



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher 30 Hydref 2002**

**Wednesday 30 October 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol  
*Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services*
- 14 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes  
*Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning*
- 24 Datganiad ar y Strategaeth Faeth  
*Statement on the Nutrition Strategy*
- 36 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Diwygio'r GIG a'r Proffesiynau Gofal Iechyd 2002  
*Delegation of the Functions of the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Act 2002*
- 48 Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru  
*The Annual Report of the Health Service Commissioner for Wales*
- 57 Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Weinidog Cymru  
*The First Minister's Annual Report*
- 91 Dadl Fer: Mae'r Rheol 20 Diwrnod yn Lladd Ffermio a Marchnadoedd Da Byw a Rhaid ei Dileu—Nawr  
*Short Debate: The 20 Day Rule is Killing Farming and Livestock Auctions and Must Go—Now*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Ymchwil i Ganser yng Nghymru Cancer Research in Wales**

**Q1 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on cancer research in Wales? (OAQ19784)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am pleased to announce that I am making funds available to set up a Welsh translational cancer research centre that will be underpinned by a Welsh cancer tumour bank. Wales will now be part of a UK-wide cancer research network that will link laboratory research findings to patients' care. It is good news for patients and for health professionals across Wales.

**Kirsty Williams:** That is indeed good news. You will be aware that professionals and cancer charities in Wales are keen that this proposal should go ahead. Do you agree that the development of the tumour bank and our participation in INTRAC will be a huge boost to recruiting high-quality specialists to Wales?

**Jane Hutt:** Yes, it will be a huge boost and I know that Professors Mason and Maughan of Velindre hospital are delighted with today's news. Also, it supports all the other top-class professionals in cancer services in Wales. It strengthens our successful Wales cancer trials network, which we support and which engages with people with cancer across Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno mai pwysigrwydd ymchwil trosglwyddiadwy, fel y banc canser hwn, yw bod yr ymchwil ei hun yn gwella'r claf?

**Jane Hutt:** That is vitally important. It will link clinical and lifestyle information with data from the analysis of tumour samples

**C1 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ymchwil i ganser yng Nghymru? (OAQ19784)

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi fy mod yn rhyddhau arian sydd ar gael i sefydlu canolfan cymhwys ymchwil canser Cymru ac y bydd banc tiwmor canser Cymru yn sail iddi. Bydd Cymru bellach yn rhan o rwydwaith ymchwil canser ledled y DU a fydd yn cysylltu canfyddiadau ymchwil labordy â gofal cleifion. Mae'n newyddion da i gleifion ac i weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol ledled Cymru.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae hyn yn newyddion da iawn. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol ac elusennau canser yng Nghymru yn awyddus i'r cynllun hwn fynd yn ei flaen. A gytunwch y bydd datblygu'r banc tiwmor a'n cyfranogiad yn INTRAC yn hwb mawr i recriwtio arbenigwyr o safon i Gymru?

**Jane Hutt:** Cytunaf. Bydd yn hwb mawr a gwn fod yr Athro Mason a'r Athro Maughan yn ysbyty Felindre yn hapus iawn â'r newyddion heddiw. Yn ogystal, mae'n cefnogi'r holl weithwyr proffesiynol eraill o'r radd flaenaf mewn gwasanaethau canser yng Nghymru. Mae'n cryfhau ein rhydwraith llwydiannus o dreialon canser yng Nghymru, a gefnogir gennym ac sy'n cysylltu â phobl sy'n dioddef o ganser ledled Cymru.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a general practitioner. Does the Minister agree that the importance of translational research, such as this cancer bank, is that the research itself improves patient health?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Bydd yn cysylltu gwybodaeth glinigol a gwybodaeth am ffordd o fyw â data a gesglir

across Wales. It will ultimately inform decisions on the treatment of individual patients and ensure that Wales is at the forefront of this UK development.

**Alun Pugh:** Following the recent decision to allow everybody to bring 3,000 cigarettes through customs, duty-free, for their personal consumption, do you accept that the need for cancer research will be greater than ever? Do you also accept that unless we are serious about reducing smoking in Wales, we will continue to lose 7,000 people per year from smoking-related diseases?

**Jane Hutt:** That is right. It puts into stark contrast our challenge in combating tobacco, which annually kills over 7,000 people in Wales. That is a minimum estimate. We must ensure that our action against smoking is as vigorous as our support for the new cancer tumour bank.

**David Melding:** As you know, better research can improve the treatment of patients and encourage the recruitment of key staff. However, do you share my grave concern that our five-year survival rates remain so low? They are among the lowest in Europe.

**Jane Hutt:** Signing up to this important translational research for the tumour bank indicates our will, which is mirrored across the UK, to improve survival rates. We must ensure that our cancer networks, which are now operational, work with our multidisciplinary teams in Wales to deliver those survival rates. We are making progress in ensuring that the minimum standard for people being referred from a GP to consultant is 10 days. We are making great progress, and that will improve survival rates.

o ddadansoddi samplau tiwmorau ledled Cymru. Yn y pen draw bydd yn llywio penderfyniadau ar drin cleifion unigol ac yn sicrhau bod Cymru ar y blaen o ran y datblygiad hwn yn y DU.

**Alun Pugh:** Yn dilyn y penderfyniad diweddar i ganiatáu i bawb ddod â 3,000 o sigarennau drwy'r tollau, yn ddi-doll, at eu defnydd personol, a dderbyniwch y bydd yr angen am ymchwil canser yn fwy nag erioed? A gytunwch hefyd, oni bai ein bod o ddifrif am leihau ysmegu yng Nghymru, y byddwn yn parhau i golli 7,000 o bobl y flwyddyn o ganlyniad i afiechydon sy'n gysylltiedig ag ysmegu?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n gywir. Mae'n cyferbynnu'n llwyr â'n her i drechu tybaco, sydd yn lladd dros 7,000 o bobl yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Yr amcangyfrif lleiaf yw hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein camau gweithredu yn erbyn ysmegu mor gadarn â'n cefnogaeth i'r banc tiwmorau canser newydd.

**David Melding:** Fel y gwyddoch, gall gwell ymchwil wella triniaeth cleifion a'i gwneud yn haws i recriwtio staff allweddol. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder mawr bod ein cyfraddau goroesi pum mlynedd yn parhau mor isel? Maent ymysg yr isaf yn Ewrop.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae ymuno â'r ymchwil gymhwysio bwysig hon ar gyfer y banc tiwmorau yn nodi ein hewyllys, a adlewyrchir ledled y DU, i wella cyfraddau goroesi. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein rhwydweithiau canser, sydd yn weithredol bellach, yn gweithio gyda'n timau amlddisgyblaethol yng Nghymru i gyrraedd y cyfraddau goroesi hynny. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd i sicrhau mai 10 diwrnod yw'r safon gofynnol ar gyfer pobl a gyfeirir gan feddyg teulu at ymgynghorydd. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd mawr, a bydd hynny'n gwella cyfraddau goroesi.

#### **Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin Carmarthenshire NHS Trust**

**Q2 Helen Mary Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the current financial

**C2 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sefyllfa ariannol

position of the Carmarthenshire NHS Trust? (OAQ19777)

**Jane Hutt:** The Carmarthenshire NHS Trust is forecasting a £6.002 million end-year deficit for 2002-03. This amount has been agreed between the trust, Dyfed Powys Health Authority and the Welsh Assembly Government within the 2002-03 service and financial framework. The trust board, as part of the Dyfed Powys health community, is reviewing its options to bring the trust into an underlying financially balanced position.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You will be aware of concerns in Carmarthenshire that the plan that the trust is developing may fundamentally affect basic services, such as the 24-hour accident and emergency services at Llanelli. Although it is right that the trust should put its financial house in order, can you assure us that you will not agree to any plan that fundamentally cuts back on front-line services?

**Jane Hutt:** Front-line services are vital to every district general hospital and to Carmarthenshire trust. Given that there were 7,500 more emergency admissions over the past two years in Wales, the prominence of our accident and emergency facilities is key and at the top of the agenda. Therefore, I will monitor decisions made by that trust carefully.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Further to that, there is clearly a financial problem with rural healthcare generally. Will you commit yourself to considering the position of rural healthcare? We have suffered depletion of services, which are again underlined by the waiting list position, as announced today.

Following on from what was rightly said about Carmarthenshire trust, will you undertake to safeguard the accident and

gyfredol Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin? (OAQ19777)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin yn rhagweld diffyg o £6.002 miliwn ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ar gyfer 2002-03. Cytunwyd ar y swm hwn gan yr ymddiriedolaeth, Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel rhan o'r fframwaith gwasanaeth ac ariannol ar gyfer 2002-03. Mae bwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth, fel rhan o gymuned iechyd Dyfed Powys, yn adolygu ei opsiynau i sicrhau bod yr ymddiriedolaeth mewn sefyllfa sylfaenol gybtwys o ran ei harian.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon yn Sir Gaerfyrddin y gall y cynllun y mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn ei ddatblygu effeithio yn y bôn ar wasanaethau sylfaenol, megis y gwasanaethau 24 awr yn Llanelli i ymdrin â damweiniau ac achosion brys. Er ei bod yn iawn y dylai'r ymddiriedolaeth roi trefn ar ei harian, a allwch roi sicrwydd inni na fyddwch yn cytuno ar unrhyw gynllun a fydd yn cwtogi yn sylfaenol ar wasanaethau rheng flaen?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gwasanaethau rheng flaen yn hanfodol i bob ysbyty cyffredinol y dosbarth ac i ymddiriedolaeth Sir Gaerfyrddin. O gofio bod 7,500 yn fwy o bobl wedi cael eu derbyn i'r ysbyty fel achosion brys yng Nghymru dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, mae pwysigrwydd ein cyfleusterau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn fater allweddol sydd ar frig yr agenda. Felly, byddaf yn monitro penderfyniadau a wnaed gan yr ymddiriedolaeth honno yn ofalus.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ymhellach at hynny, mae'n amlwg bod problem ariannol yn gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd yng nghefn gwlad yn gyffredinol. A ymrwymwch eich hun i ystyried sefyllfa gofal iechyd yng nghefn gwlad? Mae'r gwasanaethau wedi lleihau a phwysleisir hyn eto gan sefyllfa'r rhestrau aros, fel y cyhoeddwyd heddiw.

Yn dilyn yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn gywir am ymddiriedolaeth Sir Gaerfyrddin, a gytunwch i ymgymryd â diogelu gwasanaethau'r adran

emergency cover there? It faces the prospect of being closed on a 24-hour basis. The service has only been moved as a temporary measure. Can you categorically say today that that will not be countenanced and that it should provide permanent cover?

**Jane Hutt:** Clearly, there are longstanding financial problems in the Dyfed Powys Health Authority that I inherited as Minister for Health and Social Services three and a half years ago. The cumulative deficit for this health authority amounted to over £35 million in March 2002. Last year, I gave £3.5 million of strategic assistance to Carmarthenshire NHS Trust. We agreed that we would write off the debt in April 2003 if the trust could achieve financial recovery. We are monitoring that situation carefully. However, we must safeguard those front-line services and any move of any description to reduce them would have to be subject to full consultation.

damweiniau ac achosion brys yno? Mae'n wynebu'r posibilrwydd o fod ar gau 24 awr y dydd. Symudwyd y gwasanaeth fel mesur dros dro yn unig . A allwch chi ddweud yn bendant heddiw nad awdurdodir hynny ac y dylai'r gwasanaethau fod ar gael yn barhaol?

**Jane Hutt:** Yn amlwg, mae problemau ariannol hirsefydlog yn Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys, problemau a etifeddais fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol dair blynedd a hanner yn ôl. Ym mis Mawrth 2002, yr oedd cyfanswm y diffyg cronol ar gyfer yr awdurdod hwn yn fwy na £35 miliwn. Y llynedd, rhoddais £3.5 miliwn o gymorth strategol i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin. Bu inni gytuno y byddem yn dileu'r ddyled ym mis Ebrill 2003 pe byddai'r Ymddiriedolaeth yn gallu sicrhau adferiad ariannol. Yr ydym yn monitro'r sefyllfa yn ofalus. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ddiogelu'r gwasanaethau rheng flaen hynny a rhaid i unrhyw awgrym o'r fath i'w cwtdgi fod yn destun ymgynghoriad llawn.

### **Triniaeth Radiotherapi Radiotherapy Treatment**

**Q3 Alun Cairns:** What proportion of Welsh patients requiring radiotherapy is treated within the set guidelines for treatment? (OAQ19803)

**Jane Hutt:** This information is not currently held centrally by the Welsh Assembly Government. However, there are plans to establish cancer data sets for Wales and when they are complete, they will hold details on all cancer patients in Wales and will enable us to determine our success in fighting cancer and to focus on our priorities.

**Alun Cairns:** What answer can you offer one of my constituents who was forced to wait almost six months for radiotherapy treatment following a lumpectomy, when the medical guidelines from the Royal College of Radiologists state that she should have received treatment within four weeks? The patient does not want warm words, but action on what you are doing to rectify this problem.

**C3 Alun Cairns:** Pa gyfran o gleifion Cymru y mae angen radiotherapi arnynt sy'n cael eu trin yn unol â'r canllawiau penodol ar gyfer y driniaeth? (OAQ19803)

**Jane Hutt:** Ar hyn o bryd, ni chaiff y wybodaeth hon ei chadw'n ganolog gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae cynlluniau i sefydlu setiau o ddata canser ar gyfer Cymru, a phan fyddant wedi'u cyflawni bydd ganddynt fanylion am bob claf sy'n dioddef o ganser yng Nghymru a byddant yn ein caniatáu i benderfynu ar ein llwyddiant wrth ymladd canser a chanolbwyntio ar ein blaenoriaethau.

**Alun Cairns:** Pa ateb y gallwch ei gynnig i un o'm hetholwyr a orfodwyd i aros bron chwe mis am driniaeth radiotherapi yn dilyn llawdriniaeth i waredu lwmp, pan fo canllawiau meddygol Coleg Brenhinol y Radiolegwyr yn datgan y dylai fod wedi derbyn triniaeth o fewn pedair wythnos? Nid geiriau o gydymdeimlad sydd eu hangen ar y claf, ond camau gweithredu fel rhan o'r hyn

It is a personal operation and to have to wait almost six months for the necessary radiology treatment is unacceptable.

**Jane Hutt:** The cancer services co-ordinating group, which co-ordinates the development of our clinical networks for cancer services, reissued its minimum standards of care for all major cancer types during autumn 2000. Standards relating to radiotherapy treatment endorse the good practice guide laid down by the royal college. The guide states that the first out-patient appointment should be within two weeks of referral and that urgent radiotherapy should start within 24 hours, palliative radiotherapy within two weeks and radical therapy within four weeks. It is vital that those minimum standards are adhered to by the trusts in Wales. The £3.5 million extra funding invested in cancer services should enable them to do so. We want to monitor that carefully. The extra £8 million I am investing to improve and update the equipment for diagnostic, imaging and radiotherapy as a result of this year's budget will also make an impact and a contribution.

**Peter Black:** The extra money being invested into cancer services is important. How do we ensure that the radiotherapists are in place to spend that money effectively and reduce waiting times?

2:10 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** That is critical. Our workforce plans indicate that 2,000 additional allied health professionals are needed, including radiotherapists. The trusts are now enacting those 10-year plans and implementing additional training. This is also about recruitment and retention strategies; we have asked every trust in Wales to draft their strategies to coincide with our national strategy. That will enable people to have a work-life balance, to ensure continual professional development and to ensure that they have up-to-date equipment. The new CAT and MRI scanners and other imaging equipment that the Assembly is funding

yr ydych yn ei wneud i unioni'r broblem hon. Mae'n llawdriniaeth bersonol ac nid yw'n dderbyniol gorfod aros bron chwe mis am y driniaeth radiolegol angenrheidiol.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r grŵp cydgysylltu gwasanaethau cancer, sy'n cydgysylltu datblygiad ein rhwydweithiau clinigol ar gyfer gwasanaethau cancer, wedi ailgyhoeddi yn ystod hydref 2000 ei safonau gofal gofynnol ar gyfer pob prif fath o ganser. Mae safonau sy'n gysylltiedig â thriniaeth radiolegol yn ategu'r canllaw arferion da a bennwyd gan y coleg brenhinol. Noda'r canllaw y dylai'r apwyntiad cyntaf i glaf allanol fod o fewn pythefnos i'w gyfeirio ac y dylai radiotherapi brys ddechrau o fewn 24 awr, radiotherapi lliniarol o fewn pythefnos a therapi radical o fewn pedair wythnos. Mae'n hanfodol bod yr ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru yn glynu wrth y safonau gofynnol hynny. Dylai'r £3.5 miliwn ychwanegol a fuddsoddiwyd mewn gwasanaethau cancer ganiatáu iddynt wneud hynny. Yr ydym am fonitro hynny'n gywir. Yn ogystal, bydd yr £8 miliwn ychwanegol yr wyf yn ei fuddsoddi yng ngwella a diweddarau'r cyfarpar at ddibenion diagnostig, delweddu a radiotherapi o ganlyniad i gyllideb eleni yn cael effaith ac yn gwneud cyfraniad.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r arian ychwanegol a fuddsoddir mewn gwasanaethau cancer yn bwysig. Sut y sicrhawn fod radiotherapyddion ar gael i wario'r arian hynny'n effeithiol a lleihau amseroedd aros?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n hanfodol. Mae ein cynlluniau gweithlu yn nodi bod angen 2,000 o weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol perthynol, yn cynnwys radiotherapyddion. Mae'r ymddiriedolaethau yn mabwysiadu'r cynlluniau 10 mlynedd hynny yn awr ac yn cynnig hyfforddiant ychwanegol. Mae a wnelo hyn hefyd â strategaethau recriwtio a chadw; yr ydym wedi gofyn i bob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru lunio eu strategaethau drafft i gyd-fynd â'n strategaeth genedlaethol. Bydd hynny'n caniatáu i bobl gael cydbwysedd rhwng gwaith a bywyd, sicrhau datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus a sicrhau bod y cyfarpar diweddaraf ganddynt.

directly are making a difference to recruitment and retention, which I hope will address the manpower issues in radiotherapy in Wales.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a pharmacist. Minister, every cancer patient should experience a reasonably short, anxiety-free wait and be well informed about their treatment. How will you ensure that patients have access to someone, perhaps a specialist nurse, who knows about a particular cancer, has the time to listen to the patient's concerns and can explain the system to them?

**Jane Hutt:** We have pioneered multidisciplinary teams through our cancer networks. Those teams include nurses, pharmacists, doctors and consultants in primary and secondary care. The teams are working effectively across Wales and ensuring that patients have a personal, one-to-one treatment from each professional within the multidisciplinary team.

Mae'r sganwyr CAT ac MRI newydd a chyfarpar delweddu arall y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei ariannu yn uniongyrchol yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i'r broses o recriwtio a chadw. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n mynd i'r afael â phroblemau staff radiotherapi yng Nghymru.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel fferylllydd. Weinidog, dylai pob claf sy'n dioddef o ganser ddisgwyl y bydd y cyfnod aros yn un byr a dibryder a dylai gael digon o wybodaeth am ei driniaeth. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau y gall cleifion gysylltu â rhywun, efallai nyrs arbenigol, sy'n gwybod am ryw ganser penodol, sydd â'r amser i wrando ar bryderon y cleifion ac sy'n gallu esbonio'r systemau wrthynt?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym wedi arloesi timau amlddisgyblaethol drwy ein rhwydweithiau canser. Mae'r timau hynny'n cynnwys nyrsys, fferyllwyr ac ymgynghorwyr sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol ac eilaidd. Mae'r timau'n gweithio'n effeithiol ledled Cymru ac yn sicrhau bod cleifion yn cael triniaeth bersonol, unigol gan bob gweithiwr proffesiynol o fewn y tîm amlddisgyblaethol.

### **Cymhorthion Clywed Digidol Digital Hearing Aids**

**Q4 Lynne Neagle:** Will the Minister make a statement on the waiting list for digital hearing aids in Gwent? (OAQ19795)

**Jane Hutt:** In February 2001, I announced a package of measures to modernise and improve audiology services in Wales and to pave the way for the introduction of new technology hearing aids. Funding has been issued to trusts and health authorities and a programme of improvements for facilities and the training of audiologists has been undertaken across Wales. New technology hearing aids have been available from all trusts from August 2002 and there has been an enthusiastic take-up of reassessment appointments by hearing aid users and for assessments for new users.

**Lynne Neagle:** I welcome the decision to introduce these hearing aids. They will make

**C4 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y rhestr aros am gymhorthion clywed digidol yng Ngwent? (OAQ19795)

**Jane Hutt:** Ym mis Chwefror 2001, cyhoeddais becyn o fesurau i foderneiddio a gwella gwasanaethau clywedeg yng Nghymru i baratoi'r ffordd ar gyfer cyflwyno cymhorthion clywed sy'n defnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf. Rhyddhawyd arian i ymddiriedolaethau ac awdurdodau iechyd a chynhaliwyd rhaglen o welliannau ar gyfer cyfleusterau a hyfforddi clywedegwyr ledled Cymru. Bu cymhorthion clywed y dechnoleg ddiweddaraf ar gael gan bob ymddiriedolaeth ers mis Awst 2002 a bu ymateb brwdfrydig ymhlith defnyddwyr cymhorthion clywed i drefnu apwyntiadau ailasesu ac ar gyfer asesu defnyddwyr newydd.

**Lynne Neagle:** Croesawaf y penderfyniad i gyflwyno'r cymhorthion clywed hyn.



a tremendous difference to the lives of those who receive them. However, a number of my constituents face long waits simply for assessments. They have been told that about 2,000 people are now waiting in Gwent. Will the Minister investigate the situation in Gwent and take whatever action is necessary to ensure speedy access to this important service?

**Jane Hutt:** That is partially a measure of the success of the investment in new digital hearing aids across Wales. It is an all-Wales plan. Before we initiated the programme for hearing aid users, we needed to ensure that we had staff and facilities. Clearly, the investment was made: £2.25 million was invested last year, with an additional allocation of £1.7 million, and a further £0.7 million in the draft budget this year. Many people have come forward as a result. We must ensure that that is managed effectively to give precedence to clinical priority. However, I will see if there are any particular problems in Gwent, as it is rolling out effectively across the rest of Wales.

**William Graham:** Minister, can you not recognise that you are running the NHS in Wales in a shambolic way? You underestimated the demand for digital hearing aids. Will you instruct your officials to refrain from calling people for ear tests who then, within two days, receive letters saying that it is delayed with months of waiting before they are called again?

**Jane Hutt:** That is a pathetic response to a new initiative that has been widely welcomed by audiology and scientific professionals working across Wales as well as all the teams who are delighted that the Welsh Assembly Government has invested the money. We are ahead of the game in instituting these new digital hearing aids. It means that people are coming forward, and that is right and proper. However, it must be on the basis of clinical need and assessment. The new digital hearing aids are not appropriate to everybody's need and we must see that this is managed

Byddant yn trawsnewid bywydau y rhai sy'n eu defnyddio. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o fy etholwyr yn wynebu cyfnod hir o ddisgwyl am asesiadau yn unig. Dywedwyd wrthynt bod oddeutu 2,000 o bobl yn disgwyl yng Ngwent. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymchwilio i'r sefyllfa yng Ngwent a chymryd pa gamau bynnag sydd eu hangen i sicrhau y bydd pobl yn gallu defnyddio'r gwasanaeth hwn cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n rhannol yn fesur o lwyddiant y buddsoddiad mewn cymhorthion clywed digidol newydd ledled Cymru. Mae'n gynllun i Gymru gyfan. Cyn inni gychwyn y rhaglen ar gyfer defnyddwyr cymhorthion clywed, yr oedd yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym staff a chyfleusterau. Yn amlwg, gwnaethpwyd y buddsoddiad: buddsoddiwyd £2.25 miliwn y llynedd, a dyrannwyd swm ychwanegol o £1.7 miliwn, ynghyd â £0.7 miliwn arall yn y gyllideb ddrafft eleni. Mae nifer o bobl wedi ymateb o ganlyniad i hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau y rheolir hynny'n effeithiol er mwyn rhoi blaenoriaeth glinigol yn gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, edrychaf i weld a oes unrhyw broblemau penodol yng Ngwent, gan fod y gwaith yn mynd rhagddo'n effeithiol yng ngweddill Cymru.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, oni allwch gydnabod eich bod yn rhedeg y GIG yng Nghymru mewn ffordd gwbl ddi-drefn? Ni fu ichi ragweld y galw am gymhorthion clywed digidol. A roddwch gyfarwyddyd i'ch swyddogion i ymatal rhag galw pobl am broffion clyw, gan eu bod, o fewn deuddydd, yn derbyn llythyrau yn dweud bod y prawf wedi'i ohirio ac y bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros am fisoedd eto cyn cael eu galw?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n ymateb truenus i fenter newydd sydd wedi'i chroesawu'n eang gan glywedegwyr a gwyddonwyr proffesiynol sy'n gweithio ledled Cymru yn ogystal â'r holl dimau sydd yn falch iawn bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi buddsoddi'r arian. Yr ydym yn arloesi wrth gyflwyno'r cymhorthion clywed digidol newydd hyn. Mae'n golygu bod pobl, yn gwbl gywir, yn gwneud cais. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i hynny fod ar sail angen ac asesiad clinigol. Nid yw'r cymhorthion clywed digidol newydd yn bodloni anghenion pawb a

carefully. It has been managed strategically across Wales. I have received letters of support from the Royal National Institute for the Deaf, audiologists across Wales, and from patients whose lives are being transformed. We must support and not undermine this tremendous new initiative and investment.

**Rosemary Butler:** I congratulate Jane on this innovative initiative. My father became deaf after Dunkirk, so I know that having a good quality hearing aid makes a great difference. Will you give us a report on the numbers of people who have already benefited from this scheme?

**Jane Hutt:** I will issue that report and circulate it to all Members. Thousands have benefited since August. That has meant that staff have been working hard and we are recruiting more people to work in audiology in Wales.

rhaid inni sicrhau y rheolir hyn yn ofalus. Fe'i rheolwyd yn strategol ledled Cymru. Yr wyf wedi derbyn llythyrau o gefnogaeth gan Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol Pobl Fyddar, clywedegwyr o bob rhan o Gymru, a chan gleifion y cafodd eu bywydau eu trawsnewid. Rhaid inni gefnogi, nid tansellio, y fenter aruthrol newydd hon ynghyd â'r buddsoddiad.

**Rosemary Butler:** Hoffwn longyfarch Jane ar y fenter arloesol hon. Aeth fy nhad yn fyddar ar ôl Dunkirk, felly gwn fod cael cymhorthion clywed o ansawdd da yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr. A roddwch adroddiad inni ar nifer y bobl sydd wedi elwa ar y cynllun hwn eisoes?

**Jane Hutt:** Cyhoeddaf yr adroddiad hwnnw a'i ddsbarthu i'r Aelodau i gyd. Bu hyn o fudd i filoedd ers mis Awst. Golygodd hynny y bu'r staff yn gweithio'n galed ac yr ydym yn recriwtio mwy o bobl i weithio mewn clywedeg yng Nghymru.

### **Hybu Iechyd Health Promotion**

**Q5 Phil Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on her plans to develop health promotion as the most cost-effective way of improving health throughout Wales? (OAQ19770)

**Jane Hutt:** Health promotion is a key way of improving health in Wales. The Government's commitment to developing health promotion is demonstrated in 'Well Being in Wales', the new national public health service, the national service framework and the statutory requirement for local health, social care and wellbeing strategies.

**Phil Williams:** My everyday lifestyle was radically changed by a health promotion campaign called Heartbeat Wales. Is it not a serious misdirection of health priorities that, this year, only 0.13 per cent of the NHS budget is devoted to health promotion? According to the draft budget, by 2005-06, even including the £375,000 transferred to public health, that appallingly low percentage will be cut even further to 0.12 per cent. A

**C5 Phil Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei chynlluniau i sicrhau mai hybu iechyd yw'r ffordd fwyaf cost effeithiol o wella iechyd yng Nghymru? (OAQ19770)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hybu iechyd yn ffordd allweddol o wella iechyd yng Nghymru. Dangosir ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i ddatblygu hybu iechyd yn 'Lles yng Nghymru', y gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol newydd, y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol a'r gofyniad statudol am strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles lleol.

**Phil Williams:** Newidiwyd fy ffordd o fyw yn sylweddol gan ymgyrch hybu iechyd o'r enw Curiad Calon Cymru. Onid yw'r ffaith mai dim ond 0.13 y cant o gyllideb y GIG eleni sydd wedi'i neilltuo i hybu iechyd yn golygu bod blaenoriaethau iechyd wedi'u camgyfeirio'n ddifrifol? Yn ôl y gyllideb ddrafft, erbyn 2005-06, hyd yn oed gan gynnwys y £375,000 a drosglwyddwyd i iechyd cyhoeddus, cwtoir y ganran

boost in health promotion would have a far better outcome than the much greater budget for reorganisation.

**Jane Hutt:** Unfortunately, your colleagues, Dai Lloyd and Geraint Davies, did not tell you that that issue was explained at the Health and Social Services Committee meeting last week. The information in the draft budget on health promotion was a technical adjustment relating to where the health promotion stream was placed. Health promotion funding has not been reduced and I am sorry that they did not seek to explain that to you, Phil, before you raised your question. However, your question is important. 'Well Being in Wales', which I hope you have looked at, is not only the responsibility of the health and social services main expenditure group—it is also that of education, housing, environment, economic development, transport and is part of the whole Assembly agenda to improve health and wellbeing through health promotion. All Welsh Assembly Cabinet Ministers and the Assembly have a part to play in that.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Are you aware of a scheme run by Condomi, which has recruited 4,000 students to sign up to the rather enviable task of being paid as condom testers? Is this the type of cost-effective health promotion that the Minister for Health and Social Services has in mind? It seems to be an innovative way of combating student debt and sexually transmitted diseases.

**Jane Hutt:** That is the second infantile question that the Welsh Conservatives have asked today. This is a serious issue. We have a sexual health strategy in Wales, which has been endorsed by your colleagues in the Health and Social Services Committee and by the Assembly. It is a serious strategy to prevent the transmission of sexually transmitted disease and to ensure that protection, in terms of contraception, is available for young people. Many projects throughout Wales are doing important work

arswydus o isel honno ymhellach i 0.12 y cant. Byddai rhoi hwb i'r gwaith o hybu iechyd yn arwain at ganlyniadau llawer gwell na'r hyn a geir o'r gyllideb llawer mwy ar gyfer ad-drefnu.

**Jane Hutt:** Yn anffodus, ni ddywedodd eich cyd-Aelodau, Dai Lloyd a Geraint Davies, wrthy ch yr esboniwyd y mater hwnnw yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr oedd y wybodaeth yn y gyllideb ddrafft yn addasiad technegol yn ymwneud â ble y gosodwyd y ffrwd hybu iechyd. Ni ostyngwyd yr arian ar gyfer hybu iechyd ac yr wyf yn flin na wnaethant geisio esbonio hynny ichi, Phil, cyn ichi ofyn eich cwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, mae eich cwestiwn yn un pwysig. Nid yw 'Lles yng Nghymru', y gobeithiaf eich bod wedi ei ddarllen, yn gyfrifoldeb prif grŵp gwariant iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn unig—mae hefyd yn gyfrifoldeb addysg, tai, yr amgylchedd, datblygu economaidd, trafniadaeth ac mae'n rhan o agenda'r Cynulliad cyfan i wella iechyd a lles drwy hybu iechyd. Mae gan holl Weinidogion Cabinet Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Cynulliad ran i'w chwarae yn hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A ydych yn ymwybodol o gynllun a gynhelir gan Condomi, sydd wedi recriwtio 4,000 o fyfyrwyr i gymryd rhan yn y dasg dra dymunol o gael eu talu i brofi condomau? Ai dyma'r math o hybu iechyd cost-effeithiol sydd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol mewn golwg? Ymddengys ei bod yn ffordd wreiddiol i fynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr a chlefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol.

**Jane Hutt:** Dyna'r ail gwestiwn plentynaidd y mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi ei ofyn heddiw. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol. Mae gennym strategaeth iechyd rhywiol yng Nghymru, a gymeradwywyd gan eich cyd-Aelodau yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a chan y Cynulliad. Mae'n strategaeth ddifrifol i atal y broses o drosglwyddo clefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol ac i sicrhau bod diogelwch, o ran dulliau atal cenhedlu, ar gael i bobl ifanc. Mae llawer o brosiectau

and I am sure that Jane Davidson would agree that students should be the first port of call.

ledled Cymru yn cyflawni gwaith pwysig ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Jane Davidson yn cytuno mai myfyrwyr ddylai gael y flaenoriaeth.

### **Darpariaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Social Service Provision**

**Q6 Mick Bates:** How does the Minister intend to work with local authorities to improve social service provision? (OAQ19768)

**Jane Hutt:** This is an important issue. I work with local authorities through responsible partnership. We must be clear regarding the strengths and weakness of the provision and we must secure the commitment of authorities to deal with the problems that exist. We must also seek constructive ways forward to improve services. That approach has worked with authorities subject to adverse reports in the past, and it will continue to work. We must ensure that we have good local services in order to safeguard the welfare of vulnerable people.

**Mick Bates:** Would it not be better, in the interest of health service users in terms of accountability and efficiency, for social services directors, rather than senior social services officers, to sit on local health boards?

2:20 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** Social services directors have an important statutory duty to improve standards and safeguard services for the most vulnerable people in their communities. Local health boards have a statutory duty to develop health, social care and wellbeing strategies. Elected members and senior local authority officials will sit on those boards. It is important that the board has a member with social services expertise, but we are allowing local authorities to decide whether that should be a director or another senior social services manager. That person will contribute with elected members and other health professionals, which should safeguard those services. Local authorities have prime responsibility for social services, and we

**C6 Mick Bates:** Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i wella'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? (OAQ19768)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Gweithiaf gydag awdurdodau lleol drwy bartneriaeth gyfrifol. Rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â chryfderau a gwendidau'r ddarpariaeth a rhaid inni sicrhau ymrwymiad awdurdodau i ddelio â'r problemau sy'n bodoli. Rhaid inni hefyd geisio ffyrdd adeiladol o symud ymlaen er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau. Mae'r ymagwedd honno wedi gweithio gydag awdurdodau yn dilyn adroddiadau anffafriol yn y gorffennol, a bydd yn parhau i weithio. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym wasanaethau lleol da er mwyn diogelu lles pobl ddiamddiffyn.

**Mick Bates:** Oni fyddai'n well, er budd defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd o ran atebolrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd, i gyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn hytrach nag uwch swyddogion gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, fod yn aelodau o ffyrddau iechyd lleol?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gan gyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ddyletswydd statudol bwysig i wella safonau a diogelu gwasanaethau ar gyfer y bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yn eu cymunedau. Mae gan ffyrddau iechyd lleol ddyletswydd statudol i ddatblygu strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles. Bydd aelodau etholedig ac uwch swyddogion awdurdodau lleol yn aelodau o'r byrddau hynny. Mae'n bwysig bod gan y bwrdd aelod sy'n meddu ar arbenigedd ym maes gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond yr ydym yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol benderfynu a ddylai'r aelod hwnnw fod yn gyfarwyddwyr neu'n uwch reolwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol arall. Bydd y person hwnnw yn cyfrannu gydag

must ensure that they are accountable.

aelodau etholedig a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol eraill, a dylai hynny ddiogelu'r gwasanaethau hynny. Awdurdodau lleol sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am wasanaethau cymdeithasol, a dylem sicrhau eu bod yn atebol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Will the Minister allow her officials to work with officials of Cardiff County Council to remedy the problems that have arisen following the publication of the joint review on the council? Councillor Goodway of Cardiff authority has directly appealed for that. If she will not, why not?

**Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ganiatáu i'w swyddogion weithio gyda swyddogion o Gyngor Sir Caerdydd i unioni'r problemau sydd wedi deillio yn sgîl cyhoeddi'r adolygiad ar y cyd ar y cyngor? Mae'r Cyngorydd Goodway o awdurdod Caerdydd wedi apelio'n uniongyrchol am hynny. Os na wnaiff, pam hynny?

**Jane Hutt:** As leader of a local authority, Pauline—I have met with you in that capacity—you know about social services inspections. I meet and treat all leaders and senior officers of each authority the same in terms of their joint reviews. I discuss the action plans that are expected from these joint reviews with them, and then I await their response to my recommendations and their action plans, which they must deliver and develop for themselves. That is the process that I am currently following with Cardiff authority, as I did with Pauline's and all other authorities in Wales, which had joint reviews.

**Jane Hutt:** Fel arweinydd awdurdod lleol, Pauline—yr wyf wedi cael cyfarfodydd â chi yn rhinwedd y swydd honno—yr ydych yn ymwybodol o arolygiadau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn cwrdd ag arweinwyr ac uwch swyddogion pob awdurdod a byddaf yn delio â phob un yn yr un ffordd o ran eu hadolygiadau ar y cyd. Trafodaf y cynlluniau gweithredu sy'n ddisgwyliedig o'r adolygiadau ar y cyd hyn gyda hwy, ac yna arhosaf am eu hymateb i'm hargymhellion a'u cynlluniau gweithredu hwy, y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu cyflwyno a'u datblygu eu hunain. Dyna'r broses yr wyf yn ei dilyn ar hyn o bryd gydag awdurdod Caerdydd, fel y gwneuthum gydag awdurdod Pauline a holl awdurdodau eraill Cymru, a fu'n destun adolygiad ar y cyd.

**Richard Edwards:** Minister, further to the response of the Minister with responsibility for local government to my question on 16 October, will you investigate the pre-emptive rubbishing of an imminent joint review report on Pembrokeshire social services department by the leader of the council, who has publicly cast aspersions on the competence of the inspectors and invited all to ignore its findings?

**Richard Edwards:** Weinidog, ymhellach i ymateb y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros lywodraeth leol i'm cwestiwn ar 16 Hydref, a wnewch chi ymchwilio i achos arweinydd Cyngor Sir Penfro, sydd wedi dilorni adroddiad yr adolygiad ar y cyd o adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol y sir cyn iddo gael ei gyhoeddi ac sydd wedi lladd yn gyhoeddus ar allu'r arolygwyr ac wedi gwahodd pawb i anwybyddu ei ganfyddiadau?

**Jane Hutt:** The joint review report for Pembrokeshire is due for publication in mid November, and I understand that the leader of the council has written to the local press denying that he rubbished the outcome of that review, saying that the council will make any improvements that are called for. I will

**Jane Hutt:** Bwriedir cyhoeddi adroddiad yr adolygiad ar y cyd ar gyfer Sir Benfro yng nghanol mis Tachwedd, a deallaf fod arweinydd y cyngor wedi ysgrifennu at y wasg leol yn gwadu ei fod wedi dilorni canlyniad yr adolygiad hwnnw, gan ddweud y gwnaiff y cyngor unrhyw welliannau sydd

address that matter when I read the joint review. These joint reviews are considered to be powerful, independent, authoritative and credible reviews of social services departments. We have seen a turn-around in the services of authorities that had adverse reports, and we expect the same of every other authority that receives an adverse report.

eu hangen. Af i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw pan ddarllenaf yr adolygiad ar y cyd. Ystyrir bod yr adolygiadau ar y cyd hyn yn adolygiadau pwerus, annibynnol, awdurdodol a chredadwy o adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Yr ydym wedi gweld newid sylweddol yng ngwasanaethau'r awdurdodau a dderbyniodd adroddiadau anffafriol, a disgwyliwn yr un peth gan bob awdurdod arall sy'n derbyn adroddiad anffafriol.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning**

### **Cyfrifon Dysgu Unigol Individual Learning Accounts**

**Q1 Pauline Jarman:** Will the Minister make a statement on any developments in introducing a successor scheme to the disbanded individual learning account programme? (OAQ19743)

**C1 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw ddatblygiadau o ran cyflwyno cynllun i olynu'r rhaglen cyfrifon dysgu unigol a ddiddymwyd? (OAQ19743)

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** In partnership with Education and Learning Wales, we are developing a better-targeted individual learning account programme, building on the strengths of the original, using evidence gathered from external evaluations, internal reviews and the lessons learned from the other UK countries. When I receive assurances from the national council that it has the required robust systems in place to deliver the successor programme, I will announce a start date.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mewn partneriaeth â Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, yr ydym yn datblygu rhaglen cyfrifon dysgu unigol wedi'i thargedu'n well, gan adeiladu ar gryfderau'r rhaglen wreiddiol, a chan ddefnyddio tystiolaeth a gasglwyd o werthusiadau allanol, adolygiadau mewnol a'r gwersi a ddysgwyd o wledydd eraill yn y DU. Pan dderbyniaf sicrwydd gan y cyngor cenedlaethol fod ganddo'r systemau cadarn angenrheidiol ar waith i gyflwyno'r rhaglen i olynu'r cyfrifon dysgu unigol, byddaf yn cyhoeddi dyddiad dechrau.

**Pauline Jarman:** Minister, you suspended the scheme last December. Do you have any idea what happened to the money that ELWa earmarked in its budget for individual learning accounts?

**Pauline Jarman:** Weinidog, gohiriwyd y cynllun gennych ym mis Rhagfyr y llynedd. A oes gennych unrhyw syniad beth a ddigwyddodd i'r arian a glustnodwyd gan ELWa yn ei gyllideb ar gyfer cyfrifon dysgu unigol?

**Jane Davidson:** I will have to respond to that question in writing. However, over 80,000 people in Wales registered an interest in the original programme, with more than 44,000 people going on to undertake learning. Of those who used the individual learning accounts, 89 per cent said that their learning met or exceeded expectations. It is a good scheme that can deliver what individual

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ymateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw yn ysgrifenedig. Fodd bynnag, mynegodd dros 80,000 o bobl yng Nghymru ddiddordeb yn y rhaglen wreiddiol, ac aeth dros 44,000 o bobl ymlaen i ddysgu. O'r rhai a ddefnyddiodd y cyfrifon dysgu unigol, dywedodd 89 y cant i'w dysgu fodloni neu fynd y tu hwnt i'r disgwyliadau. Mae'n gynllun da a all ddarparu'r hyn sydd ei

learners need, and we will take account of that in the second programme.

We had to close down the programme because Wales was at risk from frauds operating in other parts of the UK. We could not have that situation with our public money in Wales. I will write to you on the first part of your question.

**Peter Rogers:** I welcome the fact that you will be meeting with ELWa to ensure that the scheme is up and running properly. Following my correspondence with you regarding the severe financial problems that the new Assembly learning grant had caused for some students in Wales, will you undertake to discuss this new scheme with the Department for Work and Pensions and the Benefits Agency, who will deliver the new scheme, to ensure that it is implemented smoothly?

**Jane Davidson:** I will respond in more detail on the issue of Assembly learning grants later. On the individual learning accounts scheme, on which this question is based, it is important to say that we must always ensure that we have correct and robust procedures in place, including risk management procedures. The new scheme will also require quality delivery from those paid to assist learners. It is exceptionally important that we get the new schemes right.

angen ar ddysgwyr unigol, a byddwn yn ystyried hynny yn yr ail raglen.

Bu'n rhaid inni derfynu'r rhaglen oherwydd bod Cymru mewn perygl oherwydd twyllwyr a oedd yn gweithredu mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Ni allem gael y sefyllfa honno gyda'n harian cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â rhan gyntaf eich cwestiwn.

**Peter Rogers:** Croesawaf y ffaith y byddwch yn cyfarfod ag ELWa i sicrhau bod y cynllun yn gweithredu'n briodol. Yn dilyn fy ngohebiaeth â chi mewn perthynas â'r problemau ariannol difrifol y mae grant dysgu newydd y Cynulliad wedi'u hachosi i rai myfyrwyr yng Nghymru, a wnewch chi ymrwymo i drafod y cynllun newydd hwn gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a'r Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau, a fydd yn cyflwyno'r cynllun newydd, i sicrhau y caiff ei weithredu'n ddidrafferth?

**Jane Davidson:** Ymatebaf yn fanylach ar y mater ynglŷn â grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn nes ymlaen. O ran cynllun y cyfrifon dysgu unigol, y mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn seiliedig arno, mae'n bwysig dweud y dylem sicrhau bob amser fod gennym weithdrefnau cywir a chadarn ar waith, yn cynnwys gweithdrefnau rheoli risgiau. Bydd y cynllun newydd hefyd yn gofyn am ddarpariaeth o safon gan y rhai a gaiff eu talu i gynorthwyo dysgwyr. Mae'n hynod bwysig ein bod yn gweithredu'r cynlluniau newydd yn gywir.

## ACCAC

**Q2 Janet Ryder:** What discussions has the Minister had with the Qualifications Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales since the publication of this year's A-level results? (OAQ19748)

**Jane Davidson:** I met with the chair and chief executive of ACCAC on 15 October to discuss the authority's corporate plan.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree that there are many lessons to be learned from this summer's A-level fiasco? What will you do to ensure that markers in Wales are given adequate training and support and that the

**C2 Janet Ryder:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweiniog wedi'u cynnal gydag ACCAC ers cyhoeddi canlyniadau lefel A eleni? (OAQ19748)

**Jane Davidson:** Cyfarfûm â chadeirydd a phrif weithredwr ACCAC ar 15 Hydref i drafod cynllun corfforaethol yr awdurdod.

**Janet Ryder:** A gytunwch fod llawer o wersi i'w dysgu o ffiasgo arholiadau Safon Uwch yr haf eleni? Beth a wnewch i sicrhau bod marcwyr yng Nghymru yn derbyn hyfforddiant a chymorth priodol ac na fydd y

threat of a shortage of markers for next year's A-levels does not materialise? How will you also ensure that examination bodies have systems in place to ensure that scripts do not go amiss, as was the case with some pupils at Ysgol Brynhyfryd in Ruthin? Their scripts were sent to the wrong address and thrown away, and, therefore, those students lost their A-level work.

**Jane Davidson:** On this summer's A-level issue—I do not accept the word 'fiasco' for what happened in Wales—the Welsh Joint Education Committee and ACCAC have delivered to their usual high standards in Wales, and over two-thirds of those taking A-level examinations in Wales have done so through our own board. I have taken steps to ensure that Welsh candidates with England-based awarding bodies are treated as fairly as their English counterparts, and that Wales is fully involved in the longer term in the process for maintaining consistent standards. It is important to reaffirm that Mike Tomlinson's report was clear: A-levels are not in crisis. Of course the position is vital for individual students, and Mike Tomlinson pointed the way forward in respect of re-grading in some subject areas, but it is not a system in crisis. The report identified the need for a clearer definition of the standard of work required from students at AS and A2 level, and, if this is borne out by Mike Tomlinson's further work, ACCAC will be fully engaged in addressing and resolving this issue.

bygythiad o brinder marcwyr ar gyfer arholiadau Safon Uwch y flwyddyn nesaf yn troi'n wirionedd? Sut y byddwch hefyd yn sicrhau bod gan gyrff arholi systemau ar waith i sicrhau nad yw sgriptiau yn mynd ar goll, fel a ddigwyddodd gyda rhai disgyblion yn Ysgol Brynhyfryd yn Rhuthun? Anfonwyd eu sgriptiau hwy i'r cyfeiriad anghywir ac fe'u taflwyd ymaith, ac, felly, colodd y myfyrwyr hynny eu gwaith Safon Uwch.

**Jane Davidson:** Ynglŷn ag arholiadau Safon Uwch yr haf eleni—ni dderbyniaf y gair 'ffiasgo' am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yng Nghymru—mae Cyd Bwyllgor Addysg Cymru ac ACCAC wedi darparu yn ôl eu safonau uchel arferol yng Nghymru, ac mae dros ddwy ran o dair o'r rhai a wnaeth sefyll arholiadau Safon Uwch yng Nghymru wedi gwneud hynny drwy ein bwrdd ni ein hunain. Yr wyf wedi cymryd camau i sicrhau y caiff ymgeiswyr o Gymru sydd â chyrrff dyfarnu yn Lloegr eu trin yr un mor deg â'u cydymgeiswyr yn Lloegr, a bod Cymru yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y tymor hwy yn y broses o gynnal safonau cyson. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio bod adroddiad Mike Tomlinson yn glir: nid yw arholiadau Safon Uwch mewn argyfwng. Wrth gwrs, mae'r sefyllfa'n hollbwysig i fyfyrwyr unigol, a chyfeiriodd Mike Tomlinson at y ffordd ymlaen o ran ailraddio mewn rhai meysydd pwnc, ond nid yw'n system sydd mewn argyfwng. Nododd yr adroddiad yr angen am ddiffiniad cliriach o'r safon o waith sy'n ofynnol gan fyfyrwyr ar lefel Uwch Gyfrannol ac A2, ac os caiff hyn ei ategu gan waith pellach Mike Tomlinson, bydd ACCAC yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y broses o fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn a'i ddatrys.

### **Deddf Addysg 2002 Education Act 2002**

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** How does the Minister intend to consult with schools over her plans to use the powers contained in the new Education Act? (OAQ19727)

**Jane Davidson:** Schools will be consulted on the implementation of the provisions in the Education Act 2002 that affect them in

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ymgynghori â'r ysgolion ynghylch ei chynlluniau i ddefnyddio'r pwerau newydd a ddaw yn sgîl y Ddeddf Addysg newydd? (OAQ19727)

**Jane Davidson:** Ymgynghorir ag ysgolion ar y broses o weithredu'r darpariaethau yn Neddf Addysg 2002 sy'n effeithio arnynt yn



accordance with agreed Assembly procedures. unol â gweithdrefnau cytûn y Cynulliad.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am sure that schools will be pleased to hear that they will be consulted along with the Welsh Local Government Association, which seems to take priority on these matters. Will you consult with schools on how you can protect their budgets, and how, in particular you could ring-fence budgets to provide a certainty of funding to allow headteachers to plan more effectively?

**Jane Davidson:** We should be clear about how much consultation is undertaken by the Assembly Government. Under the Government of Wales Act 1998, we have a statutory duty to work in partnership with local government, the voluntary sector, and other interested parties, including schools and communities, in developing our policies. It is only the Conservatives in the Assembly who continually suggest that we do not consult enough. Not only do we consult formally, by inviting responses to consultation documents, but we also give schools advanced notification, on a termly basis, of consultation documents of interest to them. In addition, documents are normally issued to 10 per cent of schools on a rolling basis to ease bureaucratic burdens. Every school has information on the documents on which they are being consulted, and every school can also ask to receive a document. We also publish everything on the internet, which can be accessed by schools, and teachers unions and other national and professional bodies are included in the distribution of consultation documents. In terms of the Education Act 2002, my officials have established a reference group to consider the implementation of school governance and funding issues contained in the Act, which include the school budget fora. You will find that our pre-consultation discussions are exactly why our partnership education agenda is working so effectively.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ysgolion yn falch o glywed y byddant yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori ynghyd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yr ymddengys ei bod yn cymryd blaenoriaeth ar y materion hyn. A wnewch chi ymgynghori ag ysgolion ynglŷn â sut y gallwch ddiogelu eu cyllidebau, a sut, yn arbennig, y gallech neilltuo cyllidebau'n benodol i ddarparu sicrwydd o ran cyllid er mwyn galluogi penaethiaid i gynllunio yn fwy effeithiol?

**Jane Davidson:** Dylem fod yn glir ynglŷn â faint o waith ymgynghori a gyflawnir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. O dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, mae gennym ddyletswydd statudol i weithio mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol, y sector gwirfoddol, a charfanau eraill sydd â diddordeb, gan gynnwys ysgolion a chymunedau, er mwyn datblygu ein polisïau. Dim ond y Ceidwadwyr yn y Cynulliad sy'n awgrymu'n barhaus nad ydym yn ymgynghori'n ddigonol. Nid yn unig yr ydym yn ymgynghori'n ffurfiol, drwy wahodd ymatebion i ddogfennau ymgynghori, ond yr ydym hefyd yn rhoi rhybudd ymlaen llaw i ysgolion, fesul tymor, o ddogfennau ymgynghori sydd o ddiddordeb iddynt. Yn ogystal, cyhoeddir dogfennau fel arfer i 10 y cant o ysgolion ar sail dreigl er mwyn ysgafnhau beichiau biwrocraidd. Mae gan bob ysgol wybodaeth ar y dogfennau yr ymgynghorir arnynt, a gall pob ysgol hefyd ofyn am dderbyn dogfen. Yr ydym hefyd yn cyhoedd popeth ar y rhyngwyd, y gall ysgolion gael mynediad iddo, a chaiff undebau athrawon a chyrrff cenedlaethol a phroffesiynol eraill eu cynnwys yn y dosbarthiad o ddogfennau ymgynghori. O ran Deddf Addysg 2002, mae fy swyddogion wedi sefydlu grŵp cyfeirio i ystyried y broses o weithredu materion llywodraethu ac ariannu ysgolion a gynhwysir yn y Ddeddf, sy'n cynnwys y ffora cyllidebau ysgolion. Byddwch yn canfod mai ein trafodaethau cyn-ymgynghori yw'r union reswm pam y mae ein hagenda addysg partneriaeth yn gweithio mor effeithiol.

2:30 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As you know, the Education Act 2002 allows schools, with the permission of local education authorities, to form companies. What manner of company would you support governing bodies setting up, and will you detail the functions that you envisage that these companies would undertake?

**Jane Davidson:** This was not a priority area for Wales in the passage of the Education Act 2002. Sections 11 to 13 of the Act enable governors to form or invest in companies to provide services for their own school and others. Consultation is envisaged towards the end of next year, and implementation may not take place until 2005. The important point is that there are some areas where schools might want to group together, for example in terms of legal advice or the delivery of services that may be useful. We will explore those areas in consultation.

I have discussed many other areas of the Education Act with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, upon which we hope to ensure early consultation. These include, for example, the new partnerships between schools and local authorities for school improvement, the Wales-only transition powers, which are important to the key stage 3 agenda, and the budget fora, which I know that all Members would like to see established properly so that schools can have proper dialogue with their local authorities about their budget needs.

**Helen Mary Jones:** In your response to Jonathan Morgan, you mentioned the importance of the role of officials. Given a senior official's comment to Committee that there is not enough capacity to implement the Act's provisions in full—I think that he said it would be meltdown if that were attempted—what are your priorities for implementation in terms of time, and how will you consult on the prioritisation itself?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae Deddf Addysg 2002 yn galluogi ysgolion, â chaniatâd awdurdodau addysg lleol, i ffurfio cwmnïau. Pa fath o gwmni y byddech am weld cyrff llywodraethu yn ei sefydlu, ac a wnewch chi fanylu ar y swyddogaethau y rhagwelwch y byddai'r cwmnïau hyn yn ymgymryd â hwy?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid oedd hyn yn un o'r blaenoriaethau i Gymru wth gyflwyno Deddf Addysg 2002. Mae adrannau 11 a 13 o'r Ddeddf yn galluogi llywodraethwyr i ffurfio neu fuddsoddi mewn cwmnïau i ddarparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer eu hysgol eu hunain ac ysgolion eraill. Rhagwelir y cynhelir ymgynghoriad tuag at ddiwedd y flwyddyn nesaf, ac mae'n bosibl na chaiff y cynllun ei weithredu tan 2005. Y pwynt pwysig yw bod rhai meysydd lle y byddai ysgolion, o bosibl, am gydweithio, er enghraifft, o ran cyngor cyfreithiol neu'r broses o gyflwyno gwasanaethau a allai fod yn ddefnyddiol. Archwiliwn y meysydd hynny drwy ymgynghori.

Yr wyf wedi trafod llawer o feysydd eraill y Ddeddf Addysg gyda'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, a gobeithiwn sicrhau ymgynghoriad cynnar arnynt. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys, er enghraifft, y partneriaethau newydd rhwng ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer gwella ysgolion, pwerau trosiannol Cymru yn unig, sy'n bwysig i agenda cyfnod allweddol 3, a ffora'r gyllideb, y gwn yr hoffai llawer o'r Aelodau ei weld wedi'i sefydlu'n briodol er mwyn i ysgolion allu cyfathrebu'n briodol â'u hawdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â'u hanghenion o ran y gyllideb.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn eich ymateb i Jonathan Morgan, crybwyllasoch bwysigrwydd rôl swyddogion. O ystyried sylw a wnaed gan uwch swyddog i'r Pwyllgor nad oes digon o gapasiti i weithredu darpariaethau'r Ddeddf yn llawn—credaf iddo ddweud y byddai'n llanast llwyr ped ymgeisiwyd i wneud hynny—beth yw eich blaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweithredu o ran amser, a sut y byddwch yn ymgynghori ar y broses flaenoriaethu ei hun?

**Jane Davidson:** I have just answered that question. The prioritisation issues that I have talked about today have been discussed in Committee. We want to ensure that all the school governance issues are dealt with early, such as the school budget fora and funding issues, LEA and school partnership agreements, and the provision of community facilities by governing bodies. These are important in terms of changing the current relationship between governing bodies and schools, and offer new opportunities with regard to facilities outside the education system. The establishment of school councils in consultation with pupils is an important part of our participation agenda. Issues relating to special educational needs are also important. I have given detailed reports to the Committee on this subject. We have considered a draft proposal for our implementation process in these areas, on which Members will be able to comment in due course.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf newydd ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi trafod y materion blaenoriaethu y soniais amdanynt heddiw. Yr ydym am sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â'r holl faterion ynglŷn â llywodraethu ysgolion yn gynnar, megis ffora cyllidebau ysgolion a materion ariannu, cytundebau partneriaethau Awdurdodau Addysg Lleol ac ysgolion, a'r ddarpariaeth o gyfleusterau cymunedol gan gyrff llywodraethol. Mae'r rhain yn bwysig o ran newid y berthynas gyfredol rhwng cyrff llywodraethu ac ysgolion, ac maent yn cynnig cyfleoedd newydd mewn perthynas â chyfleusterau y tu allan i'r system addysg. Mae'r broses o sefydlu cynghorau ysgolion drwy ymgynghori â disgyblion yn rhan bwysig o'n hagenda gyfranogi. Mae materion ynglŷn ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn bwysig hefyd. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno adroddiadau manwl i'r Pwyllgor ar y pwnc hwn. Yr ydym wedi ystyried cynnig drafft ar gyfer ein proses weithredu yn y meysydd hyn, y gall Aelodau wneud sylwadau arnynt maes o law.

### **Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru Education and Learning Wales**

**Q4 Christine Chapman:** What progress has ELWa made with increasing the number of post-16 learners in Wales? (OAQ19698)

**C4 Christine Chapman:** Pa gynnydd a wnaed gan ELWa o ran cynyddu nifer y dysgwyr ôl-16 yng Nghymru? (OAQ19698)

**Jane Davidson:** The National Council for Education and Training for Wales has reported that the number of learners in further education has increased from 160,816 in 2000-01 to 170,972 in 2001-02, which was the national council's first year of operation. That is an increase of over 10,000 in the number of learners in further education. The number of those in training has increased from 24,060 in 2000-01 to 27,185 in 2001-02, which is an increase of over 3,000 trainees. Overall, this represents an increase of 7.2 per cent. The council is now developing its programmes and creating new initiatives to support its priorities, aimed at further increasing the numbers of post-16 learners.

**Jane Davidson:** Nododd Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant fod nifer y dysgwyr mewn addysg bellach wedi codi o 160,816 yn 2000-01 i 170,972 yn 2001-02, sef blwyddyn weithredu gyntaf y cyngor cenedlaethol. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o dros 10,000 yn nifer y dysgwyr mewn addysg bellach. Mae nifer y rhai sy'n derbyn hyfforddiant wedi codi o 24,060 yn 2000-01 i 27,185 yn 2001-02, sef cynnydd o dros 3,000 o hyfforddeion. Ar y cyfan, mae hyn yn cynrychioli cynnydd o 7.2 y cant. Mae'r cyngor bellach yn datblygu ei raglenni ac yn creu mentrau newydd i gefnogi ei flaenoriaethau, a anelir at gynyddu nifer y dysgwyr ôl-16 ymhellach.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome that answer. Do you agree that increasing the number of students in further education and driving up

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf yr ateb hwnnw. A gytunwch fod cynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach a gwella

standards are key Assembly achievements, during what was a successful first year for ELWa? Do you also agree that further education colleges and their staff have a crucial role in raising attainment and participation levels for all age groups, particularly among those in deprived areas?

**Jane Davidson:** The figures I quoted reflect ELWa's success in encouraging additional learners in its first year. In addition, we know that 5,744 young people started a modern apprenticeship and, with extra funding of £2.8 million, 2,700 students with learning difficulties or disabilities were enabled to access mainstream education. That is vitally important. The knowledge exploitation fund has led to the establishment of 100 new businesses through entrepreneurship scholarships. A total of 2,929 employees were assisted with their skills development. In terms of the more deprived areas of Wales, it is important to note that there were more than 3,000 extra learners from wards with the lowest incomes. That is good news for the learning agenda. I believe that we would all agree that the further education sector has done tremendously well. That is why I was delighted that we were able—with the Committee's strong support—to allocate an additional £9 million to contribute towards pay in the further education sector in this year's budget.

**Gareth Jones:** Gwn y byddech yn cytuno nad cynyddu niferoedd yn unig sydd yn bwysig, ond hefyd bod unigolion yn gwella eu sgiliau a'u cymwysterau. A ydych yn ffyddiog eich bod wedi sicrhau digon o adnoddau i ganiatáu i ELWa gyflawni holl ystod ei waith a chodi safonau darpariaeth?

**Jane Davidson:** Yes I am, if you consider the longer term. We are talking about a long-term agenda for ELWa. It is currently consulting on its funding review, and I expect it to submit proposals to take account of these consultations in November. Assembly Members will have a chance to consider those proposals before a decision is taken on

safonau yn gyflawniadau allweddol gan y Cynulliad, yn ystod yr hyn a fu'n flwyddyn gyntaf lwyddiannus i ELWa? A gytunwch hefyd fod gan golegau addysg bellach a'u staff rôl hanfodol i'w chwarae i godi lefelau cyrhaeddiad a chyfranogiad ar gyfer grwpiau o bob oedran, yn enwedig ymhlith y rhai mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r ffigurau a ddyfynnwyd gennyf yn adlewyrchu llwyddiant ELWa i annog dysgwyr ychwanegol yn ystod ei flwyddyn gyntaf. Yn ogystal, gwyddom fod 5,744 o bobl ifanc wedi dechrau prentisiaeth fodern a, chyd a £2.8 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol, galluogwyd 2,700 o fyfyrwyr ag anawsterau dysgu neu anableddau i gael mynediad i addysg brif-ffrwd. Mae hynny'n hanfodol bwysig. Mae'r gronfa datblygu gwybodaeth wedi arwain at sefydlu 100 o fusnesau newydd drwy ysgoloriaethau entrepreneuriaidd. Cynorthwywyd cyfanswm o 2,929 o gyflogeion â'u datblygiad sgiliau. O ran yr ardaloedd mwy difreintiedig yng Nghymru, mae'n bwysig nodi y cafwyd dros 3,000 o ddysgwyr ychwanegol o'r wardiau â'r incwm lleiaf. Mae hynny'n newyddion da i'r agenda ddysgu. Credaf y byddem oll yn cytuno bod y sector addysg bellach wedi gwneud yn aruthrol o dda. Dyna pam yr oeddwn wrth fy modd ein bod yn gallu—gyda chymorth cadarn y Pwyllgor—dyrannu £9 miliwn ychwanegol i gyfrannu tuag at gyflogau yn y sector addysg bellach yng nghyllideb eleni.

**Gareth Jones:** I know that you would agree that it is important not only to increase numbers, but also to ensure that individuals improve their skills and qualifications. Are you confident that you have allocated sufficient resources to allow ELWa to carry out the whole range of its activities and raise standards of provision?

**Jane Davidson:** Ydw, yr wyf yn ffyddiog o hynny, os ystyriwch y tymor hwy. Yr ydym yn trafod agenda hirdymor i ELWa. Mae'n ymgynghori ynghylch ei adolygiad o gyllid ar hyn o bryd, a disgwyliaf iddo gyflwyno cynigion i ystyried yr ymgynghoriadau hyn ym mis Tachwedd. Bydd cyfle gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad i ystyried y cynigion hyn cyn y

whether or not they are implemented. If you consider the three years of the budget—that is what has been announced—the focus on promoting bilingualism to meet the demands for Welsh medium education and Welsh for adults is important. Providing for future growth in respect of learners in line with Assembly targets, assisting up-skilling in the public, private and voluntary sectors, improving the quality and capacity of the learner/provider network, and enhancing connectivity and support for e-learning is also important. We are confident that the massive additional resources that are being given to ELWa—an additional £55 million by 2005—will enable us to meet these objectives.

gwneir penderfyniad ynglŷn â pha un a chânt eu gweithredu ai peidio. Os ystyriwch dair blynedd y gyllideb—dyna'r hyn a gyhoeddwyd—mae'r ffocws ar hyrwyddo dwyieithrwydd er mwyn ymateb i'r galw am addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a Chymraeg i oedolion yn bwysig. Mae'n bwysig hefyd i ddarparu ar gyfer twf yn y dyfodol o ran dysgwyr yn unol â thargedau'r Cynulliad, cynorthwyo'r broses o uwchsgilio yn y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol, gwella ansawdd a chapasiti y rhwydwaith dysgwyr/darparwyr, a gwella cysylltedd a chymorth ar gyfer e-ddysgu. Yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd yr adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol a roddir i ELWa—£55 miliwn ychwanegol erbyn 2005—yn ein galluogi i gyflawni'r amcanion hyn.

### **Grantiau Dysgu'r Cynulliad Assembly Learning Grants**

**Q5 Brian Hancock:** Will the Minister make a statement on the administration of the new Assembly learning grants? (OAQ19744)

**C5 Brian Hancock:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y gwaith gweinyddu sydd ynghlwm wrth grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad? (OAQ19744)

**Jane Davidson:** The new Assembly learning grants are being administered by local education authorities, which have agreed to use their existing student support processes to carry out the means-testing of Assembly learning grant applications and the payment of awards to successful applicants.

**Jane Davidson:** Caiff grantiau dysgu newydd y Cynulliad eu gweinyddu gan awdurdodau addysg lleol, sydd wedi cytuno i ddefnyddio eu prosesau cymorth presennol i brofi modd myfyrwyr sy'n gwneud cais am grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad ac i dalu'r grantiau i ymgeiswyr llwyddiannus.

**Brian Hancock:** Because of poor communication and co-ordination between your department and the Department for Work and Pensions there is a loss of benefits for some students entitled to Assembly learning grants. This has affected perhaps our poorest students. Have you resolved this matter, and are you aware of the difficulty in completing an Assembly learning grant form? Various local authorities have seen a much reduced uptake of further education due to the Assembly learning grants.

**Brian Hancock:** Oherwydd diffyg cyfathrebu a chydgyssylltu rhwng eich adran chi a'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau mae rhai myfyrwyr sydd â hawl i gael grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn colli budd-daliadau. Mae hyn wedi effeithio ar ein myfyrwyr tlotaf o bosibl. A ydych wedi datrys y mater hwn, ac a ydych yn ymwybodol o'r anhawster i gwblhau ffurflen grant dysgu'r Cynulliad? Gwelodd nifer o awdurdodau lleol ostyngiad sylweddol yn nifer y bobl sy'n mynd ymlaen i addysg bellach o ganlyniad i grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad.

**Jane Davidson:** I will answer those two points in turn. First, I reject the notion that there has been poor communication between departments over the Assembly learning grants. We have been in dialogue with the

**Jane Davidson:** Atebaf y ddau bwynt hynny yn eu tro. Yn gyntaf, gwrthodaf yr awgrym bod diffyg cyfathrebu rhwng adrannau mewn perthynas â grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi bod yn cynnal trafodaethau

Department for Work and Pensions since February this year, and have involved it all the way. It told us that it would be sympathetic, and would consider all ways possible of seeing how much of the Assembly learning grants could be disregarded. The same is true of grants in Scotland—they are not fully disregarded either.

One key issue at present is that local benefit offices have not yet been given consistent guidance. We are actively working with the Department for Work and Pensions to ensure consistent guidance across Wales within the next month. I am meeting all student advisers across Wales on 7 November to discuss this issue. I believe that all Assembly Members have received a copy of the flowchart that notes the entitlement clearly. The people who are affected are those with an income of less than £5,000, who are eligible for an Assembly learning grant of £750—part-timers, particularly in further education. The Assembly Government is committed to ensuring that no-one is worse off. We will not stand by and let the most vulnerable lose out. The Department for Work and Pensions has determined that learners who are not in receipt of a student loan should have £592 of the £750 of the Assembly learning grant disregarded when their entitlement to an income related benefit is calculated. The disregard relates to costs such as books, equipment and travel. In addition, the cost of childcare is disregarded. The Department for Work and Pensions has told us this week that it therefore foresees that the maximum that students would have taken into account is £3 per week, which is £150 a year. Therefore, they would still be over £600 better off as a result of the grant. That is important.

2:40 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** As the Minister is answering in some detail—[*Laughter.*] Order. This is an important issue that concerns several of my constituents, and other Members' constituents. I will therefore allow extra time for this question.

gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ers mis Chwefror eleni, ac wedi ei chynnwys bob cam o'r ffordd. Dywedodd wrthym y byddai'n gefnogol, ac yn ystyried pob ffordd bosibl o weld pa faint o grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad y gellid ei anwybyddu. Mae'r un peth yn wir am grantiau yn yr Alban—ni chânt hwythau eu hanwybyddu'n llwyr ychwaith.

Un mater allweddol ar hyn o bryd yw na roddwyd canllawiau cyson i swyddfeydd budd-daliadau lleol hyd yma. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i sicrhau canllawiau cyson ledled Cymru o fewn y mis nesaf. Yr wyf yn cwrdd â phob ymgynghorydd myfyrwyr yng Nghymru ar 7 Tachwedd i drafod y mater hwn. Credaf i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad gael copi o'r siart llif sy'n nodi'r hawl yn glir. Y bobl yr effeithir arnynt yw'r rheini sydd ag incwm o lai na £5,000, sy'n gymwys i gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad o £750—myfyrwyr rhan amser, yn arbennig mewn addysg bellach. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau nad oes neb yn waeth ei fyd. Ni fyddwn yn laesu dwylo a gadael i'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn fod ar eu colled. Penderfynodd yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau y dylid anwybyddu £592 o'r £750 o grant dysgu'r Cynulliad ar gyfer myfyrwyr nad ydynt yn cael benthyciad i fyfyrwyr pan gaiff eu hawl i fudd-dal yn gysylltiedig ag incwm ei chyfrifo. Mae'r anwybyddiad yn ymwneud â chostau fel llyfrau, offer a theithio. Yn ogystal, anwybyddir cost gofal plant. Dywedodd yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau wrthym yr wythnos hon ei bod yn rhagweld mai'r uchafswm y byddai wedi ei ystyried i fyfyrwyr yw £3 yr wythnos, sef £150 y flwyddyn. Felly, byddent £600 yn well eu byd o hyd o ganlyniad i'r grant. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

**Y Llywydd:** Gan fod y Gweinidog yn rhoi ateb manwl—[*Chwerthin.*] Trefn. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig sy'n berthnasol i nifer o'm hetholwyr, ac etholwyr Aelodau eraill. Byddaf felly yn caniatáu amser ychwanegol ar gyfer y cwestiwn hwn.

**Mick Bates:** Will the Minister confirm that the delays in the process of applying for the Assembly learning grant are the result of the slow take-up of the scheme by county councils?

**Jane Davidson:** No. County councils across Wales are delivering the scheme on behalf of the Assembly Government. Several local education authorities have experienced problems with their student support software packages, which they use to handle their statutory student support functions. As these packages are also being used to process Assembly learning grant applications, there has been an inevitable knock-on effect on the new scheme. Today, I launched Caerphilly County Borough Council's education and leisure day. That local authority has had problems in distributing the grants. However, I was told today that all its grants will be distributed next week. We are working closely with the county councils to ensure that that happens. I have called a meeting for 7 November, so that we can resolve any outstanding issues and ensure that we get the grants out of the door.

**Glyn Davies:** I am grateful for the great detail that you have provided. However, it is sometimes difficult to understand your long answers. The Assembly learning grant was presented as a simple solution to student debt problems. What research have you undertaken—you may have answered this, but I could not spot it—on the number of students who may not qualify for the full grant because of reductions as a result of housing benefit considerations? Is it not the case that you are giving money with great fanfare with one hand and then taking it away rather surreptitiously with the other?

**Jane Davidson:** No. We will not know the full position until we receive the first set of data at the end of November. That data will take full account of the applications to local authorities. It is important to note that 14,000 learners have already benefited from this grant. That is the kind of take-up that we expected at this point. I will continue to strongly encourage all students who think

**Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau mai arafwch cynghorau sir i weithredu'r cynllun sy'n gyfrifol am yr oedi yn y broses o wneud cais am grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad?

**Jane Davidson:** Na wnaiff. Mae cynghorau sir ledled Cymru yn cyflwyno'r cynllun ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae sawl awdurdod addysg lleol wedi cael problemau gyda'u pecynnau meddalwedd cymorth i fyfyrwyr, a ddefnyddir ganddynt i ymdrin â'u swyddogaethau statudol o ran cymorth i fyfyrwyr. Gan fod y pecynnau hyn hefyd yn cael eu defnyddio i brosesu ceisiadau am grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, yn anochel effeithiwyd ar y cynllun newydd. Heddiw, lansiais ddiwrnod addysg a hamdden Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili. Cafodd yr awdurdod lleol hwnnw broblemau o ran dosbarthu'r grantiau. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd wrthyf heddiw y caiff pob un o'i grantiau eu dosbarthu yr wythnos nesaf. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos gyda'r cynghorau sir i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Yr wyf wedi galw cyfarfod ar gyfer 7 Tachwedd, er mwyn inni allu datrys unrhyw faterion sy'n weddill a sicrhau ein bod yn dosbarthu'r grantiau.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y wybodaeth hynod fanwl a roesoch. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd deall eich atebion hirfaith weithiau. Cyflwynwyd grant dysgu'r Cynulliad fel ateb syml i broblemau dyledion myfyrwyr. Pa waith ymchwil a wnaethoch—efallai ichi ateb hyn, ond ni sylwais—i nifer y myfyrwyr na fyddant o bosibl yn gymwys i gael y grant llawn oherwydd gostyngiadau o ganlyniad i ystyriaethau budd-dal tai? Onid yw'n wir i ddweud eich bod yn rhoi arian gan glochdar yn uchel amdano ar y naill law ac yna ei dynnu yn ôl yn eithaf llechwraidd gyda'r llaw arall?

**Jane Davidson:** Nac ydyw. Ni fyddwn yn gwybod y manylion llawn nes inni gael y set gyntaf o ddata ddiwedd mis Tachwedd. Bydd y data hwnnw yn ystyried y ceisiadau i awdurdodau lleol yn llawn. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod 14,000 o ddysgwyr eisoes wedi elwa ar y grant hwn. Dyna'r math o ymateb yr oeddem yn ei ddisgwyl ar yr adeg hon. Byddaf yn parhau i annog pob myfyriwr sy'n

they are eligible for the grant to apply, and I hope that other Members will also encourage them. I have given detailed answers in order to reassure Members that information received from the Department for Work and Pensions this week indicates that the maximum loss of benefit will be up to £3 a week on a grant of £750. That small group of students will still be £600 better off as a result of the Assembly learning grant.

The Assembly learning grant is an important initiative, as it encourages more people to enter further and higher education. Discussions are continuing with the Department for Work and Pensions on whether it can reconsider its decision and disregard all elements of the Assembly learning grant for benefit purpose. This has not yet been resolved. As soon as further information is available, I will ensure that a statement is made in Plenary. Members have had different experiences in terms of the information given to applicants by benefits offices across Wales. We must ensure that the advice given is consistent across Wales, and that we are party to that advice.

meddwl eu bod yn gymwys i gael y grant yn daer i wneud cais, a gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau eraill hefyd yn eu hannog. Yr wyf wedi rhoi atebion manwl er mwyn sicrhau'r Aelodau bod y wybodaeth a dderbyniwyd gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yr wythnos hon yn nodi mai hyd at £3 yr wythnos o fudd-daliadau a gollir ar y mwyaf ar grant o £750. Bydd y grŵp bach hwnnw o fyfyrwyr yn dal i fod £600 ar eu hennill o ganlyniad i grant dysgu'r Cynulliad.

Mae grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn fenter bwysig, gan ei fod yn annog mwy o bobl i ddilyn cyrsiau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Mae'r trafodaethau'n parhau â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ynghylch pa un a all ailystyried ei benderfyniad ac anwybyddu pob elfen o grant dysgu'r Cynulliad at ddiben budd-daliadau. Ni ddatryswyd hyn eto. Cyn gynted ag y bydd rhagor o wybodaeth ar gael, byddaf yn sicrhau bod datganiad yn cael ei wneud yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae'r Aelodau wedi cael profiadau gwahanol o ran y wybodaeth a roddir i ymgeiswyr gan swyddogion budd-daliadau ledled Cymru. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cyngor a roddir yn gyson ledled Cymru, a'n bod yn ymwneud â'r cyngor hwnnw.

### **Datganiad ar y Strategaeth Faeth Statement on the Nutrition Strategy**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I welcome the opportunity to report on the important work of the Welsh Assembly Government and the Food Standards Agency in developing a national nutrition strategy for Wales, which will lead to the development of an action plan for a food equality programme. The prime aim is to tackle the issues of food poverty and diet-related ill health in Wales, and that sits firmly within our tackling inequalities agenda. This will be the first national nutrition strategy in the United Kingdom and it is particularly pleasing to report that Wales is leading the way in terms of nutrition.

It is important that I begin by explaining why a strategy for Wales is necessary. Although in recent years there has been some reduction in mortality from the major chronic diseases,

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Croesawaf y cyfle i gyflwyno adroddiad ar waith pwysig Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i ddatblygu strategaeth faeth genedlaethol ar gyfer Cymru, a fydd yn arwain at ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer rhaglen cydraddoldeb bwyd. Y prif nod yw ymdrin â materion megis tlodi bwyd a salwch sy'n gysylltiedig â deiet yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n gwbl gydnaws â'n hagenda i ymdrin ag anghydraddoldebau. Hon fydd y strategaeth faeth genedlaethol gyntaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac mae'n bleser mawr imi nodi bod Cymru ar flaen y gad o ran maeth.

Mae'n bwysig imi ddechrau drwy esbonio pam mae angen strategaeth ar gyfer Cymru. Er bod rhywfaint o ostyngiad yn nifer y marwolaethau o'r prif glefydau cronig yn



health in Wales remains generally poorer than in England. On average, life expectancy in Wales is two to three years less than the best in Europe, and the gap is more marked in some of our most deprived communities.

In Wales, about 22,000 deaths from heart disease and cancer are reported every year. Experts have calculated that diet is responsible for about a third of all heart disease, and about a quarter of all cancers. Diet could be said to be the cause of around 7,000 deaths in Wales every year. More of the population is becoming overweight or obese. Those conditions increase the risk of a person developing heart disease, and are also implicated in the onset of diabetes.

Alongside our promotion of improvements in levels of physical activity, we need to promote a good diet. Research shows that as a nation our diet falls short of the recommended balance that we need to maintain good health. We eat too much that is rich in fat, sugar and salt, and too few fruit and vegetables. Ideally, we should all eat five portions of fruit and vegetables a day. As well as being an important source of nutrients—[*Interruption.*]

*Gohiriwyd y Cyfarfod Llawn.  
The Plenary was adjourned.*

*Ailymgynullodd y Cynulliad am 2.52 p.m.  
The Assembly reconvened at 2.52 p.m.*

**Jane Hutt:** The strategy's ultimate aim is to encourage the population of Wales to eat a healthier diet. However, evidence shows that some groups need urgent attention because their diet is particularly poor, because they are at increased risk of consequent ill health or are particularly amenable to behavioural change.

On the basis of those criteria, several groups have been selected for priority attention. Those who suffer social and economic disadvantage are clearly a top priority. That

ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae iechyd yng Nghymru'n parhau i fod yn waeth yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Ar gyfartaledd, mae'r disgwyliad einioes yng Nghymru ddwy i dair blynedd yn llai na'r gorau yn Ewrop, ac mae'r bwch yn fwy amlwg mewn rhai o'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig.

Yng Nghymru, cofnodir tua 22,000 o farwolaethau o glefyd y galon a chanser bob blwyddyn. Mae arbenigwyr wedi cyfrifo mai deiet sy'n gyfrifol am tua un o bob tri achos o glefyd y galon, a thua chwarter o bob achos o ganser. Gellid dweud mai deiet sy'n achosi tua 7,000 o farwolaethau yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Mae mwy o'r boblogaeth yn mynd dros bwysau neu'n ordew. Mae'r cyflyrau hyn yn cynyddu risg person o ddatblygu clefyd y galon, ac maent hefyd yn gysylltiedig ag achosi clefyd y siwgr.

Ochr yn ochr â'n gwaith o hyrwyddo mwy o weithgarwch corfforol, mae angen inni hybu deiet da. Dengys ymchwil nad yw ein deiet fel cenedl yn cyrraedd y cydbwysedd cymeradwy sydd ei angen arnom i gynnal iechyd da. Yr ydym yn bwyta gormod o fwyd sy'n cynnwys llawer o fraster, siwgr a halen, a dim digon o ffrwythau a llysiau. Yn ddelfrydol, dylai pawb ohonom fwyta pum darn o ffrwythau a llysiau bob dydd. Yn ogystal â bod yn ffynhonnell faeth bwysig—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Jane Hutt:** Nod y strategaeth yn y pen draw yw annog poblogaeth Cymru i fwyta deiet iachach. Fodd bynnag, dengys tystiolaeth bod angen rhoi sylw brys i rai grwpiau am fod eu deiet yn arbennig o wael, am eu bod yn wynebu risg gynyddol o salwch o ganlyniad i hynny neu eu bod yn arbennig o agored i newid o ran ymddygiad.

Ar sail y meini prawf hynny, dewiswyd sawl grŵp i gael blaenoriaeth. Mae'r rhai sy'n dioddef o anfantais gymdeithasol ac economaidd yn amlwg yn flaenoriaeth uchel.

includes the vulnerable elderly and ethnic minority groups. There is also a need to target infants, children and young adults, because changing diet at an early stage promises long-term health benefits. Those groups are our top priority. Other groups identified for early action are women of child-bearing age, pregnant women, and middle-aged men.

Many of you will have seen the draft nutrition strategy, which was issued for comment this summer. Following a process of extensive consultation, the Assembly Cabinet considered a draft action plan earlier this week. The action plan is still evolving and there is scope for action across many of our policies and programmes: rural support, procurement, planning policy, the older persons strategy, and Communities First, to name but a few.

Studies have shown that the major barriers are access, knowledge and attitudes. Access can mean being unable to afford to buy the right foods, or having difficulty getting to shops. These problems can be tackled in several ways. The action plan will, for example, include support for local food co-operatives, and guidance will be developed for the new local health boards to ensure food access and wider nutrition needs are addressed properly in their health and wellbeing strategies. An enhanced community food initiative will also play a part.

Improving knowledge of nutrition is another important aspect of the strategy. The action plan anticipates maximising the contribution that a range of professionals—general practitioners, health visitors, nurses, teachers, and voluntary sector workers—can make, by providing appropriate training and improving access to information sources. The Food Standards Agency will be developing information materials for particular audience needs, and ensuring that those materials reach the intended audience.

Mae hynny'n cynnwys pobl oedrannus diamddiffyn a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Hefyd mae angen targedu babanod, plant ac oedolion ifanc, oherwydd gall newid deiet yn gynnar arwain at fanteision iechyd hirdymor. Y grwpiau hynny yw ein blaenoriaeth uchaf. Grwpiau eraill a nodwyd ar gyfer gweithredu buan yw menywod sydd mewn oed i gael plant, menywod beichiog a dynion canol oed.

Bydd llawer ohonoch wedi gweld y strategaeth faeth ddrafft, a ddosbarthwyd er mwyn cyflwyno sylwadau arni yn ystod yr haf eleni. Yn dilyn ymgynghoriad helaeth, ystyriodd Cabinet y Cynulliad gynllun gweithredu drafft yn gynharach yn ystod yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn dal i ddatblygu a cheir cyfle i weithredu ar draws llawer o'n polisiau a'n rhaglenni: cymorth gwledig, caffael, polisi cynllunio, y strategaeth i bobl hŷn, a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, i enwi ychydig ohonynt.

Dengys astudiaethau mai'r prif rwystrau yw mynediad, gwybodaeth ac agweddau. Gall mynediad olygu peidio â gallu fforddio prynu'r bwydydd cywir, neu gael anawsterau i gyrraedd y siopau. Gellir ymdrin â'r problemau hyn mewn sawl ffordd. Bydd y cynllun gweithredu, er enghraifft, yn cynnwys cymorth i fentrau bwyd cymunedol lleol, a chaiff canllawiau eu datblygu ar gyfer y byrddau iechyd lleol i sicrhau y caiff mynediad i fwyd ac anghenion maeth ehangach eu diwallu'n briodol yn eu strategaethau iechyd a lles. Bydd menter fwyd gydweithredol estynedig hefyd yn chwarae rhan.

Mae gwella gwybodaeth am faeth yn agwedd bwysig arall ar y strategaeth. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn rhagweld gwneud y defnydd mwyaf posibl o'r cyfraniad y gall amrywiaeth o bobl broffesiynol—meddygon teulu, ymwelwyr iechyd, nyrsys, athrawon, a gweithwyr yn y sector gwirfoddol—ei wneud, drwy roi hyfforddiant priodol a'i gwneud yn haws i gael gafael ar ffynonellau gwybodaeth. Bydd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn datblygu deunyddiau gwybodaeth at anghenion cynulleidfaoedd arbennig, a sicrhau bod y deunyddiau hynny yn cyrraedd y gynulleidfa a fwriadwyd.

Changing attitudes involves persuasion and encouragement. The action plan includes a number of initiatives directed at children, including the provision of breakfasts in schools, expanding the network of healthy schools, and trialling interventions to encourage children to eat more fruit and vegetables. The action plan also includes provision to equip young adults with the skills necessary to prepare a healthy meal for themselves.

In addition to action that the FSA and the Assembly will be taking forward, I expect contributions to be made by a number of public sector and voluntary bodies. I am encouraged by the support for and level of interest in the strategy that organisations across Wales have shown. I am confident that this collaborative approach will give the strategy every chance of success. A national strategy is vital, and this sets the framework within which local action can focus on shared goals.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei chyfraniad allweddol, yn enwedig o gofio'r torri ar draws yn gynharach. Croesawaf yr amcanion sydd ynghlwm â'r strategaeth hon, yn arbennig gan fod nifer y bobl sydd dros bwysau yn ein gwlad yn cynyddu. Mae her sylweddol o'n blaen i wireddu'r amcanion. Yn y lle cyntaf, mae'n her bersonol inni newid ein ffordd o fyw a cheisio byw'n iach. Golyga hynny y bydd sawl un ohonom yn gorfod cymryd camau i golli pwysau drwy fwyta deiet iach, gwneud ymarfer corff—defnyddio'r grisiau yn hytrach na lifft yn yr adeilad hwn fyddai un ffordd o wneud hynny—a rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu. Mae hwn yn fater hollbwysig, gan fod plant yn eu harddegau yn awr yn dioddef y math o glefyd y siwgr yr arferid ei gysylltu â phobl hŷn sydd dros bwysau. Felly, croesawaf y cyfeiriad yn y datganiad at dargedu plant a phobl ifanc. Gobeithiaf y bydd y strategaeth yn newid eu ffordd o fyw am weddill eu hoes.

Y problemau dan sylw yw gorfwyta, diffyg ymarfer corff a deiet gwael, a chrybwyllwyd nifer o gynlluniau i ymdrin â hwy. Rhoddir pwyslais ar gydweithio ar draws meysydd

Mae newid agweddau yn golygu darbwyllo ac annog. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn cynnwys nifer o fentrau sydd wedi'u hanelu at blant, gan gynnwys darparu brecwast mewn ysgolion, ehangu'r rhwydwaith o ysgolion iach, a threialu cynlluniau i annog plant i fwyta rhagor o ffrwythau a llysiau. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu hefyd yn cynnwys rhoi'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen ar oedolion ifanc i baratoi pryd o fwyd iach iddynt hwy eu hunain.

Yn ogystal â'r camau y bydd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd a'r Cynulliad yn eu cymryd, yr wyf yn disgwyl cyfraniadau gan nifer o gyrff y sector cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol. Caf fy nghalonogi gan y gefnogaeth i'r strategaeth a'r diddordeb ynddi gan sefydliadau ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd yr agwedd gydweithredol hon yn rhoi pob cyfle i'r strategaeth lwyddo. Mae'n hanfodol bod gennym strategaeth genedlaethol, ac mae hyn yn gosod y fframwaith y gall camau gweithredu lleol ganolbwyntio ar nodau cytûn oddi mewn iddo.

**David Lloyd:** I thank the Minister for her all-important contribution, particularly in light of the interruption earlier. I welcome the strategy's objectives, because an increasing number of people in Wales are overweight. Realising the objectives is a significant challenge. First, we face a personal challenge in trying to change our lifestyles and living healthily. This means that many of us will have to take steps to lose weight by eating a healthy diet, exercising regularly—taking the stairs rather than the lift in this building would be one way of doing that—and stopping smoking. This is an all-important issue, as teenagers are now being diagnosed with the type of diabetes that we would normally associate with older, overweight people. Therefore, I welcome the reference in the statement to targeting children and young people. I hope that this strategy will change their lifestyles for good.

The issues in question are overeating, a lack of exercise and poor diet, and reference was made to initiatives aimed at tackling these problems. Emphasis is being placed on

iechyd, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg. Dylid addysgu pobl ynglŷn â sut i baratoi bwyd a'i gadw'n ddiogel. Rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau bod bwydydd iach ar gael mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Yn yr ardaloedd hynny, lle y mae'r angen mwyaf, y mae'n fwyaf anodd i gael gafael ar lysiau neu ffrwythau ffres a nwyddau elfennol o'r fath.

Mae gennyf ychydig gwestiynau am y strategaeth. Deillia un ohonynt o'r newyddion a glywsom yr wythnos diwethaf bod gwariant ar ginio ysgol ein plant oddeutu 32c y dydd. O gofio ein bod yn gwario cyn lleied, pa bwerau sydd gan y Cynulliad i reoleiddio cynnwys maethol bwyd ysgol? Hefyd, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau amserlen y cynllun gweithredol sy'n deillio o'r strategaeth hon a pha adnoddau ychwanegol sydd ar gael i wireddu amcanion y strategaeth?

3:00 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** I am glad that you support this strategy. I would like to draw attention to the healthy and active lifestyles action plan, which was initiated by the Sports Council for Wales, and sits alongside the nutrition strategy. Schemes such as the provision of fruit tuck shops in schools so that children now eat fruit instead of crisps, and free school milk, are making a difference. You do not see crisp packets in playgrounds now that children are eating fresh fruit. They eat fruit in various ways. A school that I visited this week provided fresh fruit chopped up in a kind of fruit salad. Children are also learning to eat new fruits. Our community food initiatives have done much to bring healthy eating options to some of our more disadvantaged communities. I know that Ann Jones will want to talk about the Rhyl food co-operative, which has meant that fresh fruit and vegetables are now being consumed by many families in Rhyl. The scheme provides access to cheap healthy food for the local community.

There are new nutrition standards for our school meals. That statistic that you quoted

collaboration across the health, social service and education sectors. People need to be taught how to prepare food and store it safely. We must also ensure that nutritious food is available in deprived areas. It is in those areas, where the need is greatest, that it is most difficult to get hold of fresh fruit and vegetables and other staples.

I have a few questions about the strategy. One stems from last week's news that only about 32p a day is spent on our children's school dinners. Given that we spend so little, what powers does the Assembly have to regulate the nutritional content of school dinners? Also, will the Minister confirm the timetable for the strategy's operational plan and what additional resources will be available to realise the strategy's objectives?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cefnogi'r strategaeth hon. Hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at y cynllun gweithredu ffordd o fyw iach a heini, a sefydlwyd gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, ac sy'n cydreddeg â'r strategaeth faeth. Mae cynlluniau fel darparu siopau ffrwythau mewn ysgolion fel bod plant bellach yn bwyta ffrwythau yn lle creision, a llaeth am ddim mewn ysgolion, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Ni welir pcedi creision mewn iardiau bellach gan fod plant yn bwyta ffrwythau ffres. Maent yn bwyta ffrwythau mewn amrywiaeth o ffyrdd. Yr oedd un ysgol yr ymwelais â hi yr wythnos hon yn darparu ffrwythau ffres wedi eu torri'n fân mewn rhyw fath o salad ffrwythau. Mae plant hefyd yn dysgu bwyta ffrwythau newydd. Mae ein mentrau bwyd cymunedol wedi gwneud llawer i gyflwyno opsiynau bwyta'n iach i rai o'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig. Gwn y bydd Ann Jones am siarad am fenter fwyd gydweithredol y Rhyl, sy'n golygu bod llawer o deuluoedd yn y Rhyl bellach yn bwyta ffrwythau a llysiau ffres. Mae'r cynllun yn sicrhau bod y gymuned leol yn gallu cael gafael ar fwyd iach rhad.

Mae safonau maeth newydd ar gyfer cinio ysgol. Yr oedd yr ystadegyn hwnnw a

was taken out of context last week. That is a shame, as we had a useful report about the importance of food procurement from Cardiff University. The average cost that you quoted does not represent the full cost of school meals. However, it is the nutritional basis of school meals that is important. We have now instituted those new standards. There are also new nutrition standards for hospital meals, which are also important in terms of diet. I will formally launch the strategy and action plan shortly—in the new year at the latest. This strategy encompasses not just my responsibilities, but the responsibilities of Ministers across the board. It relates to education, and to rural affairs in terms of procurement policies. I am talking about a food equality programme—that might have been missed from the beginning of the statement. The Assembly can lead on that. It is based on the outline of the Food Poverty Eradication Bill, a private Member's Bill in Westminster. We can have our own food equality programme. We must then ensure that we have the resources to back it up. It will be across the board, not just in health and social care.

**Ann Jones:** Thank you, Minister, for mentioning the food co-operative in Rhyl, which I wanted to raise. Food co-operatives can be at the heart of this plan. This is a good nutrition strategy, and we have been waiting for it for a long time. The food co-op in Rhyl shows how we can deliver that nutrition strategy in deprived areas. Will you consider how we can promote food co-ops across Wales so that all our deprived communities can benefit from fresh fruit and vegetables? It is no good our educating people about the importance of eating fresh fruit and vegetables if they cannot be accessed in deprived communities.

**Jane Hutt:** We also need to connect this with Communities First and ensure that the nutrition strategy is taken forward at every opportunity. It is being addressed in our health inequalities fund projects, which are about how we can prevent heart disease.

ddyfynnwyd gennych allan o'i gyd-destun yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae hynny'n drueni, gan inni gael adroddiad defnyddiol ar bwysigrwydd caffael bwyd gan Brifysgol Caerdydd. Nid yw'r gost gyfartalog a ddyfynnwyd gennych yn cynrychioli cost lawn cinio ysgol. Fodd bynnag, sail maeth cinio ysgol sy'n bwysig. Yr ydym bellach wedi sefydlu'r safonau newydd hynny. Ceir safonau maeth newydd hefyd ar gyfer pryddau bwyd mewn ysbytai, sydd hefyd yn bwysig o ran deiet. Byddaf yn lansio'r strategaeth a'r cynllun gweithredu yn ffurfiol yn fuan—yn y flwyddyn newydd fan bellaf. Nid fy nghyfrifoldebau i yn unig a gwmpesir yn y strategaeth hon, ond cyfrifoldebau Gweinidogion yn gyffredinol. Mae'n ymwneud ag addysg, ac â materion gwledig o ran polisïau caffael. Yr wyf yn sôn am raglen cydraddoldeb bwyd—efallai fod hynny wedi cael ei gollu o ddechrau'r datganiad. Gall y Cynulliad arwain ar hynny. Mae'n seiliedig ar amlinelliad y Mesur Dileu Tlodi Bwyd, sef Mesur Aelod preifat yn San Steffan. Gallwn gael ein rhaglen cydraddoldeb bwyd ein hunain. Yna rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym yr adnoddau i'w chefnogi. Bydd yn rhaglen gyffredinol, nid yn unig ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol.

**Ann Jones:** Diolch, Weinidog, am sôn am y fenter fwyd gydweithredol yn y Rhyl; yr oeddwn am godi hynny. Gall mentrau bwyd cymunedol fod wrth wraidd y cynllun hwn. Mae hon yn strategaeth faeth dda, ac yr ydym wedi bod yn aros amdani ers cyfnod maith. Mae'r fenter fwyd gydweithredol yn y Rhyl yn dangos sut y gallwn gyflwyno'r strategaeth faeth honno mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. A ystyriwch sut y gallwn hyrwyddo mentrau bwyd cymunedol ledled Cymru fel y gall ein holl gymunedau difreintiedig gael ffrwythau a llysiau ffres? Nid oes diben inni addysgu ein pobl am bwysigrwydd bwyta ffrwythau a llysiau ffres os na allant gael gafael arnynt mewn cymunedau difreintiedig.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hefyd angen inni gysylltu hyn â Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a sicrhau y caiff y strategaeth faeth ei datblygu bob cyfle sy'n codi. Ymdrinnir â hyn ym mhrosiectau ein cronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, sy'n ymwneud â'r ffordd y gallwn atal clefyd y

Officials from Mike German's department are considering how we can promote food co-operatives. The Countryside Alliance has also played a part in that, not just in Wales but across the UK. Food co-operatives can be cost-effective. The one in Rhyl is run by local people to meet their needs, and is very much a voluntary, self-help effort. It is making a great difference to many families in that community, and we seek to roll such projects out across Wales.

**David Melding:** One of the starker facts in your statement is that most people in Wales eat a relatively poor diet, if we take the consumption of fresh fruit and vegetables as an indicator. This must be at the forefront of a strategy to improve nutritional standards in Wales. People are subject to massive marketing forces, which constantly urge the overconsumption of food, particularly sugary drinks, highly-salted and processed food. Any Assembly strategy must concentrate intensely on the information aspect and have formidable resources behind it, particularly for an advertising campaign. I know that the action plan is not yet fully developed, but that is the kind of measure that most of us are looking at. Will there be clout behind this strategy?

My second point relates to the workplace. I stand before you as chair of the Assembly's catering sub-committee, and I take my duties seriously.

**Peter Law:** Power again.

**David Melding:** That is right. I should not have drawn Members' attention to it; perhaps they did not know about it. However, the serious point is that, for many people, the only opportunity they have to eat a principal meal during the day is at work. That is also the case for many people who work in schools and universities or other educational institutions. The standard of nutrition is important. We must ensure that healthy options are available and that caterers are required to produce more dishes that consist of healthy, properly balanced food. Balance is important. It is important that the strategy

galon. Mae swyddogion o adran Mike German yn ystyried sut y gallwn hybu mentrau bwyd cymunedol. Mae Cynghrair Cefn Gwlad hefyd wedi chwarae rhan yn hynny, nid yn unig yng Nghymru ond ledled y DU. Gall mentrau bwyd cymunedol fod yn gost-effeithiol. Pobl leol sy'n rhedeg y fenter yn y Rhyl i ddiwallu eu hanghenion, a menter wirfoddol, hunangymorth ydyw yma. Mae'n gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i lawer o deuluoedd yn y gymuned honno, a'n nod yw cyflwyno prosiectau o'r fath ledled Cymru.

**David Melding:** Un o'r ffeithiau cliraf eich datganiad yw bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru yn bwyta deiet cymharol wael, o ystyried faint o ffrwythau a llysiau ffres a fwytir fel dangosydd. Rhaid i hyn fod ar flaen strategaeth i wella safonau maeth yng Nghymru. Mae pobl yn agored i rymoedd marchnata anferth, sy'n eu hannog yn ddi-baid i orfwyta, yn enwedig diodydd llawn siwgr, bwyd hallt iawn a bwyd wedi'i brosesu. Rhaid i unrhyw strategaeth gan y Cynulliad ganolbwyntio'n fanwl ar wybodaeth a rhaid iddi gael adnoddau cadarn y tu ôl iddi, yn enwedig ar gyfer ymgyrch hysbysebu. Gwn nad yw'r cynllun gweithredu wedi'i ddatblygu'n llawn eto, ond dyna'r math o fesur y mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn ei ddisgwyl. A fydd grym y tu ôl i'r strategaeth hon?

Mae fy ail bwynt yn ymwneud â'r gweithle. Safaf o'ch blaen fel cadeirydd is-bwyllgor arlwyo'r Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn cymryd fy nyletswyddau o ddifrif.

**Peter Law:** Pŵer eto.

**David Melding:** Ie wir. Ni ddylwn fod wedi tynnu sylw'r Aelodau at hyn; efallai nad oeddent yn ymwybodol ohono. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt difrifol yw, i lawer o bobl, yr unig gyfle a gânt i fwyta pryd iawn o fwyd yn ystod y dydd yw yn y gwaith. Mae hynny yn wir hefyd am lawer o bobl sy'n gweithio mewn ysgolion neu brifysgolion neu mewn sefydliadau addysgol eraill. Mae safon y maeth yn bwysig. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod opsiynau iach ar gael a'i bod yn ofynnol i arlwywyr gynhyrchu mwy o brydau bwyd sy'n cynnwys bwyd iach a chytbwys. Mae cydbwysedd yn bwysig. Mae'n bwysig bod y

concentrates on getting people to eat healthy foods in appropriate quantities. If they want to eat sweet food, consume alcohol and eat chips or fried food, they should be allowed to do so, provided that they have also had a good balance of fruit and vegetables. There is much to be said for allowing people the occasional sins and not demoralising them. If a regime is too rigorous, people will not sign up to it—

**Mick Bates:** Clear blue sins.

**David Melding:** I was talking about sins in terms of food. The Member will know that diet plans now often refer to allowable sins as part of the package. I was referring to that. I fear that I am beginning to ramble— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Never.’] I will try to focus. I had a question to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, tabled for answer today, on the supply of fresh drinking water to schools. That is important. It is also important to have drinking water fountains available in the workplace. It is vital for people’s general health, particularly in getting them to stop drinking sugary drinks in huge quantities. Sugary drinks are unhealthy and contribute to obesity. Once people get used to drinking water, they will find it more refreshing. Let us not forget that dehydration is also a great health problem. The provision of clean drinking water can be improved in this country. It is more often available in north America, but unfortunately that has not had an impact on obesity there.

This is an important strategy, but it will take much guile and commitment from the Government to counteract marketing messages, which are too prevalent in society.

**Jane Hutt:** You were not rambling; it was a pertinent contribution. On your last point, Jane Davidson and I are considering how we can provide a supply of fresh drinking water in schools. It is crucial. The fruit tuck shops and the healthy schools network are changing

strategaeth yn canolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod pobl yn bwyta bwydydd iach mewn meintiau priodol. Os ydynt am fwyta bwydydd melys, yfed alcohol a bwyta sglodion neu fwyd wedi’i ffrio, dylent gael gwneud hynny, ar yr amod eu bod hefyd wedi cael digon o ffrwythau a llysiau. Mae llawer i’w ddweud dros adael i bobl bechu drwy ildio i demtasiwn bob hyn a hyn a pheidio â’u digalonni. Os yw’r drefn yn rhy llym, ni fydd pobl yn ei derbyn—

**Mick Bates:** Pechod marwol.

**David Melding:** Yr oeddwn yn sôn am bechu drwy ildio i demtasiwn o ran bwyd. Gŵyr yr Aelod fod cynlluniau deiet erbyn hyn yn aml yn cyfeirio at bechodau y gellir eu caniatáu fel rhan o’r pecyn. Cyfeirio at hynny oeddwn i. Yn anffodus yr wyf yn mynd ar gyfeiliorn—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Byth.’] Ceisiaf ganolbwyntio. Yr oedd gennyf gwestiwn i’r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, a gyflwynwyd i’w ateb heddiw, ar gyflenwi dŵr yfed ffres i ysgolion. Mae hynny’n bwysig. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod ffynhonnau dŵr yfed ar gael yn y gweithle. Mae’n hanfodol i iechyd cyffredinol pobl, yn enwedig i’w darbwyllo i beidio ag yfed llawer iawn o ddiodydd llawn siwgr. Nid yw diodydd llawn siwgr yn iach ac maent yn cyfrannu at fynd yn ordew. Unwaith y daw pobl i arfer ag yfed dŵr, byddant yn credu ei fod yn fwy iachusol. Ni ddylid anghofio bod disychiad yn broblem fawr arall sy’n ymwneud ag iechyd. Gellir gwella’r ddarpariaeth o ddŵr yfed glân yn y wlad hon. Mae ar gael yn amlach yng ngogledd America, ond yn anffodus nid yw hynny wedi effeithio ar nifer y bobl sy’n ordew yno.

Mae hon yn strategaeth bwysig, ond bydd angen llawer o gyfrwystra ac ymroddiad ar ran y Llywodraeth i wrthsefyll negeseuon marchnata, sy’n rhy amlwg mewn cymdeithas.

**Jane Hutt:** Nid oeddech wedi mynd ar gyfeiliorn; yr oedd yn gyfraniad perthnasol. O ran eich pwynt olaf, mae Jane Davidson a minnau yn ystyried sut y gallwn ddarparu cyflenwad o ddŵr yfed ffres mewn ysgolion. Mae’n hanfodol. Mae’r siopau ffrwythau a’r

eating habits in our schools. I was saddened to hear of one school where a minority of parents objected to replacing crisps with fruit and felt that the children should have a choice. That is fair, because, as you said, David, the strategy must be about allowable sins, but it must also enable our children to have access to fruit. We should eat five portions of fruit and vegetables per day, but, as you said, we only eat three or four portions a day in Wales. The new nutrition standards for schools means that they should be providing a wide selection of balanced food. We must have a whole Government approach. The strategy links with the local food procurement work that is being undertaken by Michael German. I am sure that Mick Bates will want to mention the Powys project in a moment. The strategy is also concerned with how we engage with our local food producers in terms of providing access to nutritious food and access to organic food, as the Cardiff University report which we discussed last week mentioned. It is about making every connection across Government. As chair of the catering sub-group, I hope that you will make those options available to Members and staff. This is a serious issue. Phil mentioned Heartbeat Wales. The nutrition strategy should have the clout that Heartbeat Wales had during the 1980s.

3:10 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you for your valuable statement. It has been proven that we have a genetic predisposition to eat as much fatty and sugary food as possible. It is a legacy from the Stone Age, when the opportunities to eat such food were few and far between. That was fine when we were running around after woolly mammoths and living in caves, but that predisposition, combined with a modern-day lack of activity, means that we have become a nation of overweight and, in many cases, obese people. The cost to the health service of treating diet-related disease is estimated to be about £4 billion a year. I agree with Ann Jones that food co-operatives have a valuable part to play in the nutrition strategy but, as you said,

rhwydwaith o ysgolion iach yn newid arferion bwyta yn ein hysgolion. Cefais fy siomi i glywed am un ysgol lle yr oedd lleiafrif o rieni'n gwrthwynebu cael ffrwythau yn lle creision ac yn teimlo y dylai'r plant gael dewis. Mae hynny'n deg, oherwydd, fel y dywedasoch, David, rhaid i'r strategaeth ganiatáu rhai pechodau, ond rhaid iddi hefyd alluogi ein plant i gael gafael ar ffrwythau. Dylem fwyta pum ffrwyth neu lysieuyn bob dydd, ond, fel y dywedasoch, dim ond tri neu bedwar a fwyteir bob dydd yng Nghymru. Mae'r safonau maeth newydd ar gyfer ysgolion yn golygu y dylent ddarparu amrywiaeth eang o fwyd cytbwys. Rhaid inni hefyd gael ymagwedd Llywodraeth gyfan. Mae'r strategaeth yn cysylltu â'r gwaith caffael bwyd lleol a wna Michael German. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Mick Bates am sôn am brosiect Powys mewn munud. Mae'r strategaeth hefyd yn ymwneud â sut yr ydym yn cysylltu â'n cynhyrchwyr bwyd lleol o ran cael gafael ar fwyd maethlon a bwyd organig, fel yr oedd adroddiad Prifysgol Caerdydd a drafodwyd gennym yr wythnos diwethaf yn ei grybwyll. Mae'n ymwneud â gwneud pob cysylltiad ar draws y Llywodraeth. Fel cadeirydd yr is-bwyllgor arlwy, gobeithio y byddwch yn sicrhau bod yr opsiynau hynny ar gael i'r Aelodau a'r staff. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol. Soniodd Phil am Curiad Calon Cymru. Dylai'r strategaeth faeth gael yr un grym ag a gafodd Curiad Calon Cymru yn ystod yr 1980au.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch am eich datganiad gwerthfawr. Profwyd bod gennym dueddiad genetig i fwyta cymaint o fwyd llawn braster a siwgr ag sy'n bosibl. Mae'n etifeddiaeth o Oes y Cerrig, pan oedd y cyfle i fwyta bwyd o'r fath yn brin iawn. Yr oedd hynny'n iawn pan oeddem yn rhedeg ar ôl mamothiadaid gwlanog ac yn byw mewn ogofâu, ond mae'r tueddiad hwnnw, ynghyd â diffyg gweithgaredd corfforol y byd modern, yn golygu ein bod wedi troi'n genedl o bobl dros bwysau, ac mewn llawer o achosion, yn bobl ordew. Amcangyfrifir mai tua £4 biliwn y flwyddyn yw'r gost i'r gwasanaeth iechyd am drin afiechydon sy'n gysylltiedig â deiet. Cytunaf ag Ann Jones fod gan fentrau bwyd cymunedol ran werthfawr i'w chwarae yn y



Minister, so do public procurement and local food chains. I am fortunate in representing a constituency in Powys that is taking great strides to develop this agenda. Last year, Llanidloes and District War Memorial Hospital participated in a scheme to use local produce in hospital meals. Other hospitals in my constituency are hoping to do the same. It delivers multiple dividends; it not only ensures that more fresh produce is used in school and hospital meals, but also benefits the local economy. I hope that you will consider Professor Morgan's recent work, undertaken at University of Wales, Cardiff, and the pilot schemes that will run in Powys, and develop an all-Wales approach to local procurement and food chains.

On educating people, it is not just a matter of teaching people which foods to eat, but how to prepare them. The demise of domestic science in schools means, sadly, that many simply do not know how to cook a healthy, nutritious meal from scratch. It is all too easy to buy a ready-meal from the local supermarket and put it in the microwave. Will you, in your discussions with Jane Davidson, consider how we can ensure that, as well as knowing which foods to buy, people are equipped with the skills to prepare healthy food?

**Jane Hutt:** I am glad that you drew attention to the pioneering work in Powys, where the local NHS trust is working with local farmers and food producers. This involves economic and sustainable development too. The Government and the Assembly can tackle this. It is about educating people and ensuring schemes through our community food initiatives. I pay tribute to the National Federation of Women's Institutes, which teaches cooking skills to young parents in Sure Start schemes and to people at mental health day centres. Much pioneering work is being done on nutritional development through Communities First initiatives. We are also considering the possibility of leaders in communities to take these skills forward. We must remember that it took the North Karelia

strategaeth faeth ond, fel y dywedasoch, Weinidog, mae gan gaffaeliad cyhoeddus a chadwyni bwyd lleol ran bwysig hefyd. Yr wyf yn ffodus fy mod yn cynrychioli etholaeth ym Mhowys sy'n cymryd camau breision i ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Y llynedd, cymerodd Ysbyty Goffa Rhyfel Llanidloes a'r Ardal ran mewn cynllun i ddefnyddio cynnyrch lleol mewn prydau bwyd mewn ysbytai. Mae ysbytai eraill yn fy etholaeth yn gobeithio gwneud yr un fath. Daw llawer o fanteision yn sgîl hyn; mae nid yn unig yn sicrhau y caiff mwy o gynnyrch ffres ei ddefnyddio mewn prydau bwyd mewn ysgolion ac ysbytai, ond hefyd mae o fudd i'r economi leol. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ystyried gwaith diweddar yr Athro Morgan, a wnaed ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd, a'r cynlluniau peilot a fydd yn rhedeg ym Mhowys, a datblygu ymagwedd Cymru gyfan at gaffaeliad lleol a chadwyni bwyd.

O ran addysgu pobl, nid yw'n fater o addysgu pobl pa fwydydd i'w bwyta, ond sut i'w paratoi. Yn anffodus, mae'r ffaith na chaiff gwyddor tŷ ei dysgu mwyach mewn ysgolion yn golygu nad yw llawer o ddisgyblion yn gwybod sut i goginio pryd o fwyd iach a maethlon o gynhwysion craidd. Mae'n rhy hawdd prynu pryd wedi'i baratoi'n barod o'r archfarchnad leol a'i roi yn y micro-don. A ystyriwch, yn eich trafodaethau â Jane Davidson, sut y gallwn sicrhau bod pobl, ynghyd â gwybod pa fwydydd i'w prynu, yn meddu ar y sgiliau i baratoi bwyd iach?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi tynnu sylw at y gwaith arloesol ym Mhowys, lle mae ymddiriedolaeth leol y GIG yn gweithio â ffermwyr a chynhyrchwyr bwyd lleol. Mae hyn yn cynnwys datblygu economaidd a chynaliadwy hefyd. Gall y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad fynd i'r afael â hyn. Mae'n ymwneud ag addysgu pobl a sicrhau cynlluniau drwy ein mentrau bwyd cymunedol. Talaf deyrnged i Ffederasiwn Sefydliadau'r Merched Cenedlaethol, sy'n dysgu sgiliau coginio i rieni ifanc mewn cynlluniau Cychwyn Cadarn ac i bobl mewn canolfannau dydd iechyd meddwl. Gwneir llawer o waith arloesol ar ddatblygiad maeth drwy fentrau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried y posibilrwydd i arweinyddwyr mewn cymunedau ddatblygu'r

region of Finland—which I have mentioned more than once—30 years to change the community's diet from a high fat, sugary diet that was based on the local economy. Cholesterol levels in the community have now dropped dramatically. This is an all-Wales mission, as is our national service framework to combat heart disease. It must be pursued in the same spirit and with the same will.

**Lorraine Barrett:** You have just mentioned Sure Start. Will there be an evaluation of the benefits accrued for children, in particular, from programmes promoted by nutritionists in Sure Start programmes? I presume that Sure Start will play an important part in the new strategy that we all welcome today.

**Jane Hutt:** Sure Start teams from Wales's 22 local authorities showcased their work and activities at a conference in Aberystwyth recently. I launched 'Well Being in Wales' in a community centre in Merthyr Tydfil where young children were eating quarters of oranges and where other fresh fruit was available. That was as part of the community food initiative and Sure Start. We are evaluating all the different projects across Wales. That will be the route by which we will reach the most vulnerable children and young people in Wales and their parents. We can also evaluate the nutrition and dietary benefits through the health inequalities project on heart disease.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome your statement, Jane, and I am pleased that you have emphasised the link with exercise. In modern life, it is difficult to ensure that you get enough exercise. Do you agree that we should encourage people to enjoy food more and to develop a better relationship with it? This follows on from David's comment earlier. I am concerned that the multi-million-pound dieting industry has succeeded in demonising food over the years. There must be a balance, and all food should be enjoyed in moderation. I do not like people referring to certain foods as sins. The psychology

sgiliau hyn. Rhaid inni gofio ei bod wedi cymryd 30 mlynedd i ranbarth Gogledd Karelia yn y Ffindir—yr wyf wedi sôn amdano fwy nag unwaith—i newid deiet y gymuned o ddeiet oedd yn llawn braster a siwgr yn seiliedig ar yr economi leol. Mae lefelau colesterol yn y gymuned wedi gostwng yn sylweddol erbyn hyn. Mae hon yn genhadaeth i Gymru gyfan, fel ein fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i drechu clefyd y galon. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â hi gyda'r un ysbryd a'r un ewyllys.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr ydych newydd sôn am Cychwyn Cadarn. A fydd gwerthusiad o'r buddiannau i blant, yn arbennig, o raglenni a hyrwyddir gan faethwyr mewn rhaglenni Cychwyn Cadarn? Cymeraf y bydd Cychwyn Cadarn yn chwarae rôl bwysig yn y strategaeth newydd a groesewir gan bawb ohonom heddiw.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae timau Cychwyn Cadarn o'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru wedi arddangos eu gwaith a'u gweithgareddau mewn cynhadledd yn Aberystwyth yn ddiweddar. Lansiais 'Lles Cymru' mewn canolfan gymunedol ym Merthyr Tudful lle yr oedd plant bach yn bwyta chwarteri o orennau a lle yr oedd ffrwythau ffres eraill ar gael. Yr oedd hynny'n rhan o'r fenter fwyd gydweithredol a Cychwyn Cadarn. Yr ydym yn gwerthuso'r holl brosiectau gwahanol ledled Cymru. Dyna sut y byddwn yn cyrraedd y plant a'r bobl ifanc mwyaf diamddiffyn yng Nghymru a'u rhieni. Gallwn hefyd werthuso'r buddiannau o ran maeth a deiet drwy'r prosiect anghydraddoldebau iechyd ar glefyd y galon.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf eich datganiad, Jane, ac yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi pwysleisio'r cysylltiad ag ymarfer corff. Mewn bywyd modern, mae'n anodd sicrhau eich bod yn cael digon o ymarfer corff. A gytunwch y dylem annog pobl i gael mwy o flas ar fwyd ac i feithrin perthynas well â bwyd? Mae hyn yn deillio o sylw David yn gynharach. Yr wyf yn pryderu bod y diwydiant colli pwysau, sydd werth miliynau o bunnoedd, wedi llwyddo i ddemoneiddio bwyd dros y blynyddoedd. Rhaid cael cydbwysedd, a dylid mwynhau pob math o fwyd yn gymedrol. Nid wyf yn hoffi clywed

behind that is wrong, and people are then encouraged to want more of such foods. We must ensure a balance and that we encourage people to enjoy food and to develop a better relationship with it.

**Jane Hutt:** As David said, there are strong commercial interests in the food industry. It sickens me to see advertisements on children's television for sugary drinks that contain little fruit. It is difficult for parents to resist junk food promotions and advertisements. We must develop our own culture in Wales that is about enjoying healthy eating and food. The dieting industry has much to answer for. There are some successful dieters in the Assembly, and I believe that regular meetings are held for those who have lost weight. We can learn much from that, but we must safeguard our children. In addition to obesity being a problem, eating disorders are a problem in Wales. We are addressing that and, as the Minister for Health and Social Services, I am concerned about it.

**John Griffiths:** As you, Minister, and others have said, education and raising awareness is important. It is strange that many people are particular about what oil and petrol they put into their cars, but pay little regard to what they put into their own systems. There is a huge task to be undertaken in education and raising awareness. What role does food labelling have in this? We have taken great strides at a UK level in recent years with regard to labelling, but it is crucial that people can know what they are eating and that information is not only available on supermarket shelves, but also in restaurants, cafes and canteens. In the Assembly, such information was provided by the previous caterers. However, I do not think that it is provided any longer. It is crucial that people who want to eat healthily are enabled to know whether or not they are eating healthy food. What is the role of food labelling and menus in restaurants, cafes and work canteens in that regard? It is right that we

pobl yn cyfeirio at fwyd penodol fel pechodau. Mae'r seicoleg y tu ôl i hynny'n anghywir, ac yna anogir pobl i chwennych mwy o fwydydd o'r fath. Rhaid inni sicrhau cydbwysedd a'n bod yn annog pobl i gael blas ar fwyd a meithrin perthynas well â bwyd.

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y dywedodd David, mae buddiannau masnachol cryf yn y diwydiant bwyd. Mae'n gas gennyf weld hysbysebion ar deledu i blant ar gyfer diodydd llawn siwgr nad ydynt yn cynnwys llawer o ffrwythau. Mae'n anodd i rieni wrthod hyrwyddiadau a hysbysiadau bwyd sothach. Rhaid inni ddatblygu ein diwylliant ein hunain yng Nghymru, un sy'n ymwneud â mwynhau bwyta'n iach a bwyd iach. Mae gan y diwydiant colli pwysau lawer i fod yn atebol amdano. Ceir pobl sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus wrth gollu pwysau yn y Cynulliad, a chredaf y cynhelir cyfarfodydd rheolaidd ar gyfer y rhai hynny sydd wedi colli pwysau. Gallwn ddysgu llawer o hynny, ond rhaid inni ddiogelu ein plant. Yn ogystal â phroblem gordewdra, mae anhwylder bwyta yn broblem yng Nghymru hefyd. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â hynny ac, fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yr wyf yn poeni am hyn.

**John Griffiths:** Fel y dywedasoeh chi, Weinidog, ac eraill, mae addysg a chodi ymwybyddiaeth yn bwysig. Mae'n rhyfedd bod pobl yn ofalus ynghylch pa fath o olew a phetrol y byddant yn ei roi yn eu ceir, ond nad ydynt yn cymryd llawer o sylw o'r hyn y maent yn ei roi yn eu cyrff eu hunain. Mae tasg anferth i'w gwneud o ran addysg a chodi ymwybyddiaeth. Pa rôl sydd gan y broses o labelu bwyd yn hyn o beth? Yr ydym wedi cymryd camau breision ar lefel y DU yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf o ran labelu, ond mae'n holl bwysig bod pobl yn gwybod beth y maent yn ei fwyta ac nad ar silffoedd archfarchnadoedd yn unig y ceir gwybodaeth, ond hefyd mewn bwytai, caffis a ffreuturiau. Yn y Cynulliad, darparwyd gwybodaeth o'r fath gan yr arlwywyr blaenorol. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf ei bod yn cael ei darparu mwyach. Mae'n holl bwysig bod pobl sydd am fwyta'n iach yn gallu gwybod pa un a ydynt yn bwyta bwyd iach ai peidio. Beth yw rôl y broses o labelu bwyd a bwydlenni

concentrate our efforts on our most deprived communities, where the need is greatest. However, a huge amount of commitment, investment and imagination will be needed to reach those people, who face so many difficulties in their everyday lives that they are not receptive to healthy living messages. People in the worst situations often cannot see their way to the end of the week, let alone think of their health in years to come. It will take a great deal of commitment and investment to reach those people.

mewn bwyta, caffis a ffreuturiau gwaith yn y cyswllt hwn? Mae'n iawn inni ganolbwyntio ein hymdrechion ar ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, lle mae'r angen mwyaf. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen llawer iawn o ymrwymiad, buddsoddiad a dychymyg i gyrraedd y bobl hynny, sy'n wynebu cymaint o anawsterau yn eu bywydau bob dydd fel nad ydynt yn barod i dderbyn negeseuon byw yn iach. Yn aml ni all pobl yn y sefyllfaoedd gwaethaf ddal deupen llinyn ynghyd at ddiwedd yr wythnos, heb sôn am feddwl am eu hiechyd mewn blynyddoedd i ddod. Bydd yn cymryd llawer iawn o ymrwymiad a buddsoddiad i gyrraedd y bobl hynny.

3:20 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** The Food Standards Agency, now in its third year of existence, has a strong role in food labelling. This is a win-win programme because it protects the interests of our food producers as well as our consumers. That is how we can bring rural affairs and health and wellbeing together. It is also in the commercial interest of food providers to ensure that the consumer becomes more discerning. That emphasises the point that we must focus this nutrition strategy on those who are in the most disadvantaged communities and those who are most vulnerable. I mentioned those people in my statement. We should focus our attention on that, as some projects, such as Sure Start, food co-operatives, health inequalities funds and fruit tuck shops do already. They focus on those communities and the sectors of the population that need such attention. That will be the way forward for the nutrition strategy.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, sydd bellach yn ei thrydedd flwyddyn, rôl bwysig i'w chwarae o ran labelu bwyd. Mae hon yn rhaglen lle mae pawb ar ei ennill am ei bod yn diogelu buddiannau ein cynhyrchwyr bwyd yn ogystal â'n defnyddwyr. Dyna sut y gallwn ddod â materion gwledig ac iechyd a lles ynghyd. Mae hefyd er budd masnachol darparwyr bwyd i sicrhau bod y defnyddiwr yn meithrin safonau uwch. Mae hynny'n pwysleisio'r ffaith bod rhaid inni ganolbwyntio'r strategaeth faeth hon ar y rhai hynny sydd yn y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig a'r rhai hynny sydd fwyaf diamddiffyn. Cyfeiriais at y bobl hynny yn fy natganiad. Dylem ganolbwyntio ar hynny, gan fod rhai prosiectau, fel y mae Cychwyn Cadarn, mentrau bwyd cymunedol, cronfeydd anghydraddoldebau iechyd a siopau ffrwythau yn ei wneud eisoes. Maent yn canolbwyntio ar y cymunedau hynny a'r sectorau o'r boblogaeth y bydd angen sylw o'r fath arnynt. Dyna'r ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer y strategaeth faeth.

### **Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Diwygio'r GIG a'r Proffesiynau Gofal Iechyd 2002**

### **Delegation of the Functions of the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Act 2002**

**Y Llywydd:** Oherwydd bod y Cyfarfod Llawn hwn wedi cael ei ohirio am 10 munud, bydd modd estyn y cyfarfod am 10 munud, os bydd angen.

**The Presiding Officer:** As this Plenary was adjourned for 10 minutes, it will be possible to extend the meeting by 10 minutes, if necessary.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 62 (1) (b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all the functions of the National Assembly contained in the National Health Service Reform and Health Care Professions Act 2002 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions. (NDM1192)*

This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and, where necessary, to staff. The Assembly powers contained in the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Act 2002 are an important step in restructuring the NHS in Wales. The Act provides the primary legislation required to ensure the framework to develop health policy in line with our plan, 'Improving Health in Wales'. The Act will abolish health authorities in Wales from April 2003. They will be replaced by local health boards that will commission health services for their local populations. Uniquely, the new local health boards and local authorities will have a duty to work together to formulate and implement health, social care and wellbeing strategies for the people in their areas. Bringing the NHS and local government together in that way is distinctive to Wales, and it will deliver joined-up health and social care planning and provision.

The changes will bring a greater local voice to NHS decision making. In Wales, community health councils play an effective role as the public's representatives in the NHS, and we plan to strengthen that role in the future. There is no question of the Act

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adrannau 62 (1) (b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir o fewn Deddf Diwygio'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol a'r Proffesiynau Gofal Iechyd 2002; i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.*

*Ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig hwn yn golygu y caiff goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn na rôl Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad o ran gweithredu'r swyddogaethau uchod eu lleihau. (NDM1192)*

Bydd y dirprwyo hwn yn cael ei wneud gan wybod y caiff y swyddogaethau hynny eu dirprwyo ymhellach i Weinidog priodol yn y Cynulliad, a lle y bo hynny'n angenrheidiol, i'r staff priodol. Mae pwerau'r Cynulliad a gynhwysir o fewn Deddf Diwygio'r GIG a'r Proffesiynau Gofal Iechyd 2002 yn gam pwysig yn y broses o ailstrwythuro'r GIG yng Nghymru. Darpara'r Ddeddf y ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol sy'n angenrheidiol i sicrhau'r fframwaith i ddatblygu polisi iechyd yn unol â'n cynllun, 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru'. Bydd y Ddeddf yn diddymu awdurdodau iechyd yng Nghymru o Ebrill 2003. Cânt eu disodli gan fyrdau iechyd lleol a fydd yn comisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd ar gyfer y boblogaeth leol. Mewn ffordd unigryw bydd gan y byrdau iechyd lleol newydd a'r awdurdodau lleol ddyletswydd i gydweithio i ffurfio a gweithredu strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles ar gyfer pobl yn eu hardaloedd. Mae dwyn y GIG a llywodraeth leol ynghyd yn y modd hwnnw yn rhywbeth sy'n arbennig i Gymru, a bydd yn cyflwyno darpariaeth cynllunio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol gydgysylltiedig.

Bydd y newidiadau yn dod â mwy o lais lleol i benderfyniadau'r GIG. Yng Nghymru, mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn chwarae rôl effeithiol fel cynrychiolydd y cyhoedd yn y GIG, a bwriadwn gryfhau'r rôl honno yn y dyfodol. Ni fydd y Ddeddf yn dileu

abolishing community health councils in Wales, as it does in England. The Act also gives the Assembly powers to enable NHS bodies and the prison service to enter into arrangements to secure and maintain prisoners' health.

In bringing these provisions into effect, we will be better placed to challenge health inequalities and improve the standard of healthcare for the people of Wales. Today's debate is about delegation of functions, which is the first step in implementing the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Act 2002 in Wales. I welcome the introduction of the Act and commend the motion to Members.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Normally, we would welcome provisions delegating functions to the National Assembly, as the Assembly needs all the powers it can get. However, for the first time, and with great reluctance, Plaid Cymru will oppose this transfer of functions. The reason for that is that we are concerned about the proposals as outlined by the Minister for Health and Social Services in Plenary and Committee. Unquestionably, this project by the coalition Government to restructure the health service is the biggest it has undertaken. However, in recent weeks it has become clear that the project is surrounded by chaos, confusion and uncertainty: chaos, because many of the deadlines set by the Minister for Health and Social Services for each stage of proceedings have been changed; confusion, because there will be 54 bodies running the health service for a nation of 3 million people; uncertainty, because no-one can predict the cost of either the transitional arrangements until the new structures are in place or the operational costs once the new system is running.

The Minister for Health and Social Services and the Business Minister have both played down the significance of the memo, dated 15 October, from the programme director responsible for the NHS structural change programme. That is not good enough. The

cynghorau iechyd cymuned yng Nghymru, fel y gwna yn Lloegr. Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd yn rhoi pwerau i'r Cynulliad i alluogi cyrff y GIG a'r gwasanaeth carcharau i wneud trefniadau i ddiogelu a chynnal iechyd carcharorion.

Wrth ddod â'r darpariaethau hyn i rym, byddwn mewn gwell sefyllfa i herio anghyfartaleddau iechyd a gwella safon gofal iechyd i bobl Cymru. Mae'r ddadl heddiw yn ymwneud â dirprwyo swyddogaethau, sef y cam cyntaf mewn gweithredu Deddf Diwygio'r GIG a'r Proffesiynau Gofal Iechyd 2002 yng Nghymru. Croesawaf gyflwyno'r Ddeddf a chymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Aelodau.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Fel arfer, byddem yn croesawu darpariaethau yn dirprwyo swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan fod angen i'r Cynulliad gael yr holl bwerau posibl. Fodd bynnag, am y tro cyntaf, ac yn amharod iawn, bydd Plaid Cymru yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig hwn i drosglwyddo swyddogaethau. Y rheswm dros hynny yw ein bod yn pryderu am y cynigion fel y'u hamlinellwyd gan y Gweinidog Dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a'r Pwyllgor. Yn ddiamau, y prosiect hwn i ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd yw'r un mwyaf i'r llywodraeth glymblaid hon ymgymryd ag ef. Fodd bynnag, dros yr wythnosau diwethaf daeth yn amlwg bod y prosiect yn llawn anhrefn, dryswch ac ansicrwydd: anhrefn oherwydd bod llawer o'r terfynau amser a bennwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar gyfer pob cam wedi newid; dryswch, oherwydd bydd 54 o gyrff yn rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd ar gyfer cenedl o 3 miliwn o bobl; ansicrwydd oherwydd ni all unrhyw un ragweld cost naill ai'r trefniadau trosiannol hyd nes y bydd y strwythurau newydd yn eu lle, na'r costau gweithredu unwaith y bydd y system newydd ar waith.

Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Trefnydd ill dau wedi gwneud yn fach o arwyddocâd y memo, dyddiedig 15 Hydref, oddi wrth y cyfarwyddwr rhaglen sy'n gyfrifol am raglen newidiadau strwythurol y GIG. Nid yw

Government's attitude was unjustifiably complacent yesterday, as was the attitude of the Minister for Health and Social Services and the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee at its meeting last week. The Business Minister told us yesterday that the words 'major risks', which appear in the memo, are normally seen in such memoranda. What words would be used if there were a major crisis with the programme? What do the words 'major risks' mean? For the sake of argument, let us take them in their literal sense—that there is currently a problem with the structures. Let us see what the major risks in this project are. There are two major concerns. The memo states that the first major risk is the issue of cost. When the Minister announced these structural changes, we were informed that they would be cost-neutral—we were led to believe that that included the transitional costs as well as the operational costs. Now we hear that the transitional costs will be at least £15 million, and that the figure is rising. If these changes go through, by 1 April 2003 the cost will be significantly higher than £15 million. We are now told 'we always said there would be transitional costs, but the operating costs will be neutral'. In other words, the new structure—54 bodies to replace the current ones—will be run on the same budget as the existing system. The management, structural and bureaucracy costs of the existing system are £73.6 million. We have been told that the new system will cost no more than that. The Minister said in response to a direct question by David Melding in last week's Committee meeting that it will be exactly the same cost. What does the memo say about the cost? It states that detailed work is continuing on the transitional costs of establishing the new structure and its operational running costs. How can the Minister state so categorically that this will be cost-neutral if work is still continuing on how much it will cost?

Only 13 senior management posts, out of a total of 88 for the 22 local health boards, have so far been filled. Incidentally, in the

hynny'n ddigon da. Yr oedd ymagwedd y llywodraeth ddoe yn hunanfodlon a hynny heb gyfiawnhad, fel yr oedd agwedd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ei gyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedodd y Trefnydd wrthym ddoe bod y geiriau '*major risks*', sy'n ymddangos yn y memo, yn rhai yr arferir eu gweld mewn memoranda o'r fath. Pa eiriau a ddefnyddid pe bai argyfwng mawr gyda'r rhaglen? Beth yw ystyr y geiriau '*major risks*'? Er enghraifft, gadewch inni eu cymryd yn llythrennol—bod anhawster gyda'r strwythurau ar hyn o bryd. Gadewch inni weld beth yw risgiau mawr y prosiect hwn. Mae dau bryder mawr. Noda'r memo mai'r risg fawr gyntaf yw'r gost. Pan gyhoeddodd y Gweinidog y newidiadau strwythurol hyn, dywedwyd wrthym y byddent yn niwtral o ran cost—fe'n harweiniwyd i gredu bod hynny'n cynnwys y costau trosiannol ynghyd â'r costau gweithredu. Yn awr dywedir wrthym y bydd y costau trosiannol yn £15 miliwn o leiaf, a bod y swm yn codi. Os aiff y newidiadau hyn drwodd, erbyn 1 Ebrill 2003 bydd y gost yn sylweddol uwch na £15 miliwn. Dywedir wrthym yn awr 'dywedasom o hyd y byddai costau trosiannol ond y byddai'r costau gweithredu yn niwtral'. Mewn geiriau eraill, byddai'r strwythur newydd—54 corff i ddisodli'r rhai cyfredol—yn cael ei redeg ar yr un gyllideb â'r system bresennol. Mae costau rheoli, strwythurol a biwrocratiaeth y system bresennol yn £73.6 miliwn. Dywedwyd wrthym na fydd y system newydd yn costio mwy na hynny. Dywedodd y Gweinidog mewn ymateb i gwestiwn uniongyrchol gan David Melding yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf y byddai'r gost yn union yr un fath. Beth y mae'r memo yn ei ddweud am y gost? Dywed fod gwaith manwl yn parhau ar gostau trosiannol sefydlu'r strwythur newydd a'i gostau gweithredu. Sut y gall y Gweinidog ddweud mor bendant y bydd hyn yn niwtral o ran cost os yw'r gwaith yn parhau i fynd rhagddo ar faint fydd yn ei gostio?

Dim ond 13 o swyddi uwch-reolwyr, allan o gyfanswm o 88 ar gyfer y 22 bwrdd iechyd lleol, a lanwyd hyd yn hyn. Gyda llaw, yn y

system that is being developed, chief executives of the 22 local health boards will be paid £80,000 a year. One hundred nurses could be employed for the cost of the 22 chief executives. When the new structures are in place, there will not be one new nurse, one new doctor or one extra bed in the health service, but we will have an overblown bureaucracy of 88 senior management posts at a massive cost to the national health service. That is why we are worried about these proposals. It is crazy to go ahead with the plan as it currently stands.

3:30 p.m.

We also know that the Minister faces a mammoth task in putting these changes in place by 1 April 2003. Today, new waiting lists were announced. Therefore, while Jane Hutt is busy putting forward this overblown piece of bureaucracy, the waiting lists rise. Eighty thousand people in Wales are now waiting for their first out-patient appointment. The Minister for Health and Social Services said that no-one would be waiting at the end of the first Assembly term. At the last election she said that no-one would have to wait for in-patient treatment, yet 4,000 people have now been waiting more than 18 months. She is now pushing these reforms forward—even though everyone knows they are in absolute chaos—while the waiting lists continue to rise. That is why we will vote against this transfer of functions Order today. It is time that this Government got its priorities right and put all these changes on hold until we have an opportunity to hold a proper debate about the future.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you, Presiding Officer, for the opportunity to express the Liberal Democrats' support for the delegation of functions. Before I comment on behalf of my party, I will respond to Ieuan Wyn Jones's attack on me as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee in describing my attitude as complacent. As Chair, I have never turned down a request by the Plaid Cymru spokesperson, or by the Conservative Party spokesperson, to debate this issue in

system sy'n cael ei datblygu, telir £88,000 y flwyddyn i brif weithredwyr y 22 bwrdd iechyd lleol. Gellid cyflogi 100 o nyrsys am gost y 22 prif weithredwr. Pan fydd y strwythurau newydd ar waith, ni fydd yr un nyrs newydd, yr un meddyg newydd nac un gwely ychwanegol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond bydd gennym fiwrocratiaeth enfawr o 88 o uwchswyddi rheoli ar gost enfawr i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Dyna pam ein bod yn gofidio am y cynigion hyn. Mae'n wallgofrwydd i fwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun fel y mae.

Gwyddom hefyd fod y Gweinidog yn wynebu tasg enfawr i roi'r newidiadau hyn ar waith erbyn 1 Ebrill 2003. Heddiw, cyhoeddwyd rhestrau aros newydd. Felly, tra bod Jane Hutt yn brysur yn cyflwyno'r darn enfawr hwn o fiwrocratiaeth, mae'r rhestrau aros yn cynyddu. Mae 80,000 o bobl yng Nghymru yn awr yn aros am eu hapwyntiad cleifion allanol cyntaf. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol na fyddai unrhyw un yn aros ar ddiwedd tymor cyntaf y Cynulliad. Adeg yr etholiad diwethaf dywedodd na fyddai'n rhaid i unrhyw un aros am driniaeth fel claf mewnol, ond eto mae 4,000 o bobl wedi bod yn aros yn awr am fwy na 18 mis. Mae hi yn awr yn gwthio'r diwygiadau hyn drwodd—er fod pawb yn gwybod eu bod mewn anhrefn llwyr—tra bod y rhestrau aros yn parhau i gynyddu. Dyna pam y byddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y Gorchymyn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau hwn heddiw. Mae'n hen bryd i'r Llywodraeth hon roi trefn ar ei blaenoriaethau a gohirio'r holl newidiadau hyn hyd nes y cawn gyfle i gynnal dadl briodol ynglŷn â'r dyfodol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch ichi, Lywydd, am y cyfle i ddatgan cefnogaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i'r cynnig i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau. Cyn imi wneud sylwadau ar ran fy mhlaid, ymatebaf i ymosodiad Ieuan Wyn Jones arnaf fi fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol pan ddisgrifiodd fy agwedd fel un hunanfodlon. Fel Cadeirydd, ni wrthodais erioed gais gan lefarydd Plaid Cymru, nac ychwaith gan lefarydd y Blaid Geidwadol, i gynnal dadl ar



Committee. In fact, I cannot remember the Plaid Cymru health spokesperson asking for a debate on this issue. I have ensured that all parties have had every opportunity to scrutinise the Minister on these proposals and I have done so in a fair, and hopefully transparent, way. I have given everyone an opportunity to express their views and to help shape the Committee agendas.

Yesterday, I spoke in my capacity as the Liberal Democrats' business manager and not as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee. Roles and responsibilities are clearly laid out and if Plaid Cymru has a problem with my chairmanship of the Committee and if my treatment of its requests has been unfair, perhaps it should refer its comments to the Presiding Officer.

It is ironic that Plaid Cymru should criticise the Welsh Assembly Government for its reorganisation proposals. If I am not mistaken, in 2001, Plaid Cymru campaigned on a manifesto which called for mass reorganisation of the NHS by scrapping NHS trusts. Scrapping those trusts would have a much more detrimental effect, by getting rid of the people responsible for providing treatment rather than reorganising the commissioning authorities—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Liberal Democrat spokesperson is making a speech and I would be grateful if you would not interrupt her.

**Kirsty Williams:** The truth is that Plaid Cymru stood on a platform of mass NHS reorganisation, although it has now changed its mind and decided that its policy in 2001 was wrong.

By developing our local health groups and boards, we have a wonderful opportunity to bring local democracy and social services provision closer to the NHS. I have heard the phrase 'seamless service' used several times in the Chamber. The Welsh Assembly Government is striving to make that a reality. We will also inject an increased amount of local democracy into the service by allowing local populations to decide the priorities for

y mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor. Yn wir, nid allaf gofio i lefarydd Plaid Cymru ofyn am ddatl ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf wedi sicrhau bod yr holl bartion wedi cael pob cyfle i graffu ar waith y Gweinidog ar y cynigion hyn a gwneuthum hynny mewn ffordd deg, a thryloyw gobeithio. Yr wyf wedi rhoi cyfle i bawb fynegi eu barn ac i gynorthwyo i lunio agendâu'r Pwyllgor.

Ddoe, siaradais yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel trefnydd busnes y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac nid fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Nodir y rolau a'r cyfrifoldebau yn glir iawn ac os oes gan Plaid Cymru broblem gyda'm cadeiryddiaeth o'r Pwyllgor ac os yw fy ymdriniaeth o'i cheisiadau wedi bod yn annheg, efallai y dylai gyfeirio ei sylwadau i'r Llywydd.

Mae'n eironig bod Plaid Cymru yn beirniadu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ei gynigion ad-drefnu. Os nad wyf yn camgymryd, yn 2001, ymgyrchodd Plaid Cymru ar fanifesto a alwai am ad-drefnu'r GIG yn gyfan gwbl drwy ddiddymu'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG. Byddai diddymu'r ymddiriedolaethau hynny wedi cael effaith llawer gwaeth, drwy gael gwared ar y bobl sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu triniaeth yn hytrach nag ad-drefnu'r awdurdodau comisiynu—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae llefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gwneud araith a byddai'n dda gennyf pe na baech yn torri ar ei thraws.

**Kirsty Williams:** Y gwir amdani yw bod Plaid Cymru wedi cefnogi ad-drefnu'r GIG yn llwyr, er ei bod yn awr wedi newid ei meddwl ac wedi penderfynu bod ei pholisi yn 2001 yn anghywir.

Drwy ddatblygu ein grwpiau a'n byrddau iechyd lleol, mae gennym gyfle gwych i ddod â democratiaeth leol a darpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn nes at y GIG. Clywais y dywediad 'gwasanaeth di-dor' yn cael ei ddefnyddio lawer gwaith yn y Siambr. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymdrechu i wneud hynny'n realiti. Byddwn hefyd yn chwistrellu swm ychwanegol o ddemocratiaeth leol i'r gwasanaeth drwy

their own areas. Powys welcomes the abolition of a remote, unrepresentative health authority based in Carmarthen, which has done its best to undermine local provision in Powys. We look forward to these powers being returned to local people and professionals so that they can decide on the priorities for Powys.

Any reorganisation carries an associated risk. However, it would be more worrying if the people responsible for undertaking reorganisation were unwilling to acknowledge that risk. That is when there is a danger of failure—when people do not keep their eye on the ball. We must constantly remind ourselves and others of the potential pitfalls of reorganisation, ensuring that problems do not arise and that in April 2003 we have an organisation that is fit to deliver for the people of Wales.

**David Melding:** We heard a most eloquent speech from the leader of the opposition and I will not repeat the criticisms that he expressed, although I agree with them. I do not want to damage his or my party by pursuing that fact. Our group will also register its opposition to the proposals for restructuring the NHS by voting against the motion. However, it is a token resistance given that these reforms are delivered by the Liberal Democrat vote.

I criticise Kirsty Williams on political grounds because she is wrong to allow these proposals to be carried. However, she has chaired the Committee in an exemplary and non-partisan way. We have had every opportunity to examine these issues and to pursue the Minister on some points—I have, at times, been called to ask two or three supplementary questions when quizzing the Minister. That is beyond reasonable conduct, and allows the opposition its full right to oppose and hold the executive to account. I give her due credit for that.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I was not criticising the

ganiatáu i boblogaethau lleol benderfynu ar y blaenoriaethau ar gyfer eu hardaloedd eu hunain. Mae Powys yn croesawu diddymu awdurdod pell anghynrychioliadol yng Nghaerfyrddin, sydd wedi gwneud ei orau i danseilio darpariaeth leol ym Mhowys. Edrychwn ymlaen i'r pwerau hyn ddychwelyd i'r bobl leol a phobl broffesiynol fel y gallant hwy benderfynu ar y blaenoriaethau i Bowys.

Mae risg yn gysylltiedig ag unrhyw ad-drefnu. Fodd bynnag, byddai yn fwy o achos pryder pe bai'r bobl sy'n gyfrifol am yr ad-drefnu yn amharod i gydnabod y risg honno. Dyna pryd mae perygl o fethiant—pan na fydd pobl yn cadw eu llygad ar y bêl. Rhaid inni atgoffa ein hunain ac eraill yn gyson o beryglon posibl ad-drefnu, gan sicrhau na fydd problemau yn codi ac y bydd gennym yn Ebrill 2003 sefydliad sy'n addas i ddarparu gwasanaethau i bobl Cymru.

**David Melding:** Clywsom araith huawdl iawn gan arweinydd yr wrthblaid ac nid ailadroddaf y beirmiadaethau a fynegodd, er fy mod yn cytuno â hwy. Nid wyf am wneud niwed i'w blaid ef na'm plaid innau drwy fynd ar drywydd y ffaith honno. Bydd ein grŵp ninnau hefyd yn cofnodi ein gwrthwynebiad i'r cynigion i ailstrwythuro'r GIG drwy bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig. Fodd bynnag, gwrthwynebiad mewn enw ydyw o gofio bod y diwygiadau hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno drwy bleidlais y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Beirmiadaf Kirsty Williams ar sail wleidyddol oherwydd mae hi'n anghywir i ganiatáu i'r cynigion hyn gael eu derbyn. Fodd bynnag, mae hi wedi cadeirio'r Pwyllgor yn rhagorol ac yn amhleidiol. Cawsom bob cyfle i archwilio'r materion hyn ac i holi'r Gweinidog ar rai pwyntiau—yr wyf, weithiau, wedi cael fy ngalw i ofyn dau neu dri o gwestiynau atodol wrth holi'r Gweinidog. Mae hynny y tu hwnt i ymddygiad rhesymol, ac yn rhoi yr hawl lawn i'r gwrthbleidiau wrthwynebu a dwyn y weithrediaeth i gyfrif. Rhoddaf y clod dyledus iddi am hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Nid oeddwn yn

way Kirsty Williams has chaired the Committee—it is a political judgment on the structures.

**David Melding:** We also concur on that point, which pleases me.

To focus on an issue that was not raised by Ieuan Wyn Jones, the difficulty is the fact that the Minister has faced a tight legislative timescale for these health service reforms. I have already made the point, but it needs to be repeated. Originally, in summer 2001, the Minister said that these reforms would be delivered in a specific Wales-only NHS health Bill. That would have allowed an appropriate and more relaxed timescale and a full examination of the new structures. We could have put them in place in our own time.

This structure is not ideal even for the governing party, as it will be introduced at the time of next year's Assembly elections. It faces the most acute difficulty because anyone who has been involved in major restructuring of a public agency knows that a great deal of turbulence is inevitable in the initial stages, even if, over time, the structures prove to be effective. The Minister has been forced on this course because she could not defend the Bill that was negotiated by the First Minister. Within five weeks, she was told that this had to be passed by means of an England and Wales Bill. That Bill has now become an Act and all these procedures have, therefore, been rushed through—although she could still have abolished the health authorities a year later and given herself more room for manoeuvre. The problem has been caused by the tight legislative timescale under which we have had to work.

I wish the new structures well because they will come into place. Our criticisms have been based on principle. The new structures are bureaucratic and differ markedly from the structure that will be in place in England. We think that the risks are high. We have made these criticisms repeatedly. Most of the senior appointments are yet to be made.

beirniadu'r ffordd y cadeiriodd Kirsty Williams y Pwyllgor—barn wleidyddol ar y strwythurau ydyw.

**David Melding:** Cytunwn ar y pwynt hwnnw hefyd, sy'n fy mhlesio.

I ganolbwyntio ar fater nas codwyd gan Ieuan Wyn Jones, yr anhawster yw i'r Gweinidog wynebu amserlen ddeddfwriaethol dynn ar gyfer y diwygiadau gwasanaeth iechyd hyn. Yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud y pwynt, ond mae angen ei ailadrodd. Yn wreiddiol, yn haf 2001, dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddai'r diwygiadau hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno mewn Mesur iechyd GIG penodol ar gyfer Cymru'n unig. Byddai hynny wedi caniatáu amserlen fwy priodol a hamddenol ac archwiliad llawn o'r strwythurau newydd. Gallem fod wedi eu rhoi ar waith yn ein hamser ein hunain.

Nid yw'r strwythur hwn yn ddelfrydol hyd yn oed i'r blaid sy'n llywodraethu, gan y caiff ei gyflwyno ar adeg etholiadau'r Cynulliad y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'n wynebu'r anhawster mwyaf dwys oherwydd bydd unrhyw un a fu'n ymwneud â phroses ailstrwythuro fawr mewn asiantaeth gyhoeddus yn gwybod bod llawer o gynnwrf yn anorfod yn y camau cychwynnol, hyd yn oed os bydd y strwythurau, gydag amser, yn profi'n effeithiol. Gorfodwyd y Gweinidog i gymryd y camau hyn oherwydd na allai amddiffyn y Mesur a negodwyd gan y Prif Weinidog. O fewn pum wythnos, dywedwyd wrthi y byddai'n rhaid i hyn gael ei basio drwy gyfrwng Mesur Cymru a Lloegr. Mae'r Mesur hwn bellach wedi dod yn Ddeddf ac mae'r gweithdrefnau hyn i gyd, felly, wedi cael eu rhuthro drwodd—er y gallai fod wedi diddymu'r awdurdodau iechyd flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach a rhoi mwy o hyblygrwydd iddi hi ei hun. Achoswyd y broblem gan y terfynau amser deddfwriaethol llym y bu'n rhaid inni weithio tuag atynt.

Dymunaf yn dda i'r strwythurau newydd oherwydd cânt eu gweithredu. Mae ein beirniadaethau wedi eu seilio ar egwyddor. Mae'r strwythurau newydd yn fiwrocraataidd ac yn wahanol iawn i'r strwythurau a fydd ar waith yn Lloegr. Credwn fod y risgiau'n fawr. Yr ydym wedi gwneud y beirniadaethau hyn droeon. Mae'r rhan fwyaf

These new bodies already exist in shadow form. They will assume their statutory obligations in April. It is risky for the Government to set up these new structures so quickly. It faces the risk of structural failure, certainly in the early stages, because of its haste in introducing the system.

3:40 p.m.

The Minister has repeatedly referred to costs and stated that the new system will not cost more than the old one. However, the memo states that those costs are still to be assessed and that no estimate has been made of them. Therefore, her naive and breezy assurances must be re-examined. The people of Wales deserve an honest answer to the question of when they are likely to hear how much the new structures will cost. To be fair to the Minister—I believe that she is an honest person at heart—she is asking for an independent audit of the new structures. However, she is still telling us that she can guarantee that they will not cost more than the old system. I am not sure why she needs an independent auditor to tell her how much they will cost if she has already determined that they will not cost more. For all these reasons, we will be voting against the Government. It has decided on its one significant policy development on health, namely restructuring the NHS. It has not decided to recruit extra doctors and nurses or tried to lower waiting lists, despite its manifesto promises. It has chosen to prioritise the restructuring of the NHS. It is the most significant restructuring since health authorities were established in the 1970s. It is obviously the wrong decision and it has been developed in a most maladroit way. However, the Cabinet is courageous for delivering these changes on the eve of the next Assembly elections.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I was surprised to hear the Plaid Cymru party leader speak during this important discussion rather than Dai Lloyd. Are you not capable of answering for your contribution in the Health and Social

o'r penodiadau uwch eto i'w gwneud. Mae'r cyrff hyn yn bodoli'n barod ar ffurf gysgodol. Byddant yn derbyn rhwymedigaethau statudol ym mis Ebrill. Mae'n risg i'r Llywodraeth sefydlu'r strwythurau newydd hyn mor gyflym. Mae'n wynebu'r risg o fethiant strwythurol, yn sicr yn y camau cynnar, oherwydd y brys wrth gyflwyno'r system.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog droeon at gostau a dywedodd na fydd y system newydd yn costio mwy na'r hen un. Fodd bynnag, noda'r memo nad yw'r costau hyn wedi eu hasesu eto ac nad oes amcangyfrif wedi ei wneud ohonynt. Felly, rhaid ailarchwilio ei sicrwydd naif ac ysgafn. Mae pobl Cymru yn haeddu ateb gonest i'r cwestiwn o pryd maent yn debygol o glywed faint fydd y strwythurau newydd yn ei gostio. I fod yn deg i'r Gweinidog—credaf ei bod yn berson gonest yn y bôn—mae'n gofyn am archwiliad annibynnol o'r strwythurau newydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n parhau i ddweud na fyddant yn costio mwy na'r hen system. Nid wyf yn siŵr pam bod angen archwilydd annibynnol arni i ddweud wrthi faint y byddant yn ei gostio os yw eisoes wedi penderfynu na fyddant yn costio rhagor. Am yr holl resymau hyn, byddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y Llywodraeth. Mae wedi penderfynu ar ei datblygiad polisi arwyddocaol ar iechyd, sef ailstrwythuro'r GIG. Nid yw wedi penderfynu recriwtio meddygon a nyrsys ychwanegol na cheisio lleihau'r rhestrau aros, er gwaethaf ei haddewidion yn ei maniffesto. Mae wedi dewis blaenoriaethu ailstrwythuro'r GIG. Hwn yw'r ailstrwythuro mwyaf arwyddocaol ers i awdurdodau iechyd gael eu sefydlu yn y 1970au. Mae'n amlwg yn benderfyniad anghywir ac mae wedi cael ei ddatblygu yn y modd mwyaf anhylaw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Cabinet yn ddewr i gyflwyno'r newidiadau hyn ar drothwy'r etholiadau Cynulliad nesaf.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Rhyfeddais wrth glywed arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn siarad yn ystod y drafodaeth bwysig hon yn hytrach na Dai Lloyd. Oni allwch ateb dros eich cyfraniad yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a

Services Committee during the past three and a half years, Dai? As Kirsty said, you have been remarkably docile on the Committee in relation to these reforms. Ieuan spoke on this issue, but he does not understand or know about the reforms and changes. It is clear that he is still reading text from a year or two ago. Plaid and the Welsh Conservatives are showing a wilful refusal to accept the truth and what I say under scrutiny. No other reorganisation has come under such scrutiny—the former Conservative Government's local government reorganisation and its health service reorganisation were not scrutinised in this way. The Welsh Assembly Government is allowing detailed scrutiny of this implementation. The information that you refer to is already in the public domain—that is a demonstration of your poor investigative skills.

**Nick Bourne:** Does your condemnation of the opposition to your plans extend to all the professional organisations that have condemned them and to the two Ministers who immediately preceded you in having responsibility for health in Wales, namely Jon Owen Jones and Win Griffiths, both of whom are greatly concerned about these plans and do not think that they should go ahead?

**Jane Hutt:** It is as if time has stood still for a year. A year ago we discussed this issue in the Chamber. A full extensive consultation on the NHS reforms was conducted during the summer of last year. At least two debates took place in the Chamber and endless discussions were held in the Health and Social Services Committee. I made changes—if you do not know about them, Nick, David Melding, Dai Lloyd and everyone who sits on the Committee certainly do—because I listened to people. That is what democracy is about. David Melding has played a significant role in terms of scrutiny. Unlike your docile companion, Dai Lloyd, you have tried to make a contribution, David. You helped Kirsty and me to appoint the 22 chairs of the new local health boards. You have played your part because the Welsh

Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol dros y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf, Dai? Fel y dywedodd Kirsty, buoch yn hynod o ddof ar y Pwyllgor mewn perthynas â'r diwygiadau hyn. Ieuan a siaradodd ar y mater hwn, ond nid yw ef yn deall nac yn gwybod am y diwygiadau a'r newidiadau. Mae'n amlwg ei fod yn parhau i ddarllen testun o'r llynedd neu'r flwyddyn gynt. Mae Plaid Cymru a Cheidwadwyr Cymru yn benderfynol o wrthod derbyn y gwirionedd a'r hyn a ddywedaf o dan broses graffu. Nid oes unrhyw ad-drefnu arall wedi bod yn destun cymaint o graffu—ni chraffwyd ar broses ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol ac ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd gan yr hen Lywodraeth Geidwadol yn y modd hwn. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn caniatáu archwiliad manwl o weithredu'r ad-drefnu. Mae'r wybodaeth y cyfeiriwch ati eisoes yn wybodaeth sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd—mae hynny'n arddangos eich sgiliau ymchwilio gwael.

**Nick Bourne:** A yw eich condemniad o'r gwrthwynebiad i'ch cynlluniau yn ymestyn i'r holl gyrff proffesiynol sydd wedi'u condemnio ac i'r ddau Weinidog a'ch rhagflaenodd chi a oedd â chyfrifoldeb dros iechyd yng Nghymru, sef Jon Owen Jones a Win Griffiths. Mae'r ddau ohonynt yn bryderus iawn am y cynlluniau hyn ac nid ydynt yn credu y dylent fynd rhagddynt?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'n ymddangos fel pe bai amser wedi aros yn llonydd am flwyddyn. Flwyddyn yn ôl trafodasom y mater hwn yn y Siambr. Cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad eang llawn ar ddiwygio'r GIG yn ystod yr haf y llynedd. Cynhaliwyd o leiaf ddwy ddadl yn y Siambr a chynhaliwyd trafodaethau diddiwedd yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Gwneuthum newidiadau—os na wyddoch amdanynt Nick, mae David Melding, Dai Lloyd a phawb sy'n eistedd ar y Pwyllgor yn sicr yn gwybod—oherwydd gwrandewais ar bobl. Dyna beth yw ystyr democratiaeth. Chwaraeodd David Melding ran sylweddol o ran craffu. Yn wahanol i'ch cyfaill dof, Dai Lloyd, yr ydych chi wedi ceisio gwneud cyfraniad, David. Rhoesoch gymorth i mi a Kirsty i benodi'r 22 cadeirydd i'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd.

Assembly Government, and the UK Labour Government, in introducing devolution, have given you a role that you would never have been given otherwise. You played your part in appointing the chairs of those health—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is concluding her speech.

**Jane Hutt:** You also played your part by improving the secondary legislation that came from the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Act 2002. This is important for the Assembly because Members have the opportunity to play their part in influencing the legislative process.

I must put the record straight in terms of the information that has been referred to as a leaked memo. It is information that has been available on the Improving Health in Wales website. In September, there was an update on the structural changes programme, which used exactly the same words about recognising the risks and the priorities ahead of us, but none of you bothered to look at it. It was also on the website last week. There was no secrecy. If you were interested, you would have read it. It is not a leak; it is transparent, open information that is required by the National Audit Office.

**Cynog Dafis:** Deallaf eich bod wedi gwrthod cymryd rhan mewn trafodaeth ar y teledu yr wythnos diwethaf ar y sail nad ydych yn cyfrannu tuag at drafodaethau cyhoeddus ar ddogfennau sydd wedi'i rhyddhau heb ganiatâd. Os oedd y ddogfen hon ar gael i'r cyhoedd ar hyd yr amser, pam nad oeddech yn fodlon cymryd rhan yn y trafodaethau ynglŷn â'r diwygiadau?

**Jane Hutt:** On the *Dragon's Eye* item, to which you obviously refer, it was in no way a scoop. I did not take part in a discussion on that late night programme. However, the programme was desperate for a story and therefore invented one. It was in no way a leak or a scoop. That is why I am putting the record straight.

Chwaraeoch chi eich rhan oherwydd bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Llywodraeth Lafur y DG, drwy gyflwyno datganoli, wedi rhoi rôl i chi na fyddech wedi ei chael o gwbl fel arall. Chwaraeoch eich rhan drwy benodi cadeiryddion y byrddau iechyd hynny—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn dirwyn ei haraith i ben.

**Jane Hutt:** Chwaraeoch eich rhan hefyd drwy'r is-ddeddfwriaeth a ddeilliodd o Ddeddf Diwygio'r GIG a'r Proffesiynau Gofal Iechyd 2002. Mae hyn yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad oherwydd bod aelodau yn cael eu cyfle i chwarae eu rhan drwy ddylanwadu ar y broses ddeddfwriaethol.

Rhaid i mi unioni pethau o ran y wybodaeth y cyfeiriwyd ati fel memo a ddatgelwyd. Mae'n wybodaeth sydd wedi bod ar gael ar wefan Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru. Ym mis Medi, yr oedd diweddariad ar y rhaglen newidiadau strwythurol, a ddefnyddiodd yr un geiriau'n union am adnabod y risgiau a'r blaenoriaethau sydd o'n blaen, ond ni thrafferthodd yr un ohonoch i edrych arno. Yr oedd hefyd ar y wefan yr wythnos diwethaf. Nid oedd unrhyw gyfrinach. Pe bai gennych ddiddordeb, byddech wedi ei darllen. Nid yw'n wybodaeth a ddatgelwyd; mae'n wybodaeth dryloyw, agored y mae'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn gofyn amdani.

**Cynog Dafis:** I understand that you refused to take part in a television discussion last week on the basis that you do not take part in public discussions on documents that have been leaked. If this document had been in the public domain the whole time, why did you refuse to take part in the discussions on the reforms?

**Jane Hutt:** Ar yr eitem ar *Dragon's Eye*, yr ydych yn amlwg yn cyfeirio ati, nid oedd honno yn sgŵp o gwbl. Ni chymerais ran yn y drafodaeth ar y rhaglen hwyr honno. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y rhaglen yn cael trafferth i gael stori ac oherwydd hynny fe ddyfeisiodd un. Nid oedd mewn unrhyw fodd yn ddatgeliad nac yn sgŵp. Dyna paham yr wyf yn unioni pethau.

The opposition parties do not have the wit or wisdom to do anything more effective than attack popular reforms. As Kirsty said, the restructuring is about health and social care working together. It is about decentralisation—I thought that Plaid Cymru believed in decentralisation. Do you want to retain the health authorities, and have a quango running the NHS in Wales? It seems that the opposition parties would rather have a quango running the NHS in Wales. The good people who are now leading our local health boards in partnership with local people and local authorities, are taking this forward with a budget increased by 50 per cent—the biggest increase over the last three and a half years. Let us give them the support that they deserve to take these reforms forward. This is about reform and investment, and that is what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing.

Nid oes gan y gwrthbleidiau y dyfeisgarwch na'r doethineb i wneud dim sy'n fwy effeithiol nac ymosod ar ddiwygiadau poblogaidd. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty, mae'r ailstrwythuro yn ymwneud ag iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn cydweithio. Mae'n ymwneud â datganoli—yr oeddwn yn credu bod Plaid Cymru yn credu mewn datganoli. A ydych am gadw'r awdurdodau iechyd a chael cwango yn rhedeg y GIG yng Nghymru? Mae'n ymddangos y byddai'n well gan y gwrthbleidiau weld cwango yn rhedeg y GIG yng Nghymru. Mae'r bobl dda sydd yn awr yn arwain ein byrddau iechyd lleol mewn partneriaeth â phobl leol ac awdurdodau lleol, yn dwyn y gwaith hwn ymlaen gyda chyllideb a gynyddwyd 50 y cant—y cynnydd mwyaf dros y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf. Gadewch inni roi'r cymorth haeddiannol iddynt i ddatblygu'r diwygiadau hyn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â diwygio a buddsoddi, a dyna beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud.

*Cynnig (NDM1192): O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.*

*Motion (NDM1192): For 28, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr The following	Aelodau canlynol o Members voted	o voted	blaid: for:	Pleidleisiodd yr The following	Aelodau canlynol yn Members voted against:	erbyn: against:
Barrett, Lorraine				Bourne, Nick		
Bates, Mick				Cairns, Alun		
Black, Peter				Dafis, Cynog		
Burnham, Eleanor				Davies, David		
Butler, Rosemary				Davies, Geraint		
Chapman, Christine				Davies, Glyn		
Davies, Andrew				Davies, Jocelyn		
Edwards, Richard				Graham, William		
Essex, Sue				Hancock, Brian		
Evans, Delyth				Jarman, Pauline		
German, Michael				Jones, David Ian		
Gregory, Janice				Jones, Elin		
Griffiths, John				Jones, Gareth		
Hart, Edwina				Jones, Helen Mary		
Hutt, Jane				Jones, Ieuan Wyn		
Jones, Ann				Lloyd, David		
Jones, Carwyn				Melding, David		
Law, Peter				Morgan, Jonathan		
Lewis, Huw				Rogers, Peter		
Lloyd, Val				Ryder, Janet		
Middlehurst, Tom				Thomas, Owen John		
Morgan, Rhodri				Thomas, Rhodri Glyn		
Neagle, Lynne				Williams, Phil		
Pugh, Alun						
Randerson, Jenny						
Sinclair, Karen						
Thomas, Gwenda						
Williams, Kirsty						

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.47 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.47 p.m.*

## **Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru The Annual Report of the Health Service Commissioner for Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that we are short of time. We have three debates, including the short debate, the time for which I must protect. That should start at 5 p.m. or 5.10 p.m., which means that we have one hour and 10 minutes for the next two debates. At least 15 Members wish to speak on the First Minister's annual report, and I am minded to impose a three-minute time limit on Members. I appeal for short speeches wherever possible. I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.5, notes the Health Service Commissioner for Wales's annual report 2001-02, laid in the Table Office on 17 July 2002. (NDM1193)*

As was the case last year, the annual report of the Health Service Ombudsman for Wales has been published jointly with that of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman, which was the subject of a separate debate this week. I am pleased that the ombudsman has reported a slight decrease in the number of complaints received by his office during the year ending 31 March 2002. This is consistent with the decrease reported in the number of complaints received by the national health service in Wales during the same period. The complaints received by the ombudsman's office covered a range of issues in relation to care and treatment provided, and nearly all concerned a clinical aspect.

I am concerned by the shortcomings that the ombudsman has highlighted but we must

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Atgoffaf yr Aelodau ein bod yn brin o amser. Mae gennym dair dadl, gan gynnwys y ddadl fer, ac mae'n rhaid imi ddiogelu yr amser a roddwyd ar ei chyfer. Dylai honno ddechrau am 5 p.m. neu 5.10 p.m. sy'n golygu bod gennym awr a 10 munud ar gyfer y ddwy ddadl nesaf. Mae o leiaf 15 Aelod yn dymuno siarad ar adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog, ac mae'n fwriad gennyf osod terfyn amser o dair munud ar Aelodau. Erfyniaf am areithiau byr lle bynnag y bo hynny'n bosibl. Yr wyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5, yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol 2001-02 Comisiynydd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Gorffennaf 2002. (NDM1193)*

Fel y digwyddodd y llynedd, cyhoeddwyd adroddiad blynyddol Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru ar y cyd ag adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru, a oedd yn destun dadl ar wahân yr wythnos hon. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr ombwdsmon wedi adrodd am leihad bach yn nifer y cwynion a dderbyniwyd gan ei swyddfa yn ystod y flwyddyn a ddaeth i ben ar 31 Mawrth 2002. Mae hyn yn gyson â'r lleihad yn nifer y cwynion a dderbyniwyd gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru yn ystod yr un cyfnod. Yr oedd y cwynion a dderbyniwyd gan swyddfa'r ombwdsmon yn cwmpasu ystod o faterion yn ymwneud â gofal a thriniaeth a ddarparwyd, ac yr oedd bron bob un yn ymwneud ag agwedd glinigol.

Yr wyf yn pryderu am y diffygion y mae'r ombwdsmon wedi eu hamlygu ond mae'n



remember that the number of investigations carried out by the ombudsman is small compared to the number of patients treated by the NHS in Wales. I remain committed to the view that complaints must not be feared, as it is only by listening to people's concerns, and ensuring that they are acted upon, that we can make visible and valuable improvement. Therefore, I am pleased that the ombudsman keeps in close touch with the NHS after carrying out an investigation to monitor action taken. I am also pleased that the complaints mentioned in the report have now been resolved and that remedial action has been taken.

3:50 p.m.

As well as noting the concerns that the ombudsman has highlighted regarding care and treatment, the Government also takes seriously his comments, which he has reiterated, about the complaints procedure, clinical negligence and financial redress. Since we debated possible changes to the NHS complaints procedure on 14 March, we have undertaken a considerable amount of work in this regard. Details of those changes are being worked through with our key stakeholders, and an implementation plan is being developed, which outlines several changes to be introduced by April 2003. The changes include proposals to improve, with our staff at the front line, how we communicate with patients, as well as changes to the complaints procedure to make it quicker and more independent. I am confident that these changes will result in a better system for all concerned.

In recognising the link between complaints and clinical negligence claims, we want to make the system of compensation faster and fairer, and are keen to consider alternatives. In Wales, I will pilot a mediation scheme and a fast-track system for resolving clinical negligence claims. The aim is to facilitate a swifter resolution of claims and to assess the potential of these schemes to save on the legal costs associated with claims. I have asked the Counsel General today to write to the senior judge of Cardiff Civil Justice Centre to arrange a meeting to discuss the establishment of the pilot project. The

rhaid inni gofio bod nifer yr ymchwiliadau a gynhelir gan yr ombwdsmon yn fach o gymharu â'r nifer o gleifion a gaiff eu trin gan y GIG yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn parhau yn ymroddedig i'r farn na ddylid ofni cwynion, oherwydd dim ond drwy wrando ar gwynion pobl a sicrhau y gweithredir arnynt y gallwn wneud gwelliant gweladwy a gwerthfawr. Felly, yr wyf yn falch bod yr ombwdsmon yn cadw mewn cysylltiad agos â'r GIG ar ôl cynnal ymchwiliad i fonitro'r camau a gymerwyd. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch bod y cwynion a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad bellach wedi eu datrys a bod camau i'w cywiro wedi cael eu cymryd.

Ynghyd â nodi'r pryderon a amlygwyd gan yr ombwdsmon ynghylch gofal a thriniaeth, mae'r Llywodraeth hefyd yn ystyried ei sylwadau, ac y mae wedi'u hailadrodd, am y weithdrefn gwyno, esgeulustod clinigol ac iawndal yn ddifrifol. Ers inni drafod newidiadau posibl yng ngweithdrefn gwyno y GIG ar 14 Mawrth, yr ydym wedi ymgymryd â chryn dipyn o waith i'r perwyl hwn. Mae manylion y newidiadau hyn yn cael eu trafod gyda'n rhanddeiliaid allweddol, ac mae cynllun gweithredu yn cael ei ddatblygu, sy'n amlinellu sawl newid sydd i'w cyflwyno erbyn Ebrill 2003. Mae'r newidiadau yn cynnwys cynigion i wella, gyda'n staff yn y rheng flaen, y modd yr ydym yn cyfathrebu â chleifion, ynghyd â newidiadau i'r weithdrefn gwyno er mwyn ei gwneud yn gyflymach ac yn fwy annibynnol. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd y newidiadau hyn yn arwain at system well i bawb sy'n ymwneud â hi.

Wrth gydnabod y cysylltiad rhwng cwynion a cheisiadau yn ymwneud ag esgeulustod clinigol, yr ydym am wneud y system iawndal yn gyflymach a thecach, ac yr ydym yn awyddus i ystyried dulliau amgen. Yng Nghymru, byddaf yn cynnal peilot o gynllun cyfryngu a system dull carlam ar gyfer datrys ceisiadau yn ymwneud ag esgeulustod clinigol. Y nod yw datrys ceisiadau'n gyflymach ac i asesu potensial y cynlluniau hyn i arbed ar gostau cyfreithiol sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ceisiadau. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol heddiw i ysgrifennu at yr uwch farnwr yng Nghanolfan

Counsel General will keep me fully apprised of developments throughout the progress of the pilot scheme.

I am always grateful for the work of the ombudsman's office, and its help in ensuring that complaints are resolved in difficult circumstances. We are committed to working with his office to ensure that the important link between its work and the NHS complaints procedure continues to be strong and effective. I assure Members that the Welsh Assembly Government has noted the comments about the NHS complaints procedure with care and, therefore, I will not support the amendment in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**David Melding:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with care the comments made by the Health Service Ombudsman on the complaints procedure within the NHS.*

I agree with much of what the Minister for Health and Social Services said, excepting her reluctance to support our amendment, which is perhaps a little ungenerous, but I will pass over that quickly. We want to emphasise the ombudsman's comments on the state of NHS complaints procedures. The ombudsman is the third tier in the system, and people go to him when they feel that they have no other redress. Therefore, he is perhaps in the best position to examine the overall workings of the system and comment on policy development, and that is what he has done in his report.

There is no doubt that the current NHS complaints system is overly complicated. Patients do not perceive it to be truly independent and therefore lack the confidence to pursue complaints, or may seek other forms of redress at an early and inappropriate stage. Health service bodies do not offer the same level of financial redress as other public agencies, which is an interesting discovery, as we often fear that

Cyfiawnder Sifil Caerdydd i drefnu cyfarfod i drafod sefydlu cynllun peilot. Bydd y Cwnsler Cyffredinol yn fy hysbysu'n llawn o'r datblygiadau drwy gydol cyfnod y cynllun peilot.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bob amser am waith swyddfa'r ombwdsmon, a'i gymorth i sicrhau y caiff cwynion eu datrys mewn amgylchiadau anodd. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i weithio gyda'i swyddfa i sicrhau bod y cyswllt pwysig rhwng ei waith a gweithdrefn gwyno'r GIG yn parhau i fod yn gryf ac effeithiol. Sicrhaf yr Aelodau bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi nodi'r sylwadau am weithdrefn gwyno'r GIG gyda gofal ac felly, ni fyddaf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**David Melding:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn nodi'n ofalus y sylwadau a wnaeth Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd ar y weithdrefn gwyno o fewn y GIG.*

Cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, heblaw am ei hamharodrwydd i gefnogi ein gwelliant, sydd efallai ychydig yn grintachlyd, ond symudaf ymlaen dros hynny'n gyflym. Yr ydym am bwysleisio sylwadau'r ombwdsmon ar gyflwr gweithdrefnau cwynion y GIG. Yr ombwdsmon yw'r trydydd haen yn y system, a bydd pobl yn mynd ato pan fyddant yn teimlo nad oes unrhyw gamau eraill i'w cymryd. Felly, ef efallai sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i archwilio gweithrediad cyffredinol y system a gwneud sylwadau ar ddatblygiad polisi, a dyna a wnaeth yn ei adroddiad.

Yn ddios mae system gwynion bresennol y GIG yn rhy gymhleth. Nid yw cleifion yn ei gweld fel system wirioneddol annibynnol ac felly nid oes ganddynt hyder i fynd ar drywydd cwynion, neu gallant geisio ffyrdd eraill o iawndal ar gam cynnar ac amhriodol. Nid yw cyrff y gwasanaeth iechyd yn cynnig yr un lefel o iawndal ariannol ag asiantaethau cyhoeddus eraill, sydd yn ddarganfyddiad diddorol, gan ein bod yn aml yn ofni bod

clinical negligence costs are ballooning. However, the payment of relatively modest sums at an early stage may be appropriate to ensure that a complaints system is effective.

The Minister mentioned poor time limits. Many people feel that they go from pillar to post, without getting anywhere, and that their complaints are not treated with the seriousness they deserve.

Finally, there seems to be a lack of consistency. The NHS is a vast organisation, and it will become even more fragmented as a result of the restructuring. We need a system that allows a consistent approach, so that patients can be confident that if they make a complaint, wherever they are, they will be treated fairly and consistently.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, David, for taking just over two minutes. I appeal to the four other Members who wish to speak to take no more than three minutes each.

**Mick Bates:** For the third consecutive year, the annual reports of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman and Health Service Ombudsman for Wales noted that poor communication was often at the heart of the complaints that he received. This remains an area for improvement for many health bodies in Wales—perhaps there is a need for improved training in dealing with in the NHS. That is further supported by the ombudsman's report, which expresses regret

'that complaints about the way in which NHS staff handle complaints locally continue to arrive at my office. A third of the investigations reported here involve errors in managing the complaints procedure, some quite elementary.'

Targets set by the office business plan for 2001 were not met, which raises serious concerns. As in the previous year, the target of clearing 75 per cent of correspondence within 18 days was not met. Further targets for the conduct of investigations—that they should not take longer than 49 weeks to complete, and that no more than two investigations should be incomplete over 12

costau esgeulustod clinigol yn chwyddo. Fodd bynnag, gall talu symiau cymharol isel yn gynnwys fod yn briodol i sicrhau bod system gwyno yn effeithiol.

Soniodd y Gweinidog am derfynau amser gwael. Mae llawer o bobl yn teimlo y cânt eu pasio o bant i bentan, heb wneud cynnydd ac nad yw eu cwynion yn cael eu trin â'r difrifoldeb haeddiannol.

I gloi, mae'n ymddangos bod diffyg cysondeb. Mae'r GIG yn gorff enfawr, a bydd yn dod yn fwy darniog o ganlyniad i ailstrwythuro. Mae angen system arnom sy'n caniatáu ymagwedd gyson, fel y gall cleifion fod yn hyderus os byddant yn gwneud cwyn, lle bynnag y bônt, y cânt eu trin yn deg a chyson.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch ichi, David, am gymryd ychydig dros ddwy funud yn unig. Apeliaf ar y pedwar Aelod arall sy'n dymuno siarad i beidio â chymryd mwy na thair munud yr un.

**Mick Bates:** Am y drydedd flwyddyn yn olynol, nododd adroddiadau blynyddol Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru ac Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru fod cyfathrebu gwael yn aml wrth wraidd y cwynion a dderbyniodd. Mae hyn yn parhau i fod yn faes i'w wella i lawer o gyrff iechyd yng Nghymru—efallai bod angen hyfforddiant gwell mewn ymdrin â hyn yn y GIG. Ategir hyn ymhellach gan adroddiad yr ombwdsmon, sy'n gresynu

'at y ffaith bod cwynion am y ffordd y mae staff y GIG yn ymdrin â chwynion yn lleol yn parhau i gyrraedd fy swyddfa. Mae traean o'r ymchwiliadau a nodwyd yma yn ymwneud â gwallau wrth reoli'r weithdrefn gwyno, ac mae rhai ohonynt yn eithaf sylfaenol.'

Ni chyrrhaeddwyd y targedau a osodwyd gan y cynllun busnes swyddfa ar gyfer 2001, sy'n codi pryderon difrifol. Fel yn y flwyddyn flaenorol, ni chyrrhaeddwyd y targed o glirio 75 y cant o ohebiaeth o fewn 18 diwrnod. Ni chyrrhaeddwyd targedau pellach ar gyfer cynnal yr ymchwiliadau—sef na ddylent gymryd mwy na 49 wythnos i'w cwblhau, ac na ddylai mwy na dau ymchwiliad fod heb eu

months—were not met. In fact, investigations took, on average, 70 weeks to complete, and there were nine incomplete investigations at the end of the 12-month period. Although there were reasons for that, in that the numbers of office staff were below strength for six months and a large number of cases involved clinical care, it suggests that resources for the ombudsman should be increased to meet what is evidently an important need.

However, to end on a positive note, Dyfed Powys Health Authority did not receive any complaints this year.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel fferyllydd. Yr wyf heddiw yn croesawu adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru. Yn anffodus, rhaid imi ategu sylwadau Dr Dai Lloyd ar adroddiad y llynedd, sef mai diffyg cyfathrebu yw'r broblem fwyaf o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn parhau.

Yr ydym yn falch o weld fod nifer y cwynion a dderbyniwyd eleni wedi disgyn 5 y cant. Fodd bynnag, y mae'n fater o bryder nad yw nifer o'r targedau a osodwyd gan swyddfa'r ombwdsmon wedi'u cyrraedd. Er enghraifft, cymerodd 70 wythnos, ar gyfartaledd, i gwblhau ymchwiliadau, sydd ymhell dros y darged a osodwyd o 49 wythnos.

Amser yw'r broblem fwyaf. Pan fo meddygon dan bwysau mawr, mae'r amser i esbonio a gwrando ar bryderon ac ateb cwestiynau'r claf yn brin. Mae angen dybryd am fwy o ddoctoriaid i ddelio â'r sefyllfa hon. Yr un hen stori ydyw: mae angen mwy o gapasiti o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yn ogystal, y mae'n siomedig na chyrhaeddodd swyddfa'r ombwdsmon ei tharged o gael dim ond dau ymchwiliad anorffenedig. Eleni yr oedd naw ymchwiliad anorffenedig.

Mae'r system gwyno yn hirwyntog a chymhleth ac, ambell waith, nid yw achosion yn dod gerbron swyddfa'r ombwdsmon tan bedair neu bum mlynedd wedi'r digwyddiad gwreiddiol. Mae hyn yn annerbyniol. Mae'n achosi mwy o broblemau i'w datrys yn nes ymlaen, ac mae'n gallu rhoi straen diangen ar

cwblhau dros gyfnod o 12 mis. Yn wir, yr oedd ymchwiliadau yn cymryd 70 wythnos i'w cwblhau ar gyfartaledd, ac yr oedd naw ymchwiliad heb eu cwblhau ar ddiwedd cyfnod o 12 mis. Er bod rhesymau dros hynny, er enghraifft bod nifer y staff swyddfa yn is na'r nifer disgwylidig am chwe mis a bod nifer fawr o achosion yn ymwneud â gofal clinigol, mae'n awgrymu y dylid cynyddu adnoddau i'r ombwdsmon i gwrdd â'r hyn sy'n amlwg yn angen pwysig.

Fodd bynnag, i ddiweddu ar nodyn cadarnhaol, ni dderbyniodd Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys unrhyw gwynion eleni.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a pharmacist. I welcome the Health Service Ombudsman for Wales's report today. Unfortunately, I must reiterate Dr Dai Lloyd's comments on last year's report, namely that lack of communication is the greatest problem in the health service. That remains the case.

We are pleased to see that the number of complaints received this year has fallen by 5 per cent. However, it is a cause for concern that many of the targets set by the ombudsman's office were not reached. For instance, it took 70 weeks, on average, to complete investigations, which is way over the target of 49 weeks that was set.

Time is the greatest problem. When doctors are under great pressure, time to explain and to listen to patients' concerns and answer their questions is scarce. There is an urgent need for more doctors to deal with this situation. It is the same old story: more capacity is needed within the health service. In addition, it is disappointing that the ombudsman's office did not reach its target of having only two uncompleted investigations. This year there were nine uncompleted investigations.

The complaints system is long-drawn-out and complicated and, sometimes, cases do not reach the ombudsman's office until four or five years after the original event. That is unacceptable. It leads to more problems that need to be solved later, and can place unnecessary pressure on the complainant and

yr achwynwyr a'r person y gwnaed y cwyn yn ei erbyn.

the person against whom the complaint has been made.

Felly, y mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r alwad i sicrhau bod penderfyniadau cyflym yn cael eu gwneud a bod digon o adnoddau a staff i sicrhau gwasanaeth iechyd mwy cyflawn a dibynadwy.

Plaid Cymru therefore supports the call to ensure that decisions are taken quickly and that sufficient resources and staff are provided to ensure a more comprehensive and reliable health service.

**David Davies:** I will try to cut my speech down to the bare minimum, Dirprwy Lywydd—

**David Davies:** Ceisiaf gwtogi fy araith i'r hyd lleiaf posibl, Ddirprwy Lywydd—

**Peter Law:** Why do you not sit down now, then?

**Peter Law:** Pam na wnewch chi eistedd yn awr, felly?

**David Davies:** You are wasting time now, Peter, but I would welcome one of your cheerful interventions about the great days of Conservative rule, if you want.

**David Davies:** Yr ydych yn gwastraffu amser yn awr, Peter, ond byddwn yn croesawu un o'ch ymyriadau serchog am ddyddiau gwych teyrnasiad y Ceidwadwyr, os dymunwch.

I welcome the report, but I have three concerns. First, in the first part of the report, we quickly learn that many complaints involve the Assembly. However, we also see the following comment:

Croesawaf yr adroddiad, ond mae gennyf dri phryder. Yn gyntaf, yn rhan gyntaf yr adroddiad, cawn wybod yn fuan bod llawer o'r cwynion yn ymwneud â'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ceir hefyd y datganiad canlynol :

'my staff and I have been able to develop a good working relationship with the National Assembly for Wales, which I believe benefits public administration in Wales.'

'Mae fy staff a minnau wedi gallu datblygu perthynas waith dda gyda Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, sy'n fuddiol i weinyddiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn fy marn i.'

4:00 p.m.

I do not share that view, because the administration and the ombudsman should take the side of the general public, which sometimes makes complaints about the Assembly. If we are to have full confidence in the ability of the ombudsman's office to consider matters independently, it does not help for it to have a cosy relationship with the body that it is meant to be investigating.

Ni rannaf y farn honno, oherwydd dylai'r weithrediaeth a'r ombwdsmon ochri gyda'r cyhoedd, sydd weithiau'n gwneud cwynion am y Cynulliad. Os ydym i fod yn gwbl hyderus ynglŷn â gallu swyddfa'r ombwdsmon i ystyried materion yn annibynnol, nid yw o gymorth iddi gael perthynas gysurus gyda'r corff y dylai fod yn ymchwilio iddo.

My second concern relates to paragraph 2.6, and the Minister for Health and Social Services ought to be aware of this:

Mae fy ail bryder yn ymwneud â pharagraff 2.6, a dylai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod yn ymwybodol o hyn:

'The present NHS complaints procedure is unduly complicated and time-consuming... All too often it finds itself in the position of

'Mae gweithdrefn gwyno bresennol y GIG yn rhy gymhleth a llafurus... Yn rhy aml o lawer, mae'n ei chael ei hun yn y sefyllfa lle y

issuing reports four or even five years after the originating events.’

That situation is unacceptable, especially as it is difficult for people with a justified complaint to take legal action once three years have passed.

Furthermore, in the ombudsman’s view, there is widespread dissatisfaction with the independent review panels. He said that,

‘their members are often not accepted as independent; and the experience of my office is that their work varies widely in quality’.

In other words, some of them are not very good. I hope that the Minister for Health and Social Services is aware of this and will make it a priority to resolve this situation. All Members have encountered maladministration by public bodies; I am currently dealing with one such case. None of us should be too congratulatory about these reports. Only a few cases fulfil the narrow criteria that allow them to be investigated in this fashion. We are merely looking at the tip of a large iceberg. It is unfortunate that there are so many cases. I can think of two, off the top of my head where people have lost everything as a result of maladministration, yet they will never get the investigation that they deserve.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I thank everyone for their mainly positive comments. David Melding and Geraint, consistency is vital, which is why we are reforming the NHS complaints system so that we can monitor it effectively.

Only a small number of complaints reached the ombudsman, and we need to revisit how complaints are handled initially. We will start new training and issue revised guidance to help us achieve a high standard. I appreciate that David Davies has handled several cases personally; that is important in his constituency role. We are addressing the issues in terms of consistency and guidance. We are also looking at strengths and external assurance mechanisms. We must ensure that

mae’n rhaid iddi gyflwyno adroddiadau bedair blynedd, neu hyd yn oed bum mlynedd, ar ôl y digwyddiadau cychwynol.’

Mae’r sefyllfa honno yn annerbyniol, yn enwedig gan ei bod yn anodd i bobl gyda chŵyn deg i ddwyn achos cyfreithiol ar ôl tair blynedd.

Hefyd, ym marn yr ombwdsmon, mae anffodlonrwydd mawr gyda’r paneli adolygu annibynnol. Dywedodd,

‘Yn aml, ni dderbynnir bod [eu] haelodau, yn annibynnol; ac yn ôl profiad fy swyddfa, mae ansawdd eu gwaith yn amrywio’n eang.’

Hynny yw, nid yw rhai ohonynt yn dda iawn. Gobeithiaf fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ymwybodol o hyn ac y bydd yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i ddatrys y sefyllfa hon. Mae pob Aelod wedi profi camweinyddu gan gyrff cyhoeddus; yr wyf yn ymdrin ag un achos o’r fath ar hyn o bryd. Ni ddylai unrhyw un ohonom fod yn rhy ganmoliaethus am yr adroddiadau hyn. Dim ond ychydig o achosion sy’n bodloni’r meini prawf llym sy’n caniatáu iddynt gael eu hymchwilio yn y modd hwn. Megis dechrau yw hyn. Mae’n anffodus bod cynifer o achosion. Gallaf feddwl am ddau, ar unwaith, lle mae pobl wedi colli popeth o ganlyniad i gamweinyddu, eto ni chânt fyth yr ymchwiliad a haeddant.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolchaf i bawb am eu sylwadau, a oedd yn bennaf yn rhai cadarnhaol. Dywedaf wrth David Melding a Geraint fod cysondeb yn hanfodol, a dyna paham yr ydym yn diwygio system gwynion y GIG, fel y gallwn ei monitro’n effeithiol.

Dim ond nifer fechan o gwynion a ddaeth i law’r ombwdsmon, ac mae angen inni ailystyried sut yr ymdrinnir â chwynion ar y cychwyn. Byddwn yn cychwyn hyfforddiant newydd ac yn cyhoeddi canllawiau diwygiedig i’n helpu i gyrraedd safon uchel. Gwerthfawrogaf fod David Davies wedi ymdrin â sawl achos yn bersonol; mae hynny’n bwysig yn ei rôl etholaethol. Yr ydym yn mynd i’r afael â’r materion o ran cysondeb a chanllawiau. Yr ydym hefyd yn

we take that forward in our complaints procedures.

To respond to David Davies and Geraint, the Health Service Ombudsman is independent of the National Assembly, and any questions or comments about the management of the ombudsman's office and caseload are matters to be taken up directly with him. They are not issues on which I should rightly comment today, but we must see this in the context of the reform of our NHS complaints system, to ensure that we provide better training in communication skills.

Mick and Geraint made the point about communication. Communication skills are included in the curriculum for all stages of medical education including pre-registration education programmes and our code of ethics for healthcare professionals, but more needs to be done. We must have that training in communication skills for our front-line staff.

People have not mentioned the important new mediation pilot scheme that we are developing. That is important; it has come out of personal experience and out of recognising that it is what people want. They want good communication skills, listening and mediation, and we should pioneer that in Wales. Thank you for your comments on this important Health Service Ombudsman's report.

edrych ar gryfderau a dulliau sicrwydd allanol. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn datblygu hynny yn ein gweithdrefnau cwynion.

I ymateb i David Davies a Geraint, mae'r Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd yn annibynnol ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac mae unrhyw gwestiynau neu sylwadau am reolaeth swyddfa'r ombwdsmon a'i faich achosion yn faterion i'w codi'n uniongyrchol gydag ef. Nid ydynt yn faterion y dylwn i mewn gwirionedd wneud sylw arnynt heddiw, ond rhaid inni ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun diwygio system gwynion y GIG, i sicrhau ein bod yn darparu gwell hyfforddiant mewn sgiliau cyfathrebu.

Gwnaeth Mick a Geraint bwynt am gyfathrebu. Cynhwysir sgiliau cyfathrebu yn y cwricwlwm ar gyfer pob cam o addysg feddygol yn cynnwys rhaglenni addysg rhag-gofrestru a'n cod moeseg ar gyfer gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol, ond mae angen gwneud rhagor. Mae'n rhaid inni gael hyfforddiant mewn sgiliau cyfathrebu ar gyfer ein staff rheng flaen.

Nid yw pobl wedi sôn am y cynllun peilot cyfryngu pwysig newydd yr ydym yn ei ddatblygu. Mae hynny'n bwysig; tyfodd o brofiad personol a hynny ar ôl cydnabod beth mae pobl yn dymuno'i gael. Maent am gael sgiliau cyfathrebu, gwrando a chyfryngu da a dylem arloesi gyda hynny yng Nghymru. Diolch ichi am eich sylwadau ar yr adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd pwysig hwn.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 8, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 24.*

*Amendment 1: For 8, Abstain 11, Against 24.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Carwyn  
Morgan, Rhodri  
German, Michael  
Hart, Edwina  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Sinclair, Karen  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val

Evans, Delyth  
Halford, Alison  
Chapman, Christine  
Lewis, Huw  
Griffiths, John  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Neagle, Lynne  
Jones, Ann  
Pugh, Alun  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Gregory, Janice  
Edwards, Richard

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1193): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM1193): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Law, Peter



Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Weinidog Cymru The First Minister's Annual Report**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Many Members wish to speak in this debate, so while the First Minister will have 15 minutes to open and close the debate, and the proposers of amendments will have five minutes, other Members will have three minutes only. I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5, yn croesawu adroddiad Prif Weinidog Cymru 2001-02 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Hydref 2002. (NDM1191)*

Y rheswm am gyhoeddi'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn yw i brofi i bobl Cymru nad siop siarad yw'r Cynulliad. Yn yr adroddiad hwn yr ydym yn rhestru, disgrifio, a chysylltu gweithgareddau. Nid yw'r adroddiad yn rhestru pwyntiau o drefn na phleidleisiau yn y corff hwn, er bod yr atebolrwydd democrataidd hwnnw, y siarad a'r dadlau a'r ymladd ar brydiau—nid yn llythrennol—yn rhan bwysig o unrhyw broses ddemocrataidd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn rhestru a chyflwyno'n gweithgareddau yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf i bobl Cymru.

Nid yw'r adroddiad yn cynnwys y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf—yr ydym fel arfer yn torri am yr haf ym mis Gorffennaf, felly nid yw'n cynnwys y newyddion da y bore yma, sef bod Caerdydd ar y rhestr fer am Brifddinas

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dymuna llawer o Aelodau siarad yn y ddadl hon ac felly, er y caiff Prif Weinidog Cymru 15 munud i agor ac i gloi'r ddadl, ac y caiff y rhai sy'n cynnig gwelliannau bum munud, dim ond tair munud a gaiff yr Aelodau eraill. Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The First Minister:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.5, welcomes the report of the First Minister 2001-02, which was laid in the Table Office on 22 October 2002. (NDM1191)*

The reason for publishing this annual report is to prove to the people of Wales that the Assembly is not a talking shop. In this report we list, describe, and link activities. The report does not list points of order made or votes registered in this institution, although that democratic accountability, the discussions and debates and even the fighting at times—though not literally—are important aspects of any democratic process. However, we list and present our activities during the last year to the people of Wales.

The report does not include the latest information—we usually break for the summer recess in July, so it does not cover this morning's good news that Cardiff is shortlisted for the Cultural Capital of Europe

Diwylliant Ewrop yn 2008. Mae hynny'n ddatblygiad pwysig, er mai dim ond hanner y gamp ydyw. Disgwyliwn ennill yr enwbiad pan ddaw'r penderfyniad terfynol fis Mai nesaf.

What can we say to the people of Wales about our achievements over the past year? I will deal quickly with the economy. I am now convinced that we have the best suite of assistance measures to encourage business in Wales that we have ever had, better than in the rest of Britain or Europe. It has been a record year for regional selective assistance. The past year has also seen the introduction of the Assembly investment grant for small and medium-sized enterprises, with much less bureaucracy in application forms. We have allocated the role of providing start-up grants to local authority economic development departments. Similarly, the Welsh Development Agency can provide property development grants. The subsidiary of the WDA—the long awaited user-friendly merchant bank, which, for legal reasons, is not allowed to call itself a bank—has been established and we want equity-type investment for small and medium-sized enterprises. Likewise, in terms of expanding SPUR and SMART, it is about expanding new products and processes rather than job creation, although, the long-term aim is job creation.

Section 4 tourism grants are available. The agriculture processing and marketing grants are also available, and, when this report was being completed, there were 600 Objective 1 projects, with a commitment of £350 million. The figure today is higher because progress is continuing. The same is true of broadband and the expansion of the overseas trade missions via WalesTrade International. On access to services and support for those most in need in Wales, we have frozen prescription charges on two occasions to help people have access to healthcare. We have provided free local bus travel for pensioners and disabled people throughout Wales. We have provided free entry to our national museums, which has resulted in record numbers of visitors to the eight national museums and galleries in

in 2008. That is an important development, although it is only half the achievement. We expect to win the nomination when the final decision is made next May.

Beth y gallwn ei ddweud wrth bobl Cymru ynghylch yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gennym yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? Ymdriniaf â'r economi yn gyflym. Yr wyf bellach yn argyhoeddedig bod gennym y gyfres orau o fesurau cymorth i annog busnesau yng Nghymru a fu gennym erioed, ac mae'n well na rhai gweddill Prydain ac Ewrop. Bu'n flwyddyn heb ei hail ar gyfer cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf hefyd, cyflwynwyd grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, a cheir llawer llai o fiwrocratiaeth o ran ffurflenni cais. Yr ydym wedi rhoi'r rôl o ddarparu grantiau cychwyn i adrannau datblygu economaidd awdurdodau lleol. Yn yr un modd, gall Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ddarparu grantiau datblygu eiddo. Sefydlwyd is-gwmni'r WDA—y banc masnachol sy'n hawdd ei ddefnyddio, y bu hir ddisgwyl amdano ac na chaniateir iddo alw ei hunan yn fanc am resymau cyfreithiol—ac yr ydym am sicrhau buddsoddiad sy'n debyg i eewiti ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Yn yr un modd, o ran ehangu SPUR a SMART, mae a wnelo ag ehangu cynnyrch a phrosesau newydd yn hytrach na chreu swyddi, er mai creu swyddi yw'r nod yn yr hirdymor.

Mae grantiau twristiaeth adran 4 ar gael. Mae grantiau prosesu a marchnata amaethyddiaeth ar gael hefyd a, phan gwblhawyd yr adroddiad hwn, yr oedd 600 o brosiectau Amcan 1, gydag ymrwymiad o £350 miliwn. Mae'r ffigur yn uwch heddiw gan y gwneir cynnydd o hyd. Mae'r un peth yn wir am fand eang a datblygu'r teithiau masnach dramor drwy gyfrwng Masnach Cymru Rhyngwladol. O ran mynediad i wasanaethau a chymorth ar gyfer y rhai â'r anghenion mwyaf yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn ddwywaith i helpu pobl i gael gofal iechyd. Yr ydym wedi rhoi cludiant am ddim ar fysiau lleol i bensynwyr a phobl anabl ledled Cymru. Yr ydym wedi rhoi mynediad am ddim i'n hamgueddfeydd cenedlaethol, gan arwain at y nifer uchaf

Wales. We have introduced the Assembly learning grants on a means-tested basis for those who want to pursue higher and further education after the age of 18, and we are funding six weeks' free home care.

These developments mean that we are now setting the pace in innovative policy thinking. We are developing a pilot of the Welsh baccalaureate, and we expect 19 schools and further education colleges covering the 16 to 19-year-old age group to begin to teach that next September. Cymru Ar-lein is setting the pace in work, with ICT policy using the buying power of the public sector to form the backbone of the new broadband strategy and focusing on outcomes rather than worrying about which technology suits which kind of user. We are now in a world-leading position in terms of our approach to sustainable development, equality of opportunity and freedom of information. We are transforming the prospects for our poorer areas by pushing ahead with Objective 1 and making faster progress in the other three UK Objective 1 areas.

4:10 p.m.

On empowering the poorest communities, Communities First, which can be found outside Objective 1 areas in places such as Cardiff and Wrexham, is working with local communities to help them determine their needs and shape future funding. On our response to crises, we provided a recovery package for rural areas affected by foot and mouth disease and a regeneration package for areas affected by the Corus steel and tinplate closures. Sadly, in July 2002, steel and tinplate employment and production finally came to an end in Ebbw Vale after around 250 years. The regeneration package that we put together jointly with the local authorities and communities, along with some funding from the Department of Trade and Industry and Europe, should provide a much brighter future for those areas when we have been able to translate it into reality.

erioed o bobl yn ymweld â'r wyth amgueddfa ac oriel genedlaethol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad ar sail prawf moddion i'r rhai sydd am ddilyn cyrsiau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach ar ôl 18 oed, ac yr ydym yn ariannu gofal yn y cartref am ddim am chwe wythnos.

Golyga'r datblygiadau hyn ein bod bellach ar flaen y gad o ran llunio polisiau arloesol. Yr ydym yn datblygu cynllun peilot o'r fagloriaeth Gymreig, a disgwyliwn i 19 o ysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach sy'n dysgu pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 19 mlwydd oed ddechrau cynnig y cwrs hwnnw fis Medi nesaf. Mae Cymru Ar-lein ar flaen y gad yn y gwaith, ac mae polisi TGCh yn defnyddio pŵer prynu'r sector cyhoeddus i fod yn asgwrn cefn i'r strategaeth band eang newydd ac yn canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau yn hytrach na phryderu ynghylch pa dechnoleg sy'n addas i ddefnyddwyr. Yr ydym bellach ar y blaen yn fyd-eang o ran ein hymagwedd tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy, cyfle cyfartal a rhyddid gwybodaeth. Yr ydym yn trawsnewid y rhagolygon ar gyfer ein hardaloedd tlotaf drwy ddatblygu Amcan 1 a thrwy wneud cynnydd cyflymach na'r tair ardal Amcan 1 arall yn y DU.

O ran grymuso'r cymunedau tlotaf, mae'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, y gellir dod o hyd iddi y tu allan i ardaloedd Amcan 1 mewn lleoedd megis Caerdydd a Wrecsam, yn cydweithio â chymunedau lleol i'w helpu i bennu eu hanghenion a sicrhau arian ar gyfer y dyfodol. O ran ein hymateb i argyfyngau, darparwyd pecyn adfer ar gyfer yr ardaloedd gwledig yr effeithiodd clwy'r traed a'r genau arnynt a phecyn adfywio ar gyfer yr ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt o ganlyniad i gau gweithfeydd dur a thunplat Corus. Yn anffodus, ym mis Gorffennaf 2002, daeth y gwaith o gynhyrchu dur a thunplat a'r swyddi yn y gweithfeydd hynny i ben yng Nglynebwy ar ôl tua 250 o flynyddoedd. Dylai'r pecyn adfywio a luniwyd gennym ar y cyd â'r awdurdodau lleol a'r cymunedau, ynghyd â rhywfaint o arian oddi wrth yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac Ewrop, sicrhau dyfodol llawer gwell ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hynny pan fyddwn wedi gallu ei

We have also innovated in service delivery. We have abolished statutory testing at key stage 1 for seven-year-olds in Wales. That is overwhelmingly supported by parents and teachers, not to mention the children. Children are not usually given a view on such matters, but if they were asked, I am sure that they would support their parents and teachers in welcoming the abolition of that test. We have signed agreements with each local authority in which the authority commits to meet targets for service delivery. There is a 1 per cent bonus at the end of the period for the local authority if it meets all its targets for service delivery. We are also reshaping the basis of the NHS in Wales to bring day-to-day decisions closer to local communities.

To turn to the amendments, as I mentioned earlier, it is important that the Assembly Government makes its proposals and gets the backing of the Assembly—the body of the kirk. That is why we reject amendment 1, which is the standard knee-jerk Plaid Cymru amendment to replace ‘welcomes’ with ‘notes’. We also reject amendment 2 on the grounds that we maintain that the new NHS structure will cost no more than the current one and that the inevitable transition costs—the one-off costs—are being kept to a minimum. That is a small price to pay for the greater local responsiveness and accountability in commissioning health and social services that will be achieved by the new structure.

It is true that waiting lists have been rising—demand has risen—but as the report states, Assembly action has made progress on cracking the long-waiting-time priority areas of cardiac and orthopaedic surgery, which is why we oppose point b of amendment 2. We have introduced national service frameworks for diabetes and coronary heart disease and are working on a similar national service framework for renal disease. A consequence is an increased waiting list, but it is better to have a healthy population than healthy-looking statistics.

wireddu.

Buom yn arloesol o ran darparu gwasanaethau hefyd. Yr ydym wedi diddymu profion statudol yng nghyfnod allweddol 1 ar gyfer plant saith mlwydd oed yng Nghymru. Cefnogir hynny'n frwd gan rieni ac athrawon, heb sôn am y plant. Fel arfer, nid oes llais gan blant o ran materion o'r fath, ond pe gofynnid iddynt, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent yn cefnogi eu rhieni a'u hathrawon wrth groesawu'r ffaith bod y prawf hwnnw wedi'i diddymu. Yr ydym wedi llofnodi cytundebau gyda phob awdurdod lleol lle yr ymrwma'r awdurdod i gyrraedd targedau ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau. Caiff yr awdurdod lleol fonws o 1 y cant ar ddiwedd y cyfnod os bydd yn cyrraedd pob un o'i dargedau ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau. Yr ydym yn ail-lunio sail y GIG yng Nghymru hefyd i sicrhau y gwneir y penderfyniadau o ddydd i ddydd yn y cymunedau lleol.

I droi at y gwelliannau, fel y crybwyllais yn gynharach, mae'n bwysig bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno ei chynigion ac yn cael cefnogaeth y Cynulliad—y corff cyfan. Dyna pam y gwrthodwn welliant 1, sef gwelliant difeddwl safonol Plaid Cymru i roi 'nodi' yn lle 'croesawu'. Gwrthodwn welliant 2 hefyd ar y sail ein bod o'r farn na fydd strwythur newydd y GIG yn fwy costus na'r strwythur presennol ac y cedwir y costau trawsnewid anochel—y costau unigol—mor isel â phosibl. Mae hynny'n bris isel i'w dalu am fwy o ymatebolrwydd ac atebolrwydd lleol wrth gomisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gyflawnir gan y strwythur newydd.

Mae'n wir y bu cynnydd yn y rhestrau aros—mae'r galw wedi cynyddu—ond fel y noda'r adroddiad, gwnaeth y Cynulliad gynnydd wrth fynd i'r afael â'r meysydd blaenoriaethol sydd ag amserau aros hir, sef llawfeddygaeth gardiaidd a llawfeddygaeth orthopedig, a dyna pam y gwrthwynebwn bwynt b gwelliant 2. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno fframweithiau gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd y siwgr a chlefyd coronaidd y galon a pharatown fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol tebyg ar gyfer clefyd arenol. Yn sgîl hyn, ceir rhestr aros hwy, ond mae'n

well cael poblogaeth iach nag ystadegau sy'n edrych yn iach.

We also reject point c of amendment 2, because it states that the gap in GDP per capita between Wales and the rest of the UK is widening when there are no figures to support that. It is a further piece of Plaid Cymru myth-making. Therefore, we request that the amendment be rejected on the basis of the evidence. Similarly, we reject point d of amendment 2 because investment in school buildings has increased since 1997. There is no evidence of a growth in the backlog of repairs; there is sustained investment to reach the target of having all school buildings in good physical shape by 2010. Local authorities are working up asset management plans to give a true picture of the state of all local authority assets, including school buildings, for the first time ever. The draft budget debated this month makes clear that continued commitment, with resources of £140 million per year from 2005-06 to the end of the decade.

Finally, on the same bright note as the news about Cardiff being shortlisted for the Cultural Capital of Europe, I have news about bathing waters. In 'Plan for Wales 2001', the Assembly Government made a commitment to improve the quality of bathing waters and obtain more European blue flags. The target was to increase the percentage of bathing waters that complied with European mandatory standards from 94 to 98 per cent by 2003-04. However, I am pleased to announce that Wales has achieved its best bathing water results ever. This year, all 75 EU-identified waters complied with EU mandatory standards. This is the first time that 100 per cent compliance has been achieved in Wales, and it has been achieved a year early. Sixty-two bathing waters also achieved more stringent guideline standards and that is also a record. Imagine how it will improve the Wales Tourist Board's ability to market Wales inside and outside Wales, now that we can say that our bathing waters are the best that they have ever been and are probably among the best in Europe. Our performance on that is significantly ahead of the targets set in the 'Plan for Wales 2001'. You cannot do that every time, because you

Gwrthodwn bwynt c gwelliant 2 hefyd, gan ei fod yn nodi bod y bwlch mewn CMC y pen rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU yn mynd yn fwy pan nad oes ffigurau i ategu hynny. Un o fythiau eraill Plaid Cymru yw hyn. Felly, gofynnwn ichi wrthod y gwelliant ar sail y dystiolaeth. Yn yr un modd, gwrthodwn bwynt d gwelliant 2 gan fod yr arian a fuddsoddir mewn adeiladau ysgolion wedi cynyddu ers 1997. Nid oes dystiolaeth o gynnydd yn y gwaith atgyweirio sy'n aros i'w wneud; ceir buddsoddiad parhaus i gyrraedd y targed o sicrhau bod adeiladau pob ysgol mewn cyflwr da erbyn 2010. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn paratoi cynlluniau rheoli asedau i roi darlun cywir o gyflwr asedau pob awdurdod lleol, gan gynnwys adeiladau ysgolion, am y tro cyntaf erioed. Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft a drafodwyd y mis hwn yn egluro'r ymrwymiad parhaus hwnnw, gydag adnoddau o £140 miliwn y flwyddyn o 2005-06 hyd at ddiwedd y degawd.

I gloi, fel y newyddion da bod Caerdydd ar y rhestr fer ar gyfer Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop, mae newyddion gennyf am ddyfroedd nofio. Yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001', gwnaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ymrwymiad i wella ansawdd dyfroedd nofio a chael mwy o faneri glas Ewropeaidd. Y targed oedd cynyddu canran y dyfroedd nofio a oedd yn cydymffurfio â safonau gorfodol Ewropeaidd o 94 i 98 y cant erbyn 2003-04. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi bod Cymru wedi cyflawni ei chanlyniadau gorau erioed o ran dyfroedd nofio. Eleni, yr oedd pob un o'r 75 o ddyfroedd a nodwyd gan yr UE yn cydymffurfio â safonau gorfodol yr UE. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i Gymru sicrhau cydymffurfiad 100 y cant, ac fe'i cyflawnwyd flwyddyn yn gynnar. Cyrhaeddodd 62 o ddyfroedd nofio safonau canllaw llymach hefyd ac mae hynny heb ei ail hefyd. Dychmygwch y modd y bydd yn gwella gallu Bwrdd Croeso Cymru i farchnata Cymru yng Nghymru a thu hwnt, oherwydd gallwn ddweud bellach fod ein dyfroedd nofio yn well nag erioed a'u bod ymhlith y gorau yn Ewrop yn ôl pob tebyg. Mae ein perfformiad yn hynny o beth ychydig yn well na'r targedau a bennwyd yn

do not know what the raw material is when you set out a plan and try to achieve it. Sometimes we achieve targets ahead of time; sometimes we slip just behind. However, that kind of practical achievement, which has real meaning for the people of Wales, is what this annual report is all about.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Dileu 'croesawu' a rhoi yn ei le 'nodi'.

Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hefyd yn mynegi pryder ynghylch record Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym maes gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a datblygu economaidd a methiant Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Weinidog Cymru i sôn am y canlynol yn benodol:*

a) y bydd y cynlluniau i ad-drefnu'r NHS yng Nghymru'n gostus ac yn aneffeithiol;

b) y cododd nifer y cleifion a oedd yn aros am driniaeth allanol 41 y cant yn ystod cyfnod yr adroddiad;

c) bod y bwlch rhwng cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru a gweddill y DU yn mynd yn fwy;

d) bod y gwaith atgyweirio sy'n aros i'w wneud ar adeiladau ysgolion yn cronni fwyfwy o hyd.

Er mai mai ychydig o funudau yn unig sydd gennyf i siarad, gobeithiaf y bydd cyfle i siaradwyr eraill o grŵp Plaid Cymru gyfeirio at wahanol elfennau o'r gwelliannau. Yr oeddwn yn falch i'r Prif Weinidog fynd drwyddynt fesul un; byddwn yn dadlau'r achos o blaid y gwelliannau fesul un wrth i'r ddadl fynd yn ei blaen.

Mae adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weindiog yn gyfle i ystyried rhaglen y Llywodraeth dros y flwyddyn. Wedi darllen yr adroddiad, yr argraff a gefais oedd ei fod yn hynod hunan-foddhaus. Mae'n rhestru'r hyn y mae'r

y 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'. Ni allwch wneud hynny bob tro, gan na wyddoch beth yw'r deunydd crai pan nodwch gynllun a cheisio ei gyflawni. Weithiau, cyrhaeddwn ein targedau yn gynnar; weithiau yr ydym ychydig yn hwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae a wnelo'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn â'r math hwnnw o gyflawniad ymarferol, sydd ag ystyr wirioneddol i bobl Cymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Delete 'welcomes' and replace with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly also expresses concern at the Welsh Assembly Government's record on public services and economic development and at the failure of the First Minister's annual report to mention, in particular, the following:*

a) that plans for restructuring the NHS in Wales will be costly and ineffective;

b) that out-patient waiting lists over the period covered by the report rose by 41 per cent;

c) that the gross domestic product gap between Wales and the rest of the UK is widening;

d) that the backlog in school building repairs has continued to rise.

Although I only have a few minutes in which to speak, I hope that there will be an opportunity for other speakers from the Plaid Cymru group to refer to different parts of the amendments. I was pleased that the First Minister went through them one by one; we will argue the case for them one by one as the debate progresses.

The First Minister's annual report is an opportunity to review the Government's programme over the year. Having read this report, the impression I got was that it is excruciatingly self-congratulatory. It lists

Llywodraeth yn ei weld fel ei llwyddiannau, ond ni chyfeiria at y trafferthion gyda rhestrau aros, ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd ac yn y blaen. Canolbwyntiaf ar un neu ddau o bwyntiau. Synnais yn fawr nad oedd y Prif Weinidog yn dweud pwy oedd yn gyfrifol am y llwyddiannau.

The First Minister declined to offer a view on who is actually responsible for the coalition's achievements. There was an interesting story in *The Western Mail* this week, to which the First Minister did not refer, that the Liberal Democrats are claiming that six of the policies are theirs.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Only six?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yes, only six. The Liberal Democrats are a modest party. They do not claim ownership of everything, just six out of eight policies.

The headline in *The Western Mail* was:

'Coalition politicians squabble over who thought up winners'.

*The Western Mail* conducted its own survey and concluded that the Liberal Democrats could perhaps claim credit for four. However, the First Minister did not give the Deputy First Minister credit for anything today. I find that surprising. He did not even ask him to deputise for him during First Minister's questions. We are entitled to know what the relationship is. It is interesting that the First Minister's response to the article was that it was not a story, and not news. However, the Deputy First Minister said in his speech to the Liberal Democrat conference that, not only are the Liberal Democrats successful in terms of ensuring achievements in the coalition, but that, although this is a Labour-led coalition, it is driven by the Liberal Democrats. I am surprised that the First Minister did not offer a view on that today.

The First Minister has repeatedly said that he wants to be judged on his record: on what his

what the Government believes to be its successes and does not refer to the difficulties with waiting lists, the restructuring of the NHS and so on. I will focus on one or two points. I was surprised that the First Minister did not state who was responsible for these successes.

Ni chynigiodd y Prif Weinidog farn ar bwy yn benodol sy'n gyfrifol am llwyddiannau'r glymblaid. Cafwyd stori ddiddorol yn *The Western Mail* yr wythnos hon, na chyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog ati, sef bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn honni mai eu polisiau hwy yw chwech ohonynt.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dim ond chwech?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ie, dim ond chwech. Plaid ddiymhongar yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Nid ydynt yn hawlio perchenogaeth o bopeth, dim ond chwe pholisi o wyth.

Y pennawd yn *The Western Mail* oedd:

Gwleidyddion y glymblaid yn dadlau dros bwy oedd yn gyfrifol am syniadau da.

Cynhaliodd *The Western Mail* ei arolwg ei hun a daeth i'r casgliad y gallai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hawlio'r clod am bedwar ohonynt o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, ni roddodd y Prif Weinidog glod i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am unrhyw beth heddiw. Mae hynny'n fy synnu. Ni ofynnodd iddo ddirprwyo ar ei ran yn ystod cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog hyd yn oed. Mae hawl gennym wybod beth yw natur y berthynas. Mae'n ddiddorol mai ymateb y Prif Weinidog i'r erthygl oedd nad oedd yn stori, nac yn newyddion. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ei araith i gynhadledd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol nid yn unig fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn llwyddiannus o ran yr hyn a gyflawnodd y glymblaid ond mai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sy'n arwain y glymblaid, er ei bod o dan arweiniad y Blaid Lafur. Synnaf na chynigiodd y Prif Weinidog farn ar hynny heddiw.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud droeon ei fod am gael ei farnu ar yr hyn a gyflawnodd:

Government has achieved of its promises in the last election. Of course, he avoids mentioning the promises on waiting lists because he knows that he cannot achieve them. I ask the First Minister to be honest, and when he responds to this debate, say: 'Yes we made that promise, and we failed. We will try to do better'. However, he refuses to acknowledge that the Government cannot achieve that promise by the next election.

4:20 p.m.

The First Minister also mentioned GDP targets and that Plaid Cymru has indicated that the GDP per capita in Wales is decreasing in relation to the UK average. That is a fact. The First Minister could not correct us. Is it his view that the GDP per capita in Wales is increasing in relation to the rest of the United Kingdom? Are we seeing economic resurgence in Wales as a result of the Government's policies? He cannot offer us an alternative. We are perfectly entitled to say that by the time of the election next May, GDP per capita in Wales will be lower than the UK average.

My final point is about Assembly learning grants, which we all acknowledge are an achievement by the Government. However, there is a problem with their implementation. I ask the First Minister to address that. Some students cannot claim the Assembly learning grant because it is simply deducted from their benefits. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has not sorted that out, despite her valiant efforts during questions today. I ask the First Minister to address that issue in his closing speech. We want the Government to acknowledge that, while there are certain achievements, there are also issues that it must continue to address. I hope that he will deal with those when he winds up.

**Alison Halford:** I will be brief, because I know that many Members want to speak today.

The need for open government has never been greater. I am glad that the First Minister

ar yr hyn y mae ei Lywodraeth wedi ei gyflawni o ran ei addewidion yn yr etholiad diwethaf. Wrth gwrs, nid yw'n crybwyll yr addewidion o ran rhestrau aros, gan ei fod yn gwybod na all eu cyflawni. Gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog fod yn onest, gan ddweud, pan ymateba i'r ddatl hon: 'Do, gwnaethom yr addewid honno, a gwnaethom fethu. Ceisiwn wneud yn well'. Fodd bynnag, gwrthoda gydnabod na all y Llywodraeth gyflawni'r addewid honno erbyn yr etholiad nesaf.

Crybwyllodd y Prif Weinidog dargedau CMC hefyd a bod Plaid Cymru wedi nodi bod CMC y pen yng Nghymru yn lleihau mewn perthynas â chyfartaledd y DU. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Ni allai'r Prif Weinidog ein cywiro. A gred fod CMC y pen yng Nghymru yn cynyddu mewn perthynas â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig? A welwn adfywiad economaidd yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i bolisiau'r Llywodraeth? Ni all gynnig dewis amgen i ni. Gallwn ddweud yn deg y bydd CMC y pen yng Nghymru yn is na chyfartaledd y DU erbyn yr etholiad mis Mai nesaf.

Mae fy mhwynt terfynol yn ymwneud â grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, y mae pob un ohonom yn cydnabod sy'n lwyddiant ar ran y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae problem o ran eu gweithredu. Gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog ymdrin â hynny. Ni all rhai myfyrwyr hawlio grant dysgu'r Cynulliad oherwydd y caiff ei ddiynnu o'u budd-daliadau. Nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oed wedi datrys hynny, er gwaethaf ei hymdrechion dewr yn ystod y cwestiynau heddiw. Gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw yn ei araith derfynol. Yr ydym am i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod bod materion y mae'n rhaid iddi barhau i ymdrin â hwy, er bod rhai cyflawniadau hefyd. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn delio â'r rhain wrth iddo gloi.

**Alison Halford:** Byddaf yn gryno, am fy mod yn gwybod y dymuna llawer o'r Aelodau siarad heddiw.

Ni fu cymaint o angen erioed am lywodraeth agored. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Prif Weinidog



has taken the opportunity of the annual report to underline his commitment to open, transparent and accountable Government. He is right to say that the Welsh Assembly Government has lead the way in publishing Cabinet minutes. The creation of a Minister for Open Government will ensure that those achievements will be added to in the near future.

However, all is not rosy in the garden. A few councils in Wales have paid lip service to open government while doing little to further its aims. Some months ago, Cardiff County Council refused the Auditor General for Wales access to its publicly funded accounts. After holding protracted negotiations and seeking legal advice, the council eventually gave way. A Cardiff council meeting on open government lasted less time than it takes to boil an egg. Such actions, on our own doorstep, do little to increase confidence in local government. Does the First Minister agree that the Assembly and its officials must continue to act as a beacon of best practice in open government in Wales, and do all it can to encourage others to follow its lead? We are, after all, committed to open government in Wales, not just in the Assembly.

A recent case in my constituency, involving a senior civilian police employee, shows how tough the job ahead of us is. Without naming names, I can tell you that this person was dragged through a three-year legal battle by her police authority. The battle left the public with a substantial bill to pay in personal compensation, a pension and the considerable legal costs of a team of lawyers. The total costs formed part of a secret deal. The authority called to its defence an out-of-date piece of non-Labour legislation, which is seldom used by those who have nothing to hide. Section 12 of the Local Government Act 1972 places a gagging order on anyone who seeks to tell the public what its public servants have done in its name, and with its money. Sir John Bourn, the Auditor General for Wales—

wedi manteisio ar yr adroddiad blynyddol i danlinellu ei ymrwymiad i Lywodraeth agored, tryloyw ac atebol. Mae'n briodol iddo ddweud i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru arwain y ffordd wrth gyhoeddi cofnodion y Cabinet. Bydd creu Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored yn sicrhau y ceir mwy o lwyddiannau yn y dyfodol agos.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw popeth yn fêl i gyd. Mae ychydig o gynghorau yng Nghymru wedi esgus cefnogi llywodraeth agored ond ni wnânt lawer i hyrwyddo ei nodau. Ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, gwrthododd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd adael i Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru weld ei gyfrifon a ariennir yn gyhoeddus. Ar ôl trafodaethau hirfaith ac ar ôl ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol, ildiodd y cyngor yn y pen draw. Parhaodd un o gyfarfodydd cyngor Caerdydd ar lywodraeth agored am lai o amser nag y mae'n cymryd i ferwi wŷ. Ni wna gweithredoedd o'r fath, ar ein trothwy ein hunain, lawer i fagu hyder mewn llywodraeth leol. A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog fod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad a'i swyddogion barhau i weithredu fel model o arferion gorau mewn llywodraeth agored yng Nghymru, gan wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i annog eraill i ddilyn ei esiampl? Wedi'r cyfan, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i lywodraeth agored yng Nghymru, ac nid yn y Cynulliad yn unig.

Dengys achos diweddar yn fy etholaeth i, a oedd yn cynnwys uwch gyflogai'r heddlu sifil, pa mor anodd yw'r dasg sy'n ein hwynebu. Heb enwi pobl, gallaf ddweud wrthyh i'r unigolyn hwnnw wynebu brwydr gyfreithiol am dair blynedd gyda'i hawdurdod heddlu. Yn sgîl y frwydr, yr oedd bil sylweddol gan y cyhoedd i'w dalu mewn iawndal personol, pensiwn a chostau cyfreithiol sylweddol tîm o gyfreithwyr. Yr oedd cyfanswm y costau yn rhan o fargen gudd. Fel rhan o'i amddiffyniad, cyfeiriodd yr awdurdod at ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth sydd wedi dyddio, nas cyflwynwyd gan y Blaid Lafur, ac nas defnyddir yn aml gan y rhai nad oes ganddynt ddim i'w guddio. Mae Adran 12 Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 1972 yn tawelu unrhyw un sy'n ceisio dweud wrth y cyhoedd yr hyn y mae ei weision sifil wedi'i wneud yn ei enw, a chyda'i arian. Mae Syr John Bourn, Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru—

**Janet Ryder:** Are you referring to the case of Flintshire County Council and its internal audit manager, who sought to tell the public what was happening and, as I am sure that you are aware, had to go to considerable lengths, through the courts, to prove that his actions were correct and justified.

**Alison Halford:** I have had a lengthy discussion with the district auditor on certain matters and I am sure that the matter to which you referred will also be addressed by the district auditor. I am grateful to you for bringing it to my attention.

Sir John Bourn, the Auditor General for Wales, has frowned upon these deals in other areas of public expenditure. Such a clause is completely at odds with the new ethos of open government and freedom of information that Labour is trying so hard to create in Wales. What can be done to stop this? Can the local government ombudsman, or the forthcoming ombudsman review, ensure that such costly deals do not happen in future, or at least do not go unchallenged?

Finally, I am happy that the First Minister is taking radical steps to ensure that factual information upon which ministerial decisions are made is automatically available to the public. This signals again that the Assembly is leading the way in open government and is willing to take risks to ensure that decisions do not take place in secret. Such actions will do a great deal to energise the public.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had four and a half minutes. I have allowed time for the intervention, but I think that you are now taking advantage.

**Alison Halford:** Will the First Minister consider bringing forward the provisions of the Freedom of Information Act 2000, and not leave it until 2005?

**Nick Bourne:** The problem with annual reports is that they are always incredibly self-congratulatory. I do not know whether it is the First Minister's now famous trips abroad

**Janet Ryder:** A gyfeiriwch at achos Cyngor Sir y Fflint a'i reolwr archwilio mewnol, a geisiodd ddweud wrth y cyhoedd yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd ac y bu'n rhaid iddo ymdrechu'n galed, drwy'r llysoedd, fel y gwyddoch yr wyf yn siŵr, i brofi bod ei gamau yn gywir ac yn gyfiawn.

**Alison Halford:** Cefais drafodaeth hir gyda'r archwiliwr dosbarth am rai materion ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr archwiliwr dosbarth yn ymdrin â'r mater y gwnaethoch gyfeirio ato hefyd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ei ddwyn at fy sylw.

Mae Syr John Bourn, Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, wedi gwgu ar y bargeinion hyn mewn meysydd eraill o wariant cyhoeddus. Mae cymal o'r fath yn hollol groes i'r ethos newydd o lywodraeth agored a rhyddid gwybodaeth y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn ymdrechu mor galed i'w greu yng Nghymru. Beth y gellir ei wneud i atal hyn? A all yr ombwdsmon llywodraeth leol, neu'r adolygiad arfaethedig gan yr ombwdsmon, sicrhau na ddigwydd bargeinion mor gostus yn y dyfodol, neu y cânt eu herio o leiaf?

I gloi, yr wyf yn falch bod y Prif Weinidog yn cymryd camau radical i sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ffeithiol y mae penderfyniadau Gweinidogion yn seiliedig arni ar gael yn awtomatig i'r cyhoedd. Mae hyn yn arwydd arall bod y Cynulliad yn flaenllaw o ran llywodraeth agored a'i fod yn fodlon mentro i sicrhau na wneir penderfyniadau yn gyfrinachol. Bydd camau o'r fath yn gwneud llawer i symbylu'r cyhoedd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael pedair munud a hanner. Caniateais amser ar gyfer yr ymyriad, ond credaf eich bod yn cymryd mantais yn awr.

**Alison Halford:** A ystyria Prif Weinidog Cymru ddod â darpariaethau Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 ymlaen, yn hytrach nag aros tan 2005?

**Nick Bourne:** Y broblem gydag adroddiadau blynyddol yw eu bod bob amser yn hynod hunanfodhaus. Ni wn ai teithiau tramor y Prif Weinidog sy'n enwog erbyn hyn sydd

that have led to this obsession with beaches, or perhaps it is because the Liberal Democrats do not have a policy on beaches that he can claim credit for the success in this regard. Important though they are, we heard more about beaches than the health service, the economy or education. The First Minister referred to the excellent news that Cardiff has been shortlisted for Cultural Capital of Europe 2008, and we congratulate Lynne Williams and the campaign on that. However, he did not mention today's news about rising waiting lists. In the interests of completeness, perhaps the First Minister will address this problem later.

Prior to the 1999 Assembly elections, Labour's manifesto pledged that, by the end of a Labour Government's first term, no-one would wait more than 18 months for in-patient treatment. The number of people waiting for admission to hospital as an in-patient or day case has risen, during the three months from the end of June, to 9,121. The number of people waiting more than 18 months stands at 2,971. We need complete reports. It is no good having lies, damned lies and the First Minister's annual report. It is no good presenting part of the picture. The picture in terms of the health service is dire. It is no good either presenting selective statistics or trying to say that we should not look at the statistics because more people, since Labour came to power, need hospital treatment. We heard that again today, but it will not wash.

While we are on the subject of health, there was no discussion about the health service reorganisation that no-one wants. It will be costly and disruptive, and will do nothing for front-line healthcare. Key directorate posts are unfilled and some have attracted little interest. The deadline for appointing chief executives has been missed by two months in more than a few cases.

On education, the First Minister claims to be

wedi arwain at yr obsesiwn hwn â thraethau, neu ai oherwydd nad oes gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol bolisi o ran traethau sy'n golygu y gall hawlio'r clod am y llwyddiant hwn. Er bod traethau yn bwysig, clywsom fwy amdanynt nag am y gwasanaeth iechyd, yr economi neu addysg. Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at y newyddion ardderchog bod Caerdydd ar y rhestr fer ar gyfer Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop 2008, a llongyfarchwn Lynne Williams a'r ymgyrch ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni chrybwyllodd y newyddion a gyhoeddwyd heddiw bod rhestrau aros yn cynyddu. Er mwyn bod yn gyflawn, efallai y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymdrin â'r broblem hon yn ddiweddarach.

Cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 1999, addawodd maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth allanol, erbyn diwedd tymor cyntaf Llywodraeth Lafur. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros i fynd i'r ysbyty am driniaeth allanol neu fel achos dydd wedi codi, yn ystod y tri mis o ddiwedd mis Mehefin, i 9,121. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros mwy na 18 mis bellach yn 2,971. Mae angen adroddiadau cyflawn arnom. Nid yw o fudd cael celwyddau, celwyddau melltgedig ac adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog. Nid yw rhoi rhan o'r darlun yn werthfawr o ddim. Mae'r darlun o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ofnadwy. Ofer hefyd yw cyflwyno ystadegau dethol neu geisio dweud na ddylem edrych ar yr ystadegau gan fod angen triniaeth mewn ysbyty ar fwy o bobl, ers i'r Blaid Lafur ddod i rym. Clywsom hynny eto heddiw, ond ni thycia hynny ddim.

Tra ein bod yn sôn am iechyd, ni chafwyd trafodaeth am y broses o ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd nad oes neb am ei weld. Bydd yn gostus a bydd yn amharu ar y gwasanaeth, ac ni wna ddim byd ar gyfer gofal iechyd rheng flaen. Mae swyddi cyfarwyddwyr allweddol yn wag ac ychydig o ddi-ddordeb a fu mewn rhai ohonynt. Collwyd y dyddiad cau ar gyfer penodi prif weithredwyr o ddau fis mewn nifer o achosion.

O ran addysg, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn honni ei fod

‘making Wales an outstanding place to teach as well as learn.’

I think that teachers would dispute that claim. A survey by the National Association of Schoolmasters and Union of Women Teachers showed that nearly 83 per cent of teachers are considering leaving the profession. A total of 78 per cent judged morale to be low and 59 per cent said that the job was affecting their health. The number of teachers who left the profession over the summer would be enough to staff 27 average-sized Welsh primary schools. Therefore, to pretend that everything in the garden is rosy in terms of education is not true. I am grateful for the candour of the Labour Member for Delyn when she said that everything in the garden is not rosy. That is true.

It is also true as regards the economy. We saw serious job losses at Dewhurst and Allied Steel and Wire during the summer. These were not mentioned in the report. We have unrealistic growth targets in which no serious economist can believe—the Minister for Economic Development may be able to believe in them, but no serious economist can do so.

**Alison Halford:** I do not want you to verbalise me, Nick. I said that things were not rosy in the garden when it comes to issues relating to freedom of information and confidentiality. I was not talking about the health service.

**Nick Bourne:** Given your background, Alison, I would not dream of verbalising you, as you well know. Your point about openness in all councils was well made. I was grateful for your comments about Flintshire, because I do not think that what you said about Cardiff should be confined to that local authority.

4:30 p.m.

Finally, the First Minister also said more about bathing beaches than he did about agriculture. Since the eradication of foot and mouth disease, is it not important to send out a signal about the restrictions on livestock movement—Peter Rogers will focus on this

‘yn gwneud Cymru yn lle rhagorol ar gyfer addysgu yn ogystal â dysgu’.

Credaf y byddai athrawon yn herio'r honiad hwnnw. Dangosodd arolwg gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Ysgolfeistri ac Undeb yr Athrawesau fod bron 83 y cant o athrawon yn ystyried gadael y proffesiwn. Barnodd cyfanswm o 78 y cant fod morâl yn isel a dywedodd 59 y cant fod y swydd yn effeithio ar eu hiechyd. Byddai nifer yr athrawon a adawodd y proffesiwn dros yr haf yn ddigon i staffio 27 o ysgolion cynradd canolig eu maint yng Nghymru. Felly, nid yw'n wir honni bod popeth yn fêl i gyd o ran addysg. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod Llafur dros Ddelyn am ei gonestrwydd pan ddywedodd nad yw popeth yn fêl i gyd. Mae hynny'n wir.

Mae'n wir am yr economi hefyd. Collodd llawer o bobl eu swyddi yn Dewhurst ac Allied Steel and Wire yn ystod yr haf. Ni chrybwyllwyd y rhain yn yr adroddiad. Mae gennym dargedau twf afrealistig na all economydd difrifol gredu ynddynt—efallai fod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn credu ynddynt, ond ni all economydd difrifol wneud hynny.

**Alison Halford:** Nid wyf am ichi ymosod yn eiriol arnaf, Nick. Dywedais nad oedd pethau yn fêl i gyd o ran materion sy'n ymwneud â rhyddid gwybodaeth a chyfrinachedd. Nid siarad am y gwasanaeth iechyd yr oeddwn.

**Nick Bourne:** O ystyried eich cefndir, Alison, ni fyddwn yn breuddwydio ymosod yn eiriol arnoch, fel y gwyddoch. Gwnaethoch bwynt da ynglŷn â sicrhau bod cynghorau yn agored. Yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar ichi am eich sylwadau ar Sir y Fflint, oherwydd ni chredaf y dylid cyfyngu'r hyn a ddywedasoch am Gaerdydd i'r awdurdod lleol hwnnw.

I gloi, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog fwy am draethau nofio nag am amaethyddiaeth. Ers dileu clwy'r traed a'r genau, onid yw'n bwysig cyfleu'r cyfyngiadau ar symud da byw—bydd Peter Rogers yn canolbwyntio ar hyn heddiw yn y ddadl fer—sy'n bygwth y

in today's short debate—which are threatening the profession and leading to serious job losses?

The trouble with the First Minister is that he tries to pretend that everything is going well. However, what we heard was Government propaganda and the position presented is far from the truth. Were he to come here with a degree of candour and present a balanced position, he would find the opposition far more receptive to the type of propaganda imposed upon us today.

**Janice Gregory:** The First Minister's report clearly demonstrates that the Labour-led Welsh Assembly Government, working in partnership with the Labour Government at Westminster, is working and has a record of delivering on the issues that matter to the people of Wales. Examples of this include the introduction of free bus passes for the elderly and disabled, the freezing of prescription charges for the second year running, the record investment made in schools and hospitals, teachers' and lecturers' pay, and the provision of hospitals for Rhondda, Merthyr Tydfil, Blaenau Gwent, Tenby and Porthmadog. This Government is rebuilding public services in Wales after years of Tory destruction.

I will focus on the difference this Government has made in the Ogmere constituency. Although located in Bridgend, the new MRI scanner at the Princess of Wales Hospital, paid for with £2 million provided by the Welsh Assembly Government, will be a huge boost for medical services in the area.

**Alun Cairns:** I am pleased that Janice Gregory referred to the MRI scanner in Bridgend. Does she regret that the hospital trust had to resort to charity funding to top up capital investment to pay for the scanner?

**Janice Gregory:** I am surprised that you said that, Alun. Had you waited a nano-second, you would have heard me say that, not only did we provide the hospital trust with record

proffesiwn ac sy'n golygu y collir llawer o swyddi?

Y broblem gyda'r Prif Weinidog yw ei fod yn ceisio honni bod popeth yn mynd yn dda. Fodd bynnag, propaganda'r Llywodraeth oedd yr hyn a glywsom ac nid yw'r sefyllfa a gyflwynwyd yn agos at y gwirionedd. Pe deuai yma gyda rhywfaint o onestrydd gan gyflwyno barn gytbwys, byddai'r gwrthbleidiau yn llawer mwy parod i dderbyn y math o bropaganda a roddwyd heddiw.

**Janice Gregory:** Dengys adroddiad y Prif Weinidog yn glir fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o dan arweiniad y Blaid Lafur, gan weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, yn gweithio a bod ganddi record o wneud gwahaniaeth o ran y materion sy'n bwysig i bobl Cymru. Ymhlith yr enghreifftiau o hyn mae cyflwyno tocynnau bws am ddim i bobl oedrannus a'r anabl, rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn am yr ail flwyddyn yn olynol, y buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed a wnaethpwyd mewn ysgolion ac ysbytai, cyflog athrawon a darlithwyr, a darparu ysbytai ar gyfer y Rhondda, Merthyr Tudful, Blaenau Gwent, Dinbych-y-pysgod a Phorthmadog. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ailddatblygu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar ôl iddynt gael eu dinistrio gan y Toriaid am flynyddoedd.

Canolbwyntiaf ar y gwahaniaeth a wnaeth y Llywodraeth hon yn etholaeth Ogwr. Er ei bod ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, bydd y sganiwr MRI newydd yn Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru, y talwyd amdano gyda £2 filiwn a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn hwb mawr i wasanaethau meddygol yn yr ardal.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr oeddwn yn falch bod Janice Gregory wedi cyfeirio at y sganiwr MRI ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. A yw'n difaru bod ymddiriedolaeth yr ysbyty wedi gorfod troi at arian elusennol i ychwanegu at fuddsoddiad cyfalaf i dalu am y sganiwr?

**Janice Gregory:** Synnaf ichi ddweud hynny, Alun. Pe baech wedi aros am hanner eiliad, byddech wedi fy nghlywed yn dweud inni ganiatáu i'r ymddiriedolaeth gadw'r rhoddion

investment of £2 million to buy a better scanner than was originally ordered, we allowed the trust to retain the charitable donations of around £200,000 to pay for ancillary equipment and staff to man the scanner. Therefore I do not have any regrets.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Janice Gregory:** No, I will not.

Housing conditions in some of my constituency's most deprived communities are being transformed thanks to the partnerships between the statutory and voluntary sectors and the local community. In Lewistown, which is a Communities First area, a social housing grant of over £1.8 million from the Assembly Government has helped to transform the whole area. Similar projects are underway in Llangeinor and Bettws, which are also Communities First areas. In the case of Llangeinor, I thank the Government for its contribution to the health impact assessment, which will help the local authority take the project forward by providing information on the health-related aspects of its plan. Housing improvements will have a huge impact on the regeneration and health of deprived communities. I am sure that local people would join me in looking forward to the positive difference that this Government will make.

Communities First is a Labour policy that will have a huge impact on those most in need. Local people are engaging in the process and identifying the needs of their community, which has never been done before, particularly during the last Tory Government when people were demoralised. I hope that the First Minister will join me in commending the work of Caerau community association and the Noddfa chapel project, which received £150,000 from the Welsh Assembly Government to convert part of the chapel into a library and community information and communication technology facility. During the years of the last Tory Government, chapels were closed and allowed to degenerate. The jobs of over 400 workers in the Georgia Pacific paper mill in Llangynwyd have been secured as a result of regional selective assistance.

elusennol o tua £200,000 i dalu am offer ategol a staff i ofalu am y sganiwr, yn ogystal â rhoi'r buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed sef £2 filiwn i'r ysbyty i brynu sganiwr gwell na'r un a archebwyd yn wreiddiol. Felly, nid wyf yn edifar am ddim.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Janice Gregory:** Na wnaif.

Trawsnewidir cyflwr y tai mewn rhai o gymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig fy etholaeth yn sgîl y partneriaethau rhwng y sectorau statudol a gwirfoddol a'r gymuned leol. Yn Trelewis, sef ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, mae grant tai cymdeithasol o fwy na £1.8 miliwn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi helpu i drawsnewid yr ardal gyfan. Mae prosiectau tebyg ar waith yn Llangeinwyr a Bettws, sydd hefyd yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Yn achos Llangeinwyr, diolchaf i'r Llywodraeth am ei chyfraniad tuag at yr asesiad o'r effaith ar iechyd, a fydd yn helpu'r awdurdod lleol i ddatblygu'r prosiect drwy ddarparu gwybodaeth am yr agweddau ar ei gynllun sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd. Caiff gwelliannau tai effaith fawr ar y broses o adfywio cymunedau difreintiedig ac iechyd y bobl sy'n byw ynddynt. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pobl leol yn ymuno â mi i edrych ymlaen at y gwahaniaeth cadarnhaol a wna'r Llywodraeth hon.

Mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn un o bolisiau'r Blaid Lafur a gaiff effaith fawr ar y rhai sydd â'r anghenion mwyaf. Mae pobl leol yn cymryd rhan yn y broses ac yn nodi anghenion eu cymuned, nas gwnaed erioed o'r blaen, yn enwedig yn ystod y Llywodraeth Dori'aid ddiwethaf pan adawodd pobl yn ddigalon. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo gwaith cymdeithas gymunedol Caerau a phrosiect capel Noddfa, a gafodd £150,000 gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i droi rhan o'r capel yn llyfrgell a chyfleuster technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Yn ystod blynyddoedd y Llywodraeth Dori'aid ddiwethaf, caewyd capeli a chaniatawyd iddynt ddirywio. Diogelwyd swyddi mwy na 400 o weithwyr ym melin papur Georgia Pacific yn Llangynwyd o ganlyniad i gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol.

These are examples of differences in my constituency and of how this Government is delivering. Welsh Assembly Government initiatives are good news for Ogmore. Regeneration is a top priority; employment is at its highest for decades and, with private sector projects such as the proposed film studios at Llanharan, people in Ogmore are looking forward to a better and more prosperous future under this Labour Government.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu a chynghorydd sir. Yng Nghymru, gwelir rhai o'r ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf, gyda'r rhestrau aros yn waeth nag erioed. Yn 1997, yr oedd 6,000 o bobl yn aros dros chwe mis i weld arbenigwr am y tro cyntaf—heddiw, mae'r ffigur hwnnw yn fwy nag 83,000. Dyna'r ffigurau sy'n bwysig i ni feddygon teulu. Yr ydym wedi penderfynu bod problemau'r 83,000 hynny y tu hwnt i'n gallu fel meddygon teulu. Mae triniaeth i'r bobl hyn wedi'i gohirio nes iddynt weld arbenigwr. Maent yn ymweld â'r meddyg teulu mewn poen ac yn pryderu am faint yn rhagor y bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros. Y syniad mawr ddylai fod i gynyddu gallu'r gwasanaeth iechyd i drin mwy o bobl gyda mwy o welyau—yr ydym yn dal i gollu gwelyau, gyda llaw—mwy o nyrsys, mwy o feddygon a chefnogaeth i ofal sylfaenol, nid ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth eto.

Regarding the restructuring, we have the longest waiting lists ever. The big idea should be to develop the service, not re-organise it; this is the sixth reorganisation in 13 years. If we must have reorganisation, it should at least be simpler, save money and treat more patients. These reforms fail on all three counts. What guidelines will there be to ensure that GP obligations on out-of-hours visits—a new local health board function—are in operation on day one of the new local health boards? Local health groups only came into being in April 1999, one month before the Assembly. They are now starting to bed down nicely, and we are about to ditch them. They are still only advisory to the health authority. A terrific challenge awaits the members of the new local health boards on 1

Mae'r rhain yn enghreifftiau o'r gwahaniaethau yn fy etholaeth i ac o'r modd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Mae mentrau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn newyddion da i Ogwr. Mae adfywio yn flaenoriaeth; mae'r gyfradd cyflogaeth ar ei uchaf ers degawdau a, chyda phrosiectau'r sector preifat megis y stiwdios ffilm arfaethedig yn Llanharan, mae pobl Ogwr yn edrych ymlaen at ddyfodol gwell a mwy ffyniannus o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a general practitioner and county councillor. Wales has some of the worst health statistics, with waiting lists worse than ever. In 1997, there were 6,000 people waiting over six months for a first appointment with a specialist—today, that figure is over 83,000. That is the important figure for us, the GPs. We have decided that the problems of those 83,000 are beyond our capabilities as general practitioners. Treatment for these people is postponed until they see a specialist. They visit the GP in pain, concerned about how much longer they must wait. The big idea should be to increase the health service's capacity to treat more people by having more beds—we are still losing beds, by the way—more nurses, more doctors and support for primary care, not another reorganisation of the service.

O ran y gwaith ailstrwythuro, mae gennym y rhestrau aros hwyaf erioed. Yr hyn y dylid ei wneud yw datblygu'r gwasanaeth yn hytrach na'i ad-drefnu; dyma'r chweched achos o ad-drefnu mewn 13 o flynyddoedd. Os oes yn rhaid inni ei ad-drefnu, dylai o leiaf fod yn symlach, dylai arbed arian a thrin mwy o gleifion. Mae'r diwygiadau hyn yn methu ar bob cyfrif. Pa ganllawiau a fydd i sicrhau bod rhwymedigaethau meddygon teulu yn ystod ymweliadau y tu allan i oriau meddygfa—un o swyddogaethau newydd y bwrdd iechyd lleol—ar waith ar ddiwrnod cyntaf y byrddau iechyd lleol newydd? Dim ond ym mis Ebrill 1999, un mis cyn y Cynulliad, y sefydlwyd y grwpiau iechyd lleol. Maent yn dechrau ymsefydlu erbyn hyn ac yr ydym ar fin cael gwared arnynt. Dim ond rhoi cyngor i'r

April 2003, operating as health authorities with radical new functions such as control over GP out-of-hours practice.

The NHS will survive, and will respond to the needs of patients because of the tremendous commitment of its staff—I am delighted to count myself as one; that is where my natural docility comes from. The service will survive and continue to care only because of its staff and despite a most ill-judged restructuring plan.

**Peter Law:** I congratulate the First Minister on his report, which contains many positive policies that are proving to be beneficial to the people of Wales. It is nice to reflect on the fact that that is due to record comprehensive spending review settlements, from a Labour Chancellor of the UK Government, as Janice mentioned earlier. It has been a good partnership in that respect.

The items listed on the first page are positive. There are also matters missing from the first page which should be there, such as the flagship Communities First programme; that is making a big difference throughout Wales, as everyone here accepts. We have also seen the success of free local bus travel, which Sue Essex will be extending to 60-year-old men from next year. Good work was also undertaken to allow free entry to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales—much of the work was done by Tom Middlehurst in readiness for this Government to implement. Those items were not in the partnership agreement, by the way; I thought I would just throw that in. It is important to recognise these matters, as I sometimes get a bit concerned about misinformation. There may be a case today of the toerags coming home to roost. I regret that recent Liberal Democrat press statements give a false impression, and tend to demonstrate overwhelming political opportunism, of which we ought to be aware by now. However, you do not expect that from a Cabinet Minister; you expect a bit more loyalty than that. In the absence of any comment from my Labour colleagues in the Cabinet, I must speak out on the matter

awdurdod iechyd a wnânt o hyd. Mae her aruthrol yn wynebu aelodau'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd ar 1 Ebrill 2003, gan weithredu awdurdodau iechyd gyda swyddogaethau newydd radical megis rheoli gwaith meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau meddygfa.

Bydd y GIG yn goroesi, a bydd yn ymateb i anghenion cleifion oherwydd ymrwymiad aruthrol ei staff—yr wyf yn falch o fod yn un ohonynt; dyna o ble y daw fy natur ufudd. Bydd y gwasanaeth yn goroesi ac yn parhau i ddarparu gofal oherwydd ei staff ac er gwaethaf cynllun ailstwythuro annoeth.

**Peter Law:** Llongyfarchaf y Prif Weinidog ar ei adroddiad, sy'n cynnwys llawer o bolisiau cadarnhaol sydd o fudd i bobl Cymru. Mae'n braf myfyrio ar y ffaith mai setliadau adolygiadau cynhwysfawr o wariant heb eu hail, gan Ganghellor Llafur Llywodraeth y DU, sydd wedi achosi hynny, fel y crybwyllodd Janice yn gynharach. Bu'n bartneriaeth dda yn hynny o beth.

Mae'r eitemau a restrir ar y dudalen gyntaf yn gadarnhaol. Ceir materion sydd ar goll o'r dudalen gyntaf hefyd a ddylai fod yna, megis y rhaglen flaenllaw Cymunedau yn Gyntaf; gwna honno wahaniaeth mawr ledled Cymru, fel y derbynnir gan bawb yma. Gwelsom lwyddiant cludiant am ddim ar fysiau lleol hefyd, y bydd Sue Essex yn ei ymestyn i gynnwys dynion 60 mlwydd oed o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen. Gwnaethpwyd gwaith da hefyd i sicrhau mynediad am ddim i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru—gwnaethpwyd llawer o'r gwaith gan Tom Middlehurst yn barod i'r Llywodraeth hon ei weithredu. Nid oedd yr eitemau hynny yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, gyda llaw; yr oeddwn am nodi hynny. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod y materion hyn, gan fy mod yn pryderu am wybodaeth anghywir weithiau. Mae'n bosibl y bydd achos heddiw o'r cnafon yn cael eu haeddiant. Mae'n edifar gennyf i'r datganiadau diweddar i'r wasg gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol roi camargraff a'u bod wedi dangos oportiwntiaeth wleidyddol helaeth, y dylem fod yn ymwybodol ohoni erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, ni ddisgwyliwch hynny gan Weinidog y Cabinet; disgwyliwch ychydig mwy o



today. We know of the panzer division—we have worked with it for two years. It was claimed at a recent party conference that the Liberal Democrat group was a powerful tail wagging the dog. I have always thought of the Liberal Democrats as part of an anatomy—not the tail, but quite near it. The fact is, with 28 Labour Members and six Liberal Democrats, there is no doubt about who is taking the legislation forward—the Labour Party. We should put that on record. Labour is getting this legislation through.

deyrngarweh na hynny. Gan na fu unrhyw sylwadau gan fy nghyd-Aelodau Llafur yn y Cabinet, rhaid imi ddweud rhywbeth ar y mater heddiw. Gwyddom am yr adran arfog—yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda hi ers dwy flynedd. Honnwyd mewn cynhadledd ddiweddar o'r blaidd bod grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gynffon bwerus sy'n siglo'r ci. Yr wyf bob amser wedi ystyried bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn rhan o gorff—nid y gynffon, ond yn eithaf agos ati. Y gwir yw, gyda 28 o Aelodau Llafur a chwech o Aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, nid oes dim amheuaeth pwy sy'n cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth—y Blaid Lafur. Dylem gofnodi hynny. Y Blaid Lafur sy'n cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hon.

4:40 p.m.

It is a matter of great concern—immaterial of who was initially responsible for what—that there has been blatant exploitation of his position by the Minister responsible for rural affairs, Wales and the outer galaxies. He blatantly made a press statement this week, commending the First Minister's confirmation of what he calls Liberal Democrat initiatives. That is an embarrassment to the First Minister and a breach of Cabinet responsibility. When the Deputy First Minister is paid £70,000 per year to support the First Minister who appointed him, one expects more loyalty and support than has been demonstrated. I hope that he apologises to the First Minister for what happened, and I hope that the First Minister tells us what steps he intends to take to ensure that such a lack of professionalism and breach of protocol does not happen again.

Mae'n fater sy'n peri pryder mawr—waeth pwy a oedd yn gyfrifol am beth ar y dechrau—bod y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am faterion gwledig, Cymru a'r galaethau allanol wedi camddefnyddio ei statws yn ddigywilydd. Gwnaeth ddatganiad digywilydd i'r wasg yr wythnos hon, yn cymeradwyo cadarnhad y Prif Weinidog o'r hyn y mae'n eu galw yn fentrau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae hynny'n embaras i'r Prif Weinidog ac yn torri cyfrifoldeb y Cabinet. Pan delir £70,000 y flwyddyn i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i gefnogi'r Prif Weinidog a'i benododd, disgwylwch fwy o deyrngarweh a chefnogaeth na'r hyn a gafwyd. Gobeithiaf yr ymddiheura i'r Prif Weinidog am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd, a gobeithio y dywed y Prif Weinidog wrthym pa gamau y bwriada eu cymryd i sicrhau na fydd diffyg proffesiynoldeb o'r fath eto ac na thorrir protocol eto.

**David Melding:** The annual report is entitled 'Delivery' and it is fair to reflect on some of the performance indicators that the First Minister briefly alluded to. Waiting lists are soaring in Wales, faster than anywhere else in the United Kingdom. I remind Members of some of the headline figures; we should not forget that each one represents a patient waiting for treatment. There are 75,000 people waiting for in-patient hospital operations or day-case treatment. The figure

**David Melding:** Teitl yr adroddiad blynyddol yw 'Cyflawni' ac mae'n deg myfyrio ar rai o'r dangosyddion perfformiad a grybwyllwyd gan y Prif Weinidog. Mae rhestrau aros yng Nghymru wedi codi'n ddychrynlyd, yn gyflymach nag unrhyw le arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau o rai o'r prif ffigurau; ni ddylem anghofio bod pob un ohonynt yn cynrychioli claf sy'n aros am driniaeth. Mae 75,000 o bobl yn aros am lawdriniaeth mewn ysbyty

was 67,000 when Labour came to office, and it promised to cut that by at least 5,000. The figure is far in excess of Labour's manifesto promise and it is a perfectly miserable performance.

When we consider out-patients, we can really see where those kept waiting by Labour's inefficient health service have been parked. When this Labour Government came to office, there were 100,000 people waiting for out-patient consultations. There are now nearly 250,000 people in Wales waiting to see a consultant in Labour's NHS, which is disgraceful. The First Minister should answer for that in his reply. He boasts that some key categories have been addressed and targets met: for example, those waiting over 18 months for orthopaedic treatment. That figure, which was 10,000 a year ago, is now down to a few hundred; there has been some progress. However, those waiting over 18 months to see an orthopaedic consultant before being put on the operation waiting list has increased by 13 per cent. That is where the patients have gone; it is not an increase in treatments, but an increase in patients being kept waiting before seeing the consultant, and being put on the waiting list.

The most damning statistic the First Minister must answer for is that the NHS in Wales treats fewer patients now than it did a year ago. How can he explain that failure when there has been a rapid increase in health expenditure? If he says that it is a capacity problem and it takes a long time to turn the tank around, let us remember that we hardly treat any more patients in 2002 than were treated in 1997, when this Government came to office. That is despite an increase in expenditure of some 35 per cent. It is no wonder that the Government is bringing in Derek Wanless to examine health expenditure in Wales. It is prudent to freeze future health budgets from 2005 but I wonder who insisted that Wanless should come in. Was it the Finance Minister or the Secretary of State for Wales? There is a crisis in the health service and I am not surprised that a

fel cleifion mewnol neu am driniaeth achos dydd. Yr oedd y ffigur yn 67,000 pan ddaeth y Blaid Lafur i rym, ac addawodd leihau'r ffigur hwnnw gan o leiaf 5,000. Mae'r ffigur llawer yn uwch nag addewid maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur ac mae'n berfformiad ofnadwy.

Pan ystyriwn gleifion allanol, gallwn weld yn iawn ym mha le y rhoddir y rhai sy'n gorfod aros oherwydd gwasanaeth iechyd aneffeithlon y Blaid Lafur. Pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur hon i rym, yr oedd 100,000 o bobl yn aros am ymgynghoriadau fel cleifion allanol. Mae bron 250,000 o bobl yng Nghymru yn aros i weld meddyg ymgynghorol erbyn hyn yn GIG y Blaid Lafur, sy'n warthus. Dylai'r Prif Weinidog roi ateb i hynny yn ei ymateb. Mae'n ymfrostio ei fod wedi ymdrin â rhai categorïau allweddol a bod targedau wedi'u cyrraedd: er enghraifft, y rhai sy'n aros dros 18 mis am driniaeth orthopedig. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw, a oedd yn 10,000 flwyddyn yn ôl, bellach wedi lleihau i ychydig o gannoedd; bu rhywfaint o gynnydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhai sy'n aros dros 18 mis i weld meddyg ymgynghorol orthopedig cyn mynd ar y rhestr aros am lawdriniaeth wedi cynyddu 13 y cant. Dyna lle yr aeth y cleifion; nid yw nifer y triniaethau wedi cynyddu, ond nifer y cleifion sy'n gorfod aros cyn gweld y meddyg ymgynghorol, ac yn cael eu rhoi ar y rhestr aros.

Yr ystadegyn mwyaf damniol y mae'n rhaid i'r Prif Weinidog roi ateb amdano yw bod y GIG yng Nghymru yn trin llai o gleifion yn awr nag yr oedd flwyddyn yn ôl. Sut y gall egluro'r methiant hwnnw pan fu cynnydd cyflym mewn gwariant iechyd? Os dywed mai problem capasiti ydyw a'i bod yn cymryd llawer o amser i droi'r tanc, gadewch inni gofio nad ydym yn trin llawer mwy o gleifion yn 2002 nag a gafodd eu trin yn 1997, pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth hon i rym. Mae hynny er gwaethaf cynnydd mewn gwariant o tua 35 y cant. Nid oes ryfedd bod y Llywodraeth wedi gofyn i Derek Wanless archwilio gwariant iechyd yng Nghymru. Mae'n ddoeth rhewi cyllidebau iechyd yn y dyfodol o 2005 ymlaen ond tybed pwy a fynnodd y dylid penodi Wanless. Ai'r Gweinidog Cyllid neu Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ydoedd? Mae argyfwng yn y

senior Labour figure is greatly concerned.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**David Melding:** Finally, health service delivery in Wales is different to that in England. We do not have the promise of foundation hospitals or enterprise to be given to local trusts. Ours is a different and second class health service. We need to set the health service free from its bureaucratic system so that it can treat more patients and cut waiting lists dramatically.

**Mick Bates:** I will focus on the principle of partnership Government, which, after all, is the reason we are debating this report today. I will concentrate on two aspects, which have been delivered, and which play a major part in this annual report, namely stability and credibility. The partnership is difficult—the comments of some Members today are testament to this—but there is no such thing as the perfect solution. Hindsight is the only perfect science. Our struggles to keep the partnership working are aided by the respect that we have for each other, and by our genuine commitment to making this institution credible in the eyes of the people of Wales. It is as well to remember that point when considering the genuine achievements listed in this report. There are challenges facing us, and I too wish that the report took note of challenges such as NHS waiting lists. Sometimes it does the individual good to stand up and admit that they have not met their target.

Under the guiding principles of social inclusion, equality of opportunity and sustainable development—which section 121 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 gives us a legal duty to promote—I believe that there have been outstanding successes. One example is our waste management strategy. The section in the report on the work of the Minister for Environment is a model for the rest of Europe. We should not forget our achievements in sustainable development, which will make us a leading example in the

gwasanaeth iechyd ac ni synnaf fod ffigwr blaenllaw o'r Blaid Lafur yn pryderu'n fawr.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**David Melding:** I gloi, mae'r ffordd o gyflwyno'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn wahanol i Loegr. Nid oes gennym yr addewid o roi ysbytai gwaddoledig neu fenter i ymddiriedolaethau lleol. Mae ein gwasanaeth iechyd ni yn wasanaeth iechyd gwahanol ac eilradd. Mae angen inni ryddhau'r gwasanaeth iechyd o'i system fiwrocraidd fel y gall drin mwy o gleifion a lleihau rhestrau aros yn sylweddol.

**Mick Bates:** Canolbwyntiaf ar yr egwyddor o Lywodraeth bartneriaeth, sef y rheswm, wedi'r cyfan, dros gynnal trafodaeth ar yr adroddiad hwn heddiw. Canolbwyntiaf ar ddwy agwedd, a gyflawnwyd, ac sy'n chwarae rhan fawr yn yr adroddiad blynyddol hwn, sef sefydlogrwydd a hygredd. Mae'r bartneriaeth yn anodd—mae sylwadau rhai o'r Aelodau heddiw yn dyst i hyn—ond nid oes y fath beth ag ateb perffaith. Ôl-ddoethineb yw'r unig wyddor berffaith. Mae'r parch sydd gennym i'n gilydd, a'n hymrwymiad gwirioneddol i wneud y sefydliad hwn yn gredadwy yn llygaid pobl Cymru yn gymorth wrth inni frwydro i gadw'r bartneriaeth yn weithredol. Mae'n bwysig cofio'r pwynt hwnnw wrth ystyried y cyflawniadau gwirioneddol a restrir yn yr adroddiad hwn. Mae heriau yn ein hwynebu, a hoffwn innau hefyd pe bai'r adroddiad yn rhoi sylw i heriau megis rhestrau aros y GIG. Weithiau mae'n gwneud lles i'r unigolyn sefyll ar ei draed a chyfaddef nad yw wedi cyrraedd y targed.

O dan egwyddorion arweiniol cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, cyfle cyfartal a datblygu cynaliadwy—y mae adran 121 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn rhoi dyletswydd gyfreithiol arnom i'w hyrwyddo—credaf y bu llwyddiannau eithriadol. Un enghraifft yw ein strategaeth rheoli gwastraff. Mae'r adran yn yr adroddiad ar waith y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn fodel i weddill Ewrop. Ni ddylem anghofio ein cyflawniadau o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, a fydd yn ein gwneud yn enghraifft flaenllaw yn y byd.

world.

On cross-cutting issues, I ask the First Minister to address the challenge of the bonfire of the quangos in his closing remarks. What happened to this promise? At the last election, we promised to reduce expenditure on bureaucracy.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the Member give way?

**Mick Bates:** I will give way in a moment. We should examine the effectiveness of the Assembly's bureaucracy.

Finally, I draw your attention to one of the best achievements for the future, namely the Welsh procurement initiative, which is outlined in the local government section of the report. I believe that all Members applaud the Government for taking steps to ensure that local products and produce are used by the public sector; that is another example of our commitment to sustainability.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to Mick Bates for giving way. He mentioned the bonfire of the quangos. Will he tell Members why he supported the establishment of 22 further quangos under NHS reorganisation?

**Mick Bates:** I consider that a challenge—*[Laughter.]*

Talented people can assist in running a country, and they must be used well. However, we are paid to run Wales, and the people of Wales need a clear answer on how we can achieve a reduction in spending when we are paying more people to run the country.

**Brian Hancock** *rose—*

**Mick Bates:** I am sorry Brian, I cannot take another intervention. The fact that we are debating this report is due to our commitment to open government. That is a reflection of the First Minister's integrity, which enables us, as he said before, to govern in the sunshine. I hope that we continue to do so.

O ran materion trawsbynciol, gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog ymdrin â than gwyllt y cwangos yn ei sylwadau cloi. Beth a ddigwyddodd i'r addewid hwn? Yn yr etholiad diwethaf, addawsom leihau gwariant ar fiwrocratiaeth.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

**Mick Bates:** Ildiaf mewn eiliad. Dylem archwilio effeithiolrwydd biwrocratiaeth y Cynulliad.

I gloi, tynnaf eich sylw at un o'r cyflawniadau gorau ar gyfer y dyfodol, sef menter caffael Cymru, a amlinellir yn yr adran ar lywodraeth leol yn yr adroddiad. Credaf fod pob Aelod yn cymeradwyo'r Llywodraeth am gymryd camau i sicrhau y defnyddir cynhyrchion lleol gan y sector cyhoeddus; mae hynny'n enghraifft arall o'n hymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Mick Bates am ildio. Soniodd am dân gwyllt y cwangos. A ddywed wrth yr Aelodau pam y cefnogodd sefydlu 22 o gwangos ychwanegol wrth ad-drefnu'r GIG?

**Mick Bates:** Ystyriaf hynny'n her—*[Chwerthin]*

Gall pobl dalentog helpu i redeg gwlad, a rhaid eu defnyddio'n dda. Fodd bynnag, fe'n telir i redeg Cymru ac mae angen ateb clir ar bobl Cymru ar sut y gallwn gyflawni gostyngiad mewn gwariant pan dalwn fwy o bobl i redeg y wlad.

**Brian Hancock** *a gododd—*

**Mick Bates:** Mae'n flin gennyf Brian, ni allaf gymryd ymyriad arall. Yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaeth ar yr adroddiad hwn oherwydd ein hymrwymiad i lywodraeth agored. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchiad o onestrywydd y Prif Weinidog, sy'n ein galluogi, fel y dywedodd o'r blaen, i lywodraethu yn yr heulwen. Gobeithiaf y parhawn i wneud hynny.

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as leader of Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council. There is no doubt that the free bus travel scheme that was welcomed by everyone is a success. Since the scheme was launched, it is fair to say that it has significantly enhanced the quality of life of thousands of elderly and disabled citizens across Wales. It has also had a positive effect on our poorer and more remote valley and rural communities in terms of moving forward the social inclusion agenda and reconnecting elderly and disabled people with their communities. In my area, council figures show that the scheme has been a big hit. The number of bus passes issued has increased by 25 per cent since the all-Wales scheme was introduced. Will the scheme become a national free bus travel scheme or will it remain jointly funded by the Assembly and local government? It is often forgotten that the scheme has been delivered as a result of partnership working between the Assembly Government and local government, with councils making a significant contribution in terms of managing, administrating and financing the scheme.

4:50 p.m.

Financial contributions made by individual councils across Wales vary significantly. Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council has increased its concessionary fares budget from £1.3 million for 2001-02 to £2.8 million for 2002-03, an increase of £1.5 million. In this financial year, it is estimated that the cost of implementing the concessionary fares scheme will be £2 million higher in Rhondda Cynon Taf than the funding received to date from the National Assembly. In the meantime, the council will be bankrolling the shortfall. This situation is happening elsewhere. Local councils want reassurance from the Assembly Government that it will cover the entire costs incurred by individual councils, including the extra cost of extending the scheme to include men aged 60 to 64 who will become eligible from April 2003 onwards and the additional costs associated with monitoring the level of concessionary travel.

The Minister for Environment readily

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Yn ddiau, mae'r cynllun teithio am ddim ar fysiau a groesawyd gan bawb yn llwyddiant. Ers i'r cynllun gael ei lansio, mae'n deg dweud ei fod wedi gwella ansawdd bywyd miloedd o ddinasyddion oedrannus ac anabl ledled Cymru. Cafodd effaith gadarnhaol hefyd ar ein cymunedau tlotach a mwy anghysbell yn y cymoedd a'r cymunedau gwledig o ran datblygu'r agenda cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac ailgysylltu pobl oedrannus ac anabl â'u cymunedau. Yn fy ardal i, dengys ffigurau'r cyngor i'r cynllun fod yn llwyddiant aruthrol. Mae nifer y tocynnau bws a roddir wedi cynyddu 25 y cant ers i gynllun Cymru gyfan gael ei gyflwyno. A ddaw'r cynllun yn gynllun cenedlaethol teithio am ddim ar fysiau neu a fydd yn parhau i gael ei ariannu ar y cyd gan y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol? Anghofir yn aml fod y cynllun wedi ei gyflwyno o ganlyniad i waith partneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol, ac mae cynghorau wedi gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol o ran rheoli, gweinyddu ac ariannu'r cynllun.

Mae'r cyfraniadau ariannol a wneir gan gynghorau unigol ledled Cymru yn amrywio'n sylweddol. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi cynyddu ei gyllideb ar gyfer tocynnau mantais o £1.3 miliwn ar gyfer 2001-02 i £2.8 miliwn ar gyfer 2002-03, cynnydd o £1.5 miliwn. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, rhagwelir y bydd y gost o weithredu'r cynllun tocynnau mantais £2 filiwn yn uwch yn Rhondda Cynon Taf na'r arian a gafwyd hyd yma gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yn y cyfamser, bydd y cyngor yn ariannu'r diffyg. Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn digwydd mewn manau eraill. Mae cynghorau lleol am i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad eu sicrhau y bydd yn talu holl gostau cynghorau unigol, gan gynnwys y gost ychwanegol o ymestyn y cynllun i gynnwys dynion 60 i 64 oed a ddaw'n gymwys o fis Ebrill 2003 ymlaen a'r costau ychwanegol sy'n gysylltiedig â monitro lefel y teithio mantais.

Bu'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn

admitted in a recent announcement about additional funding that some local authorities are still not being fully compensated, despite the extra funding. That is a matter of concern. If the Assembly Government does not cover councils' costs in their entirety, other services for residents provided by local authorities will suffer. Every pound that the Assembly Government does not reimburse to individual local authorities is a pound lost to other front-line services.

**Tom Middlehurst:** I welcome the First Minister's report. It indicates significant levels of activity and achievement by the Labour-led Assembly Government, which as a Labour group member I am proud of. However, many of us have heard and read about the Liberal Democrats' outrageous claims in the Chamber and elsewhere. If they can claim any success, it can only be measured by the willingness of my colleagues in the Labour-led Government to allow those claims to go unchallenged. That may be because they are honourable people who accept the full responsibilities of their offices. Labour Party members will not be fooled by the Liberal Democrat rhetoric. Many successful policy initiatives introduced by this Assembly Government and its predecessor have been made possible through the commitment of the Chancellor of the Exchequer, Gordon Brown, and the determination of the Finance Minister, Edwina Hart, to address the deep-seated problems that face people in our communities with record levels of investment in social and economic regeneration. The Liberal Democrats have had no part in that.

This unhappy alliance has allowed a man, rejected by the electorate in the constituency that he contested, to assume the title of Deputy First Minister and to be given a further string of titles and gifts. However, he is not content with this largess. He then has the gall to humiliate the First Minister, who gave him his position, by publicly ridiculing him. He claimed that he and the rag-bag Members of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group are the effective leadership in the

barod i gyfaddef mewn cyhoeddiad diweddar ynghylch arian ychwanegol nad yw rhai awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu digolledu'n llwyr o hyd, er gwaethaf yr arian ychwanegol. Mae hwn yn achos pryder. Os na fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn talu costau cynghorau yn gyfan gwbl, bydd gwasanaethau eraill a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol i drigolion yn dioddef. Am bob punt nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei had-dalu i awdurdodau lleol unigol, collir punt i wasanaethau rheng flaen eraill.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Croesawaf adroddiad y Prif Weinidog. Noda lefelau sylweddol o weithgaredd a chyflawniad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad o dan arweiniad y Blaid Lafur, yr wyf, fel aelod o'r grŵp Llafur, yn falch ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer ohonom wedi clywed a darllen am honiadau gwirion y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Siambr ac mewn mannau eraill. Os gallant hawlio unrhyw lwyddiant, dim ond drwy barodrwydd fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Llywodraeth o dan arweiniad y blaid Lafur i ganiatáu i'r honiadau hynny barhau yn ddiwrthwynebiad y gellir mesur hynny. Efallai mai'r rheswm am hynny yw eu bod yn bobl anrhydeddus sy'n derbyn cyfrifoldebau llawn eu swyddi. Ni chaff aelodau'r Blaid Lafur eu twyllo gan rethreg y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Gwiredwyd llawer o fentrau polisi llwyddiannus a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn a'i ragflaenydd drwy ymrwymiad Canghellor y Trysorlys, Gordon Brown, a phenderfyniad y Gweinidog Cyllid, Edwina Hart, i ymdrin â'r problemau dwfn sy'n wynebu pobl yn ein cymunedau gyda'r buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed mewn adfywiad cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Ni chwaraeodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol unrhyw ran yn hynny.

Mae'r gynghrair anhapus hon wedi caniatáu i ddyn, a wrthodwyd gan yr etholwyr yn yr etholaeth a ymladdodd, gymryd y teitl Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a chael cyfres ychwanegol o deitlau a rhoddion. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n fodlon ar yr haelioni hyn. Mae ganddo'r haerllugrwydd wedyn i fychanu'r Prif Weinidog, a roddodd ei swydd iddo, drwy ei wawdio yn gyhoeddus. Honnodd mai ef a'r cawdel o Aelodau o grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yw'r

Welsh Assembly Government. The Labour Party and other Assembly parties know that that is untrue. Sadly, his advanced announcement and his determination to preempt the First Minister's report, rather than the substance of the issues contained in the report, have attracted the headlines. He shows breathtaking arrogance, which is, perhaps, indicative of the nature of the man and the group that he leads. Since he is in full electioneering mode, now is the moment to call time on this coalition, and for Labour to assume full responsibility for government in the run-up to the Assembly elections.

**Alun Cairns:** I commend Tom Middlehurst on his contribution. Other Members' contributions will be something of an understatement following that. Returning to the First Minister's opening remarks, he highlighted regional selective assistance, the investment grant and Finance Wales's progress on Objective 1. I cannot help but think that he lives in a different world to us. The reality of his world is reflected in the economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales'. Unless the First Minister is prepared to accept the real problem and the challenges before us, how can we be confident that he will introduce policies that will overcome those problems? The greatest challenge is in overcoming the wealth gap between Wales and England, which is now wider than it has been for generations. If everything is rosy in the garden, First Minister, why is gross domestic product per capita lower in Wales compared to the rest of the United Kingdom than for generations? Why are we now poorer in real terms after five and a half years of Labour administration? Why is there no prospect of reversing this decline and in making the step change that we were promised by the Assembly and Objective 1? Why are we not making progress in bridging that wealth gap?

He highlighted the Assembly investment grant and said what a roaring success it would be and has been to date. Why has only £1 million been allocated by the Finance Minister and the Minister for Economic

arweinyddiaeth effeithiol yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gŵyr y Blaid Lafur a phleidiau eraill yn y Cynulliad nad yw hynny'n wir. Yn anffodus, yr hyn sydd wedi denu sylw'r wasg yw ei gyhoeddiad ymlaen llaw a'i benderfyniad i achub y blaen ar adroddiad y Prif Weinidog, yn hytrach na sylwedd y materion a gynhwysir yn yr adroddiad. Dengys haerllugrwydd syfrdanol sydd, efallai, yn nodweddiadol o natur y dyn a'r grŵp a arweinir ganddo. Gan ei fod wrthi'n ymgyrchu'n wleidyddol, nawr yw'r amser i derfynu'r glymblaid hon, ac i'r blaid Lafur ysgwyddo'r ddyletswydd i lywodraethu yn y cyfnod cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn llwyr.

**Alun Cairns:** Canmolaf Tom Middlehurst ar ei gyfraniad. Bydd cyfraniadau'r Aelodau eraill yn dipyn o danddatganiad yn dilyn hynny. Gan ddychwelyd at sylwadau agoriadol y Prif Weinidog, amlygodd gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, y grant buddsoddi, a chynnydd Cyllid Cymru ar Amcan 1. Ni allaf lai na chredu ei fod yn byw mewn byd gwahanol i ni. Adlewyrchir realiti ei fyd yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd, 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Oni fydd y Prif Weinidog yn barod i dderbyn y broblem wirioneddol a'r heriau ger ein bron, sut y gallwn fod yn hyderus y bydd yn cyflwyno polisiau a fydd yn goresgyn y problemau hynny? Yr her fwyaf yw goresgyn y bwlch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, sy'n lletach yn awr nag y bu ers cenedlaethau. Os yw popeth yn fêl i gyd, Brif Weinidog, pam mae cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yn is yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig nag y bu ers cenedlaethau? Pam ein bod yn dlotach yn awr mewn termau gwirioneddol ar ôl pum mlynedd a hanner o weinyddiaeth y blaid Lafur? Pam nad oes unrhyw obaith o wrthdroi'r dirywiad hwn a gwneud y newid sylweddol a addawyd i ni gan y Cynulliad ac Amcan 1? Pam na wnawn gynnydd wrth bontio'r bwlch cyfoeth hwnnw?

Amlygodd grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a dywedodd cymaint o lwyddiant aruthrol a fyddai ac a fu hyd yma. Pam mai dim ond £1 filiwn a ddyrannwyd gan y Gweinidog Cyllid a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd

Development in the budget? Will £1 million make a difference to the economy and take us from 80 per cent of GDP per capita? If Finance Wales is also such a roaring success, as highlighted by him in his personal comments at the beginning of the report, why has the money for it been reduced in real terms for the forthcoming financial year? It highlights that the flagship policies that the administration is pursuing—the Assembly investment grant and Finance Wales in particular, let alone the mess of Objective 1—are all failing. That is demonstrated in the GDP figures, namely that we are poorer now than for generations.

I am also surprised to see no mention of the new Assembly building in this annual report. Let us not forget that it has been on hold for the last 12 months. It was cancelled 15 months ago. I would have at least expected a footnote stating ‘we hope to build the Assembly building’. I expected some comment to the effect that Richard Rogers might be re-employed to build it after sacking him 15 months ago. No, the First Minister chooses to highlight some headline-grabbing issues. However, when we examine the detail, the Assembly Government has failed.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome the report and I am delighted by the positive effects that are visible around Wales as a result of the vision shown by the Labour-led Assembly. I am glad that Plaid Cymru acknowledges the success of the free bus pass scheme. It would possibly like to acknowledge that in certain local authorities, such as Rhondda Cynon Taf, there has been a huge uplift since the Labour-led Assembly’s inception.

I now turn to tourism, and the progress made following last year’s setback due to foot and mouth disease. As a Member representing a Valleys’ constituency, I am keen that tourism in the Valleys should be promoted. Arguably, the Valleys are not an area that people traditionally think of in terms of tourism, nevertheless, there is a huge potential to tap. There are many stereotypes about the Valleys, for example, that they are grey and industrial, which emanate from our industrial

yn y gyllideb? A fydd £1 filiwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i’r economi ac yn mynd â ni o 80 y cant o’r CMC y pen? Os yw Cyllid Cymru yn gymaint o lwyddiant aruthrol, fel yr amlygwyd ganddo yn ei sylwadau personol ar ddechrau’r adroddiad, pam y gostyngwyd yr arian ar ei gyfer mewn termau gwirioneddol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol i ddod? Amlyga fod y prif bolisiau y mae’r weinyddiaeth yn eu dilyn—grant buddsoddi’r Cynulliad a Chyllid Cymru yn arbennig, heb sôn am lanastr Amcan 1—i gyd yn methu. Mae ffigurau’r CMC yn dangos hynny, sef ein bod yn dlotach yn awr nag y buom ers cenedlaethau.

Yr wyf yn synnu hefyd nad oes unrhyw sôn am adeilad newydd y Cynulliad yn yr adroddiad blynyddol hwn. Ni ddylem anghofio iddo gael ei ohirio ers 12 mis. Fe’i canslwyd 15 mis yn ôl. Byddwn wedi disgwyl gweld troednodyn o leiaf yn dweud ‘gobeithiwn godi adeilad y Cynulliad’. Disgwyliais ryw faint o sylwadau i’r perwyl y gellid ailgyflogi Richard Rogers i’w adeiladu ar ôl ei ddiswyddo 15 mis yn ôl. Na, mae’r Prif Weinidog yn dewis amlygu rhai materion sy’n cael cryn sylw yn y wasg. Fodd bynnag, pan archwiliwn y manylion, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi methu.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad ac yr wyf yn falch o’r effeithiau cadarnhaol sydd i’w gweld ledled Cymru o ganlyniad i’r weledigaeth a ddangoswyd gan y Cynulliad o dan arweiniad y Blaid Lafur. Yr wyf yn falch bod Plaid Cymru yn cydnabod llwyddiant y cynllun tocynnau bws am ddim. Hoffai gydnabod, o bosibl, y bu hwb aruthrol mewn rhai awdurdodau lleol, megis Rhondda Cynon Taf, ers cychwyn y Cynulliad o dan arweiniad y Blaid Lafur.

Trof yn awr at dwristiaeth, a’r cynnydd a wnaed yn dilyn anffawd y llynedd yn sgîl clwy’r traed a’r genau. Fel Aelod yn cynrychioli etholaeth yn y Cymoedd, yr wyf yn awyddus i dwristiaeth yn y Cymoedd gael ei hyrwyddo. Heb os, nid yw’r Cymoedd yn ardal y mae pobl yn draddodiadol yn ei hystyried yn ardal dwristiaeth, serch hynny, mae posibilïadau mawr yma. Ceir llawer o ystrydebau am y Cymoedd, er enghraifft, eu bod yn llwyd a diwydiannol, sy’n deillio o’n



heritage. That can be an important ingredient in developing tourism, but it is not the only one. We need the vision and forward thinking to realise that the Valleys have vast areas of beauty that offer opportunities for walking, riding, cycling and other popular activities.

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Christine Chapman:** I want to finish my point, David.

We have a jewel in our midst and I am convinced that it is not always recognised by locals, let alone visitors.

5:00 p.m.

**David Davies:** I agree that the tourism potential of large areas of the Valleys could be developed easily. However, do you agree that this could be hampered by the Welsh Assembly Government's intention to introduce compulsory registration for all bed and breakfasts?

**Christine Chapman:** I disagree, and I will explain why as I move on to discuss accommodation. I welcome the Objective 1 grants. Alun Cairns should get out more often. I have visited many successful Objective 1 projects that have benefited from the Wales Tourist Board's grants to help develop quality accommodation. If we are to encourage visitors, good quality accommodation must be available. That is why I disagree with David's comment. Two accommodation providers in the Cynon Valley—the Falcon Inn in Cwmaman and Tyn-y-Wern Country House in Ynysybwll—have received such support and the latter now attracts visitors from as far afield as Japan and the US. The Cydcoed Objective 1 project is helping to develop cycle paths in Cynon Valley, which also offers health benefits.

These Valley areas need to be marketed. The web-based Streaming Wales project in Blaenau Gwent—which, I remind Alun Cairns, is a successful project led by the private sector—will help to attract the world's attention to Valley areas. If Cardiff's bid to be Cultural Capital of Europe is

treftadaeth ddiwydiannol. Gall hynny fod yn elfen bwysig o ddatblygu twristiaeth, ond nid dyma'r unig un. Mae angen y weledigaeth a'r blaengaredd arnom i sylweddoli bod gan y Cymoedd ardaloedd helaeth o harddwch sy'n cynnig cyfleoedd i gerdded, marchogaeth, seiclo a gweithgareddau poblogaidd eraill.

**David Davies:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Christine Chapman:** Yr wyf am orffen fy mhwynt, David.

Mae gennym drysor yn ein plith ac yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig na chaiff ei gydnabod bob amser gan y bobl leol, heb sôn am ymwelwyr.

**David Davies:** Cytunaf y gellid datblygu ardaloedd mawr o'r Cymoedd yn ardaloedd twristiaeth yn hawdd. Fodd bynnag, a gytnwch y gallai bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno cofrestru gorfodol ar gyfer pob gwesty gwely a brecwast rwystro hyn?

**Christine Chapman:** Anghytunaf, ac egluraf pam wrth imi symud ymlaen i drafod llety. Croesawaf grantiau Amcan 1. Dylai Alun Cairns fynd allan yn amlach. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â llawer o brosiectau Amcan 1 llwyddiannus sydd wedi elwa ar grantiau Bwrdd Croeso Cymru i helpu i ddatblygu llety o safon. Er mwyn annog ymwelwyr, rhaid i lety o safon fod ar gael. Dyna pam yr anghytunaf â sylw David. Mae dau ddarparwr llety yng Nghwm Cynon—y Falcon Inn yng Nghwmaman a Tyn-y-Wern Country House yn Ynysybwll—wedi derbyn cymorth o'r fath ac mae'r olaf bellach yn denu ymwelwyr o mor bell â Siapan a'r Unol Daleithiau. Mae project Amcan 1 Cydcoed yn helpu i ddatblygu llwybrau seiclo yng Nghwm Cynon, sydd hefyd yn fanteisiol i iechyd.

Mae angen i ardaloedd y Cymoedd gael eu marchnata. Bydd y prosiect Streaming Wales sy'n seiliedig ar y we ym Mlaenau Gwent—sydd, hoffwn atgoffa Alun Cairns, yn brosiect llwyddiannus o dan arweiniad y sector preifat—yn helpu i ddenu sylw'r byd i ardaloedd y Cymoedd. Os bydd cynnig

successful, the resulting prosperity will also benefit the Valleys.

I welcome the additional investment. More success is also being generated because of the joined-up thinking approach encouraged by the Assembly. Of course, much remains to be done. Rhodri, will you pay particular attention to the tourism potential of the Valleys?

**Glyn Davies:** I have been inspired by some contributions to this debate, particularly that of Tom Middlehurst. It is a pity that he has left the Chamber, as I wanted to congratulate him on the quality of his speech.

Producing an annual report is a good idea, but not if it turns out to be a glossy, official, self-congratulating, self-indulgent and boastful document such as the First Minister's annual report. There is a picture of a Minister on almost every page, and this glossy report has been designed with the forthcoming election campaign in mind.

When I first read the report, its self-congratulatory tone reminded me of the press releases issued by Mick Bates in mid Wales. We have heard much today about the Liberal Democrats' boastfulness and the claims that they make. I will share with you an interesting claim made in the *Montgomeryshire Mail*, which I found had been delivered to my home when I returned last weekend.

**Mick Bates:** It is the best publication around.

**Glyn Davies:** I would not be too forthright, if I were you. The *Montgomeryshire Mail* reports that the Liberal Democrats insisted that 120 policy issues be included in the partnership agreement. It goes on to say that, of the 120 policies, 93 have been delivered and another 30 are on target for delivery. [*Laughter.*] Members should bear in mind that Mick Bates was a mathematics teacher before he became a politician.

Caerdydd i fod yn Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop yn llwyddiannus, bydd y Cymoedd hefyd yn elwa ar y ffyniant canlyniadol.

Croesawaf y buddsoddiad ychwanegol. Caiff mwy o lwyddiant ei greu hefyd oherwydd yr ymagwedd meddwl gydgyssylltiedig a anogir gan y Cynulliad. Wrth gwrs, erys llawer i'w wneud. Rhodri, a roddwch sylw arbennig i bosibiliadau'r Cymoedd o ran twristiaeth?

**Glyn Davies:** Fe'm hysbrydolwyd gan rai cyfraniadau i'r ddadl hon, yn arbennig un Tom Middlehurst. Mae'n drueni ei fod wedi gadael y Siambr, oherwydd yr oeddwn am ei longyfarch ar ansawdd ei araith.

Mae cynhyrchu adroddiad blynyddol yn syniad da, ond nid felly os yw'n ddogfen mor foethus, swyddogol, hunanglodforus, hunanfaldodus ac ymffrostgar ag adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog. Ceir darlun o Weinidog ar bron pob tudalen ac mae'r adroddiad moethus hwn wedi ei gynllunio gyda'r ymgyrch etholiadol sydd ar ddod mewn golwg.

Pan ddarllenais yr adroddiad gyntaf, yr oedd ei dôn hunanglodforus yn fy atgoffa o'r datganiadau i'r wasg a gyhoeddir gan Mick Bates yn y Canolbarth. Clywsom lawer heddiw am ymffrost y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r honiadau a wnânt. Rhannaf honiad diddorol gyda chi a wnaed yn y *Montgomeryshire Mail*, a ddosbarthwyd i'm cartref pan ddychwelais yno y penwythnos diwethaf.

**Mick Bates:** Hwn yw'r cyhoeddiad gorau sydd ar gael.

**Glyn Davies:** Ni fyddwn yn rhy ddi-flewyn-ar-dafod, yn eich lle chi. Yn y *Montgomeryshire Mail* dywedir bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn mynnu bod 120 o faterion polisi yn cael eu cynnwys yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Â yn ei flaen i ddweud y cyflwynwyd 93 o'r 120 o bolisiau ac mae 30 arall ar y trywydd iawn i gael eu cyflwyno [*Chwerthin.*] Dylai'r Aelodau gofio mai athro mathemateg oedd Mick Bates cyn iddo fynd yn wleidydd.

I would expect an annual report to cast a favourable light; that would be expected in a private company's annual report. However, this report goes to extremes. If a private company published such an annual report, the report would be dismissed, the company's share prices would fall and it would go out of business.

I will discuss three issues mentioned in the report. Outcomes are important, not activity. We accept that there is more activity, as more money is being spent. Our taxes have been increased, and therefore more money is available and an increase in activity is to be expected. It is the outcomes that count. In his speech, Alun Cairns concentrated on the level of GDP in Wales. This annual report does not refer to GDP. The national economic development strategy—the First Minister's plan, which he discussed for the first half of this term—is based on Wales's GDP level. The Objective 1 programme, which is meant to revitalise a major part of Wales, is also based on GDP. However, there is no reference to GDP in the annual report. The report does not even challenge Plaid Cymru's claim that GDP in Wales has fallen, which I also suspect is true. Why will the First Minister not challenge that and tell us that GDP in Wales is increasing, and provide figures to prove that?

On rural development, jobs in rural communities, particularly in the farming industry is the outcome we need. Why does the report not identify the number of jobs lost? There are figures to prove that jobs have been lost, and that should be recognised in the report. That would have given credibility to this glossy propaganda, and made it a more balanced report.

**Peter Black:** I declare an interest as a member of the City and County of Swansea Council. I welcome this report. It is important that we demonstrate to the people of Wales how the Liberal Democrat-Labour partnership Government has made a difference and how effective the National Assembly has been in developing distinctive policies and outcomes, compared to the pre-

Byddwn yn disgwyl i adroddiad blynyddol ddangos ochr ffafriol; disgwyliid hynny mewn adroddiad blynyddol cwmni preifat. Fodd bynnag, â'r adroddiad hwn i'r eithaf. Pe bai cwmni preifat yn cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol o'r fath, câi'r adroddiad ei wrthod, byddai cyfranddaliadau'r cwmni yn gostwng a byddai'r busnes yn methu.

Trafodaf dri mater a grybwyllir yn yr adroddiad. Canlyniadau ac nid gweithgaredd sy'n bwysig. Derbyniwn fod mwy o weithgaredd, gan fod mwy o arian yn cael ei wario. Cynyddwyd ein trethi, ac felly mae mwy o arian ar gael a disgwyliir cynnydd mewn gweithgaredd. Y canlyniadau sy'n bwysig. Yn ei araith, canolbwyntiodd Alun Cairns ar lefel y CMC yng Nghymru. Nid yw'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn yn cyfeirio at CMC. Mae'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol—cynllun y Prif Weinidog, a drafododd yn ystod hanner cyntaf y tymor hwn—yn seiliedig ar lefel CMC Cymru. Mae rhaglen Amcan 1, y bwriedir iddi adfywio rhan fawr o Gymru, yn seiliedig hefyd ar CMC. Fodd bynnag, nid oes unrhyw gyfeiriad at CMC yn yr adroddiad blynyddol. Nid yw'r adroddiad hyd yn oed yn herio honiad Plaid Cymru bod CMC yng Nghymru wedi gostwng, y tybiaf sy'n wir hefyd. Pam na wnaiff y Prif Weinidog herio hynny a dweud wrthym fod CMC yng Nghymru yn cynyddu, a darparu ffigurau i brofi hynny?

O ran datblygu gwledig, y canlyniad sydd ei angen arnom yw swyddi mewn cymunedau gwledig, yn arbennig yn y diwydiant ffermio. Pam nad yw'r adroddiad yn nodi nifer y swyddi a gollwyd? Ceir ffigurau i brofi bod swyddi wedi eu colli, a dylid cydnabod hynny yn yr adroddiad. Byddai hynny wedi rhoi hygredded i'r propaganda moethus hwn, a'i wneud yn adroddiad mwy cytbwys.

**Peter Black:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe. Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'n bwysig inni ddangos i bobl Cymru sut y gwnaeth Llywodraeth bartneriaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur wahaniaeth a pha mor effeithiol y bu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wrth ddatblygu polisiau a chanlyniadau pendant, o'i gymharu â'r sefyllfa cyn datganoli. Mae'r adroddiad

devolution situation. Not only does the report list achievements, which is important, it also provides signposts for our future direction. The abolition of key stage 1 testing in schools is key. Many teachers and headteachers to whom I have spoken say that standard assessment tests at key stage 2 must also be abolished. I hope that we can build on our achievements to date and move on to a different agenda during the next Assembly term. Reducing the burdens faced by teachers should be part of that agenda.

As Peter Law and others have said, we must acknowledge that it is the amount of money that we received in the comprehensive spending review that has made some programmes possible. No one can deny that. What is important is how that money is spent. We could have sent it back, like John Redwood did, or we could have spent it differently. We have used the money to implement a series of distinctive policies by investing in schools and the national health service. *[Interruption.]* I feel as if I am visiting a school now, as the naughty schoolchildren on my right-hand side refuse to shut up while I am trying to speak.

**Nick Bourne** *rose—*

**Peter Black:** Go to the back of the class, Nicky. *[Laughter.]*

**Nick Bourne** *rose—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter Black is not giving way.

**Peter Black:** We have invested money in schools and hospitals and in policies such as free home care for the elderly and the Assembly learning grant, which offers people new opportunities. I accept that an opposition party's role is to highlight issues that it feels are important. However, as the First Minister said, some claims made in amendment 2 cannot be proved. Amendment 2 claims that the GDP gap between Wales and the rest of the UK is widening. Where is the evidence of that? There is none.

**Alun Cairns and Ieuan Wyn Jones** *rose—*

nid yn unig yn rhestru cyflawniadau, sy'n bwysig, mae hefyd yn gosod arwyddbyst ar gyfer ein cyfeiriad yn y dyfodol. Mae diddymu profion cyfnod allweddol 1 mewn ysgolion yn allweddol. Dywed llawer o athrawon a phenaethiaid y siaradais â hwy fod yn rhaid i brofion asesu safonol yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 gael eu diddymu hefyd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn adeiladu ar ein cyflawniadau hyd yma a symud ymlaen i agenda wahanol yn ystod tymor nesaf y Cynulliad. Dylai lleihau'r beichiau a wynebier gan athrawon fod yn rhan o'r agenda honno.

Fel y dywedodd Peter Law ac eraill, rhaid inni gydnabod mai swm yr arian a gawn yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant a wnaeth rhai o'r rhaglenni hyn yn bosibl. Ni all neb wadu hynny. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw'r modd y gwarir yr arian hwnnw. Gallem fod wedi ei ddychwelyd, fel y gwnaeth John Redwood, neu gallem fod wedi ei wario'n wahanol. Yr ydym wedi defnyddio'r arian i roi cyfres o bolisiau penodol ar waith drwy fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion a'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. *[Torri ar draws.]* Teimlaf fel pe bawn yn ymweld ag ysgol yn awr, gan fod y plant ysgol drwg ar y dde i mi yn gwrthod bod yn ddistaw wrth imi geisio siarad.

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd—*

**Peter Black:** Ewch i gefn y dosbarth, Nicky. *[Chwerthin.]*

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd—*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Peter Black am ildio.

**Peter Black:** Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi arian mewn ysgolion ac ysbytai ac mewn polisiau fel gofal cartref am ddim i'r henoed a grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, sy'n cynnig cyfleoedd newydd i bobl. Derbyniaf mai rôl gwrthblaid yw amlygu materion sy'n bwysig yn ei barn hi. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, ni ellir profi rhai honiadau a wnaed yng ngwelliant 2. Honna gwelliant 2 fod bwlch y CMC rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU yn lledu. Ble mae'r dystiolaeth o hynny? Nid oes tystiolaeth ar gael.

**Alun Cairns a Ieuan Wyn Jones** *a*

*gododd—*

**Peter Black:** I will not give way.

**Peter Black:** Nid ildiaf.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We are short of time, and Peter Black is about to wind up so he cannot give way.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydym yn brin o amser, ac mae Peter Black ar fin dirwyn i ben felly ni all ildio.

**Peter Black:** The money that has been invested is important, and the claim that the GDP gap between Wales and the rest of the UK is widening cannot be proved. The Conservatives have not bothered to table an amendment because they have nothing to say. They closed 70 hospitals while in government, they scrapped workforce planning and left a legacy of a national health service in ruins. If we are struggling to get to grips with the NHS now, it is because of the legacy that we inherited from the Conservatives.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r arian a fuddsoddwyd yn bwysig, ac ni ellir profi'r honiad bod bwlch y CMC rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU yn lledu. Nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr wedi trafferthu i gyflwyno gwelliant gan nad oes ganddynt unrhyw beth i'w ddweud. Caewyd 70 o ysbytai pan oeddent mewn grym, rhoddwyd y gorau i gynllunio gweithlu a gadawyd y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i fynd â'i ben iddo. Os ydym yn brwydro i fynd i'r afael â'r GIG yn awr, yr hyn a etifeddasom gan y Ceidwadwyr sy'n gyfrifol am hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** As a former manager in the voluntary sector and the deputy director of the Equal Opportunities Commission in Wales, I have considerable experience of preparing and evaluating annual reports. My understanding of best practice is that an annual report should remind its readers of last year's targets and demonstrate which ones have been met, or exceeded or have not been met. A good annual report should celebrate achievement but should also admit to challenges and problems and explain why targets have not been met. It should also say something about next year's plan, particularly how the current year's failed targets will be met.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fel cyn reolwr yn y sector gwirfoddol a dirprwy gyfarwyddwr y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal yng Nghymru, mae gennyf gryn brofiad o baratoi a gwerthuso adroddiadau blynyddol. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf o arferion gorau dylai adroddiad blynyddol atgoffa ei ddarllenwyr o dargedau'r flwyddyn cynt a dangos pa rai a gyrhaeddwyd, neu yr aethpwyd y tu hwnt iddynt neu nas cyrhaeddwyd. Dylai adroddiad blynyddol da ddathlu cyflawniad ond dylai hefyd gyfaddef i heriau a phroblemau ac esbonio pam na chyrrhaeddwyd targedau. Dylai hefyd ddweud rhywbeth am gynllun y flwyddyn nesaf, yn arbennig sut y caiff y targedau a fethwyd yn y flwyddyn gyfredol eu cyrraedd.

By those criteria, the report before us is barely an annual report and it certainly should not be welcomed. Therefore, I support amendments 1 and 2. Amendment 2 refers to the backlog of school building repairs. This so-called annual report does not refer to this. We will have a fuller picture of the seriousness of the situation when local authorities' asset management plans are ready. However, the Minister has acknowledged in Committee and in written answers that despite investment, the programme is behind schedule. Perhaps the First Minister should check his facts. This is

Yn ôl y meini prawf hynny, prin bod yr adroddiad ger ein bron yn adroddiad blynyddol ac yn sicr ni ddylid ei groesawu. Felly, cefnogaf welliannau 1 a 2. Cyfeiria gwelliant 2 at yr holl waith atgyweirio adeiladau ysgolion nas gwnaed. Nid yw'r adroddiad blynyddol fel y'i gelwir yn cyfeirio at hyn. Cawn ddarlun llawnach o ddifrifoldeb y sefyllfa pan fydd cynlluniau rheoli asedau awdurdodau lleol yn barod. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod mewn Pwyllgor ac mewn atebion ysgrifenedig bod y rhaglen, er gwaethaf buddsoddiad, ar ei hôl hi o ran yr amserlen. Efallai y dylai'r Prif

a serious matter, and a proper annual report would tell us how the Government proposed to address it, but there is not a word on this. No-one would deny that there have been significant achievements in education. However, as well as the school building programme, other significant targets are not being met, such as those for truancy and exclusion. Again, there is no mention of them.

5:10 p.m.

We are not told the whole story of some of the achievements that are mentioned in the report. There are concerns about the direction that ELWa is taking, particularly on the funding of informal learning. The Welsh Baccalaurate currently being piloted has been described as little more than AS Levels with compulsory community work. That is short of the original, ambitious, visionary scheme. Many teachers would tell the First Minister that if he wants to make Wales an outstanding place in which to teach and learn, then he had better persuade the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to do something about paperwork burdens and stop messing around at the edge of the problem. As Ieuan Wyn Jones mentioned, the Assembly learning grants are good news, but because of this Government's failure to negotiate proper benefit disregards, they are useless to the poorest potential students, particularly those with families.

The First Minister would accuse us of having an aversion to good news and I reject that. I know spin when I hear it—that is what is before us today. This is not a meaningful, serious annual report, but a load of smug, self-congratulatory spin. I urge the Assembly to challenge the Government instead of patting it on its back. Before we lose all grasp on reality, support amendments 1 and 2.

**The First Minister:** It would take me at least 30 minutes to deal with every point raised today by the 15 speakers in this lively debate.

Weinidog gadarnhau ei ffeithiau. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol a byddai adroddiad blynyddol priodol yn dweud wrthym sut yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ymdrin â hyn, ond nid oes gair am hyn. Ni fyddai neb yn gwadu y bu cyflawniadau sylweddol mewn addysg. Fodd bynnag, yn ogystal â'r rhaglen adeiladu ysgolion, nid yw targedau sylweddol eraill yn cael eu cyrraedd, megis y rhai ar gyfer triwantiaeth a gwaharddiadau. Unwaith eto, nid oes sôn amdanynt.

Ni chawn wybod holl fanylion rhai o'r cyflawniadau a grybwyllir yn yr adroddiad. Ceir pryderon ynghylch y cyfeiriad y mae ELWa yn ei gymryd, yn arbennig o ran ariannu dysgu anffurfiol. Disgrifiwyd y Fagloriaeth Gymreig a gyflwynir ar hyn o bryd mewn cynllun peilot fel rhywbeth nad yw'n llawer mwy na chwrs Safon Uwch Gyfrannol â gwaith cymunedol gorfodol. Nid yw hyn cystal â'r hyn a ddisgwyliwyd o'r cynllun gwreiddiol, uchelgeisiol a gweledigaethol. Byddai llawer o athrawon yn dweud wrth y Prif Weinidog y byddai'n well iddo ddarbwylo'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i wneud rhywbeth am feichiau gwaith papur a rhoi'r gorau i osgoi'r broblem wirioneddol, os yw am wneud Cymru yn lle rhagorol i addysgu a dysgu ynddo. Fel y soniodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, mae grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn newyddion da, ond oherwydd methiant y Llywodraeth hon i negodi anwybyddiad budd-daliadau priodol, maent yn ddi-werth i'r darpar fyfyrwyr tlotaf, yn arbennig y rhai sydd â theuluoedd.

Byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn ein cyhuddo o fethu â dioddef clywed newyddion da a gwrthodaf hynny. Gwn beth yw sbin pan glywaf ef—dyna'r hyn sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Nid adroddiad blynyddol ystyrlon, difrifol yw hwn, ond llwyth o sbin hunanfoddhaus, hunanglodforus. Anogaf y Cynulliad i herio'r Llywodraeth yn hytrach na'i chanmol. Cyn inni gollu pob gafael ar realiti, cefnogwch welliannau 1 a 2.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddai'n cymryd o leiaf 30 munud i ddelio â phob pwynt a godwyd heddiw gan y 15 siaradwr yn y ddadl fywiog hon.

On points raised about the NHS, Dai Lloyd stated that we were not doing enough to extend the capacity to treat people in the NHS. I did not raise this today because I did so yesterday during questions to the First Minister. There has been an 89 per cent increase in the intake of medical students in Wales since 1999. That target will be reached by 2005-06. Eighty-nine per cent is a big increase. Questions have been asked about the waiting lists and how they relate to the treatment of people in the NHS. Eighty-five per cent of people waiting in accident and emergency departments are seen within one hour—

**Brian Hancock** *rose*—

**The First Minister:** I am sorry Brian, I cannot allow an intervention because I only have four and half minutes in which to speak.

That is one of the best figures in the UK. On out-patient waiting lists, 40 per cent of people get an appointment within three months and over two-thirds within 6 months. Sixty per cent of people receive in-patient treatment within three months and 85 per cent within 12 months. That is against a background of an increasingly frail and ageing population. The average bed stays in hospital are getting longer and bed occupancy is getting tighter every year. People who work in the health service are dealing with these pressures and are doing so brilliantly. We are extending capacity with an increase in the number of nurses, doctors, physiotherapists and other professions allied to medicine. However, there is no pay-off in terms of a normal political expectation. We are doing this because it is the only way to address the problem of the NHS super tanker.

Nick Bourne was sniffy about education. There is no basis for that. Teacher morale in Wales is as good, or better, than any other part of the UK. Similarly the higher education research ratings were good across the board. Welsh universities climbed up the table. We have offered them incentives by giving them an extra £6 million to reward

O ran pwyntiau a godwyd am y GIG, dywedodd Dai Lloyd nad oeddem yn gwneud digon i ymestyn y capasiti i drin pobl yn y GIG. Ni chodais hyn heddiw oherwydd gwneuthum hynny ddoe yn ystod y sesiwn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. Bu cynnydd o 89 y cant yn nifer y myfyrwyr meddygol a dderbyniwyd yng Nghymru ers 1999. Caiff y targed hwnnw ei gyrraedd erbyn 2005-06. Mae 89 y cant yn gynnydd mawr. Gofynnwyd cwestiynau am y rhestrau aros a'r modd y maent yn berthnasol i driniaeth pobl yn y GIG. Gwelir 85 y cant o bobl sy'n aros mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys o fewn awr—

**Brian Hancock** *a gododd*—

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Brian, ni allaf ganiatáu ymyriad gan mai dim ond pedair munud a hanner sydd gennyf i siarad.

Mae hwn yn un o'r ffigurau gorau yn y DU. O ran rhestrau aros cleifion allanol, caiff 40 y cant o bobl apwyntiad o fewn tri mis a thros ddwy ran o dair o fewn chwe mis. Caiff 60 y cant o bobl driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol o fewn tri mis ac 85 y cant o fewn 12 mis. Mae hynny yn erbyn cefndir o boblogaeth fwyfwy oedrannus a bregus. Mae arhosiad claf mewn ysbyty ar gyfartaledd yn mynd yn hwy ac mae'r defnydd o welyau yn dwysáu bob blwyddyn. Mae pobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn delio â'r pwysau hyn ac yn gwneud hynny'n rhagorol. Yr ydym yn ymestyn capasiti drwy gynyddu nifer y nyrsys, meddygon, ffisiotherapyddion a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth. Fodd bynnag, nid oes unrhyw fantais o ran disgwyliad gwleidyddol arferol. Gwnawn hyn gan mai dyma'r unig ffordd o ymdrin â phroblem *super tanker* y GIG.

Yr oedd Nick Bourne yn ddirmygus ynghylch addysg. Nid oes sail dros hynny. Mae morâl athrawon yng Nghymru cystal os nad gwell, nag unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. Yn yr un modd yr oedd yr amcangyfrifon ymchwil addysg uwch yn dda yn gyffredinol. Cododd prifysgolion Cymru yn y tabl. Yr ydym wedi cynnig cymhellion iddynt drwy roi £6 miliwn

them for their good work and to encourage them to climb onto the next rung of the ladder.

I particularly commend Janice Gregory's speech. She made points about her constituency and about partnerships, and more than one partnership is involved here. There is a partnership with Westminster and it is true that it would have been impossible for us to fund the introduction of free entry to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales without the change in the VAT rules that Gordon Brown introduced, after lengthy negotiations with the then Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport, Chris Smith. I was also pleased to hear what Janice said about the MRI scanner and Caerau community association, because we aim to empower the poorest communities to raise themselves up by their bootstraps. We give them that opportunity through Communities First.

On Pauline Jarman's points about bus passes, of course there is a partnership with the local authorities—all of them. We negotiated the scheme and all authorities signed up to it. It was done in conjunction with the Welsh Local Government Association, of which Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council is a member. In this year's budget, which Edwina announced only a week or so ago, there will be additional funding because the scheme is more popular than anyone had anticipated. That is all to the good, because it contributes to sustainable development. All authorities signed up to the scheme. Some may have found that demand was particularly high in their areas. If a change in the formula can be agreed with the WLGA to accommodate particular authorities, we will do that. Pauline should not be churlish about it; all her complaints have been dealt with.

Finally, on the economy, I can only say to Ieuan Wyn and Alun Cairns that I do not know what the English language means when it is in their care. Alun said that we are poorer now than we have been for generations. I do not know what they taught you in Ysgol Gyfun Ystalyfera, but when your party was in

ychwanegol iddynt yn wobwr am eu gwaith da a'u hannog i ddringo ar ris nesaf yr ysgol.

Canmolaf araith Janice Gregory yn arbennig. Gwnaeth bwyntiau am ei hetholaeth ac am bartneriaethau, ac mae hyn yn cynnwys mwy nag un bartneriaeth. Ceir partneriaeth â San Steffan ac mae'n wir y byddai wedi bod yn amhosibl i ni ariannu'r gwaith o gyflwyno mynediad am ddim i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru heb y newid yn y rheolau TAW a gyflwynodd Gordon Brown ar ôl negodiadau hirfaith â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ar y pryd, Chris Smith. Yr oeddwn yn falch hefyd o glywed yr hyn a ddywedodd Janice am y sganiwr MRI a chymdeithas gymunedol Caerau, oherwydd anelwn am rymuso'r cymunedau tlotaf i godi eu hunain gerfydd eu careiau esgidiau eu hunain. Rhoddwn y cyfle hwnnw iddynt drwy Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

O ran pwyntiau Pauline Jarman am docynnau bws, wrth gwrs mae partneriaeth â'r awdurdodau lleol—pob un ohonynt. Negodwyd y cynllun gennym ac ymrwymodd pob awdurdod iddo. Fe'i gwnaed ar y cyd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, y mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn aelod ohoni. Yng nghyllideb eleni, a gyhoeddodd Edwina ddim ond wythnos neu ddwy yn ôl, bydd arian ychwanegol ar gael gan fod y cynllun yn fwy poblogaidd na'r disgwyl. Gorau oll yw hyn, oherwydd mae'n cyfrannu at ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Ymrwymodd pob awdurdod i'r cynllun. Efallai y canfu rhai fod y galw yn arbennig o uchel yn eu hardaloedd hwy. Os gellir cytuno ar newid yn y fformiwla gyda CLILC i gynnwys awdurdodau penodol, gwnawn hynny. Ni ddylai Pauline fod yn sarrug ynghylch hyn; ymdriniwyd â phob un o'i chwynion.

I gloi, soniaf am yr economi. Yr unig beth y gallaf ei ddweud wrth Ieuan Wyn ac Alun Cairns yw na wn i beth yw ystyr yr iaith Saesneg pan fydd yn eu gofal. Dywedodd Alun ein bod yn dlotach yn awr nag y buom ers cenedlaethau. Ni wn beth a ddysgwyd i chi yn Ysgol Gyfun Ystalyfera, ond pan oedd



power, there were 150,000 unemployed people in Wales; now there are 47,500. Your statement is absurd. I ask Members to reject the amendments.

eich plaid chi mewn grym, yr oedd 150,000 o bobl ddi-waith yng Nghymru; erbyn hyn 47,500 sy'n ddi-waith. Mae eich datganiad yn wirion. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau wrthod y gwelliannau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 2: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1191): O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.  
 Motion (NDM1191): For 28, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth Peter Law i'r Gadair am 5.18 p.m.  
 Peter Law took the Chair at 5.18 p.m.*

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Mae'r Rheol 20 Diwrnod yn Lladd Ffermio a Marchnadoedd Da Byw a Rhaid ei Dileu—Nawr The 20-Day Rule is Killing Farming and Livestock Auctions and Must Go—Now

**Peter Rogers:** First, I declare an interest as a farmer.

I remember meeting a large number of representatives of rural businesses outside the Chamber last year. They were representatives of canoeing centres, climbing centres, craft shops and riding centres from mid Wales whose businesses had been devastated by foot and mouth disease and who were in financial difficulties. Remembering what happened to them, I would be a complete idiot to choose this topic for debate if I did not have real evidence that the 20-day rule is causing havoc to our industry. The rule is not proportionate to the risk.

Why does this rule cause such economic devastation to agriculture and the livestock auction industry? I know the full consequences of foot and mouth disease, as do all those present in the public gallery. I witnessed the previous outbreaks of foot and mouth disease in Cheshire and Shropshire, and I well remember that fathers of friends of mine went to their graves early because of the devastation of seeing their animals slaughtered and burned on pyres.

Last year, my neighbour in Anglesey was the first farmer in Wales to have stock diagnosed as having foot and mouth disease. That resulted in the most appalling slaughter of animals on the island. Our farm was affected in the contiguous cull. We were lucky in that my wife and daughter-in-law were sent away the night before to avoid the sight of the slaughter. I still remember them ringing up that night to ask whether the pet lambs had been bottle-fed. The next morning, I had to hold those newly-born lambs while the vet injected them and they took their last few breaths. We watched over 500 lambs die. I assure you that I, like everybody else, never want to witness—or take any chance of witnessing—that again. We need a

**Peter Rogers:** Yn gyntaf, datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwr.

Cofiaf gyfarfod â nifer fawr o gynrychiolwyr busnesau gwledig y tu allan i'r Siambr y llynedd. Cynrychiolwyr oeddent o ganolfannau canŵio, canolfannau dringo, siopau crefftiau a chanolfannau merlota o'r canolbarth y dinistriwyd eu busnesau gan glwy'r traed a'r genau ac a oedd mewn trafferthion ariannol. Gan gofio'r hyn a ddigwyddodd iddynt, byddwn yn ffwl llwyr i ddewis y pwn hwn ar gyfer dadl oni bai fod tystiolaeth wirioneddol gennyf fod y rheol 20 diwrnod yn achosi dinistr i'n diwydiant. Nid yw'r rheol yn gymesur â'r risg.

Pam y mae'r rheol hon yn achosi cymaint o ddifrod economaidd i amaethyddiaeth a'r diwydiant marchnadoedd da byw? Gwn am effeithiau llawn clwy'r traed a'r genau, fel y gŵyr pawb sy'n bresennol yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. Gwelais effaith yr achosion blaenorol o glwy'r traed a'r genau yn Swydd Gaerlleon a Swydd Amwythig, a chofiaf yn dda fod tadau ffrindiau imi wedi mynd i'w beddau'n annhymig o ganlyniad i weld eu hanifeiliaid yn cael eu lladd a'u llosgi ar goelcerthi.

Y llynedd, fy nghymydog yn Ynys Môn oedd y ffermwr cyntaf yng Nghymru y canfuwyd bod ei anifeiliaid yn dioddef o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Arweiniodd hynny at ladd anifeiliaid ar yr ynys yn y modd mwyaf arswydus. Effeithiwyd ar ein fferm ni yn ystod y difa ar ffermydd cyffiniol. Yr oeddem yn ffodus oherwydd anfonwyd fy ngwraig a'm merch-yng-nghyfraith i ffwrdd y noson cynt er mwyn iddynt osgoi gweld y lladd. Yr wyf yn eu cofio yn ffonio'r noson honno yn gofyn a oedd eu hŵyn anwes wedi cael eu bwydo â photel. Fore trannoeth, gorfu imi ddal yr ŵyn newydd-anedig hynny wrth i'r milfeddyg eu chwistrellu wrth iddynt gymryd eu hanadl olaf. Gwelsom dros 500 o ŵyn yn marw. Fe'ch sicrhaf nad wyf i, na neb arall,

contingency plan to prevent such devastation, which is why I am determined to use measured and constructive reasoning today. The Government does not have any logical scientific evidence to continue such an ill-founded regulation as the 20-day rule. To keep it will cause chaos to the industry and will mean that livestock auctions will continue to close.

5:20 p.m.

I appreciate that businesses unrelated to agriculture were ruined because of foot and mouth disease, and it would be irresponsible of me to call for the removal of the 20-day rule if there was evidence that it would help prevent the spread of the disease, should it happen here again. However, that is not the case. North Wales was brought to a complete standstill last year because of one lamb arriving in a slaughter house. That infected lamb was trapped in the slaughter house, and there is no evidence that the infection escaped on other stock. The 20-day rule would not have helped to stop the devastation in north Wales, not one iota. None of the experts know how infection got out of that abattoir. There have been so many different theories about the virulence of the disease—talk of it spreading within 24 hours, and of it being carried along on the wind—yet there is no evidence of that and nothing makes sense. We do not know enough about the virus to follow this scientific route of using the 20-day rule.

The same people responsible for incompetence in trying to control foot and mouth disease are those who have now implemented the 20-day rule, with neither the understanding nor the scientific evidence to back it up. An immediate standstill across the United Kingdom from the determination of the first notifiable case would have had a far better result than the 20-day rule. That is what Europe did, which is why the disease was controlled in the Netherlands and in Ireland. We must have a contingency plan, so that if ever—God forbid—the disease strikes again, officials have a plan ready to stop the devastation.

am weld—na chreu'r posibilrwydd o weld—hynny eto. Mae angen cynllun wrth gefn arnom i atal dinistr o'r fath, a dyna pam yr wyf yn benderfynol o ddefnyddio ymresymiad mesuredig ac adeiladol heddiw. Nid oes tystiolaeth wyddonol resymegol gan y Llywodraeth dros barhau â rheol mor ddisail â'r rheol 20 diwrnod. Bydd ei chadw yn achosi anhrefn i'r diwydiant ac yn golygu y bydd marchnadoedd da byw yn parhau i gau.

Sylweddolaf y cafodd busnesau nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig ag amaethyddiaeth eu dinistrion gan glwy'r traed a'r genau, a byddwn yn anghyfrifol i alw am ddiddymu'r rheol 20 diwrnod pe bai tystiolaeth a fyddai'n helpu i atal y clwyf rhag lledaenu, pe bai'n digwydd yma eto. Fodd bynnag, nid fel yna y mae. Daeth y Gogledd i stop y llynedd oherwydd un oen a gyrhaeddodd ladd-dy. Yr oedd yr oen heintiedig hwnnw wedi ei ddal yn y lladd-dy, ac nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth fod yr haint wedi dianc i heintio anifeiliaid eraill. Ni fyddai'r rheol 20 diwrnod wedi bod o gymorth i ddod â'r dinistr i ben yng Nghymru, dim yr un mymryn. Ni wŷr yr un arbenigwr sut y dihangodd yr haint allan o'r lladd-dy hwnnw. Bu cymaint o ddamcaniaethau gwahanol am ffyrnigrwydd y clwyf—soniwyd amdano'n lledaenu o fewn 24 awr, ac amdano'n cael ei gludo gan y gwynt—eto nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth o hynny ac nid oes unrhyw beth yn gwneud synnwyr. Ni wyddom ddigon am y feirws i ddilyn y llwybr gwyddonol hwn, sef defnyddio'r rheol 20 diwrnod.

Yr un bobl anghymwys a oedd yn gyfrifol am geisio rheoli clwy'r traed a'r genau yw'r rhai hynny sydd yn awr yn ceisio gweithredu'r rheol 20 diwrnod, heb na'r ddealltwriaeth na'r dystiolaeth wyddonol i'w hategu. Byddai gwaharddiad llwyr ar symud anifeiliaid ledled y Deyrnas Unedig yn dilyn penderfynu ar yr achos hysbysadwy cyntaf a wedi cael canlyniad llawer gwell na'r rheol 20 diwrnod. Dyna a wnaed yn Ewrop, a dyna pam y rheolwyd y clwyf yn yr Iseldiroedd ac yn Iwerddon. Mae'n rhaid inni gael cynllun wrth gefn, fel bod cynllun yn barod gan swyddogion i atal y dinistr pe bai'r clwyf—Duw a'n gwaredo—yn taro eto.

If we don't understand the disease, we did not need to take the procedures that were followed in my area last year. We had vets who were not billeted on the island. The island was isolated, but we billeted veterinary surgeons across the water, so that they kept coming back to the farms. We had inspections every second day. For the people who were close to the infected cases it was a nightmare when those vets were handling stock and going through their feet, given orf, foot rot, and other complaints. I remember them holding a lamb for half an hour, and by the grace of goodness they did not bring it down, otherwise the farm would have gone down as having foot and mouth disease. They did not understand what they were looking for. That was the problem. We must have better training, and people who understand those viruses so that action can be taken. We cannot carry on with this 20-day rule.

The Northumberland report had all the answers, and detailed the necessary action to take. Anglesey farmers asked for road closures as soon as the disease arrived, but no-one responded. The problem with putting in place a blanket 20-day rule that is not enforceable, is that it is a waste of time and money. We did not demonstrate urgency, and we must learn from that. The experts and stakeholders going to meetings in London to discuss easing the 20-day rule say that they are considering models of what the 20-day rule would result in in the next outbreak. They should not consider models of this 20-day rule. They should consider models of what would have happened had we put an immediate standstill in place across the country.

Having a contingency plan available must be our first defence. Work should be done on that. The 20-day rule is littered with anomalies. For example, how can you have a border in Scotland, in Dumfriesshire, where a 5-day or a 6-day rule has been accepted? We do not have any natural barriers there, so that

Os nad ydym yn deall y clwyf, nid oedd angen inni gymryd y camau a ddilynwyd yn fy ardal i y llynedd. Yr oedd gennym filfeddygon nad oeddynt yn lletya ar yr ynys. Yr oedd yr ynys wedi ei hynysu, ond rhoddwyd milfeddygon mewn llety ar draws y dŵr, ac felly yr oeddynt yn parhau i ddychwelyd i'r ffermydd. Cawsom archwiliadau bob yn ail ddiwrnod. Yr oedd yn hunllef i'r bobl a oedd yn agos i'r achosion o haint pan oedd y milfeddygon hynny yn ymdrin â stoc ac yn archwilio eu traed, o gofio am orff, clwy'r traed, ac afiechydon eraill. Cofiaf iddynt ddal oen am hanner awr, a thrwy ras Duw ni ddywedwyd bod yr oen yn dioddef o'r clwyf neu byddent wedi datgan bod y fferm gyfan wedi'i heintio â chlwy'r traed a'r genau. Nid oeddynt yn deall yr hyn yr oeddynt yn chwilio amdano. Dyna oedd y broblem. Mae'n rhaid wrth well hyfforddiant, a phobl sy'n deall y feirysau hynny fel y gellir cymryd camau gweithredu. Ni allwn barhau â'r rheol 20 diwrnod hon.

Yr oedd adroddiad Northumberland yn cynnwys yr atebion i gyd, a rhoddodd fanylion am y camau angenrheidiol y mae angen eu cymryd. Gofynnodd ffermwyr Ynys Môn am i'r ffyrdd gael eu cau cyn gynted ag y cyrhaeddodd y clwyf, ond nid ymatebodd unrhyw un. Y broblem gyda rhoi rheol 20 diwrnod gyffredinol na ellir ei gorfodi ar waith, yw ei bod yn wastraff amser ac arian. Ni fuom yn ddigon cyflym, ac mae'n rhaid inni ddysgu gwersi o hynny. Dywed yr arbenigwyr a'r rhanddeiliaid sy'n mynd i gyfarfodydd yn Llundain i drafod lleihau'r rheol 20 diwrnod eu bod yn ystyried enghreifftiau o ganlyniadau'r rheol 20 diwrnod yn ystod yr achosion nesaf o'r clwyf. Ni ddylent ystyried enghreifftiau o'r rheol 20 diwrnod hon. Dylent ystyried enghreifftiau o'r hyn a fyddai wedi digwydd pe byddem wedi rhoi gwaharddiad ar symud anifeiliaid ar waith ledled y wlad.

Rhaid sicrhau mai ein hamddiffyniad cyntaf yw cael cynllun wrth gefn. Dylid gwneud gwaith ar hynny. Mae'r rheol 20 diwrnod yn frith o anghysondebau. Er enghraifft, sut y gallwch gael ffin yn yr Alban, yn Swydd Dumfries, lle y derbyniwyd rheol 5 diwrnod neu 6 diwrnod? Nid oes gennym unrhyw

does not make sense. I bet that none of the stakeholders who agreed in September to lessen the 20-day rule were aware of allowing 20,000 and 30,000 sheep—120 farmers were probably involved—to be brought down from commons onto holdings and taken to the sales, not subject to the 20-day rule. It is laughable. Lord Whitty cannot understand that, nor can any stakeholders. I do not understand either why show animals should be subject to different regulations than animals that have been to the sales.

This rule is killing auctions. There are pickets in Ireland due to problems with the price of beef. Ireland does not have the benefit of an auction system to set a price. If somebody does not stand up against the 20-day rule, these farmers and lamb farmers will be bitten down on their price. We must take this forward now. The 20-day rule must be abolished, and we must have a greater understanding. We are more responsible. We have a hygiene and disinfecting programme now, which should never be destroyed. However, we must have movement of animals.

The Government—and Carwyn was responsible for this—was determined to end livestock auctions. If you do not have the right to take an animal home from an auction and must let it go for whatever price you can get, that is not an auction. It will be the end. Let us start putting money into airports and ports and provide sniffer dogs, as Australia, New Zealand and America do. Let us start to appreciate our industry. Some 30,000 licences were issued this month. It is a bureaucratic nightmare. Nobody understands them. I praise the people who have come to the Assembly today to support this short debate, and I ask the rest of the farmers in Wales to stand up and start to lobby to break up this 20-day rule. Let us be responsible people, and ensure that we have plans to counteract any future outbreak of foot and mouth disease. [*Applause.*]

rwystrau naturiol yno, felly nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr. Mentraf ddweud nad oedd unrhyw un o'r rhanddeiliaid a gytunodd ym mis Medi i leihau'r rheol 20 diwrnod yn ymwybodol eu bod yn caniatáu i 20,000 a 30,000 o ddefaid—yr oedd 120 o ffermwyr yn rhan o'r broses mae'n debyg—gael eu cludo o dir comin i ddeiliadaethau a'u cludo i farchnadoedd, nad oeddent yn rhwym wrth y rheol 20 diwrnod. Mae'n chwerthinlyd. Ni all yr Arglwydd Whitty ddeall hynny, ac ni all unrhyw randdeiliaid ychwaith. Ni allaf ddeall ychwaith pam y dylai anifeiliaid sioe fod yn agored i reoliadau sy'n wahanol i reoliadau anifeiliaid sydd wedi bod i'r farchnad.

Mae'r rheol hon yn difetha marchnadoedd. Ceir picedi yn Iwerddon oherwydd y problemau gyda phris cig eidion. Nid oes gan Iwerddon y fantais o gael system arwerthu mewn marchnad i bennu pris. Os na fydd rhywun yn gwneud safiad yn erbyn y rheol 20 diwrnod, caiff prisiau'r ffermwyr hyn a ffermwyr cig oen eu lleihau. Mae'n rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen â hyn yn awr. Rhaid diddymu'r rheol 20 diwrnod hon, a rhaid inni feddu ar ragor o ddealltwriaeth. Yr ydym yn fwy cyfrifol. Mae gennym raglen hylendid a diheintio yn awr, na ddylid ei dinistrio byth. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni allu symud anifeiliaid.

Yr oedd y Llywodraeth—a Charwyn oedd yn gyfrifol am hyn—yn benderfynol o roi terfyn ar farchnadoedd da byw. Os nad oes hawl gennych i fynd ag anifail adref o farchnad ac mae'n rhaid ichi ei werthu am ba bris bynnag y gallwch ei gael, nid marchnad yw hynny. Y diwedd fydd hynny. Gadewch inni ddechrau buddsoddi arian mewn meysydd awyr a darparu cŵn synhwyro, fel y gwneir yn Awstralia, Seland Newydd ac America. Gadewch inni ddechrau gwerthfawrogi ein diwydiant. Cyhoeddwyd tua 30,000 o drwyddedau yn ystod y mis hwn. Mae'n hunllef fiwrocraidaidd. Nid oes unrhyw un yn eu deall. Canmolaf y bobl a ddaeth i'r Cynulliad heddiw i gefnogi'r ddadl fer hon, a gofynnaf i weddill ffermwyr Cymru wneud safiad a dechrau lobi er mwyn diddymu'r rheol 20 diwrnod hon. Gadewch inni fod yn bobl gyfrifol, a sicrhau bod gennym gynlluniau i wrthsefyll unrhyw achosion o

glwy'r traed a'r genau yn y dyfodol.  
[Cymeradwyaeth.]

5:30 p.m.

**Peter Law:** I call Rhodri Glyn Thomas.

**Peter Law:** Galwaf ar Rhodri Glyn Thomas.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch, Dirprwy Ddirprwy Lywydd. Llongyfarchiadau i chi ar eich dyrchafiad haeddiannol i'r sedd anrhydeddus honno.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Thank you, Deputy Deputy Presiding Officer. Congratulations on your deserved promotion to that honorable seat.

Diolchaf i Peter am ganiatáu ychydig o amser i mi ddweud gair neu ddau am y rheol 20 diwrnod. Credaf y gallwn ni i gyd ddeall, ym merw clwy'r traed a'r genau, pam y cyflwynwyd y rheol hon. Fodd bynnag, erbyn hyn rhaid i bawb dderbyn—a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn—wrth ystyried natur ein cymunedau gwledig a sut y caiff y diwydiant amaethyddol ei redeg, nad yw'n ymarferol cadw'r rheol hon bellach. Mae'n rhaid i ffermwyr symud anifeiliaid ar adegau arbennig, brynu anifeiliaid ar adegau arbennig, a'u gwerthu ar adegau arbennig. Nid yw'n ymarferol bosibl i weithio o gwmpas rheol 20 diwrnod. Y gwir amdani yw, Weinidog, os na chyflwynwch rhyw gymaint o hyblygrwydd i'r rheol 20 diwrnod—ac yr ydym i gyd am ddiogelu iechyd y cyhoedd, a sicrhau nad yw'r clefyd hwn yn ailymddangos—ni fydd modd i'r diwydiant amaethyddol weithredu yng Nghymru.

I thank Peter for allowing me some time to say a few words about the 20-day rule. I believe that we can all understand why, at the height of foot and mouth disease, this rule was introduced. However, by now everyone must accept—and I hope that the Minister will accept—that given the nature of our rural communities and how the agricultural industry is run, it is not practical to keep this rule. Farmers must move animals at certain times, must buy them at certain times, and must sell them at certain times. It is not practically possible to work around a 20-day rule. The truth is, Minister, that unless you introduce some flexibility into the 20-day rule—and we all want to safeguard public health and ensure that this disease does not reappear—the agricultural industry cannot operate in Wales.

Mae'r sefyllfa yn waeth yng Nghymru nag yn unrhyw ran arall o Brydain, oherwydd natur ein diwydiant amaethyddol. Erfyniaf arnoch, Weinidog, i wrando ar y diwydiant. Gwnewch bopeth i ddiogelu iechyd y cyhoedd ac i sicrhau nad yw'r clefyd hwn yn ailymddangos, ond er mwyn popeth, sicrhewch system sy'n caniatáu i amaethwyr amaethu yng Nghymru ac i'r diwydiant barhau.

The situation is worse in Wales than in any other part of Britain, because of the nature of our agricultural industry. I plead with you, Minister, to listen to the industry. Do everything possible to safeguard public health and to ensure that this disease does not reappear but, for goodness sake, ensure a system that allows farmers to farm in Wales and the industry to continue.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you, Peter, for choosing this topic. You showed great style in your presentation. I also thank all those who have lobbied on this issue for some time and those who organised the meeting last week in Brecon market, where Peter offered to choose this topic for debate.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch, Peter, am ddewis y pwnc hwn. Yr oedd eich cyflwyniad yn un medrus. Diolchaf hefyd i bawb sydd wedi llobio ar y mater hwn ers peth amser a'r bobl hynny a drefnodd y cyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf ym marchnad Aberhonddu, lle cynigiodd Peter ddewis y mater hwn i gynnal trafodaeth arno.

Many of us have suffered, and Peter outlined that suffering with great eloquence. That suffering was compounded by the unnecessary introduction of these draconian restrictions. If only the Westminster Government put the money it puts into these restrictive regulations into stopping illegal meat imports, all farmers would have some confidence in the restricting the spread of disease in future. What is so galling to everyone who has experienced these restrictions is that there is no disease in Wales at present. As the National Farmers Union has said on many occasions, this restriction is disproportionate to the risk.

Why on earth the vets at Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs the Minister, and the Secretary of State cannot see what they have done in implementing this is beyond belief. Staff in Wales have generally been in much closer contact with the industry—

Dioddefodd nifer ohonom, ac amlinellodd Peter y dioddefaint hwnnw yn huawdl iawn. Gwaethygyd y dioddefaint hwnnw drwy gyflwyno'r cyfyngiadau diangen llym hyn. Pe bai Llywodraeth San Steffan ond yn buddsoddi'r arian a werir ganddi ar y rheoliadau cyfyngol hyn i atal mewnfurion cig anghyfreithlon, byddai peth hyder gan bob ffermwr yn ein gallu i atal y clwyf rhag lledaenu yn y dyfodol. Yr hyn sy'n cythruddo bawb sydd â phrofiad o'r cyfyngiadau hyn yw nad oes clwyf yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Fel y dywedodd Undeb Cenedlaethol y Ffermwyr ar sawl achlysur, nid yw'r cyfyngiad yn gymesur â'r risg.

Pam na all milfeddygon Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, weld bod yr hyn a wnaethant wrth weithredu hyn y tu hwnt i bob dirnadaeth. Bu staff yng Nghymru mewn cysylltiad llawer agosach ar y cyfan â'r diwydiant—

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 5.33 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.33 p.m.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have run out of time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I thank Peter for giving us the opportunity to debate this important issue today. I also welcome the National Farmers Union's latest ideas, produced in its 10-point petition.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Diolchaf i Peter am roi'r cyfle inni drafod y mater pwysig hwn heddiw. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu syniadau diweddaraf Undeb Cenedlaethol y Ffermwyr, a nodir yn ei ddeiseb 10 pwynt.

This is a vital issue for the long-term viability and security of the livestock sector, and its international reputation. However, it is also important to the wider rural community—to the nation as a whole, on whom a total cost of about £8 billion fell—and to the health and welfare of animals themselves, over 1 million of which were slaughtered in Wales during the last outbreak. I recognise the difficulties posed by the current set of movement controls. I have seen some at first hand, I have discussed them directly with farmers and market operators, and I have also taken representations from key stakeholders. My officials and I remain in close touch with

Mae hwn yn fater allweddol ar gyfer hyfywedd a diogelwch hirdymor y sector da byw, a'i enw rhyngwladol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig hefyd i'r gymuned wledig ehangach—i'r genedl gyfan, y gorfu iddi dalu cyfanswm costau o tua £8 biliwn—ac i iechyd a lles yr anifeiliaid eu hunain, y lladdwyd dros 1 filiwn ohonynt yng Nghymru yn ystod yr achosion diwethaf o'r clwyf. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr anawsterau a grëir gan y cyfyngiadau presennol ar symud. Gwelais rai ohonynt â'm llygaid fy hun, a thrafodais hwy yn uniongyrchol â ffermwyr a rheolwyr marchnad, a derbyniais sylwadau hefyd gan randdeiliaid allweddol. Mae fy



DEFRA Ministers and officials, and with the industry itself.

From the outset, central and devolved Governments worked closely with the industry to develop an effective and practicable regime that was consistent with the veterinary and scientific advice available. The quality of that incurrent, professional advice is widely accepted and it is clear, firm and consistent. I will repeat the advice that I was given today by the Chief Veterinary Officer for Wales. He stated that the average incubation period for foot and mouth disease in cattle and sheep is around 10 days. That is the period between infection and the manifestation of clinical signs. Some cases will have a shorter period depending on the strain of the virus, the immune competence of the animal and the weight of the viral attack. Some will have a longer incubation period of up to 14 days, or even longer in exceptional circumstances. Ideally, therefore, the standstill period should be 28 days, twice the 14-day incubation period, to ensure that every possible case is catered for. However, since the average incubation time is 10 days, the 20-day rule will ensure that the vast majority of infections will have time to manifest themselves and be dealt with before the disease can spread further by animal movements. The 20-day standstill period balances the effective control of the disease and the effect on the industry. That is the veterinary advice that I have been given. That advice has also been endorsed by the Royal Society inquiry, chaired by Sir Brian Follett, and the lessons learned inquiry, chaired by Dr Iain Anderson. It is worth recording their publicly expressed conclusions. The Royal Society inquiry states that:

‘permanent standstill period arrangements for all livestock...would significantly decrease the chance of long-distance dissemination of the disease before it is detected. Indeed, it is highly unlikely that an epidemic of similar proportions to the 2001 epidemic would occur in the future if appropriate permanent standstill arrangements were in place.’

swyddogion a minnau yn parhau i fod mewn cysylltiad agos â Gweinidogion a swyddogion DEFRA, a chyda'r diwydiant ei hun.

O'r cychwyn cyntaf, bu'r Llywodraethau canolog a datganoledig yn gweithio'n agos â'r diwydiant i ddatblygu trefn effeithiol ac ymarferol a oedd yn gyson â'r cyngor milfeddygol a gwyddonol a oedd ar gael. Cydnabyddir ansawdd y cyngor mewnlifol, proffesiynol hwnnw yn gyffredinol ac mae'n glir, cadarn a chyson. Ailadroddaf y cyngor a roddwyd imi heddiw gan Brif Swyddog Milfeddygol Cymru. Dywedodd mai'r cyfnod inciwbeiddio cyfartalog ar gyfer clwy'r traed a'r genau mewn gwartheg a defaid yw tua 10 diwrnod. Dyna'r cyfnod rhwng heintio ac ymddangosiad yr arwyddion clinigol. Bydd rhai achosion â chyfnod byrrach gan ddibynnu ar hil y feirws, cymhwysiad imiwnedd yr anifail a grym yr ymosodiad feirol. Bydd gan rai gyfnod inciwbeiddio hwy o hyd at 14 diwrnod, neu hwy na hynny hyd yn oed mewn amgylchiadau eithriadol. Felly, yn ddelfrydol, dylai'r cyfnod cadw fod yn 28 diwrnod, sef dwywaith y cyfnod inciwbeiddio 14 diwrnod, er mwyn sicrhau bod darpariaeth ar gyfer pob math o achos. Fodd bynnag, gan mai'r amser inciwbeiddio yw 10 diwrnod ar gyfartaledd, bydd y rheol 20 diwrnod yn sicrhau amser i'r rhan fwyaf o heintiau eu hamlygu eu hunain ac y gellir ymdrin â hwy cyn i symudiadau anifeiliaid ledaenu'r clwyf ymhellach. Mae'r cyfnod cadw 20 diwrnod yn cydbwysu'r gallu i reoli'r clwyf yn effeithiol a'r effaith ar y diwydiant. Dyna'r cyngor milfeddygol a gefais. Ategwyd y cyngor hwnnw hefyd gan ymchwiliad y Gymdeithas Frenhinol, a gadeiriwyd gan Syr Brian Follett, a'r ymchwiliad gwersi a ddysgwyd, a gadeiriwyd gan Dr Iain Anderson. Mae'n werth cofnodi eu casgliadau a fynegwyd yn gyhoeddus: Dywed ymchwiliad y Gymdeithas Frenhinol:

byddai trefniadau cyfnod cadw parhaol ar gyfer yr holl dda byw...yn lleihau'n sylweddol y risg o ledaenu'r clefyd yn bell cyn iddo gael ei ddarganfod. Yn wir, y mae'n hynod annhebygol y byddai epidemig ar yr un raddfa ag epidemig 2001 yn digwydd yn y dyfodol pe bai trefniadau cyfnod cadw parhaol addas yn eu lle.

The lessons learned from the inquiry further state that:

‘the consequences of relaxing these restrictions could, in some circumstances, be devastating. A long-term solution to the problem of movement restrictions must strike an appropriate balance between the legitimate interests of the industry and the need for long term disease control.’

It concludes:

‘We recommend that the Government retain the 20-day movement restrictions pending a detailed risk assessment and wide ranging cost-benefit analysis.’

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that in Scotland proportionate measures have proved not to put livestock at risk? It is dealing with the reality, and not the myth of disease risk. [*Applause.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Michael German:** The veterinary advice that I have read to the Assembly today was also available to Ministers in Scotland. Our range of powers is much more limited, because all related powers have not been transferred to the Assembly. I will now move on to what we are doing now. Having received that advice, I need to inform you what is being done.

Extensive veterinary modelling work was undertaken prior to the introduction of the latest movement regime in September. I am conscious that the extent of that work is not yet accepted by some in the industry. I wish to highlight some key ingredients of that work. The modelling work considered a range of standstill periods, ranging from no standstill to standstill periods of six, 13 and 20 days, and a number of variants around those options. From a veterinary perspective, best practice should be a standstill period of around 28 days, as I have mentioned. The 20-day compromise was chosen in light of best biosecurity advice. Applying a theoretical, but representative range of animal

Dywed yr ymchwiliad ymhellach am y gwersi a ddysgwyd:

gallai canlyniadau lleihau'r cyfyngiadau hyn, dan rai amgylchiadau, fod yn andwyol. Dylai unrhyw ateb hirdymor i broblem cyfyngiadau ar symud anifeiliaid arwain at gydbwysedd priodol rhwng buddiannau dilys y diwydiant a'r angen i reoli'r clefyd yn yr hirdymor.

Daw i'r casgliad:

Argymhellwn fod y Llywodraeth yn cadw'r cyfyngiadau 20 diwrnod ar symudiadau nes y ceir asesiad manwl o risg a dadansoddiad pellgyrhaeddol o gost a budd.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunwch y profwyd nad yw mesurau cymesur wedi rhoi da byw mewn perygl yn yr Alban? Mae'n ymdrin â'r realiti, ac nid â'r myth ynghylch perygl y clwyf. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Michael German:** Yr oedd y cyngor milfeddygol a ddarllenais i'r Cynulliad heddiw hefyd ar gael i Weinidogion yn yr Alban. Mae ystod ein pwerau yn llawer mwy cyfyngedig, gan nad yw pob pŵer cysylltiedig wedi ei drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad. Symudaf ymlaen yn awr at yr hyn a wnawn ar hyn o bryd. Ar ôl derbyn y cyngor hwnnw, mae angen imi eich hysbysu am yr hyn a wneir.

Cynhaliwyd gwaith modelu milfeddygol helaeth cyn cyflwyno'r drefn symud ddiweddaraf ym mis Medi. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol na dderbynnir hyd a lled y gwaith hwnnw eto gan rai yn y diwydiant. Dymunaf amlygu rai elfennau allweddol o'r gwaith hwnnw. Ystyriodd y gwaith modelu amrywiaeth o gyfnodau cadw, yn amrywio o ddim cyfnod cadw hyd at chwech, 13 ac 20 diwrnod, a nifer o amrywiaethau o amgylch yr opsiynau hynny. O safbwynt milfeddygol, yr arfer gorau ddylai fod cyfnod cadw o tua 28 diwrnod, fel y soniais. Detholwyd y cyfaddawd 20 diwrnod yng ngoleuni'r cyngor bioddiogelwch gorau. Mae cymhwyso amrywiaeth damcaniaethol, ond

movements over a month illustrates that in the event of a disease outbreak, having a 20-day standstill in place would mean that 20 farms might be infected. A 13-day standstill would mean that 60 farms might be affected and under a 6-day standstill, 120 farms. The current regime reflects the conclusions of that work.

5:40 p.m.

Some argue that movement restrictions would be unnecessary if animal movements could be traced via animal identification. I agree that identification has a role to play, and improvements are in hand or planned. However, reliance on identification alone will not suffice because few, if any, tracing systems operate in real time. However, the disease does. It also takes valuable time and human resources to trace animal movements, while the disease continues to spread by other means, including mechanical means. Therefore, on the current available evidence and before the full risk assessments have been conducted, returning to a position where no movement controls were in place or we rely on other mechanisms would entail an unacceptable level of risk. It is implausible that any government or mechanism would be able to guarantee freedom from illegal imports, however small, however—

**Glyn Davies** *rose*—

**Michael German:** I will give way when I have finished this section.

—however good the enforcement arrangements or infrequent the risk may be. I am pleased, however, to note that the changes that are being carried out on controls are operating proportionately and consistently across the country and in tandem with other biosecurity measures. We will need to reassess matters following the results of the risk assessment and cost benefit analysis currently underway. Before I take Glyn's intervention, I inform the Assembly of the

cynrychioladol, o symudiadau anifeiliaid dros fis yn dangos y byddai gweithredu cyfnod cadw o 20 diwrnod, pe bai achosion o'r clwyf yn dod i'r amlwg, yn golygu y gellid effeithio ar 20 o ffermydd. Byddai cyfnod cadw 13 diwrnod yn golygu y gellid effeithio ar 60 o ffermydd a 120 o ffermydd o dan gyfnod cadw 6 diwrnod. Mae'r drefn bresennol yn adlewyrchu casgliadau'r gwaith hwnnw.

Dadleua rhai na fyddai angen cyfyngu ar symudiadau pe gellid olrhain symudiadau anifeiliaid drwy nodi anifeiliaid. Cytunaf fod gan y broses o nodi anifeiliaid rôl i'w chwarae, ac mae gwelliannau ar y gweill neu wedi eu cynllunio. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd dibynnu ar nodi anifeiliaid ynddo'i hun yn ddigon, gan mai ychydig iawn o systemau olrhain, os o gwbl, sy'n gweithredu mewn amser real. Fodd bynnag, mae'r clwyf yn gwneud hynny. Mae hefyd yn cymryd amser ac adnoddau dynol gwerthfawr i olrhain symudiadau anifeiliaid, tra bod y clwyf yn parhau i ledaenu drwy ddulliau eraill, gan gynnwys dulliau mecanyddol. Felly, yn ôl y dystiolaeth sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd a chyn y cynhelir yr asesiadau risgiau llawn, byddai dychwelyd i sefyllfa lle nad oedd unrhyw reolaethau symud ar waith neu lle y byddem yn dibynnu ar ddulliau eraill yn golygu lefel annerbyniol o risg. Mae'n annhebygol y byddai unrhyw lywodraeth neu system yn gallu gwarantu bod y wlad yn rhydd o fewnforion anghyfreithlon, waeth pa mor fach yr ydynt, waeth pa mor—

**Glyn Davies** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Ildiaf ar ôl imi orffen yr adran hon.

—waeth pa mor dda yw'r trefniadau gorfodi neu waeth pa mor anaml yw'r risg efallai. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch bod y newidiadau sy'n cael eu cynnal ar reolaethau yn gweithredu'n gymesur a chyson ledled y wlad ac yn cydweddu â mesurau bioddiogelwch eraill. Bydd angen inni ailasesu materion yn dilyn canlyniadau'r asesiad risgiau a'r dadansoddiad budd cost sy'n cael ei gynnal ar hyn o bryd. Cyn imi wrando ar ymyrraeth Glyn, hysbysaf y

three assessments that are being undertaken before any changes to the present system will take place. The first is an assessment of the risk of foot and mouth disease strains entering the United Kingdom and reaching susceptible livestock. This illegal imports risk assessment is currently underway. The second study will model the potential impact of such introductions of the virus into the UK and compare a range of variations to the 20-day standstill rule to see which would provide the best protection. Thirdly, and most importantly, given the issues that Peter raised, an economic assessment of the implications of the 20-day rule and its variations is currently underway. That will include the impact on livestock markets and the rural economy in general, as well as on the cattle and sheep sectors. Once completed, these works will be placed in the public domain.

**Glyn Davies:** Minister, you are the Member best placed to influence Lord Whitty and the Government to lift the 20-day rule. Will you tell us about, not only the various degrees of scientific evidence that you have, but also your view on the matter and what you will do to achieve what we want, namely getting rid of the 20-day rule?

**Michael German:** Those three assessments are not yet completed and I have not seen their conclusions. I would wish, as I am sure that the Assembly would, to see those conclusions before making a judgment, so that it can be made on the best scientific, veterinary and economic advice available. We need to see the assessments before making a decision because the current arrangements are temporary and new long-term arrangements are intended to be put in place early next year. The Anderson and Follett reports both recommended a detailed risk assessment and cost benefit analysis as the basis for any new arrangements. Work on these is in hand in collaboration with the industry. I have made it clear that these data and other information will be placed in the public domain. There will be, therefore, an opportunity to see those assessments. It is important that we do not jump to conclusions before the risk assessments are complete,

Cynulliad am y tri asesiad sy'n cael eu cynnal cyn y gwneir unrhyw newid i'r system bresennol. Y cyntaf yw asesiad o'r risg o hiliau clwy'r traed a'r genau yn dod i mewn i'r Deyrnas Unedig a chyrraedd da byw sy'n gallu cael y clwyf. Cynhelir yr asesiad risgiau o allforion anghyfreithlon hwn ar hyn o bryd. Bydd yr ail astudiaeth yn modelu effaith bosibl cyflwyno feirws o'r fath i'r DU ac yn cymharu ystod o amrywiaethau i'r rheol cadw 20 diwrnod er mwyn gweld pa un fyddai'n rhoi'r diogelwch gorau. Yn drydydd, ac yn bwysicaf, o gofio am y materion a gododd Peter, cynhelir asesiad economaidd ar hyn o bryd o oblygiadau'r rheol 20 diwrnod a'i hamrywiadau. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys yr effaith ar farchnadoedd da byw a'r economi wledig yn gyffredinol, yn ogystal â'r effaith ar y sectorau gwartheg a defaid. Unwaith y cânt eu cwblhau, bydd y cyhoedd yn gallu gweld yr astudiaethau hyn.

**Glyn Davies:** Weinidog, chi yw'r Aelod sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ddylanwadu ar yr Arglwydd Whitty a'r Llywodraeth i ddiddymu'r rheol 20 diwrnod. A ddywedwch wrthym, nid yn unig am hyd a lled y dystiolaeth wyddonol sydd gennych, ond hefyd eich barn ar y mater a'r hyn a wnewch i gyflawni'r hyn yr ydym ei angen, sef cael gwared ar y rheol 20 diwrnod.

**Michael German:** Ni chwblhawyd y tri asesiad hynny eto ac ni welais eu casgliadau. Byddwn yn dymuno, fel yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r Cynulliad yn dymuno, gweld y casgliadau hynny cyn gwneud penderfyniad, fel y gellir ei wneud ar sail y cyngor gwyddonol, milfeddygol ac economaidd gorau sydd ar gael. Mae angen inni weld yr asesiadau cyn gwneud penderfyniad gan mai trefniadau dros dro yw'r rhai presennol a bwriedir rhoi trefniadau hirdymor newydd ar waith ar ddechrau flwyddyn nesaf. Argymhellodd adroddiadau Anderson a Follett y dylid cynnal asesiad risg manwl a dadansoddiad budd cost fel sail ar gyfer unrhyw drefniadau newydd. Mae gwaith ar rhain yn mynd rhagddo ar y cyd â'r diwydiant. Gwneuthum yn eglur y byddai'r data hwn a gwybodaeth arall ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Felly, bydd cyfle i weld yr asesiadau hynny. Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn dod i gasgliadau yn rhy gyflym

especially given that the Royal Society inquiry recommended that we should consider them before making a judgment.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You said that this is a temporary measure and that you need to see the evidence of the assessments before you can make a judgment. Can you give us a timescale? How long will it take to collect that data, so that you can make that judgement? The industry and I have told you that the 20-day rule, as it stands, is unworkable when you consider normal farming practices. If you can give a timescale and tell us how long it will take you to make a judgment perhaps we will be in a better position to know when you will take action.

**Michael German:** The current regulations expire at the end of January. That timescale was set to allow these assessments to take place. The Royal Society inquiry kicked off these three assessment studies immediately. I understand that their conclusions will be available to Ministers by the end of November. I am cautious on that, as we in Wales do not have the capability to authorise these studies or the skills to identify the work behind them. They are being undertaken on our behalf through DEFRA. I expect these matters to be in the public domain by the end of the year and therefore open to debate.

The replacement for the current regime must take into account the assessed risks of foot and mouth disease entering the country and reaching susceptible livestock. It must also be based on a detailed comparison of the range of different movement options and an assessment of the wider economic impact on rural areas. These independent, thorough analyses will be the basis of any new arrangements.

I am aware that the present regime and the present revised scheme—it is a revised scheme—have caused difficulties. Despite the difficulties, which are particularly apparent at this time of year, the new movement arrangements are being widely

cyn y cwblheir yr asesiadau risg, yn enwedig o gofio bod ymchwiliad y Gymdeithas Frenhinol wedi argymhell y dylid eu hystyried cyn gwneud penderfyniad.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dywedasoeh mai mesur dros dro yw hwn a bod angen ichi weld tystiolaeth o'r asesiadau hyn cyn y gallwch wneud penderfyniad. A allwch roi terfyn amser inni? Pa mor hir a gymer i gasglu'r data hwnnw, fel y gallwch wneud penderfyniad? Dywedodd y diwydiant a minnau wrthy ch nad yw'r rheol 20 diwrnod, fel ag y mae, yn ymarferol pan ystyriwch arferion ffermio arferol. Os gallwch roi terfyn amser a dweud wrthym pa mor hir a gymer ichi wneud penderfyniad efallai y byddwn mewn gwell sefyllfa i wybod pa bryd y byddwch yn gweithredu.

**Michael German:** Daw'r rheoliadau presennol i ben ar ddiwedd mis Ionawr. Pennwyd y terfyn amser hwnnw er mwyn galluogi'r asesiadau hynny i gael eu cynnal. Ysgogodd ymchwiliad y Gymdeithas Frenhinol y tair astudiaeth asesiad hynny ar unwaith. Deallaf y bydd eu casgliadau ar gael i Weinidogion erbyn diwedd mis Tachwedd. Yr wyf yn ansicr o hynny, gan nad yw'r gallu gennym yng Nghymru i awdurdodi'r astudiaethau hyn na'r sgiliau i nodi'r gwaith y tu cefn iddynt. Fe'u cynhelir ar ein rhan drwy gyfrwng DEFRA. Disgwyliaf y byddant ar gael i'r cyhoedd erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ac felly bydd modd cynnal dadl ar eu cynnwys.

Rhaid i'r drefn newydd ystyried y risgiau a aseswyd sy'n ymwneud â chlwy'r traed a'r genau yn dod i mewn i'r wlad a chyrraedd anifeiliaid a all gael y clwyf. Rhaid iddi hefyd fod yn seiliedig ar gymhariaeth fanwl o'r amrywiaeth o opsiynau symud gwahanol ac asesiad o'r effaith economaidd ehangach ar ardaloedd gwledig. Y dadansoddiadau annibynnol, trylwyr hyn fydd sail unrhyw drefniadau newydd.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y drefn bresennol a'r cynllun diwygiedig presennol—cynllun diwygiedig ydyw—wedi achosi anawsterau. Er gwaetha'r anawsterau, sy'n arbennig o amlwg yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, mae'r trefniadau newydd yn cael eu gweithredu gan

taken up by farmers. I am grateful to the farmers, market operators and others who have acted responsibly in adapting to the changes.

Following representations from the industry itself, significant relaxations were made for breeding animals in the arrangements introduced in September. Evidence to date suggests that the isolation facilities are working and that the uptake in Wales is better than might be expected. In England and Wales, around 2,800 breeding isolation facilities have been approved, and over 1,000 of these are in Wales.

As Peter rightly said, the total number of movement licences issued to date in Wales exceeds 30,000. Local authorities are working hard, especially in rural areas such as Powys, where 12,400 licences have been notified since 6 September.

**Peter Rogers:** You have been listening to evidence provided by different bodies. Given last year's trauma, do you have confidence in the people who are giving this evidence? If this were investigated, I think that we would find that some information provided at the time was unfounded and untrue. That is one of the problems we face. We must ensure common sense. There is not any common sense in the 20-day rule.

**Michael German:** The Follett and the Anderson reports made the recommendations that I outlined. A royal inquiry, or any other type of inquiry, may not provide the solutions that you want. I am afraid that, sometimes, you must accept that evidence may not accord with your own feelings, but is the best evidence that the country can provide.

I am grateful to the State Veterinary Service, the Meat and Livestock Commission and local authorities for their co-operative action in inspecting and enforcing the regime. I hope the farming community, and others, will continue to act responsibly. It is no-one's long-term interest for the regime to be challenged or compromised by non-

y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r ffermwyr, gweithredwyr marchnad ac eraill a weithredodd yn gyfrifol wrth addasu i'r newidiadau.

Yn dilyn sylwadau gan y diwydiant ei hun, llaciwyd y cyfyngiadau ar anifeiliaid bridio yn sylweddol yn y trefniadau a gyflwynwyd ym mis Medi. Awgryma'r dystiolaeth hyd yma fod y cyfleusterau ynysu yn gweithio a bod nifer y rhai sy'n rhan o'r cynllun yng Nghymru yn well na'r disgwyl. Yng Nghymru a Lloegr, cymeradwywyd tua 2,800 o gyfleusterau ynysu ar gyfer bridio, ac mae dros 1,000 o'r rhain yng Nghymru.

Fel y dywedodd Peter yn gywir, mae cyfanswm y trwyddedau symud a gyhoeddwyd hyd yma yng Nghymru yn fwy na 30,000. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio'n galed, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig megis Powys, lle yr hysbyswyd 12,400 o drwyddedau ers 6 Medi.

**Peter Rogers:** Gwrandawsoch ar y dystiolaeth a ddarparwyd gan gyrff gwahanol. O gofio am drawma y llynedd, a oes gennych hyder yn y bobl sy'n rhoi'r dystiolaeth hon? Pe bai ymchwiliad i hyn, credaf y byddem yn canfod bod rhywfaint o'r wybodaeth a ddarparwyd ar y pryd yn ddi-sail ac anghywir. Dyna un o'r problemau yr ydym yn eu hwynebu. Rhaid inni arddel bod synnwyr cyffredin. Nid oes unrhyw synnwyr cyffredin i'r rheol 20 diwrnod.

**Michael German:** Adroddiadau Follett ac Anderson a wnaeth yr argymhellion a amlinellais. Efallai na fydd ymchwiliad brenhinol, nac unrhyw fath arall o ymchwiliad, yn darparu'r atebion yr ydych am eu clywed. Weithiau, ofnaf fod yn rhaid ichi dderbyn na fydd y dystiolaeth yn cyd-fynd â'ch teimladau, ond dyna'r dystiolaeth orau y gall y wlad ei darparu.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol, y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw ac awdurdodau lleol am eu cydweithrediad o ran arolygu a gorfodi'r drefn. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gymuned ffermio, ac eraill, yn parhau i weithredu'n gyfrifol. Nid yw'n fuddiol i neb yn yr hirdymor i'r drefn gael ei herio neu ei chyfaddawdu drwy

compliance now.

I am conscious that the arguments made by Kirsty about the Scottish model need to be taken into account. The independent reviews will consider these arrangements alongside other variants and advise in the light of their experience.

We are emphatically not relying solely on movement restrictions, or requiring only the livestock sector to respond and adapt. Alongside the cost benefit and risk analysis studies is an extensive programme of work to address the threat and risk posed by illegal meat imports. This includes banning, from 1 January 2003, personal imports from outside the European Union; a public awareness campaign, which I have announced to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee; significantly improving intelligence gathering and sharing, at source and in the United Kingdom; and extending the powers available to enforcement agencies and piloting the use of detector dogs. There is also a thoroughgoing review of existing enforcement structures and arrangements, which is due to report shortly. An extra £3 million is being spent this year, half of which will be spent on extra enforcement staff.

In addition, the updated contingency plan arrangements for dealing with foot and mouth disease are in hand, drawing on the lessons of last year. A final plan for Wales will be published early in the new year, following extensive consultation. I think that that answers Peter's point. In conclusion, I am aware of the operational problems highlighted by the industry and in the debate. Some are inevitable in the early days of a new and unfamiliar regime; some are a consequence of relaxations argued for by the industry itself; and some are unavoidable if there is not to be a return to free movement of animals at this stage.

I recognise the industry's continuing efforts to find a workable solution. The National Farmers Union's 10-point petition is part of

beidio â chydymffurfio yn awr.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r dadleuon a wnaed gan Kirsty ynghylch yr angen i ystyried model yr Alban. Bydd yr adolygiadau annibynnol yn ystyried y trefniadau hyn ynghyd ag amrywiadau eraill ac yn rhoi cyngor yng ngoleuni eu profiad.

Yn bendant, nid ydym yn dibynnu'n unig ar gyfyngiadau ar symud anifeiliaid, nac yn gofyn i'r sector da byw yn unig i ymateb ac addasu. Ynghyd â'r astudiaethau budd cost a dadansoddi risgiau mae rhaglen waith helaeth ar gael i ymdrin â'r bygythiad a achosir i fewnforion cig anghyfreithlon. Mae hynny'n cynnwys gwahardd, o 1 Ionawr 2003 ymlaen, fewnforion personol o'r tu allan i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd; ymgyrch ymwybyddiaeth gyhoeddus, a gyhoeddais yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig; gwella'r broses o gasglu a rhannu gwybodaeth yn sylweddol, yn y tarddleuedd ac yn y Deyrnas Unedig; ac ymestyn y pwerau sydd ar gael i asiantaethau gorfodi drwy dreialu'r defnydd o gŵn synhwyro. Ceir hefyd adolygiad trylwyr o'r strwythurau a'r trefniadau presennol, y disgwylir adroddiad arno yn fuan. Mae £3 miliwn ychwanegol yn cael ei wario eleni, ac mae hanner ohono yn cael ei wario ar staff gorfodi ychwanegol.

Yn ogystal, mae'r trefniadau cynllun wrth gefn a ddiweddarwyd yn mynd rhagddynt ar gyfer ymdrin â chlwy'r traed a'r genau, gan ddefnyddio'r gwersi a ddysgwyd y llynedd. Cyhoeddir cynllun terfynol ar gyfer Cymru yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd, yn dilyn ymgynghori helaeth. Credaf fod hynny yn ateb pwynt Peter. I gloi, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau gweithredol a amlygwyd gan y diwydiant ac yn y ddadl. Mae rhai ohonynt yn anochel ar ddechrau'r drefn newydd ac anghyfarwydd; daw rhai yn sgîl llaciadau y dadleuwyd o'u plaid gan y diwydiant ei hun; ac ni ellir osgoi rhai eraill os na ddychwelir i sefyllfa lle y caiff anifeiliaid eu symud yn rhydd yn ystod y cyfnod hwn.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod ymdrechion parhaus y diwydiant i ganfod ateb ymarferol. Mae deiseb 10 pwynt Undeb Cenedlaethol y

this ongoing dialogue. We are learning and listening. We will consider what might be done to make the existing arrangements more effective without compromising bio-security. My officials met Brecon and Radnor farmers today to discuss their concerns—

Ffermwyr yn rhan o'r ddeialog barhaus hon. Yr ydym yn dysgu ac yn gwranddo. Byddwn yn ystyried yr hyn y gellid ei wneud i wneud y trefniadau presennol yn fwy effeithiol heb beryglu bio-ddiogelwch. Cyfarfu fy swyddogion â ffermwyr Brycheiniog a Maesyfed heddiw i drafod eu pryderon—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am afraid that time has run out. This concludes today's proceedings.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Daeth yr amser i ben. Daw hyn â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.48 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.48 p.m.*