



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 17 Tachwedd 2009
Tuesday, 17 November 2009**

Cynnwys Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 37 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes
Business Statement and Announcement
- 41 Datganiad am y Papur Gwyrdd 'Talu am Ofal yng Nghymru'
Statement on the 'Paying for Care in Wales' Green Paper
- 61 Atal Rheolau Sefydlog
Suspension of Standing Orders
- 62 Y Gyllideb Ddrafft
The Draft Budget
- 131 Diogelu ac Amddiffyn Plant yng Nghymru
Safeguarding and Protecting Children in Wales
- 150 Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

The Presiding Officer: I call the Assembly to order.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Continuing NHS Healthcare Claims

Q1 Peter Black: Will the First Minister make a statement on continuing NHS healthcare claims? OAQ(3)2404(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): We published a national framework for determining eligibility for continuing healthcare, although it can only ever be applied in specific, and usually complex, individual circumstances. Further to that, Gwenda Thomas, the Deputy Minister for Social Services, published her 'Paying for Care in Wales' Green Paper, which places the issue of continuing healthcare in the wider context of establishing a sustainable system of paying for care in the future.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, First Minister. You will be aware that the Government has set a deadline of 4 December—which is in two weeks' time—for those whose care finished prior to April 2003 to make a claim for continuing healthcare. I understand that health boards have been told by the Minister for Health and Social Care that it is up to them to make arrangements to communicate this cut-off point to people who may be eligible to apply for health costs to be paid on behalf of relatives whose care ended in April 2003. However, when I approached the health boards about this, their responses show that there is confusion over who should provide publicity materials, and that what is being supplied is technical and difficult to understand. Will you look at this as a matter of urgency and consider extending the deadline to ensure that we get more

Hawliadau Gofal Iechyd Parhaus y GIG

C1 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am hawliadau yng nghyswllt gofal iechyd parhaus y GIG? OAQ(3)2404(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Cyhoeddwyd fframwaith cenedlaethol gennym er mwyn pennu pwy sy'n gymwys i gael gofal iechyd parhaus, ond ni ellir rhoi hwnnw ar waith ond dan amgylchiadau unigol penodol, a'r rheiny fel rheol yn rhai cymhleth. At hynny, cyhoeddodd Gwenda Thomas, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ei Phapur Gwyrdd 'Talu am Ofal yng Nghymru' sy'n gosod mater gofal iechyd parhaus yng nghydestun ehangach sefydlu system gynaliadwy ar gyfer talu am ofal yn y dyfodol.

Peter Black: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Gwyddoch fod y Llywodraeth wedi pennu dyddiad cau, sef 4 Rhagfyr, ymhen pythefnos, ar gyfer y rhai y daeth eu gofal i ben cyn mis Ebrill 2003. Rhaid iddynt hawlio am ofal iechyd parhaus erbyn hynny. Deallaf fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol wedi dweud wrth y byrddau iechyd mai eu gwaith hwy yw trefnu i roi gwybod am y dyddiad cau hwn i bobl a all fod yn gymwys i wneud cais am ad-dalu costau iechyd ar ran perthnasau y daeth eu gofal i ben ym mis Ebrill 2003. Fodd bynnag, pan holais y byrddau iechyd am hyn, dengys eu hymatebion fod dryswch ynglŷn â phwy a ddylai ddarparu'r deunyddiau cyhoeddusrwydd, a bod yr hyn sy'n cael ei ddarparu'n dechnegol ac yn anodd ei ddeall. A wnewch edrych ar hyn ar frys ac ystyried ymestyn y dyddiad i sicrhau bod mwy o ddeunyddiau cyhoeddusrwydd priodol ar gael

appropriate publicity materials out there so that people know what they can claim and are able to consider, in the light of that new and, hopefully, non-technical material, whether they will be eligible to claim for backdated healthcare?

The First Minister: It is very complex whenever you get retrospective claims of this kind. We do not accept that the cut-off date has been inadequately publicised because we advertised in the *Western Mail* and we wrote twice to all organisations with an interest, such as the Alzheimer's Society, Care Forum Wales and the Wales branch of the Law Society. A firm of solicitors received 1,000 enquiries and more are coming in all the time. Powys Teaching Local Health Board, which is acting as the administrative body, has had over 400 enquiries, so we do not accept that there has been a lack of publicity on this matter.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you agree that while it is essential that people who may have retrospective claims are able to make those claims, we also need to ensure that any backlog is dealt with in a timely manner because of the potential impact on funds available for people who need continuing healthcare? To support the point that you made to Peter Black, I have 13 historical constituency cases arising from the publicity that has already been given to this. Do you agree, First Minister, that it is important that the deadline is adhered to? I hope that the media can pick up on the points raised by Peter Black today to ensure that if there are still people who feel that they may have a retrospective claim, they make it as soon as possible.

The First Minister: Indeed. Solicitors have been advertising in national newspapers, and there have been three television programmes on this issue. On prompt administration, I mentioned that the Powys health board is acting as the administrator on behalf of the

er mwyn i bobl wybod beth y cânt ei hawlio ac er mwyn iddynt ystyried, yng ngoleuni'r deunydd newydd ac annhechnegol, gobeithio, a fyddant yn gymwys i hawlio am ofal iechyd wedi'i ôl-ddyddio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pryd bynnag y cewch hawliadau ôl-weithredol fel hyn, mae'n gymhleth iawn. Nid ydym yn derbyn nad yw'r dyddiad cau wedi cael digon o gyhoeddusrwydd oherwydd rhoesom hysbyseb yn y *Western Mail* ac ysgrifennu ddwywaith at bob corff a chanddo ddiddordeb yn hyn, megis Cymdeithas Alzheimer, Fforwm Gofal Cymru a changen Cymdeithas y Cyfreithwyr yng Nghymru. Cafodd cwmni o gyfreithwyr 1,000 o ymholiadau ac mae rhagor yn cyrraedd o hyd. Mae Bwrdd Addysgu Iechyd Lleol Powys, y corff sy'n gweinyddu'r drefn, wedi cael mwy na 400 o ymholiadau, felly nid ydym yn derbyn bod diffyg cyhoeddusrwydd wedi bod ynglŷn â hyn.

Helen Mary Jones: A gytunwch, er ei bod yn hanfodol i bobl y gall fod ganddynt hawliadau ôl-weithredol allu hawlio'r arian hwnnw, fod angen inni sicrhau hefyd fod unrhyw achosion sy'n cronni'n cael eu trafod yn brydlon oherwydd y gallai hynny effeithio ar yr arian sydd ar gael i bobl y mae angen gofal iechyd parhaus arnynt? I gefnogi'r pwynt a wnaethoch wrth Peter Black, mae gennyf 13 o achosion hanesyddol yn fy etholaeth sy'n codi o'r cyhoeddusrwydd y mae hyn wedi'i gael eisoes. A gytunwch, Brif Weinidog, ei bod yn bwysig inni llynu wrth y dyddiad cau? Gobeithio y gall y cyfryngau godi'r pwyntiau y mae Peter Black wedi sôn amdanynt heddiw er mwyn sicrhau, os oes pobl sy'n dal i deimlo y gall fod ganddynt hawliad ôl-weithredol, eu bod yn gwneud hwnnw cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn sicr. Mae cyfreithwyr wedi bod yn hysbysebu yn y papurau cenedlaethol, ac mae tair rhaglen deledu wedi bod ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. O ran gweinyddu'r peth yn ddi-oed, soniais fod bwrdd iechyd Powys yn gweinyddu'r drefn ar

other six LHBs in Wales. It has considered over 750 cases and has made awards totalling £18.5 million to date for the pre-2003 cases. LHBs have picked up claims for a further £5.5 million where there were crossovers, with some of the care being provided before 2003 and some after.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Continuing healthcare claims are one part of a wider NHS budget and it is critical that we get the priorities right within the NHS to ensure that such claims and future liabilities are met within a diminishing budget. In evidence to the Finance Committee, NHS finance directors said that there was scope to rebalance the NHS budget. Will your Government take on board the view that rebalancing needs to take place so that situations like this can be catered for in future liabilities?

The First Minister: As I understood it, the issue that the finance director of the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust was raising, on behalf of the team of seven who have the same responsibility throughout Wales, was this: by following best practice on day-case rates, for example by removing excessive follow-up appointments—given that some consultants ask for 10 follow-up appointments while others ask for just one or two for the same type of case or person, and so some consultants have an additional eight—and by avoiding inappropriate hospitalisation for the frail elderly, by providing them with an alternative in the community, the health service could probably save £1 billion. We would probably support that figure and that estimate. It is up to us all to see what we can do to bring about that best practice.

Yr Iaith Gymraeg

C2 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg? OAQ(3)2401(FM)

ran y chwe BILl arall yng Nghymru. Mae wedi ystyried dros 750 o achosion ac wedi dyfarnu cyfanswm o £18.5 miliwn hyd yn hyn ar gyfer yr achosion cyn 2003. Mae'r BILlau wedi cael hawliadau am £5.5 miliwn arall lle'r oedd yr achosion yn pontio cyfnodau, gyda rhywfaint o'r gofal wedi'i ddarparu cyn 2003 a rhywfaint wedyn.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Un rhan o gyllideb ehangach y GIG yw hawliadau ar gyfer gofal iechyd parhaus ac mae'n hollbwysig inni sicrhau'r blaenoriaethau iawn o fewn y GIG er mwyn sicrhau bod modd ymdrin â hawliadau o'r fath ac ymrwymadau yn y dyfodol o fewn cyllideb sy'n crebachu. Wrth roi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, dywedodd cyfarwyddwyr cyllid y GIG fod lle i ailfantoli cyllideb y GIG. A wnaiff eich Llywodraeth roi sylw i'r farn bod angen ailfantoli er mwyn gallu darparu ar gyfer sefyllfaoedd fel hyn mewn ymrwymadau yn y dyfodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ôl a ddeallais, dyma'r mater yr oedd cyfarwyddwr cyllid Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, yn ei godi ar ran y tîm o saith y mae ganddynt yr un cyfrifoldeb ledled Cymru: drwy ddilyn yr arferion gorau o ran cyfraddau achosion dydd, er enghraifft drwy ddileu gormod o apwyntiadau dilynol—o gofio bod rhai ymgynghorwyr yn gofyn am 10 o apwyntiadau dilynol ac eraill yn gofyn am un neu ddau'n unig ar gyfer yr un math o achos neu berson, ac felly fod rhai ymgynghorwyr yn cael wyth ychwanegol—a thrwy osgoi rhoi'r henoed bregus mewn ysbyty pan nad yw hynny'n briodol, a rhoi gofal amgen iddynt yn y gymuned, mae'n debyg y gallai'r gwasanaeth arbed £1 biliwn. Mae'n debyg y byddem yn cytuno â'r ffigur hwnnw a'r amcangyfrif hwnnw. Ein gwaith ni i gyd yw gweld beth y gallwn ei wneud er mwyn gwireddu'r arferion gorau hynny.

The Welsh Language

Q2 Eleanor Burnham: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to promote the Welsh language? OAQ(3)2401(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd camau olaf y broses o drosglwyddo'r gallu i ddeddfu ym maes y Gymraeg o Senedd San Steffan i'r corff hwn. Byddwn wedyn yn dod â chais am Fesur arfaethedig ger eich bron, a hynny er mwyn dod â'r gyfraith i fodolaeth a gwireddu'r addewid o greu Cymru sy'n wirioneddol ddwyieithog.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond ni fyddwch chi gyda ni—hynny yw, ni fyddwch wrth y llyw—erbyn i hynny ddigwydd. Sut yn union y bydd hynny i gyd yn gwella'r sefyllfa ac yn codi ein calonnau o ran sicrhau cynnydd yn nefnydd y Gymraeg ar draws Cymru? A ydych yn gobeithio defnyddio'r pŵer i sefydlu mwy o ysgolion cyfrwng Gymraeg?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni fyddaf gyda chi yn yr ystyr na fyddaf ar y meinciau blaen, ond byddaf ar y meinciau cefn—er nad ydym yn yr un grŵp, Eleanor. Gobeithiwn y daw'r Mesur arfaethedig i fodolaeth cyn diwedd y trydydd Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn derbyn na fydd deddfwriaeth yn gwneud gwahaniaeth dramatig o ran nifer y bobl sy'n siarad Gymraeg ac sy'n trosglwyddo'r iaith o un genhedlaeth i'r nesaf, ond bydd yn gosod y cefndir er mwyn creu Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog.

Bethan Jenkins: Yr wyf wedi cael nifer o gwynion gan bobl leol am nad yw gwefan newydd yr elusen Cymorth i Ddiodefwyf, sef corff sy'n cynrychioli Cymru a Lloegr, yn ddwyieithog. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai elusennau sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru gael polisi dwyieithrwydd? Os felly, a wnewch chi sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth neu eich bod chi, Brif Weinidog, yn cyfathrebu â'r elusennau dan sylw er mwyn iddynt gael cymorth wrth ddatblygu neu ehangu polisi o'r fath?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn sicr faint o rym sydd gennym dros elusennau i sicrhau eu bod yn cynnig gwasanaeth dwyieithog. Mae'n dibynnu ai nyni sy'n talu am y

The First Minister: We are in the final steps of transferring the powers to legislate in the field of the Welsh language from the Westminster Parliament to this body. We will then bring forward a proposed Measure in order to legislate and realise the pledge to create a truly bilingual Wales.

Eleanor Burnham: I am sorry, but you will not be with us—that is, you will not be at the helm—by the time that happens. How will all of this improve matters and encourage us as regards an increase in the number of people who use the Welsh language throughout Wales? Do you hope to use the power to establish more Welsh-medium schools?

The First Minister: I will not be with you in the sense that I will not be on the frontbenches, but I will be on the backbenches—but not in the same group, of course, Eleanor. We hope that the proposed Measure will come into existence before the end of the third Assembly. We accept that legislation will not make a dramatic difference in terms of the number of Welsh speakers and of those who transfer the language from one generation to the next, but it will provide the context in which to create a truly bilingual Wales.

Bethan Jenkins: I have received many complaints from local people who say that the new Victim Support website, which represents England and Wales, is not available bilingually. Do you agree that charities working in Wales should have a bilingual policy? If so, will you ensure that the Government, or you as First Minister, communicates with the charity concerned in order to provide assistance in the development or expansion of such a policy?

The First Minister: I am not sure how much power over charities we have as regards ensuring that they provide bilingual services. It depends on whether we pay for the services

gwasanaeth. Efallai y gallem wneud hynny yn rhan o gytundeb ond dyna un o wendidau—os gwendid ydyw—unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth. Mae'n rhwyddach o lawer gwneud deddfwriaeth yn gymwys i gyrff llywodraethol, megis llywodraeth leol, nynt, Llywodraeth San Steffan, a chyrff y Goron, er enghraifft, nag ydyw i gyrff elusennol. Felly, nid wyf yn sicr, ond efallai mai drwy berswâd y gallem gyflawni hynny. Bu Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn arbennig o gryf yn y maes hwnnw yn ystod ei 15 mlynedd a mwy o fodolaeth—a bydd y Llywydd yn cofio yn well na fi. Mae'n helpu cyrff i sefydlu gwasanaeth dwyieithog drwy ddwyn perswâd yn amlach na thrwy ddefnyddio'i bwerau o dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993.

Paul Davies: Bydd creu coleg ffederal Cymraeg o gymorth mawr wrth hyrwyddo'r iaith. Un o amcanion y coleg ffederal yw creu cymuned academaidd Gymraeg genedlaethol. Beth yw gweledigaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran sut y gall y gymuned honno wasanaethu Cymru drwy ymchwil?

Y Prif Weinidog: Er ei fod yn gallu digwydd gydag ieithoedd lleiafrifol sydd â llawer mwy o siaradwyr na'r Gymraeg, mae pawb yn derbyn nad oes modd i bob prifysgol gynnig pob pwnc drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Er enghraifft, mae prinder pobl sy'n gallu addysgu ffiseg niwclear drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd modd addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a phan fydd academyddion ar gael i addysgu yn Gymraeg, yr ydym eisiau sicrhau nad yn eu prifysgolion hwythau yn unig y maent yn gweithio ond ym mhob prifysgol yng Nghymru. Gwneir hynny drwy sefydlu rhwydwaith a chan ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf, fel bod myfyrwyr yn Abertawe, er enghraifft, yn gallu cael gafael ar y deunyddiau academaidd a addysgir ym Mangor neu Gaerdydd fel pe baent yn yr un coleg neu brifysgol. Dyna'r hyn sy'n bwysig, gan gofio'r prinder arbenigwyr sydd yn gallu addysgu pynciau o'r fath drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

or not. Perhaps we could make that a part of an agreement, but that is one of the weaknesses—if it is a weakness—of any legislation. It is far easier to make legislation apply to government bodies, local government, the Governments here and in Westminster, and Crown bodies, for example, than it is to charitable bodies. Therefore, I am not sure, but that could perhaps be achieved through persuasion. The Welsh Language Board has been particularly strong in this area during its 15 years and more of existence—the Presiding Officer will know better than I do. It has been able to persuade as much as relying on its powers under the Welsh Language Act 1993 in assisting bodies to provide bilingual services.

Paul Davies: The creation of a Welsh federal college will be of great assistance in promoting the Welsh language. One of the aims of the federal college is to create a national academic community working through the medium of Welsh. What is the Assembly Government's vision in terms of how that community could serve Wales in research?

The First Minister: Even though it can happen in the case of minority languages that have far more speakers than the Welsh language, everyone accepts that not every university can offer all courses through the medium of Welsh. For example, there is a paucity of people who can teach nuclear physics through the medium of Welsh. However, where we are able to teach through the medium of Welsh and where academics are available to do just that, we want to ensure that they work not just in their universities, but in every university in Wales. That can be done through the establishment of a network and through using state-of-the-art technology, so that students in Swansea, for example, can access the academic materials being taught in Bangor or Cardiff as though they were at the same college or university. That is the important point when you bear in mind the paucity of academics who can teach such subjects through the medium of Welsh.

1.40 p.m.

Blaenoriaethau

C3 Nerys Evans: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf? OAQ(3)2405(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Arwain ein heconomi allan o'r dirwasgiad i atgyfodiad yw'r flaenoriaeth fwyaf. Cyhoeddwyd ffigurau mis Hydref yr wythnos diwethaf, ac yr oedd y cynnydd bach iawn yn nifer y di-waith o ran nifer y bobl sy'n derbyn y dŵl yn gefnogol iawn. Hefyd, yn ystod y diwrnodau nesaf, byddwn yn derbyn adroddiad Confensiwn Cymru Gyfan, a gadeirir gan Syr Emyr Jones Parry, ar ddyfodol y Cynulliad hwn a'i allu i ddeddfu.

Nerys Evans: Ar y pwynt hwnnw, mae'r confensiwn yn adrodd yfory, ac, fel yr ydych yn gwybod, mae'n cynnwys cynrychiolaeth o bob plaid wleidyddol yn ogystal â phobl annibynnol, ac mae wedi cymryd tystiolaeth oddi wrth filoedd o unigolion a sefydliadau. A gytunwch, beth bynnag fydd casgliadau'r confensiwn, mai asesiad gwrthrychol y confensiwn o'r hyn sydd orau i'n cenedl a ddylai gael blaenoriaeth, ac nid fy marn i, eich barn chi, neu farn unrhyw unigolyn arall?

Y Prif Weinidog: Barn y bobl yw'r hyn sydd yn bwysig. Yr ydym yn meddwl ein bod wedi cwblhau ein prentisiaeth yn y ddysg a dawn o ddeddfu, gan ein bod wedi bod yn gweithredu Gorchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ac yn y blaen. Felly, yr ydym yn meddwl ein bod yn barod i symud o Ran 3 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 i Ran 4. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn yw a yw pobl Cymru yn meddwl ein bod yn barod i symud o Ran 3 i Ran 4 ac i gael yr hawl i ddeddfu. Dyna'r hyn yr ydym wedi gofyn i'r confensiwn adrodd arno.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): First Minister, last week we had

Priorities

Q3 Nerys Evans: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for the next six months? OAQ(3)2405(FM)

The First Minister: Leading our economy out of recession and towards recovery is the main priority. The October figures were published last week, and the very small increase in claimant count unemployment was encouraging. Also, during the next few days, we will receive the report of the All Wales Convention, chaired by Sir Emyr Jones Parry, on the future of this Assembly and its ability to legislate.

Nerys Evans: On that point, the convention is to report tomorrow, and, as you know, it is made up of representatives of all political parties as well as independent people, and it has taken evidence from thousands of individuals and bodies. Would you agree, whatever the conclusions of the convention, that priority should be given to the convention's objective assessment of what is best for our nation, rather than my opinion, your opinion or that of any other individual?

The First Minister: It is the opinions of people that are important. We believe that we have served our apprenticeship in the task of legislating, because we have been working with the legislative competence Orders and so on. Therefore, we believe that we are ready to move from Part 3 of the Government of Wales Act 2006 to Part 4. However, it is a matter of whether the people of Wales believe that we are ready to move from Part 3 to Part 4 and to have the right to legislate. That is what we have asked the convention to report upon.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Brif Weinidog, yr wythnos diwethaf, cawsom

the latest unemployment quarterly figures, for July to September, which showed that 8.7 per cent of working-age people in Wales were unemployed. That is a jump from 7.7 per cent in the preceding quarter. Of the UK overall net increase in unemployment of 30,000, 14,000 cases were in Wales. That is nearly 1 in 2, despite the fact that we only have about 5 per cent of the UK's population. The first response from the Assembly Government to the statistics released on that day, in relation to claimant count, was that this was encouraging. Within hours, a second press release was issued by the Welsh Assembly Government stating that the unemployment figures were disappointing. There is a very real difference between the response 'encouraging', in relation to the claimant count, and 'disappointing', in relation to the unemployment figure. The Office for National Statistics prefers to use the unemployment figure as a pointer to the employment position. Which of those responses are guiding economic policy in relation to unemployment—'encouraging' or 'disappointing'? They are very different.

The First Minister: Our economists tell us that we can be quite 'bullish'—to use their phrase—about the unemployment figures published last month. The significance of the very small rise in claimant count unemployment of only 300, which is not even enough to move the figure up by a tenth of one per cent, is that it is the lowest rise in claimant count unemployment since the beginning of the recession, which must be getting on for 18 months ago now. Claimant count unemployment was rising at a rate of 4,000 a month in the early months of this year. It then dropped to 1,000 a month over the summer, and was only 300 a month in October. That is not based on a survey; it is a head count. It is not even rounded down to the nearest 10, so it is spot-on accurate. It is a figure that is in line with a big drop in the previous level of increases in claimant count unemployment elsewhere in the UK. It is too early to say that that indicates that the recession is over, clearly. When people ask,

y ffigurau diweithdra chwarterol diweddaraf, ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng mis Gorffennaf a mis Medi, a ddangosai fod 8.7 y cant o bobl o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru'n ddi-waith. Mae hynny'n naid o 7.7 y cant yn y chwarter blaenorol. O blith y cynnydd net mewn diweithdra yn y Deyrnas Unedig drwyddi draw, sef 30,000, yr oedd 14,000 o'r achosion hynny yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n 1 o bob 2 bron iawn, er mai dim ond rhyw 5 y cant o boblogaeth y Deyrnas Unedig sy'n byw yma. Ymateb cyntaf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r ystadegau a ryddhawyd y diwrnod hwnnw, o ran nifer y rhai sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau, oedd bod hyn yn galonogol. O fewn oriau, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ail ddatganiad i'r wasg yn dweud bod y ffigurau diweithdra'n siomedig iawn. Mae gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol rhwng yr ymateb 'calonogol', i nifer yr hawlwy, a 'siomedig', i'r ffigur ar gyfer diweithdra. Mae'n well gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol ddefnyddio'r ffigur diweithdra'n arwydd o'r sefyllfa o ran cyflogaeth. Pa un o'r ymatebion hynny sy'n llywio polisi economaidd o ran diweithdra—'calonogol' ynteu 'siomedig'? Maent yn wahanol iawn i'w gilydd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywed ein heconomegwyr wrthym y gallwn fod yn eithaf 'hyderus' - a defnyddio'u gair hwy-ynglŷn â'r ffigurau diweithdra a gyhoeddwyd fis diwethaf. Arwyddocâd y cynnydd bach iawn yn nifer y di-waith sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau, sef dim ond 300, nad yw'n ddigon hyd yn oed i godi'r ffigur un rhan o ddeg o un y cant, yw mai dyma'r cynnydd isaf yn nifer y di-waith sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau ers dechrau'r dirwasgiad, bron 18 mis yn ôl erbyn hyn, mae'n siŵr. Yr oedd nifer y di-waith sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau'n cynyddu 4,000 y mis yn y misoedd cyntaf eleni. Yna, disgynnodd i 1,000 y mis dros yr haf, ac nid oedd ond yn 300 y mis ym mis Hydref. Nid yw hynny wedi'i seilio ar arolwg, ond ar gyfrif y nifer. Nid yw hyd yn oed wedi'i dalgrynnu i lawr at y 10 agosaf, felly mae'n fanwl gywir. Mae'n ffigur sy'n gyson â gostyngiad mawr yn lefel y cynnydd blaenorol yn nifer y di-waith sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau mewn manau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n amlwg ei bod yn

'What about the wider count of unemployment?', which is the one that the ONS advises is used, it is true that that is a pointer, but it is not necessarily a good pointer as to whether the economy is on the turn or not. Claimant count unemployment is probably more accurate, as it is two months more in advance of the other figure, and is less affected by Wales's small sample size in the labour force survey.

Nick Bourne: Nevertheless, there were mixed messages being sent out that day, and I am sure that the First Minister would agree that the position is very fragile. I will move on to a more specific area, namely that of small businesses. For much of the weekend and all of yesterday I was meeting with small businesses in my area. Many of these businesses still do not know the position in relation to their rates bill next April. In England, the position on small business rate relief has been known since September, but all that is known in Wales is that Brian Gibbons is thinking about it. When can we expect a statement on whether the small business rate relief figure will be going up and, if so, by how much? Small businesses are entitled to know that to plan their economic future, employment and future activity. This is a real issue for small businesses throughout Wales.

The First Minister: You referred to a fragile position, and the wider unemployment count does show discouraging trends, but the claimant count, which is more up to date by two months, shows much more encouraging signs. Should an Assembly Member, especially those in opposition parties or those who are spokespeople on education, unemployment or skills, like to have half an hour or an hour with our economists, I have made arrangements for that to happen and they would be happy to make advice available. In case anyone thinks that we are

rhy gynnar inni ddweud bod hynny'n awgrymu bod y dirwasgiad ar ben. Pan fydd pobl yn gofyn, 'Beth am y ffordd ehangach o gyfrif diweithdra', sef yr un y mae'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yn ein cynghori i'w ddefnyddio, mae'n wir bod honno'n arwydd da, ond nid yw o reidrwydd yn arwydd da o ran a oes tro ar fyd yn yr economi ai peidio. Mae'n debygol bod cyfrif nifer y di-waith sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau'n fwy cywir, gan ei fod ddau fis arall ar y blaen i'r ffigur arall, ac mae maint bach y sampl yn arolwg gweithlu Cymru yn effeithio llai arno.

Nick Bourne: Er hynny, yr oedd y negeseuon a gyhoeddid y diwrnod hwnnw'n rhai cymysg, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno bod y sefyllfa'n fregus iawn. Symudaf ymlaen at faes mwy penodol, sef busnesau bach. Am ran helaeth o'r penwythnos a thrwy'r dydd ddoe, bŵm yn cyfarfod â busnesau bach yn fy ardal. Mae llawer o'r busnesau hyn heb glywed o hyd beth yw'r sefyllfa o ran eu bil ardrethi fis Ebrill nesaf. Yn Lloegr, mae'r sefyllfa ynglŷn â'r rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach yn hysbys ers mis Medi, ond y cyfan a wyddys yng Nghymru yw bod Brian Gibbons yn ystyried y peth. Pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl datganiad ynghylch a fydd y ffigur o ran rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach yn cynyddu, ac os felly, faint? Mae gan fusnesau bach yr hawl i wybod hynny er mwyn iddynt gynllunio'u dyfodol economaidd, eu trefniadau cyflogi a'u gweithgarwch yn y dyfodol. Mae hyn yn broblem go iawn i fusnesau bach ledled Cymru.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfeiriasoch at sefyllfa fregus, ac mae'r cyfrif diweithdra ehangach yn dangos tueddiadau digalon, ond mae'r nifer sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau, sydd ddeufis yn fwy diweddar, yn dangos arwyddion llawer mwy calonogol. Petai Aelod Cynulliad, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n aelodau o'r gwrthbleidiau neu'r rhai sy'n llefaryddion addysg, diweithdra neu sgiliau, yn dymuno cael hanner awr neu awr gyda'n heconomegwyr, yr wyf wedi trefnu i hynny ddigwydd a byddent yn falch o gynnig cyngor. Rhag ofn i rywun feddwl ein bod yn

saying something that our economists are not, they would be happy to brief Members and the media to avoid any confusion.

On small business rates, our three rate relief schemes cover the waterfront. However, there are some knock-on effects from rating revaluation, which you are right to say have not yet been determined. They will be determined soon and Brian Gibbons will make that information available as quickly as he can.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for the First Minister's kind offer, and I am sure that it will be taken up by David Melding and Paul Davies. I thank him for that.

However, I press the issue of small business rate relief. This is an existing scheme, not a new scheme, and it is about where the threshold lies. If some of the businesses that have had an increase do not get an uplift in the small business rate relief, they will be paying a whacking amount more in rates next April. So, this is a very real issue.

I appreciate that we will be discussing it later, but I wish to refer to the budget and the 5 per cent efficiency cuts that are being imposed on universities and colleges. At a time when we should be growing the knowledge economy, why are we expecting disproportionate so-called 'efficiency savings'—or 'cuts' as they would have been had we been in Government and you in opposition—of education when we are not expecting it of anyone else?

The First Minister: To go back to small business rates, you will be aware that most businesses in Wales—more than 60 per cent of them—will gain from the revaluation. That implies that some 40 per cent will lose. The critical point is what happens to the rate relief because of the shifting of those who will, on the surface, benefit from the reduction in their valuation but miss out on the relief as a

dweud rhywbeth nad yw'n heconomegwyr yn ei ddweud, byddent yn falch o roi gwybodaeth i'r Aelodau ac i'r cyfryngau er mwyn osgoi unrhyw ddryswch.

O ran ardrethi i fusnesau bach, mae ein tri chynllun rhyddhad ardrethi'n cwmpasu'r holl faes. Fodd bynnag, ceir rhai effeithiau canlyniadol yn sgîl ailbrisio ardrethi, ac yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n dweud nad oes penderfyniad wedi'i wneud eto. Penderfynir yn fuan a bydd Brian Gibbons yn darparu'r wybodaeth honno cyn gynted ag y gall.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gynnig caredig y Prif Weinidog, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd David Melding a Paul Davies yn manteisio ar hynny. Diolch iddo am hynny.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am sôn eto am fater rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach. Cynllun sy'n bodoli eisoes yw hwn, nid cynllun newydd, ac mae a wnelo ag ymhle y mae'r trothwy. Os na chaiff rhai o'r busnesau sy'n wynebu codiad gynnydd yng nghyfradd rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach, byddant yn talu ardrethi uwch o lawer fis Ebrill nesaf. Felly, mae hyn yn broblem go iawn.

Sylweddolaf y byddwn yn ei drafod yn ddiweddarach, ond dymunaf gyfeirio at y gyllideb ac at y toriadau effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant a orfodir ar brifysgolion a cholegau. A hithau'n adeg pan ddylem fod yn peri i'r economi wybodaeth dyfu, pam yr ydym yn disgwyl yr hyn a elwir yn 'arbedion effeithlonrwydd' anghymesur—neu 'doriadau' fel y buasant petaem ni'n Llywodraeth a chithau'n wrthblaid—ym myd addysg pan nad ydym yn disgwyl hynny gan neb arall?

Y Prif Weinidog: A dychwelyd at yr ardrethi i fusnesau bach, gwyddoch y bydd y rhan fwyaf o fusnesau Cymru—dros 60 y cant ohonynt—ar eu hennill yn sgîl yr ailbrisio. Mae hynny'n awgrymu y bydd rhyw 40 y cant ar eu colled. Y pwynt hollbwysig yw'r hyn sy'n digwydd i'r rhyddhad ardrethi oherwydd y newid i'r rhai a fydd, ar yr wyneb, ar eu helw yn sgîl gostwng eu prisiad

result. That is the issue that Brian is considering.

The wider issue of the budget will be the subject of a huge amount of discussion later this afternoon. We believe that universities and further education colleges are capable of achieving those efficiency savings through reorganisation, mergers and changing the way in which they manage business overheads. That would allow them to direct more of their effort to the front-line services for the student body. In the case of FE, through the shift to the volume of learning payment system, which is fairer than the previous system, and we think it only right and proper, it is not determined that everyone must achieve the same efficiency savings; it is done on the basis of appropriateness for the departments concerned given what we believe to be the potential for efficiency savings. There are many other sources of income, and, for instance, some FE colleges have pursued very hard and successfully additional money from ProAct. Coleg Sir Gâr has shown the way for other colleges in Wales, in that it gained more than £1 million of additional income from ProAct. Others have used the European social fund to access additional sources of money. We believe that institutions are capable of getting money from other sources in addition to their straight-line income from the Assembly Government's core budget.

1.50 p.m.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): Last week, the Children's Commissioner for Wales raised concerns about the finding of a joint inspectorate report on safeguarding vulnerable children. The commissioner and the inspectorates questioned the ability of the newly restructured NHS to co-ordinate its protection of young people and whether local safeguarding children boards were effectively discharging their functions. Today, Barnardo's has launched a report on the sexual exploitation of children, and it, too,

ond, oherwydd hynny, yn methu cael y rhyddhad. Dyna'r broblem y mae Brian yn ei hystyried.

Bydd mater ehangach y gyllideb yn destun trafodaeth hirfaith yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Credwn y gall prifysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach sicrhau'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd hynny drwy ad-drefnu, drwy uno a thrwy newid y ffordd y maent yn rheoli eu gorbenion busnes. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu iddynt gyfeirio mwy o'u hymdrechion at wasanaethau'r rheng flaen ar gyfer corff y myfyrwyr. O ran addysg bellach, drwy symud at drefn sy'n talu am faint o ddysgu sy'n digwydd, trefn decach na'r hen drefn, a chredwn fod hynny'n hollol briodol, nid oes yn rhaid i bawb sicrhau'r un arbedion effeithlonrwydd; fe'i gwneir ar sail pa mor briodol ydyw i'r adrannau dan sylw, o ystyried y posibilïadau ar gyfer arbedion effeithiolrwydd yn ein golwg ni. Mae llu o ffynonellau incwm eraill, ac, er enghraifft, mae rhai colegau addysg bellach wedi mynd ati'n ddygn ac wedi llwyddo i gael arian ychwanegol drwy ProAct. Mae Coleg Sir Gâr wedi dangos y ffordd i golegau eraill yng Nghymru, gan iddo gael dros £1 miliwn o incwm ychwanegol drwy ProAct. Mae eraill wedi defnyddio cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop i gael gafael ar ffynonellau arian ychwanegol. Credwn fod sefydliadau'n gallu cael arian o ffynonellau eraill yn ogystal â'u hincwm llinell syth gan gyllideb graidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru ei fod yn poeni am ganfyddiad adroddiad cydarolygiaeth ar ddiogelu plant agored i niwed. Yr oedd y comisiynydd a'r arolygiaethau'n amau gallu'r GIG sydd newydd ei ad-drefnu i gydlynu ei drefniadau i ddiogelu pobl ifanc ac a oedd byrddau lleol diogelu plant yn cyflawni eu swyddogaethau'n effeithiol. Heddiw, mae Barnardo's wedi lansio adroddiad am gamfanteisio'n rhywiol ar blant, ac mae

mentions the effectiveness of those boards and the poor local implementation of national guidelines and protocols. Last week, you were unable to acknowledge that there could be a systematic problem, despite the words of your own inspectors. Will the Barnardo's report, on top of last week's report, lead you to look again at how you are protecting children in Wales?

The First Minister: Of course. I heard Martin Narey's dire warnings on national television this morning. He did not cite any specific Welsh examples, but I do not think, from the tone of what he was saying, that he was exempting Wales. He was trying to extrapolate from studies done in three middle-sized or large cities in England what could be seen as a problem elsewhere if people looked for it. I am not in a position to say that that is not the case in Wales, as I do not think that he was exempting Wales—and I am certainly not exempting Wales. It will take us a while to digest the contents of that report, but he gave us all a dire warning. That means that we should take time to digest its contents, and see to what extent the appropriate defences are in place to safeguard vulnerable children from the kind of predatory paedophile actions talked about in it.

Kirsty Williams: First Minister, in answer to a question last week, you said that good detection systems are needed and that schoolteachers, learning assistants and doctors must remain vigilant. However, it must come as a blow to you to learn that the Barnardo's report highlights that children regularly go missing, sometimes without that being noticed, and that there is a very poor systematic response to missing children in Wales. The evidence is mounting. You have had one week in which to look at the serious concerns being raised, and one more report. For some children in danger, one week is a very long time. We need more than an acknowledgment that the problem exists; we

hwnnw hefyd yn sôn am effeithiolrwydd y byrddau hynny a'r gwendid o ran rhoi canllawiau a phrotocolau cenedlaethol ar waith. Yr wythnos diwethaf, ni allech gydnabod y gallai fod problem systematig, er gwaethaf geiriau'ch arolygwyr eich hun. A wnaiff adroddiad Barnardo's, ar ben adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf, beri ichi edrych eto ar sut yr ydych yn diogelu plant yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs. Clywais rybuddion llym Martin Narey ar deledu cenedlaethol y bore yma. Ni chyfeiriodd at enghreifftiau penodol yng Nghymru, ond nid wyf yn meddwl, yn ôl tôn yr hyn yr oedd yn ei ddweud, ei fod yn eithrio Cymru. Yr oedd yn ceisio defnyddio gwybodaeth mewn astudiaethau a gynhaliwyd mewn tair dinas ganolig neu fawr yn Lloegr i ddangos yr hyn y gellid ei weld fel problem mewn mannau eraill petai pobl yn chwilio amdani. Nid wyf yn gallu dweud nad yw hynny'n wir yng Nghymru, gan nad wyf yn meddwl ei fod yn eithrio Cymru—ac yn sicr, nid wyf fi'n eithrio Cymru. Bydd angen tipyn o amser arnom i dreulio cynnwys yr adroddiad hwn, ond rhoddodd rybudd llym inni i gyd. Mae hynny'n golygu y dylem dreulio amser yn ystyried ei gynnwys, a gweld i ba raddau y mae'r amddiffynfeydd priodol ar waith i ddiogelu plant agored i niwed rhag y math o weithdredoedd ysglyfaethus gan bedoffiliaid y sonnir amdanynt ynddo.

Kirsty Williams: Brif Weinidog, wrth ateb cwestiwn yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedasoeh fod angen systemau canfod da a bod yn rhaid i athrawon, cynorthwywyr dysgu a meddygon fod yn effro i'r perygl o hyd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ei bod yn ergyd ichi glywed bod adroddiad Barnardo's yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod plant yn mynd ar goll yn rheolaidd, heb i neb sylwi weithiau, a bod yr ymateb systematig i blant coll yng Nghymru'n wael iawn. Mae'r dystiolaeth yn cronni. Yr ydych wedi cael un wythnos i edrych ar y pryderon difrifol a godir, ac un adroddiad arall. I rai plant mewn perygl, mae un wythnos yn gyfnod hir iawn. Mae angen mwy arnom na chydabyddiaeth bod y broblem yn bodoli;

need to know what your Government will do about it. I ask you again: will you outline what steps you intend to take to safeguard children in Wales?

The First Minister: I think that you are moving on to a slightly different topic. I do not think that the subject that we were discussing last week is quite the same as the one that you are bringing up today. The issue that I understood Barnardo's to be talking about today was that of children going missing and being trafficked. It is about children being ensnared or entrapped via the internet and taken away from their home, with people not knowing where they have been when they return. They were probably sold on for various services that are illegal, reprehensible and immoral. However, last week, we were talking about how the child protection system should be able to spot non-accidental injuries, for example, and how we need good paediatricians, learning assistants and schoolteachers who can spot a problem, such as parents giving a very weak excuse for any bruising on a child. Following the baby P scandal, we need those arrangements in place so that consideration can be given to whether care proceedings need to start. It is difficult to get those judgments right every time if you are on the front line in social services or paediatric medical care.

Kirsty Williams: With all due respect, First Minister, all these reports—from the children's commissioner, the inspectorates and Barnardo's—point to very similar failings. Are the safeguarding boards doing the job that they are meant to do? Are the protocol and guidance from Government being implemented at a local level? All three reports question whether that is happening, regardless of whether it is for children being trafficked or children being abused in their own homes. These systematic failures are consistently raised in all three reports. These children, who are known to be at risk, are supposed to be safer because of these systems, but it seems that that is not the case.

mae angen inni wybod beth a wnaiff eich Llywodraeth yn ei chylch. Gofynnaf ichi eto: a wnewch ddweud pa gamau y bwriadwch eu cymryd i ddiogelu plant yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf eich bod yn symud ymlaen at bwnc ychydig yn wahanol. Ni chredaf fod y pwnc yr oeddem yn ei drafod yr wythnos diwethaf yr un fath yn hollol â'r un yr ydych yn ei godi heddiw. Cefais ar ddeall mai'r pwnc y mae Barnardo's yn sôn amdano heddiw oedd plant yn mynd ar goll ac yn cael eu masnachu. Mae a wnelo â phlant yn cael eu rhwydo neu'n cael eu hudo drwy'r rhyngwrwyd ac yn cael eu dwyn o'u cartrefi, heb i bobl wybod ymhle y maent wedi bod pan ddychwelant. Mae'n debyg iddynt gael eu gwerthu ar gyfer gwahanol wasanaethau sy'n anghyfreithlon, yn anfaddeuol ac yn anfoesol. Fodd bynnag, yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddem yn sôn am sut y dylai'r system diogelu plant allu canfod anafiadau nad ydynt yn ddamweiniol, er enghraifft, a sut y mae angen pediatryddion, cynorthwywyr dysgu ac athrawon da arnom sy'n gallu canfod problem, megis rhieni'n rhoi esgus gwan iawn dros unrhyw gleisiau ar blentyn. Ar ôl sgandal babi P, mae angen y trefniadau hynny arnom er mwyn gallu ystyried a oes angen dechrau achos gofal. Mae'n anodd iawn sicrhau bod y penderfyniadau hynny'n gywir bob tro os ydych ar y rheng flaen yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol neu ym maes gofal meddygol pediatrig.

Kirsty Williams: Gyda phob dyledus barch, Brif Weinidog, mae'r adroddiadau hyn i gyd—gan y comisiynydd plant, yr arolygiaethau a Barnardo's—yn cyfeirio at fethiannau tebyg iawn i'w gilydd. A yw'r byrddau diogelu'n gwneud y gwaith y bwriedir iddynt ei wneud? A yw'r protocol a'r canllawiau gan y Llywodraeth yn cael eu rhoi ar waith ar lefel leol? Mae pob un o'r tri adroddiad yn amau a yw hynny'n digwydd, ni waeth ai sôn am blant sy'n cael eu masnachu ynteu am blant sy'n cael eu camdrin yn eu cartrefi eu hunain yr ydym. Codir y methiannau systematig hyn yn gyson ym mhob un o'r tri adroddiad. Mae'r plant hyn, y gwyddys eu bod mewn perygl, i fod yn fwy

Your task and finish group on services for children who display sexually harmful behaviour has still not reported, we are still waiting for the full report on wheelchair services for vulnerable children, and we still have not seen any progress on child and adolescent mental health services in Wales. Whatever children need—from the most serious cases of child trafficking through to the ability of disabled children to get a wheelchair—your Government is systematically failing them. I ask you once again: what is your Government going to do about it?

The First Minister: You are fond of the word ‘systematically’. You are trying to imply that a report on one area of child protection is related to another report, published today—which is not about Wales, although that is not to say that what it reported could not have been found here—and you are trying to wrap them together. You think that by saying ‘systematically’ earlier in your question and repeating it at the end, you will have produced evidence that there is any link between these reports. I am sorry, but I do not see the link. They are quite different. Some examples are about Wales, and some are not, although it is possible that evidence could be found in Wales. Therefore, I reject your use of the word ‘systematically’. I do accept, however, that we always have to crank up the vigilance to deter sex traffickers and people who are getting into a pattern of sexually or physically abusing their own children or a relative’s children, which is sadly what tends to happen, and that is what child social services and paediatric services and so on are supposed to catch and stop. It is always possible to say that it can be done better, and we are pleased when somebody helps us to catch people who are going to do these things to children in Wales, and helps us to detect problems earlier, but that is not the same as your implication that there is a systematic failure across the board. You are trying to paint unrelated pictures and bring

diogel oherwydd y systemau hyn, ond mae’n ymddangos nad felly y mae. Nid yw eich grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar wasanaethau i blant sydd ag ymddygiad rhywiol niweidiol wedi cyflwyno’i adroddiad eto, yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl yr adroddiad llawn am wasanaethau cadair olwyn i blant agored i niwed, ac nid ydym wedi gweld dim cynnydd byth o ran gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a’r glasoed yng Nghymru. Beth bynnag y mae ei angen ar blant—o’r achosion masnachu plant mwyaf difrifol hyd at allu plant anabl i gael cadair olwynion—mae eich Llywodraeth yn gwneud cam â hwy’n systematig. Gofynnaf ichi unwaith eto: beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ei wneud yn ei gylch?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn hoff o’r gair ‘systematig’. Yr ydych yn ceisio awgrymu bod adroddiad am un maes o ran diogelu plant yn gysylltiedig ag adroddiad arall, a gyhoeddwyd heddiw—nad yw’n ymwneud â Chymru, er nad yw hynny’n golygu na fuasai modd gweld yma yr hyn yr adroddwyd yn ei gylch ynddo—ac yr ydych yn ceisio’u cysylltu â’i gilydd. Yr ydych yn meddwl y byddwch, drwy ddweud ‘systematig’ yn gynharach yn eich cwestiwn, a’i ailadrodd ar y diwedd wedi cynhyrchu tystiolaeth bod cysylltiad rhwng yr adroddiadau hyn. Mae’n ddrwg gennyf, ond ni welaf y cysylltiad. Maent yn hollol wahanol. Mae rhai enghreifftiau’n ymwneud â Chymru, ac nid yw rhai eraill, er ei bod yn bosibl y gellid dod o hyd i dystiolaeth yng Nghymru. Felly, yr wyf yn gwrthod y ffordd yr ydych yn defnyddio’r gair ‘systematig’. Yr wyf yn derbyn, fodd bynnag, fod yn rhaid inni fod yn fwy gwyliadwrus o hyd er mwyn atal masnachwyr rhyw a phobl sy’n dechrau dilyn patrwm o gam-drin eu plant eu hunain neu blant perthynas yn rhywiol neu’n gorfforol, sef yr hyn sy’n tueddu i ddigwydd yn anffodus. Dyna y mae gwasanaethau cymdeithasol plant a gwasanaethau pediatrig ac yn y blaen i fod i’w ddal a’i atal. Mae bob tro’n bosibl dweud y gellir gwneud pethau’n well, ac yr ydym yn falch pan fydd rhywun yn ein cynorthwyo i ddal pobl sy’n mynd i wneud y pethau hyn i blant yng Nghymru, ac

them together, when the evidence that they are linked simply is not there.

Kirsty Williams: With all due respect, First Minister, your answer is amazing—and not in a good way. All the reports point to the fact that vulnerable children are not being picked up by the system. They show that local safeguarding children boards are not implementing Government guidance and legislation. That is the consistent theme throughout all the reports, regardless of the danger that individual children are in. I will make it very clear for you, First Minister. Does your Government have any intention whatsoever to ensure that your legislation and your guidance are being implemented at the local level, because three separate reports suggest that they are not?

The First Minister: We can always do better, and nobody has ever claimed on behalf of my administration that we have a 100 per cent error-proof system for safeguarding children. Therefore, we are always happy to read of, and act on, evidence that shows where we can improve the quality of the safety net that we provide, including a safety net that can adapt to new issues, such as child trafficking, which may not have been thought of 50 years ago. It is important that we accept that the systems are not perfect and that we see what we can do to safeguard children and strengthen the protection available to them. We do not accept the suggestion that there is some kind of systemic breakdown, as we have not seen any evidence to support that, but that does not mean that we are not determined to do even better than we are doing already.

Tackling Inequality

Q4 Val Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly

yn ein cynorthwyo i ganfod problemau'n gynharach, ond nid yw hynny yr un fath â'ch awgrym bod methiant systematig drwyddi draw. Yr ydych yn ceisio peintio darluniau digyswllt a'u dwyn at ei gilydd, er nad oes tystiolaeth o gwbl bod cysylltiad rhyngddynt.

Kirsty Williams: Gyda phob dyledus barch, Brif Weinidog, mae eich ateb yn rhyfeddol—ac nid mewn ffordd dda. Mae'r adroddiadau i gyd yn cyfeirio at y ffaith nad yw'r system yn canfod plant agored i niwed. Maent yn dangos nad yw'r byrddau lleol diogelu plant yn rhoi canllawiau a deddfwriaeth y Llywodraeth ar waith. Dyna'r thema gyson drwy'r adroddiadau i gyd, ni waeth pa berygl y mae plant unigol yn ei wynebu. Fe'i gwnaf yn glir iawn ichi, Brif Weinidog. A oes gan eich Llywodraeth unrhyw fwriad o gwbl o sicrhau bod eich deddfwriaeth a'ch canllawiau'n cael eu rhoi ar waith ar y lefel leol, oherwydd y mae tri adroddiad ar wahân yn awgrymu nad ydynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallwn bob amser wneud yn well, ac nid oes neb erioed wedi honni ar ran fy ngweinyddiaeth fod gennym system sydd 100 y cant yn berffaith i ddiogelu plant. Felly, yr ydym bob amser yn falch o ddarllen am dystiolaeth sy'n dangos ymhle y gallwn wella ansawdd y rhwyd ddiogelwch a ddarparwn, a gweithredu ar sail hynny, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys rhwyd ddiogelwch sy'n gallu ymaddasu i broblemau newydd, megis masnachu mewn plant, problemau nad oedd neb wedi meddwl amdanynt o bosibl 50 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae'n bwysig inni dderbyn nad yw'r systemau'n berffaith a'n bod yn gweld beth y gallwn ei wneud i ddiogelu plant a chryfhau'r amddiffyniad sydd ar gael ar eu cyfer. Nid ydym yn derbyn yr awgrym bod rhyw fath o chwalfa systemig, gan nad ydym wedi gweld dim tystiolaeth i gefnogi hynny, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu nad ydym yn benderfynol o wneud hyd yn oed yn well nag yr ydym yn gwneud eisoes.

Mynd i'r Afael ag Anghydraddoldeb

C4 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth

Government is doing to tackle inequality in Wales? OAQ(3)2390(FM)

The First Minister: There are many aspects to inequality. I am pleased that we have seen the commencement of Inter Faith Week, which will culminate in an inter-faith eisteddfod on 5 December. In addition, we have published our first ever single equalities scheme, which sets out the Government's priorities for action to tackle inequality in Wales.

Val Lloyd: I wish to focus on health inequality. I am concerned that the statistics in the Welsh health survey continue to show a link between deprivation and ill health. For example, the sample analysed in the survey shows that 9 per cent of people classified as most deprived have diabetes compared with 5 per cent of those classified as being least deprived. Similarly, 32 per cent of people who are classified as being most deprived suffer a limiting, long-term illness while only 24 per cent of the least deprived do. I am aware that that is fairly consistent with lifestyle habits, such as smoking, drinking and a poor diet, but it has a significant impact on life expectancy. Can you tell me what is being done to address these issues in Wales in a move to end health inequality?

The First Minister: It will be a long time before we eliminate health inequality, but we are trying to minimise it. As for the emphasis on primary care and on community and preventative care and health promotion, it is important that we are conscious of the fact that, of any health improvement made in, say, heart disease figures, probably 1 per cent of the improvement is caused by what happens behind hospital doors, and perhaps another 1 per cent by what happens behind the door of the GP surgery.

Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2390(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ceir llawer agwedd ar anghydraddoldeb. Yr wyf yn falch inni weld dechrau'r Wythnos Ryng-Ffydd, a ddaw i ben gydag eisteddfod ryng-ffydd ar 5 Rhagfyr. Hefyd, yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi'n cynllun cydraddoldebau sengl cyntaf erioed, sy'n amlinellu blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer gweithredu i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb yng Nghymru.

Val Lloyd: Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar anghydraddoldeb ym maes iechyd. Yr wyf yn poeni bod ystadegau arolwg iechyd Cymru'n dal i ddangos cysylltiad rhwng amddifadedd ac afiechyd. Er enghraifft, dengys y sampl a ddadansoddwyd yn yr arolwg fod diabetes ar 9 y cant o bobl yn y categori mwyaf amddifadus o'u cymharu â 5 y cant o'r rhai yn y categori lleiaf amddifadus. Yn yr un modd, mae 32 y cant o bobl yn y categori mwyaf amddifadus yn dioddef salwch cyfyngol, hirdymor, ond dim ond 24 y cant o blith y lleiaf amddifadus sydd yn dioddef salwch o'r math hwnnw. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod hynny'n weddol gyson ag arferion ffordd o fyw, megis ysmegu, yfed a deiet gwael, ond mae'n cael dylanwad sylweddol ar ddisgwyliad oes. A allwch ddweud wrthyf beth sy'n cael ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yng Nghymru er mwyn ceisio rhoi terfyn ar anghydraddoldeb ym maes iechyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd angen cryn amser er mwyn dileu anghydraddoldeb ym maes iechyd yn llwyr, ond yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau cyn lleied o anghydraddoldeb ag sy'n bosibl. O ran y pwyslais ar ofal sylfaenol ac ar ofal yn y gymuned, gofaliad ataliol a hybu iechyd, mae'n bwysig inni gofio, gydag unrhyw welliant ym maes iechyd, dyweder o ran ffigurau clefyd y galon, mai 1 y cant o'r gwelliant, mae'n debyg, sy'n dod yn sgîl yr hyn sy'n digwydd y tu ôl i ddrysau'r ysbty, a bod 1 y cant arall efallai'n dod yn sgîl yr hyn sy'n digwydd y tu ôl i ddrws meddygfa'r meddyg teulu.

2.00 p.m.

The rest of it will be done by amendments to lifestyles. The reduced intake of animal fats would amount to about 30 per cent; another 30 per cent could be accounted for by reduced intake of excess carbohydrates; another 25 per cent could be accounted for by reduced intake of salt; 5 per cent could be accounted for by improved uptake of exercise; and 1 per cent could be accounted for by faster ambulances and faster clot-to-needle times, and so on. We must remember that the huge impact of amending people's lifestyles is much greater than anything that we can do inside the hospital or even in GP surgeries.

Alun Cairns: First Minister, in response to Nick Bourne earlier, you said that economists say that we should be quite bullish about the prospects for the future. You were all too ready to claim success when unemployment, in quarter on quarter figures published earlier this year, had not risen, but the figures for the last two quarters have been devastating for Wales—and even more devastating for the families affected. As a result, there is greater inequality in Wales, and we have the highest figures of all UK nations for people out of work. If we look to west Wales and the Valleys, the figures are even worse. Do you think that your bullish talk—you have been doing that for the past 10 years, as First Minister—about how we were better placed to handle the recession because of European structural funds, and that we could look forward with some optimism, has resulted in our unemployment figures being higher than the rest of the United Kingdom? Is that what you consider to be a success, or have you done something wrong along the way?

The First Minister: The unemployment figures that came out last week were puzzling, because the figures for claimant

Newid ffordd o fyw a fydd yn gyfrifol am y gweddill. Byddai bwyta llai o fraster anifeiliaid yn cyfrannu tua 30 y cant; byddai bwyta llai o garbohydradau gormodol yn cyfrannu 30 y cant arall; byddai bwyta llai o halen yn cyfrannu 25 y cant arall; byddai gwneud mwy o ymarfer corff yn cyfrannu 5 y cant; a byddai ambiwlansys cyflymach a rhoi pigiad yn gyflymach pan fydd ceulo wedi digwydd yn cyfrannu 1 y cant, ac yn y blaen. Rhaid inni gofio bod newid ffordd o fyw pobl yn cael dylanwad enfawr, mwy o lawer na dim y gallwn ei wneud y tu mewn i'r ysbty neu hyd yn oed ym meddygfeydd meddygon teulu.

Alun Cairns: Brif Weinidog, wrth ymateb i Nick Bourne yn gynharach, dywedasoed fod economegwyr yn dweud y dylem fod yn eithaf hyderus ynglŷn â'r rhagolygon ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yr oeddech yn barod iawn i honni eich bod yn llwyddo pan nad oedd diweithdra wedi codi, yn y ffigurau chwarterol a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach eleni, ond mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer y ddau chwarter diwethaf wedi bod yn erchyll i Gymru—ac yn fwy erchyll byth i'r teuluoedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Yn sgîl hynny, mae mwy o anghydraddoldeb yng Nghymru, ac yng Nghymru y mae'r ffigurau diweithdra uchaf o blith holl wledydd y Deyrnas Unedig. Os edrychwn ar y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, mae'r ffigurau'n waeth byth. A gredwch fod eich geiriau hyderus—ac yr ydych wedi bod yn gwneud hynny ers 10 mlynedd, fel Prif Weinidog—ynglŷn â sut yr oeddem mewn gwell sefyllfa i ymdopi â'r dirwasgiad oherwydd cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop, ac y gallem edrych tua'r dyfodol gyda rhywfaint o obaith, wedi arwain at y ffigurau diweithdra uwch yma nag yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig? Ai dyna yw llwyddiant yn eich tyb chi, ynteu a ydych wedi gwneud rhywbeth o'i le yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd y ffigurau diweithdra a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn syndod braidd, oherwydd bod y

count unemployment looked good, and the wider count of unemployment looked bad. Alun Cairns says that we should look at the wider count of unemployment and say that this is a sign of hopeless failure, but our economists said that we could be quite bullish about this. I had to choose between listening to Alun Cairns or listening to our economists. I am terribly sorry, Alun, but I decided to listen to our economists, who said 'You can be quite bullish about this'. If you want to explore that with our economists, they are quite happy to have a meeting with you to take you through the figures, and you can put all these points to them as well. However, we are acting on their guidance.

Janet Ryder: First Minister, one of the biggest inequalities that exists in Wales is that between male and female wage levels, particularly for doing the same type of job. A number of county councils are currently trying to tussle with how to equalise that pay and overcome the problem. Where county councils in England have addressed this, particularly in Brighton and Leeds, they have equalised pay down to the lowest level—many male workers have seen their wage being reduced to the lower level of a female worker. In England, that has resulted in strikes and a great deal of discontent. First Minister, can you give an assurance that you will do everything that you can to make sure that a similar situation does not arise in Wales, and that we arrive at a situation where people get equal pay for the right work?

The First Minister: I was not proposing to invite the director of human resources of Leeds or Brighton councils to Wales to show us how it is done, if that is what you mean. Whatever problems they have got into in Leeds or Brighton as to how best to implement equal pay, I do not think that we have any proposals to follow them. Equal pay

fffigurau ar gyfer nifer y di-waith sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau'n edrych yn dda, a bod y cyfrif ehangach o nifer y di-waith yn edrych yn ddrwg. Dywed Alun Cairns y dylem edrych ar y cyfrif ehangach o nifer y di-waith gan ddweud bod hyn yn arwydd o fethiant anobeithiol, ond dywedodd ein heconomegwyr y gallem fod yn eithaf hyderus ynglŷn â hyn. Yr oedd yn rhaid imi ddewis rhwng gwrando ar Alun Cairns neu wrando ar ein heconomegwyr. Mae'n ddrwg iawn gennyf, Alun, ond penderfynais wrando ar ein heconomegwyr, a ddywedodd 'Gallwch fod yn eithaf hyderus ynglŷn â hyn'. Os ydych am drafod hynny gyda'n heconomegwyr, maent yn eithaf bodlon cael cyfarfod â chi i'ch tywys drwy'r ffigurau, a gallwch godi'r pwyntiau hyn i gyd gyda hwythau hefyd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn gweithredu ar sail eu harweiniad.

Janet Ryder: Brif Weinidog: un o'r anghydraddoldebau mwyaf yng Nghymru yw'r anghydraddoldeb rhwng cyflogau menywod a chyflogau dynion, yn enwedig am wneud yr un math o waith. Mae nifer o gynghorau sir wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ceisio ymaflyd â sut y mae cydraddoli'r cyflogau hynny a datrys y broblem. Lle y mae cynghorau sir yn Lloegr wedi mynd i'r afael â hyn, yn enwedig yn Brighton a Leeds, maent wedi cydraddoli cyflogau drwy eu gostwng i'r lefel isaf—mae llawer o ddynion sy'n gweithio iddynt wedi gweld eu cyflog yn cael ei ostwng i lefel is cyflog menywod. Yn Lloegr, mae hynny wedi arwain at streiciau a llawer iawn o anafodlonrwydd. Brif Weinidog, a allwch roi sicrwydd y gwnewch bopeth a allwch i sicrhau nad oes sefyllfa debyg yn codi yng Nghymru ac y cyrhaeddwn sefyllfa lle y bydd pobl yn cael cyflog cyfartal am y gwaith iawn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oeddwn yn bwriadu gwahodd cyfarwyddwr adnoddau dynol cyngor Leeds neu gyngor Brighton i Gymru i ddangos inni sut y mae gwneud hyn, os mai dyna yr ydych yn ei feddwl. Pa broblemau sydd ganddynt ynnddynt yn Leeds neu yn Brighton o ran y ffordd orau o roi cyflogau cyfartal ar waith, nid wyf yn meddwl ei bod

legislation has involved all councils in Wales, as in England, in looking seriously at their systems and to take suitable remedial actions where they have been paying unequally over the past 30-odd years. I do not know how many local authorities in Wales have made the appropriate arrangements—Neath Port Talbot and Torfaen councils kicked off their arrangements four or five years ago, but I do not know how many other councils have reached an agreement; we sometimes have to underwrite those agreements where they involve changes in financial structures—but we have been supportive of councils that have come forward with sensible policies, which perhaps do not follow the Leeds and Brighton municipal refuse examples.

Economic Development

Q5 Angela Burns: Will the First Minister make a statement on the economic development of Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire? OAQ(3)2398(FM)

The First Minister: Among recent significant developments in the economy of the Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire constituency has been the identification of Unit Engineers and Constructors Ltd as being one of this year's fast growth 50 companies, having seen its turnover grow by almost 1,000 per cent in the two year period from 2006 to 2008. I am sure that we would all want to join in congratulating Unit Engineers and Construction Ltd.

Angela Burns: I, too, congratulate the company. However, I am concerned that there seems to be an increase in barriers for smaller businesses and enterprises in Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire, and I am sure that this is true for all of Wales. It is harder to get business loans, the value added tax position will be changing soon, the new rateable values have hit a number of businesses hard and there are other small things, such as parking charges being raised

yn fwriad gennym eu dilyn. Mae deddfwriaeth cyflog cyfartal wedi golygu bod pob cyngor yng Nghymru, fel yn Lloegr, yn edrych o ddifrif ar eu systemau ac yn cymryd camau priodol i unioni unrhyw sefyllfa lle y maent wedi bod yn talu cyflogau anghyfartal yn ystod y 30 mlynedd diwethaf. Ni wn faint o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru sydd wedi gwneud y trefniadau priodol. Dechreuodd Castell-nedd Port Talbot a Thor-faen ar eu trefniadau bedair neu bum mlynedd yn ôl, ond ni wn faint o gynghorau eraill sydd wedi llwyddo i sicrhau cytundeb; weithiau bydd yn rhaid inni warantu'r cytundebau hynny lle y byddant yn golygu newid strwythurau ariannol—ond yr ydym wedi cefnogi cynghorau sydd wedi cynnig polisiau synhwyrol, nad ydynt efallai'n dilyn esiampl casglu sbwriel trefol Leeds a Brighton.

Datblygu Economaidd

C5 Angela Burns: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygiad economaidd Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro? OAQ(3)2398(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhai o'r datblygiadau pwysig sydd wedi bod yn ddiweddar yn economi etholaeth Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro yw enwi Unit Engineers and Constructors Ltd yn un o'r 50 o gwmnïau sy'n tyfu'n gyflym eleni, gyda'i drosiant wedi tyfu bron 1,000 y cant yn ystod y ddwy flynedd rhwng 2006 a 2008. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd am ymuno i longyfarch Unit Engineers and Construction Ltd.

Angela Burns: Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn llongyfarch y cwmni. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn poeni bod busnesau a mentrau llai yng Ngorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro i bob golwg yn wynebu mwy o rwystrau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod hyn yn wir drwy Gymru gyfan. Mae'n anos cael benthyciadau busnes, bydd y sefyllfa o ran treth ar werth yn newid cyn bo hir, mae'r gwerthoedd trethiannol newydd wedi bod yn ergyd galed i sawl busnes ac mae pethau bach eraill, megis

and charges being placed on people who put up signs advertising their businesses. For many small businesses, on which rural economies, in particular, depend, it seems to be death by 1,000 small cuts at the moment. I am never one to promote unnecessary inquiries, but would you consider holding a small, quick and targeted review for Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire and the whole of Wales, looking at all these small things that are affecting the low end of the sector at the moment? One of my big concerns is that we will lose a lot of these small one, two and three man or woman bands, which underpin the strategies for getting out of the recession in the coming years.

The First Minister: Small businesses fulfil three important functions. First, they are a form of entry into business for people who were not previously in business—that is, new enterprises. Secondly, if we can improve the rate of survival of small businesses and increase their overall numbers through a combination of birth and survival, we will simply have more one, two and three man or woman bands. Finally, some small businesses start small but, like Unit Engineers and Construction Ltd, rapidly reach 200 employees, as I believe that Unit Engineers and Construction Ltd has done, through a combination of organic growth and at least one takeover. All three functions are incredibly important, and the more rural the area—your constituency is mainly rural—the more important all three functions are in providing a diverse economic base and, therefore, greater resilience than would be the case with one company. If that one company went down, there would be dozens of other companies to take its place in the employment market.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae tref Caerfyrddin yn etholaeth Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Penfro ond mae'n eithriadol o bwysig i fy etholaeth a fy etholwyr i, o ran cyfleustra a siopa, a hefyd i economi Dwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr. Mae sawl tref

cynyddu prisiau parcio a chodi tâl ar bobl sy'n gosod arwyddion i hysbysebu eu busnesau. I lawer o fusnesau bach, y mae economïau gwledig, yn arbennig, yn dibynnu arnynt, mae'n ymddangos eu bod yn cael lluo o ergydion difaol ar hyn o bryd. Ni fyddaf byth o blaid cynnal ymchwiliadau diangen, ond a fyddech yn ystyried cynnal adolygiad bach, sydyn wedi'i dargedu ar gyfer Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro a Chymru gyfan, i edrych ar yr holl bethau bach hyn sy'n effeithio ar ben isaf y sector ar hyn o bryd? Un o'r pethau sy'n fy mhoeni fwyaf yw y byddwn yn colli llawer o'r busnseau bach hyn lle nad oes ond un neu ddau neu dri o bobl, sy'n sail i'r strategaethau ar gyfer camu o'r dirwasgiad yn y blynyddoedd nesaf.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae busnesau bach yn cyflawni tair swyddogaeth o bwys. Yn gyntaf, maent yn gyfrwng i bobl nad oeddent mewn busnes cyn hynny ddechrau arni—sef mentrau newydd. Yn ail, os gallwn wella cyfradd goroesi busnesau bach a chynyddu eu nifer yn gyffredinol drwy gyfuniad o eni a goroesi, bydd gennym fwy o fusnesau lle nad oes ond un neu ddau neu dri o bobl. Yn olaf, bydd rhai busnesau bach yn dechrau'n fach, ond fel Unit Engineers and Construction Ltd, yn cyrraedd 200 o weithwyr yn gyflym, fel y credaf fod Unit Engineers and Construction Ltd wedi gwneud, drwy gyfuniad o dwf organig a phrynu o leiaf un cwmni arall. Mae pob un o'r tair swyddogaeth hyn yn anhygoel o bwysig, a pho fwyaf gwledig fydd yr ardal—etholaeth wledig yn bennaf yw eich etholaeth chi—po bwysicaf fydd pob un o'r tair swyddogaeth hyn o ran creu sylfaen economaidd amrywiol, ac felly, mwy o wytnwch nag a fyddai'n wir gydag un cwmni. Petai'r un cwmni hwnnw'n methu, byddai dwsinau o gwmnïau eraill i lenwi'r bwloch yn y farchnad gyflogaeth.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The town of Carmarthen is in the Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire constituency but it is extremely important for my constituency and constituents, in terms of convenience and for shopping, and also for the economy of

farchnad yn sir Gaerfyrddin sydd yn gwasanaethu ardal eang iawn a busnesau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. A wnewch ystyried y sefyllfa bresennol mewn trefi marchnad, fel Caerfyrddin, lle mae sawl siop wag? Mae hynny'n effeithio ar ddelwedd y dref, ond mae hefyd yn cynnig cyfle: pe bai modd sicrhau bod y siopau hynny ar gael am gyfnodau byr i fusnesau nad ydynt, fel arall, yn gallu fforddio bod yng nghanol trefi, byddai'n gyfle iddynt hyrwyddo eu nwyddau gan ddenu pobl i leoliadau mwy gwledig.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n bwysig cadw trefi marchnad clasurol fel Caerfyrddin—efallai'r enghraifft orau yng Nghymru o dref farchnad glasurol—yn iach, nid yn unig o ran eu siopau ond o ran y gwasanaethau busnes y maent yn eu darparu i gylch eithaf helaeth. Mae hefyd yn bwysig ein bod yn gweld beth y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau nad oes siopau neu swyddfeydd gwag yn y trefi hynny. Mae'n rhaid i Gaerfyrddin barhau i allu denu pobl sy'n defnyddio canolfannau tu allan i'r dref, fel Llansamlet ar ochr ogleddol Abertawe a Pharc Trostre yn Llanelli, gan weithredu fel magned i siopwyr a phobl sydd eisiau gwasanaethau busnes fel cyfreithwyr, cyfrifwyr ac ati. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig fel un o swyddogaethau tref farchnad fel Caerfyrddin, ac mae'n bwysig i ardal helaeth o'r hen Ddyfed fod Caerfyrddin yn parhau i ffynnu.

The Recession

Q6 Nick Ramsay: Will the First Minister update us on the Welsh Assembly Government's policies to combat the recession? OAQ(3)2389(FM)

The First Minister: On top of bringing forward capital investment schemes worth some £125 million into the present financial year of 2009-10, and the tail end of the last financial year of 2008-09, from next year's budget, other schemes that are relevant to combating the recession are ProAct, to help people not to be made redundant and ReAct, to help people who have been made

Carmarthen East and Dinefwr. A number of market towns in Carmarthenshire serve a very wide area and businesses in rural areas. Will you consider the current situation in market towns like Carmarthen, where there are a number of empty shops? That affects the town's image, but it also presents an opportunity: if those shops could be offered, for short periods, to businesses that could not otherwise afford to be in town centres, it would give them an opportunity to promote their goods and would attract people to more rural areas.

The First Minister: It is important to keep classic market towns like Carmarthen—the best example, perhaps, of a classic Welsh market town—vibrant, not only for their shops but also for the business services that they provide for a fairly wide area. It is also important that we see what can be done to ensure that there are no empty shops or offices in such towns. Carmarthen must continue to be able to attract people who use out-of-town shopping centres such as Llansamlet on the northern side of Swansea or Parc Trostre in Llanelli, acting as a magnet for shoppers and people who want business services such as solicitors, accountants and so on. That is a vital role for market towns such as Carmarthen, and it is important for a large part of the former Dyfed that Carmarthen continues to thrive.

Y Dirwasgiad

C6 Nick Ramsay: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd i'r afael â'r dirwasgiad? OAQ(3)2389(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ogystal â dwyn cynlluniau buddsoddi cyfalaf gwerth tua £125 miliwn ymlaen i'r flwyddyn ariannol hon, sef 2009-10, a diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf sef 2008-09, o gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf, cynlluniau eraill sy'n berthnasol i frwydro yn erbyn y dirwasgiad yw ProAct, i gynorthwyo cwmnïau i beidio â diswyddo pobl a ReAct, i gynorthwyo pobl sydd wedi

redundant to get back into work, and also the JEREMIE fund. As regards ProAct, I can give you an update—7,430 people are now being supported through 178 successful ProAct applications, with another 140 applications still being considered.

colli eu swydd i gael gwaith eto, a hefyd cronfa JEREMIE. O ran ProAct, gallaf roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ichi—mae 7,430 o bobl bellach yn cael cymorth drwy gyfrwng 178 o geisiadau llwyddiannus o dan ProAct, a 140 o geisiadau eraill yn dal i gael eu hystyried.

2.10 p.m.

Nick Ramsay: I am glad that you mentioned ProAct and ReAct. Those schemes are welcomed in the effect that they have had on certain areas of the economy. However, there are concerns that those schemes are something of a postcode lottery. I think that I am right in saying that, in Conwy for instance, there has been extremely little money from the ProAct scheme to support businesses. If we want to grow the economy out of recession, as the Government says that it wants to do, we have to give adequate support to all parts of Wales. What are your views on this worrying problem with the roll-out of the ProAct and ReAct schemes?

Nick Ramsey: Yr wyf yn falch ichi sôn am ProAct a ReAct. Mae'r cynlluniau hynny i'w croesawu o ran y dylanwad y maent wedi'i gael ar rai meysydd o'r economi. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai'n poeni mai loteri cod post yw'r cynlluniau hynny i ryw raddau. Credaf fy mod yn iawn wrth ddweud mai ychydig iawn o arian y mae Conwy, er enghraifft, wedi'i gael gan gynllun ProAct i gynorthwyo busnesau. Os ydym am weld yr economi'n tyfu allan o'r dirwasgiad, sef yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud ei bod am iddo ddigwydd, rhaid inni roi cymorth digonol i bob rhan o Gymru. Beth yw eich barn am y broblem hon, sy'n destun gofid, o ran rhoi cynllun ProAct a chynllun ReAct ar waith?

The First Minister: We are dependent on the flow of applications. As I say, 338 companies have applied, and 178 applications have been approved, with another 140-odd being considered. We are totally dependent on where the applications come from, and we cannot predetermine that there will be a minimum of six applications from each of the 22 local authority areas—it does not work like that. We are puzzled that some areas tend to have a strong flow of applications, and others do not; we think that it is probably the demonstration effect. For example, Carmarthenshire got in early, largely because of the strength of the automotive engineering section of the economy in that area. When one automotive engineering firm benefits from the scheme, the word gets around the bush telegraph and nearby firms think about applying as well. If there are no companies in an area with experience of obtaining ProAct money, then there is no-one to ring to ask about applying for it—where you get the forms, and so on.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn dibynnu ar lif y ceisiadau. Fel y dywedaf, mae 338 o gwmnïau wedi ymgeisio, ac mae 178 o geisiadau wedi'u cymeradwyo, gyda rhyw 140 arall yn cael eu hystyried. Yr ydym yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar o ble y daw'r ceisiadau, ac ni allwn ragbennu y daw o leiaf chwe chais gan bob un o ardaloedd y 22 awdurdod lleol—nid felly y mae'n gweithio. Yr ydym yn synnu bod llif cryf o geisiadau'n tueddu i ddod o rai ardaloedd, ac nad yw'r un peth yn wir am ardaloedd eraill; credwn mai'r hyn sy'n digwydd mae'n debyg yw bod rhai'n dangos y ffordd i eraill. Er enghraifft, dechreuodd sir Gaerfyrddin arni'n fuan, yn bennaf oherwydd cryfder adran peirianeg moduro'r economi yn yr ardal honno. Pan fydd un cwmni peirianeg moduro'n elwa o'r cynllun, mae'r si'n mynd ar led a bydd cwmnïau eraill yn yr ardal yn ystyried ymgeisio hefyd. Os nad oes gan gwmnïau mewn ardal brofiad o gael arian ProAct, yna, nid oes neb i'w ffonio i holi ynglŷn ag ymgeisio amdano—ymhle y mae'r ffurflenni

There is no bush telegraph in operation in such circumstances. However, we are dependent on where the applications come from; we cannot predetermine that.

Alun Davies: All too often we discuss the recession in terms of economics and statistics, and the real human cost can be lost or hidden. I am sure that you will join me in welcoming the £700,000 that has been given to Citizens Advice to provide help, and acknowledge the human cost of recession on families. I am sure that you will agree that the money will make a real difference to Citizens Advice and its facilities, enabling it to reach out to people, particularly those who are not close to existing advice centres. It will enable people to find the help and support that they need to get through these difficult times.

The First Minister: It was a great pleasure to make that announcement at the seventieth birthday celebrations for Citizens Advice in Wales last week. That does not mean that everyone who is 70 years old gets £747,000, otherwise I would be quids in, but it was good to establish that innovative scheme to set up a co-ordinated telephone service for Citizens Advice throughout Wales. If all the lines in Cardiff are in use, callers from Cardiff will now be diverted to a bureau somewhere else in Wales, where there is a volunteer available. It is a clever piece of information technology, and we think that that is money well spent.

Jenny Randerson: I was not convinced at all by your earlier reply, stating that higher education could save 5 per cent this year by raising further funds from the private sector. I recognise the importance of higher education institutions working closely together to obtain private sector investment. However, if you expect them to increasingly rely on such investment, can you explain why International Business Wales is not working

ar gael, ac yn y blaen. Nid oes system ar lawr gwlad i ledu'r sôn amdano dan amgylchiadau o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dibynnu o ble y daw'r ceisiadau; ni allwn ragbennu hynny.

Alun Davies: Yn rhy aml o lawer, byddwn yn trafod y dirwasgiad drwy sôn am economeg ac ystadegau, a gellir colli golwg ar y wir gost ddynol neu gall fod ynghudd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i groesawu'r £700,000 sydd wedi'i roi i'r gwasanaeth Cyngor ar Bopeth i roi cymorth, ac i gydnabod cost ddynol y dirwasgiad i deuluoedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y bydd yr arian yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i'r gwasanaeth Cyngor ar Bopeth a'i gyfleusterau, gan ei alluogi i estyn allan at bobl, yn enwedig y rhai nad ydynt yn agos at ganolfannau cynghori ar hyn o bryd. Bydd yn galluogi pobl i ddod o hyd i'r cymorth a'r gefnogaeth y mae eu hangen arnynt er mwyn goroesi'r cyfnod anodd hwn.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd yn bleser mawr cyhoeddi hynny yn nathliadau pen-blwydd Cyngor ar Bopeth yn ddeg a thrigain oed yng Nghymru yr wythnos diwethaf. Nid yw hynny'n golygu bod pawb sy'n 70 oed yn cael £747,000, neu byddwn i ar ben fy nigon, ond yr oedd yn dda sefydlu'r cynllun arloesol hwnnw i gychwyn gwasanaeth ffôn cydlynol ar gyfer yr holl ganolfannau Cyngor ar Bopeth ledled Cymru. Os bydd yr holl linellau yng Nghaerdydd yn brysur, bydd pobl sy'n galw o Gaerdydd yn awr yn cael eu trosglwyddo i swyddfa yn rhywle arall yng Nghymru, lle y mae gwirfoddolwr ar gael. Mae'r dechnoleg gwybodaeth yn glyfar iawn, a chredwn fod yr arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario'n dda.

Jenny Randerson: Ni chefais fy argyhoeddi o gwbl gan eich ateb cynharach, yn dweud y gallai addysg uwch arbed 5 y cant eleni drwy godi rhagor o arian gan y sector preifat. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli ei bod yn bwysig i sefydliadau addysg uwch gydweithio'n glòs i gael buddsoddiadau gan y sector preifat. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn disgwyl iddynt ddibynnu fwyfwy ar fuddsoddiadau o'r fath, a allwch esbonio pam nad yw Busnes

more closely with universities?

The First Minister: You have compressed what I said. What I was saying was that we decided on 5 per cent efficiency savings and a flatline budget for higher and further education because of the circumstances of the sector. We believe that it is possible for the sector to achieve that 5 per cent efficiency target without affecting front-line services.

The alternative sources of income for universities especially, although perhaps less so for further education, are European structural funds, research funding, and closer collaboration with business. Further education can access ProAct, with Coleg Sir Gâr being an outstanding example. However, it should not just be Coleg Sir Gâr. As mentioned earlier, because the Carmarthenshire economy got into the idea of ProAct early, Coleg Sir Gâr also got in early and has now received over £1 million in income from ProAct schemes.

There are many other ways of getting money in if you have an entrepreneurial attitude, as has been demonstrated by Coleg Sir Gâr. So, if you do not get Assembly Government money through one door, you can try another door, such as that for ProAct. Money can also be obtained through European structural funds and, in some cases, from charitable funds, medical charities and so on. The University of Glamorgan is building the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama's new auditorium and centre. It has not received full funding for that from us, but it is seeking £3 million from charitable funds. It is willing to proceed with the building on the basis that it is confident that it will get that money. You must, to a degree, be entrepreneurial about getting your money and not be solely reliant on receiving core funding from us.

Gareth Jones: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn

Rhyngwladol Cymru'n gweithio'n fwy clòs gyda'r prifysgolion?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych wedi cywasgu'r hyn a ddywedais. Yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud oedd inni benderfynu ar arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant a chyllideb ddigynnydd ar gyfer addysg uwch ac addysg bellach oherwydd amgylchiadau'r sector. Credwn fod modd i'r sector sicrhau'r targed effeithlonrwydd hwnnw o 5 y cant heb effeithio ar wasanaethau'r rheng flaen.

Y ffynonellau incwm eraill sydd ar gael i brifysgolion yn enwedig, ond yn llai felly efallai i addysg bellach, yw cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop, arian ymchwil, a chydweithredu mwy clòs â byd busnes. Gall addysg bellach fanteisio ar ProAct, ac mae Coleg Sir Gâr yn enghraifft wych o hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid dim ond Coleg Sir Gâr a ddylai fod yn gwneud hyn. Fel y crybwyllwyd yn gynharach, oherwydd bod economi sir Gaerfyrddin wedi cael gafael ar syniad ProAct yn fuan, achubodd Coleg Sir Gâr y cyfle hwnnw'n fuan hefyd ac erbyn hyn, mae wedi cael incwm o dros £1 filiwn drwy gynlluniau ProAct.

Mae llu o ffyrdd eraill o gael gafael ar arian drwy fod yn entrepreneuriaidd eich agwedd, fel y mae Coleg Sir Gâr wedi dangos. Felly, os na chewch arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy'r naill ddrws, gallwch roi cynnig ar ddrws arall, megis drws ProAct. Gellir cael arian hefyd drwy gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop, ac mewn ambell achos, o gronfeydd elusennol, elusennau meddygol ac yn y blaen. Mae Prifysgol Morgannwg yn adeiladu awditoriwm a chanolfan newydd Coleg Brenhinol Cerdd a Drama Cymru. Nid yw wedi cael yr holl arian ar gyfer hynny gennym ni, ond mae'n ceisio £3 miliwn o gronfeydd elusennol. Mae'n barod i fwrw ymlaen â'r adeilad ar y sail ei bod yn hyderus y caiff yr arian hwnnw. I ryw raddau, rhaid i chi fod yn entrepreneuriaidd eich agwedd at gael eich arian a pheidio â dibynnu'n unig ar gael arian craidd gennym ni.

Gareth Jones: Is the First Minister confident

hyderus bod modd cyflawni addewidion cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' o fewn yr adnoddau gwario sydd ar gael yn y dirwasgiad economaidd presennol? Pa fesurau eraill y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru eu gweithredu na fyddant o reidrwydd yn golygu gwario mwy, er enghraifft, gweithio'n fwy effeithlon ac annog syniadau a mentrau newydd gyda phartneriaid fel awdurdodau lleol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae eich pwynt yn berthnasol ac amserol. Fel y dywedais dim ond chwarter awr yn ôl, dywedodd pennaeth cyllid Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, gan siarad ar ran y penaethiaid drwy Gymru gyfan, y gellid arbed cymaint ag £1 biliwn yn flynyddol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Drwy weithio'n agosach, ad-drefnu'r gwasanaethau, cynnig gwasanaethau yn eu cartrefi i bobl nad ydynt eisiau mynd i mewn i'r ysbyty, lleihau nifer y nosweithiau y mae'n rhaid i bobl aros yn yr ysbyty, lleihau nifer yr apwyntiadau dilynol gyda'r ymgynghorydd, ac yn y blaen, gellid arbed £1 biliwn heb leihau o gwbl ar lefel y gwasanaeth.

Jeff Cuthbert: In the previous recessions under the Tories in the 1980s and the early 1990s, the Tory attitude was to do nothing and to say that unemployment was a price worth paying. Do you agree that our investment in ProAct, ReAct, apprenticeships and SkillBuild demonstrate that we are not—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. Jeff Cuthbert is well aware that the First Minister has no responsibility for Conservative recessions, but I believe that he is adapting his preamble to the question.

Jeff Cuthbert: I am grateful for your guidance, Presiding Officer. Do you agree that we are not going to abandon a generation to unemployment and hopelessness in the way that the Conservatives did quite consciously?

The First Minister: You make an important

that it is possible to achieve the pledges contained in the 'One Wales' agreement within the spending resources available during the current economic downturn? Which other measures could the Welsh Government take that do not necessarily require further spending, such as working more efficiently and encouraging new ideas and initiatives with partners such as local government and the health service?

The First Minister: Your point is pertinent and timely. As I said not quarter of an hour ago, the finance director of the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust stated, when speaking on behalf of the directors from across Wales, that as much as £1 billion could be saved annually in the health service. By collaborating more, by reorganising services, by offering services in people's homes to those who do not want to be admitted to hospital, by reducing the number of nights patients spend in hospital, reducing the number of follow-up appointments with the consultant, and so on, a total sum of £1 billion could be saved without diminishing the level of service at all.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yn y dirwasgiadau blaenorol o dan y Torïaid yn yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au, agwedd y Torïaid oedd peidio â gwneud dim a dweud bod diweithdra'n bris gwerth ei dalu. A gytunwch fod ein buddsoddiad yng nghynlluniau ProAct, ReAct, prentisiaethau ac Adeiladu Sgiliau'n dangos nad ydym—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gŵyr Jeff Cuthbert yn dda nad oes gan y Prif Weinidog gyfrifoldeb o gwbl dros ddirwasgiadau'r Ceidwadwyr, ond credaf ei fod yn addasu ei ragymadrodd i'r cwestiwn.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich arweiniad, Lywydd. A gytunwch nad ydym yn bwriadu gadael cenhedlaeth ar drugaredd diweithdra ac anobaith fel y gwnaeth y Ceidwadwyr a hynny'n gwbl ymwybodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae eich pwynt yn un

point. The *Financial Times* observed, in interpreting the unemployment figures that were published Wednesday of last week, that this may be the first recession in which the labour market was not a lagging indicator, as it was in the recession of the early 1980s, when unemployment carried on rising for over four years after the recession ended. After the recession of the early 1990s turned into growth, unemployment continued to rise for two to two and a half years. The *Financial Times* stated that it thought that this would be the first recession for a very long time in which unemployment would probably turn at the same time that gross domestic product turns, in other words, when the recession ends. We may be there today or in the next quarter; we will not know for sure until the figures demonstrate that to us. However, that is what the *Financial Times* said.

pwysig. Yr oedd sylw yn y *Financial Times*, wrth ddehongli'r ffigurau diweithdra a gyhoeddwyd ddydd Mercher yr wythnos diwethaf, mai hwn o bosibl yw'r dirwasgiad cyntaf lle nad oedd y farchnad lafur yn ddangosydd a oedd ar ei hôl hi fel yr oedd yn nirwasgiad dechrau'r 1980au. Bryd hynny, daliodd diweithdra i godi am dros bedair blynedd ar ôl diwedd y dirwasgiad. Ar ôl i ddirwasgiad dechrau'r 1990au droi'n dwf, parhaodd diweithdra i godi am ddwy flynedd neu ddwy flynedd a hanner. Dywedodd y *Financial Times* ei fod yn meddwl mai dyma'r dirwasgiad cyntaf ers amser maith iawn lle y byddai diweithdra'n troi ar yr un pryd, mae'n debyg, ag y bydd y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth yn troi, sef, pan ddaw'r dirwasgiad i ben. Efallai ein bod wedi cyrraedd y sefyllfa honno heddiw, neu y cyrhaeddwn hi yn y chwarter nesaf; ni fyddwn yn gwybod i sicrwydd nes bod y ffigurau'n dangos hynny inni. Serch hynny, dyna a ddywedodd y *Financial Times*.

Heads of the Valleys Programme

Q7 Christine Chapman: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Heads of the Valleys programme? OAQ(3)2392(FM)

The First Minister: The identification of Aberdare in your constituency as the first low-carbon town in Wales and the recent opening of the British Gas/Centrica national green skills training centre in Tredegar demonstrate the part that the Heads of the Valleys programme can help to play in putting the area at the forefront of a new Welsh economy.

2.20 p.m.

Christine Chapman: The regeneration of the Heads of the Valleys is long overdue, but there is no doubt that, since devolution, the perception of the Valleys has changed for the better, with improved transport links, investment in new hospitals and other services, and, taking advantage of the natural beauty of the area, the Valleys have been opened up as a great place to visit as well as

Rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd

C7 Christine Chapman: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am raglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd? OAQ(3)2392(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae dynodi Aberdâr yn eich etholaeth yn dref carbon isel gyntaf Cymru ac agor canolfan hyfforddi sgiliau gwyrdd cenedlaethol British Gas/Centrica yn Nhrefdegar yn dangos y rhan y gall rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd helpu i'w chwarae o ran rhoi'r ardal ar flaen y gad mewn economi newydd yng Nghymru.

Christine Chapman: Mae'n hen bryd adfywio Blaenau'r Cymoedd, ond nid oes amheuaeth, ers datganoli, nad yw'r ffordd y mae pobl yn gweld y Cymoedd wedi newid er gwell, gyda gwell cysylltiadau trafniadaeth, buddsoddi mewn ysbytai newydd a gwasanaethau eraill, a thrwy fanteisio ar harddwch naturiol yr ardal, mae'r Cymoedd bellach yn ardal wych i ymweld â hi a hefyd

in which to live. However, there is more to do and, for that reason, I would like to welcome the launch of the Heart and Soul of Wales campaign. Do you agree that, by involving Valleys residents in the future of the region, you will not only bring communities together, but bring about economic benefits?

The First Minister: Indeed. Many of the valleys in Wales were beauty spots before industry came in. That was particularly true of the Rhondda Valley and Briton Ferry was a great holiday resort before industry took over 150 years ago. I know that it is hard to credit today, but quality of life will return. When we ask where economic development is going to go in future, it will not be determined by who has the lowest wages and who gives the biggest grants. It will be down to the skills base, the quality of the infrastructure and the quality of life. The Valleys can offer those three big time. However, the image still lags behind the reality. It is about changing the image. The tourist campaign is going to help to do that. That will benefit tourism, but it will also benefit inward investment.

David Melding: Aberdare is a very good example of what you can do with the intelligent use of regeneration moneys. We should have greater ambition for this area. There is no question that it will be a wonderful environment in which to live if it is developed sympathetically. I want to pursue the tourism possibilities. With the improvement of the A465 and greater interconnectivity of the region, it strikes me that we could see appropriate developments, such as hotels, concentrating on the vast industrial heritage of that area. However, it is also a gateway to the wonders and beauty of mid Wales. Really, we should raise our ambitions for the development of this sector.

The First Minister: The Brecon Beacons national park is right next door and is a natural northward extension of the south

yn ardal wych i fyw ynddi. Fodd bynnag, mae rhagor i'w wneud a dyna pam yr hoffwn groesawu lansio ymgyrch Calon ac Enaid Cymru. A gytunwch, drwy gynnwys trigolion y Cymoedd yn nyfodol y rhanbarth, y byddwch nid yn unig yn dwyn cymunedau at ei gilydd, ond yn creu manteision economaidd hefyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn sicr. Yr oedd llawer o gymoedd Cymru'n llecynnau hardd cyn i ddiwydiant gyrraedd. Yr oedd hynny'n arbennig o wir am Gwm Rhondda ac yr oedd Llansawel yn gyrchfan gwyliau wych cyn i ddiwydiant ddod yno 150 mlynedd yn ôl. Gwn ei bod yn anodd credu hynny heddiw, ond daw ansawdd bywyd yn ôl. Pan fyddwn yn gofyn ymhle y bydd datblygu economaidd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol, nid pwy sy'n ennill y cyflogau isaf a phwy sy'n rhoi'r grantiau mwyaf fydd yn cyfrif. Y sylfaen sgiliau fydd yn bwysig, ansawdd y seilwaith ac ansawdd bywyd. Gall y Cymoedd gynnig y tri hynny gydag arddeliad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddelwedd yn dal i lusgo ar ôl y realiti. Mater o newid y ddelwedd ydyw. Bydd yr ymgyrch twristiaeth yn gymorth i wneud hynny. Bydd hynny o fudd i dwristiaeth, ond bydd o fudd hefyd o ran mewnfuddsoddi.

David Melding: Mae Aberdâr yn enghraifft dda iawn o'r hyn y gallwn ei wneud drwy ddefnyddio arian adfywio'n ddoeth. Dylai fod gennym fwy o uchelgais ar gyfer yr ardal hon. Nid oes dwywaith na fydd yn amgylchedd gwych i fyw ynddo os caiff ei ddatblygu mewn ffordd sensitif. Yr wyf am fynd ar drywydd y posibiladau o ran twristiaeth. Wrth wella'r A465 a chael gwell cysylltiadau rhwng ardaloedd y rhanbarth, mae'n ymddangos i mi y gallem weld datblygiadau priodol, megis gwystai, yn canolbwytio ar dreftadaeth ddiwydiannol enfawr yr ardal honno. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn borth i ryfeddodau a harddwch y canolbarth. Yn wir, dylem fod yn fwy uchelgeisiol wrth ddatblygu'r sector hwn.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae parc cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog y drws nesaf ac mae'n estyniad naturiol tua'r gogledd o lwyfandir

Wales industrial plateau, where many specialist sports, such as paragliding, take place already. The whole mountainous area above the Valleys and immediately north of the Valleys is seriously underplayed as part of the improved image that the Valleys can now access. On top of that, it is about modernising the infrastructure, modernising the housing, which was mostly built between 1870 and 1914—and nobody cared about energy efficiency at that time, particularly if they got seven tonnes of free coal—and the new hospitals, which my colleague the Minister for Health and Social Services is building. A sum of £172 million is being spent on the hospital in Ystrad Mynach, £66 million on the new hospital in Cwm Cynon, and £55 million on the new hospital in Ebbw Vale.

Chris Franks: First Minister, I welcome the sum of £3.6 million announced by the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport, Ieuan Wyn Jones, for the site of the former Burberry factory at Treorchy. The funds include money from the Heads of the Valleys programme. Can you tell us of other similar projects in the pipeline in the South Wales Central region? One of the huge successes of the Welsh Government has been the reopening of lines to passengers. Do you agree that the reopening of the line between Hirwaun and Aberdare should be a priority?

The First Minister: The Treorchy business park signals a completely new phase following the sad closure of the Burberry factory, which caused me to shove all of my Burberry chav gear into the bin and refuse to go to Cardiff City matches in it any longer. The important point is that there is a new path through the Treorchy business park investment announced a few days ago. There is hope that we can have employers that are really committed to the Valleys, as Burberry sadly proved not to be in the end. On the question of the reopening of railway lines, Network Rail and the Government have agreed to look at the potential of a clutch of

diwydiannol y de, lle y mae llawer o chwaraeon arbenigol, megis paragleidio, yn digwydd eisoes. Nid oes hanner digon o sylw wedi'i roi i'r ardal fynyddig sydd uwchben y Cymoedd ac yn union i'r gogledd ohonynt fel rhan o'r ddelwedd well y gall y Cymoedd fanteisio arni yn awr. Ar ben hynny, mae a wnelo â moderneiddio'r seilwaith, moderneiddio'r tai, a godwyd gan mwyaf rhwng 1870 a 1914—ac nid oedd neb yn poeni am effeithlonrwydd ynni bryd hynny, yn enwedig os oeddent yn cael saith tunnell o lo am ddim—a'r ysbytai newydd, y mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn eu hadeiladu. Mae swm o £172 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar yr ysbyty yn Ystrad Mynach, £66 miliwn ar yr ysbyty newydd yng Nghwm Cynon, a £55 miliwn ar yr ysbyty newydd yng Nglynebwy.

Chris Franks: Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn croesawu'r swm o £3.6 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, Ieuan Wyn Jones, ar gyfer safle hen ffatri Burberry yn Nhreforci. Mae hyn yn cynnwys arian gan raglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd. A allwch ddweud wrthym am brosiectau tebyg sydd ar y gweill yn rhanbarth Canol De Cymru? Un o lwyddiannau enfawr Llywodraeth Cymru fu ailagor rheilffyrdd i deithwyr. A gytunwch y dylai ailagor y rheilffordd rhwng Hirwaun ac Aberdâr fod yn flaenoriaeth.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae parc busnes Treorci'n arwydd o gyfnod cwbl newydd ar ôl tristwch cau ffatri Burberry, a wnaeth imi roi'r holl gêr 'chav' Burberry a oedd gennyf yn y bin a gwrthod ei wisgo i gemau Dinas Caerdydd rhagor. Y pwynt pwysig yw bod y buddsoddiad ym mharc busnes Treorci a gyhoeddwyd ychydig ddiwrnodau'n ôl yn agor llwybr newydd. Mae gobaith y gallwn gael cyflogwyr sy'n wirioneddol ymroddedig i'r Cymoedd. Gwaetha'r modd, nid oedd hynny'n wir am Burberry yn y pen draw. O ran ailagor rheilffyrdd, mae Network Rail a'r Llywodraeth wedi cytuno i ystyried potensial nifer o reilffyrdd newydd i deithwyr, lle y

new passenger lines, where lines exist. It has agreed with the Department of the Economy and Transport to prioritise two in particular, namely the line from Aberdare to Hirwaun and the line from Bangor to Llangefni via Gaerwen junction. It is important to let that work continue to see what the potential is, what the cost of reopening of those lines would be, what the potential passenger traffic would be, and whether it makes sense.

Michael German: I know that you will agree, First Minister, that the completion of the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road is an important part of the Heads of the Valleys regeneration programme, therefore I am struggling to understand why work on parts of the dualling programme has now slipped. In 2004, when you did a review of the trunk road programme, you said that the Brynmawr to Gilwern section would be ready to start by April 2010 and in phase 2. When we come to the next reprioritisation of the trunk road programme, that section of road is still in phase 2, has not moved up to phase 1, and is now estimated to start sometime after 2011. Could you explain why that work has slipped?

The First Minister: It is matter of getting on with the next section, which is Brynmawr to Tredegar, which will give a major boost to the area at the top end of the Rhymney, Sirhowy and both Ebbw valleys. We know that the difficult section is down the Clydach gorge to Gilwern, as you say, and I think that you are right in saying that there has been a year's slippage. I think that that has been caused entirely by technical problems. I will draw this to the attention of Ieuan Wyn Jones, as he is not here today. He and I have discussed this, and I do not remember what the technical problems were, but I will ask him to put that in a letter to you and place a copy in the Library.

Legislative Competence Orders

Q8 Leanne Wood: What discussions has the

mae'r rheilffyrdd yno'n barod. Mae wedi cytuno ag Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth i flaenoriaethu dwy'n benodol, sef y rheilffordd o Aberdâr i Hirwaun a'r rheilffordd o Fangor i Llangefni drwy gyffordd y Gaerwen. Mae'n bwysig gadael i'r gwaith hwnnw fynd rhagddo er mwyn gweld beth yw'r posibiladau, faint fyddai cost ailagor y rheilffyrdd hynny, faint a fyddai o bosibl yn teithio arnynt ac a yw'n gam call.

Michael German Gwn y cytunwch, Brif Weinidog, fod cwblhau deuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn rhan bwysig o raglen adfywio Blaenau'r Cymoedd, felly yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd deall pam mae'r gwaith ar rannau o'r rhaglen ddeuoli wedi llithro erbyn hyn. Yn 2004, wrth gynnal adolygiad o raglen y cefnffyrdd, dywedasoch y byddai'r rhan rhwng Bryn-mawr a Gilwern yn barod i ddechrau erbyn Ebrill 2010 ac yn nghan 2. Pan ddown at yr ailflaenoriaethu nesaf ar raglen y cefnffyrdd, mae'r rhan honno o'r ffordd yn dal yng nghan 2. Nid yw wedi symud yn ei blaen i gam 1, ac amcangyfrifir bellach y bydd yn dechrau awr rywbryd ar ôl 2011. A allech esbonio pam mae'r gwaith hwnnw wedi llithro?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mater o fwrw ymlaen â'r rhan nesaf ydyw, sef o Fryn-mawr i Dredegar, a fydd yn rhoi hwb mawr i'r ardal ym mhen uchaf cwm Rhymni, Sirhywi a'r ddau Gwm Ebwy. Gwyddom mai'r rhan anodd yw honno i lawr ceunant Clydach i Gilwern, fel y dywedwch, a chredaf eich bod yn iawn wrth ddweud bod yr amserlen wedi llithro flwyddyn. Credaf mai problemau technegol sydd wedi achosi hynny i gyd. Tynnaf sylw Ieuan Wyn Jones at hyn, gan nad yw yma heddiw. Mae ef a finnau wedi trafod hyn, ac ni chofiaf beth oedd y problemau technegol, ond gofynnaf iddo anfon y wybodaeth honno atoch drwy lythyr a rhoi copi yn y Llyfrgell

Gorchmynion Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol

C8 Leanne Wood: Pa drafodaethau y mae

Welsh Assembly Government had with the UK Government regarding the LCO process? OAQ(3)2402(FM)

The First Minister: We have frequent discussions and after a slow start when the LCO machinery was being established and tested, the process has since gathered pace and provides the Assembly Government, the Assembly and others with a good apprenticeship in legislative matters in advance of a referendum on acquiring Part 4 primary legislative powers under the Government of Wales Act 2006, which will be discussed further tomorrow.

Leanne Wood: Does the First Minister accept that the two parties that form the Government of Wales have both agreed on the need for a referendum extending the lawmaking powers in the Assembly, and that the only caveat to that is the convention, which reports tomorrow? I know that you cannot comment on a report that is yet to be published, but will you confirm that the 'One Wales' agreement will be stuck to, that the findings of the convention will be treated very seriously, and that the recommendations will be acted upon?

The First Minister: There is no fear about that. I have already said so earlier in an answer to Nerys, I think, in which I made clear that whereas we are convinced that we have done our apprenticeship and are now ready to move on to primary lawmaking powers, it is not a matter for us, but for the people of Wales, to be convinced that we have done our apprenticeship. That can only be tested in a referendum. We have to persuade the people of Wales that we have done our apprenticeship. We asked the Emyr Jones Parry convention to test whether the people of Wales think that we are now ready to move on to primary lawmaking powers. We will have to wait a few more hours to hear the answer to that.

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch y broses LCO? OAQ(3)2402(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd ac, ar ôl cychwyn araf, pan oedd peirianwaith y Gorchmynion Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol wrthi'n cael ei sefydlu a'i roi ar brawf, mae'r broses wedi cyflymu bellach ac mae'n cynnig prentisiaeth dda i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, i'r Cynulliad ac i eraill o ran materion deddfwriaethol cyn cynnal refferendwm ynglŷn â chael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol o dan Ran 4 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, a drafodir ymhellach yfory.

Leanne Wood: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn bod y ddwy blaid sy'n ffurfio Llywodraeth Cymru ill dwy wedi cytuno bod angen refferendwm a fyddai'n ehangu pwerau deddfu yn y Cynulliad, ac mai'r unig gafeat i hynny yw'r confensiwn sy'n cyflwyno'i adroddiad yfory? Gwn na allwch ddweud dim am adroddiad nad yw wedi'i gyhoeddi eto, ond a wnewch gadarnhau y glynir wrth gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', y bydd canfyddiadau'r confensiwn yn cael eu hystyried o ddifrif, ac y gweithredir ar yr argymhellion?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny. Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud hynny'n gynharach wrth ateb Nerys, fe gredaf, pan nodais yn glir, er ein bod yn argyhoeddedig ein bod wedi gwneud ein prentisiaeth a'n bod bellach yn barod i symud ymlaen at bwerau deddfu sylfaenol, nad mater i ni, ond mater i bobl Cymru, yw cael eu hargyhoeddi ein bod wedi gwneud ein prentisiaeth. Refferendwm yw'r unig ffordd o brofi hynny. Rhaid inni ddarbwyllio pobl Cymru ein bod wedi gwneud ein prentisiaeth. Gofynasom i gonfensiwn Emyr Jones Parry holi a yw pobl Cymru'n meddwl ein bod yn barod yn awr i symud ymlaen at bwerau deddfu sylfaenol. Rhaid inni aros ychydig oriau eto i glywed yr ateb i hynny.

Local Government Employment

Q9 Trish Law: What assessment has the Welsh Assembly Government made of the number of local government staff who will be laid off in 2009-10? OAQ(3)2391(FM)

The First Minister: All local authorities will have to work hard to match spending to the resources available in 2010-11. Our funding also provides some opportunities for new staff to be recruited in priority areas. For instance 2,000 additional classroom assistants joined the workforce in September 2008. Early indications show that in excess of 3,000 additional learning assistants will be in post during the current school year with further funding and job opportunities as roll-out continues in 2011.

Trish Law: Wales is a nation that is heavily reliant on the public sector for its employment. Between a quarter and a third of all jobs are within the public sector, therefore, harsh financial settlements to local government, on top of the recession, can have and are having serious consequences for jobs and for the Welsh economy.

2.30 p.m.

The Welsh Local Government Association reckons that Welsh councils will have to shed 700 jobs this year, 300 of which are in south-east Wales, and 2,000 by the end of 2011. Do you share my concerns that the severe squeeze that is being imposed on local government in Wales is seriously damaging the nation's employment and economic prospects?

The First Minister: We all accept that the private sector is not large enough in Wales, and it is one area to which we have given a lot of attention. Although the arrows are pointing in the right direction in respect of the growth of the private sector, the distribution between private and public sector is not yet at a normal level—but it is getting

Cyflogaeth mewn Llywodraeth Leol

C9 Trish Law: Pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i wneud o nifer y staff llywodraeth leol a fydd yn colli eu swyddi yn 2009-10? OAQ(3)2391(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd yn rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol weithio'n galed i dafoli'r gwario a'r adnoddau sydd ar gael yn 2010-11. Mae ein harian hefyd yn cynnig ychydig o gyfleoedd i staff newydd gael eu recriwtio mewn meysydd sy'n flaenoriaeth. Er enghraifft, ymunodd 2,000 o gynorthwywyr dosbarth ychwanegol â'r gweithlu ym mis Medi 2008. Yn ôl yr arwyddion cynnar bydd mwy na 3,000 o gynorthwywyr dysgu ychwanegol yn eu swyddi yn ystod y flwyddyn ysgol hon, gyda rhagor o arian a chyfleoedd ar gyfer swyddi wrth barhau i roi hyn ar waith yn 2011.

Trish Law: Mae Cymru'n wlad sy'n dibynnu'n drwm ar y sector cyhoeddus am ei swyddi. Mae rhwng chwarter a thraean yr holl swyddi o fewn y sector cyhoeddus, felly, gall setliadau ariannol llym i lywodraeth leol, ar ben y dirwasgiad, gael dylanwad difrifol ar swyddi ac ar economi Cymru ac yn wir, maent yn cael dylanwad o'r fath..

Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n meddwl y bydd yn rhaid i gynghorau Cymru golli 700 o swyddi eleni, 300 o'r rheiny yn y de-ddwyrain, a 2,000 erbyn diwedd 2011. A ydych chi, fel minnau, yn poeni bod y wasgfa lem ar lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru'n gwneud difrod difrifol i ragolygon economaidd y wlad a'i rhagolygon am swyddi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn nad yw'r sector preifat yn ddigon mawr yng Nghymru, ac mae'n un maes yr ydym wedi rhoi llawer o sylw iddo. Er bod y saethau'n pwyntio i'r cyfeiriad iawn o ran twf y sector preifat, nid yw'r cydbwysedd rhwng y sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus wedi cyrraedd lefel normal eto—ond mae'n dynesu at y fan

there.

As regards the settlement, it is an overall settlement of 2.1 per cent, compared to an expected inflation rate for local government of 1.5 per cent. It is therefore an increase in real terms of 0.6 per cent, which should just about enable local authorities to deal with the need to maintain services, and to work hard to re-engineer them so that front-line services are protected.

Darren Millar: First Minister, you are suggesting that the local government settlement has been reasonable this year, but it has not been reasonable for everybody. There have been a number of local authorities, notably in Conwy—part of which I represent—that have been hard hit by the cumulative effects of low settlements year in year out, as a result of your mismanagement of local government finance. What will you do to ensure that people in my constituency are not being disadvantaged because of the way in which the Government carves up the local authority revenue support grant?

The First Minister: I do not know what you mean by ‘carve up’ because the revenue support grant funding formula is agreed jointly with local government. It agreed that, whichever local authorities get an above-average revenue support grant increase, and whichever get a below-average increase, it is the formula that is important and that should be seen to be transparent and fair. This year, the recession hit some parts of Wales harder than others, as a result of which free school meals entitlements have risen more rapidly in those areas that are worst affected by the recession, such as south-east Wales, as Trish law referred to earlier. North Wales has not been so badly affected by the recession, and therefore free school meals entitlements have not risen by an above-average amount in that area. As a result, South Wales East has done better than North Wales out of the revenue support grant, because North Wales has done better than South Wales East in the recession.

honno.

O ran y setliad, setliad cyffredinol o 2.1 y cant ydyw, o'i gymharu â chyfradd chwyddiant ddisgwyliedig o 1.5 y cant ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Felly, mae'n gynnydd mewn termau real o 0.6 y cant, a ddylai fwy neu lai alluogi awdurdodau lleol i ymdopi â'r angen i gynnal gwasanaethau, ac i weithio'n galed i'w haildrefnu er mwyn gwarchod gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen.

Darren Millar: Brif Weinidog, yr ydych yn awgrymu bod y setliad i lywodraeth leol wedi bod yn rhesymol eleni, ond nid yw wedi bod yn rhesymol i bawb. Mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol, yng Nghonwy'n enwedig—yr wyf yn cynrychioli rhan o'r ardal—sydd wedi cael eu taro'n galed gan effeithiau cronus setliadau isel flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, yn sgîl y ffaith eich bod wedi camreoli arian llywodraeth leol. Beth a wnewch i sicrhau nad yw pobl yn fy etholaeth dan anfantais oherwydd y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd ati i rannu'r grant cynnal refeniw i awdurdodau lleol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn beth a olygwch wrth 'fynd ati i rannu' oherwydd bydd fformiwla ariannu'r grant cynnal refeniw yn cael ei chytuno ar y cyd â llywodraeth leol. Yr oedd yn cytuno, pa awdurdodau lleol bynnag a gaiff gynnydd uwch na'r cyfartaledd yn eu grant cynnal refeniw, a pha rai bynnag a gaiff gynnydd is na'r cyfartaledd, mai'r fformiwla sy'n bwysig ac y dylai honno gael ei gweld yn fformiwla sy'n dryloyw ac yn deg. Eleni, trawodd y dirwasgiad rai rhannau o Gymru'n galetach nag eraill. Yn sgîl hynny, mae'r nifer sydd â'r hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim wedi codi'n gyflymach yn yr ardaloedd hynny yr effeithir waethaf arnynt gan y dirwasgiad, megis y de-ddwyrain, fel y dywedodd Trish yn gynharach. Nid yw'r dirwasgiad wedi effeithio cynddrwg ar y gogledd, ac felly, nid yw'r nifer sydd â'r hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim wedi codi mwy na'r cyfartaledd yn yr ardal honno. O ganlyniad, mae Dwyrain De Cymru wedi gwneud yn well na Gogledd Cymru yn sgîl y grant cynnal refeniw

oherwydd bod Gogledd Cymru wedi gwneud yn well na Dwyrain De Cymru yn y dirwasgiad.

The Economy

Q10 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister outline his vision for the Welsh economy? OAQ(3)2382(FM)

The First Minister: It is set out in ‘One Wales’, but if we are moving very gradually from a recession into a period of recovery, either this quarter or next quarter, I would have to up-rate it by saying that companies that are to be successful need to gain a competitiveness that enables them to export by being high-tech, niche, green, managed in a lean way, and global in their approach to their markets.

Nick Bourne: I agree with the First Minister about the importance of that and of the manufacturing strategy in general. He will be aware that the UK Government, in June this year, announced the creation of the UK innovation investment fund, from which we are able to use funds in Wales. I asked the Deputy First Minister in a written question on 5 October what discussions had been held on that. I had a response on 10 November—in other words, I have just had a response—saying that he had held no discussions with the UK Government about this fund, although we can benefit, potentially, from specialist technology funds to invest in technology-based businesses in Wales. Can the First Minister confirm that it is the Government’s approach not to have discussions with the UK Government about a fund from which our industries in Wales can benefit?

The First Minister: We attempt to get as much money as we can out of any anti-recessionary or new project-related funding

Yr Economi

C10 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu ei weledigaeth ar gyfer economi Cymru? OAQ(3)2382(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Fe’i cyflwynir yn ‘Cymru’n Un’, ond, os ydym yn symud yn raddol iawn o ddirwasgiad i gyfnod o adfer, naill ai yn y chwarter hwn neu yn y chwarter nesaf, byddai’n rhaid imi ychwanegu at hynny drwy ddweud bod yn rhaid i gwmnïau sydd am lwyddo fod yn ddigon cystadleuol i’w galluogi i allforio drwy ddefnyddio’r uwch dechnoleg, drwy fanteisio ar farchnadoedd arbenigol, drwy fod yn wyrdd, drwy gael eu rheoli’n ddarbodus, a thrwy fod yn fyd-eang eu hagwedd at eu marchnadoedd.

Nick Bourne: Cytunaf â’r Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd hynny a’r strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu’n gyffredinol. Bydd yn gwybod bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, ym mis Mehefin eleni, wedi cyhoeddi bod cronfa fuddsoddi’r Deyrnas Unedig mewn arloesi’n cael ei chreu, a’n bod yn gallu defnyddio arian y gronfa honno yng Nghymru. Gofynnais i’r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog mewn cwestiwn ysgrifenedig ar 5 Hydref pa drafodaethau a oedd wedi’u cynnal ynglŷn â hynny. Cefais ymateb ar 10 Tachwedd—mewn geiriau eraill, yr wyf newydd gael ymateb—yn dweud nad oedd wedi trafod y gronfa hon o gwbl â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, er y gallwn fanteisio, o bosibl, yn sgîl cronfeydd technoleg arbenigol i fuddsoddi mewn busnesau seiliedig ar dechnoleg yng Nghymru. A all y Prif Weinidog gadarnhau mai agwedd y Llywodraeth yw peidio â chynnal trafodaethau â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig am gronfa y gall ein diwydiannau yng Nghymru elwa ohoni?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn ceisio cael cymaint o arian ag y gallwn o unrhyw arian gwrth-ddirwasgiad neu arian newydd sy’n

from the UK budget. We have had long and protracted discussions with the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills about our access to parts of the £750 million that was announced in the budget, to ensure that Wales gets its full share. The Airbus launch aid funding, which has come out of that £750 million, is one example, but it is not enough. We hope that, before too long, there will be a further announcement about another Welsh project being funded by money that was allocated by the Treasury to the Department for Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform in the budget back in March. We expect that, after long negotiations, we will have something to say about that before too long.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych newydd gynnig sylwadau sy'n ychwanegol at y weledigaeth a amlinellir yn 'Cymru'n Un', ond mae'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i ychwanegu yn gwbl gyson â 'Cymru'n Un', oherwydd mae'n sôn am yr economi yn datblygu ledled Cymru. Mae'r meini prawf yr ydych wedi'u gosod ar gyfer y dyfodol yn golygu bod modd i fusnesau dyfu ledled Cymru. Nid oes rhaid i'r datblygiad hwnnw gael ei gyfyngu i'r dinasoedd a'r de-ddwyrain oherwydd mae'r math o fusnesau yr ydych wedi sôn amdanynt yn rhai a allai fodoli ym mhob rhan o Gymru. A ydych yn cytuno mai dyna'r ffordd i symud ymlaen ac i weld yr economi yng Nghymru yn datblygu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ysgrifennwyd 'Cymru'n Un' cyn y dirwasgiad. Yr oeddwn yn ceisio amlinellu'r blaenoriaethau a fydd yn sicrhau bod yr economi yn troi'r gornel. Gobeithiaf ei bod yn troi'r gornel yn awr.

O ran y weledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol yr economi, yr oeddwn yn ceisio cyfeirio at y ffaith ein bod yn gyson wrth geisio osgoi gorddibyniaeth ar un sector o'r economi, sef y sector ariannol. Gwendid strategaeth Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig oedd disgwyl gormod oddi wrth y sector ariannol. Wrth gwrs, gan fod y sector hwnnw wedi mynd yn fflachdar yn ystod y dirwasgiad—neu ei fod

gysylltiedig â phrosiectau gan gyllideb y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym wedi cael trafodaethau maith a helaeth gyda'r Adran Busnes, Arloesedd a Sgiliau ynglŷn â'n cyfle i gael gafael ar rannau o'r £750 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd yn y gyllideb, i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chyfran lawn. Mae'r arian cymorth i lansio Airbus, sydd wedi dod o'r £750 miliwn hwnnw, yn un enghraifft, ond nid yw'n ddigon. Gobeithiwn, cyn bo hir iawn, y bydd cyhoeddiad arall am brosiect arall yng Nghymru a fydd yn cael ei ariannu gan arian a ddyrannwyd gan y Trysorlys i'r Adran Busnes, Menter a Diwygio Rheoleiddio yn y gyllideb ym mis Mawrth. Yr ydym yn disgwyl, ar ôl negodi maith, y bydd gennym rywbeth i'w ddweud ynglŷn â hynny cyn bo hir iawn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You have just suggested some comments in addition to the vision outlined in 'One Wales', but what you have added is wholly congruent with 'One Wales', because it mentions the economy throughout Wales developing. The criteria that you have set for the future mean that it is possible for businesses throughout Wales to grow. Such development does not need to be limited to cities or to the south-east because the kinds of businesses that you are talking about are ones that could exist in any part of Wales. Do you agree that that is the way to move forward and that is how we should see the economy in Wales developing?

The First Minister: 'One Wales' was written before the recession. I was trying to outline the priorities that would ensure that the economy turned a corner. I hope that it will turn that corner now.

As for the vision for the future of the economy, I was trying to refer to the fact that we are consistent in seeking to avoid being overly dependent on one sector of the economy, namely the financial sector. The weakness of the UK Government's strategy was that it expected too much from the financial sector. Naturally, given that that sector had its come-uppance during the

wedi dechrau'r dirwasgiad—mae'n siarad yr un iaith â ni erbyn hyn. Mae angen cydbwysedd rhwng yr ochr ariannol, yr ochr weithgynhyrchu, yr ochr dechnolegol a'r ochr technoleg gwybodaeth. Mae rhai agweddau ar y diwydiannau newydd yn hollol addas i gael eu sefydlu yn unrhyw le, dim ond bod band eang ar gael, er enghraifft, o ran TG.

Mick Bates: First Minister, last night, some of us heard Sir Jonathon Porritt talk about establishing a low-carbon society. In order to do that, there has to be a vision to establish a low-carbon economy. Your Government has often been on the record as saying that you want to establish a low-carbon economy, but progress seems to be slow. Can you outline what you are doing now to establish a low-carbon economy, which is the full expression of our future economy in Wales?

The First Minister: Indeed. In an earlier answer to Chris Chapman, I mentioned the creation of a low-carbon economy and the setting up of a green technology skills training centre in Tredegar. This will not be a centre for Wales only, but for the whole of the UK. It is being brought in by British Gas or Centrica plc. That is an important area as it is important to develop the skills of plumbers and heating and ventilating engineers so that they can fit solar panels for hot water, photovoltaic panels, air or ground source pumps, or whatever forms of new technology are needed in houses or small businesses.

We also have to have a supply chain for the manufacture of the wind turbines—off-shore and on-shore—and the locations into which these turbines or biomass power stations will be placed. We have to accept that these are not always popular locally and there has to be a planning process through which they have to go. I know that wind turbine manufacturers and wind turbine installers are very critical of the planning process. We have to accept that. However, we have to act as a broker between local public opinion,

recession—or even that it started the recession—it is now talking the same language as we are. There needs to be a balance between the financial, the manufacturing, the technological, and information technology. Some elements of the new industries can be set up anywhere, as long as there is broadband, for example, for IT.

Mick Bates: Brif Weinidog, neithiwr, clywodd rhai ohonom Syr Jonathon Porritt yn sôn am sefydlu cymdeithas carbon isel. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid cael gweledigaeth ar gyfer sefydlu economi carbon isel. Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi dweud ar goedd yn aml eich bod am sefydlu economi carbon isel, ond araf yw'r cynnydd i bob golwg. A allwch amlinellu beth yr ydych yn ei wneud yn awr i sefydlu economi carbon isel, sef y weledigaeth gyflawn ar gyfer ein heconomi yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn sicr. Wrth ateb Chris Chapman yn gynharach, soniais am greu economi carbon isel a sefydlu canolfan hyfforddi sgiliau'r dechnoleg werdd yn Nhrefegar. Nid canolfan i Gymru'n unig fydd hon, ond i'r Deyrnas Unedig drwyddi draw. British Gas neu Centrica plc sy'n ei sefydlu. Mae hwnnw'n faes pwysig gan ei bod yn bwysig datblygu sgiliau plymwrwr a pheirianwyr gwres ac awyru er mwyn iddynt osod paneli solar ar gyfer dŵr poeth, paneli ffotofoltäig, pypmiao sy'n codi gwres o'r aer neu'r ddaear, neu pa ffurfiau bynnag ar dechnoleg newydd y mae eu hangen mewn tai neu mewn busnesau bach.

Rhaid inni hefyd gael cadwyn gyflenwi ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu'r tyrbinau gwynt—ar y môr ac ar y tir—a'r lleoliadau lle y gosodir y tyrbinau neu'r gorsafoedd pŵer biomas hyn. Bydd yn rhaid inni dderbyn nad yw'r rhain bob tro'n boblogaidd yn lleol a rhaid cael proses gynllunio y mae'n rhaid iddynt fynd drwyddi. Gwn fod gweithgynhyrchwyr tyrbinau gwynt a gosodwyr tyrbinau gwynt yn feirniadol iawn o'r broses gynllunio. Rhaid inni dderbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn frocer rhwng y farn

which does not like them, and the wind turbine people who say that if they cannot get planning permission, there is no point in having factories in this country.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Brif Weinidog, am ateb 10 o gwestiynau.

gyhoeddus leol, nad yw'n eu hoffi, a phobl y tyrbinau gwynt sy'n dweud nad oes diben cael ffatrïoedd yn y wlad hon os na allant gael caniatâd cynllunio.

The First Minister: Thank you, Presiding Officer, for answering 10 questions.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): There are no changes to this week's planned Government business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out on the business statement and announcement, which can be found in the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

Mark Isherwood: In previous weeks, questions have been raised in the Chamber regarding the allocation of £120 million for 10 successful bids for funding from the strategic capital investment fund by local authorities. Could we have a statement regarding serious allegations made to me that, although 62 bids were submitted, they were filtered out in Cabinet and only 27 were referred to the independent panel, 10 of which were recommended for approval?

Carwyn Jones: If allegations are to be made, they need to be made to the appropriate person and not to you.

2.40 p.m.

Alun Davies: What a short answer. I understand from the business statement that we will be having a debate next week on the Queen's Speech. Could I ask for a Government statement to accompany that, on the impact that Conservative plans to reduce the number of Welsh Members of Parliament will have on our representation in Westminster and on our ability to punch at our weight for Wales to ensure that Wales gets its voice heard in all the debates that take place in Westminster?

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Nid oes newidiadau ym musnes arfaethedig y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes, a welir ym mhapurau'r agenda sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau'n electronig.

Mark Isherwood: Yn ystod yr wythnosau sydd wedi mynd heibio, mae cwestiynau wedi'u codi yn y Siambr ynglŷn â dyrannu £120 miliwn ar gyfer 10 cais llwyddiannus am arian oddi wrth y gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol gan awdurdodau lleol. A allem gael datganiad ynglŷn â chyhuddiadau difrifol yr wyf wedi'u clywed, sef, er bod 62 cais wedi'u cyflwyno, iddynt gael eu hidlo yn y Cabinet, ac mai dim ond 27 a gyfeiriwyd at y panel annibynnol, a bod 10 o'r rheiny wedi'u hargymell i'w cymeradwyo?

Carwyn Jones: Os oes cyhuddiadau i'w gwneud, mae angen eu gwneud i'r person priodol, ac nid i chi.

Alun Davies: Am ateb byr. Deallaf yn ôl y datganiad busnes y byddwn yn cael dadl yr wythnos nesaf am Araith y Frenhines. A gawn ofyn am ddatganiad gan y Llywodraeth i gyd-fynd â honno, ynglŷn â'r effaith a gaiff cynlluniau'r Ceidwadwyr i leihau nifer Aelodau Seneddol Cymru ar ein cynrychiolaeth yn San Steffan ac ar ein gallu i wneud ein gorau glas dros Gymru er mwyn sicrhau bod ei llais yn cael ei glywed yn yr holl ddadleuon a gynhelir yn San Steffan?

The Presiding Officer: Order. Alun Davies has been here long enough to know—

David Melding: It has been too long. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Let me finish my sentence. Alun Davies has been here long enough to know that the Leader of the House has no responsibility for any alleged Conservative policies.

Carwyn Jones: What can I say? I am very glad that I have no responsibility for Conservative policy, Llywydd. I can say that I do not believe that reducing the number of Welsh Members of Parliament would mean that Wales would have a stronger voice at Westminster.

Kirsty Williams: Would it be possible for you to make time for the Minister for Health and Social Services to make a statement in this Chamber reaffirming the Government's policy on hospital closures? I understand that it is the Welsh Assembly Government's policy not to allow local health boards to close hospitals, yet there is real fear in my constituency that Powys Teaching Local Health Board is undermining the viability of Bronllys Hospital by stealth, by removing staff from that hospital and placing them in others, thereby undermining the ability to care for patients in that setting. Could you find time for that so that the Minister can clearly send a message to those managing the health service in Powys that a no-closure policy is being pursued by this Government, unless alternative facilities and services are put in place to replace existing services?

Carwyn Jones: That matter can be brought to the Minister's attention through correspondence or by asking questions in the Chamber. I am sure that she would deal with the issues that you raise if you did so as I have suggested.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn siŵr y

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae Alun Davies wedi bod yma'n ddigon hir i wybod—

David Melding: Mae wedi bod yn rhy hir. [*Chwerthin*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gadewch imi orffen fy mrawddeg. Mae Alun Davies wedi bod yma'n ddigon hir i wybod nad oes gan Arweinydd y Tŷ gyfrifoldeb o gwbl dros ddim un o bolisiau honedig y Ceidwadwyr.

Carwyn Jones: Beth y gallaf ei ddweud? Yr wyf yn falch iawn nad oes gennyf gyfrifoldeb dros bolisiau'r Ceidwadwyr, Lywydd. Gallaf ddweud nad wyf yn credu y byddai lleihau nifer Aelodau Seneddol Cymru'n golygu y byddai gan Gymru lais cryfach yn San Steffan.

Kirsty Williams: A fyddai modd ichi neilltuo amser i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol roi datganiad yn y Siambr hon yn ailgadarnhau polisi'r Llywodraeth ynglŷn â chau ysbytai? Deallaf mai polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw peidio â chaniatáu i fyrddau iechyd lleol gau'r un ysbyty, ond mae ofn gwirioneddol yn fy etholaeth fod Bwrdd Addysgu Iechyd Lleol Powys yn tanseilio hyfywedd Ysbyty Bronllys yn llechwraidd, drwy symud staff o'r ysbyty hwnnw a'u lleoli mewn ysbyty arall, a'u bod wrth wneud hynny'n tanseilio'r gallu i ofalu am gleifion yn y lleoliad hwnnw. A allech ddod o hyd i amser ar gyfer hynny er mwyn i'r Gweinidog allu anfon neges glir at y rhai sy'n rheoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd ym Mhowys mai polisi'r Llywodraeth hon yw peidio â chau'r un ysbyty, oni sefydlir cyfleusterau a gwasanaethau eraill yn lle'r gwasanaethau sydd yno eisoes?

Carwyn Jones: Mae modd tynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at y mater hwnnw drwy ohebiaeth, neu drwy ofyn cwestiynau yn y Siambr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n ymdrin â'r materion yr ydych yn eu codi petaech yn gwneud fel yr wyf wedi awgrymu.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am sure that you

byddech yn cytuno y byddai pobl Cymru yn disgwyl i'r Cynulliad drafod unrhyw fater a allai ddod â budd ariannol i'r Cynulliad yng nghyd-destun y grant bloc yr ydym yn ei dderbyn gan San Steffan. Pe bai Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cael gwared ar Trident, byddai'n arbed hyd at £95 miliwn. Pe bai San Steffan yn ail-fuddsoddi'r arian hwnnw mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, byddai canran ohono yn dod i Gymru ac i'r Cynulliad—er ein bod yn anhapus gyda fformiwla Barnett. A wnewch chi felly ystyried rhoi amser i gynnal dadl lawn ar ddyfodol Trident? Gallaf eich sicrhau mai barn unedig grŵp Plaid Cymru yw y dylid cael gwared ar Trident ac ail-fuddsoddi'r arian mewn gwariant cyhoeddus. A wnewch ystyried rhoi amser i gynnal dadl lawn yn y Cynulliad er mwyn inni allu canfod beth yw barn y grwpiau eraill ar y mater hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai unigolion yn fodlon rhoi barn yn gyhoeddus y tu allan i'r Cynulliad, ac mae pwysau difrifol ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod digon o amser rhwng yn awr a'r Nadolig i gwblhau'r gwaith deddfwriaethol sydd gennym ac i drafod pethau pwysig fel Confensiwn Cymru Gyfan ar ôl cyhoeddi ei adroddiad yfory.

Jonathan Morgan: The Leader of the House will be aware that the Government has recently concluded its consultation on the sexual health strategy for Wales. The strategy will have a substantial impact throughout Wales and it is quite detailed in nature. As a strategy, it will have big implications for schools and I would ask the Government to consider whether we could have a debate on it in the Chamber sometime in the new year, before that strategy turns into some form of Government guidance.

Carwyn Jones: This is a matter for the Minister for health. I will ask her to write to you to explain what plans the Government has to deal with this issue in the near future.

William Graham: Leader of the House, I

would agree that the people of Wales would expect the Assembly to discuss any matter that could result in a financial benefit to the Assembly in the context of the block grant that we get from Westminster. If the Westminster Government were to do away with Trident, it would save up to £95 million. If Westminster were to reinvest that money in public services, a proportion of it would come to Wales and to the Assembly—although we are unhappy with the Barnett formula. Will you therefore consider allocating time for a full debate on the future of Trident? I can assure you that it is the unanimous view of the Plaid Cymru group that Trident should be abolished and that the money should be reinvested in public spending. Will you consider giving time for a full debate in the Assembly so that we can discover the views of other groups on this?

Carwyn Jones: I am sure that individuals would be willing to give their view publicly outside the Assembly, as there is tremendous pressure on the Government to ensure that there is enough time between now and Christmas to complete our legislative work and discuss important matters like the All-Wales Convention following the publication of its report tomorrow.

Jonathan Morgan: Bydd Arweinydd y Tŷ'n gwybod bod y Llywodraeth wedi cwblhau ei hymgyngoriad yn ddiweddar ar y strategaeth iechyd rhywiol i Gymru. Caiff y strategaeth ddylanwad sylweddol ledled Cymru ac mae'n eithaf manwl ei natur. Fel strategaeth, bydd ganddi oblygiadau mawr i ysgolion a byddwn yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth ystyried a allem gael dadl yn ei chylch yn y Siambr rywbryd yn y flwyddyn newydd, cyn i'r strategaeth honno droi'n rhyw ffurf ar ganllawiau gan y Llywodraeth.

Carwyn Jones: Mater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd yw hyn. Gofynnaf iddi ysgrifennu atoch i esbonio pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Llywodraeth i ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn y dyfodol agos.

William Graham: Arweinydd y Tŷ, diolchaf

thank you for the statement on Flying Start from the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills. I am grateful to you for instigating that. Could we have a statement from the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government on small business rate relief? We have already heard many concerns about the issue in the Chamber today. In addition, we require the Minister to clarify whether he will be continuing with the regeneration allowance and many other aspects of rate relief that are vital to small businesses right across Wales. The Minister will know that any business faced with a 20 per cent increase in its rateable value will pay more rates, despite the reduction in the multiplier.

Carwyn Jones: The fact that you have quoted a figure to the Minister suggests to me that you have some idea of what the Minister has already announced. The Minister has made his plans for the business rate relief scheme clear on many occasions in this Chamber. There have been occasions when his words have been misunderstood by the party opposite. I do not believe that the Minister has done anything other than make it absolutely clear how the scheme will operate.

ichi am y datganiad ynglŷn â Dechrau'n Deg gan y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am sbarduno hynny. A allem gael datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol ynghylch rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach? Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed llawer o bryderon ynglŷn â'r mater yn y Siambr heddiw. Yn ogystal â hynny, yr ydym yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog egluro a fydd yn parhau â'r lwfans adfywio ac â llawer o agweddau eraill ar ryddhad ardrethi sy'n hollbwysig i fusnesau bach drwy Gymru benbaladr. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod y bydd unrhyw fusnes sy'n wynebu cynnydd o 20 y cant yn ei werth trethiannol yn talu ardrethi uwch, er gwaethaf y gostyngiad yn y lluosydd.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r ffaith eich bod wedi dyfynnu ffigur wrth y Gweinidog yn awgrymu i mi fod gennych ryw syniad o'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi'i gyhoeddi. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud ei gynlluniau ar gyfer y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes yn glir droeon yn y Siambr hon. Ar brydiau, mae'r blaid gyferbyn wedi camddeall ei eiriau. Ni chredaf fod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud dim heblaw ei gwneud yn gwbl glir sut y bydd y cynllun yn gweithio.

Datganiad am y Papur Gwyrdd ‘Talu am Ofal yng Nghymru’ Statement on the ‘Paying for Care in Wales’ Green Paper

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Bore ddoe, lansiais Bapur Gwyrdd ar dalu am ofal yng Nghymru. Mae'r Papur Gwyrdd hwn yn nodi'r cynigion ar gyfer diwygio'r system bresennol, ac yn eu hystyried yng nghydestun y dull unigryw yr ydym ni wedi'i fabwysiadu yma yng Nghymru ym maes gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'r Papur Gwyrdd hefyd yn fan cychwyn ar gyfer cyfnod ymgynghori o 15 wythnos. Yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw, y gobaith yw y bydd rhanddeiliaid yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'r cyhoedd, yn rhoi eu barn inni am y gwahanol ddewisiadau ar gyfer diwygio'r system. Bydd y rhaglen ymgynghori'n cynnwys tri digwyddiad gyda rhanddeiliaid cenedlaethol, ymgyrch i ddosbarthu taflenni gwybodaeth mewn mannau fel meddygfeydd a llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus, a gwefan benodol ar dalu am ofal yng Nghymru.

Cydnabyddir yn eang fod y system bresennol o dalu am ofal yn rhy gymhleth, yn annheg, ac yn amhosibl i'w chynnal yn y tymor hwy. Dyna pam y cychwynnais drafodaeth genedlaethol y llynedd ynglŷn â sut y dylem dalu am ofal a chymorth yn y dyfodol. Yr oedd yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw'n holi cwestiynau pwysig o ran egwyddor. Mae'r Papur Gwyrdd hwn yn mynd â'r drafodaeth honno gam ymhellach ac yn nodi'r dewisiadau penodol ar gyfer diwygio.

The five funding options discussed in chapter 3 of the Green Paper are those developed by the UK Government and published in its Green Paper for England in July. The options cover most of the main models that have been put forward in various reports and fora over the past few years, and we have deliberately made the consultation questions as wide as possible to stimulate an open debate about the advantages and disadvantages of each model. In our discussion of these options we have taken account of the findings of the initial consultation, and the recommendations

The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): Yesterday morning I launched our Green Paper on paying for care in Wales. The Green Paper sets out proposals for reforming the current system, and considers them in the context of the distinctive approach to social care that we have adopted in Wales. The Green Paper also initiates a 15-week consultation period, during which we hope that Welsh stakeholders and the general public will give us their views on the various options for reform. The consultation programme will include three national stakeholder events, a leafleting campaign in venues such as GP surgeries and public libraries, and a dedicated website on paying for care in Wales.

It is widely acknowledged that the current system of paying for care is complicated, unfair, and unsustainable in the long term. That is why, last year, I initiated a national debate about how we should pay for care and support in the future. That consultation asked important questions of principle. This Green Paper takes that debate a stage further, and sets out specific options for reform.

Y pum dewis o ran ariannu a drafodir ym mhennod 3 yn y Papur Gwyrdd yw'r rhai a ddatblygwyd gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac a gyhoeddwyd yn ei Phapur Gwyrdd i Loegr ym mis Gorffennaf. Mae'r dewisiadau'n cynnwys y rhan fwyaf o'r prif fodelau sydd wedi'u cynnig mewn amrywiol adroddiadau a ffora yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac yr ydym yn fwriadol wedi gwneud cwestiynau'r ymgynghori mor eang ag sy'n bosibl er mwyn sbarduno dadl agored am fanteision ac anfanteision pob model. Wrth drafod y dewisiadau hyn, yr ydym wedi

of the Wales stakeholder advisory group.

ystyried canfyddiadau'r ymgynghori cychwynnol, ac argymhellion grŵp ymgynghorol rhanddeiliaid Cymru.

It is particularly important that we consider how each of these options might work within the context of our plans to improve the delivery of social services in Wales. Many of the levers that will bring about change in the way we pay for care are operated from Westminster. This is particularly the case in Wales, as the existing legal framework works on an England and Wales basis. However, our approach to service delivery differs in several important respects to that taken in England, and we have to be sure that any new system would fit with the vision we set out in 'Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities'. That is why chapter 2 of the Green Paper deals with our agenda for transforming social services in Wales, and invites comments on the approach we have adopted. It is the background against which each of the funding options has to be judged in Wales.

Mae'n arbennig o bwysig inni ystyried sut y gallai pob un o'r dewisiadau hyn weithio o fewn cyd-destun ein cynlluniau i wella'r ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae llawer o'r ffactorau a fydd yn gyfrwng i newid y ffordd yr ydym yn talu am ofal yn cael eu rhoi ar waith o San Steffan. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir yng Nghymru, gan fod y fframwaith cyfreithiol presennol yn gweithio ar sail Cymru a Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, o ran amryw o agweddau pwysig, mae ein dull o weithredu ym maes darparu'r gwasanaeth yn wahanol i'r dull yn Lloegr, a rhaid inni fod yn siŵr y byddai unrhyw system newydd yn cydweddu â'r weledigaeth yn 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol'. Dyna pam mae pennod 2 yn y Papur Gwyrdd yn ymdrin â'n hagenda ar gyfer gwednewid gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru ac mae'n gwahodd sylwadau ynglŷn â'r dull yr ydym wedi'i fabwysiadu. Dyma'r cefndir ar gyfer barnu pob un o'r dewisiadau o ran ariannu yng Nghymru.

I will also invite the independent commission, of which I have announced further details today, to consider the findings of this consultation and to take them into account when drawing up its recommendations, so that a cohesive approach is taken to looking at the future of social care in Wales.

Byddaf hefyd yn gwahodd y comisiwn annibynnol, yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi rhagor o fanylion amdano heddiw, i ystyried canfyddiadau'r ymgynghori hwn ac i'w hystyried wrth lunio'i argymhellion, er mwyn mynd ati mewn dull cydlynol wrth edrych ar ddyfodol gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

Two of the five options are dismissed by the UK Government. The ‘pay for yourself’ option would put the responsibility for paying for care firmly on the individual. It would potentially leave many people without the care they need, and would be fundamentally unfair. At the other end of the scale, the ‘taxation’ option would put the responsibility firmly on the state, which would raise the necessary revenue through increased taxation. This has been ruled out because it would require a significant rise in tax and place a heavy burden on people of working age.

2.50 p.m.

The options favoured by the UK Government are based on the principle that the new way to pay for care should be a partnership between the individual and Government. Under the basic ‘partnership’ option, everyone who qualifies for care and support would have a proportion of their costs paid for by the Government, and they would have to fund the rest themselves. There are various ways in which individuals could prepare to meet their contributions, and these form the basis of the remaining two options. Under the ‘insurance’ option, individuals could choose to take out insurance in case they needed care in the future. It is suggested that all care costs—excluding accommodation—would be covered by a one-off payment of between £20,000 and £25,000. This might be a private or a state-run insurance scheme. Finally, there is the ‘comprehensive’ option, under which individuals who are over retirement age would be required to make a one-off payment of between £17,000 and £20,000 before or after retirement, or upon death. Some of the main advantages and disadvantages of each option are set out in the Green Paper. These will, I am sure, be explored further during the consultation.

Another significant proposal is that there might be a case for integrating certain disability benefits, such as attendance allowance, with the social care system. This

Mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn diystyru dau o'r pum dewis. Byddai'r dewis 'talu drosoch eich hun' yn rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb dros dalu am ofal yn gadarn ar ysgwyddau'r unigolyn. Gallai hynny olygu y byddai llawer o bobl yn cael eu gadael heb y gofal y mae ei angen arnynt, a byddai'n sylfaenol annheg. Ar ben arall y raddfa, byddai'r dewis 'trethiant' yn rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb yn gadarn ar y wladwriaeth, gan godi'r refeniw angenrheidiol drwy drethiant ychwanegol. Mae hyn wedi cael ei ddiystyru oherwydd y byddai gofyn cynyddu'r dreth yn sylweddol ac yn rhoi baich trwm ar bobl o oedran gweithio.

Mae'r dewisiadau a ffefirir gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi'u seilio ar yr egwyddor mai partneriaeth rhwng yr unigolyn a'r Llywodraeth yw'r ffordd newydd y dylid ei dilyn er mwyn talu am ofal. O dan y dewis 'partneriaeth' sylfaenol, byddai'r Llywodraeth yn talu cyfran o gostau pawb sy'n gymwys i gael gofal a chymorth, a byddai'n rhaid iddynt dalu'r gweddill eu hunain. Gallai unigolion baratoi i dalu eu cyfraniadau mewn sawl ffordd, a'r rhain yw'r sail ar gyfer y ddau ddewis sy'n weddill. O dan y dewis 'yswiriant', gallai unigolion ddewis talu yswiriant rhag ofn y byddai angen gofal arnynt yn y dyfodol. Awgrymir y byddai holl gostau'r gofalu—ac eithrio llety—yn cael eu talu drwy un taliad rhwng £20,000 a £25,000. Gallai hyn fod yn gynllun yswiriant preifat neu'n gynllun yswiriant gan y wladwriaeth. Yn olaf, mae'r dewis 'cynhwysfawr', lle y bydd gofyn i unigolion sydd dros oedran ymddeol dalu un swm rhwng £17,000 ac £20,000 cyn iddynt ymddeol, neu wedi iddynt ymddeol, neu pan fyddant farw. Disgrifir rhai o brif fanteision ac anafanteision pob dewis yn y Papur Gwyrdd. Archwilir y rhain, yr wyf yn siŵr, yn fwy manwl yn ystod yr ymgynghori.

Un cynnig pwysig arall yw y gallai fod dadl o blaid integreiddio rhai budd-daliadau anabledd, megis y lwfans gweini, â'r system gofal cymdeithasol. Dim ond cynnig yw hyn

is only a proposal at this stage and no final decisions have been made. I recognise that the issue of how this might affect paying for care in Wales is important to many people. While benefits are a non-devolved matter, the UK Government has made a commitment to work closely with the devolved administrations to reach a shared view on how to ensure that we obtain the best possible outcomes for all people in the UK. I am committed to an effective dialogue with my ministerial counterparts in the UK Government to help to achieve this, and to ensure that the views of people in Wales, given through this consultation, are heard.

The Green Paper continues one of the most important debates we have faced in Wales in the past decade. The challenge is to create a social care system that is fairer and more affordable for individuals and for society as a whole, and one that is sustainable in the longer term. I look forward to receiving your comments, and those of your constituents, on the options that are now being put forward.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you, Deputy Minister, for your statement and for the Green Paper that was published yesterday. To my mind, this is probably the biggest issue facing the Assembly and society. The opening part of the paper highlights the dramatic demographic changes and the demands that they will place on society, and it also highlights the predicament that many people currently face in endeavouring to secure care facilities and care packages for themselves. With advances in medical practices, the increase in life expectancy that people now enjoy calls into question the welfare model that we in Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom enjoy. It is vital that all sections of society engage in this debate.

It was interesting, listening to a phone-in on Radio Wales yesterday, to hear all sides express the same view in this debate that, in

ar hyn o bryd ac nid oes dim wedi'i benderfynu'n derfynol. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli y gallai'r effaith a gâi hyn ar dalu am ofal yng Nghymru fod yn bwysig i lawer o bobl. Er bod budd-daliadau'n fater sydd heb ei ddatganoli, mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi gwneud ymrwymiad i weithio'n glòs gyda'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig er mwyn cyrraedd safbwynt cytûn ynglŷn â sut y mae sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau posibl i bawb yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i ddeialog effeithiol â'm cyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn cynorthwyo i wireddu hyn, ac er mwyn sicrhau bod barn pobl yng Nghymru, a fynegir drwy'r ymgynghoriad hwn, yn cael ei chlywed.

Mae'r Papur Gwyrdd yn parhau un o'r dadleuon pwysicaf yr ydym wedi'i hwynebu yng Nghymru yn y degawd diwethaf. Yr her yw creu system gofal cymdeithasol sy'n decach ac yn fwy fforddiadwy i unigolion ac i'r gymdeithas drwyddi draw, a system sy'n gynaliadwy yn y tymor hwy. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael eich sylwadau, a sylwadau eich etholwyr, ynglŷn â'r dewisiadau a gyflwynir yn awr.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, am eich datganiad ac am y Papur Gwyrdd a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Yn fy marn i, mae'n debyg mai dyma'r broblem fwyaf sy'n wynebu'r Cynulliad a'r gymdeithas. Mae rhan agoriadol y papur yn tynnu sylw at y newidiadau demograffig dramatig a'r pwysau a fydd ar y gymdeithas yn sgîl hynny. Mae'n tynnu sylw hefyd at y broblem a wynebir gan lawer o bobl ar hyn o bryd wrth iddynt ymdrechu i sicrhau cyfleusterau a pheynnau gofal iddynt hwy eu hunain. Wrth i arferion meddygol ddatblygu, gall pobl ddisgwyl byw'n hwy ac mae hynny'n codi amheuon ynglŷn â'r model lles sydd gennym ni yng Nghymru ac yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n hollbwysig i holl carfanau'r gymdeithas gyfrannu at y ddatl hon.

Yr oedd yn ddiddorol gwranddo ar raglen ffonio ar Radio Wales ddoe, a chlywed pob ochr yn mynegi'r un farn yn y ddatl hon, sef,

essence, someone else should pay, be it the younger section of society or the older section. No-one seemed to be prepared to say that we are reaching an impasse, in that society will be financially challenged, which means that we will have to take some difficult and challenging decisions. The options that are laid out in the paper will provoke debate. I hope that the people taking part in this consultation will be open minded and will not look at the issue through narrow glasses, because we need to embrace a series of options that will deal with the demographic changes facing society.

You touched on the change in attendance allowance, Deputy Minister. The paper highlights 125,000 individuals are in receipt of this benefit. Responsibility for the benefits system is held in Westminster, therefore if the dialogue between the Westminster Government and the Welsh Assembly Government breaks down and our voice is not heard, there will be a dramatic impact on people's ability to meet their obligations and to lead a full and independent life, which the Assembly Government subscribes to, as do all parties. Ultimately, we must give people dignity when they look for care, and, above all, independence in making the choices. In last week's debate on direct payments and in your comments in the Multiple Sclerosis Society Cymru event afterwards, I was disappointed that the Assembly Government, while dishing out the rhetoric on independence and respect for the individual, was not interested in pursuing the option of direct payments. We believe that direct payments could lead to more independence and choice in the system, and I hope that the Deputy Minister will respond to the debate about ensuring that people have independence and choice in choosing their care packages.

You also mentioned the setting up of the commission to review the consultation. Can you outline a timeframe and process by which the commission will come forward

yn ei hanfod, y dylai rhywun arall dalu, boed hynny'n garfan iau'r gymdeithas neu'r garfan hŷn. I bob golwg, nid oedd neb yn barod i ddweud ein bod yn cyrraedd y pen draw, oherwydd bydd cymdeithas yn wynebu her ariannol, a bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid inni wneud nifer o benderfyniadau anodd a heriol. Bydd y dewisiadau a gyflwynir yn y papur yn sbarduno dadl. Gobeithio y bydd y bobl sy'n cymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghoriad hwn yn agored eu meddwl ac na fyddant yn edrych ar y broblem drwy sbectol gul, oherwydd y mae angen inni ystyried cyfres o ddewisiadau er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r newidiadau demograffig sy'n wynebu'r gymdeithas.

Soniasoch am y newid yn y lwfans gweini, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Mae'r papur yn dangos bod 125,000 o unigolion yn cael y budd-dal hwn. San Steffan sy'n gyfrifol am y system budd-daliadau, felly os bydd y deialog rhwng Llywodraeth San Steffan a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn chwalu ac na chlywir ein llais, caiff hynny effaith ddramatig ar allu pobl i gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau ac i fyw bywyd llawn ac annibynnol, rhywbeth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei gefnogi, fel y mae pob plaid. Yn y pen draw, rhaid inni roi urddas i bobl wrth iddynt chwilio am ofal, ac, yn anad dim, annibyniaeth wrth ddewis. Yn y ddadl yr wythnos diwethaf am daliadau uniongyrchol ac yn eich sylwadau yn nigwyddiad Multiple Sclerosis Society Cymru wedyn, yr oeddwn yn siomedig nad oedd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, er ei bod yn rhaffu'r rhethreg am annibyniaeth a pharch at yr unigolyn, ddiddordeb mewn mynd ar drywydd yr opsiwn taliadau uniongyrchol. Credwn y gallai taliadau uniongyrchol arwain at fwy o annibyniaeth a dewis yn y system, a gobeithio y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn ymateb i'r ddadl ynglŷn â sicrhau bod gan bobl annibyniaeth a dewis wrth ddewis eu pecyn gofal.

Soniasoch hefyd am sefydlu'r comisiwn i adolygu'r ymgynghoriad. A allwch ddweud pryd a thrwy ba broses y bydd y comisiwn yn cyflwyno'i sylwadau, fel nad yw'n troi'n

with its deliberations, so that it does not turn into an ongoing exercise where we keep moving forward but without meaningful third-party involvement in the evidence presented? I would be grateful if you could highlight how the consultation exercise will reach out to all sections of society, because all sections will need to engage with this exercise. In particular, how can the younger generation buy into the opportunity to pay for the costs of any care they might need in future, which the current welfare model will not be able to meet? There will almost be a budget deficit in moving from the old system to the new system, as was graphically emphasised in yesterday's press. Will you outline, Deputy Minister, how you hope this consultation process will reach out to all sections of society and not just to the usual people who respond to such consultations?

The Deputy Minister identified the importance of the dialogue between Westminster and the Assembly Government, because there are two strands to the debate: the benefit culture and the benefits society that puts money into care packages; and the aspirations and delivery of the Welsh Assembly Government via its tools of delivery for care in Wales, particularly in the field of social care. We all appreciate the difficulties in the social care field at the moment, especially in attracting and retaining social workers, and in the link between healthcare facilities and the social side of the care package. Although the rhetoric on linking these objectives to create a seamless care pathway sounds good, it is important that there is delivery on the ground so that people accessing the care receive the seamless strand of care that they want. An issue that came up time and again, given that we are dealing with a system that has been around for a long time, was the obstacles that have developed under the current system, and people therefore find it difficult to access care packages.

I agree with the opening statement in the foreword to the document that we need to devise a fair, simple and affordable scheme

ymarferiad parhaus lle y byddwn yn dal i symud yn ein blaen ond heb i drydydd parti gyfrannu'n ystyrllon at y dystiolaeth a gyflwynir? Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud sut y bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn estyn allan at bob carfan yn y gymdeithas, oherwydd bydd angen i bob carfan fod yn rhan o'r ymarferiad hwn. Yn benodol, sut y gall y genhedlaeth iau fanteisio ar y cyfle i dalu am gostau unrhyw ofal y bydd ei angen arnynt efallai yn y dyfodol, na fydd y model lles presennol yn gallu ei fforddio? Bydd diffyg yn y gyllideb bron wrth inni symud o'r hen drefn i'r drefn newydd, fel y pwysleisiwyd yn glir yn y wasg ddoe. A wnewch sôn, Ddirprwy Weinidog, am sut y gobeithiwch y bydd y broses ymgynghori hon yn estyn allan at bob carfan yn y gymdeithas ac nid dim ond at y bobl sydd fel rheol yn ymateb i ymgynghoriadau o'r fath?

Soniodd y Dirprwy Weinidog am bwysigrwydd y deialog rhwng San Steffan a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, oherwydd bod dau linyr i'r ddadl: y diwylliant budd-daliadau a'r gymdeithas budd-daliadau sy'n rhoi arian ar gyfer pecynnau gofal; a dyheadau a darpariaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy ei dulliau darparu gofal yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yn y maes gofal cymdeithasol. Yr ydym i gyd yn sylweddoli'r anawsterau yn y maes gofal cymdeithasol ar hyn o bryd, yn enwedig o ran denu a chadw gweithwyr cymdeithasol, ac yn y ddolen rhwng cyfleusterau gofal iechyd ac ochr gymdeithasol y pecyn gofal. Er bod y rhethreg ynglŷn â chysylltu'r amcanion i greu llwybr gofal di-dor yn glodwiw i bob golwg, mae'n bwysig bod y peth yn digwydd ar lawr gwlad er mwyn i bobl sy'n defnyddio'r gofal gael y llinyn gofal di-dor y maent am ei gael. Un broblem a gododd dro ar ôl tro, o gofio ein bod yn ymdrin â system sy'n bod ers cryn amser, oedd y rhwystrau sydd wedi datblygu o dan y drefn bresennol, ac felly mae pobl yn ei chael yn anodd manteisio ar becynnau gofal.

Cytunaf â'r datganiad agoriadol yn y rhagair i'r ddogfen fod angen inni ddyfeisio cynllun teg, syml a fforddiadwy ar gyfer gofal yn yr

for care in the twenty-first century. I hope that everyone will engage in the consultation process and be open-minded at the start of the process so that we can achieve a meaningful settlement that will put care at the forefront of our thoughts.

Gwenda Thomas: Thank you, Andrew. You started by referring to increased life expectancy and indicated that this is something that we should celebrate; I could not agree more with that. I also agree with your comment about the need for all sections of society to be engaged in this consultation.

You referred to that attendance allowance, which is an issue on which many people have already written to me. As I said in my opening remarks, I will seek to negotiate with my colleagues in Westminster, Scotland and Northern Ireland on the best way forward on the attendance allowance.

3.00 p.m.

I have serious concerns, not only about the attendance allowance, but also about the impact on the disability premium. I intend to look at that aspect of the proposal—and a proposal is all that it is at the moment—and at the impact that it could have on the disability premium, which, by way of income, often means more than the value of the attendance allowance. Therefore, I am concerned about that.

You talked about direct payments, but we are not against direct payments, Andrew; indeed, we are set to encourage the take-up of direct payments. We are now seeking to amend the legislation to widen the group of people who can claim direct payments to include those acting on behalf of others who lack the capacity to do so. Where you and I part ways, to some extent, is on the personalisation agenda. As I have said before, we will await the evidence from England on the independent budget before we move forward on that.

unfed ganrif ar hugain. Gobeithio y bydd pawb yn cyfrannu at y broses ymgynghori a'u bod yn agored eu meddwl ar ddechrau'r broses er mwyn inni allu sicrhau setliad ystyrlon a fydd yn rhoi gofal ar flaen ein meddwl.

Gwenda Thomas: Diolch, Andrew. Dechreuasoch drwy gyfeirio at y ffaith bod pobl yn gallu disgwyl byw'n hwy gan ddweud bod hyn yn rhywbeth y dylem ei ddatlu. Cytunaf yn llwyr â hynny. Yr wyf yn cytuno hefyd â'ch sylw bod angen i bob carfan yn y gymdeithas gyfrannu at yr ymgynghori hwn.

Crybyllwyd y lwfans gweini hwnnw gennyh, sy'n fater y mae llawer o bobl wedi ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch eisoes. Fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, ceisiaf negodi â'm cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan, yn yr Alban ac yng ngogledd Iwerddon er mwyn gweld beth yw'r ffordd orau o fwrw ymlaen â'r lwfans gweini.

Yr wyf yn poeni o ddifrif, nid yn unig am y lwfans gweini, ond hefyd am effaith y premiwm anabledd. Yr wyf yn bwriadu edrych ar yr agwedd honno ar y cynnig—ac nid yw'n fwy na chynnig ar hyn o bryd—ac ar yr effaith y gallai ei chael ar y premiwm anabledd, sydd, o ran incwm, yn aml yn werth mwy na'r lwfans gweini. Felly, yr wyf yn poeni am hynny.

Soniasoch am daliadau uniongyrchol, ond nid ydym yn erbyn taliadau uniongyrchol, Andrew; yn wir, yr ydym yn barod i annog pobl i dalu taliadau uniongyrchol. Yr ydym yn awr yn ceisio diwygio'r ddeddfwriaeth i ehangu'r grŵp o bobl a all hawlio taliadau uniongyrchol i gynnwys y rhai sy'n gweithredu ar ran pobl eraill na allant wneud hynny drostynt eu hunain. Yr agenda personoleiddio yw'r maes lle y byddwn i, i ryw raddau, yn anghytuno â chi. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen, byddwn yn disgwyl y dystiolaeth o Loegr ynglŷn â'r gyllideb

annibynnol cyn inni symud ymlaen gyda hynny.

I was glad to announce details of the commission today, and it will look at the future provision of social services into the next decade, which is an important piece of work. Whichever proposals this Green Paper comes up with, we need to ensure that they fit with our policy intentions in Wales, as outlined in 'Fulfilled Lives, Supported Communities'. We will hold three stakeholder events: one in north Wales, one in Cardiff and one in Carmarthen. As well as launching the consultation itself yesterday, I also launched an updated website, which I know played an important part in the consultation that was held last year. We will also distribute leaflets, as I have said.

I agree that this is also a matter for young people. It is a consultation of all generations, and I hope to find innovative ways of including young people. On the television news last night, I saw that quite a few young people seem to have opinions to share with us. I hope that those views will work their way into the consultation.

On the workforce, you will know that I have set up a task group to look at the future of workforce development, and that group is well into its work. I agree absolutely with what you said about its being fair, simple and affordable, but I would also add to that list the delivery of the high-quality services to which I am sure we all aspire.

Helen Mary Jones: I begin by expressing my gratitude to the Deputy Minister for her early statement as the consultation was issued, giving Assembly Members an opportunity to raise some initial questions and give some initial views. I also agree with the Deputy Minister and Andrew R.T. Davies that this will be one of the major challenges facing not only our nation, but all the

Yr oeddwn yn falch o gyhoeddi manylion y comisiwn heddiw, a bydd yn edrych ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn y dyfodol i'r degawd nesaf, sy'n waith pwysig. Pa gynigion bynnag a ddaw drwy'r Papur Gwyrdd hwn, mae angen inni sicrhau eu bod yn cydweddu â bwriadau ein polisiau yng Nghymru, fel y'u ceir yn 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol'. Byddwn yn cynnal tri digwyddiad i randdeiliaid, un yn y gogledd, un yng Nghaerdydd ac un yng Nghaerfyrddin. Yn ogystal â lansio'r ymgynghori ei hun ddoe, lansiais hefyd wefan wedi'i diweddarau, y gwn iddi chwarae rhan bwysig yn yr ymgynghori y llynedd. Byddwn hefyd yn dosbarthu taflennu, fel yr wyf wedi dweud.

Yr wyf yn cytuno bod hyn yn fater i bobl ifanc hefyd. Byddwn yn ymgynghori â phob cenedlaeth, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio dod o hyd i ffyrdd arloesol o gynnwys pobl ifanc. Ar newyddion y teledu neithiwr, gwelais fod gan eithaf tipyn o bobl ifanc farn i'w mynegi wrthym. Gobeithio y bydd y safbwyntiau hynny'n cael eu cyfleu drwy'r ymgynghoriad.

O ran y gweithlu, gwyddoch fy mod wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl i edrych ar ddatblygu'r gweithlu yn y dyfodol, ac mae'r grŵp hwnnw wedi hen ddechrau ar ei waith. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh ynglŷn â bod yn deg, yn syml ac yn fforddiadwy, ond byddwn yn ychwanegu darparu gwasanaethau o safon at y rhestr honno hefyd, sydd, yr wyf yn siŵr yn nod inni i gyd.

Helen Mary Jones: Dechreuaf drwy fynegi fy niolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am ei datganiad buan wrth gyhoeddi'r ymgynghori, gan roi cyfle i Aelodau'r Cynulliad godi ambell gwestiwn cychwynnol a chynnig ambell safbwynt cychwynnol. Cytunaf hefyd â'r Dirprwy Weinidog ac ag Andrew R.T. Davies mai dyma fydd un o'r heriau mawr sy'n wynebu nid yn unig ein cenedl ni, ond

developed countries in the world as we move forward, for all the reasons that have been stated.

Before I raise specific questions with the Deputy Minister, I want to take us back to the views of the Royal Commission on Long-term Care for the Elderly in 1999. I remember its recommendations being among the first things discussed by the first Assembly's Health and Social Services Committee. In principle, I still support what it said, namely that care is care and that we should not spend a lot of public time and money debating whether Mrs Jones's bath counts as social care, for which she must pay, or as healthcare, which she gets for nothing.

I also believe that the people of Wales may well be prepared to pay, either in full or through taxation, to ensure that that care is available for everyone. Therefore, I do not want us to dismiss the taxation option in the long term. After all, no-one objects to paying taxes for healthcare even if they are never ill. I hope to goodness that I will never need to go into hospital again, but I am perfectly prepared to pay for the healthcare that other people may need. Therefore, I think that many of us in Wales would be prepared to pay such a tax to ensure that that care was there if we needed it. However, that is clearly not where we are now. We do not have that option to put to the people of Wales. While it is true that the community council in Trimsaran in west Wales, where I live, has more power to raise taxes than the National Assembly, we will have to find a made-in-Wales way forward within the limits of our current powers. In that context, we in Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales wish to study the consultation document in detail, and work with the Deputy Minister to find the best way forward within the constraints under which we operate.

yn wynebu pob gwlad ddatblygedig yn y byd wrth inni symud rhagom, am yr holl resymau sydd wedi'u rhoi.

Cyn imi godi cwestiynau penodol gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog, yr wyf am fynd â ni yn ôl at farn y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar Ofal Hirdymor i'r Henoed yn 1999. Cofiaf fod ei argymhellion ymhlith y pethau cyntaf a drafodwyd gan Bwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol cyntaf y Cynulliad. Mewn egwyddor, yr wyf yn dal i gefnogi'r hyn a ddywedodd, sef mai gofal yw gofal ac na ddylem dreulio llawer o amser ac arian y cyhoedd yn dadlau ynghylch ai gofal cymdeithasol y mae'n rhaid iddi dalu amdano yw bath Mrs Jones, ynteu ai gofal iechyd y mae'n ei gael am ddim.

Yr wyf yn credu hefyd ei bod yn eithaf posibil bod pobl Cymru'n barod i dalu, naill ai'n llawn, neu drwy drethi, i sicrhau bod gofal ar gael i bawb. Felly, nid wyf am inni ddiystyru trethi'n ddewis yn y tymor hir. Wedi'r cyfan, nid oes neb yn gwrthwynebu talu trethi am ofal iechyd, hyd yn oed os nad ydynt byth yn sâl. Gobeithio'n wir na fydd byth angen imi fynd i'r ysbyty eto, ond yr wyf yn berffaith barod i dalu am y gofal iechyd y gall fod ei angen ar bobl eraill. Felly, credaf y byddai llawer ohonom yng Nghymru'n barod i dalu treth o'r fath er mwyn sicrhau bod y gofal hwnnw ar gael petai ei angen arnom. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad ydym wedi cyrraedd y fan honno yn awr. Nid yw'r dewis hwnnw ar gael inni ei gynnig i bobl Cymru. Er ei fod yn wir bod gan y cyngor cymuned yn Nhrimsaran yn y gorllewin, lle'r wyf yn byw, fwy o bŵer i godi trethi na'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, bydd yn rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o fwrw ymlaen o fewn terfynau'r pwerau sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd, ffordd sydd 'wedi'i gwneud yng Nghymru'. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru—the Party of Wales yn dymuno astudio'r ddogfen ymgynghori'n fanwl, a gweithio gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog i ddod o hyd i'r ffordd orau ymlaen o fewn y cyfyngiadau yr ydym yn gweithio oddi tanynt.

Turning to some specific questions, I welcome the reference in the consultation document to the need for any final system to be one of national entitlement. That idea of entitlement to care is important. I also welcome the references in the Minister's statement to the increasing differences of approach between England and Wales to social services and social care. Deputy Minister, can you confirm that, whatever decision our Government takes as a result of the consultation, it will reflect that increasingly distinctive Welsh approach to social services? Can you also confirm that ours may not necessarily be the same as the approach taken in England—although, of course, we may agree with it?

Deputy Minister, I know that you are well aware of the view of my group that the attendance allowance should not be withdrawn from disabled people. I absolutely take your point about the knock-on effect of that on other benefits. That said, this is not a decision that will be taken here, although it is still a proposal, and, in that context, I welcome the reference in your statement to the discussions that you are having with the Westminster Government and the other devolved administrations. It is important that you are proactive on this. If there is to be any redistribution of the attendance allowance, can you assure us that you will push hard for those funds to be made available to those currently receiving benefit here in Wales and not on a Barnettised basis, given that we have a higher percentage of benefit recipients and disabled people here in Wales?

Finally, while thanking you once again for the breadth of this consultation, will you join me in urging all Assembly Members to encourage groups and individuals to participate in this vital consultation? The points that we have heard about this affecting younger people as well as older people are well made, and all Assembly Members have

A throi at ambell gwestiwn penodol, yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfeiriad yn y ddogfen ymgynghori at y ffaith bod angen i unrhyw system a ddewisir yn y pen draw fod yn system hawl genedlaethol. Mae'r syniad hwnnw o hawl i ofal yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn croesawu hefyd y cyfeiriadau yn natganiad y Gweinidog at y gwahaniaethau cynyddol rhwng y dull o ymdrin â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol yn Lloegr a'r dull yng Nghymru. Ddirprwy Weinidog, a allwch gadarnhau, beth bynnag y bydd ein Llywodraeth yn ei benderfynu yn sgîl yr ymgynghori, y bydd yn adlewyrchu'r dull hwnnw, sy'n fwyfwy unigryw yng Nghymru, o ymdrin â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? A allwch gadarnhau hefyd na fydd ein dull ni o anghenraid yr un fath â'r dull a arddelir yn Lloegr—er y bydd yn bosibl, wrth gwrs, y byddwn yn cytuno â hynny?

Ddirprwy Weinidog, gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol iawn o farn fy ngrŵp na ddyldid tynnu'r lwfans gweini oddi ar bobl anabl. Derbynïaf eich pwynt yn llwyr ynglŷn ag effaith ganlyniadol hynny ar fudd-daliadau eraill. Wedi dweud hynny, nid penderfyniad a wneir yma yw hynny, er ei fod yn dal yn gynnig, ac, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfeiriad yn eich datganiad at y trafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cynnal â Llywodraeth San Steffan a'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Mae'n bwysig ichi fod yn rhagweithiol yn hyn. Os yw'r lwfans gweini am gael ei ailddosbarthu o gwbl, a allwch ein sicrhau y byddwch yn pwyso'n galed ar i'r arian hwnnw fod ar gael i'r rhai sy'n cael budd-daliadau yma yng Nghymru ac nid ar sail fformiwla Barnett, o gofio bod gennym ganran uwch o bobl yn cael budd-daliadau ac o bobl anabl yma yng Nghymru?

Yn olaf, wrth imi ddiolch ichi unwaith eto am ehangder yr ymgynghoriad hwn, a ymunwch â mi i bwysu ar bob Aelod Cynulliad i annog grwpiau ac unigolion i gymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghoriad hollbwysig hwn? Mae'r pwyntiau yr ydym wedi'u clywed ynglŷn ag effaith hyn ar bobl iau yn ogystal ag ar bobl hŷn, yn rhai da, ac mae gan bob Aelod

a role to play in getting the message across that this is of concern to us all. We also need to listen carefully to those groups and organisations that speak for those who are most likely to be affected. For example, I see that colleagues from Mencap are here in the gallery listening to our discussions. I hope that you agree that we should all, as Assembly Members, take some responsibility for ensuring that people get involved in this debate. One thing is certain: its impact will have a long-term effect on the most vulnerable.

Gwenda Thomas: You referred to the royal commission and, ideally, we would all support the principle of care being free at the point of need. However, I have been open from the beginning that, in my opinion, it is not affordable, and therefore we have to look at alternative ways of paying for care into the next decade. If it were to be paid from a taxation scheme, taxes would need to be raised, which would place an inappropriate burden on working people. At the turn of the century, for every one person who retired, 19 were in work. Now, for every person who retires, there are only four people in work. That is the extent of the situation, showing how many taxes would need to be raised to pay for care, given the increased demand for it.

On national entitlement, the previous group and the stakeholder group addressed that theme, and the view was that a national funding option would be the best way forward, possibly with local delivery. The Welsh Assembly Government is open-minded on that question, but I hope that we will get responses on that. Do people think that, wherever we live in Wales, we need the same quality of service, and the service paid for will be at the same level? That is an issue that we need to hear people's views on. Social services will remain a devolved responsibility, which is why I am keen for the independent commission to take account of what emerges from this consultation to inform the commission's work.

Cynulliad rôl i'w chwarae o ran cyfleu'r neges bod hyn o bwys inni i gyd. Mae angen inni hefyd wrando'n ofalus ar y grwpiau a'r mudiadau hynny sy'n siarad ar ran y rhai y bydd hyn yn fwyaf tebygol o effeithio arnynt. Er enghraifft, gwelaf fod cyfeillion o Mencap yma yn yr oriel yn gwrandao ar ein trafodaethau. Gobeithio y cytunwch y dylai pawb ohonom, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ysgwyddo rhywfaint o gyfrifoldeb dros sicrhau bod pobl yn cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Mae peth yn sicr: caiff ddylanwad hirdymor ar y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed.

Gwenda Thomas: Soniasoch am y comisiwn brenhinol, ac, yn ddelfrydol, byddem i gyd yn cefnogi egwyddor darparu gofal am ddim yn y man lle mae ei angen. Serch hynny, yr wyf wedi bod yn agored o'r cychwyn nad yw'n fforddiadwy, yn fy marn i, ac felly, fod yn rhaid inni edrych ar ffyrdd amgen o dalu am ofal ar gyfer y degawd nesaf. Pe defnyddid cynllun trethiant i dalu amdano, byddai angen cynyddu trethi, a fyddai'n rhoi baich amhriodol ar bobl sy'n gweithio. Ar droad y ganrif, ar gyfer pob un a oedd yn ymddeol, yr oedd 19 yn gweithio. Erbyn hyn, ar gyfer pob un sy'n ymddeol, dim ond pedwar sy'n gweithio. Dyna faint y sefyllfa, sy'n dangos faint o drethi y byddai angen eu codi i dalu am ofal, o gofio bod y galw amdano'n cynyddu.

O ran hawl genedlaethol, aeth y grŵp blaenorol a'r grŵp rhanddeiliaid i'r afael â'r thema honno, a'r farn oedd mai opsiwn ariannu cenedlaethol fyddai'r ffordd orau ymlaen, o bosibl drwy ei roi ar waith yn lleol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn agored ei meddwl ynglŷn â'r cwestiwn hwnnw, ond gobeithio y cawn ymatebion ynghylch hynny. A yw pobl yn meddwl, ym mha le bynnag yr ydym yn byw yng Nghymru, fod angen gwasanaeth o'r un ansawdd arnom, ac y bydd y gwasanaeth y telir amdano ar gael ar yr un lefel? Mae hwnnw'n fater y mae angen inni glywed barn pobl amdano. Bydd y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn parhau'n gyfrifoldeb datganoledig, a dyna pam yr wyf yn awyddus i'r comisiwn annibynnol ystyried yr hyn sy'n deillio o'r ymgynghoriad hwn i

oleuo gwaith y comisiwn.

3.10 p.m.

I do not think that I answered Andrew's point on the timescale. I expect the commission to bring a report by this time next year.

Ni chredaf imi ateb pwynt Andrew ynglŷn â'r amserlen. Yr wyf yn disgwyl i'r comisiwn gyflwyno adroddiad erbyn yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf.

On the point about the attendance allowance, I am pleased that the Secretary of State for Health has now clarified the situation with regard to the disability living allowance. That will not be considered as part of these proposals, but I remain concerned about the future of the attendance allowance, and I intend to hold UK Ministers to the commitment given in the English Green Paper to work closely with the devolved administrations to find an approach that works for the whole of the UK. I also want to seek to ensure that people who currently receive benefits continue to receive an equivalent level of support and protection. More than that, I want to understand what that really means. That will form a part of my exploration of the issue with other Ministers.

Ynglŷn â'r pwynt am y lwfans gweini, yr wyf yn falch bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd bellach wedi egluro'r sefyllfa gyda golwg ar y lwfans byw i'r anabl. Nid ystyrir hynny'n rhan o'r cynigion hyn, ond yr wyf yn dal i boeni am ddyfodol y lwfans gweini, a bwriadaf ddal Gweinidogion y Deyrnas Unedig at yr ymrwymiad a roddwyd ym Mhapur Gwyrdd Lloegr i weithio'n glòs gyda'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig i ganfod ffordd sy'n gweithio i'r Deyrnas Unedig drwyddi draw. Yr wyf hefyd am geisio sicrhau bod y bobl sy'n cael budd-daliadau ar hyn o bryd yn dal i gael yr un lefel o gymorth a gwarchodaeth. Yn fwy na hynny, yr wyf am ddeall beth yw gwir ystyr hynny. Bydd hynny'n rhan o'm hymchwiliad i'r mater gyda'r Gweinidogion eraill.

Kirsty Williams: I begin by thanking the Deputy Minister for her statement this afternoon. Helen Mary was right to refer us back to the findings of the royal commission, published 10 years ago. The issues identified then have not disappeared, and the demographic changes that it predicted have turned out to be correct. However, what has changed is the ability of Government to respond financially to the challenges of paying for social care. It is a matter of great regret to me that, 10 years after the publication of the royal commission's report, the Governments at Westminster and here have done little to get to grips with the issues outlined.

Kirsty Williams: Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am ei datganiad y prynhawn yma. Yr oedd Helen Mary'n iawn yn ein cyfeirio'n ôl at ganfyddiadau'r comisiwn brenhinol, a gyhoeddwyd 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Nid yw'r materion a nodwyd bryd hynny wedi diflannu, ac mae'r newidiadau demograffig a ragwelwyd yn gywir erbyn gweld. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd wedi newid yw gallu'r Llywodraeth i ymateb yn ariannol i heriau talu am ofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr, 10 mlynedd ar ôl cyhoeddi adroddiad y comisiwn brenhinol, mai ychydig y mae'r Llywodraeth yma a'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan wedi'i wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a ddisgrifiwyd.

It is also of regret that the Deputy Minister's consultation document seems to be little more than a cloned version of the UK Government's Green Paper. It offers very little evidence of Welsh solutions to these

Mae'n resyn hefyd nad yw dogfen ymgynghori'r Dirprwy Weinidog i bob golwg yn fawr mwy na fersiwn ddyblyg o Bapur Gwyrdd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Ychydig iawn o dystiolaeth y mae'n

issues. Although the Deputy Minister has made great play today of the difference between social care policy in England and Wales, her consultation document on how that care is to be paid for shows little difference between the measures being consulted on at Westminster.

Deputy Minister, what is the difference between a tax and a compulsory insurance scheme? You rule out the prospect of taxation, claiming that it is unfair and unworkable, and yet you go on to advocate a scheme that would require people to pay into it. I would be grateful if you could explain the difference between compulsory insurance and taxation. It may be my fault, but I am unable to find any distinction.

Could the Deputy Minister also tell us whether she will overcome the fundamental problem of definitions and differentiation within the system when devising a new system of paying for social care as a result of this consultation? Whatever system she comes up with, the fundamental problem will remain: what is the difference between healthcare, which will continue to be free at the point of delivery, and social care? However social care is paid for, whether through a tax or a compulsory insurance scheme, whether people opt in or opt out, and whether the state pays, the difference between healthcare and social care will remain an issue, and this paper does little to advance that argument or seek to clarify those differences. The result will be continuing confusion for those who have to deal with that system, and I dare say the replication of the court cases currently under way. People who have wrongfully paid for social care that should have been classed as healthcare are now engaged in a legal fight to seek some form of financial redress.

ei chynnig o atebion Cymreig i'r problemau hyn. Er bod y Dirprwy Weinidog wedi gwneud môr a mynydd heddiw o'r gwahaniaeth rhwng polisi gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a Lloegr, ychydig o wahaniaeth a welir rhwng ei dogfen ymgynghori a'r mesurau y mae ymgynghori yn eu cylch yn San Steffan o ran sut y telir am y gofal hwnnw.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng treth a chynllun yswiriant gorfodol? Yr ydych yn diystyru'r posibilrwydd yn ymwneud â threthiant, gan honni ei fod yn annheg ac yn anymarferol. Eto i gyd, ewch yn eich blaen i argymhell cynllun a fyddai'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bobl dalu ato. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech esbonio'r gwahaniaeth rhwng yswiriant gorfodol a threthu. Efallai mai fi sydd ar fai, ond ni allaf weld gwahaniaeth.

A allai'r Dirprwy Weinidog ddweud wrthym hefyd a fydd yn datrys problem sylfaenol diffiniadau a gwahaniaethu o fewn y system wrth ddyfeisio system newydd ar gyfer talu am ofal cymdeithasol yn sgîl yr ymgynghori hwn? Pa system bynnag y bydd yn ei chynnig, yr un fydd y broblem sylfaenol: beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng gofal iechyd, a fydd yn dal ar gael am ddim yn y man lle y'i darperir, a gofal cymdeithasol? Pa ffordd bynnag y telir am ofal cymdeithasol, ni waeth ai drwy dreth ynteu drwy gynllun yswiriant gorfodol, ni waeth a fydd pobl yn dewis ymuno â'r cynllun ai peidio, ac ni waeth a fydd y wladwriaeth yn talu ai peidio, bydd y gwahaniaeth rhwng gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn dal yn broblem, ac ychydig y mae'r papur hwn yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r ddadl honno neu i geisio egluro'r gwahaniaethau hynny. Y canlyniad fydd dryswch parhaus i'r rhai sy'n gorfod ymdrin â'r system honno, ac mae'n siŵr y gwelir mwy o'r achosion llys sydd ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd. Mae pobl sydd wedi talu ar gam am ofal cymdeithasol a ddylai fod wedi cael ei gategoreiddio'n ofal iechyd bellach yn brwydro drwy'r gyfraith i geisio rhyw fath o iawn ariannol.

So, what will the consultation do to more clearly define what is healthcare and what is social care? Can the Deputy Minister also give me some understanding of how her plans to abolish funding to encourage local health boards and county councils to work together in the field of health and social care will help? My understanding is that the Government's proposal is to abolish such funding, and one wonders how this agenda will be advanced by that step.

The Deputy Minister is right: reform of the current system is needed. We cannot continue to duck these issues, as has happened for the past 10 years. However, I and my party believe that this paper will not lead to any changes for those who find themselves in need of social care and having to establish whether they can afford it. We look forward to the results of the consultation. I trust that, by working with other political parties and those outside the Assembly, we can come up with something that is a great deal more adventurous than a rehash of what Westminster is currently proposing.

Gwenda Thomas: Thank you, Kirsty. I was coming to the opinion that we were moving towards a wide consensus. However, your words brought to mind what Nick Clegg, your party leader, said on 22 July this year, when he made a statement that:

'Our shopping lists of commitments will be far, far, far, far, far shorter. We will have to ask ourselves some immensely difficult questions about what we as a party can afford. A lot of cherished Lib Dem policies will have to go on the back burner.'
[*Laughter.*]

I understand what Nick Clegg meant by that, but I wonder whether your party or your group in the Assembly here has worked on any alternative policies to this Green Paper since our consultation last year. I know that,

Felly, beth a wnaiff yr ymgynghoriad i ddiffinio'n eglurach beth yw gofal iechyd a beth yw gofal cymdeithasol? A all y Dirprwy Weinidog fy nghynorthwyo i ddeall rhywfaint am sut y bydd ei chynlluniau i ddileu'r cyllid sy'n annog byrddau iechyd lleol a chynghorau sir i gydweithio ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol o gymorth? Yn ôl a ddeallaf, cynnig y Llywodraeth yw dileu cyllid o'r fath, ac mae rhywun yn meddwl tybed sut y bydd hynny'n rhoi hwb i'r agenda hon.

Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn iawn: mae angen diwygio'r drefn bresennol. Ni allwn barhau i osgoi'r problemau hyn, fel sydd wedi digwydd ers y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fi a'm plaid yn credu na wnaiff y papur hwn arwain at newidiadau i'r rhai sy'n canfod bod angen gofal cymdeithasol arnynt ac sy'n gorfod penderfynu a allant ei fforddio. Edrychwn ymlaen at ganlyniadau'r ymgynghori. Hyderaf, drwy weithio gyda phleidiau gwleidyddol eraill a'r rhai y tu allan i'r Cynulliad, y gallwn gynnig rhywbeth sy'n llawer mwy mentrus nag ailbobiad o'r hyn y mae San Steffan yn ei gynnig ar hyn o bryd.

Gwenda Thomas: Diolch ichi, Kirsty. Yr oeddwn yn dechrau meddwl ein bod yn symud at gonsensws eang. Fodd bynnag, fe'm hatgoffwyd gan eich geiriau am yr hyn a ddywedodd Nick Clegg, arweinydd eich plaid, ar 22 Gorffennaf eleni, pan wnaeth ddatganiad:

Bydd ein rhestrau siopa o ymrwymadau'n fyrrach o lawer iawn, iawn, iawn, iawn. Bydd yn rhaid inni ofyn nifer o gwestiynau anodd eithriadol inni'n hunain am yr hyn y gallwn ei fforddio fel plaid. Bydd yn rhaid i lawer o bolisïau a goleddir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fynd i gefn y cwpwrdd.
[*Chwerthin.*]

Deallaf yr hyn yr oedd Nick Clegg yn ei olygu wrth hynny, ond tybed a yw eich plaid neu eich grŵp yma yn y Cynulliad wedi gweithio ar unrhyw bolisïau gwahanol i'r Papur Gwyrdd hwn ers ein hymgyngoriad y

to give you credit, the Welsh Liberal Democrat proposals passed at your conference in Wrexham last month would make a start on addressing some of the problems. Your proposals would make it easier for people to fund adaptations to their homes and see a gradual increase in the numbers entitled to local authority support. That is commendable, but it does not go any way towards providing alternatives to the proposals before us. If you do have alternative proposals, I will, of course, be more than willing to listen to your views, as I will listen to the views of all political parties in the Assembly; I am sure that Trish will also wish to feed into this. So, I look forward to hearing detailed proposals.

You mentioned the Royal Commission, and I share with you some disappointment that we are not able to fund free care at the moment. However, to say that this is a cloned paper shows a total misunderstanding of the current basis of legislation, which, at the moment, is based in statute on an England and Wales basis with regard to paying for care. Therefore, England must lead on this policy. What I am determined to do, and I am sure that all of you will support this, is ensure that the voices of the people of Wales are heard and that we have a meaningful consultation.

On the difference between a compulsory insurance scheme and tax, I am not going to give a detailed explanation, but it will be a requirement on retired people to pay or contribute. That is the difference: it is not a requirement on working people. The compulsory option would place a requirement on retired people to contribute to the scheme, which could be a private or state insurance policy. I am open on this and we want to hear what people think about it.

3.20 p.m.

I take your point about health and social care, and I would like to make it clear that these

llynedd. Gwn, er clod ichi, y byddai cynigion Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru a basiwyd yn eich cynhadledd yn Wrecsam fis diwethaf yn rhoi cychwyn arni i ddatrys rhai o'r problemau. Byddai eich cynigion yn ei gwneud yn haws i bobl dalu am addasu eu cartrefi ac i weld cynnydd graddol yn y nifer a chanddynt yr hawl i gael cymorth gan awdurdod lleol. Mae hynny i'w ganmol, ond nid yw'n cyfrannu o gwbl at gynnig dewisiadau eraill yn lle'r cynigion sydd ger ein bron. Os oes gennych gynigion eraill, byddaf, wrth gwrs, yn fwy na bodlon gwrando ar eich barn, fel y byddaf yn gwrando ar farn pob plaid wleidyddol yn y Cynulliad; yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Trish yn dymuno cyfrannu at hyn hefyd. Felly, edrychaf ymlaen at glywed cynigion manwl.

Crybwyllwyd y Comisiwn Brenhinol gennych ac yr wyf finnau, fel chithau, yn siomedig na allwn dalu am ofal am ddim ar hyn o bryd. Serch hynny, mae dweud mai fersiwn ddyblyg yw'r papur hwn yn dangos camddealltwriaeth llwyr o sylfaen bresennol y ddeddfwriaeth. Ar hyn o bryd, mae iddi sylfaen statudol ar sail Cymru a Lloegr o ran talu am ofal. Felly, rhaid i Loegr arwain o ran y polisi hwn. Yr hyn yr wyf yn benderfynol o'i wneud, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch i gyd yn cefnogi hyn, yw sicrhau bod lleisiau pobl Cymru'n cael eu clywed ac y cawn ymgynghoriad ystyrlon.

O ran y gwahaniaeth rhwng cynllun yswiriant gorfodol a threth, nid wyf am roi esboniad manwl, ond bydd yn ofynnol i bobl sydd wedi ymddeol dalu neu gyfrannu. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth: nid yw'n ofynnol i bobl sy'n gweithio dalu. Byddai'r dewis gorfodol yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bobl sydd wedi ymddeol gyfrannu at y cynllun, a gallent wneud hynny drwy bolisi yswiriant preifat neu drwy bolisi yswiriant gan y wladwriaeth. Yr wyf yn agored ynglŷn â hyn ac yr ydym am glywed beth yw barn pobl amdano.

Derbyniaf eich pwynt am ofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, a hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir nad

proposals do not take account of accommodation costs. Therefore, in respect of health and social care and the difference between them, I am hoping that the independent commission will look—I am sure that it will—to see whether we are effective in integrating health and social care. I know that the Minister will say that there is work currently taking place to look at this issue. This should form part of this consultation and the work of the commission, and I encourage you all to participate in the work of the commission.

I think that you referred to the joint working grant being abolished. I would not use the word 'abolished'. We have taken a decision to cease payments of the joint working grant to local authorities. This grant had been going for seven years. As you say, and as Nick Clegg said, tough decisions have to be taken. The tough decision was taken that we could no longer continue to fund this grant, and to use those resources in a different way to fund our fairer charging policy, so that no-one in Wales pays more than £50 a week for non-residential care—that is, if the proposed Measure is adopted by the Assembly. We must not get confused between what we are saying here, about the future of integration of health and social services and the fundamentally important consultation on how we pay for care into the future.

Jonathan Morgan: I agree with you, Deputy Minister, that there are clear challenges that we need to face, particularly in the way in which we are able to pay for care in the next 20 or 30 years. There are certain things that we now cannot avoid. First, there is a demographic shift. We know that, in around 20 years, the number of retired people will outnumber the number of people in work. We know, for example, that half of all children born today will live until they are 100 years of age. That is a wonderful achievement in itself, but it poses a significant challenge in a public policy context. While I agree that we need to look at how care is funded in the future, I think that there is a flaw in the

yw'r cynigion hyn yn ystyried costau llety. Felly, o ran gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a'r gwahaniaeth rhyngddynt, yr wyf yn gobeithio y gwnaiff y comisiwn annibynnol ystyried—yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff—a ydym yn integreiddio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn effeithiol. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud bod gwaith ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd i edrych ar hyn. Dylai hyn fod yn rhan o'r ymgynghoriad hwn ac o waith y comisiwn, a phwysaf arnoch i gyd gymryd rhan yng ngwaith y comisiwn.

Credaf ichi gyfeirio at ddileu'r grant cydweithio. Ni fyddwn yn defnyddio'r gair 'dileu'. Yr ydym wedi penderfynu rhoi'r gorau i dalu'r grant cydweithio i awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r grant hwn wedi bod ar gael ers saith mlynedd. Fel y dywedwch, ac fel y dywedodd Nick Clegg, rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd. Gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad anodd na allem barhau i dalu'r grant hwn, ac y dylid defnyddio'r adnoddau hynny mewn ffordd wahanol i dalu am ein polisi taliadau tecach, fel nad oes neb yng Nghymru'n talu mwy na £50 yr wythnos am ofal amhreswyl—hynny yw, os mabwysiedir y Mesur arfaethedig gan y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni beidio â drysu rhwng yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ddweud yma, am ddyfodol gwasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol a'r ymgynghoriad o bwys sylfaenol ynglŷn â sut y byddwn yn talu am ofal yn y dyfodol.

Jonathan Morgan: Cytunaf â chi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, fod heriau amlwg y mae angen inni eu hwynebu, yn enwedig o ran sut y byddwn yn gallu talu am ofal yn yr 20 neu'r 30 mlynedd nesaf. Ceir rhai pethau na allwn eu hosgoi yn awr. Yn gyntaf, mae newid demograffig ar waith. Gwyddom, ymhen tuag 20 mlynedd, y bydd mwy o bobl sydd wedi ymddeol nag sydd o bobl sy'n gweithio. Gwyddom, er enghraifft, y bydd hanner yr holl blant a enir heddiw'n byw nes eu bod yn 100 mlwydd oed. Mae hynny'n llwyddiant rhyfeddol ynddo'i hun, ond mae'n gosod her sylweddol o ran cyd-destun polisi cyhoeddus. Er fy mod yn cytuno bod angen inni edrych ar sut y telir am ofal yn y dyfodol, credaf fod

debate that we are currently having. This is not a criticism of you. The trap that we fall into is to look purely at how we pay in the future. We have not asked ourselves what we need to provide in the future; we have not decided how models of care may need to look differently in the future; and we have not tried to establish what might be required.

Yesterday, I visited a care home in my constituency and I was talking to the residents about this particular challenge. They said that paying for care is crucially important, but so is providing a system that allows older people to live and not just merely exist. By that, they were talking about a range of activities, how it is that older people in their 80s, 90s and perhaps beyond, could be as engaged in society as possible, where they could be as active as they wanted to be. We need to look at what it is that older people feel needs to happen and perhaps talk to those people who are currently in their 50s or 60s about what might need to happen in 20 to 30 years' time, to enable them to have the greatest level of activity as possible. Sometimes, when you visit these homes, which can be rather depressing, you see situations where older people are simply existing; they are not actually living. That is something that we need to consider. Will you outline, Deputy Minister, what the Government is doing to generate a debate around the care that we need to provide, rather than just a debate about how we pay for it?

Gwenda Thomas: I will not comment further on the demographic shift, but I agree with your comments on it.

You talked about the flaw in the debate, and that it is about how we pay and that we are not looking at the services that we will need to deliver. I do not agree with that. The setting up of the independent commission will look at the future delivery of social

gwendid yn y ddadl hon yr ydym yn ei chael ar hyn o bryd. Nid beirmiadaeth arnoch chi yw hyn. Y fagl yr ydym yn disgyn iddi yw mai'r cyfan yr ydym yn edrych arno yw sut y byddwn yn talu yn y dyfodol. Nid ydym wedi gofyn i ni'n hunain beth y bydd angen inni ei ddarparu yn y dyfodol; nid ydym wedi penderfynu sut y gall fod angen i fodolau gofal fod yn wahanol yn y dyfodol; ac nid ydym wedi ceisio gweld beth a allai fod yn ofynnol.

Ddoe, ymwelais â chartref gofal yn fy etholaeth ac yr oeddwn yn siarad â'r preswylwyr am yr her benodol hon. Dywedasant fod talu am ofal yn hollbwysig, ond mae darparu system sy'n caniatáu i bobl hŷn fyw yn hytrach na bodoli'n unig yn bwysig hefyd. Yn y cyswllt hwnnw, yr oeddent yn sôn am amrywiaeth o weithgareddau, sut y gellid sicrhau bod pobl hŷn yn eu 80au, eu 90au a'r tu hwnt i hynny efallai, mor egniol ag yr oeddent yn dymuno bod. Mae angen inni edrych ar yr hyn a ddylai ddigwydd ym marn pobl hŷn ac efallai siarad â'r bobl hynny sydd ar hyn o bryd yn eu 50au neu eu 60au ynglŷn â'r hyn y gallai fod angen iddo ddigwydd ymhen 20 neu 30 mlynedd er mwyn eu galluogi i fod mor egniol ag sy'n bosibl. Weithiau, pan fyddwch yn ymweld â'r cartrefi hyn, sy'n gallu bod yn eithaf torcalonnu, gwelwch sefyllfaoedd lle nad yw pobl hŷn ond yn bodoli; nid ydynt mewn gwirionedd yn byw. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei ystyried. A wnewch ddweud, Ddirprwy Weinidog, beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i ysgogi dadl am y gofal y mae angen inni ei ddarparu, yn hytrach na dim ond dadl am sut y byddwn yn talu amdano?

Gwenda Thomas: Ni ddywedaf ragor am y newid demograffig, ond cytunaf â'ch sylwadau amdano.

Soniasoch am y gwendid yn y ddadl, sef ei bod yn ymwneud â sut yr ydym yn talu ac nad ydym yn edrych ar y gwasanaethau y bydd angen inni eu darparu. Nid wyf yn cytuno â hynny. Wrth sefydlu'r comisiwn annibynnol, byddwn yn edrych ar ddarparu

services. I want that to go hand in hand with this consultation on paying for care. Insofar as England is concerned, I think that Wales has led the way on this. The Green Paper in England deals with the issue of modernising social care and paying for care. In Wales, we have taken those steps in introducing our policy ‘Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities’, which showed the way on the modernisation agenda. We can be proud of that.

I accept your point about people in their 50s and 60s—I am one myself. These days we have what I think of as a ‘fourth age’ in life, as people are now living from 75 and 80 to 100. We need to consider the fourth age seriously; it is where the greatest call for support will fall. I hope, Jonathan, that you feed those views into the process, because it is important. We also need to consider, hand-in-hand with this issue—although it is not included in the Green Paper—how we will pay for care for younger disabled people, because we are not only celebrating people living to an older age; we are also celebrating the fact that people with what are sometimes profound disabilities are living well into middle age and beyond. Therefore, we need to knit that into the consultation.

Leanne Wood: Thank you for your statement, Deputy Minister. You know that I have grave concerns about this issue; indeed, we met recently to discuss the implications for Wales of the English Green Paper. I thank you for the meeting and your genuine interest in this matter. I was encouraged by the part of your statement in which you emphasised plans to improve the delivery of social services in Wales. Many people currently fear that social services will suffer as a result of any local authority cuts, so plans to improve services are to be welcomed. I hope that that will mean that local authorities will recognise how important those services are to some of the most vulnerable people in our

gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf am i hynny fynd law yn llaw â'r ymgynghoriad hwn ynglŷn â thalu am ofal. Cyn belled ag y mae Lloegr dan sylw, credaf fod Cymru wedi arwain y ffordd yn hyn. Mae'r Papur Gwyrdd yn Lloegr yn ymwneud â mater moderneiddio gofal cymdeithasol a thalu am ofal. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi cymryd y camau hynny wrth gyflwyno'n polisi 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol' a oedd yn dangos y ffordd o ran yr agenda moderneiddio. Gallwn fod yn falch o hynny.

Yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt am bobl yn eu 50au a'u 60au—yr wyf yn un ohonynt fy hun. Y diwrnodau hyn, mae gennym yr hyn y byddaf yn meddwl amdano fel ‘pedwaredd oes’ bywyd, wrth i bobl fyw bellach dros eu 75 a'u 80 nes eu bod yn 100 oed. Mae angen inni ystyried y bedwaredd oes o ddifrif; dyma lle y bydd y galw mwyaf am gymorth. Gobeithio, Jonathan, y byddwch yn bwydo'r safbwyntiau hynny i'r broses, oherwydd y mae'n bwysig. Mae angen inni ystyried hefyd, law yn llaw â'r mater hwn—er nad yw wedi'i gynnwys yn y Papur Gwyrdd—sut y byddwn yn talu am ofal i bobl anabl iau, oherwydd yr ydym hefyd yn dathlu'r ffaith bod pobl a chanddynt anabledau a'r rheiny'n anabledau dwys ar brydiau, yn byw tan ymhell wedi iddynt gyrraedd eu canol oed ac yn hŷn na hynny. Felly, mae angen inni gynnwys hynny'n rhan o'r ymgynghoriad.

Leanne Wood: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Gwyddoch fod mod yn poeni'n fawr am y mater hwn; yn wir, cyfarfuom yn ddiweddar i drafod goblygiadau Papur Gwyrdd Lloegr i Gymru. Diolch ichi am y cyfarfod a'ch diddordeb dilys yn y mater hwn. Fe'm calonogwyd gan y rhan o'ch datganiad lle yr oeddech yn pwysleisio cynlluniau i wella'r ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae llawer o bobl ar hyn o bryd yn ofni y bydd gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn dioddef yn sgîl unrhyw doriadau gan awdurdodau lleol, felly croesewir cynlluniau i wella gwasanaethau. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn

communities.

Deputy Minister, in your statement you outlined the five options that are on the table for the future. I was disappointed to hear you say that one of those options, namely taxation, is not favoured by the UK Government. Most people feel that taxation is the fairest way to pay for services, and that care should be funded through general progressive taxation. I support Helen Mary Jones's comments on that. I accept that it is expensive, but if it were seen as a priority, it would be paid for out of our taxes. Can you confirm that, while taxation may be ruled out by the UK Government, you will not rule it out, and that, if a majority of people as part of the consultation favour that option and feel that it is the best way forward, you will argue for it among your counterparts in Westminster? People find it very difficult to understand why social care can be paid for out of progressive taxation in Scotland, but that we cannot afford it here.

You are well aware of the arguments against the abolition of disability benefits such as attendance allowance, and you know that such a move would have a disproportionate impact on Wales: on the Welsh economy as well as on disabled pensioners, because the number of claimants is much higher here. I welcome your previous statements on this matter, but I would be grateful if you could reiterate in the strongest possible terms your opposition to the abolition of attendance allowance.

Finally, Deputy Minister, I was concerned and comforted to hear you say that you were committed to an effective dialogue with your ministerial counterparts in the UK Government to help you to achieve a shared view on the way forward. I was comforted because I know what your position is on attendance allowance, and I am confident that you will express the opinion of Welsh

cydnabod mor bwysig yw'r gwasanaethau hynny i rai o'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymunedau.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, yn eich datganiad soniasoch am y pum dewis sydd ar y bwrdd ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig o'ch clywed yn dweud nad yw Llywodraeth y DU yn ffafrio un o'r opsiynau, sef trethiant. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn teimlo mai trethiant yw'r ffordd decaf o dalu am wasanaethau, ac y dylid talu am ofal drwy drethi cynyddol cyffredinol. Yr wyf yn cefnogi sylwadau Helen Mary Jones ynglŷn â hynny. Yr wyf yn derbyn ei fod yn ddrud, ond petai'n cael ei ystyried yn flaenoriaeth, telid amdano o'n trethi. A allwch gadarnhau, er bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn diystyru trethu, na wnewch chithau ei ddiystyru, ac, os bydd mwyafrif y bobl, fel rhan o'r ymgynghori, yn ffafrio'r dewis hwnnw ac yn teimlo mai dyna'r ffordd orau o fwrw ymlaen, y byddwch yn dadlau o'i blaid ymhlith eich cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan? Mae pobl yn ei chael yn anodd iawn deall pam mae modd talu am ofal cymdeithasol drwy drethu cynyddol yn yr Alban, ond na allwn ei fforddio yma.

Gwyddoch yn iawn am y dadleuon yn erbyn dileu budd-daliadau anabledd megis y lwfans gweini, a gwyddoch y byddai cam o'r fath yn cael effaith fwy difrifol ar Gymru: ar economi Cymru yn ogystal ag ar bensynwyr anabl, oherwydd bod y nifer sy'n ei hawlio yma gymaint yn fwy. Yr wyf yn croesawu eich datganiadau blaenorol ynglŷn â hyn, ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ailddatgan, cyn gryfed byth ag sy'n bosibl, eich gwrthwynebiad i ddileu'r lwfans gweini.

Yn olaf, Ddirprwy Weinidog, yr oeddwn yn poeni ac ar yr un pryd cael cysur wrth eich clywed yn dweud eich bod yn ymroddedig i gynnal deialog effeithiol gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn eich cynorthwyo i sicrhau safbwynt ar y cyd ynglŷn â'r ffordd ymlaen. Cefais gysur am fy mod yn gwybod beth yw eich safbwynt chi o ran y lwfans gweini, ac

stakeholders to your counterparts in Westminster. However, I am concerned for the following reason: dialogue might work under the current political set-up, but do you envisage having problems with such dialogue should the Government change in Westminster? We all know the Tories' record on benefits and welfare reform, and it is likely that they will want to make quick cuts and reduce the size of the state as soon as possible. It could be that, after a change of Government, things will move faster, and those needing care will be hit even harder. How could positive dialogue work in those circumstances?

yr wyf yn hyderus y byddwch yn mynegi barn rhanddeiliaid Cymru wrth eich cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn poeni am y rheswm a ganlyn: efallai y bydd deialog yn gweithio o dan y trefniant gwleidyddol presennol, ond a ydych yn rhagweld problemau gyda deialog o'r fath petai'r Llywodraeth yn newid yn San Steffan? Gwyddom i gyd beth yw record y Torïaid o ran budd-daliadau a diwygio lles, ac mae'n debyg y byddant am dorri pethau'n gyflym a chrebachu'r wladwriaeth cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Efallai, ar ôl i'r Llywodraeth newid, y bydd pethau'n symud yn gyflymach, ac y bydd y rhai y bydd angen gofal arnynt yn cael eu taro'n galetach byth. Sut y gallai deialog cadarnhaol ddigwydd o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny?

3.30 p.m.

Gwenda Thomas: You talked about improving social services delivery in Wales, and I am committed to that. Indeed, we need to highlight that there have been great improvements in Wales. If you look back at the past 10 years through the eyes of CSSIW, you will see that this improvement is significant. There are still variations and there is still not enough consistency, but there is no doubt that improvements have been made.

Gwenda Thomas: Soniasoch am wella'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf yn ymroddedig i hynny. Yn wir, mae angen inni dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod gwelliannau mawr wedi bod yng Nghymru. Os edrychwch yn ôl ar y 10 mlynedd diwethaf drwy lygaid AGGCC, gwelwch fod pethau wedi gwella'n sylweddol. Ceir gwahaniaethau o hyd ac nid oes digon o gysondeb o hyd, ond nid oes amheuaeth nad yw pethau wedi gwella.

Our position is open. I give you the commitment that the views of the people of Wales will be conveyed to the UK Government, as will their preferences and whatever they have to say on any of the options. The influence that we can bring to bear is not insignificant and I think that we should capitalise on that. However, we will wait and see what comes through. If the majority of the people of Wales share your view, then we will convey that view to the UK Government.

Yr ydym yn agored ein meddwl. Rhoddaf ymrwymiad ichi y caiff barn pobl Cymru ei chyfleu i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, ynghyd â'r hyn a fyddai orau ganddynt a beth bynnag sydd ganddynt i'w ddweud ynglŷn ag unrhyw un o'r opsiynau. Gallwn gael dylanwad sylweddol a chredaf y dylem fanteisio i'r eithaf ar hynny. Serch hynny, arhoswn i weld beth a ddaw i'r amlwg. Os bydd mwyafrif pobl Cymru o'r un farn â chi, yna, byddwn yn cyfleu'r farn honno i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig.

You spoke about attendance allowance and challenged me for my personal opinion. Personally, I believe that attendance allowance will still have a role to play in supporting people to live independently. I do

Soniasoch am y lwfans gweini gan fy herio i fynegi fy marn bersonol. Yn bersonol, credaf y bydd gan y lwfans gweini rôl o hyd o ran cynorthwyo pobl i fyw'n annibynnol. Nid wyf yn deall yn ddigon clir beth y mae

not understand clearly enough what the UK Government is saying about people in receipt of attendance allowance retaining the same level of care. Taking Andrew R.T. Davies's point on direct payments, that is an issue on which we need clarity and which needs to be a part of this consultation process.

With regard to dialogue with a future UK Government, I am not conceding defeat to the Conservatives; I look forward to working with a future Labour Government. Nevertheless, whatever Government is in power, we would all agree that this would be a matter for each and every Government to face and to bring forward proposals to deal with the issue of paying for care.

Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ei ddweud ynghylch pobl sy'n cael y lwfans gweini'n dal i gael yr un lefel o ofal. A chymryd pwynt Andrew R.T. Davies am daliadau uniongyrchol, mae hwnnw'n fater y mae angen inni gael eglurder yn ei gylch ac y mae angen iddo fod yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori hon.

O ran deialog â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn y dyfodol, nid wyf yn cydnabod bod y Ceidwadwyr yn sicr o ennill; edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda Llywodraeth Lafur yn y dyfodol. Serch hynny, pa lywodraeth bynnag a fydd mewn grym, byddem i gyd yn cytuno y byddai hyn yn fater i bob Llywodraeth ei wynebu a chyflwyno cynigion sy'n ymdrin â sut y mae talu am ofal.

Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders

Alun Cairns: Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 35.6 a 35.8:

yn atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.2, er mwyn caniatáu i'r cynnig ar y gyllideb ddrafft gan y Llywodraeth gael ei wneud. (NDM4330)

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, datganaf fod y cynnig wedi'i dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

Alun Cairns: I move that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 35.6 and 35.8:

suspends Standing Order No. 27.2, to allow the motion in respect of the draft budget for the Government to be moved. (NDM4330)

The Presiding Officer: Does any Member object to the motion? I see that there are no objections. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, I therefore declare that the motion is agreed.

Y Gyllideb Ddrafft The Draft Budget

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Alun Cairns, a gwelliannau 7, 8, 9, 11 a 12 yn enw Peter Black. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.19(iii), ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 10.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the name of Alun Cairns, and amendments 7, 8, 9, 11 and 12 in the name of Peter Black. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.19(iii), amendment 10 has not been selected.

The Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery (Andrew Davies): I move that

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 27.6:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.6:

notes the draft budget for the financial year 2010-11 laid in the Table Office by the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery on 5 October 2009. (NDM4324)

yn nodi'r gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer blwyddyn ariannol 2010-11 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar 5 Hydref 2009. (NDM4324)

I welcome the opportunity to open the debate on the Assembly Government's draft budget proposals for 2010-11. Since the publication of the Government's draft proposals on 5 October, the Finance Committee, Assembly subject committees and other stakeholders have had the opportunity to examine these proposals in detail.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i agor y ddadl ynglŷn â chynigion cyllideb ddrafft Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2010-11. Ers cyhoeddi cynigion drafft y Llywodraeth ar 5 Hydref, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, pwyllgorau pwnc y Cynulliad a rhanddeiliaid eraill wedi cael y cyfle i archwilio'r cynigion hyn yn fanwl.

I welcome the detailed scrutiny carried out by the Finance Committee and other committees as an integral part of the budget process. I am pleased that the Finance Committee, and its Chair, has acknowledged my efforts to be helpful and constructive in the scrutiny process, and, in particular, I appreciate its comments regarding the 'massive strides' forward that we have made in budget presentation and subsequent scrutiny.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r craffu manwl gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid a phwyllgorau eraill fel rhan hanfodol o broses y gyllideb. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Cyllid, a'i Gadeirydd, wedi cydnabod fy ymdrechion i fod o gymorth ac yn adeiladol yn y broses graffu, ac yn benodol, yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi ei sylwadau am y 'camau enfawr' ymlaen yr ydym wedi'u gwneud wrth gyflwyno'r gyllideb ac wrth graffu wedyn.

I am aware that, last year, a number of Members felt that there was insufficient time for scrutiny and, although that is a matter for the Assembly and the Business Committee, I was glad to trial providing an extra week for scrutiny purposes and I hope that Members found that useful. I was also pleased to be

Gwn fod nifer o'r Aelodau'n teimlo y llynedd nad oedd digon o amser ar gyfer craffu, ac er mai mater i'r Cynulliad ac i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yw hynny, yr oeddwn yn falch o dreialu rhoi wythnos ychwanegol ar gyfer craffu a gobeithio bod yr Aelodau wedi cael hynny'n fuddiol. Yr oeddwn yn falch hefyd o

able to bring forward the tabling of the draft budget by a day.

I am pleased that the Finance Committee recognises that the restructuring of the budgets and the revised spending priority areas are part of a fundamental review that is not yet complete. It is, rather, a continuing process to ensure that budget figures are clear, consistent and comprehensible. I share the committee's aim of providing increased transparency within the scrutiny process, and will explore ways of improving transparency for the next draft budget scrutiny process.

The aim of this draft budget is to refine the previous indicative plans for 2010-11 to reflect recent UK fiscal decisions and the evolving global economic downturn. Overall, departmental revenue budgets will still increase by some £287 million between 2009-10 and 2010-11. That will enable us to protect and sustain the key public services that our citizens rely on, especially in the current difficult economic climate. However, the proposals that the draft budget contains do reflect the reductions from indicative plans in our overall budget arising from decisions at a UK level. We are living in challenging times and we have to make difficult decisions. I believe that we have faced up to this as a Government and have made strategic decisions in order to address the financial pressures arising from the global economic downturn. It is right that all departments should contribute to living within these tightening budgets. The draft budget outlines savings and further efficiencies of 1.6 per cent for all departmental near-cash revenue budgets. Through taking the difficult choices necessary to find these savings, we have also been able to create the opportunity to allocate new revenue funding strategically from reserves.

allu cyflwyno'r gyllideb ddrafft ddiwrnod yn gynharach.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn cydnabod bod ailstrwythuro'r cyllidebau a'r meysydd gwario â blaenoriaeth sydd wedi'u diwygio'n rhan o adolygiad sylfaenol nad yw wedi'i gwblhau hyd yn hyn. Yn hytrach, mae'n broses barhaus sicrhau bod ffigurau'r gyllideb yn glir, yn gyson ac yn ddealladwy. Yr wyf finnau'n cytuno â nod y pwyllgor sef sicrhau mwy o dryloywder yn y broses graffu, a byddaf yn ystyried sut y mae gwneud y broses graffu'n fwy tryloyw ar gyfer y gyllideb ddrafft nesaf.

Nod y gyllideb ddrafft hon yw mireinio'r cynlluniau dangosol blaenorol ar gyfer 2010-11 i adlewyrchu penderfyniadau ariannol y Deyrnas Unedig yn ddiweddar a'r dirywiad economaidd byd-eang wrth i hwnnw ddatblygu. Yn gyffredinol, bydd cyllidebau refeniw adrannol yn dal i gynyddu tua £287 miliwn rhwng 2009-10 a 2010-11. Bydd hynny'n ein galluogi i amddiffyn a chynnal y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol y mae ein dinasyddion yn dibynnu arnynt, yn enwedig yn yr hinsawdd economaidd anodd ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynigion sydd yn y gyllideb ddrafft yn adlewyrchu'r gostyngiadau ers y cynlluniau dangosol yn ein cyllideb gyffredinol sy'n codi o benderfyniadau a wneir ar lefel y DU. Yr ydym yn byw mewn cyfnod anodd ac mae'n rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau anodd. Credaf ein bod wedi wynebu hyn fel Llywodraeth a'n bod wedi gwneud penderfyniadau strategol er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r pwysau ariannol sy'n codi yn sgîl y dirywiad economaidd byd-eang. Mae'n iawn i bob adran gyfrannu at fyw o fewn y cyllidebau hyn sy'n crebachu. Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn sôn am 1.6 y cant o arbedion a champau effeithlonrwydd ychwanegol ar gyfer cyllidebau refeniw bron yn arian parod pob adran. Drwy wneud y penderfyniadau anodd y mae angen eu gwneud er mwyn gallu dod o hyd i'r arbedion hyn, yr ydym hefyd wedi gallu creu'r cyfle i ddyrannu arian refeniw newydd mewn ffordd strategol o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn.

Prioritisation for new strategic allocations has been given to measures that will counteract the economic challenges facing Wales. I am confident that this draft budget does respond to the challenges of the economic downturn. Furthermore, the Deputy First Minister is working hard on the Government's renewal programme to ensure that his department and other departments are best placed to face the challenges of the changed economy. One example of that is the specific new allocation of £4 million to support additional research and development work in collaboration with business. Other counter-recessionary measures include £20 million to tackle youth unemployment, to specifically avoid the creation of yet another lost generation.

In recognition of the particular pressures faced by local authorities, whose incomes are decreasing in difficult economic conditions, while the demand for their services is increasing, an additional allocation of £34 million has been given to the revenue support grant for local government across Wales. Although local authority funding also reflects the further efficiency savings referred to previously, this demonstrates the Assembly Government's commitment to working in partnership with local government through these challenging economic times. That is also why we have brought forward the monthly payment of revenue support grant by the Assembly Government by an average of five working days per month. That helps local councils to improve their cash flow and speeds up their ability to make prompt payments to suppliers. That is an important part of the Assembly Government's response to the current economic difficulties. The overall settlement for local government will rise by around 2.1 per cent in the next financial year. That is a similar uplift to the overall growth in budget allocations to the Assembly Government's departments.

Capital allocations reflect the impact of a £75

O ran dyraniadau strategol newydd, rhoddwyd y flaenoriaeth i fesurau a fydd yn gwrthweithio'r heriau economaidd sy'n wynebu Cymru. Yr wyf yn hyderus bod y gyllideb ddrafft hon yn ymateb i heriau'r dirywiad economaidd. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gweithio'n galed ar raglen adnewyddu'r Llywodraeth er mwyn sicrhau bod ei adran ac adrannau eraill yn y sefyllfa orau i wynebu heriau'r economi sydd wedi newid. Un enghraifft o hynny yw'r dyraniad newydd penodol o £4 miliwn i gefnogi ymchwil ychwanegol a gwaith datblygu drwy gydweithredu â byd busnes. Un o'r camau gwrth-ddirwasgiad eraill yw £20 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc, a hynny'n benodol er mwyn osgoi creu cenhedlaeth goll arall eto.

I gydnabod y pwysau penodol a wynebir gan awdurdodau lleol, a hwythau'n wynebu gostyngiad yn eu hincwm o dan amgylchiadau economaidd anodd, ar adeg pan mae'r galw am eu gwasanaethau'n cynyddu, rhoddwyd dyraniad ychwanegol o £34 miliwn at y grant cynnal refeniw ar gyfer llywodraeth leol ledled Cymru. Er bod arian i awdurdodau lleol hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd pellach y cyfeiriwyd atynt o'r blaen, mae hyn yn dangos ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i weithio mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol yn ystod y cyfnod economaidd anodd hwn. Dyna pam hefyd yr ydym wedi dwyn taliad misol y grant cynnal refeniw gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei flaen bum niwrnod gwaith y mis ar gyfartaledd. Mae hynny'n gymorth i gynghorau lleol wella'u llif arian ac yn golygu y gallant dalu i gyflenwyr yn brydlon yn gyflymach. Mae hynny'n rhan bwysig o ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r anawsterau economaidd presennol. Bydd y setliad cyffredinol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yn codi tua 2.1 y cant yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Mae hynny'n gynydd tebyg i'r twf cyffredinol yn nyraniadau'r gyllideb i adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Mae dyraniadau cyfalaf yn adlewyrchu

million reduction arising as a Barnett consequential from a cut in the UK Department of Health's capital budget. They also reflect our decision to accelerate around £120 million in capital projects from 2010-11 into this and last year, providing an important economic stimulus when it was needed most. This is not a cut, as some have tried to portray. Rather, it is that the money will be spent earlier, in this financial year rather than the next. Overall, this leaves us with a prudent level of reserves set at around 1 per cent for 2010-11 to meet unforeseen events and any emerging pressures. These reserves will be used to continue to respond flexibly to emerging economic events in a strategic way.

That is what we have done in 2009-10. For example, through the supplementary budget in July, around £27 million in revenue was allocated to the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills in respect of measures to support further education and training, including apprenticeships, ProAct, ReAct, SkillBuild and the young person's guarantee.

This is a Government that believes in partnership. Over the last year, through the economic summits, which were chaired by the First Minister, we have worked with our business and social partners and taken practical action to support individuals, businesses and communities through the current global economic difficulties. Only last month, we held the eighth of these economic summits, which endorse what I have called the 'Team Wales' approach, that is, a social partnership approach. That is yet another example of us, as a Government, supporting Welsh businesses and communities through the economic downturn.

3.40 p.m.

effaith gostyngiad o £75 miliwn sy'n codi fel swm canlyniadol Barnett yn sgîl toriad yng nghyllideb cyfalaf Adran Iechyd y Deyrnas Unedig. Maent yn adlewyrchu hefyd ein penderfyniad i ddwyn prosiectau cyfalaf gwerth tua £120 miliwn yn eu blaen o 2010-11 i'r llynedd ac eleni, gan roi sbardun economaidd o bwys pan oedd mwyaf o angen hynny. Nid toriad yw hwn, fel y mae rhai wedi ceisio'i bortreadu. Yn hytrach, caiff yr arian ei wario'n gynharach, yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, yn hytrach na'r flwyddyn nesaf. Yn gyffredinol, mae hyn yn golygu y bydd gennym lefel ddarbodus o arian wrth gefn, sef tua 1 y cant ar gyfer 2010-11 i ymateb i ddigwyddiadau annisgwyl ac unrhyw bwysau sy'n codi. Defnyddir y cronfeydd wrth gefn hyn er mwyn parhau i ymateb yn hyblyg mewn ffordd strategol i ddigwyddiadau economaidd sy'n codi.

Dyna yr ydym wedi'i wneud yn 2009-10. Er enghraifft, drwy'r gyllideb atodol ym mis Gorffennaf, dyrannwyd refeniw o tua £27 miliwn i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar gyfer camau i gefnogi addysg bellach a hyfforddiant, gan gynnwys prentisiaethau, ProAct, ReAct, Adeiladu Sgiliau a'r warant i bobl ifanc.

Llywodraeth sy'n credu mewn partneriaeth yw hon. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, drwy'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd, o dan gadeiryddiaeth y Prif Weinidog, yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda'n partneriaid busnes a'n partneriaid cymdeithasol ac wedi cymryd camau ymarferol i gynorthwyo unigolion, busnesau a chymunedau yn ystod yr anawsterau economaidd byd-eang. Y mis diwethaf, cynhaliwyd yr wythfed o'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd hyn, sy'n cadarnhau'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i alw'n ymagwedd 'Tim Cymru', sef, ymagwedd partneriaeth gymdeithasol. Dyna enghraifft arall eto fyth ohonom ni'r Llywodraeth yn cynorthwyo busnesau a chymunedau Cymru yn ystod y dirywiad economaidd.

In particular, we have already responded quickly to the skills needs of workers who are under threat of redundancy, or who have lost their jobs, through the ProAct programme and by enhancing ReAct and SkillBuild capacity. That has had a very real impact—so far, 143 companies have received ProAct offers of support, assisting nearly 7,300 workers. Participants in the ReAct programme reached over 11,800 by the end of September this year, and 810 new participants joined ReAct in the same month.

Looking forward, the profile of public expenditure in the UK is almost certainly going to be much more constrained than during the first 10 years of the Assembly's life. I intend to say more about this following the publication of the pre-budget report early next month, if possible. These are uncertain times, but, whatever the future may hold, we remain committed to partnership work. I have established the new invest-to-save fund to support front-line public services in Wales in achieving greater efficiencies, while continuing to deliver quality services and better outcomes for citizens.

I will now turn to consider some of the other issues that have been raised in the consultation process so far, and the amendments to the motion. I welcome the Finance Committee's report and the huge amount of work undertaken by all members. I am not proposing to provide a line by line response today, but a response to some of the key issues raised.

Members will know that, as I have already referred to in my speech this afternoon, a key priority for us as a Government in the current tough economic situation is to continue to stimulate and drive forward the Welsh economy. We have already brought forward capital projects of around £100 million into 2009-10 from 2010-11 to support the construction industry and the wider economy. The number of jobs created by this brought-

Yn benodol, yr ydym eisoes wedi ymateb yn gyflym i anghenion sgiliau gweithwyr y mae perygl iddynt gael eu gwneud yn ddi-waith, neu'r rhai sydd wedi colli eu gwaith, drwy raglen ProAct, a thrwy wella capasiti ReAct ac Adeiladu Sgiliau. Mae hynny wedi cael dylanwad gwirioneddol— hyd yn hyn, mae 143 o gwmnïau wedi cael cynnig cymorth o dan ProAct, gan gynorthwyo bron 7,300 o weithwyr. Cyrhaeddodd y nifer sy'n cymryd rhan yn rhaglen ReAct dros 11,800 erbyn diwedd mis Medi eleni, ac ymunodd 810 o gyfranogwyr newydd â ReAct yn yr un mis.

Wrth edrych tua'r dyfodol, mae proffil gwariant cyhoeddus yn y Deyrnas Unedig bron yn sicr o fod yn fwy cyfyngedig o lawer nag yn ystod 10 mlynedd cyntaf oes y Cynulliad. Bwriadaf ddweud rhagor am hyn ar ôl cyhoeddi'r adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol ddechrau'r mis nesaf, os oes modd. Mae'n gyfnod ansicr, ond beth bynnag a fydd gan y dyfodol i'w gynnig, yr ydym yn dal yn ymroddedig i waith partneriaeth. Yr wyf wedi sefydlu'r gronfa newydd, y gronfa buddsoddi i arbed, er mwyn cynorthwyo gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y rheng flaen yng Nghymru i arbed mwy drwy effeithlonrwydd, gan barhau i ddarparu gwasanaethau o safon a gwell canlyniadau i ddinasyddion.

Trof yn awr i ystyried rhai o'r materion eraill sydd wedi'u codi yn y broses ymgynghori hyd yn hyn, a'r gwelliannau i'r cynnig. Yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid a'r gwaith enfawr sydd wedi'i wneud gan bob aelod. Nid wyf yn bwriadu rhoi ateb fesul llinell heddiw, ond ymateb i rai o'r materion allweddol a godwyd.

Bydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod mai un o'r blaenoriaethau allweddol i ni'r Llywodraeth yn y sefyllfa economaidd anodd hon, ac yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio ati yn fy araith y prynhawn yma, yw ein bod yn parhau i ysgogi economi Cymru ac yn ei symbylu yn ei blaen. Yr ydym eisoes wedi dwyn prosiectau cyfalaf gwerth tua £100 miliwn ymlaen i 2009-10 o 2010-11 er mwyn cynorthwyo'r diwydiant adeiladu a'r economi

forward capital in 2009-10 is estimated to be nearly 2,000. I am pleased that the Finance Committee has acknowledged that this will provide a much-needed boost to the economy.

At the September meeting of the Joint Ministerial Committee, the First Minister, together with his opposite numbers in Scotland and Northern Ireland, made a request for capital expenditure to be brought forward from 2011-12 into 2010-11 to assist further in meeting the challenges of the recession. The outcome of this request will be known when the UK Government's pre-budget report is published early next month.

Announcements such as that on the second tranche of the strategic capital investment fund will provide a much-needed boost to the construction industry. I recently announced that around £120 million will be used to build new homes, to provide better schools and hospitals and to safeguard jobs in the next financial year.

As I mentioned earlier, the final budget will enable us to continue our counter-recessionary partnership work through, for example, tackling youth unemployment and investing in key public services, and an additional allocation of £34 million to the revenue support grant will aid that effort considerably.

To secure the new, enhanced relationship with local government, my local government ministerial colleague, Brian Gibbons, is negotiating a national framework of outcome agreements that reflect priorities for delivery of services and performance at a local authority level. He intends to have these agreements in place before the start of the 2010-11 financial year. In addition, in our health and social services budget, a specific new allocation of £50 million has been made in recognition of the significant pressures that NHS organisations are facing, and which the

ehangach. Drwy ddwyn y cyfalaf hwn ymlaen yn 2009-10, amcangyfrifir bod bron 2,000 o swyddi wedi'u creu. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi cydnabod y bydd hyn yn rhoi hwb y mae angen mawr amdano i'r economi.

Yng nghyfarfod Cydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion ym mis Medi, gofynnodd y Prif Weinidog, ynghyd â'r rhai sy'n cyfateb iddo yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, am gael dwyn gwariant cyfalaf ymlaen o 2011-12 i 2010-11 er mwyn cynorthwyo eto i ymateb i heriau'r dirwasgiad. Cawn wybod beth fydd canlyniad y cais hwn pan gyhoeddir adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ddechrau'r mis nesaf.

Bydd cyhoeddiadau megis hwnnw am ail gyfran y gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol yn rhoi hwb y mae angen mawr amdano i'r diwydiant adeiladu. Cyhoeddais yn ddiweddar y defnyddir tua £120 miliwn i godi tai newydd, i ddarparu gwell ysgolion ac ysbytai ac i ddiogelu swyddi yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

Fel y crybwyllais yn gynharach, bydd y gyllideb derfynol yn ein galluogi i barhau â'n gwaith partneriaeth gwrth-ddirwasgiad, er enghraifft drwy fynd i'r afael â diweithdra pobl ifanc a buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol, a bydd dyraniad ychwanegol o £34 miliwn i'r grant cynnal refeniw yn gymorth sylweddol i'r ymdrech honno.

Er mwyn sicrhau'r berthynas newydd, gryfach â llywodraeth leol, mae fy nghyd-Weinidog dros lywodraeth leol, Brian Gibbons, yn negodi fframwaith cenedlaethol o gytundebau canlyniadau sy'n adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau a pherfformiad ar lefel awdurdod lleol. Mae'n bwriadu i'r cytundebau hyn fod ar waith cyn dechrau blwyddyn ariannol 2010-11. Yn ogystal â hyn, yn ein cyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, cafwyd dyraniad newydd penodol o £50 miliwn i gydnabod y pwysau

reorganisation was designed to tackle, and also to support increases in demand for health services as a result of reductions in waiting times.

I believe that this draft budget provides the investment needed to continue to implement the 'One Wales' agenda despite the current challenging economic climate. It helps to protect and improve the public services that we believe make a real difference to the lives of the people of Wales. I commend the draft budget proposals to Members this afternoon.

Angela Burns: It gives me great pleasure to respond on behalf of the Finance Committee in this debate on the Government's draft budget.

Before I get into the detail of our thoughts, I would like to acknowledge the hard work and co-operation of a number of individuals. John Grimes and his clerking team, and the researchers, led by Eleanor Roy and Martin Jennings, put a great many hours into supporting the committee, often outside business hours. The deadlines—more of which later—were tight, and the committee held a number of additional informal and formal meetings, which these staff supported. We all appreciate their efforts.

I also thank the Minister and his team for appearing before the Finance Committee on no fewer than three occasions, one of which was at short notice. I know that the Minister is a busy man, and that this is a busy time of year. I thank Dr Christine Daws, the director of general finance, for giving a presentation seminar for Assembly Members and their staff in advance of the draft budget being laid. I acknowledge the quick response of the Assembly's various scrutiny committees and the willingness of witnesses to come to give what was often extremely detailed evidence.

sylweddol a wynebir gan sefydliadau'r GIG, pwysau y bwriadwyd i'r ad-drefnu fynd i'r afael â hwy, a hefyd i gynorthwyo gyda'r cynnydd yn y galw am wasanaethau iechyd yn sgîl lleihau amseroedd aros.

Credaf fod y gyllideb ddrafft hon yn cynnig y buddsoddiad y mae ei angen er mwyn parhau i roi agenda 'Cymru'n Un' ar waith, er gwaethaf yr hinsawdd economaidd anodd ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n helpu i amddiffyn a gwella'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd, yn ein barn ni, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i fywydau pobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r gyllideb ddrafft i'r Aelodau y prynhawn yma.

Angela Burns: Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf ymateb ar ran y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn y ddatl hon ynglŷn â chyllideb ddrafft y Llywodraeth.

Cyn imi fanylu ynglŷn â'n meddyliau, hoffwn gydnabod gwaith caled a chydweithrediad nifer o unigolion. Treuliodd John Grimes a'i dîm o glercod, a'r ymchwilyr dan arweiniad Eleanor Roy a Martin Jennings, oriau bwygilydd yn cynorthwyo'r pwyllgor, yn aml y tu allan i oriau busnes. Yr oedd yr amserlen—a chawn glywed mwy am hynny'n ddiweddarach—yn dynn, a chynhaliodd y pwyllgor nifer o gyfarfodydd anffurfiol a ffurfiol ychwanegol, gyda chymorth yr aelodau hyn o'r staff. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwerthfawrogi eu hymdrechion.

Diolch hefyd i'r Gweinidog a'i dîm am ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyllid gynifer â thair gwaith, ac un o'r troeon hynny heb fawr o rybudd. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ddyn prysur a bod yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn yn un brysur. Diolch i'r Dr Christine Daws, y cyfarwyddwr cyllid cyffredinol, am roi cyflwyniad mewn seminar i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'u staff cyn gosod y gyllideb ddrafft. Yr wyf yn cydnabod ymateb cyflym amrywiol bwyllgorau craffu'r Cynulliad a pharodrwydd tystion i ddod i roi tystiolaeth a honno'n aml yn eithriadol o fanwl.

Timing remains a major problem, however, and while we acknowledge the additional week allocated this year, it was simply not sufficient to examine the draft budget, particularly in the difficult circumstances that Wales currently faces. This is it, quite simply, because in an open and democratic Assembly, it is important that the Government's proposals are subject to critical and careful scrutiny. The Finance Committee takes this mandate most seriously. It is part of our remit under Starting Orders, and I beg leave to reiterate the four principles of scrutiny under which all legislatures of the United Kingdom are urged to operate by the Centre for Public Scrutiny. They are that scrutiny

Mae'r amseru'n dal yn broblem fawr, fodd bynnag, ac er ein bod yn cydnabod bod wythnos ychwanegol wedi'i neilltuo eleni, nid oedd yn ddigon inni archwilio'r gyllideb ddrafft, yn enwedig o dan yr amgylchiadau anodd y mae Cymru'n eu hwynebu ar hyn o bryd. Dyna ni'n syml, oherwydd mewn Cynulliad agored a democrataidd, mae'n bwysig i graffu beirniadol a gofalus ddirgwydd ar gynigion y Llywodraeth. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ystyried y mandad hwn o ddifrif go iawn. Mae'n rhan o'n cylch gorchwyl o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog a hoffwn ailadrodd y pedair egwyddor yn ymwneud â chraffu y mae pob deddfwrfa yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn cael ei hannog i'w rhoi ar waith gan y Ganolfan Craffu Cyhoeddus, sef, bod craffu

'provides 'critical friend' challenge to executive policy-makers and decision-makers... enables the voice and concerns of the public and its communities... is carried out by 'independent minded governors' who lead and own the scrutiny process... drives improvement in public services'.

yn herio llunwyr polisiau a phenderfynwyr gweithredol, fel 'cyfaill beirniadol'...yn galluogi llais a phryderon y cyhoedd a'i gymunedau...yn cael ei wneud gan 'lywodraethwyr annibynnol eu meddwl' sy'n arwain y broses graffu ac yn berchen arni...yn sbarduno gwelliant mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.46 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.46 p.m.*

Wales faces many challenges in coming out of a major recession, and this year's budget involved a series of complex and difficult issues. I think it fair to say that the Finance Committee's report on the draft budget has probably been one of the most difficult to produce, and it is among the most carefully considered. I am proud that the committee has worked well in bringing together some strongly held views, and I thank each and every committee member for his or her analysis, contribution and time.

Mae Cymru'n wynebu sawl her wrth gamu o ddirwasgiad mawr, ac yr oedd amryw o faterion cymhleth ac anodd yn gysylltiedig â'r gyllideb eleni. Credaf ei bod yn deg dweud bod adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar y gyllideb ddrafft wedi bod gyda'r anoddaf i'w lunio mae'n debyg, ac mae ymhlith y rhai a drafodwyd yn fwyaf gofalus. Yr wyf yn falch bod y pwyllgor wedi gweithio'n dda wrth ddod â safbwyntiau cryfion ynghyd, ac yr wyf yn diolch i bob un o aelodau'r pwyllgor am ei ddadansoddiad, ei gyfraniad a'i amser.

I have already said that the budget has been presented at a difficult time for Wales in the wake of a dramatic rise in UK public sector borrowing and in the face of an uncertain future public spending environment. The most recent comprehensive spending review was in 2007, and until the next one is

Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud bod y gyllideb wedi cael ei chyflwyno ar adeg anodd i Gymru yn sgîl y cynnydd dramatig yn lefelau benthyca sector cyhoeddus y DU ac yn wyneb ansicrwydd ynghylch patrymau gwario cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol. Yn 2007 y cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr

scheduled, we face a lack of clarity in a great many financial issues. Planning and budgeting forward are therefore increasingly subject to assumptions and expectations. The overwhelming body of evidence received by the Finance Committee was that some tough decisions will be needed to determine priorities.

It is the Finance Committee's view that the Government's budget is the single most important expression of the Government's priorities for the coming year. It is the way in which Ministers' plans and priorities are given substance for the coming 12 months. The starting point for this year's budget should therefore be the major recession from which we are emerging and the tight fiscal environment. The priorities facing Wales is to rebuild the economy, to improve and develop skills and to encourage investment. While the Finance Committee acknowledges the actions that have been taken, the Finance Committee cannot avoid the conclusion that the Government has not made any significant change to its baseline budget in response to the recession. Essentially, the draft budget largely rolls forward the spending patterns of the last couple of years and, faced with the need to make efficiency savings, applies them across the board—equal shares for all, except further and higher education, however, which is mandated to make savings of 5 per cent. Surely, if we are to drive the Welsh economy out of recession, and if we are to transform it into a knowledge and skills-based economy, putting more pressure on further and higher education than on any other portfolio does not support this objective.

The Minister for finance told the Finance Committee that the major strategic priority for the Government is the delivery of the 'One Wales' agreement, and that the strategic priorities for delivering it were made back in the 2007 budget. The committee does not have a view on the Government's priorities, but given that Wales is coming out of a major

diwethaf o wariant, ac yr ydym yn wynebu diffyg eglurder gyda nifer fawr o faterion ariannol nes trefnir y nesaf. Felly, rhaid dibynnu fwyfwy ar dybiaethau a disgwyliadau wrth gynllunio a chyllidebu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o lawer o'r dystiolaeth a ddaeth i law'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn dangos y bydd angen gwneud penderfyniadau anodd er mwyn pennu blaenoriaethau.

Ym marn y Pwyllgor Cyllid, cyllideb y Llywodraeth yw'r un prif beth sy'n dangos blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer y flwyddyn sydd i ddod. Dyna sut y rhoddir sylwedd i gynlluniau a blaenoriaethau Gweinidogion yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf. Felly, y dirwasgiad mawr yr ydym yn camu ohono a'r sefyllfa gyllidol anodd a ddylai fod yn fan cychwyn wrth lunio'r gyllideb eleni. Y blaenoriaethau i Gymru yw ailadeiladu'r economi, gwella a datblygu sgiliau ac annog buddsoddi. Er bod y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn cydnabod y camau sydd wedi'u cymryd, ni all osgoi'r casgliad nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi newid ei chyllideb sylfaen yn sylweddol er mwyn ymateb i'r dirwasgiad. Yn ei hanfod, mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn bwrw ymlaen â phatrymau gwario'r ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, ac o wynebu'r ffaith bod angen gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd, yn eu rhoi ar waith yn y gyllideb drwyddi draw—yr un faint i bawb, ac eithrio addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, lle y bydd yn rhaid arbed 5 y cant. Os ydym am roi hwb i economi Cymru er mwyn camu o'r dirwasgiad a throir economi'n un sydd wedi'i seilio ar wybodaeth a sgiliau, go brin bod rhoi addysg bellach ac addysg uwch o dan fwy o bwysau na phob portffolio arall yn gymorth i gyflawni'r amcan hwn.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros gyllid wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid mai blaenoriaeth strategol fawr y Llywodraeth yw gwireddu cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', a bod y blaenoriaethau strategol ar gyfer gwneud hynny wedi'u cynnwys yng nghyllideb 2007. Nid oes gan y pwyllgor farn am flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth, ond o ystyried bod Cymru'n

recession, and given the tight public expenditure restrictions ahead, the Finance Committee finds it difficult to understand how the same priorities will be deliverable by simply rolling forward the same patterns of expenditure. The view of the Finance Committee is that unless a much greater priority is given to driving the economy forward out of the recession, the Government will face serious difficulties in delivering these objectives.

3.50 p.m.

The Minister for finance stressed to the committee the various actions that the Government has taken to boost the economy. In his evidence to the Finance Committee, the Minister pointed to a range of programmes that will support the development of the economy, and the Finance Committee welcomes these. The committee also noted that the economy will be supported by other Government programmes and European funding, which the committee also welcomes. However, given the wide range of programmes and funding sources that support the economy, the committee is concerned about the lack of clarity in relation to the development of the economy. It has asked the Government for a clear statement of expenditure on economic development. It has also asked for a clear understanding of how the Government monitors the performance of the economy in the light of such a diverse range of programmes.

As I have already stated, the Finance Committee is deeply concerned that the further and higher education sector will be required to make a 5 per cent efficiency saving next year, compared with across-the-board savings of 1.6 per cent. The Minister for finance pointed to other programmes that will support this sector, but, in the time available, the committee was not able to examine this fully. It therefore plans to make this the subject of an urgent committee inquiry.

The committee raised a number of other

camu o ddirwasgiad mawr, ac o gofio am y cyfyngiadau tyn ar wariant cyhoeddus sydd i ddod, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ei chael yn anodd deall sut y caiff yr un blaenoriaethau eu cyflawni drwy wneud dim ac eithrio bwrw ymlaen â'r un patrymau gwario. Oni roddir blaenoriaeth fwy o lawer ar roi hwb i'r economi gamu o'r dirwasgiad, barn y Pwyllgor Cyllid yw y bydd y Llywodraeth yn wynebu anawsterau mawr wrth geisio cyflawni'r amcanion hyn.

Pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog dros gyllid wrth y pwyllgor y camau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi eu cymryd er mwyn rhoi hwb i'r economi. Yn ei dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at amrywiaeth o raglenni a fydd yn gymorth i ddatblygu'r economi, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn croesawu'r rhain. Mae'r pwyllgor hefyd yn derbyn y bydd yr economi'n cael cymorth drwy raglenni eraill sydd gan y Llywodraeth a thrwy gyllid Ewropeaidd, ac mae'n croesawu hynny hefyd. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried yr amrywiaeth eang o raglenni a'r ffynonellau ariannu sy'n gefn i'r economi, mae'r pwyllgor yn pryderu ynghylch y diffyg eglurder o ran datblygu'r economi. Mae wedi gofyn i'r Llywodraeth am ddatganiad clir am wariant ar ddatblygu economaidd. Mae wedi gofyn hefyd am wybodaeth glir ynghylch sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn monitro perfformiad yr economi tra mae ganddi amrywiaeth mor eang o raglenni.

Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn pryderu'n fawr y bydd gofyn i'r sector addysg bellach ac addysg uwch ganfod arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant y flwyddyn nesaf, o gymharu hynny â'r arbedion o 1.6 y cant yn gyffredinol. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog dros gyllid at raglenni eraill a fydd yn cynorthwyo'r sector hwn, ond nid oedd modd i'r pwyllgor edrych yn llawn ar hyn yn yr amser a oedd ar gael. Felly, mae'n bwriadu gwneud hyn yn destun ymchwiliad pwyllgor brys.

Cododd y pwyllgor nifer o faterion eraill yn

issues in its report. The Government has brought forward capital expenditure from 2010-11 to 2008-09 and 2009-10 in order to boost the economy. This sounds a welcome development, but the committee raised concerns about whether there is the necessary capacity within the building industry to respond to this. We have asked for assurances on this. The committee also highlighted the concern that if capital investment is brought forward into the current year, it risks leaving a gap in 2010-11. While the Minister assured us that there have been talks about bringing forward expenditure from 2011-12, these are, as yet, inconclusive, and there are many uncertainties ahead.

Leanne Wood: Will you take an intervention?

Angela Burns: Certainly.

Leanne Wood: Thank you very much. There are political differences in the way in which the recession and cuts should be managed, and the Assembly Government believes that public services and public jobs should be protected, which is why money is being brought forward from future years. However, some public bodies plan to cut around 10 per cent, because they know that while this year is okay, there will be big squeezes in future years. If the Tories win the next Westminster election, there are fears that there will be savage cuts in the middle of a financial year. Your counterparts in Westminster—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is a speech. We want short and sharp interventions.

Leanne Wood: May I ask the Member a question?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: One question.

Leanne Wood: Your counterparts in

ei adroddiad. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu dwyn gwariant cyfalaf ymlaen o 2010-11 i 2008-09 ac i 2009-10 er mwyn rhoi hwb i'r economi. Mae'n ymddangos bod hyn yn ddatblygiad i'w groesawu, ond yr oedd y pwyllgor yn pryderu a yw'r capasiti angenrheidiol yn y diwydiant adeiladu i ymateb i hyn. Yr ydym wedi gofyn am sicrwydd ynghylch hyn. Pwysleisiodd y pwyllgor hefyd ei bryder bod perygl y bydd bwch yn 2010-11 os dygir y buddsoddiad cyfalaf ymlaen i'r flwyddyn hon. Rhoddodd y Gweinidog sicrwydd inni fod trafodaethau wedi'u cynnal ynghylch dwyn gwariant ymlaen o 2011-12, ond hyd yma, nid oes dim pendant wedi'i benderfynu ac mae llawer o ansicrwydd o'n blaenau.

Leanne Wood: A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

Angela Burns: Gwnaf, wrth gwrs.

Leanne Wood: Diolch yn fawr ichi. Mae gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol yn y modd y dylid rheoli'r dirwasgiad a thoriadau, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn credu y dylid diogelu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a swyddi cyhoeddus. Dyna pam mae arian yn cael ei ddwyn ymlaen o'r blynyddoedd sydd i ddod. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai cyrff cyhoeddus yn bwriadu torri tua 10 y cant, oherwydd er bod modd ymdopi eleni, maent yn gwybod y bydd pethau'n dynnach o lawer yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod. Os bydd y Ceidwadwyr yn ennill etholiad nesaf San Steffan, mae pobl yn poeni y bydd toriadau ciaidd yng nghanol y flwyddyn ariannol. Mae eich cymheiriaid yn San Steffan—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Araith yw hon. Yr ydym am gael ymyriadau byr a chryno.

Leanne Wood: A gaf ofyn cwestiwn i'r Aelod?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Un cwestiwn.

Leanne Wood: Dywedodd eich cymheiriaid

Westminster said that they will protect the health and international development budget, but can you guarantee that a future Conservative Government will protect the budget of the Assembly? If not, all the amendments that you have tabled to the debate—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I am sorry, but your microphone has been switched off. That is not relevant to this debate.

Angela Burns: I am speaking as the Chair of the Finance Committee, and this is the report of the Finance Committee. For those of you who may not be aware of it, the Finance Committee is a cross-party committee. There may have been differences within the committee, but we have resolved them and produced a report. I am speaking as the Chair of the committee, which is something that Plaid Cymru may wish to remember.

The Finance Committee also raised questions about the operation of the strategic capital investment framework, particularly the claims by Ministers that they will be making bids for funding from this and other European funding. The Finance Committee noted that a number of Ministers seem to be using this as a source of funding for main policy initiatives, and that the effect of this seems to be to place the decisions on whether these initiatives go ahead outside the control of the appropriate Minister.

We also noted that capital investment does not stand in isolation from the policies and programmes to which it is contributing, and that capital investment must be considered in tandem with the corresponding revenue streams. If this is not the case, there is a risk of substantial investment being made to put assets in place but with no funding for staff or running costs to allow them to be used. The Finance Committee will consider these and related issues as part of a future committee inquiry.

yn San Steffan y byddant yn diogelu'r gyllideb iechyd a'r gyllideb datblygu rhyngwladol, ond a allwch sicrhau y bydd Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn y dyfodol yn diogelu cyllideb y Cynulliad? Oni wnaiff hynny, mae'r holl welliannau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno i'r ddadl—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae eich microffon wedi'i ddiffodd. Nid yw hynny'n berthnasol i'r ddadl hon.

Angela Burns: Yr wyf yn siarad fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ac adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid yw hwn. Os nad ydych yn ymwybodol o hynny, pwyllgor trawsbleidiol yw'r Pwyllgor Cyllid. Efallai fod anghytuno wedi bod yn y pwyllgor, ond cafodd hynny ei ddatrys ac yr ydym wedi llunio adroddiad. Yr wyf yn siarad fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, ac efallai y dylai Plaid Cymru gofio hynny.

Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn pryderu hefyd ynghylch y modd y defnyddir y fframwaith buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, ac yn enwedig yr honiadau gan Weinidogion y byddant yn gwneud ceisiadau am gyllid gan hyn a chan gyllid Ewropeaidd arall. Nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid ei bod yn ymddangos bod nifer o Weinidogion yn defnyddio hyn fel ffynhonnell arian ar gyfer eu prif gynlluniau polisi, ac mae'n ymddangos mai effaith hyn yw mai pobl eraill, yn hytrach na'r Gweinidog priodol, sy'n penderfynu a yw'r cynlluniau hyn yn mynd yn eu blaenau ai peidio.

Nodwyd hefyd nad yw buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn rhywbeth sydd ar wahân i'r polisiau a'r rhaglenni y mae'n cyfrannu atynt, a bod yn rhaid ystyried y buddsoddiad cyfalaf law yn llaw â'r ffrydiau refeniw cyfatebol. Oni wneir hyn, mae perygl y bydd buddsoddi sylweddol yn digwydd er mwyn sefydlu asedau ond heb gyllid ar gyfer y staff a'r costau cynnal i ganiatáu iddynt gael eu defnyddio. Bydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ystyried y materion hyn a materion cysylltiedig fel rhan o ymchwiliad gan y pwyllgor yn y dyfodol.

Another key issue in our report relates to efficiency savings. I have already touched on this subject, which will become increasingly important in the next few years, and which forms an integral part of the Government's financial plans for next year. The committee noted that the auditor general has raised concerns about the extent to which claimed efficiency savings are being delivered in practice.

We also noted that the Government does not accept this view and gave a robust and comprehensive rebuttal. The Finance Committee looks forward to receiving evidence in support of both sets of conclusions in due course. Meanwhile, it has called on the Government to include, as part of its budget proposals each year, reports on the efficiency savings that have been delivered and a breakdown of achievements by the NHS, local government and other public sector organisations.

The largest element of expenditure is on the NHS, which accounts for over one third of the total budget. One particular area of concern that was highlighted by witnesses from the NHS is that some 20 per cent of the total health budget—some £1 billion per year—was not being used appropriately. The causes were complex and should not be seen as all waste and poor management. This is also a headline figure and the committee accepts that a more effective redeployment of £1 billion could not be achieved overnight. We are also keen to see the extent of the savings that will be achieved by the reconfiguration of the NHS trusts and the local health boards. On the other hand, the Finance Committee is surprised that addressing this issue of the £1 billion is not the No. 1 priority of the NHS. The committee also noted that £50 million has not been allocated within the health and social services budget. It expressed a desire to know what the intended purpose is for this sum and the rationale behind it currently being unallocated.

Mae mater allweddol arall yn ein hadroddiad yn ymwneud ag arbedion effeithlonrwydd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at y pwnc hwn, a fydd yn dod yn bwysicach ac yn bwysicach yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf, ac sy'n rhan ganolog o gynlluniau ariannol y Llywodraeth ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Nododd y pwyllgor fod yr archwilydd cyffredinol wedi mynegi pryder ynghylch i ba raddau y mae'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd honedig yn cael eu gweithredu mewn gwirionedd.

Nodwyd hefyd nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn y farn hon a'i bod wedi gwadu hynny'n gadarn ac yn llwyr. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn edrych ymlaen at gael tystiolaeth i gyd-fynd â'r ddwy set o gasgliadau maes o law. Yn y cyfamser, mae wedi galw ar y Llywodraeth i gynnwys, fel rhan o'i chynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb bob blwyddyn, adroddiadau am yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd sydd wedi'u sicrhau a manylion yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gan y GIG, llywodraeth leol a chyrrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Mae'r gwariant mwyaf ar y GIG, a thros draean yr holl gyllideb yn mynd i'r perwyl hwnnw. Un peth penodol y cyfeiriodd y tystion o'r GIG ato sy'n peri pryder iddynt yw'r ffaith nad yw tuag 20 y cant o gyfanswm y gyllideb iechyd—tua £1 biliwn y flwyddyn—yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n briodol. Yr oedd y rhesymau dros hyn yn gymhleth ac ni ddylid credu mai gwastraff a rheoli gwael sy'n gyfrifol am y cyfan. Mae hwn yn ffigur sy'n cipio'r penawdau ac mae'r pwyllgor yn derbyn na ellid ailddosbarthu £1 biliwn er mwyn ei ddefnyddio'n fwy effeithlon dros nos. Yr ydym hefyd yn awyddus i wybod maint yr arbedion a sicrheir drwy ad-drefnu ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Ar y llaw arall, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn synnu nad rhoi sylw i'r £1 biliwn yw prif flaenoriaeth y GIG. Nododd y pwyllgor hefyd fod £50 miliwn heb ei ddyrannu o fewn y gyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Hoffai wybod at ba ddiben y caiff y swm hwn ei ddefnyddio a'r rhesymeg dros beidio â'i ddyrannu ar hyn o bryd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you wind up, please?

Angela Burns: My final point is that the Finance Committee acknowledges the additional sums that the Government has put into various schemes to help people and businesses. This is one of our key roles. We understand that the Government may have found our report difficult reading. We have asked searching questions about key areas and priorities. We believe that we have discharged our responsibility to deliver honest and evidence-based scrutiny and we look forward to receiving the considered response of the Government in due course.

Nick Ramsay: I move the following amendments in the name of Alun Cairns. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the draft budget does not adequately reflect the challenges facing Wales in an economic recession.

Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that the draft budget does not make any progress towards addressing the funding gap in education and skills between England and Wales.

Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the local government main expenditure group is inadequate and may result in council tax rises or reductions in front-line public services.

Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes the Welsh Assembly Government should have provided greater financial support for economic development within the draft budget.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Angela Burns: Fy mhwynt olaf yw bod y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn cydnabod y symiau ychwanegol y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u rhoi ar gyfer cynlluniau gwahanol er mwyn helpu pobl a busnesau. Dyna un o'n prif rolau. Deallwn nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi mwynhau darllen ein hadroddiad efallai. Yr ydym wedi gofyn cwestiynau dyrys ynghylch meysydd a blaenoriaethau allweddol. Credwn ein bod wedi cyflawni'n dyletswydd i graffu'n onest ac ar sail tystiolaeth, ac edrychwn ymlaen at glywed ymateb ystyriol y Llywodraeth maes o law.

Nick Ramsay: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Alun Cairns. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu nad yw'r gyllideb ddrafft yn ystyried yn ddigonol y sialensiau sy'n wynebu Cymru mewn dirwasgiad economaidd.

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi nad yw'r gyllideb ddrafft yn gwneud unrhyw gynnydd tuag at fynd i'r afael â'r bwch cyllido rhwng Cymru a Lloegr ym maes addysg a sgiliau.

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod y prif grŵp gwariant llywodraeth leol yn annigonol ac y gall arwain at godi'r dreth gyngor neu gwtogi ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus rheng flaen.

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod wedi rhoi mwy o gymorth ariannol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yn y gyllideb ddrafft.

Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to re-draft this budget in order to address the financial pressures arising from the economic downturn.

Amendment 6: add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that after 10 Assembly Government budgets, Wales remains the poorest part of the UK.

I am grateful to be called to contribute to this important debate today. As my colleague, Angela Burns, Chair of the Finance Committee said, this is perhaps the greatest expression of the Government's aims throughout the year, so it is an incredibly important debate. At the start, I also thank the Minister for the number of times that he appeared before the committee and for the seminar that was arranged by him and his officers for both AMs and support staff. I know that that has not happened in previous years, and it was enormously helpful to all of us involved in the process.

At the outset of my contribution, I would like to make clear that the opposition will not be supporting this budget because we do not believe that it adequately reflects or meets the challenges facing Wales in this economic recession. It fails to do so on a number of key fronts. In many areas, across a whole range of portfolios, budgets have been cut and some of the decisions that have been taken are nothing short of bizarre.

Our amendments highlight our key areas of concern. This draft budget fails to make any progress towards addressing the funding gap in education and skills between England and Wales. That gap remains significant and is growing. We all know of the pressures that are facing our schools and higher education

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ailddrafftio'r gyllideb hon er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r pwysau ariannol sy'n deillio o'r dirywiad economaidd.

Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu mai Cymru yw rhan dlotaf y DU o hyd ar ôl 10 cyllideb gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar o gael fy ngalw i gyfrannu at y ddadl bwysig hon heddiw. Fel y dywedodd Angela Burns, fy nghyd-Aelod a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid, efallai mai dyma'r mynegiant mwyaf o amcanion y Llywodraeth drwy gydol y flwyddyn, felly mae'n ddadl hynod bwysig. Ar y dechrau, diolchaf hefyd i'r Gweinidog am ymddangos gerbron y pwyllgor sawl gwaith ac am y seminar a drefnwyd ganddo ef a'i swyddogion ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'u staff cymorth. Gwn nad yw hyn wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol, ac yr oedd yn hynod o ddefnyddiol i bawb sy'n rhan o'r broses.

Ar ddechrau fy nghyfraniad, hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir na fydd yr wrthblaid yn cefnogi'r gyllideb hon gan nad ydym yn credu ei bod yn adlewyrchu'n ddigonol yr heriau sy'n wynebu Cymru yn ystod y dirwasgiad economaidd hwn nac ychwaith yn ymateb iddynt. Nid yw'n gwneud hynny mewn sawl ffordd allweddol. Mewn nifer o feysydd, ar draws ystod eang o bortffolios, mae cyllidebau wedi'u torri ac mae rhai o'r penderfyniadau sydd wedi'u gwneud yn rhyfedd a dweud y lleiaf.

Mae ein gwelliannau'n pwysleisio ein prif bryderon. Nid yw'r gyllideb ddrafft hon yn gwneud cynnydd tuag at fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyllido mewn addysg a sgiliau rhwng Lloegr a Chymru. Mae'r bwlch hwnnw'n sylweddol o hyd, ac mae'n tyfu. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod bod ein hysgolion a'n

institutions—we have held many debates in the Chamber discussing those problems and the need to create a more even playing field between Wales and England. Education should be the Government's key priority and yet the sector is facing huge cuts to capital budgets and a real-term revenue cut of 0.6 per cent. At the same time, the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills is required to find a 5 per cent efficiency saving. This is at a time when the average efficiency saving is 1.6 per cent, as was mentioned by the Chair of the Finance Committee—a concern that I am grateful to the Liberal Democrats for referring to in one of their amendments, which we will be supporting. Efficiency savings are right, and they are needed at this time, but I cannot fathom why education has been identified in this way. How can this be the right policy at this time when we are seeking to lead Wales out of recession?

I will be frank: the Government appears to say some plausible things—I will be generous to the Minister in that regard. He talks a great deal about the need to put in place the necessary policies to drive Wales out of recession.

4.00 p.m.

I have heard the Minister himself and, indeed, the First Minister speak of the need to grow the economy out of recession, and I agree with them. However, if you buy into that view, you should see economic development as a key area in which economic growth can be achieved. You would therefore expect the economic development and transport budget to feature prominently in this budget, yet it does not. Why not? Let us look at—

Joyce Watson: Will you take an intervention?

Nick Ramsay: I will, Joyce.

sefydliadau addysg uwch o dan bwysau—yr ydym wedi cynnal llawer o ddadleuon yn y Siambr yn trafod y problemau hyn a'r angen i wneud pethau'n fwy cytbwys rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Dylai addysg fod yn brif flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth, ac eto mae'r sector yn wynebu toriadau anferth mewn cyllidebau cyfalaf a thoriad o 0.6 y cant mewn termau real yn ei refeniw. Ar yr un pryd, mae'n ofynnol i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ganfod arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant, er mai 1.6 y cant yw'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd ar gyfartaledd, fel y dywedodd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid—ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyfeirio at y pryder hwn yn un o'u gwelliannau, a byddwn yn cefnogi hwnnw. Mae'n iawn gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd, ac mae angen eu gwneud ar hyn o bryd, ond ni allaf ddirnad pam mae addysg wedi'i dargedu yn y fath fodd. Sut y gall hwn fod yn bolisi cywir a ninnau'n ceisio arwain Cymru o ddirwasgiad?

Siaradaf yn blaen: mae'n ymddangos bod y Llywodraeth yn dweud rhai pethau creadadwy—byddaf yn hael â'r Gweinidog yn hynny o beth. Mae'n sôn cryn dipyn am yr angen i roi'r polisïau angenrheidiol ar waith er mwyn rhoi hwb i Gymru gamu o'r dirwasgiad.

Yr wyf wedi clywed y Gweinidog ei hun ac, yn wir, y Prif Weinidog yn dweud bod angen i'r economi dyfu o'r dirwasgiad, a chytunaf â hwy. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn cytuno â hynny, dylech weld datblygu economaidd yn faes allweddol er mwyn sicrhau twf yn yr economi. Felly, byddech yn disgwyl i'r gyllideb ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth fod yn rhan amlwg o'r gyllideb hon, ond nid yw. Pam hynny? Gadewch inni edrych ar—

Joyce Watson: A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

Nick Ramsay: Gwnaf, Joyce.

Joyce Watson: Thank you. I have been following what you have said so far. What you seem to have been doing up to this point is pointing out where we are cutting everything, and saying that you oppose the budget because of that. Could you tell us exactly how you are going to pay for those cuts not to be made, and how you are going to sustain your argument to the end?

Nick Ramsay: Thank you for that contribution, Joyce. I am stating where we disagree with cuts that are being made. I will come later to where I think reprioritisation could happen.

Let us look at the figures. The economic development and transport portfolio is to be hit with a 0.8 per cent reduction in its revenue budget and a 13.6 per cent reduction in its capital in real terms. The Minister spoke at length about schemes such as ReAct and ProAct, and these have been welcomed and have done good things to address some of the problems facing our businesses. However, as I mentioned earlier in my questions to the First Minister, even in these schemes, there have been anomalies in the distribution of cash and a postcode lottery operating across Wales. Why, for example, has so little money been paid out under the ProAct scheme to help businesses in the Conwy area of north Wales? In that area, unemployment rose from 5.3 per cent to 8.1 per cent between September 2008 and September 2009, and yet it seems that there is unfairness in the distribution of Government help for businesses in the area.

Turning to the health and social services budget, there is this curious anomaly of £50 million being set aside to support structural changes in the health service and real increases in demand for health services. There have been increases in the health budget, and those have been welcomed. However, I find it bizarre that such a sizeable sum as £50 million has been left unallocated at a time when resources are so tight. It is

Joyce Watson: Diolch. Yr wyf wedi bod yn dilyn yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud hyd yma. Mae'n ymddangos mai'r hyn y buoch yn ei wneud hyd yn hyn yw dangos lle yr ydym yn torri popeth, a dweud eich bod yn gwrthwynebu'r gyllideb oherwydd hynny. A allwch ddweud wrthym sut yn union y byddwch yn talu am beidio â gwneud y toriadau hynny, a sut yr ydych am gynnal eich dadl i'w phen draw?

Nick Ramsay: Diolch am y cyfraniad hwnnw, Joyce. Yr wyf yn sôn am y toriadau yr ydym yn anghytuno â hwy. Soniaf yn ddiweddarach am sut y credaf y gellid ailflaenoriaethu.

Gadewch inni edrych ar y ffigurau. Bydd y portffolio datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth yn wynebu toriad o 0.8 y cant yn ei gyllideb refeniw a thoriad o 13.6 y cant yn ei gyfalaf mewn termau real. Soniodd y Gweinidog yn helaeth am gynlluniau fel ReAct a ProAct. Mae'r rhain wedi cael croeso ac wedi bod yn dda o ran rhoi sylw i rai o'r problemau sy'n wynebu'n busnesau. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais yn gynharach yn fy nghwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, hyd yn oed yn y cynlluniau hyn bu anghysonderau o ran dosbarthu arian a cheir loteri cod post ledled Cymru. Pam, er enghraifft, y mae cyn lleied o arian wedi'i dalu o dan y cynllun ProAct i helpu busnesau yn ardal Conwy yn y gogledd? Yn yr ardal honno, cynyddodd diweithdra o 5.3 y cant i 8.1 y cant rhwng mis Medi 2008 a mis Medi 2009, ac eto mae'n ymddangos bod annhegwch yn y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn darparu cymorth i fusnesau yn yr ardal.

Gan droi at y gyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, mae'n rhyfedd iawn bod £50 miliwn yn cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer newidiadau strwythurol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ac i ymateb i'r gwir gynnydd yn y galw am wasanaethau iechyd. Mae'r gyllideb iechyd wedi cynyddu mewn manau, a chafodd hynny ei groesawu. Fodd bynnag, fe'i caf yn rhyfedd iawn bod swm mor fawr â £50 miliwn wedi'i adael heb ei ddyrannu ar

time that the Government came clean on where this money is going to be spent and why these decisions have been taken.

Nerys Evans: Will you take an intervention?

Nick Ramsay: No, I will not take an intervention at the moment, Nerys; maybe later.

Confusion over the health budget is not a new thing. Paul Davies recently told the Finance Committee of his concerns that 20 per cent of the NHS budget had not been spent effectively. This represents up to £1 billion—a huge chunk of the Assembly’s funding—that is not focused on the right areas. What a waste of money, and I am sure that, although he is laughing, Rhodri Glyn Thomas agrees that that is a huge sum of money to waste.

Many of our front-line services are provided by local authorities, some of which are again taking a massive hit at a time when they can least afford to do so. Some authorities are receiving a settlement of little over 1 per cent at a time when the inflation rate is far more than that. This could result in council tax rises or reductions in front-line public services. As I have said in previous debates, proper support for local authorities is essential because they are the deliverers at the coalface. I recognise that this is not an easy year for the Labour/Plaid Government. I also recognise that being in Government means taking difficult decisions. We are faced with an incredibly tight financial settlement from the Labour Government in Westminster. In 2010-11, public services in Wales will receive £200 million less capital and £100 million less revenue than that forecast in the 2007 comprehensive spending review as a result of UK fiscal decisions. Wales will clearly be receiving a lot less than what was promised in the final 2008 budget. I do not think that anybody here would dispute any of the difficulties facing you, Minister, and no-one disputes that there is a majority in the Chamber in support of the ‘One Wales’

adeg pan fo adnoddau mor brin. Mae’n bryd i’r Llywodraeth gyfaddef ymhle y caiff yr arian hwn ei wario a pham mae’r penderfyniadau hyn wedi’u gwneud.

Nerys Evans: A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

Nick Ramsay: Na wnaf, ni dderbyniaf ymyriad ar hyn o bryd, Nerys; yn ddiweddarach efallai.

Nid rhywbeth newydd yw dryswch ynghylch y gyllideb iechyd. Soniodd Paul Davies yn ddiweddar wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid am ei bryderon nad oedd 20 y cant o gyllideb y GIG wedi’i wario’n effeithiol. Mae’n golygu nad yw bron £1 biliwn—rhan enfawr o gyllid y Cynulliad—yn mynd i’r manau cywir. Am wastraff arian, ac er ei fod yn chwerthin, yr wyf yn sicr bod Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn cytuno bod hwnnw’n swm anferth o arian i’w wastraffu.

Awdurdodau lleol sy’n darparu llawer o’n gwasanaethau rheng flaen, ac mae rhai ohonynt unwaith eto’n dioddef yn arw ar adeg pan na allant fforddio hynny o gwbl. Ychydig dros 1 y cant yw’r setliad i rai awdurdodau pan yw cyfradd chwyddiant yn uwch o lawer na hynny. Gallai hyn arwain at godi’r dreth gyngor neu at gwtogi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus rheng flaen. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud mewn dadleuon yn y gorffennol, mae’n hanfodol rhoi cymorth iawn i awdurdodau lleol oherwydd hwy yw’r darparwyr ar lawr gwlad. Yr wyf yn cydnabod nad yw hon yn flwyddyn hawdd i Lywodraeth Llafur a Phlaid Cymru. Yr wyf yn cydnabod hefyd fod bod mewn Llywodraeth yn golygu gwneud penderfyniadau anodd. Yr ydym yn wynebu setliad ariannol hynod o dynn gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan. Yn 2010-11, caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru £200 miliwn yn llai o gyfalaf a £100 miliwn yn llai o refeniw na’r hyn a ragwelwyd yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn 2007, a hynny o ganlyniad i benderfyniadau ariannol y DU. Mae’n amlwg y bydd Cymru’n cael llawer llai na’r hyn a addawyd yng nghyllideb derfynol 2008. Ni

agreement. That is democracy. However, the 'One Wales' agreement is now over two years old, and the key question that I would ask is: if you sought to meet the objectives of that agreement today, would you put your hand on your heart and say that this was the right budget to do it? I certainly would not.

The right budget would have reprioritised spending. It would have focused much more heavily on education and skills, and it would have boosted economic development, recognising the invaluable role of small businesses in moving us out of recession. I will now give way to Alun Davies.

Alun Davies: Would you not accept that stimulating the economy and economic development occurs across a whole range of Government expenditures, and that it is something that this Government has carried out with remarkable success over the last year or so? To focus your criticism on one budget line is to misunderstand the nature of public expenditure.

Nick Ramsay: My criticisms do not focus on one budget line, and I have already said that schemes such as ProAct and ReAct have done a lot of good, but I dispute your argument, Alun. If you look at the figures for the economic development budget, there are clearly cuts, and I am saying that if this side of the Chamber were in charge, we would make that portfolio more of a priority. I think that it is key. There is no point just throwing money at schemes, or at people; it is about ensuring that you invest so that people, and the Welsh economy itself, can make money. We are supposed to be sustainable, and that is what sustainability is all about.

In conclusion, we regret that, after 10

chredaf y byddai neb yma yn gwadu nad oes anawsterau yn eich wynebu, Weinidog, ac nid oes neb yn gwadu nad oes mwyafrif yn y Siambr o blaid cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'. Dyna yw democratiaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' bellach dros ddwyflwydd oed, a'r cwestiwn allweddol y byddwn i'n ei ofyn yw hwn: pe byddech yn ceisio cyflawni amcanion y cytundeb hwn heddiw, a fyddech yn rhoi'ch llaw ar eich calon ac yn dweud mai hon oedd y gyllideb iawn i wneud hynny? Yn sicr, ni fyddwn i.

Byddai'r gyllideb iawn wedi ailflaenoriaethu gwariant. Byddai wedi canolbwyntio mwy o lawer ar addysg a sgiliau, a byddai wedi rhoi hwb i ddatblygu economaidd, gan gydnabod cyfraniad amhrisiadwy busnesau bach er mwyn ein helpu i gamu o'r dirwasgiad. Yr wyf am adael i Alun Davies siarad yn awr.

Alun Davies: Oni fyddech yn derbyn bod rhoi hwb i'r economi a datblygu economaidd yn rhywbeth sy'n digwydd drwy holl feysydd gwariant y Llywodraeth, a'i fod yn rhywbeth y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi'i wneud yn llwyddiannus dros ben yn ystod y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf? Mae canolbwyntio eich beirniadaeth ar un llinell yn y gyllideb yn golygu eich bod yn camddeall natur gwariant cyhoeddus.

Nick Ramsay: Nid yw fy meirniadaeth yn canolbwyntio ar un llinell yn y gyllideb, ac yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud bod cynlluniau fel ProAct a ReAct wedi gwneud llawer o les, ond anghytunaf â'ch dadl, Alun. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau yn y gyllideb ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, mae'n amlwg bod toriadau'n cael eu gwneud, a'r hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw y byddem yn rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth i'r portffolio hwnnw pe baem ni yr ochr hon i'r Siambr yn gyfrifol am bethau. Credaf fod hyn yn allweddol. Nid oes diben taflu arian at gynlluniau, nac at bobl; yr hyn y dylid ei wneud yw buddsoddi fel y gall pobl, ac economi Cymru ei hun, wneud arian. Yr ydym i fod yn gynaliadwy, a dyna yw hanfod cynaliadwyedd.

I gloi, gresynwn, ar ôl 10 cyllideb yn y

Assembly budgets, Wales remains officially the poorest part of the United Kingdom. We call on the Welsh Government to redraft this budget in order to address the financial pressures arising from the economic downturn. This Labour-Plaid Government promised a budget to drive the economy out of recession, but, sadly, the wheels have fallen off the car and, in too many ways, this budget drives us nowhere.

Kirsty Williams: I move the following amendments in the name of Peter Black. Amendment 7: add a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses concern that the Welsh Assembly Government's draft budget does not adequately respond to the needs of Wales during the recession.

Amendment 8: add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that the draft budget does not recognise the importance of education and training in preparing Wales for future economic growth.

Amendment 9: add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to transfer funding from elements of business support to fund an extension of the relief thresholds, in order to increase the number of businesses who will benefit from the small business rate relief scheme.

Amendment 11: add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to begin to pursue more rapidly a change in the focus of its transport budget towards more sustainable forms of transport.

Amendment 12: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynulliad, mai Cymru, yn swyddogol, yw rhan dlotaf y Deyrnas Unedig o hyd. Galwn ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ailddrafftio'r gyllideb hon er mwyn ymateb i'r pwysau ariannol sy'n deillio o'r dirywiad economaidd. Addawodd Llywodraeth Llafur a Phlaid Cymru gyllideb a fyddai'n rhoi hwb i economi Cymru gamu o'r dirwasgiad, ond, gwaetha'r modd, mae'r olwynion wedi dod oddi ar y cerbyd, ac mewn gormod o ffyrdd, nid yw'r gyllideb hon yn ein gyrru i unman.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Peter Black. Gwelliant 7: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder nad yw cyllideb ddrafft Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymateb yn ddigonol i anghenion Cymru yn ystod y dirwasgiad.

Gwelliant 8: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu nad yw'r gyllideb ddrafft yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd addysg a hyfforddiant i baratoi Cymru ar gyfer twf economaidd yn y dyfodol.

Gwelliant 9: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i drosglwyddo cyllid o elfennau o gymorth busnes i dalu am ymestyn y trothwyon rhyddhad, er mwyn cynyddu nifer y busnesau a fydd yn ehwa o'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach.

Gwelliant 11: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddechrau mynd ati'n gyflymach i newid ffocws ei chyllideb trafndiaeth at ffurfiau mwy cynaliadwy o drafnidiaeth.

Gwelliant 12: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to consider freezing the central services and admin budget, increasing the efficiency savings in the health department and savings in the operation of sponsored bodies, in order to invest in new and emerging green industries—specifically green energy production, green building techniques and green tourism.

I begin by thanking the Minister for his statement, and I also reiterate the thanks that the Finance Committee offered in its report for the role that the Minister for finance has played in repeatedly giving evidence to the committee. I also appreciate the efforts made by his officials in doing what they can to make a complicated process as transparent as possible. I also place on record my thanks to Angela Burns, the Chair of the Finance Committee, for her stewardship of one of the most important committees that this institution has known, which was a difficult task. The Finance Committee has a special role, and it is incumbent on all of us who are members of that committee to take seriously the job of scrutinising this budget. I thank John Grimes and the other officials for the tremendous work that they have put into producing the report.

This report, and the Minister's budget, finds our nation facing the most difficult of times—probably the most challenging since this Assembly came into existence. It cannot be of any satisfaction to anyone, their politics aside, to see so many of our citizens struggling through this recession, and to see unemployment levels where they are. The need to tackle public debt at Westminster means that our budget, and therefore our ability, as a Government and Assembly, to respond collectively to the individual difficulties and trials faced by families in Wales and to drive ourselves out of the recession, is hampered by a lack of power and resources.

The first point to note is that the Minister received less money than he had anticipated

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ystyried rhewi'r gyllideb gwasanaethau canolog a gweinyddu, cynyddu'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn yr adran iechyd ac arbedion yng ngweithrediad cyrff a noddir er mwyn buddsoddi mewn diwydiannau gwyrdd newydd ac sy'n datblygu—yn enwedig cynhyrchu ynni gwyrdd, technegau adeiladu gwyrdd a thwristiaeth werdd.

Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad, a hefyd ailadroddaf y diolch a roddodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ei adroddiad i'r Gweinidog dros gyllid am roi tystiolaeth droeon i'r pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi hefyd ymdrechion ei swyddogion sy'n hynny a allant i wneud proses gymhleth yn un mor agored ag sy'n bosibl. Yr wyf yn diolch hefyd i Angela Burns, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid, am stiwardio un o'r pwyllgorau pwysicaf a fu gan y sefydliad hwn, ac yr oedd honno'n dasg anodd. Mae gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid rôl arbennig, ac mae'n ddyletsrwydd ar bawb ohonom sy'n aelodau o'r pwyllgor hwnnw fod o ddifrif wrth fynd ati i graffu ar y gyllideb hon. Diolch i John Grimes a'r swyddogion eraill am y gwaith rhagorol y maent wedi'i wneud wrth gynhyrchu'r adroddiad.

Daw'r adroddiad hwn, a chyllideb y Gweinidog ar adeg pan yw ein cenedl yn wynebu cyfnod anodd tu hwnt—y cyfnod mwyaf dyrys ers i'r Cynulliad hwn gael ei sefydlu mae'n debyg. Ni all roi boddhad i neb, ni waeth beth fo'i wleidyddiaeth, weld cynifer o'n dinasyddion yn wynebu talcen caled yn ystod y dirwasgiad hwn, a gweld lefelau diweithdra fel y maent. Oherwydd bod angen mynd i'r afael â'r ddyled gyhoeddus yn San Steffan, mae ein cyllideb, ac felly ein gallu, fel Llywodraeth a Chynulliad, i ymateb gyda'n gilydd i'r anawsterau unigol a'r problemau sy'n wynebu teuluoedd yng Nghymru a pheri inni gamu o'r dirwasgiad, wedi'i llesteirio gan ddiffyg pŵer ac adnoddau.

Y pwynt cyntaf i'w wneud yw bod y Gweinidog wedi cael llai o arian nag yr oedd

from the Westminster Government. Undoubtedly, he has had a difficult job to do. It is also right to acknowledge that in drafting the 'One Wales' document, the Government could not have foreseen the trauma that the Welsh economy, and the world economy, would suffer due to the recession and the near-collapse of the banking system. It is right to acknowledge that point, but it is also right to expect a Government facing those difficult times to respond accordingly. In the face of the difficulties that the Welsh economy has experienced, the Government has sought to respond. That point is acknowledged in the report, and, as opposition parties, we should acknowledge that the Government has taken certain steps to respond to the difficulties of the Welsh economy. You can argue about whether they are the right steps and whether they are working, but the Government has brought capital forward, implemented the ReAct and ProAct schemes, and has used the levers at its disposal to try to respond to the situation.

wedi disgwyl ei gael gan Lywodraeth San Steffan. Heb os, bu ganddo waith anodd ei gwneud. Dylid cydnabod hefyd na allai'r Llywodraeth, wrth ddrafftio dogfen 'Cymru'n Un', fod wedi rhagweld y trawma y byddai economi Cymru, ac economi'r byd, yn ei ddiodeff o ganlyniad i'r dirwasgiad a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i'r system fancio wrth iddi ddymchwel bron iawn. Mae'n iawn cydnabod y pwynt hwnnw, ond mae'n iawn hefyd inni ddisgwyl i Lywodraeth sy'n wynebu'r cyfnod anodd hwnnw ymateb yn briodol. Yn wyneb yr anawsterau y mae economi Cymru wedi bod ynddynt, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ceisio ymateb. Cydnabyddir hynny yn yr adroddiad, ac, fel gwrthbleidiau, dylem gydnabod bod y Llywodraeth wedi cymryd rhai camau i ymateb i broblemau economi Cymru. Gallwch ddadlau ai'r rheiny yw'r camau cywir ac a ydynt yn gweithio ai peidio, ond mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dwyn cyfalaf ymlaen, wedi rhoi cynlluniau ReAct a ProAct ar waith, ac wedi defnyddio'r sbardunau a oedd ganddi i geisio ymateb i'r sefyllfa.

4.10 p.m.

Could the Government do more, and, in responding to difficult times, is the budget before us today, which is the budget that will shape our ability to respond in the next financial year, the right one? Are the Minister's existing plans an adequate response or could there be a different response?

A allai'r Llywodraeth wneud mwy, ac, wrth ymateb i gyfnod anodd, ai'r gyllideb sydd o'n blaenau heddiw, sef y gyllideb a fydd yn pennu sut y byddwn yn gallu ymateb yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, yw'r un gywir? A yw cynlluniau presennol y Gweinidog yn ymateb yn ddigonol ynteu a ellid ymateb mewn ffordd arall?

In response to questions today, the First Minister stated,

Wrth ymateb i gwestiynau heddiw, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog,

'When we ask where economic development is going to go in future, it will not be determined by who has the lowest wages and who gives the biggest grants. It will be down to the skills base, the quality of the infrastructure and the quality of life.'

'Pan fyddwn yn gofyn ymhle y bydd datblygu economaidd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol, nid pwy sy'n ennill y cyflogau isaf a phwy sy'n rhoi'r grantiau mwyaf fydd yn cyfrif. Y sylfaen sgiliau fydd yn bwysig, ansawdd y seilwaith ac ansawdd bywyd.'

For once, I could not agree more with the First Minister, and I think that that very succinctly sums up where we need to take the Welsh economy. However, does the budget

Am unwaith, yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r Prif Weinidog, a chredaf fod hynny'n crynhoi'n dwt iawn i ble y mae angen inni arwain economi Cymru. Fodd bynnag, a yw'r

support that statement made here in this Chamber by the First Minister this afternoon? I do not believe that the draft budget supports that statement. It is not a budget suited to providing for a country in recession, nor is it fit for the purpose of building a better and stronger economy when the recession ends, so that we can finally hold our heads up high and as a nation and not find ourselves at the bottom of all the wrong type of league tables for the next decade. I am worried about the future of this Welsh economy, and I cannot see how the Government's spending plans, as outlined by the Minister today, will stabilise and improve our economy. The Finance Committee, which is a cross-party committee, on the whole supports these concerns.

Achieving a solid and lasting recovery from the current recession demands a clear focus on education and a more effective use of the economic levers available to us in Wales. With these obvious priorities in mind, everyone with a stake in the economy of Wales should be concerned by the prospect of this draft budget becoming the final budget. Despite the huge role that our Welsh universities, colleges and sixth forms can play in boosting skills and creating economic growth, their funding has been slashed. Despite businesses folding for a lack of cash flow, the support for them in this budget is also inadequate. Set against that is the fact that the national health service admitted in the Finance Committee that £1 billion of its budget—which is 20 per cent of its total budget—is not being spent effectively, and that we have a Minister who is not prepared to do anything about it, if answers to questions are to be believed. We have a Minister for health who goes to committee and asks for suggestions on how she should spend the £50 million that has been left unallocated within her own budget. In my 10 years in this Chamber, I cannot remember a single situation where a Minister has been left in that position of being able to go to their scrutiny committee and not having to account for every single penny of what they are due to spend in the next financial year.

gyllideb yn cyd-fynd â'r datganiad a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog yn y Siambr hon? Nid wyf yn credu bod y gyllideb ddrafft yn cyd-fynd â'r datganiad hwnnw. Nid yw'n gyllideb sy'n addas ar gyfer gwlad mewn dirwasgiad, ac nid yw'n addas ychwaith ar gyfer adeiladu economi well a chryfach pan ddaw'r dirwasgiad i ben, fel y gallwn yn y pen draw fel cenedl gadw'n hurddas heb ein cael ein hunain ar waelod pob math o dablau cynghrair anghywir am y degawd nesaf. Yr wyf yn poeni am ddyfodol economi Cymru, ac ni allaf weld sut y bydd cynlluniau gwario'r Llywodraeth, fel y'u hamlinellwyd gan y Gweinidog heddiw, yn sefydlogi ac yn gwella'n heconomi. Ar y cyfan, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, sy'n bwyllgor trawsbleidiol, yn poeni yn yr un modd.

Er mwyn cael adferiad cadarn, hirhoedlog wedi'r dirwasgiad presennol, mae gofyn canolbwytio'n glir ar addysg ac ar ddefnyddio'r sbardunau economaidd sydd ar gael inni yng Nghymru yn fwy effeithiol. Gyda'r blaenoriaethau amlwg hyn mewn golwg, dylai pawb sy'n ymwneud ag economi Cymru bryderu pe bai'r gyllideb ddrafft hon yn dod yn gyllideb derfynol. Er gwaethaf y cyfraniad enfawr y gall ein prifysgolion, ein colegau ac addysg chweched dosbarth ei wneud yng Nghymru i gryfhau sgiliau a chreu twf economaidd, mae eu cyllid wedi'i gwtogi'n llym. Er bod busnesau'n methu oherwydd diffyg llif arian, mae'r gefnogaeth iddynt hwythau hefyd yn annigonol yn y gyllideb hon. Ar yr un pryd, cyfaddefodd y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid nad yw £1 biliwn o gyllideb y gwasanaeth—sef 20 y cant o gyfanswm ei gyllideb—yn cael ei wario'n effeithiol, ac mae gennym Weinidog nad yw'n fodlon gwneud dim ynghylch hynny, os ydym i gredu'r atebion a gafwyd i gwestiynau. Mae gennym Weinidog dros iechyd sy'n ymddangos gerbron y pwyllgor ac yn gofyn am awgrymiadau ynghylch sut y dylai wario'r £50 miliwn sydd heb ei ddyrannu yn ei chyllideb ei hun. Yn fy 10 mlynedd yn y Siambr hon, ni allaf gofio o gwbl am Weinidog yn y sefyllfa honno, sef ei fod yn gallu ymddangos gerbron ei bwyllgor

craffu heb orfod bod yn atebol am bob ceiniog o'r hyn yr mae disgwyl iddynt ei wario yn y flwyddyn ariannol ganlynol.

It is clear to me that this Labour/Plaid Government is still operating under the model that it put in place in 2007. It is content to continue to tread that same path while the world around us changes, while more jobs are lost and while the educational opportunities of our young people are effectively closed off. I noted that Rhodri Morgan said that it is perfectly acceptable to expect higher education and further education to accept those 5 per cent efficiency savings because, he says, there is evidence of waste in those departments.

We asked those questions in the Finance Committee, but we were not given any evidence at all of that waste, yet we were able to look at a department that admits to spending £1 billion badly and has £50 million in its budget that it is not willing to allocate. That department has gone through a reorganisation, going from having 37 health bodies to 10, but the Ministers for health and finance could not state clearly what savings we could expect from such a reorganisation. It is ridiculous to expect one department to slash its budget by 5 per cent but not to provide any evidence of waste, particularly when you consider the evidence that we are receiving from the health service.

Rhodri Morgan states that, through closer cooperation and reorganisation, we can expect the education sector to make savings. I suggest that we can expect the health service to do the same, because it has been through a similar process. If that is what it is about, I believe that this Government should have the courage of its convictions. If it wants to close sixth forms, it should say so. If it wants to merge further education colleges, it should say so, not hide behind these budgets, forcing this agenda through via budget cuts, rather than being upfront and clearly stating its intentions.

Mae'n amlwg i mi fod y Llywodraeth hon, Llywodraeth Llafur a Phlaid Cymru, yn dal i weithredu o dan y model a sefydlwyd yn 2007. Mae'n barod i droedio'r un llwybr tra bo'r byd o'n hamgylch yn newid, gyda mwy o swyddi'n cael eu colli a chyfleoedd addysgol i'n pobl ifanc i bob pwrpas yn diflannu. Sylwais i Rhodri Morgan ddweud ei bod yn gwbl dderbyniol disgwyl i addysg uwch ac addysg bellach dderbyn yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd hynny o 5 y cant oherwydd, yn ôl Rhodri Morgan, mae tystiolaeth bod gwastraff yn yr adrannau hynny.

Gofynasom y cwestiynau hynny yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ond ni roddwyd dim tystiolaeth o gwbl inni ynghylch y gwastraff hwnnw, er bod modd inni edrych ar adran sy'n cyfaddef ei bod yn gwario £1 biliwn yn wael a chanddi £50 miliwn yn ei chyllideb nad yw'n barod i'w ddyrannu. Bu ad-drefnu yn yr adran honno, wrth symud o 37 corff iechyd i 10, ond ni allai'r Gweinidogion dros iechyd a chyllid ddatgan yn glir pa arbedion y gellid eu disgwyl drwy ad-drefnu yn y fath fodd. Mae'n hurt disgwyl i un adran gwtogi 5 y cant ar ei chyllideb ond heb roi dim tystiolaeth bod gwastraff, yn enwedig pan ystyriwch y dystiolaeth yr ydym yn ei chael gan y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Drwy gydweithio'n well ac ad-drefnu, mae Rhodri Morgan yn dweud y gellir disgwyl i'r sector addysg arbed arian. Awgrymaf y gallwn ddisgwyl i'r gwasanaeth iechyd wneud yr un peth, oherwydd y mae wedi dilyn proses debyg. Os mai dyna sydd dan sylw, credaf y dylai'r Llywodraeth hon fod yn ddigon glew i wneud yr hyn y mae'n dymuno'i wneud. Os yw'n dymuno cael gwared ar addysg chweched dosbarth, dylai ddweud hynny. Os yw'n dymuno uno colegau addysg bellach, dylai ddweud hynny, yn hytrach na chuddio y tu ôl i'r cyllidebau hyn, gan roi'r agenda hon ar waith drwy dorri cyllidebau, yn hytrach na thrwy fod yn onest a datgan ei bwriadau'n glir.

We believe that these devastating education cuts should be stopped. We should be ensuring that no sixth form and no Welsh further education college has to look to lose from its budget tens of thousands of pounds, if not millions of pounds in the case of bigger colleges, at a time when the demand for the services is at its highest and our need as a country is for a skilled workforce. We need to free up cash flow for small businesses by extending small business rate relief, because a small business struggling for cash flow today is a small business that will not be there to provide work opportunities tomorrow. The Deputy First Minister must look at whether his support packages as currently aligned are the right ones and, if necessary, shift them into small business rate relief for the next financial year. We can look at this the year after that if things improve, but, for the next financial year, it is all about increasing cash flow and cutting down on overheads for small businesses.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you wind up, please?

Kirsty Williams: We need to invest in the infrastructure underpinning our economy by instigating a massive investment in rail and sustainable transport, by shifting the focus in the current transport budget to more sustainable means. We have to ask the Government itself to share the burden of cuts by reducing the duplication in back-office administration in the number of sponsored bodies that still exist in Wales, to free up money for investment in renewable energy, again so that we can improve the offer that Wales makes to business. We need an urgent rethink—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You really need to wind up.

Kirsty Williams: If the process works as it is supposed to work, I trust that the Government will think seriously about the amendments

Credwn y dylid atal y toriadau dinistriol hyn ym myd addysg. Dylem fod yn sicrhau nad oes yn rhaid i'r un chweched dosbarth na'r un coleg addysg bellach yng Nghymru golli degau o filoedd o bunnau o'u cyllidebau, os nad miliynau o bunnau yn achos y colegau mwy, ar adeg pan yw'r galw am y gwasanaethau ar ei anterth ac angen gweithlu medrus arnom yn ein gwlad. Mae angen inni ryddhau'r llif arian i fusnesau bach drwy ymestyn y rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach, oherwydd y mae busnes bach sy'n cael trafferth gyda'i lif arian heddiw'n fusnes na fydd yno i ddarparu cyfleoedd ar gyfer gwaith yfory. Rhaid i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ystyried ai'r pecynnau cymorth sydd ganddo ar hyn o bryd yw'r rhai iawn, ac os oes angen, dylai eu symud i ddarparu rhyddhad ardrethi iddynt yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Gallwn edrych ar hyn y flwyddyn wedi hynny os bydd pethau'n gwella, ond, ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, mater o gynyddu'r llif arian a thorri ar orbenion busnesau bach ydyw.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Kirsty Williams: Mae angen inni fuddsoddi yn y seilwaith sy'n sail i'n heconomi drwy fuddsoddi symiau enfawr yn y rheilffyrdd a thrafnidiaeth gynaliadwy, a chanolbwyntio mwy yn y gyllideb trafniadaeth bresennol ar ddulliau mwy cynaliadwy. Rhaid inni ofyn i'r Llywodraeth ei hun rannu baich y toriadau drwy leihau'r dyblygu yng ngweinyddiaeth cefn swyddfa'r nifer o gyrff a noddir sy'n dal i fodoli yng Nghymru, er mwyn rhyddhau arian i'w fuddsoddi mewn ynni adnewyddadwy, unwaith eto er mwyn inni allu gwella'r hyn sydd gan Gymru i'w gynnig i fusnesau. Mae angen inni ailfeddwl ar frys—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae gwir angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

Kirsty Williams: Os bydd y broses yn gweithio fel y dylai, hyderaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn meddwl o ddifrif am y

that we have tabled today.

Christine Chapman: There is a great deal that I could refer to today, but I want to focus particularly on some of the issues to do with children and young people in the draft budget. As a result of the recession, we all acknowledge the financial realities of life at the moment, that the amount of money the Assembly Government has is limited, and that there are considerable demands upon it from all directions.

During the debate on last year's draft budget, I expressed concern about the lack of clarity on how children's budgeting had been considered in formulating the budget as a whole. I am pleased that, here in Wales, we are the only country in the UK that has initiated work on children's budgeting. Work has been done by the Welsh Assembly Government, and the Children and Young People Committee has undertaken an inquiry on this. I welcome the fact that the Welsh Assembly Government has taken on board the committee's views and has provided figures that show that 28 per cent of the budget is allocated to children, stating that it is expected to remain the same in 2010-11.

With child poverty rightly a political priority for us here in the Assembly, I welcome the positive approach that has been taken by the Welsh Assembly Government in tackling it. There are a number of policies that are making a real difference to children's lives and their life chances, from Flying Start to free breakfasts, Cymorth to child trust funds, and the recent Proposed Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2009. All these demonstrate the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to providing support to those families and children in greatest need, who, without additional support, would be the most disadvantaged in society. As the children's commissioner, Keith Towler, said recently in his annual report, child poverty

gwelliannau yr ydym wedi'u cyflwyno heddiw.

Christine Chapman: Mae llawer iawn y gallwn gyfeirio ato heddiw, ond mae arnaf eisiau canolbwyntio'n arbennig ar rai o'r materion yn ymwneud â phlant a phobl ifanc yn y gyllideb ddrafft. O ganlyniad i'r dirwasgiad, yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod y sefyllfa ariannol sydd ohoni ar hyn o bryd, mai hyn a hyn o arian sydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a bod galwadau sylweddol arno o bob cyfeiriad.

Yn ystod y ddadl ar y gyllideb ddrafft y llynedd, mynegais bryder am y diffyg eglurder ynglŷn â'r modd yr ystyriwyd cyllidebu ar gyfer plant wrth lunio'r gyllideb yn ei chyfanrwydd. Yr wyf yn falch mai ni yng Nghymru yw'r unig wlad yn y Deyrnas Unedig sydd wedi dechrau gwaith ar gyllidebu ar gyfer plant. Mae gwaith wedi'i wneud gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc wedi cynnal ymchwiliad i hyn. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi derbyn sylwadau'r pwyllgor ac wedi darparu ffigurau sy'n dangos bod 28 y cant o'r gyllideb wedi'i dyrannu i blant, gan ddatgan y disgwylir i hynny aros yr un fath yn 2010-11.

Gan fod tlodi plant, yn gwbl gywir, yn flaenoriaeth wleidyddol i ni yma yn y Cynulliad, yr wyf yn croesawu'r agwedd gadarnhaol sydd wedi bod gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth fynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae nifer o bolisiau sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i fywydau plant a'u cyfleoedd mewn bywyd, fel Dechrau'n Deg, brecwast am ddim, Cymorth, cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant, a'r Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2009 yn ddiweddar. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn dangos ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddarparu cefnogaeth i'r teuluoedd a'r plant mwyaf anghenus, a heb gefnogaeth ychwanegol, hwy fyddai'r rhai mwyaf difreintiedig yn ein cymdeithas. Fel y dywedodd y comisiynydd plant, Keith Towler, yn ddiweddar yn ei adroddiad

blynyddol, tlodi plant

'is possibly the single most important issue facing modern Wales'.

'yw'r broblem unigol bwysicaf oll sy'n wynebu'r Gymru fodern'.

However, as a result of the recession, we are seeing child poverty grow across the board. A recent report published by the Campaign to End Child Poverty found that 2 million children across Britain now have no parent in work and warns that the number of children in families without jobs is rising to its highest level for a decade. That rise in unemployment itself has created a new poverty crisis. Although the current economic downturn presents a major challenge in meeting child poverty targets, as Keith Towler has said, the recession must not be used as an excuse for inaction. I would therefore welcome clarification that there is sufficient funding across Government departments to make progress on the Government's commitment to child poverty and to reach our targets, particularly next year's target to halve it.

Fodd bynnag, yn sgîl y dirwasgiad, yr ydym yn gweld tlodi plant yn tyfu drwyddo draw. Canfu adroddiad diweddar a gyhoeddwyd gan yr ymgyrch i roi terfyn ar dlodi plant fod 2 filiwn o blant ar hyd a lled Prydain bellach heb riant mewn gwaith, ac mae'n rhybuddio bod nifer y plant mewn teuluoedd heb swyddi'n codi i'w lefel uchaf ers degawd. Mae'r cynnydd hwnnw mewn diweithdra wedi creu argyfwng tlodi newydd. Er bod y dirywiad economaidd ar hyn o bryd yn gosod her fawr o ran cyrraedd targedau tlodi plant, fel y dywedodd Keith Towler, ni ddylid defnyddio'r dirwasgiad yn esgus dros beidio â gwneud dim. Felly byddai'n dda gennyf gael sicrwydd bod digon o arian ar draws adrannau'r Llywodraeth i fwrw ymlaen ag ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i ddelio â thlodi plant a chyrraedd ein targedau, yn enwedig targed y flwyddyn nesaf i'w haneru.

4.20 p.m.

The Children and Young People Committee has heard and received evidence from the children's commissioner and the NSPCC on the perceived lack of progress made with child and adolescent mental health services. I understand that some are struggling to cope with the demand for their services, and I know that a report into CAMHS by the Wales Audit Office and Healthcare Inspectorate Wales is due in the next few weeks. The NSPCC wants to see a clear commitment to providing significant funding for CAMHS in Wales to ensure that there is provision at all tiers of the service.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc wedi clywed ac wedi cael tystiolaeth gan y comisiynydd plant a'r NSPCC am y diffyg cynnydd a welir gyda gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc. Deallaf fod rhai'n ei chael yn anodd ymdopi â'r galw am eu gwasanaethau, a gwn y disgwylir adroddiad ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ac Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Mae ar yr NSPCC eisiau gweld ymrwymiad clir i ddarparu cyllid sylweddol ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau bod darpariaeth ym mhob haen o'r gwasanaeth.

In conclusion, while clearly acknowledging the financial constraints that we are under, I make a plea that we do not jeopardise the future life chances of our children and young people, and I seek reassurances from the Minister on that.

I gloi, er fy mod yn amlwg yn cydnabod y cyfyngiadau ariannol sydd arnom, yr wyf yn erfyn ar inni beidio â pheryglu cyfleoedd bywyd ein plant a'n pobl ifanc ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac yn gofyn am sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog ynglŷn â hynny.

Nick Bourne: In this important debate on the budget, I will focus my attention on the economy and on education, which have been the feature of most contributions so far. I associate myself with what Chris Chapman was just saying about the importance of ensuring that the life chances of children in deprived areas are not frittered away, notwithstanding the financial position in which we find ourselves. It is true to say that we would have to find some savings in the budget, whatever Government was in power. That is a given and is true. That said, the focus of the Finance Committee's report, as I understand it—and I listened very carefully, and I have looked at its report of that all-party committee—is on the economy and on education. If we are to be in a strong position when we come out of this recession, and we will at some stage, we have to ensure that the economic development portfolio is in a position to take up the slack. That is why, week after week, I have been focusing on this area in my questions to the First Minister, and I have been pushing on the issue of business rates, not just the revaluation—and I will come to that—but also the importance of exempting small and medium-sized businesses from business rates altogether. Our proposal is to exempt businesses with a rateable value of £10,000 or less from paying business rates altogether, with tapered relief for those with a value up to £15,000. That is where the growth in the economy will be, and that has traditionally been the bedrock of the Welsh economy. That is important.

The impact of the revaluation that we are about to see is also important. I understand that revaluations have to happen from time to time, but this one is most unfortunate because it was based on property values in 2008 when the economy was motoring along, but when it comes into effect next year, in 2010, the economy will be in recession. We know that, and that is why measures need to be taken either to halt that revaluation for a year—which is what we would do, for at least a year, and we would revise the position this

Nick Bourne: Yn y ddadl bwysig hon ar y gyllideb, canolbwyntiaf fy sylw ar yr economi ac ar addysg, y ddau faes sydd wedi cael sylw yn y rhan fwyaf o'r cyfraniadau hyd yma. Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r hyn yr oedd Christine Chapman yn ei ddweud yn awr am bwysigrwydd sicrhau na chaiff cyfleoedd bywyd plant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig eu gwastraffu, er gwaethaf y sefyllfa ariannol yr ydym ynddi. Mae'n wir dweud y byddai'n rhaid inni ddod o hyd i rai arbedion yn y gyllideb, pa Lywodraeth bynnag fyddai mewn grym. Cymerir hynny'n ganiataol ac mae'n wir. Wedi dweud hynny, mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid, yn ôl a ddeallaf—a gwrandewais yn astud iawn, ac yr wyf wedi edrych ar adroddiad y pwyllgor hollbleidiol hwnnw—yn canolbwyntio ar yr economi ac ar addysg. Os ydym am fod mewn sefyllfa gref pan ddeuwn allan o'r dirwasgiad hwn, ac fe wnawn ryw bryd, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y portffolio datblygu economaidd yn gallu dal y slac yn dynn. Dyna pam, wythnos ar ôl wythnos, yr wyf wedi bod yn canolbwyntio ar y maes hwn yn fy nghwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, ac yr wyf wedi bod yn pwysu ar fater ardrethi busnes, nid dim ond yr ailbrisio—a deuaf at hynny—ond hefyd pwysigrwydd eithrio busnesau bach a chanolig rhag talu ardrethi busnes yn gyfan gwbl. Ein cynnig yw eithrio busnesau a chanddynt werth ardrethol o £10,000 neu lai rhag talu ardrethi busnes o gwbl, gyda rhyddhad sy'n graddol leihau i rai â gwerth hyd at £15,000. Dyna lle y bydd y twf yn yr economi, a dyna yn draddodiadol fu sylfaen economi Cymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Mae effaith yr ailbrisio yr ydym ar fin ei weld yn bwysig hefyd. Deallaf fod yn rhaid i ailbrisio ddigwydd o bryd i'w gilydd, ond mae hwn yn anffodus dros ben gan ei fod wedi'i seilio ar werthoedd eiddo yn 2008 pan oedd yr economi ar i fyny, ond pan ddaw i rym y flwyddyn nesaf, yn 2010, bydd yr economi ar drai. Gwyddom hynny, a dyna pam y mae angen cymryd camau naill ai i ohirio'r ailbrisiad hwnnw am flwyddyn—sef yr hyn a wnaem ni, am o leiaf flwyddyn, a byddem yn adolygu'r sefyllfa yr adeg hon y

time next year to see what was happening in the UK and the Welsh economy—or at least to mitigate its effects. I make a plea yet again to the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government to come forward with his proposals for small businesses and the rate relief threshold, because small businesses throughout Wales do not know what will happen to them in April 2010. Businesses in England know; they have known the position in relation to the businesses rate threshold since September 2009, so Wales is already two months behind the game on that.

I raised the issue of the economy again with Rhodri Morgan today, but I did not get a clear answer. We can bid into the UK's innovation investment fund from Wales, but we simply have not done that. I do not understand why a smart Government has missed such an opportunity. I hope that that will be taken up.

I will now move on to higher education and to two areas, the first of which is tuition fees. It is regrettable that the two parties that are in Government together and that pledged not to introduce top-up fees in both their manifestos promptly did so. That was a massive mistake. Not only was it a breach of faith with the electorate but it was also a fundamental mistake because it is a denial of chances for a whole generation of students in Wales.

Specifically on this budget, I think that the 5 per cent so-called 'efficiency' cuts being discussed will do great damage to our education system and to the knowledge economy, which we need if we are to grow ourselves out of this recession. We know that skills and knowledge are vital. There has been no satisfactory response to the question of why that area has been singled out, which was put to the First Minister again today. There was talk of waste and of an ability to find savings in this area. However, if it was as blindingly obvious as he now makes it seem that there are great areas of waste in which to make potential savings, why have

flwyddyn nesaf i weld beth fyddai'n digwydd yn economi'r Deyrnas Unedig a Chymru—neu o leiaf i liniaru ei effeithiau. Erfyniaf eto ar y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol i gyflwyno'i gynigion ar gyfer busnesau bach a'r trothwy rhyddhad ardrethi, oherwydd nid yw busnesau bach drwy Gymru gyfan yn gwybod beth fydd yn digwydd iddynt ym mis Ebrill 2010. Mae busnesau yn Lloegr yn gwybod; maent hwy'n gwybod beth yw'r sefyllfa ynglŷn â'r trothwy ardrethi busnes ers mis Medi 2009, felly mae Cymru eisoes ddau fis ar ei hôl hi yn hynny o beth.

Codais fater yr economi eto gyda Rhodri Morgan heddiw, ond ni chefais ateb clir. Gallwn wneud cais gan Gymru i gronfa'r Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn arloesedd, ond nid ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Nid wyf yn deall pam y mae Llywodraeth glyfar wedi colli cyfle o'r fath. Gobeithio y manteisir ar hynny.

Symudaf ymlaen yn awr at addysg bellach ac at ddau faes, sef, yn gyntaf, ffioedd dysgu. Gresyn i'r ddwy blaid sydd mewn Llywodraeth gyda'i gilydd, ac a addawodd beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd atodol yn eu manifestos ill dwy, wneud hynny'n syth. Camgymeriad enfawr oedd hynny. Nid yn unig yr oedd yn dor-addewid i'r etholwyr ond yr oedd hefyd yn gamgymeriad sylfaenol oherwydd y mae'n amddifadu cenhedlaeth gyfan o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru o gyfleoedd.

Yn benodol o ran y gyllideb hon, credaf y gwnaiff y toriadau o 5 y cant sy'n cael eu trafod yn enw 'effeithlonrwydd' niwed mawr i'n cyfundrefn addysg ac i'r economi wybodaeth, y mae arnom ei hangen os ydym am dyfu allan o'r dirwasgiad hwn. Gwyddom fod sgiliau a gwybodaeth yn hollbwysig. Ni chafwyd ymateb boddhaol i'r cwestiwn pam y targedwyd y maes hwnnw, cwestiwn a ofynnwyd i'r Prif Weinidog drachefn heddiw. Soniwyd am wastraff ac am allu i ganfod arbedion yn y maes hwn. Fodd bynnag, os oedd mor gwbl amlwg ag y mae'n awgrymu'n awr fod meysydd mawr o wastraff lle y gellid gwneud arbedion, pam

we not tackled this in the past nine or 10 years? Frankly, I do not believe that savings of that order are to be made, and neither does the sector. I fear for the sector, because there is already a massive funding gap between Wales and other parts of the United Kingdom but particularly Scotland. There is a funding gap between Wales and England, but that between Wales and Scotland is worse still. Plaid Cymru Members will know that, because they were party to the discussions that we used to have with the Government in the second Assembly on closing that funding gap. Therefore, there is undeniably a funding gap, as all parties will recognise.

I am also concerned about the cuts to school building and housing. I know that we have to find capital savings, but those areas are labour intensive, and we need to find savings in the Welsh budget while making sure that there are jobs in those areas. I will be opposing the motion on the budget, as will my party.

Chris Franks: Wales's Government, which has almost no fiscal or financial tools at its disposal, has had to respond to the economic challenges to protect our people and communities from hardship. Let us remind ourselves again that some £200 million of funds expected from the Treasury have not arrived. It is a sign of the Welsh Government's commitment to Welsh businesses and communities that £170 million of reserves have been used to plug—

David Lloyd: I note that a supporting document to this debate is the Finance Committee's report on the draft budget. Do you agree that it is anomalous that that report seems to have ignored the flexible approach that the Government has taken through introducing measures to support businesses and communities during the recession?

Chris Franks: I echo the view that the committee worked very hard, but I am afraid

nad aethom i'r afael â hyn yn y naw neu 10 mlynedd diwethaf? A dweud y gwir, nid wyf yn credu bod cymaint â hynny o arbedion i'w gwneud, ac nid yw'r sector yn credu hynny ychwaith. Yr wyf yn pryderu am y sector, oherwydd y mae bwlch cyllidol enfawr eisoes rhwng Cymru a rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, a'r Alban yn enwedig. Mae bwlch cyllidol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, ond mae'r bwlch rhwng Cymru a'r Alban yn waeth byth. Bydd Aelodau Plaid Cymru'n gwybod hynny, oherwydd yr oedd ganddynt ran yn y trafodaethau yr arferem eu cael gyda'r Llywodraeth yn yr ail Gynulliad ynglŷn â chau'r bwlch cyllidol hwnnw. Felly, mae bwlch cyllidol yn ddiymwad, fel y cydnebydd pob plaid.

Yr wyf yn bryderus hefyd am y toriadau ym maes tai ac adeiladau ysgolion. Gwn fod yn rhaid inni ganfod arbedion cyfalaf, ond mae'r meysydd hynny'n llafurddwys, ac mae angen inni ganfod arbedion yng nghyllideb Cymru gan sicrhau ar yr un pryd y bydd swyddi yn y meysydd hynny. Byddaf yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig ar y gyllideb, a'm plaid yr un modd.

Chris Franks: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru, sydd heb nemor ddim arfau ariannol neu gyllidol ar gael iddi, wedi gorfod ymateb i'r heriau economaidd i warchod ein pobl a'n cymunedau rhag caledi. Gadewch inni ein hatgoffa'n hunain eto fod rhyw £200 miliwn o arian a ddisgwyliod oddi wrth y Trysorlys heb gyrraedd. Arwydd o ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i fusnesau a chymunedau Cymru yw bod £170 miliwn o gronfeydd wrth gefn wedi'u defnyddio i lenwi—

David Lloyd: Sylwaf mai un ddogfen ategol i'r ddadl hon yw adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar y gyllideb ddrafft. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn afreolaidd bod yr adroddiad hwnnw fel pe bai wedi anwybyddu'r agwedd hyblyg sydd wedi bod gan y Llywodraeth drwy gyflwyno mesurau i gynnal busnesau a chymunedau yn ystod y dirwasgiad?

Chris Franks: Atef af y farn bod y pwyllgor wedi gweithio'n galed iawn, ond mae arnaf

that some of the members lost their way and wavered from budgetary issues and decided to veer onto the political track, which was unfortunate. On top of that, we are still suffering financially owing to the discredited Barnett formula, which sets the level of funding that Wales receives from Westminster. Recently, we heard an expert opinion that described the Barnett formula as 'obsolete'. How many independent inquiries do we need before Wales has a fair financial allocation? I have heard no commitment from the UK Government or its Conservative opposition in Westminster to suggest that they even care about the underfunding of Welsh communities, let alone are willing to put the matter right.

David Melding: I am moved by your eloquent and spontaneous attack on the Barnett formula. There is much in it with which I agree. I advise you to take the next plane—or train, if you want to be eco-friendly—to Edinburgh to try to convince your nationalist colleague, Alex Salmond, of that, given that he is Britain's most staunch defender of the Barnett formula.

Chris Franks: I am grateful for your advice. I ask you to catch the bus to Hampstead Heath, or wherever David Cameron lives, to ask him whether he is prepared to protect the Welsh budget. That is your job, but I hear no response.

Nick Bourne *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I do not think that he is taking any more interventions.

Chris Franks: We have yet to receive a response to the Holtham report on the Barnett formula from the Westminster Government. I asked the Minister what representations he had made to the Westminster Government to get an urgent response. We have heard some opposition AMs claim that the focus has been

ofn i rai o'r aelodau golli'u ffordd a chilio oddi wrth faterion cyllidebol gan benderfynu gwyro i'r llwybr gwleidyddol, ac yr oedd hynny'n anffodus. Ar ben hynny, yr ydym yn dal i ddiodeff yn ariannol yn sgîl fformiwla Barnett, fformiwla nad oes bri arni mwyach, sy'n pennu lefel yr arian a gaiff Cymru gan San Steffan. Yn ddiweddar, clywsom farn arbenigol a ddisgrifiodd fformiwla Barnett fel un 'ddarfodedig'. Sawl ymchwiliad annibynnol y mae arnom eu hangen cyn i Gymru gael dyraniad ariannol teg? Nid wyf wedi clywed dim ymrwymiad gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig na'i gwrthblaid Geidwadol yn San Steffan i awgrymu bod ots ganddynt, hyd yn oed, am danariannu cymunedau Cymru, heb sôn am fod yn fodlon unioni'r sefyllfa.

David Melding: Mae eich ymosodiad huawdl a digymell ar fformiwla Barnett wedi fy nghyffwrdd. Mae llawer ynddo yr wyf yn cytuno ag ef. Yr wyf yn eich cynghori i ddal yr awyren nesaf—neu drên, os ydych am fod yn ecogyfeillgar—i Gaeredin i geisio darbwyllo eich cyd-genedlaetholwr, Alex Salmond, ynghylch hynny, gan mai ef yw amddiffynnydd mwyaf brwd fformiwla Barnett ym Mhrydain.

Chris Franks: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cyngor. Gofynnaf i chithau ddal y bws i Hampstead Heath, neu lle bynnag y mae David Cameron yn byw, i ofyn iddo a ydyw'n barod i warchod cyllideb Cymru. Eich tasg chi yw hynny, ond ni chlywaf ymateb.

Nick Bourne *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf yn meddwl ei fod yn derbyn rhagor o ymyriadau.

Chris Franks: Nid ydym eto wedi cael ymateb gan Lywodraeth San Steffan i adroddiad Holtham ar fformiwla Barnett. Gofynnais i'r Gweinidog pa sylwadau yr oedd wedi'u gwneud i Lywodraeth San Steffan i gael ymateb ar fyrder. Yr ydym wedi clywed rhai o ACau'r wrthblaid yn

on the 'One Wales' agreement rather than on counter-recessionary measures. However, boosting jobs, training and industry are central to the One Wales Government, and all are steps that are the key to combating the recession. In debate after debate, opposition members cite 'One Wales', but have any of you read it recently? I suggest that you read a couple of pages.

honni bod canolbwyntio wedi bod ar gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn hytrach nag ar fesurau gwrth-ddirwasgiad. Fodd bynnag, mae hybu swyddi, hyfforddiant a diwydiant yn ganolog i Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un, a'r camau hyn i gyd yw'r allwedd i wrthsefyll y dirwasgiad. Mewn dadl ar ôl dadl, mae aelodau'r wrthblaid yn cyfeirio at 'Cymru'n Un', ond a oes un ohonoch wedi ei ddarllen yn ddiweddar? Awgrymaf eich bod yn darllen tudalen neu ddwy.

4.30 p.m.

Nick Bourne: I have not heard any opposition member mention 'One Wales'. Whatever happens in the next election, one permutation will not, thankfully, be a Plaid Cymru administration at Westminster. You want your penny and your bun; that is the trouble.

Nick Bourne: Nid wyf wedi clywed dim un aelod o'r wrthblaid yn crybwyll 'Cymru'n Un'. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd yn yr etholiad nesaf, un trefniant nas gwelir, diolch i'r drefn, yw gweinyddiaeth Plaid Cymru yn San Steffan. Mae arnoch eisiau eich ceiniog a'ch teisen; dyna'r drafferth.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can we just stick to the debate in hand and not have a discussion on transport policy, buses and trains, and future election results?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A gawn lynu at y ddadl dan sylw a pheidio â chael trafodaeth ar bolisi trafndiaeth, bysiau a threnau, a chanlyniadau etholiadau yn y dyfodol?

Chris Franks: Quite right. We have had mention of 'One Wales'. However, this budget clearly shows that the Government will continue to maintain its flexible approach to targeting aid to those areas that need it most. Like so many independent organisations, I applaud the efforts made by this Government to help during the recession. An interesting fact that I hope will be drawn out from future meetings of the Finance Committee is that the percentage spent in England on economic development is lower than the percentage spent in Wales. That is not what we have heard. An even higher percentage is spent in Wales on transport than in England. That is not what we have heard today.

Chris Franks: Yn hollol. Yr ydym wedi clywed sôn am 'Cymru'n Un'. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gyllideb hon yn dangos yn glir y bydd y Llywodraeth yn parhau i gadw ei hagwedd hyblyg at dargeddu cymorth i'r mannau hynny lle y mae mwyaf o'i angen. Fel cynifer o gyrff annibynnol, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo ymdrechion y Llywodraeth i helpu yn ystod y dirwasgiad. Ffaith ddiddorol a ddaw i'r amlwg yng nghyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn y dyfodol, gobeithio, yw bod y ganran a werir yn Lloegr ar ddatblygu economaidd yn is na'r ganran a werir yng Nghymru. Nid dyna'r ydym wedi'i glywed. Mae canran uwch byth yn cael ei gwario yng Nghymru ar drafndiaeth nag yn Lloegr. Nid dyna'r ydym wedi'i glywed heddiw.

Major investments have been pooh-poohed as though they are not relevant to beating the recession. Some £125 million of strategic capital investment fund money has been announced for housing, hospitals and schools; some £32 million has been allocated

Wfftiwyd at fuddsoddiadau mawr fel pe na baent yn berthnasol i drechu'r dirwasgiad. Mae rhyw £125 miliwn o arian y gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol wedi'i gyhoeddi ar gyfer tai, ysbytai ac ysgolion; mae rhyw £32 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu i brosiect

to the Engage project, which aims to take 12,000 youngsters who are not in education or training off the streets; and £3.6 million has been allocated for the former Burberry site in the Rhondda. Members do not seem to wish to pay regard to that. Some Assembly Members should take a reality check. It is the easiest thing in the world to trot out your shopping list—more schools, better healthcare, and so on; things that we would all like to have—funded by an imaginary bottomless pit.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will you wind up, please?

Chris Franks: I guess that that is the role of the perpetual opposition parties. I am proud to say that Plaid Cymru AMs have concerned themselves with the realistic business of Government.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I am sorry, but your time really is up. Will you finish very quickly please?

Chris Franks: The Tories are likely to implement a devastating budget should they win the Westminster election. Can the Tories promise to protect the Welsh budget?

Jenny Randerson: I will start by thanking the Finance Committee for its report. When, in the previous Assembly, the Standing Orders set up a Finance Committee, we hoped that it would become a powerful vehicle for scrutiny. It is important, especially in light of the comments made by Chris Franks, that if the Assembly is to deserve greater powers, we have to behave as if we can cope with those powers. That means proper scrutiny and forgetting to endlessly follow the party political whip. The way in which we spend our money in Wales matters a great deal more than that.

Our amendments attempt to address specifically the fact that the budget does not address the challenges facing Wales in a

Ymgysylltu, sydd â'r nod o dynnu 12,000 o bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg na hyfforddiant oddi ar y strydoedd; a dyrannwyd £3.6 miliwn i hen safle Burberry yn y Rhondda. Nid yw Aelodau fel pe baent yn dymuno rhoi sylw i hynny. Dylai rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad weld faint o'r gloch yw hi. Y peth hawsaf yn y byd yw adrodd eich rhestr siopa—mwy o ysgolion, gwell gofal iechyd, ac yn y blaen; pethau yr hoffem i gyd eu cael—wedi'u hariannu gan ryw bydew diwaelod dychmygol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Chris Franks: Mae'n debyg mai dyna rôl y gwrthbleidiau parhaus. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod ACau Plaid Cymru wedi dewis ymhél â busnes realistig Llywodraeth.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae eich amser wedi hen ddod i ben. A wnewch orffen yn gyflym iawn, os gwelwch yn dda?

Chris Franks: Mae'r Torïaid yn debyg o weithredu cyllideb ddinistriol os enilliant etholiad San Steffan. A all y Torïaid addo gwarchod cyllideb Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid am ei adroddiad. Pan sefydlwyd Pwyllgor Cyllid gan y Rheolau Sefydlog, yn y Cynulliad blaenorol, ein gobaith oedd y deuai'n gyfrwng craffu grymus. Mae'n bwysig, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau a wnaed gan Chris Franks, os yw'r Cynulliad am haeddu mwy o bwerau, fod yn rhaid inni ymddwyn fel pe gallem ymdopi â'r pwerau hynny. Mae hynny'n golygu craffu priodol ac anghofio dilyn chwip y blaid wleidyddol yn ddiddiwedd. Mae'r modd yr ydym yn gwario ein harian yng Nghymru'n llawer pwysicach na hynny.

Mae ein gwelliannau'n ceisio rhoi sylw penodol i'r ffaith nad yw'r gyllideb yn ymateb i'r heriau sy'n wynebu Cymru mewn

recession. We have been very specific, because we are not in the business of endless shopping lists; we are very happy to put forward ideas of how we, as Liberal Democrats, would do it differently.

First, we would institute a complete reversal of the Government's education cut. We have identified two sources of funding in order to deal with this: first, a freezing of the Welsh Assembly Government's central services and administration budget, which has had a generous settlement in the draft budget, and secondly a modest increase in the efficiencies demanded of the Department of Health and Social Services—to go up from 1.6 per cent to 2 per cent. After all, what is sauce for the goose is sauce for the gander: if education can apparently come up with 5 per cent efficiencies, then hospitals and the health service in general should be able to come up with 2 per cent.

We have to bear in mind that, in the last few weeks, we have discovered, from the horse's mouth, that up to a fifth of the health budget has not been spent effectively. Therefore, according to the experts in the know, there is obviously clear scope for things to be done better—not just more cheaply, but for things to be done better for patients. I am disturbed to have read the Minister's reply to the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats that she is not considering investigating this potential waste of money. It is important for Members to bear in mind the creeping increase in the total health budget as a percentage of the Assembly's budget as a whole: in 2008-09, the health budget was 39.6 per cent of our total; next year, it is planned for it to be 40.3 per cent. In absolute real terms, that is a substantial increase in the size of the slice of the cake.

Amendment 9 on business rates calls for a substantial change of focus in business support. The problems with a grant-dependent culture were amply highlighted by the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport, last month, when he

dirwasgiad. Yr ydym wedi bod yn benodol iawn, oherwydd nid ydym yn rhai am lunio rhestrau siopa diddiwedd; yr ydym yn falch iawn o gyflwyno syniadau am y modd y byddem ni'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gwneud pethau'n wahanol.

Yn gyntaf, byddem yn gwrthdroi toriad y Llywodraeth ar addysg yn llwyr. Yr ydym wedi nodi dwy ffynhonnell ariannol er mwyn delio â hyn: yn gyntaf, rhewi cyllideb gwasanaethau canolog a gweinyddol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a gafodd setliad hael yn y gyllideb ddrafft, ac yn ail, cynnydd bach yn yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd a ofynnir gan yr Adran Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—i godi o 1.6 y cant i 2 y cant. Wedi'r cwbl, yr hyn sydd amheuthun i'r wydd sydd amheuthun i'r ceiliagwydd: os gall addysg wneud arbedion o 5 y cant, yna dylai ysbytai a'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gyffredinol allu canfod 2 y cant.

Rhaid inni gofio ein bod, yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, wedi cael gwybod, o lygad y ffynnon, nad yw hyd at un rhan o bump o'r gyllideb iechyd wedi'i gwario'n effeithiol. Felly, yn ôl y gwybodusion, mae'n amlwg bod lle clir i wneud pethau'n well—nid dim ond yn rhatach, ond i wneud pethau'n well i gleifion. Yr wyf wedi dychryn o ddarllen ateb y Gweinidog i arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru nad yw hi'n ystyried ymchwilio i'r gwastraff posibl hwn ar arian. Mae'n bwysig i Aelodau gofio'r cynnydd graddol yng nghyfanswm y gyllideb iechyd fel canran o gyllideb y Cynulliad yn ei chyfanrwydd: yn 2008-09, yr oedd y gyllideb iechyd yn 39.6 y cant o'n cyfanswm; y flwyddyn nesaf, bwriedir iddi fod yn 40.3 y cant. Mewn termau real absoliwt, mae hynny'n gynnydd sylweddol ym maint y gyfran o'r gacen.

Mae gwelliant 9 ar ardrethi busnes yn galw am newid ffocws sylweddol mewn cymorth i fusnesau. Tynnwyd cryn sylw at y problemau gyda diwylliant sy'n dibynnu ar grantiau gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth y mis diwethaf,

said that it is pretty obvious that the offer now has to change and to change quite radically. In other words, we need to move away from the grants culture of the past. Wales has one of the most generous grants cultures of all parts of the UK, yet we are still one of the poorest economic performers. Despite a decade of this grants culture, which has been increasingly generous, we are still at the bottom of the UK league table. PricewaterhouseCoopers recently highlighted the disparity in grants offered by the different administrations around the UK—the report made interesting reading. The average grant awarded in Wales was £13,320 per job created, which was the highest of any part of the UK, more than four times the average grant offered to companies in London and the south-east of England and several thousand pounds ahead of any other region in the UK.

Small businesses are the backbone of our economy and they must be nurtured. Business rates are frequently the third biggest expense for small businesses, and it is worth bearing in mind that small businesses pay a greater proportion of their turnover in rates than larger businesses. We must help them. We want a simple system to allow businesses to get on with their job and that will cut the endless bureaucracy. We believe that the simple transfer of funds from business grants to business rates could extend the small business rate relief scheme significantly.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you wind up, please?

Jenny Randerson: Around £25 million could extend the scheme to all businesses with a rateable value of up to £13,000, which would be a considerable improvement to the current £6,500 threshold. I ask you to support the constructive Welsh Liberal Democrat ideas for improving our economy.

pan ddywedodd ei bod yn eithaf amlwg bod yn rhaid i'r hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig newid erbyn hyn, a hynny'n newid pur helaeth. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae angen inni symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth ddiwylliant grantiau'r gorffennol. Mae gan Gymru un o'r diwylliannau grantiau haelaf o blith holl rannau'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond yr ydym yn dal i fod yn un o'r perfformwyr economaidd gwaethaf. Er gwaethaf degawd o'r diwylliant grantiau hwn, sydd wedi bod yn fwyfwy hael, yr ydym yn dal ar waelod tabl y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn ddiweddar, tynnodd PricewaterhouseCoopers sylw at y gwahaniaeth yn y grantiau a gynigir gan y gwahanol weinyddiaethau o gwmpas y Deyrnas Unedig—diddorol oedd darllen yr adroddiad. Y grant cyfartalog a ddyfarnwyd yng Nghymru oedd £13,320 am bob swydd a grëwyd, sef yr uchaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, mwy na phedair gwaith y grant cyfartalog a gynigiwyd i gwmnïau yn Llundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr, a miloedd lawer o bunnau'n uwch na dim un rhanbarth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

Busnesau bach yw asgwrn cefn ein heconomi a rhaid eu meithrin. Ardrethi busnes yn aml yw'r gost uchaf ond dwy i fusnesau bach, ac mae'n werth cofio bod busnesau bach yn talu cyfran fwy o'u trosiant mewn ardrethi nag a wna busnesau mwy. Rhaid inni eu helpu. Mae arnom eisiau system syml i ganiatáu i fusnesau fwrw ymlaen â'u gwaith gan ddileu'r fiwrocratiaeth ddiwedd. Credwn y gallai trosglwyddo arian o grantiau busnes i ardrethi busnes ehangu'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach yn sylweddol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Jenny Randerson: Gallai rhyw £25 miliwn estyn y cynllun i bob busnes a chanddynt werth ardrethol o hyd at £13,000, a fyddai'n welliant sylweddol o'i gymharu â'r trothwy presennol, sef £6,500. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi syniadau adeiladol Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ar gyfer gwella ein heconomi.

Ann Jones: The budget has been presented in tough economic times and I know that you, Andrew, have done your best. I acknowledge the broad priorities that you have supported in this budget. However, as the Minister for finance, you will know that I have some reservations about this budget, which I hope that you can take away and consider before bringing forward the final budget.

Until now, the deprivation grant had been protected and kept apart, but it has now been rolled into the revenue support grant, which will mean that some of our most deprived communities will not be able to rely on the money that we have given for deprivation, which is some £22 million, and will have to rely on local authorities to decide where their priorities will lie. You will know that I have no faith in Denbighshire County Council to govern properly. I have said before that the authority is not fit for purpose and I have some grave reservations about how it will spend that money if it is rolled into its revenue support grant. Unless we target these areas and their problems, we will not be able to protect them and we will never ever be able to reduce the problems. That is something that I really believe that we should be looking at during a recession. If this budget is not needs-based, the protected grants really must be ring-fenced and they really need to be targeted. What assurances can you give me that my constituents will not suffer as a result of this decision? I know that the Welsh Local Government Association has supported this decision, but I think that, on this occasion, the WLGA has not thought about the situation fully.

4.40 p.m.

My other concern is funding for further education. Many have talked about this. I am convinced that we need to act now to invest in skills, not only for young people but for all people. If we are to do that, we have to do it

Ann Jones: Mae'r gyllideb wedi'i chyflwyno mewn cyfnod economaidd dyrys a gwn eich bod chi, Andrew, wedi gwneud eich gorau. Yr wyf yn cydnabod y blaenoriaethau eang yr ydych wedi'u cefnogi yn y gyllideb hon. Fodd bynnag, fel y Gweinidog dros gyllid, gwyddoch fod gennyf rai amheuon ynglŷn â'r gyllideb hon, y gobeithio y gallwch fynd ati i'w hystyried cyn cyflwyno'r gyllideb derfynol.

Hyd yma, yr oedd y grant amddifadedd wedi'i warchod a'i gadw ar wahân, ond bellach mae wedi'i gynnwys yn y grant cynnal refeniw, a fydd yn golygu y bydd rhai o'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yn methu dibynnu ar yr arian yr ydym wedi'i roi ar gyfer amddifadedd, sef rhyw £22 miliwn, ac y bydd yn rhaid iddynt ddibynnu ar awdurdodau lleol i benderfynu lle y bydd eu blaenoriaethau. Gwyddoch nad oes gennyf ddim ffydd yng Nghyngor Sir Ddinbych i lywodraethu'n iawn. Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen nad yw'r awdurdod yn addas i'w ddiben ac mae gennyf amheuon dwys am y modd y gwnaiff wario'r arian hwnnw os bydd wedi ei gynnwys yn ei grant cynnal refeniw. Os na thargedwn yr ardaloedd hyn a'u problemau, ni fyddwn byth yn gallu eu gwarchod ac ni fyddwn byth yn gallu lleihau'r problemau. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y credaf o ddifrif y dylem fod yn edrych arno yn ystod dirwasgiad. Os na seilir y gyllideb hon ar anghenion, mae'n rhaid neilltuo'r grantiau sy'n cael eu gwarchod ac mae gwir angen eu targedu. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi imi na fydd fy etholwyr yn dioddef o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniad hwn? Gwn fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi cefnogi'r penderfyniad hwn, ond credaf, y tro hwn, nad yw'r gymdeithas wedi meddwl am y sefyllfa'n drylwyr.

Fy mhryder arall yw cyllid ar gyfer addysg bellach. Mae llawer wedi siarad am hyn. Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod angen inni weithredu'n awr i fuddsoddi mewn sgiliau, nid dim ond i bobl ifanc ond i bawb. Os am

now and we have to have that budget in place. We must avoid a repeat of the unemployment figures that we saw last week. With the cuts that our colleges and sixth forms now face, it is difficult to see how we will attain that aspiration. A diverse range of courses, aimed at post-16 and lifelong learning students, must have a real impact if we are to make any progress on tackling child poverty in Wales. That is something that we should not let up on, but it can be difficult within this budget.

The 5 per cent efficiency savings that the budget could impose on the further education sector will affect the options that our colleges can offer. It could pave the way for redundancies. From the conversations that I have had with colleagues in the sector, I know that there is no slack there—there is nothing to cut, so we could be facing redundancies. I ask you, Minister, to consider how can we avoid this and I ask you to look at the situation clearly.

I started by saying that this is a tough budget, written in tough economic times. However, I do not think that we should have a budget line of £50 million unallocated funds, whichever portfolio it is in. I ask you to take that away and talk to the Minister for Health and Social Services about where that £50 million will be spent. If it is not all to be spent on health, will you come back to the table and tell us so, and look at that as part of the budget?

Those are my three main concerns. Having said that, I know that, had the Tories been in power, I would have had many more concerns to raise. I am thankful that you have listened over the weeks. I hope that you will continue to listen and that we can amend the situation.

Paul Davies: I am pleased to be able to contribute to this debate. I, too, will

wneud hynny, rhaid inni ei wneud yn awr a rhaid i'r gyllideb honno fod ar waith. Rhaid inni osgoi ailadrodd y ffigurau diweithdra a welsom yr wythnos diwethaf. Gyda'r toriadau y mae ein colegau a'n dosbarthiadau chwech yn eu hwynebu'n awr, mae'n anodd gweld sut y gwireddwn y dyhead hwnnw. Rhaid i ystod amrywiol o gyrsiau, wedi'u hanelu at fyfyrwyr ôl-16 a dysgu gydol oes, gael effaith go iawn os ydym am gyflawni unrhyw beth i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth na ddylem laesu dwylo arno, ond gall fod yn anodd o fewn y gyllideb hon.

Bydd yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant y gallai'r gyllideb eu gorfodi ar y sector addysg bellach yn effeithio ar y dewisiadau y gall ein colegau eu cynnig. Gallai arwain at gollu swyddi. Yn ôl y sgysiau yr wyf wedi'u cael â chydweithwyr yn y sector, gwn nad oes dim slac yno—nid oes dim byd i'w dorri, felly gallem fod yn wynebu colli swyddi. Gofynnaf i chi, Weinidog, ystyried sut y gallwn osgoi hyn a gofynnaf ichi edrych ar y sefyllfa'n glir.

Dechreuais drwy ddweud bod hon yn gyllideb galed, wedi'i hysgrifennu mewn cyfnod economaidd dyrys. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn meddwl y dylem gael llinell wariant o £50 miliwn o arian heb ei ddyrannu, ym mha bortffolio bynnag y mae. Gofynnaf ichi roi sylw i hynny a siarad â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch lle y caiff y £50 miliwn hwnnw ei wario. Os nad yw i gyd i gael ei wario ar iechyd, a ddewch yn ôl atom a dweud hynny wrthym, ac edrych ar hynny fel rhan o'r gyllideb?

Dyna'r tri phrif bryder sydd gennyf. Wedi dweud hynny, gwn, pe buasai'r Torïaid mewn grym, y buasai gennyf lawer mwy o bryderon i'w codi. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod wedi gwrando o wythnos i wythnos. Gobeithio y parhewch i wrando ac y gallwn wella'r sefyllfa.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn falch o allu cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Byddaf finnau'n

concentrate on the education portfolio. Educating the nation must be the priority of any Government, especially during a recession. I appreciate that the Assembly Government has to work within a very tight financial settlement and that difficult decisions will have to be made, both now and in the next few years. However, we have a duty to invest sufficiently in our children and young people's education at a time such as this. Let us be clear: the block grant from Westminster has increased overall by 2.5 per cent from 2009-10. As Nick Ramsay said, it is clear from this draft budget that the Assembly Government has decided to increase revenue spending by only 0.9 per cent, which, compared with inflation, is a real terms cut of 0.6 per cent.

The Welsh Assembly Government must explain why, in a time of recession, when economic development and skills are at a premium, it is binding the hands of these departments with real-terms reductions in their budgets. I note that the explanatory memorandum that accompanies the draft budget talks about reprioritisation and, in one part, talks about 'resources released'. I find that statement astonishing, given that the budget for education is being reduced in real terms.

It is essential that we invest in the skills of our people, and we must support those people who are currently not in education, employment and training, especially during these difficult times. Will the Minister tell us whether he has budgeted for an increase in the number of people not in education, employment, or training, given that unemployment in Wales is, unfortunately, increasing at a faster rate than in any other part of the United Kingdom? One in six young people aged 16 to 24 in Wales is unemployed. Under this administration, youth employment is higher than the UK average and the unemployment rate as a whole is the highest of any UK nation. The Welsh Assembly Government must concentrate its resources on employment and

canolbwyntio ar y portffolio addysg hefyd. Rhaid i addysgu'r genedl fod yn flaenoriaeth i unrhyw Lywodraeth, yn enwedig yn ystod dirwasgiad. Sylweddolaf fod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio o fewn setliad ariannol tyn iawn ac y bydd yn rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd, yn awr ac yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym ddyletswydd i fuddsoddi'n ddigonol yn addysg ein plant a'n pobl ifanc ar adeg fel hon. Gadewch inni fod yn glir: mae'r grant bloc gan San Steffan wedi cynyddu 2.5 y cant yn ei gyfanrwydd o 2009-10. Fel y dywedodd Nick Ramsay, mae'n amlwg yn ôl y gyllideb ddrafft hon fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi penderfynu cynyddu gwariant refeniw 0.9 y cant yn unig, sydd, o'i gymharu â chwyddiant, yn doriad mewn termau real o 0.6 y cant.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru esbonio pam, ar adeg o ddirwasgiad, a datblygu economaidd a sgiliau'n brin, y mae'n rhwymo dwylo'r adrannau hyn wrth gwtogi eu cyllidebau mewn termau real. Yr wyf yn sylwi bod y memorandwm esboniadol a ddaw gyda'r gyllideb ddrafft yn sôn am ailflaenoriaethu ac, mewn un rhan, yn sôn am 'adnoddau sydd wedi'u rhyddhau'. Mae'r gosodiad hwnnw'n fy syfrdanu, o feddwl bod y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg yn cael ei lleihau mewn termau real.

Mae'n hanfodol inni fuddsoddi yn sgiliau ein pobl, a rhaid inni gefnogi'r bobl hynny nad ydynt ar hyn o bryd mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant, yn enwedig yn ystod y cyfnod dyrys hwn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym a ydyw wedi cyllidebu ar gyfer cynnydd yn nifer y bobl nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant, o gofio bod diweithdra yng Nghymru, ysywaeth, yn cynyddu'n gynt nag mewn dim un rhan arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig? Mae un o bob chwech o bobl ifanc 16 i 24 oed yng Nghymru'n ddi-waith. O dan y weinyddiaeth hon, mae diweithdra ymysg yr ifanc yn uwch na chyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig ac mae cyfradd diweithdra yn ei chyfanrwydd yn uwch na phob un o wledydd eraill y Deyrnas Unedig. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad

skills. Greater funding has to be provided in order to tackle youth unemployment. The best youth strategy that the Welsh Assembly Government could provide would be a strategy to create more jobs.

I note from the Government's explanatory memorandum that its strategy is to support the contribution of the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills to leading Wales out of the recession. If this is the case, why is the funding being cut in real terms? School capital spending is down £82 million, or 31 per cent, on 2009-10, and only £34 million of that can be explained by money having been brought forward. This could not have come at a worse time, given that the backlog in school capital building work stands at £818 million. It appears that the loss of £8.8 million in capital spending is due to

'the impact of UK fiscal decisions'.

Of course, I supported bringing £34 million forward for minor capital schemes, but that £8.8 million could have funded a new secondary school, for example. The reduction in funding for higher and further education will not address the huge funding gap between Wales and England in higher education investment. I do not understand why, at a time of economic recession, the Assembly Government is requiring the HE and FE sectors to find efficiency savings of 5 per cent when all other sectors are only required to find savings of 1.6 per cent. The funding gap will only get worse in these circumstances. Surely, this is the wrong sort of prioritisation.

It is essential to invest in teachers, lecturers and education staff. Good teachers will lead to the delivery of world-class education. However, the learning improvement and professional development budgets have been reduced. For example, the General Teaching

Cymru ganolbwyntio'i hadnoddau ar gyflogaeth a sgiliau. Rhaid darparu mwy o gyllid er mwyn mynd i'r afael â diweithdra ymysg yr ifanc. Y strategaeth ieuencid orau y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei darparu fyddai strategaeth i greu rhagor o swyddi.

Yr wyf yn sylwi yn ôl memorandwm esboniadol y Llywodraeth mai ei strategaeth yw cefnogi cyfraniad yr Adran Plant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau at arwain Cymru allan o'r dirwasgiad. Os mai felly y mae, pam y mae'r arian yn cael ei gwtogi mewn termau real? Mae'r gwariant cyfalaf ar ysgolion i lawr £82 miliwn, neu 31 y cant, o'i gymharu â 2009-10, a dim ond £34 miliwn o hynny y gellir ei esbonio am fod arian wedi'i ddwyn ymlaen. Ni allasai hyn ddod ar adeg waeth, gan fod yr ôl-groniad mewn gwaith adeiladu cyfalaf ar ysgolion yn £818 miliwn. Mae'n ymddangos bod colli £8.8 miliwn o wariant cyfalaf yn ganlyniad

'effaith penderfyniadau ariannol y Deyrnas Unedig'.

Wrth gwrs, cefnogais ddod â £34 miliwn ymlaen ar gyfer mân gynlluniau cyfalaf, ond gallai'r £8.8 miliwn hwnnw fod wedi talu am ysgol uwchradd newydd, er enghraifft. Ni fydd y gostyngiad yn y cyllid i addysg uwch ac addysg bellach yn datrys y bwlch cyllidol enfawr rhwng Cymru a Lloegr o ran buddsoddi mewn addysg uwch. Nid wyf yn deall pam, ar adeg o gyni economaidd, y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gofyn i'r sectorau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach ganfod arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant er mai dim ond arbedion o 1.6 y cant y mae gofyn i bob sector arall eu canfod. Dim ond gwaethygu a wnaiff y bwlch cyllidol yn yr amgylchiadau hyn. Dyma'r math anghywir o flaenoriaethu, bid siŵr.

Mae'n hanfodol buddsoddi mewn athrawon, darlithwyr a staff addysg. Bydd athrawon da'n arwain at ddarparu addysg o'r radd flaenaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyllidebau ar gyfer gwella dysgu a datblygiad proffesiynol wedi'u lleihau. Er enghraifft, mae Cyngor

Council for Wales has been administering a funding programme designed to meet teachers' continued individual needs, but, under this draft budget, that funding programme will now close. It is imperative that we invest in our teachers and if funding of this nature is stopped where will teachers go in future for funding support for their training and development needs? Sadly, this draft budget is not one that will help to move Wales out of the recession, when funding for education and skills is to face a real-terms revenue cut of 0.6 per cent. In the circumstances, I urge the Minister for finance to reconsider the Government's priorities to ensure that education receives the support that it deserves.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I know that this is an important debate, but I ask speakers to keep to five minutes, because I have another 10 speakers, and I want to give everybody an opportunity to contribute.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ategaf sylwadau Jenny Randerson am y rôl craffu yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n rôl eithriadol o bwysig, ac yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â hi na ddylai Aelodau fynd i gyfarfodydd pwyllgor â'u breichiau ynghlwm y tu ôl i'w cefnau. Dylent gael cyfle i bwysu a mesur y dystiolaeth a osodir ger eu bron. Yn hynny o beth, croesawaf yn fawr adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid a'r cwestiynau sylfaenol a godir ynddo—a gadewch inni bwysleisio mai cwestiynau ydynt, oherwydd yr oeddwn o dan yr argraff ar adegau bod rhai o aelodau'r pwyllgor yn derbyn y cwestiynau fel pe baent yn ganlyniadau dogmatig na ddylid eu herio. Pan gyflwynodd Nick Ramsay, sy'n aelod o'r pwyllgor, ei dystiolaeth, gwrthododd ddwywaith ildio i rai nad oeddent yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor ond oedd am ofyn cwestiwn, ond ildiodd yn syth i aelod arall ohono. Mae'n ymddangos i rai ohonom fod rhyw gartél bach cysurus wedi ffurfio ymysg aelodau'r pwyllgor hwnnw sydd ond yn siarad â'i gilydd ac nid â'r un Aelod arall.

Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru wedi bod yn gweinyddu rhaglen ariannu i ateb anghenion unigol parhaus athrawon, ond, o dan y gyllideb ddrafft hon, bydd y rhaglen ariannu honno'n awr yn dod i ben. Mae'n hollbwysig buddsoddi yn ein hathrawon ac os rhoddir terfyn ar y math hwn o gyllid, i ble yr aiff athrawon yn y dyfodol i gael cymorth ariannol ar gyfer eu hanghenion hyfforddi a datblygu? Yn anffodus, nid yw'r gyllideb ddrafft hon yn un a wnaiff helpu i godi Cymru allan o'r dirwasgiad, a chyllid addysg a sgiliau'n wynebu toriad refeniw o 0.6 y cant mewn termau real. Yn yr amgylchiadau, yr wyf yn pwysu ar y Gweinidog dros gyllid ailystyried blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth er mwyn sicrhau bod addysg yn cael y gefnogaeth y mae'n ei haeddu.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gwn fod hon yn ddadl bwysig, ond gofynnaf i siaradwyr gadw at bum munud, oherwydd y mae gennyf 10 siaradwr arall, ac mae arnaf eisiau rhoi cyfle i bawb gyfrannu.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I endorse Jenny Randerson's comments on the role of scrutiny in the Assembly. It has a vital role, and I agree entirely with her that Members should not go to committee with their hands tied behind their backs. They should be given the opportunity to evaluate and digest the evidence presented to them. In that, I warmly welcome the Finance Committee report and the fundamental questions that it raises—and let us emphasise that they are questions, because I was under the impression at times that some committee members had accepted them as dogmatic conclusions that should not be challenged. When Nick Ramsay, a member of that committee, gave his evidence, he twice refused to give way to non-members of the committee who wanted to ask a question, and yet he gave way immediately to another member of it. It appears to some of us as though a cosy little cartel has been formed among that committee's membership who will speak only to each other and not to any other Member.

Nick Ramsay: I had limited time in which to speak, Rhodri, and I thought it would be a waste of time to give way to a member of a party that does not even know what the role of the Assembly's Finance Committee is. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Well, you were so tight on time that you did not get around to telling us where you would get the money from to finance all the amendments that you have tabled, which ask for more money to be invested in certain budget areas. You did not tell us once from where that money was to come. Quite honestly, we can have no confidence in the Conservative Party given that, in Westminster, it is talking about savage cuts to the budget, which will affect the block grant to the Assembly. Here, it is 'spend, spend, spend', while for the Westminster Conservatives, it is 'cuts, cuts, cuts', and never the twain shall meet. You can promise everything, but people know that you cannot deliver anything—that is a fact.

4.50 p.m.

With regard to the report, two interesting and important questions arise. The first concerns unallocated sums of money in the health budget, and evidence that was given about money that was either spent in the wrong way or wasted. However, that was just evidence. I remember Alun Davies, who is also a member of the committee, saying at length, when we were discussing the eradication of bovine TB, that you cannot just take one piece of evidence and treat it as the only evidence in existence. He said that repeatedly. I think that issue needs to be looked at critically, and perhaps the committee could do that and look at whether or not that is a substantial criticism of the way in which—

Andrew R.T. Davies: Will you give way?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Just wait a minute. It could look at whether or not that is borne out in reality, or is just a piece of evidence that it

Nick Ramsay: Hyn a hyn o amser a oedd gennyf i siarad, Rhodri, a thybiwn mai gwastraff ar amser fyddai ildio i aelod o blaid nad yw hyd yn oed yn gwybod beth yw rôl Pwyllgor Cyllid y Cynulliad. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.]

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Wel, yr oedd amser mor brin gennych fel na lwyddasoch i ddweud wrthym o ble y caech yr arian i dalu am yr holl welliannau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno, sy'n gofyn am fuddsoddi mwy o arian mewn rhai meysydd yn y gyllideb. Ni ddywedasoch wrthym unwaith o ble y deuai'r arian hwnnw. A dweud y gwir yn onest, ni allwn fod â dim hyder yn y Blaid Geidwadol o gofio ei bod yn siarad yn San Steffan am doriadau ciaidd yn y gyllideb, a fydd yn effeithio ar y grant bloc i'r Cynulliad. Yma, 'gwario, gwario, gwario' yw'r gri, ond gan Geidwadwyr San Steffan clywn 'torri, torri, torri', ac ni chyferfydd y ddau byth. Gallwch addo popeth, ond mae pobl yn gwybod na allwch gyflawni dim—mae hynny'n ffaith.

Ynglŷn â'r adroddiad, mae dau gwestiwn diddorol a phwysig yn codi. Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â symiau o arian sydd heb eu dyrannu yn y gyllideb iechyd, a thystiolaeth a roddwyd am arian a gafodd naill ai ei wario yn y ffordd anghywir neu ei wastraffu. Fodd bynnag, dim ond tystiolaeth oedd hynny. Cofiaf Alun Davies, sydd hefyd yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, yn dweud yn groyw, pan oeddem yn trafod dileu TB mewn gwartheg, na allwch gymryd un darn o dystiolaeth a'i drin fel yr unig dystiolaeth sy'n bodoli. Dywedodd hynny dro ar ôl tro. Yr wyf yn meddwl bod angen edrych yn feirniadol ar y mater hwnnw, ac efallai y gallai'r pwyllgor wneud hynny ac edrych a ydyw hynny'n feirniadaeth sylweddol ai peidio ar y modd y mae—

Andrew R.T. Davies: A wnewch ildio?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Arhoswch funud. Gallai edrych a yw hynny'n cael ei gadarnhau ai peidio mewn gwirionedd, ynteu

has received. The other—

ai dim ond darn o dystiolaeth a gafodd ydyw.
Y dystiolaeth arall—

Andrew R.T. Davies: Will you give way?

Andrew R.T. Davies: A wnewch ildio?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: No, I do not have time; I have taken one intervention already. The other evidence that I think is important relates to the fact that there is a call upon the education department to look at post-16 education and to introduce a 5 per cent efficiency cut in that budget. I disagree with that totally. Evidence seems to be coming from all directions that we need to invest in that sector. There must be a justification for this efficiency cut. The evidence from the sector in my constituency is that there is no room for efficiency cuts within further education, higher education or sixth-form education. I am told that the sector is already under severe financial pressures, and that this will lead to severe cutbacks in the provision that they can offer. In terms of staffing, it is projected that at least 300 staff—half of them further education teaching staff—could lose their jobs. That will include people who offer Welsh-medium tuition. There are commitments in the ‘One Wales’ agreement on Welsh-medium education that will be put under pressure as a result of this.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Na wnaif, nid oes gennyf amser; yr wyf wedi derbyn un ymyriad yn barod. Y dystiolaeth arall sydd yn bwysig yn fy marn i yw'r ffaith bod galw ar yr adran addysg i edrych ar addysg ôl-16 a chyflwyno toriad effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant yn y gyllideb honno. Anghytunaf yn llwyr â hynny. Mae'n ymddangos bod dystiolaeth yn dod o bob cyfeiriad fod angen inni fuddsoddi yn y sector hwnnw. Rhaid cael cyfiawnhad dros y toriad effeithlonrwydd hwn. Y dystiolaeth o'r sector yn fy etholaeth i yw nad oes lle i doriadau effeithlonrwydd o fewn addysg bellach, addysg uwch nac addysg chweched dosbarth. Dywedir wrthyf fod y sector eisoes dan bwysau ariannol difrifol, ac y bydd hyn yn arwain at gwtogi difrifol ar y ddarpariaeth y gallant ei chynnig. O ran staffio, rhagamcener y gallai o leiaf 300 o staff—eu hanner yn staff dysgu addysg bellach—golli eu swyddi. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys pobl sy'n dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae ymrwymadau yng nghytundeb ‘Cymru'n Un’ ynglŷn ag addysg Gymraeg a roddir dan bwysau yn sgîl hyn.

I want to be convinced—I want the Minister to tell me what has changed in the education department to allow us to look at 5 per cent efficiency cuts. Where will those come from, and how can we safeguard provision in this sector, which is very important, especially in terms of the type of challenges that we face in the current economic climate? These questions have to be asked, and, knowing the Minister for finance and the Minister for education, I am sure that there are answers, but we need to hear them in order to be convinced by the draft budget before us.

Mae arnaf eisiau cael fy narbwylllo—mae arnaf eisiau i'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf beth sydd wedi newid yn yr adran addysg i ganiatáu inni edrych ar doriadau effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant. O ble y daw'r rheiny, a sut y gallwn ddiogelu'r ddarpariaeth yn y sector hwn, sydd yn bwysig iawn, yn enwedig o ran y math o heriau a wynebwn yn yr hinsawdd economaidd bresennol? Mae'n rhaid gofyn y cwestiynau hyn, ac, o adnabod y Gweinidog dros gyllid a'r Gweinidog dros addysg, yr wyf yn siŵr bod atebion i'w cael, ond mae angen inni eu clywed er mwyn cael ein darbwylllo gan y gyllideb ddrafft sydd ger ein bron.

Finally, I commend the Minister for finance on what is a transparent draft budget. In the old days, Andrew, you would not have been facing these questions, because no-one could

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r Gweinidog dros gyllid am gyllideb ddrafft sy'n dryloyw. Yn yr hen ddyddiau, Andrew, ni fuasech yn wynebu'r cwestiynau hyn, oherwydd ni

work out the budget lines and where money had gone from one portfolio to the other. So, you have created problems for yourself in producing such a transparent budget.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Can you wind up, please?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am looking at the clock, Deputy Presiding Officer.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: So am I. Can you wind up, please?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I have an extra minute, because I took an intervention.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am in charge here. Please finish.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I bow to your authority, and I will leave it at that.

Peter Black: I was interested in the argument that Rhodri Glyn Thomas put across, because, like him, I am not convinced by the education cuts. I am not convinced that the education sector can make 5 per cent 'efficiency savings'. We do not want to see a situation similar to that which happened recently, whereby cuts had to be reversed in the face of protests on the Senedd steps, with Assembly Members telling protesters that they were opposed to the cuts despite having voted for them. So, we need to have the reassurances that Rhodri Glyn Thomas asked for.

Alun Davies: It would make my life and the life of many Members much happier if you were to stop constantly misleading people about what we voted for. We voted against a Liberal Democrat Wednesday afternoon debate, which was nonsense, as it is every Wednesday afternoon. Let me tell you, Peter Black, we will continue to vote against the Liberal Democrats.

fyddai neb yn gallu dirnad y llinellau gwariant a'r manau lle y byddai arian wedi mynd o un portffolio i'r llall. Felly, yr ydych wedi creu problemau i chi'ch hun wrth lunio cyllideb mor dryloyw.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn edrych ar y cloc, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A minnau. A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae gennyf funud ychwanegol, am imi dderbyn ymyriad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Fi sydd yn rheoli yma. Gorffennwch, os gwelwch yn dda.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ymostyngaf i'ch awdurdod, ac fe'i gadawaf ar hynny.

Peter Black: Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb yn y ddadl a gyflwynodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, oherwydd, fel yntau, nid wyf finnau wedi fy narbwylllo gan y toriadau mewn addysg. Nid wyf wedi fy narbwylllo y gall y sector addysg wneud 'arbedion effeithlonrwydd' o 5 y cant. Nid oes arnom eisiau gweld sefyllfa debyg i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ddiweddar, lle y bu'n rhaid gwrthdroi toriadau yn wyneb gwrthdystiadau ar risiau'r Senedd, gydag Aelodau Cynulliad yn dweud wrth brotestwyr eu bod yn gwrthwynebu'r toriadau er eu bod wedi pleidleisio drostynt. Felly, mae angen inni gael y sicrwydd y gofynnodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas amdano.

Alun Davies: Byddai'n gwneud fy mywyd i a bywyd llawer o Aelodau'n llawer hapusach pe rhoddech y gorau i gamarwain pobl yn barhaus am yr hyn y pleidleisiasom drosto. Pleidleisiasom yn erbyn dadl brynhawn dydd Mercher gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a oedd yn nonsens, fel y mae bob prynhawn Mercher. Gadewch imi ddweud wrthy, Peter Black, parhawn i bleidleisio yn erbyn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Peter Black: I seem to remember that you voted for the last budget, which included the cuts. The consequences of those cuts were what were being protested about, so I do not think that I am misleading anyone about the facts of this particular case.

I wish to talk briefly about an issue raised in Rhodri Glyn Thomas's contribution, which was very important. What has impressed me in this debate is the readiness of Government backbench Members to stand up and express their unhappiness at this budget and the way that it has been forged, and, in particular, at this budget's response to the recession in terms of building up skills, preparing the workforce to take up jobs as we come out of the recession, and growing the Welsh economy. On the opposition benches, and it is one of the reasons why we have tabled all these amendments, we are not satisfied that the budget does that. There are clearly Members on the Government side who are equally as unhappy as we are about this.

The difference between the Welsh Liberal Democrats and the Conservatives is that we have put forward alternative proposals and have said where we think that the money for them will come from. In terms of health, in particular, Rhodri Glyn Thomas referred to the evidence that was given to the Finance Committee, saying that that was just evidence, but I was in the Chamber not a few hours ago when the First Minister acknowledged that what the Finance Committee was told was correct, namely that £1 billion is being misdirected or misspent in the health budget, and that that needed to be looked at. That is in stark contrast to the Minister for health's response to the question tabled by the Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats asking what the Minister was going to do about this £1 billion. Her response was that she would do nothing; the answer was 'no'—or '*non*', as Charles de Gaulle once responded to Britain's application to the European Community.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you for

Peter Black: Yr wyf fel petawn yn cofio ichi bleidleisio dros y gyllideb ddiwethaf, a oedd yn cynnwys y toriadau. Canlyniadau'r toriadau hynny oedd testun y brotest, felly nid wyf yn meddwl fy mod yn camarwain neb ynglŷn â ffeithiau'r achos arbennig hwn.

Hoffwn siarad yn fyr am fater a godwyd yng nghyfraniad Rhodri Glyn Thomas, a oedd yn bwysig iawn. Yr hyn sydd wedi gwneud argraff arnaf yn y ddadl hon yw parodrwydd Aelodau mainc gefn y Llywodraeth i sefyll a mynegi eu hanfodlonrwydd â'r gyllideb hon a'r ffordd y mae wedi'i llunio, ac, yn arbennig, ag ymateb y gyllideb hon i'r dirwasgiad o ran meithrin sgiliau, paratoi'r gweithlu i ymgymryd â swyddi wrth inni ddod allan o'r dirwasgiad, a pheri i economi Cymru dyfu. Ar feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau, a dyma un o'r rhesymau pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r holl welliannau hyn, nid ydym wedi ein hargyhoeddi bod y gyllideb yn gwneud hynny. Mae'n amlwg bod Aelodau ar ochr y Llywodraeth sydd yr un mor anhapus â ni ynglŷn â hyn.

Y gwahaniaeth rhwng Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru a'r Ceidwadwyr yw ein bod ni wedi cynnig cynigion amgen ac wedi dweud o ble y credwn y daw'r arian ar eu cyfer. O ran iechyd, yn arbennig, cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas at y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, gan ddweud mai dim ond tystiolaeth oedd hynny, ond yr oeddwn yn y Siambr rai oriau'n ôl pan gydnabu'r Prif Weinidog fod yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn gywir, sef bod £1 biliwn yn cael ei gamgyfeirio neu ei gamwario yn y gyllideb iechyd, a bod angen edrych ar hynny. Mae hynny'n hollol groes i ymateb y Gweinidog dros iechyd i'r cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd gan Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n gofyn beth yr oedd y Gweinidog yn mynd i'w wneud ynghylch y £1 biliwn. Ei hymateb hi oedd na wnâi ddim byd; yr ateb oedd 'na'—neu '*non*', fel yr ymatebodd Charles de Gaulle unwaith i gais Prydain i'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolch am frysio

hurrying through that last sentence, so that I could intervene. The point that I was making was that evidence has been put to the committee, and the First Minister referred to it, that there is a question over a substantial sum of money in the health budget. However, that has to be looked at in far more detail before we can say, 'Oh, we can take all of that and we can put it somewhere else without it affecting front-line services in any way'.

Peter Black: You make a valid point, Rhodri Glyn, and I would not argue that that £1 billion is money that is being wasted and could be tapped into, because that is clearly not the case. That £1 billion is being misspent because of the way that the national health service is structured, and that structure needs to be tackled over the long term. However, we have just reorganised the national health service, reducing the number of health bodies from 37 to 10, which means that, instead of having 37 chief executives, 37 directors of finance and 37 other directors, we now only have 10, and yet those people are still in post and the savings that we anticipated coming out of that reorganisation do not appear to have materialised. It is therefore reasonable for all of us to ask whether the health budget is being spent efficiently. We have concluded that it is not being spent efficiently and that efficiencies can be made, not in front-line services, but in the bureaucracy and management, which we believe is now top-heavy, in order to deliver additional resources in this budget. I think that is a reasonable conclusion.

Janet Ryder: Can you clarify this for me? The reorganisation of the health services was to lead to as little unemployment as possible, and therefore a lot of people have been guaranteed a position in the service. Are you saying that the Liberal Democrats would have said, 'Sorry, if your post is no longer needed, we'll make you redundant'?

drwy'r frawddeg olaf honno, er mwyn imi allu ymyrryd. Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud oedd bod tystiolaeth wedi'i rhoi i'r pwyllgor, a chyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at hyn, fod cwestiwn ynghylch swm sylweddol o arian yn y gyllideb iechyd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid edrych ar hynny'n llawer mwy manwl cyn y gallwn ddweud, 'O, gallwn gymryd y cyfan o hynny a gallwn ei roi yn rhywle arall heb effeithio o gwbl ar wasanaethau rheng flaen'.

Peter Black: Yr ydych yn gwneud pwynt dilys, Rhodri Glyn, ac ni ddadleuwn fod y £1 biliwn hwnnw'n arian sy'n cael ei wastraffu ac y gellid manteisio arno, oherwydd yn amlwg nid felly y mae. Mae'r £1 biliwn hwnnw'n cael ei gamwario oherwydd y ffordd y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol wedi'i strwythuro, ac mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r strwythur hwnnw dros y tymor hir. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym newydd ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, gan leihau nifer y cyrff iechyd o 37 i 10, sy'n golygu, yn lle bod 37 prif weithredwr, 37 cyfarwyddwr cyllid a 37 cyfarwyddwr arall, mai dim ond 10 sydd gennym bellach, ac eto mae'r bobl hynny'n dal yn eu swyddi ac nid yw'n ymddangos bod yr arbedion y rhagwelsom y deuent yn sgîl yr ad-drefnu hwnnw wedi digwydd. Mae'n rhesymol felly i bawb ohonom holi a yw'r gyllideb iechyd yn cael ei gwario'n effeithlon. Yr ydym wedi dod i'r casgliad nad yw'n cael ei gwario'n effeithlon ac y gellir gwneud arbedion, nid yng ngwasanaethau'r rheng flaen, ond yn y fiwrocratiaeth a'r rheolwyr, sy'n bendrwm yn awr yn ein tyb ni, er mwyn rhoi adnoddau ychwanegol o fewn y gyllideb hon. Credaf fod hynny'n gasgliad rhesymol.

Janet Ryder: A allwch egluro hyn imi? Yr oedd ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd i fod i arwain at gyn lleied o ddiweithdra ag a oedd yn bosibl, ac felly mae llawer o bobl wedi cael sicrwydd y bydd ganddynt swydd yn y gwasanaeth. A ydych yn dweud y byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi dweud, 'Mae'n ddrwg gennym, os nad oes angen eich swydd mwyach, fe'ch rhoddwn ar y clwt'?

Peter Black: We are talking about bureaucracy here, Janet, not front-line staff. You should refer to the Government's consultation document issued at the beginning of this process, in which it said that it anticipated making redundancies that would cost over £13.5 million. That was not us speaking, but the Government. If a post is superfluous, that post must go, and that is life. The money spent on the health service should be spent on hospitals, doctors and nurses on the front line, not on managers, bureaucrats and red tape. I am running out of time, because I have taken a few interventions, but I want to make a last point on the health service and that is on the unallocated £50 million. That is unprecedented, at this stage of the budget process. More importantly, you wonder what the money is for, when the Minister for health comes to the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee and asks us how it will be spent.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up now.

Peter Black: There is slack in the health budget that needs to be taken into account, and we believe that by cutting bureaucracy and top-heavy management, we can make savings that can be directed at tackling some of the difficult economic problems that we face as an Assembly.

5.00 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The discussion is beginning to drift a little from the budget before us. Please confine your thoughts to the budget.

Alun Davies: Thank you for the warning. As a member of the Finance Committee I start by thanking its staff, who have worked ferociously hard to bring this report to us this afternoon. I also thank Angela Burns as Chair of the committee for her leadership through

Peter Black: Yr ydym yn sôn am fiwrocratiaeth yma, Janet, nid staff y rheng flaen. Dylech gyfeirio at ddogfen ymgynghori'r Llywodraeth a gyhoeddwyd ar ddechrau'r broses hon, lle y dywedir y rhagwelid colli swyddi a gostiai dros £13.5 miliwn. Nid ni oedd yn dweud hynny, ond y Llywodraeth. Os yw swydd yn ddiangen, rhaid i'r swydd honno fynd, a dyna yw bywyd. Dylai'r arian a werir ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gael ei wario ar ysbytai, meddygon a nyrsys yn y rheng flaen, nid ar reolwyr, biwrocrataid a thâp coch. Yr wyf yn mynd yn brin o amser, oherwydd fy mod wedi derbyn ambell ymyriad, ond mae arnaf eisiau gwneud pwynt olaf am y gwasanaeth iechyd a hynny ynglŷn â'r £50 miliwn nas dyrannwyd. Ni welwyd hynny erioed o'r blaen, yr adeg hon ym mhroses y gyllideb. Yn bwysicach, rhaid holi ar gyfer beth y mae'r arian, pan yw'r Gweinidog dros iechyd yn dod i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol a gofyn i ni sut y caiff ei wario.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr.

Peter Black: Mae slac yn y gyllideb iechyd y mae angen rhoi ystyriaeth iddo, a chredwn, drwy dorri biwrocratiaeth a rheolaeth bendrwm, y gallwn wneud arbedion y gellir eu cyfeirio at fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau economaidd anodd sy'n ein hwynebu fel Cynulliad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'r drafodaeth yn dechrau symud ychydig oddi wrth y gyllideb sydd o'n blaen. Cyfyngwch eich sylwadau i'r gyllideb, os gwelwch yn dda.

Alun Davies: Diolch am y rhybudd. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyllid dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'w staff, sydd wedi gweithio'n ffyrnig o galed i ddod â'r adroddiad hwn inni'r prynhawn yma. Diolch hefyd i Angela Burns, Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, am ei

these difficult and sometimes fraught discussions. I also thank the Minister for making himself available for scrutiny time and again—on one occasion, with just two days' notice—and as a committee we are grateful to him for the effort that he and his staff made to enable us to carry out our work.

Some thanks you got, Minister—this is probably the toughest report, on any subject, that I have seen from a scrutiny committee since I have been a Member. It was always going to be the case. The world has changed completely in the last year. When we scrutinised the budget last year, we were still talking about how to respond to the recession, and the programmes that the Government was putting in place, and managing what we then expected to be a smaller increase in public expenditure. This year, the debate is entirely different in nature. The way in which we are approaching the budget is entirely different, as is the way that we have to scrutinise it.

I have a number of points to make on individual budget lines. I think that the Minister made great efforts to improve the transparency of the budget, and the criticism that we made in the report, from which I would not dissociate myself, was probably churlish. I know that the Minister also increased the time available to us to scrutinise the budget, so for us to come back and criticise is probably churlish. However, I hope that the Minister recognises that we are trying to reflect the feelings of individual scrutiny committees, and also to ensure that, when the budget comes here for a final vote in December, everyone feels that they have had an equal opportunity to look at it and ask those questions.

The report certainly acknowledges the Team Wales approach that the Minister described in his opening remarks. I think that a journalist at the BBC or elsewhere probably read a single paragraph rather than the whole report, and that is where the negative coverage has come from. Had they read the report in its

harweinyddiaeth drwy'r trafodaethau dyrys, ac weithiau poenus, hyn. Diolch hefyd i'r Gweinidog am fod ar gael ar gyfer craffu dro ar ôl tro—ar un achlysur, ar ddim ond deuddydd o rybudd—ac fel pwyllgor yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iddo am yr ymdrech a wnaeth ef a'i staff i'n galluogi i gyflawni ein gwaith.

Ni chawsoch fawr o ddiolch, Weinidog—mae'n debyg mai dyma'r adroddiad caletaf, ar unrhyw bwnc, imi ei weld gan bwyllgor craffu ers imi fod yn Aelod. Yr oedd bob amser yn mynd i fod felly. Mae'r byd wedi newid yn llwyr yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Wrth inni graffu ar y gyllideb y llynedd, yr oeddem yn dal i siarad am sut i ymateb i'r dirwasgiad, a'r rhaglenni yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn eu sefydlu, ac am reoli'r hyn y disgwyliem bryd hynny a fyddai'n gynydd llai mewn gwariant cyhoeddus. Eleni, mae'r ddadl yn hollol wahanol ei natur. Mae'r modd yr ydym yn edrych ar y gyllideb yn hollol wahanol, fel y modd y mae'n rhaid inni graffu arni.

Mae gennyf nifer o bwyntiau i'w gwneud ar linellau cyllideb unigol. Credaf y gwnaeth y Gweinidog ymdrechion mawr i wella tryloywder y gyllideb, ac mae'n debyg bod y feirniadaeth a wnaethom yn yr adroddiad, na fyddwn i'n datgysylltu fy hun oddi wrthi, yn anfoesgar. Gwn i'r Gweinidog gynyddu'r amser a oedd ar gael inni graffu ar y gyllideb hefyd, felly mae'n debyg mai anfoesgarwch ar ein rhan yw dod yn ôl a beirniadu. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio bod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod ein bod yn ceisio adlewyrchu teimladau pwyllgorau craffu unigol, a sicrhau hefyd, pan ddaw'r gyllideb yma am bleidlais derfynol yn Rhagfyr, y bydd pawb yn teimlo eu bod wedi cael cyfle cyfartal i edrych arni a gofyn y cwestiynau hynny.

Mae'r adroddiad yn sicr yn cydnabod y dull Tim Cymru a ddisgrifiodd y Gweinidog yn ei sylwadau agoriadol. Credaf fod gohebydd yn y BBC neu rywle arall wedi darllen un paragraff yn hytrach na'r adroddiad llawn, ac mai o'r fan honno y daeth y sylw negyddol. Petai wedi darllen yr adroddiad yn ei

entirety, they would have seen that we described the Government's response to the recession in terms of agility and creativity; we talked about the capital spending, the ProAct and ReAct schemes, and the way that the Government has moved to ensure that there is a stimulus for the economy. The response to the recession here in Wales is both creative and inventive, and will help to generate jobs and protect people's livelihoods, their homes and their employment.

We made criticisms of the overall strategic shape of the budget, and those are fair comments. I associate myself with those who wish to see greater spending on education; we need to do that. The Government itself—and this differentiates an activist Government approach—has said time and again that it will invest in bringing Wales out of the recession. People on the other side of the Chamber have got excited about the prospect of public spending cuts, talking about savage cuts to the entirety of the public sector, not giving a damn, and then coming here and spending the money twice or three times over in their proposals. That is no way to respond to a recession; that is not a responsible financial strategy. It is nothing more than a press release or a speech; it is meaningless. This Government has taken the approach that we need, struggling with one of the most difficult economic downturns in our lives.

I must say that I believe that an investigation is needed into the overall health budget, because health directors have said that 20 per cent of that budget was not being used appropriately on staff capacity, beds, and so on. We are not making the best use of the £5 billion that we have available to us, and that demands further scrutiny at a time when we are cutting back on key programme areas, and key services. The health service managers themselves said that they are under financial pressure and have difficult choices to make about staff and the non-delivery of services; given that context, there has to be an investigation into what is happening.

gyfanrwydd, buasai wedi gweld ein bod wedi disgrifio ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r dirwasgiad yn nhermau ystwythder a chreadigrwydd; soniasom am y gwario cyfalaf, y cynlluniau ProAct a ReAct, a'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi symud i sicrhau bod ysgogiad i'r economi. Mae'r ymateb i'r dirwasgiad yma yng Nghymru'n greadigol ac yn ddyfeisgar, a bydd yn helpu i greu swyddi a gwarchod bywoliaeth pobl, eu cartrefi a'u cyflogaeth.

Fe wnaethom feirniadu siâp strategol gyffredinol y gyllideb, ac mae'r rheiny'n sylwadau teg. Ymgysylltaf â'r rhai sy'n dymuno gweld mwy o wario ar addysg; mae angen inni wneud hynny. Mae'r Llywodraeth ei hun—ac mae hyn yn nodweddu dull Llywodraeth weithredol—wedi dweud dro ar ôl tro y gwnaiff fuddsoddi i ddod â Chymru allan o'r dirwasgiad. Mae pobl ar ochr arall y Siambr wedi cynhyrfu ynglŷn â rhagolygon cwtogi gwariant cyhoeddus, gan siarad am doriadau ffyrnig ar y sector cyhoeddus yn ei gyfanrwydd, heb falio botwm corn, ac wedyn dod yma a gwario'r arian ddwy waith neu dair drosodd yn eu cynigion. Nid dyna'r ffordd i ymateb i ddirwasgiad; nid strategaeth ariannol gyfrifol yw hynny. Nid yw'n ddim mwy na datganiad i'r wasg neu araith; mae'n ddiystyr. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi cymryd yr agwedd y mae arnom ei hangen, wrth ymlafnio ag un o'r dirywiadau economaidd mwyaf difrifol yn ein bywydau.

Rhaid imi ddweud fy mod yn credu bod angen ymchwiliad i'r gyllideb iechyd gyffredinol, oherwydd mae cyfarwyddwyr iechyd wedi dweud nad oedd 20 y cant o'r gyllideb honno'n cael ei defnyddio'n briodol ar staff, gwelyau, ac ati. Nid ydym yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r £5 biliwn sydd ar gael inni, ac mae hynny'n galw am graffu pellach ar adeg pan ydym yn cwtogi ar feysydd rhaglenni allweddol, a gwasanaethau allweddol. Dywedodd y rheolwyr gwasanaeth iechyd eu hunain eu bod dan bwysau ariannol a bod ganddynt ddewisiadau anodd i'w gwneud am staff a pheidio â chyflawni gwasanaethau; o ystyried y cyd-destun

hwnnw, mae'n rhaid cael ymchwiliad i'r hyn sy'n digwydd.

Alun Davies: I mentioned education in my introductory remarks, and it is crucial. We need to invest in education if we are to bring Wales out of the recession and invest in the key skills that we need for the future, which means putting more money into education and not demanding the sorts of efficiency savings that we are not demanding of other parts of the budget. I beg the Minister to take heed of those remarks before the budget comes back for approval next month.

Alun Davies: Soniais am addysg yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, ac mae'n hollbwysig. Mae angen inni fuddsoddi mewn addysg os ydym am godi Cymru allan o'r dirwasgiad a buddsoddi yn y sgiliau allweddol y mae arnom eu hangen ar gyfer y dyfodol, sy'n golygu rhoi mwy o arian i mewn i addysg a pheidio â mynnu'r mathau o arbedion effeithlonrwydd nad ydym yn eu mynnu gan rannau eraill o'r gyllideb. Erfyniaf ar y Gweinidog i gymryd sylw o'r sylwadau hynny cyn i'r gyllideb ddod yn ôl i'w chymeradwyo'r mis nesaf.

Jonathan Morgan: I will come at this debate from a slightly different angle and raise a number of issues that I have, as Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, with regards to the ability of the public sector to deliver in what will be a challenging year, and perhaps a challenging few years beyond that. We already know that the Auditor General for Wales has commented on the ability of the public sector to deliver proper efficiency savings. He said recently that the Assembly Government's framework for delivering the 'Making the Connections' efficiency targets was defective, that it did not define efficiency clearly enough and that public bodies were in doubt about what they were supposed to be doing. There were claims that the savings were unauditably or, at worst, exaggerated, and that the Assembly Government did not manage the process.

Jonathan Morgan: Deuaf at y ddadl hon o ongl ychydig yn wahanol a chodi nifer o gwestiynau sydd gennyf, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, ynglŷn â gallu'r sector cyhoeddus i gyflawni mewn blwyddyn a fydd yn un heriol, ac efallai ychydig o flynyddoedd heriol wedi hynny. Gwyddom eisoes fod Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru wedi gwneud sylw am allu'r sector cyhoeddus i gyflawni arbedion effeithlonrwydd go iawn. Dywedodd yn ddiweddar fod fframwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer cyflawni targedau effeithlonrwydd 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn ddiffygiol, nad oedd yn diffinio effeithlonrwydd yn ddigon eglur a bod cyrff cyhoeddus yn ansicr beth yr oeddent i fod yn ei wneud. Cafwyd honiadau nad oedd modd archwilio'r arbedion neu, ar y gwaethaf, eu bod wedi'u gorliwio, ac nad oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rheoli'r broses.

As we look to the next financial year and beyond, it is clear in my mind that we need more innovative thinking and a greater focus on efficiency projects with regard to public bodies; they must be more responsible in making better use of the resources that they have. However, there is also a disproportionate focus on areas such as smarter procurement and back-office functions, which have been the subject of much attention in recent years, and any

Wrth inni edrych at y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf a thu hwnt, mae'n glir yn fy meddwl i fod arnom angen mwy o feddwl arloesol a mwy o ganolbwyntio ar brosiectau effeithlonrwydd o ran cyrff cyhoeddus; rhaid iddynt fod yn fwy cyfrifol o ran gwneud defnydd gwell o'r adnoddau sydd ganddynt. Fodd bynnag, mae ffocws anghymesur hefyd ar feysydd fel swyddogaethau caffael a chefn swyddfa callach, sydd wedi bod yn destun llawer o sylw yn y blynyddoedd diweddar, ac

residual efficiency is highly unlikely to result in the level of savings required. We also need to identify projects that will cover the short, medium and long term to help public bodies to develop sustainable plans for the future. We need to see budgetary planning in a position where public bodies, year on year, do not return to this Assembly for greater funding, just to get them out of trouble. Therefore, that level of connection between Government and public body is essential.

I am not convinced that the savings required can come just from efficiency—that is, doing the same for less. The First Minister touched on this some weeks ago when he talked about the need to examine the way in which the Government funds projects in Wales. Although those projects may be desirable and nice, they might not be delivering what we expected. We may need to see the Government taking some hard decisions about some of those projects. I urge the Government to give careful and detailed thought to service redesign, and to the need to re-examining some of the roles that some people have within the public sector. We also need to look at whether unnecessary services and projects, as identified by the First Minister, need to be cut, and to do so on the basis of a robust option appraisal. I know that that is difficult for the Government to do because it would then be looking, effectively, at cutting services that have already existed. However, the First Minister identified that and I would urge the Government to examine it in detail.

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful to Jonathan Morgan for giving way. I associate myself with a lot of what you said; we are facing difficult times. In light of what you have said, can you guarantee that, if this Government begins to make some difficult decisions, we will not have each of those difficult decisions resisted by people in the opposition? We are back to the issue of everyone knowing that we are facing cuts and efficiency savings, but

mae unrhyw effeithlonrwydd sy'n weddill yn annhebygol iawn o arwain at y lefel arbedion sy'n ofynnol. Mae hefyd angen inni nodi prosiectau a fydd yn delio â'r tymor byr, canolig a hir i helpu cyrff cyhoeddus i ddatblygu cynlluniau cynaliadwy ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae angen inni weld cynllunio cyllidebol mewn sefyllfa lle na fydd cyrff cyhoeddus, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, yn dod yn ôl at y Cynulliad hwn am fwy o arian, dim ond i'w cael allan o dwll. Felly, mae'r lefel honno o gysylltiad rhwng y Llywodraeth a chyrff cyhoeddus yn hanfodol.

Nid wyf wedi fy narbwyll y gall yr arbedion gofynnol ddod drwy effeithlonrwydd yn unig—hynny yw, gwneud yr un peth am lai. Crybwyllodd y Prif Weinidog hyn rai wythnosau'n ôl pan soniodd am yr angen i edrych ar y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ariannu prosiectau yng Nghymru. Er efallai fod y prosiectau hynny'n ddymunol ac yn braf, hwyrach nad ydynt yn cyflawni'r hyn a ddisgwyliwyd. Efallai y bydd angen inni weld y Llywodraeth yn gwneud ambell benderfyniad anodd am rai o'r prosiectau hynny. Anogaf y Llywodraeth i feddwl yn ofalus a manwl am ailddylunio gwasanaethau, ac am yr angen i ailedrych ar rai o'r rolau sydd gan rai pobl o fewn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae angen inni ystyried hefyd a oes angen torri gwasanaethau a phrosiectau diangen, a nodwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, a gwneud hynny ar sail arfarniad opsiynau cadarn. Gwn ei bod yn anodd i'r Llywodraeth wneud hynny gan y byddai wedyn yn edrych, i bob pwrpas, ar dorri gwasanaethau sydd wedi bodoli eisoes. Fodd bynnag, nododd y Prif Weinidog hynny a hoffwn annog y Llywodraeth i'w archwilio'n fanwl.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jonathan Morgan am ildio. Yr wyf yn uniaethu â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedasoch; yr ydym yn wynebu adeg anodd. Yng ngolau'r hyn a ddywedasoch, os dechreuau'r Llywodraeth hon wneud penderfyniadau anodd, a allwch warantu na chawn bobl yn yr wrthblaid yn gwrthwynebu pob un o'r penderfyniadau anodd hynny? Yr ydym yn ôl yn y sefyllfa bod pawb yn gwybod ein bod yn

none of us want those cuts and efficiency savings to happen in our own pet projects. Therefore, there may be some difficult decisions for the opposition, if they are going to act responsibly, as well as to the Government.

Jonathan Morgan: I agree that there will be difficult decisions for the opposition, and I can say to Helen Mary Jones that, as Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, what concerns me is that we could see, over the next few years, a greater number of investigations into where public money is being spent and where public money may not be helping Government to realise the agenda that it has set for itself. There is currently a huge disconnect between what the Government sets at a strategic level and what public bodies feel that they are able to deliver. That leads to my final point about the need for a framework, so that public bodies are absolutely clear about what the Assembly Government expects them to do and why the Assembly Government expects them to do it. A framework needs to focus on the Government's desired outcomes, and how these outcomes might be achieved. Public bodies then need to make decisions on how they can develop services to meet those plans within a sustainable financial framework.

5.10 p.m.

We have seen years of increasing budgets for public bodies. We have seen years of plenty; we know that, during those great times of economic growth, public bodies were enjoying year-on-year increases in expenditure. I have not seen a greater degree of financial management and of financial responsibility. I cannot, hand on heart, say that public bodies have become better at managing public finances, and there has not been the level of service redesign and

wynebu toriadau ac arbedion effeithlonrwydd, ond nad oes ar neb ohonom eisiau i'r toriadau a'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd hynny ddigwydd yn ein hoff brosiectau ni. Felly, efallai y bydd penderfyniadau anodd i'r gwrthbleidiau, os ydynt am weithredu'n gyfrifol, yn ogystal ag i'r Llywodraeth.

Jonathan Morgan: Cytunaf y bydd penderfyniadau anodd i'r gwrthbleidiau, a gallaf ddweud wrth Helen Mary Jones mai'r hyn sy'n peri pryder i mi, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, yw y gallem weld, dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, nifer fwy o ymchwiliadau i ganfod ble y mae arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei wario a ble nad yw arian cyhoeddus efallai'n helpu'r Llywodraeth i wireddu'r agenda y mae wedi'i osod iddi ei hun. Mae diffyg cyswllt mawr ar hyn o bryd rhwng yr hyn a benna'r Llywodraeth ar lefel strategol a'r hyn y teimla cyrff cyhoeddus y gallant ei gyflawni. Mae hynny'n arwain at fy mhwynt olaf ynglŷn â'r angen am fframwaith, fel bod cyrff cyhoeddus yn hollol glir ynghylch beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn disgwyl iddynt ei wneud a pham y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn disgwyl iddynt ei wneud. Mae angen i fframwaith ganolbwyntio ar y canlyniadau a ddymunir gan y Llywodraeth, a sut y gellid sicrhau'r canlyniadau hyn. Wedyn mae angen i gyrff cyhoeddus wneud penderfyniadau ynghylch sut y gallant ddatblygu gwasanaethau i gyflawni'r cynlluniau hynny o fewn fframwaith ariannol cynaliadwy.

Yr ydym wedi gweld blynyddoedd o gynnydd yng nghyllidebau cyrff cyhoeddus. Yr ydym wedi gweld blynyddoedd o ddigonedd; gwyddom, yn ystod yr adegau gwych hynny o dwf economaidd, fod cyrff cyhoeddus wedi mwynhau codiadau mewn gwariant o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Nid wyf wedi gweld gradd uwch o reolaeth ariannol ac o gyfrifoldeb ariannol. Ni allaf, â'm llaw ar fy nghalon, ddweud bod cyrff cyhoeddus wedi dod yn well am reoli arian cyhoeddus,

remodelling—call it reform, or whatever—for that money to be spent more effectively. I believe that there has been a substantial disconnect between what the Government has intended and what public bodies have been able to deliver, which needs to be seriously reconsidered.

Gareth Jones: Fel y gwyddom bellach, mae rhagolygon nifer o economïau wedi newid yn sylweddol. Mae'r Deyrnas Unedig, gan gynnwys Cymru, wedi dioddef gostyngiad syfrdanol mewn cynhyrchiant ac wedi dioddef y dirywiad gwaethaf, bron â bod, yn y sector gwariant cyhoeddus o holl wledydd y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd.

Yn sicr, nid Llywodraeth Cymru a achosodd yr argyfwng. Gellid dadlau nad Llywodraeth San Steffan a achosodd yr argyfwng, ond yn ddi-os, cyfrifoldeb San Steffan yw ein tywys drwy'r dirwasgiad a chynorthwyo Llywodraeth Cymru i ymateb i anghenion dwys Cymru. Nid yw'r arweiniad na'r cymorth hwnnw ar gael ar hyn o bryd, ac ofnaf fod bryd gwleidyddion San Steffan ar bethau eraill, megis pwy fydd yn symud i mewn i rif 10 Stryd Downing y flwyddyn nesaf. Unwaith eto, mae Cymru yn cael ei hesgeuluso, ei hynysu, a'i gorfodi i wneud y gorau y gall hi dan amgylchiadau anodd, a heb y mesurau trethiannol ac ariannol angenrheidiol i gyflawni'r gwaith.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Will you take an intervention?

Gareth Jones: No. If you just allow me to continue on this theme, perhaps I will allow you to intervene.

In this key debate, we could do without the spurious amendments devised by the Welsh Conservatives to tell us that the Welsh economy is weakened. In four of those amendments, they are specifically calling for greater financial support. Where will it come from? You are demanding increased funding

ac ni chafwyd y lefel o ail-greu ac ailfodelu gwasanaethau—galwch y peth yn ddiwygio, neu beth bynnag—er mwyn gwario'r arian hwnnw'n fwy effeithiol. Credaf y cafwyd diffyg cysylltiad sylweddol rhwng yr hyn a fwriadodd y Llywodraeth a'r hyn y mae cyrff cyhoeddus wedi gallu ei gyflawni, y mae angen ei ailystyried o ddifrif.

Gareth Jones: As we now know, the prospects of a number of economies have changed significantly. The United Kingdom, including Wales, has suffered a staggering decline in productivity and has suffered nearly the worst recession in the public expenditure sector of all Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development countries.

It is certainly true that the crisis was not caused by the Welsh Government. It could be argued that the crisis was not caused by the Westminster Government, but it is, undoubtedly, the responsibility of Westminster to guide us through the recession and to assist the Welsh Government to respond to the intense needs of Wales. That leadership and assistance is not currently forthcoming, and I worry that Westminster politicians have set their sights on other things, such as who will be moving into 10 Downing Street next year. Once again, Wales is being sidelined and ignored, and forced to do the best that it can in difficult circumstances, without the fiscal and taxation tools necessary to do the job.

Andrew R.T. Davies: A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

Gareth Jones: Na wna. Os caniatewch imi barhau ar y thema hon, efallai y caniatâf ichi ymyrryd.

Yn y ddadl allweddol hon, gallem wneud heb y gwelliannau annilys a ddyfeisiwyd gan Geidwadwyr Cymru i ddweud wrthym fod economi Cymru wedi gwanhau. Mewn pedwar o'r gwelliannau hynny, maent yn galw'n benodol am fwy o gymorth ariannol. O ble y daw? Yr ydych yn galw am gyllid

for education, local government, and economic development, but these are totally unrealistic demands. They are unrealistic because the only government that can respond to such demands on that scale is the Westminster Government. I hear nothing but silence from Brown and Cameron. Wales is suffering and those who could help do nothing.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you, Gareth, for taking an intervention. Do you acknowledge that the budget that is before us today is of such a size because we are part of the union that is the United Kingdom? You have not laid out a plan of how you would fund your aspirations if you had your wish of an independent Wales.

Gareth Jones: We have always had great aspirations and we have the ingenuity, but sometimes we do not have the funding for obvious reasons.

Being on our own is not a new situation for the people of Wales. We have been let down on so many occasions by so many Westminster Governments that we have come to realise that we must use the limited resources and powers that we have in this Assembly in the most effective and enterprising way. That is why, in the teeth of this depression, we have our Ministers battling hard, and none more so than Ieuan Wyn Jones, to counter the economic and social hardships facing us today. That is what this budget is about; it is about facing up to the realities of unemployment, with schemes such as ReAct and ProAct; it is about planning ahead, training, re-skilling, and providing new skills to our people for the post-recession era.

Joyce Watson: Will you take an intervention?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Gareth is not taking an intervention.

Gareth Jones: Do not forget that it is also about implementing those key aspects of the

ychwanegol ar gyfer addysg, llywodraeth leol, a datblygu economaidd, ond galwadau cwbl afrealistig yw'r rhain. Maent yn afrealistig am mai Llywodraeth San Steffan yw'r unig lywodraeth a all ymateb i alwadau o'r fath ar y raddfa honno. Ni chlywaf ddim ond distawrwydd gan Brown a Cameron. Mae Cymru'n dioddef ac nid yw'r rhai a allai helpu'n gwneud dim.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch, Gareth, am dderbyn ymyriad. A ydych yn cydnabod bod y gyllideb sydd o'n blaen heddiw o gystal maint oherwydd ein bod yn rhan o undeb y Deyrnas Unedig? Nid ydych wedi amlinellu cynllun ar gyfer sut y byddech yn ariannu eich dyheadau pe caech eich dymuniad am Gymru annibynnol.

Gareth Jones: Yr ydym bob amser wedi cael dyheadau mawr ac mae'r dyfeisgarwch gennym, ond weithiau nid yw'r arian gennym, am resymau amlwg.

Nid yw bod ar ein pen ein hunain yn sefyllfa newydd i bobl Cymru. Yr ydym wedi cael ein siomi gynifer o weithiau gan gynifer o Lywodraethau yn San Steffan nes dod i sylweddoli bod yn rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r adnoddau a'r pwerau cyfyngedig sydd gennym yn y Cynulliad hwn yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol a mentrus. Dyna pam, yn nannedd y dirwasgiad hwn, y mae ein Gweinidogion yn brwydro'n galed, a neb yn fwy felly na Ieuan Wyn Jones, i weithio yn erbyn y caledi economaidd a chymdeithasol sy'n ein hwynebu heddiw. Dyna fyrdwn y gyllideb hon; mae a wnelo ag wynebu realiti diweithdra, gyda chynlluniau fel ReAct a ProAct; mae a wnelo â chynllunio ymlaen, hyfforddi, ailsgilio a darparu sgiliau newydd i'n pobl ar gyfer y cyfnod ôl-ddirwasgiad.

Joyce Watson: A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw Gareth yn cymryd ymyriad.

Gareth Jones: Cofiwch fod a wnelo hyn hefyd â gweithredu agweddau allweddol

'One Wales' agreement, which will improve the quality of life for the people of Wales. Addressing fuel poverty, eradicating child poverty, preventing house repossessions, funding affordable homes: you have not mentioned any of these important key social aspects. There has been nothing at all; just politics. Hospitals, school buildings—

Nick Ramsay: I did. It is getting more bizarre by the minute.

Gareth Jones: You used the word 'bizarre', Nick. The way that you go about it is bizarre. Helping pensioners with council tax, giving reliable advice through citizens advice bureaux and so on, revitalising towns and communities: that is what this draft budget is about, and the list goes on. The Tories moan and criticise simply to make political capital. Wales is facing a difficult time. We are on our own, but we have the calibre of leadership and the vision to take us through these difficult times. I urge you to support the draft budget and the endeavours of the One Wales Government.

Trish Law: I support the amendments tabled by the Conservatives and Liberal Democrats, particularly those relating to education, the economy and local government. I am particularly supportive of amendment 8 as I feel that neither the draft budget nor the Assembly Government acknowledges the importance of education and training in preparing Wales for future economic growth.

The draft budget will have significant repercussions in terms of the ability of schools to provide the high-quality education service to which Wales aspires. The proposals represent real-term cuts to the education provision for our schools on top of the year-on-year efficiency savings that they have consistently been forced to make. Pupils in our schools are already funded £496 per head a year less on average than those in England. So, schools are significantly underfunded, and that is having a severe

cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', a fydd yn gwella ansawdd bywyd i bobl Cymru. Delio â thlodi tanwydd, dileu tlodi plant, atal adfeddiannu tai, ariannu tai fforddiadwy: nid ydych wedi crybwyll yr un o'r agweddau cymdeithasol allweddol hyn. Ni chafwyd dim byd o gwbl; dim ond gwleidyddiaeth. Ysbytai, adeiladau ysgolion—

Nick Ramsay: Do yn wir. Mae'n mynd yn fwy bisâr bob munud.

Gareth Jones: Defnyddiasoch y gair 'bisâr', Nick. Y ffordd yr ewch chi o'i chwmpas hi sy'n bisâr. Helpu pensïynwyr gyda'u treth gyngor, rhoi cyngor dibynadwy drwy ganolfannau cynghori ac ati, adfywio trefi a chymunedau: dyna fyrdwn y gyllideb ddrafft hon, ac â'r rhestr yn ei blaen. Mae'r Torïaid yn cwyno ac yn beirniadu dim ond er mwyn gwneud elw gwleidyddol. Mae Cymru'n wynebu adeg anodd. Yr ydym ar ein pen ein hun, ond mae gennym y safon o arweinyddiaeth a'r weledigaeth i'n cludo drwy'r adeg anodd hon. Fe'ch anogaf i gefnogi'r gyllideb ddrafft ac ymdrechion Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un.

Trish Law: Cefnogaf y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn enwedig y rhai ynglŷn ag addysg, yr economi a llywodraeth leol. Yr wyf yn arbennig o gefnogol i welliant 8 gan y teimlaf nad yw'r gyllideb ddrafft na Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd addysg a hyfforddiant i baratoi Cymru ar gyfer twf economaidd yn y dyfodol.

Caiff y gyllideb ddrafft ôl-ffeithiau arwyddocaol yn nhermau gallu ysgolion i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth addysg o ansawdd uchel y mae Cymru'n ei ddeisyfu. Mae'r cynigion yn golygu torïadau mewn termau real yn y ddarpariaeth addysg i'n hysgolion ar ben yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd y'u gorfodwyd i'w gwneud yn gyson o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Caiff disgyblion yn ein hysgolion eisoes eu hariannu £496 y pen yn llai ar gyfartaledd na disgyblion yn Lloegr. Felly, mae ysgolion wedi'u tanariannu'n sylweddol,

effect on jobs, resources, curriculum choice and class sizes. Continued underfunding is having a negative impact on our children, our schools and our communities, and that must be of concern to us all.

As far as higher and further education are concerned, I fear that the efficiency savings of 5 per cent being demanded of Welsh universities and colleges next year will have yet another devastating effect on colleges such as Coleg Gwent, which has been underfunded for years and which is continuously playing a losing game of catch-up. The cruellest cut affecting my constituency this year has been the closure of Stepping Stones Nursery at the college's Ebbw Vale campus. This has had the immediate effect of denying single parents the chance to better themselves by going on to further education. Coleg Gwent has already cut to the bone. Imposing a further 5 per cent cut is bound to have a devastating impact at the chalkface.

Of course, I accept the Finance Committee's conclusion that the Assembly Government, in drafting this budget, makes no significant changes to its spending plans in response to the economic downturn.

Local government has again been clobbered and Welsh councils are of one mind: that the biggest barriers to economic recovery is the lack of finance and the very serious revenue hit due to continuing harsh financial settlements. Overall, next year, councils will see an average increase of 2.1 per cent, the lowest increase since devolution. As usual, Blaenau Gwent gets well below average, with an increase of just 1.5 per cent. It is going to mean tough decisions for Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council, and there is no doubt that there will be further orchestrated opposition to the cuts, for cuts there will surely have to be. The only saving grace for Blaenau Gwent is that the council anticipated an even worse settlement for 2010-11. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government

ac mae hynny'n cael effaith ddifrifol ar swyddi, adnoddau, dewis cwricwlwm a maint dosbarthiadau. Mae tanariannu parhaus yn cael effaith negyddol ar ein plant, ein hysgolion a'n cymunedau, a rhaid i hynny fod yn destun pryder i bawb ohonom.

O ran addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, ofnaf y caiff yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant y mynnir bod prifysgolion a cholegau Cymru'n eu gwneud y flwyddyn nesaf effaith ddifaol eto fyth ar golegau fel Coleg Gwent, sydd wedi'i danariannu ers blynyddoedd ac sydd o hyd yn ceisio ennill tir heb lwyddiant. Y toriad creulonaf sy'n effeithio ar fy etholaeth i eleni fu cau Meithrinfa Stepping Stones ar gampws y coleg yng Nglynebwy. Effaith hyn yn syth fu gwrthod i rieni sengl y cyfle i wella'u hunain trwy fynd ymlaen i addysg bellach. Mae Coleg Gwent eisoes wedi torri i'r asgwrn. Mae gorfodi toriad pellach o 5 y cant yn rhwym o gael effaith ddifaol ar lawr y dosbarth.

Wrth gwrs, derbyniaf gasgliad y Pwyllgor Cyllid nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, wrth ddrafftio'r gyllideb hon, yn gwneud newidiadau arwyddocaol i'w chynlluniau gwariant mewn ymateb i'r dirywiad economaidd.

Mae llywodraeth leol wedi cael cosfa unwaith eto ac mae cynghorau Cymru'n unfryd: mai'r rhwystrau mwyaf i adferiad economaidd yw'r diffyg cyllid a'r ergyd ddifrifol iawn i refeniw yn sgîl setliadau ariannol caled parhaus. Yn gyffredinol, y flwyddyn nesaf, gwêl cynghorau gynnydd ar gyfartaledd o 2.1 y cant, y cynnydd isaf ers datganoli. Fel arfer, caiff Blaenau Gwent gryn dipyn yn llai na'r cyfartaledd, gyda chynnydd o 1.5 y cant yn unig. Mae'n mynd i olygu penderfyniadau caled i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent, ac nid oes dim dwywaith na threfnir mwy o wrthwynebiad i'r toriadau, gan y bydd rhaid cael toriadau yn ddi-os. Yr unig achubiaeth i Flaenau Gwent yw bod y cyngor wedi rhagweld setliad gwaeth fyth ar gyfer 2010-

rethinks this draft budget to release the shackles from education and local government in order to ensure a brighter post-recession future for Wales.

Joyce Watson: We have heard a great deal about the budget settlement, but it is not warm words or threats that make any difference to the people out there—it is action that usually speaks loudest. This budget settlement comes in very difficult times. I must take issue with something that has been said, and this is a fairly obvious point: Wales is not swimming along on its own, but it is in receipt of money from a Westminster block grant. The union is still in place as far as I know; it has not been severed. I just thought I would make that obvious point.

5.20 p.m.

Turning to some of the key points, as a member of the Finance Committee, I pay due regard to all those who worked very hard to put this together. It was a difficult report, and some robust debate took place in bringing it to where it is. To go back to where I started, it is, nonetheless, actions that speak. It is foolhardy to ignore—as some are trying to do today—the actions that have been taken as a direct consequence of the recession in which we find ourselves. Many of those items have been discussed at length, including ReAct, ProAct, and the bringing forward of capital investment—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will you give way?

Joyce Watson: I will in a minute, but not now. ReAct, ProAct and the bringing forward of capital investment have all helped to save jobs. Let us be clear about why we brought forward that capital investment when we did: it was the only game in town at that time for the construction industry. It saved or created a total of 2,000 jobs in Wales—here in Wales and now in Wales. We need to be clear about the actions that have been taken. Ministers from both sides joined forces to take those

11. Gobeithio y gwnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ailystyried y gyllideb ddrafft hon i ryddhau'r cadwynau ar addysg a llywodraeth leol er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol gwell wedi'r dirwasgiad i Gymru.

Joyce Watson: Yr ydym wedi clywed cryn dipyn am setliad y gyllideb, ond nid geiriau mwyn na bygythiadau sy'n gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth i'r bobl ar lawr gwlad—gweithredoedd sy'n siarad yn fwyaf huawdl fel rheol. Daw'r setliad cyllideb hwn ar adeg anodd iawn. Rhaid imi anghytuno â rhywbeth a ddywedwyd, ac mae hyn yn bwynt eithaf amlwg: nid yw Cymru'n nofio ar ei phen ei hun, ond mae'n cael arian drwy grant crynswth o San Steffan. Mae'r undeb yn dal i sefyll hyd y gwn i; nid yw wedi'i dorri. Dim ond am wneud y pwynt amlwg hwnnw yr oeddwn.

A throi at rai o'r pwyntiau allweddol, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, rhoddaf barch dyledus i bawb a weithiodd yn galed iawn i ddod â hyn ynghyd. Yr oedd yn adroddiad anodd, a chafwyd dadlau cryf i ddod ag ef i'r fan lle y mae. A mynd yn ôl at y fan lle y dechreuais, gweithredoedd sy'n siarad, serch hynny. Rhyfygus yw anwybyddu—fel y mae rhai'n ceisio gwneud heddiw—y camau a gymerwyd o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r dirwasgiad y cawn ein hunain ynddo. Mae llawer o'r eitemau hynny wedi'u trafod yn hir, gan gynnwys ReAct, ProAct, a dod â buddsoddiad cyfalaf ymlaen—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnewch chi ildio?

Joyce Watson: Gwnaf mewn munud, ond nid yn awr. Mae ReAct, ProAct, a dod â buddsoddiad cyfalaf ymlaen i gyd wedi helpu achub swyddi. Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â pham y daethom â'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf hwnnw ymlaen pan wnaethom: dyna oedd yr unig siawns ar y pryd i'r diwydiant adeiladu. Llwyddodd i achub neu greu cyfanswm o 2,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru—yma yng Nghymru ac yn awr yng Nghymru. Mae angen inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â'r camau

real decisions in the here and now. There is also £34 million extra in the revenue support grant. However, one part of the draft budget concerns me, which has been mentioned several times today, and on which I would like the answers, namely the 5 per cent efficiency savings from the FE budget. I am concerned about that.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will you give way?

Joyce Watson: I will take an intervention now.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Your minute was up, although you were making an important point about the efficiency cut in respect of higher and further education. You referred earlier to the fact that we are financed through a block grant; we all understand that. The Barnett formula means that we do not get the amount of money that we deserve in Wales. The British Government—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is just an intervention, not a speech.

Joyce Watson: I have taken your point, as has the Government, and, as you know, there is a report on that point.

I do not want to say much more, except that I am concerned—and this has been raised several times today—about the 5 per cent efficiency savings relating to the FE budget. I also support the Finance Committee's immediate inquiry into the potential waste of £1 billion in the NHS.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I thank the Minister for finance for bringing forward the debate and for his opening remarks. I also thank the Finance Committee for its report, which has informed the debate today. Its scrutiny of the draft budget helps many Members who look

a gymerwyd. Ymunodd Gweinidogion o'r ddwy ochr i wneud y penderfyniadau real hynny, yma ac yn awr. Mae £34 miliwn ychwanegol hefyd yn y grant cynnal refeniw. Fodd bynnag, mae un rhan o'r gyllideb ddrafft yn peri pryder imi, sydd wedi'i chrybwyll sawl gwaith heddiw, ac yr hoffwn yr atebion yn ei chylch, sef yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant o'r gyllideb addysg bellach. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnewch chi ildio?

Joyce Watson: Cymeraf ymyriad yn awr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr oedd eich munud wedi dod i ben, er eich bod yn gwneud pwynt pwysig am y toriad effeithlonrwydd yng nghyswllt addysg bellach ac uwch. Cyfeiriasoch yn gynharach at y ffaith y cawn ein hariannu trwy grant crynswth; yr ydym i gyd yn deall hynny. Mae fformiwla Barnett yn golygu na chawn y swm o arian yr ydym yn ei haeddu yng Nghymru. Mae Llywodraeth Prydain—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Dim ond ymyriad yw hyn, nid araith.

Joyce Watson: Yr wyf wedi derbyn eich pwynt, fel y gwnaeth y Llywodraeth, ac, fel y gwyddoch, y mae adroddiad ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Nid wyf am ddweud llawer mwy, ac eithrio fy mod yn bryderus—ac mae hyn wedi'i godi sawl gwaith heddiw—ynghlŷn â'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant yng nghyswllt y gyllideb addysg bellach. Cefnogaf hefyd ymchwiliad di-oed y Pwyllgor Cyllid i'r gwastraff posibl o £1 biliwn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch i'r Gweinidog dros gyllid am gyflwyno'r ddadl ac am ei sylwadau agoriadol. Diolch hefyd i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid am ei adroddiad, sydd wedi bwydo'r ddadl heddiw. Mae'r modd y mae wedi craffu ar y gyllideb ddrafft yn helpu

at it from a distance by providing greater information and insight into what is going on when the Government is assessing its priorities.

One thing that worries me greatly about the draft budget is the fact that many of the operators on the frontbench of the Government's main party have been around for the full 10 years of devolution, filling various seats on that bench, and yet, sadly, the reforms that we are told time and again will stand us in good stead for the new economic dawn that we are supposed to be dealing with will be entrusted to the same operators. It was only a week or two ago that a leading member of the Government pointed out that public service delivery was lacking in Wales and that there was a need for greater change and reform, although that person was then put down by being described as being 'semi-detached' from the Government. I would welcome hearing the Minister for finance stating in his closing speech how he believes the draft budget sets Wales on course for greater public service delivery, albeit in a far tighter financial climate. While the debate is on the draft budget, one would hope that, ultimately, the Minister will be prepared to take on board many of the points that have been raised and to work with his colleagues in order to allay some of the very real fears that have been identified in Plenary today.

I endorse our amendment 2, on education, because it is a critical field of development that must be afforded to our young people and the adult community. One of the big losers in this budget is the adult community learning programmes, which have seen massive cuts. This harms many people who are in mid-life or in semi-retirement and who are looking to retrain and improve their skills. If these schemes are not available—and, by laying this budget, the Government seems to be indicating that it is not prepared to support them—then this will shut off an avenue that would have helped to create a remodelled workforce that many employers in the twenty-first century will be looking for.

llawer o Aelodau sy'n edrych arni o bell drwy roi mwy o wybodaeth a mewnwleidiad i'r hyn sydd yn mynd ymlaen wrth i'r Llywodraeth asesu ei blaenoriaethau.

Un peth sy'n fy mhoeni'n fawr am y gyllideb ddrafft yw'r ffaith bod llawer o'r gweithredwyr ar fainc flaen prif blaidd y Llywodraeth wedi bod yma drwy gydol 10 mlynedd datganoli, gan lenwi amryfal seddi ar y fainc honno, ac eto, yn anffodus, caiff y diwygiadau y dywedir wrthym dro ar ôl tro y byddant o les inni ar gyfer y wawr economaidd newydd yr ydym i fod i ymdrin â hi eu rhoi yng ngofal yr un gweithredwyr. Dim ond wythnos neu ddwy sydd wedi mynd heibio ers i aelod blaenllaw o'r Llywodraeth nodi bod cyflenwad gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ddiffygiol yng Nghymru a bod angen mwy o newid a diwygio, er y lladdwyd ar y person hwnnw wedyn drwy ddweud ei fod wedi 'lled-wahanu' oddi wrth y Llywodraeth. Croesawn glywed y Gweinidog dros gyllid yn datgan yn ei araith gloi sut y mae'n credu y mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn gosod Cymru ar y trywydd i gyflenwi mwy o wasanaethau cyhoeddus, er mewn hinsawdd ariannol lawer tynnach. Tra mai dadl ar y gyllideb ddrafft yw hon, y gobaith, yn y pen draw, fyddai y bydd y Gweinidog yn barod i dderbyn llawer o'r pwyntiau sydd wedi'u codi ac i weithio gyda'i gyd-Weinidogion er mwyn tawelu rhai o'r ofnau gwirioneddol iawn sydd wedi'u nodi yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw.

Cymeradwyaf ein gwelliant 2, ar addysg, oherwydd mae'n faes datblygu allweddol y mae'n rhaid ei ddarparu i'n pobl ifanc a'r gymuned oedolion. Un o'r collwyr mawr yn y gyllideb hon yw'r rhaglenni dysgu oedolion yn y gymuned, sydd wedi gweld toriadau enfawr. Mae hyn yn niweidio llawer o bobl sydd yng nghanol eu hoes neu wedi lledymddeol ac sy'n edrych i ailhyfforddi a gwella'u sgiliau. Os na fydd y cynlluniau hyn ar gael—a, thrwy osod y gyllideb hon, mae'n ymddangos bod y Llywodraeth yn dweud nad yw'n barod i'w cefnogi—yna bydd hyn yn cau llwybr a fuasai wedi helpu i greu gweithlu ail-luniedig y bydd llawer o gyflogwyr yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yn

edrych amdano.

How can we actively encourage people to come to Wales to set up if we do not have the workforce that should be shaping the destiny of Wales for tomorrow? It is a balanced economy and an economy with a larger private sector that will enable us to stand on our own two feet and to support more initiatives in Wales. I hope that the one thing that the Minister will identify when he responds to the debate today is that the budget that he and his colleagues have to operate is as great as it is because we are part of the union that is the United Kingdom. While the nationalists on the other side of the Chamber, as part of Government, might wish to make various allegations about opposition parties not having put forward some of the policies that they would like to see, they should front up and say what they would offer in an independent Wales to fund these services. We have heard much about Barnett today and, while it has many problems, more resource comes to Wales than would be the case through the tax take and given the population level. While we would all argue for more resources for Wales, we have to accept that the budget is the size that it is because we are part of the union that is the United Kingdom.

Nerys Evans: Can you guarantee that the Tories at a Westminster level, should you win the election next year, will not cut the Assembly's budget?

Andrew R.T. Davies: What I can guarantee is that, on the portfolio that I shadow, health spending in the next Government will have a real terms increase. That is something that no other party is prepared to stand by. It is something in which I have a particular interest. I am sure that you are aware of that and I am proud to tell you that today.

However, in relation to the health budget, we need to look at the evidence supplied by the Finance Committee. When Paul Davies, the

Sut y gallwn fynd ati i annog pobl i ddod i Gymru i ymsefydlu os nad oes gennym y gweithlu a ddylai fod yn ffurfio tynged Cymru yfory? Economi gytbwys ac economi â sector preifat mwy fydd yn ein galluogi i sefyll ar ein traed ein hunain a chynnal mwy o fentrau yng Nghymru. Gobeithio mai un o'r pethau y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei nodi wrth ymateb i'r ddadl heddiw yw bod y gyllideb sydd ganddo ef a'i gyd-Weinidogion i'w gweithio mor fawr ag y mae oherwydd ein bod yn rhan o undeb y Deyrnas Unedig. Tra hoffai'r cenedlaetholwyr ar ochr arall y Siambr, fel rhan o'r Llywodraeth, wneud amryfal honiadau bod y gwrthbleidiau heb gynnig rhai o'r polisiau yr hoffent eu gweld, dylent fod yn onest a dweud beth a gynigient hwy mewn Cymru annibynnol i dalu am y gwasanaethau hyn. Yr ydym wedi clywed llawer am Barnett heddiw ac, er bod iddi lawer o broblemau, daw mwy o adnoddau i Gymru nag a ddeuai drwy'r dreth ac o ystyried lefel y boblogaeth. Er y byddem i gyd yn dadlau dros fwy o adnoddau i Gymru, rhaid inni dderbyn bod y gyllideb gymaint ag y mae oherwydd ein bod yn rhan o undeb y Deyrnas Unedig.

Nerys Evans: A allwch warantu na fydd y Torïaid ar lefel San Steffan, pe enillech yr etholiad y flwyddyn nesaf, yn torri cyllideb y Cynulliad?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Yr hyn y gallaf ei warantu yw, ar y portffolio a gysgodaf i, y ceir cynnydd mewn termau real mewn gwariant ar iechyd yn y Llywodraeth nesaf. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth nad oes yr un blaid arall yn barod i'w arddel. Mae'n rhywbeth y mae gennyf ddiddordeb arbennig ynddo. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o hynny ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud hynny wrthy ch heddiw.

Fodd bynnag, mewn perthynas â'r gyllideb iechyd, mae angen inni edrych ar y dystiolaeth a ddarparwyd gan y Pwyllgor

chair of the NHS trust finance directors, gave evidence, he did not say that money needed to be taken out of the NHS budget; I think that we all accept that. However, he identified that there was a misspend—and we can take it that his organisation believes this, because the colleague who was with him at the meeting did not disagree; so it was a consensus view—and that a reprioritisation was needed within that budget. To hear the Government frontbench side with the Minister when she says that she is not prepared to look at that calls into question the ability of this Government to respond to situations that come out in scrutiny. This is a 20 per cent stake of your budget, Minister.

The reorganisation has been welcomed by many in the NHS as providing clear lines for the direction of the NHS in Wales. Going from 37 organisations to 10 will create opportunities for efficiencies. However, you have not been prepared to endorse that, because those efficiencies could create more doctor and nurse posts, which the NHS in Wales desperately needs. You know the deficit in the number of junior doctors in the NHS and your budget does not allow for that to be rectified, because it is padding out guaranteed salaries for the chief executives and finance directors who have been taken on as a result of the reorganisation. That cannot be right, Minister. I hope that you will work with your colleague to try to address it.

David Lloyd: Mae'n bleser gennyf gyfrannu at y ddadl ar y gyllideb ddrafft. Cefndir hyn oll yw'r argyfwng ariannol byd-eang a maint benthyciadau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, sydd wedi arwain at oblygiadau sylweddol iawn i gyllideb y Cynulliad. Byddwn yn gweld cyfyngu sylweddol ar yr arian sydd ar gael i'w wario ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru oherwydd bod yn rhaid talu llog ar yr holl fenthyciadau.

Yn ogystal â hyn oll, mae sefyllfa ariannol y Cynulliad yn annigonol ar y gorau, a hynny o

Cyllid. Pan roddodd Paul Davies, cadeirydd cyfarwyddwyr cyllid ymddiriedolaeth y GIG, dystiolaeth, ni ddywedodd fod angen cymryd arian allan o gyllideb y GIG; credaf ein bod i gyd yn derbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, fe nododd fod yno gamwario—a gallwn gymryd bod ei sefydliad yn credu hyn, oherwydd nid anghytunodd y cyfaill a oedd gydag ef yn y cyfarfod; felly yr oedd yn farn consensws—a bod angen ailflaenoriaethu o fewn y gyllideb honno. Mae clywed mainc flaen y Llywodraeth yn ochri gyda'r Gweinidog pan ddywed honno nad yw'n barod i edrych ar hynny yn bwrw amheuaeth ar allu'r Llywodraeth hon i ymateb i sefyllfaoedd a ddaw i'r fei wrth graffu. Mae hyn yn gyfran 20 y cant o'ch cyllideb, Weinidog.

Mae'r ad-drefnu wedi'i groesawu gan lawer yn y GIG gan y bydd yn rhoi llinellau clir ar gyfer cyfeiriad y GIG yng Nghymru. Bydd newid o 37 corff i 10 yn creu cyfleoedd i wneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd. Fodd bynnag, nid ydych wedi bod yn barod i gymeradwyo hynny, oherwydd gallai'r arbedion hynny greu mwy o swyddi meddygon a nyrsys, y mae dirfawr angen amdanynt ar y GIG yng Nghymru. Gwyddoch beth yw'r diffyg yn y nifer o feddygon iau yn y GIG ac nid yw eich cyllideb yn caniatáu cywiro hynny, am ei fod yn padio allan gyflogau gwarantedig i'r prif weithredwyr a'r cyfarwyddwyr cyllid sydd wedi'u cyflogi o ganlyniad i'r ad-drefnu. Ni all hynny fod yn iawn, Weinidog. Gobeithio y gweithiwch gyda'ch cyd-Weinidog i geisio'i gywiro.

David Lloyd: It is a pleasure to contribute to this debate on the draft budget. The background to this is the global financial crisis and the scale of the United Kingdom Government's loans, which have very significant implications for the Assembly budget. We will see significant squeezing of the amount of money available for public services in Wales as a result of interest payments on all the loans.

In addition, the Assembly's financial position is, at the best of times, inadequate as a result

ganlyniad i fformiwla annigonol Barnett, sy'n amddifadu Cymru o dros £400 miliwn bob blwyddyn ac a fydd yn amddifadu Cymru o £8.5 biliwn yn y blynyddoedd nesaf, hyd at 2020, yn ôl comisiwn annibynnol Holtham.

In terms of this Government's response to the current economic crisis, I will turn my attention to the housing portfolio and congratulate my colleague, the Deputy Minister for Housing, Jocelyn Davies, on all of her hard work in acting swiftly and spending wisely in response to the recession. Her decisions on spending were in line with the recommendations of the economic summits at the time, such as bringing forward capital spend in the construction industry and helping people to stay in their own homes.

5.30 p.m.

The Deputy Minister for Housing's mortgage rescue scheme was the first of its kind in the UK. It was a timely response to the housing crisis as a result of the credit crunch: £9 million was spent on keeping more than 100 families in their homes in Wales compared with the 10 people who were helped by England's later scheme. As for the Deputy Minister's following the Wales economic summit's recommendations to bring forward Assembly Government building programmes to benefit construction companies, she has secured £42 million in strategic capital investment funding for additional affordable housing. Housing associations were encouraged to buy properties that private developers could no longer develop as a result of the recession. That was done in full consultation and partnership, with all local authorities across Wales leading on which sites they wanted funding for, thereby funding the strategic priorities of local authorities, and 200 houses have been built as a result.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. That is a very interesting history, but can we stick to the draft budget?

of the inadequate Barnett formula, which deprives Wales of more than £400 million every year and which will, according to the independent Holtham commission, deprive Wales of £8.5 billion over the coming years up to 2020.

O ran ymateb y Llywodraeth hon i'r argyfwng economaidd presennol, trof fy sylw at y portffolio tai a llongyfarch fy nghyd-Aelod, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai, Jocelyn Davies, am ei holl waith caled yn gweithredu'n gyflym ac yn gwario'n ddoeth mewn ymateb i'r dirwasgiad. Yr oedd ei phenderfyniadau ar wario'n cyd-fynd ag argymhellion yr uwch-gynadleddau economaidd ar y pryd, fel dod ymlaen â gwariant cyfalaf yn y diwydiant adeiladu a helpu pobl i aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

Cynllun achub morgesi'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai oedd y cyntaf o'r fath yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr oedd yn ymateb amserol i'r argyfwng tai a ddaeth yn sgîl y wasgfa greddyd: gwariwyd £9 miliwn ar gadw mwy na 100 o deuluoedd yn eu cartrefi yng Nghymru o gymharu â'r 10 o bobl a gafodd gymorth gan gynllun diweddarach Lloegr. Wrth i'r Dirprwy Weinidog ddilyn argymhellion uwchgynhadledd economaidd Cymru i ddod â rhaglenni adeiladu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ymlaen er lles cwmnïau adeiladu, mae hi wedi sicrhau £42 miliwn o gyllid buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy ychwanegol. Anogwyd cymdeithasau tai i brynu eiddo na allai datblygwyr preifat eu datblygu mwyach oherwydd y dirwasgiad. Gwnaed hynny mewn ymgynghoriad a phartneriaeth lawn, wrth i bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru bennu pa safleoedd yr oedd arnynt eisiau arian ar eu cyfer, gan ariannu blaenoriaethau strategol yr awdurdodau lleol felly, ac mae 200 o dai wedi'u hadeiladu o ganlyniad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Dyna hanes diddorol iawn, ond a gawn ni lynu at y gyllideb ddrafft?

David Lloyd: That was an interesting intervention, DPO, and I will come to that now.

On 20 October 2009, the Deputy Minister for Housing announced an additional £20 million from the strategic capital investment fund. That will deliver yet more units of affordable housing, unlock stalled private sector sites with section 106 agreements, and enable work to start on public sector sites. The social housing grant budget has increased to £107.4 million per year to support housing associations in providing new affordable housing for rent or low-cost home ownership. According to the independent Work and Employment Research Unit, WAG is more than halfway towards meeting its target of building 6,500 additional affordable homes in Wales, with 3,252 homes already built to date. Bringing forward moneys from subsequent years in the budget, as requested by the economic summits, has therefore proven to be excellent management of limited resources. It has kept many in the construction industry in work.

Peter Black *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Are you taking an intervention from someone else besides me?

Peter Black: The 3,252 homes are not a net gain, because you have to take account of sales under the right to buy and demolitions. Therefore, you have actually increased the housing stock by about 2,200.

David Lloyd: Read the independent report: an additional 3,252 homes have already been built. No-one lives in houses that are about to be demolished. Read the report, Peter.

Jocelyn Davies ensured that limited funds were spent wisely and were well targeted, and she involved the local authorities in the

David Lloyd: Yr oedd hwnnw'n ymyriad diddorol, Ddirprwy Lywydd, a deuaif at hynny'n awr.

Ar 20 Hydref 2009, cyhoeddodd y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai £20 miliwn yn ychwanegol o'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau mwy eto o unedau tai fforddiadwy, yn datgloi safleoedd ataliedig y sector preifat gyda chytundebau adran 106, ac yn galluogi dechrau gwaith ar safleoedd sector cyhoeddus. Mae cyllideb y grant tai cymdeithasol wedi cynyddu i £107.4 miliwn y flwyddyn i gynorthwyo cymdeithasau tai i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy newydd i'w rhentu neu i berchentyaeth cost isel. Yn ôl yr Uned Ymchwil i Waith a Chyflogaeth annibynnol, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dros hanner y ffordd tuag at gyrraedd ei tharged o adeiladu 6,500 o dai fforddiadwy ychwanegol yng Nghymru, gyda 3,252 o dai eisoes wedi'u hadeiladu hyd yma. Mae dod ag arian ymlaen o flynyddoedd dilynol yn y gyllideb, fel y gofynnodd yr uwchgynadleddau economaidd, wedi profi felly i fod yn rheolaeth ragorol ar adnoddau cyfyngedig. Mae wedi cadw llawer mewn gwaith yn y diwydiant adeiladu.

Peter Black *a gododd—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A ydych yn derbyn ymyriad gan rywun arall heblaw fi?

Peter Black: Nid yw'r 3,252 o gartrefi'n enillion net, oherwydd rhaid ichi ystyried gwerthiannau dan yr hawl i brynu a thai a dymchwelwyd. Felly, yr ydych wedi ychwanegu rhyw 2,200 at y stoc dai mewn gwirionedd.

David Lloyd: Darllenwch yr adroddiad annibynnol: mae 3,252 o gartrefi ychwanegol eisoes wedi'u hadeiladu. Nid oes neb yn byw mewn tai sydd ar fin cael eu dymchwel. Darllenwch yr adroddiad, Peter.

Sicrhaodd Jocelyn Davies y gwariwyd arian cyfyngedig yn ddoeth a'i fod wedi'i dargedu'n dda, a chynhwysodd yr

decisions. She deserves widespread commendation for her work.

Mark Isherwood: Rhodri Morgan said that he was confident of delivering economic prosperity for Wales but, after 10 years of devolution, double budgets and billions of euros of funding, Wales is the poorest nation or region of the UK with the highest rate of unemployment. What a missed opportunity. What a testament to failure.

The Prime Minister said that the UK's economy was the best placed to deal with the global downturn, but we are still in recession while our major competitors are in recovery. This year, the UK Government will have to borrow up to £200 billion, with interest alone standing at £43 billion, and the national debt at £1.4 trillion. The cost of the benefits system alone has risen from £93 billion in 1997 to £193 billion today. It was Gordon Brown who removed powers from the Bank of England to control the amount of debt in the economy and who scrapped the Mortgage Code Compliance Board. To those of us working in the sector who were qualified banking professionals, it was as plain as Pinocchio's nose that toxic debt would destroy our economy. We must now repair the damage caused by Gordon Brown's light-touch regulatory world, going from an economy built on debt to one that saves and spends prudently.

Jeff Cuthbert: I assume that, at some point, you will actually come on to talk about the budget. When you do, perhaps you will explain to us how the spending in Wales will be improved if your party at Westminster has its way—God forbid—and cuts the moneys coming into Wales significantly. How would matters improve in that scenario?

Mark Isherwood: Jeff, whenever you talk, you remind me of the words of the great philosopher Plato, who said that a wise man talks when he has something to say, a fool when he has to say something.

awdurdodau lleol yn y penderfyniadau. Mae hi'n haeddu clod gan bawb am ei gwaith.

Mark Isherwood: Dywedodd Rhodri Morgan ei fod yn hyderus o ddod â ffyniant economaidd i Gymru ond, ar ôl 10 mlynedd o ddatganoli, dyblu cyllidebau a biliynau o ewros o gyllid, Cymru yw gwlad neu ranbarth tlotaf y Deyrnas Unedig gyda'r gyfradd ddiweithdra uchaf. Dyna golli cyfle. Dyna destament i fethiant.

Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog fod economi'r Deyrnas Unedig yn y sefyllfa orau i ddelio â'r dirywiad byd-eang, ond yr ydym yn dal mewn dirwasgiad tra bod ein prif gystadleuwyr yn ymadfer. Eleni, bydd raid i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig gael benthg hyd at £200 biliwn, gyda llog yn unig yn sefyll ar £43 biliwn, a'r ddyled genedlaethol yn £1.4 triliwn. Mae cost y system fudd-daliadau'n unig wedi codi o £93 biliwn yn 1997 i £193 biliwn heddiw. Gordon Brown a gymerodd bwerau oddi wrth Fanc Lloegr i reoli swm y ddyled yn yr economi ac a sgrapiodd y Bwrdd Cydymffurfiaeth â'r Cod Morgeisi. I'r rheiny ohonom yn gweithio yn y sector a oedd yn fancwyr proffesiynol cymwysedig, yr oedd mor amlwg â thrwyn Pinocio y byddai dyled wenwynig yn difa'n heonomi. Rhaid inni'n awr atgyweirio'r difrod a achoswyd gan fyd rheoleiddio ysgafndroed Gordon Brown, a mynd o fod yn economi a adeiladwyd ar ddyled i un sy'n cynilo ac yn gwario'n ddoeth.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn cymryd, ar ryw bwynt, y dewch ymlaen i siarad am y gyllideb. Pan wnewch, efallai yr eglurwch inni sut y caiff y gwariant yng Nghymru ei wella os caiff eich plaid chi yn San Steffan ei ffordd—Duw a'n gwaredo—a chwtogi'n sylweddol ar yr arian a ddaw i mewn i Gymru. Sut y byddai pethau'n gwella yn y sefyllfa honno?

Mark Isherwood: Jeff, bob tro y siaradwch, yr ydych yn f'atgoffa o eiriau'r athronydd mawr Platon, a ddywedodd fod dyn doeth yn siarad pan fydd ganddo rywbeth i'w ddweud, a ffwl pan fydd yn rhaid iddo ddweud

rhywbeth.

We must be honest with the electorate about the cuts that Labour is imposing now. This month's blueprint for action from Homes for All Cymru, a coalition of 16 key organisations, stated that

'There is a crisis in Wales... This is not a new crisis, although the economic downturn is making it even worse. The current housing system has been failing for a long time... The consequences for the health and well being of people and the stability of communities in Wales is dire... We can not continue to tinker with a failed housing system. We need to work towards new ways of providing, managing and looking after homes in Wales.'

That was this month. However, housing faces a funding black hole in this draft budget. Capital spending for housing is to fall by 25 per cent, or 17.1 per cent excluding SCIF funding. That is a cut of £91 million, £40 million of which was money brought forward. That will take away a vital lifeline to the construction industry and threaten social cohesion when Wales is still in recession. We welcome plans for a new Welsh housing bond, but we note that the Welsh Government is still unclear about its equity contribution, which will be required to plug funding gaps ranging from social housing to stock transfer.

Housing is the key vehicle for social and economic regeneration. However, affordable housing cuts, which started a decade ago, cross-subsidised the Communities First programme that was intended to tackle deprivation. Although the funding for Communities First has been cut in this draft budget, it is still the largest component of the social justice budget. The Wales Audit Office has identified major failings in the Communities First programme. In a private meeting, it told me that the programme has emerged from chaos. It was not planned and there was an absence of basic financial and human resource planning before the

Rhaid inni fod yn onest gyda'r etholwyr ynglŷn â'r toriadau y mae Llafur yn eu gorfodi'n awr. Dyma a ddywedodd glasbrint gweithredu'r mis yma gan Cartrefi i Bawb Cymru, clymblaid o 16 o gyrff allweddol:

'Mae argyfwng yng Nghymru... Nid argyfwng newydd yw hwn, er bod y dirywiad economaidd yn ei wneud yn waeth fyth. Mae'r system dai gyfredol yn methu ers tro byd... Mae'r canlyniadau i iechyd a lles pobl a sefydlogrwydd cymunedau yng Nghymru'n enbyd... Ni allwn barhau i botsian gyda system dai sydd wedi methu. Mae angen inni weithio tuag at ffyrdd newydd o ddarparu, rheoli a gofalu am gartrefi yng Nghymru.'

Y mis yma oedd hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae tai'n wynebu twll du ariannol yn y gyllideb ddrafft hon. Bydd gwariant cyfalaf ar dai'n cwmpo 25 y cant, neu 17.1 y cant heb gynnwys arian y gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol. Dyna doriad o £91 miliwn, £40 miliwn ohono'n arian a ddygwyd ymlaen. Bydd hynny'n cipio rhaff achub hanfodol oddi wrth y diwydiant adeiladu ac yn bygwth cydlyniant cymdeithasol a Chymru'n dal mewn dirwasgiad. Croesawn gynlluniau ar gyfer bond tai newydd i Gymru, ond nodwn fod Llywodraeth Cymru'n dal yn aneglur ynglŷn â'i chyfraniad ecwiti, y bydd ei angen i lenwi bylchau ariannu'n amrywio o dai cymdeithasol i drosglwyddo stoc.

Tai yw'r prif gyfrwng ar gyfer adfywio cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Fodd bynnag, defnyddiwyd toriadau mewn tai fforddiadwy, a ddechreuwyd ddegawd yn ôl, i draws-noddi rhaglen Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, y bwriadwyd iddi fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd. Er bod cyllid Cymunedau'n Gyntaf wedi'i dorri yn y gyllideb ddrafft hon, dyna gydran fwyaf y gyllideb gyfiawnder cymdeithasol o hyd. Mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wedi nodi diffygion mawr yn rhaglen Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Mewn cyfarfod preifat, dywedodd wrthyf fod y rhaglen wedi codi o anhrefn. Ni chafodd ei chynllunio ac ni fu dim cynllunio ariannol ac adnoddau dynol sylfaenol cyn

programme was launched. Bids were therefore not assessed properly, monitoring was weak, and there was no evidence that anything was ever done with the feedback. In a time of plenty, the Welsh Government invested more than £200 million of taxpayers' money unprofessionally and wastefully. Meanwhile, the proportion of the programme's budget spent on actual projects has fallen to just 9 per cent during this third Assembly. So much for better outcomes.

Research from the Joseph Rowntree Foundation indicated that more children in poverty live outside rather than inside Communities First areas. Children in Wales has said that it is time to move away from the system by which a family on one side of the street can access support, but a family living across the street in a worse financial situation cannot. If we are to remake society and tackle a broken Wales, we must move from state action to social action, with Government helping to engineer the shift. We must empower public and voluntary sector organisations to fight poverty and injustice, but funding for social enterprise and the third sector has flatlined in this draft budget. The Welsh Government talks of efficiencies when it means cuts. Real efficiency will require the redirection of funding from administering big Government schemes to supporting poverty fighters working on the front line in our communities. We cannot spend more but we must spend much, much better.

The Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery (Andrew Davies): Whenever I hear Mark Isherwood talk, I am reminded of the saying—although I cannot remember who said it—that incoherence lends him an air of profundity.

On the process issues, Angela Burns, Chair of the Finance Committee, said that there was not enough time to scrutinise the budget. As I

lansio'r rhaglen. Felly, ni chafodd ceisiadau eu hasesu'n iawn, yr oedd y monitro'n wan, ac nid oedd dim tystiolaeth y gwnaed unrhyw beth erioed gyda'r adborth. Mewn cyfnod o ddigonedd, buddsoddodd y Llywodraeth hon fwy na £200 miliwn o arian y trethdalwyr yn amhroffesiynol ac yn wastraffus. Yn y cyfamser, mae'r gyfran o gyllideb y rhaglen a wariwyd ar brosiectau go iawn wedi cwmpo i ddim ond 9 y cant yn ystod y trydydd Cynulliad hwn. Wfft i ganlyniadau gwell.

Dangosodd ymchwil gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree fod mwy o blant mewn tlodi'n byw y tu allan i ardaloedd Cymunedau'n Gyntaf nag o'u mewn. Mae Plant yng Nghymru wedi dweud ei bod yn bryd symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth y system lle gall teulu ar un ochr i'r stryd gael cymorth, ond nid teulu ar draws y stryd sydd mewn sefyllfa ariannol waeth. Os ydym am ail-lunio cymdeithas a mynd i'r afael â Chymru sydd wedi torri, rhaid inni symud oddi wrth weithredu gan y wladwriaeth i weithredu cymdeithasol, a rhaid i'r Llywodraeth helpu sicrhau'r symudiad. Rhaid rhoi grym i gyrff y sector cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol i ymladd tlodi ac anghyfiawnder, ond mae cyllid ar gyfer menter gymdeithasol a'r trydydd sector wedi aros yn ei unfan yn y gyllideb ddrafft hon. Sonia Llywodraeth Cymru am arbedion effeithlonrwydd pan yw'n golygu toriadau. Bydd effeithlonrwydd go iawn yn gofyn am ailgyfeirio cyllid oddi wrth weinyddu cynlluniau mawr y Llywodraeth i gynorthwyo ymladdwyr tlodi sy'n gweithio ar y rheng flaen yn ein cymunedau. Ni allwn wario mwy ond rhaid inni wario'n llawer, llawer gwell.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Andrew Davies): Pryd bynnag y clywaf Mark Isherwood yn siarad, fe'm hatgoffir am y dywediad—er na allaf gofio pwy a'i dywedodd—fod ei glapiogrwydd yn rhoi ymddangosiad o ddyfnder iddo.

Ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r broses, dywedodd Angela Burns, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid, nad oedd digon o amser i

said in my opening remarks, by laying the draft budget a day early, I allowed the committee eight extra days. If the committee feels that there is insufficient time to allow proper scrutiny of the budget, it is a matter for the committee and the Assembly to make those decisions. Many of the points that have been made have been about our strategic priorities, questioning whether we have the right priorities. I agree with Gareth Jones about the Conservatives' amendments. They are asking for more money to be spent on economic development and on other priorities such as education and business support, but they do not say where the money would have to be moved from. As a responsible and prudent Government, we have to make decisions about spending priorities. At least the Liberal Democrats, in their proposals, said where they felt the money should be reallocated from within existing resources.

5.40 p.m.

Nick Ramsay: There is £50 million in the health budget that has not been allocated. We have said that we would look at allocating that money. Can you tell us what it is for?

Andrew Davies: I made the point in the Finance Committee's most recent scrutiny session that that £50 million in the NHS budget is, in effect, a reserve to deal with emerging pressures such as those caused by swine flu. We have had discussions with the UK Government about the use of resources and who is to pay for dealing with the swine flu epidemic. If we were to use that money, and then find that we had to pay for treating the epidemic, you and your party would no doubt be the first to criticise us for the imprudent management of resources. As a Government, we feel that we have made the right decisions. People say that 'One Wales' should be ripped up or that we should reprioritise, but if we were to do that, your party and the Liberal Democrats would be the first to say that we had flip-flopped or had

graffu ar y gyllideb. Fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, trwy gyflwyno'r gyllideb ddrafft ddiwrnod yn gynnar, rhoddais wyth diwrnod ychwanegol i'r pwyllgor. Os teimla'r pwyllgor nad oes digon o amser i ganiatáu craffu'n iawn ar y gyllideb, mater i'r pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad yw gwneud y penderfyniadau hynny. Pwyntiau am ein blaenoriaethau strategol yw llawer o'r pwyntiau a wnaed, gan gwestiynu a oes gennym y blaenoriaethau iawn. Cytunaf â Gareth Jones ynghylch gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr. Maent yn gofyn am wario mwy o arian ar ddatblygu economaidd ac ar flaenoriaethau eraill fel addysg a chymorth i fusnes, ond ni ddywedant o ble y byddai'n rhaid symud yr arian. Fel Llywodraeth gyfrifol a doeth, rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau am flaenoriaethau gwario. O leiaf fe ddywedodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn eu cynigion hwy, o ble y teimlent y dylid ailddyrannu'r arian o fewn yr adnoddau sy'n bodoli.

Nick Ramsay: Mae £50 miliwn yn y gyllideb iechyd sydd heb ei ddyrannu. Yr ydym wedi dweud yr ystyriem ddyrannu'r arian hwnnw. A allwch ddweud wrthym beth yw diben hwnnw?

Andrew Davies: Gwneuthum y pwynt yn sesiwn graffu ddiweddaraf y Pwyllgor Cyllid fod y £50 miliwn hwnnw yng nghyllideb y GIG, i bob pwrpas, yn gronfa wrth gefn i ddelio â phwysau a ddaw i'r amlwg fel y rhai a achoswyd gan y fflw moch. Yr ydym wedi cael trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ynglŷn â defnyddio adnoddau a phwy sydd i dalu am ddelio ag epidemig y fflw moch. Pe defnyddiem yr arian hwnnw, ac wedyn canfod bod yn rhaid inni dalu am drin yr epidemig, chi a'ch plaid yn ddi-os fyddai'r cyntaf i'n beirniadu am reolaeth annoeth ar adnoddau. Fel Llywodraeth, teimlwn ein bod wedi gwneud y penderfyniadau iawn. Dywed pobl y dylid sgrapio 'Cymru'n Un' neu y dylem ailflaenoriaethu, ond pe gwnaem hynny, eich plaid chi a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol

changed our priorities. This coalition Government's programme for government is 'One Wales', and that is what we will be judged on in the Assembly elections in 2011.

We have reallocated resources, and I absolutely reject any allegation that we have not dealt with the recession or taken urgent measures to deal with it. I itemised those measures in my opening speech, so I will not go through them again. Specific issues have come up today, and education was consistently among them. It is just not true that there has been a real-terms cut in the education budget. Excluding the supplementary budget figures from this year's budget, there has been a real-terms increase of 2.5 per cent in the education budget. It is just not true to say that the budget has been cut. Neither is it true to say that the FE and HE budgets have been cut. In fact, funding for work-based learning and sixth forms has gone up in the learner provision budget from £545 million in 2009-10 to more than £552 million. Effectively, that is a flatlining of the budget but given what the Minister for education has said about efficiencies, an increase in the volume of learning under a flatlined budget will represent an efficiency saving. That represents greater productivity by the sector, and the same is true of HE. In addition, £530 million of capital expenditure has been announced by the Minister this year, so this idea that we have somehow neglected education is absolute rubbish.

The issue of child poverty was raised. We have protected early years intervention through Flying Start and the foundation phase. It is a priority for this Government, and we will be judged on our performance. We feel that early years intervention is not only the best educationally, but also the best way of dealing with issues of deprivation.

On the health service, the Minister for health and I have been clear about this. In the Finance Committee, I said that if the finance

fyddai'r cyntaf i ddweud ein bod wedi gwneud tro pedol neu wedi newid ein blaenoriaethau. 'Cymru'n Un' yw rhaglen lywodraeth y Llywodraeth glymblaid hon, a dyna beth y'n bernir arno yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2011.

Yr ydym wedi ailddyrranu adnoddau, a gwrthodaf yn llwyr unrhyw honiad nad ydym wedi delio â'r dirwasgiad nac wedi cymryd camau brys i ddelio ag ef. Rhestrais y mesurau hynny yn fy araith agoriadol, felly ni wnaif fynd trwyddynt eto. Mae materion penodol wedi codi heddiw, ac addysg yn eu plith yn gyson. Yn syml, nid yw'n wir y bu toriad mewn termau real yn y gyllideb addysg. Gan hepgor ffigurau'r gyllideb atodol o gyllideb eleni, bu cynnydd mewn termau real o 2.5 y cant yn y gyllideb addysg. Yn syml, nid yw'n wir dweud bod y gyllideb wedi'i thorri. Nid yw'n wir ychwaith dweud bod cyllidebau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch wedi'u torri. Mewn gwirionedd, mae cyllid ar gyfer dysgu seiliedig ar waith a chweched dosbarthau wedi codi yn y gyllideb darpariaeth dysgwyr o £545 miliwn yn 2009-10 i dros £552 miliwn. I bob diben, mae'r gyllideb yn aros yn ei hunfan ond o gofio'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog addysg am arbedion effeithlonrwydd, bydd cynnydd ym maint y dysgu dan gyllideb sydd yn ei hunfan yn golygu arbediad effeithlonrwydd. Mae hynny'n golygu mwy o gynhyrchiant gan y sector, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am addysg uwch. At hynny, cyhoeddwyd £530 miliwn o wariant cyfalaf gan y Gweinidog eleni, felly rwtsh llwyr yw'r syniad hwn ein bod rywsut wedi esgeuluso addysg.

Codwyd mater tlodi plant. Yr ydym wedi gwarchod ymyriad y blynyddoedd cynnar drwy Dechrau'n Deg a'r cyfnod sylfaen. Mae'n flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth hon, a chawn ein barnu ar ein perfformiad. Teimlwn fod ymyriad blynyddoedd cynnar nid yn unig yn orau yn addysgol, ond hefyd y ffordd orau o ddelio â materion amddifadedd.

Am y gwasanaeth iechyd, mae'r Gweinidog dros iechyd a mi wedi bod yn glir ynglŷn â hyn. Yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid, dywedais os yw'r

directors, who are well-paid executives, are saying that 20 per cent or £1 billion could be used more effectively—and he did not use the word ‘waste’; he said ‘make the best use’—we will expect them to deliver on that. It is not about new structures and reorganisations, but about the way in which services are delivered. I was not at that meeting, but I believe that Mr Davies, the finance director of the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, was referring to whether it was necessary to have three recalls for out-patient clinic services. Therefore, that is what they were talking about: the more effective use of resources. I agree absolutely with Jonathan Morgan’s remark that that will be the big challenge. It is not about how much we spend, but what we get for the expenditure.

You mentioned redesigning services, Jonathan. I could not agree more. Kirsty Williams made the same point. In Brecon, in her area, there is the proposed merger between Powys Teaching Local Health Board and the local authority. That is a model, and it may be a model for other parts of Wales, but it suits the local requirements. I spoke at a conference held by Powys County Council on this issue last week, because it is an example of reconfiguring and redesigning services. Similar work is being undertaken at Torfaen in Gwent with regard to the work that Professor Bim Bhowmick has done on intermediate care for the elderly. It has not only transformed services, but has also led to better services for older people, because they do not have to go into hospitals as in-patients—they can go to the out-patients department if they need treatment in a hospital. It has saved the health service locally £5 million, and it has meant that the social services department in Torfaen has underspent for the first time ever. That model is being rolled out across Gwent. It is about redesigning services and making them better for citizens and patients, particularly older people. It is also an efficiency saving, in terms of making better use of the Welsh pound.

cyfarwyddwyr cyllid, sydd yn swyddogion gweithredol ar gyflogau da, yn dweud y gellid defnyddio 20 y cant neu £1 biliwn yn fwy effeithiol—ac ni ddefnyddiodd y gair ‘gwastraff’; dywedodd ‘gwneud y defnydd gorau’—byddwn yn disgwyl iddynt gyflawni hynny. Nid mater o strwythurau newydd ac ad-drefnu ydyw, ond y ffordd y cyflenwir gwasanaethau. Nid oeddwn yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, ond credaf fod Mr Davies, cyfarwyddwr cyllid Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a’r Fro, yn gofyn a oedd angen cael tair galwad yn ôl i glinigau cleifion allanol. Felly, dyna beth yr oeddent yn sôn amdano: defnyddio adnoddau’n fwy effeithiol. Cytunaf yn llwyr â sylw Jonathan Morgan mai dyna fydd yr her fawr. Nid mater o faint a wariwn ydyw, ond beth a gawn am y gwariant.

Soniasoch am ail-greu gwasanaethau, Jonathan. Ni allwn gytuno mwy. Gwnaeth Kirsty Williams yr un pwynt. Yn Aberhonddu, yn ei hardal hi, mae bwriad i uno Bwrdd Addysgu Iechyd Lleol Powys a’r awdurdod lleol. Dyna fodel, a gall fod yn fodel i rannau eraill o Gymru, ond mae’n gweddu i’r gofynion lleol. Siaradais mewn cynhadledd a gynhaliwyd gan Gyngor Sir Powys ar y mater hwn yr wythnos diwethaf, oherwydd mae’n esiampl o ailffurfio ac ail-lunio gwasanaethau. Mae gwaith tebyg ar droed yn Nhorfaen yng Ngwent yng nghyswllt y gwaith y mae’r Athro Bim Bhowmick wedi’i wneud ar ofal canolraddol i’r henoed. Nid yn unig y mae wedi trawsnewid gwasanaethau, ond mae hefyd wedi arwain at well gwasanaethau i bobl hŷn, oherwydd nid oes raid iddynt fynd i’r ysbyty fel cleifion mewnol—gallant fynd i’r adran cleifion allanol os oes arnynt angen triniaeth mewn ysbyty. Mae wedi arbed £5 miliwn i’r gwasanaeth iechyd yn lleol, ac mae wedi golygu bod yr adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn Nhorfaen wedi tanwario am y tro cyntaf erioed. Mae’r model hwnnw’n cael ei ledaenu ar draws Gwent. Mae a wnelo ag ail-greu gwasanaethau a’u gwella i ddinasyddion a chleifion, yn enwedig pobl hŷn. Mae’n arbediad effeithlonrwydd hefyd, yn nhermau gwneud gwell defnydd o’r bunt

Gymreig.

I have made the point, but it bears repeating, that if the Auditor General for Wales commissioned an international peer review of his organisation that said that there is a greater role for the effective use of resources and more efficient use of scrutiny and that there should be more collaboration between the Wales Audit Office, Estyn, the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales and others, I would take the review at its word. That is a big challenge for the auditor general and the Wales Audit Office, and we expect it to look more carefully at not only its auditing procedures, but also the way in which it runs its organisation.

The auditor general also signed up to the definition of efficiency savings at the beginning of the 'Making the Connections' agenda. He said that the progress on the 'Making the Connections' target for efficiency savings was overstated, although he admitted that it was based on historic evidence—three years' evidence. We are confident that we will reach the target of £600 million of efficiency savings by the end of the current financial year, next March.

Nick Bourne raised the issue of freezing business rates. I know that Nick is not here, but if you were to adopt the Scottish model, which I think that he was suggesting, it would cost us £100 million. Where are you going to get that level of resource? So, I return to the point that I made in my opening speech: this Government will deliver on the 'One Wales' agreement. The budget is designed to deliver on it, as well as the other strategic priority of tackling the recession. A responsible opposition should say, if it expects more expenditure in one area, where it would find that money.

I commend the draft budget to Members. I will take on board the individual comments that were made, and I look forward to the

Yr wyf wedi gwneud y pwynt, ond mae'n werth ei ailadrodd, petai Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru'n comisiynu adolygiad gan gymheiriaid rhyngwladol o'i sefydliad, a hwnnw'n dweud bod mwy o rôl i ddefnyddio adnoddau'n effeithiol a chraffu mwy effeithlon ac y dylai fod mwy o gydweithio rhwng Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, Estyn, Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ac eraill, fe gymerwn yr adolygiad ar ei air. Mae hynny'n her fawr i'r archwilydd cyffredinol a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, a disgwyliwn iddi edrych yn fwy gofalus nid yn unig ar ei threfniadau archwilio, ond hefyd ar y ffordd y mae'n rhedeg ei sefydliad.

Derbyniodd yr archwilydd cyffredinol y diffiniad o arbedion effeithlonrwydd ar ddechrau agenda 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' hefyd. Dywedodd fod y cynnydd ar darged 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ar gyfer arbedion effeithlonrwydd wedi'i orbwysleisio, er y cyfaddefodd ei fod yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth hanesyddol—tystiolaeth tair blynedd. Yr ydym yn hyderus y cyrhaeddwn y targed o £600 miliwn o arbedion effeithlonrwydd erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol, fis Mawrth nesaf.

Cododd Nick Bourne fater rhewi ardrethi busnes. Gwn nad yw Nick yma, ond pe mabwysiaddech fodel yr Alban, sef yr hyn yr oedd yn ei awgrymu, mi gredaf, byddai'n costio £100 miliwn inni. O ble'r ydych yn mynd i gael y lefel honno o adnoddau? Felly, dychwelaf at y pwynt a wneuthum yn fy araith agoriadol: bydd y Llywodraeth hon yn gwireddu nodau cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'. Mae'r gyllideb wedi'i chynllunio i'w gyflawni, yn ogystal â'r flaenoriaeth strategol arall, sef mynd i'r afael â'r dirwasgiad. Dylai gwrthblaid gyfrifol ddweud, os yw'n disgwyl mwy o wariant mewn un maes, o ble y câi'r arian hwnnw.

Cymeradwyaf y gyllideb ddrafft i'r Aelodau. Fe dderbyniaf y sylwadau unigol a wnaed, ac edrychaf ymlaen at y ddadl ar y gyllideb

final budget debate on 8 December.

derfynol ar 8 Rhagfyr.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that there are objections. Therefore, I defer all voting until voting time.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw y dylid cytuno ar welliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiadau. Felly, gohiriaf bob pleidleisio tan yr amser pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan yr amser pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Diogelu ac Amddiffyn Plant yng Nghymru Safeguarding and Protecting Children in Wales

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Peter Black and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Alun Cairns.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Peter Black, a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Alun Cairns.

The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): I move that

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. welcomes the publication of the Care and Social Services Inspectorate and Healthcare Inspectorate Wales reports on safeguarding and protecting children in Wales;

1. yn croesawu cyhoeddiad adroddiadau Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ac Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru ar ddiogelu ac amddiffyn plant yng Nghymru;

2. notes the improvements made and the work still to be done by the NHS, local authorities and their partners; and

2. yn nodi'r gwelliannau sydd wedi'u sicrhau a'r gwaith sydd eto i'w gyflawni gan y GIG, awdurdodau lleol a'u partneriaid; ac

3. supports the Welsh Assembly Government's intention to take forward work with all the statutory agencies, devolved and non devolved, and to actively pursue these issues. (NDM4325)

3. yn cefnogi bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fwrw ati â gwaith gyda'r holl asiantaethau statudol, yn ddatganoledig ac fel arall, ac i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. (NDM4325)

In my written statement of 20 October, I promised Members the opportunity to debate the two Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales reports and the Health Inspectorate Wales report published on that day. I look forward to this debate, and will consider carefully the suggestions that emerge in developing our action plan to strengthen the safeguarding of children.

Yn fy natganiad ysgrifenedig ar 20 Hydref, addewais i'r Aelodau y caent gyfle i drafod dau adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ac adroddiad Arolygiaeth Iechyd Cymru a gyhoeddwyd y diwrnod hwnnw. Edrychaf ymlaen at y ddadl hon, a rhoddaf ystyriaeth ofalus i'r awgrymiadau a ddaw i'r fei ynghylch datblygu ein cynllun gweithredu i

gryfhau'r gwaith o ddiogelu plant.

I will begin by addressing the opposition amendments. Taking them in the order that they appear on the agenda, I reject amendment 1 tabled in the name of Peter Black. Were the amendments split, I would have been minded to support the new point 4, as I accept that the doubling of serious case reviews is a concern. However, to provide some reassurance, the requirements in relation to serious case reviews were changed recently to include all cases of suicide, and that other cases were not to be restricted only to those where a child has died. I will also reconsider the current requirements as part of ongoing work.

Dechreuaf drwy roi sylw i welliannau'r gwrthbleidiau. O'u cymryd yn y drefn yr ymddangosant yn yr agenda, gwrthodaf welliant 1 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Peter Black. Pe holltid y gwelliannau, buaswn wedi ystyried cefnogi'r pwynt 4 newydd, gan y derbyniaf fod dyblu adolygiadau achosion difrifol yn bryder. Fodd bynnag, i roi rhywfaint o sicrwydd, newidiwyd y gofynion ynglŷn ag adolygiadau achosion difrifol yn ddiweddar i gynnwys pob achos o hunanladdiad, ac i beidio â chyfyngu achosion eraill i rai lle bu farw plentyn yn unig. Ailystyriaf y gofynion cyfredol hefyd fel rhan o waith parhaus.

5.50 p.m.

I reject amendment 2 tabled in the name of Alun Cairns. As a Government, we take the claims made in this amendment seriously, but the extent of the problem is unclear. We will seek to clarify the situation before we act. To accept this amendment would be to act in ignorance. I reject amendment 3, tabled in the name of Alun Cairns, on the grounds that the roles and responsibilities of local safeguarding children boards are clearly defined in section 32 of the Children Act 2004. The final amendment, amendment 4, also in the name of Alun Cairns, I reject because the objectives of LSCBs, as set out in the Children Act 2004, do not include service delivery, which remains a matter for the statutory agencies, and LSCBs are not therefore intended to be accessible to the public.

Gwrthodaf welliant 2 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Alun Cairns. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym o ddiffrif ynglŷn â'r haeriadau a wneir yn y gwelliant hwn, ond mae maint y broblem yn aneglur. Fe geisiwn gael eglurhad ar y sefyllfa cyn gweithredu. Gweithredu mewn anwybodaeth fyddai derbyn y gwelliant hwn. Gwrthodaf welliant 3, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Alun Cairns, am y rheswm fod rolau a chyfrifoldebau byrddau lleol diogelu plant wedi'u diffinio'n glir yn adran 32 Deddf Blant 2004. Gwrthodaf y gwelliant olaf, gwelliant 4, hefyd yn enw Alun Cairns, oherwydd nid yw amcanion byrddau lleol diogelu plant, fel y'u hamlinellir yn Neddf Blant 2004, yn cynnwys cyflenwi gwasanaethau, sy'n parhau'n fater i'r asiantaethau statudol, ac felly ni fwriedir i'r byrddau fod yn agored i'r cyhoedd.

I am pleased to see improvements highlighted in the CSSIW report on safeguarding, and I can tell you what action this Government has already taken and plans to take in relation to the concerns raised in the reports and the matters raised during my statement. Following receipt of the HIW report, the Minister immediately required officials to review current practice in the NHS. We are sensitive to the importance of Criminal Records Bureau checking to ensure the safety

Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ar ddiogelu'n pwysleisio gwelliannau, a gallaf ddweud wrthyfych pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth hon eisoes wedi'u cymryd ac yn bwriadu eu cymryd ynglŷn â'r pryderon a godwyd yn yr adroddiadau a'r materion a godwyd yn ystod fy natganiad. Ar ôl derbyn adroddiad Arolygiaeth Iechyd Cymru, mynnodd y Gweinidog yn syth fod swyddogion yn

of children and vulnerable adults as patients; we have previously issued comprehensive guidance to the NHS on these matters and we expect it to comply with legal and mandatory requirements. The Minister asked all NHS organisations to confirm their preparedness in relation to the introduction of the vetting and barring scheme. The outcome of the exercises that I have referred to will be available shortly and the Minister will inform Assembly Members in writing.

On 4 November this year, the NHS director of planning and strategy wrote to chief executives of local health boards to remind them of their responsibilities towards children and young people and that they must have appropriate arrangements in place to discharge those responsibilities. LHBs have been asked to confirm their organisations' arrangements for meeting their statutory duties as set out in that letter, to ensure that these are clearly described and understood, and that they support, and contribute to, local children and young people's partnerships and LSCBs. LHBs must notify all partner organisations and the Welsh Assembly Government by the end of November of the names of those within their organisations who have lead responsibility. The director will report to me on the responses.

Professor Mansel Aylward, chair of Public Health Wales, has been asked to consider the concerns raised by children's charities during and after the consultation on the health service reforms. He will share his preliminary findings with the Minister and agree any actions necessary to ensure that Public Health Wales is robust and supports NHS bodies in discharging their duties in safeguarding children.

I have written to chief executives of local authorities to ensure that they are satisfied

adolygu'r arferion cyfredol yn y GIG. Yr ydym yn sensitif i bwysigrwydd archwiliadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol i sicrhau diogelwch plant ac oedolion bregus fel cleifion; yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau cynhwysfawr i'r GIG yn y gorffennol ar y materion hyn a disgwylwn iddo gydymffurfio â gofynion cyfreithiol a gorfodol. Gofynnodd y Gweinidog i bob corff GIG gadarnhau eu parodrwydd i gyflwyno'r cynllun fetio a gwahardd. Bydd canlyniadau'r ymarferiadau yr wyf wedi cyfeirio atynt ar gael yn fuan a bydd y Gweinidog yn hysbysu Aelodau'r Cynulliad mewn ysgrifen.

Ar 4 Tachwedd eleni, ysgrifennodd cyfarwyddwr cynllunio a strategaeth y GIG at brif weithredwyr byrddau iechyd lleol i'w hatgoffa am eu cyfrifoldebau tuag at blant a phobl ifanc a bod rhaid iddynt sefydlu trefniadau priodol i gyflawni'r cyfrifoldebau hynny. Gofynnwyd i fyrddau iechyd lleol gadarnhau trefniadau eu sefydliadau ar gyfer cyflawni eu dyletswyddau statudol fel y'u hamlinellwyd yn y llythyr hwnnw, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod wedi'u disgrifio'n glir ac wedi'u deall, a'u bod yn cefnogi, ac yn cyfrannu at, bartneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc lleol a byrddau lleol diogelu plant. Rhaid i fyrddau iechyd lleol hysbysu pob corff sy'n bartner iddynt a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru erbyn diwedd Tachwedd o enwau'r sawl o fewn eu sefydliadau sydd â chyfrifoldeb arweiniol. Bydd y cyfarwyddwr yn fy hysbysu i am yr ymatebion.

Gofynnwyd i'r Athro Mansel Aylward, cadeirydd Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru, ystyried y pryderon a godwyd gan elusennau plant yn ystod ac wedi'r ymgynghoriad ar ddiwygio'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Bydd yn rhannu ei ganfyddiadau cychwynol â'r Gweinidog ac yn cytuno ar unrhyw gamau gweithredu angenrheidiol i sicrhau bod Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru'n gadarn ac yn cefnogi cyrff y GIG yng nghyflawniad eu dyletswyddau i ddiogelu plant.

Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at brif weithredwyr awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn fodlon

with current arrangements for charring and membership of LSCBs, and that the relationship between the local partnerships and the boards is such that the boards can challenge and advise statutory agencies on safeguarding and child protection matters. I have already issued guidance on the role of the Director of Social Services for Wales, which requires that directors report annually to elected members on safeguards for vulnerable children and adults.

The first meeting of the Welsh safeguarding forum, which I asked the Director of Social Services for Wales to establish, is imminent. This will be a standing group. I expect it to report in the coming months on local leadership across agencies in respect of child protection; how practice can be further strengthened; and how we will strengthen the voice of social work. It will also consider the operation of LSCBs, including whether the charring, membership and current arrangements enable the delivery of the highest level of safeguarding. I am pleased to announce today that the Children's Commissioner for Wales has agreed to join the forum. The Director of Social Services for Wales has convened the social care workforce task group to consider recruitment and retention, qualification and career development for social workers, and how to strengthen the voice of social work.

We must ensure that social workers are well trained, supported by their managers, and have the tools that they need to fully utilise their skills. In relation to the CSSIW report on serious case reviews, I have commissioned further work to implement arrangements for delivery and practice, and I expect to see the report in the late spring of 2010.

Finally, the Proposed Children and Families (Wales) Measure was approved by the Assembly last week. The integrated family support element of that proposed Measure is

â'r trefniadau presennol ar gyfer cadeirio ac aelodaeth byrddau lleol diogelu plant, a bod y berthynas rhwng y partneriaethau lleol a'r byrddau yn gyfryw fel y gall y byrddau herio a chynghori asiantaethau statudol ar faterion diogelu ac amddiffyn plant. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ar rôl Cyfarwyddwr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, sy'n gofyn bod cyfarwyddwyr yn adrodd yn flynyddol i aelodau etholedig ar fesurau diogelu i blant ac oedolion bregus.

Mae cyfarfod cyntaf fforwm diogelu Cymru, y gofynnais i Gyfarwyddwr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ei sefydlu, ar ddiwydd. Grŵp sefydlog fydd hwn. Disgwyliaf iddo adrodd yn y misoedd a ddaw ar arweinyddiaeth leol ar draws asiantaethau ynghylch amddiffyn plant; sut y gellir cryfhau arferion ymhellach; a sut y gwnawn gryfhau llais gwaith cymdeithasol. Bydd yn ystyried gweithrediad byrddau lleol diogelu plant hefyd, gan gynnwys a yw'r trefniadau cadeirio ac aelodaeth cyfredol yn galluogi cyflenwi'r lefel uchaf o ddiogelu. Mae'n dda gennyf gyhoeddi heddiw fod Comisiynydd Plant Cymru wedi cytuno i ymuno â'r fforwm. Mae Cyfarwyddwr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru wedi cynnull grŵp gorchwyl y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol i ystyried recriwtio a chadw staff, cymwysterau a datblygiad gyrfa i weithwyr cymdeithasol, a sut i gryfhau llais gwaith cymdeithasol.

Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gweithwyr cymdeithasol wedi'u hyfforddi'n dda, y cânt gefnogaeth eu rheolwyr, ac y cânt yr arfau y mae eu hangen arnynt i ddefnyddio'u sgiliau'n llawn. Ynglŷn ag adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ar adolygiadau achosion difrifol, yr wyf wedi comisiynu gwaith pellach i roi trefniadau ar waith ar gyfer cyflenwi ac ymarfer, a disgwyliaf weld yr adroddiad tua diwedd gwanwyn 2010.

Yn olaf, cymeradwywyd y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) gan y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf. Bwriedir i'r elfen gefnogaeth

intended to tackle systemic problems and to improve support for children living in families with problems. It will deal with many issues identified in the HIW and CSSIW reports, and will require health and social care professionals working with adults to consider potential risks to children, make referrals and share information. It will require teams of social workers and other professionals to work together with those families. It will enable social workers to build and use their skills in working directly with families, and it will introduce a career path for consultant social workers. The pioneer areas will be engines for change across the system, and I expect that learning will be spread more widely as soon as a good case is made.

Peter Black: I move amendment 1 in my name. Insert as new points after point 2 and renumber accordingly:

3. notes the concern expressed about the impact of NHS reforms on local safeguarding children boards and calls on the Minister to outline how this will be addressed;

4. notes with concern the doubling of the number of serious case reviews in Wales in 2007/08 from the previous year and that there are a further 50 to 60 cases awaiting review.

I thank the Deputy Minister for bringing this debate to the Chamber, and for commissioning these reports in the first place. Although they contain many criticisms and suggestions for change, that is partly because they have been so thorough, and looked at some difficult issues. This debate is crucial in dealing with those issues and the flaws and the problems that have been revealed in the reports.

integredig i deuluoedd yn y Mesur arfaethedig hwnnw fynd i'r afael â phroblemau systemaidd a gwella cefnogaeth i blant sy'n byw mewn teuluoedd â phroblemau. Bydd yn delio â llawer o faterion a nodir yn adroddiadau Arolygiaeth Iechyd Cymru ac Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, a bydd yn gofyn i weithwyr proffesiynol ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol sy'n gweithio gydag oedolion ystyried peryglon posibl i blant, cyfeirio achosion a rhannu gwybodaeth. Bydd yn gofyn i dimau o weithwyr cymdeithasol a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill gydweithio â'r teuluoedd hynny. Bydd yn galluogi gweithwyr cymdeithasol i adeiladu a defnyddio'u sgiliau wrth weithio'n uniongyrchol gyda theuluoedd, a bydd yn cyflwyno llwybr gyrfa i weithwyr cymdeithasol ymgynghorol. Bydd yr ardaloedd arloesi'n ysgogwyr newid ar draws y system, a disgwyliaf y caiff yr hyn a ddysgir ei ledaenu'n ehangach cyn gynted ag y gwneir achos da.

Peter Black: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn fy enw i. Cynnwys fel pwyntiau newydd ar ôl pwynt 2 ac ail-rifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:

3. yn nodi'r pryder a fynegwyd ynghylch effaith diwygiadau'r GIG ar fyrddau lleol diogelu plant ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i amlinellu sut yr eir i'r afael â hyn;

4. yn nodi â phryder bod nifer yr adolygiadau achosion difrifol yng Nghymru wedi dyblu yn ystod 2007/08 ers y flwyddyn flaenorol a bod 50 i 60 o achosion eraill yn aros i gael eu hadolygu.

Diolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am ddod â'r ddatl hon i'r Siambr, ac am gomisiynu'r adroddiadau hyn yn y lle cyntaf. Er eu bod yn cynnwys sawl beirniadaeth ac awgrym ar gyfer newid, mae hynny'n rhannol am eu bod wedi bod mor drwyadl, ac wedi edrych ar faterion dyrys. Mae'r ddatl hon yn hollbwysig i ddelio â'r materion hynny a'r gwendidau a'r problemau sydd wedi'u datgelu yn yr adroddiadau.

One issue that needs to be highlighted is the problem being caused by the overall shortage of social workers. There are several ways in which the review of local authority social services, and local safeguarding children boards, sees this as causing a problem. First, inexperienced social workers are being given complex cases that could present problems for them and for those involved in the cases assigned to them. The lack of social workers is leaving them struggling to deal with this increasing pressure and the complexity of cases that they have in their workload.

Another problem is that children and families are having their social workers switched frequently, so that it is unusual for them to have the same social worker for more than six months. We would all recognise that this is not an ideal situation. Social workers need to build bonds of trust with those they are working with, particularly the children involved, and although I recognise that the shortage of social workers is an issue that goes beyond Wales, we need to know what support is being given to social workers who are already struggling, and the families that they are meant to be working with. We need to find a way of getting more consistency into the system, if at all possible.

The Deputy Minister has addressed the issue raised in our amendment of the doubling of the number of serious case reviews. I accept that the criteria for serious case reviews have changed. Nevertheless, there appears to be an increase in reviews in relation to child abuse cases and issues around that—not just the additional criteria that the Deputy Minister outlined. That is a concern. The First Minister was probably correct in his answer to Kirsty Williams last week, when he said that the media coverage around baby P was an influence. However, although he may be right, that does not mean that this is best for children in Wales. Either too few serious case reviews were being conducted before, or too many are being conducted now; either way, it

Un mater y mae angen tynnu sylw ato yw'r broblem a achosir gan brinder cyffredinol gweithwyr cymdeithasol. Mae'r adolygiad o wasanaethau cymdeithasol awdurdodau lleol, a byrddau lleol diogelu plant, yn gweld bod hyn yn achosi problem mewn sawl ffordd. Yn gyntaf, rhoddir i weithwyr cymdeithasol amhrofiadol achosion cymhleth a allai roi problemau iddynt ac i'r rhai sy'n rhan o'r achosion a roddir iddynt. Mae'r prinder gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn eu gadael i ymlafnio i ddelio â'r pwysau cynyddol hyn a chymhlethdod yr achosion sydd ganddynt yn eu llwyth gwaith.

Problem arall yw y newidir gweithwyr cymdeithasol i blant a theuluoedd yn fynych, fel mai anarferol yw iddynt gael yr un gweithiwr cymdeithasol am fwy na chwe mis. Byddai pawb ohonom yn cydnabod nad yw hyn yn sefyllfa ddelfrydol. Mae angen i weithwyr cymdeithasol adeiladu clymau ymddiriedaeth gyda'r rhai y maent yn gweithio â hwy, yn enwedig y plant, ac er y sylweddolaf fod prinder gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn fater sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i Gymru, mae arnom angen gwybod pa gefnogaeth sy'n cael ei rhoi i weithwyr cymdeithasol sydd eisoes mewn anhawster, a'r teuluoedd y maent i fod i weithio gyda hwy. Mae angen inni ganfod ffordd o gael mwy o gysondeb i mewn i'r system, os oes modd o gwbl.

Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi rhoi sylw i'r cwestiwn a godwyd yn ein gwelliant ynglŷn â dyblu nifer adolygiadau achosion difrifol. Derbyniaf fod y meini prawf ar gyfer adolygiadau achosion difrifol wedi newid. Serch hynny, mae'n ymddangos bod cynnydd mewn adolygiadau ynglŷn ag achosion camdrin plant a materion cysylltiedig â hynny—nid dim ond y meini prawf ychwanegol a amlinellodd y Dirprwy Weinidog. Mae hynny'n bryder. Mae'n debyg fod y Prif Weinidog yn gywir yn ei ateb i Kirsty Williams yr wythnos diwethaf, pan ddywedodd fod sylw'r cyfryngau i achos baban P yn ddylanwad. Fodd bynnag, er ei fod efallai'n iawn, nid yw hynny'n golygu mai dyma sydd orau i blant yng Nghymru.

seems that we are focusing more and more on these issues, and dealing with them is not just resource-intensive, but importantly, we must learn lessons from those reviews and ensure that problems are not repeated.

Naill ai nad oedd digon o adolygiadau achosion difrifol yn digwydd gynt, neu mae gormod yn digwydd yn awr; y naill ffordd neu'r llall, mae'n ymddangos ein bod yn canolbwyntio mwyfwy ar y materion hyn, ac mae delio â hwy nid yn unig yn cymryd llawer o adnoddau, ond, yn bwysig, rhaid inni ddysgu gwersi o'r adolygiadau hynny a sicrhau nad ailadroddir problemau.

6.00 p.m.

We cannot let a media storm dictate how children's services are run. I would be grateful if the Deputy Minister could tell me what is being done to address this issue and to ensure that every case that needs a review receives one. However, as you said, you are looking at the system to ensure that we do not have reviews for the sake of it. Reviews must deal with serious cases.

Ni allwn adael i storm gyfryngol reoli sut y rhedir gwasanaethau plant. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Dirprwy Weinidog ddweud wrthyf beth sy'n cael ei wneud i roi sylw i'r mater hwn ac i sicrhau bod pob achos sydd angen adolygiad yn ei gael. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedasoch, yr ydych yn edrych ar y system i sicrhau na chawn adolygiadau heb fod angen. Rhaid i adolygiadau ddelio ag achosion difrifol.

Several other issues have come out of those serious case reviews, and the one that has been causing me concern, which I have raised with the Deputy Minister privately in the past, is that of communication between various agencies. That came out of the review of the Aaron Gilbert case in Swansea, in which several agencies were identified as being at fault in relation to the unfortunate death of that child. One fact that struck me particularly was that information in the possession of one agency was not being passed to other agencies, and, as a result, the necessary action was not taken. When we have had briefings on reviews from the Deputy Minister, it seems that, in particular, the police are not sharing information with social services departments as quickly or as comprehensively as they could. In the case of Aaron Gilbert, the health service also had not shared the information in its possession with the social services department. That issue needs desperately to be addressed. We need to ensure that, when a case of abuse comes to light, all agencies are aware that they should share information as quickly as possible with the relevant agency.

Mae sawl mater arall wedi dod allan o'r adolygiadau achosion difrifol hyn, a'r un sydd wedi peri pryder i mi, yr wyf wedi ei godi gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn breifat yn y gorffennol, yw mater cyfathrebu rhwng gwahanol asiantaethau. Daeth hynny allan o'r adolygiad o achos Aaron Gilbert yn Abertawe, lle enwyd sawl asiantaeth a oedd ar fai mewn perthynas â marwolaeth anffodus y plentyn hwnnw. Un ffaith a'm trawodd yn arbennig oedd nad oedd gwybodaeth a oedd ym meddiant un asiantaeth yn cael ei throsglwyddo i asiantaethau eraill, ac, o ganlyniad, na chymerwyd y camau angenrheidiol. Pan ydym ninnau wedi cael ein briffio ar adolygiadau gan y Dirprwy Weinidog, mae'n ymddangos nad yw'r heddlu, yn arbennig, yn rhannu gwybodaeth ag adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol mor gyflym nac mor gynhwysfawr ag y gallent. Yn achos Aaron Gilbert, nid oedd y gwasanaeth iechyd yntau wedi rhannu'r wybodaeth yn ei feddiant ag adran y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae dirfawr angen rhoi sylw i'r mater hwnnw. Mae angen inni sicrhau, pan ddaw achos o gam-drin i'r amlwg, fod pob asiantaeth yn ymwybodol y dylent rannu gwybodaeth cyn gynted ag y bo

modd â'r asiantaeth berthnasol.

I am running out of time, but I will quickly mention the issue of local safeguarding children boards and local health boards. I am concerned that the joint working grant has, effectively, ceased and that local authorities are now working with much bigger bodies, which has an impact on the effectiveness of local safeguarding children boards. I hope that the Deputy Minister will come back to us with an idea of how that can be resolved, so that we do not face that issue in the future.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I move the following amendments in the name of Alun Cairns. Amendment 2: Add a new point to the end of the motion:

notes with concern the number of NHS staff who have not had their Criminal Records Bureau checks completed.

Amendment 3: Add a new point to the end of the motion:

believes that the roles and responsibilities of the local safeguarding children boards should be more rigorously defined to ensure clarity of purpose in protecting children.

Amendment 4: Add a new point to the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to take measures to ensure equality of access to, funding of, and service delivery by, local safeguarding children boards across Wales.

The Deputy Minister has said that she cannot support these amendments. I am bewildered by that, particularly in relation to amendment 2, on Criminal Records Bureau checks. A deficit in that regard was identified in the healthcare standards report published in August, which looked at the past year. I was surprised to hear the Deputy Minister call that more of a claim by the Conservatives. Amendment 2 has been brought forward on the basis of hard evidence in the healthcare

Mae fy amser yn dod i ben, ond soniaf yn gyflym am fater byrddau lleol diogelu plant a byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr wyf yn bryderus bod y grant cydweithio, i bob pwrpas, wedi dod i ben a bod awdurdodau lleol bellach yn gweithio gyda chyrff llawer mwy, sy'n amharu ar effeithiolrwydd byrddau lleol diogelu plant. Gobeithio y daw'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn ôl atom â syniad o sut y gellir datrys hynny, fel na wynebwn y mater hwnnw yn y dyfodol.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Alun Cairns. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi â phryder y nifer o staff y GIG nad yw eu gwiriadau Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol wedi cael eu cwblhau.

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu y dylid diffinio swyddogaethau a chyfrifoldebau'r byrddau lleol diogelu plant yn fwy trwyadl er mwyn sicrhau bod eu diben yn glir o ran amddiffyn plant.

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gymryd camau i sicrhau cyfartaledd o ran mynediad at, cyllid i, a chyflenwi gwasanaethau gan, fyrddau lleol diogelu plant ledled Cymru.

Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi dweud na all gefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn. Mae hynny'n peri dryswch i mi, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt gwelliant 2, ar wiriadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol. Nodwyd diffyg yn hynny o beth yn yr adroddiad ar safonau gofal iechyd a gyhoeddwyd yn Awst, yn edrych ar y flwyddyn flaenorol. Synnais o glywed y Dirprwy Weinidog yn galw hynny'n fwy o haerriad gan y Ceidwadwyr. Mae gwelliant 2 wedi'i gyflwyno ar sail

standards report, which identified that, sadly, in many instances there is a deficit in CRB checks and that there is no continuity in CRB checks among staff. I would welcome the Deputy Minister's reconsidering her view of that amendment and the Government's unwillingness to accept it. The amendment has been put forward on the basis of information provided to the Assembly and to the people of Wales in the healthcare standards report. Therefore, I would be grateful if the Deputy Minister could address that point in summing up.

Amendment 3 is on the importance of local safeguarding children boards and the ability of these boards to function and operate. The report clearly identifies good practice in certain fields, but, sadly, many of these boards rely upon individuals taking on the issues and working on them because they have a passion, rather than it being accepted that these boards are a means of collecting all the views together so that information can be shared. Listening to what Peter Black said earlier, I agree with him about the problem with sharing information. When we have a briefing with the Deputy Minister, or when we look at issues in our own areas, that problem is often identified. Time and again, things break down because one organisation had information but, for some perverse reason, felt unable to share it. The ability to share information and to allow people in the sector to work with it could prevent many tragedies, and would lead to a far better service for children.

Amendment 4 is on the funding of local safeguarding children boards, because the report clearly identifies that, without the goodwill of local authorities and their ability to put in the lion's share of the funding, there is a problem with funding the boards. With the reorganisation of health boards into larger groupings, there will be a greater demand for groups to work together to create the cohesion that, ultimately, we are seeking to develop to create a good environment for

tystiolaeth galed yn yr adroddiad ar safonau gofal iechyd, a nododd, ysywaeth, fod diffyg yng ngwiriadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol mewn sawl achos ac nad oes dilyniant gwiriadau ymysg staff. Croesawn pe ailystyriai'r Dirprwy Weinidog ei barn am y gwelliant hwnnw ac anafodlonrwydd y Llywodraeth i'w dderbyn. Mae'r gwelliant wedi'i gyflwyno ar sail gwybodaeth a ddarparwyd i'r Cynulliad ac i bobl Cymru yn yr adroddiad ar safonau gofal iechyd. Felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Dirprwy Weinidog roi sylw i'r pwynt hwnnw wrth grynhoi.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn ymwneud â phwysigrwydd byrddau lleol diogelu plant a gallu'r byrddau hyn i weithredu a gweithio. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'n glir arferion da mewn rhai meysydd, ond, ysywaeth, mae llawer o'r byrddau hyn yn dibynnu ar unigolion i ymgymryd â materion a gweithio arnynt am eu bod yn teimlo'n angerddol, yn hytrach na derbyn bod y byrddau hyn yn fodd i gasglu pob safbwynt ynghyd er mwyn rhannu gwybodaeth. O wrando ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Peter Black yn gynharach, cytunaf ag ef am y broblem gyda rhannu gwybodaeth. Pan gawn ein briffio gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog, neu pan edrychwn ar faterion yn ein hardaloedd ein hunain, nodir y broblem honno'n aml. Dro ar ôl tro, bydd pethau'n torri i lawr am fod gan un sefydliad wybodaeth ond ei fod wedi teimlo, am ryw reswm gwrthnysig, na allai ei rhannu. Gallai gallu rhannu gwybodaeth a chaniatáu i bobl yn y sector weithio â hi atal sawl trychineb, a byddai'n arwain at wasanaeth llawer gwell i blant.

Mae a wnelo gwelliant 4 ag ariannu byrddau lleol diogelu plant, oherwydd mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'n glir fod problem gydag ariannu'r byrddau, oni bai am ewyllys da awdurdodau lleol a'u gallu i gyfrannu'r rhan fwyaf o'r cyllid. Gydag ad-drefnu byrddau iechyd yn grwpiau mwy, bydd mwy o alw am i grwpiau gydweithio i greu'r cydlynad yr ydym yn ceisio'i ddatblygu yn y pen draw i greu amgylchedd da i blant ac fel y gall teuluoedd sydd angen y gwasanaeth gael

children and so that families who need the service can have confidence in it.

The report also touches on social workers and the excellent role that they play in our society. They really are at the forefront of developing strategies and the environment—

Bethan Jenkins: Do you therefore welcome the work that the British Association of Social Workers has been doing, lobbying to ensure that this commission comes about? Do you support the event that it will hold at the National Assembly next week to launch a patron scheme?

Andrew R.T. Davies: I was just about to go on to say that I believe that we need to hold social workers in far higher regard. I have gone around, meeting directors of social services and people working in the social welfare field, and one thing that I have noticed is their inability to convey the work that they do to the wider community. In many meetings now, the body that represents the directors of social work is identifying champions, so to speak, of the work that social workers carry out, so that they get a higher profile and so that their work can be better understood by the community. That is a critical aspect of developing the field of social care. Ultimately, as the report identifies, experienced social workers are needed who can work with new entrants to the profession to ensure that their experience is used to develop strands of care that have the best interests of the individual at their heart.

I look forward to the Deputy Minister's response to the comments that have been made today, and I welcome the opportunity to debate the report in Plenary.

Joyce Watson: I welcome today's debate on safeguarding and protecting children in Wales. In March 2007, the Welsh Local Government Association published a guide to

hyder ynddo.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn crybwyll gweithwyr cymdeithasol a'r rôl ragorol a chwaraeant yn ein cymdeithas. Maent yn wir ar flaen y gad gyda datblygu strategaethau a'r amgylchedd—

Bethan Jenkins: A ydych felly'n croesawu'r gwaith y mae Cymdeithas Brydeinig y Gweithwyr Cymdeithasol wedi bod yn ei wneud, yn lloio i sicrhau y daw'r comisiwn hwn i fod? A ydych yn cefnogi'r digwyddiad y bydd yn ei gynnal yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yr wythnos nesaf i lansio cynllun noddwyr?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Yr oeddwn ar fin mynd ymlaen i ddweud fy mod yn credu bod angen inni roi llawer mwy o barch i weithwyr cymdeithasol. Yr wyf wedi teithio o gwmpas, gan gwrdd â chyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a phobl sy'n gweithio ym maes lles cymdeithasol, a'r un peth yr wyf wedi sylwi arno yw eu hanallu i gyfleu'r gwaith a wnânt i'r gymuned ehangach. Mewn sawl cyfarfod yn awr, mae'r corff sy'n cynrychioli cyfarwyddwyr gwaith cymdeithasol yn enwi pencampwyr, fel petai, yn y gwaith a wneir gan weithwyr cymdeithasol, fel y cânt broffil uwch ac fel y gall eu gwaith gael ei ddeall yn well gan y gymuned. Mae hynny'n agwedd hollbwysig o ddatblygu maes gofal cymdeithasol. Yn y pen draw, fel y noda'r adroddiad, mae angen gweithwyr cymdeithasol profiadol a all weithio gyda newydd ddyfodiaid i'r proffesiwn i sicrhau y defnyddir eu profiad i ddatblygu llinynnau gofal sydd â buddiannau gorau'r unigolyn yn ganolog iddynt.

Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb y Dirprwy Weinidog i'r sylwadau sydd wedi'u gwneud heddiw, a chroesawaf y cyfle i drafod yr adroddiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Joyce Watson: Croesawaf y ddadl heddiw ar ddiogelu ac amddiffyn plant yng Nghymru. Ym Mawrth 2007, cyhoeddodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru arweinyfr i

safeguarding vulnerable children, which recognised that more needed to be done to research and combat issues such as the trafficking of children and unaccompanied asylum-seeking children. Since then, Cardiff and Newport safeguarding children boards have adopted protocols that outline the responsibilities that different agencies have when cases of child trafficking are referred to them. Does the Deputy Minister agree that all 22 local authorities should look to emulate that?

Children's services in these two areas became alarmed by the lack of response they were getting from other agencies when suspected cases of child trafficking were brought to their notice. It was clear that other agencies were not sure what responsibilities, if any, they had when cases of suspected child trafficking were referred to them. Does the Deputy Minister agree that this applies to agencies in places such as Pembrokeshire, for example, where human trafficking arrests were made last year, as much as it does to those in urban centres?

The recent report commissioned by the Children's Commissioner for Wales, 'Bordering on Concern: Child Trafficking in Wales', highlighted the cases of 32 children who, over a very short time, have been trafficked in Wales. The nature of internal trafficking means that these children might have passed through any local authority area in that time. Therefore, it is vital that every authority has mechanisms in place to protect children who might be picked up.

Progress has been made on recognising child trafficking and the fact that it exists in Wales, and responses have been made to that. However, we need to raise awareness of the problem outside our cities and develop a Wales-wide response that protects children. That is why I am delighted to be involved in a Pembrokeshire-based project that is publishing a book entitled *Slavery Today Through the Eyes of Children*. It will be published shortly and launched and sold here

ddiogelu plant agored i niwed, a gydnabu fod angen gwneud mwy i ymchwilio ac ymladd yn erbyn materion fel masnachu plant a phlant ar eu pen eu hunain sy'n ceisio lloches. Ers hynny, mae byrddau diogelu plant Caerdydd a Chasnewydd wedi mabwysiadu protocolau sy'n amlinellu'r cyfrifoldebau sydd gan wahanol asiantaethau pan gyfeirir achosion o fasnachu mewn plant atynt. A ydyw'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn cytuno y dylai pob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol geisio efelychu hynny?

Dechreuodd gwasanaethau plant yn y ddwy ardal hyn boeni ynglŷn â'r diffyg ymateb a gaent gan asiantaethau eraill pan ddeuid ag achosion lle'r oedd amheuaeth o fasnachu mewn plant i'w sylw. Yr oedd yn amlwg nad oedd asiantaethau eraill yn siŵr pa gyfrifoldebau oedd ganddynt, os o gwbl, pan gyfeirid achosion o amheuaeth o fasnachu plant atynt. A ydyw'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn cytuno bod hyn yn wir am asiantaethau mewn llefydd fel Sir Benfro, er enghraifft, lle arestiwyd pobl am fasnachu dynol y llynedd, yn gymaint ag am rai mewn canolfannau trefol?

Tynnodd yr adroddiad diweddar a gomisiynwyd gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru, 'Ffiniau Pryder: Masnachu Plant yng Nghymru', sylw at achosion 32 o blant sydd, dros gyfnod byr iawn, wedi'u masnachu yng Nghymru. Mae natur masnachu mewnol yn golygu y gallai'r plant hyn fod wedi pasio drwy ardal unrhyw awdurdod lleol yn yr amser hwnnw. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig fod gan bob awdurdod beirianwaith i warchod plant y gellid eu codi.

Mae camau wedi'u cymryd i gydnabod masnachu mewn plant a'r ffaith ei fod yn digwydd yng Nghymru, a chafwyd ymatebion i hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r broblem y tu allan i'n dinasoedd a datblygu ymateb dros Gymru gyfan a fydd yn amddiffyn plant. Dyna pam yr wyf wrth fy modd o ymwneud â phrosiect yn Sir Benfro sy'n cyhoeddi llyfr o'r enw *Slavery Today Through the Eyes of Children*. Fe'i cyhoeddir yn fuan a chaiff ei lansio a'i

in the Assembly in December. It brings together the personal reflections and artworks of primary school children who have looked at slavery today.

6.10 p.m.

It is the culmination of their efforts, as well as the dedication of their teachers, and the vision and support of local Soroptimists. It has been put together by children for children, with the proceeds from sales going to Anti-slavery International and BAWSO, organisations that work tirelessly to eliminate all forms of slavery. That is a local solution to a local, and sometimes international, problem. Will the Deputy Minister look at rolling out similar projects or providing help to support other people who are doing so? Empowerment for children and the actions that we take for children often come from those children themselves, because they are the future and the ones whom we need to get on board for the next few generations to take this agenda forward and find solutions.

Mark Isherwood: ‘For want of a nail the shoe was lost.
For want of a shoe the horse was lost.
For want of a horse the rider was lost.
For want of a rider the battle was lost.
For want of a battle the kingdom was lost’.

That is certainly true of a child, its upbringing, education and life chances. It is timely that we should have this debate today, given that Barnardo’s reported today that thousands of girls and boys are at risk of organised trafficking and accuses councils of failing the victims. We are told that children as young as 10 are being moved around the UK to be sexually exploited at parties organised by paedophiles. The organisation also states that the vast majority of local authorities do not provide expert help for such children. Barnardo’s also stated:

‘We do not know the true extent of the problem in Wales because of its hidden

werthu yma yn y Cynulliad ym mis Rhagfyr. Mae’n gasgliad o fyfyrddau personol a gwaith celf plant ysgolion cynradd sydd wedi edrych ar gaethwasiaeth heddiw.

Dyma benllanw eu hymdrechion hwy, ac ymroddiad eu hathrawon, a gweledigaeth a chefnogaeth Soroptimyddion lleol. Fe’i lluniwyd gan blant i blant, a bydd elw’r gwerthiant yn mynd i Anti-slavery International a BAWSO, cyrff sy’n gweithio’n ddiflino i ddileu pob ffurf ar gaethwasiaeth. Dyna ateb lleol i broblem leol, ac weithiau ryngwladol. A wnaiff y Dirprwy Weinidog ystyried cyflwyno prosiectau tebyg neu ddarparu cymorth i gefnogi pobl eraill sydd am wneud hynny? Mae rhoi grym i blant a’r camau a gymerwn dros blant yn aml yn deillio o’r plant hynny eu hunain, oherwydd hwy yw’r dyfodol a’r rhai y mae arnom angen eu cael gyda ni am yr ychydig genedlaethau nesaf i fwrw ymlaen â’r agenda hwn a chanfod atebion.

Mark Isherwood: ‘O ddiffyg hoelen collwyd y bedol.
O ddiffyg pedol collwyd y march.
O ddiffyg march collwyd y marchog.
O ddiffyg marchog collwyd y frwydr.
O ddiffyg brwydr collwyd y deyrnas’.

Mae hynny’n sicr yn wir am blentyn, ei fagwraeth, ei addysg a’i gyfleon bywyd. Mae’n amserol ein bod yn cael y ddaidl hon heddiw, a Barnardo’s wedi cyhoeddi heddiw fod miloedd o fechgyn a genethod mewn perygl o fasnachu wedi’i drefnu, gan gyhuddo cynghorau o wneud cam â’r dioddefwyr. Dywedir wrthym fod plant mor ifanc â 10 oed yn cael eu symud o gwmpas y Deyrnas Unedig i gael eu defnyddio’n rhywiol mewn partion a drefnir gan bedoffiliaid. Dywed Barnardo’s hefyd nad yw’r mwyafrif llethol o awdurdodau lleol yn darparu cymorth arbenigol i blant o’r fath. Dywedasant hefyd:

‘Ni wyddom wir faint y broblem yng Nghymru oherwydd ei natur gudd ond yr

nature but we are certain we are only working with a fraction of the children and young people who are being sexually exploited or who are at risk’.

That brings to mind the Waterhouse inquiry in north Wales. Those falsely accused, and since cleared, say that there was a witch hunt; those who were abused say that the perpetrators were never brought to book. However, both parties have told me that key documentation was never submitted to the Waterhouse inquiry. We should note that the number of children in care has risen by 10 per cent across north Wales since 2005.

Speaking in 2006 on the regulations that introduced local safeguarding children boards in Wales, I stated that if they were to protect children from abuse and neglect, and therefore to deliver on the recommendations made by Lord Laming in his report into the death of Victoria Climbié, the regulations were not sufficient unless the boards were equipped with the resources and mechanisms required to meet their purpose.

As the regulatory appraisal for those regulations stated, we had no definitive information on the costs of providing such support. I also noted that it should be self-evident that their degree of independence will determine their effectiveness, noting that almost three quarters of the board chairs in England were council employees and that only 22 per cent of chairs were independent of all board partners. I therefore brought forward an amendment that chairs should be independent of all board partners, but this was defeated. Perhaps we should not therefore be surprised by the findings of the two reports being considered today. The executive summary of the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales report highlights

‘a sharp rise in serious case review activity in the last two years’.

ydym yn sicr ein bod yn gweithio gyda ffracsiwn yn unig o’r plant a’r bobl ifanc sy’n cael eu hecsbloetio’n rhywiol neu sydd mewn perygl’.

Mae hynny’n ein hatgoffa o ymchwiliad Waterhouse yn y Gogledd. Dywed y rhai a gyhuddwyd ar gam, ac a gafwyd yn ddiuog wedyn, y bu helpa wrachod; dywed y rhai a gamdriniwyd na chafodd y troseddwyd eu dal i gyfrif byth. Fodd bynnag, mae’r ddwy ochr wedi dweud wrthyf fod dogfennaeth allweddol na chyflwynwyd fyth i ymchwiliad Waterhouse. Dylem nodi bod nifer y plant mewn gofal wedi codi 10 y cant ar draws y Gogledd ers 2005.

Wrth siarad yn 2006 am y rheoliadau a gyflwynodd fyrdau lleol diogelu plant yng Nghymru, dywedais os oeddent i ddiogelu plant rhag cael eu cam-drin a’u hesgeuluso, ac felly i weithredu’r argymhellion a wnaed gan yr Arglwydd Laming yn ei adroddiad ar farwolaeth Victoria Climbié, nad oedd y rheoliadau’n ddigonol oni châi’r byrdau yr adnoddau a’r peirianweithiau gofynnol i gyflawni’u diben.

Fel y dywedodd yr arfarniad rheoliadol i’r rheoliadau hynny, nid oedd gennym ddim gwybodaeth bendant am gostau darparu’r cyfryw gefnogaeth. Nodais hefyd y dylai fod yn hunan-amlwg y bydd i ba raddau y maent yn annibynnol yn penderfynu pa mor effeithiol y byddant, gan nodi bod bron i dri chwarter o gadeiryddion byrdau yn Lloegr yn gyflogedig gan y cynghorau ac mai dim ond 22 y cant oedd yn annibynnol ar holl bartneriaid y bwrdd. Felly cyflwynais welliant y dylai cadeiryddion fod yn annibynnol ar holl bartneriaid y byrdau, ond trechwyd hyn. Efallai na ddylem synnu felly at ganfyddiadau’r ddau adroddiad sydd dan ystyriaeth heddiw. Mae crynodeb gweithredol adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru yn amlygu

‘cynnydd sydyn mewn gweithgaredd adolygu achosion difrifol yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf’.

It also notes that:

‘The time and resources required to undertake reviews together with problems of delay reduce the impact of the findings and prevent timely local action being taken’.

The summary also notes that:

‘There is insufficient expertise and capacity in many LSCBs....Frontline practitioners have limited involvement in the review process....Findings tend to be the same or similar “over and over again”, good practice is rarely if ever identified’.

The Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales report stated that

‘the quality of work remains inconsistent within and between authorities’.

It also states that

‘there is an imbalance in how organisations and professionals discharge their responsibilities in relation to safeguarding and promoting the welfare of children’.

It further states that there were

‘inconsistencies in practice...with gaps in completing checks, spending time with children, collecting all of the information needed’,

and that there was

‘variable quality of assessments and limited plans which focus on immediate protection rather than longer term aspirations for improving outcomes for children and their families’.

The report also states that:

‘There was clearly a heightened awareness and response amongst everyone involved in protecting children following the Victoria Climbié inquiry report, but this has not been

Mae’n nodi hefyd:

‘Mae’r amser a’r adnoddau angenrheidiol i gynnal adolygiadau, ynghyd â phroblemau oedi, yn lleihau effaith y canfyddiadau ac yn atal gweithredu amserol yn lleol’.

Mae’r crynodeb yn nodi hefyd:

‘Nid oes digon o arbenigedd a gallu mewn amryw o fyrddau lleol diogelu plant...Rhan gyfyngedig a gaiff ymarferwyr rheng flaen yn y broses adolygu...Tuedda’r canfyddiadau i fod yr un fath neu’n debyg “dro ar ôl tro”; prin, os o gwbl, y canfyddir arferion da’.

Dyweddodd adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru fod

‘ansawdd gwaith yn parhau’n anghyson o fewn awdurdodau a rhyngddynt’.

Dywed hefyd fod

‘anghydbwysedd yn y modd y bydd cyrff a gweithwyr proffesiynol yn cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau mewn perthynas â diogelu a hyrwyddo lles plant’.

Dywed ymhellach y canfuwyd

‘anghysonderau mewn ymarfer...gyda bylchau wrth gwblhau gwiriadau, treulio amser gyda phlant, casglu’r holl wybodaeth angenrheidiol’,

a bod

‘asesiadau o ansawdd amrywiol a chynlluniau cyfyngedig sy’n canolbwyntio ar amddiffyn yn y tymor byr yn hytrach na dyheadau tymor hwy ar gyfer gwella canlyniadau i blant a’u teuluoedd’.

Dywed yr adroddiad hefyd:

‘Yr oedd ymwybyddiaeth ac ymateb cryfach yn amlwg ymysg pawb oedd yn ymwneud ag amddiffyn plant yn dilyn adroddiad ymchwiliad Victoria Climbié, ond nid yw

consistently maintained and systems are not sufficiently well developed and aligned to facilitate this’.

Chillingly, it states that:

‘Protecting children should not be about waiting for things to go wrong before individuals and organisations once again focus on how to do things better’.

It said that

‘there is widespread variation in the contributions made by statutory partners to funding the operation of LSCBs, with the overwhelming contribution being made by the local authority, in the absence of contribution from other partners’.

That is precisely what I warned of in the debate in 2006. It also said:

‘from the outset there has been a lack of clarity about the scope of the LSCBs responsibilities in relation to safeguarding’.

Finally, and most chillingly, in paragraph 1.14, it said that

‘safeguarding and protecting children should be a priority for all organisations, professionals and practitioners, but this review has identified considerable variability amongst them...Indeed the differing priorities of the key organisations and professionals can lead to each being able to demonstrate that they are fulfilling their own responsibilities, without the child being effectively safeguarded and protected’.

That is a savage indictment and is precisely what I warned of in 2006, but the Welsh Government failed to listen. I hope and trust that this Deputy Minister will listen now.

Helen Mary Jones: Like others who have contributed to the debate, I welcome the reports to which the Deputy Minister is

hyn wedi’i gynnal yn gyson ac nid yw systemau wedi’u datblygu a’u halinio’n ddigon da i hwyluso hyn’.

Yn iasol, dywed:

‘Ni ddylai amddiffyn plant olygu aros i bethau fynd o chwith cyn i unigolion a sefydliadau unwaith eto ganolbwyntio ar sut i wneud pethau’n well’.

Dywedodd

‘mae amrywiaeth eang yn y cyfraniadau a wneir gan bartneriaid statudol i ariannu gwaith byrddau lleol diogelu plant, a daw rhan fwyaf y cyfraniad o bell ffordd oddi wrth yr awdurdod lleol, yn absenoldeb cyfraniad gan bartneriaid eraill’.

Dyna’n union beth y rhybuddiais amdano yn y ddadl yn 2006. Dywedodd hefyd:

‘o’r cychwyn cyntaf bu diffyg eglurder ynghylch cwmpas cyfrifoldebau’r byrddau lleol diogelu plant mewn perthynas â diogelu’.

Yn olaf, ac yn fwyaf iasol, ym mharagraff 1.14, dywedodd

‘dylai diogelu ac amddiffyn plant fod yn flaenoriaeth i bob sefydliad, ymarferwr a gweithiwr proffesiynol, ond mae’r adolygiad hwn wedi nodi cryn amrywioldeb yn eu plith...Yn wir, gall gwahanol flaenoriaethau’r sefydliadau a’r bobl broffesiynol allweddol arwain at i’r naill a’r llall allu dangos eu bod yn cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau eu hunain, heb fod y plentyn wedi’i ddiogelu a’i amddiffyn yn effeithiol’.

Mae hynny’n feirniadaeth hallt ac yn union beth y rhybuddiais yn ei gylch yn 2006, ond ni wrandawodd Llywodraeth Cymru. Gobeithiaf a hyderaf y gwnaiff y Dirprwy Weinidog presennol wrando’n awr.

Helen Mary Jones: Fel eraill sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl, croesawaf yr adroddiadau y mae’r Dirprwy Weinidog yn

referring today, and I thank all those involved in their preparation. I am pleased to see the progress that the reports demonstrate has been made, but I also welcome the acknowledgment in the Government's motion that there is still work to do.

I will not reiterate what has been said on many occasions in the Chamber about the vital importance of safeguarding work. We all know how catastrophic the results can be when things go wrong. I want to raise some specific concerns with the Deputy Minister that I am sure she will wish to address as she takes this vital work forward. I welcome what the Deputy Minister has said today about establishing the Welsh safeguarding forum, and the fact that the children's commissioner will be part of it. The Deputy Minister will be aware of the concerns that the children's commissioner raised in his report, which was published last week, about the involvement of the health service in the safeguarding process, the sharing of information and the level of participation of the new local health boards in the safeguarding children boards. The fact that the children's commissioner will be part of that forum will ensure that those issues will now be addressed, and the Deputy Minister has set out today the steps that the Government is already taking. I am sure that the Deputy Minister will be able to reassure us today that the commissioner's voice will be clearly heard in that process and that his concerns will be addressed.

Like Mark Isherwood, I would draw the Deputy Minister's attention to the Barnardo's report that has been published today. It is disturbing, but, sadly, not surprising. I seek the Deputy Minister's assurance that, through the safeguarding forum, the issues raised in the report will be addressed. No-one would expect the Deputy Minister to respond to those issues specifically today, which are in a report that has only just been published, but it does raise some important points about working with that very vulnerable group of children.

cyfeirio atynt heddiw, a diolchaf i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â'u paratoi. Mae'n dda gennyf weld y camau y mae'r adroddiadau'n dangos sydd wedi'u cymryd, ond croesawaf hefyd y gydnabyddiaeth yng nghynnig y Llywodraeth fod gwaith i'w wneud o hyd.

Nid ailadroddaf yr hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud ar sawl achlysur yn y Siambr ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd allweddol gwaith diogelu. Gwyddom i gyd mor drychinebus y gall y canlyniadau fod pan aiff pethau o chwith. Mae arnaf eisiau codi rhai pryderon penodol gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hi'n awyddus i roi sylw iddynt wrth iddi fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith hollbwysig hwn. Croesawaf yr hyn y mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi'i ddweud heddiw ynglŷn â sefydlu fforwm diogelu Cymru, a'r ffaith y bydd y comisiynydd plant yn rhan ohono. Bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon a gododd y comisiynydd plant yn ei adroddiad, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, ynglŷn â rhan y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y broses ddiogelu, rhannu gwybodaeth a lefel cyfranogiad y byrddau iechyd lleol newydd yn y byrddau diogelu plant. Bydd y ffaith y bydd y comisiynydd plant yn rhan o'r fforwm hwnnw'n sicrhau y caiff y materion hynny sylw yn awr, ac mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi amlinellu heddiw y camau y mae'r Llywodraeth eisoes yn eu cymryd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog roi sicrwydd inni heddiw y clywir llais y comisiynydd yn glir yn y broses honno ac y rhoddir sylw i'w bryderon.

Fel Mark Isherwood, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Dirprwy Weinidog at adroddiad Barnardo's a gyhoeddwyd heddiw. Mae'n peri pryder, ond, ysywaeth, nid syndod. Ceisias sicrwydd gan y Dirprwy Weinidog y caiff y materion a godir yn yr adroddiad sylw drwy'r fforwm diogelu. Ni fyddai neb yn disgwyl i'r Dirprwy Weinidog ymateb i'r materion hynny'n benodol heddiw, a hwythau mewn adroddiad nad yw ond newydd ei gyhoeddi, ond y mae'n codi pwyntiau pwysig ynglŷn â gweithio gyda'r grŵp bregus iawn hwnnw o blant.

I need to raise with the Deputy Minister the complexity of the bureaucracy that front-line children's social workers have to deal with, and particularly the complexity of the recording system. That is raised with me and others every time I speak to front-line social workers, and indeed to organisations that represent them, such as the British Association of Social Workers, which has already been referred to today. Nobody would want to go back to the bad old days when meetings were not properly recorded, and when plans were not clearly set out and shared. I must admit that, when I was working in the field, record-keeping was not my strongest point, and I frequently had to be reminded by my managers of how important it is. It is clear that we need systems under which information is set out and clearly shared, but it cannot be right for front-line social workers who go into the profession to work directly with vulnerable children, young people and families, to spend more than half their working time on computerised paperwork. That, Deputy Minister, is what front-line social workers are telling me—and I am sure other Members—is happening now.

I urge the Deputy Minister to look at this again, perhaps through the safeguarding forum because it is important for us to adjust the balance between record-keeping and front-line work. Some of those issues will be addressed when we have a larger supply of child protection social workers, who are coming through, and when those social workers have smaller caseloads. In the meantime, we need to look at the balance in the longer term.

6.20 p.m.

There are many issues that will need to be addressed in taking the work forward, as the Deputy Minister knows. We are fortunate in having a Deputy Minister in charge of this process who has such an understanding of the work and of the commitment. We all need to

Mae arnaf eisiau tynnu sylw'r Dirprwy Weinidog at gymhlethdod y fiwrocratiaeth y mae'n rhaid i weithwyr cymdeithasol plant yn y rheng flaen ddelio â hi, ac yn enwedig gymhlethdod y system gofnodi. Codir hynny gyda mi ac eraill bob tro y siaradaf â gweithwyr cymdeithasol rheng flaen, ac, yn wir, â chyrrff sy'n eu cynrychioli, fel Cymdeithas Brydeinig y Gweithwyr Cymdeithasol, y cyfeiriwyd ati eisoes heddiw. Ni fyddai neb yn dymuno mynd yn ôl i'r hen ddyddiau gwael pan na châi cyfarfodydd eu cofnodi'n iawn, a phan na châi cynlluniau eu hamlinellu a'u rhannu'n iawn. Rhaid imi gyfaddef, pan oeddwn yn gweithio yn y maes, nad cadw cofnodion oedd fy mhwynt cryfaf, a bu raid imi gael f'atgoffa'n aml gan fy rheolwyr mor bwysig ydyw. Mae'n amlwg fod arnom angen systemau ar gyfer amlinellu gwybodaeth a'i rhannu'n glir, ond ni all fod yn iawn i weithwyr cymdeithasol rheng flaen sy'n mynd i mewn i'r proffesiwn i weithio'n uniongyrchol gyda phlant, pobl ifanc a theuluoedd bregus, dreulio dros hanner eu hamser gweithio ar waith papur cyfrifiadurol. Dyna, Ddirprwy Weinidog, beth, yn ôl yr hyn y mae gweithwyr cymdeithasol rheng flaen yn ei ddweud wrthyf fi—ac Aelodau eraill, mae'n siŵr—sydd yn digwydd yn awr.

Anogaf y Dirprwy Weinidog i edrych ar hyn eto, efallai drwy'r fforwm diogelu, oherwydd mae'n bwysig inni addasu'r cydbwysedd rhwng cadw cofnodion a gwaith rheng flaen. Datrysir rhai o'r materion hynny pan gawn gyflenwad mwy o weithwyr cymdeithasol amddiffyn plant, sy'n dod drwodd, a phan fydd gan y gweithwyr cymdeithasol hynny lwythi achosion llai. Yn y cyfamser, mae angen inni edrych ar y cydbwysedd yn y tymor hwy.

Mae llawer o faterion y bydd angen mynd i'r afael â hwy wrth fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith, fel y gŵyr y Dirprwy Weinidog. Yr ydym yn ffodus o gael Dirprwy Weinidog yn gyfrifol am y broses hon sydd yn deall y gwaith a'r ymroddiad cystal. Mae angen inni i gyd ei

applaud her for being ready to take some quite tough decisions when necessary. The Deputy Minister's contribution to this debate so far demonstrates fully that she understands that there is no place for complacency here. I commend the motion to the Assembly.

The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): I will begin by thanking Members for their contributions. We all agree that child protection is an area for which we all have a responsibility.

I outlined a number of areas in my opening remarks and I think that these remarks covered many of the issues that have been raised by Members. With regard to some of the comments made by Mark Isherwood and Andrew R.T. Davies, I have outlined actions to answer some of your concerns. While it is important that the matter of Criminal Records Bureau checks is resolved, the new vetting and barring scheme is already being phased in. That process will continue for five years, with public registration beginning in July 2010. We are working hard with the Home Office to ensure that everyone who will be affected by the new arrangements is made aware of their responsibilities and the timescale for the implementation of the new scheme.

I am also particularly keen that the work on serious case reviews progresses. I take Peter Black's point on this. We are all aware that these now take far too long and often seem to repeat what has previously been reported. The report published by the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales on 20 October was particularly helpful and I have now authorised further work, which will determine how a future framework can be delivered in practice. I expect pilot projects to begin towards the end of next year, with a full scheme being introduced in spring 2011.

chymeradwyo am fod yn barod i wneud ambell benderfyniad eithaf anodd pan fo angen. Mae cyfraniad y Dirprwy Weinidog at y ddadl hon hyd yn hyn yn dangos yn llawn ei bod yn deall nad oes lle i hunanfodlonrwydd yma. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Cynulliad.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Yr ydym i gyd yn gytûn fod amddiffyn plant yn faes y mae gan bawb ohonom gyfrifoldeb drosto.

Amlinellais nifer o feysydd yn fy sylwadau agoriadol a chredaf fod y sylwadau hyn wedi delio â llawer o'r materion a godwyd gan Aelodau. Ynglŷn â rhai o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan Mark Isherwood ac Andrew R.T. Davies, yr wyf wedi amlinellu camau gweithredu i ateb rhai o'ch pryderon. Er ei bod yn bwysig datrys mater gwiriadau'r Bwrdd Cofnodion Troseddol, mae'r cynllun fetio a gwahardd newydd eisoes yn cael ei gyflwyno'n raddol. Bydd y broses honno'n parhau am bum mlynedd, a dechreuir y cofrestru cyhoeddus ym mis Gorffennaf 2010. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref i sicrhau y caiff pawb yr effeithir arnynt gan y trefniadau newydd wybod am eu cyfrifoldebau a'r amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'r cynllun newydd.

Yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus hefyd i'r gwaith ar adolygiadau achosion difrifol fynd rhagddo. Derbyniaf bwynt Peter Black ynglŷn â hyn. Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol fod y rhain bellach yn cymryd llawer gormod o amser a'u bod yn aml fel pe baent yn ailadrodd pethau a adroddwyd eisoes. Yr oedd yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ar 20 Hydref yn arbennig o fuddiol ac yr wyf yn awr wedi awdurdodi gwaith pellach, a fydd yn pennu sut y gellir cyflenwi fframwaith i'r dyfodol yn ymarferol. Disgwyliaf i gynlluniau peilot ddechrau tua diwedd y flwyddyn nesaf, a chyflwyno cynllun llawn yng ngwanwyn 2011.

There have been reports in the press over the last week about the difficulty in attracting and retaining staff involved with child protection. While there is some variability across Wales in the recruitment of social workers and while local pressures exist in some areas, particularly in childcare, information suggests that vacancy rates in social services departments continue to improve. There are significantly more applicants for social work courses than there are places available. The evidence shows that the vast majority of graduates going to work in local authority social services stay in those posts. A corner has been turned—and I take Peter Black's point on this—in the recruitment and retention of social workers. The key challenge now is to sustain that change and build upon it. I also take the point made by Bethan Jenkins in her intervention regarding the workforce task group and the role of BASW. I, too, look forward to the forthcoming event. I also accept Helen Mary's comments on bureaucracy. I expect that task group to look at issues of that nature.

On 20 October, Helen Mary Jones asked me whether I was content with the number and structures of LSCBs in Wales. Peter Black, Andrew Davies and Mark Isherwood have brought up this important issue. The Children Act 2004 makes provision for two or more children's services authorities in Wales to establish a local safeguarding children board for their combined area. As I said earlier, I have written to chief executives asking for their views on the current structure. This is something that I want the new safeguarding forum and senior officials in the Assembly to look at in the coming months.

Many of you, including Andrew and Peter Black, brought up the sharing of information and funding issues. I expect the forum to look at issues of that nature.

Cafwyd adroddiadau yn y wasg dros yr wythnos diwethaf am anhawster denu a chadw staff sy'n ymwneud ag amddiffyn plant. Er bod rhywfaint o amrywioldeb ar draws Cymru o ran recriwtio gweithwyr cymdeithasol ac er bod pwysau lleol mewn rhai mannau, yn enwedig mewn gofal plant, awgryma'r wybodaeth fod cyfraddau swyddi gwag mewn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn dal i wella. Mae cryn nifer yn fwy o ymgeiswyr am gyrsiau gwaith cymdeithasol nag sydd o leoedd ar gael. Dengys y dystiolaeth fod y mwyafrif helaeth o raddedigion a aiff i weithio yn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol awdurdodau lleol yn aros yn y swyddi hynny. Yr ydym wedi troi cornel—a derbyniat bwynt Peter Black ar hyn—o ran recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr cymdeithasol. Yr her allweddol yn awr yw cynnal y newid hwnnw ac adeiladu arno. Derbyniat hefyd y pwynt a wnaed gan Bethan Jenkins yn ei hymyriad ynglŷn â grŵp gorchwyl y gweithlu a rôl BASW. Yr wyf ffinau hefyd yn edrych ymlaen at y digwyddiad sydd i ddod. Derbyniat sylwadau Helen Mary am fiwrocratiaeth hefyd. Disgwyliaf i'r grŵp gorchwyl hwnnw edrych ar faterion o'r fath.

Ar 20 Hydref, gofynnodd Helen Mary Jones imi a oeddwn yn fodlon gyda nifer a strwythurau byrddau lleol diogelu plant yng Nghymru. Mae Peter Black, Andrew Davies a Mark Isherwood wedi codi'r mater pwysig hwn. Mae Deddf Blant 2004 yn darparu am i ddau neu ragor o awdurdodau gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru sefydlu bwrdd lleol diogelu plant i'w hardal gyfunedig. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at brif weithredwyr yn gofyn am eu sylwadau ar y strwythur presennol. Dyma rywbeth y mae arnaf eisiau i'r fforwm diogelu newydd ac uwch swyddogion yn y Cynulliad edrych arno yn y misoedd sydd i ddod.

Soniodd llawer ohonoch, yn cynnwys Andrew a Peter Black, am faterion rhannu gwybodaeth ac ariannu. Disgwyliaf i'r fforwm edrych ar faterion felly.

I pay tribute to the work of Joyce Watson with regard to preventing the trafficking of children, which was also mentioned by Mark Isherwood. I highlight the fact that the WLGA will be part of the safeguarding forum. I am sure that issues of that nature will not escape the forum's consideration.

Helen Mary commented on the report of the children's commissioner. I am delighted that the children's commissioner will participate in the work of this forum. On the issue of the Barnardo's report, I know that the voluntary sector often produces helpful and informative reports and when such reports are issued we give them serious consideration.

Finally, I have set up a Commission on Social Care in Wales. The commission will consider the provision of social services and social care over the next decade. The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to improving services for vulnerable children and adults and that must include safeguarding and protection. All of these aspects, which the commission will consider, are fundamental to the protection of vulnerable children and adults in Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is that the amendment 1 be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is. Therefore, the votes will be deferred until voting time.

It is now past 5 p.m., which is the allocated voting time, therefore I intend to move straight to the vote. Does anyone wish for the bell to be rung? I see that no-one does.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Rhodaf deyrnged i waith Joyce Watson ynglŷn ag atal masnachu plant, a grybwyllwyd hefyd gan Mark Isherwood. Pwysleisiaf y bydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n rhan o'r fforwm diogelu. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y fforwm yn ystyried materion o'r fath.

Gwnaeth Helen Mary sylw ar adroddiad y comisiynydd plant. Yr wyf wrth fy modd y bydd y comisiynydd plant yn cyfranogi yng ngwaith y fforwm. Ar fater adroddiad Barnardo's, gwn fod y sector gwirfoddol yn aml yn cynhyrchu adroddiadau buddiol ac addysgiadol a phan gyhoeddir adroddiadau o'r fath rhoddwn ystyriaeth ddifrifol iddynt.

Yn olaf, yr wyf wedi sefydlu Comisiwn Gofal Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Bydd y comisiwn yn ystyried darpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol dros y deng mlynedd nesaf. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i wella gwasanaethau i blant ac oedolion agored i niwed, a rhaid i hynny gynnwys diogelu ac amddiffyn. Mae'r agweddau hyn i gyd, y bydd y comisiwn yn eu hystyried, yn sylfaenol i amddiffyn plant ac oedolion agored i niwed yng Nghymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw bod gwelliant 1 yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriwn y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Mae bellach wedi 5 p.m. sef yr amser pleidleisio dynodedig, felly bwriadaf symud yn syth at y bleidlais. A oes unrhyw un yn dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes neb.

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4324: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
Amendment 1 to NDM4324: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4324: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 2 to NDM4324: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris

Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4324: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 3 to NDM4324: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val

Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4324: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 4 to NDM4324: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM4324: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.
Amendment 5 to NDM4324: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM4324: O blaid 10, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 6 to NDM4324: For 10, Abstain 4, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.

Gwelliant 7 i NDM4324: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 7 to NDM4324: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 34.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 8 i NDM4324: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 8 to NDM4324: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 9 i NDM4324: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42.
Amendment 9 to NDM4324: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 42.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Law, Trish
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Rhodri
Ramsay, Nick
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 10.
Amendment 10 not selected.*

*Gwelliant 11 i NDM4324: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 11 to NDM4324: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 12 i NDM4324: O blaid 7, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment to NDM4324: For 7, Abstain 8, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Law, Trish
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene

Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.

Cynnig NDM4324: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 14.
Motion NDM4324: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 14.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4325: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
Amendment 1 to NDM4325: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4325: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
Amendment 2 to NDM4325: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4325: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
Amendment 3 to NDM4325: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew

Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4325: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
Amendment 4 to NDM4325: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4325: O blaid 40, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 1.
Motion NDM4325: For 40, Abstain 6, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Rhodri
Ramsay, Nick
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Member voted against:

Graham, William

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.30 p.m.
The meeting ended at 6.30 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asgar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)

Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)