



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 24 Hydref 2000**

**Tuesday 24 October 2000**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| 3  | Datganiad gan y Llywydd<br><i>Statement by the Presiding Officer</i>   |
| 3  | Cymnig Trefniadol<br><i>Procedural Motion</i>  |
| 4  | Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Busnes<br><i>Elections to the Business Committee</i>  |
| 5  | Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru<br><i>Questions to the First Minister</i>   |
| 21 | Cwestiwn Brys: Damwain ar Reilffordd y Cambrian ger Porthmadog<br><i>Urgent Question: Accident on the Cambrian Railway near Porthmadog</i>   |
| 25 | Pwynt o Drefn<br><i>Point of Order</i>   |
| 27 | Datganiad Busnes<br><i>Business Statement</i>  |
| 30 | Deddf Addysg 1997: Is-ddeddfwriaeth y Cynulliad<br><i>Education Act 1997: Assembly Subordinate Legislation</i>   |
| 47 | Pwynt o Drefn<br><i>Point of Order</i>   |
| 48 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Cynrychiolaeth Ddaearyddol yn y Cabinet Newydd<br><i>Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): Geographical Representation in the New Cabinet</i> |
| 70 | Pwynt o Drefn<br><i>Point of Order</i>   |
| 70 | Cyflwyno Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000<br><i>Introduction of the Care Standards Act 2000</i>  |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambra. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadaïr  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

**Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae gennyf ddatganiad byr am ein technoleg gwybodaeth. Y newyddion diweddaraf ynglyn â'r firws ar rwydwaith OSIRIS yw bod y gwaith o waredu'r firws o'r rhwydwaith wedi ei gwblhau. Mae'r systemau mewnol, gan gynnwys gwe'r Siambr, sydd yn bwysig i'n dibenion ni y prynhawn yma, yn gweithio yn ôl eu harfer. Bydd nodyn pellach o Swyddfa'r Llywydd yn ymddangos ar y rhwydwaith yn ystod y prynhawn. Mae trafodaethau eisoes ar y gweill i ddysgu o'r digwyddiad difrifol hwn. Bydd y Cynulliad, drwy Bwyllgor y Tŷ a Swyddfa'r Llywydd, yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hyn a byddwn yn rhoi gwybodaeth fanwl ichi.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have a brief statement on our information technology. The latest news regarding the virus on the OSIRIS network is that the work of eliminating the virus from the network has been completed. The internal systems, including the Chamberweb, which is important for our purposes this afternoon, are working as normal. A further note from the Office of the Presiding Officer will appear on the network during the afternoon. There are already discussions underway so that we can learn from this serious incident. The Assembly, through the House Committee and the Office of the Presiding Officer, will be part of these discussions and we will inform you of them in detail.

**Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion**

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf y Trefnydd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Minister for Assembly Business to propose a procedural motion.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, allows me to propose a no named day motion on elections in relation to the Business Committee.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn caniatáu imi gynnig cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar etholiadau mewn perthynas â'r Pwyllgor Busnes.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Busnes**  
**Elections to the Business Committee**

**Andrew Davies:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 13.2, elects Kirsty Williams to the Business Committee in place of Jenny Randerson and elects John Marek, Deputy Presiding Officer, to chair the Committee.*

**Andrew Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn gweithredu dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 13.2, yn ethol Kirsty Williams i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn lle Jenny Randerson ac yn ethol John Marek, y Dirprwy Lywydd, yn gadeirydd i'r Pwyllgor.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn

Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

## Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

### Asesu'r Memorandwm Cyd-ddealltwriaeth Assessing the Memorandum of Understanding

**Q1 Janet Davies:** What assessment has the First Minister made of the current memorandum of understanding between the National Assembly and Government departments in London? (OAQ7272)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The memorandum was signed in October 1999, and a review was commenced in the meeting of the Joint Ministerial Committee in Edinburgh on 1 September 2000. There was no evidence that, when we reviewed the memorandum of understanding, it was not working satisfactorily. However, that does not exclude that we could make improvements in years to come.

**Janet Davies:** I accept that you feel that there were no, or few in the way of, problems,

**C1 Janet Davies:** Pa asesiad y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi ei wneud o'r memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth presennol rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain? (OAQ7272)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Llofnodwyd y memorandwm yn Hydref 1999, a dechreuwyd adolygiad yng nghyfarfod Cyd-bwyllgor y Gweinidogion yng Nghaeredin ar 1 Medi 2000. Nid oedd unrhyw dystiolaeth, pan adolygasom y memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth, nad oedd yn gweithio'n fodhaol. Fodd bynnag, ni olyga hynny na allwn wneud gweliannau yn y dyfodol.

**Janet Davies:** Derbyniaf eich bod o'r farn nad oedd unrhyw, neu ddim ond ychydig o,

Rhodri. However, do you think that the Assembly's rights in the memorandum could be strengthened to avoid a repetition of problems that we, and members of your Cabinet, have experienced with Whitehall departments?

**The First Minister:** It depends what you thought the memorandum of understanding was going to achieve. It did not mean that there would be no disagreements, or that it would act as a guarantee that there would never be disagreement between a Whitehall department and the Assembly, the Scottish Parliament or the Northern Ireland Assembly. It meant that there would be a procedure and an understanding to try to minimise those disagreements, or their knock-on effects. We are talking about consultation, about trying to avoid surprises where possible, and about trying to ensure that the business of the UK as a whole is not affected adversely by the arrival of devolution. It does not mean that there will never be any disagreements. It is merely a modus operandi to try to ensure that no bad blood or mistrust develops out of a disagreement on an issue between a UK Government department and any of the devolved bodies.

**Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister tell us why there is still no concordat between the National Assembly and the Ministry for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, and when does he foresee that one will be established?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that your information is correct, Mick. I understand that the only two departments that have not yet signed their concordats are the Department for Education and Employment and the Home Office, and that is purely because of administrative, not political, foot dragging. The MAFF concordat was signed recently. We can now celebrate the arrival of almost all the UK Government departments to the point of signature on the concordats.

**William Graham:** Will the First Minister confirm that, under the memorandum of understanding, the interests of the National Assembly for Wales are receiving equal

problemau, Rhodri. Fodd bynnag, a gredwch y gellid atgyfnerthu hawliau'r Cynulliad yn y memorandwm er mwyn sicrhau na fydd y problemau yr ydym ni, ac aelodau o'ch Cabinet wedi eu cael gydag adrannau Whitehall yn digwydd eto?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n dibynnu ar yr hyn yr oeddech yn disgwyl i'r memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth ei gyflawni. Nid oedd yn golygu na fyddai anghytundeb, neu y byddai'n gwarantu na fyddai unrhyw anghytundeb rhwng un o adrannau Whitehall a'r Cynulliad, Senedd yr Alban neu Gynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon. Golygai y byddai gweithdrefn a dealltwriaeth er mwyn ceisio lleihau anghytundebau o'r fath neu eu heffeithiau canlynol i'r eithaf. Yr ydym yn sôn am ymgynghori, am geisio osgoi'r annisgwyl lle bo modd, ac am geisio sicrhau nad yw dyfodiad datganoli yn effeithio'n andwyol ar fusnes y DU gyfan. Ni olyga na fydd unrhyw anghytundeb fyth eto. Dim ond ffordd o weithredu ydyw er mwyn ceisio sicrhau na fydd unrhyw ddrwgdeimlad na diffyg hyder yn codi yn sgil anghytundeb ar fater rhwng un o adrannau Llywodraeth y DU ac unrhyw un o'r cyrff datganoledig.

**Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym pam nad oes gennym concordat fyth rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r Weinnyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd, a phryd y caiff concordat ei sefydlu yn ei farm ef?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni chredaf fod eich gwybodaeth yn gywir, Mick. Deallaf mai'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth a'r Swyddfa Gartref yw'r unig ddwy adran sydd heb llofnodi eu concordatiau hyd yn hyn, a hynny oherwydd llusgo traed gweinyddol, nid gwleidyddol. Llofnodwyd concordat y Weinnyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn ddiweddar. Gallwn yn awr ddathlu'r ffaith bod bron pob un o adrannau Llywodraeth y DU wedi llofnodi'r concordatiau.

**William Graham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gadarnhau bod buddiannau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cael yr un ystyriaeth â buddiannau Senedd yr Alban a Chynulliad

consideration, on a par with the Scottish Parliament and the Northern Ireland Assembly? Gogledd Iwerddon o dan y memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth?

**The First Minister:** That is my understanding.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Deallaf fod hynny'n digwydd.

### Swyddogaethau'r Cabinet The Cabinet's Functions

**C2 Dafydd Wigley:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ynghylch y modd y mae Cabinet y Cynulliad yn cyflawni ei swyddogaethau? (OAQ7266)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n bopeth ac yn ddim byd ar yr un pryd, Dafydd. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig ac yn berthnasol i'r modd y mae'r Cabinet yn cyflawni ei waith—gan ei fod bellach yn seiliedig ar Lywodraeth fwyafrifol yn hytrach na lleiafrifol—yw y dylem, efallai, ystyried y modd y rhoddir mwy o hawl i'r gwrthbleidiau a'r Aelodau mainc gefn i archwilio, ymysg eu dyletswyddau eraill. Byddaf yn hapus i ystyried unrhyw syniadau a ddaw o'r ddwy wrthblaid ynglŷn â sut i wneud hynny.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ymwybodol o gyfweliad Delyth Evans—y Dirprwy Weinidog sydd yn cynorthwyo Jenny Randerson mewn perthynas â diwylliant—gyda Gwilym Owen ar Radio Cymru ddoe? Datganodd mai camgymeriad gan un o swyddogion Swyddfa'r Wasg yn y Cynulliad oedd nodi cyfrifoldeb Jenny Randerson dros ieithoedd Cymru ac, mewn gwirionedd, fod ganddi gyfrifoldeb penodol dros yr iaith Gymraeg yn ogystal â chyfrifoldeb cyffredinol dros ieithoedd eraill. A wnaiff Rhodri gadarnhau heddiw fod gan Jenny Randerson gyfrifoldeb penodol dros yr iaith Gymraeg a bod honno'n eitem unigryw a sylweddol yn ei phortffolio? A wnaiff drefnu, felly, fod gwefan y Cynulliad yn cael ei newid er mwyn adlewyrchu hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni chlywais y cyfweliad hwnnw. Dyma'r tro cyntaf imi glywed amdano. Nid wyf yn credu bod unrhyw sail i'r syniad sydd y tu ôl i'r cwestiwn, sef bod camgymeriad ar wefan y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, os yw Dafydd yn dymuno ysgrifennu ataf, gallaf holi Delyth

**Q2 Dafydd Wigley:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the National Assembly Cabinet's overall exercise of functions? (OAQ7266)

**The First Minister:** That question is everything and nothing at the same time, Dafydd. What is important and relevant to the way that the Cabinet accomplishes its work—now that it is based on a majority, rather than a minority, Government—is that perhaps we should consider the way in which a greater right is given to the opposition parties and the back-bench Members to scrutinise, among their other duties. I will be happy to consider any ideas that emanate from the two opposition parties on how to do that.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Is the First Minister aware of an interview given by Delyth Evans—the Deputy Minister who assists Jenny Randerson in relation to culture—to Gwilym Owen on Radio Cymru yesterday? She stated that it was a mistake by one of the officers in the Assembly's Press Office to note Jenny Randerson's responsibility for the languages of Wales and that she has, in fact, specific responsibility for the Welsh language as well as a general responsibility for other languages. Will Rhodri confirm today that Jenny Randerson has specific responsibility for the Welsh language and that that is a unique and substantial part of her portfolio? Will he, therefore, arrange that the Assembly's website is changed to reflect that?

**The First Minister:** I did not hear that interview. This is the first that I have heard about it. I do not think that there is any basis to the idea behind the question, that there is a mistake on the Assembly's website. However, if Dafydd wishes to write to me, I can ask Delyth about what she said and I will

ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddywedodd a byddaf wedyn yn gallu ei ateb. Nid wyf yn tybio iddi ddweud unrhyw beth amhriodol.

2:07 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Although I welcome your statement about the involvement of opposition parties, do you regret the statement that you made last week, having recomposed the Cabinet, that there was no room for anybody from north Wales based solely on merit?

**The First Minister:** When there is a restructuring and portfolios are changed, a Cabinet is chosen—and I have not heard you offering any alternative method of choosing one—on the basis of who are the best people to fit the Cabinet portfolios that emerge from that restructuring. If Nick is putting forward an alternative theory that Cabinet members should be chosen according to the geographical areas that they represent, it would be a unique constitutional theory and new to the Conservative Party as well as to British politics. I would be interested to hear him lay it out more formally.

then be able to reply to him. I do not think that she said anything inappropriate.

**Nick Bourne:** Er fy mod yn croesawu'ch datganiad ynglŷn â chyfraniad y gwrthbleidiau, a ydych yn edifarhau'r datganiad a wnaethoch yr wythnos diwethaf, ar ôl ad-drefnu'r Cabinet, nad oedd lle i unrhyw un o ogledd Cymru yn seiliedig ar deilyngdod yn unig?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Pan fo ailstrwythuro a newid portffolios, dewisir Cabinet—ac nid wyf wedi eich clywed yn cynnig unrhyw ddull arall o ddewis Cabinet—ar sail pwy yw'r bobl orau sydd yn gweddu â phortffolios y Cabinet a ddaw i'r amlwg wedi'r ailstrwythuro hwnnw. Os yw Nick yn cyflwyno damcaniaeth amgen y dylid dewis aelodau'r Cabinet yn ôl yr ardaloedd daearyddol y maent yn eu cynrychioli, byddai'n ddamcaniaeth gyfansoddiadol unigryw ac yn newydd i'r Blaid Geidwadol yn ogystal ag i wleidyddiaeth Prydain. Byddai diddordeb gennyd ei glywed yn ei thraethu'n fwy ffurfiol.

### Statws 'Gwell Cymru' The Status of 'A Better Wales'

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the status of 'Betterwales.com' in the light of the draft partnership agreement with the Liberal Democrats? (OAQ7258)

'Betterwales.com' was never regarded as being fixed and final. Items that emerged from the partnership agreement have been added to it. However, items would have been added to it at some stage because it was never intended to be a bible from which there could be no departure over the next seven years. In December, we will issue a draft strategic plan for 2001-02 and for the years beyond, which we hope the Assembly can adopt in March 2001. That strategic plan will build on the excellent work of the original 'Betterwales.com'.

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar statws 'Gwellcymru.com' yng ngoleuni'r cytundeb partneriaeth drafft gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? (OAQ7258)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid ystyriwyd erioed bod 'Gwellcymru.com' yn derfynol. Ychwanegwyd ato eitemau a ddeilliodd o'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Fodd bynnag, byddai eitemau wedi cael eu hychwanegu ato ryw bryd neu'i gilydd am na fwriadwyd erioed iddo fod megis beibl na ellid gwyo oddi wrtho yn ystod y saith mlynedd nesaf. Yn Rhagfyr, byddwn yn cyhoeddi cynllun strategol drafft ar gyfer 2001-02 ac ar gyfer y blynnyddoedd wedi hynny, y gall y Cynulliad, gofeithio, ei fabwysiadu ym Mawrth 2001. Bydd y cynllun strategol hwnnw yn adeiladu ar waith rhagorol y 'Gwellcymru.com' gwreiddiol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The partnership agreement commits you to smaller primary school class sizes, but it is a well-known fact that secondary school class sizes have increased dramatically since the election of the First Minister's party to Government in 1997. When will the First Minister commit himself and his administration to halting this damaging increase in class sizes at secondary school level?

**The First Minister:** 'Betterwales.com' also included targets for primary school size reduction. However, the question of secondary school class sizes is more appropriately addressed to Jane Davidson, Minister for Education and Life-long Learning.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** One of the most interesting parts of the coalition documents that you signed with the Liberal Democrats is the commitment to consider the introduction of proportional representation for local government elections. Can you tell us today whether you are personally in favour of PR for council elections?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that it would be right and proper for me to offer a view when—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'O.]

This herd-of-donkeys-type braying is all very well orchestrated. I have to commend the choral traditions of the Plaid Cymru group. You should enter a choir in the National Eisteddfod or the Royal Welsh Agricultural Show—I am not sure which. [Laughter.]

We are committed to establishing an independent commission to look into voting systems for local government. That does not exclude matters relating to proportional representation. People of all views will have the opportunity to present their philosophies, feelings and sentiments based on their experience of the voting systems in local

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'r cytundeb partneriaeth yn eich ymrwymo i ddosbarthiadau llai mewn ysgolion cynradd, ond mae'n ffaith gwbl hysbys bod maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion uwchradd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ers adeg ethol plaid y Prif Weinidog i Lywodraeth yn 1997. Pryd y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymrwymo ei hun a'i weinyddiaeth i atal y cynnydd niweidiol hwn ym maint dosbarthiadau ar lefel ysgolion uwchradd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oedd 'Gwellcymru.com' hefyd yn cynnwys targedau ar gyfer lleihau maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion cynradd. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n fwy priodol holi Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ynglŷn â maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion uwchradd.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Leader of the Opposition.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Un o'r rhannau mwyaf diddorol o'r dogfennau clymlaid a lofnodwyd gennych gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw'r ymrwymiad i ystyried cyflwyno cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol mewn etholiadau llywodraeth leol. A allwch ddweud wrthym heddiw a ydych chi'n bersonol o blaid cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ar gyfer etholiadau cyngor?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni chredaf y byddai'n briodol imi roi barn pan—[AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.]

Mae'r brefu hwn megis gyr o asynnod wedi ei drefnu'n dda iawn. Rhaid imi ganmol traddodiadau corawl grŵp Plaid Cymru. Dylech gystadlu fel côr yn yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol neu Sioe Frenhinol Amaethyddol Cymru—nid wyf yn siŵr pa un. [Chwerthin.]

Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i sefydlu comisiwn annibynnol a fydd yn ymchwilio i systemau pleidleisio ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Gallai hynny gynnwys materion sydd yn ymwneud â chynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Bydd pobl o bob safbwyt yn cael cyfreithiadau eu hathrawiaethau, a'u teimladau yn seiliedig ar eu profiad o systemau pleidleisio llywodraeth

government. Some will be in favour of PR; others will be against it and in favour of no change. Therefore, at this stage, I am not sure whether it is entirely appropriate for me, as First Minister, to say what I favour. I have been a member of the Labour campaign for electoral reform for many years, which may give you some indication. However, I have never expressed a view about the applicability of electoral reform to any one system, whether for Westminster, local government, European or Assembly elections.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am somewhat amazed at the First Minister's coyness in giving us his personal view on this matter, because everybody else involved in politics in Wales is giving us his or her view. On Sunday, *The Observer* stated that even Tony Blair was in favour of introducing PR for local elections. We know that Charles Kennedy is in favour of PR for local elections, as is Mike German. I can also tell you who is against PR for local elections: Jeff Jones, the leader of Bridgend County Borough Council. We also know that most of your colleagues in Westminster are against PR. How can the First Minister stay out of this debate? Surely, he has a responsibility to tell us where he stands on this issue.

**The First Minister:** I am sorry, Ieuan, you prefaced your question with a rather cunning word: personal. Personal opinions, to a degree, must be set aside when one is First Minister. It is perfectly possible for people to hold personal opinions but not to offer those opinions because they believe that their responsibility as First Minister is to take an overarching view of what is in the best interest of Wales in the light of the views that are expressed to them, regardless of what their personal opinions might be.

When this review has been set up, I believe that the partnership document commits us to put it before the Assembly. All the people that Ieuan listed, from the Prime Minister downwards, can put their views to this independent commission. As it then comes to the Assembly's Cabinet, with me as First

leol. Bydd rhai o blaid cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol; bydd eraill yn ei herbyn ac o blaid peidio â newid. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'n gwbl briodol imi, fel Prif Weinidog, nodi'r hyn sydd orau gennyf. Bûm yn aelod o ymgrych y Blaid Lafur dros ddiwygio etholiadol ers blynnyddoedd lawer, a allai roi rhyw amcan ichi. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf erioed wedi mynegi barn ynghylch pa mor berthnasol fyddai diwygio etholiadol i unrhyw un system, boed yn etholiadau San Steffan, llywodraeth leol, Ewrop neu'r Cynulliad.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Synnaf braidd bod y Prif Weinidog mor amharod i roi ei farm bersonol ar y mater hwn inni, am fod pawb arall sydd yn ymwneud â gwleidyddiaeth Cymru yn rhoi eu barn hwy. Ddydd Sul, dywedodd *The Observer* fod hyd yn oed Tony Blair o blaid cyflwyno cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ar gyfer etholiadau lleol. Gwyddom fod Charles Kennedy o blaid cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ar gyfer etholiadau lleol, a Mike German hefyd. Gallaf ddweud wrthych hefyd pwysydd yn erbyn cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ar gyfer etholiadau lleol: Jeff Jones, arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Gwyddom hefyd fod y rhan fwyaf o'ch cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan yn erbyn cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Sut y gall y Prif Weinidog ymgadw rhag y ddadl hon? Onid oes cyfrifoldeb arno i ddweud wrthym beth yw ei farm ar y mater hwn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ieuan, cyn gofyn eich cwestiwn defnyddiasoch air bach cyfrwys, sef personol. Rhaid i unigolyn ymwrthod â barn bersonol i raddau pan fydd yn Brif Weinidog. Mae'n gwbl dderbyniol i ddyn fod â barn bersonol ond iddo wrthod rhoi'r farm honno oherwydd ei fod yn credu mai ei gyfrifoldeb fel Prif Weinidog yw llunio barn gyffredin o'r hyn fyddai orau er lles Cymru yng ngoleuni'r safbwytiau a fynegwyd iddo, waeth beth fo ei farm bersonol yntau.

Pan sefydlir yr adolygiad hwn, credaf fod y ddogfen bartneriaeth yn ein hymrwymo i'w osod gerbron y Cynulliad. Gall yr holl bobl a restrwyd gan Ieuan, o'r Prif Weinidog i lawr, roi eu barn i'r comisiwn annibynnol hwn. Gan y bydd wedyn yn dod i Gabinet y Cynulliad, a minnau fel Prif Weinidog, i

Minister, to make a recommendation to the Assembly based on what will emerge from it, I do not think that it is wise for me to express what might be my personal opinion at this stage. I am not sure that I have a formed personal opinion on the application of the principle of PR to local government.

wneud argymhelliaid i'r Cynulliad yn seiliedig ar yr hyn a fydd yn deillio ohono, ni chredaf ei bod yn ddoeth imi fynegi fy marn bersonol o bosibl ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf yn siŵr fy mod wedi llunio barn bersonol ar ddefnyddio egwyddor cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol mewn llywodraeth leol.

### **Hyrwyddo Cymru Ledled y Byd** **Promoting Wales to the Global Community**

**Q4 Christine Chapman:** What has the Assembly done to promote Wales to the widest global community? (OAQ7256)

**The First Minister:** The existence of the Assembly has done a great deal to promote Wales across Europe. Because of its natural interest in the only other part of the globe that shares its name, the state of New South Wales in Australia was interested in the setting up of the Assembly. Therefore, it would help if we could establish the Assembly in the minds of at least the politically interested classes in Europe. We must ruefully accept that the marriage of Catherine Zeta Jones to Michael Douglas will probably do more to put Wales on the map, at least in North America, than anything the Assembly does. That is how it is in the publicity stakes and we cannot really compete with that.

At the moment, for instance, 450 members of the society of American travel writers are attending an annual conference in Wales. This is an incredible opportunity for the people of Wales to establish themselves and to carve out a much bigger share of the inbound tourist market from the USA and Canada over the next five years. The conference has not before been held in Wales in the 44 years of the society's existence. It was a great privilege for me to have the opportunity to address it on Sunday.

**Christine Chapman:** After this weekend's European Cup rugby action, much of the world will have sat up and taken notice of Wales. However, further to your answer, can you tell me whether the Assembly will investigate the possible introduction of a scheme along the lines of the British Chevening scholarship, to allow international students to study in this country and take

**C4 Christine Chapman:** Beth mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i wneud i hyrwyddo Cymru i'r gymuned fyd-eang ehangaf? (OAQ7256)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaeth bodolaeth y Cynulliad gryn dipyn i hyrwyddo Cymru ledled Ewrop. Oherwydd ei diddordeb naturiol yn yr unig le arall yn y byd sydd yn dwyn yr un enw â hi, yr oedd gan dalaith De Cymru Newydd yn Awstralia ddiddordeb yn sefydliad y Cynulliad. Felly, byddai o gymorth pe gallem sefydlu'r Cynulliad ym meddwl y dosbarthiadau sydd â diddordeb gwleidyddol yn Ewrop o leiaf. Rhaid inni dderbyn gan resynu y bydd priodas Catherine Zeta Jones â Michael Douglas yn debygol o wneud mwy i roi Cymru ar y map, o leiaf yng Ngogledd America, nag unrhyw beth a wna'r Cynulliad, Dyma'r sefyllfa o safbwyt cyhoeddusrwydd ac ni allwn gystadlu yn erbyn hynny mewn gwirionedd.

Ar hyn o bryd, er enghraift, mae 450 o aelodau cymdeithas awduron taith America yn mynchu cynhadledd flynyddol yng Nghymru. Mae hwn yn gyfle anhygoel i bobl Cymru ennill bri a mynnu cyfran lawer mwy o'r farchnad dwristaidd a fydd yn dod i mewn o UDA a Chanada dros y pum mlynedd nesaf. Ni chynhaliwyd y gynhadledd yng Nghymru o'r blaen ers sefydlu'r gymdeithas 44 o flynyddoedd yn ôl. Bu'n faint o'r mwyaf imi gael y cyfle i'w hannerch ddydd Sul.

**Christine Chapman:** Ar ôl gemau rygbi'r Cwpan Ewropeaidd dros y penwythnos hwn, bydd llawer o'r byd wedi deffro a rhoi sylw i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, ymhellach i'ch ateb, a allwch ddweud wrthyf a fydd y Cynulliad yn ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o gyflwyno cynllun ar hyd llinellau ysgoroliaeth Chevening Prydain, er mwyn caniatáu i fyfyrwyr rhyngwladol astudio yn y wlad hon

home their experiences and spread the message of Wales abroad. This scheme has had some impact in Wales but it is possibly still limited in its scope.

**The First Minister:** I have only limited familiarity with the Chevening scholarships for international students. There is an issue of getting at opinion formers while they are still in their early twenties, bringing them to Wales and showing them how we attempt to make the new Welsh democracy work. They will return to their own countries and, possibly, as they are opinion formers and they may become quite important and even become prime ministers of their own countries in the next 20 years, they will have a little recognition of Wales in years to come. I do not know the details of this scheme but we must take any opportunity that is presented to us to attract overseas students and overseas investment, to promote the exports of Welsh food and drink and other Welsh exports and to promote tourism into Wales. The Assembly gives us the platform to do it in a way that we never had before. The existence of the Assembly is an unrepeatable bargain opportunity to promote Wales and we must take these opportunities when they arise.

**Geraint Davies:** While attempts to promote Wales on a global level are to be welcomed, does the First Minister agree that a far more pressing priority is the need to promote Wales itself and, in particular, to promote the most deprived communities in economic terms. The consensus within these communities, certainly in my own and probably in the Cynon Valley as well, is that this is not being done sufficiently at present. When does the First Minister expect his administration to reverse this consensus?

**The First Minister:** There is a slight overdose of doom and gloom in that question. The Assembly is committed, as an overarching principle in 'Betterwales.com', to reversing and combating social disadvantage. That must imbue all our policies, and we have undertaken to do that. If Geraint wants to write to me to point out an area where our promotion of Wales is not

gan fynd â'u profiadau gartref a lledaenu'r neges am Gymru dramor. Cafodd y cynllun hwn rywfaint o effaith ar Gymru ond efallai bod ei gwmpas yn gyfyngedig o hyd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn ag ysgoloriaethau Chevening ar gyfer myfyrwyr rhwngwladol. Mae'n ymwneud â mater dylanwadu ar lunwyr barn tra byddant yn dal yn eu hugeiniau cynnar, gan ddod â hwy i Gymru a dangos iddynt sut yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau bod democraeth newydd Cymru yn gweithio. Dychwelant i'w gwledydd eu hunan, ac, o bosibl, gan y byddant yn llunwyr barn ac efallai yn dod yn eithaf pwysig a hyd yn oed yn brif weinidogion eu gwledydd eu hun yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd nesaf, bydd ganddynt rywfaint o adnabyddiaeth o Gymru yn y blynnyddoedd i ddod. Ni wn am fanylion y cynllun hwn ond rhaid inni fanteisio ar unrhyw gyfle posibl i ddenu myfyrwyr a buddsoddiad tramor, er mwyn hyrwyddo allforion bwyd a diod Cymru ac allforion eraill Cymru a hyrwyddo twristiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'r Cynulliad yn rhoi llwyfan inni wneud hyn mewn ffordd na chawsom erioed o'r blaen. Mae bodolaeth y Cynulliad yn gyfle arbennig nas gwelwn byth eto i hyrwyddo Cymru a rhaid inni fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hynny pan godant.

**Geraint Davies:** Er bod rhaid croesawu unrhyw ymgais i hyrwyddo Cymru ledled y byd, a fydd y Prif Weinidog yn cytuno bod yr angen i hyrwyddo Cymru ei hun ac, yn arbennig, y cymunedau mwyaf diffreintiedig yn economaidd yn flaenoriaeth llawer pwysicach. Y farn gyffredinol yn y cymunedau hyn, ac yn sicr yn fy nghwm i a fwy na thebyg yng Nghwm Cynon hefyd, yw nad yw hyn yn cael ei wneud yn ddigonol ar hyn o bryd. Pryd y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn disgwyl i'w weinyddiaeth wrthbrofi'r farn hon?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae ychydig gormod o ddiflaстod yn y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig, fel egwyddor gyffredinol yn 'Gwellcymru.com' i unioni a gwrthsefyll anfantais gymdeithasol. Rhaid i hynny ymdreiddio i bob un o'n polisiau, ac yr ydym wedi addo gwneud hynny. Os hoffai Geraint ysgrifennu ataf gan nodi unrhyw faes lle nad yw ein hymgyrch i

combating social disadvantage, then I hope that I can put it right quickly.

hyrwyddo Cymru yn gwrthsefyll anfantais gymdeithasol, yna gobethiaf y gallaf ei gywiro'n fuan.

2:17 p.m.

### **Gwella Delwedd Canolborth a Gorllewin Cymru Improving the Image of Mid and West Wales**

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives to ask question 5.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru i ofyn cwestiwn 5.

**Q5 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** What policies are under development to improve the image of mid and west Wales? (OAQ7262)

**C5 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Pa bolisiau sydd ar y gweill i wella delwedd canolborth a gorllewin Cymru? (OAQ7262)

**The First Minister:** This is like the previous question in reverse. I assume that what Nick means is his list constituency area, which includes a substantial part of eastern Wales as well, along the English border in Powys. However, that is the name of the list constituency for which he is a Member. It is a very non-industrial area, with the exception of the Llanelli and Ammanford areas. It is important that we keep in mind that, although it is an area of enormous importance for tourism and agriculture, we also need to promote it for industrial investment. We have had several breakthroughs in this area. It may be at the far end of the M4 corridor, but we have had the important call-centre development at Cleddau Bridge, the Mitsui Kinzoku door-lock factory in Ammanford and, at the eastern end of mid and west Wales, SBX Contech have come to Welshpool. That is a pretty good record over the past six months.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hwn yn debyg i'r cwestiwn blaenorol ond fel arall. Tybiaf mai'r hyn a olyga Nick yw ardal ei etholaeth restr, sydd yn cynnwys rhan sylweddol o ddwyrain Cymru yn ogystal, ar hyd y ffin â Lloegr ym Mhowys. Fodd bynnag, dyna enw'r etholaeth restr y mae'n Aelod drosti. Mae'n ardal anniwydiannol iawn, heblaw am ardaloedd Llanelli a Rhydaman. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cofio hynny, er ei bod yn ardal bwysig iawn o ran twristiaeth ac amaethyddiaeth, mae angen hefyd inni ei hyrwyddo ar gyfer buddsoddi diwydiannol. Cawsom sawl llwyddiant yn yr ardal hon. Er iddi fod ar ben pellaf corridor yr M4, yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gael datblygiad canolfan galwadau pwysig ym Mhont Cleddau, ffatri cloeon drysau Mitsui Kinzoku ym Rhydaman ac, ym mhen dwyreiniol canolborth a gorllewin Cymru, mae SBX Contech wedi dod i'r Trallwng. Mae hynny'n gofnod eithaf da yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf.

**Nick Bourne:** While I agree that there has been some limited success, there is still a major problem in parts of Powys, Brecon and Radnorshire. However, I specifically refer you to the problem of west Wales and Objective 1 funding. You will probably be aware that the west Wales local authorities met last week and said that they found the 35-page processing document for Objective 1 unnecessarily complicated. I wonder what you are proposing to do in relation to their comment.

**Nick Bourne:** Er fy mod yn cytuno y bu peth llwyddiant, mae problem fawr o hyd mewn rhannau o Bowys, Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. Fodd bynnag, fe'ch cyfeiriaf yn benodol at broblem gorllewin Cymru ac arian Amcan 1. Gwyddoch, mae'n siŵr, fod awdurdodau lleol gorllewin Cymru wedi cyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf gan ddweud bod y ddogfen brosesu 35 tudalen ar gyfer Amcan 1 yn un ddiangen o gymhleth yn eu tyb hwy. Beth, tybed, yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud ynglŷn â'u sylw.

**The First Minister:** Provided that it is acceptable to Europe, I am sure that we will

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ar yr amod ei bod yn dderbynio i Ewrop, yr wyf yn siŵr y

make every effort to make the forms less complex. The issue is whether you would then prejudice your ability to get money from Europe. If so, we cannot afford to do that; people will just have to live with that complexity. If that can be done as part of a general war against unnecessary bureaucracy, I guarantee that it will be done.

gwnawn bob ymdrech i sicrhau bod y ffurflenni yn llai cymhleth. Y cwestiwn yw a fydddech wedyn yn peryglu eich gallu i gael arian gan Ewrop. Os felly, ni allwn fforddio gwneud hynny; yn syml bydd yn rhaid i bobl dderbyn y cymhlethod hwnnw. Os gellir gwneud hynny fel rhan o ymgyrch gyffredinol yn erbyn biwrocratiaeth ddiangen, rhoddaf sicrwydd y gwnawn hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** Anybody who knows anything about mid Wales knows that we have a great image already. We need a little more help in marketing that to other people, as a tourist destination, and—as you said—a great location for business. Do you not agree that the extra money for the Wales Tourist Board and the WDA in the partnership agreement will help you and this administration to do so?

**The First Minister:** Yes, for example, in relation to food and drink sales, among the most successful food and drink exporters with a strong Welsh brand image are Tŷ Nant water and Rachel's organic yoghurt, from the Aberystwyth area. In getting themselves established across the UK, they are important path-breakers on behalf of the rest of the Welsh food and drink industry. On the question of tourism, the green and clean image of mid and west Wales is hugely important for the future of green, clean tourism, which is the future that everyone envisages for Wales.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gŵyr unrhyw un a wyr unrhyw beth am ganolbarth Cymru bod gennym ddelwedd wych eisoes. Mae angen inni gael ychydig mwy o gymorth i farchnata hynny i bobl eraill, fel cyrchfan i dwristiaid, ac—fel y dywedasoch—lleoliad rhagorol i fusnes. Oni chytunwch y bydd yr arian ychwanegol gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru a'r WDA yn y cytundeb partneriaeth yn eich helpu chi a'r weinyddiaeth i wneud hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd, er enghraifft, mewn perthynas â gwerthiannau bwyd a diod, gyda dŵr Tŷ Nant a iogwrt organig Rachel, o ardal Aberystwyth gyda'r allforwyr bwyd a diod mwyaf llwyddiannus â chanddynt frand Cymreig cryf. Wrth ennill bri ledled y DU, maent yn arloeswyr pwysig ar ran gweddill y diwydiant bwyd a diod Cymreig. O ran twristiaeth, mae delwedd werdd a glân canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru yn hynod bwysig i ddyfodol twristiaeth werdd, lân, sef y dyfodol y mae pawb yn ei ragweld ar gyfer Cymru.

### Cynlluniau ar gyfer Adolygiad o'r Cynulliad Plans for the Assembly's Review

**Q6 Pauline Jarman:** Will the First Minister make a brief statement on his plans for the Assembly's review? (OAQ7268)

**C6 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ar ei gynlluniau ar gyfer adolygiad o'r Cynulliad? (OAQ7268)

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for this question, which is not dissimilar to the question that another member of the Plaid Cymru group—Jocelyn, I think—asked me on 10 October. I want to re-emphasise that it is for all members of the review group, including the Presiding Officer, who will chair it, to agree on the best method of taking the review forward. The basic principle on which we will work is to investigate how we can change the Assembly's procedures:

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn hwn, nad yw'n annhebyg i'r cwestiwn a ofynnodd aelod arall o grŵp Plaid Cymru—Jocelyn, fe gredaf—imi ar 10 Hydref. Hoffwn bwysleisio eto mai cyfrifoldeb holl aelodau'r grŵp adolygu, gan gynnwys y Llywydd, sydd yn ei gadeirio, fydd cytuno ar y ffordd orau o gynnal yr adolygiad. Yr egwyddor sylfaenol a fydd yn sail i'n gwaith yw ymchwilio sut y gallwn newid gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad: pa un a yw

whether that is in relation to the way we ask questions here, to try and make them more contemporaneous; the timings of Assembly sessions, or the way in which the Committees work in their scrutinising role with Members of the Cabinet. We are willing to discuss and discover all ways of making the Assembly connect better with the people outside, through the way we work. This is not a review of the powers of the Assembly; it is about reviewing the modus operandi of the Assembly, to make it a more effective body.

**Pauline Jarman:** The review of the Assembly will be a worthwhile project. Do you agree that the Executive and back benchers have an equal and unique contribution to make to the review from their different perspectives? Do you also agree that it should be made clear to the Labour and Liberal Democrat groups in this Chamber that one either participates as a member of the Government of Wales partnership or as a member of the opposition?

**The First Minister:** I refer Pauline to my answer to a question asked either by Ieuan or Dafydd, who are sitting in front of her. An inevitable consequence of having a majority-based government, as we now have, is that we need to strengthen the rights of back benchers and of the two opposition parties to be able to scrutinise the Executive. Exactly how we do that is not up to me, but it could be done in the review. We need to recognise the different structure that now exists and the need for greater scrutiny. I do not know exactly how that should be done; whether it can be done in the Committees as they are, or whether we need separate scrutiny sessions. We can deal with that matter during the review. It is urgently necessary as a consequence of forming the partnership Government.

**David Davies:** Will the First Minister ensure that part of that review includes the issue of open questions to the First Minister? Does he recall making a speech to the Institute of Welsh Affairs on 14 February, in which he said that he could not understand why open questions were not asked to the then First Secretary? Is he also aware that asking questions to the First Minister has become markedly more difficult in the last month or

hynny mewn perthynas â'r ffordd yr ydym yn gofyn cwestiynau yma, gan geisio sicrhau eu bod yn fwy amserol; amseriad sesiynau'r Cynulliad, neu'r ffordd y mae'r Pwyllgorau'n gweithio yn eu rôl archwilio gydag Aelodau'r Cabinet. Yr ydym yn fodlon trafod a chanfod pob ffordd o sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn cysylltu â'r bobl ar y tu allan yn well, trwy'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithio. Nid adolygiad o bwerau'r Cynulliad ydyw; ei ddiben yw adolygu gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad, er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn gorff mwy effeithiol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Bydd adolygiad o'r Cynulliad yn brosiect gwerth chweil. A gytunwch y gall yr Weithrediaeth ac aelodau'r meinciau cefn wneud cyfraniad cyfartal ac unigryw tuag at yr adolygiad o'u gwahanol safbwytiau? A gytunwch hefyd y dylid ei gwneud yn glir i'r grŵp Llafur a grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Siambra hon bod yr aelodau naill ai'n cymryd rhan fel aelod o bartneriaeth Llywodraeth Cymru neu fel aelod o'r wrthblaidd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cyfeiriaf Pauline at fy ateb i gwestiwn a ofynnwyd gan naill ai Ieuan neu Dafydd, sydd yn eistedd o'i blaen. Canlyniad anochel llywodraeth fwyafriol, fel sydd gennym bellach, yw bod angen inni atgyfnerthu hawliau aelodau'r meinciau cefn a'r ddwy wrthblaidd i allu archwilio'r Weithrediaeth. Nid fi fydd yn gyfrifol am benderfynu sut yn union y gwnawn hynny, ond gallai fod yn rhan o'r adolygiad. Rhaid inni gydnabod y strwythur gwahanol sydd yn bodoli bellach a'r angen am well archwilio. Ni wn sut yn union y dylid gwneud hynny; pa un a ellir ei wneud yn y Pwyllgorau fel y maent, neu a oes angen sesiynau archwilio ar wahân arnom. Gallwn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw yn ystod yr adolygiad. Mae angen brys amdano yn sgîl llunio'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth.

**David Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog sicrhau bod y rhan honno o'r adolygiad hwnnw yn cwmpasu mater cwestiynau agored i'r Prif Weinidog? A yw'n cofio gwneud arraith i'r Sefydliad Materion Cymreig ar 14 Chwefror, pan ddywedodd na allai ddeall pam na ofynnwyd cwestiynau agored i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ar y pryd? A yw hefyd yn ymwybodol bod gofyn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog wedi dod yn llawer anos yn

two, with questions which deviate in even the slightest fashion from the First Minister's brief being rejected?

**The First Minister:** I am not responsible for decisions made by the Table Office as to what questions can or cannot be asked of the First Minister. I understand the background to this because, if I do not have a portfolio interest, it is a trickier job requiring more initiative and gumption on the part of questioners to find their way past the otherwise impenetrable defences of the Table Office. However, that is not a matter for me. It involves the way in which the Table Office interprets the rules and I do not want to get involved in that area.

As I spoke without notes on the evening in question, I do not remember every detail of what I said. I still adhere to the broad thrust of my speech. I am not sure about open questions. I think that I said that, back then. We do not want to go down the Westminster route of all the silly nonsense of every open question having to be prefaced by an enquiry about the Prime Minister's engagements. If we could find another way around it so that we have contemporaneous questions, I would be happy to consider how best it could be done.

#### **Gwireddu Penderfyniadau a Gaiff eu Pasio yn y Cyfarfodydd Llawn** **Fulfilling Resolutions Passed in Plenary**

**Q7 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a brief statement on the progress made by the Assembly towards fulfilling resolutions passed in Plenary sessions? (OAQ7271)

**The First Minister:** Subject to the Melissa virus's depredations on the OSIRIS system—I can talk total computer gobbledegook—a table setting out the action taken by the Executive between 6 June and 10 October 2000 has been placed on the Cabinet statements page on the intranet. I am pleased that the intranet can be accessed today, as it could not be yesterday. I am sorry for that, Jocelyn. In addition, a table of action taken by the Executive between 6 July 1999 and 24 May 2000, which was first published in June, has recently been updated and is also

yystod yr ychydig fisoeedd diwethaf, gyda chwestiynau sydd yn gwyro'r mymryn lleiaf o briff y Prif Weinidog yn cael eu gwrthod?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid fi sydd yn gyfrifol am benderfyniadau a wneir gan y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ynghylch pa gwestiynau y gellir neu na ellir eu gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog. Deallaf y cefndir y tu ôl i hyn oherwydd, os nad oes gennyf ddiddordeb portffolio, mae'n dasg llawer anos sydd yn gofyn am flaengaredd a chrebwyll ar ran y rhai sydd yn gofyn cwestiynau i oresgyn amddiffynfeydd hynod gadarn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno. Fodd bynnag, nid mater i mi ydyw. Mae'n ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno yn dehongli'r rheolau ac nid wyf am ymyrryd yn y maes hwnnw.

Am imi siarad heb nodiadau ar y noson dan sylw, ni chofiaf bob manylyn o'r hyn a ddywedais. Yr wyf yn parhau i lynn wrth brif fyrdwn fy arraith. Nid wyf yn siŵr ynglŷn â chwestiynau agored. Credaf i mi ddweud hynny bryd hynny. Nid ydym am ddilyn nonsens San Steffan lle y mae'n rhaid i bob cwestiwn agored a ofynnir gael ei ragflaenu gan ymholiad ynglŷn ag ymrwymiadau'r Prif Weinidog. Os gallwn ganfod ffordd arall fel y bydd gennym gwestiynau amserol, byddwn yn fodlon ystyried y ffordd orau o wneud hynny.

**C7 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd gan y Cynulliad tuag at wireddu'r penderfyniadau a gaiff eu pasio yn y Cyfarfodydd Llawn? (OAQ7271)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gan ddibynnu ar y difrod a barodd firws Melissa ar system OSIRIS—gallafer siarad rwdl-mi-ri cyfrifiadurol yn hawdd—gosodwyd tabl sydd yn nodi'r camau a gymerwyd gan y Weithrediaeth rhwng 6 Mehefin a 10 Hydref 2000 ar dudalen datganiadau'r Cabinet ar y fewnrwyd. Yr wyf yn falch y gellir cyrchu'r fewnrwyd heddiw, gan na ellid gwneud hyn ddoe. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am hynny, Jocelyn. Yn ogystal, diweddarwyd tabl o gamau a gymerwyd gan y Weithrediaeth rhwng 6 Gorffennaf 1999 a 24 Mai, a

available on the intranet today, although it was not yesterday.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I am sure that Rhodri will agree that the public will soon lose confidence in us if we pass resolutions but do nothing about them. Will you tell us exactly what the Cabinet has done to promote a vibrant and confident Wales by leading the campaign for St David's Day to become a national public holiday? That resolution received the unanimous support of this Chamber seven months ago.

**The First Minister:** Jocelyn is in danger of falling into outsider thinking on leading campaigns, although that is fair enough as she is a member of the opposition and leading campaigns is what you are all about. Where it is not a matter for the Assembly—this is an issue for central Government and is not devolved—you can ask whether the administration in the Assembly should also be leading campaigns or is there another way of trying to do it. I would not depart from the sentiments that Jocelyn has expressed. However, although Jocelyn may think that the only way of leading the campaign is by using Plaid Cymru's megaphone and she wants to lend that megaphone to me, there may be other ways in which I can lead the campaign as the Assembly's First Minister.

2:27 p.m.

**Peter Rogers:** Do you recall the resolution made on 14 September last year, calling for further action to address the crisis in the agricultural industry? Do you accept that bureaucracy is frustrating that industry, and can the Assembly deliver on that resolution? In addition, how do you plan to stand up to Brussels in the interests of the industry in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I recall that the motion to which you referred took place prior to the special settlement made after approaches by this administration, the Scottish Parliament and others to bring short-term assistance to the agricultural industry. Therefore, there was a response to that resolution. I believe that most farming unions and farmers in Wales

gyhoeddwyd yn gyntaf ym Mehefin, yn ddiweddar, ac mae hwnnw hefyd ar gael ar y fewnrwyd heddiw, er nad oedd ddoe.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytuna Rhodri y bydd y cyhoedd yn colli hyder ynom yn go fuan os pasiwn benderfyniadau ond na wnaeon unrhyw beth amdanynt. A wnewch ddweud wrthym beth yn union y mae'r Cabinet wedi ei wneud i hyrwyddo Cymru fywiog a hyderus trwy arwain yr ymgyrch dros sicrhau bod Dydd Gŵyl Ddewi yn wyl gyhoeddus genedlaethol? Cafodd y penderfyniad hwnnw gefnogaeth unfrydol gan y Siambra hon saith mis yn ôl.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Jocelyn mewn perygl o fabwysiadu meddylfryd pobl o'r tu allan o ran ymgyrchu, er bod hynny'n ddigon teg gan ei bod yn aelod o'r wrthblaid ac arwain ymgyrchoedd yw eich nod chi. Lle nad yw'n fater i'r Cynulliad—mae hwn yn fater i Lywodraeth ganolog ac nid yw'n fater a ddatganolir—gallwch holi a ddylai'r weinyddiaeth yn y Cynulliad hefyd ymgyrchu neu a oes ffordd arall o geisio cyflawni hyn. Nid af yn groes i'r teimladau a fynegwyd gan Jocelyn. Fodd bynnag, er bod Jocelyn yn meddwl o bosibl mai'r unig ffordd o ymgyrchu yw trwy ddefnyddio megaffon Plaid Cymru ac yr hoffai roi benthyg y megaffon hwnnw imi, efallai bod ffyrdd eraill imi arwain yr ymgyrch fel Prif Weinidog y Cynulliad.

**Peter Rogers:** A ydych yn cofio'r penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd ar 14 Medi y llynedd, yn galw am weithredu pellach i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng yn y diwydiant amaethyddol? A gytunwch fod biwrocratiaeth yn rhwystro'r diwydiant hwnnw, ac a all y Cynulliad gyflawni'r penderfyniad hwnnw? Yn ogystal, sut y bwriadwch wrthsefyll Brwsel er lles y diwydiant yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cofiaf i'r cynnig y cyfeiriasoch ato ddigwydd cyn i'r setliad arbennig a wnaethpwyd ar ôl ceisiadau gan y weinyddiaeth hon, Senedd yr Alban ac eraill i roi cymorth tymor byr i'r diwydiant amaethyddol. Felly, bu ymateb i'r penderfyniad hwnnw. Credaf y bu'r rhan fwyaf o'r undebau amaethwyr a ffermwyr

were pleased with the amount of emergency assistance that they received as a consequence of that resolution, and the meetings between Christine Gwyther, myself and the Welsh farming unions in Llandeilo and approaches made to the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food and the Prime Minister shortly thereafter. Therefore, there was a clear and measurable response, which involved a large sum of money. It would not be fair if we did not record that.

On Peter's other point about Brussels doing various things, he must be more specific. If he wants to write to me about that, I will ensure that the matter is pursued.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 8 has been withdrawn.

### **Goblygiadau Ehangu'r UE Implications of EU Enlargement**

**Q9 Christine Gwyther:** Will the First Minister report on any talks that he has held with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding implications for Wales of European Union enlargement? (OAQ7254)

**The First Minister:** I have just had lunch with the Polish ambassador. We discussed that issue about an hour ago. This is a matter of massive interest to us in terms of the agriculture industry. Agriculture is the big sticking point in terms of the Polish application. I mentioned Poland because its population is the same as the total population of the other six or seven applicant countries that are in the frame. Therefore, it is a big player in the enlargement issue.

On industry, Poland is of enormous importance because firms that are particularly sensitive to labour costs are migrating to Poland, Hungary, the Czech Republic and so on. Firms involved in television set production, and electronic and automotive component production are migrating to those countries because their labour costs are one-sixth or one-seventh of those in Wales. Therefore, it pays to move unless you can bring in big investment to compensate for

ying Nghymru yn fodlon ar swm y cymorth brys a gawsant o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniad hwnnw, a'r cyfarfodydd rhwng Christine Gwyther, undebau amaethwyr Cymru a minnau yn Llandeilo a'r ceisiadau a wnaethpwyd i'r Wein yddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd a'r Prif Weinidog yn fuan wedi hynny. Felly, bu ymateb clir a mesuradwy, a oedd yn golygu swm mawr o arian. Ni fyddai'n deg pe na baem yn cofnodi hynny.

Ynglŷn â phwynt arall Peter am Frwsel yn gwneud amrywiol bethau, rhaid iddo fod yn fwy penodol. Os hoffai ysgrifennu ataf am hynny, gwnaf sicrhau ein bod yn mynd ar drywydd y mater.

**Y Llwydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 8 yn ôl.

**C9 Christine Gwyther:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru adrodd yn ôl ar unrhyw drafodaethau a gafodd gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yng hylch y goblygiadau i Gymru o ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? (OAQ7254)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf newydd gael cinio gyda llysgennad Gwlad Pŵyl. Trafodwyd y mater hwnnw gennym tua awr yn ôl. Mae hwn yn fater o ddiddordeb mawr inni o ran y diwydiant amaethyddol. Amaethyddiaeth yw'r prif rwystr o safbwyt cais Gwlad Pŵyl. Soniais am Wlad Pŵyl am fod ei phoblogaeth tua'r un maint a chyfanswm poblogaeth y chwech neu saith gwlad arall y mae eu ceisiadau yn cael eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae'n chwaraewr pwysig o ran mater ehangu.

O safbwyt diwydiant, mae Gwlad Pŵyl yn hynod bwysig am fod y cwmnïau sydd yn hynod sensitif i gostau llafur yn symud i Wlad Pŵyl, Hwngari, y Weriniaeth Tsiec ac yn y blaen. Mae cwmnïau sydd yn cynhyrchu setiau teledu, a chydranau electronig a modurol yn symud i'r gwledydd hynny am fod eu costau llafur yn un rhan o chwech neu un rhan o saith o'r costau llafur yng Nghymru. Felly, mae'n talu i symud oni allwch ddenu buddsoddiad mawr i wneud yn

that saving in labour costs. When Wales joined the European Community in 1973, it was in roughly the same state of economic development as countries such as Poland are in now.

**Christine Gwyther:** Do you agree that if—or maybe ‘when’ is more appropriate—enlargement happens, Objective 1 funding would move to the new member states? I discovered this on a recent visit to Brussels. Do you also agree that the implications for Wales now need close examination in readiness for the post-Objective 1 era? A week might be a long time in politics, but seven years is no time at all to reach our economic destination.

**The First Minister:** I agree that we must look ahead to 2007, even now. Discussions have begun with the Department of Trade and Industry and other branches of the British Government regarding our attitude towards the renewal of the European regional development fund programme in 2007. By that time, it is probably almost beyond a peradventure that six countries in eastern Europe and perhaps one or two small countries in southern Europe, such as Malta and Cyprus, will have joined the European Union. A key issue for us is whether we have any realistic prospect of getting an Objective 1 renewal if those countries lower the average, below which no part of Wales would probably qualify. If those countries join the EU, the best that we can hope for is a good transition programme, as the Highlands and Islands had when they lost their Objective 1 status. Northern Ireland also has a good transition programme, although it lost Objective 1 status. Therefore, maybe that is the best for which we can hope. However, discussions have begun about what will happen in 2007 and afterwards.

iawn am arbediad o'r fath o ran costau llafur. Pan ymunodd Cymru â'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd yn 1973, yr oedd fwy neu lai yn yr un cyflwr o ddatblygiad economaidd ag y mae gwledydd megis Gwlad Pwyl ynddo yn awr.

**Christine Gwyther:** A gytunwch os bydd—neu efallai fod ‘pan fydd’ yn fwy priodol—ehangu, y byddai arian Amcan 1 yn symud i'r aelod-wladwriaethau newydd? Canfûm hyn ar ymweliad diweddar â Brwsel. A gytunwch hefyd fod angen ymchwilio i'r goblygiadau i Gymru'n fanwl yn awr er mwyn bod yn barod am y cyfnod ar ôl Amcan 1? Efallai fod wythnos yn amser hir mewn gwleidyddiaeth, ond nid yw saith mlynedd yn ddim inni gyrraedd ein nod economaidd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf fod yn rhaid inni edrych ymlaen at 2007, hyd yn oed yn awr. Mae trafodaethau wedi dechrau gyda'r Adran Diwydiant a Masnach a changhennau eraill o Lywodraeth Prydain ynglŷn â'n hagwedd tuag at adnewyddu rhaglen y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd yn 2007. Erbyn hynny, yn ddiabron, bydd chwe gwlad yn nwyrain Ewrop ac efallai un neu ddwy o'r gwledydd bach yn ne Ewrop, fel Malta a Cyprus, wedi ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Un o'r materion allweddol inni yw a oes gennym unrhyw obaith realistig y caiff Amcan 1 ei adnewyddu os bydd y gwledydd hynny yn gostwng y lefel gyfartalog mor isel fel na fyddai unrhyw ran o Gymru yn debygol o fod yn gymwys. Os bydd y gwledydd hynny yn ymuno â'r UE, y gorau y gallwn ei ddisgwyl yw rhaglen drosi dda, fel y cafodd Ucheldiroedd ac Ynysoedd yr Alban pan gollasant statws Amcan 1. Mae gan Ogledd Iwerddon hefyd raglen drosi dda, er iddo golli statws Amcan 1. Felly, efallai mai hynny yw'r gorau y gallwn ei ddisgwyl. Fodd bynnag, dechreuwyd trafodaethau eisoes ynglŷn â'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn 2007 ac wedi hynny.

### Ceisiadau am Iawndal gan Lowyr Cymru Compensation Claims by Welsh Miners

**Q10 Geraint Davies:** Has the First Minister had any discussions with the Department of Trade and Industry regarding compensation claims by Welsh miners? (OAQ7263)

**C10 Geraint Davies:** A gafodd Prif Weinidog Cymru unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r Adran Diwydiant a Masnach ynglŷn â cheisiadau am iawndal gan lowyr Cymru? (OAQ7263)

**The First Minister:** Yes, I have had many discussions on that issue. It arises frequently in discussions between myself and Helen Liddell, with the Secretary of State for Wales as an intermediary sometimes. It is of enormous concern, even though not a devolved issue. Inevitably people who suffer severe breathing problems—emphysema, or vibration white finger and other knock-on effects of long careers underground in coal mining—tend to look to the Assembly to help press their case for an early solution. The hands of the Department of Trade and Industry, and the British Government as a whole, are tied by the fact that the DTI is not in governmental mode, but it is a party to a dispute. It can and has put the money aside, several billions pounds if I remember rightly because this is the biggest legal case in British history. However, because it is a legal case, the DTI is not free to simply say as a Government department ‘here is the cheque, get the money out’ because you must go back to the judge who also hears pleas from the solicitors for the other side. Your hands are bound by the fact that you are a party to a legal case. Even governments cannot override judges who say ‘this is what you must do, this is the amount of time I am going to give and now I am also going to allow the other side to put their case’. You are not in governmental mode. You are in the mode of being a party to a legal case. Even though the money has been set aside it is difficult to get the money out of the door.

**Geraint Davies:** It is approaching three years since the miners won their historic victory in the court. There are over 116,000 miners still waiting for assessments for their compensation claims. The Government has promised to assess 4,000 cases a month but this year only 2,500 cases have been assessed. Meanwhile, thousands of miners have died waiting. Does he agree that this is a disgraceful situation and will he join in the call for Helen Liddell’s resignation?

**The First Minister:** No, I am not interested

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Do, cefais drafodaethau lawer ar y mater hwnnw. Mae'n codi'n aml mewn trafodaethau rhyngof i a Helen Liddell, gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn gweithredu fel canolwr weithiau. Mae'n achos pryder enbyd, er nad yw'n fater a ddatganolir. Yn anochel mae pobl sydd yn dioddef o broblemau anadlu difrifol—emphysema, neu gryndod bys gwyn ac effeithiau canlynol eraill ar ôl gweithio am gyfnodau maith tanddaear yn y diwydiant glo—yn tueddu i edrych i'r Cynulliad am gymorth i bwys o am eu hachos am ateb buan. Clymwyd dwylo penaethiaid yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, a Llywodraeth Prydain gyfan am nad yw'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn gweithredu fel adran, am iddi fod yn barti i'r anghydfod. Mae'n gallu ac mae wedi neilltuo arian, sawl biliwn o bunnau, os cofiaf, am mai hwn yw'r achos cyfreithiol mwyaf yn hanes Prydain. Fodd bynnag, am ei fod yn achos cyfreithiol, yn syml nid yw'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn rhydd i ddweud fel un o adrannau'r Llywodraeth, 'dyma'r siec, tynnwch yr arian allan' am fod yn rhaid ichi fynd yn ôl at y barnwr sydd hefyd yn gwrando ar bledion gan gyfreithwyr yr ochr arall. Clymir eich dwylo gan yffaith eich bod yn barti mewn achos cyfreithiol. Ni all llywodraethau hyd yn oed anwybyddu barnwyr a ddywed 'dyma beth sydd yn rhaid ichi ei wneud, dyma'r amser a roddaf ichi ac yr wyf yn awr hefyd yn mynd i ganiatáu i'r ochr arall gyflwyno ei hachos'. Nid ydych yn gweithredu fel llywodraeth. Yr ydych yn gweithredu fel parti i achos cyfreithiol. Er bod yr arian wedi ei neilltuo mae'n anodd cael yr arian allan trwy'r drws.

**Geraint Davies:** Mae tair blynedd bron wedi mynd heibio ers i'r glowyr ennill eu buddugoliaeth hanesyddol yn y llys. Mae dros 116,000 o lowyr yn aros o hyd i'w ceisiadau am iawndal gael eu hasesu. Addawodd y Llywodraeth asesu 4,000 o achosion y mis ond eleni dim ond 2,500 o achosion a aseswyd. Yn y cyfamser, mae miloedd o lowyr wedi marw tra'n aros. A wnaiff gytuno bod y sefyllfa hon yn un warthus ac a wnaiff ymuno yn yr alwad am ymddiswyddiad Helen Liddell?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Na wnaf, nid oes

in ministerial resignations of administrations of which I am not a part. That is irrelevant. Geraint, you would have to admit that what you have done is to describe the situation without offering any solutions.

**Dafydd Wigley:** You are wrong.

**The First Minister:** Dafydd, I do not know if you listened to what I said. It is not up to the Government to pay out. It is up to the judge to conduct the case. The money has been set aside. The problem is how to get it out of the door when you must go in front of a judge to do so. You are not in governmental mode, and not able to simply pay out. You must get the judge's authorisation to pay out. You cannot do that without being able to satisfy the judge after he has also heard from the solicitors of the individuals. You are not in governmental mode, but a party to a dispute. If you want to assist the solution, you must propose solutions that are better than the ones currently proposed. It is not enough to describe the situation. You have to come up with better solutions, for which we are all looking. The money is there, it only wants to be moved through the door.

gennyf ddiddordeb mewn gweinidogion yn ymddiswyddo o weinyddiaeth nad wyf yn rhan ohoni. Mae hynny'n amherthnasol. Geraint, rhaid ichi gyfaddef mai'r cwbl a wnaethoch oedd disgrifio'r sefyllfa heb gynnig unrhyw atebion.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yr ydych yn anghywir.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dafydd, ni wn a wrandawsoch ar yr hyn a ddywedais. Nid y Llywodraeth sydd yn penderfynu ar dalu iawndal. Penderfyniad y barnwr sydd yn cynnal yr achos ydyw. Neilltuwyd yr arian. Y broblem yw sut i'w gael allan trwy'r drws pan fydd yn rhaid ichi fynd gerbron barnwr i wneud hyn. Nid ydych yn gweithredu fel un o adrannau'r llywodraeth, ac yn syml ni allwch wneud taliadau. Rhaid ichi gael caniatad y barnwr cyn gwneud taliadau. Ni allwch wneud hynny os na allwch fodloni'r barnwr ar ôl iddo hefyd wrando ar gyfreithwyr yr unigolion. Nid ydych yn gweithredu fel llywodraeth, ond fel parti i anghydfod. Os ydych am helpu i ddatrys y broblem, rhaid ichi gynnig atebion sydd yn well na'r rhai a gynigir ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw disgrifio'r sefyllfa'n ddigon. Rhaid ichi gynnig atebion gwell, rhai yr ydym oll yn chwilio amdanynt. Mae'r arian yno, dim ond ei symud trwy'r drws sydd ei angen.

### Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

#### Damwain ar Reilffordd y Cambrian ger Porthmadog Accident on the Cambrian Railway near Porthmadog

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi penderfynu caniatáu i gwestiwn brys ar fater o ddiddordeb cyhoeddus gael ei ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Fe wnaif osgoi'r demtasiwn i ddod yn ôl ar y cwestiwn diwethaf.

A wnaiff Sue Essex ddatganiad ar y ddamwain angheuol ddoe ar Reilffordd y Cambrian ger Porthmadog? (EAQ7557)

**The Minister for the Environment (Sue Essex):** That was a terrible tragedy. I am sure that Assembly Members will wish to join me in extending our sympathy to the family and

**The Presiding Officer:** I have decided to allow an urgent question on a matter of public importance to be asked of the Minister for the Environment.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I will avoid the temptation to come back on the last question.

Will Sue Essex make a statement on the fatal accident yesterday on the Cambrian Railway near Porthmadog? (EAQ7557)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Yr oedd honno'n drychinez ofnadwy. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffai Aelodau'r Cynulliad ymuno â mi wrth estyn ein cydymdeimlad i

friends of Mr Andrew Deakin, who was killed. The British Transport Police, supported by Railtrack, have launched an investigation into the incident and an independent assessment has been made of the crossing to check its operational status at the time of the incident. The railway inspectorate's initial findings confirm that the equipment was in full working order. I will study the official findings of the investigation.

I was due to meet Gerald Corbett, Chief Executive of Railtrack, tomorrow. I have had several planned meetings that have not materialised. Were we meeting tomorrow, I would raise many safety issues for passengers travelling on the trains and for workers within the industry and, in the light of some terrible incidents in Wales, the issue of level crossing safety. This tragedy has reinforced that point.

2:37 p.m.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Estynnaf gydymdeimlad i deulu Andrew Deakin, y bachgen ifanc a laddwyd, a diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei chydymdeimlad hithau. A yw hi'n derbyn bod angen ymchwiliadau mewn dyfnder, nid yn unig i amgylchiadau'r ddamwain unigol hon ddoe, ond hefyd yn gyffredinol i'r croesfannau dilidiart hyn ar hyd rheilffordd y Cambrian a rheilffyrdd eraill yng Nghymru. A wnaiff hi gydlynus â gweinidogion yn Llundain a chwmni Railtrack i bwysu am ymchwiliad o'r fath gyda'r nod o gael systemau sydd yn sicrhau bod moduron yn cael eu hatal os oes trêñ yn agos? Yn olaf, a gytuna fod yn rhaid cael yr arian angenrheidiol i sicrhau diogelwch ar ein rheilffyrdd ac ar y croesfannau sydd yn mynd ar draws y rheilffyrdd, i'r rhai sydd yn teithio ar y trenau ac i'r rhai sydd mewn moduron?

**Sue Essex:** I agree with all your points. This also concerns pedestrian crossings over railways. There is one around the corner from where I live and they are having a site meeting with local people soon. If you look at the statistics—I have looked at them and I would not wish to preclude what comes out of this investigation—there is a pattern where terrible, tragic accidents occur. I will ask

deulu a chyfeillion Mr Andrew Deakin, a laddwyd. Mae Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydain, gyda chymorth Railtrack, wedi lansio ymchwiliad i'r digwyddiad a gwnaethpwyd asesiad annibynnol o'r groesfan er mwyn gwirio ei statws gweithredol ar adeg y digwyddiad. Mae canfyddiadau cychwynnol arolygiaeth y rheilffyrdd yn cadarnhau bod y cyfarpar yn gwbl weithredol. Byddaf yn astudio canfyddiadau swyddogol yr ymchwiliad.

Yr oeddwn i fod i gwrdd â Gerald Corbett, Prif Weithredwr Railtrack, yfory. Yr wyf wedi trefnu sawl cyfarfod ond nid ydynt wedi mynd rhagddynt. Pe baem yn cyfarfod yfory, codwn lawer o faterion diogelwch ar ran teithwyr sydd yn teithio ar y trenau ac ar ran gweithwyr yn y diwydiant ac, yng ngoleuni rhai o'r digwyddiadau ofnadwy yng Nghymru, fater diogelwch ar groesfannau rheilffordd. Mae'r drychineb hon wedi atgyfnerthu'r pwnt hwnnw.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I extend my sympathy to the family of Andrew Deakin, the young man who was killed, and I thank the Minister for her expressions of sympathy. Does she accept that we need in-depth inquiries, not only into the circumstances of this particular accident yesterday, but generally into crossings without barriers along the Cambrian railway and other railways in Wales? Will she liaise with ministers in London and Railtrack to press for such an inquiry with the aim of securing systems that ensure that vehicles are stopped if a train is close? Lastly, does she agree that we must have the necessary funds to ensure safety on our railways and on the level crossings that cross railways, for train passengers and for those in vehicles?

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf â phob un o'ch pwyniau. Mae hyn hefyd yn cwmpasu croesfannau i gerddwyr dros reilffyrdd. Mae un yn ymyl lle yr wyf yn byw a chynhelir cyfarfod safle gyda phobl leol yn fuan. Os edrychwrch ar yr ystadegau—edrychais arnynt ac ni hoffwn achub y blaen ar yr hyn a ddaw o'r ymchwiliad hwn—mae patrwm lle y digwydd damweiniau trychinebus ofnadwy.

Railtrack and the Health and Safety Executive to look at this in a completely new way because these accidents are so horrific. They need to look afresh at how absolute protection can be put in at these points. Tragically, the concern about safety has also arisen from other major incidents. I am pleased, as I am sure we all are, that we will now see a large sum of money coming from the Government to give priority to safety for train users and those who earn their living from working on trains.

**Mick Bates:** The Liberal Democrats wish to express their sympathy to the family. Over the years, we have seen many grave incidents along the length of the Cambrian line. You will be aware that there was a tragic accident last summer in Llanbrynmair in my constituency. I am sure that we welcome the money, but our concerns rest on what immediate action is to be taken on all the unmanned crossings that still exist. These are the particular points where tragedies seem to occur. I have met with residents and with Railtrack on site on many occasions. However, progress is slow. For the protection of those people who must use these crossings in the course of their daily lives, we need to know what immediate action you will be taking to protect them.

**Sue Essex:** As I said, I was due to meet Gerald Corbett tomorrow. That was postponed because of the accident at Hatfield. It would be better under the circumstances, and particularly as a result of this latest tragedy, for me to write on behalf of everybody here to say how concerned we are about a series of awful events. Prior to any meeting, I will take into account the feelings of Assembly Members and the people of Wales. I will then have an answer when I go to see him.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I thank the Minister for her sensitive response to this matter before us today. Without wishing to pre-empt the outcome of any inquiry, does the Minister agree that this pattern of accidents at level crossings without barriers strongly suggests that lights and sirens are not sufficient? In her

Gofynnaf i Railtrack a'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch i ymchwilio i hyn mewn ffordd holol newydd am fod y damweiniau hyn mor erchyll. Mae angen iddynt ystyried o'r newydd sut y gellir sicrhau diogelwch llwyr yn y mannau hyn. Yn drychnebus, codwyd y pryder ynglŷn â diogelwch hefyd oherwydd digwyddiadau mawr eraill. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi, fel yr ydym oll mae'n siŵr, y gwelwn y Llywodraeth yn rhoi swm mawr o arian er mwyn rhoi blaenoriaeth i ddefnyddwyr trenau a'r rhai sydd yn ennill eu bywoliaeth yn gweithio ar y trenau.

**Mick Bates:** Hoffai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fynegi eu cydymdeimlad i'r teulu. Dros y blynnyddoedd, gwelsom nifer o ddigwyddiadau difrifol ar hyd lein y Cambrian. Gwyddoch y bu damwain drist iawn yn yr haf y llynedd yn Llanbrynmair yn fy etholaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr y croesawn yr arian, ond mae pryder gennym ynghylch pa gamau a gymerir ar unwaith ar bob un o'r croesfannau hyn heb griw sydd yn bodoli o hyd. Dyma'r mannau penodol lle y digwydd trychinebau, fe ymddengys. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â thrigolion a Railtrack ar safleoedd sawl gwaith. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynnydd yn araf. Er mwyn diogelu'r bobl hynny sydd yn defnyddio'r croesfannau hyn yn ystod eu bywyd bob dydd, mae angen inni wybod pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd ar unwaith i'w diogelu.

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais, yr oeddw i fod i gwrdd â Gerald Corbett yfory. Fe'i gohiriwyd oherwydd y ddamwain yn Hatfield. Byddai'n well o dan yr amgylchiadau, ac yn enwedig yn sgîl y drychneb ddiweddaraf hon, pe bawn yn ysgrifennu ar ran pawb yma gan ddweud pa mor bryderus yr ydym ynglŷn â'r gyfres hon o ddigwyddiadau ofnadwy. Cyn unrhyw gyfarfod, fe ystyriaef deimladau Aelodau'r Cynulliad a phobl Cymru. Wedyn bydd ateb gennyf pan af i gyfarfod ag ef.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb sensitif i'r mater hwn ger ein bron heddiw. Nid wyf am achub y blaen ar ganlyniad unrhyw ymchwiliad, ond a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod y patrwm hwn o ddamweiniau ar groesfannau dilidiart yn awgrymu'n gryf nad yw goleuadau a chynn

discussions with Railtrack, and in the letter that she mentioned, will she press Railtrack strongly to use some of those new safety resources in which they must invest, to look at putting barriers on all level crossings in Wales? One particular issue is that rural roads are subject to variable use. Depending on when they are reviewed, one can find low-level usage or high-level usage, particularly in the tourist season. I would like to see her going one step further and pressing Railtrack to use some of those new resources for crossings in rural Wales.

**Sue Essex:** That will naturally follow from the money that is available. I see this as a real priority for us in Wales. You are correct to say that whatever the outcome of the investigation, we see a pattern of terrible tragedies and lives being lost. The system needs to be rechecked because those accidents are happening for a variety of reasons. Every life lost in this terrible way is a life lost needlessly.

**David Davies:** I echo the sympathy expressed by many other Members to Andrew Deakin's family. I welcome the inquiry and the extra money that is being spent on safety. Would it be possible to find out from the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions, or one of the bodies that investigates accidents, how often accidents of this nature happen? We could then see whether there is a widespread problem. The statistics for the whole of the United Kingdom must be available somewhere.

**Sue Essex:** They are. We will make sure that those are collated and passed to the spokesperson of each of the individual parties.

**Ann Jones:** I was not going to intervene, but the person who sadly lost his life in this tragic accident resided in my constituency, and I am aware of him and his family. It is a double tragedy for the area. I am grateful that Sue said that the whole of the Assembly's views will be considered in this, which goes across party divisions. I am grateful for the

yn ddigonol? Yn ei thrafodaethau â Railtrack, ac yn y llythyr y cyfeiriodd ato, a fydd yn pwysô'n gryf ar Railtrack i ddefnyddio rhai o'r adnoddau diogelwch newydd hynny y mae'n rhaid iddo fuddsoddi ynddynt, i ystyried gosod llidiardau ar bob croesfan reilffordd yng Nghymru? Un mater penodol yw'r defnydd amrywiol o ffyrdd cefn gwlad. Gan ddibynnau ar ba adeg y'u harolygir, gweler defnydd bach neu ddefnydd mawr, yn enwedig yn nhymor y twristiaid. Hoffwn ei gweld yn mynd un cam ymhellach a phwyso ar Railtrack i ddefnyddio rhai o'r adnoddau newydd hynny ar gyfer croesfannau yng Nghymru wledig.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd hynny'n dilyn yn naturiol o'r arian sydd ar gael. Credaf fod hon yn wir flaenoriaeth inni yng Nghymru. Yr ydych yn gywir wrth ddweud beth bynnag fo canlyniad yr ymchwiliad, yr ydym yn gweld patrwm o drychnebau ofnadwy a phobl yn colli eu bywydau. Mae angen ailedrych ar y system am fod y damweiniau hynny yn digwydd am amryw o resymau. Mae pob un sydd yn colli ei fywyd yn y ffordd erchyll hon yn colli ei fywyd yn ddiangen.

**David Davies:** Ategaf y cydymdeimlad a fynegwyd gan lawer o'r Aelodau eraill i deulu Andrew Deakin. Croesawaf yr ymchwiliad a bod arian ychwanegol yn cael ei wario ar ddiogelwch. A fyddai modd cael gwybod gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau, neu un o'r cyrff sydd yn ymchwilio i ddamweiniau, pa mor aml y digwydd damweiniau o'r fath? Yna gallem weld a oes problem helaeth. Rhaid bod yr ystadegau ar gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan ar gael rhywle.

**Sue Essex:** Ydynt. Gwnawn sicrhau y cânt eu casglu a'u trosglwyddo i lefarydd pob un o'r pleidiau unigol.

**Ann Jones:** Nid oeddwn yn bwriadu ymyrryd, ond yr oedd y person a fu farw yn y ddamwain drychnebus hon yn byw yn fy etholaeth, ac yr wyf yn ei adnabod ef a'i deulu. Mae'n drychneb ddyblyg i'r ardal. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Sue am ddweud y caiff barn y Cynulliad cyfan ei hystyried yn hyn o beth, sydd yn mynd ar draws rhaniadau

way in which Members have responded today to this incident.

pleidiol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y ffordd y mae'r Aelodau wedi ymateb heddiw i'r digwyddiad hwn.

### Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Val Feld:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 6.30, which allows the supplementary question to be asked. According to custom and practice, each Assembly Member asks only one supplementary question. Today, under question 3, you allowed the leader of Plaid Cymru to speak twice. This is the second occasion on which he has been able to ask two questions—

**Dafydd Wigley:** Quite right.

**Val Feld:** You might do me the courtesy of allowing me to speak, since you are clearly taking up a fair amount of time. The previous occasion was, I think, two weeks ago, when he was raising questions on a statement by the First Secretary. At the time I thought that it was a misunderstanding, but for it to happen twice seems to be more than a coincidence. Will you tell us whether there has been some change in the protocol? If there has, how and when was this agreed? Is this leeway to speak more than once only available to the leader of Plaid Cymru?

**The Presiding Officer:** There is no leeway for any Member of this Assembly to speak more than once in the course of debates. That is clear from the Standing Orders. I was asked by the Leader of the Opposition originally whether he would be able to ask a further supplementary question during a statement. He asked one question and requested to be allowed to ask another, rather than ask a series of questions together. I agreed to this. This happened, I think, three weeks ago.

As regards question time, we are now in a new situation. The Leader of the Opposition and the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives have both asked me whether they would be allowed, in these circumstances, to ask further supplementaries as party leaders. I have agreed to that.

**Val Feld:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.30, sydd yn caniatáu i gwestiwn atodol gael ei ofyn. Yn ôl ein harfer, nid yw Aelodau'r Cynulliad ond yn gofyn un cwestiwn atodol. Heddiw, o dan gwestiwn 3, gwnaethoch ganiatáu i arweinydd Plaid Cymru siarad ar ddau achlysur. Dyma'r ail dro iddo gael gofyn dau gwestiwn—

**Dafydd Wigley:** Hollol iawn.

**Val Feld:** A fyddch mor garedig â gadael imi siarad, gan eich bod yn amlwg yn cael cryn dipyn o amser. Digwyddodd yr achlysur arall bythefnos yn ôl, fe gredaf, pan gododd gwestiynau ar ddatganiad gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd. Ar y pryd, tybiais mai camsyniad ydoedd, ond ar ôl iddo ddigwydd ddwywaith, ymddengys fel pe bai'n fwy na chyd-digwyddiad. A ddywedwch wrthym a fu newid yn y protocol? Os bu, sut a phryd y cytunwyd ar hyn? A yw'r rhyddid hwn i siarad fwy nag unwaith ond ar gael i arweinydd Plaid Cymru?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes unrhyw ryddid i unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad hwn siarad fwy nag unwaith yn ystod y dadlau. Mae hynny'n glir yn ôl y Rheolau Sefydlog. Gofynnodd Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid imi yn wreiddiol a allai ofyn cwestiwn atodol arall yn ystod datganiad. Gofynnodd un cwestiwn gan ofyn caniatâd i ofyn cwestiwn arall, yn hytrach na gofyn cyfres o gwestiynau gyda'i gilydd. Cytunais ar hynny. Digwyddodd hynny dair wythnos yn ôl, fe gredaf.

Ynglŷn â'r amser holi, yr ydym bellach mewn sefyllfa newydd. Mae Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid ac Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru ill dau wedi gofyn imi a fyddai modd iddynt, o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, ofyn cwestiynau atodol eraill fel arweinwyr pleidiau. Yr wyf wedi cytuno ar hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** I confirm that that is the case. I was unaware of it until today, but we had an exchange of e-mails where you confirmed that I would be able to do that next week.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Further to that point of order, I was going to raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 6.3 because you called Nick Bourne as Leader of the Welsh Conservatives. I thought that we asked questions as ordinary Members.

**The Presiding Officer:** I called Nick Bourne as Leader of the Welsh Conservative group. We have discussed this, as a result of the new circumstances. In this Chamber, Mr Ieuan Wyn Jones is to be called Leader of the Opposition, and Professor Nick Bourne is to be called Leader of the Welsh Conservatives, at their request and with my agreement. These are courtesy titles which are not in our Standing Orders. I think that we have a number of other titles which may or may not be in our Standing Orders.

**Ron Davies:** Further to that point of order, I warmly commend the decision that you have taken to give a second chance to the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives and to the Leader of the Opposition. In view of their manifest failure to make any impact at all on the First Minister, would you consider giving them a third shot?

2:47 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** If I could ensure that other Members are not deprived their opportunity, I might be able to do so. These are matters of discretion and will no doubt be subject to discussion, periodically in the Business Committee, as all aspects of our handling of business are subject to discussion and consultation.

**Val Feld:** Further to that point of order. I am not a member of the Business Committee but I am reassured that this was discussed in that committee. However, if it was discussed, I am surprised that Nick Bourne should not—

**Nick Bourne:** Cadarnhaf fod hynny wedi digwydd. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol ohono tan heddiw, ond buom yn gohebu dros yr e-bost lle y gwnaethoch gadarnhau y gallwn wneud hynny yr wythnos nesaf.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, yr oeddwn yn bwriadu codi pwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 am ichi alw ar Nick Bourne fel Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Credais ein bod yn gofyn cwestiynau fel Aelodau cyffredin.

**Y Llywydd:** Gelwais ar Nick Bourne fel Arweinydd grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Trafodasom hynny, o ganlyniad i'r amgylchiadau newydd yn y Siambra hon. Bellach gelwir Mr Ieuan Wyn Jones yn Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid, a gelwir yr Athro Nick Bourne yn Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yn ôl eu cais hwy a'm cytundeb innau. Teitlau cwrteisi ydynt ac nid ydynt yn ymddangos yn ein Rheolau Sefydlog. Credaf fod gennym nifer o deitlau eraill nad ydynt o bosibl yn ymddangos yn ein Rheolau Sefydlog.

**Ron Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'n fawr iawn eich penderfyniad i roi ail gyfle i Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru ac Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid. O ystyried eu methiant llwyr i gael unrhyw effaith o gwbl ar y Prif Weinidog, a wnewch chi ystyried rhoi tri chynnig iddynt?

**Y Llywydd:** Pe gallwn sicrhau na chaiff Aelodau eraill eu hamddifadu o'u cyfle, gallwn wneud hynny o bosibl. Materion dewisol ydynt a fydd yn ddiau yn cael eu trafod o bryd i'w gilydd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, fel y mae pob agwedd ar sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â busnes yn destun trafodaeth ac ymgynghori.

**Val Feld:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Nid wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes ond tawelwyd fy meddwl gan y ffaith y trafodwyd hyn yn y pwyllgor hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, os y'i trafodwyd, yr wyf yn synnu nad yw Nick Bourne—

**The Presiding Officer:** It may be discussed.

**Val Feld:** I hope that it will be discussed. My concern as a back-bench Assembly Member is to ensure that back-bench Assembly Members have adequate time to ask questions of our Cabinet, and that this does not deteriorate into the kind of confrontational point scoring that we have seen over many years in Westminster. Many of us who worked over a long time to achieve this Assembly were clear that we did not wish to get into that kind of confrontational politics. I would be concerned if that was the road down which we were going.

**The Presiding Officer:** You will be aware that the First Minister answered a question today on the handling of questions to the First Minister, which is still subject to consultation. I look forward to the result of that consultation. If it is deemed necessary to ensure further questions to the First Minister, which I did not favour during that consultation, that will be the structure. In the meantime, I have accepted this mode of operation to reflect the new circumstances in the Assembly. These are all matters for consultation.

**Y Llywydd:** Efallai y caiff ei drafod.

**Val Feld:** Gobeithiaf y caiff ei drafod. Fy mhryder i fel un o Aelodau meinciau cefn y Cynulliad yw sicrhau bod Aelodau meinciau cefn y Cynulliad yn cael digon o amser i ofyn cwestiynau i'n Cabinet, ac nid yw hyn yn troi'n rhyw fath o ymryson gwleidydd a ymosodol yr ydym wedi ei weld ers blynnyddoedd lawer yn San Steffan. Mae llawer ohonom a weithiai dros gyfnod maith i wireddu'r Cynulliad hwn yn bendant nad oeddem am gael y math hwnnw o wleidyddiaeth ymosodol. Byddwn yn pryeru pe bawn yn dilyn y trywydd hwnnw.

**Y Llywydd:** Gwyddoch i'r Prif Weinidog ateb cwestiwn heddiw ynglŷn ag ymdrin â chwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, sydd yn destun ymgynghoriad o hyd. Edrychaf ymlaen at ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw. Os tybir bod angen sicrhau cwestiynau pellach i'r Prif Weinidog, nad oeddwn i o'i blaidd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad, dyna fydd y strwythur. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf wedi derbyn y dull hwn o weithredu er mwyn adlewyrchu'r amgylchiadau newydd yn y Cynulliad. Bydd yr holl faterion hyn yn destun ymgynghoriad.

### Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** It may be invidious to single out particular guests, but I would like to extend a warm welcome to Jeremy Paxman of *Newnight*, who is here today. I hope that it bodes well for improved relations between Wales and London and how the First Minister is portrayed on that programme. [Laughter.]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This slot is for the Minister for Assembly Business.

**Andrew Davies:** Business on Tuesday, 31 October and on Thursday 2 November is as I reported last week. On Tuesday 7 November, business will include motions to approve the Home Energy Efficiency Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2000, the National Health Service Bodies and Local Authorities Partnership Arrangements (Wales)

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Efallai ei bod yn annheg nodi gwesteion penodol, ond hoffwn estyn croeso cynnes i Jeremy Paxman o *Newnight*, sydd yma heddiw. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer perthynas well rhwng Cymru a Llundain a sut y caiff y Prif Weinidog ei bortreadu ar y rhaglen honno. [Chwerthin.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Slot y Trefnydd yw hwn.

**Andrew Davies:** Bydd y busnes ddydd Mawrth, 31 Hydref a dydd Iau 2 Tachwedd fel y nodais yr wythnos diwethaf. Ddydd Mawrth 7 Tachwedd, bydd y busnes yn cynnwys cynigion i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio Effeithlonwyd Ynni Cartref (Cymru) 2000, Rheoliadau Trefniadau Partneriaeth Cyrff y Gwasanaeth Iechyd

Regulations 2000, and the Education (Exclusion from Schools) (Prescribed Periods) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2000. Business on Thursday 9 November is as I reported last week.

On Tuesday 14 November there will be a debate on the single programming document for LEADER Plus INTERREG, which is the Wales-Ireland programme and the URBAN community initiatives. The debate is to agree the submission that is going forward to the European Commission in Brussels. Business on Thursday 16 November will include a Plaid Cymru minority party debate and a motion to make the sustainable development scheme.

Finally, on the advice of this morning's Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, in accordance with Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following item of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee—the Teachers (Compulsory Registration) (Wales) Regulations 2000. As in previous weeks I will make arrangements to post a copy of the business statement to the intranet and internet later today.

**Cynog Dafis:** Edrychais ar y galeri i weld a oes unrhyw un y gallwn i ei groesawu i'r Cynulliad heddiw, ond methais â rhoi enw ar unrhyw un. Ni wn a ddaw hynny yn arfer o'r hyn ymlaen.

Gwnaf gais pwysig am ddatganiad barn gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar ddyfodol Cyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru. Gofynnaf hyn oherwydd bod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi gwneud datganiad i'r wasg ddydd Mercher diwethaf ar y pwnc hwn ac wedi trafod amgylchiadau ariannol CBAC a chyfreithlondeb eu gweithgarwch, a adroddwyd yn y wasg ddydd Sul.

Mae CBAC yn gorff cenedlaethol o'r pwys mwyaf yn ein system addysg, wedi ei sefydlu drwy statud, ac felly o ddiddordeb canolog i Lywodraeth Cymru ac i'r Cynulliad. Mae cyfrifoldeb arnom i sicrhau dyfodol CBAC. Mae gennyf ohebiaeth gyda gweinidogion yn y Swyddfa Gymreig ers cyn sefydlu'r

Gwladol ac Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2000 a Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwahardd o'r Ysgol) (Cyfnodau Rhagnodedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000. Bydd y busnes ddydd Iau 9 Tachwedd fel y nodais yr wythnos diwethaf.

Ddydd Mawrth 14 Tachwedd bydd dadl ar y ddogfen raglennu sengl ar gyfer LEADER Plus INTERREG, sef y rhaglen Cymru-Iwerddon a mentrau cymunedol URBAN. Diben y ddadl yw cytuno ar y cyflwyniad i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ym Mrwsel. Bydd y busnes ddydd Iau 16 Tachwedd yn cynnwys dadl plaid leiafrifol Plaid Cymru a chynnig i weithredu'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy.

I gloi, ar gyngor y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oedd angen cyfeirio'r eitem ganlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i bwyllogor pwnc—sef Rheoliadau Athrawon (Cofrestru Gorfodol) (Cymru) 2000. Fel yn ystod wythnosau blaenorol gwnaf drefniadau i roi copi o'r datganiad busnes ar y fewnrwyd a'r rhyngrywd yn ddiweddarach heddiw.

**Cynog Dafis:** I have been looking to the gallery to see whether there is anybody that I could welcome to the Assembly today, but I failed to name anybody. I do not know whether that will become customary from now on.

I make an important request for a statement of opinion from the Minister for Education and Life-long Learning on the future of the Welsh Joint Education Committee. I ask this because the Minister for Economic Development made a statement to the press last Wednesday on this matter and discussed the financial circumstances of the WJEC and the legality of their activities, which was reported in the press on Sunday.

The WJEC is a national body of the greatest importance to our education system, established by statute, and is therefore of central interest to the Government of Wales and to the Assembly. We have a responsibility to ensure the future of the WJEC. I have correspondence with ministers

Cynulliad ynglŷn â sefyllfa gyfreithiol CBAC, ond ni fu unrhyw weithredu ar y mater. Mae'n gwbl annerbyniol ein bod yn cael datganiadau gan Weinidogion Cynulliad ar y pwnc hwn oddi allan i'r Siambra ond na wneir unrhyw ddatganiad yn y Siambra. Gwnaf gais ffurfiol am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar y pwnc pwysig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Is there a comment from the Welsh Conservative group?

**Nick Bourne:** On that issue, although on quite a different basis, we have been saying for some time that, in the interests of the administration and the broader National Assembly, it is important to clear the air on the briefing by the WJEC against the Deputy First Minister and now, it seems, by the Deputy First Minister against the WJEC. If the reports are correct regarding the status of the WJEC and that it may be an illegal body, this will have considerable impact throughout Wales given the importance of that body as an examining body and given its cultural and educational significance. We therefore need an urgent statement from the Deputy First Minister to clear the air on this issue.

**The First Minister:** Can I deal with it?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a point of order. It is a question or a comment on the business statement.

**Andrew Davies:** I understand that the Minister for Economic Development did not make a statement on the WJEC outside the Assembly. However, the WJEC is a private company. The running of the WJEC is a matter for that company and for the Welsh Local Government Association. It is not a matter in which the Assembly should intervene. However, I clearly need to have more discussions with my colleagues on this and, if colleagues from other parties wish to make representations, we will take that into account.

at the Welsh Office since prior to the establishment of the Assembly regarding the WJEC's legal situation, but no action has been taken on the matter. It is completely unacceptable that we receive statements by Assembly Ministers on this subject outwith the Chamber but that no statement is made in the Chamber. I make a formal request for a statement by the Minister for Education and Life-long Learning on this important subject.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw sylw gan grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru?

**Nick Bourne:** Ar y mater hwnnw, er ar sail holol wahanol, buom yn dweud ers tro, er budd y weinyddiaeth a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyffredinol, ei bod yn bwysig cael eglurhad o'r briffio gan CBAC yn erbyn y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a bellach, mae'n debyg, gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn erbyn CBAC. Os yw'r adroddiadau'n gywir ynglŷn â statws CBAC ac y gallai fod yn gorff anghyfreithlon, bydd hyn yn cael cryn effaith ledled Cymru o ystyried pwysigrwydd y corff hwnnw fel corff arholi ac o gofio ei arwyddocâd diwylliannol ac addysgol. Felly mae angen datganiad brys gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog er mwyn cael eglurhad ar y mater hwn.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** A gaf i ymdrin ag ef?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid pwynt o drefn ydyw. Mae'n gwestiwn neu sylw ar y datganiad busnes.

**Andrew Davies:** Deallaf na wnaeth y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ddatganiad ar CBAC y tu allan i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, cwmni preifat yw CBAC. Mater i'r cwmni hwnnw ac i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yw rhedeg CBAC. Nid yw'n fater y dylai'r Cynulliad ymyrryd yn ddo. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gwbl amlwg bod angen imi gael rhagor o drafodaethau gyda'm cyd-Aelodau ar hyn ac, os hoffai cyd-Aelodau o'r pleidiau eraill wneud sylwadau, fe ystyriwn hynny.

## **Deddf Addysg 1997: Is-ddeddfwriaeth y Cynulliad Education Act 1997: Assembly Subordinate Legislation**

**Brian Hancock:** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*resolves to instruct the Assembly Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training to bring forward draft subordinate legislation under section 46(3) of the Education Act 1997. The objective to be achieved is:*

*make provision for requiring the governing bodies of institutions within the further education sector, and the principals or other heads of such institutions, to secure that a programme of careers education is provided for all students aged 16-19 attending such institutions. This regulation to apply to the whole of Wales.*

It is a great pleasure and honour to stand here in the National Assembly and present the second secondary legislation. This, if you like, is my private member's Bill. I should declare, as noted in the register of interests, that I have been a parent governor of a primary school and a secondary school since 1985. That came to an end in September of this year.

I am keen to present this motion in a clear and concise manner. Therefore, I will not take interventions while I present the motion. I will, however, address any points raised in summing up at the end of the debate. As the second Member to win the ballot, I have first hand experience of the ambiguities of our subordinate legislative powers. I am sure that Elin Jones can appreciate that. We targeted several areas within the education field, including the abolition of league tables. Unfortunately, that was not possible through subordinate legislation under part 7 of Standing Order No. 22. I am disappointed with this, as evidence has shown that these tables lead to social exclusion and damaging competition between schools. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will call on the Minister to address this through her executive powers.

**Brian Hancock:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn ymroi i gyfarwyddo Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 y Cynulliad i gyflwyno is-ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft o dan adran 46(3) o Ddeddf Addysg 1997. Yr amcan yw:*

*darparu i'w gwneud yn ofynnol bod cyrff llywodraethu sefydliadau o fewn y sector addysg bellach, a phrifathrawon neu benaethiaid eraill sefydliadau o'r fath, yn sicrhau bod rhaglen o addysg gyrfaoedd yn cael ei darparu ar gyfer pob myfyriwr 16-19 oed sydd yn mynychu sefydliadau o'r fath. Bydd y rheoliad hwn yn berthnasol i Gymru gyfan.*

Mae'n bleser ac yn anrhydedd o'r mwyaf sefyll yma yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cyflwyno'r ail ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd. Fy Mesur aelod preifat yw hyn, os dymunwch. Dylwn ddatgan, fel y nodir yn y gofrestro o fuddiannau, y bûm yn rhiant-lywodraethwr ysgol gynradd ac ysgol uwchradd ers 1985. Daeth hynny i ben ar ddiwedd mis Medi eleni.

Yr wyf yn awyddus i gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn mewn modd clir a chryno. Felly, ni dderbyniad ymyriadau tra cyflwynaf y cynnig. Fodd bynnag, ymdriniaf ag unrhyw bwyntiau a godir wrth grynhai ar ddiwedd y ddadl. Fel yr ail Aelod i ennill y bleidlais, mae profiad uniongyrchol gennyd o amwyseddau ein pwerau is-ddeddfwriaethol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gall Elin Jones werthfawrogi hynny. Targedasom nifer o feysydd o fewn addysg, gan gynnwys diddymu'r tablau cynghrair. Yn anffodus, nid oedd hynny'n bosibl drwy is-ddeddfwriaeth o dan rhan 7 o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22. Fe'm siomwyd gan hyn, gan fod tystiolaeth yn dangos yr arweinia'r tablau hyn at eithrio cymdeithasol a chystadleuaeth niweidiol rhwng ysgolion. Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn galw ar y Gweinidog i ymdrin â hyn drwy ei phwerau gweithredol.

The proposal before us today is equally significant and, possibly, more timely in view of the current developments in careers education and advice. There is currently a duty on secondary schools to provide careers education to all pupils in years 9 to 11—that is, up to 16 years of age.

2:57 p.m.

However, the statutory right to careers education ends there for sixth formers and for those who progress into further education. Under this proposal, the same duty would be applied to students aged 16 to 19 at further education institutions.

At the moment, a great deal of good practice exists within the further education sector despite the fact that there is no legislative duty upon the colleges to provide careers education. Many have adopted a healthy, proactive approach and have developed good, businesslike partnerships with the eight careers service companies in Wales. That was recognised in a report commissioned two years ago by the Welsh Office from the National Foundation for Educational Research. However, it remains that careers education is less developed in the FE sector than in schools. There have been misleading and damaging assumptions that students in further education need less guidance on career planning than school pupils, in view of the vocational nature of many of the courses offered at colleges. The annual report of the careers service in Wales last year stated that minimum service levels in most areas are set below the levels for sixth form support. As a result, the measure proposed in the motion would formalise the provision of careers education in colleges for those aged 16 to 19, underpinning the good practice that currently exists. It would also achieve continuity and progression for those moving from schools into FE institutions. I emphasise that this motion in no way seeks to interfere with existing partnerships between FE colleges and careers companies. We foresee that it would serve as a legislative basis and that these relationships could be consolidated and further strengthened.

Mae'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron heddiw yr un mor arwyddocaol ac, yn fwy amserol, o bosibl, yng ngoleuni'r datblygiadau cyfredol mewn addysg a chyngor gyrfaoedd. Mae dyletswydd ar ysgolion uwchradd ar hyn o bryd i ddarparu addysg gyrfaoedd i bob disgylb ym mlynnyddoedd 9 i 11—sef, hyd at 16 mlwydd oed.

Fodd bynnag, daw'r hawl statudol i addysg gyrfaoedd i ben ar gyfer disgylion chweched dosbarth a'r rheini sydd yn mynd ymlaen i addysg bellach. O dan y cynnig hwn, byddai'r un dyletswydd yn berthnasol i fyfyrwyr 16 i 19 oed mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach.

Ar hyn o bryd, ceir llawer o arfer da o fewn y sector addysg bellach er gwaethaf yffaith nad oes dyletswydd ddeddfwriaethol ar golegau i ddarparu addysg gyrfaoedd. Mabwysiadodd llawer ohonynt ymagwedd iach, ragweithiol a datblygasant bartneriaethau da, effeithiol gyda'r wytch cwmni gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru. Cydnabuwyd hynny mewn adroddiad a gomisiynwyd ddwy flynedd yn ôl gan y Swyddfa Gymreig o'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol er Ymchwil i Addysg. Fodd bynnag, datblygir addysg gyrfaoedd yn llai o hyd yn y sector addysg bellach nag mewn ysgolion. Bu rhagdybiaethau camarweiniol a niweidiol bod angen llai o arweiniad ar gynllunio gyrfa ar fyfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach nag ar ddisgyblion ysgol, yn sgîl natur alwedigaethol llawer o'r cyrsiau a gynigir mewn colegau. Datganodd adroddiad blynnyddol y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru y gosodir y lefelau gwasanaeth isaf yn y rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd yn is na'r lefelau ar gyfer cymorth chweched dosbarth. O ganlyniad, byddai'r mesur a gynigir yn y cynnig yn ffurfioli'r ddarpariaeth addysg gyrfaoedd mewn colegau i'r bobl ifanc 16 i 19 oed, gan ategu'r arfer da sydd yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Byddai hefyd yn sicrhau parhad a dilyniant ar gyfer y rheini sydd yn symud o ysgolion i sefydliadau addysg bellach. Pwysleisiaf na cheisia'r cynnig hwn ymyrryd mewn unrhyw ffordd a'r partneriaethau presennol rhwng colegau addysg bellach a chwmniau gyrfaoedd. Rhagwelwn y gwasanaethai fel sail ddeddfwriaethol ac y

gellid atgyfnerthu a chryfhau'r cydberthnasau hyn ymhellach.

Having outlined what the motion will achieve, there are two key questions that need to be addressed. First, what is the potential for the students? That is arguably the most important question. Second, in what way can this measure help secure education, training and skills that meet the future economic and employment needs of Wales? On the first question, one of the overriding aims of this motion is to provide a firmer basis for students to develop the appropriate skills and knowledge required to manage and plan their career development. The measure is a timely one. It ties in with current work by ACCAC, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Council for Wales, of drawing up a framework and guidance for careers education provision in schools and colleges. Careers education needs to be outcome driven. In other words, you will identify what you need to achieve for the student and provide a careers guidance that realises those outcomes in the best possible way. We agree with ACCAC that careers education needs to aim towards three targets. They are effective career planning, opportunity awareness and self-awareness. This measure will make an important contribution towards ensuring the structures and support required to meet these targets in the FE colleges. We consulted widely with colleges, careers companies and other interested parties in preparation for today. While being pleasantly surprised by the initiatives in place across Wales, it is clear from the responses that the current provision is departmentalised and fragmented. This motion will establish a more coherent and standardised framework for the provision of careers education in Wales. This is at a time when we are about to see the establishment of a new all-age information, advice and guidance service in Careers Wales.

On the second question, if we broaden the picture and turn to the potential economic benefits of this motion, the ultimate aim is to get people into jobs to help boost the economy by helping to create a better college-leaver for employers. It is no secret

Ar ôl amlinellu'r hyn a gyflawna'r cynnig, ceir dau gwestiwn allweddol y mae angen ymdrin â hwy. Yn gyntaf, beth yw'r potensial i'r myfyrwyr? Gellir dadlau mai hwn yw'r cwestiwn pwysicaf. Yn ail, ym mha ffordd y gall y mesur hwn helpu i ddiogelu addysg, hyfforddiant a sgiliau a fodlona anghenion economaidd a chyflogaeth Cymru yn y dyfodol? Ynglŷn â'r cwestiwn cyntaf, un o brif nodau'r cynnig hwn yw darparu sail fwy cadarn er mwyn i fyfyrwyr ddatblygu'r sgiliau priodol a'r wybodaeth sydd ei hangen i reoli a chynllunio eu datblygiad gyrfaol. Mae'r mesur yn amserol. Cysyllta â gwaith cyfredol ACCAC, Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, o lunio fframwaith ac arweiniad ar gyfer darpariaeth addysg gyrfaoedd mewn ysgolion a cholegau. Mae angen i addysg gyrfaoedd gael ei lywio gan ganlyniadau. Hynny yw, nodir yr hyn y bydd angen ei gyflawni ar gyfer y myfyriwr a darperir arweiniad gyrfaoedd fydd yn cyflawni'r canlyniadau hynny yn y ffordd orau bosibl. Cytunwn gydag ACCAC bod angen i addysg gyrfaoedd anelu at dri tharged, sef gwaith cynllunio gyrfaoedd effeithiol, ymwybyddiaeth o gyfleoedd a hunan-ymwybyddiaeth. Gwna'r mesur hwn gyfraniad pwysig tuag at sicrhau'r strwythurau a'r cymorth sydd eu hangen i fodloni'r targedau hyn yn y colegau addysg bellach. Ymgynghorosom yn eang â cholegau, cwmnïau gyrfaoedd a phartïon eraill â diddordeb wrth baratoi am heddiw. Er inni gael ein siomi ar yr ochr orau gan y mentrau a sefydlwyd ledled Cymru, mae'n glir o'r ymatebion bod y ddarpariaeth gyfredol wedi'i hadranoli ac yn ddarniog. Sefydla'r cynnig hwn fframwaith mwy cydlynol a safonol ar gyfer darparu addysg gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru. Ceir hyn ar adeg pan fo Gyrfaoedd Cymru, gwasanaeth newydd sydd yn cynnig gwybodaeth, cyngor ac arweiniad i bob oedran, ar fin cael ei sefydlu.

Ynglŷn â'r ail gwestiwn, pe ehangem y sefyllfa a throi at fanteision economaidd posibl y cynnig hwn, y nod yn y pen draw yw rhoi pobl mewn swyddi er mwyn helpu i roi hwb i'r economi drwy helpu i wella'r person sydd yn gadael coleg er mwyn cyflogwyr.

that we are underperforming economically in Wales. The national economic development strategy records the culture of underachievement in Wales. There is a crying need to address the skills shortages that are a barrier to employment for many people of all ages in Wales.

A key proposal in the employment skills strategy is the need to focus on all-age skills and preparatory training programmes. Careers education is the obvious means to start introducing people to such programmes. We must use careers education and guidance as a platform to promote innovation and entrepreneurship far more than we do at present. Increasingly, employers are recognising the value of such skills. Students must be made aware of the opportunities offered by nurturing those abilities.

On the amendments, I support Andrew Davies's call to extend the duty to provide careers education programmes to school sixth forms. I would like to put on record that, when we considered this issue in July, I was given to understand that we could only introduce a single proposal of subordinate legislation under part 7 of Standing Order No. 22, and that it was a case of one or the other. I decided to apply the duty to colleges first, given that careers education is less developed than in school sixth forms. Nevertheless, it makes sense to introduce that measure at the same time, and we warmly welcome the proposal.

It makes perfect sense that the duty should apply to all post-16 students. That was the reasoning behind the amendment in my name calling for careers education to be made available to all full-time students, given the emphasis on life-long learning and supporting mature students. The further education sector reacted by saying that that would be more desirable than limiting it to 16 to 19 year-olds. The practicalities of implementing that amendment need further investigation and the Assembly is probably not in a position to make an informed decision based on the financial implications of such a measure. However, while

Nid yw'n gyfrinach ein bod yn tanberfformio'n economaidd yng Nghymru. Cofnoda'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ddiwylliant o dangyflawni yng Nghymru. Mae angen dybryd i ymdrin â'r diffygion o ran sgiliau sydd yn rhwydro llawer o bobl o bob oedran yng Nghymru rhag cael eu cyflogi.

Cynnig allweddol yn y strategaeth sgiliau cyflogaeth yw'r angen i ganolbwytio ar raglenni sgiliau pob oed a hyfforddiant darparol. Mae addysg gyrfaoedd yn fod amlwg i ddechrau cyflwyno pobl i raglenni o'r fath. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio addysg ac arweiniad gyrfaoedd fel llwyfan i hyrwyddo dyfeisgarwch ac entrepreneurship llawer mwy nag y gwnawn ar hyn o bryd. Mae cyflogwyr yn cydnabod gwerth sgiliau o'r fath yn gynyddol. Rhaid gwneud y myfyrwyr yn ymwybodol o'r cyfleoedd a gynigir drwy feithrin y galluoedd hynny.

Ynglŷn â'r gwelliannau, cefnogaf alwad Andrew Davies i ehangu'r ddyletswydd i ddarparu rhaglenni addysg gyrfaoedd i ddosbarthiadau chwech ysgolion. Hoffwn gofnodi y rhoddwyd ar ddeall imi, pan ystyriasm y mater hwn ym mis Gorffennaf, mai dim ond un cynnig is-ddeddfwriaeth y gallem ei gyflwyno o dan rhan 7 o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22, ac mai mater o un neu'r llall ydoedd. Penderfynais gymhwys o'r ddyletswydd i golegau yn gyntaf, gan nad yw addysg gyrfaoedd wedi datblygu cymaint ag mewn dosbarthiadau chwech ysgolion. Serch hynny, synhwyrol yw cyflwyno'r mesur hwnnw ar yr un pryd, a chroesawn y cynnig hwnnw yn wresog.

Mae'n gwbl synhwyrol y dylai'r ddyletswydd fod yn berthnasol i bob myfyriwr ôl-16. Dyna'r ymresymiad y tu ôl i'r gwelliant yn fy enw yn gofyn i addysg gyrfaoedd fod ar gael i bob myfyriwr amser llawn, yn sgil y pwyslais ar ddysgu gydol oes a rhoi cymorth i fyfyrwyr aeddfed. Adweithiodd y sector addysg bellach drwy ddweud y byddai'n fwy dynunol na'i chyfngu i bobl 16 i 19 oed. Mae angen ymchwilio ymhellach i'r agweddu ymarferol ar y gwelliant hwnnw ac mae'n debyg nad yw'r Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa i wneud penderfyniad hyddysg yn seiliedig ar oblygiadau ariannol mesur o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, er imi dynnu gwelliant 1

withdrawing amendment 1 in my name, I call upon the Minister to consider the proposal and give an assurance that she will seek to extend the duty to all full-time students in further education.

Therefore, along with colleges, careers companies and students, I urge you to support the motion as a healthy step in the right direction. Please support this motion for secondary legislation.

Gobeithiaf y caf eich cefnogaeth.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome Brian's motion and I declare an interest as a member of the Institute of Careers Guidance. I was also formerly a director of Mid Glamorgan Careers Limited.

It is vital that 16 to 19 year-olds have full access to a careers education programme, because there are massive changes in the world of work in the twenty-first century. Because of the wholesale changes in the employment market, people will be expected to take a much greater role in planning their careers than has been the case in the past. Gone are the days of a job for life. We have work patterns that are characterised by short-term contracts, continual re-skilling, personal development and the need sometimes to change careers completely. The Institute of Careers Guidance is changing its name to the Institute of Career Guidance, which reflects—

**Pauline Jarman:** I am receiving news that 1,300 redundancies in Panasonic have just been announced. As the Member for the Cynon Valley, what can the administration do to promote career guidance for those displaced people?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This debate is not about job losses in Panasonic. I understand that Members are anxious immediately to discuss such matters in the Assembly. If you wish for this to be discussed, I advise you to e-mail me urgently and I will consider allowing an urgent question on Thursday morning.

3:07 p.m.

yn fy enw yn ôl, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried y cynnig a rhoi sicrwydd y ceisia ehangu'r ddyletswydd i bob myfyriwr amser llawn mewn addysg bellach.

Felly, ar y cyd â cholegau, cwmnïau gyrfaoedd a myfyrwyr, fe'ch anogaf i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn fel cam iach i'r cyfeiriad cywir. A fyddch crystal â chefnogi'r cynnig hwn ar gyfer is-ddeddfwriaeth.

I hope that I will have your support.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf gynnig Brian a datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o'r Sefydliad Cyfarwyddyd Gyrfaoedd. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn gyn-gyfarwyddwr Gyrfaoedd Morgannwg Ganol Cyfyngedig.

Mae'n hanfodol y caiff pobl 16 i 19 mlwydd oed fynediad i raglen addysg gyrfaoedd, gan fod newidiadau enfawr ym myd gwaith yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Oherwydd y newidiadau eang yn y farchnad gyflogaeth, disgwyllir i bobl gymryd rôl lawnach wrth gynllunio eu gyrfaoedd nag a wnaethant yn y gorffennol. Ni cheir swydd am oes bellach. Nodweddion y patrymau gwaith sydd gennym yw contractau tymor byr, ailsgilio parhaus, datblygiad personol a'r angen i newid gyrfa yn llwyr weithiau. Mae'r Sefydliad Cyfarwyddyd Gyrfaoedd yn newid ei enw i Sefydliad Cyfarwyddyd Gyrfa, a adlewyrcha—

**Pauline Jarman:** Yr wyf newydd glywed bod 1,300 o ddiswyddiadau wedi eu cyhoeddi yn Panasonic. Fel yr Aelod ar gyfer Cwm Cynon, beth gall y weinyddiaeth ei wneud i hyrwyddo cyfarwyddyd gyrfa ar gyfer y bobl hynny a ddadleolir?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â'r diswyddiadau yn Panasonic. Deallaf fod yr Aelodau yn awyddus i drafod materion o'r fath ar unwaith yn y Cynulliad. Os dymunwch drafod hyn, fe'ch cynghoraf i anfon e-bost ataf ar frys ac ystyriaf ganiatáu cwestiwn brys fore dydd Iau.

**Christine Chapman:** I will answer Pauline briefly. The same situation arose in Hitachi. The job situation is changing. That is why people need to be as fully equipped as possible in modern times to deal with this. I do not know whether that is applicable to this particular debate.

As I said, it is vital that our young people are equipped to cope with the ever-changing demands made upon them. There is a role here for the careers service. I welcome the fact that the careers service in Wales, which will become Careers Wales in April 2001, is well placed to provide professional guidance on the options available for our young people. They must be congratulated on their work. They are also in a good position because of the close links that the careers companies have had historically with employers. They work closely with local employers to keep themselves up-to-date with new friends and with other agencies. I endorse what Brian said about strengthening any partnerships that the careers services have with further education colleges or other institutions.

There is much more to be done. A recent survey by the National Foundation for Educational Research found that the careers service still fell some way behind the family, subject teachers and friends as providers of influential advice and information involved with career choices. In addition, Estyn, in its consultation with young people, felt that the service needs to improve if young people are to view it as the natural source of advice. I welcome the fact that Careers Wales is being established to provide a national, all-age advice structure. To my mind, that will include all students aged 16 to 19 for whom the benefit of relevant, timely advice will be crucial at that stage in their development.

The provision of a careers programme for students in this age group is an important tool in tackling demotivation that may manifest itself in students. Careers guidance and the careers dedication programme is not simply a one-off chat with an adviser as used to be the

**Christine Chapman:** Atebaf Pauline yn gryno. Cododd yr un sefyllfa yn Hitachi. Mae sefyllfa swyddi yn newid. Dyna paham bod yn rhaid i bobl fod mor gymwys â phosibl yn yr oes hon i ymdrin â hyn. Ni wn a yw hynny yn berthnasol i'r ddadl benodol hon.

Fel y dywedais, mae'n hanfodol bod ein pobl ifanc yn gymwys i ymdopi â'r gofynion sydd yn newid o hyd a wneir ohonynt. Ceir rôl yma ar gyfer y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd. Croesawaf y ffaith fod y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru, a ddaw yn Gyrfaoedd Cymru ym mis Ebrill 2001, mewn sefyllfa dda i ddarparu arweiniad proffesiynol ar y dewisiadau sydd ar gael i'n pobl ifanc. Rhaid eu llongyfarch ar eu gwaith. Maent hefyd mewn sefyllfa dda oherwydd y cysylltiadau agos a fu rhwng y cwmnïau gyrfaoedd a chyflogwyr yn hanesyddol. Cydweithiant yn agos â chyflogwyr lleol er mwyn cael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ffrindiau newydd ac asiantaethau eraill. Cefnogaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Brian am gryfhau unrhyw bartneriaethau sydd gan y gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd â cholegau addysg bellach neu sefydliadau eraill.

Mae llawer mwy i'w wneud. Darganfu arolwg diweddar gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ymchwil Addysgol fod y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yn syrthio y tu ôl i'r teulu, athrawon pwnc a ffrindiau o hyd fel darparwyr cyngor a gwybodaeth dylanwadol sydd yn ymwneud â dewis gyrfa. Yn ogystal, bu Estyn o'r farn, wrth ymgynghori â phobl ifanc, bod angen i'r gwasanaeth wella os yw pobl ifanc am ei weld fel y ffynhonnell cyngor naturiol. Croesawaf y ffaith bod Gyrfaoedd Cymru yn cael ei sefydlu i ddarparu strwythur cyngor cenedlaethol ar gyfer pob oedran. Yn fy marn i, bydd hynny yn cynnwys pob myfyriwr 16 i 19 oed y bydd mantais cyngor perthnasol ac amserol yn hanfodol iddynt yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw o'u datblygiad.

Mae darparu rhaglen gyrfaoedd i fyfyrwyr yn y grŵp oedran hwn yn arf bwysig wrth fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg cymhelliant a all myfyriwr ei ddangos. Nid yn unig sgwrs unigol ag ymgynghorydd fel oedd yn wir yn y gorffennol yw arweiniad gyrfaoedd a'r

case. Careers advice should also be available to part-time students, full-time students and all students who want advice because the world is changing. I accept that the current provision of careers education in the further education sector is somewhat patchy. I am pleased that Brian has brought this to our attention today. However, with the introduction of Careers Wales and the new systems that we will put in place, we should have better advice.

Older students often have difficulty in making up their minds and their choices are often more confusing. They often need sophisticated careers advice to capture their imagination.

I endorse Brian's motion today. We must seek to end the fragmentation of services for many of our students in the 16 to 19 age group. We must do this so that we can avoid the situation where many of our young people, for one reason or another, may slip through the net.

**Jonathan Morgan:** On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I congratulate and thank Brian Hancock for bringing this to our attention. It is a worthwhile initiative and will gain cross-party support in the Assembly. Christine Chapman emphasised that the need for greater co-ordination between careers providers is obvious and clear. Careers guidance and services, particularly in our schools and further education colleges, is at best patchy. The careers service is often seen as the Cinderella service in the education system. However, it is an essential part of the education system in providing appropriate guidance and support for people who wish to either go on into further education establishments or into work-placed careers.

Sometimes, many young people go through the education system without having appropriate guidance and support. That still happens in schools and is non-existent in many or all further education colleges in Wales. I want to ask one particular point about how this service will be delivered. Will it be up to the particular college to offer a certain number of hours of careers guidance to students on a weekly basis or will it be up to individual students to seek careers

rhaglen ymrroddiad gyrfaoedd. Dylai cyngor gyrfaoedd fod ar gael hefyd i fyfyrwyr rhan amser, myfyrwyr llawn amser a phob myfyriwr sydd am gael cyngor gan fod y byd yn newid. Derbyniaf fod y ddarpariaeth addysg gyrfaoedd gyfredol yn y sector addysg bellach braidd yn fylchog. Mae'n dda gennyt fod Brian wedi dod â hyn i'n sylw heddiw. Fodd bynnag, yn dilyn cyflwyno Gyrfaoedd Cymru a'r systemau newydd a roddwn yn eu lle, dylem gael cyngor gwell.

Mae myfyrwyr hŷn yn aml yn cael anawsterau wrth wneud penderfyniadau ac mae eu dewisiadau yn aml yn fwy dryslyd. Mae angen cyngor gyrfaoedd soffistigedig arnynt yn aml er mwyn dal eu dychymyg.

Cefnogaif gynnig Brian heddiw. Rhaid inni geisio rhoi diwedd ar y ffordd o ddarnio gwasanaethau ar gyfer llawer o'n myfyrwyr yn y grŵp oedran 16 i 19 oed. Rhaid inni wneud hyn fel y gallwn osgoi'r sefyllfa lle gall llawer o'n pobl ifanc lithro drwy'r rhwyd, am ryw reswm neu'i gilydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ar ran Plaid Gaidwadol Cymru, llonyfarchiadau a diolch i Brian Hancock am ddod â hyn i'n sylw. Mae'n fenter werthfawr a chaiff cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad. Pwysleisiodd Christine Chapman fod yr angen i ddarparwyr gyrfaoedd gydweithio'n fwy yn amlwg ac yn glir. Mae arweiniad a gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yn fylchog ar eu gorau, yn arbennig yn ein hysgolion a'n colegau addysg bellach. Ystyrir y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yn aml fel gwasanaeth Sinderela y system addysg. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhan hanfodol o'r system addysg wrth ddarparu arweiniad a chymorth priodol i bobl sydd yn dymuno mynd i sefydliadau addysg bellach neu yrfaedd mewn gwaith.

Weithiau, aiff llawer o bobl ifanc drwy'r system addysg heb gael arweiniad a chymorth priodol. Digwydd hynny o hyd mewn ysgolion ac nid yw'n bodoli mewn llawer neu ddim un o golegau addysg bellach Cymru. Dymunaf ofyn un pwyt arbennig ynglŷn â sut y cyflwynir y gwasanaeth hwn. Ai cyfrifoldeb coleg penodol fydd cynnig nifer penodol o oriau o arweiniad gyrfaoedd i'r myfyrwyr yn wythnosol neu ai'r myfyrwyr unigol fydd yn gyfrifol am ofyn

guidance and support from appropriate individuals when he or she sees fit? We need to know how this will be delivered within the normal timetable of either a school or college because it will have budgetary and time implications for the schools or colleges concerned. We look forward to the details, as they become available, particularly in relation to those who return to further education colleges. Very often young people, perhaps in their early twenties, who have returned to secure qualifications, do not know who to turn to, who has the appropriate support and who can provide the guidance that they require to assist them in making career choices. For those who have been out of the education system for a number of years, it is daunting to return to college to secure qualifications and to seek appropriate guidance.

In terms of the FE sector, the business link between the FE sector and the outside world tends to be stronger than that found with the school sector. It is often the case that small and medium sized companies will be actively involved in providing education and training packages in the FE sector and providing support and work based placements. That tends to create an environment within which young people have a better understanding of the career choices that are available to them when they leave, more so than the school sector as the links between the traditional school model and the business community tend to be weaker.

In looking forward to the detail that will be provided on this, we must also examine how schools will enhance their links with the outside world and provide stronger links with the business community. This will allow for a greater understanding among young people as to what careers they could enter into once they leave that institution. We look forward to this being brought forward by the Minister for Education and Life-long Learning and to supporting the details as and when they arrive.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call Mick Bates I call Andrew Davies to propose amendment 2.

am arweiniad a chyngor gyrfaoedd gan unigolion priodol pan welant yn dda gwneud hynny? Mae angen inni wybod sut y cyflwynir hyn o fewn amserlen arferol ysgol neu goleg oherwydd y bydd goblygiadau cylidebol ac amser i'r ysgolion a'r colegau perthnasol. Edrychwn ymlaen at y manylion, wrth iddynt ddod ar gael, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r rheini sydd yn dychwelyd i golegau addysg bellach. Yn aml iawn, ni wyr pobl ifanc, efallai yn eu hugeiniau cynnar, a ddychwelodd i ennill cymwysterau, at bwy i droi, pwysydd â'r cymorth priodol a phwy a all ddarparu'r arweiniad sydd ei angen arnynt er mwyn eu cynorthwyo i wneud dewisiadau gyrfa. Mae'n anodd iawn i'r rheini a fu allan o'r system addysg am nifer o flynyddoedd ddychwelyd i'r coleg i ennill cymwysterau a gofyn am arweiniad priodol.

Mewn perthynas â'r sector addysg bellach, tuedda'r cyswllt busnes rhwng y sector addysg bellach a'r byd y tu allan fod yn gryfach na'r hyn a geir gyda'r sector ysgolion. Mae'n wir yn aml y cymera cwmniâu bach a chanolig eu maint ran frwd wrth ddarparu pecynnau addysg a hyfforddiant yn y sector addysg bellach ac wrth ddarparu cymorth a lleoliadau yn y gwaith. Tuedda hynny i greu amgylchedd lle bo dealltwriaeth well gan y bobl ifanc o'r dewisiadau gyrfa sydd ar gael iddynt pan adawant, yn fwy na'r sector ysgolion gan fod y cysylltiadau rhwng y model ysgol traddodiadol a'r gymuned fusnes yn tueddu i fod yn wannach.

Wrth edrych ymlaen at y manylion a ddarperir ynglŷn â hyn, rhaid inni archwilio hefyd sut bydd ysgolion yn gwella eu cysylltiadau â'r byd y tu allan a darparu cysylltiadau cryfach â'r gymuned fusnes. Caniatâ hyn ddealltwriaeth fwy ymlysg pobl ifanc o'r gyrfaoedd y gallent eu dilyn pan adawant y sefydliad hwnnw. Edrychwn ymlaen at hyn yn cael ei symud ymlaen gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ac at gefnogi'r manylion pan gyrrhaeddant.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar Mick Bates galwaf ar Andrew Davies i gynnig gwelliant 2.

**Andrew Davies:** I propose amendment 2.

Replace ‘Assembly Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training’ with

‘Minister for Education and Life-long Learning’.

Insert ‘46(1) and’ before ‘46(3)’.

Insert new second clause:

*To make provision, to secure that a programme of careers education is provided for all pupils aged 16-19 attending maintained schools (except special schools established in hospitals) and pupil referral units.*

Add at the end of the motion:

*In the case of institutions within the further education sector that objective is to be achieved by imposing a duty to provide such a programme on the governing bodies of such institutions and on the principals or other heads of those institutions.*

*In the case of the other educational establishments that objective is to be achieved in the case of schools by imposing such a duty on governing bodies and head teachers, and in the case of pupil referral units by imposing such a duty on local education authorities maintaining, and teachers in charge, of such units.*

**Mick Bates:** The Liberal Democrats welcome this motion as it calls for an original Wales-based legislation, unlike so much of our Assembly legislation which originates in London. Congratulations to Brian Hancock for bringing this forward. This will be the second piece of Welsh legislation. It follows the Liberal Democrat measure to extend the categories of homeless people who are entitled to receive immediate help. We find the motion acceptable because, as stated in the ETAG report, it needs to be implemented to extend the provision of careers help in schools. The Tories with their competitive tendering system for training caused the schools to miss out and further education colleges miss out too because schools kept a lot of the careers advice within their own

**Andrew Davies:** Cynigiaf welliant 2.

Yn lle ‘Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ol-16 y Cynulliad’, rhodder

‘y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes’.

Rhoi ‘46(1) a’ cyn ‘46(3)’.

Ychwaneger ail gymal newydd:

*Sicrhau bod rhaglen addysg gyrfaoedd yn cael ei darparu ar gyfer yr holl ddisgyblion 16-19 oed sydd yn mynychu ysgolion a gynhelir (ac eithrio ysgolion arbennig mewn ysbytai) ac unedau cyfeirio disgyblion.*

Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*Mewn sefydliadau o fewn y sector addysg bellach, dylid cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw drwy ei gwneud yn ddyletswydd ar gyrrff llywodraethu a phrifathrawon neu benaethiaid eraill y sefydliadau hynny i ddarparu rhaglen o'r fath.*

*Mewn sefydliadau addysgol eraill, dylid cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw mewn ysgolion drwy osod dyletswydd o'r fath ar y cyrff llywodraethu a'r prifathrawon, ac mewn unedau cyfeirio disgyblion, drwy osod dyletswydd o'r fath ar yr awdurdodau addysg lleol sy'n cynnal yr unedau, a'r athrawon sy'n gyfrifol andanynt.*

**Mick Bates:** Croesawa'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol y cynnig hwn gan ei fod yn galw am ddeddfwriaeth Gymreig wreiddiol, sydd yn wahanol i gymaint o ddeddfwriaeth y Cynulliad sydd yn deillio o Lundain. Llongyfarchiadau i Brian Hancock am gyflwyno hyn. Hwn fydd yr ail ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth Gymreig. Dilyna fesur y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i ehangu'r categoriâu o bobl ddigartref sydd â hawl i gael help ar unwaith. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn dderbynol gan fod angen ei weithredu er mwyn ehangu darpariaeth cymorth gyrfaoedd mewn ysgolion, fel y nodir yn adroddiad y grŵp gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant. O ganlyniad i system dendro gystadleuol ar gyfer hyfforddiant oedd gan y Toraid, collodd ysgolion y cyfle a cholla colegau

institutions.

Many schools and further education institutions are already providing the sort of careers education set out in this motion. This motion gives it a statutory basis and formalises the provisions. We hope that the motion will raise institutions to the standard of the best, ensuring consistency of service to students. The only condition that we place on this is that there will be sufficient funding to implement the motion. Otherwise, we welcome this important interface to assist young people in their career.

**Gareth Jones:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy ac aelod o gorff llywodraethol Ysgol y Gogarth, ysgol anghenion arbennig yn Llandudno. Yr wyf yn llonygfarch Brian, fel y gwnaeth eraill, ar ei waith da, ei waith ymchwil ac am y modd y mae wedi cyfleu'r cynnig y prynhawn yma a'i osod yn ei gyd-destun. Croesawaf y cynnig. Hoffwn amlinellu rhai o'r ffyrdd y gwelaf y byddai myfyrwyr yn elwa o'r mesur pe bai'r Cynulliad yn datgan ei gefnogaeth ac, ar hyn o bryd, ymddengys yn debygol y bydd cefnogaeth.

Gall y cynnig hwn gyfrannu tuag at atal nifer o gyfleoedd sydd yn cael eu colli. Mae economi Cymru wedi dioddef drwy ddiffyg ymwybyddiaeth ymhliith pobl ifanc o'r posibiliadau a'r opsiynau sydd o'u blaenau. Mae darpariaeth sefydlog a chyson o addysg gyrfaoedd yn gallu codi dyheadau a gobeithion ein pobl ifanc. Mae angen ysgogi pobl ifanc i feddwl yn gadarnhaol, i sylweddoli bod cyfleoedd yn agored iddynt ac i gynllunio eu gyrfaoedd mewn ffordd gadarnhaol.

3:17 p.m.

Er mwyn hybu twf yr economi, mae angen annog ein pobl ifanc i berfformio i'w gwir botensial. Mae'r cynnig yn gam tuag at alluogi i hynny ddigwydd ac, yn yr ystyr hwnnw, mae'n gynnig o bwys.

Cyfeiriodd Mick Bates at safonau. Oes, mae lle i bryderu, a rhaid inni weithio'n galed i

addysg bellach y cyfle hefyd oherwydd i lawer o ysgolion gadw llawer o'r cyngor gyrfaoedd o fewn eu sefydliadau eu hunain.

Darpara llawer o ysgolion a sefydliadau addysg bellach y math o addysg gyrfaoedd a nodir yn y cynnig hwn eisoes. Rhydd y cynnig hwn sail statudol iddi a ffurfiola'r ddarpariaeth. Gobeithio y bydd y cynnig yn codi'r sefydliadau i safon y gorau, gan sicrhau cysondeb gwasanaeth ar gyfer myfyrwyr. Yr unig amod a osodwn ar hyn yw y bydd digon o arian i weithredu'r cynnig. Fel arall, croesawn y rhngwyneb pwysig hwn i gynorthwyo pobl ifanc yn eu gyrfa.

**Gareth Jones:** I declare an interest as a member of Conwy County Borough Council and a member of the governing body of Ysgol y Gogarth, a special needs school in Llandudno. I congratulate Brian, as others have done, for his good work, his research and for the way he has presented the motion this afternoon and put it in context. I welcome the motion. I would like to outline some of the ways in which I see students would benefit from the measure if the Assembly supported it and, at the moment, it seems likely that there will be support.

This motion could contribute towards preventing many opportunities from being lost. The economy of Wales has suffered because of a lack of awareness among young people of the possibilities and the options before them. An established and regular provision of careers education can raise the aspirations and hopes of our young people. There is a need to motivate young people to think positively, to realise that there are opportunities open to them and to plan their careers in a positive way.

In order to promote the growth of the economy, we need to encourage our young people to perform to their true potential. The motion is a step towards enabling that to happen and, in that respect, is an important motion.

Mick Bates referred to standards. Yes, there is cause for concern, and we must work hard

sicrhau bod y safonau o'r ansawdd gorau. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed sut y gallai'r cynnig helpu i safoni'r ddarpariaeth addysg gyrfaoedd o fewn y sector addysg bellach. Byddai'n sicrhau cysondeb a dilyniant i'r myfyrwyr.

Mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn anelu at safonau ansawdd cyson a chyffredin o fewn addysg gyrfaoedd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae pedwar model yn gweithredu ar draws Cymru. Hoffem weld safon ansawdd genedlaethol ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, fel yr argymhellwyd yn nogfen y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Byddai hyn hefyd yn cyfrannu at system o ddarpariaeth fwy cydlynol a fyddai wedi ei ffurfioli'n effeithiol. Mae angen inni edrych yn ofalus ar safonau ansawdd, a sicrhau eu bod yn gyffredin ledled Cymru.

Mae amcanion y cynnig yn gorgyffwrdd ag amcanion eang y Cynulliad, sydd o bwys mawr i ni. Mae'n ceisio hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol drwy leihau'r nifer o bobl sydd yn gadael addysg a hyfforddiant, a hynny drwy addysg gyrfaoedd sydd yn sicrhau bod gan bobl sgiliau sydd yn cydweddu â'r hyn y mae cyflogwyr yn chwilio amdano. Mae dod â'r ddau beth hynny at ei gilydd yn holl bwysig.

Gall y cynnig hwn a'r ddeddfwriaeth hybu cyfleoedd cyfartal a thaclo'r ystrydebau sydd i'w cael yn ein cymdeithas trwy dynnu sylw at bosibiliadau i fenywod neu bobl ag anabledbau. Mae gormod o ystrydebau yn bodoli o'n cwmpas. Mae'r elfen o gyfle cyfartal yn holl bwysig.

Mae'r dilyniant y mae'r Mesur yn ceisio ei sicrhau yn cyd-fynd â'r agenda dysgu gydol oes. Mae hynny'n un o themâu pwysig y Cynulliad ac yn un sydd ynghlwm wrth y cynnig hwn. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Cynulliad yn ein cefnogi y prynhawn yma.

**The Minister for Education and Life-long Learning (Jane Davidson):** I welcome Brian's choice of area for a part 7 Order. Since Gareth referred to the importance of life-long learning, I am particularly pleased to be standing here in my new role as the Minister for both education and life-long learning. The role and importance of career

to ensure that the standards are of the highest calibre. We have already heard how the motion could help to standardise the provision of careers education within the further education sector. It would secure consistency and continuity for the students.

It is vital that we aim for consistent and common quality standards within careers education. At present, four models operate across Wales. We would like to see a national quality standard for the whole of Wales, as was recommended in the Education and Training Action Group document. This would also contribute to a more cohesive and effectively formalised system of provision. We must look carefully at quality standards and ensure that they are common throughout Wales.

The aims of the motion overlap with the broad objectives of the Assembly, which are very important to us. It tries to promote social inclusion by reducing the number of people leaving education and training, by means of careers education that ensures that people have the skills that match what employers are seeking. Bringing those two things together is vital.

This motion and the legislation could promote equal opportunities and tackle the stereotypes that exist in our society by drawing attention to the possibilities for women or people with disabilities. Too many stereotypes exist around us. The element of equal opportunities is vital.

The continuity that the Bill is trying to secure conforms to the life-long learning agenda. That is one of the Assembly's important themes and it ties in with this motion. I look forward to seeing the Assembly support us this afternoon.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Croesawaf ddewis faes Brian ar gyfer Gorchymyn rhan 7. Gan fod Gareth wedi cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd dysgu gydol oes, mae'n dda iawn gennyl sefyll yma yn fy'rôleu newydd fel y Gweinidog dros addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Mae'r rôle a phwysigrwydd materion gyrfaoedd yn

issues is crucial when we look at the link between the two parts of my brief. It is important that we ensure that young people get good, impartial advice on options open to them. I know that the Assembly is wedded to this. Today, with Brian bringing this forward, we are taking our first step to turning this into home-grown legislation.

A planned programme of careers education helps young people develop the career management skills that are so important in a fast-changing economy. In particular, it helps them to take an informed and realistic view of the options available and plan effectively for the future. Brian has cogently explained the position of schools and further education. I am sure that, like me, many Members were surprised that the provision was so patchy. That is why I welcome the fact that we are not only discussing this today but are talking about how we address that patchiness, both in terms of the sectors and in terms of the people who are entitled to receive this new impartial careers advice. Therefore, it is important that we do not simply look at full-time students. I am grateful to Brian for withdrawing this amendment, because as Gareth Jones said, we want to ensure that we provide this advice to everyone. We want to make the opportunities available to everyone whether they are full or part-time students, returning to work, or whether they fall into another category that we have not yet thought about in terms of how the Order will progress. We want to ensure that this advice is available to all.

I particularly welcome the fact that this comes out of the education and training action plan for Wales's proposal. That proposed—as many people in this Chamber have heard time and time again—an integrated post-16 education and training system, one in which our individual communities and employers could flourish and prosper and where people would enjoy a high standard of education and training throughout their lives. ETAP recognised that if young people are to develop the skills and knowledge needed to manage their career developments, they must have access to an appropriate service. Therefore, the plan made a specific recommendation on this matter in

hanfodol pan edrychwn ar y cyswllt rhwng dwy ran fy mriff. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael cyngor da, diduedd ar yr opsiynau sydd yn agored iddynt. Gwn fod y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i hyn. Heddiw, pan gyflwynir hyn gan Brian, cymerwn ein cam cyntaf i droi hyn yn ddeddfwriaeth gartref.

Mae rhaglen o addysg gyrfaoedd a gynllunnir yn helpu pobl ifanc i ddatblygu y sgiliau rheoli gyrrfa sydd mor bwysig mewn economi sydd yn newid yn gyflym. Mae'n eu helpu, yn arbennig, i gael barn hyddysg a realistig am yr opsiynau sydd ar gael ac i gynllunio'n effeithiol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Eglurwyd sefyllfa ysgolion ac addysg bellach yn gryf gan Brian. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer o Aelodau, fel minnau, wedi'u syfrdanu bod y ddarpariaeth mor fylchog. Dyna paham y croesawaf nid yn unig y ffaith ein bod yn trafod hyn heddiw ond hefyd y ffaith ein bod yn trafod sut i ymdrin â'r bylchau, o ran y sectorau ac o ran y bobl sydd â'r hawl i gael y cyngor gyrfaoedd diduedd newydd hwn. Felly, mae'n bwysig nad ystyriwn fyfyrwyr llawn amser yn unig. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Brian am dynnu'r gwelliant hwn yn ôl, oherwydd ein bod am sicrhau y darparwn y cyngor hwn i bawb, fel y dywedodd Gareth Jones. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod y cyfleoedd ar gael i bawb pa un ai a ydynt yn fyfyrwyr llawn neu ran amser, yn dychwelyd i'r gwaith, neu pa un ai a ydynt yn syrthio o fewn categori arall nas ystyriwyd eto gennym mewn perthynas â sut y bydd y Gorchymyn yn datblygu. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod y cyngor hwn ar gael i bawb.

Croesawaf yn arbennig y ffaith bod hyn yn deillio o gynnig gynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant Cymru. Cynigiodd hynny—fel y clywyd gan lawer o bobl yn y Siambra hon dro ar ôl tro—system addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 integredig, lle gallai ein cymunedau a chyflogwyr unigol lewyrchu a ffynnu a lle y byddai pobl yn manteisio ar safon uchel o addysg a hyfforddiant drwy gydol eu bywydau. Cydnabu'r cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant bod yn rhaid i bobl ifanc gael mynediad at wasanaeth priodol, er mwyn datblygu'r sgiliau a'r wybodaeth sydd eu hangen er mwyn rheoli datblygiad eu gyrrfa. Felly, gwnaeth y cynllun argymhelliaid penodol ar y mater hwn mewn perthynas â

terms of the provision of careers education for all pupils and students aged 16 to 19 in maintained secondary schools and further education institutions, which should be mandatory in Wales. This was supported by the Committee. In February this year, the Assembly as a whole also supported it. I suggest that this is consensual politics in action. This is where we jointly identify the needs of people in Wales and use the opportunity to meet those needs.

Making the provision of careers education mandatory for all 16 to 19 year-olds, whether in FE colleges or schools will oblige the governing bodies, principals, and heads of those institutions to implement suitable policies to support such a service. We will need to ensure that the service provided is monitored and evaluated for its effectiveness, because more young people are deferring decisions on career options until 18 years of age. That is why we need to have this programme available for those between the ages of 16 and 19.

Although I mentioned home grown legislation, it is also important to remind Members that the introduction of Careers Wales in April 2001—which is also supported by the whole Assembly—relates to our effective lobby in Whitehall and Westminster to ensure that that was incorporated in the Learning and Skills Act that achieved its Royal Assent in July and extended the powers of careers services in Wales. This is an example of something that we can bring forward in the full knowledge that we have been able to put our case effectively in Westminster about how we look forward at issues of career services guidance in Wales.

The new Careers Wales will expand the current role of the careers service companies. They will continue to provide the existing draft of support to schools and colleges, but they will also have responsibility for the guidance-related elements of education and business links, something that Gareth identified in his speech and is clearly important. The new Careers Wales companies will therefore be well placed to help both schools and colleges to integrate

darparu addysg gyrfaoedd ar gyfer pob disgybl a myfyriwr 16 i 19 oed mewn ysgolion uwchradd a gynhelir a sefydliadau addysg bellach, a ddylai fod yn orfodol yng Nghymru. Cefnogwyd hyn gan y Pwyllgor. Fe'i cefnogwyd gan y Cynulliad cyfan hefyd, ym mis Chwefror eleni. Awgrymaf mai gwleidyddiaeth gydsyniol ar waith yw hyn. Dyma ble y nodwn ar y cyd anghenion pobl Cymru a defnyddiwn y cyfle i fodloni'r anghenion hynny.

Bydd gwneud darparu addysg gyrfaoedd yn orfodol ar gyfer pob person 16 i 19 oed, mewn colegau addysg bellach neu mewn ysgolion, yn gorfodi cyrff llywodraethol, prifathrawon, a phenaethiaid y sefydliadau hynny i weithredu polisiau addas i gynnal gwasanaeth o'r fath. Bydd angen inni sicrhau y caiff effeithiolrwydd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir ei fonitro a'i arfarnu, gan fod mwy o bobl ifanc yn gohirio penderfyniadau ar opsiynau gyrfa nes iddynt gyrraedd 18 oed. Dyna pam y mae angen inni ddarparu'r rhaglen hon ar gyfer pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 19 oed.

Er imi grybwyl deddfwriaeth gartref, mae'n bwysig atgoffa'r Aelodau hefyd bod cyflwyno Gyrfaoedd Cymru ym mis Ebrill 2001—a gefnogir gan y Cynulliad cyfan hefyd—yn gysylltiedig â'n lobi effeithiol yn Whitehall a San Steffan er mwyn sicrhau y'i hymgorfforwyd yn y Ddeddf Dysgu a Sgiliau a gafodd Gysyniad Brenhinol ym mis Gorffennaf ac a ehangodd bwerau'r gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru. Dyma enghraift o rywbeth y gallwn ei gyflwyno gan wybod yn iawn i ni gyflwyno ein hachos yn effeithiol yn San Steffan am sut yr edrychwn ymlaen o ran materion arweiniad gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru.

Ehangâ'r Gyrfaoedd Cymru newydd rôl gyfredol cwmnïau gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd. Parhânt i ddarparu'r cymorth cyfredol i ysgolion a cholegau, ond byddant yn gyfrifol hefyd am yr elfennau o gysylltiadau addysg a busnes sydd yn gysylltiedig ag arweiniad, sef rhywbeth a nododd Gareth yn ei arraith ac sydd yn amlwg yn bwysig. Felly, bydd y cwmnïau Gyrfaoedd Cymru newydd mewn sefyllfa dda i helpu ysgolion a cholegau i integreiddio gweithgareddau megis profiad

activities such as work experience within an ongoing programme of careers and work-related education to help all young people plan for the future.

ACCAC has already published guidance on the provision of careers education in providing for choice. In addition, it is pulling together further guidance on suitable learning outcomes for 14 to 19 year-olds resulting from careers education. As the new Minister, I will want to keep a close eye on that.

The Careers Wales budgets for the next three years, as outlined in the draft budget settlement that Edwina launched last week, shows that we are investing £27.8 million from next year and between £31.8 million and £33.8 million for the future. I hope that that is taken into account, in terms of Mick's point about funding, because it is important that we all sign up to the importance of this issue. The provision for the Careers Service to provide specialist support to secondary schools and FE institutions will, therefore, be found within that budget.

We need to build on Brian's notion to ensure a comprehensive careers education policy for all our young people. That is why I am so grateful that he accepted our amendment. The points that Jonathan raised were right in terms of the issues that we need to consider under the Order and associated guidance. However, at this stage, we ask the Assembly to endorse this motion and then ask me to bring further motions before the Assembly. Today's debate has shown that we have a common interest in looking after the careers guidance for all young people in Wales. We must tie it into the skills agenda of employers, so that we know what skills they want and we must look at how we can formulate our education and training agenda to achieve that. I thank Brian Hancock for proposing this motion and I ask you all to support the Government's amendment to which Brian has agreed in taking this motion forward. I look forward to being in front of you again in three months time with an Order.

gwaith o fewn rhaglen barhaus o yrfaeodd ac addysg sydd yn gysylltiedig â gwaith er mwyn helpu pob person ifanc i gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Cyhoeddwyd arweiniad ar ddarparu addysg gyrfaoedd wrth ddarparu ar gyfer dewis eisoes gan ACCAC. Yn ogystal, casgl a ynghyd arweiniad pellach ar ganlyniadau dysgu addas ar gyfer pobl 14 i 19 mlwydd oed sydd yn deillio o addysg gyrfaoedd. Fel y Gweinidog newydd, yr wyf am gadw llygad barcud ar hynny.

Dengys cyllidebau Gyrfaoedd Cymru ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, fel y'u hamlinellwyd ym mhenderfyniad y gyllideb ddrafft a lansiwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan Edwina y buddsoddw £27.8 miliwn o'r flwyddyn nesaf a rhwng £31.8 miliwn a £33.8 miliwn ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gobeithio yr ystyri hyn, mewn perthynas â phwynt Mick am arian, gan ei fod yn bwysig bod pob un ohonom yn cytuno ar bwysigrwydd y mater hwn. Felly, daw'r ddarpariaeth er mwyn i'r Gwasanaeth Gyrfaoedd ddarparu cymorth arbenigol i ysgolion uwchradd a sefydliadau addysg bellach o'r gyllideb honno.

Mae angen inni ddatblygu ar gynnig Brian er mwyn sicrhau polisi addysg gyrfaoedd cynhwysfawr i bob un o'n pobl ifanc. Dyna pam yr wyf mor ddiolchgar iddo am dderbyn ein gwelliant. Bu'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Jonathan yn gywir mewn perthynas â'r materion y mae angen inni eu hystyried o dan y Gorchymyn ac arweiniad cysylltiedig. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, gofynnwn i'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo'r cynnig hwn ac wedyn gofyn imi gyflwyno cynigion pellach gerbron y Cynulliad. Dangosodd y ddadl heddiw bod diddordeb cyffredin gennym mewn gofalu am arweiniad gyrfaoedd pob person ifanc yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni ei glymu wrth agenda sgiliau cyflogwyr, er mwyn gwybod pa sgiliau sydd eu hangen arnynt a rhaid inni ystyried sut y gallwn fformwleiddio ein hagenda addysg a hyfforddiant er mwyn cyflawni hynny. Diolch i Brian Hancock am gynnig y cynnig hwn a gofynnaf i bob un ohonoch gefnogi gwelliant y Llywodraeth y cytunodd Brian arno wrth gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Edrychaf ymlaen at fod o'ch blaen eto ymhen tri mis

gyda Gorchymyn.

3:27 p.m.

**Brian Hancock:** Thank you everyone for your support. I did not know that I was that popular. [Interruption.]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know that this is a great moment because we are making our own legislation, but let us do it in order.

**Brian Hancock:** Yes, it is an important day because we are trying to make Welsh legislation here in Wales for the people of Wales. It is a great step forward. I thank everyone for their support.

The role of career planning is important, because we do not want people doing nothing because they were given the wrong advice. We want them to be active members of the community developing, promoting and contributing to the economy.

The careers service is good, but it needs developing and strengthening. We have heard about some variation in practice, but there is still good practice. There are four models being worked on at the moment. Perhaps if we were to look at the models and suggest a Welsh model we could strengthen and improve it further.

I agree that part-time and mature students, in fact all students, need careers advice and guidance and, perhaps, education. There may be a timetable problem, particularly for part-time students, but I am sure that by getting our heads down and putting in effort we can sort that out.

Business links are important. Over the years, FE colleges have developed links with local businesses or even large businesses. As a result, some careers advice and guidance has been departmentalised. By having good business links you get good careers advice. We need to build on that and emphasise that further.

This motion appeals to all people in

**Brian Hancock:** Diolch i chi i gyd am eich cefnogaeth. Ni wyddwn fy mod mor boblogaidd â hynny. [Ymyriad.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwn ei bod yn awr wych gan ein bod yn sefydlu ein deddfwriaeth ein hunain, ond gadewch inni ei wneud mewn trefn.

**Brian Hancock:** Ydyw, mae'n ddiwrnod pwysig gan ein bod yn ceisio sefydlu deddfwriaeth Gymreig yma yng Nghymru ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Mae'n gam mawr ymlaen. Diolch i bawb am eu cefnogaeth.

Mae'r rôl gwaith cynllunio gyrfaoedd yn bwysig, gan nad ydym eisiau i bobl fod yn gwneud dim oherwydd iddynt gael y cyngor anghywir. Hoffem iddynt ddod yn aelodau gweithredol o'r gymuned, gan ddatblygu, hyrwyddo a chyfrannu at yr economi.

Mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yn dda, ond mae angen ei ddatblygu a'i gryfhau. Clywsom am beth gwahaniaethau o ran arfer, ond ceir arfer da o hyd. Datblygir pedwar model ar hyn o bryd. Efallai pe edrychwn ar y modelau ac awgrymu model Cymreig, gallem ei atgyfnerthu a'i wella ymhellach.

Cytunaf fod angen cyngor ac arweiniad gyrfaoedd, ac efallai, addysg gyrfaoedd, ar fyfyrwyr rhan amser a myfyrwyr aeddfed, ar bob myfyriwr yn wir. Efallai bod problem o ran amserlen, yn arbennig ar gyfer myfyrwyr rhan amser, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn ddatrys hynny drwy weithio ac ymdrechu'n galed.

Mae cysylltiadau busnes yn bwysig. Dros y blynnyddoedd, datblygodd colegau addysg bellach cysylltiadau â busnesau lleol neu hyd yn oed fusnesau mawr. O ganlyniad, adrano wyd peth cyngor ac arweiniad gyrfaoedd. Drwy gael cysylltiadau busnes da cewch gyngor gyrfaoedd da. Mae angen inni adeiladu ar hynny a phwysleisio hynny ymhellach.

Apelia'r cynnig hwn at bawb yn y byd

education. We need to be forward looking. addysg. Mae angen inni edrych at y dyfodol.  
Thank you for your support and I hope that Diolch am eich cefnogaeth a gobeithio y  
you will vote for the motion. pleidleisiwch o blaid y cynnig.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:*

*Amended motion:*

*The National Assembly resolves to instruct the Minister for Education and Life-long Learning to bring forward draft subordinate legislation under sections 46(1) and 46(3) of the Education Act 1997. The objective to be achieved is:*

*to make provision, to secure that a programme of careers education is provided for all pupils aged 16-19 attending maintained schools (except special schools established in hospitals) and pupil referral units.*

*In the case of institutions within the further education sector that objective is to be achieved by imposing a duty to provide such a programme on the governing bodies of such institutions and on the principals or other heads of those institutions.*

*In the case of the other educational establishments that objective is to be achieved in the case of schools by imposing such a duty on governing bodies and head teachers, and in the case of pupil referral units by imposing such a duty on local education authorities maintaining, and teachers in charge, of such units.*

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymroi i gyfarwyddo y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gyflwyno is-ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft o dan adran 46(1) a 46(3) o Ddeddf Addysg 1997. Yr amcan yw:*

*sicrhau bod rhaglen addysg gyrfaoedd yn cael ei darparu ar gyfer yr holl ddisgyblion 16-19 oed sydd yn mynychu ysgolion a gynhelir (ac eithrio ysgolion arbennig mewn ysbytai) ac unedau cyfeirio disgyblion.*

*Mewn sefydliadau o fewn y sector addysg bellach, dylid cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw drwy ei gwneud yn ddyletswydd ar gyrrff llywodraethu a phrifathrawon neu benaethiaid eraill y sefydliadau hynny i ddarparu rhaglen o'r fath.*

*Mewn sefydliadau addysgol eraill, dylid cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw mewn ysgolion drwy osod dyletswydd o'r fath ar y cyrff llywodraethu a'r prifathrawon, ac mewn unedau cyfeirio disgyblion, drwy osod dyletswydd o'r fath ar yr awdurdodau addysg lleol sy'n cynnal yr unedau, a'r athrawon sy'n gyfrifol amdanynt.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Barrett, Lorraine
- Bates, Mick
- Black, Peter
- Bourne, Nick
- Butler, Rosemary
- Chapman, Christine
- Dafis, Cynog
- Davidson, Jane
- Davies, Andrew
- Davies, David
- Davies, Geraint
- Davies, Glyn
- Davies, Janet
- Davies, Jocelyn
- Davies, Ron
- Edwards, Richard
- Essex, Sue
- Evans, Delyth
- Feld, Val
- German, Michael
- Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted.*

**Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order**

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae hwn yn fater difrifol. Gwn nad oes amser gennym heddiw i'w gyflwyno fel cwestiwn brys, ond yr ydym newydd glywed cyhoeddriad y bydd 1,300 o swyddi yn cael eu colli yn Panasonic. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol i'r Cynulliad. Drwyddoch chi, Lywydd, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yn wyneb difrifoldeb y sefyllfa, a yw'n fodlon gwneud datganiad ar y mater hwn heddiw neu ddydd Iau.

**Y Lwywydd:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn cais yn barod am gwestiwn brys ar gyfer dydd Iau, a byddaf yn ystyried hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Further to that point of order, it is 130 jobs. It is regrettable, but it is not 1,300.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** This is a serious matter. I know that we do not have time today to present it as an urgent question, but we have just heard an announcement that 1,300 jobs are to be lost in Panasonic. This is a serious matter for the Assembly. Through you, Presiding Officer, I ask the Minister for Economic Development, in light of the gravity of this situation, to make a statement on this matter today or on Thursday.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have already received a request for an emergency question on Thursday, and I will consider that.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, 130 o swyddi ydyw. Mae'n destun gofid, ond nid yw'n 1,300.

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)**  
**Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Cynrychiolaeth Ddaearyddol yn y Cabinet Newydd**  
**Geographical Representation in the New Cabinet**

**Peter Rogers:** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*regrets the failure of the Labour led administration to recognise the needs and interests of Wales, outside of Glamorgan, as reflected in the composition of the new Cabinet announced on 16 October 2000.*

It might be hard for some Members to believe this, but there are some of us who live north of Cardiff. Why is the entire Cabinet from south Wales? Did the First Minister have a mental block when he started to think beyond Pontypridd? Perhaps he suffers from geographical vertigo. Perhaps the further north he goes, the dizzier he becomes. In what was supposed to be a National Assembly for Wales, we have a national and sectional Cabinet.

**Cynog Dafis:** Yr wyf newydd glywed Peter yn defnyddio'r term 'south Wales'. Efallai yr hoffai ddiffinio'r term hwnnw. A yw ef yn ystyried, er enghraift, bod 'south Wales' yn cynnwys Talgarreg, lle yr wyf fi'n byw?

**Peter Rogers:** The motion refers to Glamorgan. The First Minister's decision not to include north Wales is extremely short-sighted. It is not only short-sighted, it is narrow-minded. This new Cabinet makes a mockery of any pretence of inclusivity. The Cabinet is precisely the reverse of that. It is an exclusive Cabinet. It is no wonder that the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats wanted in. An inclusive Cabinet should reflect the demographics of the whole of Wales. If those at the top table manage to get out of Cardiff, they will have a better idea of people's needs. If they do, they will find out that they are letting the people of Wales down. For example, last Thursday evening I was at the People's Assembly in Brymbo. History shows that some of the finest steel in

**Peter Rogers:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn gresynu at fethiant y weinyddiaeth a arweinir gan Lafur i gydnabod anghenion a buddiannau Cymru, y tu allan i Forgannwg, fel y caiff ei adlewyrchu yng nghyfansoddiad y Cabinet newydd a gyhoeddwyd ar 16 Hydref 2000.*

Efallai y bydd yn anodd i rai Aelodau gredu hyn, ond mae rhai ohonom yn byw i'r gogledd o Gaerdydd. Pam bod y Cabinet cyfan yn dod o dde Cymru? A gafodd y Prif Weinidog floc meddyliol pan ddechreuodd feddwl y tu hwnt i Bontypridd? Efallai ei fod yn dioddef o bendro ddaearyddol. Efallai ei fod yn mynd yn fwy chwil po fwyaf i'r gogledd yr â. Mae gennym Gabinet cenedlaethol ac adrannol yn yr hyn a oedd i fod yn Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

**Cynog Dafis:** I have just heard Peter using the term 'south Wales'. Perhaps he would like to define that term. Does he consider, for example, that 'south Wales' includes Talgarreg, where I live?

**Peter Rogers:** Cyfeiria'r cynnig at Forgannwg. Mae penderfyniad y Prif Weinidog i beidio â chynnwys gogledd Cymru yn fyrweledol tu hwnt. Nid yn unig mae'n fyrweledol, mae'n gul. Gwna'r Cabinet newydd hwn unrhyw esgus o fod yn gynhwysol yn destun sbort. Mae'r Cabinet yn union i'r gwrtwyneb o hynny. Mae'n Gabinet neilltuedig. Does ryfedd bod arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn awyddus i gael ei gynnwys. Dylai Cabinet cynhwysol adlewyrchu demograffeg Cymru gyfan. Pe byddai'r rheini ar y bwrdd mawr yn llwyddo i fynd allan o Gaerdydd, byddai ganddynt well syniad o anghenion pobl. Os gwnânt hynny, byddant yn darganfod eu bod yn siomi pobl Cymru. Er enghraift, nos iau diwethaf yr oeddwon yng Nghynulliad y Bobl

the world was made there. The removal of the steel plant left an overgrown slag heap and a decaying and demoralised community. I am sure that there were those who believed that devolution would help to resolve the problems of that community. Redevelopment there could have been a shining example for north Wales. The people of Brymbo reminded me of that when I talked to them after the People's Assembly. Redevelopment could be an example of the Assembly's commitment to the communities in the north. I urge this new coalition to give the people of Brymbo a chance. I hope that my personal intervention as a Brymbo boy will prompt this coalition into action.

This Cardiff-centric coalition seems uninterested in the desperate circumstances of the people of the whole of Wales. Take Objective 1 for example. The nearest Welsh European Funding Office for north Wales is in Machynlleth, which is not even in an Objective 1 area. Reaching this office means over two hours' travel from most areas in north Wales. So much for local response to local needs. I have written to certain Ministers about north Wales issues and I have not had the courtesy of an acknowledgement, let alone a reply. Letters can go unanswered for months or even never get a reply.

ym Mrymbo. Dengys hanes mai yno y gwnaethpwyd peth o ddur gorau'r byd. Gadawyd tomen sorod wedi'i gorchuddio â llstyfiant a chymuned ddigalon oedd yn dirywio yn sgil cael gwared ar y gwaith dur. Yr wyf yn sicr bod pobl a gredai y byddai datganoli yn helpu i ddatrys problemau'r gymuned honno. Gallai ailddatblygiad yno fod wedi bod yn enghraifft wych i ogledd Cymru. Fe'm hatgoffwyd o hynny gan bobl Brymbo pan siaradais â hwy ar ôl Cynulliad y Bobl. Gallai ailddatblygiad fod yn esiampl o ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i gymunedau'r gogledd. Pwysaf ar y glymbiaid newydd hon i roi cyfle i bobl Brymbo. Gobeithiaf y bydd fy ymyriad personol fel bachgen o Frymbo yn hwb i'r glymbiaid hon weithredu.

Ymddengys nad oes gan y glymbiaid hon, sydd â Chaerdydd yn ganolbwyt iddi, ddiddordeb yn amgylchiadau adfydus pobl Cymru gyfan. Ystyriwch Amcan 1 er enghraifft. Y Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru sydd agosaf at ogledd Cymru yw Machynlleth, nad yw hyd yn oed yn ardal Amcan 1. Golyga cyrraedd y swyddfa hon daith o fwy na dwy awr o'r rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd yng ngogledd Cymru. Felly peidiwch â sôn am ymateb yn lleol i anghenion lleol. Ysgrifennais at rai Gweinidogion am faterion yn ymwneud â gogledd Cymru ac nid ydynt wedi cael y cwrteisi i gydnabod fy llythyr, heb sôn am ei ateb. Gall llythyrau aros heb eu hateb am fisioedd neu beidio â chael ateb byth hyd yn oed.

**The Presiding Officer:** Will you give way to Brian Gibbons?

**Peter Rogers:** No, I am struggling for time.

**The Presiding Officer:** You are not struggling for time. You are in your first five minutes. You have 10 minutes to open the debate.

**Peter Rogers:** I am sorry, I will give way to Brian.

**Brian Gibbons:** Can Peter remind us where the Objective 1 office was when his Government was in power?

**Y Llywydd:** A wnewch chi ildio i Brian Gibbons?

**Peter Rogers:** Na wnaf, yr wyf yn brin o amser.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid ydych yn brin o amser. Yr ydych yn eich pum munud cyntaf. Mae gennych 10 munud i agor y ddadl.

**Peter Rogers:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, fe ildiaf i Brian Gibbons.

**Brian Gibbons:** A all Peter ein hatgoffa ble yr oedd y swyddfa Amcan 1 pan oedd ei Lywodraeth ef mewn grym?

3:37 p.m.

**Peter Rogers:** We must look forward. We have devolution, and we have Objective 1. We must start to be positive about it and implement it to the best effect for all of Wales. It seems that I must take this opportunity to raise the issue of the unacceptable delay in the appointment of a member from Wales to the Medical Practitioner's Committee—a committee that was six months without a Welsh voice. This is a coalition that is out of touch. In Llangollen, people voted to stay within Denbighshire, yet this administration decided not to listen to them. This has created much uncertainty in that area, and future investment and planning has been put into question. This is all due to our interference from Cardiff. In Beaumaris, we have an excellent project for a marina, which the local community and planners support, yet once again Cardiff interferes.

We have the same problem with renewable energy projects. We get good proposals that local communities and planners support—projects such as wind farms that will create jobs and opportunities in areas that need them, and the construction of wind turbines by Cambrian Engineering in Bangor, yet Cardiff calls them in. They bow to pressure from a misguided green welly brigade. Unless this Cardiff cabinet is represented from these areas, they will never understand the real issues of the countryside. Yes, we need to protect the environment, but we must remember the development part of sustainable development. We should not allow the green welly brigade to be cuckoos in the nest of economic regeneration.

**Ann Jones:** Could you refine your language? Green welly brigade to me is quite offensive. I have a pair of green wellies but I do not go tramping across fields, and neither do I stop people enjoying the countryside. You ought to temper your language in the confines of our Standing Orders. If you slowed down slightly we will listen with a little more sensitivity to what you say without your getting people's backs up.

**Peter Rogers:** Rhaid inni edrych ymlaen. Mae gennym ddatganoli, ac mae gennym Amcan 1. Rhaid inni ddechrau bod yn gadarnhaol yn ei gylch a'i weithredu er y budd gorau i Gymru gyfan. Ymddengys bod yn rhaid imi fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i godi'r mater o oedi annerbyniol wrth benodi aelod o Gymru ar y Pwyllgor Ymarferwyr Meddygol—pwyllogor a fu am chwe mis heb lais o Gymru. Mae'r glymblaid hon wedi colli gafael ar bethau. Yn Llangollen, pleidleisiodd pobl i aros o fewn Sir Ddinbych, ond penderfynodd y weinyddiaeth hon beidio â gwrandeo arnynt. Creodd hyn lawer o ansicrwydd yn yr ardal honno, a chodwyd cwestiwn ynglynch buddsoddi a chynllunio yn y dyfodol. Canlyniad ein hymyrraeth ni o Gaerdydd yw hyn oll. Ym Miwmares, mae gennym brosiect gwych ar gyfer marina, a gefnogir gan y gymuned leol a'r cynllunwyr, ond unwaith eto mae Caerdydd yn ymyrryd.

Gwelwn yr un broblem gyda phrosiectau ynni adnewyddol. Cawn gynigion da a gefnogir gan gymunedau lleol a chynllunwyr—prosiectau fel ffermydd gwynt a fydd yn creu swyddi a chyfleoedd mewn ardaloedd sydd eu hangen, ac adeiladu tyrbinau gwynt gan Cambrian Engineering ym Mangor, ond eto mae Caerdydd yn eu galw i mewn. Plygant i bwysau gan fyddin gyfeiliornus y welingtons gwyrdd. Oni fydd cynrychiolaeth o'r ardaloedd hyn yn y Cabinet hwn yng Nghaerdydd, ni ddeallant byth y materion gwirioneddol sydd yn ymwned â chefn gwlad. Oes, mae angen inni ddiogelu'r amgylchedd, ond rhaid inni gofio'r gair 'datblygiad' yn yr ymadrodd 'datblygiad cynaliadwy'. Ni ddylem ganiatáu i fyddin y welingtons gwyrdd fod yn gyw cog yn nyth adferiad economaidd.

**Ann Jones:** A allech goethi eich iaith? Mae byddin y welingtons gwyrdd i mi yn eithaf sarhaus. Mae gennyf fi bâr o welingtons gwyrdd ond nid af i droedio caeau, ac nid ataliaf bobl ychwaith rhag mwynhau cefn gwlad. Dylech gymedrol i eich iaith o fewn cyfyngiadau ein Rheolau Sefydlog. Petaech yn arafu ychydig byddem yn gwrandeo gydag ychydig mwy o sensitfrwydd ar yr hyn a ddywedwch heb ichi gynhyrfu pobl.

**Peter Rogers:** I have worn wellies all my life, of many different colours. I wear green wellies.

**Ann Jones:** Both you and I wear green wellies, but that is where any resemblance of policy or politics between you and I should cease.

**Peter Rogers:** Thank you for that important point. Much redevelopment is frustrated by the unelected bureaucracy in Europe. Red tape is weighing down business and frustrating investment, and some of the Euro-babble regulations place intolerable constraints on development. In Ireland, ministers are standing up to these Eurocrats over environmental directives and it is about time that we did the same. Unfortunately, unless we have Cabinet members with experience of the countryside, we will not address these real issues.

I fear that this could turn out to be an ostrich Cabinet whose members will seek to bury their heads in the political sand when things go wrong. This is not what Wales needs. We need a Cabinet that will represent all of Wales and that will bring common sense to all our economic policies. We need a common sense revolution in Wales and a Cabinet that understands and represents all of Wales. We will support Elin Jones's amendment 1.

**Elin Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig, ychwaneger

*Yn cydnabod y byddai adleoli rhai adrannau o'r llywodraeth a phencadlysoedd asiantaethau cyhoeddus eraill y tu allan i Gaerdydd yn fodd o wneud iawn am y methiant hwn, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried hyn o ddifrif yn ystod y ddwy flynedd nesaf.*

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y gwelliant sydd yn fy enw yn symud yn wedol bell oddi wrth y cynnig gwreiddiol, ond credaf ei bod yn ymdrech gadarnhaol—o gynnig cymharol negyddol—i fynd i'r afael o ddifrif ag ymdeimlad sydd yn rhedeg drwy'r wlad—yn

**Peter Rogers:** Yr wyf wedi gwisgo welingtons drwy gydol fy mywyd, o nifer o wahanol liwiau. Gwisgaf innau welingtons gwyrdd.

**Ann Jones:** Yr ydych chi a minnau yn gwisgo welingtons gwyrdd, ond dyna lle y dylai unrhyw debygrwydd rhyngom o ran polisi neu wleidyddiaeth ddod i ben.

**Peter Rogers:** Diolch am y pwnt pwysig hwnnw. Llesteirir llawer o ailddatblygiad gan fiwrocratiaeth anetholedig yn Ewrop. Mae mân reolau yn pwysio ar fusnesau ac yn llesteirio buddsoddiad, a gosoda rhai o'r rheoliadau Ewro-gleber gyfngiadau annioddefol ar ddatblygiad. Yn Iwerddon, mae gweinidogion yn herio'r Ewrocratiaid hyn ynghylch cyfarwyddebau amgylcheddol ac mae'n hen bryd i ni wneud yr un peth. Yn anffodus, oni fydd gennym aelodau o'r Cabinet sydd â phrofiad o gefn gwlad, ni fyddwn yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion go iawn.

Ofnaf y gallai hyn droi'n Cabinet estrys lle bydd ei aelodau yn ceisio claddu eu pennau yn y tywod gwleidyddol pan aiff pethau o le. Nid dyna beth sydd ei angen ar Gymru. Mae angen Cabinet arnom fydd yn cynrychioli Cymru gyfan a daw hynny â synnwyr cyffredin i'n holl bolisiau economaidd. Mae angen chwyldro synnwyr cyffredin arnom yng Nghymru a Chabinet sydd yn deall ac yn cynrychioli Cymru gyfan. Cefnogwn welliant 1 Elin Jones.

**Elin Jones:** I propose amendment 1. Add at the end of the motion

*Recognises that the relocation of certain government departments and the headquarters of other public agencies outside of Cardiff would help to compensate for this failure and calls upon the Government of Wales to give active consideration to this over the next two years.*

I am aware that the amendment in my name is moving quite far from the original motion, but I believe that it is a positive attempt—with a comparatively negative motion—to deal with a sentiment that runs through the country—in Talgarreg and in Brymbo—that

Nhalgarreg ac ym Mrymbo—fod gorganoli cynyddol yng Nghaerdydd.

Byddai cadarnhad heddiw gan Lywodraeth y glymplaid ei bod yn fodlon rhoi ystyriaeth fanwl i raglen o symud pencadlysoedd rhai o'n prif gyrrff cyhoeddus ac elfennau o adrannau o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol allan o Gaerdydd yn anfon neges eglur bod y Llywodraeth am roi Cymru gyfan yn gyntaf, ac am wasgaru'r gweithgareddau a'r cyfleoedd i bob cwr o Gymru.

Yn Aberystwyth—lle'r wyf yn byw—yr ydym yn ffodus bod y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol yno. Mae'n gyflogwr sylweddol yn yr ardal ac mae'n rhoi rhywfaint o statws cenedlaethol i'r dref honno. Mae hyn yn wir hefyd am y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad ym Mangor a'r Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig gynt yn y Drenwydd. Mae rhai ardaloedd o Gymru hefyd wedi elwa'n sylweddol o ddatganoli'r sector cyhoeddus o dde-ddwyrain Lloegr: yn benodol y bathdy yn Llantrisant, y Swyddfa Patent yng Nghasnewydd, Tŷ'r Cwmniau yng Nghaerdydd a'r Asiantaeth Drwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau yn Abertawe. Dyma gyfle inni ofyn i ni ein hunain pam na all pencadlys y WDA, er enghraifft, fod ym Merthyr Tudful, Cyngor y Celfydyyddau yng Nghaefyddin, y Bwrdd Croeso yn Llandudno a pham na all yr Adran Amaethyddiaeth ddychwelyd i Aberystwyth.

Mae'r drafodaeth hon yn arbennig o briodol wrth inni sefydlu'r Cyngor cenedlaethol ar gyfer Addysg a Hyfforddiant: corff newydd sydd heb bencadlys amlwg. Mae dadleuon cryf dros sefydlu'r pendcadlys y tu allan i Gaerdydd, gyda swyddfeydd rhanbarthol drwy'r wlad.

Nid mater i'w benderfynu'n fympwyol yw hwn. Hoffwn weld y Llywodraeth yn ymrwymo i raglen ddatganoli gan edrych ar restr o safleoedd addas ar gyfer swyddfeydd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, gyda dadansoddiad cost manwl o'r dewisiadau a chydweithio agos â'r undebau llafur sydd yn cynrychioli'r gweithwyr yn y sector hwn.

Bydd costau adleoli cychwynnol yn deillio o'r fath raglen ond bydd arbedion cost hefyd gyda rhent is na Chaerdydd ar gael yng

there is an increasing overcentralisation in Cardiff.

An assurance today by the coalition Government that it is willing to give detailed consideration to a programme of moving the headquarters of some of our major public bodies and elements of National Assembly departments would send a clear message that the Government wants to put the whole of Wales first, and wants to spread the activities and the opportunities to every corner of Wales.

In Aberystwyth—where I live—we are fortunate to have the National Library. It is a substantial employer in the area and it accords a certain amount of national status to the town. This is true also of the Countryside Council for Wales in Bangor, and the former Development Board for Rural Wales in Newtown. Some areas of Wales have also profited substantially from public sector devolution from south-east England: specifically the mint in Llantrisant, the Patent Office in Newport, Companies House in Cardiff and the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency in Swansea. This is an opportunity for us to ask ourselves why the headquarters of the WDA, for example, cannot be in Merthyr Tydfil, the Arts Council in Carmarthen, the Tourist Board in Llandudno and why the Agriculture Department cannot return to Aberystwyth.

This discussion is especially appropriate as we establish the national Council for Education and Training: a new body that does not have an obvious headquarters. There are strong arguments for establishing the headquarters outside Cardiff, with regional offices throughout the country.

This is not a matter to be decided on a whim. I would like to see the Government commit itself to a programme of devolution, examining a list of sites that are suitable for public offices in Wales, with a detailed cost analysis of the options and close co-operation with the trade unions who represent the workers in this sector.

There will be initial relocation costs stemming from such a programme but there will also be cost savings with lower rent

ngweddill Cymru. Byddai hefyd yn rhyddhau gofod yng Nghaerdydd ar gyfer datblygiadau gan y sector preifat, neu'r sector gwirfoddol.

Nid gwelliant gwirth-Gaerdydd yw hwn, ond gwelliant a fyddai'n rhyddhau'r pwysau datblygu a thrafnidiaeth yng Nghaerdydd. Dyma welliant hefyd a fyddai'n dangos bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cymryd o ddifrif ei swyddogaeth o roi arweiniad i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i Gymru gyfan.

Cyfre i gefnogi'r egwyddor yw'r gwelliant heddiw, heb ymrwymo i fanylion. Byddwn yn disgwyl i bawb a gefnogai'r syniad o leoli'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn Abertawe, neu yn rhywle arall, gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn. Yr un yw'r dadleuon dros y ddau achos. Mae'n fy nharo i hefyd y dylai pawb sydd wedi dangos pryder ynglŷn â dylanwad cudd Clwb Caerdydd a'r Sir ar benderfyniadau'r sector cyhoeddus groesawu unrhyw ymdrech i wasgaru rheolwyr y gwahanol sefydliadau ar hyd a lled y wlad.

Mae gwelliant 1 yn fy enw yn ymgais i gyflwyno syniadau cadarnhaol mewn cynnig cyfan gwbl negyddol. Mae hefyd wrth graidd ein gweledigaeth am ddatblygu ein gwlaid ymhellach. Ai gwlaid gyda'i gweithgaredd wedi'i chanoli mewn un ddinas yw ein dymuniad ar gyfer Cymru, ynteu gwlaid gyda chanolfannau o arbenigedd a chyfleoedd wedi'u lledaenu drwy'r wlad? Byddai hyn yn unol â phatrwm yr Unol Daleithiau neu Wlad y Basg.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn barod i edrych yn gadarnhaol ar y gwelliant hwn a rhoi Cymru gyfan yn gyntaf.

**Alun Pugh:** I will say a few words about Elin Jones's amendment 1. It is badly drafted and that is why I will be voting against it later this afternoon. However, I have great sympathy with the aims of locating headquarters of government bodies in places other than Cardiff. There is no reason why new bodies, such as the office of the children's commissioner for example, should not be, let us say, in Pembrokeshire. There is

available in the rest of Wales than in Cardiff. It would also free up space in Cardiff for private sector or voluntary sector developments.

This is not an anti-Cardiff amendment, but an amendment that would relieve the development and transport pressures in Cardiff. This is also an amendment that would demonstrate that the National Assembly takes seriously its role of giving a lead in the provision of public services for the whole of Wales.

This amendment today is an opportunity to support the principle, without committing to detail. I would expect that everyone who supported the idea of locating the National Assembly in Swansea, or elsewhere, would support this amendment. The arguments are the same for both cases. It also strikes me that everyone who has demonstrated concern at the hidden influence of the Cardiff and County Club on public sector decisions would welcome any attempt to scatter the managers of the various institutions throughout the length and breadth of the country.

Amendment 1 in my name is an attempt to introduce positive ideas into a wholly negative motion. It is also at the heart of our vision for further developing our country. Is our wish for a Wales where activity is centralised in one city, or a country with centres of expertise and opportunities spread throughout the country? This would be in line with the pattern of the United States or the Basque Country.

I hope that the Government will be willing to look at this amendment positively and put the whole of Wales first.

**Alun Pugh:** Dywedaf ychydig eiriau am welliant 1 Elin Jones. Fe'i drafftiwyd yn wael a dyna pam y byddaf yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyl gydymdeimlad mawr a'r amcanion o leoli pencadlysoedd cyrff y llywodraeth mewn lleoedd ar wahân i Gaerdydd. Nid oes unrhyw reswm pam na ddylai cyrff newydd, fel swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant er enghraifft, fod yn Sir

no reason why the new training and education powerhouse for Wales should not be located in the north, preferably in an Objective 1 area. I hope that the Government of Wales will take these perfectly reasonable requests into account.

3:47 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** The First Minister and the leader of the Liberal Democrats in Wales have made a serious mistake by not appointing anyone from outside the old county of Glamorgan to their new Cabinet. This mistake has caused great offence in north, mid and west Wales. Since he announced his Cabinet, I have heard the First Minister commenting on this issue and trying unsuccessfully to justify what he has done.

**The Presiding Officer:** Will you give way to Lorraine Barrett?

**Glyn Davies:** No I will not, Llywydd. I have planned my speech so that it lasts for five minutes and I know that you are a hard man.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will be brief.

**Glyn Davies:** She has promised to be brief.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Will you remind us, Glyn, how many former Conservative Secretaries of State for Wales either lived in Wales or represented Welsh constituencies?

**Glyn Davies:** That was brief, but irrelevant to my point.

The most worrying aspect is that I genuinely believe that the First Minister does not understand why his decision to exclude anyone from north, mid and west Wales from his Cabinet should have caused such offence. Perhaps he has seen Tony Blair get away with a Cabinet of cronies and thinks that what is right for Tony is also okay for Rhodri. Perhaps he does not even realise what he has done. This demonstrates just how out of touch the First Minister and the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats are with Wales north of the M4.

Benfro, dyweder. Nid oes unrhyw reswm pam na ddylai'r pwerdy newydd ar gyfer hyfforddiant ac addysg gael ei leoli yn y gogledd, yn ddelfrydol o fewn ardal Amcan 1. Gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried y ceisiadau hollol resymol hyn.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog ac arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghymru gamgymeriad dybryd wrth beidio â phenodi rhywun o'r tu allan i hen sir Forgannwg ar eu Cabinet newydd. Achosodd y camgymeriad hwn dramgydd mawr yng ngogledd, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru. Ers iddo gyhoeddi ei Gabinet, clywais y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud sylw ar y mater hwn ac yn ymgeisio yn aflwyddiannus i gyflawnhau yr hyn a wnaeth.

**Y Llywydd:** A wnewch chi ildio i Lorraine Barrett?

**Glyn Davies:** Na wnaef, Lywydd. Yr wyf wedi cynllunio fy arraith fel ei bod yn parhau am bum munud a gwn eich bod yn ddyn caled.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Byddaf yn gryno.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae wedi addo bod yn gryno.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A wnewch chi ein hatgoffa, Glyn, sawl un o gyn Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol Cymru a oedd naill ai'n byw yng Nghymru neu'n cynrychioli etholaethau yng Nghymru?

**Glyn Davies:** Yr oedd hynny'n gryno, ond yn amherthnasol i'm pwynt.

Yr agwedd sydd yn achosi'r gofid mwyaf yw fy mod yn gwir gredu nad yw'r Prif Weinidog yn deall pam y dylai ei benderfyniad i eithrio unrhyw un o ogledd, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru o'i Gabinet fod wedi achosi cymaint o dramgydd. Efallai iddo weld Tony Blair yn llwyddo i gael Cabinet o gyfeillion a'i fod yn credu bod yr hyn sydd yn iawn i Tony hefyd yn iawn i Rhodri. Efallai nad yw hyd yn oed yn sylweddoli'r hyn a wnaeth. Dengys hyn yn union faint o ddiffyg gafael ar bethau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog ac arweinydd

Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru o fewn Cymru i'r gogledd o'r M4.

When the devolution referendum was announced on 18 September 1997, I discussed with my local Conservative association in Montgomeryshire how I would become involved. I was prepared to join the 'no' campaign. However, it accepted my preference, which was to arrange a series of public meetings in village halls across Montgomeryshire, entitled 'Assembly—Yes or No?' I held discussion evenings where I could lead the debate on the minuses and pluses of establishing a national assembly for Wales. In Montgomeryshire, as in north, mid and west Wales, the main concern about devolution was that the area would become dominated by south Wales. The area was accustomed to a history of economic and social decline. Mid Wales knew that it was going to lose its specialist rural development agency. There was much talk about organisations moving their headquarters to Cardiff—I particularly remember the concern about moving the head office of the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds from Newtown to Cardiff. Worries about domination by south Wales was an important issue in north, mid and west Wales; an issue that was given almost disproportionate importance in the minds of people considering whether to vote yes or no. It was more to do with the recognition of the area rather than jobs, grant availability or economic activity

When the First Minister and the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats chose a Cabinet with no representation from north, mid or west Wales, the message conveyed is that this Government—and by extension, this Assembly—is Cardiff-centric and will be driven by the interests of south-east Wales. I am not calling for full geographical balance, or any other sort of balance. In general, I accept the principle that the First Minister should choose his Ministers on the basis of their ability to do the job. However, there are limits. This Assembly functions in a political environment and we cannot set aside the political impact of all of our decisions. The First Minister and the leader of the Welsh

Pan gyhoeddwyd y refferendwm ar ddatganoli ar 18 Medi 1997, trafodais pa ran y byddwn yn ei chwarae yn hyn gyda'm cymdeithas Geidwadol leol yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Yr oeddwn yn barod i ymuno â'r ymgyrch 'na'. Fodd bynnag, derbyniodd fy newis, sef trefnu cyfres o gyfarfodydd cyhoeddus mewn neuaddau pentref ledled Sir Drefaldwyn, yn dwyn y teitl, 'Cynulliad—Ie neu Na?' Cynhaliais dair noson drafod lle y gallaswn arwain y ddadl ar anfanteision a manteision sefydlu cynulliad cenedlaethol i Gymru. Yn Sir Drefaldwyn, fel yng ngogledd, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru, y prif bryder ynghylch datganoli oedd y byddai'r ardal yn cael ei llywodraethu gan dde Cymru. Yr oedd yr ardal yn hen gyfarwydd â hanes o ddirywiad economaidd a chymdeithasol. Gwyddai canolbarth Cymru y byddai'n colli ei hasiantaeth datblygu gwledig arbenigol. Yr oedd llawer o sôn am sefydliadau yn symud eu pencadlysoedd i Gaerdydd—cofiaf yn arbennig y pryder ynghylch symud prif swyddfa'r Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar o'r Drenewydd i Gaerdydd. Yr oedd pryderon ynghylch de Cymru yn llywodraethu yn fater pwysig yng ngogledd, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru; mater y rhoddwyd pwysigrwydd anghymesur bron iddo ym meddyliau'r bobl a oedd yn ystyried pa un a oeddent am bleidleisio ie neu na. Yr oedd yn ymwneud yn fwy â chydubyddiaeth o'r ardal yn hytrach na swyddi, argaeedd grantiau neu weithgaredd economaidd.

Pan ddewisodd y Prif Weinidog ac arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Gabinet heb unrhyw gynrychiolaeth o ogledd, canolbarth na gorllewin Cymru, y neges a gyflewyd yw bod y Llywodraeth hon—ac ymhellach, y Cynulliad hwn—wedi'i ganoli yng Nghaerdydd ac y bydd yn cael ei llywio gan ddiddordebau de-ddwyrain Cymru. Nid wyf yn galw am gydbwysedd daearyddol llawn, nac unrhyw fath arall o gydbwysedd. Yn gyffredinol, derbyniaf yr egwyddor y dylai'r Prif Weinidog ddewis ei Weinidogion ar sail eu gallu i gyflawni'r swydd. Fodd bynnag, mae pen draw i hynny. Gweithreda'r Cynulliad mewn amgylchedd gwleidyddol ac ni allwn roi effaith wleidyddol ein holl

Liberal Democrats would probably have got away with just one Minister from north, mid or west Wales. However, they just could not see it, and it seems to me that they still cannot see it. They cannot see why it was such a mistake. Imagine what would have happened if the entire Cabinet had been drawn from north Wales. The people of Cardiff would have been outraged, and rightly so.

If this is to be an effective Assembly, it must be a National Assembly for all of Wales. We need a Government that recognises the equal importance of every region of Wales. We must look for ways of developing our national identity and reducing the disconnection that increases as distance from Cardiff increases. Through their serious mistake of limiting their Cabinet to one small part of south-east Wales, the First Minister and Michael German have dealt a serious blow to the devolution process, which can only be put right by a change to the Cabinet.

I welcome Elin Jones's amendment 1. We have a responsibility, working as we do for the greater part of our time in Cardiff, to look seriously at how we can counteract the isolation and disconnection felt in other parts of Wales. I am not in favour of a gesture that would lead to greatly increased costs, but Elin's amendment 1 is framed in reasonable terms. It is framed in terms of a principle, rather than the details that would have to be considered carefully. I support the principle and I will support her amendment.

**Kirsty Williams:** Having listened to Peter's and Glyn's speeches, have I, somewhere along the line, missed the golden rule that, just because someone lives in the same area, comes from the same race, practises the same religion or is of the same sex, means that they will automatically promote positively the needs of that group, if they have the opportunity. One thinks of Mrs Thatcher as the first female Prime Minister and all that she did for her fellow women—not. Mrs Thatcher probably did more to set back the

benderfyniadau i'r naill ochr. Byddai'r Prif Weinidog ac arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru fwy na thebyg wedi dianc yn groeniach gyda dim ond un Gweinidog o ogledd, canolbarth neu orllewin Cymru. Fodd bynnag, ni allent weld hynny, ac ymddengys i mi eu bod yn dal i fethu â gweld hynny. Ni allant weld pam ei fod yn gymaint o gamgymeriad. Dychmygwch beth fyddai wedi digwydd pe byddai'r Cabinet cyfan yn dod o ogledd Cymru. Byddai pobl Caerdydd yn gandryll, a phwy fyddai'n eu beio?

Os yw'r Cynulliad am fod yn effeithiol, rhaid iddo fod yn Gynulliad Cenedlaethol i Gymru gyfan. Mae angen Llywodraeth arnom sydd yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cyfartal pob rhan o Gymru. Rhaid inni edrych am ffyrdd o ddatblygu ein hunaniaeth genedlaethol a lleihau'r datgysylltiad sydd yn cynyddu wrth i'r pellter o Gaerdydd gynyddu. Drwy eu camgymeriad difrifol o gyfyngu eu Cabinet i un rhan fechan o dde-ddwyrain Cymru, mae'r Prif Weinidog a Michael German wedi rhoi ergyd drom i'r broses ddatganoli, a dim ond drwy newid y Cabinet y gallir unioni hynny.

Croesawaf welliant 1 Elin Jones. Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb, drwy weithio fel y gwnawn y rhan fwyaf o'n hamser yng Nghaerdydd, i edrych o ddifrif ar sut y gallwn wrthweithio'r teimladau ynysig a'r teimladau o ddatgysylltiad mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Nid wyf o blaid arwydd a fyddai'n arwain at gynnnydd mawr mewn costau, ond mae gwelliant 1 Elin wedi'i roi mewn termau rhesymol. Mae wedi'i gyflwyno yn nhermau egwyddor, yn hytrach na'r manylion y byddai'n rhaid inni eu hystyried yn ofalus. Cefnogaf yr egwyddor a chefnogaf ei gwelliant.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ar ôl gwrando ar areithiau Peter a Glyn, a ydwyf, yn rhywle, wedi colli'r rheol euraid sydd yn dweud, oherwydd bod rhywun yn byw yn yr un ardal, yn hanu o'r un hil, yn arfer yr un grefydd neu o'r un rhyw, y byddant yn awtomatig yn hyrwyddo anghenion y grŵp hwnnw yn gadarnhaol, os caint y cyfle. Mae rhywun yn meddwl am Mrs Thatcher fel y Prif Weinidog benywaidd cyntaf a'r holl bethau a wnaeth dros ei chyd-chwiorydd—neu ddim. Gwnaeth Mrs Thatcher, yn fwy na thebyg, fwy i lesteirio

position of women in Wales than any Prime Minister before her. Let us consider the Tory record in this respect. It was the Tories who gave us, as Lorraine said, a string of Secretaries of State who neither came from Wales nor represented a Welsh constituency, let alone Glamorgan. The Tories' current Welsh affairs spokesperson represents the Ribble Valley. I am sorry, I forgot, you do not have any Welsh Members of Parliament at the moment. Perhaps Peter, and the other Tories, need to take the plank out of their own eyes before looking for splinters in the eyes of others.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The title that should be used is the Welsh Conservative group. In fairness to all groups, we should use, in regular parlance, the names that they choose to call themselves.

**Kirsty Williams:** The suggestion that just because there are no mid or north Wales AMs in the Cabinet, those of us outside the Cabinet are not capable of presenting a strong case, is insulting to everyone in this Chamber. Have you also noticed that we do not have any members of black or ethnic minorities as Members in this Chamber? We do not have disabled AMs, but that does not mean that we do not seek, at every opportunity, to put forward their needs and concerns. However, having said that, the Cabinet must be sensitive to the whole of Wales. I urge Cabinet members to ensure that they get out and about as much as possible and at every opportunity look to promote the needs of all of Wales. I issue a standing invitation to Cabinet members to visit my constituency of Brecon and Radnorshire whenever they can.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae cyfraniad Kirsty Williams yn swnio'n debyg i ddadl yn erbyn unrhyw fath o wahaniaethu cadarnhaol. Mae dadl dros gael pobl o gategori arbennig yn rhan o lywodraeth er mwyn iddynt allu sicrhau bod gofynion y categori hwnnw yn cael eu hadlewyrrchu. Mae hynny hefyd yn wir o ran daearyddiaeth. Yr wyf yn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith fod Plaid Cymru, drwy welliant 1 Elin Jones, yn ceisio troi'r ddadl at bwrrpas adeiladol fel nad ydym yn trafod y negyddol

sefyllfa'r ferch yng Nghymru nag unrhyw Brif Weinidog a'i rhagflaenodd. Gadewch inni ystyried record y Torïaid yn hyn o beth. Y Torïaid a roddodd inni, fel y dywedodd Lorraine, un Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar ôl y llall nad oeddent yn dod o Gymru nac yn cynrychioli etholaeth yng Nghymru, heb sôn am Forgannwg. Mae llefarydd materion Cymreig presennol y Torïaid yn cynrychioli Dyffryn Ribble. Mae'n ddrwg gennyl, anghofiai, nid oes gennych unrhyw Aelodau Seneddol Cymreig ar hyn o bryd. Efallai fod angen i Peter, a'r Torïaid eraill, dynnu'r trawst o'u llygad eu hunain cyn edrych am y brycheuyn yn llygaid pobl eraill.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Y teitl y dylid ei ddefnyddio yw grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Er tegwch i bob grŵp, dylem ddefnyddio, mewn iaith reolaidd, yr enwau y dewisant alw eu hunain.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r awgrym na all y rheini ohonom y tu allan i'r Cabinet gyflwyno achos cryf, dim ond oherwydd nad oes unrhyw Aelodau o ganolbarth neu ogledd Cymru yn y Cabinet, yn sarhad i bawb yn y Siambwr hon. A ydych hefyd wedi sylwi nad oes gennym aelodau o leiafrifoedd du nac ethnig fel Aelodau yn y Siambwr hon? Nid oes gennym Aelodau anabl, ond ni olyga hynny na cheisiwn, ar bob cyfle, gyflwyno eu hanghenion a'u pryderon. Fodd bynnag, wedi dweud hynny, rhaid i'r Cabinet fod yn sensitif i Gymru gyfan. Pwysaf ar aelodau'r Cabinet i sicrhau eu bod yn teithio o amgylch gymaint â phosibl ac yn ceisio hyrwyddo anghenion Cymru gyfan ar bob cyfle. Estynnaf wahoddiad sefydlog i aelodau'r Cabinet ymweld â'm hetholaeth i, sef Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, pryd bynnag y gallant.

**Cynog Dafis:** Kirsty Williams's contribution sounds like an argument against any kind of positive discrimination. There is an argument for having people of a certain category in government so that they can ensure that that category's needs are reflected. That is also true as regards geography. I take pride in the fact that Plaid Cymru, through Elin Jones's amendment 1, are trying to turn the debate to a constructive purpose so that we do not always discuss the negative.

bob amser.

Gresynaf at fethiant y coalisiwn i adlewyrchu realiti amrywiol daearyddiaeth Cymru yn y Cabinet. Fodd bynnag, gresynaf fwy byth at unrhyw ymdrech i ddefnyddio hynny i greu rhaniadau yn y genedl. Yr wyf yn gresynu at y diwn gron a glywn o hyd, fod *north Wales* yn cael ei fradychu gan y Cynulliad a bod pob mantais yn cael ei sugno gan *south Wales*. Nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth wrthrychol fod hynny'n wir. Y rhai sydd yn canu'r diwn gron honno'n aml yw'r rhai sydd am rannu Cymru. Gwrthwynebaf y defnydd o'r term '*north Wales*'. Mae'n rhoi'r argraff ein bod yn siarad am wlad arall, megis *North Korea* neu *North Vietnam*. Nid oes unrhyw un yn Lloegr yn cyfeirio at '*north England*'. Y term a ddefnyddir yw '*the North*', ynghyd â thermau eraill megis '*the West Country*', '*the South East*' a '*the Midlands*'. Fodd bynnag, yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn defnyddio'r termau '*north Wales*', '*mid Wales*' a '*south Wales*' yn dragwyddol. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu meddylfryd trefedigaethol, sydd am rannu gwlad yn dair gwlad wahanol. Dylem wrthwynebu hynny.

Rhith yw'r hyn a elwir yn ogledd Cymru. Ar wahân i'r 'u' yddfol a rhai nodweddion tafodieithol eraill, mae mwy yn gyffredin rhwng Caernarfon a Dolgellau ac Aberystwyth ac Aberteifi nag sydd yn gyffredin rhwng Caernarfon a'r Fflint. Nid yw'n anos cyrraedd Caerdydd o Lannau Dyfrdwy nag ydyw o Abergwaun neu Ddoc Penfro. Mae'n drueni mawr bod Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 wedi gwneud darpariaeth unigryw ar gyfer sefydlu Pwyllgor Rhanbarth ar gyfer y Gogledd, ond nad oes gofyniad statudol i sefydlu Pwyllgorau mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

3:57 p.m.

Mae canolborth Cymru yn llawn cymaint o rith. Mae'n gynnrych y cyfnod pan sefydlwyd Corfforaeth Datblygu Canolborth Cymru, nad oedd yn cynnwys Ceredigion o gwbl. Mae gan Geredigion fwy yn gyffredin â Sir Gâr neu ogledd Penfro nag â Phowys. Mae amrywiaeth yn un o nodweddion Cymru. Mae'n rhywbeth i ymfalchiö ynddo ac yn rhywbeth y dylem ei ystyried. Fodd bynnag, mae creu undod o'r amrywiaethau

I regret the failure of the coalition to reflect the diverse reality of Wales's geography in the Cabinet. However, I regret even more any efforts to use that to create divisions in the nation. I regret that we always hear the same old story about north Wales being betrayed by the Assembly and that every advantage is sucked into south Wales. There is no objective evidence that that is true. The ones reciting that same old story often are the ones intent on dividing Wales. I object to the use of the term 'north Wales'. It gives the impression that we are talking about another country, such as North Korea or North Vietnam. No-one in England refers to 'north England'. The term used is 'the North', along with other terms such as 'the West Country', 'the South East' and 'the Midlands'. However, in Wales, we are forever using the terms 'north Wales', 'mid Wales' and 'south Wales'. That reflects a colonial mentality, intent on dividing a country into three different countries. We should oppose that.

That which is called north Wales is a myth. Apart from the guttural 'u' and some other dialectal characteristics, there is more in common between Caernarfon and Dolgellau and Aberystwyth and Aberteifi than there is between Caernarfon and Flint. It is no more difficult to reach Cardiff from Deeside than it is from Fishguard or Pembroke Dock. It is a great pity that the Government of Wales Act 1998 made unique provision for establishing a Regional Committee for the North, but that there is no statutory requirement to establish Committees in other parts of Wales.

Mid Wales is just as much of a myth. It is a product of the period when the Mid Wales Development Corporation was established, which did not include Ceredigion at all. Ceredigion has more in common with Carmarthenshire or northern Pembrokeshire than with Powys. Diversity is one Wales's characteristics. It is something in which to take pride and something that we should consider. However, creating unity from that

hynny yn dasg bwysig ac mae'r sefyllfa yn achosi anhawster a her. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bryd inni ymateb i'r her honno mewn modd cadarnhaol a dechrau meddwl fel un Gymru ac un wlad, a dechrau gweithredu i gwrdd â gofynion gwahanol rannau o'n gwlad, fel y mae gwelliant Elin Jones yn awgrymu.

**The First Minister:** What is this motion trying to say? It states that the Cabinet has failed to recognise the needs and interests of the areas of Wales outside Glamorgan. Then it tries to link that with the appointments to the Cabinet. Peter presented his so-called case that people believe that this Cabinet is Cardiff-dominated, south Wales-dominated or Glamorgan-dominated and, therefore, would neglect the interests of the other areas of Wales. I rebut that.

I will put the proposition to the test and set it against the factoids that Peter tried to present. In the last few weeks, I appointed, on Tom's recommendation, Enid Rowlands from north Wales as chair of the equally most important quango in Wales—the new Council for Education and Training for Wales. Also, a few weeks ago, BAE Systems received approval for a grant of almost £20 million that will create 1,700 additional jobs in north-east Wales. Likewise, a couple of weeks ago, GDA Hotpoint was awarded a grant of almost £20 million to safeguard 935 jobs at Bodelwyddan. That grant is also likely to create a further 170 jobs.

Wrexham, including the Brymbo area that Peter mentioned, received the only URBAN European programme grant that has been, and will be, awarded in Wales. The western suburbs of Wrexham around Brymbo benefited from that. Likewise, David Pritchard was appointed as the head of the Assembly civil service's Economic Development Department. He is another north Welsh to be appointed to an extremely sensitive and important position.

Those are kinds of decisions for which the Cabinet has been responsible over the past few weeks. Those decisions predate the formation of the partnership Cabinet, but

diversity is an important task and the situation is difficult and challenging. However, it is time for us to respond to that challenge positively and start to think as one Wales and one country, and begin to act to meet the different needs of various parts of our country, as Elin Jones's amendment suggests.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Beth mae'r cynnig hwn yn ceisio ei ddweud? Noda fod y Cabinet wedi methu â chydnewydd anghenion a buddiannau ardaloedd o Gymru sydd y tu allan i Forgannwg. Yna ceisia gysylltu hynny â'r penodiadau i'r Cabinet. Cyflwynodd Peter ei achos bondigrwybwyll y cred pobl y caiff y Cabinet ei lywodraethu gan dde Cymru neu Forgannwg ac, felly, yn esgeuluso buddiannau ardaloedd eraill o Gymru. Gwrthodaf hynny.

Rhoddaf y cynnig ar brawf a'i osod yn erbyn y ffeithiau ffug y ceisiodd Peter eu cyflwyno. Yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, penodais, ar argymhelliad Tom, Enid Rowlands o ogledd Cymru yn gadeirydd y cwango cydradd bwysicaf yng Nghymru—Cyngor Addysg a Hyfforddiant newydd i Gymru. Hefyd, ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, cafodd BAE Systems gymeradwyaeth ar gyfer grant o bron i £20 miliwn a fydd yn creu 1,700 o swyddi ychwanegol yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Yn yr un modd, ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, dyfarnwyd grant o bron i £20 miliwn i GDA Hotpoint i ddiogelu 935 o swyddi ym Modelwyddan. Mae'r grant hwnnw hefyd yn debygol o greu 170 o swyddi ychwanegol.

Wrecsam, gan gynnwys ardal Brymbo a grybwylodd Peter, a dderbyniodd yr unig grant gan y rhaglen Ewropeaidd URBAN a ddyfarnwyd, ac a gaiff ei ddyfarnu, yng Nghymru. Elwodd maestrefi gorllewinol Wrecsam o amgylch Brymbo ar hynny. Yn yr un modd, penodwyd David Pritchard fel penneth Adran Datblygu Economaidd gwasanaeth sifil y Cynulliad. Mae yntau'n Ogleddwr arall a benodwyd i swydd hynod sensitif a phwysig.

Dyna'r math o benderfyniadau y bu'r Cabinet yn gyfrifol amdanynt dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Mae'r penderfyniadau hynny yn rhagddyddio ffurfio'r Cabinet

there is no reason for supposing—

**Richard Edwards:** To pursue a point made earlier by my colleague, Alun Pugh, do you agree that, at the very least, the headquarters of new agencies should be located outside Cardiff? Without being parochial, I suggest Pembrokeshire for the children's commissioner's office.

**The First Minister:** I agree with that principle. I intended to discuss Elin Jones's amendment after dealing with Peter Rogers's original point. He seems to believe that the Cabinet is biased and that it will not make decisions that are favourable to north Wales, in terms of public appointments, resource allocation or battles between authorities or different parts of Wales. He believes that all decisions inevitably go against north Wales. I quoted five examples from the last few weeks demonstrating that that is not true. Those decisions predate the formation of the partnership Cabinet, but they show that the ability of the Labour administration—

partneriaeth, ond nid oes unrhyw reswm dros dybio—

**Richard Edwards:** I fynd ar drywydd pwynt a wnaethpwyd yn gynharach gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Alun Pugh, a gytunwch y dylai pencadlysoedd asiantaethau newydd gael eu lleoli y tu allan i Gaerdydd, o leiaf? Heb fod yn blwyfol, awgrymaf Sir Benfro ar gyfer swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â'r egwyddor honno. Bwriadais drafod gwelliant Elin Jones ar ôl ymdrin â phwynt gwreiddiol Peter Rogers. Ymddengys ei fod yn credu bod y Cabinet yn unochnrog ac na fydd yn gwneud penderfyniadau sydd yn ffafriol i ogledd Cymru, o ran penodiadau cyhoeddus, dyrannu adnoddau neu frwydrau rhwng awdurdodau neu wahanol rannau o Gymru. Cred fod pob penderfyniad yn anochel yn mynd yn erbyn gogledd Cymru. Dyfynnais bum enghraifft o'r ychydig wythnosau diwethaf sydd yn dangos nad yw hynny'n wir. Mae'r penderfyniadau hynny'n rhagddyddio ffurffio'r Cabinet partneriaeth, ond dangosant fod gallu'r weinyddiaeth Lafur—

**Karen Sinclair:** You did not mention Plas Power in Wrexham, which I am pleased about. I am also pleased about the ongoing work at Brymbo. Let it be known and let people rest assured that people are working hard on Brymbo.

**The First Minister:** Yes, indeed. I think that Peter assumes that the decision has been taken not to redevelop the Brymbo site. Nothing could be further from the truth. We are not yet in a position to announce the go-ahead on it, but Peter is wrong to imply that a negative decision has been taken on Brymbo. More work has probably been undertaken by Assembly civil servants on the Brymbo redevelopment than on any other project in Wales over the last 18 months, since the formation of the Assembly. However, it is a knotty issue, and trying to bring it to a successful conclusion is taking much time.

I do not see evidence either that there is any likelihood that the Cabinet, as newly constituted, will show bias against north

**Karen Sinclair:** Ni soniasoch am Plas Power yn Wrecsam, yr wyf yn falch yn ei gylch. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o'r gwaith parhaus ym Mrymbo. Gadewch inni ddweud wrth bobl a'u sicrhau bod pobl yn gweithio'n galed ar Frymbo.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ie, yn wir. Credaf fod Peter yn tybio bod y penderfyniad wedi cael ei gymryd i beidio ag ailddatblygu safle Brymbo. Ni allai unrhyw beth fod ymhellach o'r gwir. Nid ydym eto mewn sefyllfa i gyhoeddi y dylai pethau fynd yn eu blaenau yno, ond mae Peter yn anghywir i awgrymu bod penderfyniad negyddol wedi ei gymryd ar Frymbo. Mae'n debyg yr ymgymherwyd â mwy o waith gan weision sifil y Cynulliad ar ailddatblygu Brymbo nag ar unrhyw brosiect arall yng Nghymru dros y 18 mis diwethaf, ers ffurffio'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae'n fater dyrys, ac mae ceisio ei ddwyn i ben yn llwyddiannus yn cymryd llawer o amser.

Ni welaf dystiolaeth ychwaith bod unrhyw debygolwyd y bydd y Cabinet, ar ei newydd wedd, yn dangos tuedd yn erbyn

Wales, rural Wales or parts of Wales outside Glamorgan and Gwent, which are represented in the Cabinet—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn barod i dderbyn eich dadl na fydd y Cabinet, o reidrwydd, yn peidio â dangos diddordeb mewn materion sydd yn ymwneud â gogledd Cymru. Y broblem a gaf gyda'ch dadl yw'r ffaith eich bod yn dweud na ddylid cael cynrychiolaeth ddaearyddol o fewn eich Cabinet. Yr ydych fel pe baech yn dadlau nad oes angen hynny. Onid yr un ddadl fyddai dweud, yn dilyn y bartneriaeth, nad oes angen cynrychiolwyr o Blaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn eich Cabinet oherwydd y gallai cynrychiolwyr o'r Blaid Lafur gynrychioli eu barn hwy yn ddigonol? Os ydych am wahaniaethu ar unrhyw sail, rhaid ichi wahaniaethu yn ddaearyddol hefyd a dweud bod angen pobl o ogledd Cymru yn y Cabinet i gynrychioli'r materion sydd yn ymwneud â gogledd Cymru. Mae nam deallusol rhesymegol yn y dadleuon yr ydych yn ceisio eu cyflwyno inni.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel rhywun o gefndir diwinyddol, byddwn wastad yn disgwyl ichi fod yn llawer rhy eithafol wrth osod yr egwyddorion hynny yn y maes gwleidyddol. Daw ffactorau gwahanol i mewn i'r pictiwr pan ydych yn dewis Cabinet. Mae elfennau daearyddol o bwys. Mae cydbwysedd rhyw yn ffactor. Nid oes gennym ddewis o ran lliw croen, ac yn y blaen, gan nad oes gennym unrhyw un o leiafrif ethnig yn y Cynulliad. Mae cefndir gyrfaol ac yn y blaen hefyd yn ffactor pan ydych yn dewis pobl ac yn ceisio eu ffítio i'r swydd orau y gallwch. Mae'r holl ffactorau yn y fantol a rhaid ichi ddewis y bobl orau ar gyfer y swyddi. Daw'r ochr wleidyddol i mewn pan ydych yn sefydlu partneriaeth.

Fodd bynnag, ni allwch fod yn eithafol a dewis un ffactor megis daearyddiaeth a dweud bod yn rhaid iddo fod ar draws bob ffactor a'i fod yn bwysicach na'r ffactorau eraill. Dyna'r broblem pan ydych yn eithafol, fel y ceisiasoch fod. Yr ydych yn mynd â rhesymeg yn llawer rhy eithafol, gan gredu bod un ffactor yn llawer pwysicach nag unrhyw ffactor arall.

**Jocelyn Davies:** If the best person for the job

gogledd Cymru, Cymru wledig neu rannau o Gymru y tu allan i Forgannwg a Gwent, a gynrychiolir yn y Cabinet—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am willing to accept your argument that the Cabinet will not, of necessity, fail to show an interest in matters involving north Wales. The problem that I have with your argument is the fact that you say that there should not be geographical representation within your Cabinet. You seem to argue that that is unnecessary. Would it not be the same argument to say that, following the partnership, no representatives of the Liberal Democrat Party are required in your Cabinet as Labour Party representatives could represent their views sufficiently? If you are going to differentiate on any grounds, you must also differentiate geographically and say that people from north Wales are needed in the Cabinet to represent the matters involving north Wales. There is an intellectual logical flaw in the arguments that you are attempting to present to us.

**The First Minister:** As someone from a theological background, I would always expect you to be far too extreme in setting those principles in the political field. Different factors enter the picture when you choose a Cabinet. Geographical elements are important. Gender balance is a factor. We do not have a choice in terms of race and so on, as we do not have any members of a racial minority in the Assembly. Career background and so on is also a factor when you choose people and try to fit them to the job as best you can. All the factors are in the melting pot and you must choose the best people for the jobs. The political side comes in when you establish a partnership.

However, you cannot be extreme and choose one factor such as geography and say that it must cut across all factors and that it is more important than the other factors. That is the problem when you are extreme, as you tried to be. You take reasoning to an extreme, believing that one factor is much more important than any other factor.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Os mai'r person gorau ar

was the prime consideration, can you explain to the nation why Ron Davies remains a back bencher?

**The First Minister:** We do not discuss individual Members when we discuss a Cabinet. It is a waste of the right of intervention on a speech for back-bench opposition Members to pop up suddenly out of nowhere and say, ‘You should have put person x, y or z in the Cabinet.’ Anyone can get up and say, ‘If I was choosing the Cabinet, I would have chosen somebody different.’ Of course you would.

**David Melding:** You said that they were the best people.

**The First Minister:** Everyone has a different view of who is the best person. Jocelyn has made her feelings clear. I do not know what damage she may have done to Ron’s political career with her comment, but that is a matter for others to decide. Everyone will have different opinions. What is important is that the Tories are now deciding to give us a lecture on—

**Nick Bourne:** The Welsh Conservatives.

**The First Minister:** Am I banned from using the word ‘Tories’?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are not banned but, out of courtesy in this Chamber, I have generally observed the position that party groups should follow the description by which they chose to describe themselves in the Standing Orders. The group that sits to my left is the Welsh Conservative group.

**The First Minister:** Fine. If they do not want to be the Tories they can be the Welsh Conservatives. It is staggering that the Welsh Conservatives have now set themselves up as experts on representativeness in Wales—

**Geraint Davies** rose—

4:07 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I will take the intervention in a second. Peter Rogers made

gyfer y swydd oedd y brif ystyriaeth, a allwch esbonio i’r genedl pam bod Ron Davies yn dal i fod ar y meinciau cefn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid ydym yn trafod Aelodau unigol wrth drafod Cabinet. Mae’r arfer i Aelodau’r gwrthbleidiau ar y meinicau cefn godi’n sydyn yn ddirybudd a dweud, ‘Dylech fod wedi rhoi person x, y neu z yn y Cabinet’ yn wastraff o’r hawl i ymyrryd mewn araith. Gall unrhyw un godi a dweud, ‘Pe bawn i yn dewis y Cabinet, byddwn i wedi dewis rhywun gwahanol.’ Wrth gwrs y byddech.

**David Melding:** Dywedasoch mai hwy oedd y bobl orau.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae gan bawb farm wahanol ynglŷn â phwy yw’r person gorau. Gwnaeth Jocelyn ei theimladau’n glir. Ni wn pa niwed y gallai fod wedi’i wneud i yrfa wleidyddol Ron gyda’i sylw, ond mater i eraill ei benderfynu yw hynny. Bydd gan bawb farm wahanol. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw bod y Torïaid bellach yn penderfynu rhoi darlith inni ar—

**Nick Bourne:** Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** A wyf wedi cael fyngwahardd rhag defnyddio’r gair ‘Torïaid’?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydych wedi eich gwahardd ond, allan o gwreisi yn y Siambr hon, yn gyffredinol yr wyf wedi parchu’r safbwyt y dylai grwpiau’r pleidau ddilyn y disgrifiad a ddewiswyd ganddynt i ddisgrifio eu hunain yn y Rheolau Sefydlog. Y grŵp sydd yn eistedd ar y chwith imi yw grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** O’r gorau. Os nad ydynt am fod yn Dorïaid gallant fod yn Geidwadwyr Cymru. Mae’n syfranol bod Ceidwadwyr Cymru bellach wedi penodi eu hunain yn arbenigwyr ar gynrychioldeb yng Nghymru—

**Geraint Davies** a gododd—

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cymeraf yr ymyriad mewn eiliad. Gwnaeth Peter Rogers un o’i

one of his famous points about the Medical Practitioners Union. I must admit that I did not understand his point about the MPU, but I did not understand many of his other points either. I think that the medical practitioners must have given the Tories a triple hypocrisy bypass operation for them to try to lecture the Assembly and the Cabinet of the partnership Government on the nature of representativeness, given that for 10 years, from 1987 to 1997, Wales had to put up with Walker from Worcester, Hunt from Wirral, Redwood from Wokingham and then William from north Richmond. Their only connection with Wales was that a 'W' featured somewhere in their constituency, christian or family name. That does not give you any basis for lecturing anybody on the representativeness of any part of Wales.

**Geraint Davies:** You have taken responsibility for promoting the North, but who will promote the Valleys as nobody in the Cabinet lives in the Valleys?

**The First Minister:** That is an example of classic nationalist nit-picking concerning where the Valleys start and finish. I do not know how closely you have observed the river Taff's geography, but Gwaelod-y-Garth is above the Taff and is, as far as I am aware, a Valleys constituency although the village happens to be in the administrative area of Cardiff. You may say that the Valleys start at the Rhondda, but that is a narrow point of view.

**David Davies:** If the First Minister feels that it is wrong for somebody who comes from England to represent Wales, what does he think of somebody from Scotland representing England?

**The First Minister:** You raise an interesting point about the geographical representativeness of Cabinets. If somebody complained about the British Cabinet and suggested that Scotland and the north-east of England should have half the places in the Cabinet, representing only 8 million people, and that the rest of the UK should have the other half, representing the other 50 million,

bwyntiau enwog am Undeb yr Ymarferwyr Meddygol. Rhaid imi gyfaddef na ddeallais ei bwynt am Undeb yr Ymarferwyr Meddygol, ond ni ddeallais lawer o'i bwyntiau eraill ychwaith. Credaf i'r ymarferwyr meddygol roi llawfeddygaeth ddargyfeiriol driphlyg ar ragrith i'r Torïaid er mwyn iddynt geisio rhoi darlith i'r Cynulliad a Chabinet y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth ar natur cynrychioldeb, o gofio bod Cymru, am 10 mlynedd, o 1987 i 1997, wedi gorfod dioddef Walker o Gaerwrangon, Hunt o Gilgwri, Redwood o Wokingham ac yna William o ogledd Richmond. Eu hunig gyswllt â Chymru oedd yffaith i'r llythyren 'W' ymddangos rhywle yn enw eu hetholaeth, eu henw bedydd neu eu henw teuluol. Ni rydd hynny unrhyw sail ichi dros roi darlith i unrhyw un ar gynrychioldeb unrhyw ran o Gymru.

**Geraint Davies:** Yr ydych wedi cymryd y cyfrifoldeb dros hyrwyddo'r Gogledd, ond pwys fydd yn hyrwyddo'r Cymoedd gan nad oes unrhyw un yn y Cabinet yn byw yn y Cymoedd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae honno yn engrai ffglasurol o holtti blew gan y cenedlaetholwyr ynghylch ble mae'r Cymoedd yn dechrau ac yn gorffen. Ni wn pa mor agos yr ydych wedi astudio daearyddiaeth afon Taf, ond mae Gwaelod-y-Garth yn uwch na'r Taf a, hyd y gwn i, yn un o etholaethau'r Cymoedd er bod y pentref yn digwydd bod o fewn ardal weinyddol Caerdydd. Gallech ddweud bod y Cymoedd yn dechrau yn y Rhondda, ond safbwyt cul yw hwnnw.

**David Davies:** Os teimla'r Prif Weinidog nad yw'n briodol i rywun a ddaw o Loegr gynrychioli Cymru, beth yw ei farn am rywun o'r Alban yn cynrychioli Lloegr?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Codwch bwynt diddorol am gynrychioldeb daearyddol Cabinet. Pe bai rhywun yn cwyno am y Cabinet Prydeinig ac yn awgrymu y dylai'r Alban a gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr gael hanner y lleoedd yn y Cabinet, gan gynrychioli dim ond 8 miliwn o bobl, ac y dylai gweddill y DU gael yr hanner arall, gan gynrychioli'r 50 miliwn arall, byddai'n cael

it would be considered incredibly narrow-minded by everyone. That is a matter of interest to somebody writing a PhD or an idle article to fill up *The Guardian* review page or whatever. However, anyone who tried to present it as a serious political point would be laughed out of court. It would not be taken seriously as a proper political comment. It would be considered narrow-minded to make such a comment. In judging a Cabinet, you consider whether the people concerned are doing a good job and not whether they are in some part of the country that is either over or under-represented in the Cabinet.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. First Minister, you have had 10 minutes.

**The First Minister:** I am sorry, I have hardly made a speech; I have been responding to interventions. Can I beg your indulgence to refer to Elin Jones's amendment? Would that be in order? I do not feel that I have dealt with that.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am afraid that it would not be in order. This is the Welsh Conservative group's time, but you have been generous in responding to interventions.

**The First Minister:** I know, I have been over-generous.

**David Melding:** The First Minister made serious points and I hope to address at least a couple of them, if not to answer them to his satisfaction. As it stands, one-third of the AMs in the groups that make up the Government represent constituencies outside south Wales, by which I mean Glamorgan and Gwent. A little over one-third of the membership of those groups represents north, mid or west Wales. Is the First Minister telling us that not one of those AMs is suitable and of the necessary calibre to be a Cabinet member? I do not believe that. Does the First Minister think that it is satisfactory for every Cabinet member either to represent a Glamorgan constituency or to live in Glamorgan? That cannot be adequate. There are nine members of the Cabinet; one should be from outside that area. I thought that the First Minister sounded shrill in his defence.

ei ystyried gan bawb fel rhywbeth hynod o gul. Mae hynny'n fater o ddiddordeb i rywun sydd yn ysgrifennu PhD neu erthygl wag i lenwi tudalen adolygiad yn *The Guardian* neu beth bynnag. Fodd bynnag, byddai unrhyw un a fyddai'n ceisio ei gyflwyno fel pwynt gwleidyddol difrifol yn cael ei wawdio. Ni châi ei gymryd o ddifrif fel sylw gwleidyddol priodol. Câi ei ystyried yn gul i wneud sylw o'r fath. Wrth feirniadu Cabinet, yr ydych yn ystyried a yw'r bobl dan sylw yn gwneud gwaith da ac nid pa un a ydynt mewn rhyw ran o'r wlad sydd naill ai'n cael ei gorgynrychioli neu ei thangynrychioli yn y Cabinet.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Brif Weinidog, yr ydych wedi cael 10 munud.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, prin fy mod wedi gwneud arraith; bûm yn ymateb i ymyriadau. A allaf erfyn am eich goddefgarwch er mwyn cyfeirio at welliant Elin Jones? A fyddai hynny mewn trefn? Ni theimlaf fy mod wedi delio â hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond ni fyddai hynny mewn trefn. Amser grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yw hwn, ond yr ydych wedi bod yn hael wrth ymateb i ymyriadau.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwn, bûm yn orhael.

**David Melding:** Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog bwyntiau difrifol a gobeithiaf roi sylw i un neu ddu ohonynt o leiaf, os nad eu hateb er boddhad iddo. Fel y mae, mae traean o'r ACau yn y grwpiau sydd yn ffurfio'r Llywodraeth yn cynrychioli etholaethau y tu allan i dde Cymru, ac wrth hynny golygaf Forgannwg a Gwent. Cynrychiola ychydig dros draean o Aelodau'r grwpiau hynny ogledd, canolbarth neu orllewin Cymru. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn dweud wrthym nad oes unrhyw un o'r ACau hynny yn addas ac yn meddu ar y calibr angenrheidiol i fod yn aelod o'r Cabinet? Ni chredaf hynny. A yw'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn ei bod yn fodhaol i bob aelod o'r Cabinet naill ai gynrychioli etholaeth ym Morgannwg neu fyw ym Morgannwg? Ni all hynny fod yn ddigonol. Mae naw aelod o'r Cabinet; dylai un fod o'r tu allan i'r ardal honno. Credais i'r Prif

The reason that a judge would laugh this out of court is because he would never expect it to be in court, and that someone could be so maladroit as not to address this problem and include at least one Cabinet member from another part of Wales.

The Executive is an important institution in devolution; it is easily as important as the Assembly. Some of us believe that the Executive should govern and that the Assembly should scrutinise. That mixture has been muddled and has done damage to the institution but to have no-one in the Executive from outside south Wales is greatly damaging to the overall process and project of devolution. You are naïve if you do not think that people in north Wales resent your actions. I think that you will suffer at the next elections.

**Peter Black:** Although I acknowledge David's points, does he also acknowledge the frustrations of those of us who live in Swansea, which is constantly identified as being part of greater Cardiff?

**David Melding:** I have not mentioned Cardiff in my speech. I said Glamorgan and Gwent, so I extended the comments to all of south Wales.

Rhodri Morgan's predecessor as First Secretary had some geographical balance in his Cabinet, so the principle that you can reject all geographical balance is a fairly new one. Perhaps it was a secret code in the partnership. I would be happy to give way to a Liberal Democrat if that is not the case. Whatever his failings, Alun Michael addressed that need and ensured that all the people, all over Wales, would feel a part of the Assembly and of the Assembly's Executive. The First Minister has ditched that, and I do not think that he can laugh the matter off as if it is not a serious complaint.

The First Minister mentioned the string of English Conservative Secretaries of State that were in Wales from 1987. I say, candidly, that I think that that greatly damaged the

Weinidog amddiffyn hyn yn groch. Y rheswm y byddai barnwr yn gwawdio hyn mewn llys yw oherwydd na fyddai erioed wedi disgwyl iddo fod mewn llys, ac y gallai rhywun fod mor lletchwith â pheiddio â rhoi sylw i'r broblem hon a chynnwys o leiaf un aelod o'r Cabinet o ran arall o Gymru.

Mae'r Weithrediaeth yn sefydliad pwysig mewn datganoli; mae yn hawdd yr un mor bwysig â'r Cynulliad. Cred rhai ohonom mai'r Weithrediaeth ddylai lywodraethu ac mai archwilio ddylai'r Cynulliad ei wneud. Bu'r gymysgedd honno yn ddryslyd a gwnaeth niwed i'r sefydliad ond mae peidio â chael unrhyw un o'r tu allan i dde Cymru yn y Weithrediaeth yn andwyol iawn i'r broses a'r prosiect cyffredinol o ddatganoli. Yr ydych yn naïf os na chredwch fod pobl yng ngogledd Cymru yn teimlo atgasedd tuag at eich gweithredoedd. Credaf y byddwch yn dioddef yn yr etholiadau nesaf.

**Peter Black:** Er fy mod yn cydnabod pwyntiau David, a yw hefyd yn cydnabod rhwystredigaethau'r rheini ohonom sydd yn byw yn Abertawe, a adwaenir yn gyson fel rhan o Gaerdydd fwyaf?

**David Melding:** Nid wyf wedi sôn am Gaerdydd yn fy arraith. Dywedais Morgannwg a Gwent, felly ymestynnais y sylwadau i dde Cymru gyfan.

Yr oedd gan ragflaenydd Rhodri Morgan fel Prif Ysgrifennydd rywfaint o gydbwysedd daearyddol yn ei Gabinet, felly mae'r egwyddor y gallwch ymrthod â phob cydbwysedd daearyddol yn un gymharol newydd. Efallai mai cod cyfrinachol yn y bartneriaeth ydoedd. Byddwn yn barod i ildio i Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol os nad dyna'r sefyllfa. Beth bynnag oedd ei feiau, rhoddodd Alun Michael sylw i'r angen hwnnw a sicrhau y byddai'r holl bobl, ledled Cymru, yn teimlo'n rhan o'r Cynulliad ac o Weithrediaeth y Cynulliad. Cafodd y Prif Weinidog wared ar hynny, ac ni chredaf y gall drin y mater hwn yn ysgafn fel pe na bai'n gŵyn ddifrifol.

Soniodd y Prif Weinidog am y gyfres o Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol Seisnig a fu yng Nghymru o 1987. Dywedaf, yn blwmp ac yn blaen, y credaf i hynny wneud

Conservative Party in Wales. We had exceptionally talented Secretaries of State, and I admired William Hague's work greatly. The First Minister's point that someone can represent an area in which they do not live was valid. Consider all the Secretaries of State for Northern Ireland; it has been a common principle there. The Conservative Party could have appointed one or two Secretaries of State from outside Wales, but appointing a string of them damaged us. The party was reduced to having no Members of Parliament in Wales in 1997, and I assure you, First Minister, that we have learnt that lesson. It is a bitter lesson, and I think that your party and the Liberal Democrat Party will be punished for your attitudes at the next Assembly elections.

Kirsty Williams's view was remarkable. She basically said that the Liberal Democrats did not need to be in the Cabinet to raise concerns day-to-day and that they could see a Cabinet member when they needed to. The trouble is that that Cabinet is forming Executive decisions day-to-day. Kirsty will not be present when it discusses half of those decisions because they will not see the light of day and Kirsty will not know what has been rejected.

**Kirsty Williams:** I do not know about the state of communications within the internal workings of the Welsh Conservative Party, but I assure you that the internal workings of our party will ensure that, if there is something of which we need to be informed, we shall be. It is incumbent on every person in this Chamber, whether they are in or out of the Cabinet, to stand up for their constituencies. To suggest that we cannot do so if we are not in the Cabinet is insulting.

**David Melding:** I am sure that Kirsty Williams is taken as seriously as Peter Black is by Edwina Hart. When he tried to raise this issue in Committee, he was squashed by her. I am not sure how well your communications run, but it is obvious that Cabinet members may not perform well, but take their Executive functions seriously. The Conservative group is not in the Executive and neither is Kirsty. No-one from north, mid

niwed mawr i'r Blaid Geidwadol yng Nghymru. Cawsom Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol arbennig o dalentog, ac edmygais waith William Hague yn fawr. Yr oedd pwynt y Prif Weinidog y gall rhywun gynrychioli ardal nad yw'n byw yn ddi yn ddilys. Ystyriwch yr holl Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol dros Ogledd Iwerddon; bu'n egwyddor gyffredin yno. Gallai'r Blaid Geidwadol fod wedi penodi un neu ddau o Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol o'r tu allan i Gymru, ond gwnaeth penodi un ar ôl y llall niwed inni. Difywiodd y blaidd i fod heb yr un Aelod Seneddol yng Nghymru yn 1997, ac fe'ch sicrhaf, Brif Weinidog, inni ddysgu'r wers honno. Mae'n wers chwerw, a chredaf y cewch chi a Phlaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol eich cosbi am eich agweddau yn ystod etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad.

Yr oedd safbwyt Kirsty Williams yn syfrdanol. Dywedodd fwy neu lai nad oedd angen i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fod yn y Cabinet i godi pryderon yn ddyddiol ac y gallent weld aelod o'r Cabinet pryd bynnag y dynunant. Y drafferth yw bod y Cabinet hwnnw'n gwneud penderfyniadau Gweithrediaeth yn ddyddiol. Ni fydd Kirsty yn bresennol pan fydd yn trafod hanner y penderfyniadau hynny gan na fyddant yn gweld golau dydd ac ni fydd Kirsty yn gwybod beth gafodd ei wrthod.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ni wn am gyflwr cyfathrebu o fewn systemau mewnol Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, ond gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd systemau mewnol ein plaid ni yn sicrhau, os bydd rhywbeth y mae angen inni gael gwybod amdano, y cawn wybod hynny. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar bob person yn y Siambr hon, pa un a ydynt yn rhan o'r Cabinet ai peidio, i amddiffyn eu hetholaethau. Mae awgrymu na allwn wneud hynny os nad ydym yn y Cabinet yn sarhad.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff Kirsty Williams ei chymryd yr un mor ddifrifol ag y cymerir Peter Black gan Edwina Hart. Pan geisiodd godi'r mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor, rhoddodd daw arno. Nid wyf yn siŵr pa mor dda yw eich dulliau cyfathrebu, ond mae'n amlwg na fydd aelodau'r Cabinet yn perfformio'n dda o bosibl, ond eu bod yn cymryd eu swyddogaethau Gweithrediaeth o ddifrif. Nid

or west Wales is in the Executive, and that is a disgrace.

yw'r grŵp Ceidwadol yn rhan o'r Weithrediaeth ac nid yw Kirsty ychwaith. Nid oes unrhyw un o ogles, canolbarth na gorllewin Cymru yn y Weithrediaeth, ac mae hynny'n warthus.

**Nick Bourne:** This debate is about an attitude of Government, not just about whether there are representatives from north, mid and west Wales in the Cabinet. The First Minister, in his response—albeit an abridged response, perhaps that is just as well for the administration—seemed to score a spectacular own goal, when he said that Enid Rowlands was appointed to a key post on the recommendation of Tom Middlehurst. Last time I looked, he was a north Wales Assembly Member in a Cabinet that, at that time, contained a north Wales representative. That point was made forcibly by you, in your speech, on our behalf, First Minister.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud ag agwedd Llywodraeth, nid dim ond pa un a oes cynrychiolwyr o ogles, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru yn y Cabinet. Ymddengys i'r Prif Weinidog, yn ei ymateb—er yn ymateb cryno, ac efallai mai da o beth oedd hynny i'r weinyddiaeth—sgorio gôl anhygoel yn erbyn ei dîm ei hun, pan ddywedodd i Enid Rowlands gael ei phenodi i swydd allweddol ar argymhelliaid Tom Middlehurst. Y tro diwethaf imi edrych, yr oedd ef yn aelod Aelod o'r Cynulliad dros ogles Cymru mewn Cabinet a oedd, ar y pryd, yn cynnwys cynrychiolydd o ogles Cymru. Gwnaethoch y pwynt hwnnw yn gryf, yn eich arraith, ar ein rhan, Brif Weinidog.

4:17 p.m.

The composition of the Cabinet does matter, and this debate is not about disabled people or black or ethnic minorities, so I do not know why that was raised. Neither is the debate about perfect geographic balance; we do not expect that. However, if this Cabinet is based on merit, it is a frightening admission on the First Minister's part that there is nobody from north Wales who he felt able to include in any of the nine portfolios. It is also frightening that the two Liberal Democrats are in the Cabinet on merit; we thought that they were there because they are Liberal Democrats. If they are there on merit, perhaps you would like to confirm that. Is it not true that this Government does not understand Wales outside the M4 corridor?

Mae ots am gyfansoddiad y Cabinet, ac nid yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â phobl anabl neu leiafrifoedd du neu ethnig, felly ni wn pam y codwyd hynny. Nid yw'r ddadl hon ychwaith yn ymwneud â chydbwysedd daearyddol perffaith; ni ddisgwylawn hynny. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r Cabinet hwn yn seiliedig ar haediant, mae'n gyfaddeifiad brawychus ar ran y Prif Weinidog nad oes unrhyw un o ogles Cymru y teimlai y gallai ei gynnwys o fewn unrhyw un o'r naw portffolio. Mae hefyd yn frawychus bod y ddau Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol yn y Cabinet ar haediant; credasom eu bod yno am mai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ydynt. Os mai yno ar eu haediant y maent, efallai yr hoffech gadarnhau hynny. Onid yw'n wir nad yw'r Llywodraeth hon yn deall Cymru y tu allan i goridor yr M4?

The truth is that this Cabinet is a Cardiff city councillor's Cabinet plus a couple of others. It is what you might describe as a 'cappuccino Cabinet', and I hope that that did not offend Ann Jones. It is an urban Cabinet that has no knowledge of what life is like outside Cardiff. It does not understand agriculture, believing, along with David Blunkett, that it is about subsidy junkies. Perhaps it agrees with Christine Gwyther's

Y gwir amdani yw mai Cabinet o gynghorwyr dinas Caerdydd yw'r Cabinet hwn ac un neu ddau o bobl eraill. Mae'n gabinet y gallech ei ddisgrifio fel 'Cabinet cappuccino', a gobeithiaf nad yw hynny'n tramgwyddo Ann Jones. Mae'n Gabinet trefol nad oes ganddo wybodaeth am fywyd y tu allan i Gaerdydd. Nid yw'n deall amaethyddiaeth, gan gredu, ynghyd â David Blunkett, ei fod yn ymwneud â'r rheini sydd

comment that the farmers make no contribution to the national product of Wales. It is a Cabinet that was wrong-footed on the fuel crisis because it did not understand it and thought that it was best dealt with by an urban-based Secretary for the Environment, Planning and Transport rather than by the man who now says that he speaks for north Wales—a sort of governor general add-on to his role as First Minister.

Yes, you made the right decision—eventually—on Broughton, but goodness knows that you had to be brought kicking and screaming to that decision. It was not done quickly, was it First Minister? It was only done after morale was badly damaged and after the workforce at that factory had to concentrate your attention on the issue. The truth is that you were brought to that decision, kicking and screaming, by the opposition parties. If you really understand north Wales, what about Llangollen? If you want to sit there and say that people should consider referendum decisions, what about Llangollen? Was that a grasp of the north Wales situation? If we had a representative from north, mid and west Wales in the Cabinet, that would give a clearer voice to those areas outside the M4 corridor because the truth is that this is all about—

**Karen Sinclair:** As I am the constituency AM for Llangollen, I do not know whether Nick is aware that the opinion poll taken in Llangollen was taken by the town council exclusively for it to formulate its response. It was nothing more, nor less than that.

**Nick Bourne:** I am aware of the fact that this administration has flown in the face of opinion in Llangollen as well as broader Denbighshire. If you are trying to tell me otherwise, I do not agree.

This Government needs to get a grasp of the issues that matter to Wales, and this administration, including Liberal Democrats, is far worse than it was previously, with less of a geographical spread. We do not expect perfect geographical balance, but to suggest

yn gaeth i gymorthdaliadau. Efallai ei fod yn cytuno â sylw Christine Gwyther nad yw ffermwyr yn gwneud cyfraniad tuag at gynnyrch cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'n Gabinet a fethodd gyda'r argyfwng tanwydd gan nad oedd yn ei ddeall ac yn credu ei fod yn well i Ysgrifennydd yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth trefol ddelio ag ef yn hytrach na'r dyn sydd bellach yn dweud ei fod yn siarad ar ran gogledd Cymru—rhyw fath o ychwanegiad llywodraethwr cyffredinol at ei rôl fel Prif Weinidog.

Do, gwnaethoch y penderfyniadau cywir—yn y pen draw—ar Frychdyn, ond dyn a âŵr ichi orfod dod i'r penderfyniad hwnnw dan brotest. Nis gwnaethpwyd yn gyflym, naddo Brif Weinidog? Dim ond ar ôl ergyd wael i ysbryd ac ar ôl i'r gweithlu yn y ffatri honno orfod canolbwytio eich sylw ar y mater y'i gwnaethpwyd. Y gwir amdani yw eich bod wedi cael eich gorfodi i wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, yn erbyn eich ewyllys, gan y gwrthbleidau. Os ydych yn deall gogledd Cymru yn wirioneddol, beth am Langollen? Os ydych am eistedd yno a dweud y dylai pobl ystyried penderfyniadau'r refferendwm, beth am Langollen? A oedd hynny'n dangos gafael ar y sefyllfa yng ngogledd Cymru? Pe bai gennym gynrychiolydd o ogledd, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru yn y Cabinet, byddai hynny'n rhoi llais cliriach i'r ardaloedd hynny y tu allan i goridor yr M4 oherwydd y gwir amdani yw bod hyn yn ymwneud â—

**Karen Sinclair:** Gan mai fi yw'r Aelod etholaeth dros Langollen, ni wn a yw Nick yn ymwybodol i'r arolwg barn a gynhalwyd yn Llangollen gael ei wneud gan gyngor y dref yn benodol er mwyn iddo ffurfio ei ymateb. Nid oedd yn ddim mwy, na llai na hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod y weinyddiaeth hon wedi mynd yn groes i'r farn yn Llangollen yn ogystal â'r Sir Ddinbych ehangach. Os ydych yn ceisio dweud yn wahanol wrthyf, anghytunaf.

Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth hon gael gafael ar y materion sydd o bwys i Gymru, ac mae'r weinyddiaeth hon, gan gynnwys y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn llawer gwaeth nag yr oedd yn flaenorol, gyda llai o rychwant daearyddol. Ni ddisgwylwn

that the absence of anybody from outside the M4 corridor is good news for an all-Wales approach in the Assembly is nonsense. We support Elin Jones's amendment and we wanted to keep the motion short and crisp because we feel that this is the most singular, inept act of management by the First Minister, and adding on north Wales to his responsibilities, as an afterthought, is an insult to all of Wales.

gydbwysedd daearyddol perffaith, ond mae awgrymu bod absenoldeb unrhyw un o'r tu allan i goridor yr M4 yn newyddion da ar gyfer ymagwedd Cymru gyfan yn y Cynulliad yn nonsens. Cefnogwn welliant Elin Jones ac yr oeddem am gadw'r cynnig yn fyr ac yn sionc gan y teimlwn mai dyma'r weithred unigol fwyaf amhriodol o ran rheoli gan y Prif Weinidog, ac mae ychwanegu gogledd Cymru at ei gyfrifoldebau, fel ôl-feddwl, yn sarhad i Gymru gyfan.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 1, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Jane Davidson  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Halford, Alison

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Motion: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Dafis, Cynog

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick

Davies, David	Black, Peter
Davies, Geraint	Butler, Rosemary
Davies, Glyn	Chapman, Christine
Davies, Jocelyn	Davidson, Jane
Graham, William	Davies, Andrew
Jarman, Pauline	Davies, Ron
Jones, Elin	Essex, Sue
Jones, Gareth	Evans, Delyth
Jones, Helen Mary	Feld, Val
Jones, Ieuan Wyn	German, Michael
Lloyd, David	Gibbons, Brian
Melding, David	Gregory, Janice
Morgan, Jonathan	Griffiths, John
Richards, Rod	Gwyther, Christine
Rogers, Peter	Hutt, Jane
Ryder, Janet	Jones, Ann
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Law, Peter
	Lewis, Huw
	Middlehurst, Tom
	Morgan, Rhodri
	Neagle, Lynne
	Pugh, Alun
	Randerson, Jenny
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Gwenda
	Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion rejected.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Jenny Randerson:** I raise a point of order relating to the previous point of order by Ieuan Wyn Jones. I inadvertently gave inaccurate information. I wish to clear this up. The e-mail had dropped a nought. I regret to say that the number of jobs involved was 1,300. I wanted to clarify the accuracy.

**The Presiding Officer:** On that point, I indicated that it was open to Members to request an urgent question for Thursday morning. I can now confirm that I have received such a request. I have communicated it to the Cabinet. I can indicate that I am minded to accept that request. We will either have an urgent question or a statement on Thursday morning on this matter in view of the information that has been conveyed to us.

**Jenny Randerson:** Codaf bwynt o drefn ynglŷn â'r pwynt o drefn blaenorol gan Ieuan Wyn Jones. Drwy amryfusedd, rhoddais wybodaeth anghywir. Hoffwn ddatrys y mater hwn. Yr oedd dim ar goll ar yr e-bost. Mae'n ddrwg gennyl ddweud mai 1,300 oedd nifer y swyddi dan sylw. Yr oeddwn am egluro'r cywirdeb.

**Y Llywydd:** Ar y pwynt hwnnw, nodais ei fod yn agored i Aelodau ofyn cwestiwn brys ar gyfer bore Iau. Bellach gallaf gadarnhau fy mod wedi derbyn cais o'r fath. Yr wyf wedi cyfleu hynny i'r Cabinet. Gallaf nodi fy mod yn bwriadu derbyn y cais hwnnw. Cawn naill ai gwestiwn brys neu ddatganiad fore Iau ar y mater hwn yng ngoleuni'r wybodaeth a gyfleoedd inni.

### **Cyflwyno Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 Introduction of the Care Standards Act 2000**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly welcomes the introduction of the Care Standards Act 2000 (available on the HMSO web site [www.HMSO.gov.uk](http://www.HMSO.gov.uk)) and the new functions provided for the National Assembly*

*i. to act as the single regulator in Wales for social care, childminding and day care for under 8s and independent sector acute health care;*

*ii. to establish the Care Council for Wales to regulate and raise standards in the social care workforce in Wales; and*

*iii. to establish the Children's Commissioner for Wales.*

*the Assembly notes that a programme of secondary legislation will be submitted for National Assembly approval over the next 12 months to give practical effect to the range of new powers provided in the Act.*

It is important that we debate the introduction of the Care Standards Act 2000 in Wales and its many provisions. Social care is one of the most important service areas for which the National Assembly is responsible. A whole spectrum of social services helps to support some of the most vulnerable people in our country to live as independently and safely as possible. Social care has been seen as the poor relation for too long. Social care services are vital for some of the most vulnerable people in our society. We must ensure that they can provide the people of Wales with the best possible care. Dedicated and caring providers and their staff are committed to doing that every day. Standards of care are often good and there are many examples of excellent practice across Wales in all sectors. However, sometimes, accepted standards are not delivered. You know that reports and inquiries have highlighted the weaknesses and failings of the safeguards that aim to protect vulnerable people, particularly children. The most recent and devastating example is the Waterhouse report, which the Assembly has already considered in some depth.

At the heart of the Care Standards Act lies

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu cyflwyno Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (ar gael ar wefan Gwasg ei Mawrhydi [www.HMSO.gov.uk](http://www.HMSO.gov.uk)) a'r swyddogaethau newydd y darparwyd ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*i. i weithredu fel yr unig reoleiddiwr yng Nghymru ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol, gwarchod plant gofal dydd ar gyfer plant o dan 8 oed a gofal iechyd aciwt y sector annibynnol;*

*i. i sefydlu Cyngor Gofal ar gyfer Cymru i reoleiddio a chodi safonau ymhliith y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru; a*

*iii. i sefydlu Comisiynydd Plant ar gyfer Cymru.*

*a bod y Cynulliad yn nodi bod rhaglen o is-ddeddfwriaethau ar gyfer eu cymeradwyo gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cael eu cyflwyno dros y 12 mis nesaf i roi'r ystod o bwerau newydd y mae'r Ddeddf yn eu darparu mewn grym yn ymarferol.*

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn dadlau cyflwyno Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000 yng Nghymru a'i amrywiol ddarpariaethau. Gofal cymdeithasol yw un o'r meysydd gwasanaeth pwysicaf y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyfrifol amdano. Mae sbectwm cyfan o wasanaethau cymdeithasol yn helpu i gefnogi rhai o bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn ein gwlaid i fyw mor annibynnol a diogel â phosibl. Ystyriwyd gofal cymdeithasol yn rhy hir fel eilbeth. Mae gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol yn hanfodol i rai o'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymdeithas. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gallant ddarparwyr ymroddedig a gofalgar a'u staff yn ymrwymedig i wneud hynny bob dydd. Mae safonau gofal yn aml yn dda a cheir llawer o enghreifftiau o arfer gwych ledled Cymru ym mhob sector. Fodd bynnag, weithiau, ni chyflawnir safonau derbyniol. Gwyddoch fod adroddiadau ac ymholiadau wedi amlygu gwendidau a methiannau'r camau diogelwch sydd wedi'u hanelu at ddiogelu pobl ddiamddiffyn, yn arbennig plant. Yr enghraifft frawyches fwyaf diweddar yw adroddiad Waterhouse, y mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi'i ystyried yn eithaf manwl.

Wrth galon y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal mae'r

the concern to drive up standards of care and improve protection not only for the thousands of people who rely on social services, but for children in day care settings and with childminders, as well as patients who use private, acute health services. The public should know that staff who provide crucial services are competent and well trained, that clear quality standards will be set and enforced, and that those in need of most protection are properly safeguarded. The Act will mean that real progress can be made in each of these areas. The fundamental reforms that the Act sets in place are long overdue. The current system fails to provide adequate protection from abuse characterised by lack of consistency, independence and coverage. There is not a professional regulatory body of any kind dedicated to overseeing standards and practice in the social care workforce. The provisions in the Care Standards Act, together with secondary legislation that the Assembly will be asked to approve, will put right these deficiencies. It will deliver modern, comprehensive and effective regulatory arrangements for social care and non-NHS health care in Wales.

The involvement of the Assembly's Health and Social Services Committee from last July in developing the policy for Wales on regulatory form has been crucial. It resulted in broad consensus on the tailoring of requirements for primary legislation impacting on Wales. Delivering distinctive Welsh provisions in the Act from early Assembly policy deliberations is a hallmark of the Act.

**Rod Richards:** You said earlier that the general standard in Wales was good, but that the standards need to be raised. Nobody would dispute that. However, are you not aware that proprietors of residential and nursing homes throughout Wales are desperately worried that the provisions in the Act to change the sizes of rooms, doorways and so on, when the buildings that they are using—often perhaps not having more than 20 patients—are not conducive to such structural changes? If these provisions are rigidly applied, it means that a considerable number of these care homes, residential and

pryder i godi safonau gofal a gwella diogelwch nid yn unig ar gyfer y miloedd o bobl sydd yn dibynnu ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond i blant mewn lleoliadau gofal dydd, a chyda gwarchodwyr plant, yn ogystal â chleifion sydd yn defnyddio gwasanaethau iechyd preifat, aciwt. Dylai'r cyhoedd wybod bod staff sydd yn darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol yn gymwys ac wedi'u hyfforddi'n dda, y pennir ac y gorfodir safonau ansawdd clir, a bod y rheini sydd angen eu diogelu fwyaf yn cael eu diogelu'n gywir. Golyga'r ddeddf y gellir gwneud cynnydd gwirioneddol ym mhob un o'r meysydd hyn. Mae'n hen bryd bod y diwygiadau sylfaenol a sefydlir gan y Ddeddf yn cael eu gweithredu. Nid yw'r system gyfredol yn darparu digon o ddiogelwch rhag cam-drin wedi'i nodweddu gan ddiffyg cysondeb, annibyniaeth a chwmpas. Nid oes unrhyw fath o gorff rheoleiddio proffesiynol penodedig er mwyn goruchwyllo safonau ac arfer yn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd darpariaethau'r Ddeddf Safonau Gofal, ynghyd â'r is-ddeddfwriaeth y gofynnir i'r Cynulliad ei chymeradwyo, yn unioni'r diffygion hyn. Bydd yn cyflwyno trefniadau rheoleiddio modern, cynhwysfawr ac effeithiol ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol a gofal iechyd nad yw'n ofal iechyd yr NHS yng Nghymru.

Mae rhan Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y Cynulliad ers Gorffennaf diwethaf mewn datblygu'r polisi ar gyfer Cymru ar ffurf rheoleiddiol wedi bod yn holl bwysig. Ei ganlyniad oedd consensws cyffredinol ar deilwra gofynion deddfwriaeth sylfaenol sydd yn effeithio ar Gymru. Mae cyflwyno darpariaethau Cymreig unigryw yn y Ddeddf o benderfyniadau polisi cynnar y Cynulliad yn un o nodweddion y Ddeddf.

**Rod Richards:** Dywedasoch yn gynharach fod y safon cyffredinol yng Nghymru yn dda, ond bod angen codi'r safonau. Ni fyddai unrhyw un yn amau hynny. Fodd bynnag, onid ydych yn ymwybodol fod perchenogion cartrefi preswyl a nrysio drwy Gymru yn pryderu'n fawr bod darpariaethau yn y Ddeddf i newid maint ystafelloedd, drysau ac ati, pan na fydd newidiadau strwythurol o'r fath yn gydnaws â'r adeiladau a ddefnyddiant—sydd yn aml o bosibl heb fod â mwy nag 20 o gleifion? Os cymhwysir y darpariaethau hyn yn llym, golyga y bydd yn rhaid i nifer sylweddol o'r cartrefi gofal, preswyl a nrysio hyn gau. Dyna a allai

nursing, will have to close down. That could be the consequence of rigid application of what are otherwise perfectly good and sensible measures.

4:27 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** I will refer to that issue in my speech and I am sure that it will be raised in the discussion as well.

The Care Standards Act will raise the standards of care provided for those who use the care system. The aim is that whatever care service is delivered, people can be assured that the care will be safe, will meet proper quality standards and will be delivered by skilled and competent staff.

One of the Assembly's most important priorities, now given statutory force by the Act, has been the establishment of an independent children's commissioner for Wales. The Health and Social Services Committee, supported by the Pre-16 Education Committee, has been vital in the development of the Assembly's policy for this office, together with all the organisations who contributed to the consultation process.

An initial Commencement Order to establish the office and to progress necessary practical arrangements has been introduced and is due to come into force on 13 November. Notification has been given of regulations governing the appointment arrangements and it is anticipated that they will come into force before Christmas, to enable an appointment to be formally made as soon as possible.

The recruitment and selection process has begun with the setting up of the Assembly appointment advisory committee, which is, again, a cross-party committee. The office has been advertised. I hope that you have seen it in the press. The deadline for applications is 6 November.

Further secondary legislation is being worked up to commence and inform the commissioner's core functions under the Act, which we expect to bring forward in the spring. The Assembly's policy, which is endorsed by all political parties, is to establish a commissioner with wide-ranging

ddeillio o ganlyniad cymhwysol llym yr hyn sydd fel arall yn gamau da a synhwyrol iawn.

**Jane Hutt:** Cyfeiriaf at y mater hwnnw yn fy araih ac yr wylf yn siŵr y caiff ei godi yn y drafodaeth hefyd.

Bydd y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal yn codi'r safonau gofal a ddarperir ar gyfer y rheini sydd yn defnyddio'r system gofal. Y nod yw pa bynnag wasanaeth a gyflwynir, y gellir sicrhau pobl y bydd y gofal yn ddiogel, yn cwrdd â safonau gofal priodol ac yn cael ei gyflwyno gan staff medrus a chymwys.

Un o flaenoriaethau pwysicaf y Cynulliad, y rhoddir grym statudol iddo gan y Ddeddf, fu sefydlu comisiynydd plant annibynnol i Gymru. Bu'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, gyda chefnogaeth y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16, yn allweddol wrth ddatblygu polisi'r Cynulliad ar gyfer y swydd hon, ynghyd â'r holl sefydliadau a gyfrannodd at y broses ymgynghori.

Cyflwynwyd Gorchymyn Cychwyn cychwynnol i sefydlu'r swydd ag i fynd ymlaen â'r trefniadau ymarferol angenreidiol a daw i rym ar 13 Tachwedd. Rhoddir hysbysiad o'r rheoliadau sydd yn rheoli'r trefniadau penodi a rhagwelir y dônt i rym cyn y Nadolig, er mwyn galluogi i benodiad gael ei wneud yn ffurfiol cyn gynted â phosibl.

Mae'r broses recriwtio a dethol wedi dechrau gyda sefydlu pwyllgor ymgynghorol penodi'r Cynulliad, sydd, eto, yn bwylgor trawsbleidiol. Hysbysebwyd y swydd. Gobeithiaf ichi ei gweld yn y wasg. Y dyddiad cau ar gyfer ceisiadau yw 6 Tachwedd.

Mae deddfwriaeth eilaidd bellach yn cael ei ffurfi i ddechrau a llywio swyddogaethau craidd y comisiynydd o dan y Ddeddf, y disgwyliwn ei chyflwyno yn y gwanwyn. Polisi'r Cynulliad, a gymeradwyir gan bob plaid wleidyddol, yw sefydlu comisiynydd gyda chwmpas eang, yn cwmpasu pob plentyn yng

scope, covering all children in Wales, whose powers extend across different sectors. I note that two amendments have been tabled on this issue. These are entirely consistent with the Assembly's policy in this matter and I am content to accept them. We are determined to secure a legislative opportunity to widen the commissioner's statutory powers as soon as possible. The First Minister has written to the Secretary of State for Wales on this issue and discussions are ongoing.

It is important to note that in social care, staff are our most important asset. The Act gives Wales important new opportunities to raise standards in its social care workforce. The Act establishes a new Assembly sponsored public body called the Care Council for Wales/Cyngor Gofal Cymru. It will have two key tasks, to regulate the social care workforce in Wales and to improve levels of training and qualifications where necessary. It will start work on 1 October 2001. The council's first job will be to set the standards for social care. There will be a code of practice and conduct for social care workers. There will also be a code of practice for employers, which will require them to have effective complaints and disciplinary procedures to ensure that if people are found to be unsuitable, they are removed and do not reappear elsewhere in another home or in another part of the country.

The council will also be responsible for registering individual workers. This will be an important new lever in improving quality and raising public confidence. In Wales, it will be for the National Assembly to determine how this opportunity is used. With a diverse and dedicated social care workforce of at least 60,000, most of whom have no qualifications, there will have to be a phasing-in of registration.

My paper to the Health and Social Services Committee last month proposed that registration of the workforce would begin in 2002, and would be completed over four or five years. In most cases, we do not intend to wait until all these staff are qualified before they are registered. Whether or not applicants are qualified, the Care Council will be under a duty to refuse entry to the register to those

Nghymru, gyda'i bwerau yn ymestyn ar draws gwahanol sectorau. Nodaf y cyflwynwyd dau welliant ar y mater hwn. Mae'r rhain yn holol gyson â pholisi'r Cynulliad ar y mater hwn ac yr wyf yn fodlon eu derbyn. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o sicrhau cyfle deddfwriaethol i ehangu pwerau statudol y comisiynydd cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ysgrifennu at Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynglŷn â'r mater hwn ac mae trafodaethau'n mynd rhagddynt.

Mae'n bwysig nodi mewn gofal cymdeithasol, mai staff yw ein hased bwysicaf. Rhydd y Ddeddf gylleoedd newydd pwysig i Gymru godi safonau ei gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol. Sefydla'r Ddeddf gorff cyhoeddus newydd a noddir gan y Cynulliad o'r enw Cyngor Gofal Cymru. Bydd ganddo ddu orchwyl allweddol, rheoleiddio'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a gwella lefelau hyfforddiant a chymwysterau lle bo angen. Bydd yn dechrau ar ei waith ar 1 Hydref 2001. Gorchwyl cyntaf y cyngor fydd gosod y safonau ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd cod ymarfer ac ymddygiad ar gyfer gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd cod ymarfer hefyd ar gyfer cyflogwyr, a fydd yn gofyn iddynt gael gweithdrefnau cwyno a disgyblu effeithiol i sicrhau y ceir gwared ar bobl os canfyddir eu bod yn anaddas ac na fyddant yn ailymddangos rywle arall mewn cartref arall neu mewn rhan arall o'r wlad.

Bydd y cyngor hefyd yn gyfrifol am gofrestru gweithwyr unigol. Bydd hyn yn ddull newydd pwysig o wella ansawdd a chynyddu hyder y cyhoedd. Yng Nghymru, y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fydd yn penderfynu sut i ddefnyddio'r cyfle hwn. Gyda gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol amrywiol ac ymroddedig o 60,000 o leiaf, y rhan fwyaf ohonynt heb unrhyw gymwysterau, bydd angen cyflwyno'r cofrestru fesul cam.

Cynigiodd fy mhapur i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fis diwethaf y byddai cofrestru'r gweithlu yn dechrau yn 2002, ac yn cael ei gwblhau dros bedair neu bum mlynedd. Yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, nid ydym yn bwriadu aros nes i'r holl staff hyn fod yn gymwys cyn iddynt gael eu cofrestru. Pa un a yw ymgeiswyr yn gymwys ai peidio, bydd yn ddyletswydd ar y Cyngor Gofal i wrthod

who are unsuitable and it will have powers to suspend or remove from the register in cases of misconduct, bad practice, negligence or abuse.

We are determined that people who use social care services in Wales should be able to rely on a workforce that is properly trained, appropriately qualified and effectively regulated. The present levels of training and qualifications in the social care workforce are low. We will use the National Assembly's new powers in the Act to improve this situation.

The Act also establishes the Care Standards Inspectorate, which will regulate the organisations providing care services. It will be a new Assembly division from April 2002. It will regulate social care and non-NHS acute health services.

As the Royal Commission on long-term care, chaired by Sir Stewart Sutherland recommended, the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales will report to the public on the provision of long-term care and have a duty under section 8 of the Act to encourage higher quality in that sector. It will be responsible for regulating the full range of social care services. The inspectorate will regulate thousands of care homes in Wales, accommodating around 15,000 vulnerable people. That will include, for the first time, care homes run by local authorities, which have until now been exempt. The Care Standards Inspectorate will provide a single all-Wales regulation system and will remove the inconsistency and inefficiencies of the current system. Instead of the 27 different authorities currently responsible for regulating care homes, there will be one national body, providing a much more coherent and consistent service, to the benefit of care home owners and their residents.

For the first time, care provided to people in their own homes will be subject to statutory regulation. The Act also breaks new ground by providing that private and voluntary hospitals will, for the first time ever in this country, be subject to a tough, proper and

cynnwys y rheini sydd yn anaddas ar y gofrestr a bydd ganddo'r pwerau i atal neu gael gwared ar bobl oddi ar y gofrestr mewn achosion o gamymddwyn, ymarfer gwael, esgeulustod neu gam-drin.

Yr ydym yn benderfynol y dylai pobl sydd yn defnyddio gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru allu dibynnu ar weithlu sydd wedi'i hyfforddi'n gywir, gyda'r cymwysterau priodol ac a reoleiddir yn effeithiol. Mae lefelau presennol hyfforddiant a chymwysterau yn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn isel. Byddwn yn defnyddio pwerau newydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn y Ddeddf i wella'r sefyllfa hon.

Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd yn sefydlu'r Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal, fydd yn rheoleiddio'r sefydliadau sydd yn darparu gwasanaethau gofal. Bydd yn is-adran newydd o'r Cynulliad o Ebrill 2002. Bydd yn rheoleiddio gofal cymdeithasol a gwasanaethau iechyd aciwt nad ydynt yn rhan o'r NHS.

Yn dilyn argymhelliaid y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar ofal hir dymor, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Syr Stewart Sutherland, bydd Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru yn cyflwyno adroddiad i'r cyhoedd ar ddarpariaeth gofal hir dymor a bydd ganddi ddyletswydd o dan adran 8 y Ddeddf i annog ansawdd uwch yn y sector hwnnw. Bydd yn gyfrifol am reoleiddio'r ystod lawn o wasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd yr arolygiaeth yn rheoleiddio miloedd o gartrefi gofal yng Nghymru, sydd yn cynnwys tua 15,000 o bobl ddiamddiffyn. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys, am y tro cyntaf, gartrefi gofal a gaiff eu rhedeg gan awdurdodau lleol, sydd hyd yma wedi cael eu heithrio. Bydd yr Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal yn darparu un system reoleiddio ar gyfer Cymru gyfan ac yn cael gwared ar anghysondebau ac aneffeithlonwydd y system gyfredol. Yn hytrach na'r 27 o awdurdodau gwahanol sydd yn gyfrifol am reoleiddio cartrefi gofal ar hyn o bryd, bydd un corff cenedlaethol, yn darparu gwasanaeth llawer mwy cydlynus a chyson, er budd perchenogion cartrefi gofal a'u preswylwyr.

Am y tro cyntaf, bydd y gofal a ddarperir i bobl yn eu cartrefi eu hunain yn destun rheoliad statudol. Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd yn torri tir newydd drwy ddarparu y bydd ysbytai preifat a gwirfoddol, am y tro cyntaf erioed yn y wlad hon, yn destun system reoliadol lem, briodol ac

effective system of regulation.

I now turn to children's homes. We are all too aware of the appalling cases where children have been abused by the very people who are supposed to care for them. The new inspectorate will have significant responsibilities for safeguarding children. All types of children's homes will be regulated and subjected to rigorous inspections, including, for the first time, private children's homes for fewer than four children. Regulations to be submitted to the Assembly for approval under the Act will remove the exemption for small children's homes.

I now turn to early-years care and childminding. On regulation of day care for children under eight and childminding, the Health and Social Services Committee and Pre-16 Education Committee agreed last October that the Assembly will regulate welfare and care issues. That will be in partnership with Estyn, who will continue to inspect educational aspects of early-years education in Wales. There will be a formal protocol setting out the partnership arrangements between the Care Standards Inspectorate and Estyn.

The Act also introduces, for the first time, regulatory regimes for fostering agencies, for residential family centres and for the work of voluntary adoption agencies. The Act gives the National Assembly the powers to set national minimum standards in Wales to secure greater consistency in the regulation of services. Over the next 18 months, we will need to develop about 15 sets of standards covering services from homes for older people and independent hospitals to adoption and childminding for our youngest children. In addition, for the first time, the law will enable these standards to be enforced even-handedly in both the public and independent sectors. That will be an important responsibility. It is a major new opportunity for the Assembly to be clear about what it expects for those vulnerable children and adults who live in homes and use other care services. I would like to think that in approaching that task there will be one simple test: what standards would we expect for our elderly parents, our own young children, or our relatives who have

effeithiol.

Trof yn awr at gartrefi plant. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol iawn o'r achosion gwarthus lle y cafodd plant eu cam-drin gan yr union bobl oedd i fod i ofalu amdanynt. Bydd gan yr arolygiaeth newydd gyfrifoldebau sylweddol dros ddiogelu plant. Caiff pob math o gartrefi plant eu rheoleiddio a byddant yn destun arolygiadau trylwyr, gan gynnwys, am y tro cyntaf, cartrefi plant preifat ar gyfer llai na phedwar o blant. Bydd rheoliadau sydd i'w cyflwyno i'r Cynulliad i'w cymeradwyo o dan y Ddeddf yn cael gwared ar yr eithriad ar gyfer cartrefi plant bach.

Trof yn awr at ofal blynnyddoedd cynnar a gwarchod plant. O ran rheoleiddio gofal dydd ar gyfer plant o dan wyth a gwarchod plant, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 fis Hydref diwethaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn rheoleiddio materion lles a gofal. Bydd hynny mewn partneriaeth ag Estyn, a fydd yn parhau i arolygu agweddau addysgol addysg blynnyddoedd cynnar yng Nghymru. Bydd protocol ffurfiol yn nodi'r trefniadau partneriaeth rhwng yr Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal ac Estyn.

Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd, am y tro cyntaf, yn cyflwyno systemau rheoleiddio ar gyfer asiantaethau maethu, canolfannau preswyl i deuluoedd a gwaith asiantaethau mabwysiadu gwirfoddol. Rhydd y Ddeddf bwerau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bennu isafswm safonau cenedlaethol yng Nghymru i sicrhau gwell cysondeb o ran rheoleiddio gwasanaethau. Dros y 18 mis nesaf, bydd angen inni ddatblygu tua 15 set o safonau yn cwmpasu gwasanaethau o gartrefi i bobl hŷn ac ysbytai annibynnol i fabwysiadu a gwarchod plant ar gyfer ein plant ieuengaf. Yn ogystal, am y tro cyntaf, bydd y gyfraith yn galluogi'r safonau hyn i gael eu gweithredu'n gyson yn y sectorau cyhoeddus ac annibynnol. Bydd hynny'n gyfrifoldeb pwysig. Mae'n gyfle newydd mawr i'r Cynulliad fod yn glir ynghylch yr hyn a ddisgwylia ar gyfer y plant a'r oedolion diamdiffyn hynny sydd yn byw mewn cartrefi ac yn defnyddio gwasanaethau gofal eraill. Hoffwn feddwl wrth fynd ati i gyflawni'r gorchwyl hwnnw y bydd un prawf syml: pa safonau y byddem yn eu disgwyl ar gyfer ein rhieni sydd mewn oed, neu ein plant ifanc ein hunain, neu ein perthnasau

disabilities?

The standards must have regard to what is sensible, what can be achieved and what can be afforded. We will need to strike the right balance between promoting quality of care for service users, and at the same time giving providers a realistic opportunity to make improvements. We may conclude, for instance, that older people may not wish to share their bedroom with a total stranger. However, we will need to bear in mind that—with the best will in the world—reducing the numbers of shared rooms in a home will take time and money. We will need to be particularly sensitive to the situation in smaller homes, and be careful not to drive all our older people into larger establishments because of the way we set our standards.

I know that some Members are aware of a statement on 21 July by the Minister of State for Health, John Hutton, announcing decisions on some of the standards in England. That statement dealt with room and door sizes, and just a handful of other physical standards. That announcement for England does not apply to Wales and does not affect the situation in Wales. We have not made a similar announcement in Wales. We believe that the national minimum standards need to deal, as a whole, with everything that affects the quality of life for service users, not just the physical environment in which they live. It is important that we work through the standards group that we have established with representatives of proprietors. We intend to stick to this plan to bring forward a complete set of standards for consideration around the turn of the year. The final standards must be as a result of our discussion.

Today I met the independent sector providers. I heard their concerns and I understand that this is a time of uncertainty for them. I am looking closely at the impact of any new standards, especially on smaller homes and in rural areas where there may be few alternatives. Care Forum Wales has asked that we work with the care industry to determine sensible arrangements through consultation. That is exactly what we propose to do. The first meeting of the external reference group on national

sydd ag anableddau?

Rhaid i'r safonau ystyried yr hyn sydd yn synhwyrol, beth y gellir ei gyflawni a beth y gellir ei fforddio. Bydd angen inni gael y cydbwysedd cywir rhwng hyrwyddo ansawdd gofal ar gyfer defnyddwyr gwasanaeth, ac ar yr un pryd roi cyfle realistig i ddarparwyr wneud gwelliannau. Gallwn ddod i'r casgliad, er enghraift, na fydd pobl hŷn o bosibl yn dymuno rhannu eu hastafell wely gyda dieithryn. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen inni gadw mewn cof—gyda'r bwriadau gorau—y bydd lleihau nifer yr ystafelloedd a rennir mewn cartref yn cymryd amser ac arian. Bydd angen inni fod yn arbennig o sensitif i'r sefyllfa mewn cartrefi llai, a bod yn ofalus i beidio ag anfon ein pobl hŷn i gyd i sefydliadau mwy oherwydd y ffordd yr ydym yn gosod ein safonau.

Gwn fod rhai Aelodau yn ymwybodol o ddatganiad ar 21 Gorffennaf gan y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Iechyd, John Hutton, yn cyhoeddi penderfyniadau ar rai o'r safonau yn Lloegr. Ymdriniodd y datganiad hwnnw â maint ystafelloedd a drysau, a llond llaw yn unig o safonau ffisegol eraill. Nid yw'r cyhoeddiad hwnnw yn Lloegr yn berthnasol i Gymru ac nid yw'n effeithio ar y sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Nid ydym wedi gwneud cyhoeddiad tebyg yng Nghymru. Credwn fod angen i'r isafswm safonau cenedlaethol ddelio, yn gyfan gwbl, â phopeth sydd yn effeithio ar ansawdd bywyd defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, nid dim ond yr amgylchedd ffisegol y maent yn byw ynddo. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gweithio drwy'r grŵp safonau a sefydlwyd gennym gyda chynrychiolwyr perchenogion. Bwriadwn lynnau at y cynllun hwn er mwyn cyflwyno set gyflawn o safonau i'w hystyried tua diwedd y flwyddyn. Rhaid i'r safonau terfynol ddeillio o'n trafodaeth.

Cyfarfum heddiw â darparwyr y sector annibynnol. Gwrandewais ar eu pryerdon a deallaf fod hon yn adeg o ansicrwydd iddynt. Yr wyf yn edrych yn fanwl ar effaith unrhyw safonau newydd, yn enwedig ar gartrefi llai ac mewn ardaloedd gwledig lle nad oes llawer o ddewisidaau eraill, o bosibl. Mae Fforwm Gofal Cymru wedi gofyn inni weithio gyda'r diwydiant gofal i benderfynu ar drefniadau synhwyrol drwy ymgynghori. Dyna'n union y bwriadwn ei wneud. Cynhelir cyfarfod cyntaf y grŵp cyfeirio allanol ar safonau cenedlaethol yn

standards will be held in the next few weeks and the group will help us to take forward our commitment to work closely with the sector—

4:37 p.m

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had over 10 minutes.

**Jane Hutt:** I have finished. Thank you.

**David Lloyd:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi mai dim ond pwerau statudol cyfyngedig a chychwynnol a roddir i'r Comisiynydd Plant gan ddarpariaethau'r Ddeddf Safonau Gofal.*

Datganaf fuddiant fel arfer fel meddyg a chyngorydd sir. Diolchaf i Jane am ei chyfraniad ac am dderbyn y gwelliannau. Yn naturiol, croesawn y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000, yn enwedig yr hyblygrwydd i ni yng Nghymru ddeddfu, o dan ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd, i addasu penderfyniadau cynradd i ofynion Cymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig er mwyn i ni gael y penderfyniadau gorau i Gymru, i gael comisiynydd plant â phwerau llawn i ofalu am holl blant Cymru—bydd Helen Mary yn siarad am hynny yn y man—a Chyngor Gofal i Gymru a fydd yn hyrwyddo delwedd a safonau gweithwyr cymdeithasol ein gwlad. Mae hefyd yn bwysig cael y gallu i addasu penderfyniadau ynglŷn â chartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nrysio, gyda phwyslais ar ansawdd y gofal. Mae Rod wedi gadael, ond dyna oedd ei bwynt ef hefyd.

Wedi inni gytuno ei bod yn bwysig gwella ansawdd y gofal, rhaid ystyried safonau, fel y crybwylodd Jane, ynglŷn â maint ystafelloedd mewn cartrefi preswyl a faint ohonynt sydd yn ystafelloedd sengl neu ddwbl. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein safonau yn y maes hwn yn addas i ofynion cartrefi Cymru, gan gofio'r gofynion mewn perthynas â'r iaith Gymraeg, ein cymunedau a'r nifer o gartrefi bach sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Mae angen strategaeth synhwyrol o ganlyniad i ymgynghori â'r sawl sydd yn rhedeg ein cartrefi preswyl.

Mae adroddiad y Comisiwn Brehinol ar ofal

ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf a bydd y grŵp yn ein cynorthwyo i symud ymlaen â'n hymrwymiad i gydweithio'n agos â'r sector—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael dros 10 munud.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf wedi gorffen. Diolch.

**David Lloyd:** I propose amendment 1. Add at the end of the motion:

*The National Assembly notes that the Care Standards Act furnishes only limited and initial statutory powers to the Children's Commissioner.*

I declare an interest as usual as a doctor and a county councillor. I thank Jane for her contribution and for accepting the amendments. Naturally, we welcome the Care Standards Act 2000, especially the flexibility for us in Wales to legislate, under secondary legislation, to modify primary decisions to Wales's needs. That is important so that we get the best decisions for Wales, to get a children's commissioner to care for all children in Wales—Helen Mary will talk about that shortly—and a Care Council for Wales that will promote the image and standards of our country's social workers. It is also important to have the ability to modify decisions on residential homes and nursing homes, with the emphasis on the standard of care. Rod has left, but that was his point also.

Once we have agreed that it is important to improve the standard of care, we must consider standards, as Jane mentioned, regarding room size in residential homes and how many of them are single or double rooms. We must ensure that our standards in this field are appropriate to the needs of the homes in Wales, keeping in mind the requirements in relation to the Welsh language, our communities and the number of small homes that we have in Wales. We need a sensible strategy resulting from consultation with those who run our homes.

The report of the Royal Commission on long-

tymor hir am yr henoed hefyd yn bwysig wrth drafod safonau gofal mewn cartrefi preswyl. Yn ôl y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar ofal tymor hir, dylai'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru fod yn achub ar y cyfle i sefydlu canllawiau asesu cenedlaethol ar gyfer gofal personol. Dylid asesu gofal personol a sicrhau ei fod o'r un safon â gofal nyrso. Byddai canllawiau asesu cenedlaethol o'r fath yn sicrhau bod gan unigolion yr hawl i gael yr un defnydd o'r un gofal lle bynnag y maent yn byw. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cofio argymhellion y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar ofal tymor hir am yr henoed.

I gloi, mae Plaid Cymru'n croesawu'r Mesur hwn a fydd yn rheoli gofal ar draws y sectorau i gyd, fel y dywedodd Jane. Bydd yn rheoli gofal ac yn gwella safonau gofal. Galwn, felly, ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod y rhannau o'r Ddeddf sydd angen eu haddasu ar gyfer dibenion unigryw Cymru yn cael eu haddasu.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I welcome the measures that the Care Standards Act will introduce. I remember soberly that the last Tory Government was of a mind to consider deregulation. I have said that before in this Chamber and I make no apologies for repeating it. There was a move to deregulate play schemes, which was shelved after the dreadful events at Dunblane. I am sure that none of us would like to even consider deregulating any services to children, whether they are short-term play schemes or whatever.

I would like to concentrate on two issues. I want to mention the statutory guidance on local authority charging the home care services. If there has to be charging, I welcome this. However, will this embrace guidance on social security benefits? I am concerned that there are no guidelines, for example, for the means testing of attendance allowances, which, of course, is a non-means-testable benefit. If we are to issue guidelines, they must include guidance on social security benefits.

I will ask some questions from the perspective of local government. Given the detailed secondary legislation required—I understand that about 40 Orders are

term care for the elderly is also important as we discuss the standard of care in homes. According to the Royal Commission on long-term care, the Government in Wales should take the opportunity to set up national care standards for personal care. There is a need to assess personal care and ensure that that is of the same standard as nursing care. Such national assessment guidelines would ensure that individuals have the right to the same access to the same care wherever they live. It is important that we remember the recommendations of the Royal Commission on the long-term care of the elderly.

To close, Plaid Cymru welcomes this Bill, which will control care across all of the sectors, as Jane said. It will manage care and improve care standards. We therefore call on the Government of Wales to ensure that those parts of the Act that need to be modified for the unique purposes of Wales are so modified.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Croesawaf y mesurau y bydd y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal yn eu cyflwyno. Cofiaf yn sobr i'r Llywodraeth Dorïaid ddiwethaf fwriadu ystyried dadreoleiddio. Yr wyf wedi dweud hynny droeon yn y Siambra hon ac nid ymddiheuraf am ei ailadrodd. Yr oedd cam i ddadreoleiddio cynlluniau chwarae, ond rhoddwyd stop ar hynny yn dilyn y digwyddiadau erchyll yn Dunblane. Yr wyf yn sier na fyddai un ohonom am hyd yn oed ystyried dadreoleiddio unrhyw wasanaethau i blant, boed yn gynlluniau chwarae byr dymor neu beth bynnag.

Hoffwn ganolbwytio ar ddau fater. Hoffwn sôn am yr arweiniad statudol ar awdurdodau lleol yn codi tâl ar y gwasanaethau gofal cartref. Os oes rhaid codi tâl, croesawaf hyn. Fodd bynnag, a fydd hyn yn cynnwys arweiniad ar fudd-daliadau nawdd cymdeithasol? Pryderaf nad oes unrhyw ganllawiau, er enghraifft, ar osod prawf modd ar lwfansau gweini, nad ydynt, wrth gwrs, yn fudd-daliadau prawf modd. Os cyhoeddwn ganllawiau, rhaid iddynt gynnwys arweiniad ar fudd-daliadau nawdd cymdeithasol.

Gofynnaf rai cwestiynau o bersbectif llywodraeth leol. O gofio'r is-ddeddfwriaeth fanwl sydd yn ofynnol—deallaf fod tua 40 o Orchmyntion dan sylw—a yw'r terfyn amser, sef

involved—is the timescale of April 2002 a realistic one? What is the timetable for developing the minimum national standard for services? What will happen to staff currently in regulatory posts who do not wish to transfer to the Care Standards Inspectorate in Wales—will they make themselves redundant? What obligations will the employing authorities have towards them? What additional resources will be made available to local authority training departments to meet the major implications for workforce skill development and training? How will the cost of this for the independent sector also be met? How will the relationship between the new regulatory body and local authority complaints and local authority commissioning units be defined? I know that Jane will seek to answer these questions, which relate to important issues, in due course.

**David Melding:** The Welsh Conservative Party welcomes the Care Standards Act 2000. The aspiration to drive up the standards of social care to the highest available is an excellent public policy, which we support completely. Appropriate standards that are enforceable by public agencies are necessary, and in no way would we support a policy that would move backwards from that commitment.

I will focus my remarks on the independent care sector because Dai Lloyd has already talked about the children's commissioner and I believe that Helen Mary Jones will also do that later. We support the amendments. I have commented on the children's commissioner in the past and I will not repeat them now. The independent care sector is sometimes overlooked, or at least omitted from our discussions. It is appropriate for us to reflect on how vital that sector is. People often think that it is part of the private sector, which is true of some of the provision. However, a lot of the care is provided by voluntary organisations, not for profit organisations and organisations that offer neighbourhood services accustomed and centred on the needs of a particular community. It is important that this sector is maintained and developed. It currently provides 25,000 residential places, which is a huge amount of the capacity available in Wales. If we do anything to endanger a

Ebrill 2002, yn un realistig? Beth yw'r terfyn amser ar gyfer datblygu'r isafswm safon cenedlaethol ar gyfer gwasanaethau? Beth fydd yn digwydd i staff sydd ar hyn o bryd mewn swyddi rheoleiddiol nad ydynt yn dymuno trosglwyddo i Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru—a fyddant yn diswyddo eu hunain? Pa ddyletswyddau fydd gan yr awdurdodau sydd yn eu cyflogi tuag atynt? Pa adnoddau ychwanegol fydd ar gael i adrannau hyfforddi awdurdodau lleol i gwrdd â'r goblygiadau mawr o ran datblygu sgiliau a hyfforddi'r gweithlu? Sut y caiff cost hyn ar gyfer y sector annibynnol ei chwrdd? Sut y diffinnir y berthynas rhwng y corff rheoleiddio newydd ac unedau cwynion awdurdodau lleol ac unedau comisiynau awdurdodau lleol? Gwn y bydd Jane yn ceisio ateb y cwestiynau hyn, sydd yn ymwneud â materion pwysig, maes o law.

**David Melding:** Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn croesawu Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000. Mae'r dyhead i godi safonau gofal cymdeithasol mor uchel â phosibl yn bolisi cyhoeddu rhagorol, ac fe'i cefnogwn yn llwyr. Mae safonau priodol y gall asiantaethau cyhoeddus eu gorfodi yn angenrheidiol, ac ni ddylem gefnogi polisi a fyddai'n camu yn ôl oddi wrth yr ymrwymiad hwnnw o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau.

Byddaf yn canolbwytio fy sylwadau ar y sector gofal annibynnol gan fod Dai Lloyd eisoes wedi sôn am y comisiynydd plant a chredaf y bydd Helen Mary Jones hefyd yn gwneud hynny. Cefnogwn y gwelliannau. Gwneuthum sylwadau ar y comisiynydd plant yn y gorffennol ac nid ailadroddaf hwy yn awr. Weithiau caiff y sector gofal annibynnol ei anwybyddu, neu o leiaf ei hepgor o'n trafodaethau. Mae'n briodol inni fyfyrto ar pa mor hanfodol yw'r sector hwnnw. Mae pobl yn aml yn meddwl ei fod yn rhan o'r sector preifat, sydd yn wir ar gyfer rhywfaint o'r ddarpariaeth. Fodd bynnag, darperir llawer o'r gofal gan sefydliadau gwirfoddol, sefydliadau di-elw a sefydliadau sydd yn cynnig gwasanaethau cymdogaeth sydd yn gyfarwydd ac yn seiliedig ar anghenion cymuned benodol. Mae'n bwysig cynnal a datblygu'r sector hwn. Ar hyn o bryd darpara 25,000 o lefydd preswyl, sydd yn swm anferthol o'r gallu sydd ar gael yng Nghymru. Os gwnawn unrhyw beth i beryglu nifer sylweddol o'r lleoedd hynny, bydd gennym

significant number of those places, we will have a crisis in the provision of community care. This sector is one of the largest employers in Wales, with approximately 50,000 employees. It is made up of a number of small employers that, collectively, employ a large number of people. However, it is sometimes difficult to hear its collective voice because it is so fragmented.

I have been encouraged by some earlier references in this debate, especially by the Minister's remarks. There is a danger that higher standards can undermine this sector by unmet costs. It is one thing to call for higher standards, but it is another thing to commit public resources to ensure that they are met. Even in the private and independent sector, about 75 per cent of people's places are paid for by the public purse, which is appropriate. We must ensure that the fees are realistic and that they reflect the increase in standards that we demand. There is no question that we are all committed to higher standards, but we cannot leave fees at a stagnated level and expect that, somehow, by magnificent efficiency savings, the sector will be transformed. Higher standards mean higher costs, which must be met. If we are not meeting those costs we must be honest enough to say that the budget is not increasing enough to take care of those costs and that we expect them to be met some other way. I do not think that there is another way. However, we owe it to the providers of independent care to be honest with them.

One thing that this sector is calling for is a national assessment tool. Currently, the flat rate fees do not necessarily reflect individual need, and if we have better assessment and a better accounting for individual need, that needs to be reflected in the cost of that care. A national assessment tool would be a good way of meeting that requirement. The sector has called for it and it is in discussion with the Minister. I would appreciate a response on that.

4:47 p.m.

Remarks have also been made about the physical requirements that are likely to be increasingly driven up by the regulations that

argyfwng mewn darpariaeth gofal cymunedol. Y sector hwn yw un o'r cyflogwyr mwyaf yng Nghymru, gyda thua 50,000 o gyflogion. Cynhwysa nifer o gyflogwyr bach sydd, gyda'i gilydd, yn cyflogi nifer fawr o bobl. Fodd bynnag, weithiau mae'n anodd clywed ei lais cyfan gan ei fod mor ddarniog.

Fe'm calonogwyd gan gyfeiriadau yn gynharach yn y ddadl hon, yn arbennig sylwadau'r Gweinidog. Mae perygl i safonau uwch danseilio'r sector hwn drwy gostau nas telir. Un peth yw galw am safonau uwch, ond mater arall yw ymrwymo adnoddau cyhoeddus i sicrhau y caint eu cwrdd. Hyd yn oed yn y sector preifat ac annibynnol, telir tua 75 y cant o lefydd pobl o'r pwrs cyhoeddus, sydd yn briodol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y ffioedd yn realistig a'u bod yn adlewyrchu'r cynnydd yn y safonau a fynnir gennym. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth ein bod oll yn ymrwymedig i safonau uwch, ond ni allwn adael ffioedd ar lefel ddigyfnewid a disgwyli, rhywffordd, drwy arbedion effeithlonrwydd gwych, y caiff y sector ei thrawsffurfio. Mae safonau uwch yn golygu costau uwch, y mae'n rhaid eu cwrdd. Os nad ydym yn cwrdd â'r costau hynny rhaid inni fod yn ddigon onest i ddweud nad yw'r gyllideb yn cynyddu ddigon i dalu'r costau hynny ac y disgwyliwn iddynt gael eu talu mewn rhyw ffordd arall. Ni chredaf fod ffordd arall. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym ddyled i ddarparwyr gofal annibynnol i fod yn onest gyda hwy.

Un peth y mae'r sector hwn yn galw amdano yw offeryn asesu cenedlaethol. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r ffioedd cyfradd unffurf o reidrwydd yn adlewyrchu anghenion unigol, ac os oes gennym well asesiad a gwell cyfrif ar gyfer anghenion unigol, mae angen adlewyrchu hynny yng nghost y gofal hwnnw. Byddai offeryn asesu cenedlaethol yn ffordd dda o gwrdd â'r gofyniad hwnnw. Mae'r sector wedi galw amdano ac mae trafodaethau ar y gweill gyda'r Gweinidog. Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi ymateb ar hynny.

Gwnaethpwyd sylwadau hefyd am y gofynion ffisegol sydd yn debygol o gael eu llywio fwy fwy gan rheoliadau a ddaw ger ein bron.

will come before us. No matter how long the programme takes to roll out—it may be over five years—someone who has already developed and bought a care home will want to sell that on at some point, when they retire, or they will want to improve on the capacity that they have. We must distinguish between those homes that already exist and new build. It is one thing in new build to have the highest possible standards—we would all support that—but we must remember that many people have already made an investment, say 20 years ago, in their particular home. When we talk about room size, many homes in residential neighbourhoods may be in older type buildings; they are not necessarily easy to transform overnight to meet new regulations on room size. The number of double rooms is crucial. While nobody would presumably want to be put in a room with a stranger, others develop deep companionship with the people with whom they share and are happy in their double rooms.

Finally, I ask the Minister to improve on the consultation with the independent sector, at local level and at Assembly level. We must ensure that this sector is involved in strategic planning, and they must be advised on what sort of level of commissioning they can expect from the public sector and its agencies.

**Kirsty Williams:** On behalf of the Liberal Democrats, I welcome the introduction of this Act, which will do a great deal to improve standards across the board in all areas of social care. I especially welcome the Act as it includes the amendment that will create in law the post of children's commissioner, and welcome it as a first step to establishing the Assembly's vision for that post. We welcome early action on improving standards registration, inspection and training of the care industry. I will focus briefly on a few of the Liberal Democrats group's concerns. We may be in danger of focusing a little too strongly on physical standards, rather than on the overall quality of life and quality of service that these care homes, nursing homes, and other settings provide. Focusing on the number of electrical sockets or the width of a doorway is not necessarily the best way of ensuring quality in many of these settings.

Waeth faint o amser a gymer i gyflwyno'r rhaglen—gallai fod dros bum mlynedd—bydd rhywun sydd eisoes wedi datblygu a phrynu cartref gofal am ei werthu ar ryw adeg, pan fyddant yn ymddeol, neu byddant am wella ar y cynhwysedd sydd ganddynt. Rhaid inni wahaniaethu rhwng y cartrefi hynny sydd eisoes yn bodoli a'r rhai a adeiledir o'r newydd. Un peth yw cael y safonau uchaf posibl wrth adeiladu o'r newydd—byddem oll yn cefnogi hynny—ond rhaid inni gofio bod llawer o bobl eisoes wedi buddsoddi, 20 mlynedd yn ôl dyweder, yn eu cartref penodol. Pan siaradwn am faint ystafelloedd, efallai bod llawer o gartrefi mewn cymogaethau preswyl mewn mathau hŷn o adeiladau; nid ydynt o anghenraíd yn hawdd i'w trawsffurfio dros nos i gwrdd â rheoliadau newydd ar faint ystafelloedd. Mae nifer yr ystafelloedd dwbl yn hanfodol. Er na fyddai unrhyw un, fe dybiaf, am gael ei roi mewn ystafell gyda dieithryn, mae eraill yn datblygu cyfeillgarwch ddofn gyda'r bobl y maent yn rhannu â hwy ac yn hapus yn eu ystafelloedd dwbl.

Yn olaf, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog wella ar yr ymgynghoriad gyda'r sector annibynnol, ar lefel leol ac ar lefel y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y sector hwn yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllunio strategol, a rhaid eu cyngori ynglŷn â pha lefel o gomisiynu y gallant ei disgwyl gan y sector cyhoeddus a'i asiantaethau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, croesawaf gyflwyno'r Ddeddf hon, a fydd yn gwneud llawer i wella safonau yn gyffredinol ym mhob maes o ofal cymdeithasol. Croesawaf y Ddeddf yn arbennig gan ei bod yn cynnwys y diwygiad a fydd yn creu yn gyfreithiol y swydd o gomisiynydd plant, ac fe'i croesawaf fel y cam cyntaf i sefydlu gweledigaeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer y swydd honno. Croesawn gamau cynnar ar wella safonau cofrestru, arolygu a hyfforddi'r diwydiant gofal. Canolbwytiaf yn fyr ar ychydig o bryderon grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Efallai fod perygl inni ganolbwytio ychydig yn ormodol ar safonau ffisegol, yn hytrach nag ar ansawdd bywyd yn gyffredinol ac ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir gan y cartrefi gofal, cartrefi nyrso a lleoliadau eraill. Nid canolbwytio ar nifer y socedi trydan a lled drws o anghenraíd yw'r ffordd orau o sicrhau ansawdd o fewn llawer o'r

lleoliadau hyn.

In our deliberation of any regulations or guidance or secondary legislation, we need to be aware of these issues. In seeking to improve standards for the people of Wales we could inadvertently remove a great deal of choice. Closure of a small rural home because of the inability to meet some arbitrary physical standard could mean an individual, for instance, being forced to move many miles away from their village to a large and unfamiliar setting. I echo many of David Melding's comments about the independent sector—at private and voluntary organisations—providing care, often, as he said, local care. We do not want to undermine that provision. Often these days we, see in an attempt to drive up standards, a drive towards the centralisation of services and the belief that big is always better. I do not believe that that is always the case. In rural areas, the independent sector is a vital provider of care provision. We could inadvertently remove that choice for individuals by rigidly, as Mr Richards said, applying strict and arbitrary standards.

**Peter Rogers:** Do you agree, Kirsty, that the independent sector in rural areas not only upholds these standards, but also provides much needed employment in this area, and that it must be recognised as one of the leading providers of employment in these areas?

**Kirsty Williams:** As David mentioned, the independent sector and the whole care industry is a major employer throughout Wales. That brings me to my second concern, which is the ability to recruit care workers. In some areas, there are already problems in recruiting the quality of staff that homes and care institutions need. I welcome the move towards staff training and perhaps even giving a new status to this profession. These are important people and because they do not have medical training it does not mean that they are not providing an important service. However, we need to be realistic about how quickly we can implement these training standards and the effect this will have on recruitment opportunities.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose amendment 2.

Yn ein penderfyniad ar unrhyw reoliadau neu arweiniad neu is-ddeddfwriaeth, mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r materion hyn. Wrth geisio gwella safonau ar gyfer pobl Cymru gallem drwy amryfusedd gael gwared â llawer iawn o ddevis. Gallai cau cartref bach gwledig o ganlyniad i'r anallu i gwrdd â rhyw safon ffisegol fympwyol olygu gorfodi unigolyn, er enghraift, i symud filltiroedd lawer o'u pentref i leoliad mawr ac anghyfarwydd. Ategaf lawer o sylwadau David Melding ynghylch y sector annibynnol—mewn sefydliadau preifat a gwirfoddol—sydd yn darparu gofal, ac yn aml, fel y dywedodd, ofal lleol. Nid ydym am danseilio'r ddarpariaeth honno. Yn aml y dyddiau hyn, gwelwn mewn ymdrech i godi safonau, gam tuag at ganoli gwasanaethau a'r gred fod mawr bob amser yn well. Ni chredaf fod hyn yn wir bob amser. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mae'r sector annibynnol yn ddarparwr gofal holl bwysig. Gallem trwy amryfusedd ddileu'r dewis hwnnw i unigolion drwy gymhwysyo safonau llym a mympwyol, fel y dywedodd Mr Richards.

**Peter Rogers:** A gytunwch, Kirsty, fod y sector annibynnol mewn ardaloedd gwledig nid yn unig yn arddel y safonau hyn, ond hefyd yn darparu llawer o gyflogaeth y mae mawr ei hangen yn y maes hwn, a rhaid iddo gael ei gydnabod fel un o brif ddarparwyr cyflogaeth yn y meysydd hyn?

**Kirsty Williams:** Fel y crybwylodd David, mae'r sector annibynnol a'r holl ddiwydiant gofal yn gyflogwr o bwys ledled Cymru. Daw hyn â mi at fy ail bryder, sef y gallu i recriwtio gweithwyr gofal. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae problemau eisoes wrth recriwtio staff o'r ansawdd y mae ei angen ar gartrefi a sefydliadau gofal. Croesawaf y cam hwn tuag at hyfforddi staff a hyd yn oed rhoi statws newydd i'r proffesiwn hwn. Mae'r rhain yn bobl bwysig ac nid yw'r ffaith na chawsant hyfforddiant meddygol yn golygu nad ydynt yn darparu gwasanaeth pwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni fod yn realistig ynglŷn â pha mor gyflym y gallwn weithredu'r safonau hyfforddi hyn a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar gyfleoedd recriwtio.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 2.

Add at the end of the motion

*The Assembly calls on the First Minister to make representations to the Secretary of State for Wales so that in the next Queen's Speech there is a free standing bill providing the Children's Commissioner for Wales with full statutory powers in line with the policy of the National Assembly.*

I address amendment 2 in my name, and I will say a little more in support of Dai Lloyd's amendment 1. The plans for the establishment of a children's commissioner for Wales are the fruit of many months of hard work by the Health and Social Services Committee and the Pre-16 Education Committee; we have also had the full co-operation of Ministers. Most importantly, they are the fruit of wide consultation particularly with children and young people. The Assembly has backed wholeheartedly a role for the commissioner in investigating all matters of concern to the children of Wales, not only those in care and those who are vulnerable. I welcome that Jane Hutt has accepted our amendments to the motion, and I am also grateful to David Melding for the Welsh Conservative group's report.

We must make clear that it is this Assembly, on behalf of the children of Wales, that is establishing the children's commissioner. The current devolution settlement makes it necessary for the Government of Wales to seek Westminster time to endow the commissioner with statutory powers. However, it is not the Care Standards Act 2000 that establishes the commissioner. The Act simply gives that commissioner initial statutory powers. I am not talking about legal niceties, though we cannot possibly ignore them. I am talking about perception and, importantly, about ownership and responsibility. This motion, as it was tabled by the Government of Wales, raised real concerns, for example, from the voluntary organisations working with and for children. I received several calls asking me whether I thought that this was a move on behalf of the Government of Wales to somehow ditch its commitment to seek full statutory powers for the commissioner for all areas affecting children's lives. By accepting our amendments today, Jane Hutt has provided

Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*Mae'r Cynulliad yn galw ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i gyflwyno cais i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, er mwyn iddo sicrhau y bydd Araith nesaf y Frenhines yn cynnwys mesur sy'n sefyll ar ei draed ei hun i ddarparu pwerau statudol llawn i Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru yn unol â pholisi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

Ymdriniaf â gwelliant 2 yn fy enw, a dywedaf ychydig mwy i gefnogi gwelliant 1 Dai Lloyd. Mae'r cynlluniau ar gyfer sefydlu comisiynydd plant i Gymru yn ffrwyth llafur misoedd lawer o waith caled gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16; cawsom hefyd gydwethrediad llwyr y Gweinidogion. Yn bwysicaf oll, maent yn ffrwyth ymgynghori eang yn arbennig â phlant a phobl ifanc. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cefnogi yn galonnog rôl i'r comisiynydd ymchwilio i bob mater o bryder i blant Cymru, nid yn unig y rhai mewn gofal a'r rhai sydd yn ddiamddiffyn. Croesawaf yffaith i Jane Hutt dderbyn ein gweliannau i'r cynnig, ac yr wyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i David Melding am adroddiad grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

Rhaid inni egluro mai'r Cynulliad hwn, ar ran plant Cymru, sydd yn sefydlu'r comisiynydd plant. Gwna'r setliad datganoli cyfredol hi'n angenrheidiol i Lywodraeth Cymru ofyn am amser San Steffan i roi pwerau statudol i'r comisiynydd. Fodd bynnag, nid Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 sydd yn sefydlu'r comisiynydd. Dim ond rhoi pwerau statudol cychwynnol i'r comisiynydd a wna'r Ddeddf. Nid wyf yn sôn am fanylion cyfreithiol er, yn sicr, na allwn eu hanwybyddu. Yr wyf yn sôn am ganfyddiad ac, yn bwysicach, am berchenogaeth a chyfrifoldeb. Cododd y cynnig hwn, fel y'i cyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru, bryderon gwirioneddol, er enghraifft, ymyst y sefydliadau gwirfoddol sydd yn gweithio gyda ac ar ran plant. Cefais sawl galwad yn gofyn imi a oeddwon o'r farn bod hyn yn gam ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru i ymrthod mewn rhyw ffordd â'i ymrwymiad i geisio pwerau statudol llawn i'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pob maes sydd yn effeithio ar fywydau plant. Drwy dderbyn ein gweliannau heddiw, rhoddodd Jane Hutt beth sicrwydd iddynt. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf iddi roi cyfrif y prynhawn yma am sut y bu i'r cynnig hwn gael ei

them with some reassurance. However, I ask her to account this afternoon for how this motion came to be submitted as it was with no reference to the wider remit of the children's commissioner. It has fed a perception, which I am afraid is there, that there is some reluctance somewhere to see the fullest powers delivered.

That brings me to amendment 2. Children's organisations tell me that they are hearing rumours—and we all know that perception is important in politics and that rumours can sometimes influence perceptions—that the Westminster Cabinet are reluctant to grant a free standing bill for our children's commissioner and are talking in terms of a further hotchpotch of amendments for various Bills at various times. The name of the Welsh Office Minister, David Hanson, has been mentioned as supporting this approach. I urge Jane Hutt, if she can this afternoon, to clearly disassociate herself from this approach, as she has done already by implication in accepting our amendments. I further ask her to report more fully in her response to this debate on the current state of negotiations between the Government of Wales and the UK Cabinet about this matter. On what level are these negotiations being undertaken, how are they progressing, and are we likely to get a freestanding Bill in this Queen's Speech? The Assembly needs to know this and, more importantly, so do the children of Wales and those who speak for them. I suggest that an exchange of letters at this point is not quite enough.

From our point of view as the opposition party, this situation shows the mess that the current devolution settlement is in. The Assembly, with all-party support, has a clear vision of a powerful commissioner, a voice for all the children in Wales. Yet, the Government of Wales must go cap in hand to other Ministers in another place who may or may not allow a few hours to make this vision a reality. This is not good enough. However, we must live with it for now. The opposition will continue to co-operate fully with the Government of Wales on this for the sake of the children of Wales. We trust that the Government of Wales will do all in its power to persuade the Westminster Government to give our commissioner all the

gyflwyno fel yr oedd heb unrhyw gyfeiriad at gylch gorchwyl ehangach y comisiynydd plant. Mae wedi bwydo canfyddiad, sydd yn bodoli mae arnaf ofn, fod peth amharodrwydd yn rhywle i weld y pwerau llawnaf yn cael eu cyflwyno.

Daw hynny â mi at welliant 2. Dywed sefydliadau plant wrthyf eu bod yn clywed sibrydion—ac fe âyr pawb ohonom fod canfyddiad yn bwysig mewn gwleidyddiaeth ac y gall sibrydion weithiau ddylanwadu ar ganfyddiadau—fod Cabinet San Steffan yn amharod i roi mesur annibynnol ar gyfer ein comisiynydd plant ac yn siarad yn nhermau cawlach arall o welliannau i wahanol Fesurau ar wahanol adegau. Crybwyllyd enw Gweinidog y Swyddfa Gymreig, David Hanson, fel un sydd yn cefnogi'r ymagwedd hon. Pwysaf ar Jane Hutt, os gall wneud hynny y prynhawn yma, i ddatgysylltu ei hun yn amlwg oddi wrth yr ymagwedd hon, fel y gwnaeth eisoes drwy awgrym wrth dderbyn ein gwelliannau. Gofynnaf iddi hefyd roi adroddiad llawnach yn ei hymateb i'r ddadl hon ar sefyllfa bresennol y negodiadau rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a Chabinet y DU ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Ar ba lefel y cynhelir y negodiadau hyn, pa gynnydd a wneir, ac a ydym yn debygol o gael Mesur annibynnol yn Araith y Frenhines y tro hwn? Mae angen i'r Cynulliad wybod hyn ac, yn bwysicach, blant Cymru hefyd a'r rheini sydd yn siarad ar eu rhan. Awgrymaf nad yw cyfnewid llythyrau yn ddigon yn awr.

O'n safbwyt ni fel yr wrthblaid, dengys y sefyllfa hon y llanastr y mae'r setliad datganoli cyfredol ynddo. Mae gan y Cynulliad, gyda chefnogaeth pob plaid, weledigaeth glir o gomisiynydd pwerus, llais i holl blant Cymru. Eto, rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru fynd â'i chap yn ei llaw at Weinidogion eraill yn rhywle arall a fydd yn caniatâu neu'n gwrthod ychydig oriau i wireddu'r weledigaeth hon. Nid yw hyn yn ddigon da. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fyw gydag ef ar hyn o bryd. Bydd yr wrthblaid yn parhau i gydwethredu'n llawn â Llywodraeth Cymru er budd plant Cymru. Hyderwn y gwnaiff Llywodraeth Cymru boeth o fewn ei gallu i ddarbwyllo Llywodraeth San Steffan i roi i'n comisiynydd yr holl bwerau fydd eu hangen arno ef neu arni hi.

powers that she or he will need.

4:57 p.m.

**Geraint Davies:** The Care Standards Act 2000 is designed to improve the lives of people in care. Nobody would disagree with that intention. The most important factor in improving care is to improve the quality of the staff. The staff must be properly trained, must receive the support that they need and must be given the status that they deserve. More than 25,000 people work in social service departments in Wales but in 1997, 95 per cent of social workers were professionally qualified, only 17 per cent of staff in children's homes had appropriate qualifications, only 7 per cent of residential care staff working with adults and only 8 per cent of day care staff were qualified. This lack of training is something the Act must be used to address as a matter of urgency. There must be criteria for admission to training programmes as well as required outcomes and examinations for all such programmes. It is important to involve social care agencies and employers in the management of these programmes that must be designed to fit the purpose of the job.

Various events have led to the general public having a negative image of social workers. We can look at Northern Ireland's development of a promotional campaign to raise the profile of social work as a career choice and to stem the falling number of applicants to social work programmes in that region. Using Department of Health, Social Services and Public Safety funding, they are attempting there to determine the factors which motivate and demotivate potential social work candidates and to increase the public understanding of the considerable contribution social workers make. There is a chronic shortage of social workers, especially those working with children. This is not surprising bearing in mind the stress which is often involved in that job. Many qualified social workers are leaving the profession, looking to other areas where conditions are better, such as the probation service. Public sector pay has not increased in line with the private sector. We see the haemorrhage of highly qualified staff out of the service.

**Geraint Davies:** Lluniwyd Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 er mwyn gwella bywydau pobl mewn gofal. Ni fyddai unrhyw un yn anghytuno â'r bwiad hwnnw. Y ffactor pwysicaf wrth wella gofal yw gwella ansawdd y staff. Rhaid i'r staff gael eu hyfforddi'n iawn, derbyn y gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt a rhoi iddynt y statws y maent yn ei haeddu. Mae mwy na 25,000 o bobl yn gweithio mewn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru ond ym 1997, yr oedd 95 y cant o weithwyr cymdeithasol â chymwysterau proffesiynol, dim ond 17 y cant o staff mewn cartrefi plant oedd â chymwysterau priodol, dim ond 7 y cant o'r staff gofal preswyl oedd yn gweithio gydag oedolion a dim ond 8 y cant o'r staff gofal dydd oedd yn gymwys. Mae'r diffyg hyfforddiant hwn yn rhywbeth y dylid defnyddio'r Ddeddf i fynd i'r afael ag ef ar fyrder. Rhaid bod meini prawf ar gyfer derbyn pobl ar raglenni hyfforddi yn ogystal â chanlyniadau angenrheidiol ac arholiadau ar gyfer pob rhaglen o'r fath. Mae'n bwysig cynnwys asiantaethau a chyflogwr gofal cymdeithasol yn y gwaith o reoli'r rhaglenni hyn y mae'n rhaid iddynt gael eu cynllunio i fod yn addas at ddiben y swydd.

Parodd amrywiol ddigwyddiadau i'r cyhoedd gael delwedd negyddol o weithwyr cymdeithasol. Gallwn edrych ar ddatblygiad Gogledd Iwerddon o ymgyrch hyrwyddo i godi proffil gwaith cymdeithasol fel dewis gyrfa ac i atal y gostyngiad yn nifer yr ymgeiswyr i raglenni gwaith cymdeithasol yn y rhanbarth hwnnw. Gan ddefnyddio arian gan yr Adran Iechyd, Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Diogelwch y Cyhoedd, ymdrechant yno i benderfynu ar y ffactorau sydd yn gymhelliant neu'n anghymhelliant i ddarpar ymgeiswyr gwaith cymdeithasol a chynyddu dealltwriaeth y cyhoedd o'r cyfraniad sylweddol a wneir gan weithwyr cymdeithasol. Mae prinder dybryd o weithwyr cymdeithasol, yn arbennig y rheini sydd yn gweithio gyda phlant. Nid yw hyn yn syndod o gofio'r pwysau sydd yn aml ynghlwm â'r swydd honno. Mae llawer o weithwyr cymdeithasol cymwys yn gadael y proffesiwn, gan edrych i feysydd eraill lle ceir amodau gwell, fel y gwasanaeth prawf. Nid yw cyflog y sector cyhoeddus wedi cynyddu yn unol â'r sector preifat. Gwelwn staff â chymwysterau

uchel yn llifo o'r gwasanaeth.

Social workers too must have regular training as well as supervision and support to ensure that they do not burn out. The status of social care staff must be increased and their registration is fundamental. The Care Standards Act must be used to deal effectively with those unfit to practice on the grounds of misconduct, bad practice, negligence or abuse. Those who use social services in Wales should be able to have the confidence that they are being looked after by staff who are properly trained, have gained adequate qualifications and are effectively regulated. The most improving factor for improving care in all establishments, and in the care service in general, is to ensure that the staff are trained to do a good job, supported to continue to work effectively and given the status commensurate with their level of responsibility so that the job will be attractive to more people.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** The debate on the Care Standards Act is complex and large scale and will continue when we consider the regulations. I thank all Members for their helpful contributions. Picking up some of Dai, David and Kirsty's points about giving assurances that we are looking for Welsh solutions to Welsh needs, this is not about Welsh problems but about Welsh needs. That is why I met with the independent sector today to discuss concerns. I assure David that this is the beginning of a dialogue. I congratulated the independent sector for accessing Assembly Members. We have a good understanding of the sector's needs. The task group that we have set up will involve those representatives of the independent sector—over 1,000 homes in Wales. We want to keep our Welsh homes in Wales and not have them threatened by the difficulties that they might perceive coming through. They welcomed the national standards and consistency that will come through the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales.

I want to point out to Kirsty and David that only a handful of standards deal with the physical environment. We must ensure, as I

Rhaid i weithwyr cymdeithasol hefyd gael hyfforddiant rheolaidd yn ogystal â goruchwyliaeth a chefnogaeth i sicrhau nad ydynt yn llosgi'r gannwyll y ddau ben. Rhaid codi statws staff gofal cymdeithasol ac mae eu cofrestru yn holl bwysig. Rhaid defnyddio'r Ddeddf Safonau Gofal i ddelio'n effeithiol â'r rhai sydd yn anaddas i weithio ar sail camymddygiad, arfer gwael, esgeulustod neu gam-drin. Dylai'r rhai sydd yn defnyddio gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru allu bod yn hyderus y gofeler amdanyst gan staff sydd wedi'u hyfforddi'n gywir, wedi cael cymwysterau digonol ac yn cael eu rheoleiddio'n effeithiol. Yr elfen bwysicaf i wella gofal ym mhob sefydliad, ac yn y gwasanaeth gofal yn gyffredinol, yw sicrhau bod y staff wedi'u hyfforddi i wneud gwaith da, yn cael cefnogaeth i barhau i weithio'n effeithiol ac yn cael y statws sydd yn gymesur â'u lefel o gyfrifoldeb fel y bydd y swydd yn fwy deniadol i fwy o bobl.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r ddadl hon ar y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal yn gymhleth ac yn fawr a bydd yn parhau pan ystyriwn y rheoliadau. Diolchaf i bob Aelod am eu cyfraniadau defnyddiol. Gan ddilyn rhai o bwyntiau Dai, David a Kirsty ynglŷn â rho'i'r sicrwydd ein bod yn edrych am atebion Cymreig i anghenion Cymreig, mae hyn yn ymwneud ag anghenion Cymreig nid problemau Cymreig. Dyna pam y cyfarfum â'r sector annibynnol heddiw i drafod pryderon. Gallaf sicrhau David mai dechrau deialog yw hyn. Llongyfarchais y sector annibynnol am gysylltu ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae gennym ddealltwriaeth dda o anghenion y sector. Bydd y grŵp gorchwyl a sefydlwyd gennym yn cynnwys y cynrychiolwyr hynny o'r sector annibynnol—dros 1,000 o gartrefi yng Nghymru. Yr ydym am gadw ein cartrefi Cymreig yng Nghymru ac nid ydym am iddynt gael eu bygwth gan yr anawsterau y credant sydd yn codi. Croesawsant y safonau cenedlaethol a'r cysondeb a ddaw yn sgîl Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru.

Hoffwn dynnu sylw Kirsty a David mai dim ond llond llaw o safonau sydd yn ymdrin â'r amgylchedd ffisegol. Rhaid inni sicrhau, fel y

said in my opening remarks, that it is about the care that is given and the way that it is given. It is also about the support that we give to the social care workforce, which is the point that Geraint made so powerfully. We must ensure that we improve communication and consultation with staff and with proprietors in the independent sector.

Moving on to some of Gwenda's points, the social security means-tested benefits are not a devolved function. Those are issues that the UK Government will consider. However, I wanted to take on board your issue about staff in local authorities. They will have the opportunity to transfer to the Assembly and to continue to undertake this work in relation to the inspectorate. These people have the qualifications, skills and expertise. There are currently 140 inspectors and around 50 administrative staff involved in inspection units and in under-eights regulation. We will need additional staff to deal with the new areas that we are regulating, such as domiciliary care and small homes. We are already having staff conferences to consider issues and needs and we are in consultation with trade unions. This will be about the Assembly employing its own workforce of inspectors and using experienced inspection staff. Those who are working in this field will be encouraged to transfer to the National Assembly. There will be protection under the Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Employment) Regulations. We will work with them on these issues.

I want to pick up on the points that Geraint and others made about the social care workforce. It has not had the status or recognition that it deserves. There are dedicated people working in difficult jobs and circumstances throughout Wales. We need to improve the status of the 60,000 workforce.

It is important—and I am glad that the Minister for Education and Life-long Learning has just entered the Chamber—because we must recognise that the social care workforce is also part of the growing Welsh social economy. The role of CETW will be vital in helping the independent and

dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, ei fod yn ymwneud â'r gofal a roddir a'r ffordd y'i rhoddir. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â'r cymorth a roddwn i'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, sef y pwynt a wnaeth Geraint mor gryf. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwella cyfathrebu ac ymgynghori gyda staff a pherchenogion y sector annibynnol.

Gan symud ymlaen at rai o bwyntiau Gwenda, nid yw budd-daliadau nawdd cymdeithasol yn seiliedig ar brawf modd yn swyddogaeth ddatganoledig. Mae'r rheini'n faterion y bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn eu hystyried. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn am ystyried eich mater yngylch staff mewn awdurdodau lleol. Cânt y cyfle i drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad a pharhau i ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn mewn perthynas â'r arolygiaeth. Mae'r bobl hyn yn meddu ar y cymwysterau, y sgiliau a'r arbenigedd. Ar hyn o bryd mae 140 o arolygwyr a thua 50 o staff gweinyddol yn gysylltiedig ag unedau arolygu a rheoleiddio ar gyfer plant dan wyth. Bydd angen staff ychwanegol arnom i ddelfio â'r meysydd newydd a reoleiddiwn, fel gofal yn y cartref a chartrefi bach. Yr ydym eisoes yn cynnal cynadleddau staff i ystyried materion ac anghenion ac yr ydym wrthi'n ymgynghori ag undebau llafur. Bydd hyn yn ymwneud â'r Cynulliad yn cyflogi ei weithlu ei hun o arolygwyr ac yn defnyddio staff arolygu priodol. Caiff y rhai sydd yn gweithio yn y maes hwn eu hannog i drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ceir diogelwch o dan Reoliadau Trosglwyddo Ymgynheriadau (Diogelu Cyflogaeth). Byddwn yn cydweithio â hwy ar y materion hyn.

Hoffwn ddilyn y pwyntiau a wnaeth Geraint ac eraill ynglŷn â'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol. Nid yw wedi cael y statws na'r gydnabyddiaeth haeddiannol. Mae pobl ymroddedig yn gweithio mewn swyddi ac amgylchiadau anodd ledled Cymru. Mae angen inni wella statws y gwetihlu o 60,000.

Mae'n bwysig—ac yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes newydd ddod i'r Siambra—oherwydd rhaid inni gydnabod fod y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol hefyd yn rhan o economi gymdeithasol Gymreig sydd yn tyfu. Bydd swyddogaeth y Cyngor dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru yn holl

social care sectors to have access to additional training. I was pleased to hand out certificates in a local, independent firm in my constituency recently. I am sure that many other Members are in that position. We must ensure that we work with the independent sector in supporting their attempts and aspirations to improve the training opportunities for the social care workforce.

Gwenda and David mentioned issues concerning the relationship between the new inspectorate and local authority commissioning units. It is not yet clear how those relationships will work. We discussed this earlier today in my meeting with the representatives from the independent sector. We know that there is an issue about income and charging. In terms of charging, we will have statutory guidance on the charging regimes for domiciliary services. However, in relation to residential and nursing care, we will have to look at the whole interface, particularly in relation to the long-term care of the elderly. We must look at the results of the Royal Commission on the long-term care of the elderly. It is important to have the assessment tools to help in this.

I hope, Helen Mary, that you understand that there was no question of even thinking that I would not accept your amendment 2. I welcomed it, because you know my determination to get these extra powers. I am disappointed that people may have been worried that this amendment was some kind of indication to the contrary.

The Care Standards Act is a huge debate and the children's commissioner is an important part of it. However, we are looking at the whole area of social care, the Care Standards Act and the Care Council for Wales. There are so many vital parts. I assure you that it is not just about writing letters; it is about making representations. We know that there are rumour machines—perhaps you are closer to them than I, Helen Mary. However, I am confident that we have done everything, as has the First Minister, to secure those wider statutory powers.

5:07 p.m.

bwysig wrth helpu'r sectorau annibynnol a gofal cymdeithasol i gael mynediad i hyfforddiant ychwanegol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gyflwyno dystysgrifau mewn cwmni annibynnol, lleol yn fy etholaeth yn ddiweddar. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod nifer o Aelodau eraill yn y sefyllfa honno. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio gyda'r sector annibynnol i gefnogi eu hymdrehigion a'u dyheadau i wella cyfleoedd hyfforddi ar gyfer y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol.

Soniodd Gwenda a David am faterion yn ymwneud â'r berthynas rhwng yr arolygiaeth newydd ac unedau comisiynau awdurdodau lleol. Nid yw'n glir eto sut y bydd y berthynas hon yn gweithio. Trafodasom hyn yn gynharach heddiw yn fy nghyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr o'r sector annibynnol. Gwyddom fod problem ynghylch incwm a chodi tâl. O ran codi tâl, bydd gennym arweiniad statudol ar systemau codi tâl ar gyfer gwasanaethau yn y cartref. Fodd bynnag, mewn perthynas â gofal preswyl a nysrio, bydd yn rhaid inni edrych ar yr holl ryngwyneb, yn arbennig mewn perthynas â gofal hir dymor yr henoed. Rhaid inni edrych ar ganlyniadau'r Comisiwn Brenhinol ar ofal hir dymor i'r henoed. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym yr offer asesu i helpu yn hyn o beth.

Gobeithio, Helen Mary, eich bod yn deall nad oedd unrhyw amheuaeth o hyd yn oed ystyried na fyddwn yn derbyn eich gwelliant 2. Yr oeddwn yn ei groesawu, oherwydd gwyddoch fy mod yn benderfynol i gael y pwerau ychwanegol hyn. Yr wyf yn siomedig fod pobl wedi bod yn bryderus efallai bod y gwelliant hwn yn rhyw fath o awgrym i'r gwirthwyneb.

Mae'r Ddeddf Safonau Gofal yn ddadl enfawr ac mae'r comisiynydd plant yn rhan bwysig ohoni. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn edrych ar faes cyfan gofal cymdeithasol, y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal a Chyngor Gofal Cymru. Mae cymaint o rannau holl bwysig. Gallaf eich sicrhau nad mater o ysgrifennu llythyrau yn unig yw hyn; mae'n ymwneud â gwneud cynrychioliadau. Gwyddom fod yna beiriannau sibrydion—efallai eich bod chi yn agosach atynt na mi, Helen Mary. Fodd bynnag, hyderaf ein bod wedi gwneud popeth, fel y mae'r Prif Weinidog, i sicrhau'r pwerau statudol ehangach hynny.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I want to make clear that I was never in doubt about your position, Jane, but the wording of the motion as it stood gave rise to concern. Perhaps, when we mention it again, we should look at that.

The other matter that I would like to raise again is whether you are able to dissociate yourself from the idea of a whole range of other amendments to other Westminster Bills as opposed to a freestanding Bill for our children's commissioner. I realise that it may be difficult for you to do so in the middle of negotiations. However, there is a strong feeling that if we must amend every piece of Westminster legislation that is concerned with children, then our commissioner will have to wait many years until she or he has their full powers.

**Jane Hutt:** I think that you are tuned into a different kind of rumour machine than I am. As far as I am concerned it is a Bill to extend the children's commissioner's powers. We must leave it at that, except to say that we have an all-party appointments advisory committee, of which Helen Mary is a member, as are David and Kirsty. We meet again in a couple of weeks, with Lorraine Barrett from the former Pre-16 Education Committee. We are doing the work. You saw the advertisements which said that we in Wales are leading the way in the UK with our children's commissioner. The advertisement already anticipates in writing the extension of the commissioner's powers, as does the accompanying documentation in the post. This is going to be a real demonstration of devolution at work. We will have our children's commissioner, and we anticipate those wider powers. I hope that the assurance that I give you today will gain the confidence of the whole Assembly, and the children and young people of Wales, as well as all other vulnerable people. This concerns the Care Standards Bill, where we are using one part of the statutory powers for a children's commissioner. Let us not forget that that was the first recommendation of the Waterhouse Report. We are honouring that for the children and young people who, unfortunately, experienced abuse in Wales.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf bleidlais ar welliant 1 yn enw David Lloyd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir nad oedd gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth am eich sefyllfa, Jane, ond yr oedd geiriad y cynnig fel yr oedd yn peri pryder. Efallai, pan fyddwn yn sôn amdano eto, y dylem edrych ar hynny.

Y mater arall yr hoffwn ei godi eto yw a allwch ddatgysylltu eich hun oddi wrth y syniad o ystod cyfan o welliannau eraill i Fesurau eraill yn San Steffan yn hytrach na Mesur annibynnol ar gyfer ein comisiynydd plant. Sylweddolaf y gallai fod yn anodd ichi wneud hyn ynghanol negodiadau. Fodd bynnag, mae ymdeimlad cryf os bydd yn rhaid inni ddiwygio pob darn o ddeddfwriaeth yn San Steffan sydd yn ymwneud â phlant, yna bydd yn rhaid i'n comisiynydd aros am flynyddoedd lawer nes y caiff hi neu ef bwerau llawn.

**Jane Hutt:** Credaf ichi glywed gwahanol fath o beiriant sibrydion na mi. O'm safbwyt i mae'n Fesur i ymestyn pwerau'r comisiynydd plant. Rhaid inni ei adael ar hynny, ac eithrio dweud bod gennym bwylgor ymgynghorol penodiadau pob plaid, y mae Helen Mary yn aelod ohono, yn ogystal â David a Kirsty. Byddwn yn cyfarfod eto ymhen wythnos neu ddwy, gyda Lorraine Barrett o'r cyn Bwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16. Yr ydym yn gwneud y gwaith. Gwelsoch yr hysbysebion a ddywedodd ein bod ni yng Nghymru yn arwain y ffordd yn y DU gyda'n comisiynydd plant. Mae'r hysbyseb eisoes yn rhagweld yn ysgrifenedig ymestyn pwerau'r comisiynydd, yn ogystal â'r ddogfennaeth ategol ar gyfer y swydd. Bydd hyn yn brawf gwirioneddol o ddatganoli ar waith. Bydd gennym ein comisiynydd plant, a rhagwelwn y pwerau ehangach hynny. Gobeithio y bydd y sicrwydd a roddaf ichi heddiw yn ennyn hyder y Cynulliad cyfan, a phlant a phobl ifanc Cymru, yn ogystal â phobl ddiamddiffyn eraill. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r Mesur Safonau Gofal, lle yr ydym yn defnyddio un rhan o'r pwerau statudol ar gyfer comisiynydd plant. Gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio mai dyna oedd argymhelliaid cyntaf Adroddiad Waterhouse. Anrhyydeddwn hynny ar gyfer y plant a'r bobl ifanc a ddioddefodd gamdriniaeth yng Nghymru, yn anffodus.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call a vote on amendment 1 in the name of David Lloyd.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o gyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf ac fel fferyllydd.

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as Chair of Rhondda Cynon Taff council.

**Gareth Jones:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Sir Conwy.

**Peter Black:** I declare an interest as a member of the City and County of Swansea.

**William Graham:** I declare an interest as a member of Newport County Borough Council.

**The Presiding Officer:** Those declarations of interest have been noted.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff council and as a pharmacist.

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel Cadeirydd cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf.

**Gareth Jones:** I declare an interest as a member of Conwy County Council.

**Peter Black:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe.

**William Graham:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Nodwyd y datganiadau hynny o fuddiant.

Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Amendment 2: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:  
Amended motion:*

*the National Assembly welcomes the introduction of the Care Standards Act 2000 (available on the HMSO web site [www.HMSO.gov.uk](http://www.HMSO.gov.uk)) and the new functions provided for the National Assembly*

- i. to act as the single regulator in Wales for social care, childminding and day care for under 8s and independent sector acute health care;*
- ii. to establish the Care Council for Wales to regulate and raise standards in the social care workforce in Wales; and*
- iii. to establish the Children's Commissioner for Wales.*

*the Assembly notes that a programme of secondary legislation will be submitted for National Assembly approval over the next 12 months to give practical effect to the range of new powers provided in the Act.*

*the National Assembly notes that the Care Standards Act furnishes only limited and initial statutory powers to the Children's Commissioner.*

*the Assembly calls on the First Minister to make representations to the Secretary of State for Wales so that in the next Queen's Speech there is a free standing bill providing the Children's Commissioner for Wales with full statutory powers in line with the policy of the National Assembly.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu cyflwyno Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (ar gael ar wefan Gwasg ei Mawrhydi [www.HMSO.gov.uk](http://www.HMSO.gov.uk)) a'r swyddogaethau newydd y darparwyd ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i*

- i. weithredu fel yr unig reoleiddiwr yng Nghymru ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol, gwarchod plant gofal dydd ar gyfer plant o dan 8 oed a gofal iechyd aciwt y sector annibynnol;*
- ii. sefydlu Cyngor Gofal ar gyfer Cymru i reoleiddio a chodi safonau ymhliith y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru; a*
- iii. sefydlu Comisiynydd Plant ar gyfer Cymru.*

*a bod y Cynulliad yn nodi bod rhaglen o is-ddeddfwriaethau ar gyfer eu cymeradwyo gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cael eu cyflwyno dros y 12 mis nesaf i roi'r ystod o bwerau newydd y mae'r Ddeddf yn eu darparu mewn grym yn ymarferol.*

*mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi mai dim ond pwerau statudol cyfyngedig a chychwynnol a roddir i'r Comisiynydd Plant gan ddarpariaethau'r Ddeddf Safonau Gofal.*

*mae'r Cynulliad yn galw ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i gyflwyno cais i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, er mwyn iddo sicrhau y bydd Araith nesaf y Frenhines yn cynnwys mesur sy'n sefyll ar ei draed ei hun i ddarparu pwerau statudol llawn i Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru yn unol â pholisi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted.*

**Y Llywydd:** Datganaf fod y sesiwn ar ben. **The Presiding Officer:** I declare this session closed. I thank Members for their co-operation.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.13 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.13 p.m.*