



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 31 Hydref 2000**

**Tuesday 31 October 2000**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 18 Datganiad ar Adroddiad Phillips ar BSE  
*Statement on the Phillips Report on BSE*
- 30 Datganiad ar y Llifogydd yng Nghymru  
*Statement on the Flooding in Wales*
- 49 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 51 Diddymu Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000  
*Revocation of the Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2000*
- 53 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000  
*Approval of the Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2000*
- 54 Fformwla Asesiad Safonol o Wariant Llywodraeth Leol  
*Local Government Standard Spending Assessment Formula*
- 91 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio  
*The Audit Committee Report*

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambwr. Yn ogystal, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad Saesneg o eiriau a lefarwyd yn y Gymraeg. Bydd cofnod dwyieithog cyflawn ar gael bum niwrnod gwaith ar ôl cynnal y sesiwn.

*These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches has been included. A fully bilingual record will be available five working days after the session was held.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.*  
*The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

### Y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (Partneriaeth â Busnes) The National Assembly (Partnership with Business)

**Q1 Christine Gwyther:** Can the First Minister outline how the National Assembly for Wales is working in partnership with business in Wales? (OAQ7407)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Aside from the Business Partnership Council—I was asked about that last week—there is a general pattern of working between the Assembly administration and the world of business. I will cite three contemporaneous examples. First, the Wales Innovation Summit, which I co-hosted with Terry Matthews at the Celtic Manor last week. Second, the Welsh Electronics Forum—the first meeting of which was chaired this morning by the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development, Mike German. Third, the Ryder Cup bid for 2009: a public-private venture, which we teed off this morning at the Norwegian Church no more than 100 yards from here.

**Christine Gwyther:** Do you share my enthusiasm for the new way of working that is growing out of the structural funds partnerships across Wales? I refer to the partnership of business not only with public sector agencies and the Assembly, but with the voluntary sector also. We are breaking new ground in Wales as far as that is concerned, and consolidating previous good practice. How do you see that progressing in the months and years to come?

**The First Minister:** I agree with you in the sense that there is this idea—which was perhaps new to Wales until six months ago—of a one-third partnership between the world of business, the voluntary sector and the public sector. It was not easy to get all those partners to realise that they were co-equal

**C1 Christine Gwyther:** A all y Prif Weinidog amlinellu sut mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â busnesau yng Nghymru? (OAQ7407)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Ar wahân i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes—gofynnwyd i mi am hynny yr wythnos diwethaf—mae patrwm cyffredinol o weithio rhwng gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad a'r byd busnes. Dyfynnaf dair enghraifft gyfoes. Yn gyntaf, Uwch-Gynhadledd Dyfeisgarwch Cymru, a gynhalwyd ar y cyd rhyngof a Terry Matthews yn y Celtic Manor yr wythnos diwethaf. Yn ail, Fforwm Electroneg Cymru—cadeiriwyd y cyfarfod cyntaf y bore yma gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, Mike German. Yn drydydd, y cynnig am y Cwpan Ryder ar gyfer 2009: menter gyhoeddus-breifat, a gychwynasom y bore yma yn yr Eglwys Norwaidd nad yw'n fwy na 100 llath o'r fan hyd.

**Christine Gwyther:** A rannwch fy mrwdrydedd am y ffordd newydd o weithio sydd yn datblygu o'r partneriaethau cronfeydd strwythurol ledled Cymru? Cyfeiriaf at y bartneriaeth fusnes nid yn unig gydag asiantaethau'r sector cyhoeddus a'r Cynulliad, ond gyda'r sector gwirfoddol hefyd. Torrwn dir newydd yng Nghymru mewn perthynas â hynny, ac atgyfnherthwn arfer da blaenorol. Sut y gwelwch hynny yn datblygu yn y misoedd a'r blynnyddoedd i ddod?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â chi o ran y syniad hwn—a oedd yn newydd i Gymru efallai hyd at chwe mis yn ôl—o bartneriaeth draean rhan rhwng byd busnes, y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector cyhoeddus. Nid oedd yn hawdd cael yr holl bartneriaid hynny i sylweddoli eu bod yn bartneriaid cyfartal. Ar

partners. At a local partnership level, the local authority might start it off as the local council is the obvious starting point. On the other hand, once it is up and running it must be on the basis that nobody has the dominant share. Nobody must have more than a one-third share and you must develop the mentality that there are three co-equal partners. It does not matter in whose premises you meet. It does not matter who started it, but it is important that nobody has more than a 50 per cent share. It is divided into thirds between the voluntary sector, the business sector and the public sector. That is the fundamental principle without which Objective 1 will not proceed.

**Brian Hancock:** I am glad that you mentioned partnerships, because partnerships develop trust. What representations have you received from businesses across Wales, particularly in the north, on the effect of the huge rise in business rates decided by your Government? Do you agree that it should be made clear that it is not a decision of the National Assembly, but of your Government, and it should take responsibility for the damaging effect that it is having on businesses across Wales?

**The First Minister:** It is clear that Brian was watching *Dragon's Eye* last Thursday. However, I made it clear in my answer—following the briefing that I was luckily given by the relevant Assembly officials, albeit at the last minute—that 90 per cent of businesses that face rises of 10 per cent or more are covered by the capping scheme introduced by Peter Law several months ago. That does not mean, of course, that 100 per cent are covered by the scheme. However, any scheme, which can be a transitional, damping or capping scheme—as we should call this one—that catches 90 per cent of those who are liable to a 10 per cent or more increase is a comprehensive capping scheme. Having recently carried out a re-evaluation exercise, I do not know that we could ever devise a capping scheme that prevented all businesses from having business rate rises of more than 10 per cent.

lefel partneriaeth leol, gallai'r awdurdod lleol ei dechrau gan mai'r cyngor lleol yw'r pwynt cychwyn amlwg. Ar y llaw arall, unwaith ei fod wedi sefydlu mae'n rhaid ei fod ar y sail na chaiff neb y gyfran bennaf. Ni ddylai neb gael mwy nag un rhan o dair a rhaid ichi ddatblygu'r meddylfryd bod tri phartner cyfartal. Nid oes ots yn eiddo pwy yr ydych yn cwrdd. Nid oes ots pwy a'i dechreuodd, ond mae'n bwysig nad oes neb yn meddu ar gyfran sydd yn fwy na 50 y cant. Fe'i rhennir yn dair rhan rhwng y sector gwirfoddol, y sector busnes a'r sector cyhoeddus. Dyna'r egwyddor sylfaenol na aiff Amcan 1 yn ei flaen hebddi.

**Brian Hancock:** Mae'n dda gennyf eich bod wedi crybwyll partneriaethau, gan fod partneriaethau yn datblygu ymddiriedaeth. Pa gynrychioliadau a dderbyniasoch gan fusnesau ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn y gogledd, ynglŷn ag effaith y codiad enfawr yn y trethi busnes y penderfynwyd arno gan eich Llywodraeth chi? A gytunwch y dylid ei gwneud yn glir nad penderfyniad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ydyw, ond penderfyniad eich Llywodraeth chi, ac mai hi ddylai gymryd y cyfrifoldeb dros yr effaith andwyol a gaiff ar fusnesau ledled Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n glir bod Brian wedi gwyllo *Dragon's Eye* ddydd Iau diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, fe'i gwnaethpwyd yn glir gennyf yn fy ateb—ar ôl y briff a roddwyd imi yn ffodus gan swyddogion perthnasol y Cynulliad, er y bu ar y funud olaf—y cwmpesir 90 y cant o'r busnesau sydd yn wynebu codiadau o 10 y cant neu fwy gan y cynllun capio a gyflwynwyd gan Peter Law sawl mis yn ôl. Ni olyga hynny, wrth gwrs, y cwmpesir 100 y cant gan y cynllun. Fodd bynnag, mae unrhyw gynllun, a all fod yn gynllun dros dro, lleddfu neu capio—fel y dylem alw'r un hwn—sydd yn dal 90 y cant o'r rheini sydd yn rhwymedig i godiad o 10 y cant neu fwy yn gynllun capio cynhwysfawr. Ar ôl cynnal ymarfer ailwerthuso yn ddiweddar, nid wyf yn ymwybodol y gallem byth lunio cynllun capio a rwystrai pob busnes rhag dioddef codiadau treth busnes o fwy na 10 y cant.

## Bodloni Anghenion Trawsbynciol (Datblygu Polisi) Meeting Cross-cutting Needs (Policy Development)

**C2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa gamau a gymerir gan Brif Weinidog Cymru i sicrhau bod polisiau'r Cynulliad yn cael eu datblygu er mwyn sicrhau y bodlonir anghenion trawsbynciol? (OAQ7391)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Credaf fod gan y Cynulliad ymrwymiad cryf i'r tair egwyddor ganlynol, sef datblygu cynaliadwy—sydd yn un o brif ddiddordebau Rhodri Glyn—cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chyfle cyfartal.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dylai datblygu cynaliadwy fod yn brif ddiddordeb i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Sicrhaodd Plaid Cymru, rai wythnosau'n ôl, fod safle datblygu cynaliadwy fel pwnc trawsbynciol wedi'i sefydlu. Gofynnwyd yn benodol i'r uned ddatblygu cynaliadwy estynedig gael ei sefydlu o fewn prif uned bolisi'r Cynulliad i sicrhau ymagwedd wirioneddol drawsbynciol tuag at ddatblygu polisi. A yw hynny wedi digwydd, ac os na, pam nad yw wedi digwydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni allaf ond rhoi ateb ysgrifenedig ichi ynglŷn â'r uned. Ni allaf eich ateb yn awr, oherwydd eich bod wedi gofyn cwestiwn penodol ac nid wyr yn siŵr o'r ateb. Ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â statws yr uned newydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Local government finance is important for a range of local services. The SSA formula will clearly reduce the ability of Cardiff council and the Vale of Glamorgan to support school services. Will you agree to delay the new SSA formula so that you can consult properly as to how we can prevent cuts in school budgets?

**The First Minister:** That stretches the elastic of this question considerably. The SSA formula and the decision to go for the new formula, but with appropriate damping, is a matter in which all the councils of Wales, via the WLGA, have played a co-equal role with the Assembly. We knew, roughly speaking, how much money we could inject into the local government process. To be honest, it

**Q2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What steps is the First Minister taking to ensure that Assembly policy is developed to ensure that cross-cutting needs are met? (OAQ7391)

**The First Minister:** I believe that the Assembly is strongly committed to the following three principles: sustainable development—which is one of Rhodri Glyn's main interests—social inclusion and equal opportunity.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Sustainable development should be the main concern of every Assembly Member. Some weeks ago, Plaid Cymru ensured that the status of sustainable development as a cross-cutting theme was established. It was specifically requested that the extended sustainable development unit be established within the Assembly's main policy unit to ensure a truly cross-cutting approach to policy development. Has that happened and if it has not, why has it not happened?

**The First Minister:** I can only give you a written answer as regards the unit. I cannot answer you now, because you have asked a specific question and I am not certain of the answer. I will write to you concerning the status of the new unit.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae arian llywodraeth leol yn bwysig i amrywiaeth o wasanaethau lleol. Gostynga'r fformwla SSA yn glir ar allu cyngor Caerdydd a Bro Morgannwg i gynnal gwasanaethau ysgolion. A gytunwch i ohirio'r fformwla SSA newydd fel y gallwch ymgynghori mewn ffordd addas ar sut y gallwn atal toriadau mewn cyllidebau ysgolion?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ehanga hynny ar lastig y cwestiwn hwn yn sylweddol. Mae'r fformwla SSA a'r penderfyniad i ddefnyddio'r fformwla newydd, ond gan ei leddfu'n briodol, yn fater y dylai pob un o gynghorau Cymru, drwy'r WLGA, fod wedi chwarae rôl gyfartal â'r Cynulliad yn ddio. Gwyddem, yn fras, faint o arian y gallem ei fuddsoddi yn y broses llywodraeth leol. I fod

was up to local government to decide whether to go for the new formula or stick with the old formula. The decision to go for the new formula was made essentially by the councils, as much as by the Assembly. When a new formula is introduced, even though you damp out the biggest transitional increases, which are inevitable, some councils do better than others. Beyond that, I cannot do anything, other than to say that you should not give the impression that this is something which the Assembly is imposing on local government. Local councils have had just as much a share in it as the Assembly. It is very much a question for local councils.

**Mick Bates:** I will return to the issue of sustainable development, which is a statutory duty for the Assembly. I believe that there is a budget for promotion. What steps is the First Minister taking to promote the concept to the people of Wales?

2.05 p.m

**The First Minister:** I do not have a specific figure for promotion budgets. We have a budget of £28 million in the next year, rising to £94 million for the following two years to support sustainable development measures. I presume that the promotion budget comes from within that £28 million.

yn onest, llywodraeth leol oedd yn gyfrifol am benderfynu a ddylid defnyddio'r fformwla newydd neu a ddylid glynu at yr hen fformwla. Penderfynwyd defnyddio'r fformwla newydd gan y cynghorau yn bennaf, yn gymaint â'r Cynulliad. Pan gyflwynir fformwla newydd, er y lleddfir y codiadau trosiannol mwyaf, sydd yn anochel, gwna rhai cynghorau yn well nag eraill. Y tu hwnt i hynny, ni allaf wneud unrhyw beth, heblaw dweud na ddylech roi'r argraff bod hyn yn rhywbeth y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei osod ar lywodraeth leol. Mae cymaint o ran gan gynghorau lleol ynddo â'r Cynulliad. Mater i'r cynghorau lleol ydyw yn bennaf.

**Mick Bates:** Dychwelaf at fater datblygu cynaliadwy sydd yn ddyletswydd statudol ar gyfer y Cynulliad. Credaf fod cyllideb i'w hyrwyddo. Pa gamau a gymerir gan Brif Weinidog Cymru i hyrwyddo'r cysyniad i bobl Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes ffigur penodol gennyl ar gyfer cyllidebau hyrwyddo. Mae cyllideb o £28 miliwn gennym yn y flwyddyn nesaf, sydd yn codi i £94 miliwn am y ddwy flynedd ganlynol, er mwyn cynnal mesurau datblygu cynaliadwy. Tybiaf y daw'r gyllideb hyrwyddo o'r tu mewn i'r £28 miliwn hynny.

### Targedau 'Gwellcymru.com' 'Betterwales.com' Targets

**Q3 Geraint Davies:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the general public to discuss the targets outlined in 'Betterwales.com'? (OAQ7397)

**The First Minister:** The general public has had complete freedom to comment on 'Betterwales.com' through the dedicated website. We have all been pleased with the huge number of hits on that website; it was over 30,000 at the last time of asking, but it may be more by now. If that figure is significantly different, I will write to you, Geraint. The large number of responses we received, even during the initial drafting of 'Betterwales.com', helped to shape its objectives and targets. They are currently

**C3 Geraint Davies:** Pa drafodaethau a fu rhwng Prif Weinidog Cymru â'r cyhoedd i drafod y targedau a amlinellir yn 'Gwellcymru.com'? (OAQ7397)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cafodd y cyhoedd ryddid llawn i roi sylwadau ar 'Gwellcymru.com' drwy'r wefan benodol. Buom oll yn fodlon â'r nifer enfawr o bobl a fu'n defnyddio'r wefan honno: 30,000 ydoedd y tro diwethaf y gofynnwyd am y ffigur, ond efallai ei fod yn fwy erbyn hyn. Os bydd y ffigur yn wahanol iawn, ysgrifennaf atoch, Geraint. Helpodd y nifer fawr o ymatebion a dderbyniasom, hyd yn oed yn ystod gwaith draffio cychwynnol 'Gwellcymru.com', i lunio ei hamcanion a'i

being reviewed and we intend to fully consult with the public again.

**Geraint Davies:** How serious is the administration in trying to hit the target in ‘Betterwales.com’ to reduce the number of houses in serious disrepair to 4 per cent of the stock by March 2003? In my local authority—and I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council—12 per cent of houses are unfit and there is a waiting list of up to six years for housing repair grants. In addition, the housing budget has only been increased by a mere 2.5 per cent despite the comprehensive spending review.

**The First Minister:** The Assembly cannot be held responsible for the individual priority actions that are taken by any individual council. Targets agreed in ‘Betterwales.com’ are based on our best estimate of what we can hit as an all-Wales target. That does not mean that there will not be a departure from that average by any one local authority, which may have a particular problem or which may decide to set its targets in a different way.

**Rod Richards:** Does the First Minister have a target for routine tuberculosis immunisation or has he secretly abandoned that policy without telling the general public?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of any particular policy changes in relation to TB inoculation. Perhaps Rod would like to write to me with details of his concerns or any information that he has received about a recent change in policy on that matter.

**David Melding:** Does the First Minister agree that it is vital that we encourage public participation in the formulation of public policy, and that here the voluntary sector can be an excellent intermediary and that we should back ways to develop mechanisms to encourage public participation?

**The First Minister:** Until the arrival of the Assembly, Wales was famous, or notorious, for not having national political institutions.

thargedau. Fe’u harolygir ar hyn o bryd a bwriadwn ymgynghori â’r cyhoedd yn llawn unwaith eto.

**Geraint Davies:** Pa mor ddifrifol y mae’r weinyddiaeth wrth geisio cyrraedd y targed yn ‘Gwellcymru.com’ i ostwng y nifer o dai adfeiliadig i 4 y cant o’r stoc erbyn Mawrth 2003? Yn fy awdurdod lleol i—a datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf—mae 12 y cant o’r tai yn anaddas a cheir rhestr aros o hyd at chwe blynedd am grantiau atgyweirio tai. Yn ogystal, dim ond 2.5 y cant o godiad a gafwyd yn y gyllideb tai er gwaethaf yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni ellir dal y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol am y camau blaenoriaeth unigol a gymerir gan gynghorau unigol. Mae’r targedau y cytunwyd arnynt yn ‘Gwellcymru.com’ yn seiliedig ar ein hamcangyfrif gorau o’r hyn y gallwn ei gyrraedd fel targed Cymru gyfan. Ni olyga hynny na fydd unrhyw awdurdod lleol, a all gael problem benodol neu a all benderfynu gosod ei dargedau mewn ffordd wahanol, yn gwyo oddi ar y cyfartaledd hwnnw.

**Rod Richards:** A oes targed gan y Prif Weinidog ar gyfer gwaith imiwneiddio twbercwlosis arferol neu a roddodd y gorau i’r polisi hwnnw yn ddirgel heb ddweud wrth y cyhoedd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw newidiadau polisi penodol mewn perthynas â gwrth-heintio TB. Efallai yr hoffai Rod ysgrifennu ataf gyda manylion ei bryderon neu unrhyw wybodaeth a dderbyniodd am y newid diweddar mewn polisi ar y mater hwnnw.

**David Melding:** A gytuna’r Prif Weinidog ei bod yn hanfodol ein bod yn annog y cyhoedd i gyfranogi wrth lunio polisi cyhoeddus, ac y gall y sector gwirfoddol fod yn gyfryngwr ardderchog yma ac y dylem gefnogi ffyrdd i ddatblygu dulliau i annog y cyhoedd i gyfranogi?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Tan i’r Cynulliad gyrraedd, yr oedd Cymru yn enwog, neu’n ddrwg-enwog, gan nad oedd sefydliadau

However, because of that, it had an enormous wealth of voluntary sector bodies on a level that was unrivalled in Europe. It is part of our civil society throughout Wales. It is one of our great strengths and we do not want to erode that strength because we now have a Welsh Assembly. It is not a substitute for those voluntary bodies: it should be built on the platform of the voluntary bodies. I welcome anything that we can do to keep the voluntary sector in use as a way of communicating with voluntary sector bodies throughout Wales.

gwleidyddol cenedlaethol ganddi. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd hynny, yr oedd ganddi nifer enfawr o gyrrff sector gwirfoddol ar lefel heb ei hail yn Ewrop. Mae'n rhan o'r gymdeithas sifil ledled Cymru. Mae'n un o'n cryfderau mawr ac nid ydym yn awyddus i erydu'r cryfder hwnnw gan fod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gennym bellach. Ni chymera le'r cyrrff gwirfoddol hynny: dylid ei adeiladu ar lwyfan y cyrrff gwirfoddol. Croesawaf unrhyw beth y gallwn ei wneud er mwyn parhau i ddefnyddio'r sector gwirfoddol fel ffordd o gysylltu â chyrff sector gwirfoddol ledled Cymru.

### **Cynrychioli Barn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ym Mesurau Llywodraeth y DU Representing the National Assembly's views in UK Government Bills**

**C4 David Lloyd:** Pa drafodaethau a fu rhwng y Prif Weinidog ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch sut y gellid cynrychioli barn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn well ym Mesurau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig sydd wedi'u cyhoeddi? (OAQ7395)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes gennych unrhyw beth i'w ychwanegu at yr ateb a roddais i gwestiwn Rhodri Glyn Thomas ar 17 Hydref. Pe baech yn gofyn cwestiwn penodol, efallai y gallwn roi ateb mwy cynhwysfawr ichi.

**David Lloyd:** Byddaf yn benodol, felly. Yn dilyn eich ymrwymiad yn y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ddoe y dylai o leiaf un Mesur y flwyddyn o'r Cynulliad hwn gael ei gynnwys mewn rhyw fath o slot Cymreig yn Araith y Frenhines, sut y dewisir y darn hwnnw o ddeddfwriaeth a beth fydd y Mesur nesaf?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes llawer o amser cyn Araith nesaf y Frenhines ar 6 Rhagfyr—tua chwe wythnos. Yr ydym wedi bod yn pwysol am Fesur annibynnol ynglŷn â'r Comisiynydd Plant annibynnol yng Nghymru, y swydd a sefydlwyd eisoes drwy welliant yn neddfwriaeth San Steffan i'r Mesur Safonau Gofal. Yr ydym am ymestyn hawliau a dyletswyddau'r Comisiynydd Plant annibynnol drwy gael Mesur annibynnol yn Araith y Frenhines. Yr ydym yn disgwl clywed am hyn, ond ni allwn fod yn siŵr nes clywed Araith y Frenhines ymhent tua chwe

**Q4 David Lloyd:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding how the views of the National Assembly could be better represented in published UK Government Bills? (OAQ7395)

**The First Minister:** I have nothing to add to the answer I gave to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's question on 17 October. If you asked a specific question, perhaps I could give you a more comprehensive answer.

**David Lloyd:** I will be specific, therefore. Following your commitment to the Select Committee on Welsh Affairs yesterday that at least one Bill a year from this Assembly should be included in some sort of Welsh slot in the Queen's Speech, how will that piece of legislation be selected and what will the next Bill be?

**The First Minister:** There is not much time before the next Queen's Speech on 6 December—about six weeks. We have been pressing for an independent Bill regarding the independent Children's Commissioner in Wales, the post that has already been established by an amendment in Westminster legislation to the Care Standards Bill. We want to extend the rights and duties of the independent Children's Commissioner by having an independent Bill in the Queen's Speech. We are waiting to hear about this, but we cannot be sure until we hear the

wythnos.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yn y cytundeb partneriaeth a lofnodasoch gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, cyfeiriwch at yr angen am gorff neu gomisiwn i adolygu pwerau'r Cynulliad. A gydnabyddwch y bydd yn rhaid i'r comisiwn hwnnw, os yw am fod yn gwbl agored, ystyried pwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mewn egwyddor, ydwyt. Ni fyddch am ddileu rhai posibiliadau cyn i'r corff annibynnol hwn ddechrau ar ei waith. Byddech yn disgwyli'r corff hwn ystyried pob math o gynigion gan bobl â diddordeb yng Nghymru o wahanol sectorau ein bywyd cyhoeddus a phreifat, a byddem yn disgwyli i rai o'r cynigion hynny ddelio ag ychwanegu neu ledaenu pwerau'r Cynulliad.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Tynnaf eich sylw at ddatganiad a wnaethpwyd gan Paul Murphy ym Madrid heddiw. Dywed ef yn berffaith glir nad yw pobl Cymru eisaiu pwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad. Pwy sydd yn siarad ar ran Llafur yng Nghymru—chi neu Paul Murphy?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym wedi cytuno i sefydlu comisiwn annibynnol. Mae hynny yn rhan o'r cytundeb y sefydlwyd y llywodraeth bartneriaeth arno. Byddai gan Paul Murphy bob hawl i roi ei syniadau gerbron y comiswn annibynnol a bydd yn rhaid inni weld pa argymhellion a ddaw o'r comisiwn annibynnol ymhengtair blynnyd.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** What discussions have you had with the Secretary of State for Wales or other Westminster colleagues regarding a legislative, or other, response to the fuel crisis, or can we merely expect troops driving fuel lorries? Will there be any other response from the Government according to representations made by you?

**The First Minister:** The representations that we have made are that there is a strong body of opinion in Wales in favour of lower fuel prices. Those lower fuel prices are a

Queen's Speech in about six weeks' time.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** In the partnership agreement that you signed with the Liberal Democrats, you refer to the need for a body or commission to review the Assembly's powers. Do you acknowledge that that commission, if it is to be totally open, will have to consider additional powers for the Assembly?

**The First Minister:** In principle, yes. You would not wish to eliminate some possibilities before this independent body begins its work. You would expect this body to consider all kinds of proposals from interested parties in Wales from the various sectors in our public and private life, and we would expect some of those proposals to deal with adding to or enhancing the Assembly's powers.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I draw your attention to a statement made by Paul Murphy in Madrid today. He states categorically that the people of Wales do not wish the Assembly to have additional powers. Who speaks on behalf of Labour in Wales—you or Paul Murphy?

**The First Minister:** We have agreed to establish an independent commission. That is part of the agreement upon which the partnership government is founded. Paul Murphy has every right to put his ideas to the independent commission and we will have to see what recommendations come from the independent commission three years hence.

**Arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig (Nick Bourne):** Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru neu gyd-Aelodau eraill yn San Steffan mewn perthynas ag ymateb deddfwriaethol, neu ymateb arall, i'r argyfwng tanwydd, neu a allwn ond disgwyli y bydd milwyr yn gyrru lorïau tanwydd? A fydd unrhyw ymateb arall gan y Llywodraeth yn ôl y cynrychioliadau a wnaethpwyd gennych?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Y cynrychioliadau a wnaethom yw bod barn gref yng Nghymru o blaid prisiau tanwydd is. Mae'r prisiau tanwydd is hynny yn gyfuniad o ffactorau

combination of external factors—namely the price of crude oil on the international market, which has been far higher than when the budget level of fuel duty was set—and fuel duties. Although Gordon Brown abolished the fuel duty escalator, which was brought in by your party some five years previously, the price of crude oil has since shot up and with the turbulence in the Middle East shows little sign of coming back down. Whether that is sufficient to persuade the Chancellor that most of the green objectives that were to be achieved by the combination of fuel duty and crude oil prices as they were when he set his budget and can now be achieved by a lower level of tax because of the higher price of crude oil, is a matter for him. There is not long to wait before Gordon Brown manifests his thoughts and shares them with the general public—a week tomorrow, I believe.

**Nick Bourne:** I remind the First Minister that he gave an undertaking at the time of the first fuel crisis and protests that he would speak to the leaders of the protesters to understand their views and to take those views to Westminster. There was a meeting last week that you failed to attend when you were in the Assembly. In fairness, the Minister for the Environment was there, but you were not, and there was great disappointment about that. Will you give an undertaking that you will meet with them before the 60-day period is up so that we can relay those feelings to Westminster?

2.15 p.m.

**The First Minister:** It would help if Nick could put what he states as bare fact into a question. If he had asked whether I was invited to that meeting, I could have told him, that no, I was not. I have been invited to a meeting, which, I believe, takes place tomorrow. As soon as I was invited I agreed to attend. However, I was not aware of the previous meeting. It took place before I knew of it. We would be far happier if Nick could confine himself to asking questions rather than making bald statements that are not well based in fact. I did not know of that meeting. As soon as I was invited to a meeting, I agreed to attend. That meeting takes place tomorrow. I would have thought, Nick, that

allanol—sef pris olew crai ar y farchnad ryngwladol, a fu'n llawer uwch na phan osodwyd lefel y dreth danwydd yn y gyllideb—a threthi tanwydd. Er i Gordon Brown ddiddymu'r esgynnydd treth tanwydd, a gyflwynwyd gan eich plaid chi tua phum mlynedd yn gynt, mae pris olew crai wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ers hynny ac nid ymddengys ei fod yn gostwng eto, oherwydd y cythrwl yn y Dwyrain Canol. Mater i'r Canghellor ydyw a yw hynny'n ddigonol i'w ddarbwyllo y gellir cyflawni'r rhan fwyaf o'r amcanion gwyrdd a oedd i'w cyflawni drwy gyfuno'r dreth danwydd a phrisiau olew crai fel yr oeddent pan osodwyd y gyllideb ganddo bellach drwy lefel is o dreth oherwydd pris uwch olew crai. Nid oes yn rhaid aros yn hir cyn i Gordon Brown amlyu ei syniadau a'u rhannu â'r cyhoedd—wythnos i yfory, mi gredaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Atgoffaf Brif Weinidog Cymru iddo addo, ar adeg yr argyfwng a'r protestiadau tanwydd cyntaf, siarad ag arweinwyr y protestwyr er mwyn deall eu safbwytiau ac er mwyn mynd â'r rheini i San Steffan. Bu cyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf y methasoch â'i fynychu am eich bod yn y Cynulliad. I fod yn deg, roedd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yno, ond nid oeddech chi yno, ac roedd siom fawr am hynny. A ymgymmerwch i gyfarfod â hwy cyn diwedd y cyfnod 60 diwrnod fel y gallwn drosglwyddo'r teimladau hynny i San Steffan?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai Nick yn rhoi ar ffurf cwestiwn yr hyn a ddatgana fel ffaith noeth. Pe gofynnai a gefais fy ngwahodd i'r cyfarfod hwnnw, gallwn fod wedi dweud wrtho, naddo, ni chefais fy ngwahodd. Fe'm gwahoddwyd i gyfarfod a fydd yn digwydd yfory, fe gredaf. Cyn gynted â'm gwahoddwyd, cytunais i fynychu. Fodd bynnag, nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r cyfarfod blaenorol. Fe'i cynhalwyd cyn i mi wybod amdano. Byddwn lawer hapusach pe gallai Nick ei gyfyngu ei hun i ofyn cwestiynau yn hytrach na gwneud datganiadau noeth nad ydynt yn seiliedig ar ffeithiau. Ni oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r

you would be happy about that.

cyfarfod hwennw. Cyn gynted â'm gwahoddwyd i gyfarfod, cytunais i'w fynychu. Cynhelir y cyfarfod yfory. Dychmygwn, Nick, y byddech yn hapus am hynny.

### **Ad-drefnu'r Cabinet Cabinet Reshuffle**

**Q5 Pauline Jarman:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the recent Cabinet reshuffle? (OAQ7388)

**The First Minister:** Yes. I have nothing to add to the statement that I made on 17 October.

**Pauline Jarman:** Are pre-Cabinet caucus meetings of Labour Ministers held to agree business before those Ministers meet their Liberal Democrat partners in the Cabinet?

**The First Minister:** Perhaps you are better informed than I am, Pauline.

**Glyn Davies:** They do not invite you, Rhodri.

**The First Minister:** If meetings did take place, I would be present.

**Glyn Davies:** You know that we as a group are unhappy with your choosing a Cabinet that does not include representatives from north, mid or south Wales—west Wales, I mean—and that we wanted you to change that Cabinet. We know that there is no chance of you doing so unless you recognise that it is a problem. Do you believe that it is a problem that you have chosen an entire Cabinet from the former Glamorgan part of Wales and not from any other part? Do you see that as a problem that should be dealt with?

**The First Minister:** I would accept that it makes it possible for opposition parties to make trouble and try to wind up the population of the other parts of Wales. I accept that there is a perceived problem. That is why I have taken on the additional duty of co-ordinating Government policy in north Wales.

**C5 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch yr ad-drefnu Cabinet diweddar? (OAQ7388)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf. Nid oes dim byd gennyf i'w ychwanegu at y datganiad a wneuthum ar 17 Hydref.

**Pauline Jarman:** A gynhelir cyfarfodydd cawcws cyn y Cabinet o Weinidogion Llafur i gytuno ar fusnes cyn i'r Gweinidogion hynny gwrdd â'u partneriaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cabinet?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Efallai fod mwy o wybodaeth gennych chi na fi, Pauline.

**Glyn Davies:** Ni wahoddant chi, Rhodri.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Pe cynheliad cyfarfodydd, byddwn yn bresennol.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwyddoch nad ydym ni fel grŵp yn fodlon eich bod wedi dewis Cabinet nad yw'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o'r gogledd, y canolbarth neu'r de—y gorllewin, mae'n ddrwg gennyf—a'n bod am i chi newid y Cabinet. Gwyddom na wnewch hynny oni fyddwch yn cydnabod ei fod yn broblem. A gredwch ei bod yn broblem y dewisasoch Gabinet cyfan o'r hen Forgannwg a dim un rhan arall? A welwch fod hynny yn broblem y dylid ymdrin â hi?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Derbyniwn ei bod yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i'r gwrthbleidiau achosi trafferth a cheisio cynhyrfu poblogaeth rhannau eraill o Gymru. Derbyniaf fod problem ganfyddedig. Dyna pam yr ymgymerais â'r ddyletswydd ychwanegol o gydlynw polisi'r Llywodraeth yng ngogledd Cymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6 has been withdrawn. **Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 6 yn ôl.

### Polisi'r Llywodraeth yng Ngogledd Cymru Government Policy in North Wales

**Q7 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a brief statement on co-ordination of Government policy in north Wales? (OAQ7387)

**The First Minister:** In my new role as Minister with special responsibility for the co-ordination of Government policy in north Wales, I will ensure that the north is properly represented and seen to be properly represented in all Assembly policies, including matters related to resource allocation and public appointments. I will also ensure that the North Wales Regional Committee's voice is heard loud and clear at Assembly Cabinet level.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome that announcement. As Minister with responsibility for the north, will you guarantee today that you will attend every meeting of the North Wales Regional Committee and will allow full scrutiny of your actions regarding the north in those meetings?

**The First Minister:** It would be rather too much for the North Wales Regional Committee to want to invite me to every meeting. I have to be invited. I cannot invite myself to the meetings. I understand that Ann Jones asked the Committee to invite me; it has done so and I have agreed to attend. I understand that its next meeting, at which I will be present, is on 8 December.

**Alison Halford:** I had a supplementary question to Tom Middlehurst's withdrawn question. However, my point has been covered by Janet Ryder's supplementary. We were going to invite the First Minister to the North Wales Regional Committee meeting. He has now signified his willingness to do so and I will be delighted to buy him tea as soon as he arrives at the meeting.

**The First Minister:** Every time I am invited

**C7 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad byr ynghylch cydlyn u polisi'r Llywodraeth yng ngogledd Cymru? (OAQ7387)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yn fy rôl newydd fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb arbennig dros gydlyn u polisi'r Llywodraeth yng ngogledd Cymru, sicrhaf y cynrychiolir y gogledd mewn ffordd briodol ac y gwelir y cynrychiolir y gogledd mewn ffordd briodol ym mhob un o bolisiau'r Cynulliad, gan gynnwys materion sydd yn gysylltiedig â dyrannu adnoddau a phenodiadau cyhoeddus. Sicrhaf hefyd y clywir llais Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd yn uchel ac yn glir ar lefel Cabinet y Cynulliad.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad hwnnw. Fel y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am y gogledd, a roddwch sicrhad heddiw y mynchwch bob un o gyfarfodydd Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd ac y caniatewch i'ch gweithredoedd ynglŷn â'r gogledd yn y cyfarfodydd hynny gael eu harchwilio'n llawn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddai braidd yn ormod i Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd ddymuno fy ngwahodd i bob cyfarfod. Rhaid imi gael fy ngwahodd. Ni allaf wahodd fy hun i'r cyfarfodydd. Deallaf y gofynnodd Ann Jones i'r Pwyllgor fy ngwahodd; gwnaeth hyn a chytunais i'w fynychu. Deallaf y cynhelir ei gyfarfod nesaf, y byddaf yn ei fynychu, ar 8 Rhagfyr.

**Alison Halford:** Roedd gennyf gwestiwn atodol i gwestiwn Tom Middlehurst a dynnyd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, cwmpaswyd fy mhwynt gan gwestiwn atodol Janet Ryder. Yr oeddym yn mynd i wahodd y Prif Weinidog i gyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd. Dangosodd bellach ei barodrwydd i wneud hynny a byddaf wrth fy modd yn prynu te iddo cyn gynted ag y bydd yn cyrraedd y cyfarfod.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bob tro y'm

to a North Wales Regional Committee meeting, I will seek to attend.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y sicrwydd hwnnw gan fod y Prif Weinidog yn methu â mynchu hanner y cyfarfodydd y mae'n eu trefnu yn y Gogledd. Sut y gall weithredu fel Gweinidog dros y Gogledd pan fo'n tynnu yn ôl o gyfarfod ar ôl cyfarfod? Er enghrafft, tynnodd yn ôl o gyfarfod gyda Phrifysgol Cymru ym Mangor ryw bythefnos yn ôl ac o gyfarfod i agror rheilffordd Eryri—a gallaf ddeall hynny—a rhes o gyfarfodydd eraill. A wnaiff roi sicrwydd y bydd yn cadw ei gyhoeddiadau yn y Gogledd o hyn ymlaen ac yn mynchu pob cyfarfod o Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gan bwyll, Dafydd. Yr oedd hynny dros ben llestri. Sut y gellir disgwyl i unrhyw brif weinidog, neu unrhyw un â'm dyletswyddau innau, fynychu pob cyfarfod y derbynia wahoddiad iddo? Mae'n drueni bod hynny'n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn credu bod fy record yn gywilyddus, ac yr wyf yn hapus gyda hi. Byddaf yn ymweld â gogledd Cymru yn ystod y ddau benwythnos nesaf.

**Peter Rogers:** As the co-ordinator of Government policy in north Wales, will you instruct Cabinet colleagues to review their procedure in answering letters? We receive a variable level of response in north Wales and, in some cases, we do not receive any replies.

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that that is an issue particularly related to letters received from north Wales. I hope that he is not referring to the postal service between north and south Wales. I am aware of a serious problem in the postal service in Cardiff during part of last week, which may have delayed some communications. If Peter wishes to write to me with the details—I am not aware of a complaint about the time taken to reply to letters—and if there is a problem, I will be able to examine it and try to sort it out.

gwahodd i gyfarfod o Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd, ceisiaf ei fynychu.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I am pleased to hear that assurance as the First Minister fails to attend half the meetings that he arranges in the North. How can he operate as Minister for the North when he withdraws from meeting after meeting? For example, he withdrew from a meeting with the University of Wales in Bangor a fortnight or so ago and from a meeting to open the Welsh Highland railway—and I can understand that—and a range of other meetings. Will he give an assurance that he will keep his engagements in the North from now on and attend every meeting of the North Wales Regional Committee?

**The First Minister:** Steady on, Dafydd. That was over the top. How could anyone expect any first minister, or anyone with my duties, to attend every meeting to which he or she is invited? It is a pity that that happens. However, I do not think that my record is shameful, and I am happy with it. I will visit north Wales during the next two weekends.

**Peter Rogers:** Fel cydlynnydd polisi'r Llywodraeth yng ngogledd Cymru, a ddywedwch wrth eich cyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet am adolygu eu gweithdrefnau o ran ateb llythyrau? Yr ydym yn derbyn lefel amrywiol o ymateb yng ngogledd Cymru ac, mewn rhai achosion, ni dderbyniwn unrhyw ymateb.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n fater sydd yn ymwneud yn benodol â llythyrau a dderbynir o ogledd Cymru. Gobeithiaf na chyfeiria at y gwasanaeth post rhwng gogledd a de Cymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o broblem ddifrifol yn y gwasanaeth post yng Nghaerdydd yn ystod rhan o'r wythnos diwethaf, a allai fod wedi oedi rhai llythyrau. Pe dymunai Peter ysgrifennu ataf gyda'r manylion—nid wyf yn ymwybodol o gwŷn am yr amser a gymerir i ymateb i lythyrau—ac os oes problem, gallaf ymchwilio iddi a cheisio ei datrys.

### **Dyletswyddau Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru The Deputy First Minister's Duties**

**Q8 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister explain the duties that will be incorporated in the new Cabinet post of Deputy First Minister? (OAQ7409)

**The First Minister:** Although we have to abide by the rules as defined strictly by the Presiding Officer, am I right that your concern relates to the Deputy First Minister, not to Deputy Ministers? That is what I was told.

**Janet Davies:** Yes.

**The First Minister:** The Deputy First Minister will take my place in Plenary, Cabinet meetings and on other occasions when I will be unavailable. He is also the Minister for Economic Development.

**Janet Davies:** Will that not cause a confusion of roles, and how would you defend them?

**The First Minister:** I do not see any confusion of roles as regards the Deputy First Minister also being the Minister for Economic Development, if that is what lies behind your question. In any system of government in western Europe or the world—with the exception of the American presidency and vice presidency, with which we would not compare ourselves—the deputy prime minister or deputy premier usually has a substantial portfolio as well as the role of deputising in the absence of the first minister or premier.

**William Graham:** I see that the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board are on the Deputy Prime Minister's list of responsibilities. However, I do not see the Welsh Joint Education Committee on that list. Is there any reason for that?

**The First Minister:** Yes—the WJEC does not come under economic development.

**C8 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru egluro'r dyletswyddau a gaiff eu hymgorffori i swydd newydd Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru o fewn y Cabinet? (OAQ7409)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Er bod yn rhaid inni gadw at y rheolau a ddiffinnir yn fanwl gan y Llywydd, a wyf yn gywir bod eich pryder yn ymwneud â Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru ac nid â'r Dirprwy Weinidogion? Dyna'r hyn a ddywedwyd wrthyf.

**Janet Davies:** Ydych.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cymera Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru fy lle yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, cyfarfodydd y Cabinet ac ar adegau eraill pan na fyddaf ar gael. Ef hefyd yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd.

**Janet Davies:** Oni achosa hynny ddryswch o ran y rolau, a sut y byddech yn eu hamddiffyn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni welaf unrhyw ddryswch o ran y rolau gan fod Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru hefyd yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, os dyna'r hyn sydd y tu ôl i'ch cwestiwn. Mewn unrhyw system lywodraethol yng ngorllewin Ewrop neu'r byd—ac eithrio arlywyddiaeth ac is-arlywyddiaeth America, na chymharwn ein hunain â hwy—mae portffolio sylweddol gan y dirprwy brif weinidog neu'r dirprwy lywydd fel arfer ynghyd â'r rôl o ddirprwyd yn absenoldeb y prif weinidog neu lywydd.

**William Graham:** Gwelaf fod Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ar y rhestr o gyfrifoldebau sydd gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, ni welaf Gydbwylgor Addysg Cymru ar y rhestr honno. A oes rheswm dros hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Oes—ni ddaw CBAC o dan ddatblygu economaidd.

### **Cabinet y Cynulliad (Swyddogaethau) The Assembly Cabinet (Functions)**

**Q9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the First Minister make a brief statement on the

**C9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ynghylch y

overall exercise of functions by the Assembly Cabinet? (OAQ7392)

**The First Minister:** As I said in my answer to a similar question from Dafydd Wigley on 24 October, Cabinet Ministers are responsible for functions within their portfolios, as appointed by me. I am content with how they are being exercised.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It was necessary to ask that question because we missed a certain appointment. Carwyn Jones, the Minister for Rural Affairs, now appears to be the Cabinet spokesperson on the euro. Last week, he made an interesting statement when he said that

‘The greatest obstacle that farming faces is the fact that we are not members of the euro.’

He went on to say that farmers are hit by a double whammy because of that. Does the Government of Wales now support entry into the euro?

**The First Minister:** It depends on what rate is available for entry. I think that Carwyn’s point was that, at the time when entry might have been possible—when the euro:sterling exchange rate was different from what it is now—Welsh farmers would be better off had we entered at that rate. The rate has changed so much by now that it would create fewer benefits. Looking back, entry at that rate would have been of great benefit, not only to farming where it is a double whammy, but also to manufacturing.

**David Davies:** Does the First Minister accept that, while the rate might be right at one point in time, it might not always be right? However, if we lock ourselves into a single currency at one rate in perpetuity, farmers who benefit one month, could suffer two months or two years later.

**The First Minister:** Yes. If you join the euro you will no longer have a variation between the euro:sterling exchange rate. That is what it is all about. However, there is a timing factor. If you enter the euro at purchasing power parity, then you start off and lock in at

modd y mae Cabinet y Cynulliad yn arfer ei swyddogaethau yn gyffredinol? (OAQ7392)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i gwestiwn tebyg gan Dafydd Wigley ar 24 Hydref, mae Gweinidogion y Cabinet yn gyfrifol am y swyddogaethau o fewn eu portffolios, fel y'u penodwyd gennyf. Yr wyf yn fodlon â'r modd y cānt eu cyflawni.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr oedd angen gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw gan ein bod wedi colli un penodiad. Ymddengys fod Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, bellach yn llefarydd y Cabinet ar yr ewro. Gwnaeth ddatganiad diddorol yr wythnos diwethaf pan ddywedodd mai

‘Y rhwystr mwyaf a wyneba ffermio yw'rffaith nad ydym yn aelodau o'r ewro.’

Aeth ymlaen i ddweud y caiff ffermwyr eu taro ddwywaith oherwydd hynny. A gefnoga Llywodraeth Cymru bellach fynediad i'r ewro?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n dibynnu ar ba gyfradd sydd ar gael ar gyfer mynediad. Credaf mai pwyt Carwyn oedd, ar adeg pan allai mynediad fod wedi bod yn bosibl—pan fu'r gyfradd gyfnewid ewro:sterling yn wahanol i'r hyn y mae ar hyn o bryd—byddai ffermwyr Cymru wedi bod yn well eu byd pe byddem wedi mynd i mewn ar y gyfradd honno. Mae'r gyfradd wedi newid cymaint erbyn hyn fel y byddai'n creu llai o fanteision. Wrth edrych yn ôl, byddai mynd i mewn ar y gyfradd honno wedi bod yn fanteisiol iawn, nid yn unig i ffermio lle ceir effaith ddwbl, ond hefyd i weithgynhyrchu.

**David Davies:** A dderbynia Prif Weinidog Cymru, er y gallai'r gyfradd fod yn addas ar un adeg, efallai na fydd yn addas bob amser? Fodd bynnag, pe byddem yn cloi ein hunain i arian sengl ar un gyfradd am byth, gallai'r ffermwyr sydd yn manteisio un mis ddioddef ddaus fis neu ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ydwyt. Pe ymunir â'r ewro, ni pharheir i gael amrywiaeth rhwng y gyfradd gyfnewid ewro:sterling. Dyna wraidd hyn i gyd. Fodd bynnag, ceir ffactor amseru. Pe byddid yn mynd i mewn i'r ewro ar baredd pŵer prynu, byddwch yn

a rate which is regarded as fair on all sides. It does not confer artificial advantages on farmers or businesses in Wales, but you do not get unfair advantages either. You do not cover up inefficiencies or low productivity. However, at any one time, the markets are moving quickly and we see the instability that you get from a euro:sterling exchange rate which is moving like a yo-yo. Unfortunately, at the moment, that is causing Welsh farmers to suffer considerably. The same applies to Welsh manufacturing industry.

2.25 p.m.

### **Adrannau Eraill y Llywodraeth (Swyddogaethau) Other Government Departments (Functions)**

**C10 Cynog Dafis:** Pa drafodaethau a fu rhwng Prif Weinidog Cymru ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch y swyddogaethau sydd yn cael eu cyflawni ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru gan adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth? (OAQ7396)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn siarad â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol am y pynciau hynny, ac yn uniongyrchol hefyd â'r Gweinidogion sydd yn rhedeg yr adrannau sydd yn effeithio'n fawr ar Gymru neu sydd yn gwario llawer yng Nghymru. Ar raddfa fras, mae tua hanner yr arian sydd yn cael ei wario yng Nghymru yn cael ei wario gan y Cynulliad, a chaiff yr hanner arall ei wario gan adrannau'r Llywodraeth ganolog.

**Cynog Dafis:** Beth yw agwedd y Prif Weinidog a'r coalisiwn tuag at drosglwyddo cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad? Yr wyf yn meddwl am yr heddlu a'r gwasanaeth Tân, er enghraift. A yw'n ymwybodol bod cefnogaeth yn yr heddlu i symudiad o'r fath? A yw'n derbyn y byddai gwneud hynny yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i ymdrin yn fwy effeithiol â sefyllfaoedd megis y lligfogydd presennol a'r problemau diweddar gyda phrotestiadau gyrwyr lorïau ynglŷn â thanwydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyna gwestiwn y diwrnod, os nad cwestiwn y degawd. Byddai'n syndod pe na bai'r broses yr ydym wedi'i gweld, ac wedi byw gyda hi—os ydych yr un oedran â mi—yn parhau.

dechrau ac yn cloi i mewn ar gyfradd yr ystyria bob ochr ei bod yn deg. Ni rydd manteision ffug i ffermwyr neu fusnesau yng Nghymru, ond ni cheir anfanteision annheg ychwaith. Ni chaiff aneffeithlonrwydd na chynhyrchiant isel eu cuddio. Fodd bynnag, ar unrhyw adeg, symuda'r marchnadoedd yn gyflym a gwelwn yr ansefydlogrwydd a geir o gyfradd gyfniewid ewro:sterling sydd yn symud fel io-io. Yn anffodus, achosa hynny i ffermwyr Cymru ddioddef yn fawr ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ddiwydiant gweithgynhyrchu Cymru.

**Q10 Cynog Dafis:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales about the functions currently carried out in Wales by other Government departments? (OAQ7396)

**The First Minister:** I talk to the Secretary of State about those subjects, and also directly to the Ministers who run the departments which have a great impact on Wales or which spend a great deal in Wales. Roughly half the money that is spent in Wales is spent by the Assembly, and the other half is spent by central Government departments.

**Cynog Dafis:** What is the First Minister's attitude and that of the coalition towards transferring additional responsibilities to the Assembly? I am thinking about the police and the fire service, for example. Is he aware that there is some support within the police service for such a move? Does he accept that doing that would enable the Assembly to deal more effectively with situations such as the floods affecting us at present and the recent problems with lorry drivers' protests about fuel?

**The First Minister:** That is the question of the day, if not the question of the decade. It would be a surprise if the process that we have seen, and lived with—if you are the same age as me—does not continue. We saw

Gwelsom ddechrau'r Swyddfa Gymreig yn 1964, ac wedyn ychwanegwyd at ei dyletswyddau bron bob pum mlynedd. Nid oedd ots pa un ai'r Torïaid ai Llafur oedd mewn grym—yr oedd rhyw ddyletswydd yn cael ei throsglwyddo o Whitehall a San Steffan i'r Swyddfa Gymreig. Ni ddisgwyliech i'r broses honno ddod i ben ar ôl inni gael datganoli. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn sicr pryd y bydd y broses honno'n ailddechrau ac yn trosglwyddo efallai—fel y trafodasom ddoe ger bron y Pwyllgor Dethol—bethau megis cyfrifoldeb am y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd. Maent hwy'n awyddus i ni ei chymryd drosodd, a dywedwn ninnau, 'lawn, os cawn yr arian, cymerwn ni hi drosodd.' Fodd bynnag, mae cytundeb ar draws y pleidiau i beidio â chymryd y cyfrifoldeb am S4C, a'i bod yn well iddi aros o dan gyfundrefn ganolog gyda'r sectorau darlledu eraill yn Llundain o dan yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon.

Ni fyddch yn disgwyli'r broses ddod i ben. O ran yr heddlu a'r gwasanaeth Tân, efallai mai yno y mae'r gefnogaeth gryfaf. Clywais ambell brif gwnstabl ledled Cymru yn dweud y byddent yn llawer hapusach o dan y Cynulliad. Efallai y digwydd hynny.

**Brian Hancock:** Yesterday you said that you thought that perhaps one Bill a year could be contributed to the Queen's Speech. What is that one Bill this year?

**The First Minister:** You will have to wait until the Queen's Speech. Nobody is fully aware of the contents of that speech, other than those who are preparing it, until the day before it is delivered. The coming session of Parliament, which starts in the middle of December, will be the shortest for a long time because of the likelihood of an election in May or June of next year. Therefore it will be a relatively short Queen's Speech. We hope that the Bill concerning the children's commissioner will be in it. However, I do not know because the final decisions are made only in the days before the Queen's Speech is prepared.

the establishment of the Welsh Office in 1964 and an expansion of its duties almost every five years. It did not matter whether it was the Tories or Labour who were in power—some functions were transferred from Whitehall and Westminster to the Welsh Office. You would not expect that process to stop once we had devolution. However, I am not sure when that process will recommence and transfer perhaps—as we discussed yesterday before the Select Committee—things such as the responsibility for the European social fund. They are keen for us to take it over, and we say, 'Fine, if we get the money, we will take it over.' However, there is agreement across the parties not to take responsibility for S4C, and that it is better for it to stay under the central system with the other broadcasting sectors in London under the Department for Culture, Media and Sport.

You would not expect the process to stop. As regards the police and the fire service, perhaps that is where support is strongest. I have heard a few chief constables throughout Wales saying that they would be much happier under the Assembly. Perhaps that will happen.

**Brian Hancock:** Dywedasoch ddoe y credasoch efallai y gellid cyfrannu un Mesur y flwyddyn tuag at Araith y Frenhines. Beth yw'r un Mesur hwnnw eleni?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd yn rhaid ichi aros tan Araith y Frenhines. Nid oes unrhyw un yn hollol ymwybodol o gynnwys yr araith honno, ar wahân i'r rheini sydd yn ei pharatoi, tan y diwrnod cyn y caiff ei chyflwyno. Y sesiwn Seneddol sydd yn dod, sydd yn dechrau yng nghanol mis Rhagfyr, fydd y sesiwn fyrraf ers amser hir oherwydd y tebygolrwydd y ceir etholiad ym Mai neu Fehefin y flwyddyn nesaf. Felly bydd Araith y Frenhines yn gymharol fer. Gobeithiwn y bydd y Mesur sydd yn ymwneud â chomisiynydd plant yn rhan ohoni. Fodd bynnag, ni wn oherwydd dim ond yn y diwrnodau cyn y paratoir Araith y Frenhines y gwneir y penderfyniadau terfynol.

## Datganiad ar Adroddiad Phillips ar BSE Statement on the Phillips Report on BSE

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** Last Thursday, 26 October, the UK Government published the report of the BSE inquiry, chaired by Lord Phillips. The Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food made a detailed statement to Parliament on that day and a copy of that statement is on the National Assembly's intranet. The First Minister has welcomed the report and has acknowledged that this is but the start of the process to consider the detailed and wide-ranging issues covered in the report. His statement is also available on the intranet.

The inquiry was commissioned by the UK Government in 1997. Lord Phillips and his team are to be congratulated for providing a comprehensive report that is the outcome of three years of thorough investigative work. The inquiry was a massive undertaking, with more than 1,000 people submitting written evidence. Around 140 public hearings were held, involving over 300 witnesses. The inquiry team sifted through 3,000 files of contemporary official documents.

Commenting on the size of the inquiry's task, Lord Phillips stated:

'Our report has to distil evidence that we have received over the last two years. It must deal fairly with individuals whose reputations are at stake. It must explain clearly a complex series of events and state what is to be learned from them. Many have devoted enormous time and energy to providing us with evidence and submissions. If our report is to do justice to them, it cannot be produced in a rush. The rigorous appraisal of complex and detailed evidence that is necessary for sound and fair conclusions is a heavy task.'

There is no doubt that that is the case, because the inquiry's report consists of a

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU adroddiad ar yr ymchwiliad BSE, a gadeiriwyd gan yr Arglwydd Phillips ddydd Iau diwethaf, 26 Hydref. Gwnaeth y Gweinidog Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd ddatganiad manwl i'r Senedd y diwrnod hwnnw a cheir copi o'r datganiad hwnnw ar fewnrwyd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Croesawyd yr adroddiad gan y Prif Weinidog a chydnabu mai megis dechrau'r broses yw hyn i ystyried y materion manwl ac eang eu cwmpas sydd yn yr adroddiad. Mae ei ddatganiad ef ar gael ar y fewnrwyd hefyd.

Comisiynwyd yr ymchwiliad gan Lywodraeth y DU yn 1997. Rhaid llonyfarch yr Arglwydd Phillips a'i dim am ddarparu adroddiad cynhwysfawr sydd yn ganlyniad tair blynedd o waith ymchwilio trylwyr. Bu'r ymchwiliad yn fenter enfawr, a chyflwynodd mwy na 1,000 o bobl dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig. Cynhaliwyd tua 140 o wrandawiadau cyhoeddus, gyda mwy na 300 o dystion yn cymryd rhan. Edrychodd tîm yr ymchwiliad drwy 3,000 o ffeiliau o ddogfennau swyddogol cyfoes.

Gan roi sylwadau ar faint tasg yr ymchwiliad, datganodd yr Arglwydd Phillips:

'Rhaid i'n hadroddiad ddistyllu'r dystiolaeth a gawsom dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Rhaid iddo ymdrin yn deg ag unigolion y mae eu henwau da yn y fantol. Rhaid iddo esbonio'n glir gyfres gymhleth o ddigwyddiadau a nodi'r hyn sydd i'w ddysgu ohonynt. Mae nifer o bobl wedi rhoi o'u hamser a'u hegni yn aruthrol er mwyn rhoi dystiolaeth a chyflwyniadau inni. Os ydym am i'n hadroddiad wneud cyfiawnder â hwy, ni ellir ei gynhyrchu ar frys. Mae'r gwaith o gloriannu dystiolaeth cymhleth a manwl yn drwyndl, sydd yn angenreidiol er mwyn sicrhau casgliadau cadarn a theg, yn dasg anodd.'

Nid oes amheuaeth bod hynny'n wir, gan fod adroddiad yr ymchwiliad yn cynnwys prif

main volume of around 300 pages that contains the key findings, criticisms and recommendations, and 15 supporting volumes—a total of around 4,000 pages. The role of the former Welsh Office is covered in detail in volume 9. It makes clear that there are no scapegoats. Individuals are criticised and those are listed in the annex to volume 1. The list does not include any former Welsh Office Ministers or officials.

The report makes a significant contribution to our collective understanding of BSE, how it emerged and its tragic consequence for those new variant CJD victims, whom we must all remember. It catalogues the actions and inactions of the then UK Government's response to the emerging crisis. It does so with balance and in recognition that hindsight should not be a factor. The history of BSE, the emerging science and CJD linkage unfold through the events outlined in the report.

The inquiry report concentrates on the following issues: how policy measures were developed, delays in taking action at various points in the BSE story and concerns about the way that messages about BSE were conveyed to the public. It also outlines the fact that the Government expected its scientific advisory committees to shoulder too much of the responsibility for policy matters and that enforcement of BSE controls was not as thorough as it should have been. The report is hard-hitting on matters relating to cosmetics, medicines and occupational health risks. It expresses concerns, which come across strongly, about communication failures between departments. The inquiry concludes that there was a collective failure to revisit key scientific assumptions about BSE on a sufficiently regular basis and that policy measures might have had a firmer basis had key people stopped to take another look at assumptions that underpinned new decisions.

The report highlights key lessons to be learnt and it will be important for the Assembly to identify them. The main message is that animal health and disease issues do not

gyfrol o tua 300 o dudalennau sydd yn cynnwys y canfyddiadau, y beirniadaethau a'r argymhellion allweddol, a 15 o gyfrolau ategol—cyfanswm o tua 4,000 o dudalennau. Trafodir rôl yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig yn fanwl yng nghyfrol 9. Gwna yn glir nad oes bychod dihangol. Beirniedir unigolion a rhestrir y rheini yn yr atodlen i gyfrol 1. Nid yw'r rhestr yn cynnwys unrhyw gyn-Weinidogion na chyn-swyddogion y Swyddfa Gymreig.

Gwna'r adroddiad gyfraniad sylweddol tuag at ein cyd-ddealltwriaeth o BSE, sut y dechreuodd a'i ganlyniadau trasig ar gyfer dioddefwyr amrywiolyn newydd CJD, y mae'n rhaid inni eu cofio. Mae'n rhestru gweithredoedd ac anweithredoedd ymateb Llywodraeth y DU ar y pryd i'r argyfwng a godai. Gwna hynny gyda chydbwysedd a chan gydnabod na ddylai ôl-ddoethineb fod yn ffactor. Datblyga hanes BSE, y wyddoniaeth a oedd yn dod i'r amlwg a'r cysylltiad â CJD drwy'r digwyddiadau a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad.

Mae adroddiad yr ymchwiliad yn canolbwytio ar y materion canlynol: sut y datblygwyd mesurau polisi, oedi cyn cymryd camau ar adegau amrywiol yn hanes BSE a phryderon am y modd y trosglwyddwyd negeseuon am BSE i'r cyhoedd. Amlinella hefyd yffaith i'r Llywodraeth ddisgwyl i'w phwylgorau ymgynghorol gwyddonol ysgwyddo gormod o gyfrifoldeb dros faterion polisi ac na orfodwyd rheolaethau BSE mewn modd mor drylwyr ag y dylid fod wedi gwneud hynny. Mae'r adroddiad yn ddidrugaredd ar faterion sydd yn ymwneud â chosmetigau, meddyginaethau a risgau iechyd galwedigaethol. Mynega bryderon, a ddaw drosodd yn gryf, ynglŷn â methiannau cyfathrebu rhwng adrannau. Daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad y bu diffyg torfol i ailystyried rhagdybiaethau gwyddonol allweddol am BSE yn ddigon rheolaidd ac y gallai mesurau polisi fod wedi cael sail gadarnach pe byddai pobl allweddol wedi aros i ailedrych ar y rhagdybiaethau a oedd wrth wraidd penderfyniadau newydd.

Mae'r adroddiad yn amlygu'r gwensi allweddol i'w dysgu a bydd yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad eu nodi. Y brif neges yw nad yw materion iechyd a chlefydau anifeiliaid yn

respect geographical boundaries. The former Welsh Office demonstrated a multi-functional response to the emerging BSE crisis. It is a shame that Whitehall could not follow that lead nor act on the concerns from Wales that were put forward at the time.

The inquiry was a necessary process because the victims of new variant CJD, their families and carers are owed an explanation. The food and farming industries need to understand what happened. The report will help us to learn the lessons of the BSE crisis.

2.35 p.m.

The impact of the BSE crisis in Wales remains deep-seated. Since 1988, over 16,000 cases of BSE in cattle have been identified. Yearly, the number of cases has fallen dramatically: 152 in 1999 and 60 so far this year. In total some 5 million animals have been slaughtered in Wales and over £173 million has been paid in compensation to farmers. The effect of the crisis remains with the agriculture industry. For many in rural Wales its effects have been a personal tragedy.

There is also personal tragedy for the victims of new variant CJD. The epidemic in humans is a serious public health development, which has had tragic consequences for families throughout the UK. According to our latest information, there have been 85 cases in the UK, four of which have been in Wales. Currently, there is no diagnostic test for new variant CJD. Cases are confirmed by a unit in Edinburgh that co-ordinates work on the disease across the UK. Knowledge and techniques are improving and give the hope that earlier diagnosis will allow improvements to be made in the care provided. Sadly, at present there is no treatment and subsequently no cure.

At this stage in the epidemic, we cannot be certain how many victims there will be. The upper limit of estimates that have been made is around 100,000, but it could be far fewer. As scientific knowledge increases, the estimates will be refined. We are conscious

parchu ffiniau daearyddol. Ymatebodd yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig mewn modd amlswyddogaethol i'r argyfwng BSE a oedd yn dod i'r amlwg. Mae'n drueni na allai Whitehall fod wedi dilyn yr arweiniad hwnnw na gweithredu ar y pryderon a gyflwynwyd o Gymru ar y pryd.

Bu'r ymchwiliad yn broses angenheidiol gan fod angen esboniad ar ddioddefwyr amrywiolyn newydd CJD, eu teuluoedd a'u gofalwyr. Mae angen i'r diwydiannau bwyd a ffermio ddeall yr hyn a ddigwyddodd. Bydd yr adroddiad yn ein helpu i ddysgu gwersi'r argyfwng BSE.

Gwreiddir effaith yr argyfwng BSE yng Nghymru yn ddwfn. Ers 1998, nodwyd mwy na 16,000 o achosion o BSE ymysg gwartheg. Syrthiodd nifer yr achosion yn ddramatig bob blwyddyn: 152 yn 1999 a 60 hyd yma eleni. Lladdwyd cyfanswm o tua 5 miliwn o anifeiliaid yng Nghymru a thalwyd mwy na £173 miliwn i ffermwyr fel iawndal. Erys effaith yr argyfwng gyda'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth. Bu ei effaith yn drychneb bersonol i lawer o bobl yng nghefn gwlad Cymru.

Mae'n drychneb bersonol i ddioddefwyr amrywiolyn newydd CJD hefyd. Mae'r epidemig mewn pobl yn ddatblygiad iechyd cyhoeddus dirifol, a gafodd ganlyniadau trasig ar deuluoedd ledled y DU. Yn ôl ein gwybodaeth ddiweddaraf, bu 85 o achosion yn y DU, gyda phedwar ohonynt yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes prawf diagnostig am amrywiolyn newydd CJD. Cadarnheir achosion gan uned yng Nghaeredin sydd yn cydlynú'r gwaith ar y clefyd ledled y DU. Mae gwybodaeth a thechnegau yn gwella ac yn rhoi'r gobaith y bydd diagnosis cynharach yn caniatáu gwelliannau yn y gofal a ddarperir. Yn anffodus, nid oes triniaeth ar gael ar hyn o bryd ac felly ni ellir gwella'r clefyd yn llwyr.

Ar yr adeg hon o'r epidemig, ni allwn fod yn siŵr faint o ddioddefwyr fydd. Tua 100,000 yw'r amcangyfrif uchaf a wnaethpwyd, ond gallai fod lawer llai na hynny. Wrth i wybodaeth wyddonol gynyddu, mireinir yr amcangyfrifon. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod

that care services are needed and that we must be more sensitive to the needs of new variant CJD victims. Last week guidance was issued to GPs, health authorities and local authorities.

The UK Government is to take immediate action to ensure that a dedicated support mechanism is established to address inadequacies that have been identified in the report. That will involve the families themselves, which are being fully consulted in the development of the enhanced care arrangements announced by Nick Brown in his statement to Parliament last Thursday. In addition to extra care support co-ordinated by the CJD Surveillance Unit, there will be new arrangements to provide financial assistance to victims and their families. The Chief Medical Officer is in close touch with her professional counterparts about this work in which we have a key interest.

There is one surviving victim in Wales and the CJD Surveillance Unit that visited that person to assess the adequacy of the local support arrangements that were made. The Chief Medical Officer is also following that assessment through with the local services. On the grounds of patient confidentiality, it would not be right or proper for me to say anything further.

Llywydd, as the First Minister made clear in his statement last Thursday, although the BSE inquiry report was commissioned by the UK Government, it is likely that action to address its findings and conclusions will fall to the National Assembly. The UK Government has announced that it will review the contents of the report in detail and the National Assembly and other devolved administrations will be involved in that process. It is right that the National Assembly should examine the content of the report. That work is underway.

The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee will meet on Thursday to consider, as a starting point, how it can examine the lessons that are presented to us as they affect the agriculture industry. We

angen gwasanaethau gofal a bod yn rhaid inni fod yn fwy sensitif i anghenion dioddefwyr amrywiolyn newydd CJD. Cyhoeddwyd arweiniad i feddygon teulu, awdurdodau iechyd ac awdurdodau lleol yr wythnos diwethaf.

Bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn cymryd camau ar unwaith er mwyn sicrhau y sefydlir mechanwaith cymorth arbennig i ymdrin â'r diffygion a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys y teuluoedd eu hunain, yr ymgynghorir â hwy yn llawn wrth ddatblygu'r trefniadau gofal gwell a gyhoeddwyd gan Nick Brown yn ei ddatganiad i'r Senedd ddydd Iau diwethaf. Yn ogystal â'r cymorth gofal ychwanegol a gydlynir gan yr Uned Goruchwyliau CJD, bydd trefniadau newydd i ddarparu cymorth ariannol i ddioddefwyr a'u teuluoedd. Mae'r Prif Swyddog Meddygol mewn cysylltiad agos â'i chydweithwyr proffesiynol ynglŷn â'r gwaith hwn y mae gennym ddiddordeb mawr ynddo.

Mae un dioddefydd byw yng Nghymru ac ymwebdd yr Uned Goruchwyliau CJD â'r person hwnnw er mwyn asesu digonoldeb y trefniadau cymorth lleol a wnaethpwyd. Dilyna'r Prif Swyddog Meddygol yr asesiad hwnnw drwodd gyda'r gwasanaethau lleol hefyd. Am resymau cyfrinachedd, ni fyddai'n addas neu'n briodol imi ddweud unrhyw beth arall.

Lwydd, fel yr eglurodd y Prif Weinidog yn ei ddatganiad ddydd Iau diwethaf, er y comisiynwyd adroddiad ymchwiliad BSE gan Lywodraeth y DU, mae'n debygol y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyfrifol am weithredu er mwyn ymdrin â'i ganfyddiadau a'i gasgliadau. Cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU yr adolyga gynnwys yr adroddiad yn fanwl a chaiff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gweinyddiaethau eraill a ddatganolwyd eu cynnwys yn y broses honno. Mae'n briodol y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol archwilio cynnwys yr adroddiad. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw wedi dechrau.

Bydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn cyfarfod ddydd Iau er mwyn ystyried, fel man cychwyn, sut y gall archwilio'r gwrsi a gyflwynir inni fel yr effeithiant ar y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth.

have in place effective methods to control BSE as demonstrated by the fact that the epidemic is in decline. The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee should consider these aspects and what more can be done. The Health and Social Services Committee is also considering how it should address the issues in its remit.

In 1999, the UK Food Standards Agency was vested as an independent body charged with guarding public health in food matters. The FSA, which is accountable to the National Assembly for its work in Wales through the FSA Advisory Committee for Wales, recently published its draft review of BSE controls. Subject to confirmation next week, this draft does not propose change to the existing control measures that the FSA considers to be sufficiently robust to allow the public to consume British beef with confidence. The FSA has a key role in protecting health and in giving sound information to the public. The Agency is required to operate openly and this is an important factor in addressing the deficiencies identified by the Phillips report. We accord its work high importance and, accordingly, in the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities's draft budget proposals, which were debated in Plenary last Thursday, there was a major funding increase of £1.2 million per annum for the next three years for the Food Standards Agency in Wales. Provision has also been made to raise the standards of food law enforcement by Welsh local authorities.

Much work must now be undertaken to carefully consider the detail that is set out in the BSE inquiry report. The publication of the report is the beginning of that process. It will be important that the National Assembly has a further chance to debate the report in Plenary, informed by the review process and the Subject Committees' work. With your indulgence, Llywydd, and subject to discussion with the parties' business managers, I suggest that early in the new year would be the appropriate time for it to be discussed in Plenary.

Sefydlasom ddulliau effeithiol i reoli BSE a ddangosir gan y ffaith bod yr epidemig yn lleihau. Dylai'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ystyried yr agweddau hyn a'r hyn y gellir ei wneud eto. Mae'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ystyried sut y dylai ymdrin a'r materion yn ei gylch gwaith hefyd.

Yn 1999, sefydlwyd Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd y DU yn gorff annibynnol yn gyfrifol am warchod iechyd cyhoeddus mewn materion bwyd. Cyhoeddodd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, sydd yn atebol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am ei gwaith yng Nghymru drwy Bwyllgor Ymgynghorol yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd dros Gymru ei hadolygiad drafft o'r rheolaethau BSE yn ddiweddar. Yn ddarostyngedig i gadarnhad yr wythnos nesaf, ni chynigia'r drafft hwn newid i'r mesurau rheoli presennol yr ystyria'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn ddigon cadarn i ganiatáu i'r cyhoedd fwyta cig eidion o Brydain gyda hyder. Mae rôl allweddol gan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd wrth ddiogelu iechyd ac wrth roi gwybodaeth gadarn i'r cyhoedd. Mae angen i'r asiantaeth weithredu mewn ffodd agored ac mae hynny'n ffactor pwysig wrth ymdrin a'r diffygion a nodwyd yn adroddiad Phillips. Mae ei gwaith yn bwysig iawn yn ein barn ac, o ganlyniad, cafwyd cynnydd ariannol mawr o £1.2 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf ar gyfer yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yng Nghymru yng nghynigion cyllideb drafft y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, a ddadleuwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Iau diwethaf. Gwnaethpwyd darpariaeth i godi safonau gorfodi'r gyfraith fwyd gan awdurdodau lleol Cymru hefyd.

Rhaid ymgymryd â llawer o waith bellach er mwyn ystyried yn ofalus y manylion a nodir yn adroddiad yr ymchwiliad BSE. Dechrau'r broses honno yw cyhoeddi'r adroddiad. Bydd yn bwysig y caiff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfle arall i ddadlau'r adroddiad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, wedi'i lywio gan y broses adolygu a gwaith y Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Gyda'ch goddefgarwch, Lywydd, ac yn amodol ar drafodaethau gyda rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau, awgrymaf mai ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd fyddai'r amser priodol i'w drafod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Ron Davies:** I welcome Carwyn's statement. Does he agree that one of the most disturbing aspects revealed by the report is that, over a decade or so, the previous Government ignored all warnings about the potential dangers of BSE and CJD? That is especially disturbing as the warnings came from specialists in the previous Government's administration. Should we not, therefore, offer Dame Deirdre Hine, the former Chief Medical Officer in the Welsh Office, our warmest congratulations on her robust defence of Welsh public health interests, and particularly on her attempts to break the cover-up which undoubtedly existed in the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food? Would it not be appropriate to acknowledge that, had we had a National Assembly then, there would not have been any possibility of those fears being withheld from the public view? We should now look forward. In so doing, I welcome the fact that a Plenary debate will be held on this in the not too distant future. Can Carwyn assure the Assembly that, under the terms of the recently signed concordat between the National Assembly and the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food in Whitehall, there can be no question of MAFF withholding information from the National Assembly or failing to co-operate with it, even when the matters under discussion may prove politically inconvenient for it or damaging to its self-interest?

**Carwyn Jones:** I doubt whether that is how that is phrased in the concordat. However, the concordat is designed to facilitate the freeflow of information between us and Whitehall bodies. In volume 1 of the inquiry report, 'Findings and Conclusions', it is made clear that a great shortcoming identified during the inquiry was the lack of co-ordination and the lack of notice that was taken of the 'territorial departments'. The phraseology used in the report is that there were many occasions when the views of Scotland and Wales were treated with 'disinterest'. That must never happen again. Ron is right that Dame Deirdre Hine made great efforts to present her point of view, which was subsequently shown to be correct. It is right that we put on record our thanks to her for her efforts in 1990-91 in highlighting her concerns about BSE.

**Ron Davies:** Croesawaf ddatganiad Carwyn. A gytuna mai un o'r agweddau mwyaf pryderus a ddatgelwyd gan yr adroddiad yw i'r Llywodraeth flaenorol anwybyddu pob rhybudd am beryglon possibl BSE a CJD, am ddegawd neu fwy? Mae hynny'n achosi pryder arbennig gan fod y rhybuddion wedi eu codi gan arbenigwyr yng ngweinyddiaeth y Llywodraeth flaenorol. Oni ddylem, felly, gynnig i'r Fonesig Deirdre Hine, cyn-Brif Swyddog Meddygol yn y Swyddfa Gymreig, ein llonyfarchiadau cynhesaf am ei hamddiffyniad cadarn o fuddiannau iechyd cyhoeddus Cymru, ac yn arbennig am ei hymdrehchion i dorri'r ymgais i guddio'r ffeithiau a gafwyd heb amheuaeth yn y Weinnyddiaeth Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd? Oni fyddai'n briodol cydnabod, pe fadolai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bryd hynny, na fyddai unrhyw posibilrwydd o guddio'r pryderon hynny rhag y cyhoedd? Dylem edrych ymlaen bellach. Wrth wneud hynny, croesawaf yffaith y cynhelir dadl lawn ar hyn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn y dyfodol agos. A all Carwyn sicrhau'r Cynulliad na all y Weinnyddiaeth Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd guddio gwylbodaeth rhag y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol neu beidio â chydweithio ag ef, hyd yn oed pan all y materion a drafodant fod yn anghyfleus yn wleidyddol neu yn niweidiol i'w hunan-les, o dan dermau'r concordat a lofnodwyd yn ddiweddar rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r Weinnyddiaeth Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn Whitehall?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n amheus gennyf ai dyna'r ffordd y'i geiriwyd yn y concordat. Fodd bynnag, bwriad y concordat yw hwyluso'r llif rhydd o wybodaeth rhyngom ni a chyrff yn Whitehall. Yng nghyfrol 1 o adroddiad yr ymchwiliad, 'Canfyddiadau a Chasgliadau', nodir yn glir mai un o'r diffygion mawr a nodwyd yn ystod yr ymchwiliad oedd y diffyg cydlynau a'r diffyg sylw a gymerwyd o'r 'adrannau tiriogaethol'. Yn ôl yr ieithwedd a ddefnyddiwyd yn yr adroddiad bu llawer o achlysuron pan driniwyd sylwadau Cymru a'r Alban 'yn ddifater'. Rhaid i hynny beidio â digwydd eto. Mae Ron yn gywir yr ymdrechodd y Fonesig Deirdre Hine yn galed i gyflwyno ei barn, y dangoswyd wedyn ei bod yn gywir. Mae'n briodol inni gofnodi ein diolch iddi am ei hymdrehchion yn 1990-91 wrth amlyu ei phryderon ynglŷn â BSE.

The Welsh Office is also complimented for its multi-functional approach, which I translate as meaning that it was easy for people to work across departments as they were all situated in Cathays Park. It was far easier than for Whitehall departments to co-operate. That lesson can be learnt by people outside Wales. Ron is also right to highlight that, had this crisis occurred when the National Assembly was in being, Dame Deirdre Hine's views would have been properly represented and could have been made public. However, it is easy to say that with hindsight. However, if such a situation were to occur in the future, Wales would be in a far stronger position to protect the health of the people of Wales than was the case in 1990.

2.45 p.m.

**Elin Jones:** Croesawaf y datganiad pwysig hwn gan y Gweinidog a'i ymateb i sylwadau Ron Davies. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol a phellgyrhaeddol, a chroesawaf eich ymrwymiad, Weinidog, i ddadl bellach ar fanylion adroddiad Phillips, yn dilyn trafodaethau manylach yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Er bod adroddiad Phillips yn adrodd hanes i bob pwrpas, mae gwensi lu inni eu dysgu o'r adroddiad o ran asesu risg, pwysigrwydd polisi rhagofalus a phwysigrwydd diogelwch y cyhoedd. Mae'r gwensi hynny hefyd yn berthnasol i'n trafodaethau ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno mai'r wers bwysicaf inni ei dysgu o'r argyfwng BSE yw bod iechyd y cyhoedd yn bwysicach nag unrhyw beth? A gytunwch, er mwyn sierhau hynny, fod angen rheoleiddio priodol a synhwyrol a bod hynny o les nid yn unig i'r cwsmer, ond i'r cynhyrchedd bwyd ac i'r diwydiant amaeth cyfan?

A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod agwedd y Torïaid tuag at ddadreoleiddio wedi peryglu iechyd a diogelwch y cyhoedd yn y pen draw? Mae Aelodau Ceidwadol y Cynulliad

Canmolir y Swyddfa Gymreig hefyd am ei hymagwedd amlswyddogaethol, sydd yn golygu, yn fy nhyb i, y bu'n hawdd i bobl weithio ar draws adrannau gan fod pob un wedi'i lleoli ym Mharc Cathays. Bu'n llawer haws iddynt hwy nag i adrannau Whitehall gydwethio. Gall pobl y tu allan i Gymru ddysgu'r wers honno. Mae Ron hefyd yn iawn i bwysleisio y byddai sylwadau Deirdre Hine wedi'u cynrychioli mewn ffodd briodol ac y gellid bod wedi'u cyhoeddi, pe digwyddai'r argyfwng hwn pan fodolai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hawdd dweud hynny ar ôl y digwyddiad. Fodd bynnag, pe digwyddai sefyllfa o'r fath yn y dyfodol, byddai Cymru mewn sefyllfa llawer cryfach i ddiogelu iechyd pobl Cymru nag y bu yn 1990.

**Elin Jones:** I welcome this important statement by the Minister and his response to Ron Davies's comments. This is a serious and far-reaching matter, and I welcome your commitment, Minister, to a further debate on the details of the Phillips report, following more detailed discussions in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and Health and Social Services Committee.

Although the Phillips report is an historical account to all intents and purposes, there are many lessons for us to learn from the report in terms of risk assessment, the importance of precautionary policy and the importance of public safety. Those lessons are also relevant to our discussions on genetically modified crops.

Does the Minister agree that the most important lesson for us to learn from the BSE crisis is that public health is more important than anything else? Do you agree that, to ensure that, we need appropriate and sensible regulation and that that is beneficial not only to the customer, but to the food producer and the agricultural industry as a whole?

Does the Minister agree that the Tories' attitude towards deregulation endangered public health in the end? Conservative Members in the Assembly also praise

hefyd yn clodfori dadreoleiddio. Yr wythnos diwethaf, neidiodd Alun Cairns ar fandwagen dadreoleiddio. Mae hynny'n ein hatgoffa o agwedd gafaliraidd a diofal y Torïaid tuag at godi'r gwaharddiad ar gig eidion ar yr asgwrn yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig y llynedd.

Gan fod ffydd y cyhoedd yn gyffredinol—a'r diwydiant amaeth yn benodol—yn deilchion o ran gallu'r Llywodraethau Torïaid yn San Steffan i ddelio â'r argywng BSE, a yw'r Gweinidog yn credu nad heddiw oedd y diwrnod mwyaf priodol i'r Tori, Glyn Davies, gyhoeddi ei hun yn Gadeirydd Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, heb gytundeb y Cynulliad?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd yn rhaid dadlau yr hyn a wnaeth Glyn yn rhywle arall. Cytunaf mai iechyd y cyhoedd yw'r brif egwyddor y dylai unrhyw lywodraeth ei hystyried mewn sefyllfa fel hon.

Ynglŷn â dadreoleiddio, mae adroddiad Phillips yn nodi y gwnaethpwyd toriadau ariannol yn y Weinyddiaeth Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd, a bod hynny wedi ei gwneud yn llawer anos i'w staff weithio'n effeithiol. Noda hefyd fod llawer o bobl yn y Weinyddiaeth Amaeth yn gorfod gwneud gormod o waith a bod gormod o ddyletswyddau arnynt oherwydd bod cymaint o staff wedi eu colli dros y blynnyddoedd. Felly, y neges y mae'n rhaid inni ei chyfleu heddiw yw, os ydych yn torri i lawr ar bobl ac arian, nid yw'n bosibl cael yr un safon o wasanaeth.

**Peter Rogers:** We welcome the Phillips report and the support that will be given to families who are suffering from this terrible disease. I am sure that a great cloud has been lifted from their lives, now that somebody has accepted that things have gone wrong and that they are finally recognised fairly and supportively. I am sure that they want to know what went wrong. Therefore, we fully support the move to make compensatory payments to the victims' families. The report is constructive in that respect. It focuses on the lessons to be learnt. Mistakes have been made and we must ensure that they are never

deregulation. Alun Cairns jumped on the deregulation bandwagon last week. This reminds us of the Tories' cavalier and careless attitude towards lifting the ban on beef on the bone in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee last year.

As public confidence in general—and the agriculture industry particularly—has been shattered regarding the ability of the Tory Government in Westminster to handle the BSE crisis, does the Minister believe that today was not the most appropriate day for the Tory, Glyn Davies, to declare himself the Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee of the National Assembly, without the Assembly's agreement?

**Carwyn Jones:** What Glyn did will have to be debated somewhere else. I agree that public health is the main principle that any government should consider in a situation such as this.

On deregulation, the Phillips report states that financial cutbacks were made within the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, and that that made it much more difficult for its staff to work effectively. It also notes that many people in MAFF are overworked and that they have too many duties because so many staff have been lost over the years. Therefore, the message that we must convey today is that, if you cut down on people and funding, it is not possible to attain the same standard of service.

**Peter Rogers:** Croesawn adroddiad Phillips a'r cymorth a roddir i'r teuluoedd sydd yn dioddef o'r clefyd ofnadwy hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y codwyd cwmwl mawr o'u bywydau, yn awr bod rhywun wedi derbyn bod pethau wedi mynd o le ac y cânt eu cydnabod mewn ffordd deg a chefnogol o'r diwedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod am wybod beth a aeth o'i le. Felly, cefnogwn yn llawn y penderfyniad i wneud taliadau iawndal i deuluoedd y dioddefwyr. Mae'r adroddiad yn adeiladol yn y modd hwnnw. Canolbwytia ar y gwersi sydd i'w dysgu. Gwnaethpwyd camgymeriadau a rhaid inni sicrhau na chânt

repeated.

I am sure that Carwyn will agree that we need to avoid information blockages within the system. We must ensure that we have the best scientific advice available from across the United Kingdom, and feed that into Westminster. I join Ron in commending Dr Deirdre Hine for trying so valiantly to bring these concerns to Westminster's attention. One of the most important points raised in this report is how we will assess risks. We must assess not only risks, but rational uncertainty. If we are uncertain about the potential risks to animals and human health, that does not mean that we should not act, so that consumers and producers can be protected along this line. From the farm to the dinner table, we must ensure the highest quality produce and we must ensure that it is safe. We must trust the public with this available information. We probably failed in doing that last time. We must trust ourselves to make tough decisions on the evidence that we receive. We welcome your proposal, Carwyn, to debate the Phillips report in the Assembly.

**Carwyn Jones:** It is right and proper that the National Assembly debates the report in full, subject to the Subject Committees considering the matter in detail. My first point is that we must remember that the report deals with something that happened in the past. There is no question now that we have the strongest BSE controls imaginable in place in the UK. That makes our beef the safest to eat in the world. That message must be reinforced. Peter raised two other points. First, information blockages may be a euphemism for not listening to people's views. If it means that it must be easier for the devolved administrations to be able to access and have input into decision-making at a UK level, that should be pursued with full vigour.

The other point that Peter made about the state of scientific knowledge—and Elin also raised it—was valid. One strong theme in the report is that, as new scientific evidence came to light, action was not taken quickly enough

eu hailadrodd.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytuna Carwyn fod angen inni osgoi rhwystrau gwybodaeth o fewn y system. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cyngor gwyddonol gorau gennym ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, a'n bod yn bwydo'r wybodaeth honno i San Steffan. Ymunaf â Ron wrth gymeradwyo Dr Deirdre Hine am ceisio dod â'r pryderon hyn i sylw San Steffan mewn ffordd mor ddewr. Un o'r pwyntiau pwysicaf a godwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn yw sut yr aseswn risgau. Rhaid inni asesu nid yn unig y risgau, ond ansicrywyd rhesymegol. Os nad ydym yn siŵr am y risgau posibl i anifeiliaid a iechyd dynol, ni olyga hynny na ddylem gymryd camau, fel y gellir amddiffyn defnyddwyr a chynhyrchwyr ar hyd y llinell yma. O'r fferm i'r bwrdd cinio, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cynnrych o'r ansawdd uchaf a rhaid inni sicrhau ei fod yn ddiogel. Rhaid inni ymddiried y wybodaeth hon sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Mae'n debyg inni feth â gwneud hynny y tro diwethaf. Rhaid inni ymddiried ynom ein hunain i wneud penderfyniadau caled yn seiliedig ar y dystiolaeth a dderbynwiwn. Croesawaf eich cynnig, Carwyn, i ddadlau adroddiad Phillips yn y Cynulliad.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n briodol bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn dadlau'r adroddiad yn llawn, yn ddarostyngedig i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc yn ystyried y mater yn fanwl. Fy mhwyt cyntaf yw bod rhaid inni gofio bod yr adroddiad yn delio â rhywbeth a ddigwyddodd yn y gorffennol. Nid oes amheuaeth yn awr bod gennym yn y DU y rheoliadau BSE cadarnaf y gellid eu dychmygu. Golyga hynny mai ein cig eidion ni yw'r mwyaf diogel yn y byd. Rhaid atgyfnerthu'r neges honno. Cododd Peter ddau bwynt arall. Yn gyntaf, gall rhwystrau gwybodaeth fod yn fwythair am beidio â gwrando ar farn pobl. Os golyga bod rhaid iddi fod yn haws i weinyddiaethau datganoledig allu cael mynediad a mewnbwn i'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau ar lefel y DU, dylid mynd ar drywydd hynny yn llawn egni.

Bu'r pwynt arall a wnaeth Peter am gyflwr gwybodaeth wyddonol—a godwyd gan Elin hefyd—yn ddilys. Un thema gref yn yr adroddiad yw, wrth i dystiolaeth wyddonol newydd ddod i'r amlwg, na chymerwyd

to stem the epidemic. It happened quickly at the initial stages of the Southwood report when the availability of meat and bone-meal feed to animals was discovered. Apart from that, it is clear that action was not taken quickly enough in a number of different fields. The lesson to be learnt from that is that one must accept a strong precautionary principle if one does not know the state of scientific knowledge. That is why Elin's point about beef on the bone is correct. It is right to have a precautionary principle until one can be certain that there is no significant risk to human health in the light of the scientific knowledge available. The beef on the bone inquiry was, in many ways, the National Assembly's first triumph because it examined all the issues and made a mature and sensible decision. The lesson for us all is that we must be careful to apply the precautionary principle until we know that the scientific knowledge is such that we can remove any bans on products produced in Wales.

**Mick Bates:** I declare an interest as a farmer. I thank the Minister for his statement and his commitment to a debate. I also thank Lord Phillips and his team for this thorough report. It is a true reflection of the deep and tragic impact that this disease has had. I am thankful to see the measured way in which people are responding to the report. In public health terms, the first measure must be to establish mechanisms by which we can offer true protection to the public. I also welcome the announcement of a compensation package to the families and victims as a critical part of us in Government accepting part responsibility for this national tragedy. As a farmer throughout the crisis, it is still the biggest disaster to hit modern agriculture. Many farmers share my concern that there should be sufficient mechanisms for policing the standards in other countries. Twenty per cent of our meat is imported and there is considerable fear that controls abroad do not meet our standards.

2.55 p.m

An important issue on the precautionary principle was expounded by you and others.

camau digon cyflym i atal yr epidemig. Digwyddodd yn gyflym yn ystod camau cynnar adroddiad Southwood pan ddarganfuwyd bod bwyd cig a blawd esgyrn i anifeiliaid ar gael. Ar wahân i hynny, mae'n glir na chymerwyd camau digon cyflym mewn nifer o feysydd gwahanol. Y wers i'w dysgu o hynny yw bod rhaid derbyn egwyddor ragofalus gref os nad ydych yn ymwybodol o gyflwr y wybodaeth wyddonol. Dyna pam bod pwynt Elin am gig ar yr asgwrn yn gywir. Mae'n briodol cael egwyddor ragofalus nes y gellid bod yn siw'r nad oes risg sylweddol i iechyd dynol yng ngoleuni'r wybodaeth wyddonol sydd ar gael. Buddugoliaeth gyntaf y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fu'r ymchwiliad cig eidion ar yr asgwrn, i raddau helaeth, gan iddi archwilio pob un o'r materion a chan iddi wneud penderfyniad aeddfed a synhwyrol. Y wers i bob un ohonom yw bod rhaid inni fod yn ofalus i gymhwysôr egwyddor ragofalus nes y gwyddwn fod yr wybodaeth wyddonol crystal fel y gallwn ddiddymu unrhyw waharddiadau ar gynnyrch a gynhyrchrir yng Nghymru.

**Mike Bates:** Datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwyr. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad a'i ymrwymiad i ddadl. Diolchaf hefyd i'r Arglwydd Phillips a'i dîm am yr adroddiad trylwyr hwn. Adlewyrcha wir effaith ddofn a thrasig y clefyd. Yr wyf yn falch gweld y ffordd bwyllog yr ymetyb pobl i'r adroddiad. Yn nhermau iechyd cyhoeddus, rhaid mai'r mesur cyntaf fydd sefydlu dulliau y gallwn eu defnyddio i ddiogelu'r cyhoedd yn iawn. Croesawaf hefyd y cyhoeddiad y bydd pecyn iawndal ar gyfer y teuluoedd a'r dioddefwyr fel rhan hanfodol ohonom ni yn y Llywodraeth yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb rhannol dros y drychinez genedlaethol hon. Fel ffermwyr drwy gydol yr argyfwng, parha fel y drychinez fwyaf i fwrw amaethyddiaeth fodern. Rhanna llawer o ffermwyr fy mhryder y dylid sefydlu dulliau digonol i blismona'r safonau mewn gwledydd eraill. Mewnforir ugain y cant o'n cig ac mae pryderon mawr nad yw'r rheoliadau dramor yn cwrdd â'n safonau ni.

Traethwyd mater pwysig ynglŷn â'r egwyddor ragofalus gennych chi a chan

As Elin said, there is an obvious analogy with the GM situation that we face. I am sure, now that we have heard your commitment to this, that our strategy group on GM will be established so that we can examine how we can put the precautionary principle into practice and bring forward a UK monitorium on GMs.

I also welcome the remarks about the need for openness and transparency in government. Peter referred to the blockage of information. Previous experience in Wales reflected that unhelpful attitude. I hope that the Food Standards Agency, with its independent nature, will enable us to have independent evidence. I would be pleased to hear from you how the Food Standards Agency will report to the Assembly. One of my deepest concerns and that of others is that we still do not know how the disease started or the means of infection. Can you assure me that there is sufficient funding in the system to ensure that research and development is taking place to bring forward a cure for this terrible disease?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes. The treatment and cure for the disease is similar to those for any neurological complaint: it can often take a long time for the pathology of the illness to be identified and subsequently for a treatment and cure to become clear. In many other neurological disorders and viruses that affect the brain and the nervous system, it often takes time or we are still looking for ways to treat many of those illnesses.

Regarding the Food Standards Agency, the advisory committee for Wales is responsible to the National Assembly. Regular meetings are held between the Welsh executive of the Food Standards Agency, the chairman of the advisory committee in Wales and the Chief Medical Officer. Therefore, there are formal contacts that take place.

The point of the report is not to launch a witch-hunt, but to ensure that lessons that were not taken heed of in the past are learned for the future. Therefore, we know that if such an event should happen again—and let us hope that it does not—the controls are in place to ensure that the effect on the

eraill. Fel y dywedodd Elin, mae cyfatebiaeth amlwg â'r sefyllfa o ran addasu genetig a wynebwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr, nawr ein bod wedi clywed eich ymrwymiad i hyn, y sefydlir ein grŵp strategaeth ar addasu genetig fel y gallwn archwilio sut y gallwn ymarfer yr egwyddor ragofalus a symud monitoriwm y DU ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig ymlaen.

Croesawaf hefyd y sylwadau am yr angen i fod yn agored ac eglur yn y llywodraeth. Cyfeiriodd Peter at rwystro gwybodaeth. Adlewyrchodd brofiad blaenorol yng Nghymru yr agwedd annefnyddiol honno. Gobeithiaf y galluoga'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, gyda'i natur annibynnol, inni gael gafael ar dystiolaeth annibynnol. Byddai'n dda gennyf glywed gennych sut y cyflwyna'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd adroddiadau i'r Cynulliad. Un o'm pryderon mwyaf ac un o bryderon mwyaf pobl eraill yw na wyddwn o hyd sut y dechreuodd y clefyd na'r modd o heintio. A allwch fy sicrhau bod digon o arian yn y system i sicrhau y cynhelir gwaith ymchwil a datblygu er mwyn darganfod ffordd o wella'r clefyd ofnadwy hwn yn gynt?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallaf. Mae'r ffordd o drin a gwella'r clefyd yn debyg i'r ffordd o drin a gwella unrhyw gwyn niwrolegol: yn aml, gall gymryd amser hir i nodi patholeg y clefyd ac wedyn i ffordd o'i drin a'i wella ddod yn glir. Mewn llawer o afiechydon a feirysau niwrolegol eraill sydd yn effeithio ar yr ymennydd a'r system nerfol, cymera amser yn aml neu parhawn i edrych am ffyrdd o drin y clefydon hynny.

Ynglŷn â'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, mae'r pwylgor ymgynghorol dros Gymru yn atebol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cynhelir cyfarfodydd rheolaidd rhwng pwylgor gwaith Cymreig yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, cadeirydd y pwylgor ymgynghorol yng Nghymru a'r Prif Swyddog Meddygol. Felly, cynhelir cysylltiadau ffurfiol.

Nid lansio erledigaeth yw bwriad yr adroddiad, ond sicrhau y dysgir y gwersi ar gyfer y dyfodol a anwybyddwyd yn y gorffennol. Felly, gwyddom pe digwyddai rhywbeth o'r fath eto—a gadewch inni obeithio na wna—mae'r rheolaethau yn eu lle i sicrhau nad yw'r effaith ar y defnyddiwr ac

consumer and on farmers is nothing as hard as it has been.

When I first read this report, it struck me that the first case of BSE was identified as far back as 1986. It is amazing that BSE has now been with us for 14 years, although it does not seem so. It is at least 10 years since the embryonic controls were put in place on the illness. Therefore, we have had to live with this disease for a long time. Mick is right that its effect on farming is still being felt after 14 years. In addition, families who have suffered from new variant CJD will feel those effects forever. You referred to the precautionary principle and the question of GM crops. As I mentioned to the National Assembly a fortnight ago, I will establish a strategy group and look for ways to take that forward on GM crops.

**Rod Richards:** I declare an interest as I was responsible for health in Wales from 1994 to 1996. During that time, Deirdre Hine was the Chief Medical Officer. On more than one occasion, she expressed to me her reservations about the scientific advice that she was receiving. I had great respect for her and listened carefully to what she said. I must say to the Minister for Rural Affairs that anybody who thinks that Deirdre Hine's views could be disregarded has obviously not met her. She is a forceful lady who gets her points across clearly. She, like the Ministers, was dependent on the best scientific advice available. That advice, and clearly the science, was changing.

I see this report as being about how government works, or, in this instance, how it did not work when faced with a new and potentially horrendous problem. It is indeed horrendous for those who have already suffered from nvCJD and for their families. I say to the Minister—and this is not intended as a political point; it is far too serious for that—that I disagree with the former Secretary of State for Wales's comment that the Assembly, had it been in existence, would have made a difference. Even if his party had been in government at that time, I doubt that

ar ffermwyr mor galed ag y bu.

Pan ddarllenais yr adroddiad hwn yn gyntaf, fe'm trawyd gan yffaith y nodwyd yr achos cyntaf o BSE cyn belled yn ôl ag yn 1986. Mae'n anhygoel y bu BSE gennym ers 14 o flynyddoedd bellach, er nad ymddengys felly. Mae o leiaf 10 mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ers sefydlu'r rheolaethau cychwynnol ar y salwch. Felly, bu'n rhaid inni fyw gyda'r clefyd hwn ers amser hir. Mae Mick yn gywir bod y byd ffermio yn dal i deimlo ei effaith ar ôl 14 o flynyddoedd. Yn ogystal, teimla'r teuluoedd a ddioddefodd o amrywiolyn newydd CJD yr effeithiau hynny am byth. Cyfeiriasoch at yr egwyddor ragofalus a'r mater o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Fel y crybwylais i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bythefnos yn ôl, sefydlaf grŵp strategaeth a chwilio am ffyrdd o ddatblygu hynny mewn perthynas â chnydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

**Rod Richards:** Datganaf fuddiant gan y bûm yn gyfrifol am iechyd yng Nghymru o 1994 i 1996. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, Deirdre Hine oedd y Prif Swyddog Meddygol. Ar fwy nag un achlysur, mynegodd ei hamheuon imi am y cyngor gwyddonol a dderbynai. Yr oedd gennyl barch mawr tuag ati a gwrandewais ar yr hyn a ddywedodd yn ofalus. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig ei bod yn amlwg nad yw unrhyw un sydd yn credu y gellid anwybyddu sylwadau Deirdre Hine wedi cwrdd â hi. Mae'n wraig awdurdodol a fynega ei barn yn glir. Fel y Gweinidogion, yr oedd yn dibynnu ar y cyngor gwyddonol gorau a oedd ar gael. Yr oedd y cyngor hwnnw, a'r wyddoniaeth, mae'n amlwg, yn newid.

Credaf fod yr adroddiad yn sôn am sut mae llywodraeth yn gweithio, neu, yn yr achos hwn, sut na weithiodd pan wynebodd broblem newydd a allai fod yn echrydus. Mae'n wir yn echrydus i'r bobl a ddioddefodd eisoes o amrywiolyn newydd CJD ac i'w teuluoedd. Dywedaf wrth y Gweinidog—ac ni fwriadaf i hyn fod yn bwynt gwleidyddol; mae'n llawer rhy ddifrifol i hynny—yr anghytunaf â sylw cyn-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru y byddai'r Cynulliad wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth, pe bodolai. Hyd yn oed pe byddai ei blaidd ef

Ministers would have come to different conclusions or acted significantly differently, because we and they were so dependent on experts in a sector that was constantly changing.

mewn llywodraeth bryd hynny, amheuaf y byddai'r Gweinidogion wedi dod i gasgliadau gwahanol neu wedi gweithredu mewn ffordd arwyddocaol wahanol, gan ein bod ninnau a hwythau yn dibynnau cymaint ar arbenigwyr mewn sector a oedd yn newid yn barhaus.

**Carwyn Jones:** There are two points arising from that. First, in the days before this Assembly and the Scottish parliament existed, Cabinet Ministers were bound by a Cabinet line. I note from the report that Dame Deirdre Hine's opinion was conveyed to Ministers and officials in Whitehall. The response that she received on one occasion was along the lines of 'know your place'. That was the thrust of the letter sent to her. It is also clear from the report that part of the 'irritation'—that is the word used in the letter—was because the Welsh Office and the Scottish Office were not privy to the information that MAFF had. That was rectified later on, when the territorial departments were given access to more information. However, I make the point strongly that, as we have a Chief Medical Officer for Wales, his or her opinion should be our starting point, otherwise there is no point in our having a Chief Medical Officer.

**Carwyn Jones:** Deillia dau bwynt o hynny. Yn gyntaf, yn y dyddiau cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad hwn a senedd yr Alban, yr oedd Gweinidogion y Cabinet o dan rwymedigaeth arweiniad y Cabinet. Sylwaf o'r adroddiad y trosglwyddwyd barn y Fonesig Deirdre Hine i'r Gweinidogion a'r swyddogion yn Whitehall. Yr oedd yr ymateb a dderbyniodd ar un achlysur yn debyg i 'rhaid ichi wybod eich safle'. Dyna hanfod y llythyr a anfonwyd ati. Mae'n glir hefyd o'r adroddiad yr achoswyd rhan o'r 'cythruddiad'—dyna'r gair a ddefnyddiwyd yn y llythyr—gan nad oedd y Swyddfa Gymreig na Swyddfa'r Alban yn gyfarwydd â'r wybodaeth a oedd gan y Weinyddiaeth Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd. Cywirwyd hyn yn nes ymlaen, pan gafodd yr adrannau tiriogaethol fynediad i fwy o wybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf y pwynt yn gryf, gan fod Prif Swyddog Meddygol gennym yng Nghymru, y dylem ddechrau gyda'i farn ef neu ei barn hi, neu fel arall nid oes pwynt inni gael Prif Swyddog Meddygol.

Secondly, we can now make representations at a political level without being bound by Cabinet collective responsibility. That may prove more effective in getting Wales's point of view across. We should bear that in mind. In future we should ensure that, where information is made available by the research teams that operate out of Whitehall—and there is a large research capacity there that we could not hope to replicate in Wales—those findings are made available to all territorial assemblies and the UK Parliament. That is a finding of the report.

Yn ail, gallwn bellach wneud cynrychioliadau ar lefel wleidyddol heb fod o dan rwymedigaeth cydgyfrifoldeb y Cabinet. Gallai hynny fod yn fwy effeithiol wrth fynegi barn Cymru. Dylem gadw hynny mewn cof. Yn y dyfodol, dylem sicrhau, lle gwneir gwybodaeth ar gael gan y timau ymchwil sydd yn gweithredu o Whitehall—ac mae gallu cynnal ymchwil mawr yno na allem obeithio ei atgynhyrchu yng Nghymru—y rhoddir y canfyddiadau tiriogaethol ac i Senedd y DU. Dyna un o ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad.

### **Datganiad ar y Llifogydd yng Nghymru Statement on the Flooding in Wales**

**The Minister for the Environment (Sue Essex):** The flooding that we have experienced over the past two days has been sudden, severe and damaging. Some river

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Mae'r llifogydd yr ydym wedi eu profi dros y ddeuddydd diwethaf wedi bod yn annisgwyl, yn ddifrifol ac yn niweidiol.

levels are recorded as being at their highest for 25 years. Houses, farms and businesses have been flooded in many places around Wales. Many people have suffered damage to their homes and land and the disruption of services, transport and business has been exceptional. Elsewhere in Britain, the weather has impacted even more severely.

Flooding is a particularly unpleasant and sometimes frightening experience. I am sure that we all extend our sympathy to those caught up in these difficulties. I begin by thanking the hundreds of people who have been working flat out in atrocious conditions to protect lives and properties and to restore essential services. We owe a great debt to those who have been working in local authorities, utilities, on the roads and railways and in the emergency services. The position around Wales appears to be improving, with today's dry start helping the situation. There are still, however, a great many problems on roads and railways and around 1,000 people have no electricity supplies, although SWALEC is making concerted efforts to reconnect everyone by tonight. In Gwent, clearing-up operations are taking place on roads and in houses. Landslides blocked a number of roads, including the A465 Heads of the Valleys road. In Cardiff, the threat of further flooding in the Ely Bridge area did not materialise and clearing-up operations are taking place. There are general flood-watch warnings on the Ely, Taff and Rhymney rivers, and contingency plans are in place to avert serious flooding during the next few days. In the Vale of Glamorgan the situation has improved. However, severe flood warnings are still in place in some areas on the rivers Dee, Severn, Vyrnwy and Wye. There is a great deal of mopping-up to be done, and the risk of further flooding has not entirely receded. There is a legacy of damage to repair, and as always in floods, there will be losses and damage that cannot be undone.

3.05 p.m.

We need to consider what we need to learn and what we can do for the future. We have seen at first hand in the last few days the

Cofnodir bod lefelau rhai afonydd gyda'r uchaf ers 25 mlynedd. Dioddefodd tai, ffermdai a busnesau lifogydd mewn sawl lle yng Nghymru. Dioddefodd llawer o bobl ddifrod i'w cartrefi a'u tir ac amharwyd yn sylweddol ar wasanaethau, cludiant a busnesau. Mewn mannau eraill ym Mhrydain, cafodd y tywydd effaith fwy difrifol byth.

Mae llifogydd yn brofiad hynod amhleserus a brawychus ar brydiau. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod oll yn ymestyn ein cydymdeimlad i'r rheini sydd wedi profi'r anawsterau hyn. Dechreuaef drwy ddiolch i'r cannoedd o bobl a fu'n gweithio'n ddi-baid mewn amodau erchyll i ddiogelu bywydau ac eiddo ac i adfer gwasanaethau hanfodol. Mae ein dyled yn fawr i'r rheini a fu'n gweithio mewn awdurdodau lleol, cyfleustodau, ar y ffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd ac yn y gwasanaethau brys. Ymddengys bod y sefyllfa o amgylch Cymru yn gwella, gyda'r tywydd sych ar ddechrau'r dydd heddiw yn helpu'r sefyllfa. Serch hynny, mae nifer fawr o broblemau o hyd ar ffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd ac nid oes gan tua 1,000 o bobl gyflenwad trydan, er bod SWALEC yn gwneud ymdrechion glew i aiglysyltu pawb erbyn heno. Yng Ngwent, mae gweithrediadau clirio ar waith ar ffyrdd ac mewn tai. Cafodd nifer o ffyrdd, gan gynnwys ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, yr A465, eu blocio gan dirlithriadau. Yng Nghaerdydd, ni wireddwyd y bygythiad o ragor o lifogydd yn ardal Pont Trelái ac mae gweithrediadau clirio ar waith. Mae rhybuddion cyffredinol rhag llifogydd ar afonydd Trelái, Taf a Rhymni, a sefydlwyd trefniadau wrth gefn i osgoi llifogydd difrifol dros yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf. Ym Mro Morganwg mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwella. Fodd bynnag, mae rhybuddion rhag llifogydd difrifol yn parhau i fod ar rai rhannau o afonydd Dyfrdwy, Hafren, Fyrnwy a Gwy. Mae llawer iawn o glirio i'w wneud, ac nid yw'r perygl o ragor o lifogydd wedi cilio'n gyfan gwbl. Gadawyd difrod i'w atgyweirio, ac, fel arfer mewn gorlifiadau, bydd colledion a difrod na ellir eu dadwneud.

Mae angen inni ystyried beth sydd angen inni ei ddysgu a beth y gallwn ei wneud i'r dyfodol. Gwelsom yn uniongyrchol dros yr

stark effects of climate change. Whatever mechanisms we are putting in place to combat climate change, through measures agreed in the Kyoto Protocol, it is unfortunately inevitable that we will have severe weather events of this kind more frequently in the future. We must face up to that. Nevertheless, we can build on some good work that has been undertaken recently. The Assembly has already set out its aim to reduce the risk to people from flooding. To achieve this, last July we published an interim set of high level targets aimed at improving flood warnings, encouraging sensible and sustainable flood defence schemes and, perhaps more importantly, encouraging development away from flood risk areas. Later this year, we will issue a more comprehensive set of high level targets that will translate those aims into action. The Environment Agency has done a great deal to raise public awareness of the risk of flooding and of the need for people to access the much-improved flood warning system that now exists. In addition, the Environment Agency will improve its flood forecasting and flood warning and the dissemination of those warnings. This is a long-term programme, averaging around £1 million expenditure a year with the Assembly currently providing 50 per cent of the cost.

On flood defence, a great deal has been achieved over the years, but I am not convinced that we have in place the institutions we need to cope with the greater challenges that we now face. I will institute an in-depth review of these institutions, to ensure that we are as well-equipped as possible to react quickly and to take sensible decisions on the priorities for action, using the best technical expertise available.

This review of decision-making structures will need to be considered in the context of critical information on the pattern of flooding and future predictions. The review will need to look at the existing structure of responsibilities, including those of flood-defence committees, local authorities and the Environment Agency. It will also need to

ychydig ddyddiau diwethaf effeithiau moel newid mewn hinsawdd. Beth bynnag fo'r dulliau a sefydlir gennym i frwydro yn erbyn newid mewn hinsawdd, drwy'r mesurau a gytunwyd ym Mhrotocol Kyoto, yn anffodus mae'n anochel y cawn achosion o dywydd garw fel hyn yn amlach yn y dyfodol. Rhaid inni wynebu hynny. Serch hynny, gallwn adeiladu ar beth gwaith da a wnaethpwyd yn ddiweddar. Mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi pennu ei nod i leihau'r risg i bobl o lifogydd. Er mwyn cyflawni hyn, fis Gorffennaf diwethaf cyhoeddasm set interim o dargedau lefel uchel wedi'u hanelu at wella rhybuddion rhag llifogydd, annog cynlluniau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd synhwyrol a chynaliadwy ac, yn bwysicach efallai, annog datblygiad oddi wrth ardaloedd sydd mewn perygl o lifogydd. Yn ddiweddarach eleni, byddwn yn cyhoeddi set fwy cynhwysfawr o dargedau lefel uchel a fydd yn rhoi'r amcanion hynny ar waith. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi gwneud cryn dipyn i godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o'r risg o lifogydd ac o'r angen i bobl gael mynediad i'r system rhybuddio rhag llifogydd llawer gwell sydd bellach yn bodoli. Yn ogystal, bydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gwella ei rhagolygon llifogydd a'r rhybuddion rhag llifogydd a'r ffordd o ddosbarthu'r rhybuddion hynny. Mae hon yn rhaglen dymor hir, sydd yn gwario tua £1 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd, gyda'r Cynulliad yn darparu 50 y cant o'r gost ar hyn o bryd.

O ran amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd, cyflawnwyd llawer dros y blynnyddoedd, ond nid wyl yn argyhoedddegig bod y sefydliadau gennym i ymdrin â'r heriau mwy sydd bellach yn ein hwynebu. Cychwynnaf adolygiad manwl o'r sefydliadau hyn, i sicrhau ein bod wedi ein paratoi cymaint â phosibl i ymateb yn gyflym ac i gymryd penderfyniadau synhwyrol ar y blaenoriaethau gweithredu, gan ddefnyddio'r arbenigedd technegol gorau sydd ar gael.

Bydd angen ystyried yr adolygiad hwn o strwythurau gwneud penderfyniadau yng nghyd-destun gwybodaeth holl bwysig ar batrwm llifogydd a'r rhagolygon yn y dyfodol. Bydd angen i'r adolygiad edrych ar y strwythur cyfrifoldebau presennol, gan gynnwys rhai pwylgorau amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd, awdurdodau lleol ac

review the decision criteria and formulations that we use to set priorities to ensure that we are taking proper account of the impact of flooding on individuals and communities and not only on property values. It will also need to take stock of the scale of the potential flooding challenge we face so that we have a clear view of our priorities. We also need to ensure that we maintain the defences and drainage that we have. Blockages of culverts and drains can rapidly cause problems. The Environment Agency has been working on the main river systems but we need to work with local authorities and other public and private bodies to identify and respond to local problems.

However, there is a limit to what we can achieve through flood warning and even flood defence. Historically, many of our villages, towns and cities have grown around flood risk areas and many thousands of properties are in known flood risk areas. Even if no new development takes place in these areas, the numbers of properties at risk will increase with time simply because of climate change. We need to ensure that we do not go on compounding this problem and adding to future misery by building in areas that we cannot defend from flooding. Planning guidance for development in flood risk areas in Wales was strengthened and issued in 1998 and we are currently revising the Assembly's general planning policy guidance. We will consult on a draft early in the new year. I am determined that we should set out a clear and vigorous policy which will enable local planning authorities to prevent development that stores up untenable flooding problems for the future.

We face an increasing challenge. We cannot prevent all flooding but we must do all we can to defend ourselves as effectively as possible, and to warn about and respond as quickly as possible to events that we cannot prevent. Having spoken to colleagues over the last few days, I have had some further

Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Bydd angen iddo hefyd adolygu'r mein i prawf penderfyniadau a'r fformwleiddiadau a ddefnyddiwn i bennu blaenoriaethau er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cymryd ystyriaeth briodol o effaith llifogydd ar unigolion a chymunedau ac nid yn unig ar werthoedd eiddo. Bydd angen iddo hefyd ystyried graddfa'r her llifogydd bosibl a wynebwn fel bod gennym olwg glir o'n blaenoriaethau. Mae angen inni hefyd sicrhau ein bod yn cynnal yr amddiffynfeydd a'r draenio sydd gennym. Gall ceuffosydd a draeniau wedi'u blocio achosi problemau'n gyflym. Bu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gweithio ar y prif systemau afonydd ond mae angen inni weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol a chyrff cyhoeddus a phreifat eraill i nodi problemau lleol ac ymateb iddynt.

Fodd bynnag, mae cyfyngiadau ar yr hyn y gallwn ei gyflawni drwy rybuddio rhag llifogydd a hyd yn oed amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd. Yn hanesyddol, mae llawer o'n pentrefi, trefi a'n dinasoedd wedi tyfu o amgylch ardaloedd sydd â risg o lifogydd ac mae miloedd lawer o eiddo mewn ardaloedd lle y gwyddys bod risg o lifogydd. Hyd yn oed os na fydd datblygiad newydd yn yr ardaloedd hyn, bydd nifer yr eiddo sydd yn wynebu risg yn cynyddu gydag amser oherwydd y newid hinsawdd. Mae angen inni sicrhau nad ydym yn parhau i ddwysâu'r broblem hon ac ychwanegu at ddiflastod yn y dyfodol drwy adeiladu mewn ardaloedd na allwn eu hamddiffyn rhag llifogydd. Cryfhawyd a chyhoeddwyd arweiniad cynllunio ar gyfer datblygiadau mewn ardaloedd â risg o lifogydd yng Nghymru yn 1998 ac yr ydym wrthi yn adolygu arweiniad polisi cynllunio cyffredinol y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd. Byddwn yn ymgynghori ar ddrafft yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd. Yr wyf yn benderfynol y dylem nodi polisi clir a hyfyw a fydd yn galluogi awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i atal datblygiadau a fydd yn achosi problemau llifogydd anghynaliadwy yn y dyfodol.

Yr ydym yn wynebu her gynyddol. Ni allwn atal pob llifogydd ond rhaid inni wneud y cyfan a allwn i amddiffyn ein hunain mor effeithiol â phosibl, a rhybuddio am ddigwyddiadau na allwn eu hatal ac ymateb iddynt cyn gynted â phosibl. Wedi siarad â chydweithwyr dros yr ychydig ddyddiau

details of experiences on the ground. As we put together a picture of affected locations, I would appreciate any information that Assembly Members would like to pass on to me.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I thank the Minister for her statement. I join her in expressing our sympathy as an Assembly to those whose homes and businesses have been flooded and whose lives have been disrupted, and in thanking all those involved for their excellent work in dealing with a difficult situation over the last couple of days.

I have several questions arising from the statement. I am glad that Sue Essex agrees that climate change is the underlying cause of this extreme weather condition and to hear that she feels that we need to plan more effectively for dealing with the consequences. I would appreciate hearing a little more about how that planning is to be undertaken. What discussions has she had, or plans to have, with Railtrack, and both the current train operators and those bidding for the new franchises, to ensure that the rail infrastructure in future is robust enough to continue working in storm conditions? What discussions has she had, or plans to have, with the appropriate authorities about the poor condition of much of the Welsh sewerage and drainage system, a problem to which she referred briefly in her statement?

I welcome her comments about including the issue of development in flood plains and coastal plains in the spatial planning review. Will she go so far as to commit herself to a presumption against further development in those areas? To enable us to do our best to reduce climate change in the long term, will she consider creating a more favourable planning environment both in the short and the long term, for renewable energy projects rather than placing obstacles in their way even when they have broad local support?

Does she agree that adequate home and home-contents insurance is way beyond the means of the poorest in many of our communities? Will she undertake to discuss

diwethaf, yr wyf wedi cael rhai manylion pellach o brofiadau ar lawr gwlad. Wrth inni roi'r darlun o leoliadau a effeithir at ei gilydd, byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi unrhyw wybodaeth yr hoffai Aelodau'r Cynulliad ei throsglwyddo imi.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Ymunaf â hi drwy fynegi ein cydymdeimlad fel Cynulliad i'r rheini y mae eu cartrefi a'u busnesau wedi dioddef llifogydd ac yr amharwyd ar eu bywydau, a thrwy ddiolch i bawb fu'n gysylltiedig am eu gwaith rhagorol wrth ddelio â sefyllfa anodd dros yr ychydig ddyddiau diwethaf.

Mae gennyf sawl cwestiwn yn deillio o'r datganiad. Yr wyf yn falch y cytuna Sue Essex mai'r newid hinsawdd yw achos sylfaenol y twydd eithafol hwn ac yn falch o glywed y teimla bod angen inni gynllunio'n fwy effeithiol ar gyfer ymdrin â'r canlyniadau. Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi clywed ychydig mwy am sut y bwriedir mynd i'r afael â'r cynllunio hwnnw. Pa drafodaethau a gafodd, neu y bwriadu eu cael, gyda Railtrack, a'r gweithredwyr trenau presennol a'r rhai sydd yn cynnig am y masnachfreintiau newydd, i sicrhau bod y sealwaith rheilffyrdd yn y dyfodol yn ddigon cadarn i barhau i weithio mewn twydd stormus? Pa drafodaethau a gafodd, neu y bwriadu eu cael, gyda'r awdurdodau priodol ynghylch cyflwr gwael llawer o system carthffosiaeth a draenio Cymru, problem y cyfeiriodd ati'n fyr yn ei datganiad?

Croesawaf ei sylwadau ynghylch cynnwys y mater o ddatblygiad ar orlifdiroedd a gorlifdiroedd arfordirol yn yr adolygiad cynllunio gofodol. A aiff mor bell ag ymrwymo i dybiaeth yn erbyn datblygiad pellach yn yr ardaloedd hynny? Er mwyn ein galluogi i wneud ein gorau i leihau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn y tymor hir, a wnaiff ystyried creu amgylchedd cynllunio mwy ffafriol yn tymor byr a'r tymor hir, ar gyfer prosiectau ynni adnewyddol yn hytrach na gosod rhwystrau yn eu ffordd hyd yn oed pan fydd cefnogaeth gyffredinol iddynt yn lleol?

A gytuna bod yswiriant cartref a chynnwys y cartref digonol ymhell y tu hwnt i fod y bobl dloaf yn nifer o'n cymunedau? A wnaiff addo trafod y mater gyda'r Ysgrifennydd

this issue with the Secretary of State for Social Security at Westminster to ensure that the social security system addresses this problem in future, given that global warming means that we are likely to face, as she has acknowledged, these problems again and again?

I warmly welcome Sue's reference to the review for dealing with flooding, but does she agree that the current systems are woefully inadequate? What extra resources is the Government of Wales planning to make available, both for prevention and for crisis management? What consideration has been given to compensating local authorities in Wales for the additional costs of dealing with yesterday's crisis, along the lines of extra resources which I believe have already been offered to local government in the south of England by the Westminster Cabinet? Does she agree that effective emergency planning in future might be easier if the Assembly had governance over the police and fire services?

**Sue Essex:** That is a long list of questions. Many of your points will be part of this review, which gives us an opportunity to look across the board at the decision-making system, the infrastructures—because we have inherited a drainage system which in places is quite archaic—and planning guidance. I understand why you ask for a presumption against further development in flood plains and coastal plains. That is the natural step to take and I am tempted to agree with that point of view, but we need to discuss planning guidance in committee and broadly consider the implications.

I was due to meet Gerald Corbett of Railtrack but some three meetings have been cancelled. I share the public's great frustration that the system could not cope yesterday, which was compounded by the safety work that was going on. We need to look at the major transport arteries across the UK—including roads coping with the run-off—and see how they cope and what needs to be done to allow them to cope with these kinds of downpours and heavy rainfall. It was the intensity of rainfall over a period that caused the floods. I completely agree with you on climate change. There have been many years of

Gwladol dros Nawdd Cymdeithasol yn San Steffan i sicrhau bod y system nawdd cymdeithasol yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon yn y dyfodol, o gofio fod cynhesu byd eang yn golygu ein bod yn debygol, fel y cydnabu, o wynebu'r problemau hyn dro ar ôl tro?

Croesawaf yn gynnes gyfeiriad Sue at yr adolygiad ar gyfer ymdrin â llifogydd, ond oni chytuna fod y systemau cyfredol yn druenus o annigonol? Pa adnoddau ychwanegol y bwriad a Llywodraeth Cymru sicrhau eu bod ar gael, er mwyn atal a rheoli argyfyngau? Pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd i ddigolledu awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ar gyfer y costau ychwanegol o ddelio gyda'r argyfwng ddoe, o ran adhoddau ychwanegol y credaf sydd eisoes wedi'u cynnig i lywodraeth leol yn ne Lloegr gan Gabinet San Steffan? A gytuna y gallai cynllunio'n effeithiol ar gyfer argyfyngau yn y dyfodol fod yn haws petai'r Cynulliad yn llywodraethu'r heddlu a'r gwasanaethau tân?

**Sue Essex:** Mae honno'n rhestr faith o gwestiynau. Bydd nifer o'ch pwyntiau yn rhan o'r adolygiad hwn, sydd yn rhoi cyfle inni edrych yn gyffredinol ar y system gwneud penderfyniadau, y seilweithiau—gan ein bod wedi etifeddu system ddraenio sydd yn eithaf hynafol mewn rhai mannau—ac arweiniad cynllunio. Deallaf pam eich bod yn gofyn am dybiaeth yn erbyn datblygiadau pellach ar orlifdiroedd a gorlifdiroedd arfordirol. Mae hynny'n gam naturiol i'w gymryd a chaf fy nhemtio i gytuno â'r safbwyt hwnnw, ond mae angen inni drafod arweiniad cynllunio yn y pwylgor ac ystyried y goblygiadau yn gyffredinol.

Yr oeddwn i fod i gwrdd â Gerald Corbett o Railtrack ond cafodd tua thri chyfarfod eu canslo. Rhannaf rwystredigaeth fawr y cyhoedd na allai'r system ymdopi ddoe, a gwaethygwyd y sefyllfa gan y gwaith diogelwch a oedd yn cael ei wneud. Mae angen inni edrych ar y prif wythiennau trafnidiaeth ledled y DU—gan gynnwys ffyrdd yn ymdopi â'r goferiad—a gweld sut y maent yn ymdopi a beth sydd angen ei wneud er mwyn caniatáu iddynt ymdopi gyda'r mathau hyn o genllif a glaw trwm. Dwyster y glaw dros gyfnod o amser a achosodd y llifogydd. Cytunaf yn llwyr gyda chi ar newid

debate on this issue, in which people have agonised and academics have expressed different points of view. Whatever the causes—and there have been some disagreements about that—there is no doubt in anyone's mind now that we have to face the consequences. These are not going to be turned around easily. It is important, therefore, that we speak to our past, and the kinds of debates that we have had in the Assembly have brought those issues to the fore. We must stick to our principles, but we must realise that, over the next few years, we need to do our best to cope with the situation, but we cannot change it. Those forces are bigger than us and bigger than the Assembly.

3.15 p.m

In terms of the extra resources, I am sure that my colleague, the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities will listen sympathetically to any bid—that is based on sound reason—for extra resources. That is where the review is important. It is not only a grab for more resources. It will need to be a substantial collation of facts and predictions so that we can argue for those resources in a rational way. On local authorities, the current situation is that we have not, as far as I know, received any requests for additional resources. Edwina may know differently, but I do not believe that we have received any requests.

**Huw Lewis:** It is interesting to hear the Welsh nationalists' concern about global warming. I hope that that will carry over into concerns surrounding fuel tax and so on when we debate that issue perhaps later this month. We shall see. I thank Sue for making this statement—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This statement is about flooding. I am sure that there will be an opportunity to discuss fuel tax.

**Huw Lewis:** I think that I have just found one.

hinsawdd. Bu dadlau ers blynnyddoedd ar y mater hwn, lle mae pobl wedi crafu pen ac ysgolheigion wedi mynegi gwahanol safbwytiau. Beth bynnag fo'r achosion—a bu peth anghytundeb ynghylch hynny—nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth ym meddwl unrhyw un bellach bod yn rhaid inni wynebu'r canlyniadau. Ni fydd yn hawdd datrys y rhain. Mae'n bwysig, felly, ein bod yn cyfeirio at ein gorffennol, ac mae'r mathau o ddadleuon a gawsom yn y Cynulliad wedi dod â'r materion hynny i'r amlwg. Rhaid inni lynnau at ein hegwyddorion, ond rhaid inni sylweddoli bod angen inni wneud ein gorau i ymdopi â'r sefyllfa dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, ond na allwn ei newid. Mae'r grymodd hynny yn fwy na ni ac yn fwy na'r Cynulliad.

O ran yr adnoddau ychwanegol, yr wyf yn sier y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn gwrando'n gydymdeimladol ar unrhyw gynnig—sydd yn seiliedig ar resymeg gadarn—ar gyfer adnoddau ychwanegol. Dyna lle mae'r adolygiad yn bwysig. Nid dim ond ymgais ydyw i gael mwy o adnoddau. Bydd angen iddo fod yn gasgliad sylweddol o ffeithiau a rhagolygon fel y gallwn ddadlau dros yr adnoddau hynny mewn ffordd resymegol. Ar awdurdodau lleol, y sefyllfa gyfredol yw nad ydym, hyd y gwn i, wedi derbyn unrhyw geisiadau am adnoddau ychwanegol. Efallai y gw^yr Edwina yn wahanol, ond ni chredaf inni dderbyn unrhyw geisiadau.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n ddiddorol clywed pryder y cenedlaetholwyr Cymreig ynghylch cynhesu byd eang. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn y pryderon ynghylch y dreth ar danwydd ac ati pan fyddwn yn dadlau'r mater hwnnw yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn o bosibl. Cawn weld. Diolchaf i Sue am wneud y datganiad hwn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r datganiad hwn yn ymwneud â llifogydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y daw cyfle i drafod treth ar danwydd.

**Huw Lewis:** Credaf fy mod newydd ddarganfod un.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You may have done so, but you should not have.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank Sue for her responsive and sensitive statement, especially considering the concerns and anguish I saw in my constituency yesterday as a result of the flooding and storm damage that people faced, which caused them considerable amounts of distress and even put them in danger.

Scientific research shows that we will have a 100-year flood incidence if we speed up reviews to once every 10 years. Given that, we must accept that our ways of working must change. Do you agree that we must speed up our response of reviewing how we maintain and progress flood defences? We must react quicker. At the moment, the structure is too slow and underfunded. It is archaic in its working practices. Flood defence committees are working with the Environment Agency with multiple layers of responsibility, which are unclear. It is high time for that review. I ask for that review to include looking at the crucial point of funding. There are clear identifiabilities. I knew the half a dozen spots to visit in my constituency yesterday without having to ask. We have hotspots where victims always suffer. They are not all the result of acts of God. That is not so, and we should get away from that idea. The victims are the flood victims. The Environment Agency and the Government of Wales should not see themselves as victims of acts of God. Many people face incidents of flooding as a result of poor maintenance, poor planning and lack of funding.

Finally, will you consider in future, in terms of the funding of improved flood defences, that we approach an obvious private partner—the insurance companies, who are losing customers because they cannot insure them because of the repeated risk of flooding faced by certain property owners and businesses?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Efallai eich bod, ond ni ddylech fod wedi gwneud hynny.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolchaf i Sue am ei datganiad ymatebol a sensitif, yn arbennig o ystyried y pryderon a'r gofid a welais yn fy etholaeth ddoe o ganlyniad i'r llifogydd a'r difrod gan stormydd a wynebodd pobl, a achosodd lawer iawn o drallod iddynt a hyd yn oed eu rhoi mewn perygl.

Dengys ymchwil wyddonol y bydd gennym lifogydd bob 100 mlynedd os byddwn yn cyflymu adolygiadau i unwaith bob 10 mlynedd. O gofio hynny, rhaid inni dderbyn bod yn rhaid i'n ffyrdd o weithio newid. A gytunwch bod yn rhaid inni gyflymu ein hymateb i adolygu sut yr ydym yn cynnal ac yn datblygu amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd? Rhaid inni ymateb yn gyflymach. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r strwythur yn rhy araf a heb ei ariannu'n ddigonol. Mae'n hynafol o ran ei arferion gwaith. Gweithia pwylgorau amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd gyda haenau lloosog o gyfrifoldeb, sydd yn anelwig. Mae'n hen bryd cael yr adolygiad hwnnw. Gofynnaf i'r adolygiad hwnnw gynnwys edrych ar y pwyt holl bwysig o ariannu. Mae nodweddion amlwg. Gwyddwn am yr hanner dwsin o ardaloedd i ymweld â hwy yn fy etholaeth ddoe heb orfod gofyn. Mae gennym fannau drwg lle mae dioddefwyr bob amser yn dioddef. Nid canlyniadau gweithredoedd Duw yw pob un ohonynt. Nid felly y mae, a dylem symud oddi wrth y syniad hwnnw. Y dioddefwyr yw dioddefwyr y llifogydd. Ni ddylai Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd na Llywodraeth Cymru ystyried eu hunain fel dioddefwyr gweithredoedd Duw. Mae llawer o bobl yn dioddef llifogydd o ganlyniad i waith cynnal a chadw gwael, cynllunio gwael a diffyg arian.

Yn olaf, a ystyriwch yn y dyfodol, o ran ariannu amddiffynfeydd gwell rhag llifogydd, ein bod yn cysylltu â phartner preifat amlwg—y cwmniau yswiriant, sydd yn colli cwsmeriaid gan na allant eu hyswirio oherwydd y risg barhaus o lifogydd a wynebir gan rai perchenogion eiddo a busnesau?

**Sue Essex:** I agree entirely about the structures for decision-making. I instituted this review last week before the flooding. Once you start to get close to the system, you realise that it is perhaps completely inapplicable to the changes that Wales will face in the future. As you rightly said, if there is work to be done, it requires the funding mechanisms. The current funding mechanisms are sometimes difficult and the process of trying to put packages and agreements together to respond to urgently needed works on the ground is often slow. It must be part of a comprehensive review across the board. Issues of maintenance—as you rightly said—must also be looked at. In some cases, many of the incidents that I heard of were where there was a particular problem on the ground with blockage and so on. A more regular maintenance system might have averted that. In addition to putting in place major infrastructure works we must also put in place mechanisms to ensure that they are maintained.

Helen Mary raised the point that insurance companies should be part of the review. It is important. I am aware of the problems. Having represented the Riverside ward during the floods—actually, it was before I represented Riverside, but I was involved in the ward—I remember the terrible aftermath and the consequences for many people of not being insured.

**David Davies:** I express gratitude to the emergency services. Like many others, I have spent some time touring affected areas in my constituency. The flooding has come to within a few hundred yards of my home. You will be pleased to note that it did not block any of the access roads to the Assembly so I was able to get here today.

The issue of flooding and climatic change should not come as a surprise to anyone. We have known for years that there is a problem with increasingly extreme weather. Although I welcome many of the sentiments in this statement, I query how much substance there is in what you say. We hear that you were

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf yn llwyr ynglŷn â'r strwythurau ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau. Cychwynnais yr adolygiad hwn yr wythnos diwethaf cyn y llifogydd. Unwaith y dechreuwch agosâu at y system, fe sylwedolwch ei bod o bosibl yn holol amherthnasol i'r newidiadau y bydd Cymru yn eu hwynebu yn y dyfodol. Fel y dywedasoch, a hynny'n gywir, os bydd gwaith i'w wneud, mae'n gofyn am ddulliau ariannu. Mae'r dulliau ariannu cyfredol weithiau'n anodd ac mae'r broses o geisio rhoi pecynnau a chytundebau at ei gilydd i ymateb i waith sydd angen ei wneud ar fyrder ar lawr gwlad yn aml yn araf. Rhaid iddo fod yn rhan o adolygiad cynhwysfawr yn gyffredinol. Rhaid edrych hefyd ar faterion cynnal a chadw—fel y dywedasoch, a hynny'n briodol. Mewn rhai achosion, yr oedd llawer o'r digwyddiadau y clywais amdanynt yn ymwneud â phroblem benodol ar lawr gwlad gyda blocio ac ati. Efallai y byddai system gynnal a chadw fwy rheolaidd wedi osgoi hynny. Yn ogystal â rhoi gweithiau seilwaith mawr yn eu lle rhaid inni hefyd sefydlu dulliau i sicrhau y caint eu cynnal a'u cadw.

Cododd Helen Mary y pwyt y dylai cwmnïau yswiriant fod yn rhan o'r adolygiad. Mae'n bwysig. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau. Wedi cynrychioli ward Llan yr Afon yn ystod y llifogydd—a dweud y gwir, yr oedd cyn imi gynrychioli Riverside, ond yr oeddwn yn ymwneud â'r ward—cofiaf yr effeithiau ofnadwy a chanlyniadau peidio â chael yswiriant i nifer o bobl.

**David Davies:** Mynegaf ddiolchgarwch i'r gwasanaethau brys. Fel llawer o bobl eraill, treulais beth amser yn teithio ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt yn fy etholaeth. Daeth y llifogydd o fewn ychydig gannoedd o lathenni i'm cartref. Byddwch yn falch o nodi na wnaeth flocio unrhyw un o'r ffyrdd mynediad i'r Cynulliad felly llwyddais i gyrraedd yma heddiw.

Ni ddylai'r mater o lifogydd a newid hinsawdd fod yn syndod i neb. Gwyddom ers blynnyddoedd fod problem gyda thywydd garw ar gynnydd. Er y croesawaf nifer o'r teimladau a fynegwyd yn y datganiad hwn, cwestiynaf faint o sylwedd sydd yn yr hyn a ddywedwch. Clynn eich bod yn gobeithio

hoping to change planning guidance so that homes are not built in flood plain areas. However, Minister, that is not happening. I represent an area where homes are built in flood plain areas. As well as putting those homes at risk, it decreases the run-off that is available to remove water when the water level is too high. I am not sure that this is happening in practice.

You have spoken of the need to introduce policies to combat global warming but in the budget there was a cut in the freight facilities grant for example, something that would have encouraged freight to be transported by rail rather than by road. Where is the substance behind your calls, the policies that will combat global warming? Previous speakers have highlighted the lack of spending on flood defence. The budget appeared to show a cut in such spending from £7.5 million in 1999-2000 to £7.271 million for next year, which will be kept at the same level with, I assume, a little built in for inflation, for the next two years. This issue was not highlighted because of the headline-grabbing initiatives about health and education, but it is important. That is why the review must not only take into account the measures that exist when flooding happens, but the flood defences themselves. The review must specifically look at the state of flood defences in different parts of Wales, some of which are 40 or 50 years old, to ensure that they are safe. If we do not have proper investment we will return here repeatedly to make these sorts of statements. The time has come to take stern action.

**Sue Essex:** We come to Plenary each week and wonder whether there really was a Tory Government for 18 years, as it appears to have evaporated. That Government could have introduced all of these things during that time. Global warming started many years ago. If you sat and listened, we have had debates on climate change, carbon emissions into the atmosphere and we are a signatory to the Kyoto Protocol, which sets targets for the reduction of emissions. That agreement is in place and we are working towards meeting

newid yr arweiniad cynllunio fel na chaiff cartrefi eu hadeiladu mewn ardaloedd gorlifdiroedd. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, nid yw hynny'n digwydd. Cynrychiolaf ardal lle yr adeiladir cartrefi ar ardaloedd gorlifdiroedd. Yn ogystal â rhoi'r cartrefi hynny mewn perygl, mae'n lleihau'r goferiad sydd ar gael i gael gwared ar ddŵr pan fo lefel y dŵr yn rhy uchel. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny yn digwydd yn ymarferol.

Yr ydych wedi sôn am yr angen i gyflwyno polisiau i frwydro yn erbyn cynhesu byd eang ond yn y gyllideb yr oedd toriad yn y grant cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau er enghraift, rhywbeth a fyddai wedi annog nwyddau i gael eu cludo ar y rheilffyrdd yn hytrach nag ar y fflyrdd. Ble mae'r sylwedd y tu ôl i'ch ceisiadau, y polisiau a fydd yn brwydro yn erbyn cynhesu byd-eang? Amlwgodd y siaradwyr blaenorol y prinder gwario ar amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd. Ymddengys bod y gyllideb yn dangos toriad mewn gwariant o £7.5 miliwn yn 1999-2000 i £7.271 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf, a gaiff ei gadw ar yr un lefel, fe dybiaf, gydag ychydig wedi'i gynnwys ar gyfer chwyddiant, am y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Nid amlwgwyd hyn oherwydd y mentrau trawiadol ynghylch iechyd ac addysg, ond mae'n bwysig. Dyna pam y mae'n rhaid i'r arolwg ystyried nid yn unig y mesurau sydd yn bodoli pan fydd llifogydd yn digwydd, ond yr amddiffynfeydd llifogydd eu hunain. Rhaid i'r arolwg edrych yn benodol ar gyflwr amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, rhai ohonynt yn 40 i 50 mlwydd oed, i sicrhau eu bod yn ddiogel. Os na chawn fuddsoddiad priodol byddwn yn dychwelyd yma droeon i wneud y mathau hyn o ddatganiadau. Daeth yr amser i gymryd camau cadarn.

**Sue Essex:** Deuwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn bob wythnos yn meddwl tybed a oedd Llywodraeth Doriaidd am 18 mlynedd mewn gwirionedd, gan yr ymddengys iddi ddiflannu. Gallasai'r Llywodraeth honno fod wedi cyflwyno pob un o'r pethau hyn yn ystod yr amser hwnnw. Dechreuodd cynhesu byd-eang sawl blwyddyn yn ôl. Pe baech wedi eistedd a gwrando, cawsom ddadleuon ar newid hinsawdd, allyriannau carbon i'r atmosffer ac yr ydym yn un o lofnodwyr Protocol Kyoto, sydd yn pennu targedau ar

those targets. The British Government has taken a lead on this and we are signed up to move forward. That is a credit to us. We have taken that line and now we must put the policies and the resources behind it to ensure that we achieve it. We have discussed this on previous occasions. It is not just about what we do as a Government but also about what people do and what our partners do. We are trying to secure that.

In terms of spending on environmental flood defence systems, one of the problems that we have had—as I said to Huw and as he appreciated—is putting together funding mechanisms to ensure that those packages are spent on the ground. If we have a review of how those decisions are made and how that funding comes together, I am hopeful that we can increase spending and invest that money where it is most needed. I have spoken to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and the Communities and have had a sympathetic ear. We are talking about not having a standstill budget because we have not been spending money as we need to, but an agreed programme. The review needs to take a comprehensive view of the way forward. Once that is in place and we have agreement, then we can progress.

3.25 p.m.

In terms of planning guidance, you would be the first to jump up and scream, David, if I said that I was taking unilateral decisions on planning guidance. That is not how we conduct business. We go out to consultation. In the light of what we have learnt in the last few days and from predictions of global climate change, precautionary policies on building on flood plains will be important. The Committee is part of that decision-making programme and you are a member of that Committee, so you will have a chance to express your views.

**Peter Black:** As a result of this adverse weather, many roads were closed and traffic was disrupted. As you may know, the new

gyfer lleihau allyriadau. Mae'r cytundeb hwnnw mewn grym ac yr ydym yn gweithio tuag at gwrdd â'r targedau hynny. Mae Llywodraeth Prydain wedi cymryd yr arweiniad ar hyn ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i symud ymlaen. Mae hynny'n glod inni. Yr ydym wedi cymryd y safbwyt hwnnw ac yn awr rhaid inni roi'r polisiau a'r adnoddau y tu ôl iddo er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn ei gyflawni. Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn o'r blaen. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud yn unig â'r hyn a wnaeon fel Llywodraeth ond hefyd â'r hyn a wnaeon pobl a'r hyn a wna ein partneriaid. Ceisiwn sicrhau hynny.

O ran gwario ar systemau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd amgylcheddol, un o'r problemau a gawsom—fel y dywedais wrth Huw ac fel y gwerthfawrogodd ef—yw rhoi dulliau ariannu ynghyd i sichrau y caiff y pecynnau hynny eu gwario ar lawr gwlad. Os adolygwn sut y gwneir y penderfyniadau hynny a sut y daw'r arian hwnnw ynghyd, gobeithiaf y gallwn gynyddu gwariant a buddsoddi'r arian hwnnw lle mae ei angen fwyaf. Yr wyf wedi siarad â'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ac wedi cael cydymdeimlad. Yr ydym yn sôn am beidio â chael cyllideb sydd yn sefyll yn ei hunfan gan nad ydym wedi bod yn gwario arian fel y bo angen, ond rhaglen y cytunwyd arni. Mae angen i'r adolygiad gymryd golwg gynhwysfawr o'r ffordd ymlaen. Unwaith y bydd hynny yn ei le a bod pawb yn gytûn, gallwn fynd ati.

O ran arweiniad cynllunio, chi fyddai'r cyntaf i neidio ar eich traed a sgrechian, David, pe dywedwn fy mod yn gwneud penderfyniadau unochrog ar arweiniad cynllunio. Nid dyna'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithredu. Yr ydym yn ymgynghori. Yng ngoleuni'r hyn a ddysgasom dros yr ychydig ddyddiau diwethaf ac o ragolygon newid hinsawdd byd-eang, bydd polisiau rhagofalus ar orlifdiroedd yn bwysig. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn rhan o'r rhaglen gwneud penderfyniadau honno ac yr ydych chi yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw, felly cewch gyfle i fynegi eich barn.

**Peter Black:** O ganlyniad i'r tywydd garw hwn, yr oedd nifer o ffyrdd ar gau ac amharwyd ar y traffig. Fel y gwyddoch, o

Briton Ferry bridge on the M4 was closed. That has happened several times since this Assembly was established and before then. Several people have expressed to me their concern that this bridge closes in adverse weather and the impact that has on the perception of west Wales economically, with people who are trying to get there being forced to queue on the old Briton Ferry bridge. In the light of the recent closure, would you reconsider the need for further research into placing wind baffles on the M4 at that bridge? Would you consider perhaps introducing a scheme in the near future to try to prevent further closures of this vital artery to west Wales?

**Sue Essex:** I understand your concern. I will look at the figures, see how many days of the year the bridge is out of action and come back to you on that, Peter.

**Janet Ryder:** Sue, you said that these floods were sudden and severe and that floods seem to be happening more frequently. As has already been said, floods seem to happen time and again to the same areas. Unfortunately, Ruthin is one of those areas. Over the past few years, the same area of town has experienced severe flooding. It is a problem common to other areas, I am sure. Every time we are told that there was too much water for the culvert to cope with. You have said that your review will consider that problem. However, will you also look at local authorities that have suffered flooding this time, and have previously suffered flooding in the same area, to see whether problems have been identified and work has not been carried out? Perhaps we need to invest in making those culverts big enough to cope with the amount of water that seems to be coming down. I ask you to either include that in your review or to go to each authority that has suffered from flooding this time around, such as Denbighshire, and find out what the causes are, whether floods have occurred previously, how the authorities are going to act on this and how you can help them.

**Sue Essex:** There is a problem of a repeat pattern of flooding occurring in several areas. I would like to build up a comprehensive

bosibl, yr oedd pont newydd Llansawel ar yr M4 ar gau. Digwyddodd hynny sawl gwaith ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad hwn a chyn hynny. Mae sawl person wedi mynegi eu pryder wrthyf bod y bont hon ar gau mewn tywydd garw a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar y canfyddiad o orllewin Cymru yn economaidd, gyda phobl sydd yn ceisio cyrraedd yno yn cael eu gorfodi i giwio ar hen bont Llansawel. Yng ngoleuni'r achos diweddar o gau'r bont, a fydddech yn ystyried yr angen am ymchwil bellach i osod bafflau gwyt ar yr M4 ger y bont honno? A ailystyriwch o bosibl cyflwyno cynllun yn y dyfodol agos i geisio atal achosion pellach o gau'r brif wythien holl bwysig hon i orllewin Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** Deallaf eich pryder. Edrychaf ar y ffigurau i weld ar sawl diwrnod yn ystod y flwyddyn nad yw'r bont yn gweithredu a dof yn ôl atoch ar hynny, Peter.

**Janet Ryder:** Sue, dywedasoch fod y llifogydd hyn yn annisgwyl ac yn ddifrifol ac yr ymddengys bod llifogydd yn digwydd yn fwy aml. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, ymddengys bod llifogydd yn digwydd dro ar ôl tro yn yr un ardaloedd. Yn anffodus, mae Rhuthun yn un o'r ardaloedd hynny. Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r un ardal o'r dref wedi dioddef llifogydd difrifol. Mae'n broblem gyffredin i ardaloedd eraill, yr wyf yn siŵr. Bob tro dywedir wrthym bod gormod o ddŵr i'r geuffos ymdopi ag ef. Dywedasoch y bydd eich adolygiad yn ystyried y broblem honno. Fodd bynnag, a edrychwch hefyd ar awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi dioddef llifogydd y tro hwn, ac wedi dioddef llifogydd yn flaenorol yn yr un ardal, i weld a nodwyd problemau ac na chyflawnwyd gwaith? Efallai y dylem fuddsoddi i sicrhau bod y ceuffosydd hynny yn ddigon mawr i ymdopi gyda'r swm o ddŵr a ddaw i lawr yn ôl pob golwg. Gofynnaf ichi naill ai gynnwys hynny yn eich adolygiad neu fynd at bob awdurdod sydd wedi dioddef llifogydd y tro hwn, fel Sir Ddinbych, i ddarganfod beth yw'r achosion, a yw llifogydd wedi digwydd cyn hyn, sut y bydd yr awdurdodau'n gweithredu ar hyn a sut y gallwch eu helpu.

**Sue Essex:** Mae problem o batrwm ailadroddus o lifogydd yn digwydd mewn sawl ardal. Hoffwn greu darlun cynhwysfawr

picture of where those areas are and what the identified remedies are. Sometimes the remedy is not clear. We can then see how we can achieve those remedies and develop a work programme. It is not all down to the Environment Agency to fund this. We may consider other partners. Often, problems have been inherited from previous planning decisions, where perhaps the knock-on effect of a development was not clearly understood. There is much that we have to come to grips with. It is not just a matter of where building takes place, but what its knock-on effect will be. I hope that in this review we will get a comprehensive picture of Wales, particularly of those problematic spots. If Members here could give me any information that they have, I am sure that, when that is added to the information on the Environment Agency's database, we would learn of a series of locations that are suffering unduly.

**Karen Sinclair:** I agree with much of what the previous speaker said. We have dreadful problems with old drainage systems in our towns and villages, and much of the flooding that happened yesterday was due to these systems failing. However, it is important to note that not everything failed yesterday and, thankfully, the flood defences in Bangor-on-Dee held. There was localised flooding due to the drainage problems, but the Dee did not breach its banks. I spent six hours last night at the emergency centre and I place on record my thanks and my absolute admiration of the emergency staff who worked tirelessly day and night and were magnificent. It is important that we place on record how much we appreciate their work.

**Sue Essex:** Thank you for those two sensible points: the distinction between flood protection and drainage, and how vital the emergency services are.

**William Graham:** I ask that in these discussions you also include the British Waterways Board. You will be aware that canals, particularly in south-east Wales, are approximately 250 years old. This caused particular concern over the last few days. I also ask that you engage a protocol in respect of the electricity supply. It is all very well turning it off in the event of a flood, but when

o ble mae'r ardaloedd hynny a beth yw'r atebion a nodir. Weithiau nid yw'r ateb yn glir. Yna gallwn weld sut y gallwn gyflawni'r atebion hynny a datblygu rhaglen waith. Nid gwaith Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw ariannu hyn i gyd. Efallai yr ystyriwn bartneriaid eraill. Yn aml, etifeddwyd problemau o benderfyniadau cynllunio blaenorol, lle na ddeallwyd sgîl-effaith datblygiad yn llwyr, o bosibl. Mae llawer y dylem fynd i'r afael ag ef. Nid dim ond mater o lle mae gwaith adeiladu'n digwydd ydyw, ond beth fydd ei sgîl-effaith. Gobeithiaf y cawn ddarlun cynhwysfawr o Gymru yn yr adolygiad hwn, yn arbennig o'r ardaloedd problematig hynny. Pe gallai'r Aelodau yma roi unrhyw wybodaeth sydd ganddynt imi, yr wyf yn sicr, o ychwanegu hynny at y wybodaeth ar gronfa ddata Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, y byddem yn clywed am gyfres o leoliadau sydd yn dioddef yn ddiangen.

**Karen Sinclair:** Cytunaf gyda llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd y siaradwr blaenorol. Mae gennym broblemau ofnadwy gyda hen systemau draenio yn ein trefi a'n pentrefi, ac yr oedd llawer o'r llifogydd a ddigwyddodd ddoe yn deillio o fethiant y systemau hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig nodi na fethodd popeth ddoe a, diolch byth, goroesodd yr amddiffynfeydd ym Mangor Is-coed. Yr oedd gorlifo lleol oherwydd y problemau draenio, ond ni orlfodd afon Dyfrdwy ei glannau. Treuliais chwe awr neithiwr yn y ganolfan argyfwng a chofnodaf fy niolch a'm edmygedd llwyr o'r staff argyfwng a weithiodd yn ddiflino ddydd a nos ac a oedd yn wych. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cofnodi gymaint yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi eu gwaith.

**Sue Essex:** Diolch ichi am y ddau bwynt synhwyrol hynny: y gwahaniaeth rhwng diogelwch rhag llifogydd a draenio, a phamor hanfodol yw'r gwasanaethau brys.

**William Graham:** Gofynnaf yn y trafodaethau hyn ichi gynnwys hefyd Fwrdd Dyfrffydd Prydain. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod camlesi, yn arbennig yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, tua 250 mlwydd oed. Achosodd hyn bryder arbennig dros yr ychydig ddyddiau diwethaf. Gofynnaf hefyd ichi weithredu protocol ynglŷn â'r cyflenwad trydan. Mae'n ddigon hawdd ei ddiffodd pan fydd llifogydd,

it comes to putting it back on, not all consumer units are properly labelled with the name of the supplier. This is causing major difficulties for people who are already badly affected by flooding.

**Sue Essex:** Thank you for two sensible points. The British Waterways Board is not a devolved organisation, but I take your point, and I will follow up that safety aspect.

**Peter Law:** I thank the Minister for her report this afternoon and I concur with her comments about the emergency services. All Members have said how much we appreciate what they have done throughout Wales at a difficult time. As regards the Heads of the Valleys road, which is an arterial road, can she assure me that all steps will be taken to reopen this as soon as possible, bearing in mind that road's vital importance to the economy of the Heads of the Valleys, Blaenau Gwent and Merthyr Tydfil?

**Sue Essex:** The landslip was particularly severe, with all three lanes closed. Work is in progress, and we will keep you informed.

**Alun Pugh:** Two stories have dominated the news today: the consequences of global warming, which mean more flooding and also destructively high winds, and petrol prices. Nobody is making the connection in the news at the moment between increased carbon dioxide emissions and environmental change. The environment has no vote, so will you press the environment's case? The people manning the petrol barricades will be up to their necks in floodwater before they get the message.

**Sue Essex:** If that connection has not been made, then you have made it nicely now. The environment does have votes, because the environment is about life and people are beginning to understand that. This is not something that I want to resolve by making an election issue out of it. It is very important. We are looking at fundamental changes. The chickens are coming home to roost here. We in Wales are on the front line of some of the stormiest squalls. I think that

ond pan ddaw i'w adfer, ni chaiff pob uned defnyddiwr ei labelu'n gywir gydag enw'r cyflenwr. Mae hyn yn achosi anawsterau mawr i bobl yr effeithir arnynt yn ddrwg eisoes gan lifogydd.

**Sue Essex:** Diolch ichi am ddau bwynt synhwyrol. Nid yw Bwrdd Dyfrffyrdd Prydain yn sefydliad datganoledig, ond cymeraf eich pwynt, a byddaf yn mynd ar drywydd yr agwedd ddiogelwch honno.

**Peter Law:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei hadroddiad y prynhawn yma a chytunaf â'i sylwadau am y gwasanaethau brys. Mae pob Aelod wedi dweud gymaint yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi beth maent wedi'i wneud ledled Cymru ar amser anodd. O ran ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, sydd yn ffordd brifwylchiennol, a all hi fy sicrhau y cymerir pob cam i ailagor hon cyn gynted â phosibl, o gofio pwysigrwydd hanfodol y ffordd honno i economi Blaenau'r Cymoedd, Blaenau Gwent a Merthyr Tudful?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oedd y tirlithriad yn arbennig o ddifrifol, gyda phob un o'r tair lôn ar gau. Mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo, a byddwn yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i chi.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae dwy stori wedi cael lle amlwg yn y newyddion heddiw: canlyniadau cynhesu byd-eang, sydd yn golygu mwy o lifogydd a gwyntoedd cryfion dinistriol hefyd, a phrisiau petrol. Ni wna neb y cysylltiad yn y newyddion ar hyn o bryd rhwng cynnydd mewn allyriannau carbon deuocsid a newid amgylcheddol. Nid oes gan yr amgylchedd unrhyw bleidlais, felly a wnewch chi bledio achos yr amgylchedd? Bydd y bobl a fydd yn rhan o'r blocadau petrol at eu gyddfa mewn llifogydd cyn iddynt gael y neges.

**Sue Essex:** Os na wnaethpwyd y cyswllt hwnnw, yna yr ydych wedi gwneud hynny'n dda yn awr. Mae gan yr amgylchedd bleidleisiau, oherwydd mae'r amgylchedd yn ymwneud â bywyd ac mae pobl yn dechrau deall hynny. Nid yw hyn yn rhywbeth yr wyf am ei ddatrys drwy wneud mater etholiad ohono. Mae'n bwysig iawn. Yr ydym yn edrych ar newidiadau sylfaenol. Daw'r adar gartref i nythu yma. Yr ydym ni yng Nghymru ar linell flaen rhai o'r

people are starting to rethink the priorities of their lives. We must support people in doing that as much as we can.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for your statement. As Liberal Democrats, we offer our sympathy to all those who suffered the misery of recent days. I wish to address three issues. First, I welcome your review. You talk about targets to assist the process of addressing global warming and reducing carbon emissions. Are you setting targets for renewable energy within your review? Second, coming from Montgomeryshire, where we have suffered floods in the Severn Valley for many years, the flow of traffic from north to south and vice versa is always halted in this area. We have had the Babtie report. Are you prepared to take action, particularly now that the Assembly has the powers to ensure that that area will no longer be flooded every year? Third, will you also pursue with the Environment Agency the lowering of water retained in reservoirs? My colleague Lembit Öpik and I have managed to get a reduction in the level of water in Clywedog, for example, which therefore reduces the flooding down the Severn Valley by up to 10 per cent. We are currently pursuing the same thing in the Vyrnwy. Releases from these reservoirs have a tremendous impact on the level of flooding. I know from experience that the Environment Agency is not keen to do this: will you give a commitment to make sure that these levels will cater for the change in weather patterns and in the deluges that we are now suffering?

3.35 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I will take up your points about the management of water levels. That was an interesting point, which had not been brought to my attention before. Thank you for that. Renewable energy is not in my brief. It is part of the economic development brief. However, we must be involved in meeting the UK target and I hope that we do that.

Regarding road priorities, can you remind me of your point, Mick?

hyrddwyntoedd mwyaf stormus. Credaf fod pobl yn dechrau aillfeddwl am flaenoriaethau eu bywydau. Rhaid inni gefnogi pobl i wneud hynny gaint ag y gallwn.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am eich datganiad. Fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mynegwn ein cydymdeimlad i bawb a dioddefodd drallod y dyddiau diwethaf Hoffwn ymdrin â thri mater. Yn gyntaf, croesawaf eich adolygiad. Soniwr am dargedau i gynorthwyo'r broses o fynd i'r afael â chynhesu byd-eang a lleihau allyriannau carbon. A osodwch dargedau ar gyfer ynni adnewyddol o fewn eich adolygiad? Yn ail, fel un sydd yn dod o Sir Drefaldwyn, lle yr ydym wedi dioddef llifogydd yn Nyffryn Hafren ers blynnyddoedd, mae llif y traffig o'r gogledd i'r de ac i'r gwrthwyneb bob amser yn dod i stop yn yr ardal hon. Cawsom adroddiad Babtie. A ydych yn barod i gymryd camau, yn arbennig yn awr bod gan y Cynulliad y pwerau i sicrhau na fydd yr ardal honno yn dioddef llifogydd bob blwyddyn mwyach? Yn drydydd, a wnewch chi hefyd godi'r mater o ostwng lefelau'r dŵr a gedwir mewn cronfeydd gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd? Llwyddodd fy nghyd-aelod Lembit Öpik a minnau i gael gostyngiad yn lefel y dŵr yng Nghlywedog, er enghrafft, sydd felly'n lleihau llifogydd yn Nyffryn Hafren hyd at 10 y cant. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud yr un peth yn Fyrnwy. Caiff y dŵr a ryddheir o'r cronfeydd hyn effaith aruthrol ar lefel y llifogydd. Gwn o brofiad nad yw Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn awyddus i wneud hyn: a wnewch chi ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd y lefelau hyn yn darparu ar gyfer y newid ym mhatriwm y tywydd ac yn y llifogydd a ddioddefwn yn awr?

**Sue Essex:** Af ar drywydd eich pwyntiau yngylch rheoli lefelau dŵr. Yr oedd hwnnw'n bwynt diddorol, na ddaeth i'm sylw cyn hyn. Diolch ichi am hynny. Nid yw ynni adnewyddol o fewn fy nghylch gorchwyl. Mae'n rhan o'r cylch gorchwyl datblygu economaidd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gymryd rhan mewn cwrdd â'r targed DU hwn a gobeithiaf y gwnawn hynny.

Ynglŷn â blaenoriaethau o ran ffyrdd, a allwch fy atgoffa o'ch pwynt, Mick?

**Mick Bates:** It was to ensure that we prevent flooding on the roads in the Welshpool area.

**Sue Essex:** Thank you for bringing that to my attention. I will look at that with the mid Wales transport agency.

**The Presiding Officer:** These statements are important, which is why I allowed almost half an hour for that statement.

**Mick Bates:** Sicrhau ein bod yn atal llifogydd ar ffyrdd yn ardal y Trallwng.

**Sue Essex:** Diolch ichi am ddod â hynny i'm sylw. Edrychaf ar hynny gydag asiantaeth trafnidiaeth canolbarth Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r datganiadau hyn yn bwysig, a dyna pam y caniateais ymron i hanner awr ar gyfer y datganiad hwnnw.

### Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**David Melding:** I wish to make a point of order under Standing Order No. 23, which is aptly entitled 'miscellaneous procedures'. You may have heard already that the supreme Pontiff has declared St Thomas More a patron saint of politicians. This announcement comes from the Vatican today. I ask you to make a ruling on whether the jurisdiction of this appointment will extend to this place. If it does, will you consider issuing a protocol that would advise those perhaps unaccustomed with how saints are used to intercede on behalf of those in prayer, as to how they may go about this business? I realise that in the Deputy First Minister we now have our own titular bishop, but this guidance ought to come from you.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. As someone of Anglo-Catholic persuasion of the Church in Wales, I, of course, welcome this statement from the Pontiff, particularly in view of the fact that St Thomas More was himself a Speaker of another place and argued strongly and continually for the freedom of Parliament. The religious observance of individual Members is a private matter. We have no religious observance in this building. The Church in Wales was disestablished in 1920. Since the Assembly's establishment we have not followed any religious practice. It is important in my view that this building remains secular. However, the Lightship is always open. If you are not already aware, the Lightship is behind the building and it is an ecumenical chaplaincy located in the bay. I am sure that it would be prepared to mark St Thomas along with any other saints that the

**David Melding:** Dymunaf wneud pwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23, a enwir yn briodol 'gweithdrefnau amrywiol'. Efallai y clywsnoch eisoes bod y Pab wedi datgan y bydd Sant Thomas More yn nawddsant gwleidyddion. Daw'r cyhoeddiad hwn o'r Fatican heddiw. Gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu a ehanga awdurdodaeth y penodiad hwn i'r lle hwn. Os gwna, a ystyriwch gyhoeddi protocol a hysbysai'r rheini nad ydynt yn gyfarwydd efallai â sut y defnyddir saint i eiriol dros y rheini sydd yn gweddio ynglŷn â sut y gallant wneud hyn? Sylweddolaf fod gennym bellach ein esgob teitlog ein hun, sef Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru, ond chi a ddylai gyhoeddi'r arweiniad hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fel rhywun o gred Anglo-Gatholig yr Eglwys yng Nghymru, croesawaf y datganiad hwn gan y Pab, wrth gwrs, yn enwedig yn sgil y ffaith y bu Sant Thomas More ei hun yn Llefarydd lle arall ac yn dadlau'n gryf ac yn barhaol dros ryddid y Senedd. Mater preifat yw arfer grefyddol Aelodau unigol. Nid oes gennym arfer crefyddol yn yr adeilad hwn. Datgysylltwyd yr Eglwys yng Nghymru yn 1920. Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad ni ddilynasm arfer grefyddol. Mae'n bwysig bod yr adeilad hwn yn parhau i fod yn secwlar yn fy marn i. Fodd bynnag mae'r Oleulong ar agor drwy'r amser. Os nad ydych eisoes yn ymwybodol ohoni, lleolir yr Oleulong y tu ôl i'r adeilad a chaplandy ecwmenaidd ydyw a leolir yn y bae. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n barod i nodi Sant Thomas gydag unrhyw saint eraill y dymunai Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad dynnu ein sylw tuag atynt.

Chairman of the Committee on Standards of Conduct would wish to draw to our attention.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Forgive me, Llywydd, for not pursuing that particular issue. I wish to raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 9.2, which states that the:

'Chairs of Subject Committees shall be selected from a panel of Members elected by the Assembly'.

However, I have just been handed a press release from the Conservative group that says that Glyn Davies has been appointed Chair of the Rural Affairs Committee. Leaving aside the fact that that appears to be an old-fashioned stitch-up between Labour and the Conservatives—the real forces of Conservatism in this place—would you remind the Conservative group and its cohorts in the Labour group that nobody can be the Chair of a Subject Committee unless they are appointed by the panel?

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for being allowed to respond to this point of order. It is a nice attempt by the leader of Plaid Cymru, the leader of the Opposition, to try to cause difficulty on this particular point. It was made clear when this matter was explained to the press that this was a proposal that would be subject to an Assembly vote. However, is it not true that Plaid Cymru is seeking to get more chairmanships than its entitlement under Standing Orders? Under Standing Orders, it is entitled to two. It is a clear mathematical process and the sooner it agrees to that process the better for all, because we can then agree the competition, the Committees and the good working of this body, which it is supposed to support.

**The Presiding Officer:** These matters are indeed covered under Standing Order No. 9.2. If there are internal discussions not so much as to the numbers of Chairs, perhaps, but as to the Committees on which they sit, these are best conducted privately in the panel of Chairs. These are not matters on which I want to pronounce in Plenary. However, as you refer to Standing Orders, I will seek further information about what may be happening in this area. I will consult with

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Maddeuwch imi, Llywydd, am beidio â dilyn y mater penodol hwnnw. Dymunaf godi pwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 9.2, sydd yn datgan y:

'Dewisir cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau Pwnc o banol o Aelodau a etholir gan y Cynulliad'.

Serch hynny, yr wyf newydd dderbyn datganiad i'r wasg gan y grŵp Ceidwadol a ddywed y penodwyd Glyn Davies yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Gwledig. Gan anwybyddu'r ffaith yr ymddengys ei fod yn gyfuniad hen ffasiwn rhwng y Blaid Lafur a'r Ceidwadwyr—gwir pwerau Ceidwadaeth yn y lle hwn—a atgoffech y grŵp Ceidwadol a'i garfanau yn y grŵp Llafur na all neb fod yn Gadeirydd Pwyllgor Pwnc oni chaiff ei benodi gan y panel?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gael caniatâd i ymateb i'r pwynt hwn o drefn. Ymgais dda ydyw gan arweinydd Plaid Cymru, arweinydd yr Wrthblaid, i geisio achosi trfferth ar y pwynt penodol hwn. Gwnaethpwyd yn glir pan eglurwyd y mater hwn i'r wasg mai cynnig ydoedd a fyddai'n amodol ar bleidlais y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'n wir bod Plaid Cymru yn ceisio cael mwy o gadeiryddiaethau na'i hawl o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog? O dan y Rheolau Sefydlog, mae hawl ganddi i gael dwy. Mae'n broses fathemategol glir a pho gynted y cytuna â'r broses honno, gwell ar gyfer pawb fyddai, oherwydd y gallwn wedyn gytuno'r gystadleuaeth, y Pwyllgorau a gweithrediad da y corff hwn, y dylai ei gefnogi.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n wir y cwmpesir y materion hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 9.2. Os ceir trafodaethau mewnol ddim cymaint am nifer y Cadeiryddion, efallai, ond ynglŷn â'r Pwyllgorau y maent yn eistedd arnynt, mae'n well eu cynnal yn breifat ym mhanel y Cadeiryddion. Nid materion ydynt y dymunaf ddatgan arnynt yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Fodd bynnag, gan eich bod yn cyfeirio at y Rheolau Sefydlog, chwiliaf am fwy o wybodaeth am yr hyn a allai fod yn digwydd

my experienced Deputy and send him among you if there is a problem.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Point of order. First, as an atheist, I thank you for your response to David Melding. I have my own views on the matter. However, I want to make a point of order under Standing Order No. 6.30. I may have missed something, but I did not think that the two supplementary questions from Nick Bourne on fuel tax were anything to do with question 4, under which he raised them. I wonder whether you could keep an eye on supplementary questions to ensure that Members do not abuse the system, because that is unfair on those of us whose questions are not listed but who behave ourselves by only raising appropriate supplementary questions.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to you for declaring your religious affiliation, as we are all welcome to do in this Chamber. All beliefs are welcome, from atheist to Catholic. On the issue of supplementary questions, I try to keep an ear open for this. I do not always succeed. I will review the record and if the leader of the Welsh Conservatives has, in my view, transgressed he will be summoned to the upstairs room, where we will have a discussion. My door is always open on these matters.

**David Lloyd:** Pwynt o drefn. Rhoddais rybudd i'ch swyddfa ynglŷn â hyn. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.1, codaf bwynt ynglŷn â chyfarfod y Pwyllgor Deddfau y bore yma. Fel Cadeirydd dros dro y Pwyllgor hwnnw, bu'n rhaid imi ohirio'r cyfarfod am 20 munud, oherwydd mai dim ond tri Aelod o Blaid Cymru oedd yn bresennol am 9 a.m., pan oedd y cyfarfod i fod i ddechrau. Nid oedd cworm gennym. Dechreuodd y cyfarfod pan gyrhaeddodd Aelod arall yn hwyr am 9.25 a.m. Digwyddodd rhywbeth tebyg bythefnos yn ôl ac, wrth gwrs, ni allwn ddelio â deddfwriaeth yn y lle hwn os na allwn gynnal cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor. Yr ydym yn delio â deddfwriaeth y Llywodraeth, ond mae Aelodau'r Llywodraeth yn gyndyn o fynychu'r Pwyllgor hwn. Mae'r sefyllfa bresennol yn anfoddhaol. Mae pawb yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i waith y Cynulliad fynd rhagddo, ac eto mae Aelodau'n gyndyn o

yn y maes hwn. Ymgynghoraf â'm Dirprwy profiadol ac fe'i anfonaf i'ch mysig os bydd problem.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Pwynt o drefn. Yn gyntaf, fel anghredadun, diolch ichi am eich ymateb i David Melding. Mae gennyf fy marn fy hunan ar y mater. Fodd bynnag, dymunaf wneud pwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.30. Efallai y collais rywbeth, ond ni chredwn fod y ddau gwestiwn atodol gan Nick Bourne ar dreth tanwydd a wnelo ddim â chwestiwn 4, lle y cododd hwy. Tybed a allech gadw llygad ar gwestiynau atodol er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r Aelodau'n camddefnyddio'r system, gan fod hynny'n annheg ar y rheini ohonom na restrir ein cwestiynau ond sydd yn ymddwyn yn dda drwy ddim ond codi cwestiynau atodol priodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ddatgan eich teimladau ar grefydd, fel y mae croeso i bob un ohonom ei wneud yn y Siambr hon. Mae pob cred i'w chroesawu, o fod yn anghredadun i fod yn Gatholig. Ar y mater o gwestiynau atodol, ceisiaf gadw clust ar agor ar gyfer hyn. Ni lwyddaf bob tro. Adolygaf y cofnod a phe byddai arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi tramwyddo, yn fy marn innau, caiff ei alw i'r ystafell lan llofft, lle cawn drafodaeth. Mae fy nrws ar agor bob amser ynglŷn â'r materion hyn.

**David Lloyd:** Point of order. I gave your office notice of this. Under Standing Order No. 11.1, I raise a point about the Legislation Committee meeting this morning. As the temporary Chair of that Committee, I had to postpone the meeting for 20 minutes, because only three Plaid Cymru Members were present at 9 a.m., when the meeting was scheduled to begin. We did not have a quorum. The meeting began when another Member arrived late at 9.25 a.m. Something similar happened a fortnight ago, and, of course, we cannot deal with legislation in this place if we cannot hold meetings of the Committee. We deal with Government legislation, but Members of the Government are reluctant to attend this Committee. The present situation is unsatisfactory. Everyone agrees that the work of the Assembly must proceed, yet Members are reluctant to attend Legislation Committee meetings. Can you

fynychu cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau.  
Allwch chi farnu ar hyn, Llywydd?

**Kirsty Williams:** On this point of order, I concur that Dai and the Legislation Committee are having difficulties. However, we in the Liberal Democrats are anxious for our Members to be replaced on that Committee and other Committees, but we cannot do so unless procedural motions are placed before this Assembly, and we cannot do that because Plaid Cymru is not co-operating.

**Huw Lewis:** Further to that point of order, I explained to the Chair of the Legislation Committee this morning that I was late because of a diary mix-up. However, I try, as a member of that Committee and all other Committees on which I sit, to treat each Committee as being of equal importance and as having equal claim to my attention. Would you be concerned, Llywydd, if a political party in this Chamber treated some Committees as being of major importance and others as being of minor importance? If a certain political party treated the Committee that deals with rural affairs, for instance, as a Committee of minor importance, that would cause concern throughout the rural community. I hope that the Welsh nationalists take note of that.

**Y Llywydd:** Ar y pwynt o drefn gwreiddiol a'r sylwadau a ddilynodd, mae'r Pwyllgor Deddfau yn rhan hanfodol a statudol o'n gweithgareddau. Heb weithrediad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nid yw'n bosibl inni drin ein deddfwriaeth eilaidd yn briodol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Felly, mae'n holl bwysig bod y Pwyllgor hwn yn cael ei drin fel pob Pwyllgor. Rhaid i hwn, yn arbennig, o safbwyt prosesau'r Cynulliad, gael ei drin fel Pwyllgor o bwys. Deallaf gan y Clerc mai cworwm o draean o Aelodau'r Pwyllgor sydd ei angen, ac nid yw hynny'n nifer uchel. Felly, apelias ar Aelodau i edrych eto ar eu dyddiaduron i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu gweithredu'n briodol. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r drafodaeth hon yn rhan o ddeialog neu ddadl ryng-bleidiol nad wyf yn ymwybodol ohoni, apelias ar y pleidiau sydd yn rhan ohoni i ddod â hi i ben yn gyflym fel y gallwn fynd ati i ethol Pwyllgorau. Cyngoraf y Cabinet i beidio â chynhyrfu'n ormodol.

rule on this, Llywydd?

**Kirsty Williams:** Ynglŷn â'r pwynt hwn o drefn, cytunaf y caiff Dai a'r Pwyllgor Deddfau anawsterau. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym ninnau yn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn awyddus i'n Haelodau gael eu disodli ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw a'r Pwyllgorau eraill, ond ni allwn wneud hyn oni fydd cynigion trefniadol yn cael eu gosod gerbron y Cynulliad hwn, ac ni allwn wneud hynny am nad yw Plaid Cymru yn cydweithredu.

**Huw Lewis:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, eglurais i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau y bore yma fy mod yn hwyr oherwydd dryswch ynglŷn â'm dyddiadur. Fodd bynnag, ceisias, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw a phob Pwyllgor arall yr wyf yn aelod ohono, drin pob Pwyllgor ar y sail eu bod yr un mor bwysig â'i gilydd ac y dylent gael yr un sylw gennyf. A fyddch yn pryderu, Llywydd, pe bai plaid wleidyddol yn y Siambra hon yn trin rhai Pwyllgorau ar sail eu bod bwysig iawn ac eraill ar sail nad ydynt mor bwysig? Pe bai plaid wleidyddol benodol yn trin y Pwyllgor sydd yn ymdrin â materion gwledig, er enghraifft, fel Pwyllgor dibwys, byddai'n achosi pryder ar draws y gymuned wledig Gobeithiaf fod y cenedlaetholwyr yn nodi hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** On the original point of order and the subsequent comments, the Legislation Committee is a crucial and statutory part of our activities. Without the operation of the Legislation Committee, it is not possible for us to deal with our secondary legislation appropriately in Plenary. Therefore, it is vital that this Committee is treated like every other Committee. It is particularly important, in terms of Assembly processes, that this one is treated as an important Committee. I understand from the Clerk that a quorum of one-third of Committee members is required, which is not a large number. Therefore, I appeal to Members to look again at their diaries to ensure that we can act appropriately. However, if this discussion is part of an inter-party dialogue or debate of which I am not aware, I appeal to the parties that are part of it to bring it to a swift conclusion so that we can proceed to elect Committees. I advise the

Cabinet not to become overexcited.

3.45 p.m.

O'r Gadair hon, mae'r Pwyllgorau yn rhan hanfodol o waith y Cynulliad, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn symud i sefydlu'r Pwyllgorau. Apelias felly ar Drefnyddion Busnes y gwahanol bleidiau ac unrhyw un arall sydd yn rhan o drafodaethau ynglŷn ag ethol Pwyllgorau i symud ymlaen fel y gallwn wneud hynny naill ai ddydd Iau neu yr adeg hon yr wythnos nesaf fan bellaf.

**Peter Rogers:** Point of order. I did not declare an interest earlier during the debate on the Phillips report. However, I understand that I do not need to do so as I was not going to gain from it.

**The Presiding Officer:** The golden rule is, if in doubt, declare at all times.

**Peter Rogers:** Then I declare an interest.

From this Chair, the Committees are a crucial part of the Assembly's work and it is important that we move to establish the committees. I therefore appeal to the Business Managers of the various parties and anybody else involved in discussion on the election of committees to move forward so that we can do so either on Thursday or at the latest this time next week.

**Peter Rogers:** Pwynt o drefn. Ni ddatgenais fuddiant yn gynharach yn y ddadl ar adroddiad Phillips. Fodd bynnag, deallaf nad oes angen imi wneud hynny gan na fyddwn yn elwa arno.

**Y Llywydd:** Y rheol euraidd yw, os oes amheuaeth, datganer bob amser.

**Peter Rogers:** Yna datganaf fuddiant.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** Business on Tuesday 7 November will include a debate on the principles of the National Health Service Bodies and Local Authorities Partnership Arrangements (Wales) Regulations 2000 and the Health Act (Commencement No. 3) (Wales) Order 2000. Motions to approve four items of subordinate legislation, including the Orders that I have just mentioned, and a debate on the Health Service Commissioner for Wales (Ombudsman) Annual Report will also take place. Business on 9 November will now also include a motion to approve the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Wales) Regulations 2000. Business on Tuesday 14 November and Thursday 16 November is as I reported last week.

On Tuesday 21 November there will be a motion to approve the Teachers (Compulsory Registration) (Wales) Regulations 2000, a debate on the upgrade of school buildings and a debate on the Committee on Standards of Conduct report. Business on Thursday 23

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Bydd y busnes ddydd Mawrth 7 Tachwedd yn cynnwys dadl ar egwyddorion Rheoliadau Trefniadau Partneriaethau Cyrff y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol ac Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2000 a Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd (Cychwyn Rhif 3) (Cymru) 2000. Bydd cynigion i gymeradwyo pedair eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth, gan gynnwys y Gorchymynion a grybwylais nawr, a dadl ar Adroddiad Blynnyddol Comisiynydd Gwasanaeth Iechyd (Ombudsmon) Cymru hefyd. Bydd y busnes ar 9 Tachwedd bellach yn cynnwys cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gorchwyl) (Cymru) 2000 hefyd. Bydd busnes ddydd Mawrth 14 Tachwedd a dydd Iau 16 Tachwedd fel y nodais yr wythnos diwethaf.

Ddydd Mawrth 21 Tachwedd bydd cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Athrawon (Cofrestru Gorfodol) (Cymru) 2000, a dadl ar uwchraddio adeiladau ysgolion a dadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Safonau Ymddygiad. Bydd busnes ddydd Iau 23

November will include motions to approve several items of subordinate legislation. On the advice of this morning's Business Committee the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, in accordance with Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee: the Children's Commissioner for Wales (Appointments) Regulations 2000 and the National Health Service (General Dental Services) Amendment (Wales) Regulations 2000. Arrangements will be made to post a copy of the business statement to the intranet and internet today.

I hope to be in a position to table a no-named day motion today to elect the panel of Chairs and the members of the Subject and other Committees. I have consulted all parties about the proposals for the Committees and have the agreement of my group, the Welsh Conservative Party and the Welsh Liberal Democrats to these proposals. As you have already indicated, Presiding Officer, the election of Committees is an important matter for the Assembly and we need to move the matter forward. I would like to be in a position to at least elect the panel of Chairs in Plenary on Thursday.

**William Graham:** I note from our discussion this morning that you prefer for a statement on the Welsh Joint Education Committee and the allegations made by the Minister for Economic Development to go to committee. Could you reconsider that and ask the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to make a statement on that matter of public concern?

**Andrew Davies:** You have raised this in Business Committee and we discussed it in Plenary last week. As I indicated then, and I believe that the Presiding Officer supported me in this view, this is not a matter of urgent public importance and should not therefore be the subject of a statement. That is not to say that it is not a matter of great importance—it is a matter of distinguishing between what is urgent and what is important. I feel that that was endorsed. My colleague, Jane Davidson, and I have suggested a way forward on this. It will be a matter for the Chair of the proposed

Tachwedd yn cynnwys cynigion i gymeradwyo sawl eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth. Ar gyngor y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma mae'r Diprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i Bwyllgor Pwnc: Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru (Penodiadau) 2000 a Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaethau Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) Gwelliant (Cymru) 2000. Trefnir i gopi o'r datganiad busnes gael ei roi ar y fewnrwyd a'r rhyngrwyd heddiw.

Gobeithiaf fod mewn sefyllfa i gyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod heddiw i ethol panel y Cadeiryddion ac aelodau o'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc a'r Pwyllgorau eraill. Ymgynghorais â phob plaid ynglŷn â'r cynigion ar gyfer y Pwyllgorau ac mae fy ngrŵp i, Plaid Geidwadol Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymreig wedi cytuno ar y cynigion hyn. Fel y nodasoch eisoes, Lywydd, mae ethol Pwyllgorau yn fater pwysig i'r Cynulliad ac mae angen inni symud ymlaen. Hoffwn fod mewn sefyllfa i ethol panel y Cadeiryddion o leiaf yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd iau.

**William Graham:** Nodaf o'n trafodaeth y bore yma y byddai'n well gennych pe bai datganiad ar Gyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru a'r honiadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn mynd i'r pwyllgor. A allech ailystyried hynny a gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i wneud datganiad ar y mater hwnnw sydd yn achos pryder i'r cyhoedd?

**Andrew Davies:** Codasoch hyn yn y Pwyllgor Busnes ac fe'i trafodwyd gennym yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf. Fel y nodais bryd hynny, a chredaf y bydd y Llywydd yn ategu'r farn hon, nad yw'n fater o bwys brys i'r cyhoedd ac na ddylai felly fod yn destun datganiad. Ni olyga hynny nad yw'n fater o bwys mawr—mae'n fater o wahaniaethu rhwng yr hyn sydd yn fater brys a'r hyn sydd yn fater pwysig. Teimlaf fod cytundeb ynglŷn â hynny. Awgrymodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Jane Davidson, a minnau ffordd ymlaen ar hyn. Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg arfaethedig ynghyd â'r Gweinidog

Education Committee in consultation with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to discuss how this can best be taken forward.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** We could have a debate about what constitutes consultation. However, I have written a letter to Rhodri, which was copied to Andrew, suggesting an urgent meeting between our Business Manager, the First Minister, myself and Andrew tomorrow at 5 p.m. to try to resolve this matter. Will the Minister agree to that meeting?

**Andrew Davies:** I have not yet had the opportunity to discuss this issue with the First Minister, as I have only just seen a copy of the letter. I will discuss it with him as soon as possible and we will inform you in due course whether we can meet tomorrow.

**Diddymu Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000  
Revocation of the Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales)  
Order 2000**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*revokes its decision of 19 October 2000 to approve the Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2000 laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2000.*

On Thursday, 19 October, the Assembly approved the Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2000 to bring into force certain provisions of the Local Government Act 2000. Unfortunately, the Order contained minor drafting errors, which made the legislation technically flawed. Those drafting errors have now been corrected in the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2000. The error was administrative and the spirit of the Order remains unchanged, as I reported to the Business Committee this morning.

dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes fydd yn trafod y ffordd orau o fynd â'r mater hwn yn ei flaen.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gallem gael dadl ynghylch ystyr ymgynghori. Fodd bynnag, ysgrifennais lythyr at Rhodri, y rhoddwyd copi ohono i Andrew, yn awgrymu cynnal cyfarfod brys rhwng ein Rheolwr Busnes, Prif Weinidog Cymru, Andrew a minnau yfory am 5 p.m. er mwyn ceisio datrys y mater hwn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno ar y cyfarfod hwnnw?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid wyf wedi cael cyfle eto i drafod y mater hwn gyda Phrif Weinidog Cymru, gan mai newydd weld y copi o'r llythyr ydwyt. Byddaf yn ei drafod gydag ef cyn gynted â phosibl a byddwn yn eich hysbysu maes o law a allwn gyfarfod yfory.

**Diddymu Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000  
Revocation of the Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales)  
Order 2000**

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn gwyrdroi ei benderfyniad dyddiedig 19 Hydref 2000 i gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2000.*

Ddydd Iau, 19 Hydref, cymeradwywyd Gorchymyn Deddf Llywodraeth Leol (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000 gan y Cynulliad er mwyn gweithredu darpariaethau penodol Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000. Yn anffodus, yr oedd mân wallau drafftio yn y Gorchymyn, a olygai fod y ddeddfwriaeth yn ddifygiol yn dechnegol. Bellach cywiriwyd y gwallau drafftio hynny yn y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2000. Yr oedd y gwall yn un gweinyddol ac mae ysbryd y Gorchymyn heb ei newid, fel y nodais i'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma.

*Cynnig: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000  
Approval of the Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order  
2000**

**The Minister for Assembly Business  
(Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*(a) approves under Standing Order No. 22.23A the following draft order:*

*Local Government Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2000 laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2000; and*

*(b) considers the report of the Legislation Committee relating to this draft order laid in the Table Office on 11 October 2000 and the memorandum of corrections pursuant to Standing Order No. 22.12A laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2000.*

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*(a) yn cymeradwyo o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.23A y gorchymyn draft canlynol:*

*Gorchymyn Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2000; ac yn*

*(b) ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ynghylch y gorchymyn draft hwn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Hydref 2000 a'r memorandwm cywiriadau parthed Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.12A a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2000.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline

Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion adopted.*

### **Fformwla Asesiad Safonol o Wariant Llywodraeth Leol Local Government Standard Spending Assessment Formula**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, approves the new standard spending assessment formula as the method of distribution of the 2001-02 local government revenue settlement.*

The new standard spending assessment formula for 2001-02 has been achieved following thorough consultation and independent examination. For example, when we last discussed this issue in this Chamber, we were asked to consider issues such as sparsity and rurality. Because any new formula must, of necessity, produce winners and losers, you also asked that ways should be found to cushion authorities that might find themselves to be losers.

All that has been done. We commissioned the distribution sub-group to consult as widely as possible and its recommendations have been endorsed by the consultative forum on finance and the Partnership Council. You

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):  
 Cynigiaf fod**

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cymeradwyo fformwla newydd yr asesiad safonol o wariant fel dull dosrannu setliad refeniw Llywodraeth Leol 2001-02.*

Lluniwyd fformwla newydd yr asesiad safonol o wariant ar gyfer 2001-02 yn dilyn ymgynghoriad manwl ac archwiliad annibynnol. Er enghraifft, y tro diwethaf inni drafod y mater hwn yn y Siambwr hon, gofynnwyd inni ystyried materion megis teneurwydd a gwledigrwydd. Am fod unrhyw fformwla newydd yn golygu, wrth reswm, y bydd rhai ar eu hennill ac eraill ar eu colled, gofynasoch hefyd am ganfod ffyrdd o leddfu'r sefyllfa i awdurdodau a allai fod ar eu colled.

Mae hyn oll wedi ei wneud. Gorchmynnwyd i'r is-grŵp dosbarthu ymgynghori mor eang â phosibl a chymeradwywyd ei argymhellion gan y fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid a'r Cyngor Partneriaeth. Mae gennych gopi o'r

have a copy of the final recommendations. I am particularly pleased that the Welsh Local Government Association has endorsed the report as an improved way of distributing revenue resources.

3.55 p.m.

Full implementation of the proposed SSA formula depends on better data than is available now. I will ensure that better quality data is produced in the coming years. I welcome the constructive spirit of Janet Ryder's amendment 2 and I agree that the purpose of this review is to achieve greater social justice and recognition of the circumstance of deprivation and delivering services in dispersed populations. My only disagreement with Janet's amendment 2 is that it requires that no further incorporation of new data should take place until 2003. I have had discussions with the Welsh Local Government Association on the question of how to handle new data. Our joint view is that we should seek to minimise unnecessary turbulence. However, if significant new data becomes available, we should not exclude the possibility of considering and agreeing to its incorporation as it becomes available. It is on the single point of keeping the options open on the incorporation of new data that I must ask the Assembly not to support Janet's amendment. However, I stress that there is a great deal of common ground between us on the issues that her amendment brings into the debating arena. I am particularly grateful to Professor Hugh Coombs and David Adams Jones for their work as independent members of the group. They have confirmed that the consultation and the resulting recommendations have been arrived at in a professional and objective way. That needs to be stressed.

There will always be winners and losers. As you know, I have already allocated £4 million in additional resources for a scheme that will provide transitional relief where necessary. On the current available data, this should ensure that no authority that has the average real and substantial growth in budgets would need to increase its council tax by more than around 9 per cent in any of the three years.

argymhellion terfynol. Yr wyf yn falch dros ben bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi cymeradwyo'r adroddiad fel ffordd well o ddosrannu adnoddau refeniw.

Bydd gweithredu fformwla arfaethedig yr asesiad gwariant safonol yn llawn yn dibynnu ar gael gwell data nag sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Byddaf yn sicrhau y caiff data o safon well ei gynhyrchu yn y dyfodol. Croesawaf naws adeiladol gwelliant 2 Janet Ryder a chytunaf mai diben yr adolygiad hwn yw cael gwell cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a chydnabyddiaeth o amgylchiadau amddifadedd a chyflwyno gwasanaethau i boblogaethau gwasgaredig. Yr unig fater lle na chytunaf â gwelliant 2 Janet yw ei fod yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol na ddylid ymgorffori unrhyw ddata newydd tan 2003. Cefais drafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynghylch sut y dylid trafod data newydd. Yr ydym yn gytûn y dylem geisio lleihau unrhyw aflonyddwch i'r eithaf. Fodd bynnag, os daw data newydd arwyddocaol i'r golwg, ni ddylem ddiystyr u'r posibilrwydd o'i ystyried a chytuno ar ei ymgorffori wrth iddo ddod ar gael. Er mwyn sicrhau y bydd opsiynau o ran ymgorffori data newydd, rhaid imi ofyn i'r Cynulliad beidio â chefnogi gwelliant Janet. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn bwysleisio ein bod yn cytuno ar nifer o'r materion y mae ei gwelliant yn eu codi i'w trafod. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Athro Hugh Coombs a David Adams Jones yn arbennig am eu gwaith fel aelodau annibynnol o'r grŵp. Maent wedi cadarnhau bod yr ymgynghoriad wedi ei gynnal a bod yr argymhellion dilynol wedi eu llunio mewn ffordd broffesiynol a gwrthrychol. Mae angen pwysleisio hynny.

Bydd rhai ar eu hennill a rhai ar eu colled bob amser. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf eisoes wedi dosrannu £4 miliwn o adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer cynllun a fydd yn rhoi cymorth trosiannol lle bo angen. O ran y data cyfredol sydd ar gael, dylai hyn sicrhau na fyddai angen i unrhyw awdurdod sydd â thwf gwirioneddol a sylweddol yn ei gyllideb gynyddu ei dreth gyngor yn fwy na thua 9 y cant yn ystod unrhyw un o'r tair blynedd hyn.

Janet Ryder's amendment 3 requires that we spend £11 million on transitional arrangements. If I can limit council tax increases to around 9 per cent in any authority at a cost of £4 million, that is sufficient protection. I expect that the scheme I propose will apply to three authorities in year one—Merthyr Tydfil, Monmouthshire and Blaenau Gwent, and one authority in year two. It will end after three years. I fear that Janet's amendment 3 would extend the transitional arrangements forever and a day. I ask the Assembly to vote against this amendment.

Beginning the implementation of the new formula in the next financial year will bring substantial improvements to the financing of local services in Wales. When the Conservative Government reorganised local government in 1996, it was grossly irresponsible in leaving the question of distribution unresolved. Since that date, all Welsh authorities have struggled, with no ability to plan for their futures. The poorest authorities inherited spending commitments way above their standard spending assessments and were reliant on fragile, unpredictable damping arrangements. David Davies's amendment 1 continues the irresponsible attitude of the Conservatives in Wales. It represents fundamental opposition to this sensible measure of redistribution. In seeking to protect those very few privileged enclaves of Conservatism left in Wales, its aim is to keep local government in a state of permanent uncertainty and disarray. I ask the Assembly to reject David Davies's amendment.

I commend this review to you. It will lead to a sensible and just redistribution to the areas of greatest need in terms of deprivation and rurality. I do not intend that any authority will be worse off in real terms, compared to where they are now, by the implementation of this review. I expect all local authorities to use this new framework for distribution to plan efficiently for their futures. I commend the new SSA formula for 2001-02 to the Chamber today.

**David Davies:** I propose amendment 1. After

Mae gwelliant 3 Janet Ryder yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni wario £11 miliwn ar drefniadau trosiannol. Os gallaf gyfyngu'r cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor i tua 9 y cant mewn unrhyw awdurdod am gost o £4 miliwn, mae hynny'n ddigon o ddiogelwch. Disgwyliaf y bydd y cynllun a gynigiaf yn berthnasol i dri awdurdod ym mlwyddyn un—Merthyr Tudful, Sir Fynwy a Blaenau Gwent, ac un awdurdod ym mlwyddyn dau. Bydd yn dod i ben ar ôl tair blynedd. Ofnaf y byddai gwelliant 3 Janet yn ymestyn y trefniadau trosiannol am byth. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant hwn.

Bydd dechrau gweithredu'r fformwla newydd yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf yn esgor ar welliannau sylweddol i ariannu gwasanaethau lleol yng Nghymru. Pan ad-drefnwyd llywodraeth leol gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn 1996, peth hynod anghyfrifol oedd peidio â datrys mater dosrannu. Ers hynny, cafodd pob awdurdod yng Nghymru anawsterau, heb allu cynllunio ar gyfer eu dyfodol o gwbl. Etifedodd yr awdurdodau tlataf ymrwymiadau gwariant a oedd yn llawer uwch na'u hasesiadau gwariant safonol ac yr oeddent yn dibynnu ar drefniadau dampio bregus, anwadal. Mae gwelliant 1 David Davies yn cynnal agwedd anghyfrifol y Ceidwadwyr yng Nghymru. Mae'n wrthwynebiad sylfaenol i'r mesur synhwyrol hwn o ailddosrannu. Wrth geisio diogelu'r ychydig gilfachau Ceidwadol sydd yn weddill yng Nghymru, ei nod yw cadw llywodraeth leol mewn sefyllfa o ansicrywydd ac anhrefn parhaol. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod gwelliant David Davies.

Cymeradwyaf yr arolwg hwn ichi. Bydd yn arwain at ailddosrannu synhwyrol a chyflawn i'r ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus o ran amddifadedd a gwledigrwydd. Nid yw'n fwriad gennyf y bydd unrhyw awdurdod ar eu colled mewn termau real, o'i gymharu â'u sefyllfa bresennol, yn sgîl gweithredu'r adolygiad hwn. Disgwyliaf i bob awdurdod lleol ddefnyddio'r fframwaith dosrannu newydd hwn er mwyn cynllunio ar gyfer eu dyfodol yn effeithiol. Cymeradwyaf fformwla newydd yr adroddiad gwariant safonol ar gyfer 2001-02 i'r Siambr heddiw.

**David Davies:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ar ôl y

the words '*National Assembly*' on line 1, delete '*approves*' and replace with '*notes the proposals for*'.

In the second line, delete '*as the method of distribution of the 2001-02 local government revenue settlement*' and replace with

*but recognises that there is still much to be done. The Assembly recognises that it would be wrong to rush through such important changes to local government finance because of political priorities and will delay the introduction of the new formula until the 2002-03 local government revenue settlement, to allow further consultation and change.*

I had hoped last year that we would never see a repeat of the fiasco of that local government settlement. Many rural authorities saw a cut in their grant because £18 million was siphoned off to bail out four local authorities that had been mismanaged by their councillors for decades. That situation was criticised at the time by the Liberal Democrats, who voted against the budget, by Labour councillors and by the local Labour Member of Parliament—Brian Gibbons, take note—in Monmouth. He was so outraged that he organised a meeting with the Secretary of State for Wales—which I attended—to complain about the situation. The Labour Secretary of State for Wales accepted that it was unfair and that it should never happen again. Please take note once again, Brian—he was your own Secretary of State for Wales. Following that debacle, as Members are well aware, I repeatedly raised the council tax formula in the Committee and in this Chamber. On numerous occasions, I was told by past and present members of this administration that the new formula would ensure a fairer settlement, and that it would take close account of the costs of delivering services in rural areas.

The formula that we are being asked to support today is fundamentally flawed. It is so flawed that even the distribution sub-group that drew it up admits its shortcomings. It also admits that regression analysis, which is the method used to calculate the formula, is not '*a perfect tool*'. In the short time that I

geiriau '*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*' yn llinell 1 dileu '*cymeradwyo*' a rhoi '*nodi'r cynigion ar gyfer*' yn ei le.

Yn yr ail linell, dileu '*fel dull dosrannu setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol 2001-02*' a rhoi'r canlynol yn ei le:

*'ond yn cydnabod bod llawer i'w wneud eto. Mae'r Cynulliad yn cydnabod y byddai'n gam gwag i ruthro i wneud y fath newidiadau pwysig i gyllid llywodraeth leol oherwydd blaenorriaethau gwleidyddol a bydd yn oedi rhag cyflwyno'r fformwla newydd tan setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol 2002-03, er mwyn rhoi digon o gyfle i ymgynghori a newid ymhellach.*

Yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y llynedd na fyddem yn gweld y fath ddryswnch byth eto wrth bennu'r setliad llywodraeth leol. Cwtogwyd grant llawer o'r awdurdodau gwledig am fod £18 miliwn wedi eu tynnu oddi wrth ynt i helpu pedwar awdurdod lleol a gamreolwyd gan eu cynghorwyr ers degawdau. Beirniadwyd y sefyllfa honno ar y pryd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a bleidleisiodd yn erbyn y gyllideb, gan gyngorwyr Llafur a chan yr Aelod Seneddol Llafur lleol—sylwer, Brian Gibbons—yn Nhrefynwy. Yr oedd wedi cynddeiriogi cymaint nes iddo drefnu cyfarfod ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru—a fynychais i—er mwyn cwyno am y sefyllfa. Derbyniodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Llafur dros Gymru ei fod yn annheg ac na ddylai ddigwydd byth eto. A wnewch nodi unwaith eto, Brian—eich Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru eich hun ydoedd. Yn dilyn y traed moch hyn, fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, codais fater fformwla'r dreth gyngor dro ar ôl tro yn y Pwyllgor a'r Siambwr hon. Dywedodd cynaelodau ac aelodau presennol o'r weinyddiaeth hon wrthyf sawl tro y byddai'r fformwla newydd yn sicrhau setliad tecach, ac y byddai'n ystyried y gost o gyflwyno gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn fanwl.

Mae'r fformwla y gofynnir inni ei chefnogi heddiw yn ddiffygol yn y bôn. Mae mor ddiffygol nes bod hyd yn oed yr is-grŵp dosbarthu a'i lluniodd yn cyfaddef bod ganddi ddiffygion. Mae hefyd yn cyfaddef nad yw dadansoddi atchwel, sef y dull a ddefnyddir i gyfrifo'r fformwla, yn 'arf

have, I will outline a few key reasons why this formula is flawed.

As I have said—and as the Minister echoed—we were led to expect a formula that would deliver fairer funding to rural areas. However, the small print shows that the weighting given to rurality has dropped from 8 per cent to 6 per cent. Rurality—

**Huw Lewis rose—**

**David Davies:** I do not want to take interventions yet because I am aware of the time.

Rurality is calculated not by the distance by road from an isolated settlement to the nearest town, but by measuring the geographical distance as the crow flies. That is absurd. Even the officials—and the Minister was at the meeting when I raised this issue—found it difficult to state why they had done that and to defend that method. They based their calculations of rurality on the notion that rural people can sprout wings and fly directly to hospitals, shops and libraries, rather than using a car to get from A to B on the road.

Criticisms of the cuts in funding to rural areas are answered by the cry that funding for deprived areas has massively increased. On the surface, it has. However, if you look again, the real picture emerges. The key to determining whether or not a household is deprived should be its income. However, that factor is not considered in making that determination. All sorts of other factors are considered—practically everything you could think of—such as the number of single parent households, the number of people on different forms of benefits, and even, I believe, the number of household utilities such as washing machines and so. However, by not considering average incomes, areas where many people are struggling on low incomes but are not getting benefits—as is happening in many rural areas—are effectively discounted from their fair share of the money.

In calculating deprivation, the final formula

berffaith'. Yn yr ychydig amser sydd gennyf, nodaf ychydig o resymau allweddol pam bod y fformwla hon yn ddiffygiol.

Fel y dywedais—ac fel yr ategodd y Gweinidog—cawsom yr argraff y caem fformwla a fyddai'n darparu swm tecach o arian i ardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, dengys y manylion fod y pwysoliad a roddir ar gyfer gwledigrwydd wedi gostwng o 8 y cant i 6 y cant. Gwledigrwydd—

**Huw Lewis a gododd—**

**David Davies:** Nid wyf am gymryd ymyriadau yn awr am fy mod yn ymwybodol bod amser yn brin.

Ni chyfrifir gwledigrwydd yn ôl y pellter o anheddwa anghysbell i'r dref agosaf ar hyd y ffordd, ond drwy fesur y pellter daearyddol uniongyrchol. Mae hynny'n hurt. Yr oedd hyd yn oed y swyddogion—ac yr oedd y Gweinidog yn y cyfarfod pan godais y mater hwn—yn ei chael yn anodd egluro pam eu bod wedi gwneud hynny ac i amddiffyn y dull hwnnw. Seiliwyd eu cyfrifiadau o wledigrwydd ar y syniad bod pobl wledig yn gallu tyfu adenydd a hedfan yn uniongyrchol i ysbytai, siopau a llyfrgelloedd yn hytrach na defnyddio car i deithio o A i B ar y ffordd.

Pan feirniedir y toriadau yn arian yr ardaloedd gwledig taerir bod yr arian ar gyfer ardaloedd difreintiedig wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Mae wedi cynyddu, ar yr wyneb. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwrh eto, daw'r gwir ddarlun i'r golwg. Dylid defnyddio incwm teulu yn sail i benderfynu a yw'n ddifreintiedig ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, nid ystyrir y ffactor hwnnw wrth wneud y cyfryw benderfyniad. Ystyrir pob math o ffactorau eraill—bron pob un y gallwrh ei nodi—megis nifer y teuluoedd â rhiant sengl, y nifer o bobl ar wahanol fathau o fudd-daliadau, a hyd yn oed, fe gredaf, faint o gyfarpar sydd yn y ty megis peirannau golchi ac ati. Fodd bynnag, drwy beidio ag ystyrified cyfartaledd incwm, caiff ardaloedd lle y caiff llawer o bobl anhawster wrth geisio byw ar incwm isel heb fudd-daliadau—fel sydd yn digwydd mewn nifer o'r ardaloedd gwledig—eu hamddifadu o'u cyfran deg o'r arian.

Wrth gyfrifo amddifadedd, caiff y fformwla

will therefore be skewed in favour of the south Wales urban Labour strongholds. That is unacceptable. It is appropriate that, on Halloween, this administration wants to play its own game of trick or treat. It is tricking areas such as Monmouthshire out of what is rightfully theirs to treat its strongholds in the Valleys.

The one thing that has not been considered is coyly alluded to in this document. We are informed that different levels of efficiency are common to all authorities. In other words, some local authorities are more efficient than others. That is news to none of us. However, we have a right to know which local authorities are less efficient than others. We have a right to ask why questions are not being asked about inefficient local authorities, whose profligacy is causing well-run areas to suffer. Why does rural Monmouthshire spend only £16.88 per household on rubbish collection, while, just up the road, the more urban area of Merthyr Tydfil spends well over twice as much? I am happy to give way to the Member for that constituency now if he wishes to intervene.

**Huw Lewis:** Thank you, David. You are, if nothing else, a good sport when it comes to interventions.

What is your definition of rural? I think that the people of Anglesey, Gwynedd, Conwy and Pembrokeshire would be surprised to learn that, given the enormous amount of extra spending per head—an extra £15 per head in Pembrokeshire, and an extra £37 per head on the Isle of Anglesey—they are being done down by an urban conspiracy.

**David Davies:** There are many rural areas around Wales, for example, Brecon and Radnorshire, which will loose out as a result of how this formula was calculated.

**Kirsty Williams** rose—

**David Davies:** I will give way in a minute, although you are not a good sport when it comes to interventions.

**The Presiding Officer:** I point out to David

derfynol, felly, ei gwyro o blaid cadarnleoedd trefol Llafur yn ne Cymru. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Mae'n briodol bod y weinyddiaeth hon, ar Nos Galan Gaeaf, am chwarae ei gêm ei hun o gast ynteu ceiniog. Mae'n chwarae cast ar ardaloedd megis Sir Fynwy drwy eu hamddifadu o'u gwir haeddiant er mwyn rhoi'r geiniog i'w chadarnleoedd yn y Cymoedd.

Mae'r ddogfen hon yn cynnwys ryw led-awgrym at un mater nas ystyriwyd. Gwyddys fod gan bob awdurdod wahanol lefelau o effeithlonrwydd. Hynny yw, mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn fwy effeithlon nag eraill. Nid yw hynny'n syndod i'r un ohonom. Fodd bynnag, mae hawl gennym wybod pa awdurdodau lleol sydd yn llai effeithlon nag eraill. Mae hawl gennym i ofyn pam na ofynnir cwestiynau am awdurdodau lleol aneffeithlon, y mae eu hafradlondeb wedi peri i ardaloedd a weinyddir yn dda dioddef. Pam bod Sir Fynwy wledig ond yn gwario £16.88 y tî ar gasglu sbwriel, tra bod ardal fwy trefol gyfagos Merthyr Tudful yn gwario ymhell dros ddwywaith cymaint? Yr wyf yn fodlon ildio i'r Aelod dros yr etholaeth honno yn awr os mymuna ymyrryd.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch yn fawr, David. Chwarae teg ichi, yr ydych bob amser yn hael o ran ymyriadau, os dim byd arall.

Beth yw eich diffiniad o wledig? Credaf y byddai pobl Ynys Môn, Gwynedd, Conwy a Sir Benfro yn synnu wrth glywed eu bod, o ystyried y swm enfawr o wariant ychwanegol fesul pen—£15 y pen yn ychwanegol yn Sir Benfro, a £37 y pen yn ychwanegol ar Ynys Môn—yn dioddef oherwydd rhyw gynllwyn trefol.

**David Davies:** Mae llawer o ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru, er enghraifft, Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, a fydd ar eu colled o ganlyniad i'r ffordd y cyfrifwyd y fformwla hon.

**Kirsty Williams** a gododd—

**David Davies:** Fe ildiaf mewn munud, er nad ydych yn chwarae'n deg o ran ymyriadau.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnaf sylw David at y ffaith

that he has had the standard five minutes for speaking to an amendment, so I am being generous.

**David Davies:** In that case, I will not take any further interventions. I am sorry, Kirsty.

Let nobody be fooled that the dampening scheme that is being introduced will limit the rises, because it will do so only to some extent this year. However, in the following years, the same rises will apply.

Ni fydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn derbyn y fformwla newydd gan ein bod am sicrhau chwarae teg i ardaloedd cefn gwlad. Nid yw hon yn fformwla deg. Mae'n drwydded i gymryd arian o gefn gwlad i'r Cymoedd bob blwyddyn.

4.05 p.m.

We hope that even at this late stage, the Liberal Democrats will remember that while they now have obligations to the Government of Wales, they have a higher obligation to the people whom they claim to represent. We hope that they will support us, along, I hope, with the Welsh Nationalist Party, in saying to the Executive today that we reject this motion. We want it returned to the distribution sub-group and rewritten so that it properly reflects everybody's needs in Wales.

**Janet Davies:** Point of order. David Davies called us the Welsh Nationalist Party. We expect to be called Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. I do not call the Members over there Tories, however much I would like to do so. I expect them to respect us.

**David Davies:** Further to that point of order, I have been quite happy to refer to you as Plaid Cymru in the past. However, this afternoon I heard members of your group referring to us as the Tory party. You cannot have it both ways. We are the Welsh Conservative Party. You start calling us the Welsh Conservative Party and I will stop calling you the nationalists.

iddo gael y pum munud safonol ar gyfer siarad ar welliant, felly yr wyf innau wedi bod yn hael.

**David Davies:** Os felly, ni chymeraf unrhyw ymyriad pellach. Mae'n ddrwg gennylf, Kirsty.

Ni ddylai neb ei dwyllo ei hun y bydd y cynllun dampio a gyflwynir yn cyfyngu ar y codiadau, gan y bydd yn gwneud hynny i ryw raddau eleni. Fodd bynnag, yn y blynnyddoedd dilynol, bydd yr un codiadau yn berthnasol.

The Conservative Party will not accept the new formula because we want to ensure fair play for rural areas. This is not a fair formula. It is a licence to take money every year from rural areas to the Valleys.

Gobeithiwn hyd yn oed ar yr adeg hon, y bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cofio, er gwaethaf yr ymrwymiadau sydd ganddynt bellach i Lywodraeth Cymru, fod ganddynt ymrwymiad pwysicach i'r bobl yr honnant eu cynrychioli. Gobeithiwn y byddant yn ein cefnogi ni, ynghyd â Plaid Genedlaethol Cymru, gobeithio, wrth ddweud wrth y Weithrediaeth heddiw ein bod yn gwrthod y cynnig hwn. Yr ydym am iddo gael ei ddychwelyd i'r is-grŵp dosbarthu a'i ailsgrifennu fel y bo'n adlewyrchu anghenion pawb yng Nghymru yn briodol.

**Janet Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Cyfeiriodd David Davies atom fel Plaid Genedlaethol Cymru. Disgwylawn inni gael yn galw yn Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Ni alwaf yr Aelodau acw yn Dorïaid, er cymaint yr hoffwn wneud hynny. Disgwyliaf iddynt hwythau ein parchu ni.

**David Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Yr oeddwn yn holol fodlon cyfeirio atoch fel Plaid Cymru yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, y prynhawn yma, clywais aelodau o'ch grŵp yn cyfeirio atom fel y blaids Dorïaidd. Ni allwch ei chael bob ffordd. Plaid Geidwadol Cymru ydym ni. Os dechreuwch chi ein galw ni yn Blaid Geidwadol Cymru rhoddaf finnau'r gorau i'ch galw yn genedlaetholwyr.

**The Presiding Officer.** Order. I hope that this is the last occasion that I will visit the question of names of parties. It has surfaced many times recently. In this Chamber, parties call themselves by their registered name and Members should refer to them by their registered names.

I call on Janet Ryder to propose the second and third amendment in the name of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales.

**Janet Ryder:** I propose amendment 2. Add at the end of the motion

*acknowledges the importance of this revised formula as a small measure towards the redistribution of wealth and the achievement of social justice in Wales and its potential as a tool to rectify the appalling lack of investment in our communities over recent decades;*

*acknowledges that deprivation is not confined to urban areas alone but that many rural communities also suffer from poverty. Similarly, many urban communities suffer from difficulties in service delivery and access to services;*

*notes that insufficient data is available to produce many statistically based indicators, the paucity of ward-level data which could reveal rural and urban pockets of deprivation within more affluent areas and data for personal social services;*

*acknowledges that a year on year change to the standard spending assessment formula would result in instability for local government;*

*notes that the distribution sub-group of the Consultative Forum on Finance (a Partnership Council working group) recommended that they take work forward with a view to including it into the formula at a later date;*

*resolves to set a review date of May 2003. This review to consider how best to incorporate new data available and refinements to the formula that this may*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gobeithiaf mai hwn fydd yr achlysur olaf imi drafod mater enwau'r pleidiau. Mae wedi codi sawl gwaith yn ddiweddar. Yn y Siambwr hon, geilw'r pleidiau eu hunain wrth eu henw cofrestredig a dylai'r Aelodau gyfeirio atynt wrth eu henwau cofrestredig.

Galwaf ar Janet Ryder i gynnig yr ail a'r trydydd gwelliant yn enw Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales.

**Janet Ryder:** Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegar ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw'r fformwla ddiwygiedig fel cam bach tuag at ailddosbarthu cyfoeth a chael cyflawnder cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, a'i botensial i wneud iawn am y diffyg buddsoddiad dybryd yn ein cymunedau yn ystod y degawdau diwethaf;*

*cydnabod nad rhywbeth i ardaloedd trefol yn unig yw amddifadedd, ond bod cymunedau gwledig hefyd yn dioddef oddi wrth dodi. Yn yr un modd, mae nifer o gymunedau trefol yn dioddef anawsterau o ran cael gwasanaethau a medru mynd at wasanaethau;*

*cydnabod nad oes digon o ddata ar gael i lunio mynegeion ystadegol, bod prinder data am y gwahanol wardiau a allai ddatgelu pocedi o amddifadedd mewn ardaloedd mwy cefnog yng nghefn gwlad ac mewn trefi, a data ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol personol;*

*cydnabod y byddai newid fformwla yr asesiad safonol o wariant o un flywyddyn i'r llall yn golygu ansefydlogrwydd i lywodraeth leol;*

*nodi bod is-grŵp dosbarthu y Fforwm Ymgynghorol ar Gyllid (gweithgor Cyngor Partneriaeth) wedi argymhell eu bod yn bwrw'r gwaith ymlaen gyda gohwg ar ei gynnwys yn y fformwla yn nes ymlaen.;*

*penderfynu gosod dyddiad adolygu ym mis Mai 2003. Bydd yr adolygiad yn ystyried sut orau i ymgorffori'r data newydd sydd ar gael ac unrhyw welliannau i'r fformwla a allai fod*

suggest as possible and desirable.

I also propose amendment 3. Add at the end of the motion

*acknowledges that without transitional arrangements there will be a need for some councils to make significant reductions in their spending or significantly increase council taxes this year; and*

*accepts that transitional arrangements will be required in order to implement the new formula successfully.*

*These transitional arrangements should be funded in addition to the rates support grant and sets aside £11 million in 2001-02 for this purpose.*

During the initial debate on this formula in July, Peter Law, the former Secretary for Local Government said:

‘The Assembly will have further opportunity to debate the proposals in the light of responses to the consultation, ahead of consideration by the Partnership Council this autumn’.

No debate was held prior to consideration by the Partnership Council this autumn. The date of this debate was delayed and one is left wondering why. Was it to allow the draft budget to be announced last week? Whatever the reasons, we are at last debating this new formula for the distribution of the revenue support grant to local authorities.

All that any formula can do is to distribute the resources available. It cannot address the problems caused by the lack of adequate resources made available to local government over many years nor the unacceptably high gearing impact on council tax levels. Recognition should be given, as has been said, to the individual members of the distribution sub-group for their contributions to a difficult task. They undertook a piece of work in a comparatively short timescale and their achievement must be recognised.

The formula is a distribution mechanism

*yn bosibl ac yn ddymunol.*

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 3. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*cydnabod, heb drefniadau trosiannol, y bydd angen i rai cyngorau gwtogi'n sylweddol ar eu gwariant neu gynyddu trethi'r cyngor yn sylweddol eleni; ac*

*yn derbyn y bydd angen trefniadau trosiannol er mwyn gweithredu'r fformwla newydd yn llwyddiannus;*

*Dylai'r trefniadau trosiannol hyn gael eu hariannu yn ychwanegol i'r grant cynnal trethi ac yn rhoi £11 miliwn o'r neilltu yn 2001-02 at y diben hwn.*

Yn ystod y ddadl gychwynnol ar y fformwla hon ym mis Gorffennaf, dywedodd Peter Law, y cyn-Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol:

‘Bydd gan y Cynulliad gyfle pellach i drafod y cynigion wedi derbyn ymatebion i'r ymgynhoriad, cyn i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth ystyried y mater yr hydref hwn’.

Ni chynhalwyd dadl cyn i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth eu ystyried yn yr hydref eleni. Gohiriwyd dyddiad y ddadl hon ac mae rhywun yn gofyn pam. Ai'r rheswm oedd caniatáu i'r gyllideb ddraft gael ei chyhoeddi yr wythnos diwethaf? Beth bynnag fo'r rhesymau, yr ydym o'r diwedd yn trafod y fformwla newydd hon ar gyfer dosrannu'r grant cymorth refeniw i'r awdurdodau lleol.

Y cyfan y gall unrhyw fformwla ei gyflawni yw dosrannu'r adnoddau sydd ar gael. Ni all fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a achoswyd oherwydd y diffyg adnoddau digonol a gafodd llywodraeth leol dros flynyddoedd lawer na'r effaith lywio ar lefelau'r dreth gyngor sydd yn annerbyniol o uchel. Dylid cydnabod, fel y dywedwyd, yr aelodau unigol o'r is-grŵp dosrannu am eu cyfraniadau at dasg anodd. Ymgymerasant â darn o waith mewn cyfnod cymharol fyr a rhaid cydnabod eu llwyddiant.

Mae'r fformwla yn ddull dosrannu yn hytrach

rather than an assessment of need. It could be said that no formula could realistically be expected to reflect the spending needs of 22 local authorities and that this new formula presents an improvement over the present formula. It will work in a small way towards the redistribution of wealth and the achievement of social justice in Wales. It also has the potential to be used as a tool to rectify the appalling lack of investment in our communities over recent decades.

The devastating effect of 18 years of Conservative Party rule—

**Glyn Davies:** Welsh Conservatives.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. As far as I am aware, the Welsh Conservatives have not yet ruled.

**Janet Ryder:** Nevertheless, the effect of 18 years of devastating attacks by that party on public spending and public services left local government starved of resources to provide adequate levels of services and will take many years to rectify. Combined with this was an inadequate and badly thought-out reorganisation of local government, the funding of which required a transitional mechanism throughout its lifetime.

Many hoped that the advent of a Labour Government at Westminster would herald a new era for local government. Instead we have seen a continued attack on the freedom of local government to meet the needs that it has identified within its own communities. This attack has taken the form of increased hypothecation, or in simpler terms, central dictation to locally elected members as to how they should spend the moneys available to them.

The new formula does not address this problem. All that is achieved by this motion is to set in place a mechanism for the distribution of those funds to local government. I note that according to the draft budget that was announced last week, more money will be available to local authorities. However, the amount of freedom that will be given to local authorities to spend that money was not shown. I look forward to a debate in

nag asesiad o angen. Gellid dweud na ellid disgwyl i unrhyw fformwla adlewyrchu anghenion gwario 22 o awdurdodau lleol yn ymarferol a bod y fformwla newydd hon yn well na'r fformwla gyfredol. Bydd yn helpu i ryw raddau tuag at aillodosrannu cyfoeth a chael cyflawnder cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae potensial iddi hefyd gael ei defnyddio i wneud iawn am y diffyg buddsoddi dybryd yn ein cymunedau yn ystod y degawdau diweddar.

Mae effaith ddybryd 18 mlynedd o lywodraeth y Blaid Geidwadol—

**Glyn Davies:** Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hyd y gwn i ni fu'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig erioed mewn grym.

**Janet Ryder:** Eto i gyd, mae'r effaith a gafodd 18 mlynedd o ymosodiadau dybryd gan y blaid honno ar wariant cyhoeddus a'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn golygu bod llywodraeth leol wedi ei hamddifadu o adnoddau ar gyfer darparu lefelau priodol o wasanaethau ac y bydd yn cymryd blynnyddoedd lawer i'w unioni. Ar yr un pryd bu ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol annigonol a gynlluniwyd yn wael, yr oedd ei ariannu yn gofyn am ddull trosiannol drwy gydol ei oes.

Gobeithiai llawer y byddai dyfodiad Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan yn esgor ar oes newydd ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Yn lle hynny cawsom ymosodiad di-baid ar ryddid llywodraeth leol i fodloni'r anghenion a nododd o fewn eu cymunedau eu hunain. Bu'r ymosodiad hwn ar ffurf pridiant cynyddol, neu yn symlach, gorchmyntion canolog i aelodau etholedig lleol ynghylch sut y dylent wario'r arian sydd ar gael iddynt.

Nid yw'r fformwla newydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon. Y cyfan a gyflenwa'r cynnig hwn yw sefydlu dull ar gyfer dosrannu'r arian hwnnw i lywodraeth leol. Nodaf y bydd rhagor o arian ar gael i awdurdodau lleol yn ôl y gyllideb ddrafft a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, ni nodir pa ryddid a gaiff yr awdurdodau lleol i wario'r arian hwnnw. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddadl yn y Pwyllgor ar yr

Committee on that aspect.

If it was hoped that by delaying this debate for a week until after the announcement of the draft budget it would be accepted per se then, I am sorry, it will not. As it stands, the motion fails to address some of the problems that have come to light during the consultation period and it does not openly recognise the need for a transitional scheme. Edwina has acknowledged it today but we feel that it should have been included in the motion.

In the debate in July I said that for the consultation to be meaningful the responses had to be taken into account. I am pleased that some of these responses have been included. This is not the formula that was originally debated. A number of points that Plaid Cymru sought to include in the original motion, which have all been highlighted in various responses in the consultation process, have not appeared in this final version. This has led to the amendments that I propose today.

Janet Davies will expand on the issue of deprivation in urban and rural areas, but I would like to mention the major problem regarding the paucity of some of the statistics. This new formula should have given a statistical distribution of revenue, but because of the lack of data in some areas, it still had to rely on subjective decisions. That is a cause for concern. This consultation exercise has shown the need for further analysis and data gathering.

It is still not possible to produce either ward-based statistics or per-head costings of service delivery. Given the serious deficiencies that remain in the proposed formula, Plaid Cymru calls for a further review. The aim of this review would be to produce a more credible, robust formula within the next two to three years by undertaking fundamental statistical analysis work. This could be done in two ways, either by using the new local government statistics unit, which I understand will have a service level agreement with the National Assembly, or by commissioning outside consultants

agwedd honno.

Os mai'r gobaith oedd y cai ei dderbyn pe bai'r ddadl hon yn cael ei gohирio tan yr wythnos ar ôl cyhoeddi'r gyllideb ddrafft, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni chaiff. Fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r cynnig yn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau a ddaeth i'r golwg yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghorol ac nid yw'n cydnabod yn agored bod angen cynllun trosiannol. Cydnabu Edwina hynny heddiw ond yr ydym o'r farn y dylid bod wedi ei gynnwys yn y cynnig.

Yn y ddadl ym mis Gorffennaf dywedais fod yn rhaid ystyried yr atebion er mwyn i'r ymgynghoriad fod yn ystyrlon. Mae'n dda gennyf nodi bod rhai o'r ymatebion hyn wedi eu cynnwys. Nid y fformwla a drafodwyd yn wreiddiol yw hon. Ni chynhwyswyd nifer o bwyntiau yr oedd Plaid Cymru yn ceisio eu cynnwys yn y cynnig gwreiddiol, y nodwyd pob un ohonynt mewn ymatebion gwahanol yn y broses ymgynghori, yn y fersiwn derfynol hon. Mae hyn wedi arwain at y gwelliannau a gynigiaf heddiw.

Bydd Janet Davies yn ymhelaethu ar fater amddifadedd mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig, ond hoffwn sôn am y brif broblem o ran prinder rhai o'r ystadegau. Dylai'r fformwla newydd hon fod wedi rhoi dosraniad refeniw ystadegol, ond oherwydd diffyg data mewn rhai meysydd, bu'n rhaid iddi ddibynnu ar benderfyniadau goddrychol o hyd. Mae hynny'n achos pryder. Dangosodd yr ymarfer ymgynghori hwn fod angen dadansoddi a chasglu gwybodaeth ymhellach.

Nid oes modd o hyd i gynhyrchu naill ai ystadegau yn seiliedig ar wardiau neu gost y pen ar gyfer cyflwyno gwasanaethau. O ystyried y diffygion difrifol sydd gan y fformwla arfaethedig o hyd, mae Plaid Cymru yn galw am adolygiad pellach. Nod yr adolygiad hwn fyddai llunio fformwla fwy credadwy, gadarn yn ystod y ddwy neu dair blynedd nesaf drwy ymgymryd â gwaith dadansoddi ystadegol sylfaenol. Gellid gwneud hyn mewn dwy ffordd, naill ai drwy ddefnyddio'r uned ystadegau llywodraeth leol newydd, y bydd ganddi gytundeb lefel gwasanaeth â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol,

such as the present review that was carried out by Pion Economics and the University of Wales Swansea. The distribution sub-group would still play a leading role in this formula's development by commissioning, monitoring and assessing the work of the independent agent. Either of these paths will require additional and adequate funding. The Minister for Local Government and Communities could practice building her Chinese walls as she argues with herself, as the Minister for Finance, for the extra funding.

During the debate in July, Peter Law accepted Plaid Cymru's amendment to set a timescale for the collection of data and said that that would be helpful. He said,

'By setting a target date we will signal to local authorities that we are serious about our intention to collect more robust data in the future. Some of the statistical work for the review has been hampered by the lack of adequate information so we must address this information deficit.'

Bearing that statement in mind, I look forward to the coalition Government coming forward with a timescale and framework for this review after it accepts this amendment.

Whichever route is chosen, a clear timetable needs to be set. This has led to the inclusion in the amendment of a review date of May 2003. That would seem to meet the timescale of much of the further work deemed necessary by the ad hoc group on transitional arrangements. It would be detrimental to local government funding to be subjected to continuous change and it would not be acceptable to put a formula in place without setting a review date. We propose a sensible interval for a review, which will allow local authorities to plan ahead while making provision for new data to be incorporated into the formula. Ironically, that was the idea behind this present review; to produce a scientific method of distributing the revenue formula and to introduce it in one go. That has not been achieved and there is still much

deallaf, neu drwy gomisiynu ymgynghorwyr allanol fel yr adolygiad presennol a wnaethpwyd gan Pion Economics a Phrifysgol Cymru Abertawe. Byddai'r is-grŵp dosrannu yn parhau i chwarae rôl amlwg wrth ddatblygu'r fformwla hon drwy gomisiynu, monitro ac asesu gwaith yr asiant annibynnol. Byddai angen arian ychwanegol a digonol ar y naill lwybr a'r llall. Gallai'r Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ymarfer adeiladu ei muriau diadlam wrth iddi ddadlau â hi ei hun, fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, am arian ychwanegol.

Yn ystod y ddadl ym mis Gorffennaf, derbyniodd Peter Law welliant Plaid Cymru i bennu amserlen ar gyfer casglu data a dywedodd y byddai'n ddefnyddiol. Dywedodd,

'Drwy bennu dyddiad targed byddwn yn rhoi arwydd i awdurdodau lleol ein bod o ddifrif an ein bwriad i gasglu data mwy cadarn i'r dyfodol. Llesteiriwyd peth o'r gwaith ystadegol ar gyfer yr adolygiad oherwydd diffyg gwybodaeth ddigonol felly mae'n rhaid inni roi sylw i'r diffyg gwybodaeth hwn.'

O ystyried y datganiad hwnnw, edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Llywodraeth glymbiaid yn cynnig amserlen a fframwaith ar gyfer yr adolygiad hwn ar ôl iddi dderbyn y gwelliant.

Pa lwybr bynnag a ddewisir, mae angen pennu amserlen glir. Arweiniodd hyn at gynnwys dyddiad adolygiad yn y gwelliant sef Mai 2003. Ymddengys y byddai hynny'n cyd-fynd â'r amserlen ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o'r gwaith ychwanegol sydd yn angenrheidiol yn nhyb y grŵp ad hoc ar gyfer trefniadau trosiannol. Byddai'n niweidiol pe bai arian llywodraeth leol yn amrywio drwy'r amser ac ni fyddai'n dderbyniol llunio fformwla heb bennu dyddiad adolygiad. Cynigiwn gyfnod synhwyrol ar gyfer adolygiad, a fydd yn caniatáu i'r awdurdodau lleol gynllunio ymlaen llaw tra'n darparu ar gyfer y data newydd a gaiff ei ymgorfod yn y fformwla. Yn eironig ddigon, dyna pam y sefydlwyd yr adolygiad presennol hwn, sef cael dull gwydonol o ddosrannu'r fformwla refeniw

work to be done.

As was said in the original debate on the formula in July, any new formula will produce winners and losers, causing some councils to make significant reductions in their spending and/or significant increases in council tax in one year. To implement this formula successfully, some transitional arrangements need to be made. This was the conclusion of the ad hoc group. We agree with it and Edwina has acknowledged it. I note that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities intends to only provide transitional arrangements for three counties. That is not acceptable.

It has been acknowledged in the draft budget that some transitional arrangement is necessary but even given the increase in money that appears to be available to councils, Plaid Cymru does not think it sufficient. The amount that appears in the draft budget is added to the overall amount available to councils as their revenue support grant. I acknowledge that, given the way the budget was presented, it is hard to show this and set it out clearly. However, it needs to be clearly shown that any transitional money is additional to any revenue support grant allocated to local government. That is what has led to my amendment 3.

4.15 p.m.

We do not find David Davies's amendment 1 acceptable because it would merely note the work done on the formula and seek to delay its implementation. Any new formula will create winners and losers. It is important that adequate transitional mechanisms are in place to ensure that councils can adjust their budgets accordingly.

Plaid Cymru strongly believes that for the formula to be fully acceptable, it must address the deficiency in data. To facilitate that, a framework and timescale for a further review needs to be developed as a matter of

a'i chyflwyno ar yr un pryd. Ni chyflawnwyd hynny ac mae llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd.

Fel y dywedwyd yn y ddadl wreiddiol ar y fformwla ym mis Gorffennaf, golyga unrhyw fformwla newydd y bydd rhai ar eu hennill a rhai ar eu colled, gan beri i rai cynghorau ostwng eu gwariant a/neu gynyddu'r dreth gyngor yn sylweddol mewn blwyddyn. Er mwyn gweithredu'r fformwla hon yn llwyddiannus, mae angen gwneud rhai trefniadau trosiannol. Dyma gasgliad y grŵp ad hoc. Cytunwn ag ef ac mae Edwina wedi ei gydnabod. Nodaf mai dim ond ar gyfer tair sir y mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn bwriadu darparu trefniadau trosiannol. Nid yw hynny'n dderbynol.

Cydnabuwyd yn y gyllideb ddrafft bod angen rhyw fath o drefniant trosiannol ond hyd yn oed ar ôl ystyried y cynnydd yn yr arian sydd ar gael i'r cynghorau, yn ôl pob tebyg, mae Plaid Cymru o'r farn nad yw'n ddigonol. Ychwanegir y swm sydd yn y gyllideb ddrafft at y swm cyffredinol sydd ar gael i'r cynghorau fel eu grant cymorth refeniu. Cydnabyddaf, o ystyried y ffordd y cyflwynwyd y gyllideb, ei bod yn anodd dangos hyn a'i nodi'n glir. Fodd bynnag, mae angen nodi'n glir bod unrhyw arian trosiannol yn ychwanegol at unrhyw grant cymorth refeniu a ddosrennir i lywodraeth leol. Dyna'r rheswm dros fy ngwelliant 3.

Nid yw gwelliant 1 David Davies yn dderbynol inni gan mai dim ond nodi'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd ar y fformwla a cheisio gohirio ei rhoi ar waith y byddai'r gwelliant hwn. Bydd unrhyw fformwla newydd yn golygu bod rhai ar eu hennill a rhai ar eu colled. Mae'n bwysig bod dulliau trosiannol digonol yn barod er mwyn sicrhau y gall cynghorau addasu eu cyllidebau yn unol â hyn.

Mae Plaid Cymru o'r farn bendant bod rhaid i'r fformwla fynd i'r afael â'r prinder data er mwyn bod yn gwbl dderbynol. Er mwyn hwyluso hynny, mae angen datblygu fframwaith ac amserlen ar gyfer adolygiad

urgency. Also, to implement the formula successfully an adequately funded transitional mechanism must be put in place. For those reasons, if our amendments are not adopted, we cannot support the motion.

**Peter Black:** How local government funding is distributed is fundamental to the Assembly's agenda of tackling poverty, delivering sustainable development and ensuring inclusiveness in Wales. I believe that common ground exists among the majority of the Members, and certainly among those in local government, in agreeing that the current formula has had its day. It not only penalises councils with some of the worst problems and the lowest council tax bases, but fails to reflect the social and economic geography of Wales. That we have had what amounts to a permanent damping scheme since 1996 illustrates that that formula has become unsustainable.

Whatever happens, we cannot have a repeat of the local government settlement last year, when councils and politicians were at each other's throats over how the damping scheme was implemented. In recent weeks I have said, and I repeat it now, that the new funding formula is not robust. That is not just my opinion. In its report and following the consultation exercise, the distribution sub-group highlights the need for further work. That work includes highways data, the collection of further indicators at school level, the development of an improved measure of enhanced population, the use of Best Value data, ward level data for social services, the use of 2001 census data and much more. All of these data are fundamental to the new formula's effectiveness. The WLGA has accepted this, but has taken the view that despite the problems, the new formula is still better than the existing one.

The Liberal Democrat group's view is that we must progress. If we are serious about tackling the many inequalities in Wales, we must recognise that local councils are the best vehicle for delivering the policies that will do that. Their funding, therefore, must reflect

pellach fel mater o frys. Hefyd, er mwyn gweithredu'r fformwla yn llwyddiannus rhaid sefydlu dull trosiannol a ariennir yn ddigonol. Am y rhesymau hynny, os na chaiff ein gwelliannau eu mabwysiadu, ni allwn gefnogi'r cynnig.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r ffodd y caiff arian llywodraeth leol ei ddosrannu yn rhan hanfodol o agenda'r Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â thlodi, cyflwyno datblygu cynaliadwy a sierhau cynhwysiant yng Nghymru. Credaf fod tir cyffredin rhwng y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau ac yn sicr rhwng y rhai sydd mewn llywodraeth leol, wrth gytuno bod y fformwla gyfredol wedi darfod arni. Mae nid yn unig yn cosbi'r cyngorau sydd yn dioddef y problemau mwyaf dybryd ac sydd â'r sylfeini treth gyngor isaf, ond yn methu ag adlewyrchu daearyddiaeth gymdeithasol ac economaidd Cymru. Dengys y ffaith y bu gennym gynnllun dampio parhaol i bob diben ers 1996 nad yw'r fformwla honno yn un y gellir ei chynnal bellach.

Beth bynnag a ddigwydd, ni allwn gael setliad llywodraeth leol fel yr un y llynedd, pan oedd cyngorau a gwleidyddion wrth yddfau'i gilydd ynghylch sut y rhoddwyd y cynllun dampio ar waith. Yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, dywedais, a dywedaf eto yn awr, nad yw'r fformwla ariannu newydd yn un gadarn. Nid fy marn i yn unig ydyw. Nododd yr is-grŵp dosrannu yn ei adroddiad ac yn dilyn yr ymarfer ymgynghori fod angen gwaith pellach. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn cwmpasu data am briffyrrd, casglu dangosyddion pellach ar lefel ysgolion, datblygu mesur gwell o boblogaethau uwch, defnyddio data Gwerth Gorau, data ar lefel wardiau ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, defnyddio data cyfrifiad 2001 a llawer mwy. Mae'r holl ddata hwn yn hanfodol i effeithiolrwydd y fformwla newydd. Derbyniodd CLILC hyn, ond mae o'r farn bod y fformwla newydd yn dal i fod yn well na'r un bresennol er gwaethaf y problemau.

Ym marn grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol rhaid inni symud ymlaen. Os ydym o ddifrif o ran mynd i'r afael â'r anghyfiawnderau niferus yng Nghymru, rhaid inni gydnabod mai'r cyngorau lleol yw'r cyfrwng gorau i gyflwyno'r polisiau a fydd yn gwneud hynny.

their need. We should accept the WLGA's view that the new distribution formula is needed but must be amended as the new data becomes available to ensure that it becomes more robust over time.

Having accepted that, the questions of implementation and timing remain. If we are to introduce this new formula, the next financial year is the optimum time to do so. The new partnership administration had already taken on board the view of Liberal Democrats and others that in introducing the formula we should seek to minimise its impact on those who will lose out as a result. Any formula is just another way of distributing scarce resources. It is inevitable that there will be winners and losers. Our job is to ensure that we help the losers to adjust as best we can. The 8 per cent extra funding for local government next year is the best settlement for Welsh councils since the mid-1980s. It means that we can give local government the opportunity to expand services while keeping council tax increases to a minimum. Those going around Wales shouting about double figure council tax increases have been shown to be no more than scaremongers. Despite the new formula, we will be able keep the maximum council tax increase to no more than 9 per cent, with the vast majority of councils well below that.

While this money is available, we have an opportunity to minimise the formula's impact. In future years, it may not be. If we adopt David Davies's amendment 1 and delay the implementation, the impact on councils such as Monmouthshire will be greater and there is no guarantee that by 2002-03, as stipulated by David, the formula will be substantially any more robust than it is at present.

I have much sympathy with Janet Ryder's amendments. Her amendment 2 reflects very much what I have already said. However, the WLGA has asked that we retain an element of flexibility regarding the new data, and it is right that if data becomes available that will make a significant difference, then we should

Rhaid bod eu harian, felly, yn adlewyrchu eu hangen. Dylem dderbyn barn CLILC bod angen fformwla ddosrannu newydd ond rhaid ei newid wrth i ddata newydd fod ar gael er mwyn sicrhau y bydd yn gadarnach gyda threigl amser.

Wedi derbyn hynny, mae materion yn ymwneud â gweithredu ac amseru o hyd. Os bwriadwn gyflwyno'r fformwla newydd hon, yr adeg orau i wneud hyn fydd yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Mae gweinyddiaeth y bartneriaeth newydd eisoes wedi ystyried barn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac eraill y dylem geisio, wrth gyflwyno'r fformwla, leihau i'r eithaf unrhyw effaith a gaiff ar y rhai a fydd ar eu colled o'r herwydd. Dim ond ffordd arall o ddosrannu adnoddau prin yw unrhyw fformwla. Mae'n anochel y bydd rhai ar eu hennill a rhai ar eu colled. Ein gwaith ni yw sicrhau y gallwn helpu'r rhai ar eu colled i ymaddasu gorau y gallwn. Yr 8 y cant o arian ychwanegol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol y flwyddyn nesaf yw'r setliad gorau a gafodd cynghorau Cymru ers canol yr 1980au. Golyga y gallwn roi'r cyfle i lywodraeth leol ehangu gwasanaethau tra'n lleihau'r cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor i'r eithaf. Dangoswyd bod y rhai sydd wedi mynd o amgylch Cymru dan weiddi y byddai'r dreth gyngor yn cynyddu mewn rhifau dwbl ond wedi bod yn codi bwganod. Er gwaethaf y fformwla newydd, gallwn sicrhau na fydd y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yn uwch na 9 y cant, gyda mwyafir llethol y cynghorau dipyn yn is na hynny.

Tra bod yr arian hwn ar gael, mae gennym gyfle i leihau effaith y fformwla i'r eithaf. Yn y dyfodol, hwyrach na fydd gennym. Os mabwysiadwn welliant 1 David Davies a gohirio ei gweithredu, bydd yr effaith ar gynghorau megis Sir Fynwy yn fwy ac nid oes unrhyw sicrwydd y bydd y fformwla, erbyn 2002-03, fel y nodwyd gan David, yn llawer cadarnach nag y mae ar hyn o bryd.

Mae gennyf gryn gydymdeimlad dros welliannau Janet Ryder. Adlewyrcha ei gwelliant 2 lawer o'r hyn a ddywedais eisoes. Fodd bynnag, mae CLILC wedi gofyn inni gadw rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd o ran y data newydd, ac mae'n hollol iawn os daw data i'r golwg a fydd yn gwneud cryn wahaniaeth,

introduce it as soon as possible to be fair to local authorities. That is why I oppose stipulating specific review dates. We cannot be too prescriptive about this, but this is one of the traps into which the amendment has fallen.

Janet Ryder's amendment 3 is also worthy of consideration. I agree that, having looked at the figures, we need transitional arrangements. The danger is that we must not build those transitional arrangements into the new formula forever and a day, as Edwina has already said. They must be short-lived and they must be fully funded by the Assembly. The £11 million figure proposed by Janet will make the system too reliant on transitional relief. The figures show that it can be done for £4 million and that it can be phased out over three years. That is the correct approach, and we shall therefore vote against this amendment too. I hope, therefore, that we will adopt this motion unamended.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. Local government finance has been a cause of great dissatisfaction to the residents of Wales for a considerable time. This is particularly true of my council, which has had particular problems. I will not dwell on that—it would take up all my five minutes and more. People find it totally unacceptable in this day and age to pay more council tax year on year for fewer and fewer services. In the ward where I live, in the past three and a half years, we have seen this reduction in services. We have seen the closure of local housing offices, bus services cut, grant offices moving out of the valley altogether, which is not surprising considering their longer and longer waiting lists for grants. Yet during this time of reduced services, we have seen the council tax increase by approaching 100 per cent since the reorganisation of local government. You can sell an increase in council tax for improved services. I can understand a reduction in council tax for reduced services, but an increase in council tax for reduced services is totally unacceptable. Yet this is a direct result of Government policy.

yna dylem ei gyflwyno mor fuan â phosibl, er mwyn bod yn deg â'r awdurdodau lleol. Dyna'r rheswm pam fy mod yn gwrthwynebu penu dyddiadau penodol ar gyfer adolygiadau. Ni allwn fod yn rhy argymhellol ynglŷn â hyn, ond dyma un o'r maglau y mae'r gwelliant wedi syrthio iddo.

Mae gwelliant 3 Janet Ryder hefyd yn werth ei ystyried. Cytunaf, ar ôl ystyried y ffigurau, fod arnom angen trefniadau trosiannol. Y perygl yw bod yn rhaid inni warchod rhag cynnwys y trefniadau trosiannol hynny yn y fformwla newydd am byth, fel y dywedodd Edwina eisoes. Rhaid iddynt fod yn fyrhoedlog a rhaid iddynt gael eu hariannu'n llawn gan y Cynulliad. Bydd y ffigur o £11 miliwn a gynigir gan Janet yn golygu bod y system yn rhy ddibynnol ar gymorth trosiannol. Dengys y ffigurau y gellir gwneud hynny ar gyfer £4 miliwn ac y gellir ei gyflwyno fesul cam dros dair blynedd. Dyna'r ymagwedd gywir, a byddwn felly yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant hwn hefyd. Gobeithiaf, felly, y mabwysiadwn y cynnig hwn heb ei ddiwygio.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Bu cyllid llywodraeth leol yn achos cryn anfodlonrwydd i drigolion Cymru ers tro byd. Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir yn achos fy nghyngor i, sydd wedi dioddef problemau arbennig. Ni ymhelaethaf ar y rheini—cymerai'r pum munud cyfan sydd gennyf a mwy. Mae'n holol annerbyniol i bobl heddiw dalu mwy o dreth gyngor flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn am lai a llai o wasanaethau. Yn y ward lle yr wyf yn byw, yr ydym wedi gweld y gostyngiad hwn mewn gwasanaethau yn ystod y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf. Gwelsom swyddfeydd tai lleol yn cau, gwasanaethau bws yn cael eu cwtogi, swyddfeydd grantiau yn symud o'r cwm yn gyfan gwbl, nad yw'n rhyfedd o beth o ystyried eu rhestrau aros cynyddol am grantiau. Eto i gyd yn ystod y cyfnod hwn lai o wasanaethau, gwelsom y dreth gyngor yn cynyddu 100 y cant bron ers ad-drefn u llywodraeth leol. Gallwch ddarbwyllo pobl o gynnydd yn y dreth gyngor ar gyfer gwasanaethau gwell. Gallaf ddeall gostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor ar gyfer llai o wasanaethau, ond mae cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor ar gyfer llai o wasanaethau yn gwbl

annerbyniol. Ac eto dyma ganlyniad unioñgyrchol polisi'r Llywodraeth.

Coming from the Valleys, I welcome the greater emphasis on deprivation in the formula. I am, however, disappointed that the overall effect on the standard spending assessment is generally so small. I do not pretend to understand the intricacies of regressive analysis, but I am reliably informed that the method used in this case is flawed. However, we are prepared to accept it, as the proposed formula for 2001-02 is an improvement on the present one. But this must be an interim measure. There are major deficiencies in the proposed formula. There is also a deficiency, as we heard, in the data, particularly in identifying deprivation at subward level.

Local authorities' spending has a vital role to play in addressing the increasing divide between the 'haves' and 'have nots' in our society. Deprived communities by definition have unmet needs and local councils need to provide services and facilities to improve the quality of life in these areas. They need basic services, such as community centres and education facilities to address the increased social exclusion caused by the information technology revolution. We need things such as homework clubs, youth and recreation facilities, and, importantly, outreach workers to help disaffected youth. All those facilities must be provided locally where they are accessible to the most needy in society. That is expensive. These needs are not exclusive to Valley communities. They are also needed in rural communities. Rural and Valley communities have similar problems; for example, rural areas suffer from high travel costs. However, that can also be true in linear Valley communities where services have been centralised and where access to such services involves long, expensive journeys.

A minnau'n hanu o'r Cymoedd, croesawaf y pwyslais mwy ar amddifadedd yn y fformwla. Yr wyf, fodd bynnag, yn siomedig bod yr effaith gyffredinol ar yr asesiad safonol o wariant mor fach at ei gilydd. Ni chymeraf fy mod yn deall manylion dadansoddi atchwelliadol, ond cefais wybod gan ffynhonnell ddibynadwy, fod y dull a ddefnyddir yn yr achos hwn yn ddifygiol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn barod i'w dderbyn, gan fod y fformwla arfaethedig ar gyfer 2001-02 yn well na'r fformwla bresennol. Ond rhaid mai mesur dros dro ydyw. Mae gan y fformwla arfaethedig ddifygion difrifol. Mae diffyg hefyd, fel y clywsom, o ran y data, yn enwedig o ran nodi amddifadedd ar lefel is na'r wardiau.

Mae rôl holl bwysig gan wariant awdurdodau lleol i'w chwarae wrth roi sylw i'r gagendor cynyddol rhwng y rhai sydd â digon a'r rhai sydd heb unrhyw beth yn ein cymdeithas. Mae gan gymunedau difreintiedig wrth reswm anghenion nas bodlonir ac mae angen i gynghorau lleol ddarparu gwasanaethau a chyfleusterau a fydd yn gwella ansawdd bywyd yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae angen gwasanaethau sylfaenol arnynt, megis canolfannau cymunedol a chyfleusterau addysg i ddelio â'r allgáu cymdeithasol cynyddol a achosir gan y chwyldro technoleg gwybodaeth. Mae angen pethau megis clybiau gwaith cartref, cyfleusterau ieuenciad ac adloniant arnom, ac, yn bwysig, gweithwyr allanol a fydd yn helpu ieuenciad difreintiedig. Rhaid darparu'r holl gyfleusterau hynny yn lleol lle y maent yn hygyrch i'r rhai mwyaf anghenus mewn cymdeithas. Bydd hynny'n gostus. Nid yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd yn unig y mae angen y rhain. Mae eu hangen hefyd mewn cymunedau gwledig. Mae gan gymunedau gwledig a chymunedau'r Cymoedd broblemau tebyg; er enghraift, mae ardaloedd gwledig yn dioddef oherwydd costau teithio uchel. Fodd bynnag, gall hynny hefyd fod yn wir yn achos cymunedau unionlin y Cymoedd lle y canolwyd gwasanaethau a lle golyga mynediad i wasanaethau o'r fath deithiau hir, costus.

4.25 p.m.

The effect of the change in the formula, as I have said, is disappointing. That emphasises the need to increase local government spending as a whole. The last three years, following on from the 18 years of Conservative rule, have been wasted. During that time, we have seen further erosion of the assets of local authorities. The backlog of repairs for schools, council houses and basic infrastructure, such as roads, bridges and pavements, is scandalous. We need a massive injection of resources into local government, not only to address that backlog, but also to improve and introduce new services that are needed desperately by our communities.

As has been said twice before, in any change of formula for distribution of resources, there are winners and losers. Some councils will be in a situation of either increasing council tax at a disproportionate level, or cutting services, as I described previously. To implement the new formula in a fair way, it is essential that adequate transitional support is forthcoming from the Assembly. A 9 per cent increase is far too high for any council, when other councils may not have any increases. These resources in the transitional arrangements should be additional to the rate support grant to prevent the squabbling we saw earlier this year over the local government settlement. This formula must be an interim arrangement, until a further improved distribution formula is in place; a formula that will adequately address the needs of all the communities of Wales, particularly those that are deprived.

**Huw Lewis:** I will first comment on some of the issues raised by the opposition parties in relation to the settlement under discussion. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, the Best Party in the World Ever, or whatever they are called—told us that it is in favour of the redistribution of wealth, that it is socialist at heart, and one of its members stood up to say that more money for the Valleys is a jolly good thing. However, as saints are on the agenda today, in the words of a saint—I wish David was here so that he could tell me which one—the members of Plaid Cymru are

Mae'r effaith a gaiff y newid yn y fformwla, fel y dywedais, yn siomedig. Mae hynny'n pwysleisio'r angen i gynyddu gwariant llywodraeth leol yn gyffredinol. Gwastraffwyd y tair blynedd ddiwethaf, yn dilyn 18 mlynedd o lywodraeth Geidwadol. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, gwelsom ragor o erydu ar asedau'r awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r ôl-groniad o waith trwsio ar gyfer ysgolion, tai cyngor a'r isadeiledd sylfaenol, megis ffyrdd, pontydd a phalmentydd yn warthus. Mae angen chwistrelliad enfawr o adnoddau i mewn i lywodraeth leol nid yn unig i fynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad, ond hefyd i wella gwasanaethau a chyflwyno'r gwasanaethau newydd sydd eu hangen yn ddybryd ar ein cymunedau.

Fel y dywedwyd ddwywaith cyn hyn, yn achos unrhyw newid i'r fformwla ddosrannu adnoddau, bydd rhai ar eu hennill a rhai ar eu colled. Bydd rhai cyngorau mewn sefyllfa lle y maent naill ai yn cynyddu'r dreth gyngor ar lefel anghymesur, neu'n cwtogi gwasanaethau, fel y disgrifiai yn gynt. I weithredu'r fformwla newydd yn deg mae'n hanfodol bod y Cynulliad yn rhoi cymorth trosiannol digonol. Mae cynnydd o 9 y cant yn llawer rhy uchel i unrhyw gyngor, lle na fydd unrhyw gynnydd mewn cyngorau eraill o bosib. Dylai'r adnoddau trefniadau trosiannol hyn fod yn ychwanegol at y grant cymorth yn y trethi er mwyn atal y ffræao a welsom yn gynharach eleni ynglŷn â'r setliad llywodraeth leol. Rhaid i'r fformwla hon fod yn drefniant dros dro, nes y bydd fformwla ddosrannu well arall yn ei lle; fformwla a aiff i'r afael ag anghenion holl gymunedau Cymru mewn modd digonol, yn enwedig y rheini sydd yn ddifreintiedig.

**Huw Lewis:** Cynigiaf sylwadau yn gyntaf ar rai o'r materion a godwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau mewn perthynas â'r setliad sydd dan drafodaeth. Dywedodd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, y Blaid Orau yn y Byd Erioed, neu beth bynnag y'i gelwir—wrthym ei bod o blaid ailddosrannu cyfoeth, ei bod yn y bôn yn sosialaidd, a safodd un o'i haelodau i ddweud bod mwy o arian ar gyfer y Cymoedd yn beth da iawn. Fodd bynnag, gan fod seintiau ar yr agenda heddiw, yng ngeiriau un o'r seintiau—trueni nad yw David yma i ddweud wrthyf ba un—

asking to be made socialists, but please, God, not yet. They want some delay in the redistribution of wealth.

**The Presiding Officer:** A saint is trying to intervene.

**Brian Gibbons:** Are Huw's comments a case of doubting Thomas?

**Huw Lewis:** Janet Ryder is saying that they would like to involve themselves in the redistribution of wealth and opportunity, but they would like to delay it as long as possible and if they cannot have it quite the way they want it, they will not vote for it. We will miss an historic opportunity to fulfil the manifesto pledges of a Labour led administration to carry out that redistribution. The Tories, to give them credit, have much more clarity of sight when—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Huw Lewis:** The Welsh Conservative and Unionist Party, or whatever it is called. You will need big compliment slips for this.

The Tories, to give them credit, are more clear-sighted on this issue. I have done it again. Can I be bleeped out when I make that mistake, so that we can continue.

David Davies is more clear-sighted on the issue. He recognises redistribution of wealth and opportunity when he sees them and it scares the hell out of him. He argues honestly and with honour and, as his party's historical mission would have him do, he argues against the redistribution of wealth and opportunity. You are right, David, this is about redistributing money to areas of Wales that are underprivileged, including the south Wales valleys. That is why I will vote in favour of this.

**David Davies:** The Member obviously missed the point in my speech when I made it clear that I am not against giving money to deprived areas. My complaint was about how deprivation has been calculated. It has not been calculated by looking at the relative

mae aelodau Plaid Cymru yn gofyn am fod yn sosialwyr, ond Duw a'n helpo, nid eto. Maent am oedi ychydig cyn ailldosrannu cyfoeth.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae sant yn ceisio ymyrryd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ai achos o Domos yr amheuwr yw sylwadau Huw?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae Janet Ryder yn dweud eu bod am ymwneud ag ailldosrannu cyfoeth a chyfle, ond yr hoffent ei ohirio gyhyd â phosibl ac os na allant gael pethau yn union fel yr hoffent, ni fyddant yn pleidleisio drosto. Collwn gyfle hanesyddol i gyflawni addunedau maniffesto gweinyddiaeth a arweinir gan Lafur i ailldosrannu felly. Mae'r Torïaid, a bod yn deg â hwy, yn llawer mwy eglur pan—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Huw Lewis:** Plaid Geidwadol ac Unoliaethol Cymru, neu beth bynnag y'i gelwir. Bydd angen slipiau cyfarch mawr ar gyfer hyn.

Mae'r Torïaid, a bod yn deg iddynt, yn llawer mwy eglur ar y mater hwn. Fe'i dywedais eto. A oes modd i'm geiriau gael eu dileu pan wnaf y camgymeriad hwnnw, fel y gallwn barhau.

Mae David Davies yn llawer mwy eglur ar y mater. Mae'n cydnabod ailldosrannu cyfoeth a chyfle pan y'u gwelant, ac mae'n codi arswyd arno. Mae'n dadlau'n ddiffuant ac urddasol ac, fel y byddai cenhadaeth hanesyddol ei blaidd yn mynnu iddo ei wneud, mae'n dadlau yn erbyn ailldosrannu cyfoeth a chyfle. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, David, mae hyn yn ymwneud ag ailldosrannu arian i ardaloedd yng Nghymru sydd yn ddifreintiedig, gan gynnwys cymoedd de Cymru. Dyna pam fy mod yn pleidleisio o blaidd hyn.

**David Davies:** Mae'n amlwg i'r Aelod golli'r pwyt yn fy arraith pan ddywedais yn eglur nad oeddwn yn erbyn rhoi arian i ardaloedd wedi'u hamddfadiadu. Fy nghŵyn oedd sut y cyfrifwyd yr amddifadedd. Ni chyfrifwyd hyn drwy ystyried cyfoeth

wealth of different areas. It has been calculated in a nebulous fashion by looking at different factors that favour certain parts of Wales that have been mis-run by his colleagues for decades. Those areas will benefit. However, nobody is asking why they must spend much more than other areas on public services.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have made one speech. That was a long intervention.

**Huw Lewis:** I must tell you, David, poverty in Wales is probably the most studied animal since the giant panda. We have had study after study, and document after document, and they all point towards the same geographical areas of Wales. Those are the areas that have also been agreed by the European Commission to qualify for Objective 1 as being worthy of additional help. The reason why these areas are worthy of additional help is, in one word, poverty. It is as simple as that. David, as all Welsh Conservatives, describes what is, in reality, the defence of wealth and privilege, and dresses it up as frugality and efficiency.

I welcome this historic decision to redistribute money to local authorities according to deprivation and relative measures of wealth, despite the fact that all of us would have liked for some things to be slightly different and for certain measures to have a different emphasis in the proposals.

**Brian Hancock:** You mentioned measurements. Will you comment on the measurement of unmet need and how this will be accommodated in the next spending assessment?

**Huw Lewis:** You have got me there, Brian.

**Phil Williams:** That is an important issue.

**Huw Lewis:** I will admit freely that ‘unmet need’ is somewhat too vague a phrase for me to be able to engage with it.

cymharol y gwahanol ardaloedd. Fe'i cyfrifwyd mewn ffordd annelwig drwy ystyried y gwahanol ffactorau a fydd o fantais i rannau penodol o Gymru a gamreolwyd gan ei gyd-Aelodau ers degawdau. Bydd yr ardaloedd hynny yn elwa. Fodd bynnag, nid oes neb yn gofyn pam bod yn rhaid iddynt wario cymaint mwy ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus nag ardaloedd eraill.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi gwneud un arraith. Yr oedd hwnnw'n ymyriad hir.

**Huw Lewis:** Rhaid imi ddweud wrthych, David, fod tlodi yng Nghymru yn un o'r pynciau a astudiyd fwyaf erioed. Cawsom un astudiaeth ar ôl y llall, ac un ddogfen ar ôl y llall, ac maent i gyd yn nodi yr un ardaloedd daearyddol yng Nghymru. Dyma'r ardaloedd y mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi cytuno eu bod yn gymwys ar gyfer Amcan 1 ac yn haeddu cymorth ychwanegol. Y rheswm pam y mae'r ardaloedd hyn yn haeddu cymorth ychwanegol yw, mewn gair, tlodi. Mae mor syml â hynny. Mae David, fel Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yn disgrifio'r hyn sydd, mewn gwirionedd, yn gyflawnhad dros gyfoeth a braint, gan eu cyflwyno fel darbodusrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd.

Croesawf y penderfyniad hanesyddol hwn i ailddosbarthu arian i'r awdurdodau lleol yn ôl amddifadedd a mesurau cymharol o gyfoeth, er gwaethaf yffaith y dymunai pob un ohonom i rai pethau fod ychydig yn wahanol a bod pwyslais gwahanol i fesurau penodol yn y cynigion.

**Brian Hancock:** Soniasoch am fesurau. A wnewch chi sôn am y mesur o angen nas bodlonir a sut y caiff hyn ei fodloni yn yr asesiad nesaf o wariant?

**Huw Lewis:** Yr ydych wedi fy nal yn hynny o beth, Brian.

**Phil Williams:** Mae hwnnw yn fater o bwys.

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf yn hollol fodlon cyfaddef bod ‘angen nas bodlonir’ yn ymadrodd braidd yn amwys imi uniaethau ag ef.

**Dafydd Wigley:** We understand it.

**Huw Lewis:** This is by no means a perfect settlement for areas such as Merthyr and Rhymney, David. I would have liked for the deprivation measures in the document to be as strong as they were in the original document in July. However, there has been some dilution, which I regret. The deprivation measures that we have must be held constantly in mind as we look at new data that becomes available and any modifications that it might provide as we monitor the system over time. I make a plea to the Minister to look at a problem that affects Valleys authorities in particular, which is the disproportionate number of properties in council tax bands A and B. The largest local authority in my constituency, Merthyr Tydfil, has no less than 81 per cent of its properties in bands A and B. This causes a double gearing effect—it is difficult to raise any appreciable amounts of money from council tax without bumping up the rate to more than it should be. I ask the Minister to consider that as an item for future action.

Although I have some reservations and, like everyone else in the Chamber I am sure, would like to see some things in the document written slightly differently, I will vote for it and I will support it. The major opposition party will stare redistribution of wealth in the face again, and will retreat again. Do not dress it up by saying that because your amendments, which would have made the document perfect, have been rejected, you cannot vote for it. The simple fact is that what is offered, however imperfectly, is a simple redistributive formula for local government funding in Wales, but the Welsh nationalists will run away.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Point of order.

**The Presiding Officer:** I know what your point of order is.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Would you remind him of your ruling, therefore? This is the second time that he has called us ‘nationalists’ this afternoon. There are a number of things I would like to call Huw Lewis and his colleagues, but I restrain myself in this Chamber.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Deallwn ni ei ystyr.

**Huw Lewis:** Nid yw hwn yn setliad perffaith ar gyfer ardaloedd megis Merthyr a Rhymni o bell ffordd, David. Byddai'n well gennyf pe bai'r mesurau o amddifadedd yn y ddogfen wedi bod mor gadarn ag yr oeddent yn y ddogfen wreiddiol ym mis Gorffennaf. Fodd bynnag, bu rhywfaint o lastwreiddio, sydd yn edifar gennyf. Rhaid cadw'r mesurau o amddifadedd sydd gennym mewn cof bob amser wrth inni edrych ar ddata newydd a fydd ar gael ac unrhyw addasiadau y gallai eu darparu wrth inni barhau i fonitro'r system. Apelias ar i'r Gweinidog ystyried problem sydd yn effeithio ar awdurdodau'r Cymoedd yn arbennig, sef y nifer anghymesur o eiddo ym mandiau A a B y dreth cyngor. Mae 81 y cant o eiddo'r awdurdod lleol mwyaf yn fy etholaeth, Merthyr Tudful, ym mandiau A a B. Mae hyn yn achosi effaith llywio dyblyg—mae'n anodd codi symiau mawr o arian drwy'r dreth gyngor heb gynyddu'r gyfradd yn uwch nag y dylai fod. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried hynny fel eitem i weithredu arni yn y dyfodol.

Er bod gennyf rai amheuon ac, fel pawb arall yn y Siambwr mae'n siŵr, yr hoffwn weld rhai pethau yn y ddogfen yn cael eu hysgrifennu ychydig yn wahanol, byddaf yn pleidleisio drosti ac yn ei chefnogi. Bydd y brif wrthblaid yn wynebu ailddosbarthu cyfoeth eto, ac yn ymgilio eto. Peidiwch â chymryd arnoch na allwch bleidleisio o'i phlaid am fod eich gwelliannau, a fyddai wedi sicrhau bod y ddogfen yn berffaith, wedi eu gwirthod. Y gwir syml amdani yw bod yr hyn a gynigir, waeth pa mor amherffaith ydyw, yn fformwla ddosbarthol syml ar gyfer arian llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, ond bydd y cenedlaetholwyr yn cilio i ffwrdd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Pwynt o drefn

**Y Llywydd:** Gwn beth yw eich pwynt o drefn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A wnewch chi ei atgoffa o'ch dyfarniad, felly? Dyma'r ail dro iddo ein galw yn 'genedlaetholwyr' y prynhawn yma. Mae nifer o bethau yr hoffwn alw Huw Lewis a'i gyd-Aelodau, ond ymataliaf rhag gwneud hynny yn y Siambwr hon.

4.35 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** If he does it for a third time, I will assume that it is deliberate.

**Nick Bourne:** He said it at least three times. I counted to five.

I do not think that anyone is against helping areas of deprivation. This is a fairly crude measure, which I find stunning. Huw Lewis admitted that he is not totally in favour of the measure that he will support. Therefore, it is assumed that just because we have a crude measure everybody should support it. However, there are large areas of rural Wales that will be worse off under this formula. We were told that rurality would be given additional weighting. It has, in fact, been given less weighting in the new formula than in the old formula. I find the suggestion that there is no deprivation in rural Wales offensive. There is significant deprivation in large parts of Brecon and Radnorshire and in other parts of Powys. How will they be helped by this formula? They will not be helped; they will be further disadvantaged.

I listened to the draft budget speech, delivered by Edwina Hart when she was wearing her finance hat rather than her communities hat, and heard her present it as a great success that some local authorities would only have single figure increases. The Deputy Minister for the environment today mentioned the scaremongering about double figure increases. Somehow there was a quantum leap between 10 per cent and 9 per cent. The figure of 9 per cent is unacceptable to those authorities that had swingeing increases last time. This formula does not begin to address that matter. To suggest that this is a redistributive measure, which we must all, therefore, support, does not give the proper thought that we should be giving to this debate. There are many people on low incomes in rural Wales who will suffer swingeing increases, having also suffered them last year. It is wrong to try to dragoon people to vote for this motion by saying that it will help the poor. It is wrong-headed and not what this is about—rural Wales is also disadvantaged.

**Y Llywydd:** Os gwnaiff hynny am y trydydd tro, tybiaf ei fod yn bwrvpasol.

**Nick Bourne:** Dywedodd hynny dair gwaith o leiaf. Nodais i bum gwaith.

Ni chredaf fod unrhyw un yn erbyn helpu ardaloedd difreintiedig. Mae hwn yn fesur eithaf amrwd, sydd yn fy syfrdanu. Cyfaddefodd Huw Lewis nad yw'n hollol o blaid y mesur a gefnoga. Tybir felly, am fod gennym ryw fath o fesur amrwd, y dylai pawb ei gefnogi. Fodd bynnag, bydd ardaloedd helaeth o Gymru wledig o dan y fformwla hon yn waeth eu byd. Dywedwyd wrthym y byddai pwysoliad ychwanegol ar gyfer gwledigrwydd. Cafodd, mewn gwirionedd, lai o bwysoliad yn y fformwla newydd nag yn yr hen un. Mae'r awgrym nad oes unrhyw amddifadedd yng Nghymru wledig yn un gwrthun imi. Mae cryn amddifadedd o fewn rhannau helaeth o Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed ac mewn rhannau eraill o Bowys. Sut y bydd y fformwla hon yn eu helpu? Ni chânt eu helpu; byddant o dan anfantais fwy byth.

Gwrandewais ar yr arraith ar y gyllideb ddrafft a draddodwyd gan Edwina Hart pan oedd yn gwisgo ei het gyllid yn hytrach na het y cymunedau, gan ei chlywed yn cyflwyno'r ffaith y byddai rhai awdurdodau lleol ond yn cael cynnydd ffigur sengl yn unig fel petai'n llwyddiant mawr. Soniodd Dirprwy Weinidog yr Amgylchedd heddiw am godi bwganod ynglŷn â chynnydd ffigur dwbl. Rywsut neu'i gilydd bu naid enfawr rhwng 10 y cant a 9 y cant. Mae'r ffigur o 9 y cant yn annerbyniol i'r awdurdodau hynny lle y bu cynnydd aruthrol y tro diwethaf. Nid yw'r fformwla hon hyd yn oed yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw. Mae'r awgrym ei fod yn fesur o ailddosrannu, y mae'n rhaid inni oll ei gefnogi, felly, yn anwybyddu'r ystyriaeth briodol y dylem fod yn ei rhoi i'r ddadl hon. Mae llawer o bobl ar incwm isel yng Nghymru wledig a fydd yn dioddef cynnydd aruthrol, ar ôl dioddef cynnydd arall y llynedd. Nid yw'n iawn ceisio gorfodi pobl i bleidleisio dros y cynnig hwn drwy ddweud y bydd yn helpu'r tlodion. Mae'n gyfeiliornus ac nid yw'n ymdrin â'r

mater hwnnw—mae Cymru wledig hefyd yn ddifreintiedig.

A factor that has not been addressed is that this formula does not give sufficient weight or take proper account of an ageing population in some areas, which is a serious issue for large parts of Wales. On behalf of the rural poor and the elderly—it is particularly bad for the rural poor who are also elderly—this formula does not help. It is wrong to present it as a success and as a socialist measure that we should all support because it will help everybody. Large parts of Wales are not spoken for by the administration, and the new formula serves to underline that fact.

**Brian Gibbons:** I support the main resolution. As many have said, this is a start of a process that will rectify the injustices of the ad hoc reorganisation of local government following the poll tax fiasco. Even though it is not ideal, it is the start of a process. Consequently, to support the line suggested by David Davies would be wrong. Plaid Cymru's line is also wrong, because even though the formula may not be perfect, it is the beginning of a corrective process. It reminds me of the sinner who was praying for the Lord to save him, but not to do so just yet. Plaid Cymru has a choice to make a decision on this. Will it start on the road towards redistribution or will it fail to jump the jump yet again?

I welcome the fact that, in this standard spending assessment formula, my local authority, Neath Port Talbot, has achieved a minor redistribution that is 1 per cent more than the previous formula and will achieve an extra anticipated £1.6 million. Notwithstanding what has been said from the Conservative benches, Neath Port Talbot will still have one of the highest council tax rates in Wales, and not because of inefficiencies. Time and time again when the Audit Commission looks at the performance of Labour-run councils, Labour councillors perform well in the better half of the table. For example, in my own authority of Neath Port Talbot, we have the best education results across Wales. That is miles better than local authorities such as Monmouth. I

Un o'r ffactorau nad ymdriniwyd ag ef yw nad yw'r fformwla hon yn rhoi digon o bwys nac ystyriaeth i'r boblogaeth sydd yn heneiddio mewn rhai ardaloedd, sydd yn fater difrifol mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru. Ar ran tlodion cefn gwlaid a'r henoed—mae'n arbennig o wael ar gyfer tlodion cefn gwlaid sydd hefyd yn oedrannus—nid yw'r fformwla hon o gymorth. Mae'n gamwedd ei gyflwyno fel llwyddiant a mesur sosialaidd y dylem ni oll ei gefnogi oherwydd y bydd yn helpu pawb. Nid yw'r weinyddiaeth yn siarad dros rannau helaeth o Gymru, ac mae'r fformwla newydd yn tanlinellu'r ffaith honno.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cefnogaf brif ran y cynnig. Fel y dywedodd llawer, mae hyn yn ddechrau proses a fydd yn unioni anghyfiawnderau'r ad-drefnu rywsut-rywsut o lywodraeth leol yn dilyn helynt treth y pen. Er nad yw'n ddelfrydol, mae'n ddechrau proses. O ganlyniad, byddai'n anghywir cefnogi'r hyn a awgrymodd David Davies. Mae safbwyt Plaid Cymru hefyd yn anghywir, oherwydd er nad yw'r fformwla yn berffaith o bosibl, mae'n ddechrau proses unioni. Mae'n fy atgoffa o'r pechadur a weddai i'r Arglwydd ei achub ond ddim eto o bosibl. Mae gan Blaid Cymru ddewis o ran y penderfyniad ar hyn. A fydd yn dechrau ar y ffordd tuag at ailddosrannu neu a fydd yn methu â neidio'r naid unwaith eto?

Croesawaf y ffaith bod fy awdurdod lleol, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, yn y fformwla hon o asesiad safonol o wariant, wedi cael ailddosraniad bach sef 1 y cant yn fwy na'r fformwla flaenorol ac y rhagwelir y caiff £1.6 miliwn ychwanegol. Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd gan y rhai ar feinciau'r Ceidwadwyr, bydd cyfraddau treth gyngor Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn dal ymhlið y cyfraddau uchaf yng Nghymru, ac nid oherwydd anefffeithlonrwydd. Dro ar ôl tro pan edrycha'r Comisiwn Archwilio ar berfformiad cynghorau a weinyddir gan Lafur, mae cynghorwyr Llafur yn perfformio'n dda yn y rhan uchaf o'r tabl. Er enghraifft, yn fy awdurdod fy hun, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, gennym ni mae'r canlyniadau addysg gorau yng Nghymru.

entirely reject the argument that the reason we have high spending and high needs in authorities such as Neath Port Talbot is because of inefficiency.

**Janet Ryder:** Will Brian explain why he and the Labour Party are intent—he said that Labour-controlled councils perform well time and time again—on punishing those councils, such as Flintshire and Wrexham, without putting in transitional arrangements to help the councils that are run by their own party and do a reasonably good job? That is not acceptable to them. They are going to turn their backs on great parts of Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** The point is reasonable because our local authority, equally, will get no transitional arrangements. I do not disagree with your point. However, we are starting on a process and we are either going to work together to address these issues, or we are going to fail yet again to move forward, as your party recommends. If we want to move forward, let us pull together on this particular issue.

I agree with David Davies's point about regression analysis. I am sure that Saint Thomas is looking down on me in a benefactory way for having made such a confession. However, there are problems with using regression analysis as a means of informing a new local government resource allocation mechanism. I am pleased to see that the distribution group is saying that it will try and use more clearly identified objective measures of need and, also, to use more carefully informed first value review outcomes as a means of allocating resources to these well identified needs. The other point that I make—and the redistribution group makes the point clearly and regrets that it had to use the old census data from 1991—is a strong plea for having robust, valid data for what is happening in Wales. That brings us to the importance of ensuring that there is a 100 per cent compliance with the new census that is due to take place next year. A great deal of the mechanism and theory will not count for very much if we are not going to have robust census data. I hope that in this Chamber

Mae hynny'n llawer gwell nag awdurdodau lleol fel Mynwy. Gwrthodaf yn llwyr y ddadl mai aneffeithlonwydd yw'r rheswm pam fod gennym wariant uchel ac anghenion uchel mewn awdurdodau fel Castell-nedd Port Talbot.

**Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff Brian egluro pam ei fod ef a'r Blaid Lafur yn benderfynol—dywedodd fod cynghorau a weinyddir gan Lafur yn perfformio'n dda dro ar ôl tro—o gosbi'r cynghorau hynny, fel Sir y Fflint a Wrecsam, heb sefydlu trefniadau trosiannol i helpu'r cynghorau a weinyddir gan eu plaid eu hun ac sydd yn gweithredu'n dda? Nid yw hynny'n dderbynio iddynt. Maent yn mynd i gefnu ar rannau helaeth o Gymru.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r pwynt yn un rhesymol am na fydd ein hawdurdod lleol ni, ychwaith yn cael unrhyw drefniadau trosiannol. Nid anghytunaf â'ch pwynt. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dechrau proses ac yr ydym naill ai yn mynd i gydweithio i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn, neu yr ydym yn mynd i fethu unwaith eto â symud ymlaen, fel y mae'ch plaid chi yn ei argymhell. Os ydym am symud ymlaen, gadewch inni gyd-dynnu ar y mater penodol hwn.

Cytunaf â phwynt David Davies ynglŷn â dadansoddi atchwel. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Sant Thomas yn edrych i lawr arnaf yn garedig am wneud cyfaddefiad o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, mae problemau wrth ddefnyddio dadansoddi atchwel fel modd o lywio dull newydd o ddosrannu adnoddau llywodraeth leol. Mae'n dda gennyl nodi bod y grŵp dosrannu yn dweud y bydd yn ceisio defnyddio mesurau gwrthrychol mwy penodol o angen a, hefyd, ddefnyddio canlyniadau arolygiadau gwerth cyntaf a lywir yn fwy gofalus fel modd o ddosrannu adnодau ar gyfer yr anghenion hyn a nodir yn dda. Y pwynt arall a wnaf—ac mae'r grŵp ailddosbarthu'n gwneud y pwynt yn glir ac yn edifarthau bod yn rhaid iddo ddefnyddio hen ddata cyfrifiad o 1991—yw apêl gref dros ddata cadarn, dilys ar gyfer yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yng Nghymru. Mae hynny yn ein harwain at bwysigrwydd sierhau bod cydymffurfio 100 y cant gyda'r cyfrifiad newydd a fydd yn digwydd y flwyddyn nesaf. Bydd rhan helaeth o'r dull a'r ddamcaniaeth yn ddiystyr os na chawn ddata cadarn o'r cyfrifiad. Gobeithiaf yn y

today, all political parties will be able to unequivocally sign up to a campaign to get maximum compliance with the 2001 census so that, when we come to this subject again, we will be proceeding from the best evidence base.

**Janet Davies:** The aim of the review of the standard spending assessment formula was to get resources increasingly targeted on deprivation. It is unfortunate that this debate has once again shown up a false dichotomy of priorities between rural and urban areas and the valleys and the cities. Any deprived area is deprived. We should stop talking about whether rural, urban or valley areas should get more or less. That is not a helpful way to proceed. There is a need for adequate statistics. The missing ward level statistics, particularly for social services, are causing problems in this review. They are vitally important services for vulnerable people in all communities—rural and valley communities and cities such as Cardiff, Newport and Swansea. There may be special challenges in rural areas, but there are also special challenges in every other area. I was amazed that the Labour Government commenced this review in the light of the lack of statistics in these areas. I cannot understand that they did not realise that there was a lack of statistics. Perhaps nobody told them. Statistics do not always reflect deprivation in different types of areas. That is something that must be looked at in the future. It is essential that councils have enough money to provide good services and that we enable them to relieve deprivation and address the challenges that arise. The Deputy Minister for local government is claiming responsibility for the Liberal Democrats—that is what I understood him to say—in obtaining transitional funding for some councils. He describes references to the double figure council tax increases as scaremongering, but accepts the increase as 9 per cent. Nick Bourne has already made this point, but it should be made strongly, that the public will not be totally euphoric about the promise that the rise in council tax will be no more than 9 per cent.

4.45 p.m.

Siambr hon heddiw, y bydd pob plaid wleidyddol yn cefnogi'r ymgyrch i gael cydymffurfiad â chyfrifiad 2001 i'r carn fel y byddwn, pan ddychwelwn at y pwnc hwn eto, yn gweithredu o'r sail dystiolaeth orau bosibl.

**Janet Davies:** Nod yr adolygiad o'r fformwla asesiad safonol o wariant oedd targedu mwy o adnoddau at amddifadedd. Mae'n anffodus i'r ddadl hon unwaith eto ddangos deuoliaeth gau o flaenoriaethau rhwng yr ardaloedd gwledig a threfol a'r cymoedd a'r dinasoedd. Difreintiedig yw pob ardal ddifreintiedig. Dylem roi'r gorau i drafod a ddylai ardaloedd gwledig, ardaloedd trefol neu ardaloedd y cymoedd gael mwy neu lai o arian. Nid yw hon yn ffordd fuddiol o weithredu. Mae angen ystadegau digonol. Mae'r ystadegau coll ar lefel wardiau, yn achosi problemau yn yr adolygiad hwn, yn enwedig ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Maent yn wasanaethau holl bwysig i bobl ddiamddiffyn ym mhob cymuned—boed yng nghefn gwlad, y cymoedd neu'r dinasoedd fel Caerdydd, Casnewydd ac Abertawe. Efallai bod heriau arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ond mae heriau arbennig hefyd ym mhob ardal arall. Synnais at y ffaith fod y Llywodraeth Lafur wedi dechrau'r adolygiad hwn o gofio'r prinder ystadegau yn yr ardaloedd hyn. Ni allaf ddeall pam na sylweddolasant fod prinder ystadegau. Efallai na ddywedwyd wrthynt. Nid yw ystadegau bob amser yn adlewyrchu amddifadedd mewn gwahanol fathau o ardaloedd. Mae hwnnw yn fater y bydd yn rhaid ei ystyried yn y dyfodol. Mae'n hanfodol y caiff y cynghorau ddigon o arian i ddarparu gwasanaethau digonol a'n bod yn eu galluogi i liniaru amddifadedd a mynd i'r afael â'r heriau sydd yn codi. Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros lywodraeth leol yn honni mai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sydd yn gyfrifol—fel y deallais i yr hyn a ddywedodd—dros gael arian trosiannol ar gyfer rhai cynghorau. Disgrifia gyfeiriadau at gynnydd rhifau dwbl yn y dreth gyngor fel codi bwganod, ond derbynia y bydd cynnydd o 9 y cant. Gwnaeth Nick Bourne y pwyt hwn eisoes, ond dylid ei nodi'n gryf, na fydd y cyhoedd yn llawenhau ryw lawer ynglŷn â'r addewid na fydd y dreth gyngor uwch na 9 cant.

We must ensure that councils can control the level of council tax and that people on moderate incomes do not see this tax rise above the increase in their income in one year again. That is bad. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales's attitude towards deprivation has been attacked. I assure the Assembly that we want action now, but it is important to get it right and not to make the local council funding even more unstable. There have been problems with instability in the past. If we are going to talk about not being fully behind attacking deprivation, perhaps we should recall some of the UK Labour Government's recent actions on low incomes and benefits. We should not forget about those—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. If Members wish to make interventions, they should do so properly through standing up, or not at all.

**Janet Davies:** Above all, we must not, however indirectly or inadvertently, set community against community. That is absolutely important. The formula acknowledges that there are also single parents and others in rural communities. The formula has made a start to address inequality, but I am afraid that it has much further to go.

**Peter Law:** Make no mistake, this formula is a major improvement for local government in Wales. I understand that all the spin, rhetoric and propaganda must be heard because that is what politics is all about. However, the fact remains that what the Minister presented this afternoon is a move forwards and a target against deprivation. That is what this National Assembly is here to achieve, on behalf of the people of all the communities of Wales and, if nothing else, it is doing that.

**Owen John Thomas:** Sut y bydd y fformwla newydd yn ymwneud â phroblemau mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig sydd yn rhan o ardaloedd breintiedig, megis Butetown yng Nghaerdydd?

**Peter Law:** There is deprivation and

Rhaid inni sicrhau y gall y cynghorau reoli lefel y dreth gyngor ac na fydd pobl ar incwm cymedrol yn gweld cynnydd yn y dreth sydd yn uwch na'r cynnydd yn eu hincwm mewn blwyddyn eto. Y mae hynny'n wael. Ymosodwyd ar agwedd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales ar amddifadedd. Hoffwn sicrhau'r Cynulliad ein bod am weld gweithredu yn awr, ond mae'n bwysig gweithredu'n gywir a sicrhau na fydd arian llywodraeth leol yn fwya ansefydlog byth. Bu problemau o ran ansefydlogrwydd yn y gorffennol. Os ydym yn sôn am beidio â chefnogi'r ymgrych yn erbyn amddifadedd i'r carn, effallai y dylem gofio rhai o gamau diweddar Llywodraeth Lafur y DU ar incwm isel a budd-daliadau. Ni ddylem anghofio am y rheini—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Os yw'r Aelodau am ymyrryd, dylent wneud hyn yn briodol drwy sefyll, neu ddim o gwbl.

**Janet Davies:** Yn anad dim, rhaid inni beidio â gosod cymuned yn erbyn cymuned, boed hynny'n anuniongyrchol neu'n anfwriadol. Mae hynny'n hanfodol bwysig. Mae'r fformwla yn cydnabod bod rhieni sengl a phobl eraill hefyd mewn cymunedau gwledig. Mae'r fformwla wedi dechrau mynd i'r afael ag annhegwyd, ond ofnaf fod tipyn o ffordd i fynd.

**Peter Law:** Peidiwch â chamsynied, mae'r fformwla hon yn welliant sylweddol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Deallaf fod yn rhaid gwrando ar yr holl droelli, rhethreg a phropaganda am mai dyna natur gwleidyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw bod yr hyn a gyflwynodd y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma yn gam ymlaen ac yn darged yn erbyn amddifadedd. Dyna nod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ar ran pobl holl gymunedau Cymru, a, hyd yn oed os na wna ddim arall, mae'n cyflawni hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** How will the new formula deal with the problems of deprived areas that are a part of affluent areas, such as Butetown in Cardiff?

**Peter Law:** Mae mwy nag un fath o

deprivation. I wish you had not asked that question because when you live in a virtual reality like this one, you sometimes get a false perspective. Owen John talks about Cardiff, the capital city, and I am proud of the achievements of the council, which is Labour controlled, and what it has done for the people of Wales. However, we need some perspective when we consider these issues. When Owen John talks about Cardiff and the Valleys, he does not always look east at the Gwent Valleys. He talks about the Glamorgan Valleys. There are enough problems there. If you look at the Valley areas, you will see deprivation like no other. The formula takes account of that deprivation by looking at the relative strengths and weaknesses in each community and the vast amount of wealth in places like Cardiff compared with Merthyr Tydfil or Blaenau Gwent, which I represent. This formula takes account of that, at last, and that is right.

We are moving in the right direction, but it is not what everybody wants. I can pick holes in the formula because we, in Blaenau Gwent, cannot understand some of the things in it. However, in fairness, it takes account of the fundamental problem of social deprivation, which is what the Assembly is here to do. I pay tribute to the Welsh Local Government Association for its work with the Assembly in the past.

I listened carefully to David Davies, who is affectionately known as 'the Monmouthshire Mouth'. Many people in the Valleys communities would have found what he said offensive. Nevertheless, I am used to David. He speaks as a Conservative local government spokesman for Monmouthshire—he does not speak for Wales. He may speak for the little Conservative enclaves around Wales, but he does not speak for the greater number of people in Wales who have been asking for such a long time for something to be done to target deprivation. However, selfishness, indifference and callousness have always been the hallmarks of the Conservative Party. We know that because of the position that we are in today, having experienced two decades of Tory oppression. It is due to the situation

amddifadedd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich bod wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw am fod dyn weithiau yn cael perspectif ffug wrth fyw mewn realiti rhithwir fel yr un yn y fan yma. Mae Owen John yn sôn am Gaerdydd, y brifddinas, ac yr wyf yn falch o gyflawniadau'r cyngor, a reolir gan Lafur, a'r hyn a wnaeth dros bobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae angen rhywfaint o berspectif pan ystyriwn y materion hyn. Pan fydd Owen John yn sôn am Gaerdydd a'r Cymoedd, nid yw bob tro yn edrych i'r dwyrain i Gymoedd Gwent. Mae'n sôn am Gymoedd Morgannwg. Mae digon o broblemau ganddynt. Os edrychwch ar ardaloedd y Cymoedd, gwelwch amddifadedd heb ei debyg. Mae'r fformwla yn ystyried yr amddifadedd hwnnw drwy edrych ar gryfderau a gwendidau cymharol pob cymuned a'r cyfoeth enfawr mewn lleoedd fel Caerdydd o'i chymharu â Merthyr Tudful neu Flaenau Gwent, a gynrychiolaf. Mae'r fformwla hon yn ystyried hyn, o'r diwedd, a hynny'n gyfiawn.

Yr ydym yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir, ond nid yw pawb yn gytûn. Gallaf innau dynnu'r fformwla'n ddarnau am na allwn ni, ym Mlaenau Gwent, ddeall rhai pethau sydd ynnddi. Fodd bynnag, a bod yn deg, mae'n ystyried problem sylfaenol amddifadedd cymdeithasol, sef un o ddibenion y Cynulliad. Talaf deyrnged i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru am ei gwaith gyda'r Cynulliad yn y gorffennol.

Gwrandewais yn astud ar David Davies, a elwir wrth yr enw serchus 'Sain Sir Fynwy'. Byddai llawer o bobl yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd yn digio wrth yr hyn a ddywedodd. Eto i gyd, yr wyf yn adnabod David. Mae'n siarad fel llefarydd llywodraeth leol Geidwadol dros Sir Fynwy—nid yw'n siarad dros Gymru. Efallai ei fod yn siarad dros y cilfachau bach Ceidwadol ar draws Cymru, ond nid yw'n siarad dros y rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru a fu'n gofyn ers tro byd am gamau i dargedu amddifadedd. Fodd bynnag, mae hunanoldeb, dihidrwydd a difaterwch erioed wedi bod yn nodweddion y Blaid Geidwadol. Gwyddom hynny oherwydd ein sefyllfa heddiw, ar ôl dau ddegawd o ormes Doriáidd. Oherwydd y sefyllfa o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol—

under the Conservative Government that—

**David Davies:** Has not your party controlled Blaenau Gwent for decades?

**Peter Law:** My party has been in power in local government in Blaenau Gwent for decades and I am pleased to say that it has an AM and MP who have been fighting for social justice for the people of the community. Things would have been worse if we had not had a Labour administration in local government during those two decades of Tory oppression; we would have been off the map by now. This afternoon, I heard an ex-Tory Minister among the nine guilty men over on the Conservative side of the Chamber break cover for the first time that I am aware. The Conservatives are guilty in communities like mine where we are surrounded by deprivation because that party and those people put us in the position that we are in today. They introduced the 1996 reorganisation, but they did not introduce a funding regime nor a formula. They left us high and dry to fight our way through it.

**Nick Bourne:** You began reasonably, but since then you have given way to wild hyperbole. You said that only other politicians were guilty of sin. I remind you that your party was in central Government for a large part of the last century and, therefore, for some of the time that there has been deprivation in Blaenau Gwent, which undoubtedly exists. To try to pretend that it was all the fault of the wicked Conservatives will not wash.

**Peter Law:** You cannot get away from the fact that we had 18 years of Tory oppression. I saw what they did in my community and others saw what they did in the Valleys communities. We are paying the price for that now no matter what they say in this Chamber, as they sit in their £35,000 per year seats, eight of which were won through proportional representation. They sit here and enjoy this Assembly, after a Conservative Member of Parliament for New Forest East—that lovely place that sounds so leafy—said today that the Assembly should be wound up and abolished. If they believe that, they

**David Davies:** Onid yw eich plaid chithau wedi rheoli Blaenau Gwent ers degawdau?

**Peter Law:** Bu fy mhlaid mewn gym mewn llywodraeth leol ym Mhlaenau Gwent ers degawdau ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod ganddi AC ac AS sydd wedi ymladd dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol dros bobl y gymuned. Byddai'r sefyllfa wedi bod yn waeth pe na baem wedi cael gweinyddiaeth Lafur mewn llywodraeth leol yn ystod y ddau ddegawd hynny o ormes Doriidd; byddem wedi mynd i ebargofiant erbyn hyn. Y prynhawn yma, gwelais gyn-Weinidog Toriaidd ymhliith y naw dyn euog draw ar fainc y Ceidwadwyr yn y Siambwr yn codi ei ben am y tro cyntaf hyd y gwn i. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn euog mewn cymunedau fel fy un i lle yr ydym mewn môr o amddifadedd am fod y blaid honno a'r bobl hynny wedi ein rhoi yn y sefyllfa a wynebwn heddiw. Cyflwynasant yr ad-drefnu yn 1996, ond ni chyflwynasant drefn ariannu na fformwla. Fe'n gadawsant yn ddiynged i frwydo yn ei erbyn.

**Nick Bourne:** Dechreuausoch yn eithaf da, ond wedyn buoch yn ymollwng i ormodiaeth wylt. Dywedasoch mai dim ond gwleidyddion eraill a oedd wedi pechu. Hoffwn eich atgoffa bod eich plaid chithau mewn Llywodraeth ganolog am ran helaeth o'r ganrif ddiwethaf, ac, felly, am rywfaint o'r amser lle y bu amddifadedd ym Mhlaenau Gwent, sydd yn ddiau yn bodoli. Ni thâl geisio cymryd arnoch mai bai'r Ceidwadwyr drwg ydoedd.

**Peter Law:** Ni allwch anwybyddu'r ffaith inni ddioddef 18 mlynedd o ormes Doriidd. Gwelais yr hyn a wnaethant yn fy nghymuned i a gwelodd eraill yr hyn a wnaethant yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd. Yr ydym yn talu'n hallt am hynny yn awr waeth beth a ddywedant yn y Siambwr hon, wrth iddynt eistedd yn eu seddi £35,000 y flwyddyn, yr enillwyd wyth ohonynt drwy gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Eisteddant yma gan fwynhau'r Cynulliad hwn, ar ôl i'r Aelod Seneddol Ceidwadol dros New Forest East—y lle hyfryd hwnnw sydd yn swnian mor irlas—ddweud heddiw y dylid diddymu'r

should resign today and be out of here on principle or they should deplore what Julian Lewis said. However, they have still not said a word about it. Perhaps Uncle Mott will give us a fairy story later now that he is chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee—

**Glyn Davies** *rose—*

**Peter Law:** You were not here last week when Peter Rogers told us about Uncle Mott.

**Glyn Davies:** I noted what was said last week from my hospital bed.

You asked for one word from us to disagree with what Julian Lewis said, therefore, I will tell you that the Welsh Conservative Party is totally committed to the Assembly being a success, which is a view that I have expressed in this Chamber many times.

**Peter Law:** We welcome that. It is the only thing that the Welsh Conservatives have ever said that I have welcomed.

These deprived communities need help and support, because the deprivation is like no other. It is the cutting edge of poverty and we need—

**Helen Mary Jones:** I would like to give you the opportunity to clarify something that you said because you have repeatedly used the words ‘deprivation’ and ‘Valleys communities’ together. Of course, you are correct about that. I represent the Gwendraeth Valley and I lived in the Gwent Valleys during those years that you described and nobody can deny the depredations of the Conservative Government nor the damage that it caused.

However, will you join me in asserting that there is deprivation in communities that are defined by this formula as rural and across the road in Butetown? We cannot simply say that it is adequate to have a formula that lumps all areas together in that boundary. Therefore, as Janet Davies said, when we

Cynulliad. Os credant hynny, dylent ymddiswyddo heddiw ac ymadael fel mater o egwyddor neu dylent resynu wrth yr hyn a ddywedodd Julian Lewis. Fodd bynnag, ni ddywedasant ddim gair hyd yn hyn. Efallai y bydd Wncl Mott yn rhoi stori dylwyth deg inni yn nes ymlaen gan mai ef yw cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig bellach—

**Glyn Davies** *a gododd—*

**Peter Law:** Nid oeddech yma yr wythnos diwethaf pan fu Peter Rogers yn sôn wrthym am Wncl Mott.

**Glyn Davies:** Nodais yr hyn a ddywedwyd yr wythnos diwethaf o'm gwely yn yr ysbyty.

Gofynasoch inni am air i wrth-ddweud yr hyn a ddywedodd Julian Lewis, felly, dywedaf wrthych fod Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn hollol ymrwymedig i lwyddiant y Cynulliad, sydd yn safbwyt yr wyf wedi ei fynegi sawl gwaith yn y Siambwr hon.

**Peter Law:** Croesawn hynny. Dyna'r unig beth y dywedodd Ceidwadwyr Cymru erioed imi ei groesawu.

Mae angen help a chymorth ar y cymunedau difreintiedig hyn, am fod yr amddifadedd heb ei debyg. Dyna dlodi ar ei waethaf ac mae angen—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Hoffwn roi'r cyfle ichi egluro rhywbeth a ddywedasoch am ichi ddefnyddio'r geiriau 'amddifadedd' a 'cymunedau'r Cymoedd' gyda'i gilydd sawl gwaith. Wrth gwrs, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle yn hyn o beth. Yr wyf yn cynrychioli Cwm Gwendraeth a bûm yn byw yng Nghymoedd Gwent yn ystod y blynnyddoedd a ddisgrifiwyd gennych a ni all neb wadu difrod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol na'r niwed a barodd.

Fodd bynnag, a wnewch ymuno â mi wrth ddatgan bod amddifadedd mewn cymunedau a ddiffinnir fel rhai gwledig gan y fformwla yn ogystal ag ar draws y ffordd yn Butetown? Ni allwn ddweud bod fformwla sydd yn taflu'r holl ardaloedd ynghyd o fewn y ffin honno yn un ddigonol. Felly, fel y dywedodd

discuss deprivation, let us not divide communities and say that the north is deprived and that the south is not or vice versa. Let us not say that the Valleys are deprived and that the cities are not. Let us say that for too many years, too many people have been poor because they have been neglected by Government. Does Peter agree with me?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That was a speech. I will not allow interventions to become speeches. Many Members are guilty of that.

**Peter Law:** Helen Mary tactically took 30 seconds of my time.

4.55 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I advise Members not to give way to interventions if they know that speeches will be made instead of interventions.

**Peter Law:** I must make up for 18 months of not being on the back benches.

Forget deprivation, I am talking about total poverty, and you will not get better examples of that than where I come from. I challenge anybody to come to Blaenau Gwent. We will arrange for two buses to take the whole Assembly up there, anytime, free of charge. My council will be pleased to sponsor it and we will look after you well.

When you consider this formula, in places like Anglesey, Gwynedd, Conwy, Pembrokeshire and Caerphilly, the figure is less than 0 per cent. It is curious that no one mentioned that. Many rural areas will benefit from that. In Denbighshire, Wrexham, Carmarthenshire, Swansea, Rhondda Cynon Taff and Newport, the figure will be between 0 and 5 per cent. They have never seen such figures before, and we are seeing them now because this Assembly has got to grips with the problem and dealt with it. It will not be everybody's cup of tea, but it is a move in the right direction and it targets self-deprivation. We should support the formula fully today.

**The Minister for Finance, Local**

Janet Davies, wrth inni sôn am amddifadedd, peidier â rhannu cymunedau a dweud bod y gogledd yn ddifreintiedig tra nad yw'r de neu fel arall. Peidier â dweud bod y Cymoedd yn ddifreintiedig ac nad yw'r dinasoedd. Gadewch inni ddweud bod llawer gormod o bobl wedi bod yn dlawd am lawer gormod o flynyddoedd am iddynt gael eu hesgeuluso gan Lywodraeth. A wnaiff Peter gynto â mi?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr oedd honno'n arraith. Ni chaniatâf i ymyriadau'n droi'n areithiau. Mae llawer o'r Aelodau yn euog o hynny.

**Peter Law:** Cymerodd Helen Mary 30 eiliad o'm amser a hynny'n dactegol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cyngoraf yr Aelodau i beidio ag ildio i ymyriadau os gwyddant y cawn arraith yn hytrach nag ymyriad.

**Peter Law:** Rhaid imi wneud iawn am y 18 mis o beidio â bod ar y meinciau cefn.

Anghofiwch am amddifadedd, sôn yr wyf am dloidi llwyr, ac ni chewch enghreifftiau gwell o hynny nag yn y lle yr wyf yn hanu ohono. Rhoddaf her i unrhyw un i ddod i Flaenau Gwent. Trefnwn ddau fws i fynd â'r holl Gynulliad yno, unrhyw bryd, am ddim. Bydd fy nghyngor yn falch o'i noddi a byddwn yn cymryd gofal da ohonoch.

Wrth ystyried y fformwla hon, mewn lleoedd fel Ynys Môn, Gwynedd, Conwy, Sir Benfro a Chaerffili, mae'r ffigur yn is na 0 y cant. Mae'n rhyfedd na chrybwylodd neb hynny. Bydd llawer o'r ardaloedd gwledig yn elwa ar hynny. Yn Sir Ddinbych, Wrecsam, Sir Gaerfyrddin, Abertawe, Rhondda Cynon Taf a Chasnewydd, bydd y ffigur rhwng 0 a 5 y cant. Nid ydynt wedi gweld y fath ffigurau erioed o'r blaen, ac yr ydym yn eu gweld yn awr am fod y Cynulliad hwn wedi mynd i'r afael â'r broblem ac wedi ymdrin â hi. Ni fydd wrth fod pawb, ond mae'n gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir ac mae'n targedu hunan-amddifadedd. Dylem roi cefnogaeth lawn i'r fformwla heddiw.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth**

**Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I thank my colleague Peter Law for replying to the debate on my behalf.

I must address some points that have been raised. We need to talk about the proportion of funding distributed on the basis of sparsity and rurality. The proportion of the formula based on dispersion indicators is now similar to the current formula at around 8 per cent. The recommended formula takes on board the issues surrounding the difficulties and costs of providing services to these remote communities.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that the new formula targets sparsity payments, removing the anomalies that led to Cardiff receiving sparsity payment last year and targeting them to rural communities? Will you take on board the concerns of councils like Powys about the efficacy of some of the figures that are available in this formula and will you review them year-on-year to ensure that the statistics are fairer?

**Edwina Hart:** We need to review the figures year-on-year because we must ensure that the statistics available are fair. When I consider the gain of the total of the SSAs, the most rural authorities like Anglesey, Gwynedd, Conwy, Denbighshire, Powys, Ceredigion, Pembrokeshire, Carmarthenshire and Monmouthshire have gained.

**Gareth Jones rose—**

**Edwina Hart:** I will not give way.

David Davies referred to inefficient councils. I am fed up with this crude way of looking at matters. Ultimately, we must recognise that in local government, authorities are entitled to manage things how they wish. We put down the settlement, but it is up to them to manage their local services appropriately. We can offer guidance and indications of where we want money to be spent and I am not talking about hypothecation this year. We can give clear directions hopefully through our agreements with local government. Ultimately, local authorities have to assess

**Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Diolchaf i'm cyd-Aelod, Peter Law, am ymateb i'r ddadl ar fy rhan.

Rhaid imi ymdrin â rhai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd. Mae angen inni sôn am gyfran yr arian a ddosrennir ar sail teneurwydd a gwledigrwydd. Mae cyfran y fformwla sydd yn seiliedig ar ddangosyddion gwasgariad bellach yn debyg i'r fformwla bresennol sef tua 8 y cant. Mae'r fformwla a gynigir yn ystyried materion o ran yr anawsterau a'r costau o ddarparu gwasanaethau yn y cymunedau anghysbell hyn.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunwch fod y fformwla newydd yn targedu taliadau teneurwydd, gan ddileu'r anghysonderau a arweiniodd at Gaerdydd yn derbyn taliad teneurwydd y llynedd a'u targedu at y cymunedau gwledig? A wnewch ystyried pryderon cynghorau fel Powys ynghylch pa mor werthfawr yw rhai o'r ffigurau sydd ar gael yn y fformwla hon ac a wnewch eu hadolygu flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn er mwyn sicrhau bod yr ystadegau yn decach?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae angen inni adolygu'r ffigurau flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn am fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr ystadegau sydd ar gael yn deg. Pan edrychaf ar enillion pob un o'r Asesiadau Safonol o Wariant, mae'r awdurdodau mwyaf gwledig fel Ynys Môn, Gwynedd, Conwy, Sir Ddinbych, Powys, Ceredigion, Sir Benfro, Sir Gaerfyrddin a Sir Fynwy ar eu hennill.

**Gareth Jones a gododd—**

**Edwina Har:** Nid ildiaf.

Cyfeiriodd David Davies at gynghorau aneffeithiol. Yr wyf wedi syrffedu'n lân ar y ffordd amrwd hon o edrych ar faterion. Yn y pen draw, rhaid inni gydnabod bod hawl gan awdurdodau mewn llywodraeth leol i reoli pethau fel y mynnont. Ni sydd yn pennu'r setliad, ond hwy sydd yn gyfrifol am reoli eu gwasanaethau lleol yn briodol. Gallwn gynnig arweiniad ac arwyddion lle yr hoffem i'r arian gael ei wario ac nid sôn am bridiant yr wyf eleni. Gallwn roi cyfarwyddiadau eglur, gobeithio, drwy ein cytundebau â llywodraeth leol. Yn y pen draw, rhaid i

what they require for their local electorate and I must emphasise that point. I do not accept that problems in some areas arise from the inefficiency of Welsh local government. We were left with a mess after local government reorganisation and, as Peter Law said, some authorities were in a difficult position, but at that time, we should have considered the local funding mechanisms. It is all very well to rant like the Conservatives, but reorganisation was not done properly and we are now paying the penalty. This year, we are starting to put matters right by introducing a decent local government settlement that will ensure decent council tax levels.

**Alun Cairns:** I thank the Minister for allowing me to intervene. In condemning the Conservatives' ranting, will she also condemn the ranting from the Member for Blaenau Gwent? I cannot believe his audacity, when you consider that the only place you can find a quorum for councillors in Blaenau Gwent is in the police station—  
[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.]

**Edwina Hart:** That is the most awful comment—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I ask Alun Cairns to reconsider that remark.

**Alun Cairns:** In the interest of co-operation, I withdraw that comment.

**Edwina Hart:** I will not take more interventions, because I am aware of the important debate that is to follow. Points were raised about indicators of services. I am particularly concerned about social services, especially for the elderly. The standard methods used throughout all services did not produce population as a relevant factor in social services for the elderly. This is probably due to the fact that indicators used represented a high proportion of the elderly population. The Assembly was not able to follow the review's recommendations in this area, but we must look at further data, as the years go by, to address some of those issues.

awdurdodau lleol asesu'r hyn sydd ei angen arnynt ar gyfer eu hetholwyr lleol a rhaid imi bwysleisio'r pwynt hwnnw. Ni dderbyniaf fod problemau mewn rhai ardaloedd yn codi oherwydd aneffeithlonrwydd llywodraeth leol Cymru. Cawsom annibendod yn sgîl ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol ac, fel y dywedodd Peter Law, yr oedd rhai awdurdodau mewn sefyllfa anodd, ond bryd hynny, dylem fod wedi ystyried y dulliau ariannu lleol. Gallwch rafio a morio fel y Ceidwadwyr faint a fynnoch, ond nid ad-drefnwyd yn briodol ac yr ydym yn talu'r gosb yn awr. Eleni, yr ydym yn dechrau cywiro pethau drwy gyflwyno setliad llywodraeth leol teg a fydd yn sicrhau lefel treth gyngor deg.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ganiatâu imi ymyrryd. Wrth gondemnio rafio a morio'r Ceidwadwyr, a fydd hefyd yn condemnio arthio'r Aelod dros Flaenau Gwent? Ni allaf gredu ei haerllugrwydd, o ystyried mai'r unig le y cewch gworwm o gynghorwyr ym Mlaenau Gwent yw yng ngorsaf yr heddlu—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.]

**Edwina Hart:** Yr oedd hynny'n sylw erchyll—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnaf i Alun Cairns ailystyried y sylw hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Er mwyn cydweithredu, tynnar y sylw hwnnw yn ôl.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chymeraf ragor o ymyriadau, am fy mod yn ymwybodol o'r ddadl bwysig sydd yn dilyn. Codwyd pwyntiau ynglŷn â dangosyddion gwasanaethau. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn arbennig, yn enwedig ar gyfer yr henoed. Nid oedd y dulliau safonol a ddefnyddiwyd ar draws yr holl wasanaethau yn nodi poblogaeth fel ffactor perthnasol mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i'r henoed. Mae hyn siw'r o fod oherwydd bod y dangosyddion a ddefnyddiwyd yn adlewyrchu cyfran uchel o'r boblogaeth oedrannus. Ni allai'r Cynulliad ddilyn argymhellion yr adolygiad yn y maes hwn, ond rhaid inni ystyried rhagor o ddata, wrth i'r blynnyddoedd fynd heibio, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hynny.

There has been much talk about regression analysis, but I do not want to go into this area because I see Phil Williams looking at me. Regression analysis looks at the expenditure of all authorities against a number of explanatory factors. If an authority has overspent, its assessment is likely to be some way below its expenditure. There are issues about the way information has been collated and dealt with, but we must work through those together. There has also been much talk, particularly in relation to the amendments, about the formula's future. We must recognise that the current formula is subjective. The new formula has been developed using standard statistical methods as recommended in the independent review. I am sorry that I cannot accept Janet Ryder's amendment 2 in the case of how we develop the formula. I have given a commitment to Welsh local government that I will try to bring new data on line year on year so that we can get the changes to which Kirsty has alluded, perhaps in areas in Powys, when the good data starts to come in. There are some key areas there.

There is no attack by the Labour Government in the Assembly, or in Westminster, on local government. I value—and I will state this publicly—our partnership with local government. My concern to get this new formula through is on the basis of the partnership that we have had with local government, and the fact that we have worked with it on the formula. No formula is perfect. A formula does not solve the ills of Wales, but will help to address elements of those ills. It is only through partnership with local government and giving it the necessary freedom to operate that we will get true democracy working, and services that people want at local level. I deny that we have taken a hard line on these areas. If we ever need to have a row with local government in the interest of the people of Wales, we will have a row. In the main, we must accept that local government is our partner and is responsible for large numbers of services that we undertake.

Geraint Davies's contribution was pie in the sky. You cannot have a budget in which you

Bu cryn sôn am ddadansoddi atchwel, ond nid wyf am fanylu ar y maes hwnnw oherwydd gwelaf Phil Williams yn edrych arnaf. Mae dadansoddi atchwel yn ystyried gwariant pob un o'r awdurdodau yn erbyn nifer o ffactorau eglurhaol. Os yw awdurdod wedi gorwario, bydd ei asesiad yn debygol o fod dipyn yn is na'i wariant. Mae materion ynglŷn â'r ffodd y cafodd yr wybodaeth ei chasglu a'i thrafod, ond rhaid inni ddatrys y rhain gyda'n gilydd. Bu cryn sôn hefyd, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r gwelliannau, ynglŷn â dyfodol y fformwla. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod y fformwla bresennol yn oddrychol. Lluniwyd y fformwla newydd drwy ddefnyddio dulliau ystadegol safonol fel yr argymhellwyd yn yr adolygiad annibynnol. Mae'n ddrwg gennys na allaf dderbyn gwelliant 2 Janet Ryder o safbwyt sut yr ydym yn datblygu'r fformwla. Rhoddais ymrwymiad i lywodraeth leol Cymru y byddaf yn ceisio cyflwyno data newydd flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn fel y gallwn sicrhau'r newidiadau y cyfeiriodd Kirsty atynt, efallai mewn ardaloedd ym Mhowys, pan fydd y data da yn dechrau dod i mewn. Mae rhai meysydd allweddol yma.

Nid yw'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad, nac yn San Steffan, yn ymosod ar lywodraeth leol. Gwerthfawrogaf—a nodaf hyn yn gyhoeddus—ein partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol. Fy nod i o ran cyflwyno'r fformwla newydd hon yw ei bod ar sail y bartneriaeth â llywodraeth leol a fu gennym, a'r ffaith ein bod wedi cydweithio â hi ar y fformwla. Nid oes unrhyw fformwla yn berffaith. Ni fydd fformwla yn datrys problemau Cymru, ond bydd yn helpu i fynd i'r afael ag elfennau o'r problemau hynny. Dim ond drwy bartneriaeth â llywodraeth leol a rhoi'r rhyddid angenrheidiol iddi weithredu y cawn wir ddemocratiaeth yn gweithio, a'r gwasanaethau y mae pobl am eu cael yn lleol. Gwadaf inni fod yn llym ar yr ardaloedd hynny. Os bydd angen byth inni ddadlau gyda llywodraeth leol er budd pobl Cymru, gwnawn hynny. Ar y cyfan, rhaid inni dderbyn bod llywodraeth leol yn bartner inni ac yn gyfrifol am nifer helaeth o'r gwasanaethau yr ymgwymerwn â hwy.

Yr oedd cyfraniad Geraint Davies yn freuddwyd gwrach. Ni allwch gael cyllideb

demand, on one hand, everything for health and on the other hand, say that there must be more money for local government. Everything has to be measured in the round when you have budgetary responsibilities. This is a good local government settlement. It is 8 per cent of Assembly assistance to local government this year. We have been able to target expenditure. I am sure that when the local authorities see the full extent of the settlement, they will be pleased that we are moving in the right direction. It is difficult to move in the right direction, because there are areas of local government that have been underfunded in other years.

There has been much scaremongering. Nick, I do not know how you had the audacity to say that it has nothing to do with you. The scaremongering tactics about what will go on in Powys—12 to 14 per cent—are not true. I accept that 9 per cent as a ceiling will not upset anybody. It is up to local authorities how they set their council tax. I make funds available from the centre and they must make their position clear.

I thank everybody for their contributions to this debate. This settlement is not perfect but this is the way forward. We must recognise that there is more work to be done. I am sorry that I was not able to accept Plaid Cymru's amendments. I ask you to reject Plaid Cymru's amendments 2 and 3, and David Davies and the Welsh Conservatives' amendment 1.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 46.  
Amendment 1: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 46.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

lle yr ydych yn mynnu popeth ar gyfer iechyd ar y naill llaw, ac ar y llaw arall yn dweud bod yn rhaid rhoi mwy o arian ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Rhaid pwysio a mesur popeth yn ei gyffanrwydd pan fydd gennych gyfrifoldebau cyllidebol. Mae hwn yn setliad llywodraeth leol da. Mae'r Cynulliad yn rhoi 8 y cant o gymorth i lywodraeth leol eleni. Llwyddwyd i dargedu gwariant. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr awdurdodau lleol yn falch ein bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir pan welant y setliad cyfan. Mae'n anodd symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir am fod ardaloeedd o lywodraeth leol nad ydynt wedi cael digon o arian yn y gorffennol.

Bu cryn godi bwganod. Nick, ni wn sut y gallech fod mor haerllug â dweud nad oes a wnelo hyn ddim â chi. Mae codi bwganod ynglŷn â'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd ym Mhowys—rhwng 12 a 14 y cant—yn anwir. Derbyniaf na fydd 9 y cant fel uchafbris yn aflonyddu ar neb. Yr awdurdodau lleol fydd yn gyfrifol am sut y maent yn pennu eu treth gyngor. Yr wyf yn sicrhau bod arian ar gael o'r canol a rhaid iddynt hwy nodi eu sefyllfa yn glir.

Diolchaf i bawb am eu cyfraniadau yn y ddadl hon. Nid yw'r setliad hwn yn berffaith ond hon yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod mwy o waith i'w wneud. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na allwn dderbyn gwelliannau Plaid Cymru. Gofynnaf ichi wrthod gwelliannau 2 a 3 Plaid Cymru a gwelliant 1 David Davies a Cheidwadwyr Cymru.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth

Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected*

5:05 p.m.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 16, Yn erbyn 8.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 16, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

## Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio Audit Committee Report

**Janet Davies:** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.5, notes the annual report of the Audit Committee on reports laid before the Assembly in the previous 12 months, laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2000.*

*I am delighted to introduce to the Assembly a report on the activities of the Audit Committee over the last 12 months. I will refrain from making any Halloween jokes about witches stirring cauldrons.*

*The Audit Committee fulfils an important role as the public's financial watchdog as regards the Assembly and its sponsored bodies. It assures the people of Wales that their money has been spent properly and effectively in providing public services, with a view to providing value for money for the taxpayer.*

*I am proud to have led such an influential committee during its first year. I hope that you will agree that our report demonstrates that we have already made a significant impact. There are a number of people whom I would like to thank for their contribution to the Committee's work. First, the commitment and the enthusiasm demonstrated by the Assembly Members of all parties who have played a part on the Committee. Their hard work, attention to detail, and willingness to leave party political considerations on one side, have helped to ensure that our evidence sessions with officials have been extremely productive and that our reports have carried the full weight of a united and purposeful committee behind them. I also pay tribute to the high standards of service provided by the Auditor General for Wales, Sir John Bourn, and the National Audit Office. Their work has proved invaluable in enabling us to carry out their role effectively and in identifying the important issues that need to be addressed. I take this opportunity to offer our thanks to Jon Shortridge and the other officials who*

**Janet Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5, yn nodi adroddiad blynnyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar yr adroddiadau a osodwyd gerbron y Cynulliad yn y 12 mis diwethaf, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2000.*

*Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad adroddiad ar weithgareddau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio dros y 12 mis diwethaf. Ceisiaf beidio â gwneud unrhyw jôcs Calan Gaeaf am wrach yn troi crochan.*

*Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn cyflawni rôl bwysig fel gwarchodwr ariannol y cyhoedd o ran y Cynulliad a'r cyrff a noddir ganddo. Mae'n sicrhau pobl Cymru bod eu harian wedi'i wario'n gywir ac yn effeithiol wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, â'r bwriad o ddarparu gwerth am arian i'r t rethdalwr.*

*Mae'n bleser gennyf fod wedi arwain pwyllgor mor ddylanwadol yn ystod ei flwyddyn gyntaf. Gobeithio y byddwch yn cytuno bod ein hadroddiad yn dangos ein bod wedi gwneud argraff sylweddol eisoes. Hoffwn ddiolch i nifer o bobl am eu cyfraniad i waith y Pwyllgor. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddiolch am yr ymrwymiad a'r brwdfrydedd a ddangoswyd gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad o bob plaid sydd wedi chwarae rhan ar y Pwyllgor. Mae eu gwaith caled, eu sylw i fanylion, a'u parodrwydd i roi ystyriaethau gwleidyddol pleidiau o'r neilltu, wedi helpu i sicrhau bod ein sesiynau tystiolaeth gyda'r swyddogion wedi bod yn hynod gynhyrchiol a bod ein hadroddiadau wedi adlewyrchu gwaith pwyllgor unedig a phwrpasol. Hefyd hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'r safonau gwasanaeth uchel a ddarparwyd gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, Syr John Bourn, a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Bu eu gwaith yn amhrisiadwy wrth alluogi i ni gyflawni eu rôl yn effeithiol ac wrth nodi'r materion pwysig sydd angen ymdrin â hwy. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i*

have appeared before the Committee. Without exception, they have been knowledgeable and constructive and have accepted our comments in the spirit in which they were intended. We are grateful for their positive approach. I am glad to see Jon Shortridge back after his illness, and I am sure that the prospect of more appearances before the Audit Committee will hasten his recovery.

Before giving a factual report of the Committee's proceedings I will say a few words about the importance of the audit function, as I see it. I was ready to take a back seat on many things in the Assembly in order to chair this committee this year. There is a deep suspicion that taxpayers' money is squandered by government at all levels. I passionately want the Assembly to work, to be accepted and to achieve wider powers for the people in this country. However, it can only do this if the people think that it is run well, openly and efficiently. The Cabinet and the Subject Committees are in the front line, but the Audit Committee is crucial as the backstop and fielders for anything that might go wrong, or might be done better. It must work well, without bias, with strength, courage and determination. I hope that you feel that it has begun to do this and to understand that it is not simply the occasional riveting performance that is important, but also the less glamorous parts of its work.

During its first year, it has been productive with a wide-ranging work programme covering several important areas of public expenditure in Wales. It has undertaken eight formal examinations since September last year and produced five reports to date. These reports have led to 52 separate recommendations to the Assembly Cabinet for improving procedures and saving millions of pounds of the Assembly and taxpayers' money. I believe that the Cabinet has accepted every one of these recommendations to date.

I am particularly pleased that many of our recommendations have had far wider application than for the Assembly sponsored public body under examination at the time.

*Jon Shortridge a'r swyddogion eraill sydd wedi ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor. Heb eithriad, buont yn wybodus ac adeiladol ac maent wedi derbyn ein sylwadau yn yr ysbryd y'i bwriadwyd. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am eu hymagwedd gadarnhaol. Yr wyf yn falch o weld Jon Shortridge yn ôl ar ôl ei salwch, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr addewid o fwy o ymddangosiadau gerbron y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn cyflymu ei adferiad.*

*Cyn rhoi adroddiad ffieithiol o drasodion y Pwyllgor hoffwn ddweud ychydig o eiriau ar bwysigwydd y swyddogaeth archwilio, fel y'i gwelaf hi. Yr oeddwn yn barod i sefyll yn ôl ar lawer o bethau yn y Cynulliad er mwyn cadeirio'r pwyllgor hwn eleni. Ceir amheuaeth gref y caiff arian y trethdalwr ei wastraffu gan y llywodraeth ar bob lefel. Teimlaf yn angerddol fy mod am i'r Cynulliad fod yn llwyddiant, i gael ei dderbyn ac i gyflawni pwerau ehangach ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, dim ond os bydd y bobl o'r farn y caiff ei redeg yn dda, yn agored ac yn effeithiol y gall wneud hyn. Mae'r Cabinet a'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc yn y rheng flaen, ond mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn hanfodol fel ceidwad neu faeswr rhag ofn i unrhyw beth fynd o'i le, neu rhag ofn y gellid gwneud rhywbeth yn well. Rhaid iddo weithio'n dda, heb duedd, gyda chryfder, dewrder a phenderfyniad. Gobeithio eich bod yn teimlo ei fod wedi cychwyn gwneud hyn a'ch bod yn deall nad perffomiad gafaelgar achlysuol yn unig sydd yn bwysig, ond hefyd y rhannau llai cyfareddol o'i waith.*

Yn ystod ei flwyddyn gyntaf, bu'n gynhyrchiol gyda rhaglen waith eang yn cwmpasu sawl maes pwysig o wariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae wedi ymgymryd ag wyth archwiliad ffurfiol ers mis Medi y llynedd ac wedi cynhyrchu pump adroddiad hyd yma. Mae'r adroddiadau hyn wedi arwain at 52 o argymhellion ar wahân i Gabinet y Cynulliad ar gyfer gwella gweithdrefnau ac arbed miliynau o bunnoedd o arian y Cynulliad a'r trethdalwr. Credaf fod y Cabinet wedi derbyn pob un o'r argymhellion hyn hyd yma.

Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch fod llawer o'n hargymhellion wedi cael eu defnyddio yn llawer ehangach nag ar gyfer y corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a oedd

We have been able to identify many issues that have wide relevance throughout the Assembly, its sponsored public bodies and the health bodies.

On value for money, we took evidence from Cadw: Welsh Historic Monuments, on protecting and conserving the built heritage of Wales. The Committee stressed the importance of Cadw maintaining up to date statutory lists of buildings of special historic interest. There were 10,000 or more such buildings in Wales at that time that did not enjoy the statutory protection that they deserved.

We also held two sessions on further education in Wales, looking in particular at procurement and the scope for financial savings. We have had significant scope to improve how further education institutions manage the procurement of goods and services. The sector accepted that even a modest 2 per cent saving would generate savings of some £1.5 million a year.

On financial audit, we took evidence from Peter Gregory, Director of the NHS in Wales, on the basis of the Auditor General's Report on NHS (Wales) Summarised Accounts 1998-99. We made several recommendations for improving the financial management in the sector, which consumes one-third of the Welsh block budget.

We also took evidence from the National Museums and Galleries of Wales on a matter of an irregular settlement payment to a departing senior officer. The amount was not significant, but we established the important principles that public money should not be used as a substitute for dealing with poor performance and it certainly should not be used as a substitute for disciplinary action. I hope that our report sent an important message to all Welsh public bodies that we expect the highest possible standards in the management of their financial affairs.

The Committee has been keen to oversee the full visibility of the expenditure of public funds. It has already taken a number of steps to develop its own style of working. These include, for example, calling former accounting officers to give evidence to

yn cael ei archwilio ar y pryd. Yr ydym wedi gallu nodi llawer o faterion sydd yn berthnasol yn eang drwy'r Cynulliad, ei gyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir a'r cyrff iechyd.

Ar werth am arian, cafwyd dystiolaeth gan Cadw: Henebion Cymru, ar ddiogelu a chadw'r dreftadaeth adeiledig yng Nghymru. Nododd y Pwyllgor bwysigrwydd bod Cadw yn cynnal rhestrau statudol wedi'u diweddar o adeiladau o ddiddordeb hanesyddol arbennig. Yr oedd 10,000 neu fwy o adeiladau o'r fath yng Nghymru ar y pryd nad oeddent yn mwynhau'r diogelwch statudol yr oeddent yn ei haeddu.

Hefyd cynhaliwyd dwy sesiwn ar addysg bellach yng Nghymru, gan edrych yn benodol ar gaffaeliad a'r cyfle i wneud arbedion ariannol. Yr ydym wedi cael cyfle sylweddol i wella'r modd y mae sefydliadau addysg bellach yn rheoli caffaol nwyddau a gwasanaethau. Derbyniodd y sector y byddai arbediad cymedrol o 2 y cant yn cynhyrchu arbedion o tua £1.5 miliwn y flwyddyn.

Ar archwiliad ariannol, clywsom dystiolaeth gan Peter Gregory, Cyfarwyddwr yr NHS yng Nghymru, ar sail Adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol ar Gyfrifon Cryno NHS (Cymru) 1998-99. Gwnaethom sawl argymhelliaid i wella'r rheolaeth ariannol yn y sector, sydd yn defnyddio un rhan o dair o gyllideb bloc Cymru.

Hefyd cafwyd dystiolaeth gan Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru ar fater taliad setliad afreolaidd i uwch swyddog a oedd yn ymadael. Nid oedd y swm yn un sylweddol, ond sefydlwyd yr egwyddorion pwysig na ddylid defnyddio arian cyhoeddus i gymryd lle ymdrin â pherfformiad gwael ac yn bendant ni ddylid ei ddefnyddio i gymryd lle camau disgyblu. Gobeithio bod ein hadroddiad wedi anfon neges bwysig i holl gyrrff cyhoeddus Cymru ein bod yn disgwyl y safonau uchaf posibl wrth reoli eu materion ariannol.

Bu'r Pwyllgor yn awyddus i oruchwyllo amlgrwydd llawn y gwariant o arian cyhoeddus. Mae eisoes wedi cymryd nifer o gamau i ddatblygu ei arddull ei hun o weithio. Ymysg y rhain, er enghraift, ceir galw ar gyn swyddogion cyfrifon i roi

account for actions during their period in office. They came from the National Museums and Galleries of Wales and from the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation.

The Committee has also taken further evidence on the basis of the Government's response to a previous Public Accounts Committee report on Coleg Gwent. It may do so again, if there are reservations about the adequacy of the Cabinet's response to any of its reports.

We are holding a second session to take evidence from bodies that are directly responsible for the delivery of public services. For example, a supplementary session with two further education college principals, as a follow-up to the earlier session with the Further Education Funding Council for Wales.

Over the next 12 months, the Committee will take evidence on many areas of the Assembly's operation as well as following up examinations conducted this year. Among the topics that we have in mind are the Assembly's accommodation arrangements, the administration of European Union funds for the last tranche of these funds, drug prescribing, homelessness and rooflessness, the wind-up of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and clinical negligence. You will probably agree that those are worthwhile issues to consider. I can assure you that we will continue to be vigilant in our work so that we can all be assured that the Assembly spends its money wisely and well. I hope that the Assembly will accept the Audit Committee's annual report.

**Alison Halford:** After such positive words from the Chairman, I am reluctant to say that I wish to make a small criticism of Standing Order No. 12.7. I was saddened that I was not allowed to take part in the Audit Committee's scrutiny of the Cardiff Bay barrage discussions. Bearing in mind that it was funded by £12.5 million of taxpayers' money—some of which was north Wales taxpayers' money—I felt that that was wrong. Standing Order No. 12.7 makes it clear that

tystiolaeth i gyfrif am weithredoedd yn ystod eu cyfnod yn eu swydd. Daethant o Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru ac o Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd.

Mae'r Pwyllgor hefyd wedi cymryd tystiolaeth bellach ar sail ymateb y Llywodraeth i adroddiad blaenorol y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus ar Goleg Gwent. Gallai wneud hynny eto, os oes amheuon am ddigonolrwydd ymateb y Cabinet i unrhyw un o'i adroddiadau.

Yr ydym yn cynnal ail sesiwn i gymryd tystiolaeth gan gyrrf sydd yn gyfrifol yn uniongyrchol am ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Er enghraift, sesiwn atodol â dau bennaeth coleg addysg bellach, fel dilyniant i'r sesiwn gynharach gyda Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru.

Dros y 12 mis nesaf, bydd y Pwyllgor yn cymryd tystiolaeth ar sawl maes o weithrediad y Cynulliad yn ogystal â dilyn trywydd archwiliadau a gynhalwyd eleni. Ymysg y topigau sydd gennym mewn golwg mae trefniadau ystafelloedd ac adeiladau'r Cynulliad, gweinyddu arian yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer y rhan olaf o'r arian hwn, rhagnodi cyffurfiau, digartrefedd a'r rhai heb do uwch eu pen, diwedd Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd ac esgeulustod clinigol. Mae'n debyg y byddwch yn cytuno bod y rhain yn faterion gwerth chweil i'w hystyried. Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn yn parhau i wneud ein gwaith yn drylwyr fel y gallwn oll fod yn sicr bod y Cynulliad yn gwario ei arian yn ddoeth ac yn dda. Gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn derbyn adroddiad blynnyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio.

**Alison Halford:** Ar ôl clywed geiriau mor gadarnhaol gan y Cadeirydd, yn anffodus hoffwn wneud un feirniadaeth fach o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 12.7. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig nad oeddwn yn cael cymryd rhan yn archwiliad y Pwyllgor Archwilio o'r trafodaethau ar forglawdd Bae Caerdydd. O ystyried ei fod wedi'i ariannu gan £12.5 miliwn o arian y trethdalwr—peth ohono yn arian trethdalwyr gogledd Cymru—yr oeddwn o'r farn fod hynny'n anghywir. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.7 yn nodi

'No member of the Committee shall participate in its consideration of any issue arising in a field in which he or she is, or was at the relevant time, a member of the relevant subject committee.'

5.15 p.m.

The underlying purpose is to ensure that any person with a conflict of interest is not allowed to participate when the Committee deals with matters relating to the aforementioned interest. My central concern is how conflicting must a member's interest be to prevent that member from participating? The short time that the Local Government and Housing Committee had the issue of the barrage on its agenda was not enough to debar me. It did not make sense to me that another Assembly Member, who is geographically attached to Cardiff Bay by virtue of her constituency, was able to remain on the Committee and take part in the evidence session. The geographical location of an AM's constituency must be part of the equation of who can or who cannot stand. Standing Order No. 12.7 needs to be reconsidered. I have written to people, but nothing has been done yet. As a Member for north Wales, I am entitled to take part in such deliberations where a great deal of taxpayers' money in my constituency must go to a south Wales barrage project.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Wrth gefnogi'r adroddiad, talaf deyrnged i waith Janet Davies fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Bu ei phrofiad yn werthfawr a llwyddodd i gadw gwaith y Pwyllgor uwchben gwleidyddiaeth plaid fel y dylai fod. Ategaf gammoliaeth Janet i waith Syr John Bourn, Archwiliyd Cyffredinol Cymru, a'i dîm. Cawsom fantais sylwedol o brofiad Syr John ac o'i gyfrifoldebau eraill. Efallai y bydd angen i'r Cynulliad chwilio am ei archwilydd ei hun i Gymru yn y dyfodol, heb y ddolen gyswllt â'r drefn yn Llundain. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn gwneud y peth iawn wrth fanteisio ar brofiad ac arbenigedd Syr John a'i dîm.

'Ni chaiff unrhyw aelod o'r Pwyllgor gymryd rhan wrth i'r Pwyllgor ystyried unrhyw fater sydd yn codi mewn maes lle y mae ef neu hi, neu yr oedd ar yr adeg berthnasol, yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Pwnc perthnasol.'

Y pwrrpas sylfaenol yw sicrhau na chaiff unrhyw berson sydd â gwrthdaro buddiant gymryd rhan pan fydd y Pwyllgor yn ymdrin â materion sydd yn ymwneud â'r buddiant y cyfeiriwyd ato ynghynt. Fy mhrif bryder yw pa mor wrthdrawiadol y mae'n rhaid i fuddiant aelod fod er mwyn atal yr aelod hwnnw rhag cymryd rhan? Nid oedd yr amser byr yr oedd gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai fater y morglawdd ar ei agenda yn ddigon i'm gwahardd i. Nid oedd yn gwneud synnwyr i mi fod Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad, sydd yn gysylltiedig yn ddaearyddol â Bae Caerdydd oherwydd ei hetholaeth, yn gallu parhau i fod ar y Pwyllgor a chymryd rhan yn y sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth. Rhaid i leoliad daearyddol etholaeth AC fod yn rhan o'r cwestiwn yn ymwneud â phwy a all sefyll a phwy na all sefyll. Mae angen ailystyried Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.7. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at bobl, ond ni wnaethpwyd unrhyw beth eto. Fel Aelod dros ogledd Cymru, mae gennyf hawl i gymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau o'r fath lle bod yn rhaid i swm sylwedol o arian trethdalwyr yn fy etholaeth i fynd i broiect morglawdd yn ne Cymru.

**Dafydd Wigley:** In supporting the report, I pay tribute to the work of Janet Davies as Chair of the Audit Committee. Her experience has been valuable and she succeeded in keeping the Committee's work apart from party politics, as it should be. I endorse Janet's praise of the work of Sir John Bourn, the Auditor General for Wales, and his team. We benefitted greatly from Sir John's experience and from his other responsibilities. Perhaps the Assembly will have to look for its own auditor for Wales in the future, without being linked to the London system. However, at the moment, we are doing the right thing by taking advantage of the experience and expertise of Sir John and his team.

Beth bynnag yw gwendidau San Steffan a'r drefn Brydeinig—tynnaf sylw yn aml at nifer o wendidau—mae natur llywodraeth ym Mhrydain yn gymharol lân ac yn gymharol rydd o lygredd. Un o negeseuon cychwynnol y Cynulliad oedd dangos i Gymru, ac i'r byd, fod gennym gyfundrefn gyhoeddus sydd yn lân, yn agored ac yn gwbl rydd o lygredd. Dangosodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio ein hymrwymiad i'r egwyddorion hynny drwy'r modd y bu inni gytuno i gais Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru am adnoddau. Cynigiodd Syr John dri opsiwn: cyllideb fechan, un dderbyniol neu un anrhyydeddus. Rhoesom gyllideb anrhyydeddus iddo. Ymatebodd Syr John drwy ddweud y byddai'n talu yn ôl inni drwy sicrhau arbedion o leiaf saith gwaith yn fwy na'r swm a fuddsoddom yn ei waith.

Gadewch i'r Cynulliad gyfleo'r neges ein bod yn cymryd gwaith archwilio o ddifrif, a disgwyliwn i holl gyrff cyhoeddus Cymru ddilyn ein hesiampl. Daeth y neges honno'n glir drwy'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad a'r Pwyllgor Archwilio wedi gweithio. Archwiliwyd nifer o gyrff cyhoeddus yn fanwl a chaled. Er archwilio'n galed, yr oedd hefyd yn deg a chwrtas, sydd yn wahanol i ymddygiad rhai pwylgorau archwilio yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Mae'n werth ailadrodd un hanesyn. Bûm mewn cyfarfod yn ddiweddar lle'r adroddodd unigolyn am ei brofiad yn ymddangos gerbron ein Pwyllgor. Dywedodd

'I never, ever, want to go through that experience again.'

Dyna'r neges y dylid ei gyfleo i gyrff cyhoeddus Cymru. Os oes unrhyw gorff yn camddefnyddio arian neu yn defnyddio systemau ac arian yn aneffeithiol, bydd y Cynulliad yn galw'r cyfryw gorff i gyfrif. Mae'r cyrff hynny o dan feicrosogop, yn sgil bodolaeth y Cynulliad. Maent yn atebol, a gwae hwy os anghofiant hynny.

Un peth yw canfod camweddau, peth arall yw eu cywiro a sicrhau'r arbedion cyllidol. Rhaid cael mwy nag adroddiadau swmpus a deifiol gan Syr John a'i dîm. Rhaid eu dilyn a gofalu bod y cyrff sydd wedi dangos y gallant arbed arian yn gwireddu'r targedau hynny.

Whatever the weaknesses of Westminster and the British system—and I draw attention to them frequently—the nature of government in Britain is comparatively clean and comparatively free of corruption. One of the Assembly's first messages was to show Wales, and the world, that we have a public system that is clean, open and completely free of corruption. The Audit Committee showed our commitment to those principles through the way in which we agreed to the Auditor General for Wales's request for resources. Sir John offered three options: a small budget, an acceptable one or an honourable one. We gave him an honourable budget. Sir John responded by saying that he would pay us back by ensuring a minimum seven-fold saving on the amount we invested in his work.

Let the Assembly convey the message that we take the work of auditing seriously and that we expect every public body in Wales to follow our example. That message has been reinforced by the way the Assembly and the Audit Committee have worked. Several public bodies have been subject to a detailed and rigorous audit. Although it was rigorous, it was also fair and courteous, which is different to the conduct of some of the audit committees in the House of Commons. It is worth repeating one story. I attended a meeting recently where an individual recounted his experience of appearing before our Committee. He said

'Nid wyf byth bythoedd am fynd drwy'r profiad yna eto.'

That is the message that should be conveyed to public bodies in Wales. If any body misuses money, or uses money or systems inefficiently, the Assembly will call that body to account. Those bodies are under a microscope because of the Assembly's existence. They are accountable, and woe betide them if they forget that.

It is one thing to find transgressions, it is another to correct them and secure the financial savings. We need more than hefty and scathing reports by Sir John and his team. They must be followed up and it must be ensured that the bodies that have shown

Golyga hynny fod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidogion ddilyn argymhellion y Pwyllgor a sicrhau y gweithredir hwy. Yr wyf yn falch eu bod wedi eu derbyn mewn egwyddor, ond rhaid troi hynny yn realiti yn awr. Fel arall, nid oes unrhyw siawns o ennill saith gwaith y buddsoddiad y cyfeiriodd Syr John ato. Er enghraifft, clustnododd y Pwyllgor ffyrdd y gellid arbed £1.5 miliwn y flwyddyn yn y sector addysg bellach. Drwy gyfrwng y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, rhaid sicrhau y cymerir camau i weithredu hynny.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd fod Gweinidogion yn rhoi ar ddeall i'r adrannau sydd yn atebol iddynt eu bod yn cydweithio'n bositif ac yn adeiladol ag ymdrechion Syr John Bourn a'i dîm a'u bod yn disgwyl yr un peth gan yr adrannau a'r cwangos sydd yn atebol iddynt. Er enghraifft, nododd yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol bosibiliadau i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru sicrhau arbedion o bron i £200,000 drwy arbed ynni a gwneud gwell defnydd o'i adeiladau. Ymateb y WDA oedd ceisio creu amheuon ynglŷn â sail asesiad yr archwilydd. Mae'n hanfodol bwysig fod pob adran ac asiantaeth yn edrych ar waith yr archwilydd yn bositif. Wedi'r cyfan, os llwyddir i arbed arian, bydd yr adnoddau hynny ar gael i'w defnyddio'n fwy effeithiol gan y cyfryw gorff. Rhaid peidio â chaniatâu i fuddiannau unigolion neu gystadleuaeth ryngadrannol lesteirio gwaith pwysig yr archwilydd. Tynnodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio sylw hefyd at ddiffyg cyfarfodydd rhwng Gweinidogion a'r cwangos sydd dan eu gofal, ac mae hynny eto yn welliant i'r sefyllfa gyfredol.

Mater arall y mae'n rhaid tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad ato yw sefyllfa rhai cyrff yng Nghymru sydd yn gwario arian cyhoeddus ond nad ydynt yn agored i gael eu harchwilio gan yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol. Un enghraifft yw Cyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru, sydd â statws cwmni cyfyngedig. Ymddengys o adroddiadau diweddar ei fod yn bosibl y bydd yn rhaid iddo ad-dalu £500,000 i Frwsl oherwydd aneffeithlonrwydd. Nid oes gennyf ddiddordeb mewn dilyn hyn o safbwyt unigolion, ond rhaid i gyrrff fel CBAC fod yn agored i gael eu harchwilio gan yr

that they can save money fulfil those targets. That means that the Government and the Ministers must follow the Committee's recommendations and ensure that they are implemented. I am pleased that they have been accepted in principle, but that must now be turned into reality. Otherwise, there is no chance of gaining the seven-fold investment to which Sir John referred. For example, the Committee earmarked ways in which £1.5 million a year could be saved in the further education sector. Through the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, we must ensure that steps are taken to implement that.

It is also important that Ministers convey to the departments that are accountable to them that they are co-operating positively and constructively with the efforts of Sir John Bourn and his team and that they expect the same of the departments and the quangos that are accountable to them. For example, the Auditor General noted possibilities for the Welsh Development Agency to ensure savings of nearly £200,000 by saving energy and making better use of its buildings. The WDA's response was to attempt to create doubts about the basis of the auditor's assessment. It is essentially important that all departments and agencies look positively at the auditor's work. After all, if financial savings are secured, those resources will be available for more effective use by the organisation concerned. Individuals' interests or inter-departmental competition must not be allowed to hamper the auditor's important work. The Audit Committee also drew attention to a lack of meetings between Ministers and the quangos for which they are responsible, and that is also an improvement to the current situation.

Another matter that must be brought to the Assembly's attention is the situation of some bodies in Wales that spend public money but are not open to inspection by the Auditor General. One example is the Welsh Joint Education Committee, which has limited company status. It seems from recent reports that it is possible that it will have to repay £500,000 to Brussels due to inefficiency. I am not interested in pursuing this from the point of view of individuals, but bodies such as the WJEC must be open to inspection by the Auditor General. Sir John Bourn has

Archwilydd Cyffredinol. Mae Syr John Bourn eisoes wedi datgan fod arno eisiau'r hawliau hynny. Galwaf felly ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gydlynu gyda Llywodraeth Prydain yn San Steffan er mwyn agor pob corff o'r fath—ac y mae llawer ohonynt—i archwiliad. Er hyn, yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r adroddiad.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I want to put on record how much I have enjoyed being a member of the Audit Committee. I thank Janet Davies, who has chaired the Committee in a professional, but friendly manner. One of the Committee's attractions for me, and I am sure that this is true of all the members, is that it cuts across party political boundaries. The Committee keeps an eye on the public purse, which is in all of our interests. It also acts as a watchdog for the implementation of, for instance, best value, and helps to identify financial irregularities and sleaze. The Audit Committee plays an important part in building confidence in public bodies.

**Alun Cairns:** The Audit Committee is one of the National Assembly's most important Committees. Irrespective of anyone's view on devolution, either before or after the referendum, no one can deny that it has led to scrutiny of Government policies and, in particular, of the agencies that follow through many of those policies. That is one of the Audit Committee's key benefits. I was delighted that, when we voted on the Auditor General's budget and were provided with a matrix of three options, the Audit Committee recommended to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities that we chose the higher option, which meant spending £1 million or so on investigation into the administration. I applaud the Government for accepting that recommendation and for making the necessary budget allocations.

I pay tribute to the chair of the Audit Committee, who has managed the Committee's affairs extremely effectively ensuring that no witness has left the Committee without being adequately questioned and that the Committee members have been wholly facilitated in pursuing their objectives.

already stated that he wants those rights. I therefore call on the Government of Wales to work with the British Government in Westminster to open up all such bodies—of which there are many—to inspection. Nevertheless, I am pleased to support the report.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Hoffwn gofnodi cymaint yr wyf wedi mwynhau bod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Hoffwn ddiolch i Janet Davies, sydd wedi cadeirio'r Pwyllgor mewn modd proffesiynol, ond cyfeillgar. Un o atyniadau'r Pwyllgor i mi, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod hyn yn wir am yr holl aelodau, yw ei fod yn torri ffiniau pleidiau gwleidyddol. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn cadw llygad ar arian cyhoeddus, sydd o fudd i bawb ohonom. Mae hefyd yn gweithredu fel gwarchodwr ar gyfer gweithredu, gwerth gorau er enghraifft, ac yn helpu i nodi afreoleidd-dra ariannol a llygredd. Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn chwarae'r rôl bwysig wrth adeiladu hyder mewn cyrff cyhoeddus.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn un o Bwyllgorau pwysicaf y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Heb ystyried barn unrhyw un ar ddatganoli, naill ai cyn neu ar ôl y refferendwm, ni all neb wadu ei fod wedi arwain at archwiliadau o bolisiâu'r Llywodraeth ac, yn arbennig, o'r asiantaethau sydd yn dilyn trywydd llawer o'r polisiâu hynny. Dyna un o fanteision allweddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Roeddwn wrth fy modd fod y Pwyllgor Archwilio, pan bleidleisiwyd ar gyllideb yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol a chafwyd matrics o dri opsiwn, wedi argymhell i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Cymunedau ein bod wedi dewis yr opsiwn uchaf, oedd yn golygu gwario tua £1 miliwn ar archwiliad i'r gweinyddiad. Cymeradwyaf y Llywodraeth am dderbyn yr argymhelliaid hwnnw ac am wneud y lwfansau cyllid angenheidiol.

Talaf deyrnged i gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, sydd wedi rheoli materion y Pwyllgor yn hynod effeithiol gan sicrhau nad oes unrhyw dystion wedi gadael y Pwyllgor heb gael eu cwestiynnú'n ddigonol a bod aelodau'r Pwyllgor wedi'u cynorthwyo'n llawn wrth gyflawni eu hamcanion.

5.25 p.m.

It has already been said that the Audit Committee is a non-political Committee that approaches everything on non-political lines. This must be preserved and guarded in every way possible, as that is how the Audit Committee gets to the bottom of the issues that are presented to it and, in the long term, seeks to save taxpayers' money. I remember Sir John Bourn, the Auditor General—to whom I would also like to pay tribute—saying that the saving that we would make would be approximately seven times the amount that we had made available to him. We can only achieve that by maintaining the Committee in a non-political way.

One concern that I have is that, on some occasions, as Janet Davies mentioned in her address, we had to call back the former chief executives of organisations. Michael Boyce, the former chief executive of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, was one example. Unfortunately, the Audit Committee did not have the power to do that. If we wanted to formally summons someone, we would have to use the Public Accounts Committee in the House of Commons. In future, the powers must be granted to the Audit Committee in the National Assembly for Wales so that we can call on whoever we wish, rather than rely on the co-operation of people such as Michael Boyce or the other person whom Janet mentioned.

The Audit Committee's operation is not a witch-hunt. It is aimed at exposing malpractice and mismanagement, with the ultimate objective of saving money in the long term. It involves preserving taxpayers' interests, rather than exposing individuals for capital gain.

I appreciate that time is tight, but I must comment on one matter of regret. Some witnesses who were called before the Committee tended to give rambling answers to difficult questions to avoid Committee members getting to the issue. I know that the Committee Chair is keen to expose this in the Committee to ensure that we get to the bottom of issues. Due to the time constraints,

Dywedwyd eisoes bod y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn Bwyllgor anwleidyddol sydd yn ymdrin â phopeth ar linellau anwleidyddol. Rhaid cadw a diogelu hyn ym mhob ffordd bosibl, gan mai dyna sut y mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn datrys y materion a gyflwynir iddo ac, yn yr hir dymor, yn ceisio arbed arian y trethdalwr. Cofiaf Syr John Bourn, yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol—yr hoffwn hefyd dalu teyrnged iddo—yn dweud y byddai'r arbedion y byddem yn ei wneud tua saith gwaith y swm yr oeddem wedi ei roi ar gael iddo. Dim ond drwy gynnal y Pwyllgor mewn modd anwleidyddol y gellir cyflawni hynny.

Un pryder sydd gennyl yw ein bod, ar rai adegau, fel y nododd Janet Davies yn ei hanerchiad, wedi gorfod galw cyn brif weithredwyr sefydliadau yn ôl. Roedd Michael Boyce, cyn brif weithredwr Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, yn un enghraift. Yn anffodus, nid oedd gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio y pŵer i wneud hynny. Os oeddem am alw rhywun yn ffurfiol, byddai'n rhaid i ni ddefnyddio'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Yn y dyfodol, rhaid rhoi'r pwerau i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fel y gallwn alw ar pwy bynnag y dymunwn, yn hytrach na dibynnu ar gydweithrediad pobl megis Michael Boyce neu'r person arall a grybwylloedd Janet.

Nid erledigaeth yw gweithrediad y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Caiff ei anelu at ddatguddio camweddau a chamreolaeth, gyda'r amcan terfynol o arbed arian yn y tymor hir. Mae'n cynnwys cadw buddiannau trethdalwyr, yn hytrach na datguddio unigolion ar gyfer elw cyfalaf.

Gwerthfawrogaf bod yr amser yn dynn, ond rhaid i mi roi sylwadau ar un mater o bryder. Yr oedd rhai o'r tystion a alwyd gerbron y Pwyllgor yn dueddol o roi atebion hirwyntog i gwestiynau anodd i osgoi aelodau'r Pwyllgor rhag trafod y mater. Gwn fod Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn awyddus i ddatguddio hyn yn y Pwyllgor i sicrhau ein bod yn datrys materion. Oherwydd y

I will close by saying that lessons must be learnt. If we are to make political gain from the Audit Committee, that should be in the lessons that are being learnt and in ensuring that they are followed through.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** Very briefly, I echo the words of everyone who has spoken in the debate on approving the Audit Committee's annual report. The Cabinet supports the Committee's excellent work. Like most others, I single out Janet's work as Committee Chair. She has done an excellent job. I also echo Dafydd Wigley's remarks in commending the Committee's work when he said that a witness expressed a desire never to go through the experience again. Although the Permanent Secretary and others may not echo this, I hope that the Audit Committee gains a similar reputation to that of the Public Accounts Committee in the House of Commons for the rigour and independence of its work. I endorse the report of the Audit Committee.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Janet Davies to respond to the debate. I know that the session has extended beyond 5.30 p.m., but I will be flexible by five minutes.

**Janet Davies:** I will not speak for five minutes. I thank Members for supporting the Audit Committee and for their kind remarks. Although there is not much to say in summing up, I will pick up on a few points. On Alison's comments, the Audit Committee does not have the power to ignore Standing Orders. We cannot say that we do not like them and go our own way. We foresaw the problem with the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and requested that the Business Committee amend Standing Orders. The Assembly in Plenary amended them to allow a substitute to attend a Committee meeting when a member was debarred because that member had been discussing an issue in a Subject Committee. That substitution was offered to all the affected members at the time. Standing Orders have been reconsidered by the Business Committee, but it was not felt possible to amend them. I do not think that that is a criticism of the Audit

cyfngiadau amser, byddaf yn cloi drwy ddweud bod yn rhaid dysgu gwersi. Os ydym am ennill yn wleidyddol o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio, dylai hynny fod o ganlyniad i wersi a gaiff eu dysgu ac wrth sicrhau y ceir dilyniant iddynt.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Yn fyr iawn, hoffwn ategu geiriau pawb sydd wedi siarad yn y drafodaeth ar gymeradwyo adroddiad blynnyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae'r Cabinet yn cefnogi gwaith ardderchog y Pwyllgor. Fel y rhan fwyaf o'r lleill, nodaf yn arbennig waith Janet fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor. Gwnaeth waith ardderchog. Hefyd ategaf sylwadau Dafydd Wigley yn canmol gwaith y Pwyllgor pan ddywedodd bod dyst yn dymuno pedio â mynd drwy'r profiad byth eto. Er hwyrach na fydd yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ac eraill yn ategu hyn, gobeithio y bydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn ennill enw tebyg i un y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin am drylwyrdd ac annibyniaeth ei waith. Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Janet Davies i ymateb i'r drafodaeth. Gwn bod y sesiwn wedi mynd heibio i 5.30 p.m., ond byddaf yn hyblyg o bum munud.

**Janet Davies:** Ni fyddaf yn siarad am bum munud. Diolch i'r Aelodau am gefnogi'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ac am eu sylwadau caredig. Er nad oes llawer i'w ddweud i grynhau, hoffwn godi rhai pwntiau. Ar sylwadau Alison, nid oes gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio y pŵer i anwybyddu Rheolau Sefydlog. Ni allwn ddweud nad ydym yn eu hoffi a dilyn ein trywydd ein hunain. Rhagwelwyd y broblem gyda Chorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd a gofynnwyd i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ddiwygio Rheolau Sefydlog. Diwygiodd Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad hwy i alluogi i rywun gymryd lle aelod a gaiff ei wahardd mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor oherwydd bod yr aelod hwnnw wedi bod yn trafod mater mewn Pwyllgor Pwnc. Cynigiwyd hyn i'r holl aelodau yr effeithiwyd arnynt ar y pryd. Ailystyriwyd Rheolau Sefydlog gan y Pwyllgor Busnes, ond ni theimlwyd ei bod yn bosibl eu diwygio. Ni chredaf fod hynny yn

Committee. I cannot accept that.

I note Dafydd's comments on the WJEC. The Audit Committee has no brief to examine the WJEC. Our remit is restricted to the Assembly, Assembly sponsored public bodies and the health service. However, if you want someone else to consider that matter, I think that that would be a good idea.

I note Alun's point about formal summons of witnesses. Perhaps the Audit Committee's greatest weapon in our armoury is that if a witness refuses to appear before it because we cannot summon him or her formally, the Chair of the Committee can state publicly that that person has decided not to appear before it. I agree with you about the rambling answers. This is a learning process for every Audit Committee member. We need to prevent witnesses giving rambling answers in order to use up time and avoid perhaps nastier questions later on.

I do not have anything else to say other than I hope that you will accept the report.

feirniadaeth o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Ni allaf dderbyn hynny.

Nodaf sylwadau Dafydd ar CBAC. Nid oes gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio friff i archwilio CBAC. Mae ein cylch gorchwyl wedi'i gyfyngu i'r Cynulliad, cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Fodd bynnag, os ydych am i rywun arall ystyried y mater hwnnw, credaf y byddai hynny'n syniad da.

Nodaf bwynt Alun ar alw tystion yn ffurfiol. Efallai mai arf gorau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yw os yw tyst yn gwrthod ymddangos ger ei fron am na allwn ei alw neu ei galw yn ffurfiol, gall Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor nodi'n gyhoeddus bod y person hwnnw wedi penderfynu peidio ag ymddangos ger ei fron. Cytunaf â chi ynghylch yr atebion hirwyntog. Mae hon yn broses ddysgu i bob aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae angen i ni atal tystion rhag rhoi atebion hirwyntiog er mwyn defnyddio'r amser ac osgoi cwestiynau a allai fod yn fwy cas yn nes ymlaen.

Nid oes gennyf unrhyw beth arall i'w ddweud heblaw fy mod yn gobeithio y byddwch yn derbyn yr adroddiad.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Barrett, Lorraine
- Bates, Mick
- Black, Peter
- Bourne, Nick
- Cairns, Alun
- Davies, Andrew
- Davies, David
- Davies, Geraint
- Davies, Glyn
- Davies, Janet
- Davies, Jocelyn
- Davies, Ron
- Essex, Sue
- Evans, Delyth
- Feld, Val
- German, Michael
- Gibbons, Brian
- Graham, William
- Halford, Alison
- Hancock, Brian
- Hart, Edwina
- Hutt, Jane
- Jones, Elin
- Law, Peter

Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbynwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i Aelodau am eu cydweithrediad yn y cyfarfod heddiw, sydd yn awr wedi dod i ben. **The Presiding Officer:** I thank Members for their co-operation in today's meeting, which is now at an end.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.33 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.33 p.m.*