



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mercher, 26 Mai 2004

Wednesday, 26 May 2004

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3 | Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister |
| 15 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside |
| 24 | Datganiad ar Fenter Reoli'r Sector Cyhoeddus—Adroddiad Cynnydd
Statement on the Public Sector Management Initiative—A Progress Report |
| 35 | Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer |
| 35 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaethau Eirioli a Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant)
(Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau Adolygu Achosion Plant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Advocacy Services and Representations Procedure (Children)
(Wales) Regulations 2004 and the Review of Children's Cases (Amendment) (Wales)
Regulations 2004 |
| 47 | Caffael Cynaliadwy
Sustainable Procurement |
| 77 | Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order |
| 77 | Dadl Fer: Cyllid ar gyfer Ysgolion Cymru
Short Debate: Funding for Welsh Schools |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister

Dyranid Cyllideb Portffolio Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Budget Allocation to the Social Justice and Regeneration Portfolio

Q1 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget allocation to the social justice and regeneration portfolio? (OAQ35514)

C1 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y gyllideb a ddyfarnwyd i'r portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio? (OAQ35514)

Q6 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget allocation to the social justice portfolio? (OAQ35543)

C6 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y gyllideb a ddyfarnwyd i'r portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol? (OAQ35543)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): The social justice and regeneration departmental expenditure limit budget increases in 2004-05 by £23.6 million on the 2003-04 plans. This represents a 5.9 per cent rise, bringing the portfolio's total departmental expenditure limit to £423.4 million for 2004-05.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Bydd cyllideb terfyn gwariant adrannol ar gyfer cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yn cynyddu £23.6 miliwn yn 2004-05 o'i chymharu â chynlluniau 2003-04. Mae hyn yn gynydd o 5.9 y cant, sy'n dod â chyfanswm terfyn gwariant adrannol y portffolio i £423.4 miliwn ar gyfer 2004-05.

Jocelyn Davies: You will know that many voluntary organisations are active in social justice, and many say that they face extreme difficulty in planning for the future because their funding is not guaranteed. Will you and your colleague, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, consider if it is now time to indicate what funding will be made available to such groups in the longer term?

Jocelyn Davies: Fe wyddoch fod sawl mudiad gwirfoddol yn gweithio ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, a dywed llawer eu bod yn wynebu cryn anhawster i gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol gan nad yw eu harian wedi ei warantu. A wnewch chi a'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ystyried a yw'n bryd nodi yn awr pa arian fydd ar gael i grwpiau o'r fath yn y tymor hwy?

Sue Essex: That is an important point. The voluntary sector delivers a good service right across the range of the Assembly's work, not just in terms of the social justice portfolio. I have regular meetings with the voluntary sector, and in a meeting the week before last, we talked about this issue of long-term planning. The comprehensive spending review covers three-year tranches of funding, and we are looking to do the same in terms of base funding for local government. Working with Edwina Hart, who is responsible for the voluntary sector, we could consider giving more core funding to those sectors with

Sue Essex: Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn gwneud gwaith da ym mhob un o'r meysydd lle y mae gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldebau, nid dim ond yng nghyswllt portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Caf gyfarfodydd rheolaidd â'r sector gwirfoddol, ac mewn cyfarfod bythefnos yn ôl bu inni sôn am gynllunio hirdymor. Mae'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn cwmpasu cyllido ar gyfer tair blynedd, a disgwyliwn wneud yr un peth o ran arian sylfaenol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Gan weithio gydag Edwina Hart, sy'n gyfrifol am y sector gwirfoddol, gallem

which we know that we will work in partnership. We can work this issue through.

Mark Isherwood: What budget provision do you envisage, given that providing desperately needed affordable housing is the key to sustainable social and economic regeneration? Affordability is about people, not buildings. Assembly housing statistics show a 45 per cent budget cut for affordable housing, and a 19 per cent cut in funding for local authority housing since 1997.

Sue Essex: A budget planning round is in progress. One difficulty with affordability is that the situation changes over time, because rises in house prices that may be welcomed by some people make it more difficult for others to find decent accommodation. One issue that we are considering—which perhaps extends wider than affordability—is the quality of housing provision for the elderly. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, led by Janice Gregory, as Chair, has been considering this issue. Some of the issues to do with the affordability and appropriateness of housing provision could be dealt with by a more focused look at housing for the elderly, and particularly how it relates to healthcare. That could lead to the release of some larger accommodation, which perhaps poses problems for some elderly people.

Carl Sargeant: Will you work with your colleague, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, to ensure that all parts of the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003—which were opposed by opposition parties at Westminster—are implemented in Wales? Will you ensure that they are supported and appropriately funded by this Government?

Sue Essex: Much thought, effort and resources have gone into dealing with anti-social activity. To go back to the previous point, many elderly people feel threatened or vulnerable at home, which does not help with the aim of keeping people in their own homes and communities. Sometimes that has more

ystyried rhoi mwy o arian craidd i'r sectorau hynny y gwyddom y byddwn yn gweithio gyda hwy mewn partneriaeth. Gallwn weithredu ar y mater hwn.

Mark Isherwood: O gofio mai darparu tai fforddiadwy y mae eu hangen yn ddybryd yw'r allwedd i adfywio cymdeithasol ac economaidd cynaliadwy, a ddarpariaeth a ragwelwch o ran y gyllideb i'r perwyl hwnnw? Mae a wnelo fforddiadwyedd â phobl, nid ag adeiladau. Dengys ystadegau tai y Cynulliad doriad o 45 y cant yn y gyllideb ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, a thoriad o 19 y cant yn yr arian ar gyfer tai awdurdodau lleol ers 1997.

Sue Essex: Mae cylch cynllunio'r gyllideb ar waith. Un anhawster o ran fforddiadwyedd yw bod y sefyllfa yn newid dros amser, gan fod cynnydd mewn prisiau tai a groesewir efallai gan rai pobl yn ei gwneud yn anos i eraill ddod o hyd i lety safonol. Un mater a ystyriwn—sydd efallai yn mynd y tu hwnt i fforddiadwyedd—yw ansawdd y ddarpariaeth tai ar gyfer yr henoed. Bu'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, o dan arweiniad Janice Gregory, fel Cadeirydd, yn ystyried y mater hwn. Gellid ymdrin â rhai o'r materion o ran fforddiadwyedd a phriodoldeb y ddarpariaeth drwy edrych yn fanylach ar dai i'r henoed, yn arbennig yng nghyd-destun gofal iechyd. Gallai hynny arwain at ryddhau rhywfaint o adeiladau mwy o faint, sydd efallai yn achosi problemau i rai pobl oedrannus.

Carl Sargeant: A wnewch chi weithio gyda'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, i sicrhau bod pob rhan o Ddeddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003—a wrthwynebwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau yn San Steffan—yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru? A sicrhewch y cânt eu cefnogi a'u hariannu'n briodol gan y Llywodraeth hon?

Sue Essex: Rhoddwyd cryn ystyriaeth a gwnaed cryn ymdrech i ddelio â gweithgarwch gwrthgymdeithasol a neilltuwyd llawer o adnoddau iddo. Gan ddychwelyd i'r pwynt blaenorol, teimla llawer o bobl oedrannus o dan fygythiad neu'n ddiameddiffyn yn eu cartrefi, ac nid yw

to do with perception than fact. This is an important point that society as a whole must tackle—it is not just for government; it is about support for families and provision for youngsters. That way, we can attempt to unravel unacceptable anti-social behaviour.

Peter Black: Do you share my concern that the creation of a major repairs allowance, while welcome, has, in effect, cut the amount of money available for disabled facilities grants by about £40 million this year, with a potentially similar cut next year? As part of your budget review, will you target additional money at disabled facilities grants, given their importance in terms of tackling bedblocking?

Sue Essex: You raise an important point. It is not for me to pre-empt the budget review, but going back to the issue of allowing people to stay in their own homes, ensuring disabled access and provision for people as they become impaired—which will affect a majority of the population—is crucial. This is about avoiding bedblocking, and avoiding admitting people to hospital when they do not need to be admitted. Organisations like Care and Repair Cymru do good work in adapting people's homes before they become so infirm or ill that they have to be admitted to a dedicated medical facility. We must consider this point in the round with the issue of care for the elderly.

William Graham: Minister, may I press you on cross-cutting issues, particularly the issue of health and social services and sustainable development? Would you outline the financial guidance provided on accruing funding for such important cross-cutting issues?

Sue Essex: You may certainly press me on cross-cutting issues, which I speak about all the time because they are close to my heart. In the spending review and budget planning round we have identified a long, though not exhaustive, list of cross-cutting issues. The

hyn yn helpu'r nod o gadw pobl yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau eu hunain. Weithiau mae a wnelo hynny mwy â chanfyddiad na ffaith. Mae hyn yn bwynt pwysig y mae'n rhaid i gymdeithas gyfan fynd i'r afael ag ef—nid yw'n broblem lywodraethol yn unig; mae a wnelo â chefnogi teuluoedd ac ystyried anghenion pobl ifanc. Yn y ffordd honno, gallwn ymdrechu i ddatrys ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol annerbyniol.

Peter Black: Er y croesawyd y lwfans atgyweiriadau mawr, a rannwch fy mhryder fod creu'r lwfans mewn gwirionedd yn tynnu tua £40 miliwn oddi ar yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer grantiau cyfleusterau i'r anabl eleni, gyda thoriad tebyg o bosibl y flwyddyn nesaf? Fel rhan o'ch adolygiad o'r gyllideb, a dargedwch arian ychwanegol tuag at grantiau cyfleusterau i'r anabl, o gofio eu pwysigrwydd wrth fynd i'r afael â blocio gwelyau?

Sue Essex: Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Nid fy lle i yw achub y blaen ar yr adolygiad o'r gyllideb, ond gan ddychwelyd at y mater o adael i bobl aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, mae sicrhau mynediad i'r anabl a darpariaeth ar gyfer pobl wrth iddynt fynd yn fethedig—a fydd yn effeithio ar y mwyafrif o'r boblogaeth—yn hollbwysig. Mae a wnelo hyn ag osgoi blocio gwelyau, ac osgoi derbyn pobl i'r ysbyty yn ddiangen. Mae sefydliadau fel Care and Repair Cymru yn gwneud gwaith da wrth addasu cartrefi pobl cyn iddynt fynd mor eiddil neu sâl fel bod yn rhaid iddynt gael eu derbyn i gyfleuster meddygol penodedig. Rhaid inni ystyried y pwynt hwn yng nghyd-destun ehangach gofal i'r henoed.

William Graham: Weinidog, a allaf bwysio arnoch ar faterion trawsbynciol, yn arbennig mater iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a datblygu cynaliadwy? A wnewch chi amlinellu'r canllawiau ariannol a ddarparwyd ar gronni i'w wario ar faterion trawsbynciol pwysig o'r fath?

Sue Essex: Yn sicr, gallwch bwysio arnaf ar faterion trawsbynciol, y siaradaf amdanynt drwy'r amser gan eu bod yn agos at fy nghalon. Yn yr adolygiad o wariant a chylch cynllunio'r gyllideb, yr ydym wedi nodi rhestr hir, ond nid un cynhwysfawr, o

list could be much longer because so much of what we do has links with other areas. You have picked out an important issue—the relationship between health and local authority delivery of social care. It was a focus of attention in the Wanless review and in our incapacity grant which we gave earlier this year. It is a useful area on which to focus, as you said. We now have some good examples in Wales of innovative work in delivering this agenda. I will not mention any authorities at this time. It is often about process, working together and putting the customer first and not just about money, though money is important.

faterion trawsbynciol. Gallai'r rhestr fod yn hwy o lawer oherwydd mae cymaint o'r hyn a wnawn yn gysylltiedig â meysydd eraill. Yr ydych wedi codi pwynt pwysig—y berthynas rhwng iechyd a'r gofal cymdeithasol a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol. Rhoddwyd sylw i hyn yn adolygiad Wanless ac yn y grant analluogrwydd a roddasom yn gynharach eleni. Mae hwn yn faes defnyddiol i ganolbwyntio arno, fel y dywedasoch. Mae gennym rai enghreifftiau da yng Nghymru o weithio'n arloesol er mwyn cyflawni'r agenda hon. Ni soniaf am awdurdodau ar hyn o bryd. Mae a wnelo'n aml â phroses, cydweithio a rhoi'r cwsmer yn gyntaf, felly, er ei bwysigrwydd, nid arian yw'r unig beth pwysig.

Prosiectau Menter Cyllid Preifat Private Finance Initiative Projects

Q2 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on private finance initiative projects in Wales? (OAQ35500)

C2 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar brosiectau mentrau cyllid preifat yng Nghymru? (OAQ35500)

Sue Essex: There have been a number of PFI projects in Wales, including education, transport and health schemes. There are occasions when PFI represents the best way forward in terms of value for money. However, it is not free—like every other type of investment, PFI has to be paid for. It does not mean getting assets on the cheap. It is important to look at the capital infrastructure of Wales as a whole and identify the overall investment and maintenance needs, properly taking into account such issues as lifetime costs.

Sue Essex: Bu nifer o brosiectau menter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys cynlluniau addysg, trafniadaeth ac iechyd. Weithiau PFI yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen wrth geisio cael gwerth am arian. Fodd bynnag, nid yw am ddim—fel pob math arall o fuddsoddiad, rhaid talu amdano. Nid yw'n golygu cael asedau'n rhad. Mae'n bwysig edrych ar seilwaith cyfalaf Cymru yn gyffredinol a nodi'r buddsoddiad a'r anghenion cynhaliaeth cyffredinol, gan roi ystyriaeth briodol i faterion megis costau gydol oes.

Brynle Williams: As I said last week, Minister, I visited Argoed High School in Flintshire and met the headteacher. I saw at first hand the excellent educational opportunities which are available to the children, but I was appalled at the state of the school buildings. In light of your reply, what discussions have you had with other Ministers on using PFI funding for schools in Wales? I understand that only nine school projects have been proposed in Wales, compared with 500 across the border.

Brynle Williams: Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, Weinidog, ymwelais ag Ysgol Uwchradd Argoed yn sir y Fflint a chyfarfûm â'r pennaeth. Gwelais â'm llygaid fy hun y cyfleoedd addysgol rhagorol a roddir i'r plant, ond synnais at gyflwr adeiladau'r ysgol. O gofio eich ateb, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda Gweinidogion eraill ar ddefnyddio arian PFI ar gyfer ysgolion yng Nghymru? Deallaf mai dim ond naw prosiect ysgol a gynigiwyd yng Nghymru, tra bo cyfanswm o 500 wedi'i gynnig dros y ffin.

Sue Essex: To emphasise my earlier reply, PFI is just one method of procuring private investment. In the public sector we have

Sue Essex: I bwysleisio fy ateb cynharach, dim ond un dull o gaffael buddsoddiad preifat yw PFI. Yn y sector cyhoeddus yr ydym bob

always used private investment in all sorts of ways. You will recall that Jane Davidson, as the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, made a statement a few weeks ago about how we as the Government have come forward with an investment programme in school buildings. It is an important issue and all of us in our constituencies face it. There is a strong investment programme and our manifesto states how much money we will put in over time. There are good examples of new school buildings paid for using the traditional route, and of those that have been paid for using PFI. It is very much horses for courses.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): This morning in committee, the Minister for Health and Social Services was not able to tell me how much of the £550 million capital programme for improvements to NHS buildings would come from the private sector. Could you tell me?

Sue Essex: I did not attend this morning's meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee. We have made a commitment to that development. We will assess the best way forward in terms of value for money. There was an interesting article in one of the magazines published by the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy, which looked at the pros and cons of using PFI. You have to look at which procurement method, in terms of financing, would suit the project in hand. One of the interesting issues that this article brought out was the attention that PFI has focused on lifetime costing, which is inherent in PFI. Before we make our decision and monitor where the money goes, we need to look at the value of our assets. We have an investment strategy that ensures that we do not consider investment and new build at a particular time, but that we look at the lifetime use of the building and what that means in terms of further investment.

2.10 p.m.

Michael German: I agree that you should look at lifetime costs when considering PFI as one of the tools in the armoury in trying to

amser wedi defnyddio buddsoddiad preifat mewn nifer o ffyrdd. Byddwch yn cofio i Jane Davidson, fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, wneud datganiad ychydig wythnosau yn ôl ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ydym ni fel y Llywodraeth wedi datblygu rhaglen i fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgol. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig sydd wedi codi ym mhob etholaeth. Mae gennym raglen fuddsoddi gref a dywed ein maniffesto faint o arian a neilltuwn dros amser. Gwelwyd enghreifftiau da o adeiladau ysgol newydd y talwyd amdanynt drwy'r ffordd draddodiadol a thrwy ddefnyddio PFI.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Y bore yma yn y pwyllgor, nid oedd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gallu dweud wrthyf faint o'r rhaglen gyfalaf gwerth £550 miliwn ar gyfer gwelliannau i adeiladau'r GIG a fyddai'n dod o'r sector preifat. A allwch chi ddweud wrthyf?

Sue Essex: Nid oeddwn yn bresennol yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma. Yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i'r datblygiad hwnnw. Byddwn yn asesu'r ffordd orau ymlaen o ran gwerth am arian. Gwelais erthygl ddiddorol yn un o'r cylchgronau a gyhoeddir gan Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth, a oedd yn trafod manteision ac anfanteision defnyddio PFI. Rhaid ichi edrych ar ba ddull caffael, o ran ariannu, a fyddai'n gweddu i'r prosiect dan sylw. Un o'r materion diddorol a grybwyllwyd yn yr erthygl hon oedd y sylw y mae PFI wedi ei roi i gostau gydol oes, sy'n rhan hanfodol o PFI. Cyn inni wneud ein penderfyniad a monitro i ble yr aiff yr arian, mae angen inni edrych ar werth ein hasedau. Mae gennym strategaeth fuddsoddi sy'n sicrhau nad ydym yn ystyried buddsoddiad ac adeiladau newydd ar adeg benodol, ond ein bod yn edrych ar ddefnydd gydol oes yr adeilad a beth y mae hynny'n ei olygu o ran buddsoddiad pellach.

Michael German: Cytunaf y dylech edrych ar gostau gydol oes wrth ystyried PFI fel un adnodd y gellid ei ddefnyddio wrth geisio

repair school buildings and hospitals, and in building new hospitals. Do you think that it might be appropriate that, to add to that armoury of PFI or direct funding from the Welsh block, you have the power to borrow to invest, to ensure that we can deliver appropriate school buildings and hospitals, and the new hospitals that are demanded by Welsh patients?

Sue Essex: You know the restrictions as well as I do. We need to define the best route, and we have established a team to consider capital investments. The week before last I was in northern Ireland to look at a model of procurement, which we might take forward. I say 'might', because it is one idea. That model looks at partnership arrangements that build in an incentive for private sector involvement. There are many different models. I would be interested to hear your ideas, and you would be happy to write to me, I am sure. It is a matter of ensuring that, at the beginning, you consider the whole purpose of the project, its lifetime value and costs, and then make an assessment of the best possible vehicle to take it forward.

atgyweirio adeiladau ysgol ac ysbytai, ac wrth adeiladu ysbytai newydd. A gredwch y byddai'n briodol efallai, er mwyn ychwanegu at adnoddau PFI neu at arian uniongyrchol o floc Cymru, fod gennych y pŵer i fenthg i fuddsoddi, er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn ddarparu adeiladau ysgol ac ysbytai priodol, ynghyd â'r ysbytai newydd y mae cleifion Cymru yn galw amdanynt?

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn deall y cyfyngiadau gystal â minnau. Mae angen inni ddiffinio'r ffordd orau, ac yr ydym wedi sefydlu tîm i ystyried buddsoddiadau cyfalaf. Ymwelais â Gogledd Iwerddon bythefnos yn ôl i edrych ar fodel caffael, y byddwn yn ei ddatblygu efallai. Dywedaf 'efallai', oherwydd un syniad ydyw. Mae'r model hwnnw yn edrych ar drefniadau partneriaeth sy'n cynnwys cymhelliant i gynnwys y sector preifat. Mae sawl model gwahanol. Byddai diddordeb gennyf i glywed eich syniadau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn fodlon ysgrifennu ataf. Mater o sicrhau eich bod, ar y dechrau, yn ystyried diben y prosiect, ei werth gydol oes a'r costau, a gwneud asesiad wedyn o'r cyfrwng gorau posibl i'w ddatblygu.

Targedau Effeithlonrwydd Efficiency Targets

Q3 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on efficiency targets for spending departments within the Assembly? (OAQ35556)

Sue Essex: As part of our commitment to improving public services, we are actively looking at issues of efficiency, as well as effectiveness and making the best use of the Assembly's resources. We have set out our expectations on efficiency for this year with a number of our partners, such as local government, Assembly sponsored public bodies, and the NHS in Wales. I believe that we have to address efficiency in the context of effectiveness—they need to go together—particularly on the frontline of our public services.

Alun Cairns: The Welsh Assembly Government is spending around 40 per cent of its funding on health, a policy that every party was expected to support. However, given that waiting lists have increased 80 per

C3 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar dargedau effeithlonrwydd yr adrannau gwario yn y Cynulliad? (OAQ35556)

Sue Essex: Fel rhan o'n hymrwymiad i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yr ydym yn edrych ar faterion effeithlonrwydd, yn ogystal ag effeithiolrwydd a gwneud y defnydd gorau o adnoddau'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi nodi ein disgwyliadau o ran effeithlonrwydd eleni gyda nifer o'n partneriaid, megis llywodraeth leol, cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, a'r GIG yng Nghymru. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni ymdrin ag effeithlonrwydd yng nghyd-destun effeithiolrwydd—mae angen iddynt fynd law yn llaw—yn arbennig yn rheng flaen ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Alun Cairns: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwario tua 40 y cant o'i chyllid ar iechyd, sy'n bolisi yr oedd disgwyl i bob plaid ei gefnogi. Fodd bynnag, o gofio bod rhestrau aros wedi cynyddu 80 y cant ers

cent since 1999 and that bedblocking now costs £300,000 a day, when will the Minister conclude that her policies are not efficient and not working? People are paying the price for that lack of efficiency and the failure of those policies. When will you admit, Minister, that your policies are failing and that we need a new Minister for Health and Social Services?

Sue Essex: It is ridiculous for you to keep taking this line. It takes you nowhere politically, but that is your decision. Conservatives, as always, are good on price but not on value. We know that our investment in health and social services is delivering good results. That is not to say that the situation is perfect; we have never said that. Aspects still need detailed consideration, and that work is ongoing. Derek Wanless has identified what needs to be done. He came to committee and spoke about it, and the Wanless action plans have now been produced. That is all about securing efficiency and effectiveness in funding, and a quality product for the public.

1999 a bod blocio gwelyau yn costio £300,000 y dydd erbyn hyn, pryd y daw'r Gweinidog i'r casgliad nad yw ei pholisïau yn effeithlon ac nad ydynt yn gweithio? Mae pobl yn talu'r pris am y diffyg effeithlonrwydd hwnnw a methiant y polisïau hynny. Prid y cyfaddefwch, Weinidog, fod eich polisïau yn methu a bod angen Gweinidog newydd dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol arnom?

Sue Essex: Mae'n wirion ichi arddel y safbwynt hwn o hyd. Nid yw'n fanteisiol yn wleidyddol, ond eich penderfyniad chi yw hynny. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr bob amser yn dda gyda phrisiau ond nid gyda gwerth. Gwyddom fod ein buddsoddiad mewn iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn arwain at ganlyniadau da. Nid yw hynny'n golygu bod y sefyllfa'n berffaith; nid ydym erioed wedi dweud hynny. Mae angen ystyried rhai agweddau yn fanwl o hyd, ac mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn mynd rhagddo. Mae Derek Wanless wedi nodi'r hyn sydd angen i'w wneud. Daeth i'r pwyllgor a siarad amdano, a bellach cynhyrchwyd cynlluniau gweithredu Wanless. Mae a wnelo hyn i gyd â sicrhau effeithlonrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd cyllidol ac â chreu cynnyrch o ansawdd ar gyfer y cyhoedd.

Yr Adolygiad Cynhwysfawr o Wariant The Comprehensive Spending Review

C4 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gylch nesaf yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant? (OAQ35510)

Q4 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on the next round of the comprehensive spending review? (OAQ35510)

Sue Essex: I have been discussing with my Cabinet colleagues their spending pressures and priorities and the messages emerging from the evaluation exercise. This will be brought together with the budget planning process. I expect this work, together with the papers currently being worked up by committees, to help the Cabinet to formulate the draft budget.

Sue Essex: Bûm yn trafod y pwysau a'r blaenoriaethau cyllido gyda'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet ynghyd â'r negeseuon sy'n deillio o'r ymarfer gwerthuso. Caiff hyn ei ddwyn ynghyd gyda phroses cynllunio'r gyllideb. Disgwyliaf i'r gwaith hwn, ynghyd â'r papurau sy'n cael eu datblygu ar hyn o bryd gan y pwyllgorau, helpu'r Cabinet i lunio'r gyllideb ddrafft.

David Lloyd: A fydd arian cyfatebol yn cael ei sicrhau yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett, fel nad yw prosiectau Amcan 1 yn wynebu'r un problemau y maent wedi'u hwynebu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf?

David Lloyd: Will match funding be secured over and above the Barnett formula, so that Objective 1 projects do not face the problems that they have faced over the past few years?

Sue Essex: I do not know of evidence for the problems that you mention. We know that we have performed well on Objective 1, and that has been recognised by Europe, and, importantly, by people on the ground. I regularly meet people from the private sector and other bodies who feel positively about where we are going. It has always been the case that match funding is the priority of the developer—the person making the application. A small pot of money has been available for match funding over and above that where needed, and that system has worked well up until now.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Dywedasoch eich bod yn trafod gydag aelodau'r Cabinet. Cymeraf, felly, y buoch yn trafod ffioedd ychwanegol i fyfyrwyr gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Pa amcangyfrif yr ydych wedi'i wneud o'r gost o beidio â chodi ffioedd dysgu yn ystod 2006-07?

Sue Essex: That is part of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning's application in the budget planning round.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid dyna oedd y cwestiwn, Weinidog. Beth yw'r amcangyfrif? Yr ydych, yn amlwg, wedi amcangyfrif, oherwydd bod pob adran yn modelu'r posibiliadau o beidio â chodi'r ffioedd hyn. A ydych yn fodlon datgelu'r amcangyfrif hwnnw? Gwyddoch hyd yn oed os nad ydych yn codi ffioedd yn 2006-07, bydd myfyrwyr sy'n dechrau yn y coleg y flwyddyn honno hefyd yn gorfod cael eu hariannu yn 2007 a 2008, oherwydd byddant yn y coleg am o leiaf dair blynedd. Pam yr ydych mor amharod i ddweud wrthym beth yw'r amcangyfrif hwnnw, a pha addewid pellach y gallwch ei roi na chyflwynir ffioedd ar ôl 2007?

Sue Essex: You know as well as everybody else here what our pledge is. My answer is the same: it is up to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to put in an application for her budget priorities during this present consideration, and she is doing that.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Can you tell us what impact

Sue Essex: Ni wn am dystiolaeth o'r problemau a grybwyllwch. Gwyddom ein bod wedi perfformio'n dda o ran Amcan 1, a chydabuwyd hynny gan Ewrop, ac, yn hollbwysig, gan bobl ar lawr gwlad. Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â phobl o'r sector preifat a chyrrff eraill sy'n teimlo'n hyderus am y cyfeiriad yr ydym wedi ei ddewis. Bu'n wir erioed mai arian cyfatebol yw blaenoriaeth y datblygwr—y person sy'n gwneud y cais. Mae cronfa fach o arian wedi bod ar gael i'w hychwanegu at arian cyfatebol yn ôl yr angen, ac mae'r system honno wedi gweithio'n dda hyd yma.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): You say that you are in discussion with Cabinet members. I assume, therefore, that you have had discussions with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning on top-up fees for students. What estimate have you made of the cost of not introducing tuition fees during 2006-07?

Sue Essex: Mae hynny'n rhan o gais y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yng nghylch cynllunio'r gyllideb.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That was not the question, Minister. What is the estimate? You have obviously made an estimate, because every department models the possibilities of not introducing these fees. Are you willing to disclose that estimate? You know that even if you do not introduce fees in 2006-07, the students starting college during this year will also need to be funded for 2007 and 2008, as they will be in college for at least three years. Why are you so unwilling to tell us what that estimate is, and what further pledge can you give that fees will not be introduced after 2007?

Sue Essex: Fe wyddoch gystal ag unrhyw un arall yma beth yw ein haddewid. Mae fy ateb yr un peth: cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yw cyflwyno cais ar gyfer ei blaenoriaethau cyllidebol yn ystod yr ystyriaeth bresennol hon, ac mae'n gwneud hynny.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A allwch ddweud wrthym pa

the latest health service waiting list figures have on the comprehensive spending review? The figures have gone up by another 8,000 in just one month, a 12,000 increase on a year ago. That shows that, despite all the exultant crowing of last month, those figures were an aberration—not that they were brilliant—and we now see that waiting lists are yet again on an upward trend.

Sue Essex: As you know, Nick, the second offer scheme has been successful in dealing with waiting lists. I would not just look at the figures over one or two months, you have to consider the trend over time, and I would say that even if I were sitting where you are. We know that you have to look at trends in health demand.

My answer in terms of the budget for health is the same as that for the education budget: Ministers are making applications for funding according to their portfolio pressures, which will be considered along with everything else.

Nick Bourne: I am happy to consider the figures over time, which is why I made the comparison with the situation a year ago. The figures for the three-month, six-month, 12-month and 18-month out-patient waiting lists are up on last month and on a year ago, as are the three-month, six-month and 12-month in-patient waiting lists. We have looked at the waiting lists over time, and they have gone up remorselessly under this administration—under Jane Hutt and Rhodri Morgan. It is not just a question of looking at one month in isolation; that is what Jane Hutt wanted us to do last month. I repeat the question: what impact will this have on the comprehensive spending review? Is it just a question of money, or is it, as I strongly suspect—as, increasingly, do more and more people—a question of the policy and stewardship of Rhodri Morgan and Jane Hutt?

Sue Essex: When I said to look at the figures over time, I meant look at them in the future in terms of what the second offer—*[Interruption.]* Well, given that we have introduced the new policy of a second offer,

effaith y mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf ar restrau aros y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ei chael ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant? Mae'r ffigurau wedi codi 8,000 arall mewn un mis yn unig, cynnydd o 12,000 ers y llynedd. Mae hynny'n dangos, er gwaethaf yr holl ymffrostio gorfoleddus fis diwethaf, mai eithriad oedd y ffigurau hynny—er nad oeddent yn wych—a gwelwn yn awr fod y rhestrau aros yn codi eto.

Sue Essex: Fel y gwyddoch, Nick, bu cynllun yr ail gynnig yn llwyddiannus wrth ddelio â rhestrau aros. Ni fyddwn yn edrych ar y ffigurau dros fis neu ddau yn unig, rhaid ichi ystyried y duedd dros gyfnod hwy, a byddwn yn dweud hynny hyd yn oed pe bawn yn eistedd lle yr ydych chi yn eistedd. Gwyddom fod yn rhaid ichi edrych ar dueddiadau anghenion iechyd.

Mae fy ateb o ran y gyllideb ar gyfer iechyd yr un peth â'r ateb ar gyfer y gyllideb addysg: mae Gweinidogion yn gwneud ceisiadau am gyllid yn ôl anghenion eu portffolios, a chânt eu hystyried ynghyd â phopeth arall.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn fodlon ystyried y ffigurau dros gyfnod hwy, a dyna pam y gwneuthum y gymhariaeth â'r sefyllfa flwyddyn yn ôl. Mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer cleifion allanol sy'n aros tri mis, chwe mis, 12 mis a 18 mis wedi codi ers mis diwethaf, ac ers blwyddyn yn ôl, fel y mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer cleifion mewnol sy'n aros tri mis, chwe mis a 12 mis wedi codi. Yr ydym wedi edrych ar y rhestrau aros dros gyfnod hwy, ac maent wedi codi'n barhaus o dan y weinyddiaeth hon—o dan Jane Hutt a Rhodri Morgan. Nid mater o edrych ar un mis yn unig ydyw; dyna yr oedd Jane Hutt am inni ei wneud fis diwethaf. Ailadroddaf y cwestiwn: pa effaith a gaiff hyn ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant? Ai mater o arian yn unig ydyw, neu a ydyw, fel y tybiaf—ac fel y gwna mwy a mwy o bobl yn gynyddol—yn fater o bolisi a stiwardiaeth Rhodri Morgan a Jane Hutt?

Sue Essex: Pan soniais am edrych ar y ffigurau dros gyfnod hwy, yr oeddwn yn golygu edrych arnynt yn y dyfodol o ran yr hyn yr oedd yr ail gynnig—*[Torri ar draws.]* Wel, o gofio ein bod wedi cyflwyno'r polisi

we need to look at that over time. Derek Wanless made a combination of recommendations. He said that, although money was important, it was not everything, and other changes have to take place in the health service. Those changes are taking place, but you do not turn an oil tanker around in one go. We see many good statistics, but it does not cross your mind to mention those in Plenary. I agree with Jane that the direction in which the health service is going is the right one. We are making inroads in many areas, and it is a matter of turning that oil tanker around and ensuring that you go ahead with this. I do not know why you think that you have the right to criticise Jane and Rhodri; you have not come up with alternatives for improving the situation.

newydd o ail gynnig, mae angen inni edrych ar hynny dros gyfnod hwy. Gwnaeth Derek Wanless gyfuniad o argymhellion. Dywedodd, er bod arian yn bwysig, nad dyma oedd yr ystyriaeth bwysicaf, a rhaid i newidiadau eraill ddigwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r newidiadau hynny yn digwydd, ond ni allant gael eu cyflawni dros nos. Gwelwn lawer o ystadegau da, ond nid yw'n croesi eich meddwl i sôn amdanynt mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Cytunaf â Jane fod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Yr ydym yn cymryd camau breision mewn sawl maes, ac mae'n fater o weithredu mor gyflym ag sy'n bosibl a sicrhau bod y datblygu'n parhau. Ni wn pam y credwch fod gennych yr hawl i feirniadu Jane a Rhodri; nid ydych wedi cynnig ffyrdd amgen o wella'r sefyllfa.

Jenny Randerson: Have you discussed with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning the serious pressures on the schools budget? In Cardiff, and throughout Wales, strains are showing because of the hidden cuts. The grants for education support and training budget, now ironically renamed the better schools budget, was cut by 30 per cent. The General Teaching Council for Wales budget was cut from £5 million to £1.5 million and there have been cuts in the amount of money in Cardiff for the children of asylum seekers. These are all having a serious impact on schools in Cardiff and throughout Wales. Are you aware that in my constituency, and in Cardiff in general, those cuts are hitting the poorest areas hardest?

Jenny Randerson: A ydych wedi trafod y pwysau difrifol ar gyllideb ysgolion gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes? Yng Nghaerdydd, a ledled Cymru, mae'r straen yn dod i'r amlwg yn sgîl y toriadau cudd. Torrwyd 30 y cant oddi ar gyllideb grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant, a ailenwyd yn gyllideb ysgolion gwell yn eironig. Torrwyd cyllideb Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru o £5 miliwn i £1.5 miliwn a chwtogwyd ar y swm ar gyfer plant ceiswyr lloches yng Nghaerdydd. Mae hyn oll yn cael effaith ddifrifol ar ysgolion yng Nghaerdydd a ledled Cymru. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod y toriadau hynny, yn fy etholaeth i, ac yng Nghaerdydd yn gyffredinol, yn effeithio fwyaf ar yr ardaloedd tlotaf?

2.20 p.m.

Sue Essex: Going back to the debate that we had over the last budget, we said quite clearly then that GEST would not go on for ever. It was about looking at and trying out new initiatives, and mainstreaming those when it was felt that they were working. I do not know what you are talking about when you mention hidden cuts—the education sector got a good settlement this year, both in terms of the portfolio and the local government settlement, which majored on pay increases, threshold agreements, workload increases and pension funds. I have been involved in the issue of asylum seekers, and that is now

Sue Essex: Gan fynd yn ôl i'r ddadl a gawsom ynglŷn â'r gyllideb ddiwethaf, dywedasom yn eithaf clir bryd hynny na fyddai GCAH yn parhau am byth. Yr oedd a wnelo ag ystyried mentrau newydd a rhoi cynnig arnynt, ac yna eu prif ffrydio pan fyddem o'r farn eu bod yn gweithio. Ni wn am beth yr ydych yn sôn pan soniwch am doriadau cudd—cafodd y sector addysg setliad da eleni, o ran y portffolio a setliad llywodraeth leol, a ganolbwyntiodd ar godiadau cyflog, cytundebau trothwy, cynnydd yn y llwyth gwaith a chronfeydd pensiwn. Bùm yn gysylltiedig â mater

settled in Cardiff. There must have been a misunderstanding. From our looking at it, the money is available, in the education main expenditure group and through the revenue support grant. I can discuss this with you outside afterwards, if that would help.

ceiswyr lloches, ac mae hynny bellach wedi ei ddatrys yng Nghaerdydd. Rhaid bod camddealltwriaeth wedi bod. O'n safbwynt ni, mae'r arian ar gael, yn y prif grŵp gwariant addysg a drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw. Gallwn drafod hyn gyda chi y tu allan ar ôl y cyfarfod, pe bai hynny o gymorth.

Mynediad yr Anabl i Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad Disabled Access to the New Assembly Building

Q5 Mick Bates: What provisions have been made for access to the new Assembly building for people with disabilities? (OAQ35496)

C5 Mick Bates: Pa ddarpariaeth sydd i hwyluso mynediad pobl ag anableddau i adeilad newydd y Cynulliad? (OAQ35496)

Sue Essex: On the basis of recommendations by the access advisory group, several changes were made to the design, as it progressed, to enable better access. Those changes include having an additional lift installed at the front of the building for public access to the entrance, an enlarged public lift in the building to accommodate electric scooter types of vehicles, the installation of fire evacuation lifts at the rear of the building, and covered walkways from the disabled parking bays to the lifts at the front of the building.

Sue Essex: Ar sail yr argymhellion gan y grŵp cynghori ar fynediad, gwnaed sawl newid i'r cynllun, wrth iddo ddatblygu, i wella mynediad. Yr oedd y newidiadau hynny yn cynnwys gosod lifft ychwanegol ym mlaen yr adeilad ar gyfer mynediad cyhoeddus i'r fynedfa, lifft gyhoeddus fwy o faint yn yr adeilad gyda digon o le i gerbydau megis sgwter trydan, gosod lifftiau ar gyfer gwagio'r adeilad pe bai tân yng nghefn yr adeilad, a rhodfeydd dan do o'r cilfachau parcio i'r anabl i'r lifftiau ym mlaen yr adeilad.

Mick Bates: Thank you for that response—I am sure that we all share the aim of making this building an exemplar in terms of accessibility. However, have any changes been made to the Chamber design as a result of consultation with outside organisations?

Mick Bates: Diolch ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw—yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod oll yn rhannu'r nod o osod esiamp! o ran hygrychedd gyda'r adeilad hwn. Fodd bynnag, a wnaed unrhyw newidiadau i gynllun y Siambr o ganlyniad i ymgynghori â sefydliadau allanol?

Sue Essex: Yes. The Chamber design was altered—and you will remember some of the debates that we had here about this—to give access in relation to mobility, to about 70 per cent of the seats, including the Cabinet row. However, I will not hide the fact that there was an issue and a difference of opinion on that. It was the one area where there was not agreement between the access advisory group and ourselves, certainly in the policy steering group, in which we were both involved. The other important point is that the design is not only about the construction of the building and its design elements. It is also about the fittings and the finishes, which are of great importance to people with disabilities,

Sue Essex: Do. Newidiwyd cynllun y Siambr—ac fe gofiwch am rai o'r dadleuon a gawsom yma ynglŷn â hyn—i roi mynediad mewn perthynas â symudedd, i tua 70 y cant o'r seddau, gan gynnwys rhes y Cabinet. Fodd bynnag, ni chuddiaf y ffaith i hyn fod yn broblem a bod gwahaniaeth barn am hynny. Hwn oedd yr unig faes lle nad oedd cytundeb rhwng y grŵp cynghori ar fynediad a ninnau, yn sicr yn y grŵp llywio polisi, yr oedd y ddau ohonom yn gysylltiedig ag ef. Y pwynt pwysig arall yw nad yw'r dyluniad yn ymwneud â chodi'r adeilad a'i elfennau dylunio yn unig. Mae a wnelo hefyd â'r ffitiadau a'r gorffeniadau, sy'n hollbwysig i bobl ag anableddau, yn arbennig y rhai sydd

particularly those who are visually impaired. Work on considering the fitting out of the building is ongoing with the access advisory group. We do not want to take our eye off the ball on this one, because it is an important issue for people with disabilities.

Laura Anne Jones: Disabled voters are losing out according to a recent Polls Apart Cymru survey, which states that in the 2003 elections 77 per cent of the polling stations surveyed were inaccessible. One in six people in Wales are disabled and each disabled person has different needs. Do you agree that, with the local and European elections approaching—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I believe that this question is about the new building. [*Interruption.*] Order. I need no assistance from any other part of the Chamber in presiding over this or any other session. Your question is not really in order, Laura. If you can somehow relate it to the new building, even tangentially, I may be able to bring it back into order.

Laura Anne Jones: Our party would, of course, welcome any changes made to the new Assembly building to ensure that disabled people to have appropriate access, and that deaf and hard of hearing people have appropriate adaptations in the Chamber. I hope that, in future elections, you will consider adapting polling stations in this way.

Sue Essex: I will be generous and take those points on board. I can give you a list of what will be available in the new building, which includes hearing induction loops. It would have been useful had the Conservative Party made these points in steering group meetings. I pay tribute to my colleagues who sit on that group because it is bringing about the development of the building.

On access to polling stations, I have done a great deal of work with the Polls Apart Cymru group. Its work on highlighting this issue has been important because people have the basic right to cast their vote and to express their preference. We held a seminar

â nam ar eu golwg. Mae gwaith ar ystyried cyflenwi popeth ar gyfer yr adeilad yn mynd rhagddo gyda'r grŵp cynghori ar fynediad. Nid ydym am golli golwg ar hyn, gan ei fod yn fater pwysig i bobl ag anabledau.

Laura Anne Jones: Mae pleidleiswyr anabl ar eu colled yn ôl arolwg diweddar Etholiadau'n Eithrio Cymru, a nododd fod 77 y cant o'r gorsafoedd pleidleisio a arolygwyd yn etholiadau 2003 yn anhygyrch. Mae un o bob chwe pherson yng Nghymru yn anabl ac mae gan bob person anabl anghenion gwahanol. A gytunwch, gyda'r etholiadau lleol ac Ewropeaidd yn agosáu—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Credaf fod a wnelo'r cwestiwn hwn â'r adeilad newydd. [*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Nid oes angen cymorth arnaf o unrhyw ran arall o'r Siambr i lywyddu'r sesiwn hon nac unrhyw sesiwn arall. Nid yw eich cwestiwn mewn trefn a dweud y gwir, Laura. Os gallwch ei gysylltu rhywffordd â'r adeilad newydd, hyd yn oed yn ymylol, efallai y gallaf ddod â'r cwestiwn yn ôl mewn trefn.

Laura Anne Jones: Byddai ein plaid, wrth gwrs, yn croesawu unrhyw newidiadau a wneir i adeilad newydd y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod gan bobl anabl fynediad priodol, a bod addasiadau priodol yn cael eu gwneud yn y Siambr ar gyfer pobl fyddar a thrwm eu clyw. Gobeithiaf y byddwch, mewn etholiadau yn y dyfodol, yn ystyried addasu gorsafoedd pleidleisio fel hyn.

Sue Essex: Byddaf yn hael ac ystyriaf y pwyntiau hynny. Gallaf roi rhestr ichi o'r hyn a fydd ar gael yn yr adeilad newydd, sy'n cynnwys dolenni anwytho. Byddai wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol pe bai'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi gwneud y pwyntiau hyn yng nghyfarfodydd y grŵp llywio. Talaf deyrnged i'm cyd-Aelodau sy'n eistedd ar y grŵp hwnnw gan ei fod yn peri i ddatblygiad yr adeilad fynd rhagddo.

O ran mynediad i orsafoedd pleidleisio, yr wyf wedi gwneud llawer o waith gyda grŵp Etholiadau'n Eithrio Cymru. Bu ei waith ar amlygu'r mater hwn yn bwysig gan fod gan bobl yr hawl sylfaenol i bleidleisio ac i fynegi eu dewis. Cynhaliwyd seminar gennym yn

in Llandrindod Wells, which electoral registration officers from across Wales attended. I spoke at that seminar and we are strongly encouraging local authorities to make their polling stations and booths accessible. We are pushing that because I think, as you do, that all people, regardless of their abilities, should have the right to vote.

Llandrindod, a fynychwyd gan swyddogion cofrestru etholiadol o bob cwr o Gymru. Siaradais yn y seminar hwnnw ac yr ydym yn annog awdurdodau lleol yn gryf i wneud eu gorsafoddd pleidleisio a'u bythau pleidleisio yn hygyrch. Yr ydym yn hybu hynny oherwydd credaf, fel chithau, y dylai pob un, beth bynnag fo'i anabledd, gael yr hawl i bleidleisio.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister, for your earlier remarks.

Y Llywydd: Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich sylwadau cynharach.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Ffermydd sy'n Arallgyfeirio Farm Diversification

Q1 Christine Chapman: What action has the Minister taken to support farm diversification in Wales? (OAQ35470)

C1 Christine Chapman: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd i gefnogi ffermydd sy'n arallgyfeirio yng Nghymru? (OAQ35470)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Farming Connect, launched in September 2001, provides a complete service for farmers to assess their businesses and to take decisions on how best to take them forward.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Mae Cyswllt Ffermio, a lansiwyd ym mis Medi 2001, yn rhoi gwasanaeth cyflawn i ffermwyr asesu eu busnesau a gwneud penderfyniadau ar y ffordd orau o'u datblygu.

Christine Chapman: It is vital that the farming community is encouraged to participate in initiatives such as Farming Connect, which will increase their businesses and contribute to the growth of the local economy. What assurances can you give that the various agencies that support diversification projects are as proactive in urban areas, such as Cynon Valley, as they are in rural areas where there are many more farms?

Christine Chapman: Mae'n hollbwysig bod y gymuned ffermio yn cael ei hannog i gymryd rhan mewn mentrau megis Cyswllt Ffermio, a fydd yn cynyddu eu busnesau ac yn cyfrannu at dwf yr economi leol. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi bod yr asiantaethau amrywiol sy'n cefnogi prosiectau arallgyfeirio mor rhagweithiol mewn ardaloedd trefol megis Cwm Cynon, ag y maent mewn ardaloedd gwledig lle mae llawer mwy o ffermydd?

Carwyn Jones: Farming Connect is available to all. We seek to advertise it by ensuring that there are examples of good projects in *Gwlad*, the farming magazine, and via other methods, such as holding roadshows at agricultural events. We try to get the message out as widely as possible.

Carwyn Jones: Mae Cyswllt Ffermio ar gael i bawb. Ceisiwn ei hysbysebu drwy sicrhau bod enghreifftiau o brosiectau da yn *Gwlad*, y cylchgrawn ffermio, a drwy ddulliau eraill, megis cynnal sioeau ar daith mewn digwyddiadau amaethyddol. Ceisiwn gyfleu'r neges mor eang â phosibl.

Helen Mary Jones: Will you reconsider some of the recent changes to the Farming Connect criteria? You will be aware that

Helen Mary Jones: A ailystyriwch rai o'r newidiadau diweddar i feini prawf Cyswllt Ffermio? Fe wyddoch fod rhai busnesau

some farming businesses have been caught in that process having made diversification plans that they can no longer fulfil. I ask you to reconsider some individual cases, which I believe you undertook to do in February. Will you also review the overall impact of these changes? It has been strongly suggested to me that they are having a negative impact on the ability of some farmers, especially those outside Objective 1 areas, to diversify.

Carwyn Jones: The changes were made because it was becoming obvious that a great deal of grant funding was being spent on buildings, which was not necessarily the direction that we wanted to take. Without making any promises, I will reconsider the situation regarding individual cases. Few have been referred to me, but I will continue to review them.

Lorraine Barrett: While two Farming Connect grants were granted to improve dog kennels in breeding establishment, there are too many unwanted dogs in Wales. Will you ensure that no more grants will be given to dog breeding establishments?

Carwyn Jones: I have made it clear that while applications for Farming Connect grants are not usually referred to me, if there are any further applications by dog breeding establishments, they should be referred directly to me so that I can make a decision.

Brynle Williams: I have raised many issues lately regarding farm diversification grants. One which is troubling many of my constituents in north Wales—but I believe that it is a nationwide problem—is that some grants for converting farm buildings for holiday accommodation have been withdrawn. Can these be restored, because many people spend a great deal of money applying for planning permission and then find out that they cannot access grant aid?

2.30 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: I am not aware of any decision taken by the Government or by the Wales Tourist Board to withdraw grants previously issued to turn farm buildings into holiday accommodation.

ffermio wedi cael eu dal yn y broses honno ar ôl gwneud cynlluniau arallgyfeirio na allant eu cyflawni bellach. Gofynnaf ichi ailystyried rhai achosion unigol, yr addawsoch ei wneud, fe gredaf, ym mis Chwefror. A wnewch hefyd adolygu effaith gyffredinol y newidiadau hyn? Awgrymwyd yn gryf imi eu bod yn cael effaith negyddol ar allu rhai ffermwyr, yn enwedig y rhai y tu allan i ardaloedd Amcan 1, i arallgyfeirio.

Carwyn Jones: Gwnaed y newidiadau am ei fod yn dod yn amlwg bod llawer o'r arian grant yn cael ei wario ar adeiladau—nid y cyfeiriad o reidrwydd yr oeddem am iddynt fynd iddo. Heb wneud unrhyw addewidion, ailystyriaf y sefyllfa o ran achosion unigol. Dim ond ychydig a gyfeiriwyd ataf, ond parhaf i'w hadolygu.

Lorraine Barrett: Er i ddau grant Cyswllt Ffermio gael eu rhoi i wella cytiau cŵn mewn sefydliadau bridio, mae gormod o gŵn nad oes eu heisiau yng Nghymru. A roddwch sicrwydd na chaiff rhagor o grantiau eu rhoi i sefydliadau bridio cŵn?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi egluro, er na chyfeirir ceisiadau am grantiau Cyswllt Ffermio ataf fel arfer, os gwneir rhagor o geisiadau gan sefydliadau bridio cŵn, dylid eu cyfeirio'n uniongyrchol ataf fel y gallaf ddod i benderfyniad.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf wedi codi sawl mater yn ddiweddar o ran grantiau arallgyfeirio ar ffermydd. Un sy'n peri gofid i lawer o'm hetholwyr yn y Gogledd—ond credaf fod hyn yn broblem ledled y wlad—yw bod rhai grantiau ar gyfer troi adeiladau fferm yn llety gwyliau wedi cael eu tynnu'n ôl. A ellir adfer y rhain, oherwydd mae llawer o bobl yn gwario llawer o arian yn gwneud cais am ganiatâd cynllunio, ac yna'n darganfod na allant gael cymorth grant?

Carwyn Jones: Ni wn am unrhyw benderfyniad a wnaed gan y Llywodraeth neu gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru i dynnu'n ôl grantiau a roddwyd yn flaenorol i droi adeiladau fferm yn llety gwyliau.

Mick Bates: Hearing so many Labour Members praising Farming Connect is a tribute to this Liberal Democrat policy. It is a good system. Farm diversification takes many forms, and many farmers wish to undertake energy projects. However, the technical advice note 8 planning guidance notes remain unpublished, thereby preventing people from diversifying into energy projects. When will this important piece of planning legislation be available?

Carwyn Jones: It will be published in draft before the summer recess.

Mick Bates: Mae clywed cymaint o Aelodau Llafur yn canmol Cyswllt Ffermio yn deyrnged i'r polisi hwn gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae'n system dda. Mae sawl math o arallgyfeirio ar ffermydd, ac mae llawer o ffermwyr am ymgymryd â phrosiectau ynni. Fodd bynnag, erys canllawiau cynllunio nodyn cyngor technegol 8 heb eu cyhoeddi, sy'n atal pobl felly rhag arallgyfeirio i brosiectau ynni. Pryd y bydd y darn pwysig hwn o ddeddfwriaeth ar gael?

Carwyn Jones: Fe'u cyhoeddir ar ffurf ddrafft cyn toriad yr haf.

Sgiliau Amaethyddol yn y Gogledd Agricultural Skills in North Wales

Q2 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on agricultural skills in north Wales? (OAQ35491)

Carwyn Jones: Support for the development of agricultural skills in north Wales has been secured by Education and Learning Wales's decision to recognise Coleg Llysfasi as the lead provider of full-time level 3 agricultural provision in north Wales.

Mark Isherwood: Given that Llysfasi college has been designated a lead centre for agricultural development in north Wales, and that equivalent centres in England are resourced to meet needs until 2010, why is this not being followed through with additional resources that will allow the college to deliver? Should you not, therefore, take the funding for agri-food training out of ELWa's control in order for this area to be funded more strategically by your department?

Carwyn Jones: I am not aware that the college is claiming that it is suffering financially. A decision was taken to base level 3 courses at Llysfasi in north Wales and at Gelli Aur in south Wales, for which appropriate funding has been provided.

Sandy Mewies: As you know, Minister, the Welsh College of Horticulture in Northop is in my constituency of Delyn. The college teaches many rural skills and has a good reputation. May I pass on the college's invitation to you to visit the campus to see at

C2 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sgiliau amaethyddol yn y Gogledd? (OAQ35491)

Carwyn Jones: Mae cymorth i ddatblygu sgiliau amaethyddol yn y Gogledd wedi ei sicrhau gan benderfyniad Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru i gydnabod Coleg Llysfasi fel prif ddarparwr cyrsiau amaethyddol lefel 3 llawn amser y Gogledd.

Mark Isherwood: O gofio i Goleg Llysfasi gael ei ddynodi yn brif ganolfan ar gyfer datblygiad amaethyddol yn y Gogledd, a bod canolfannau cyfatebol yn Lloegr wedi cael adnoddau i ddiwallu anghenion tan 2010, pam na chaiff yr adnoddau ychwanegol a fydd yn galluogi'r coleg i wneud y gwaith eu dyrannu iddo? Oni ddylech, felly, fynd â'r arian ar gyfer hyfforddiant bwyd-amaeth oddi wrth ELWa er mwyn i'ch adran chi ariannu'r maes hwn yn fwy strategol?

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod y coleg yn haeru ei fod yn dioddef yn ariannol. Gwnaed penderfyniad i seilio cyrsiau lefel 3 yn Llysfasi yn y Gogledd ac yn y Gelli Aur yn y De, a darparwyd arian priodol ar eu cyfer.

Sandy Mewies: Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae Coleg Garddwriaeth Cymru yn Llanelwain yn fy etholaeth i, Delyn. Mae'r coleg yn addysgu llawer o sgiliau gwledig ac mae ganddo enw da. Ar ran y coleg, a allaf eich gwahodd i ymweld â'r campws i weld

first hand the wonderful work that it undertakes not only in teaching rural skills, but in the way that it has broadened its scope to, for example, take into account young people who are in danger of being excluded socially or educationally?

Carwyn Jones: I would very much like to visit the college, Sandy, and I look forward to receiving an invitation in due course.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ym mha ffordd y bydd penderfyniad i ddiraddio'r cyrsiau amaethyddol yng Ngholeg Glynllifon ger Caernarfon yn gwella sgiliau amaethyddol ieuencid y Gogledd-orllewin?

Carwyn Jones: Er mwyn sicrhau bod cyrsiau lefel 3 yn parhau i gael eu cynnig yn y Gogledd, rhaid cael nifer benodol o fyfyrwyr, neu'r màs critigol. Nid yw'n bosibl gwneud hyn ym mhob canolfan amaethyddol yn y Gogledd.

â'ch llygaid eich hun y gwaith ardderchog a wna nid yn unig wrth addysgu sgiliau gwledig, ond yn y ffordd y mae wedi ehangu ei gwmpas i ystyried pobl ifanc, er enghraifft, sydd mewn perygl o gael eu hallgáu yn gymdeithasol neu'n addysgol?

Carwyn Jones: Byddwn yn falch iawn o ymweld â'r coleg, Sandy, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael gwahoddiad maes o law.

Alun Ffred Jones: How will the decision to downgrade the agricultural courses at Coleg Glynllifon near Caernarfon improve the agricultural skills of young people in north-west Wales?

Carwyn Jones: In order to maintain the provision of level 3 courses in north Wales, a specific number of students, or the critical mass, is required. Achieving this number in every agricultural institution in north Wales is not possible.

Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus Keep Wales Tidy

Q3 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement concerning discussions he has held with Keep Wales Tidy? (OAQ35448)

Carwyn Jones: I met the chair of the Keep Wales Tidy board, and I took part in the unfurling of a Blue Flag award at Rest bay, Porthcawl, on 5 June 2003. I also helped to launch the Keep Wales Tidy website at last year's Royal Welsh Show.

William Graham: Keep Wales Tidy indicates that a local environment quality survey, which is sadly only undertaken in England at present, would allow for a more effective measurement of the progress made on tackling environmental issues. Would you introduce such a survey for Wales?

Carwyn Jones: Keep Wales Tidy has not raised this point with me, but if it wishes to provide me with details, I will consider it.

Catherine Thomas: I take this opportunity

C3 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y trafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gyda Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus? (OAQ35448)

Carwyn Jones: Cyfarfûm â chadeirydd bwrdd Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus, a chymerais ran yn achlysur cyflwyno Baner Las yn Rest Bay, Porthcawl, ar 5 Mehefin 2003. Bûm yn rhan hefyd o ddigwyddiad lansio gwefan Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus yn Sioe Amaethyddol Frenhinol Cymru y llynedd.

William Graham: Mae Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus yn nodi y byddai arolwg ansawdd o'r amgylchedd lleol, sydd, yn affodus, ond yn cael ei gynnal yn Lloegr ar hyn o bryd, yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i'r cynnydd a wneir wrth fynd i'r afael â materion amgylcheddol gael ei fesur yn fwy effeithiol. A fydddech yn cyflwyno arolwg o'r fath ar gyfer Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus wedi codi'r pwynt hwn gyda mi, ond os yw am roi manylion imi, gwnaf ei ystyried.

Catherine Thomas: Manteisiaf ar y cyfle

to praise the work of Keep Wales Tidy. The messages conveyed by the organisation, especially to young people, are important, encouraging them to respect their local environments and take responsibility for them. Will you join me in congratulating people in the Communities First areas of Felin-foel, Tyisha and Glan-y-môr in my constituency of Llanelli, who have undertaken environmental clean-ups that have benefited these communities by making them more attractive for everyone who lives there? Will you visit my constituency to meet these young people and to see their work at first hand?

Carwyn Jones: I accept that invitation, even though I am in danger of filling my diary between now and Christmas. It is important that such schemes succeed and are recognised as they involve young people in the work of cleaning their own environment as well as providing an educational aspect by raising awareness of the importance of the environment and ensuring a proper environmental balance.

Lorraine Barrett: Will you speak to your colleague, the Minister with responsibility for local government, to see how community councils like Llandough Community Council can campaign with the school and Keep Wales Tidy to keep their villages litter-free?

Carwyn Jones: I will certainly do that; it is an interesting point to raise with Keep Wales Tidy to see whether it has any good ideas on this.

hwn i ganmol gwaith Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus. Mae'r negeseuon a gyflëir gan y sefydliad, yn enwedig i bobl ifanc, yn bwysig, ac yn eu hannog i barchu eu hamgylchedd lleol a bod yn gyfrifol amdano. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch pobl yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Felin-foel, Tyisha a Glan-y-môr yn fy etholaeth i, Llanelli, a aeth ati i lanhau'r amgylchedd sydd wedi bod o fudd i'r cymunedau hyn drwy eu gwneud yn fwy atyniadol i bawb sy'n byw yno? A ymwelwch â'm hetholaeth i gwrdd â'r bobl ifanc hyn a gweld eu gwaith â'ch llygaid eich hun?

Carwyn Jones: Derbyniaf y gwahoddiad hwnnw, er fy mod mewn perygl yn awr o lenwi fy nyddiadur rhwng nawr a'r Nadolig. Mae'n bwysig bod cynlluniau o'r fath yn llwyddo ac yn cael eu cydnabod gan eu bod yn cynnwys pobl ifanc yn y gwaith o lanhau eu hamgylchedd eu hunain yn ogystal â'u haddysgu drwy godi ymwybyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd yr amgylchedd a sicrhau cydbwysedd amgylcheddol priodol.

Lorraine Barrett: A siaradwch â'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol, i weld sut y gall cynghorau cymuned fel Cyngor Cymuned Llandochau ymgysgu â'r ysgol a Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus i sicrhau nad oes sbwriel yn eu pentrefi?

Carwyn Jones: Yn sicr, gwnaf hynny; mae'n bwynt diddorol i'w godi gyda Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus i weld a oes ganddo unrhyw syniadau da ynglŷn â hyn.

Perchenogaeth Amhendant Tir yn y Cymoedd Land of Uncertain Ownership in the Valleys

Q4 Leighton Andrew: Will the Minister make a statement on plans to identify land of uncertain ownership in the Valleys? (OAQ35488)

Carwyn Jones: The land registry records the ownership of interest in registered land in England and Wales, but does not hold information about interest in unregistered land.

Leighton Andrews: You will be aware that

C4 Leighton Andrew: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynlluniau i glustnodi tir yn y Cymoedd nad yw'n glir pwy sy'n berchen arno? (OAQ35488)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r gofrestrfa tir yn cofnodi perchenogaeth buddiant mewn tir cofrestredig yng Nghymru a Lloegr, ond nid oes ganddi wybodaeth am fuddiant mewn tir anghofrestredig.

Leighton Andrews: Fe wyddoch fod hanes

there is a history of ransom strips in the Valleys, which often makes the identification of the ownership of land difficult. That causes great problems for residents, particularly in terms of clearing such land. Will you consider whether the powers available to local authorities in dealing with problems of rubbish on land of uncertain ownership are sufficiently drawn to allow them to take action where necessary?

Carwyn Jones: Local authorities can already take action—they can seek to determine the ownership of land, if they have cause to do so, under powers outlined in, for example, legislation on housing, planning or the environment. If an authority determines that the use or condition of a property, or land, is in breach of legislation, it has powers and obligations to take action in the first instance to require the owner to remedy the breach. If the owner cannot be traced, then the authority can enter the land and take whatever action it deems appropriate to deal with the problem.

Janet Davies: That was interesting. Will you report back to committee when you reach final decisions?

Carwyn Jones: As I said earlier, it is up to local authorities to ensure that they take control of their powers on these matters and move forward to deal with such problems on unregistered land in their areas. Therefore, it is a matter for local authorities.

lleiniau pridwerth yn y Cymoedd, sy'n aml yn ei gwneud yn anodd gwybod pwy sy'n berchen ar y tir. Mae hynny'n achosi problemau mawr i drigolion, yn arbennig o ran clirio tir o'r fath. A ystyriwch a yw'r pwerau sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol wrth ddelio â phroblemau sbwriel ar dir nad yw'n glir pwy sy'n berchen arno yn ddigonol i ganiatáu iddynt gymryd camau lle y bo angen?

Carwyn Jones: Gall awdurdodau lleol eisoes gymryd camau—gallant geisio penderfynu pwy sy'n berchen ar y tir, os oes rheswm da dros wneud hynny, o dan bwerau a amlinellwyd, er enghraifft, mewn deddfwriaeth ar dai, cynllunio neu'r amgylchedd. Os yw awdurdod yn penderfynu bod y defnydd a wneir o eiddo, neu dir, neu ei gyflwr, yn mynd yn groes i deddfwriaeth, mae pwerau a rhwymedigaethau ganddo i gymryd camau yn y lle cyntaf i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i'r perchennog unioni hynny. Os na ellir canfod y perchennog, yna gall yr awdurdod fynd ar y tir a chymryd y camau y tybia eu bod briodol i ddelio â'r broblem.

Janet Davies: Yr oedd hynny'n ddiddorol. A gyflwynwch adroddiad i'r pwyllgor pan fyddwch wedi gwneud y penderfyniadau terfynol?

Carwyn Jones: Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw sicrhau eu bod yn defnyddio eu pwerau ar y materion hyn ac yn gweithredu i ddelio â phroblemau o'r fath ar dir anghofrestredig yn eu hardaloedd. Felly, mater i awdurdodau lleol ydyw.

Polisïau Cynllunio Planning Policies

Q5 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister make a statement on planning policies in Wales? (OAQ35477)

Carwyn Jones: 'Planning Policy Wales' and 'Minerals Planning Policy Wales' set out the Assembly Government's land use planning policies in conjunction with technical advice notes.

Lisa Francis: According to the Town and

C5 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar bolisïau cynllunio yng Nghymru? (OAQ35477)

Carwyn Jones: Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' a 'Polisi Cynllunio Mwynau Cymru' yn nodi polisïau cynllunio defnydd tir Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyda nodiadau cyngor technegol.

Lisa Francis: Yn ôl Gorchymyn Cynllunio

Country Planning (General Development Procedure) Order 1995, not all planning and national park authorities in my area of mid and west Wales need take the trouble to inform objectors of planning applications about forthcoming site meetings, nor do they always inform objectors about modified or second applications at the same site or location. Following research, it would appear that many disparities exist, particularly regarding tetra masts. What is your view on these disparities and what will you do to improve the situation?

Carwyn Jones: Local authorities must obey all legal obligations placed on them. If they do not, they put themselves in the potential position of court action against them. I do not know of the examples that you raise, but you are welcome to write to me. Local authorities must follow the law and guidance issues from elsewhere.

Gwlad a Thref (Gweithdrefn Datblygu Cyffredinol) 1995, nid oes angen i bob awdurdod cynllunio ac awdurdod parc cenedlaethol yn fy ardal i yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin fynd i'r drafferth o hysbysu gwrthwynebwyr ceisiadau cynllunio am gyfarfodydd safle y bwriedir eu cynnal, ac nid ydynt ychwaith yn hysbysu gwrthwynebwyr bob tro am geisiadau diwygiedig neu ail geisiadau ar yr un safle neu leoliad. Yn dilyn ymchwil, ymddengys bod llawer o anghysonderau, yn arbennig o ran mastiau tetra. Beth yw eich barn am yr anghysonderau hyn a beth a wnewch i wella'r sefyllfa?

Carwyn Jones: Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ufuddhau i'r holl rwymedigaethau cyfreithiol a roddir arnynt. Os na wnânt hynny, gallant o bosibl wynebu achos llys yn eu herbyn. Ni wn am yr enghreifftiau a godwyd gennych, ond mae croeso ichi ysgrifennu ataf. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol weithredu'n unol â'r gyfraith a'r canllawiau a roddwyd gan eraill.

Fforwm Pobl Ifanc ar Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy The Young People's Forum on Sustainable Development

Q6 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on the value of the young people's forum on sustainable development? (OAQ35475)

Carwyn Jones: The Assembly Government actively supports the Welsh Youth Forum on Sustainable Development and is committed to engaging with young people on key issues that affect them. The forum was actively involved in the recent Network of Regional Governments for Sustainable Development conference in Cardiff. It organised its own workshop and participated in the events throughout the week. Its presence was valued and it contributed greatly to the event.

Val Lloyd: The forum will be pleased with your congratulations for its work. Do you also agree that by involving young people in such an important issue, we strengthen Wales's position globally and engage young people in the political process?

Carwyn Jones: I agree. It is exceptionally

C6 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar werth fforwm pobl ifanc ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy? (OAQ35475)

Carwyn Jones: Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gefnogol i Fforwm Ieuencid Cymru ar Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy ac yn ymrwymedig i ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc mewn materion allweddol sy'n effeithio arnynt. Bu'r fforwm yn gysylltiedig â chynhadledd ddiweddar y Rhwydwaith Llywodraethau Rhanbarthol ar gyfer Datblygu Cynaliadwy yng Nghaerdydd. Trefnodd ei weithdy ei hun a chymerodd ran yn y digwyddiadau drwy gydol yr wythnos. Gwerthfawrogwyd ei bresenoldeb a chyfrannodd yn helaeth at y digwyddiad.

Val Lloyd: Bydd y fforwm yn falch o glywed eich bod yn ei longyfarch ar ei waith. A gytunwch hefyd ein bod, drwy gynnwys pobl ifanc mewn mater mor bwysig, yn cryfhau sefyllfa Cymru yn y byd ac yn ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc yn y broses wleidyddol?

Carwyn Jones: Cytunaf. Mae'n bwysig iawn

important to realise that we can make a contribution to sustainable development and to climate change, not only in Wales, but globally. By engaging young people and getting them actively involved, we can pick up on some of their many good ideas so that we can hold our heads up high and say that we are doing our bit for sustainable development.

2.40 p.m.

David Davies: Will you tell me whether the youth forum discussed the outstanding contribution made to sustainable development by the British shooting industry? Will you also tell me whether, at the next meeting of the forum, representatives from the British Association for Shooting and Conservation will be invited to attend and put up an identical exhibition to the excellent one that they set up here today, complete with examples of game meat?

Carwyn Jones: You have misunderstood sustainable development. Nevertheless, you made your point clearly, knowing that members of the BASC are outside the Chamber and hopefully listening to you via a monitor. Sustainable development is about rather more than your understanding of it.

David Lloyd: Un mater yw safon a darpariaeth addysg i bobl ifanc yng nghydestun datblygu cynaliadwy, yn benodol felly, sut mae gwella'r ddarpariaeth addysg bresennol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a sut y gellir mesur unrhyw welliant?

Carwyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni sicrhau bod mwy o bobl ifanc yn rhan o'r fforwm. Yn ail, rhaid inni sicrhau bod enghreifftiau o ddatblygu cynaliadwy dros Gymru gyfan, er mwyn i bobl ifanc weld bod ffordd wahanol o fyw, sydd yn cynnwys pob agwedd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, o ran addysgu unigolion, rhaid sicrhau bod pobl yn gweld datblygu cynaliadwy fel rhywbeth sy'n berthnasol i'w bywydau, ac nid fel rhyw fath o gysyniad mewn llyfr.

sylweddoli y gallwn wneud cyfraniad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac i newid yn yr hinsawdd, nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond yn fyd-eang. Drwy ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc a'u cael i gymryd rhan, gallwn elwa ar rai o'u syniadau da niferus fel y gallwn ddal ein pennau yn uchel a dweud ein bod yn chwarae ein rhan dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

David Davies: A ddywedwch wrthyf a drafododd y fforwm ieuencid y cyfraniad aruthrol a wneir i ddatblygu cynaliadwy gan y diwydiant saethu ym Mhrydain? A ddywedwch wrthyf hefyd a gaiff cynrychiolwyr o Gymdeithas Saethu a Chadwraeth Prydain eu gwahodd i fynychu'r cyfarfod nesaf o'r fforwm, a chyflwyno arddangosfa debyg i'r un ragorol a gyflwynasant yma heddiw, ynghyd ag enghreifftiau o gig hela?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych wedi camdeall datblygu cynaliadwy. Serch hynny, bu ichi wneud eich pwynt yn glir, gan wybod bod aelodau'r gymdeithas y tu allan i'r Siambr a, gobeithiwch, yn gwrandao arnoch drwy gyfrwng monitor. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn golygu llawer mwy na'ch dealltwriaeth chi ohono.

David Lloyd: One issue is the quality and provision of sustainable development education for young people, therefore specifically, how can the current provision of sustainable development education be improved, and how can any improvement be measured?

Carwyn Jones: First, we must ensure that more young people are part of the forum. Secondly, we must ensure that there are examples of sustainable development throughout Wales, so that young people can see that there is an alternative way of life, which includes every aspect of sustainable development. However, with regard to educating individuals, we must ensure that people view sustainable development as something that is relevant to their lives, and not as some kind of concept in a book.

Cydfodolaeth Cnydau GM a Chnydau Eraill Co-existence of GM and Non-GM Crops

Q7 Eleanor Burnham: Will the Minister make a statement on organic and conventional crop co-existence with genetically modified crops? (OAQ35434)

C7 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar dyfu cnydau organig a chonfensiynol ochr yn ochr â chnydau a addaswyd yn enynnol? (OAQ35434)

Carwyn Jones: It is the established policy of the National Assembly for Wales to take the most restrictive approach to GM crop cultivation that is consistent with UK and EU legislation.

Carwyn Jones: Polisi sefydledig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yw cyfyngu ar dyfu cnydau GM cyhyd ag y bo hynny'n gyson â deddfwriaeth y DU a'r UE.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you agree that, given the evidence that co-existence is not an option on the prairies in a country as large as Canada, there is no possibility of it being feasible in a country as small as Wales?

Eleanor Burnham: A gytunwch, o gofio'r dystiolaeth nad yw cydfodolaeth yn opsiwn ar y peithiau mewn gwlad mor fawr â Chanada, nad yw'n bosibl iddi fod yn ymarferol mewn gwlad mor fach â Chymru?

Carwyn Jones: We are consulting on co-existence at present. You are welcome to contribute to that consultation.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar gydfodolaeth ar hyn o bryd. Mae croeso ichi gyfrannu at yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw.

Arllwysion o Garthffosydd Sewage Discharges

Q8 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on the steps that he is taking to ensure that all sewage discharges receive at least secondary treatment? (OAQ35483)

C8 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y camau y mae'n eu cymryd i sicrhau bod yr holl arllwysion o garthffosydd yn cael o leiaf driniaeth eilaidd? (OAQ35483)

Carwyn Jones: I publish guidance on, and approve, the environmental quality enhancement programmes of water companies in Wales. Approximately 96 per cent of Dŵr Cymru's sewage treatment works already provide secondary or higher levels of treatment to the flows they receive.

Carwyn Jones: Cyhoeddaf ganllawiau ar raglenni gwella ansawdd amgylcheddol cwmnïau dŵr yng Nghymru a'u cymeradwyo. Mae tua 96 y cant o weithfeydd trin carthion Dŵr Cymru eisoes yn rhoi triniaeth eilaidd neu lefelau uwch o driniaeth i'r llifau a dderbyniant.

Alun Cairns: Minister, it is interesting to hear about that guidance and that 96 per cent of what Dŵr Cymru discharges receives at least secondary treatment. However, that does not detract from the 98 locations in Wales where raw sewage is discharged, or where sewage only receives primary treatment. Is it not time that you introduced some positive policies to reduce that number?

Alun Cairns: Weinidog, mae'n ddiddorol clywed am y canllawiau hynny a bod 96 y cant o'r hyn y mae Dŵr Cymru yn ei arllwys yn cael triniaeth eilaidd o leiaf. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n tynnu oddi ar y 98 o leoliadau yng Nghymru lle yr arllwysir carthion heb eu trin, neu lle mae'r carthion ond yn cael triniaeth sylfaenol. Onid yw'n bryd ichi gyflwyno rhai polisiau cadarnhaol i leihau'r nifer hwnnw?

Carwyn Jones: Money must be found to do that, which is a factor in the guidance that I

Carwyn Jones: Rhaid dod o hyd i arian i wneud hynny, sy'n ffactor yn y canllawiau a

have provided with regard to water price rises. It is ultimately a matter for the water companies, which are responsible for sewerage infrastructure, and it is for them to make the necessary investment to ensure that as much sewage as possible is treated at higher levels.

roddais o ran cynnydd mewn prisiau dŵr. Yn y pen draw, mater i'r cwmnïau dŵr ydyw, gan mai hwn sy'n gyfrifol am seilwaith carthffosiaeth, ac am wneud y buddsoddiad angenrheidiol i sicrhau bod cymaint o garthion â phosibl yn cael eu trin ar lefelau uwch.

Datganiad ar Fenter Reoli'r Sector Cyhoeddus—Adroddiad Cynnydd Statement on the Public Sector Management Initiative—A Progress Report

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I am bringing a progress report before Plenary today on the public sector management initiative. I make this statement following our discussion in the Local Government and Public Service Committee last week, as I believe it would be helpful if I brought all Assembly Members up to date with the progress of this initiative. What is the public sector management initiative? The purpose of PSMI is to help create a stronger Welsh public service by improving the quality of public services for users, citizens and communities. The significant contribution of this initiative is in the increase in the capacity of public servants to deliver the kind of top-quality services that people in Wales have a right to expect. This initiative will build on the development programmes that organisations across the public sector already have for their staff, rather than duplicating them. In doing so, it will focus on a whole series of issues, improving the knowledge and understanding of public servants on how services work across the public sector and what they are there to achieve. It will also increase the ability of public service organisations and public servants to develop and deliver public services more effectively, facilitating the joint development and delivery of services between providers and the public whom they serve, and delivering the programme in a way that meets the expectations of stakeholders about diversity, bilingualism, social inclusion and sustainable development.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cyflwynaf adroddiad cynnydd ger bron y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw ar fenter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus. Gwnaf y datganiad hwn yn dilyn ein trafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yr wythnos diwethaf, gan fy mod o'r farn y byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe rhoddwn y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad am gynnydd y fenter hon. Beth yw menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus? Diben y fenter yw helpu i greu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus cryfach yng Nghymru drwy wella ansawdd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i ddefnyddwyr, dinasyddion a chymunedau. Cyfraniad arwyddocaol y fenter hon yw'r cynnydd yng ngallu gweision sifil i gyflwyno'r math o wasanaethau o'r radd flaenaf y mae gan bobl yng Nghymru yr hawl i'w disgwyl. Bydd y fenter hon yn adeiladu ar y rhaglenni datblygu a gynhelir eisoes gan sefydliadau ar draws y sector cyhoeddus ar gyfer eu staff, yn hytrach na'u dyblygu. Wrth wneud hynny, bydd yn canolbwyntio ar gyfres gyfan o faterion, gan wella gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth gweision sifil o'r ffordd y mae gwasanaethau'n gweithio, a'u nod, ar draws y sector cyhoeddus. Bydd hefyd yn cynyddu gallu sefydliadau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a gweision sifil i ddatblygu a chyflwyno gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn fwy effeithiol, gan hwyluso'r broses o ddatblygu a darparu gwasanaethau ar y cyd rhwng darparwyr a'r cyhoedd a wasanaethir ganddynt, a chyflwyno'r rhaglen mewn ffordd sy'n bodloni disgwyliadau rhanddeiliaid o ran amrywiaeth, dwyieithrwydd, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a datblygu cynaliadwy.

The reasons why we brought the public sector management initiative forward must be set in the wider context of our agenda for

Rhaid gosod y rhesymau pam y cyflwynwyd menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus gennym yng nghyd-destun ehangach ein hagenda i wella

improving public services. The First Minister has arranged a review of our approach to public service provision. This will include a review of the various actions that are already under way to make best use of our resources through responsive front-line and support services, and a scoping exercise of the possibilities for more effective collaboration between public bodies. The public sector management initiative is a key part of this improvement agenda. In order to deliver effective public services, we need public servants who are excellent leaders and good managers, and who are able to work together and thereby work effectively. That capacity now exists in Wales to a certain extent, but, as many of you will know, the evidence from the Wales programme for improvement that is operating through local government, and from the Wanless review and elsewhere, suggests that there is still some way to go. We need to raise our game.

Public-sector organisations have been invited to join the public sector management initiative, with a membership fee ranging from £2,000 to £12,000, depending on the size of the organisation. More than 35 organisations have joined to date. Securing a wide membership base across the public sector has been one of the key issues in building consensus and developing the initiative. I am delighted at the progress that has been made—more than half the local authorities and Assembly sponsored public bodies have joined so far. I place on record my thanks to the Welsh Local Government Association for the work that it has put in to secure local authority commitment across Wales. A number of other public sector organisations which operate in Wales have also joined, and a full list of members is being placed in the Library.

In terms of the health sector, we need to recognise that the NHS is going through major change, as are other parts of the public sector. Specifically, there is a need to implement the recommendations of the Wanless review, and the broader issues in 'Health Challenge Wales' and 'Wales: A Better Country'. Following consultation, Jane Hutt has agreed that the Centre for Health

gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi trefnu adolygiad o'n hymagwedd tuag at ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Bydd y broses yn cynnwys adolygiad o'r amrywiol gamau gweithredu sydd eisoes ar waith i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar ein hadnoddau drwy wasanaethau rheng flaen a gwasanaethau cymorth ymatebol, ac ymarfer cwmpasu o'r posibilidadau o ran cydweithredu mwy effeithiol rhwng cyrff cyhoeddus. Mae menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus yn rhan allweddol o'r agenda wella hon. Er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol, mae angen gweision sifil arnoch sy'n arweinwyr ardderchog ac yn rheolwyr da, ac sy'n gallu cydweithio a drwy hynny weithio'n effeithiol. Mae'r gallu hwnnw bellach yn bodoli yng Nghymru i ryw raddau, ond, fel y gwŷr sawl un ohonoch, awgryma'r dystiolaeth o raglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella sydd ar waith drwy lywodraeth leol, ac o adolygiad Wanless a lleoedd eraill, fod llawer i'w wneud o hyd. Mae angen inni wneud mwy o ymdrech.

Gwahoddwyd sefydliadau o'r sector cyhoeddus i ymuno â menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus, gyda'r ffi aelodaeth yn amrywio o £2,000 i £12,000, yn dibynnu ar faint y sefydliad. Mae mwy na 35 o sefydliadau wedi ymuno hyd yma. Sicrhau nifer fawr o aelodau ar draws y sector cyhoeddus oedd un o'r materion allweddol o ran meithrin consensws a datblygu'r fenter. Yr wyf wrth fy modd â'r cynnydd a wnaed—mae mwy na hanner yr awdurdodau lleol a'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad wedi ymuno hyd yma. Cofnodaf fy niolch i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru am y gwaith a wnaed ganddi i sicrhau ymrwymiad awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru. Mae nifer o sefydliadau eraill o'r sector cyhoeddus sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru wedi ymuno hefyd, a rhoddir rhestr lawn o'r aelodau yn y Llyfrgell.

O ran y sector iechyd, mae angen inni gydnabod bod newid mawr ar waith yn y GIG, felly hefyd yn rhannau eraill o'r sector cyhoeddus. Yn benodol, mae angen rhoi argymhellion adolygiad Wanless, a'r materion ehangach yn 'Her Iechyd Cymru' a 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' ar waith. Yn dilyn cyfnod ymgynghori, mae Jane Hutt wedi cytuno y dylai'r Ganolfan er Arweiniad

Leadership Wales and Innovations in Care should combine to form a new leadership and innovations agency for healthcare. The agency will work in partnership with the public sector management initiative to further the common objective of achieving excellence in our public services. The NHS will be in partnership with PSMI, via corporate membership through the agency. The agency, with PSMI, will develop a joint programme of activities designed to reflect the interface-working agenda, which will be offered across the public sector.

How is the public sector management initiative being taken forward? The current phase is intended to establish a strong consensus and focus on some initial activity. So far, a project board with cross-sector representation has been established to oversee its delivery, and, following a tender exercise, Warwick University has been commissioned to advise on the approach and programmes that should be delivered. In carrying out its research, it has drawn on leading practice throughout the UK and beyond—a copy of the report is being placed in the Library. A competency framework, setting out the characteristics of an effective leader or manager, has been developed to underpin PSMI, and is contained in the research report. A conference for chief executives, senior managers and focus groups around Wales has been held, as has the first PSMI workshop, with Professor Mark Moore of the Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University. An evaluation framework has been prepared in order to ensure a robust and independent evaluation of PSMI, and a range of programmes are under development.

We are designing a programme with short, medium and long-term objectives. In the current year, we expect PSMI to deliver action learning sets for senior managers, interactive workshops for senior managers with input from acknowledged experts, an interchange/secondment programme, and coaching and mentoring support. This should foster a rapid interchange of learning between participants in different levels of government, and in different public services, which is

mewn Iechyd i Gymru ac Arloesedd mewn Gofal gyfuno i ffurfio asiantaeth arweinyddiaeth ac arloesi newydd ym maes gofal iechyd. Bydd yr asiantaeth yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus i weithio at amcan cyffredin sef cyflawni rhagoriaeth yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Bydd y GIG mewn partneriaeth â'r fenter, drwy gyfrwng aelodaeth gorfforaethol drwy'r asiantaeth. Bydd yr asiantaeth, ar y cyd â'r fenter, yn datblygu cyd-raglen o weithgareddau wedi'i chynllunio i adlewyrchu'r agenda gweithio rhyngwyneb, a gynigir ar draws y sector cyhoeddus.

Sut y caiff menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus ei datblygu? Bwriad y cam cyffredol yw sefydlu consensws cryf a chanolbwyntio ar weithgareddau cychwynnol. Hyd yma, sefydlwyd bwrdd prosiect gyda chynrychiolaeth o bob rhan o'r sector i oruchwylio'r broses o'i chyflwyno, ac, yn dilyn ymarfer tendro, comisiynwyd Prifysgol Warwick i'n cynghori ar yr ymagwedd a'r rhaglenni y dylid eu cyflwyno. Wrth gynnal ei gwaith ymchwil, ystyriodd enghreifftiau o arferion blaenllaw ledled y DU a thu hwnt—rhoddir copi o'r adroddiad yn y Llyfrgell. Datblygwyd fframwaith cymhwysedd yn amlinellu nodweddion arweinydd neu reolwr effeithiol i ategu'r Fenter, ac mae wedi'i gynnwys fel rhan o'r adroddiad ymchwil. Cynhaliwyd cynhadledd i brif weithredwyr, uwch reolwyr a grwpiau ffocws ledled Cymru, ynghyd â gweithdy cyntaf y fenter, gyda'r Athro Mark Moore o'r Kennedy School of Government ym Mhrifysgol Harvard. Paratowyd fframwaith gwerthuso er mwyn sicrhau gwerthusiad cadarn ac annibynnol o'r Fenter, ac mae amrywiaeth o raglenni wrthi'n cael eu datblygu.

Yr ydym yn cynllunio rhaglen ag amcanion byrdymor, tymor canolig a hirdymor. Eleni, disgwyliwn i'r Fenter gyflwyno setiau dysgu gweithredu i uwch reolwyr, gweithdai rhyngweithiol i uwch reolwyr â mewnbwn gan arbenigwyr cydnabyddedig, rhaglen rhyngnewid/secondio, a chymorth hyfforddi a mentora. Dylai hyn arwain at gyfranogwyr ar lefelau gwahanol o lywodraeth ac mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwahanol yn dysgu'n gyflym oddi wrth ei gilydd, ac mae

important. In the medium term, we will work up a development programme for tomorrow's leaders, and elements of this may be accredited in due course. I will make an outline prospectus available to Members, setting out what will be delivered and by when.

In terms of where we are going with PSMI, the emphasis will be on building bridges across the public services, so that the different parts of the public sector work better together. That will very much benefit Wales, and I hope that you will endorse this scheme.

2.50 p.m.

David Lloyd: Thank you, Minister, for a comprehensive roundup of the public sector management initiative. We had an in-depth appraisal of this matter in committee last week, and we all welcomed the initiative. It has huge potential to increase the quality of public sector management and to develop a truly Welsh public service that allows, as we mentioned in committee, a free flow of managers and officials between the National Assembly, local government, the various quangos and health service bodies, in order to enhance leadership and management skills across the public service spectrum. We have just heard about that in your statement.

Naturally, some questions arise. As we saw from the brief for committee last week, health bodies have been reluctant to join, and, as I mentioned, with the arrival of 22 local health boards, many concerns have been expressed about the managerial and organisational capacity of local health boards to respond to the huge agenda now facing them. In that regard, it is disappointing that health bodies as a genre are not more actively involved in the active development of the public service management initiative. How will you address that situation?

Another issue with regard to the health service is that management and clinicians have occasionally and, some would say, traditionally, been at odds with one another, despite the recognition that the NHS needs

hynny'n bwysig. Yn y tymor canolig, byddwn yn llunio rhaglen ddatblygu ar gyfer arweinwyr y dyfodol, ac o bosibl, caiff elfennau o'r rhaglen hon eu hachredu maes o law. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod prospectws amlinellol ar gael i Aelodau, a fydd yn nodi'r hyn a gyflwynir ac erbyn pryd.

O ran datblygu'r Fenter, bydd y pwyslais ar adeiladu pontydd ar draws y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, er mwyn i wahanol rannau'r sector cyhoeddus gydweithio'n well. Bydd hynny'n fuddiol iawn i Gymru, a gobeithiaf y cymeradwywch y cynllun hwn.

David Lloyd: Diolch, Weinidog, am grynodedd cynhwysfawr o fenter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus. Cynhaliwyd arfarniad manwl gennym o'r mater hwn yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, ac yr oedd pob un ohonom yn croesawu'r fenter. Mae ganddi botensial enfawr i wella ansawdd rheolaeth o fewn y sector cyhoeddus ac i ddatblygu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus gwirioneddol. Gymreig sy'n caniatáu, fel y bu inni sôn yn y pwyllgor, i reolwyr a swyddogion symud yn hwylus rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, llywodraeth leol, yr amrywiol gwangos a chyrrff y gwasanaeth iechyd, er mwyn gwella sgiliau arwain a rheoli ar draws y rhydwant o wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr ydym newydd glywed am hynny yn eich datganiad.

Yn naturiol, cyfyd rhai cwestiynau. Fel y gwelwch o'r briff a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, bu cyrrff iechyd yn amharod i ymuno, ac, fel y soniais, gyda dyfodiad 22 o fyrddau iechyd lleol, mynegwyd llawer o bryderon am allu rheoli a threfnu byrddau iechyd lleol i ymateb i'r agenda enfawr sydd yn awr yn eu hwynebu. Yn hynny o beth, mae'n siomedig nad yw cyrrff iechyd fel genre yn cymryd rhan fwy gweithgar wrth ddatblygu menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus. Sut y byddwch yn ymdrin â'r sefyllfa honno?

Mater arall o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd yw bod gwrthdaro wedi bod rhwng rheolwyr a chlinigwyr o bryd i'w gilydd, a byddai rhai yn dweud, yn draddodiadol, er y cydnabyddir bod angen rheolwyr o ansawdd uchel ar y

high-quality management. I understood totally Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey's argument last week that non-clinical managers work just as well as, if not better than, clinical ones. However, one solution to the traditional dichotomy between clinicians and management would be to have managers with dual qualifications, that is, both managerial and clinical, whether the latter is nursing or medical. Can dual qualification be accommodated under this initiative?

Building on that, this is a free flow of increasing expertise between the Assembly, local government, quangos and the health service, and officials will, hopefully, gather specialised knowledge along the way, from health and economic development in particular, and spread it into the various arms of the Welsh civil service. Can you foresee, Minister, this public service management initiative becoming a mechanism to eventually dismantle the quangos?

Sue Essex: Thank you, Dai. I have now learned a new collective noun for health trusts and health boards—a 'genre' of health trusts. I shall occasionally drop that into my conversation.

I said in committee that I was to hold a meeting with Jane Hutt on ensuring closer involvement, and I am pleased to say that that has been recognised, and that there is a commitment to closer involvement, in the joint working that we will put in place. It is important to stress that this initiative is not meant to replace other areas of work—last week, for example, we mentioned Syniad's work in local government. This initiative is very much a response to our agenda in Wales. William mentioned cross-cutting issues during questions, and this initiative reflects the need for integration across the public sector in Wales. It is also intended to address the issue of the capacity to deliver effective management and leadership. That said, there is, obviously, a different requirement for clinicians, who come from a different background and have a different training approach from managers and, perhaps, sometimes a different cultural approach. I will talk further with Jane about this matter, as I think that there are

GIG. Deallaf yn llwyr ddadl Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey yr wythnos diwethaf bod rheolwyr nad ydynt yn glinigwyr yn gweithio llawn cystal, os nad yn well, na rheolwyr sy'n glinigwyr. Fodd bynnag, un ateb i'r ddeuliaeth draddodiadol rhwng clinigwyr a rheolwyr fyddai penodi rheolwyr â chymwysterau deuol, hynny yw, cymwysterau rheoli a chlinigol, pa un a fyddai'r cymwysterau clinigol ym maes nyrzio neu faes meddygol. A ellir cynnwys cymhwyster deuol fel rhan o'r fenter hon?

Yn ategu hynny, mae arbenigedd cynyddol yn llifo rhwng y Cynulliad, llywodraeth leol, cwangos a'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a bydd swyddogion, gobeithio, yn casglu gwybodaeth arbenigol ar hyd y ffordd, ym maes iechyd a datblygu economaidd yn benodol, ac yn ei rhannu ymhlith amrywiol ganghennau'r gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru. A allwch ragweld, Weinidog, y daw'r fenter reoli'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus hon yn ffordd o ddiddymu'r cwangos yn y pen draw?

Sue Essex: Diolch, Dai. Yr wyf yn awr wedi dysgu enw torfol newydd ar gyfer ymddiriedolaethau iechyd a byrddau iechyd—'genre' o ymddiriedolaethau iechyd. Fe'i defnyddiaf o bryd i'w gilydd.

Dywedais yn y pwyllgor fy mod yn bwriadu cynnal cyfarfod gyda Jane Hutt i drafod y broses o sicrhau perthynas agosach, ac yr wyf yn falch o allu dweud bod hynny wedi'i gydnabod, a bod ymrwymiad i sicrhau perthynas agosach, yn y prosesau cydweithio y byddwn yn eu rhoi ar waith. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio na fwriedir i'r fenter hon ddisodli meysydd gwaith eraill—yr wythnos diwethaf, er enghraifft, bu inni sôn am waith Syniad ym maes llywodraeth leol. Ymateb i'n hagenda yng Nghymru yw'r fenter hon i raddau helaeth. Bu i William sôn am faterion trawsbynciol yn ystod cwestiynau, ac mae'r fenter hon yn adlewyrchu'r angen i integreiddio ar draws y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Bwriedir hefyd iddi ymdrin â'r gallu i gyflwyno rheolaeth ac arweinyddiaeth effeithiol. Wedi dweud hynny, yn amlwg, mae gofyniad gwahanol i glinigwyr, sy'n dod o wahanol gefndir a chanddynt ymagwedd wahanol tuag at hyfforddi o'u cymharu â rheolwyr ac, efallai, ymagwedd ddiwylliannol wahanol weithiau. Byddaf yn

advantages in terms of that cross-play. Clinicians need to understand the issues of management, and managers need to understand clinicians' issues, in order to get a greater understanding of what can and cannot be done. I would not go as far as you did in saying that this is a must. My colleague Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey has done a wonderful job as a health manager, and she made a forceful argument in committee as to why she believed that it should be the way that it is. I want to leave this at present to common sense and trying to get that greater understanding and relationship.

On developing specialists and how knowledge might be exchanged, we are not trying to turn any of these managers into, for example, Welsh Development Agency experts by sitting them alongside somebody who works in the WDA, or vice versa. We are trying to get a cohort—perhaps a generation—of people in Wales who feel comfortable working in the public sector and who feel that they can make valuable careers in the sector. It is important that we value public sector workers, and this sends out a strong message about that. Whether staff come from Assembly sponsored public bodies, health trusts, or local government, they should feel equipped to deliver. This is a mature and sophisticated agenda for the future of Wales, in which I think all Members share.

Laura Anne Jones: While we welcome this scheme, I am confused as to why we are having a re-run of what we discussed in committee last week. Your statement does not seem to contain anything new. We welcome the development of the public sector management initiative if it will create a stronger public sector in Wales and significantly improve the quality and provision of public services, improving joint working and developing joint approaches to common issues across those services. However, we must turn our words into actions. Are you concerned that only a small number of health organisations have joined the PSMI? How successful do you believe

trafod y mater hwn ymhellach gyda Jane, a chredaf fod manteision o ran y rhyngweithio hwnnw. Mae angen i glinigwyr ddeall materion rheoli, ac mae angen i reolwyr ddeall materion clinigol, er mwyn meithrin gwell dealltwriaeth o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud a'r hyn na ellir ei wneud. Ni fyddwn yn mynd mor bell â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh chi, sef bod hyn yn angenrheidiol. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey wedi gwneud gwaith ardderchog fel rheolwr iechyd, a chyflwynodd ddadl rymus yn y pwyllgor ar pam mai dyma sut y dylai fod, yn ei barn hi. Yn fy marn i, dylid arddel synnwyr cyffredin yn hyn o beth a cheisio sicrhau'r ddealltwriaeth a'r gydberthynas well honno.

O ran datblygu arbenigwyr a sut y gellid cyfnewid gwybodaeth, nid ydym yn ceisio troi unrhyw rai o'r rheolwyr hyn, er enghraifft, yn arbenigwyr ar Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru drwy eu rhoi i eistedd wrth ymyl rhywun sy'n gweithio yn y WDA, neu i'r gwrthwyneb. Yr ydym yn ceisio sefydlu carfan—cenedlaeth efallai—o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n teimlo'n gyfforddus yn gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus ac sy'n teimlo y gallant gael gyrfaoedd gwerthfawr yn y sector. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi gweithwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac mae hyn yn cyfleu neges gref yn hynny o beth. Dylai staff deimlo eu bod yn gallu cyflawni, pa un a ydynt yn gweithio o fewn cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, ymddiriedolaethau iechyd, neu lywodraeth leol. Mae hon yn agenda aeddfed a soffistigedig ar gyfer dyfodol Cymru, y mae i bob Aelod, fe gredaf, ran ynddi.

Laura Anne Jones: Er ein bod yn croesawu'r cynllun hwn, nid wyf yn deall pam ein bod yn ailrafod yr hyn a drafodwyd gennym yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf. Nid ymddengys bod unrhyw beth newydd yn eich datganiad. Croesawn ddatblygiad menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus os bydd yn creu sector cyhoeddus cryfach yng Nghymru ac yn gwella'n sylweddol y ddarpariaeth o ran gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a'u hansawdd, yn gwella prosesau cydweithio ac yn datblygu ymagweddau ar y cyd tuag at faterion cyffredin ar draws y gwasanaethau hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni droi ein geiriau yn weithredoedd. A ydych yn pryderu mai dim ond nifer fach o'r sefydliadau iechyd sydd

that the initiative will be in improving the capacity and effectiveness of public leadership, management and governance in Wales at all levels of government and across the spectrum of public services? Would you consider making the PSMI compulsory where it is most needed, in order to make it work throughout Wales?

I was concerned that the national health service has highlighted the need to enhance the leadership and management skills of senior managers, and, therefore, wondered why the NHS was excluded from the projected income figures for 2004-05. Will you assure us that the scheme will be delivered in a way that meets the expectations of stakeholders with regard to diversity, bilingualism, social inclusion and sustainable development?

Do you agree with the Director-General of the Audit Commission who questioned whether the Wales programme for improvement is strong and external enough to ensure that weaknesses or failures in managerial or political leadership will be addressed, as highlighted by the employment tribunal judgment in favour of Flintshire council's internal audit manager?

Sue Essex: You asked why we are doing this now, and you said that my statement contained nothing new, but there is something new: my point on the NHS and my discussions with Jane following the committee meeting last week. Given the number of people sitting in the public gallery today, it is justified that we take discussion of this initiative outside the committee and spread it around so that people across the sector know about it, because it also applies to culture, social justice, the environment, and so on. People working in these areas will be part of this initiative. Therefore, I make no apology for giving a statement; it is useful and I think that those in the public gallery will welcome it.

On turning words into action, people must learn and put what they learn into practice. We have an issue regarding leadership and

wedi ymuno â'r fenter? Pa mor llwyddiannus fydd y fenter, yn eich barn chi, wrth wella gallu ac effeithiolrwydd arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar bob lefel o lywodraeth ac ar draws rhychwant gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? A fydddech yn ystyried gwneud y fenter yn orfodol lle y mae ei hangen fwyaf, er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn llwyddo ledled Cymru?

Yr oeddwn yn pryderu bod y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol wedi amlygu'r angen i wella sgiliau arwain a rheoli uwch reolwyr, ac felly, yn meddwl tybed pam nad oedd y GIG wedi'i gynnwys yn y ffigurau incwm amcanol ar gyfer 2004-05. A allwch ein sicrhau y caiff y cynllun ei gyflwyno mewn ffordd sy'n bodloni disgwyliadau rhanddeiliaid o ran amrywiaeth, dwyieithrwydd, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a datblygu cynaliadwy?

A gytunwch gyda Chyfarwyddwr Cyffredinol y Comisiwn Archwilio a ofynnodd pa un a yw rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella yn ddigon cadarn ac allanol i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â gwendidau neu fethiannau o ran arweinyddiaeth reoli neu wleidyddol, fel yr amlygwyd gan ddyfarniad y tribiwnlys cyflogaeth o blaid rheolwr archwilio mewnol cyngor sir y Fflint?

Sue Essex: Bu ichi ofyn pam ein bod yn gwneud hyn yn awr, a dywedasoch nad oedd fy natganiad yn cynnwys unrhyw beth newydd, ond mae rhywbeth newydd: fy mhwynt ar y GIG a'm trafodaethau gyda Jane ar ôl cyfarfod y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf. O ystyried nifer y bobl sy'n eistedd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus heddiw, mae'n briodol ein bod yn trafod y fenter hon y tu allan i'r pwyllgor ac yn lledaenu'r neges er mwyn i bobl o bob rhan o'r sector ddod i wybod amdani, gan ei bod hefyd yn berthnasol i ddiwylliant, cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, yr amgylchedd, ac yn y blaen. Bydd pobl sy'n gweithio yn y meysydd hyn yn rhan o'r fenter hon. Felly, nid ymddiheuraf am roi datganiad; mae'n ddefnyddiol a bydd y rheini yn yr oriel gyhoeddus, yn fy marn i, yn ei groesawu.

O ran troi geiriau yn weithredoedd, rhaid i bobl ddysgu gan roi'r hyn a ddysgant ar waith. Mae gennym broblem o ran y gallu i

management capacity, and a lack of many skills. The Welsh programme for improvement has identified one of the big weaknesses, namely the lack of leadership and management ability. One way to address that is to sit on your hands and doing nothing, but the second, and better, way to address it is to ask, 'What can we do, jointly, across Wales to try to support that change?' Also, importantly—and I want to stress this—the initiative is looking forward to those managers and leaders who will come through the system. My experience in local government has shown me that, as well as giving support to those who are already in the senior leadership echelons of the public sector, you need to be able to support and encourage the next round of managers and leaders who are coming through, particularly if you are to get it right across the board and encourage women and others to come in. Therefore, I hope that that will be part of PSMI. It is in addition, as I say, to the training work that is done by other organisations.

3.00 p.m.

On whether this should be compulsory or voluntary, at present we are going for consensus. We believe that other organisations will join. When you set up a new organisation, it is unlikely that you will have 100 per cent membership from day one—it does not happen like that. People come on board as and when they see that it is delivering. I spoke at the first meeting, when this was launched to a full group of people. Before then we had very few members, but afterwards many organisations were sufficiently enthused to come on board and sign up. Over half the organisations have joined. In time, certainly after the local government elections, another tranche of local government will come in.

Bilingualism and social inclusion are the values of Wales, and they are certainly the values of this Government. We want to see a public sector in Wales—I do not want to use the word 'indoctrination'; but we want a sector that understands and empathises with the values inherent in Wales. Some of you might think that a good bit of old-fashioned indoctrination does wonders now and again,

arwain a rheoli, a phrinder sgiliau mewn sawl maes. Mae rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella wedi nodi un o'r gwendidau mawr, sef diffyg gallu i arwain a rheoli. Un ffordd o ymdrin â hynny yw llaesu dwylo a gwneud dim, ond yr ail ffordd, a'r ffordd well, yw gofyn, 'Beth y gallwn ei wneud, gyda'n gilydd, ledled Cymru i geisio cefnogi'r newid hwnnw?' Hefyd, yn bwysig—ac yr wyf am bwysleisio hyn—mae'r fenter yn edrych ymlaen at y rheolwyr a'r arweinwyr hynny a ddaw drwy'r system. Yn ôl fy mhrofiad ym maes llywodraeth leol, yn ogystal â rhoi cefnogaeth i'r rheini sydd eisoes yn gweithio fel uwch arweinwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus, mae angen i chi allu cefnogi ac annog y garfan nesaf o reolwyr ac arweinwyr ymhlith y to sy'n codi, yn arbennig er mwyn llwyddo ym mhob maes ac annog menywod ac eraill i ymuno Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd hynny yn rhan o'r fenter. Mae hyn, fel y dywedais, yn ategu'r gwaith hyfforddi a wneir gan sefydliadau eraill.

O ran pa un a ddylai'r fenter fod yn orfodol neu'n wirfoddol, ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn ceisio consensws. Credwn y bydd sefydliadau eraill yn ymuno. Wrth sefydlu sefydliad newydd, mae'n annhebygol y cewch aelodaeth o 100 y cant o'r cychwyn—nid felly y mae. Bydd pobl yn ymuno ar ôl gweld bod y sefydliad yn llwyddo. Yn y cyfarfod cyntaf, adeg lansio'r fenter, siaradais â grŵp llawn o bobl. Cyn hynny, prin iawn oedd nifer yr aelodau, ond ar ôl hynny ysgogwyd sawl sefydliad i ymuno â'r fenter. Mae dros hanner y sefydliadau wedi ymuno. Ymhen amser, yn sicr ar ôl yr etholiadau llywodraeth leol, bydd haen arall o lywodraeth leol yn ymuno â'r fenter.

Dwyieithrwydd a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol yw gwerthoedd Cymru, ac yn sicr mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn arddel y gwerthoedd hynny. Yr ydym am weld sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru—nid wyf am ddweud ein bod yn gwthio syniadau; ond yr ydym am weld sector sy'n deall ac yn uniaethu â gwerthoedd cynhenid Cymru. Efallai fod rhai ohonoch o'r farn bod rhywfaint o wthio syniadau hen

but it is nice if you can encourage people and take them along.

Finally, on your point, Laura, about the Wales programme for improvement, it is in its early days, but so far so good. There is some evidence that tackling improvement in the way that we are doing through local government is working. We need more collaboration, and we must use that to address the skills deficit that exists in many areas, from social work right across to corporate management. I hope that this will help to further the ethos of collaboration and the spirit of working together, which will be beneficial for all public agencies, including local government.

Michael German: I will try to avoid comments and questions on matters that have already been raised. However, there were several issues in your statement, and in the discussion that took place at the Local Government and Public Services Committee, that need, and are worthy of, further exploration.

There is, undoubtedly, a shortage of leadership, and the initiative is the right way to move forward—it is a good idea and a good scheme. However, a key area that you have not yet ventured into is what you do about political leadership. That was discussed in committee. We have examples of failing political leadership in Wales. I am sure that many colleagues can probably identify failing political leadership in local authorities in Wales. *[Interruption.]* A few people seem to want to try to do so—I agree with provocation. The intention of this scheme is to consider leadership wherever it occurs. Recent reports into social services have required political leadership, as well as leadership from officials and officers. Perhaps you could address when you expect this scheme to be able to pick up and address political leadership. That is, again, for the three categories that you have identified—not only the council leader, but also those who are in a scrutiny role and those who wish to move through the ranks of political leadership into more senior positions in local authorities.

ffasiwn yn gwneud gwrthiau o bryd i'w gilydd, ond mae'n braf gallu annog pobl a'u cynnwys yn y broses.

I gloi, i ymateb i'ch pwynt, Laura, o ran rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella, mae'n ddyddiau cynnar, ond hyd yn hyn bu'r canlyniadau yn galonogol. Ceir rhywfaint o dystiolaeth fod mynd i'r afael â gwelliant fel y gwnawn o fewn llywodraeth leol yn gweithio. Mae angen mwy o gydweithredu arnom, a rhaid inni ddefnyddio hynny i ymdrin â'r diffyg sgiliau sy'n bodoli mewn sawl maes, o waith cymdeithasol i reolaeth gorfforaethol. Gobeithiaf y bydd hyn yn helpu i ddatblygu'r ethos o gydweithredu a'r ysbryd o gydweithio, a fydd yn fuddiol i bob asiantaeth gyhoeddus, gan gynnwys llywodraeth leol.

Michael German: Ceisiaf osgoi sylwadau a chwestiynau ar faterion a godwyd eisoes. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd sawl mater yn eich datganiad, ac yn y drafodaeth a gynhaliwyd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, y mae angen eu harchwilio ymhellach, ac sy'n haeddu eu harchwilio ymhellach.

Yn ddiau, mae prinder arweinwyr, a'r fenter yw'r ffordd orau o weithredu ar hyn—mae'n syniad da ac yn gynllun da. Fodd bynnag, un maes allweddol nad ydych wedi sôn amdano eto yw beth i'w wneud o ran arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol. Trafodwyd hynny yn y pwyllgor. Mae gennym enghreifftiau o arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol sy'n methu yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gall sawl un o'm cyd-Aelodau nodi arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol sy'n methu o fewn awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. *[Torri ar draws.]* Ymddengys bod sawl un am geisio gwneud hynny—mae pryfocio yn beth da. Bwriad y cynllun hwn yw ystyried arweinyddiaeth lle bynnag y'i ceir. Mae adroddiadau diweddar ar y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi gofyn am arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol, yn ogystal ag arweinyddiaeth gan swyddogion. Efallai y gallech nodi pryd y disgwyliwch y bydd y cynllun hwn yn gallu ystyried arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol ac ymdrin â hynny. Hynny yw, unwaith eto, ar gyfer y tri chategori a nodwyd gennych—nid yn unig arweinydd y cyngor, ond hefyd y rhai a chanddynt rôl graffu a'r rhai sy'n awyddus i symud drwy rengoedd arweinyddiaeth

wleidyddol i swyddi uwch mewn awdurdodau lleol.

There has also been some concern about how the relationship with the health service will work. If I were to be uncharitable, and I do not intend to be, I would say that what you have done, since the committee, is cobble together three different groups of bodies to put together some form of arrangement that may work. Do you not think that it requires something rather more substantial in this partnership agreement that you have with the three organisations to try to ensure some cohesiveness? Some of the issues that you are addressing in leadership in local authorities and local government will be the same—they will be generic across the piste. If there is a general thrust in one direction, it would surely be useful to ensure that that was also being carried out elsewhere.

Bu rhywfaint o bryder hefyd o ran sut y bydd y gydberthynas â'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gweithio. Pe bawn yn angharedig, ac nid dyna fy mwriad, dywedwn mai'r hyn a wnaethoch, ers y pwyllgor, yw tynnu ynghyd tri grŵp gwahanol o gyrff i geisio llunio rhyw fath o drefniant a allai weithio. Oni chredwch fod angen rhywbeth mwy sylweddol yn y cytundeb partneriaeth hwn a luniwyd gennych â'r tri sefydliad er mwyn ceisio sicrhau rhywfaint o gydlyniant? Bydd rhai o'r materion yr ydych yn ymdrin â hwy o ran arweinyddiaeth mewn awdurdodau lleol a llywodraeth leol yn union debyg—byddant yn faterion cyffredinol sy'n berthnasol i bawb. Os gwneir ymdrech benodol i un cyfeiriad, oni fyddai'n ddefnyddiol sicrhau bod yr un gwaith yn mynd rhagddo mewn meysydd eraill hefyd.

The third issue, which I believe we have discussed, involves middle managers who are struggling with their current workload. It is right that you should identify that, but what will you do about the problem and where will you find room in what you are suggesting for those managers, who are essential if we are to have strong local government and public services throughout Wales?

Mae'r trydydd mater, y credaf inni ei drafod eisoes, yn ymwneud â rheolwyr canolradd sy'n ei chael yn anodd ymdopi â'u llwyth gwaith cyfredol. Yr ydych yn iawn i nodi hynny, ond beth a wnewch am y broblem a sut y gweithredwch eich awgrymiadau ar gyfer y rheolwyr hynny, sy'n hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau llywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus cadarn ledled Cymru?

Sue Essex: I will take those points in the order in which they were made. As was said in committee, it is intended that this will spread and bring in politicians and appointees. That is a possibility. We must remember that this is an across-the-board consensus organisation. It is not for us to dictate what people will do; if we did that, we would not keep everyone on board. They have paid their membership fees but they have not done so for the Assembly to dictate what they will do. It is not that kind of doctrinaire organisation. As I said previously, many other good initiatives in terms of leadership, training for councillors and scrutiny have been identified in committee. Therefore, we must be careful that they are not duplicated or undermined. This is about bringing people together across organisational boundaries. As you say, it is an issue of generic competencies and skills. I

Sue Essex: Ymatebaf i'r pwyntiau hynny yn y drefn y'u gwnaed. Fel y dywedwyd yn y pwyllgor, y bwriad yw y bydd sôn am y fenter yn lledaenu ac yn denu gwleidyddion a phenodedigion. Mae hynny'n bosibilrwydd. Rhaid inni gofio mai sefydliad cyffredinol sy'n gweithredu yn ôl consensws ydym. Nid ein lle ni yw dweud wrth bobl beth i'w wneud; pe baem yn gwneud hynny, ni fyddem yn llwyddo i sicrhau ymrwymiad gan bawb. Maent wedi talu eu ffioedd aelodaeth ond nid er mwyn i'r Cynulliad ddweud wrthynt beth i'w wneud y gwnaethant hynny. Nid y math hwnnw o sefydliad dysgodrol mohono. Fel y dywedais eisoes, nodwyd sawl menter dda arall o ran arweinyddiaeth, hyfforddiant i gynghorwyr a chraffu yn y pwyllgor. Felly, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus na chânt eu dyblygu na'u tanseilio. Mae a wnelo hyn â dod â phobl ynghyd ar draws ffiniau sefydliadol. Fel y dywedwch, mae'n

attended the seminar led by Mark Moore from Harvard University, which was about identifying those competencies. I believe that this is about developing people's skills pace. Knowledge can be acquired as it is about memory, but you must develop people's skills. There has been a deficit of that in some areas—it is not fair to say that that only applies to local government; I think that it applies to other areas too. We have not thought adequately about training people and preparing them for some difficult jobs. As you may or may not know, not all aspects of leading a local authority are glamorous. The issue is about bringing that generic programme together.

I am keen for the NHS to be very much on board. However, I respect the fact that Jane has already taken this initiative forward by establishing a new agency for innovation and leadership in the NHS, which may deal with particular NHS issues. There is great potential for movement within the public sector, and that is why secondments and cross working are important. I hope that the PSMI will ensure joined-up delivery and planning.

In terms of existing managers, as I said, I believe that a programme has been identified—I will inform you if that is not the case—for the second or third layers of managers that are coming through who will be in those jobs tomorrow or in a few years' time.

Glyn Davies: I was sorry to have missed the discussion in committee. I approve of the action that you are taking to address an obvious weakness. However, I am concerned—and this is not meant to be a negative comment—about whether you have held discussions with organisations over the border in England. There is a serious concern regarding the barriers being built between the health services. Many people equate it to having the Berlin Wall across Offa's Dyke. Are you trying to counteract the possibility of

ymwneud â chymwyseddau a sgiliau cyffredinol. Mynychais y seminar o dan arweiniad Mark Moore o Brifysgol Harvard, a oedd yn ymwneud â nodi'r galluoedd hynny. Mae a wnelo hyn â datblygu cyflymder sgiliau pobl, fe gredaf. Gellir meithrin gwybodaeth gan fod hynny'n ymwneud â'r cof, ond rhaid ichi ddatblygu sgiliau pobl. Bu prinder hynny mewn rhai meysydd—nid yw'n deg dweud mai dim ond ym maes llywodraeth leol y mae hynny'n berthnasol; credaf ei fod yn berthnasol i feysydd eraill hefyd. Ni roddwyd ystyriaeth ddigonol gennym i hyfforddi pobl a'u paratoi ar gyfer swyddi anodd. Fel y gwyddoch o bosibl, neu efallai na wyddoch, nid yw arwain awdurdod lleol yn fêl i gyd. Y broblem yw tynnu pob agwedd ar y rhaglen gyffredinol honno ynghyd.

Yr wyf yn awyddus i'r GIG chwarae rhan bwysig yn y broses. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf barch tuag at Jane am ddatblygu'r fenter hon ymhellach drwy sefydlu asiantaeth newydd ar gyfer arloesedd ac arweinyddiaeth yn y GIG, a all ymdrin â materion sy'n benodol i'r GIG. Mae potensial mawr ar gyfer symud o fewn y sector cyhoeddus, a dyna pam mae secondiadau a gweithio ar draws gwahanol sefydliadau yn bwysig. Gobeithiaf y bydd y fenter yn sicrhau prosesau cyflwyno a chynllunio cydgysylltiedig.

O ran rheolwyr presennol, fel y dywedais, credaf fod rhaglen wedi'i nodi—fe'ch hysbysaf os nad yw hynny'n wir—ar gyfer yr ail a'r drydedd haen o reolwyr sy'n datblygu drwy'r system a gaiff eu penodi i'r swyddi hynny yfory neu ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd.

Glyn Davies: Yr oedd yn edifar gennyf golli'r drafodaeth yn y pwyllgor. Croesawaf y camau sydd ar waith gennych i ymdrin â gwendid amlwg. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu—ac ni fwriedir i'r sylw hwn fod yn un negyddol—o ran pa un a ydych wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda sefydliadau dros y ffin yn Lloegr. Mae pryder difrifol o ran y rhwystrau sy'n datblygu rhwng y gwasanaethau iechyd. Mae llawer o bobl yn cymharu'r sefyllfa â chodi Wal Berlin ar hyd Clawdd Offa. A ydych yn ceisio goresgyn y

what you are doing somehow becoming a barrier to the free movement of people across the border? You may have had discussions on this—perhaps you could share information with us.

Sue Essex: The combination of the Berlin Wall and Offa's Dyke would be something wonderful to behold. You raise a valid point. This is a unique Welsh initiative, which can be taken on board in a nation of 3 million people. You alluded to practical operational issues that cross boundaries. I will consider whether we can share practices across the border and whether there are interrelationships and a degree of co-operation that we can establish. We are supporting this, but the membership must respond to it. I will feed back your comments.

3.10 p.m.

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Yn ystod cwestiynau'r prynhawn yma, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog Cyllid at ddatblygiadau yng nghyswllt hygrychedd yr adeilad newydd. Mae'n bleser gennyf dynnu sylw Aelodau, y cyhoedd ac aelodau o'r staff sydd â diddordeb yn y materion hyn, at yr arddangosfa o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ar gyfer yr adeilad seneddol newydd. Mae'r arddangosfa i'w gweld yn ystafell gynadledda C ar y llawr cyntaf, a bydd ar agor am weddill y dydd yn ogystal ag yfory. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ymweld â hi ac y byddant mor frwdfrydig ag yr oeddwn i ar ôl fy ymweliad yn gynharach heddiw. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r staff a'r contractwyr a drefnodd yr arddangosfa.

posibilrwydd y gallai'r hyn a wnewch atal pobl rhag symud yn hwylus ar draws y ffin? Mae'n bosibl eich bod wedi trafod y mater—efallai y gallech rannu'r wybodaeth gyda ni.

Sue Essex: Byddai'r cyfuniad o Wal Berlin a Chlawdd Offa yn werth ei weld. Codwch bwynt dilys. Mae'r fenter hon yn unigryw i Gymru ac yn fenter y gellir ei chyflwyno mewn gwlad â 3 miliwn o bobl. Bu ichi gyfeirio at faterion gweithredol ymarferol sy'n croesi ffiniau. Ystyriaif pa un a allwn rannu arferion ar draws y ffin a pha un a oes rhyngberthnasau a rhywfaint o gydweithrediad y gallwn eu rhoi ar waith. Yr ydym o blaid hyn, ond rhaid i'r aelodau ymateb iddo. Cyflwynaf eich sylwadau iddynt.

The Presiding Officer: During today's questions, the Finance Minister referred to developments regarding the accessibility of the new building. It gives me great pleasure to draw the attention of Members, the public and staff who may have an interest in such matters, to the exhibition of information and communication technology for the new parliamentary building. The exhibition can be seen in conference room C on the first floor and will be open today and tomorrow. I hope that Members will take the opportunity to visit the exhibition and that they will share my enthusiasm following my visit earlier today. I thank the staff and contractors involved in the work of organising this exhibition.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaethau Eirioli a Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau Adolygu Achosion Plant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004

Approval of the Advocacy Services and Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2004 and the Review of Children's Cases (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw'r Gweinidog, carwn alw ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau, Glyn Davies, i sôn am bwynt o drefn

The Presiding Officer: Before I call the Minister, I wish to call the Chair of the Legislation Committee, Glyn Davies, to raise

perthnasol.

Glyn Davies: There was concern in the Legislation Committee meeting on 18 May that the commencement Order had not been made when it was being discussed by the Department for Education and Skills. The commencement Order was made on 20 May, therefore, as far as the Legislation Committee is concerned, it is in order that this debate is held today.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the Chair of the Legislation Committee for his contribution and for the role he undertakes on behalf of the Assembly—[*Interruption.*] Order. The Legislation Committee fulfils a useful function and may even do more in future. I call the Minister.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Advocacy Services and Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1967)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 May in relation to the Advocacy Services and Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) 2004; and

2. approves that the Advocacy Services and Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) 2004 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1968)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers

a point of order that relates to this debate.

Glyn Davies: Mynegwyd pryder yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Deddfau ar 18 Mai nad oedd y Gorchymyn cychwyn wedi ei wneud pan oedd yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn ei drafod. Gwnaethpwyd y Gorchymyn cychwyn ar 20 Mai, felly, o ran y Pwyllgor Deddfau, mae cynnal y ddatl hon heddiw mewn trefn.

Y Llywydd: Hoffwn ddiolch i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau am ei gyfraniad ac am y gwaith y mae'n ei wneud ar ran y Cynulliad—[*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Mae'r Pwyllgor Deddfau yn cyflawni swyddogaeth ddefnyddiol a gall wneud hyd yn oed mwy o waith yn y dyfodol. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt) : Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Eirioli a Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1967)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mai 2004, mewn perthynas â'r Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Eirioli a Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2004; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Eirioli a Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004; a'r

b) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1968)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried

the principle of the Review of Children's Cases (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1969)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 May 2004 in relation to the Review of Children's Cases (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and

2. approves that the Review of Children's Cases (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1970)

Upholding the rights of children and young people and empowering them to have a voice in matters and decisions that affect their lives are at the heart of the Assembly Government's agenda. I am pleased that these regulations progress these aims for our most vulnerable children and young people by placing new duties on local authorities.

The first set of regulations requires local authorities to provide advocacy services to children in need, including those who are looked after and who leave care, who intend to make a complaint under the Children Act 1989. The second set requires them to appoint independent reviewing offices, who will participate in the statutory review of cases for looked-after children, including care-leavers, to monitor authorities' functions in respect of the review and to refer a child's case to the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service where a local authority's failure to implement aspects of the care plan is considered to be in breach of the child's human rights.

Access to independent advocacy is central to

egwyddor y Rheoliadau Adolygu Achosion Plant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1969)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mai mewn perthynas â'r Rheoliadau Adolygu Achosion Plant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Adolygu Achosion Plant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004; a'r

b) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1970)

Mae amddiffyn hawliau plant a phobl ifanc a'u galluogi i leisio eu barn o ran materion a phenderfyniadau sy'n effeithio ar eu bywydau wrth wraidd agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn falch bod y rheoliadau hyn yn datblygu'r amcanion hyn ar gyfer ein plant a'n pobl ifanc fwyaf diamddiffyn drwy roi dyletswyddau newydd i awdurdodau lleol.

Mae'r gyfres gyntaf o reoliadau yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol roi gwasanaethau eirioli i blant mewn angen, gan gynnwys y rhai sy'n derbyn gofal ac sy'n gadael gofal, sy'n bwriadu gwneud cwyn o dan Ddeddf Plant 1989. Mae'r ail gyfres yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddynt benodi swyddogion adolygu annibynnol, a fydd yn cymryd rhan yn y broses o gynnal adolygiad statudol o achosion ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal, gan gynnwys plant sy'n gadael gofal, i fonitro swyddogaethau awdurdodau o ran yr adolygiad a chyfeirio achos plentyn i'r Gwasanaeth Cynghori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd lle ystyrir methiant awdurdod lleol i roi elfennau o'r cynllun gofal ar waith fel achos o dorri hawliau dynol y plentyn.

Mae mynediad i wasanaeth eirioli annibynnol

safeguarding children and protecting them from harm and poor practice. These regulations will extend the right of access to advocacy to include all children in need, not only looked-after children, when making a complaint, thereby benefiting an extra 15,000 children. The regulations will advance the Assembly's long-term aim of making advocacy available to all children and young people in social care, education and health settings, and build on national standards issued last February. New rights to advocacy also support the Assembly's commitment to recommendations in the Waterhouse report, 'Lost in Care', the Children's Commissioner for Wales's report, 'Telling Concerns', and Lord Laming's report on the death of Victoria Climbié.

Legislation to bring forward regulations to require local authorities to appoint independent reviewing officers is included in the Adoption and Children Act 2002, which responded to two High Court cases about the failure of the local authorities concerned in implementing children's care plans. One of the cases was referred to the House of Lords, where it was identified that a young person with no parent or guardian had no means of taking a local authority to court, which was in breach of their human rights.

These regulations bestow new powers on local authority independent reviewing officers to protect and support the interests of looked-after children in the review process, to ensure that there is no drift in the review of their cases and the implementation of their care plans. A key responsibility of the independent reviewing officer will be to ensure that the child or young person and key adults participate in the review process and that their views are understood and taken into account. The regulations will make the review process stronger, and they require local authorities to be more accountable and vigilant in their responsibilities for the health and welfare of children in their care.

Consultation on both sets of regulations and supporting guidance has been wide-ranging,

yn ganolog i'r broses o ddiogelu plant a'u hamddiffyn rhag niwed ac arfer gwael. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn ehangu'r hawl i gael mynediad i wasanaeth eirioli a fydd yn cynnwys pob plentyn mewn angen, nid dim ond plant sy'n derbyn gofal, wrth wneud cwyn, gan fod o fudd i 15,000 o blant ychwanegol. Bydd y rheoliadau yn hybu nod hirdymor y Cynulliad o gyflwyno gwasanaeth eirioli i bob plentyn a pherson ifanc mewn lleoliadau gofal cymdeithasol, addysg ac iechyd, a byddant yn datblygu'r safonau cenedlaethol a gyflwynwyd fis Chwefror diwethaf. Mae hawliau newydd i gael gwasanaeth eirioli hefyd yn ategu ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i argymhellion adroddiad Waterhouse, 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal', adroddiad Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, 'Datgan Pryderon', ac adroddiad yr Arglwydd Laming ar farwolaeth Victoria Climbié.

Cynhwysir deddfwriaeth i gyflwyno rheoliadau sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol benodi swyddogion adolygu annibynnol yn Neddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002, a ymatebodd i ddau achos yn yr Uchel Lys ynghylch methiant yr awdurdodau lleol dan sylw i roi cynlluniau gofal plant ar waith. Cyfeiriwyd un o'r achosion at Dŷ'r Arglwyddi, lle amlygwyd y ffaith na all person ifanc heb riant na gwarcheidwad fynd ag awdurdod lleol i'r llys, a oedd yn torri ei hawliau dynol.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn rhoi pwerau newydd i swyddogion adolygu annibynnol awdurdodau lleol i ddiogelu ac ategu buddiannau plant sy'n derbyn gofal yn y broses adolygu, er mwyn sicrhau na cheir llithriad yn y broses o adolygu eu hachosion a rhoi eu cynlluniau gofal ar waith. Un o gyfrifoldebau allweddol y swyddog adolygu annibynnol fydd sicrhau bod y plentyn neu'r person ifanc a'r oedolion allweddol yn cymryd rhan yn y broses adolygu ac y deallir ac yr ystyrir eu safbwyntiau. Bydd y rheoliadau yn cryfhau'r broses adolygu, ac maent yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol fod yn fwy atebol ac effro o ran eu cyfrifoldebau dros iechyd a lles plant yn eu gofal.

Bu'r broses ymgynghori ar y ddwy gyfres o reoliadau a chanllawiau ategol yn un eang, ac

and they have been welcomed by children's organisations and the office of the children's commissioner, as positive steps towards tightening systems to protect children's rights. Local authorities also see the new IRO arrangements as a positive step to refocusing the review process and improving practice to achieve better outcomes for looked-after children.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn a fydd yn sicrhau gwasanaethau angenrheidiol ar gyfer plant sydd yn aml mewn sefyllfaoedd bregus. Er ein bod yn eu croesawu, rhaid i mi fynegi rhywfaint o siom ynghylch yr oedi o ran eu gweithredu. Cyfeiriasoch at y bwlch yn y gyfraith o ran y rheoliadau adolygu achosion plant, ond a oes rhaid aros nes bod gweithredu yn San Steffan bob amser cyn gweithredu yma, yn enwedig pan fo enghreifftiau o sefyllfaoedd lle y mae angen sicrhau strwythurau tynnach? Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r achosion diweddar pan gwestiynwyd barn arbenigol ynghylch diogelwch plant. Tybiaf y bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn tynhau strwythurau, ond byddwn wedi dymuno gweld hynny'n cael ei gyflwyno'n gynt.

Yn olaf, sut y byddwch yn sicrhau annibyniaeth y swyddog adolygu? Mae annibyniaeth yn hollbwysig er mwyn i'r swyddog gyflawni ei swyddogaethau yn gywir.

Gwenda Thomas: I welcome the amendment of the principal regulations. Paragraph 5 (c) of the amendment states that

'any failure to review cases in accordance with these regulations or to take proper steps to make or carry out arrangements in accordance with regulation 8 is brought to the attention of persons at an appropriate level of seniority.'

Will you make clear to the responsible authorities what an appropriate level of seniority means, and will you seek to ensure consistency regarding seniority among all the responsible authorities in Wales?

Jonathan Morgan: We will vote in favour

fe'u croesawyd gan sefydliadau plant a swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant, fel camau cadarnhaol tuag at dynhau systemau i ddiogelu hawliau plant. Gwêl awdurdodau lleol drefniadau y swyddog adolygu annibynnol newydd fel cam cadarnhaol hefyd tuag at edrych o'r newydd ar y broses adolygu a gwella arfer i gyflawni canlyniadau gwell ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I welcome these regulations, which will secure essential services for children, who are often in vulnerable situations. Although we welcome them, I must express some disappointment about the delay in implementing them. You referred to the gap in the law relating to the regulations on reviewing children's cases, but must we always wait until action is taken in Westminster before we can act here, particularly when we have examples of situations where we need to ensure more rigid structures? You will be aware of recent cases when the views of specialists on the safety and security of children have been called into question. I imagine that these regulations will tighten structures, but I would have liked them to have been introduced sooner.

Finally, how will you ensure the independence of the reviewing officer? Independence is crucial if the officer is to undertake his or her functions appropriately.

Gwenda Thomas: Croesawaf y diwygiad i'r prif reoliadau. Noda paragraff 5 (c) y diwygiad y dylid sicrhau

bod unrhyw fethiant i adolygu achosion yn unol â'r rheoliadau hyn neu i gymryd camau priodol i wneud neu ddilyn trefniadau yn unol â rheoliad 8 yn cael ei ddwyn i sylw'r bobl sy'n dal swyddi â lefel briodol o awdurdod.

A eglurwch i'r awdurdodau cyfrifol beth yw ystyr 'lefel briodol o awdurdod', ac a geisiwch sicrhau cysondeb o ran lefel uwch ymysg yr holl awdurdodau cyfrifol yng Nghymru?

Jonathan Morgan: Pleidleisiwn o blaid y

of both regulations. However, I have some points of clarification for the Minister to address. You said that the advocacy services regulations would extend such services to children in need. I am delighted that that is the case, but will you confirm that they will apply to all children in local authority areas who are of school age and that their need will merely be defined by the fact that they have a complaint of whatever nature against the local authority?

You stated in the regulatory appraisal that this service is only available to looked-after children in some authorities, can you confirm how many local authorities find themselves in that position? On extending this advocacy service, how will it fit in with organisations, such as the special needs advisory project and others, which already provide advocacy services? In my experience, they provide an excellent level of work and advocacy in Cardiff, and I am keen to see how they will fit into this extension of local authority provision.

Finally, can you tell me whether the children's commissioner was consulted on the detail of the regulation? He is not listed in the regulatory appraisal, which states that voluntary organisations, including advocacy and children's rights providers, were consulted, but does not list the children's commissioner separately. Can you confirm whether Peter Clarke was consulted on the content of the regulations?

3.20 p.m.

On the review of children's cases and the appointment of independent reviewing officers, I am delighted that money has been made available to local authorities to cover the cost of appointing the officers. However, will you confirm how much money has been allocated to the voluntary sector for it to make similar appointments? Has that been costed, and do we know whether the voluntary sector has the capacity to appoint individual independent reviewing officers? How many voluntary sector bodies do you anticipate being affected? You mentioned in the regulatory appraisal that the intended

ddau reoliad. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn i'r Gweinidog egluro rhai pwyntiau. Dywedasoeh y byddai rheoliadau'r gwasanaethau eirioli yn ehangu gwasanaethau o'r fath i blant mewn angen. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd hynny'n digwydd, ond a wnewch gadarnhau y byddant yn berthnasol i bob plentyn ym mhob ardal awdurdod lleol sydd o oedran ysgol ac y bydd eu hangen yn cael ei ddiffinio gan y ffaith bod ganddynt gwŷn o ba natur bynnag yn erbyn yr awdurdod lleol?

Yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol, dywedasoeh mai dim ond i blant sy'n derbyn gofal mewn rhai awdurdodau y bydd y gwasanaeth hwn ar gael, a allwch gadarnhau faint o awdurdodau lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa honno? O ran ehangu'r gwasanaeth eirioli hwn, sut y bydd yn cydweddu â sefydliadau, fel y prosiect ymgynghorol ar anghenion arbennig ac eraill, sydd eisoes yn darparu gwasanaethau eirioli? O'm profiad i, gwnant waith, a chynigiant wasanaeth eirioli, rhagorol yng Nghaerdydd ac yr wyf yn awyddus i weld sut y byddant yn cydweddu â'r broses hon o ehangu darpariaeth awdurdodau lleol.

Yn olaf, a allwch ddweud wrthyf pa un a ymgynghorwyd â'r comisiynydd plant o ran manylion y rheoliad? Ni chaiff ei restru yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol, sy'n nodi yr ymgynghorwyd â sefydliadau gwirfoddol, gan gynnwys darparwyr gwasanaethau eirioli a hawliau plant, ond nid yw'n rhestru'r comisiynydd plant ar wahân. A allwch gadarnhau pa un a ymgynghorwyd â Peter Clarke ar gynnwys y rheoliadau?

O ran yr adolygiad o achosion plant a phenodi swyddogion adolygu annibynnol, yr wyf yn hynod falch bod arian ar gael i awdurdodau lleol i dalu'r gost o benodi'r swyddogion. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch gadarnhau faint o arian a ddyrannwyd i'r sector gwirfoddol er mwyn iddo wneud penodiadau tebyg? A yw hynny wedi'i gostio, ac a ydym yn gwybod a oes gan y sector gwirfoddol y capasiti i benodi swyddogion adolygu annibynnol? Faint o gyrff yn y sector gwirfoddol y rhagwelwch yr effeithir arnynt? Yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol bu ichi grybwyll mai'r effaith fwriadedig yw

effect is to strengthen and raise the status of the review process and to ensure that there is no drift in meeting care plans, but that is often the case, because there are not enough qualified social workers. How will you address that issue, in line with tightening up the review side of children's cases?

In reference to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's comment on the independence of the reviewing officers who will be appointed by local authorities, how can we be certain of the independence of somebody who is appointed by the authority? He or she may wish to make a judgment against that authority, particularly, as you said in your regulatory appraisal, if the ultimate sanction will be for that independent review officer to send a case to the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service if that officer believes that the local authority has failed to meet its statutory obligations? That is a serious matter for somebody who is meant to be independent. How will their independence be monitored? In addition, was the children's commissioner consulted? It is not stated whether Peter Clarke was consulted. I hope that he was, because, with regard to advocacy and the disgraceful position that two local authorities, namely Cardiff County Council and the County Borough of Blaenau Gwent have found themselves in during recent months, the involvement of the children's commissioner in this process would be welcome.

Michael German: I will ask a couple of questions, which relate to Jonathan's comments. First, on the relationship with the children's commissioner, will the Minister tell us whether there is a consistent approach with regard to changes in policy that affect children and young people? Would the children's commissioner be consulted as a matter of course? It is important that his office, and his views, are taken seriously. Secondly, on the role of the independent reviewing officers, the money has obviously been made available to local authorities to appoint them, but will you confirm that they are all in post, or will be, as the money was made available during the last financial year? In addition, are local authorities prepared for their new, strengthened role? Thirdly, on independence, it would be difficult for

cryfhau a chodi statws y broses adolygu a sicrhau nad oes llithriad o ran bodloni gofynion cynlluniau gofal, ond dyma sy'n digwydd yn aml, oherwydd prinder gweithwyr cymdeithasol cymwys. Sut yr ewch i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw, yn unol â gwella'r broses o adolygu achosion plant?

O ran sylw Rhodri Glyn Thomas ynghylch annibyniaeth swyddogion adolygu a gaiff eu penodi gan awdurdodau lleol, sut y gallwn fod yn sicr ynghylch annibyniaeth rhywun a benodir gan yr awdurdod? Efallai y bydd ef neu hi am farnu yn erbyn yr awdurdod hwnnw, yn enwedig, fel y dywedasoch yn eich arfarniad rheoliadol, os mai'r brif gosb fydd i'r swyddog adolygu annibynnol hwnnw anfon achos i'r Gwasanaeth Cyngori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd os yw'r swyddog o'r farn bod yr awdurdod lleol wedi methu â bodloni ei rwymedigaethau statudol? Mae hwnnw'n fater difrifol i rywun sydd i fod yn annibynnol. Sut y caiff eu hannibyniaeth ei fonitro? Yn ogystal, a ymgynghorwyd â'r comisiynydd plant? Ni nodir a ymgynghorwyd â Peter Clarke ai peidio. Gobeithiaf y gwnaethpwyd hynny oherwydd, o ran eiriolaeth a sefyllfa warthus dau awdurdod lleol, sef Cyngor Sir Caerdydd a Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, byddai cyfranogiad y comisiynydd plant yn y broses hon yn cael ei groesawu.

Michael German: Gofynnaf ychydig o gwestiynau, sy'n ymwneud â sylwadau Jonathan. Yn gyntaf, o ran y berthynas â'r comisiynydd plant, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa un a oes ymagwedd gyson tuag at newidiadau mewn polisi sy'n effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc? A ymgynghorid â'r comisiynydd plant fel mater o drefn? Mae'n bwysig cymryd ei swydd, a'i sylwadau, o ddifrif. Yn ail, o ran rôl y swyddogion adolygu annibynnol, mae'n amlwg bod yr arian ar gael i awdurdodau lleol eu penodi, ond a wnewch gadarnhau eu bod wedi'u penodi, neu y cânt eu penodi, gan y rhyddhawyd yr arian yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf? Yn ogystal, a yw awdurdodau lleol yn barod am eu rôl newydd, cryfach? Yn drydydd, o ran annibyniaeth, byddai'n anodd i rywun a

someone who is an appointee of a local authority to shop that authority publicly, if the local authority is their paymaster and he or she is answerable to it. Will you indicate how the independent review officers will be supported externally in their role, how they will be evaluated, and who will take an external view of their work?

Finally and crucially, there must be a consistent approach across Wales, so that children, wherever they are, in turning to this service, will know that they are guaranteed an equal and consistent service. How will that level of consistency be matched externally, and to whom will the independent reviewing officer be able to turn to ensure that such matters are being dealt with fairly across Wales?

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I thank Members for their important points. In relation to the issues raised by Rhodri Glyn, Jonathan and Mike with regard to the independence of the independent reviewing officers, those functions are prescribed in primary legislation, in the Adoption and Children Act 2002 and in regulations. In terms of power, they flesh out the detailed arrangements. The new arrangements will require a reconfiguration of the local authority review of cases to ensure that there are criteria for independence in the regulations. Independent review officers currently operate under a non-statutory status, and the points made about their independence are key. They were all consulted in the lead up to this, because they operate with a non-statutory status, and we must ensure that this is taken through in terms of their criteria. It is about introducing an effective means by which someone who is independent of the decision-making process and the implementation of a child's care plan, can ensure proper development and implementation. It is also to ensure that the powers encourage effective local authority compliance with a child's care plan, by means of monitoring, and that cases are referred to the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service for possible court intervention, as a last resort.

benodir gan awdurdod lleol i feirniadu'r awdurdod hwnnw'n gyhoeddus os mai'r awdurdod lleol hwnnw sy'n talu'r cyflog a'i fod ef neu ei bod hi yn atebol iddo. A ddynodwch sut y caiff y swyddogion adolygu annibynnol eu cefnogi yn allanol yn eu rôl, sut y cânt eu gwerthuso, a phwy fydd yn edrych ar eu gwaith o'r tu allan?

Yn olaf ac yn bwysicaf oll, rhaid sicrhau ymagwedd gyson ledled Cymru, er mwyn i blant, ble bynnag y bônt, wrth droi at y gwasanaeth hwn, wybod eu bod yn sicr o gael gwasanaeth cyfartal a chyson. Sut y caiff y lefel honno o gysondeb ei sicrhau'n allanol, ac at bwy y gall y swyddogion adolygu annibynnol droi er mwyn sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â materion o'r fath yn deg ledled Cymru?

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Hoffwn ddiolch i Aelodau am eu pwyntiau pwysig. O ran y materion a godwyd gan Rhodri Glyn, Jonathan a Mike a oedd yn ymwneud ag annibyniaeth y swyddogion adolygu annibynnol, rhagnodir y swyddogaethau hynny mewn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, yn Neddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 ac mewn rheoliadau. O ran pŵer, nodant y trefniadau manwl. Bydd y trefniadau newydd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ailffurfio'r broses o adolygu achosion o fewn awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sicrhau y ceir meini prawf ar gyfer annibyniaeth yn y rheoliadau. Ar hyn o bryd, gweithreda swyddogion adolygu annibynnol o dan statws anstatudol, ac mae'r pwyntiau a wnaed ynghylch eu hannibyniaeth yn allweddol. Ymgynghorwyd â phob un ohonynt wrth baratoi ar gyfer hwn, am eu bod yn gweithredu gyda statws anstatudol, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod hwn yn parhau o ran eu meini prawf. Mae'n ymwneud â chyflwyno dull effeithiol sy'n galluogi rhywun sy'n annibynnol ar y broses gwneud penderfyniadau a'r broses o roi cynllun gofal plentyn ar waith, i sicrhau'r datblygiad a'r broses weithredu gywir. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod y pwerau yn annog awdurdodau lleol i gydymffurfio â chynllun gofal plentyn yn effeithiol, drwy ddulliau monitro, a bod achosion yn cael eu cyfeirio i'r Gwasanaeth Cynghori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd ar gyfer ymyrraeth bosibl gan y llys, fel y cam olaf.

To ensure that support is provided through advocacy—Jonathan, you raised a point about the special needs advisory service and its role in advocacy—we have 22 advocacy service providers in Wales at present, who are contracted by local authorities. I am happy to provide information as to who is contracted. They have been contracted according to the standards that we set in Wales, which were agreed and distributed to social services last year, and have formed the basis of the contracts for advocacy.

Mike, you asked whether there is a standard procedure to consult with the children's commissioner. To reassure Members, he is fully consulted on all drafts of regulations that affect children and young people. That is on the basis of the Children's Commissioner for Wales Act 2001, and our responsibilities to the commissioner. As I said in my opening remarks, the children's commissioner fully supports the steps that we have taken to enhance the powers of the independent review officer and the regulations. It is having some impact on telling concerns in terms of the recommendations for the Welsh Assembly Government, in relation to these issues, and for local authorities.

Jonathan Morgan: To clarify, I know that the regulations on reviewing cases specify the type of person that we would expect to be appointed as an independent reviewing officer, but how senior within the local authority will that officer be? Do we expect him or her to have an administrative background, or to be a senior officer in the local authority who will have some clout?

Jane Hutt: It is clear that this is an independent role, and we need to ensure that the officer is independent from the local authority. I am certainly happy to clarify the specification of an independent review officer, Jonathan, to reassure you. It interestingly links to the point that Gwenda raised about the seniority of the reviewing officer, and whether it is identified. You will know about seniority from the regulations. In terms of the guidance, this must relate to

Er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir cymorth drwy eirioli—Jonathan, codwyd pwynt gennych ynghylch y gwasanaeth ymgynghorol ar anghenion arbennig a'i rôl o ran eirioli—mae gennym 22 o ddarparwyr gwasanaeth eirioli yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd a gaiff eu contractio gan awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn barod i ddarparu gwybodaeth am bwy gaiff eu contractio. Cânt eu contractio yn unol â'r safonau a bennir gennym yng Nghymru, y cytunwyd arnynt ac a gyflwynwyd i'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol y llynedd, ac sydd wedi ffurfio sylfaen y contractau eirioli.

Mike, gofynnasoch a oes gweithdrefn safonol er mwyn ymgynghori â'r comisiynydd plant. Er mwyn tawelu meddyliau Aelodau, ymgynghorir ag ef yn llawn ynghylch pob rheoliad drafft sy'n effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc. Gwneir hynny ar sail Deddf Comisiynydd Plant Cymru 2001, a'n cyfrifoldebau i'r comisiynydd. Fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, mae'r comisiynydd plant yn gwbl gefnogol i'r camau a gymerwyd gennym i wella pwerau'r swyddog adolygu annibynnol a'r rheoliadau. Mae'n cael rhywfaint o effaith ar ddatgan pryderon o ran yr argymhellion ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mewn perthynas â'r materion hyn, ac ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol.

Jonathan Morgan: I gadarnhau, gwn fod y rheoliadau ynghylch adolygu achosion yn nodi'r math o berson y byddem yn disgwyl iddo gael ei benodi fel swyddog adolygu annibynnol, ond pa mor uchel o fewn yr awdurdod lleol y bydd y swyddog hwnnw? A ydym yn disgwyl iddo ef neu hi feddu ar gefndir gweinyddol, neu i fod yn uwch swyddog yn yr awdurdod lleol ag iddo rywffaint o awdurdod?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n amlwg mai rôl annibynnol yw hon, ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod y swyddog yn annibynnol ar yr awdurdod lleol. Yr wyf yn sic yn barod i egluro manyleb swydd swyddog adolygu annibynnol, Jonathan, er mwyn tawelu eich meddwl. Yn ddiddorol, mae'n cysylltu â'r pwynt a godwyd gan Gwenda ynghylch lefel y swyddog adolygu, a pha un a nodir hynny. Byddwch yn gyfarwydd â lefel uwch o'r rheoliadau. O ran y canllawiau, rhaid i hyn

someone at assistant director, director, or chief executive level in order to ensure seniority. We must distinguish between the safeguard that you seek and the independence of the independent reviewing officer, in relation to status and expertise, and the role of the officers in safeguarding and supporting young people in relation to their care plans.

fod yn gysylltiedig â rhywun ar lefel cyfarwyddwr cynorthwyol, cyfarwyddwr, neu brif weithredwr er mwyn sicrhau lefel uwch briodol. Rhaid inni wahaniaethu rhwng y diogelwch a geisiwch ac annibyniaeth y swyddog adolygu annibynnol, mewn perthynas â statws ac arbenigedd, a rôl y swyddogion wrth ddiogelu a chynorthwyo pobl ifanc mewn perthynas â'u cynlluniau gofal.

*Cynnig (NDM1967): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1967): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1968): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1968): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1969): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1969): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1970): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1970): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.33 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.33 p.m.*

Caffael Cynaliadwy Sustainable Procurement

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendments 4, 5 and 6

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

in the name of Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. notes the progress made towards creating a competitive and sustainable economy through the implementation of 'A Winning Wales';

2. welcomes the work of the Welsh Assembly Government and its partners in taking forward the Welsh procurement initiative's vision of adopting a truly joined-up approach to procurement in Wales to secure better value for money and improved public services while embedding sustainable development within their procurement activities;

3. supports the creation of a sustainable business taskforce and its aim of facilitating greater economic benefit from public sector expenditure by creating synergies between the commercial needs of the public sector and wider economic development; and

4. recognises that the Welsh Assembly Government's innovative approach to public sector procurement complements the 'A Winning Wales' agenda in seeking to remove barriers to Welsh enterprises competing for and winning business in Wales. (NDM1971)

I welcome this debate and the opportunity that it provides to discuss a key feature of this Government's commitment to deliver a better Wales.

'A Winning Wales' provides the context of a vision of a prosperous and competitive twenty-first century economy. This is what I call a dragon economy based on innovation, enterprise and knowledge exploitation. It will be an economy that is stronger, more sustainable and more prosperous, based on enterprise, innovative business and supported by a highly-skilled workforce. Clearly, how the Welsh public sector procures goods and services is important to turning today's vision for Wales into tomorrow's reality. Not only

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn nodi'r camau a gymerwyd o ran creu economi gystadleuol a chynaliadwy drwy weithredu 'Cymru'n Ennill';

2. yn croesawu gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i phartneriaid o ran mynd ati i wireddu gweledigaeth menter gaffael Cymru o fabwysiadu agwedd gydgyssylltiedig at gaffael yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau gwell gwerth am arian a gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus tra'n ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy yn eu gweithgareddau caffael;

3. yn cefnogi'r bwriad i greu tasglu busnes cynaliadwy a'i nod o hwyluso mwy o fanteision economaidd o'r gwariant yn y sector cyhoeddus drwy greu cysylltiad rhwng anghenion masnachol y sector cyhoeddus a datblygiad economaidd ehangach; ac

4. yn cydnabod bod dull arloesol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o fynd i'r afael â chaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus yn ategu agenda 'Cymru'n Ennill' o ran chwalu'r rhwystrau i fentrau Cymreig sy'n cystadlu am fusnes yng Nghymru ac yn ei ennill. (NDM1971)

Croesawaf y ddadl hon a'r cyfle a rydd i drafod nodwedd allweddol ar ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon i sicrhau Cymru well.

Mae 'Cymru'n Ennill' yn rhoi cyd-destun gweledigaeth o economi ffyniannus a chystadleuol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dyma economi'r ddraig, fel y'i galwaf, sy'n seiliedig ar arloesedd, mentergarwch a datblygu gwybodaeth. Bydd yn economi gryfach a mwy cynaliadwy a ffyniannus, wedi'i seilio ar fentergarwch, arloesedd busnes ac wedi'i hategu gan weithlu hyfedr. Yn amlwg, mae'r ffordd y mae'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn caffael nwyddau a gwasanaethau yn bwysig i droi'r

must we remain true to our 'A Winning Wales' themes of enterprise and innovation, it is equally important that we embrace sustainability as an overarching theme of any sensible procurement policy.

As an indication of the scale of the opportunity, the Welsh public sector spends some £4 billion per annum on goods, services and works. This represents over 11 per cent of Wales's gross domestic product. Therefore, the way in which that money is spent has an important influence on our economy, environment and communities. That is why we have established the Welsh procurement initiative, which works with its Welsh public sector partners to secure better value for money and improved public services from this expenditure and to contribute to advancing the sustainable development agenda. The initiative includes an innovative pathfinder project in which it and the WDA have combined to explore measures aimed at ensuring that smaller and local suppliers are in the best possible position to compete for, and to win, Welsh public sector business, starting with the food sector. Today, I will report on progress. I will also propose new action to extend this approach to all other areas of Welsh public sector procurement expenditure.

My colleague, Sue Essex—who will close this debate—will shortly be launching an initiative guidance note entitled 'Food for Thought', which will cover how the Welsh public sector can re-think its approach to food procurement. The guidance provides a menu of practical solutions to ensure that smaller and local suppliers are not discriminated against and that barriers to entry are broken down, while remaining compliant with European Union directives and providing value for money. The Welsh procurement initiative has developed this guidance through a working partnership of catering and procurement managers from all sectors across Wales. A number of these organisations have started to pilot different aspects of this guidance, and we are starting to see a real difference in approach in, for example, Welsh health supplies, and some local councils have projects that work in

weledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru heddiw yn realiti yfory. Rhaid inni nid yn unig gadw at ein themâu o fentergarwch ac arloesedd yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', ond mae'r un mor bwysig ein bod yn derbyn cynaliadwyedd fel thema sy'n rhychwantu unrhyw bolisi caffael synhwyrol.

Fel arwydd o faint o gyfle sydd, mae'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn gwario tua £4 biliwn y flwyddyn ar nwyddau, gwasanaethau a gweithiau, sef dros 11 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru. Felly, mae'r ffordd y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario yn cael dylanwad pwysig ar ein heconomi, ein hamgylchedd a'n cymunedau. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi sefydlu menter gaffael Cymru, sy'n gweithio gyda'i phartneriaid yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru i sicrhau gwell gwerth am arian a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell o'r gwariant hwn ac i gyfrannu at hybu'r agenda datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'r fenter yn cynnwys prosiect braenaru arloesol lle mae'r fenter a'r WDA wedi dod ynghyd i ymchwilio i fesurau sydd wedi'u hanelu at sicrhau bod cyflenwyr llai a lleol yn gallu cystadlu am fusnes sector cyhoeddus Cymru a'i ennill, gan ddechrau gyda'r sector bwyd. Heddiw, cyflwynaf adroddiad ar gynnydd. Byddaf hefyd yn cynnig camau gweithredu newydd i ymestyn hyn i bob maes arall o wariant caffael y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Bydd fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex—a fydd yn cloi'r ddadl hon—yn lansio nodyn canllaw ar y fenter o'r enw 'Food for Thought' cyn bo hir. Bydd hyn yn ymdrin â sut y gall y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ailystyried y ffordd y mae'n caffael bwyd. Mae'r canllawiau yn cynnig dewis o atebion ymarferol i sicrhau na wahaniaethir yn erbyn cyflenwyr llai a lleol ac y caiff y rhwystrau iddynt ennill busnes eu chwalu, tra'n parhau i gydymffurfio â chyfarwyddebau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a rhoi gwerth am arian. Mae menter gaffael Cymru wedi datblygu'r canllawiau hyn drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â rheolwyr arlwygo a chaffael o bob sector ledled Cymru. Mae nifer o'r sefydliadau hyn wedi dechrau treialu gwahanol agweddau ar y canllawiau hyn, ac yr ydym yn dechrau gweld gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol o ran caffael, er enghraifft, cyflenwadau iechyd Cymru, ac mae rhai

partnership with local farmers and producers to provide entry into the existing supply chains. By so doing, they are getting Welsh produce into schools, hospitals, staff restaurants, meals on wheels schemes and council-run tourist sites in a cost-effective way, which is compliant with European Union directives. The Higher Education Purchasing Consortium Wales—

Alun Ffred Jones: You mentioned local authorities, which local authorities are those?

Andrew Davies: I will come on to that in a moment.

The Higher Education Purchasing Consortium Wales is working with its distributors to ensure that Welsh produce options are offered in university canteens. Monmouthshire County Council is reviewing its school-meal provision in several pilot schools.

The Welsh procurement initiative is starting to work with suppliers on improving the nutritional content of the top processed food items in schools. The initiative is also co-ordinating a study of distribution needs in west Wales to assess the benefits of a cross-sector approach. It is working with the primary school breakfast pilots to ensure that the opportunities for local suppliers are maximised.

The initiative's food pathfinder project is beginning to produce results. The quality and volume of bids received from local suppliers is beginning to improve, and the Welsh public sector is beginning to demonstrate greater flexibility and innovation in its procurement. We know, for the first time, that 20 per cent of our public sector food provision is of produce reared, grown or produced in Wales, and we can now start to track changes to measure improvement.

As Minister, I, along with my Cabinet colleagues, feel that if we can adopt this

cynghorau lleol wedi cyflwyno prosiectau sy'n gweithio mewn partneriaeth â ffermwyr a chynhyrchwyr lleol i'w helpu i fod yn rhan o'r cadwyni cyflenwi presennol. Drwy wneud hynny, maent yn cyflenwi cynnyrch Cymreig i ysgolion, ysbytai, ffreturiau staff, cynlluniau pryd ar glud a safleoedd i dwristiaid a gaiff eu rhedeg gan gynghorau, a hynny mewn ffordd gost effeithiol, sy'n cydymffurfio â chyfarwyddbau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae Consortiwm Prynu Addysg Uwch Cymru—

Alun Ffred Jones: Bu ichi gyfeirio at awdurdodau lleol, pa awdurdodau lleol ydynt?

Andrew Davies: Soniaf am hynny yn y man.

Mae Consortiwm Prynu Addysg Uwch Cymru yn gweithio gyda'i ddosbarthwyr i sicrhau y cynigir opsiynau ar gyfer prynu cynnyrch Cymreig mewn ffreturiau prifysgolion. Mae Cyngor Sir Fynwy yn adolygu ei ddarpariaeth o brydau ysgol mewn sawl ysgol beilot.

Mae menter gaffael Cymru yn dechrau gweithio gyda chyflenwyr ar wella maeth y bwydydd proses mwyaf poblogaidd mewn ysgolion. Mae'r fenter hefyd yn cyd-drefnu astudiaeth o anghenion dosbarthu yn y Gorllewin i asesu manteision gweithredu ar draws sectorau. Mae'n gweithio gyda chynlluniau brecwast sy'n cael eu treialu mewn ysgolion cynradd i sicrhau bod cyflenwyr lleol yn cael y cyfleoedd gorau posibl.

Mae prosiect braenaru'r fenter yng ngyswllt bwyd yn dechrau dwyn ffrwyth. Mae mwy o gyflenwyr lleol yn dechrau ymgeisio ac mae ansawdd y ceisiadau hynny yn gwella, ac mae'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn dechrau bod yn fwy hyblyg ac arloesol wrth gaffael nwyddau. Gwyddom, am y tro cyntaf, fod 20 y cant o'r bwyd a ddarperir yn y sector cyhoeddus yn dod o gynnyrch sydd wedi'i ffermio, ei dyfu neu ei gynhyrchu yng Nghymru, a gallwn yn awr ddechrau olrhain newidiadau i fesur gwelliant.

Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf fi, ynghyd â'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet, yn teimlo os

innovative approach for the food sector, we could extend it to all aspects of Welsh public sector procurement.

Gwenda Thomas: Do you accept that it is important to take note of the two Commission for Racial Equality procurement guides that were launched on 17 July last year? They have been mentioned in a Plenary debate. They make it clear that taking account of race equality in making decisions on procurement is key to complying with our duties under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000.

Andrew Davies: We need to address that important issue. Our overarching principles are sustainable development and social justice, but the third issue is that of equality of opportunity and mainstreaming that into all of our policy programmes. Procurement is important, and, therefore, we will mainstream the approach to which you refer.

It is estimated that some 35 per cent of the Welsh public sector's procurement expenditure is won by businesses operating in Wales, supporting some 70,000 jobs. Every 1 per cent of procurement expenditure won by Welsh business should result in around 2,000 additional jobs. While that figure must be treated with some caution, the key message is clear: increasing the value of contracts won by competitive businesses in Wales will have multiple benefits. It will mean stronger businesses creating more employment, it will reduce pressure on our environment, particularly through traffic movements, and it will ensure better value for the public sector, enabling improved delivery of public services. The potential benefits of more business being won at a more local level are clear, but the barriers to realising this potential are considerable.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you also envisage considering Assembly reports in this initiative? We had a report in committee, if I remember rightly, from the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales that was commissioned, printed and published in Surrey. I asked whether a Welsh company should take on that work. Do you

gallwn fynd ati i arloesi gyda'r sector bwyd, y gallem ymestyn hyn i bob agwedd ar gaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Gwenda Thomas: A dderbyniwch ei bod yn bwysig nodi'r ddau ganllaw ar gaffael a lansiwyd gan y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol ar 17 Gorffennaf y llynedd? Cyfeiriwyd atynt yn un o ddadleuon y Cyfarfod Llawn. Eglurant fod ystyried cydraddoldeb hil wrth benderfynu ar faterion caffael yn allweddol i gydymffurfio â'n dyletswyddau o dan Ddeddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000.

Andrew Davies: Mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r mater pwysig hwnnw. Ein hegwyddorion rhychwantol yw datblygu cynaliadwy a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ond cyfle cyfartal yw'r drydedd egwyddor, a'r ffordd yr ydym yn ei phrif ffrydio ym mhob un o'n rhaglenni polisi. Mae caffael yn bwysig, ac, felly, byddwn yn prif ffrydio'r hyn yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato.

Amcangyfrifir bod tua 35 y cant o wariant caffael y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn cael ei ennill gan fusnesau sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru, gan helpu i ddiogelu tua 70,000 o swyddi. Dylai pob 1 y cant o wariant caffael a enillir gan fusnesau o Gymru greu tua 2,000 o swyddi ychwanegol. Er bod yn rhaid trin y ffigur hwnnw yn ofalus, mae'r neges allweddol yn amlwg: bydd cynyddu gwerth contractau a enillir gan fusnesau cystadleuol yng Nghymru yn esgor ar fanteision amryfal. Bydd yn golygu busnesau cryfach sy'n creu mwy o swyddi, bydd yn lleihau'r pwysau ar ein hamgylchedd, yn enwedig o ran traffig, a bydd yn sicrhau gwell gwerth am arian i'r sector cyhoeddus, gan ei alluogi i ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae manteision posibl ennill mwy o fusnes yn fwy lleol yn amlwg, ond mae'r rhwystrau i wireddu'r potensial hwnnw yn sylweddol.

Eleanor Burnham: A ydych yn rhagweld hefyd y byddwch yn ystyried adroddiadau'r Cynulliad yn y fenter hon? Cyflwynodd Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, os cofiaf yn iawn, adroddiad i'r pwyllgor a gomisiynwyd, a argraffwyd ac a gyhoeddwyd yn Surrey. Holais a ddylai cwmni o Gymru fod wedi gwneud y gwaith

envisage all Assembly reports being produced in Wales?

hwnnw. A ydych yn rhagweld y bydd pob un o adroddiadau'r Cynulliad yn cael ei gynhyrchu yng Nghymru?

3.40 p.m.

Andrew Davies: Very much so. We will undertake an audit of existing reports and of examples of public procurement elsewhere, not just in the UK but also in Europe. Any such information will be germane to the initiative that I am about to announce.

Andrew Davies: Gobeithio'n wir. Byddwn yn cynnal archwiliad o'r adroddiadau o gynhyrchir ar hyn o bryd ac o enghreifftiau o gaffael cyhoeddus mewn mannau eraill, nid yn unig yn y DU ond hefyd yn Ewrop. Bydd unrhyw wybodaeth o'r fath yn berthnasol i'r fenter yr wyf ar fin ei chyhoeddi.

The lack of a developed procurement infrastructure across the Welsh public sector is a barrier to procurement. There is a dearth of procurement professionals to help us to ensure that contracts are offered in ways that will maximise the ability of businesses in Wales, large and small, to compete and win business, keeping added value in Wales wherever possible.

Mae'r ffaith nad oes seilwaith caffael datblygedig ar draws y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn rhwystr i gaffael. Mae prinder gweithwyr caffael proffesiynol i'n helpu i sicrhau y cynigir contractau mewn ffyrdd a fydd yn amlhau i'r eithaf allu busnesau yng Nghymru, yn fawr neu'n fach, i gystadlu ac ennill busnes, gan gadw gwerth ychwanegol yng Nghymru lle bynnag y bo modd.

Secondly, on the lack of sound information on procurement expenditure, the majority of the Welsh public sector does not know how much it spends on procurement, on what, or, indeed, with whom. Without this information, measuring the amount of business being won by Welsh suppliers is next to impossible. Thirdly, there is a lack of a systematic and strategic link between the Welsh public sector and its supply chains. There is no current mechanism for a co-ordinated and strategic approach to markets to identify gaps in supply to the Welsh public sector for which steps could be taken to fill and monitor progress.

Yn ail, o ran y diffyg gwybodaeth gadarn am wariant caffael, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn gwybod faint y mae'n ei wario ar gaffael, ar beth, neu, yn wir, gyda phwy. Heb y wybodaeth hon, mae bron yn amhosibl mesur faint o fusnes a enillir gan gyflenwyr yng Nghymru. Yn drydydd, nid oes cysylltiad systematig na strategol rhwng y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a'i gadwyni cyflenwi. Nid oes ymagwedd gydgyssylltiedig na strategol ar hyn o bryd tuag at farchnadoedd i nodi bylchau mewn cyflenwadau i'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, bylchau y gellid cymryd camau i'w llenwi ac i fonitro cynnydd yn eu cylch.

David Lloyd: On public sector supply food chains, would you acknowledge the work done by Rhondda Cynon Taf and Caerphilly county borough councils in establishing the exact supply chain that you mention between local producers and counties?

David Lloyd: O ran cadwyni cyflenwi bwyd y sector cyhoeddus, a gydnabyddwch waith cyngor bwrdeistref sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf a chyngor bwrdeistref sirol Caerffili i sefydlu'r union gadwyn gyflenwi rhwng cynhyrchwyr lleol a'r siroedd y cyfeiriasoch ati?

Andrew Davies: I believe that I said earlier that I acknowledge all councils that have made progress on improving the local supply of produce.

Andrew Davies: Credaf imi ddweud yn gynharach fy mod yn cydnabod pob cyngor sydd wedi gwneud cynnydd o ran gwella'r cyflenwad lleol o gynnyrch.

The Welsh procurement initiative is working

Mae menter gaffael Cymru yn gweithio

with its partners to address these barriers to unlock the undoubted potential that exists. What is currently missing is the strategic link between the Welsh public sector as a whole and its supply chains. With the Finance Minister, I propose, therefore, to establish a business procurement taskforce, which I will chair. Its membership will include businesspeople who have experience of competing for Welsh public sector contracts and representatives from the business support community.

The taskforce will identify the barriers to more business being won by smaller and more local suppliers and the steps necessary to break through those barriers. As chair of the taskforce, I will report on progress to the Assembly Cabinet's sustainable development sub-committee. I intend that the taskforce will have several sub-groups reporting to it that will examine sector specific issues, for example, for the food and construction sectors. The taskforce will set a challenging but achievable target for the amount of business being won by smaller and more local suppliers, and will monitor progress. The taskforce will complement the measures in 'A Winning Wales' to create a competitive and sustainable Welsh economy.

Our actions in this area provide yet another solid example of innovative and joined-up Government, where we aim not only to secure value for money, but also to ensure that our approach to procurement supports our wider ambitions within the framework of European law, which governs public procurement. The procurement approach that I have outlined takes us forward to secure greater value for money and improved public services from public expenditure. It also creates further synergies between public sector commercial needs and the wider economy, and removes barriers that prevent Welsh enterprises from competing for, and winning, public sector business.

Through acting in this way, we are furthering our strategic agenda to build a winning Welsh economy that is socially inclusive and sustainable, but which is, above all, prosperous. Activities to that end deserve all our support, so I ask you to support the

gyda'i phartneriaid i fynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau hyn i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd sydd, yn ddiau, ar gael. Yr hyn sydd ar goll ar hyn o bryd yw'r cysylltiad strategol rhwng y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ei gyfanrwydd a'i gadwyni cyflenwi. Felly, cynigïaf, gyda'r Gweinidog Cyllid, y dylid sefydlu tasglu caffael busnes, o dan fy nghadeiryddiaeth i. Ymhlith ei aelodau bydd pobl fusnes sydd wedi cael profiad o gystadlu am gontractau'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a chynrychiolwyr o'r gymuned cymorth i fusnes.

Bydd y tasglu yn nodi'r rhwystrau sy'n atal cyflenwyr llai a mwy lleol rhag ennill rhagor o fusnes a'r camau sydd eu hangen i oresgyn y rhwystrau hynny. Fel cadeirydd y tasglu, byddaf yn rhoi adroddiad ar gynnydd i is-bwyllgor datblygu cynaliadwy Cabinet y Cynulliad. Fy mwriad yw y bydd sawl is-grŵp yn cyflwyno adroddiadau i'r tasglu ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â sectorau penodol, er enghraifft, ar gyfer y sector bwyd a'r sector adeiladu. Bydd y tasglu yn gosod targed ymestynnol ond un y gellir ei gyflawni ar gyfer faint o fusnes y mae cyflenwyr llai a mwy lleol yn ei ennill, a bydd yn monitro cynnydd. Bydd y tasglu yn ategu'r mesurau yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', i greu economi gystadleuol a chynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

Mae ein camau gweithredu yn y maes hwn yn enghraifft gadarn arall eto o Lywodraeth arloesol a chydgyssylltiedig, lle yr ydym yn anelu at sicrhau nid yn unig gwerth am arian, ond hefyd dull o gaffael sy'n ategu ein huchelgeisiau ehangach o fewn fframwaith deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd, sy'n rheoli caffael cyhoeddus. Mae'r dull o gaffael a nodais yn gam ymlaen inni sicrhau mwy o werth am arian a gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus am wariant cyhoeddus. Mae hefyd yn creu rhagor o gysylltiadau rhwng anghenion masnachol y sector cyhoeddus a'r economi ehangach ac yn dileu rhwystrau sy'n atal mentrau yng Nghymru rhag cystadlu am fusnes y sector cyhoeddus a'i ennill.

Drwy weithredu yn y modd hwn, yr ydym yn hybu ein hagenda strategol i ddatblygu economi yng Nghymru sy'n ennill, economi sy'n gymdeithasol-gynhwysol ac yn gynaliadwy, ond sydd, yn anad dim, yn ffyniannus. Mae gweithgareddau i'r perwyl

motion.

hwnnw yn haeddu pob cefnogaeth gennym, felly gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 1, rhoi 'diffyg' ar ôl 'Yn nodi'r'

Alun Ffred Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: in point 1, insert 'lack of' after 'notes the'

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 4:

I propose amendment 3. Insert at the end of point 4:

, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi canllawiau ar fyrder ar gyfer cyrff cyhoeddus ar ddefnyddio cynnyrch lleol.

, and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to issue as a matter of urgency practical guidance to public bodies on sourcing locally.

Nid oes dwywaith bod manteision mawr i gwmnïau lleol, cyfleoedd i gynyddu a diogelu cyflogau, ac enillion amgylcheddol o gael strategaeth gaffael sy'n targedu rhan sylweddol o'n gwariant cyhoeddus at gynhyrchwyr a chwmnïau lleol. Un o'r pethau cyntaf a wnaeth Cyngor Gwynedd yn dilyn ad-drefnu 1996 oedd trefnu cyfarfodydd i arwain cwmnïau lleol i weld cyfleoedd yn rhaglen wario'r cyngor. Golygai hyn roi'r cwmnïau mewn cysylltiad â chynghorwyr busnes ac, o ran ymgymerydd, ddangos beth oedd gofynion y cyngor o ran sicrwydd ariannol a safonau. Nid oedd hynny'n anodd—mater o ewyllys wleidyddol, synnwyr cyffredin a rhannu arfer da ydyw. Mater arall yw rheolau tendro yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, a deawn yn ôl at hynny yn y man.

There is no doubt that there are great benefits to local companies, opportunities to increase and safeguard earnings, and environmental gains to having a procurement strategy that targets a substantial proportion of our public expenditure at local producers and companies. One of the first things that Gwynedd Council did after the 1996 reorganisation was to arrange meetings to guide local companies to identify opportunities within the council's expenditure programme. That meant putting the companies in contact with business consultants and, as practitioners, demonstrating the council's requirements regarding financial assurance and standards. There was nothing difficult about this—it is a matter of political will, common sense and sharing good practice. European Union tendering regulations are another matter, and I will return to that in a moment.

Ar y cynnig ac araith y Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn siŵr o gael fy nghyhuddo o fod yn negyddol, yr oeddwn yn disgwyl cyhoeddiad ychydig yn fwy cynhyrfus na bod un Gweinidog yn mynd i sefydlu tasglu a bod un arall yn mynd i gyhoeddi canllawiau. Byddai pawb yn y Siambwr yn cytuno â chnewyllyn y cynnig hwn—mae'r enillion yn amlwg i bawb. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth yn chwarae gwleidyddiaeth drwy wneud honiad ysgubol hunanganmoliaethus. Gadewch inni ddangos rhywfaint o aeddfedrwydd yn ein trafodaethau, hyd yn oed os yw'r sylwedd yn brin.

On the motion and the Minister's speech, and I am sure that I will be accused of being negative, I was expecting a rather more exciting announcement than that one Minister will establish a taskforce and that another will publish guidelines. Everyone in the Chamber would agree with the essence of this motion—the benefits are obvious to everyone. However, the Government is playing politics by making a self-congratulatory sweeping statement. Let us show some maturity in our debates, even if they lack substance.

Gwnaf sylw ar un agwedd ar y pwnc hwn, gan ystyried y gair 'cynaliadwy'. Wrth inni

I will comment on one aspect of this issue in considering the word 'sustainable'. In letting

roi cytundebau, rhaid inni roi sylw i amodau gwaith y rhai sy'n cynhyrchu'r nwyddau. Mae'r Catholic Agency for Overseas Development, sydd â chysylltiadau agos â'r Eglwys Babyddol, wedi tynnu ein sylw yn ddiweddar at amodau gwaith peryglus a diffyg hawliau sylfaenol y rhai sy'n cynhyrchu cyfrifiaduron, er enghraifft, i gwmnïau mawr fel IBM, Dell a Hewlett-Packard. Yn y farchnad fyd-eang, ni waeth inni osod amodau caeth ar gyfer ein cynhyrchwyr ni gan anwybyddu yr hyn sy'n digwydd dros y dŵr.

Mae'n hawdd i wrthblaid alw ar Lywodraeth i weithredu yn gynt. Mae cyhoeddi'r nodyn canllaw 'Food for Thought' i'w groesawu'n fawr. Fodd bynnag, ble y bu'r Llywodraeth? Faint o amser a aeth heibio ers i'r Athro Kevin Morgan gyhoeddi erthygl ar sut y mae gwledydd y cyfandir yn llwyddo i ddefnyddio rheolau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd i'w mantais eu hun? Fel cyn arweinydd cyngor, yr oeddwn yn disgwyl y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithredu yn ddi-oed ar y mater hwn gan fod cymaint i'w ennill ac i'w cholli. Fodd bynnag, clywsom heddiw y caiff tasglu ei sefydlu ac y bydd cyhoeddiad. Yr oeddwn dan yr argraff fod Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru eisoes yn datblygu cynllun ar y pwnc hwn o leiaf ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Beth a ddigwyddodd i'r gwaith hwnnw?

Cyfeiriais yn gynharach at y sefyllfa yng Ngwynedd, sy'n berthnasol i'r drafodaeth hon. Caiff 85 y cant o brydau mewn ysgolion yng Ngwynedd ei ddarparu gan gwmnïau sy'n gynhenid i Wynedd, a chaiff 11 y cant arall ei ddarparu gan gwmnïau Cymreig. Dyna record i fod yn falch ohoni. Fodd bynnag, ni ddaw'r cynnyrch i gyd o Gymru o bell ffordd. Dyna'r sialens. Ceir amryw o gytundebau ar gyfer prydau ysgolion. Mae sefyllfa Hufenfa De Arfon, Rhydygwystl yn un ddelfrydol. Mae'r cytundeb sydd ganddo yn hwb i ffermwyr llaeth lleol ac i weithwyr yr hufenfa. Mae hefyd yn dda i'r amgylchedd am nad oes angen cludo'r nwyddau bellteroedd mawr. Ceir llwyddiant ar dair lefel.

Cefais sgwrs brynhawn dydd Llun gyda chyn berchennog cwmni bwydydd yng Ngwynedd.

contracts, we must pay attention to the working conditions of those who produce the commodities. The Catholic Agency for Overseas Development, which has close links with the Catholic Church, has recently drawn our attention to the dangerous working conditions and the fundamental lack of rights of those involved in manufacturing computers for example, for large companies such as IBM, Dell and Hewlett-Packard. In the global market, there is no point in setting strict restrictions for our own producers while ignoring what is happening abroad.

It is easy for an opposition party to demand that the Government takes swifter action. The publication of the 'Food for Thought' guidance note is to be greatly welcomed. However, where has the Government been? How much time has passed since Professor Kevin Morgan published his article on how continental countries succeed in using European Union rules to their own advantage? As a former council leader, I expected to see the Assembly Government acting without delay on this issue as there is so much to gain and so much to lose. However, we have heard today that a taskforce will be established and that an announcement will be made. I was also under the impression that the Welsh Development Agency was developing a scheme along these lines at least two years ago. What has happened to that work?

I referred earlier to the situation in Gwynedd, which is relevant to this debate. Eighty five per cent of school meals in Gwynedd is provided by indigenous companies within Gwynedd, and another 11 per cent is provided by Welsh companies. That is a record to be proud of. However, not all the produce comes from Wales by a long chalk. That is the challenge. There are many contracts for school meals. The situation at South Caernarfon Creameries in Rhydygwystl is ideal. The contract that it has provides a boost for local dairy farmers and the workers at the creamery. It also benefits the environment as goods do not have to be transported over long distances. There is success on three levels.

On Monday afternoon, I had a conversation with the former owner of a food company in

Rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, yr oedd gan y cwmni weithlu craidd o 25 a fyddai'n cynyddu yn yr haf—sef tymor yr ymwelwyr—i o gwmpas 60. Byddai'r gwaith ychwanegol yn addas ar gyfer myfyrwyr a disgyblion ond nid oedd o fawr ddefnydd i deulu oedd eisiau prynu tŷ a magu teulu. Ar ôl ennill cytundeb sylweddol gan y cyngor, mae'r cwmni bellach yn cyflogi 45 o bobl yn rhan amser a dim ond tua 15 yn rhagor yn yr haf, sef patrwm llawer mwy cynaliadwy a buddiol i'r gymdeithas. Dyna ddarlun o'r enillion sydd i'w cael. Fy neges i'r Llywodraeth felly yw, tynnwch eich bys allan.

3.50 p.m.

Glyn Davies: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. In point 1, delete '*notes the progress made*' and replace with

notes the failure to make satisfactory progress

This debate covers a wide subject area. I will refer to the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities. I do not know what it would place as its highest priority, but I would imagine that raising the gross domestic product of Wales would certainly be high on the list, and sustainable procurement plays a part in that. Raising GDP would be the highest priority on my list, largely because a stronger economy delivers most of the other social objectives of the Welsh Assembly Government and other Assembly parties. Recent figures suggest that GDP levels have not progressed as well as Rhodri Morgan, as the former Minister for economic development, would have hoped. Whenever I discuss this issue with Alun Cairns, who has become something of an authority on GDP levels in Wales, I hear that the figures have gone into reverse, although I accept that we do not have up-to-date figures.

Reference is made to 'A Winning Wales' in point 1 of the motion, which talks about creating a competitive, sustainable economy. The motion would be more accurate if amendment 2 were carried and, were it not for the embarrassment that this would cause, I am sure that the Minister would agree.

Gwynedd. Some years ago, the company had a core workforce of 25, which would increase during the summer—the tourist season—to around 60. The additional work was suitable for students and pupils but it was not much use for a family that wanted to buy a house and raise a family. After securing a substantial contract from the council, the company now employs 45 part-time staff members and only around 15 more during the summer, which is a much more sustainable and beneficial pattern for the community. That is a picture of the benefits that can be gained. My message to the Government therefore is, pull your finger out.

Glyn Davies: Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ym mhwynt 1, dileu '*yn nodi'r camau a gymerwyd*' a rhoi yn ei le

yn nodi'r methiant i gymryd camau boddhaol

Mae'r ddadl hon yn cwmpasu maes eang. Cyfeirir at flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Ni wn pa flaenoriaeth fyddai ei blaenoriaeth uchaf, ond byddwn yn meddwl y byddai codi cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru yn sicr yn cael blaenoriaeth uchel, ac mae caffael cynaliadwy yn chwarae rhan yn hynny o beth. Codi CMC fyddai'r flaenoriaeth uchaf i mi, yn bennaf am fod economi gryfach yn cyflawni'r rhan fwyaf o amcanion cymdeithasol eraill Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r pleidiau eraill yn y Cynulliad. Awgryma ffigurau diweddar nad yw CMC wedi codi gymaint ag y byddai Rhodri Morgan, fel y cyn-Weinidog dros ddatblygu economaidd, wedi gobeithio. Pryd bynnag y trafodaf y mater hwn gydag Alun Cairns, sydd wedi dod yn rhyw fath o awdurdod ar lefelau'r CMC yng Nghymru, clywaf fod y ffigurau wedi gwaethygu, er y derbynaf nad oes gennym y ffigurau diweddaraf.

Cyfeirir at 'Cymru'n Ennill' ym mhwynt 1 y cynnig, sy'n sôn am greu economi gystadleuol a chynaliadwy. Byddai'r cynnig yn fwy cywir pe byddai gwelliant 2 yn cael ei dderbyn ac, oni bai am yr embaras y byddai hyn yn ei achosi, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno.

The Welsh Assembly Government is right to recognise that the local sourcing of products should be a policy objective. I think that every party would agree with that. Listening to the Minister speaking about the WDA, I did not hear anything new. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, when I served as a member of the WDA, Source Wales was a major initiative. It was designed primarily to build on the successful inward investment policies of that time. Building on this work was, and is, a major step.

I was recently stung, if not a little hurt, in the Local Government and Public Services Committee, by Peter Law's description of me as a master of negativity. I wish to say that we fully support point 2 of the motion, which refers to sustainable development being embedded in procurement policy. It should be embedded in everything that we do. The Government is also right to state, in point 3, that it should search out wider economic benefits from public sector investment. I do not know how the new bureaucracy announced by the Minister—the sustainable business taskforce—will work, therefore I hope that clear targets will be set in this regard. However, we support the Government's overall aim. Point 4 has a slightly self-congratulatory tone, which the Minister cannot help but use every time he speaks.

There is no doubt that we should all applaud pursuing a policy of Welsh enterprise and winning more business, but this is not a straightforward issue. We are all aware of the benefits of local sourcing. Every penny and pound spent on local sourcing produces a wider and better economic benefit than a penny or pound spent elsewhere. However, we must acknowledge that there are constraints. There are legal constraints relating to competition and open trading, which is important to Wales and Britain. This, in turn, is a constraint on Government, and it is wrong of opposition parties to make demands of Government when legal constraints prevent it from delivering. Perhaps my natural negativity is creeping in, but there are also financial implications to what the Government may want to do.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn iawn i gydnabod y dylai'r defnydd o ffynonellau lleol o gynnyrch fod yn amcan polisi. Credaf y byddai pob plaid yn cytuno â hynny. Wrth wrando ar y Gweinidog yn sôn am y WDA, ni chlywais ddim byd newydd. Ddiwedd yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au, pan oeddwn yn aelod o'r WDA, yr oedd Ffynhonnell Cymru yn fenter bwysig. Fe'i cynlluniwyd yn bennaf i adeiladu ar y polisiau mewnfuddsoddi llwyddiannus ar y pryd. Yr oedd adeiladu ar y gwaith hwn yn gam pwysig, ac mae'n parhau'n bwysig.

Cefais fy synnu, os nad fy mrifo braidd yn ddiweddar yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus gan ddisgrifiad Peter Law ohonof fel meistr negyddoldeb. Hoffwn ddweud ein bod yn cefnogi pwynt 2 y cynnig yn llwyr. Cyfeiria at ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy mewn polisiau caffael. Dylai gael ei ymgorffori ym mhopeth a wnawn. Mae'r Llywodraeth hefyd yn iawn i nodi, ym mhwynt 3, y dylai geisio manteision economaidd ehangach o fuddsoddiad y sector cyhoeddus. Ni wn sut y bydd y fiwrocratiaeth newydd a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog—y tasglu busnes cynaliadwy—yn gweithio, felly, gobeithiaf y caiff targedau pendant eu gosod yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, cefnogwn nod cyffredinol y Llywodraeth. Mae i bwynt 4 ryw dinc hunanglodforus, a glywn bob tro y mae'r Gweinidog yn siarad.

Nid oes amheuaeth y dylai pob un ohonom gymeradwyo dilyn polisi o fentergarwch yng Nghymru ac o ennill mwy o fusnes, ond nid mater syml ydyw. Gwyddom oll am fanteision defnyddio ffynonellau lleol. Mae pob ceiniog a werir ar ffynonellau lleol yn cael budd economaidd ehangach a gwell na'r un geiniog a werir yn rhywle arall. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod bod cyfyngiadau. Mae cyfyngiadau cyfreithiol o ran cystadleuaeth a masnach agored, sy'n bwysig i Gymru a Phrydain. Mae hyn, yn ei dro, yn cyfyngu ar y Llywodraeth, ac mae'n amhriodol i'r gwrthbleidiau alw ar y Llywodraeth i weithredu pan fo cyfyngiadau cyfreithiol yn ei hatal rhag gwneud hynny. Efallai fod fy natur negyddol yn dod i'r golwg, ond mae goblygiadau ariannol hefyd i'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth am ei wneud o

bosibl.

This initiative impacts on the private sector, and enterprises in this sector must remain competitive and commercial; they cannot afford to become uncompetitive. Whatever system we use, it must not put private sector businesses at a commercial disadvantage. The same applies to the public sector. Any costs arising from this strategy must not fall on council tax payers. We have had several debates about the implications of extra costs for council tax payers, therefore this strategy must not incur additional costs.

Mae'r fenter hon yn effeithio ar y sector preifat, a rhaid i fentrau yn y sector hwn barhau'n gystadleuol ac yn fasnachol; ni allant fforddio mynd yn anghystadleuol. Pa system bynnag a ddefnyddiwn, rhaid sicrhau na fydd busnesau yn y sector preifat o dan anfantais yn fasnachol. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y sector cyhoeddus. Rhaid sicrhau nad talwyr y dreth gyngor fydd yn gorfod talu unrhyw gostau sy'n codi o'r strategaeth hon. Yr ydym wedi cael sawl dadl ynglŷn â goblygiadau costau ychwanegol i dalwyr y dreth gyngor, felly rhaid sicrhau nad yw'r strategaeth hon yn arwain at gostau ychwanegol.

Local sourcing is not a straightforward issue, but it has potentially great benefits. In committing itself to pursuing local sourcing, the Government is doing the right thing, and I wish to say, positively, that we give our full support to that.

Nid yw'r defnydd o ffynonellau lleol yn fater syml, ond gall esgor ar fanteision mawr. Wrth ymrwymo i'r defnydd o ffynonellau lleol, mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweithredu'n gywir, a hoffwn ddweud, yn gadarnhaol, ein bod yn cefnogi hynny'n llwyr.

Jenny Randerson: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 4: add at the end of the motion:

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Minister to place a duty on Assembly sponsored public bodies and local authorities to report annually on the amount of local produce they have procured.

yn galw ar y Gweinidog i'w gwneud hi'n ddyletswydd ar gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac ar awdurdodau lleol i adrodd yn flynyddol ar faint o gynnyrch lleol y maent wedi'i gaffael.

I propose amendment 5. Add at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau gwelliant 5: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

recognises local food procurement by the public sector as a vital means of support for the small family farms that are prevalent in the agricultural sector in Wales.

yn cydnabod bod caffael bwyd lleol gan y sector cyhoeddus yn gymorth holl bwysig i ffermydd bach teuluol sy'n fath cyffredin iawn yn y sector amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru.

I propose amendment 6. Add at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau gwelliant 6: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Minister to ensure that there is sufficient early-years funding to sustain all local procurement projects.

yn galw ar y Gweinidog i sicrhau bod digon o gyllid y blynyddoedd cynnar ar gael i gynnal yr holl brosiectau caffael lleol.

Sustainable procurement is a marriage of two concepts: sustainable development and local procurement. These concepts are supported wholeheartedly by the Welsh Liberal

Mae caffael cynaliadwy yn uno dau gysyniad: datblygu cynaliadwy a chaffael lleol. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn llwyr gefnogi'r cysyniadau hyn.

Democrats. My colleague, Mike German, started work on the local food procurement strategy in October 2002, when he was Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad. Members should remember that date.

This is about more than recycled paper and buying local food. We must look at complex supply chains and at the complex results of our decisions. It is good to buy local food for many reasons, but it is important that we do not step over the line into protectionism because this has adverse consequences, particularly for people in the developing world. Local, sustainable procurement is good for the environment in that it reduces the number of food miles and is therefore part of combating pollution and climate change. Local sourcing means that the food we eat is fresher because the supply chain is shorter, and that less packaging is used, which is another good consequence. Also, because we are dealing with local companies, it means, indirectly, that they are more accountable for the safety and quality of their product, because they are more easily accessible. Strengthening the local food supply chain to the public sector in Wales is a crucial aspect, which has been outlined by the Minister in financial terms. Our amendment calls for duties to be placed on Assembly sponsored public bodies and local authorities to report annually, because we see that the cascading down of the Assembly's decisions need to go directly through them. We must be able to measure how effective the Assembly's policies are in practice for a whole range of public authorities.

In the interests of the Welsh economy, it is only right that we should look to ensure that as much money as possible stays in Wales. Our rural economy and small family farms, in particular, stand to gain from a robust sustainable procurement policy, which is the reason behind one of our amendments. However, these policies must be funded effectively, if they are to work effectively.

The concept is good and we support it.

Dechreuodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mike German, waith ar y strategaeth caffael bwyd lleol ym mis Hydref 2002, pan oedd yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor. Dylai Aelodau gofio'r dyddiad hwnnw.

Mae a wnelo hyn â mwy na phapur wedi'i ailgylchu a phrynu bwyd lleol. Rhaid inni edrych ar gadwyni cyflenwi cymhleth a chanlyniadau cymhleth ein penderfyniadau. Mae prynu bwyd lleol yn beth da am sawl rheswm, ond mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn croesi'r ffin ac yn dechrau ceisio diogelu nwyddau rhag y farchnad am fod hyn yn arwain at ganlyniadau anffafriol, yn enwedig i bobl yn y byd datblygol. Mae caffael cynaliadwy, lleol yn beth da i'r amgylchedd yn yr ystyr ei fod yn lleihau nifer y milltiroedd cludo bwyd ac felly mae'n rhan o'r ymgyrch i wrthsefyll llygredd a newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae ffynonellau lleol yn golygu bod y bwyd a fwytawn yn fwy ffres am fod y gadwyn gyflenwi yn fyrrach, ac y defnyddir llai o ddeunydd pacio, sydd hefyd yn fuddiol. Hefyd, gan ein bod yn ymdrin â chwmnïau lleol, mae'n golygu, yn anuniongyrchol, eu bod yn fwy atebol am ddiogelwch ac ansawdd eu cynnyrch, oherwydd mae'n haws cael gafael arnynt. Mae cryfhau'r gadwyn cyflenwi bwyd lleol i'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn agwedd allweddol, a amlinellwyd gan y Gweinidog o safbwynt ariannol. Mae ein gwelliant yn galw ar i ddyletswyddau gael eu gosod ar gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno adroddiad yn flynyddol, oherwydd, yn ein tyb ni, drwyddynt hwy yn uniongyrchol y mae angen i benderfyniad y Cynulliad raeadru. Rhaid bod modd inni fesur pa mor effeithiol yw polisiau'r Cynulliad yn ymarferol ar gyfer amrywiaeth o awdurdodau cyhoeddus.

Er mwyn economi Cymru, mae'n hollol briodol inni geisio sicrhau bod cymaint o arian â phosibl yn aros yng Nghymru. Bydd ein heconomi wledig a'n ffermydd teuluol bach, yn arbennig, yn elwa ar bolisi caffael cynaliadwy cadarn, sef y rheswm dros un o'n gwelliannau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r polisiau hyn gael eu hariannu'n effeithiol, er mwyn iddynt weithio'n effeithiol.

Mae'r cysyniad yn un da ac fe'i cefnogwn.

However, I raise a note of concern at the apparent lack of progress on this since the early days, back in 2002. To be effective, we must adopt a practical approach and the sustainable procurement ethos must permeate throughout the public sector. I raise two examples: first, on procurement for our new Assembly building, I understand that the contracts were deliberately broken down into chunks in order to make them accessible to local suppliers. However, a local office furniture supplier, which has won awards and is at the forefront of design and technology, informed me that because the contracts were advertised exclusively in the *Official Journal of the European Communities*, smaller suppliers were unaware of them. Therefore, despite our efforts, goodwill and good intentions, these measures have proved to be ineffective in getting small, local suppliers to apply for the contracts. Secondly, I was approached by a large local stationery supplier, who informed me that the stationery contracts for Cardiff County Council and the Welsh Development Agency have been awarded to French firms. Where is the local procurement? I would be interested to learn why those types of decisions are being made.

Finally, I will raise the concept of the term 'sustainable' in the widest possible context. We must look at employees' pay and conditions, particularly homeworkers. Oxfam has stated that there are over 1 million homeworkers in the UK: 90 per cent of whom are women, 50 per cent of whom are from ethnic minorities, and many of whom are working in Wales for well below the minimum wage.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: I apologise to Alun Ffred Jones in advance, because I do not think that I can deliver the same degree of maturity as he does. Sustainable procurement is most definitely a win-win measure, from which our small and medium-sized enterprises can directly benefit. Approximately £928 million is spent per annum on school meals. If small and medium-sized enterprises can sell produce to local authorities, which then goes into the supply chain, then they will benefit, as will the employees and schools. There can also be

Fodd bynnag, codaf bryder ynglŷn â'r diffyg cynnydd i bob golwg o ran y polisi hwn ers y dyddiau cynnar, yn ôl yn 2002. Er mwyn bod yn effeithiol, rhaid inni fod yn ymarferol a rhaid i ethos caffael cynaliadwy drwytho drwy'r sector cyhoeddus. Codaf ddwy enghraifft: yn gyntaf, o ran caffael ar gyfer adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, deallaf i gontractau gael eu rhannu'n gontractau llai yn fwriadol er mwyn ei gwneud yn bosibl i gyflenwyr lleol ymgeisio. Fodd bynnag, cefais wybod gan gyflenwr dodrefn swyddfa lleol, sydd wedi ennill gwobrau ac sydd ar flaen y gad o ran dylunio a thechnoleg, nad oedd cyflenwyr llai o faint yn ymwybodol o'r contractau gan mai dim ond yng nghyfnodolyn swyddogol y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd y'u hysbyswyd. Felly, er gwaethaf ein hymdrechion, ein hewyllys da a'n bwriadau da, bu'r mesurau hyn yn aneffeithiol o ran annog cyflenwyr lleol, bach i ymgeisio am y contractau. Yn ail, cysylltodd cyflenwr deunydd swyddfa lleol mawr â mi. Dywedodd wrthyf fod contractau ar gyfer deunydd swyddfa Cyngor Sir Caerdydd ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi cael eu dyfarnu i gwmnïau yn Ffrainc. Beth am gaffael lleol? Byddai diddordeb gennyf wybod pam y mae penderfyniadau o'r fath yn cael eu gwneud.

Yn olaf, codaf y cysyniad 'cynaliadwy' yn y cyd-destun ehangaf posibl. Rhaid inni edrych ar gyflogau ac amodau gweithwyr, yn enwedig gweithwyr cartref. Mae Oxfam wedi dweud bod dros 1 filiwn o weithwyr cartref yn y DU: mae 90 y cant ohonynt yn ferched, 50 y cant ohonynt yn dod o leiafrifoedd ethnig, ac mae llawer ohonynt yn gweithio yng Nghymru am gyflog sydd dipyn yn is na'r isafswm cyflog.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: Ymddiheuraf i Alun Ffred Jones ymlaen llaw, gan na chredaf fy mod yn gallu bod yr un mor aeddfed ag ef. Yn sicr, mae caffael cynaliadwy yn fesur lle mae pawb ar ei ennill, ac y gall ein busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint elwa'n uniongyrchol arno. Gwerir tua £928 miliwn y flwyddyn ar brydau ysgol. Os gall busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint werthu cynnyrch i awdurdodau lleol, sydd wedyn yn mynd i mewn i'r gadwyn gyflenwi, yna byddant hwy yn elwa, yn ogystal â'r cyflogion a'r ysgolion. Gall hefyd esgor ar

a knock-on benefit for the children who, as has been mentioned, can then understand their food chain. They can even see the source of their food and know where it is produced. We must praise that particular aspect of this.

4.00 p.m.

I will highlight a WDA-sponsored initiative, which is part of the food supply and development programme in Pembrokeshire at present. A joint Pembrokeshire County Council, Pembrokeshire Business Initiative and WDA 'meet the buyer' event was recently held at Wolfcastle in my constituency. It was a pilot of this programme, and the 'meet the buyer' event was specifically tailored for small businesses to meet food purchasers for local authorities' school meals service. Businesses were informed of the local authority needs that they should be trying to meet. One of the difficulties that small businesses face is obtaining the expertise to apply for tenders and to win them, and therefore win the section of the market for which they are aiming. That particular initiative was run on the basis that the WDA is trying to inform small businesses of how they can fit into our legislative framework, within the due diligence testing, and how they can apply for and win tenders. In addition, there will be a WDA workshop on 24 June to assist businesses to make tenders.

In addition, last year, a brochure was published locally on how to tender for council work. Those are the real steps that we must take to ensure that we produce sustainable procurement. By encouraging and helping our small businesses and taking them through the quagmire of tendering processes, we can ensure that they win contracts, which perhaps they have not done in the past. Therefore, I welcome the business procurement taskforce, which will identify the barriers that small businesses face and which prevent them from achieving their aims. In addition, targets will be set for the taskforce to identify and achieve. As I said at the outset, this is a win-win measure for all concerned, and we should therefore welcome it.

fantais arall o ran y plant, a all wedyn ddeall eu cadwyn fwyd, fel y soniwyd. Gallant hyd yn oed weld ffynhonnell eu bwyd a gwybod ble y caiff ei gynhyrchu. Rhaid inni ganmol yr agwedd benodol honno.

Tynnaf sylw at fenter a noddir gan y WDA, sy'n rhan o'r rhaglen cyflenwi bwyd a datblygu yn sir Benfro sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd. Cynhaliwyd digwyddiad 'dewch i gwrdd â'r prynwr' yng Nghas-blaidd yn fy etholaeth i yn ddiweddar, a drefnwyd ar y cyd gan Gyngor Sir Penfro, Menter Busnes Sir Benfro a'r WDA. Yr oedd yn beilot o'r rhaglen hon a chafodd y digwyddiad 'dewch i gwrdd â'r prynwr' ei deilwra'n benodol er mwyn i fusnesau bach gwrdd â phrynwyr bwyd ar gyfer gwasanaeth prydau ysgol awdurdodau lleol. Dywedwyd wrth y busnesau am anghenion yr awdurdodau lleol y dylent geisio eu diwallu. Un o'r anawsterau a wynebir gan fusnesau bach yw cael yr arbenigedd i wneud cais am dendr a'i ennill, a drwy hynny ennill y rhan o'r farchnad y maent yn anelu ati. Cynhaliwyd y fenter benodol honno ar y sail bod y WDA yn ceisio dweud wrth fusnesau bach sut y gallant gydweddu â'n fframwaith deddfwriaethol, o fewn y profion diwydrwydd priodol, a sut y gallant wneud cais am dendrau a'u hennill. Yn ogystal, cynhelir gweithdy gan y WDA ar 24 Mehefin i helpu busnesau i gyflwyno tendrau.

Yn ogystal, y llynedd, cyhoeddwyd llyfryn yn lleol ar sut i gyflwyno tendr am waith y cyngor. Dyna'r camau gwirioneddol y mae'n rhaid inni eu cymryd i sicrhau caffael cynaliadwy. Drwy annog a helpu ein busnesau bach a drwy roi canllawiau iddynt ar y prosesau tendro cymhleth, gallwn sicrhau eu bod yn ennill contractau, nad ydynt wedi eu gwneud o bosibl yn y gorffennol. Felly, croesawaf y tasglu caffael busnes, a fydd yn nodi'r rhwystrau y mae busnesau bach yn eu hwynebu ac sy'n eu hatal rhag cyflawni eu nodau. Yn ogystal, bwriedir pennu targedau ar gyfer y tasglu i nodi caffael cynaliadwy a'i gyflawni. Fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, mae'n fesur lle mae pawb ar ei ennill, ac felly dylem ei groesawu.

Elin Jones: Mae llawer o gonsensws ymysg Aelodau fod caffael lleol a chaffael yng Nghymru yn bwysig i hyrwyddo'r economi ac i leihau niwed amgylcheddol. Mae'n drueni felly, fel y dywedodd Glyn Davies, fod y Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Gallai'r mater hwn fod wedi cael cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol. Fodd bynnag, mae cynnig y Llywodraeth yn gorganmol cyflwr cyffredinol yr economi.

Yr wyf gyda'r cyntaf i gydnabod fod agweddau o'r economi yn bositif, yn enwedig rhai ffigurau cyflogaeth a diweithdra, neu ddiffyg diweithdra, ond mae agweddau gwan hefyd. Mae dirwasgiad yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, lefelau cyflogau isel, diweithdra tymor hir, lefelau uchel o anweithgarwch economaidd ac mae lefelau cymharol cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yn parhau i ddisgyn.

Fodd bynnag, y prif bryder yw'r anghydwysedd economaidd yng Nghymru rhwng y Cymoedd a gorllewin Cymru ar yr un llaw, a dwyrain Cymru, sy'n llawer mwy llewyrchus, ar y llaw arall. Pan fo lefel cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd gyda'r isaf yng ngorllewin Ewrop, mae clywed y Llywodraeth yn canmol llwyddiant ei hunain ar gyflwr yr economi yn anatyniadol ac anghyfrifol.

Mae gwendid sylfaenol yn sefyllfa economaidd gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Mae potensial gwirioneddol i'r ardaloedd hynny yn benodol elwa o weithgaredd caffael cenedlaethol y sector cyhoeddus. Awgrymaf y dylwn edrych yn benodol ar flaenoriaethu'r gwaith hwnnw o fewn ardal Amcan 1. Mae gan y sector cyhoeddus rôl hollbwysig yn y gwaith o lywio'r adfywiad economaidd yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Yn yr un modd ag y bydd polisi adleoli swyddi'r Cynulliad yn rhoi hwb i economïau Merthyr, Ceredigion a Chyffordd Llandudno, mae cyfle hefyd i bolisïau caffael roi hwb i'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn y sector bwyd, mewn canolfannau galw, yn y sector argraffu, yn y byd adeiladu ac yn y blaen.

Fodd bynnag, i wneud hynny, rhaid cofio bod

Elin Jones: There is a great deal of consensus among Members that local procurement and procurement within Wales is important to promote the economy and to reduce environmental damage. It is pity therefore, as Glyn Davies said, that the Government has proposed this motion. This issue could have gained cross-party support, but in its motion, the Government seeks to over-congratulate itself on the general state of the economy.

I am one of the first to acknowledge that some aspects of the economy are positive, particularly some of the employment and unemployment figures, but there are also weak aspects. There is a recession in the manufacturing industry, low wage levels, long-term unemployment, high levels of economic inactivity and the comparative gross domestic product per capita levels continue to fall.

However, the main concern is the lack of economic balance in Wales between the Valleys and west Wales on the one hand, and east Wales, which is far more prosperous, on the other. When the GDP per capita level of west Wales and the Valleys is among the lowest in Europe, hearing the Government congratulating itself on the state of the economy is unattractive and irresponsible.

There is a fundamental deficiency in the economic situation of west Wales and the Valleys. There is real potential for those areas in particular to benefit from national procurement in the public sector. I suggest that we should look specifically at prioritising that work within the Objective 1 area. The public sector has a crucial role to play in driving the economic regeneration of west Wales and the Valleys. In the same way as the Assembly's job relocation policy will boost the economies of Merthyr, Ceredigion and Llandudno Junction, there is an opportunity for procurement policies to provide a stimulus to west Wales and the Valleys in the food sector, in call centres, in the printing sector, in construction and so on.

However, to do that, we must bear in mind

maint busnesau yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd lawer yn llai yn gyffredinol na chwmnïau dinesig neu rhyngwladol. Felly, mae eu gallu i gystadlu am gytundebau mawr a bach yn llawer mwy cyfyng, fel y dywedodd Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey. Mae busnesau yn fy ardal innau wedi sôn wrthyf fod y broses o gystadlu am contract yn feichus. Nid oes gan y busnesau hynny yr adrannau tendro sydd gan rhai cwmnïau mawr, ac maent wedi llunio polisiau amgylcheddol, cyfle cyfartal ac ati, ac wedi ennill rhai gytundebau.

Mae cymal penodol yn y canllawiau tendro sy'n gweithio erbyn busnesau bach ym marn rhai rheolwyr busnes yn y Gorllewin. Mae'r cymal hwn yn cysylltu gwerth y cytundeb â throshiant y cwmni, sef yr hyn a elwir yn rheol gorddibyniaeth. Gan fod cwmnïau yn ardal Amcan 1 yn llai na'r cyfartaledd, mae'r rheol hon yn eu gosod dan anfantais yn syth, ac yn eu cau allan o ambell i gytundeb. Nid y troshiant ei hun sy'n bwysig, eithr sicrwydd ariannol y cwmni. Felly, Weinidog, a edrychwch ar y rheol hon yng nghyd-destun y tasglu sydd ar fin cael ei sefydlu? I alluogi busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint gystadlu, rhaid sicrhau nad oes rhwystrau diangen, fel yr un cyfeiriais ato, wedi'u gosod o fewn y system.

Gobeithio y bydd y gwaith yn bwrw ymlaen yn gyflym er lles yr economi a'r amgylchedd, ac y bydd cynnydd yn y nwyddau a'r gwasanaethau Cymreig a brynir drwy wariant cyhoeddus.

Sandy Mewies: My contribution will be brief, but, I hope, to the point.

Sustainable procurement is becoming a reality in Wales, particularly given the lead taken by the Welsh Assembly Government. The vision of a strong, prosperous and, most importantly, sustainable economy, as outlined in 'A Winning Wales', will be met in part by the adoption across the public and private sectors of procurement strategies that recognise the wealth of quality produce available near the point of consumption. I have been struck, as have others, by how close some of us are in this debate. There are differences with regard to how we will

that the size of businesses in west Wales and the Valleys is generally much smaller than urban or international companies. Therefore, their ability to compete for large or small contracts is far more restricted, as Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey mentioned. Businesses in my area have told me that the process of competing for these contracts is burdensome. Those businesses do not have the tendering departments that some large companies have, and they have prepared environmental and equality of opportunity policies and so on, and have already won contracts.

The tendering guidance contains a specific clause that militates against small businesses, in the view of some business managers in west Wales. This clause links the value of the contract to company turnover, which is called the over-reliance rule. Since companies in Objective 1 areas are smaller than average, this rule immediately places them at a disadvantage, and excludes them from certain contracts. It is not the turnover itself that is important, but rather the financial security of the company. Therefore, Minister, will you examine this rule in the context of the taskforce that is about to be established? In order for small and medium-sized enterprises to compete, we must ensure that unnecessary obstacles, such as the one I have alluded to, are not part of the system.

I hope that the work will progress rapidly for the benefit of the economy and the environment, and that public expenditure on Welsh goods and services will increase.

Sandy Mewies: Bydd fy nghyfraniad yn fyr, ond yn berthnasol, gobeithio.

Mae caffael cynaliadwy yn dechrau cael ei wireddu yng Nghymru, yn enwedig o ystyried arweiniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyn o beth. Caiff y weledigaeth o economi gref, economi ffyniannus ac, yn bwysicaf oll, economi gynaliadwy, fel y nodwyd yn 'Cymru'n Ennill' ei chyflawni'n rhannol drwy fabwysiadu strategaethau caffael ar draws y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat sy'n cydnabod y cyfoeth o gynnyrch o safon sydd ar gael yn lleol i ddefnyddwyr. Fe'm trawyd, fel y trawyd eraill, bod cymaint o gonsensws rhwng rhai ohonom yn y ddadl

achieve the goals, but we all agree on some common goals that should be achieved.

Setting the private sector aside, the public sector spends some £4 billion a year via procurement, which, at 11 per cent of Wales's GDP, is a significant sum. If a significant proportion of this money were spent sustainably, we would make great strides in meeting the goals of 'A Winning Wales'. We are making progress, and we have constantly supported the work of the Welsh Procurement Initiative on securing sustainable development within food chains. As a catalyst for change, the WPI does appear to be tackling such issues as the need to improve the relationship between procurement in the public and private sector, and the need to ensure that sustainable development principles play their proper role in the procurement process. The WPI's work with the food sector should be applauded. For example, the pathfinder project is helping small and medium-sized food suppliers to compete for, and win, public sector contracts, and attempts to create a level playing field, which, in part, is what these suppliers require. I also welcome the news that the Minister will soon launch guidance notes covering how the Welsh public sector can rethink its approach to food procurement. While I understand that we must operate within legislation, I hope that authorities will be encouraged to approach this matter in an innovative way, and to seek means to work together to maximise what they do.

Any public procurement initiatives taken by the Welsh Assembly Government must operate within a myriad of European rules. However, other European countries such as Italy appear to make procurement strategies work in their favour. While I realise that we cannot evade the rules, and that we should be bound by them, I hope that we take further action to examine how we can operate within European law and yet try to ensure that procurement gives an advantage to our suppliers. The goals of sustainable procurement are worth working towards, though they cover much more than just food procurement. However, it is via food

hon. Mae gwahaniaeth barn o ran sut y byddwn yn cyflawni'r nodau, ond cytuna pawb ar rai nodau cyffredin y dylid eu cyflawni.

Ac anwybyddu'r sector preifat am y tro, mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn gwario tua £4 biliwn y flwyddyn drwy gaffael, sydd, ar 11 y cant o CMC Cymru, yn swm sylweddol. Pe bai canran sylweddol o'r arian hwn yn cael ei gwario mewn ffordd gynaliadwy, byddem yn cymryd camau breision i gyflawni nodau 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd, ac yr ydym bob amser wedi cefnogi gwaith Menter Gaffael Cymru i sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy o fewn cadwyni bwyd. Fel ysgogydd newid, ymddengys bod y fenter yn mynd i'r afael â materion megis yr angen i wella'r berthynas rhwng caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, a'r angen i sicrhau bod egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy yn chwarae rhan briodol yn y broses gaffael. Dylid canmol gwaith y fenter gyda'r sector bwyd. Er enghraifft, mae'r prosiect braenaru yn helpu cyflenwyr bwyd bach a chanolig eu maint i gystadlu am gcontractau'r sector cyhoeddus a'u hennill, ac mae'n ceisio creu'r un amodau i bawb, sef yr hyn sydd ei angen, i raddau, ar y cyflenwyr hyn. Croesawaf hefyd y newyddion y bydd y Gweinidog yn lansio nodiadau canllaw cyn bo hir ar sut y gall y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ailystyried y ffordd y mae'n caffael bwyd. Er y deallaf fod yn rhaid inni weithredu'n unol â'r ddeddfwriaeth, gobeithiaf y bydd awdurdodau yn cael eu hannog i arloesi yn hyn o beth, ac i geisio dod o hyd i ffyrdd o gydweithio er mwyn cael y budd mwyaf posibl o'r hyn a wnânt.

Rhaid i unrhyw fentrau caffael cyhoeddus gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithredu o fewn myrdd o reolau Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys bod gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop, megis yr Eidal, yn llunio strategaethau caffael sy'n fanteisiol iddynt. Er y sylweddolaf na allwn dorri'r rheolau, ac y dylent fod yn gyfrwymol, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gweithredu eto i archwilio sut y gallwn weithredu'n unol â'r ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd tra'n ceisio sicrhau bod caffael yn rhoi mantais i'n cyflenwyr. Mae nodau caffael cynaliadwy yn werth anelu atynt, er eu bod yn cwmpasu llawer mwy na chaffael bwyd. Fodd bynnag, ym maes caffael bwyd

procurement that we are beginning to make a real difference. Hopefully, this best practice will spread across other areas, where the sustainable benefits will be more fully felt.

Mick Bates: I am sure that many of those listening to this debate who are engaged in the belief and practice of local procurement, will feel a certain sense of frustration. There has been fine rhetoric—I think it was the Minister for Economic Development Transport who used the phrase, ‘today’s vision in tomorrow’s reality’.

4.10 p.m.

I remind people that this process has been going on for some time, and that much of the work was born out of local agenda 21. All authorities appointed a local agenda 21 officer, who tried to implement the agenda’s principles. To cite an example from my authority, Powys, a process of food links was born. As many people have said, food is one of the biggest drivers of local procurement, where we can gain full benefit of the multiplier effect, a principle of which we are all aware, whereby every £1 spent can give a return of up to £25, although the generally accepted figure is around £6.

Our amendments 4, 5, and 6 recognise both the good work that has been undertaken and the frustration of authorities. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that further progress is dependent on a duty being placed on ASPBs and local authorities to report on their progress in this regard annually, because there is a limit to the work that can be done voluntarily. Although some people seem to think that European procurement is a mystery, and not well understood, we have had a good understanding of European procurement rules for many years. There are three tiers of procurement, and if the project is under a certain value—around £5,000—it can be sourced locally without national procurement or recourse to the *Official Journal of the European Communities*. These issues are well known; Alun Ffred cited his authority, which has understood them for a long time, and taken the lead in local procurement. The problem is that local authorities, like the Government here, are

yr ydym yn dechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr arfer gorau hwn yn lledaenu i feysydd eraill, lle y bydd manteision cynaliadwy yn cael mwy o effaith.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o’r bobl sy’n gwrando ar y ddadl hon ac sy’n credu mewn caffael lleol ac sy’n ei arfer, yn teimlo rhywfaint o rwystredigaeth. Cawsom rethreg wych —credaf mai’r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth a ddefyddiodd yr ymadrodd, ‘troi gweledigaeth heddiw yn realiti yfory’.

Hoffwn atgoffa pobl fod y broses hon wedi bod ar waith ers peth amser, a bod llawer o’r gwaith yn deillio o agenda 21 leol. Penododd pob awdurdod swyddog agenda 21 leol, a geisiodd weithredu egwyddorion yr agenda. I roi enghraifft o’r hawdurdod i, Powys, sefydlwyd proses o gysylltiadau bwyd. Fel y dywedodd llawer o bobl, mae bwyd yn un o ysgogwyr mwyaf caffael lleol, lle y gallwn fanteisio’n llawn ar yr effaith luosi, sef egwyddor sy’n gyfarwydd i bob un ohonom, lle y gall pob £1 a werir ddwyn elw o hyd at £25, er mai tua £6 yw’r ffigur a dderbynnir yn gyffredinol.

Mae ein gwelliannau 4, 5 a 6 yn cydnabod y gwaith da a wnaed a rhwystredigaeth awdurdodau. Cred Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru na fydd rhagor o gynnydd oni osodir dyletswydd ar CCNC ac awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno adroddiad ar y cynnydd a wnânt yn hyn o beth bob blwyddyn, oherwydd mae terfyn i’r gwaith y gellir ei wneud yn wirfoddol. Er bod rhai pobl, mae’n debyg, yn meddwl bod caffael Ewropeaidd yn ddirgelwch, nad yw wedi’i ddeall yn dda, yr ydym wedi deall rheolau caffael Ewropeaidd yn dda ers blynyddoedd lawer. Mae i gaffael dair haen, ac os yw’r prosiect yn werth llai na swm penodol—tua £5,000—gellir defnyddio ffynhonnell leol heb orfod caffael yn genedlaethol na hysbysebu yng Nghyfnodolyn Swyddogol y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd. Mae’r materion hyn yn hysbys iawn. Cyfeiriodd Alun Ffred at ei awdurdod ef, sydd wedi’u deall ers amser maith, ac sydd wedi arwain o ran caffael lleol. Y broblem yw bod awdurdodau

getting lazy. They are not prepared to place a duty on the public bodies that we control to ensure that they report to us annually. At first, they could simply report on local food procurement, and then extend reporting to all areas of procurement. It would be admirable for the Government to ensure that.

If you want to talk to people about this, go to Powys, because we have many fine examples of local procurement. The forerunner to the local health board ran a project for two years on local food procurement in a hospital. There were some tremendous conclusions as a result, and we understood the procurement process. However, as local government lost funding, it was unable to provide the support, advice and co-ordination that are necessary for small producers. As those of us who have attempted this for many years are aware, continuity of supply is crucial. To address that, the Government must enable the process of supply to be robust, so that local authorities, schools and hospitals know that when they sign a contract, they will receive what they signed up for. At the moment, that is not possible. In Powys, for example, we do not have the funds to continue with the good work that has been undertaken over the last six or seven years. Amendment 6 calls for sustainable funding, which every authority would welcome. You know that local government is hard-pressed from your experience of local government finance, Minister. For a small investment, perhaps one job in each authority to assist with the arrangements for regular supply, you would get an immense return.

You must be able to measure the impact of this. Placing a duty on ASPBs and local authorities would be a start, but we also need recourse to better measurements. Glyn Davies referred to GDP earlier, but GDP has many other impacts that we do not take into account at the moment. Therefore, I suggest that we also need to look at the indicators. The index of sustainable economic welfare is under discussion; you should support it and say that it would provide an excellent indicator of where we need to go in the

lleol, fel y Llywodraeth yn y fan hon, yn mynd yn ddiog. Nid ydynt yn barod i roi dyletswydd ar y cyrff cyhoeddus yr ydym yn eu rheoli i sicrhau eu bod yn cyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol inni. I ddechrau, gallent gyflwyno adroddiad ar gaffael bwyd lleol yn unig, ac yna estyn cwmpas yr adroddiadau i bob maes caffael. Byddai'n beth clodwiw pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn sicrhau hynny.

Os ydych am siarad â phobl am hyn, ewch i Bowys, oherwydd mae gennym sawl enghraifft dda o gaffael lleol. Cynhaliodd rhagflaenydd y bwrdd iechyd lleol brosiect am ddwy flynedd ar gaffael bwyd lleol mewn ysbyty. Cyflawnwyd pethau gwych o ganlyniad, ac yr oeddem yn deall y broses gaffael. Fodd bynnag, wrth i lywodraeth leol golli cyllid, nid oedd yn gallu rhoi'r cymorth a'r cyngor a gwneud y gwaith cydlynus sydd eu hangen ar gyfer cynhyrchwyr bach. Fel y gwyr y rhai hynny ohonom sydd wedi ceisio gwneud hyn ers blynyddoedd lawer, mae parhad cyflenwad yn hollbwysig. Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â hynny, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ei gwneud yn bosibl i'r broses gyflenwi fod yn gadarn, fel y bydd awdurdodau lleol, ysgolion ac ysbytai yn gwybod pan fyddant yn llofnodi contract, y byddant yn cael yr hyn y maent wedi cytuno arno. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw hynny'n bosibl. Ym Mhowys, er enghraifft, nid oes gennym y cyllid i barhau â'r gwaith da a wnaed dros y chwech neu saith mlynedd diwethaf. Mae gwelliant 6 yn galw am gyllid cynaliadwy, rhywbeth y byddai pob awdurdod yn ei groesawu. Fe wyddoch fod llywodraeth leol o dan bwysau mawr o'ch profiad o gyllid llywodraeth leol, Weinidog. Am fuddsoddiad bach, efallai un swydd ym mhob awdurdod i gynorthwyo gyda'r trefniadau ar gyfer cyflenwad rheolaidd, byddech yn elwa'n fawr iawn.

Rhaid bod modd ichi fesur effaith hyn. Byddai gosod dyletswydd ar CCNC ac awdurdodau lleol yn fan cychwyn, ond mae angen inni hefyd droi at fesuriadau gwell. Cyfeiriodd Glyn Davies at CMC yn gynharach, ond mae CMC yn cael sawl effaith arall nad ydym yn eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd. Felly, awgrymaf fod angen inni edrych ar y dangosyddion. Trafodir y mynegai lles economaidd cynaliadwy ar hyn o bryd; dylech ei gefnogi a dweud y byddai'n ddangosydd ardderchog o ble y mae angen

future.

Lorraine Barrett: There is a danger, when we discuss this issue, for the debate to become too narrow. We must not lose sight of the bigger picture. Value for money should not just be about price. If procurement is to be sustainable, it must also reflect fair and ethical trading practices, to which Jenny Randerson referred earlier. As politicians we often use the term 'fair trade', but it is important that we remind ourselves what it means. It is about helping producers and workers in developing countries and helping excluded and disadvantaged producers, including independent, small farmers, to access the international markets and receive a fair price for their products. Alun Ffred Jones talked of procuring all-Wales-produced food for schools. We discussed that at the last Local Government and Public Services Committee meeting, where I said that I think that we need to be big enough to embrace the developing countries and help them with the produce that we cannot grow, such as bananas. We must look to the wider world, as well as helping companies in Wales.

One area that I think has been slightly overlooked in this motion is the need to ensure decent working conditions and fair wages for our workers. Sustainable procurement should be about ensuring fairer employment clauses in all contracts. That way, we would ensure that procuring or outsourcing services does not drive down—

Alun Ffred Jones: Just to clarify, we cannot grow all the food that we need in Wales. Very few bananas, for example, grow in Gwynedd at present, but we are working on it.

Lorraine Barrett: I look forward to that day, but I would still want to buy some Fairtrade bananas from developing countries. We should share our wealth.

It is important that we do not drive down the terms and conditions of service for staff employed by contractors who work for the National Assembly for Wales. These staff

inni fynd yn y dyfodol.

Lorraine Barrett: Wrth drafod y mater hwn, mae perygl i'r ddadl fynd yn rhy gul. Rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar y darlun mawr. Ni ddylai gwerth am arian olygu pris yn unig. Er mwyn i gaffael fod yn gynaliadwy, rhaid iddo hefyd adlewyrchu arferion masnachu teg a moesegol, y cyfeiriodd Jenny Randerson atynt yn gynharach. Fel gwleidyddion yr ydym yn aml yn defnyddio'r term 'masnach deg', ond mae'n bwysig inni ein hatgoffa ein hunain beth mae'n ei olygu. Mae'n golygu helpu cynhyrchwyr a gweithwyr mewn gwledydd sy'n datblygu a helpu cynhyrchwyr sydd wedi'u hallgáu ac sydd o dan anfantaes, gan gynnwys ffermwyr annibynnol bach, i gael mynediad i farchnadoedd rhyngwladol a phris teg am eu cynnyrch. Soniodd Alun Ffred Jones am gaffael bwyd a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru yn unig i ysgolion. Bu inni drafod hynny yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, lle y dywedais fod angen inni fod yn ddigon rhadlon, yn fy marn i, i groesawu'r gwledydd sy'n datblygu a'u helpu gyda'r cynnyrch na allwn ei dyfu, megis bananas. Rhaid inni edrych ar y byd i gyd, yn ogystal â helpu cwmnïau yng Nghymru.

Un maes sydd wedi cael ei anwybyddu i ryw raddau yn y cynnig hwn yn fy marn i yw sicrhau amodau gwaith safonol a chyflogau teg i'n gweithwyr. Dylai caffael cynaliadwy ymwneud â sicrhau cymalau cyflogaeth decach ym mhob contract. Drwy hynny, byddem yn sicrhau nad yw caffael neu ddarparu gwasanaethau'n allanol yn gwaethygu—

Alun Ffred Jones: I roi eglurhad, ni allwn dyfu'r holl fwyd sydd ei angen arnom yng Nghymru. Ychydig iawn o fananas, er enghraifft, sy'n tyfu yng Ngwynedd ar hyn o bryd, ond yr ydym yn gweithio ar hynny.

Lorraine Barrett: Edrychaf ymlaen at weld hynny, ond byddwn yn dal i ddymuno prynu rhai bananas Masnach Deg o wledydd sy'n datblygu. Dylem rannu ein cyfoeth.

Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn gwaethygu telerau ac amodau gwasanaeth i staff a gyflogir gan gontractwyr sy'n gweithio i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Dylai'r

should be employed under terms and conditions of service that are in line with those for equivalent staff employed directly by the Assembly. I am sure that the Minister will be aware of the efforts of the London mayor to ensure that a fair employment policy is applied to service contracts awarded by the Greater London Authority. Experience in London has shown that, while a blanket policy of not inviting or considering tenders from contractors unwilling to agree to fair employment clauses in their contracts would be unlawful, it is possible to put into effect the policy of including fair employment clauses in those contracts by having regard, and giving some weight, to a contractor's attitude to fair employment clauses, during the evaluation of tenders. I ask the Minister to consider the London example to ensure that the fair employment issue becomes central to our procurement of goods and services.

David Lloyd: It is often asked why we cannot get food from local farmers and local businesses for our schools and hospitals. The answer usually given, as we have already heard, is 'because of European law'—European Union directives that are supposed to ensure non-discrimination across the board. However, as Sandy mentioned, many other countries, such as France and Italy, interpret these EU regulations far more creatively than we do. Italy, for instance, has already legislated at national and regional levels to enable the public catering service to use local food. Welsh public agencies spend £60 million on food each year. If the current provision of food for our schools and hospitals was universally excellent, I would say no more about it, but, patently, and as we continue to hear, that is not the case. We need to be far more creative with European procurement directives in order to favour the procurement of local food for a whole host of economic, quality, social and environmental reasons to which the Minister alluded earlier—and even incorporate social and environmental impacts into procurement procedures.

aelodau hyn o staff gael eu cyflogi o dan delerau ac amodau gwasanaeth sy'n unol â thelerau ac amodau gwasanaeth staff cyfatebol a gyflogir yn uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwŷr y Gweinidog am ymdrechion maer Llundain i sicrhau y caiff polisi cyflogaeth deg ei gymhwyso i gontractau gwasanaeth a roddir gan Awdurdod Llundain Fwyaf. Dengys profiad Llundain, er y byddai polisi cyffredinol o beidio â gwahodd neu ystyried tendrau gan gontractwyr nad ydynt yn fodlon cytuno ar gymalau cyflogaeth deg yn eu contractau yn anghyfreithlon, ei bod yn bosibl gweithredu'r polisi o gynnwys cymalau cyflogaeth deg yn y contractau hynny drwy roi sylw i agwedd contractwr tuag at gymalau cyflogaeth deg a rhoi pwys ar hynny wrth werthuso tendrau. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried enghraifft Llundain i sicrhau bod cyflogaeth deg yn dod yn rhan ganolog o'n proses o gaffael nwyddau a gwasanaethau.

David Lloyd: Gofynnir yn aml pam na allwn gaffael bwyd oddi wrth ffermwyr a busnesau lleol i'n hysgolion a'n hysbytai. Yr ateb a roddir fel arfer, fel yr ydym wedi clywed eisoes, yw 'deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd'—cyfarwyddebau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd y bwriedir iddynt sicrhau nad oes unrhyw gamwahaniaethu yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, fel y soniodd Sandy, mae llawer o wledydd eraill, megis Ffrainc a'r Eidal, yn dehongli'r rheoliadau hyn o eiddo'r UE yn llawer mwy creadigol na ninnau. Mae'r Eidal, er enghraifft, eisoes wedi deddfu'n genedlaethol ac yn rhanbarthol i'w gwneud yn bosibl i'r gwasanaeth arlwygo cyhoeddus ddefnyddio bwydydd lleol. Mae asiantaethau cyhoeddus Cymru yn gwario £60 miliwn ar fwyd bob blwyddyn. Pe bai'r bwyd a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd yn ein hysgolion a'n hysbytai yn ardderchog drwyddi draw, ni fyddwn yn sôn mwy am y mater, ond, yn amlwg, ac fel yr ydym yn parhau i glywed, nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae angen inni fod yn llawer mwy creadigol gyda'r cyfarwyddebau caffael Ewropeaidd er mwyn ffafrio caffael bwyd lleol am lu o resymau economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol ac o ran ansawdd y cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog atynt yn gynharach—a hyd yn oed ymgorffori effeithiau cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol yn y gweithdrefnau caffael.

There is an urgent need for more training and development of the procurement professionals so that they understand the European legal requirements and have confidence in applying them. There is also an urgent need to educate food suppliers in how they can successfully bid for procurement business as single suppliers or as part of a consortium. All this is being done elsewhere, in Italy and France for example, and we need to emphasise quality food as opposed to cheap food. Quality means organic, fresh and fair trade, as Lorraine mentioned.

We all know about spiralling obesity, that cases of diabetes are increasing and that doctors are now diagnosing type 2 maturity onset diabetes in teenagers. This is all diet-related and is the result of too much processed food, food that is high in salt and fat, junk food, and too many sugary soft drinks. What food do we find in our schools today? I have valuable research staff—my three children—and they have listed, in preparation for this speech, what is available: burgers, pizza, chips, sausages and doughnuts. Our private finance initiative schools insist on supplying sugary soft drinks. Let us have some joined-up thinking and let us see the bigger picture.

4.20 p.m.

We certainly need to consider quality and quantity in relation to hospital food. I marvel at studies that reveal malnutrition in hospital patients—you need to read them. There is an all-Wales procurement strategy in the NHS that mitigates against local procurement and fair trade. How does this fit with the Minister's announcement today?

The present procurement system largely mitigates against healthy life choices. There are excellent examples of good practice in some local authorities, to which Mick alluded—in Rhondda Cynon Taf and Caerphilly councils especially. That is not true of all local authorities. Those two

Mae angen brys am ragor o hyfforddi a datblygu ymhlith y gweithwyr proffesiynol caffael fel y gallant ddeall y gofynion cyfreithiol Ewropeaidd, a bod yn hyderus wrth eu cymhwysu. Mae angen brys hefyd i addysgu cyflenwyr bwyd o ran sut y gallant wneud cais am fusnes caffael fel cyflenwyr unigol neu fel rhan o gonsortium yn llwyddiannus. Gwneir hyn mewn gwledydd eraill, yn yr Eidal ac yn Ffrainc, er enghraifft, ac mae angen inni bwysleisio ansawdd bwyd yn hytrach na bwyd rhad. Mae ansawdd yn golygu bwydydd organig a ffres a bwydydd masnach deg, fel y soniodd Lorraine.

Gwyddom oll am y cynnydd mawr mewn gordewdra, fod cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o ddiabetes, a bod meddygon erbyn hyn yn canfod diabetes math 2 sy'n digwydd i bobl mewn oed fel arfer ymhlith pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau. Mae hyn i gyd yn ymwneud â deiet ac mae wedi'i achosi gan ormod o fwydydd proses, bwyd â llawer o halen ynddo, bwydydd sothach a gormod o ddiodydd meddal, llawn siwgr. Pa fwydydd a welwn yn ein hysgolion heddiw? Mae gennyf staff ymchwil gwerthfawr—tri o blant—ac er mwyn helpu i baratoi ar gyfer yr araith hon maent wedi rhestru'r hyn sydd ar gael: byrgers, pizza, sglodion, selsig a thoesenni. Mae ein hysgolion menter cyllid preifat yn mynnu cyflenwi diodydd meddal, llawn siwgr. Gadewch inni ddechrau meddwl yn gydgyssylltiedig a gweld y darlun mawr.

Yn sicr, mae angen inni ystyried ansawdd a maint mewn cysylltiad â bwyd ysbyty. Rhyfeddaf at yr astudiaethau sy'n datgelu diffyg maeth ymhlith cleifion ysbyty—mae angen ichi eu darllen. Mae strategaeth gaffael i Gymru gyfan yn y GIG sy'n milwrio'n erbyn caffael lleol a masnach deg. Sut y mae hyn yn cydweddu â chyhoeddiad y Gweinidog heddiw?

Mae'r system gaffael bresennol yn milwrio'n erbyn dewisiadau byw'n iach i raddau helaeth. Ceir enghreifftiau ardderchog o arfer da mewn rhai awdurdodau lleol y cyfeiriodd Mick atynt—yng nghyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf a chyngor Caerffili yn enwedig. Nid yw hynny'n wir am bob awdurdod. Yr oedd y

examples were in Andrew Davies's prepared speech, but he curiously forgot to mention them when he was speaking earlier. The fast food and soft drink industries have enormous vested interests, which the Government will have to confront if it is serious about health and wellbeing. Global multinational or local supplier—which is it to be? The provision of free school breakfasts offer a chance to put theories into practice. Nutritious food from local farms, or Kellogg's multinational corn flakes of dubious nutritional value—which is it to be?

A few weeks ago in the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee, we heard that the Government will not define local people for the purposes of affordable housing, despite the fact that other countries define local people. Last week, during Helen Mary Jones's debate on second homes under Standing Order No. 31, we heard that the Government will not define second homes, despite the fact that they are defined elsewhere. Do not tell me that Government will not define local procurement either, despite the fact that local procurement can be defined in countries such as Italy and France, to which the same EU regulations apply. Our health statistics, in terms of obesity and diabetes, demand urgent action. Do not just talk about sustainable procurement. It is time to do something about it.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): There have been many interesting contributions. The thread running through many contributions was the inference that we are talking and not doing anything. I must disabuse you of that misconception. A lot is happening on the ground across Wales and, as some contributors said, has been for some time. I can give you a list, but I will choose just one important issue that has been mentioned, namely fair trade.

Many speakers mentioned fair trade, including Lorraine, and I will run through what we are doing on that. The procurement organisation has recently circulated guidance to the Welsh public sector on fair and ethical trading. The Welsh Procurement Initiative

ddwy enghraifft hynny yn yr araith a baratowyd gan Andrew Davies, ond, yn rhyfedd iawn, anghofiodd sôn amdanynt pan oedd yn siarad yn gynharach. Mae gan y diwydiant bwydydd brys a'r diwydiant diodydd meddal fuddiannau enfawr o ran hyn, y bydd yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth eu herio os yw o ddifrif ynglŷn ag iechyd a lles. Cwmnïau amlwladol byd-eang ynteu cyflenwr lleol—pa un a gaiff ei ddewis? Mae darparu brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion yn gyfle i roi damcaniaethau ar waith. Bwyd maethlon o ffermydd lleol, ynteu creision yd y cwmni amlwladol Kelloggs y mae eu gwerth maethol yn amheus—pa un a gaiff ei ddewis?

Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, clywsom na fydd y Llywodraeth yn diffinio pobl leol at ddibenion tai fforddiadwy, er bod gwledydd eraill yn diffinio pobl leol. Yr wythnos diwethaf, yn ystod dadl Helen Mary Jones ar ail gartrefi o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, clywsom na fydd y Llywodraeth yn diffinio ail gartrefi, er y'u diffinnir mewn mannau eraill. Peidiwch â dweud wrthyf na fydd y Llywodraeth yn diffinio caffael lleol ychwaith, er y gellir diffinio caffael lleol mewn gwledydd megis yr Eidal a Ffrainc, y mae'r un rheoliadau o dan yr UE yn gymwys iddynt. Mae ein hystadegau iechyd o ran gordewdra a diabetes yn gofyn am weithredu ar fyrder. Rhaid ichi wneud mwy na siarad am gaffael cynaliadwy. Mae'n bryd ichi weithredu yn ei gylch.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Gwnaed llawer o gyfraniadau diddorol. Y thema gyffredin mewn sawl un o'r cyfraniadau oedd y casgliad mai dim ond siarad yr ydym ac nad ydym yn gwneud dim. Rhaid imi gywiro'r camsyniad hwnnw. Mae llawer yn digwydd ar lawr gwlad ledled Cymru ac, fel y dywedodd rhai cyfranwyr, mae wedi bod yn digwydd ers amser. Gallaf roi rhestr ichi, ond dewisaf un eitem bwysig a grybwyllwyd, sef masnach deg.

Cyfeiriodd llawer o siaradwyr at fasnach deg, gan gynnwys Lorraine, a nodaf yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yn hynny o beth. Mae'r sefydliad caffael wedi dosbarthu canllawiau i'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â masnachu teg a

will issue comprehensive guidance on all aspects of sustainable procurement, including fair trade, later this year, backed up by workshops. We are in close discussion with Oxfam Cymru on that. The training courses programme includes three courses scheduled for autumn 2004 on sustainable procurement, including fair trade, and current reviews of procurement procedures by our own unit will address the sustainability issues of fair trade. We are considering mainstreaming that in local government, and we are considering various initiatives that will pull that through. That is just one area where a considerable amount of work is going on, so please do not leave at the end of this debate and say that nothing is happening.

However, I am the first to admit that we need to mainstream many of the things that we know we can work through, and do so all the way through the public sector procurement initiative. First, I will consider some of the barriers, many of which have been mentioned. The legal barrier is, and has been, quite a deterrent to many organisations. As many contributors have said, we need to operate to the outmost limits of those boundaries to ensure that we are creative. However, many small organisations do not have the wherewithal to do that preliminary work. Therefore, that kind of legal guidance and back-up is important.

Secondly, if we are to source locally, we must match the demand within the public sector with the supply in Wales. That is at the heart of the taskforce that Andrew is leading. It is ensuring that the supply chain is in place and that suppliers in Wales can use the capacity of the procurement process. A national procurement website has already been set up and many people and suppliers have registered already, and many connections have been made. We are not talking about it; we are doing it. These connections are being made.

Thirdly, on the issue of best practice, I agree

moesegol. Bydd Menter Gaffael Cymru yn rhoi canllawiau cynhwysfawr ar bob agwedd ar gaffael cynaliadwy, gan gynnwys masnach deg, yn ddiweddarach yn ystod y flwyddyn, wedi'u hategu gan weithdai. Yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaethau manwl gydag Oxfam Cymru ar hynny. Mae rhaglen y cyrsiau hyfforddi yn cynnwys tri chwrs sydd wedi'u trefnu ar gyfer hydref 2004 ar gaffael cynaliadwy, gan gynnwys masnach deg, a bydd yr adolygiadau o weithdrefnau caffael a gynhelir gan ein huned ein hunain ar hyn o bryd yn mynd i'r afael â chynaliadwyedd masnach deg. Yr ydym yn ystyried prif ffrydio hynny mewn llywodraeth leol, ac yr ydym yn ystyried mentrau amrywiol a fydd yn cyflawni hynny. Dyna un maes yn unig lle mae cryn waith yn cael ei wneud, felly peidiwch â gadael ar ddiwedd y ddadl hon gan ddweud nad oes dim byd yn digwydd.

Fodd bynnag, fi yw'r cyntaf i gyfaddef fod angen inni brif ffrydio llawer o'r pethau y gwyddom y gallwn eu cyflwyno'n llwyddiannus, a gwneud hynny ym mhob rhan o fenter gaffael y sector cyhoeddus. Yn gyntaf, ystyriaf rai o'r rhwystrau, y crybwyllwyd llawer ohonynt. Bu'r rhwystr cyfreithiol yn gryn rwystr i lawer o sefydliadau ac erys yn rhwystr. Fel y dywedodd llawer o gyfranwyr, mae angen inni weithredu i eithafion y ffiniau hynny er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn greadigol. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gan sefydliadau bach yr adnoddau i wneud y gwaith rhagarweiniol hwnnw. Felly, mae'r math hwnnw o arweiniad cyfreithiol a chefnogaeth yn bwysig.

Yn ail, os ydym yn mynd i ddefnyddio ffynonellau lleol, rhaid inni ateb y galw o fewn y sector cyhoeddus gyda'r cyflenwad yng Nghymru. Mae hynny wrth wraidd y tasglu y mae Andrew yn ei arwain. Mae'n sicrhau bod y gadwyn gyflenwi ar waith ac y gall cyflenwyr yng Nghymru ddefnyddio'r broses gaffael. Mae gwefan gaffael genedlaethol wedi'i sefydlu ac mae llawer o bobl a chyflenwyr wedi ymgofrestru eisoes, ac mae llawer o gysylltiadau wedi'u gwneud. Nid siarad am wneud pethau yr ydym; yr ydym yn eu gwneud. Mae'r cysylltiadau hyn yn cael eu gwneud.

Yn drydydd, o ran arfer gorau, cytunaf â'r

with what Alun Ffred said—I do not agree with everything that he said; he would be surprised if I did—in that we must distribute best practice and ensure that we transfer the lessons learned and the experience gained across the board. We have not been very good at doing that in the past. We must ensure that successful examples across all areas in Wales are transferred.

On training, I assure Members that the procurement board includes the private sector, elements of the public sector and representatives from the procurement initiatives that we have set up. We have few procurement officers in Wales. One authority is doing extremely well, but some are not. We have a real gap in training, and gaps in terms of ability to deliver on the ground. Therefore, we are considering how we might do that using the expertise that is available, and seeing whether we can ensure that there is collaboration. Elin mentioned the over-reliance rule; I will consider that to see whether it is an important factor.

It is not fair to be completely negative about this. We are tackling an issue that is fairly new to us, and we are still learning about it. There are many examples of where we are using our policies, such as in terms of waste: a recycling initiative has been established and the materials being supplied are being matched up with the industries and enterprises that can use them. That is one good example—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up.

Sue Essex: There are two important points that we must remember. First, there is the importance of collaboration, and people working together and sharing good practice, resources and supplies—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up.

Sue Essex: We must also use our resources and knowledge in initiatives and mainstream good practice throughout Wales.

hyn a ddywedodd Alun Ffred—ni chytunaf â phopeth a ddywedodd: byddai'n synnu pe bawn wedi dweud hynny—yn yr ystyr bod yn rhaid inni ledaenu arfer gorau a sicrhau ein bod yn trosglwyddo'r gwersi a ddysgwyd a'r profiad a gafwyd ar draws y sector. Nid ydym wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny bob tro yn y gorffennol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod enghreifftiau llwyddiannus ym mhob maes yng Nghymru yn cael eu trosglwyddo.

O ran hyfforddiant, rhoddaf sicrwydd i'r Aelodau fod y bwrdd caffael yn cynnwys y sector preifat, elfennau o'r sector cyhoeddus a chynrychiolwyr o'r mentrau caffael a sefydlwyd gennym. Dim ond nifer fach o swyddogion caffael sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Mae un o'r awdurdodau'n gwneud yn arbennig o dda, ond nid yw eraill yn gwneud cystal. Mae bwlch gwirioneddol o ran hyfforddiant, ac mae bylchau o ran y gallu i gyflawni ar lawr gwlad. Felly, yr ydym yn ystyried sut y gallem wneud hynny drwy ddefnyddio'r arbenigedd sydd ar gael, a gweld a allwn sicrhau bod cydweithredu. Soniodd Elin am y rheol gorddibyniaeth; fe'i hystyriaif i weld a yw'n ffactor pwysig.

Nid yw'n deg bod yn gwbl negyddol ynglŷn â hyn. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â mater sy'n weddol newydd inni, ac yr ydym yn dal i ddysgu amdano. Ceir llawer o enghreifftiau lle yr ydym yn defnyddio ein polisiau, megis o ran gwastraff: sefydlwyd menter ailgylchu ac mae'r defnyddiau a gyflenwir yn cael eu paru â'r diwydiannau a'r mentrau sy'n gallu eu defnyddio. Dyna un enghraifft dda—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

Sue Essex: Mae dau bwynt pwysig y mae'n rhaid inni eu cofio. Yn gyntaf, pwysigrwydd cydweithredu, a phobl yn cydweithio ac yn rhannu arferion da, adnoddau a chyflenwadau—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

Sue Essex: Rhaid inni hefyd ddefnyddio ein hadnoddau a'n gwybodaeth mewn mentrau a phrif ffrydio arferion da ledled Cymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call for a vote. If amendment 1 is carried amendment 2 will fall.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais. Os derbynnir gwelliant 1 bydd gwelliant 2 yn methu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann

Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 3: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

4.30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 4: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine

Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 5: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment defeated.

Gwelliant 6: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.

Amendment 6: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment defeated.

Cynnig (NDM1971): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.

Motion (NDM1971): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 9.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Lisa Francis: Point of order. I believe that the voting equipment did not register my vote on amendment 2, therefore I wish to state that I had intended to vote for this amendment.

Lisa Francis: Pwynt o drefn. Credaf na chofnododd yr offer pleidleisio fy mhleidlais ar welliant 2, felly hoffwn ddatgan fy mod yn bwriadu pleidleisio o blaid y gwelliant hwn.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Your comments will be included in the Record. However, in future, if the vote is open and you are unable to vote, I would be obliged if you were to raise a point of order at the time, before I declare the result. The result of this vote must stand.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Caiff eich sylwadau eu cynnwys yn y Cofnod. Fodd bynnag, yn y dyfodol, os yw'r bleidlais yn agored ac na allwch bleidleisio, byddai'n dda gennyf pe baech yn codi pwynt o drefn ar y pryd cyn imi ddatgan y canlyniad. Rhaid i ganlyniad y bleidlais hon aros fel y mae.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Cyllid ar gyfer Ysgolion Cymru Funding for Welsh Schools

Mick Bates: I have agreed to give a minute of my time to Eleanor Burnham, Jeff Cuthbert, Mark Isherwood and Janet Ryder.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf wedi cytuno i roi munud o'm hamser i Eleanor Burnham, Jeff Cuthbert, Mark Isherwood a Janet Ryder.

I have chosen to speak about funding for Welsh schools in response to the continuing anxiety expressed by everyone involved in education—headteachers, governors, parents, councillors and local education authorities. We are all aware of the many issues surrounding the local government settlement, the reduction in funding for grants for

Yr wyf wedi dewis siarad am gyllid ar gyfer ysgolion Cymru mewn ymateb i'r pryder parhaus a fynegir gan bawb ym maes addysg—penaethiaid, llywodraethwyr, rhieni, cynghorwyr ac awdurdodau addysg lleol. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol o'r materion niferus sy'n ymwneud â setliad llywodraeth leol, y gostyngiad yn y cyllid ar

education support and training, the reduction in the General Teaching Council for Wales's budget, the problems of further education, about which we heard yesterday, the school buildings initiative, and the survival of rural schools.

I wish to concentrate on evidence, not theory. It is important to ask what is really happening. I conducted a survey of headteachers in Montgomeryshire in April, and I have their responses with me. I hope that this debate will focus on the transparency and stability of school funding. All Assembly Members visit schools and colleges, and I am sure that there is nothing but praise for the work undertaken by the teaching profession, classroom assistants, office staff, caretakers and everyone else involved in education. We all have ears to hear their voices, but do we listen? I am sure that we have all received replies from the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning telling us how well off our schools are when we inquire about funding. However, when I visit schools, I hear a different story. I am informed of the pressures on budgets, the potential loss of crucial activities such as the north Powys band and orchestra, the loss of teachers, the loss of post-16 funding from Education and Learning Wales, the loss of small schools and, more damagingly, the loss of morale among teachers. Such is the level of discontent that there has even been talk of a strike among Powys teachers. I hope that the Minister's response to this debate will sweep away their concerns so that pupils and parents will be spared the disruption that this would cause.

As I said, I wrote to all schools in my constituency to find out the truth about what happens to school funding. The message I received was loud and clear: where has all the money gone? Minister, school funding is not what it used to be. I have copies of all the letters that I received for you to read. Listen to this letter from a secondary school headteacher in Powys:

'Dear Mick, the actual decrease in funding to

gyfer grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant, y gostyngiad yng nghyllideb Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru, y problemau ym maes addysg bellach y clywsom amdanynt ddoe, y fenter adeiladau ysgolion, a pharhad ysgolion gwledig.

Dymunaf ganolbwyntio ar dystiolaeth, yn hytrach na damcaniaeth. Mae'n bwysig gofyn beth sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd. Cynhaliais arolwg o benaethiaid yn sir Drefaldwyn ym mis Ebrill, ac mae eu hymatebion gennyf. Gobeithiaf y bydd y ddadl hon yn canolbwyntio ar dryloywder a sefydlogrwydd cyllid ysgolion. Mae pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn ymweld ag ysgolion a cholegau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr mai dim ond canmoliaeth sydd am y gwaith a wneir gan athrawon, cynorthwywyr dosbarth, staff swyddfa, gofalwyr a phawb arall sy'n gweithio ym maes addysg. Mae gennym oll glustiau i glywed eu lleisiau, ond a ydym yn gwranddo? Yr wyf yn siŵr bod pob un ohonom wedi cael ymatebion gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i ymholiadau am gyllid, yn dweud wrthym gymaint o gyllid sydd gan ein hysgolion. Fodd bynnag, pan fyddaf yn ymweld ag ysgolion, fe'm hysbysir o'r pwysau sydd ar gyllidebau, y posibilrwydd o golli gweithgareddau hanfodol megis seindorf a cherddorfa gogledd Powys, colli athrawon, colli cyllid ôl-16 o Ddysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, colli ysgolion bach ac yn fwy andwyol byth, colli morâl ymysg athrawon. Cymaint yw'r anfodlonrwydd fel bod athrawon Powys wedi bod yn trafod mynd ar streic. Gobeithiaf y bydd ymateb y Gweinidog i'r ddadl hon yn tawelu pob un o'u pryderon fel y gellir osgoi'r aflonyddwch y byddai hynny'n ei achosi i ddisgyblion a rhieni.

Fel y dywedais, ysgrifennais at yr holl ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i gael gwybod y gwir am yr hyn sy'n digwydd i gyllid ysgolion. Yr oedd y neges a gefais yn hollol glir: i ble yr aeth yr holl arian? Weinidog, nid yw cyllid ysgolion yr hyn yr arferai fod. Mae gennyf gopiâu o'r holl lythyrau a dderbynais i chi eu darllen. Gwrandewch ar y llythyr hwn gan bennaeth ysgol uwchradd ym Mhowys:

Annwyl Mick, y gostyngiad gwirioneddol

the school this year is £63,995, but the school should have received an additional £29,479 over last year's budget due to an increase in the school roll. Therefore, based on increased numbers, the budget deficit for this year is a total of £93,474. The position is made worse by the fact that the staffing budget will increase due to annual increments on the main professional side. The popularity of the school has meant that an additional year 7 class is being planned for September 2004 as we have an extra 24 pupils entering the year.'

Another secondary school reports a budget shortfall of £34,628 for post-16 funding. A primary school of 97 pupils received £230,000—an average of around £2,300 per pupil. The figures outlined in letters that I received from you in April indicate that the average budget spend per pupil in Wales was £3,688 in 2003-04. You gave me the comparable figure for England, which was £3,697; it is £3,604, if you exclude London. If I were that primary school headteacher receiving an average of £2,300 per pupil, I would want to know where that money has gone. Where has that theoretical £1,368 gone? I suspect that it has been spent on initiatives.

I will now quote from another letter from a school, which contains the fundamental question that I want answered today, so that when I send a report on this debate to those headteachers, they can read your replies to their letters:

'Dear Mr Bates, thank you for your letter that I received this morning about the Welsh Assembly Government's school funding. I am very pleased that finally someone has decided to take up the issue. Having a daughter teaching in nearby Shropshire, I find it more and more frustrating to compare English school funding to our own. We are in a situation where a budget cut of 2 per cent has been imposed on us. In our school this amounts to £15,258, approximately half a teacher's salary, meaning that we must declare a redundancy from March 2005. We are now existing on our reserves to maintain staffing levels. It is simply not acceptable for

mewn cyllid i'r ysgol eleni yw £63,995, ond dylai'r ysgol fod wedi derbyn £29,479 yn ychwanegol at gyllideb y llynedd oherwydd cynnydd yng nghofrestr yr ysgol. Felly, yn seiliedig ar gynnydd mewn nifer, cyfanswm y diffyg yn y gyllideb eleni yw £93,474. Gwaethygir y sefyllfa gan y ffaith y bydd y gyllideb staffio yn cynyddu oherwydd cynyddrannau blynyddol yn y prif gyflogau proffesiynol. Mae poblogrwydd yr ysgol yn golygu bod dosbarth blwyddyn 7 ychwanegol wedi ei gynllunio ar gyfer mis Medi 2004 gan fod gennym 24 o blant yn ychwanegol yn dechrau'r flwyddyn honno yn yr ysgol.

Mae ysgol uwchradd arall yn nodi diffyg o £34,628 mewn cyllid ôl-16. Derbyniodd ysgol gynradd sydd â 97 o ddisgyblion £230,000—cyfartaledd o tua £2,300 am bob disgybl. Mae'r ffigurau a amlinellir mewn llythyrau a dderbyniais gennych ym mis Ebrill yn nodi mai'r cyfartaledd gwariant cyllideb ar gyfer pob disgybl yng Nghymru oedd £3,688 ar gyfer 2003-04. Rhoesoch y ffigur cymharol i mi ar gyfer Lloegr, sef £3,697; a £3,604 os nad ydych yn cynnwys Llundain. Pe bawn i yn bennaeth yr ysgol gynradd honno, yn cael cyfartaledd o £2,300 ar gyfer pob disgybl, byddwn am gael gwybod i ble yr aeth yr arian hwnnw. I ble yr aeth y £1,368 damcaniaethol hwnnw? Yr wyf yn amau iddo gael ei wario ar fentrau.

Dyfynnaf yn awr o lythyr gan ysgol arall, sy'n cynnwys y cwestiwn sylfaenol yr hoffwn gael ateb iddo heddiw, fel y gall y penaethiaid hynny ddarllen eich ymateb i'w llythyrau pan fyddaf yn anfon adroddiad atynt ar y ddadl hon:

Annwyl Mr Bates, diolch am eich llythyr a dderbyniais y bore yma am gyllideb ysgolion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod rhywun wedi penderfynu codi'r mater o'r diwedd. Gyda merch yn dysgu dros y ffin yn swydd Amwythig, mae'n fwyfwy rhwystredigaethus imi gymharu cyllideb ysgolion Lloegr â'n cyllideb ni. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa lle mae toriad o 2 y cant yn y gyllideb wedi cael ei orfodi arnom. Cyfanswm hyn yn ein hysgol ni yw £15,258, tua hanner cyflog athro, sy'n golygu bod rhaid inni gyhoeddi colli swyddi o fis Mawrth 2005. Yr ydym bellach yn bodoli ar ein harian wrth gefn er mwyn

the Welsh Assembly Government to blame Powys’—

cynnal lefelau staffio. Nid yw’n dderbyniol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weld bai ar Bowys—

the local authority—

yr awdurdod lleol—

‘and for Powys to blame the Welsh Assembly Government. If there is a problem, it needs sorting out. In England, the £55,000 allocated to each primary school enables them to make educational choices. Where has the £55,000 allocated to each primary school in Wales gone? On what has it been spent? Also, in a previous year, primary schools received about £35,000 in the Chancellor’s budget. Schools in England receive that amount. We received a white board package per school. The money and the choices could have gone towards increased staffing and reduced class sizes, but we had a white board package. We hear that the Government has allocated £35,000 and we were fobbed off with a white board package costing about £2,000. Where did the other £33,000 go?’

ac i Bowys weld bai ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Os oes problem yn bodoli, rhaid ei datrys. Yn Lloegr, mae’r £55,000 a ddyrennir i bob ysgol gynradd yn eu galluogi i wneud dewisiadau addysgol. I ble yr aeth y £55,000 a ddyrannwyd i bob ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru? Ar beth y cafodd ei wario? Hefyd, mewn blwyddyn flaenorol, dyrannwyd tua £35,000 i ysgolion cynradd yng nghyllideb y Canghellor. Mae ysgolion yn Lloegr yn derbyn y swm hwnnw. Cawsom becyn bwrdd gwyn ar gyfer pob ysgol. Gallai’r arian a’r dewisiadau fod wedi’u defnyddio i gynyddu staff a lleihau maint dosbarthiadau, ond cawsom becyn bwrdd gwyn. Clywn fod y Llywodraeth wedi dyrannu £35,000 a chawsom becyn bwrdd gwyn sydd werth tua £2,000 i’n cadw’n dawel. I ble yr aeth y £33,000 arall?

I explored this matter further. I could not find out where the missing money had gone. I understand that it is an increase from the school standards fund. For the sake of transparency, can you explain to these headteachers where the standards fund money has gone? Did it, as many suspect, go towards match funding for Objective 1? I will give you more evidence from the headteachers.

Archwiliais y mater hwn ymhellach. Ni allwn ganfod i ble yr aeth yr arian coll. Deallaf ei fod yn gynydd o’r gronfa safonau ysgolion. Er mwyn tryloywder, a allwch egluro i’r penaethiaid hyn i ble yr aeth arian y gronfa safonau? A aeth, fel y mae llawer yn ei amau, tuag at arian cyfatebol ar gyfer Amcan 1? Rhoddaf fwy o dystiolaeth ichi gan y penaethiaid.

4.40 p.m.

‘The financial situation for this school is dire. For 2004-05, we are not facing financial meltdown—we are already experiencing it. The continuing inequality in Wales is of great concern.’

Mae sefyllfa ariannol yr ysgol hon yn enbyd. Ar gyfer 2004-05, nid ydym yn wynebu argyfwng ariannol—yr ydym yn ei brofi eisoes. Mae’r anghydraddoldeb parhaus yng Nghymru yn achosi llawer o bryder.

Another headteacher said,

Dywedodd pennaeth arall,

‘Having previously taught in England, I find the whole budget picture in Powys and Wales bleak, unfair and depressing.’

Ar ôl dysgu yn Lloegr cyn hyn, mae’r darlun o ran y gyllideb ym Mhowys ac yng Nghymru yn ddu, yn annheg ac yn dorcalonnus.

Where is the transparency? Minister, please help me, and other Members today, to explain the situation to schools in our

Ble mae’r tryloywder? Weinidog, helpwch fi ac Aelodau eraill heddiw, i egluro’r sefyllfa i ysgolion yn ein hetholaethau. Os nad ydynt

constituencies. If they do not understand it, and we do not understand it, how can we expect that parents across Wales can have any confidence in the Assembly's budgeting?

I have always lobbied for stable budgeting, to avoid this annual round of anxiety that we often face. In your letter to me on 22 April, you said,

'On your point regarding three-year budgets for schools, the Assembly has no powers to require LEAs to set three-year budgets for schools.'

That is not true, Minister. Take a look at section 47 of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998. You could do it if you had the will. Just a few days after I received that letter, a fairly prominent, English Labour politician said in Cardiff,

'One of the greatest difficulties for schools, as the last two years has shown, is to plan ahead not knowing year on year what the school budget will be.'

That prominent, English, male, Labour politician went on to say,

'I can tell you today that it is our intention in the education department future programme announcement in July to set out to move to three-yearly, not yearly, budgets for schools, with assured funding to underpin them.'

You have guessed it—that Labour politician was no less than the Prime Minister himself. The Minister greeted that announcement with warm words:

'We are currently engaged in delivering on our ambition that schools should be confident of their funding over three years.'

On the one hand, you seem to deny the need for three-year funding. On the other, since Tony Blair's statement, you now want three-year funding, but you do not know how to introduce it. Minister, will you take this opportunity to agree with your Prime Minister and bring some hope to hard-pressed

hwy yn ei deall, ac os nad ydym ni yn ei deall, sut y gallwn ddisgwyl i rieni ledled Cymru gael unrhyw hyder yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad?

Yr wyf bob amser wedi llobio dros gyllidebu sefydlog, er mwyn osgoi'r pryder blynyddol hwn y byddwn yn aml yn ei wynebu. Yn eich llythyr ataf ar 22 Ebrill, dywedasoch,

O ran eich pwynt chi ynglŷn â chyllidebau tair blynedd i ysgolion, nid oes gan y Cynulliad bwerau i orfodi AALI i osod cyllidebau tair blynedd ar gyfer ysgolion.

Nid yw hynny yn wir, Weinidog. Edrychwch ar adran 47 Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998. Gallech wneud hynny pe bai'r ewyllys gennych. Ychydig ddyddiau wedi imi dderbyn y llythyr hwnnw, dywedodd gwleidydd Llafur cymharol adnabyddus o Loegr yng Nghaerdydd,

Un o'r anawsterau mwyaf i ysgolion, fel y dangosodd y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, yw blaengynllunio heb wybod o un flwyddyn i'r llall beth fydd cyllideb yr ysgol.

Aeth y dyn hwnnw, y gwleidydd Llafur, adnabyddus hwnnw o Loegr ymlaen i ddweud,

Gallaf ddweud wrthy'ch heddiw mai ein bwriad yng nghyhoeddiad rhaglen yr adran addysg ar gyfer y dyfodol ym mis Gorffennaf yw ceisio sefydlu cyllidebau tair blynedd, nid blynyddol, ar gyfer ysgolion, gyda sicrwydd ariannol yn sail iddynt.

Yr ydych wedi ei ddyfalu—y gwleidydd Llafur hwnnw oedd Prif Weinidog y DU. Derbyniodd y Gweinidog y cyhoeddiad hwnnw gyda geiriau caredig:

Yr ydym wrthi'n ceisio cyflawni ein huchelgais y dylai ysgolion fod yn hyderus o'u cyllid dros dair blynedd.

Ar yr un llaw, ymddengys eich bod yn gwadu'r angen am gyllid tair blynedd. Ar y llaw arall, ers datganiad Tony Blair, yr ydych bellach am gael cyllid tair blynedd, ond ni wyddoch sut i'w gyflwyno. Weinidog, a achubwch ar y cyfle hwn i gytuno â Phrif Weinidog Llafur y DU a rhoi gobaith i rai o'r

schools throughout Wales? Minister, we both know that stability of funding is crucial. Please make it clear today that you will support your Prime Minister and use your powers, under section 47 of the Schools Standards and Framework Act 1998, to allow schools to plan on a three-year budget cycle. With that, and increased transparency, this short debate might be worthwhile.

Eleanor Burnham: I thank Mick for allowing me to contribute. I recently proposed a short debate on the condition of school buildings. Many schools in my region, North Wales, are in dire straits. I was aghast when the Minister told me recently that Flintshire has not bid for money. Some of the Flintshire schools that I have visited have leaking roofs. What is the point of having a computer suite if there is water dripping through the holes in the roof? This is a serious issue, not only for secondary schools, but also for primary schools. Perception is reality. When headteachers, who are trying to run these schools, hear that there is so much money around in England, it mystifies them. Morale is at rock bottom, so what, Minister, are you going to do about it?

Jeff Cuthbert: Mick, I thank you for allowing me to speak in this debate, but I do not recognise the picture that you paint. Schools in Wales have benefited from a 5 per cent, or greater, annual increase in funding for the past five years. That is double the rate of inflation and more than double the increase originally proposed. Last year, school budgets increased by 10 per cent. The Assembly Government continues to deliver on education and to ensure that all schools in Wales are well funded and able to deliver benefits for pupils and teachers. In 2004-05, councils in Wales are receiving additional income of some £3.2 billion, to support front-line services, which includes £33 million to fund the teachers' workload agreement. Capital investment in school buildings is a top 10 commitment. The Assembly Government has pledged a further £560 million during this Assembly to improve buildings, and we are committed to ensuring that all schools will be in good shape by

ysgolion ledled Cymru sy'n wynebu caledi? Weinidog, gwŷr y ddau ohonom fod sefydlogrwydd cyllid yn hanfodol. Rhoddwch sicrwydd heddiw y byddwch yn cefnogi Prif Weinidog Llafur y DU ac yn defnyddio eich pwerau, o dan adran 47 Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998, i alluogi ysgolion i gynllunio ar gylch cyllideb o dair blynedd. Gyda hynny, a mwy o dryloywder, efallai y bydd y ddadl fer hon yn werthfawr.

Eleanor Burnham: Diolchaf i Mick am ganiatáu imi gyfrannu. Cynigiais ddadl fer yn ddiweddar ar gyflwr adeiladau ysgolion. Mae llawer o ysgolion yn fy rhanbarth i, Gogledd Cymru, mewn sefyllfa enbyd. Cefais fy synnu pan ddywedodd y Gweinidog wrthyf yn ddiweddar nad oedd sir y Fflint wedi gwneud cais am arian. Mae gan rai o'r ysgolion yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy yn sir y Fflint doeon sy'n gollwng. Beth yw diben cael ystafell gyfrifiadurol os oes dŵr yn diferu drwy dyllau yn y to? Mae hyn yn fater difrifol, nid yn unig i ysgolion uwchradd, ond hefyd i ysgolion cynradd. Mae canfyddiad yn wirionedd. Pan fydd penaethiaid, sy'n ceisio rhedeg yr ysgolion hyn, yn clywed fod cymaint o arian ar gael yn Lloegr, mae'n eu syfrdanu. Mae morâl ar ei isaf, felly beth, Weinidog, yr ydych am ei wneud am hyn?

Jeff Cuthbert: Mick, diolchaf ichi am ganiatáu imi siarad yn y ddadl hon, ond nid wyf yn adnabod y darlun yr ydych yn ei gyfleu. Mae ysgolion yng Nghymru wedi elwa ar 5 y cant, neu fwy, o gynnydd blynyddol mewn cyllid dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Mae hynny ddwywaith yn uwch na chyfradd chwyddiant, ac yn fwy na dwywaith y cynnydd a gynigiwyd yn wreiddiol. Y llynedd, cynyddodd cyllidebau ysgolion 10 y cant. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i gyflawni ar addysg a sicrhau y caiff pob ysgol yng Nghymru eu cyllidebu'n dda ac y gallant gyflawni er budd disgyblion ac athrawon. Yn 2004-05, mae cynghorau yng Nghymru yn cael incwm ychwanegol o tua £3.2 biliwn i gefnogi gwasanaethau rhengflaen, sy'n cynnwys £33 miliwn i ariannu cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon. Mae buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn adeiladau ysgolion yn un o'r 10 prif ymrwymiad. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi addo £560 miliwn ychwanegol yn ystod y Cynulliad

2010. We will deliver for Wales, and reverse the 18 years of gross underinvestment by the Conservative Government. Our belief in equality of opportunity means that we are breaking down barriers to learning and, with increased investment and innovative reform, we are ensuring that schools in Wales are fit for purpose and are able to deliver the pledges set out in ‘The Learning Country’.

Mark Isherwood: As a primary headteacher in Flintshire told me, funding for Welsh schools is a case of robbing Peter to pay Paul. A headline-grabbing workload agreement, which was falsely and cynically used to inflate local government budgets and launched on an underfunded basis—even after other unhypothecated, but core funding, was raided—raised teachers’ expectations, only to dash them, yet again, on the rocks of broken promises. We have heard about the threat of industrial action in Powys, after 90 per cent of teachers voted in favour of protesting against education cuts. The situation in Flintshire has been summed up in a school newsletter, which states that successive budget cuts have reduced the funding that is available for resources. The budget for March 2004 will not meet essential needs, and further cuts will be needed. The crisis of teacher stress and headteacher resignations in Wrexham was highlighted at the recent National Association of Head Teachers conference, which was held in Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Mark, you have had a minute. You have shut Janet Ryder out. She now only has 15 seconds.

Janet Ryder: On Wrexham, an independent inquiry is reporting tonight to a special meeting of the council on the spiralling costs of the two new super schools. The inquiry has looked at how and why those costs have spiralled. I would like the Minister to satisfy herself that the distribution of capital grants in Wrexham has not affected other schools.

hwn i wella adeiladau, ac yr ydym yn ymroddedig i sicrhau y bydd pob ysgol mewn cyflwr da erbyn 2010. Byddwn yn cyflawni dros Gymru, ac yn dadwneud y 18 mlynedd o danwariant dybryd gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Mae ein cred mewn cyfle cyfartal yn golygu ein bod yn cael gwared â'r rhwystrau i ddysgu a, chyda buddsoddiad cynyddol a diwygiad arloesol, yr ydym yn sicrhau bod ysgolion yng Nghymru yn addas at y diben ac y gallant gyflawni'r addewidion a nodwyd yn ‘Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu’.

Mark Isherwood: Fel y dywedodd pennaeth ysgol gynradd yn sir y Fflint wrthyf, mae cyllid ar gyfer ysgolion Cymru yn fater o ddwyn o un gronfa er mwyn talu'r llall. Codwyd gobeithion athrawon gan gytundeb llwyth gwaith a ddenodd lawer o sylw, ac a ddefnyddiwyd yn anghywir ac yn sinigaidd i chwyddo cyllidebau llywodraeth leol ac a lanswyd heb ddigon o gyllid—hyd yn oed ar ôl mynd ag arian craidd arall nad oedd wedi ei glustnodi, a chwalwyd y gobeithion hynny unwaith eto gan addewidion a dorwyd. Yr ydym wedi clywed am fygythiad gweithredu diwydiannol ym Mhowys, ar ôl i 90 y cant o athrawon bleidleisio o blaid protestio yn erbyn toriadau mewn addysg. Crynhowyd y sefyllfa yn sir y Fflint mewn newyddlen ysgol, sy'n nodi bod toriadau parhaus mewn cyllidebau wedi lleihau'r cyllid sydd ar gael ar gyfer adnoddau. Ni fydd y gyllideb ar gyfer mis Mawrth 2004 yn diwallu anghenion hanfodol, a bydd angen toriadau pellach. Tynnwyd sylw at argyfwng y straen ar athrawon ac ymddiswyddiadau penaethiaid yn Wrecsam yng nghynhadledd ddiweddar Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon, a gynhaliwyd yng Nghymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mark, cawsoch funud. Yr ydych wedi cau Janet Ryder allan. Dim ond 15 eiliad sydd ganddi bellach.

Janet Ryder: O ran Wrecsam, mae ymchwiliad annibynnol yn cyflwyno adroddiad heno i gyfarfod arbennig o'r cyngor ar gostau cynyddol y ddwy ysgol fawr newydd. Mae'r ymchwiliad wedi edrych ar sut a pham y mae'r costau hynny wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog fodloni ei hun nad yw dyraniad grantiau cyfalaf yn Wrecsam wedi effeithio ar

ysgolion eraill.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your time has run out, it is time for the Minister to reply.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben, mae'n bryd i'r Gweinidog ymateb.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I am pleased to respond to this debate on school funding. I will comment on the two issues that you highlighted, Mick, in reverse order. You have always been a strong advocate of the case for providing schools with three-year budgets in order to remove year-on-year uncertainty. It was rather unfair of you not to acknowledge that I always responded positively when you were on the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in terms of my commitment to consider that issue. I have said on many occasions, then and since, that we will always consider ways of encouraging longer-term planning throughout the education and training portfolio. Some of the arrangements that we have established, which you supported, for example school budget fora, are an opportunity to do that.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Yr wyf yn falch o ymateb i'r ddadl hon ar gyllid ysgolion. Rhoddaf sylwadau ar y ddau fater a godwyd gennych, Mick, yn y drefn groes. Buoch bob amser yn eiriolydd cadarn dros roi cyllidebau tair blynedd i ysgolion er mwyn cael gwared ag ansicrwydd blynyddol parhaus. Yr oedd braidd yn annheg ichi beidio â chydabod fy mod bob amser wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol pan oeddech ar y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o ran fy ymrwymiad i ystyried y mater hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi dweud sawl gwaith, yr adeg honno ac ers hynny, y byddwn bob amser yn ystyried ffyrdd o annog cynllunio tymor hwy ar draws y portffolio addysg a hyfforddi. Mae rhai o'r trefniadau a sefydlwyd gennym, a gefnogwyd gennych chi, er enghraifft fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion, yn gyfle i wneud hynny.

It is important to take evidence and to consider facts, but you must also consider the legal position. As I said to you in a recent letter, the Assembly has no powers to require local authorities to set three-year school budgets. I will quote the same pieces of legislation: section 45(1) of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 requires local education authorities to set budgets 'for each financial year'; and section 47 deals with the distribution of the individual school budget 'for that year', to arrive at each school's delegated budget. The legislation only relates to the year in question. I have tested this legally, because if I could have used it to require local authorities to set three-year budgets, I would have done so, but the legislation is specific: it operates in that year. These provisions sit alongside legislation on local government finance. The Local Government Finance Act 1992 requires local authorities to set their council tax levels and their budgets by 11 March every year for the forthcoming financial year only. They must, by law, balance their budgets annually.

Mae'n bwysig cymryd tystiolaeth ac ystyried ffeithiau, ond rhaid ichi ystyried y sefyllfa gyfreithiol hefyd. Fel y dywedasoch mewn llythyr diweddar, nid oes gan y Cynulliad y pŵer i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol osod cyllidebau ysgolion o dair blynedd. Dyfynnaf yr un rhannau o ddeddfwriaeth: mae adran 45(1) Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau addysg lleol osod cyllidebau 'ar gyfer pob blwyddyn ariannol', ac mae adran 47 yn ymdrin â dyrannu cyllideb ysgol unigol 'ar gyfer y flwyddyn honno', i gytuno ar gyllideb ddyranedig pob ysgol. Dim ond at y flwyddyn dan sylw y cyfeiria'r ddeddfwriaeth. Yr wyf wedi profi hyn yn gyfreithiol, oherwydd pe bawn wedi gallu ei ddefnyddio i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol osod cyllidebau tair blynedd, byddwn wedi gwneud hynny, ond mae'r ddeddfwriaeth yn benodol: mae'n gweithredu o fewn y flwyddyn honno. Mae'r darpariaethau hyn yn cyd-fynd â deddfwriaeth ar gyllid llywodraeth leol. Mae Deddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol osod eu lefelau treth gyngor a'u cyllidebau erbyn 11 Mawrth bob blwyddyn ar gyfer y

flwyddyn ariannol ganlynol yn unig. Rhaid iddynt, yn ôl y gyfraith, fantoli'u cyllidebau yn flynyddol.

4.50 p.m.

The Assembly's budget plans already provide local authorities with indicative figures for the local government revenue settlement for three years, so it is possible for authorities to set indicative budgets for their services for more than one year. However, such figures can only be indicative. Authorities' standard spending assessments, derived from formula allocation of the overall settlement, will vary from year to year as data and pupil numbers change. They will also vary in relation to annual decisions on council tax levels, which also have a bearing on budgets. Changes in the circumstances of individual schools, including changes in pupil numbers, have a bearing on their individual share of resources each year. However, you will also know, through the consultation instigated while you were a member of the committee, that we are reducing the pupil-led component of the formula in terms of the consultation that we conducted last year.

Brian Gibbons: You mentioned that the council tax comes into play with regard to the amount of money that local schools receive. My local authority, Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, has one of the highest per pupil expenditures based on a relatively high council tax. However, it must be relevant to this debate—and it is strange that Mick Bates did not mention it—that Powys has one of the lowest council tax precepts in Wales. If Mick's constituents were so concerned, then it would be in order for their authority to make a commitment along the lines of local authorities such as Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council.

Jane Davidson: Of course, local authorities are responsible for setting council tax levels, and they must take into account their statutory responsibilities in delivering services when setting those levels. Some authorities, however, are starting to give their

Mae cynlluniau cyllideb y Cynulliad eisoes yn rhoi ffigurau dangosol i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol am dair blynedd, felly mae'n bosibl i awdurdodau osod cyllidebau dangosol ar gyfer eu gwasanaethau am fwy na blwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, dim ond dangosol y gall y ffigurau hyn fod. Bydd asesiadau gwariant safonol awdurdodau, sy'n deillio o ddyraniad fformiwla y setliad cyffredinol, yn amrywio o un flwyddyn i'r llall wrth i ddata a niferoedd y disgyblion newid. Byddant yn amrywio hefyd o ran y penderfyniadau blynyddol ar lefelau'r dreth gyngor, a fydd hefyd yn dylanwadu ar gyllidebau. Mae newidiadau yn amgylchiadau ysgolion unigol, gan gynnwys newidiadau yn nifer y disgyblion, yn dylanwadu ar eu cyfran unigol hwy o adnoddau bob blwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch hefyd, drwy ymgynghoriad a ddechreuwyd tra yr oeddech yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, yr ydym yn gostwng yr elfen o'r fformiwla sy'n seiliedig ar ddisgyblion o ran yr ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd gennym y llynedd.

Brian Gibbons: Cyfeiriasoch at y ffaith bod y dreth gyngor yn chwarae rhan mewn perthynas â chyfanswm yr arian a gaiff ysgolion lleol. Mae gan fy awdurdod i, sef Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, un o'r gwariannau uchaf fesul disgybl yn seiliedig ar dreth gyngor cymharol uchel. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid ei fod yn berthnasol i'r ddadl hon—ac mae'n syndod na chyfeiriodd Mick Bates ato—bod gan Bowys un o'r praeseptau treth gyngor isaf yng Nghymru. Pe bai etholwyr Mick mor bryderus, yna byddai mewn trefn i'w hawdurdod wneud ymrwymiad tebyg i awdurdodau lleol megis Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot.

Jane Davidson: Wrth gwrs, awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am osod lefelau'r dreth gyngor, a rhaid iddynt ystyried eu cyfrifoldebau statudol ym maes darparu gwasanaethau wrth osod y lefelau hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai awdurdodau yn

schools a three-year run of indicative budget figures. Although they cannot provide a firm picture for the reasons outlined, they do offer a useful guide to schools to assist in their budget planning process. I want this, as you do, to become normal practice across Wales. In providing the guidance to authorities on the work of the new statutory school budget fora, we have made it clear that the fora should look beyond the year immediately ahead. In time, therefore, I believe that authorities and schools will become much more used to planning over a longer-term horizon. Therefore, it is already in the gift of local authorities to provide indicative three-year budgets, as they, and not the Assembly, set school budgets. It is also important to say, however, that the spending review that the Finance Minister is conducting, which will consider Assembly funding from 2005 to 2007, is about ensuring that everybody has greater security in terms of three-year funding and about looking for opportunities through the spending review to ensure the kind of stability that you seek.

Janet Ryder: Would you not agree that the distribution of capital grants has the same effect on schools as revenue grants have? I am sure that you share my concerns about the spiralling costs of the two super-schools that are being developed in Wrexham. Quite rightly, the council commissioned an independent inquiry into how and why those costs have spiralled from £12.5 million to the current estimate of £22.5 million. Will you undertake to consider events at Wrexham council to ensure that no other school in Wrexham is losing out on capital grants or any other grants because of the concentration on the development of these two new super-schools? Will you also ensure that you are satisfied that all grants awarded to Wrexham County Borough Council for use in schools have been used for the purpose for which they were granted?

Jane Davidson: Capital grants work in two ways. First, there is a formula allocation to every local authority, which is for general capital spending. There is also a separate allocation for the school building

dechrau rhoi ffigurau cyllideb dangosol am gyfnod o dair blynedd i'w hysgolion. Er na allant roi darlun pendant oherwydd y rhesymau a amlinellwyd, maent yn cynnig canllaw defnyddiol i ysgolion er mwyn eu cynorthwyo yn y broses o gynllunio cyllidebau. Fe hoffwn i, fel chithau, i hyn ddod yn arfer ledled Cymru. Wrth roi'r canllawiau i awdurdodau ar waith y fforymau cyllideb ysgolion statudol newydd, yr ydym wedi ei gwneud yn glir y dylai'r fforymau edrych y tu hwnt i'r flwyddyn sydd i ddod. Felly, ymhen amser, credaf y daw awdurdodau ac ysgolion yn llawer mwy cyfarwydd â chynllunio ar gyfer cyfnod hwy. Felly, mae eisoes o fewn gallu awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu cyllidebau tair blynedd dangosol gan mai hwy ac nid y Cynulliad sy'n gosod cyllidebau ysgolion. Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud, fodd bynnag, bod yr adolygiad o wariant a gaiff ei gynnal gan y Gweinidog Cyllid, a fydd yn ystyried cyllid y Cynulliad o 2005 i 2007, yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod gan bawb fwy o sicrwydd o ran cyllid tair blynedd a chwilio am gyfleoedd drwy'r adolygiad o wariant i sicrhau y math o sefydlogrwydd a geisiwch.

Janet Ryder: Oni chytunwch fod dyraniad grantiau cyfalaf yn cael yr un effaith ar ysgolion â grantiau refeniw? Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn rhannu fy mhryderon ynglŷn â chostau cynyddol y ddwy ysgol fawr sy'n cael eu datblygu yn Wrecsam. Mae'r cyngor wedi bod yn ddoeth i gomisiynu ymchwiliad annibynnol i sut a pham y mae'r costau hynny wedi cynyddu o £12.5 miliwn i'r amcangyfrif presennol o £22.5 miliwn. A gytunwch i ystyried y digwyddiadau yng nghyngor Wrecsam i sicrhau na fydd unrhyw ysgol arall yn Wrecsam ar eu colled o ran grantiau cyfalaf nac unrhyw grantiau eraill am fod llawer o gyllid yn cael ei wario ar ddatblygu'r ddwy ysgol fawr hyn? A wnech hefyd sicrhau eich bod yn fodlon bod yr holl grantiau a roddwyd i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam i gael eu defnyddio mewn ysgolion yn cael eu defnyddio at y dibenion y cawsant eu rhoi?

Jane Davidson: Mae grantiau cyfalaf yn gweithio mewn dwy ffordd. Yn gyntaf, rhoddir dyraniad drwy fformiwla i bob awdurdod lleol, ar gyfer gwariant cyfalaf cyffredinol. Rhoddir dyraniad ar wahân hefyd

improvement grant, as you know. In addition to that, we have announced, on a non-formula basis, an additional £9 million individual grant to every local authority to be phased in between 2005 and 2010. The spending requirements with regard to that money are the normal auditable requirement that every local authority must assure the Assembly that the money is properly spent. There is no change to any arrangement in any local authority in terms of that requirement.

Local authorities can already help their schools to handle budget changes arising from changes in pupil numbers, for example. Not all local authorities are using this important provision at present. They can include in their formula a factor to protect schools where the budget shares would otherwise be reduced year on year by more than 5 per cent. Since we have a rapidly declining child population, it is important that local authorities are able to safety-net in this way. It is for each local authority to decide on its own funding formula, taking into account local needs.

Michael German: You have referred to the desire to move towards three-year funding and to the Prime Minister's stated desire to move in this direction. Does he propose to do that by introducing primary legislation or does he already have the powers to do this in England? If so, would that give you the powers, which you say that you would use if you had them, to introduce measures in Wales to direct that there will be three-year funding?

Jane Davidson: The Prime Minister has referred to the fact that the standard spending assessments for education are published discreetly in England, and the money goes directly to schools. Similarly, we will be looking to ensure that the overall funding for local government and increases in this funding have indicative figures for each year. Education funding is not hypothecated and, when you were in partnership with us, you were a strong supporter of local authorities making their own decisions on these matters. Therefore, while this is a non-hypothecated

ar gyfer y grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion, fel y gwyddoch. Yn ychwanegol at hynny, fel y cyhoeddwyd gennym, heb fod ar sail fformiwla, rhoddir grant unigol ychwanegol o £9 miliwn i bob awdurdod lleol rhwng 2005 a 2010. Y gofynion gwariant o ran yr arian hwnnw yw'r gofynion archwiliadwy arferol bod yn rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol sicrhau'r Cynulliad bod yr arian wedi ei wario'n briodol. Nid oes unrhyw newid yn y trefniadau i unrhyw awdurdod lleol o ran y gofyniad hwnnw.

Gall awdurdodau eisoes helpu eu hysgolion i ymdopi â newidiadau cyllideb sy'n deillio o newidiadau yn nifer y disgyblion, er enghraifft. Nid yw pob awdurdod lleol yn defnyddio'r ddarpariaeth bwysig hon ar hyn o bryd. Gallant gynnwys ffactor yn eu fformiwla i ddiogelu ysgolion lle y byddai'r rhan o'r gyllideb yn cael ei lleihau fel arall fwy na 5 y cant o un flwyddyn i'r llall. Gan fod nifer y plant yn gostwng yn gyflym, mae'n bwysig bod awdurdodau lleol yn gallu cynnig y math hwn o ddiogelwch. Yr awdurdod lleol sy'n penderfynu ar ei fformiwla ariannu ei hun, gan ystyried anghenion cyfrifo lleol.

Michael German: Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at yr awydd i symud tuag at gyllid tair blynedd a'r awydd a nodwyd gan Brif Weinidog y DU i symud i'r cyfeiriad hwn. A yw'n fwriad ganddo wneud hynny drwy gyflwyno deddfwriaeth sylfaenol neu a yw'r pwerau ganddo eisoes i wneud hynny yn Lloegr? Os felly, a fyddai hynny'n rhoi'r pwerau i chi, y byddech, meddech chi, yn eu defnyddio pe baent gennych, i gyflwyno mesurau yng Nghymru i gyfarwyddo y bydd cyllid tair blynedd?

Jane Davidson: Cyfeiriodd Prif Weinidog y DU at y ffaith y caiff yr asesiadau o wariant safonol ar gyfer addysg eu cyhoeddi ar wahân yn Lloegr, ac yr aiff yr arian yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Yn yr un modd, byddwn yn ceisio sicrhau bod gan y cyllid cyffredinol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol a chynnydd yn y cyllid hwn ffigurau dangosol ar gyfer pob blwyddyn. Nid yw cyllid addysg wedi ei glustnodi'n benodol, a phan oeddech mewn partneriaeth â ni, yr oeddech yn gadarn o blaid awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain ar y materion hyn.

service, we would not be able to give the same kind of guarantees in Wales, because it is up to local authorities to set their budgets for all of their local services, according to their local needs. England operates a mechanism that provides funding directly to schools, the use of which means that it is possible to say, 'Well, this amount will go into the education SSA over the following three years.' We need to do what we can to ensure that we make our system as transparent as possible.

Brian Gibbons: Will you give way?

Jane Davidson: This will have to be the last intervention I take because I want to tackle some of the other issues raised.

Brian Gibbons: You mentioned the situation in England, and Mick Bates mentioned the situation in Shropshire, and I pointed out that people living in Neath Port Talbot pay high rates of council tax. Average council tax in Shropshire is £1,100 in band D, which is probably £300 to £400 higher than the equivalent in Powys. This is perhaps another example of people wanting to have their cake and eat it.

Jane Davidson: A debate about cross-border issues will always include an element of cherry-picking. It is clear on any chart that Powys funds education better than its neighbours across the border. We take the figures to committee every year, and they are tested through the Assembly Government and through the Department for Education and Skills. Mick is a member of the committee and will know, from studying the comparisons, that Powys has historically been a good funder of education. Also, ELWa has provided funding above inflation, as it increased its funding by 11.95 per cent in 2002-03 and by 4 per cent this year. Therefore, there has not been a reduction in terms of ELWa's funding to schools.

I turn to the charge that the Assembly Government is providing inadequate funding for schools. We are committed to the principle that decisions on funding local

Felly, er nad yw hwn yn wasanaeth y mae ei gyllid wedi ei glustnodi'n benodol, ni fyddwn yn gallu rhoi'r un sicrwydd yng Nghymru, gan mai'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n gosod eu cyllidebau ar gyfer eu holl wasanaethau lleol, yn ôl eu hanghenion lleol. Mae Lloegr yn gweithredu system sy'n rhoi cyllideb yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion, ac mae'r defnydd ohoni yn golygu ei bod yn bosibl dweud, 'wel, aiff y swm hwn i'r asesiad o wariant safonol ar gyfer addysg dros y tair blynedd nesaf'. Mae angen inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud ein system ni mor dryloyw â phosibl.

Brian Gibbons: A ildiwch?

Jane Davidson: Rhaid mai hwn fydd yr ymyriad olaf a dderbyniaf gan fy mod am fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion eraill a godwyd.

Brian Gibbons: Cyfeiriasoch at y sefyllfa yn Lloegr, a chyfeiriodd Mick Bates at y sefyllfa yn swydd Amwythig, a soniais innau fod pobl sy'n byw yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot yn talu cyfraddau treth gyngor uchel. Cyfartaledd y dreth gyngor yn swydd Amwythig yw £1,100 ym mand D, sydd tua £300 i £400 yn uwch nag ym Mhowys. Efallai fod hon yn enghraifft arall o bobl sydd am ei chael hi bob ffordd.

Jane Davidson: Bydd dadl am faterion trawsffiniol bob amser yn cynnwys elfen o ddewis a dethol. Mae'n amlwg ar unrhyw siart bod Powys yn ariannu addysg yn well na'i chymdogion dros y ffin. Yr ydym yn cyflwyno'r ffigurau i'r pwyllgor bob blwyddyn, a chânt eu profi drwy Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a drwy'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau. Mae Mick yn aelod o'r pwyllgor a bydd yn gwybod, o astudio'r cymariaethau, bod Powys yn hanesyddol wedi ariannu addysg yn dda. Hefyd, mae ELWa wedi rhoi cyllid y tu hwnt i chwyddiant, ac wedi cynyddu ei gyllid 11.95 y cant yn 2002-03 a 4 y cant eleni. Felly, ni chafwyd gostyngiad o ran cyllid ELWa i ysgolion.

Cyfeiriaf at y cyhuddiad nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi cyllid digonol i ysgolion. Yr ydym ym ymrwymedig i'r egwyddor mai awdurdodau lleol unigol ddylai wneud

services should be taken by individual local authorities. Mick's party is also firmly committed to this.

Eleanor Burnham: Will you give way?

Jane Davidson: I said that I would not take any further interventions because I have already taken four.

Eleanor Burnham: They were not from our party.

Jane Davidson: I took an intervention from your leader.

There is clear agreement with local government that, in return for the freedom to determine its own expenditure on individual services, it will deliver on key outcomes in areas that are top priorities for the National Assembly, including education. This principle has been successful. For 2003-04, local authorities increased their school budgets by 9.9 per cent, delegated budgets went up by 10 per cent on average, and the figures on revenue funding streams to schools, budgeted per pupil spend, were quoted earlier and demonstrate that the funding is on a par with England. In England, an element of the capital and the equivalent of our GEST funding is held in the standards fund, so you cannot make a direct comparison because our capital spend sits in the overall allocation to local authorities. Therefore, we provide funding in a different way. However, these figures tell us that, overall, the position stacks up, because the same factors are taken into account in England as in Wales. We have debated these figures in committee, where Members wanted to be reassured that the figures were on a like-for-like basis. Fully accepting that the systems in Scotland and Northern Ireland are different means that we do not have dialogue in terms of these areas, although perhaps we should, and the system in Wales is increasingly different from the one operated in England.

5.00 p.m.

As my colleague, Jeff Cuthbert, said, it is

penderfyniadau ar ariannu gwasanaethau lleol. Mae plaid Mick yn gadarn o blaid hyn hefyd.

Eleanor Burnham: A ildiwch?

Jane Davidson: Dywedais na fyddwn yn derbyn mwy o ymyriadau gan fy mod wedi derbyn pedwar eisoes.

Eleanor Burnham: Nid oedd yr ymyriadau hynny gan ein plaid ni.

Jane Davidson: Derbyniais ymyriad gan eich arweinydd.

Mae cytundeb clir gyda llywodraeth leol y bydd, yn gyfnewid am y rhyddid i benderfynu ar ei wariant ei hun ar wasanaethau unigol, yn cyflawni canlyniadau allweddol mewn meysydd sy'n brif flaenoriaethau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan gynnwys addysg. Bu'r egwyddor hon yn llwyddiannus. Ar gyfer 2003-04, cynyddodd awdurdodau lleol eu cyllidebau ysgolion 9.9 y cant, cynyddodd cyllidebau dirprwyedig 10 y cant ar gyfartaledd, a chafodd y ffigurau ar lif cyllid refeniw i ysgolion, wedi eu cyllidebu fesul disgybl, eu dyfynnu yn gynharach, ac maent yn dangos bod y gyllideb yn gyfartal â Lloegr. Yn Lloegr, cedwir elfen o'r cyfalaf a'r hyn sy'n cyfateb i'n cyllid GCAH yn y gronfa safonau, felly ni allwch wneud cymhariaeth uniongyrchol gan fod ein gwariant cyfalaf yn dod o fewn y dyraniad cyffredinol i awdurdodau lleol. Felly, yr ydym yn rhoi cyllid mewn ffordd wahanol. Fodd bynnag, dywed y ffigurau hyn wrthym fod y sefyllfa ar y cyfan yn gymharol, gan fod yr un ffactorau yn cael eu hystyried yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Yr ydym wedi trafod y ffigurau hyn yn y pwyllgor, pan oedd Aelodau am gael eu sicrhau bod y ffigurau yn cael eu hystyried ar yr un sail. Gan ein bod yn derbyn yn llwyr bod y systemau yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon yn wahanol nid ydym yn trafod yr ardaloedd hyn, ond efallai y dylem wneud hynny, ac mae'r system yng Nghymru yn gynyddol wahanol i'r un a gaiff ei gweithredu yn Lloegr.

Fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Jeff

important to bear in mind that local government has received an increase of 5 per cent this year, at double the rate of inflation. We have identified, as requested by teachers, the £33 million for the costs of the workload agreement. It is also important to point out that we all signed up to this agreement. I was extremely happy to sign up to an agreement to reduce the workload of teachers. However, central Government did not provide additional funding to introduce the agreement. We have an utterly transparent budget system, and the only way that we could have put more money into the agreement in the first year was by taking it out of an already identified spending area. We have included an identified sum in the budgets for the next financial year. The analysis of budgets set by Welsh authorities for 2004-05 is provided to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in the usual way and is available to all through the internet.

Reference has been made to the fact that the Chancellor referred in his statement on 17 March to direct funding for schools in England—£55,000 for an average primary school and £185,000 for an average secondary school. Once again, no funding came to the Assembly because these figures have been taken into account in the comparison between the spend in England and in Wales. These are the up-rated amounts for existing funding through the standards fund and formula capital allocations. There is no new money and no consequential. Where there is consequential funding—and, under the budget announcements, all the services for which the Assembly is responsible will receive some such funding for 2006-07, which means that it will not be for another few years—this will go into the Assembly's block grant. The Assembly Government will then decide how the funding should be used.

I am committed to considering ways in which we can give schools, colleges and universities more stability, and to improving the transparency of funding decisions. For the first time this year, we have published the formula for support given to individual authorities. This information, and the creation of the local school budget fora, will help

Cuthbert, mae'n bwysig cofio bod llywodraeth leol wedi cael cynnydd o 5 y cant eleni, sef ddwywaith cyfradd chwyddiant. Yr ydym wedi nodi, ar ôl cais gan athrawon, y costau o £33 miliwn o ran y cytundeb llwyth gwaith. Mae hefyd yn bwysig nodi ein bod i gyd wedi cytuno i'r cytundeb hwn. Yr oeddwn yn fwy na bodlon cytuno i gytundeb i leihau llwyth gwaith athrawon. Fodd bynnag, ni ddarparodd y Llywodraeth yn ganolog gyllid ychwanegol i gyflwyno'r cytundeb. Mae gennym system gyllideb hollol dryloyw, a'r unig ffordd y gallwn fod wedi rhoi mwy o arian i'r cytundeb yn y flwyddyn gyntaf fyddai drwy ei gymryd o faes gwariant a nodwyd eisoes. Yr ydym wedi cynnwys swm a nodwyd yn y cyllidebau ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Caiff y dadansoddiad o gyllidebau a osodwyd gan awdurdodau Cymru ar gyfer 2004-05 ei roi i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn y ffordd arferol ac mae ar gael i bawb drwy'r rhyngwyd.

Cyfeiriwyd at y ffaith bod y Canghellor wedi cyfeirio yn ei ddatganiad ar 17 Mawrth at gyllid uniongyrchol i ysgolion yn Lloegr—£55,000 ar gyfer ysgol gynradd gyffredin a £185,000 ar gyfer ysgol uwchradd gyffredin. Unwaith eto, ni ddaeth unrhyw gyllid i'r Cynulliad gan fod y ffigurau hyn wedi cael eu hystyried yn y gymhariaeth rhwng y gwariant yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Y rhain yw'r symiau wedi'u huwchraddio ar gyfer y cyllid presennol drwy'r gronfa safonau a'r dyraniadau cyfalaf drwy fformiwla. Nid oes unrhyw arian newydd na symiau canlyniadol. Pan fo cyllid canlyniadol—ac, o dan y cyhoeddiadau cyllideb, bydd pob gwasanaeth y mae'r Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdano yn cael ychydig o arian o'r fath ar gyfer 2006-07, sy'n golygu na fydd hyn yn digwydd am ychydig flynyddoedd eto—bydd hyn yn mynd i mewn i grant bloc y Cynulliad. Yna, bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn penderfynu sut i ddefnyddio'r cyllid.

Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i ystyried ffyrdd o roi mwy o sefydlogrwydd i ysgolion, colegau a phrifysgolion, a sicrhau bod penderfyniadau cyllido yn fwy tryloyw. Am y tro cyntaf eleni, yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi'r fformiwla ar gyfer cymorth a roddwyd i awdurdodau unigol. Bydd y wybodaeth hon, ynghyd â chreu fforymau cyllideb ysgolion lleol, o

local authorities to be accountable for their decisions. I have also offered the opportunity, with my colleague, the Finance Minister, for the teacher unions to put evidence—

gymorth i awdurdodau lleol fod yn atebol am eu penderfyniadau. Yr wyf hefyd, ynghyd â'm cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Cyllid, wedi cynnig cyfle i undebau athrawon gyflwyno tystiolaeth—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Time has run out. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daeth yr amser i ben. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.04 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.04 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)

Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)