



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 23 Mai 2002**

**Thursday 23 May 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau  
*Questions on Local Government to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities*
- 13 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd  
*Questions to the Minister for Environment*
- 23 Datganiad ar y Trefniadau i Roi Cyswllt Ffermio ar Waith  
*Statement on the Implementation of Farming Connect*
- 33 Datganiad ar Broffesiynau Iechyd Cymru  
*Statement on Health Professions Wales*
- 44 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 45 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cyngor Datblygu Garddwriaeth (Diwygio) 2002  
*Approval of the Horticultural Development Council (Amendment) Order 2002*
- 46 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Cronfeydd Strwythurol  
*Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Structural Funds*
- 79 Dadl Fer: Tai Da; Cymru Dda  
*Short Debate: Good Housing; Good Wales*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau**  
**Questions on Local Government to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities**

**Cynllun Hawl i Brynu  
Right to Buy Scheme**

**Q1 Janet Davies:** How many local authority houses were sold under the right to buy scheme during 2000-01 and 2001-02? (OAQ17807)

**C1 Janet Davies:** Faint o dai awdurdodau lleol a werthwyd o dan y cynllun hawl i brynu yn ystod 2000-01 a 2001-02? (OAQ17807)

**Q3 Janet Davies:** How does the stock transfer process affect the right to buy scheme? (OAQ17806)

**C3 Janet Davies:** Sut y mae'r broses drosglwyddo stoc yn effeithio ar y cynllun hawl i brynu? (OAQ17806)

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I am grateful to you, Presiding Officer, for agreeing to the request that these questions be taken together.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi, Lywydd, am gytuno i'r cais am gymryd y cwestiynau hyn gyda'i gilydd.

Local authorities sold around 3,400 dwellings under the right to buy scheme during 2000-01. Information up to December 2001 suggests a similar number of sales during 2001-02. I will disseminate the information to Members when it becomes available. Secure tenants of local authorities have the right to buy. Following a stock transfer, the right to buy is preserved, enabling tenants of the new landlord to purchase their homes if they wish.

Gwerthodd yr awdurdodau lleol tua 3,400 o anheddau dan y cynllun hawl i brynu yn ystod 2000-01. Mae'r wybodaeth hyd at Ragfyr 2001 yn awgrymu bod nifer debyg wedi'i gwerthu yn ystod 2001-02. Dosbarthaf yr wybodaeth i'r Aelodau pan fydd ar gael. Mae tenantiaid diogel yr awdurdodau lleol yn meddu ar yr hawl i brynu. Ar ôl trosglwyddo stoc, cedwir yr hawl i brynu, fel y gall tenantiaid y landlord newydd brynu eu cartrefi os dymunant.

**Janet Davies:** I have heard some anecdotal evidence that suggests that sales are increasing due to fears about stock transfer. What steps are you taking to explain the community mutual model to local authorities, so that they can explain it to tenants?

**Janet Davies:** Yr wyf wedi clywed peth tystiolaeth anecdotaidd sy'n awgrymu bod cynnydd yn y gwerthu oherwydd ofnau ynghylch trosglwyddo stoc. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i egluro'r model cydfuddiannol cymunedol i'r awdurdodau lleol, fel y gallant ei egluro i'r tenantiaid?

**Edwina Hart:** The National Assembly has launched the community mutual model, and many local government housing departments have already held discussions with officials. I will see what further work can be undertaken with Welsh local government on this, and will examine the trends of the right to buy scheme to see whether I can substantiate any

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi lansio'r model cydfuddiannol cymunedol, ac mae llawer o adrannau tai llywodraeth leol wedi cynnal trafodaethau â swyddogion eisoes. Caf weld pa waith pellach y gellir ei wneud gyda llywodraeth leol Cymru ar hyn, ac archwiliaf dueddiadau'r cynllun hawl i brynu i weld a

of the rumours that have reached you.

allaf gadarnhau unrhyw un o'r sion sydd wedi'ch cyrraedd.

**Janet Davies:** I have referred to the fear of stock transfer, and the danger that it can drive people into right to buy purchases when they have insufficient funds to cope with maintaining their homes and keeping up mortgage repayments. Have you any plans to deal with that by declaring areas of renewal, for example?

**Janet Davies:** Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at yr ofn ynghylch trosglwyddo stoc, a'r perygl y gall yrru pobl i brynu dan y cynllun hawl i brynu a hwythau heb ddigon o arian i ymdopi â chynnal eu cartrefi a pharhau â'u had-daliadau morgais. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i ddelio â hynny drwy gyhoeddi ardaloedd adnewyddu, er enghraifft?

**Edwina Hart:** I will consider that. I have not received any indication—from my officials or from Welsh local government—that that is occurring. As a result of your questions today, I will consider it in detail, and will report any information to the Local Government and Housing Committee.

**Edwina Hart:** Ystyriaf hynny. Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw hysbysiad—gan fy swyddogion neu gan lywodraeth leol Cymru—fod hynny'n digwydd. O ganlyniad i'ch cwestiynau heddiw, fe'i hystyriaf yn fanwl, a rhoddaf wybod am unrhyw wybodaeth i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai.

**William Graham:** Will you confirm that the continuing aspiration of the overwhelming majority of people in Wales is to own their own homes, and that the right to buy scheme has been the most effective way of allowing people to realise that aspiration?

**William Graham:** A wnewch gadarnhau mai dyhead y mwyafrif llethol o bobl yng Nghymru o hyd yw cael bod yn berchen ar eu cartrefi eu hunain, ac mai'r cynllun hawl i brynu fu'r dull mwyaf effeithiol o ganiatáu i bobl wireddu'r dyhead hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** The right to buy scheme has been a success in some areas. However, I would not assume that everybody wants to own their own home; it is perfectly acceptable to want to rent. Maximisation of choice in the housing market is the issue.

**Edwina Hart:** Bu'r cynllun hawl i brynu'n llwyddiant mewn rhai ardaloedd. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn rhagdybio bod pawb am fod yn berchen ar ei gartref ei hun; mae'n gwbl dderbyniol dymuno rhentu. Amlhau'r dewis yn y farchnad dai yw'r mater dan sylw.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I have some reservations about the right to buy scheme in principle. I know that we are in this situation and that some people like to buy, but it has left local councils devastated in terms of the amount of affordable housing that they have available to rent to people.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae gennyf rai amheuan am y cynllun hawl i brynu mewn egwyddor. Gwn ein bod yn y sefyllfa hon a bod rhai pobl am gael prynu, ond mae wedi andwyo'r cynghorau lleol o ran y nifer o dai fforddiadwy sydd ar gael ganddynt i'w gosod ar rent.

**Edwina Hart:** Some areas have difficulties, Lorraine, but we must also be aware that there are a considerable number of housing stock voids across Welsh local government.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae rhai ardaloedd yn profi anawsterau, Lorraine, ond rhaid inni gofio hefyd fod nifer sylweddol o dai gwag yn y stoc dai ar draws llywodraeth leol Cymru.

**David Melding:** Do you agree with the Welsh Conservative Party that right to buy has been a great success? It has been confirmed as such for over 20 years, because tenants still want to use it. Is it not essential that that right is not only preserved but promoted actively?

**David Melding:** A ydych yn cytuno â Phlaid Geidwadol Cymru bod yr hawl i brynu wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr? Cadarnhawyd hynny am fwy nag 20 mlynedd, gan fod y tenantiaid yn dal i ddymuno'i defnyddio. Onid yw'n hollbwysig nid yn unig cadw'r hawl honno ond hefyd ei hyrwyddo'n egniol?

**Edwina Hart:** Individuals who have been long-standing tenants of local authorities have enjoyed the right to buy scheme, and have decided to remain in the areas where they first rented. In that narrow arena, I regard it as a success.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae unigolion a fu'n denantiaid hir-sefydlog i'r awdurdodau lleol wedi defnyddio'r cynllun hawl i brynu, ac wedi penderfynu aros yn yr ardaloedd lle yr oeddent yn rhentu'n gyntaf. Yn y maes cyfyng hwnnw, fe'i hystyriaif yn llwyddiant.

### **Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf (Gorllewin y Rhyl a De-orllewin y Rhyl) Communities First (Rhyl West and Rhyl South West)**

**Q2 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement about the Communities First programme in Rhyl West and Rhyl South West? (OAQ17798)

**C2 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yng Ngorllewin y Rhyl a De-orllewin y Rhyl? (OAQ17798)

**Edwina Hart:** In June 2001, I announced the first tranche of areas for inclusion in the programme, including Rhyl West and Rhyl South West in Denbighshire. I am concerned about the slow progress that is being made in taking Communities First forward in Rhyl, particularly in view of the severe deprivation that exists there.

**Edwina Hart:** Ym Mehefin 2001, cyhoeddais y garfan gyntaf o ardaloedd i'w cynnwys yn y rhaglen, gan gynnwys Gorllewin y Rhyl a De-orllewin y Rhyl yn sir Ddinbych. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y cynnydd araf a fu wrth fwrw ymlaen â Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn y Rhyl, yn enwedig yng ngolwg yr amddifadedd difrifol sy'n bodoli yno.

**Ann Jones:** I need not highlight the deprivation in Rhyl; the position of its wards on the index of multiple deprivation shows that all too vividly. These communities are attempting to turn that around, but have had little support in accessing Communities First, as you highlighted. Will you visit Rhyl with me, witness the good community spirit there and offer your experience and expertise on how Communities First can assist the area?

**Ann Jones:** Nid oes angen imi dynnu sylw at yr amddifadedd yn y Rhyl; mae safle ei wardiau ar y mynegai amlamddifadedd yn dangos hynny'n gwbl glir. Mae'r cymunedau hyn yn ceisio newid hynny, ond ychydig o gymorth a gawsant i gael defnyddio Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, fel y nodasoch. A wnewch ymweld â'r Rhyl gyda mi, a gweld y gymdogaeth dda sydd yno a chynnig eich profiad a'ch arbenigedd ar y modd y gall Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf helpu'r ardal?

**Edwina Hart:** I would be delighted to visit the area with you. In March, my officials met representatives of Denbighshire County Council, which has now appointed a lead officer to take Communities First forward. Following the meeting that we had last week, I will write to the leader of Denbighshire council highlighting our concerns about the need to facilitate a proper partnership there and, if one cannot be facilitated, what further action I may take.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn wrth fy modd yn ymweld â'r ardal gyda chi. Ym Mawrth, cyfarfu fy swyddogion â chynrychiolwyr o Gyngor Sir Ddinbych, sydd bellach wedi penodi swyddog arweiniol i fwrw ymlaen â Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Ar ôl y cyfarfod a gawsom yr wythnos diwethaf, byddaf yn ysgrifennu at arweinydd cyngor sir Ddinbych gan dynnu sylw at ein pryderon am yr angen i hwyluso partneriaeth briodol yno ac, os na ellir hwyluso un, pa gamau pellach y gallaf eu cymryd.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree that one problem facing Rhyl and many other towns is the poor quality of private rented accommodation, particularly houses of multiple occupation? Will you join me in condemning a

**Janet Ryder:** A ydych yn cytuno mai un broblem sy'n wynebu'r Rhyl a llawer o drefi eraill yw ansawdd gwael y llety preifat sydd ar osod, yn enwedig tai amlfeddiant? A wnewch ymuno â mi i gollfarnu Llywodraeth

Government that has been in power for five years, yet has failed to introduce a compulsory licensing scheme for houses of multiple occupation?

**Edwina Hart:** Members are well aware of my view that we need to address the licensing of private sector accommodation. However, I will not join you in any condemnation of the UK Government.

**Brian Gibbons:** On your point about Rhyl, getting partnerships up and running can be a problem. Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council has taken an active lead in my constituency in encouraging partnerships. When local authorities are proactive like that, the challenge is for them to be able to let go and allow communities to develop their own initiatives. I commend Neath Port Talbot as a positive and active example of good practice.

9:15 a.m.

**Edwina Hart:** The majority of local authorities have been proactive in taking their responsibilities forward in respect of Communities First. I have been particularly impressed by the work undertaken by Neath Port Talbot local authority. It has an excellent record of working with the voluntary sector.

sydd mewn grym ers pum mlynedd, ac sydd er hynny wedi methu â chyflwyno cynllun trwyddedu gorfodol ar gyfer tai amlfeddiant?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r Aelodau'n ymwybodol iawn fy mod o'r farn bod angen inni roi sylw i drwyddedu llety yn y sector preifat. Fodd bynnag, nid ymunaf â chi mewn unrhyw gollfarnu ar Lywodraeth y DU.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ynghylch eich pwynt am y Rhyl, fe all fod yn anodd cychwyn partneriaethau. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot wedi rhoi arweiniad egniol yn fy etholaeth i wrth hybu partneriaethau. Pan yw awdurdodau lleol yn rhagweithiol yn y fath fodd, yr her yw iddynt allu gollwng yr awenau a gadael i'r cymunedau ddatblygu eu mentrau eu hunain. Canmolaf Gastell-nedd Port Talbot fel enghraifft gadarnhaol ac egniol o arfer da.

**Edwina Hart:** Bu mwyafrif yr awdurdodau lleol yn rhagweithiol wrth fwrw ymlaen â'u cyfrifoldebau mewn cysylltiad â Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Gwnaethpwyd argraff arbennig arnaf gan y gwaith a wnaeth awdurdod lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Mae ganddo record ragorol o weithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol.

### **Diogelwch Cymunedol yng Nghymru Community Safety in Wales**

**Q4 Jonathan Morgan:** What discussions has the Minister had with representatives in the Home Office about community safety in Wales? (OAQ17827)

**Edwina Hart:** I have regular discussions with the Crime Reduction Director for Wales, David A'Herne, who was appointed by the Home Secretary. Mr A'Herne brings the Welsh dimension to bear in his dealings with Home Office colleagues and, through him, I am assured of close links with developments there.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You will no doubt be aware of the use of the civilian warden

**C4 Jonathan Morgan:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael â chynrychiolwyr yn y Swyddfa Gartref am ddiogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru? (OAQ17827)

**Edwina Hart:** Caf drafodaethau rheolaidd â Chyfarwyddwr Cymru dros Leihau Troseddu, David A'Herne, a benodwyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Mae Mr A'Herne yn rhoi sylw i'r dimensiwn Cymreig yn ei drafodion â'i gydweithwyr yn y Swyddfa Gartref a thrwyddo ef gallaf fod yn sicr o gael cysylltiadau clòs â'r datblygiadau yn y fan honno.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'n siŵr y byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r defnydd o'r cynllun

scheme in Wales, which has had limited success. However, will you make a commitment to the Assembly that, during future discussions with the Home Office, you will press upon it that the civilian warden scheme cannot be seen as a replacement for properly trained professional police officers?

**Edwina Hart:** I concur with your comments and that is also the Local Government and Housing Committee's view. I also feel strongly that people must have confidence in the service. We have confidence in the police, but we must see how the warden scheme develops. It is not comparable to a police force.

**John Griffiths:** In your discussions with the Home Office, will you consider making representations on the ever-growing number of young people in Wales being given custodial sentences, often ones of a few months or less? That is counterproductive to community safety in Wales as it creates universities of crime and makes rehabilitation, employment, housing and stable family relations more difficult to achieve.

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that we concentrate on the causes of these problems. Early intervention in terms of education and, perhaps, social services is important. We need to consider the overall issues in society that the Assembly can influence to ensure that this does not happen.

**Pauline Jarman:** Yesterday, Mr David A'Herne painted a grim picture of the potential influx of heroin and crack cocaine from Bristol, which could lead to an increase in addicts and a growth in crime. Will you be holding a follow-up meeting with the Home Secretary to consider whether that situation can be avoided?

**Edwina Hart:** You were disturbed in the meeting yesterday, as was the Committee, by David A'Herne's contribution on the dangerous situation we may face in south Wales. The Chair of the Committee, as you know, is writing to the First Minister to outline the Committee's concerns and to

wardeiniaid sifil yng Nghymru, a gafodd lwyddiant cyfyngedig. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch roi ymrwymiad i'r Cynulliad y byddwch, yn ystod trafodaethau â'r Swyddfa Gartref yn y dyfodol, yn pwysleisio wrthi na ellir ystyried y cynllun wardeiniaid sifil yn rhywbeth a all gymryd lle heddwision proffesiynol a hyfforddwyd yn briodol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'ch sylwadau a dyna farn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai hefyd. Teimlaf yn gryf hefyd fod yn rhaid i bobl fod â ffydd yn y gwasanaeth. Mae gennym ffydd yn yr heddlu, ond bydd yn rhaid inni weld sut y bydd y cynllun wardeiniaid yn datblygu. Ni ellir ei gymharu â'r heddlu.

**John Griffiths:** Yn eich trafodaethau â'r Swyddfa Gartref, a wnewch ystyried cyflwyno sylwadau ar y nifer fythol-gynyddol o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru sy'n cael dedfrydau o garchar, a'r rheini'n aml yn rhai o ychydig fisoedd neu lai? Mae hynny'n wrthgynhyrchiol i ddiogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru gan ei fod yn creu prifysgolion troseddu ac yn ei gwneud yn anos sicrhau ailsefydlu, cyflogaeth, tai a chysylltiadau teuluol sefydlog.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig inni ganolbwyntio ar achosion y problemau hyn. Mae ymyrryd cynnar o ran addysg ac, efallai, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn bwysig. Rhaid inni ystyried y materion cyffredinol mewn cymdeithas y gall y Cynulliad ddylanwadu arnynt i sicrhau nad yw hyn yn digwydd.

**Pauline Jarman:** Ddoe, disgrifiodd Mr David A'Herne ddarlun arswydus o'r mewnlifiad posibl o heroin a chocên crac o Fryste, a allai arwain at gynnydd yn nifer y rhai sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau a thwf mewn troseddu. A fyddwch yn cynnal cyfarfod dilynol gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref i ystyried a oes modd osgoi'r sefyllfa honno?

**Edwina Hart:** Cawsoch eich anesmwytho yn y cyfarfod ddoe, a'r Pwyllgor yr un modd, gan gyfraniad David A'Herne ar y sefyllfa beryglus y gallem ei hwynebu yn y De. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn ysgrifennu at Brif Weinidog Cymru i amlinellu pryderon y Pwyllgor a chynnig rhai

make some useful suggestions about how we can take these issues forward. I will have further discussions with the First Minister about this serious issue.

**Kirsty Williams:** Given your desire for a cross-cutting approach to preventing young people from falling into a life of crime, will you discuss with the Home Office representative in the Assembly the possibilities of providing financial support to an alternative curriculum scheme being developed by Llandrindod High School, which is in an area that is enduring a high increase in youth crime?

**Edwina Hart:** The alternative curriculum has been useful in some areas. I will be happy, with the agreement of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, to take discussions forward on this issue.

awgrymiadau buddiol am y modd y gallwn ymdrin â'r materion hyn. Caf drafodaethau pellach â Phrif Weinidog Cymru am y mater difrifol hwn.

**Kirsty Williams:** O wybod am eich awydd am ddull trawsbynciol o atal pobl ifanc rhag cyfeiliorni i fywyd o droseddu, a wnewch drafod â chynrychiolydd y Swyddfa Gartref yn y Cynulliad y posibilïadau o ddarparu cymorth ariannol i gynllun cwricwlwm amgen a ddatblygir gan Ysgol Uwchradd Llandrindod, sydd mewn ardal sy'n dioddef cynnydd mawr mewn troseddu gan yr ifanc?

**Edwina Hart:** Bu'r cwricwlwm amgen o gymorth mewn rhai ardaloedd. Byddaf yn fodlon cael trafodaethau ar y mater hwn, gyda chydysniad y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

### **Cynlluniau Prynu Cartref mewn Ardaloedd Trefol Homebuy Schemes in Urban Areas**

**Q5 Jocelyn Davies:** What discussions has the Minister had with local authorities over the development of homebuy schemes in urban areas? (OAQ17809)

**Edwina Hart:** I have not had any discussions, because the use of homebuy schemes is a matter for local authorities to determine according to the needs and priorities for housing in their respective areas.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Do you agree that house prices in some urban areas, such as Newport and Cardiff, are well beyond the pocket of the average wage earner? How many urban councils have taken advantage of the availability of this scheme and what will you do to encourage those that have not?

**Edwina Hart:** I have not been approached by any housing organisations to extend to urban areas the 50 per cent maximum loan. Should I receive any, I will consider that issue carefully. A small number of loans of around 35 per cent have been given in urban areas. Those involved regeneration schemes whereby owners of some low-value properties were rehoused in new dwellings

**C5 Jocelyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ag awdurdodau lleol ynghylch datblygu cynlluniau prynu cartref mewn ardaloedd trefol? (OAQ17809)

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau, gan fod y defnydd o gynlluniau prynu cartref yn fater i'w benderfynu gan yr awdurdodau lleol yn unol â'r anghenion a'r blaenoriaethau i dai yn eu priod ardaloedd.

**Jocelyn Davies:** A ydych yn cytuno bod y prisiau tai mewn rhai ardaloedd trefol, fel Casnewydd a Chaerdydd, ymhell y tu hwnt i gyrraedd gweithiwr ar y cyflog cyfartalog? Sawl cyngor trefol sydd wedi manteisio ar y ffaith bod y cynllun hwn ar gael a beth a wnewch i annog y rhai nad ydynt wedi gwneud hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes unrhyw fudiad tai wedi cysylltu â mi gan ofyn am ymestyn y benthyciad uchaf o 50 y cant i ardaloedd trefol. Os bydd un yn cysylltu â mi, fe ystyriaf y mater hwnnw'n ofalus. Rhoddwyd nifer fach o fenthyciadau o tua 35 y cant mewn ardaloedd trefol. Yr oeddent yn ymwneud â chynlluniau adfywio lle y câi perchnogion rhai tai isel eu gwerth eu



under homebuy. I will make some inquiries of local authorities to see whether they have exercised any powers in this regard. I will pass on information to you. There is an issue with regard to the rise in property prices in some towns.

**David Davies:** I congratulate you on your previous comments because you appear to recognise that the right to buy has been a tremendous success story, freeing people from the yoke of municipal socialism and giving them a tangible stake in society. Do you agree that this success story should not just be maintained but should be fully extended to those who have not yet had the right to buy?

**Edwina Hart:** I indicated that it was a success for those people who wished to buy as it allowed them to do that, and many people availed themselves of the opportunity. However, I would not want you to think that my remarks signalled a warming to Tory philosophies.

hailgartrefu mewn anheddau newydd dan y cynllun prynu cartref. Gwnaf ymholiadau ymysg yr awdurdodau lleol i weld a ydynt wedi arfer unrhyw bwerau yn hynny o beth. Trosglwyddaf yr wybodaeth i chi. Mae mater wedi codi mewn cysylltiad â'r cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai mewn rhai trefi.

**David Davies:** Fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar eich sylwadau blaenorol gan ei bod yn ymddangos eich bod yn cydnabod bod y cynllun hawl i brynu wedi bod yn llwyddiant aruthrol, gan ryddhau pobl o iau sosialaeth ddinesig a rhoi cyfran bendant iddynt mewn cymdeithas. A ydych yn cytuno y dylid gwneud mwy na dim ond parhau â'r llwyddiant hwnnw ac y dylid ei ymestyn yn llawn i'r rhai na chawsant yr hawl i brynu eto?

**Edwina Hart:** Nodais ei fod yn llwyddiant i'r rhai a oedd yn dymuno prynu gan ei fod yn caniatáu iddynt wneud hynny, a manteisiodd llawer o bobl ar y cyfle. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn am ichi feddwl bod fy sylwadau'n dangos fy mod yn cael fy nenu gan athroniaethau'r Toriaid.

### **Cwrdd â Swyddogion Cyngor Sir Caerdydd Meetings with Cardiff County Council Officials**

**C6 Owen John Thomas:** Pa mor aml y mae'r Gweinidog yn cwrdd ag aelodau a swyddogion o Gyngor Sir Caerdydd? (OAQ17767)

**Edwina Hart:** When appropriate.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cardiff City Council is undertaking a feasibility study of its planned ULTra transport system, following an award of £20 million from the National Assembly. What steps did the National Assembly Government take to ensure the viability of this dubious project before sanctioning this considerable grant?

**Edwina Hart:** That is news to me. I am sure that the Minister for Environment, who will be answering questions after me, would be better able to explain the position to you.

**Jonathan Morgan:** In your meetings with Cardiff County Council, have you had the opportunity to press the authority on the state of community transport? If such great

**Q6 Owen John Thomas:** How often does the Minister meet with members and officials of Cardiff County Council? (OAQ17767)

**Edwina Hart:** Pan yw'n briodol.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae Cyngor Dinas Caerdydd yn cynnal astudiaeth dichonoldeb o'i system drafnidiaeth ULTra arfaethedig, wedi i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddyfarnu £20 miliwn iddo. Pa gamau a gymerodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau hyfywedd y prosiect amheus hwnnw cyn cymeradwyo'r grant sylweddol hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae hynny'n newydd i mi. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, a fydd yn ateb cwestiynau ar fy ôl i, yn gallu egluro'r sefyllfa ichi'n well.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn eich cyfarfodydd â Chyngor Sir Caerdydd, a gawsoch gyfle i bwysu ar yr awdurdod ynghylch cyflwr trafndiaeth gymunedol? Os yw gwariant mor

expenditure is to be made on one small, limited scheme, perhaps it should consider the rest of the capital city, which is dreadfully under-resourced.

**Edwina Hart:** I am sure that my colleague, the Minister for Environment, has listened to your question attentively, and will deal with the matter in due course.

fawr i fod ar un cynllun bach, cyfyngedig, efallai y dylai ystyried gweddill y brifddinas, sydd yn ofnadwy o brin o adnoddau.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn sicr bod fy nghyd-aelod, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, wedi gwranddo'n astud ar eich cwestiwn, ac y bydd yn ymdrin â'r mater gyda hyn.

### Argaeledd Grantiau Availability of Grants

**Q7 Gwenda Thomas:** What steps is the Minister taking to ensure that community groups and local organisations have up-to-date information on the availability of grants? (OAQ17781)

**Edwina Hart:** Information on grants for community groups and local organisations is provided in the National Assembly for Wales voluntary sector grants guide—a catchy title, I must say—which is available on the Assembly website. Furthermore, the Communities First support network ensures that Communities First partnerships have up-to-date information on all funding sources relevant to community action plans through its website and helpline.

**Gwenda Thomas:** With reference to Communities First, will you commend the excellent work currently being undertaken by the Communities First support network, and can you comment on the level of local government participation in the development of local partnerships?

**Edwina Hart:** I commend the work of the network, which has been first class. Several people have raised issues about the participation of local government. While there are no difficulties with your own authority in Neath Port Talbot, Gwenda, there are issues across Wales. If it would be helpful to Members, I will report to the Local Government and Housing Committee on the progress of partnership arrangements across the Communities First areas.

**David Lloyd:** A oes strwythur penodol i'r partneriaethau cymunedol, neu a ydynt yn cael eu ffurfio ar ddamwain a hap?

**C7 Gwenda Thomas:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod grwpiau cymunedol a sefydliadau lleol yn cael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ba grantiau sydd ar gael? (OAQ17781)

**Edwina Hart:** Darperir gwybodaeth am grantiau i grwpiau cymunedol a mudiadau lleol yn arweiniad i grantiau sector gwirfoddol Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru—teitl bachog, rhaid imi ddweud—sydd ar gael ar wefan y Cynulliad. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae rhwydwaith cymorth Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn sicrhau y caiff y partneriaethau Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr holl ffynonellau ariannu sy'n berthnasol i gynlluniau gweithredu cymunedol drwy ei wefan a'i linell gymorth.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mewn cysylltiad â Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, a wnewch ganmol y gwaith rhagorol a wneir ar hyn o bryd gan rwydwaith cymorth Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, ac a allwch wneud sylw am faint y cyfranogiad gan lywodraeth leol wrth ddatblygu partneriaethau lleol?

**Edwina Hart:** Canmolaf waith y rhwydwaith, a fu o'r radd flaenaf. Mae nifer o bobl wedi codi materion ynghylch cyfranogiad llywodraeth leol. Er nad oes trafferthion â'ch awdurdod chi yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, Gwenda, mae materion yn codi ledled Cymru. Os byddai o gymorth i'r Aelodau, rhoddaf adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar hynt y trefniadau partneriaeth ledled yr ardaloedd Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf.

**David Lloyd:** Do community partnerships have a specific structure, or do they happen by chance?

**Edwina Hart:** They do not happen by chance, but with the leadership of the local authority and the involvement of local people. Some are historical and some are new developments. Therefore, it is not a matter of chance, but of like-minded people coming together to give their communities the opportunity to have Communities First money improve their lives.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chânt eu ffurfio ar ddamwain a hap, ond drwy arweiniad yr awdurdod lleol a chyfraniad pobl lleol. Mae rhai ohonynt yn hir-sefydlog a rhai'n ddatblygiadau newydd. Felly, nid yw'n fater o ddamwain, ond o bobl o'r un meddwl yn dod at ei gilydd i roi cyfle i'w cymunedau gael arian Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf i wella eu bywydau.

### **Cynllun Prynu Cartref Homebuy Scheme**

**C8 Dafydd Wigley:** Oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i adolygu'r cynllun prynu cartref? (OAQ17802)

**Q8 Dafydd Wigley:** Does the Minister have any plans to review the homebuy scheme? (OAQ17802)

**Edwina Hart:** Yes, I intend to review the scheme during the summer, and will report on it to the Local Government and Housing Committee in the autumn.

**Edwina Hart:** Oes, bwriadaf adolygu'r cynllun yn ystod yr haf, a byddaf yn adrodd arno i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn yr hydref.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Croesawaf hynny. Bydd angen i'r adolygiad ystyried o leiaf ddau fater sydd yn achosi problemau. Y cyntaf yw'r rhicyn ar gyfer uchafswm gwerth y tŷ, oherwydd bod chwyddiant ym mhrisiau tai wedi gwneud y cynllun yn amherthnasol mewn llawer o ardaloedd gwledig. Yn ail, byddai'n fanteisiol pe bai'r uchafswm yn berthnasol i'r swm sydd yn dod o'r pwrs cyhoeddus, ac nid i'r swm a werir ar y tŷ oherwydd, weithiau, gall y sawl sydd yn prynu tai grafu ychydig o filoedd o bunnau uwchben yr uchafswm hynny er mwyn prynu tŷ a fyddai, fel arall, y tu hwnt i'w cyrraedd.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I welcome that. The review will need to consider at least two issues that are causing problems. First is the increment for the maximum value of the house, because inflation in house prices has rendered the scheme irrelevant in many rural areas. Secondly, it would be advantageous if the maximum limit were relevant to the sum paid from the public purse, and not to the sum that is spent on the house because homebuyers can sometimes get a few thousand pounds above that limit to purchase a house that would otherwise be outside their reach.

**Edwina Hart:** In light of your comments I will ask my officials to make inquiries of local authorities on the progress of the scheme in the rural areas. I will take account of it in my review. I had hoped to review it earlier, but that has proved difficult so I will carry out a more substantial review in the summer. I am happy to take your comments on board.

**Edwina Hart:** Yng ngolwg eich sylwadau gofynnaf i'm swyddogion holi'r awdurdodau lleol ynghylch hynt y cynllun yn yr ardaloedd gwledig. Cymeraf hynny i ystyriaeth yn fy adolygiad. Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio'i adolygu'n gynharach, ond profodd hynny'n anodd felly cynhaliad adolygiad mwy sylweddol yn yr haf. Yr wyf yn hapus i ystyried eich sylwadau.

9:25 a.m.

**William Graham:** Do you agree that the homebuy scheme must ensure equality between English and Welsh-speaking members of our communities, and that the regeneration and sustainability of our Welsh-

**William Graham:** A ydych yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i'r cynllun prynu cartref sicrhau cydraddoldeb rhwng aelodau Saesneg a Chymraeg eu hiaith yn ein cymunedau, a bod rhaid ymdrin ag adfywio a chynaliadwyedd

speaking communities must be met by greater economic development and investment? This administration's failure to ensure a dedicated Minister for Economic Development for most of 2001 meant that we failed to deliver what these communities require.

**Edwina Hart:** We had a dedicated Minister for housing for the entire duration. We are doing a good job on the homebuy scheme and on the housing agenda. This is about economic activity in communities. People must have job prospects in their communities, so that children grow up wanting to stay in their communities. This is a major issue, not only in rural Wales but also in deprived urban areas.

ein cymunedau Cymraeg drwy fwy o ddatblygu economaidd a buddsoddi? Yr oedd methiant y weinyddiaeth hon i sicrhau Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd penodol am y rhan fwyaf o 2001 yn golygu ein bod wedi methu â darparu'r hyn y mae ar y cymunedau hyn ei angen.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr oedd gennym Weinidog penodol dros dai ar hyd yr amser. Yr ydym yn gwneud gwaith da ar y cynllun prynu cartref ac ar yr agenda tai. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â gweithgaredd economaidd mewn cymunedau. Rhaid i bobl gael rhagolygon da am waith yn eu cymunedau, fel bod plant yn tyfu gan ddymuno aros yn eu cymunedau. Mae hyn yn fater o bwys, nid yn unig yn y Gymru wledig ond hefyd mewn ardaloedd trefol difreintiedig.

### **Amcanion Trawsbynciol y Cynulliad (Cyfraniad Awdurdodau Lleol) Assembly Cross-Cutting Objectives (Contribution of Local Authorities)**

**C9 Glyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru am sut y gallai'r awdurdodau lleol gyfrannu at amcanion trawsbynciol y Cynulliad? (OAQ17858)

**Q9 Glyn Davies:** What discussions has the Minister had with the Welsh Local Government Association about the contribution local authorities can make to the Assembly's cross-cutting objectives? (OAQ17858)

**Edwina Hart:** I have regular discussions with the Welsh Local Government Association, ranging across all the Assembly's objectives.

**Edwina Hart:** Caf drafodaethau rheolaidd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, sy'n ymdrin â holl amcanion y Cynulliad.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr ydych yn gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol a chyfle cyfartal. Mae'r prinder cyfleoedd i ferched gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yn achos pryder i mi. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gydag awdurdodau lleol am eu strategaethau i hyrwyddo cyfleoedd i ferched?

**Glyn Davies:** You are responsible for local government and equal opportunities. I am concerned about the lack of opportunities for women to participate in sport. What discussions have you had with local authorities on their strategies to promote opportunities for women?

**Edwina Hart:** Sport is not within my portfolio. I will refer this to Jenny Randerson, who discusses these issues with local government. Sport plays an important part in people's lives, and it is essential in tackling social exclusion.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid yw chwaraeon yn fy mhortffolio i. Cyfeiriaf hyn at Jenny Randerson, sy'n trafod y materion hyn â llywodraeth leol. Mae chwaraeon yn chwarae rhan bwysig ym mywydau pobl, ac maent yn hollbwysig wrth fynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol.

### **Gwella Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol ym Mhowys Improving Social Inclusion in Powys**

**Q10 The Leader of the Welsh C10 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick**

**Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister make a statement on efforts to improve social inclusion in Powys? (OAQ17856)

**Edwina Hart:** Social inclusion is one of the Government's guiding principles. The wide range of policies and programmes detailed in the 'Annual Report on Social Inclusion in Wales 2002' is a demonstration of our commitment to improving social inclusion in all communities across Wales, including Powys.

**Nick Bourne:** Reference has already been made this morning to Llandrindod High School. It has a successful scheme to combat truancy. Unfortunately, because of this year's funding arrangements and the drop in funding for schools, that scheme is under threat. Will you, in conjunction with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, consider whether more money could be made available for this scheme? It is highly successful, as I found when I visited the school recently.

**Edwina Hart:** Spending on education as a percentage of our budget is good, and this administration's expenditure on education is high. I will consider your comments on the scheme. It seems to be an enlightened scheme, and could be mirrored across Wales if it is so successful. I will take the matter forward with Jane Davidson.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for answering 10 questions, Minister.

**Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr ymdrechion i wella cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ym Mhowys? (OAQ17856)

**Edwina Hart:** Cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yw un o egwyddorion sylfaenol y Llywodraeth. Mae'r amrediad eang o bolisiau a rhaglenni a nodir yn yr 'Adroddiad Blyneddol ar Gynhwysiant Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru 2002' yn brawf o'n hymrwymiad i wella cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ym mhob cymuned ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys Powys.

**Nick Bourne:** Cyfeiriwyd eisoes y bore yma at Ysgol Uwchradd Llandrindod. Mae ganddi gynllun llwyddiannus i ymladd triwantiaeth. Gwaetha'r modd, oherwydd trefniadau ariannu'r flwyddyn hon a'r gostyngiad yn yr arian i ysgolion, mae'r cynllun hwnnw dan fygythiad. A wnewch chi, ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ystyried a ellid darparu rhagor o arian i'r cynllun hwn? Mae'n dra llwyddiannus, fel y canfûm pan ymwelais â'r ysgol yn ddiweddar.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r gwariant ar addysg fel canran o'n cyllideb yn dda, ac mae gwariant yr weinyddiaeth hon ar addysg yn uchel. Gwnaf ystyried eich sylwadau am y cynllun. Mae'n ymddangos yn gynllun goleuedig, a gellid ei ailadrodd ledled Cymru os yw mor llwyddiannus. Af ynghylch y mater hwn gyda Jane Davidson.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i chi am ateb 10 cwestiwn, Weinidog.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd Questions to the Minister for Environment**

### **Mesurau ar gyfer Penderfyniadau Cynllunio Measures for Determining Planning Decisions**

**Q1 Val Lloyd:** What measures has the Minister taken to create a fairer and more open procedure for determining planning decisions? (OAQ17833)

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** Our recent consultation paper, 'Planning: Delivering for Wales', sets out the Assembly Government's objectives for the

**C1 Val Lloyd:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd i greu gweithdrefn decach a mwy agored ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau cynllunio? (OAQ17833)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Mae ein papur ymgynghori diweddar, 'Cynllunio: Cyflawni dros Gymru', yn nodi amcanion Llywodraeth y

planning system in Wales and a series of proposals to support those objectives. The paper includes proposals to ensure a fairer and more open process for preparing plans and determining planning applications.

**Val Lloyd:** There is always a small number of contentious planning applications that raise local anxiety. Do you have plans to ensure that third parties have a right to present their objections in person to their local planning authority? I declare an interest as a Swansea councillor.

**Sue Essex:** Sometimes it does not seem to be a small number; there are many contentious planning applications. We did not present plans in the document to introduce third party rights; that would require primary legislation. We have considered ways of ensuring that people can participate and express their views. That would involve mandatory neighbour notification, and the availability of more open information. We have proposed a right to make representations at the planning committee stage. Having information and being heard will reassure people and give them confidence.

**Janet Davies:** As openness and transparency are crucial in developing unitary development plans, do you believe that councillors—given the particular case of the leader of the Independent/Liberal Democrat coalition in Ceredigion—who own land that has been allocated for development in a UDP should declare a direct financial interest and abstain from voting?

**Sue Essex:** I cannot comment on that question. If you contact me privately through the normal channels, I may be able to provide an answer.

However, going back to Val's point, in terms of an open and transparent system, we are considering ways of supporting organisations such as Planning Aid, which has helped people over many years. I declare a partial interest, as I was involved in that organisation. Helping people to participate, not only in individual planning applications,

Cynulliad i'r system gynllunio yng Nghymru a chyfres o gynigion i ategu'r amcanion hynny. Mae'r papur yn cynnwys cynigion i sicrhau proses decach a mwy agored ar gyfer paratoi cynlluniau a gwneud penderfyniadau cynllunio.

**Val Lloyd:** Ceir nifer fach o geisiadau cynllunio dadleuol bob amser sy'n peri pryder yn lleol. A ydych yn bwriadu sicrhau y caiff rhai o drydydd parti hawl i gyflwyno'u gwrthwynebiadau yn bersonol i'w hawdurdod cynllunio lleol? Datganaf fuddiant fel cynghorydd yn Abertawe.

**Sue Essex:** Weithiau nid yw'n ymddangos yn nifer fach; mae llawer o geisiadau cynllunio dadleuol. Ni wnaethom gynnig cynlluniau yn y ddogfen i gyflwyno hawliau trydydd parti; byddai hynny'n gofyn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Yr ydym wedi ystyried dulliau o sicrhau y caiff pobl gymryd rhan a mynegi eu barn. Byddai hynny'n golygu gofyniad i hysbysu cymdogion, a darpariaeth o wybodaeth fwy agored. Yr ydym wedi cynnig hawl i roi sylwadau ar gam y pwyllgor cynllunio. Bydd pobl yn dawelach eu meddwl o gael gwybodaeth a gwrandawriad, a bydd hynny'n rhoi hyder iddynt.

**Janet Davies:** Gan fod gweithredu agored a thryloywder yn hollbwysig wrth ddatblygu cynlluniau datblygu unedol, a ydych yn credu y dylai cynghorwyr—yng ngolwg achos penodol arweinydd y glymblaid Annibynnol/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Ngheredigion—sy'n berchen ar dir a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer datblygu mewn cynllun datblygu unedol ddatgan buddiant ariannol uniongyrchol ac ymatal rhag pleidleisio?

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf wneud sylw ar y cwestiwn hwnnw. Os cysylltwch â mi'n breifat drwy'r sianeli arferol, efallai y byddaf yn gallu darparu ateb.

Fodd bynnag, gan fynd yn ôl at bwynt Val, o ran system agored a thryloyw, yr ydym yn ystyried dulliau o gynorthwyo mudiadau fel Cymorth Cynllunio, sydd yn helpu pobl ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Datganaf fuddiant rhannol, gan y bûm â rhan yn y mudiad hwnnw. Mae helpu pobl i gymryd rhan, nid yn unig mewn ceisiadau cynllunio unigol,

but also by providing more information so that they can participate in considering the development of UDPs are equally important.

**David Davies:** To return to the initial question, do you agree in principle that it is unfair that developers whose applications are refused by local planning authorities can appeal to the Assembly, but opponents to developments that are accepted by local planning authorities have no such right of appeal? If you agree in principle, should we not try to rectify that?

**Sue Essex:** That has been argued since the 1947 Town and Country Planning Act and I understand your point. However, governments over the years, including Conservative governments, have considered it and decided that, on balance, changing the law would perhaps raise many problems on the ground in determining planning applications. I am sure that you would agree that there is an economic need to make speedy decisions on planning applications. I have considered this issue in terms of opening up the system and you will be aware that I have proposed options in the consultation paper for a more open system for making decisions on local authorities' own developments. I hope that the proposed measures will provide reassurance but members of the Committee will have an opportunity to discuss the responses and my proposed way forward.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2 (OAQ17810) has been transferred for written answer.

ond hefyd drwy ddarparu rhagor o wybodaeth fel y gallant gymryd rhan wrth ystyried datblygiad y cynlluniau datblygu unedol, yr un mor bwysig.

**David Davies:** Gan fynd yn ôl at y cwestiwn gwreiddiol, a ydych yn cytuno mewn egwyddor ei bod yn annheg y caiff datblygwyr y gwrthodir eu ceisiadau gan awdurdodau cynllunio lleol apelio i'r Cynulliad, ond nad yw gwrthwynebwr datblygiadau a dderbynnir gan awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yn meddu ar hawl apelio o'r fath? Os ydych yn cytuno mewn egwyddor, oni ddylem geisio cywiro hynny?

**Sue Essex:** Dadleuir hynny ers Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1947 ac yr wyf yn deall eich pwynt. Fodd bynnag, mae llywodraethau dros y blynyddoedd, gan gynnwys llywodraethau Ceidwadol, wedi'i ystyried ac wedi penderfynu, ar ôl pwysu a mesur, y byddai newid y gyfraith yn gallu codi llawer o broblemau ymarferol wrth wneud penderfyniadau ar geisiadau cynllunio. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod angen economaidd i benderfynu'n gyflym ar geisiadau cynllunio. Yr wyf wedi ystyried y mater hwn o ran agor y system a byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi cynnig dewisiadau yn y papur ymgynghori ar gyfer system fwy agored i wneud penderfyniadau ar ddatblygiadau'r awdurdodau lleol eu hunain. Gobeithiaf y bydd y mesurau arfaethedig yn rhoi tawelwch meddwl ond caiff aelodau'r Pwyllgor gyfle i drafod yr ymatebion a'r ffordd ymlaen yr wyf yn ei chynnig.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 2 (OAQ17810) wedi'i drosglwyddo ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

### **Trafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus Gonsesiynol i Bensiynwyr a'r Anabl Concessionary Public Transport for Pensioners and the Disabled**

**Q3 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister make a statement on concessionary public transport for pensioners and the disabled? (OAQ17837)

**Sue Essex:** The new scheme is proving immensely popular, not just with pensioners and disabled people throughout Wales, but with everyone who supports our objective of

**C3 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar dtrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus gonsesiynol i bensiynwyr a'r anabl? (OAQ17837)

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r cynllun newydd yn profi'n aruthrol o boblogaidd, nid yn unig gan bensiynwyr a phobl anabl ledled Cymru, ond gan bawb sy'n cefnogi ein hamcan o

promoting accessibility and more-affordable public transport. It means that pass-holders can go shopping, visit their friends and relatives, or enjoy a day out without worrying about the cost of transport.

**Nick Bourne:** While I recognise the scheme's benefits—and we have corresponded on this issue—it presents a particular problem in rural areas, where there are no local bus services. Will you press local authorities to consider extending the scheme to rail, where that is available, and the possibility of making tokens available for the aged and disabled, enabling them to use taxis where there is no bus route?

**Sue Essex:** We recognise that the provision of commercial bus services is not consistent throughout Wales. Local authorities have given tokens to residents in the past and that provision is still available to them. In recent months I have discussed a range of issues with every local authority in Wales, including the concessionary fares scheme and how it is working.

**Mick Bates:** We all recognise the tremendous value of this excellent scheme. However, to pursue Nick's point, many places have no public transport, particularly rural areas. However, Dial-a-Ride schemes will soon be introduced. Will you investigate the possibility of financing Dial-a-Ride through a voucher system organised through the local authorities so that they can take advantage of this scheme and bring pensioners and disabled people from these remote areas so that they can do their shopping or meet their friends.

9:35 a.m.

**Sue Essex:** The transport forum and a group led by the Welsh Consumer Council are considering community transport. I am concerned about responding to the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's report on extending this to community transport. We must find a method of doing this properly, not only through a good scheme, but consistently. It is crucial to achieve as much consistency as possible

hyrwyddo hygyrchedd a thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus fwy fforddiadwy. Mae'n golygu y caiff deiliaid y tocynnau siopa, ymweld â'u ffrindiau a'u perthnasau, neu fwynhau diwrnod allan heb boeni am gost trafndiaeth.

**Nick Bourne:** Er fy mod yn cydnabod manteision y cynllun—ac yr ydym wedi gohebu ar y pwnc hwn—mae'n codi problem benodol mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle nad oes gwasanaethau bws lleol. A wnewch bwysu ar yr awdurdodau lleol i ystyried ymestyn y cynllun i gynnwys y rheilffyrdd, lle y maent ar gael, a'r posibiliad o ddarparu tocynnau i'r henoed a phobl anabl, fel y gallant ddefnyddio tacsis lle nad oes llwybr bysiau?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym yn cydnabod nad yw'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau bysiau masnachol yn gyson ledled Cymru. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi rhoi tocynnau i drigolion yn y gorffennol, ac mae'r ddarpariaeth honno ar gael iddynt o hyd. Yn y misoedd diwethaf hyn yr wyf wedi trafod amryw o faterion gyda phob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys y cynllun tocynnau consesiynol a'r modd y mae'n gweithio.

**Mick Bates:** Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod gwerth aruthrol y cynllun rhagorol hwn. Fodd bynnag, gan ddilyn pwynt Nick, mae llawer o leoedd nad oes ganddynt drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, yn enwedig ardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, cyflwynir cynlluniau Dial-a-Ride cyn hir. A wnewch ymchwilio i'r posibiliad o ariannu Dial-a-Ride drwy system dalebau a drefnir drwy'r awdurdodau lleol fel y gallant fanteisio ar y cynllun hwn a dod â phensiynwyr a phobl anabl o'r ardaloedd diarffordd hyn fel y gallant siopa neu gwrdd â'u ffrindiau.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r fforwm trafndiaeth a grŵp dan arweiniad Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru'n ystyried trafndiaeth gymunedol. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch ymateb i adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar ymestyn hyn i drafnidiaeth gymunedol. Rhaid inni ganfod modd i wneud hyn yn iawn, nid drwy gynllun da yn unig, ond yn gyson. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn sicrhau cymaint o gysondeb ag y bo modd



throughout Wales. We know that it will not be possible everywhere, but we must do as much as we can. We will consider extending that scheme. There will be extra financial influences on us, and I must discuss that with the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. It is our intention to establish additional community support systems within this regime.

**Brian Hancock:** What discussions have you had with your Cabinet colleagues about elderly and disabled people who need carers? Those carers may not be elderly, and the cost of transport for shopping, visiting friends and so on can be excessive? Will you consider extending the rural scheme of replacing concessionary fares with taxi vouchers so that it can also happen in urban areas?

**Sue Essex:** As part of the scheme, escort passes are available for severely disabled people who need a companion, which also applies to urban areas where there are commercial bus services. That is being widely used at present.

ledled Cymru. Gwyddom na fydd yn bosibl ym mhobman, ond rhaid inni wneud cymaint ag y gallwn. Byddwn yn ystyried ymestyn y cynllun hwnnw. Bydd dylanwadau cyllidol ychwanegol arnom, a rhaid imi drafod hynny â'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau. Yr ydym yn bwriadu sefydlu systemau cymorth cymunedol ychwanegol o fewn y gyfundrefn hon.

**Brian Hancock:** Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch â'ch cyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet mewn cysylltiad â phobl oedrannus a phobl anabl y mae arnynt angen gofaluwr? Efallai na fydd y gofaluwr hynny'n oedrannus, a gall cost trafnidiaeth ar gyfer siopa, ymweld â ffrindiau ac yn y blaen fod yn ormodol. A wnewch ystyried ymestyn y cynllun gwledig o ddefnyddio tocynnau consesiynol yn lle talebau tacsï fel y gall ddigwydd mewn ardaloedd trefol hefyd?

**Sue Essex:** Fel rhan o'r cynllun, mae tocynnau cydymaith ar gael i bobl anabl iawn y mae arnynt angen cydymaith, ac mae hynny'n berthnasol hefyd i ardaloedd trefol lle y mae gwasanaethau bysiau masnachol. Gwneir defnydd helaeth o hynny ar hyn o bryd.

### **Nodweddion Unigryw Cymru (Polisiâu Cynllunio) Distinct Characteristics of Wales (Planning Policy)**

**Q4 Val Lloyd:** What measures has the Minister taken to ensure that planning policy reflects the distinct characteristics of Wales? (OAQ17792)

**Sue Essex:** A comprehensive review of land use planning policy for Wales has recently been completed, using a new and inclusive approach. One of the aims of the review, which culminated in the publication last month of 'Planning Policy Wales', was to take account of Welsh circumstances and needs, to develop a policy appropriate to the distinctive governance, structures and approaches in Wales. In addition, the Wales Planning Research Programme enables policy to be evidence-based and focused on Welsh issues.

**Val Lloyd:** I was pleased that the statement issued on 8 May pointed out the difference

**C4 Val Lloyd:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau bod polisiâu cynllunio yn adlewyrchu nodweddion unigryw Cymru? (OAQ17792)

**Sue Essex:** Mae adolygiad cynhwysfawr o bolisi cynllunio defnydd tir i Gymru wedi'i gwblhau'n ddiweddar, gan ddefnyddio dull newydd a chynhwysol. Un o nodau'r adolygiad, a arweiniodd at gyhoeddi 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', oedd ystyried amgylchiadau ac anghenion Cymru, i ddatblygu polisi sy'n briodol i'r llywodraethu, y strwythurau a'r dulliau gweithredu neilltuol a geir yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae Rhaglen Ymchwil Cynllunio Cymru yn fodd i seilio polisi ar dystiolaeth a'i ganolbwyntio ar faterion Cymreig.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr oeddwn yn falch bod y datganiad a gyhoeddwyd ar 8 Mai yn tynnu

between planning policy in Wales and in England. However, what assurances can you give that when the report is published in July, local communities will remain at the heart of the planning process?

**Sue Essex:** If you consider the planning policy document in Wales compared with England, it has tried to integrate with other policies, including some of our community-based policies. It has, for the first time, included aspects of equal opportunities, many of which are community-based. The whole process has reflected the issue of sustainable development, which is at the heart of the document. As we know, sustainable development in Wales, in many cases, reflects community aspirations and is community-based. There are many issues in terms of how it was prepared, but also what it states, which is what you intimated.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yr oedd croeso cyffredinol i'ch datganiad diweddar bod yr iaith Gymraeg i'w hystyried fel ffactor perthnasol wrth ystyried ceisiadau cynllunio. A wnewch gadarnhau y bydd gofyn i awdurdodau lleol, wrth gwblhau eu cynlluniau unedol newydd, ystyried yr iaith Gymraeg fel ffactor ar gyfer y cynlluniau hynny?

**Sue Essex:** It was included in the technical advice note on the language and it is reinforced in the planning policy guidance, to which Val referred. It applies to all local authorities in Wales, which was one of the key differences. We would expect all local authorities in Wales, at the beginning of their UDP, to reflect the needs of the language, along with all the reflections on sustainability.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I have raised this issue with you previously, but I ask you again to consider strengthening the planning guidelines on telecommunication masts. There is a feeling among some local authorities that the planning guidelines are not sufficiently strong to allow them to refuse many of these applications.

**Sue Essex:** The regulations that will come

sylw at y gwahaniaeth rhwng polisi cynllunio yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y bydd cymunedau lleol yn dal i fod ar ganol y broses cynllunio pan gyhoeddir yr adroddiad yng Ngorffennaf?

**Sue Essex:** Os cymharwch y ddogfen polisi cynllunio yng Nghymru â'r un yn Lloegr, mae wedi ceisio integreiddio â pholisïau eraill, gan gynnwys rhai o'n polisïau cymunedol. Am y tro cyntaf, mae wedi cynnwys agweddau ar gyfle cyfartal, a llawer ohonynt yn rhai cymunedol. Mae'r holl broses wedi adlewyrchu pwnc datblygu cynaliadwy, sydd wrth graidd y ddogfen hon. Fel y gwyddom, mae datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, mewn llawer o achosion, yn adlewyrchu dyheadau'r gymuned ac wedi'i leoli yn y gymuned. Mae llawer o faterion yn codi ynghylch y dull o'i baratoi, a hefyd ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n ei ddweud, sef yr hyn yr oeddech yn ei awgrymu.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Your statement recently that the Welsh language was to be considered a relevant factor in considering planning applications was broadly welcomed. Will you confirm that local authorities will be required, when completing their new unitary development plans, to take the Welsh language into account as a factor for those plans?

**Sue Essex:** Fe'i cynhwyswyd yn y nodyn cyngor technegol ar yr iaith ac fe'i hategir yn y canllawiau polisi cynllunio, y cyfeiriodd Val atynt. Mae'n berthnasol i'r holl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a dyna oedd un o'r gwahaniaethau allweddol. Byddem yn disgwyl i'r holl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, ar ddechrau eu cynllun datblygu unedol, adlewyrchu anghenion yr iaith, ynghyd â'r holl agweddau ar gynaliadwyedd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda chi o'r blaen, ond gofynnaf eto ichi ystyried cryfhau'r canllawiau cynllunio ar fastiau telathrebu. Mae ymdeimlad ymysg rhai awdurdodau lleol nad yw'r canllawiau cynllunio'n ddigon cryf i ganiatáu iddynt wrthod llawer o'r ceisiadau hyn.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd y rheoliadau a ddaw

before the Assembly give local authorities many opportunities to undertake proper consultation locally and make the right decisions.

**Glyn Davies:** Un nodwedd o'r canolbarth yw bod llawer o flodau a phlanhigion o gwmpas y trefi a'r pentrefi. Yn y Drenewydd, mae cwmni lleol, Contract Poweriser Cyf, eisiau plannu blodau ar y cylchdro ger adeiladau hyll Coleg Powys a Theatr Hafren. Dywedwyd wrth y cwmni bod caniatâd wedi'i wrthod oherwydd rhyw fân reolau. Hi yw'r broblem. A wnaiff y Gweinidog newid ei meddwl?

**Sue Essex:** I will try to guess who you mean by 'she'. I might be accused of many things, but being petty is not one of them. I do not know to what you refer. I am overjoyed if we have an outbreak of biodiversity in Newtown. I will look into the issue of who 'she' might be and what the petty rules that you mentioned are.

gerbron y Cynulliad yn rhoi llawer o gyfleoedd i awdurdodau lleol ymgynghori'n briodol yn lleol a gwneud y penderfyniadau iawn.

**Glyn Davies:** One characteristic of mid Wales is that there are many flowers and plants around the villages and towns. In Newtown, a local company, Contract Poweriser Ltd, wants to plant flowers on the roundabout near the ugly buildings of Coleg Powys and Theatr Hafren. The company was told that permission had been refused because of some petty regulations. She is the problem. Will the Minister change her mind?

**Sue Essex:** Ceisiaf ddyfalu pwy yr ydych yn ei feddwl wrth 'hi'. Efallai fy mod yn cael fy nghyhuddo o lawer o bethau, ond nid yw bod yn bitw'n un ohonynt. Ni wn beth yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato. Yr wyf wrth fy modd os ydym wedi cael cychwyniad o fioamrywiaeth yn y Drenewydd. Ymchwiliaf i ganfod pwy y gallai 'hi' fod a beth yw'r rheolau pitw y cyfeiriasoch atynt.

#### 'Climate Change Scenarios for the United Kingdom'

**Q5 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement concerning the implications for Wales outlined in 'Climate Change Scenarios for the United Kingdom'? (OAQ17793)

**Sue Essex:** I think that all Members will have received a copy of the document that I circulated on this. The report confirms that we can expect a warmer climate, changes to seasonal precipitation, and rising sea levels. Last July, we issued 'Climate Change Wales: Learning to Live Differently', which described the policies that the Assembly is pursuing to deliver a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions in Wales. We have recently published 'Community Leadership and Climate Change', which provides guidance to local authorities.

**William Graham:** One of the implications for Wales, as you said, is an increase in rainfall and inflow into our rivers and river estuaries. In South Wales East, the rivers Usk, Wye and Monnow regularly flood as a

**C5 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch y goblygiadau i Gymru a amlinellwyd yn y ddogfen 'Climate Change Scenarios for the United Kingdom'? (OAQ17793)

**Sue Essex:** Credaf y bydd yr holl Aelodau wedi derbyn copi o'r ddogfen yr wyf wedi'i chylchredeg ar hyn. Mae'r adroddiad yn cadarnhau y gallwn ddisgwyl hinsawdd gynhesach, newidiadau i wlybanaeth tymhorol, a lefelau môr uwch. Fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, gwnaethom gyhoeddi 'Newid yn Hinsawdd Cymru: Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol', a ddisgrifiodd y polisiau y mae'r Cynulliad yn eu dilyn i gyflawni gostyngiad yn y gollyngiadau o nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru. Yn ddiweddar gwnaethom gyhoeddi 'Arweiniad Cymunedol a'r Newid yn yr Hinsawdd', sy'n darparu canllawiau i'r awdurdodau lleol.

**William Graham:** Un o'r goblygiadau i Gymru, fel y dywedasoch, yw cynnydd yn y glawriad a'r mewnlifiad i'n hafonydd a'n haberoedd. Yn Nwyrain De Cymru, mae afonydd Wysg, Gwy a Mynwy'n gorlifo'n

result of the current level of rainfall, particularly at high tide. What measures will you suggest to tackle flooding in South Wales East?

**Sue Essex:** There have been instances of flooding over the last few years in north-east and south-east Wales. We need to adapt to more intensive, and perhaps unpredictable, rainfall. We are working closely with the Environment Agency, which is undertaking catchment area studies. Work is also ongoing on how we can hold up heavy bursts of rainfall. If we can hold back the flow for a while, and spread out peaks of rainfall, which are currently a problem—that will help. As you know, we have also invested more in flood defence schemes and are supporting local flood defence committees and local authorities in developing schemes. We cannot be 100 per cent prepared, as we cannot anticipate the situation completely. We need to do our best, but we also need to change how we live—which is what ‘Learning to Live Differently’ is about—so that we can reduce the impact of climate change.

**Peter Black:** As climate change is driven by carbon emissions, when will the revised ‘Technical Advice Note 8: Renewable Energy’ be available to assist planning applications on renewable energy generators?

**Sue Essex:** I think that it will be available in the autumn. We have tried to be inclusive in dealing with this issue, which can be controversial. The members of the technical advisory group have been chosen from a wide range of organisations and, in many cases, represent quite different views. I spoke to the officials dealing with this recently, and they feel that progress is being made. However, we are aiming to produce a technical advice note that all of the group can feel ownership of. That will take time. Although I had originally hoped that it would have been available in the spring, if we can produce a revised note in the autumn that everyone is happy with, or can at least accept, then it will be worth having waited those extra few months. We also have to consider

rheolaidd o ganlyniad i faint y glawiad presennol, yn enwedig ar lanw uchel. Pa gamau a wnewch eu hawgrymu i fynd i'r afael â'r llifogydd yn Nwyrain De Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** Bu enghreifftiau o lifogydd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf hyn yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain a'r De-ddwyrain. Rhaid inni ymaddasu i lawiad a fydd yn fwy arddwys, ac efallai'n fwy anrhagweladwy. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, sy'n cynnal astudiaethau ar ddalgylchoedd. Mae gwaith yn mynd ymlaen ar y modd y gallwn ddal yn ôl hyrddiau o law. Os gallwn atal y llif am ychydig, a gwasgaru brigau'r glawiad, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn broblem—bydd hynny o gymorth. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym hefyd wedi buddsoddi rhagor mewn cynlluniau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd ac yn cynorthwyo'r pwyllgorau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd lleol a'r awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu cynlluniau. Ni allwn fod yn gwbl barod, gan na allwn ragweld y sefyllfa'n llwyr. Rhaid inni wneud ein gorau, ond rhaid inni hefyd newid ein dull o fyw—a dyna sydd dan sylw yn ‘Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol’—fel y gallwn leihau effaith y newid hinsawdd.

**Peter Black:** Gan fod y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn cael ei ysgogi gan ollyngiadau carbon, pa bryd y bydd y ‘Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 8: Ynni Adnewyddadwy’ diwygiedig ar gael i hwyluso ceisiadau cynllunio am generaduron ynni adnewyddadwy?

**Sue Essex:** Credaf y bydd ar gael yn yr hydref. Yr ydym wedi ceisio bod yn gynhwysol wrth ddelio â'r mater hwn, a all fod yn un dadleuol. Dewiswyd aelodau'r grŵp ymgynghorol technegol o blith amrediad eang o gyrff a mudiadau ac, mewn llawer achos, maent yn cynrychioli safbwyntiau eithaf gwahanol. Siaredais â'r swyddogion sy'n delio â hyn yn ddiweddar, a theimlant fod cynnydd yn digwydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ceisio cynhyrchu nodyn technegol y bydd yr holl grŵp yn gallu teimlo ei fod yn berchen arno. Bydd hynny'n cymryd amser. Er fy mod wedi gobeithio'n wreiddiol y byddai ar gael yn y gwanwyn, os gallwn gynhyrchu nodyn diwygiedig yn yr hydref y bydd pawb yn fodlon arno, neu o leiaf yn gallu'i dderbyn, yna bydd wedi bod

reducing carbon emissions.

yn werth disgwyl yr ychydig fisoedd hynny. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried lleihau gollyngiadau carbon.

**Phil Williams:** As William Graham said, one of the predicted consequences of climate change is an increase in rainfall in Wales, but a decrease in rainfall is predicted for parts of England. There is already talk of a massive new reservoir in mid Wales to meet the anticipated demand. Can you give an assurance that no such reservoir could be built without the National Assembly's full agreement? If such agreement were considered, could the National Assembly insist on a full economic return to Wales for the export of an important economic resource?

**Phil Williams:** Fel y dywedodd William Graham, un o'r canlyniadau i'r newid hinsawdd a ragwelir yw cynnydd yn y glawiad yng Nghymru, ond rhagwelir y bydd gostyngiad yn y glawiad mewn rhannau o Loegr. Mae sôn eisoes am gronfa ddŵr newydd anferth yn y Canolbarth i ddiwallu'r galw a ragwelir. A allwch roi sicrwydd na ellid adeiladu cronfa ddŵr o'r fath heb gytundeb llawn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Os ystyrid cytundeb o'r fath, a allai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fynnu tâl economaidd llawn i Gymru am allforio adnodd economaidd pwysig?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Question 8 deals with this matter. Question 6 (OAQ17834) has been withdrawn. Question 7 (OAQ17859) has been transferred for written answer.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae cwestiwn 8 yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Mae cwestiwn 6 (OAQ17834) wedi'i dynnu'n ôl. Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 7 (OAQ17859) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

9:45 a.m.

### **Cronfa Ddŵr Anferth yng Nghraig Goch Craig Goch Super Reservoir**

**Q8 Kirsty Williams:** What discussions has the Minister had regarding the possibility of building a super reservoir at Craig Goch? (OAQ17835)

**C8 Kirsty Williams:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch y posibilrwydd y caiff cronfa ddŵr anferth ei hadeiladu yng Nghraig Goch? (OAQ17835)

**Sue Essex:** I have had no such discussions and am not aware of any active proposals for any major reservoir developments in Wales. Following recent press speculation, my officials have contacted the managing director of Severn Trent Water. He wishes to assure the National Assembly that neither he, his company nor Water UK are developing plans to enlarge Craig Goch reservoir.

**Sue Essex:** Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau o'r fath ac nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw gynigion gweithredol am unrhyw ddatblygiadau cronfa ddŵr mawr yng Nghymru. Ar ôl y dyfalu yn y wasg yn ddiweddar, mae fy swyddogion wedi cysylltu â rheolwr gyfarwyddwr Severn Trent Water. Dymuna sicrhau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol nad yw ef, na'i gwmni na Water UK yn datblygu cynlluniau i ehangu cronfa ddŵr Craig Goch.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am sure that my constituents in the Elan Valley and Rhayader will be pleased to hear those reassurances. Will you give a guarantee that you will keep a close eye on this situation and continue to watch Severn Trent Water's movements? If it should come up with any such proposals, perhaps you could consider the company's

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy etholwyr yng Nghwm Elan a Rhaeadr Gwy'n falch o glywed y sicrwydd hwnnw. A wnewch roi sicrwydd y byddwch yn cadw llygad barcud ar y sefyllfa hon ac yn dal i wyllo symudiadau Severn Trent Water? Os bydd yn cyflwyno cynigion o'r fath, efallai y gallech ystyried effeithiolrwydd y cwmni

effectiveness in conserving its water supplies rather than affecting my constituents in the way that press speculation has led them to believe.

**Sue Essex:** We will do that. I was quite perturbed, as was the First Minister, about the press speculation and we discussed that. You are right that before any major projects are proposed, or even come forward at feasibility stage, we need to assure ourselves that we have done our best on conserving water. Many good schemes are coming forward that reduce the need, through various construction methods, and so on. We need to consider where we can make huge progress on conserving water supplies with the health trusts and others. To answer Phil Williams's point, permission could not be given without the Assembly being involved. It would originally come from the Environment Agency. We have devolved planning powers to call in any development, or whatever may be suitable at the time.

**Nick Bourne:** I have spoken to the managing director of Severn Trent Water, and it appears that it has no such plans at present. A misinterpretation of a much earlier document has led to this situation. Do you agree that if any such proposal comes forward, it is important that local people are consulted, unlike what has happened at nearby Cefn Croes, where I understand that we may hear today from a Scottish Minister at Westminster that there will be a public inquiry into something that affects the people of Radnorshire.

**Sue Essex:** Going back to the Craig Goch reservoir, 'affected' is a minimalist word to describe any potential proposal. It goes back to the earlier point on planning; we need to build in local consultation and local involvement as early as possible in any planning process. On Val's point about community involvement, if we consider Wales to be a community-orientated country, which I believe it is, community participation across the board in all sorts of aspects is important, so that the emphasis is changed from Government done to people to

wrth gadw ei gyflenwadau dŵr yn hytrach nag effeithio ar fy etholwyr yn y modd y mae'r dyfalu yn y wasg wedi'u harwain i gredu.

**Sue Essex:** Fe wnawn hynny. Profais gryn anesmwythyd, fel a wnaeth Prif Weinidog Cymru, oherwydd y dyfalu yn y wasg a gwnaethom drafod hynny. Yr ydych yn gywir wrth ddweud bod rhaid inni fod yn sicr, cyn y caiff unrhyw brosiectau mawr eu cynnig, neu hyd yn oed ddod ymlaen ar y cam dichonolrwydd, ein bod wedi gwneud ein gorau ar gadw dŵr. Mae llawer o gynlluniau da'n cael eu cyflwyno sy'n lleihau'r angen, drwy wahanol ddulliau adeiladu, ac yn y blaen. Rhaid inni ystyried lle y gallwn wneud cynnydd mawr ar gadw cyflenwadau dŵr gyda'r ymddiriedolaethau iechedd ac eraill. I ateb pwynt Phil Williams, ni ellid rhoi caniatâd heb i'r Cynulliad gymryd rhan. Fe ddeuai o Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gyntaf. Mae gennym bwerau cynllunio a ddatganolwyd i alw i mewn unrhyw ddatblygiad, neu beth bynnag a allai fod yn addas ar y pryd.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf wedi siarad â rheolwr gyfarwyddwr Severn Trent Water, ac ymddengys nad oes ganddo unrhyw gynlluniau o'r fath ar hyn o bryd. Camddehongli dogfen gynharach o lawer sydd wedi arwain at y sefyllfa hon. A ydych yn cytuno, os daw unrhyw gynnig o'r fath ymlaen, ei bod yn bwysig ymgynghori â'r bobl leol, yn wahanol i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yng Nghefn Croes gerllaw, a deallaf y gallem glywed gan Weinidog o'r Alban yn San Steffan heddiw y bydd ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i rywbeth sy'n effeithio ar bobl sir Faesyfed.

**Sue Essex:** Gan fynd yn ôl at gronfa ddŵr Craig Goch, mae 'effeithir' yn air bach iawn i ddisgrifio unrhyw gynnig posibl. Mae'n mynd yn ôl at y pwynt cynharach ar gynllunio; rhaid inni gynnwys ymgynghori lleol a chysylltiad lleol mor gynnar â phosibl mewn unrhyw broses cynllunio. Ynghylch pwynt Val am y rhan a gymerir gan y gymuned, os ydym o'r farn fod Cymru'n wlad â gogwydd cymunedol, a chredaf mai felly y mae, mae cyfranogiad gan y gymuned yn gyffredinol ym mhob math o agwedd yn bwysig, fel bod newid yn y pwyslais o

Government done with people.

Lywodraeth ar y bobl i Lywodraeth gyda'r bobl.

**Janet Davies:** You have clarified some of the issues coming out of this. Could we have a report on how global warming would affect water supply in mid Wales and the areas supplied by mid Wales? That seemed to be the rationale behind the statement—that global warming would create a greater need for water in Birmingham.

**Janet Davies:** Yr ydych wedi egluro rhai o'r materion sy'n deillio o hyn. A allem gael adroddiad ar y modd y byddai'r cynhesu byd-eang yn effeithio ar y cyflenwad o ddŵr yn y Canolbarth a'r ardaloedd a gyflenwir gan y Canolbarth? Yr oedd yn ymddangos mai hynny oedd y sail resymegol i'r datganiad—y byddai'r cynhesu byd-eang yn creu mwy o angen am ddŵr yn Birmingham.

**Sue Essex:** As I said, that was a press statement, not an official statement. To go back to my original answer, we are considering this, and the UK document was useful. It stated that many of these changes will happen and we need to adjust to them and try to prevent further deterioration in Wales. One point was that it is not just about heavier rainfall, but about parts of south Wales having less rainfall during the summer, which has consequences. I take this extremely seriously. Civil servants are working on this across the board. It affects agriculture, the environment and perhaps where we build and how we build. It has enormous implications for us. As a Government, we must work closely on this in consultation with other agencies and people, and try to prepare as best we can. As I said to William, I do not honestly think that we will get all the answers, but we can do our best.

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais, datganiad i'r wasg oedd hynny, nid datganiad swyddogol. I ddychwelyd at fy ateb gwreiddiol, yr ydym yn ystyried hyn, ac yr oedd dogfen y DU yn fuddiol. Nododd y bydd llawer o'r newidiadau hyn yn digwydd a bod angen inni ymaddasu iddynt a cheisio atal dirywiad pellach yng Nghymru. Un pwynt oedd bod a wnelo hyn â mwy na glawriad trymach, ac y bydd rhannau o'r De'n cael llai o law yn ystod yr haf, ac mae canlyniadau i hynny. Cymeraf hyn o ddifrif calon. Mae gweision sifil yn gweithio ar hyn yn gyffredinol. Mae'n effeithio ar amaethyddiaeth, yr amgylchedd ac efallai y mannau yr ydym yn adeiladu a'n dull o adeiladu. Mae iddo oblygiadau aruthrol i ni. Fel Llywodraeth, rhaid inni gydweithio'n agos ar hyn gan ymgynghori ag asiantaethau a phobl eraill, a cheisio paratoi orau y gallwn. Fel y dywedais wrth William, nid wyf yn credu y cawn yr holl atebion, a dweud y gwir, ond gallwn wneud ein gorau.

### **Datganiad ar y Trefniadau i Roi Cyswllt Ffermio ar Waith Statement on the Implementation of Farming Connect**

**The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones):** I am glad to report, a little over six months after its launch, on the progress on Farming Connect. Launched in the autumn of 2000, it is a key commitment of the partnership Government—not least because of Mick Bates's enthusiasm for the scheme. It is also an innovative service, aimed at helping farming families to rethink their approach to farm businesses, making them fit for the future. The scheme plays a central role in enabling the Welsh Assembly Government to deliver on the farming for the future strategy.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones):** Yr wyf yn falch o adrodd, ychydig dros chwe mis ar ôl ei lansio, ar y cynnydd ar Cyswllt Ffermio. Fe'i lanswyd yn hydref 2000, ac mae'n un o ymrwymadau allweddol y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth—nid lleiaf oherwydd brwdfrydedd Mick Bates dros y cynllun. Mae hefyd yn wasanaeth arloesol, sydd â'r nod o helpu teuluoedd sy'n ffermio i ailfeddwl am eu hagwedd at fusnesau fferm, gan eu gwneud yn addas i'r dyfodol. Mae'r cynllun yn chwarae rôl ganolog wrth alluogi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflawni'r

Its purpose is to ensure that farmers adapt to modern requirements through greater efficiency and/or diversification allied to economic and social sustainability. The scheme provides a comprehensive range of specialist advice and practical support, tailored specifically to the farming community in Wales.

On registering for the scheme farmers are provided with the on-farm services of a business consultant free of charge to draft a farm business development plan. Proposals for improvement and/or diversification are drafted, and a range of capital grants is available for viable projects.

While the foot and mouth disease outbreak delayed the launch of Farming Connect last year, I considered it essential to get the scheme up and running as soon as possible. Farming Connect has been positively received by many sectors of the farming community, including the farming unions, which played a key role in getting the scheme started. Of the over 4,000 inquiries to the service centre, almost all have requested a farm business development plan, which is the scheme's core element. Teething troubles are inevitable with the start of such a comprehensive scheme because numbers are well in excess of the total expected for its first year. I regret the waiting lists for consultant visits and the completion of business plans. I want to see waiting times reduced, but not at the risk of compromising the quality-assured nature of the scheme. That said, over 300 farms now have agreed business plans and we are working hard on improvements. My officials and those at the WDA are studying existing processes to find ways to streamline the service and speed up turn-around times, for example, by offering a short, sharp diagnostic assessment rather than a full business plan for those viable farming businesses that already have an improvement in mind and are anxious to proceed.

The key grants available on completion of a farm business development plan are first, the

strategaeth ffermio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ei bwrpas yw sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn ymaddasu i ofynion modern drwy fod yn fwy effeithlon ac/neu drwy arallgyfeirio sy'n gysylltiedig â chynaliadwyedd economaidd a chymdeithasol. Mae'r cynllun yn darparu amrediad cynhwysfawr o gymorth arbenigol a chymorth ymarferol, wedi'u haddasu'n benodol i'r gymuned ffermio yng Nghymru.

Ar ôl cofrestru ar gyfer y cynllun caiff ffermwyr wasanaethau ymgynghorydd busnes ar y fferm yn rhad ac am ddim i ddrafftio cynllun datblygu busnes fferm. Mae cynigion ar gyfer gwella ac/neu arallgyfeirio'n cael eu drafftio, ac mae amrediad o grantiau cyfalaf ar gael i brosiectau hyfyw.

Er bod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi gohirio lansio Cyswllt Ffermio y llynedd, credais ei bod yn hollbwysig rhoi'r cynllun ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Cafodd Cyswllt Ffermio dderbyniad cadarnhaol gan lawer o sectorau yn y gymuned ffermio, gan gynnwys yr undebau ffermio, a chwaraeodd ran allweddol wrth gychwyn y cynllun. O blieth y 4,000 a mwy o ymholiadau a dderbyniodd y ganolfan gwasanaeth, yr oedd bron bob un yn ymwneud â gofyn am gynllun datblygu busnes fferm, sef elfen ganolog y cynllun. Mae'n anochel bod problemau dechreuol wrth gychwyn cynllun mor gynhwysfawr gan fod y niferoedd yn fwy o lawer na'r cyfanswm a ddisgwylyd ar gyfer ei flwyddyn gyntaf. Mae'n flin gennyf am y rhestrau aros am ymweliadau gan ymgynghorwyr ac am gwblhau cynlluniau busnes. Yr wyf am weld lleihau'r rhestrau aros, ond nid ar draul sicrwydd ansawdd y cynllun. Wedi dweud hynny, mae dros 300 o ffermydd yn meddu ar gynlluniau busnes cytunedig bellach ac yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed ar welliannau. Mae fy swyddogion i a'r rhai yn y WDA yn astudio'r prosesau presennol i ganfod dulliau o symleiddio'r gwasanaeth a chyflymu'r amseroedd cwblhau, er enghraifft, drwy gynnig asesiad diagnostig byr, cryno yn hytrach na chynllun busnes llawn i'r busnesau ffermio hyfyw hynny sydd â gwelliant mewn golwg eisoes ac sy'n awyddus i fynd ymlaen.

Y grantiau allweddol sydd ar gael ar ôl cwblhau cynllun datblygu busnes ffermio yw,



farm improvement grant, which helps farmers to adopt best practice to make annual animal welfare, hygiene and product quality improvements and enhance, protect and maintain the environment of the farm. Secondly, farm enterprise grants help to widen the employment base on and off farms for farmers and farming family members, also to provide grants for tourism, timber processing, and processing and marketing. To date, £435,141 in grants has been committed, underpinning the total expenditure so far of £1,123,985. These figures will increase substantially in coming months. We intend to approve more applications during that time.

It is important to emphasise that Farming Connect is not just about grants; it is about helping Welsh farmers to manage a period of massive change in the farming industry and help them to explore new enterprises. New techniques and technology must be taken into account; new markets must be explored; good ideas must be pioneered and adopted. Therefore development centres have been established to improve knowledge transfer, and the network of 30 demonstration farms is being established to assist in this process and encourage the adoption of best practice. A number of successful events have been held at these centres and farms, and many more will be held throughout the summer. The right skills are essential. Specially tailored training programmes, launched last month by Education and Learning Wales, will help farmers to sharpen their business management and IT skills. They will also help farmers to develop entrepreneurial skills and become more aware of changing markets and consumer demands.

I have always said that Farming Connect must develop and expand, and additional services will be adopted. These are environmental and advisory services, which will demonstrate the practical and economic advantages of sustainable farming practices, and subsidised advice on planning applications for non-agricultural farm diversification.

yn gyntaf, y grant gwella ffermydd, sy'n helpu ffermwyr i fabwysiadu'r arfer gorau er mwyn gwneud gwelliannau bob blwyddyn mewn lles anifeiliaid, glanweithdra ac ansawdd cynnyrch a gwella, diogelu a chynnal amgylchedd y fferm. Yn ail, mae grantiau menter ffermydd yn helpu i ehangu'r sylfaen gyflogaeth ar ffermydd ac oddi arnynt i ffermwyr ac i aelodau o deuluoedd ffermio, a hefyd i ddarparu grantiau ar gyfer twristiaeth, prosesu coed, a phrosesu a marchnata. Hyd yn hyn, mae grantiau gwerth £435,141 wedi'u dyrannu, yn sail i gyfanswm gwariant hyd yn hyn o £1,123,985. Bydd cynnydd sylweddol yn y ffigurau hyn yn y misoedd i ddod. Bwriadwn gymeradwyo rhagor o geisiadau yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio bod Cyswllt Ffermio'n ymwneud â mwy na grantiau; mae'n ymwneud â helpu ffermwyr Cymru i reoli cyfnod o newid aruthrol yn y diwydiant ffermio a'u helpu i ymchwilio i fentrau newydd. Rhaid cymryd technegau a thechnoleg newydd i ystyriaeth; rhaid ymchwilio i farchnadoedd newydd; rhaid arloesi a mabwysiadu syniadau da. Felly sefydlwyd canolfannau datblygu i hwyluso rhannu gwybodaeth, a sefydlir y rhwydwaith o 30 o ffermydd arddangos i hwyluso'r broses hon a hyrwyddo mabwysiadu arferion gorau. Cynhaliwyd sawl digwyddiad llwyddiannus yn y canolfannau a'r ffermydd hyn, a chynhelir mwy o lawer yn ystod yr haf. Mae'n hollbwysig cael y sgiliau priodol. Bydd rhaglenni hyfforddi a addaswyd yn benodol, a lanswyd gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru y mis diwethaf, yn helpu ffermwyr i finio eu sgiliau rheoli busnes a thechnoleg gwybodaeth. Byddant hefyd yn helpu'r ffermwyr i ddatblygu sgiliau entrepreneuriaidd a dod yn fwy ymwybodol o farchnadoedd newidiol a gofynion defnyddwyr.

Yr wyf wedi dweud erioed fod yn rhaid i Cyswllt Ffermio ddatblygu ac ehangu, a mabwysiedir gwasanaethau ychwanegol. Gwasanaethau amgylcheddol ac ymgynghorol yw'r rhain, a fydd yn dangos manteision ymarferol ac economaidd yr arferion ffermio cynaliadwy, a chynghor cymorthdaledig ar geisiadau cynllunio am arallgyfeirio anamaethyddol ar ffermydd.

9:55 a.m.

This is an innovative initiative. It encapsulates the best in joined-up Government and involves a wide range of public sector partners, all with one aim—to equip the Welsh farming industry with the ability to survive and flourish. We are listening to the farming community, to the partners, to the clearing banks and to the farming unions. We will listen to anyone with a point to make about Farming Connect or with a good idea. Regular feedback is an important part of the scheme and making the necessary improvements quickly will be essential if it is to develop as we intend, to become a key element of the drive to create a sustainable Welsh farming industry for the future.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ategaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod y cynllun hwn wedi derbyn croeso cyffredinol, yn drawsbleidiol ac o fewn y diwydiant. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn gwbl agored ynglŷn â'r trafferthion a fu o ran ffermwyr a brofodd oedi wrth gysylltu â Cyswllt Ffermio. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio fy mod, fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-orllewin, wedi cysylltu ag ef ar ôl cyfarfod a gynhaliwyd yn Sanelêr ddechrau'r flwyddyn. Bu i ffermwyr yn y cyfarfod hwnnw gwyno'n enbyd am oedi o hyd at dri mis cyn gweld unrhyw weithredu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi manylion pellach ynglŷn â'r oedi? Derbyniaf ei fod yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r broblem, ond beth yn union yw'r sefyllfa ac a oes yn rhaid i bobl barhau i aros am fisoedd wedi iddynt gysylltu â'r gwasanaeth?

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog hefyd at y ffaith y bydd cyngor ar gynlluniau amgylcheddol ar gael drwy Cyswllt Ffermio. Ar wahân i Tir Gofal—fel y gwyr y Gweinidog, nid yw'r cynllun hwn yn derbyn ceisiadau ar hyn o bryd—nid oes cyfleoedd eraill ar gael i ffermwyr sy'n dymuno hyrwyddo cynlluniau amgylcheddol ar eu ffermydd. Sut y bydd Cyswllt Ffermio yn rhoi gwybodaeth am gynlluniau amgylcheddol i ffermwyr a rhoi cyfleoedd iddynt hyrwyddo'r cynlluniau hynny ar eu ffermydd?

Mae hon yn fenter arloesol. Mae'n cynrychioli'r gorau o ran Llywodraeth gydgysylltiedig ac mae'n cynnwys amrediad eang o bartneriaid sector cyhoeddus, a phob un â'r un nod—rhoi'r gallu i ddiwydiant ffermio Cymru orosi a ffynnu. Yr ydym yn gwrando ar y gymuned ffermio, ar y partneriaid, ar y banciau clirio ac ar yr undebau ffermio. Byddwn yn gwrando ar unrhyw un sydd â phwynt i'w wneud am Cyswllt Ffermio neu syniad da. Mae adborth rheolaidd yn rhan bwysig o'r cynllun a bydd yn hollbwysig gwneud y gwelliannau angenrheidiol yn gyflym os yw i ddatblygu fel yr ydym yn bwriadu, i ddod yn elfen allweddol yn yr ymgyrch i greu diwydiant ffermio Cymreig cynaliadwy ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I endorse the Minister's comments on the fact that this scheme has been broadly welcomed by all parties and by the industry itself. I am not convinced that the Minister has been entirely open about the difficulties faced by some farmers in contacting Farming Connect. The Minister will recall that I, as Chair of the South West Wales Regional Committee, contacted him after a meeting held in St Clears at the beginning of the year. Farmers at that meeting were extremely critical of delays of up to three months before any action was taken. Will the Minister provide further details on the delays? I accept that he is trying to tackle the problem, but what exactly is the situation and will people have to continue to wait months after initially contacting the service?

The Minister also referred to the fact that advice on environmental schemes would be available through Farming Connect. Apart from Tir Gofal—as the Minister knows, this scheme is closed to applications at present—there are no other opportunities for farmers who wish to implement environmental schemes on their farms. How will Farming Connect give farmers information on environmental schemes and opportunities to implement such schemes on their farms?

**Carwyn Jones:** Fel y dywedais ynghynt, bu trafferthion o ran oedi. Un o'r problemau yw bod naw corff yn rhan o'r cynllun hwn i ddarparu gwybodaeth ac i gefnogi ffermwyr ac i ymgynghori â hwy ynglŷn â'r ffordd ymlaen i'w ffermydd. Yr hyn a ddigwyddodd pan ddechreuwyd y cynllun oedd bod nifer fawr o ffermwyr am fynd at y cyrff yr oeddent yn gyfarwydd â hwy eisoes, megis y Gwasanaeth Datblygu a Chynghori Amaethyddol—ADAS. Profodd y bobl a geisiodd gyngor gan ADAS oedi sylweddol, ond nid oedd problem gyda rhai o'r cyrff eraill. Yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn awr yw y rhoddir amcan i bobl, wrth iddynt ffonio a dewis y corff yr hoffent gyngor ganddo, ynglŷn â faint o amser y bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros cyn derbyn cyngor a chyn y bydd cynrychiolydd o'r corff yn ystyried eu cynlluniau. Felly, mae nifer o bobl bellach yn defnyddio cyrff eraill, yn hytrach nag ADAS, er mwyn iddynt allu parhau â'u gwaith yn gynt na phe baent wedi defnyddio ADAS. Gwneuthum y pwynt hwn wrth siarad â ffermwyr ifanc yn Sir Benfro ddydd Gwener, a bu iddynt dderbyn bod pawb am gael cyngor gan un neu ddau o gyrff penodol yn hytrach na chan y cyrff newydd a sefydlwyd i helpu a chynghori ffermwyr.

Ynglŷn â chynlluniau amgylcheddol, yr ydym yn ceisio helpu ffermwyr i wella'r amgylchedd ar y fferm ac i ddelio â llygredd, fel slyri ac ati. Dyluniwyd y gwasanaeth hwn i'r diben hwnnw. Ni fydd hyn yn rhan o Tir Gofal, ond yn hytrach yn wasanaeth ychwanegol a fydd ar gael i bob ffermwr, er mwyn iddynt dderbyn y cyngor gorau ar sut i ddelio â materion amgylcheddol ar y fferm.

**Ann Jones:** I welcome the statement, in particular the attention paid to the length of time between registration and receiving a grant. Will you assure the many people in my area who have applied to the Farming Connect scheme that they will not experience undue delays in future?

**Carwyn Jones:** I give that assurance. Some people think that the business development plans and the farm reviews are only small obstacles to receiving grants, but it is more complicated than that; they must be taken seriously before people can access the

**Carwyn Jones:** As I said earlier, there have been delays. One of the problems is that, under this scheme, nine organisations provide information, support and an advisory service for farmers on the way forward for their farms. What happened at the outset was that a great number of farmers wanted to approach organisations with which they were already familiar, such as the Agricultural Development Advisory Service. Those who sought advice from ADAS experienced lengthy delays, while there were no problems with some of the other organisations. The current practice is that, when people telephone and choose the organisation from which they would like to receive advice, they are given an estimate of how long it will take to provide that advice and to have their schemes considered by that organisation. Therefore, many people now use organisations other than ADAS, so that they can proceed with their work more quickly than would have been possible had they used ADAS. I made this point to young Pembrokeshire farmers last Friday, and they accepted that everyone seeks advice from one or two specific organisations rather than from the new organisations established to help and advise farmers.

In terms of environmental schemes, we are trying to assist farmers in improving the on-farm environment and in dealing with pollution, such as slurry and so on. That is what this service was designed to do. It will not be part of Tir Gofal, but rather an additional service available to all farmers, to provide them with the best advice on how to deal with environmental issues on their farms.

**Ann Jones:** Croesawaf y datganiad, yn enwedig y sylw a roddir i hyd yr amser rhwng cofrestru a derbyn grant. A wnewch sicrhau'r nifer fawr o bobl yn fy ardal i sydd wedi ymgeisio i'r cynllun Cyswllt Ffermio na fyddant yn profi oedi gormodol yn y dyfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw. Mae rhai'n credu bod y cynlluniau datblygu busnes a'r adolygiadau fferm ddim ond yn rhwystrau bach rhag derbyn grantiau, ond mae'n fwy cymhleth na hynny; rhaid eu cymryd o ddifrif cyn y gall pobl gyrraedd y

financial measures available. However, the majority of people do not fall into that category. This issue has been raised many times with me. The capital grants are being paid now. Inevitably, there will be difficulties when a scheme of this size is launched. I assure farmers that capital grants are being distributed, and we are considering ways of speeding up the process without compromising the quality of the process and the advice.

**Peter Rogers:** If you think that you can give credibility to another bungling and ill-planned scheme by mentioning the name 'Bates', you are wrong. Only 11 schemes have been approved in north Wales, and only three in Anglesey. Your statement does not accurately reflect what is happening. We all know that there is a huge waiting list for the consultancy programme. You want to blame the farmers for that; you say that it is because we have all been requesting the services of the Agricultural Development Advisory Service. All consultants have waiting lists. The case that I mentioned last week in Plenary, where a farmer is facing a delay of four months, did not involve ADAS. Is it not true that the blame rests with you?

Farming Connect was due to come online in April 2001, but foot and mouth disease intervened. The delay was inevitable, but why did we not, at that time, anticipate the huge demand? Why did we not establish measures to avoid these huge waiting lists? It is no good blaming farmers. You had time to work it out, but you did not. You allowed the development of a complex, bureaucratic system that is off-putting to applicants. What do you have to say to farmers who have work to do but must decide whether they will do it now or whether they will wait a horrendous length of time for this bureaucratic process? It takes at least four to six months to set up. Is it not the case that a high proportion of applications are being returned because inadequate supporting documentation is submitted by the consultants? Is that not a reflection on the training given to those consultants?

mesurau ariannol sydd ar gael. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn perthyn i'r categori hwnnw. Codwyd y mater hwn lawer gwaith gyda mi. Telir y grantiau cyfalaf yn awr. Mae'n anorfod y bydd anawsterau pan gaiff cynllun o'r maint hwn ei lansio. Yr wyf yn sicrhau ffermwyr bod y grantiau cyfalaf yn cael eu dosbarthu, ac yr ydym yn ystyried dulliau o gyflymu'r broses heb beryglu ansawdd y broses a'r cyngor.

**Peter Rogers:** Os credwch y gallwch roi hygrededd i gynllun aflêr a di-drefn arall drwy grybwyll yr enw 'Bates', yr ydych yn methu. Dim ond 11 o gynlluniau a gymeradwywyd yn y Gogledd, a dim ond tri yn Ynys Môn. Nid yw'ch datganiad yn cyfleu'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn gywir. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod bod rhestr aros anferth ar gyfer y rhaglen ymgynghori. Yr ydych am roi'r bai ar y ffermwyr am hynny; fe ddywedwch mai am ein bod i gyd wedi gofyn am wasanaethau'r Gwasanaeth Datblygu a Chynghori Amaethyddol y mae hynny. Mae rhestrau aros gan yr holl ymgynghorwyr. Nid oedd yr achos a grybwyllais yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, lle y mae ffermwr yn wynebu oedi o bedwar mis, yn ymwneud ag ADAS. Onid yw'n wir mai arnoch chi y mae'r bai?

Yr oedd Cyswllt Ffermio i fod i gychwyn yn Ebrill 2001, ond cafwyd clwy'r traed a'r genau yn y cyfamser. Yr oedd yr oedi'n anorfod, ond pam na wnaethom ragweld, bryd hynny, y byddai galw aruthrol? Pam na wnaethom sefydlu mesurau i osgoi'r rhestrau aros anferth hyn? Ni ellir rhoi'r bai ar y ffermwyr. Cawsoch amser i roi trefn arno, ond ni wnaethoch. Gwnaethoch ganiatáu datblygu system gymhleth, fiwrocraataidd sy'n anneniadol gan ymgeiswyr. Beth sydd gennych i'w ddweud wrth ffermwyr sydd â gwaith i'w wneud ond sy'n gorfod penderfynu a fyddant yn ei wneud yn awr neu a fyddant yn disgwyl am hydoedd am y broses fiwrocraataidd hon? Mae'n cymryd o leiaf bedwar i chwe mis i'w roi ar waith. Onid yw'n wir bod cyfran fawr o'r ceisiadau'n cael eu dychwelyd am fod yr ymgynghorwyr wedi cyflwyno dogfennaeth atodol annigonol? Onid yw hynny'n adlewyrchu ar yr hyfforddiant a roddir i'r

ymgynghorwyr hynny?

The ICT scheme for farmers, which you praised a moment ago, was recently launched. That again raised expectations that ICT support and advice would be available through Farming Connect. Why is this scheme not delivering? Should we not ensure that the current schemes work effectively before launching anything extra?

Yn ddiweddar, lansiodd y cynllun technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu i ffermwyr, y gwnaethoch ei ganmol eiliad yn ôl. Yr oedd hynny eto'n creu disgwyliadau y byddai cymorth a chynngor technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ar gael drwy Cyswllt Ffermio. Pam nad yw'r cynllun hwn yn gwneud ei waith? Oni ddylem sicrhau bod yr holl cynlluniau cyfredol yn gweithio'n effeithiol cyn lansio dim byd ychwanegol?

**Carwyn Jones:** There are bound to be difficulties with schemes such as this. Inevitably, some people believe that reviews and plans are bureaucratic obstacles. They are not. They must be in place in order to give people decent advice. Many farmers need and want that advice. My conversation with young farmers in Pembrokeshire on Friday, which I mentioned earlier, was a prime example of that. They welcomed Farming Connect's aims and the fact that we have put our money where our mouth is. Instead of telling farmers to diversify and consider new business opportunities without offering any help, we are delivering practical help and allocating money to transform an industry that is in difficulty, especially compared to the industry elsewhere in Europe, which is in a much stronger position because of its stronger structure.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae anawsterau'n sicr o godi gyda chynlluniau fel hwn. Mae'n anrffod bod rhai pobl yn credu mai rhwystrau biwrocraidaidd yw'r adolygiadau a'r cynlluniau. Nid felly y maent. Rhaid eu cwblhau er mwyn rhoi cynngor boddhaol. Mae ar lawer o ffermwyr angen y cynngor hwnnw. Yr oedd fy sgwrs gyda ffermwyr ifanc yn sir Benfro ddydd Gwener, a grybwyllais yn gynharach, yn enghraifft ragorol o hynny. Gwnaethant groesawu nodau Cyswllt Ffermio a'r ffaith ein bod wedi rhoi ein harian ar ein gair. Yn hytrach na dweud wrth ffermwyr am arallgyfeirio ac ystyried cyfleoedd busnes newydd heb gynnig unrhyw gymorth, yr ydym yn rhoi cymorth ymarferol ac yn dyrannu arian i drawsffurfio diwydiant sydd mewn trafferthion, yn enwedig o'i gymharu â'r diwydiant mewn mannau eraill yn Ewrop, sydd yn gryfach o lawer oherwydd ei strwythur cryfach.

10:05 a.m.

This is a practical example of partnership in action. This scheme has been welcomed by the farming unions and welcomed heartily by farmers on the ground. The 4,000 inquiries that we have received and the initial difficulties in meeting demand are evidence of that. I would rather have problems in meeting demand than not have enough people showing interest in the scheme. This is an example of the Conservative Party's criticism of farming policy. I look forward to reading the party's agricultural policy when it is published in its Assembly manifesto next year because blank sheets do not take long to read.

Mae hon yn enghraifft ymarferol o bartneriaeth ar waith. Croesawyd y cynllun hwn gan yr undebau ffermio a chafodd groeso calonog gan y ffermwyr ar lawr gwlad. Mae'r 4,000 o ymholiadau a gawsom a'r anawsterau dechreuol wrth ateb y galw yn dystiolaeth o hynny. Byddai'n well gennyf gael problemau o ran ateb y galw na bod heb ddigon o bobl yn ymddiddori yn y cynllun. Mae hon yn enghraifft o feirniadaeth y Blaid Geidwadol ar bolisi ffermio. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddarllen polisi amaethyddol y blaid honno pan gyhoeddir ef yn ei manifestio ar gyfer etholiadau'r Cynulliad y flwyddyn nesaf oherwydd nid oes angen llawer o amser i ddarllen tudalennau gwag.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for acknowledging

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i chi am gydnabod y

the small part that I played in developing this scheme. Collaboration produces results. Having heard the last contribution, the message must be that co-operation and not conflict is the way forward. By developing this co-operation with the agriculture industry, a message is being sent to the whole industry in Wales that this Government cares about agriculture. In 1998, when I drafted parts of this scheme, I never dreamed that I would be lucky enough to be part of a Government that would develop it. Thank you, Minister, for making that possible. My overriding aim—[*Laughter.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an important statement on agricultural policy.

**Mick Bates:** We could revert to conflict, as I am sure Plaid Cymru will shortly.

My overriding aim is to help establish a viable and sustainable Welsh agriculture industry and I hope that Members will note that. Agriculture is a fundamental economic resource for Wales and, like so many primary industries, has undergone massive changes. Some are politically driven by the World Trade Organisation or the European Community, while others are brought about by the push of technology, the pull of the marketplace or a disaster such as foot and mouth disease. Whatever the forces for change, a responsible Government allows an industry to adapt. I found it difficult to listen to Peter Rogers's remarks because his party withdrew the support mechanisms that allowed the agriculture industry to adapt. It withdrew 25 per cent of the funding for hill farmers. That made a massive contribution to the state in which the industry found itself two or three years ago.

Farming Connect is a service but it allows farmers to adapt and that is why the industry today can look to the future.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Please ask a question soon.

rhan fach a chwaraeais wrth ddatblygu'r cynllun hwn. Mae cydweithredu'n esgor ar ganlyniadau. Wedi clywed y cyfraniad diwethaf, y neges y mae'n rhaid ei chyfleu yw mai cydweithredu ac nid gwrthdaro yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Drwy ddatblygu'r cydweithredu hwn gyda'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth, anfonir neges i'r diwydiant yn ei gyfanrwydd yng Nghymru fod y Llywodraeth hon yn gofalu am amaethyddiaeth. Yn 1998, pan ddrafftiais rannau o'r cynllun hwn, ni freuddwydiais y byddwn yn ddigon ffodus i fod yn rhan o Lywodraeth a fyddai'n ei ddatblygu. Diolch i chi, Weinidog, am wneud hynny'n bosibl. Fy amcan pennaf—[*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hwn yn ddatganiad pwysig ar bolisi amaethyddol.

**Mick Bates:** Gallem droi'n ôl at wrthdaro, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Plaid Cymru yn gwneud hynny cyn hir.

Fy amcan pennaf yw helpu i sefydlu diwydiant amaethyddiaeth hyfyw a chynaliadwy yng Nghymru a gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau'n nodi hynny. Mae amaethyddiaeth yn adnodd economaidd sylfaenol i Gymru ac, fel cynifer o'r diwydiannau pwysicaf, mae wedi profi newidiadau aruthrol. Ysgogir rhai'n wleidyddol gan Gorff Masnachu'r Byd neu'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd, tra hybir eraill gan dechnoleg, tynfa'r farchnad neu drychineb fel clwy'r traed a'r genau. Beth bynnag fo'r grymoedd sy'n peri newid, mae Llywodraeth gyfrifol yn caniatáu i unrhyw ddiwydiant ymaddasu. Fe'i cefais yn anodd gwranddo ar sylwadau Peter Rogers oherwydd gwneth ei blaid ef dynnu'n ôl y mecanweithiau cymorth a oedd yn caniatáu i'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth ymaddasu. Tynnodd yn ôl 25 y cant o'r arian i ffermwyr mynydd. Cyfrannodd hynny'n fawr at gyflwr y diwydiant ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl.

Mae Cyswllt Ffermio'n wasanaeth ond mae'n caniatáu i ffermwyr ymaddasu a dyna pam y gall y diwydiant heddiw edrych ymlaen at y dyfodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnwch gwestiwn cyn hir, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Mick Bates:** That is why we need the farm improvement grant and the farm enterprise grant.

I am pleased that 4,000 applications have been received, a quarter of which came from Powys. It reflects the scheme's success. How will the process be thoroughly monitored and evaluated and what processes are in place to ensure that feedback from the farmers and the unions will be taken into account? There are also concerns about the cost of consultants. However, it is worth reiterating that we will see a reduction of subsidies in years to come. We aim to establish a commercial basis to the agriculture industry in Wales. That can only be achieved by proper business planning and that is why the gateway through a business plan is essential.

Does the Minister have any plans to bring forward more incentives within this scheme to assist young farmers into the industry? We currently have a 10 per cent incentive, but there is a discrepancy between east and west Wales whereby all farmers cannot access the same level of funding. If we are to move forward with an innovative scheme, the incentives must be equal across all Wales.

**Carwyn Jones:** You will be aware that a monitoring group has been set up to evaluate the way in which Farming Connect is working. Regular reports will be given to the Committee.

You are right to point out the incentives that already exist for young farmers. If we can make the scheme more attractive to those we want to enter the industry, we will try to do so.

On funding, it is difficult to be inside Objective 1 areas and outside them. That creates a problem that will be difficult to resolve, but we must live with that. I take on board your points about the need for the industry to adapt. Industries that do not adapt die—end of story. That is the law of the market and farming is a business like any other. The world will not return to how it was in the 1970s or 1980s; those days are gone. The world will not return to the days when

**Mick Bates:** Dyna pam y mae arnom angen y grant gwella ffermydd a'r grant menter ffermydd.

Yr wyf yn falch bod 4,000 o geisiadau wedi dod i law, chwarter ohonynt o Bowys. Mae hynny'n dangos llwyddiant y cynllun. Sut y caiff y broses ei monitro a'i gwerthuso'n drwyadl a pha brosesau sydd ar waith i sicrhau y bydd yr adborth gan y ffermwyr a'r undebau'n cael ei ystyried? Mae pryderon hefyd ynghylch cost ymgynghorwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae'n werth dweud eto y byddwn yn gweld lleihad yn y cymorthdaliadau yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. Ein bwriad yw gosod sail fasnachol i'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru. Ni ellir gwneud hynny ond drwy gynllunio busnes priodol a dyna pam y mae'r mynediad drwy gynllun busnes yn hollbwysig.

A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i gyflwyno rhagor o fentrau dan y cynllun hwn i helpu ffermwyr ifanc i ddod yn rhan o'r diwydiant? Mae gennym anogaeth o 10 y cant ar hyn o bryd, ond mae gwahaniaeth rhwng y Dwyrain a'r Gorllewin sy'n golygu na all yr holl ffermwyr gael yr un faint o arian. Os ydym i symud ymlaen gyda chynllun arloesol, rhaid i'r anogaethau fod yn gyfartal ledled Cymru.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod grŵp monitro wedi'i sefydlu i werthuso dull gweithredu Cyswllt Ffermio. Rhoddir adroddiadau i'r Pwyllgor yn rheolaidd.

Mae'n briodol ichi dynnu sylw at yr anogaethau sy'n bodoli eisoes ar gyfer ffermwyr ifanc. Os gallwn wneud y cynllun yn fwy deniadol i'r rhai sydd am ddod i'r diwydiant, byddwn yn ceisio gwneud hynny.

Ynghylch ariannu, mae'n anodd bod o fewn ardaloedd Amcan 1 a'r tu allan iddynt. Mae hynny'n creu problem y bydd yn anodd ei datrys, ond rhaid inni ddygymod â hynny. Deallaf eich pwyntiau am yr angen i'r diwydiant ymaddasu. Marw a wnaiff diwydiannau nad ydynt yn ymaddasu—a dyna'i diwedd hi. Dyna ddeddf y farchnad ac mae ffermio'n fusnes fel pob un arall. Nid aiff y byd yn ôl at yr hyn yr oedd yn 1970au a'r 1980au; mae'r dyddiau hynny wedi mynd.

people shopped on the high street. The supermarkets will not disappear overnight. The challenge for farmers in Wales is to face the fact that the world has changed. To be fair, most farmers accept that. That was not meant as a criticism in any way. However, we must also accept that consumers have changed, and that the market has changed. There is no point bemoaning that fact. We must ensure that people adapt.

Yesterday, I was given a document by a Nuffield scholar—who came from your area, Mick—which examined how farming is structured in Sweden, France, Germany, Italy and Ireland. We are way behind. The document was a real eye-opener. Britain probably has the weakest farming structure in the whole of the European Union. There is no question about that. We must ensure that the structure of farming improves and that farming is able to face the challenges of the future. That is why Farming Connect is essential to that process.

**Elin Jones:** Ar y rhaglen *Ffermio* neithiwr, gwnaethoch sôn eich bod yn ystyried cynllun ymddeol ar gyfer ffermwyr. Pryd y bwriadwch gyhoeddi cynllun o'r fath, ac a fydd yn cael ei gyflawni drwy Cyswllt Ffermio?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym yn ystyried cynllun a fyddai'n cysylltu cynllun ymddeol â chynllun i ddenu ffermwyr ifanc i'r diwydiant. Dyma sut y byddai'r cynllun yn gweithio: byddai'r ffermwr yn ymddeol ac yn gadael y fferm er mwyn derbyn blwydd-dâl ar gyfer y pensiwn cyntaf. Rhoddir y fferm i ffermwr ifanc sydd eisiau dechrau yn y diwydiant a chaiff gyfle i brynu'r ffarm dros gyfnod o flynyddoedd. Golyga hynny y byddai'r costau'n is nag o dan gynllun traddodiadol. Yn ogystal, gall ffermwyr ifanc ddod i gyswllt â ffermwyr sydd yn ymddeol. Pe byddech ond yn cael cynllun ymddeol, byddai ffermwyr yn gwerthu eu ffermydd i bwy bynnag sy'n cynnig y pris uchaf. Ni fyddai hynny'n helpu pobl ifanc o gwbl. Mae ffermydd yng Nghymru yn costio rhwng £300,000 a £400,000, ac felly ni fyddai £15,000 yn gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth i

Nid aiff y byd yn ôl at y dyddiau pan oedd pobl yn siopa ar y stryd fawr. Ni wnaiff yr archfarchnadoedd ddiiflannu dros nos. Yr her i ffermwyr yng Nghymru yw wynebu'r ffaith bod y byd wedi newid. A bod yn deg, mae'r rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr yn derbyn hynny. Nid oedd hynny i fod yn feirniadaeth o gwbl. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dderbyn hefyd fod y defnyddwyr wedi newid, a bod y farchnad wedi newid. Nid oes diben cwyno o achos hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod pobl yn ymaddasu.

Ddoe, rhoddwyd dogfen i mi gan un o ysgolorion Nuffield—sy'n hanu o'ch ardal chi, Mick—sy'n ymdrin â strwythur ffermio yn Sweden, Ffrainc, yr Almaen, yr Eidal ac Iwerddon. Yr ydym ymhell ar ei hól hi. Mae'r ddogfen yn agoriad llygad gwirioneddol. Mae'n debyg mai gan Brydain y mae'r strwythur ffermio gwannaf drwy'r Undeb Ewropeaidd i gyd. Nid oes dwywaith am hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod strwythur ffermio'n gwella a bod ffermio'n gallu wynebu heriau'r dyfodol. Dyna pam y mae Cyswllt Ffermio'n hollbwysig i'r broses honno.

**Elin Jones:** On last night's edition of *Ffermio*, you said that you were considering a retirement scheme for farmers. When do you intend to announce such a scheme and will it be delivered through Farming Connect?

**Carwyn Jones:** We are considering a scheme that would link the retirement scheme to a scheme to attract young farmers into the industry. The scheme would work as follows: the farmer would retire and leave his farm in order to receive an annuity for his first pension. The farm would be allocated to a young farmer who wants to enter the industry and he would have the opportunity to buy the farm over a period of years. As a result, the costs would be lower than would be the case under a traditional scheme. Furthermore, young farmers can come into contact with retiring farmers. If you only had a retirement scheme, farmers would sell their farms to the highest bidder. That would not help young farmers at all. Farms in Wales cost between £300,000 and £400,000 and therefore £15,000 would make little difference to farmers who want to enter the industry, but



ffermwyr sydd eisiau ymuno â'r diwydiant ond nad ydynt am gael fferm y tro cyntaf.

who do not want to own a farm the first time around.

Yr ydym yn archwilio'r cynllun hwn yn fanwl ar hyn o bryd, ond mae nifer o broblemau cyfreithiol, ariannol a strwythurol i'w goresgyn. Os bydd y cynllun hwn yn gweithio, gallai fod yn batrwm i weddill Ewrop o ran sicrhau bod ffermwyr ifanc yn cael cyfle teg a bod ffermwyr sydd eisiau ymddeol yn gallu gwneud hynny heb orfod gwneud taliad. Byddai'r cyhoedd yn anghytuno â hynny. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn embryonig ar hyn o bryd, ond yr ydym yn gweithio arno.

We are currently examining this scheme in detail, but there are many legal, financial and structural problems to overcome. If this scheme is a success, it could act as an exemplar in Europe in terms of ensuring that farmers get a good deal and that farmers who want to retire can do so without having to make a payment. Most of the public would object to that. This scheme is embryonic at the moment, but we are working on it.

**Glyn Davies:** Croesewais Cyswllt Busnes, ac yr wyf am i'r cynllun fod yn llwyddiant. Un o'r pryderon sydd gan ffermwyr a phobl fusnes cefn gwlad, yw bod gormod o arian o gyllidebau cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth, fel Tir Gofal a Cyswllt Busnes, yn cael ei wastraffu ar fiwrocratiaeth. A wnewch chi gyhoeddi pa ganran o gyllideb Cyswllt Ffermio sy'n cael ei gwario ar fiwrocratiaeth?

**Glyn Davies:** I have welcomed Business Connect and I want it to be successful. One of the main concerns that farmers and business people in rural Wales have raised with me is that too much money from Government schemes, such as Tir Gofal and Business Connect, is wasted on bureaucracy. Will you announce what percentage of Farming Connect's budget is spent on bureaucracy?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn croesawu Cyswllt Busnes. Gobeithwn hefyd eich bod yn croesawu Cyswllt Ffermio. Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r ffigurau hynny; gallaf eich sicrhau eu bod ar gael. Rhaid inni gael system o weinyddu grantiau i sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd y bobl sydd ei angen. Ni allwn ddsbarthu arian heb reoli i ble mae'n mynd. Os ydych am wneud cais am grant, rhaid ichi dderbyn eich bod yn gorfod llenwi ffurflenni. Ni allwch gael yr arian heb ateb cwestiynau. Mae hon yn hen ddadl. Yr wyf wedi clywed ffermwyr yn cwyno yn aml am gostau biwrocratiaeth. Fodd bynnag, os yw pobl am gael system o daliadau grant, rhaid gweinyddu'r system honno i sicrhau ei bod yn gweithio'n effeithiol. Gwnaf yn siŵr bod y ffigurau ar gael.

**Carwyn Jones:** I am glad that you welcome Business Connect. I also hope that you will welcome Farming Connect. I will write to you with those figures; I assure you that they are available. We must have a system of administering grants to ensure that the money reaches those who need it. We cannot hand out money willy-nilly. If you wish to apply for a grant, you have to accept that you must fill in forms. You cannot get the money without answering questions. This is an old argument. I have heard farmers complain many times about the costs of bureaucracy. However, if people want a system of grant payments, it must be administered to ensure that it works effectively. I will ensure that the figures are made available.

10:15 a.m.

### **Datganiad ar Broffesiynau Iechyd Cymru Statement on Health Professions Wales**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I bring to your **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Tynnaf eich

attention a new health body in Wales—Health Professions Wales. It came into being on 1 April 2002. The body will provide a service for a range of healthcare professions, namely, nurses, midwives, health visitors, allied health professionals and healthcare scientists. Presently, HPW is a unit within the National Assembly. That is an interim measure until primary legislation in the form of the NHS (Wales) Bill is passed. That will allow us to establish HPW as an Assembly sponsored public body. The establishment of HPW is a result of UK-wide legislative change to professional regulation. Members of the Health and Social Services Committee have been informed of these regulatory changes previously through Committee papers and discussions. As a result of these changes, the United Kingdom Central Council for Nurses, Midwives and Health Visitors ceased to exist and the Nursing and Midwifery Council has become the new regulatory body. The UKCC and its four boards served the four UK countries. These boards not only had a regulatory function but also carried out other functions relevant to developing the professional competence of these staff groups, including quality assurance, post-registration education and training and providing a framework for continued professional development.

The Welsh Assembly Government and the nursing professions do not wish to lose the additional non-regulatory functions that the Welsh national board undertook and therefore a solution has been sought to enable continuity. This work was tasked to a change management group, chaired by Sir Adrian Webb. It put forward the proposal for the creation of a new body that would embrace a wider range of professional groups and carry out a range of functions to support the policy goals of NHS Wales. Many of these functions build on and expand the excellent work previously undertaken by the WNB. The change management group was a real partnership and included doctors, dentists, pharmacists, nurses, midwives, health visitors, health service managers, allied

sylw at gorff iechyd newydd yng Nghymru—Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru. Daeth i fod ar 1 Ebrill 2002. Bydd y corff yn darparu gwasanaeth i amrediad o weithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol, sef nyrsys, bydwragedd, ymwelwyr iechyd, gweithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd a gwyddonwyr gofal iechyd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru yn uned o fewn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae hynny'n gam dros dro hyd nes y caiff deddfwriaeth sylfaenol ar ffurf Mesur y GIG (Cymru) ei phasio. Bydd hynny'n caniatáu inni sefydlu Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru fel corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae sefydlu Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n ganlyniad i newid deddfwriaethol i reoleiddio proffesiynol ledled y DU. Rhoddwyd gwybod i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y newidiadau rheoliadol hyn eisoes drwy drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor a'i bapurau. O ganlyniad i'r newidiadau hyn, mae Cyngor Canolog y Deyrnas Unedig dros Nyrsio, Bydwreigiaeth a Gwasanaethau Ymwelwyr Iechyd wedi dod i ben a'r Cyngor Nyrsio a Bydwreigiaeth yw'r corff rheoliadol newydd. Yr oedd Cyngor Canolog y DU a'i bedwar bwrdd yn gwasanaethu pedair gwlad y DU. Yn ogystal â'u swyddogaeth rheoliadol, yr oedd y byrddau hyn yn cyflawni swyddogaethau eraill a oedd yn berthnasol i ddatblygu gallu proffesiynol y grwpiau hyn o staff, gan gynnwys sicrwydd ansawdd, addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-gofrestru a darparu fframwaith ar gyfer datblygu proffesiynol parhaus.

Nid yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r proffesiynau nyrsio'n dymuno colli'r swyddogaethau anrheoliadol ychwanegol yr oedd bwrdd cenedlaethol Cymru'n eu cyflawni ac felly ceisiwyd ateb i sicrhau dilyniant. Rhoddwyd y gwaith hwn i grŵp rheoli newid, dan gadeiryddiaeth Syr Adrian Webb. Y grŵp hwn a gyflwynodd y cynnig i greu corff newydd a fyddai'n cwmpasu amrediad ehangach o grwpiau proffesiynol ac yn cyflawni amryw o swyddogaethau i ategu nodau polisi GIG Cymru. Mae llawer o'r swyddogaethau hyn yn ychwanegu at ac yn ymhelaethu ar y gwaith rhagorol a wnaethpwyd o'r blaen gan fwrdd cenedlaethol Cymru. Yr oedd y grŵp rheoli newid yn bartneriaeth wirioneddol ac yn cynnwys meddygon, deintyddion, fferyllwyr,

health professionals and healthcare scientists and educationalists. As part of its work, the change management group carried out extensive consultation with stakeholders across Wales. The feedback received was in favour of establishing this new multi-professional body—Health Professions Wales—which will play an important role in supporting the structural changes to the NHS now being put in place to improve the quality of care we can offer our communities. HPW can be a force for change in helping to deliver our plan by supporting the continued education, training and development of a wide group of healthcare professionals.

NHS Wales employs around 77,000 staff. Nurses, midwives and health visitors account for approximately 30,000 and the allied health professions a further 8,000. Our workforce is our greatest asset. It is essential to the policy reforms that we are successfully delivering. HPW will ensure that we further develop this talent. NHS Wales also depends upon effective integrated teamwork. That requires that the professionals who work together in delivering these services have arrangements available for them to learn and develop together. That will encourage inter-professional and cross-boundary working. HPW will have an important role to play in that. It can bring these professionals together, particularly in terms of continuing professional development. With other partners, such as Education and Learning Wales, the General Social Care Council and the Quality Assurance Agency, HPW can assist in the development of a common framework for lifelong learning. We have already seen evidence of such a framework being developed for nurses, midwives and health visitors in the one developed by the WNB.

HPW is an ideal and timely vehicle for delivering developments in working practices through these new partnerships. I am confident that a multi-professional body of this nature can enhance and complement

nyrsys, bydwragedd, ymwelwyr iechyd, rheolwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd, gweithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd a gwyddonwyr gofal iechyd ac addysgwyr. Fel rhan o'i waith, cynhaliodd y grŵp rheoli newid ymgynghoriad helaeth gyda rhanddeiliaid ledled Cymru. Yr oedd yr adborth a gafwyd o blaid sefydlu'r corff amlbroffesiynol newydd hwn—Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru—a fydd yn chwarae rôl bwysig wrth ategu'r newidiadau yn strwythur y GIG a roddir ar waith ar hyn o bryd i wella ansawdd y gofal y gallwn ei gynnig i'n cymunedau. Gall Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru fod yn rym dros newid wrth helpu i gyflawni'n cynllun drwy gynnal addysg, hyfforddiant a datblygiad parhaus grŵp eang o weithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol.

Mae GIG Cymru'n cyflogi tua 77,000 o staff. Nyrsys, bydwragedd ac ymwelwyr iechyd yw tua 30,000 ohonynt a'r proffesiynau perthynol i iechyd yn 8,000 ar ben hynny. Ein gweithlu yw ein hased mwyaf. Mae'n hollbwysig i'r diwygiadau polisi yr ydym yn llwyddo i'w cyflawni. Bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n sicrhau ein bod yn datblygu'r doniau hynny ymhellach. Mae GIG Cymru'n dibynnu hefyd ar waith tîm integredig effeithiol. Oherwydd hynny rhaid i drefniadau fod ar gael i'r gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd wrth ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hyn fel y gallant ddysgu a datblygu gyda'i gilydd. Bydd hynny'n hybu gweithio rhyngbroffesiynol a thrawsffiniol. Bydd rôl bwysig gan Broffesiynau Iechyd Cymru yn hynny o beth. Gall ddod â'r gweithwyr proffesiynol hyn at ei gilydd, yn enwedig o ran datblygu proffesiynol parhaus. Gyda'i bartneriaid eraill, fel Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, y Cyngor Gofal Cymdeithasol Cyffredinol a'r Asiantaeth Sicrhau Ansawdd, gall Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru helpu i ddatblygu fframwaith cyffredin i ddysgu gydol oes. Gwelsom dystiolaeth eisoes o ddatblygu fframwaith o'r fath i nyrsys, bydwragedd ac ymwelwyr iechyd yn yr un a ddatblygwyd gan fwrdd cenedlaethol Cymru.

Mae Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n gyfrwng delfrydol ac amserol i gyflawni datblygiadau mewn arferion gweithio drwy'r partneriaethau newydd hyn. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd corff amlbroffesiynol o'r

other initiatives to strengthen the quality of the NHS Wales workforce. The education system must prepare health professionals for changing environments and make them unafraid to embrace change when it is required. Health Professions Wales will play a key role in helping to implement change. Health professionals across Wales need access to excellent professional education, from pre-registration education to post-registration development and lifelong learning, and to be confident that career development opportunities are available. Health Professions Wales will have a dynamic role to play in working with other professional organisations and educational establishments to ensure consistent professional standards across health and social care in Wales.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a general practitioner. All-Wales standards for continuing professional development are needed in all sectors of the health workforce, and that aspect is to be welcomed. We will scrutinise the details of Health Professions Wales in forthcoming discussions on the draft NHS (Wales) Bill. The various health professions are concerned about the protection of titles and safeguarding the public from bogus practitioners in physiotherapy. They are also concerned about resources for clinical teaching and continuing professional development in such diverse professions as nursing, podiatry, and physiotherapy.

Health Professions Wales is a result of UK legislative change to professional regulation. How will it interface with the new UK Health Professions Council, and how will Welsh representation on this council be safeguarded and organised?

This umbrella organisation for allied health professions, and members of the former Welsh national board, represents a huge diversity of health professionals, including physiotherapists, chiropodists, dieticians, art therapists, medical laboratory technicians—I could go on in a more emotional vein—as well as nurses, midwives and health visitors. All of these health professionals are diverse in clinical practice and qualifications. How

natur hon yn gallu gwella ac ategu mentrau eraill i gryfhau ansawdd gweithlu GIG Cymru. Rhaid i'r system addysg baratoi gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol ar gyfer amgylcheddau sy'n newid a'u calonogi i dderbyn newid pan fo angen hynny. Bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n chwarae rôl allweddol wrth helpu i roi newid ar waith. Mae ar weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol ledled Cymru angen mynediad at addysg broffesiynol ragorol, o'u haddysg cyn cofrestru hyd at ddatblygu a dysgu gydol oes ar ôl cofrestru, a rhaid iddynt fod yn hyderus bod cyfleoedd ar gael i ddatblygu eu gyrfa. Bydd gan Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru rôl ddynamig wrth weithio gyda chyrff proffesiynol eraill a sefydliadau addysgol i sicrhau safonau proffesiynol cyson mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Mae angen safonau i Gymru gyfan ar gyfer datblygu proffesiynol parhaus ym mhob sector yn y gweithlu iechyd, ac mae'r agwedd honno i'w chroesawu. Byddwn yn archwilio manylion Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru yn y trafodaethau sydd i ddod ar Fesur GIG (Cymru) drafft. Mae'r gwahanol broffesiynau iechyd yn bryderus ynghylch diogelu teitlau ac amddiffyn y cyhoedd rhag ymarferwyr ffug mewn ffisiotherapi. Maent hefyd yn bryderus ynghylch yr adnoddau ar gyfer dysgu clinigol a datblygu proffesiynol parhaus mewn proffesiynau mor wahanol â nyrsio, podiatreg a ffisiotherapi.

Mae Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n ganlyniad i newid deddfwriaethol i reoleiddio proffesiynol yn y DU. Sut y bydd yn rhyngwynebu â'r Cyngor Proffesiynau Iechyd y DU newydd, a sut y caiff y gynrychiolaeth o Gymru ar y cyngor hwnnw ei diogelu a'i threfnu?

Mae'r corff ambarél hwn i'r proffesiynau perthynol i iechyd, ac aelodau cyn fwrdd cenedlaethol Cymru, yn cynrychioli amrywiaeth aruthrol o weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, gan gynnwys ffisiotherapyddion, ceiropodyddion, dietegwyr, therapyddion celf, technegwyr labordai meddygol—gallwn fynd ymlaen mewn modd mwy emosiynol—yn ogystal â nyrsys, bydwagedd ac ymwelwyr iechyd.

will Health Professions Wales, as an umbrella organisation, address this diversity, while raising standards of professional education and accreditation across the board?

Will the Minister also outline how Health Professions Wales, to quote your statement,

‘will play an important role in supporting the structural changes to the NHS now being put in place’?

What role does the Minister foresee for Health Professions Wales in retaining staff in the health service in Wales?

**Jane Hutt:** As you said, this body will ensure that we have all-Wales standards, and it is taking a step, as a result of the change management group’s thorough work, to include those wider health professionals that form such an important part of our health workforce.

How it fits in with the Nursing and Midwifery Council and the new UK Health Professions Council is an important issue. There is no overlap in the roles. The Nursing and Midwifery Council and the Health Professions Council are regulatory bodies for the professions, and gatekeepers for the registers. Health Professions Wales will concentrate on those professionals after they qualify and enter the workforce. It will focus on continuing professional development, student awards, career information, clinical leadership, continuing education, and embracing that wider health professional base. The professions allied to medicine are now called allied health professionals. They are a huge range of professionals and play a key role in improving health in Wales. We are incorporating them into our local health boards, as you know, Dai, alongside the nursing, medical and other primary care professionals—the dentists, optometrists and pharmacists—to form the health team with local government and patients, on the local health boards. Therefore, they will have a crucial role. Health Professions Wales will work with us to ensure that we provide every

Mae’r holl weithwyr proffesiynol iechyd hyn yn amrywiol o ran eu harfer clinigol a’u cymwysterau. Sut y bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, fel corff ambarél, yn ymdrin â’r amrywiaeth hon, wrth godi safonau addysg ac achredu proffesiynol yn gyffredinol?

A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu hefyd sut y bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, a dyfynnu o’ch datganiad,

‘yn chwarae rôl bwysig wrth ategu’r newidiadau yn strwythur y GIG a roddir ar waith ar hyn o bryd’?

Pa rôl y mae’r Gweinidog yn ei rhagweld ar gyfer Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru o ran cadw staff yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru?

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y dywedasoeh, bydd y corff hwn yn sicrhau bod gennym safonau i Gymru gyfan, ac mae’n cymryd camau, o ganlyniad i waith trwyadl y grŵp rheoli newid, i gynnwys y gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol mwy cyffredinol hynny sy’n rhan mor bwysig o’n gweithlu iechyd.

Mae’r modd y bydd yn cyd-fynd â’r Cyngor Nyrso a Bydwreigiaeth a’r Cyngor Proffesiynau Iechyd y DU newydd yn fater pwysig. Nid oes gorgyffwrdd yn eu rolau. Mae’r Cyngor Nyrso a Bydwreigiaeth a’r Cyngor Proffesiynau Iechyd yn gyrrff rheoliadol i’r proffesiynau, ac yn borthorion i’r cofrestrau. Bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru’n canolbwyntio ar y gweithwyr proffesiynol hynny wedi iddynt ymgymhwyso a dod yn rhan o’r gweithlu. Bydd yn canolbwyntio ar ddatblygu proffesiynol parhaus, dyfarniadau i fyfyrwyr, gwybodaeth am yrfaeodd, arweinyddiaeth glinigol, addysg barhaus, a chwmpasu’r sylfaen broffesiynol iechyd ehangach honno. Yr enw ar y proffesiynau sy’n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth bellach yw gweithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd. Ceir amrywiaeth aruthrol o weithwyr proffesiynol ac maent yn chwarae ran allweddol mewn gwella iechyd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn eu cynnwys yn ein byrddau iechyd lleol, fel y gwyddoch, Dai, ochr yn ochr â’r gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill mewn nyrsio, meddygaeth a gofal sylfaenol—y deintyddion, yr optometryddion a’r fferyllwyr—i ffurfio’r

opportunity to enhance the education and continuing professional development of those professions. We must remember that that includes all those represented by the Welsh scientific advisory committee, particularly the medical laboratory scientific officers, and those whom we do not often mention but who are key to our workforce.

tîm iechyd gyda llywodraeth leol a'r cleifion, ar y byrddau iechyd lleol. Felly, bydd ganddynt rôl hollbwysig. Bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n gweithio gyda ni i sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig pob cyfle i wella addysg a datblygu proffesiynol parhaus y gweithwyr proffesiynol hynny. Rhaid inni gofio bod hynny'n cynnwys pawb a gynrychiolir gan bwyllgor ymgynghorol gwyddonol Cymru, yn enwedig swyddogion gwyddonol y labordai meddygol, a'r rhai nad ydym yn sôn amdanynt yn aml ond sy'n allweddol i'n gweithlu.

10:25 a.m.

**Val Lloyd:** I start by declaring an interest as a registered nurse and registered nurse teacher. One exciting aspect of this change, which I thoroughly welcome, is the multi-professional role of Health Professions Wales, which you mentioned. It can bring together 18 health professions. There are reservations when a new body is established but I know that the professions in general welcome that closer collaboration. As you mentioned, it underlies the national move to inter-professional education and working.

**Val Lloyd:** Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan buddiant fel nyrs gofrestredig a nyrs athrawes gofrestredig. Un agwedd gyffrous ar y newid hwn, a lwyr groesawaf, yw rôl amlbroffesiynol Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, y gwnaethoch ei chrybwyll. Gall ddod â 18 o broffesiynau iechyd at ei gilydd. Mae amheuan pan sefydlir corff newydd ond gwn fod y proffesiynau'n gyffredinol yn croesawu'r cydweithredu agosach hwnnw. Fel y gwnaethoch grybwyll, mae wrth wraidd y symudiad cenedlaethol at addysg a gweithio rhyngbroffesiynol.

Will you confirm that the co-ordination of the local supervising authority function for supervising midwives in Wales will be transferred to Health Professions Wales when the health authorities are dissolved in April 2003? Will you give a broader explanation of how you envisage that this new organisation will improve the quality of patient care in Wales?

A wnewch gadarnhau y bydd y gwaith o gydlyn swyddogaeth yr awdurdod arolygu lleol ar gyfer arolygu bydwagedd yng Nghymru'n cael ei drosglwyddo i Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru pan ddi-ddymir yr awdurdodau iechyd yn Ebrill 2003? A wnewch roi eglurhad ehangach ynghylch sut yr ydych yn rhagweld y bydd y corff newydd hwn yn gwella ansawdd y gofal i gleifion yng Nghymru?

**Jane Hutt:** I welcome your support, Val, as you are a member of one of the professions which benefited from the Welsh national board. Inter-professional education, which is developing now through our expanding health education in Wales will be crucial for the teamwork that is part of developing a new health service based on partnership. Safeguarding the role of midwives will be key. Returning to Dai's question about the role of the Nursing and Midwifery Council in relation to Health Professions Wales, the post-registration arrangement will secure professionals' place on the register. You will

**Jane Hutt:** Croesawaf eich cefnogaeth, Val, gan eich bod yn aelod o un o'r proffesiynau a gafodd fudd o fwrdd cenedlaethol Cymru. Bydd addysg rhyngbroffesiynol, sy'n datblygu'n awr drwy ein haddysg iechyd gynyddol yng Nghymru, yn hollbwysig i'r gwaith tîm sy'n rhan o'r gwaith o ddatblygu gwasanaeth iechyd newydd sy'n seiliedig ar bartneriaeth. Mae diogelu rôl y bydwagedd yn hollbwysig. Gan fynd yn ôl at gwestiwn Dai am rôl y Cyngor Nyrsio a Bydwreigiaeth o ran Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, bydd y trefniant ôl-gofrestru'n sicrhau lle i'r gweithwyr proffesiynol ar y gofrestr. Fe

probably be aware that the Nursing and Midwifery Council will have a statutory midwifery committee. Another issue that needs to be raised, perhaps, is that there are safeguards for health visitors, who have a separate register on the Nursing and Midwifery Council. In terms of patient care, this is about supporting a key part of our workforce and profession, providing clinical leadership, career information, development and support. Continuing professional development is particularly important given the growth in consultants, as well as nurses and midwives and the allied health professionals who are key to the health teams.

**David Melding:** I find the timing of this statement strange, as is the absence of the Labour members of the Health and Social Services Committee. There may be an explanation, but it is curious that they are absent this morning when you are making this statement, Minister—[*Interruption.*] I hear ‘get on with it’ being called from a sedentary position. That is usually the response when one makes a point of genuine scrutiny. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. David Melding is the health spokesperson for his party and he is making a preamble.

**David Melding:** The reason that the timing is strange is that the Health and Social Services Committee will scrutinise the draft NHS (Wales) Bill on Wednesday. That is an important process. I will ask about the detail of that Bill, as you have given your statement in advance of that discussion. Why are the two new organisations that are to be created under that Bill, namely the Wales Centre for Health and Health Professions Wales, dealt with so differently? One is described in great detail, with a full schedule, the other, which is the subject of this statement, is not. Why have you chosen to approach these issues so differently? How will the appointments to the Health Professions Wales board be made? Will they all be public appointments, in particular, the appointment of the chair? Along with Dai Lloyd, I want to know what the mechanism will be for the various professions to be represented on the board. Also, how will the public be represented,

wyddoch, mae'n debyg, y bydd gan y Cyngor Nyrsio a Bydwreigiaeth bwyllgor bydweigiaeth statudol. Mater arall y dylid ei godi, efallai, yw y ceir mesurau diogelwch i ymwelwyr iechyd, sydd â chofrestr ar wahân yn y Cyngor Nyrsio a Bydwreigiaeth. O ran gofalu am gleifion, mae hyn yn golygu cefnogi rhan allweddol o'n gweithlu a'n proffesiwn, gan ddarparu arweinyddiaeth glinigol, gwybodaeth am yrfaeodd, datblygu a chymorth. Mae datblygu proffesiynol parhaus yn arbennig o bwysig o ystyried y twf yn nifer yr ymgynghorwyr, nyrsys a'r bydwragedd a'r gweithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd sy'n allweddol i'r timau iechyd.

**David Melding:** Mae amseru'r datganiad hwn yn rhyfedd, gan ei fod yn digwydd yn absenoldeb aelodau Llafur y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Efallai fod eglurhad, ond mae'n rhyfedd eu bod yn absennol y bore yma pan ydych yn gwneud y datganiad hwn, Weinidog—[*Torri ar draws.*] Clywaf alw ‘ymlaen â chi’ gan rywun ar ei eistedd. Dyna'r ymateb arferol pan fo rhywun yn gwneud pwynt archwilio gwirioneddol. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. David Melding yw'r llefarydd iechyd dros ei blaid ac mae'n rhagymadroddi.

**David Melding:** Y rheswm y mae'r amseru'n rhyfedd yw y bydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn archwilio'r Mesur GIG (Cymru) drafft ddydd Mercher. Mae honno'n broses bwysig. Holaf am fanylion y Mesur hwnnw, gan eich bod wedi rhoi'ch datganiad cyn y drafodaeth honno. Pam y mae'r ddau gorff newydd sydd i'w creu dan y Mesur hwnnw, sef Canolfan Iechyd Cymru a Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, yn cael eu trin mor wahanol? Disgrifir un yn fanwl iawn, gydag amserlen lawn, ond nid y llall, sy'n destun i'r datganiad hwn. Pam yr ydych wedi dewis ymdrin mor wahanol â'r materion hyn? Sut y gwneir y penodiadau i fwrdd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru? A fyddant oll yn benodiadau cyhoeddus, yn enwedig penodiad y cadeirydd? Yn yr un modd â Dai Lloyd, yr wyf am wybod beth fydd y mecanwaith i'r gwahanol broffesiynau gael eu cynrychioli ar y bwrdd. Hefyd, sut y caiff y cyhoedd ei gynrychioli, gan fod

because continuing professional development and education is key to delivering modern medicine? The public needs to be reassured that we have the best possible physicians and clinicians in our health service.

**Jane Hutt:** I visited Health Professions Wales staff shortly after they became part of the Assembly having moved here from the former Welsh national board. This is the interim period. We hope to set up an Assembly sponsored public body through the legislation that we will discuss next week and in due course. I welcomed the staff to the Assembly and talked to them about their expanded role and remit, because we have brought a wide group of professionals into their remit. We have regularly reported to the Health and Social Services Committee on the work of the change management group led by Sir Adrian Webb and gave Committee members many opportunities to discuss what was happening. The nursing professions in particular were concerned about what would happen following the demise of the UKCC. We needed to address the regulatory changes in Wales to ensure that we have the best possible solution. The work that was done resulted in the conclusion that we needed to establish an Assembly sponsored public body. What we are seeking, as far as the legislation and the Wales Centre for Health are concerned, is to establish a new body. We have had the change management group and wide consultation. We need the statutory backing of legislation, which I hope we will achieve.

As HPW will be an Assembly sponsored public body, we will act in accordance with the Nolan-Neill rules and have the proper public appointment process. I hope that David will be engaged in that process. It will be helpful to consider the role of lay members and patients in terms of how we take that Assembly sponsored public body forward. The HPW staff are now part of the Assembly and we have a management group, which includes senior civil servants, external professionals and an audit group. Transfer of undertakings (protection of employment) regulations applied to the arrangements for those staff. I am delighted that they are so enthusiastic about the work that they are

datblygu proffesiynol parhaus ac addysg yn allweddol i ddarparu meddygaeth fodern? Rhaid i'r cyhoedd gael sicrwydd bod y meddygon a'r clinigwyr gorau posibl gennym yn ein gwasanaeth iechyd.

**Jane Hutt:** Ymwelais â staff Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru yn fuan wedi iddynt ddod yn rhan o'r Cynulliad ar ôl iddynt symud yma o gyn fwrdd cenedlaethol Cymru. Y cyfnod interim yw hwn. Yr ydym yn gobeithio sefydlu corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn ei bryd drwy'r ddeddfwriaeth y byddwn yn ei thrafod yr wythnos nesaf. Croesewais y staff i'r Cynulliad a siaredais â hwy am eu rôl a'u cylch gwaith ehangach, gan ein bod wedi cynnwys grŵp eang o weithwyr proffesiynol yn eu cylch gwaith. Yr ydym wedi adrodd yn rheolaidd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar waith y grŵp rheoli newid sydd dan arweiniad Syr Adrian Webb ac wedi rhoi llawer o gyfleoedd i aelodau'r Pwyllgor drafod yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd. Yr oedd y proffesiynau nyrsio'n benodol yn bryderus am yr hyn a ddigwyddai ar ôl tranc yr UKCC. Yr oedd yn rhaid inni ymdrin â'r newidiadau rheoliadol yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod yr ateb gorau posibl gennym. O ganlyniad i'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd, daethpwyd i'r casgliad bod rhaid inni sefydlu corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei geisio, o ran y ddeddfwriaeth a Chanolfan Iechyd Cymru, yw sefydlu corff newydd. Cawsom y grŵp rheoli newid a bu ymgynghori eang. Rhaid inni gael cefnogaeth statudol drwy ddeddfwriaeth, a gobeithiaf y byddwn yn sicrhau hynny.

Gan y bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n gorff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, byddwn yn gweithredu'n unol â rheolau Nolan-Neill ac yn cael proses benodiadau cyhoeddus briodol. Gobeithiaf y bydd David yn cymryd rhan yn y broses honno. Bydd yn fuddiol ystyried rôl aelodau lleig a chleifion o ran sut yr ydym yn datblygu'r corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad hwnnw. Mae staff Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n rhan o'r Cynulliad bellach ac mae gennym grŵp rheoli, sy'n cynnwys uwch weision sifil, gweithwyr proffesiynol allanol a grŵp archwilio. Yr oedd y rheoliadau trosglwyddo ymgymeriadau (diogelu cyflogaeth) yn berthnasol i'r trefniadau i'r staff hynny. Yr



taking forward. Those outside Wales regard with some envy the fact that we have decided to give this status to the continuing professional development of that wider group of health professionals in the health service. I hope that that answers some of your questions, David.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am grateful for your clarification on the public appointment of the chair of this new body. However, do you not think that it is regrettable that the staff involved will have had to undergo two changes in status? They were brought into the civil service from the Welsh national board and they will be moved out again into an Assembly sponsored public body. Does this not highlight once again the need for the Assembly to be able to act of its own accord, pass its own primary legislation and not be subject to the timetable of another place? That causes inconvenience for the Assembly and its staff. If we had primary legislative powers we could establish the Assembly sponsored public body immediately.

On continuing professional development, do you agree that it is crucial that we develop career pathways for professionals in order to recruit and retain staff within these professions? Recently, the Health and Social Services Committee took evidence on large shortfalls in staff. One reason for that is the lack of career pathways. Will the new organisation pay particular regard to developing career pathways for these professionals?

In developing its regulations, clinical governance procedures, and practice standards, will the new organisation be mindful of the challenges of service delivery in rural areas, and take these into account, as London based organisations have failed to do that in the past?

10:35 a.m.

**Jane Hutt:** I hope that we will achieve that legislation. I have met the staff. Many of them have been through previous reorganisations but they are enthusiastic

wyf wrth fy modd eu bod mor frwd dros y gwaith y maent yn ei ddatblygu. Mae rhai y tu allan i Gymru'n eithaf cenfigennus o'r ffaith ein bod wedi penderfynu rhoi'r statws hwn i ddatblygu proffesiynol parhaus y grŵp ehangach hwnnw o weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n ateb rhai o'ch cwestiynau, David.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich eglurhad am benodiad cyhoeddus cadeirydd y corff newydd hwn. Fodd bynnag, onid ydych yn meddwl ei bod yn destun gofid y bydd y staff dan sylw wedi gorfod profi dau newid mewn statws? Daethpwyd â hwy i'r gwasanaeth sifil o fwrdd cenedlaethol Cymru a chânt eu symud allan eto i gorff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Onid yw hyn yn tynnu sylw unwaith eto at yr angen i'r Cynulliad allu gweithredu ohono'i hun, pasio ei ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol ei hun a pheidio â bod yn ddarostyngedig i amserlen lle arall? Mae hynny'n peri anhwylostod i'r Cynulliad a'i staff. Pe byddai gennym bwerau deddfu sylfaenol gallem sefydlu'r corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ar unwaith.

O ran datblygu proffesiynol parhaus, a ydych yn cytuno'i bod yn hollbwysig inni ddatblygu llwybrau gyrfa i weithwyr proffesiynol er mwyn recriwtio a chadw staff o fewn y proffesiynau hyn? Yn ddiweddar, cymerodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol dystiolaeth ar y prinder mawr o ran staff. Un rheswm am hynny yw diffyg llwybrau gyrfa. A fydd y corff newydd yn rhoi sylw penodol i ddatblygu llwybrau gyrfa i'r gweithwyr proffesiynol hyn?

Wrth ddatblygu'i reoliadau, ei weithdrefnau llywodraethu clinigol, a'i safonau ymarfer, a fydd y corff newydd yn cofio am yr heriau o ran darparu gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac yn eu cymryd i ystyriaeth, gan fod cyrff sydd wedi'u lleoli yn Llundain wedi methu â gwneud hynny yn y gorffennol?

**Jane Hutt:** Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn sicrhau'r ddeddfwriaeth honno. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â'r staff. Mae llawer ohonynt wedi mynd drwy sawl ad-drefniant o'r blaen ond maent

about the backing given them by the Assembly and the arrangements that have been made. It is important that, for the first time ever, the Assembly will have thorough prelegislative scrutiny. The NHS (Wales) Bill was the only Wales-only Bill that was recognised in the Queen's Speech. We will take it forward next week with great vigour, and get legislative backing for this new board. It is essential that career pathways, which can be developed through continuing professional development, and the clinical leadership that we are developing in Wales, are supported through Health Professions Wales for all professions. This must also link in to our workforce planning, which we will discuss in Committee next month, and ensuring that our human resources strategy, 'Putting Patients First' and 'Delivering for Patients', deliver career pathways and support, in partnership with Health Professions Wales, across all our communities in Wales, be they rural or urban.

**Peter Law:** I welcome today's statement on Health Professions Wales. We all recognise it as an excellent example of partnership. Many will be pleased about it, because extensive consultation was undertaken before we arrived at this solution. I note the involvement of allied health professionals and I hope that speech and language therapists will figure prominently, bearing in mind the difficulties that I have mentioned before. I know that you share my concerns. What can this body do to address the major shortage of speech and language therapy professionals in Wales, particularly in paediatric care? I mentioned recently that there is a waiting list of 1,800 or so for these services in Gwent. Many parents are worried about the lack of provision and that their children may have speech impediments for life if they cannot get this vital treatment.

**Jane Hutt:** As Health Professions Wales will include the allied health professionals, I am glad that we can focus on speech and language therapists and on the current shortage. The Health and Social Services Committee has addressed that in its current review of children's special health needs.

yn frwdfrydig ynghylch y gefnogaeth a gawsant gan y Cynulliad a'r trefniadau a wnaethpwyd. Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad, am y tro cyntaf erioed, yn cael archwilio hyn yn drwyadl cyn deddfu. Mesur y GIG (Cymru) oedd yr unig fesur i Gymru'n unig a gydnabuwyd yn Araith y Frenhines. Byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen ag ef yr wythnos nesaf yn egniol iawn, ac yn cael cefnogaeth ddeddfwriaethol i'r bwrdd newydd hwn. Mae'n hollbwysig bod llwybrau gyrfa, y gellir eu datblygu drwy ddatblygu proffesiynol parhaus, a'r arweinyddiaeth glinigol yr ydym yn ei datblygu yng Nghymru, yn cael eu cefnogi drwy Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru ar gyfer yr holl broffesiynau. Rhaid cysylltu hynny hefyd â'n cynllunio gweithlu, y byddwn yn ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor y mis nesaf, a sicrhau bod ein strategaeth adnoddau dynol, 'Rhoi Cleifion yn Gyntaf' a 'Darparu ar gyfer Cleifion', yn darparu llwybrau gyrfa a chymorth, mewn partneriaeth â Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, yn ein holl gymunedau yng Nghymru, boed hwy'n rhai gwledig neu drefol.

**Peter Law:** Croesawaf y datganiad heddiw ar Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru. Yr ydym i gyd yn ei gydnabod yn enghraifft ragorol o bartneriaeth. Bydd llawer yn falch ohono, gan y bu ymgynghori eang cyn inni ddod i'r ateb hwn. Nodaf y rhan a gymerir gan weithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd a gobeithiaf y bydd lle amlwg i therapyddion iaith a lleferydd, gan gofio'r anawsterau a grybwyllais yma o'r blaen. Gwn eich bod yn rhannu fy mhryderon. Beth y gall y corff hwn ei wneud i ymdrin â'r prinder mawr o weithwyr therapi iaith a lleferydd proffesiynol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig mewn gofal pediatrig? Soniais yn ddiweddar fod rhestr aros o ryw 1,800 am y gwasanaethau hyn yng Ngwent. Mae llawer o rieni'n bryderus ynghylch y diffyg darpariaeth ac y gallai eu plant fod â nam ar eu lleferydd ar hyd eu hoes os na allant gael y driniaeth hanfodol hon.

**Jane Hutt:** Gan y bydd Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru'n cynnwys y gweithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd, yr wyf yn falch y gallwn ganolbwyntio ar therapyddion iaith a lleferydd ac ar y prinder presennol. Mae'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi ymdrin â hynny yn ei

This issue has been raised on several occasions by parents experiencing those difficulties, including parents from Gwent and from your constituency. I am discussing this issue with my colleague, Jane Davidson, because it is about the interface between health and social services and education. It is also about training speech and language therapists, and relates to our workforce plans, which we are discussing next month. We have asked all the trusts in Wales how many more health professionals we need, including speech and language therapists.

We have a problem across the UK. We must consider imaginative solutions, such as assistants for speech and language therapists, as well as ensuring that we retain and bring back into the profession all those who have this important qualification. That must be placed alongside all the other therapists that we need—physiotherapists and occupational therapists have already been mentioned. The whole range of those allied health professionals will be embraced in Health Professions Wales to ensure that we give them as much attention and recognition as we give our other medical and nursing colleagues in Wales.

**Brian Hancock:** Thank you for your answer on speech and language therapists, which Peter Law raised, because these problems also arise in my postbag and surgeries. There is a growing interest in alternative therapies and Chinese medicine. This must be addressed on the grounds of quality assurance and professionalism for the benefit of patients. Will this new body be the umbrella organisation for doctors of Chinese medicine?

**Jane Hutt:** This body will not be responsible for the regulation or the professional development of complementary therapists. However, I take your point that a great deal of beneficial use could be made of complementary therapy in Wales. I regularly discuss this with the regulated professions in those areas, but HPW will cover nursing,

adolygiad cyfredol o anghenion iechyd arbennig plant. Codwyd y mater hwn sawl gwaith gan rieni sy'n profi'r anawsterau hynny, gan gynnwys rhieni o Went ac o'ch etholaeth chi. Yr wyf yn trafod y mater hwn gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, gan ei fod yn ymwneud â'r rhyngwyneb rhwng iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg. Mae'n ymwneud hefyd â hyfforddi therapyddion iaith a lleferydd, ac yn gysylltiedig â'n cynlluniau gweithlu, y byddwn yn eu trafod y mis nesaf. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i'r holl ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru faint yn rhagor o weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol y mae arnom eu hangen, gan gynnwys therapyddion iaith a lleferydd.

Mae gennym broblem ledled y DU. Rhaid inni ystyried atebion llawn dychymyg, fel cynorthwywyr i therapyddion iaith a lleferydd, yn ogystal â sicrhau ein bod yn cadw ac yn denu'n ôl i'r proffesiwn bawb sy'n meddu ar y cymhwyster pwysig hwn. Rhaid ystyried hynny ochr yn ochr â'r holl therapyddion eraill y mae arnom eu hangen—mae ffisiotherapyddion a therapyddion galwedigaethol wedi'u crybwyll eisoes. Cwmpasir holl amrediad y gweithwyr proffesiynol hynny sy'n berthynol i iechyd yn Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru i sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi cymaint o sylw a chydnyddiaeth iddynt hwy ag yr ydym yn eu rhoi i'n cydweithwyr meddygol a nyrsio eraill yng Nghymru.

**Brian Hancock:** Diolch i chi am eich ateb ar therapyddion iaith a lleferydd, a gododd Peter Law, gan fod y problemau hyn yn codi yn fy mag post a'm cymorthfeydd i hefyd. Mae diddordeb cynyddol mewn therapiâu amgen a meddygaeth Tsieineaidd. Rhaid ymdrin â hyn ar sail sicrwydd ansawdd a phroffesiynoldeb er budd y cleifion. A fydd y corff newydd hwn yn gorff ambarél i feddygon meddygaeth Tsieineaidd?

**Jane Hutt:** Ni fydd y corff hwn yn gyfrifol am reoleiddio therapyddion ategol nac am eu datblygiad proffesiynol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt y gellid cael llawer o fudd o ddefnyddio therapi ategol yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn trafod hyn yn rheolaidd gyda'r gweithwyr proffesiynol rheoleiddiedig yn y meysydd hynny, ond bydd Proffesiynau

midwifery, health visiting, allied health professionals and scientific officers.

**Pauline Jarman:** You will recall that I wrote to you on this subject some weeks ago. I note in the statement, that as a result of these changes, the UKCC ceases to exist, and that the new regulatory council will now be the Nursing and Midwifery Council. Given those circumstances, does this open up the opportunity for you to consider paying the professional fees of nurses in Wales, similar to those fees paid for teachers for membership of the General Teaching Council for Wales?

**Jane Hutt:** I will have to respond to you in writing, Pauline. We must consider that issue, but I cannot comment further on it today.

Iechyd Cymru'n cynnwys nyrsio, bydweigiaeth, gwasanaethau ymwelwyr iechyd, gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n berthynol i iechyd a swyddogion gwyddonol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Byddwch yn cofio fy mod wedi ysgrifennu atoch ar y pwnc hwn rai wythnosau'n ôl. Sylwaf oddi wrth y datganiad y bydd Cyngor Cenedlaethol y DU yn peidio â bod, o ganlyniad i'r newidiadau hyn, ac mai'r cyngor rheoliadaol newydd fydd y Cyngor Nyrsio a Bydweigiaeth. O ystyried yr amgylchiadau hynny, a yw hyn yn cynnig cyfle ichi ystyried talu ffioedd proffesiynol nyrsys yng Nghymru, yn debyg i'r ffioedd hynny a delir dros athrawon am eu haelodaeth o Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru?

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ymateb i chi yn ysgrifenedig, Pauline. Rhaid inni ystyried y mater hwnnw, ond ni allaf wneud sylw pellach arno heddiw.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Dafydd Wigley:** Pwynt o drefn. Yn y cyflwyniad i Reolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad, ysgrifennodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, yn Ebrill 1999, bod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad fod yn gorff gwirioneddol ddwyieithog. Yr ydym yn methu â chyflawni hynny, o safbwynt yr hyn sydd yn digwydd nid yn unig yn y Siambr, ond y tu allan hefyd. Cymeraf fod ysbryd y datganiad hwnnw yn cyfeirio'n gyffredinol at ein gwaith. Yn benodol, mae'n anodd i staff dderbyn e-byst cyffredinol yn Gymraeg oddi wrth rhai adrannau, gan gynnwys yr adrannau sydd yn gyfrifol am gyfleusterau, adeiladwaith a thechnoleg gwybodaeth—adrannau o fewn eich swyddfa chi, Lywydd. Deallaf mai'r rheswm am hynny yw diffyg cyfleusterau cyfieithu.

Mae gan staff Cymraeg eu hiaith sydd yn gweithio o fewn y Cynulliad yr hawl i dderbyn gwybodaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, fel y mae gan staff Saesneg eu hiaith yr hawl i hynny drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. Mae hyn yn arbennig o berthnasol o ystyried cylchlythyrau cyffredinol syml a byr a anfonir gydag ymddiheuriad nad oedd

**Dafydd Wigley:** Point of order. In his introduction to the Assembly's Standing Orders, the then Secretary of State for Wales wrote in April 1999 that the Assembly should be a truly bilingual institution. We are failing to achieve that, not only with regard to business in the Chamber, but also outside. I assume that the spirit of that statement refers to our work in general. Specifically, staff seldom receive general e-mails in Welsh from some departments, including the departments responsible for infrastructure, facilities and information technology—parts of your office, Presiding Officer. As I understand it, the reason for this is the lack of translation facilities.

Welsh-speaking Assembly staff have the right to receive information through the medium of Welsh, as English language staff have the right to receive information through the medium of English. This is particularly relevant when short and simple circulars are sent out with an apology that there was no time for translation. I understand that this

amser i gyfieithu. Deallaf fod hyn yn deillio o'r polisi blaenoriaethu. Beth yw'r polisi hwnnw? A ddilynir polisi ysgrifenedig, ac a drafodir hyn? Mae hyn yn berthnasol i'r arolwg iaith sy'n mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithiaf y gall y Cynulliad fod yn esiampl i weddill Cymru o safbwynt gweithredu cyfundrefn ddwyieithog a pheidio â bod yn agored i feirniadaeth.

**Y Llywydd:** Cytunaf â phwynt Dafydd Wigley. Trafodwyd hyn eisoes gan Bwyllgor y Tŷ, sy'n gyfrifol am y blaenoriaethu. Bydd hyn yn parhau i gael ei drafod, ac anelwn at sefyllfa lle na fydd hyn yn digwydd yn y dyfodol.

emanates from the prioritisation policy. What is that policy? Is a written policy adhered to, and has it been discussed? This is relevant to the Welsh language review that is currently being conducted. I hope that the Assembly can be an exemplar to the rest of Wales from the point of view of operating a bilingual system and not leave itself open to criticism.

**The Presiding Officer:** I agree with Dafydd Wigley's point. This has already been discussed by the House Committee, which is responsible for the prioritisation. It will continue to be discussed and we will aim for a situation where this does not happen in the future.

### **Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cyngor Datblygu Garddwriaeth (Diwygio) 2002 Approval of the Horticultural Development Council (Amendment) Order 2002**

**Y Llywydd:** Dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn destun dadl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 22.25, 23.10 a 23.11, yn cymeradwyo'r drafft o'r Gorchymyn Cyngor Datblygiad Garddwriaethol (Diwygio) 2002 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mai 2002. (NDM1061)*

*the National Assembly: acting under Standing Order Nos. 22.25, 23.10 and 23.11 approves the draft Horticultural Development Council (Amendment) Order 2002, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 14 May 2002. (NDM1061)*

*Cynnig: O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 37, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.41 a.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer came to the Chair at 10.41 a.m.*

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

#### **Cronfeydd Strwythurol Structural Funds**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**Elin Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

**Elin Jones:** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*the National Assembly*

*1. yn cadarnhau ei gred na ddylid gwireddu manteision derbyniadau o'r cronfeydd strwythurol ar draul cyllidebau craidd presennol a gyllidir o floc Cymru;*

*1. affirms its belief that the benefits of structural funds receipts must not be delivered at the cost of existing core budgets financed from the Welsh block;*

*2. yn pwyso ar Lywodraeth y DU i sicrhau bod darpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus llawn, a chyllid cyfatebol digonol ar gael yn ail ran y rhaglen gyllido strwythurol, a fydd yn dilyn ar ôl i gynlluniau gwariant cyfredol Llywodraeth y DU ddod i ben yn 2003. (NDM1060)*

*2. presses the UK Government to ensure that full public expenditure cover and adequate match funding is in place for the second half of the structural funding programme, which follows the expiry of the UK Government's spending plan in 2003. (NDM1060)*

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn dod, bron air am air, o This proposal is taken, almost word for word,

gymal 15, adran 4 y cytundeb partneriaeth sy'n ffurfio rhaglen Llywodraeth y glymblaid.

Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio nad ceisio bod yn glyfar, gosod trap i'r Llywodraeth na dwyn embaras arni oedd Plaid Cymru wrth gynnig y cynnig hwn. Nid creu rhwygiadau a thensiynau pellach rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Swyddfa Cymru oedd ein bwriad chwaith—mae hynny'n digwydd heb gymorth Plaid Cymru.

Cynigiwn y cynnig hwn mewn ysbryd o gefnogi datganiad y bartneriaeth ar yr angen am gyllid Ewropeaidd a chyllid cyfatebol llawn yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, sy'n cael ei drafod ar hyn o bryd, i'w gyhoeddi ym mis Gorffennaf.

Yn 2000, croesawodd pob plaid y ffaith ein bod wedi derbyn cyllid Ewropeaidd yn ychwanegol at arian Barnett am y tro cyntaf erioed: £421 miliwn. Am y tro cyntaf, derbyniodd Cymru y rhan fwyaf o'r arian Ewropeaidd yr oedd y Comisiwn wedi'i ddarparu ar ein cyfer. Yr oedd hon yn fuddugoliaeth fawr ar y pryd—

**Peter Law:** Will you join me in congratulating the Labour Government on achieving Objective 1 funding for Wales?

10:45 a.m.

**Elin Jones:** Croesawn y ffaith fod gennym Amcan 1 yng Nghymru, ond mae hynny o ganlyniad i bwysau gan Blaid Cymru ar hyd y blynyddoedd i sicrhau cronfeydd strwythurol i adlewyrchu haeddiant ac—yn anffodus—dlodi cymunedau Cymru.

Am y tro cyntaf—ac mae hwn yn fater i'w groesawu—derbyniodd Cymru y rhan fwyaf o'r arian yr oedd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn ei ddarparu ar ein cyfer. Cydnabyddaf mai buddugoliaeth i'r Llywodraeth hon oedd hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn adlewyrchu anghyfiawnder y blynyddoedd ers diwedd yr 1980au pan na dderbyniodd Cymru lawer o'r arian Ewropeaidd yr honnwyd iddo lifo i Gymru o dan Amcan 2 a 5 ac yn y blaen. Nid oes rhyfedd na ddangosodd y rhaglenni hyn fawr o ôl cadarnhaol ar economi Cymru.

from clause 15, section 4 of the partnership agreement that sets out the coalition Government's programme.

It is important to emphasise that in proposing this motion, Plaid Cymru was not trying to be clever, set a trap or embarrass the Government. Neither was it our intention to create further rifts and tensions between the Assembly Government and the Wales Office—that is happening without Plaid Cymru's help.

We propose this motion in a spirit of support for the partnership's statement on the need for European funding and full match funding over and above the Barnett formula in the comprehensive spending review, which is currently being discussed, and will be announced in July.

In 2000, all parties welcomed the fact that we had received European funding in addition to the Barnett funds for the first time: £421 million. For the first time, Wales received most of the European funding that the Commission had allocated to us, and that was a great victory at the time—

**Peter Law:** A wnewch ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch y Llywodraeth Lafur ar sicrhau arian Amcan 1 i Gymru?

**Elin Jones:** We welcome the fact that we have Objective 1 in Wales, but that is as a result of pressure from Plaid Cymru over the years for structural funds to reflect the needs and—unfortunately—the poverty of Welsh communities.

For the first time—and this is to be welcomed—Wales received most of the money that the European Commission provided for us. I acknowledge that that was a victory for this Government. However, it reflected the injustice of the years since the end of the 1980s when little of the European money that was allegedly flowing into Wales under Objective 2 and 5 and so on, was given to us. It is no wonder that these programmes had little positive impact on the Welsh economy.

Ni dderbyniodd y Cynulliad arian cyllid cyfatebol Amcan 1 yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett yn adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant 2000, ac, felly, mae'r cyllid cyfatebol i Amcan 1 wedi dod o gyllidebau mewnol y Cynulliad, a gweddill sector cyhoeddus Cymru. Er bod hyn yn awr yn tynnu oddi wrth gyllidebau craidd y Cynulliad, gydag Amcan 1 ar fin symud i'w broffil gwariant uchaf, heb gyllid cyfatebol ychwanegol i'r bloc, bydd yr effaith yn y dyfodol ar gyllidebau craidd y Cynulliad yn sylweddol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Which other parts of the United Kingdom received match funding?

**Elin Jones:** Nid wyf yma i ddadlau achosion rhanbarthau eraill y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i ni ei wneud yw sicrhau bod Cymru—gallaf ond siarad dros Gymru—yn derbyn arian Ewropeaidd yn ogystal â'r cyllid cyfatebol domestig oddi wrth Lywodraeth yr aelod wladwriaeth.

Dyna pam bod Plaid Cymru yn croesawu cymal 15 y cytundeb partneriaeth. Tynnaf sylw Brian Gibbons at hynny. Nodir yn glir na ddylai manteision y cronfeydd strwythurol fod ar draul cyllidebau craidd y Cynulliad na chyllidebau craidd adrannau o fewn rhanbarthau Lloegr. Dylai Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol ddarparu'r arian Ewropeaidd a'r cyllid cyfatebol ar gyfer ail hanner y rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol, ar ôl i'w chynlluniau gwariant cyfredol ddod i ben yn 2003. Yn awr, felly, wrth i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau drafod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, yw'r amser i'r Cynulliad ddatgan yn glir ei ddisgwyliadau o'r adolygiad yn mis Gorffennaf.

That is why I am more than dismayed at the Government's approach to our motion and debate. It wants to delete our motion and reassert the partnership agreement, claiming that there is sufficient European and public sector match funding at present. In proposing such an amendment, I expect the Minister to put on record that she will look to the UK Treasury to supply, in the next spending round, sufficient European and match

The Assembly did not receive match funding for Objective 1 over and above the Barnett formula in the 2000 comprehensive spending review, and, therefore, match funding for Objective 1 has come from internal Assembly budgets, and the rest of Wales's public sector. Although this is now taking money from the Assembly's core budgets, with Objective 1 about to move to its highest spending profile, without match funding additional to the block, the future effect on the Assembly's core budgets will be significant.

**Brian Gibbons:** Pa rannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig a dderbyniodd gyllid cyfatebol?

**Elin Jones:** I am not here to argue the case for other regions of the United Kingdom. The important task for us is to ensure that Wales—and I can only speak for Wales—receives European funding as well as domestic match funding from the member state Government.

That is why Plaid Cymru welcomes clause 15 of the partnership agreement. I draw Brian Gibbons's attention to that. It is clearly stated that the structural funds should not be spent at the expense of the Assembly's core budgets, nor the core budgets of any departments in English regions. The United Kingdom Government should provide the European money and the match funding for the second part of the structural funds programme, at the end of its current spending plans in 2003. Therefore, now is the time, as the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities discusses the comprehensive spending review with the Secretary of State, for the Assembly to clearly state its expectations of the review in July.

Dyna pam yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr at ymagwedd y Llywodraeth at ein cynnig a'n dadl. Mae'n dymuno dileu ein cynnig ac ailddatgan y cytundeb partneriaeth, gan honni bod digon o gyllid cyfatebol Ewropeaidd a sector cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd. Wrth gynnig gwelliant o'r fath, disgwyliaf i'r Gweinidog roi ar y cofnod y bydd yn disgwyl i Drysorlys y DU ddarparu, yn y cylch gwariant nesaf, ddigon o gyllid Ewropeaidd a chyllid



funding to avoid draining the Assembly's core budgets. Match funds are currently met from the core budget, therefore, we cannot support the amendment tabled by the Labour/Liberal Democrat alliance. While I should not be too surprised by Carwyn Jones's amendment, the Liberal Democrats' arguments never cease to amaze me. Such great protagonists not so long ago for both European and match funding additional to the Barnett block, they now struggle desperately for a credible line to justify voting against their own partnership agreement today.

This is their attempt at a justification, taken from the Liberal Democrat press release this week:

'What they're suggesting is absolutely right. That's why it's in the partnership agreement and that's why we're already doing it. For that reason, we'll be voting against their out of date motion.'

The Lib-Dem logic is 'It's right, so we'll vote against it.' They claim that it is out of date; but the motion in fact refers to the next spending review period for 2003. The spending plans are being negotiated and finalised at present in advance of the July announcement. This motion is therefore current. If you believe in it, vote for it.

We will support amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2 is, in fact, a matter of historical record. Unlike the Liberal Democrats, if it is right, we will vote for it. Amendment 3 takes us into the realms of implementation, and we agree that voluntary and business sectors are increasingly turning away from Objective 1 because of bureaucratic overload.

Faint o arian, felly, fyddai'n ateb y gofyn am arian Ewropeaidd a chyllid cyfatebol heb orfod tynnu oddi wrth arian iechyd ac addysg o 2003 ymlaen? O gymryd ein bod am wario arian Amcan 1 yn gyson o hyn i ddiwedd y rhaglen, gan osgoi datglustnodi arian ar ôl dwy flynedd, mae'n debyg y bydd angen tua

cyfatebol i osgoi dihysbyddu cyllidebau craidd y Cynulliad. Telir cyllid cyfatebol ar hyn o bryd o'r gyllideb graidd, felly, ni allwn gefnogi'r gwelliant a gyflwynwyd gan y gynghrair Lafur/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Er na ddylwn gael fy synnu'n ormodol gan welliant Carwyn Jones, mae dadleuon y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn destun rhyfeddod imi bob amser. A hwythau'n gymaint o gefnogwyr ychydig yn ôl i gyllid Ewropeaidd a chyllid cyfatebol ar ben bloc Barnett, maent bellach yn ymbalfalu'n anobeithiol am ddadl gredadwy i gyfiawnhau pleidleisio yn erbyn eu cytundeb partneriaeth eu hunain heddiw.

Dyma eu hymgais hwy i'w gyfiawnhau, a gymerwyd o ddatganiad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i'r wasg yr wythnos hon:

'Mae'r hyn y maent yn ei awgrymu'n berffaith gywir. Dyna pam y mae yn y cytundeb partneriaeth a dyna pam yr ydym eisoes yn ei wneud. Oherwydd hynny, byddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn eu cynnig hen ffasiwn.'

Rhesymeg y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw 'Mae'n iawn, felly pleidleisiwn yn ei erbyn.' Maent yn honni ei fod yn hen ffasiwn; ond mae'r cynnig yn cyfeirio mewn gwirionedd at gyfnod yr adolygiad nesaf o wariant ar gyfer 2003. Mae'r cynlluniau gwario'n cael eu negodi a'u cwblhau ar hyn o bryd cyn y cyhoeddiad yng Ngorffennaf. Felly mae'r cynnig hwn yn gyfoes. Os credwch ynddo, pleidleisiwch drosto.

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Mae gwelliant 2 yn fater o gofnod hanesyddol, mewn gwirionedd. Yn wahanol i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, os yw'n iawn, pleidleisiwn drosto. Mae gwelliant 3 yn mynd â ni i faes gweithredu, a chytunwn fod y sectorau gwirfoddol a busnes yn troi fwyfwy oddi wrth Amcan 1 oherwydd y baich biwrocataidd gormodol.

How much funding, therefore, would meet the demand for European funding and match funding without forcing us to withdraw funding from health and education from 2003 onwards? Assuming that we wish to spend Objective 1 funding consistently from now to the end of the programme and avoid

£190 miliwn y flwyddyn o arian Ewropeaidd am y cyfnod nesaf, gyda thua £20 miliwn o hwn yn dod o fewn Barnett yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, a rhyw £170 miliwn yn dod o'r tu allan i Barnett. Hefyd, dros yr un cyfnod, bydd angen tua £160 miliwn o gyllid cyfatebol o'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae tua £60 miliwn o hwn yn y system eisoes—yn Ffordd i Ffyniant ac ati—felly, mae angen £100 miliwn o gyllid cyfatebol. O ble y daw hwn? Daw naill ai o'r Trysorlys, yn ychwanegol at floc Barnett, neu o gyllidebau craidd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Nid jôc fyddai dod o hyd i £100 miliwn heb niweidio ac amddifadu rhai o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn sylweddol. Mae'r cais yn un syml—os am beidio â thynnu arian oddi wrth ieched neu addysg yng Nghymru, er mwyn defnyddio Amcan 1 yn llawn, ym mis Gorffennaf bydd yn rhaid i Gordon Brown gyhoeddi £270 miliwn y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol at Barnett: £170 miliwn o arian Ewropeaidd, a £100 miliwn o arian cyfatebol ychwanegol.

**Huw Lewis:** You must agree that the Assembly's budget has increased massively under this Labour Government, to almost £11 billion. That enables us to invest in public services in an historic sense. Is it not the case that if the Labour Government were to introduce free beer, Plaid Cymru would complain that the bar was too crowded?

**Elin Jones:** No.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi croesawu'r ffaith ein bod yn cael yr arian Ewropeaidd, a hynny am y tro cyntaf yn 2000, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cydnabod hynny fel cam sylweddol ymlaen. Gofynnaf yn awr am y cyllid cyfatebol yn ogystal, gan fod y swm hwnnw yn £100 miliwn y flwyddyn a byddai peidio â'i dderbyn yn tynnu'n sylweddol oddi wrth ein cyllidebau craidd. Byddai'n rhoi'r cyllidebau craidd dan anfantais o gymharu â rhanbarthau eraill yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol nad oes ganddynt gynifer o ardaloedd Amcan 1.

10:55 a.m.

Yn ôl ein dadansoddiad, mae'r ffigurau'n

decommitting funding after two years, then it is likely that about £190 million of European funding per annum will be needed for the next period, with approximately £20 million of that coming from within Barnett in the comprehensive spending review, and about £170 from elsewhere. Over the same period, about £160 million in match funding will also be required from the public sector. Some £60 million of this is already in the system—in Pathway to Prosperity and so on—so we need £100 million in match funding. Where will this money be found? It will either come from the Treasury, in addition to the Barnett block, or from core National Assembly budgets. Finding £100 million without considerably damaging and depriving some of our public services would be no joke. The request is simple—if we are to avoid taking money from health or education in Wales, in order to make full use of Objective 1 funding, Gordon Brown must announce in July that Wales is to receive £270 million per annum over and above Barnett: £170 million in European funding, and £100 million in additional match funding.

**Huw Lewis:** Rhaid ichi gytuno bod cyllideb y Cynulliad wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, i ymron i £11 biliwn. Mae hynny'n ein galluogi i fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn ystyr hanesyddol. Onid yw'n wir, pe bai'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn cyflwyno cwrw am ddim, byddai Plaid Cymru'n cwyno bod y bar yn orlawn?

**Elin Jones:** Nac ydyw.

I have already welcomed the fact that we received the European funding, for the first time in 2000, and I hope that you will acknowledge that as a considerable step forward. I am now asking that we receive the match funding too. To be deprived of a sum of £100 million per annum would place great strain on our core budgets. It would put us at a disadvantage compared to other regions of the United Kingdom that do not have as many Objective 1 areas.

According to our analysis, the figures are

syml—£170 miliwn o arian Ewropeaidd a £100 miliwn o gyllid cyfatebol y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol i Barnett. Mae'r ideoleg a'r egwyddor hefyd yn syml. Mae gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd bolisi o ailddosbarthu adnoddau yn rhanbarthol. Mae Cymru'n elwa ar hyn o bryd oherwydd ein tlodi cymharol ac yr ydym yn derbyn arian Ewropeaidd ers 2000.

simple—£170 million of European funding and £100 million of match funding per annum in addition to Barnett. The ideology and the principle are also simple. The European Union has a policy of redistributing resources to the regions. Wales benefits at the moment because of our comparative poverty and we have received European funding since 2000.

Cytundeb yw'r cronfeydd strwythurol rhwng yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a'r aelod wladwriaeth, gyda chyfrifoldeb ar yr aelod wladwriaeth i roi arian i gyfateb â chyllid yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn yr ysbryd o ailddosbarthu adnoddau i ranbarthau anghennus, gofynnwn i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol sicrhau arian cyfatebol i'r arian Ewropeaidd yn ychwanegol i gyllidebau craidd y Cynulliad, ac nid ar eu traul.

The structural funds constitute an agreement between the European Union and the member state, and the member state has a responsibility to match the European Union's funding. In the spirit of redistributing resources to deprived regions, we ask the United Kingdom Government to ensure match funding in addition to the Assembly's core budgets, rather than at their expense.

Mae Gordon Brown yn ymweld â Chymru heddiw, a bydd yn areithio ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Mae 65 y cant o bobl Cymru yn byw yn rhai o ardaloedd tlotaf yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'r unigolion a'r cymunedau hynny'n haeddu gweld Llywodraeth y DG a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn cymryd ymagwedd o ddifrif tuag at waredu tlodi a chreu cyfleoedd economaidd gwirioneddol i'r dyfodol.

Gordon Brown is visiting Wales today, and will make a speech on social justice. Sixty-five per cent of Wales's population lives in some of the poorest areas of the European Union. Those individuals and communities deserve to see the UK Government and the European Union take a serious approach to eliminating poverty and creating real economic opportunities for the future.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete points 1 and 2 and replace with:

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu pwyntiau 1 a 2 a rhoi yn eu lle:

*reaffirms the commitments given in the partnership agreement in relation to structural funds, adequacy of public expenditure cover and match funding.*

*yn ailddatgan yr ymrwymadau a roddwyd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth mewn perthynas â chronfeydd strwythurol, ac yn datgan bod darpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus ac arian cyfatebol digonol ar gael.*

**Alun Cairns:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2: at the end of motion add a new point:

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 2: ar ddiwedd y cynnig ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*regrets that no additional match funding was made available over and above the Barnett block grant for the first years of the Objective 1 programme.*

*yn gresynu na threfnwyd bod unrhyw arian cyfatebol ar gael yn ychwanegol at grant bloc Barnett ar gyfer blynyddoedd cyntaf rhaglen Amcan 1.*

I propose amendment 3. At the end of the motion add new point:

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to simplify and streamline the Objective 1 application procedure to renew the interest of all partners, particularly the business community.*

I welcome this debate, as it is the first time that we have had the opportunity to discuss the second phase of structural funding, particularly Objective 1. Amid the confusion of the debate on the last comprehensive spending review, it is worth highlighting that Wales did not receive any match funding over and above the Barnett block grant, and that is why we have tabled amendment 2 as a matter of record to clarify the issue for Members and external observers. As a result, it is fair to claim that funding has been diverted from other spending priorities.

I will pick up on Brian Gibbons's earlier intervention during Elin Jones's speech. He asked what other UK regions were given match funding. That is a silly question, because it is obvious that the financial arrangements between Wales and Westminster are completely different from those between Westminster and Merseyside. We must stand up for the Welsh economy, as I am sure that people in Merseyside stand up for their economy. The question does not even arise. The public expenditure survey cover and the match funding come from the Westminster budget, not from our fixed block grant.

**Brian Gibbons:** Is it not the case that the English regions envy Wales's situation and how we can support Objective 1? They would give their back teeth to do in their regions what we are successfully delivering in Wales, as the Welsh Affairs Committee report graphically illustrated. The Objective 1 money is supporting our core objectives, so the match funding is not delivering the core programme. It is elementary, Watson.

**Alun Cairns:** The English regions envied the spin that was being put out by the administration, which claimed that Wales was given a good deal. Wales was not given a good deal last time. I will expand on that later.

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i symleiddio ac ystwytho'r weithdrefn ar gyfer gwneud cais am Amcan 1 er mwyn ennyn diddordeb yr holl bartneriaid perthnasol, yn enwedig y gymuned fusnes.*

Croesawaf y ddadl hon, gan mai hwn yw'r tro cyntaf inni gael cyfle i drafod ail ran y cyllid strwythurol, yn enwedig Amcan 1. Yng nghanol dryswch y ddadl ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant diwethaf, mae'n werth tynnu sylw at y ffaith na dderbyniodd Cymru unrhyw gyllid cyfatebol ar ben grant bloc Barnett, a dyna pam inni gyflwyno gwelliant 2 fel mater o gofnod i egluro'r mater ar gyfer yr Aelodau a'r gwylwyr allanol. O ganlyniad, mae'n deg honni bod cyllid wedi'i ddargyfeirio o flaenoriaethau gwario eraill.

Ymdriniaf ag ymyriad cynharach Brian Gibbons yn ystod araith Elin Jones. Gofynnodd pa ranbarthau eraill yn y DU a gafodd gyllid cyfatebol. Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn gwirion, gan ei bod yn amlwg bod y trefniadau cyllidol rhwng Cymru a San Steffan yn gwbl wahanol i'r rhai rhwng San Steffan a Glannau Mersi. Rhaid inni sefyll dros economi Cymru, fel y mae pobl Glannau Mersi'n sefyll dros eu heconomi hwy, yr wyf yn siŵr. Nid yw'r cwestiwn yn codi hyd yn oed. Daw arian yr adolygiad o wariant cyhoeddus a'r cyllid cyfatebol o gyllideb San Steffan, nid o'n grant bloc penodedig.

**Brian Gibbons:** Onid yw'n wir bod rhanbarthau Lloegr yn genfigennus o sefyllfa Cymru a'r modd y gallwn gefnogi Amcan 1? Byddent yn rhoi'r byd am gael gwneud yn eu rhanbarthau hwy yr hyn y llwyddwn ei gyflawni yng Nghymru, fel y dangosodd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig yn eglur. Mae'r arian Amcan 1 yn cefnogi ein hamcanion craidd, felly nid yw'r cyllid cyfatebol yn cyflawni'r rhaglen graidd. Mae'n berffaith syml, Watson.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr oedd rhanbarthau Lloegr yn genfigennus o'r sbin a gâi ei hyrwyddo gan y weinyddiaeth, a honnai fod Cymru wedi cael bargaen dda. Ni chafodd Cymru fargaen dda y tro diwethaf. Ymhelaethaf ar hynny'n ddiweddarach.

I pay tribute to Phil Williams for the data that he has made available to the Economic Development Committee, which broke down spending patterns in a straightforward manner—or as straightforward as they could be—in spite of the administration's clear intention to introduce a funding fog to prevent clarity and transparency in the figures. That is what has led to the confusion between the spending in the English regions and our financial settlement.

All that was received was a portion of the European cover that was rightly ours in the first place if we were to take advantage of structural funds or if we were to receive any money from Europe. This debate allows us to call for full cover of European funds, as well as the match funding that is needed. So much importance was placed on this matter during the early days of the Assembly that Plaid Cymru, the Liberals and the Welsh Conservative Party were keen to work together for the sake of Wales and the Welsh economy. The events speak for themselves, but what role will the Liberals play this time? In credit to the Liberals, last time, theirs was a principled argument. Let us hope that they stand by their principles this time. I think that this is the first time I have looked forward to a contribution by a Liberal Democrat, who will hopefully clarify the party's standpoint on this matter and clear up the confusion caused by its press release. Perhaps it is their intention to create another fog of confusion around their position so that they can be all things to all people.

The case for today's motion is even stronger than it was two or three years ago. I hope that the Liberal Democrats will highlight that point in their response, because Wales is poorer in comparison with the rest of the United Kingdom, unemployment has started to rise again, inactivity rates are increasing dramatically and output and production are falling at the alarming rate of 7.3 per cent, against 2.2 per cent in England. The economic outlook is bleak. We need to re-engage different sectors into Objective 1. If Objective 1 is to give us the long-term prosperity that we demand and need, we must engage the private sector in Wales. It is

Talaf deyrnged i Phil Williams oherwydd y data a ddarparodd i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a roddodd ddadansoddiad o batrymau gwario mewn modd syml—neu mor syml ag y gellid—er gwaethaf bwriad amlwg y weinyddiaeth i daenu niwl rhag i'r ffigurau cyllido fod yn eglur ac yn dryloyw. Hynny sydd wedi arwain at y dryswch rhwng y gwario yn rhanbarthau Lloegr a'n setliad ariannol ni.

Y cwbl a dderbyniwyd oedd cyfran o'r arian Ewropeaidd a oedd yn eiddo priodol i ni yn y lle cyntaf os oeddem i fanteisio ar y cronfeydd strwythurol neu os oeddem i dderbyn unrhyw arian o Ewrop. Mae'r ddadl hon yn caniatáu inni alw am yr holl arian Ewropeaidd, yn ogystal â'r cyllid cyfatebol sydd ei angen. Rhoddwyd cymaint o bwys ar y mater hwn yn ystod dyddiau cynnar y Cynulliad fel bod Plaid Cymru, y Rhyddfrydwyr a Phlaid Geidwadol Cymru'n awyddus i gydweithio er mwyn Cymru ac economi Cymru. Mae'r digwyddiadau'n siarad drostynt eu hunain, ond pa rôl y bydd y Rhyddfrydwyr yn ei chwarae y tro hwn? Er clod i'r Rhyddfrydwyr, y tro diwethaf, yr oedd eu dadl yn un egwyddorol. Gadewch inni obeithio y byddant yn arddel eu hegwyddorion y tro hwn. Credaf mai dyma'r tro cyntaf imi edrych ymlaen at gyfraniad gan Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol, a fydd, gobeithiaf, yn egluro safbwynt y blaid ar y mater ac yn datrys y dryswch a achoswyd gan ei datganiad i'r wasg. Efallai mai eu bwriad yw creu niwl o ddryswch eto ynghylch eu sefyllfa fel y gallant fod yn bopeth i bawb.

Mae'r achos dros y cynnig heddiw yn gryfach nag yr oedd ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl hyd yn oed. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn tynnu sylw at y pwynt hwnnw yn eu hymateb, gan fod Cymru'n dlotach o'i chymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, mae diweithdra wedi dechrau codi eto, mae cynnydd trawiadol yn y cyfraddau anweithgarwch ac mae'r allbwn a'r cynhyrchu yn disgyn ar y gyfradd frawychus o 7.3 y cant, o'i chymharu â 2.2 y cant yn Lloegr. Mae'r rhagolwg economaidd yn ddigalon. Rhaid inni ailgysylltu'r gwahanol sectorau ag Amcan 1. Os yw Amcan 1 i roi inni'r ffyniant tymor hir a

smaller than the private sector in England and, in contrast to the distribution of public sector funds to various bodies, it generates real wealth. The numbers of facilitators are far too small and the bureaucracy and application process is far too big. It is fair to say that the only real jobs that Objective 1 has created are those for bureaucrats in the Wales European Funding Office.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** We will support amendment 1, but not the motion as it stands. I regret to say that there are those in this Chamber who unjustifiably seek to take credit for the contents of the partnership agreement, which goes to prove that you can fool some of the people some of the time, but Plaid Cymru all of the time.

I turn to the serious matter within this motion, which, of course, is contained in the partnership agreement. There are many commentators who think that the granting of Objective 1 status was perhaps the most important political event in Wales since devolution. There are some who would disagree with that. It might be worth our while considering the last comprehensive spending review and the additional Barnett-busting £421 million granted to Wales by the Treasury as being more important, not just because this allowed the additional resources and benefits of Objective 1 status to come to Wales, but because an important precedent was established. I remind Members that the partnership agreement reflects the process for the next CSR, as the agreement did not exist during the last CSR. It was an important precedent, because the inadequacies of Barnett as a means of providing fiscal transfers in an increasingly sophisticated, devolved, yet unequal British state, had been laid bare.

Look at what has happened since: two weeks ago, in a not-very-widely-appreciated statement with regard to its impact on Wales, the Prime Minister and the Chancellor of the Exchequer announced additional resources for Northern Ireland, including the transfer of capital assets, and preferential borrowing of

fynnwn ag y mae arnom ei angen, rhaid inni gynnwys y sector preifat yng Nghymru. Mae'n llai na'r sector preifat yn Lloegr ac, mewn cyferbyniad â'r dosbarthu ar arian sector cyhoeddus i wahanol gyrff, mae'n creu cyfoeth gwirioneddol. Mae nifer yr hwyluswyr yn rhy fach o lawer ac mae'r fiwrocratiaeth a'r broses ymgeisio'n rhy helaeth o lawer. Mae'n deg dweud mai'r unig swyddi gwirioneddol y mae Amcan 1 wedi'u creu yw'r rhai i fiwrocratiaid yn Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 1, ond nid y cynnig fel y mae. Gresynaf bod rhai yn y Siambr hon yn ceisio cymryd y clod ar gam am gynnwys y cytundeb partneriaeth, ac mae hynny'n profi y gallwch dwyllo rhywrai rywfaint o'r amser, ond y gallwch dwyllo Plaid Cymru drwy'r amser.

Trof at y mater pwysig sydd yn y cynnig hwn, a geir, wrth gwrs, yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Mae sawl sylwebydd yn credu mai rhoi statws Amcan 1 oedd y digwyddiad gwleidyddol pwysicaf o bosibl yng Nghymru ers datganoli. Byddai eraill yn anghytuno â hynny. Efallai y byddai'n werth inni ystyried yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant diwethaf a'r £421 miliwn ychwanegol ar ben Barnett a roddwyd i Gymru gan y Trysorlys yn bwysicach na hynny, nid yn unig am ei fod yn caniatáu i adnoddau a manteision ychwanegol statws Amcan 1 ddod i Gymru, ond am fod cynsail bwysig wedi'i gosod. Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Aelodau bod y cytundeb partneriaeth yn adlewyrchu'r broses ar gyfer yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant nesaf, gan nad oedd y cytundeb yn bod yn ystod yr adolygiad diwethaf. Yr oedd yn gysail bwysig, oherwydd datgelwyd annigonolrwydd Barnett fel modd i ddarparu trosglwyddiadau cyllidol mewn gwladwriaeth Brydeinig sy'n fwyfwy soffistigedig a datganoledig ac eto'n anghyfartal.

Edrychwch ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ers hynny: bythefnos yn ôl, mewn datganiad nad oedd wedi'i werthfawrogi'n eang iawn o ran ei effaith ar Gymru, cyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog a Changhellor y Trysorlys adnoddau ychwanegol i Ogledd Iwerddon, gan gynnwys trosglwyddo asedau cyfalaf, a

low-interest loans of £200 million for immediate priorities, and the power to borrow billions of pounds in future in addition to the block grant. Clearly, circumstances in Northern Ireland warrant sympathetic treatment in order to facilitate development. However, that announcement was revealing, and further evidence that Barnett was failing to provide for Northern Ireland's needs. Last week, we saw the unveiling of the Government's plans for devolution to the English regions, with greater tax-varying powers than Wales. Regardless of the capacity of English regional assemblies to raise their own finance, their creation will finally kill the Barnett formula. Can you imagine, for example, Peter Mandelson, a putative First Minister of the north-east of England assembly, not lobbying his neighbours, Messrs Blair and Byers, on the inequity of a system that fails to recognise his region's poverty?

**Janet Ryder:** You have just made a good case for a review of the Barnett formula. Therefore, why do you not support our motion calling for a review of the Barnett formula?

11:05 a.m.

**Michael German:** The Liberal Democrats' position on the reform of the Barnett formula is on record in our last UK general election manifesto. We stood on that platform and therefore we support it. It is up to Plaid Cymru to propagate its policies and for us to propagate ours. You do your business. We put it in our manifesto; we were the only UK party that did so.

However, we must recognise—

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**Michael German:** I will not take an intervention yet.

The cocktail of recent constitutional, democratic and demographic changes means that the Barnett formula will have to be replaced. The issue will not go away.

benthyca ffafriol o fenthyciadau llog isel o £200 miliwn ar gyfer y blaenoriaethau nesaf, a'r pŵer i fenthycia biliynau o bunnoedd yn y dyfodol yn ogystal â'r grant bloc. Mae'n amlwg bod yr amgylchiadau yng Ngogledd Iwerddon yn cyfiawnhau triniaeth gydymdeimladol er mwyn hwyluso datblygu. Er hynny, yr oedd y cyhoeddiad hwnnw'n ddadlennol, ac yn dystiolaeth bellach bod Barnett yn methu â darparu ar gyfer anghenion Gogledd Iwerddon. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gwelsom ddatgelu cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer datganoli i ranbarthau Lloegr, gyda mwy o bwerau amrywio treth na'r hyn sydd gan Gymru. Beth bynnag fydd gallu cynulliaidau rhanbarthol Lloegr i godi eu cyllid eu hunain, bydd eu creu'n lladd fformiwla Barnett yn derfynol. A allwch ddychmygu, er enghraifft, Peter Mandelson, Prif Weinidog tybiadol yng nghynulliad gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, yn peidio â lobïo'i gymdogion, y Meistri Blair a Byers, ynghylch annhegwch system sy'n methu â chydabod tlodi'i ranbarth?

**Janet Ryder:** Yr ydych newydd gyflwyno dadl dda dros adolygu fformiwla Barnett. Felly, pam nad ydych yn cefnogi ein cynnig sy'n galw am adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett?

**Michael German:** Mae safbwynt y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett ar glawr yn ein maniffesto ar gyfer etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf y DU. Gwnaethom arddel y polisi hwnnw ac felly yr ydym yn ei gefnogi. Lle Plaid Cymru yw lledaenu'i pholisïau hi ac i ninnau ledaenu'n rhai ni. Gwnewch chi'ch gwaith eich hun. Fe'i rhoesom yn ein maniffesto ni; ni oedd unig blaidd y DU i wneud hynny.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod—

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Ni wnaf dderbyn ymyriad eto.

Mae'r coctel o newidiadau cyfansoddiadol, democratiaidd a demograffig diweddar yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid disodli fformiwla Barnett. Ni fydd modd osgoi'r mater hwn.

**Nick Bourne** *rose*—

**Michael German:** I will give way in a moment.

It is better that we push for a new regional public expenditure framework in the UK, based on need, than wait for something else to be imposed on us. That framework should take account of need and consider the regional distribution of public expenditure and the rights of all devolved bodies to raise their own finance, including the rights to borrow. We currently have a jigsaw puzzle of a constitutional settlement in Wales. All the devolved bodies in Britain have tax-varying powers, except for the National Assembly for Wales. The way that that box of pieces now fits together is unsatisfactory. That is why I agree with the House of Commons's Select Committee on Welsh Affairs report that the case for a similar comprehensive spending review settlement for Wales is at least as strong as it was in 2000. That is especially helpful when one considers that the rate of programme spending and commitment will accelerate during 2003-04 and 2005-06.

I will take Nick's intervention first, and then Alun's.

**Nick Bourne:** Why are there only seven members of the Government benches here to hear his keynote address on aspects of spending in Northern Ireland and the north-east of England? A more germane point is that it is regrettable that his stance on Objective 1 funding seems to have altered because of an event that occurred after the instigation of the partnership Government and the offer of two places in the Cabinet to Liberal Democrats. Is that not the real reason for the difference between your former and current stances?

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We cannot have an intervention on an intervention.

**Michael German:** I said that I would accept

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Fe ildiaf ymhen eiliad.

Mae'n well inni bwysu dros fframwaith gwariant cyhoeddus rhanbarthol newydd yn y DU, ar sail angen, yn hytrach na disgwyl i rywbeth arall gael ei orfodi arnom. Dylai'r fframwaith hwnnw ystyried angen a dosbarthiad rhanbarthol gwariant cyhoeddus a hawliau'r holl gyrff datganoledig i godi eu cyllid eu hunain, gan gynnwys yr hawliau i fenthyca. Ar hyn o bryd pos jig-so o setliad cyfansoddiadol sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Mae pwerau amrywio trethi gan yr holl gyrff datganoledig ym Mhrydain, heblaw am Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'r darnau hynny'n ffitio i'w gilydd yn anfoddhaol ar hyn o bryd. Dyna pam yr wyf yn cytuno ag adroddiad Pwyllgor Dethol Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar Faterion Cymreig bod y ddadl dros setliad tebyg o ran yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant cyn gryfed o leiaf ag yr oedd yn 2000. Mae hynny'n arbennig o ddefnyddiol pan yw rhywun yn ystyried y bydd cyfradd gwariant ac ymrwymiad y rhaglen yn cyflymu yn ystod 2003-04 a 2005-06.

Derbyniaf ymyriad Nick yn gyntaf, ac wedyn un Alun.

**Nick Bourne:** Pam dim ond saith aelod o feinciau'r Llywodraeth sydd yma i wrando ar ei anerchiad allweddol ar agweddau ar wario yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr? Pwynt mwy perthnasol yw ei bod yn destun gofid bod ei safbwynt ar gyllid Amcan 1 wedi newid, i bob golwg, oherwydd digwyddiad ar ôl sefydlu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth a chynnig dau le yn y Cabinet i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Onid hynny yw'r gwir reswm dros y gwahaniaeth rhwng eich safbwynt blaenorol a'r un presennol?

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ni allwn gael ymyriad ag ymyriad.

**Michael German:** Dywedais y byddwn yn



Alun Cairn's intervention after Nick Bourne's.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had five and a half minutes. You need to reply to Nick's point and then you may take Alun's intervention quickly, if you have time.

**Michael German:** No, I will not take Alun's intervention now if you think I have not got enough time. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh'] It is the Deputy Presiding Officer's decision, not mine.

The issue is that the partnership agreement makes it clear that we will seek the three items that are clearly stated in that agreement. That has not changed and it will hold true for the next CSR and that is exactly what the commitment says. We should welcome the fact that Objective 1 is now on track. There are over 500 projects, with over £300 million worth of grants.

I am grateful that Plaid Cymru now supports the partnership agreement. Perhaps their motion should have stated, 'We support the partnership agreement in its proposal.' Plaid Cymru's motion was composed from extracts of the partnership agreement. Is this a cut-and-paste policy from a cut-and-paste party or a Damascene conversion? Did Dafydd see the light on the road to Dinas Dinlle? We deserve to be told.

**Phil Williams:** I do not apologise for giving a maths lesson, even on Thursday morning. If we want more small and medium sized enterprises, if we want to tackle deprivation and boost the rural economy, we must get the sums right. Those sums are simple: just adding and subtracting. All the figures are in the public domain, so all Members can do the sums and should get them right. If you want to hand in your answers by 4.00 p.m., I will get them marked.

The European grant for projects is set and fixed in the agreement between the National Assembly and the European Union. If we add the total for Objectives 1, 2 and 3, the rural development plan and the four communitiy

derbyn ymyriad Alun Cairns ar ôl un Nick Bourne.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Cawsoch bum munud a hanner. Rhaid ichi ymateb i bwynt Nick ac wedyn cewch dderbyn ymyriad Alun yn gyflym, os oes amser gennyh.

**Michael German:** Ni dderbyniaf ymyriad Alun yn awr os credwch nad oes gennyf ddigon o amser. [AELODAU CYNULLIAD: 'O'] Penderfyniad y Dirprwy Lywydd ydyw, nid fy un i.

Y mater dan sylw yw bod y cytundeb partneriaeth yn rhoi ar ddeall y byddwn yn ceisio'r tair eitem a nodir yn eglur yn y cytundeb hwnnw. Ni fu newid yn hynny a bydd yn dal i fod yn wir am yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant nesaf a dyna'n union y mae'r ymrwymiad yn ei ddweud. Dylem groesawu'r ffaith bod Amcan 1 ar y trywydd iawn yn awr. Mae dros 500 o brosiectau, gyda dros £300 miliwn o grantiau.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r cytundeb partneriaeth bellach. Efallai y dylai eu cynnig fod wedi dweud, 'Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r cytundeb partneriaeth yn ei gynnig.' Cyfansoddwyd cynnig Plaid Cymru o ddarnau o'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Ai polisi torri a phastio gan blaid torri a phastio yw hwn neu dröedigaeth ar y ffordd i Ddamascus? A welodd Dafydd y goleuni ar y ffordd i Ddinas Dinlle? Mae'n iawn inni gael gwybod.

**Phil Williams:** Nid wyf yn ymddiheuro am roi gwers mathemateg, hyd yn oed ar fore Iau. Os ydym am gael rhagor o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, os ydym am fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd a hybu'r economi wledig, rhaid inni gael y symiau'n iawn. Mae'r symiau hynny'n syml: dim ond adio a thynnu. Mae'r holl ffigurau ar gael i'r cyhoedd, felly gall yr holl Aelodau wneud y symiau a dylent eu cael yn iawn. Os ydych am roi'ch atebion i mewn erbyn 4.00 p.m., trefnaf iddynt gael eu marcio.

Mae'r grant Ewropeaidd i brosiectau wedi'i bennu a'i osod yn y cytundeb rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Os adiwn y cyfanswm am Amcanion 1, 2 a 3, y cynllun datblygu

initiatives, we should have approved grants of £209 million for 2000, £204 million last year and £199 million this year. At the moment we are a little behind, but we are catching up. However, that is not the crucial point. Europe is not strict about the timetable for approving grants, but it is strict on the timetable for spending them. Therefore, the £209 million scheduled for approval in 2000 must be drawn down by December this year. Another £204, which we should have approved last year, must be drawn down by 2003—

**Brian Gibbons:** I am sure that Phil must be delighted to read in the Welsh Affairs Committee's report that, of the four regions in the United Kingdom, Wales is number one in terms of commitment and number two in terms of spending. I am sure that he would congratulate us that we are doing so well.

**Phil Williams:** I am sure that you have looked at the comparable record in the two countries that we have studied, namely Sweden and Germany. Comparing us with the other UK regions is like comparing positions at the bottom of the fourth division.

Money not spent within the time allowed is decommitted; it is returned. Brussels officially refers to it as the 'humiliation of decommitment'. The threat is real. It is now almost certain that tens of millions of pounds from the 1994-99 European programme will be decommitted during the next year. That is the Assembly Government's fault. Unlike the £100 million that was alleged to have been returned to the Treasury by John Redwood, but was apparently saved by some brilliant accountancy, the European money will be lost forever. That is why sums are important. They indicate that if we do not increase the level of spending now, it will be too late to catch up in two years time.

Therefore, where are the problems? Two budget lines in Objective 1 raised concern at the last meeting of the Objective 1 Monitoring Committee. First, according to the timetable, only 40 per cent of the budget for community regeneration had been

gwledig a'r pedair menter gymunedol, dylem gael grantiau cymeradwyedig o £209 miliwn am 2000, £204 miliwn y llynedd a £199 miliwn eleni. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym ychydig ar ei hôl hi, ond yr ydym yn cau'r bwllch. Fodd bynnag, nid hwnnw yw'r pwnt hollbwysig. Nid yw Ewrop yn fanwl ynghylch yr amserlen ar gyfer cymeradwyo grantiau, ond mae'n fanwl ynghylch yr amserlen ar gyfer eu gwario. Felly, rhaid defnyddio'r £209 miliwn a amserlennwyd i'w cymeradwyo yn 2000 erbyn Rhagfyr eleni. Rhaid defnyddio £204 miliwn arall, y dylem fod wedi'u cymeradwyo y llynedd, erbyn 2003—

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Phil wrth ei fodd o ddarllen yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Faterion Cymreig bod Cymru yn y safle cyntaf, o blith y pedwar rhanbarth yn y Deyrnas Unedig, o ran rhwymo ac yn ail o ran gwario. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n ein llongyfarch am ein bod yn gwneud cystal.

**Phil Williams:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi edrych ar y record gymaradwy yn y ddwy wlad yr ydym wedi'u hastudio, sef Sweden a'r Almaen. Mae ein cymharu â rhanbarthau eraill yn y DU yn debyg i gymharu safleoedd ar waelod y bedwaredd adran.

Mae arian nas gwarir o fewn yr amser a ganiateir yn cael ei ddadrwymo; fe'i dychwelir. Mae Brwsel yn cyfeirio'n swyddogol at hyn fel 'cywilydd dadrwymo'. Mae'r bygythiad yn un gwirioneddol. Mae bron yn sicr bellach y caiff degau o filiynau o bunnoedd o raglen Ewropeaidd 1994-99 eu dadrwymo yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf. Bai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw hynny. Yn wahanol i'r £100 miliwn yr honnwyd ei fod wedi'i ddychwelyd i'r Trysorlys gan John Redwood, ond a achubwyd, yn ôl pob sôn, drwy gyfrifyddu arbennig, fe gollir yr arian Ewropeaidd am byth. Dyna pam y mae symiau'n bwysig. Maent yn dangos, os na chynyddwn y gwariant yn awr, y bydd yn rhy hwyr i gau'r bwllch ymhen dwy flynedd.

Felly, ym mhle y mae'r problemau? Yr oedd dwy linell gyllideb yn Amcan 1 yn peri pryder yn y cyfarfod diwethaf o Bwyllgor Monitro Amcan 1. Yn gyntaf, yn ôl yr amserlen, dim ond 40 y cant o'r gyllideb ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol a oedd wedi'i

committed. The report that we received said the shortage of match funding was a major problem in the deprived communities. European grants are available, but we must ensure adequate match funding. If we increase the level of grants to avoid decommitting the money for community regeneration, we will need to increase the level of match funding available from our Assembly budget.

The second budget line causing concern to the monitoring committee was that of the infrastructure partnership where only 4 per cent of the scheduled total had been committed. That is inexcusable. Almost two years ago, Plaid Cymru drew attention to the absence of any regional partnership for energy, information technology or transport infrastructure. Time and time again, we drew attention to this gap, but an infrastructure partnership was not fully in place until last November. That was Government incompetence. It is dishonest for the Government to claim now that the partnership was delayed to ensure that a proper action plan to spend the money was developed because work on the action plan did not start until the partnership was in place. It is absurd to issue business with large grants to encourage use of the internet and not invest in broadband infrastructure. Again, we will need a huge boost in spending or we will lose the opportunity. I hope that the Government will listen this time.

Finally, and this is where the sums come in, we need to anticipate a large increase in the spending of European grants and in public sector match funding. I am glad to see Edwina here; it is a pity that the previous Minister for Economic Development has left. I hope that he was listening and I hope that the Government is fighting tooth and nail to ensure that an adequate amount is allocated on top of the Barnett formula otherwise after 2003 the Government—probably led by Plaid Cymru—will be in difficulty.

11:15 a.m.

**Peter Law:** I am interested to see, once

rwymo. Yr oedd yr adroddiad a gawsom yn dweud bod prinder cyllid cyfatebol yn broblem fawr yn y cymunedau difreintiedig. Mae grantiau Ewropeaidd ar gael, ond rhaid inni sicrhau cyllid cyfatebol digonol. Os byddwn yn cynyddu lefel y grantiau i osgoi dadrwymo'r arian ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol, bydd yn rhaid inni gynyddu lefel y cyllid cyfatebol sydd ar gael o gyllideb y Cynulliad.

Yr ail linell gyllideb a barai bryder i'r pwyllgor monitro oedd un y bartneriaeth seilwaith lle nad oedd ond 4 y cant o'r cyfanswm a amserlennwyd wedi'i rwymo. Mae hynny'n anfaddeuol. Ymron i ddwy flynedd yn ôl, tynnodd Plaid Cymru sylw at y ffaith nad oedd partneriaeth ranbarthol ar gyfer y seilwaith ynni, technoleg gwybodaeth neu drafnidiaeth. Dro ar ôl tro, gwnaethom dynnu sylw at y bwlech hwnnw, ond nid oedd partneriaeth seilwaith yn llawn weithredol tan fis Tachwedd diwethaf. Aflerwch y Llywodraeth oedd hynny. Mae'n anonest i'r Llywodraeth honni'n awr fod y bartneriaeth wedi'i gohirio i sicrhau bod cynllun gweithredu priodol i wario'r arian wedi'i ddatblygu oherwydd ni ddechreuodd y gwaith ar y cynllun gweithredu nes oedd y bartneriaeth ar waith. Hurt yw rhoi grantiau mawr i fusnes i hybu'r defnydd o'r rhyngwyd heb fuddsoddi yn y seilwaith band llydan. Unwaith eto, bydd arnom angen hwb mawr mewn gwariant neu byddwn yn colli'r cyfle. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gwrando'r tro hwn.

Yn olaf, a dyma lle y daw'r symiau i mewn, rhaid inni ddisgwyl cynnydd mawr yn y gwario ar grantiau Ewropeaidd ac yng nghyllid cyfatebol y sector cyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn falch o weld Edwina yma; mae'n drueni bod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd blaenorol wedi ymadael. Gobeithiaf ei fod yn gwrando a gobeithiaf fod y Llywodraeth yn ymladd nerth deng ewin i sicrhau y caiff swm digonol ei ddyrannu ar ben fformiwla Barnett neu, fel arall, ar ôl 2003 bydd y Llywodraeth—dan arweiniad Plaid Cymru, mae'n debyg—mewn trafferthion.

**Peter Law:** Mae'n ddiddorol imi weld

again, a Conservative and Plaid Cymru alliance for this debate. I understand why Plaid Cymru must always rubbish something that has been so successful because that will always be one of its weakest points. A Labour UK Government delivered Objective 1 for west Wales and the Valleys in 1999, which Plaid Cymru has failed to recognise on many occasions. It should never forget that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I thought that Wales qualified for Objective 1 on the basis that it is under 75 per cent of the European average gross domestic product. Are you taking the credit for the Labour governments of the seventies and eighties and the Conservative governments from 1979 onwards for creating an economy in west Wales and the old industrial valleys of south Wales, which led to the poverty that qualified us for Objective 1?

**Peter Law:** That is as irrelevant as it sounds. Consider the 18 years of Conservative governments—what did they ever do for us? I can say that the answer is ‘nothing’. That is why you cannot stand there and comment on the Labour Government’s handling of Objective 1.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you accept that Wales is now poorer than it was five years ago in comparison to England?

**Peter Law:** If Wales is poorer now, it certainly has something to do with 18 years of Conservative rule—

**Jonathan Morgan:** That old chestnut.

**Peter Law:** Yes, because the party that delivered Objective 1 also delivered lower interest rates, the lowest mortgage and unemployment rates for years, and the minimum wage. You cannot rubbish that. Wales, generally, has not had it so good for a long time. Things are changing, which is why the comprehensive spending review is the way forward as far as funding is concerned because no-one—[*Interruption.*]

**David Davies:** Is it not the case that during the golden years of Conservative rule, the Labour opposition called for the country to

cynghrair rhwng y Ceidwadwyr a Plaid Cymru, unwaith eto, ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Deallaf pam y mae Plaid Cymru bob amser yn gorfod lladd ar rywbeth a fu mor llwyddiannus oherwydd hwnnw fydd un o’i nodweddion gwannaf bob amser. Llywodraeth Lafur y DU a sicrhodd Amcan 1 i’r Gorllewin a’r Cymoedd yn 1999, ac mae Plaid Cymru wedi methu â chydabod hynny lawer gwaith. Ni ddylai byth anghofio hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Credais i fod Cymru’n gymwys ar gyfer Amcan 1 am fod ganddi lai na 75 y cant o’r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth cyfartalog Ewropeaidd. A ydych yn cymryd y clod dros lywodraethau Llafur y saith degau a’r wyth degau a’r llywodraethau Ceidwadol o 1979 ymlaen am greu economi yn y Gorllewin a hen gymoedd diwydiannol y De, a arweiniodd at y tloedi a’n gwnaeth yn gymwys ar gyfer Amcan 1?

**Peter Law:** Mae hynny mor amherthnasol ag y mae’n swnio. Ystyriwch y 18 mlynedd o lywodraethau Ceidwadol—beth a wnaethant drosom ni erioed? Gallaf ddweud mai’r ateb yw ‘dim’. Dyna pam na allwch sefyll yno a gwneud sylwadau am ddull y Llywodraeth Lafur o drin Amcan 1.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn derbyn bod Cymru’n dlotach yn awr nag yr oedd bum mlynedd yn ôl o’i chymharu â Lloegr?

**Peter Law:** Os yw Cymru’n dlotach yn awr, mae’n sicr bod a wnelo hynny rywbeth â’r 18 mlynedd o reolaeth Geidwadol—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr hen stori honno.

**Peter Law:** Ie, oherwydd y blaid a sicrhodd Amcan 1 sydd hefyd wedi sicrhau cyfraddau llog is, y cyfraddau morgais a diweithdra isaf ers blynnyddoedd, a’r isafswm cyflog. Ni allwch ladd ar hynny. Yn gyffredinol, nid yw Cymru wedi’i chael gystal ers amser maith. Mae pethau’n newid, a dyna pam mai’r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yw’r ffordd ymlaen o ran ariannu gan nad oes neb—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**David Davies:** Onid yw’n wir bod yr wrthblaid Lafur, yn ystod oes aur rheolaeth y Ceidwadwyr, wedi galw am i’r wlad dynnu

pull out of the European Union and nationalise all industry. Do you still support those policies and if not, do you agree that it was a good thing that there was a Conservative Government?

**Peter Law:** I would never believe that a Conservative Government could represent anything good for anyone in Wales or Britain. That is a fact of life. It is noticeable that you were not heckled by Plaid Cymru Members because you are in an alliance with them today. They should have heckled you.

There are some difficulties with how Objective 1 works. However, it is not a doom and gloom scenario. Generally, it is a success and I see it working on the ground. We do not want it to be talked down by Plaid Cymru in terms of doom and gloom. It is working well and we delivered the funding. I remember the momentous occasion when a good man called Alun Michael was sacrificed and when the bloodlust was at its highest level here. Nine months after that, Comrade German was appointed Minister for Economic Development and he got up and said that there was no problem with Objective 1, that we had cracked it and that it was a winner. Yet he was one of the people who stuck a knife into Alun Michael's back. I will never forget that, which is why I am reminding you this morning—

**Michael German:** What about members of your own party?

**Peter Law:** Never mind my own party. I know who stuck the knife in that day. Look at the votes to see who did it. We all remember.

We are working on behalf of deprived communities to make a difference through Objective 1. Labour provided us with that opportunity. I am sure that Gordon Brown will give us an excellent comprehensive spending review settlement. There are no problems in terms of that coming forward and there had better not be because the Assembly and UK Labour Governments are committed to it.

allan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a gwladoli pob diwydiant. A ydych yn dal i gefnogi'r polisïau hynny ac, os nad ydych, a ydych yn cytuno ei fod yn beth da bod Llywodraeth Geidwadol bryd hynny?

**Peter Law:** Ni fyddwn byth yn credu y gallai Llywodraeth Geidwadol gynrychioli dim sy'n dda i neb yng Nghymru neu Brydain. Un o ffeithiau bywyd yw hynny. Mae'n amlwg na wnaeth Aelodau Plaid Cymru weiddi ar eich traws am eich bod mewn cynghrair â hwy heddiw. Fe ddylent fod wedi gweiddi ar eich traws.

Mae rhai anawsterau ynghylch dull gweithredu Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ddarlun hollol ddu. Mae'n llwyddo at ei gilydd ac fe'i gwelaf yn gweithio ar lawr gwlad. Nid ydym am i'n llais gael ei fodd gan Blaid Cymru yn proffwydo gwae. Mae'n gweithio'n dda a gwnaethom sicrhau'r cyllid. Cofiaf yr achlysur tyngedfennol pan aberthwyd dyn da o'r enw Alun Michael a phan oedd y chwant am waed ar ei waethaf yma. Naw mis wedyn, penodwyd y Cymrawd German yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ac fe gododd ar ei draed a dweud nad oedd problem ynghylch Amcan 1, ein bod wedi'i ddatrys a'i fod yn llwyddiant. Ac eto, ef oedd un o'r rhai a fwriodd gyllell i gefn Alun Michael. Ni wnaif byth anghofio hynny, a dyna pam yr wyf yn eich atgoffa y bore yma—

**Michael German:** Beth am aelodau'ch plaid eich hun?

**Peter Law:** Peidiwch â phoeni am fy mhlaid fy hun. Yr wyf yn gwybod pwy a blannodd y gyllell y diwrnod hwnnw. Edrychwch ar y pleidleisiau i weld pwy a'i gwnaeth. Yr ydym ni i gyd yn cofio.

Yr ydym yn gweithio ar ran cymunedau difreintiedig i wneud gwahaniaeth drwy Amcan 1. Llafur a roddodd y cyfle hwnnw i ni. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Gordon Brown yn rhoi setliad rhagorol i ni yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Mae'n sicr o ddod i ni ac felly y dylai fod gan fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Lafur y DU wedi ymrwymo iddo.

I pay tribute to Christine Chapman, who works hard as Chair of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee and I respect her. I also pay tribute to the people on the ground, running local partnerships. In many respects, what we say here is not that relevant. We should pay tribute to the people at the coal face, who work so hard in these partnerships voluntarily for the good of their community. I thank them and I hope that the Minister will mention them later.

I have seen some of the regional projects of the Blaenau Gwent partnership to which I belong. We have to be notified of them; even though I do not sit on the monitoring committee, I see the documents. I have to question how valid they are for certain areas. Many of the regional projects that go through for consultation—and the process is transparent and is democracy at its best—include major schemes worth millions of pounds. However, what does that mean for Blaenau Gwent? The tick box is ‘poor’ or perhaps sometimes ‘very little’ on employment. Some issues need to be addressed. Every scheme is relevant. I am pleased about a tree-planting scheme that is being implemented; I think that it is based in Aberystwyth. I would like to see some tree planting in Blaenau Gwent in that scheme as well, not just in Aberystwyth.

**Phil Williams:** Do you accept that properly calculated regional targets on a more local basis would ensure that the allocation of jobs would go where they were needed?

**Peter Law:** Fine-tuning is a useful thing.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Peter Law:** We are all learning. However, Objective 1 is provided by a Labour Government. It is a success for Wales now and will be an even greater success in future. Deprived communities have a future thanks to Labour. I am proud to support the Labour Party.

Talaf deyrnged i Christine Chapman, sy'n gweithio'n galed fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1 ac yr wyf yn ei pharchu. Talaf deyrnged hefyd i'r rhai yn y maes, sy'n rhedeg partneriaethau lleol. Ar lawer ystyr, nid yw'r hyn a ddywedwn yma mor berthnasol â hynny. Dylem dalu teyrnged i'r rhai sydd wrth y gwaith, sy'n gweithio mor galed yn y partneriaethau hyn o'u gwirfodd er budd eu cymuned. Diolchaf iddynt a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn sôn amdanynt yn ddiweddarach.

Gwelais rai o brosiectau rhanbarthol partneriaeth Blaenau Gwent, yr wyf fi'n aelod ohoni. Rhaid inni gael ein hysbysu amdanynt; er nad wyf yn eistedd ar y pwyllgor monitro, yr wyf yn gweld y dogfennau. Rhaid imi gwestiynu pa mor ddilys y maent i rai ardaloedd. Mae llawer o'r prosiectau rhanbarthol aiff drwodd ar gyfer ymgynghori—ac mae'r broses yn dryloyw ac yn enghraifft o ddemocratiaeth ar ei gorau—yn cynnwys cynlluniau mawr gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd. Fodd bynnag, beth y mae hynny'n ei olygu i Flaenau Gwent? 'Gwael' neu efallai 'ychydig iawn' yw'r blwch ticio ar gyflogaeth weithiau. Rhaid ymdrin â rhai materion. Mae pob cynllun yn berthnasol. Yr wyf wrth fy modd â chynllun plannu coed sy'n cael ei weithredu; credaf ei fod wedi'i leoli yn Aberystwyth. Hoffwn weld rhywfaint o blannu coed ym Mlaenau Gwent dan y cynllun hwnnw hefyd, nid yn unig yn Aberystwyth.

**Phil Williams:** A ydych yn derbyn y byddai targedau rhanbarthol a gyfrifwyd yn briodol ar sail fwy lleol yn sicrhau y byddai'r dyraniad o swyddi'n mynd at y mannau yr oedd eu hangen?

**Peter Law:** Mae manwl gyweirio'n beth defnyddiol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi gloi.

**Peter Law:** Dysgu y mae pob un ohonom. Fodd bynnag, darperir Amcan 1 gan Lywodraeth Lafur. Mae'n llwyddiant i Gymru'n awr a bydd yn llwyddiant mwy fyth yn y dyfodol. Mae dyfodol gan gymunedau difreintiedig, diolch i Lafur. Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r Blaid Lafur.

**Janet Ryder:** The implications of the Labour Government's failure to obtain a single penny of match funding from the UK Treasury from the last comprehensive spending review have already hit Wales hard. By the end of this financial year, £123 million will have been taken from the National Assembly's core budget because of Labour's failure to stand up to the UK Government and demand match funding for Wales. That is an average of £41 million a year between 2000-03 and it directly contradicts the Labour/Liberal partnership agreement, which clearly states that:

'the benefits of structural fund receipts must not be delivered at the cost of the existing core budgets financed from the Welsh block.'

In this year alone, a total of £64 million will come out of the Welsh block. Next year it will rise to £66 million as the need to increase expenditure of EU funds to avoid decommitment becomes even greater. Is the coalition comfortable with the fact that spending on health, education, housing, and so on must be cut by £64 million this year, in order to fund economic development? The following figures have been taken from the National Assembly's budget: local authority projects, £33.5 million; voluntary sector projects, £4.5 million; food processing and marketing, £3.5 million; farm adaptations, more than £3 million; fisheries, more than £500,000; Pathway to Prosperity, £18 million.

All the money used for match funding comes from the Welsh block. No-one doubts the importance of financing these projects to the Welsh economy. However, that money should come through the comprehensive spending review, not from the core budget. It should not be spent to the detriment of spending on public services.

**Peter Black:** You have made a compelling case. However, if what you say is correct, why is expenditure per capita on health higher in Wales than in England?

**Janet Ryder:** Because we need it. In the

**Janet Ryder:** Mae goblygiadau methiant y Llywodraeth Lafur i gael yr un geiniog o gyllid cyfatebol gan Drysorlys y DU o'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant diwethaf wedi bwrw Cymru'n galed eisoes. Erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon, bydd £123 miliwn wedi'i gymryd o gyllideb graidd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am fod Llafur wedi methu â herio Llywodraeth y DU a mynnu cyllid cyfatebol i Gymru. Mae hynny'n gyfartaledd o £41 miliwn y flwyddyn rhwng 2000 a 2003 ac mae'n mynd yn gwbl groes i'r cytundeb partneriaeth Llafur/Rhyddfrydol, sy'n datgan yn eglur:

'na ddylid gwireddu manteision derbyniadau o'r cronfeydd strwythurol ar draul y cyllidebau craidd presennol a gyllidir o floc Cymru.'

Yn y flwyddyn hon yn unig, daw cyfanswm o £64 miliwn o floc Cymru. Y flwyddyn nesaf bydd yn codi i £66 miliwn wrth i'r angen i gynyddu'r gwariant o gyllid yr UE i osgoi dadrwyddo fynd yn fwy byth. A yw'r glymblaid yn fodlon ar y ffaith y bydd yn rhaid torri'r gwariant ar iechyd, addysg, tai, ac yn y blaen o £64 miliwn eleni, er mwyn ariannu datblygu economaidd? Cymerwyd y ffigurau a ganlyn o gyllideb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol: prosiectau'r awdurdodau lleol, £33.5 miliwn; prosiectau'r sector gwirfoddol, £4.5 miliwn; prosesu a marchnata bwyd, £3.5 miliwn; addasiadau i ffermydd, mwy na £3 miliwn; pysgodfeydd, mwy na £500,000; Ffordd i Ffyniant, £18 miliwn.

Daw'r holl arian a ddefnyddir ar gyfer cyllid cyfatebol o floc Cymru. Nid oes neb yn amau bod ariannu'r prosiectau hyn yn bwysig i economi Cymru. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r arian hwnnw ddod drwy'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, nid o'r gyllideb graidd. Ni ddylid ei wario ar draul gwariant ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

**Peter Black:** Yr ydych wedi cyflwyno dadl rymus. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r hyn a ddywedwch yn gywir, pam y mae'r gwariant y pen ar iechyd yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr?

**Janet Ryder:** Am fod arnom ei angen. Yn y

partnership agreement, the coalition affirmed that that should be the case. The agreement states that there should be extra money available. You must press this case as strongly as possible with the UK Treasury.

As you have heard today, some Labour politicians would have us believe that the Government has secured match funding. They do not understand the difference between European funds and match funding. That is not at all reassuring. Not only has the Government failed to secure match funding at the cost of Wales's public services, but also the amount of funding taken from the Welsh block will rise substantially from now until 2009. Committing the bare minimum to avoid decommitment is not acceptable, as that would risk large sums of money, which are vital to the Welsh economy, if projects are delayed. That is all too familiar to us.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales strongly advises the Government to consider a responsible spending strategy. That involves committing £190 million a year of EU funds to balance out spending from now until 2009 to avoid building up a massive use-it-or-lose-it pot by 2008-09. If the Government follows this responsible strategy, it will be even more important to secure match funding from the Treasury. At present, £100 million a year of match funding comes from the National Assembly core budget to finance economic development. As Plaid Cymru predicted, we are robbing Peter to pay Paul, or, perhaps, robbing Jane to pay Andrew. That is totally unacceptable. The Government of Wales must act to secure our full share of EU funds and match funding through the CSR and over and above Barnett.

11:25 a.m.

**Christine Chapman:** I will not support amendment 3, particularly given the House of Commons Welsh Affairs Committee's report on Objective 1. I welcome the fact that this report has highlighted that Objective 1 is working well in Wales and is performing well in comparison to its English

cytundeb partneriaeth, fe gadarnhaodd y glymblaid y dylai fod felly. Mae'r cytundeb yn datgan y dylai arian ychwanegol fod ar gael. Rhaid ichi wthio'r ddadl mor gryf ag y gallwch wrth Drysorlys y DU.

Fel y clywsoch heddiw, byddai rhai gwleidyddion Llafur am inni gredu bod y Llywodraeth wedi sicrhau cyllid cyfatebol. Nid ydynt yn deall y gwahaniaeth rhwng cyllid Ewropeaidd a chyllid cyfatebol. Nid yw hynny'n tawelu meddwl rhywun o gwbl. Nid yn unig y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi methu â sicrhau cyllid cyfatebol, a hynny ar draul gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru, ond hefyd bydd y swm o gyllid a gymerir o floc Cymru'n codi'n sylweddol o hyn tan 2009. Nid yw rhwymo'r isafswm lleiaf i osgoi dadrwymo'n dderbyniol, gan y byddai hynny'n peryglu symiau mawr o arian, sy'n hollbwysig i economi Cymru, os caiff prosiectau eu gohirio. Yr ydym yn rhy gyfarwydd o lawer â hynny.

Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cynghori'r Llywodraeth yn gryf i ystyried strategaeth wario gyfrifol. Mae hynny'n golygu rhwymo £190 miliwn y flwyddyn o gyllid yr UE i gydbwysu'r gwariant o hyn tan 2009 er mwyn peidio â chreu pot anferth o arian i'w ddefnyddio neu'i gollu erbyn 2008-09. Os bydd y Llywodraeth yn dilyn y strategaeth gyfrifol hon, bydd yn bwysicach fyth sicrhau cyllid cyfatebol gan y Trysorlys. Ar hyn o bryd, daw £100 miliwn y flwyddyn o gyllid cyfatebol o gyllideb graidd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ariannu datblygu economaidd. Fel y rhagwelodd Plaid Cymru, yr ydym yn dwyn yr hen i dalu'r newydd, neu, efallai, yn dwyn gan Jane i dalu Andrew. Mae hynny'n gwbl annerbyniol. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru weithredu i sicrhau ein cyfran lawn o gyllid yr UE a chyllid cyfatebol drwy'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant ac yn ychwanegol at Barnett.

**Christine Chapman:** Ni chefnogaf welliant 3, yn enwedig o ystyried adroddiad Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar Amcan 1. Croesawaf y ffaith bod yr adroddiad hwn wedi dangos bod Amcan 1 yn gweithio'n dda yng Nghymru ac yn perfformio'n dda o'i gymharu â'i gymheiriaid yn Lloegr.



counterparts.

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**Christine Chapman:** No, I will not give way now.

Therefore, despite the doom and gloom predictions forecast by Plaid Cymru, it is now good to see on record that it is recognised that Wales is performing well.

I understand some of the sentiments expressed in amendment 3. However, it is flawed and does not recognise the good work and the progress that has been made. As chair of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee, I pay tribute to the enthusiasm and the efforts of all the partners involved in the various sectors. I am glad that Peter Law mentioned this, because it is not just about the Assembly, it is about the partners who are working with Objective 1 to make this a success.

**Nick Bourne:** You referred to the Welsh Affairs Committee. I am sure that you would agree that of its nine members, seven are Labour members, and one is a Lib Dem, who presumably can be relied on in these circumstances to support Labour. You say that you will not support amendment 3. However, I quote from the Welsh Affairs Committee's report, which is, after all, a Labour-led—to use that much overused phrase—Committee:

'We are concerned, however, about the obstacles to participation by representatives of the private and voluntary sectors. It does appear that for many small businesses the cost of participating in the partnerships is prohibitive and that there may therefore be a case for some more systematic form of reimbursement for loss of earnings and out-of-pocket expenses. Likewise, it is important that the proceedings of the partnerships are readily comprehensible to those people who do not have a great deal of experience of participating in EU funding programmes.'

Why will the Government not support this amendment?

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Christine Chapman:** Ni wnaif ildio'n awr.

Felly, er gwaethaf y darogan gwae gan Blaid Cymru, mae'n braf gweld bod cydnabyddiaeth bod Cymru'n perfformio'n dda.

Deallaf rai o'r teimladau a fynegir yng ngwelliant 3. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddiffygiol ac nid yw'n cydnabod y gwaith da a'r cynnydd a gafwyd. Fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1, talaf deyrnged i frwdfrydedd ac ymdrechion yr holl bartneriaid sy'n gysylltiedig yn y gwahanol sectorau. Yr wyf yn falch bod Peter Law wedi sôn am hyn, oherwydd nid yw'n ymwneud â'r Cynulliad yn unig, ond â'rartneriaid sy'n gweithio gydag Amcan 1 i'w wneud yn llwyddiant.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod saith o blith ei naw aelod yn aelodau Llafur, a bod un yn Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol, y gellir dibynnu arno yn yr amgylchiadau hynny, yn ôl pob tebyg, i gefnogi Llafur. Dywedwch na wnewch gefnogi gwelliant 3. Fodd bynnag, dyfynnaf o adroddiad y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig, sydd, wedi'r cwbl, yn Bwyllgor dan arweiniad Llafur—a defnyddio'r ymadrodd hwnnw a gaiff ei ordefnyddio:

'Yr ydym yn bryderus, fodd bynnag, ynghylch y rhwystrau i gyfranogiad cynrychiolwyr y sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol. Mae'n ymddangos bod cost cyfranogi yn y partneriaethau'n afresymol i lawer o fusnesau bach a'i bod yn bosibl, felly, fod dadl dros gael dull mwy systematig o'u had-dalu am golli enillion a threuliau parod. Yr yr un modd, mae'n bwysig bod trafodion y partneriaethau'n hawdd eu deall gan y rhai nad oes ganddynt lawer o brofiad o gymryd rhan yn rhaglenni ariannu'r UE.'

Pam na wnaiff y Llywodraeth gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn?

**Christine Chapman:** I wanted to mention that later. The overall report was good. However, it gives us some constructive feedback, which we need to take on board. On this point, I have visited all the Objective 1 partnerships, and I pay tribute to the people involved because they are the ones who are making Objective 1 a success. This has been recognised by Europe and by the Welsh Affairs Committee. We are drawing on the expertise of the people of Wales to make this huge programme a success. It is not 100 per cent right yet, but it is a question of fine-tuning. To return to Nick's point, I will not support amendment 3 because we need to build on the work that we are doing already. Progress has already been made. It is not just a question of saying that it is all wrong.

On Alun's point about jobs, Objective 1 is a long-term programme. It is not about creating jobs overnight, although I have seen evidence of that when I have visited partnerships and projects. It is a long-term project and it is vital that we spend time putting in the right partnerships and the framework to enable us to go beyond the Objective 1 period.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you also accept that improving inactivity rates figures, that is, reducing the number of people who are economically inactive, is the key thrust of Objective 1? Are you alarmed that that is rising quite significantly?

**Christine Chapman:** Many of the Objective 1 projects are about turning that bat around. Some of the projects, if you consider things such as Finance Wales, where we are helping indigenous businesses, are about getting people into jobs. If you look at the facts, you will see that things are moving. The Welsh European Funding Office is about to launch its database, which will be a good analysis of the jobs that will be created, and will give us a much better picture.

We need to recognise that we must keep people on board, because it is about keeping this programme sustainable with the strong leadership shown by the Assembly.

**Christine Chapman:** Yr oeddwn am sôn am hynny'n ddiweddarach. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn dda at ei gilydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhoi rhywfaint o adborth adeiladol i ni, y bydd yn rhaid inni'i gymryd i ystyriaeth. Ar y pwynt hwn, yr wyf wedi ymweld â'r holl bartneriaethau Amcan 1, a thalaf deyrnged i'r rhai sy'n gysylltiedig am mai hwy sy'n gwneud Amcan 1 yn llwyddiant. Cydnabuwyd hynny gan Ewrop a chan y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig. Yr ydym yn manteisio ar arbenigedd pobl Cymru i droi'r rhaglen anferth hon yn llwyddiant. Nid yw pob dim amdano'n iawn eto, ond mae'n fater o fanwl gyweirio. Gan ddychwelyd at bwynt Nick, ni chefnogaf welliant 3 gan fod angen inni adeiladu ar sail y gwaith da yr ydym yn ei wneud eisoes. Cafwyd cynnydd. Nid yw'n fater o ddweud bod popeth wedi mynd o chwith.

Ynghylch pwynt Alun am swyddi, mae Amcan 1 yn rhaglen dymor hir. Nid yw'n ymwneud â chreu swyddi dros nos, er imi weld tystiolaeth o hynny wrth ymweld â phartneriaethau a phrosiectau. Mae'n brosiect tymor hir ac mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn treulio amser yn rhoi'r partneriaethau a'r fframwaith iawn ar waith fel y gallwn fynd ymhellach na'r cyfnod Amcan 1.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych hefyd yn derbyn mai gwella ffigurau'r cyfraddau anweithgaredd, hynny yw, lleihau'r nifer sy'n economaidd anweithredol, yw prif bwyslais Amcan 1? A ydych yn dychryn wrth weld y nifer yn codi'n eithaf sylweddol?

**Christine Chapman:** Mae llawer o brosiectau Amcan 1 yn ymwneud â gweddnewid hynny. Mae rhai o'r prosiectau, os ystyriwch bethau fel Cyllid Cymru, lle'r ydym yn helpu busnesau cynhenid, yn ymwneud â rhoi pobl mewn swyddi. Os edrychwch ar y ffeithiau, fe welwch fod pethau'n symud. Mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ar fin lansio'i chronfa ddata, a fydd yn ddadansoddiad da o'r swyddi a greir, a bydd yn rhoi darlun gwell o lawer i ni.

Rhaid inni sylweddoli bod angen inni gadw pobl gyda ni, gan mai'r hyn sy'n bwysig yw cadw'r rhaglen hon yn gynaliadwy gyda'r arweinyddiaeth gryf a amlygir gan y

Recognising this, WEFO has set up several initiatives. A private sector unit has been set up to assist it to access funds. That is working well with the social partners unit that the Assembly has set up. We also have the voluntary sector unit, which is located with the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, and supports the voluntary sector to access Objective 1 advice. Another good initiative, which has been warmly welcomed by the voluntary sector, is the advance payment scheme. This is not happening in other areas.

To return to amendment 3, it is about recognising the progress that has already been made. Another point that Phil raised—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose*—

**Christine Chapman:** May I finish this first? Objective 1, unlike previous structural funds programmes, will be strengthened because of the additional scrutiny that devolution brings. It is about the Economic Development Committee, the programme monitoring committee—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose*—

**Christine Chapman:** Can I just wind up?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have time for two or three more sentences.

**Christine Chapman:** To finish, Martin Caton, who sits on the Welsh Affairs Committee, remarked in *The Western Mail* yesterday that

‘there is no evidence at all that Wales will fail to get every euro of the funds allocated to us’.

That shows that we are making progress.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Y mae’n drueni nad yw Peter Law yn bresennol yn awr, oherwydd fy mod am ateb y pwynt a wnaeth. Wedi pum mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, yr ydym yn y llanast hwn o hyd, sy’n gyfan gwbl annerbyniol.

Mae sicrhau cyfundrefn sy’n cyllido’r rhaglen strwythurol Ewropeaidd yn llawn—

Cynulliad. Gan gydnabod hynny, mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru wedi sefydlu sawl menter. Sefydlwyd uned sector preifat i’w helpu i gael mynediad at gyllid. Mae honno’n gweithio’n dda gyda’r uned partneriaid cymdeithasol a sefydlwyd gan y Cynulliad. Mae gennym uned sector gwirfoddol hefyd, sydd wedi’i lleoli gyda Chyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, ac yn cynorthwyo’r sector gwirfoddol i gael cyngor ar Amcan 1. Menter da arall, a groesawyd yn gynnes gan y sector gwirfoddol, yw’r cynllun blaendalu. Nid yw hynny’n digwydd mewn ardaloedd eraill.

Gan fynd yn ôl at welliant 3, mae’n ymwneud â chydabod y cynnydd a gafwyd eisoes. Pwynt arall a gododd Phil—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd*—

**Christine Chapman:** A gaf orffen hyn yn gyntaf? Caiff Amcan 1, yn wahanol i’r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol blaenorol, ei gryfhau oherwydd yr archwilio ychwanegol a ddaw gyda datganoli. Mae’n ymwneud â’r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, y pwyllgor monitro rhaglen—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd*—

**Christine Chapman:** A gaf gloi?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae gennyh amser i ddwy neu dair brawddeg yn rhagor.

**Christine Chapman:** I orffen, dywedodd Martin Caton, sy’n eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig, yn *The Western Mail* ddoe

Mae hynny’n dangos ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd.

**Dafydd Wigley:** It is a shame that Peter Law is not present, as I wanted to respond to the point that he made. After five years of Labour Government, we are still in this mess, which is wholly unacceptable.

Establishing a system that fully funds the European structural programme—especially

yn arbennig Amcan 1—yn allweddol bwysig am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, i sicrhau ein bod yn cymryd mantais lawn o'r cyfle a ddaw gydag Amcan 1. Yn ail, i osgoi gorfod dwyn arian o elfennau eraill o'n cyllideb, er enghraifft addysg, a fyddai'n ein rhwystro rhag cyflawni ein targedau. Mae addysg yn allweddol i lwyddiant economaidd.

Oni bai bod gennym adnoddau digonol, mae perygl na fyddwn yn gallu codi cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen, a dyna'r rheswm sylfaenol inni gael arian Amcan 1 yn y lle cyntaf. Y gwir yw ein bod wedi methu'n drychinebus hyd yma i wireddu polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer codi CMC y pen. Eleni, bydd CMC y pen yng Nghymru yn codi 1 y cant, o gymharu ag 1.9 y cant ar draws y Deyrnas Gyfunol

**Brian Gibbons:** Does Dafydd agree that promoting education and training is one of the key aims of Objective 1, so that instead of being in competition, they complement each other?

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yes, and is it not sad that the increase in money for education in Wales was held back? Resources had to be diverted from education to fund the Objective 1 programme because of the lack of adequate funding in the last comprehensive spending review settlement.

Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at ein methiant i gyrraedd y targed. Targed Llywodraeth Cymru oedd codi CMC y pen yng Nghymru o 80 y cant o lefel Prydain—y lefel ddifrifol o isel sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd—i 90 y cant, o fewn 10 mlynedd. Y realiti yw bod y sefyllfa yn gwaethygu, nid yn gwella. Y disgwyl yw mai 2.8 y cant bydd twf CMC y pen ym Mhrydain yn 2003, a 2.0 y cant yng Nghymru. Mae'r bwlch yn lledaenu.

Pam nad yw'r rhaglen Ewropeaidd a pholisi Gordon Brown wedi dechrau effeithio ar y sefyllfa? Mae Gordon Brown wedi bod yn ei swydd ers pum mlynedd. Faint rhagor mae'n rhaid inni ddisgwyl i weld effaith ar CMC y pen yng Nghymru? Mae ffigurau cofrestru busnesau ar gyfer treth ar werth, am bob 10,000 o'r boblogaeth, yn dangos yr un methiant. Mae wedi disgyn o 323 yn 1998 i

Objective 1—is vital for two reasons. First, to ensure that we take full advantage of the opportunity that Objective 1 affords. Secondly, to avoid having to divert money from other budgets, for example education, which would prevent us from reaching our targets. Education is fundamental to economic success.

Unless we have sufficient resources, there is a danger that we will not be able to raise gross domestic product per capita, and that is why we received Objective 1 funding in the first place. The truth is that, to date, we have failed abysmally to deliver the Assembly Government's policies for raising GDP per capita. This year, GDP per capita in Wales will increase 1 per cent, compared with 1.9 per cent across the UK.

**Brian Gibbons:** A yw Dafydd yn cytuno mai hybu addysg a hyfforddiant yw un o nodau allweddol Amcan 1, fel eu bod yn ategu'i gilydd yn hytrach na chystadlu â'i gilydd?

**Dafydd Wigley:** Ydwyf, ac onid yw'n drist bod y cynnydd yn yr arian i addysg yng Nghymru wedi'i ddal yn ôl? Bu'n rhaid dargyfeirio adnoddau o addysg i ariannu'r rhaglen Amcan 1 am nad oedd cyllid digonol yn setliad yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant diwethaf.

I was referring to our failure to reach the target. The Assembly Government's target was to raise GDP per capita in Wales from 80 per cent of the British level—the pitifully low level that currently exists—to 90 per cent, within 10 years. The reality is that the situation is deteriorating, rather than improving. It is expected that the increase in GDP per capita in Britain in 2003 will be 2.8 per cent, and 2 per cent in Wales. The gap is widening.

Why have the European programme and Gordon Brown's policies not started to remedy the situation? Gordon Brown has been in office for five years. How much longer must we wait to see an impact on GDP per capita in Wales? The business registration figures for value added tax, for every 10,000 head of the population, shows the same failure. It has fallen from 323 in 1998 to 317

317 y llynedd. Nod y Llywodraeth oedd codi'r lefel yn nes at gyfartaledd Prydain.

Mae'r Llywodraeth hefyd wedi methu â chodi graddfeydd gweithgarwch yng Nghymru. Bu perfformiad Cymru ers 1999 yn waeth na Lloegr. Mae'r ffigurau yn dangos cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n economaidd anweithgar i 26,000, sef 5.7 y cant yng Nghymru, tra nad oedd ond yn 2.5 y cant dros Brydain. Derbyniodd Andrew Davies, yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ddoe, mai codi graddfeydd gweithgarwch yw'r allwedd i godi CMC y pen.

Pryd fedrwn ni ddisgwyl i rywbeth ddigwydd yn hyn o beth? Mae'r methiant hwn yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar lefelau tlodi yng Nghymru. Datganodd y Child Poverty Action Group fod 36 y cant o blant Cymru yn byw o dan y llinell dlodi, sy'n gwbl annerbyniol. Dyna effaith cael Gordon Brown yn y Trysorlys a Llywodraeth Lafur am bum mlynedd, ar ben 18 mlynedd o lywodraeth gan y Ceidwadwyr.

Mae diffyg gwaith hefyd yn adlewyrchu ar lefelau cyflogau. Cyfartaledd cyflog Prydain ar gyfer dynion y llynedd oedd £490 yr wythnos. Yng Nghymru, £412 ydoedd, yn Rhondda Cynon Taf £366, ac yng Nghonwy £346—£144 yr wythnos yn is na chyfartaledd Prydain. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol ychwaith.

Lefelau incwm aelwydydd Cymru yw'r isaf yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol—yn is na Gogledd Iwerddon a gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr. Dyna pam y mae'n rhaid inni gael yr adnoddau llawn yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, i sicrhau rhaglen a fydd yn codi incwm y pen. Fel arall, bydd ein gwlad yn parhau i ddioddef y tlodi enbyd annerbyniol sy'n tanseilio ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru.

11:35 a.m.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I have listened carefully this morning, particularly to Elin's opening remarks on arrangements for the European structural funds programmes in Wales. It is disappointing that the Government must

last year. The aim of the Government was to raise the level nearer to the British average.

The Government has also failed to increase activity rates in Wales. Wales's performance since 1999 has been worse than England's. The figures show an increase in the numbers of people who are economically inactive to 26,000, which is 5.7 per cent in Wales, while the figure is only 2.5 per cent across Britain. Andrew Davies accepted, in the Economic Development Committee yesterday, that raising activity rates is the key to improving GDP per capita.

When can we expect something to happen in this respect? This failure has a direct impact on poverty levels in Wales. The Child Poverty Action Group has stated that 36 per cent of children in Wales live beneath the poverty line, which is totally unacceptable. That is the result of having Gordon Brown in the Treasury and a Labour Government in office for five years, on top of 18 years of Conservative rule.

Lack of employment also reflects on wage levels. The average salary level for men in Britain last year was £490 per week. In Wales it was £412, in Rhondda Cynon Taff £366, and in Conwy £346—£144 a week under the British average. That is not acceptable either.

Household income levels in Wales are the lowest in the United Kingdom—lower than Northern Ireland and the north-east of England. That is why we must have the full resources in the comprehensive spending review, to ensure a programme that will raise income per capita. Otherwise, our country will continue to suffer the unacceptable poverty that undermines the quality of life of people in Wales.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf wedi gwrando'n astud y bore yma, yn enwedig ar sylwadau agoriadol Elin ar y trefniadau i raglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru. Mae'n destun siom bod y Llywodraeth yn gorfod parhau i

persist in restating its position when 'Putting Wales First', the partnership agreement, makes our commitments clear, in ensuring that Wales fully benefits from all European funding, through the current structural funds programme.

As Mike said, this is about the negotiating position for this comprehensive spending review. The Secretary of State for Wales was advised of the partnership agreement as soon as we signed it. He knew what our position would be, and the UK Cabinet knows our position: it is clear.

If what Elin said is true, and she is not trying to make mischief out of the partnership agreement, she will hold up her hand and support our amendment. Mischief making is going on here. You speak as though we have not considered this issue and are taking an unclear mandate to the CSR. That is not true; the mandate was contained in the partnership agreement. Let us see an element of good faith, and see you supporting amendment 1, tabled in the name of Carwyn Jones.

It is important that I remind everyone of what we have done in light of continuing scepticism, which perhaps, Peter, we could refer to as the 'grand alliance'. The opposition parties claim that we did not get Objective 1 status and that no work went into this. However, work did go into it and Objective 1 status was achieved. As Peter said, it was a Labour Government that managed to ensure that these programmes are now running in Wales.

Janet Ryder commented—in quite a patronising manner, I thought—that Labour politicians do not understand how budgets work. We do understand. When moneys come through, and I have the consequentials, I am not like some lap dog; I have a consequential and decide that I will definitely allocate it to the same programme in Wales. We allocate our budget as a whole as we want to. Nobody has lost out; we have simply allocated it in a certain way. I do not follow Westminster in that regard.

ailldatgan ei safbwynt pan yw 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf', y cytundeb partneriaeth, yn egluro ein hymrwymiaidau, o ran sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael pob budd o'r holl gyllid Ewropeaidd, drwy'r rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol bresennol.

Fel y dywedodd Mike, mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r safbwynt negodi ar gyfer yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant hwn. Hysbyswyd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru am y cytundeb partneriaeth cyn gynted ag yr oeddem wedi'i arwyddo. Fe wyddai beth fyddai ein safbwynt, ac mae Cabinet y DU yn gwybod beth yw ein safbwynt: mae'n glir.

Os yw'r hyn a ddywedodd Elin yn wir, ac os nad yw'n ceisio creu helynt o'r cytundeb partneriaeth, bydd yn codi'i llaw ac yn cefnogi'n gwelliant. Mae ymgais i greu helynt yma. Yr ydych yn siarad fel pe baem heb ystyried y mater hwn ac am fynd â mandad aneglur at yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Nid yw hynny'n wir; yr oedd y mandad yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Gadewch inni weld rywfaint o ewyllys da, a'ch gweld yn cefnogi gwelliant 1, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Carwyn Jones.

Mae'n bwysig imi atgoffa pawb am yr hyn a wnaethom yng ngolwg y sgeptigiaeth barhaus, y gallem ei galw o bosibl, Peter, yn 'gynghrair fawreddog'. Mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n honni na chawsom statws Amcan 1 ac na wnaethpwyd unrhyw waith ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, fe wnaethpwyd gwaith arno a sicrhawyd statws Amcan 1. Fel y dywedodd Peter, Llywodraeth Lafur a lwyddodd i sicrhau bod y rhaglenni hyn yn rhedeg yng Nghymru'n awr.

Dywedodd Janet Ryder—mewn modd eithaf nawddoglyd, yr oeddwn i'n meddwl—nad yw gwleidyddion Llafur yn deall sut y mae cyllidebau'n gweithio. Yr ydym yn deall. Pan ddaw'r arian drwodd, a phan gaf y symiau canlyniadol, nid wyf yn ymddwyn fel rhyw gi anwes; mae'r swm canlyniadol gennyf a phenderfynaf yn bendant y byddaf yn ei ddyrannu i'r un rhaglen yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn dyrannu ein cyllideb yn ei gyfanrwydd fel yr ydym yn dymuno. Nid oes neb ar ei golled; nid ydym ond wedi'i dyrannu mewn modd penodol. Nid wyf yn dilyn San Steffan yn hynny o beth.

It is most irresponsible to continue to claiming that more money is needed, as seems to happen in every debate. That is not how to run the sector, or the budget process here. The begging bowl mentality of Plaid Cymru, in putting its hands out to a state that it does not really want, because it would like to be independent—

**Dafydd Wigley:** Will the Minister give way?

**Edwina Hart:** This is quite a difficult issue. I was disappointed, Dafydd, with your use of the word 'steal'. There is no stealing; it is simply allocating according to budget priorities. Education has not lost out. We discussed the budget in the Chamber, we had a generous settlement, and we presented the budget proposals.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I wanted to pick up the point that Edwina made a moment ago, about asking for more resources. Yesterday, in the Economic Development Committee, we were told that the First Minister is negotiating with Paul Murphy to secure more resources. Is that not exactly what needs to be done? Our motion seeks to underpin that objective, and I hope that the Government succeeds, because if it does not, we will pay a price.

**Edwina Hart:** We are well aware of our commitment in the partnership agreement, that we wanted to request more resources in the CSR. I was alluding to contributions made in this Chamber. There is a continual demand for more money, but not in a strategic way for the CSR. Every time we have a discussion, someone asks the Government for more money, without ever saying how they would change priorities and allocations. The reality of life in Government is that you have to prioritise your allocations. The Secretary of State for Wales and the Assembly Government press the Treasury as hard as we can, and our commitment in terms of the CSR is well made in the partnership agreement.

Anghyfrifol dros ben yw parhau i honni bod angen rhagor o arian, fel a wneir ym mhob dadl, yn ôl pob golwg. Nid honno yw'r ffordd i redeg y sector, neu broses y gyllideb yma. Mae meddylfryd ffiol gardod Plaid Cymru, wrth estyn ei llaw at wladwriaeth nad yw am ei chael mewn gwirionedd, am y carai fod yn annibynnol—

**Dafydd Wigley:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ildio?

**Edwina Hart:** Mater eithaf anodd yw hwn. Cefais fy siomi, Dafydd, gan eich defnydd o'r gair 'dwyn'. Nid oes unrhyw ddwyn; y cwbl a wneir yw dyrannu yn ôl ein blaenoriaethau cyllideb. Nid yw addysg ar ei cholled. Gwnaethom drafod y gyllideb yn y Siambr, cawsom setliad hael, a chyflwynasom y cynigion cyllideb.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yr oeddwn am godi'r pwynt a wnaeth Edwina eiliad yn ôl, ynghylch gofyn am fwy o adnoddau. Ddoe, yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, dywedwyd wrthym fod Prif Weinidog Cymru'n negodi gyda Paul Murphy i sicrhau mwy o adnoddau. Onid hynny yw'r union beth y mae'n rhaid ei wneud? Mae ein cynnig yn ceisio ategu'r amcan hwnnw, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn llwyddo, oherwydd os na wnaiff, byddwn yn talu'r pris.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym yn dra ymwybodol o'n hymrwymiad yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, ein bod yn dymuno gofyn am ragor o adnoddau yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at gyfraniadau a wnaethpwyd yn y Siambr hon. Mae galw parhaus am fwy o arian, ond nid mewn modd strategol i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Bob tro y cawn drafodaeth, mae rhywun yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth am fwy o arian, heb byth ddweud sut y byddent yn newid y blaenoriaethau a'r dyraniadau. Y gwir am fywyd mewn Llywodraeth yw bod rhaid ichi flaenoriaethu'ch dyraniadau. Mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn pwyso ar y Trysorlys mor galed ag y gallwn, ac mae ein hymrwymiad o ran yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant wedi'i ddatgan yn gadarn yn y cytundeb partneriaeth.

Regarding the current spending review, let me make it clear that we are pursuing the commitments contained in 'Putting Wales First'.

**Phil Williams** *rose*—

**Edwina Hart:** We have revisited the EU grants forecast for structural funds programmes over 2003-04 to 2005-06, and have revised our requirements. That has been conveyed to the Secretary of State for Wales and the Chief Secretary to the Treasury.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Are you giving way to Phil? The Minister is not giving way.

**Edwina Hart:** The Chancellor had no difficulty in looking at what the priorities are within Wales, and understanding what our policy position is.

I continue to stress that, in the first instance, match funding is the responsibility of grant applicants. That ensures local ownership of, and commitment to, projects. The numerous possible sources for match funds include local authorities, ELWa, Assembly sponsored public bodies, the voluntary sector, Assembly Government schemes, lottery funding and the private sector. Nevertheless, at the time of the comprehensive spending review in 2000, we recognised that the new structural fund programmes would provide a significant challenge to public sector applicants to raise the match funding required. We reviewed the likely match funding requirements and concluded that it would be around £60 million per annum. As a result of Gordon Brown's generous comprehensive spending review settlement, I established a wide range of match funding budgets averaging nearly £70 million.

Until now, the Treasury has not provided specific moneys for match funding to any Government department or devolved administration. I do not think that I would want any hypothecation of my block if it was to do that. However, I am committed to what we have asked in terms of this year's

Ynghylch yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant presennol, gadewch imi roi ar ddeall ein bod yn dilyn yr ymrwymadau a geir yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'.

**Phil Williams** *a gododd*—

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym wedi ailedrych ar grantiau'r UE a ragwelir ar gyfer rhaglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol o 2003-04 hyd 2005-06, ac wedi adolygu ein gofynion. Cyflewyd hynny i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A ydych yn ildio i Phil? Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chafodd y Canghellor unrhyw anhawster wrth edrych ar y blaenoriaethau a geir yng Nghymru, a deall beth yw ein safbwynt polisi.

Yr wyf yn dal i bwysleisio bod cyllid cyfatebol yn gyfrifoldeb, yn y lle cyntaf, i'r ymgeiswyr am grant. Mae hynny'n sicrhau perchnogaeth leol ar brosiectau ac ymrwymiad iddynt. Mae'r ffynonellau niferus posibl o gyllid cyfatebol yn cynnwys yr awdurdodau lleol, ELWa, cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, y sector gwirfoddol, cynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, arian loteri a'r sector preifat. Er hynny, ar adeg yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn 2000, gwnaethom gydnabod y byddai'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol newydd yn cynnig her sylweddol i ymgeiswyr o'r sector cyhoeddus godi'r cyllid cyfatebol sydd ei angen. Gwnaethom adolygu'n gofynion tebygol o ran cyllid cyfatebol a dod i'r casgliad y byddai tua £60 miliwn y flwyddyn. O ganlyniad i setliad hael Gordon Brown yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, sefydlais amrediad eang o gyllidebau cyllid cyfatebol ac ynddynt ymron i £70 miliwn yr un ar gyfartaledd.

Hyd yn hyn, nid yw'r Trysorlys wedi darparu arian penodol ar gyfer cyllid cyfatebol i unrhyw adran o'r Llywodraeth neu weinyddiaeth ddatganoledig. Ni chredaf y byddwn am gael unrhyw bridiannu yn fy mloc pe byddai am wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i'r hyn yr



comprehensive spending review. The generous allocation to our block has provided sufficient resources. If there is evidence to suggest otherwise, I have always indicated that I would consider the issue.

I listened with interest to Phil's comments. Some of the match fund budgets were underspent at the end of 2001-02, which suggests that sufficient match funds were available. If there is evidence to suggest a shortfall, I will consider it as part of my budget planning round.

**Phil Williams:** Do you accept that the decommitment rules place a different pressure on you, because you must decide not whether to allocate money from one block to another, but whether to abandon spending? If we are to avoid decommitment, the level of spend—which was lower than we expected in 2001-02—must increase substantially.

**Edwina Hart:** I must consider the level of spend in line with the decommitment rules that apply in Brussels.

The Government is committed—

**Alun Cairns:** If there is a surplus in the match funding allocation for the programme to date, does the Minister accept that the bureaucracy and the cumbersome application process could have contributed to that?

**Edwina Hart:** I agree with Christine Chapman that we have made progress in dealing with Objective 1 over the past 12 months. The Welsh Affairs Committee also recognised that. There is always room for improvement. I agree with Peter Law; we must always be vigilant in ensuring that these programmes develop. We are now getting to the heart of issues and getting money out of the door.

On Jonathan Morgan's amendment 3, we have ensured that WEFO and the programme monitoring committee are continuously evaluating and improving the application and approval procedures. That also answers Alun's question.

ydym wedi gofyn amdano o ran adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant y flwyddyn hon. Mae'r dyraniad hael i'n bloc ni wedi darparu digon o adnoddau. Os oes tystiolaeth i awgrymu fel arall, yr wyf yn dweud erioed y byddwn yn ystyried y mater.

Gwrandewais â diddordeb ar sylwadau Phil. Bu tanwario ar rai o'r cyllidebau cyllid cyfatebol ar ddiwedd 2001-02, sy'n awgrymu bod digon o gyllid cyfatebol ar gael. Os oes tystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu bod diffyg, fe'i hystyriaf fel rhan o'm cylch cynllunio cyllideb.

**Phil Williams:** A ydych yn derbyn bod y rheolau dadrwympo'n rhoi pwysau gwahanol arnoch, gan nad penderfynu a ddylid dyrannu arian o un bloc i'r llall a wneir, ond penderfynu a ddylid rhoi'r gorau i wario? Os ydym i osgoi dadrwympo, rhaid i lefel y gwariant—a oedd yn is nag yr oeddem yn ei ddisgwyl yn 2001-02—gynyddu'n sylweddol.

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid imi ystyried lefel y gwariant yn unol â'r rheolau dadrwympo sy'n weithredol ym Mrwsel.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo—

**Alun Cairns:** Os oes gwarged yn y dyraniad o gyllid cyfatebol i'r rhaglen hyd yn hyn, a yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn ei bod yn bosibl bod y fiwrocratiaeth a'r broses ymgeisio anhylaw wedi cyfrannu at hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf â Christine Chapman ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd wrth ddelio ag Amcan 1 dros y 12 mis diwethaf. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig yn cydnabod hynny hefyd. Mae lle i wella bob amser. Cytunaf â Peter Law; rhaid inni fod yn wyliadwrus bob amser wrth sicrhau bod y rhaglenni hyn yn datblygu. Yr ydym yn mynd at wraidd pethau'n awr ac yn gyrru arian allan.

Ynghylch gwelliant 3 Jonathan Morgan, yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru a'r pwyllgor monitro rhaglen yn gwerthuso ac yn gwella'r gweithdrefnau ymgeisio a chymeradwyo'n barhaus. Mae hynny'n ateb cwestiwn Alun hefyd.

We must stop carping and being negative when discussing structural funds in Wales. The Assembly is making achievements. People are participating in the structural fund process and it is all starting to work. We must acknowledge that Westminster succeeded in providing the resources and the expenditure cover in the last comprehensive spending review.

**Nick Bourne:** Amendment 3 is not meant to be a form of carping. The Welsh Affairs Committee report stated that

‘WEFO is missing its targets for the time taken to process applications by a considerable margin’.

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for reminding me of that. We will only support our amendment.

I ask Members to vote against Plaid Cymru’s motion and the Conservative Party’s amendments and to support our amendment, which reaffirms our policy commitment in terms of what we want in the comprehensive spending review. The partnership agreement is quite specific. Please do not table any more motions that try to cause mischief as regards the partnership agreement. It will not work because, at the end of the day, we know how we are working, we have made the appropriate representations, and everyone knows where we stand on policy.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** To respond to the Minister’s final, tongue-in-cheek remark, it is not us who are causing mischief in terms of the partnership agreement. I was interested to read the *South Wales Echo* recently, which stated that the First Minister’s local branch of the Labour Party is calling on the Labour Party to come out of the partnership agreement. That is an interesting aside. Perhaps we can read the *South Wales Echo* together later on, Rhodri, as a little bit of fun.

11:45 a.m.

**The First Minister:** That is not what was

Rhaid inni beidio â phigo beiau a bod yn negyddol wrth drafod y cronfeydd strwythurol yng Nghymru. Mae’r Cynulliad yn cyflawni pethau. Mae pobl yn cymryd rhan ym mhroses y cronfeydd strwythurol ac mae popeth yn dechrau gweithio. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod San Steffan wedi llwyddo o ran darparu’r adnoddau a’r arian ar gyfer gwariant yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant diwethaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid yw gwelliant 3 yn ymgais i bigo beiau. Dywedodd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig:

‘Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru’n methu ei thargedau am yr amser a gymerir i brosesu ceisiadau o gryn dipyn’.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch i chi am fy atgoffa o hynny. Ni fyddwn ond yn cefnogi ein gwelliant ni.

Gofynnaf i’r Aelodau bleidleisio yn erbyn cynnig Plaid Cymru a gwelliannau’r Blaid Geidwadol a chefnogi ein gwelliant ni, sy’n ailddatgan ein hymrwymiad polisi o ran yr hyn yr ydym am ei gael yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Mae’r cytundeb partneriaeth yn eithaf penodol. Byddwch cystal â pheidio â chyflwyno rhagor o gynigion sy’n ceisio creu helynt o ran y cytundeb partneriaeth. Ni wnaiff weithio oherwydd, yn y pen draw, fe wyddom sut yr ydym yn gweithio, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno’r sylwadau priodol, ac fe w’yr pawb ein safbwynt ar bolisi.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Er mwyn ymateb i sylw olaf, cellweirus y Gweinidog, nid ni sy’n creu helynt o ran y cytundeb partneriaeth. Yr oedd o ddi-ddordeb imi ddarllen y *South Wales Echo* yn ddiweddar lle y dywedwyd bod cangen leol Prif Weinidog Cymru o’r Blaid Lafur yn galw ar y Blaid Lafur i dynnu allan o’r cytundeb partneriaeth. Mae hynny’n rhywbeth diddorol wrth fynd heibio. Efallai y gallwn ddarllen y *South Wales Echo* gyda’n gilydd yn ddiweddarach, Rhodri, er mwyn cael ychydig o hwyl.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid hynny a

stated in the *South Wales Echo*. It said that the motion had been withdrawn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It shows that the motion was at least tabled. [*Laughter.*] This is interesting.

Gadewch imi ddod at ddadl heddiw. Agorodd Elin Jones y ddadl hon drwy ddatgan y ffigurau. Os ydym am wneud y defnydd llawn o Amcan 1 o hyn hyd ddiwedd y rhaglen, rhaid inni gael £270 miliwn bob blwyddyn, £170, miliwn o arian Ewropeaidd a £100 miliwn o arian cyfatebol. Mae'n arwyddocaol nad yw'r un siaradwr Llafur nac un ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi dweud bod y ffigurau hynny'n anghywir. Mae pawb felly'n cydnabod y ffigurau hynny. Mae Brian Gibbons, y Gweinidog, Peter Law, Christine Chapman a Mike German yn amddiffyn y drefn hon. Nid oes un ohonynt yn gwrthwynebu'r ffigurau. Rhoddodd Phil Williams sialens i unrhyw un i ddod â ffigurau gwahanol iddo erbyn 4 p.m., a gwnaiff eu marcio.

Yr oedd y ffordd yr oedd Brian Gibbons, Christine Chapman a Peter Law yn ceisio amddiffyn y sefyllfa bresennol o ran Amcan 1 yn ddiddorol. Fodd bynnag, gŵyr pawb, os siaradwch â phobl ar lawr gwlad, fod problemau difrifol gydag Amcan 1, a fydd yn arwain at yr hyn a ddisgrifiodd Phil Williams mor glir. Oni bai ein bod yn gwneud y defnydd llawn o'r arian hwnnw cyn bo hir, bydd yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ddanfôn arian yn ôl i Ewrop. Dyna'r feirniadaeth fwyaf y gallech ei gwneud o Lywodraeth Cymru. Nid yw'n medru gwneud defnydd o'r arian am nad oes arian cyfatebol ar gael ac am fod problemau difrifol yn y ffordd y caiff y sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol afael ar yr arian—

**Christine Chapman:** I take issue with your comments that we are defending the status quo. The progress of Objective 1 has been recognised. We are performing well and comparing well with our UK counterparts. That is on record and should be acknowledged, Ieuan. With over 500 projects now committed and approved and with £300 million, Objective 1 is now starting to make a difference.

ddywedwyd yn y *South Wales Echo*. Dywedodd fod y cynnig wedi'i dynnu'n ôl.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n dangos bod y cynnig wedi'i gyflwyno o leiaf. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae hyn yn ddiddorol.

Let me come to today's debate. Elin Jones opened this debate by giving us the figures. If we are going to make full use of Objective 1 between now and the end of the programme, we must have £270 million every year, £170 million of European money and £100 million of match funding. It is significant that not one Labour or Liberal Democrat spokesperson stated that those figures were incorrect. Everyone therefore recognises those figures. Brian Gibbons, the Minister, Peter Law, Christine Chapman and Mike German defended the status quo. None of them questioned those figures. Phil Williams has challenged you to present different figures by 4 p.m., and he will mark them.

The way in which Brian Gibbons, Christine Chapman and Peter Law tried to defend the current situation with regard to Objective 1 was interesting. However, as everyone knows, if you speak to people on the ground, there are serious problems with Objective 1, which will result in what Phil Williams clearly described. Unless we make full use of this money before long, the Government will be forced to send money back to Europe. That is the biggest condemnation that you could make of the Government of Wales. It cannot make use of the money because the match funding is not available and because there are serious problems with the way in which the money is accessed by the private sector and by the voluntary sector—

**Christine Chapman:** Anghytunaf â'ch sylwadau i'r perwyl ein bod yn amddiffyn y sefyllfa sydd ohoni. Mae cynnydd Amcan 1 wedi'i gydnabod. Yr ydym yn perfformio'n dda ac yn cymharu'n dda â'n cymheiriaid yn y DU. Mae hynny ar glawr a dylid ei gydnabod, Ieuan. Gydag ymrwymiad a chymeradwyaeth bellach i dros 500 o brosiectau a chyda £300 miliwn, mae Amcan 1 yn dechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth yn awr.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dafydd Wigley underlined that five years after a Labour Government came to power, the gross domestic product per capita in Wales against the UK average has gone down. That is a fact. We have had three years of Objective 1 and the figures are going down. Under the current platform for next year, they will go down again. What is Objective 1 achieving against its own original target? The Government must answer that question.

**Brian Gibbons:** Your point about the GDP levels may or may not be true. However, do you not agree that the Welsh economy is performing better than the vast majority of all the other economies in the EU?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is not. It is not a question of whether the GDP figures may or may not be correct. It is a fact. Those figures were given to the Economic Development Committee and they are on record. Nobody challenged those figures today. You must accept, Brian, that you cannot be complacent. You must explain to your constituents next May why the GDP levels are going down.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Ieuan, you must wind up now.

**Brian Gibbons:** I will be glad to go back to my constituents and tell them of an unemployment rate of 3.5 per cent and a dramatic growth in real income in my constituency since the Labour Government came to power. I am more than pleased to stand on that record.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I hope that you will also explain to your constituents why £50 million of education money in the first CSR was siphoned off for match funding, and why, in the second round, £100 million a year will also be siphoned off from health, education and other departments. I hope that that will be in your next manifesto for the people of Aberavon, Brian.

To conclude, Dafydd Wigley made the point clearly that the first CSR did not provide us with the money needed to regenerate the

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwysleisiodd Dafydd Wigley fod y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru, bum mlynedd ar ôl i Lywodraeth Lafur ddod i rym, wedi gostwng o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd y DU. Ffaith yw honno. Cawsom dair blynedd o Amcan 1 ac mae'r ffigurau'n mynd i lawr. O dan y trefniant presennol ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, byddant yn gostwng eto. Faint y mae Amcan 1 yn ei gyflawni yn ôl ei darged gwreiddiol ei hun? Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw.

**Brian Gibbons:** Gallai'ch pwynt am y lefelau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth fod yn gywir neu'n anghywir. Fodd bynnag, onid ydych yn cytuno bod economi Cymru'n perfformio'n well na'r mwyafrif helaeth o holl economïau eraill yr UE?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Nid ydyw. Nid yw'n gwestiwn o ba un a yw'r ffigurau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth yn gywir neu beidio. Mae'n ffaith. Rhoddwyd y ffigurau hynny i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac maent ar glawr. Ni wnaeth neb herio'r ffigurau hynny heddiw. Rhaid ichi dderbyn, Brian, na allwch fod yn ddifater. Rhaid ichi egluro i'ch etholwyr fis Mai nesaf pam y mae'r lefelau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth yn gostwng.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ieuan, rhaid ichi gloi'n awr.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddaf yn falch o fynd yn ôl at fy etholwyr a sôn wrthynt am y gyfradd diweithdra o 3.5 y cant a chynnydd trawiadol yn yr incwm gwirioneddol yn fy etholaeth i ers i'r Llywodraeth Lafur ddod i rym. Yr wyf yn falch dros ben o arddel y record honno.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gobeithiaf y byddwch hefyd yn egluro i'ch etholwyr pam y cafodd £50 miliwn o'r arian addysg yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant cyntaf ei ddargyfeirio i gyllid cyfatebol, a pham, yn yr ail gylch, y caiff £100 miliwn y flwyddyn ei ddargyfeirio hefyd o iechyd, addysg ac adrannau eraill. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny yn eich maniffesto nesaf i bobl Aberafan, Brian.

I derfynu, gwnaeth Dafydd Wigley y pwynt yn glir na wnaeth yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant cyntaf ddarparu inni'r arian yr oedd

Welsh economy; we are falling behind. We ask the Government, since it accepts these clear figures, is say that it will not allow Gordon Brown to get away with it this time and that the Welsh budget, following the next CSR, will receive the £270 million of European money and match funding that will ensure that we do not lose this wonderful opportunity.

ei angen i adfywio economi Cymru; yr ydym yn cael ein gadael ar ôl. Gofynnwn i'r Llywodraeth ddweud, gan ei bod yn derbyn y ffigurau eglur hynny, na fydd yn caniatáu i Gordon Brown gael ei ffordd y tro hwn ac y bydd cyllideb Cymru, ar ôl yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant nesaf, yn cael y £270 miliwn o arian Ewropeaidd a chyllid cyfatebol a fydd yn sicrhau na chollwn y cyfle gwych hwn.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.*

*Amendment 1: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.*

*Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 24.  
 Amendment 3: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 24.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Graham, William  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Melding, David  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly reaffirms the commitments given in the partnership agreement in relation to structural funds, adequacy of public expenditure cover and match funding.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ailddatgan yr ymrwymadau a roddwyd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth mewn perthynas â chronfeydd strwythurol, ac yn datgan bod darpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus ac arian cyfatebol digonol ar gael.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
Amended motion: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **Tai Da; Cymru Dda Good Housing; Good Wales**

**Janet Davies:** William Graham has requested some of my time, therefore I will ensure that I leave him at least one minute in which to speak.

I spent much of the 1970s and 1980s trying to help people in the village where I live whose council-owned homes were in an appalling condition. People redecorated their homes every six months, but nothing could disguise the bracket fungi, big enough to hold a television set, that grew on their living room walls. Black damp would appear within three weeks of redecorating, and they had rotten window frames that could not be opened, and overflowing sewers. I could tell you many stories about those days, but one will be enough. On a stormy night, as a councillor, I

**Janet Davies:** Mae William Graham wedi gofyn am rywfaint o'm hamser, felly gwnaf sicrhau fy mod yn gadael o leiaf un munud iddo siarad.

Treuliais lawer o'r 1970au a'r 1980au'n ceisio helpu pobl yn y pentref lle'r oeddwn yn byw yr oedd eu tai cyngor mewn cyflwr gwarthus. Byddent yn ailaddurno eu cartrefi bob chwe mis, ond ni allai dim guddio'r ffyngau ysgwydd, a oedd yn ddigon mawr i ddal set deledu, a dyfai ar waliau eu hystafell fyw. Byddai lleithder du'n ymddangos o fewn tri mis ar ôl ailaddurno, ac yr oedd ganddynt fframiau ffenestri pwdr na ellid eu hagar, a charthffosydd a oedd yn gorlifo. Gallwn ddweud llawer o storïau wrthy ch am y dyddiau hynny, ond bydd un yn ddigon. Ar

was called to a house to find rainwater pouring through the walls, several feet above the floor. It looked like a number of miniature waterfalls. One parent was bailing out the kitchen with a bucket while the other tried to comfort three small children crying upstairs.

Eventually, using right-to-buy receipts, the borough council was able to rebuild many of the houses and put others into a good, modern condition. By the mid 1990s, they were warm and weatherproof. However, about that time, I visited owner-occupied homes in Pontypridd where water ran down electric wiring and some where the foundations were moving. I visited student housing that was damp, had unsafe electrics and was overcrowded. I also visited a house, built against the mountainside, where a stream came through a hole in the upstairs wall, flowed down the stairs, out under the front door and down the pavement. An unusual form of running water, you might say, but a frail elderly man was living in these conditions. This, to a large extent, formed my early politics.

We all like to think that such housing is in the past, albeit the recent past. However, there are still homes in which people have to cope with such conditions, and new problems have arisen where housing is in good condition but where communities are no longer safe and pleasant places to live. What is particularly awful about living in bad housing is that you cannot escape it. Housing is central to quality of life and should be central to our work in the Assembly.

Homelessness, in its broadest sense, is unforgivable, and the Assembly has taken action to tackle it. There is enough unoccupied housing not to have forced homelessness in Wales. The Assembly has good and cost-effective schemes to provide information and intervene early. In order to achieve the vision of 'Betterwales.com', money is poured into all kinds of services. However, this money is often not as effective as it should be, because housing is not available within reach of work, or is unfit or at least unpleasant or unsuitable. In many

noson stormus, fe'm galwyd, fel cynghorydd, i dŷ a chael bod dŵr glaw yn arllwys drwy'r waliau, rai troedfeddi uwch y llawr. Ymddangosai fel nifer o raeadrau bach. Yr oedd un rhiant yn taflu dŵr o'r gegin â bwced tra oedd y llall yn ceisio cysuro tri o blant bach a oedd yn crio i fyny'r grisiau.

Yn y pen draw, drwy ddefnyddio'r derbyniadau o'r hawl i brynu, yr oedd y cyngor bwrdeistref yn gallu ailgodi llawer o'r tai a sicrhau bod y lleill mewn cyflwr da, modern. Erbyn canol y 1990au, yr oeddent yn gynnes ac yn ddiddos. Fodd bynnag, tua'r adeg honno, ymwelais â thair perchnogion preswyl ym Mhontypridd lle'r oedd dŵr yn llifo i lawr gwifrau trydan a rhai lle'r oedd y seiliau'n symud. Ymwelais â thair myfyrwr a oedd yn llaith â'u gosodiadau trydan yn anniogel ac a oedd yn orlawn. Ymwelais hefyd â thŷ, a oedd wedi'i godi yn erbyn ochr y mynydd, lle yr oedd nant yn dod drwy dwll yn y wal i fyny'r grisiau, yn llifo i lawr y grisiau, allan o dan y drws ffrynt ac i lawr y palmant. Ffurf anarferol o ddŵr rhedegog, gallech ddweud, ond yr oedd henwr bregus yn byw yn yr amgylchiadau hyn. Hynny, i raddau helaeth, a ffurfiodd fy ngwleidyddiaeth gynnar.

Yr ydym i gyd yn hoffi meddwl bod tai o'r fath yn y gorffennol, er mai'r gorffennol agos ydyw. Er hynny, ceir cartrefi o hyd lle y mae pobl yn gorfod ymdopi ag amodau o'r fath, ac mae problemau newydd wedi codi lle y mae'r tai mewn cyflwr da ond y cymunedau heb fod bellach yn fannau diogel a dymunol i fyw. Yr hyn sy'n arbennig o ofnadwy am fyw mewn tai gwael yw na allwch eu hosgoi. Mae tai'n ganolog i ansawdd bywyd a dylent fod yn ganolog i'n gwaith yn y Cynulliad.

Mae digartrefedd, yn ei ystyr ehangaf, yn anfaddeuol, ac mae'r Cynulliad wedi cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae digon o dai gwag fel nad oes rhaid cael digartrefedd dan orfod yng Nghymru. Mae gan y Cynulliad gynlluniau da a chost-effeithiol i ddarparu gwybodaeth ac ymyrryd yn gynnar. Er mwyn gwireddu gweledigaeth 'Gwellcymru.com', arllwysir arian i bob math o wasanaethau. Fodd bynnag, yn aml nid yw'r arian hwn mor effeithiol ag y dylai fod, am nad yw tai ar gael o fewn cyrraedd gwaith, neu am eu bod yn anaddas neu'n annymunol neu'n



ways, good housing is the basis for making other policies effective, for achieving targets and for improving quality of life, and can be an engine for economic regeneration.

11:55 a.m.

It often seems to me that, while nothing is ever straightforward and spending cannot take place in isolation, Assembly priorities are back to front. I am not pursuing a party line on this, but making a personal statement. I know that Governments, of whatever political persuasion, will have discussion and arguments on how much money is allocated to different sectors of spending. However, money for housing was reduced after 1996, and we are only now beginning to return funding to that level.

My deeply felt conviction is that good housing should be top of the agenda, and that good quality housing, whatever its tenure, is fundamental to achieving the vision of 'Better wales.com'. When we consider other policy portfolios, we can see how central housing is to them all: homes that are built for a longer life, can be easily repaired and adapted for changing lifestyles and that are well insulated and supplied from renewable energy sources, reduce the use of raw materials and fossil fuels, thereby reducing global warming. The Assembly has initiated or improved several valuable schemes. For example, the home energy efficiency scheme leads to warm homes that cost less to heat. The quality homes and lifetime homes schemes set standards for build and equipment and the ability of new social housing to be adapted as needs change.

It has often been said in the Assembly that children cannot fully benefit from education if their homes do not have a quiet place where they can read and study. We have heard that cold, damp homes increase ill-health, and that unsafe homes are the biggest cause of accidents. It has been suggested that poor housing costs our health budget between £40 million and £50 million a year. That is a small percentage of the NHS budget, and money would have to be spent to achieve the

anghymwys o leiaf. Ar lawer ystyr, tai da yw'r sail i sicrhau effeithiolrwydd polisiau eraill, i gyrraedd targedau ac i wella ansawdd bywyd, a gallant ysgogi adfywio economaidd.

Mae'n ymddangos yn aml i mi, er nad oes dim yn gwbl syml ac er na all gwario ddigwydd ar wahân, fod blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad o chwith. Nid wyf yn dilyn polisi plaid ar hyn, ond yn gwneud datganiad personol. Gwn y bydd Llywodraethau, o ba bynnag liw gwleidyddol, yn cael trafodaeth a dadleuon ar faint o arian a ddyrennir i wahanol sectorau gwariant. Fodd bynnag, gostyngwyd yr arian i dai ar ôl 1996, a dim ond yn awr yr ydym yn dechrau codi'r arian yn ôl at y lefel honno.

Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig y dylai tai da fod ar ben yr agenda, a bod tai o ansawdd da, o ba ddaliadaeth bynnag, yn hanfodol er mwyn gwireddu gweledigaeth 'Gwellcymru.com'. Pan ystyriwn bortffolios polisi eraill, gallwn weld mor ganolog yw tai i bob un ohonynt: mae tai a godir i barhau'n hwy, y gellir eu hatgyweirio a'u haddasu'n rhwydd i newidiadau mewn ffyrdd o fyw ac sydd wedi'u hinswleiddio a'u cyflenwi gan ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy yn lleihau'r defnydd o ddefnyddiau crai a thanwyddau ffosil, gan leihau'r cynhesu byd-eang. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi sefydlu neu wella sawl cynllun gwerthfawr. Er enghraifft, mae'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn arwain at dai cynhesach y mae'n costio llai i'w gwresogi. Gwnaeth y cynllun cartrefi o ansawdd da a'r cynllun cartrefi gydol oes osod safonau ar gyfer adeiladu ac offer a'r gallu i addasu tai cymdeithasol newydd wrth i anghenion newid.

Fe ddywedwyd yn aml yn y Cynulliad na all plant fanteisio'n llawn ar addysg os nad oes lle tawel yn eu cartrefi lle y gallant ddarllen ac astudio. Clywsom fod cartrefi oer, llaith yn cynyddu ieched gwael, ac mai cartrefi anniogel yw pennaf achos damweiniau. Awgrymwyd bod tai gwael yn costio rhwng £40 miliwn a £50 miliwn y flwyddyn i'n cyllideb ieched. Mae honno'n ganran fach o gyllideb y GIG, a byddai'n rhaid gwario arian i sicrhau'r arbediad. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn

saving. However, this is not just about saving money—although that sum is as much money as some Government grants—but mainly about giving people the quality of life that United Kingdom subjects deserve.

There is also the issue of employment, including its geographical availability and travel to work. However, in addition, there is the stimulus to the economy provided by building, repairing and equipping houses. Employment dictates where people live. For most of the last century, we saw depopulation in the Valleys as coal mining and steel production receded and, eventually, almost disappeared. In the area of Cardiff where the Assembly is located, after the closure of the steelworks and massive job losses in the docks in the late 1970s and early 1980s, thousands of people were unemployed. Housing has been a key factor for people in adapting to such huge changes in their lives and in their expectations as they move to areas where employment is to be found. However, that also leads to the disruption of communities, of their traditions and of their web of relationships. It leads to the destruction of cultures. People in this area of Cardiff were moved to the edges of the city, and young people were separated from their grandparents.

Poor housing and unwisely situated housing leads to miserable conditions and to the break-up of communities. That cannot be separated from the effects of job losses; it is enmeshed with the economy. However, together those factors have created socially excluded communities, where, all too often, those who cannot compete with drug barons and other criminals retreat into isolation and misery. To stand up and fight for communities demands courage and stamina and that deserves recognition. Crime is reduced when houses and communities are secure.

The Communities First programme recognises how difficult it is to repair social breakdown. New housing has been built in some areas without achieving the results that were expected or, at least, desired. Lessons must be learned from those schemes. It is

yn ymwneud â mwy nag arbed arian—er bod y swm hwnnw yn gymaint â rhai grantiau Llywodraeth—ond yn bennaf â rhoi i bobl yr ansawdd bywyd y mae deiliaid y Deyrnas Unedig yn ei haeddu.

Mae mater yn codi hefyd ynghylch cyflogaeth, gan gynnwys ei hargaeledd daearyddol a theithio i'r gwaith. Fodd bynnag, yn ogystal â hynny, fe geir yr hwb i'r economi oddi wrth adeiladu, atgyweirio a chyfarparu tai. Cyflogaeth sy'n pennu lle y mae pobl yn byw. Yn ystod y rhan fwyaf o'r ganrif diwethaf, gwelwom ddioblogi yn y Cymoedd wrth i gloddio glo a chynhyrchu dur encilio a diflannu bron yn y pen draw. Yn yr ardal o Gaerdydd lle y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i leoli, ar ôl cau'r gweithfeydd dur a'r colledion swyddi aruthrol yn y dociau ddiwedd y 1970au a dechrau'r 1980au, yr oedd miloedd o bobl yn ddi-waith. Bu tai yn ffactor allweddol i bobl wrth ymaddasu i newidiadau mor fawr yn eu bywydau ac yn eu disgwyliadau wrth iddynt symud i ardaloedd lle y mae gwaith i'w gael. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n arwain hefyd at chwalu cymunedau, eu traddodiadau a gwe eu cysylltiadau. Mae'n arwain at ddinistrio diwylliannau. Symudwyd y bobl yn yr ardal hon o Gaerdydd i gyrion y ddinas, a gwahanwyd y bobl ifanc oddi wrth eu neiniau a'u teidiau.

Mae tai gwael a thai a leolwyd yn annoeth yn arwain at amodau truenus ac at chwalu cymunedau. Ni ellir gwahanu hynny oddi wrth effeithiau colledion swyddi; mae ynghlwm wrth yr economi. Fodd bynnag, gyda'i gilydd mae'r ffactorau hynny wedi creu cymunedau sydd wedi'u hallgàu'n gymdeithasol, lle, yn llawer rhy aml, y mae'r rhai na allant gystadlu â'r barwniaid cyffuriau a throseddwr eraill yn encilio i unigrwydd a gofid. Mae sefyll ac ymladd dros gymunedau'n gofyn dewrder a dyfalbarhad ac mae'n haeddu cydnabyddiaeth. Ceir gostyngiad mewn troseddu pan yw tai a chymunedau'n ddiogel.

Mae'r rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn cydnabod mor anodd yw atgyweirio chwalfa gymdeithasol. Codwyd tai newydd mewn rhai ardaloedd heb sicrhau'r canlyniadau a oedd wedi'u disgwyl neu, o leiaf, eu dymuno. Rhaid dysgu gwersi oddi wrth y cynlluniau

unacceptable for over 50 per cent of nearly new houses to be boarded up in some areas.

Although good housing alone will not repair decades of damage, any scheme that ignores the need for good housing will have no effect. Good quality housing is central to all that the Assembly wants and is trying to do. Writing people off in any community, for any reason, is not an option.

The terrible lessons of the effects of changes in the macro economy on the Valleys and cities must be learned, as similar events are unfolding now in our rural areas. Anyone who blames a particular political party for the damage of earlier years, and therefore ignores the point that party makes about rural areas now, is equally guilty.

We must address the lack of housing in the rural areas that are at the sharp end now. Ensuring that rural areas remain viable and that a heritage and language, which exists nowhere else in the world, are kept strong and vibrant, is the Assembly's responsibility. Using those areas as a whipping-boy, when they are in a minority, is unforgivable. It would be unbelievable if the National Assembly for Wales failed to take the steps on housing necessary to ensure that our native language and culture, which has survived centuries of oppression, discrimination and domination, lives on through this century and beyond. If anyone does not believe me, I suggest that you read some of Gwyn Alf Williams's books, which explicitly describe that oppression. If the unbelievable happens, the names of those who sat back, or actively worked against its survival in our time, will go down in history.

Good housing requires Government intervention. People fall by the wayside in the free market. I said earlier that United Kingdom subjects deserve better than they currently get. That was not a throwaway or unconsidered remark; the United Kingdom is one of the richest countries in the world and it can afford to ensure that gross inequalities

hynny. Mae'n annerbyniol bod dros 50 y cant o dai sydd bron yn newydd wedi'u bordio mewn rhai ardaloedd.

Er na fydd tai da ar eu pen eu hunain yn atgyweirio degawdau o ddifrod, ni fydd unrhyw gynllun sy'n anwybyddu'r angen am dai da'n cael unrhyw effaith. Mae tai o ansawdd da'n ganolog ym mhob dim y mae'r Cynulliad am ei gael ac yn ceisio'i wneud. Nid yw diystyru pobl mewn unrhyw gymuned, am unrhyw reswm, yn ddewis.

Rhaid dysgu'r gwersi ofnadwy o effeithiau'r newidiadau yn y facro-economi ar y Cymoedd a'r dinasoedd, gan fod digwyddiadau tebyg yn datblygu yn ein hardaloedd gwledig. Mae unrhyw un sy'n beio plaid wleidyddol benodol am ddifrod y blynyddoedd cynharach, ac felly'n anwybyddu'r pwynt y mae'r blaid honno'n ei wneud yn awr am yr ardaloedd gwledig, yr un mor euog.

Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r prinder tai yn yr ardaloedd gwledig sy'n dioddef yn awr. Cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad yw sicrhau bod yr ardaloedd gwledig yn aros yn hyfyw a bod treftadaeth ac iaith, nad yw'n bod yn unman arall yn y byd, yn parhau'n gryf ac yn fywiog. Mae defnyddio'r ardaloedd hynny fel bwch dihangol, a hwythau'n lleiafrif, yn anfaddeuol. Byddai'n anghredadwy os methai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gymryd y camau ar dai sydd eu hangen i sicrhau bod ein hiaith a'n ddiwylliant cynhenid, a oroesodd ganrifoedd o ormes, gwahaniaethu a thra-arglwyddiaethu, yn parhau drwy'r ganrif hon a thu hwnt. Os oes rhywun nad yw'n fy nghredu, awgrymaf eich bod yn darllen rhai o lyfrau Gwyn Alf Williams, sy'n disgrifio'r ormes honno'n fanwl. Os bydd yr anghredadwy'n digwydd, bydd enwau'r rhai a safodd o'r neilltu, neu a weithiodd yn egnïol yn erbyn ei goroesiad yn ein cyfnod ni, yn cael eu cofio.

Mae tai da'n gofyn am ymyrraeth gan Lywodraeth. Mae pobl yn syrthio ar fin y ffordd yn y farchnad rydd. Dywedais yn gynharach fod deiliaid y Deyrnas Unedig yn haeddu gwell nag y maent yn ei gael ar hyn o bryd. Nid sylw difeddwl neu ffwrdd-â-hi oedd hwnnw; y Deyrnas Unedig yw un o'r gwledydd cyfoethocaf yn y byd a gall

do not exist within its boundaries. How shameful it is, therefore, that it refrains from ensuring reasonably equal overall development.

Everything I have said in this debate implies that I do not think that enough money is being invested in housing. I know that that is an easy statement to make when I am not in a Government party. I know that the health and education services make huge calls on funding. I know that, electorally, bad housing is low on the agenda because only a relatively small proportion of people is affected. I know that many are reluctant to fund housing because affected communities are out of sight, whereas everyone uses the education and health services at some time. An individual may have good housing and feel that this is not important to them. However, as an inhabitant of Wales, I ask you to understand that poor housing will affect your life in some way.

I accept that good work has been done, but my point today is that the centrality of housing has not been recognised in policy, programmes or funding. I am convinced that if we have good quality housing, it will be the beginning of confidence and stability in Wales.

12:05 p.m.

**William Graham:** I am grateful to Janet for choosing this topic for the short debate. It is now recognised that a warm, comfortable home is at the heart of many of the challenges that we face in terms of physical and mental health, our attitude to others, our respect for authority, and our care for our community. We also know how important the hearth and family life is in Welsh culture.

Some of Janet's remarks remind us of the huge sums that were spent by local authorities on council housing throughout Wales. There was a dreadful amount of poor accountability, and that mould has at least now been broken. We all regret the poor standards. It took new legislation to properly control the housing revenue account. Previously, certain authorities had been able to subsidise the rates from the profits they

fforddio sicrhau nad yw anghydraddoldebau enbyd yn bodoli o fewn ei ffiniau. Testun cywilydd, felly, yw ei bod yn ymatal rhag sicrhau datblygu cyffredinol eithaf cyfartal.

Mae popeth a ddywedais yn y ddadl hon yn awgrymu nad wyf yn credu bod digon o arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi mewn tai. Gwn fod hynny'n ddatganiad hawdd ei wneud a minnau heb fod yn un o bleidiau'r Llywodraeth. Gwn fod galwadau aruthrol am arian oddi wrth y gwasanaethau iechyd ac addysg. Yr wyf yn gwybod bod tai gwael yn isel ar yr agenda etholiadol gan mai dim ond cyfran gymharol fach o bobl a effeithir. Gwn fod llawer yn amharod i ariannu tai am fod y cymunedau a effeithir o'r golwg, tra bo pawb yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau addysg ac iechyd rywbryd. Efallai fod gan rywun gartref da ac felly'n teimlo nad yw hyn yn bwysig iddo. Fodd bynnag, fel un o drigolion Cymru, gofynnaf ichi ddeall y bydd tai gwael yn effeithio ar eich bywyd mewn rhyw fodd.

Derbyniaf fod gwaith da wedi'i wneud, ond fy mhwynt heddiw yw na chydabyddir y ffaith bod tai yn ganolog i faterion polisi, rhaglenni ac ariannu. Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig, os cawn dai o ansawdd da, y bydd hynny'n fan cychwyn i ddatblygu hyder a sefydlogrwydd yng Nghymru.

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Janet am ddewis y pwnc hwn i'r ddadl fer. Cydnabyddir bellach fod cartref cynnes a chyfforddus yn hanfodol i lawer o'r heriau yr ydym yn eu hwynebu o ran iechyd corfforol a meddyliol, ein hymagwedd at bobl eraill, ein parch at awdurdod, a'n gofal am ein cymuned. Gwyddom hefyd mor bwysig yw'r aelwyd a bywyd teuluol yn y diwylliant Cymreig.

Mae rhai o sylwadau Janet yn ein hatgoffa am y symiau anferth a wariwyd gan yr awdurdodau lleol ar dai cyngor ledled Cymru. Yr oedd llawer iawn o atebolrwydd gwael, ac mae'r patrwm hwnnw wedi'i chwalu bellach o leiaf. Mae'r safonau gwael yn destun gofid inni i gyd. Bu'n rhaid cael deddfwriaeth newydd i reoli'r cyfrif refeniw tai'n briodol. Cyn hynny, yr oedd rhai awdurdodau wedi gallu sybsideiddio'r dreth

had made in council housing rents. I hope that those days have gone, and housing will be a central issue. In itself, housing will not solve our problems, but it will go a great way towards redressing the challenges that we all face.

**The Deputy Minister for Local Government (Peter Black):** I welcome this debate and congratulate Janet on her speech. She is right that housing should be a central, cross-cutting issue in the Assembly, and we are beginning to address that.

If I had to encapsulate the Welsh Assembly Government's housing objectives and policies in one word, it would be 'quality'. It is at the heart of all that we have sought to achieve. We have already made a great deal of progress and now have in place much of the framework that will ensure that our vision of good quality housing for the people of Wales will materialise. What do we mean by quality? It is not just the physical standards of the houses, but the environments of our council estates, the way that management and maintenance services are delivered in the public and private sector, and so on. Leading on from that is the quality of life of those who live in those homes.

We now have in place a national housing strategy. Our vision, which is set out in 'Better Homes for People in Wales', is clear. We want everyone in Wales to have the opportunity to live in good quality, affordable housing, and to be able choose where they live and whether they rent or buy. We have turned this vision into the Welsh housing quality standard, which is our target for all housing in Wales. This standard is in keeping with reasonable expectations and aspirations in the twenty-first century. In the social housing sector, the standard should be achieved by 2012. It will be a major challenge for social landlords, particularly local authorities, but tenants have a right to expect nothing less.

To support this objective we are requiring local authorities to adopt a business planning approach to their landlord function. This will help them identify what is needed to reach the Welsh housing quality standard by 2012 and provide the planning structure to achieve

o'r elw a wnaethant ar renti tai cyngor. Gobeithiaf fod y dyddiau hynny ar ben, ac y bydd tai'n fater canolog. Ni fydd tai'n datrys ein problemau ohono'i hun, ond bydd yn cyfrannu'n fawr at ateb yr heriau y mae pob un ohonom yn eu hwynebu.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol (Peter Black):** Croesawaf y ddadl hon a llongyfarchaf Janet ar ei haraith. Mae'n iawn wrth ddweud y dylai tai fod yn fater canolog, trawsbynciol yn y Cynulliad, ac yr ydym yn dechrau rhoi sylw i hynny.

Os oedd rhaid imi grisialu amcanion a pholisïau tai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn un gair, 'ansawdd' fyddai hwnnw. Mae'n ganolog i bob dim yr ydym wedi ceisio'i gyflawni. Gwnaethom lawer iawn o gynnydd eisoes a bellach sefydlwyd llawer o'r fframwaith a fydd yn sicrhau gwireddu ein gweledigaeth o dai o ansawdd da i bobl Cymru. Beth yr ydym yn ei feddwl wrth ansawdd? Nid safonau ffisegol y tai'n unig ydyw, ond amgylchoedd ein stadau cyngor, y dull o gyflawni gwasanaethau rheoli a chynnal a chadw yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, ac yn y blaen. Yn deillio o hynny y mae ansawdd bywyd y rhai sy'n byw yn y cartrefi hynny.

Mae strategaeth dai genedlaethol ar waith gennym yn awr. Mae ein gweledigaeth, a nodir yn 'Cartrefi Gwell i Bobl yng Nghymru', yn eglur. Yr ydym am i bawb yng Nghymru gael cyfle i fyw mewn tai fforddiadwy o ansawdd da, ac i allu dewis lle y maent yn byw ac a ydynt yn rhentu neu'n prynu. Yr ydym wedi troi'r weledigaeth hon yn safon ar gyfer ansawdd tai Cymru, sef ein targed i'r holl dai yng Nghymru. Mae'r safon hon yn gydnaws â disgwyliau a dyheadau rhesymol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Yn y sector tai cymdeithasol, dylid cyrraedd y safon erbyn 2012. Bydd yn her fawr i'r landlordiaid cymdeithasol, yn enwedig yr awdurdodau lleol, ond mae gan y tenantiaid hawl i ddisgwyl dim llai na hynny.

Er mwyn ategu'r amcan hwn yr ydym yn mynnu bod yr awdurdodau lleol yn ymdrin â'u swyddogaeth fel landlord drwy gynllunio busnes. Bydd hyn yn eu helpu i ganfod yr hyn sydd ei angen i gyrraedd y safon ar gyfer ansawdd tai Cymru erbyn 2012 ac yn darparu

it. The current estimate of the additional investment needed to meet the Welsh housing quality standard is that it could be as much as £1.5 billion. For some councils, that will mean that they will have to look seriously at transferring their housing stock to new landlords who will be able to raise private finance.

Where transfer is the only option, we want councils to offer their tenants the opportunity to transfer to a community mutual model. The Assembly Government has been responsible for developing this model, which is now available and was formally launched a fortnight ago by Edwina Hart. This model can provide a means of transferring housing stock and raising funds that is acceptable to tenants and which empowers them, enabling them to have some control over their housing.

Staying with public sector housing, we can be proud of our quality standards for new houses. Our design requirements for houses and estates are stringent. They include high levels of energy efficiency to keep heating costs as low as possible, a mandatory requirement for all to be built to a lifetime homes specification, and for all to obtain 'secured by design' accreditation from the police.

Our quest for good quality housing does not only apply to the public sector. Our target is equally important for the private sector, particularly the private rented sector. Privately rented accommodation plays an important role in meeting the housing needs of some people in Wales. Many landlords provide satisfactory accommodation, but, unfortunately, some still rent out poorly managed and overcrowded properties with inadequate fire, health and safety standards. The Assembly Government is committed to introducing a mandatory licensing scheme for houses in multiple occupation, which will address some of the worst conditions in the privately rented sector.

**Brian Gibbons:** I agree with you on the need for a comparable set of standards for the public and private sector. However, standards are clearly different for the management of

strwythur i gynllunio i'w chyrraedd. Ar hyn o bryd, amcangyfrifir y gallai'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol sydd ei angen i gyrraedd y safon ar gyfer ansawdd tai Cymru fod yn gymaint â £1.5 biliwn. Yn achos rhai cynghorau, bydd hynny'n golygu y byddant yn gorfod dwys ystyried trosglwyddo eu stoc dai i landlordiaid newydd a fydd yn gallu codi cyllid preifat.

Os mai trosglwyddo yw'r unig ddewis, yr ydym am i'r cynghorau gynnig cyfle i'w tenantiaid drosglwyddo i'r model tai cydfuddiannol cymunedol. Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a fu'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu'r model hwn, sydd bellach ar gael ac a lansiwyd yn ffurfiol bythefnos yn ôl gan Edwina Hart. Gall y model hwn gynnig dull o drosglwyddo stoc dai a chodi cyllid sy'n dderbyniol i'r tenantiaid ac sy'n eu galluogi, fel y gallant gael rhywfaint o reolaeth dros eu tai.

Gan aros gyda thai sector cyhoeddus, gallwn ymfalchïo yn ein safonau ansawdd i dai newydd. Mae ein gofynion dylunio ar gyfer tai a stadau'n llym. Maent yn cynnwys lefelau uchel o effeithlonrwydd ynni i gadw costau gwresogi mor isel â phosibl, gofyniad mandadol i bob un gael ei godi yn unol â manyleb cartrefi gydol oes, ac i bob un gael achrediad 'diogelwch drwy gynllunio' gan yr heddlu.

Nid yw ein hymchwil am dai o ansawdd da'n berthnasol i'r sector cyhoeddus yn unig. Mae ein targed yr un mor bwysig i'r sector preifat, yn enwedig y sector rhent preifat. Mae llety rhent preifat yn chwarae rôl o bwys wrth ddiwallu anghenion tai rhai pobl yng Nghymru. Mae llawer o landlordiaid yn darparu llety boddhaol, ond, gwaetha'r modd, mae rhai'n dal i osod eiddo gorlawn a reolir yn wael sydd â safonau tân, iechyd a diogelwch annigonol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i gyflwyno cynllun trwyddedu mandadol ar gyfer tai amfeddiant, a fydd yn ymdrin â rhai o'r amodau gwaethaf yn y sector rhent preifat.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cytunaf â chi ar yr angen am set o safonau cymaradwy i'r sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat. Er hynny, mae'n amlwg bod y safonau'n wahanol ar gyfer

anti-social tenants. A range of powers is available to local authorities and social landlords, but private tenants do not have similar obligations to public sector tenants in relation to anti-social behaviour. Do you think that this should be addressed?

**Peter Black:** Anti-social behaviour, whether in the private or the public sector, is a serious matter and should be addressed. Local government has a range of powers, which can assist in some cases. However, those powers are not always adequate and, in some situations, anti-social tenants can cause a huge problem, which local authorities are virtually powerless to address. That is an issue for primary legislation in some respects, but I hope that we will address that as part of the mandatory licensing scheme. I cannot give any undertaking on that today, but, as part of the scheme, we can consider the issue.

Introducing the mandatory licensing scheme for houses in multiple occupation requires new legislation. That will be introduced as the parliamentary timetable allows. In the meantime, it is important that local authorities develop effective strategies for the private rented sector, take the opportunity to introduce registration schemes for HMOs and make full use of the significant powers already available to them. Some authorities have already done so and are seeing the benefits of this approach. The Department for Transport, Local Government and the Regions and the Assembly Government have consulted on the selective licensing of non-HMOs in the private rented sector. In England, the DTLR's proposals would limit selective licensing to areas of low demand which have falling property prices, an increase in private rented accommodation and considerable socio-economic problems. The problems in the private rented sector in Wales differ from those in England and are not restricted to areas of low demand. Some problems could be addressed if local authorities had the scope to introduce this selective, discretionary licensing scheme within criteria set by the Assembly. The proposals for Wales are that, providing that the criteria set by the Assembly are met, local

rheoli tenantiaid gwrthgymdeithasol. Mae amryw o bwerau ar gael i awdurdodau lleol a landlordiaid cymdeithasol, ond nid yw tenantiaid preifat dan rwymedigaethau tebyg i rai'r tenantiaid sector cyhoeddus o ran ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. A gredwch y dylid ymdrin â hynny?

**Peter Black:** Mae ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, boed yn y sector preifat neu'r sector cyhoeddus, yn fater difrifol a dylid rhoi sylw iddo. Mae gan lywodraeth leol amryw o bwerau, sy'n gallu bod o gymorth mewn rhai achosion. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r bwerau hynny'n ddigonol bob amser ac, mewn rhai sefyllfaoedd, gall tenantiaid gwrthgymdeithasol beri problem anferth, y mae'r awdurdodau lleol heb unrhyw allu bron i'w thrin. Mae rhai agweddau o hynny'n fater i ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, ond gobeithiaf y byddwn yn rhoi sylw i hynny fel rhan o'r cynllun trwyddedu mandadol. Ni allaf roi unrhyw ymrwymiad ar hynny heddiw, ond gallwn ystyried y mater fel rhan o'r cynllun.

Mae angen deddfwriaeth newydd i gyflwyno'r cynllun trwyddedu mandadol ar gyfer tai amlfeddiant. Cyflwynir hynny fel y mae'r amserlen seneddol yn caniatáu. Yn y cyfamser, mae'n bwysig bod yr awdurdodau lleol yn datblygu strategaethau effeithiol i'r sector rhent preifat, yn achub ar y cyfle i gyflwyno cynlluniau cofrestru ar gyfer tai amlfeddiant ac yn defnyddio i'r eithaf y bwerau sylweddol sydd ar gael iddynt eisoes. Mae rhai awdurdodau wedi gwneud hynny eisoes ac yn gweld manteision y dull gweithredu hwn. Mae'r Adran dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymgynghori ar drwyddedu dethol o dai nad ydynt yn rhai amlfeddiant yn y sector rhent preifat. Yn Lloegr, byddai cynigion yr Adran dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau yn cyfyngu trwyddedu dethol i ardaloedd lle y mae ychydig o alw, lle y mae prisiau eiddo'n gostwng, lle y mae cynnydd yn y llety rhent preifat a phroblemau cymdeithasol-economaidd sylweddol. Mae'r problemau yn y sector rhent preifat yng Nghymru'n wahanol i'r rhai yn Lloegr ac nid ydynt yn gyfyngedig i ardaloedd lle y mae ychydig o alw. Gellid ymdrin â rhai o'r problemau os câi'r awdurdodau lleol gyfle i gyflwyno'r cynllun trwyddedu dethol,

authorities would have the discretion to license all or part of their areas. Although the criteria could include areas of low demand, they would also include areas undergoing strategic renovation, areas where there are high levels of housing benefit or where there have been high levels of complaints or management problems.

The principles behind these proposals received widespread support, and we are now considering the responses to the consultation and will, in due course, announce how the proposals will be taken forward. The new arrangements require primary legislation, and the Assembly Government will ensure that there is sufficient scope to enable it to implement its broader approach for Wales through secondary legislation once the primary legislation is enacted. Changes to private sector renewal policy will increase local authorities' flexibility to develop strategic solutions to housing issues according to local pressures and priorities. The existing renovation grant regime and elements of the current loan regime will be replaced with a broad enabling power for local authorities to provide assistance. Many of the current prescriptions will be removed and authorities will have a wide range of opportunities to offer assistance. That could be through grants, loans, guarantees or helping people to move to more suitable accommodation. The changes involve a substantial element of deregulation and are being introduced through a regulatory reform Order. The Order has undergone parliamentary scrutiny and has been agreed by the Assembly. The new arrangements not only present a unique opportunity for local authorities to develop locally based solutions to local issues; they are a significant step forward in our agenda of modernising local government. It is important that authorities in Wales are well placed to exact maximum advantage from the new arrangements and the Assembly will issue detailed guidance on this. The new arrangements should be in place by early June. However, there will be a transitional period of 12 months to give local authorities the time necessary to develop their

dewisol hwn yn unol â meini prawf a bennir gan y Cynulliad. Y cynigion ar gyfer Cymru yw, ar yr amod bod y meini prawf a bennir gan y Cynulliad wedi'u bodloni, y byddai rhyddid gan yr awdurdodau lleol i drwyddedu rhan neu'r cyfan o'u hardal. Er y gallai'r meini prawf gynnwys ardaloedd ag ychydig o alw, byddent hefyd yn cynnwys ardaloedd sy'n profi adnewyddu strategol, ardaloedd lle y mae niferoedd mawr yn derbyn budd-dal tai neu lle y bu llawer o gwynion neu broblemau rheoli.

Cafwyd cefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r egwyddorion sy'n sail i'r cynigion hyn, ac yr ydym yn ystyried yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd, a byddwn yn cyhoeddi sut y bwirir ymlaen â'r cynigion maes o law. Mae'r trefniadau newydd yn gofyn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, a bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sicrhau y bydd digon o gyfle iddi allu gweithredu ei dull mwy cyffredinol i Gymru drwy ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd wedi i'r ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol ddod i rym. Bydd newidiadau i'r polisi adnewyddu sector preifat yn rhoi mwy o hyblygrwydd i'r awdurdodau lleol ddatblygu atebion strategol i faterion tai yn ôl y pwysau a'r blaenoriaethau lleol. Bydd y gyfundrefn grantiau adnewyddu bresennol ac elfennau o'r gyfundrefn benthyciadau bresennol yn cael eu disodli gan bŵer galluogi eang i awdurdodau lleol ddarparu cymorth. Dileir llawer o'r rhagnodiadau presennol a bydd gan yr awdurdodau amrediad eang o gyfleoedd i gynnig cymorth. Gallai hynny fod drwy grantiau, benthyciadau, gwarantau neu drwy helpu pobl i symud i lety mwy addas. Mae'r newidiadau'n cynnwys elfen sylweddol o ddadroleiddio ac fe'u cyflwynir drwy Orchymyn diwygio rheoliadol. Mae'r Gorchymyn wedi'i archwilio gan y Senedd ac mae'r Cynulliad wedi cytuno arno. Yn ogystal â bod yn gyfle unigryw i'r awdurdodau lleol ddatblygu atebion lleol i faterion lleol, mae'r trefniadau newydd yn gam mawr ymlaen yn ein hagenda ar gyfer moderneiddio llywodraeth leol. Mae'n bwysig bod yr awdurdodau yng Nghymru mewn sefyllfa dda i gael y fantais fwyaf posibl o'r trefniadau newydd a bydd y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi canllawiau manwl ar hyn. Dylai'r trefniadau newydd fod ar waith erbyn dechrau Mehefin. Fodd bynnag, bydd



renewal policies.

**Brian Hancock:** In developing guidance, will you take on board the fact that registered social landlords and private landlords build houses to the minimum specifications? There may be specifications for heat efficiency and insulation, but there are none for soundproofing, the size of doorways or the type of walls that should be built. Will you also consider how we can encourage the building industry in Wales to use Welsh timber and so on in buildings and also consider establishing design criteria to that effect? How will you help people who are down on their luck, but who still have a desire to better themselves and their families, to move out of rented accommodation and purchase their own properties?

12:15 p.m.

**Peter Black:** On the issue of design requirements, we set high-quality standards for new social housing, which incorporate high levels of energy efficiency and try to address the concerns that you raised.

On Welsh materials, we do not have the power to dictate to the private sector and the building industry. We seek to encourage them, if we can, to use Welsh materials and also to build their houses to a high standard. Some discussion has taken place in the Local Government and Housing Committee on how we can influence building regulations. They remain the responsibility of the UK Government, but we would like to take this issue on board in the National Assembly.

Many schemes exist to help people to move from rented accommodation to owner-occupied accommodation, including the right to buy and right to acquire schemes in terms of social housing, the homebuy scheme, which applies to urban areas as much as to rural areas, and many other schemes that can help people in that situation. If there are any other schemes that you want to bring to our attention, we will consider them and take them on board if we can.

cyfnod trosiannol o 12 mis i roi'r amser y mae ar yr awdurdodau lleol ei angen i ddatblygu eu polisiau adnewyddu.

**Brian Hancock:** Wrth ddatblygu'r canllawiau, a fyddwch yn ystyried y ffaith bod landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig a landlordiaid preifat yn codi tai yn unol â'r manylbau sylfaenol? Efallai fod manylbau ar gyfer effeithlonrwydd ynni ac inswleiddio, ond nid oes rhai ar gyfer seinglosio, maint drysau neu'r math o waliau y dylid eu hadeiladu. A wnewch hefyd ystyried sut y gallwn annog y diwydiant adeiladu yng Nghymru i ddefnyddio coed a defnyddiau eraill o Gymru mewn adeiladau a hefyd ystyried pennu meini prawf dylunio i'r perwyl hwnnw? Sut y byddwch yn helpu pobl sydd mewn twll, ond sydd ag awydd o hyd i wella eu byd hwy a'u teuluoedd, i symud o lety rhent a phrynu eu tai eu hunain?

**Peter Black:** Ynghylch mater gofynion dylunio, yr ydym yn gosod safonau ansawdd da ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol newydd, sy'n cynnwys llawer o fesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni ac yn ceisio ymdrin â'r pryderon y gwnaethoch eu codi.

Ynghylch defnyddiau o Gymru, nid ydym yn meddu ar y pŵer i orchymyn y sector preifat a'r diwydiant adeiladu. Yr ydym yn ceisio'u hannog, os gallwn, i ddefnyddio defnyddiau o Gymru a hefyd i adeiladu eu tai at safon uchel. Bu peth trafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar y modd y gallwn ddylanwadu ar reoliadau adeiladu. Maent yn gyfrifoldeb i Lywodraeth y DU o hyd, ond hoffem gymryd y mater hwn i ystyriaeth yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Ceir llawer o gynlluniau i helpu pobl i symud o lety rhent i lety perchennog preswyl, gan gynnwys y cynlluniau hawl i brynu a hawl i gael meddiant yng nghyd-destun tai cymdeithasol, y cynllun prynu cartref, sy'n berthnasol i ardaloedd trefol i'r un graddau ag ardaloedd gwledig, a llawer o gynlluniau eraill sy'n gallu helpu pobl sydd yn y sefyllfa honno. Os oes unrhyw gynlluniau eraill yr ydych am eu dwyn i'n sylw, byddwn yn eu hystyried ac yn eu derbyn os gallwn.

On home energy efficiency, which I mentioned in my response to Brian, fuel poverty affects far too many people in Wales—possibly as many as 250,000 families. By improving the energy efficiency of their homes, we can reduce the costs of heating and ensure that vulnerable people can afford to heat their houses to an acceptable standard. Our home energy efficiency scheme has already made considerable inroads into tackling this problem in its 18 months in operation. We are now spending £11 million a year on this important programme.

Domestic fires have a devastating impact on people's lives. If you live in a house in multiple occupation, you are 15 times more likely to die in a fire, and you are five times more likely to die in a fire if you live in social housing. These are stark statistics. That is why we have been working closely with the Welsh fire services to produce a programme to provide hard-wired smoke detectors and a series of other measures in social housing to reduce this terrible death toll. This year, we are providing over £2 million to support social landlords to install protective appliances.

Care and repair agencies are now operating throughout Wales to help older people to continue to live in their own homes. We have provided a new funding regime to ensure that the agencies have a firm financial footing and we are considering ways in which the role of care and repair can be expanded in order to maximise the impact of the provision of support for those who are most vulnerable.

No response by me to this debate would be complete without a reference to what we have done to tackle homelessness and rough sleeping in Wales. Janet referred to that in her speech. In 1999, funding for homelessness was a mere £650,000. This year we will be spending £4.6 million, an 800 per cent increase. However, it is not just about money. We have created a raft of policies to tackle this comprehensively and strategically across the country. We have used our secondary legislative powers to extend the categories of homeless people to

Ynghylch effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, a grybwyllais yn fy ymateb i Brian, mae tlodi tanwydd yn effeithio ar ormod o lawer o bobl yng Nghymru—cynifer â 250,000 o deuluoedd o bosibl. Drwy wella effeithlonrwydd ynni eu cartrefi, gallwn leihau costau gwresogi a sicrhau bod rhai sy'n agored i niwed yn gallu fforddio gwresogi eu tai at safon dderbyniol. Mae ein cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref wedi cael cryn effaith eisoes wrth drin y broblem hon yn ystod y 18 mis o'i weithrediad. Yr ydym bellach yn gwario £11 miliwn y flwyddyn ar y rhaglen bwysig hon.

Mae tanau yn y cartref yn cael effaith ddinistriol ar fywydau pobl. Os ydych yn byw mewn tŷ amlfeddiant, yr ydych yn 15 gwaith yn fwy tebygol o farw mewn tân, ac yr ydych yn bum gwaith yn fwy tebygol o farw mewn tân os ydych yn byw mewn tai cymdeithasol. Ystadegau noeth yw'r rheini. Dyna pam y buom yn cydweithio'n agos â gwasanaethau tân Cymru i gynhyrchu rhaglen i ddarparu canfodyddion mwg gwifredig a chyfres o fesurau eraill mewn tai cymdeithasol i leihau'r nifer arswydus o farwolaethau. Eleni, yr ydym yn darparu dros £2 filiwn i roi cymorth i landlordiaid cymdeithasol osod cyfarpar diogelu.

Mae asiantaethau gofal a thrwsio'n gweithredu ledled Cymru'n awr i gynorthwyo pobl hŷn i barhau i fyw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Yr ydym wedi darparu cyfundrefn ariannu newydd i sicrhau sylfaen gyllidol gadarn i'r asiantaethau ac yr ydym yn ystyried dulliau o ehangu rôl gofal a thrwsio er mwyn amlhau effaith y ddarpariaeth o gymorth i'r rhai sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed.

Ni fyddai unrhyw ymateb gennyf i'r ddadl hon yn gyflawn heb gyfeirio at yr hyn a wnaethom i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd a chysgu allan yng Nghymru. Cyfeiriodd Janet at hynny yn ei haraith. Yn 1999, dim ond £650,000 o gyllid a oedd ar gael ar gyfer digartrefedd. Eleni byddwn yn gwario £4.6 miliwn, sy'n gynydd o 800 y cant. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymwneud â mwy nag arian. Yr ydym wedi creu llu o bolisiau i fynd i'r afael â hyn yn gynhwysfawr ac yn strategol ledled y wlad. Yr ydym wedi defnyddio ein pwerau deddfwriaeth eilaidd i ymestyn y

whom local authorities must give priority. We were the first administration to do that and, as a consequence, we are now providing for vulnerable people, such as 16 and 17-year-olds who would have faced unacceptable options resulting in many of them living on the streets. As part of that strategy, we are now starting to roll out local homelessness strategies and encouraging local councils to take them on board, as they know best what needs to be done to deal with homelessness in their areas.

Poor quality housing can have a profoundly negative effect on people's wellbeing. Good housing can be a major influence in improving health and education standards. Achieving our vision, which I set out at the beginning of my reply, will provide this influence. We have made good progress in the last three years and have created a platform to support organisations and communities to tackle these issues at a local level. We cannot afford to be complacent, as there is still a long way to go. However, we have already demonstrated the priority that we attach to ensuring that our vision is not just empty words. As the years go by and as the Assembly starts to develop that vision, I hope that we will address the concerns that Janet raised in her speech and ensure that the people whom she described as living in appalling housing conditions 20 years ago, and who still do today possibly, no longer have to live in such conditions. That is our vision for Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

categoriâu o bobl ddigartref y mae'n rhaid i'r awdurdodau lleol roi blaenoriaeth iddynt. Ni oedd y weinyddiaeth gyntaf i wneud hynny ac, o ganlyniad, yr ydym bellach yn darparu ar gyfer pobl sy'n agored i niwed, fel rhai 16 a 17 mlwydd oed a fyddai wedi wynebu dewisiadau annerbyniol fel y byddai llawer ohonynt yn byw ar y strydoedd. Fel rhan o'r strategaeth honno, yr ydym bellach yn dechrau datblygu strategaethau digartrefedd lleol ac annog y cynghorau lleol i ymgymryd â hwy, gan mai hwy a wŷr orau beth y mae angen ei wneud i ddelio â digartrefedd yn eu hardaloedd.

Gall tai o ansawdd gwael gael effaith andwyol iawn ar les pobl. Gall tai da fod yn ddylanwad o bwys ar wella safonau iechyd ac addysg. Ceir y dylanwad hwn drwy wireddu ein gweledigaeth, a nodais ar ddechrau fy ymateb. Gwnaethom gynnydd da yn y tair blynedd diwethaf a chreu llwyfan i gynorthwyo cyrff a chymunedau i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yn lleol. Ni allwn fforddio bod yn ddifater, gan fod llawer i'w gyflawni o hyd. Er hynny, yr ydym eisoes wedi dangos y pwys a roddwn ar sicrhau nad geiriau gwag yw ein gweledigaeth. Wrth i'r blynyddoedd fynd heibio ac wrth i'r Cynulliad ddechrau datblygu'r weledigaeth honno, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn ymdrin â'r pryderon a gododd Janet yn ei haraith ac yn sicrhau nad yw'r rhai a ddisgrifiodd a oedd yn byw mewn amodau tai gwarthus 20 mlynedd yn ôl, ac sy'n dal i fyw felly heddiw o bosibl, yn gorfod byw dan amodau o'r fath o hyn allan. Dyna ein gweledigaeth i Gymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.18 p.m.  
The session ended at 12.18 p.m.*