



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 28 Chwefror 2006  
Tuesday, 28 February 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

Penodi Ymddiriedolwyr Ychwanegol i Gynllun Pensiwn Aelodau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru The Appointment of Additional Trustees to the National Assembly for Wales Members' Pension Scheme.....	4
Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2006-2 Election of Members to Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-2 .....	5
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister .....	7
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services .....	33
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.....	50
Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee .....	63
Cwestiwn Brys: Cau Melin Bapur DS Smith Urgent Question: The Closure of the DS Smith Paper Mill .....	64
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	67
Cymeradwyo o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval under Standing Order No. 24.25 .....	71
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006.....	73
Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006.....	89
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 .....	97
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006 The Approval of the National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006.....	103
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006 The Approval of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006 .....	112
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006	

Approval of the Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006.....	118
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Pontio Rhwng y Gynradd a'r Ysgol Uwchradd (Cymru) 2006, a Cymeradwyo o dan reol Sefydlog Rhif 29 y Gofyniad am Lunio Cynlluniau Pontio ac Arweiniad	
Approval of the Transition from Primary School to Secondary School (Wales) Regulations 2006, and the approval under Standing Order No. 29 Requirement for the production of Transition Plans and Guidance.....	128

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg. Mae hon yn fersiwn ddrafft o'r cofnod. Cyhoeddir fersiwn derfynol ymhen pum diwrnod gwaith.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included. This is a draft version of the record. The final version will be published within five working days.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Penodi Ymddiriedolwyr Ychwanegol i Gynllun Pensiwn Aelodau Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The Appointment of Additional Trustees to the National Assembly for Wales  
Members' Pension Scheme**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I propose that  
**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 18 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 3.4:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 18 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3.4:*

*1. determines that rule B2 schedule 1.1 of the National Assembly for Wales Members' pension scheme rules be amended to allow the maximum number of trustees to be six; and*

*1. yn penderfynu diwygio rheol B2 atodlen 1.1 rheolau cynllun pensiwn Aelodau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn caniatáu hyd at chwech o ymddiriedolwyr; ac*

*2. elects Edwina Hart as a trustee to the scheme. (NDM2853)*

*2. yn ethol Edwina Hart yn un o ymddiriedolwyr y cynllun. (NDM2853)*

*Cynnig (NDM2853): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2853): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val

Marek, John  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

### **Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2006-2 Election of Members to Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-2**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod propose that

*the National Assembly resolves:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu:*

*1. that a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-2, be established in accordance with Standing Order No. 17 of the Assembly to discharge those functions of the Assembly in respect of the matters identified in the schedule to this motion which are indicated in respect of each matter in that schedule and that the Assembly's functions in those respects be delegated to that committee;*

*1. bod pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2006-2, yn cael ei sefydlu, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17 y Cynulliad, i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yng nghyswllt y materion y cyfeirir atynt yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn ac a nodir yng nghyswllt pob mater yn yr atodlen honno a bod swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yng nghyswllt y rheiny'n cael eu dirprwyo i'r pwyllgor hwnnw;*

*2. that the members of that committee be: Carwyn Jones, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody, Mick Bates;*

*2. mai aelodau'r pwyllgor hwnnw fydd: Carwyn Jones, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody, Mick Bates;*

*3. that the committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.16 or on the 31 March 2006, whichever is the earlier;*

*3. bod y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.16 neu ar 31 Mawrth 2006, pa un bynnag a fydd gyntaf;*

*4. that if the committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Minister.*

*4. os bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyr penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, yna, yn yr achos hwnnw, dirprwyir y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, yng nghyswllt mater o'r fath, i'r Prif Weinidog.*

*Schedule*

*Atodlen*

*Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended): section 78*      *Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 (fel y'i diwygiwyd): adran 78*

*Appeal by the National Assembly for Wales.*      *Apêl gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.*

*Proposed residential development following the demolition of existing buildings at Meadowslea Hospital, Penyffordd, Flintshire.*      *Datblygiad preswyl arfaethedig yn dilyn chwalu adeiladau cyfredol yn ysbyty Meadowslea, Penyffordd, sir y Fflint.*

*Planning appeal and listed building consent appeal by T-Mobile (UK) LTD for the replacement of existing louvres with GRP louvres to facilitate the internal installation of a mobile phone base station at St. Thomas' Church, Bath Street, Rhyl. (NDM2854)*      *Apêl cynllunio ac apêl caniatâd adeilad rhestredig gan T-Mobile (UK) Cyf ar gyfer disodli eu lwfrau cyfredol gyda lwfrau GRP er mwyn hwyluso gosod yn fewnol orsaf ffon symudol yn Eglwys Sant Thomas, Stryd y Baddon, y Rhyl. (NDM2854)*

*Cynnig (NDM2854): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM2854): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Y Cynllun Gwaith a Ganiateir The Permitted Work Scheme**

**Q1 Gwenda Thomas:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Department for Work and Pensions on the permitted work scheme? OAQ1266(FM)

**C1 Gwenda Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau am y cynllun gwaith a ganiateir? OAQ1266(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** We work closely with the Department for Work and Pensions and Jobcentre Plus to ensure that the Welfare to Work agenda, which includes the Pathways to Work and the permitted work programmes, provides opportunities for all those seeking employment.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith i sicrhau bod yr agenda o Fudd-dâl i Waith, sy'n cynnwys Llwybrau at Waith a'r rhaglenni gwaith a ganiateir, yn darparu cyfleoedd i bawb sy'n chwilio am waith.

**Gwenda Thomas:** The recently published Department for Work and Pensions consultation paper, 'A New Deal for Welfare: Empowering People to Work', contains some positive references to announced changes to permitted work. Bearing in mind the Welsh Assembly Government's statutory duty to promote equality of opportunity, will you ensure that the findings of the first phase of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's review of services for disabled young people are fed to the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, and that he is made fully aware that the committee is being supported by a parallel group of disabled young people, whose contribution to the review is invaluable?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae'r papur ymgynghori a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau '*A New Deal for Welfare: Empowering People to Work*', yn cynnwys rhai cyfeiriadau cadarnhaol at newidiadau a gyhoeddwyd i waith a ganiateir. A chofio dyletswydd statudol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal, a wnewch sicrhau y bydd canfyddiadau cam cyntaf adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar wasanaethau i bobl ifanc anabl yn cael eu cyflwyno i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau, a'i fod yn cael gwybod yn glir y caiff y pwyllgor ei gefnogi gan grŵp cyfochrog o bobl ifanc anabl y mae eu cyfraniad at yr adolygiad yn amhrisiadwy?

**The First Minister:** I certainly agree that the consultation period remains open. I am very pleased that the Assembly's Committee on Equality of Opportunity has had the chance to draw up a report, which will form part of our consultation response. I do not think that a single Member has not had experience of constituents having difficulty in understanding the rules of the halfway house.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr i'r cyfnod ymgynghori aros ar agor. Yr wyf yn hynod falch bod Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal y Cynulliad wedi cael cyfle i lunio adroddiad, a fydd yn rhan o'n hymateb i'r ymgynghoriad. Ni chredaf fod yr un Aelod heb gwrdd ag etholwyr sy'n ei chael hi'n anodd deall rheolau'r tŷ hanner ffordd. Maent am roi cynnig ar rywfaint penodol o waith

They want to try out a certain amount of work or a certain kind of work, but sometimes they are deemed to have overstepped the mark and are disqualified. The improvement in the permitted working rules will be helpful to everyone who wants to see people who have been out of work for a long time able to try out a halfway house and, if that is successful, move to full-time or part-time work.

**Laura Anne Jones:** On that note, another programme designed to reduce inactivity rates is Want to Work. Will the Welsh Assembly Government want to develop that programme through Objective 1 areas and, if so, does the First Minister recognise that problems in rural parts of Wales are very different from those in urban Valley communities? A uniform approach will not necessarily give best value for money or best practice. Will he agree to discuss these concerns, which have been raised with me, with local authorities?

**The First Minister:** We certainly play a bigger part in Want to Work than we do in Pathways to Work, where you could say that we provide 'only' occupational therapy and medical support. With Want to Work, we are almost 50:50 partners with the Department for Work and Pensions. Clearly, the programmes do not yet apply throughout Wales, and they are being implemented first in the areas where the economic inactivity figures show the biggest problem. If you have particular points about constituents of yours who cannot access the Want to Work programme, but who would definitely benefit from it, I would be grateful if you would write to me about it, as we would be interested in picking that up when we, and the DWP, are ready to roll that programme out throughout Wales.

neu fath penodol o waith, ond ambell dro bernir eu bod wedi cymryd cam yn ormod a chânt eu gwahardd. Bydd gwella'r rheolau ar gyfer gwaith a ganiateir o fudd i bawb sydd am weld pobl sydd wedi bod yn ddi-waith am gyfnod hir yn gallu rhoi cynnig ar dŷ hanner ffordd ac, os bydd hynny'n llwyddo, symud ymlaen i waith amser llawn neu ran amser.

**Laura Ann Jones:** Ar y pwynt hwnnw, rhaglen arall a ddyluniwyd i ostwng cyfraddau anweithgarwch yw Eisiau Gweithio. A fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ddatblygu'r rhaglen honno drwy ardaloedd Amcan 1 ac, os felly, a yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod bod y problemau a geir yn rhannau gwledig Cymru yn wahanol iawn i'r rheiny a geir yng nghymunedau trefol y Cymoedd? Ni fydd defnyddio dull unfurf o reidrwydd yn rhoi'r gwerth gorau am arian na'r arfer gorau. A wnaiff gytuno i drafod y pryderon hyn, a godwyd gyda mi, gydag awdurdodau lleol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn sicr yn chwarae rhan fwy yn Eisiau Gweithio nag a wnawn yn Llwybrau at Waith, lle gallech ddweud ein bod yn darparu therapi galwedigaethol a chefnogaeth feddygol 'yn unig'. Gydag Eisiau Gweithio, yr ydym bron yn bartneriaid 50:50 gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau. Yn amlwg, nid yw'r rhaglenni'n berthnasol ledled Cymru eto, ac maent yn cael eu gweithredu'n gyntaf yn y mannau lle mae'r ffigurau anweithgarwch economaidd yn dangos y broblem fwyaf. Os oes gennych bwyntiau penodol am etholwyr i chi sydd yn methu cael mynediad i'r rhaglen Eisiau Gweithio, ond a fyddai'n bendant yn elwa ohoni, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â hwy, gan y byddai gennym ddiddordeb mewn codi hynny pan fyddwn ni a'r Adran Waith a Phensiynau yn barod i dreiglo'r rhaglen honno allan drwy Gymru gyfan.

### **Cyfarfod â'r Trysorlys Meeting with the Treasury**

**Q2 Janet Davies:** What priorities has the First Minister identified to raise in his next meeting with the Treasury? OAQ1286(FM)

**C2 Janet Davies:** Pa flaenoriaethau a nodwyd gan y Prif Weinidog i'w codi yn ei gyfarfod nesaf â'r Trysorlys? OAQ1286(FM)



**The First Minister:** I have no meetings scheduled with Treasury Ministers.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw gyfarfodydd wedi'u trefnu gyda Gweinidogion y Trysorlys.

**Janet Davies:** That is extremely interesting. Do you believe that, in principle, public funding should be directed according to need and, if so, have you discussed this with the Treasury? Do you have any idea as to when you might meet the Treasury to discuss the issue of reforming Barnett?

**Janet Davies:** Mae hynny'n hynod o ddiddorol. A gredwch y dylai arian cyhoeddus, mewn egwyddor, gael ei gyfeirio yn ôl yr angen ac, os felly, a ydych wedi trafod hyn gyda'r Trysorlys? A oes gennych unrhyw syniad pa bryd y gallech gyfarfod â'r Trysorlys i drafod cwestiwn diwygio Barnett?

**The First Minister:** In principle, all public funding should be allocated according to need, or relative need. That is a fundamental principle of good public expenditure, government accounting, and good value for money. That must be right. You were making a bit of a leap in the assumption in the final part of your question, which I have heard before from you and other members of your group, that Barnett is therefore not allocated according to need. I am not sure that you could demonstrate that clearly. We accept that it is a very rough-and-ready way of giving us and the devolved parliament and Executive in Scotland resources. However, if you were to change it, it is not clear how that would come out. It is a gross oversimplification to say that, if you got rid of the Barnett formula, Wales would have more money because of this principle of relative need. It is unclear that that would be the case.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mewn egwyddor, dylai pob arian cyhoeddus gael ei ddyrannu yn ôl yr angen, neu'r angen cymharol. Dyna un o egwyddorion sylfaenol gwariant cyhoeddus a chyfrifyddu llywodraeth da, a gwerth da am arian. Rhaid i hynny fod yn iawn. Gwnaethoch dipyn o naid yn y dybiaeth yn rhan olaf eich cwestiwn, rhywbeth yr wyf wedi ei glywed o'r blaen gennych chi ac aelodau eraill o'ch grŵp, nad yw Barnett felly wedi'i ddyrannu yn ôl yr angen. Nid wyf yn siŵr y gallech ddangos hynny'n glir. Derbyniwn mai ffordd ffwrdd-â-hi iawn ydyw o roi adnoddau i ni ac i'r Weithrediaeth a'r senedd ddatganoledig yn yr Alban. Fodd bynnag, pe baech yn ei newid, nid yw'n glir sut y digwyddai hynny. Gorsymleiddio dybryd yw dweud, pe ceid gwared â fformiwla Barnett, y câi Cymru fwy o arian oherwydd yr egwyddor hon o angen cymharol. Nid yw'n eglur mai felly y byddai hi.

**William Graham:** It is clearly worrying if you are not having regular talks with the Treasury. On this side of the Chamber, every time we ask something about education, health and economic development, the answer is, 'No, there is not enough money'. Will you please make representations on behalf of Wales for more money?

**William Graham:** Yn amlwg, mae'n destun pryder os nad ydych yn siarad yn rheolaidd â'r Trysorlys. Ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, bob tro y gofynnwn rywbeth am addysg, iechyd a datblygu economaidd, yr ateb yw, 'Na, nid oes digon o arian'. A wnewch chi bwysu ar ran Cymru am ragor o arian, os gwelwch yn dda?

**The First Minister:** On the other hand, I have heard your group say that it does not agree with getting rid of the Barnett formula. Perhaps I have that wrong, but that is what I have heard from your group. It is an example of one of those rare occasions when the Labour and Conservative groups agree on something. You might leap out and say for a certainty that some alternative formula would give us greater resources, but it would be a

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ar y llaw arall, yr wyf wedi clywed eich grŵp chi'n dweud nad yw'n cytuno â chael gwared â fformiwla Barnett. Efallai imi gamddeall hynny, ond dyna yr wyf wedi ei glywed gan eich grŵp chi. Mae'n enghraifft o un o'r achlysuron prin hynny pan fo'r grwpiau Llafur a Cheidwadol yn cytuno ar rywbeth. Gallech neidio allan a dweud i sicrwydd y byddai rhyw fformiwla arall yn rhoi mwy o

pig in a poke, if you like, because it is not certain that that would be the outcome. We would all like more money—local government, every hospital and school, and us—that goes without saying, but you also have to think of the implications of that for the people from whom that money is raised.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n debyg, mae'r Glymblaid ar Godi Ffioedd yng Nghymru yn ddig iawn gyda'ch Llywodraeth am adael pobl anabl i lawr drwy dorri ei haddewid i ddarparu gofal cartref am ddim. Mae'r glymblaid yn dweud y dylech fynd at y Trysorlys i gael yr arian sydd yn cael ei arbed drwy fudd-daliadau er mwyn eich helpu i wireddu'ch addewid. Gan eich bod wedi torri'r addewid hon, Brif Weinidog, sut y gall unrhyw un ymddiried yn yr hyn a ddywedwch o hyn ymlaen?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf ailddweud yr hyn a ddywedodd Brian Gibbons yr wythnos diwethaf wrth wneud ei ddatganiad o flaen y Cynulliad: yr ydym ni, fel Cabinet, ac efe a minnau yn bersonol, yn ymddiheuro i bobl Cymru, ac, yn enwedig, i bobl anabl Cymru, am dorri'r addewid. Nid yw'n bleserus, ac nid wyf yn awyddus i'w wneud eto. Credaf fy mod yn siarad ar ran Brian a'r Gweinidogion eraill wrth ddweud hynny. Serch hynny, bydd llawer o bobl anabl yng Nghymru ar eu hennill oherwydd y rhaglen y cyhoeddodd Brian ei manylion yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fodd bynnag, nid dyna'r rheswm pam yr oedd pobl wedi pleidleisio dros eich plaid yn yr etholiad—gwnaed hynny ar sail yr addewid yn eich maniffesto i ddileu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl. Dyna'r hyn a ddywedwyd gennych, a dyna'r addewid a roddwyd gennych. Onid ydych yn sylweddoli eich bod wedi chwalu ymddiriedaeth y bobl oedd wedi pleidleisio drosoch ar sail yr addewid honno? Onid ydych yn teimlo cywilydd am hynny?

2.10 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr am beth yr ydych yn gofyn. Yr wyf wedi dweud fy mod yn ymddiheuro i bobl Cymru am dorri'r

adnoddau inni, ond cath mewn cwd fyddai hynny, os hoffwch chi, oherwydd nid oes sicrwydd mai dyna fyddai'r canlyniad. Byddai pawb ohonom yn hoffi mwy o arian—llywodraeth leol, pob ysbyty ac ysgol, a ni—mae hynny'n ganiataol, ond rhaid ichi feddwl hefyd am oblygiadau hynny i'r bobl y codir yr arian hwnnw oddi arnynt.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** As you know, I am sure, the Coalition on Charging in Wales is very angry with your Government for letting disabled people down by breaking its promise to provide free homecare. The coalition says that you should approach the Treasury to get the money that is being saved through benefits in order to help you to deliver on your promise. Given that you have broken this promise, First Minister, how can anyone trust what you say from now on?

**The First Minister:** I will repeat what Brian Gibbons said last week in making his statement before the Assembly: we, as a Cabinet, and he and I personally, apologise to the people of Wales, and, in particular, to the disabled people of Wales, for breaking that promise. We did not enjoy doing so, and I am not eager to do it again. I am sure that I speak on behalf of Brian and the other Ministers in saying that. However, there are many disabled people in Wales who will benefit because of the programme the details of which Brian announced last week.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** However, that is not the reason why people voted for your party in the election—they did so on the basis of your manifesto pledge to abolish homecare fees for disabled people. That is what you said, and that was the promise that you made. Do you not realise that you have destroyed the trust of those who voted for you on the basis of that pledge? Are you not ashamed of that?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure what you are asking for. I have said that I apologise to the people of Wales for breaking that

addewid; nid yw'n bleserus gosod maniffesto ac yna gorfod torri addewid. Dywedodd Brian yr un peth yr wythnos diwethaf. Nid wyf yn siŵr am beth y mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn gofyn. Efallai nad yw'n disgwyl i mi ymddiheuro, ond yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny yn gyhoeddus drwy'r Cynulliad i bobl Cymru—yn arbennig i'r sawl a bleidleisiodd drosom wedi iddynt ddarllen yr ymrwymiad yn y maniffesto i ddileu costau o fewn categorïau penodol. Yr wyf yn ymddiheuro i'r bobl hynny, ond, serch hynny, bydd llawer o bobl ar eu hennill o fewn grwpiau nad oeddynt yn disgwyl unrhyw fantais o'r addewid a wnaed. Bydd rhai nad oeddynt wedi'u cynnwys yn yr addewid a wnaed yn wreiddiol yn derbyn gwasanaeth gwell am bris is neu am ddim. Ni fydddech yn disgwyl imi ymddiheuro i'r bobl hynny, gan y byddant ar eu hennill, ond yr wyf yn ymddiheuro i'r sawl a bleidleisiodd drosom ni ac, yn fwy cyffredinol, i'r anabl a'u gofalwyr.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Those words will not mean that those who were betrayed by your Government on this issue will not feel anger. They feel very angry, and they are entitled to feel that way. They cast their votes on the basis that they could trust the word of Wales's First Minister. Now, they see that they cannot trust those words, as you have broken that promise to people who voted for you. That is the key issue, and no apology will make up for the fact that you have broken a fundamental promise. We want you to go back to the Treasury to see whether you can find the money to keep your promise. That is the least that you can do for the disabled people of Wales.

**The First Minister:** That is sheer political opportunism. It shows that you have no interest whatsoever in the disabled people of Wales. I have apologised, but you are now saying that I am not allowed to apologise. What more am I expected to do? It is extremely unpleasant to have to break a manifesto commitment; Brian said as much last week, and I reiterate it this week. However, as the leader of the opposition, you have to ensure that everything that you say on this issue is free of the charge that all you are doing is political point-scoring and

promise; it is not pleasant to present a manifesto and then to have to break a promise. Brian said the same thing last week. I am not sure what the leader of the opposition is asking for. He may not expect me to apologise, but I have done so publicly through the Assembly to the people of Wales—especially to those who voted for us having read the manifesto commitment to abolish costs in certain categories. I do apologise to those people, but, having said that, many people, in groups that did not expect to gain from the pledge that was made, will now benefit. Some people who would not have been included in the pledge that we originally made will receive a better service for a lower price or free of charge. You would not expect me to apologise to those people, as they are set to gain from this. However, I do apologise to those people who voted for us and, more generally, to the disabled and their carers.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ni fydd y geiriau hynny'n golygu na fydd y rhai a fradychwyd gan eich Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn yn teimlo dicter. Teimlant yn ddig iawn, ac mae ganddynt hawl i deimlo felly. Bwriasant eu pleidleisiau ar y sail y gallent ymddiried yng ngair Prif Weinidog Cymru. Yn awr, gwelant na allant ymddiried yn y geiriau hynny, gan eich bod wedi torri'r addewid hwnnw i bobl a bleidleisiodd drosoch. Dyna'r mater allweddol, ac ni fydd dim ymddiheuriad yn gwneud iawn am y ffaith eich bod wedi torri addewid sylfaenol. Mae arnom eisiau i chi fynd yn ôl at y Trysorlys i weld a allwch ddod o hyd i'r arian i gadw'ch addewid. Dyna'r lleiaf y gallwch ei wneud dros bobl anabl Cymru.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Oportiwnistiaeth wleidyddol noeth yw hynny. Mae'n dangos nad oes gennych unrhyw ddiddordeb o gwbl ym mhobl anabl Cymru. Yr wyf wedi ymddiheuro, ond yr ydych chithau'n awr yn dweud nad wyf yn cael ymddiheuro. Beth yn fwy y disgwylir imi ei wneud? Mae'n eithriadol o annifyr gorfod torri ymrwymiad maniffesto; dywedodd Brian hynny yr wythnos diwethaf, ac fe'i hailadroddaf yr wythnos hon. Fodd bynnag, fel arweinydd yr wrthblaid, rhaid i chi sicrhau bod popeth a ddywedwch ar y mater hwn yn rhydd o'r

grandstanding. Everything that I have heard from you this afternoon demonstrates that you have no interest in the disabled people of Wales; all you are doing is seeing whether you can score points off me and Brian Gibbons. Your comments are useless and worthless.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):**

When you get to meet a Treasury Minister, I am sure that you will have a busy time. One of the key issues facing Wales is the reorganisation of our police forces. We know that that will cost us between £55 million and £60 million, according to the estimates of Welsh police authorities. That money can come from only one of three places: from central Government, from local government, or from the National Assembly. Have you met with the Treasury to ensure, absolutely, that the funding comes from Treasury resources, and not from the National Assembly or from Welsh council tax payers?

**The First Minister:** It is my understanding—Edwina will, no doubt, correct me if I am wrong—that the Treasury has not provided additional funds to the Home Office. The Treasury has an agreement with the Home Office that all of the additional transitional costs will come from within the Home Office's budget. That applies to the reorganisation of Welsh police forces and to the three English areas included in the first wave of reorganisation. That is a matter of negotiation between the Home Office and the Treasury. If the Home Office is to do this, it has to do it from within its current Treasury-allocated resources.

**Michael German:** I hope that you agree that we do not want to see this cost falling upon the National Assembly or upon Welsh council tax payers. It is a substantial sum of money. The Home Office is currently saying that it has £125 million for the reorganisation—that is for the whole of England and Wales. Yet, it will cost between £55 million and £60 million in Wales alone. Have you sought guarantees on this? Are you

cyhuddiad mai'r cwbl yr ydych yn ei wneud yw sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol a chwarae'r galeri. Mae popeth yr wyf wedi'i glywed gennych y prynhawn yma'n dangos nad oes gennych ddim diddordeb ym mhobl anabl Cymru; y cyfan yr ydych yn ei wneud yw gweld a allwch sgorio pwyntiau oddi arnaf fi a Brian Gibbons. Mae eich sylwadau'n dda i ddim ac yn ddiwerth.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):**

Pan gewch gyfle i gyfarfod â Gweinidog o'r Trysorlys, yr wyf yn siŵr y cewch amser prysur. Un o'r materion allweddol sydd yn wynebu Cymru yw ad-drefnu ein heddluoedd. Gwyddom y gwnaiff gostio rhwng £55 miliwn a £60 miliwn inni, yn ôl amcangyfrifon awdurdodau heddlu Cymru. Gall yr arian hwnnw ddod o un o dri lle yn unig: oddi wrth y Llywodraeth ganolog, oddi wrth lywodraeth leol neu oddi wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. A ydych wedi cyfarfod â'r Trysorlys i sicrhau, yn bendant, mai o adnoddau'r Trysorlys y daw'r cyllid, ac nid oddi wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol nac oddi wrth dalwyr trethi cyngor Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fy nealltwriaeth i—gwnaiff Edwina, mae'n siŵr, fy nghywiro os wyf yn anghywir—yw nad yw'r Trysorlys wedi darparu cyllid ychwanegol i'r Swyddfa Gartref. Mae gan y Trysorlys gytundeb gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref y daw'r cyfan o'r costau trosiannol ychwanegol oddi mewn i gyllideb y Swyddfa Gartref. Mae hynny'n wir am ad-drefnu heddluoedd Cymru ac am y tri rhanbarth yn Lloegr a gynhwyswyd yn y don gyntaf o ad-drefnu. Mater i'w negodi rhwng y Swyddfa Gartref a'r Trysorlys yw hynny. Os yw'r Swyddfa Gartref am wneud hyn, rhaid iddi ei wneud oddi mewn i'r adnoddau sydd wedi'u dyrannu iddi gan y Trysorlys ar hyn o bryd.

**Michael German:** Gobeithio y cytunwch nad oes arnom eisiau gweld y gost hon yn syrthio ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol nac ar drethdalwyr Cymru. Mae'n swm sylweddol o arian. Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn dweud ar hyn o bryd fod ganddi £125 miliwn ar gyfer yr ad-drefnu—hynny yw, ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr yn gyfan. Eto, mae'n mynd i gostio rhwng £55 miliwn a £60 miliwn yng Nghymru'n unig. A ydych chi wedi ceisio

certain that you can tell Welsh council tax payers that they will not have to pay any extra money for this reorganisation? Can you tell the National Assembly that we will not have to pay any extra money, on behalf of the people of Wales, for a reorganisation that is, quite clearly, being foisted upon us by the Home Office, against the wishes of police authorities and council tax payers?

**The First Minister:** Each year, we go through the delicate process of trying to keep the police precept down to reasonable levels, and those negotiations are being led by Sue Essex, as Finance Minister. One of the odd asymmetries of our relationship with the police is that we deal with the police precept, while all operational matters, including organisational matters as to whether there should be one or four constabularies in Wales—or any other number for that matter—are for the Home Office and not for us. We work closely with the Home Office, but fundamental decisions of that kind, as well as funding, are matters for it. As far as I am aware, there has never been any suggestion that the police reorganisation should be funded using Assembly resources.

**Michael German:** If I can take that as a 'yes' and that the funding will not come from the Assembly, can we also take it that we will not be asking the council tax payers to pay for those extra costs through the precepts? Will you therefore seek to get the full costs of any reorganisation foisted upon us by the Home Office from the Home Office, to ensure that the funding does not come from our resources taking away moneys that could well be used in our schools and hospitals in Wales?

**The First Minister:** As far as I am aware, there has never been any suggestion that the costs of reorganisation should fall anywhere except on the Home Office's central budget. It is its proposition and it must find the costs for it and implement it. It does not fall on the police precept, and, as far as I am aware, at a distant remove, it does not fall on any new funding from the Treasury either. It will come from the Home Office's own resources.

gwarantau ar hyn? A ydych yn sicr y gallwch ddweud wrth drethdalwyr Cymru na fydd yn rhaid iddynt dalu unrhyw arian ychwanegol am yr ad-drefnu hwn? A allwch ddweud wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol na fydd yn rhaid i ni dalu unrhyw arian ychwanegol, ar ran pobl Cymru, am ad-drefnu sydd, yn gwbl amlwg, yn cael ei orfodi arnom gan y Swyddfa Gartref, yn erbyn dymuniadau awdurdodau'r heddlu a thalwyr y dreth gyngor?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bob blwyddyn, awn drwy'r broses ddelicet o geisio cadw praesept yr heddlu i lawr i lefelau rhesymol, ac arweinir y trafodaethau hynny gan Sue Essex, fel Gweinidog Cyllid. Un o anghymesureddau od ein perthynas gyda'r heddlu yw mai ni fydd yn delio â phraesept yr heddlu, tra bod pob mater gweithredol, gan gynnwys materion trefniadaeth o safbwynt ai un ynteu bedwar heddlu ddylai fod yng Nghymru—neu unrhyw nifer arall, os daw i hynny—yn faterion i'r Swyddfa Gartref ac nid i ni. Cydweithiwn yn agos gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref, ond mater iddi hi yw penderfyniadau sylfaenol o'r math hwnnw, yn ogystal â chyllid. Hyd y gwn i, ni fu erioed unrhyw awgrym y dylid talu am ad-drefnu'r heddlu gan ddefnyddio adnoddau'r Cynulliad.

**Michael German:** Os caf fi gymryd hynny fel ateb cadarnhaol, ac na ddaw'r cyllid oddi wrth y Cynulliad, a allwn gymryd hefyd na fyddwn yn gofyn i dalwyr y dreth gyngor dalu am y costau ychwanegol hynny drwy'r praeseptau? A wnewch chi felly geisio cael costau llawn unrhyw ad-drefnu a orfodir arnom gan y Swyddfa Gartref oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gartref, er mwyn sicrhau na ddaw'r cyllid allan o'n hadnoddau ni gan ddwyn arian y gellid ei ddefnyddio heb os yn ein hysgolion a'n hysbytai yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hyd y gwn i, ni fu unrhyw awgrym erioed y dylai costau ad-drefnu syrthio yn unrhyw le ac eithrio ar gyllideb ganolog y Swyddfa Gartref. Ei chynnig hi ydyw, a rhaid iddi hi ganfod y costau ar ei gyfer a'i weithredu. Nid yw'n syrthio ar braesept yr heddlu, a hyd y gwn i, o bell, nid yw'n syrthio ar unrhyw gyllid newydd oddi wrth y Trysorlys ychwaith. Daw allan o adnoddau'r Swyddfa Gartref ei hun.

## **Dyfodol Ysbytai Cymunedol** **The Future of Community Hospitals**

**Q3 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of community hospitals? OAQ1259(FM)

**The First Minister:** ‘Designed for Life’, our 10-year strategy for delivering health services in Wales, identifies the important future role of community hospitals. This will include developments in diagnostic treatments and new models of care, ensuring that treatment takes place near or in the home.

**Jenny Randerson:** In the middle of my constituency, there languishes the site of the old Cardiff Royal Infirmary, which was not just a valuable community hospital in its time, but was also paid for by the community in the nineteenth century. It closed during the first year of the Labour Government, and the community has felt total frustration ever since because of the lack of progress on finding a plan for its replacement. Last year, the second plan for the site, put forward by the local health board, was rejected. The community health council said that the plan was not ambitious enough, but the trust said that it was too ambitious and that it could not afford the revenue costs. The local health board says that it cannot afford the capital charges that come with a more ambitious plan. It is predicted to have an overspend of £1 million by the end of this year, and the trust an overspend of £1.6 million. When will you sit down with your Minister for Health and Social Services and persuade him to consider the funding of the health service in the capital city of this country?

**The First Minister:** Those who have lived in Cardiff all their lives, as I have, will be more than familiar with the inside and outside of the Cardiff Royal Infirmary, for obvious reasons. Even today, it is probably one of the top 20 most important hospitals in Wales in terms of attendances, because of the huge number of out-patient attendances at its different clinics. However, the plan to have a modern facility on the west-wing site or the

**C3 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol ysbytai cymunedol? OAQ1259(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ‘Cynllun Oes’, sef ein strategaeth ddeng mlynedd ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru, yn nodi rôl bwysig ysbytai cymunedol i'r dyfodol. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys datblygiadau mewn triniaethau diagnostig a modelau gofal newydd, gan sicrhau bod y driniaeth yn digwydd yn agos at gartref neu yn y cartref.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn dihoeni yng nghanol fy etholaeth mae safle hen Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd, oedd nid yn unig yn ysbyty cymunedol gwerthfawr yn ei ddydd, ond y talwyd amdano gan y gymuned hefyd yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg. Caeodd yn ystod blwyddyn gyntaf y Llywodraeth Lafur, ac mae'r gymuned wedi teimlo rhwystredigaeth lwyr byth oddi ar hynny oherwydd y diffyg symud ymlaen gyda chanfod cynllun i godi un arall yn ei le. Y llynedd, gwrthodwyd yr ail gynllun ar gyfer y safle, a gyflwynwyd gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Dywedodd y cyngor iechyd cymuned nad oedd y cynllun yn ddigon uchelgeisiol, ond dywedodd yr ymddiriedolaeth ei fod yn rhy uchelgeisiol ac na allai fforddio'r costau refeniw. Dywed y bwrdd iechyd lleol na all fforddio'r costau cyfalaf a ddaw gyda chynllun mwy uchelgeisiol. Rhagwelir y bydd ganddo orwariant o £1 filiwn erbyn diwedd eleni, ac y bydd gan yr ymddiriedolaeth orwariant o £1.6 miliwn. Pa bryd y gwnewch chi eistedd i lawr gyda'ch Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'i berswadio i ystyried dull ariannu'r gwasanaeth iechyd ym mhrifddinas y wlad hon?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y rhai sydd wedi byw yng Nghaerdydd drwy gydol eu hoes, fel fi, yn fwy na chyfarwydd â thu mewn a thu allan Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd, am resymau amlwg. Hyd yn oed heddiw, mae'n debyg ei fod yn un o'r 20 ysbyty pwysicaf yng Nghymru o ran mynychwyr, oherwydd y nifer enfawr o gleifion allanol fydd yn mynychu ei amryfal glinigau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynllun i gael cyfleuster modern ar

main CRI facility is still in abeyance because of the inability of the local health trust and the local health board to agree on the right way forward. Meetings are continuing in order to get value for money, and in order to discuss where the right place would be for a community hospital, whether the site is the right place for that hospital, and, if so, how to proceed given that the site is split and is on both sides of the road. Those matters continue to be the subject of negotiations.

**Irene James:** Do you agree that the new Caerphilly hospital will be a huge step forward in health provision for the people of my constituency, who suffer some of the highest levels of ill health in Wales? Do you also agree that investment in the reform of the health service across Wales has long been overdue, and that the cinderella health service under the Tories is now being turned around by a Labour Assembly Government working for people across the whole of Wales?

**The First Minister:** I am proud to be the First Minister of an administration that is trebling the annual allocation for capital investment in the health service, from around £100 million to £300 million by the end of the current budget round, which comes to an end in a couple of years' time. Among the major projects that will be funded is the new Caerphilly hospital, which is a project that has been on and off the stocks for the best part of the past 30 or 40 years but has never been built. I hope that that situation will be remedied soon and that it will fill in the gap between the hospitals that serve the Heads of the Valleys, such as the Prince Charles Hospital and Nevill Hall Hospital, and those on the M4 belt, such as the Royal Gwent Hospital, Llandough Hospital and the University Hospital of Wales. It will fill that long-standing gap. A new hospital in the mid-Valleys area is long overdue.

2.20 p.m.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais gyfarfod gyda Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Ceredigion. Mae ailfeddwl mawr wedi bod yn y bwrdd iechyd ynglŷn â dyfodol ysbytai

safle'r asgell orllewinol neu brif gyfleuster yr Ysbyty Brenhinol yn dal heb ei benderfynu oherwydd anallu'r ymddiriedolaeth iechyd lleol a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol i gytuno ar y ffordd iawn ymlaen. Mae cyfarfodydd yn parhau er mwyn sicrhau gwerth am arian, ac er mwyn trafod ble fyddai'r lle iawn ar gyfer ysbyty cymunedol, ai'r safle hwn yw'r lle iawn ar gyfer yr ysbyty hwnnw, ac, os felly, sut i symud ymlaen gan gofio bod y safle wedi'i rannu ac ar y ddwy ochr i'r ffordd. Mae'r materion hynny'n dal i fod yn destun trafodaethau.

**Irene James:** A gytunwch y bydd yr ysbyty newydd yng Nghaerffili'n gam enfawr ymlaen yn y ddarpariaeth iechyd i bobl fy etholaeth i, sydd yn dioddef rhai o'r lefelau uchaf o afiechyd yng Nghymru? A gytunwch hefyd ei bod yn hen bryd, ers tro maith, buddsoddi yn niwygiad y gwasanaeth iechyd ledled Cymru, a bod y gwasanaeth iechyd geiniog a dimai o dan y Toriaid bellach yn cael ei droi o'i amgylch gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn gweithio dros bobl ar hyd a lled Cymru gyfan?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn Brif Weinidog ar weinyddiaeth sydd yn treblu'r dyraniad blynyddol ar gyfer buddsoddi cyfalaf yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, o ryw £100 miliwn i £300 miliwn erbyn diwedd y cylch cyllideb cyfredol, a ddaw i ben ymhen blwyddyn neu ddwy. Ymysg y prosiectau newydd y telir amdanynt mae ysbyty newydd Caerffili, sef prosiect a fu ar ac oddi ar y gweill ers y rhan orau o 30 neu 40 mlynedd ond nas adeiladwyd byth. Gobeithiaf yr unionir y sefyllfa honno'n fuan ac y gwnaiff llenwi'r bwlch rhwng yr ysbytai sydd yn gwasanaethu Blaenau'r Cymoedd, megis Ysbyty'r Tywysog Charles ac Ysbyty Nevill Hall, a'r rhai ar lain yr M4, megis Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, Ysbyty Llandochoau ac Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru. Bydd yn llenwi'r bwlch hwnnw sy'n bodoli ers cyhyd. Mae'n hen bryd cael ysbyty newydd yng nghanol ardal y Cymoedd.

**Elin Jones:** Last week, I had a meeting with the Ceredigion Local Health Board. There has been a major rethink within the health board regarding the future of Tregaron and

Tregaron ac Aberteifi. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd wedi gwranddo ar yr 11,000 o bobl a lofnododd ddeiseb i gadw'r ddau ysbyty. Nid wyf yn gwybod a fuoch chi neu'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol yn ymyrryd yn y mater hwn, ond os gwnaethoch, diolch. Gofynnaf ichi sicrhau bod trafodaeth lawn a chyhoeddus ar unrhyw newidiadau i'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir o'r ddau ysbyty os fydd angen newidiadau o'r fath.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn i glywed eich diolchgarwch. Nid fi a ymyrrodd; efallai mai Brian a wnaeth, neu efallai nad oedd ymyrraeth. Efallai bod rhyw elfen o— *[Torri ar draws.]*

Fodd bynnag, os ydych chi'n hapus, yr wyf i yn hapus. Yr wyf yn awyddus i weld dyfodol llewyrchus i ysbytai cymunedol angenrheidiol, fel y rhai sydd yn gwasanaethu ardal Aberteifi—yr wyf yn defnyddio'r ysbyty hwnnw, gan fod gennyf garafán yn yr ardal—a Thregaron. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod yr ymgynghoriad gyda'r bobl leol yn digwydd; mae'r bobl leol wedyn yn gallu dwyn perswâd ar y bobl mewn awdurdod, sydd yn gyfrifol am gynllunio ond nad oes ganddynt y wybodaeth leol sydd gan y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau iechyd.

**Ann Jones:** The future of community hospitals is often one of the issues that will galvanise a constituency, or a community, as is currently the case in Prestatyn. The community has responded to a public consultation from the local health board regarding the closure of its community hospital. Given the recent announcement by the Secretary of State for Health in England indicating that she intends to review community hospitals, will you be talking to your colleague, Brian Gibbons, regarding the issue of whether, before LHBs—such as Denbighshire LHB—make any decisions about the future of community hospitals, we look at improving diagnostic treatment centres in communities and thus bring much needed services into the heart of those communities, ensuring that the community has the medical services that it requires for the future?

Cardigan hospitals. The health board has listened to the 11,000 people who signed a petition to keep those hospitals open. I do not know if you or the Minister for Health and Social Services intervened in this matter, but if you did, thank you. I ask you to ensure that a full and public discussion takes place on any changes to the services that will be delivered from those two hospitals if such changes are required.

**The First Minister:** I am pleased to hear your gratitude. I did not intervene; Brian might have done so, or there may have been no intervention. Perhaps there was an element of— *[Interruption.]*

However, if you are pleased, I am pleased. I am eager to see a prosperous future for essential community hospitals such as those serving the Cardigan area—which I use myself, as I have a caravan in the area—and Tregaron. The important point is that the consultation with the local people takes place; local people can then bring pressure to bear on those in authority, who are responsible for planning but who do not have the local knowledge of the people who use the health services.

**Ann Jones:** Yn aml, dyfodol ysbytai cymunedol yw un o'r materion a fydd yn sbarduno etholaeth, neu gymuned, fel sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd ym Mhrestatyn. Mae'r gymuned wedi ymateb i ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol gyda golwg ar gau ei ysbyty cymunedol. O wybod am y cyhoeddiad diweddar gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd yn Lloegr yn nodi ei bod yn bwriadu adolygu ysbytai cymunedol, a fyddwch chi'n siarad â'ch cydweithiwr, Brian Gibbons, ynghylch a fyddwn ni, cyn i'r BILlau—megis BILl Sir Ddinbych—wneud unrhyw benderfyniadau am ddyfodol ysbytai cymunedol, yn edrych ar y mater o wella canolfannau triniaethau diagnostig mewn cymunedau a thrwy hynny ddod â gwasanaethau y mae mawr angen amdanynt i galon y cymunedau hynny, gan sicrhau bod gan y gymuned y gwasanaethau meddygol sydd eu hangen arni ar gyfer y dyfodol?



**The First Minister:** I believe that the situation in Prestatyn is not unlike that in Blaenau Ffestiniog, or the previous situation in Tregaron and Cardigan, where a great deal of concern has been expressed about the future of a much-loved community hospital. I think that everyone accepts that you have to modernise, that you have to change and that you cannot freeze the pattern that we have sometimes inherited from our Edwardian, or even Victorian, ancestors in terms of hospital provision. On the other hand, the general principle is that we want hospital services to be provided as close to home and with the shortest journey time possible and for as wide a range as possible. Those can be before you go into a big overnight-stay-type hospital as an in-patient by way of diagnostics and therapies, or they may be for rehabilitation after you have done your acute phase by staying a week or a fortnight in a hospital after an operation. If possible, the diagnostics, therapies, and rehabilitation should take place either in your own home or, if that is not possible, in a hospital as near to your own home as is practical in health terms.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First Minister, in your response to Elin Jones, you expressed a great degree of delight that the Government might have intervened to keep a hospital open in her area. If the Government is willing, or has the ability, to intervene to keep a hospital open, surely, likewise, you should intervene to try to broker a deal in Cardiff, where the LHB cannot agree with the NHS trust regarding what to do with the Cardiff Royal Infirmary site. It is not good enough for you to say that you are willing to intervene where something is as politically controversial as the closure of a hospital, but then sit back and not show any willingness to intervene in the local dispute in Cardiff where patient care is not being delivered to the highest standard because those services that the LHB wants to provide on that site have no prospect of being delivered at present or in the foreseeable future.

**The First Minister:** I think that you are overdoing the parallel with the situation in

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf fod y sefyllfa ym Mhrestatyn yn ddigon tebyg i'r sefyllfa ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog, neu'r sefyllfa flaenorol yn Nhregaron ac Aberteifi, lle mynegwyd cryn bryder am ddyfodol ysbyty cymunedol a oedd yn agos iawn at galon y bobl. Credaf fod pawb yn derbyn bod yn rhaid moderneiddio, bod yn rhaid newid ac na allwch rewi'r patrwm yr ydym weithiau wedi'i etifeddu gan ein hynafiaid o oes Edward, neu o oes Fictoria hyd yn oed, o ran y ddarpariaeth mewn ysbytai. Ar y llaw arall, yr egwyddor gyffredinol yw ein bod am i wasanaethau ysbyty gael eu darparu cyn agosed at ein cartrefi â phosibl a chyda'r amser teithio lleiaf posibl ac ar gyfer amrediad mor eang â phosibl. Gall y rheiny fod cyn ichi fynd i ysbyty mawr o fath aros-dros-nos fel claf mewnol drwy wasanaeth diagnosteg a therapïau, neu gallant fod ar gyfer ailsefydlu ar ôl ichi fynd drwy'ch cyfnod aciwt o aros wythnos neu bythefnos mewn ysbyty ar ôl cael llawdriniaeth. Os oes modd, dylai'r gwasanaeth diagnosteg, y therapïau a'r ailsefydlu ddigwydd naill yn eich cartref eich hun neu, os nad yw hynny'n bosibl, mewn ysbyty sydd gyn agosed i'ch cartref ag sy'n ymarferol yn nhermau iechyd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brif Weinidog, yn eich ymateb i Elin Jones, mynegwyd cryn foddhad gennych fod y Llywodraeth o bosibl wedi ymyrryd i gadw ysbyty ar agor yn ei hardal. Os yw'r Llywodraeth yn fodlon, neu â'r gallu i ymyrryd i gadw ysbyty ar agor, oni ddylech, yn yr un modd, ymyrryd i geisio dod i gytundeb yng Nghaerdydd, lle na all y BILL gytuno gydag Ymddiriedolaeth y GIG ynghylch beth i'w wneud gyda safle Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd. Nid yw'n ddigon da ichi ddweud eich bod yn fodlon ymyrryd mewn mater sydd mor wleidyddol ddadleuol â chau ysbyty, ond wedyn eistedd yn ôl a pheidio â dangos unrhyw barodrwydd i ymyrryd yn yr anghydfod lleol yng Nghaerdydd lle nad yw cleifion yn derbyn gofal o'r safon uchaf oherwydd nad oes gobaith y bydd y gwasanaethau hynny y mae'r BILL am eu darparu ar y safle hwnnw yn cael eu darparu ar hyn o bryd nac yn y dyfodol agos.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf eich bod yn gorwneud y tebygrwydd gyda'r sefyllfa yn

Tregaron and Cardigan. I naturally welcomed the fact that Elin Jones was now, as a constituency Member, happy with the outcome of what was, at one time, a vexed situation of public opposition to the proposals that had come from the LHB and the trust. I was not claiming any of the credit for that because I do not know the details, although Brian may well know.

As regards the situation in Cardiff, there is a fundamental opposition between the trust, the LHB and, possibly, the community health council, as to what to do with the Cardiff Royal Infirmary site—or the sites on both sides of the road—and whether the whole concept of the community hospital for eastern Cardiff, which was one of the conditions that William Hague and then Jon Owen Jones laid down for the closure of CRI as a major hospital, should be provided on that site. However, the argument has moved on to whether the hospital, because the population of eastern Cardiff has moved out towards St Mellons, Llanedeyrn, Pentwyn and so forth, should be more accessible to them by being further out. Until we have agreement on some of those big issues, there is nothing to intervene about. However, I hope that meetings which are currently taking place will result in agreement. We are talking about some meetings which are imminent to try to achieve agreement.

Nhregaron ac Aberteifi. Yn naturiol, yr oeddwn yn croesawu'r ffaith fod Elin Jones yn awr, fel Aelod etholaethol, yn hapus gyda chanlyniad yr hyn a oedd, ar un cyfnod, yn sefyllfa ddyrys o wrthwynebiad cyhoeddus i gynigion y BILl a'r ymddiriedolaeth. Nid oeddwn yn hawlio unrhyw clod am hynny gan nad ydwyf yn gwybod y manylion, ond efallai fod Brian yn gwybod.

Gyda golwg ar y sefyllfa yng Nghaerdydd, mae gwrthwynebiad sylfaenol rhwng yr ymddiriedolaeth, y BILl ac, o bosibl, y cyngor iechyd cymuned, ynghylch beth i'w wneud gyda safle Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd—neu'r safleoedd ar y naill ochr i'r ffordd—ac a ddylai'r cysyniad cyfan o ysbyty cymunedol ar gyfer Dwyrain Caerdydd, a oedd yn un o'r amodau a osodwyd gan William Hague ac wedyn Jon Owen Jones wrth gau YBC fel prif ysbyty, gael ei ddarparu ar y safle hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddadl wedi symud ymlaen i'r cwestiwn a ddylai'r ysbyty, oherwydd bod poblogaeth dwyrain Caerdydd wedi symud allan tuag at Llaneirwg, Llanedern, Pentwyn ac ati, fod yn fwy hygyrch iddynt trwy fod ymhellach allan. Hyd nes y cawn gytundeb ar rai o'r ystyriaethau mawr hyn, nid oes dim i ymyrryd yn ei gylch. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd cyfarfodydd sy'n cael eu cynnal ar hyn o bryd yn arwain at gytundeb. Yr ydym yn siarad am rai cyfarfodydd sydd ar fin cael eu cynnal er mwyn cael cytundeb.

### **Cyffuriau Gofal Iechyd Healthcare Drugs**

**Q4 Glyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the availability of healthcare drugs in mid and west Wales? OAQ1282(FM)

**C4 Glyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y cyffuriau gofal iechyd sydd ar gael yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin? OAQ1282(FM)

**The First Minister:** The availability of medicines in mid and west Wales is no different to that in other parts of Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'r meddyginiaethau sydd ar gael yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yn wahanol i'r rhai sydd ar gael yng ngweddill Cymru.

**Glyn Davies:** The National Institute of Clinical Excellence is proposing that anticholinesterase drugs, such as Aricept, Exelon and Reminyl, should be withdrawn from those suffering in the early stages of Alzheimer's disease. This is causing great distress to sufferers and to carers,

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol (NICE) yn argymhell na ddylai cyffuriau gwrthgolinesteras, megis Aricept, Exelon a Reminyl, gael eu rhoi mwyach i'r rhai sy'n dioddef o symptomau cynnar clefyd Alzheimer. Mae hyn yn peri trallod mawr i ddiodefwyr ac i ofalwyr, yn

particularly, and to consultants who, in many cases, believe that these drugs would delay the onset of the disease. If NICE confirms its proposal—which seems to be rather cruel—will you look carefully at this before accepting this proposal and supporting its implementation in Wales?

**The First Minister:** Yes; it is an important issue. Your information may be slightly out of date, Glyn. You are right that NICE did review its original 2001 approval and sought to question the clinical-effectiveness and cost-effectiveness of those drugs. However, responses received during the consultation suggested that the drugs may be effective for certain groups. NICE decided to issue a revised appraisal consultation document recommending that these drugs continue to be prescribed for patients with moderate Alzheimer's disease. It requested responses to its revised consultation document by 13 February, and plans to issue its final guidance by July 2006. Until then, NICE's original positive 2001 guidance remains in force.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnewch chi dderbyn bod yr holl fater hwn wedi peri pryder a gofid mawr i nifer o bobl sy'n gofalu am aelodau'r teulu sy'n dioddef gwahanol ffurfiau o salwch sy'n golygu eu bod yn ei chael yn anodd i ofalu am eu hunain? A ydych yn cydnabod bod y gofalwyr hyn yn gwneud gwaith eithriadol o bwysig, ac mai cyfrifoldeb unrhyw lywodraeth yw sicrhau eu bod yn cael pob cefnogaeth bosibl, ac yn sicr yn cael cyfle i gael gorffwys o'r beichiau hyn sydd ganddynt yn barhaus? A wnewch chi ymrwymo, ar ran y Llywodraeth, i sicrhau bod y cyfleoedd hynny ganddynt ym mhob rhan o Gymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf. Ymddiheuraf am beidio â datgan buddiant wrth ateb cwestiwn Ieuan Wyn Jones yn gynharach. Yn ogystal, bydd angen imi ddatgan buddiant wrth ateb eich cwestiwn chi yn awr.

Mae'n bwysig bod gofalwyr y bobl sy'n dioddef clefyd Alzheimer, a'r cleifion eu

neilltuol, ac i ymgynghorwyr sydd, mewn sawl achos, yn credu y byddai'r cyffuriau hyn yn arafu cychwyniad y clefyd. Os bydd NICE yn cadarnhau ei argymhelliad—sydd yn ymddangos braidd yn greulon—a wnewch chi edrych yn ofalus ar hyn cyn derbyn y cynnig hwn a chyn cefnogi gweithredu'r argymhelliad yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf; mae'n fater pwysig. Efallai fod eich gwybodaeth ychydig yn hen, Glyn. Yr ydych yn iawn yn dweud bod NICE wedi adolygu ei gymeradwyaeth wreiddiol yn 2001 ac wedi ceisio cwestiynu effeithiolrwydd clinigol a chost effeithiolrwydd y cyffuriau hynny. Serch hynny, yr oedd ymatebion a dderbyniwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad yn awgrymu y gall y cyffuriau fod yn effeithiol ar gyfer rhai grwpiau. Penderfynodd NICE gyhoeddi dogfen ymgynghori ddiwygiedig a oedd yn argymhell parhau i ddefnyddio'r cyffuriau hyn i gleifion gyda chlefyd Alzheimer cymedrol. Gofynnwyd am ymatebion i'r ddogfen ymgynghori ddiwygiedig erbyn 13 Chwefror, a bwriedir cyhoeddi ei arweiniad terfynol erbyn Gorffennaf 2006. Tan hynny, mae arweiniad cadarnhaol gwreiddiol 2001 NICE yn dal mewn grym.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you accept that this whole issue has caused great concern and worry to a great number of people who provide care for family members suffering from various forms of illness that mean that they find it difficult to care for themselves? Do you acknowledge that these carers carry out an exceptionally important task, and that the responsibility of any government is to ensure that they receive every possible support, and that they are given an opportunity for respite from the continual care? Will you make a commitment, on behalf of the Government, to ensure that carers have these opportunities for respite in every part of Wales?

**The First Minister:** Yes. I apologise for the fact that I did not declare an interest while answering Ieuan Wyn Jones's question earlier. I also declare an interest in responding to your question now.

It is important that carers of people suffering from Alzheimer's, and the patients

hunain, ymhlith y grwpiau a fydd ar eu hennill oherwydd y datganiad a wnaeth Brian Gibbons ynglŷn â'r hyn a wnawn i ariannu'r bobl sy'n gofalu am bobl anabl yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad y bu'n rhaid iddo ei wneud o safbwynt torri'r addewid a oedd yn y maniffesto. Byddant, yn sicr, ar eu hennill mewn ffordd nad oedd modd ei ragweld pan luniwyd y maniffesto yn 2003.

2.30 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** Your answer to Glyn Davies is, frankly, wrong. If you believe it to be correct, you are living in a fantasy world. My constituents in Brecon and Radnorshire, and a great number of patients in south Wales, cannot get access to beta interferon, the reason being that the money for beta interferon in south Wales has run out. However, if I represented Wrexham or somewhere in north Wales, those constituents would be able to get beta interferon, because they have not yet run out of money for that drug in north Wales. It is not correct for you to say that there is no difference in access to drugs for people in mid and west Wales; there is a difference—my constituents cannot get beta interferon, regardless of what their consultants say. Therefore, will you apologise to those people for misleading the Assembly by saying that they can get access to drugs when they cannot do so? More importantly, will you do something about it?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I ask Kirsty Williams to reconsider the accusation that the First Minister is misleading the Assembly.

**Kirsty Williams:** If I heard correctly, the First Minister said that there was no differentiation in terms of access to drugs for people living in mid and west Wales. I would contend that there is a difference.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That is a matter of argument—it is not a matter on which to accuse any Member, whether it is the First Minister or anyone else, of misleading the Assembly. That imputes an intention, which—and I am looking the First Minister in the eye—I am sure he does not

themselves, are among the groups that will benefit as a result of the statement made by Brian Gibbons regarding how we will fund the careres of disabled people following the announcement about breaking the manifesto pledge. They certainly benefit in a way that was not anticipated when the 2003 manifesto was written.

**Kirsty Williams:** A dweud y gwir, mae eich ateb i Glyn Davies yn anghywir. Os credwch ei fod yn gywir, yr ydych yn byw mewn byd o ffantasi. Mae rhai o fy etholwyr ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed a nifer fawr o gleifion yn Ne Cymru, nad ydynt yn gallu cael gafael ar beta interferon, a hynny oherwydd fod yr arian ar gyfer beta interferon yn ne Cymru wedi dod i ben. Fodd bynnag, petawn yn cynrychioli Wrecsam neu rywle arall yn y gogledd, byddai'r etholwyr hynny'n gallu cael beta interferon, oherwydd nad yw'r arian ar gyfer y cyffur hwnnw wedi dod i ben yn y gogledd hyd yma. Nid yw'n iawn ichi ddweud nad oes gwahaniaeth mewn mynediad at gyffuriau i bobl yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin; mae gwahaniaeth—nid yw fy etholwyr i yn gallu cael beta interferon, beth bynnag a ddywed eu hymgyngorwyr. Felly, a wnewch chi ymddiheuro i'r bobl hynny am gamarwain y Cynulliad drwy ddweud y gallant gael gafael ar gyffuriau pan na allant wneud hynny? Yn bwysicach byth, a wnewch chi rywbeth am hynny?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnaf i Kirsty Williams ailystyried y cyhuddiad bod y Prif Weinidog yn camarwain y Cynulliad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Os clywais yn gywir, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog nad oes unrhyw wahaniaethu o ran cael gafael ar gyffuriau ar gyfer y bobl sy'n byw yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Byddwn yn dadlau bod yna wahaniaeth.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mater o farn yw hynny—nid mater ydyw i gyhuddo unrhyw Aelod o gamarwain y Cynulliad, boed yr aelod hwnnw'n Brif Weinidog neu'n unrhyw un arall. Mae hynny'n awgrymu bwriad—ac yr wyf yn edrych yn syth i lygad y Prif Weinidog—yr wyf yn sicr nad oes ganddo.

have.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am willing to withdraw that comment. I am sure that the First Minister will wish to put the record straight.

**The First Minister:** Officials at Health Commission Wales have been in discussion with the trust to help resolve the difficulties to which you refer. My original statement in answer to Glyn Davies was a statement in principle, which remains the case. However, we are aware that the Cardiff and Swansea centres are experiencing such demand that they have reached maximum capacity. Our officials at HCW have been in discussion with those trusts to help resolve these difficulties. We are reviewing the position of disease modifying therapies for MS, with a view to alleviating current pressures on the NHS.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn fodlon tynnu'r sylw'n ôl. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Prif Weinidog am egluro'r hyn a ddywedodd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae swyddogion yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru wedi bod yn trafod gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth er mwyn helpu i ddatrys yr anawsterau yr ydych yn cyfeirio atynt. Yr oedd fy natganiad gwreiddiol wrth ateb Glyn Davies yn ddatganiad mewn egwyddor, ac mae hynny'n dal yn wir. Serch hynny, yr ydym yn ymwybodol fod canolfannau Caerdydd ac Abertawe'n profi cymaint o alw fel eu bod wedi defnyddio'u holl gapasiti. Mae ein swyddogion yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru wedi bod yn trafod gyda'r ymddiriedolaethau hynny i geisio datrys yr anawsterau hyn. Yr ydym yn diwygio sefyllfa therapïau addasu clefydau ar gyfer MS, gyda'r nod o liniaru'r pwysau cyfredol ar y GIG.

### **Cronfeydd Strwythurol Ewropeaidd European Structural Funds**

**Q5 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the progress of the convergence programme for European structural funds? OAQ1285(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Cabinet agreed the principles and priorities to guide the development and implementation of the new structural fund programmes, to run from 1 January, including the convergence programme—the big daddy of them all. These have been subsequently agreed, in broad terms, with our external stakeholders group, and considered by the Committee on European and External Affairs and the Economic Development and Transport Committee.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sure that the First Minister is aware that the European Commission has made it clear that it expects, later this month, that the budget for convergence funding—or for the whole European structural funds—will probably be agreed in April, and that the programmes will then be ready to be considered in September. Since the First Minister has made it clear that he believes that there may come a stage

**C5 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynnydd y rhaglen gydyfeirio ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd? OAQ1285(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunodd y Cabinet i'r egwyddorion a'r blaenoriaethau ar gyfer tywys y gwaith o ddatblygu a gweithredu rhaglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol newydd, i redeg o 1 Ionawr, gan gynnwys y rhaglen gydyfeirio—eu tad hwy oll. Cytunwyd ar y rhain wedyn, yn gyffredinol, gyda'n grŵp rhanddeiliaid allanol, ac fe'u hystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn sicr bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi nodi'n glir ei fod yn disgwyl, yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn, y bydd y gyllideb ar gyfer arian cydgyfeirio—neu ar gyfer yr holl gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd—yn cael ei chytuno arni yn fwy na thebyg ym mis Ebrill, ac y bydd y rhaglenni wedyn yn barod i'w hystyried ym mis Medi. Gan fod y Prif Weinidog wedi

where he needs to go to the Treasury for match funding, when does he expect to be in a position to do that?

**The First Minister:** What I said was that you never say 'never' in politics, and it is an issue to which we may wish to return. However, that must be done against the background of how different the new programme will be, as regards the call for match funding, compared with the ones that are running currently in their final year. Until we know the intervention rate, and until various other aspects of the programme to be agreed are known, it is impossible—indeed, it would be a waste of time—to approach the Treasury on this matter. However, I do not rule it out in the next few months. However, we must all accept that we are in a good position of having a new Objective 1 programme, resulting in an extra £1.3 billion coming to west Wales and the Valleys. We do not have to worry about negotiating a special Barnett plus arrangement, as that was solved in last November's budget, in which those receipts come automatically to us with full public expenditure cover.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** You were no doubt pleased, as I was, to hear Commissioner Hübner in Brussels tell us how pleased she was with the way that the current objective fund programme was working, particularly our ability to attract private match funding. Therefore, do you agree that we are moving forward to convergence on the basis of strength, that we will learn the lessons of the current programme, that we can look forward to a programme that focuses on issues such as the skills agenda and town-centre redevelopment in depressed Valleys communities, and that we have every reason for optimism?

**The First Minister:** You are right. I was at the same meeting as you, Jeff, as were several other Assembly Members. My head is almost swimming with the compliments that were paid by Commissioner Hübner regarding how we have administered the first round of Objective 1. If I had a disagreement with her, it was when she said that we were

datgan yn glir ei fod yn credu y gallai orfod mynd at y Trysorlys i gael arian cyfatebol, ryw bryd neu'i gilydd, pryd mae'n disgwyl y bydd mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd na ddylech byth ddweud 'byth' mewn gwleidyddiaeth, ac mae'n fater y byddwn am ddychwelyd ato o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, rhaid gwneud hynny yn erbyn y cefndir o ba mor wahanol fydd y rhaglen newydd, o ran y galw am arian cyfatebol, o'i gymharu â'r rhai sy'n rhedeg ar hyn o bryd yn eu blwyddyn olaf. Hyd nes y gwyddom y gyfradd ymyrryd, a hyd nes y gwyddom am agweddau amrywiol eraill y rhaglen y mae angen cytuno arnynt, mae'n amhosibl—yn wir, byddai'n wastraff ar amser—mynd at y Trysorlys ynghylch y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn diystyru hynny yn ystod y misoedd nesaf. Ond rhaid i bawb ohonom dderbyn ein bod mewn sefyllfa dda o ran bod gennym raglen Amcan 1 newydd, sy'n golygu £1.3 biliwn yn ychwanegol i orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Nid oes raid inni boeni am negodi trefniant Barnett a mwy arbennig, gan y cafodd hynny ei ddatrys yn y gyllideb fis Tachwedd diwethaf, lle daw'r derbynebaw hynny atom ni yn awtomatig gyda sicrwydd gwariant cyhoeddus llawn.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diau ichi fod yn falch, fel finnau, o glywed Comisiynydd Hübner ym Mrwsel yn dweud wrthym pa mor falch yr ydoedd o'r ffordd yr oedd y rhaglen amcan un bresennol yn gweithio, yn enwedig ein gallu i ddenu arian cyfatebol preifat. Felly, ydych chi'n cytuno ein bod yn symud tuag at gydgyfeirio ar sail cryfder, y byddwn yn dysgu gwersi'r rhaglen gyfredol, y gallwn edrych ymlaen at raglen sy'n canolbwyntio ar faterion megis yr agenda sgiliau ac ailddatblygu canol trefi yng nghymunedau dirwasgedig y Cymoedd a bod gennym bob rheswm dros fod yn optimistaidd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn iawn. Yr oeddwn yn yr un cyfarfod â chi, Jeff, ynghyd â sawl Aelod Cynulliad arall. Mae fy mhen yn troi bron gyda'r ganmoliaeth a gafwyd gan Gomisiynydd Hübner gyda golwg ar y ffordd yr ydym wedi gweinyddu rownd gyntaf Amcan 1. Os oeddwn yn anghytuno â hi ar unrhyw beth, yr oedd hynny pan

doing it so well now that we do not need to change anything for phase 2, whereas, in fact, we want to change things by being more strategic and trying to ensure that the community-based programmes that we want to encourage are complementary to the big strategic programmes that we believe will provide us with more bang for the buck from the second £1.3 billion than the present £1.3 billion. The key point is the one that you have just raised, Jeff, about private-sector match funding. We have done extremely well in getting in a high level of private-sector match funding. In the new programme, we would like to see that level go even higher. Clearly, this is the issue: if you can get the maximum amount of private-sector match funding in, then it reduces any need for thinking about how we handle public-sector match funding among ourselves, local authorities and other public bodies in Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** Objective 1 funding has obviously paid an important role in north Wales, particularly in the Conwy area, where initiatives such as the DAWN project have provided much needed training and support to disadvantaged people. What guarantees can you give me that the next round of Objective 1 funding will continue to support schemes such as this and that match funding for the convergence programme will not be detrimental to education and health services in north Wales?

**The First Minister:** It is too early to give guarantees at the moment, because you have to remember that there are 3,000 projects which have been, are, or will be, funded by Objective 1. That is an awful lot of projects, all of which would no doubt like us to say, 'And you will get the same funding for the next seven years as well'. Things never happen like that, because we have to test the projects' value for money, strategic value and so forth. The particular project that you referred to may well be an extremely good project and if you would like to write to me about it—or to Andrew Davies, if it is on his side of the house—to put in a plea on its behalf, please do so. However, what I said earlier was about trying to have perhaps not 3,000 projects in the next seven years but rather a smaller number than that, without

ddywedodd ein bod yn gwneud mor dda fel nad oes raid inni newid unrhyw beth ar gyfer cam 2, lle yr ydym ni, mewn gwirionedd, am newid pethau drwy fod yn fwy strategol a cheisio sicrhau bod y rhaglenni cymunedol yr ydym am eu hannog yn ategu'r rhaglenni strategol mawr a fydd, yn ein barn ni, yn gwneud gwell defnydd o'r ail £1.3 biliwn na'r hyn a wnaed gyda'r £1.3 biliwn presennol. Y pwynt allweddol yw'r un wnaethoch ei godi gynnu, Jeff, am arian cyfatebol o'r sector preifat. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo'n eithriadol o dda i ddenu lefel uchel o arian cyfatebol o'r sector preifat. Yn y rhaglen newydd, hoffem weld y lefel hon yn codi eto. Yn amlwg, dyma wraidd y mater; os gellir cael y swm uchaf posibl o arian cyfatebol o'r sector preifat, yna does dim angen meddwl cymaint am sut yr ydym yn delio gydag arian cyfatebol o'r sector cyhoeddus ymysg ein gilydd, awdurdodau lleol a chyrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru.

**Brynle Williams:** Yn amlwg, mae arian Amcan 1 wedi chwarae swyddogaeth bwysig yn y Gogledd, yn enwedig yn ardal Conwy, lle mae cynlluniau fel y prosiect DAWN wedi darparu hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth hollbwysig i bobl ddifreintiedig. Pa sicrwydd a allwch ei roi i mi y bydd y rownd nesaf o arian Amcan 1 yn parhau i gefnogi cynlluniau o'r fath ac na fydd arian cyfatebol ar gyfer y rhaglen gydgyfeirio yn andwyol i wasanaethau addysg a iechyd yn y Gogledd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n rhy gynnar i wneud unrhyw addewidion ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd rhaid i chi gofio bod 3,000 o brosiectau wedi derbyn arian, yn cael eu hariannu ar hyn o bryd, neu a fydd yn cael eu hariannu gan Amcan 1. Dyna i chi beth wmbreth o brosiectau. Mae'n siŵr y byddai pob un ohonynt yn falch o'n clywed yn dweud, 'Cewch yr un lefel o gyllid am y saith mlynedd nesaf eto'. Nid yw pethau byth yn gweithio fel hynny, oherwydd rhaid i ni brofi gwerth am arian y prosiect a'i werth strategol ac yn y blaen. Mae'n ddigon posibl bod y prosiect penodol y cyfeiriasoch ato yn brosiect ardderchog, a phe hoffech ysgrifennu ataf—neu at Andrew Davies os yw'n disgyn dan adain ei swyddogaeth ef—i ddadlau dros y cynllun, yna mae croeso i chi wneud hynny. Serch hynny, dywedais ynghynt nad ceisio

eliminating the possibility of community groups coming up with really valuable projects. We would like those, however, to be complementary to major strategic projects that we hope will have more bang for the buck.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that, with almost £100 million committed to over 140 projects across Conwy and Gwynedd, Objective 1 European structural funds have been a Labour success in the area? Do you also agree that—despite unwavering statements of doom and gloom from the opposition regarding the next round of funding—it is Labour that will continue to deliver real change, regenerating our poorest communities, as I have already seen happening in Maesgerchan in Bangor and the Tudno and Mostyn wards in Llandudno?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know that we have been away for a week, but there is no need to shout. We are in a new building; there is no need to shout.

**The First Minister:** I agree that the proposition that, in some way, the administration of Objective 1 by a Labour administration would be biased against certain areas of Wales because they do not elect a Labour local authority or whatever, certainly does not appear to be the case, as can be seen throughout Gwynedd and adjoining areas of north Wales. It is a success story, and a success story that is based on partnership between communities, us, and different public bodies, which have got stuck into the local partnerships and made them work really well.

There is no question about the proposition that there was a lot of doom and gloom talked. I often feel that the frustration of opposition parties in the run-up to the next Assembly elections is based on the fact that they had hoped to be able to say, 'And we are not getting Objective 1 the second time around'. Now that they find that we are getting Objective 1 the second time around, they are flailing around to try to find another theme and getting increasingly into minor

cael 3,000 o brosiectau dros y saith mlynedd nesaf yw'r nod, ond yn hytrach nifer llawer iawn yn llai, ond ni fydd hynny ar draul y posibilrwydd bod grwpiau cymunedol yn llunio prosiectau gwirioneddol gwerthfawr. Byddai'n well gennym, serch hynny, bod y rhain yn ategu prosiectau strategol mawr a fydd yn creu mwy o effaith o'r arian a warir.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A ydych yn cytuno, gan gofio bod bron i £100 miliwn wedi'i ddyrranu i dros 140 o brosiectau ledled Conwy a Gwynedd, bod cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd Amcan 1 wedi bod yn un o lwyddiannau Llafur yn yr ardal? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno—er gwaethaf ymdrechion cyson y gwrthbleidiau i godi bwganod am y rownd nesaf o gyllid—mai Llafur fydd yn parhau i greu newidiadau go iawn, gan adfywio ein cymunedau tlotaf, fel yr wyf wedi gweld eisoes ym Maesgeirchen ym Mangor a wardiau Tudno a Mostyn yn Llandudno?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn gwybod ein bod wedi bod i ffwrdd am wythnos ond nid oes angen gweiddi. Yr ydym mewn adeilad newydd; nid oes angen codi llais.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno nad yw'n dal dŵr, y byddai gweinyddiaeth Lafur sy'n gweinyddu Amcan 1 yn rhoi rhai ardaloedd o Gymru dan anfantais, mewn rhyw ffordd, oherwydd nad ydynt yn ethol awdurdod lleol Lafur neu beth bynnag, ac fe brofir hynny yng Ngwynedd a'r ardaloedd cyfagos yn y Gogledd. Dyma stori o lwyddiant. Stori o lwyddiant sy'n seiliedig ar bartneriaethau rhwng cymunedau, rhyngom ni a rhwng cyrff cyhoeddus gwahanol, sydd wedi gweithio'n galed ar y partneriaethau lleol er mwyn iddynt allu gweithio'n dda iawn.

Nid oes dwywaith amdani bod llawer o godi bwganod wedi digwydd. Yr wyf yn teimlo'n aml bod y gwrthbleidiau'n rhwystredig iawn wrth ddynesu at etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Yr oeddent wedi gobeithio cael clochdar, 'Ac nid ydym am gael ail rownd o Amcan 1'. Nawr eu bod nhw'n gwybod y byddwn yn cael Amcan 1 am yr eildro, maent yn mynd rownd a rownd mewn cylchoedd yn chwilio am thema arall ac yn canolbwyntio ar bigo mân feiau yn y mater hwn yn hytrach nag



nitpicks in this area rather than looking at the big picture. The big picture is that we have delivered and have continued to deliver Objective 1.

edrych ar y darlun mawr. Mae'r darlun mawr yn profi ein bod wedi cyflawni pethau ac yr ydym am barhau i ddarparu Amcan 1.

### **Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru Government of Wales Bill**

**Q6 Helen Mary Jones:** What recent discussions has the First Minister held with UK Government Ministers regarding the Government of Wales Bill? OAQ1284(FM)

**C6 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru? OAQ1284(FM)

**The First Minister:** I have regular discussions with UK Government Ministers about this Bill and what it will mean for the future governance of Wales. We hope and trust that it will receive its Third Reading in the House of Commons later today.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU am y Mesur hwn a'r goblygiadau i'r drefn lywodraethu yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn disgwyl y bydd yn cael ei Drydydd Ddarlleniad yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn nes ymlaen heddiw.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Thank you for your answer, First Minister. I wonder whether, in those recent discussions, you had an opportunity to discuss amendments 20 and 21, which were tabled by Plaid Cymru. They would have enabled Assembly Members to swear their oath or make their affirmation to the people of Wales. Did you personally support those amendments, or is that another non-devolved matter about which you will not tell us what you think?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolch yn fawr am eich ateb, Brif Weinidog. Ys gwn i, yn ystod y trafodaethau diweddar hyn, a gawsoch gyfle i drafod gwelliannau 20 ac 21, a gyflwynwyd gan Blaid Cymru. Byddent wedi galluogi Gweinidogion y Cynulliad i dyngu llw neu gadarnhau i bobl Cymru. A oeddech yn cefnogi'r diwygiadau hyn eich hun, neu a yw hwn yn un arall o'r materion hynny sydd heb ei ddatganoli ac felly na fyddwch yn rhoi'ch barn ar y mater?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with the exact details of what that would mean in practical terms, but I have heard people from your party say, quite often, that we should have a settlement much more similar to that in Scotland. In fact, what is proposed here is very similar, if not identical, to the provisions that rule already in the Scottish Act and which are implemented by the Scottish Parliament, so perhaps you would care to look at that aspect.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn ddigon cyfarwydd ag union fanylion y goblygiadau ymarferol, ond yr wyf wedi clywed pobl o'ch plaid yn dweud, yn bur aml, y dylem gael setliad llawer tebycach i'r Alban. Yn wir, mae'r hyn a gynigir yn y fan hon yn debyg iawn, os nad yn union yr un peth, â'r darpariaethau sydd mewn grym eisoes yn Neddf yr Alban ac a weithredir gan Senedd yr Alban, felly, efallai yr hoffech daro golwg dros hynny.

**John Griffiths:** The Government of Wales Bill will bring new opportunities for Assembly Members and the Assembly Government to take forward legislation to improve public services and quality of life here in Wales. Do you agree therefore that all of us in the Assembly, as well as pressure

**John Griffiths:** Bydd Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru'n dod â chyfleoedd newydd yn ei sgil i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wthio deddfwriaeth yn ei blaen i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac ansawdd bywyd yma yng Nghymru. A ydych yn cytuno, felly, y dylem ni oll yn y Cynulliad,

groups, voluntary organisations, trade unions and business, think-tanks and civil society in general in Wales, should now be turning our minds to fresh thinking, new ideas, policies and proposals, so that we can have a wealth of ideas and proposals to feed into these new legislative opportunities to improve quality of life here in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I absolutely agree. At a certain stage—it could have been the Second Reading in the House of Commons a month or so ago, or it could be tomorrow on the assumption of what I said earlier about the Third Reading, which the Commons will be considering later today—people wake up to the fact that they can now, although it still has to go to the House of Lords, start writing manifestos with a view to what use they could make of the new powers in the Government of Wales Bill. We are already doing that on the Labour side, but it is not for me to tell other parties what they should do. You made the point about civil society also applying pressure; individual private Members can make use of this as well in the House of Commons. Bills can be brought forward more easily than before that might have a prospect of becoming legislation, in effect. Therefore, I hope that the whole of civil society will engage with this, as well as the four political parties.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Just a few moments ago, in answer to Helen Mary Jones, you spoke of the settlement that is currently going through in the Government of Wales Bill as being similar to that in Scotland. Yet, in three key respects, it is very different, and they are three key areas where the Government has not made out a case for the proposals it is putting forward. First, on the Orders in Council, there is no referendum for the Welsh people. Secondly, on the electoral system—quite different from Scotland, which has not denied this dual mandate—you are mimicking a system that was discredited in pre-revolution Ukraine, and thirdly, there is the d'Hondt committee structure, which was dropped like a hot potato in Scotland because it did not work. On those key features, why are we not following the Scottish example, when it had some success in ploughing a very

yn ogystal â grwpiau pwyso, mudiadau gwirfoddol, undebau llafur a busnesau, melinau trafod a chymdeithas sifil yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru ddechrau meddwl o'r newydd, gan lunio syniadau, polisiau a chynigion newydd fel bod gennym gronfa gyfoethog o syniadau a chynigion i fwydo'r cyfleoedd deddfwriaethol newydd hyn i wella ansawdd bywyd yma yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno gant y cant. Bydd pobl yn sylweddoli—efallai eu bod wedi sylweddoli'n barod yn ystod yr Ail Ddarlleniad yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin fis yn ôl, neu efallai fory, ar sail yr hyn a ddywedais ynghynt am y Trydydd Darlleniad a fydd gerbron Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn nes ymlaen heddiw—eu bod nawr yn gallu, er bod rhaid iddo fynd gerbron Tŷ'r Arglwyddi, dechrau ysgrifennu maniffestos gyda golwg ar y defnydd posibl o'r pwerau newydd ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru. Yr ydym ni yn y Blaid Lafur eisoes yn gwneud hynny, ond nid fy lle i yw dweud beth y dylai'r gwrthbleidiau ei wneud. Gwnaethoch y pwynt y dylai cymdeithas sifil hefyd fod yn rhoi pwysau; gall Aelodau preifat unigol fanteisio ar hyn hefyd yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Mewn gwirionedd, gellir cyflwyno Mesurau a all fod yn ddeddfwriaeth yn llawer haws nawr nag o'r blaen. Felly, mawr obeithiaf y bydd y gymdeithas sifil gyfan yn ymroi at hyn, yn ogystal â'r pedair plaid wleidyddol.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Rai munudau yn ôl, wrth ateb Helen Mary Jones, soniasoch fod y setliad ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn debyg i'r Alban. Ond, mewn tair ystyriaeth allweddol, mae'n wahanol iawn, a dyma'r tri maes allweddol lle nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno dadl dros y cynigion y mae'n eu rhoi gerbron. Yn gyntaf, ar Orchmynion y Cyfrin Gyngor, nid oes refferendwm yn cael ei gynnig i bobl Cymru. Yn ail, ar y system etholiadol—sydd yn wahanol iawn i'r Alban, gan nad ydynt wedi gwrthod y mandad deul hwn—yr ydych yn dynwared system a danseiliwyd yn yr Wcráin cyn y chwyldro, ac yn drydydd, mae'r strwythur pwyllgor d'Hondt a gafodd ei wthio o'r neilltu yn yr Alban yn ddigon diseremoni am nad oedd yn gweithio. Felly, ac ystyried y nodweddion allweddol hyn, pam nad ydym yn dilyn enghraifft yr Alban, oherwydd maent wedi

different furrow?

**The First Minister:** I believe that all these issues were matters that your colleagues in the House of Commons were intending to debate at great length, which is why they said that not enough time was allocated yesterday; they voted against the programmed motion so that they could have more time to discuss them. However, in the end, the debate finished an hour and a half early because there were not enough Conservative speakers to put some of these points to the House of Commons. I find it a bit odd that you should come here today and pretend that we need to debate these matters further when your colleagues in Westminster chose not to do so yesterday and everyone went home at 8.30 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** I wish I could say that I am surprised by the cavalier approach of the First Minister to what are serious questions. It is the same approach that we saw in Aberystwyth—we are not going to discuss the Iraq war—now, we are not even going to discuss central issues in the Government of Wales Bill that are of concern to the people of Wales. I put three, very specific, points to the First Minister, and we had his usual, flippant approach, which fails to address the issues that matter to the people of Wales. Come on now, let us have some answers to those three very important issues, and none of the flip responses that we have just had.

**The First Minister:** Oh dear, you are getting very angry, Nick, which I suppose is because you walked into a trap of which you were not aware and now you are trying to get out of it. Sorry, but it is your MPs who did not want to discuss these issues yesterday. When they were given the opportunity, they did not use it; they could have had another hour and a half's worth of debate, but everybody went home at 8.30 p.m. because your MPs—your colleagues—did not get up and make the points that you are now seeking to drag up here. I am very sorry that you are seeking to get a bit angry about this issue now, but your MPs had plenty of opportunity to debate and did not use it yesterday, which is a pretty poor show on your part.

cael cryn lwyddiant yn torri cwys wahanol iawn yn y fan honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf fod y rhain oll yn faterion yr oedd eich cydweithwyr yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn bwriadu eu trafod yn bur faith a dyna paham y dywedwyd nad oedd digon o amser wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer y mater ddoe; pleidleisiasant yn erbyn y cynigion ar y rhaglen er mwyn cael mwy o amser i'w trafod. Serch hynny, daeth y drafodaeth i ben awr a hanner yn gynnar oherwydd nad oedd digon o lefarwyr o'r Blaid Geidwadol yn bresennol i gyflwyno rhai o'r pwyntiau hyn i Dŷ'r Cyffredin. Yr wyf yn ei chael hi'n anodd deall pam eich bod chi'n dod yma heddiw i ofyn am gael trafod y materion hyn ymhellach pan ddewisodd eich cydweithwyr yn San Steffan beidio â gwneud hynny gan olygu bod pawb wedi mynd adref am 8.30 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Byddai'n dda gennyf ddweud fy mod wedi cael fy synnu gan agwedd ffwrdd-â-hi y Prif Weinidog i gwestiynau difrifol iawn. Ond dyma'r un agwedd yn union a welsom yn Aberystwyth—nid ydym am drafod y rhyfel yn Irac nawr—nid ydym ychwaith yn mynd i drafod materion canolog ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru sydd yn peri pryder i bobl Cymru. Rhoddais dri phwynt penodol iawn i'r Prif Weinidog, a'r ymateb a gefais oedd ei agwedd ddi-hid arferol sy'n osgoi mynd i'r afael â materion o bwys i bobl Cymru. Dewch nawr, gadewch inni gael atebion di-lol y tro hwn i'r tri mater pwysig iawn a godais.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O diar, yr ydych wedi colli'ch limpyn Nick. Ai'r rheswm am hyn yw eich bod wedi cerdded i mewn i drap nad oeddech yn ymwybodol ohono a nawr yr ydych yn ceisio dianc ohono. Mae'n flin gen i, ond eich ASau chi a benderfynodd nad oeddent eisiau trafod y mater ddoe. Pan gawsant y cyfle, ni wnaethant fanteisio arno; gallasant fod wedi cael awr a hanner ychwanegol o drafodaeth, ond aeth pawb adref am 8.30 p.m. oherwydd ni wnaeth eich ASau—eich cydweithwyr—sefyll i fyny a chyflwyno'r pwyntiau yr ydych yn ceisio'u llusgo allan yma. Mae'n flin iawn gen i eich bod chi'n ddig iawn am y materion hyn nawr, ond cafodd eich ASau ddigon o gyfle i'w trafod ddoe ond ni wnaethant fanteisio ar y

cyfle hynny, sy'n adlewyrchu'n wael arnoch chi.

**Nick Bourne:** It is very disappointing that you do not understand, after seven years here, the nature of devolution. We have a Chamber in Wales to discuss issues of importance to the people of Wales—what goes on in another place should not affect the answers that you should be giving to the questions that I am putting to you. I have specific questions: why is there to be no referendum on the Orders in Council? Why are we going for an electoral system that is not what has been used successfully in Scotland? Perhaps we already know the answer to that question: Labour benefits from that system in Scotland—ask Mr Peter Peacock about that. Why are we not having a system of proportionate balance for political parties on committees, and going for a d'Hondt system that favours the Labour Party, according to all the figures produced by the Members' research service? Could I have answers to those three specific questions? Forget Westminster; you are not in Westminster now. You are supposed to be here as a representative of the people of Wales and I remind you of that because you seem to forget it far too often. You should answer those three specific questions.

**The First Minister:** We have a Chamber and a building here, but you did not want either of them, Nick—I had better remind you of that. As regards the d'Hondt system, I answered this point last week, but you refused to accept my answer. The mathematics are not in your favour here—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I would like to hear the First Minister's answers.

**The First Minister:** I explained last week that, under certain assumptions, which you did not want to agree were assumptions, the d'Hondt system does not favour Labour, on the assumption that Labour gets a majority of two or four at the next elections. It is only if you are in a minority Government that you could say that the system would benefit you. It certainly does if you only have committees of six members. I accepted last week—I do

**Nick Bourne:** Gresyn o beth, ar ôl saith mlynedd, nad ydych yn deall natur datganoli o hyd. Mae gennym Siambr yng Nghymru i drafod materion o bwys i bobl Cymru—ni ddylai'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn rhywle arall effeithio ar yr atebion y dylech eu rhoi i'r cwestiynau yr wyf i'n eu gofyn. Mae gennyf gwestiynau penodol: pam nad oes refferendwm ar Orchmynion y Cyfrin Gyngor? Pam ein bod ni'n bwriadu dilyn system etholiadol sy'n wahanol i'r hyn sy'n llwyddiannus yn yr Alban? Efallai ein bod eisoes yn gwybod yr ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw: Mae Llafur yn elwa o'r system honno yn yr Alban—holwch Mr Peter Peacock am hynny. Pam nad ydym yn cael system sy'n darparu cydbwysedd cyfrannol i bleidiau gwleidyddol ar bwyllgorau, ac yn lle hynny'n sefydlu system d'Hondt sy'n ffafrio'r Blaid Lafur, yn ôl yr holl ffigurau a gynhyrchwyd gan wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau? A gaf i atebion i'r tri chwestiwn penodol hyn? Anghofiwch am San Steffan; nid ydych yn San Steffan nawr. Yr ydych chi i fod yma fel cynrychiolydd dros bobl Cymru, ac yr wyf yn eich atgoffa o hynny oherwydd mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn anghofio hynny'n llawer rhy aml. Dylech ateb y tri chwestiwn penodol hyn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennym Siambr ac adeilad yma, ond nid oeddech chi am weld yr un ohonynt, Nick—a gaf i eich atgoffa chi o hynny. Mewn perthynas â'r system d'Hondt, atebais y pwynt hwnnw yr wythnos diwethaf, ond ni wnaethoch dderbyn fy ateb. Nid yw'r ffigurau o'ch plaid yn y fan hon—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hoffwn glywed atebion Y Prif Weinidog.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Eglurais yr wythnos diwethaf, dan rai rhagdybiaethau, er nad oeddech chi'n barod i gytuno mai rhagdybiaethau oeddent, nad yw'r system d'Hondt yn ffafrio Llafur ar y rhagdybiaeth y bydd Llafur yn cael mwyafrif o ddau neu bedwar adeg yr etholiad nesaf. Dim ond os ydych mewn Llywodraeth â lleiafrif y gallech ddweud y byddai'r system o fantais i chi. Mae'n sicr o wneud hynny os oes gennyh

not know why I have to repeat it, as you did not want to and your MPs did not want to raise it in Westminster yesterday—that if there were a committee of six members, you would not dream of using d'Hondt. I have already given you that public undertaking here.

It is pathetic that your MPs did not turn up to debate these issues in the chamber in which they are being considered again this afternoon. I hope that your MPs will at least bother to turn up for the final part of the Report Stage and the Third Reading, otherwise they are not doing their jobs and they will be showing their usual contempt for the people of Wales.

bwyllgorau gyda dim ond chwech o aelodau. Cytunais yr wythnos diwethaf—nid wyf yn gwybod pam fy mod yn ailadrodd hyn, oherwydd nid oeddech chi na'ch ASau am godi'r mater yn San Steffan ddoe—pe bai pwyllgor â chwe aelod, na fydddech yn breuddwydio defnyddio d'Hondt. Yr wyf wedi addo hynny'n gyhoeddus yma.

Mae'n warth na wnaeth eich ASau fynychu'r ddadl ar y materion hyn yn y siambr lle maent yn cael eu trafod unwaith eto'r prynhawn yma. Gobeithio bod eich ASau o leiaf yn bwriadu bod yno adeg rhan olaf y Cyfnod Adrodd a'r Trydydd Darlleniad, neu fel arall nid ydynt yn gwneud eu gwaith a byddant yn dangos eu difaterwch arferol tuag at bobl Cymru.

### **Ariannu Llywodraeth Leol Funding Local Government**

**C7 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ariannu llywodraeth leol? OAQ1290(FM)

**Q7 David Lloyd:** Will the First Minister make a statement on funding local government? OAQ1290(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe'ch cyfeiriau at y datganiad ysgrifenedig a wnaed gan y Gweinidog Cyllid, sy'n eistedd wrth fy ochr, ar 8 Rhagfyr a'r drafodaeth yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 17 Ionawr ynghylch y setliad llywodraeth leol terfynol.

**The First Minister:** I refer you to the written statement released by the Finance Minister, who is sitting next to me, on 8 December and the Plenary debate on 17 January regarding the final local government settlement.

**David Lloyd:** Y mae angen £30 miliwn ar fyrder i drwsio Neuadd y Sir yn Abertawe. Pa gymorth a fyddwch yn ei roi i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe yn hyn o beth?

**David Lloyd:** The sum of £30 million is required for immediate repairs to Swansea County Hall. What help will you give to the City and County of Swansea Council in this regard?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn meddwl bod y cyngor wedi cael setliad eithaf teg ond efallai ei fod o hyd yn gofyn am fwy o arian. Nid wyf yn siŵr ynglŷn â'r prosiect yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato, ond nid wyf wedi clywed llywodraeth leol yn gyffredinol yn cwyno drwy Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynglŷn â'r setliad. Mae wedi dweud fod y setliad yn deg ac yn uwch na'r hyn yr oedd yn ei ddisgwyl ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol sy'n dechrau mewn dau fis.

**The First Minister:** I think that the council has had quite a fair settlement, but perhaps it always asks for more money. I am not sure about the project to which you just referred, but I have not heard local government in general complaining through the Welsh Local Government Association about the settlement. It has said that the settlement is fair and higher than that which it was expecting for the financial year that is to start in two months' time.

### **Datblygiad Economaidd yng Ngheredigion Economic Development in Ceredigion**

**C8 Elin Jones:** Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r

**Q8 Elin Jones:** What are the First Minister's

Prif Weinidog ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yng Ngheredigion? OAQ1292(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cynyddu cyflogaeth yw'r flaenoriaeth, yn ogystal â gwella ansawdd y swyddi. Mae buddsoddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ein cymunedau, ein seilwaith economaidd ac mewn cwmnïau megis Protherics UK Cyf yn Ffostrasol, sy'n cyflogi 120 o staff, sy'n amrywio o bobl sy'n gadael ysgol i wyddonwyr cymwysedig, yn ei help i gyflawni ein hamcanion yng Ngheredigion.

**Elin Jones:** Un o'r sefydliadau economaidd pwysicaf yng Ngheredigion, ac un o'r cyflogwyr mwyaf, yw'r Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd ger Aberystwyth. Clywsom rhyw fis yn ôl bod posibilrwydd y bydd 40 o swyddi yn cael eu colli oherwydd diffyg cyllid gan DEFRA. Yr oedd cyhoeddiad hyd yn oed yn fwy difrifol yr wythnos diwethaf gan y Cyngor Ymchwil Biotechnoleg a Gwyddorau Biolegol sy'n ariannu IGER, yn dweud bod ariannu IGER yn mynd i uno gyda sefydliad ymchwil yn Lloegr, sef Rothamsted, sy'n sefydliad o ddwywaith maint IGER. Mae hwn yn bygwth annibyniaeth ac arbenigedd IGER. Mae'r gweithiwr yn haeddu eich bod yn ymyrryd gyda DEFRA i sicrhau dyfodol sefydlog i IGER yng Nghymru.

2.50 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw ariannu gwyddoniaeth yn fater datganoledig, fel y gwyddoch. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn awyddus i ymyrryd er mwyn llobydd ar ran IGER oherwydd mae cyn lleied o sefydliadau gwyddonol cenedlaethol, yn yr ystyr DU, yng Nghymru. Hwnnw yw'r mwyaf o bell ffordd a nid ydym eisiau gweld cwtogiad. Wrth gwrs, mae hawl gan BBSRC a DEFRA, fel y noddwyr, i newid eu blaenoriaethau. Maent i gyd yn cael eu cynhyrfu yn awr gan ffws a ffwdan cynhesu byd-eang, a gall unrhyw un ddeall pam maent am symud y duedd tuag at flaenoriaethu cynhesu byd-eang yn fwy, ond mae hynny'n gweithio yn erbyn budd a lles IGER. Nid wyf wedi clywed am y cynnig diweddaraf i ddod ag IGER a Rothamsted—Rothamsted yr ydych yn siarad amdano, onid ef—at ei gilydd, ond fe ofynnaf i Carwyn ymchwilio i'r mater hwn. Yn sicr, yr ydym

priorities with regard to economic development in Ceredigion? OAQ1292(FM)

**The First Minister:** Our priorities are to increase employment and to improve the quality of jobs. Welsh Assembly Government investment in our communities, our economic infrastructure, and in companies such as Protherics UK Ltd in Ffostrasol, which employs 120 staff, ranging from school leavers to qualified scientists, is helping us to achieve our objectives in Ceredigion.

**Elin Jones:** One of the most important economic institutions in Ceredigion, and one of the biggest employers, is the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research near Aberystwyth. We heard about a month ago that there is a possibility that 40 jobs will be lost because of a lack of funding from DEFRA. An even more serious announcement was made last week by the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council, which funds IGER, saying that IGER's funding will join with that of a research institution in England, namely Rothamsted, which is twice the size of IGER. This threatens IGER's independence and expertise. You should intervene with DEFRA to ensure a stable future for IGER in Wales—the workers deserve that.

**The First Minister:** Science funding is not a devolved matter, as you know. However, we are keen to interfere to lobby on IGER's behalf because, in Wales, there are so few scientific institutions that are national in the UK sense. That is the biggest by far and we do not want to see it cut back. However, BBSRC and DEFRA have the right, as sponsors, to change their priorities. They are all now exercised by the fuss and bother of global warming, and anyone can understand why they want to shift the tendency towards prioritising global warming more, but that works against the interests and benefit of IGER. I have not heard of the latest proposal to amalgamate IGER and Rothamsted—you are talking about Rothamsted, are you not?—but I will ask Carwyn to look into the matter. We are certainly lobbying on its behalf, and we want to see what we can do to help to

yn lobïo ar ei ran, ac yr ydym am weld beth y gallwn ni ei wneud i helpu i gadw'r llu hwnnw o wyddonwyr ar gael, oherwydd y mae arallgyfeirio o ran cynydau ac ati yn hollbwysig. Hyd yn oed pe cawn lawer o gynhesu byd-eang, mae eisiau'r galluoedd sydd yn IGER arnom ni a'r byd.

keep that mass of scientists available, because diversification with regard to crops and so on is vital. Even if we have a significant level of global warming, the rest of the world and we will need those talents at IGER.

### Cynnydd tuag at Dargedau Economaidd Progress toward Economic Targets

**Q9 Alun Cairns:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the latest progress towards economic targets? OAQ1274(FM)

**C9 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd diweddaraf tuag at dargedau economaidd? OAQ1274(FM)

**The First Minister:** As I understand it, how we are doing in the targets that were set out in 'A Winning Wales' is set out in 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. I think that we are up in six, down in two, and, in the ninth, the data have turned out to be such rubbish that we have stopped having it as a target.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall, mae ein cynnydd o ran y targedau a nodwyd yn 'Cymru'n Ennill' wedi ei nodi yn 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Yr wyf yn credu inni fynd yn uwch mewn cysylltiad â chwech ohonynt, yn is mewn cysylltiad â dau, ac, o ran y nawfed, cafwyd bod y data mor ddiwerth fel ein bod wedi rhoi'r gorau iddo fel targed.

**Alun Cairns:** It is convenient that, when the targets are difficult, the Government chooses to ignore them. I want to ask specifically about the pay differences between men and women, a concern highlighted by the UK Government, and the difference is far greater in Wales than it is in any other part of the United Kingdom. I am sure that the First Minister shares our concern about that. In light of the edition of the *Global Entrepreneurship Monitor* published this morning, showing a 22 per cent decline in entrepreneurship activity among women since 2004, does the First Minister recognise that some of his policies are not working, does he share my concerns, and what plans does he have to change policy in the hope of raising GDP to his own target of 90 per cent of UK GVA?

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n gyfleus bod y Llywodraeth yn dewis anwybyddu targedau pan fyddant yn anodd. Yr wyf yn dymuno holi'n benodol am y gwahaniaethau rhwng cyflogau dynion a menywod, sydd yn destun pryder y mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi tynnu sylw ato, ac mae'r gwahaniaeth yn fwy o lawer yng Nghymru nag ydyw mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Prif Weinidog yn rhannu ein pryder ynghylch hynny. Yng ngolwg y ffaith bod y rhifyn o'r *Global Entrepreneurship Monitor* a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma yn dangos bod gweithgarwch entrepreneuriaeth ymysg menywod wedi gostwng 22 y cant er 2004, a yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod bod rhai o'i bolisiau nad ydynt yn llwyddo, a yw'n rhannu fy mhryderon, a pha fwriad sydd ganddo i newid polisi gan obeithio codi CMC at ei darged ei hun o 90 y cant o werth ychwanegol crynswth y DU?

**The First Minister:** That last bit is not the case, though I know that you always try to stick the knife in under the guise of a question, when the question is not actually about that. If you want to ask a question about that, then please do so. Do not try to stick the knife in, as it is unworthy of you, Alun.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'r rhan olaf yn wir, er fy mod yn gwybod eich bod bob amser yn ceisio rhoi ergyd gas ar ffurf cwestiwn, a'r cwestiwn heb fod yn ymwneud â hynny mewn gwirionedd. Os dymunwch ofyn cwestiwn am hynny, gwnewch hynny, os gwelwch yn dda. Peidiwch â cheisio rhoi ergyd gas, gan nad yw hynny'n deilwng

ohonoch, Alun.

The issue of entrepreneurship is one of the two that are heading south, that is, in the wrong direction, although it is not expressed exactly like that in 'A Winning Wales', which states that the aim is to increase the stock of VAT-registered businesses. However, that is one of the indicators that is heading the wrong way, as I mentioned. We are up in six, and down in two, but we are up spectacularly in two of those six. However, I accept your remarks that we have to pay more attention to equal pay and entrepreneurship. Entrepreneurship is not going badly wrong, but it is not heading in the right direction, and we have to give more thought to what we can do to increase the levels of enterprise and find out why those levels, as least as expressed in the VAT-registered stock of businesses for which we have the data, are not moving in the right direction.

Mae entrepreneuriaeth yn un o ddau fater sydd yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir, er nad felly'n union y mae wedi ei fynegi yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', sydd yn datgan mai'r nod yw cynyddu nifer y busnesau sydd wedi eu cofrestru ar gyfer TAW. Fodd bynnag, dyna un o'r dangosyddion sydd yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir, fel y dywedais. Aethom yn uwch mewn cysylltiad â chwech ohonynt, ac yn is mewn cysylltiad â dau, ond aethom yn uwch o lawer mewn cysylltiad â dau o'r chwech hynny. Er hynny, yr wyf yn derbyn eich sylwadau i'r perwyl bod rhaid inni roi mwy o sylw i gyflog cyfartal ac entrepreneuriaeth. Nid yw entrepreneuriaeth yn methu'n ddifrifol, ond nid yw'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn, a rhaid inni ystyried ymhellach beth y gallwn ei wneud i godi lefelau menter a darganfod pam nad yw'r lefelau hynny, o ran nifer y busnesau sydd wedi eu cofrestru ar gyfer TAW y mae gennym ddata amdanynt, yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn.

### **Bwlio yn y Gweithle Bullying in the Workplace**

**Q10 Carl Sargeant:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to tackle bullying in the workplace? OAQ1280(FM)

**C10 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â bwlio yn y gweithle? OAQ1280(FM)

**The First Minister:** Although this is a non-devolved issue, the Welsh Assembly Government is committed to the equality of treatment, and will be working with the UK Government to ensure that the rights of Welsh employees are represented on the policies to counteract bullying in the workplace, which, we recognise, is a major problem.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Er nad yw'r mater hwn wedi ei ddatganoli, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau triniaeth gyfartal, a bydd yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau bod hawliau gweithwyr Cymru wedi eu hystyried mewn polisïau i wrthweithio bwlio yn y gweithle, sydd yn broblem fawr, fel yr ydym yn cydnabod.

**Carl Sargeant:** Bullying and harassment generate stress and makes many people fearful of going to work. The Trades Union Congress has estimated that 18 million working days are lost in the UK every year owing to bullying in the workplace. Therefore, it seems like common sense that employers would benefit from doing everything that they can to eradicate bullying in the workplace. Will the Assembly consider

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae bwlio ac aflonyddu'n achosi straen ac yn peri bod llawer o bobl yn ofni mynd i weithio. Mae Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur wedi amcangyfrif bod 18 miliwn o ddiwrnodau gwaith yn cael eu colli bob blwyddyn yn y DU oherwydd bwlio yn y gweithle. Felly, mae'n debyg mai rhesymol yw credu y byddai cyflogwyr yn cael budd o wneud popeth a allant i ddileu bwlio yn y gweithle. A wnaiff y Cynulliad ystyried



working with trades unions or other relevant bodies to develop a recognised scheme in which managers can be educated to recognise and tackle workplace bullying?

**The First Minister:** Yes, although, in the first place, we have to try to get the data right. The TUC version of events is that 18 million working days a year are lost, with managers and supervisors named as the worst perpetrators, but the Chartered Management Institute says that middle management are the most likely to be bullied. I suppose that both propositions are possibly true, but we must first find out who the bullies are, who is being bullied, and what we can do about it in terms of a sensible strategy, because it leads to time spent away from work when it should not be. Above all, it represents economic potential being needlessly lost by poor practice and people who believe that the old slave-driver approach will in some way encourage people to work harder, when we all know that, in practical terms, it has absolutely the reverse effect.

gweithio gydag undebau llafur a chyrrff perthnasol eraill i ddatblygu cynllun cydnabyddedig a fydd yn fodd i addysgu rheolwyr i adnabod bwlio yn y gweithle a mynd i'r afael ag ef?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaiff, ond, yn y lle cyntaf, rhaid inni geisio cael y data cywir. Yn ôl Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur, collir 18 miliwn o ddiwrnodau gwaith bob blwyddyn, a rheolwyr a goruchwylwyr yw'r tramgwyddwyr gwaethaf, ond dywed Sefydliad Siartredig y Rheolwyr mai rheolwyr canol sydd yn fwyaf tebygol o gael eu bwlio. Mae'n debyg gennyf y gallai'r ddau osodiad fod yn wir, ond rhaid inni ddarganfod yn gyntaf pwy yw'r bwliaid, pwy sydd yn cael ei fwlio, a beth a allwn ei wneud ynghylch hynny o ran cael strategaeth synhwyrol, gan ei fod yn arwain at dreulio amser oddi wrth y gwaith pan na ddylid gwneud. Yn fwy na dim, mae'n golygu colli potensial economaidd yn ddiangen oherwydd arferion gwael a rhai sydd yn credu y gellir cymell pobl i weithio'n galetach drwy fod yn deyrn arnynt, a ninnau'n gwybod bod hynny'n cael effaith gwbl groes, yn ymarferol.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Pwysedd Ariannol y GIG NHS Financial Pressures**

**Q1 Jocelyn Davies:** What recent discussions has the Minister held with the national health service regarding financial pressures? OAQ0718(HSS)

**C1 Jocelyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol parthed pwysedd ariannol? OAQ0718(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** My officials and I regularly meet chairs and chief executives of NHS trusts and local health boards to discuss issues, including their financial positions.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae fy swyddogion a minnau'n cwrdd yn rheolaidd â chadeiryddion a phrif weithredwyr ymddiriedolaethau GIG a byrddau iechyd lleol i drafod materion, gan gynnwys eu sefyllfa ariannol.

**Jocelyn Davies:** You probably know that Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust estimates a shortfall of £2.5 million in respect of 'Agenda for Change' assimilation costs. That pattern is repeated elsewhere in Wales, even though you promised assimilation by the end

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae'n debyg eich bod yn gwybod bod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent yn amcangyfrif y bydd diffyg o £2.5 miliwn mewn cysylltiad â chostau cymhathu 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Gwelir yr un patrwm mewn manau eraill yng

of December last year. Why have you failed to keep that promise and why will you not fully fund 'Agenda for Change'?

**Brian Gibbons:** There is recognition that it is very important to consider that we are dealing with more than 80,000 people working in the NHS, and that we give due regard to people's expertise and evaluation of their jobs. If we were to rush it and consequently not give due value to the quality of work of individual members of the NHS in Wales, we would be doing them less than justice. Everyone under 'Agenda for Change' will receive back pay if there is any delay in the assimilation and the matching process.

**Jonathan Morgan:** During the past two years, five of the NHS trusts in Wales have seen their deficits increase quite sharply. The accumulative deficit for NHS trusts now stands at more than £50 million, which is a huge sum of money and is very difficult for trusts to tackle. Do you accept the criticism that it is not just a case of bad financial management on the part of trusts, and that in many circumstances trusts are finding it hard to deliver on the agenda that you have set out, because the funds have not been made available for them to meet your commitments?

**Brian Gibbons:** Generally, that is not the case. As I have said on some occasions, there are probably one or two instances in which individual trusts, local health boards and the health community in general may have a legitimate complaint in relation to their general allocation not meeting their requirements. However, in general, it is only when we see all trusts performing to the quality of good practice that we can come forward and say that they are short of money. If we see that operations are being needlessly cancelled, that the length of waits is unacceptably long, the number of delayed transfers of care is too high, that there is a dependency on locum agencies for filling vacancies and so forth, and that fees inefficiencies exist in the system, we would expect those inefficiencies to be driven out

Nghymru, er eich bod wedi addo y byddai cymhathu erbyn diwedd Rhagfyr y llynedd. Pam yr ydych wedi methu â chadw'r addewid honno a pham na thalwch yn llawn am 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'?

**Brian Gibbons:** Derbynnir ei bod yn bwysig iawn cofio ein bod yn delio â mwy na 80,000 o weithwyr yn y GIG, ac y dylem roi sylw dyladwy i arbenigedd pobl a'r gwerthuso ar eu swyddi. Pe byddem yn brysio ac felly'n peidio â rhoi cydnabyddiaeth ddyladwy i ansawdd gwaith gwahanol aelodau'r GIG yng Nghymru, ni fyddem yn gwneud chwarae teg â hwy. O dan 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', bydd pawb yn cael ôl-gyflog os oes unrhyw oedi wrth gymhathu ac yn y broses baru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, mae pump o'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG yng Nghymru wedi gweld cynnydd eithaf sydyn yn eu diffyg. Mae diffyg cronol ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn fwy na £50 miliwn bellach, ac mae hwnnw'n swm anferth ac yn anodd iawn i ymddiriedolaethau ei drin. A ydych yn derbyn y feirniadaeth nad rheoli ariannol gwael ar ran ymddiriedolaethau'n unig yw hyn, a bod ymddiriedolaethau, mewn llawer o amgylchiadau, yn ei chael yn anodd cyflawni'r agenda yr ydych wedi ei gosod, gan na ddarparwyd digon o arian iddynt allu cyflawni eich ymrwymadau?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar y cyfan, nid yw hynny'n wir. Fel y dywedais o bryd i'w gilydd, mae'n debyg bod un neu ddau o achosion lle y gallai ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol penodol a gweithwyr iechyd yn gyffredinol fod â chwyn ddilys wrth ddweud nad yw'r dyraniad cyffredinol iddynt yn diwallu eu hanghenion. Fodd bynnag, at ei gilydd, dim ond pan welwn yr holl ymddiriedolaethau'n perfformio'n unol ag arferion da y bydd modd inni ddweud eu bod yn brin o arian. Os gwelwn fod llawdriniaethau'n cael eu dileu'n ddiangen, bod arosiadau'n annerbyniol o hir, bod nifer yr achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn rhy uchel, bod dibyniaeth ar asiantaethau locwm i lenwi swyddi gwag ac yn y blaen, a bod aneffeithlonrwydd o ran ffioedd yn y system, byddem yn disgwyl gweld dileu

before a legitimate case could be made for saying that they are underfunded.

aneffeithlonrwydd o'r fath cyn y gellid dadlau'n briodol eu bod wedi eu tanariannu.

### Bywydau Iachach Healthier Lifestyles

**Q2 Jeff Cuthbert:** Will the Minister give a progress report on the Welsh Assembly Government's initiatives to encourage people to lead healthier lifestyles in Caerphilly? OAQ0701(HSS)

**C2 Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi adroddiad cynnydd am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i annog pobl i fyw bywydau iachach yng Nghaerffili? OAQ0701(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** I am pleased to report that there has been a good take-up of the Assembly Government's health improvement initiatives in the Caerphilly area. For example, 80 schools are involved in the Welsh network of healthy school schemes and the local health board has achieved the corporate health standard at gold level.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn falch o roi gwybod bod nifer da wedi ymuno â chynlluniau gwella iechyd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ardal Caerffili. Er enghraifft, mae 80 ysgol yn ymwneud â Chynlluniau Ysgolion Iach—Rhwydwaith Cymru ac mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi cyrraedd lefel aur y safon iechyd gorfforaethol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Will you join me in applauding the work of the Caerphilly local public health team, the local healthy living centre and the Communities First officer for working together to establish food co-operatives across the borough of Caerphilly? I was fortunate enough to attend a distribution of fresh fruit and vegetables at the Lansbury Park community centre, which is in a Communities First area. Seventy bags of fruit and vegetables are now distributed weekly. Will you join me in applauding their work and encouraging them in their efforts, and in hoping that similar ventures can be set up in other parts of Wales?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnewch ymuno â mi i ganmol gwaith tîm iechyd cyhoeddus lleol Caerffili, y ganolfan byw'n iach leol a'r swyddog Cymunedau yn Gyntaf gan eu bod wedi cydweithio i sefydlu cydweithfeydd bwyd ledled bwrdeistref Caerffili? Bûm yn ddigon ffodus o fod yn bresennol mewn cyfarfod dosbarthu ffrwythau a llysiau ffres yng nghanolfan gymunedol Parc Lansbury, sydd mewn ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Bellach mae 70 o fagiau o ffrwythau a llysiau'n cael eu dosbarthu bob wythnos. A wnewch ymuno â mi i ganmol eu gwaith a chefnogi eu hymdrechion, ac i obeithio y bydd modd sefydlu mentrau tebyg mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** It is excellent that we have two food co-operatives in Caerphilly, and that goes along with much of the other work under way in Caerphilly in terms of the money that it has availed itself of for the food and fitness grant—some £75,000—as well as something of the order of £5,000 under the small grants scheme, again to address issues of food and fitness. The Caerphilly community is making very good progress, and there are also 16 primary schools in Caerphilly availing themselves of the excellent free school breakfast scheme, with 10 more schools planning to join. This is a good-news story in Caerphilly.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'n beth ardderchog bod gennym ddwy gydweithfa fwyd yng Nghaerffili, ac mae hynny'n ychwanegol at lawer o waith arall sydd yn mynd rhagddo yng Nghaerffili yng nghyd-destun yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer y grant bwyd a ffitrwydd—tua £75,000—yn ogystal â swm o oddeutu £5,000 o dan y cynllun grantiau bach, sydd hefyd yn ymwneud â materion sydd yn gysylltiedig â bwyd a ffitrwydd. Mae cymuned Caerffili'n gwneud cynnydd rhagorol, ac, yn ogystal â hynny, mae 16 ysgol gynradd yng Nghaerffili'n manteisio ar y cynllun brechwast am ddim mewn ysgolion, a 10 ysgol ar ben hynny sydd yn bwriadu ymuno. Mae hyn yn newyddion da yng Nghaerffili.

3.00 p.m.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Some public sector watchdogs have warned that the target to reduce childhood obesity by half by 2010 will not be possible unless the Welsh Assembly Government takes more initiatives forward and shows more leadership. We have to welcome projects such as that which Jeff Cuthbert has just outlined about what is going on in Caerphilly, but what ground are we making in Wales to tackle childhood obesity and what specifically are you doing to tackle the problem in Caerphilly?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am sure that you will be pleased to congratulate the 16 schools that are engaging with the free school breakfast scheme in Caerphilly and to welcome the other 10 that are lining up to join the scheme. Equally, the 55 primary schools that are involved in the free fruit tuck shop scheme, the 45 schools that are involved in 'The Class Moves!' and the many schools and classes in the Caerphilly area that are lining up to join 'Smoke Bugs!' and other programmes designed to promote positive health. Others are also availing themselves of the food and fitness grants that I have already outlined—£75,000 for the bigger grant and £5,000 for the smaller grant. Caerphilly local authority is proactive in addressing these issues and is availing itself of the £15,000 that the Welsh Assembly Government is making available to local authorities to promote Health Challenge Wales in its area.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae rhai gwylwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus wedi rhybuddio na fydd modd cyrraedd y targed i leihau gordewdra ymysg plant o hanner erbyn 2010 os na fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n hyrwyddo mwy o gynlluniau ac yn dangos mwy o arweiniad. Dylem groesawu prosiectau fel yr un y mae Jeff Cuthbert newydd ei ddisgrifio sydd yn mynd ymlaen yng Nghaerffili, ond pa gynnydd yr ydym yn ei wneud yng Nghymru i ddelio â gordewdra ymysg plant a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud yn benodol i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem yng Nghaerffili?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn falch o longyfarch yr 16 ysgol sydd yn rhan o'r cynllun brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion yng Nghaerffili ac o groesawu'r 10 arall sydd yn aros eu tro i ymuno â'r cynllun. Yn yr un modd, y 55 ysgol gynradd sydd yn ymwneud â'r cynllun siopau ffrwythau am ddim yn yr ysgol, y 45 ysgol sydd yn gysylltiedig â 'Symud y Dosbarth!' a'r nifer mawr o ysgolion a dosbarthiadau yn ardal Caerffili sydd yn aros eu tro i ymuno â 'Bygiau Baco!' a rhaglenni eraill sydd â'r bwriad o hybu iechyd da. Mae eraill yn manteisio hefyd ar y grantiau bwyd a ffitrwydd yr wyf eisoes wedi eu disgrifio—£75,000 ar gyfer y grant mwy a £5,000 ar gyfer y grant llai. Mae awdurdod lleol Caerffili'n cymryd camau i ddelio â'r materion hyn ac yn manteisio ar y £15,000 y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei ddarparu i awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo Her Iechyd Cymru yn eu hardal.

### Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Dental Services

**C3 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gwasanaethau deintyddol sydd ar gael ledled Cymru? OAQ0716(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Steps have been taken to improve access to personal dental service pilot schemes. To date, 163 schemes have been secured for NHS dental care, looking after 642,186 existing patients and an additional 179,917 new patients across Wales. A total of 36 further applications have

**Q3 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the availability of dental services across Wales? OAQ0716(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Cymerwyd camau i wella mynediad i gynlluniau peilot ar gyfer gwasanaethau deintyddol personol. Hyd yma, sicrhawyd 163 o gynlluniau ar gyfer gofal deintyddol y GIG, sydd yn gofalu am 642,186 o'r cleifion presennol yn ogystal â 179,917 o gleifion newydd ledled Cymru.

been received. Local health boards are utilising dental initiative grants to further increase NHS provision.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol y bu i Tony Blair ddweud yn 1999 y byddai pawb yn cael mynediad i ddeintydd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd o fewn dwy flynedd, dim ond iddynt ffonio Galw Iechyd. Ni wn a ydych chi wedi ffonio Galw Iechyd yn ddiweddar ond, os gwnewch hynny o Sir Fôn, nid oes gobaith ichi gael deintydd ar y GIG. Addewid Tony Blair oedd y byddai gennym ddeintydd erbyn 2001. Erbyn pryd y byddwch chi'n dweud y bydd pobl Sir Fôn yn cael mynediad i ddeintydd GIG?

**Brian Gibbons:** We know that the fundamental problem with access to NHS dentistry is the unsatisfactory contract that dentists have. From 1 April 2006, that contract will end and a new one put in its place, based very much on the principles of personal dental services. We know that well over a third of NHS patients are already on the PDS contract, which bodes very well for the future of NHS dentistry and the continuing increase in the number of opportunities that people have to register for dental care.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** If I may say so, those are pure excuses. Your leader in London said that everybody would have access to an NHS dentist by 2001; it is now 2006 and you are blaming all sorts of things. Why can we not have access to NHS dentists in Anglesey? I want the Minister to assure me that that will happen quickly, with no more excuses, please.

**Brian Gibbons:** I have not given any excuses. I have explained the reason why people are not finding the current dental arrangements satisfactory from the professional point of view. Dentists have told us that they do not find the existing contractual arrangements acceptable and that is why they are leaving the NHS. Therefore, the new dental contract is geared precisely to address dentists' concerns. Therefore, these

Cafwyd 36 o geisiadau pellach. Mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn defnyddio grantiau'r fenter ddeintyddol i gynyddu darpariaeth y GIG ymhellach.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sure that you are aware that Tony Blair said in 1999 that everybody would have access to an NHS dentist within two years and that they had only to ring NHS Direct to do so. I do not know whether you have rung NHS Direct recently but, if you did so from Anglesey, you would have no hope of getting a dentist on the health service. Tony Blair's promise was that we would have a dentist by 2001. By when would you say that the people of Anglesey will have access to an NHS dentist?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwyddom mai'r broblem sylfaenol mewn cysylltiad â mynediad i ddeintyddiaeth y GIG yw'r contract anfoddhaol sydd gan ddeintyddion. O 1 Ebrill 2006, bydd y contract hwnnw'n dod i ben a bydd un newydd yn ei le, a fydd yn seiliedig i raddau helaeth ar egwyddorion gwasanaethau deintyddol personol. Gwyddom fod ymhell dros un rhan o dair o gleifion y GIG o dan y contract gwasanaethau deintyddol personol eisoes, ac mae hynny'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer dyfodol deintyddiaeth y GIG a'r cynnydd parhaus yn nifer y cyfleoedd i bobl gofrestru i gael gofal deintyddol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Os caf ddweud, esgusion yw'r rhain a dim arall. Dywedodd eich arweinydd yn Llundain y byddai gan bawb fynediad at ddeintydd GIG erbyn 2001; mae bellach yn 2006 ac yr ydych yn bwrw'r bai ar bob math o bethau. Pam na allwn gael mynediad at ddeintyddion y GIG yn Ynys Môn? Yr wyf yn dymuno i'r Gweinidog fy sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn gyflym, heb ragor o esgusion, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni roddais unrhyw esgusion. Yr wyf wedi egluro pam nad yw gweithwyr proffesiynol yn cael bod y trefniadau deintyddol presennol yn foddhaol. Mae ddeintyddion wedi dweud wrthym nad yw trefniadau'r contract presennol yn dderbyniol ganddynt a dyna pam y maent yn gadael y GIG. Felly, mae'r contract deintyddol newydd wedi ei addasu'n unswydd i ymateb i bryderon ddeintyddion.

are not excuses; this is action that is linked to the extra £15 million that we are putting in place for the new dental contract next year as well as the continuing support that we are giving to the Welsh dental initiative, which is a unique scheme in the United Kingdom.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Having declined to sign up for private dental care, I was delighted yesterday to join a steady stream of my constituents who were registering for NHS dental care at the Gwyn Hall, Neath. I also understand that 1,000 forms have been sent out to people who were unable to attend in person. Another positive development in my home community is that the Gwauncaegurwen practice will now continue to offer NHS dental care for children. I am sure that you are as keen as I am to publicly recognise the efforts of Neath Porth Talbot Local Health Board, which have resulted in ensuring that NHS dental treatment will be provided for my constituents.

**Brian Gibbons:** Neath Port Talbot Local Health Board has been proactive in addressing these issues. It has had six PDS schemes approved, and a number of those have been open for business in the past few weeks, offering new opportunities to people in Port Talbot and Neath. This is the direction in which NHS dentistry is moving. Hundreds of thousands of places have been secured, and something in the order of 175,000 new places have been made available since I announced the launch of the PDS schemes a number of months ago.

**Nick Bourne:** The Minister talks of a gain, but the fact is that fewer than half of the people in Wales are registered with a dentist. There have been some good developments in that you are seeking to use the private sector with public funds to deliver dental care, which is something that we have argued for for a long time. However, when does the Minister expect everyone in Wales to have access to an NHS dentist? Less than half the population has access to one at the moment, and you have been in power for seven years. There is a real fear that the dental contract is going to make things worse.

Felly, nid esgusion yw'r rhain; mae'r camau hyn yn gysylltiedig â'r £15 miliwn yr ydym yn ei neilltuo ar gyfer y contract deintyddol newydd y flwyddyn nesaf yn ogystal â'r cymorth parhaus yr ydym yn ei roi i fenter ddeintyddol Cymru, sydd yn gynllun unigryw yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A minnau wedi gwrthod cofrestru ar gyfer gofal deintyddol preifat, yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o ymuno ddoe â'r llif cyson o'm hetholwyr a oedd yn cofrestru ar gyfer gofal deintyddol y GIG yn Neuadd Gwyn, Castell-nedd. Yr wyf hefyd yn deall bod 1,000 o ffurflenni wedi eu hanfon at rai nad oeddent yn gallu bod yn bresennol. Un datblygiad da arall yn fy nghymuned enedigol yw y bydd practis Gwauncaegurwen yn parhau i gynnig gofal deintyddol y GIG i blant. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod mor awyddus ag yr wyf fi i gydnabod ar goedd ymdrechion Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, sydd wedi arwain at sicrhau y bydd triniaeth ddeintyddol o dan y GIG yn cael ei darparu i fy etholwyr.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot wedi bod yn rhagweithiol yn delio â'r materion hyn. Mae chwe chynllun Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (PDS) wedi eu cymeradwyo ganddo, a nifer o'r rhai hynny wedi agor eu drysau yn yr wythnosau diwethaf, gan gynnig cyfleoedd newydd i bobl Castell-nedd a Phort Talbot. Dyma'r cyfeiriad y mae deintyddiaeth y GIG yn symud iddi. Mae cannoedd o filoedd o leoedd wedi eu sicrhau, ac oddeutu 175,000 o leoedd newydd wedi eu creu ers imi gyhoeddi lansiad y cynlluniau PDS rai misoedd yn ôl.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r Gweinidog yn siarad am ennill tir, ond y ffaith yw bod llai na hanner pobl Cymru wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd. Cafwyd rhai datblygiadau da gymaint â'ch bod yn ceisio defnyddio'r sector preifat gyda chyllid cyhoeddus i ddarparu gofal deintyddol, sy'n rhywbeth yr ydym wedi dadlau drosto ers tro byd. Er hynny, pryd y mae'r Gweinidog yn disgwyl y bydd pawb yng Nghymru yn gallu cael deintydd gyda'r GIG? Llai na hanner y boblogaeth sy'n gallu gweld un o ddeintyddion y GIG ar hyn o bryd, ac mae hi'n saith mlynedd ers ichi ddod i rym. Mae

ofn gwirioneddol y bydd y contract deintyddol yn gwneud pethau'n waeth.

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not know how anyone could argue that it will make things worse, because the PDS scheme is the model for the new type of contract. The large number of dentists and practices that have signed up for the scheme and the number of important new companies that are offering to provide new dental services suggest that this is the correct model. It is the type of model needed to encourage dentists to go back to the NHS. It will encourage the dentists in the NHS to stay and those who have left to come back. Obviously, new players will also enter the market, particularly in areas where dental registration is at its lowest.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni wn sut y gall unrhyw un ddadlau y bydd hyn yn gwneud pethau'n waeth, oherwydd y PDS yw'r model ar gyfer y math newydd o contract. Mae'r nifer mawr o ddeintyddion a deintyddfeydd sydd wedi ymuno â'r cynllun, a nifer y cwmnïau newydd pwysig sy'n cynnig darparu gwasanaethau deintyddol newydd, yn awgrymu mai dyma'r model iawn. Dyma'r math o fodel sy'n mynd i annog deintyddion i ddod yn ôl at y GIG. Bydd yn annog deintyddion yn y GIG i aros a'r rheini sydd wedi gadael i ddychwelyd. Yn amlwg, bydd chwaraewyr newydd hefyd yn ymuno â'r farchnad, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd lle mae'r nifer sydd wedi cofrestru ar ei isaf.

**Nick Bourne:** I asked the Minister about targets. Surely you have an ambition for when you will achieve the situation where everyone in Wales will have access to NHS dentistry, or have you just given up on that completely? There are concerns about the new contract, which have been voiced by the British Dental Association in Wales. It is concerned about the way in which the targets are being set. Therefore, I do not accept the rosy picture that you are presenting. However, I return to the specific question: when will everybody in Wales have access to an NHS dentist? After seven years of your Government's being in power, this has gone backwards. When is it going to move forward, and when will everyone have that access?

**Nick Bourne:** Gofynnais i'r Gweinidog am dargedau. Siawns nad oes gennych uchelgais ar gyfer pryd y cawn sefyllfa lle gall pawb yng Nghymru gael deintydd GIG, neu a ydych wedi rhoi'r gorau i hynny'n llwyr? Mae pryderon am y contract newydd wedi eu lleisio gan Gymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain yng Nghymru. Mae'n poeni am y modd y mae'r targedau'n cael eu gosod. Nid wyf felly yn derbyn y darlun gwych yr ydych yn ei roi inni. Fodd bynnag, dof yn ôl at y cwestiwn penodol: pryd y bydd pawb yng Nghymru'n gallu cael deintydd gyda'r GIG? Ar ôl saith mlynedd o fod mewn grym fel Llywodraeth, mae hyn yn gam yn ôl. Pryd y bydd yn symud ymlaen, a phryd y bydd pawb yn gallu cael y gwasanaeth hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** We want to achieve a situation where people will have the opportunity to register with an NHS dentist should they wish to do so. Obviously, I do not think that anybody can give a clear indication of when that is going to happen. I would be very willing to listen to your suggestions as to when it would be likely to happen. The challenge for us is to put in place a dental contract that dentists feel is attractive, which allows them to work in the NHS, in order to get rid of the contract that your party imposed upon them and which is at the root of the problem that we are now addressing. We are addressing the fundamentals of the problem, offering a new

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym eisiau bod mewn sefyllfa lle bydd gan bobl gyfle i gofrestru gyda deintydd GIG os dyna yw eu dymuniad. Yn amlwg, nid wyf yn meddwl y gall neb roi syniad clir pryd y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Byddwn yn barod iawn i wrando ar eich awgrymiadau ynghylch pryd y bydd hyn yn debygol o ddigwydd. Yr her i ni yw sicrhau contract deintyddol sy'n ddeniadol i ddeintyddion, sy'n caniatáu iddynt weithio o fewn y GIG, er mwyn cael gwared ar y contract a orfodwyd arnynt gan eich plaid chi, ac sy'n mynd at wraidd y broblem yr ydym yn ei hwynebu heddiw. Yr ydym ni'n ceisio mynd at wraidd y broblem, drwy gynnig contract newydd a fydd, gobeithio, yn

contract that will, I hope, give NHS dentistry a completely new opportunity to move forward. We are seeing that with the PDS pilot schemes.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that the creation of new NHS dental places in Gwynedd and Conwy, among others planned across north Wales, will bring vital services to NHS patients in my constituency who do not have access to an NHS dentist? Will you give an assurance that you will work closely with both local health boards to secure better NHS dental provision for people in the Conwy constituency?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am very pleased that a number of applications have been made for PDS schemes in Conwy. Dental registrations in the Conwy LHB area have increased by somewhere in the order of 4 per cent. I am sure that we all want to see continued development in that direction.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, you have trumpeted the new places that are being made available for patients, but you have been very quiet about the number of places lost during the current year. We all know that large numbers of dentists are leaving the NHS, frightened away by the new contract. Will you give a commitment to publish, at the earliest opportunity, the net figures for loss or gain of the number of places available to patients?

3.10 p.m.

Do you share my concern that the large private companies concerned have been actively seeking to recruit associate dentists from existing small practices? They are offering them preferential terms of employment. Do you also share my concern that there will simply be a massive game of musical chairs among the dentists available in Wales? What are you doing to recruit entirely new dentists into Wales to ensure that there really is an improvement rather than a switching of bodies from one place to another?

**Brian Gibbons:** On the last point, it is probably inevitable, if there is an expansion in the range of contractual arrangements, that

gyfle hollol newydd i ddeintyddiaeth y GIG symud ymlaen. Yr ydym yn gweld hynny gyda'r cynlluniau peilot PDS.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A ydych yn cytuno y bydd creu lleoedd deintyddol GIG newydd yng Ngwynedd a Chonwy, ymhlith eraill sydd wedi eu cynllunio ar draws y Gogledd, yn dod â gwasanaethau hanfodol i gleifion y GIG yn fy etholaeth i na allant gael deintydd dan y GIG? A roddwch sicrwydd y byddwch yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r ddau fwrdd iechyd lleol i sicrhau gwell darpariaeth ddeintyddol GIG i bobl yn etholaeth Conwy?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn fod nifer o geisiadau wedi eu gwneud am gynlluniau PDS yng Nghonwy. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n cofrestru gyda deintydd yn ardal Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Conwy wedi cynyddu tua 4 y cant. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd eisiau gweld parhad y datblygiad hwn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, yr ydych wedi brolio'r lleoedd newydd sy'n cael eu creu i gleifion, ond buoch yn dawedog iawn ynghylch faint o leoedd sydd wedi eu colli yn ystod y flwyddyn bresennol. Gwyddom i gyd fod nifer mawr o ddeintyddion yn gadael y GIG, wedi eu dychryn i ffwrdd gan y contract newydd. A ymrwymwch i gyhoeddi, cyn gynted ag y bo modd, y ffigurau net ar gyfer nifer y lleoedd i gleifion sydd wedi eu colli neu eu hennill?

A ydych chi fel finnau yn pryderu bod y cwmnïau preifat mawr dan sylw wedi bod yn mynd ati a'u deg ewin i recriwtio deintyddion cyswllt o rai o'r deintyddfeydd bach presennol? Maent yn cynnig telerau cyflogaeth ffafriol iddynt. A ydych hefyd yn pryderu fel finnau y bydd gêm ddiiddiwedd o newid cadeiriau yn cael ei chwarae ymhlith y deintyddion sydd ar gael yng Nghymru? Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i recriwtio deintyddion cwbl newydd yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau bod y sefyllfa'n gwella, yn hytrach na bod cyrff yn symud o le i le?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar y pwynt diwethaf, mae'n debyg ei bod yn anochel, os bydd ystod y trefniadau contractio yn ehangu, y gallai



some of what you are suggesting may occur. However, overall, we are increasing the number of dental student places, so the number of students that are being trained for dentistry in Wales will continue to increase, as will the number of vocational training posts under the Wales dental initiative, which has been welcomed as part of the new contract. We are also recruiting abroad and looking for dentists to come in from overseas to work in Wales, if they wish. Therefore, between recruiting our own dentists and encouraging people to come here from overseas, we will hopefully be able to address that.

We are working with Education and Learning Wales, in particular, on training additional dental nurses, as well as with the universities and colleges to provide more training for dental hygienists and so forth. This is all part of the wider workforce strategy that the Assembly Government is pursuing.

rhywfaint o'r hyn yr ydych yn ei awgrymu ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan yr ydym yn cynyddu nifer y lleoedd deintyddol i fyfyrwyr, fel y bydd nifer y myfyrwyr sy'n cael eu hyfforddi mewn deintyddiaeth yng Nghymru yn parhau i godi, fel y bydd nifer y swyddi hyfforddiant galwedigaethol yn cynyddu hefyd o dan gynllun deintyddol Cymru, sydd wedi'i groesawu fel rhan o'r contract newydd. Yr ydym hefyd yn recriwtio dramor ac yn chwilio am ddeintyddion i ddod o wledydd tramor i weithio yng Nghymru, os ydynt yn dymuno. Felly, rhwng recriwtio ein deintyddion ein hunain ac annog pobl i ddod yma o wledydd tramor, gobeithio y byddwn yn gallu ateb y broblem.

Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, yn enwedig, i hyfforddi mwy o nyrsys deintyddol, yn ogystal â chyda'r prifysgolion a'r colegau i gynnig mwy o hyfforddiant i lanweithwyr deintyddol, ac yn y blaen. Mae hyn i gyd yn rhan o'r strategaeth ehangach ar gyfer y gweithlu y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei dilyn.

### **Gofal Iechyd ar gyfer Pobl Ddigartref Healthcare for the Homeless**

**Q4 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on the availability of healthcare services for the homeless? OAQ0720(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Local health boards are responsible for developing healthcare services that address the health needs of the local population, including vulnerable groups. The Assembly does not currently hold data on healthcare services for the homeless, but we are undertaking an audit of selected LHBs to identify the provision of such services.

**Leanne Wood:** A number of projects in England and Scotland provide healthcare services that are specifically aimed at targeting homeless people. As far as I am aware, there is no such service in Wales. What funding have you set aside in your portfolio that is dedicated to ensuring access to services for homeless people?

**C4 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gwasanaethau gofal iechyd sydd ar gael ar gyfer pobl ddigartref? OAQ0720(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Y byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu gwasanaethau gofal iechyd i ddelio ag anghenion iechyd y boblogaeth leol, gan gynnwys grwpiau sy'n agored i niwed. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad ddata ar hyn o bryd am wasanaethau gofal iechyd i bobl ddigartref, ond yr ydym wrthi'n archwilio rhai Byrddau Iechyd Lleol i weld faint o'r gwasanaethau hyn sy'n cael eu darparu.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae nifer o brosiectau yn Lloegr a'r Alban yn darparu gwasanaethau gofal iechyd sy'n anelu'n benodol at dargedu pobl ddigartref. Cyn belled ag y gwn i, nid oes yr un gwasanaeth o'r fath yng Nghymru. Pa gyllid penodol yr ydych wedi'i neilltuo yn eich portffolio i sicrhau bod pobl ddigartref yn gallu cael gwasanaethau?

**Brian Gibbons:** I think that your thesis is wrong, Leanne, because there is a locally enhanced scheme for general practitioner services, provided through Dr Kay Saunders, in this particular part of Cardiff, for example. There are also specialist nurses working in Cardiff to identify the needs of homeless people. A special midwife is available for homeless women in Cardiff, and there is also a special midwife with a particular interest in tackling substance abuse working with homeless people in Cardiff. Therefore, the thesis that you are pursuing is incorrect.

The audit that I am undertaking with six local health boards will give us a better picture of the scale of the need for additional healthcare support for homeless people. That links in with a similar audit that is being undertaken by my colleague Edwina Hart on a similar basis of six local authorities to consider homeless issues and identify the particular problems that they may have in accessing healthcare. When we receive the information, which should be at the end of March or early in April, hopefully we will be in a position to see how well the services are actually working out in practice.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn meddwl bod eich ymchwil yn anghywir, Leanne, oherwydd mae cynllun lleol uwch yn darparu gwasanaethau meddyg teulu, drwy Dr Kay Saunders, yn y rhan arbennig hon o Gaerdydd, er enghraifft. Mae gan Gaerdydd hefyd nyrsys arbenigol sy'n gweithio i nodi anghenion pobl ddigartref. Mae bydwaig arbennig ar gael i ferched sy'n ddigartref yng Nghaerdydd, ac mae yma hefyd fydwaig arbennig sy'n ymddiddori'n benodol mewn delio â chamddefnyddio sylweddau ac yn gweithio gyda phobl ddigartref yng Nghaerdydd. Felly, mae'r ddamcaniaeth yr ydych yn ei dilyn yn anghywir.

Bydd yr archwiliad sydd gennyf ar y gweill gyda chwe bwrdd iechyd lleol yn rhoi darlun gwell inni am faint yr angen am gymorth gofal iechyd ychwanegol i bobl ddigartref. Mae cysylltiad rhwng hynny ag archwiliad tebyg sy'n cael ei wneud gan fy nghyd-aelod Edwina Hart o chwe awdurdod lleol i ystyried materion pobl ddigartref ac i nodi'r problemau arbennig y gallant eu hwynebu wrth geisio cael gofal iechyd. Pan ddaw'r wybodaeth i law, a dylai hynny ddigwydd erbyn diwedd Mawrth neu ddechrau Ebrill, gobeithio y byddwn mewn sefyllfa i weld pa mor dda y mae'r gwasanaethau'n gweithio mewn gwirionedd.

### **Defnyddio Technoleg Newydd yn y GIG Adoption of New Technology in the NHS**

**Q5 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the adoption of new technology in the NHS? OAQ0673(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Informing Healthcare is the national programme in Wales to improve healthcare delivery through providing better access to information technology and knowledge. It is one of the critical enabling activities highlighted in 'Designed for Life', the future national strategy for healthcare delivery in Wales over the next 10 years.

**Kirsty Williams:** You will be aware that the rural nature of my constituency and clinical governance issues mean that many of my constituents have to travel a great distance in order to access services. This could be overcome with the adoption of telemedicine.

**C5 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddefnyddio technoleg newydd yn y GIG? OAQ0673(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd yw'r rhaglen genedlaethol i wella darparu gofal iechyd yng Nghymru drwy gynnig gwell mynediad i dechnoleg gwybodaeth. Mae'n un o'r gweithgareddau galluogi hanfodol y tynnir sylw atynt yn y 'Cynllun Oes', sef strategaeth genedlaethol y dyfodol ar gyfer darparu gofal iechyd yng Nghymru dros y deng mlynedd nesaf.

**Kirsty Williams:** Byddwch yn gwybod bod natur wledig fy etholaeth i a materion llywodraethu clinigol yn golygu bod yn rhaid i lawer o'm hetholwyr deithio ymhell iawn i gael gwasanaethau. Gellid goresgyn hyn drwy fabwysiadu telefeddygaeth. Nid

This is not a new concept; we have been talking about introducing improved telemedicine in our hospitals for a number of years, but there seems to be little evidence of that on the ground in my constituency. What are you doing to monitor local health boards and trusts in their uptake of telemedicine opportunities to improve access for patients?

**Brian Gibbons:** We are proactive in terms of promoting the uptake of telemedicine. It is generally recognised that Wales is leading the way in Europe in terms of telemedicine and telecare, with a number of innovative schemes, such as teledermatology in north Wales. In many remote communities there are minor injury units located and linked to main accident and emergency units, and health video services are being promoted to allow clinicians to be able to engage with us. The announcement that I made before the recess regarding telecare and enabling 10,000 houses to have telecare facilities will be a massive step forward in improving the ability of new technology to provide safer services of better quality in Wales.

**Elin Jones:** Fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, mae technoleg gwybodaeth yn bwysig mewn ardaloedd gwledig i arbed cleifion o fy etholaeth i yng Ngheredigion, er enghraifft, rhag gorfod mynd i ganolfannau yn Nhreforys a Singleton. Ond, mae'r gwrthwyneb i hynny'n digwydd gyda'r newyddion diweddar fod Ysbyty Treforys wedi canslo'r clinig teithiol yn ysbytai Bron-glais a Glangwili a oedd yn edrych ar reolyddion calon pobl, oherwydd diffyg arian. A ydych yn credu ei fod yn ddigonol ac yn ddigon da i bobl orfod teithio dros 150 milltir i Dreforys o Geredigion dim ond i rywun edrych ar eu rheolyddion calon?

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the big challenges of 'Designed for Life' is precisely to stop that sort of thing from happening. If you would like to send me the details of the specific case, I will be more than happy to look at it. One of the great success stories in this area is the multidisciplinary cancer care video-conferencing that takes place in Bron-glais Hospital. That is an outstanding example of

cysyniad newydd ydyw; yr ydym wedi bod yn siarad am gyflwyno gwell telefeddygaeth yn ein hysbytai ers blynyddoedd lawer, ond ymddengys mai prin iawn yw'r dystiolaeth fod hyn yn digwydd yn fy etholaeth i. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i fonitro'r graddau y mae byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau yn achub ar bob cyfle telefeddygaeth i wella mynediad ar gyfer cleifion?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn weithgar yn hyrwyddo defnyddio telefeddygaeth. Mae'n cael ei gydnabod yn gyffredinol fod Cymru yn arwain y ffordd yn Ewrop o ran telefeddygaeth a theleofal, gyda nifer o gynlluniau arloesol, fel teledermatoleg yng ngogledd Cymru. Mewn nifer o gymunedau anghysbell mae yna unedau mân anafiadau sydd wedi eu cysylltu â'r prif unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac mae gwasanaethau fideo iechyd yn cael eu hyrwyddo fel y bydd clinigwyr yn gallu ymgysylltu â ni. Bydd y cyhoeddiad a wneuthum cyn y toriad ynghylch teleofal a galluogi 10,000 o dai i gael cyfleusterau teleofal yn gam anferth ymlaen i sicrhau bod technoleg newydd yn gallu darparu gwasanaethau mwy diogel ac o ansawdd gwell yng Nghymru.

**Elin Jones:** As Kirsty Williams said, information technology is important in rural areas to prevent patients from my constituency in Ceredigion, for example, having to go to centres in Morriston and Singleton. However, the contrary is happening with the recent news that Morriston Hospital has cancelled its peripatetic clinic at Bron-glais and Glangwili hospitals, which checked people's pace-makers, because of a lack of funding. Do you believe it is adequate and good enough that people have to travel over 150 miles to Morriston from Ceredigion just to check a pace-maker?

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o'r sialensau mwyaf yn y 'Cynllun Oes' yw atal yr union fath o beth rhag digwydd. Os ydych eisiau anfon manylion yr achos penodol hwnnw ataf, byddaf yn falch o edrych arno. Un o'r hanesion mwyaf llwyddiannus yn y cyswllt hwn yw'r fideo-gynadledda aml-ddisgyblaeth ar gyfer gofal canser sy'n digwydd yn Ysbyty Bron-glais. Dyma enghraifft benigamp o'r

how people in Bron-glais can have their cancer care co-ordinated through telemedicine without having to leave Bron-glais Hospital. There is some good and innovative work going on there. If you would like to write to me about the other case, then I will be happy to look at it.

ffordd y gall pobl ym Mron-glais gael gofal cancer wedi'i gydlynu drwy defeddygaeth heb orfod gadael Ysbyty Bron-glais. Mae gwaith da ac arloesol yn cael ei wneud yma. Os ydych eisiau ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch yr achos arall, byddaf yn fodlon iawn edrych arno.

### **Clefyd Parkinson Parkinson's Disease**

**Q6 Christine Chapman:** Will the Minister make a statement on services for Parkinson's disease sufferers in Wales? OAQ0671(HSS)

**C6 Christine Chapman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau i bobl sy'n dioddef gan glefyd Parkinson yng Nghymru? OAQ0671(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Local health boards are responsible for commissioning services for Parkinson's disease across Wales. Neurological assessment and outreach support is provided by neurosciences services across south and mid Wales. Services in north Wales are divided between the Walton Centre in Liverpool and outreach clinics in Ysbyty Gwynedd, Ysbyty Glan Clwyd and Wrexham Maelor Hospital.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am gomisiynu gwasanaethau ar gyfer clefyd Parkinson ledled Cymru. Mae asesu niwrolegol ac allgymorth yn cael eu darparu gan wasanaethau niwrowyddoniaeth ar draws de a chanolbarth Cymru. Rhennir y gwasanaethau yn y Gogledd rhwng Canolfan Walton yn Lerpwl a chlinigau allgymorth yn Ysbyty Gwynedd, Ysbyty Glan Clwyd ac Ysbyty Wrecsam Maelor.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you agree that higher priority needs to be given to services for sufferers of this disease? Parkinson's disease is not included in local health boards' strategic and financial frameworks. This has meant that the promotion of genuine local improvements to Parkinson's disease services across Wales has sometimes proven to be difficult. NICE has just finished consulting on new guidelines on the diagnosis and management of the disease in primary and secondary care. How will the Welsh Assembly Government respond to this new guidance, which is expected to be finalised in the summer?

**Christine Chapman:** A ydych yn cytuno bod angen rhoi blaenoriaeth uwch i wasanaethau i bobl sydd â'r clefyd hwn? Nid yw clefyd Parkinson wedi'i gynnwys yn fframweithiau strategol ac ariannol y byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae hyn yn golygu bod hyrwyddo gwelliannau lleol gwirioneddol mewn gwasanaethau clefyd Parkinson ar draws Cymru wedi bod yn anodd weithiau. Mae NICE newydd orffen ymgynghori ar ganllawiau newydd ar gyfer diagnosis a rheoli'r clefyd mewn sefydliadau gofal sylfaenol ac eilaidd. Sut y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymateb i'r canllawiau newydd hyn y disgwylir eu cwblhau yn ystod yr haf?

**Brian Gibbons:** The importance of early intervention and promoting of reablement is central to the 'Designed for Life' strategy. Waiting for people to be in an advanced state of deterioration is certainly not the type of philosophy that we want to promote, particularly in relation to Parkinson's disease. A lot of the treatment is given in a community setting. Many local health boards, particularly in north Wales, have specialist Parkinson's disease nurses working in the community. At a general hospital level, there

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae pwysigrwydd ymyrryd yn gynnar a hyrwyddo ailalluogi yn ganolog i'r strategaeth 'Cynllun Oes'. Yn sicr, nid aros i bobl ddirywio'n ddifrifol yw'r math o athroniaeth yr ydym yn dymuno'i hyrwyddo, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt clefyd Parkinson. Caiff llawer o'r driniaeth ei rhoi yn y gymuned. Mae gan nifer o fyrddau iechyd lleol, yn enwedig yn y Gogledd, nyrsys Parkinson arbenigol sy'n gweithio yn y gymuned. Yn yr ysbytai cyffredinol, mae yna arbenigwyr sy'n ymddiddori'n benodol yn y

are specialists who take particular interest in this condition. As well as that, there are specialist neurological services for the more difficult and intractable cases. There is a reasonable network, but I agree that it is vital that everyone engages with their local health, social care and wellbeing strategies because if those strategies do not pick up the particular needs of a group of patients, that group of patients may find itself at a disadvantage in terms of the type of services that are being provided. It is crucial that all organisations that feel that they have a particular condition that has historically been missed out actively engage with their local health boards and make sure that they have a vigorous input into the local health, social care and wellbeing strategies.

3.20 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** You have made reference to the provision of services in north Wales, where there are no consultant neurologists. Neurologists travel out of Walton to provide that service. Therefore it is very important that we develop Parkinson's disease nurse specialists to support the many people in north Wales who suffer from that disease. When those groups, as you have said, have tried to interact with their local health boards, they have received varying answers according to the financial condition of those local health boards. Some, like Flintshire Local Health Board, which has had an increase in its budget under the Townsend formula, have been able to develop Parkinson's disease nurse specialists; some, such as Wrexham, cannot do so. What will you do, Minister, to ensure that patients throughout Wales have equitable access to Parkinson's disease nurse specialists?

**Brian Gibbons:** The answer is the same as that I just gave to Christine Chapman: the primary responsibility for commissioning these services lies with the local health boards. Consequently, it is important that the needs assessments that inform the health, social care and wellbeing strategies should be engaged with to ensure that these types of services are delivered locally. Given that spending on the national health service in Wales has increased by in excess of 80 per

cyflwr hwn. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae yna wasanaethau niwrolegol arbenigol ar gyfer achosion anos a mwy cymhleth. Mae yna rwydwaith rhesymol, ond cytunaf ei bod yn hanfodol i bawb ymgysylltu â'u strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles yn lleol, oherwydd os nad yw'r strategaethau hynny'n nodi anghenion arbennig grŵp o gleifion, gall y bydd y grŵp hwnnw weld ei fod dan anfantais o ran y math o wasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu. Mae'n hollbwysig i bob cymdeithas sy'n teimlo bod ganddi gyflwr penodol sydd wedi colli allan yn y gorffennol ymgysylltu'n weithredol â bwrdd iechyd lleol a gwneud yn siŵr ei bod yn cyfrannu'n rymus at y strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles lleol.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at ddarparu gwasanaethau yn y gogledd, lle nad oes unrhyw niwrolegwyr ymgynghorol. Daw niwrolegwyr o Walton i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwn. O'r herwydd, mae'n bwysig iawn inni feithrin arbenigwyr nyrsio ar gyfer clefyd Parkinson i roi cefnogaeth i'r holl bobl yn y gogledd Cymru sy'n dioddef gan y clefyd hwn. Pan fydd y grwpiau hynny, fel yr oeddech yn dweud, wedi ceisio rhyngweithio â'u byrddau iechyd lleol, maent wedi cael atebion amrywiol yn ôl cyflwr ariannol y byrddau iechyd lleol hynny. Mae rhai, megis Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir y Fflint, a gafodd gynnydd yn ei gyllideb dan fformwla Townsend, wedi gallu meithrin arbenigwyr nyrsio ar gyfer clefyd Parkinson; mae rhai, megis Wrecsam, yn methu â gwneud hynny. Beth fyddwch chi'n ei wneud, Weinidog, i sicrhau bod cleifion ledled Cymru yn cael tegwch o ran gwasanaeth arbenigwyr nyrsio Parkinson?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r ateb yr un fath ag a roddais yn awr i Christine Chapman: y byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am gomisiynu'r gwasanaethau hyn. O'r herwydd, mae'n bwysig gweithio'n agos gyda'r asesiadau angen sy'n dylanwadu ar y strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles er mwyn sicrhau bod y mathau hyn o wasanaethau'n cael eu darparu'n lleol. O gofio bod gwariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu dros 80

cent since the Assembly came into being, local organisations have to ensure that they deliver efficient and effective care that addresses the needs of their communities.

y cant ers bodolaeth y Cynulliad, rhaid i sefydliadau lleol sicrhau eu bod yn darparu gofal effeithlon ac effeithiol sy'n rhoi sylw i anghenion eu cymunedau.

### **Her Iechyd Cymru Health Challenge Wales**

**Q7 Jeff Cuthbert:** Will the Minister give an update on the work of Health Challenge Wales? OAQ0700(HSS)

**C7 Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am waith Her Iechyd Cymru? OAQ0700(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** I congratulate you, Jeff, on the work that you are doing to promote wellbeing in Wales and in the Assembly. Health Challenge Wales is capturing the imagination of organisations and individuals across Wales. More than 100 organisations have publicly declared their support for the challenge, and are now working together on a common goal—to prevent ill health from occurring in the first place.

**Brian Gibbons:** Llongyfarchiadau i chi, Jeff, am y gwaith yr ydych yn ei wneud i hybu lles yng Nghymru ac yn y Cynulliad. Mae Her Iechyd Cymru yn dal dychymyg sefydliadau ac unigolion ledled Cymru. Mae dros 100 o sefydliadau wedi datgan yn gyhoeddus eu cefnogaeth i'r her, ac yr ydym yn awr yn gweithio gyda'n gilydd ar nod cyffredin—sef rhwystro salwch rhag digwydd yn y lle cyntaf.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The public sector watchdogs—the National Audit Office, the Healthcare Commission, and the Audit Commission in England, and, for that matter, everyone else—have agreed that there is a big job of work to get obesity rates under control by 2010, although they stressed the excellent work that is being done through many local initiatives to deal with unhealthy lifestyles. Do you agree that Health Challenge Wales is helping to keep Wales at the forefront of these activities? Furthermore, will you join me in encouraging every Assembly Member and all local authorities throughout Wales to engage fully in the Healthy Living week in May 2006?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae carfannau gwarchod y sector cyhoeddus—y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol, y Comisiwn Gofal Iechyd, a'r Comisiwn Archwilio yn Lloegr, a phawb arall, o ran hynny—wedi cytuno bod llawer iawn i'w wneud i gael y cyfraddau gordewdra dan reolaeth erbyn 2010, er iddynt bwysleisio'r gwaith ardderchog a wneir drwy lawer o gynlluniau lleol i ddelio â ffyrdd afiach o fyw. A gytunwch fod Her Iechyd Cymru yn helpu cadw Cymru ar y blaen yn y gweithgareddau hyn? At hynny, a ymunwch â mi i annog pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad a'r holl awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru i ymwneud yn llawn â'r wythnos Byw'n Iach ym Mai 2006?

**Brian Gibbons:** I certainly would. It is an important way of highlighting the healthy living message. I also congratulate the other local authorities across Wales that are taking up the Health Challenge Wales message. I know that in my own local authority, Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, there was an active launch, which my colleague, Alun Pugh, attended a few weeks ago. Other local authorities, such as Denbighshire County Council, Pembrokeshire County Council, the City and County of Swansea Council, Anglesey County Council—and we know the work that is taking place in Caerphilly—are responding to the challenge

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr. Mae'n ffordd bwysig i dynnu sylw ar neges byw'n iach. Llongyfarchaf hefyd yr awdurdodau lleol eraill ledled Cymru sy'n mabwysiadu neges Her Iechyd Cymru. Yn fy awdurdod lleol fy hun, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, gwn fod lansiad bywiog wedi ei gynnal ac yr oedd fy nghyd-Aelod, Alun Pugh, yn bresennol yno rai wythnosau'n ôl. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol eraill, megis Cyngor Sir Ddinbych, Cyngor Sir Penfro, Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe, Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn-a gwyddom am y gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen yng Nghaerffili-yn ymateb i sialens Her Iechyd Cymru. Rhaid inni

of Health Challenge Wales. We need to work across the board on this, whether it is through promoting healthy school breakfasts on the one hand, promoting leisure activity for schoolchildren on the other, or through the provision of free swimming for the older population. These are all innovative strategies led by the Welsh Assembly Government.

weithio'n eang ar hyn, boed drwy hybu brecwastau iach yn yr ysgol ar y naill law a hybu gweithgaredd hamdden i blant ysgol ar y llaw arall, neu drwy ddarparu cyfleoedd i'r boblogaeth hŷn gael nofio am ddim. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn strategaethau arloesol dan arweiniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

### Gwasanaethau Gofal Care Services

**Q8 Helen Mary Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of care services in Wales? OAQ0713(HSS)

**C8 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau gofal yng Nghymru? OAQ0713(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The legal responsibility for planning, assessing needs for, and commissioning social care services rests with local authorities. It is the Assembly Government's responsibility to provide the policy framework, statutory guidance and the regulation and inspection regimes to support these local authority services. In May, I will publish a policy directions paper for social services in Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol yn gyfreithiol am gynllunio gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol, eu comisiynu ac asesu anghenion amdanynt. Cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw darparu'r fframwaith polisi, y canllawiau statudol a'r trefniadau arolygu a rheoleiddio i gefnogi'r gwasanaeth hyn gan yr awdurdodau lleol. Ym Mai, byddaf yn cyhoeddi papur cyfarwyddiadau polisi ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Will you acknowledge that your Government is now in a grave position with regard to your broken promise over the provision of free homecare last week, with the Coalition on Charging considering legal action against you for what it believes is a breach of this Assembly's statutory duty to promote equality of opportunity? Will you acknowledge that by breaking that promise, you have not only brought your own Government, but the whole of this institution, into disrepute? Will you apologise for that, and, perhaps more importantly, will you look again at all the evidence, as the coalition is urging you to do, particularly that of the relevant Rowntree report into the situation in Scotland, with a view to reviewing in the medium term the affordability of free homecare?

**Helen Mary Jones:** A wnewch gydnabod bod eich Llywodraeth yn awr mewn sefyllfa ddifrifol o safbwynt yr addewid a dorwyd gennych yr wythnos diwethaf i ddarparu gofal cartref am ddim, a'r Glymblaid Taliadau yn ystyried cymryd camau cyfreithiol yn eich erbyn am ei bod yn credu ichi dorri dyletswydd statudol y Cynulliad hwn i hybu cyfle cyfartal? A wnewch gydnabod eich bod, drwy dorri'r addewid hwn, nid yn unig wedi dwyn anfri ar eich Llywodraeth eich hun, ond ar y sefydliad hwn i gyd? A wnewch ymddiheuro am hyn, ac yn bwysicach, hwyrach, a edrychwch eto ar yr holl dystiolaeth, fel y mae'r glymblaid yn eich annog i wneud, yn enwedig y dystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad perthnasol gan sefydliad Rowntree ar y sefyllfa yn yr Alban, gyda'r bwriad o adolygu fforddiadwyedd gofal cartref am ddim yn y tymor canolig?

**Brian Gibbons:** As I said in my statement two weeks or so ago, we have taken no satisfaction or pleasure from the fact that we were not able to deliver this; the decision that

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad ryw bythefnos yn ôl, nid oedd unrhyw foddhad na phleser inni oherwydd methu darparu hyn; yr oedd y penderfyniad y

we were forced to make was based on affordability and equity grounds. If there is evidence to suggest that the issues of affordability and equity can be addressed, we will be more than pleased to look at that. However, it is not true to say that, because we have not been able to deliver this manifesto commitment, we have turned our back on promoting equality of opportunity—quite the contrary. The fact that we are putting £76 million into an alternative scheme—which is 50 per cent more than the amount of money that was targeted for the free homecare scheme—is clear evidence of our commitment to promote the independence and autonomy, as well as the quality of care and safety, of disabled people across Wales.

gorfodwyd ni i'w wneud yn seiliedig ar fforddiadwyedd a thegwch. Os oes tystiolaeth i awgrymu y gellir delio â materion fforddiadwyedd a thegwch, byddem yn fwy na pharod i edrych ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n wir dweud, oherwydd nad ydym wedi llwyddo i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwn yn y manifest, ein bod wedi troi ein cefn ar hybu cyfle cyfartal—i'r gwrthwyneb yn llwyr. Mae'r ffaith ein bod yn rhoi £76 miliwn i gynllun amgen—sydd 50 y cant yn fwy na'r swm o arian a dargedwyd ar gyfer y cynllun gofal cartref am ddim—yn dystiolaeth bendant o'n haddewid i hybu annibyniaeth ac ymreolaeth pobl anabl ledled Cymru yn ogystal ag ansawdd eu gofal a'u diogelwch.

### **'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'** **'Agenda for Change'**

**Q9 Peter Black:** What discussions has the Minister had with NHS trusts on their implementation of 'Agenda for Change'?  
OAQ0683(HSS)

**C9 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gydag ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG ynglŷn â gweithredu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'?  
OAQ0683(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The implementation of 'Agenda for Change' is closely managed by the pay modernisation team, in terms of ensuring compliance with national guidelines and profiles, as well as the speed of implementation. The head of the pay modernisation board meets the trust board members and the implementation teams of NHS trusts regularly.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gweithredu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn cael ei reoli'n ofalus gan y tîm moderneiddio cyflogau, o safbwynt cydymffurfio â phroffiliau a chanllawiau cenedlaethol, yn ogystal â chyflymdra'r gweithredu. Bydd pennaeth y bwrdd moderneiddio cyflogau yn cwrdd gydag aelodau bwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth a thimau gweithredu ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn rheolaidd.

**Peter Black:** Do you accept that the implementation of 'Agenda for Change' across Wales is happening at a variable pace depending on which part of Wales you live in? As a result, many NHS staff are living with some uncertainty as to how they will be slotted into it, and when—if they are due to get any more money—they will receive any back pay to which they are entitled. Is there any way that this can be speeded up? In particular, for my constituents in Swansea who have contacted me about this issue, could you talk with those NHS trusts that are implementing it at a slower pace than others to try to get them to pay more attention, and to deal with this much more expeditiously?

**Peter Black:** A ydych yn derbyn bod gweithredu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' ar draws Cymru yn digwydd ar gyflymder amrywiol yn ôl pa ran o Gymru yr ydych yn byw? O ganlyniad, mae nifer o staff y GIG yn byw mewn cryn ansicrwydd o safbwynt eu lle yn y drefn, a phryd—os oes arian yn ddyledus iddynt—y byddant yn cael unrhyw ôl-dâl y mae ganddynt hawl iddo. A oes unrhyw ffordd y gellir cyflymu hyn? Yn benodol, ar gyfer fy etholwyr yn Abertawe sydd wedi cysylltu â mi ynghylch y mater hwn, a allech siarad â'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG hynny sy'n ei weithredu'n arafach nag eraill er mwyn ceisio sicrhau eu bod yn rhoi rhagor o sylw, ac yn delio â hyn lawer yn



fwyn prydlon?

**Brian Gibbons:** In Swansea, strangely enough, the matching process is among the best in Wales, with well over 85 per cent of the jobs matched already. Therefore, we should give Swansea some credit for that. There are a fair number of people to be assimilated—50 or 60 per cent of people have yet to be assimilated in Swansea. So, I would not want to say that Swansea was the worst in terms of matching. However, your general thesis is correct, in that the level of performance varies across Wales. It is important that we get ‘Agenda for Change’ fully in place. In the current year, we have put in about £56 million or £57 million into trusts to allow them to deliver ‘Agenda for Change’; next year, we are putting in an extra £60 million. Therefore, we as an Assembly Government are making a massive investment in ensuring fair play for and giving due value to staff working in the NHS in Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn Abertawe, yn rhyfedd ddigon, mae'r broses baru ymysg y gorau yng Nghymru, acf mae ymhell dros 85 y cant o'r swyddi eisoes wedi eu paru. Felly, dylem roi rhywfaint o'r clod i Abertawe am hynny. Mae cryn nifer o bobl i'w cymathu—mae 50 neu 60 y cant o bobl heb eu cymathu eto yn Abertawe. Felly, ni fyddwn am ddweud mai Abertawe yw'r gwaethaf o safbwynt paru. Fodd bynnag, mae eich thesis cyffredinol yn gywir, o ran bod lefel y perfformiad yn amrywio ar draws Cymru. Mae'n bwysig inni sefydlu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn llwyr. Yn y flwyddyn gyfredol, yr ydym wedi rhoi oddeutu £56 miliwn neu £57 miliwn i'r ymddiriedolaethau er mwyn iddynt allu darparu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'; y flwyddyn nesaf, byddwn yn rhoi £60 miliwn yn ychwanegol. Felly, yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud buddsoddiad anferthol i sicrhau chwarae teg i'r staff ac i roi'r gwerth dyledus ar staff sy'n gweithio yn y GIG yng Nghymru.

### **Gofal Iechyd i'r Henoed Healthcare for the Elderly**

**Q10 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on NHS fully funded healthcare for the elderly? OAQ0650(HSS)

**C10 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ofal iechyd i'r henoed sy'n cael ei ariannu'n llwyr gan y GIG? OAQ0650(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Fully funded continuing NHS care is provided in hospitals, care homes and in people's own homes when the nature, intensity and complexity of healthcare needs are assessed as requiring full NHS responsibility.

**Brian Gibbons:** Darperir gofal parhaus sy'n cael ei ariannu'n llwyr gan y GIG mewn ysbytai, cartrefi gofal ac yng nghartrefi pobl pan asesir bod natur, dwyster a chymhlethdod yr anghenion gofal iechyd yn golygu bod angen i'r GIG ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb llawn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As the BBC *Week in Week Out* programme illustrated perfectly, the Welsh Assembly Government is failing in its duty of care towards the elderly. In too many cases, the rules mean that people only qualify for NHS funding when they are at death's door. Would you not agree that good nursing is about providing dignity to patients, and that the current eligibility criteria fail those with long-term degenerative diseases who need wide-ranging care? Do you also agree that, if we are to be true to the founding ideals of the NHS, free personal care must be provided for the elderly and disabled?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Fel y dangosodd y rhaglen BBC *Week in Week Out* yn berfffaith, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn methu yn ei dyletswydd i ofalu am yr henoed. Mewn gormod o achosion, mae'r rheolau'n golygu bod pobl ond yn gymwys am nawdd gan y GIG dim ond pan fyddant ar eu gwely angau. Oni fydddech yn cytuno bod nyrsio da yn golygu â rhoi urddas i glifion, ac nad yw'r meini prawf cymhwyso presennol yn darparu ar gyfer y rheini sydd â chlefydau dirywiol sy'n gofyn am ofal amrywiol iawn? A gytnwch hefyd, os ydym i fod yn driw i ddelfrydau sefydlu'r GIG, ei bod yn rhaid

darparu gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed a'r anabl?

**Brian Gibbons:** Again, I would have to disagree with your thesis. The *Week in Week Out* programme did not throw any clarity on this situation. I would suggest that, at the end of the *Week in Week Out* programme, people would be more confused and uncertain as to the situation. People who require nursing care, whether in the community or in a nursing home, receive free nursing care. People who have been assessed as requiring NHS continuing care also receive that care free of charge. The people who require healthcare services in Wales go through an assessment process, and if it indicates that they need extra care, then it is my duty as Minister to ensure that they get it. That was far from clear in the *Week In Week Out* programme.

**Brian Gibbons:** Unwaith eto, byddai'n rhaid imi anghytuno gyda'ch thesis. Nid oedd y rhaglen *Week in Week Out* yh rhoi unrhyw oleuni ar y sefyllfa. Byddwn yn awgrymu y byddai pobl, ar ddiwedd y rhaglen *Week in Week Out* yn fwy dryslyd ac ansicr am y sefyllfa. Mae pobl sydd ag angen gofal nyrsio arnynt, boed yn y gymuned neu mewn cartref nyrsio, yn cael gofal nyrsio am ddim. Mae pobl yr aseswyd bod arnynt angen gofal parhaus gan y GIG hefyd yn cael y gofal hwnnw am ddim. Mae'r bobl sydd ag arnynt angen gwasanaethau gofal iechyd yng Nghymru yn mynd drwy broses asesu, ac os yw honno'n dynodi bod arnynt angen gofal ychwanegol, yna fy nyletswydd i fel Gweinidog yw sicrhau eu bod yn ei gael. Yr oedd hynny ymhell o fod yn glir yn y rhaglen *Week in Week Out*.

3.30 p.m.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport**

### **Y Celfyddydau ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni The Arts in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney**

**Q1 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of the arts in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney? OAQ0604(CWS)

**C1 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol y celfyddydau ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni? OAQ0604(CWS)

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** This Government has invested heavily in the arts since we were elected. I am committed to ensuring that the arts are accessible to all communities across Wales, including Merthyr and Rhymney.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi buddsoddi'n helaeth yn y celfyddydau ers inni gael ein hethol. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod y celfyddydau ar gael yn hwylus i bob cymuned ar draws Cymru, gan gynnwys Merthyr a Rhymni.

**Huw Lewis:** I take this opportunity to extend a big 'thank you' on behalf of my constituents and, indeed, the inhabitants of the south Wales Valleys as a whole, for your unquestioned commitment to changing the current grossly unfair pattern of arts funding within our nation. Do you agree that the Heads of the Valleys strategy introduces a new opportunity to develop this sort of investment and that there should be a strong element of arts, culture and heritage

**Huw Lewis:** Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i ddiolch 'diolch' o waelod calon ar ran fy etholwyr ac, yn wir, ar ran trigolion Cymoedd de Cymru gyfan, am eich ymrwymiad diamheuol i newid y patrwm presennol annheg o ariannu'r celfyddydau yn ein cenedl. A gytunwch fod strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn gyfle newydd i ddatblygu'r math hwn o fuddsoddiad ac y dylai fod elfen gref o fentrau celfyddydol, diwylliannol a threftadaeth yn y cynlluniau y mae

initiatives within the plans that local authorities draw up for the Heads of the Valleys strategy? Will you engage with the Heads of the Valleys partnership with that in mind?

**Alun Pugh:** The Heads of the Valleys strategy is very ambitious and is certainly there for the long term. When we met at the Theatre Royal, you said that access to the arts in Merthyr is not easy, and you raised a number of examples, including cinema and theatre. In that respect, I have instructed my officials to arrange a further meeting with you, the local authority—which clearly has an important role—Cadw and the arts council to look at the best way forward to ensure sustainable access to the arts for the people of Merthyr and the wider Heads of the Valleys community.

**Michael German:** I wonder whether you are aware of the community theatre application to the Heritage Lottery Fund for the conversion of the Soar chapel in Merthyr into a community arts forum and centre, which has the backing of all of the arts fora in Merthyr. Would you be amenable to meeting these people, who obviously have the interests of the arts community in Merthyr close to their hearts?

**Alun Pugh:** I am happy to meet any group of individuals who share my passion and commitment for ensuring that the arts are available to all parts of Wales, particularly the most socially deprived parts of the nation.

awdurdodau lleol yn eu llunio ar gyfer strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd? A wnewch feithrin cyswllt â phartneriaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd gan gadw hyn mewn cof?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn uchelgeisiol iawn ac yma yn bendant am yr hirdymor. Yn ein cyfarfod yn Theatre Royal, yr oeddech yn dweud nad yw mynediad i'r celfyddydau ym Merthyr yn hawdd, a chodwyd nifer o esiamplau gennyh, gan gynnwys sinemâu a theatrau. I'r perwyl hwnnw, yr wyf wedi cyfarwyddo fy swyddogion i drefnu cyfarfod pellach gyda chi, yr awdurdod lleol—sydd â rôl bwysig yn amlwg—Cadw a chyngor y celfyddydau i edrych ar y ffordd orau ymlaen i sicrhau mynediad cynaliadwy i'r celfyddydau i bobl Merthyr a chymuned ehangach Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

**Michael German:** Ysgwn i a ydych yn ymwybodol o gais y theatr gymunedol i Gronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri i addasu capel Soar ym Merthyr yn fforwm a chanolfan gelf gymunedol? Mae hwn yn brosiect sy'n cael ei gefnogi gan yr holl fforymau celfyddydol ym Merthyr. A fydddech yn barod i gael cyfarfod â'r bobl hyn y mae buddiannau'r gymuned gelfyddydol ym Merthyr yn amlwg yn agos at eu calonnau?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn fodlon cyfarfod ag unrhyw grŵp o unigolion sy'n rhannu fy angerdd a'm hymrwymiad i sicrhau bod y celfyddydau ar gael i bob rhan o Gymru, yn enwedig rhannau mwyaf cymdeithasol-ddifreintiedig y genedl.

### **Mynediad i Theatrau a Sinemâu Access to Theatres and Cinemas**

**Q2 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on access to theatres and cinemas in Wales? OAQ0605(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Access is generally good in the new network of arts venues that has come to fruition in recent years. That extends from Galeri in the north, to Newport in the south-east. The position in older venues is steadily improving.

**C2 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fynediad i theatrau a sinemâu yng Nghymru? OAQ0605(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae mynediad yn dda ar y cyfan yn y rhwydwaith lleoliadau celfyddydol newydd a ddaeth yn amlwg yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae hwn yn ymestyn o Galeri yn y gogledd, i Gasnewydd yn y de-ddwyrain. Mae'r sefyllfa mewn lleoliadau hyn yn gwella'n raddol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Money is available from the Film Council, I believe, in both England and Wales, to provide subtitling at cinemas for deaf people. In England, this money is being spent through grants to commercial cinemas, but this money has apparently not yet been spent or allocated in Wales. I am told that you insist that this money should only go to non-commercial cinemas. Is this true, Minister? If so, bearing in mind your oft-repeated commitment to widening access, will you rethink that criterion in the interest of promoting access to new cinema-goers? I am sure that you would agree that they are more likely to make their first visit to a commercial cinema and to enjoy that particular art form in a commercial cinema rather than in an art house cinema.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae arian ar gael gan y Cyngor Ffilm, mi gredaf, yng Nghymru a Lloegr fel ei gilydd, i ddarparu isdeitlau mewn sinemâu i bobl fyddar. Yn Lloegr, mae'r arian hwn yn cael ei wario drwy grantiau i sinemâu masnachol, ond nid yw'r arian hwn, yn ôl pob golwg, wedi ei wario na'i ddyrannu yng Nghymru. Dywedir wrthyf eich bod yn mynnu y dylai'r arian hwn fynd i sinemâu anfasnachol yn unig. A yw hyn yn wir, Weinidog? Os felly, o gofio'ch ymrwymiad a glywn mor aml i ehangu mynediad, a wnewch ailystyried y maen prawf hwn er mwyn hybu mynediad ymysg pobl sy'n mynd i'r sinema o'r newydd? Yr wyf yn sicr y byddech yn cytuno eu bod yn fwy tebygol o fynd ar eu hymweliad cyntaf i sinema fasnachol a mwynhau'r ffurf gelfyddydol benodol honno mewn sinema fasnachol yn hytrach nag mewn sinema gelfyddydol.

**Alun Pugh:** The arts council has allocated some £200,000 in the financial year 2006-07 to implement the outcome of a review of digital projection facilities. That will include work at the Aberystwyth Arts Centre, Chapter, Riverfront, Taliesin, Theatr Colwyn and so on. However, the Arts Council of Wales does not propose to provide funding for commercial cinemas in Wales. If the Liberal Democrats now believe that I should start ordering the arts council to do this, that and the other, I would be happy to hear from you.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae cyngor y celfyddydau wedi dyrannu oddeutu £200,000 yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol 2006-07 i weithredu canlyniad adolygiad o gyfleusterau taflunio digidol. Bydd hwn yn cynnwys gwaith yng Nghanolfan Gelfyddydau Aberystwyth, Chapter, Glanyrafon, Taliesin, Theatr Colwyn, ac ati. Fodd bynnag, Nid yw Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn bwriadu darparu arian ar gyfer sinemâu masnachol yng Nghymru. Os yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn awr yn credu y dylwn ddechrau gorchymyn cyngor y celfyddydau i wneud hyn a'r llall, byddwn yn falch o glywed gennych.

**Christine Chapman:** When we talk about access, do you agree that one problem is that it takes a while for the newest, and often the most popular, films to come to areas such as my own, which has smaller cinemas? Those cinemas are in competition with the larger multiplexes, which proves challenging for small cinemas. What can the Welsh Assembly Government do to address that and to ensure that we maximise the spending potential of areas like the Cynon valley, as opposed to people being forced to spend money outside the area?

**Christine Chapman:** Wrth sôn am fynediad, a gytunwch mai un broblem yw ei bod yn cymryd tipyn i'r ffilmiau mwyaf newydd, ac yn aml y rhai mwyaf poblogaidd, ddod i ardaloedd megis fy ardal i, lle mae sinemâu llai? Mae'r sinemâu hyn yn cystadlu â'r sinemâu aml-sgrîn mawr, sy'n gallu bod yn anodd i sinemâu llai. Beth all Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â hynny ac i sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y gwariant posibl mewn ardaloedd fel cwm Cynon, yn hytrach na bod pobl yn cael eu gorfodi i wario arian y tu allan i'r ardal?

**Alun Pugh:** I can appreciate the frustration felt by constituents as a result of delays, as I

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â rhwystredigaeth etholwyr oherwydd yr oedi,

am familiar with it myself. There is a giant multiplex up the road from my constituency, and it sometimes takes a couple of weeks for those films to reach Colwyn Bay. However, I know that the Arts Council of Wales sees investment in community facilities as an important priority, and community facilities the length and breadth of Wales, which include cinemas, have gained substantial amounts of ACW funding in the past. It is not perfect, but that is the market for you.

**Owen John Thomas:** Bythefnos yn ôl, bu i chi a Huw Lewis ymweld â'r Theatre Royal ym Merthyr Tudful a bu ichi ddweud y byddech yn gweithio gyda'ch gilydd i sicrhau cefnogaeth i gymunedau'r Cymoedd.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn ystyried rhoi'r gorau i gyllido amgueddfa Pontypridd—colled i'r amgueddfa o £45,000 y flwyddyn. A fyddech chi'n fodlon derbyn gwahoddiad i ymweld â'r amgueddfa gyda fi i ystyried y potensial enfawr sydd ganddi i hyrwyddo etifeddiaeth ddiwylliannol a diwydiannol gyfoethog y gymuned honno?

**Alun Pugh:** Local museums are the responsibility of locally elected authorities. As a Minister, I have responsibility for our national museums and a certain amount of oversight through CyMAL, which is an important division of the culture department. However, if there was a suggestion that there would be a widespread withdrawal of facilities at any community museum, I would be disappointed.

### **Hyrwyddo Atyniadau Diwylliannol The Promotion of Cultural Attractions**

**Q3 Janet Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion of cultural attractions in Wales? OAQ0657(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Wales has a wealth of cultural attractions, offering a wide range of activities and facilities to different visitor markets. Therefore, they are promoted in different ways. However, we take every opportunity to promote our varied cultural attractions, both

gan fy mod yn gyfarwydd â hyn fy hun. Mae sinema aml-sgrîn anferth i fyny'r ffordd o'm hetholaeth i, ac weithiau gall gymryd tua phythefnos i'r ffilmiau hynny gyrraedd Bae Colwyn. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn ystyried buddsoddi mewn cyfleusterau cymunedol fel blaenoriaeth bwysig, ac mae cyfleusterau cymunedol ar hyd a lled Cymru, sy'n cynnwys sinemâu, wedi cael symiau sylweddol o arian gan CCC yn y gorffennol. Nid yw'n berffaith, ond dyna'r farchnad ichi.

**Owen John Thomas:** A fortnight ago, you and Huw Lewis visited the Theatre Royal in Merthyr Tydfil and you said that you would work together to ensure support for Valleys communities.

However, I am sure you will be aware that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council is considering ceasing funding for Pontypridd museum—a loss to the museum of £45,000 a year. Would you be prepared to accept an invitation to visit the museum with me to consider its huge potential to promote the rich cultural and industrial heritage of that community?

**Alun Pugh:** Awdurdodau etholedig lleol sy'n gyfrifol am amgueddfeydd lleol. Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf yn gyfrifol am ein hamgueddfeydd cenedlaethol a rhyw gymaint o oruchwyliaeth yn sgil CyMAL, sy'n isadran bwysig o'r adran dros ddiwylliant. Fodd bynnag, pe bai awgrym bod cyfleusterau'n cael eu hatal ar raddfa fawr mewn unrhyw amgueddfa gymunedol, byddwn yn siomedig.

**C3 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo atyniadau diwylliannol yng Nghymru? OAQ0657(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan Gymru gyfoeth o atyniadau diwylliannol, sy'n cynnig amrywiaeth eang o weithgareddau a chyfleusterau ar gyfer gwahanol farchnadoedd ymwelwyr. Felly, maent yn cael eu hyrwyddo mewn ffyrdd gwahanol.

here in Wales and further afield.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn manteisio ar bob cyfle i hyrwyddo ein hamrywiol atyniadau diwylliannol, yma yng Nghymru a thu hwnt.

**Janet Davies:** Celtica in Machynlleth is an attraction that gives an overview of our history and is also a major tourist attraction in the area. Consultants were appointed to review and report on it when it got into financial difficulties. However, it now appears that they may not have been given full information on its operation. What discussions have you had with Powys County Council—the main funder—to ensure that full consideration is given to all information before a final decision is made on its future?

**Janet Davies:** Mae Celtica ym Machynlleth yn atyniad sy'n rhoi golwg gyffredinol ar ein hanes ac mae hefyd yn atyniad twristiaeth pwysig yn yr ardal. Penodwyd ymgynghorwyr i'w adolygu a pharatoi adroddiad arno pan aeth i drafferthion ariannol. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys yn awr ei bod yn bosibl nad oeddent wedi cael gwybodaeth lawn am ei weithredu. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda Chyngor Sir Powys—y prif gyllidydd—i sicrhau bod yr holl wybodaeth yn cael ei hystyried yn llawn cyn gwneud penderfyniad terfynol am ddyfodol y lle?

**Alun Pugh:** Powys County Council has not raised this matter with me.

**Alun Pugh:** Nid yw Cyngor Sir Powys wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda mi.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you agree that the new Assembly building, particularly the wonderful new Chamber, has already become an iconic cultural attraction for Wales?

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ydych yn cytuno bod adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, yn enwedig y Siambr newydd hardd, eisoes yn atyniad diwylliannol eiconig i Gymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Yes, it is a very fine building.

**Alun Pugh:** Ydy, y mae'n adeilad gwych iawn.

**Lisa Francis:** I am sure that the Minister realises that a coherent Welsh cultural tourism product depends on continued investment in the historic environment and the promotion of Welsh heritage at home and abroad, and that it needs to be increased, sustained and progressed. How far has this been progressed by the 14-month-old culture board?

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn sylweddoli bod twristiaeth ddiwylliannol Gymreig ystyrllon yn ddibynnol ar barhau i fuddsoddi yn yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ac ar hyrwyddo treftadaeth Cymru gartref a thramor, a bod angen cynyddu, cynnal a datblygu hyn. I ba raddau y mae hyn wedi datblygu yng ngofal y bwrdd diwylliant 14 mis oed?

**Alun Pugh:** The culture board is a strategic body comprising my officials, officers and members of the Arts Council of Wales, the National Library of Wales and a number of other organisations, including Welsh local authorities, which play an important role. At the moment, the primary task of the board is taking forwards the development of a new cultural strategy for Wales, and I look forward to our next meeting in a couple of weeks' time.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'r bwrdd diwylliant yn gorff strategol sy'n cynnwys fy swyddogion i, swyddogion ac aelodau Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru a nifer o sefydliadau eraill, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol Cymru, sydd â rôl bwysig. Ar hyn o bryd, prif dasg y bwrdd yw bwrw ymlaen i ddatblygu strategaeth ddiwylliannol newydd i Gymru, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ein cyfarfod nesaf ymhnen pythefnos.

**Mick Bates:** Street markets are an important cultural attraction and activity throughout Wales, particularly in rural Wales. They have

**Mick Bates:** Mae marchnadoedd stryd yn atyniad ac yn weithgarwch diwylliannol pwysig ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn y

great potential to attract visitors across the border to towns such as Welshpool in my constituency. What activities are you undertaking to promote these wonderful Welsh markets in towns such as Welshpool?

**Alun Pugh:** We do not have a direct financial funding stream for street markets. I well remember going to Ponty market on a Wednesday and a Saturday when I was a boy, but the direct subsidy of commercial markets such as that one, is not a matter for the culture budget, as you know.

Gymru wledig. Mae iddynt botensial mawr i ddenu ymwelwyr dros y ffin i drefi megis y Trallwng yn fy etholaeth i. Pa weithgareddau yr ydych yn ymgymryd â hwy i hyrwyddo'r marchnadoedd gwych hyn mewn trefi fel y Trallwng?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid oes gennym ffrwd gyllido ariannol uniongyrchol ar gyfer marchnadoedd stryd. Mae gennyf gof da o fynd i farchnad Ponty ar ddydd Mercher a dydd Sadwrn pan oeddwn yn fachgen, ond nid yw cymhorthdal uniongyrchol i farchnadoedd masnachol fel hon yn fater i'r gyllideb diwylliant, fel y gwyrddoch.

3.40 p.m.

### **Hyrwyddo Cwpan Ryder yn 2010 The Promotion of the Ryder Cup in 2010**

**Q4 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion of the Ryder Cup in 2010? OAQ0645(CWS)

**C4 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo'r Cwpan Ryder yn 2010? OAQ0645(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The Ryder Cup is a huge opportunity to raise the global profile of Wales. We wish to use the competition as a platform to promote Wales, not just as a superb golfing destination, but also as a great place to work and to play.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'r Cwpan Ryder yn gyfle gwych i godi proffil Cymru ar draws y byd. Yr ydym yn awyddus i ddefnyddio'r gystadleuaeth fel llwyfan i hyrwyddo Cymru, nid yn unig fel cyrchfan golff ragorol, ond hefyd fel lle gwych i weithio ac i chwarae.

**William Graham:** I acknowledge that Ryder Cup Wales recently pledged £1.2 million to promote golf at grass-roots level, making it more accessible to young people. Will the Minister outline the number of municipal golf courses in Wales and the anticipated increase in the number of such courses that will be required to meet the identified targets?

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn derbyn bod y Cwpan Ryder Cymru wedi addunedu £1.2 miliwn yn ddiweddar i hyrwyddo golff ar lawr gwlad, i'w gwneud yn haws i bobl ifanc chwarae. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu nifer y cyrsiau golff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a'r cynnydd a ragwelir yn nifer y cyrsiau o'r fath y bydd eu hangen i gyrraedd y targedau a nodwyd?

**Alun Pugh:** We want to make golf more accessible. In the past, it has suffered from an elitist image though that is certainly changing. I know that we can point to many examples of schemes in which clubs are actively engaging with women members and young people. However, we need to make golf more accessible and we will make a major announcement shortly on how we will be rolling out the availability of turn-up-and-play, pitch-and-putt and other courses that form an important first step on the road to

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym am wneud golff yn fwy agored i bawb. Yn y gorffennol, mae wedi dioddef oherwydd delwedd elitaidd, er bod hynny'n sicr yn newid. Gwn y gallwn gyfeirio at nifer o enghreifftiau o gynlluniau lle mae clybiau'n mynd ati o ddifrif i ddenu merched a phobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni wneud golff yn fwy agored, a byddwn yn gwneud cyhoeddiad pwysig cyn hir am y modd y byddwn yn cyflwyno cyrsiau cyrraedd a chwarae, pitsh a phytio, a chyrtsiau eraill a fydd yn gam pwysig cyntaf i gael

full membership.

aelodaeth lawn.

### **Adeiladau Hanesyddol Historic Buildings**

**Q5 Irene James:** Will the Minister make a statement on historic buildings in Wales? OAQ0627(CWS)

**C5 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am adeiladau hanesyddol yng Nghymru? OAQ0627(CWS)

**Q6 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on historic buildings? OAQ0613(CWS)

**C6 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am adeiladau hanesyddol? OAQ0613(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** We have some 30,000 listed buildings and 3,800 monuments of national importance in Wales. They are a testament to the rich and distinctive built heritage of Wales. Thirteen of the most important historical structures in Wales, from Caernarfon Castle in the north to Castell Coch in the south, will be offering free admission tomorrow, on our national day.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gennym oddeutu 30,000 o adeiladau wedi eu rhestru a 3,800 o henebion o bwys cenedlaethol yng Nghymru. Maent yn dystiolaeth o dreftadaeth adeiledig gyfoethog ac unigryw Cymru. Bydd tri ar ddeg o'r adeiladau hanesyddol pwysicaf yng Nghymru, o Gastell Caernarfon yn y Gogledd i Gastell Coch yn y De, yn cynnig mynediad am ddim yfory, ar ein diwrnod cenedlaethol.

**Irene James:** The latest round of funding for historic buildings, announced on 16 February, highlights an historic inequity in funding across Wales, with yet again not a single penny for the poorest Valleys areas. Minister, will you give me your assurance that you will address that disparity and ensure better strategic distribution of funds to acknowledge the historical value of all parts of Wales?

**Irene James:** Mae'r rownd ddiweddaraf o arian ar gyfer adeiladau hanesyddol, a gyhoeddwyd ar 16 Chwefror, yn dangos anghydraddoldeb o ran cyllido yng Nghymru, heb yr un geiniog unwaith eto i ardaloedd tlotaf y Cymoedd. Weinidog, a allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn rhoi sylw i'r gwahaniaeth hwn, ac yn sicrhau gwell dosbarthiad strategol o arian i gydnabod gwerth hanesyddol pob rhan o Gymru?

**Alun Pugh:** You will know that I am committed to making sure that the most deprived parts of Wales get their full share of public funding. However, we should not look at one funding round in isolation and there are many examples in Valleys areas of where Assembly Government support, channelled through the lottery, and important investments made through the Heritage Lottery Fund have helped to revitalise Valley communities. Across the hill from you is Blaenafon, which is a showpiece example of that regeneration in action.

**Alun Pugh:** Gwyddoch fy mod wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru yn cael eu cyfran deg o arian cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem edrych ar un rownd gyllido ar ei phen ei hun, gan fod nifer o enghreifftiau yn y Cymoedd lle mae cefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, wedi ei sianelu trwy'r loteri, a buddsoddiadau pwysig a wneir trwy Gronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri wedi helpu adfywio cymunedau'r Cymoedd. Dros y mynydd oddi wrthy ch mae Blaenafon, sy'n enghraifft nodedig o adfywio ar waith.

**Mark Isherwood:** To expand the issue, a series of academic books, based on research in Mold library, on archaeological evidence and on the oral and written traditions of Wales, has highlighted the link between the old kingdom of Gwynedd and the Arthurian legend. This has been highlighted many times

**Mark Isherwood:** I ymhelaethu ar y pwnc hwn, mae cyfres o lyfrau academiaidd, sy'n seiliedig ar ymchwil yn llyfrgell yr Wyddgrug, ar dystiolaeth archaeolegol ac ar draddodiadau llafar ac ysgrifenedig Cymru, wedi amlygu'r cysylltiad rhwng hen deyrnas Gwynedd a'r chwedl Arthuraidd. Tynnwyd



in the House of Commons, but not, to the best of my knowledge, so far in this Senedd. What action can you take to maximise the opportunities presented by that unique cultural inheritance?

**Alun Pugh:** As well as the real and tangible built environment, which we are determined to protect, there is certainly a place in Wales for a bit of legend. However, I think that that is more a matter for the tourist department.

**Alun Cairns:** Many chapels and churches in Wales are listed buildings, but because of the nature of their activities, they are excluded from receiving lottery funding and support. What policies can you introduce to correct the imbalance and the difference between lottery funding and the public funds that can be used to support these organisations?

**Alun Pugh:** I would be very interested indeed to receive any correspondence or reports that you have to show that religious organisations are not getting lottery funding. I know that there have been many examples of good church projects receiving lottery funding, but if you think that there is any discrimination, I would be pleased to hear from you further on that.

**Brynle Williams:** Given the rich assets that we have in Wales, in landscape, historical sites and culture, how is your Government working to bring foreign film production companies to Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** We will be discussing this issue in a later question. However, we have a specialist organisation dedicated to bringing film productions to Wales. Of course, Wales has many suitable venues for making movies. It has been famous in the past as the location of a string of movies, including everything from the so-called *Lara Croft Tomb Raider: The Cradle of Life* to—for those of us with slightly longer memories—*Carry On Up The Khyber*.

sylw at hyn lawer tro yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, ond nid yn y Senedd hon, hyd y gwn i. Pa gamau y gallwch chi eu cymryd i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd sy'n codi yn sgil yr etifeddiaeth ddiwylliannol unigryw honno?

**Alun Pugh:** Yn ogystal â'r amgylchedd adeiledig real a diriaethol yr ydym yn benderfynol o'i ddiogelu, yn sicr mae lle yng Nghymru i ychydig chwedloniaeth. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai mater i'r adran dwristiaeth yw hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae nifer o gapeli ac eglwysi yng Nghymru yn adeiladau sydd wedi eu rhestru, ond oherwydd natur eu gweithgareddau ni allant gael arian na chefnogaeth gan y loteri. Pa bolisiâu y gallwch eu cyflwyno i gywiro'r anghydbwysedd a'r gwahaniaeth rhwng arian y loteri ac arian cyhoeddus y gellir ei ddefnyddio i gefnogi'r sefydliadau hyn?

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwn yn falch iawn cael unrhyw ohebiaeth neu adroddiadau sydd gennych i ddangos nad yw sefydliadau crefyddol yn cael arian loteri. Gwn fod nifer o enghreifftiau o brosiectau eglwysig da wedi cael arian loteri, ond os credwch fod unrhyw achos o wahaniaethu, byddwn yn falch clywed mwy gennych am y mater.

**Brynle Williams:** O gofio'r asedau gwerthfawr sydd gennym yng Nghymru, o ran y dirwedd, safleoedd hanesyddol a diwylliant, beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i ddod â chwmnïau cynhyrchu ffilmiau o dramor i Gymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwn yn trafod y mater hwn mewn cwestiwn diweddarach. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym sefydliad arbenigol penodedig sy'n gweithio i ddenu cynrychiadau ffilm i Gymru. Wrth gwrs, mae gan Gymru nifer o leoliadau addas i wneud ffilmiau. Bu'n enwog yn y gorffennol fel lleoliad nifer o ffilmiau, gan gynnwys popeth o *Lara Croft Tomb Raider: The Cradle of Life* i—i'r rheini ohonom sy'n gallu cofio ymhellach yn ôl — *Carry On Up The Khyber*.

#### **Hyrwyddo Ffilmiau o Gymru Dramor Promoting Welsh Film Abroad**

**Q7 Carl Sargeant:** Will the Minister make a **C7 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog

statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is promoting Welsh film abroad? OAQ0642(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Moving seamlessly from that last supplementary question, the Wales Screen Commission promotes Wales as a location for film and television production in the UK and overseas, and it has a well established profile in the international marketplace. The commission has had a presence at the Cannes film festival as part of 'Wales in Cannes' every year since its inception.

**Carl Sargeant:** Promoting Welsh film and television abroad is one of the most effective ways of raising Wales's profile in the world. A Welsh film broadcast in a foreign country has the potential to reach tens or hundreds of millions of people, and I am sure that Connah's Quay and its characters in particular would make a wonderful film across the world. However, we need to ensure that films are made here in the first place, and the UK tax regime means that Ireland is often a more attractive place for production. Given that this matter is, of course, outside the scope of the Assembly's powers, what else can the Assembly do to encourage film production in Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right that the tax regime is not devolved, but we can have a clear focus and give a clear message that Wales is an excellent place in which to shoot films. That is not just limited to films of course, as television production is becoming increasingly important. In that context, it was pleasing to see the *Dr Who* series—which was made in Wales, and BBC Wales has a huge input into the technical background for that—achieving worldwide sales, and that can only be good for our tourism market.

ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyrwyddo ffilmiau o Gymru dramor? OAQ0642(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I symud ymlaen yn ddi-dor o'r cwestiwn atodol diwethaf, mae Comisiwn Sgrin Cymru yn hyrwyddo Cymru fel lleoliad i gynhyrchu ffilmiau a rhaglenni teledu yn y DU a thramor, ac mae'n enw cyfarwydd yn y farchnad ryngwladol. Mae'r comisiwn wedi bod yn bresennol yng ngŵyl ffilm Cannes fel rhan o 'Cymru yn Cannes' bob blwyddyn ers ei sefydlu.

**Carl Sargeant:** Hyrwyddo ffilm a theledu Cymreig mewn gwledydd tramor yw un o'r ffyrdd mwyaf effeithiol i godi proffil Cymru yn y byd. Mae gan ffilm Gymreig sy'n cael ei darlledu mewn gwlad dramor y potensial i gyrraedd degau neu gannoedd o filiynau o bobl, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Cei Connah a'i gymeriadau yn fwyaf arbennig yn gwneud ffilm ragorol ar draws y byd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau yn y lle cyntaf fod ffilmiau'n cael eu gwneud yma, ac mae cyfundrefn dreth y DU yn aml yn golygu bod Iwerddon yn cael ei hystyried fel lleoliad mwy deniadol ar gyfer cynhyrchu. A derbyn bod y mater hwn, wrth gwrs, y tu allan i bwerau'r Cynulliad, beth arall all y Cynulliad ei wneud i annog cynhyrchu ffilmiau yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud nad yw'r gyfundrefn dreth wedi ei datganoli, ond gallwn sicrhau pwyslais cryf a chyfleu neges glir, sef bod Cymru yn lle ardderchog i gynhyrchu ffilmiau. Nid yw'n cael ei gyfyngu i ffilmiau yn unig, wrth gwrs, gan fod cynhyrchu rhaglenni teledu'n dod yn fwy a mwy pwysig. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr oedd yn braf gweld bod cyfres *Dr Who*—a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru, ac mae BBC Cymru wedi gwneud cyfraniad enfawr at gefndir technegol y rhaglen—yn cael ei gwerthu ar draws y byd, ac mae hynny'n siŵr o fod yn newyddion da i'n marchnad dwristiaeth.

### 'Dringo'n Uwch' 'Climbing Higher'

**Q8 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the 'Climbing Higher'

**C8 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y strategaeth 'Dringo'n

strategy? OAQ0653(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Last year, we published ‘Climbing Higher’, the Welsh Assembly Government’s long-term strategy for sport and physical activity. Since then, we have made several important announcements and developments, including on free swimming for older people and many coaching awards. I met representatives of the Sports Council for Wales yesterday, ahead of the publication of our next steps action plan, which will take place later in the spring.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Following your attendance at a recent event at the Orangery at Margam Country Park, organised by the Neath Port Talbot health and wellbeing partnership, will you join me in congratulating the partnership, a consortium of local organisations, on putting together its physical health action plan? Will you also congratulate the partnership on its commitment to the principles of ‘Climbing Higher’, which, hopefully, will increase the number of adults—and I include myself—who participate in physical activity in Neath Port Talbot?

**Alun Pugh:** That is a very fair point indeed. I saw much good practice there in Margam, and a real commitment and sense of engagement. Of course, it is only by improving the diet of the Welsh population and levels of physical activity, which are fairly low by European standards, that we can ever hope, in the long term, to crack the problems of public health.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr bod pawb yn cytuno â chi bod angen sicrhau mynediad pawb i gyfleoedd i ymgymryd ag ymarfer corff a chael deiet da. A wnewch dderbyn bod llawer o bobl ag anabledau gwahanol yn ei chael hi’n anodd i gael y mynediad hwnnw, ac a wnaiff eich Llywodraeth ymrwymo i sicrhau y caiff y bobl hynny y cyfle i gyfranogi o’r gweithgareddau hynny?

**Alun Pugh:** I am happy to do that. I said that the average level of physical activity in Wales is pretty low by European standards. If you then drill down below that national average, you see that several groups are below even our currently low average, such

Uwch’? OAQ0653(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Y llynedd, cyhoeddasom ‘Dringo’n Uwch’, sef strategaeth tymor hir Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol. Ers hynny, yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer cyhoeddiad a datblygiad pwysig, gan gynnwys nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn a nifer o wobrau hyfforddi. Cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru ddoe, cyn cyhoeddi camau nesaf ein cynllun gweithredu, yn ddiweddarach yn y gwanwyn.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yn dilyn eich ymweliad â digwyddiad yn ddiweddar yn yr Orendy ym Mharc Gwledig Margam, a drefnwyd gan bartneriaeth iechyd a lles Castell-nedd Port Talbot, a ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y bartneriaeth, consortiwm o sefydliadau lleol, ar lunio ei gynllun gweithredu ar gyfer iechyd corfforol? A wnewch chi hefyd longyfarch y bartneriaeth ar ei hymrwymiad i egwyddorion ‘Dringo’n Uwch’ a fydd, gobeithio, yn golygu cynnydd yn nifer yr oedolion—ac yr wyf yn cynnwys fy hun—sy’n cymryd rhan mewn gweithgarwch corfforol yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gennych bwynt teg iawn yn wir. Gwelais nifer o arferion da ym Margam, a gwir ymroddiad ac ymdeimlad o ymwneud. Wrth gwrs, dim ond trwy wella diet pobl Cymru a lefelau eu gweithgarwch corfforol, sy’n ddigon isel yn ôl safonau Ewrop, y gallwn obeithio goresgyn problemau iechyd y cyhoedd yn y pen draw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, I am sure everyone would agree with you that there is a need to ensure access for all to opportunities to participate in exercise and a good diet. Do you accept that many people with various disabilities find it difficult to secure such access, and will your Government undertake to ensure that those people have the opportunity to participate in those activities?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn hapus i wneud hynny. Dywedais fod lefelau cyfartalog gweithgarwch corfforol yng Nghymru yn ddigon isel yn ôl safonau Ewropeaidd. Os ymchwiliwch yn is na’r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol hwnnw wedyn, gwelwch fod

as people from ethnic minorities, people from socially deprived areas and people with disabilities. All those examples are accounted for in the 'Climbing Higher' strategy.

llawer grŵp yn is na'n cyfartaledd isel presennol hyd yn oed, megis pobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig, pobl o ardaloedd sydd wedi eu hamddifadu'n gymdeithasol, a phobl ag anabledau. Rhoddir ystyriaeth i'r holl enghreifftiau hyn yn y strategaeth 'Dringo'n Uwch'.

**Eleanor Burnham:** What funding has been made available from your strategy for north Wales local authorities so that they can ensure that adequate sports and leisure facilities are available to all people across north Wales?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Pa arian sydd ar gael o'ch strategaeth ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol y Gogledd, er mwyn iddynt allu sicrhau bod cyfleusterau chwaraeon a hamdden digonol ar gael i bawb ar hyd a lled gogledd Cymru?

3.50 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** Local authorities are important delivery partners. The 22 local authorities in Wales own many sports facilities. As far as the Government's commitment is concerned, when the National Assembly for Wales was established in 1999 the sports budget was around £6.8 million. By 2007-08, it will have increased to over £24 million, which is an increase of 250 per cent. Investment in sport and mass participation is a key focus of Assembly Government budgets.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae awdurdodau lleol yn bartneriaid darparu pwysig. Mae'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn berchen ar nifer o gyfleusterau chwaraeon. Cyn belled ag y mae ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth yn bod, pan sefydlwyd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn 1999 yr oedd y gyllideb chwaraeon oddeutu £6.8 miliwn. Erbyn 2007-08, bydd wedi cynyddu i dros £24 miliwn, sy'n gynydd o 250 y cant. Mae buddsoddi mewn chwaraeon a chyfranogaeth dorfol yn ffocws allweddol yng nghyllidebau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ0635(CWS), yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 9, OAQ0635(CWS), has been withdrawn.

### **Pwysigrwydd yr Amgylchedd Hanesyddol The Importance of the Historical Environment**

**Q10 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of the historical environment in Wales? OAQ0640(CWS)

**C10 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd yr amgylchedd hanesyddol yng Nghymru? OAQ0640(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Wales has a rich, varied and distinctive historic environment which needs to be appreciated and protected not only for its intrinsic worth but also for its added value in terms of its contribution to the economy, sustainability, education and lifelong learning and health.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan Gymru amgylchedd hanesyddol cyfoethog, amrywiol a nodedig. Y mae angen ei werthfawrogi a'i warchod, nid yn unig oherwydd ei werth cynhenid, ond hefyd oherwydd ei werth ychwanegol o ran ei gyfraniad at yr economi, cynaliadwyedd, addysg, a dysgu gydol oes ac iechyd.

**Lisa Francis:** Having said that, I am sure that you believe that there needs to be a clear vision for the historic environment which halts destruction and damage to it at all levels. Why do you not believe that a key way to do this would be to assess the state of

**Lisa Francis:** Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn credu bod angen gweledigaeth glir ar gyfer yr amgylchedd hanesyddol sy'n atal ei ddinistrio a'i ddfrodi ar bob lefel. Pam nad ydych yn credu mai un ffordd allweddol o wneud hyn fyddai drwy

the historic environment in Wales, including an audit of current expenditure and a projection of future needs, as was recently put forward by English Heritage and the Conservatives as an amendment?

**Alun Pugh:** We consider that the best way forward is to look at those issues—and they are important—as an integral part of our culture strategy, rather than to have a separate strategy for the historic environment. I understand that that approach carries wide support in the sector.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiynau 11, OAQ0612(CWS), a 12, OAQ0622(CWS), yn ôl.

asesu cyflwr yr amgylchedd hanesyddol yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys archwiliad o'r gwariant cyfredol ac rhagamcan o anghenion y dyfodol, fel y cynigiwyd yn ddiweddar gan English Heritage a'r Ceidwadwyr fel gwelliant?

**Alun Pugh:** Credwn mai'r ffordd orau yw edrych ar y materion hynny—ac maent yn bwysig—fel rhan annatod o'n strategaeth diwylliant, yn hytrach na chael strategaeth ar wahân ar gyfer yr amgylchedd hanesyddol. Deallaf fod cefnogaeth eang yn y sector i'r dull hwn o weithredu.

**The Presiding Officer:** Questions 11, OAQ0612(CWS), and 12, OAQ0622(CWS), have been withdrawn.

### Chwaraeon yng Ngheredigion Sports in Ceredigion

**C13 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am chwaraeon yng Ngheredigion? OAQ0673(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Over £4 million has been invested in capital projects in Ceredigion through the Sports Council for Wales since 1995. A few minutes ago, we were talking about the low levels of physical activity in Wales in general, but according to sports council data you will be very pleased to learn that residents of Ceredigion are significantly more active than the general population of Wales.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ystadegau hynny, ond, yn ogystal â chyfranogiad cyffredinol, mae'n bwysig bod cyfleusterau chwaraeon arbenigol ar gael. Yr wyf eisoes wedi codi diffyg trac rhedeg ac athletau yng Ngheredigion gyda chi. Yn sgîl dyfodiad y Gemau Olympaidd i Lundain yn 2012, oni fyddai'n dda o beth i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar un cynllun mawr ym mhob ardal llywodraeth leol ar draws y Deyrnas Gyfunol i hybu a datblygu athletau?

**Alun Pugh:** I understand that there have been some issues in terms of Ceredigion's applications to the Big Lottery Fund. It is fair to say that we need to develop facilities all over Wales. In terms of the upcoming

**Q13 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on sports in Ceredigion? OAQ0673(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae dros £4 miliwn wedi ei fuddsoddi ar brosiectau cyfalaf yng Ngheredigion drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru er 1995. Rai munudau'n ôl yr oeddem yn siarad am lefelau isel y gweithgarwch corfforol yng Nghymru yn gyffredinol. Ond yn ôl data'r cyngor chwaraeon byddwch yn falch iawn o ddeall bod trigolion Ceredigion yn gwneud llawer iawn mwy o weithgarwch corfforol na phoblogaeth Cymru yn gyffredinol.

**Elin Jones:** I am aware of those statistics, but in addition to general participation, it is important that specialist sports facilities are available. I have previously raised with you the lack of a running and athletics track in Ceredigion. Given that the Olympic Games are coming to London in 2012, would it not be a good thing for the Government to look at one big plan in each local authority area across the United Kingdom to promote and develop athletics?

**Alun Pugh:** Deallaf fod rhai problemau wedi codi gyda cheisiadau Ceredigion i'r Gronfa Loteri Fawr. Mae'n deg dweud bod angen inni ddatblygu cyfleusterau ar hyd a lled Cymru. O ran y Gemau Olympaidd sydd ar

Olympics, there will be a participation focus on that, but we will have to concentrate on our major national facilities which are spread all over Wales, from the velodrome in Newport, to the Tryweryn canoeing centre, to the national swimming pool in Swansea.

ddod, bydd canolbwyntio ar gyfranogi, ond bydd yn rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar ein prif gyfleusterau cenedlaethol, sydd wedi'u gwasgaru ar draws Cymru, o'r feledrom yng Nghasnewydd, i ganolfan ganwio Tryweryn, i'r pwll nofio cenedlaethol yn Abertawe.

### **Pwysigrwydd Meysydd Chwarae The Importance of Playing Fields**

**Q14 Michael German:** Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of playing fields in Wales? OAQ0606(CWS)

**C14 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd meysydd chwarae yng Nghymru? OAQ0606(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** As I have outlined in my Climbing Higher strategy, the Welsh Assembly Government wants Wales to become a fitter and healthier nation. I regard the playing fields in Wales as an important facility, as it is where many young people enjoy their first experience of taking part in sport and physical activity.

**Alun Pugh:** Fel yr wyf wedi ei amlinellu yn fy strategaeth Dringo'n Uwch, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am i Gymru ddod yn genedl mwy ffit ac iach. Yr wyf yn ystyried y meysydd chwarae yng Nghymru yn gyfleuster pwysig, gan mai yno y mae nifer o bobl ifanc yn mwynhau eu profiad cyntaf o gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol.

**Michael German:** The Minister will be aware of the recent report about increasing obesity in young children up to the age of 15, and the requirement for participation in sport as well as a change in diet. What discussions has the Minister held with his colleague, Jane Davidson, in respect of schools losing playing fields or the recovery of playing fields that local authorities have released in previous years? Does the Minister agree that there is a pattern of a loss of playing fields, on average, across Wales, which means that young people are not able to exercise as much as they could have done in the past?

**Michael German:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad yn ddiweddar am ordewdra cynyddol mewn plant ifanc hyd at 15 oed, a'r gofyniad i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yn ogystal â newid diet. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gyda'i gyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, am ysgolion sy'n colli meysydd chwarae, neu hawlio'n ôl feysydd chwarae sydd wedi eu rhyddhau gan awdurdodau lleol yn y gorffennol? A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod hynna batrwm o golli meysydd chwarae, ar gyfartaledd, ar draws Cymru, sy'n golygu nad yw pobl ifanc yn gallu ymarfer cymaint ag y gallent fod wedi ei wneud yn y gorffennol.

**Alun Pugh:** The rising trend of obesity among young people in Wales is very worrying, because, if we cannot counteract the problem in the long term, whoever is Minister with responsibility for health in 20 or 30 years will face a huge bill for treating diabetes. It is partially a question of diet and partially a question of physical activity, which is why school sport is particularly important. I will have a major announcement to make later this year about extending the Dragon Sport initiative into secondary schools. There is a special technical advice

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'r duedd gynyddol o ordewdra ymysg pobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn peri pryder mawr, oherwydd os na allwn atal y broblem yn y tymor hir, bydd pwy bynnag yw'r Gweinidog a fydd yn gyfrifol am iechyd ymhen 20 i 30 mlynedd yn wynebu bil enfawr am drin diabetes. Mae'n gwestiwn o ddieta yn rhannol ac o weithgarwch corfforol yn rhannol, a dyna pam mae chwaraeon ysgol yn arbennig o bwysig. Bydd gennyf gyhoeddiad mawr i'w wneud yn ddiweddarach eleni am ymestyn cynllun Campau'r Ddraig i ysgolion uwchradd. Mae

note from the planning division with regard to school playing fields—TAN 16—which deals with sport and recreation. It is in the process of being revised, and the draft documents will be available for public consultation in the summer. I am sure that you will have something to say about those at that stage, Mike.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, time and again this afternoon you have stressed the importance of school playing fields. Do you, therefore, agree that, before any school sells its playing fields, it should seek the approval of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning?

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to say that the availability of school playing fields is a bigger issue for our colleagues in England than it is in Wales. However, before any school disposes of its playing fields, a very careful assessment is needed to ensure that the availability of facilities for pupils' recreation is adequate.

gan yr is-adran gynllunio nodyn cyngor technegol arbennig ar feysydd chwarae ysgolion—TAN 16—sy'n delio â chwaraeon ac adloniant. Mae yn y broses o gael ei adolygu, a bydd y dogfennau drafft ar gael i ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd yn eu cylch yn yr haf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gennych rywbeth i'w ddweud amdanynt bryd hynny, Mike.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, dro ar ôl tro y prynhawn yma yr ydych wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd meysydd chwarae ysgolion. A ydych yn cytuno, felly, cyn i unrhyw ysgol werthu ei meysydd chwarae, y dylai geisio cymeradwyaeth y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg dweud bod argaeledd meysydd chwarae ysgolion yn fwy o broblem i'n cydweithwyr yn Lloegr nag ydyw yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, cyn i unrhyw ysgol waredu ei meysydd chwarae, mae angen asesiad gofalus iawn i sicrhau bod y cyfleusterau sydd ar gael ar gyfer hamdden y disgyblion yn ddigonol.

## Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee

### Ymwelwyr â'r Senedd Visitors to the Senedd

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff cynrychiolydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ ddatganiad am ymwelwyr â'r Senedd? OAQ009(HC)

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** Will the representative of the House Committee make a statement on visitors to the Senedd? OAQ009(HC)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** Visitors to the Senedd are welcome. [*Laughter.*] I have genuinely good news. Between opening the doors to the public at 10 a.m. on Tuesday 7 February and the close of business on Monday 20 February, there were 16,773 visitors to the Senedd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Mae croeso i ymwelwyr â'r Senedd. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae gennyf newyddion gwirioneddol dda. Rhwng agor y drysau i'r cyhoedd am 10 a.m. ddydd Mawrth 7 Chwefror a diwedd busnes ddydd Llun 20 Chwefror, bu 16,773 o bobl ym ymweld â'r Senedd.

**Owen John Thomas:** I find that remarkable, given that some people present today have found it difficult to say 'senedd', let alone find it. Will you join me in congratulating the committee on the choice of the name 'Senedd', which gives this institution great esteem and dignity, which the word 'chamber' did not provide?

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae hynny'n rhyfeddol, o gofio bod rhai pobl sy'n bresennol heddiw wedi ei chael yn anodd dweud 'senedd', heb sôn am ddod o hyd iddi. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y pwyllgor ar ddewis yr enw 'Senedd', sy'n rhoi i'r sefydliad hwn fri ac urddas mawr, rhywbeth nad oedd y gair 'siambr' yn ei wneud?

**John Marek:** ‘Senedd’ is the official name. For those Members who do not wish to use that word, I do not think that it would be a great feat of translation to say ‘senate’. However, if people can say ‘senedd’, we would like them to do so.

**Owen John Thomas:** What about the congratulations?

**John Marek:** Although I am the Chair of the House Committee, I congratulate the committee on a decent set of names, which were decided after consultation with all parties and all the Members of the different party groups that sit on the committee.

**John Marek:** ‘Senedd’ yw’r enw swyddogol. I’r Aelodau hynny nad ydynt am ddefnyddio’r gair hwnnw, ni chredaf y byddai’n orchest gyfieithu i ddweud ‘senate’. Fodd bynnag, os gall pobl ddweud ‘senedd’, byddem yn hoffi iddynt wneud hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Beth am y llongyfarchiadau?

**John Marek:** Er mai fi yw Cadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ, yr wyf yn llongyfarch y pwyllgor ar set deilwng o enwau, a benderfynwyd ar ôl ymgynghori â’r pleidiau i gyd a holl aelodau’r gwahanol grwpiau plaid sydd ar y pwyllgor.

### **Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question**

#### **Cau Melin Bapur DS Smith The Closure of the DS Smith Paper Mill**

**William Graham:** Will the Minister for Economic Development and Transport make a statement on the impact of the closure of the DS Smith paper mill at Sudbrook, Monmouthshire? EAQ0698(EDT)

**William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ddatganiad ar effaith cau melin bapur DS Smith yn Sudbrook, sir Fynwy? EAQ0698(EDT)

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** This is very disappointing news. I am sure that Members will join me in expressing sadness about this and the impact that it will have on those affected. Some 140 people are employed at DS Smith paper mill at Sudbrook. The Assembly Government and its Team Wales partners are ready to work together to assess the needs of affected individuals and to help them to secure fresh employment opportunities. This process has already swung into action with my officials and the other Team Wales partners in the public sector meeting the company yesterday to discuss available support to the workforce.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Mae hyn yn newyddion siomedig iawn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau’n ymuno â mi i fynegi tristwch am hyn a’r effaith a gaiff ar y rhai yr effeithir arnynt. Cyflogir rhyw 140 o bobl ym melin bapur DS Smith yn Sudbrook. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a’i phartneriaid yn Nhîm Cymru yn barod i weithio gyda’i gilydd i asesu anghenion yr unigolion yr effeithir arnynt a’u helpu i sicrhau cyfleoedd cyflogaeth newydd. Mae’r broses hon eisoes wedi dechrau, a chyfarfu fy swyddogion a phartneriaid eraill Tîm Cymru yn y sector cyhoeddus â’r cwmni ddoe i drafod y cymorth sydd ar gael i’r gweithlu.

**William Graham:** Thank you for your reply. I share your concern. You will know that this part of Monmouthshire has no other manufacturing concerns of this size. You will also know that a major contributing factor to the closure was the rapid and significant rise in energy costs. I have no doubt that that will form part of your future strategy. This plant has a unique feature in that it has shared

**William Graham:** Diolch ichi am eich ateb. Yr wyf fi fel chithau yn pryderu. Gwyddoch nad oes gan y rhan hon o sir Fynwy unrhyw fusnesau gweithgynhyrchu eraill o’r maint hwn. Byddwch yn gwybod hefyd mai un ffactor o bwys a gyfrannodd at y cau oedd y cynnydd cyflym a sylweddol yng nghostau ynni. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth na fydd hynny’n rhan o’ch strategaeth ar gyfer y



access to the water being pumped from beneath the Severn to keep the railway tunnel open. Therefore, it has access to some 60 million litres of water a year. That is a substantial amount of water, and perhaps when you advertise the site, you could make people aware of this unique facility.

4.00 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** Clearly that is a factor that will have to be taken into consideration. The company has announced a 90-day consultation and we will be looking, with the trade unions and the company, to see what we can do to help those affected by this decision. At this stage, it is too early to say what will happen with the site and whether alternative purchasers will come in, but the factors that you outline will have to be taken into account.

**John Griffiths:** Could you confirm the scale of the proactivity of the advice and help that is available for employees in terms of alternative jobs, training, advice on benefits, and so on? Could that be on-site and, if not, could it be as proactive as possible?

In terms of general help for manufacturing, given that this is an example of some of the difficulties that manufacturing faces—although there are particular problems with this firm—will you continue to look at the sort of help and advice that the manufacturing industry receives in Wales, in particular with regard to energy costs that have escalated substantially recently and which impact, for example, on steel firms in my constituency of Newport East?

**Andrew Davies:** In terms of the support that we can give, the company was contacted on 21 February and, yesterday, the Welsh Development Agency account manager met with company representatives, along with Careers Wales, Business Eye and Monmouthshire County Council, to outline to the management what is available in terms of public-sector support. If, after the end of the 90-day consultation, the closure of the plant goes ahead and the redundancies are made,

dyfodol. Mae i'r gwaith hwn nodwedd unigryw gan ei fod yn rhannu'r cyflenwad dŵr sy'n cael ei bwmpio o dan afon Hafren i gadw twnnel y rheilffyrdd ar agor. Felly, mae'n gallu manteisio ar ryw 60 miliwn litr o ddŵr y flwyddyn. Mae hynny'n llawer iawn o ddŵr, a phan fyddwch yn hysbysebu'r safle, efallai y gallech sicrhau bod pobl yn gwybod am y cyfleuster unigryw hwn.

**Andrew Davies:** Yn amlwg, mae hwnnw'n ffactor y bydd yn rhaid ei gymryd i ystyriaeth. Mae'r cwmni wedi cyhoeddi ymgynghoriad 90 diwrnod, a byddwn yn edrych, gyda'r undebau llafur a'r cwmni, i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud i helpu'r rheini y mae'r penderfyniad hwn yn effeithio arnynt. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhy gynnar dweud beth fydd yn digwydd gyda'r safle ac a ddaw prynwyr eraill i mewn. Ond bydd yn rhaid i'r ffactorau yr ydych yn eu hamlinellu gael eu cymryd i ystyriaeth.

**John Griffiths:** A allech gadarnhau pa mor rhagweithiol yw'r cyngor a'r help sydd ar gael i weithwyr o ran swyddi gwahanol, hyfforddiant, cyngor am fudd-daliadau, ac ati? A allai hynny ddigwydd ar y safle, ac os na all, a allai fod mor rhagweithiol â phosibl?

O ran help cyffredinol i weithgynhyrchu, gan fod hon yn enghraifft o rai o'r anawsterau sy'n wynebu gweithgynhyrchu—er bod problemau neilltuol gyda'r cwmni hwn—a fyddwch yn parhau i edrych ar y math o help a chyngor y mae'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn ei gael yng Nghymru, yn arbennig o ran costau ynni, sydd wedi codi'n sylweddol yn ddiweddar ac sy'n effeithio, er enghraifft, ar gwmnïau dur yn fy etholaeth i yn Nwyrain Casnewydd?

**Andrew Davies:** O ran y cymorth y gallwn ei roi, cysylltwyd â'r cwmni ar 21 Chwefror, a ddoe cyfarfu rheolwr cyfrifon Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru â chynrychiolwyr y cwmni, ynghyd â Gyrfa Cymru, Llygad Busnes a Chyngor Sir Fynwy, i amlinellu i'r rheolwyr yr hyn sydd ar gael o ran cymorth gan y sector cyhoeddus. Os bydd y bwriad i gau'r gwaith, ar ôl diwedd yr ymgynghori 90 diwrnod, yn mynd yn ei flaen a swyddi'n cael eu dileu, mae gennym fecanwaith hynod

we have a well-oiled mechanism in place to help those affected. One of the issues that we will be discussing with the company and the trade unions is the level of support that the company and those affected by this announcement can expect.

Manufacturing is of huge importance to the Welsh economy. As a sector, it still contributes a greater degree of wealth in Wales than it does in any other part of the United Kingdom. We, as a Government, and as I, a Minister, will be doing everything that we can do to help the sector go through many of the challenges and changes that it is faced with, not least of which is the substantial rise in energy costs over the last 12 months or so. We have a liberalised energy market system in the UK and we have benefited from that over the last five to 10 years and from the fact that energy prices have been lower than those of many of our competitors in the European Union. Unfortunately, we are now faced with high energy prices because of the global demand for oil and gas. There is no direct financial help that we can give to companies but we can offer them help in reducing their energy use through the Carbon Trust and the Energy Saving Trust and a range of other mechanisms. We will continue to press the UK Government as well as the European Commission about the need for the greater liberalisation of the European Union energy market.

**Michael German:** I am sure that the Minister would agree that this is sad news for a company that produces a specialist corrugated card, which uses a high content of recycled material. Has the Minister done an analysis of the impact on recycling, in south Wales, given that, in north Wales, there is a substantial industry for using recycled paper? Has he done any analysis of where this material comes from and whether or not it will have an impact on local authority collections across south Wales?

While I share the Minister's commitment to manufacturing in this area, as it is an important part of south Wales, is there any way in which the Minister can intervene with support in terms of energy costs for other manufacturing industries across south-east

effeithiol i helpu'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt. Un o'r materion y byddwn yn eu trafod gyda'r cwmni a'r undebau llafur yw lefel y cymorth y gall y cwmni a'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn ei disgwyl.

Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn bwysig aruthrol i economi Cymru. Fel sector, mae'n dal i gyfrannu mwy o gyfoeth yng Nghymru nag yn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Byddwn ni, fel Llywodraeth, a minnau, fel Gweinidog, yn gwneud popeth a allwn i helpu'r sector trwy nifer o'r sialensiau a'r newidiadau sy'n ei wynebu, ac yn anad dim y cynnydd sylweddol mewn costau ynni dros y 12 mis diwethaf yn fras. Mae gennym system o farchnad ynni rydd yn y DU ac yr ydym wedi elwa o hynny dros y pump i 10 mlynedd diwethaf, ac o'r ffaith fod prisiau ynni wedi bod yn is na phrisiau nifer o'n cystadleuwyr yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn anffodus, yr ydym yn wynebu prisiau ynni uchel yn awr oherwydd y galw byd-eang am olew a nwy. Nid oes cymorth ariannol uniongyrchol y gallwn ei roi i gwmnïau, ond gallwn gynnig help iddynt ddefnyddio llai o ynni drwy'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni ac amryw o fecanweithiau eraill. Byddwn yn parhau i bwysio ar Lywodraeth y DU yn ogystal â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd am yr angen i wneud marchnad ynni'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn farchnad fwy rhydd.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod hyn yn newyddion trist i gwmni sy'n cynhyrchu cerdyn rhychiog arbenigol, sy'n defnyddio elfen uchel o ddeunydd wedi'i ailgylchu. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud dadansoddiad o'r effaith ar ailgylchu, yn ne Cymru, o gofio yng ngogledd Cymru fod diwydiant sylweddol ar gyfer defnyddio papur wedi'i ailgylchu? A yw wedi gwneud unrhyw ddadansoddiad i weld o ble y daw'r deunydd hwn ac a fydd yn effeithio ar gasgliadau awdurdodau lleol ar draws de Cymru?

Er fy mod i, fel y Gweinidog, wedi ymrwymo i weithgynhyrchu yn yr ardal hon, gan ei fod yn rhan bwysig o dde Cymru, a oes unrhyw ffordd y gall y Gweinidog ymyrryd gyda chymorth yn ymwneud â chostau ynni i ddiwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu eraill ar

Wales, which are also finding it difficult, particularly with the recently announced hike in gas prices?

**Andrew Davies:** Officials are currently considering the impact that this might have on suppliers. This is a standard response to any major closure: to examine the wider impact, rather than just that on the company and the 140 employed at DS Smith. That will include other suppliers that are part of the supply chain.

Therefore, I think that it is too soon to say what the precise impact will be, but there will be an impact, as you said, in terms of the production of the corrugated inner section of the cardboard boxes. One of the problems that the company has perhaps faced is that it only produces one product, so it has all its eggs in one basket, and that has clearly made it extremely vulnerable to the hike in energy costs.

On support in relation to energy prices, there is nothing that we can do directly. As I said in my response to John Griffiths, we have an open market for energy supply. The problems that we face are because of the lack of a liberalised open market in the rest of the European Union. To a large extent, the recent hike in prices has been a result of that. However, we and the UK Government will continue to press the European Commission. As you may be aware, a report was published last week, or the week before, by the EC on the closed markets that are operating in many EU countries. This means that we are unable to offer direct financial assistance to companies as a result of what we hope will be the short-term rise in energy prices, other than helping them to reduce their energy use in the first place.

draws de-ddwyrain Cymru, sydd hefyd yn ei chael hi'n anodd, yn enwedig gyda'r codiad a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar ym mrisiau olew?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r swyddogion wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried yr effaith y gallai hyn ei chael ar gyflenwyr. Ymateb safonol yw hwn pan gaeir unrhyw waith mawr: archwilio'r effaith ehangach, yn hytrach na dim ond ar y cwmni a'r 140 a gyflogir yn DS Smith. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys cyflenwyr eraill sy'n rhan o'r gadwyn gyflenwi.

Felly, yn fy marn i, mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud beth fydd yr union effaith, ond fe fydd effaith, fel y dywedasoch, o ran cynhyrchu rhan rychiog fewnol y blychau cardfwrdd. Un o'r problemau y mae'r cwmni wedi eu hwynebu, efallai, yw mai un cynnyrch sydd ganddo. Felly, mae ei wyau i gyd yn yr un fased, sy'n amlwg wedi ei wneud yn fregus dros ben gyda'r cynnydd yng nghostau ynni.

O ran cymorth gyda phrisiau ynni, nid oes dim byd uniongyrchol y gallwn wneud. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i John Griffiths, mae gennym farchnad agored ar gyfer cyflenwi ynni. Mae'r problemau a wynebw'n yn ganlyniad i ddiffyg marchnad agored rydd yng ngweddill yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. I raddau helaeth, canlyniad hynny oedd y codiad yn ddiweddar mewn prisiau. Fodd bynnag, fe fyddwn ni a Llywodraeth y DU yn dal i ddwyn pwysau ar y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Fel y gwyddoch, efallai, cyhoeddwyd adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf, neu'r wythnos flaenorol, gan y CE ar y marchnadoedd caeedig sy'n gweithredu mewn nifer o wledydd yn yr UE. Golyga hyn na allwn gynnig cymorth ariannol uniongyrchol i gwmnïau o ganlyniad i'r hyn a fydd, gobeithio, yn gynydd tymor-byr ym mhrisiau ynni, heblaw am eu helpu i ddefnyddio llai o ynni yn y lle cyntaf.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have one change to report to this week's business. As a consequence of the notice to debate the NHS Pensions Agency Abolition Order, the debate on which has been deferred until next

**Y Gweinidog Busnes (Jane Hutt):** Mae gennyf un newid i sôn amdano ym musnes yr wythnos hon. O ganlyniad i'r rhybudd i drafod Gorchymyn Diddymu Asiantaeth Bensiynau'r GIG y gohiriwyd y ddadl arno

week, I will not be proposing the composite motion to approve that Order and the NHS Blood and Transplant (Amendment) Regulations 2006, the NHS Business Services Authority (Amendment) Regulations 2006 and the NHS Business Services Authority (Establishment and Constitution) (Amendment) Order Regulations 2006. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which is available to Members on the agenda, with the addition of the motion to debate the NHS Pensions Agency Abolition Order, and the motions to approve the regulations that I just mentioned, on Wednesday 8 March, and the motions to approve the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 7) (Wales) Order 2006, the Groundwater (Water Framework Directive) Directions 2006, the Plant Breeders' Rights (Naming and Fees) Regulations 2006, the Water Resources (Abstraction and Impounding) Regulations 2006, and the Environmental Impact Assessment (Land Drainage Improvement Works) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, which were considered by the Business Committee this morning and will be discussed in Plenary on Tuesday 7 March.

Following the Business Committee meeting this morning, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Abolition of Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006; the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No.6) (Wales) Order 2006; the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No.7) (Wales) Order 2006; the Local Government (Best Value Authorities) (Power to Trade) (Wales) Order 2006; the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales (Standards Investigations) Order 2006; and the Welsh Regional Flood Defence Committee (Composition) Order 2006.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I thank the Business Minister for acceding to some of the requests that were put to her by opposition party business managers today. We particularly

tan yr wythnos nesaf, ni fyddaf yn cyflwyno'r cynnig cyfansawdd i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn hwnnw a Rheoliadau Gwaed a Thrawsblaniadau'r GIG (Diwygio) 2006, Rheoliadau Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG (Diwygio) 2006 a Rheoliadau Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG (Sefydlu a Chyfansoddiad) (Diwygio) 2006. Mae'r busnes am y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi ei osod allan yn y datganiad drafft, sydd ar gael i Aelodau ar yr agenda, gan ychwanegu'r cynnig i drafod Gorchymyn Diddymu Asiantaeth Bensiynau'r GIG, a'r cynigion i gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau yr wyf newydd eu crybwyll, ddydd Mercher 8 Mawrth, a'r cynigion i gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Plant (Cychwyn Rhif 7) (Cymru) 2006, Cyfarwyddiadau Dŵr Daear (Cyfarwyddeb Fframwaith Dŵr) 2006, Rheoliadau Hawliau Bridwyr Planhigion (Enwi a Ffioedd) 2006, Rheoliadau Adnoddau Dŵr (Codi a Thynnu) 2006, a Rheoliadau Asesiad Effaith Amgylcheddol (Gwaith Gwella Draeniad Tir) (Diwygio) 2006, a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma ac a drafodir yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar ddydd Mawrth, 7 Mawrth.

Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaeth: Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Diddymu Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 7) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Awdurdodau Gwerth Gorau) (Pŵer i Fasnachu) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru (Ymchwilio i Safonau) 2006; a Gorchymyn Pwyllgor Rhanbarthol Amddiffyn Rhag Llifogydd Cymru (Cyfansoddi) 2006.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes. Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Carwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog Busnes am gytuno i rai o'r ceisiadau a wnaed iddi gan reolwyr busnes y gwrthbleidiau heddiw. Yr ydym yn

welcome the opportunity to discuss the unacceptable levels of violence suffered by NHS staff in Wales. We will want to raise concerns at that time as to whether or not the Assembly Government is taking this as seriously as it should, particularly with regard to the possibility of increased penalties for those members of the public who sadly do commit such offences. We look forward to having that debate at the right time and thank the Minister for being so co-operative on this occasion.

**Lisa Francis:** I thank you for your statement today, Minister, and for agreeing to some requests. We also welcome the debate on the safety of public sector staff, particularly in the NHS. We are grateful for the statement on safety on trains and railway stations following the recent reports that suggest that passengers are at greater risk in Wales than in other parts of the UK. We also welcome the written statement on the gender pay gap and for the statement that will come forward regarding the potential job losses at, I think, 68 Kwik Save and Somerfield stores, which will, potentially, result in the loss of 260 jobs in Wales.

4.10 p.m

In relation to our request for a statement giving an update on the police forces merger, I am disappointed that the Minister does not intend to schedule time for this statement. While you say that these issues are non-devolved, the Secretary of State for Wales has told the BBC that there is a danger that the Welsh police authorities will miss out on financial incentives. I would have thought that that would be your incentive to give this matter further consideration.

**Peter Black:** Although the statement is not actually available on the agenda pages on the internet here, we are happy to support it in the good faith that it is what the Minister says that it is. Like the other parties, we welcome the debate on public sector staff, particularly accident and emergency department staff. This is an important issue, and requires debate. I thank the Minister for her increasing flexibility in meeting the demands of the party business managers, particularly the request for an oral statement on the contract

croesawu'n arbennig y cyfle i drafod lefel annerbyniol y trais a ddiodeffir gan staff y GIG yng Nghymru. Byddwn eisiau lleisio pryderon bryd hynny am y cwestiwn a yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymryd hyn mor ddifrifol ag y dylai, yn enwedig o ran posibilrwydd cosbau llymach ar yr aelodau hynny o'r cyhoedd sydd, ysywaeth, yn cyflawni troseddau felly. Edrychwn ymlaen at y ddadl honno ar yr adeg iawn, a diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei chydweithrediad ar yr achlysur hwn.

**Lisa Francis:** Diolch am eich datganiad heddiw, Weinidog, ac am gytuno i rai ceisiadau. Yr ydym ni hefyd yn croesawu'r ddadl am ddiogelwch staff y sector cyhoeddus, yn enwedig yn y GIG. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am y datganiad am ddiogelwch ar drenau a gorsafoedd rheilffordd, yn dilyn yr adroddiadau'n ddiweddar sy'n awgrymu bod teithwyr mewn mwy o berygl yng Nghymru nag mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Croesawn hefyd y datganiad ysgrifenedig am y bwloch tâl rhwng y ddau ryw, ac am y datganiad a ddaw gerbron parthed y swyddi y gellir eu colli mewn 68 o siopau Kwik Save a Somerfield, mi gredaf. Bydd hynny o bosibl yn golygu colli 260 o swyddi yng Nghymru.

Parthed ein cais am ddatganiad i roi'r diweddaraf am uno'r heddluoedd, yr wyf yn siomedig nad yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu rhoi amser ar yr agenda i'r datganiad hwn. Er eich bod yn dweud nad yw'r pynciau hyn yn rhai sydd wedi eu datganoli, dywedodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru wrth y BBC fod perygl y bydd awdurdodau heddlu Cymru yn peidio â chael y cymhellion ariannol. Byddwn yn meddwl mai hynny fyddai eich sbardun i ystyried y mater hwn ymhellach.

**Peter Black:** Er nad yw'r datganiad mewn gwirionedd ar gael ar dudalennau'r agenda ar y rhyngwyd yma, yr ydym yn falch o'i gefnogi gan gredu'n ffyddiog ei fod fel y dywed y Gweinidog. Fel y pleidiau eraill, croesawn y ddadl am staff y sector cyhoeddus, yn enwedig staff adrannau damweiniau ac argyfwng. Y mae hwn yn fater pwysig, ac y mae angen ei drafod. Carwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei hyblygrwydd cynyddol i fodloni gofynion rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau, yn enwedig y

for the supply of oxygen, which is of increasing concern for many Members, given the number of queries that we are getting about it. I look forward to hearing that statement and to contributing to it.

**Carl Sargeant:** Minister, perhaps we could find time in the future to debate the effects of free school breakfasts across Wales. It was a policy that faced strong objections from opposition parties, where Nick Bourne—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We listened in relative quiet to the three opposition party spokespeople. I am anxious to hear what Carl Sargeant has to say.

**Carl Sargeant:** Headteachers have said to me that free school breakfasts have radically transformed their classrooms, and that children are learning better. Also, there is the Assembly's north Wales regional office. It is a fine office, with good facilities. My constituents have suggested that it could be better used, and that it would save the tax payer £250,000 if regional Members were to use it, instead of having their offices in key constituency seats. Finally, I would like to discuss the Assembly sponsored public body mergers, particularly the issue of branding. The WDA's branding, the bold dragon logo, was a positive logo and was recognised by industry worldwide. I congratulate my colleagues from Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales on their decision this week to adopt a Welsh poppy as the party's logo. It is suitable, as the poppy seeks growth in damp and shady places, is in decline, and lives on rocky ground. I would be interested in your thoughts, Minister.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Minister, you may answer a selection of those questions—those that are within your portfolio.

**The Business Minister:** I will certainly choose to answer a selection of those questions.

It is important to say to Helen Mary, Lisa and Peter that we wholeheartedly welcome a debate on the safety of public sector staff.

cais am ddatganiad llafar am y contract i gyflenwi ocsigen, sy'n bryder cynyddol i nifer o Aelodau, o gofio nifer yr ymholiadau a gawn amdano. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed y datganiad hwnnw ac at gyfrannu ato.

**Carl Sargeant:** Weinidog, efallai y bydd modd cael amser yn y dyfodol i drafod effeithiau brecwast ysgol am ddim ledled Cymru. Polisi ydoedd a wrthwynebwyd yn gryf gan y gwrthbleidiau, gyda Nick Bourne—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydym wedi gwranddo'n ddigon tawel ar dri llefarydd y gwrthbleidiau. Yr wyf yn awyddus i glywed beth sydd gan Carl Sargeant i'w ddweud.

**Carl Sargeant:** Dywedodd prifathrawon wrthyf fod brecwast ysgol am ddim wedi trawsnewid eu hystafelloedd dosbarth, a bod y plant yn dysgu'n well. Hefyd, mae yna fater swyddfa ranbarthol y Cynulliad yn y Gogledd. Mae'n swyddfa braf, gyda chyfleusterau da. Awgrymodd fy etholwyr y gellid gwneud gwell defnydd ohoni, ac y byddai'n arbed £250,000 i drethdalwr petai Aelodau rhanbarthol yn ei defnyddio, yn hytrach na chael eu swyddfeydd mewn seddi etholaeth allweddol. Yn olaf, carwn drafod uno'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, yn enwedig mater brandio. Yr oedd brandio Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, logo balch y ddraig, yn logo cadarnhaol ac yn cael ei gydnabod gan ddiwydiant ledled y byd. Dymunaf longyfarch fy nghydweithwyr o Blaid Cymru - the Party of Wales ar eu penderfyniad yr wythnos hon i fabwysiadu'r pabi Cymreig fel logo'r blaid. Y mae'n addas, gan fod y pabi'n tyfu mewn mannau llaith a chysgodol, yn prinhaus, ac yn byw ar dir caregog. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb yn eich barn, Weinidog.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Weinidog, cewch ateb detholiad o'r cwestiynau hyn – y rhai sydd o fewn eich portffolio.

**Y Gweinidog Busnes:** Yn sicr fe ddewisaf ateb detholiad o'r cwestiynau hyn.

Mae'n bwysig dweud wrth Helen Mary, Lisa a Peter ein bod yn croesawu'n frwd ddadl am ddiogelwch staff y sector cyhoeddus. Yn wir,

Indeed, it is very much in line with our public services management initiative, which is being taken forward by the Finance Minister. In terms of the situation of accident and emergency staff, and the work that we have done to tackle bullying and harassment, we know that this will be a robust debate, but the Government is happy to take this forward. In terms of the situation highlighted by Lisa, we could not have had more debate or more statements brought forward by the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration in relation to the police forces merger. Time and again she has reported on devolved aspects of the police reforms in Plenary, and I know that that will continue as and when necessary.

Perhaps I could respond to Carl, because I think that it is important that we acknowledge that children benefit from not only breakfasts, but good, healthy breakfasts. It has been a particular success in our Communities First areas, and those are the areas on which we are targeting resources and action to make a difference to children's lives. I am sure that we will want to bring that back for further debate and statement in this Chamber.

Finally, there is the Third Reading today of the Government of Wales Bill—I am sure that is going through as we speak—and it will ensure that the people of Wales have clarity as to who their candidates are, and who their local and regional Members will be. In response to branding, there is a thought, possibly, that it is a case of fading poppy, fading party. I will leave it at that.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.15 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.15 p.m.*

### **Cymeradwyo o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval under Standing Order No. 24.25**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

y mae'n cyd-fynd i raddau helaeth â'n cynllun rheoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a ddygir ymlaen gan y Gweinidog Cyllid. O ran sefyllfa staff adrannau damweiniau a brys, a'r gwaith a wnaethom i fynd i'r afael â bwlio ac aflonyddu, fe wyddom y bydd hon yn ddadl rymus, ond y mae'r Llywodraeth yn falch o fynd ymlaen â hyn. Parthed y sefyllfa yr oedd Lisa yn tynnu sylw ati, ni allem fod wedi cael mwy o ddadleuon na datganiadau wedi eu rhoi gerbron gan y Gweinidog Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio mewn perthynas ag uno'r heddluoedd. Dro ar ôl tro, rhoes adroddiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar yr agweddau ar ddiwygio'r heddlu sydd wedi eu datganoli, a gwn y bydd hynny'n parhau yn ôl y galw.

Efallai y gallaf ymateb i Carl, oherwydd yr wyf yn credu ei bod yn bwysig inni gydnabod fod plant yn elwa nid yn unig o frecwast, ond o frecwast da, iach. Bu'n llwyddiant arbennig yn ein hardaloedd Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, a dyna'r ardaloedd lle'r ydym yn targedu adnoddau a gweithredu er mwyn gwneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau plant. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn am ddod â hynny'n ôl am ddadl a datganiad pellach yn y Siambr hon.

Yn olaf, heddiw y bydd Trydydd Darlleniad Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru - yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn mynd yn ei flaen wrth i mi siarad – a bydd yn sicrhau bod pobl Cymru yn glir ynghylch pwy fydd eu Haelodau lleol a rhanbarthol. I ymateb i frandio, gellid tybio, efallai, mai achos yw hwn o'r pabi'n gwywo ac o blaid yn gwywo. Fe'i gadawaf ar hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni fydd dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| <p><i>the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:</i></p> <p><i>1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006 on the draft the Seed Potatoes (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and</i></p> <p><i>b) approves that the Seed Potatoes (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with</i></p> <p><i>(i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 24 January 2006; and</i></p> <p><i>(ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office 24 January 2006;</i></p> <p><i>2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 on the draft the Contaminants in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006; and</i></p> <p><i>b) approves that the Contaminants in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with</i></p> <p><i>(i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006;</i></p> <p><i>(ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006; and</i></p> <p><i>(iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006. (NDM2855)</i></p> | <p><i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:</i></p> <p><i>1. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tatws Had (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006; a</i></p> <p><i>b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tatws Had (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag</i></p> <p><i>(i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2006; a</i></p> <p><i>(ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2006;</i></p> <p><i>2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006; a</i></p> <p><i>b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:</i></p> <p><i>(i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006;</i></p> <p><i>(ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006; a</i></p> <p><i>(iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2855)</i></p> |
|---|---|

*Cynnig (NDM2855): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.*

*Motion (NDM2855): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Francis, Lisa



Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau  
 Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006  
 Approval of the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements)  
 (Wales) Regulations 2006**

Motion (NDM2857): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2857): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

Motion (NDM2858): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2857 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2006. (NDM2857)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

Cynnig (NDM2858): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2857 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2857)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14*

*February 2006 in relation to the draft the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006. (NDM2858)*

The arguments for the regulations have been well-rehearsed over recent months in Plenary and in the Health and Social Services Committee. Therefore, I do not propose to go through them in great detail other than to say that the overall effect will be to give legislative force to the new contractual arrangements for general dental services and personal dental services, to outline the charging regimes that would apply, and to highlight local health board duties in relation to public health requirements, as well as outlining arrangements that will permit a smooth transition from the current discredited contract to new models of care based on the GDS and PDS regulations.

Particularly in relation to this opening Order, I accept the point that it is desirable that when Orders are put forward that they should be available in both Welsh and English. I think that everyone agrees that this should be done wherever is practicable. However, in view of the sheer volume of the content of these regulations and the tight timescale within which we have been operating to bring them forward, it has not been physically or practically possible for us to do so. I am glad to say that the communication campaign that will be taking place on the back of these regulations will be fully bilingual and fully available to the public and to professionals in Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Helen Mary Jones.

*Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2858)*

Aethpwyd dros y dadleuon dros y rheoliadau yn ddigon aml dros y misoedd diwethaf yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Felly, ni fwriadaf fynd trwyddynt yn fanwl iawn, dim ond dweud mai'r effaith yn gyffredinol fydd rhoi grym deddfwriaethol i'r trefniadau contractiol newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol a gwasanaethau deintyddol personol, amlinellu'r drefn codi tâl a fyddai'n gymwys, a thynnu sylw at ddyletswyddau byrddau iechyd lleol mewn perthynas â gofynion iechyd cyhoeddus, yn ogystal ag amlinellu trefniadau a fydd yn caniatáu trosi'n llyfn o'r contract presennol sydd mewn cryn anfr i fodolau gofal newydd yn seiliedig ar reoliadau'r GDS a'r PDS.

Yn arbennig mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn agoriadol hwn, derbyniaf y pwynt ei bod yn ddymunol i Orchmynion, pan gânt eu rhoi gerbron, fod ar gael yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg. Credaf fod pawb yn cytuno y dylid gwneud hyn lle bynnag y mae'n ymarferol. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd cynnwys anferthol y rheoliadau hyn a'r amserlen dynn sydd gennym i'w dwyn gerbron, nid oedd yn gorfforol bosibl nac yn ymarferol bosibl inni wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud y bydd yr ymgyrch gyfathrebu a fydd yn digwydd yn sgil y rheoliadau hyn yn hollol ddwyieithog ac ar gael yn llawn i'r cyhoedd ac i weithwyr proffesiynol yng Nghymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf Helen Mary Jones.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Sorry, Deputy Presiding Officer, I was expecting to be called after the Liberal Democrats spokesperson, as I believe that the Liberal Democrats have an amendment, but I am more than content to proceed.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You do not have to speak if you do not wish to do so.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I do indeed want to speak, but I was anxious not to speak out of turn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Could we not propose the amendment first?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will call you next. It is my fault.

4.20 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I have a few general comments about the dental situation, and then wish to refer to the Liberal Democrat amendment. We must remind the Minister, as he was reminded during questions, of the pledges made by his party both here and by Tony Blair at a British level, namely that dental provision would be available to all by 2001. While these regulations, as a package, may bring some small improvements, the Minister needs to acknowledge that his Government's performance in this regard has so far been dismal; there is nothing at all on which he can congratulate himself. While he is right to say that the root of the problem lies with a contract that the profession was never happy with, introduced by the Conservative Party, he has had almost 10 years to sort it out. The Minister looks concerned, but it has been seven years. [*Interruption.*] If the Minister wishes to intervene to disassociate himself from his predecessor's performance, I am sure that many of us in the opposition parties will not be in the least surprised. However, I find it difficult to respond to him if he chooses to do so from a sedentary position.

Therefore, we have a great deal to put right. The Minister has no need to congratulate himself. I draw his attention again to

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n ddrwg gen i, Ddirprwy Lywydd, yr oeddwn yn disgwyl cael fy ngalw ar ôl llefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan fy mod yn credu bod gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol welliant, ond yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon mynd ymlaen.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Does dim rhaid i chi siarad os nad ydych am wneud.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf am siarad, yn sicr, ond yr oeddwn yn awyddus i beidio â neidio fy nhro i siarad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Oni allem ni gynnig y gwelliant gyntaf?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Fe'ch galwaf chi nesaf. Fy mai i yw hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Y mae gennyf rai sylwadau cyffredinol am y sefyllfa ddeintyddol, a dymunaf wedyn gyfeirio at welliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Rhaid inni atgoffa'r Gweinidog, fel y cafodd ei atgoffa yn ystod y cwestiynau, am yr addewidion a wnaethpwyd gan ei blaid a chan Tony Blair ar lefel Brydeinig, y byddai gwasanaeth deintyddol ar gael i bawb erbyn 2001. Er y gall y rheoliadau hyn, fel pecyn, olygu rhai mân welliannau, mae angen i'r Gweinidog gydnabod bod perfformiad ei Lywodraeth yn hyn o beth wedi bod yn anobeithiol hyd yma; nid oes ganddo reswm yn y byd dros ei longyfarch ei hun. Er ei fod yn iawn yn dweud mai gwraidd y broblem yw contract na fu'r proffesiwn erioed yn hapus yn ei gylch, ac a gyflwynwyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol, cafodd bron 10 mlynedd i unioni'r mater. Mae golwg bryderus ar y Gweinidog, ond aeth saith mlynedd heibio. [*Torri ar draws.*] Os yw'r Gweinidog yn dymuno ymyrryd er mwyn ei ddatgysylltu ei hun oddi wrth berfformiad ei ragflaenydd, yr wyf yn sicr na fydd hynny'n syndod yn y byd i ni yn y gwrthbleidiau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd imi ymateb iddo os bydd yn dewis gwneud hynny o'i sedd.

Felly, mae llawer iawn o unioni i'w wneud. Nid oes angen i'r Gweinidog ei longyfarch ei hun. Hoffwn dynnu ei sylw at sylwadau a

comments made in the broadcast media on 9 February by his colleague, Gwenda Thomas, who accused the dentists of greed. If we are to proceed, surely we must do so in a spirit of partnership with the industry. Will he take this opportunity—he refused to do so the week before last—to distance himself from that?

As a party, we will abstain overall on this package of regulations because we have some ongoing concerns, which I will highlight briefly as we go through the debates. However, we would not want to see further delay in implementing this new contract, which, whatever its faults, is a step forward. I urge the Minister to keep the new contracts and their implementation under review. He is aware, and I will refer to this again, that elements of the new contracts have not been piloted, and it is important that those are reviewed.

We will support the Liberal Democrats' amendment. The Minister speaks of the volume of work, but that is the kind of excuse that has been used not to operate bilingually in the public sector in this nation again and again. I accept that the volume of the regulations is enormous, but the Minister has known for a long time that they would be introduced. We, as an Assembly, and Wales, as a nation, have the right to expect our legislation to be bilingual.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I apologise to Jenny and to the Assembly—I have been trying to use this modern digital screen, and my eyes alighted on the wrong name. We have an amendment to move, and there is nothing wrong with the procedure as such. I have selected the amendment so I call Jenny Randerson to propose it.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2857 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English, and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

wnaethpwyd ar y cyfryngau darlledu ar 9 Chwefror gan ei gydweithwraig, Gwenda Thomas, a gyhuddodd y deintyddion o fod yn farus. Os ydym i symud ymlaen, yn sicr bydd yn rhaid inni wneud hynny mewn ysbryd o bartneriaeth gyda'r diwydiant. A fydd yn achub ar y cyfle hwn—gwrthododd wneud hynny yr wythnos cyn y diwethaf—i ymbellhau oddi wrth hynny?

Fel plaid, byddwn yn ymatal yn gyffredinol ar y pecyn rheoliadau hwn am fod gennym rai pryderon o hyd, a byddaf yn tynnu sylw at y rheini'n fyr wrth inni fynd trwy'r trafodaethau. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddem am weld rhagor o oedi wrth weithredu'r contract newydd hwn. Beth bynnag yw ei ddiffygion, y mae'n gam ymlaen. Anogaf y Gweinidog i ddal adolygu'r contractau newydd a'u gweithrediad. Mae'n ymwybodol, a byddaf yn cyfeirio at hyn eto, fod elfennau o'r contractau newydd sydd heb eu treialu, ac mae'n bwysig adolygu'r rheini.

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Sonia'r Gweinidog am y baich gwaith, ond dyna'r math o esgus a wnaethpwyd dros beidio â gweithredu'n ddwyieithog yn y sector cyhoeddus yn y wlad yma droeon a thro. Derbyniaf fod y rheoliadau'n anferthol, ond gwyddai'r Gweinidog ers tro byd y caent eu cyflwyno. Mae gennym, fel Cynulliad, a Chymru fel cenedl, hawl i ddisgwyl ein deddfwriaeth yn ddwyieithog.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ymddiheuraf i Jenny ac i'r Cynulliad—bûm yn ceisio defnyddio'r sgrîn ddigidol fodern yma, a thynnwyd fy llygaid at yr enw anghywir. Mae gennym welliant i'w gynnig, ac nid oes dim o'i le ar y drefn fel y cyfryw. Dewisais y gwelliant, ac felly galwaf ar Jenny Randerson i'w gynnig.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigaf welliant 1 i NDM2857 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg, ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

I am pleased that it is recognised that it is normal to move the amendments before we have the debate.

I will take up the issue that Helen Mary raised finally, which is the same point that goes through each piece of legislation here this afternoon. The Welsh Liberal Democrats have tabled an amendment in this respect, stating that the legislation should be in Welsh in each case. I will not repeat this point for every piece of legislation, but I will flesh out the argument slightly on this one.

I cannot recall a piece of legislation of this significance being debated here that has not been bilingual. I understand the Minister's argument that this is a last-minute issue, and that it is lengthy. However, I have seen far longer documents translated. As for the rush, this has been in its current format for a long time now, for well over the usual period of time that it takes to get a document translated—at least a month. If we are going to say that we do not do this because it is too complicated and lengthy, we must look at the reverse, which is that we will only produce stuff bilingually if it is simple and we have plenty of time to think about it. If we accept that argument, we are on a slippery slope as a bilingual legislature—we would no longer be doing anything more than paying lip service to the concept of bilingualism. I feel strongly that something as significant and important as this should be bilingual.

I have a few general points. The new dental contract is a pretty sorry tale. It was trumpeted as a solution to the haemorrhaging of dentists from the NHS, which has been taking place since the good old Tory years. In fact, what it has done is speeded up that haemorrhaging. It has speeded it up from a trickle to a flood. It was trumpeted as an end to the pay-per-item-of-treatment treadmill to which dentists objected so strongly, but, in fact, all it has done is created a new treadmill. This treadmill has larger steps, but it is still a treadmill.

Unlike the GPs' contract, this contract has not been properly negotiated; it has been

Yr wyf yn falch bod cydnabyddiaeth ei bod yn arferol cynnig y gwelliannau cyn inni drafod.

Codaf y mater a godwyd gan Helen Mary ar y diwedd, sef yr un pwynt sy'n gyffredin i bob darn o ddeddfwriaeth a gafwyd yma heddiw y prynhawn yma. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cynnig gweliant yn hyn o beth, sy'n dweud y dylai'r ddeddfwriaeth fod yn Gymraeg ym mhob achos. Nid wyf am ailadrodd y pwynt hwn ar gyfer pob darn o ddeddfwriaeth, ond fe rof ychydig gig ar yr esgryn yng nghyswllt hwn.

Ni allaf gofio inni drafod deddfwriaeth yma a oedd cyn bwysiced â hon heb iddi fod yn ddwyieithog. Deallaf ddadl y Gweinidog mai mater munud olaf yw hwn, a mater hirfaith. Fodd bynnag, gwelais gyfieithu dogfennau llawer hirach. O ran y brys, mae hon yn ei ffurf bresennol ers tro byd bellach, yn hwy o lawer na'r amser arferol a gymer i gyfieithu dogfen—o leiaf mis. Os ydym am ddweud na fyddwn yn gwneud hyn am ei fod yn rhy gymhleth a rhy hir, bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried y gwrthwyneb, sef na fyddwn yn cynhyrchu deunyddiau'n ddwyieithog oni fyddant yn syml a bod gennym ddigonedd o amser i feddwl amdano. Os derbyniwn y ddadl honno, byddwn ar lethr lithrig fel corff deddfwriaethol—ni fyddem wedyn yn gwneud dim mwy nag esgus cefnogi cysyniad dwyieithrwydd. Teimlaf yn gryf y dylai rhywbeth sydd mor arwyddocaol ac mor bwysig â hyn fod yn ddwyieithog.

Mae gennyf rai pwyntiau cyffredinol. Mae hanes digon truenus i'r contract deintyddol newydd. Cafodd ei gyhoeddi fel ateb i'r colledion anferth yn nifer y deintyddion sydd wedi gadael y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol ers dyddiau da y Ceidwadwyr. Yn wir, yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ei sgil oedd cyflymu'r colledion hynny. Mae'r diferion wedi troi'n lliw. Fe'i cyhoeddwyd fel diwedd i'r felin draed o dalu fesul pob eitem o driniaeth yr oedd deintyddion yn ei wrthwynebu mor daer. Ond mewn gwirionedd, yr hyn y mae wedi ei wneud yw creu melin draed newydd. Ac er bod camau'r felin draed hon yn fwy, melin draed ydyw o hyd.

Yn wahanol i'r contract meddygon teulu, ni chafodd y contract hwn ei drafod yn iawn;

imposed, and that is one of the fundamental problems and why it is creating such an exodus from the NHS. Added to which, in practical terms, of course, GPs have few places to go—there is a very small private GP scenario, but there is a very large private dentist scenario and it is much easier for dentists to leave the NHS.

The units of dental activity have not been piloted, and that is the key issue. How will people react to having three bands of treatment and three different charges? The question is not how dentists will react, but how patients will react to this. Will people respond to having to pay quite a lot for the basic band 1 treatment by saying, ‘Well, I do not want to have just a bit of an inspection and a bit of a clean, I want the full works; I want everything that I am entitled to have under band 1’ or will they react by saying, ‘I am not going to go to the dentist at all until I need several things done under the band of treatment that I reckon I will be charged’?

Another issue is that, as ever, things have been slower in Wales. The personal dental service pilot schemes have been rolled out far more slowly in Wales, and they have been rolled out in a slightly different way. We have failed so far to have proper results from those pilot schemes. In terms of the content of the rest of the contract, I will simply say that it fails to look to the long term, it fails to look to the importance of preventative care, and, given the shortage of NHS dentists, it fails to give enough priority to the treatment of young people, for whom preventative care is a key issue.

I turn to the specific piece of legislation that we are looking at, because my comments so far have been general. I am concerned about the nature of the pilot schemes of the PDS contract. I would be interested in the Minister’s comments on this. I have been informed that, in England, those pilots have largely been done by people such as orthodontists, and they will be migrated over to the new PDS contract, but, in Wales, people on the PDS pilot schemes have been providing more general dental services and will be migrated from the personal dental

cafodd ei orfodi, a dyna un o’r problemau sylfaenol, a dyna pam y mae’n achosi i gynifer adael y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol. Ar ben hynny, mewn gwirionedd, wrth gwrs, prin yw’r llefydd y gall meddygon teulu fynd —mae yna nifer fechan iawn o feddygon teulu preifat, ond mae yna nifer fawr iawn o ddeintyddion preifat, ac mae’n llawer haws i ddeintyddion adael y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol.

Nid yw’r unedau gwaith deintyddol wedi eu treialu, a dyna’r mater allweddol. Sut y bydd pobl yn ymateb i dri band triniaeth a thri thâl gwahanol? Nid y modd y bydd deintyddion yn ymateb yw’r cwestiwn, ond sut y bydd y cleifion yn ymateb i hyn. A fydd pobl yn ymateb o orfod talu cryn dipyn am driniaeth sylfaenol band 1 trwy ddweud, ‘Wel, nid yw ychydig archwiliad a glanhau’r dannedd yn ddigon; yr wyf am gael popeth y mae gennyf hawl iddo dan fand 1’. Neu a fyddant yn ymateb trwy ddweud, ‘Nid wyf am fynd at y deintydd o gwbl nes bydd angen gwneud nifer o bethau dan y band triniaeth y tybiaf y bydd yn rhaid imi ei dalu’?

Mater arall hefyd, yn ôl yr arfer, yw arafwch pethau yng Nghymru. Mae’r cynlluniau gwasanaeth deintyddol personol wedi eu cyflwyno llawer yn arafach yng Nghymru, ac maent wedi eu cyflwyno ychydig yn wahanol. Methasom â chael canlyniadau iawn o’r cynlluniau treialu hynny hyd yma. O ran cynnwys gweddill y contract, dywedaf yn syml nad yw’n edrych ar yr hirdymor, nid yw’n edrych ar bwysigrwydd gofal ataliol, ac o ystyried prinder deintyddion y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol, nid yw’n rhoi digon o flaenoriaeth i drin pobl ifanc y mae gofal ataliol yn fater allweddol iddynt.

Trof at yr union ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth yr ydym yn ei ystyried yn awr, gan imi wneud sylwadau cyffredinol hyd yma. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch natur cynlluniau treialu contract y Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol. Hoffwn glywed sylwadau’r Gweinidog am hyn. Clywais, yn Lloegr, fod y cynlluniau treialu hynny wedi eu gwneud yn bennaf gan bobl megis orthodontyddion, ac y cânt hwythau eu trosglwyddo i gontract newydd y Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol. Ond yng Nghymru, mae pobl sydd ar gynlluniau treialu’r Gwasanaethau

service to the general dental service contracts. That is more than a technical issue—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must wind up.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have just one more sentence, Deputy Presiding Officer. I am interested to know whether the Minister believes that that roll over from one contract to another very different type of contract will happen smoothly.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First, we are content with the amendment and the motion. I accept what Jenny Randerson has said about the rather irritating and unacceptable way in which we are not able to see these regulations in both languages, although there is a risk here of over-egging the custard, or even the pudding—though you can over-egg custard as well—because this is an important regulation in itself. I welcome the success of the PDS pilot schemes, which, in my view, have been limited, but there is some success there.

To the Government, I say that you have to recognise that the national health service now is unable to cope with the demand for dental services in Wales. By your actions, you have accepted that, both in the way that you have extended the use of the private sector in delivering dental care and by using public money in commissioning those services.

4.30 p.m.

In looking at this particular regulation, it is unclear how local health boards will manage demand. They will have a very clear commissioning role, and there will be a very strong pressure on that role as a small unit. This is where we will see the strain continuing on LHBs. We have 22 mini commissioning authorities struggling at the moment with their large number of functions and responsibilities, and I think that we will see them struggle with their commissioning role for dental services, particularly as set out

Deintyddol Personol wedi bod yn darparu gwasanaethau deintyddol mwy cyffredinol, a chânt eu trosglwyddo o'r gwasanaeth deintyddol personol i'r contractau gwasanaeth deintyddol cyffredinol. Mae hwn y fwy na mater technegol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid i chi ddirwyn i ben.

**Jenny Randerson:** Un frawddeg sydd gennyf ar ôl, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Hoffwn wybod a yw'r Gweinidog yn credu bod trosglwyddo o'r naill gontract i'r llall a hwnnw'n gontract gwahanol iawn yn mynd i ddigwydd yn rhwydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn fodlon ar y gwelliant a'r cynnig. Derbynïaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Jenny Randerson ynghylch y modd annifyr braidd ac annerbyniol na chawn weld y rheoliadau hyn yn y ddwy iaith, er bod perygl yn hyn o beth inni dagu'r ci drwy roi gormod o bwddin iddo—oherwydd mae hwn yn rheoliad pwysig ynddo'i hun. Yr wyf yn falch o lwyddiant cynlluniau treialu'r Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol. Llwyddiant bach ydyw, yn fy marn i, ond cafwyd ychydig lwyddiant.

Wrth y Llywodraeth, dywedaf fod yn rhaid i chi gydnabod na all y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ymdopi bellach â'r galw am wasanaethau deintyddol yng Nghymru. Trwy eich gweithredoedd, yr ydych wedi derbyn hynny, yn y modd y bu ichi ymestyn defnyddio'r sector preifat i ddarparu gofal deintyddol a defnyddio arian cyhoeddus i gomisiynu'r gwasanaethau hynny.

O edrych ar y rheoliad neilltuol hwn, nid yw'n eglur sut y bydd y byrddau iechyd lleol yn rheoli'r galw. Bydd ganddynt rôl gomisiynu glir iawn, a bydd pwysau mawr ar y rôl honno fel uned fechan. Dyma ble y gwelwn straen parhaus ar y Byrddau Iechyd Lleol. Mae gennym 22 awdurdod comisiynu yn brwydro ar hyn o bryd â'r swyddogaethau a'r cyfrifoldebau niferus sydd ganddynt, a chredaf y gwelwn hwy'n brwydro â'u rôl o gomisiynu gwasanaethau deintyddol, yn enwedig fel y mae wedi ei gosod allan dan



under the PDS regulations before us.

I ask the Minister directly about the regulatory appraisal, which talks about the way in which we can increase capacity in the NHS as a result of this PDS regulation. It is very clear about the wish to increase capacity within the NHS. What you have not been clear on, in questions today and in previous sessions in the Chamber, is how much you anticipate capacity increasing and how many more patients you think will be registered with an NHS dentist over the next five to 10 years or so. It seems very easy for you as a Government to set out targets and aspirations in the variety of glossy documents that we have seen published in the past seven years, but there has been very little in terms of the actual aspirations that you expect for access to dental care. As we are now considering these regulations, it is fair to ask you what your aspirations are and what your targets will be. I suspect that you will shy away from answering that because you know full well that trying to set a target for this particular area of the NHS could be rather tricky, and, in light of the problems you have faced in setting targets in the past seven years, I will not be at all surprised if you do shy away from answering this. However, the people of Wales deserve to know what the aspiration of the Assembly Government is; the Prime Minister himself said that everyone should have access to an NHS dentist. If you share that aspiration, people will rightly ask when, at least by which year, roughly, they should expect access to an NHS dentist.

Some clarity of purpose and aspiration is important, and I look forward to the discussions that we will have on the other regulations before us this afternoon. However, this one in particular is of significance because of the commissioning role that develops among the local health boards. I hope you will be able to deal with the very direct concern that I have about the capacity of those LHBs to undertake that role

reoliadau'r Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol sydd ger ein bron.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog yn uniongyrchol ynglŷn â'r gwerthuso rheoleiddiol, sy'n ymwneud â'r modd y gallwn gynyddu gallu'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol o ganlyniad i reoliad y Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol. Mae'n glir iawn ynghylch y dymuniad i gynyddu gallu'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol. Yr hyn na fuoch yn glir yn ei gylch, mewn cwestiynau heddiw ac mewn sesiynau blaenorol yn y Siambr, yw'r graddau y credwch y bydd y gallu'n cynyddu a faint o gleifion a gredwch a gaiff eu cofrestru gyda deintydd y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol yn ystod y pump neu'r 10 mlynedd nesaf. Ymddengys yn hawdd iawn ichi fel Llywodraeth osod targedau a dyheadau yn yr amrywiol ddogfennau sgleiniog a welsom yn cael eu cyhoeddi yn ystod y saith mlynedd diwethaf, ond ychydig iawn a glywsom am yr union ddyheadau yr ydych yn eu disgwyl o ran agor y drws at ofal deintyddol. Gan ein bod yn awr yn ystyried y rheoliadau hyn, teg yw gofyn i chi beth yw eich dyheadau a beth fydd eich targedau. Tybiaf na fyddwch am ateb oherwydd gwyddoch yn dda y gallai fod yn anodd iawn gosod targed ar gyfer y rhan hon o'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol. Ac o ystyried y problemau yr ydych wedi eu hwynebu wrth gosod targedau yn ystod y saith mlynedd diwethaf, ni synnwn o gwbl petaech yn ceisio peidio ag ateb. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl Cymru yn haeddu gwybod beth yw dyheadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad; dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru ei hun y dylai pawb gael yr hawl i weld deintydd dan y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol. Os ydych yn rhannu'r dyhead hwnnw, mae'n ddigon teg i bobl ofyn pryd, o leiaf erbyn pa flwyddyn, yn fras, y gallant ddisgwyl cael yr hawl i fynd at ddeintydd dan y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol.

Mae'n bwysig cynnig rhyfaint o eglurder am eich pwrpas a'ch dyheadau, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ein trafodaethau ynghylch y rheoliadau eraill sydd ger ein bron y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, mae hwn yn neilltuoel bwysig oherwydd y rôl gomisiynu a fydd yn datblygu ymhlith y byrddau iechyd lleol. Gobeithio y medrwn ateb y pryder gwirioneddol sydd gennyf ynghylch gallu'r Byrddau Iechyd Lleol i ymgymryd â'r rôl

in an effective and efficient way.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn falch o'r cyfle i gyfrannu i'r drafodaeth hon. Fel y gwyyddom, yr ydym yn trafod egwyddor y rheoliadau ar hyn o bryd, ac felly mae'n iawn ein bod yn asesu'r addewidion y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn eu gwneud o ran y gwasanaeth deintyddol yng Nghymru, i weld sut y maent yn mesur yn erbyn y realiti ym mhob rhan o Gymru, ac wedyn i asesu a fydd y newidiadau hyn yn gwella pethau'n sylweddol. Mae'r Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod fy mod wedi bod yn pwysu'n gyson iawn ar y Llywodraeth i ddweud wrthyf pryd y bydd modd i'm hetholwyr innau gael mynediad i wasanaeth deintyddol y gwasanaeth iechyd. Wrth gwrs, er bod y Gweinidog yn cyfeirio dro ar ôl tro at rai mesurau, yr unig beth y gallaf ddweud o ran profiad personol, a phrofiad fy etholwyr, yw ein bod yn ei chael hi'n gynyddol anodd cael mynediad i'r gwasanaeth.

Cysylltodd etholwr o'r Fali â mi yn ddiweddar a dywedodd wrthyf pan ffoniodd yntau Galw Iechyd Cymru, dywedwyd wrtho, ar ôl sawl galwad ffôn, bod deintydd gwasanaeth iechyd ar gael iddo yn Abermo. Bydd unrhyw un sy'n gwybod am ddaearyddiaeth yr hen Wynedd yn gwybod nad yw'r daith o Fali i Abermo yn foddhaol o gwbl. Felly, mewn gwirionedd, nid oedd mynediad gan yr etholwr hwnnw i'r gwasanaeth.

Mae gennym hawl, felly, i fesur sefyllfa'r etholwr hwnnw o'r Fali yn erbyn addewid Tony Blair yn 1999, pan ddywedodd y byddai pawb yn medru cael mynediad i ddeintydd y GIG o fewn dwy flynedd heb orfod gwneud mwy na ffonio Galw Iechyd Cymru. Yr oedd hynny i fod i ddigwydd erbyn 2001, ac yn awr y mae'n 2006, ond nid yw wedi digwydd. Dywedodd y Llywodraeth hon,

'we will ensure that patients have access to NHS dentists in all parts of Wales'.

That promise was made in 1999 and it simply has not been kept. How are we then to judge whether these sets of regulations will

honno yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am also pleased to have the opportunity to contribute to this debate. As we know, we are discussing the principle of the regulations at present, and so it is right that we assess the promises the Government has been making in terms of dental services in Wales, to see how they measure up against the reality of the situation in all parts of Wales, and then to assess whether these changes will improve matters substantially. The Minister and the First Minister are aware that I have regularly pressed the Government to tell me when my constituents will have access to dental services on the national health service. Of course, although the Minister refers time and again to some measures, the only thing that I can say, from personal experience, and from the experience of my constituents, is that we are finding it increasingly difficult to access the service.

A constituent from Valley contacted me recently and said that when he phoned NHS Direct, he was told, after several phone calls, that an NHS dentist was available to him in Barmouth. Anyone who knows anything about the geography of the former county of Gwynedd will know that the journey from Valley to Barmouth is not at all acceptable. Therefore, in reality, that constituent did not have access to the service.

We have a right, therefore, to compare the situation of that constituent from Valley with Tony Blair's promise in 1999, when he told us that everyone would be able to access an NHS dentist within two years, simply by phoning NHS Direct Wales. That was supposed to happen by 2001. It is now 2006, and it has not happened. This Government said,

byddwn yn sicrhau bod cleifion yn gallu cael gwasanaeth deintydd GIG ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Gwnaethpwyd yr addewid hwn yn 1999 ond nid yw wedi ei gadw. Sut felly y gallwn ddweud a fydd y rheoliadau hyn yn gwella'r

improve the situation or not? I think that the confidence that we have in the Government is rapidly diminishing.

We know that the British Dental Association is unhappy with aspects of the contract and it is not convinced that it will deliver in the way that the Government claims that it will. What I really want to hear from the Government—and I mentioned this to the Minister in earlier exchanges today—is a commitment to action not words. We want to be absolutely sure that everything that the Government is doing will lead, in the short term, to the provision of NHS dentistry in all parts of Wales. I hope that the Minister, when he responds, will be able to give us those assurances.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** A number of members of the public have expressed consternation to me in relation to the point that Helen Mary raised about the unwillingness of dentists who have been trained at the taxpayers' expense to work in the NHS. I am sure that she must have had those same reports made to her. If she has not been given those types of accounts, I would suggest that she probably is not going out to meet the same range of people that I meet on a fairly regular basis, in my constituency and throughout Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Some of those concerns are justifiable and they have certainly been raised with me. What I was concerned about was the intemperate nature of the language that was used in a public forum and I wondered whether you felt that it was constructive. When we have people leaving the profession, surely we need to try to persuade them to stay, not insult them.

**Brian Gibbons:** I did not hear the comments and I probably would not have understood them in any event, but I think that the comments that Gwenda Thomas made were probably quite temperate, compared with some of the comments that have been made to me. I know that Gwenda Thomas is always

sefyllfa ai peidio? Credaf fod y ffydd a oedd gennym yn y Llywodraeth yn diflannu'n gyflym.

Gwyddom fod Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain yn anfodlon â rhai agweddau ar y contract ac nad yw wedi ei hargyhoeddi y bydd y contract yn cyflawni'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn honni y bydd yn ei gyflawni. Yr hyn yr hoffwn o ddifrif ei glywed gan y Llywodraeth—ac yr wyf wedi dweud hyn wrth y Gweinidog yn gynharach heddiw—yw ymrwymiad i weithredu, nid geiriau. Mae angen inni fod yn hollol siŵr y bydd popeth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud yn arwain, yn y tymor byr, at ddarparu gwasanaeth deintyddol dan y GIG ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog, pan fydd yn ymateb, yn gallu rhoi'r sicrwydd hwn inni.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae sawl un wedi dweud wrthyf ei fod yn synnu at y pwynt a godwyd gan Helen Mary ynglŷn ag amharodrwydd deintyddion sydd wedi eu hyfforddi ag arian trethdalwyr i weithio yn y GIG. Mae'n sicr gennyf ei bod hi wedi clywed yr un sylwadau. Os nad yw wedi clywed y mathau hynny o sylwadau, byddwn yn awgrymu efallai nad yw'n mynd allan i gyfarfod yr un amrywiaeth o bobl ag yr wyf fi'n eu cyfarfod yn weddol reolaidd, yn fy etholaeth i a thrwy Gymru gyfan.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae rhai o'r pryderon hyn yn bryderon y gellir eu cyfiawnhau, ac maent yn sicr wedi eu dwyn i'm sylw. Yr hyn yr oeddwn yn bryderus yn ei gylch oedd yr iaith eithafol a ddefnyddiwyd mewn fforwm cyhoeddus. Yr oeddwn am wybod a oeddech yn credu bod hyn yn adeiladol. Pan fydd pobl yn gadael y proffesiwn, oni ddylem fod yn ceisio eu perswadio i aros, yn hytrach na'u sarhau?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni chlywais y sylwadau, ac mae'n debyg na fyddwn wedi eu deall beth bynnag. Ond mae'n debyg bod y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan Gwenda Thomas yn ddigon cymedrol, o'u cymharu â rhai o'r sylwadau a gyflwynwyd i mi. Gwn fod Gwenda Thomas bob amser yn siarad yn dda iawn am faterion

a most articulate commentator on affairs in Wales, so I am sure that she was only recounting what people had said to her, in a controlled and informed way.

I do not accept that that necessarily is the case. I have repeatedly said that dentists are entitled to have contractual arrangements that are in line with best and changing professional practice. I think that this is what these regulations are designed to achieve. I accept the point—no-one is making any virtue of the fact that we have not been able to do the translation—but it is not simply the case, as Jenny Randerson said, that the regulations were too long. That is not the issue; it is simply that the timescale in which it would be appropriate to start a translation was too short. I think that Jenny is wrong to talk about a torrent compared with a gradual trickle—between 1997 and 2000 the reduction in NHS registrations was 5.4 per cent and since the Assembly was established it has been 2.5 per cent. I do not think that your description of the situation is accurate at all.

We want to reverse the decline in the number of people who are able to access NHS dentistry and clearly the fact that the PDS schemes have given us an extra 170,000 places must indicate that we are moving in the right direction. This reversal is something that, hopefully, every Member will find themselves in a position to welcome.

**Jenny Randerson:** The point that I was making was about the events of recent months, since the content of the contract has become more widely known and concerns have been raised. I do not know whether you have access to figures to which I do not, but this is very much the same question that I asked you earlier during your ministerial questions: how many dentists have left the NHS in recent months? You are talking about a historical perspective; I am asking for the current data. I believe that that haemorrhaging has increased in recent months.

4.40 p.m.

Cymreig, felly, yr wyf yn siŵr mai'r cyfan yr oedd yn ei wneud oedd dweud beth yr oedd pobl wedi ei ddweud wrthi hi, mewn ffordd dawel a deallus.

Nid wyf yn derbyn mai dyna'r sefyllfa o reidrwydd. Yr wyf wedi dweud droeon fod gan ddeintyddion hawl i gael trefniadau contractiol sy'n gydnaws â'r arferion proffesiynol gorau ac â newidiadau yn y maes. Credaf fod y rheoliadau hyn wedi eu cynllunio i sicrhau hynny. Derbyniaf y pwynt—nid oes neb yn dweud bod rhinwedd yn y ffaith inni fethu cael cyfieithiad—ond yn wahanol i'r hyn a ddywedodd Jenny Randerson, nid oherwydd hyd y rheoliadau yr oedd hynny. Nid dyna'r broblem; y broblem yn y bôn yw bod yr amserlen pan fyddai'n briodol dechrau cyfieithu yn rhy fyr. Nid wyf yn credu bod Jenny yn gywir wrth sôn am bobl yn llifo allan o'r proffesiwn yn hytrach na gadael yn raddol. Rhwng 1997 a 2000 bu gostyngiad o 5.4 y cant yn y nifer a oedd wedi eu cofrestru gyda'r GIG, ac ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad mae'n 2.5 y cant. Nid wyf yn credu bod eich disgrifiad o'r sefyllfa yn gywir o gwbl.

Yr ydym yn awyddus i wrthdroi'r gostyngiad yn nifer y bobl sy'n gallu cael gwasanaeth deintyddol dan y GIG, ac mae'r ffaith bod y cynlluniau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol wedi rhoi 170,000 yn rhagor o leoedd inni yn arwydd pendant ein bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Mae'r gwrthdroi hwn yn rhywbeth, gobeithio, y gall pob Aelod ei groesawu.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr oedd y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud yn gysylltiedig â digwyddiadau'r misoedd diwethaf, ers i gynnwys y contract ddod yn fwy hysbys acers i bryderon gael eu mynegi. Ni wn a ydych wedi gweld ffigurau nad wyf fi wedi eu gweld, ond yr un cwestiwn yw hwn yn y bôn ag a ofynnais ichi yn gynharach: faint o ddeintyddion sydd wedi gadael y GIG yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf? Yr ydych yn siarad am bersbectif hanesyddol; yr wyf yn gofyn am y data cyfredol. Credaf fod y llif hwn wedi cynyddu yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf.

**Brian Gibbons:** The most recent figures, as you well remember, show an increase in the number of children being registered. While it is true that the number of registered adults has gone down, the number of registered children has gone up. I have given you the most recent figures, so I do not think that your description is accurate.

I will deal with the important point of people moving to PDS compared with what is happening in England. An essential difference between PDS and GDS is that general dental service contractors have to provide mandatory services. Therefore, any dentists who wish to provide mandatory services—that is, mainstream dental services—would almost certainly have to be on a GDS contract to do that. People can roll over their PDS contract on the basis of providing general dental services if it proves agreeable. The only disadvantage to them of doing so would be that PDSs are basically on a limited contract basis, so that, if you wanted to provide mainstream general dental services, and you wanted to provide that as the basis of your working career, the GDS contract would give you better security than would following the PDS route. However, if you wanted to concentrate on providing orthodontic treatment, which would not be a mandatory treatment, it would make sense to concentrate on the PDS contract, as there would not be any real advantage, necessarily, for you to go to a GDS contract if you did not want to provide mandatory services. Again, the disadvantage would be that you would have a limited period on that contract.

Our objective is for everybody who wants to sign on with an NHS dentist to be able to do so. I do not think that we or anybody else are in a position to know—maybe Jonathan knows—how many people want to sign on with an NHS dentist. I would welcome hearing such a figure. However, we do know

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf, fel y cofiwch yn iawn, yn dangos cynnydd yn nifer y plant sydd wedi eu cofrestru. Mae'n wir bod nifer yr oedolion sydd wedi eu cofrestru wedi gostwng, ond mae nifer y plant sydd wedi eu cofrestru wedi cynyddu. Yr wyf wedi rhoi'r ffigurau diweddaraf ichi, felly nid wyf yn credu bod eich disgrifiad yn gywir.

Yr wyf am ddelio â'r pwynt pwysig fod pobl yn troi at Wasanaethau Deintyddol Personol o'u cymharu â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr. Un gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol yw bod rhaid i gontractwyr gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol ddarparu gwasanaethau gorfodol. Felly, byddai unrhyw ddeintydd sydd am ddarparu gwasanaethau gorfodol—hynny yw, gwasanaethau deintyddol prif ffrwd—bron yn sicr yn gorfod bod ar gontract Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol. Gall pobl drosglwyddo eu contract Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol ar sail darparu gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol os yw hynny'n dderbyniol. Unig anfantais gwneud hynny iddynt hwy yw bod Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol yn y bôn ar sail contract cyfyngedig, ac felly, pe baech eisiau darparu gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol, ac eisiau darparu hynny fel sail eich gyrfa weithiol, byddai contract Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol yn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd ichi na dilyn y trywydd Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol. Fodd bynnag, pe baech am ganolbwyntio ar ddarparu triniaeth orthodontig, na fyddai'n driniaeth orfodol, byddai'n gwneud synnwyr ichi ganolbwyntio ar y contract Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol, gan na fyddai unrhyw wir fantais, o reidrwydd, ichi fynd am gontract Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol pe na baech am ddarparu gwasanaethau gorfodol. Unwaith eto, yr anfantais fyddai mai cyfnod cyfyngedig fyddai gennych ar y contract hwnnw.

Ein nod yw sicrhau bod pawb sydd eisiau bod ar restr deintydd GIG yn gallu gwneud hynny. Nid wyf yn meddwl ein bod ni nac unrhyw un arall mewn sefyllfa i wybod—efallai bod Jonathan yn gwybod—faint o bobl sydd eisiau bod ar restr deintydd GIG. Byddwn yn falch o glywed ffigurau o'r fath.

that even where there are relatively good levels of access, a significant minority of the population, for all sorts of personal reasons, still chooses not to register with a dentist. There will always be an element of uncertainty, therefore, as to how many people we can set a hard target to register. However, we want to reach a stage whereby, in all local health board areas and in all communities, those people who want to register with a dentist should have the opportunity to do so. If you want to ask whether that is 85 per cent, 90 per cent or 75 per cent, none of us could answer with certainty, and it is pure speculation at this juncture.

The speed at which we will get there is problematic, not least because, as NHS dentistry expands, there will be certain bottlenecks with regard to training dental nurses, getting the hygienists, and the number of extra dental places in the dental schools that we are commissioning. Those will all take a certain amount of time to emerge. However, we have changed the contractual arrangements, and we are putting in the necessary investment in training, and that will, hopefully, put us in a position whereby people who want NHS dental treatment should be able to get it.

Fodd bynnag, gwyddom hyd yn oed lle mae nifer cymharol dda o leoedd ar gael fod nifer fechan o bobl, am bob math o resymau personol, yn dal i ddewis peidio â chofrestru gyda deintydd. Bydd rhywfaint o ansicrwydd o hyd, felly, ynglŷn â faint o bobl y byddai'n rhesymol anelu at eu cofrestru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym eisiau cyrraedd sefyllfa, ym mhob ardal bwrdd iechyd lleol ac ym mhob cymuned, lle dylai pob person sydd eisiau cofrestru gyda deintydd gael cyfle i wneud hynny. Os ydych eisiau gofyn a yw hynny'n 85 y cant, 90 y cant neu 75 y cant, ni allai neb ohonom ateb i sicrwydd, a dim ond dyfalu yr ydym ar hyn o bryd.

Ni allwn ddweud faint o amser y bydd hyn yn ei gymryd, oherwydd wrth i wasanaethau deintyddol y GIG gynyddu, yr ydym yn siŵr o weld rhywfaint o dagfeydd gyda'r gwaith o hyfforddi nyrsys deintyddol, dod o hyd i lanweithyddion deintyddol, a'r lleoedd ychwanegol yr ydym yn eu comisiynu yn yr ysgolion deintyddol. Bydd hyn i gyd yn cymryd amser i ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi newid y trefniadau contractiol, ac yr ydym yn buddsoddi'r arian angenrheidiol mewn hyfforddiant. Bydd hyn, gobeithio, yn ein rhoi mewn sefyllfa lle bydd pobl sydd eisiau cael triniaeth ddeintyddol ar y GIG yn gallu cael triniaeth o'r fath.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2857): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2857): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2857): O blaid 40, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 1.*

*Motion (NDM2857): For 40, Abstain 7, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Member voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen

Gibbons, Brian

Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2858): O blaid 42, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2858): For 42, Abstain 8, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda



Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

Motion (NDM2859): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2859): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the regulations place insufficient emphasis on preventative dental care.*

*yn credu nad yw'r rheoliadau'n gosod digon o bwyslais ar ofal deintyddol ataliol.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

I will deal with some of the points that have been raised in the amendments, particularly the concern that there is a lack of emphasis on preventative dental care in the regulations.

The whole purpose of the dental contract reform has been to allow a new service design to emerge more in line with current professional thinking, patient needs and guidance from bodies such as NICE. This information and guidance states that prevention should be absolutely intrinsic, not only to discrete episodes of dental care, but to all stages of dental care. It is fundamentally misconceived to try to separate prevention from overall dental examination and the treatment process. The new working patterns that will liberate dental time from redundant work practices will provide the extra time to allow these types of activities to take place.

Failure to understand these fundamentals has led the Liberal Democrats to suggest that we need a separate charge band for prevention. They assert—without a single scrap of evidence—that the implications of this new charge would be cost-neutral without changing work patterns. However, within a cost-neutral framework, this would inevitably lead to tensions between prevention and treatment, and create an artificial barrier between prevention and treatment which the new contract is specifically designed to address.

Furthermore, the implementation of an additional charge band would seriously delay the implementation of this new contract which we are all determined to see come into being on 1 April. A new charge band would have to be subject to negotiation with the key stakeholders, particularly if it was to be fitted within the cost-neutral envelope, which I seriously doubt is possible.

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

Yr wyf am ddelio â rhai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn y gwelliannau, yn enwedig y pryder nad oes digon o bwyslais ar ofal deintyddol ataliol yn y rheoliadau.

Holl bwrpas diwygio'r contractau deintyddol oedd caniatáu i fath newydd o wasanaeth ddatblygu, gwasanaeth a fyddai'n fwy cydnaws â'r farn broffesiynol gyfredol, ag anghenion cleifion ac â chyfarwyddyd cyrrff fel NICE. Mae'r wybodaeth a'r cyfarwyddyd yn nodi y dylai gwaith ataliol fod yn rhan hollol annatod, nid yn unig o ofal deintyddol unigol, ond o bob cam o ofal deintyddol. Camsyniad sylfaenol yw ceisio gwahanu gwaith ataliol oddi wrth archwiliadau deintyddol cyffredinol a'r broses o gynnig triniaeth. Bydd y patrymau gweithio newydd a fydd yn gwneud i ffwrdd ag arferion gwaith diangen ac yn rhyddhau amser deintyddol yn darparu'r amser ychwanegol a fydd yn caniatáu i'r mathau hyn o weithgareddau ddigwydd.

Mae methiant i ddeall y pwyntiau sylfaenol hyn wedi peri i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol awgrymu bod arnom angen band ffioedd ar wahân ar gyfer gwaith ataliol. Maent yn taeru—heb unrhyw fath o dystiolaeth—y byddai goblygiadau'r ffi newydd hon yn gost niwtral ac na fyddai'n newid patrymau gweithio. Fodd bynnag, mewn fframwaith cost niwtral, byddai hyn yn arwain yn anorfod at densiynau rhwng gwaith ataliol a thriniaeth, ac yn creu rhwystr artiffisial rhwng gwaith ataliol a thriniaeth, rhywbeth y mae'r contract newydd wedi ei lunio'n benodol er mwyn rhoi sylw iddo.

Yn ogystal â hyn, byddai gweithredu band ffioedd ychwanegol yn achosi oedi difrifol cyn gweithredu'r contract newydd hwn y mae pob un ohonom yn benderfynol o'i weld yn dod i rym ar 1 Ebrill. Byddai angen trafod band ffioedd newydd gyda'r prif randdeiliaid, yn enwedig os yw'n mynd i gael ei osod yn yr amlen gost niwtral, er fy mod yn amau'n fawr a yw hynny'n bosibl.

4.50 p.m.

Even if agreement could be reached, a further round of consultation and legislation would be necessary to allow the new contract to come into being. This further delay would allow the present unsatisfactory contract to continue for an unduly long time, and would prevent dentistry from receiving the benefits of the new dental GDS and PDS schemes.

Hyd yn oed pe gellid sicrhau cytundeb, byddai'n rhaid cael rownd bellach o ymgynghori a deddfwriaeth i alluogi'r contract newydd i ddod i rym. Byddai'r oedi pellach hwn yn caniatáu i'r contract anfodddhaol presennol barhau am amser annerbyniol o faith, a byddai'n rhwystro deintyddiaeth rhag derbyn buddiannau'r cynlluniau deintyddol Gwasanaeth Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaeth Deintyddol Personol newydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau welliant 1. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the regulations place insufficient emphasis on preventative dental care.*

*yn credu nad yw'r rheoliadau'n gosod digon o bwyslais ar ofal deintyddol ataliol.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

*yn credu y dylid fod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

With regard to preventative care, I am interested in the Minister's line of argument, which is that as this has been left this to the last minute, we are therefore willing to accept something that is inadequate. The Minister has not said that it is inadequate, but the suggestion is that we should be willing to accept something that is inadequate simply because the alternative would be to delay the start of the new contract. When you are talking about something as fundamental as preventative care, you must take into account the fact that delaying something by two or three months in order to take the proper approach is probably much more acceptable than having a poor set up.

O ran gofal ataliol, mae trywydd dadl y Gweinidog yn ddiddorol, sef gan fod hyn wedi ei adael tan y funud olaf, ein bod felly'n barod i dderbyn rhywbeth sy'n annigonol. Nid yw'r Gweinidog wedi dweud ei fod yn annigonol, ond yr awgrym yw y dylem fod yn barod i dderbyn rhywbeth sy'n annigonol am y rheswm y byddai'r opsiwn arall yn golygu oedi cyn cychwyn y contract newydd. Pan fyddwch yn sôn am rywbeth mor sylfaenol â gofal ataliol, rhaid i chi dderbyn bod oedi am ddau neu dri mis er mwyn dilyn y trywydd iawn yn debygol o fod yn llawer mwyn derbyniol na chael trefn ddiffygiol.

There is only one reference to preventative care in the three bands of units of dental activity. It appears in band 1, but not in bands 2 or 3. Therefore, when dentists are carrying out more complex work there is no incentive for them to incorporate preventative care. It is only when dentists are carrying out simpler

Dim ond un cyfeiriad at ofal ataliol sydd yn y tri band unedau gweithgarwch deintyddol. Mae'n ymddangos ym mand 1, ond nid ym mandiau 2 a 3. Felly, pan fydd deintyddion yn ymgymryd â gwaith mwy cymhleth nid oes cymhelliant iddynt i ymgorffori gofal ataliol. Dim ond pan fydd deintyddion yn

work that the incentive exists. There is also no incentive for patients to go to the dentist for preventative care, and to have a reasonably cheap option of non-treatment, if I can put it that way. Patients would have to pay a significant amount of money to receive a band 1 unit of dental activity and to receive the preventative care that they feel that they need, or would, ideally, wish to have. We want young people in Wales to have better teeth. We want dentists to concentrate on preventing caries and disease, rather than waiting for them to occur. Minister, I would have hoped that that was in line with your image of the NHS of the future. Therefore, in our amendment 1, we propose that preventative care be given a place in its own right.

You talk about a lack of evidence. I have talked to dentists the length and breadth of Wales, and to the various organisations that represent dentists. I have talked to patients, and I have carried out a survey of all NHS dentists in Wales. They talk with one voice about their concerns about the structure of the UDAs. They also repeat time and again their concerns about the lack of emphasis on preventative care. There have been no pilots of the UDAs. I may have no evidence about the cost, which you are asking for, but you have no evidence that these will work, Minister. I do not understand how you can assert that this will not work, when you have no evidence from pilot schemes on which to base your arguments.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I endorse the comments that Jenny Randerson has made about the lack of emphasis on prevention. We have waited a very long time for these regulations. There was time to get it right. We will support the Liberal Democrat amendments.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you for that short speech.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We are content with the amendments to the motion on the principle of the Order, and we are also happy to support the amendment to the motion approving the Order. If Jenny Randerson has a survey that backs up her claim, it might be a good idea to publish it or to provide the Government with

gwneud gwaith syml y mae'r cymhelliad yn bodoli. Nid oes cymhelliant ychwaith i gleifion fynd at y deintydd am ofal ataliol, ac i gael y dewis cymharol rad o beidio â chael triniaeth, os gallaf ei fynegi felly. Byddai'n rhaid i gleifion dalu swm sylweddol i gael gweithgarwch deintyddol band 1 ac i gael y gofal ataliol y maent yn teimlo sydd ei angen arnynt, neu y byddent, yn ddelfrydol, yn dymuno'i gael. Yr ydym am i bobl ifanc yng Nghymru gael dannedd gwell. Yr ydym am i ddeintyddion ganolbwyntio ar atal pydredd dannedd ac afiechyd, yn hytrach nag aros iddynt ddigwydd. Weinidog, byddwn wedi gobeithio bod hynny'n cyd-fynd â'ch syniad o GIG y dyfodol. Felly, yn ein gwelliant 1, yr ydym yn cynnig bod gofal ataliol yn cael lle yn ei rinwedd ei hun.

Yr ydych yn sôn am ddiffyg tystiolaeth. Yr wyf wedi siarad â deintyddion ar hyd a lled Cymru, ac â'r gwahanol sefydliadau sy'n cynrychioli deintyddion. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chleifion, ac wedi cynnal arolwg o holl ddeintyddion y GIG yng Nghymru. Maent yn unfarn o ran eu pryderon ynglŷn â strwythur yr UDA. Maent yn sôn dro ar ôl tro am eu pryderon ynghylch y diffyg pwyslais ar ofal ataliol. Efallai nad oes gennyf dystiolaeth am y gost, yr ydych yn gofyn amdani, ond nid oes gennych dystiolaeth y bydd y rhain yn llwyddo, Weinidog. Nid wyf yn deall sut y gallwch chi haeru na fydd hyn yn llwyddo, a chwithau heb dystiolaeth am gynlluniau peilot sy'n sail i'ch dadl.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn cefnogi sylwadau Jenny Randerson ar y diffyg pwyslais ar ofal ataliol. Yr ydym wedi aros amser maith am y rheoliadau hyn. Yr oedd digon o amser i sicrhau eu bod yn briodol. Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliannau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch i chi am eich araith fer.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr ydym yn fodlon ar y gwelliannau yn y cynnig ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn, ac yr ydym yn hapus hefyd i gefnogi'r gwelliant yn y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. Os oes gan Jenny Randerson arolwg sy'n cadarnhau ei honiad, gallai fod yn syniad da pe bai'n ei gyhoeddi

a copy, because if it needs evidence, perhaps it could rely on her work.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have it here. It has been published and is freely available.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am delighted to hear that. If you could provide the Minister with a copy, perhaps that would inform his deliberations on this matter. It is a point well made that the issue of preventative work is not laid out in the regulations as adequately as we would have wanted it to be. We debated this at length in committee, as we did all of these regulations and amendments, but a fresh look at this at some point might be useful.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** As I said earlier, the new dental contract for general dental services and personal dental services is based on National Institute for Health Clinical Excellence guidance, and incorporates a contractual set of arrangements that incorporate the NICE guidelines. The importance of those guidelines in terms of promoting good treatment and, particularly, the importance of a proper prevention regime, is the reason behind these regulations, linked to dentists' alienation with the present dental contract. It is interesting that, even though you bluntly state in your cost assessment that your amendment would be cost-neutral, you said in your contribution that you do not have a clue how much it is going to cost. You are expecting the Assembly to vote for a pig in a poke when you are unable to substantiate your charges.

You also stated that this would delay the implementation of the contract by two or three months; I would be grateful if you would let me know the evidence that you have for making such an optimistic assessment, because I do not believe that there is any evidence to suggest that it would have such a minimal effect on the implementation of the contract. However, if you have evidence to back up your assertion, I would be pleased to hear it.

neu'n rhoi copi i'r Llywodraeth, oherwydd os oes angen tystiolaeth, efallai y gallai ddibynnu ar ei gwaith.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae ar gael gennyf yma. Mae wedi ei gyhoeddi ac mae ar gael i bawb.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny. Pe baech yn rhoi copi i'r Gweinidog, efallai y gallai fod yn sail i'w ystyriaethau ar y mater. Mae'n bwynt da nad yw gwaith ataliol wedi ei gynnwys yn y rheoliadau i'r graddau y byddem wedi ei hoffi. Cawsom ddadleuon maith am hyn yn y pwyllgor, fel a gafwyd yn achos yr holl reoliadau a'r gwelliannau hyn, ond gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol edrych ar hyn o'r newydd rywbyrd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae'r contract newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol a gwasanaethau deintyddol personol yn seiliedig ar ganllawiau'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol, ac mae'n ymgorffori cyfres gytundebol o drefniadau sy'n ymgorffori canllawiau NICE. Pwysigrwydd y canllawiau hynny o ran hyrwyddo triniaeth dda ac, yn fwyaf arbennig, pwysigrwydd cyfundrefn ataliol briodol, yw'r rheswm dros y rheoliadau hyn, sy'n gysylltiedig ag anfodlonrwydd deintyddion â'r contract deintyddol presennol. Mae'n ddi-ddorol, er eich bod yn datgan yn ddiamwys yn eich asesiad cost y byddai'ch gwelliant yn niwtral ran cost, eich bod wedi dweud yn eich cyfraniad nad oes gennych syniad faint y bydd yn ei gostio. Yr ydych chi'n disgwyl i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio dros gath mewn cwd am nad ydych ynn gallu cadarnhau'ch costau.

Yr ydych wedi dweud hefyd y byddai hyn yn arwain at oedi o ddau neu dri mis cyn y gellid rhoi'r cytundeb ar waith; byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn gallu dangos imi'r dystiolaeth sydd gennych dros wneud asesiad mor optimistaidd, oherwydd nid wyf yn credu bod unrhyw dystiolaeth ar gael i awgrymu y byddai'n cael effaith mor bitw ar weithredu'r contract. Fodd bynnag, os oes gennych dystiolaeth i gadarnhau eich haerriad, byddwn yn falch o'i chlywed.

**Jenny Randerson:** You missed the irony, Minister. I was making a joke that I had no evidence and you had no evidence. The issue is that this is an invest-to-save principle. Clearly, you would be setting out something separately to encourage prevention, which would mean that, eventually, you would save money. The evidence comes from information supplied by the various dental organisations, which have suggested this as an amendment. Dentists have all emphasised the importance of prevention, therefore I would have thought that it would take very little time to negotiate a change, because the wishes of the dental profession would be with you as opposed to against you, as they are currently.

**Brian Gibbons:** Many a true word is spoken in jest, and I will leave it at that in relation to that point. It is incredible that Jenny Randerson would suggest that because there is not necessarily a financial incentive in the new dental contract—even though it is intrinsic to the new contract—dentists would not behave professionally and incorporate preventive activity into the second and third band treatment programme. One wonders what type of prevention would be implemented that was not linked to a basic, cursory examination, unless people were just going to turn up at the dentist, sit down and have an informal chat about the principles of prevention. However, serious prevention, involving the examination of a person's dental health, is catered for in band 1. Equally, a considerable amount of work is going on in dental prevention, but much of that is being carried out by the community dental service. I accept that the ordinary GDS dentist may not see that, but just because it does not appear in a GDS surgery, it does not mean that we as an Assembly Government are not fully committed to the principles of preventative dental care.

5.00 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** Aeth yr eironi dros eich pen, Weinidog. Tynnu coes yr oeddwn pan ddywedais nad oedd gen i dystiolaeth ac nad oedd gennyh chwithau dystiolaeth. Y peth pwysig yw mai egwyddor buddsoddi-i-gynilo yw hon. Yn amlwg, byddech chi'n cyflwyno rhywbeth ar wahân i annog gofal ataliol, a fyddai'n golygu, yn y pen draw, y byddech yn arbed arian. Daw'r dystiolaeth hon o wybodaeth a baratowyd gan y gwahanol sefydliadau deintyddol, sydd wedi awgrymu hyn fel gwelliant. Mae'r holl ddeintyddion wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd gofal ataliol, felly, byddwn yn tybio na fyddai'n cymryd llawer o amser i negodi newid, oherwydd y byddech yn cyd-fynd â dymuniadau'r proffesiwn deintyddol, yn hytrach na mynd yn groes iddynt, fel sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae llawer o wirionedd mewn cellwair, ac fe'i gadawaf ar hynny o ran y pwynt hwn. Mae'n anhygoel y byddai Jenny Randerson yn awgrymu, gan nad oes cymhelliant ariannol o reidrwydd yn y contract deintyddol newydd—er ei fod yn allweddol i'r contract newydd—na fyddai deintyddion yn ymddwyn yn broffesiynol ac y byddent yn ymgorffori gweithgarwch ataliol yn y rhaglen driniaeth band dau a band tri. Ysgwn i pa fath o weithgarwch ataliol a fyddai'n cael ei weithredu nad oedd yn gysylltiedig ag archwiliad sylfaenol, bras, oni bai fod pobl am fynd i weld eu deintydd, eistedd i lawr a chael sgwrs anffurfiol am egwyddorion gofal ataliol? Fodd bynnag, darperir ar gyfer gwaith ataliol difrifol, sy'n cynnwys archwilio iechyd deintyddol y claf, ym mand 1. Yn yr un modd, mae llawer o waith yn mynd ymlaen ar waith deintyddol ataliol, ond bod llawer ohono'n cael ei wneud gan y gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol. Yr wyf yn derbyn na fydd y deintydd gwasanaeth deintyddol cyffredin o reidrwydd yn gweld hynny, ond nid yw'r ffaith nad yw'n ymddangos mewn deintyddfa gwasanaeth deintyddol cyffredinol yn golygu nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i egwyddorion gofal deintyddol ataliol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2859): to propose that  
*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

Cynnig (NDM2859): cynnig bod  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2859): O blaid 40, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 1.  
 Motion (NDM2859): For 40, Abstain 9, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Dunwoody, Tamsin



Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol)  
(Cymru) 2006**  
**Approval of the National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations  
2006**

Motion (NDM2860): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2860): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglyn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. approves that the draft National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006; and*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006; a*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Jenny Randerson. Insert a new Schedule 4 to create a fourth band dedicated to preventative care as specified in band 1(g).

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Jenny Randerson. Rhoi Atodlen 4 newydd i greu pedwerydd band yn neilltuol ar gyfer gofal ataliol fel y'i nodir ym mand 1(g).

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons) :** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006; and*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006. (NDM2860)*

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1 in my name and those of Kirsty Williams and Michael German: insert a new Schedule 4 to create a fourth band dedicated to preventative care as specified in band 1(g).

This refers to the need for translation and to place the emphasis much more on young people. It is important to remember that, in Wales, we have the worst level of dental caries in the UK, and among the worst in Europe. If you have a vision for the future of the NHS, Minister, it must surely be for a health service rather than the current illness service. I would have imagined that the concept of concentrating on young people would be core to that vision.

The amendment refers to the part of the regulations that prevents dentists from discriminating between categories of patients. Given that there is currently such a serious shortage of NHS dentists—and I would remind you that in Pembrokeshire only 15 per cent of people are registered with an NHS dentist—it is necessary to take emergency measures and to give priority to young people. I wish that it was not necessary to put down this amendment, and I believe that Tony Blair's original glib assertion about NHS dentists being available for everyone should be a fact of life for all of us. However, we are not in that situation and, realistically, we are not going to be in that situation for many years, with the best will in the world. This amendment, which was passed in

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2860)*

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigïaf welliant 1 yn fy enw i ac yn enwau Kirsty Williams a Michael German: rhoi Atodlen 4 newydd i greu pedwerydd band yn neilltuol ar gyfer gofal ataliol fel y'i nodir ym mand 1(g).

Mae hyn yn cyfeirio at yr angen am gyfieithu ac mae'n rhoi llawer mwy o bwyslais ar bobl ifanc. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod gennym, yng Nghymru, y lefel uchaf o bydredd dannedd yn y DU, ac ymhlith yr uchaf yn Ewrop. Os oes gennych weledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol y GIG, Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y dylai fod yn un i sicrhau gwasanaeth iechyd yn hytrach na'r gwasanaeth salwch presennol. Byddwn wedi tybio y byddai'r cysyniad o ganolbwyntio ar bobl ifanc yn ganolog i'r weledigaeth honno.

Mae'r gwelliant yn cyfeirio at y rhan o'r rheoliadau sy'n atal deintyddion rhag gwahaniaethu rhwng categorïau o gleifion. O gofio bod prinder difrifol o ddeintyddion yn y GIG ar hyn o bryd, hoffwn eich atgoffa mai dim ond 15 y cant o bobl sir Benfro sydd wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG—mae'n hanfodol cymryd camau brys a rhoi blaenoriaeth i bobl ifanc. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe na bai'n rhaid cyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn, a chredaf y dylai honiad parod gwreiddiol Tony Blair ynglŷn â chael deintyddion y GIG i bawb fod yn ffaith i bob un ohonom. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn y sefyllfa honno, ac i fod yn realistig ni fyddwn, gyda'r holl ewyllys yn y byd, yn y sefyllfa honno am flynyddoedd lawer. Mae'r gwelliant hwn, a basiwyd yn y pwyllgor, yn

committee, seeks to ensure that local dentists can give priority to young people.

The Minister has since argued in a letter to the Chair of the committee, that this was not necessary. Essentially, his letter says that local health boards can agree to give priority to young people, and he says that this point will be covered in guidance that would go to local health boards. I would prefer that there was a much stronger approach to this to allow a local response to local need.

I will give you an example. As a single area in health terms, an area such as Powys would be able to prioritise at local health board level and could say, 'We will prioritise young people; we will allow dentists to concentrate on young people when enrolling new patients'. It is a long way from one end of Powys to the other, and the situation could be dramatically different in different parts of Powys. It is alright for Cardiff Local Health Board to say, 'We will have one blanket priority for young people for the whole area', or, 'We will not bother with it because it is not a particular problem', but it is a completely different situation in Powys. The same argument probably applies to Ceredigion, to Gwynedd, and I could go on to name a number of other large areas that are all under one local health board or one organisation for health purposes.

The fact that you do not have a particular problem with the need to prioritise young people in Powys as a whole does not mean that there will not be some areas where that would be a good idea because of the shortage of dentists. Therefore, my amendment would allow dentists to take a local approach to solve a local problem, instead of relying on local health boards to do it for the whole area. This amendment in itself does not add to the costs in any way, Minister; it simply reprioritises items within existing budgets.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I do not see any speakers, and so I call the Minister to reply.

**The Minister for Health and Social**

ymdrech i sicrhau bod modd i ddeintyddion lleol roi blaenoriaeth i bobl ifanc.

Ers hynny, mae'r Gweinidog wedi dadlau mewn llythyr at Gadeirydd y pwyllgor nad oedd hyn yn angenrheidiol. Yn y bôn, dywed ei lythyr y gall byrddau iechyd lleol gytuno i roi blaenoriaeth i bobl ifanc, a dywed y byddai'r pwynt hwn yn cael sylw yn y canllawiau a roddid i fyrddau iechyd lleol. Byddai'n well gennyf weld ymagwedd gryfach tuag at hyn er mwyn caniatáu ymateb lleol i anghenion lleol.

Rhoddaf enghraifft i chi. Fel un rhanbarth o ran iechyd, gallai ardal fel Powys osod blaenoriaethau ar lefel bwrdd iechyd lleol a dweud, 'Rhown flaenoriaeth i bobl ifanc; caniatawn i ddeintyddion ganolbwyntio ar bobl ifanc wrth gofrestru cleifion newydd'. Mae'n ffordd bell o'r naill ben o Bowys i'r llall, a gallai'r sefyllfa fod yn ddramatig o wahanol mewn gwahanol rannau o Bowys. Digon hawdd i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd ddweud, 'Cawn un flaenoriaeth gyffredin i bobl ifanc ar gyfer yr ardal gyfan', neu 'Ni thrafferthwn â hyn gan nad yw'n broblem arbennig'. Ond mae'r sefyllfa'n hollol wahanol ym Mhowys. Mae'n debyg fod yr un ddatl yn wir am Geredigion, am Wunedd, a gallwn fynd ymlaen i enwi nifer o ranbarthau mawr eraill sydd i gyd dan un bwrdd iechyd lleol neu un sefydliad at ddibenion iechyd.

Nid yw'r ffaith nad oes gennych broblem arbennig o ran yr angen am roi blaenoriaeth i bobl ifanc ym Mhowys yn ei chyfanrwydd yn golygu nad os rhai ardaloedd lle byddai hynny'n syniad da oherwydd y prinder deintyddion. Felly, byddai fy ngwelliant i'n caniatáu i ddeintyddion weithredu'n lleol i ddatrys problem leol, yn hytrach na dibynnu ar fyrddau iechyd lleol i weithredu dros y rhanbarth cyfan. Nid yw'r gwelliant ynddo'i hun yn ychwanegu at y costau mewn unrhyw fodd, Weinidog; dim ond ailosod blaenoriaeth eitemau o fewn y cyllidebau sydd yn bodoli.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni welaf unrhyw siaradwyr, ac felly galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ateb.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau**

**Services (Brian Gibbons):** This is a pretty rum old amendment—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry, Minister, but I have just received a note from Helen Mary Jones to say that she would like to speak.

**Helen Mary Jones:** With apologies to fellow Members and to you, I thought that we were about to vote on NDM2860. I believe that my colleague, Jenny Randerson, may just have spoken to NDM2862. I have nothing further to say on NDM2860, but I have a specific point that I want to make in response to what Jenny Randerson has said on NDM2862. I seek your guidance, Deputy Presiding Officer, regarding when I should make those comments.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We are not on NDM2862 at the moment. We are on the amendment that seeks to introduce a further section, section 4, into the regulations. That is the amendment that we are on. I call the Minister to reply.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Are we still in order in relation to what Jenny Randerson has been speaking to?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I judged that she was in order.

**Brian Gibbons:** To deal with the points that Jenny raised in her contribution, following the discussion that we had at the Health and Social Services Committee, we took on board the amendment that was proposed there, but we also took legal advice to see whether the existing regulations were fit for purpose, to deliver the precise intention of Jenny's proposed amendment to the regulations. We were advised that the regulations precisely allow us to give preferential treatment if the local health board feels that there is a need in a particular area to contract for services specifically targeted at children. Given that that power exists, and we have double-checked it with our legal advisers, we are of the opinion that these powers exist and that this particular amendment is entirely superfluous.

**Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Hen welliant digon rhyfedd yw hwn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Weinidog, ond yr wyf newydd dderbyn nodyn oddi wrth Helen Mary Jones i ddweud yr hoffai hi siarad.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Gan ymddiheuro i gyd-Aelodau ac i chi, yr oeddwn yn meddwl ein bod ar fin pleidleisio ar NDM2860. Credaf efallai fod fy nghyd-Aelod, Jenny Randerson, newydd siarad ar NDM2862. Nid oes gennyf ddim byd pellach i'w ddweud ar NDM2860, ond mae gennyf bwynt penodol yr hoffwn ei wneud i ymateb i'r hyn a ddywedodd Jenny Randerson ar NDM2862. Gofynnaf am eich arweiniad, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ynghylch pryd y dylwn wneud y sylwadau hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid ydym ar gynnig NDM2862 ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym ar y gwelliant sy'n ceisio cyflwyno adran ychwanegol, adran 4, yn y rheoliadau. Dyna'r gwelliant yr ydym yn ei drafod. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ateb.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** A ydym yn dal mewn trefn o ran yr hyn yr oedd Jenny Randerson yn siarad arno?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyfarnais ei bod hi mewn trefn.

**Brian Gibbons:** I ddelio â'r pwyntiau a gododd Jenny yn ei chyfraniad, yn dilyn y drafodaeth a gawsom yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, derbyniasom y gwelliant a gynigiwyd yn y fan honno, ond cawsom gyngor cyfreithiol hefyd i weld a oedd y rheoliadau presennol yn addas at eu pwrpas, i gyflawni union fwriad y gwelliant a gynigiodd Jenny yn y rheoliadau. Cynghorwyd ni fod y rheoliadau'n fanwl gywir yn caniatáu inni roi triniaeth ffafriol os bydd y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn teimlo bod angen contractio am wasanaethau sy'n targedu plant yn benodol mewn ardal benodol. Gan fod y grym hwnnw'n bodoli, ac yr ydym wedi ailedrych ar hyn gyda'n cynghorwyr cyfreithiol, yr ydym o'r farn fod y pwerau hyn yn bodoli a bod y gwelliant arbennig hwn yn gwbl ddiangen.

Finally, if we take the position, as Jenny Randerson has, that this motion will not incur any extra cost, there is a discontinuity in her logic in proposing that the amendment will somehow add value to the service. If it will provide extra care and extra services for children that would not otherwise be catered for in our amendment, then, logically, that would incur extra costs. I do not understand. There is a serious inconsistency in the point that Jenny Randerson is trying to make, quite apart from the fact that her amendment is superfluous.

Yn olaf, os cymerwn y safbwynt, fel y gwnaeth Jenny Randerson, na fydd y cynnig hwn yn golygu unrhyw gost ychwanegol, mae bwlch yn ei rhesymeg pan gynigia y bydd y gwelliant rywfodd yn ychwanegu gwerth at y gwasanaeth. Os bydd yn darparu gofal ychwanegol a gwasanaethau ychwanegol i blant na fyddai darpariaeth ar eu cyfer fel arall yn ein gwelliant ni, yna yn rhesymegol byddai hynny'n achosi costau ychwanegol. Nid wyf yn deall. Mae anghysondeb difrifol yn y pwynt y mae Jenny Randerson yn ceisio'i wneud, yn hollol ar wahân i'r ffaith fod ei gwelliant yn ddiangen.

5.10 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2860): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation*

Cynnig (NDM2860): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau*

*Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft National Health Service (Dental Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 be made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

*a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd Deintyddol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2860): O blaid 40, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2860): For 40, Abstain 8, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau  
Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006  
The Approval of the National Health Service (General Dental Services  
Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

Motion (NDM2861): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations place insufficient emphasis on dental care for children.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English, and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

Motion (NDM2862): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations*

Cynnig (NDM2861): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu nad yw'r rheoliadau yn gosod digon o bwyslais ar ofal deintyddol i blant.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg, ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

Cynnig (NDM2862): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol*

2006; and

2. approves that the draft National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006 be made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Jenny Randerson.

Schedule 3 Part 1

In paragraph 1(4)(a) delete 'age' and add new paragraph (b)

a person's age, except in that it is permissible to give preference to the treatment of those under the age of 18.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 to NDM2861 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendment 1 to NDM2862 in the names of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Jenny Randerson.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006. (NDM2861)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft National Health Service (General Dental*

*Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Jenny Randerson.

Atodlen 3 Rhan 1

Ym mharagraff 1(4)(a) dileu 'age' ac ychwanegu paragraff newydd (b)

a person's age, except in that it is permissible to give preference to the treatment of those under the age of 18.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 i NDM2861 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliant 1 i NDM2862 yn enwau Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Jenny Randerson.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2861)*

Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol*



*Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*(Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. approves that the draft National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006 be made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006; and*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006; a*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006. (NDM2862)*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2862)*

These regulations, in contrary distinction to the amendments tabled, pay due attention to the importance of dental care for children. However, it is not our intention for dental inspections to be mandatory or compulsory for all children, though we would expect such an examination to be offered to all children and we would strongly promote its uptake. A mandatory requirement would be highly illiberal and totally unenforceable, to say the least. It is amazing that this illiberal proposal should be proposed by the so-called Liberal Democrats.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn, yn gwbl wahanol i'r gwelliannau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno, yn rhoi sylw dyledus i bwysigrwydd gofal deintyddol i blant. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n fwriad gennym i archwiliadau deintyddol fod yn orfodol i bob plentyn, er y byddem yn disgwyl i archwiliad felly gael ei gynnig i bob plentyn, a byddem yn argymhell yn gryf y dylid ei gymryd. Byddai gofyniad gorfodol yn hynod o anoddefgar ac yn gwbl amhosibl ei weithredu, a dweud y lleiaf. Mae'n rhyfeddol bod y cynnig anoddefgar hwn yn cael ei wneud gan rai sy'n eu galw eu hunain yn Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Furthermore, when we look at the range of activities that we as an Assembly Government are undertaking in promoting the wellbeing of children, we see that we have the dental sealant programme in particular which is an innovative and uniquely Wales-only scheme designed to address the issues of children. In view of the increased dental registration rate for children; in view of the healthy foods programme that we, as an Assembly Government, are promoting through our wide range of healthy school breakfasts, food and fitness programmes; and linked with the evidence base that underpins this contract, I do not think that this particular amendment has any substance and I urge its rejection.

Ar ben hynny, pan edrychwn ar yr amrediad o weithgareddau yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymgymryd â hwy i hybu lles plant, gwelwn fod gennym y rhaglen selio tyllau deintiol yn benodol, sy'n gynllun arloesol ac unigryw i Gymru wedi ei lunio i ddelio â phroblemau plant. Yng ngolau'r cynnydd yn y gyfradd cofrestru deintyddol ymysg plant; yng ngoleuni'r rhaglen bwydydd iach yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ei hyrwyddo drwy ein hamrediad eang o frecwastau ysgol iach, bwyd iach a rhaglenni ffitrwydd; ac o ystyried y sylfaen dystiolaeth sydd wrth wraidd y contract hwn, nid wyf yn meddwl bod gan y gwlliant arbennig hwn unrhyw sylwedd, ac anogaf ei wrthod.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose the following amendments to NDM2861 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the regulations place yn credu nad yw'r rheoliadau yn gosod digon*

*insufficient emphasis on dental care for children.* *o bwyslais ar ofal deintyddol i blant.*

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English, and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg, ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

I propose amendment 1 to NDM2862 in the name of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Jenny Randerson.

Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM2862 yn enwau Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Jenny Randerson.

#### *Schedule 3 Part 1*

#### *Atodlen 3 Rhan 1*

*In paragraph 1(4)(a) delete 'age' and add new paragraph (b)*

*Ym mharagraff 1(4)(a) dileu 'age' ac ychwanegu paragraff newydd (b)*

*a person's age, except in that it is permissible to give preference to the treatment of those under the age of 18.*

*a person's age, except in that it is permissible to give preference to the treatment of those under the age of 18.*

I will attempt to clarify the situation. I formally move the amendments but ask the Deputy Presiding Officer to clarify. You have just said that we are on item 12, which, on my screen, relates to NDM2861. Am I right, Deputy Presiding Officer?

Ceisias egluro'r sefyllfa. Yr wyf yn cynnig y gwelliannau'n ffurfiol, ond gofynnaf i'r Dirprwy Lywydd egluro. Yr ydych newydd ddweud ein bod ar eitem 12, sydd, ar fy sgrin i, yn ymwneud ag NDM2861. A ydwyf yn gywir, Ddirprwy Lywydd?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I think so.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Credaf eich bod.

**Jenny Randerson:** In that case, the Minister and I fiercely debated the issues that relate to this item during the previous item, and, in his opening comments, the Minister has just moved us on to what I believe is item 14 as opposed to item 13. Therefore, I will not add anything to this. I will just formally move the amendments and refer you to my earlier comments, which relate to the need to prioritise children and to allow dentists to prioritise children.

**Jenny Randerson:** Os felly, yr oedd y Gweinidog a minnau'n dadlau'n ffyrnig am y materion sy'n ymwneud â'r eitem hon yn ystod yr eitem flaenorol, ac yn ei sylwadau agoriadol mae'r Gweinidog newydd ein symud ymlaen at eitem 14, mi gredaf, yn hytrach nag eitem 13. Felly, ni wnaf ychwanegu dim at hyn. Yr unig beth a wnaf yw cyflwyno'r gwelliannau'n ffurfiol a'ch cyfeirio at fy sylwadau cynharach, sy'n ymwneud â'r angen i roi blaenoriaeth i blant a chaniatáu i ddeintyddion roi blaenoriaeth i blant.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call speakers on this, I will just say that I have not heard anything on any of the motions so far that is out of order.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn galw siaradwyr ar hyn, hoffwn ddweud nad wyf wedi clywed dim ar unrhyw un o'r cynigion hyd yma sydd allan o drefn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The previous contributions were certainly not out of order,

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn sicr nid oedd y cyfraniadau blaenorol allan o drefn, ond yr

but they were deeply confusing. We are now speaking about the regulations placing insufficient emphasis on dental care for children, are we not? We will support amendment 1 to the principle, as well as amendment 2 with regard to the regulations being made available in the Welsh language. However, when it comes to the vote on the Order itself, we will abstain, because we are concerned about giving anyone in the public services an automatic right to discriminate on any grounds whatsoever. I understand Jenny Randerson's points, and I would associate myself with the principle. However, we cannot support the amendment to the Order itself, because we are concerned that it may have unintended consequences.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I see that the Minister does not wish to reply, and we will therefore move to a vote.

oeddent yn ddigon i'n drysu'n lân. Yr ydym yn sôn yn awr fod y rheoliadau'n gosod pwyslais annigonol ar ofal deintyddol i blant, onid ydym? Cefnogwn welliant 1 i'r egwyddor, yn ogystal â gwelliant 2 o ran darparu'r rheoliadau yn yr iaith Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, pan ddaw'n fater o bleidleisio ar y Gorchymyn ei hun, byddwn yn atal ein pleidlais, oherwydd yr ydym yn bryderus ynghylch rhoi hawl awtomatig i neb yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wahaniaethu ar unrhyw sail o gwbl. Deallaf bwyntiau Jenny Randerson, a byddwn yn uniaethu â'r egwyddor. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn gefnogi'r gwelliant yn y Gorchymyn ei hun, oherwydd yr ydym yn pryderu y gallai gael canlyniadau na fwriedir.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwelaf nad yw'r Gweinidog yn dymuno ateb, ac felly symudwn at bleidlais.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2861): to propose that  
*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006.*

Cynnig (NDM2861): cynnig bod  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2861): O blaid 41, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2861): For 41, Abstain 8, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 6, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 1: For 6, Abstain 14, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 German, Michael  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian

Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2862): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2006 be made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table*

Cynnig (NDM2862): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y*

*Office on 7 February 2006.*

*Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2862): O blaid 41, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2862): For 41, Abstain 8, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol  
Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006  
The Approval of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services  
Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006**

Motion (NDM2863): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2863): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes the concerns expressed by the dental profession with regard to:*

*yn nodi'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan y proffesiwn deintyddol gyda golwg ar:*

*1. delays in providing information on the workload and funding implications of the new contract to dentists;*

*1. oedi wrth ddarparu gwybodaeth am y baich gwaith a goblygiadau ariannu'r contractau newydd i ddeintyddion;*

*2. no piloting of certain elements within the new contract; and*

*2. rhai elfennau o fewn y contract newydd heb eu treialu; a*

*3. the lack of opportunity within the new contract to allow dentists to undertake preventative work.*

*3. y diffyg cyfle o fewn y contract newydd i roi lle i ddeintyddion wneud gwaith ataliol.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

Motion (NDM2864): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2864): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â drafft y Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006; ac*



2. approves that the draft General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2864)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams to NDM2863.

5.20 p.m.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2863)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006; and*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod drafft y Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006 (NDM2864)*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams i NDM2863.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2863)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006; ac*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006; a*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2864)*

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2863. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the concerns expressed by the dental profession with regard to:*

*1. delays in providing information on the workload and funding implications of the new contract to dentists;*

*2. no piloting of certain elements within the new contract; and*

*3. the lack of opportunity within the new contract to allow dentists to undertake preventative work.*

Briefly, bearing in mind the time constraints, our amendment seeks to put on record the well-known concerns that the dental profession has about the new contract. It complains of delays in providing information on workload and on the funding implications of the new contract; it has concerns about certain elements that have not been piloted, which the Minister has acknowledged; and it has concerns about the lack of opportunities to proactively undertake preventative work. We have discussed this in previous debates. We will also support the amendment that has been tabled by the Liberal Democrats.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 2 to NDM2863. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support the Plaid Cymru amendment.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I have one question for the Minister, in relation to the funding that was made available for the transition period. I note that almost £1 million was made available for 2004-05, and that there is a continuation of support into 2005-06 and

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2864)*

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM2863. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan y proffesiwn deintyddol gyda golwg ar:*

*1. oedi wrth ddarparu gwybodaeth am y baich gwaith a goblygiadau ariannu'r contractau newydd i ddeintyddion;*

*2. rhai elfennau yn y contract newydd heb eu treialu; a*

*3. y diffyg cyfle o fewn y contract newydd i roi lle i ddeintyddion wneud gwaith ataliol.*

Yn fyr, o gofio bod amser yn brin, mae ein gwelliant yn ceisio cofnodi'r pryderon cyfarwydd sydd gan ddeintyddion ynghylch y contract newydd. Maent yn cwyno am oedi wrth ddarparu gwybodaeth am y baich gwaith ac am oblygiadau ariannu'r contract newydd; maent yn pryderu ynghylch rhai elfennau sydd heb eu treialu, ac y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cydnabod; ac maent yn pryderu ynghylch prinder cyfleoedd i wneud gwaith ataliol. Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn mewn dadleuon blaenorol. Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi'r gwelliant sydd wedi ei gyflwyno gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiaf welliant 2 i NDM2863. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi gwelliant Plaid Cymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae gennyf un cwestiwn i'w ofyn i'r Gweinidog, mewn cysylltiad â'r arian a ddarparwyd ar gyfer y cyfnod trosiannol. Sylwaf fod bron £1 filiwn wedi ei ddarparu ar gyfer 2004-05, ac y bydd y cymorth i BILlau yn parhau yn 2005-06 a

2006-07 for LHBs, but is there any continuation of financial support during the transition for dental practices?

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** My understanding is that there will be a payment system to allow the necessary treatments to be continued and completed during the period that the new contract will have been in place. Consequently, there will be a payment stream available for those treatments that would have been started under the present contract and will have to be completed under the new contract.

2006-07. Ond a fydd unrhyw gymorth ariannol parhaus yn y cyfnod trosiannol i bractisiau deintyddol?

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Yn ôl a ddeallaf, bydd yna system daliadau fel y gellir parhau a chwblhau'r triniaethau angenrheidiol yn ystod y cyfnod pan fydd y contract newydd wedi bod mewn grym. O ganlyniad i hynny, bydd ffrwd dalu ar gael ar gyfer y triniaethau hynny a fyddai wedi eu cychwyn o dan y contract presennol ac y bydd yn rhaid eu cwblhau o dan y contract newydd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton

Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM2863:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006.*

Cynnig NDM2863:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2863): O blaid 42, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NDM2863): For 42, Abstain 9, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2864): O blaid 42, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2864): For 42, Abstain 9, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd  
 Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006  
 Approval of the Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health)  
 (Wales) Regulations 2006**

Motion (NDM2865): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2865): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y

motion:

*regrets that the regulations place no obligation on LHBs to improve access to NHS dental care when a shortage of such provision has been identified.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have placed an obligation on LHBs to improve levels of preventative dental care for children.*

Amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

Motion (NDM2866): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Jenny Randerson. In paragraph 2 (2) delete 'to the extent it considers necessary'.

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Jenny Randerson. In paragraph 2 (2) (b) insert

cynnig:

*yn gresynu nad yw'r rheoliadau yn gosod dyletswydd ar y BILLau i wella mynediad i ofal deintyddol dan y GIG pan fydd prinder wedi'i bennu yn y cyfryw ddarpariaeth.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylai'r rheoliadau osod dyletswydd ar y BILLau i wella lefelau gofal deintyddol ataliol ar gyfer plant.*

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

Cynnig (NDM2866): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol Cyhoeddus) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Jenny Randerson. Ym mharagraff 2 (2) dileu 'to the extent it considers necessary'.

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Jenny Randerson. Ym mharagraff 2 (2) (b) rhoi 'regular' ar ôl 'dental

'regular' before 'dental inspection'; and insert 'all' before 'pupils'.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams to NDM2865 and amendments 1 and 2 in the names of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Jenny Randerson to NDM2866.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2865)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2866)*

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2865. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that the regulations place no obligation on LHBs to improve access to NHS dental care when a shortage of such provision has been identified.*

I propose amendment 2 to NDM2865. Add a

inspection' a rhoi 'all' cyn 'pupils'.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams i NDM2865 a gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enwau Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Jenny Randerson i NDM 2866.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2865)*

Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoeddus) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2866)*

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigaf welliant 1 i NDM2865. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu nad yw'r rheoliadau yn gosod dyletswydd ar y BILLau i wella mynediad i ofal deintyddol dan y GIG pan fydd prinder wedi'i bennu yn y cyfryw ddarpariaeth.*

Cynigaf welliant 2 i NDM2865. Ychwanegu



new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have placed an obligation on LHBs to improve levels of preventative dental care for children.*

I propose amendment 3 to NDM2865. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the regulations should have been made available in both Welsh and English and calls on the Minister to lay regulations in both languages.*

I propose amendment 1 to NDM2866. In paragraph 2 (2) delete 'to the extent it considers necessary'.

I propose amendment 2 to NDM2866. In paragraph 2 (2) (b) insert 'regular' before 'dental inspection', and insert 'all' before 'pupils'.

I take this opportunity to answer the Minister's comments in the previous debate, when he talked about the obligations to deal with young people with regard to the inspection of their teeth. There are unacceptable variations from one area of Wales to another in the amount of NHS dentistry available. In Pembrokeshire, 15 per cent of people are registered, in Gwynedd, 22 per cent of people are registered, and, top of the league, you are really lucky if you live in Swansea, where over 60 per cent of people are registered. However, this means that 40 per cent of people are still not registered, so we know that there are shortages. By deleting the phrase 'to the extent that it considers necessary' that amendment leaves the obligation on local health boards to

'secure the provision of the following to meet all reasonable requirements within its areas.'

In other words, it gives much less option to local health boards as to how much dental healthcare they provide via the NHS. It places a much clearer obligation on them, without the rather mysterious phrase, 'to the extent that it considers necessary'. Our earlier amendment 2 refers to the regular dental inspection of all pupils; the Minister started

pwyt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylai'r rheoliadau osod dyletswydd ar y BILLau i wella lefelau gofal deintyddol ataliol ar gyfer plant.*

Cynigiau welliant 3 i NDM2865. Ychwanegu pwyt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylid bod wedi darparu'r rheoliadau yn Gymraeg a Saesneg ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau yn y ddwy iaith.*

Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM2866. Ym mharagraff 2 (2) dileu 'to the extent it considers necessary'.

Cynigiau welliant 2 i NDM2866. Ym mharagraff 2 (2) (b) rhoi 'regular' ar ôl 'dental inspection' a rhoi 'all' cyn 'pupils'.

Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i ateb y sylwadau a wnaeth y Gweinidog yn y ddatl flaenorol, pan soniodd am y rhwymedigaethau i ddelio â phobl ifanc mewn cysylltiad ag archwilio eu dannedd. Ceir amrywiadau annerbyniol rhwng y naill ardal a'r llall yng Nghymru o ran maint deintyddiaeth y GIG sydd ar gael. Yn sir Benfro, mae 15 y cant o bobl wedi eu cofrestru, yng Ngwynedd, mae 22 y cant o bobl wedi eu cofrestru, ac ar frig y tabl yr ydych yn wirioneddol ffodus os ydych yn byw yn Abertawe, lle mae 60 y cant o bobl wedi eu cofrestru. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n golygu bod 40 y cant o bobl eto sydd heb eu cofrestru, felly gwyddom fod prinder. Drwy ddileu'r geiriau 'to the extent that it considers necessary', mae'r gwelliant hwnnw'n gadael y rhwymedigaeth ar ysgwyddau byrddau iechyd lleol i

sicrhau darparu'r canlynol i ddiwallu'r holl anghenion rhesymol yn ei ardaloedd.

Mewn geiriau eraill, mae'n rhoi llai o lawer o ddewis i fyrddau iechyd lleol o ran faint o ofal iechyd deintyddol y maent yn ei ddarparu drwy'r GIG. Mae'n eu rhoi dan rwymedigaeth lawer mwy pendant, heb y geiriau rhyfedd braidd, 'to the extent that it considers necessary'. Mae ein gwelliant 2 cynharach yn cyfeirio at archwiliadau

to deal with this issue earlier. I emphasise that the phrasing here is that it offers regular dental inspection. It does not say that every pupil has to have it; it simply says that it has to be offered to the pupil. It does not use the term 'all', and I believe that it is important to include that phrase. There is no systematic way—and the Minister said this in committee—of picking up on the pupils who happen to be away on the day that the regular inspection is offered. That is a key issue, namely that pupils who happen to be away—that is probably one in 10—are given another alternative to have that inspection, and that that inspection is regular. We had legal advice that 'regular' was not such a precise term that it would tie the hands of the LHB on how frequently that was offered in schools.

deintyddol rheolaidd ar gyfer pob disgybl; dechreuodd y Gweinidog ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn gynharach. Yr wyf yn pwysleisio bod y geiriad yma'n cynnig archwiliadau deintyddol rheolaidd. Nid yw'n dweud y bydd pob disgybl yn eu cael; nid yw ond yn dweud bod yn rhaid eu cynnig i'r disgybl. Nid yw'n cynnwys y gair 'pob', a chredaf ei bod yn bwysig cynnwys y gair hwnnw. Nid oes dull systematig—a dywedodd y Gweinidog hyn yn y pwyllgor—o fynd ar ôl y disgyblion sydd yn digwydd bod i ffwrdd ar y diwrnod y cynigir yr archwiliad rheolaidd. Mae hynny'n fater allweddol, sef bod disgyblion sydd yn digwydd bod i ffwrdd—sef un o bob 10, mae'n debyg—yn cael cynnig arall i gael archwiliad o'r fath, a bod yr archwiliad hwnnw'n un rheolaidd. Cawsom gyngor cyfreithiol i'r perwyl nad oedd 'rheolaidd' yn derm mor benodol fel y byddai'n clymu dwylo'r BILL o ran pa mor aml y byddai'n ei gynnig mewn ysgolion.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** As the Minister does not wish to reply, we will move to the votes.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gan nad yw'r Gweinidog am ymateb, awn ymlaen i bleidleisio.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 3: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina

Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

5.30 p.m.

Motion (NDM2865): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2865): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2865): O blaid 42, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NDM2865): For 42, Abstain 7, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 7, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Jones, Elin  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 8, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 2: For 8, Abstain 6, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Jones, Elin  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Ryder, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2866): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2866): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006; ac*

*2. approves that the draft Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol Cyhoeddus) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006; and*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006; a*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006.*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM2866): O blaid 42, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2866): For 42, Abstain 8, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Pontio Rhwng y Gynradd a'r Ysgol Uwchradd  
 (Cymru) 2006, a Chymeradwyo o dan reol Sefydlog Rhif 29 y Gofyniad am  
 Lunio Cynlluniau Pontio ac Arweiniad  
 Approval of the Transition from Primary School to Secondary School (Wales)  
 Regulations 2006, and the approval under Standing Order No. 29 Requirement  
 for the production of Transition Plans and Guidance**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Transition from Primary to Secondary School (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo o'r Ysgol Gynradd i'r Ysgol Uwchradd (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr*



(NDM2867)

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the draft Transition from Primary to Secondary School (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft the Transition from Primary to Secondary School (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006; and*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2868)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii):*

*considers the principle of Requirement for the production of Transition Plans and Guidance a draft of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2869)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii):*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006 in relation to the Requirement for the production of Transition Plans and Guidance; and*

2. *approves the Requirement for the production of Transition Plans and Guidance a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2006. (NDM2870)*

I want to draw Members' attention to the fact that this is a piece of Wales-only legislation.

2006. (NDM2867)

Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo o'r Ysgol Gynradd i'r Ysgol Uwchradd (Cymru) 2006; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo o'r Ysgol Gynradd i'r Ysgol Uwchradd (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2868)*

Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii):*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gofyniad i gynhyrchu Cynlluniau ac Arweiniad Trosglwyddo y gosodwyd drafft ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2869)*

Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii):*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006 ynghylch y Gofyniad i gynhyrchu Cynlluniau ac Arweiniad Trosglwyddo; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo'r Gofyniad i gynhyrchu Cynlluniau ac Arweiniad Trosglwyddo y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2870)*

Yr wyf am dynnu sylw Aelodau at y ffaith mai eitem ddeddfwriaeth ar gyfer Cymru'n

Our primary schools, in recent years, have made huge strides in improving standards and the quality of teaching. Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales noted in her annual report that the percentage of lessons in primary schools awarded the top two grades during inspection increased over the last five years by 30 percentage points, from 46 per cent in 1999-2000 to 76 per cent in 2004-05. Standards at the end of key stage 3, although steadily improving, indicate that, at times, we fail to capitalise fully on the positive attitude, enthusiasm and spirit that most young people demonstrate and develop during their primary school years.

As the inspectorate underlined, more needs to be done to ensure that, in the delivery of the curriculum, teachers and pupils build on the progress made in primary schools from the beginning of year 7. What we are proposing today is that by taking forward the Wales-only legislation that was secured in the Education Act 2002, we will provide the basis for our young people to hit the ground running in the most important phase of their education. It is a real opportunity to frame an approach that is distinctive to circumstances and needs in Wales, using new transition plans that will become statutory only in Wales. I commend these regulations and the requirement for the production of transition plans and guidance to the Assembly.

**William Graham:** Due to the lateness of the hour, I will be as short as possible. Minister, can I remind you of Estyn's conclusions regarding primary and secondary schools usually having good pastoral links? It noted that schools need to make the educational transition between key stage 2 and key stage 3 equally successfully. I have some reservations regarding the termination of disputes as to whether a particular school is a feeder primary school for a particular secondary school for the purposes of section 198. Also, I acknowledge the response to comments registered during the consultation on the cohort size of small schools, allowing primary schools with a total number of registered pupils of 50 or less at the end of

unig yw hon. Mae ein hysgolion cynradd wedi cymryd camau bras, yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, i wella safonau ac ansawdd dysgu. Dywedodd Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru yn ei hadroddiad blynyddol fod canran y gwersi mewn ysgolion cynradd y dyfarnwyd y ddwy radd uchaf iddynt wedi codi 30 y cant dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, o 46 y cant yn 1999-2000 i 76 y cant yn 2004-05. Mae'r safonau ar ddiwedd cyfnod allweddol 3, er eu bod yn gwella'n raddol, yn dangos ein bod, ar adegau, yn methu elwa'n llawn ar yr ymagwedd gadarnhaol, y brwdfrydedd a'r meddylfryd y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl ifanc yn eu dangos a'u datblygu yn ystod eu blynyddoedd yn yr ysgol gynradd.

Fel y pwysleisiodd yr arolygiaeth, mae angen gwneud rhagor i sicrhau bod athrawon a disgyblion, wrth gwblhau'r cwricwlwm, yn adeiladu ar sail y cynnydd a wnaed mewn ysgolion cynradd oddi ar ddechrau blwyddyn 7. Yr ydym yn cynnig heddiw y byddwn, drwy fwrw ymlaen â'r ddeddfwriaeth hon ar gyfer Cymru'n unig a sicrhawyd yn Neddf Addysg 2002, yn darparu sail i'n pobl ifanc fynd ati'n ddirwystr yn y cyfnod pwysicaf yn eu haddysg. Dyma gyfle gwirioneddol i greu dull gweithredu wedi ei addasu'n benodol ar gyfer amgylchiadau ac anghenion yng Nghymru, drwy ddefnyddio cynlluniau trosglwyddo newydd a fydd yn statudol yng Nghymru'n unig. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau hyn a'r gofyniad i gynhyrchu cynlluniau ac arweiniad trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad.

**William Graham:** Gan ei bod yn hwyr, byddaf mor gryno â phosibl. Weinidog, a gaf fi eich atgoffa am y casgliadau y daeth Estyn iddynt fod cysylltiadau bugeiliol da fel rheol rhwng ysgolion cynradd ac ysgolion uwchradd? Dywedai fod angen i ysgolion sicrhau bod y pontio addysgol rhwng cyfnod allweddol 2 a chyfnod allweddol 3 yr un mor llwyddiannus. Mae gennyf rai amheuon ynghylch datrys dadleuon a yw ysgol benodol yn ysgol gynradd sy'n bwydo ysgol uwchradd benodol at ddibenion adran 198. Ar ben hynny, yr wyf yn cydnabod yr ymateb i sylwadau a gofnodwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghori am faint cohort ysgolion bach, sy'n caniatáu eithrio ysgolion cynradd sydd â 50 neu lai o ddisgyblion cofrestredig ar

the school year to be exempt. I would welcome further guidance from the Minister on parental choice with regard to flexibility.

**Peter Black:** Although it is late, education is as important as health, and I want to make several points on this issue.

The transition from key stage 2 to key stage 3 is very important. As William and the Minister outlined, there have been issues around the transition, particularly with regard to how you manage to carry forward a child's progress at key stage 2 into key stage 3. These transition plans are possibly one way of moving towards that. However, formal plans such as these are not necessarily the only answer, because there has to be much closer working. Although you cannot always plan for that, it should certainly come as a matter of course with regard to the primary schools and the secondary schools that they feed into. Therefore, while we would support these transition plans, we would also like to see them develop generically and naturally, so that any artificial barriers that may exist are broken down as a result. For example, if we are to achieve continuity of learning, we might want to make better use of specialised teachers in the primary sector. Where we have expertise in subjects such as modern languages and sciences, secondary school teachers could introduce those subjects to pupils in primary schools as well. That approach could be incorporated into the transition plans, and it is certainly worth looking at in the wider context. It should be made much easier, and we should try to achieve that objective if we can do so without overburdening the teachers involved. It is important, and those teachers would want to see that progression, and familiarise themselves with the children at an earlier stage.

This wider curriculum, and this developing continuity, would be facilitated still further by feeder primary schools and secondary schools working together to share resources as well as expertise. In some rural areas, for example, school federations are already a way of life, and guarantee that pupils do not miss out on the best and widest possible

ddiwedd y flwyddyn ysgol. Byddwn yn croesawu rhagor o arweiniad gan y Gweinidog am ddewis i rieni gyda golwg ar hyblygrwydd.

**Peter Black:** Er ei bod hi'n hwyr, mae addysg yr un mor bwysig ag iechyd, ac yr wyf am gyflwyno nifer o bwyntiau ar y mater hwn.

Mae pontio o gyfnod allweddol 2 i gyfnod allweddol 3 yn bwysig dros ben. Fel yr amlinellodd William a'r Gweinidog, cafwyd problemau gyda'r cyfnod pontio, yn enwedig o ran sut mae trosglwyddo cynnydd plentyn yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 i gyfnod allweddol 3. Mae'r cynlluniau pontio hyn o bosibl yn un ffordd i symud tuag at hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid cynlluniau ffurfiol fel y rhain o reidrwydd yw'r unig ateb, oherwydd rhaid gweithio'n agosach. Er nad oes modd cynllunio ar gyfer hynny bob tro, dylai'n sicr fod yn fater o drefn i ysgolion cynradd a'r ysgolion uwchradd sy'n cael eu bwydo ganddynt. Felly, er y byddem am gefnogi'r cynlluniau pontio hyn, caredm hefyd eu gweld yn datblygu'n enerig ac yn naturiol er mwyn chwalu unrhyw rwystrau artiffisial a all fodoli. Er enghraifft, os ydym am sicrhau dilyniant dysgu, efallai y byddem am fanteisio mwy ar athrawon arbenigol yn y sector cynradd. Lle mae gennym arbenigedd mewn pynciau fel ieithoedd modern a'r gwyddorau, gallai athrawon ysgolion uwchradd gyflwyno'r pynciau hynny i ddisgyblion mewn ysgolion cynradd hefyd. Gellid cynnwys y dull hwnnw yn y cynlluniau pontio, ac yn ddiâu byddai'n werth edrych ar hyn yn y cyd-destun ehangach. Dylid gwneud hyn yn haws o lawer, a dylem geisio cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw os oes modd gwneud hynny heb orlwytho'r athrawon dan sylw. Mae hi'n bwysig, a byddai'r athrawon hynny am weld y cynnydd hwnnw, a dod i adnabod y plant yn cynharach.

Byddai'r cwricwlwm ehangach hwn, a'r dilyniant hwn a fyddai'n datblygu, yn cael eu hwyluso ymhellach petai ysgolion uwchradd a'r ysgolion cynradd sy'n eu bwydo yn cydweithio i rannu adnoddau yn ogystal ag arbenigedd. Mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig, er enghraifft, mae ffederasiynau ysgol eisoes wedi ennill eu plwyf, ac yn gwarantu na fydd

education. We must look at how this best practice can help to increase continuity across the board. Schools should work together, and not compete against each other, and by concentrating on raising standards for all, we can achieve that and achieve the goal that we are all aiming for of better transition for youngsters between key stage 2 and key stage 3.

In looking at this legislation, I hope that we do not consider these transition plans to be the be-all and end-all. If we can get those more natural working practices, where teachers are working in both primary and secondary schools, and are talking to each other more frequently about the pupils, then we can achieve those aims and much greater success at that level.

**Janet Ryder:** Plaid Cymru will support this legislation. I do not quite agree with what Peter has just said. While we do not expect these regulations to be the be-all and end-all, we do expect them to be the foundation on which those bridges are made. The bridges for children transferring from primary to secondary school are incredibly important. It is true that we lose an awful lot of ability in the transition from key stage 2 to key stage 3, and that is usually around children going to new and strange surroundings, with new teachers, new friends and new buildings. We hope that these plans will create links between secondary schools and their feeder schools, with teachers interacting between those schools, so that pupils get to know the new staff. We also hope that these plans will help to bridge that gap and to stop the loss of skills at key stage 3.

I would like the Minister to look in particular at the loss of children classed as first language Welsh speakers between key stage 2 and key stage 3. There is an overall loss of 22 per cent when you look at the numbers of children moving from Welsh-medium primary schools into Welsh-medium

disgyblion yn cael eu hamddifadu o'r addysg orau ac ehangaf sy'n bosibl. Rhaid inni edrych sut y gall yr arfer gorau hwn helpu cynyddu dilyniant yn gyffredinol. Dylai ysgolion gydweithio, a pheidio â chystadlu yn erbyn ei gilydd, a thrwy ganolbwyntio ar godi safonau i bawb gallwn gyflawni hynny a chyflawni'r nod yr ydym bob un yn ymgynraedd tuag ato, sef pontio gwell ar gyfer plant rhwng cyfnod allweddol 2 a chyfnod allweddol 3.

Wrth edrych ar y ddeddfwriaeth hon, gobeithio nad ydym yn credu y bydd y cynlluniau pontio hyn yn ateb i bopeth. Os gallwn sicrhau'r arferion gweithio mwy naturiol hynny, gydag athrawon yn gweithio mewn ysgolion cynradd ac ysgolion uwchradd a'r ysgolion hynny'n siarad â'i gilydd yn amlach am y disgyblion, gallwn gyflawni'r nodau hynny a sicrhau llawer mwy o lwyddian ar y lefel honno.

**Janet Ryder:** Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Nid wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r hyn y mae Peter newydd ei ddweud. Er na ddisgwyliwn i'r rheoliadau hyn fod yn ateb i bopeth, yr ydym yn disgwyl iddynt fod yn sylfaen ar gyfer codi'r pontydd hynny. Mae'r pontydd sy'n arwain plant o'r ysgol gynradd i'r ysgol uwchradd yn arbennig o bwysig. Mae hi'n deg dweud ein bod yn colli llawer iawn o allu wrth i ddisgyblion symud o gyfnod allweddol 2 i gyfnod allweddol 3, a hynny fel rheol oherwydd bod disgyblion yn mynd i amgylchedd newydd a dieithr, gydag athrawon newydd, ffrindiau newydd ac adeiladau newydd. Hyderwn y bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn creu dolenni cyswllt rhwng ysgolion uwchradd a'r ysgolion cynradd sy'n eu bwydo, gydag athrawon yn gyswllt rhwng yr ysgolion hynny, er mwyn i'r disgyblion ddod i adnabod y staff newydd. Hyderwn hefyd y bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn helpu pontio'r bwch hwnnw a rhoi diwedd ar golli sgiliau yng nghyfnod allweddol 3.

Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog edrych yn benodol ar nifer y disgyblion sy'n cael eu dynodi'n siaradwyr Cymraeg iaith gyntaf ac sy'n cael eu colli rhwng cyfnod allweddol 2 a chyfnod allweddol 3. Mae 22 y cant yn gyffredinol yn cael eu colli os edrychwch ar nifer y plant sy'n symud o ysgolion cynradd cyfrwng

secondary education, and I would particularly like to hear the Minister's views on that and on how, in these plans, she will bridge that gap, ensuring that provision is available and that children are encouraged to continue their education through the medium of Welsh in secondary school.

5.40 p.m.

How will the £5.7 million that is alluded to in the memorandum be distributed? Will it be distributed on a formula basis, or will schools have to bid for it? There will be added expense for all schools—and possibly the local education authority, but mainly the schools—in developing these plans. Therefore, will this be just a one-off lump sum or will it be continued and rolled into the formula for schools in order to support the development of this crucial initiative?

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** The point that Janet made about this being the foundation on which bridges are made is absolutely right, and it is exactly why we have taken this approach to the plans. The plans are produced where there is a firm and ongoing relationship between a secondary school and a group of feeder primary schools, so the kind of thing that you are looking at, Peter, in terms of getting that improved relationship between a cluster of schools, will be enshrined in this plan.

The guidance particularly specifies that a feeder school is defined as a school where 50 per cent or more of the cohort move at the end of year 6 to a specific secondary school, because we did not want to over-burden schools with plans. Therefore, currently, tiny schools with 50 pupils or less, and therefore a very small year 6 group, will not have to be a statutory part of similar transition planning, because the children may move in different directions. However, we would want secondary schools to engage with them on a voluntary basis, so that they do not miss out in terms of the new transition planning arrangements. Each plan must be the product of a genuine partnership, and jointly owned by the primary and secondary schools, with agreement on targets for improvement that reflect local circumstances and priorities.

Cymraeg i addysg uwchradd cyfrwng Cymraeg. Hoffwn yn arbennig glywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog am hynny, a sut, yn y cynlluniau hynny, y bydd hi'n pontio'r bwlch hwnnw, gan sicrhau bod darpariaeth ar gael a bod plant yn cael eu hannog i barhau eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn ysgol uwchradd.

Sut y caiff y £5.7 miliwn y cyfeirir ato yn y memorandwm ei ddsbarthu? A gaiff ei ddsbarthu ar sail fformiwla, neu a fydd yn rhaid i ysgolion wneud cais amdano? Bydd costau ychwanegol i bob ysgol—ac o bosibl i'r awdurdod addysg lleol, ond i'r ysgolion yn bennaf—i ddatblygu'r cynlluniau hyn. Felly, a fydd hwn yn swm unwaith ac am byth, ynteu a fydd yn parhau ac yn rhan o'r fformiwla ar gyfer ysgolion er mwyn cefnogi datblygu'r fenter hollbwysig hon?

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae Janet wedi taro'r hoelen ar ei phen gyda'i phwynt mai hyn yw'r sylfaen ar gyfer codi pontydd, ac am yr union reswm hwnnw yr ydym wedi defnyddio'r dull hwn gyda'r cynlluniau. Cynhyrchir y cynlluniau lle mae perthynas gadarn a pharhaus rhwng ysgol uwchradd a grŵp o ysgolion cynradd sy'n ei bwydo. Felly, bydd y math o beth yr ydych chi'n edrych arno, Peter, o ran sicrhau perthynas well rhwng clwstwr o ysgolion, wedi'i wreiddio yn y cynllun hwn.

Dywed yr arweiniad yn benodol y caiff ysgol sy'n bwydo ei diffinio fel ysgol lle mae 50 y cant neu ragor o'r cohort ar ddiwedd blwyddyn 6 yn symud i ysgol uwchradd benodol, gan nad oeddem am orlwytho ysgolion â chynlluniau. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, ni fydd ysgolion bach iawn sydd â 50 neu lai o ddisgyblion, ac felly sydd â grŵp bach iawn o ddisgyblion blwyddyn 6, yn gorfod bod yn rhan statudol o gynllunio pontio tebyg, oherwydd y gall y plant symud i gyfeiriadau gwahanol. Fodd bynnag, byddem am weld ysgolion uwchradd yn ymwneud â'r ysgolion hynny o'u gwirfodd, er mwyn sicrhau na fyddant ar eu colled o ran y trefniadau cynllunio pontio newydd. Rhaid i bob cynllun fod yn gynnyrch partneriaeth go iawn, a rhaid i'r ysgol gynradd a'r ysgol uwchradd ei pherchnogi ar y cyd, gan gyuno

Plans should major on measures to improve continuity and delivery of the curriculum and teaching methods.

The point that Janet made about first-language Welsh speakers is very important, because the *Llais y Lli* report demonstrated that there is a drop-off in figures, but it also demonstrated that the drop-off is quite local in certain parts of Wales, and I am already looking with the relevant local authorities at how we can give out a strong message from the Assembly that we want to encourage people to move from first-language Welsh education in the primary school to first-language Welsh education in the secondary school. Our new approach on categorisation, which, as you know, is currently out for consultation, will help with this because it will be a factual rendition of exactly the amount of Welsh taught in our schools, and it will encourage parents to make choices based on that information, knowing that it has been looked at in the same way across Wales.

In terms of funding, there is funding of £9.5 million in 2006-07 in the Better Schools fund to support the development of transition plans, because we have always had funding for transition in that fund. However, the fund is specifically for transition plans this year. We are making an additional £5 million available over three years for local authorities to work with schools on exemplar projects on specific aspects of transition, and we will consult on the funding arrangements for that. It is £1 million in the coming financial year, and £2 million in each of the next financial years. We are also providing additional in-service training days that can be used for the transition plans.

ar dargedau ar gyfer gwella sy'n adlewyrchu amgylchiadau a blaenoriaethau lleol. Dylai'r cynlluniau ganolbwyntio ar fesurau i wella dilyniant a chyflwyno'r cwricwlwm a dulliau dysgu.

Mae pwynt Janet ynghylch siaradwyr Cymraeg iaith gyntaf yn bwysig dros ben, oherwydd dangosodd adroddiad *Llais y Lli* fod y ffigurau'n disgyn. Ond dangosai hefyd fod y gostyngiad yn weddol lleol mewn rhannau penodol o Gymru, ac yr wyf eisoes yn edrych gyda'r awdurdodau lleol perthnasol ar y ffordd y gallwn gyfleu neges gref o du'r Cynulliad ein bod am annog pobl i symud o addysg Gymraeg iaith gyntaf yn yr ysgol gynradd i addysg Gymraeg iaith gyntaf yn yr ysgol uwchradd. Bydd ein dull newydd ar gyfer categoraidd, sydd, fel y gwyrddoch, yn destun ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd, o gymorth yn hyn oherwydd bydd yn ddatganiad ffeithiol am union faint o Gymraeg a ddysgir yn ein hysgolion, a bydd yn annog rhieni i ddewis ar sail y wybodaeth honno, gan wybod bod sylw wedi ei roi i hyn yn yr un modd ledled Cymru.

O ran cyllid, mae cyllid o £9.5 miliwn yn 2006-07 yn y Gronfa Ysgolion Gwell i gefnogi datblygu cynlluniau pontio, oherwydd ein bod bob amser wedi cael cyllid ar gyfer pontio yn y gronfa honno. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gronfa'n arbennig ar gyfer cynlluniau pontio eleni. Yr ydym yn darparu £5 miliwn ychwanegol dros dair blynedd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol er mwyn iddynt weithio gydag ysgolion ar brosiectau enghreifftiol ar agweddau penodol ar bontio, a byddwn yn ymgynghori am y trefniadau cyllido ar gyfer hynny. Mae'n £1 filiwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, a £2 filiwn yr un ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd ariannol ganlynol. Yr ydym hefyd yn darparu diwrnodau hyfforddiant mewn swydd ychwanegol y gellir eu defnyddio ar gyfer y cynlluniau pontio.

*Cynnig (NDM2867): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion (NDM2867): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Mewies, Sandy

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2868): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2868): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2869): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2869): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael



Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2870): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2870): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
 today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.46 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.46 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)

Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)