



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 23 Tachwedd 2010
Tuesday, 23 November 2010**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer
- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 30 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes
Business Statement and Announcement
- 36 Datganiad Deddfwriaethol am y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Tai (Cymru)
Legislative Statement on the Proposed Housing (Wales) Measure
- 47 Datganiad am Ganolfannau Busnes Technium
Statement on Technium Business Centres
- 61 Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Eithriadau Gwarchod Plant a Gofal Dydd (Cymru)
2010
Motion to Approve the Child Minding and Day Care Exceptions (Wales) Order 2010
- 65 Gwasanaethau Gyrfaoedd
Careers Services
- 84 Y Cynnydd o ran Rhoi Rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un' Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar Waith
Progress in Implementing the Welsh Assembly Government's 'One Wales' Programme
- 104 Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw ar y Prif Weinidog i ateb cwestiynau, carwn longyfarch yr Aelod Cynulliad Jenny Randerson ar ei phenodiad i ail Dŷ'r Deyrnas Unedig. Hoffwn gyplu â'i henw fy ngwir anrhydeddus gyfaill, Dafydd Wigley, cyn-Aelod Cynulliad, a hefyd Eluned Morgan, y cyn-Aelod Seneddol Ewropeaidd, sydd wedi cydweithio â ni dros y blynyddoedd. Yr wyf yn falch o'r ffaith bod bellach bedwar ohonom yn Aelodau neu'n gyn-Aelodau Cynulliad sydd hefyd yn aelodau o'r ail Dŷ. Gobeithiaf y gallwn i gyd ddefnyddio ein dylanwad yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf er lles datganoli, ac er lles Cymru. Llongyfarchiadau mawr, Jenny. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

The Presiding Officer: Before I call the First Minister to answer questions, I would like to congratulate Assembly Member Jenny Randerson on her appointment to the United Kingdom's second House. I link with her name that of my right honourable friend, former Assembly Member Dafydd Wigley, and Eluned Morgan, former Member of the European Parliament, who has worked with us over the years. I am pleased that there will now be four Assembly Members or former Assembly Members sitting in the second House. I hope that we will all be able to use our influence over the coming years for the benefit of devolution, and for the benefit of Wales. Congratulations, Jenny. [*Applause.*]

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1, OAQ(3)3246(FM), yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 1, OAQ(3)3246(FM), has been withdrawn.

Proses Ddeddfwriaethol

2. Leanne Wood: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am brosesau deddfwriaethol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.* OAQ(3)3252(FM)

The First Minister (Carwyn Jones): The Counsel General has recently conducted a review of the Welsh Assembly Government's legislative processes. He is expected to present his findings to Cabinet shortly.

Leanne Wood: In March, the Welsh electorate will get the chance to get rid of our inefficient legislative competence Order process. Earlier this month, my office conducted research that showed just how bureaucratic the present system is. The 16 LCOs that have been referred to both Houses of Parliament since 2007 have languished, awaiting consent, for a combined total of more than nine years. Welsh laws, which only affect Wales, and which are needed

Legislative Process

2. Leanne Wood: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's legislative processes.* OAQ(3)3252(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones): Yn ddiweddar, cynhaliodd y Cwnsler Cyffredinol adolygiad o brosesau deddfwriaethol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Disgwylir y bydd yn cyflwyno ei ganfyddiadau i'r Cabinet cyn bo hir.

Leanne Wood: Ym mis Mawrth, caiff etholwyr Cymru gyfle i gael gwared â phroses aneffeithlon ein Gorchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol. Yn gynharach y mis hwn, cynhaliodd fy swyddfa ymchwil a ddangosodd mor fiwrocraidaidd yw'r system bresennol. Mae'r 16 LCO a gyfeiriwyd at ddau Dŷ'r Senedd er 2007 wedi nychu, yn aros am gydsyniad, am gyfanswm o dros naw mlynedd. Mae cyfreithiau i Gymru, sy'n effeithio ar Gymru'n unig, ac sydd eu hangen

right now, are being hindered for an unacceptable amount of time. Furthermore, the legislative process has also been found to be more expensive in its current form. When you factor in that we have a cuts-happy coalition Government in the UK, which has shown hostility to our nation, do you agree that the primary focus of all Assembly Members needs to be on winning a 'yes' vote in next March's referendum?

The First Minister: Yes, I agree. The system will be far cheaper, far more effective and far more efficient. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I was intending to call a Welsh Conservative, but I would like to hear the First Minister's response. Can we get back to some courtesy? You are not the worst offender, by the way.

Gorffennwch eich ateb, Brif Weinidog.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi gorffen.

Mark Isherwood: The Counsel General has described the process of transferring legislative powers through LCOs to the Assembly as repetitive and expensive, costing £2 million a year. During the last Assembly, after the Richard commission reported, I was approached by a Labour MP offering a deal with the Conservatives to sabotage the Richard proposals for full working powers by 2011. Subsequent to that, you held a special conference in north Wales, where you agreed to impose what Labour's Lord Richard described as a tortuous route, which has proved ruinously expensive. What assurances can you provide now that Welsh Labour Members—in Westminster as well as here—will be supportive as we move forward to take out this unfortunate, tortuous dog's breakfast?

The First Minister: The Welsh Labour Party is fully committed to a 'yes' vote. That applies wherever people sit, and it is something that my party voted for in 2007.

Cyflawni Ymrwymïadau 'Cymru'n Un'

3. **Mohammad Asghar:** Pa asesiad y mae'r

nawr, yn cael eu llesteirio am gyfnod annerbyniol. Hefyd, canfuwyd bod ffurf bresennol y broses deddfwriaethol yn ddrotach. Ac ystyried bod gennym Lywodraeth glymblaid yn y DU sy'n hoff o doriadau, ac wedi dangos gelyniaeth tuag at ein cenedl, a ydych yn cytuno bod angen i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad ganolbwyntio'n bennaf ar ennill pleidlais 'ie' yn y refferendwm fis Mawrth nesaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydw, yr wyf yn cytuno. Bydd y system yn llawer rhatach, yn llawer mwy effeithiol ac yn llawer mwy effeithlon. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr oeddwn yn bwriadu galw ar un o Geidwadwyr Cymru, ond hoffwn glywed ateb y Prif Weinidog. A gawn rywfaint o gwrteisi? Nid chi yw'r troseddwr gwaethaf, gyda llaw.

Finish your answer, First Minister.

The First Minister: I have finished.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol wedi disgrifio'r broses o drosglwyddo pwerau deddfwriaethol drwy gyfrwng LCOs i'r Cynulliad fel proses ailadroddus a drud sy'n costio £2 filiwn y flwyddyn. Yn ystod y Cynulliad diwethaf, wedi i gomisiwn Richard adrodd, daeth AS Llafur ataf i gynnig bargaen gyda'r Ceidwadwyr i danseilio cynigion Richard am bwerau gweithio llawn erbyn 2011. Wedi hynny, cynalïasoch gynhadledd arbennig yn y gogledd, lle cytunasoch i ddefnyddio llwybr y galwodd yr Arglwydd Richard o'r blaidd Llafur yn un trofaus, ac sydd wedi bod yn ddinistriol o ddrudd. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch chi ei rhoi nawr y bydd Aelodau Llafur Cymru—yn San Steffan ac yma—yn gefnogol wrth inni symud ymlaen i gael gwared â'r llanastr anffodus a throfaus hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Plaid Lafur Cymru'n gwbl ymroddedig i bleidlais 'ie'. Mae hynny'n berthnasol ble bynnag mae pobl yn eistedd, a phleidleisiodd fy mhlaidd o blaidd hynny yn 2007.

Achieving 'One Wales' Commitments

3. **Mohammad Asghar:** What assessment has

Prif Weinidog wedi'i wneud o'r tebygolrwydd y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cyflawni ei hymrwymadau Cymru'n Un erbyn diwedd y Trydydd Cynulliad. OAQ(3)3254(FM)

the First Minister made of the likelihood of the Welsh Assembly Government achieving its One Wales commitments by the end of the Third Assembly. OAQ(3)3254(FM)

The First Minister: The expected delivery dates for those commitments that are still outstanding are shown in the recent update of the 'One Wales' delivery plan, which was published on 17 November 2010.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r dyddiadau y disgwylir cyflenwi'r ymrwymadau sydd heb gael eu cwblhau wedi'u dangos yn niweddariad diweddar cynllun cyflenwi 'Cymru'n Un', a gyhoeddwyd ar 17 Tachwedd 2010.

Mohammad Asghar: 'One Wales' contains a number of commitments linked to health, and, most notably, aspires to the development of a world-class health service. Given that the NHS in Wales often lags behind England in so many key indicators, such as the ambulance service, response times and waiting lists, that stroke services have been labelled as scandalously bad, and that dementia services have been earmarked as the worst in the United Kingdom, are you confident that your Government is achieving this? Given that 75 per cent of the Welsh public oppose the real term cuts to the Welsh NHS that are planned by your Government over the next three years, do you think that the Welsh Assembly Government is showing enough commitment to the future development of a world-class health service in Wales?

Mohammad Ashgar: Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn cynnwys nifer o ymrwymadau cysylltiedig ag iechyd, a'i uchelgais amlycaf yw datblygu gwasanaeth iechyd o safon fyd-eang. Ac ystyried bod y GIG yng Nghymru'n aml ar ei hôl hi o gymharu â Lloegr o ran cynifer o ddangosyddion allweddol, megis y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, amseroedd ymateb a rhestri aros, bod gwasanaethau strôc mor ddrwg nes iddynt gael eu labelu'n sgandal, a bod gwasanaethau dementia wedi'u clustnodi y gwaethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a ydych yn hyderus bod eich Llywodraeth yn cyflawni hyn? Ac ystyried bod 75 y cant o gyhoedd Cymru'n gwrthwynebu'r toriadau termau real i'r GIG yng Nghymru y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cynllunio dros y tair blynedd nesaf, a ydych yn meddwl bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dangos o ymrwymiad i ddatblygu gwasanaeth iechyd o safon fyd-eang yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol?

The First Minister: I would like to know who made those comments; I notice that you do not say who made them—I wonder if they were ever made. We are ahead of England on many indicators. If you look at referral-to-treatment times, particularly those waiting more than 52 weeks for treatment, 20,800-plus patients have been waiting for treatment following referral for more than 52 weeks in England. In Wales, the figure is 11—not 11,000, but 11 people. On your point about the budget, your party has singularly failed to outline exactly how it would pay for its spending plans. Apparently, the Welsh public will be told by Christmas; well, that is very good of you. Last week, we heard your leader say that it was a priority that you should cut 24 per cent from the education budget in Wales. That was confirmed, eventually, by Andrew R.T. Davies on Radio Wales the

Y Prif Weinidog: Hoffwn wybod pwy wnaeth y sylwadau hynny; sylwaf nad ydych yn dweud pwy a'u gwnaeth—yr wyf yn tybed a gawsant eu gwneud erioed. Yr ydym o flaen Lloegr yn ôl nifer o ddangosyddion. Os edrychwch ar amseroedd atgyfeirio-i-driniaeth, yn enwedig i'r rheini sy'n aros am dros 52 wythnos am driniaeth, mae dros 20,800 o gleifion wedi bod yn aros am driniaeth ar ôl atgyfeiriad am dros 52 wythnos yn Lloegr. Yng Nghymru, y ffigur yw 11—nid 11,000, ond 11 o bobl. O ran eich pwynt am y gyllideb, mae eich plaid wedi methu'n lân ag amlinellu sut yn union y byddai'n talu am ei chynlluniau gwario. Mae'n debyg y caiff cyhoedd Cymru wybod erbyn y Nadolig; chwarae teg i chi, wir. Yr wythnos diwethaf, clywsom eich arweinydd yn dweud ei bod yn flaenoriaeth y dylech dorri 24 y cant oddi ar y gyllideb addysg yng

following morning. On television that evening, Nick Ramsay said that the money for health would come out of the culture budget. It is a complete shambles, Llywydd.

Rhodri Morgan: Will you give your observations on the fact that, from time to time, some 'One Wales' commitments need a bit of back up and common sense collaboration from the Westminster Government? In that context, will you comment on the latest figures about the way in which the Future Jobs fund termination will affect our ability to bring down the numbers who are not in education, employment or training? In Cardiff, for example, up until July, which are the last figures available, because it has been terminated since then, 220 18 to 24-year-olds had started on Future Jobs fund projects. That is not as many as in Rhondda Cynon Taf, which had 570, but it was a very healthy figure nevertheless. What feedback have you had from the Westminster Government about what will replace those lost Future Jobs fund places?

The First Minister: There is nothing planned, as far as I can see. There is no commitment as strong as the commitments made by the previous Government to bringing people back into work. We will have to wait and see.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): More people per head of population in Wales die of cancer than in England and the United Kingdom as a whole. Given the concerns that we must all have about cancer sufferers in Wales, do you think that they are receiving the best care available? What more should we be doing in Wales in the light of those statistics?

The First Minister: The latest figures, from the end of September of this year, show that the 31-day cancer target was being met. Performance against the 31-day target remained above 98 per cent, at 98.5 per cent, which was the twelfth month in a row that this target had been achieved at an all-Wales

Nghymru. Cadarnhawyd hynny, yn y pen draw, gan Andrew R.T. Davies ar Radio Wales fore drannoeth. Ar y teledu y noswaith honno, dywedodd Nick Ramsay y byddai'r arian am iechyd yn dod o'r gyllideb diwylliant. Mae'n llanastr llwyr, Lywydd.

Rhodri Morgan: A rowch eich arsylwadau am y ffaith bod, o bryd i'w gilydd, angen rhywfaint o gefnogaeth a chydweithredu synnwyr cyffredin gan Lywodraeth San Steffan er mwyn cyflawni rhai o ymrwymadau 'Cymru'n Un'? Yn y cyddestun hwnnw, a rowch sylwadau am y ffigurau diweddaraf am sut y bydd diddymu cronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol yn effeithio ar ein gallu i ostwng y niferoedd nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant? Yng Nghaerdydd, er enghraifft, hyd at fis Gorffennaf, sef y ffigurau diweddaraf sydd ar gael, gan y cafodd ei diddymu er hynny, yr oedd 220 o bobl 18 i 24 oed wedi dechrau ar brosiectau cronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol. Nid yw hynny'n gynifer ag yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, lle'r oedd y ffigur yn 570, ond yr oedd yn ffigur iach iawn serch hynny. Pa adborth yr ydych wedi'i gael gan Lywodraeth San Steffan am yr hyn a fydd yn cymryd lle'r lleoedd hynny a gollwyd yng nghronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes dim byd wedi'i gynllunio, cyn belled ag y gwelaf. Nid oes dim ymrwymiad mor gryf ag ymrwymadau'r Llywodraeth flaenorol i ddod â phobl yn ôl i'r gwaith. Cawn weld.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Mae cyfran uwch o boblogaeth Cymru'n marw o ganser nag o boblogaeth Lloegr a'r Deyrnas Unedig gyfan. Ac ystyried ein pryderon ni i gyd am ddiodefwrwr canser yng Nghymru, a ydych yn meddwl eu bod yn cael y gofal gorau sydd ar gael? Pa beth yn rhagor y dylem fod yn ei wneud yng Nghymru ac ystyried yr ystadegau hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf, o ddiwedd mis Medi eleni, yn dangos bod y targed canser 31 diwrnod yn cael ei gyrraedd. Yr oedd perfformiad yn erbyn y targed 31 diwrnod yn dal i fod dros 98 y cant, ar 98.5 y cant, sef y deuddegfed mis yn olynol i'r targed hwn gael ei gyrraedd

level. The indications, as far as cancer is concerned, are that our targets are working, but it is right to say that there is still much to be done to tackle cancer, and we all hope to see new treatments emerge over the next few years.

Nick Bourne: That answer does not deal with the relative position, on which I assume you agree, namely that it is a worse position, sadly, than in England or the UK as a whole. I note and welcome what you say about new treatments becoming available. I take it, therefore, that you welcome the coalition agreement at Westminster and the delivery of the £50 million cancer drugs fund, which is allowing people to be treated with drugs in England. However, those drugs are being denied to people in Wales. Will you have a look at that?

The First Minister: People are not being denied drugs in Wales that are available in England. I do not know whether you saw *The Times* yesterday, but it was clear that the new fund has been accessed by only a handful of people since its introduction. It is right to say that we should try to ensure that the right drugs are available to treat the right people in Wales, but creating a specific fund does not take things any further.

Nick Bourne: You are wrong; people in Wales are being denied Avastin, for example, which is available in England. So, you are absolutely wrong on the basic premise that people are not being denied drugs in Wales; they are being denied drugs that are available in England. You are right that the uptake has not been as good as it could be in England as yet, but that is irrelevant. There are people in Wales who could have their lives prolonged by drugs that are not available in Wales but are available in England. Do you deplore that, and will you look at that so that those cancer sufferers can access those drugs in Wales?

1.40 p.m.

The First Minister: You have mentioned one drug, but we try to follow the guidelines of the National Institute for Health and

ar lefel Cymru gyfan. Mae'n ymddangos, cyn belled ag y mae canser dan sylw, bod ein targedau'n gweithio, ond mae'n deg dweud bod llawer i'w wneud o hyd i fynd i'r afael â chanser, ac yr ydym i gyd yn gobeithio gweld triniaethau newydd yn ymddangos dros y blynyddoedd nesaf.

Nick Bourne: Nid yw'r ateb hwnnw'n delio â'r sefyllfa gymharol, y tybiaf eich bod yn cytuno â hi, sef ei bod yn sefyllfa waeth, yn anffodus, nag yn Lloegr neu'r DU gyfan. Nodaf a chroesawaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am driniaethau newydd yn ymddangos. Cymeraf, felly, eich bod yn croesawu cytundeb y glymblaid yn San Steffan a chyflenwi'r gronfa cyffuriau canser gwerth £50 miliwn, sy'n galluogi pobl yn Lloegr i gael eu trin â chyffuriau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cyffuriau hynny ar gael i bobl yng Nghymru. A edrychwch ar hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes cyffuriau ar gael yn Lloegr sy'n cael eu gwrthod i bobl Cymru. Ni wn a welsoch *The Times* ddoe, ond yr oedd yn glir mai dim ond llond dwrn o bobl sydd wedi cael defnyddio'r gronfa newydd ers iddi gael ei chyflwyno. Mae'n deg dweud y dylem geisio sicrhau bod y cyffuriau priodol ar gael i drin y bobl briodol yng Nghymru, ond nid yw creu cronfa benodol yn mynd â phethau ddim pellach.

Nick Bourne: Yr ydych yn anghywir; mae Avastin yn cael ei wrthod i bobl Cymru, er enghraifft, ac mae ar gael yn Lloegr. Felly yr ydych yn gwbl anghywir yn sylfaenol wrth ddweud nad oes cyffuriau'n cael eu gwrthod i bobl Cymru; maent yn cael eu gwrthod er eu bod ar gael yn Lloegr. Yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch nad oes cymaint â phosibl ohono wedi cael ei ddefnyddio yn Lloegr eto, ond mae hynny'n amherthnasol. Mae cyffuriau ar gael yn Lloegr, ond nid yng Nghymru, a allai ymestyn bywydau pobl yng Nghymru. A ydych yn gresynu wrth hynny, ac a edrychwch ar hynny fel bod y cyffuriau hynny ar gael i'r dioddefwyr canser hynny yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych wedi crybwyll un cyffur, ond yr ydym yn ceisio dilyn canllawiau'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros

Clinical Excellence. We do not know what the situation is in England. It is still unclear as to what NICE's position will be, and whether its advice will be heeded. It seems that, in England, the blame for drugs not being available will be shifted from NICE on to the shoulders of GPs, because it is not clear who, ultimately, will have the responsibility for ensuring that drugs are available. As I have said, the creation of a separate fund does not mean that a particular range of drugs will, necessarily, be available in England but not in Wales. As we saw from the article in *The Times* yesterday, a very small number of people indeed have access to that fund.

Nick Bourne: I come back to the point that you denied that there were people in Wales who are not getting drugs that are available in England. That is not the case. Avastin, which was made available temporarily in Wales by the Minister until the NICE guidelines were issued, has now been withdrawn from some patients. Will you look at that and at the benefits that people in England are getting via the ability to access this drugs fund, which is not available in Wales, and is unlikely to be, given the way that you have committed not to fund the health service and not to protect the health service?

The First Minister: This has nothing to do with money. It is to do with the guidance given to us by NICE. NICE looks at drugs to assess how effective they might be, and how cost effective they might be. This is not to do with a lack of money in Wales; it is to do with following the advice of experts. Again, I come back to the point that you have not demonstrated to the people of Wales how you would pay for the commitments that you say that you would make on health. You have said imperiously that you will let the people of Wales know by Christmas. That is not good enough: tell us now.

Nick Bourne: First, you are not here to ask me questions, but the other way around. Let me remind you of that. I have made it absolutely—[*Interruption.*] It did not sound particularly good, but I look forward to him having the opportunity to hone his skills as

Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol. Nid ydym yn gwybod beth yw'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr. Mae'n aneglur o hyd beth fydd safbwynt NICE, ac a ddilynir eu cyngor. Mae'n ymddangos, yn Lloegr, mai meddygon teulu, yn hytrach na NICE, sy'n cael y bai am gyffuriau nad ydynt ar gael, gan nad yw'n glir pwy, yn y pen draw, fydd yn gyfrifol am sicrhau bod cyffuriau ar gael. Fel y dywedais, nid yw creu cronfa ar wahân yn golygu y bydd cyfres benodol o gyffuriau o reidrwydd ar gael yn Lloegr ond nid yng Nghymru. Fel y gwelsom yn yr erthygl yn *The Times* ddoe, dim ond i nifer bach iawn o bobl y mae'r gronfa honno ar gael mewn gwirionedd.

Nick Bourne: Dychwelaf at y pwynt eich bod wedi gwadu bod pobl yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn cael cyffuriau sydd ar gael yn Lloegr. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae Avastin, a oedd ar gael dros dro yng Nghymru, diolch i'r Gweinidog, nes i ganllawiau NICE gael eu cyhoeddi, bellach wedi'i dynnu'n ôl oddi wrth rai cleifion. A edrychwch ar hynny ac ar y buddion y mae pobl yn Lloegr yn eu cael gan fod y gronfa gyffuriau hon ar gael iddynt, er nad yw ar gael yng Nghymru, a'i bod yn annhebygol y bydd, ac ystyried y modd yr ydych wedi ymrwymo i beidio ag ariannu'r gwasanaeth iechyd nac amddiffyn y gwasanaeth iechyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim ag arian. Mae'n ymwneud â'r canllawiau a roddir i ni gan NICE. Mae NICE yn edrych ar gyffuriau ac yn asesu pa mor effeithiol y gallant fod, a pha mor gost effeithiol y gallant fod. Nid mater o ddiffyg arian yng Nghymru yw hwn; mater o ddilyn cyngor arbenigwyr ydyw. Eto, dychwelaf at y pwynt nad ydych wedi dangos i bobl Cymru sut y byddech yn talu am yr ymrwymadau y dywedwch y byddech yn eu gwneud ym maes iechyd. Yr ydych wedi dweud yn awdurdodus y rhwch wybod i bobl Cymru erbyn y Nadolig. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da: dywedwch wrthym nawr.

Nick Bourne: Yn gyntaf, nid ydych yma i ofyn cwestiynau i mi, ond i'r gwrthwyneb. Gadewch imi eich atgoffa o hynny. Yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn gwbl—[*Torri ar draws.*] Nid oedd yn swnio'n arbennig o dda, ond edrychaf ymlaen iddo gael ei gyfle i hogi ei

leader of the opposition. Let us be clear: this is about cancer sufferers in Wales. It has nothing to do with NICE guidelines. People in England are getting a drug that is being denied cancer sufferers in Wales. You said that it has nothing to do with money, but then you said that it was an issue of whether the drug was cost-effective or not. If it is about cost-effectiveness, then that seems to be an issue of money, so can we be clear on this? Are people in Wales being denied this drug on the basis of its not being cost-effective, which is what you have just said?

The First Minister: NICE looks at many factors, and cost-effectiveness is one of those factors. Drugs companies produce drugs, and they want to make profits, so they push the products that they put on the market. That is why you have to have an independent body to assess the claims of the drugs companies and to determine whether the drug is as effective as is claimed. That is why we have NICE as an independent body to do that work. I think that I have a perfect right to ask you about your budget proposals. Your party has said that you want to find between £880 million and £1.3 billion from the Welsh budget to pay for your health promises, but you have not said from where that will come. We know that you will cut education; that will take £700 million straight out of the schools budget. You have been upfront about that, but from where will the rest of the money come? I have a right to ask, as do the people of Wales, and you must answer.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr oedd y cwestiwn gwreiddiol yn ymwneud ag ymrwymiadau 'Cymru'n Un'. A fydddech yn cytuno bod ymrwymiadau 'Cymru'n Un' wedi'u seilio ar ddarparu gwasanaethau o'r safon uchaf i bobl Cymru, a bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn am dair blynedd yn gwneud hynny? Hyd yn oed yn wyneb y toriadau sydd yn cael eu gorfodi arnom, yr ydym yn parhau i wneud hynny, gyda'r gyllideb ddrafft yn dangos bod gwasanaethau wedi'u diogelu. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol, am y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, wedi sôn am £1 biliwn nad yw'n cael ei wario'n effeithiol o

sgiliau fel arweinydd yr wrthblaid. Dewch i ni fod yn glir: mae hyn yn ymwneud â dioddefwyr canser yng Nghymru. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â chanllawiau NICE. Mae pobl yn Lloegr yn cael cyffur sy'n cael ei wrthod i ddioddefwyr canser yng Nghymru. Dywedasoeh nad oes a wnelo hyn ddim ag arian, ond yna dywedasoeh ei fod yn fater o ba mor gost effeithiol yw'r cyffur. Os yw'n ymwneud â chost effeithiolrwydd, mae'n ymddangos mai mater ariannol yw hynny, felly a allwn fod yn glir am hyn? A yw'r cyffur hwn yn cael ei wrthod i bobl yng Nghymru gan nad yw'n gost effeithiol, sef yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae NICE yn edrych ar nifer o ffactorau, ac mae cost effeithiolrwydd yn un o'r ffactorau hyn. Mae cwmnïau cyffuriau'n cynhyrchu cyffuriau, ac mae arnynt eisiau gwneud elw, felly maent yn gwrthio'r cynhyrchion y maent yn eu rhoi ar y farchnad. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid i chi gael corff annibynnol i asesu hawliadau'r cwmnïau cyffuriau a phenderfynu a yw'r cyffur mor effeithiol ag y maent yn ei hawlio. Dyna pam mae gennym NICE fel corff annibynnol i wneud y gwaith hwnnw. Credaf fod gennyf berffaith hawl i ofyn i chi am eich cynigion cyllidebol. Mae eich plaid wedi dweud bod arnoch eisiau dod o hyd i rhwng £880 miliwn a £1.3 biliwn yng nghyllideb Cymru i dalu am eich addewidion iechyd, ond nid ydych wedi dweud o ble y daw'r arian hwnnw. Yr ydym yn gwybod eich bod am dorri addysg; bydd hynny'n cymryd £700 miliwn yn syth o gyllideb yr ysgolion. Yr ydych wedi bod yn onest am hynny, ond o ble y daw gweddill yr arian? Mae gennyf hawl i ofyn, fel pobl Cymru, a rhaid ichi ateb.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The original question was about 'One Wales'. Do you agree that the 'One Wales' commitments are based upon providing the highest quality services to the people of Wales, and that the One Wales Government has been very successful for three years in doing that? Even in the face of the cuts that are being forced upon us, we continue to do that, with the draft budget showing that services have been protected. The Conservative Party, for the past year, has been talking about £1 billion not being spent effectively in the health budget, but it wishes to protect the budget in its entirety rather than

fewn y gyllideb iechyd, ond maent am ddiogelu'r gyllideb yn ei chyfanrwydd yn hytrach na diogelu'r gwasanaethau. Wrth wneud hynny, maent am danseilio gwasanaethau mewn meysydd hollbwysig eraill, megis addysg.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae llawer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb gan y Torïaid. Nid ydym wedi cael ateb hyd yn hyn. Yr ydym wedi bod yn agored gyda phobl Cymru, er nad yw'r pleidiau eraill yn y Siambr wedi bod.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): First Minister, in 2004, your Government spent £1.9 million on external consultants. Last year, that figure soared to almost £12 million. That is £32,000 a day—more than most people in Wales earn in a year. You have just published your draft budget. What do you propose to spend on external consultants next year?

The First Minister: We do not propose to spend a planned amount of money on external consultants. I have sent the message to all departments that I expect external consultants to be used as little as possible in the future.

Kirsty Williams: You do not say how you expect those departments to deliver on that promise. You have just spent months and months considering this draft budget, so it is surprising that you do not have figures to hand. Could you explain to us what the Welsh taxpayer has got from that £12 million-worth of consultancy last year?

The First Minister: There are occasions when expertise that does not exist within the Welsh Assembly Government has to be brought in in order to provide advice, and that has been the case for many years. However, I can say now that I do not expect to see external consultants being used in the future unless there are exceptional reasons for doing so.

Kirsty Williams: It would be helpful if you could give us an example of whether such advice has led to better policy or perhaps

protect services. In doing so, they want to undermine services in other crucial areas, such as education.

The First Minister: The Tories have left many questions unanswered. We have not had an answer as yet. We have been open with the people of Wales, although other parties in the Chamber have not.

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Brif Weinidog, yn 2004, gwariodd eich Llywodraeth £1.9 miliwn ar ymgynghorwyr allanol. Y llynedd, cododd y ffigur hwnnw i bron £12 miliwn. Mae hynny'n £32,000 y dydd—mwy nag y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru'n ei ennill mewn blwyddyn. Yr ydych newydd gyhoeddi eich cyllideb ddrafft. Faint yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wario ar ymgynghorwyr allanol y flwyddyn nesaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid ydym yn bwriadu gwario swm penodol o arian ar ymgynghorwyr allanol. Yr wyf wedi anfon y neges i bob adran fy mod yn disgwyl i ymgynghorwyr allanol gael eu defnyddio cyn lleied â phosibl yn y dyfodol.

Kirsty Williams: Nid ydych yn dweud sut yr ydych yn disgwyl i'r adrannau hynny wireddu'r addewid hwnnw. Yr ydych newydd dreulio misoedd ar fisoedd yn ystyried y gyllideb ddrafft hon, felly mae'n syndod nad yw'r ffigurau wrth law gennyh. A allech egluro inni beth mae trethdalwyr Cymru wedi'i gael o'r gwerth £12 miliwn hwnnw o ymgynghori'r llynedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar achlysuron, bydd angen prynu arbenigedd nad yw'n bodoli o fewn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn rhoi cyngor, ac mae hynny wedi bod yn wir ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud nawr nad wyf yn disgwyl gweld ymgynghorwyr allanol yn cael eu defnyddio yn y dyfodol oni bai bod rhesymau eithriadol dros wneud hynny.

Kirsty Williams: Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gallech roi enghraifft inni o gyngor o'r fath yn arwain at bolisi gwell neu efallai at arbed

even to some money being saved. Last week, the UK Government announced that it would publish all Government expenditure over £25,000 in the interests of transparency. Will you commit to doing the same so that we can judge you on the commitment that you have just made that your department will spend less on consultancy?

The First Minister: You can ask that at any time. However, I can give you the example of the PricewaterhouseCoopers report on school effectiveness. That was extremely useful and it enabled Ministers to take decisions for the good of schools.

Kirsty Williams: I will ask you again. The Westminster Government has decided to publish all expenditure over £25,000 in the interests of transparency. You have just made a commitment that your Government will spend less on consultancy next year. Will you publish the figures so that we can hold you to account? You used to be the Minister for open government; what are you so afraid of?

The First Minister: The figures are available and can be made available to you on request.

Kirsty Williams: With all due respect, I do not want to request the figures; I think that the public has the right to see how you are spending its money. You spend all your time saying that there is no money to be spent; let us see your Government publish, in the same way as Westminster is doing, every single item of expenditure over £25,000 so that you can truly be held to account for how you use Welsh taxpayers' money. It is not about the information being available on request; it should be available as a matter of course so that the Welsh public can see what you are doing with its cash.

The First Minister: I am sorry if I have knocked you off script, but, as I have said before, these figures are available, and I would be pleased to furnish you with the figures if you request them.

Irene James: The commitment to education and training is a cornerstone of the 'One

rhywfaint o arian, hyd yn oed. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU y byddai'n cyhoeddi holl wariant y Llywodraeth dros £25,000 er tryloywder. A ymrowch i wneud yr un fath fel y gallwn eich barnu ar yr ymrwymiad yr ydych newydd ei wneud y bydd eich adran yn gwario llai ar ymgynghori?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cewch ofyn hynny unrhyw bryd. Fodd bynnag, gallaf roi i chi enghraifft adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers am effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Yr oedd hwnnw'n ddefnyddiol iawn ac yn galluogi Gweinidogion i wneud penderfyniadau er lles ysgolion.

Kirsty Williams: Gofynnaf ichi eto. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi penderfynu cyhoeddi pob gwariant dros £25,000 er tryloywder. Yr ydych newydd wneud ymrwymiad y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn gwario llai ar ymgynghori'r flwyddyn nesaf. A gyhoedddech y ffigurau fel y gallwn eich galw i gyfrif? Yr oeddech yn arfer bod yn Weinidog Llywodraeth agored; beth sy'n codi cymaint o ofn arnoch?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ffigurau ar gael a gallwch eu gweld ar gais.

Kirsty Williams: Gyda phob dyledus barch, nid wyf yn dymuno gofyn am y ffigurau; credaf fod gan y cyhoedd hawl i weld sut yr ydych yn gwario eu harian. Yr ydych yn treulio eich holl amser yn dweud nad oes dim arian i'w wario; gadewch inni weld eich llywodraeth yn cyhoeddi, fel y mae San Steffan yn ei wneud, pob gwariant dros £25,000 er mwyn inni allu eich galw i gyfrif am sut yr ydych yn defnyddio arian trethdalwyr Cymru. Nid yw'n fater o gael y wybodaeth ar gael ar gais; dylai fod ar gael yn ôl yr arfer fel y gall cyhoedd Cymru weld beth yr ydych yn ei wneud â'u harian.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os wyf wedi eich taro oddi ar eich sgript, ond fel y dywedais eisoes, mae'r ffigurau hyn ar gael, a byddai'n bleser gennyf roi'r ffigurau i chi pe baech yn gofyn amdanynt.

Irene James: Mae'r ymrwymiad i addysg a hyfforddiant yn un o gonglfeini cytundeb

Wales' agreement. A large part of any education and training strategy is a good-quality careers advice service. Craig Lewis, in my constituency, was helped back into work by Careers Wales Gwent. He said of the service that Careers Wales Gwent pointed him in the right direction as to what he needed to do, and it gave him the confidence needed to do it. First Minister, do you agree that the opposition's plans to cut massive amounts from such budgets will harm people like Craig throughout Wales?

The First Minister: There is absolutely no doubt that the Tories' planned 24 per cent cut to education would harm our children's chances in the future.

Perfformiad y Gwasanaeth Iechyd

4. Peter Black: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol. OAQ(3)3253(FM)*

The First Minister: The Minister monitors performance and regularly meets LHB chairs to drive forward service improvements. Additionally, monthly meetings are held between each LHB and senior Welsh Assembly Government officials.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, First Minister. You will be aware that I have raised with you previously the issue of the accident and emergency units at Morriston Hospital and the Princess of Wales Hospital, particularly the fact that they are not meeting their four-hour target. On at least one occasion, 10 ambulances were held in line outside Morriston Hospital, waiting to offload patients. Will you publish the number of hours lost by ambulances as a result of these logjams at accident and emergency departments, and of the failure to meet the four-hour target?

The First Minister: If it is possible to provide such figures, I see no reason why they cannot be provided to you.

Val Lloyd: Will you join me in welcoming the research reported in Friday's *The Guardian* that the NHS in Wales, Scotland,

'Cymru'n Un'. Mae gwasanaeth cyngor gyrfa o safon yn rhan fawr o unrhyw strategaeth addysg a hyfforddiant. Cafodd Craig Lewis, yn fy etholaeth i, ei helpu'n ôl i'r gwaith gan Gyrfa Cymru Gwent. Dywedodd am y gwasanaeth fod Gyrfa Cymru Gwent wedi ei roi ar y trywydd cywir o ran beth oedd angen iddo ei wneud, a bod hyn wedi rhoi iddo'r hyder yr oedd ei angen i wneud hynny. Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno y bydd cynlluniau'r wrthblaid i dorri symiau mor enfawr o gyllidebau o'r fath yn niweidio pobl megis Craig ledled Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes dim amheuaeth o gwbl y byddai'r toriad 24 y cant ar addysg y mae'r Torïaid yn ei gynllunio'n niweidio cyfleoedd ein plant yn y dyfodol.

Performance of the Health Service

4. Peter Black: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the performance of the National Health Service. OAQ(3)3253(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog yn monitro perfformiad ac yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â chadeiryddion Byrddau Iechyd Lleol i sbarduno gwelliannau i wasanaethau. Hefyd, cynhelir cyfarfodydd misol rhwng pob BILL ac uwch swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Peter Black: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod eisoes wedi sôn am fater unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru, yn enwedig y ffaith nad ydynt yn cyrraedd eu targed pedair awr. Ar un achlysur o leiaf, cafodd 10 ambiwlans eu dal mewn rhes y tu allan i Ysbyty Treforys, yn aros i ddadlwytho cleifion. A gyhoeddwch nifer yr oriau a gollir gan ambiwlansys o ganlyniad i'r tagfeydd hyn mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac o ganlyniad i'r methiant i gyrraedd y targed pedair awr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Os yw'n bosibl darparu ffigurau o'r fath, ni welaf ddim rheswm pam na ellid eu rhoi i chi.

Val Lloyd: A ymunwch â mi wrth groesawu'r ymchwil a nodwyd yn *The Guardian* ddydd Gwener mai'r GIG yng

England and Northern Ireland is the only one of 11 leading countries where wealth does not determine access to care? Do you agree that continuing the range of universal benefits contributes to this access and maintains the cost-effectiveness of the NHS, a fact that was also reported in that newspaper?

The First Minister: All of us would applaud the fact that the NHS delivers a service that is free at the point of need. We as a Government are determined to maintain that.

Alun Davies: Will you join me in thanking the NHS staff who helped to deliver the 1000 Lives Campaign by driving through changes in the way we combat infections, deal with surgical complications, and work with the patient as part of a medical team? This project has saved nearly 2,000 lives in Wales. As well as delivering that, NHS staff are also delivering life-saving changes to NHS medical services day in, day out.

The First Minister: Absolutely, and I reiterate what you said, in that more than 1,000 thank-yous can be made to NHS staff, and that shows how effective the campaign has been.

1.50 p.m.

Grwpiau Difreintiedig

5. Chris Franks: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gefnogi grwpiau difreintiedig yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. OAQ(3)3251(FM)*

The First Minister: The Assembly Government supports disadvantaged groups in Rhondda Cynon Taf and across Wales.

Chris Franks: I am concerned that there are still poor levels of literacy and numeracy in areas of Rhondda Cynon Taf. What is the Welsh Government doing to tackle those problems, and what discussions has the Government had with Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council on improving education standards? Would you agree, First

Nghymru, yr Alban, Lloegr a Gogledd Iwerddon yw'r unig un o 11 gwlad flaenllaw lle nad yw cyfoeth yn pennu pwy sy'n cael gofal? A ydych yn cytuno bod parhau â'r ystod o fuddion cyffredinol yn cyfrannu at y gofal sydd ar gael ac yn cynnal cost effeithiolrwydd y GIG, sef ffaith arall a nodwyd yn y papur newydd hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai pawb ohonom yn cymeradwyo'r ffaith bod y GIG yn cyflenwi gwasanaeth sy'n ddi-dâl ar bwynt yr angen. Yr ydym fel Llywodraeth yn benderfynol o gadw hynny.

Alun Davies: A ymunwch â mi i ddiolch i staff y GIG a helpodd i gyflenwi'r Ymgrych 1000 o Fywydau drwy wneud newidiadau i'r ffordd yr ydym yn brwydro yn erbyn heintiau, yn delio â chymhlethodau llawfeddygol, ac yn gweithio gyda'r claf fel rhan o dîm meddygol? Mae'r prosiect hwn wedi achub bron i 2,000 o fywydau yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal â chyflenwi hynny, mae staff y GIG hefyd yn gwneud newidiadau sy'n achub bywydau i wasanaethau meddygol y GIG bob dydd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs, ac ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedaso, sef bod gan dros 1,000 o bobl le i ddiolch i staff y GIG, sy'n dangos pa mor effeithiol y mae'r ymgrych wedi bod.

Disadvantaged Groups

5. Chris Franks: *Will the First Minister make a statement on supporting disadvantaged groups in Rhondda Cynon Taff. OAQ(3)3251(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi grwpiau difreintiedig yn Rhondda Cynon Taf a ledled Cymru.

Chris Franks: Yr wyf yn pryderu bod lefelau llythrennedd a rhifedd yn dal i fod yn wael mewn rhai ardaloedd yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn, a pha drafodaethau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u cael gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf am wella safonau

Minister, that the Conservatives' education budget plans are irresponsible and would mean slashing the money for schemes such as the new national literacy plan, which will provide support for learners aged seven and eight?

The First Minister: We have the national literacy plan, which will provide additional support for learners aged between seven and 11. For adults, basic skills provision in the workplace is being taken forward over the next four years by a substantial all-Wales European social fund project. That means an investment of £17.5 million, to help low-skilled workers to improve their literacy and numeracy skills through the Employer Pledge programme on basic skills. These programmes and so many others in the field of education would simply disappear under the Conservatives' plans.

David Melding: Will you join me in commending the voluntary organisation Valleys Kids, which operates in poor locations in Rhondda Cynon Taf? What is excellent about such organisations is that they can innovate with services, for instance by providing support with literacy in after-school clubs when many deprived children lack the support to benefit fully from the curriculum. It is organisations such as Valleys Kids that really will deliver the maximum return on many programmes, which we need to ensure that people live a long and productive life after leaving education.

The First Minister: I welcome the innovation that is shown by many in the third sector. There are numerous examples throughout Wales of those organisations' effectiveness. However, it is important that they should not be asked to take on responsibilities that currently rest with the public sector; rather, they should be able to focus on what they do best. You have given an example of one organisation and the good work that it does.

Blaenoriaethau Cyllidebol

6. Nick Ramsay: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog*

addysg? A fydddech yn cytuno, Brif Weinidog, bod cynlluniau cyllideb addysg y Ceidwadwyr yn anghyfrifol ac y byddent yn golygu lleihau'r arian sydd ar gael i gynlluniau megis y cynllun llythrennedd cenedlaethol newydd, a fydd yn rhoi cymorth i ddysgwyr saith ac wyth oed?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennym y cynllun llythrennedd cenedlaethol, a fydd yn darparu cymorth ychwanegol i ddysgwyr rhwng saith ac 11 oed. I oedolion, mae darpariaeth sgiliau sylfaenol yn y gweithle'n cael ei arwain dros y pedair mlynedd nesaf gan brosiect sylweddol cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop i Gymru gyfan. Mae hynny'n golygu buddsoddiad o £17.5 miliwn i helpu gweithwyr heb lawer o sgiliau i wella eu sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd drwy gyfrwng y rhaglen sgiliau sylfaenol Adduned Cyflogwr. Byddai'r rhaglenni hyn a chynifer o rai eraill ym maes addysg yn diflannu'n llwyr dan gynlluniau'r Ceidwadwyr.

David Melding: A ymunwch â mi i gymeradwyo'r mudiad gwirfoddol Plant y Cymoedd, sy'n gweithredu mewn lleoliadau tlawd yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? Y peth rhagorol am fudiadau o'r fath yw y gallant arloesi gyda gwasanaethau, er enghraifft drwy ddarparu cymorth â llythrennedd mewn clybiau ar ôl ysgol pan nad yw'r gefnogaeth gan lawer o blant difreintiedig i elwa'n llawn o'r cwricwlwm. Mudiadau megis Plant y Cymoedd sydd am roi'r canlyniadau gorau posibl i nifer o raglenni, ac mae eu hangen er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn byw bywyd hir a chynhyrchiol ar ôl gadael addysg.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r arloesi sy'n cael ei wneud gan lawer yn y trydydd sector. Ceir enghreifftiau niferus ledled Cymru o effeithiolrwydd y mudiadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn gofyn iddynt gymryd cyfrifoldebau sy'n eiddo i'r sector cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd; yn hytrach, dylent allu canolbwyntio ar yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud orau. Yr ydych wedi rhoi enghraifft o un mudiad a'r gwaith da y mae'n ei wneud.

Budget Priorities

6. Nick Ramsay: *Will the First Minister*

ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau cyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer 2011. OAQ(3)3242(FM)

The First Minister: Yes. We published them last week.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you for the brevity of your answer, First Minister. On your priorities, I was looking through the draft budget that was laid last week, and which the Finance Committee looked at on 18 November, and it will not come as a surprise for you to learn that I am concerned about your decision to slash spending on the health service in real terms over three years by £800 million. That is not acceptable to the party on this side of the Chamber. If you look specifically at the health section of the budget narrative, which is on page 33, if you happen to have a copy with you—you probably do not—you will see that it is stated that savings in the health service are to pay for the difference in inflation. Therefore, inflation is not factored into your figures, and you expect savings to deliver the inflationary increase. I suggest that that is inadequate, because if those savings are not made, there will be a cut to front-line services. Do you accept that if these efficiency savings are not made, there will be a decline in front-line health services in Wales?

The First Minister: Your party at Westminster is talking about £15 billion to £20 billion as a similar figure for what is described as ‘efficiency savings’ in England. I wonder about this. Last week, your leader said on *Wales Today*—we all heard it, so it is hardly a matter of private record—that it was a priority for him to slash education spending by 24 per cent. We then heard Andrew R.T. Davies confirm it the following morning on Radio Wales. It took him a while, because he kept being asked a question that he did not know the answer to, and he tends to shout louder when that happens, but, eventually, he confirmed it. We all heard it, and all the journalists heard it. The following evening, we had Nick Ramsay saying that this had nothing to do with education, and that they would take the money out of the culture budget, but that budget does not come close

make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government’s budget priorities for 2011. OAQ(3)3242(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Cyhoeddasom hwy’r wythnos diwethaf.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch am roi ateb mor gryno, Brif Weinidog. O ran eich blaenoriaethau, yr oeddwn yn edrych drwy’r gyllideb ddrafft a bennwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, yr un yr edrychodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid arni ar 18 Tachwedd, ac ni fydd yn syndod i chi gael gwybod fy mod yn pryderu am eich penderfyniad i dorri gwariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd mewn termau real o £800 miliwn dros dair mlynedd. Nid yw hynny’n dderbyniol i’r blaid ar yr ochr hon i’r Siambr. Os edrychwch yn benodol ar yr adran iechyd yn naratif y gyllideb, sydd ar dudalen 33, os oes copi’n digwydd bod gennych ar hyn o bryd—mae’n debygol nad oes—gwelwch ei bod yn datgan y bydd arbedion yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn talu am y gwahaniaeth mewn chwyddiant. Felly, nid yw eich ffigurau’n ystyried chwyddiant, ac yr ydych yn disgwyl i arbedion gyflenwi’r cynnydd oherwydd chwyddiant. Awgrymaf fod hynny’n annigonol, oherwydd oni wneir yr arbedion hynny, ceir toriadau i wasanaethau rheng flaen. A ydych yn cytuno, oni wneir yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd hyn, y ceir dirywiad yng ngwasanaethau iechyd rheng flaen yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae eich plaid yn San Steffan yn sôn am £15 biliwn i £20 biliwn fel ffigur cyffelyb ar gyfer yr hyn a ddisgrifir fel ‘arbedion effeithlonrwydd’ yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn tybed am hyn. Yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd eich arweinydd ar *Wales Today*—yr ydym i gyd wedi ei glywed, felly go brin ei fod yn fater o gofnod preifat—fod torri gwariant ar addysg 24 y cant yn flaenoriaeth iddo. Yna, clywsom Andrew R.T. Davies yn cadarnhau hyn fore drannoeth ar Radio Wales. Cymerodd gryn amser iddo, gan eu bod yn mynnu gofyn cwestiwn iddo nad oedd yn gwybod ei ateb, ac mae’n tueddu i weiddi’n uwch pan mae hynny’n digwydd, ond yn y pen draw, cadarnhaodd y ffaith. Clywodd pawb ohonom hyn, a chlywodd y newyddiadurwyr i gyd ef hefyd. Y noswaith ganlynol, yr oedd Nick Ramsay’n dweud nad oedd a wnelo hyn ddim ag addysg, ac y

to being able to meet the suggested demands. If you want to be taken seriously as an opposition, if you say that there is £880 million in the budget that you think can be diverted to the health budget, and if you think that that money is there despite the cuts that your Government has made at Westminster, let the people of Wales see your plans; do not hide and say that you might let us know by Christmas.

Jeff Cuthbert: First Minister, education must remain one of our key budget priorities for next year. Despite the comprehensive spending review of this Conservative-Liberal Democrat Government, which imposed the deepest cuts to public expenditure in Wales for a generation, the education Minister, Leighton Andrews, has announced in his draft education budget that our young people will not be disadvantaged and will be given the best possible start in life in Wales by funding for schools, skills and early years education being protected. We know that the opposition parties have previously called for more spending on education, but now the leader of the opposition has announced publicly that he would slash that budget by 20 per cent. Do you agree, First Minister, that it is time for the Tories to come clean and to admit that it is the children of Wales, particularly those in our more disadvantaged communities, who will bear the brunt of their spending cuts?

The First Minister: Absolutely. At the end of the day, there is nowhere else from where that the money can come. What have the Tories got against children, for goodness' sake? Child trust funds have been axed, there have been cuts to child benefits, and we now see these cuts in education. There is obviously an agenda here that involves making cuts in services to children. I think that they will find that the people of Wales will punish that thoroughly in May.

Jenny Randerson: We acknowledge fully, First Minister, that you have a fixed budget. Welsh Liberal Democrats are well aware of

byddent yn cymryd yr arian o'r gyllideb diwylliant, ond nid yw'r gyllideb honno'n dod yn agos at allu ateb y galw a awgrymir. Os hoffech gael eich cymryd o ddifrif fel gwrthblaid, os dywedwch fod £800 miliwn yn y gyllideb y credwch y gellir ei atgyfeirio at y gyllideb iechyd, ac os credwch fod yr arian hwnnw yno er gwaethaf y toriadau y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi eu gwneud yn San Steffan, gadewch i bobl Cymru weld eich cynlluniau; peidiwch â chuddio a dweud y gwnewch efallai roi gwybod inni erbyn y Nadolig.

Jeff Cuthbert: Brif Weinidog, rhaid i addysg barhau i fod yn un o brif flaenoriaethau ein cyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Er gwaethaf yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a osododd y toriadau dyfnaf ar wariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ers cenhedlaeth, mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Leighton Andrews, wedi cyhoeddi yn ei gyllideb addysg ddrafft na fydd ein pobl ifanc dan anfantais ac y cânt y dechrau gorau posibl i fywyd yng Nghymru drwy ddiogelu cyllid i ysgolion, sgiliau ac addysg blyneddodd cynnar. Yr ydym yn gwybod bod y gwrthbleidiau yn y gorffennol wedi galw am wario mwy ar addysg, ond nawr mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid wedi cyhoeddi y byddai'n torri 20 y cant oddi ar y gyllideb honno. A ydych yn cytuno, Brif Weinidog, ei bod yn bryd i'r Torïaid fod yn onest a chyfaddef mai plant Cymru, yn enwedig y rheini yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, fydd yn dioddef fwyaf o ganlyniad i'w toriadau gwario?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf yn llwyr. Ar ddiwedd y dydd, ni all yr arian ddod o unman arall. Beth sydd gan y Torïaid yn erbyn plant, er mwyn dyn? Mae cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth i blant wedi cael eu dileu, cafwyd toriadau i fudd-daliadau plant, ac nawr yr ydym yn gweld y toriadau hyn ym maes addysg. Mae'n amlwg bod agenda ar waith sy'n cynnwys gwneud toriadau mewn gwasanaethau i blant. Credaf y darganfyddant y bydd pobl Cymru'n cosbi hynny'n llym ym mis Mai.

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydym yn cydnabod yn llwyr, Brif Weinidog, mai swm penodol sydd i'ch cyllideb. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol

the fact that if you give more to one sector then, inevitably, you give less to another. That said, there has been cross-party agreement here over the years that we need a more prosperous economy and, in order to have that, we need a more highly-educated and highly-skilled workforce. Therefore, I am at a loss to understand why the cuts that inevitably had to be made to this year's budget were particularly severe both for economic development and transport and for education. Can you explain this?

The First Minister: We needed to ensure that there was enough money available for those front-line services. Remember also that the budget for skills goes wider than the learner provision budget. That is worth emphasising. There is expenditure in other spending lines, for example, for post-16 education, special educational needs, 14-19 learning pathways and the Welsh baccalaureate. In the same way, the schools budget is not included in the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills budget—it is included, in the main, in the budget for local government. We have protected skills across the board, where skills need to be protected, in each budget line, as skills are to be found in almost every budget line that exists within the budget of the Welsh Assembly Government. However, we cannot spend money that we do not have. I accept that your party has not made wild promises that you know full well cannot be carried out, as the Conservatives have done. However, from our point of view, we believe that we have delivered a balanced budget that not only is sensible, but also provides the protection for those front-line services that we think that the people of Wales value the most.

Gareth Jones: Brif Weinidog, mae cyllideb Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cael derbyniad cadarnhaol gan lawer o sylwebyddion. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y pwyslais a'r flaenoriaeth a roddir i ysbysai, ysgolion a sgiliau. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen yn fawr at fuddsoddiad newydd yn Ysbyty Llandudno. Ar y pwnc hwn, a allech chi roi unrhyw arwydd y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru—os bydd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Betsi Cadwaladr yn cymeradwyo strategaeth ddrafft y gwasanaeth yn y cyfarfod ddydd Gwener

Cymru'n gwbl ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod rhoi mwy i un sector yn anochel yn golygu rhoi llai i un arall. Wedi dweud hynny, bu cytundeb trawsbleidiol yma dros y blynyddoedd fod angen economi fwy ffyniannus arnom, ac er mwyn ei chael, fod angen gweithlu â gwell addysg a sgiliau arnom. Felly, ni allaf ddeall pam yr oedd y toriadau anochel yng nghyllideb eleni'n arbennig o lym ym maes datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth ac ym maes addysg. A allwch egluro hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd angen inni sicrhau bod digon o arian ar gael i'r gwasanaethau rheng flaen hynny. Cofiwch hefyd fod y gyllideb sgiliau'n ehangach na chyllideb y darpariaeth ddysgu. Mae'n werth pwysleisio hynny. Ceir gwariant mewn llinellau gwariant eraill, er enghraifft, ar gyfer addysg ôl-16, anghenion addysgol arbennig, llwybrau dysgu 14-19 a bagloriaeth Cymru. Yn yr un modd, nid yw cyllideb ysgolion wedi'i chynnwys yng nghyllideb yr Adran Plant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau—mae wedi'i chynnwys, gan fwyaf, yng nghyllideb llywodraeth leol. Yr ydym wedi gwarchod sgiliau'n gyffredinol, pan fo angen gwarchod sgiliau, ym mhob llinell cyllideb, gan fod sgiliau i'w cael yn bron bob llinell cyllideb sy'n bodoli yng nghyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn wario mwy o arian nag sydd gennym. Yr wyf yn derbyn nad yw eich plaid wedi gwneud addewidion gwyllt gan wybod yn iawn na allwch eu cyflawni, fel y gwnaeth y Ceidwadwyr. Fodd bynnag, o'n safbwynt ni, yr ydym yn credu ein bod wedi cyflenwi cyllideb gytbwys sydd, yn ogystal â bod yn un ddoeth, yn diogelu'r gwasanaethau rheng flaen hynny sydd fwyaf gwerthfawr i bobl Cymru, yn ein tyb ni.

Gareth Jones: First Minister, the Welsh Government's budget has had a positive response from many commentators. I am pleased to see the emphasis and priority given to hospitals, schools and skills. I very much look forward to new investment in Llandudno Hospital. On this subject, can you give any indication that the Welsh Government—if the Betsi Cadwaladr Local Health Board approves the draft service strategy in the meeting this Friday—will look favourably on the scheme to invest £48.8

hwn—yn edrych yn ffafriol ar y cynllun i fuddsoddi swm cyfalaf o £48.8 miliwn mewn gwasanaethau meddygol craidd newydd yn yr ysbyty, er gwaethaf y cyfyngiadau y mae cyllideb y Torïaid a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi eu gorfodi ar bobl Cymru, a'r ffaith na wnaeth y mwyafrif ohonynt bleidleisio dros doriadau ar y fath raddfa?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r rhaglen gyfalaf yn cael ei hadolygu ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos â'r bwrdd iechyd er mwyn gweld beth yw ei flaenoriaethau dros y tair neu bum mlynedd nesaf. Tybiaf fod Ysbyty Llandudno yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth i'r bwrdd iechyd yn y dyfodol.

Y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu

7. Mark Isherwood: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth i ddiwydiant gweithgynhyrchu Cymru. OAQ(3)3249(FM)*

The First Minister: We continue to support and work with the manufacturing sector to help it address global challenges. You will be aware of our document, 'Economic Renewal: a new direction'.

Mark Isherwood: Sadly, barely a week goes by without our hearing of another manufacturing company in my region in north Wales either announcing redundancies or even shutting up shop and moving to a different part of the UK or overseas. The recent CBI Wales economic trends panel talked about

'the failure of the world economy to realise the expected buoyancy has had a knock-on effect on Welsh exporters'.

2.00 p.m.

The chair of the panel rightly praises the efforts being put in by Welsh manufacturing to make the longer-term future stronger and brighter. Why, therefore, do you believe that, over the past quarter, the total amount of orders for Welsh manufacturers declined but rose in the rest of the UK, with domestic and export orders within Wales notably weaker than the equivalent UK-wide measures?

million in capital in new core medical services at the hospital, despite the restrictions that the budget of the Tories and Liberal Democrats have imposed on the people of Wales, and the fact that the majority of them did not vote for cuts on such a scale?

The First Minister: The capital programme is being reviewed at present. We are working closely with the health board to see what its priorities are over the next three or five years. I would have thought that Llandudno Hospital would continue to be a priority for the health board in the future.

The Manufacturing Industry

7. Mark Isherwood: *Will the First Minister make a statement on support for the Welsh manufacturing industry. OAQ(3)3249(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn parhau i gefnogi'r sector gweithgynhyrchu a chydweithio ag ef i'w helpu i ateb heriau byd-eang. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'n dogfen, 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd'.

Mark Isherwood: Yn anffodus, anaml yr aiff wythnos heibio heb inni glywed am gwmni gweithgynhyrchu arall yn fy rhanbarth yn y gogledd yn cyhoeddi ei fod naill ai'n dileu swyddi neu'n cau ac yn symud i ran arall o'r DU neu dramor. Soniodd panel tueddiadau economaidd diweddar CBI Cymru am

fethiant economi'r byd i sylwi bod yr hydwythedd a ddisgwyliwyd wedi cael effaith ganlyniadol ar allforwyr Cymru.

Mae cadeirydd y panel yn rhoi clod haeddiannol i ymdrechion cwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu Cymru i wneud y dyfodol mwy hirdymor yn gryfach ac yn fwy disglair. Pam, felly, yr ydych yn credu, dros y chwarter diwethaf, fod cyfanswm yr archebion i gwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu Cymru wedi gostwng ond eu bod wedi codi yng ngweddill y DU, a bod archebion

What does Wales have that the rest of the UK does not have?

The First Minister: ‘A poor budget settlement from Westminster’ is the simple answer. After what we saw last week in Scotland and Northern Ireland, we all know that. We also have a UK Government that has deliberately decided to put workers’ jobs at risk, such as those at the Passport Office. More than 300 people in Newport might lose their jobs because of the UK Government’s decision. Now we understand that there could also be job losses in Companies House. It does not help if hundreds of jobs in Wales are being lost because of the direct actions of the UK Government. We come back again to the same question: what has Wales done to the UK Government to deserve this?

Sandy Mewies: Revolymer, a company in my constituency, recently launched the first removable and degradable chewing gum. It is a really significant innovation in the formulation of chewing gum, and it means that it need not be such an environmentally unfriendly and unpleasant issue in the future. It can be removed from pavements, clothes and textiles far more easily and cheaply than before. As our previous First Minister will recall, this was achieved with the help of a Welsh Assembly Government regional selective assistance grant. It is an example of how this Welsh Government has always backed business and industry and of how it intends to do so to promote economic growth in the future. Do you agree, First Minister, that it is a shame that the Conservative Government, with the Liberals following on rather reluctantly behind, does not have such a policy but instead will go back to throwing people on the scrap heap, because that is the only thing that it can do to solve any economic problems?

The First Minister: It is a fine example of innovation, and I applaud the work that has been done by Revolymer. No doubt, it will find a ready market throughout the world, apart from in Singapore, where I believe that

domestig ac allforio o fewn Cymru’n amlwg yn wannach na’r mesuriad cywerth i’r DU gyfan? Beth sydd gan Gymru nad yw gan gweddill y DU?

Y Prif Weinidog: ‘Setliad cyllideb gwael gan San Steffan’ yw’r ateb syml. Ar ôl yr hyn a welsom yr wythnos diwethaf yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod hynny. Mae gennym hefyd Lywodraeth y DU sydd wedi penderfynu’n fwriadol ei bod am beryglu swyddi gweithwyr, megis rhai’r Swyddfa Basbort. Gallai dros 300 o bobl yng Nghasnewydd golli eu swyddi oherwydd penderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU. Nawr yr ydym yn deall y gellid colli swyddi yn Nhŷ’r Cwmnïau hefyd. Nid yw’n helpu os oes cannoedd o swyddi’n cael eu colli yng Nghymru o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i weithredoedd Llywodraeth y DU. Yr ydym yn dychwelyd eto at yr un cwestiwn: beth mae Cymru wedi ei wneud i Lywodraeth y DU i haeddu hyn?

Sandy Mewies: Yn ddiweddar, lansiodd Revolymer, cwmni yn fy etholaeth, y gwm cnoi cyntaf y gellir ei dynnu ac sy’n ddiraddiadwy. Mae’n newyddbeth gwirioneddol arwyddocaol o ran creu gwm cnoi, ac mae’n golygu nad oes angen iddo fod yn fater mor annymunol ac anghyfeillgar i’r amgylchedd yn y dyfodol. Gellir ei dynnu oddi ar balmentydd, dillad a thecstilau’n llawer haws a rhatach nag o’r blaen. Fel y bydd ein Prif Weinidog blaenorol yn cofio, cyflawnwyd hyn gyda chymorth grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae’n enghraifft o sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cefnogi busnes a diwydiant erioed ac o sut y mae’n bwriadu gwneud hynny er mwyn hybu twf economaidd yn y dyfodol. A ydych yn cytuno, Brif Weinidog, ei bod yn siom nad oes gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, gyda’r Rhyddfrydwyr yn eu dilyn yn eithaf cyndyn, bolisi o’r fath, ond y byddant yn hytrach yn dychwelyd at daflu pobl ar y domen sgrap gan mai dyna’r unig beth y gallant ei wneud i ddatrys unrhyw broblemau economaidd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae’n enghraifft wych o arloesi, a chymeradwyaf y gwaith y mae Revolymer wedi’i wneud. Nid oes amheuaeth y caiff farchnad barod ledled y byd, heblaw yn Singapore; credaf fod cnoi gwm yn

chewing gum is illegal. Nevertheless, I am sure that, in many other countries in the world, this Welsh innovation will be warmly welcomed.

Eleanor Burnham: As you will know, because you were at our meeting this morning, the Committee on European and External Affairs is currently looking at the best use that can be made of European funds in promoting the knowledge economy, innovation and so on. I noticed this morning that the Royal Academy of Engineering is concerned that,

‘within a balanced research portfolio, a higher proportion of our research investment goes towards high quality research that is likely to lead to near- to mid-term economic benefit.’

Despite your rather blasé statement just now that it is everyone else’s fault but your own, particularly those at Westminster, what are you doing to enhance support for manufacturing, and particularly to make much better use of the European funding that has been made available over the past 12 years?

The First Minister: We provide financial support to the Welsh manufacturing forum, because we know that manufacturing is important to Wales. There are also some great examples of engineering innovation, such as the advanced composite training and development centre at Airbus, which I have visited. It is a fantastic place and is ideally located to support supply-chain developments in aerospace, wind power, optoelectronics, energy and the automotive industry, all of which offer key market opportunities for Wales and the rest of the UK. You will also be aware of the launch of Skills Growth Wales, which is a programme that has provided help for firms to develop the skills base of their workforce.

Janet Ryder: Any support that you give to manufacturing businesses or to any businesses in Wales will be dependent on the amount of money that the Welsh Government has at its disposal to spend. Do you share my

anghyfreithlon yno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff y newyddbeth hwn o Gymru groeso cynnes mewn sawl gwlad arall yn y byd.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel y byddwch yn gwybod, gan eich bod yn ein cyfarfod y bore yma, mae’r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol ar hyn o bryd yn edrych ar y ffordd orau o ddefnyddio cronfeydd Ewropeaidd i hybu’r economi wybodaeth, arloesi ac ati. Sylwais y bore yma fod yr Academi Frenhinol Peirianeg yn pryderu,

o fewn portffolio ymchwil cytbwys, mae cyfran uwch o’n buddsoddiad ymchwil yn mynd tuag at ymchwil o safon uchel sy’n debygol o arwain at fudd economaidd yn y tymor agos i ganolig.

Er gwaethaf y datganiad eithaf didaro yr ydych newydd ei wneud yn beio pawb heblaw chi am hyn, ac yn enwedig y rheini yn San Steffan, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i gynyddu’r gefnogaeth i weithgynhyrchu, ac yn benodol i ganfod ffordd lawer gwell o ddefnyddio’r cyllid Ewropeaidd sydd wedi bod ar gael dros y 12 mlynedd diwethaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn darparu cymorth ariannol i’r fforwm gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, oherwydd yr ydym yn gwybod bod gweithgynhyrchu’n bwysig i Gymru. Ceir enghreifftiau gwych hefyd o arloesi ym maes peirianeg, megis y ganolfan ar gyfer hyfforddiant a datblygiad ym maes uwchgyfansoddion yn Airbus; yr wyf wedi ymweld â’r ganolfan hon. Mae’n lle anhygoel ac mae mewn lleoliad delfrydol i gefnogi datblygiadau cadwyn gyflenwi ym maes awyrofod, pŵer gwynt, optoelectroneg, ynni a’r diwydiant modurol, sydd i gyd yn cynnig cyfleoedd marchnad allweddol i Gymru a gweddill y DU. Byddwch hefyd yn ymwybodol o lansio Sgiliau Twf Cymru, rhaglen sydd wedi darparu cymorth i gwmnïau i ddatblygu cronfa sgiliau eu gweithlu.

Janet Ryder: Bydd unrhyw gefnogaeth a rowch i fusnesau gweithgynhyrchu neu i unrhyw fusnesau yng Nghymru’n dibynnu ar faint o arian sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i’w wario. A ydych yn rhannu fy siom gyda’r

disappointment at the statement given to yesterday's meeting of the Finance Committee that the Tory and Liberal Democrat Government at Westminster will not be looking at a re-assessment of the Barnett formula, despite the work of Gerry Holtham, despite the fact that it has cross-party support in the Assembly, and despite the fact that it will mean that Wales will remain one of the poorest regions of Europe for many years to come?

The First Minister: The whole thing is mired in confusion, Janet, and the same happened yesterday. I looked carefully at the Chancellor's words after the comprehensive spending review, and he said that the UK Government would work with the Welsh Assembly Government to take forward the findings of the Holtham commission, depending on the outcome of a referendum. Not unreasonably, I think, that means looking at the first part of the Holtham work, on funding, and the conclusion to be drawn from those words is that a 'no' vote in the referendum will mean no more money. However, yesterday, the situation seemed to have changed—perhaps unilaterally on the part of the Chief Secretary to the Treasury—and we need some clarification on that. I have never taken the view that the referendum vote should have any bearing on the way in which Wales is funded; that was an issue raised by the UK Government, not by us or by any party in the Chamber. The situation is that you cannot have the second part of Holtham without the first part, which Gerry Holtham himself made clear. It is disappointing. I take on board the views of all parties in the Chamber on Holtham, because I am aware that there is a genuine desire among the Liberal Democrats and the Conservatives to take forward the first part of his work. However, I hope that we get some more clarity from the UK Government across the board, so that we do not have this apparent disconnect between the words of the Chancellor and the words of the Chief Secretary to the Treasury.

Cyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus

8. Darren Millar: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. OAQ(3)3248(FM)*

datganiad a roddwyd i gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyllid ddoe na fydd Llywodraeth y Torïaïd a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn San Steffan yn edrych ar ailasesu fformiwla Barnett, er gwaethaf gwaith Gerry Holtham, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod ganddi gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad, ac er gwaethaf y ffaith y bydd yn golygu y bydd Cymru'n dal i fod yn un o ranbarthau tlotaf Ewrop am flynyddoedd maith i ddod?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r holl beth yn llawn dryswch, Janet, a digwyddodd yr un peth ddoe. Edrychais yn ofalus ar eiriau'r Canghellor ar ôl yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, a dywedodd y byddai Llywodraeth y DU yn cydweithio â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i symud ymlaen â chanfyddiadau comisiwn Holtham, gan ddibynnu ar ganlyniad refferendwm. Ni chredaf ei bod yn afresymol bod hynny'n golygu edrych ar ran gyntaf gwaith Holtham, ar gyllid, a'r casgliad i'w ffurfio o'r geiriau hynny yw y bydd pleidlais 'na' yn y refferendwm yn golygu dim mwy o arian. Fodd bynnag, ddoe, yr oedd yn ymddangos bod y sefyllfa wedi newid—efallai'n unochrog ar ran Prif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys—ac mae angen egluro hynny ychydig. Nid wyf erioed wedi bod o'r farn y dylai pleidlais y refferendwm gael unrhyw effaith ar sut y caiff Cymru ei hariannu; Llywodraeth y DU a gododd y mater hwnnw, nid ni nac unrhyw blaid yn y Siambr. Y sefyllfa yw na allwch gael ail ran Holtham heb y rhan gyntaf, ac eglurodd Gerry Holtham hynny ei hun. Mae'n siom. Ystyriaf farn pob plaid yn y Siambr am Holtham, oherwydd yr wyf yn gwybod bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Ceidwadwyr yn wirioneddol yn dymuno symud ymlaen â rhan gyntaf ei waith. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y cawn ychydig mwy o eglurder gan Lywodraeth y DU yn gyffredinol, fel na fydd gennym y datgysylltiad ymddangosol hwn rhwng geiriau'r Canghellor a geiriau Prif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys.

Public Service Delivery

8. Darren Millar: *Will the First Minister make a statement on public service delivery. OAQ(3)3248(FM)*

The First Minister: Our approach is twofold: to sustain front-line services; and to invest in the long-term wellbeing of the people of Wales.

Darren Millar: Thank you for that answer, First Minister. You will be aware that public services are just that: services delivered for the public. In my opinion, the public ought to be involved in the planning and delivery of those services. However, as you will know, the Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board in north Wales is undertaking reviews, but the public feels shut out and not engaged in the proposals to develop and reshape services in north Wales. There is a good deal of concern about maternity, neonatal and general emergency surgery services in particular. Do you believe that it is time for those who deliver public services in Wales to listen to the people to whom they are supposed to be providing those services? Do you agree that the Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board and others like it in Wales, which do not take the views of the public seriously and do not allow the public to engage in the development of public service delivery, should be ashamed of themselves and ought to go back to the drawing board?

The First Minister: First of all, Darren, I thank you for your startling revelation that public services are services delivered for the public. I do not see how you can say that the local health board has not listened when you do not know what its final proposals are. It is exceptionally important that the local health board consults with people, listens to their views and takes them into account when looking at service configuration in north Wales.

Brian Gibbons: The independent commission on social services, the front-line review in education, and the local, regional and national review undertaken by the Minister for Local Government and Social Justice are likely to lead to major recommendations on reconfiguring the way in which we deliver public services in Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn mynd o gwmpas hyn mewn dwy ffordd: cynnal gwasanaethau rheng flaen; a buddsoddi yn lles hirdymor pobl Cymru.

Darren Millar: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Byddwch yn ymwybodol mai ystyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw gwasanaethau a ddarperir i'r cyhoedd. Yn fy marn i, dylai'r cyhoedd gael eu cynnwys yn y broses o gynllunio a chyflenwi'r gwasanaethau hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyrddoch, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr yn y gogledd yn cynnal adolygiadau, ond mae'r cyhoedd yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu heithrio ac nad ydynt yn cael eu cynnwys yn y cynigion i ddatblygu ac ail-lunio gwasanaethau yn y gogledd. Ceir cryn dipyn o bryder am wasanaethau mamolaeth a newyddenedigol ac am wasanaethau llawdriniaeth argyfwng cyffredinol yn enwedig. A ydych yn credu ei bod yn bryd i'r bobl sy'n cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wrando ar y bobl y dylent fod yn darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny iddynt? A ydych yn cytuno y dylai Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr a rhai eraill tebyg yng Nghymru, nad ydynt yn cymryd barn y cyhoedd o ddifrif ac nad ydynt yn cynnwys y cyhoedd wrth ddatblygu cyflenwi gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, gywilyddio wrth hyn a llunio cynlluniau newydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn gyntaf, Darren, diolch am y datgeliad anhygoel mai gwasanaethau a gyflenwir i'r cyhoedd yw gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ni welaf sut y gallwch ddweud nad yw'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi gwranddo pan nad ydych yn gwybod beth yw ei gynigion terfynol. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig bod y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn ymgynghori â phobl, yn gwranddo ar eu safbwyntiau ac yn eu hystyried wrth edrych ar gyfluniad gwasanaethau yn y gogledd.

Brian Gibbons: Mae'r comisiwn annibynnol ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, yr adolygiad addysg rheng flaen, a'r adolygiad lleol, rhanbarthol a chenedlaethol a gynhaliwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol a Chyfiawnder Cymdeithasol yn debygol o arwain at argymhellion pwysig am ail-lunio'r ffordd yr ydym yn cyflenwi gwasanaethau

Will you indicate how important coterminosity will be as a principle in the reconfiguration of the service delivery mechanisms?

The First Minister: Local authority boundaries form the building blocks of most of our services boundaries in Wales; for example, local authority boundaries are coterminous with those of the LHBs and the police authorities. It certainly makes life a lot easier when it comes to delivering public services. It also means that, as we examine which public services should be provided by which body, coterminosity will be essential to ensure that we do not have any jagged edges where services are delivered by different bodies in the same part of Wales.

Veronica German: First Minister, local government estimates that it has spent around £35 million this year purely on administrating specific grants rather than on front-line services. I understand that your Cabinet colleagues have been asked to consider rationalising existing grants, and that a total of £10 million has already been found from within the local government and social justice portfolio, giving you a saving of about £0.5 million in administration costs. What will you do to ensure that more of that £35 million, which is much needed, is used by local government to deliver front-line services rather than being spent purely on administration costs?

2.10 p.m.

The First Minister: I am sorry, but I lost that. I thought for a second that you said that we had identified savings of £10 million that would deliver savings of £0.5 million, but there we are. The administration costs of local authorities are a matter for them. We are pressing down on our administration costs in the Assembly Government and it is absolutely right that local authorities do the same. They should always consider reducing administrative costs before making compulsory redundancies.

Nerys Evans: As our budgets in Wales are slashed by the Conservative and Lib Dem

cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. A nodwch pa mor bwysig fydd cydffinioldeb fel egwyddor wrth ail-lunio'r mecanweithiau cyflenwi gwasanaethau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ffiniau awdurdodau lleol yw blociau adeiladu'r rhan fwyaf o'n ffiniau gwasanaethau yng Nghymru; er enghraifft, mae ffiniau awdurdodau lleol yr un fath â ffiniau'r Byrddau Iechyd Lleol a'r awdurdodau heddlu. Mae'n sicr yn gwneud bywyd yn llawer haws o ran cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae hefyd yn golygu, wrth inni archwilio pa gorff ddylai ddarparu pa wasanaethau cyhoeddus, y bydd cydffinioldeb yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau nad oes gennym ddim ymylon garw lle caiff gwasanaethau eu cyflenwi gan gyrff gwahanol yn yr un rhan o Gymru.

Veronica German: Brif Weinidog, mae llywodraeth leol yn amcangyfrif ei bod wedi gwario tua £35 miliwn eleni ar weinyddu grantiau penodol yn unig, yn hytrach nag ar wasanaethau rheng flaen. Deallaf y gofynnwyd i'ch cyd-Aelodau Cabinet ystyried rhesymoli'r grantiau sy'n bodoli eisoes, a bod cyfanswm o £10 miliwn eisoes wedi'i ganfod oddi mewn y portffolio llywodraeth leol a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol, gan arbed tua £0.5 miliwn ichi mewn costau gweinyddu. Beth a wnewch i sicrhau bod mwy o'r £35 miliwn hwnnw, sydd ei angen yn fawr, yn cael ei ddefnyddio gan lywodraeth leol i gyflenwi gwasanaethau rheng flaen yn hytrach nag yn cael ei wario i gyd ar gostau gweinyddu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond collais hynny. Meddyliais am eiliad ichi ddweud ein bod wedi canfod £10 miliwn o arbedion a fyddai'n cyflenwi £0.5 miliwn o arbedion, ond dyna ni. Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw eu costau gweinyddu. Yr ydym yn ceisio lleihau ein costau gweinyddu yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac mae'n gwbl briodol bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud yr un peth. Dylent ystyried lleihau costau gweinyddol bob amser cyn dileu swyddi.

Nerys Evans: Wrth i'n cyllidebau yng Nghymru gael eu torri gan Lywodraeth y

Government at Westminster, it is important that we take advantage of all other funding routes. One such fund is the People's Millions 2010, which is a collaboration between the Big Lottery Fund and ITV, awarding tens of thousands of pounds to community groups this week. In today's competition, Pembroke Eats to Live is competing for £50,000, which would pay for the completion of the refurbishment of the Foundry House community centre, introduce a local produce shop, and enable it to offer courses in cooking and healthy eating for parents in low-income families and young people. It is a worthy and worthwhile project. Will you join me in congratulating the Big Lottery Fund and ITV for this scheme and urge people to vote for the Pembroke Eats to Live project? The phone lines are open until midnight.

The First Minister: How can I not urge people to vote for a Welsh project? I hope that it is successful.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ(3)3243(FM), yn ôl.

Gwasanaethau Brys yng Nghymru

10. Brian Gibbons: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gydweithio rhwng y gwasanaethau brys yng Nghymru.* OAQ(3)3240(FM)

The First Minister: The Minister for Health and Social Services commissioned a joint emergency services task and finish group in 2009, which included senior representatives from the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, the police and the fire and rescue services.

Brian Gibbons: Thank you very much for that. You will be aware that, in many European countries and in North America, the ambulance and fire services work together as a single integrated service. Is it time that we considered that in the Welsh context?

The First Minister: I think that it is. I have seen some good examples of it, for example, when I visited the joint control centre at St

Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn San Steffan, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn manteisio ar bob llwybr cyllid arall. Un gronfa o'r fath yw'r People's Millions 2010, cydweithfa rhwng y Gronfa Loteri Fawr ac ITV, sy'n rhoi degau o filoedd o bunnau i grwpiau cymunedol yr wythnos yma. Yng nghystadleuaeth heddiw, mae Pembroke Eats to Live yn cystadlu am £50,000, a fyddai'n talu am gwblhau gwaith ailwampio canolfan gymunedol Foundry House, yn cyflwyno siop cynnyrch lleol, ac yn eu galluogi i gynnig cyrsiau coginio a bwyta'n iach i rieni mewn teuluoedd incwm isel a phobl ifanc. Mae'n brosiect teilwng a gwerth chweil. A ymunwch â mi wrth longyfarch y Gronfa Loteri Fawr ac ITV am y cynllun hwn ac i annog pobl i bleidleisio dros brosiect Pembroke Eats to Live? Mae'r llinellau ffôn ar agor tan hanner nos.

Y Prif Weinidog: Sut y gallaf beidio ag annog pobl i bleidleisio dros brosiect o Gymru? Gobeithiaf y bydd yn llwyddiannus.

The Presiding Officer: Question 9, OAQ(3)3243(FM), has been withdrawn.

Emergency Services in Wales

10. Brian Gibbons: *Will the First Minister make a statement on collaboration between the emergency services in Wales.* OAQ(3)3240(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Comisiynodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar y cyd ar gyfer y gwasanaethau brys yn 2009, a oedd yn cynnwys uwch gynrychiolwyr o Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru, yr heddlu a'r gwasanaethau tân ac achub.

Brian Gibbons: Diolch yn fawr iawn am hynny. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, yn nifer o wledydd Ewrop ac yng Ngogledd America, bod y gwasanaethau ambiwlans a thân yn cydweithio fel un gwasanaeth integredig. A yw'n bryd inni ystyried hynny yng nghydestun Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf ei bod. Yr wyf wedi gweld enghreifftiau da o hyn, er enghraifft, pan ymwelais â'r ganolfan reoli ar

Asaph recently. It is clear that there are advantages to the emergency services sharing the same control centre. I know that that will be taken forward to deliver a more effective and joined-up service.

Mohammad Asghar: I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's recent actions aimed at improving the communication systems for fire and rescue services in Wales. Effective collaboration and communication between ambulance services and accident and emergency departments are also important. While I welcome the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board's recent focus on this issue, success in meeting the 15-minute handover target has regularly fallen below 50 per cent at the Royal Gwent Hospital. How is the Welsh Assembly Government working with health boards to ensure that levels of collaboration improve so that handovers between ambulance services and accident and emergency departments run as smoothly as possible?

The First Minister: As I mentioned in the answer that I gave some moments ago, Government officials and we monitor the performance of the local health boards. We know that the ambulance services have met their targets, but where there are difficulties in handovers at hospitals in Wales, they are monitored by officials and the Minister.

Helen Mary Jones: To return to the point that was made earlier by Brian Gibbons, First Minister, do you accept that having a national structure for the ambulance services and a regional structure for the other emergency services, namely the police and fire services, may be getting in the way of maximising local co-operation? If the Government were to find that that was so, would you reconsider whether it is appropriate to retain a national structure for the ambulance service, given that it has been seen by some front-line staff as meaning that their management can be a long way away from them, not only in geographic terms, but also in understanding some of the other challenges that they face?

y cyd yn Llanelwy yn ddiweddar. Mae'n amlwg bod manteision i'w cael wrth i'r gwasanaethau brys rannu'r un ganolfan reoli. Gwn y byddant yn symud ymlaen â hyn i gyflenwi gwasanaeth mwy effeithiol a chydgyssylltiedig.

Mohammad Ashgar: Croesawaf y camau a gymerodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ddiweddar gyda'r nod o wella systemau cyfathrebu gwasanaethau tân ac achub yng Nghymru. Mae cydweithredu a chyfathrebu effeithiol rhwng gwasanaethau ambiwlans ac adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys hefyd yn bwysig. Er fy mod yn croesawu ffoecs diweddar Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan ar y mater hwn, mae llwyddiant o ran cyrraedd y targed trosglwyddo 15 munud wedi bod yn rheolaidd yn is na 50 y cant yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent. Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cydweithio â byrddau iechyd i sicrhau bod lefelau cydweithredu'n gwella fel bod trosglwyddiadau rhwng gwasanaethau ambiwlans ac adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn broses mor esmwyth â phosibl?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y dywedais yn yr ateb a roddais rai munudau'n ôl, mae swyddogion y Llywodraeth a ni'n monitro perfformiad y byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr ydym yn gwybod bod y gwasanaethau ambiwlans wedi cyrraedd eu targedau, ond pan geir anawsterau â throsglwyddiadau mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru, cânt eu monitro gan swyddogion a'r Gweinidog.

Helen Mary Jones: I ddychwelyd at y pwynt a godwyd eisoes gan Brian Gibbons, Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn derbyn y gall y ffaith bod strwythur cenedlaethol i'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans a strwythur rhanbarthol i'r gwasanaethau brys eraill, sef y gwasanaethau heddlu a'r gwasanaethau tân, gael effaith anffafriol ar gydweithredu lleol? Pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn canfod bod hynny'n wir, a fydddech yn ailystyried a yw'n briodol cadw strwythur cenedlaethol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ac ystyried bod rhai staff rheng flaen yn teimlo bod hyn yn golygu bod eu rheolwyr yn bell oddi wrthynt, nid yn unig yn ddaearyddol, ond hefyd o ran deall rhai o'r heriau eraill y maent yn eu hwynebu?

The First Minister: We will consider any way of improving service delivery. If improvements can be identified by examining carefully how emergency services are structured, they can be taken forward.

Camdriniaeth ar Drafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus

11. Jeff Cuthbert: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am amddiffyn teithwyr rhag cael eu cam-drin wrth iddynt ddefnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. OAQ(3)3239(FM)

The First Minister: Increasing safety and security on public transport is a key commitment in the national transport plan, and we are investing in that. For example, we are funding an increase in the number of British Transport Police uniformed officers. We want to ensure that people are safe when they travel on trains, whatever the time of day or night.

Jeff Cuthbert: Thank you for that response, First Minister. At the end of September, Mrs Lisa Robinson of Ystrad Mynach in my constituency was travelling back from a day out in Cardiff on an Arriva Trains Wales service on the Rhymney valley line when she and her family were verbally abused by drunks. After several complaints to the driver went ignored, Mrs Robinson halted the train at her local station and stood on the tracks in protest until police arrived; the train's journey was terminated. As I understand it, British Transport Police are still investigating the matter and there has been substantial media coverage of it. I am sure that neither of us would urge passengers to stand in front of trains; nevertheless, do you agree that abuse on public transport—whether aimed at passengers or staff—is unacceptable? Will the Welsh Government assure me that it will work closely with train operating companies, trade unions, passenger representatives and the British Transport Police to ensure that such abuse is kept to a minimum and that when such incidents do occur, the victims will have access to the appropriate channels of redress, and the perpetrators will be duly punished?

The First Minister: People who physically assault others on trains, particularly train

Y Prif Weinidog: Ystyriwn unrhyw ffordd o gyflenwi gwasanaethau'n well. Os gellir canfod gwelliannau drwy archwilio'n ofalus sut y mae'r gwasanaethau brys wedi'u strwythuro, gellir symud ymlaen â hwy.

Abuse on Public Transport

11. Jeff Cuthbert: Will the First Minister make a statement on the protection of passengers from abuse whilst on public transport. OAQ(3)3239(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gwella diogelwch ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn ymrwymiad allweddol yn y cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol, ac yr ydym yn buddsoddi ynddo. Er enghraifft, yr ydym yn ariannu cynnydd yn nifer swyddogion mewn lifrai'r Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydeinig. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod pobl yn ddiogel wrth deithio ar drenau, ar unrhyw adeg o'r dydd neu'r nos.

Jeff Cuthbert: Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Ddiwedd mis Medi, yr oedd Mrs Lisa Robinson o Ystrad Mynach yn fy etholaeth yn teithio'n ôl o ddiwrnod yng Nghaerdydd ar wasanaeth Trenau Arriva Cymru ar reilffordd cwm Rhymni pan gafodd hi a'i theulu eu cam-drin yn eiriol gan feddwon. Ar ôl i nifer o gwynion i'r gyrrwr gael eu hanwybyddu, stopiodd Mrs Robinson y trê'n yn ei gorsaf leol a safodd ar y traciau fel protest nes i'r heddlu gyrraedd; cafodd taith y trê'n ei therfynu. Deallaf fod yr Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydeinig yn dal i ymchwilio i'r mater a'i fod wedi cael sylw sylweddol gan y cyfryngau. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai'r un o'r ddau ohonom yn annog teithwyr i sefyll o flaen trenau; fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cytuno bod cam-drin teithwyr neu staff ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn annerbyniol? A wnaiff Llywodraeth Cymru fy sicrhau y bydd yn cydweithio'n agos â chwmnïau gweithredu trenau, undebau llafur, cynrychiolwyr teithwyr a'r Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydeinig i sicrhau bod cam-drin o'r fath yn cael ei leihau gymaint â phosibl a phan fydd digwyddiadau o'r fath yn digwydd, bod sianeli priodol ar gael i'r dioddefwyr i unioni'r sefyllfa, ac y caiff y drwgweithredwyr eu cosbi'n briodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel rheol, mae pobl sy'n ymosod yn gorfforol ar eraill ar drenau, yn

staff, normally deserve to go to prison; it is as simple as that. There is no reason why people who work on the railways—or in any other capacity, for that matter—should have to put up with physical abuse in any way. I am very familiar with this case, having seen the report on it. As you said, British Transport Police are investigating the matter, and I understand that they have now seen the train's onboard closed-circuit television footage and are looking to conclude the investigation in due course.

William Graham: First Minister, you will be aware of the prevalent problem of metal thefts from the railway, which are becoming extremely worrying in the eastern part of Gwent, where over £12,000-worth of copper wire has been stolen between the Severn tunnel and Newport. This immediately put everybody who uses the railways at risk, and is a bad advertisement for Wales. Although the British Transport Police are doing their best, can you, through the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport, endeavour to ensure that this matter receives much greater attention, and will you pay due attention to sentencing proposals for those people who are caught?

The First Minister: Catching people is the problem, is it not? It is part of the difficulty. I do not want to sound as though I am taking a particularly hard line on justice, but if people steal things that endanger the lives of others, they should go to prison; it is simple as that. They have no excuse, and it is right that that message gets out there. You are right to say that, with the increase in the price of copper, particularly recently, the problem is increasing. I urge members of the public to come forward with information if they know of people who have stolen copper in this way. They should understand that this is not a simple theft, but one that puts the lives of others at risk.

Addysg yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru

12. Nerys Evans: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth addysg yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. OAQ(3)3247(FM)*

enwedig ar staff y trêen, yn haeddu mynd i'r carchar; mae mor syml â hynny. Nid oes dim rheswm pam dylai pobl sy'n gweithio ar y rheilffyrdd—nac mewn unrhyw swydd arall, o ran hynny—orfod dioddef cam-drin corfforol mewn unrhyw ffordd. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â'r achos hwn; yr wyf wedi gweld yr adroddiad amdano. Fel y dywedasoeh, mae'r Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydeinig yn ymchwilio i'r mater, a deallaf eu bod bellach wedi gweld lluniau'r teledu cylch cyfyng ar fwrdd y trêen a'u bod yn bwriadu cwblhau'r ymchwiliad gyda hyn.

William Graham: Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r broblem gyffredin o ddwyn metel o'r rheilffordd, sy'n dechrau peri pryder mawr yn nwyrain Gwent, lle mae gwerth dros £12,000 o wifrau copr wedi cael eu dwyn rhwng twnnel yr Hafren a Chasnewydd. Mae hyn yn peri risg ar unwaith i bawb sy'n defnyddio'r rheilffyrdd, ac mae'n hysbyseb wael i Gymru. Er bod yr Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydeinig yn gwneud eu gorau, a allwch chi, gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, ymdrechu i sicrhau bod y mater hwn yn cael llawer mwy o sylw, ac a roddwch sylw priodol i gynigion i ddedfrydu'r bobl hynny sy'n cael eu dal?

Y Prif Weinidog: Onid dal pobl yw'r broblem? Mae'n rhan o'r anhawster. Nid wyf am swnio fel fy mod yn dangos wyneb caled ym maes cyfiawnder, ond os yw pobl yn dwyn pethau sy'n peryglu bywydau eraill, dylent fynd i'r carchar; mae mor syml â hynny. Nid oes ganddynt ddim esgus, ac mae'n iawn bod y neges yn cael ei lledaenu. Yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch, gyda'r cynnydd ym mhpris copr, yn enwedig yn ddiweddar, bod y broblem yn cynyddu. Yr wyf yn annog aelodau'r cyhoedd i roi gwybodaeth os ydynt yn gwybod am bobl sydd wedi dwyn copr yn y modd hwn. Dylent ddeall nad lladrad syml yw hwn, ond un sy'n peryglu bywydau pobl eraill.

Education in Mid and West Wales

12. Nerys Evans: *Will the First Minister make a statement regarding education provision in Mid and West Wales. OAQ(3)3247(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdodau yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yw darparu ac adolygu'r ddarpariaeth addysg yn ysgolion yr ardal honno.

The First Minister: It is the responsibility of the authorities in mid and west Wales to provide and review the education provision of schools in that area.

Nerys Evans: Yn dilyn o'ch sylwadau am sicrhau gwariant teilwng i'r sector addysg yng Nghymru, a ydych yn cytuno bod cynlluniau'r Ceidwadwyr yng Nghymru i dorri gwariant addysg o bron i chwarter y gyllideb yn golygu diswyddo athrawon, cau ysgolion, cynyddu maint dosbarthiadau a lleihau safonau addysgol i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc, a bod hynny'n anghyfrifol iawn? Diolch byth, ac yn wahanol iawn, mae cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth i sicrhau parhad i'r sector addysg fel un llwyddiannus a llewyrchus.

Nerys Evans: Following your comments on securing fair spend for the education sector in Wales, do you agree that the Welsh Conservatives' plans to cut the education budget by almost a quarter would mean making teachers redundant, closing schools, increasing class sizes and reducing the standard of the education that our children and young people receive, and that that would be irresponsible? Thank goodness that the Government's plans are very different and are to ensure that the education sector continues to be successful and to flourish.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr.

The First Minister: I agree totally.

Paul Davies: Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais yr anrhydedd o ymweld ag Ysgol y Preseli, sydd yn fy etholaeth i. Mae'r ysgol hon yn cynhyrchu canlyniadau arbennig o dda, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol. Yn ystod fy nghyfarfod, clywais fod pryderon ynglŷn â hyblygrwydd yn y cyrsiau lefel-A y gall yr ysgol eu cynnig i'r myfyrwyr, ac yr wyf yn deall nad yw rhai cyrsiau lefel-A yn cael eu cydnabod o dan y Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009 o ran pwyntiau UCAS. Gall hyn wneud pethau'n anodd, yn enwedig o ran darparu cyrsiau trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. A all y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym a yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fodlon edrych ar hyn i sicrhau bod hyblygrwydd yn y system?

Paul Davies: Last week, I had the privilege of visiting Ysgol y Preseli, which is in my constituency. This school produces very good results, as I am sure that the First Minister knows. During the meeting, I heard that there are concerns about the flexibility in the A-level courses that the school can offer its students, and I understand that some A-level courses are not recognised under the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009 in terms of UCAS points. This can make things difficult, especially in relation to the provision of courses through the medium of Welsh. Will the First Minister tell us whether the Assembly Government will look at this to ensure that there is flexibility in the system?

2.20 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os ysgrifennwch ataf, byddaf yn ysgrifennu yn ôl atoch gyda fy sylwadau ar y pwynt hwn.

The First Minister: If you write to me, I will write back to you with my comments on this point.

Mynediad i Fand Eang yng Nghymru

Access to Broadband in Wales

13. Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am fynediad i fand eang yng Nghymru. *OAQ(3)3238(FM)*

13. Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister make a statement on access to broadband in Wales. *OAQ(3)3238(FM)*

The First Minister: As part of 'Economic Renewal: a new direction', we have committed to ensuring that Wales will have

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel rhan o 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd', yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd gan Gymru y

the best broadband in the UK and Europe by 2020.

Nick Bourne: I thank the First Minister for that response. He will be aware of research cited by Ofcom's 'Communications Market Report: Wales' that large parts of mid and west Wales are unable to support the universal commitment of 2 Mbps, and that it is particularly serious in Powys, Ceredigion and Carmarthenshire. He will also know of the UK Government's spending review, which committed £530 million across the UK to support the development of the network. The rollout of the pilot schemes is an issue that has come and gone, but there is still money available, and I wonder if the First Minister could tell us what discussions are ongoing between the Government here and the Government at Westminster to access some of those funds.

The First Minister: We always look to access new funds as far as Wales is concerned. This has been looked at seriously by the Deputy First Minister and the Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills, but as far as Wales is concerned, unless there is intervention by Government, we will never have broadband of any speed in many parts of Wales. That is why we await with interest plans to roll out superfast broadband across the whole of the UK at an appropriate time.

Amodau Tywydd Garw

14. Andrew R.T. Davies: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu unrhyw ddarpariaethau arbennig sydd wedi cael eu gwneud yn barod am amodau tywydd garw megis y rheini a gafwyd y llynedd. OAQ(3)3257(FM)*

The First Minister: Emergency services, local authorities and other agencies have been working together in multi-agency groups to learn from the experiences of last year, and have further enhanced their preparation for this winter.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you for that response, First Minister. Last winter, you

band eang gorau yn y DU ac Ewrop erbyn 2020.

Nick Bourne: Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Bydd yn ymwybodol o'r ymchwil a nodwyd yn 'Adroddiad Marchnad Cyfathrebiadau: Cymru' Ofcom sef bod rhannau mawr o'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin yn methu â bodloni'r ymrwymiad cyffredinol o 2 Mbps, a bod y sefyllfa'n arbennig o ddifrifol ym Mhowys, Ceredigion a sir Gaerfyrddin. Bydd hefyd yn gwybod am adolygiad o wariant Llywodraeth y DU, a ymrwymodd £530 miliwn ledled y DU i gefnogi datblygu'r rhwydwaith. Mae cyflwyno'r cynlluniau peilot yn fater sydd wedi dod ac wedi mynd, ond mae arian yn dal i fod ar gael, ac yr wyf yn tybed a allai'r Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym pa drafodaethau sy'n cael eu cynnal rhwng y Llywodraeth yma a'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan i gael mynediad at rai o'r cronfeydd hynny.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn gyson yn ceisio cael mynediad at gronfeydd newydd cyn belled ag y mae Cymru dan sylw. Mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau wedi edrych yn ddifrifol ar hyn, ond cyn belled ag y mae Cymru dan sylw, oni bai bod y Llywodraeth yn ymyrryd, ni chawn byth fand eang ag unrhyw gyflymder mewn nifer o rannau o Gymru. Dyna pam yr ydym yn disgwyl â diddordeb am gynlluniau i gyflwyno band eang cyflym iawn ledled y DU ar adeg briodol.

Adverse Weather Conditions

14. Andrew R.T. Davies: *Will the First Minister outline any special provisions that have been made in anticipation of adverse weather conditions such as those experienced last year. OAQ(3)3257(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gwasanaethau argyfwng, awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau eraill wedi bod yn cydweithio mewn grwpiau amlasiantaethol i ddysgu o brofiadau'r llynedd, ac maent wedi gwneud mwy i wella eu paratodau am y gaeaf hwn.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Y gaeaf diwethaf,

gave a statement to Plenary outlining the actions of the Welsh Assembly Government. On reviewing the actions, and in particular the need to consult with local authorities and providers of public services, are you confident that lessons have been learned and appropriate action taken? While no-one can foresee how hard the winter might be, that lack of communication that some people were highlighting will hopefully have been alleviated by the lessons-learned campaign that the Government undertook at the end of last winter.

The First Minister: Back in January, I asked all those involved in dealing with the severe weather to come forward with proposals for this winter. I established a task and finish group, which reported to the resilience forum last month on the actions that have been taken since last winter, and I believe that those actions are robust.

rhoesoch ddatganiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn i amlinellu camau gweithredu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Wrth adolygu'r camau gweithredu, ac yn enwedig yr angen i ymgynghori ag awdurdodau lleol a darparwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a ydych yn hyderus bod gwersi wedi'u dysgu a bod camau priodol wedi'u cymryd? Er na all neb ragweld pa mor galed fydd y gaeaf, gobeithio y bydd ymgyrch dysgu gwersi'r Llywodraeth ar ddiwedd y gaeaf diwethaf wedi unioni'r diffyg cyfathrebu y tynnodd rai pobl sylw ato.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ôl ym mis Ionawr, gofynnais i bawb a oedd yn ymwneud â delio â'r tywydd garw i gyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer y gaeaf hwn. Sefydlais grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, a adroddodd wrth y fforwm Cymru Gydnerth y mis diwethaf am y camau a gymerwyd ers y gaeaf diwethaf, a chredaf fod y camau hynny'n rhai cadarn.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt): There is a change to this week's planned Government business. Later this afternoon, Lesley Griffiths, the Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills, will be making a statement on technium business centres. However, business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement announcement, which can be found among the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt): Mae newid i fusnes y Llywodraeth a gynlluniwyd ar gyfer yr wythnos yma. Yn ddiweddarach brynhawn heddiw, bydd Lesley Griffiths, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau, yn gwneud datganiad am ganolfannau busnes technium. Fodd bynnag, mae busnes y tair wythnos nesaf fel y nodir yn y cyhoeddiad datganiad busnes, sydd i'w gael ymysg y papurau agenda sydd ar gael i Weinidogion yn electronig.

William Graham: Minister, could you bring forward a statement from the Deputy First Minister on how procurement rules, particularly with regard to supply chains, are advertised and published? You will be aware of the complaint from a firm in Newport, which is a leading manufacturer of barriers used, for example, on the motorway, about losing a contract. No-one is suggesting that the tendering process was not properly run, but the consequence is that the firm that won the contract is an Austrian firm, and while I am not suggesting that it will bring anything the 1,000 miles to Newport, but it will bring materials from Leeds, nearly 200 miles away.

William Graham: Weinidog, a allech roi datganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am sut y caiff rheolau caffael, yn enwedig o ran cadwyni cyflenwi, eu hysbysebu a'u cyhoeddi? Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r gŵyn gan gwmni yng Nghasnewydd, sy'n un o brif gynhyrchwyr rhwystrau diogelwch sy'n cael eu defnyddio, er enghraifft, ar y draffordd, ynghylch colli contract. Nid oes neb yn awgrymu na chafodd y broses dendro ei chynnal yn briodol, ond y canlyniad yw mai cwmni o Awstria yw'r cwmni a enillodd y contract, ac er nad wyf yn awgrymu y bydd yn dod ag unrhyw beth i Gasnewydd o 1,000 o filltiroedd i ffwrdd, bydd yn dod â

What are the procurement rules regarding the effect on the environment? There will be a minimum of 33 journeys from Leeds to Newport, as opposed to short journeys within Newport, let alone the effect on jobs in the Newport area when local firms like this are not awarded contracts on a fair basis. This could apply anywhere in Wales.

Jane Hutt: As I know that you are aware, all projects like this have to be advertised on an EU-wide basis by law, and the contractors chosen provided the best value for the Welsh taxpayers' pound. It is also helpful to remember that the principal contractor on the M4 junction 27 to 28 scheme, Alun Griffiths (Contractors) Ltd, is based in Abergavenny and is using other local suppliers and businesses for the scheme. We would always encourage companies that are looking to bid for Welsh Assembly Government contracts to take advantage of the supplier development service, which is delivered in south-east Wales by Venture Wales, which in turn is backed by the European social fund, providing help and advice to companies on procurement and tendering procedures to help them to bid for and win public and private sector contracts.

Ann Jones: Could I ask you to consult with the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning about providing an oral statement in the near future on the task and finish group on future arrangements for funding for post-16 additional learning needs?

Jane Hutt: The Minister for education has published the report, which is very welcome, and he has sought additional funding in the budget. I know that the report's recommendations are being considered.

Eleanor Burnham: Could we have a statement and update on the proposed north Wales air service and one on the proposed new rail company that I understand the Deputy First Minister has been discussing? While many people in north Wales are happy to use the air service, given the general state of affairs now and the lack of money, most would much prefer an upgraded rail

defnyddiau o Leeds, sydd bron 200 o filltiroedd i ffwrdd. Beth yw'r rheolau caffael am yr effaith ar yr amgylchedd? Bydd o leiaf 33 o deithiau o Leeds i Gasnewydd, yn hytrach na theithiau byr o fewn Casnewydd, heb sôn am yr effaith ar swyddi yn ardal Casnewydd pan nad yw contractau'n cael eu dyfarnu'n deg i gwmnïau lleol fel hwn. Gallai hyn ddigwydd yn unrhyw le yng Nghymru.

Jane Hutt: Fel y gwn eich bod yn gwybod, rhaid i bob prosiect fel hwn gael ei hysbysebu ledled yr UE yn ôl y gyfraith, a'r contractwyr a ddewiswyd sy'n rhoi'r gwerth gorau am bunnoedd trethdalwyr Cymru. Mae'n gymorth hefyd cofio bod y prif gontractwr ar gynllun cyffordd 27 i 28 yr M4, Alun Griffiths (Contractors) Ltd, wedi'i leoli yn y Fenni a'i fod yn defnyddio cyflenwyr a busnesau lleol eraill ar gyfer y cynllun. Byddem bob amser yn annog cwmnïau sy'n bwriadu cynnig am gontractau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fanteisio ar y gwasanaeth datblygu cyflenwyr, a gyflenwir yn y deddwyrain gan Fenter Cymru, sydd yn ei dro wedi'i gefnogi gan gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop, sy'n rhoi cymorth a chynghor i gwmnïau am weithdrefnau tendro a chaffael i'w helpu i gynnig am gontractau o'r sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat, a'u hennill.

Ann Jones: A gaf ofyn i chi ymgynghori â'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am ddarparu datganiad llafar yn y dyfodol agos am y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar gyfer trefniadau ariannu anghenion dysgu ychwanegol ôl-16 yn y dyfodol?

Jane Hutt: Mae'r Gweinidog dros addysg wedi cyhoeddi'r adroddiad, a groesawyd yn gynnes, ac mae wedi ceisio cyllid ychwanegol yn y gyllideb. Gwn fod argymhellion yr adroddiad yn cael eu hystyried.

Eleanor Burnham: A gawn ddatganiad a diweddariad am wasanaeth awyr arfaethedig y gogledd ac un am y cwmni rheilffyrdd newydd arfaethedig y deallaf fod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi bod yn ei drafod? Er bod llawer o bobl yn y gogledd yn hapus i ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth awyr, ac ystyried y sefyllfa gyffredinol sydd ohoni a'r diffyg arian, byddai'n llawer gwell gan y rhan fwyaf

service—and I know that I am treading on some people's corns by saying that. Although we have Arriva Trains Wales, which receives a considerable amount of support from the Government, I am quite concerned about what is happening with regard to the proposed new rail company. In view of all those things that are going on, I believe that it is timely to have a statement and update on what is going on generally.

Jane Hutt: The current interim contract for the north-south air link was awarded for a seven-month period and will cease on 10 December. We hope to make an announcement shortly regarding the new four-year contract.

Nerys Evans: Ddydd Iau, 25 Tachwedd, fydd Diwrnod Rhuban Gwyn i godi ymwybyddiaeth ynghylch trais yn erbyn menywod. Gwn fod delio â thrais yn erbyn menywod yn flaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru, yn enwedig gyda chyhoeddi 'Yr Hawl i fod yn Ddiogel', sef ei strategaeth ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â phob math o drais yn erbyn menywod a cham-drin domestig, ddechrau'r flwyddyn. Mae hwn yn fater cymhleth iawn oherwydd bod llawer o'r gwasanaethau sydd ynghlwm wrth ddod â chyfiawnder a rhoi gwasanaethau i ddiodefwr heb gael eu datganoli, megis gwasanaeth yr heddlu, y llysoedd, a Gwasanaeth Erllyn y Goron. Wrth i Lywodraeth San Steffan dorri 20 y cant o gyllideb yr heddlu, er enghraifft, a oes modd inni gael datganiad gan Lywodraeth Cymru er mwyn rhoi'r diweddaraf inni am y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud i weithredu'r strategaeth i fynd i'r afael â thrais yn erbyn menywod? Mae'n bwysig inni gael gwybod sut mae'r newidiadau hyn ar lefel Brydeinig yn effeithio ar y gwaith da sy'n cael ei wneud gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn y maes hwn.

Jane Hutt: This is a very important opportunity to recognise the international day of action to end violence against women is on Thursday. It is also an opportunity to recognise that, in announcing the draft budget last week, I was glad to be able to say that the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, as a result of rigorous line-by-line scrutiny, had sought to protect

ohonynt gael gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd gwell—a gwn fy mod yn sathru ar draed rhai pobl wrth ddweud hynny. Er bod gennym Drenau Arriva Cymru, sy'n cael cryn dipyn o gefnogaeth gan y Llywodraeth, yr wyf yn eithaf pryderus am beth sy'n digwydd o ran y cwmni rheilffyrdd newydd arfaethedig. Ac ystyried popeth sy'n mynd ymlaen, credaf ei bod yn bryd inni gael datganiad a diweddariad am beth sy'n digwydd yn gyffredinol.

Jane Hutt: Cafodd y contract dros dro presennol ar gyfer y cyswllt awyr rhwng y de a'r gogledd ei ddyfarnu am gyfnod o saith mis a bydd yn dod i ben ar 10 Rhagfyr. Gobeithiwn wneud cyhoeddiad yn fuan am y contract newydd pedair mlynedd.

Nerys Evans: Thursday, 25 November, will be White Ribbon Day, raising awareness of violence against women. I know that dealing with violence against women is a priority of the Welsh Government, especially with the publication at the beginning of the year of 'The Right to be Safe', which is its strategy for dealing with all sorts of violence against women and domestic violence. This is a very complicated business because many of the services that bring people to justice and provide support to victims have not been devolved, such as the police forces, the courts, and the Crown Prosecution Service. As the Westminster Government cuts 20 per cent from the police budget, for example, could we have a statement from the Welsh Government on the latest work that is being done to implement the strategy for dealing with violence against women? It is important that we are told how these changes on the British level are affecting the good work that is being done by the Welsh Government in this field.

Jane Hutt: Mae hwn yn gyfle pwysig iawn i gydnabod bod y diwrnod rhyngwladol o weithredu i ddiweddu trais yn erbyn menywod ddydd Iau. Mae hefyd yn gyfle i gydnabod fy mod, wrth gyhoeddi'r gyllideb ddrafft yr wythnos diwethaf, yn falch o allu dweud bod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, o ganlyniad i graffu trwyadl fesul llinell, wedi

investment in the 'Right to be Safe' six-year strategy to tackle violence against women. That demonstrates that this issue is a top priority for the Minister and, indeed, for this Government.

There are concerns about the police funding settlement, and given that policing is not devolved, we must await the Home Office announcement. We should recognise that although crime is generally falling across Wales, the issues of domestic violence must be addressed, and policing is vital with regard to tackling unacceptable violence against women in our communities.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Minister for Business and Budget for her statement. From time to time, we hear in the media about 'the last community' in the United Kingdom to be connected to mains electricity—I am sure that I have heard that three or four times since I have been an Assembly Member. Indeed, I received a letter last week about families in the Elan valley that still do not have mains electricity, and I have subsequently written to the supply company. This matter probably falls within Carl's area, but could a written statement be issued on this issue, given that, particularly with the increase in the price of diesel, this is a real problem for some families in Wales that remain without mains electricity. Therefore, I wonder whether such a statement could be forthcoming from the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government—I see that he is nodding his head, which is a good sign.

Jane Hutt: I think that the Minister has heard your plea, and I am sure that the Elan valley will hear an update on this matter.

2.30 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: I called for a statement on the provision for ex-forces personnel in Wales with complex post-traumatic stress disorder in the context of a new report from the Howard League for Penal Reform entitled 'Leave No Veteran Behind'. My attention was drawn to this by Elfyn Llwyd, Member

ceisio diogelu'r buddsoddiad yn y strategaeth chwe mlynedd 'Hawl i fod yn Ddiogel' i fynd i'r afael â thrais yn erbyn menywod. Mae hynny'n dangos bod y mater hwn yn un o brif flaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog ac, yn wir, y Llywodraeth hon.

Ceir pryderon am setliad cyllid yr heddlu; ac ystyried nad yw plismona wedi'i ddatganoli, rhaid inni aros am gyhoeddiad y Swyddfa Gartref. Dylem gydnabod, er bod troseddu'n gostwng yn gyffredinol ledled Cymru, bod rhaid rhoi sylw i drais domestig, a bod plismona'n hollbwysig o ran mynd i'r afael â thrais annerbyniol yn erbyn menywod yn ein cymunedau.

Nick Bourne: Diolch i'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb am ei datganiad. O bryd i'w gilydd, byddwn yn clywed yn y cyfryngau am 'y gymuned olaf' yn y Deyrnas Unedig i gael ei chysylltu â'r prif gyflenwad trydan—yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod wedi clywed hynny dair neu bedair gwaith ers imi fod yn Aelod Cynulliad. Yn wir, cefais lythyr yr wythnos diwethaf am deuluoedd yng nghwm Elan sy'n dal i fod heb drydan prif gyflenwad, ac yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y cwmni cyflenwi o ganlyniad i hyn. Mae'n debyg bod y mater hwn ym maes Carl, ond a ellid cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig am y mater hwn, ac ystyried, yn enwedig gyda'r cynnydd ym mhris diesel, bod hyn yn broblem wirioneddol i rai teuluoedd yng Nghymru sy'n dal i fod heb drydan prif gyflenwad. Felly, yr wyf yn tybed a allem gael datganiad o'r fath gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol—gwelaf ei fod yn nodio, sy'n arwydd da.

Jane Hutt: Credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi clywed eich ple, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd cwm Elan yn cael diweddariad am y mater hwn.

Mark Isherwood: Galwais am ddatganiad am y ddarpariaeth i gyn-bersonél y lluoedd arfog yng Nghymru sy'n dioddef o anhwylder straen wedi trawma cymhleth yng nghyd-destun adroddiad newydd Cynghrair Howard dros Ddiwygio Cosbau dan y teitl 'Leave No Veteran Behind'. Tynnwyd fy

of Parliament, who sat on the advisory group for this inquiry, asking why so many veterans find themselves caught in the criminal justice system, stating that it is vital that the complex needs of armed forces personnel are adequately addressed and that we do everything that we can to help those who serve their country to adjust to civilian life. It found that the US routinely screens for post-traumatic stress disorder, depression, problem drinking and military sexual trauma, but that no equivalent screening is done in the UK. Given the complexity of this form of PTSD, with dual diagnosis often linked to mental health problems and substance misuse, in the UK discussion of substance misuse as a problem for the armed forces focuses almost entirely on alcohol, whereas, in the US, substance misuse is recognised as a particular problem for veterans, accepting that drugs and alcohol contribute to offending behaviour among veterans. In fact, the King's Centre for Military Health Research in the UK states that 11 per cent of the UK veterans who are in prison are serving sentences for drug-related offences, and that illicit drug use may feature as a factor in the offending in several categories. The interrelated context of this, which impacts on so many areas that are devolved to Wales, in the context of this report, demands a response.

Jane Hutt: This is very much an interrelated issue in terms of devolved and non-devolved responsibilities. We are working closely with the Ministry of Defence on that. The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government is leading on this, taking up your point about the interrelated delivery of appropriate services for servicemen and servicewomen who have suffered complex post-traumatic stress disorders.

Jonathan Morgan: It was reported over the weekend that a doctor who had been convicted of manslaughter in Spain had been working shifts at the University Hospital of Wales in Cardiff. I am sure that you share my concern that this has, sadly, been allowed to

sylw at hyn gan Elfyn Llwyd, Aelod Seneddol, a oedd yn rhan o grŵp cynghori'r ymchwiliad hwn, a ofynnodd pam mae cymaint o gyn-filwyr yn cael eu dal yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol, gan nodi ei bod yn hollbwysig bod anghenion cymhleth personél y lluoedd arfog yn cael sylw digonol a'n bod yn gwneud popeth y gallwn i helpu'r rheini sy'n gwasanaethu eu gwlad i addasu i fywyd fel sifiliaid. Canfu fod UDA yn sgrinio'n rheolaidd am anhwylder straen wedi trawma, iselder, yfed problemus a thrawma rhywiol milwrol, ond nad oes sgrinio cyfatebol yn digwydd yn y DU. Ac ystyried pa mor gymhleth yw'r math hwn o anhwylder straen wedi trawma, a bod diagnosis deuol yn aml yn gysylltiedig â phroblemau iechyd meddwl a chamddefnyddio sylweddau, yn y DU mae trafod camddefnyddio sylweddau fel problem i'r lluoedd arfog yn canolbwyntio bron yn llwyr ar alcohol, ond yn UDA, cydnabyddir bod camddefnyddio sylweddau'n broblem arbennig i gyn-filwyr, a derbynnir bod cyffuriau ac alcohol yn cyfrannu at ymddygiad troseddol ymysg cyn-filwyr. Yn wir, mae Canolfan Ymchwil Iechyd Milwrol King's yn y DU yn datgan bod 11 y cant o gyn-filwyr o'r DU sydd yn y carchar wedi'u dedfrydu am droseddau cysylltiedig â chyffuriau, ac y gallai defnyddio cyffuriau anghyfreithlon fod yn ffactor yn y troseddu mewn sawl categori. Mae angen ateb ar gyddestun cydberthynol hyn, sy'n effeithio ar gynifer o feysydd sydd wedi'u datganoli i Gymru, yng nghyd-destun yr adroddiad hwn.

Jane Hutt: Mae hwn yn sicr yn fater cydberthynol o ran cyfrifoldebau datganoledig a rhai nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ar hynny. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn arwain y gwaith hwn, i gymryd eich pwynt am gyflenwi cydberthynol gwasanaethau priodol i filwyr sydd wedi dioddef anhwylderau straen wedi trawma cymhleth.

Jonathan Morgan: Cafwyd adroddiadau dros y penwythnos bod meddyg a gafodd gollfarn am ddynladdiad yn Sbaen wedi bod yn gweithio shiffitiau yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru yng Nghaerdydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn rhannu fy mhryder bod hyn, yn

happen. As I understand it, the doctor in question, when he was convicted of manslaughter in Spain, did not have his practice licence revoked by the Spanish equivalent of the General Medical Council, on the assumption that, if he ended up working anywhere else in Europe, he would be obliged to tell the authorities of his past conviction. I find it astonishing that the expectation would be on him to reveal his conviction.

Niall Dickson, chief executive of the GMC, has stated that it is important that regulators across Europe tell each other when action has been taken against a doctor. Unfortunately, this does not always happen as it should. In addition, he has confirmed that, while the GMC tells other regulators when we take action against particular doctors, the law in Europe does not require others to do the same. This is a serious matter, particularly when we in Wales, as is the case throughout the UK, rely on doctors and other health professionals who come to work here from the European Union, many of whom are highly qualified, professional and motivated members of staff. However, something has gone wrong here, with this individual having been employed by the University Hospital of Wales. Would the Minister for Health and Social Services be willing to make an oral statement in the Chamber to reassure patients who are being treated in Welsh hospitals, as well as to outline what action might be taken, in collaboration with the Whitehall Department of Health, as to how the European angle could be resolved?

Jane Hutt: As you say, this is a matter for the GMC, to ensure that its systems, in terms of regulation, take on board the weaknesses that have been exposed by this case. I know that the Minister for Health and Social Services is prepared to take this up with the GMC, as well as with colleagues, as appropriate, in the Department of Health.

anffodus, wedi cael digwydd. Fel y deallaf, pan gafodd y meddyg dan sylw gollfarn am ddynladdiad yn Sbaen, ni wnaeth y corff yn Sbaen sy'n cyfateb i'r Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol ddirymu ei drwydded ymarfer, gan dybio, pe bai'n mynd i weithio yn rhywle arall yn Ewrop, y byddai'n rhaid iddo ddweud wrth yr awdurdodau am ei gollfarn yn y gorffennol. Mae'n syfrdanol imi y byddai disgwyliad arno ef i ddatgelu ei gollfarn.

Mae Niall Dickson, prif weithredwr y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol, wedi dweud ei bod yn bwysig bod cyrff rheoleiddio ledled Ewrop yn dweud wrth ei gilydd pan gymerwyd camau yn erbyn meddyg. Yn anffodus, nid yw hyn yn digwydd fel y dylai bob tro. Mae hefyd wedi cadarnhau, er bod y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol yn dweud wrth gyrff rheoleiddio eraill pan fyddwn yn cymryd camau yn erbyn meddygon penodol, nad yw'r gyfraith yn Ewrop yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol bod eraill yn gwneud yr un fath. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol, yn enwedig pan yr ydym ni yng Nghymru, a ledled y DU, yn dibynnu ar feddygon a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill ym maes iechyd sy'n dod yma i weithio o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, a llawer ohonynt yn aelodau staff cymwysedig, proffesiynol a brwdfrydig iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae rhywbeth wedi mynd o'i le yn yr achos hwn, gan fod yr unigolyn hwn wedi cael ei gyflogi gan Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. A fyddai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn fodlon gwneud datganiad llafar yn y Siambr i dawelu meddyliau cleifion sy'n cael eu trin yn ysbytai Cymru, yn ogystal ag i amlinellu pa gamau y gellid eu cymryd, ar y cyd â'r Adran Iechyd yn Whitehall, i ddatrys yr agwedd Ewropeaidd?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedwch, mater i'r Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol yw hwn, i sicrhau bod eu systemau, o ran rheoleiddio, yn ystyried y gwendidau y mae'r achos hwn wedi'u datgelu. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn barod i drafod hyn gyda'r Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol, a gyda'i gydweithwyr, fel sy'n briodol, yn yr Adran Iechyd.

Datganiad Deddfwriaethol am y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Tai (Cymru) **Legislative Statement on the Proposed Housing (Wales) Measure**

The Deputy Minister for Housing and Regeneration (Jocelyn Davies): Yesterday, I laid the Proposed Housing (Wales) Measure, together with an explanatory memorandum, before the National Assembly. I also issued a written statement, and I am pleased to introduce the proposed Measure for Assembly Members' consideration today. The proposed Measure will cover two important areas, which are intended to improve the delivery of affordable housing. The first covers the suspension of the right to buy and related rights. The second provides Welsh Ministers with enhanced intervention and enforcement powers over the provision of housing by registered social landlords.

As Members are well aware, this proposed Measure has been long in the making, but the time taken to obtain the legislative competence has been well used. We have worked closely with the housing sector, and this proposed Measure is the result of a collaborative effort. Indeed, the Council of Mortgage Lenders and the Welsh Tenants Federation, among others, have positively welcomed the proposals for the enhanced intervention and enforcement powers.

The right-to-buy part of the proposed Measure is based on a commitment in 'One Wales', and will enable local housing authorities to apply to Welsh Ministers for a direction to suspend right to buy in areas of housing pressure. The objective underlying the policy is to provide local housing authorities with a period of grace, when statutory rights are suspended, to enable the supply of affordable housing in the area subject to a direction to be increased by other means. Ways in which this could be done include the use of section 106 planning agreements, the use of public sector land for affordable housing, bringing back empty properties into use as affordable homes, and an increase in non-grant funded affordable housing. When the supply of affordable housing has been built up and the period of suspension ends, it is intended that tenants

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai ac Adfywio (Jocelyn Davies): Ddoe, gosodais y Mesur Tai Arfaethedig (Cymru), ynghyd â memorandwm esboniadol, gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cyhoeddais hefyd ddatganiad ysgrifenedig, ac mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r Mesur arfaethedig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ei ystyried heddiw. Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn ymdrin â dau faes pwysig, gyda'r bwriad o wella cyflenwi tai fforddiadwy. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymdrin ag atal yr hawl i brynu a hawliau cysylltiedig. Mae'r ail yn rhoi mwy o bwerau ymyrryd a gorfodi i Weinidogion Cymru dros ddarpariaeth tai gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig.

Fel y mae Aelodau'n gwybod yn iawn, mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn wedi bod ar y gweill ers amser maith, ond mae'r amser a gymerwyd i gael y cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol wedi cael ei ddefnyddio'n dda. Yr ydym wedi cydweithio'n agos â'r sector tai, ac mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn ganlyniad i ymdrech gydweithredol. Yn wir, mae'r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi a Ffederasiwn Tenantiaid Cymru, ymysg eraill, wedi rhoi croeso cadarnhaol i'r cynigion am y pwerau ychwanegol o ran ymyrryd a gorfodi.

Mae'r rhan o'r Mesur arfaethedig sy'n ymwneud â'r hawl i brynu'n seiliedig ar un o ymrwymadau 'Cymru'n Un', a bydd yn galluogi awdurdodau tai lleol i wneud cais i Weinidogion Cymru am gyfarwyddyd i atal hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle ceir pwysau oherwydd prinder tai. Yr amcan sy'n tanatgu'r polisi yw rhoi cyfnod gras i awdurdodau tai lleol, pan gaiff hawliau statudol eu hatal, i alluogi i'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy yn yr ardal sy'n destun cyfarwyddyd gael ei gynyddu mewn modd arall. Mae ffyrdd o wneud hyn yn cynnwys defnyddio cytundebau cynllunio adran 106, defnyddio tir sector cyhoeddus ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, ailddechrau defnyddio eiddo gwag fel tai fforddiadwy, a chynyddu'r tai fforddiadwy nad ydynt yn cael cyllid grant. Pan mae cyflenwad tai fforddiadwy wedi'i gynyddu a chyfnod yr atal yn dod i ben,

will be able to exercise their statutory rights once again. The way in which suspension of the right to buy is set out on the face of the proposed Measure makes the objective very clear, in that suspension will only be used as a temporary mechanism to halt the sale of social housing in a clearly defined area while the supply is increased by other means.

The proposed Measure provides that only local authorities may apply for suspension. This is because, as strategic housing providers, they have a duty to assess and make provision for housing needs in their areas, whether or not they retain housing stock. However, before submitting an application, the Measure states that they must consult interested bodies, such as local registered social landlords and tenants' groups. Local authorities will also have to provide evidence to demonstrate what action they will take during the suspension period to improve the supply of affordable housing. The proposed suspension period is for a maximum of five years, with the possibility of one extension for a further five years, if further convincing evidence is provided. I believe that the proposed Measure represents a sensible compromise between improving provision for people who are in housing need, while also recognising the long-term aspirations of tenants who wish to buy the home that they currently rent.

Part two of the proposed Measure will provide the Welsh Ministers with enhanced regulatory and intervention powers concerning the provision of housing by registered social landlords. A very broad range of intervention powers is required to maintain the rigour and credibility of the regulation of registered social landlords. This is because we must ensure that lenders' confidence in the regulatory regime for registered social landlords is maintained, so that they are content to continue investing in Wales. Our RSL sector spends almost £500 million a year and provides 14,000 jobs, directly and indirectly—it is clearly a very important sector. In the future, as the sector develops against a backdrop of tighter public expenditure, the demand for funding from

bwriedir y bydd tenantiaid yn gallu defnyddio eu hawliau statudol unwaith eto. Mae atal yr hawl i brynu wedi'i amlinellu ar wyneb y Mesur arfaethedig mewn modd sy'n gwneud yr amcan yn glir iawn, sef na chaiff yr atal ei ddefnyddio ond fel mecanwaith dros dro i stopio gwerthu tai cymdeithasol mewn ardal sydd wedi'i diffinio'n glir tra mae'r cyflenwad yn cael ei gynyddu mewn modd arall.

Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn darparu mai dim ond awdurdodau lleol sy'n cael gwneud cais am ataliad. Y rheswm am hyn yw bod ganddynt ddyletswydd fel darparwyr tai strategol i asesu'r angen am dai yn eu hardaloedd hwy a darparu ar ei gyfer, heb ystyried a ydynt yn cadw stoc tai ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, cyn cyflwyno cais, mae'r Mesur yn datgan bod rhaid iddynt ymgynghori â chyrff â diddordeb, megis landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig lleol a grwpiau tenantiaid. Bydd rhaid i awdurdodau lleol hefyd roi tystiolaeth i ddangos pa gamau y byddant yn eu cymryd yn ystod cyfnod yr ataliad i wella'r cyflenwad tai fforddiadwy. Uchafswm cyfnod yr ataliad arfaethedig yw pum mlynedd, gyda'r posibilrwydd o un estyniad am bum mlynedd arall, os darperir rhagor o dystiolaeth argyhoeddiadol. Credaf fod y Mesur arfaethedig yn gyfaddawd synhwyrol rhwng gwella'r ddarpariaeth i bobl sydd mewn angen o ran tai, gan hefyd gydnabod dyheadau hirdymor tenantiaid sy'n dymuno prynu'r tŷ y maent yn ei rentu ar hyn o bryd.

Bydd ail ran y Mesur arfaethedig yn rhoi mwy o bwerau rheoleiddio ac ymyrryd i Weinidogion Cymru o ran darpariaeth tai gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Mae angen ystod eang iawn o bwerau ymyrryd i gynnal manylrwydd a hygredded rheoleiddio landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Y rheswm am hyn yw bod rhaid inni sicrhau bod darparwyr benthyciadau'n aros yn hyderus yn y drefn o reoleiddio landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, er mwyn iddynt fod yn fodlon i ddal i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru. Mae ein sector landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig yn gwario bron £500 miliwn y flwyddyn gan ddarparu 14,000 o swyddi, yn uniongyrchol ac yn anuniongyrchol—mae'n amlwg yn sector pwysig iawn. Yn y dyfodol, wrth i'r sector

existing associations and new transfer organisations will increase. This is likely to occur along with challenging conditions for private finance and the wider funding shortage. It is, therefore, crucial that the development of the new regulatory regime ensures that the ability of the housing association sector to attract private finance is maximised for the benefit of tenants.

The move towards obtaining these powers is part of the wider package of regulatory reform that is being developed with the sector. This includes the set of delivery outcomes for registered social landlords, which I launched recently with Community Housing Cymru. These performance standards are intended to improve service delivery using annual self-assessments based on evidence. It is this new regulatory regime, with these delivery outcomes, that needs to be reinforced by the powers contained in the proposed Measure. The powers include accepting a voluntary undertaking, commissioning an inspection, imposing a penalty, appointing a manager, or, in extreme cases, amalgamating an RSL with another body. I hope that we will not have cause to use the powers, but if problems do occur, we need to be able to intervene quickly to protect services for tenants and the financial viability of the registered social landlord. To conclude, I encourage Members to study the proposed Measure carefully, and I hope that Members will welcome the opportunities that this proposed Measure affords to communities across Wales. I look forward to working with Assembly Members and others who have an interest in social housing in scrutinising the proposed Measure.

2.40 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: Thank you, Deputy Minister, for your statement on two important areas that are intended to improve the delivery of affordable housing. I will speak first about the proposals for regulation relating to registered social landlords. As you say, enhanced regulatory and intervention

ddatblygu yn erbyn cefndir o lai o wariant cyhoeddus, bydd y galw am gyllid gan gymdeithasau sy'n bodoli eisoes a sefydliadau trosglwyddo newydd yn cynyddu. Mae'n debygol y bydd hyn yn digwydd ynghyd ag amodau heriol i gyllid preifat a'r prinder cyllid mwy cyffredinol. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig bod datblygu'r drefn reoleiddio newydd yn sicrhau bod gan y sector cymdeithasau tai gymaint â phosibl o allu i ddenu cyllid preifat, er budd i denantiaid.

Mae'r symudiad tuag at gael y pwerau hyn yn rhan o'r pecyn ehangach o ddiwygio rheoleiddio sy'n cael ei ddatblygu gyda'r sector. Mae hyn yn cynnwys y set o ganlyniadau cyflenwi i landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, a lansiais yn ddiweddar gyda Thai Cymunedol Cymru. Bwriad y safonau perfformiad hyn yw gwella'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau eu cyflenwi drwy ddefnyddio hunanasesiadau blynyddol yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth. Y drefn reoleiddio newydd hon, gyda'r canlyniadau cyflenwi hyn, sydd angen ei hatgyfnerthu gan y pwerau yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Mae'r pwerau'n cynnwys derbyn ymgymeriadau gwirfoddol, comisiynu arolygiadau, gosod cosbau, penodi rheolwyr, neu, mewn achosion eithafol, uno landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig â chorff arall. Gobeithiaf na chawn achos i ddefnyddio'r pwerau, ond os bydd problemau'n digwydd, bydd angen inni allu ymyrryd yn gyflym i amddiffyn gwasanaethau i denantiaid a hyfywedd ariannol y landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig. I gloi, anogaf Aelodau i astudio'r Mesur arfaethedig yn ofalus, a gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n croesawu'r cyfleoedd y mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn eu rhoi i gymunedau ledled Cymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at gydweithio ag Aelodau Cynulliad ac eraill sydd â diddordeb mewn tai cymdeithasol i graffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig.

Mark Isherwood: Diolch, Ddirprwy Weinidog, am eich datganiad am ddau faes pwysig y bwriedir iddynt wella cyflenwi tai fforddiadwy. Siaradaf yn gyntaf am y cynigion am reoleiddio yng nghyswllt landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Fel y dywedwch, mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn

powers concerning the provision of housing by registered social landlords are included in the proposed Measure. You say that

‘we must ensure that lenders’ confidence in the regulatory regime for registered social landlords is maintained so that they are content to continue investing in Wales’.

I know that Community Housing Cymru is broadly content with that, and sees it as reading across from powers that apply already in England. What discussions have you had with the Council of Mortgage Lenders in Wales regarding this matter? Can you confirm that it, too, is content with the proposals as drafted? How will this prudential and risk-based approach allow registered social landlords to increase the level of enterprise and investment in other areas to generate revenue that may be invested back into social and affordable housing and wider regeneration activities?

With regard to the right to buy, you have said that

‘the way in which suspension of the right to buy is set out on the face of the proposed Measure makes the objective very clear, in that suspension will only be used as a temporary mechanism to halt the sale of social housing in a clearly defined area while supply is increased by other means’.

How many new units do you expect that to generate or safeguard, given the constraints that you apply, namely the fact that it will be temporary and undertaken in a defined area? The UK’s leading researcher in this area, Professor Wilcox, said that suspending the right to buy for a limited time in a specified area would not contribute to improving the availability of affordable housing. An average tenant remains in occupation for 15 years, so it would have no impact on short-term or even medium-term housing pressure. We are talking about short-term or, in your words, ‘temporary’, activity in this area. The Welsh Affairs Committee’s report on the legislative competence Order that led to the

cynnwys mwy o bwerau rheoleiddio ac ymyrryd ar gyfer tai a ddarperir gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Dywedwch

‘rhaid inni sicrhau bod darparwyr benthyciadau’n aros yn hyderus yn y drefn o reoleiddio landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, er mwyn iddynt fod yn fodlon i ddal i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru.’

Gwn fod Tai Cymunedol Cymru’n gyffredinol fodlon â hynny, a’u bod yn ei weld yn cyfateb i bwerau sydd eisoes mewn grym yn Lloegr. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi’u cael â’r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi yng Nghymru am y mater hwn? A allwch gadarnhau eu bod hwy hefyd yn fodlon â’r cynigion fel y maent wedi’u drafftio? Sut y bydd y dull darbodus hwn sy’n seiliedig ar risg yn galluogi landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig i gynyddu lefel y fenter a’r buddsoddi mewn meysydd eraill i gynhyrchu refeniw a all gael ei ail-fuddsoddi mewn tai cymdeithasol a fforddiadwy ac mewn gweithgareddau adfywio mwy cyffredinol?

O ran yr hawl i brynu, yr ydych wedi dweud

‘mae atal yr hawl i brynu wedi’i amlinellu ar wyneb y Mesur arfaethedig mewn modd sy’n gwneud yr amcan yn glir iawn, sef na chaiff yr atal ei ddefnyddio ond fel mecanwaith dros dro i stopio gwerthu tai cymdeithasol mewn ardal sydd wedi’i diffinio’n glir tra mae’r cyflenwad yn cael ei gynyddu mewn modd arall.’

Sawl uned newydd yr ydych yn disgwyl i hynny eu cynhyrchu neu eu diogelu, ac ystyried y cyfyngiadau yr ydych yn eu gosod, sef y ffaith y caiff ei wneud dros dro ac mewn ardal ddiffiniedig? Dywedodd prif ymchwilydd y DU yn y maes hwn, yr Athro Wilcox, na fyddai atal yr hawl i brynu am gyfnod cyfyngedig mewn ardal benodol yn cyfrannu at gynyddu nifer y tai fforddiadwy sydd ar gael. Mae deiliadaeth tenant cyfartalog yn para 15 mlynedd, felly ni châi hyn ddim effaith ar bwysau oherwydd prinder tai yn y tymor byr, na’r tymor canolig hyd yn oed. Yr ydym yn sôn am weithgarwch tymor byr neu, yn eich geiriau chi, ‘dros dro’ yn y maes hwn. Yr oedd adroddiad y Pwyllgor

proposed Measure stated that

‘suspension of the Right to Buy would not, of itself, result in an increase in the supply of affordable housing’.

We on this side are determined to support Measures that will help to tackle the housing crisis in Wales. However, we still struggle to support elements in relation to which we can see no evidence to indicate that they would make any difference whatsoever. Why has the right to buy been prioritised over many other good things that were in the legislative competence Order, in areas such as homelessness, affordable housing supply, neutral tenure, housing-related support for the most vulnerable and so on, which surely should be priorities for this Welsh Government and its successor, in whatever form it presents itself?

There is no reference in your statement or in proposals to funding. I know that we face a black hole in funding for various reasons. However, I was pleased to see that, in the Welsh Government’s capital allocation announcement yesterday, £3 million was announced for the Welsh housing investment trust. Could you advise the Assembly of how matters are progressing in that vital respect, and how matters are progressing in your dialogue with the UK Treasury over housing revenue accounts, given that the Bevan Foundation’s report found that the great mistake made in 2000 by Governments in London and Cardiff has led to Wales losing over £1 billion of public expenditure over the last decade. It has praised you, Deputy Minister, for being the first person in the Welsh Government to intervene. It says that a consistent feature of Government is that, unless rigorously challenged—as I have in this area—it does not revisit or question its previous decisions.

Finally, how would you respond to the Home Builders Federation’s report, issued at the end of last week, which expressed deep

Materion Cymreig am y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol yn datgan

ni fyddai atal yr Hawl i Brynu, ynddo’i hun, yn achosi cynnydd yng nghyflenwad tai fforddiadwy.

Yr ydym ni ar yr ochr hon yn benderfynol o gefnogi Mesurau a fydd yn helpu i fynd i’r afael â’r argyfwng tai yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dal i’w chael yn anodd cefnogi elfennau pan na allwn weld dim tystiolaeth i ddangos y byddent yn gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth o gwbl. Pam mae’r hawl i brynu wedi’i blaenoriaethu dros nifer o bethau da eraill a oedd yn y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, mewn meysydd megis digartrefedd, cyflenwad tai fforddiadwy, deiliadaeth niwtral, cymorth cysylltiedig â thai i’r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed ac ati? Nid oes bosibl na dylai’r rhain fod yn flaenoriaethau i Lywodraeth Cymru ar hyn o bryd ac i’w holynydd, ar ba ffurf bynnag y bydd yn ymddangos?

Nid yw eich datganiad na’ch cynigion yn cyfeirio at gyllid. Gwn ein bod yn wynebu twll du o ran cyllid am resymau amrywiol. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn yn falch o weld, yng nghyhoeddiad dyraniad cyfalaf Llywodraeth Cymru ddoe, y cyhoeddwyd £3 miliwn i ymddiriedolaeth buddsoddi tai Cymru. A allech roi gwybod i’r Cynulliad sut y mae materion yn symud ymlaen yn y cyswllt hollbwysig hwnnw, a sut y mae materion yn symud ymlaen yn eich deialog â Thrysorlys y DU dros gyfrifon refeniw tai, ac ystyried bod adroddiad Sefydliad Bevan wedi canfod bod y camgymeriad mawr a wnaethpwyd yn 2000 gan Lywodraethau yn Llundain a Chaerdydd wedi colli dros £1 biliwn o wariant cyhoeddus i Gymru dros y degawd diwethaf. Mae wedi rhoi clod i chi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, am mai chi oedd yr unigolyn cyntaf yn Llywodraeth Cymru i ymyrryd yn y mater. Mae’n dweud mai un o nodweddion cyson Llywodraeth yw, oni chaiff ei herio’n drwyadl—fel yr wyf fi wedi gwneud yn y maes hwn—nad yw’n ailystyried ei phenderfyniadau blaenorol nac yn eu cwestiynu.

Yn olaf, sut y byddech yn ymateb i adroddiad y Ffederasiwn Adeiladwyr Cartrefi, a gyhoeddwyd ddiweddd yr wythnos diwethaf, a

concern about the way in which local and national policy is being proposed and implemented in Wales, and the impact that that is having on the ability of the sector to deliver housing, including affordable housing, in Wales?

Jocelyn Davies: Thank you for your comments, Mark. You started with regulation and you made a comparison with the regulatory regime in England. I know that there will be changes there and that there will be less regulation in England. You asked whether I have had any discussions with the Council of Mortgage Lenders, so I will quote from that organisation. I know that you like quotations from outside organisations—you will love this one, and you can take it from the Record tomorrow.

‘in Wales lenders key concerns are around how the regulator will ensure the financial viability of the sector and that housing associations have good governance arrangements in place. We welcome the progress made on this through the development of an approach that includes robust, evidence-based self assessment, a set of delivery outcomes linked to governance and viability and a risk based proportionate approach to regulation in future. The key outstanding points for lenders are the delivery of formal judgements on viability and government by the regulator and a statutory basis for the regulator’s objectives and intervention and enforcement powers.’

Therefore, I can assure you that we have engaged with the sector throughout the process. We have already done what we can to change the regulatory regime, which the organisation has praised, and it says that this legislation is needed. Therefore, I know that we will have your support on that.

You asked about the number of new units. Professor Wilcox is quite right to say that if you only suspend the right to buy, you do not produce any more units. I am quite clear on that. You keep quoting him out of context, because you know that, on the face of the proposed Measure, it is stated that no application for suspension would be allowed unless a local authority, in making its

fynegodd bryder dwfn am y modd y mae polisïau lleol a chenedlaethol yn cael eu cynnig a’u gweithredu yng Nghymru, ac am effaith hynny ar allu’r sector i gyflenwi tai, gan gynnwys tai fforddiadwy, yng Nghymru?

Jocelyn Davies: Diolch am eich sylwadau, Mark. Fe wnaethoch ddechrau ym maes rheoleiddio a gwnaethoch gymhariaeth â’r drefn reoleiddio yn Lloegr. Gwn y bydd newidiadau yno ac y bydd llai o reoleiddio yn Lloegr. Gofynasoch a wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau â’r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi, felly dyfynnaf y sefydliad hwnnw. Gwn eich bod yn hoff o ddyfyniadau gan sefydliadau allanol—byddwch wrth eich bodd â’r un hwn, a gallwch ei gymryd o’r Cofnod yfory.

yng Nghymru, mae prif bryderon darparwyr benthyciadau’n ymwneud â sut y bydd y rheoleiddiwr yn sicrhau hyfywedd ariannol y sector a bod gan gymdeithasau tai drefniadau llywodraethu da ar waith. Yr ydym yn croesawu’r cynnydd a wnaethpwyd yn hyn o beth drwy ddatblygu dull sy’n cynnwys hunanasesu cadarn yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, set o ganlyniadau cyflawni sy’n gysylltiedig â llywodraethu a hyfywedd a dull rheoleiddio cymesur sy’n seiliedig ar risg yn y dyfodol. Y pwyntiau allweddol i ddarparwyr benthyciadau nad ydynt wedi cael sylw yw dyfarniadau ffurfiol am hyfywedd a llywodraethu gan y rheoleiddiwr a sail statudol i amcanion y rheoleiddiwr a’i bwerau ymyrryd a gorfodi.

Felly, gallaf eich sicrhau ein bod wedi ymgysylltu â’r sector drwy gydol y broses. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud beth y gallwn i newid y drefn reoleiddio, ac wedi cael clod am hynny gan y sefydliad, sy’n dweud bod angen y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Felly, gwn y cawn eich cefnogaeth yn hynny o beth.

Gofynasoch am nifer yr unedau newydd. Mae’r Athro Wilcox yn gywir wrth ddweud na fyddwch yn cynhyrchu dim mwy o unedau drwy atal yr hawl i brynu’n unig. Yr wyf yn eithaf clar am hynny. Yr ydych yn mynnu ei ddyfynnu allan o’i gyd-destun, gan eich bod yn gwybod, ar wyneb y Mesur arfaethedig, ei fod yn datgan na chaniateid unrhyw gais am ataliad oni bai bod awdurdod lleol, wrth

application, explains what it intends to do in the suspension period. That is a requirement on the face of the proposed Measure.

On the social housing grant, I know that we have a problem with funding. That is not the fault of the Welsh Assembly Government, which has prioritised the social housing grant over the last few years. However, from the next financial year, I will allow local authorities to decide within their areas where social housing grants will be spent. Not only will they be required to explain to us, they will have mechanisms available to them in order to increase supply.

As to the question of why we have focused on the right to buy, it is a 'One Wales' pledge and it is a manifesto promise—not just in Plaid Cymru's manifesto, but in Labour's manifesto and in the manifesto of the Lib Dems, the Welsh Local Government Association, Shelter, and others for the last Assembly elections. I know that your party is an exception, but we try to keep our manifesto pledges if we can do so. That is why this has been prioritised.

You mentioned homelessness and tenure, and we are working with the sector in order to come up with the best possible solution so that future legislation will be appropriate. *[Interruption.]* Sorry, I did not hear what you said.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Deputy Minister, you do not need to take notice of anything that any Member says when sitting down. I wish that everyone would do the same.

Jocelyn Davies: Okay, thank you.

On funding, as I said, the social housing grant has been a priority for this Government. In the last few years, we have been able to get significant increases in the social housing grant. We had an extra £62 million from the strategic capital investment fund, plus an extra £5 million for the mortgage rescue scheme.

wneud ei gais, yn egluro beth mae'n bwriadu ei wneud yng nghyfnod yr ataliad. Mae hynny'n ofyniad ar wyneb y Mesur arfaethedig.

O ran y grant tai cymdeithasol, gwn fod gennym broblem gyda chyllid. Nid bai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw hynny; maent hwy wedi blaenoriaethu'r grant tai cymdeithasol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, o'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf ymlaen, gadawaf i awdurdodau lleol benderfynu ble i wario grantiau tai cymdeithasol o fewn eu hardaloedd. Bydd rhaid iddynt egluro i ni, a bydd mecanweithiau ar gael iddynt i gynyddu'r cyflenwad.

O ran cwestiwn pam yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio ar yr hawl i brynu, mae'n un o addunedau 'Cymru'n Un' ac yn addewid maniffesto—nid yn unig ym maniffesto Plaid Cymru, ond ym maniffesto Llafur ac ym maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Shelter, ac eraill am etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad. Gwn fod eich plaid chi'n eithriad, ond yr ydym ni'n ceisio cadw ein haddunedau maniffesto os gallwn. Dyna pam mae hyn wedi cael blaenoriaeth.

Soniasoch am ddigartrefedd a deiliadaeth, ac yr ydym yn cydweithio â'r sector i ganfod y datrysiaid gorau posibl fel y bydd deddfwriaeth y dyfodol yn briodol. *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni chlywais yr hyn a ddywedasoch.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ddirprwy Weinidog, nid oes angen ichi gymryd sylw o unrhyw beth y mae unrhyw Aelod yn ei ddweud pan mae'n eistedd. Dymunaf i bawb wneud yr un fath.

Jocelyn Davies: O'r gorau, diolch.

O ran cyllid, fel y dywedais, mae'r grant tai cymdeithasol wedi bod yn flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth hon. Yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gallu cael cynnydd sylweddol yn y grant tai cymdeithasol. Cawsom £62 miliwn ychwanegol o'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, a £5 miliwn ychwanegol i'r cynllun achub morgeisi.

You asked about the housing investment trust and the £3 million that has been announced by Jane Hutt is in addition to the published budget that you have seen. Community Housing Cymru currently hosts the development of the investment trust, but I am sure that it will let us know as soon as there are developments.

On the housing revenue account subsidy system, you are probably right to say that I am the first Minister to take this on, but I am now joined ably by Jane Hutt, who met Danny Alexander yesterday, and I know that this is one of the things that they intended to discuss. I hope that you will use your influence with the UK Government to put an end to the shameful injustice that local authorities in Wales have endured for a number of years. I hope that we will be able to achieve this together.

You mentioned the Home Builders Federation not liking one of the housing policies. I have no idea what that is. I am sorry if that came out last week and I have not seen it. I would be most grateful if you could send that to me. I suspect that it probably relates to planning policy and not anything within my portfolio. No-one likes the planning system. It would appear that everyone has a complaint about it, but one thing is for certain, you do need a planning system.

2.50 p.m.

Gareth Jones: Ddirprwy Weinidog, yr wyf yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn yn fawr, ac yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch ar eich gwaith caled a'ch dyfalbarhad gyda'r broses LCO yn y lle cyntaf. Drwy'r dyfalbarhad hwnnw, a thrwy ddal ati fel y gwnaethoch, yr ydych wedi sicrhau Mesur arfaethedig a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i argaeledd tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Dyna'r union beth yr ydym ei eisiau, a dyna yr oedd y pleidiau i gyd ei eisiau, hyd y gwn i. Yr ydych hefyd yn cyflawni un o addewidion 'Cymru'n Un'. Cyfeiriaf hefyd at y ffaith eich bod wedi ymwneud â'r rhanddeiliaid yn y sector hwn. Yr ydych newydd ddyfynnu'r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi; nid wyf am

Gofynasoch am yr ymddiriedolaeth buddsoddi tai ac mae'r £3 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd gan Jane Hutt yn ychwanegol i'r gyllideb gyhoeddedig yr ydych wedi'i gweld. Ar hyn o bryd, Cartrefi Cymunedol Cymru sy'n llywyddu'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r ymddiriedolaeth buddsoddi, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y cawn wybod ganddynt cyn gynted ag y bydd unrhyw ddatblygiadau.

O ran system cymhorthdal y cyfrif refeniw tai, mae'n debygol eich bod yn gywir pan ddywedwch mai fi yw'r Gweinidog cyntaf i ymgymryd â hyn, ond nawr mae Jane Hutt wedi ymuno â mi. Cyfarfu hi â Danny Alexander ddoe, a gwn fod hyn yn un o'r pethau yr oeddent yn bwriadu eu trafod. Gobeithiaf y defnyddiwch eich dylanwad gyda Llywodraeth y DU i ddiweddu'r anghyfiawnder cywilyddus y mae awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru wedi'i ddiodef ers nifer o flynyddoedd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn gyflawni hyn gyda'n gilydd.

Dywedasoch nad oedd y Ffederasiwn Adeiladwyr Cartrefi'n hoff o un o'r polisïau tai. Nid oes gennyf syniad pa un yw hwnnw. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os cyhoeddwyd hynny yr wythnos diwethaf heb imi ei weld. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn pe gallech ei anfon ataf. Amheuaif ei fod yn ymwneud â pholisi cynllunio ac nid ag unrhyw beth yn fy mhorthffolio i. Nid oes neb yn hoff o'r system gynllunio. Mae'n ymddangos bod gan bawb gŵyn amdani, ond yr un peth sy'n sicr yw bod angen system gynllunio.

Gareth Jones: Deputy Minister, I very much welcome this statement, and I congratulate you on your hard work and determination in the LCO process in the first place. Through that determination, and by persevering as you have, you have secured a proposed Measure that will make a real difference to the availability of affordable housing in Wales. That is exactly what we want, and that is what all parties wanted, as far as I know. You are also delivering on a 'One Wales' commitment. I will also refer to the fact that you have dealt with stakeholders in this sector. You have just quoted the Council of Mortgage Lenders; I will not embarrass Mark Isherwood again by repeating what that

godi embaras ar Mark Isherwood eto drwy ail-ddweud beth a ddywedodd y sefydliad hwnnw, ond yn sicr mae dynesiad gwahanol wedi bod yn y ffordd yr ydych wedi mynd o'i chwmpas, ac mae hynny i'w gymeradwyo'n fawr. Yn bersonol, gwn i chi ymweld â ni yn Aberconwy; cawsoch drafodaethau gyda'm hetholwyr ynghylch dulliau newydd a gwahanol o fynd ati i geisio rhyddhau eiddo cyhoeddus er mwyn gweithio rhywbeth allan o ran cytundebau adran 106 ac yn y blaen. Yr oedd angen gwneud hynny i sicrhau ein bod yn edrych i bob cyfeiriad i weld sut y gallwn wella a sicrhau tai fforddiadwy. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'n fawr y ffordd yr ydych wedi mynd o'i chwmpas. Yn gyffredinol, cyn belled ag y mae Gweinidogion Cymru yn y cwestiwn, mae'r dull hwn o gydweithio wedi cael derbyniad da ac mae'n nodweddiadol o'r ddemocratiaeth newydd gydweithredol sy'n datblygu yn y Gymru ddatganoledig.

While the issue of the right to buy was an important one for this proposed Measure, the new regulatory policy for the social housing sector is just as important. Will this new regulatory regime attract much-needed investment in social housing and will it lead to a more effective way of providing social housing?

Jocelyn Davies: I know that it took a long time. However, as I say, we did not waste that time, because we have been undertaking policy development along with those who are involved with housing in Wales from all sorts of backgrounds: the public, private and voluntary sectors, lenders and tenants' organisations. It has been a different approach, and it has not been an easy one to establish—although, once established, it works very well. I am grateful to those who have given of their time to assist us in that, and in looking for a consensus in the way forward on so many things in relation to housing. You mentioned public land, and we have radically improved the release of land for affordable housing, and grants can go so much further if you can take out the land price. On regulation, yes, it is important, and yes, it will attract investment and improve effectiveness. It will ensure that lenders continue to be confident in lending in Wales, because the risk to them is lowered and the cost to the borrower is not so great, because if

organisation said, but certainly there has been a different approach in the way that you have gone about this, and that is to be greatly applauded. Personally, I know that you visited us in Aberconwy; you had discussions with my constituents about new ways of going about releasing public property in order to work something out with regard to section 106 agreements and so on. All of that needed to be done in order to ensure that we look at all approaches to see how we can improve and secure affordable housing. I very much endorse the way that you have gone about this. In general, as far as Welsh Ministers are concerned, this collaborative approach has been well received and it is characteristic of the new democracy of collaboration that is developing in devolved Wales.

Er bod mater yr hawl i brynu'n fater pwysig yn y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, mae polisi rheoleiddio newydd y sector tai cymdeithasol yr un mor bwysig. A wnaiff y drefn reoleiddio newydd hon ddenu buddsoddiad sydd ei angen yn fawr mewn tai cymdeithasol, ac a wnaiff arwain at ffordd fwy effeithiol o ddarparu tai cymdeithasol?

Jocelyn Davies: Gwn ei fod wedi cymryd amser maith. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, ni chafodd yr amser hwnnw ei wastraffu, oherwydd yr ydym wedi bod yn ymgymryd â datblygu polisi ynghyd â phobl sy'n ymwneud â thai yng Nghymru o bob math o gefndir: y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol, darparwyr benthyciadau a sefydliadau tenantiaid. Mae wedi bod yn ddull gwahanol, ac ni fu'n hawdd ei sefydlu—er ei fod, wedi ei sefydlu, yn gweithio'n dda iawn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r bobl sydd wedi rhoi o'u hamser i'n cynorthwyo yn hynny o beth, ac wrth chwilio am gonsensws ar gyfer y ffordd ymlaen o ran cymaint o bethau mewn perthynas â thai. Soniasoch am dir cyhoeddus, ac yr ydym wedi creu gwelliannau mawr o ran rhyddhau tir ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, a gall grantiau fynd yn llawer pellach os dilëwch bris y tir. O ran rheoleiddio, ydy, mae'n bwysig, a bydd, bydd yn denu buddsoddi ac yn gwella effeithiolrwydd. Bydd yn sicrhau bod darparwyr benthyciadau'n yn dal i fod yn

they perceive a risk, lenders normally ask you to pay for it. We certainly wanted to ensure that lenders were not only prepared to lend, but prepared to lend at a reasonable cost.

Peter Black: I welcome this proposed Measure. As the Deputy Minister says, it was in the Welsh Liberal Democrat manifesto as well, and I am pleased to have played a small part in enabling the Assembly to have the powers to be able to exercise that particular commitment. I very much look forward to the proposed Measure being on the statute book. I am a bit disappointed at the time that it has taken from the approval of the LCO by the Privy Council to the publication of the proposed Measure. I know that the Minister has had three years to work up this proposed Measure, and she has talked about the time that she spent talking to the sector and developing policy. However, the fact that the proposed Measure has been published so late in the day—two or three weeks later than I believe that it could have been—means that there is little time left to scrutinise it properly at Stage 1, which I am concerned about.

I have a few questions about the proposed Measure. In relation to the proposal to suspend the right to buy, what impact will the suspension have, if agreed? I agree with you about the various measures and obstacles that have to be overcome. That is right and proper. However, if a suspension is agreed for a period, how will that affect the qualifying period for new tenants to have the right to buy, and what impact will it have on the accrual of discount that people are entitled to after a period as a tenant when they come to buy the property? Will that be suspended as part of that five-year period as well?

Secondly, I am pleased about the emphasis on the strategic role of local authorities as housing providers, both in the proposed Measure and in the answers that you have given. That is very important. Are you confident that every one of the 22 local

hyderus i ddarparu benthyciadau yng Nghymru, gan fod y risg yn is iddynt ac nad yw'r gost mor uchel i'r benthycwr, oherwydd os ydynt yn canfod risg, bydd darparwyr benthyciadau fel rheol yn gofyn i chi dalu amdano. Yn sicr, yr oedd arnom eisiau sicrhau bod darparwyr benthyciadau'n barod i ddarparu benthyciadau, ac i wneud hynny am bris rhesymol.

Peter Black: Croesawaf y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Fel y dywedodd y Dirprwy Weinidog, yr oedd hwn ym maniffesto Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hefyd, ac yr wyf yn falch fy mod wedi chwarae rhan fach yn y broses o alluogi'r Cynulliad i gael y pwerau i allu cyflawni'r ymrwymiad penodol hwnnw. Edrychaf ymlaen yn eiddgar at weld y Mesur arfaethedig ar y llyfr statud. Yr wyf ychydig yn siomedig wrth yr amser y cymerodd wedi i'r Cyfrin Gyngor gymeradwyo'r LCO nes i'r Mesur arfaethedig gael ei gyhoeddi. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi cael tair blynedd i weithio ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, a'i bod wedi sôn am yr amser a dreuliodd yn siarad â'r sector ac yn datblygu polisi. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith bod y Mesur arfaethedig wedi cael ei gyflwyno mor hwyr—ddwy neu dair wythnos yn hwyrach nag y credaf y gallai fod—yn golygu nad oes llawer o amser yn weddill i graffu'n briodol arno yng Nghyfnod 1, sy'n peri pryder imi.

Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau am y Mesur arfaethedig. Mewn perthynas â'r cynnig i atal yr hawl i brynu, beth fydd effaith yr ataliad, os cytunir arno? Cytunaf â chi fod angen goresgyn amryw o fesurau a rhwystrau. Mae hynny'n gywir ac yn briodol. Fodd bynnag, os cytunir ar ataliad am gyfnod, sut y bydd hynny'n effeithio ar y cyfnod cymhwysio i denantiaid newydd i gael hawl i brynu, a beth fydd ei effaith ar y disgownt y mae gan bobl hawl i'w gronni ar ôl cyfnod fel tenant pan maent yn prynu'r eiddo? A gaiff hwnnw ei atal fel rhan o'r cyfnod pum mlynedd hefyd?

Yn ail, yr wyf yn falch o'r pwyslais ar rôl strategaethol awdurdodau lleol fel darparwyr tai, yn y Mesur arfaethedig ac yn yr atebion yr ydych wedi'u rhoi. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn. A ydych yn hyderus bod pob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru'n gallu

authorities in Wales is capable of exercising that strategic role? What sort of watching brief will you be taking to ensure that that role is exercised strategically? There have been examples in the past with regard to the development of local housing plans and so on that have raised questions about how well that role is being exercised.

Finally, I welcome the regulations, because it appears that they provide the reassurances that the Council of Mortgage Lenders requires, which may well mean that additional money will come into the housing sector to give them more scope, not just to develop housing but to do other things around that as well. What assurances can you give us about how that regulation will be exercised? In the past, often, regulation has been exercised by the Welsh Government in an overly detailed way, with it often concerning itself with the size of windows, the positioning of radiators and so on rather than taking a more strategic approach. Can you give us an assurance that that will be put behind us as a result of these new regulations and that we will be able to work in that more strategic way in regulating registered social landlords?

Jocelyn Davies: You are probably almost as pleased as I am that the day has come that we introduce this proposed Measure. I am very grateful for your input. You mentioned the delay from the time that we gained the powers to today. It has certainly not been deliberate. I hope that the scrutiny will be thorough, and I know that the Business Committee will be keeping an eye on that. In relation to the right to buy, any application to buy a property will be stayed during the period. It will be held in suspension during the suspension of statutory rights. Discount will continue to accrue, and tenancy law will not change; it is just a suspension, so no tenant will be disadvantaged at all other than having to wait until the period is up. It is not as though the discount will not continue to accrue and so on.

You asked me how confident I am that every single local authority is up to scratch with its strategic housing role. I will give you some assurances. I am looking at the Minister with responsibility for local government. He is

cyflawni'r rôl strategol honno? Pa fath o friff gwyllo y byddwch yn ei ddefnyddio i sicrhau bod y rôl honno'n cael ei chyflawni'n strategol? Cafwyd enghreifftiau yn y gorffennol yng nghyswllt datblygu cynlluniau tai lleol ac ati sydd wedi codi cwestiynau am ba mor dda mae'r rôl honno'n cael ei chyflawni.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn croesawu'r rheoliadau, gan ei bod yn ymddangos eu bod yn rhoi'r tawelwch meddwl sydd ei angen ar y Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi, a allai olygu y daw mwy o arian i'r sector tai i roi mwy o gwmpas iddynt wneud pethau eraill yn ogystal â datblygu tai. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi inni am sut y caiff y rheoleiddio hwnnw ei gyflawni? Yn y gorffennol, yn aml, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi rheoleiddio mewn modd rhy fanwl, gan bryderu'n aml am faint ffenestri, lleoliad rheiddiaduron ac ati, yn hytrach na defnyddio dull mwy strategol. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y cawn adael hynny yn y gorffennol o ganlyniad i'r rheoliadau newydd hyn ac y gallwn weithio mewn modd mwy strategol wrth reoleiddio landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig?

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'n siŵr eich bod bron mor falch â mi bod diwrnod cyflwyno'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn wedi cyrraedd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn am eich cyfraniad. Soniasoch am yr oediad cyn heddiw ers inni gael y pwerau. Yn sicr, nid oedd hynny'n fwriadol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y craffu'n drwyadl, a gwn y bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn cadw llygad ar hynny. Mewn perthynas â'r hawl i brynu, caiff unrhyw gais i brynu eiddo ei ohirio yn ystod y cyfnod. Caiff ei atal tra mae'r hawliau statudol wedi'u hatal. Bydd disgownt yn dal i gronni, ac ni fydd cyfraith tenantiaeth yn newid; dim ond ataliad ydyw, felly ni fydd anfantais i unrhyw denant heblaw gorfod aros tan ddiwedd y cyfnod. Nid yw'r disgownt yn stopio cronni na dim byd felly.

Gofynasoch pa mor hyderus ydwyf fod pob un awdurdod lleol yn ddigon da o ran ei rôl strategol ym maes tai. Rhoddaf rywfaint o sicrwydd ichi. Yr wyf yn edrych ar y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb am lywodraeth

smiling, and you are smiling. I do not think that it would be wise of me to give you a categorical assurance today, but we are moving in the right direction as far as that is concerned, shall we say. Some local authorities are moving faster than others. On regulation, yes, it is a priority. I know that, when you look at the legislation, it looks very technical, and it probably is. Of course, what it is doing is amending a previous Act. However, you are quite right, that, before the Essex review, there was far too much micromanagement rather than proper oversight. We want a regulatory regime that is appropriate and that achieves what we want to achieve. The days of micromanagement are well and truly gone. We now need to ensure that we have a regulatory regime that is fit for purpose and that we keep it that way.

leol. Mae ef yn gwenu, ac yr ydych chi'n gwenu. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai'n ddoeth imi roi sicrwydd diamod ichi heddiw, ond dewch inni ddweud ein bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir yn hynny o beth. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn symud yn gyflymach na'i gilydd. O ran rheoleiddio, ydy, mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth. Gwn fod y ddeddfwriaeth yn ymddangos yn dechnegol iawn, ac mae'n siŵr ei bod hi. Wrth gwrs, beth mae'n ei wneud yw diwygio Deddf flaenorol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn gwbl gywir pan ddywedwch, cyn adolygiad Essex, y bu llawer gormod o ficro-reoli yn hytrach na goruchwyllo priodol. Hoffem drefn reoleiddio sy'n briodol ac sy'n cyflawni'r hyn yr ydym yn dymuno ei gyflawni. Mae dyddiau micro-reoli yn y gorffennol. Nawr, mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym drefn reoleiddio sy'n addas at ei diben a'n bod yn ei chadw felly.

Datganiad am Ganolfannau Busnes Technium Statement on Technium Business Centres

The Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills (Lesley Griffiths): Thank you, Llywydd, for making time to allow me to make a statement on the future of the technium network. As Members will know from my written statement last week, we have revealed plans to reform the network radically following a performance review of the individual technium centres. These are innovation centres that provide office space and support services to new companies, and the first was built by the former Welsh Development Agency in 2001. Our review looked at the under-used incubation capacity within the network. The time for a review was right and partly reflected concerns that technium performance had been mixed. I was determined that we should undertake an evidence-based review that provided robust advice on which sound and defensible judgments could be made.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau (Lesley Griffiths): Diolch, Lywydd, am roi amser imi wneud datganiad am ddyfodol y rhwydwaith technium. Fel y bydd Aelodau'n gwybod o fy natganiad ysgrifenedig yr wythnos diwethaf, yr ydym wedi datgelu cynlluniau i ddiwygio'r rhwydwaith yn sylfaenol ar ôl adolygiad o berfformiad y canolfannau technium unigol. Canolfannau arloesi yw'r rhain sy'n darparu swyddfeydd a gwasanaethau cymorth i gwmniau newydd, ac adeiladwyd y gyntaf gan yr hen Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn 2001. Edrychodd ein harolygiad ar allu hybu busnes y rhwydwaith gan nad oedd yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n ddigonol. Yr oedd yn amser da i gynnal adolygiad, yn rhannol oherwydd pryderon am berfformiad cymysg y canolfannau technium. Yr oeddwn yn benderfynol y dylem gynnal adolygiad seiliedig ar dystiolaeth gan ddarparu cyngor cadarn y gellid ei ddefnyddio i wneud penderfyniadau doeth y gellid eu hamddiffyn.

3.00 p.m.

The thorough and comprehensive review found that some of the facilities have generated returns at an acceptable level, some

Canfu'r adolygiad trwyadl a chynhwysfawr fod rhai o'r cyfleusterau wedi cynhyrchu lefel dderbyniol o enillion, a bod rhai wedi

of them delivering significant performance, while others had not been delivering value for money or creating the outputs expected. The key to all our decisions is return on investment and, where those returns are not appropriate to the investment made, we should consider carefully whether our scarce resources might be more fruitfully deployed elsewhere.

Currently, there are ten technium centres throughout Wales. Four of these will be retained to support business incubation and start-up companies. These are Technium Digital at Swansea University, Technium OpTIC in St Asaph, Technium Springboard in Cwmbran, and Technium 1 and 2 in Swansea, which have been treated as a single technium during this review. The other technium centres will no longer be part of the network. These are Technium Aberystwyth, Technium Sustainable Technologies in Baglan, Technium CAST in Bangor, Technium Pembrokeshire in Pembroke Dock, Technium Performance Engineering in Llanelli and Technium Digital@Sony in the Sony plant, Bridgend.

The review of technium centres was undertaken against the backdrop of our new approach to economic development set out in 'Economic Renewal: a new direction'. As part of that, we looked at every bit of spending in the Department for the Economy and Transport to ensure that it is focused on tackling wide systemic issues within the Welsh economy.

This policy aims to create the best conditions in which to create jobs, with a focus on investing in infrastructure, research and development, and improving the conditions within which businesses operate. Therefore, while I have taken radical decisions, I recognise that there remains a crucial role for incubation centres that deliver new companies, new ideas and new jobs, and that work closely with our universities to help to deliver the Wales that at least matches the best in the world and, where possible, becomes the best in the world. That included taking a thorough, close look at the technium network. This review has found that parts of the network are simply not delivering or

cyflawni perfformiad sylweddol, ond bod eraill heb roi gwerth am arian na chreu'r allbynnau a ddisgwyliwyd. Mae sicrhau enillion am fuddsoddiad yn allweddol i'n holl benderfyniadau, ac os nad yw'r enillion hynny'n briodol i'r buddsoddiad a wnaethpwyd, dylem ystyried yn ofalus a fyddai'n well defnyddio ein hadnoddau prin yn rhywle arall.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae deg canolfan technium yng Nghymru. Cedwir pedair o'r rhain i gynorthwyo hybu busnesau a chychwyn cwmnïau. Y rhain yw Technium Digidol ym Mhrifysgol Abertawe, Technium OpTIC yn Llanelli, Technium Springboard yng Nghwbrân, a Technium 1 a 2 yn Abertawe, sydd wedi cael eu trin fel un technium yn ystod yr adolygiad hwn. Ni fydd y canolfannau technium eraill yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith mwyach. Y rhain yw Technium Aberystwyth, Technium Technolegau Cynaliadwy ym Maglan, Technium CAST ym Mangor, Technium Sir Benfro yn Noc Penfro, Technium Peirianeg Perfformiad yn Llanelli a Technium Digidol@Sony yn ffatri Sony, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr.

Cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad o ganolfannau technium yn erbyn cefndir ein dull gweithredu newydd ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a amlinellir yn 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd'. Fel rhan o hynny, edrychasom ar bob darn o wario yn Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth i sicrhau ei bod yn canolbwyntio ar fynd i'r afael â materion systemig eang o fewn economi Cymru.

Nod y polisi yw creu'r amodau gorau i greu swyddi ynddynt, gyda ffocws ar fuddsoddi mewn seilwaith, ymchwil a datblygu, a gwella'r amodau y mae busnesau'n gweithredu ynddynt. Felly, er fy mod wedi gwneud penderfyniadau radical, yr wyf yn cydnabod bod rôl hollbwysig o hyd i ganolfannau hybu busnes sy'n cyflenwi cwmnïau newydd, syniadau newydd a swyddi newydd, ac sy'n cydweithio'n agos â'n prifysgolion i helpu i gyflenwi Cymru sydd o leiaf gyda'r gorau yn y byd ac, os yn bosibl, a fydd y gorau yn y byd. Yr oedd hynny'n cynnwys edrych yn agos ac yn drwyadl ar y rhwydwaith technium. Mae'r adolygiad hwn wedi canfod rhannau o'r rhwydwaith nad

providing value for money.

The Assembly Government cannot continue to fund buildings with a low occupancy rate and low levels of outputs. To do so would give rise to legitimate criticism. That is why I took the difficult but necessary decision to remove those performing less well from the network. In doing so, I have given a commitment that we will ensure that any displaced tenants are provided with all possible help to find alternative accommodation.

Since 2001, the economic and financial climate has changed and, to reflect that, the way in which we provide business support has to change. Our investment needs to be smarter. Our key aim at all times must be to support economic growth. The technium centres that we are retaining will be a part of that approach. They will continue to provide incubation support for new, growing companies throughout Wales. They are a vital part of the new approach that we are taking, but we will continue to monitor and check, so that the outputs that we expect continue to be delivered. Where that does not happen, I will, as now, take the decisions that are necessary.

We will be looking at the options for those centres that we are not keeping in the network. Where the local authorities own the property, we are talking to them about the options available. We are also talking to universities and private industry, to companies such as Sony, which is a part of the industrial fabric of Wales, and at the forefront of high value-added manufacturing.

I reiterate my assurance that current tenants will not be abandoned. They have my commitment that we will fulfil our obligations by finding alternative office space, if required. Technium centres will not be closing overnight and all existing tenants will be fully supported through this gradual process. I recognise that there will be ongoing uncertainty as we work to implement our changes. I want to provide total clarity at the earliest opportunity. For that reason, I

dynt yn cyflenwi nac yn rhoi gwerth am arian.

Ni all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad barhau i ariannu adeiladau â chyfradd meddiannaeth isel a lefelau isel o allbwn. Byddai gwneud hynny'n arwain at feirniadaeth deg. Dyna pam y gwnes y penderfyniad anodd ond angenrheidiol i ddileu'r rhai nad ydynt yn perfformio'n dda o'r rhwydwaith. Wrth wneud hynny, yr wyf wedi rhoi ymrwymiad i sicrhau y bydd unrhyw denantiaid a gafodd eu disodli'n cael pob cymorth posibl i ddod o hyd i leoliad arall.

Er 2001, mae'r hinsawdd economaidd ac ariannol wedi newid ac, i adlewyrchu hynny, rhaid i'r ffordd yr ydym yn darparu cymorth busnes newid. Mae angen inni fuddsoddi'n ddoethach. Rhaid mai ein nod allweddol bob amser yw cynorthwyo twf economaidd. Bydd y canolfannau technium yr ydym yn eu cadw'n rhan o'r dull hwnnw. Byddant yn parhau i ddarparu cymorth hybu busnes i gwmnïau newydd sy'n tyfu ledled Cymru. Maent yn rhan hollbwysig o'r dull newydd yr ydym yn ei ddefnyddio, ond byddwn yn parhau i fonitro a gwirio fel bod yr allbynnau yr ydym yn eu disgwyl yn dal i gael eu cyflenwi. Os nad yw hynny'n digwydd, fel nawr, gwnaf y penderfyniadau angenrheidiol.

Byddwn yn edrych ar y dewisiadau ar gyfer y canolfannau hynny nad ydym yn eu cadw yn y rhwydwaith. Os mai'r awdurdodau lleol yw perchennogion yr eiddo, yr ydym yn siarad â hwy am y dewisiadau sydd ar gael. Yr ydym hefyd yn siarad â phrifysgolion a diwydiannau preifat, â chwmnïau megis Sony, sy'n rhan o adeiladwaith diwydiannol Cymru, ac sydd ar flaen y gad o ran gweithgynhyrchu sy'n ychwanegu gwerth sylweddol.

Ailadroddaf fy sicrwydd na wnawn gefnu ar denantiaid presennol. Mae ganddynt fy ymrwymiad y gwnawn gyflawni ein rhwymedigaethau drwy ganfod swyddfeydd eraill os oes eu hangen. Ni fydd canolfannau technium yn cau dros nos a chaiff pob tenant presennol gymorth llawn drwy gydol y broses raddol hon. Yr wyf yn cydnabod y ceir ansicrwydd parhaus wrth inni weithio i roi ein newidiadau ar waith. Hoffwn roi eglurder llwyr cyn gynted â phosibl. Am y rheswm

will be setting my officials challenging targets to ensure that we manage this process quickly and with the minimum of fuss. Going forward, we will also be implementing a new approach to managing the network, so that it becomes a leading element of the innovation and research and development structure in Wales, and provides a co-ordinated approach to ensure an element of consistency across the network. In addition, we will work closely with the new sector panels and other key stakeholders, such as higher education institutions, to ensure higher occupancy levels. We agree that these are tough decisions but, despite the changes to the network, we remain committed to supporting business growth and innovation, as these themes are central to the future of the Welsh economy.

David Melding: I welcome your statement, Deputy Minister. It is a pity that the rigour that you have brought to this issue was not applied in 2001, when the programme was first developed. I think that your balanced approach has been quite right, acknowledging where the technicians have succeeded but also realising that they were widely overoptimistic and that they lacked some basic rigorous tests. You do not create a knowledge-based economy based on vague aspirations. I think that I can make this point quite forcefully, because colleagues on the opposition benches raised these issues in the early years of the technician programme, and we have had to wait a long time for this fundamental review. However, it is here, and we acknowledge that the Government is sincere in taking forward the best bits of the programmes while also pruning it as appropriate, and I think that that is absolutely right.

It is important to acknowledge that some of the technicians have worked. That is the best practice that we want to build upon. It may be just in those locations, or it may be possible to develop this programme if we can find other link-ups that would be fruitful.

For technicians to work, it seems quite clear—as it was nine years ago—that it is essential

hwnnw, byddaf yn gosod targedau heriol i fy swyddogion i sicrhau ein bod yn rheoli'r broses hon yn gyflym ac â chyn lleied â phosibl o ffwdan. Wrth symud ymlaen, byddwn hefyd yn cyflwyno dull newydd o reoli'r rhwydwaith, fel ei fod yn dod yn un o brif elfennau'r strwythur arloesi ac ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru, ac yn darparu dull cydlynol o sicrhau elfen o gysondeb ar draws y rhwydwaith. Hefyd, byddwn yn cydweithio'n agos â'r paneli sector newydd a rhanddeiliaid allweddol eraill, megis sefydliadau addysg uwch, i sicrhau lefelau meddiannaeth uwch. Yr ydym yn cytuno bod y rhain yn benderfyniadau anodd ond, er gwaethaf y newidiadau i'r rhwydwaith, yr ydym yn dal i fod yn ymroddedig i gefnogi twf busnesau ac arloesi, gan fod y themâu hyn yn rhan ganolog o ddyfodol economi Cymru.

David Melding: Croesawaf eich datganiad, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Mae'n biti na chafodd eich trylwyredd chi ar y mater hwn ei ddefnyddio yn 2001, pan ddatblygwyd y rhaglen am y tro cyntaf. Credaf fod eich dull cytbwys wedi bod yn ddigon teg, gan gydnabod ble mae'r canolfannau technium wedi llwyddo ond gan sylweddoli hefyd eu bod yn llawer rhy optimistaidd a bod ganddynt ddiffyg profion trwyadl sylfaenol. Nid ydych yn creu economi wybodaeth yn seiliedig ar ddyheadau amhendiant. Credaf y gallaf wneud y pwynt hwn yn eithaf grymus, oherwydd cododd Aelodau ar feinciau'r wrthblaid y materion hyn ym mlynnyddoedd cynnar y rhaglen technium, ac yr ydym wedi gorfod aros amser maith am yr adolygiad sylfaenol hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi cyrraedd, ac yr ydym yn cydnabod bod y Llywodraeth yn ddiffuant wrth symud ymlaen â rhannau gorau'r rhaglenni gan ei thocio hefyd fel sy'n briodol, a chredaf fod hynny'n gwbl deg.

Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod rhai o'r canolfannau technium wedi gweithio. Dyna'r arfer gorau yr hoffem adeiladu arno. Efallai mai dim ond yn y lleoliadau hynny y bydd hynny'n digwydd, neu efallai y gellir datblygu'r rhaglen os gallwn ganfod cysylltiadau eraill a fyddai'n gynhyrchiol.

Er mwyn i ganolfannau technium weithio, mae'n ymddangos yn eithaf clir—fel yr oedd

to have close HE involvement or connections to already existing industrial expertise that is highly innovative and that taps into existing local expertise. Without those existing networks, we will not take advantage of the full potential that we have been developing in various areas. It is no wonder that the centre in St Asaph has been successful, or the others that you referred to, as a single instance in Swansea. Those techniums have been able to develop effective networks. In other areas, the centres have been much less successful. Some still have bits of good practice, but, at their worst, they were just rather elitist offices and locations for start-up businesses, which were not stretching the knowledge-based economy.

Some issues have to be faced directly, and it is time that we looked at HE in general in light of its contribution to the economy. It is important that HE institutions and academics be assessed on their participation in techniums and other knowledge-transfer projects. That can succeed much more than it is at present. We are only just starting this encouragement of spin-outs and new businesses that take good ideas, get them to market, get them tested, and then see larger companies evolve from them. Getting ideas to market is a great skill, and many ideas never reach the marketplace. We are right to try to tap into these opportunities because you need only a few companies that really succeed. They start very small, but as we have seen with software production, they can become world beaters within a generation, within 20 years or so. Therefore, the returns can be fantastic.

In conclusion, while the concept of techniums remains robust when it exists in its best practice, we did have far too ambitious a target in 2001, with the roll-out in so many places with rather vague aspirations. It is right that you prune that bit, Deputy Minister, but we also need to preserve the core expertise that we have, and return to areas such as Cardiff, where we could not establish

naw mlynedd yn ôl—ei bod yn hanfodol cael cysylltiadau neu ymglymiad AU agos ag arbenigedd diwydiannol sy'n bodoli eisoes ac sy'n arloesol iawn ac yn defnyddio arbenigedd lleol sy'n bodoli eisoes. Heb y rhwydweithiau hynny sy'n bodoli eisoes, ni fanteisiwn ar y potensial llawn yr ydym wedi bod yn ei ddatblygu mewn gwahanol ardaloedd. Nid yw'n syndod bod canolfan Llanelwy wedi llwyddo, na'r lleill y cyfeiriasoch atynt, megis canolfan Abertawe. Mae'r canolfannau technium hynny wedi gallu datblygu rhwydweithiau effeithiol. Mewn ardaloedd eraill, mae'r canolfannau wedi bod yn llawer llai llwyddiannus. Mae darnau o arfer da gan rai ohonynt, ond ar eu gwaethaf, yr oeddent yn swyddfeydd a lleoliadau eithaf elitaidd i fusnesau newydd nad oeddent yn ymestyn yr economi wybodaeth.

Rhaid wynebu rhai materion yn uniongyrchol, ac mae'n bryd inni edrych ar AU yn gyffredinol yng ngoleuni ei chyfraniad i'r economi. Mae'n bwysig bod sefydliadau ac academyddion AU yn cael eu hasesu yn ôl eu cyfranogiad mewn canolfannau technium a phrosiectau trosglwyddo gwybodaeth eraill. Gall hynny lwyddo'n llawer gwell nag y mae ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym newydd ddechrau annog cwmnïau deillio a busnesau newydd sy'n cymryd syniadau da, yn eu rhoi ar y farchnad, yn eu profi, ac yna'n gweld cwmnïau mwy'n esblygu ohonynt. Mae rhoi syniadau ar y farchnad yn sgîl mawr, ac mae llawer o syniadau sydd byth yn cyrraedd y farchnad. Mae'n deg ein bod yn ceisio cymryd y cyfleoedd hyn oherwydd nid oes ond angen i ychydig o gwmnïau lwyddo. Maent yn dechrau'n fach iawn, ond fel yr ydym wedi gweld ym maes cynhyrchu meddalwedd, gallant fod yn arwain y byd o fewn cenhedlaeth, o fewn tuag 20 mlynedd. Felly, mae'r enillion yn gallu bod yn anhygoel.

I gloi, er bod cysyniad y canolfannau technium yn dal i fod yn gadarn pan mae arfer gorau'n bodoli, yr oedd gennym darged llawer rhy uchelgeisiol yn 2001, a chawsant eu cyflwyno â dyheadau eithaf amhendiant mewn llawer o lefydd. Mae'n deg eich bod ynocio'r darn hwnnw, Ddirprwy Weinidog, ond mae angen inni hefyd gadw'r arbenigedd craidd sydd gennym, a dychwelyd i

a technium because so much European money was being used. We need to look at the parts of the economy that are already quite strong but could reach a new level with this approach, and be of benefit to neighbouring areas that are more deprived, such as the Valleys areas if we are looking at Cardiff. Sometimes, we have to invest where the expertise is, and not just shift it piecemeal to where it is not, in the vague hope that somehow a knowledge-based economy will suddenly sprout up and flourish.

ardaloedd megis Caerdydd, lle na allasom sefydlu technium gan fod cymaint o arian Ewropeaidd yn cael ei ddefnyddio. Mae angen inni edrych ar y rhannau o'r economi sydd eisoes yn eithaf cryf ond a allent gyrraedd lefel newydd gyda'r dull hwn, a bod o fudd i ardaloedd cyfagos sy'n fwy difreintiedig, megis ardaloedd y Cymoedd os ydym yn edrych ar Gaerdydd. Weithiau, rhaid inni fuddsoddi ble mae'r arbenigedd, ac nid ei symud fesul darn i ble nad yw, gyda'r gobaith amhendant y bydd economi wybodaeth rywsut yn ymddangos ac yn ffynnu'n sydyn.

3.10 p.m.

Lesley Griffiths: I welcome the tone of your comments, David. You are right to say that we need to have closer links between academia and business. The technium network that we will retain reflects the findings of the research and department review panel that I held earlier this year, as one of its recommendations was that we needed that close link.

Lesley Griffiths: Croesawaf dôn eich sylwadau, David. Yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch fod angen inni gael cysylltiadau agosach rhwng academia a busnes. Mae'r rhwydwaith technium y byddwn yn ei gadw'n adlewyrchu canfyddiadau'r panel adolygu ymchwil a datblygu a gynhaliats yn gynharach eleni; un o argymhellion hwnnw oedd bod angen y cysylltiad agos hwnnw arnom.

I think that what you referred to at the end of your comments was clustering. Again, you are quite right, and there is a cluster forming there around the OpTIC Glyndŵr at St Asaph. That is very much the way forward.

Credaf mai cyfeirio at glystyru yr oeddech ar ddiwedd eich sylwadau. Eto, yr ydych yn gywir, ac mae clwstwr yn ffurfio o gwmpas OpTIC Glyndŵr yn Llanelwy. Yn sicr, dyna'r ffordd ymlaen.

Andrew Davies: Deputy Minister, I thank you for your statement. As you will know, I have taken a close interest in this issue before and after leaving Government. This is a disappointing decision, but it is not unexpected. As you and David Melding have pointed out, this programme was started in 2001 under the former Welsh Development Agency. As a Minister at the time, I was extremely concerned about the lack of strategy and the lack of management of that programme, which, as David Melding rightly pointed out, was largely funded by European structural funds. In fact, such was our frustration at this and other programmes within the WDA that that was a major reason why we took the decision to merge the WDA into the Assembly Government. I remember Jenny Randerson asking me questions about the issue, and she subsequently submitted a data request under the Freedom of

Andrew Davies: Ddirprwy Weinidog, diolch am eich datganiad. Fel y byddwch yn gwybod, yr wyf wedi dangos diddordeb brwd yn y mater hwn cyn ac ar ôl gadael y Llywodraeth. Mae hwn yn benderfyniad siomedig, ond nid yw'n annisgwyl. Fel yr ydych chi a David Melding wedi nodi, dechreuwyd y rhaglen hon yn 2001 dan hen Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Fel Gweinidog ar y pryd, yr oeddwn yn bryderus dros ben am ddiffyg strategaeth a diffyg rheoli'r rhaglen honno, a oedd, fel y nododd David Melding yn gywir, wedi'i hariannu gan fwyaf gan gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Yn wir, yr oedd ein rhwystredigaeth â'r rhaglen hon ac â rhaglenni eraill o fewn WDA yn un o'r prif resymau am inni benderfynu uno WDA yn rhan o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Cofiaf Jenny Randerson yn gofyn cwestiynau imi am y mater, ac wedi hynny, cyflwynodd gais data dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth

Information Act 2000, which confirmed that I had consistently raised this issue with the chief executive of the WDA at the time.

Deputy Minister, I compliment you on your decision. If it had not been for Ministers making this decision, my fear is that this situation would have continued for some time. Several internal reviews have been undertaken of techniums, which have identified serious management failures, a lack of knowledge and sector expertise, and a failure to monitor progress other than occupancy levels, which was not the reason behind the technium concept, as they were supposed to be high-tech business incubators. As Minister, I asked repeatedly for data, and I suspect that the reason I was not provided with them was because they did not exist. There was no way of measuring the success of techniums other than through occupancy levels. Therefore, I compliment you on your decision, which I understand was not an easy one to make.

There are 10 existing technium centres, but two further ones were also established, namely the BioTechnium in the National Botanic Garden of Wales, which has since been bought by a biotech company, and the creative industries technium in the former Gelli Aur stately home in the Tywi valley, which also failed. However, people forget that there were two further techniums.

Therefore, Deputy Minister, I compliment you on your decision, but I have publicly expressed my concerns about the management of that department and this programme in particular. I seek reassurance—as I am sure that you and other Members do—about what management changes have taken place within the Department for the Economy and Transport and what steps have been taken to ensure that there will be sector expertise to manage the four technium centres that remain? If the other six centres are no longer in the network, I presume that there will be some attempt to sell or otherwise dispose of those centres. Will you comment on your presumption about the six centres that will no longer be a part of the technium network?

Lesley Griffiths: Since I took up the post 11

2000 a gadarnhaodd fy mod wedi codi'r mater hwn yn aml gyda phrif weithredwr WDA ar y pryd.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, rhoddaf glod ichi am eich penderfyniad. Oni fyddai Gweinidogion wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwn, ofnaf y byddai'r sefyllfa wedi parhau am gryn amser. Mae nifer o adolygiadau mewnol wedi'u cynnal ar y canolfannau technium, ac mae'r rhain wedi canfod methiannau rheoli difrifol, diffyg gwybodaeth ac arbenigedd y sector, a methiant i fonitro cynnydd heblaw lefelau meddiannaeth. Nid dyma oedd y rheswm y tu ôl i'r cysyniad technium; yr oeddent i fod i hybu busnesau uwch-dechnoleg. Fel Gweinidog, gofynnais dro ar ôl tro am ddata, ac amheuaf mai'r rheswm na chefais hwy oedd nad oeddent yn bodoli. Nid oedd ffordd arall o fesur llwyddiant canolfannau technium heblaw lefelau meddiannaeth. Felly, rhoddaf glod ichi am eich penderfyniad; deallaf nad oedd yn un hawdd ei wneud.

Mae 10 canolfan technium ar hyn o bryd, ond sefydlwyd dwy arall hefyd, sef BioTechnium yng Ngardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru, a gafodd ei phrynu gan gwmni biotechnoleg, a'r technium diwydiannau creadigol yn hen blasty Gelli Aur yn nyffryn Tywi, a fethodd hefyd. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl yn anghofio am y ddwy ganolfan technium arall.

Felly, Ddirprwy Weinidog, rhoddaf glod ichi am eich penderfyniad, ond yr wyf wedi mynegi fy mhryderon yn gyhoeddus am reoli'r adran honno a'r rhaglen hon yn benodol. Hoffwn gael tawelwch meddwl—yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech chi ac Aelodau eraill gael hefyd—am ba newidiadau rheoli sydd wedi digwydd yn Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth a pha gamau sydd wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau y ceir arbenigedd sector i reoli'r pedair canolfan technium sy'n weddill? Os nad yw'r chwe chanolfan arall yn y rhwydwaith mwyach, cymeraf y bydd rhyw ymgais i werthu'r canolfannau hynny neu gael gwared ohonynt mewn modd arall. A rowch sylwadau am eich tybiaeth am y chwe chanolfan na fyddant mwyach yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith technium?

Lesley Griffiths: Ers imi gymryd y swydd

months ago, I have been concerned about the network, and that is why I called for this review back in the spring. You will appreciate that now I am the Deputy Minister with responsibility, I am here to defend the decisions that I have taken. I am not accountable for any of the decisions taken by any previous Ministers, and I cannot comment on officials in the Chamber, as it would be inappropriate for me to do so. What I can say to reassure you and other Members is that I have had discussions with the Permanent Secretary about the lessons learned and also with officials in the Department for the Economy and Transport. I have asked for an appropriate senior management team restructure to take the technium network forward, because, as I think David said, there are areas that are very good and we need to link into them. I hope that that reassures you and other Members.

Jenny Randerson: Thank you very much for your statement, Deputy Minister. As the other two speakers have done, I strongly welcome it. As one economic observer said a week or so ago, techniums started as a good idea based on intellectual property and ended up as a bad idea based on property. What you have done today was long overdue. You will know that I have taken a long-term interest in this project—indeed, Andrew Davies mentioned just now that I had made freedom of information requests. One would expect that a new project such as this would take two or three years to get established—you would have to give it time. Andrew referred to the fact that it was under the WDA and that that was a good reason for bringing it in-house, but that happened years ago. My first question is: why was action not taken before? Was there an unwillingness to admit that it was not working? Was it that no-one had looked in sufficient detail at the figures? Was the detailed monitoring not being done? Are you the first member of the Government, to your knowledge, to have asked for a full and thorough review of the financial position and total effectiveness of the techniums?

11 mis yn ôl, yr wyf wedi pryderu am y rhwydwaith, a dyna pam y galwais am yr adolygiad hwn yn ôl yn y gwanwyn. Byddwch yn gwerthfawrogi, gan mai fi yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb nawr, fy mod yma i amddiffyn y penderfyniadau yr wyf wedi'u gwneud. Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am unrhyw benderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd gan unrhyw Weinidogion blaenorol, ac ni allaf sôn am swyddogion yn y Siambr, gan y byddai'n amhriodol imi wneud hynny. Yr hyn y gallaf ei ddweud i dawelu eich meddwl a meddyliau Aelodau eraill yw fy mod wedi cael trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol am y gwersi a ddysgwyd a hefyd â swyddogion yn Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth. Yr wyf wedi gofyn am ailstrwythuro'r uwch dîm rheoli mewn modd priodol i symud ymlaen â'r rhwydwaith technium oherwydd, fel y credaf y dywedodd David, mae rhai meysydd yn dda iawn ac mae angen inni gysylltu â hwy. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n tawelu eich meddwl a meddyliau Aelodau eraill.

Jenny Randerson: Diolch yn fawr iawn am eich datganiad, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Fel y gwnaeth y ddau siaradwr arall, yr wyf yn ei groesawu'n fawr. Fel y dywedodd un arsylwr economaidd tuag wythnos yn ôl, dechreuodd y canolfannau technium fel syniad da yn seiliedig ar eiddo deallusol a gorffenasant yn syniad drwg yn seiliedig ar eiddo. Yr oedd yn hen bryd ichi wneud yr hyn a wnaethoch heddiw. Byddwch yn gwybod fy mod wedi cymryd diddordeb hirdymor yn y prosiect hwn—yn wir, mae Andrew Davies newydd ddweud fy mod wedi gwneud ceisiadau rhyddid gwybodaeth. Byddai rhywun yn disgwyl y byddai'n cymryd dwy neu dair blynedd i sefydlu prosiect newydd fel hwn—byddai'n rhaid ichi roi amser iddo. Cyfeiriodd Andrew at y ffaith ei fod dan WDA a bod hynny'n rheswm da am ei droi'n fewnol, ond digwyddodd hynny flynyddoedd yn ôl. Fy nghwestiwn cyntaf yw: pam na weithredwyd ynghynt? A fu anfodlonrwydd i gyfaddef nad oedd yn gweithio? A oedd y ffigurau heb gael eu hastudio'n ddigon manwl? Onid oedd y gwaith monitro manwl yn cael ei wneud? Ai chi yw'r aelod cyntaf o'r Llywodraeth, hyd y gwyddoch chi, i ofyn am adolygiad llawn a thrylwyr o sefyllfa ariannol ac effeithiolrwydd cyffredinol y canolfannau technium?

I am interested in the two lists list that you have provided. Every time I have asked a question to the Government about techniums, I have received a different list. Andrew has just drawn attention to the fact that there are two outliers. However, I have received numerous answers over the years and each had a different list. That is possibly part of the answer to the first question that I asked you, namely that the Government was not always looking at the same set of buildings and organisations in this case. Sometimes, local authority techniums were included, but sometimes not. The names have changed from time to time. It has been difficult trying to sort out the situation. According to the latest figures that I received from the Government on the running costs of the techniums, both the digital technium at Swansea University and Technium 1 Swansea were making a loss. Technium 2 was profitable. Can you clarify whether that list of four or five techniums, depending on whether you count those in Swansea as one or two, are all profitable in the traditional sense of the term, in that the income covers and exceeds the running costs? I would like your confirmation of that.

You mentioned later in your statement the importance of the close work with universities, but you did not give us any detail. Are you planning in some way to stimulate the university-side input into the techniums that will remain? I ask that because the economic renewal programme makes much of the importance of the link between business and higher education and the spin-out of good new ideas and research from higher education into the business community. Techniums were designed in order to enable that to happen easily and effectively. In your statement there was a considerable lack of detail on what you expect from universities to stimulate the remaining techniums in future.

3.20 p.m.

You say that the Assembly Government cannot continue to fund buildings for the low

Mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb yn y ddwy restr yr ydych wedi'u darparu. Bob tro yr wyf wedi gofyn cwestiwn i'r Llywodraeth am ganolfannau technium, yr wyf wedi cael rhestr wahanol. Mae Andrew newydd dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod yna ddwy ganolfan ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi cael nifer o atebion dros y blynyddoedd a rhestr wahanol ym mhob un. Mae'n bosibl bod hynny'n rhan o'r ateb i'r cwestiwn cyntaf y'i gofynnais ichi, sef nad oedd y Llywodraeth bob amser yn edrych ar yr un set o adeiladau a sefydliadau yn yr achos hwn. Weithiau, byddai canolfannau technium awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu cynnwys, ond ar adegau eraill, ni fyddent. Mae'r enwau wedi newid o bryd i'w gilydd. Mae wedi bod yn anodd ceisio rhoi trefn ar y sefyllfa. Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf imi eu cael gan y Llywodraeth am gostau rhedeg y canolfannau technium, yr oedd y technium digidol ym Mhrifysgol Abertawe a Technium 1 Abertawe'n gwneud colled. Yr oedd Technium 2 yn broffidiol. A allwch egluro a yw'r rhestr honno o bedair neu bum canolfan technium, gan ddibynnu a ydych yn cyfrif y rhai yn Abertawe fel un ynteu ddwy, i gyd yn broffidiol yn ystyr traddodiadol y gair, sef bod yr incwm yn fwy na'r costau cynnal? Hoffwn i chi gadarnhau hynny.

Soniasoch yn ddiweddarach yn eich datganiad am bwysigrwydd y cydweithio agos â phrifysgolion, ond ni roesoch unrhyw fanylion inni. A ydych yn bwriadu ysgogi mewnbwn y prifysgolion i'r canolfannau technium a fydd yn dal i fodoli mewn rhyw ffordd? Gofynnaf hynny gan fod y rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd yn gwneud llawer o bwysigrwydd y cyswllt rhwng busnes ac addysg uwch ac o allgynhyrchu syniadau ac ymchwil newydd da o addysg uwch i'r gymuned fusnes. Cynlluniwyd canolfannau technium i ganiatáu i hynny ddigwydd yn rhwydd ac yn effeithiol. Yn eich datganiad, yr oedd diffyg sylweddol o fanylion am yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddisgwyl gan brifysgolion er mwyn ysgogi'r canolfannau technium sy'n weddill yn y dyfodol.

Dywedwch na all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad barhau i ariannu adeiladau ar gyfer y gyfradd

occupancy rate and the low level of outputs. This emphasises the need for a more comprehensive approach to how you measure the success of the remaining techniums, and I am interested in hearing how you will measure that in future.

Finally, you say that the technium centres will not be closing overnight, so when are you planning for that to happen? Are we looking at a year or two, or only six months? Perhaps you could give us some kind of timescale. You mentioned local authorities and the private sector in your statement; this is a golden opportunity for the development of social enterprise, and I urge you to take special note of the potential for these techniums to be adopted and developed by social enterprise in future. That is something that the Assembly Government has spoken about; there is cross-party agreement on the need for the development of that sector in Wales, and I urge you to press the case.

Lesley Griffiths: I will start with your final point; you referred to the six techniums that we are not retaining, and I realised that I did not answer Andrew's question on what we will be doing with the buildings. Where a technium facility is not owned by the Welsh Assembly Government, it is a matter for the property owner. We are looking at the options for the facilities that we own. The need for discussions with local authorities on social enterprise is a good point, and I will take that on board.

As I said to Andrew, I am not here to defend other Ministers. I am the Deputy Minister with responsibility for the technium network; I have made this decision and will defend it. I do not know what went on before and cannot therefore defend it, so I cannot respond to your questions as clearly you would obviously like me to.

You referred to the level of income in the four techniums that we are retaining. I do not think that we can say that we are covering everything at Technium OpTIC—it is running part of it, so we will need to look at the matter in more detail because, although that technium recovers some income from rental space and from holding events, we

meddiannaeth isel a lefel isel yr allbynnau. Mae hyn yn pwysleisio'r angen am ddull mwy cynhwysfawr o fesur llwyddiant y canolfannau technium sy'n weddill, ac mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed sut y mesurwch hynny yn y dyfodol.

Yn olaf, dywedwch na fydd y canolfannau technium yn cau dros nos, felly pryd yr ydych yn bwriadu y bydd hynny'n digwydd? A ydym yn edrych ar flwyddyn neu ddwy, ynteu ddim ond chwe mis? Efallai y gallech roi rhyw fath o amserlen inni. Soniasoch am awdurdodau lleol a'r sector preifat yn eich datganiad; mae hwn yn gyfle euraidd i ddatblygu menter gymdeithasol, ac anogaf chi i wneud nodyn arbennig o'r potensial i fentrau cymdeithasol fabwysiadu a datblygu'r canolfannau technium hyn yn y dyfodol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi siarad am hynny; ceir cytundeb trawsbleidiol am yr angen i ddatblygu'r sector hwnnw yng Nghymru, ac anogaf chi i wthio'r achos.

Lesley Griffiths: Dechreuaf â'ch pwnt olaf; cyfeiriasoch at y chwe chanolfan technium nad ydym yn eu cadw, a sylwais na atebais gwestiwn Andrew am yr hyn y byddwn yn ei wneud â'r adeiladau. Os nad yw'r cyfleuster technium yn eiddo i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mater i berchennog yr eiddo ydyw. Yr ydym yn edrych ar y dewisiadau ar gyfer y cyfleusterau sy'n eiddo i ni. Mae'n bwynt da y bydd angen trafod mentrau cymdeithasol ag awdurdodau lleol, a chofiaf ef.

Fel y dywedais wrth Andrew, nid wyf yma i amddiffyn Gweinidogion eraill. Fi yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb am y rhwydwaith technium; fi sydd wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwn, ac amddiffynnaf ef. Nid wyf yn gwybod beth ddigwyddodd cynt felly ni allaf ei amddiffyn, felly ni allaf ateb eich cwestiynau mor glir ag y mae'n amlwg yr hoffech imi wneud.

Cyfeiriasoch at lefel yr incwm yn y pedair canolfan technium yr ydym yn eu cadw. Ni chredaf y gallwn ddweud ein bod yn ymwneud â phopeth yn Technium OpTIC—mae'n cynnal rhan ohono, felly bydd angen inni edrych ar y mater yn fanylach oherwydd, er bod y ganolfan technium honno'n adennill rhywfaint o incwm o rentu lle ac o gynnal

need to work with Glyndŵr University on that.

We are drawing up a programme to talk to higher education institutions to ensure that they are part of the network as we go forward.

On the timescale, I hope that it will not be in years. We need to look at those buildings and at what we can do with them. I am happy to come forward with a further update on this matter before the election, if Members would like that.

Gareth Jones: Hoffwn ddweud cymaint yr wyf yn croesawu eich datganiad, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Mae'n ddatganiad clir a diamwys, ac yr wyf yn edmygu eich parodrwydd i fynd i'r afael â sefyllfa sydd wedi bodoli a chodi pob math o gwestiynau dros rai blynnyddoedd. Nid mater hawdd yw gwneud penderfyniadau fel yr ydych wedi bwrw iddi i'w gwneud, yn enwedig wrth sôn am gau sefydliadau.

O wrando ar y siaradwyr blaenorol, yr ydym i gyd o blaid y syniad o gael technium, os mai'r bwriad yw datblygu syniadau da i'w masnacheiddio mewn cysylltiad agos ag addysg uwch ac addysg bellach. Dylem ni weld hynny'n digwydd; mae'r berthynas honno'n angenrheidiol os ydym am weld twf economaidd yng Nghymru. Mae'n siomedig i mi—ac yr wyf yn gwybod fy mod yn siarad ar ran cyd-aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu sydd wedi edrych yn fanwl ar gyfraniad addysg uwch i economi Cymru—nad yw rôl addysg uwch mor flaenllaw yn nifer o'r canolfannau technium hyn. Mae hynny'n siomedig iawn, yn enwedig oherwydd y sylw a roddwyd i'r berthynas rhwng addysg uwch a phellach a byd busnes yn ddiweddar.

Cyfeiriasoch hefyd yn eich datganiad at ddigwyddiadau a newidiadau cyffrous sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, sef rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi a'r sectorau sydd wedi'u dethol fel rhan o'r rhaglen honno. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Cynulliad fod gennym bellach academi wyddoniaeth, a bod prif gynghorydd gwyddonol wedi'i benodi—mae ef yn y broses o ddatblygu polisi gwyddoniaeth Cymru i'r dyfodol. Mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu hefyd yn edrych ar

digwyddiadau, mae angen inni weithio gyda Phrifysgol Glyndŵr ar hynny.

Yr ydym wrthi'n llunio rhaglen i siarad â sefydliadau addysg uwch i sicrhau eu bod yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith wrth inni fynd ymlaen.

O ran yr amserlen, gobeithiaf na fydd yn fater o flynyddoedd. Mae angen inni edrych ar yr adeiladau hynny ac ar beth y gallwn ei wneud â hwy. Yr wyf yn hapus i roi diweddariad pellach am y mater hwn cyn yr etholiad, pe bai Aelodau'n hoff o gael un.

Gareth Jones: I want to say how much I welcome your statement, Deputy Minister. It is a clear and unambiguous statement, and I admire your willingness to tackle a situation that has existed and raised all sorts of questions for some years. It is no easy matter to make decisions as you have set out to do, particularly when talking about closing institutions.

Having listened to the previous speakers, I find that we all support the idea of having techniums, if the intention is to develop good ideas for commercialisation in close contact with higher and further education. We should see that happen; the relationship is necessary if we want to see economic growth in Wales. It is disappointing to me—and I know that I speak on behalf of fellow members of the Enterprise and Learning Committee, which has looked in detail at the contribution of higher education to the Welsh economy—that higher education does not play such a prominent role in a number of these techniums. That is very disappointing, especially considering the recent attention given to the relationship between higher and further education and the business world.

You also referred in your statement to the exciting events and changes taking place in Wales at the moment, namely the economic renewal programme and the sectors that have been selected as part of it. I would remind the Assembly that we now have the science academy, and that a chief scientific adviser has been appointed—he is in the process of developing a future science policy for Wales. The Enterprise and Learning Committee is also looking at the STEM subjects, as they

y pynciau STEM, fel y'u gelwir, sef gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianneg a mathemateg, a bu i Jenny Randerson gyfeirio at y ffaith bod gan fentrau cymdeithasol rôl bwysig iawn i'w chwarae. Pe byddech yn casglu'r cyfan at ei gilydd, yna gallai'r canolfannau technium hyn chwarae rôl allweddol.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, pan ewch ati i ail-arfarnu ac ailasesu rôl y canolfannau technium hyn, a wnewch chi ystyried popeth da sy'n digwydd yn y cefndir yng Nghymru, fel ein bod yn medru rhoi arweiniad ar draws yr holl sectorau hyn, i gael y budd gorau o'r canolfannau technium, yn enwedig gan ein bod wedi colli allan yn y gorffennol?

Lesley Griffiths: You are absolutely right. As I said in my statement, the time was right, particularly with regard to the economic renewal programme. Business innovation support will be re-focused within the key sectors in the ERP to ensure that we get the commercialisation that we want, which fits in well with taking the technium network further. You referred to Professor John Harries, the chief scientific adviser, who has visited some of the techniums, such as Technium OpTIC at Glyndŵr University, and thought, like you, that it fitted in perfectly with the STEM agenda.

You are absolutely right in your last point: there must be clarity from Ministers and the Government about what we expect from this technium network, and I can assure you that that will happen.

Helen Mary Jones: I will confine my question to the technium in Llanelli, as you would expect, Deputy Minister. You will be aware that I have been raising concerns for some time, publicly and with the Government, about what I perceive, and what is widely perceived in the Llanelli area, to be a technium that was not succeeding. In that context, I welcome the decision that you have made. We all support the technium concept, but this was clearly a part of it that was not working. I have experience of supporting what I thought were suitable local businesses to try to get into the technium, only to find that the conditions there were drawn so

are called, namely science, technology, engineering and mathematics, and Jenny Randerson referred to the fact that social enterprises have a very important role to play. If you were to draw all this together, then the techniums could play a key role.

Deputy Minister, when you go about re-evaluating and re-assessing the role of the these techniums, will you consider all the good things that are happening in the background in Wales, so that we can provide leadership across all of these sectors, to get the maximum benefit from the techniums, particularly as we have lost out in the past?

Lesley Griffiths: Yr ydych yn hollol gywir. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, yr oedd yr amser yn gywir, yn enwedig o ran y rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd. Caiff cymorth arloesi busnes ei ailffocysu yn sectorau allweddol y rhaglen i sicrhau y cawn y masnacheiddio yr ydym yn ei ddymuno, sy'n cyd-fynd yn dda â mynd â'r rhwydwaith technium ymhellach. Soniasoch am yr Athro John Harries, y prif gynghorydd gwyddonol, sydd wedi ymweld â rhai o'r canolfannau technium, megis Technium OpTIC ym Mhrifysgol Glyndŵr, ac a feddylodd, fel chi, ei bod yn cyd-fynd yn berffaith â'r agenda STEM.

Mae eich pwynt olaf yn hollol gywir: rhaid cael eglurder gan Weinidogion a'r Llywodraeth am yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ddisgwyl gan y rhwydwaith technium hwn, a gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

Helen Mary Jones: Fe gyfyngaf fy nghwestiwn at y ganolfan technium yn Llanelli, fel y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi bod yn mynegi pryderon ers cryn amser, yn gyhoeddus a gyda'r Llywodraeth, am yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ystyried, ac y mae pobl ardal Llanelli'n gyffredinol yn ei ystyried, yn ganolfan technium nad oedd yn llwyddo. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, croesawaf y penderfyniad yr ydych wedi'i wneud. Yr ydym i gyd o blaid y cysyniad technium, ond yr oedd yn amlwg nad oedd y rhan hon ohono'n gweithio. Mae gennyf brofiad o gefnogi busnesau lleol yr

narrowly that the businesses that, to a lay person like me, looked as though they would ideally fit into that model were just perceived as not quite fitting in. I know that some of those businesses will now feel vindicated. However, Deputy Minister, you will be aware that there are tenants in that technium, and they may feel that they have gone through quite considerable hoops, and gone to a lot of trouble to invest, in time and money, to get their business proposals to the point where they were acceptable under the technium concept. I know that you will understand that those tenants are disappointed and concerned.

oeddwn yn credu eu bod yn addas i geisio mynd yn rhan o'r technium, ond yna ganfod bod yr amodau wedi'u llunio mor gul nes bod y busnesau a oedd, i leygwr fel fi, yn ymddangos fel rhai a fyddai'n ffitio'n ddefnyddol i'r model hwnnw, yn cael gwybod nad oeddent yn ffitio'n ddigonol. Gwn y bydd rhai o'r busnesau hynny'n teimlo eu bod wedi'u cyfiawnhau nawr. Fodd bynnag, Ddirprwy Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gan y ganolfan technium honno denantiaid, ac mae'n bosibl eu bod yn teimlo eu bod wedi gorfod goresgyn rhwystrau eithaf sylweddol, a mynd i'r drafferth o fuddsoddi llawer o amser ac arian, er mwyn i'w cynigion busnes gael eu hystyried yn dderbyniol i'r cysyniad technium. Gwn y byddwch yn deall bod y tenantiaid hynny'n siomedig ac yn bryderus.

I welcome what you have said in your statement about ensuring that tenants are not hung out to dry, particularly in situations where a technium building is not taken over and run according to a similar concept. However, I am sure that you will understand that people are still very concerned. What further assurances can you give me this afternoon, and can you give any more detail about what will be done to support those businesses that are in the techniums that are to close? Will they be moved out or will they become tenants of a new body? I am sure that none of us would want to see those businesses suffering from failures of policy that have not been their fault.

Croesawaf yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud yn eich datganiad am sicrhau na fyddwn yn cefnu ar denantiaid, yn enwedig mewn sefyllfaoedd lle na chaiff adeilad technium ei feddiannu a'i gynnal yn unol â chysyniad tebyg. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y deallwch fod pobl yn dal i bryderu'n fawr. Pa sicrwydd pellach y gallwch ei roi imi brynhawn heddiw, ac a allwch roi unrhyw fanylion eraill am yr hyn a wneir i gefnogi'r busnesau hynny sydd yn y canolfannau technium sydd am gau? A gânt eu symud allan ynteu a fyddant yn denantiaid i gorff newydd? Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai neb ohonom yn dymuno gweld y busnesau hynny'n dioddef o ganlyniad i fethiannau polisi nad ydynt ar fai amdanynt.

3.30 p.m.

Lesley Griffiths: On the criteria for entry, all techniums use entry criteria to ensure the quality of the businesses located there. However, it is fair to say that there has been a lack of consistency in the entry criteria and assessment methods used across the 10 techniums in Wales. They have been used to varying degrees of interpretation. This will need to be addressed as we go forward with the techniums that we are retaining, as part of the new management arrangements, to ensure that admission criteria are consistent.

Lesley Griffiths: O ran y meini prawf mynediad, mae pob canolfan technium yn defnyddio meini prawf mynediad i sicrhau ansawdd y busnesau sydd wedi'u lleoli yno. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud y cafwyd diffyg cysondeb yn y meini prawf mynediad a'r dulliau asesu a ddefnyddiwyd ar draws y 10 canolfan technium yng Nghymru. Maent wedi cael eu dehongli mewn ffyrdd gwahanol. Bydd angen unioni hyn wrth inni symud ymlaen gyda'r canolfannau technium yr ydym yn eu cadw, fel rhan o'r trefniadau rheoli newydd, i sicrhau bod meini prawf mynediad yn gyson.

For the businesses that are in the techniums at present, this is disappointing news, and they have my commitment that they will not be abandoned. Each tenant will have had a letter and will have been spoken to by an official. They must be treated sympathetically, and given information as to what will happen next. We will help them to look for office space somewhere else, if that is what they want. I do not want to see any company go because of this.

Jonathan Morgan: Having read the statement, and having heard what you have said this afternoon, my concern, as Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, if money has been spent—it would seem that a substantial sum of money has been spent—to deliver the technium project, is whether that money will realise any benefits in the short, medium or long term. Can you inform the Assembly of the total spend since the project started, and whether your officials have been able to assess whether any level of expenditure has been incurred that may be recovered by way of future changes to the scheme? I understand that this has been subject to several reviews, one of which—I believe that it was called the first stage review—was conducted by DTZ. However, I understand that there is a second, more substantial, review, which is still ongoing. Has that review now been completed? Is the statement based on that more recent review, and, if so, will you make the documentation available?

Lesley Griffiths: Are you referring to the internal audit review? I see that you are. I believe that, of the 53 recommendations, 52 have been implemented; there was one outstanding recommendation, which was to do with the technium advisory board, and there will be a ministerial statement on that in due course.

In relation to the cost, I have asked officials to collate that information. The DTZ report states that a total of £94 million was spent on developing the technium network; that figure has not been verified by the Welsh Assembly Government.

Mae hyn yn newyddion siomedig i'r busnesau sydd yn y canolfannau technium ar hyn o bryd, ac mae ganddynt fy ymrwymiad na wnawn gefnu arnynt. Bydd pob tenant wedi cael llythyr a bydd swyddog wedi siarad â phob un. Rhaid eu trin â chydymdeimlad, a rhoi gwybodaeth iddynt am beth fydd yn digwydd nesaf. Byddwn yn eu helpu i chwilio am swyddfeydd yn rhywle arall os dymunant. Ni hoffwn golli unrhyw gwmni oherwydd hyn.

Jonathan Morgan: Wedi darllen y datganiad, ac wedi clywed yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud brynhawn heddiw, fy mhryder i, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, os yw arian wedi'i wario—byddai'n ymddangos bod swm sylweddol o arian wedi'i wario—i gyflenwi'r prosiect technium, yw a wnaiff yr arian hwnnw wireddu unrhyw fuddion yn y tymor byr, y tymor canolig neu'r tymor hir. A allwch ddweud wrth y Cynulliad beth yw cyfanswm y gwariant ers i'r prosiect ddechrau, ac a yw eich swyddogion wedi gallu asesu a achoswyd unrhyw lefel o wariant y gellid ei adennill drwy newid y cynllun yn y dyfodol? Deallaf fod hyn wedi bod yn destun nifer o adolygiadau, a bod un ohonynt—yr adolygiad cam cyntaf, credaf—wedi'i gynnal gan DTZ. Fodd bynnag, deallaf fod ail adolygiad mwy sylweddol yn dal i gael ei gynnal. A yw'r adolygiad hwnnw wedi'i gwblhau bellach? A yw'r datganiad yn seiliedig ar yr adolygiad diweddarach hwnnw, ac, os ydyw, a sicrhewch fod y ddogfen ar gael?

Lesley Griffiths: A ydych yn cyfeirio at adolygiad yr archwiliad mewnol? Gwelaf eich bod. Credaf, o'r 53 o argymhellion, fod 52 wedi eu rhoi ar waith; yr oedd un argymhelliad na chafodd ei roi ar waith yn ymwneud â bwrdd cynghori'r canolfannau technium, a cheir datganiad gweinidogol am hynny gyda hyn.

O ran y gost, yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion gasglu'r wybodaeth honno. Mae adroddiad DTZ yn datgan y gwariwyd cyfanswm o £94 miliwn ar ddatblygu'r rhwydwaith technium; nid yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwirio'r ffigur hwnnw.

**Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Eithriadau Gwarchod Plant a Gofal Dydd
(Cymru) 2010**
**Motion to Approve the Child Minding and Day Care Exceptions (Wales) Order
2010**

Cynnig NDM4591 Jane Hutt

Motion NDM4591 Jane Hutt

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 24.4:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 24.4:

Yn cymeradwyo bod y fersiwn ddrafft o'r Gorchymyn Eithriadau Gwarchod Plant a Gofal Dydd (Cymru) 2010 yn cael ei llunio yn unol â'r fersiwn ddrafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Hydref 2010.

Approves that the draft The Child Minding and Day Care Exceptions (Wales) Order 2010 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 22 October 2010.

The Deputy Minister for Children (Huw Lewis): I move the motion.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Blant (Huw Lewis): Cynigiau y cynnig.

I am pleased to present the Child Minding and Day Care Exceptions (Wales) Order 2010 for approval. The Order forms part of an initial phase of subordinate legislation to be made under Part 2 of the Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2010, and defines the circumstances under which a person caring for children would not be required to register as a childminder or provider of day care.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno Gorchymyn Eithriadau Gwarchod Plant a Gofal Dydd (Cymru) 2010 i'w gymeradwyo. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn rhan o gam cyntaf is-ddeddfwriaeth i'w gwneud dan Ran 2 Mesur Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2010, ac mae'n diffinio'r amgylchiadau pan na fyddai'n ofynnol i unigolyn sy'n gofalu am blant gofrestru fel gwarchodwr plant neu ddarparwr gofal dydd.

The purpose of the Order is to establish clear and sensible boundaries between what constitutes formal childcare, and should be regulated as such, and more informal childcare provision, such as baby-sitting, where imposing a registration and inspection regime would clearly be disproportionate. The Order balances carefully, I hope, the need to ensure quality of care, recognising a variety of different approaches, so that parents can exercise flexibility and choice in the arrangements that they put in place for their children. Safeguarding and promoting the welfare of children is everyone's responsibility, and is of paramount importance to the Assembly Government. These arrangements recognise that principle of shared responsibility. Consultation on the provisions of the Order took place over the summer, and the responses have been helpful in developing the legislation that is before you. This contains some key revisions to the original draft that was issued for consultation.

Diben y Gorchymyn yw sefydlu ffiniau clir a synhwyrol rhwng gofal plant ffurfiol y dylid ei reoleiddio felly, a darpariaeth gofal plant mwy anffurfiol, megis carco, lle byddai gosod trefn gofrestru ac arolygu'n amlwg yn anghymesur. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn taro cydbwysedd gofalus, gobeithiaf; mae angen sicrhau ansawdd gofal, gan gydnabod amrywiaeth o wahanol ddulliau, fel y gall rhieni fod yn hyblyg wrth ddewis y trefniadau y maent yn eu defnyddio ar gyfer eu plant. Mae diogelu plant a hybu eu lles yn gyfrifoldeb i bawb, ac mae'n hollbwysig i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r trefniadau hyn yn cydnabod yr egwyddor honno o rannu cyfrifoldeb. Ymgynghorwyd am ddarpariaethau'r Gorchymyn dros yr haf, ac mae'r atebion wedi bod o gymorth wrth inni ddatblygu'r ddeddfwriaeth sydd o'ch blaen. Mae hon yn cynnwys rhai diwygiadau allweddol i'r drafft gwreiddiol a gyhoeddwyd i ymgynghori arno.

New provision in article 7 provides an exception where a person provides, without payment, care for children in the course of a friendship with the parents of those children. This recognises that parents sometimes need the flexibility that such care arrangements can offer, particularly where a parent may have unusual work patterns. I know that evidence from the childcare sufficiency audits has shown that there is a need to improve the provision of childcare linked to parents' work patterns, as well as a need to improve the geographical spread of childcare to meet parental demand and community patterns. There has also been some clarification of the exception criteria for providers of coaching or tuition, where care provided to children is incidental to the main purpose of the provision. This now includes firmer requirements and will address concerns raised by consultation respondents that the exception could have been open to interpretation.

It was also clear from the consultation exercise that there was not a strong appetite for increasing the number of days that a temporary day-care setting, such as a holiday day-care scheme, is able to operate, unregistered, in a calendar year. Although some respondents felt that increasing the number of days from fewer than six days to fewer than 14 days would help increase much-needed short-term provision, a greater number were concerned that such provision might be of lower quality and have a detrimental impact on regulated care. On balance, it has been decided that this exception should remain at the current level.

I commend this Order to you as an important contribution to our childcare agenda, ensuring that regulation of care is imposed proportionately, and recognising that parental choice and the need to ensure quality of care is carefully balanced.

Mark Isherwood: As the National Childminding Association Cymru states, quality childcare has a key role to play in tackling child poverty and supporting children, families and the economy in Wales. The effective regulation of such care is vital in protecting children and ensuring that

Mae darpariaeth newydd yn erthygl 7 yn darparu eithriad os yw unigolyn yn darparu gofal am blant, heb dâl, os yw'n ffrind i rieni'r plant hynny. Mae hyn yn cydnabod bod ar rieni ar adegau angen trefniadau gofal hyblyg o'r fath, yn enwedig os oes patrymau gwaith anarferol gan riant. Gwn fod tystiolaeth o'r archwiliadau digonoldeb gofal plant wedi dangos bod angen gwella darpariaeth gofal plant mewn cysylltiad â phatrymau gwaith rhieni, ynghyd ag angen i wella lledaeniad daearyddol gofal plant i ateb y galw gan rieni a phatrymau cymunedau. Hefyd, cafwyd rhywfaint o eglurhad o'r meini prawf eithrio ar gyfer darparwyr hyfforddiant neu wersi preifat, lle mae gofalu am blant yn ganlyniad i brif ddiben y ddarpariaeth. Mae hyn nawr yn cynnwys gofynion mwy llym a bydd yn bodloni pryderon a godwyd gan atebwyr yr ymgynghoriad y gellid dehongli'r eithriad mewn ffyrdd gwahanol.

Yr oedd yn amlwg hefyd o'r ymarfer ymgynghori nad oedd llawer o archwaeth am gynyddu nifer y dyddiau y gall lleoliad gofal dydd dros dro, megis cynllun gofal dydd gwyliau, weithredu, heb gofrestru, mewn blwyddyn galendr. Er bod rhai atebwyr yn teimlo y byddai cynyddu nifer y dyddiau o lai na chwe diwrnod i lai na 14 diwrnod yn helpu i gynyddu darpariaeth tymor byr sydd ei hangen, yr oedd mwy'n pryderu y gallai ansawdd darpariaeth o'r fath fod yn is ac y byddai hyn yn cael effaith anffafriol ar ofal wedi'i reoleiddio. Ar gydbwysedd, penderfynwyd y dylid cadw'r eithriad hwn ar y lefel bresennol.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn hwn fel cyfraniad pwysig at ein hagenda gofal plant, gan sicrhau y caiff gofal ei reoleiddio'n gymesur, a chydabod cydbwysedd gofalus rhwng dewis rhieni a'r angen i sicrhau ansawdd gofal.

Mark Isherwood: Fel y mae Cymdeithas Genedlaethol Gwarchod Plant Cymru'n datgan, mae gan ofal plant o safon ran allweddol i'w chwarae o ran mynd i'r afael â thlodi plant a chefnogi plant, teuluoedd a'r economi yng Nghymru. Mae rheoleiddio gofal o'r fath yn effeithiol yn hollbwysig o

parents have access to a diverse range and choice of high-quality childcare. However, childminding organisations are concerned that these childminding and day-care regulations fail to make necessary provision in several key areas, which may have consequences for the safety and wellbeing of children and the achievement of broader policy aims. Wales has a chance to show a lead and blaze a trail but, instead, Ministers rejected action to address concerns in two of the areas being considered today as disproportionate.

On the third issue—the exemption of children over the age of eight from the scope of the regulations—this is the current position in Wales and England. The Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2010 would have allowed Ministers to use this Order to amend this age, but they have not done so. Many in the sector feel that this places children and young people at risk. Childminders provide mixed provision to different ages of children, and often to siblings. Maintaining a regulatory system that values care for one group above that of another cannot be in the best interest of children as a whole and disproportionately risks affecting disabled children over eight years old. As the Wales Pre-school Providers Association states, we are, at the end of the day, quite often referring to the most vulnerable children, so safeguards need to be in place. Unregistered provision, whether for eight-year-olds or open daily for less than two hours, has no requirement for staff to be checked by the Criminal Records Bureau or to hold relevant qualifications. There are no standards of provision in relation to quality of accommodation, activities, resources and child-to-staff ratios. The new regulations do not apply to periods of care for under two hours in duration per day. NCMA Cymru is concerned that this will exclude much of the short-term care provided by childminders, including respite care.

Shorter periods of care can be vital in allowing families to access other services and support. In fact, 67 per cent of consultation

ran amddiffyn plant a sicrhau bod ystod a dewis eang o ofal plant o safon uchel ar gael i rieni. Fodd bynnag, mae sefydliadau gofal plant yn pryderu nad yw'r rheoliadau gwarchod plant a gofal dydd hyn yn darparu'n ddigonol mewn nifer o feysydd allweddol, a allai achosi canlyniadau o ran diogelwch a lles plant a chyflawni nodau polisi mwy cyffredinol. Mae gan Gymru gyfle i arwain a dangos y ffordd ond, yn lle hyn, mae Gweinidogion wedi gwrthod camau i unioni pryderon mewn dau o'r meysydd sy'n cael eu hystyried yn anghymesur heddiw.

O ran y trydydd mater—eithrio plant dros wyth oed o gwmpas y rheoliadau—dyma'r sefyllfa bresennol yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Byddai Mesur Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2010 wedi galluogi Gweinidogion i ddefnyddio'r Gorchymyn hwn i newid yr oed hwn, ond nid ydynt wedi gwneud hynny. Mae llawer o bobl yn y sector yn teimlo bod hyn yn peri risg i blant a phobl ifanc. Mae gwarchodwyr plant yn darparu darpariaeth gymysg i blant o wahanol oeddrannau, ac yn aml i frodyr a chwiorydd. Os cynhaliwn system reoleiddio sy'n gwerthfawrogi gofal i un grŵp uwchlaw grŵp arall, ni all hynny fod er pennaf les plant yn gyffredinol ac mae'n creu risg anghymesur i blant anabl dros wyth mlwydd oed. Fel y mae Cymdeithas Darparwyr Cyn Ysgol Cymru'n datgan, yr ydym, ar ddiwedd y dydd, yn eithaf aml yn cyfeirio at y plant mwyaf agored i niwed, felly mae angen i ragofalon fod ar waith. Mewn darpariaeth heb gofrestrriad, boed hynny i blant wyth oed neu'n agored yn ddyddiol am lai na dwyawr, nid oes dim gofyniad i staff gael eu harchwilio gan y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol na bod â chymwysterau perthnasol. Nid oes dim safonau darpariaeth mewn perthynas ag ansawdd llety, gweithgareddau, adnoddau a chymarebau plant-i-staff. Nid yw'r rheoliadau newydd yn berthnasol i gyfnodau gofal sy'n fyrrach na dwyawr y dydd. Mae NCMA Cymru'n pryderu y bydd hyn yn eithrio llawer o'r gofal tymor byr a ddarperir gan warchodwyr plant, gan gynnwys gofal seibiant.

Mae cyfnodau gofal byrrach yn gallu bod yn hollbwysig o ran galluogi teuluoedd i ddefnyddio mathau eraill o wasanaethau a

responses to these regulations were dissatisfied with these exemption arrangements, while only 27 per cent agreed. As the consultation response from the National Day Nurseries Association stated, there should be a level playing field in place to ensure equality and fairness, as well as the fundamental need to protect the welfare of the child in all childcare settings. Yet, care between 6 p.m. and 2 a.m. is also exempt from the regulations, despite 67 per cent of consultation responses disagreeing that the existing provisions exempting these hours were appropriate; only 24 per cent agreed. These regulations do not cover the vital care being provided during these critical hours by childminders, or within hotels and guest houses, despite the fact that children could be more vulnerable during these hours. The sector believes that the time in which care takes place should not matter. This is not about baby-sitters. If children are in paid care, this should be regulated.

3.40 p.m.

This regulation as it stands is at odds with the Welsh Government's vision for flexible childcare, which could damage the economic prospects of families, with subsequent implications for tackling child poverty. These are hours when shift work might take place, and by keeping care in these hours unregulated, families in such employment are placed at a disadvantage. Excluding such care from regulation potentially places children at risk, and a survey of childminders carried out by the NCMA Cymru this August found that 80 per cent of childminders disagreed with the regulation as it stands. The Wales Pre-school Providers Association states that this heightens the problem of safeguarding. Consultation responses to these regulations that supported these exemptions are from the viewpoint of adults, not children, yet the child should be at the centre of these regulations if they are to meet the objectives of the Welsh Government's Proposed Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child.

chymorth. Yn wir, yr oedd 67 y cant o'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad am y rheoliadau hyn yn anfodlon â'r trefniadau eithrio hyn, a dim ond 27 y cant oedd yn cytuno. Fel yr oedd yr ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad gan y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Meithrinfeydd Dydd yn datgan, dylai'r maes chwarae fod yn wastad er mwyn sicrhau cydraddoldeb a thegwch, yn ogystal â'r angen sylfaenol i ddiogelu lles y plentyn ym mhob lleoliad gofal plant. Ac eto, mae gofal rhwng 6 p.m. a 2 a.m. hefyd wedi'i eithrio o'r rheoliadau, er bod 67 y cant o ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad yn anghytuno bod y darpariaethau presennol sy'n eithrio'r oriau hyn yn briodol; dim ond 24 y cant a gytunodd. Nid yw'r rheoliadau hyn yn ystyried y gofal hanfodol sy'n cael ei ddarparu yn ystod yr oriau hollbwysig hyn gan warchodwyr plant, nac mewn gwestai a thai llety, er y gallai plant fod yn fwy agored i niwed yn ystod yr oriau hyn. Mae'r sector yn credu na ddylai fod yn bwysig faint o'r gloch y mae'r gofal yn digwydd. Nid mater yn ymwneud â gwarchodwyr plant yw hwn. Os yw plant yn derbyn gofal am dâl, dylid rheoleiddio hyn.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r rheoliad hwn yn groes i weledigaeth Llywodraeth Cymru o ofal plant hyblyg; gallai hyn niweidio rhagolygon economaidd teuluoedd a chreu goblygiadau o ran mynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Oriau yw'r rhain pan allai gwaith shifft fod yn digwydd, a drwy beidio â rheoleiddio gofal yn yr oriau hyn, mae teuluoedd mewn cyflogaeth o'r fath yn cael eu rhoi dan anfantais. Gallai eithrio gofal o'r fath o reoleiddio greu risg i blant, a chanfu arolwg o warchodwyr plant a gynhaliwyd gan NCMA Cymru fis Awst eleni fod 80 y cant o warchodwyr plant yn anghytuno â'r rheoliad fel y mae. Mae Cymdeithas Darparwyr Cyn Ysgol Cymru'n datgan bod hyn yn gwaethygu problem diogelu. Mae'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad am y rheoliadau hyn a gefnogodd yr eithriadau hyn yn dod o safbwynt oedolion, nid plant, ond y plentyn ddylai fod yn ganolog i'r rheoliadau hyn os ydynt am fodloni amcanion Mesur Hawliau Plant a Phobl Ifanc (Cymru) arfaethedig Llywodraeth Cymru a Chonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn.

We cannot approve this proposed Order, and urge the Welsh Government to reflect further on the concerns raised, and to bring forward amended regulations that make the necessary provision in these key areas.

The Deputy Minister for Children (Huw Lewis): Thank you for your comments, Mark. As we are all aware, this is an important instance of getting the balance right. We must ensure that, where appropriate, childcare is effectively regulated. We also have to recognise that the regulatory burden must be carefully placed. Universal regulation of all childcare in its various forms would not be fair and balanced, and would impose an unnecessary and overwhelming burden on a range of more informal types of care. The line has to be drawn to provide safeguards for children and flexibility for parents.

I commend this proposed Order, which I believe achieves the right balance in a sensible way, and will help to ensure a vibrant childcare sector that reflects the needs of families in terms of availability, flexibility and quality of care.

Y Llywydd: Y cynnig yw bod y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.42 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.42 p.m.*

Gwasanaethau Gyrfaoedd Careers Services

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Nick Ramsay and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Peter Black.

Cynnig NDM4593 Jane Hutt

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

Ni allwn gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn arfaethedig hwn, ac yr ydym yn annog Llywodraeth Cymru i ystyried ymhellach y pryderon a fynegwyd, a chyflwyno rheoliadau diwygiedig sy'n gwneud y ddarpariaeth angenrheidiol yn y meysydd allweddol hyn.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Blant (Huw Lewis): Diolch am eich sylwadau, Mark. Fel yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod, mae hwn yn achos pwysig o sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff gofal plant ei reoleiddio'n effeithiol pan mae hynny'n briodol. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd bod rhaid bod yn ofalus wrth osod y baich rheoleiddio. Ni fyddai'n deg a chytbwys rheoleiddio pob math o ofal plant yn unffurf; byddai hynny'n rhoi baich diangen a gormodol ar ystod o fathau mwy anffurfiol o ofal. Rhaid tynnu'r llinell er mwyn diogelu plant a rhoi hyblygrwydd i rieni.

Cymeradwyaf y Gorchymyn arfaethedig hwn; credaf ei fod yn cyflawni'r cydbwysedd cywir mewn modd doeth, ac y bydd yn helpu i sicrhau sector gofal plant llewyrchus sy'n adlewyrchu anghenion teuluoedd o ran argeledd, hyblygrwydd ac ansawdd gofal.

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is that the motion be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

Motion NDM4593 Jane Hutt

To propose that the National Assembly for

yn nodi 'Uchelgeisiau i'r dyfodol: datblygu gwasanaethau gyrfaedd yng Nghymru' ac yn croesawu cynnig Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sefydlu strwythur sy'n uno ar gyfer Gyrfaedd Cymru.

Wales notes 'Future Ambitions: developing careers services in Wales' and welcomes the Assembly Government's proposal to establish a unifying structure for Careers Wales.

The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews): I move the motion.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews): Cynigiau cynnig.

Wales has a proud record of innovation in the careers field. Careers Wales was the first all-age careers service to be set up in the UK, and one of the first in the world—an achievement that was recognised by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. Wales was the first country in the UK to introduce careers education for the entire 11-19 cohort. Careers Wales online gained early recognition and has grown to be a key resource in helping young people make their crucial option choices for the 14-19 phase. We are presently piloting an apprentice-matching service on the site.

Mae gan Gymru hanes balch o arloesi ym maes gyrfaedd. Gyrfa Cymru oedd y gwasanaeth gyrfaedd cyntaf i bob oed i gael ei sefydlu yn y DU, ac un o'r cyntaf yn y byd—cydnabuwyd y gamp hon gan y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd. Cymru oedd y wlad gyntaf yn y DU i gyflwyno addysg gyrfaedd i'r holl gohort 11-19. Cafodd Gyrfa Cymru ar-lein gydnabyddiaeth gynnar ac mae wedi tyfu i fod yn adnodd allweddol o ran helpu pobl ifanc i wneud eu dewisiadau opsiynau hollbwysig ar gyfer y cyfnod 14-19. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn cynnal peilot o wasanaeth paru prentisiaid ar y safle.

In the fifth economic summit we saw the vital role that careers advisers play in the Team Wales response to redundancies, making available £2 million over two years to increase capacity to meet the extra demand. Successive reports by the OECD, by our inspectorate and by independent academics have informed us that we can take pride in our Careers Wales service. It is well-regarded in local communities and it is embedded across the range of Assembly Government policies.

Yn y bumed uwchgynhadledd economaidd, gwelsom rôl hanfodol cynghorwyr gyrfaedd yn ymateb Tîm Cymru i golli swyddi, gan ryddhau £2 filiwn ychwanegol dros ddwy flynedd i gynyddu eu gallu i ateb y galw ychwanegol. Mae adroddiadau olynol gan yr OECD, gan ein harolygiaeth a gan academyddion annibynnol wedi dweud wrthym y gallwn ymfalchïo yn ein gwasanaeth Gyrfa Cymru. Mae'n uchel ei barch mewn cymunedau lleol ac mae wedi ei gynnwys ar draws amrediad polisïau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Professor Watts, in his review of Careers Wales, said that it was a strong and highly professional organisation of which the Assembly Government should be proud. In its professionalism and quality-assurance processes, he said that it was world class. Yet there remain doubts that we, as a nation, are preparing young people well enough for the transition to adult working life. We know that the percentage of young people not in education, employment or training remains stubbornly high. The CBI and other employer organisations bemoan the capability of even well-qualified university graduates to cope in the workplace, in addition to the basic skills

Yn ei adolygiad o Yrfa Cymru, dywedodd yr Athro Watts ei fod yn sefydliad cryf a phroffesiynol iawn, ac y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn falch ohono. Dywedodd fod ei broffesiynoldeb a'i brosesau sicrhau ansawdd o safon fyd-eang. Ac eto, mae amheuaeth yn parhau a ydym, fel cenedl, yn paratoi pobl ifanc yn ddigon da i symud i fywyd gwaith fel oedolion. Yr ydym yn gwybod bod canran y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant yn dal i fod yn uchel. Mae'r CBI a sefydliadau cyflogwyr eraill yn gresynu wrth allu graddedigion prifysgol â chymwysterau da, hyd yn oed, i ymdopi yn y gweithle, yn

problems identified at all ages and all levels.

In an economic downturn, we struggle with critical skills shortages in the growth industries of the future. The report by Dr Haydn Edwards and his team gives us a number of clear messages. The influences on the decisions that people take are numerous, and there are complex relationships. Responsibilities are blurred at present, and there is a need for partners to recognise that they are working for a shared outcome. The role of schools is crucial, but so is that of employers and parents, and we need to understand how those influences work together. We also need better labour market intelligence, and we need to make it more accessible and more alive for citizens of all ages, as well as to promote educational provision that is more attuned to the needs of the Welsh economy.

'Future Ambitions' makes 60 detailed recommendations on how to improve the service, and I will pick out a few themes. The first is leadership. It is essential that we have a strong, central role for the careers service in developing relationships across the careers family. Dr Edwards recognises that there needs to be a more cohesive approach to the careers agenda in the Assembly; we need to join up the different parts of the service better. There is also a need for the careers family to start showing a more assertive face, perhaps by using a career service forum as a catalyst to move us towards best design. There may be some 5,000 people in the careers family workforce whose job, at least in part, involves giving some level of careers information.

Careers Wales and the Higher Education Careers Services Unit employ full-time careers advisers, but they are supplemented by many other organisations, and each of those organisations has developed in its own way. We need to ensure in future that they are moving together, in tandem, and that we have common quality assurance systems, for example, reinforced by adopting national branding. Therefore, we need to bring the different elements of the careers family together in a careers forum.

ogystal â'r problemau sgiliau sylfaenol a welir ar bob oedran ac ar bob lefel.

Mewn dirywiad economaidd, yr ydym yn cael anawsterau o ran prinderau sgiliau critigol yn niwydiannau twf y dyfodol. Mae'r adroddiad gan Dr Haydn Edwards a'i dîm yn rhoi nifer o negeseuon clir inni. Mae nifer o bethau'n dylanwadau ar benderfyniadau pobl, ac mae perthnasoedd cymhleth yn bodoli. Mae cyfrifoldebau'n aneglur ar hyn o bryd, ac mae angen i bartneriaid gydnabod eu bod yn gweithio tuag at ganlyniad a rennir. Mae rôl ysgolion yn hollbwysig, ond mae hynny hefyd yn wir am gyflogwyr a rhieni, ac mae angen inni ddeall sut y mae'r dylanwadau hynny'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Mae angen gwell gwybodaeth am y farchnad lafur arnom hefyd, ac mae angen inni ei gwneud yn fwy hygrych i ddinasyddion o bob oed, yn ogystal â hyrwyddo darpariaeth addysgol sy'n fwy addas i anghenion economi Cymru.

Mae 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol' yn gwneud 60 argymhelliad manwl am sut i wella'r gwasanaeth, a soniaf am rai themâu. Y gyntaf yw arweinyddiaeth. Mae'n hanfodol bod gennym rôl gref a chanolog i'r gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd o ran datblygu perthnasoedd drwy'r teulu gyrfaoedd i gyd. Mae Dr Edwards yn cydnabod bod angen dull mwy cydynol o ymdrin â'r agenda gyrfaoedd yn y Cynulliad; mae angen inni uno gwahanol rannau'r gwasanaeth yn well. Mae angen hefyd i'r teulu gyrfaoedd ddechrau dangos wyneb mwy pendant, efallai drwy ddefnyddio fforwm gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd fel catalydd i'n symud tuag at y cynllun gorau. Efallai fod tua 5,000 o bobl yng ngweithlu'r teulu gyrfaoedd â swyddi sydd, o leiaf yn rhannol, yn golygu rhoi rhywfaint o wybodaeth am yrfaedd.

Mae Gyrfa Cymru a'r Uned Gwasanaethau Gyrfaoedd Addysg Uwch yn cyflogi cynghorwyr gyrfaoedd llawn-amser, ond cânt eu hategu gan nifer o sefydliadau eraill, ac mae pob un o'r sefydliadau hyn wedi datblygu yn ei ffordd ei hun. Mae angen inni sicrhau eu bod yn symud gyda'i gilydd yn y dyfodol, a bod gennym systemau sicrhau ansawdd cyffredin wedi'u hatgyfnerthu, er enghraifft, drwy fabwysiadu brand cenedlaethol. Felly, mae angen inni ddod â gwahanol elfennau'r teulu gyrfaoedd at ei

gilydd mewn fforwm gyrfaoedd.

With regard to schools, 'Future Ambitions' identifies the important role that schools have in helping young people to form their career planning skills, and it recognises that our record in developing policy in this area compares well internationally. It also identifies that there are areas of delivery that are not well understood. Dr Edwards reports that he is unable to come to an informed judgment on the success or failure of schools in their delivery of careers education because of a lack of evidence. However, he does report that there is a strong anecdotal consensus that not all schools take their responsibility to prepare young people for a future in the workforce as seriously as they might. There is insufficient training and little reward for taking on the role of a careers teacher, and work experience is another area where we have challenges. There are also suspicions that, in some schools, immediate examination results are more important than the future employability prospects of students. Subject choice can be determined by the need to fill the existing subject offer, regardless of whether the subjects taught are meaningful in terms of future job prospects. Therefore, there are challenges and shortcomings that we need to overcome.

I accept the recommendation that Estyn should undertake a thematic inspection of the delivery of the careers and the world of work framework. That will help us in developing future policy and in understanding better what is currently happening. It will also enable us to develop sustainable reporting and accountability frameworks.

I would like to see higher education institutions develop more detailed destination data about their graduates, in order to demonstrate the real return on investment that different degree courses deliver. We need to work harder at employer engagement, breaking down barriers between schools and employers in developing work-focused experience. That means that we need to look at the resources that are available to employers in investing in young people's time.

Mewn perthynas ag ysgolion, mae 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol' yn nodi'r rôl bwysig sydd gan ysgolion o ran helpu pobl ifanc i ffurfio eu sgiliau cynllunio gyrfa, ac mae'n cydnabod bod ein hanes o ddatblygu polisi yn y maes hwn yn cymharu'n dda'n rhyngwladol. Mae hefyd yn nodi nad oes dealltwriaeth dda o rai meysydd cyflenwi. Mae Dr Edwards yn nodi na all ffurfio dyfarniad deallus am lwyddiant neu fethiant ysgolion i gyflenwi addysg gyrfaoedd oherwydd diffyg tystiolaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n nodi y ceir consensws anecdotaidd cryf nad yw pob ysgol yn cymryd ei chyfrifoldeb i baratoi pobl ifanc am ddyfodol yn y gweithlu mor ddifrifol ag y gallent. Nid oes digon o hyfforddiant na llawer o wobwr am gymryd rôl athro gyrfaoedd, ac mae profiad gwaith yn faes arall lle'r ydym yn wynebu heriau. Ceir amheuaeth hefyd, mewn rhai ysgolion, fod canlyniadau arholiadau tymor byr yn bwysicach na rhagolygon cyflogadwyedd myfyrwyr yn y dyfodol. Gall dewis pynciau gael ei bennu gan yr angen i lenwi'r cynnig pwnc sy'n bodoli, heb ystyried a yw'r pynciau a addysgir yn ystyrion o ran rhagolygon swyddi yn y dyfodol. Felly, mae angen inni oresgyn rhai heriau a diffygion.

Derbyniaf yr argymhelliad y dylai Estyn gynnal arolygiad thematig o gyflenwi'r fframwaith gyrfaoedd a byd gwaith. Bydd hynny'n ein helpu i ddatblygu polisi'r dyfodol ac i gael gwell dealltwriaeth o'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Bydd hefyd yn ein galluogi i ddatblygu fframweithiau cynaliadwy ar gyfer adroddiadau ac atebolrwydd.

Hoffwn weld sefydliadau addysg uwch yn datblygu data cyrchfan manylach am eu graddedigion, er mwyn dangos yr enillion gwirioneddol ar fuddsoddiad a gyflenwir gan wahanol gyrsiau gradd. Mae angen inni weithio'n galetach wrth ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr, gan ddymchwel rhwystrau rhwng ysgolion a chyflogwyr i ddatblygu profiad sy'n canolbwyntio ar waith. Mae hynny'n golygu bod angen inni edrych ar yr adnoddau sydd ar gael i gyflogwyr wrth fuddsoddi yn amser pobl ifanc.

Organisationally, it makes sense to bring together the efforts of the different organisations in relation to employer engagement. We will therefore encourage Careers Wales, the employer engagement teams of schools, further education colleges and higher education institutions, and interested parties from the private and voluntary sectors, to liaise more closely to make employer visits better targeted and to try to reduce duplication.

We need better, up-to-date information on learning availability and how that links to pathways into particular occupations. Therefore, as I have said, we need to transform the labour market information that is available.

3.50 p.m.

We also need to reinforce the need for employability skills. The messages about soft skills—communication, number, team-working and problem solving skills—are well known, but we need to be certain that they are being delivered properly. We spend tens of millions of pounds on basic skills remedial work and preparation for work—the SkillBuild programme and the Youth Gateway—as part of our response to the youth unemployment agenda and in seeking to combat the numbers of young people not in education, employment or training. We also hear repeatedly from employers about the lack of employment-ready graduates. There are, therefore, challenges ahead. Employability skills are an all-age, all-ability issue.

Not all service users require the same amount of support, so we need a differentiated service—that is, a service that is sensitively tailored to the needs of the individual once their needs have been identified. Therefore, we need to ensure that we have a bespoke, client-centred service.

We need to maximise the current investment across all sectors. That means having clarity about roles and responsibilities, smart investment strategies and directing the most skilled practitioners to meet the needs of those most in need of professional support. It

Yn sefydliadol, mae'n gwneud synnwyr dod ag ymdrechion y gwahanol sefydliadau at ei gilydd at ddiben ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr. Felly, byddwn yn annog Gyrfa Cymru, timau ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr mewn ysgolion, colegau addysg bellach a sefydliadau addysg uwch, a phartïon â diddordeb o'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol, i gysylltu'n agosach â'i gilydd i sicrhau bod ymweliadau cyflogwyr wedi'u targedu'n well ac i geisio lleihau dyblygu.

Mae arnom angen gwybodaeth well a chyfredol am argaeledd dysgu a'r cysylltiad rhwng hynny â llwybrau i alwedigaethau penodol. Felly, fel yr wyf wedi dweud, mae angen inni drawsnewid y wybodaeth sydd ar gael am y farchnad lafur.

Mae angen inni hefyd atgyfnerthu'r angen am sgiliau cyflogadwyedd. Mae'r negeseuon am sgiliau meddal—cyfathrebu, rhif, gweithio mewn tîm a sgiliau datrys problemau—yn glir, ond mae angen inni fod yn sicr eu bod yn cael eu cyflenwi'n briodol. Yr ydym yn gwario degau o filiynau o bunnoedd ar waith adferol sgiliau sylfaenol a pharatoi am waith—y rhaglen Adeiladu Sgiliau a'r Porth Ieuencid—fel rhan o'n hymateb i'r agenda diweithdra ieuencid ac wrth geisio gostwng niferoedd y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Yr ydym hefyd yn clywed yn aml gan gyflogwyr am y diffyg graddedigion sy'n barod am gyflogaeth. Felly, mae heriau o'n blaen. Mae sgiliau cyflogadwyedd yn fater sy'n berthnasol i bob oed a phob gallu.

Nid oes angen yr un faint o gymorth ar bob defnyddiwr gwasanaeth, felly mae angen gwasanaeth gwahaniaethol arnom—hynny yw, gwasanaeth sydd wedi'i deilwra'n sensitif i anghenion yr unigolyn wedi i'r anghenion hynny gael eu canfod. Felly, mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym wasanaeth pwrpasol sy'n canolbwyntio ar y cleient.

Mae angen inni wneud y mwyaf o'r buddsoddiad presennol ar draws pob sector. Mae hynny'n golygu bod yn glir am rolau a chyfrifoldebau, strategaethau buddsoddi deallus a chyfeirio'r ymarferwyr mwyaf sgilgar i ddiwallu anghenion y rheini â'r

means twenty-first century solutions such as the development of Careers Wales online.

In his report, Dr Edwards also provided some clear pointers on the issues that we need to address and the priority groups to which we need to pay the most attention. However, his report is not a costed programme. It provides us with a direction of travel for the medium to longer term. Over the coming years, we will need to balance investment in areas such as youth unemployment with forthcoming demands. It is clear that there will be increased demand for Team Wales support for public sector workers losing their jobs. Careers guidance services are involved heavily in these areas, but resources are finite and demand is not easy to forecast. We need, of course, to maintain front-line delivery as far as resources can permit, but there is no doubt that we will have hard decisions to make. Planning in the immediate term is also affected by the uncertainties surrounding the policy direction of the Department for Work and Pensions work programme and the impact that that may have on our own services.

In January, we announced that Careers Wales would move to a unitary structure, and that has been endorsed by Dr Edwards in the report. The change outlined in 'Future Ambitions' recognises that we need to take the service forward. There needs to be a single organisation that can speak for the sector; the present fragmented company system does not. There needs to be an organisation where there is no suspicion of duplication in terms of costs and there is a real focus on putting resources to the front line. A unitary Careers Wales will provide the critical mass around which the wider careers family and careers service may grow to work and develop its own solutions.

Therefore, there are a number of challenges ahead of us as a result of this report. We now need to focus on getting the remit of the new organisation right, and defining that remit will be the next critical stage of our work on the careers service in Wales. Form should

angen mwyaf am gymorth proffesiynol. Mae'n golygu datrysiadau i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain megis datblygu Gyrfa Cymru ar-lein.

Yn ei adroddiad, rhoddodd Dr Edwards hefyd rai pwyntiau clir am y materion y mae angen inni eu hunioni a'r grwpiau blaenoriaeth y mae angen inni roi'r sylw mwyaf iddynt. Fodd bynnag, nid rhaglen wedi'i chostio yw ei adroddiad. Mae'n rhoi cyfeiriad teithio inni ar gyfer y tymor canolig a hirach. Dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, bydd angen inni gydbwysu buddsoddi mewn meysydd megis diweithdra ieuencid â gofynion y dyfodol. Mae'n amlwg y ceir mwy o alw am gymorth Tîm Cymru i weithwyr sector cyhoeddus sy'n colli eu swyddi. Mae gwasanaethau cyfarwyddyd gyrfaedd yn chwarae rhan fawr yn y meysydd hyn, ond mae'r adnoddau'n gyfyngedig ac nid yw'n hawdd rhagweld y galw. Wrth gwrs, mae angen inni ddal i gyflenwi cymaint â phosibl ar y rheng flaen o fewn ein hadnoddau, ond nid oes amheuaeth y bydd rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau anodd. Mae ansicrwydd ynghylch cyfeiriad polisi rhaglen waith yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, a'r effaith y gallai ei chael ar ein gwasanaethau ni, hefyd yn effeithio ar gynllunio yn y tymor byr iawn.

Ym mis Ionawr, cyhoeddasom y byddai Gyrfa Cymru'n symud at strwythur unedol, ac mae Dr Edwards wedi cymeradwyo hynny yn yr adroddiad. Mae'r newid amlinellir yn 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol' yn cydnabod bod angen inni symud y gwasanaeth yn ei flaen. Mae angen un sefydliad sy'n gallu siarad dros y sector; nid yw'r system bresennol o gwmnïau ar wasgar yn gwneud hynny. Mae angen sefydliad lle nad oes amheuaeth o ddatblygu o ran costau a lle ceir ffocws gwirioneddol ar roi adnoddau i'r rheng flaen. Bydd Gyrfa Cymru unedol yn rhoi màs critigol y gall y teulu gyrfaedd a'r gwasanaeth gyrfaedd ehangach dyfu o'i gwmpas i weithio a datblygu ei ddatrysiadau ei hun.

Felly, mae nifer o heriau o'n blaen o ganlyniad i'r adroddiad hwn. Nawr, mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod cylch gwaith y sefydliad newydd yn briodol, a diffinio'r cylch gwaith hwnnw fydd cam critigol nesaf ein gwaith ar y gwasanaeth

follow function, and that is what my officials are working on now. We believe that we can build on the recommendations of 'Future Ambitions' and can take the development of Careers Wales to a new stage.

Gwelliant 1 Nick Ramsay

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad 'Uchelgeisiau i'r dyfodol' yn llawn mewn ffordd amserol a phriodol.

Paul Davies: I move amendment 1.

I am pleased to be able to take part in this important debate. First, I would like to stress the importance of careers services in Wales for children, young people and adults in obtaining advice and support in finding work. A lot of good work has been done by organisations such as Careers Wales. It is crucial that people receive the highest possible standard of careers advice. 'Future Ambitions: developing careers services in Wales' has issued a set of clear recommendations and I am pleased that the Minister has, for the most part, accepted them.

One particular issue of importance that is highlighted within the report is careers services for adults, and I note that the Minister has accepted either fully or in principle all of the report's recommendations in this regard. With regard to recommendation 40, I hope that the Minister will agree that universities, with particular reference to Go Wales, should be actively involved in the revitalised education and business partnerships network. I also hope that the Minister will agree that the introduction of joint external inspection of individual higher education careers advisory services in Wales by the Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education and Estyn would underpin the development of consistent quality standards across all of our higher education institutions in Wales. It is pleasing to note that, earlier this year, as part of Careers Wales' main contract

gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru. Dylai'r ffurf ddilyn y swyddogaeth, ac mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio ar hynny nawr. Credwn y gallwn adeiladu ar argymhellion 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol' a mynd â datblygiad Gyrfa Cymru i gam newydd.

Amendment 1 Nick Ramsay

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to fully implement the recommendations of the Future Ambitions report in a timely and appropriate manner.

Paul Davies: Cynigiau gwelliant 1.

Yr wyf yn falch o allu cymryd rhan yn y ddadl bwysig hon. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn bwysleisio pwysigrwydd gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru i blant, pobl ifanc ac oedolion o ran cael cyngor a chymorth i ganfod gwaith. Mae sefydliadau megis Gyrfa Cymru wedi gwneud llawer o waith da. Mae'n hollbwysig bod pobl yn cael cyngor gyrfaoedd o'r safon uchaf bosibl. Mae 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol: datblygu gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru' wedi cyhoeddi set o argymhellion clir ac yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn y rhan fwyaf ohonynt.

Un mater o bwysigrwydd arbennig sy'n cael sylw yn yr adroddiad yw gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd i oedolion, a nodaf fod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn argymhellion yr adroddiad yn hyn o beth, naill ai'n llawn neu mewn egwyddor. O ran argymhelliad 40, gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno y dylai prifysgolion, gan gyfeirio'n benodol at Go Wales, gymryd rhan weithgar yn y rhwydwaith o bartneriaethau busnes ac addysg sydd ar newydd wedd. Gobeithiaf hefyd y gwnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno y byddai cyflwyno arolygu allanol ar y cyd i wasanaethau cynghori gyrfaoedd addysg uwch unigol yng Nghymru gan yr Asiantaeth Sicrhau Ansawdd ar gyfer Addysg Uwch ac Estyn yn tanategu datblygu safonau ansawdd cyson ar draws pob sefydliad addysg uwch sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Braf oedd nodi'n gynharach eleni, fel rhan o brif gyraeddiadau contract Gyrfa Cymru, fod

achievements, the number of adults interviewed over the year had increased. However, this report also highlighted the fact that, generally, few adults in Wales use the Careers Wales service at any point in their lives. Given that that is the case, perhaps the Minister could outline in his response what promotional activity has been taking place to encourage adults to use Careers Wales and update us on the impact of such promotional activity. I am sure that we all appreciate the difficult financial circumstances that organisations such as Careers Wales face. However, it is more important than ever that strategic and operational careers services are available to the public.

Another key issue that needs to be addressed is the provisions and services available to those who are not in employment, education or training. As a member of the Enterprise and Learning Committee, I have been witness to a number of evidence sessions that looked indirectly at careers services in Wales as part of an inquiry into young people not in education, employment or training over the past year. The committee's report, published last month, concluded that a lack of direction and joint working is resulting in overlapping and uncoordinated services. It was recommended that Careers Wales should manage a national register of young people not in education, employment or training that is consistent and comprehensive, along with a database to match job vacancies with unemployed young people. In light of the committee's report, I would be interested to see what stance the Welsh Assembly Government has taken in response to this recommendation and what sort of monitoring work it will be looking to implement for Careers Wales with regard to this. 'Future Ambitions' has also considered priority groups such as those who are not in education, employment or training and has recommended that, following the reorganisation of Careers Wales into a unitary structure, a national tracking and data management system should be put in place for those not in education, employment or training, as this could build on the annual destination survey, which provides an idea of the percentage of young people who are not

nifer yr oedolion a gyfwelwyd dros y flwyddyn wedi cynyddu. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr adroddiad hwn hefyd yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith mai, yn gyffredinol, ychydig iawn o oedolion yng Nghymru sy'n defnyddio gwasanaeth Gyrfa Cymru unrhyw bryd yn eu bywydau. Ac ystyried y ffaith hon, efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog amlinellu yn ei ateb pa weithgarwch hyrwyddo sydd wedi bod yn digwydd i annog oedolion i ddefnyddio Gyrfa Cymru a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am effaith gweithgarwch hyrwyddo o'r fath. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn gwerthfawrogi'r amodau ariannol anodd y mae Gyrfa Cymru'n eu hwynebu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysicach nag erioed bod gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd strategol a gweithredol ar gael i'r cyhoedd.

Mater allweddol arall ag angen sylw yw'r darpariaethau a'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i bobl nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na hyfforddiant. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, yr wyf wedi bod yn dyst i nifer o sesiynau tystiolaeth yn edrych yn anuniongyrchol ar wasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru fel rhan o ymchwiliad i bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Casgliad adroddiad y pwyllgor, a gyhoeddwyd y mis diwethaf, oedd bod diffyg cyfeiriad a chydweithio'n arwain at orgyffwrdd a gwasanaethau nad ydynt yn gydgyssylltiedig. Argymhellwyd y dylai Gyrfa Cymru reoli cofrestr genedlaethol gyson a chynhwysfawr o bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant, ynghyd â chronfa ddata i baru swyddi gwag â phobl ifanc ddi-waith. Yng ngoleuni adroddiad y pwyllgor, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn gweld beth yw safbwynt Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel ymateb i'r argymhelliad hwn a pha fath o waith monitro y bydd yn gobeithio ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer Gyrfa Cymru yn hyn o beth. Mae 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol' hefyd wedi ystyried grwpiau blaenoriaeth megis pobl nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant ac wedi argymhell y dylid, ar ôl aildrefnu Gyrfa Cymru i strwythur unedol, rhoi system genedlaethol o dracio a rheoli data ar waith ar gyfer pobl nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant, gan y gallai hon adeiladu ar yr arolwg cyrchfan blyneddol, sy'n rhoi syniad o ganran y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn

in education, employment or training after leaving full-time education. I acknowledge that the recommendations in 'Future Ambitions' reflect the Assembly committee's recommendations, but I still have some concerns over the loss of regional structures. The Assembly committee's recommendation aimed to match unemployed people with jobs, whereas the report only wishes to provide a destination map, which could be seen as less effective and weaker.

We also need to focus on the importance of skills training with regard to our careers service if we want our country to be competitive in the future. As the Minister said, the development of skills not only leads to more competitive businesses and jobs, but enriches people's lifestyles and cultural experiences. 'Future Ambitions' notes that skills sector councils should develop models of suitable work-focused experiences to support vocational learning pathways in their respective sectors from school through to pre-employment. While I am pleased that you have accepted this recommendation, Minister, perhaps you would be kind enough to tell us how you plan to ensure that the development of pathways from schools through to pre-employment can be progressed through the sector qualification strategies and that these will be in line with the 14-19 learning pathways.

Careers organisations such as Careers Wales work hard to help to provide support and advice with regard to finding work and developing skills for many people across the country. I look forward to hearing how careers services will develop in the future and listening to how they can help to make Wales and its workforce more competitive.

Gwelliant 2 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn credu bod yn rhaid rhoi cyngor gyrfa heb ragfarn ac er budd y myfyrwr.

Gwelliant 3 Peter Black

addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant ar ôl gadael addysg lawn-amser. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod yr argymhellion yn 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol' yn adlewyrchu argymhellion pwyllgor y Cynulliad, ond mae gennyf rai pryderon o hyd ynghylch colli strwythurau rhanbarthol. Nod argymhelliad pwyllgor y Cynulliad oedd paru pobl ddi-waith â swyddi, ond yr unig beth y mae'r adroddiad yn dymuno ei wneud yw rhoi map cyrchfan; gellid ystyried bod hynny'n llai effeithiol ac yn wannach.

Mae angen inni hefyd ganolbwyntio ar bwysigrwydd hyfforddiant sgiliau mewn perthynas â'n gwasanaeth gyrfaedd os ydym am i'n gwlad fod yn gystadleuol yn y dyfodol. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, yn ogystal â chreu busnesau a swyddi mwy cystadleuol, mae datblygu sgiliau'n cyfoethogi bywydau a phrofiadau diwylliannol pobl. Mae 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol' yn nodi y dylai cynghorau sector sgiliau ddatblygu modelau o brofiadau addas sy'n canolbwyntio ar waith i gefnogi llwybrau dysgu galwedigaethol yn y sectorau perthnasol o'r ysgol hyd at gyfnod cyn cyflogaeth. Er fy mod yn falch eich bod wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn, Weinidog, a fydddechystal â dweud wrthym sut yr ydych yn bwriadu sicrhau y gellir defnyddio strategaethau cymwysterau'r sector i ddatblygu llwybrau o ysgolion hyd at gyfnod cyn cyflogaeth, ac y bydd hyn yn cyd-fynd â'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19?

Mae sefydliadau gyrfaedd megis Gyrfya Cymru'n gweithio'n galed i helpu i ddarparu cymorth a chynghor i ganfod gwaith a datblygu sgiliau i lawer o bobl ledled y wlad. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed sut y bydd gwasanaethau gyrfaedd yn datblygu yn y dyfodol ac at wrando ar sut y gallant helpu i wneud Cymru a'i gweithlu'n fwy cystadleuol.

Amendment 2 Peter Black

Add as new point at end of motion:

Believes that careers advice must be given without bias and for the good of the student.

Amendment 3 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn credu y dylid integreiddio entrepreneuriaeth gymdeithasol i'r cyngor gyrfa a roddir gan y corff gyrfaedd newydd.

Jenny Randerson: I move amendments 2 and 3.

I am pleased to have the opportunity to take part in this debate, because the careers service in Wales has cropped up repeatedly in the inquiries that the Enterprise and Learning Committee has undertaken. It is often referred to tangentially, but it has been the subject of steady criticism in various respects in each of these inquiries that we have undertaken. Ensuring that we get the careers service right is the key.

4.00 p.m.

Therefore, the Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendments include a reference to the need for unbiased advice for students. The fact that schools are unable to provide unbiased advice has been referred to in committee on numerous occasions. There must be a key role for formal careers advice that ensures that our young people get the advice on their futures that they deserve, so that they are set on the path that is right for them, that they are comfortable with, and that supports their ambitions. That must happen while they are in school, rather than their having to go back and take different subjects in later life and build up careers, having discovered that they made the wrong choice the first time around. You cannot iron out all the mistakes. People change over time and learn from the decisions that they make, but I am absolutely sure that some of the problems that we have with the low uptake of STEM subjects would not exist if we had had the sort of thorough and unbiased advice that our young people deserve.

Our amendments also include reference to the importance of social entrepreneurship. We had evidence in committee that this is a part of the economy that is hardly raised with young people at an early age. The Assembly Government has an ambition to promote

Add as new point at end of motion:

Believes that social entrepreneurship should be integrated into careers advice given by the new careers body.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiau gwelliannau 2 a 3.

Mae'n bleser cael y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon, oherwydd mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaedd yng Nghymru wedi codi'n aml yn ymholiadau'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu. Cyffyrddir arno'n aml, ond mae wedi cael ei feirniadu'n gyson am wahanol resymau ym mhob un o'r ymchwiliadau yr ydym wedi eu cynnal. Mae'n allweddol ein bod yn sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth gyrfaedd yn ddigonol.

Felly, mae gwelliannau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cyfeirio at yr angen am yngor diduedd i fyfyrwyr. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi cyfeirio sawl gwaith at y ffaith na all ysgolion roi yngor diduedd. Rhaid rhoi rôl allweddol i gynghori ffurfiol am yrfaedd i sicrhau bod ein pobl ifanc yn cael y cyngor am eu dyfodol y maent yn ei haeddu, fel y cânt eu gosod ar y llwybr sy'n iawn iddynt, y maent yn gyfforddus ag ef, ac sy'n cefnogi eu huchelgeisiau. Rhaid i hynny ddigwydd tra y maent yn yr ysgol, yn hytrach na'u bod yn gorfod mynd yn ôl ac astudio pynciau gwahanol yn ddiweddarach yn eu bywydau ac adeiladu gyrfaedd ar ôl canfod eu bod wedi gwneud y dewis anghywir y tro cyntaf. Ni allwch gael gwared â'r camgymeriadau i gyd. Mae pobl yn newid dros amser ac yn dysgu o'u camgymeriadau, ond yr wyf yn gwbl siŵr na fyddai rhai o'r problemau sydd gennym gyda'r niferoedd isel sy'n astudio pynciau STEM yn bodoli pe bai gennym y math o yngor trwyadl a diduedd y mae ein pobl ifanc yn ei haeddu.

Mae ein gwelliannau hefyd yn cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd entrepreneuriaeth gymdeithasol. Cawsom dystiolaeth yn y pwyllgor nad yw'r rhan hon o'r economi'n cael llawer o sylw gyda phobl ifanc ar oed cynnar. Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad

social enterprise, and yet we do not underpin that by encouraging people to enter social enterprises at an early age. It is important that the careers service takes that aspect into account. Having read the report, Minister, I notice that you have not accepted a significant number of the recommendations. In fact, it is an unusually large number. It is not usual for Ministers here to take quite such a pick-and-mix approach. Sometimes, Ministers completely ignore reports, which is what you are entitled to do. Very often, Ministers accept or accept in principle practically everything, but there is a significant number of recommendations that you have not accepted. Can you give me a single coherent reason why you have not undertaken to accept those recommendations? There may be a host of different reasons that you do not have time to go into now, but I would be interested in your comments on the report as a whole.

There are a couple of things in the report that I want to emphasise before I finish. First, there is the importance of higher education careers advice. The report comments on the variability in the quality and quantity of advice available at higher education level. I would be interested to know in some more detail from the Minister what approach he feels he can take to improve that situation. Secondly, there is the key issue of good-quality, well structured work experience. Without that, young people do not get the experience at the sharp end that so often makes them decide that something is either for them or not for them. Finally, Minister, I am perfectly content to accept the concept of a unified careers service, but I think that it is important that we maintain that local identity and those local links that ensure that the service is able to respond to local needs, because the needs in rural areas are dramatically different from those in Cardiff, which, in turn, are dramatically different from those in Wrexham and so on. The provision must vary and must be sensitive to the local labour market.

Christine Chapman: I welcome the publication of this report. It gives us a great deal to ponder. At a time of economic downturn, it is important that young people

uchelgais i hyrwyddo menter gymdeithasol, ac eto nid ydym yn tanategu hynny drwy annog pobl i fynd i fentrau cymdeithasol yn ifanc. Mae'n bwysig bod y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yn ystyried yr agwedd honno. O ddarllen yr Adroddiad, Weinidog, sylwaf nad ydych wedi derbyn nifer sylweddol o'r argymhellion. Nifer anarferol o fawr, a dweud y gwir. Nid yw'n arferol i Weinidogion fod mor ddetholus. Weithiau, bydd Gweinidogion yn anwybyddu adroddiadau'n llwyr; mae gennych hawl i wneud hynny. Yn aml iawn, bydd Gweinidogion yn derbyn, neu'n derbyn mewn egwyddor, popeth bron, ond mae nifer sylweddol o argymhellion nad ydych wedi'u derbyn. A allwch roi un rheswm clir imi pam nad ydych wedi derbyn yr argymhellion hyn? Efallai fod llu o resymau gwahanol ac nad oes gennych amser i'w hegluro nawr, ond byddai gennyf ddiddordeb yn eich sylwadau am yr adroddiad yn gyffredinol.

Hoffwn bwysleisio dau beth yn yr adroddiad cyn imi orffen. Yn gyntaf, pwysigrwydd cyngor gyrfaoedd mewn addysg uwch. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi sylwadau am amrywioldeb o ran faint o gyngor sydd ar gael ar lefel addysg uwch, ac am ansawdd y cyngor hwnnw. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb cael gwybod ychydig yn fanylach pa ddulliau y mae'r Gweinidog yn teimlo y gall eu defnyddio i wella'r sefyllfa honno. Yn ail, mater allweddol profiad gwaith o ansawdd a strwythur da. Hebdo, nid yw pobl ifanc yn cael y profiad yn y pen dwfn sydd mor aml yn gwneud iddynt benderfynu bod rhywbeth yn addas neu'n anaddas iddynt. Yn olaf, Weinidog, yr wyf yn gwbl fodlon i dderbyn cysyniad gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd unedig, ond credaf ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn cadw'r hunaniaeth leol honno a'r cysylltiadau lleol hynny sy'n sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth yn gallu ymateb i anghenion lleol, oherwydd mae'r anghenion mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn gwbl wahanol i'r anghenion yng Nghaerdydd, sydd, yn eu tro, yn gwbl wahanol i'r anghenion yn Wrecsam ac yn y blaen. Rhaid i'r ddarpariaeth amrywio a bod yn sensitif i'r farchnad lafur leol.

Christine Chapman: Croesawaf gyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'n rhoi llawer inni ei ystyried. Yn ystod dirywiad economaidd, mae'n bwysig bod pobl ifanc a phobl hŷn yn

and older people get the careers advice to best equip them for the future. It is important for good careers advice to be available even in the good times, as we know that people change careers quite often during their lifetime. Therefore, it is important that it is accessible.

The report comes at a crucial time, with the implementation of the learning pathways, which gives us an opportunity to integrate careers advice into the wider educational process. I have taken a great interest in that over the years, as I formerly worked within the careers service. We must recognise the valuable work that the careers service does in helping young people, particularly, to choose their future paths. We must also recognise that Careers Wales is universally acknowledged as a good model. It has been free at the point of delivery, it is available to people of all ages, and it is bilingual.

The publication of this document gives us an opportunity to make improvements within the service. I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's proposal to create a unified structure for Careers Wales. We know that one model does not always fit all, but it is about good practice and quality if we are to ensure the best start for learners and excellence within the service all around the country. I also welcome the Government's acceptance of the report's recommendations that more must be done to promote industry and business links within the careers service, and to look at the role of enterprise business partnerships. I have also had quite a lot of involvement previously within education business partnerships as well. It is vital that there is a close working relationship between education and industry, which would be of great value to learners. The essence of this is about raising aspirations and broadening young people's horizons. It is very much a social justice issue.

Jenny has already mentioned the importance of STEM subjects, but I want to say something about the role of STEM subjects and the consideration of women, because the Enterprise and Learning Committee here has been looking at that. We know that there has been some good work in this area and that

cael y cyngor gyrfaoedd i'w harfogi gystal â phosibl ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n bwysig bod cyngor gyrfaoedd da ar gael hyd yn oed pan mae pethau'n dda, oherwydd gwyddom fod pobl yn newid yn newid gyrfaoedd yn eithaf aml yn ystod eu hoes. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod hyn yn hygyrch.

Mae'r adroddiad yn dod ar adeg hollbwysig, gyda gweithredu'r llwybrau dysgu, sy'n rhoi cyfle inni i integreiddio cyngor gyrfaoedd yn y broses addysgol ehangach. Yr wyf wedi dangos diddordeb mawr yn y broses honno dros y blynyddoedd; yr oeddwn yn arfer gweithio yn y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd. Rhaid inni gydnabod y gwaith gwerthfawr y mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yn ei wneud o ran helpu pobl ifanc, yn enwedig, i ddewis llwybrau eu dyfodol. Rhaid inni hefyd sylwi y cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fod Gyrfa Cymru'n fodel da. Mae wedi bod yn ddi-dâl ar y pwynt cyflenwi, mae ar gael i bobl o bob oed, ac mae'n ddwyieithog.

Mae cyhoeddi'r ddogfen hon yn rhoi cyfle inni i wneud gwelliannau o fewn y gwasanaeth. Croesawaf gynig Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i greu strwythur unedig ar gyfer Gyrfa Cymru. Gwyddom nad yw un model yn addas i bawb bob amser, ond mater o arfer da ac ansawdd fydd sicrhau'r dechrau gorau i ddysgwyr a rhagoriaeth o fewn y gwasanaeth ledled y wlad. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn derbyn argymhellion yr adroddiad bod rhaid gwneud mwy i hyrwyddo cysylltiadau busnes a diwydiant o fewn y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd, ac i edrych ar rôl partneriaethau menter a busnes. Yr wyf hefyd wedi ymwneud llawer yn y gorffennol â phartneriaethau addysg a busnes hefyd. Mae'n hanfodol cael perthynas waith agos rhwng addysg a diwydiant; byddai hynny'n werthfawr iawn i ddysgwyr. Hanfod hyn yw codi dyheadau ac ehangu gorchwylion pobl ifanc. Mae'n wirioneddol yn fater o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Mae Jenny eisoes wedi crybwyll pwysigrwydd pynciau STEM, ond hoffwn ddweud rhywbeth am rôl pynciau STEM ac ystyried menywod, oherwydd mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yma wedi bod yn edrych ar hynny. Gwyddom fod rhywfaint o waith da wedi'i wneud yn y maes hwn a bod

Careers Wales plays an important role by offering pupils the chance to experience real-life STEM activities through partnership working within the engineering, design and construction sectors, thereby enriching curriculum provision. Careers Wales has been involved in the development of Discover! Saturday clubs for girls, aimed at promoting STEM pathways through young female audiences and a wider public, including parents and peers. However, from the evidence that the committee has taken in its inquiry, we see that, although the statistics are better and things are improving, very few women enter such a career. In other words, we are wasting the talent of probably half our population. We must look very seriously at that. Things are improving, but we need to do much more.

I support Peter Black's amendment 2, which is to do with making sure that careers advice is given without bias and for the good of the student. We need to be careful of that. As a previous member of the Institute of Career Guidance, I know that it is happening, and that there is a code of ethics that ensures that careers advisers must have the interests of the client at heart. The amendment fits in well with that and, therefore, I support it, although we would support it as a party anyway. I look forward to seeing the developments relating to this report, and to responding to the challenges.

Mark Isherwood: In response to a written question a couple of months ago, the Minister wrote to me confirming that the report, 'Future Ambitions: developing careers services in Wales', would include recommendations that had the potential to impact across much of the lifelong learning system in Wales and beyond. Shortly after that, I stated in the Chamber that

'Careers Wales currently has the contract with the Welsh Government to support young people, among others, through the youth gateway programme, focusing on hard outcomes like employment, training or further education. These are not-for-profit social enterprises, publicly funded companies, and there are six of them across

Gyrfa Cymru'n chwarae rhan bwysig drwy gynnig cyfle i ddisgyblion brofi gweithgareddau STEM bywyd go iawn drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r sectorau peirianeg, dylunio ac adeiladu, gan gyfoethogi darpariaeth y cwricwlwm. Mae Gyrfa Cymru wedi ymwneud â datblygu clybiau dydd Sadwrn Discover! i ferched, gyda'r nod o hyrwyddo llwybrau STEM drwy gynulleidfaoedd benywaidd ifanc a'r cyhoedd yn fwy cyffredinol, gan gynnwys rhieni a chyfoedion. Fodd bynnag, o'r dystiolaeth y mae'r pwyllgor wedi'i chymryd yn ei ymchwiliad, gwelwn, er bod yr ystadegau'n well a bod pethau'n gwella, mai ychydig iawn o fenywod sy'n dechrau ar yrfa o'r fath. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae'n debyg ein bod yn gwastraffu talent hanner ein poblogaeth. Rhaid inni edrych yn ddifrifol iawn ar hynny. Mae pethau'n gwella, ond mae angen inni wneud llawer mwy.

Cefnogaf welliant 2 Peter Black, sy'n ymwneud â sicrhau bod cyngor gyrfaedd yn cael ei roi heb duedd ac er budd i'r myfyrwr. Mae angen inni fod yn ofalus o hynny. Fel cyn-aelod o'r Sefydliad Cyfarwyddyd Gyrfa, gwn fod hyn yn digwydd, a gwn fod cod moeseg yn bodoli sy'n sicrhau bod rhaid i gynghorwyr gyrfaedd ganolbwyntio ar fudd y cleient. Mae'r gwelliant yn cyd-fynd yn dda â hynny, felly, yr wyf yn ei gefnogi, er y byddem yn ei gefnogi fel plaid beth bynnag. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y datblygiadau mewn perthynas â'r adroddiad hwn, ac at ateb yr heriau.

Mark Isherwood: Mewn ymateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig gwpl o fisoedd yn ôl, ysgrifennodd y Gweinidog ataf i gadarnhau y byddai'r adroddiad, 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol: datblygu gwasanaethau gyrfaedd yng Nghymru', yn cynnwys argymhellion â photensial i effeithio ar lawer o'r system dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru a thu hwnt. Yn fuan wedi hynny, dywedais yn y Siambr

Ar hyn o bryd, mae gan Gyrfa Cymru'r contract gyda Llywodraeth Cymru i gefnogi pobl ifanc, ymysg eraill, drwy'r rhaglen porth ieuenctid, gan ganolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau caled megis cyflogaeth, hyfforddiant neu addysg bellach. Mentrau cymdeithasol di-elw yw'r rhain, cwmnïau a ariennir yn gyhoeddus, ac mae chwech ohonynt ledled

Wales, employing about 1,000 staff. They are understandably concerned about their own futures because of the delays. It is also a concern that they are currently on annual contracts, which does not allow sufficient time for sustainable project planning and delivery. They recognise that there is a need to maintain a regional network, including north-east and north-west Wales, and worry that if the work was to go out to tender in future, smaller, indigenous social enterprises could lose out to big companies, including some that are based in England.'

Cymru sy'n cyflogi tua 1,000 o staff. Mae'n ddealladwy eu bod yn pryderu am eu dyfodol eu hunain oherwydd yr oediadau. Mae'n bryder hefyd eu bod ar gontractau blynyddol ar hyn o bryd; nid yw hynny'n rhoi digon o amser i gynllunio a chyflenwi prosiectau'n gynaliadwy. Maent yn cydnabod bod angen cynnal rhwydwaith rhanbarthol, gan gynnwys y gogledd-ddwyrain a'r gogledd-orllewin, ac yn pryderu y gallai cynnig y gwaith drwy dendr yn y dyfodol achosi i fentrau cymdeithasol bach brodorol golli'r gwaith i gwmnïau mawr, gan gynnwys rhai wedi'u lleoli yn Lloegr.

4.10 p.m.

I therefore welcomed confirmation in the Minister's statement last week on the publication of 'Future Ambitions: developing careers services in Wales', that essential components would include a unified Careers Wales. We now need to know whether the negative impact of annual contracts on project planning and delivery will be addressed.

Felly, croesawais gadarnhad yn natganiad y Gweinidog yr wythnos diwethaf pan gyhoeddwyd 'Uchelgeisiau i'r Dyfodol: datblygu gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru', y byddai cydrannau hanfodol yn cynnwys Gyrfya Cymru unedig. Nawr, mae angen inni wybod a roddir sylw i effaith negyddol contractau blynyddol ar gynllunio a chyflenwi prosiectau.

Recommendation 33 in the report, regarding Careers Wales, stated that it should be given a leadership role in devising and co-ordinating local partnership strategies to reduce the number of young people who are not in education, employment or training. Careers Wales is the only organisation whose remit requires it to support all young people aged 16 to 18 through the transition from education to employment, training and further education. It is therefore disappointing that that recommendation has been rejected in the Minister's responses. The formalising of that planning and co-ordinating role for the 16 to 18 age group would enhance current working relationships with partners through the clarification of roles, in addition to providing robust, well co-ordinated and consistently managed local strategies within the national framework, all within the context of the young people's partnerships. As we heard earlier, the Minister should take note of the recent report of the Enterprise and Learning Committee regarding young people not in education, employment or training at a time of record youth unemployment.

Yr oedd argymhelliad 33 yr adroddiad, sy'n ymwneud â Gyrfya Cymru, yn datgan y dylid rhoi rôl arweiniol iddo o ran dyfeisio a chydlynu strategaethau partneriaeth lleol i leihau nifer y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Gyrfya Cymru yw'r unig sefydliad â chylch gwaith sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddo gefnogi'r holl bobl ifanc 16 i 18 oed drwy'r cyfnod pontio rhwng addysg a chyflogaeth, hyfforddiant ac addysg bellach. Felly, mae'n siom bod yr argymhelliad wedi cael ei wrthod yn ymatebion y Gweinidog. Byddai ffurfioli'r rôl cynllunio a chydlynu honno i'r grŵp 16 i 18 yn gwella perthnasoedd gwaith presennol â phartneriaid drwy wneud swyddogaethau'n gliriach, yn ogystal â darparu strategaethau lleol sy'n gadarn, wedi'u cydlynu'n dda ac wedi'u rheoli'n gyson o fewn y fframwaith cenedlaethol, i gyd yng nghyd-destun y partneriaethau pobl ifanc. Fel y clywsom eisoes, dylai'r Gweinidog nodi adroddiad diweddar y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu am bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant ar adeg pan mae diweithdra ieuencid ar ei uchaf erioed.

Recommendations 53 to 55, regarding Careers Wales's organisation and brand, recommend that the unified structure should retain a regional infrastructure capable of relating to local stakeholders, which I recognise. Local government and accountability should be two important features of the new structure. I understand that Careers Wales believes that the report has captured the breadth of its services and the relationships with the wider careers family, and that it recognises the crucial role that careers information, advice and guidance plays in bringing together the demand side of the economy and the supply side, namely people. I further understand that it is keen to work with the Welsh Government to develop a model of excellence that will provide a complementary, consistent and coherent range of services for individuals throughout Wales over the next three to five years, irrespective of the fact that we are entering a period of economic constraint, as we know.

The Welsh Government must therefore recognise not only what it pays Careers Wales to do, but also what Careers Wales does well, working alongside community enterprise schemes, such as the excellent projects undertaken by the registered charity, Caia Park Partnership in Wrexham, which I visited yesterday, and working in real partnership with Jobcentre Plus Wales, and also alongside the welfare-to-work reforms in the UK Government's work programme, which are designed to tackle entrenched poverty and worklessness.

Nerys Evans: Diolch yn fawr am y cyfle i gyfrannu, a diolch i'r Llywodraeth am ddod â'r drafodaeth hon ger ein bron heddiw. Gwyddom oll fod y farchnad lafur yn heriol ar hyn o bryd, ac yn newid ac yn datblygu yn ddyddiol. Mae rôl y gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd, felly, yn un bwysig iawn, o ran y cysylltiad rhwng yr ochr gyflenwi, sef y llafur, a'r galw—y *'supply and demand'* yn y farchnad lafur.

Mae'n bwysig bod y strwythur mwyaf effeithiol posibl ar waith, felly, yn enwedig yn ystod yr amseroedd anodd hyn. Mae llwyth o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad, ac mae sawl Aelod wedi cyfeirio at sawl elfen

Mae argymhellion 53 i 55, sy'n ymwneud â sefydliad a brand Gyrfa Cymru, yn argymhell y dylai'r strwythur unedig gadw seilwaith rhanbarthol sy'n gallu uniaethu â rhanddeiliaid lleol; yr wyf yn cydnabod hyn. Dylai llywodraeth leol ac atebolrwydd fod yn ddwy o nodweddion pwysig y strwythur newydd. Deallaf fod Gyrfa Cymru'n credu bod yr adroddiad wedi llwyddo i gynnwys ei holl wasanaethau a'r perthnasoedd â'r teulu gyrfaoedd ehangach, a'i fod yn cydnabod y rhan hollbwysig y mae gwybodaeth, cyngor a chyfarwyddyd gyrfaoedd yn ei chwarae wrth ddod â galw'r economi ynghyd â'i chyflenwad, sef pobl. Deallaf hefyd eu bod yn awyddus i gydweithio â Llywodraeth Cymru i ddatblygu model o ragoriaeth a fydd yn darparu ystod gyflenwol, gyson a chydlynol o wasanaethau i unigolion ledled Cymru dros y tair i bum mlynedd nesaf, heb ystyried y ffaith ein bod yn dechrau cyfnod o gyfyngiad economaidd, fel y gwyddom.

Felly, rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru gydnabod beth mae'n talu Gyrfa Cymru i'w wneud, ond hefyd beth mae Gyrfa Cymru'n ei wneud yn dda, sef gweithio ochr yn ochr â chynlluniau menter cymunedol, megis y prosiectau rhagorol sy'n cael eu cynnal gan elusen gofrestrdig Partneriaeth Parc Caia yn Wrecsam, yr ymwelais â hi ddoe, a gweithio mewn partneriaeth wirioneddol â Chanolfan Byd Gwaith Cymru, a hefyd ochr yn ochr â'r diwygiadau O Fudd-dâl i Waith yn rhaglen waith Llywodraeth y DU, sydd wedi'u cynllunio i fynd i'r afael â thlodi a diweithdra sydd wedi ymwreiddio.

Nerys Evans: Thank you for the opportunity to contribute, and thank you to the Government for bringing this debate before us today. We are all aware that the labour market is challenging at the moment, and it changes and develops on a daily basis. The role of the careers service is therefore an important one, providing a link between the supply side, namely the labour, and the demand in the labour market.

It is important that we have the most effective structure possible in place, therefore, particularly given these difficult times. There is a host of recommendations in the report, and many Members have referred to various

wahanol. Hoffwn sôn am dair elfen yn benodol.

Mae argymhellion yr adroddiad yn ddigon clir. Ceir cryfderau amlwg yn y system bresennol, ond ceir gwahaniaethau sylfaenol yn narpriaeth y gwasanaethau ledled Cymru. Oherwydd hynny, fel y soniodd y Gweinidog ac fel y mae'r cynnig yn sôn, bwriad Llywodraeth Cymru yw sefydlu strwythur uno ar gyfer Gyrfa Cymru. Croesawn y datblygiadau hyn a fydd yn gallu creu'r capasiti ar gyfer arweinyddiaeth glir yn y gwasanaeth a sicrhau cysondeb rhwng gwasanaethau Gyrfa Cymru a darparwyd gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd eraill yng Nghymru.

Mae newid strwythurau yn gallu bod yn heriol. Felly, mae'n bwysig nad yw'r arbenigedd lleol yn cael ei golli wrth i'r strwythur newydd ddatblygu. Fel y soniodd Jenny Randerson, mae'r argymhellion yn nodi'r angen i greu corff Gyrfa Cymru newydd, gan gadw isadeiledd rhanbarthol sy'n gallu gadw'r cyswllt gyda rhanddeiliaid lleol. Mae'r argymhelliad i'w weld yn un synhwyrol, ond tybiaf ei fod yn un anodd ei weithredu wrth i'r strwythur cenedlaethol ddatblygu. Mae sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng anghenion cenedlaethol a lleol yn anodd, ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen i glywed mwy gan y Gweinidog am sut y bydd y cysylltiadau lleol hyn yn parhau o dan y strwythur newydd.

Wrth edrych ar y strwythurau a fydd yn datblygu, mae'n bwysig hefyd fod cynlluniau datblygu proffesiynol addas a phriodol yn cael eu datblygu. Mae'n annerbyniol nad yw'r system bresennol yn gwneud hyn, gyda diffyg amlwg yn y cyrsiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg wedi ei amlinellu yn yr adroddiad.

Cyfeiriodd sawl Aelod at bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na gwaith, ac mae'r adroddiad yn sôn amdanynt fel grŵp blaenoriaeth. Fel y soniwyd, bu'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn edrych i mewn i'r mater hwn yn ei adolygiad diweddar, ac mae cynlluniau di-rif i geisio helpu'r bobl ifanc hyn. Os cofiaf yn iawn, mae dros 100 o gynlluniau yn Abertawe yn unig i geisio helpu pobl i mewn i addysg, hyfforddiant neu'r byd gwaith. Yr wyf yn deall y

elements. I want to cover three elements specifically.

The recommendations in the report are quite clear. There are obvious strengths in the current system, but there are fundamental differences in the provision of services throughout Wales. As a result of that, as the Minister said and as the motion notes, the aim of the Assembly Government is to establish a unified structure for Careers Wales. We welcome those developments, which will create the capacity for clear leadership in the service and ensure consistency between the services of Careers Wales and those of other careers service providers in Wales.

Implementing structural changes can be challenging. It is therefore important that local expertise is not lost as the new structure develops. As Jenny Randerson mentioned, the recommendations state the need to create a new Careers Wales organisation, while retaining a regional infrastructure that is capable of maintaining contact with local stakeholders. The recommendation appears to be a sensible one, but I suspect that it will be difficult to implement as the national structure develops. Ensuring balance between national and local needs is difficult, and I look forward to hearing more from the Minister on how these local links will continue under the new structure.

In looking at the structures that will develop, it is also important that suitable and appropriate professional development plans are developed. It is unacceptable that the current system is unable to do this, with clear shortcomings in the Welsh-medium courses outlined in the report.

Several Members referred to young people who are not in education, training or work, and the report mentioned them as a priority group. As mentioned, the Enterprise and Learning Committee examined this issue in its recent review, and it found that there are countless schemes trying to help these young people. If I remember correctly, there are over 100 schemes in Swansea alone trying to help people into education, training or employment. I understand the complexities

cymhlethdodau—mae pawb yn wahanol ac felly mae eu hanghenion yn wahanol yn y maes hwn. Fodd bynnag, wrth i'r strwythuro ddatblygu yn fwy strategol, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd gwell trosolwg ar y cynlluniau sy'n bodoli. Mae angen fwy nag erioed sicrhau cymorth pwrpasol, priodol ac amserol i'n pobl ifanc. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweld hwn fel cyfle i edrych ar rywfaint o'r gwaith hwn er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r dyblygu gwaith yn parhau.

Y pwynt olaf yn yr adroddiad yr hoffwn gyfeirio ato yw'r adran ar adolygu'r wladwriaeth les. Mae argymhelliad penodol sy'n sôn am yr angen i ddatblygu capasiti i ddylanwadu ar bolisi o fewn yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn Llywodraeth San Steffan ar lefel swyddogion uwch i sicrhau fod trefniadau ac anghenion Cymru yn cael y sylw neu'r ystyriaeth briodol pan fo penderfyniadau'n cael eu gwneud. Mae'r argymhelliad yn un teilwng ac mae'r pwynt yn un pwysig, yn enwedig wrth ystyried cyflymder y datblygiadau sy'n digwydd ar y lefel Brydeinig. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r argymhelliad mor hawdd â hynny i'w wireddu. Bydd yn ddiddorol clywed yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud yn hynny o beth. Mae'r argymhelliad hefyd yn awgrymu nad yw'r capasiti i ddylanwadu yn ddigonol ym mholisi Llywodraeth Llundain ar hyn o bryd.

Mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd mewn sefyllfa anodd gan ei fod yn cwmpo rhwng dwy stôl. Mae'n amlwg bod penderfyniadau ar lefel Llywodraeth San Steffan yn effeithio'n fawr ar waith bob dydd y gwasanaeth, ond ni allwn adael i gymhlethdodau'r setliad datganoli rwystro'r gwaith pwysig y mae'r gwasanaeth yn ei gyflawni. Mae'r gwaith o gynorthwyo unigolion ar adegau gwahanol yn eu bywydau i wneud penderfyniadau ynghylch addysg, hyfforddiant a'r byd gwaith er mwyn rheoli eu gyrfaoedd yn heriol, yn datblygu'n gyflym ac yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau gweithlu priodol i economi Cymru.

The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews): It has been a useful debate, and I welcome the contributions that have been made by Members.

involved—everyone is different and therefore their needs are different in this area. However, as the structuring develops more strategically, I hope that a better overview of the existing schemes will be gained. We need more than ever to ensure dedicated, appropriate and timely support for our young people. I hope that the Minister sees this as an opportunity to look at some of this work to ensure that the duplication does not continue.

The final point in the report that I wish to refer to is the section on reviewing the welfare state. There is a specific recommendation that talks about the need to develop the capacity to influence policy within the Department for Work and Pensions in the Westminster Government at senior official level to ensure that the arrangements and needs of Wales are given the proper attention or consideration when decisions are taken. The recommendation has merit and the point is important, especially considering the pace of developments taking place at the British level. However, the recommendation is not that easy to fulfil. It will be interesting to hear what the Minister has to say in that regard. The recommendation also suggests that the capacity to influence London Government policy is currently inadequate.

The careers service is in a difficult position because it falls between two stools. It is clear that decisions at the Westminster Government level have a major impact on the service's day-to-day work, but we can not let the convoluted nature of the devolution settlement hinder the important work of that service. The task of supporting individuals at different times in their lives to make decisions about education, training and the world of work to manage their careers is challenging, rapidly evolving and vital to ensuring a workforce fit for the Welsh economy.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews): Mae wedi bod yn ddadl ddefnyddiol, a chroesawaf y cyfraniadau a wnaethpwyd gan Aelodau.

On the amendments, we reject amendment 1. We will move steadily forward on the recommendations of 'Future ambitions', recognising the challenges that we face in the current spending round.

We will accept amendment 2. We welcome the recognition given in amendment 2 to the need for impartial advice. That impartial advice is available in most settings, but there are questions over whether that happens in every learning setting.

In respect of amendment 3, we recognise the importance of social enterprises, and I speak as the Minister who was formally responsible for them before my colleague, Carl Sargeant, took on that responsibility. We would not want specifically to privilege one area by picking it out in the motion. We launched the youth entrepreneurship strategy just last week, and we would hope that social enterprises would be covered within that and that that would be reflected in the advice available to young people.

4.20 p.m.

Jenny Randerson is not here just now. I was going to say that she needs no careers advice this week, so I will congratulate her in her absence. She raised a number of questions about the report and suggested that I was rejecting a high percentage of its recommendations. In fact, I am accepting around 80 per cent, which is a fair reflection of the work that has been done. There are some challenges for us in taking some of them forward at present. This is a report about the medium and longer term.

In his contribution, Paul picked up the issue of the take-up of adult services. We will need to look at that. I said that we need to ensure that the services provided are twenty-first century services and, in that context, we will look to see what we can do to advance the online work, which has already been a great success, in Careers Wales. We also face other challenges, which have been acknowledged by a number of speakers, in relation to how we address the agenda of young people who are not in employment, education or training.

O ran y gwelliannau, yr ydym yn gwrthod gwelliant 1. Symudwn ymlaen yn gyson gydag argymhellion 'Uchelgeisiau i'r dyfodol', gan gydnabod yr heriau yr ydym yn eu hwynebu yn y cylch gwariant presennol.

Derbyniwn welliant 2. Croesawn y gydnabyddiaeth a roddir yng ngwelliant 2 i'r angen am gyngor diduedd. Mae'r cyngor diduedd hwnnw ar gael yn y rhan fwyaf o leoliadau, ond ceir cwestiynau ynghylch a yw hynny'n digwydd ym mhob lleoliad dysgu.

O ran gwelliant 3, yr ydym yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd mentrau cymdeithasol, a siaradaf fel y Gweinidog a oedd yn ffurfiol gyfrifol amdanynt cyn i'm cydweithiwr, Carl Sargeant, gymryd y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Ni fyddem am roi braint benodol i un maes drwy ei amlygu yn y cynnig. Lansiodd y strategaeth entrepreneuriaeth ieuenticid gennym yr wythnos diwethaf, a byddem yn gobeithio ei bod yn cynnwys mentrau cymdeithasol ac y câi hynny ei adlewyrchu yn y cyngor sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc.

Nid yw Jenny Randerson yma ar y foment. Yr oeddwn am ddweud nad oes angen cyngor gyrfaoedd arni yr wythnos yma, felly llongyfarchaf hi yn ei habsenoldeb. Cododd hi nifer o gwestiynau am yr adroddiad ac awgrymodd fy mod yn gwrthod canran uchel o'i argymhellion. Mewn gwirionedd, yr wyf yn derbyn tuag 80 y cant, sy'n adlewyrchiad teg o'r gwaith sydd wedi cael ei wneud. Mae rhywfaint o heriau inni o ran symud ymlaen â rhai ohonynt ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ymwneud â'r tymor canolig a hirach.

Yn ei gyfraniad, soniodd Paul am fater faint o bobl sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau i oedolion. Bydd angen inni edrych ar hynny. Dywedais fod angen inni sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn wasanaethau i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain ac, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, edrychwn i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud i symud ymlaen â'r gwaith ar-lein, sydd eisoes wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr, o fewn Gyrfa Cymru. Yr ydym hefyd yn wynebu heriau eraill, ac mae nifer o siaradwyr wedi cydnabod y rhain, mewn perthynas â sut yr ydym yn trin agenda pobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na

hyfforddiant.

Christine Chapman welcomed the move towards a unitary structure and spelled out some of the demands that we must overcome in encouraging more women to take up STEM subjects and to move into careers related to science, technology and engineering. Nerys and a number of Members, including Mark Isherwood, picked up the issues of linking together demand and supply and the need for active and up-to-date labour market information. We know that that is important and we are reviewing it at present.

I want to reassure Members that we expect to see regional provision within a unitary structure for Careers Wales. I think that that was raised by Nerys, Jenny and Paul. Therefore, that is part of our agenda. Mark Isherwood raised a series of questions in respect of the structure. It is important to point out that the Careers Wales companies are private companies. They were established in that form by, if I remember rightly, a Conservative Government in the 1990s. Therefore, when we come to a process of awarding contracts, we must ensure that we are operating within European Union law as it is now applied. As we develop the model for the unitary structure, there are several technical and interrelated questions that we must resolve on that structure to ensure that it is fit for purpose and that we can deliver within the restrictions that we face under EU law.

I want to end by thanking Dr Edwards and his team for providing us with a high-quality report that helps us to advance the development of careers services in Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is that amendment 1 be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is. Therefore, I will defer all voting on this item until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Croesawodd Christine Chapman y symudiad tuag at strwythur unedol ac amlinellodd rai o'r heriau y mae'n rhaid inni eu goresgyn o ran annog mwy o fenywod i astudio pynciau STEM a symud i yrfaeodd sy'n gysylltiedig â gwyddoniaeth, technoleg a pheirianeg. Soniodd Nerys a nifer o Aelodau, gan gynnwys Mark Isherwood, am gysylltu galw a chyflenwad ac am yr angen am wybodaeth weithredol a chyfoes am y farchnad lafur. Gwyddom fod hynny'n bwysig ac yr ydym wrthi'n adolygu'r mater.

Hoffwn dawelu meddyliau Aelodau ein bod yn disgwyl gweld darpariaeth ranbarthol o fewn strwythur unedol i Gyrfa Cymru. Credaf fod Nerys, Jenny a Paul wedi sôn am hynny. Felly, mae hynny'n rhan o'n hagenda. Cododd Mark Isherwood gyfres o gwestiynau mewn perthynas â'r strwythur. Mae'n bwysig nodi mai cwmnïau preifat yw cwmnïau Gyrfa Cymru. Cawsant eu sefydlu felly, os cofiaf yn gywir, gan Lywodraeth Geidwadol yn yr 1990au. Felly, pan ddown at broses o ddyfarnu contractau, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gweithredu'n unol â chyfraith yr Undeb Ewropeaidd fel sy'n berthnasol ar hyn o bryd. Wrth inni ddatblygu model y strwythur unedol, rhaid inni ateb nifer o gwestiynau technegol a chydberthynol am y strwythur hwnnw i sicrhau ei fod yn addas at ei ddiben ac y gallwn gyflenwi o fewn y cyfyngiadau yr ydym yn eu hwynebu dan gyfraith yr UE.

Hoffwn ddiweddu drwy ddiolch i Dr Edwards a'i dîm am roi adroddiad o safon uchel inni sy'n ein helpu i symud ymlaen â datblygu gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno â gwelliant 1. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriaf bleidleisio am yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

**Y Cynnydd o ran Rhoi Rhaglen ‘Cymru’n Un’ Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru
ar Waith**
**Progress in Implementing the Welsh Assembly Government’s ‘One Wales’
Programme**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Nick Ramsay and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Peter Black.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw Nick Ramsay a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Peter Black.

Cynnig NDM4592 Jane Hutt

Motion NDM4592 Jane Hutt

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu'r cynnydd sy'n parhau i gael ei wneud ar weithredu rhaglen Cymru'n Un Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the continued progress on implementing the Assembly Government's One Wales programme.

The First Minister: I move the motion.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cynigiad y cynnig.

I did not intend to talk about our big-ticket successes during the course of the One Wales Government, but I will mention some: tackling poverty and providing innovative support for families; using our new legislative powers to add full weight to our actions; stripping out the bureaucratic internal market from the NHS in Wales, creating a streamlined structure focused on improving patient outcomes; and the referendum that was approved unanimously by this body to be held on 3 March on new legislative powers for the Assembly.

Nid oeddwn yn bwriadu siarad am ein prif lwyddiannau yng nghyfnod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, ond nodaf rai ohonynt: mynd i'r afael â thlodi a darparu cymorth arloesol i deuluoedd; defnyddio ein pwerau deddfu newydd i roi pwysau llawn i'n gweithredoedd; cael gwared â marchnad fewnol fiwrocataidd y GIG yng Nghymru, gan greu strwythur symlach yn canolbwyntio ar wella canlyniadau cleifion; a'r refferendwm a gymeradwywyd yn unfrydol gan y corff hwn ac a gynhelir ar 3 Mawrth ar bwerau deddfu newydd i'r Cynulliad.

I will not reel off a list of all our achievements. There is no need, for we publish regular updates on all our progress, but I want to take stock of where we have reached and the task that still lies ahead. When the Deputy First Minister spoke on the third anniversary of the One Wales Government, he reported that 156 commitments had been delivered, 81 commitments had not yet been fulfilled and, of those, 64 were scheduled for completion by May next year and 17 during the course of the next Assembly. As at the end of September, a further dozen commitments had been delivered from that list, and that was despite the in-year budget cuts that we have had to deal with and despite the comprehensive spending review.

Nid wyf am restru popeth yr ydym wedi'i gyflawni. Nid oes angen gwneud hynny, gan ein bod yn cyhoeddi diweddariadau rheolaidd am ein holl gynnydd, ond hoffwn bwysu a mesur ein cyrhaeddiad hyd yn hyn a'r dasg sy'n dal i'n hwynebu. Pan siaradodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar drydydd pen-blwydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, dywedodd fod 156 o ymrwymadau wedi'u cyflenwi, 81 o ymrwymadau heb eu cyflawni ac, o'r rheini, y caiff 64 eu cwblhau erbyn mis Mai y flwyddyn nesaf ac 17 yn ystod y Cynulliad nesaf. Erbyn diwedd mis Medi, yr oedd deuddeg o ymrwymadau eraill wedi'u cyflenwi o'r rhestr honno, a hynny er inni orfod delio â thoriadau cyllidebol yn ystod y flwyddyn ac er gwaethaf yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant.

We all know that Wales is underfunded, but thanks to the authoritative work of the

Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod bod Cymru'n cael ei thanariannu, ond diolch i waith

Holtham commission, we know now that that is not simply an assertion but a fact. In July, the Deputy First Minister identified the challenge for the One Wales Government now as being to demonstrate in its final year that we can set a budget shaped by cuts in Westminster that are in excess of what is required to deal with the deficit—and which endanger our struggling economy—in a way that protects the vulnerable and builds our economy and institutions in any way possible. I believe that our draft budget for the next three years, published last week, protects funding for schools, skills and secondary and community healthcare as far as it can. In line with our ‘One Wales’ agenda, the draft budget maintains progressive universal benefits, including the successful concessionary fare scheme, free prescriptions, free swimming and free breakfasts and milk for primary school children. The things that we set out to do in ‘One Wales’ are even more necessary in bad times than in good.

We know that our public services are critical to the fabric of our society, and we know that cuts will put real pressure on our ability to meet the needs of our population with the same high standards of service and care that have developed over the past 10 years. Wider welfare cuts at a UK level will hit Wales disproportionately hard, given our historical legacy of poverty and vulnerability. Cuts to the housing benefit, employment allowance and disability allowance, and changes to tax credits, risk pushing some of the poorest and most vulnerable in our communities further below the poverty line. As many economists have pointed out, it is risky to assume that the private sector will provide jobs to make up for those lost from the public sector. Public investment plays a far greater role in our economy than elsewhere in the UK, perhaps; our business sector is more fragile, particularly at the moment.

We have to provide, and are providing, help for people during tough times. We also have to build resilience in our economy and

awdurdodol comisiwn Holtham, yr ydym nawr yn gwybod bod hynny'n ffaith ac nid dim ond haeriad. Ym mis Gorffennaf, dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog mai'r her nawr i Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un yw dangos yn ei blwyddyn olaf y gallwn osod cyllideb wedi'i siapio gan doriadau yn San Steffan sy'n fwy na'r hyn sy'n ofynnol i ddelio â'r diffyg—ac sy'n peryglu ein heconomi fregus—mewn modd sy'n diogelu pobl agored i niwed ac yn adeiladu ein heconomi a'n sefydliadau mewn unrhyw fodd posibl. Credaf fod ein cyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, yn diogelu cyllid i ysgolion, sgiliau a gofal iechyd eilaidd a chymunedol cyn belled ag y gall. Yn unol â'n hagenda ‘Cymru'n Un’, mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn cadw buddion cyffredinol cynyddol, gan gynnwys y cynllun tocynnau teithio rhatach llwyddiannus, presgripsiynau di-dâl, nofio di-dâl a brecwast a llaeth di-dâl i blant ysgol gynradd. Mae'r pethau y dywedasom y byddem yn eu gwneud yn ‘Cymru'n Un’ hyd yn oed yn fwy angenrheidiol pan mae pethau'n ddrwg na phan maent yn dda.

Gwyddom fod ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn hanfodol i adeiladwaith ein cymdeithas, a gwyddom y bydd toriadau'n rhoi pwysau gwirioneddol ar ein gallu i ddiwallu anghenion ein poblogaeth gyda gwasanaethau a gofal o'r safon uchel sydd wedi datblygu dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Bydd toriadau lles ehangach ar lefel y DU yn taro Cymru'n anghymesur o galed, ac ystyried ein hetifeddiaeth hanesyddol o dlodi a phobl agored i niwed. Mae toriadau i'r budd-dal tai, lwfans cyflogaeth a lwfans anabledd, a newidiadau i gredydau treth, yn creu perygl o wthio rhai o'r bobl dlotaf a mwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymunedau'n is o dan y ffin flodi. Fel y mae nifer o economegwyr wedi nodi, mae'n beryglus tybio y bydd y sector preifat yn darparu swyddi i gymryd lle'r rhai a gollir o'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae buddsoddi cyhoeddus yn chwarae rhan lawer mwy yn ein heconomi nag mewn mannau eraill yn y DU, efallai; mae ein sector busnes yn fwy bregus, yn enwedig ar y foment.

Rhaid inni ddarparu cymorth i bobl pan mae pethau'n galed, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Rhaid inni hefyd adeiladu gwytnwch

provide the vital services on which so many people depend. I will not hide from the Assembly how concerned I am about the fragility of our economic recovery and the vulnerability of our people to the impacts of cuts made at an UK level. It is not for me to judge whether the UK Government's programme will work in London and south-east England, but I know that it does not address the issues that we face in Wales. However, we are determined to do the best that we can with the money that we have. There are difficult balances to be struck; we have to build our capacity to intervene earlier and more effectively to break the long-term cycle of deprivation, ill health and low skills, and achieve equity in our services and support for individuals. We also have to make the Welsh pound go further, promoting radical change to reduce costs and improve delivery. With this in mind, we are doing everything that we can to mobilise and energise our public services, looking for change through concerted action and for improved frontline delivery of services designed around the citizen. All along, the direction of our 'One Wales' programme has been towards a distinctive, co-operative approach to services that support our communities and pursue the long-term wellbeing of the people of Wales as our central organising principle; it is not a direction from which we will depart now.

When people look back on this Assembly and the agenda that we set ourselves in 2007, I do not think that they will focus primarily on whether we achieved everything that we wanted to in four years, although they may conclude that we have done remarkably well in terms of our delivery and transparency. I think that people will say that we charted our course in fine weather, gained in confidence and ambition as we rowed forward, and that when the storm clouds gathered and the tide ran against us, we were prepared to row harder and maintain our course. I am proud of the achievements that we have already notched up in this Assembly, and of those yet to come. I am prouder still that we are sticking to our principles, holding to our course and delivering the agenda of the One Wales Government.

yn ein heconomi a darparu'r gwasanaethau hollbwysig y mae cymaint o bobl yn dibynnu arnynt. Ni wnaf gelu rhag y Cynulliad fy mhryder am fregusrwydd ein hadferiad economaidd ac am ba mor agored i niwed yw ein pobl oherwydd effeithiau toriadau a wneir ar lefel y DU. Nid fy lle i yw barnu a wnaiff rhaglen Llywodraeth y DU weithio yn Llundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr, ond gwn nad yw'n rhoi sylw priodol i'r materion sy'n ein hwynebu yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn benderfynol o wneud y gorau y gallwn â'r arian sydd gennym. Rhaid taro cydbwyseddau anodd; rhaid inni feithrin ein gallu i ymyrryd yn gynharach ac yn fwy effeithiol i dorri'r cylch hirdymor o amddifadedd, afiechyd a diffyg sgiliau, a chyflawni tegwch yn ein gwasanaethau a'n cymorth i unigolion. Rhaid inni hefyd wneud i bunt Cymru fynd ymhellach, drwy hyrwyddo newidiadau sylfaenol i leihau costau a gwella cyflenwi. Gyda hyn mewn golwg, yr ydym yn gwneud popeth y gallwn i ymgasglu a grymuso ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, gan geisio newid drwy weithredu ar y cyd a chyflenwi gwasanaethau sydd wedi'u cynllunio ar gyfer dinasyddion yn well ar y rheng flaen. Drwy gydol ein rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un', mae ei chyfeiriad wedi bod tuag at ddull neilltuol a chydweithredol o gyflenwi gwasanaethau sy'n cefnogi ein cymunedau ac yn ceisio sicrhau lles hirdymor pobl Cymru fel prif egwyddor drefniadol; ni wnawn newid y cyfeiriad hwnnw nawr.

Pan fydd pobl yn edrych yn ôl ar y Cynulliad hwn ac ar yr agenda a osodwyd gennym yn 2007, ni chredaf y byddant yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar ein llwyddiant o ran cyflawni popeth yr oeddem am ei wneud mewn pedair blynedd, er y gallent ddod i'r casgliad ein bod wedi gwneud yn arbennig o dda o ran cyflenwi a thryloywder. Credaf y bydd pobl yn dweud ein bod wedi mapio ein llwybr mewn tywydd braf, wedi magu hyder ac uchelgais wrth rwyfo ymlaen, a phan ddaeth y storm a phan redodd y llanw yn ein herbyn, y buom yn barod i rwyfo'n galetach i aros ar ein llwybr. Yr wyf yn falch o'r hyn yr ydym eisoes wedi'i gyflawni yn y Cynulliad hwn, ac o'r hyn yr ydym am ei gyflawni. Yr wyf yn falchach fyth ein bod yn glynu at ein hegwyddorion, yn aros ar ein llwybr ac yn cyflenwi agenda Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un.

Gwelliant 1 Nick Ramsay

Ar ôl 'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru' ychwanegu:

ond yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y diffygion parhaus mewn perfformiad ar draws gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: I move amendment 1.

It is important to take a stock check to see how things are going, and the First Minister has set the scene. He referred to the debate and vote on the referendum, which is welcome, though I think that the fact that there was unanimity in that vote is an Assembly success rather than a success for the Welsh Assembly Government alone. However, it was certainly a notable achievement, and we look forward to the referendum on 3 March and to future success. The First Minister also referred to the review of the Barnett formula; he knows that I and the Welsh Conservatives are committed to that, as are the Liberal Democrats, our colleagues in the coalition Government at Westminster. It has to be said, however, that there were 13 years of no movement from the present Welsh Assembly Government to reform that formula. I think that all parties here are agreed that it needs attention.

It is undoubtedly true that we live in challenging times and that there has been a challenging budget, although I think that there is a danger of overstating this. We are returning, as a nation, to the levels of spending of 2006, so it is scarcely the end of civilisation as we know it—it is a challenge. When you look at what has been happening in Ireland, you see a representation of chaos. I do not want to overstate it, but it is clearly a financial disaster, and that is how it could have been in this country if we had not taken action, given the level of debt that we were left with by the outgoing Government. One is always reminded of the—[*Interruption.*]

4.30 p.m.

I am happy to give way to the former First Minister if he wants to say something. He has this habit of intervening from a sedentary position. I know that I am not supposed to

Amendment 1 Nick Ramsay

After 'programme' insert:

But expresses concern about the continued shortcomings in performance across public services in Wales.

Nick Bourne: Cynigiaf gwelliant 1.

Mae'n bwysig pwysu a mesur y sefyllfa i weld sut y mae pethau, ac mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi gosod y cefndir. Cyfeiriodd at y ddadl a'r bleidlais ar y refferendwm, sydd i'w chroesawu, er y credaf fod y ffaith y cafwyd unfrydedd yn y bleidlais honno'n llwyddiant i'r Cynulliad yn hytrach na llwyddiant i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn unig. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr yr oedd yn beth nodedig i'w gyflawni, ac edrychwn ymlaen at refferendwm 3 Mawrth ac at lwyddiant yn y dyfodol. Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog hefyd at adolygu fformiwla Barnett; mae'n gwybod fy mod i a Cheidwadwyr Cymru'n ymroddedig i hynny, fel y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ein cydweithwyr yn y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan. Rhaid dweud, fodd bynnag, y cafwyd 13 blynedd heb ddim symudiad gan Lywodraeth bresennol Cynulliad Cymru i ddiwygio'r fformiwla honno. Credaf fod pob plaid yma'n cytuno bod angen sylw arni.

Yn ddi-os, mae'n wir ein bod yn byw mewn cyfnod heriol ac y bu'r gyllideb yn heriol, ond credaf fod perygl o or-ddweud hyn. Yr ydym yn dychwelyd, fel cenedl, at lefelau gwariant 2006, felly go brin bod hyn yn ddiweddd ar wareiddiad fel yr ydym yn ei adnabod—her ydyw. Pan edrychwch ar yr hyn sydd wedi bod yn digwydd yn Iwerddon, cewch ddarlun o anhrefn. Nid wyf am ei or-ddweud, ond mae'n amlwg yn drychineb ariannol, a dyna sut y gallasai fod yn y wlad hon oni bai ein bod ni wedi gweithredu, ac ystyried lefel y ddyled a adawyd inni gan y Llywodraeth a oedd yn gadael. Mae hyn yn atgoffa rhywun o—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Yr wyf yn fodlon ildio i'r cyn Brif Weinidog os hoffai ddweud rhywbeth. Mae ganddo'r arfer hwn o ymyrryd o safle eisteddog. Gwn na ddylwn ei gydnabod, Ddirprwy Lywydd,

acknowledge it, Deputy Presiding Officer, but when it is so loud, it is difficult to ignore. Do you want to intervene?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. No, he does not. Please carry on.

Nick Bourne: I am happy to carry on, but as I say, it is off-putting, and not just for me.

However, let us return to the challenging position that we inherited on the debt that was left by the last Labour Government. Let me repeat: £62 billion of interest has to be paid every year on that debt. That is three times the size of the Welsh block, just in interest. That is a massive challenge. I share common ground with the First Minister—we need to protect the vulnerable. In particular, we need to protect the health budget. After all, £1 billion is being taken out of that budget by the present Government over the period of the comprehensive spending review. That is a massive amount, and I do not believe that you can take that out without affecting the quality of healthcare delivered in Wales. That is why we are pledged to retain that budget plus an uplift for inflation. Why the Welsh Assembly Government is not doing that, I still do not understand.

Again, I share common ground with the First Minister on the need to grow the private sector; I have heard him say that, and I believe that he means it. However, we need to take measures to do that, because there is clearly, within the United Kingdom, a stronger private sector in other parts of the country as compared with Wales. That is something that we are committed to. I come back to the point that we believe that the NHS is vital; that will be reflected when we present out alternative budget.

There are challenges coming up on the referendum, on which we will stand shoulder to shoulder, and there are challenges in the budget, although there is a great danger of overstating them, and running down our country—both Wales and the UK—in pretending that it is a greater challenge than it

and pan mae mor swllyd, mae'n anodd ei anwybyddu. A hoffech ymyrryd?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Na hoffai, wir. Ewch ymlaen.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn fodlon mynd ymlaen, ond fel y dywedaf, mae'n annymunol, ac nid dim ond i mi.

Fodd bynnag, dewch inni ddychwelyd at y sefyllfa heriol a etifeddwyd gennym o ran y ddyled a adawyd gan Lywodraeth ddiwethaf Llafur. Gadewch imi ailadrodd: rhaid talu £62 biliwn o log bob blwyddyn ar y ddyled honno. Mae hynny'n deirgwaith maint bloc Cymru, mewn llog yn unig. Mae hynny'n her enfawr. Rhannaf dir cyffredin â'r Prif Weinidog—mae angen inni amddiffyn yr hyn sy'n agored i niwed. Yn benodol, mae angen inni amddiffyn y gyllideb iechyd. Wedi'r cyfan, mae'r Llywodraeth bresennol yn tynnu £1 biliwn o'r gyllideb honno dros gyfnod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Mae hwnnw'n swm enfawr, ac ni chredaf y gallwch ei dynnu allan heb effeithio ar ansawdd y gofal iechyd sy'n cael ei gyflenwi yng Nghymru. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi gwneud adduned i gadw'r gyllideb honno ynghyd â chynnydd ar gyfer chwyddiant. Yr wyf yn dal i fethu deall pam nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwneud hynny.

Eto, rhannaf dir cyffredin â'r Prif Weinidog o ran yr angen i dyfu'r sector preifat; yr wyf wedi ei glywed yn dweud hynny, a chredaf ei fod o ddifrif. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni gymryd mesurau i wneud hynny, oherwydd mae'n amlwg bod gan rannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig sector preifat cryfach nag a geir yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i hynny. Dychwelaf at y pwynt ein bod yn credu bod y GIG yn hollbwysig; adlewyrchir hynny pan gyflwynwn ein cyllideb amgen.

Mae heriau o'n blaen o ran y refferendwm—byddwn yn sefyll ysgwydd wrth ysgwydd o ran y rheini—ac mae heriau yn y gyllideb, er bod perygl mawr o'u gor-ddweud, ac o ladd ar ein gwlad—Cymru a'r DU—drwy gymryd arnom bod yr her yn fwy nag ydyw. Fodd bynnag, caiff pobl Cymru'r cyfle i fynegi eu

is. However, the Welsh people will have the opportunity to express their views in the referenda and in the vote on 5 May, when we need to set out a change of direction and elect a new Welsh Government. I look forward to that opportunity.

Gwelliant 2 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn gresynu bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi methu buddsoddi digon mewn uwchraddio adeiladau ysgolion yn ystod y cyfnod o dwf yn y gyllideb, fel y nodir yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

Gwelliant 3 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn gresynu wrth y methiant parhaus i gyrraedd y targedau ar gyfer amseroedd aros sydd wedi'u nodi yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

Gwelliant 4 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn gresynu wrth fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy fel sydd wedi'i nodi yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

Peter Black: I move amendments 2, 3 and 4.

This debate is remarkably low-key considering that we are discussing the key document on which this One Wales Government has been based; it has been tucked in for debate at the end of a Tuesday afternoon. The key test for this Government is not how many boxes it can tick, but the outcomes of the policies that it has pursued. Nevertheless, it has chosen to talk to us about the 200-odd promises in 'One Wales', and use that as its measure, so I want to run through some of those promises and assess how well it has done. I know that my colleague Jenny Randerson will do something similar with other promises.

barn yn y refferenda ac yn y bleidlais ar 5 Mai, pan mae angen inni osod cyfeiriad newydd ac ethol Llywodraeth newydd i Gymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at y cyfle hwnnw.

Amendment 2 Peter Black

Add as new point at end of motion:

Regrets that during the period of budget growth, the Welsh Assembly Government failed to sufficiently invest in upgrading school buildings as set out in One Wales.

Amendment 3 Peter Black

Add as new point at end of motion:

Regrets the continued failure to meet the waiting times target as set out in One Wales.

Amendment 4 Peter Black

Add as new point at end of motion:

Regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to increase the supply of affordable housing as set out in One Wales.

Peter Black: Cynigiau gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn rhyfeddol o dawel ac ystyried ein bod yn trafod y ddogfen allweddol y seiliwyd Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un arni; mae wedi'i gwthio o'r neilltu am ddadl ar ddiwedd prynhawn Mawrth. Nid y prawf allweddol i'r Llywodraeth hon yw sawl blwch y gall eu ticio, ond canlyniadau'r polisïau y mae wedi anelu atynt. Fodd bynnag, maent wedi dewis siarad â ni am y tua 200 o addewidion yn 'Cymru'n Un', a defnyddio hynny fel ffon fesur, felly hoffwn fynd drwy rhai o'r addewidion hynny ac asesu pa mor dda y maent wedi gwneud. Gwn y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod Jenny Randerson yn gwneud rhywbeth tebyg ag addewidion eraill.

I will start with health and the waiting-times target. The Government consistently misses its own target that no-one should wait more than 26 weeks between referral and treatment. In fact, over 13,000 people were waiting longer than that in the last month alone. However, in the 'One Wales Delivery Plan', the Government says that the target has been achieved. Thirteen thousand people each month say otherwise, but the Government insists on massaging the figures in order to tick one more promise off that list. In the published figures, the Government's line is now that the target is for 95 per cent of patients to be seen in that period, because 5 per cent of cases involve good medical reasons for that person not to be seen during that time. If that is the case, then the Government should not have set a target of 26 weeks, which is nothing more, in my view, than a public relations exercise aimed at misleading people.

The Government is telling people that they will not wait more than 26 weeks, but, in reality, that is not the case. I believe that we should be focusing less on waiting times and more on assessing how many people have been treated. That is the approach that the UK Government is developing for England, which is far better at responding to patients' needs, without treating people as numbers in trying to meet the statistics for the month. It is worth pointing out that, at the end of the last financial year, there was a sudden disappearance of people off the waiting list as the Government proclaimed that it had achieved its target. However, since that time, the waiting list has been steadily building up again in quite substantial numbers, which makes you wonder where all of those people disappeared and how they have come back on to that list.

The Government's affordable housing target is another classic example of massaging the figures. The pledge was to increase the supply of affordable homes by 6,500 over four years, not to build 6,500 new homes. Increasing the supply had to take account of sales and demolitions, as well as new builds, yet the Government completely failed to

Dechreuaf gydag iechyd a'r targed amseroedd aros. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gyson yn methu eu targed eu hunain, sef na ddylai neb aros mwy na 26 wythnos rhwng atgyfeirio a thriniaeth. Yn wir, yr oedd dros 13,000 o bobl yn aros am gyfnod hwy na hynny yn y mis diwethaf yn unig. Fodd bynnag, yng 'Nghynllun Cyflenwi Cymru'n Un', mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud bod y targed wedi'i gyflawni. Mae tair mil ar ddeg o bobl y mis yn dweud fel arall, ond mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynnu tyllino'r ffigurau er mwyn rhoi tic wrth un addewid arall ar y rhestr. Yn y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd, mae'r Llywodraeth nawr yn dweud mai'r targed yw bod 95 y cant o gleifion yn cael eu gweld yn y cyfnod hwnnw, oherwydd, mewn 5 y cant o achosion, ceir rhesymau meddygol da am beidio â gweld yr unigolyn yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Os yw hynny'n wir, ni ddylai'r Llywodraeth fod wedi gosod targed o 26 wythnos, sy'n ddim mwy, yn fy marn i, nag ymarferiad cysylltiadau cyhoeddus gyda'r nod o gamarwain pobl.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud wrth bobl na wnânt aros mwy na 26 wythnos, ond y realiti yw nad yw hynny'n wir. Credaf y dylwn ganolbwyntio llai ar amseroedd aros a mwy ar asesu faint o bobl sydd wedi cael triniaeth. Dyna'r dull y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn ei ddatblygu ar gyfer Lloegr, sy'n llawer gwell am ymateb i anghenion cleifion, heb drin pobl fel rhifau wrth geisio bodloni ystadegau'r mis. Mae'n werth nodi, ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol diwethaf, y diflannodd pobl yn sydyn oddi ar y rhestr aros wrth i'r Llywodraeth gyhoeddi eu bod wedi cyrraedd eu targed. Fodd bynnag, ers yr adeg honno, mae'r rhestr aros wedi cynyddu'n gyson eto mewn niferoedd eithaf sylweddol, sy'n peri ichi ofyn tybed i ble diflannodd yr holl bobl hynny a sut y maent wedi dod yn ôl ar y rhestr honno.

Mae targed tai fforddiadwy'r Llywodraeth hefyd yn glasur o enghraifft o dylino'r ffigurau. Yr adduned oedd cynnydd o 6,500 yn y cyflenwad tai fforddiadwy dros bedair blynedd, nid adeiladu 6,500 o dai newydd. Yr oedd cynnyddu'r cyflenwad yn gorfod ystyried gwerthu a dymchwel tai, yn ogystal ag adeiladu rhai newydd, ac eto mae'r

recognise that selling or destroying 1,900 buildings has a significant effect on the number of affordable homes available to rent. The latest version of the 'One Wales Delivery Plan' states that 4,235 new affordable houses have been built; the actual increase in the supply is only 2,335. The delivery plan also tells us that the next figures for new affordable housing will be released this month—I believe that that will be done tomorrow. However, interestingly, we can now no longer get hold of the figures for demolitions. The responsibility for collecting and publishing this data has been transferred from the local government data unit directly to the Welsh Government, which no longer publishes the figures in the same format. You can, therefore, no longer distinguish from those figures whether a demolition deals with an affordable home owned by a local council or housing association or a private-sector home. It is interesting, therefore, that, when challenged, the access to data becomes more opaque.

The Government's target to reduce carbon dioxide emissions by 3 per cent per year by 2011 is another example. When the climate change strategy was finally published, the 3 per cent target was in there, but we learned that only 0.89 per cent of that target was to be delivered by the Welsh Assembly Government's actions. The rest of it—2.11 per cent—was to be achieved by relying on action to be taken by the UK Government and by the European Union.

What we have in front of us from the One Wales Government is a series of targets, many of which are not being achieved. Where they are being missed, it seems to me that the Government has been manipulating the statistics and the figures to make it look as though they are being achieved. I do not believe that we can rely on this delivery document as a sound indicator of the Government's achievements. We should be having a more independent review of those achievements. If such a review was available, it would show that the One Wales Government is not delivering what it promised to the people of Wales.

Llywodraeth wedi methu'n lân â chydabod bod gwerthu neu ddiroddio 1,900 o adeiladau'n cael effaith sylweddol ar nifer y tai fforddiadwy sydd ar gael i'w rhentu. Mae fersiwn ddiweddaraf 'Cynllun Cyflenwi Cymru'n Un' yn datgan bod 4,235 o dai fforddiadwy wedi'u hadeiladu; dim ond 2,335 yw'r cynnydd gwirioneddol yn y cyflenwad. Mae'r cynllun cyflenwi hefyd yn dweud wrthym y caiff ffigurau nesaf tai fforddiadwy newydd eu rhyddhau'r mis yma—credaf y gwneir hyn yfory. Fodd bynnag, yn ddiddorol, ni allwn bellach gael gafael ar ffigurau dymchweliadau. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb am gasglu a chyhoeddi'r data hyn wedi'i drosglwyddo o uned ddata llywodraeth leol yn uniongyrchol i Lywodraeth Cymru; nid ydynt hwy'n cyhoeddi'r ffigurau ar yr un fformat. Felly, nid oes modd gwahaniaethu mwyach yn y ffigurau a yw dymchweliad yn ymwneud â chartref fforddiadwy sy'n eiddo i gyngor lleol neu gymdeithas dai neu â chartref sector preifat. Mae'n ddiddorol, felly, pan gânt eu herio, ei bod ym mynd yn anoddach cael mynediad at ddata.

Mae targed y Llywodraeth i leihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid 3 y cant bob blwyddyn erbyn 2011 yn enghraifft arall. Pan gafodd y strategaeth newid yn yr hinsawdd ei chyhoeddi o'r diwedd, yr oedd y targed 3 y cant ynddi, ond cawsom wybod mai dim ond 0.89 y cant o'r targed hwnnw a gâi ei gyflenwi drwy weithredoedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Câl'r gweddill ohono—2.11 y cant—ei gyflawni drwy ddibyynu ar gamau a gymerid gan Lywodraeth y DU a gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn rhoi cyfres o dargeddi o'n blaen; mae llawer ohonynt nad ydynt yn cael eu cyflawni. Pan maent yn cael eu methu, mae'n ymddangos bod y Llywodraeth wedi bod yn camdrafod yr ystadegau a'r ffigurau fel ei bod yn ymddangos eu bod yn cael eu cyflawni. Ni chredaf y gallwn ddibyynu ar y ddogfen gyflenwi hon fel dangosydd cadarn o'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i gyflawni. Dylem drefnu adolygiad mwy annibynnol o'r cyraeddiadau hyn. Pe bai adolygiad o'r fath ar gael, byddai'n dangos nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn cyflenwi'r hyn a addawodd i bobl Cymru.

Jeff Cuthbert: Thank you, Dirprwy Lywydd, for allowing me to contribute to this debate. When 'One Wales' was agreed over three years ago as a document for effective coalition Government, it was an ambitious, but realistic, programme for government over the following four years. I believe that, to date, it has been just that, which is why I am supporting the Welsh Assembly Government's motion today.

I particularly welcome the way that European structural funds have been used to support economic development in Wales, to get people back into employment, even in the current austere financial climate. I also welcome the promotion of the skills and lifelong learning agenda, so that our working-age population is prepared for economic recovery. Despite Wales suffering during the entirely unavoidable global recession, and now suffering even more due to the entirely avoidable coalition Government cuts, the 2007-13 EU structural fund programmes have been progressing well and are on track to deliver. There was £3.5 billion of European money available for us to spend, of which 59 per cent is already committed. So far, nearly 12,000 people have been helped into work, with 165 projects approved. This commitment is well ahead of the EU and British average, which is another testament to how highly regarded Wales is within the corridors of power in Brussels when it comes to managing and spending our European funds. The strategic frameworks that govern how and where our structural funds are spent align our 'One Wales' priorities with those of the EU, Lisbon and Gothenberg agendas, ensuring that they are spent on the key growth drivers of the economy, one of which is skills.

4.40 p.m.

Another important area of 'One Wales' is its commitment to improving our skills base, thereby creating a more joined-up approach so that there is more co-ordination between schools, further education colleges, the careers service and employers in equipping

Jeff Cuthbert: Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd, am ganiatáu imi gyfrannu at y ddatl hon. Pan gytunwyd ar 'Gymru'n Un' dros dair blynedd yn ôl fel dogfen ar gyfer Llywodraeth glymblaid effeithiol, yr oedd yn rhaglen uchelgeisiol, ond realistig, ar gyfer llywodraethu dros y pedair blynedd ganlynol. Credaf, hyd yn hyn, mai dyna'n union ydoedd, a dyna pam yr wyf yn cefnogi cynnig Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru heddiw.

Croesawaf yn arbennig y ffordd y mae cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd wedi cael eu defnyddio i gefnogi datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru, i gael pobl yn ôl i gyflogaeth, hyd yn oed yn yr hinsawdd ariannol lem sydd ohoni. Croesawaf hefyd hyrwyddo'r agenda sgiliau a dysgu gydol oes, fel bod ein poblogaeth o oed gwaith yn barod am adferiad economaidd. Er bod Cymru wedi dioddef yn ystod y dirwasgiad byd-eang cwbl anosgoadwy, a nawr yn dioddef mwy fyth oherwydd toriadau cwbl osgoadwy'r Llywodraeth glymblaid, mae rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol yr UE ar gyfer 2007-13 wedi gwneud cynnydd da ac ar y trywydd iawn o ran cyflenwi. Yr oedd £3.5 biliwn o arian Ewropeaidd ar gael inni ei wario, ac mae 59 y cant ohono eisoes wedi'i ymrwymo. Hyd yn hyn, mae bron 12,000 o bobl wedi cael cymorth i gael gwaith, a 165 o brosiectau wedi'u cymeradwyo. Mae'r ymrwymiad hwn yn llawer uwch na chyfartaledd yr UE a Phrydain, sy'n dangos eto pa mor uchel ei pharch yw Cymru o fewn y coridorau pŵer ym Mrwsel o ran rheoli a gwario ein cronfeydd Ewropeaidd. Mae'r fframweithiau strategol sy'n llywodraethu sut a ble y caiff ein cronfeydd strwythurol eu gwario'n golygu bod ein blaenoriaethau 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyd-fynd â rhai'r UE, agendâu Lisbon a Gothenburg, gan sicrhau y cânt eu gwario ar sbardunau twf allweddol yr economi; un o'r rheini yw sgiliau.

Un arall o feysydd pwysig 'Cymru'n Un' yw ei ymrwymiad i wella ein cronfa sgiliau, a chreu dull mwy cydgysylltiedig fel y ceir mwy o gydlynw rhwng ysgolion, colegau addysg bellach, y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd a chyflogwyr wrth roi'r sgiliau i ddysgwyr

individual learners with the skills that they need to play their part in boosting economic growth. That has been reflected in our response to the Webb report, our 'Skills That Work for Wales' strategy document, and the subsequent Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009. Structural funds have been used in this area, and the £48 million ProAct scheme has helped to upskill 10,000 workers who were at threat of being made redundant. Meanwhile, those who were unfortunate enough to lose their jobs have been helped by the ReAct programme on a similar basis. Furthermore, £25 million has been provided to expand our apprenticeships programme over the next three years, and a further £20 million has been provided to protect them during the economic downturn. That follows on from our development and implementation of the 14-19 learning pathways, which aim to give young people more choice and influence over what they learn in school or college, and which help young people to better realise their potential, putting vocational subjects on a par with traditional academic ones. We have also developed a green jobs strategy to ensure greater carbon efficiency and to help to generate a range of new jobs that are based on emerging green technologies and products.

I will conclude by reminding Members that, despite the difficulties of the global recession and coalition-Government-imposed spending cuts, we are very much on track in delivering our 'One Wales' programme of commitments. Our intelligent use of EU structural funds, combined with driving forward our skills agenda, has ensured that we are putting the building blocks in place for economic recovery. By building on what we have already done, we can make sure that our workforce has the appropriate skills and that the right investments are made in the infrastructure of economic growth, so that we can be that small, clever country that we aspire to be.

Jenny Randerson: We live in a very different world from the one in which 'One Wales' was written. I always thought that it was a highly ambitious document and that its commitments were difficult to afford, even in those days before banking crises and Labour

unigol sydd eu hangen arnynt i chwarae eu rhan yn y broses o hybu twf economaidd. Adlewyrchwyd hynny yn ein hymateb i adroddiad Webb, ein dogfen strategaeth 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', ac ym Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009, a'i dilynodd. Mae cronfeydd strwythurol wedi cael eu defnyddio yn y maes hwn, ac mae'r cynllun ProAct gwerth £48 miliwn wedi helpu i uwchsgilio 10,000 o weithwyr a oedd mewn perygl o golli eu swyddi. Yn y cyfamser, mae'r rheini a oedd yn ddigon anffodus i golli eu swyddi wedi cael cymorth gan raglen ReAct ar sail debyg. Hefyd, darparwyd £25 miliwn i ehangu ein rhaglen prentisiaethau dros y tair blynedd nesaf, a darparwyd £20 miliwn arall i'w diogelu yn ystod y dirywiad economaidd. Mae hynny'n dilyn ein gwaith o ddatblygu a gweithredu'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19, gyda'r nod o roi mwy o ddewis a dylanwad i bobl ifanc dros yr hyn y maent yn ei ddysgu yn yr ysgol neu'r coleg, ac sy'n rhoi gwell cyfle i bobl ifanc wireddu eu potensial, gan roi pynciau galwedigaethol ar yr un lefel â phynciau academaidd traddodiadol. Yr ydym hefyd wedi datblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd i sicrhau gwell effeithlonrwydd carbon ac i helpu i gynhyrchu ystod o swyddi newydd sy'n seiliedig ar dechnolegau a chynhyrchion gwyrdd newydd.

Gorffennaf drwy atgoffa Aelodau ein bod, er gwaethaf anawsterau'r dirwasgiad byd-eang a'r toriadau gwariant a osodwyd gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid, ar y trywydd iawn i gyflenwi ein rhaglen o ymrwymadau 'Cymru'n Un'. Drwy ddefnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol UE yn ddeallus, a bwrw ymlaen â'n hagenda sgiliau, yr ydym wedi sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi'r blociau adeiladu yn eu lle ar gyfer adferiad economaidd. Drwy adeiladu ar yr hyn yr ydym eisoes wedi'i wneud, gallwn sicrhau bod gan ein gweithlu'r sgiliau priodol ac y gwneir y buddsoddiadau cywir yn seilwaith twf economaidd, fel y gallwn wireddu ein dyhead o fod yn wlad fach glyfar.

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydym yn byw mewn byd gwahanol iawn i'r un ble cafodd 'Cymru'n Un' ei ysgrifennu. Meddyliais erioed ei bod yn ddogfen uchelgeisiol iawn ac y byddai'n anodd fforddio ei hymrwymadau, hyd yn oed yn y dyddiau

overspending. However, as time goes on, and as is true for all Governments, events shape your programme rather more than your programme for government does—events take over, as they have done in this case. Looking back at this programme for government in its historical context, I take issue with some things that it is claimed have been achieved, and some that have not been achieved.

Let us look at the free laptops scheme. I was reading a briefing by the teachers' unions recently, which said that the scheme was ineffective and underfunded, although it cost £700,000. The pilot scheme was included of course in order to satisfy Plaid Cymru, but I doubt very much that there has been any significant benefit to the education of the children involved.

Let us look at the ban on the use of private finance in the NHS—that was always a misnomer because there is heaps of private finance in the NHS, in the primary care sector in particular. Peter Black was telling me earlier this afternoon about the building of a community health centre in his region, which relies firmly on private finance. We have a backlog of £500 million to bring hospital buildings up to scratch, yet the Government will not even look at the possibility of using private finance to improve that situation. It is a ridiculous pledge, because private finance has been used in education. I would ask why it was right to spend £34 million on two new private finance initiative schemes to upgrade school buildings, but it is not right to spend the money on upgrading buildings for the health service.

Let us look at some of the promises that have been delivered rather badly, such as the costly reorganisation of the health service, which has not yet produced any financial savings. As a result of the no-redundancy policy, we are in the ridiculous position of having tenure-protected salaries, with 22 finance directors, 22 chief executives and 22 human resources managers, although we have only seven organisations for them to work in.

hynny cyn argyfyngau bancio a gorwario Llafur. Fodd bynnag, wrth i amser fynd heibio, ac fel sy'n wir am bob Llywodraeth, mae digwyddiadau'n siapio eich rhaglen ychydig mwy nag y mae eich rhaglen lywodraethu'n ei wneud—mae digwyddiadau'n rheoli, fel y gwnaethant yn yr achos hwn. Wrth edrych yn ôl ar y rhaglen lywodraethu yn ei chyd-destun hanesyddol, nid wyf yn fodlon â rhai o'r pethau y mae'n hawlio ei bod wedi eu cyflawni, nac â rhai nad ydynt wedi'u cyflawni.

Dewch inni edrych ar y cynllun gliniaduron di-dâl. Yr oeddwn yn darllen briff gan undebau'r athrawon yn ddiweddar, a oedd yn dweud bod y cynllun yn aneffeithiol ac wedi'i danariannu, er iddo gostio £700,000. Wrth gwrs, i fodloni Plaid Cymru y cafodd y cynllun peilot ei gynnwys, ond amheuf yn fawr a fu unrhyw fudd arwyddocaol i addysg y plant dan sylw.

Dewch inni edrych ar wahardd defnyddio cyllid preifat yn y GIG—camenw oedd hynny o'r dechrau gan fod llwythi o gyllid preifat yn y GIG, yn enwedig yn y sector gofal sylfaenol. Yr oedd Peter Black yn dweud wrthyf yn gynharach brynhawn heddiw am adeiladu canolfan iechyd gymunedol yn ei ranbarth, sy'n dibynnu'n gryf ar gyllid preifat. Mae gennym ôl-groniad o £500 miliwn i ailwampio adeiladau ysbytai, ac eto ni wnaiff y Llywodraeth hyd yn oed edrych ar y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio cyllid preifat i wella'r sefyllfa honno. Mae'n adduned chwerthinllyd, oherwydd mae cyllid preifat wedi cael ei ddefnyddio ym maes addysg. Byddwn yn gofyn pam yr oedd yn iawn gwario £34 miliwn ar ddau gynllun menter cyllid preifat newydd i uwchraddio adeiladau ysgol, ond nad yw'n iawn gwario'r arian ar uwchraddio adeiladau'r gwasanaeth iechyd.

Dewch inni edrych ar rai o'r addewidion a gyflenwyd yn eithaf gwael, megis y gwaith costus o aildrefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd; nid yw wedi cynhyrchu unrhyw arbedion ariannol eto. O ganlyniad i'r polisi dim dileu swyddi, yr ydym mewn sefyllfa chwerthinllyd lle mae gennym gyflogau wedi'u diogelu gan ddeiliadaeth, gyda 22 o gyfarwyddwyr cyllid, 22 o brif weithredwyr a 22 o reolwyr adnoddau dynol, er mai dim ond

saith sefydliad sydd gennym iddynt weithio ynddynt.

The grant for first-time buyers was another badly delivered promise. In order to accommodate Plaid Cymru's pledge, the Government somehow managed to lump grants for first-time buyers in with energy efficiency grants, so that people who had no interest in energy efficiency grants were being given them ahead of those who wanted those grants. Then, a few months ago, the whole scheme was quietly dropped. It is funny how you have a Government fanfare when something is taken up, but there is no fanfare when it is dropped.

There are some other weak and immeasurable promises, and I would like to finish by talking about the claim in relation to child poverty.

Nerys Evans: Are you saying, then, that you were against the first-time buyer grants? Your party signed up to that in 'The All-Wales Accord' three years ago.

Jenny Randerson: Sorry, I did not hear the beginning of that, Nerys.

Nerys Evans: Are you saying that you are against the first-time buyer grants? Your party signed up to that three years ago in 'The All-Wales Accord'.

Jenny Randerson: It is the way that one grant was disguised as another that we have a problem with.

I now turn to child poverty. The most misleading claim by far is that in relation to child poverty. 'One Wales' commits the Government to support the aim to halve child poverty by 2010 and eradicate it by 2020. The delivery plan says that this has been achieved. Surely this is playing with words. What exactly has been achieved? You have delivered on supporting the aim, but you certainly have not delivered on halving child poverty. That is even in relation to the concept of eradicating child poverty that is talked about with regard to the 2020 target. When you look at the fine detail of that

Yr oedd y grant i brynwyr tro cyntaf yn addewid arall a gyflenwyd yn wael. Er mwyn rhoi lle i adduned Plaid Cymru, llwyddodd y Llywodraeth rywsut i uno grantiau i brynwyr tro cyntaf â grantiau effeithlonrwydd ynni, fel bod pobl heb ddim diddordeb mewn grantiau effeithlonrwydd ynni'n eu cael o flaen pobl a oedd am gael y grantiau hynny. Yna, rai misoedd yn ôl, gollyngwyd yr holl gynllun yn dawel. Mae'n ddoniol sut y ceir ffanffer gan y Llywodraeth ar ddechrau cynllun, ond dim ffanffer pan gaiff ei ollwng.

Mae rhai addewidion gwan eraill nad oes modd eu mesur, a hoffwn orffen drwy siarad am yr hawliad mewn perthynas â thlodi plant.

Nerys Evans: A ydych yn dweud, felly, eich bod yn gwrthwynebu'r grantiau i brynwyr tro cyntaf? Cytunodd eich plaid â hwy yng 'Nghytgord Cymru Gyfan' dair blynedd yn ôl.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni chlywais ddechrau hynny, Nerys.

Nerys Evans: A ydych yn dweud eich bod yn gwrthwynebu'r grantiau i brynwyr tro cyntaf? Cytunodd eich plaid â hwy dair blynedd yn ôl yng 'Nghytgord Cymru Gyfan'.

Jenny Randerson: Mae ein problem yn ymwneud â'r ffordd y cafodd un grant ei guddio o fewn un arall.

Nawr, trof at dlodi plant. Yr hawliad mwyaf camarweiniol o bell yw'r un sy'n ymwneud â thlodi plant. Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn ymrwymo'r Llywodraeth i gefnogi'r nod o haneru tlodi plant erbyn 2010 a'i ddileu erbyn 2020. Mae'r cynllun cyflenwi'n dweud bod hyn wedi'i gyflawni. Nid oes posibl nad chwarae ar eiriau yw hyn. Beth yn union sydd wedi'i gyflawni? Yr ydych wedi cefnogi'r nod, ond yn sicr nid ydych wedi llwyddo i haneru tlodi plant. Mae hynny, hyd yn oed, yn gymharol â'r cysyniad o ddileu tlodi plant y siaredir amdano yng nghyswllt targed 2020. Pan edrychwch ar fanylion y

target, 'eradicating' child poverty means getting it below 10 per cent. That is a different interpretation of eradication from the definition in my dictionary. In Wales, around 32 per cent of children live in poverty—some 192,000 children—and 126,000 children live in severe poverty. The Government owes it to every one of those children to at least be honest about the outcome on that.

Helen Mary Jones: I have said before in this Chamber that, three years ago, I was not entirely convinced that it was the right time for my party to go into Government, and I am not famous for being pleased to be proved wrong. However, in this case, I am very pleased to have been proved decisively wrong. We have seen a Government that has been able to deliver real change, that has been able to provide genuine made-in-Wales solutions to the problems that our communities face and a Government that has been able to do that in the face of very different circumstances from those that we thought would pertain when 'One Wales' was agreed, as many people have acknowledged.

It is remarkable, given that times have become so hard, that the Government has managed to achieve so many of its commitments, although I do not think that anyone would claim that the work of public service reform and improvement is entirely done. I would like to touch on a few of those achievements, and I am particularly pleased with some of what has been achieved in the area of health. It is clear that the service faces enormous challenges; none of us would deny that. However, much has been achieved.

I am very glad that the One Wales Government took the decision to end the previous Government's hospital centralisation plans, and I know that that has been welcomed by Members across the Chamber where our communities are affected. It was right to end the use of costly private finance initiative schemes in funding hospital building. Jenny Randerson is right, of course, to refer to the community health developments that have happened, but those

targed hwnnw, mae 'dileu' tlodi plant yn golygu ei gael yn is na 10 y cant. Mae hynny'n ddiffiniad gwahanol o ddileu i'r un yn fy ngeiriadur i. Yng Nghymru, mae tua 32 y cant o blant yn byw mewn tlodi—tua 192,000 o blant—ac mae 126,000 o blant yn byw mewn tlodi difrifol. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar y Llywodraeth i fod yn onest â phob un o'r plant hynny am y canlyniad hwnnw, o leiaf.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen yn y Siambr hon nad oeddwn, dair blynedd yn ôl, yn gwbl argyhoeddedig ei bod yn amser da i fy mhlaidd fynd i Lywodraeth, ac nid wyf yn enwog am fod yn hapus i gael fy mhrofi'n anghywir. Fodd bynnag, yn yr achos hwn, yr wyf yn hapus iawn imi gael fy mhrofi'n anghywir y tu hwnt i amheuaeth. Yr ydym wedi gweld Llywodraeth sydd wedi gallu cyflenwi newid gwirioneddol, sydd wedi gallu darparu datrysiadau sy'n wirioneddol wedi'u gwneud yng Nghymru i broblemau ein cymunedau a Llywodraeth sydd wedi gallu gwneud hynny yn wyneb amgylchiadau gwahanol iawn i'r rhai a ragwelwyd gennym pan gytunwyd ar 'Gymru'n Un', fel y mae llawer o bobl wedi cydnabod.

Mae'n rhyfeddol, ac ystyried ei bod yn adeg mor anodd, bod y Llywodraeth wedi gallu cyflawni cymaint o'i hymrwymiaadau, er nad wyf yn credu y byddai unrhyw un yn hawlio bod y gwaith o ddiwygio a gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wedi'i orffen yn llwyr. Hoffwn sôn am rai o'r cyraeddiadau hyn, ac yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o rai o'r pethau a gyflawnwyd ym maes iechyd. Mae'n amlwg bod y gwasanaeth yn wynebu heriau enfawr; ni fyddai neb ohonom yn gwadu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer wedi'i gyflawni.

Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi penderfynu diweddu cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth flaenorol i ganoli ysbytai, a gwn fod Aelodau ar draws y Siambr wedi croesawu hynny pan gafodd effaith ar ein cymunedau. Yr oedd yn gywir i roi diwedd i ddefnyddio cynlluniau menter cyllid preifat costus i dalu am adeiladu ysbytai. Mae Jenny Randerson yn gywir, wrth gwrs, wrth gyfeirio at y datblygiadau sydd wedi digwydd ym maes iechyd

have happened with the GPs who, in reality, as we all know, are private contractors. However, when I look at the cost of PFI schemes in healthcare provision across the border and see hospitals costing up to 10 times as much over the life of a PFI scheme as they would have cost had they been funded through a more traditional model, I think that our Government has made the right decision.

Jenny Randerson: Will you give way?

Helen Mary Jones: I am sorry, Jenny, I will give way in a moment.

I am very glad that the Government has produced an effective rural health plan. It is very important for many of us who represent rural areas. I do not think that we would call Llanelli a rural area, but I have also been an Assembly Member for Mid and West Wales. It has been very important to have a health plan in place that acknowledges the differences and the challenges in providing healthcare and other public services—but in this case, particularly health care—in rural areas. I think that it has been right to end the internal market, which was a costly and complex bureaucracy—we would, of course, expect Jenny Randerson to defend it, since her party was in Government when it was brought into being. I acknowledge fully that there is more to be done to demonstrate how cost-effective that reform can be. It is not just about saving money, however. We now have a health service that is accountable to people that the people of Wales can sack: not to faceless bureaucrats, but to politicians. I am glad of that. As I have said, the service does face challenges, but I would argue strongly that it is better placed to face those challenges than it would otherwise have been.

4.50 p.m.

Others have spoken about some of what has been done in relation to the economy. I do not think that any of us would have expected to hear the Trades Union Congress, the

cymunedol, ond mae'r rheini wedi digwydd gyda'r meddygon teulu, ac mewn gwirionedd, fel yr ydym oll yn gwybod, contractwyr preifat ydynt hwy. Fodd bynnag, pan edrychaf ar gost cynlluniau PFI ym maes darparu gofal iechyd dros y ffin a gweld ysbytai'n costio hyd at 10 gwaith cymaint dros oes cynllun PFI nag y byddent wedi'u costio o gael eu hariannu drwy gyfrwng model mwy traddodiadol, credaf fod ein Llywodraeth wedi gwneud y penderfyniad cywir.

Jenny Randerson: A wnewch ildio?

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Jenny, ildiaf mewn munud.

Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod y Llywodraeth wedi cynhyrchu cynllun iechyd gwledig effeithiol. Mae'n bwysig iawn i lawer ohonom sy'n cynrychioli ardaloedd gwledig. Ni chredaf y byddem yn galw Llanelli'n ardal wledig, ond yr wyf hefyd wedi bod yn Aelod Cynulliad dros y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Mae wedi bod yn bwysig iawn sicrhau cynllun iechyd sy'n cydnabod y gwahaniaethau a'r heriau o ran darparu gofal iechyd a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill—ond yn yr achos hwn, gofal iechyd yn enwedig—mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Credaf y bu'n benderfyniad da diweddu'r farchnad fewnol, a oedd yn fiwrocratiaeth gostus a chymhleth—wrth gwrs, byddem yn disgwyl i Jenny Randerson ei hamddiffyn, gan fod ei phlaid hi yn y Llywodraeth pan gafodd ei sefydlu. Cydnabyddaf yn llawn fod angen gwneud mwy i ddangos pa mor gost-effeithiol y gall y diwygiad hwnnw fod. Nid mater o arbed arian yn unig ydyw, fodd bynnag. Nawr, mae gennym wasanaeth iechyd sy'n atebol i bobl y gall pobl Cymru eu diswyddo: nid biwrocratiaid diwyneb, ond gwleidyddion. Yr wyf yn falch o hynny. Fel y dywedais, mae'r gwasanaeth yn wynebu heriau, ond byddwn yn dadlau'n gryf ei fod mewn gwell sefyllfa i wynebu'r heriau hynny nag y byddai wedi bod fel arall.

Mae eraill wedi sôn am rywfaint o'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud mewn perthynas â'r economi. Ni chredaf y byddai neb ohonom wedi disgwyl clywed Cyngres yr Undebau

Confederation of British Industry and the Federation of Small Businesses in Wales say that a Plaid Cymru and Labour Government has done a better job of helping businesses to face the recession than the Government at a UK level, but that is what they have said. Jeff Cuthbert has already referred to the ProAct and ReAct schemes. The ProAct scheme has kept hundreds of people in their jobs in my constituency alone, and those are good quality, relatively well-paid jobs in sectors such as the manufacturing sector. On the economy, the Government has also been prepared to move towards preparing for the future—there is the new economic renewal programme, the green jobs strategy, and the rural development plan, which is very important to our rural communities. We have to acknowledge that there is still much more to be done with regard to child poverty and I do not think that anyone would doubt that for a moment. I certainly do not think that our Ministers would. However, I, for one, am not prepared to take any lessons on child poverty from the Liberal Democrats or the Conservatives, given the effect that their proposed changes to benefits are likely to have on the 5,000 families in Cardiff alone who are likely to have to move from their homes because of the cuts in housing benefit. I am proud that our Government has made a commitment to enshrine the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in Welsh law, and is making moves towards that; we are the first country in these islands to do so.

This has been a Government based on two parties being ready to find genuine common ground. The parties have governed, as the First Minister has said, in a principled manner, and the Government has placed, and is placing, the protection of the vulnerable at its heart. I believe that we have some consensus in that regard across the Chamber. The people of Wales will decide next May what kind of Government they want for the future, and they may look across the border to help them judge those who oppose this Government.

Alun Davies: Like others, I will focus on the economic legacy that will be left by this

Llafur, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yng Nghymru'n dweud bod Llywodraeth Plaid Cymru a Llafur wedi gwneud gwaith gwell o helpu busnesau i wynebu'r dirwasgiad na'r Llywodraeth ar lefel y DU, ond dyna a ddywedasant. Mae Jeff Cuthbert eisoes wedi cyfeirio at y cynlluniau ProAct a ReAct. Mae'r cynllun ProAct wedi cadw cannoedd o bobl yn eu swyddi yn fy etholaeth yn unig, ac mae'r rheini'n swyddi o ansawdd da am dâl cymharol uchel mewn sectorau megis y sector gweithgynhyrchu. O ran yr economi, mae'r Llywodraeth hefyd wedi bod yn fodlon symud tuag at baratoi am y dyfodol—ceir y rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd newydd, y strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd, a'r cynllun datblygu gwledig, sy'n bwysig iawn i'n cymunedau gwledig. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod llawer mwy i'w wneud o hyd o ran tlodi plant ac ni chredaf y byddai neb yn amau hynny am ennyd. Yn sicr, ni chredaf y byddai ein Gweinidogion yn gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf fi'n fodlon cymryd unrhyw wersi am dlodi plant gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol na'r Ceidwadwyr, ac ystyried yr effaith y mae eu newidiadau arfaethedig i fudd-daliadau'n debygol o'i chael ar y 5,000 o deuluoedd yng Nghaerdydd yn unig sy'n debygol o orfod symud o'u cartrefi oherwydd y toriadau i fudd-dal tai. Yr wyf yn falch bod ein Llywodraeth wedi ymrwmo i gynnwys Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn yng nghyfraith Cymru, ac yn cymryd camau tuag at hynny; ni yw'r wlad gyntaf yn yr ynysoedd hyn i wneud hynny.

Bu'r Llywodraeth hon yn seiliedig ar barodrwydd dwy blaid i ganfod tir cyffredin gwirioneddol. Mae'r pleidiau wedi llywodraethu, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, mewn modd egwyddorol, ac mae'r Llywodraeth wedi pwysleisio amddiffyn pobl agored i niwed, ac mae'n dal i wneud hynny. Credaf fod gennym rywffaint o gonsensws ar draws y Siambr yn hynny o beth. Fis Mai nesaf, bydd pobl Cymru'n penderfynu pa fath o Lywodraeth yr hoffent yn y dyfodol, ac efallai yr edrychant dros y ffin i'w helpu i farnu'r rheini sy'n gwrthwynebu'r Llywodraeth hon.

Alun Davies: Fel erail, canolbwyntiaf ar yr etifeddiaeth economaidd a adewir gan y

Government when it leaves office in May. When the 'One Wales' agreement was made back in the early summer of 2007, there was a focus on the politics of it, and on the novel situation confronting Plaid Cymru and the Labour Party in creating a programme for government. There was also—we have heard echoes of it this afternoon from opposition benches—a questioning of the deliverability of some of the commitments made in it. We understand and accept that. However, when we look back at this Government in years to come, it will be the response to the economic crisis of 2008 that will define it and its success. No-one anticipated—I do not think that anyone could have—the economic hurricane that came across the Atlantic to this country and to other European countries in the autumn of 2008—[*Interruption.*] You can intervene if you want, Angela. No-one foresaw that economic crisis in 2008. However, this Government was tested under the most trying circumstances and demonstrated that it was able to lead and articulate a response to that economic crisis that went beyond simply individual policies, but demonstrated an approach to government and a philosophical approach to an economic crisis that will bear comparison with any elsewhere.

Rhodri Morgan: As *The Guardian* said.

Alun Davies: That is absolutely right. [*Laughter.*] You are right; perhaps I should just sit down and allow you to intervene for the next five minutes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Alun Davies: The other aspect of this was a partnership that we enjoyed with the then Westminster Government. The pre-budget report in October 2008 laid down and created a financial framework for the way in which we were able to respond to the economic crisis. The capital investment projects that were brought forward—around £350 million for 19 different projects—were able to lever in £700 million to the Welsh economy. That money was spent keeping people in jobs, maintaining livelihoods and investing in an economic response to the crisis. I remember the debates that we had here at that time; I

Llywodraeth hon pan fydd yn gadael ym mis Mai. Pan wnaethpwyd y cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn ôl ar ddechrau haf 2007, cafwyd ffocws ar ei wleidyddiaeth, ac ar y sefyllfa anarferol a oedd yn wynebu Plaid Cymru a'r Blaid Lafur o ran creu rhaglen lywodraethu. Cafwyd hefyd—a chlywsom atseiniau o hyn brynhawn heddiw o feinciau'r wrthblaid—gwestiynu a fyddai modd cyflenwi rhai o'r ymrwymadau. Yr ydym yn deall hynny ac yn derbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, pan edrychwn yn ôl ar y Llywodraeth hon yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, ei hymateb i argyfwng economaidd 2008 fydd yn ei diffinio hi a'i llwyddiant. Ni ragwelodd neb—ni chredaf y gallasai neb fod wedi gwneud—y corwynt economaidd a groesodd yr Iwerydd i'r wlad hon ac i wledydd eraill yn Ewrop yn hydref 2008—[*Torri ar draws.*] Cewch ymyrryd os hoffwch, Angela. Ni ragwelodd neb yr argyfwng economaidd hwnnw yn 2008. Fodd bynnag, cafodd y Llywodraeth hon ei phrofi dan yr amgylchiadau anoddaf a dangosodd ei gallu i arwain a ffurfio ymateb i'r argyfwng economaidd hwnnw a aeth y tu hwnt i bolisiau unigol, gan ddangos dull llywodraethu ac ymagwedd bwyllog at argyfwng economaidd y gellid ei chymharu ag unrhyw un yn unrhyw le arall.

Rhodri Morgan: Fel y dywedodd *The Guardian*.

Alun Davies: Yn union. [*Chwerthin.*] Yr ydych yn gywir; efallai y dylwn eistedd a gadael i chi dorri ar draws am y pum munud nesaf.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Alun Davies: Yr agwedd arall ar hyn oedd y bartneriaeth yr oeddem yn ei mwynhau â Llywodraeth San Steffan ar y pryd. Yn adroddiad cyn cyllideb mis Hydref 2008, gosodwyd a chrëwyd fframwaith ariannol y gallem ei ddefnyddio i ymateb i'r argyfwng economaidd. Llwyddodd y prosiectau buddsoddi cyfalaf a ddygwyd ymlaen—tua £350 miliwn ar gyfer 19 prosiect—i ddod â £700 miliwn i economi Cymru. Gwariwyd yr arian hwnnw ar gadw pobl mewn swyddi, cynnal bywoliaethau a buddsoddi mewn ymateb economaidd i'r argyfwng. Cofiaf y dadleuon a gawsom yma ar y pryd; cofiaf yn

remember very well speaking in those debates, and I remember the silence from the parties opposite—from the opposition benches. Occasionally, they would say that they agreed with the Minister, but no alternatives at all were articulated by any of the opposition parties at any time.

David Melding *rose*—

Alun Davies: Do you want to intervene? No, you do not. Oh, you will.

David Melding: The reason why we really get tested in a crisis is that the long-term endurance of the economy is then shown to be what it really is. In many years, the administration, led under the sort of latter-day Roosevelt that you have been referring to—Rhodri Morgan—had not done anything to increase the inner wealth of this nation by increasing the size of the private sector. That is why we got knocked for six.

Alun Davies: David, if you look at some of the statistics that have been published—I accept that they are prior to the crisis of two years ago—you will see that the private sector has grown over the period of devolution and that more jobs have been created in the private sector than in the public sector over that period. That is the reality of the picture that we are painting. However, it is little wonder that the parties opposite were unable to articulate a response. Looking back through the records of that time, I came across a particularly sad personality called Philip Hammond, who was the Tory shadow Chief Secretary to the Treasury at the time. On 27 October 2008, in the morning, he suggested that increasing borrowing was not a strategy for dealing with the recession. By the time that the evening news was being broadcast, he had decided that to increase borrowing to deal with an economic downturn was a perfectly sensible thing to do. If that is the sort of economic strategy that they were being led on by their colleagues in Westminster, it is little wonder that the people here were unable to articulate any intelligent response to the economic storm that we saw in 2008.

Today, as it comes to the end of its time in office, we see the Government continuing to

iaawn imi siarad yn y dadleuon hynny, a chofiaf y tawelwch o'r pleidiau gyferbyn—o feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau. Yn achlysurol, byddent yn dweud eu bod yn cytuno â'r Gweinidog, ond ni chynigiwyd unrhyw ddewisiadau amgen gan unrhyw un o'r gwrthbleidiau ar unrhyw adeg.

David Melding *a gododd*—

Alun Davies: A ydych am ymyrryd? Nac ydych. O, yr ydych yn mynd i wneud.

David Melding: Y rheswm pam y cawn ein profi mewn gwirionedd mewn argyfwng yw ei fod yn datgelu gwir wytnwch hirdymor yr economi. Mewn llawer o flynyddoedd, ni wnaeth y weinyddiaeth, dan arweiniad rhyw fath o Roosevelt modern yr ydych wedi cyfeirio ato—Rhodri Morgan—ddim byd i gynyddu cyfoeth mewnol y genedl hon drwy gynyddu maint y sector preifat. Dyna pam y cawsom ein llorio.

Alun Davies: David, os edrychwch ar rai o'r ystadegau sydd wedi cael eu cyhoeddi—derbyniaf fod y rhain cyn yr argyfwng ddwy flynedd yn ôl—gwelwch fod y sector preifat wedi tyfu dros gyfnod datganoli a bod mwy o swyddi wedi cael eu creu yn y sector preifat nag yn y sector cyhoeddus dros y cyfnod hwnnw. Dyna realaeth y darlun yr ydym yn ei beintio. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n syndod na allodd y pleidiau gyferbyn roi ymateb. Wrth edrych drwy gofnodion y cyfnod hwnnw, sylwais ar bersonoliaeth arbennig o drist o'r enw Philip Hammond, sef Prif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys yr wrthblaid, y Torïaid, ar y pryd. Ar 27 Hydref 2008, yn y bore, awgrymodd nad oedd cynyddu benthyca'n strategaeth i ddelio â'r dirwasgiad. Erbyn amser darlledu'r newyddion y noswaith honno, yr oedd wedi penderfynu bod cynyddu benthyca i ddelio â dirywiad economaidd yn beth cwbl synhwyrol i'w wneud. Os mai dyna'r math o strategaeth economaidd oedd yn eu harwain gan eu cydweithwyr yn San Steffan, nid yw'n syndod na allai'r bobl yn y fan hyn roi unrhyw ymateb deallus i'r storm economaidd a welsom yn 2008.

Heddiw, wrth i'w chyfnod mewn grym ddirwyn i ben, gwelwn y Llywodraeth yn

respond to the economic times, but, unfortunately, we see no partnership from Westminster. The respect agenda did not last as long as the cricket season. Yesterday, in the Finance Committee, we saw that the new Chief Secretary to the Treasury has very little knowledge of anything that affects us here in Wales.

In closing, I believe that the economic renewal programme demonstrates that this One Wales Government is coming to the end of its term of office, determined, full of ideas for the future, and continuing to invest in the future of the Welsh economy.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Hoffwn ddechrau drwy gyfeirio at gynnwys y gwelliannau i gynnig heddiw. Hoffwn gyfeirio hefyd at rai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn ystod y ddadl. Er gwaethaf yr ensyniad yng ngwelliannau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a sylwadau Peter Black wrth eu cyflwyno, llwyddodd y gwasanaeth iechyd i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i ostwng amseroedd aros i 26 wythnos ym mis Rhagfyr 2009 a phob mis wedi hynny hyd at Fedi 2010. Gwnaethpwyd hynny gyda'r goddefiad cydnabyddedig o 5 y cant ar lwybrau agored er mwyn caniatáu ar gyfer achosion sy'n gymhleth yn glinigol a materion sy'n ymwneud â dewisiadau cleifion.

O ran y gwelliant ar unedau tai fforddiadwy, erbyn mis Rhagfyr y llynedd yr oeddem eisoes wedi sicrhau 4,235 uned, gydag arian ychwanegol o'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol. Yr ydym yn ffyddiog ein bod yn dal ar y trywydd iawn i gyrraedd y targed o 6,500 uned. Mae hynny er gwaethaf cyfraniad llai gan y sector preifat nag y byddai unrhyw un wedi gallu ei ddisgwyl yn ôl yn 2007.

Andrew R.T. Davies: How can you say that you have met the waiting time targets when the 26 to 36-week wait time went up by 287 per cent in September this year and the over-36-week wait time went up by a staggering 5,000 per cent, from 35 in January to 1,774? How can you say that? They are your own figures, Minister.

5.00 p.m.

parhau i ymateb i'r adegau economaidd, ond, yn anffodus, ni welwn ddim partneriaeth o San Steffan. Ni pharodd yr agenda parch cyn hired â'r tymor criced. Ddoe, yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid, gwelsom nad oes gan Brif Ysgrifennydd newydd y Trysorlys brin ddim gwybodaeth am unrhyw beth sy'n effeithio arnom yma yng Nghymru.

I orffen, credaf fod y rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd yn dangos bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn dod at ddiwedd ei thymor, yn benderfynol, yn llawn syniadau ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac yn parhau i fuddsoddi yn nyfodol economi Cymru.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): I would like to start by referring to the contents of the amendments to today's motion. I would also like to refer to some of the points that have arisen during the debate. Despite what is implied in the Liberal Democrats' amendments and in Peter Black's comments in presenting them, the health service succeeded in achieving the commitment in 'One Wales' to reduce waiting times to 26 weeks in December 2009 and in every subsequent month up to September 2010. That has been done with the recognised 5 per cent tolerance on open pathways to allow for clinically complex cases and patient choice issues.

With regard to the amendment on affordable housing units, by December last year we had already delivered 4,235 units, with additional money from the strategic capital investment fund. We believe that we are still on track to deliver the target of 6,500 units. That is despite a smaller private sector contribution than anyone could have expected in 2007.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Sut y gallwch ddweud eich bod wedi cyrraedd y targedau amser aros pan aeth yr amser aros 26 i 36 wythnos i fyny 287 y cant ym mis Medi eleni a'r amser aros dros 36 wythnos i fyny 5,000 y cant, sy'n ffigur anhygoel, o 35 ym mis Ionawr i 1,774? Sut y gallwch ddweud hynny? Eich ffigurau chi ydynt, Weinidog.

Elin Jones: Yr wyf wedi rhoi'r ffigurau yn fy ymateb ac maent wedi'u cydnabod. Yn unol â'r ymrwymiad yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', yr ydym wedi buddsoddi, ac yn parhau i fuddsoddi, i wella adeiladau ysgolion. Bydd £693 miliwn yn cael ei ddarparu yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn, ac mae'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol hefyd wedi rhoi hwb o £81.3 miliwn i'r gyllideb hon. Felly, bydd cyfanswm o £774 miliwn yn cael ei ddarparu yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn.

Soniodd y Prif Weinidog eisoes am ein gweledigaeth unigryw a chydweithredol ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac, i roi ychydig o enghreifftiau yn unig i chi o'n strategaeth yn y maes hwn, yr ydym wedi gwneud arbedion sylweddol ym maes technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfrifiadurol yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy eu prynu'n fwy effeithlon. Mae gwasanaeth iechyd Cymru, er enghraifft, ar y cyd â nifer o awdurdodau lleol a sefydliadau addysg uwch, eisoes wedi arbed tua £5 miliwn drwy brosiect cydgasglu band eang y sector cyhoeddus. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda'n partneriaid i ddod o hyd i ffyrdd newydd o ddylunio gwasanaethau. Er enghraifft, mae timau integredig yn darparu cymorth wedi'i dargedu i deuluoedd sydd ag anghenion cymhleth yn Nhor-faen. Maent eisoes wedi arbed bron i £12 miliwn drwy helpu teuluoedd yn y gymuned a thrwy leihau'r angen i droi at y gwasanaethau gofal. Wrth reswm, mae lle i wella drwy'r amser, a'n bwriad ni yw sbarduno rhagor o welliant yn hyn o beth.

A symud ymlaen at y pwyntiau a godwyd yn ystod y ddadl ac sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i'r gwelliannau, rhoddodd Jenny Randerson restr o feirniadaethau ar rai o'r ymrwymadau yn 'Cymru'n Un' a'n gweithrediadau. Yn gyntaf, cafwyd beirniadaeth o'r cynllun peilot ar gyfer gliadiuron. Efallai yr hoffai Jenny Randerson ddod ar ymweliad gyda mi i ysgol yn fy etholaeth i, neu mewn etholaethau eraill, sy'n rhan o'r cynllun peilot hwn ac sy'n gwerthfawrogi hynny, a sôn wrth y plant a'r ysgol sy'n elwa o'r cynllun am ei beirniadaeth bod y cynllun yn wastraff.

Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn falch o fod wedi cael gwared ar y farchnad breifat yn y

Elin Jones: I have included the figures in my response and those are recognised. In accordance with the commitment in the 'One Wales' agreement, we have invested, and will continue to invest, in improving school buildings. During the lifetime of this Assembly, £693 million will be provided, and the strategic capital investment fund has also enhanced this budget by £81.3 million. Therefore, a total of £774 million will be provided during this third Assembly.

The First Minister has already talked about our distinctive and collaborative vision for public services and, to provide you with just a few examples of our strategy in this area, we have made significant savings in the field of information technology and computing in public services by purchasing more efficiently. The national health service, for example, alongside several local authorities and higher education institutions, have already saved some £5 million through the public sector broadband aggregation programme. We are also working with our partners to find new ways of designing services. For instance, integrated teams are providing targeted support for families who have complex needs in Torfaen. They have already saved almost £12 million by helping families in the community and by reducing the need for placements with care services. Naturally, there is always room for improvement, and our intention is to drive forward further improvements in this regard.

To move on to the points that were raised during the debate and which go beyond the amendments, Jenny Randerson gave us a list of criticisms of some of the commitments in 'One Wales' and our actions. First, there was her criticism of the pilot scheme for laptops. Perhaps Jenny would like to come on a visit with me to a school in my constituency or in other constituencies that is a part of this pilot scheme and appreciates that, and tell the children and the school that are benefiting from it about her criticism that the scheme is a waste of money.

As a Government, we are proud of the fact that we have got rid of the private market in

GIG ac o gadw cyllid preifat allan o'r gwasanaeth. Mae lle i dyfu busnesau preifat ar hyd a lled Cymru. Dyna ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog, a dyna yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth am ei weld. Fodd bynnag, nid o fewn y GIG nac ar draul y GIG y mae gwneud hynny.

Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn gytundeb blaengar ond ymarferol, fel y dywedodd Jeff Cuthbert. Wrth inni nesáu at ddiwedd y Llywodraeth hon, gwelwn fod mwyafrif helaeth yr ymrwymadau wedi'u cyflawni, a hynny er gwaethaf amgylchiadau allanol fel y dirwasgiad byd-eang, toriadau i'n cyllideb o fewn tymor 'Cymru'n Un', ac ambell benderfyniad gan lys barn sydd wedi effeithio ar ambell ymrwymiad, gan gynnwys un amlwg yn fy mhortffolio i.

Mae 'Cymru'n Un' wedi cyflawni y tu hwnt i bortffolios penodol. Mae refferendwm fis Mawrth nesaf yn digwydd oherwydd ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un', er bod y gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yma yn dyngedfennol i sicrhau pleidlais 'ie', fel y clywsom gan Nick Bourne. Yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol honno. Oherwydd 'Cymru'n Un' hefyd y gwnaeth comisiwn annibynnol Holtham argymhell yn ddigamsyniol y dylid adolygu fformiwla Barnett ac, yn ddiweddarach, y dylid edrych hefyd ar bwerau trethiannol i'r Cynulliad. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, yn ogystal â'r ddwy wrthblaid, o blaid adolygu fformiwla Barnett. Bu'r daith hon yn un go sylweddol i'r Torïaid ei chefnogi. Yn y Cynulliad yn 2001, yr oedd Nick Bourne yn rhybuddio y byddai busnesau yn heidio o Gymru i Loegr pe cynhelid adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett. Mae ei safbwynt wedi newid erbyn heddiw, ac yr ydym yn croesawu hynny. A bod yn deg â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am eiliad, maent wedi bod yn gyson o blaid diwygio fformiwla Barnett.

The Liberal Democrats have been consistent on Barnett reform over the past 10 years—that is, until yesterday. They were consistent until they reached Government at Westminster.

Jenny Randerson: The Liberal Democrats are still consistent on that issue. Do you

the NHS and have kept private finance out of the service. There is room to grow private businesses throughout Wales. That is what the First Minister said, and that is what we as a Government want to see. However, that should not be done within the NHS or at its expense.

'One Wales' is a progressive yet practical agreement, as Jeff Cuthbert said. As we approach the end of this period of Government, we see that the vast majority of the commitments have been achieved, despite the external circumstances such as the global recession, the cuts to our budget within the term of 'One Wales', and the occasional court judgment affecting some commitments, including one notable one in my portfolio.

'One Wales' has achieved beyond the boundaries of individual portfolios. The referendum is to take place next March as a result of a 'One Wales' commitment, although the cross-party support here was crucial to securing a 'yes' vote, as we heard from Nick Bourne. We appreciate that cross-party support. It was also because of 'One Wales' that the independent Holtham commission recommended unequivocally that the Barnett formula should be reviewed and, later, that taxation powers should be considered for the Assembly. The One Wales Government, in addition to the two opposition parties, is in favour of a review of the Barnett formula. It has been quite a journey for the Tories to come to support that. In the Assembly in 2001, Nick Bourne warned that businesses would flock from Wales to England if such a review of the Barnett formula were held. His standpoint has changed since then, and we welcome that. To be fair to the Liberal Democrats for a moment, they have been consistently in favour of reforming the Barnett formula.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi bod yn gyson am ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf—tan ddoe, hynny yw. Yr oeddent yn gyson nes iddynt gyrraedd Llywodraeth San Steffan.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dal i fod yn gyson ar y mater

acknowledge the inconsistency within Nationalist ranks in that you, as a party, are completely consistent on the issue but your cousins in Scotland are totally opposed to it?

Elin Jones: Plaid Cymru and the Scottish National Party are not one and the same party. I think that you will find that the Liberal Democrats here and at Westminster are part of one and the same party. Danny Alexander, the Liberal Democrat UK Government Treasury Minister, came to the Assembly yesterday to say 'no' to Barnett reform. However, guess who said this on 6 February 2010?

'The Barnett Formula is completely outdated, and it's simply not fair...It's time—finally—for a fair deal for Wales.'

Those were the words of Nick Clegg MP. Another Lib Dem election promise well and truly dumped to the detriment of the people of Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that there is objection. Therefore, I defer all voting on this item until voting time.

As we have finished the business of the day, I intend to proceed to voting time. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Does anyone wish to have the bell rung? I see that no-one wishes the bell to be rung.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4593: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 1 to NDM4593: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick

hwnnw. A ydych yn cydnabod yr anghysondeb ymysg y Cenedlaetholwyr sef eich bod chi, fel plaid, yn gwbl gyson am y mater ond bod eich cefndryd yn yr Alban yn ei wrthwynebu'n llwyr?

Elin Jones: Nid yr un blaid yw Plaid Cymru a'r Scottish National Party. Credaf y gwelwch fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yma ac yn San Steffan yn perthyn i'r un blaid. Daeth Danny Alexander, y Democrat Rhyddfrydol sy'n Weinidog Trysorlys Llywodraeth y DU, i'r Cynulliad ddoe i ddweud 'na' wrth ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett. Fodd bynnag, dyfalwch pwy a ddywedodd hyn ar 6 Chwefror 2010?

Mae Fformiwla Barnett wedi dyddio, ac yn syml, mae'n annheg...Mae'n bryd—o'r diwedd—am fargen deg i Gymru.

Geiriau Nick Clegg AS oedd y rheini. Un arall o addewidion etholiad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a gafodd ei thafllu o'r neilltu er anfantais i bobl Cymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno â gwelliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad. Felly, gohiriaf bob pleidleisio am yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Gan ein bod wedi gorffen busnes y dydd, bwriadaf symud ymlaen i'r cyfnod pleidleisio. A yw unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. A hoffai unrhyw un i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes neb am i'r gloch gael ei chanu.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny

Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4593: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2 to NDM4593: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Veronica
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4593: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
 Amendment 3 to NDM4593: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Veronica
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM4593 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM4593 as amended:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru *To propose that the National Assembly for Wales*

yn nodi 'Uchelgeisiau i'r dyfodol: datblygu gwasanaethau gyrfaedd yng Nghymru' ac yn croesawu cynnig Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sefydlu strwythur sy'n uno ar gyfer Gyrfaedd Cymru. *Notes 'Future Ambitions: developing careers services in Wales' and welcomes the Assembly Government's proposal to establish a unifying structure for Careers Wales.*

Yn credu bod yn rhaid rhoi cyngor gyrfa heb ragfarn ac er budd y myfyriwr. *Believes that careers advice must be given without bias and for the good of the student.*

Cynnig NDM4593 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 37, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion NDM4593 as amended: For 37, Abstain 11, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Veronica
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bourne, Nick
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul

Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4593 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
 Motion NDM4593 as amended agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4592: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
 Amendment 1 to NDM4592: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Veronica
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4592: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
 Amendment 2 to NDM4592: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun

Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Veronica
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny

Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4592: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
 Amendment 3 to NDM4592: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Veronica
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4592: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 4 to NDM4592: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4592: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.
Motion NDM4592: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David

Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's business to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.10 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.10 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democrat Rhyddfrydol Annibynnol – Independent Liberal Democrat)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Veronica (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)

Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)