



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 22 Tachwedd 2006  
Wednesday, 22 November 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol  
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 26 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon  
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport
- 43 Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ  
Questions to the House Committee
- 43 Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig  
Revised Business Statement
- 45 Datganiad am Ddyfodol Alcoa yn Abertawe  
Statement on the Future of Alcoa in Swansea
- 56 Datganiad am Farwolaethau o Ganlyniad i Wenwyno Carbon Monocsid  
Statement on Deaths as a Result of Carbon Monoxide Poisoning
- Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifio Bwyd Cychwyn Iach)  
(Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales)  
Regulations 2006
- 74 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf y Loteri Genedlaethol 2006 i'r Prif  
Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions under the National Lottery Act 2006 to the First Minister
- 77 Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru  
Annual Report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales
- 85 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 86 Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru: Parhad  
Annual Report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales: Continued
- 99 Adroddiad Blynyddol 2005-06 Comisiynydd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru 2005-06  
Annual Report of the Health Service Commissioner for Wales
- 100 Dadl Fer: Plant yng Nghymru—Cânt eu Gweld, ond a Gânt eu Clywed?  
Short Debate: Children in Wales—Seen, But Are they Heard?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Cau Cartrefi Gofal Preswyl Cyngorau The Closure of Council-run Residential Care Homes**

**Q1 Trish Law:** Is it Welsh Assembly Government policy to move towards the closure of council-run residential care homes for older people? OAQ1114(HSS)

**C1 Trish Law:** A yw'n bolisi gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru symud tuag at gau cartrefi gofal preswyl y cyngorau ar gyfer pobl hŷn? OAQ1114(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** No, our policy is to ensure that there is a range of modern facilities to meet the needs of older people, and to provide good standards of care that are consistent with those expected in the twenty-first century. The precise mix between different types of provision is for local authorities to determine.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Nac ydyw, ein polisi yw sicrhau bod amrywiaeth o gyfleusterau modern ar gael i ddiwallu anghenion pobl hŷn, a darparu safonau da o ofal sy'n gyson â'r safonau a ddisgwylir yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu ar y gymysgedd benodol o wahanol fathau o ddarpariaeth.

**Trish Law:** I am grateful for that reply. As you are aware, there is considerable concern in my constituency about the proposed closure of four council-run residential care homes. Are you aware that, over the past year or so, there has been a marked increase in the demand for care-home places, which only the private sector can meet if all council-managed homes are closed?

**Trish Law:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb hwnnw. Fel y gwyddoch, mae cryn bryder yn fy etholaeth i ynglŷn â'r cynnig arfaethedig i gau pedwar cartref gofal preswyl y cyngor. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod cynnydd sylweddol yn y galw am leoedd mewn cartrefi gofal yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a dim ond y sector preifat a all ateb y galw hwnnw os caiff holl gartrefi'r cyngor eu cau?

**Brian Gibbons:** My understanding is certainly not that the proposals in Blaenau Gwent are to close all facilities and put nothing else in their place; my understanding is that the local authority is proposing an innovative range of new services in the wake of the consultation that, I think, has just ended. One of the big challenges for the local authority is for it to respond to the needs of the majority of people, so that, wherever possible, they are treated in their own homes and communities.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol mai'r cynigion ym Mlaenau Gwent yw cau pob cyfleuster a pheidio â rhoi dim yn eu lle; deallaf fod yr awdurdod lleol yn cynnig amrywiaeth arloesol o wasanaethau newydd yng ngoleuni'r ymgynghori a ddaeth i ben yn ddiweddar, mi gredaf. Un o'r heriau mawr i'r awdurdod lleol yw ymateb i anghenion y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl, fel y cânt eu trin yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau eu hunain, ble bynnag y mae'n bosibl.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weiniidog, derbynïaf yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, a chroesawn mesurau i addasu ar gyfer anghenion y gymdeithas. Mae gennym boblogaeth sy'n

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, I accept what you are saying, and we welcome measures taken to adapt to the needs of society. We have an ageing population, but it

heneiddio ond sy'n fwy annibynnol nag erioed, ac, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae ymgais gwirioneddol i ymateb i hynny. Yn Llanybydder, mae bwriad i greu uned a fydd yn galluogi pobl i fyw yn annibynnol ond gyda rhyw elfen o warchodaeth. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i groesawu penderfyniad Cyngor Sir Gâr i gadw cartref preswyl Annedd ar agor hyd nes i'r uned newydd gael ei hagog? Y bwriad yw defnyddio Annedd i sicrhau bod gofal seibiant ar gael i ofalwyr, sydd yn gwneud gwasanaeth mor bwysig yn ein cymdeithas.

**Brian Gibbons:** If people are to be allowed to stay in their own homes and communities, with their families, respite care is a key part of that package. Therefore, the fact that respite provision has been made available is to be welcomed. The general principle is a good one: that is, wherever possible, facilities should continue to operate until new arrangements are put in place. However, in some situations, that is not possible, either because of the location of the facilities or because, sometimes, the facilities that are in place need to release resources in order to allow the change to take place. Everything being equal, dual running is a better way to proceed, if it is deliverable.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Minister will be aware—or should be—that Cardiff local authority is considering changing the use of one of its homes. The Iorwerth Jones Home in Llanishen is currently being used as a residential home by the local authority, but it is considering transferring it to the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust so that it can increase its places for the elderly mentally ill. While there is a need to increase places for the elderly mentally ill, do you share my concern that that is being done at the expense of valuable care-home beds, which are much needed across the city, and are falling in number across Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** Contrary to your opening remark, I do not regard it as my responsibility to be involved in the day-to-day running of local authorities. Authorities and their social services departments have their own accountabilities, and primary responsibility should rest with them. However, you are

is also more independent than ever before, and, in Carmarthenshire, there is a genuine attempt to respond to that. In Llanybydder, the creation of a unit that will enable people to live independently, while also affording them some element of protection, is proposed. Will you join me in welcoming a decision by Carmarthenshire County Council to keep Annedd residential home open until the new unit is opened? The intention is to use Annedd to ensure that respite care is available for carers, who perform such an important service in our society.

**Brian Gibbons:** Os yw pobl i gael aros yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau, gyda'u teuluoedd, mae gofal seibiant yn rhan allweddol o'r pecyn hwnnw. Felly, mae'r ffaith fod darpariaeth gofal seibiant ar gael i'w chrosawu. Mae'r egwyddor gyffredinol yn un dda: hynny yw, ble bynnag y mae modd, dylai cyfleusterau barhau ar waith nes rhoi trefniadau newydd ar waith. Fodd bynnag, mewn rhai sefyllfaoedd nid yw hynny'n bosibl, naill ai oherwydd lleoliad y cyfleusterau neu oherwydd, weithiau, fod angen i'r cyfleusterau sydd ar waith ryddhau adnoddau er mwyn i'r newid allu digwydd. At ei gilydd, mae gweithredu deuol yn ffordd well o fynd ati, os oes modd gwneud hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Gŵyr y Gweinidog—neu dylai wybod—fod awdurdod lleol Caerdydd yn ystyried newid defnydd un o'i gartrefi. Mae Cartref Iorwerth Jones yn Llanisien yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel cartref preswyl gan yr awdurdod lleol ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'n ystyried ei drosglwyddo i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro fel y gall gynyddu nifer ei leoliadau ar gyfer yr henoed sy'n fregus eu meddwl. Er bod angen cynyddu nifer y lleoedd ar gyfer yr henoed sy'n fregus eu meddwl, a ydych chi fel finnau'n pryderu y gwneir hynny ar draul gwelyau cartref gofal gwerthfawr, y mae eu hangen yn ddirfawr ledled y ddinas, ac sy'n lleihau mewn niferoedd ledled Cymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn groes i'ch sylw agoriadol, nid wyf yn ystyried fi sy'n gyfrifol am reoli awdurdodau lleol o ddydd i ddydd. Mae awdurdodau ac adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn atebol am eu materion eu hunain, a'u cyfrifoldeb hwy yw hyn yn bennaf. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn iawn mai

right that one area in which there is a particular weakness is the provision for elderly mentally ill patients. It is one of the great shortages that we need to address as a priority. As an Assembly Government, we are working constructively with Cardiff council, but primary responsibility must lie with the authority. It is not my job to second-guess the decisions being made locally.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I accept that it is not your job to second-guess what local authorities are doing, but you have accepted that there is a weakness in EMI capacity. Do you further accept that another weakness is the shortage of beds in Wales? We have lost countless numbers of care-home beds since 1999, and we have lost countless numbers of care homes in general. There is also a shortage of domiciliary care, which contributes significantly to bedblocking. Do you and your Assembly Government colleagues at least accept some responsibility for that?

**Brian Gibbons:** I certainly think that there is a problem in Cardiff, in particular, in relation to some residential provision. The reasons for that have been fairly well rehearsed over the years. Having said that, my understanding is that Cardiff social services department is looking forward to new residential provision coming on-stream in the next year or two. Some of the concerns that you raise will be addressed in that way. Equally, the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales report indicated a slightly different message to the one that you are conveying. It pointed out that the fall in the number of beds over the last year was just 2 per cent, and that the number of applicants was at least double that. Therefore, I think that the picture is slightly more optimistic than the one that you wish to portray.

**Jenny Randerson:** You are aware, I am sure, of problems in Cardiff, the Vale of Glamorgan, Flintshire and many other local authority areas, with the funding of adult social care. The CSIW acting chief inspector is on record as saying that most, if not all, councils in Wales are spending more on adult social services than is allocated under their

un maes lle y mae gwendid penodol yw'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer yr henoed sy'n fregus eu meddwl. Mae'n un o'r prinderau mawr y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy fel blaenoriaeth. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn gweithio'n adeiladol gyda chynghor Caerdydd, ond yr awdurdod sydd â'r prif gyfrifoldeb. Nid fy ngwaith i yw rhagweld beth yw'r penderfyniadau a wneir yn lleol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Derbyniaf nad eich gwaith chi yw rhagweld beth y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei wneud, ond yr ydych wedi derbyn bod gwendid yn y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer yr henoedd sy'n fregus eu meddwl. A ydych yn derbyn mai gwendid arall yw prinder gwelyau yng Nghymru? Yr ydym wedi colli nifer fawr o welyau cartrefi gofal er 1999, ac yr ydym wedi colli nifer fawr o gartrefi gofal yn gyffredinol. Mae yn brinder gofal cartref hefyd, sy'n cyfrannu'n sylweddol at flocio gwelyau. A ydych chi a'ch cyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o leiaf yn derbyn rhywfaint o gyfrifoldeb am hynny?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn sicr yn credu bod problem yng Nghaerdydd, yn benodol, gyd rhywfaint o'r ddarpariaeth breswyl. Mae'r rhesymau am hynny wedi eu nodi'n aml dros y blynyddoedd. Wedi dweud hynny, deallaf fod adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Caerdydd yn edrych ymlaen at roi darpariaeth breswyl newydd ar waith yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf. Eir i'r afael â rhai o'r pryderon a godwyd gennych fel hynny. Yn yr un modd, yr oedd gan adroddiad Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru neges ychydig yn wahanol i'r hyn yr ydych chi'n ei chyfleu. Dywedai mai 2 y cant yn unig y gostyngiad yn nifer y gwelyau yn ystod y flwyddyn diwethaf a nifer yr ymgeiswyr o leiaf ddwywaith hynny. Felly, credaf fod y darlun ychydig yn fwy optimistaidd nag yr ydych am ei bortredu.

**Jenny Randerson:** Fe wyddoch, mae'n siŵr, am broblemau Caerdydd, Bro Morgannwg, sir y Fflint a sawl ardal awdurdod lleol arall, gydag ariannu gofal cymdeithasol i oedolion. Cofnodwyd bod prif arolygydd dros dro ASGC wedi dweud bod y rhan fwyaf o gynghorau Cymru, os nad pob un, yn gwario mwy ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion

standard spending assessment. What do you intend to do about this deplorable situation, whereby the Government is short-changing local authorities and not recognising the extent of their responsibilities? While we all support your desire to get people out of hospital and back into the community as soon as possible, do you not recognise that you are putting local authorities in an impossible position given the additional strain that this puts on their budgets?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would not use the word 'short-changing', because, if we look at the Assembly Government allocation for social services over the last four or five years, it has gone up by 80 per cent. That may slightly overstate the position, as it includes the transfer of some previously hypothecated money, but the increase is 80 per cent. Indeed, spending on social services has increased by over 50 per cent in recent years. In addition to the general uplift to local government this year of 5.1 per cent, we as an Assembly Government provided an additional £45 million for adult social services. Therefore, to make an accusation that this is short-changing is to overstate the case. We know, from CSIW, that one reason why local authorities are in this difficulty is because of the case mix that they have available to them, and the case mix of the provision that they are putting in place. In many instances, the provision made is the most expensive, but is not, necessarily, the best provision for the patient. Therefore, patients, or service users, are losing out twice: they are getting an expensive service that is not the best service.

**Jenny Randerson:** You have said that the amount of money given has gone up by 80 per cent, but one local authority has reported to the Welsh Local Government Association that the number of adult care packages that it had went up, in one year, from 40 to 114. That is a great deal more than 80 per cent—that is 300 per cent, according to my quick calculation. That is complicated by the fact that the WLGA toolkit produces a figure for nursing and care home fees that is in excess of that which is currently allowed for. Do you

nag a ddyrennir iddynt o dan eu hasesiad safonol o wariant. Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud am y sefyllfa warthus hon, lle mae'r Llywodraeth yn methu â rhoi digon o gyllid i awdurdodau lleol ac yn methu â chydabod faint o gyfrifoldeb sydd arnynt? Er ein bod i gyd yn cefnogi eich awydd i gael pobl allan o ysbytai ac yn ôl i'r gymuned cyn gynted â phosibl, oni chydabyddwch eich bod yn rhoi awdurdodau lleol mewn sefyllfa amhosibl o ystyried y straen ychwanegol y mae hyn yn ei roi ar eu cyllidebau?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni fyddwn yn defnyddio'r geiriau hynny, oherwydd, os edrychwn ar ddyraniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn ystod y pedair neu'r pum mlynedd diwethaf, mae wedi cynyddu 80 y cant. Efallai fy mod yn gorddweud ychydig, gan ei fod yn cynnwys trosglwyddo rhywfaint o arian a neilltuwyd gynt, ond bydd cynnydd o 80 y cant. Yn wir, mae'r gwariant ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi cynyddu dros 50 y cant yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yn ogystal â'r cynnydd cyffredinol i lywodraeth leol eleni o 5.1 y cant, yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi darparu £45 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion. Felly, mae'r cyhuddiad na roddwyd digon o gyllid yn gorddweud. Gwyddom, wrth ASGC, mai un rheswm pam mae awdurdodau lleol yn cael yr anhawster hwn yw'r cymysgedd achosion sydd ar gael iddynt, a chymysgedd y ddarpariaeth y maent yn ei rhoi ar waith. Mewn nifer o enghreifftiau, y ddarpariaeth a wneir yw'r ddrutaf, ond nid y ddarpariaeth orau i'r claf o reidrwydd. Felly, mae cleifion, neu ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau ar eu colled ddwywaith: maent yn cael gwasanaeth drud nad yw'n cynnig y gwasanaeth gorau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr oeddech yn dweud bod swm yr arian a roddwyd wedi cynyddu 80 y cant, ond mae un awdurdod lleol wedi dweud wrth Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru fod nifer y pecynnau gofal i oedolion a oedd ganddo mewn un flwyddyn wedi codi o 40 i 114. Mae hynny gryn dipyn yn fwy nag 80 y cant—mae hynny'n 300 y cant, yn ôl fy nghyfrifiad cyflym i. Caiff hynny ei gymhlethu gan y ffaith fod pecyn cymorth CLILC yn rhoi ffigur ar gyfer ffioedd nyrsio a chartrefi gofal sydd lawer yn fwy nag a

not recognise that it is time to look again at the adult social care budget?

ganiateir ar hyn o bryd. Oni chydabyddwch ei bod yn bryd ailystyried y gyllideb gofal cymdeithasol i oedolion?

2.10 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** That is why we have already given an undertaking—unanimously agreed by the Assembly two weeks ago—to carry out a precise review along these lines, particularly in relation to delayed transfers of care. These discussions with my officials are at an advanced stage, and, within the next week to 10 days, I will, hopefully, be able to bring proposals to the opposition spokespeople on what we are offering to address the resolution made by Plenary. I will also be discussing the proposals with the Welsh Local Government Association and the National Health Service Confederation in Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** Dyna pam yr ydym wedi addo eisoes—cytunwyd ar hyn yn unfrydol gan y Cynulliad bythefnos yn ôl—cynnal adolygiad manwl o'r fath, yn enwedig mewn perthynas ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Mae'r trafodaethau hyn gyda'm swyddogion yn mynd rhagddynt yn dda, ac yn ystod yr wythnos neu'r 10 diwrnod nesaf gobeithio y gallaf gyflwyno cynigion gerbron llefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau am yr yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gynnig i fynd i'r afael â'r penderfyniad a wnaed gan y Cyfarfod Llawn. Byddaf hefyd yn trafod y cynigion gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chyddfederasiwn y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol yng Nghymru.

#### **Cleifion Orthopaedig (Dwyrain De Cymru) Orthopaedic Patients (South Wales East)**

**Q2 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of treatment for orthopaedic patients in South Wales East? OAQ1086(HSS)

**C2 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu triniaeth ar gyfer cleifion orthopaedig yn Nwyrain De Cymru? OAQ1086(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The new orthopaedic unit at St Woolos hospital opened in May 2006. It is forecast to carry out 2,000 additional operations and to provide 5,000 additional out-patient appointments each year. This unit, combined with increased Assembly investment and the hard work of NHS staff, will help to achieve our goal of further reducing waiting times in Gwent.

**Brian Gibbons:** Agorodd uned orthopaedig newydd yn ysbyty Gwynlliw ym mis Mai 2006. Rhagwelir y bydd yn rhoi 2,000 o lawdriniaethau ychwanegol ac yn darparu 5,000 o apwyntiadau ychwanegol i gleifion allanol bob blwyddyn. Bydd yr uned hon, ynghyd â chynnydd ym muddsoddiad y Cynulliad a gwaith caled staff y GIG, yn ein helpu i gyrraedd ein nod o leihau amseroedd aros ymhellach yng Ngwent.

**William Graham:** Everyone welcomes that successful facility at St Woolos hospital. However, its funding contributes towards the huge deficit of the NHS in Wales. Will you follow the example of your opposite number in Westminster, who has indicated that she will resign if the NHS in England does not break even, financially, by March? Will you consider doing the same in Wales by March, or will you wait for the voters to get rid of you in May?

**William Graham:** Mae pawb yn croesawu'r cyfleuster llwyddiannus hwnnw yn ysbyty Gwynlliw. Fodd bynnag, mae ei gyllid yn cyfrannu at ddiffyg ariannol sylweddol y GIG yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi ddilyn esiampl eich cyd-weinidog yn San Steffan, sydd wedi dweud y bydd yn ymddiswyddo os na fydd y GIG yn Lloegr yn mantoli'r gyllideb erbyn mis Mawrth? A wnewch chi ystyried gwneud yr un peth yng Nghymru erbyn mis Mawrth, neu a fyddwch yn aros i bleidleiswyr gael gwared arnoch ym mis Mai?

**Brian Gibbons:** I certainly will not be

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr, ni fyddaf yn

resigning because of changes in England, William.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you share the relief felt by many of my constituents regarding the defeat of the amendment last week, which would have brought a halt to reconfiguration plans, including the plans for orthopaedic treatment, and which would have possibly delayed the new hospital for the mid Rhymney valley?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. It was an extraordinary resolution, when we are seeing record investment in new hospitals and facilities, which the people of Wales have waited so long for. For anyone to say that the best way forward is to stop that and put it back six or nine months until after the election in May is extraordinary. I also wish to congratulate Caerphilly Local Health Board on the imaginative approach that it is taking to addressing orthopaedic waiting time lists, with the use of consultant physiotherapists, working in partnership with the Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust. It is one of the most innovative schemes that I have had an opportunity to visit—I visited it around 12 months ago. It is this type of scheme, which is modernising the NHS, that is the way forward, rather than calling the process to a halt or even attempting to put it into reverse, which is what we saw last week.

ymddiswyddo oherwydd newidiadau yn Lloegr, William.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych chi, fel nifer o'm hetholwyr i, yn teimlo rhyddhad fod y gwelliant wedi ei wrthod yr wythnos diwethaf a fyddai wedi atal cynlluniau i ailgyflunio, gan gynnwys y cynlluniau ar gyfer triniaeth orthopaedig, ac a fyddai efallai wedi peri oedi cyn agor yr ysbyty newydd ar gyfer canol cwm Rhymni?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ydwyf. Yr oedd yn gynnig rhyfedd, a ninnau'n gweld y buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed mewn ysbytai a chyfleusterau newydd y mae pobl Cymru wedi aros cyhyd amdanynt. Byddai'n rhyfedd pe bai unrhyw un yn dweud mai'r ffordd orau ymlaen yw rhoi'r gorau iddi a gohirio'r gwaith am chwe neu naw mis tan ar ôl yr etholiad ym mis Mai. Hoffwn longyfarch Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili hefyd am y ffordd ddychmygus y mae'n mynd i'r afael â rhestrau amseroedd aros, gan ddefnyddio ffisiotherapyddion ymgynghorol yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent. Mae'n un o'r cynlluniau mwyaf arloesol yr wyf wedi cael cyfle i ymweld â hwy—ymwelais ag ef tua 12 mis yn ôl. Y math hwn o gynllun, sy'n moderneiddio'r GIG, yw'r ffordd ymlaen, yn hytrach na gohirio'r broses neu hyd yn oed ceisio'i wrthdroi, sef yr hyn a welsom yr wythnos diwethaf.

### Dyfodol Niwrolawfeddygaeth i Oedolion The Future of Adult Neurosurgery

**Q3 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of adult neurosurgery in south Wales? OAQ1087(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** I have asked Health Commission Wales to consider its proposal for the future of neurosciences in south Wales in the light of new issues that have arisen during the consultation. The consultation demonstrated that there is widespread recognition of the need for a single neuroscience centre in south Wales. That is an important step forward that the consultation process established.

**Peter Black:** When you referred this issue back to Health Commission Wales, you

**C3 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol niwrolawfeddygaeth i oedolion yn ne Cymru? OAQ1087(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf wedi gofyn i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ystyried ei gynnig ar gyfer dyfodol niwrowyddorau yn y de yng ngoleuni'r materion newydd a gododd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad. Yr oedd yr ymgynghoriad yn dangos bod cydnabyddiaeth eang i'r angen am gael un ganolfan niwrowyddorau yn y de. Mae hynny'n gam pwysig ymlaen sydd wedi ei gadarnhau gan yr ymgynghoriad.

**Peter Black:** Wrth gyfeirio'r mater hwn yn ôl i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, gofynasoch



asked it to consider a number of issues. Nowhere in that list of issues was a reference to the fact that Morriston Hospital is a major trauma centre with specific facilities for burns treatment, plastic surgery, spinal operations and so on. Would you add that to the list of issues that you could ask Health Commission Wales to consider as part of this review?

**Brian Gibbons:** You are quite right to say that that was not included in the detail of the letter, but, in a number of media interviews that I did on the back of writing the letter, I made it clear that that was an important consideration. I also referred to that in my speech last week.

**Val Lloyd:** Last week's coverage in this Chamber showed the strength of feeling on this subject. In your answer to the previous question, you dealt with what you said that day. However, can you tell me, a week on, whether you have anything further to add to your public comments in that debate?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am arranging to meet the chief executive and chair of Health Commission Wales to discuss how we will move forward the proposals that can be moved forward at this juncture. Clearly, one of the most important elements of that set of proposals is the future of paediatric services. I do not think that it will be possible to make deliberations on that until we get the outcome of the review of specialist children's services in south Wales. As I pointed out last week, that will probably not be available until mid spring next year. That is an important part of the overall jigsaw, and trying to reach a conclusion without that information being available to us would be ill advised and probably would not result in the best outcome for patients or children, particularly if there were a risk that children from Pembrokeshire or Ceredigion could end up travelling to Bristol or Birmingham for their care.

**David Lloyd:** The management of major trauma is the big issue, as Peter Black mentioned. At the moment, Morriston Hospital is the only level 1 major trauma

ofyn iddo ystyried nifer o faterion. Nid oes yr un cyfeiriad yn y rhestr honno o faterion at y ffaith bod Ysbyty Treforys yn ganolfan trawma fawr sydd â chyfleusterau penodol ar gyfer trin llosgiadau, llawdriniaeth blastig, llawdriniaeth yr asgwrn cefn, ac ati. Hoffech ychwanegu hynny at y rhestr o faterion y gallech ofyn i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru eu hystyried fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud na chynhwyswyd hynny yn y llythyr. Ond mewn nifer o gyfweiliadau a gefais gyda'r cyfryngau ar ôl ysgrifennu'r llythyr, dywedais yn glir fod hynny'n fater pwysig i'w ystyried. Cyfeiriais at hynny hefyd yn fy araith yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr oedd trafodaeth yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Siambr yn dangos y teimladau cryf ar y mater hwn. Yn eich ateb i'r cwestiwn blaenorol, yr oeddech yn ymdrin â'r hyn a ddywedwyd gennych y diwrnod hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, a allwch ddweud wrthyf, wythnos yn ddiweddarach, a oes gennych unrhyw beth arall i'w ychwanegu at eich sylwadau cyhoeddus am y drafodaeth honno?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn trefnu cyfarfod â phrif weithredwr a chadeirydd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru i drafod sut y byddwn yn symud ymlaen gyda'r cynigion y gellir gweithredu arnynt ar hyn o bryd. Yn amlwg, un o'r elfennau pwysicaf yn y gyfres honno o gynigion yw dyfodol gwasanaethau pediatrig. Ni chredaf y bydd yn bosibl ystyried hynny nes inni gael canlyniad yr adolygiad o wasanaethau arbenigol i blant yn y de. Fel y soniais yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'n debygol na fydd hwnnw ar gael tan ganol y gwanwyn y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hwnnw'n rhan bwysig o'r jig-so cyffredinol, a byddai ceisio dod i gasgliad heb fod y wybodaeth honno ar gael inni yn annoeth. Mae'n debyg na fyddai hynny, ychwaith, yn arwain at y canlyniad gorau i gleifion na phlant, yn enwedig os byddai risg y gallai fod angen i blant o sir Benfro neu Geredigion deithio i Fryste neu Birmingham i gael gofal yn y pen draw.

**David Lloyd:** Rheoli trawma mawr yw'r brif broblem, fel y soniodd Peter Black. Ar hyn o bryd, Ysbyty Treforys yw'r unig ganolfan trawma mawr lefel 1 yng Nghymru,

centre in Wales, courtesy of the co-location of neurosurgery, a burns unit and plastic surgery at the same site. If neurosurgery is lost from that site, that designation will be lost to Wales, as Cardiff does not have a burns unit or plastic surgery. In view of that, what is your strategy for retaining a level 1 major trauma centre in Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** One issue that came up in the consultation was that the original proposals from HCW made the assertion, based on experience in England, that it is possible to maintain major trauma centres without neurosurgical services. I am aware that this was contested during the consultation, particularly by clinicians from Swansea. In order to make a sufficiently well-informed decision on this, we need to clarify, once and for all, whether or not, as was originally asserted in the HCW document, it is possible to maintain a high-level major trauma centre in places such as Swansea, and how crucial neurosurgery is to that. That was an issue that the consultation process did not clarify, and it needs to be clarified if we are to make an informed decision on the best future for neurosurgical services.

**Alun Cairns:** In the debate last week you mentioned that the proposal to close the paediatric neurosurgery unit in Morriston Hospital and transfer it to Cardiff was not a decision that you, as Minister, took here. However, would you accept that you would have had to have supported that decision in order for it to go ahead? In light of those events—and we may well disagree about the sequence of events and the ultimate decision—and as a result of the circumstances surrounding that decision, do you not accept that there is likely to be scepticism about the proposed postponement of the decision until after the next Assembly elections?

**Brian Gibbons:** That will only happen if people try to rewrite history and do not accurately recall the sequence of events that led to the ending of paediatric neurosurgery in Swansea. If people want to continue to

oherwydd bod niwrolawdriniaeth, uned llosgiadau a llawfeddygaeth blastig ar yr un safle. Os caiff niwrolawdriniaeth ei symud o'r safle hwnnw, caiff y dynodiad hwnnw ei golli yng Nghymru, gan nad oes gan Gaerdydd uned llosgiadau na llawfeddygaeth blastig. O ystyried hynny, beth yw eich strategaeth ar gyfer cadw canolfan trawma mawr lefel 1 yng Nghymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** Un mater a gododd yn y broses ymgynghori oedd bod cynigion gwreiddiol Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn tybio, ar sail yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn Lloegr, ei bod yn bosibl cynnal canolfannau trawma mawr heb wasanaethau niwrolawdriniaeth. Gwn fod hyn wedi ei herio yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad, yn enwedig gan glinigwyr o Abertawe. Er mwyn gwneud penderfyniad digon goleuedig am hyn, mae angen inni egluro, unwaith ac am byth, a yw'n bosibl, fel y dywedwyd yn wreiddiol yn nogfen Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, i gynnal canolfan trawma mawr lefel uchel mewn lleoedd fel Abertawe, a pha mor hanfodol yw niwrolawdriniaeth i hynny. Yr oedd hwnnw'n fater nad eglurwyd yn y broses ymgynghori, ac mae angen inni gael eglurhad os ydym am wneud penderfyniad goleuedig am y dyfodol gorau i wasanaethau niwrolawdriniaeth.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn y ddadl yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddech yn sôn nad oedd y cynnig i gau'r uned niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn Ysbyty Treforys a'i throsglwyddo i Gaerdydd yn benderfyniad a wnaed gennych chi, fel Gweinidog, yma. Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch y byddai'n rhaid eich bod wedi cefnogi'r penderfyniad hwnnw er mwyn iddo fynd rhagddo? Yn sgîl y digwyddiadau hynny—ac mae'n bosibl yr anghytunwn ar y dilyniant digwyddiadau a'r penderfyniad yn y pen draw—ac o ganlyniad i amgylchiadau'r penderfyniad hwnnw, oni dderbyniwch ei bod yn debygol y bydd amheuaeth ynghylch y bwriad arfaethedig i ohirio'r penderfyniad tan ar ôl etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad?

**Brian Gibbons:** Dim ond os bydd pobl yn ceisio ailysgrifennu hanes ac yn methu â chofio'n gywir y gyfres o ddigwyddiadau a arweiniodd at derfynu gwasanaethau niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn Abertawe y

portray the sequence of events inaccurately, then that will lead to confusion, but the decision of the Assembly Government was to support the continuation of paediatric neurosurgery in Swansea. That subsequent events prevented that was not to do with a decision of the Assembly Government.

bydd hynny'n digwydd. Os yw pobl am barhau i bortreadu dilyniant y digwyddiadau'n anghywir, yna bydd hynny'n arwain at ddryswch. Ond penderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad oedd cefnogi parhad niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn Abertawe. Nid oedd a wnelo'r ffaith fod digwyddiadau dilynol wedi rhwystro hynny ddim oll i'w wneud â phenderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

### Gwasanaethau Ysbytai ym Mhowys Hospital Services in Powys

**Q4 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister make a statement on Powys Local Health Board's proposals to reconfigure hospital services in Powys? OAQ1118(HSS)

**C4 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynigion Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys i ad-drefnu gwasanaethau ysbytai ym Mhowys? OAQ1118(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Powys Local Health Board has consulted on 'Doing More, Doing Better', a strategy for guiding the development of services in Powys. It will now work with a range of statutory and voluntary parties to produce fuller proposals for the future pattern of hospital and community services.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys wedi ymgynghori ar 'Gwneud Mwy, Gwneud yn Well', sef strategaeth ar gyfer llywio datblygu gwasanaethau ym Mhowys. Bydd yn gweithio yn awr gydag ystod o bartion statudol a gwirfoddol i gynhyrchu cynigion llawnach ar gyfer patrwm gwasanaethau ysbyty a chymunedol yn y dyfodol.

**Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister join me in welcoming the demonstrators from Community Hospitals Acting Nationally Together, who have come here today? In passing, I would like to congratulate Mark Isherwood and Kirsty Williams on sponsoring the event, and to note the all-party support—or, I should say, the three-party support—given to CHANT Wales by Plaid Cymru, the Welsh Conservatives and the Welsh Liberal Democrats. There was no support whatsoever from the Labour Party. Although it felt able to support CHANT UK, it gave no support at all for CHANT Cymru. Why is it, Minister, that you were unable to meet these people and give an assurance about the community hospital issue that is affecting Powys? [*Applause.*] The Minister will be aware—he certainly will now—of the depth of feeling. There is a need to protect these services and not to kick this issue into the long grass the other side of the election. He needs to give a guarantee, as he is able to do now, of continued in-patient services at Builth Wells, Bronllys, Llanidloes, Knighton,

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i groesawu gwrthdystwyr o Ysbytai Cymuned yn Gweithredu'n Genedlaethol Gyda'i Gilydd, sydd wedi dod yma heddiw? Gyda llaw, hoffwn longyfarch Mark Isherwood a Kirsty Williams am noddi'r digwyddiad, a nodi'r gefnogaeth hollbleidiol—neu, dylwn ddweud, cefnogaeth tair plaid—a gafodd CHANT Cymru gan Blaid Cymru, Ceidwadwyr Cymru a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Ni chafwyd cefnogaeth o gwbl gan y Blaid Lafur. Er iddi deimlo y gallai gefnogi CHANT UK, ni roddodd ddim cefnogaeth o gwbl i CHANT Cymru. Pam, Weinidog, nad oeddech yn gallu cyfarfod â'r bobl hyn a rhoi sicrwydd iddynt ynghylch mater yr ysbytai cymuned sy'n effeithio ar Bowys? [*Cymeradwyaeth.*] Gŵyr y Gweinidog—fe wŷr yn awr yn sicr—am ddyfnder y teimladau. Mae angen diogelu'r gwasanaethau hyn a pheidio ag anwybyddu'r mater hwn tan ar ôl yr etholiad. Mae angen iddo roi sicrwydd, fel y gall ei roi yn awr, y bydd gwasanaethau i gleifion mewnol yn

and elsewhere throughout Wales.

parhau yn Llanfair ym Muallt, Bronllys, Llanidloes, Trefyclo, ac mewn mannau eraill ledled Cymru.

2.20 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** To answer the first question, I was not able to be present this morning because I was in Carmarthen at an engagement that had been arranged some time ago with an important voluntary sector organisation, which I felt was a key element in promoting health services in south-west Wales. Equally, I had to attend a Frank Buttle Trust meeting at which the educational prospects of children in care were being discussed—again, a long-standing commitment. So there were clear logistical difficulties in rearranging a diary including two such important events, particularly as the Powys invitation only turned up at the end of last week.

**Brian Gibbons:** I ateb y cwestiwn cyntaf, nid oeddwn yn gallu bod yn bresennol y bore yma gan fy mod yng Nghaerfyrddin mewn digwyddiad a oedd wedi ei drefnu gryn amser yn ôl gyda sefydliad pwysig yn y sector gwirfoddol. Teimlwn ei fod yn elfen allweddol i hybu gwasanaethau iechyd yn y de orllewin. Yn yr un modd, bu'n rhaid imi fynychu cyfarfod o Ymddiriedolaeth Frank Buttle lle'r oedd rhagolygon addysgol plant mewn gofal yn cael eu trafod—unwaith eto, ymrwymiad maith. Felly, yr oedd anawsterau logistaidd amlwg o ran ad-drefnu dyddiadur a oedd yn cynnwys dau ddigwyddiad mor bwysig, yn enwedig gan mai ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf yn unig y cefais wahoddiad gan Bowys.

**Nick Bourne:** And the rest of the question?

**Nick Bourne:** A gweddill y cwestiwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** The heads of health and social services in Wales have pointed out to Powys Local Health Board that, as they develop their proposals in line with 'Doing More, Doing Better', they need to take into account the guidance that we will be proposing on community services, and particularly community services framework, which will probably be published in January. We think that it is important that Powys, and any other health community in Wales that proposes to reorganise their services, should not do so precipitously ahead of this guidance. We have advised them that, if they are planning a significant reorganisation of community health services, they should not proceed without having an opportunity to study the guidance that will be forthcoming in January.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae penaethiaid iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru wedi sôn wrth Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys fod angen iddynt, wrth ddatblygu eu cynigion yn unol â 'Gwneud Mwy, Gwneud yn Well', ystyried y canllawiau y byddwn yn eu cynnig ar wasanaethau cymunedol, ac yn enwedig fframwaith gwasanaethau cymunedol, a gaiff ei gyhoeddi ym mis Ionawr yn ôl pob tebyg. Credwn ei bod yn bwysig na fydd Powys, nac unrhyw gymuned iechyd arall yng Nghymru sy'n cynnig ad-drefnu eu gwasanaethau, yn gwneud hynny cyn cyhoeddi'r canllawiau hyn. Yr ydym wedi eu cynghori, os ydynt yn bwriadu ad-drefnu gwasanaethau iechyd cymunedol yn sylweddol, na ddylent fwrw ati heb gael y cyfle i astudio'r canllawiau a gyhoeddir ym mis Ionawr.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, you will be aware that I wrote to you some weeks ago asking you to meet a delegation of concerned citizens, and concerned clinicians, from my constituency, and your written reply, again received some weeks ago, indicated that you were unable to do so. Given that your diary presented you with difficulties today, I ask you once again: will you meet with those

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, fe wyddoch imi ysgrifennu atoch rai wythnosau'n ôl yn gofyn ichi gyfarfod â dirprwyaeth o bobl a chlinigwyr yn fy etholaeth i sy'n gofidio am y sefyllfa, av yr oedd eich ymateb ysgrifenedig a dderbyniwyd, unwaith eto, rai wythnosau yn ôl, yn dweud nad oeddech yn gallu gwneud hynny. O gofio bod anawsterau wedi codi gyda'ch dyddiadur heddiw,

concerned clinicians to discuss the future of services in Powys as they relate to 'Designed for Life', and if not, why not?

**Brian Gibbons:** I think that the first level of engagement in these situations must be with local health organisations. It is inappropriate that the decision on Powys should be taken by the Minister for Health and Social Services in Cardiff; it should be taken by the residents of Powys and the local health organisations. This is why we have devolution in Wales, and this is why we want decisions to be taken as close as possible to people's own homes and communities. If I, as health Minister, was to dictate to Powys the future shape of its health services, I am sure that you, Kirsty, would be one of the first to jump up here condemning me for overriding the decisions of local people and local organisations. This is a local matter and primarily one for local decision.

gofynnaf ichi unwaith eto: a wnewch chi gyfarfod â'r clinigwyr hynny sy'n gofidio am y sefyllfa, i drafod dyfodol gwasanaethau ym Mhowys fel y maent yn berthnasol i 'Cynllun Oes', ac os na wnewch hynny, pam felly?

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf fod yn rhaid i'r lefel gyntaf o ymgysylltu yn y sefyllfaoedd hyn fod gyda sefydliadau iechyd lleol. Mae'n amhriodol mai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghaerdydd ddylai wneud y penderfyniad am Bowys; dylai gael ei wneud gan drigolion Powys a'r sefydliadau iechyd lleol. Dyna pam mae gennym ddatganoli yng Nghymru, a dyna pam ein bod am i benderfyniadau gael eu gwneud mor agos â phosibl at gartrefi a chymunedau pobl. Pe bawn i, fel y Gweinidog iechyd, yn penderfynu ffurf gwasanaethau iechyd ym Mhowys yn y dyfodol, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech chi, Kirsty, yn un o'r cyntaf i'm condemnio am ddiystyru penderfyniadau pobl lleol a sefydliadau lleol. Mater lleol yw hwn a phenderfyniad lleol sydd ei angen yn bennaf.

### **Curo Iselder Beating the Blues**

**Q5 Rosemary Butler:** What assessment has the Minister made of the Beating the Blues cognitive behavioural therapy programme in Newport? OAQ1094(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** I have noted the conclusions of the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence, which recommended that Beating the Blues should be an option for delivering cognitive behaviour therapy in the management of mild and moderate depression.

**Rosemary Butler:** Newport local health board has been using this programme since 2002 and it has had a positive impact on reducing waiting lists. It is a clinically proven and drug-free treatment. However, although some GPs are aware of the programme, they continue to prescribe anti-depressants. Do you have any plans to further promote this worthwhile, non-drug therapy for those suffering from mild to moderate depression?

**C5 Rosemary Butler:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o'r rhaglen therapi ymddygiad gwybyddol Curo Iselder yng Nghasnewydd? OAQ1094(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf wedi nodi casgliadau'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol, a argymhellodd y dylai Curo Iselder fod yn ddewis ar gyfer cyflwyno therapi ymddygiad gwybyddol i reoli iselder ysgafn a chymedrol.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae bwrdd iechyd lleol Casnewydd wedi bod yn defnyddio'r rhaglen hon er 2002 ac mae wedi cael effaith gadarnhaol ar leihau rhestrau aros. Mae'n driniaeth sydd wedi'i phrofi'n glinigol ac nid yw'n defnyddio cyffuriau. Fodd bynnag, er bod rhai meddygon teulu yn ymwybodol o'r rhaglen, maent yn dal i roi cyffuriau gwrthiselder. A oes unrhyw gynlluniau ar y gweill i hybu ymhellach y therapi gwerth chweil hon nad yw'n defnyddio cyffuriau ar gyfer pobl sy'n dioddef gan iselder ysgafn i gymedrol?

**Brian Gibbons:** There is increasing valid evidence of the benefit of cognitive behavioural therapy in the treatment of mild and moderate depression. I understand that Newport Local Health Board has secured two further licences for the rollout of the Beating the Blues programme. Looking at non-pharmaceutical interventions, the scheme that the Assembly Government has launched on bibliotherapy is also a good example of this type of thinking, which increases the range of choices open to people. The bibliotherapy, or book prescription, scheme that we are sponsoring and which is available in libraries throughout Wales is an example of offering a diverse choice to patients, particularly in terms of options that do not involve drug treatments. However, it would be a mistake to send out the message that there are not situations where drug therapies are appropriate. Clearly, there are situations where the use of drugs is important and people who could benefit from drug treatment should be prescribed drugs, if they will improve their clinical condition.

**William Graham:** What will you do to encourage young adults, particularly young men, who may feel embarrassed to seek treatment for depressive illness?

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the big challenges that we outlined in our national service framework was tackling the stigma associated with mental illness. Unless we can tackle that, then the problem that you have outlined will continue. If we are going to tackle the stigma, we need to look at mental health problems not only in terms of drugs and counselling, but in terms of the wider social context and of enabling people to live full lives as normal citizens in society. So, the answer is that services need to be tailored to young males, but we equally need a resolute and united front on tackling the stigma and discrimination associated with mental illness.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae yna dystiolaeth ddilys gynyddol am fuddiannau therapi ymddygiad gwybyddol wrth drin iselder ysgafn a chymedrol. Deallaf fod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Casnewydd wedi cael dwy drwydded arall i gyflwyno'r rhaglen Curo Iselder. O ran ymyriadau an-fferyllol, mae'r cynllun sydd wedi'i lansio gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar fibliotherapi hefyd yn esiampl dda o'r math hwn o feddwl, sy'n cynyddu amrywiaeth y dewisiadau sydd ar gael i bobl. Mae bibliotherapi, neu ragnodi llyfrau, sy'n gynllun a noddir gennym ac sydd ar gael mewn llyfrgelloedd ledled Cymru, yn enghraifft o gynnig dewis amrywiol i gleifion, yn enwedig o ran dewisiadau nad ydynt yn defnyddio cyffuriau. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n gamgymeriad cyfleu'r neges nad oes sefyllfaoedd pan fydd therapïau cyffuriau yn briodol. Yn amlwg, mae yna sefyllfaoedd pan fydd defnyddio cyffuriau'n bwysig, a dylid rhoi cyffuriau i bobl a allai gael budd o driniaeth sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau, os byddant yn gwella'u cyflwr clinigol.

**William Graham:** Beth fyddwch yn ei wneud i annog oedolion ifanc, yn enwedig dynion ifanc, sy'n teimlo'n annifyr ynghylch ceisio triniaeth am salwch sy'n gysylltiedig ag iselder?

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o'r heriau mawr a amlinellwyd gennym yn ein fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol oedd mynd i'r afael â'r stigma sy'n gysylltiedig â salwch meddwl. Oni allwn fynd i'r afael â hwnnw, bydd y broblem a nodwyd gennych yn parhau. Os ydym i fynd i'r afael â'r stigma, mae angen inni edrych ar broblemau iechyd meddwl nid yn unig o ran cyffuriau a chwmsela, ond o ran y cyd-destun cymdeithasol ehangach a galluogi pobl i fyw bywydau llawn fel dinasyddion normal mewn cymdeithas. Felly, yr ateb yw bod angen teilwra gwasanaethau i ddiwallu anghenion dynion ifanc, ond hefyd mae angen dangos agwedd benderfynol ac unedig wrth fynd i'r afael â'r stigma a'r gwahaniaethu sy'n gysylltiedig â salwch meddwl.

**Gwelyau i'r Henoed â Salwch Meddwl  
Beds for the Elderly Mentally Ill**

**Q6 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the availability of elderly mentally ill beds in north Wales? OAQ1138(HSS)

**C6 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gwelyau sydd ar gael yn y gogledd i'r henoed sydd â salwch meddwl? OAQ1138(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** There are currently 136 in-patient beds in both acute and community units in north Wales. These provide patient assessment for complex and/or challenging patient behaviour, step-down facilities from acute units and reassessment and review of community-located patients linked to patient care plans.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar hyn o bryd, mae 136 o welyau i gleifion mewnol mewn unedau aciwt a chymunedol yn y gogledd. Mae'r rhain yn asesu cleifion ar gyfer ymddygiad cymhleth a/neu heriol, yn darparu cyfleusterau cam-i-lawr o unedau aciwt ac yn ailasesu ac yn adolygu cleifion sydd yn y gymuned yn gysylltiedig â chynlluniau gofal cleifion.

**Brynle Williams:** I could argue with you over one bed, because I believe that the correct figure is 135, but I will not go into that. Given that north Wales has one of the highest concentrations of elderly people in the UK in the Colwyn Bay and Rhos-on-Sea area, it is deeply worrying that there is a severe shortage of available beds for the elderly mentally ill. There are only 135 beds, as compared with 447 in mid Wales and 459 in south-east Wales. When will you put an end to the situation that makes families travel from as far afield as Anglesey to Wrexham to visit loved ones? It is a severe problem and I hope that you will try to address it.

**Brynle Williams:** Gallaf ddadlau â chi dros un gwely, oherwydd credaf mai'r ffigur cywir yw 135, ond nid af ar drywydd hynny. O gofio mai yn y gogledd mae un o'r crynadau uchaf o'r henoed yn y DU yn ardal Bae Colwyn a Llandrillo-yn-Rhos, mae'n destun pryder mawr fod prinder difrifol o welyau i'r henoed sydd â salwch meddwl. Dim ond 135 o welyau sydd ar gael, o'u cymharu â 447 yn y canolbarth a 459 yn y de ddwyrain. Pryd y byddwch yn rhoi terfyn ar y sefyllfa sy'n golygu bod rhaid i deuluoedd deithio mor bell i ffwrdd ag Ynys Môn i Wrecsam i ymweld â'u perthnasau? Mae'n broblem ddifrifol, a gobeithio y byddwch yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â hi.

**Brian Gibbons:** My understanding is that, in many areas in north Wales, from Anglesey to Wrexham, discussions and consultations are taking place on this issue to ensure that a range of services are available—both hospital-based and community-based services. For example, the 620 non-NHS beds available for EMI patients in north Wales can be more effectively used and community facilities can be promoted. The overwhelming majority of patients with EMI difficulties and problems can be treated in the community or at a local secondary care setting. So, while we ensure that there are sufficient in-patient beds, we must not do so at the cost of having strong community-based provision in place.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fy nealltwriaeth i, mewn llawer o ardaloedd yn y gogledd, o Ynys Môn i Wrecsam, yw fod trafodaethau ac ymgynghoriadau'n mynd ymlaen am y mater hwn er mwyn sicrhau bod amrywiaeth o wasanaethau ar gael—gwasanaethau ysbyty a gwasanaethau cymunedol. Er enghraifft, gellir defnyddio'n fwy effeithiol y 620 o welyau nad ydynt yn welyau'r GIG ac sydd ar gael ar gyfer yr henoed sy'n fregus eu meddwl yn y gogledd, a gellir hybu cyfleusterau cymunedol. Gellir trin y mwyafrif helaeth o gleifion sydd ag anawsterau a phroblemau'n gysylltiedig â bod yn fregus eu meddwl yn y gymuned neu mewn lleoliad gofal eilaidd yn lleol. Felly, wrth sicrhau bod digon o welyau i gleifion allanol, rhaid inni beidio â gwneud hynny ar draul cael darpariaeth gymunedol gref.

2.30 p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae un o'r ddau gartref yn fy etholaeth i sy'n cynnig gwasanaeth i'r henoed eiddil eu meddwl ar fin cau. Pa effaith a gaiff hyn ar y nifer sy'n aros i symud allan o'n hysbytai? Cyfrifoldeb pwy yw hi i sicrhau bod nifer digonol o wlaŵ ar gyfer y cleifion hyn?

**Brian Gibbons:** As I said earlier, in response to the first question, one of the big commissioning challenges that we face in Wales is to commission an adequate range of EMI provision, not only in line with hospital beds, but in line with community provision. We said in the document on the development of our strategic direction for social services that the resilience of commissioning in social services and the health service needs to be improved so that we are better able to put in place the configuration of services. However, there are instances in which the physical fabric of a building is not conducive to best practice and, when such evaluations are taking place, we have to consider the totality of the situation and, wherever possible—as I said in response to Trish—we need to see whether these services can be most appropriately provided in a community setting before we start looking at overall bed provision.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** One of the two homes in my constituency that provide a service for the elderly mentally ill is about to close. What effect will this have on those who are waiting to move out of our hospitals? Who is responsible for ensuring that sufficient beds are available for these patients?

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mewn ymateb i'r cwestiwn cyntaf, un o'r heriau comisiynu mwyaf sy'n ein hwynebu yng Nghymru yw comisiynu digon o ddarpariaeth ar gyfer yr henoed sy'n fregus eu meddwl, nid yn unig o ran gwelyau ysbyty, ond o ran darpariaeth gymunedol. Dywedasom yn y ddogfen ar ddatblygu ein cyfeiriad strategol ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol fod angen i'r broses gomisiynu mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac yn y gwasanaeth iechyd fod yn gadarnach fel y byddwn mewn sefyllfa well i gyflunio gwasanaethau. Fodd bynnag, mae yna achosion lle nad yw cyflwr adeilad yn addas ar gyfer arfer gorau, a phan fydd gwerthusiadau felly'n mynd ymlaen, rhaid inni ystyried y sefyllfa yn ei chyfanrwydd, a ble bynnag y mae'n bosibl—fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i Trish—mae angen inni weld ai yn y gymuned y gellir darparu'r gwasanaethau hyn yn fwyaf priodol cyn inni ddechrau edrych ar y ddarpariaeth gwelyau'n gyffredinol.

#### **Torri Swyddi Ysgrifenyddion Meddygol (Gwent) Medical Secretaries Job Cuts (Gwent)**

**Q7 Trish Law:** Will the Minister make a statement about plans to cut the jobs of medical secretaries in Gwent hospitals? OAQ1101(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** I am not aware that any decisions have been made on this particular matter, although discussions are taking place on the financial recovery plan for the Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust. Staff organisations have been fully involved in the process.

**Trish Law:** Are you aware that PricewaterhouseCoopers, which was commissioned by the Welsh Assembly Government, at a cost of £300,000, to

**C7 Trish Law:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau i dorri swyddi ysgrifenyddion meddygol yn ysbytai Gwent? OAQ1101(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol fod unrhyw benderfyniadau wedi eu gwneud am y mater penodol hwn, er bod trafodaethau'n mynd rhagddynt ar gynllun adfer ariannol ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent. Mae sefydliadau staff wedi cymryd rhan lawn yn y broses.

**Trish Law:** A ydych yn ymwybodol fod PricewaterhouseCoopers, a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am gost o £300,000 i nodi arbedion o £43 miliwn, wedi



identify savings of £43 million, concluded that the work of half the medical secretaries in Gwent could be outsourced with a loss of between 100 and 150 jobs?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am aware that this was one of a range of measures that PricewaterhouseCoopers suggested could be presented to Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust. However, my understanding is that the trust has yet to make any decision on the range of options presented by PricewaterhouseCoopers. Following the report by PricewaterhouseCoopers, the trust is developing its own response to this issue. It has not yet come up with any proposals with regard to medical secretaries or any other element of the workforce.

**Rosemary Butler:** I know that the financial recovery plan is under debate at the moment and that the trust has yet to make any decisions, but I will do everything that I possibly can to persuade it to move away from this course of action. Medical secretaries are at the front line as far as patients are concerned. If they want to talk to their surgeon, talk about treatment, or rearrange an appointment, they talk to the medical secretaries. They have real therapeutic value. Patients feel more comfortable having spoken to a medical secretary, who is in direct contact with the surgeon. Minister, will you do everything that you can to ensure that Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust looks at other options to recover its overspend rather than reducing medical secretaries?

**Brian Gibbons:** First, I agree with you about the importance of medical secretaries. Very often in this Chamber, we hear people talking about the extra tiers of administration that exist within the health service. However, key elements of that extra administrative tier include medical secretaries, and I could not agree more with you that an effective tier of medical secretaries is absolutely crucial to the smooth running of the NHS in Wales. Therefore, the importance of medical secretaries cannot be underestimated. However, in addressing the deficits, it is

dod i'r casgliad y gellid gosod gwaith hanner yr ysgrifenyddesau meddygol yng Ngwent ar gcontract allanol, a fyddai'n arwain at golli rhwng 100 a 150 o swyddi?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod hwn yn un o nifer o fesurau y mae PricewaterhouseCoopers wedi awgrymu y gellid eu cyflwyno i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent. Fodd bynnag, deallaf nad yw'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi gwneud penderfyniad eto am yr amrywiol ddewisiadau a gyflwynwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers. Yn dilyn adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers, mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn llunio ei hymateb ei hun i'r mater hwn. Nid yw wedi cyflwyno unrhyw gynigion hyd yma ynglŷn ag ysgrifenyddesau meddygol nac unrhyw ran arall o'r gweithlu.

**Rosemary Butler:** Gwn fod y cynllun adfer ariannol yn cael ei drafod ar hyn o bryd ac nad yw'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi gwneud unrhyw benderfyniadau eto, ond byddaf yn gwneud popeth o fewn fy ngallu i'w darbwyllo rhag cymryd y camau hyn. Ysgrifenyddesau meddygol yw'r rheng flaen o safbwynt y cleifion. Os ydynt am siarad â'u llawfeddyg, trafod eu triniaeth, neu aildrefnu apwyntiad, maent yn siarad â'r ysgrifenyddesau meddygol. Mae iddynt werth therapiwtig gwirioneddol. Mae cleifion yn teimlo'n fwy cysurus ar ôl cael siarad ag ysgrifenyddes feddygol, sydd mewn cysylltiad uniongyrchol â'r llawfeddyg. Weinidog, a wnewch bopeth a allwch i sicrhau bod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent yn ystyried dewisiadau eraill i arbed costau yn hytrach na chwotgi niferoedd ysgrifenyddesau meddygol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn gyntaf, cytunaf â chi ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd ysgrifenyddesau meddygol. Yn aml iawn yn y Siambr hon, clywn am bobl yn sôn am yr haenau ychwanegol o weinyddwyr yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Fodd bynnag, ymhlith yr elfennau allweddol yn yr haen ychwanegol honno o weinyddwyr mae ysgrifenyddesau meddygol, a chytunaf yn llwyr â chi fod haen effeithiol o ysgrifenyddesau meddygol yn hollbwysig i sicrhau bod y GIG yn cael ei redeg yn ddidrafferth yng Nghymru. Felly, ni ellir tanbrizio pwysigrwydd ysgrifenyddesau

important that organisations within the health service in Wales manage their resources effectively. My priorities, in terms of addressing those deficits, are that patient services must be maintained, the clinical targets that the Assembly Government has set must be delivered, and jobs must be maintained. We must have it in that prioritised way.

**William Graham:** Minister, will you reassure those medical secretaries in Gwent hospitals that their jobs will not be outsourced to India and that other jobs from Wales will not follow them?

**Brian Gibbons:** William, you are asking me to give a reassurance on a hypothetical question. As Trish said in her question, this came from PricewaterhouseCoopers and, to the best of my knowledge, Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust has not taken a view on this in one way or another.

meddygol. Fodd bynnag, wrth ymdrin â'r diffygion, mae'n bwysig bod sefydliadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn rheoli eu hadnoddau'n effeithiol. Fy mlaenoriaethau o ran ymdrin â'r diffygion hynny yw bod yn rhaid cadw gwasanaethau i gleifion, rhaid cyflawni'r targedau clinigol a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a rhaid cadw swyddi. Rhaid inni osod y blaenoriaethau hynny.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, a rowch chi sicrwydd i'r ysgrifenyddesau meddygol hynny mewn ysbytai yng Ngwent na chaiff eu swyddi eu gosod ar gontract i staff yn India, ac na fydd swyddi eraill o Gymru yn eu dilyn?

**Brian Gibbons:** William, yr ydych yn gofyn imi roi sicrwydd am gwestiwn damcaniaethol. Fel y dywedodd Trish yn ei chwestiwn, PricewaterhouseCoopers sydd wedi cynnig hyn, a hyd y gwn i nid yw Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent wedi llunio barn am hyn y naill ffordd na'r llall.

### **Darparu Gwasanaethau Gofal Brys Delivering Emergency Care Services**

**Q8 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on the delivering emergency care services strategy? OAQ1132(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The consultation process that has been taking place on the DECS strategy ended on 10 October 2006. Officials have worked through the consultation responses and have identified the main themes for consideration by the project board, which met for the first time on 10 November 2006.

**David Melding:** Minister, I hope that we will see something published on this before the Assembly elections. Do you agree that it was somewhat misconceived to have this separate from your publication of the various reconfigurations strategies, because most people's concerns regarding any hospital changes come down to the provision of accident and emergency services? I agree that the last major overhaul in accident and emergency services was probably in the 1960s, but do you regret not taking Sir Derek

**C8 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y strategaeth ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys? OAQ1132(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Daeth yr ymgynghoriad ar Ddarparu Gwasanaethau Gofal Brys sydd wedi bod yn mynd ymlaen i ben ar 10 Hydref 2006. Mae swyddogion wedi gweithio drwy'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad ac wedi nodi'r prif themâu i'w hystyried gan fwrdd y prosiect, a gyfarfu am y tro cyntaf ar 10 Tachwedd 2006.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, gobeithio y byddwn yn gweld rhywbeth yn cael ei gyhoeddi am hyn cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad. A gytunwch ei fod yn gangymeriad braidd ystyried hyn ar wahân i'r gwahanol strategaethau ailgyflunio a gyhoeddwyd gennych, oherwydd yr hyn y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn poeni yn ei gylch o ran newidiadau mewn ysbytai yw darparu gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys? Cytunaf mai'r tro diwethaf i'r gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys gael eu

Wanless's advice in trying to seek a political consensus on this issue, rather than ploughing your own furrow and publishing what are, potentially, rather controversial proposals?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am not aware that the DECS proposals are controversial. Most of the reactions that I am aware of regarding DECS indicate that they are a welcome set of proposals. I realise that the Royal College of Nursing has concerns that some of the evidence that it presented was not properly acknowledged. However, other than that, there is general consensus that the principles underlining the DECS project are correct. Insofar as it is possible to have consensus on these issues, this is one area where there is broad agreement with the approach being taken in relation to unscheduled and emergency care in Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is interesting to hear you say that, Minister, but I am not entirely sure that your colleagues in the Royal College of Nursing would agree with you about the level of consensus. However, be that as it may, I am sure that you will agree that the delivery of the new strategy will depend on staff and resources. What assessments have you made or are you making, in the process of preparing to deliver the new strategy, of how the current financial pressures on the NHS are impacting on the delivery of emergency care, and, therefore, on the future delivery of any strategy?

**Brian Gibbons:** As I said in response to another question, very often, the most financially efficient service is also better for the patient. Unscheduled care is also an area where that is probably true at the moment, because a person trying to access unscheduled care will come across duplication or triplication, depending on where they are. They may come in contact with NHS Direct, the ambulance service, their own general practitioner's out-of-hours system, the deputising service or the co-operatives. Therefore, there is considerable scope to get rid of some of the duplication

hailwampio, mae'n debyg, oedd yn y 1960au, ac onid ydych yn edifarhau na dderbyniwyd cyngor Syr Derek Wanless gennych i geisio cael consensws gwleidyddol ar y mater hwn, yn hytrach na thorri'ch cwys eich hun a chyhoeddi'r hyn sydd, o bosibl, yn gynigion dadleuol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod y cynigion ar gyfer Darparu Gwasanaethau Gofal Brys yn rhai dadleuol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r ymatebion y gwn i amdanynt am Ddarparu Gwasanaethau Gofal Brys yn awgrymu bod pobl yn croesawu'r cynigion. Deallaf fod pryderon gan Goleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys fod rhywfaint o'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd ganddo heb ei chydnabod yn briodol. Fodd bynnag, ar wahân i hynny, mae consensws cyffredinol fod yr egwyddorion sy'n sail i'r prosiect Darparu Gwasanaethau Gofal Brys yn gywir. I'r graddau y gellir cael consensws ar y materion hyn, mae hwn yn un maes lle y mae cytundeb cyffredinol am y dull a ddefnyddir mewn cysylltiad â gofal heb ei drefnu a gofal brys yng Nghymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n ddiddorol eich clywed yn dweud hynny, Weinidog, ond nid wyf yn hollol siŵr a fyddai Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yn cytuno â chi ynglŷn â faint o gonsensws sydd. Fodd bynnag, boed hynny fel y bo, fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, y bydd cyflawni'r strategaeth newydd yn dibynnu ar staff ac adnoddau. A ydych wedi asesu neu a ydych yn asesu, wrth baratoi ar gyfer cyflawni'r strategaeth newydd, sut y mae'r pwysau ariannol cyfredol ar y GIG yn effeithio ar y ffordd y caiff gofal brys ei ddarparu ac, felly, ar ddarparu'r strategaeth yn y dyfodol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn arall, y gwasanaeth mwyaf effeithlon yn ariannol yn aml iawn yw'r gwasanaeth gorau i'r claf hefyd. Mae gofal heb ei drefnu hefyd yn faes lle mae hynny'n wir yn ôl pob tebyg ar hyn o bryd, gan y bydd rhywun sy'n ceisio cael gofal heb ei drefnu yn gorfod wynebu dyblygu neu driblygu, yn ôl ble maent yn byw. Efallai y byddant yn dod i gysylltiad â Galw Iechyd Cymru, y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, system y tu allan i oriau eu meddyg teulu ei hun, y gwasanaeth dirprwyo neu'r cydweithredwyr. Felly, mae cryn le i gael gwared ar rywffaint

that exists within the unscheduled and emergency care system, and by getting rid of that duplication, efficiencies can be produced for the service. It can also result in the service being much more easily accessible and comprehensible to patients, particularly when they are trying to access that service in an emergency, when it is not always possible to make cool and calm decisions.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I think that we would all agree that having more clarity in services and having more accessible services for patients would be welcome. However, it has been put to me that the current financial situation is having real impacts on some accident and emergency units, with nursing posts, for example, not being made redundant, as has sadly happened in England, but being frozen. Therefore, there is an impact on the current financial pressures on the services as they currently stand. I am sure that it will be possible to get some efficiency savings, which we would all welcome. However, I must refer you again to your answer to William Graham's supplementary question. Your colleague in England has said that if the books are not balanced and if the financial position is not sorted out, she will consider her position. I would not ask you to go that far, Minister, and I am certainly not asking you to respond to an English situation, but if the historic debt continues to rise in a significant number of trusts, will you at least consider what you are doing, if you do not consider your position?

2.40 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes, to deal with the last point first, we clearly require organisations to place a great priority on maintaining financial balance. We are quite determined that organisations should develop realistic steps to secure that. I have indicated the order of priority with regard to the way in which I would expect organisations to deliver that financial balance. That is obviously a statutory obligation, and it clearly exists from my position as health Minister, so there should be no doubt about my determination on that.

o'r dyblygu sy'n digwydd yn y system gofal heb ei drefnu a gofal brys, a thrwy gael gwared ar ddyblygu, gellir sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth. Gall hefyd arwain at wasanaeth sydd lawer yn fwy cyfleus a dealladwy i gleifion, yn enwedig pan fyddant yn ceisio cael y gwasanaeth hwnnw mewn argyfwng, pan nad yw bob amser yn bosibl meddwl yn synhwyrol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Credaf y byddem i gyd yn cytuno y byddai mwy o eglurdeb ynglŷn â gwasanaethau a chael gwasanaethau mwy hwylus i gleifion yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd wrthyf fod y sefyllfa ariannol presennol yn cael effaith wirioneddol ar rai unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys, gyda swyddi nyrsys, er enghraifft, yn cael eu rhewi yn hytrach na chael eu dileu, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn Lloegr, gwaetha'r modd. Felly, mae'r pwysau ariannol presennol yn cael effaith ar y gwasanaethau fel y maent ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn bosibl sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd, rhywbeth y byddem oll yn ei groesawu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi eich cyfeirio eto at eich ateb i gwestiwn atodol William Graham. Mae'ch cyd-Weinidog yn Lloegr wedi dweud, os na lwyddir i fantoli'r cyfrifon ac os nad ymdrinnir â'r sefyllfa ariannol, y bydd yn ystyried ymddiswyddo. Ni fyddwn yn gofyn ichi wneud hynny, Weinidog, ac yn sicr nid wyf yn gofyn ichi ymateb i'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr. Ond os bydd y ddyled hanesyddol yn parhau i gynyddu mewn nifer sylweddol o ymddiriedolaethau, a wnewch chi o leiaf ystyried beth yr ydych yn ei wneud, hyd yn oed os nad ydych yn ystyried ymddiswyddo?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ie, i ddelio â'r pwynt olaf yn gyntaf, yn amlwg yr ydym yn gofyn i sefydliadau roi blaenoriaeth fawr i fantoli'r cyfrifon. Yr ydym yn hollol benderfynol y dylai sefydliadau ddatblygu camau gweithredu realistig i sicrhau hynny. Yr wyf wedi nodi ym mha drefn y dylid blaenoriaethu o ran y ffordd y byddwn yn disgwyl i sefydliadau fantoli'r cyfrifon hynny. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn rhwymedigaeth statudol, ac mae'n amlwg yn deillio o'm swydd fel Gweinidog iechyd, felly, ni ddylai fod amheuaeth o gwbl ynglŷn

â'm penderfyniad ar hynny.

Your point about accident and emergency departments is a good example of such duplication. We know that somewhere between 15 per cent and 35 per cent of people who attend accident and emergency departments would be better off being looked after in an alternative setting. Therefore, if we deliver the vision of the developing emergency care services project, when a patient presents themselves in an out-of-hours situation, they will not end up in the accident and emergency department if that is not the best location; they would see a primary care practitioner if that were the best option for them, and that would be the first thing that would happen. That is the challenge of the DECS project, and accident and emergency departments are a good example of where the present system breaks down.

Mae eich pwynt ynglŷn ag adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn enghraifft dda o ddyblygu o'r fath. Gwyddom y byddai'n well i rhwng 15 y cant a 35 y cant o bobl sy'n mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys gael gofal mewn lleoliad arall. Felly, os gallwn wireddu gweledigaeth y prosiect gwasanaethau gofal brys sy'n datblygu, pan fydd cleifion yn cysylltu y tu allan i oriau, na fyddant yn cael gofal yn y pen draw yn yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys os nad hwnnw yw'r lleoliad gorau; byddent yn gweld ymarferydd gofal sylfaenol os dyna fyddai'r dewis gorau iddynt, a dyna'r peth cyntaf a fyddai'n digwydd. Dyna yw her prosiect Darparu Gwasanaethau Gofal Brys, ac mae adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn enghraifft dda o ddiffygion y system bresennol.

### **Cleifion MS MS Patients**

**Q9 Catherine Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's support for multiple sclerosis patients in Wales? OAQ1125(HSS)

**C9 Catherine Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gleifion sglerosis ymledol yng Nghymru? OAQ1125(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Local health boards commission most multiple sclerosis services in Wales, while more specialist treatments are commissioned by Health Commission Wales. Chronic conditions, including multiple sclerosis, are a national priority. We will aim to ensure early intervention and appropriate support for patients with chronic diseases such as multiple sclerosis.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n comisiynu'r rhan fwyaf o wasanaethau sglerosis ymledol yng Nghymru, a Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru sy'n comisiynu triniaethau mwy arbenigol. Mae cyflyrau cronig, gan gynnwys sglerosis ymledol, yn flaenoriaeth genedlaethol. Byddwn yn anelu at sicrhau ymyriad yn gynnar a chymorth priodol i gleifion sydd â chlefydau cronig megis sglerosis ymledol.

**Catherine Thomas:** I have been approached by constituents in Llanelli regarding the fact that physiotherapy support in the community for multiple sclerosis patients is extremely stretched. Do you have any plans to expand this and other vital ancillary services to ensure that MS sufferers are receiving the essential support that they need? May I also take this opportunity to ask you to join me in congratulating members of Llanelli hospital's league of friends, who are in the gallery today, for their work in the community and for the support that they give to many

**Catherine Thomas:** Mae etholwyr yn Llanelli wedi cysylltu â mi ynglŷn â'r ffaith fod cymorth ffisiotherapi yn y gymuned i gleifion sglerosis ymledol o dan gryn bwysau. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i ehangu'r gwasanaeth hwn a gwasanaethau atodol hanfodol eraill er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl sy'n dioddef gan sglerosis ymledol yn cael y cymorth hanfodol y mae ei angen arnynt? A gaf fi hefyd achub ar y cyfle hwn i ofyn ichi ymuno â mi i longyfarch aelodau o gyfeillion ysbyty Llanelli, sydd yn yr oriel heddiw, am eu gwaith yn y gymuned ac am y

services in the hospital in Llanelli?

**Brian Gibbons:** Certainly. All hospitals across Wales are very dependent on their league of friends or equivalent organisations. That is the situation in Neath Port Talbot. The many tens of thousands of pounds, quite apart from the volunteer hours that people give to supporting their local hospitals, are to be welcomed. You are right about community-based physiotherapy. One of the big challenges in 'Designed for Life' is to shift as much care as possible out of the hospital setting and into the community. One of the reasons why we have dramatically increased the number of physiotherapy training posts available in Wales is to ensure that we will have the necessary workforce available to deliver that diverse range of provision along the lines that you suggested.

**Lisa Francis:** In a press release issued by the former health Minister in 2002, she stated that postcode prescribing for MS sufferers would not be an issue. Unfortunately, in recent years, it has been. The additional money that has been made available for Health Commission Wales is obviously welcome. As I understand it, it will allow prescribing centres to commence treatment for patients who have previously been assessed as eligible for treatment. In your most recent correspondence to me, you pointed to guidance from the Association of British Neurologists, I think, in respect of this. Will the additional funding enable all such eligibly assessed patients in mid and west Wales to receive disease-modifying therapy treatment, and what role, if any, will the Association of British Neurologists have in that? Will it have the final say? What I am asking you is this: am I able to tell my constituents in Powys, whose GP's reckon that they are eligible for DMTs, that they will now be able to receive those drugs?

**Brian Gibbons:** I think that the evaluation and appropriateness of the treatment is generally done by consulting neurologists at the special centres established to administer

cymorth y maent yn ei roi i lawer o wasanaethau yn yr ysbyty yn Llanelli?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr. Mae ysbytai ledled Cymru yn dibynnu'n fawr iawn ar eu cyfeillion neu fudiadau tebyg. Dyna'r sefyllfa yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Mae'r degau ar filoedd o bunnau, heb sôn am yr oriau y mae gwirfoddolwyr yn eu rhoi i gefnogi eu hysbytai lleol, i'w croesawu. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynglŷn â ffisiotherapi yn y gymuned. Un o'r heriau mawr yn 'Cynllun Oes' yw symud cymaint â phosibl o ofal o'r ysbytai i'r gymuned. Un o'r rhesymau pam yr ydym wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol nifer y swyddi hyfforddi ym maes ffisiotherapi sydd ar gael yng Nghymru yw sicrhau y bydd gennym y gweithlu angenrheidiol ar gael i ymgymryd â'r ddarpariaeth amrywiol ar hyd y llinellau a awgrymwyd gennych.

**Lisa Francis:** Mewn datganiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd gan y cyn-Weinidog iechyd yn 2002, dywedodd na fyddai rhagnodi yn ôl cod post i bobl sy'n dioddef gan sglerosis ymledol yn broblem. Yn anffodus, yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf mae wedi bod yn broblem. Mae'r arian ychwanegol a neilltuwyd ar gyfer Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru i'w groesawu, yn amlwg. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, bydd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i ganolfannau rhagnodi ddechrau trin cleifion sydd eisoes wedi cael eu hasesu'n gymwys i gael triniaeth. Yn eich gohebiaeth ddiwethaf â mi, cyfeiriwyd at ganllawiau gan Gymdeithas Niwrolegwyr Prydain, mi gredaf, ar hyn. A fydd yr arian ychwanegol yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i bob claf yr aseswyd ei fod yn gymwys yn y canolbarth ac yn y gorllewin i gael triniaeth therapi addasu clefyd, a pha rôl, os o gwbl, fydd gan Gymdeithas Niwrolegwyr Prydain yn hynny? Ai'r Gymdeithas fydd yn gwneud y penderfyniad terfynol? Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ofyn ichi yw: a allaf ddweud wrth fy etholwyr ym Mhowys, y mae eu meddygon teulu yn tybio eu bod yn gymwys i gael therapi addasu clefyd, y byddant yn gallu cael y cyffuriau hyn bellach?

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf fod y gwaith o werthuso a phennu priodoldeb y driniaeth fel arfer yn cael ei wneud drwy ymgynghori â niwrolegwyr yn y canolfannau arbennig a

this scheme. This is a specialist area of activity, and not all patients who suffer from multiple sclerosis would benefit from this treatment.

One of the key points made in the guidelines from the Association of British Neurologists relates not only to deciding when patients should start on the treatment but also to patients being encouraged to come off the treatment if they are not showing any benefit, as it will not be doing them any good. Any treatment that is not doing good has the risk of doing harm. I do not think that we are totally convinced that the guidelines in this regard are being rigidly followed in every instance.

You will also be aware that these drugs are prescribed on the basis of the risk-sharing scheme. The reason we are going down that road is because the evidence base for these disease-modifying treatments is not convincing at present. Part of the risk-sharing scheme has been to develop the evidence base further. I understand that the number of patients recruited to the risk-sharing scheme should now give us enough patients to further inform our decisions on these matters, and, hopefully, some time next year, we will be able to come to some conclusions at a UK level as to whether the initial advice that was provided by the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence was correct. In other words, in the light of this new experience, we can see whether the treatment benefits were fairly marginal or more substantial. However, we have to proceed on an evidence base.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10 OAQ1134(HSS) is withdrawn.

sefydlwyd i weithredu'r cynllun hwn. Mae'r maes gweithgarwch hwn yn un arbenigol, ac ni fyddai pob claf sydd â sglerosis ymledol yn cael budd o'r driniaeth hon.

Mae un o'r pwyntiau allweddol a wneir yn y canllawiau gan Gymdeithas Niwrolegwyr Prydain yn ymwneud ag annog cleifion i roi'r gorau i'r driniaeth os nad ydynt yn cael unrhyw fudd ohoni, gan na fydd yn gwneud lles iddynt, yn ogystal â phenderfynu pryd y dylai cleifion ddechrau cael y driniaeth. Gall unrhyw driniaeth nad yw'n gwneud lles wneud niwed. Ni chredaf ein bod wedi ein hargyhoeddi'n llwyr fod y canllawiau ar hyn yn cael eu dilyn yn fanwl gywir bob amser.

Fe wyddoch hefyd fod y cyffuriau hyn yn cael eu rhagnodi ar sail y cynllun rhannu risg. Y rheswm pam yr ydym yn gwneud hynny yw nad yw'r sail dystiolaeth ar gyfer y triniaethau hyn sy'n addasu clefydau yn ein darbwylllo ar hyn o bryd. Rhan o'r cynllun rhannu risg oedd datblygu'r sail dystiolaeth ymhellach. Deallaf y dylai nifer y cleifion sy'n cymryd rhan yn y cynllun rhannu risg bellach olygu bod gennym ddigon o gleifion i lywio ein penderfyniadau ar y materion hyn ymhellach, a gobeithio, rywbryd yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf, y byddwn yn gallu llunio rhai casgliadau ar lefel y DU a oedd y cyngor cychwynnol a roddwyd gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol yn gywir. Mewn geiriau eraill, yn sgil y profiad newydd hwn, gallwn weld a oedd manteision y driniaeth yn lled ymylol neu'n fwy sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni barhau ar sail dystiolaeth.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn OAQ1134(HSS) yn ôl.

### **Ad-drefnu Ysbytai ym Mhowys The Reorganisation of Hospitals in Powys**

**Q11 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the reorganisation of hospitals in Powys? OAQ1096(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Service reorganisation in Powys will be done on the basis of the consultation process that is taking place in Powys, and the consultation process that will follow on from that. If any consultation

**C11 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ad-drefnu ysbytai ym Mhowys? OAQ1096(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Caiff gwasanaethau eu had-drefnu ym Mhowys ar sail proses ymgynghori sy'n mynd ymlaen ym Mhowys, a'r broses ymgynghori a fydd yn dilyn o hynny. Os bydd unrhyw broses ymgynghori,

process takes place, as Minister, I may be involved in any final adjudication of the matter.

**Kirsty Williams:** You will be aware that there is little confidence in my constituency with regard to that consultation process, given the actions of the local health board to date. Once again, I ask you whether you will meet with concerned clinicians who have little confidence in the local health board, as demonstrated by previous meetings with the chief medical officer's department, and as you heard first hand from a member of staff visiting the Assembly last week. Will you meet with those clinicians to listen to their concerns? If not, why not? Your refusal to do so to date makes me wonder what you are afraid of hearing. [*Applause.*]

**Brian Gibbons:** I find myself in a slightly difficult position because, following Kirsty's representations to me a month or so ago, we made clear to Powys Local Health Board that it should not proceed with any significant change in service provision in Powys until it had been informed by the wider community services project. In other words, any basis to proceed should be informed by the best evidence and guidance available. I would have thought that Kirsty would welcome that. The consultation process has not started yet, but people are articulating concerns that are not even based on firmed-up proposals. It is my understanding that Powys Local Health Board has to agree what firm proposals will emerge from 'Doing More, Doing Better'. There is no significant problem, as long as the formal consultation process has not been started by my meeting individuals. However, if the consultation process has formally started, that would be inappropriate.

2.50 p.m.

It would be equally inappropriate of me to suggest that I would somehow be taking the accountability away from organisations such as Powys Local Health Board to make local decisions. Powys Local Health Board is made up of local clinicians, members of the local

fel Gweinidog efallai y byddaf yn ymwneud ag unrhyw ddyfarniad terfynol ar y mater.

**Kirsty Williams:** Fe wyddoch nad oes llawer o hyder yn fy etholaeth yn y broses ymgynghori honno, o ystyried gweithredoedd y bwrdd iechyd lleol hyd yma. Unwaith eto, gofynnaf ichi a fyddwch yn cwrdd â chlinigwyr pryderus nad oes ganddynt lawer o ffydd yn y bwrdd iechyd lleol, fel y dangoswyd gan gyfarfodydd blaenorol gydag adran y prif swyddog meddygol, ac fel y clywsoch yn uniongyrchol gan aelod o staff a oedd yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf. A wnewch chi gwrdd â'r clinigwyr hynny i wrando ar eu pryderon? Os na wnewch, pam? Mae'r ffaith eich bod wedi gwrthod hyd yma yn gwneud imi dybio beth yr ydych yn ofni ei glywed. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf mewn sefyllfa braidd yn anodd oherwydd, yn dilyn y sylwadau a gefais gan Kirsty tua mis yn ôl, gwnaethpwyd yn hollol glir i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys na ddylai fynd ymlaen ag unrhyw newid sylweddol yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ym Mhowys nes iddo gael arweiniad gan y prosiect gwasanaethau cymunedol ehangach. Mewn geiriau eraill, dylai unrhyw gamau pellach gael eu llywio gan y dystiolaeth a'r canllawiau gorau sydd ar gael. Byddwn wedi disgwyl i Kirsty groesawu hynny. Nid yw'r broses ymgynghori wedi dechrau eto, ond mae pobl yn mynegi pryderon nad ydynt hyd yn oed yn seiliedig ar gynigion cadarn. O'r hyn a ddeallaf, rhaid i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys gytuno pa gynigion cadarn sy'n deillio o 'Gwneud Mwy, Gwneud yn Well'. Nid oes problem fawr, cyn belled ag y bydd y broses ymgynghori ffurfiol heb ddechrau drwy imi gyfarfod ag unigolion. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r broses ymgynghori wedi dechrau'n ffurfiol, ni fyddai hynny'n briodol.

Yn yr un modd, ni fyddai'n briodol imi awgrymu y byddwn, mewn rhyw ffordd, yn cymryd yr atebolrwydd oddi wrth sefydliadau megis Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys i wneud penderfyniadau lleol. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys yn cynnwys clinigwyr lleol,



authority, key members of the public and the voluntary sector in Powys. The decision on the future of health services in Powys should be made in the first instance by local people; it should not be down to me as Minister to come in as a dictator and impose a solution on people. In the first instance, the basis of the policy must be decided by the membership of the local health board, and, having come up with a set of proposals, it should then actively engage with the public in Powys. This must be a Powys decision, made by Powys people, for Powys people, and not a decision dictated to them by a Minister for health.

**Glyn Davies:** I listened to that long answer with interest, Minister. You cannot have it both ways. You say that this decision should be left locally to Powys, and yet we know that the most senior civil servant in the health service has intervened in the process to ensure that the consultation on closures does not take place until after the election. The people of Powys want to know what your role is in this. You tell us today—and I welcome that—that you have no role at all, but hardly a single person in Powys believes that. You need to give people an absolute assurance, and meeting people to tell them that face to face should be your way of doing that.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am pleased to have the opportunity to clarify this matter. As I have already explained, the head of the NHS approached Powys Local Health Board on the basis of Kirsty Williams's representations to me, given her concerns over how the process was being driven forward. That was why the head of the NHS and social services in Wales drew to the attention of Powys Local Health Board the proposed community services guidelines coming forward in January. Therefore, that is the basis of her intervention; it was following representations from Kirsty Williams. I would have thought that you, and Kirsty, would welcome that intervention, given that that was the basis on which it was made.

Having said that, there is also a key issue in that if important service reconfigurations take place in Wales, particularly if they are controversial in a local circumstance, they

aelodau o'r awdurdod lleol, aelodau allweddol o'r cyhoedd a'r sector gwirfoddol ym Mhowys. Y bobl leol ddylai fod yn gwneud y penderfyniad ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau iechyd ym Mhowys yn y lle cyntaf; ni ddylwn i fel Gweinidog orfod gweithredu fel unben a gorfodi ateb ar bobl. Yn y lle cyntaf, rhaid i aelodau'r bwrdd iechyd lleol benderfynu ar sail y polisi, ac ar ôl cyflwyno cyfres o gynigion, dylai wedyn ymgysylltu â phobl Powys. Rhaid mai penderfyniad gan bobl Powys i bobl Powys yw hwn, ac nid penderfyniad a orfodir arnynt gan Weinidog iechyd.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwrandewais ar yr ateb hir hwnnw gyda diddordeb, Weinidog. Ni allwch ei chael y ddwy ffordd. Dywedwch y dylai'r penderfyniad hwn gael ei adael i bobl Powys, ac eto gwyddom fod y gwas sifil uchaf ei swydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi ymyrryd yn y broses i sicrhau na fydd yr ymgynghori am gau ysbytai yn digwydd tan ar ôl etholiad. Mae pobl Powys am wybod beth yw eich rôl chi yn hyn. Dywedwch wrthym heddiw—a chroesawaf hynny—nad oes gennych rôl o gwbl, ond prin fod neb ym Mhowys yn credu hynny. Mae angen ichi roi sicrwydd pendant i bobl, a dylech wneud hynny drwy gwrdd â phobl wyneb yn wyneb i ddweud hynny wrthynt.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn falch cael y cyfle i egluro'r mater hwn. Fel yr wyf eisoes wedi ei egluro, cysylltodd pennaeth y GIG â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys ar sail y sylwadau a roddodd Kirsty Williams imi, o ganlyniad i'w phryderon ynghylch cyfeiriad y broses. Dyna pam y tynnodd pennaeth y GIG a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru sylw Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys at y canllawiau arfaethedig ar wasanaethau cymunedol a gyflwynir ym mis Ionawr. Felly, dyna sail ei hymyriad; yn dilyn sylwadau gan Kirsty Williams. Byddwn wedi disgwyl i chi, a Kirsty, groesawu'r ymyriad hwnnw, o gofio mai ar y sail honno y cafodd ei wneud.

Ar ôl dweud hynny, mae yna broblem allweddol hefyd, os bydd yna waith pwysig ar ail-gyflunio gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, yn enwedig os ydynt yn ddadleuol yn lleol,

should not get caught up in the purdah period in the run-up to an election, or in the immediate election period, particularly as the changes may be put in place by a current Government on behalf of a future Government. Therefore, trying to ensure that a consultation process does not get involved in the purdah period before an election is useful, generic advice that is issued to all health services across Wales, and is not restricted to Powys. It is general advice that we issue to the health service: if it is engaged in major reconfiguration negotiations, which may be contested, it should not get caught up in purdah, or it may result in it being caught up or delayed.

na ddylai'r gwaith hwnnw gael ei ddal yn y cyfnod yn syth cyn etholiad, nac yn ystod etholiad, yn enwedig gan y gall y newidiadau gael eu cyflwyno gan Lywodraeth bresennol ar ran Llywodraeth a fydd mewn grym yn y dyfodol. Felly, mae ceisio sicrhau nad yw proses ymgynghori yn cael ei dal yn y cyfnod yn syth cyn etholiad yn gyngor cyffredinol, defnyddiol a roddir i bob gwasanaeth iechyd ledled Cymru, ac nid i Bowys yn unig. Mae'n gyngor cyffredinol a roddir i'r gwasanaeth iechyd: os yw'n ymwneud â thrafodaethau ar waith ail-gyflunio mawr, y gellir ei wrthwynebu, ni ddylai gael ei ddal yn y cyfnod yn syth cyn etholiad, neu fe allai gael ei ohirio.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport**

#### **Gemau'r Gymanwlad The Commonwealth Games**

**Q1 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on a Welsh bid for the Commonwealth Games? OAQ1030(CWS)

**C1 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gais gan Gymru i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad? OAQ1030(CWS)

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** You will recall that, on 4 July, I said that any Commonwealth Games bid would be submitted by the Commonwealth Games Council for Wales. A future bid is dependent on a Welsh city coming forward as a potential host for the games.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Fe gofiwch, ar 4 Gorffennaf, imi ddweud y byddai unrhyw gais i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn cael ei gyflwyno gan Gyngor Gemau'r Gymanwlad dros Gymru. Mae cais yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu ar gael dinas yng Nghymru i'w chyflwyno ei hun fel dinas bosibl i gynnal y gemau ynddi.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you for that answer, Minister, but I did not quite understand it, as I could not hear it properly. However, in view of the fact that the Olympic bid seems to be degenerating into such a shambles, including the Treasury's grubby grabbing of money that might even include value added tax, do you not agree that it is about time that you got your act together on the Welsh Commonwealth Games bid? Do you not also agree that you should pay more attention to detail and look more thoroughly at the bid, so that it does not degenerate into the absolutely shambolic mess that it appears to be at the moment?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog, ond ni ddeallais ef yn llwyr, oherwydd nid oeddwn yn gallu ei glywed yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, yn sgil y ffaith fod y cais llwyddiannus am y Gemau Olympaidd yn ymddangos fel petai'n chwalu'n ddarnau, a'r Trysorlys yn cipio arian mewn modd mor fudr a allai hyd yn oed gynnwys treth ar werth, oni chytunwch ei bod yn bryd ichi roi'ch meddwl ar waith am y cais i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yng Nghymru? Oni chytunwch hefyd y dylech roi mwy o sylw i fanylion ac edrych yn fanylach ar y cais, fel na fydd yn chwalu'n ddarnau fel y mae'n ymddangos ar hyn o bryd?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Before the Minister answers that question, I ask him to repeat the original answer if it was not heard. I heard it, of course, but if it was not heard properly throughout the Chamber, I would be grateful—

**Eleanor Burnham:** We cannot hear here.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I heard that you did not hear, but I am trying to be helpful.

**Alun Pugh:** I said to Eleanor Burnham that, on 4 July, any Commonwealth Games bid would be submitted by the Commonwealth Games Council for Wales. A future bid will be dependent on a Welsh city coming forward as a potential host. I will explain the technicalities again to Eleanor Burnham. *[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The hearing of replies is not helped by people who interject while they are sitting down. You know my views on these matters, and I have mentioned them to you privately on a number of occasions.

**Alun Pugh:** I will explain the technicalities behind this again to Eleanor Burnham. Wales cannot bid to host the Commonwealth Games, as the rules state that a city in the Commonwealth must put forward a bid. Legally, therefore, there is no such thing as a Welsh bid. If a city puts forward such a bid, it is then up to the host nation's Commonwealth Games association to endorse that bid and to submit it to the Commonwealth Games Federation.

**Mark Isherwood:** On a television programme in April, when explaining the difficulty of staging the Commonwealth Games, you said that if Wales wanted to host the Commonwealth Games in Cardiff, for example, the National Assembly would have to build a velodrome and a national pool in that city, and that people in north Wales, as well as west Wales and Newport, would be pretty upset if we spent all of our capital development budget on a single city. Clearly, you are right, and you know well how sensitive people in north Wales are to the

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cyn i'r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, gofynnaf iddo ailadrodd yr ateb gwreiddiol os na chafodd ei glywed. Clywais i ef, wrth gwrs, ond os na chafodd ei glywed yn iawn drwy'r Siambr, byddwn yn ddiolchgar—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ni allwn glywed yma.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Clywais nad oeddech wedi gallu clywed, ond yr wyf yn ceisio bod o gymorth.

**Alun Pugh:** Dywedais wrth Eleanor Burnham, ar 4 Gorffennaf, y byddai unrhyw gais i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn cael ei gyflwyno gan Gyngor Gemau'r Gymanwlad dros Gymru. Bydd unrhyw gais yn y dyfodol dibynnu ar gael dinas yng Nghymru i'w chyflwyno ei hun fel dinas bosibl i gynnal y gemau ynddi. Egluraf y manylion technegol i Eleanor Burnham eto. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw cael pobl sy'n eistedd i lawr yn torri ar draws yn helpu neb i glywed atebion. Fe wyddoch fy marn am hyn, ac yr wyf wedi ei mynegi wrthyh yn breifat droeon.

**Alun Pugh:** Egluraf y manylion technegol i Eleanor Burnham rywbryd eto. Ni all Cymru gyflwyno cais i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad, oherwydd yn ôl y rheolau rhaid i ddinas yn y Gymanwlad gyflwyno cais. Felly, yn gyfreithiol, nid oes y fath beth â chais gan Gymru. Os bydd dinas yn cyflwyno cais o'r fath, mater i gymdeithas Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn y wlad sy'n eu cynnal yw cefnogi'r cais hwnnw a'i gyflwyno i Ffederasiwn Gemau'r Gymanwlad.

**Mark Isherwood:** Ar raglen deledu ym mis Ebrill, wrth egluro anhawster cynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad, yr oeddech yn dweud pe byddai Cymru am gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yng Nghaerdydd, er enghraifft, y byddai'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol adeiladu felodrom a phwll cenedlaethol yn y ddinas honno, ac y byddai pobl y gogledd, ynghyd â phobl y gorllewin a Chasnewydd, yn eithaf blin pe byddem yn gwario ein holl gyllideb datblygu cyfalaf ar un ddinas. Yr ydych yn gywir, mae'n amlwg, ac fe wyddoch mor sensitif yw pobl y gogledd

preferment of particularly south Wales over the regions. However, we understand that Birmingham may also be making a bid. In those circumstances, what proposals do you have to work with Birmingham to ensure the maximum benefits for north Wales and the regions, which are so close in travelling distances to the Birmingham conurbation?

**Alun Pugh:** I have had no discussions with Birmingham.

ynghlân â ffafriaeth i'r de yn arbennig dros y rhanbarthau. Fodd bynnag, deallwn efallai fod Birmingham hefyd yn gwneud cais. O dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, pa gynigion sydd gennych i weithio gyda Birmingham i sicrhau'r budd mwyaf i'r gogledd a'r rhanbarthau, sydd mor agos o ran pellter teithio i gytref Birmingham?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf wedi cael dim trafodaethau gyda Birmingham.

### Gemau Olympaidd 2012 2012 Olympic Games

**Q2 Jenny Randerson:** What assessment has the Minister made of the role that Wales has to play in the 2012 Olympic Games? OAQ1040(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** As well as the sporting spectacle—and I hope that Team GB wins many medals—there will be significant economic development opportunities for Welsh businesses, and a major cultural Olympiad around the games.

**Jenny Randerson:** In addition to what you have suggested, the games have the potential to inspire our young sportsmen and women, and that would lead to achieving some of your 'Climbing Higher' targets. However, in order to get young people in Wales enthused about sport, we desperately need to make improvements to many of our leisure and sports facilities, many of which must rely on lottery funding to make improvements. We all know that the games are likely to have a dire impact on lottery funding for projects outside London, because so much funding will be diverted to supporting the games in London. Yesterday, the Secretary of State announced a £900 million increase in the estimated cost of the games, which has already risen to £3.3 billion—and that is just what the Government admits to, rather than other, potentially even higher, estimates. What discussions have you had with the Secretary of State about the impact of the London Olympic Games on lottery funding for sport and for other good causes in Wales? There is almost certainly bound to be an overall reduction in the funding available to Wales.

**C2 Jenny Randerson:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o'r rhan sydd gan Gymru i'w chwarae yng Ngemau Olympaidd 2012? OAQ1040(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Yn ogystal â'r wledd o safbwynt chwaraeon—a gobeithio y bydd Tîm Prydain Fawr yn ennill nifer o fedalau—bydd cyfleoedd datblygu economaidd sylweddol i fusnesau yng Nghymru, ac Olympiad diwylliannol mawr o amgylch y gemau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn ogystal â'r hyn yr ydych wedi ei awgrymu, gallai'r gemau ysbrydoli ein pobl ifanc, a byddai hynny'n arwain at gyflawni rhai o'ch targedau yn 'Dringo'n Uwch'. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn cael pobl ifanc yng Nghymru i ymddiddori mewn chwaraeon, mae dirfawr angen inni wneud gwelliannau mewn nifer o gyfleusterau hamdden a chwaraeon, lawer ohonynt yn gorfod dibynnu ar arian loteri i wneud gwelliannau. Fe wyddom fod y gemau'n debygol o gael effaith niweidiol ar yr arian loteri a roddir i brosiectau y tu allan i Llundain, oherwydd bydd cymaint o arian yn cael ei roi i gefnogi'r gemau yn Llundain. Ddoe cyhoeddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol gynnydd o £900 miliwn yn yr amcangyfrif o gost y gemau, sydd eisoes wedi codi i £3.3 biliwn—a'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei gyfaddef yn unig yw hynny, yn hytrach nag amcangyfrifon eraill a allai fod hyd yn oed yn uwch. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar effaith Gemau Olympaidd Llundain ar arian loteri ar gyfer chwaraeon ac achosion da eraill yng Nghymru? Mae bron yn sicr y bydd gostyngiad cyffredinol yn yr arian a fydd ar gael i Gymru.

**Alun Pugh:** These matters are regularly discussed in the UK sport cabinet, which is chaired by Tessa Jowell and includes representatives from the UK Government, the Welsh Assembly Government, and colleagues in Scotland and Northern Ireland. I agree with your statement that the Olympic Games present us with an enormous opportunity as a platform for participation, particularly by young people. I do not think that anyone in the Assembly does not share my concern about the current low levels of participation in sport and physical exercise among our young people.

3.00 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** The cost, as Jenny has said, has risen by £900 million in the last 16 months and, on top of that, there is an amazing £250 million that was not taken into account by the Labour Government when it looked at value added tax in the budget estimates. That is a total of £1.15 billion in 16 months. That is just the increase: that is on top of the costs that existed previously. What assurances can you give that you will ensure that Welsh interests are considered in this matter and that you are not going to sit back and watch things get worse, as the Olympic Games becomes more and more costly and the funds coming to Wales decrease?

**Alun Pugh:** I read with interest what Tessa Jowell had to say to the culture committee of the UK Parliament yesterday. You are right to say that there has been an escalation in the costs of the Olympic Games: the world price of steel has doubled, for example, and that was not taken into account in the original estimates. However, you certainly have my assurance that, as the Minister with responsibility for Welsh sport, I will defend the interests of Welsh sport.

**Owen John Thomas:** Of course, we remember the Wembley farce, which has not finished yet. The cost of that continues to go up and up; it seems that London does not keep good control of things. Even before this huge increase, or threatened loss of funds to Wales, we heard that 50 per cent of the

**Alun Pugh:** Trafodir y materion hyn yn rheolaidd yng nghabinet chwaraeon y DU, dan gadeiryddiaeth Tessa Jowell sy'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o Lywodraeth y DU, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a chyd-Aelodau yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Cytunaf â'ch datganiad fod y Gemau Olympaidd yn gyfle aruthrol inni fel llwyfan i gymryd rhan, yn arbennig o ran pobl ifanc. Credaf fod pawb yn y Cynulliad fel finnau yn pryderu am y lefelau isel presennol o gyfranogi mewn chwaraeon ac ymarfer corff ymysg ein pobl ifanc.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae'r gost, fel y dywedodd Jenny, wedi codi £900 miliwn yn yr 16 mis diwethaf, ac ar ben hynny mae'r swm rhyfeddol o £250 miliwn na chafodd ei gynnwys gan y Llywodraeth Lafur pan oedd yn ystyried y dreth ar werth yn amcangyfrifon y gyllideb. Mae hynny'n gyfanswm o £1.15 biliwn mewn 16 mis. Y cynnydd yn unig yw hynny: mae hynny ar ben y costau a oedd yn bodoli eisoes. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y byddwch yn sicrhau bod buddiannau Cymru'n cael eu hystyried yn y mater hwn, ac na fyddwch yn llaesu dwylo a gadael i bethau waethygu, wrth i'r Gemau Olympaidd fynd yn fwy ac yn fwy costus ac wrth i'r arian a ddaw i Gymru leihau?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr oedd yn ddiddorol darllen yr hyn a ddywedodd Tessa Jowell wrth bwyllgor diwylliant Senedd y DU ddoe. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod costau'r Gemau Olympaidd wedi cynyddu: mae pris dur y byd wedi dyblu, er enghraifft, ac nid ystyriwyd hynny yn yr amcangyfrifon gwreiddiol. Fodd bynnag, gallwch fod y sicr y byddaf fi, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros chwaraeon Cymru, yn amddiffyn buddiannau chwaraeon Cymru.

**Owen John Thomas:** Wrth gwrs, fe gofiwn ffars Wembley, nad yw wedi gorffen eto. Mae'r costau hynny'n dal i godi a chodi; ymddengys nad yw Llundain yn cadw rheolaeth dda ar bethau. Hyd yn oed cyn y cynnydd anferth hwn, neu'r bygythiad o golli arian i Gymru, clywsom y gallai 50 y cant o

lottery funding that goes to the Sports Council for Wales and the Arts Council of Wales could be cut. That was before we heard about these huge increases in the costs of the games. I am concerned, as are many other people, that sports and the arts in Wales will be hit by this, unless you take a firm stand.

**Alun Pugh:** I am pleased to say that I am not responsible for the Wembley project, although that project has been enormously good for the Millennium Stadium and the economy of Cardiff. As regards your wild speculation about lottery funding, I certainly do not recognise those figures.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3, OAQ1022(CWS), yn ôl.

arian y loteri a roddir i Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru gael ei dorri. Yr oedd hynny cyn inni glywed am y cynnydd anferth hwn yng nghostau'r gemau. Yr wyf yn bryderus, fel mae llawer o bobl eraill, yr effeithir ar chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru oherwydd hyn, os na wnewch chi safiad cadarn.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud nad fi sy'n gyfrifol am brosiect Wembley, er bod y prosiect hwnnw wedi bod o fendith i Stadiwm y Mileniwm ac economi Caerdydd. O ran eich dyfalu mawr ynglŷn ag arian y loteri, mae'n sicr nad yw'r ffigurau hynny'n taro deuddeg.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 3, OAQ1022(CWS), has been withdrawn.

### **Drama i Bobl ag Anghenion Arbennig Drama for People with Special Needs**

**C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael ym maes drama i bobl ag anghenion arbennig? OAQ1053(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Opportunities are available for people with special needs in the field of drama and are provided by a number of organisations, including the Drama Association of Wales and Arts Disability Wales. Theatre in education companies have a major role to play in this, and, of course, there is the Hijinx Theatre Company, which does excellent work in this field.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch, Weinidog, eich bod wedi cyfeirio at gwmni Hijinx. Rhaid i mi ddatgan buddiant yn hyn o beth, fel aelod o fwrdd cefnogwyr cwmni Hijinx. Un o uchafbwyntiau cyfnod y Nadolig i mi yw mynychu cynhyrchiad gan Theatr Odyssey, a gwn bod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud hynny yn y gorffennol hefyd. A wnewch ein sicrhau y prynhawn yma y bydd cyllid ar gyfer y cynhyrchiad hollbwysig hwn ar gael ar gyfer Nadoligau'r dyfodol, fel y gallwn edrych ymlaen at eu mwynhau yn y dyfodol?

**Alun Pugh:** I have certainly enjoyed Hijinx's performances in the past. The *Seize the Day* production was absolutely first rate and

**Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the opportunities available in the field of drama for people with special needs? OAQ1053(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae cyfleoedd ar gael i bobl ag anghenion arbennig ym maes drama, a chânt eu darparu gan nifer o sefydliadau, gan gynnwys Cymdeithas Ddrama Cymru a Chelfyddydau Anabled Cymru. Mae gan gwmnïau theatr mewn addysg ran fawr i'w chwarae yn hyn, ac wrth gwrs, mae yna Gwmni Theatr Hijinx sy'n gwneud gwaith ardderchog yn y maes hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am pleased, Minister, that you referred to Hijinx. I declare an interest as a member of the Hijinx supporters board. One of the highlights of the Christmas period for me is attending the Odyssey Theatre production, and I know the Minister has also attended in the past. Will you give an assurance this afternoon that funding for this important production will be available for Christmases to come, so that we can look forward to enjoying them in the future?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn sicr wedi mwynhau perfformiadau Hijinx yn y gorffennol. Yr oedd *Seize the Day* yn gynhyrchiad o'r radd

featured Sarah Gordy, an actress with Down's syndrome. As far as the future goes, I cannot guarantee funding for any arts organisation, but I look forward to your support in the forthcoming negotiations on the culture budget.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you accept that pupils and students with special educational needs can excel in the field of drama and that every opportunity needs to be made available in schools, colleges and independent theatres to encourage and facilitate them in this regard, to give them the opportunity to excel?

**Alun Pugh:** I do indeed: all eight of the theatre-in-education companies provide performances for special schools.

flaenaf ac yn cynnwys Sarah Gordy, actores sydd â syndrom Down. O ran y dyfodol, ni allaf warantu ariannu unrhyw sefydliad celfyddydol, ond edrychaf ymlaen at eich cefnogaeth yn y trafodaethau sydd o'n blaenau ar y gyllideb ddiwylliant.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn derbyn y gall disgyblion a myfyrwyr sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ddod i'r brig ym maes drama, a bod angen sicrhau pob cyfle iddynt mewn ysgolion, colegau a theatrau annibynnol i'w hannog a'u cynorthwyo yn y maes hwn, er mwyn rhoi'r cyfle iddynt ddod i'r brig?

**Alun Pugh:** Ydwyf, yn bendant: mae pob un o'r wyth cwmni theatr mewn addysg yn cynnig perfformiadau i ysgolion arbennig.

### **Cynaliadwyedd Cymunedau Cymraeg eu Hiaith The Sustainability of Welsh Language Communities**

**Q5 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the sustainability of Welsh-language communities in north Wales? OAQ1023(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn deall pwysigrwydd y mater hwn oherwydd yr wyf yn byw mewn ardal ddwyieithog. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hybu llawer o brosiectau fel Twf, y mentrau iaith a'r pecynnau ar symud i Gymru er mwyn cefnogi cynaliadwyedd.

**Brynle Williams:** The future of north Wales Welsh-language communities, at this moment, looks to be particularly bleak: without affordable housing, young families can no longer afford to stay in their communities.

Small schools are closing because of falling pupil numbers, which, regrettably, this leaves us with an ageing population. How will the Welsh Assembly Government support the younger generation of first-language Welsh speakers and ensure the affordable housing that is crucial to the future of these communities?

**Alun Pugh:** You will have to refer the detailed question on housing to the Minister with responsibility for housing. We certainly support the 'Symud i Gymru' packs—over

**C5 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynaliadwyedd cymunedau Cymraeg eu hiaith yn y gogledd? OAQ1023(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I understand the importance of this matter because I live in a bilingual area. The Assembly Government promotes many projects, such as Twf, the mentrau iaith, and the moving to Wales packs, to support sustainability.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae dyfodol cymunedau Cymraeg y gogledd yn edrych yn ddu iawn ar hyn o bryd: heb dai fforddiadwy, ni all teuluoedd ifanc fforddio aros yn eu cymunedau.

Mae ysgolion bach yn cau am fod niferoedd disgyblion yn lleihau, sydd, yn anffodus, yn ein gadael gyda phoblogaeth sy'n heneiddio. Sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynorthwyo'r genhedlaeth iau sydd â'r Gymraeg yn iaith gyntaf iddynt, ac yn sicrhau'r tai fforddiadwy sy'n hanfodol i ddyfodol y cymunedau hyn?

**Alun Pugh:** Bydd yn rhaid ichi gyfeirio'r cwestiwn manwl am dai i'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros dai. Yr ydym yn bendant yn cefnogi'r pecynnau 'Symud i Gymru'—

100 estate agents are engaged in that scheme. That is for people moving into the area. As we know, Brynle, the future of the Welsh language lies with young people, which is why we have heavily invested in the Twf programme, which encourages parents to raise their children in both languages, regardless of the home language, and the Welsh Assembly Government provides strong encouragement to respond positively to the welcome increase in demand for Welsh-medium education.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Mae'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod trafodaeth wedi'i chynnal ynghylch pa mor bell y dylid mynd i gryfhau deddfwriaeth er mwyn cryfhau sefyllfa'r iaith Gymraeg. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod bod peth o'r drafodaeth honno yn ymwneud â'r posibilrwydd o sefydlu swydd comisiynydd iaith. Bydd y swydd honno'n dra gwahanol i swydd y dyfarnydd oedd gan y Gweinidog mewn golwg, gan y byddai gan gomisiynydd bwerau llawer ehangach. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn, os nad yw'n derbyn holl swyddogaethau comisiynydd, y byddai cael comisiynydd yn ffocws ardderchog, nid yn unig o ran ystyried problemau'r iaith heddiw, ond o ran argymhell y ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer y dyfodol? Byddai hynny'n tynnu'r iaith o'r arena bleidiol wleidyddol.

**Alun Pugh:** We have said that we are happy to look again at the whole legislative base when we review 'Iaith Pawb'. Changes to legislation to create the dyfarnydd and the role of the dyfarnydd will be an early legislative priority when the Assembly picks up its new powers in the next Assembly. I believe that investment and encouragement are probably more useful tools than major new primary legislation, but, as I have said, let us look at this again in the context of the 'Iaith Pawb' review.

mae dros 100 o werthwyr tai yn rhan o'r cynllun hwnnw. Mae hynny ar gyfer pobl sy'n symud i'r ardal. Fel y gwyddom, Brynle, mae dyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg yn nwylo pobl ifanc, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi buddsoddi cryn dipyn yn y rhaglen Twf, sy'n annog rhieni i fagu eu plant yn y ddwy iaith, waeth beth yw iaith yr aelwyd. Ac mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi anogaeth gref i ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r galw cynyddol am addysg Gymraeg.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** The Minister is aware that there has been discussion regarding how far one should go to strengthen legislation in order to strengthen the position of the Welsh language. The Minister will know that some of that discussion has revolved around the possible creation of the post of a language commissioner. That post would be quite different from that of the dyfarnydd which the Minister had in mind, because the commissioner would have far broader powers. Does the Minister accept, even if he does not fully accept the role of the commissioner, that such a role would give superb focus, not only in terms of considering the current problems of the language, but in terms of recommending a way forward for the future? That would bring the language out of the party political arena.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym wedi dweud ein bod yn fodlon edrych eto ar yr holl sail deddfwriaethol pan fyddwn yn adolygu 'Iaith Pawb'. Bydd newidiadau mewn deddfwriaeth i greu swydd y dyfarnydd, a bydd rôl y dyfarnydd yn flaenoriaeth deddfwriaethol gynnar pan fydd y Cynulliad yn dechrau gweithredu ei bwerau newydd yn y Cynulliad nesaf. Credaf fod buddsoddiad ac anogaeth hwyrach yn ddulliau mwy defnyddiol na deddfwriaeth sylfaenol newydd, ond fel y dywedais, gadewch inni edrych ar hyn eto yng nghyd-destun adolygiad 'Iaith Pawb'.

### Cysylltiadau Diwylliannol Dramor Cultural Links Abroad

**Q6 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement about building cultural links abroad? OAQ1041(CWS)

**C6 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am feithrin cysylltiadau diwylliannol dramor?



OAQ1041(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The Welsh Assembly Government and its sponsored bodies support a number of initiatives of international significance to help promote Wales and its distinctive cultural agenda. This ensures that the cultural talent in Wales is recognised and nurtured.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Would you agree that devolution has pushed Welsh cultural issues up the agenda and given Welsh culture an international dimension? Minister, what actions have been taken to capitalise on a renewed spotlight on Welsh culture, and what feedback have you had from Welsh art displays at the Venice Biennale or greater cultural links with Patagonia?

**Alun Pugh:** We explored this theme in detail at a marketing conference in Newport this morning. There is a variety of international initiatives—the Dylan Thomas prize is the latest, but there are many others. Artes Mundi is a major international exhibition and competition for international art, and the Venice Biennale puts Welsh artists at the forefront of international exhibition.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Un o'r sefydliadau sydd wedi cyfrannu at feithrin cysylltiadau diwylliannol tramor yw Canolfan Iaith a Threftadaeth Cymru, Nant Gwrtheyrn. Pa ran y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei chymryd mewn trafodaethau i sicrhau y bydd y ganolfan hon yn rhan o'r strategaeth ar ddysgu Cymraeg i oedolion?

**Alun Pugh:** The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills made a major announcement on the development of the Welsh education service for adults. I value the work that Nant Gwrtheyrn does, having been a student there on several occasions.

**Lisa Francis:** What talks have you had with the Government's new tourism department about updating its cultural tourism strategy which, obviously, would promote visits from people overseas?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r cyrff a noddir ganddi yn cefnogi nifer o fentrau sydd o bwys rhyngwladol i helpu hyrwyddo Cymru a'i hagenda ddiwylliannol unigryw. Mae hyn yn sicrhau y caiff y doniau diwylliannol sydd yng Nghymru eu cydnabod a'u meithrin.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A gytunwch fod datganoli wedi rhoi hwb i faterion diwylliannol Cymru ac wedi rhoi dimensiwn rhyngwladol i ddiwylliant Cymru? Weinidog, pa gamau a gymerwyd i fanteisio ar y sylw newydd a roddir i ddiwylliant Cymru, a pha adborth a gawsoch o arddangosfeydd o gelf Cymru yng ngŵyl Venice Biennale neu gysylltiadau diwylliannol cadarnach â Phatagonia?

**Alun Pugh:** Cafodd y thema hon ei hystyried gennym yn fanwl mewn cynhadledd farchnata yng Nghasnewydd y bore yma. Mae yna amrywiaeth o fentrau rhyngwladol—gwobr Dylan Thomas yw'r un ddiweddaraf, ond mae nifer o rai eraill. Mae Artes Mundi yn arddangosfa ryngwladol fawr, ac mae'r gystadleuaeth am gelf ryngwladol a'r Venice Biennale yn rhoi artistiaid o Gymru yn y rheng flaen mewn arddangosfeydd rhyngwladol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** One of the institutions which has contributed to nurturing cultural links abroad is the Welsh Language and Heritage Centre in Nant Gwrtheyrn. What role has the Minister had in discussions to ensure that this centre will be part of the strategy on teaching Welsh to adults?

**Alun Pugh:** Gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau gyhoeddiad o bwys ar ddatblygu'r gwasanaeth dysgu Cymraeg i oedolion. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi gwaith Nant Gwrtheyrn, a minnau wedi bod yn fyfyrwr yno lawer gwaith.

**Lisa Francis:** Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gydag adran dwristiaeth newydd y Llywodraeth ar ddiweddarau ei strategaeth twristiaeth ddiwylliannol a fyddai, yn amlwg, yn hyrwyddo ymweliadau gan bobl o

wledydd tramor?

**Alun Pugh:** Discussions are ongoing, but tourism will be a theme of the cultural strategy, and we are looking to publish a draft version, following consultation, in the new year.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae trafodaethau'n parhau, ond bydd twristiaeth yn un o themâu'r strategaeth ddiwylliant, a'r gobaith yw y byddwn yn cyhoeddi fersiwn drafft, ar ôl ymgynghori, yn y flwyddyn newydd.

3.10 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** When the former Wales Tourist Board produced the document 'Cultural Tourism Strategy for Wales' in 2003, it said that the most popular tourist activity was visiting heritage sites. You will know from previous meetings that the historic environment supports 22,000 jobs in Wales, is worth £750 million to the Welsh economy, and has the potential for enormous growth in tourism. Do you agree that an assessment of the historic environment needs to be undertaken, including an audit of current expenditure and a projection of future needs, which will count towards developing a serious strategy or action plan, particularly when at last week's meeting of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee, representatives from the Heritage Lottery Fund were in broad agreement that such a strategy needs to be undertaken? Will you grasp the nettle and commit to developing this important strategy?

**Lisa Francis:** Pan gyhoeddodd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, fel yr oedd, y ddogfen 'Strategaeth Twristiaeth Ddiwylliannol ar gyfer Cymru' yn 2003, dywedodd mai'r gweithgarwch mwyaf poblogaidd gan dwristiaid oedd ymweld â safleoedd treftadaeth. Fe wyddoch o gyfarfodydd blaenorol fod yr amgylchedd hanesyddol yn cynnal 22,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru, ei fod yn werth £750 miliwn i economi Cymru, a bod iddo'r posibilrwydd o dwf anferthol mewn twristiaeth. A gytunwch fod angen gwneud asesiad o'r amgylchedd hanesyddol, gan gynnwys archwiliad o wariant presennol a rhagamcaniad o anghenion yn y dyfodol, a fydd yn rhan o ddatblygu strategaeth neu gynllun gweithredu difrifol, yn arbennig o gofio bod cynrychiolwyr o Gronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yr wythnos diwethaf yn cytuno'n gyffredinol bod angen cael strategaeth o'r fath? A wnewch achub ar y cyfle ac ymrwymo i ddatblygu'r strategaeth bwysig hon?

**Alun Pugh:** As you know, we have a historic environment group, which considers such issues. As Andrew Davies would point out, bringing the Wales Tourist Board into the heart of the Assembly Government has had many benefits. The quality of the links between Cadw and officials in the tourism department is bearing fruit. You are right to point out the substantial economic contribution of cultural and historic tourism to Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae gennym grŵp sy'n ymwneud â'r amgylchedd hanesyddol ac yn ystyried materion o'r fath. Fel y byddai Andrew Davies yn ei ddweud, mae nifer o fanteision i ddod â Bwrdd Croeso Cymru o dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r cysylltiadau da rhwng Cadw a swyddogion yr adran dwristiaeth yn dwyn ffrwyth. Yr ydych yn gywir i nodi cyfraniad economaidd sylweddol twristiaeth ddiwylliannol a hanesyddol i Gymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylid buddsoddi mwy yn y Cyngor Prydeinig, sy'n gallu hybu Cymru yn well erbyn hyn? Beth yr ydych yn gallu ei wneud i'w annog, a pha fath o gyllid y gallwch ei addo iddo?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you agree that there should be more investment in the British Council, which can now promote Wales more effectively? What can you do to encourage it, and what sort of funding can you promise it?

**Alun Pugh:** I am not responsible for the

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am y

British Council, but I value the work that it does with regard to many aspects of the Assembly Government's cultural agenda.

Cyngor Prydeinig, ond yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwaith y mae'n ei wneud ar lawer agwedd ar agenda ddiwylliannol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr ydych yn dweud nad ydych yn monitro'r hyn mae'r Cyngor Prydeinig yn ei wneud, ond oni ddylech gymryd rhyw fath o sylw ohono? Mae'n gorff cryf sydd â phresenoldeb o gwmpas y byd. Mewn Cymru ddatganoledig, dylem fanteisio ar ei waith gwych. Yr wyf wedi ei weld mewn ambell le yn Ewrop, a chredaf ei bod yn bwysig eich bod yn cymryd ychydig mwy o ddiddordeb yn hyn. Mae'n ddigon hawdd ichi ddweud nad yw'n fater i chi, ond fel ein Gweinidog dros ddiwylliant, dylech wneud ymdrech i ddangos bod gennych rhyw fath o ddiddordeb mewn hybu Cymru ar draws y byd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** You say that do not monitor the British Council's activities, but should you not take some note of what it does? It is a powerful body that operates globally. In a devolved Wales, we should take advantage of its excellent work. I have seen it in a number of places in Europe, and I believe it is important that you take a little more interest in this. It is easy for you to say that it is not a matter for you, but as our Minister for culture, you should make an effort to show that you have some interest in promoting Wales globally.

**Alun Pugh:** I did not say that I am not interested in this, and I did not say that I do not monitor the British Council's work. What I said was that I do not have responsibility as a Minister for its work. The British Council does excellent work, not just with regard to culture, but with regard to sport.

**Alun Pugh:** Ni ddywedais nad oes gennyf ddiddordeb yn hyn, ac ni ddywedais nad wyf yn monitro gwaith y Cyngor Prydeinig. Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd nad oes gennyf gyfrifoldeb, fel Gweinidog, am ei waith. Mae'r Cyngor Prydeinig yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog, nid yn unig o ran diwylliant, ond o ran chwaraeon.

### Hyrwyddo'r Celfyddydau Promoting the Arts

**Q7 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister update us on his policies for promoting the arts in Wales? OAQ1046(CWS)

**C7 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am ei bolisiau i hyrwyddo'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru? OAQ1046(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** My priorities for the arts, including promoting the arts, are set out in our annual remit letter to the Arts Council of Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae fy mlaenoriaethau dros y celfyddydau, gan gynnwys hyrwyddo'r celfyddydau, wedi eu nodi yn ein llythyr cylch gwaith blynyddol at Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for that response. Edinburgh has a range of national art galleries, as does Dublin, and London, certainly, has a considerable range of gallery. You will know of my and, indeed, my party's commitment to a national gallery for Wales. Is your Government committed to having a distinct and discrete national gallery for Wales? If so, when will that be delivered?

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw. Mae gan Gaeredin amrywiaeth o orielau cenedlaethol, fel sydd gan Ddulyn, ac mae gan Lundain, yn bendant, amrywiaeth sylweddol o orielau. Fe wyddoch am fy ymrwymiad i, ac ymrwymiad fy mhlaidd, i gael oriel genedlaethol i Gymru. A yw eich Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i gael oriel genedlaethol benodol ac unigryw i Gymru? Os felly, pryd y bydd honno'n dod?

**Alun Pugh:** You will know that I have committed a substantial resource to do some detailed planning and a feasibility study. Such a project would have substantial capital and revenue cost implications, but, Nick, you have not identified culture as a priority in the budget negotiations this year.

**John Griffiths:** I am sure that you will agree that we want to promote the arts in Wales on the basis of inclusiveness and equality of opportunity, recognising, for example, our multi-cultural heritage. Therefore, will you join me in condemning the British National Party, which currently has on its website an attack on the National Museum Wales for organising exhibitions on Muslim culture in Wales? Given the current world situation, and at this difficult time for Muslims in our communities, it is extremely important that we foster tolerance and understanding, and these exhibitions are an important way of doing that.

**Alun Pugh:** I am afraid that I have seen the article on the BNP's website. The BNP is a collection of racists, bigots and criminals who try to drive wedges between different parts of Welsh society. It tries to do that with regard to colour, and its latest tactic is to do that with regard to religion.

It is entirely appropriate that National Museum Wales holds this exhibition and we all have a responsibility, as democratically elected politicians, to stand up to this sort of bullying.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I would like to pursue that issue, but I think that we are all of one mind here.

The Sharing Treasures initiative to move special artefacts around Wales is one way in which Wales gets its fair share of seeing the wonderful things that are often stored in the basements of the national library and national museum. What have you done in the last two or three years to expand that scheme? Do you think that it is important enough to ensure that it gets to all parts of Wales and that more

**Alun Pugh:** Fe wyddoch fy mod wedi neilltuo adnoddau sylweddol i wneud gwaith cynllunio manwl ac astudiaeth ddichonoldeb. Byddai costau cyfalaf a refeniw sylweddol ynghlwm wrth brosiect o'r fath, ond, Nick, nid ydych wedi nodi diwylliant fel blaenoriaeth yn y trafodaethau ar y gyllideb eleni.

**John Griffiths:** Fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, ein bod am hyrwyddo'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru ar sail cynhwysiant a chyfle cyfartal, gan gydnabod, er enghraifft, ein treftadaeth aml-ddiwylliannol. Felly, a ymunwch â mi i gondemnio Plaid Genedlaethol Prydain, sy'n lladd ar Amgueddfa Cymru ar ei gwefan ar hyn o bryd am drefnu arddangosfeydd o ddiwylliant Mwslemaidd yng Nghymru? O gofio'r byd sydd ohoni, a'r amser anodd hwn i Fwslemaid yn ein cymunedau, mae'n bwysig iawn inni feithrin goddefgarwch a dealltwriaeth, ac mae'r arddangosfeydd hyn yn ffordd bwysig i wneud hynny.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae arnaf ofn fy mod wedi gweld yr erthygl ar wefan y BNP. Mae'r BNP yn gasgliad o bobl hiliol, ragfarnlyd a throseddol sy'n ceisio creu rhwygiadau rhwng gwahanol rannau o gymdeithas yng Nghymru. Mae'n ceisio gwneud hynny gyda hil, a'i dacteg ddiweddaraf yw gwneud hynny gyda chrefydd.

Mae'n hollol briodol fod Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru yn cynnal yr arddangosfa hon, ac mae gennym oll gyfrifoldeb, fel gwleidyddion a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd, i wrthsefyll y math hwn o fwlio.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Hoffwn fynd ar ôl y mater hwnnw, ond credaf ein bod i gyd o'r un farn am hyn.

Mae menter Cyfoeth Cymru Gyfan i symud arteffactau arbennig o amgylch Cymru yn un ffordd i Gymru gael ei chyfran deg o weld pethau gwych sy'n cael eu storio'n aml yn isloriau'r llyfrgell genedlaethol a'r amgueddfa genedlaethol. Beth ydych chi wedi ei wneud yn y ddwy neu dair blynedd diwethaf i ehangu'r cynllun hwnnw? A ydych yn credu ei bod yn ddigon pwysig sicrhau ei

money should be allocated to it?

**Alun Pugh:** It is important that not only the artefacts stored in basements, but also the crown jewels, are moved around. There are important considerations not just in terms of security, but also of environmental storage. Many of these artefacts are fragile. There has been substantial investment in both security and environmental terms to get more artefacts literally on the road. We have seen many examples of that and I will drop you a letter with the detail. It was great to see the Mold gold cape—a priceless treasure from the British Museum—on display in Wrexham. That could not have happened without Assembly Government investment.

**Carl Sargeant:** As you know, Minister, I am a huge culture vulture and will join you in supporting any such investment in my constituency of Alyn and Deeside. Earlier we touched on the Olympic and Commonwealth Games, so do you think that if there were a gold medal for ‘getting one over on someone’, the artist who was paid £12,000 by the Arts Council of Wales for exhibiting an empty room would win? It was quite ironic, and an interesting concept in art.

**Alun Pugh:** As you know, Carl, I do not make detailed decisions on exhibitions or performances; it would be entirely inappropriate for a culture Minister to do so. On you being a culture vulture, if I can get my hands on a couple of tickets for the *Ring Cycle*, I will ensure that you get an invitation.

bod yn cyrraedd pob rhan o Gymru, ac y dylid dyrannu mwy o arian ar ei chyfer?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n bwysig nid yn unig i'r arteffactau sy'n cael eu storio mewn isloriau gael eu symud o amgylch, ond tlysau'r goron hefyd. Mae ystyriaethau pwysig nid yn unig o ran diogelwch, ond hefyd o ran storio amgylcheddol. Mae nifer o'r arteffactau hyn yn fregus. Gwnaed cryn fuddsoddiad mewn diogelwch ac yn yr amgylchedd i roi mwy o arteffactau, yn llythrennol, ar y ffordd. Gwelsom lawer enghraifft o hynny, a byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch i roi'r manylion. Yr oedd yn wych gweld mantell aur yr Wyddgrug—trysor gwerthfawr o'r Amgueddfa Brydeinig—yn cael ei harddangos yn Wrecsam. Ni allai hynny fod wedi digwydd heb fuddsoddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, yr wyf yn hoff iawn o ddiwylliant, ac ymunaf â chi i gefnogi unrhyw fuddsoddiad o'r fath yn fy etholaeth i yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy. Buom yn sôn yn gynharach am y Gemau Olympaidd a Gemau'r Gymanwlad, felly, pe bai medal aur am dwyllo rhywun, a fyddai'r artist y talwyd £12,000 iddo gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru am arddangos ystafell wag yn ennill? Yr oedd yn eithaf eironig, ac yn gysyniad diddorol mewn celfyddyd.

**Alun Pugh:** Fel y gwyddoch, Carl, nid fi sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau manwl ar arddangosfeydd na pherfformiadau; byddai'n hollol amhriodol i Weinidog dros ddiwylliant wneud hynny. O ran bod yn hoff o ddiwylliant, os gallaf gael gafael ar ddau docyn ar gyfer *Cyfres y Fodrwy*, byddaf yn sicrhau y cewch chi wahoddiad.

### Diwrnod Owain Glyndŵr Owain Glyndŵr Day

**Q8 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is promoting Owain Glyndŵr day? OAQ1052(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Through Cadw, our historic environment service, the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales and our cultural institutions, such as the National Library of Wales and

**C8 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo diwrnod Owain Glyndŵr? OAQ1052(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Trwy Cadw, ein gwasanaeth amgylcheddol hanesyddol, Comisiwn Brenhinol Henebion Cymru a'n sefydliadau diwylliannol, megis Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru ac Amgueddfa Cymru, yr ydym wedi

Amgueddfa Cymru, we have supported a number of local initiatives and events that promote Owain Glyndŵr day.

**Leanne Wood:** In answer to a recent written question, you told me that only £500 had been spent commemorating Owain Glyndŵr this year. Given that he is such an important historic figure, who gets little attention in school history lessons, and that £500,000 was spent on Royal garden parties last year, do you agree that the Assembly should do much more to celebrate and commemorate the life and political action of Owain Glyndŵr?

**Alun Pugh:** I am responsible for many things in this job, but not for Royal garden parties, I am pleased to inform you. It is entirely appropriate that people celebrate Owain Glyndŵr day on 16 September. He was an important figure in many parts of Wales, including my home town of Ruthin.

**Mick Bates:** Scotland had Robert the Bruce and Wales has Glyndŵr and I entirely support making 16 September Glyndŵr's day. Minister, you know that the people of Machynlleth, under the leadership of Mr Henry Evans and Mr Wyn Thomas, are trying to build a better centre to commemorate the first parliament held there over 600 years ago by Owain Glyndŵr. Do you agree that Glyndŵr's first parliament in Machynlleth needs a better celebration and a building that includes a direct link to this Assembly so that the people of mid Wales may feel more engaged in the democratic process that takes place here and was originally founded by Owain Glyndŵr?

**Alun Pugh:** It is a fine building. I remember cycling past it on many occasions, but before I get involved in discussions about direct links from the Assembly, I need to be careful that I do not tread on the toes of the Assembly Parliamentary Service.

3.20 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** We too support the recognition of Owain Glyndŵr, mainly on the grounds

cefnogi nifer o fentrau a digwyddiadau lleol sy'n hyrwyddo diwrnod Owain Glyndŵr.

**Leanne Wood:** Wrth ateb cwestiwn ysgrifenedig yn ddiweddar, dywedasoch wrthyf mai £500 yn unig a oedd wedi ei wario ar goffâu Owain Glyndŵr eleni. O gofio ei fod yn ffigwr hanesyddol mor bwysig nad yw'n cael llawer o sylw mewn gwersi hanes yn yr ysgol, a bod £500,000 wedi ei wario ar arddwestau Brenhinol y llynedd, a gytuwch y dylai'r Cynulliad wneud llawer mwy i ddathlu a choffâu bywyd a gweithredoedd gwleidyddol Owain Glyndŵr?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn gyfrifol am nifer o bethau yn y swydd hon, ond nid wyf yn gyfrifol am arddwestau Brenhinol, mae'n dda gennyf ddweud. Mae'n hollol briodol i bobl ddathlu diwrnod Owain Glyndŵr ar 16 Medi. Yr oedd yn ffigwr pwysig mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys Rhuthun, fy nhref enedigol.

**Mick Bates:** Yr oedd gan yr Alban Robert the Bruce ac yr oedd gan Gymru Glyndŵr ac yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi'r nod o wneud 16 Medi yn ddiwrnod Glyndŵr. Weinidog, fe wyddoch fod pobl Machynlleth, o dan arweiniad Mr Henry Evans a Mr Wyn Thomas, yn ceisio adeiladu canolfan well i goffâu'r senedd gyntaf a gynhaliwyd yno dros 600 mlynedd yn ôl gan Owain Glyndŵr. A gytunwch fod angen dathliad gwell ar gyfer senedd gyntaf Glyndŵr ym Machynlleth, ac adeilad sy'n cynnwys cyswllt uniongyrchol â'r Cynulliad hwn er mwyn i bobl y canolbarth deimlo bod mwy o ran ganddynt yn y broses ddemocrataidd sy'n digwydd yma ac a sefydlwyd yn wreiddiol gan Owain Glyndŵr?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n adeilad hardd. Cofiaf seiclo heibio iddo lawer gwaith. Ond cyn imi ddechrau trafod cysylltiadau uniongyrchol o'r Cynulliad, mae angen imi ofalu nad wyf yn sathru ar draed Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr ydym ni hefyd yn cydnabod Owain Glyndŵr, yn bennaf am mai

that, philosophically, he was clearly a Conservative. [*Laughter.*] I have heard it mentioned that it may well be a national holiday. There is a move towards more national holidays across Europe, so do you agree that, the next time the number is increased, we should have a national holiday that is specific to Wales and that that holiday should be on 1 May? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: '1 March'.]

I am sorry, 1 March. [*Laughter.*]

**Alun Pugh:** Tempting though it is, Llywydd, I do not think that I want to be drawn too far down that path.

Ceidwadwr ydoedd, yn athronyddol. [*Chwerthin.*] Clywais sôn y gall fod yn wyl genedlaethol. Mae yna symudiad at greu mwy o wyliau cenedlaethol ledled Ewrop, felly, a gytunwch, y tro nesaf pan fydd cynnydd yn y nifer, y dylem gael gwyl genedlaethol sy'n benodol i Gymru ac y dylai'r wyl honno fod ar 1 Mai? [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: '1 Mawrth'.]

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, 1 Mawrth [*Chwerthin.*]

**Alun Pugh:** Er bod hynny'n atyniadol, Lywydd, ni chredaf fy mod am gael fy hynnu'n rhy bell ar hyd y llwybr hwnnw.

### **Ehangu Mynediad at Hyfforddiant Chwaraeon Widening Access to Sports Coaching**

**Q9 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on widening access to sports coaching in Wales? OAQ1051(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Through our coaching plan for Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government is investing £3.9 million to create an infrastructure that will deliver more and better coaches at all levels to support both the participation agenda and the performance pathway.

**John Griffiths:** Along with the rest of Wales, I will be roaring on our national side against the All Blacks on Saturday—sadly, this will be from my armchair rather than at the stadium. However, I think that you will agree that, if we are to have future success in rugby and a variety of other sports, it is vital that we widen access to sports coaching. In addition to that, this is important on a cross-cutting basis in terms of social inclusion, community development and many other aspects. Given all of the advantages and benefits that will come from widening access to sports coaching, can you assure me that you will look at further developments on that front, especially in our most deprived communities?

**Alun Pugh:** I am certainly happy to give you that assurance, John. We want to develop more coaches. As we know, participation

**C9 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ehangu mynediad i hyfforddiant chwaraeon yng Nghymru? OAQ1051(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Drwy ein cynllun hyfforddiant i Gymru, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn buddsoddi £3.9 miliwn i greu seilwaith a fydd yn darparu rhagor o hyfforddwyr a gwell hyfforddwyr ar bob lefel i gefnogi'r agenda cyfranogiad a'r llwybr perfformiad.

**John Griffiths:** Fel gweddill Cymru, byddaf yn gweiddi dros Gymru yn erbyn y Crysau Duon ddydd Sadwrn—yn anffodus, bydd hyn o'm cadair esmwyth yn hytrach nag o'r stadiwm. Fodd bynnag, credaf y cytunwch, er mwyn inni gael llwyddiant mewn rygbi ac amrywiaeth o chwaraeon eraill yn y dyfodol, ei bod yn hollbwysig inni ehangu mynediad i hyfforddiant chwaraeon. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae hyn yn bwysig ar draws pynciau o ran cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, datblygu cymunedol a nifer o agweddau eraill. O gofio'r manteision a'r buddiannau a ddaw yn sgil ehangu mynediad i hyfforddiant chwaraeon, a allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn ystyried datblygiadau pellach i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, yn enwedig yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn sicr yn falch o roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw, John. Yr ydym am ddatblygu rhagor o hyfforddwyr. Fel y

levels are at their lowest in the most deprived areas. Anyone watching this broadcast on television with a spare ticket for Saturday will no doubt be in touch.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I hope not; that is not what this place is for.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, I am sure that you will agree that teams from Wales compete in many different areas on a world stage. To arrive at that point, they need support, such as coaching, and encouragement as well as congratulations when they do exceptionally well. Would you, therefore, join me in congratulating the Wales national culinary team, which, this week, gained a silver medal for its hot kitchen and a bronze medal for its cold buffet? The team is now waiting to see its overall place in the world culinary games, which have just taken place. I know that the chefs were a little disappointed with the bronze for the cold buffet, but would you not agree that the team has done exceptionally well and that the team members are marvellous ambassadors for Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** I am always happy to celebrate the success of people from Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question was about sport. As far as I am concerned, Welsh culinary matters are not a matter for sport; they are very serious.

gwyddom, mae lefelau cyfranogiad ar eu hisaf yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Bydd unrhyw un sy'n gwylio'r darllediad hwn ar y teledu ac sydd â thocyn sbâr ar gyfer dydd Sadwrn mewn cysylltiad, mae'n siŵr.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gobeithio na fydd; nid dyna yw diben y lle hwn.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod timau o Gymru'n cystadlu mewn llawer maes gwahanol ar lwyfan byd. Er mwyn cyrraedd y fan honno, mae angen cefnogaeth arnynt, megis hyfforddiant, ac anogaeth yn ogystal â chanmoliaeth pan fyddant yn gwneud yn arbennig o dda. Felly, a ymunwch â mi i longyfarch tîm coginio cenedlaethol Cymru a enillodd fedal arian yr wythnos hon am ei fwyd cegin poeth, a medal efydd am ei fwyd bwffe oer? Mae'r tîm yn awr yn disgwyl gweld beth yw ei safle cyffredinol yng ngemau coginio'r byd, sydd newydd eu cynnal. Gwn fod y cogyddion braidd yn siomedig â'r fedal efydd am y bwyd bwffe oer, ond oni chytunwch fod y tîm wedi gwneud yn arbennig o dda, a bod aelodau'r tîm yn llysenhadon gwych i Gymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf bob amser yn hapus i ddatlu llwyddiant pobl o Gymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Chwaraeon oedd testun y cwestiwn hwn. O'm rhan i, nid testun chwarae yw materion coginio Cymru; maent yn bwnc difrifol iawn.

### Cydbwysedd y Gyllideb The Balance of Funding

**Q10 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the balance of funding between men and women participating in sport in Wales? OAQ1016(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I have made it clear in 'Climbing Higher: Next Steps' that I expect all key partners involved in helping to drive forward our Climbing Higher agenda to ensure that levels of investment are targeted towards the provision of equal access to sport for all.

**C10 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gydbwysedd y gyllideb ar gyfer dynion a menywod sy'n cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yng Nghymru? OAQ1016(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf wedi egluro yn 'Dringo'n Uwch: Camau Nesaf' fy mod yn disgwyl i bob partner allweddol sy'n helpu datblygu ein hagenda Dringo'n Uwch sicrhau bod lefelau buddsoddiad yn anelu at sicrhau bod pawb yn cael mynediad cyfartal i chwaraeon.



**Eleanor Burnham:** That is all very well, but my understanding is that we need to encourage more women to take up sport. What innovative ways do you and the Welsh Assembly Government have to try to encourage more participation generally, but also to ensure more equality between men and women in sports participation in Wales?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Digon hawdd dweud hynny, ond deallaf fod angen inni annog mwy o ferched i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon. Pa ffyrdd arloesol sydd gennych chi a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i geisio annog mwy o bobl i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yn gyffredinol, ond hefyd i sicrhau bod mwy o gydraddoldeb rhwng dynion a merched ynglŷn â chymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** If you look at the Assembly Government's commitment to deliver free swimming, the reason why we chose swimming, which is a substantial area of Assembly Government investment, is that swimming is an activity that brings in both genders in broadly equal numbers. It also tends not to discriminate against people on the grounds of age. Therefore, there is a strong anti-discriminatory element in everything that we do in terms of our sport agenda.

**Alun Pugh:** Os edrychwch ar ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu nofio am ddim, y rheswm pam y dewiswyd nofio y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi llawer ynddo, yw bod nofio'n weithgaredd sy'n denu'r un nifer o ddynion a merched yn fras. Mae hefyd yn tueddu i beidio â gwahaniaethu yn erbyn pobl ar sail oedran. Felly, mae elfen wrth-wahaniaethol gref ym mhopeth a wnawn o ran ein agenda chwaraeon.

**Alun Cairns:** Minister, do you accept that many young girls get turned off sport for whatever reason as soon as they reach their teenage years? In some schools, that is almost accepted as the norm. A strong message needs to go out to secure long-term activity in sport, particularly from that age, in order to improve health and wellbeing.

**Alun Cairns:** Weinidog, a ydych yn derbyn bod llawer o ferched ifanc yn diflasu ar chwaraeon am ba reswm bynnag cyn gynted ag y byddant yn cyrraedd eu harddegau? Mewn rhai ysgolion, derbynnir hynny bron fel y peth arferol. Mae angen cyfleu neges gref i sicrhau gweithgaredd hirdymor mewn chwaraeon, yn arbennig o'r oedran hwnnw, er mwyn gwella iechyd a lles.

**Alun Pugh:** I agree with much of that, Alun. It is important that schools develop appropriate and popular activities that promote the level of cardiovascular activity that we want to achieve for our wider health aims.

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf â llawer o hynny, Alun. Mae'n bwysig i ysgolion ddatblygu gweithgareddau priodol a phoblogaidd sy'n hyrwyddo lefel y gweithgaredd cardiofasgwlaidd yr ydym am ei sicrhau ar gyfer ein nodau iechyd ehangach.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am in contact with a number of sports clubs across the region that I represent, including Trimsaran Rugby Football Club, which is seeking to upgrade its facilities in order to be able to run girls' and boys' teams. It is equally true that sports that have traditionally been associated with girls—such as aerobics and keep fit—want to attract young men. Do you have any suggestions for those organisations as to where to go for funding, because they are experiencing considerable difficulty? They are grateful for the money provided for increased coaching, but, as they are now

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae gennyf gysylltiad â nifer o glybiau chwaraeon ar draws y rhanbarth a gynrychiolaf, gan gynnwys Clwb Rygbi Trimsaran, sy'n ceisio gwella'i gyfleusterau er mwyn gallu cynnal timau i ferched a bechgyn. Mae'r un mor wir fod chwaraeon sydd wedi eu cysylltu'n draddodiadol â merched—megis erobeg a chadw'n heini—am ddenu dynion ifanc. A oes gennych unrhyw awgrymiadau ar gyfer y sefydliadau hynny o ran ble i fynd am gyllid, oherwydd maent yn cael cryn anhawster? Maent yn ddiolchgar am yr arian a ddarperir ar gyfer mwy o hyfforddiant, ond gan eu bod

getting a big response to that initiative, the physical facilities are not there, in terms of changing rooms and so on, to enable them to retain those young people. Do you have any suggestions as to where we might go to ensure that those young people who have been involved in some of the work that the Government has funded, do not lose interest because the standard of facilities are not up to scratch with what is expected in the twenty-first century?

**Alun Pugh:** It is good to see growth in girls' sports, certainly in sports that have been traditionally seen as sports for boys and men; I think that we have a former secretary of the Welsh women's rugby union in the public gallery this afternoon. It has also been great to see the growth in girls' football. The Sports Council for Wales is our primary delivery agent, together with our partnership with local government, so organisations need to talk to the sports council.

bellach yn cael ymateb mawr i'r fenter honno, nid yw'r cyfleusterau ffisegol yno, o ran ystafelloedd newid, ac yn y blaen, i'w galluogi i gadw'r bobl ifanc hynny. A oes gennych unrhyw awgrymiadau ble y gallem fynd i sicrhau nad yw'r bobl ifanc hynny sydd wedi ymwneud â rhywfaint o'r gwaith y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ei ariannu, yn colli diddordeb gan nad yw safon y cyfleusterau crystal ag a ddisgwylir yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n dda gweld twf mewn chwaraeon i ferched, yn sicr mewn chwaraeon a ystyriwyd yn draddodiadol yn chwaraeon i fechgyn a dynion; credaf fod cyn ysgrifennydd undeb rygbi merched Cymru yn yr oriel gyhoeddus y prynhawn yma. Mae wedi bod yn wych gweld twf mewn pêldroed i ferched hefyd. Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yw ein prif gyfrwng darparu, ynghyd â'n partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol, felly, mae angen i sefydliadau siarad â'r cyngor chwaraeon.

### Theatrau Ieuentid Youth Theatres

**Q11 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on youth theatres in north Wales? OAQ1044(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** There is an excellent network of theatres across north Wales that are committed to delivering high quality and inclusive youth theatre. These include theatre in the community, the National Youth Theatre of Wales, Flintshire Youth Theatre and the theatre in education work of Clwyd Theatr Cymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** I will start by declaring an interest; my wife is a member of the steering group of Flintshire Youth Theatre. Youth theatre can play a great role in engaging young people, giving them something positive to do and building self-esteem. However, organisations such as Flintshire Youth Theatre say that they are living a hand-to-mouth existence. I appreciate your budget constraints, but what actions do you propose to put such youth theatres on a sustainable footing and to engage them on a cross-departmental basis with your colleagues in the wider social regeneration

**C11 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am theatrau ieuentid yn y gogledd? OAQ1044(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae rhwydwaith rhagorol o theatrau ledled y gogledd sydd wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu theatr ieuentid gynhwysol o safon. Mae hyn yn cynnwys theatr yn y gymuned, Theatr Genedlaethol Ieuentid Cymru, Theatr Ieuentid Sir y Fflint a gwaith theatr mewn addysg gan Clwyd Theatr Cymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan buddiant; mae fy ngwraig yn aelod o grŵp llywio Theatr Ieuentid Sir y Fflint. Gall theatr ieuentid fod yn bwysig iawn wrth gynnwys pobl ifanc, rhoi rhywbeth cadarnhaol iddynt ei wneud a chynyddu hunan barch. Fodd bynnag, mae sefydliadau megis Theatr Ieuentid Sir y Fflint yn dweud eu bod yn gorfod byw drwy ddal llygoden a'i bwyta. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi eich cyfyngiadau o ran cyllideb, ond pa gamau y bwriadwch eu cymryd i roi theatrau ieuentid ar sail gynaliadwy a'u cynnwys ar sail drawsadrannol gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn yr

agenda?

**Alun Pugh:** We have made a major investment in theatre in recent years, and there will be further investment forthcoming, in terms of capital—the Merthyr project, which is a Heads of the Valleys project, is a key part of that—and there is also broader support for English-language theatre. The final culture budget is a matter for negotiation and agreement in the National Assembly, and I look forward to your support for culture, sport and the Welsh language in the budget round.

agenda adfywio cymdeithasol ehangach?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi llawer mewn theatrau dros y blynydoedd diwethaf, a byddwn yn darparu mwy maes o law, o ran cyfalaf—mae prosiect Merthyr, sef prosiect Blaenau'r Cymoedd, yn rhan o hynny—ac mae cefnogaeth ehangach hefyd i theatr Saesneg. Mater i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei drafod ar y cyd a chytuno arno yw'r gyllideb ddiwylliant derfynol, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael eich cefnogaeth i ddiwylliant, chwaraeon a'r iaith Gymraeg yn y cylch gyllideb.

### **Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee**

**Y Llywydd:** Ni chyflwynwyd unrhyw gwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ.

**The Presiding Officer:** No questions have been tabled to the House Committee.

### **Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have come forward with a revised business statement in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 5.4 and 5.5. The draft statement can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno datganiad busnes diwygiedig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhifau 5.4 a 5.5. Mae'r datganiad drafft ar gael ar we'r Siambr o dan y dogfennau ategol.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. Galwaf am sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see there are none. I call for comments on the business statement.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Trefnydd am ymateb ac am gytuno i ddatganiad ar y rhaglen gydgyfeirio cyn i'r ddogfen gael ei chyflwyno i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Ond, tra'n bod yn gwerthfawrogi hynny, nid ydym yn tynnu'r cais am ddadl yn ôl. Diolchwn i'r Trefnydd am yr hyn y mae wedi'i addo heddiw, ac felly, ni fyddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad, ond cadwn yr hawl i ofyn am ddadl bellach, yn dibynnu ar gynnwys y drafodaeth ar y datganiad.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank the Minister for her response and for agreeing to a statement on the convergence programme before the document is presented to the European Commission. However, while we appreciate that, we do not withdraw the request for a debate. We thank the Minister for what she has promised today, so we will not be opposing the statement, but we retain the right to request a further debate, depending on the contents of the discussion of the statement.

3.30 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** Thank you, Minister, for the oral statement on the convergence funding programme, which will take place on 12

**Lisa Francis:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am y datganiad llafar ar y rhaglen cydgyfeirio cyllid, a gynhelir ar 12 Rhagfyr. Dylai'r

December. The poorest parts of Wales should get about £1.3 billion of convergence funding between 2007 and 2013, and it is only fair that the Assembly should have a scrutiny opportunity. In fact, I would go further and reiterate the words of the leader of the opposition and suggest that, if you are keen to receive input from the whole Assembly on this programme, you will consider holding a debate in the near future. Respectfully, I ask you to consider that.

I am sure that you will have heard the people outside the Senedd today who have been in exceptionally good voice. After all, we are here to listen to the people of Wales. In light of that, perhaps you would also consider giving us a debate on the future of our community hospitals. I wish to add that, for those Assembly Members who did not manage to get out there to listen to their constituents today, there is still an opportunity to do so because they are still out there.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank the Business Minister for listening to the concerns that were raised yesterday regarding the convergence document. It is a start to have the opportunity for a statement, although we would have preferred a full debate on this. However, we recognise that the Minister has moved in some way to accommodate the wishes expressed yesterday.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Ieuan, Lisa and Kirsty, I think that an oral statement is the appropriate way to handle this. For the record, I wish to say again that the draft programmes have been amended as a direct result of many constructive and useful comments received during the consultation. That includes the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee meeting on 20 September and the European and External Affairs Committee meeting on 27 September. Again, for the record, those comments were then fed into the document. However, I think that an oral statement is appropriate, and Brian, very appropriately, answered questions in relation to the openness and democracy of what we see in relation to these issues today. That is the appropriate way to deal with them. I am grateful that I was able to give this business statement.

rhannau tlotaf o Gymru gael tuag £1.3 biliwn o arian cydgyfeirio rhwng 2007 a 2013, ac mae'n ddigon teg y dylai'r Cynulliad gael cyfle i graffu. Yn wir, byddwn yn mynd ymhellach ac yn ail-bwysleisio geiriau arweinydd yr wrthblaid ac yn awgrymu, os ydych yn awyddus i gael cyfraniad gan y Cynulliad cyfan ar y rhaglen hon, y byddwch yn ystyried cynnal dadl yn y dyfodol agos. Gyda phob parch, gofynnaf ichi ystyried hynny.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi clywed y bobl y tu allan i'r Senedd heddiw sydd wedi bod yn ddigon uchel eu cloch. Wedi'r cyfan, yr ydym yma i wrando ar bobl Cymru. O gofio hynny, efallai y byddech hefyd yn ystyried rhoi dadl inni ar ddyfodol ein hysbytai cymuned. Hoffwn ychwanegu, i'r Aelodau hynny o'r Cynulliad a fethodd fynd allan i wrando ar eu hetholwyr heddiw, fod cyfle o hyd iddynt wneud hynny gan eu bod yno o hyd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i'r Trefnydd am wrando ar y pryderon a fynegwyd ddoe am y ddogfen gydgyfeirio. Mae cael cyfle am ddatganiad yn ddechreuad, er y byddai'n well gennym fod wedi cael dadl lawn ar y mater. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddwn fod y Gweinidog wedi symud mewn rhyw ffordd i fodloni'r dymuniadau a fynegwyd ddoe.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Ieuan, Lisa a Kirsty, credaf mai datganiad llafar yw'r ffordd briodol i ddelio â hyn. Er mwyn y cofnod, hoffwn ddatgan eto bod y rhaglenni drafft wedi'u diwygio o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i nifer o sylwadau adeiladol a defnyddiol a gafwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad. Mae hynny'n cynnwys cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ar 20 Medi a chyfarfod y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol ar 27 Medi. Eto, er mwyn y cofnod, cynhwyswyd y sylwadau hynny wedyn yn y ddogfen. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod datganiad llafar yn briodol, ac atebodd Brian, yn briodol iawn, gwestiynau mewn perthynas â natur agored a democratiaeth yr hyn a welwn o ran y materion hyn heddiw. Dyna'r ffordd briodol i ymdrin â hwy. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar fy mod wedi gallu rhoi'r datganiad busnes

hwn.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Datganiad am Ddyfodol Alcoa yn Abertawe Statement on the Future of Alcoa in Swansea**

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to make a statement on the proposed closure of the Alcoa plant. I was deeply disappointed, as I am sure were all Members, to hear the news yesterday that Alcoa has announced that the Waunarlwydd plant will close in March, subject to the outcome of the statutory 90-day consultation period. What made the news more difficult was that it came out of the blue without any consultation with the unions or the workforce in Swansea.

I will be meeting the company this Friday morning to discuss what might be done to keep the plant open and to offer any assistance that the Welsh Assembly Government can provide. I understand that the company is meeting the trade unions tomorrow. I am sure that I speak for all Members by saying that our thoughts are with the workforce and their families at this difficult time.

I visited the plant in 2002 to announce a £4.25 million regional selective assistance project, which was to support investment at the plant and to make it more competitive. Although the company has made claims against this grant, a substantial part of the offer is still available. However, I must make it clear—as I did to the company yesterday—that if the plant closes I will be looking to recover the £1.87 million that has been paid, although, to date, £2.5 million has been claimed.

The company has blamed the decision on three factors: rising energy costs—in terms of electricity and oil—high labour costs and material costs. We have discussed the issue of energy in the Chamber before. The Assembly Government responded to the UK Government energy review by stressing that high UK energy prices have a

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Diolch am roi'r cyfle imi wneud datganiad ar y cynnig i gau ffatri Alcoa. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig iawn, fel yr oedd pob Aelod, mae'n siŵr, o glywed y newyddion ddoe fod Alcoa wedi cyhoeddi y bydd ffatri Waunarlwydd yn cau ym mis Mawrth, yn amodol ar ganlyniad y cyfnod ymgynghori statudol o 90 diwrnod. Yr hyn a wnaeth y newyddion yn anos oedd ei fod mor annisgwyl ac na fu ymgynghori o gwbl â'r undebau na'r gweithlu yn Abertawe.

Byddaf yn cyfarfod â'r cwmni fore dydd Gwener i drafod beth y gellid ei wneud i gadw'r ffatri ar agor ac i gynnig unrhyw gymorth y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei roi. Deallaf fod y cwmni'n cyfarfod â'r undebau llafur yfory. Yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn siarad ar ran pob Aelod wrth ddweud ein bod yn cydymdeimlo â'r gweithlu a'u teuluoedd yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn.

Ymwelais â'r ffatri yn 2002 i gyhoeddi prosiect cymorth dewisol rhanbarthol gwerth £4.25 miliwn, a oedd i gefnogi buddsoddiad yn y ffatri a'i gwneud yn fwy cystadleuol. Er bod y cwmni wedi gwneud ceisiadau yn erbyn y grant hwn, mae rhan helaeth o'r cynnig ar gael o hyd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi egluro—fel yr eglurais wrth y cwmni ddoe—os bydd y ffatri'n cau, byddaf yn disgwyl adennill y £1.87 miliwn a dalwyd, er bod £2.5 miliwn wedi ei hawlio hyd yma.

Mae'r cwmni wedi beio tri ffactor am y penderfyniad: costau ynni uwch—o ran trydan ac olew—costau llafur uchel a chostau defnyddiau. Yr ydym wedi trafod ynni yn y Siambr o'r blaen. Ymatebodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adolygiad ynni Llywodraeth y DU drwy bwysleisio fod prisiau ynni uchel yn y DU yn cael effaith anghymesur o fawr

disproportionately large impact on Wales as we have a larger proportion of energy-intensive industry than any other part of the UK. We fully expect new gas supply infrastructure to be coming on-stream. This should, we hope, reduce energy prices, but obviously not in the short term.

The workers at Alcoa are highly skilled and operate complex machinery. Many are long-standing employees who earn wages relative to their skills. I hope that this does not come to pass, but should the closure proposals be confirmed, my officials and those in other departments—particularly those in Jane Davidson's department—will do everything possible to support the workforce to find new employment, including utilising the Objective 1-funded ReAct programme.

In addition, I am aware that suppliers to the company will be affected by this announcement. Following my meeting on Friday, my officials will be identifying and offering support to these suppliers.

**David Lloyd:** I thank the Minister for his statement. This is a devastating blow for Waunarlwydd. It is terrible news that we are losing 298 highly skilled jobs at Alcoa, which has a long-established factory in Waunarlwydd—it has been going since 1968, as the Minister will know. Many of us have grown up next to it and it seems to be a permanent fixture. The sudden announcement made late yesterday afternoon came out of the blue, as the Minister mentioned, and it has devastated the local area.

Alcoa is a worldwide premier aluminium smelting company, with profits of over \$1 billion last year. As I mentioned, this closure statement came without warning. We have had previous announcements here, and we have been pursuing with the Minister issues such as the Visteon situation. However, my first question is: what proactive work has been carried out with Alcoa over the last few years, but particularly over the last couple of months? I hear reports that a review procedure was in place in terms having of an early warning procedure, and, apparently, a package of cost-cutting proposals was put to

ar Gymru gan fod gennym gyfran uwch o ddiwydiannau ynni-ddwys nag unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. Yr ydym yn llawn ddisgwyl i seilwaith newydd cyflenwi nwy gael ei sicrhau. Dylai hyn, gobeithio, leihau prisiau ynni, ond yn amlwg nid yn y tymor byr.

Mae'r gweithwyr yn Alcoa yn fedrus iawn ac yn gweithio peiriannau cymhleth. Mae nifer wedi bod yn gweithio yno ers amser ac yn ennill cyflogau sy'n adlewyrchu eu sgiliau. Gobeithio na ddaw i hyn, ond os caiff y cynigion i gau'r ffatri eu cadarnhau, bydd fy swyddogion a swyddogion adrannau eraill—yn arbennig swyddogion adran Jane Davidson—yn gwneud popeth posibl i helpu'r gweithlu i gael swyddi newydd, gan gynnwys defnyddio rhaglen ReAct sy'n cael ei hariannu gan Amcan 1.

Yn ogystal, yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd y cyhoeddiad hwn yn effeithio ar gyflenwyr y cwmni. Ar ôl fy nghyfarfod ddydd Gwener, bydd fy swyddogion yn nodi'r cyflenwyr hyn ac yn cynnig cymorth iddynt.

**David Lloyd:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Mae hon yn ergyd drychinebus i Waunarlwydd. Mae'n newyddion ofnadwy ein bod yn colli 298 o swyddi medrus yn Alcoa, sydd wedi bod â ffatri yn Waunarlwydd ers amser—agorodd yn 1968, fel y gwyr y Gweinidog. Mae nifer ohonom wedi cael ein magu yn y cyffiniau ac yn ei hystyried yn rhan barhaol o'r ardal. Yr oedd y cyhoeddiad sydyn a wnaed yn hwyr brynhawn ddoe yn gwbl annisgwyl, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, ac mae wedi llorio'r ardal leol.

Mae Alcoa yn gwmni mwyndoddi alwminiwm byd-eang o'r radd flaenaf, a gwnaeth elw o fwy nag \$1 biliwn y llynedd. Fel y crybwyllais, ni fu unrhyw rybudd am y datganiad hwn ynghylch cau. Cawsom gyhoeddiadau yma o'r blaen, ac yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod materion megis sefyllfa Visteon gyda'r Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, fy nghwestiwn cyntaf yw: pa waith rhagweithiol a wnaed gydag Alcoa yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn arbennig yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf? Clywaf adroddiadau fod gweithdrefn adolygu ar waith i sefydlu gweithdrefn i rybuddio'n gynnar, ac yn ôl

the workforce a few months ago. Is that the case? I am trying to ascertain details of fact.

How much did the Minister know about this review procedure, and what did he do with that knowledge? We keep having such announcements and we keep being told that these announcements come from out of the blue. We also keep hearing, on the other hand, that we have strategies in place so that such things do not come out of the blue in terms of things appearing on your radar and all the proactive work that has been going on. Therefore, what proactive work has been taking place with Alcoa over the last couple of months, in view of the fact that £2.5 million of public money has been ploughed into Alcoa, as you mentioned, and there is more to be claimed, apparently?

My second point concerns the appropriateness of a rescue plan. As I said, there are 298 highly skilled jobs and there will be a knock-on effect on the suppliers, as you mentioned. How confident are you of the success of any rescue plans to keep Alcoa working as it is? What thoughts are you formulating, prior to any meetings later this week, regarding what sort of rescue plans you intend to adopt?

My final point concerns the bigger picture in terms of the lack of employment protection for workers in the UK generally. This is a devastating blow at Alcoa, which is just down the road from the Dewhirst factory in Fforest-fach, where, a few years ago, we lost 435 manufacturing jobs. It is in the same area, which I know well from my GP and county-councillor days. This is a further blow of the same magnitude as that which hit Dewhirst a few years ago.

That is the point about the lack of employment protection. It seems that it is cheaper, easier and faster to sack workers in Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom than it is in the rest of Europe. We are aware that European legislation to strengthen the rights of workers has been blocked by Labour Members of the European Parliament in the past. Following this latest blow to our manufacturing base, what representations is

pob tebyg, cyflwynwyd pecyn o gynigion torri costau i'r gweithlu ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. A yw hynny'n wir? Yr wyf yn awyddus i gadarnhau'r ffeithiau.

Faint a wyddai'r Gweinidog am y weithdrefn adolygu hon, a beth a wnaeth â'r wybodaeth honno? Mae cyhoeddiadau fel hyn yn dod dro ar ôl tro, a dywedir wrthym dro ar ôl tro fod y cyhoeddiadau hyn yn gwbl annisgwyl. Clywn hefyd, ar y llaw arall, fod gennym strategaethau ar waith i sicrhau na fydd cyhoeddiadau annisgwyl o'r fath o ran sicrhau eich bod yn ymwybodol o broblemau a'r holl waith rhagweithiol sydd wedi mynd ymlaen. Felly, pa waith rhagweithiol sydd wedi mynd ymlaen gydag Alcoa yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, o gofio bod £2.5 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus wedi ei fuddsoddi yng nghwmni Alcoa, fel yr oeddech yn sôn, a bod mwy ar gael iddo, mae'n ymddangos?

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â phriodolrwydd cynllun achub. Fel y dywedais, mae yno 298 o sgiliau medrus a bydd sgîl-effaith ar y cyflenwyr, fel yr oeddech yn sôn. Pa mor hyderus ydych chi am lwyddiant unrhyw gynlluniau achub i gadw Alcoa i weithredu fel y mae? Pa syniadau sydd gennych, cyn unrhyw gyfarfodydd yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon, am y math o gynlluniau achub y bwriadwch eu mabwysiadu?

Mae a wnelo fy mhwynt olaf â'r darlun mwy o ran diffyg diogelwch cyflogaeth i weithwyr yn y DU yn gyffredinol. Mae hon yn ergyd drom yn Alcoa, sydd nid nepell o ffatri Dewhirst yn Fforest-fach, lle collwyd 435 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae yn yr un ardal, ac yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â hi o'm dyddiau fel meddyg teulu a chynghorydd sir. Mae hon yn ergyd arall sydd mor drwm â'r ergyd ar Dewhirst ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl.

Dyna'r pwynt ynglŷn â diffyg diogelwch cyflogaeth. Ymddengys ei bod yn rhatach, yn haws ac yn gyflymach diswyddo gweithwyr yng Nghymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig nag yng ngweddill Ewrop. Gewyddom fod deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd i atgyfnerthu hawliau gweithwyr wedi'i hatal gan Aelodau Llafur Senedd Ewrop yn y gorffennol. Yn dilyn yr ergyd ddiweddaraf hon i'n sail gweithgynhyrchu, pa sylwadau y mae'r

the Minister making to his colleagues at a variety of levels on the need to strengthen employment legislation to protect the workers of Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** Once again, I think that all that we should be saying is that our thoughts are with the workers and those affected by this announcement at this time. In terms of proactive support, as I said, the Government and my department have been working with the company for many years. The latest investment package that we agreed with the company in 2002 was for just over £4 million. The company has drawn down £1.87 million of that sum, although another claim has been made but has not been paid.

3.40 p.m.

There have been concerns about costs at the plant for some time, and the workforce and unions have been intimately involved in those discussions. While the company is profitable globally, at the group level, the Swansea plant has been losing money for some time, which has been acknowledged by the local workforce. I heard an interview on the radio this morning, where one of the workers said that they understand that issue. A package was put to the workforce in April regarding a cost-cutting measure, and there was a majority vote against that. That may well be when the company decided to close the plant—I do not know; I will explore that with the company on Friday. However, it is an awful dilemma for workers to be in. Alcoa is not the only place where this is happening—at TRW in Resolven, and in many other locations, workers are being given an awful choice between reducing their terms and conditions and accepting the closure of the plant. I do not believe that anyone is comfortable in that position.

Therefore, we have done everything that we can as a Government, and my department has been in regular discussions with the company. I meet regularly with the trade unions—both Amicus and TGWU—about this position. However, in Alcoa's case, and unlike other recent announcements, this is not about production being moved overseas, to other parts of Europe, or to Asia. Alcoa made

Gweinidog yn eu gwneud i'w gyd-Aelodau ar amrywiol lefelau am yr angen i atgyfnerthu deddfwriaeth cyflogaeth i ddiogelu gweithwyr Cymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Unwaith eto, credaf mai'r cyfan y dylem ei ddweud ar hyn o bryd yw ein bod yn cydymdeimlo â'r gweithwyr a'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn. O ran cymorth rhagweithiol, fel y dywedais, bu'r Llywodraeth a'm hadran yn gweithio gyda'r cwmni ers blynnyddoedd. Yr oedd y pecyn buddsoddi diweddaraf y cytunwyd arno gyda'r cwmni yn 2002 yn werth ychydig dros £4 miliwn. Mae'r cwmni wedi hawlio £1.87 miliwn o'r swm hwnnw, er bod cais arall wedi'i wneud ond heb ei dalu.

Bu pryderon ynghylch costau yn y ffatri ers cryn amser, a bu'r gweithlu a'r undebau yn rhan bwysig o'r trafodaethau hynny. Er bod y cwmni'n gwneud elw ar lefel fyd-eang, ar lefel grŵp mae'r ffatri yn Abertawe wedi bod yn colli arian ers cryn amser, a chydabuwyd hynny gan y gweithlu lleol. Clywais gyfweiliad ar y radio y bore yma lle y dywedodd un o'r gweithwyr eu bod yn deall y mater hwnnw. Cyflwynwyd pecyn i'r gweithlu ym mis Ebrill ar fesur i leihau'r costau, a chafwyd pleidlais fwyafrifol yn erbyn y pecyn hwnnw. Mae'n ddigon posibl mai dyna pryd y penderfynodd y cwmni gau'r ffatri—ni wn; byddaf yn ymchwilio i hynny gyda'r cwmni ddydd Gwener. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gyfyng-gyngor anodd i'r gweithwyr. Nid yn Alcoa yn unig y mae hyn yn digwydd—yn TRW yn Resolven, ac mewn llawer man arall, mae gweithwyr yn cael dewis ofnadwy rhwng derbyn telerau ac amodau is a derbyn bod y ffatri'n cau. Ni chredaf fod neb yn gyfforddus yn y sefyllfa honno.

Felly, yr ydym wedi gwneud popeth a allwn fel Llywodraeth, ac mae fy adran wedi bod yn trafod yn rheolaidd gyda'r cwmni. Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'r undebau llafur—Amicus a TGWU—i drafod y sefyllfa hon. Fodd bynnag, yn achos Alcoa, ac yn wahanol i gyhoeddiadau eraill yn ddiweddar, nid mater o symud y broses gynhyrchu dramor, i rannau eraill o Ewrop, neu i Asia yw hyn.



it clear to me yesterday that it is exiting this part of the European market—the drinks can market. Therefore, it is pulling out of that area and is not looking to invest or shift production overseas.

Our focus at this time is to work with the unions and the company to see what possibility there is for maintaining production, and as many jobs as possible, in Swansea. In the first instance, we will be doing everything that we can to do that with the company. That will be the basis of the discussions on Friday. The company will also be holding discussions, which will be starting tomorrow; I understand that there is a meeting between the company, the local workforce, and union officials tomorrow to discuss the 90-day statutory period. I would not want to prejudice the outcome of those discussions.

However, we have made it clear that we stand ready to help the company, and, more importantly, the unions and the workforce, if those discussions are not successful. We have a good record in Wales of helping workers who have been affected by redundancy announcements. For example, well over 3,000 redundancies were announced at Corus in 2001; by the time that those redundancies came into operation, only just over 100 people in Wales were unemployed. Therefore, we have a good record of helping those affected by these announcements.

On employment protection, I made it clear that workers and unions should have greater rights in terms of consultation. However, as ever, it is a balance between employers' rights and ensuring that Wales, and the UK, is still the premier location for inward investment. The UK is still ahead of the rest of the European Union in terms of inward investment, and we want to keep the balance right between protecting workers' rights and their consultation rights, and continuing to punch above our weight in attracting inward investment.

**Alun Cairns:** In the first instance, our thoughts must go to those families and individuals who may well expect to lose their

Eglurodd Alcoa ddoe ei fod yn dod allan o'r rhan hon o'r farchnad Ewropeaidd—sef y farchnad caniau diodydd. Felly, mae'n rhoi'r gorau i'r maes hwnnw ac nid yw'n bwriadu buddsoddi na symud ei broses gynhyrchu dramor.

Ein blaenoriaeth ar hyn o bryd yw gweithio gyda'r undebau a'r cwmni i weld a oes unrhyw bosibilrwydd parhau i gynhyrchu, a chadw cynifer â phosibl o swyddi, yn Abertawe. I ddechrau, byddwn yn gwneud popeth a allwn i wneud hynny gyda'r cwmni. Dyna fydd sail y trafodaethau ddydd Gwener. Bydd y cwmni hefyd yn cynnal trafodaethau a fydd yn dechrau yfory; yr wyf ar ddeall fod cyfarfod wedi'i drefnu rhwng y cwmni, y gweithlu lleol a swyddogion undeb yfory i drafod y cyfnod statudol o 90 diwrnod. Ni fyddwn am ragfarnu canlyniad y trafodaethau hynny.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi egluro ein bod yn barod i helpu'r cwmni, ac, yn bwysicach, yr undebau a'r gweithlu, os na fydd y trafodaethau hynny'n llwyddiannus. Mae gennym record dda yng Nghymru o helpu gweithwyr sy'n dioddef oherwydd cyhoeddiadau diswyddo. Er enghraifft, cyhoeddwyd ymhell dros 3,000 o ddiswyddiadau yn Corus yn 2001; erbyn i'r diswyddiadau hynny ddod i rym, ychydig dros 100 yn unig o bobl yng Nghymru a gollodd eu swyddi. Felly, mae gennym record dda o helpu pobl yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiadau hyn.

O ran diogelwch cyflogaeth, eglurais y dylai fod gan weithwyr ac undebau fwy o hawliau o ran ymgynghori. Fodd bynnag, fel arfer mater o gydbwysedd yw hyn rhwng hawliau cyflogwyr a sicrhau bod Cymru, a'r DU, yn parhau'n lleoliad blaenllaw ar gyfer mewnfuddsoddi. Mae'r DU yn parhau ar y blaen i weddill yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o ran mewnfuddsoddi, ac yr ydym am gadw'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng diogelu hawliau gweithwyr a'u hawliau ymgynghori, a pharhau i lwyddo lawer yn fwy na'n maint wrth ddenu mewnfuddsoddi.

**Alun Cairns:** I ddechrau, rhaid inni gydymdeimlo â'r teuluoedd a'r unigolion hynny a fydd, yn ddigon posibl, yn colli eu

jobs. There cannot be a worse time of the year in which to hear such an announcement—just weeks before Christmas, with the outcome expected shortly after Christmas. For every one of those individuals, there will be a family that is looking forward to Christmas, and a mortgage that needs paying; many will have children, who will have the same expectations as every other child at this time of year.

Secondly, we need to recognise that the competitive position of the United Kingdom—and Wales within the United Kingdom—has deteriorated over recent years. That is recognised by international business studies; we were second some years ago on the international competitiveness index league table, and we have now dropped to fourteenth, which is worrying.

Allied to that is the recognition that we have lost more than 3,500 manufacturing jobs in Wales since 1 April. We need at least to accept that something is going wrong and that it is not working as we would like it to work. Matters may or may not be beyond our control, but there should be an acceptance and a recognition that things are not working as we would like.

For the wider economy, there is the value of the output to consider. It is a high-value output, the costs of aluminium continue to rise, and the economic position and the added value that this operation would provide Wales and the UK is quite significant. It is more significant for the Welsh figures, and will have a negative impact on gross value added. All of our goals are about raising the value of the Welsh economy, particularly in relation to GVA.

Minister, could you clarify the position in terms of the £2.5 million that you quoted, as well as the £1.87 million that you said you hope to reclaim? I may have misunderstood what you said, but I would be grateful for clarification of that.

swyddi. Nid oes adeg waeth o'r flwyddyn i glywed cyhoeddiad o'r fath—ychydig wythnosau cyn y Nadolig, a'r canlyniad i'w ddisgwyl yn fuan ar ôl y Nadolig. I bob un o'r unigolion hynny, bydd yna deulu sy'n edrych ymlaen at y Nadolig, a morgais i'w dalu; bydd gan nifer ohonynt blant, a bydd gan y rheini yr un disgwyliadau â phob plentyn arall yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn.

Yn ail, mae angen inni gydnabod bod sefyllfa gystadleuol y Deyrnas Unedig—a Chymru yn y Deyrnas Unedig—wedi dirywio yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Cydnabyddir hynny gan astudiaethau busnes rhyngwladol; yr oeddem yn ail ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl ar dabl cynghrair y mynegai cystadleurwydd rhyngwladol. Yr ydym bellach wedi gostwng i'r pedwerydd safle ar ddeg, sy'n destun pryder.

Yn gysylltiedig â hynny mae'r gydnabyddiaeth ein bod wedi colli mwy na 3,500 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru er 1 Ebrill. Rhaid inni o leiaf dderbyn bod rhywbeth o'i le ac nad yw'n gweithio fel y byddem yn dymuno iddo weithio. Efallai fod pethau y tu hwnt i reolaeth neu ddim, ond dylid derbyn a chynabod nad yw pethau'n gweithio fel yr hoffem iddynt weithio.

O ran yr economi ehangach, mae gwerth yr allbwn i'w ystyried. Mae'n allbwn gwerth uchel, mae costau alwminiwm yn parhau i gynyddu, ac mae'r safle economaidd a'r gwerth ychwanegol a fyddai'n dod yn sgîl y gweithrediad hwn i Gymru a'r DU yn sylweddol. Mae'n fwy sylweddol o safbwynt ffigurau Cymru, a chaiff effaith negyddol ar y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Mae ein nodau i gyd yn ymwneud â chynyddu gwerth economi Cymru, yn enwedig o safbwynt GYC.

Weinidog, a allech egluro'r sefyllfa yng nghyd-destun y £2.5 miliwn a ddyfynnwyd gennych, yn ogystal â'r £1.87 miliwn y dywedasoed eich bod yn gobeithio'i adennill? Hwyrach imi gamdeall yr hyn a ddywedasoed, ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech egluro hynny.

It is easy to call for an early-warning system, and, if it is in place, or if a company is prepared to play ball with that system, it can help. On the other hand, the significance of such a system can be overstated, and the Welsh economy needs to be in a competitive position, offering better skills, better infrastructure and far more effective, efficient and productive Welsh operations. The responsibility lies with you, Minister, to deliver a wider infrastructure to allow a private sector organisation to flourish. I am not convinced at this time that we are in that position, having lost 3,500 jobs since April alone.

However, our first priority must be to seek to prevent the closure at every opportunity. I have no doubt that you will be making every effort in this respect, but a warm relationship with companies that receive regional selective assistance would be helpful to develop that ongoing relationship. Therefore, if an investment can take place that will make them more efficient, productive and competitive, that would be useful.

**Andrew Davies:** On your thoughts on the workforce, as you rightly say, there is never a good time for such an announcement, but this is a particularly difficult time. In terms of competitiveness, the reasons given by the company has for its proposal to close the plant are: energy prices—electricity and oil—the increase in raw material costs, and labour costs. There is nothing that Government can do about any of those three factors. We have gone from a position of the UK consistently having the lowest energy prices in the EU three years ago to one of rising energy prices—and not just in the UK, but across the European Union. Clearly, the major reason for that is the dramatic rise in demand for fossil fuels, particularly oil and gas, largely driven by increasing demand from China and India while the UK has suffered a decline in the supply of North sea oil and gas and an increasing dependence on importation. I do not think that Alcoa's decision can be criticised as a Government action; it is due to factors that are largely outside the Government's control, whether that is the UK Government or the Assembly Government.

Mae'n hawdd galw am system o rybuddion cynnar, ac os yw ar waith, neu os bydd cwmni'n barod i fabwysiadu'r system honno, gall fod o help. Ar y llaw arall, mae modd gorbwysleisio arwyddocâd system o'r fath, ac mae angen i economi Cymru fod mewn safle cystadleuol, gan gynnig gwell sgiliau, gwell seilwaith a gweithrediadau llawer mwy effeithiol, effeithlon a chynhyrchiol yng Nghymru. Arnoch chi mae'r cyfrifoldeb, Weinidog, i wireddu seilwaith ehangach er mwyn caniatáu i sefydliad sector preifat ffynnu. Nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi ar hyn o bryd ein bod yn y sefyllfa honno, o gofio ein bod wedi colli 3,500 o swyddi ers Ebrill yn unig.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau mai ein blaenoriaeth gyntaf yw ceisio atal y ffatri rhag cau ar bob cyfle. Yr wyf yn hyderus y byddwch yn gwneud pob ymdrech yn y cyddestun hwn, ond byddai'n ddefnyddiol meithrin perthynas agos â chwmnïau sy'n cael cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i ddatblygu'r berthynas honno. Felly, byddai'n ddefnyddiol os gellir gwneud buddsoddiad a fydd yn eu gwneud yn fwy effeithlon, cynhyrchiol a chystadleuol.

**Andrew Davies:** O safbwynt eich sylwadau ar y gweithlu, fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud yn hollol gywir, nid oes amser da byth i wneud cyhoeddiad o'r fath, ond mae hyn yn gyfnod arbennig o anodd. O ran cystadleurwydd, dyma yw'r rhesymau a roddwyd gan y cwmni dros gynnig cau'r ffatri: prisiau ynni—trydan ac olew—y cynnydd mewn costau deunydd crai a chostau llafur. Nid oes dim y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud ynghylch yr un o'r tri ffactor hwnnw. Yr ydym wedi mynd o sefyllfa lle gwelwyd yn gyson mai'r DU oedd â'r prisiau ynni isaf yn yr UE dair blynedd yn ôl i sefyllfa o brisiau ynni cynyddol—ac nid yn y DU yn unig, ond ledled yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn amlwg, y prif reswm dros hyn yw'r cynnydd aruthrol yn y galw am danwyddau ffosil, yn enwedig olew a nwy, sy'n cael ei ysgogi'n bennaf gan alw cynyddol o Tsiena ac India, tra mae'r DU wedi gweld gostyngiad yn y cyflenwad olew a nwy o fôr y Gogledd a dibyniaeth gynyddol ar fewnforio. Ni chredaf y gellir beirniadu penderfyniad Alcoa fel gweithred o du'r Llywodraeth; mae'n tarddu o ffactorau sydd i raddau helaeth y tu hwnt i reolaeth y

Llywodraeth, boed yn Llywodraeth y DU neu Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Jobs have been lost since 1 April, but you must also bear in mind that a considerably greater number of jobs has been created. The latest official employment statistics show an increase of 23,000 jobs in Wales, or 1.7 per cent of people in employment, compared with the preceding quarter. Therefore, we have been extremely successful in creating employment across a wide range of sectors, including manufacturing.

Mae swyddi wedi eu colli er 1 Ebrill, ond rhaid ichi gofio bod niferoedd sylweddol uwch o swyddi wedi eu creu hefyd. Mae'r ystadegau cyflogaeth swyddogol diweddaraf yn dangos cynnydd o 23,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru, neu 1.7 y cant o bobl mewn cyflogaeth, o'u cymharu â'r chwarter blaenorol. Felly, yr ydym wedi bod yn llwyddiannus tu hwnt wrth greu cyflogaeth mewn ystod eang o sectorau, gan gynnwys gweithgynhyrchu.

3.50 p.m.

Manufacturing is changing, as I have said on many occasions; we are going from high-volume, low-value-added production to low-volume, higher-value-added production. The recent announcement by G24i, the manufacturer of new solar technology, is an example of the way in which industry and manufacturing is going.

Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud droeon, mae gweithgynhyrchu'n newid; yr ydym yn symud o gynhyrchiant ar raddfa fawr, gwerth ychwanegol is i gynhyrchiant ar raddfa lai gyda gwerth ychwanegol uwch. Mae'r cyhoeddiad yn ddiweddar gan G24i, y gweithgynhyrchwr technoleg solar newydd, yn enghraifft o'r cyfeiriad y mae diwydiant a gweithgynhyrchu yn symud iddo.

In addition to citing the Corus example, I will refer to the fact that, in June 2005, Sony announced the closure of its television manufacturing plant in Bridgend. Of the 650 employees affected by that decision, the unions and the company have told me that the only people who remain unemployed are those who are not looking for work. In many cases, those workers found work that paid more. Therefore, I am quite confident that we will be able to help those affected by this announcement, but I still hope that it will not come to that.

Yn ogystal â chyfeirio at enghraifft Corus, cyfeirir at y ffaith fod Sony, ym Mehefin 2005, wedi cyhoeddi y byddai ei ffatri gweithgynhyrchu setiau teledu ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn cau. O'r 650 o weithwyr yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan y penderfyniad hwnnw, yn ôl yr undebau a'r cwmni, yr unig rai sy'n parhau'n ddi-waith yw'r bobl hynny nad ydynt yn chwilio am waith. Mewn llawer achos, cafodd y gweithwyr hynny waith a oedd yn talu mwy. Felly, yr wyf yn hyderus y byddwn yn gallu estyn cymorth i'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn. Ond yr wyf yn dal i obeithio na ddaw i hynny.

To clarify the situation on the regional selective assistance grant, my understanding is that the company has claimed in the region of £2.5 million; however, only £1.87 million has been paid. I made it clear to the company yesterday, and the local plant management has made the parent company at its New York headquarters aware, that we will be seeking to reclaim the £1.87 million, because it is still within the conditions.

Er mwyn egluro'r sefyllfa am y grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, yn ôl a ddeallaf mae'r cwmni wedi gwneud cais am oddeutu £2.5 miliwn; fodd bynnag, dim ond £1.87 miliwn sydd wedi ei dalu. Eglurais wrth y cwmni ddoe, ac mae'r rheolwyr lleol yn y ffatri wedi rhoi gwybod i'r rhiant gwmni yn ei bencadlys yn Efrog Newydd, y byddwn yn ceisio adennill yr £1.87 miliwn, oherwydd bod hyn yn dal o fewn yr amodau.

**Peter Black:** I also thank you, Minister, for making this statement to the Assembly today.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf fi hefyd am ddiolch ichi, Weinidog, am wneud y datganiad hwn

Like previous speakers, I am saddened and disappointed by this terrible news, which will be a major blow to many families as they prepare for Christmas, and it will have a huge impact on the economy of Swansea. We cannot afford to see manufacturing jobs of this calibre lost from the city. I hope that your talks with the company and the trade unions bear some fruit in maintaining some employment prospects at the factory, even if you are not successful in keeping it open.

From the media interviews that I heard you give this morning, I understood that your officials had been in contact with Alcoa over the past few months, certainly since the package of cuts was discussed with the workforce last April. Do you know whether any indication was given to your officials that such an announcement was pending? Had they discussed the remainder of the RSA grant that was available to Alcoa and how it could utilise that money to remain on the site? We hope that the talks that you have will be successful, but what contingency measures are you putting in place to mitigate the impact of the loss of these jobs both on the city and the people concerned, by ensuring that they are able to find other jobs? I would be grateful for your views on those points, Minister.

**Andrew Davies:** The announcement came as a surprise. As I indicated earlier, we were aware of the difficulties that the plant was experiencing; however, in my discussions with the unions yesterday, they told me that they were not aware that this announcement was pending, although they had been in discussions with the company on the cost-cutting exercise back in the spring. They had concerns at that time that it might presage an announcement, but they were certainly taken by surprise with the timing. My officials, including the RSA case officer, had a very recent meeting with company representatives, on 6 November. To the best of my knowledge, the company gave no indication at that time that it was going to make this announcement.

In terms of mitigation, we will do everything that we can to keep as many jobs as possible in Swansea and to keep the operation going

i'r Cynulliad heddiw. Fel y siaradwyr blaenorol, yr wyf wedi fy nhristáu a'm siomi gan y newyddion ofnadwy hyn, a fydd yn ergyd drom i nifer o deuluoedd wrth iddynt baratoi at y Nadolig, a chaiff effaith fawr ar economi Abertawe. Ni allwn fforddio colli swyddi gweithgynhyrchu o'r safon hon o'r ddinas. Gobeithio y bydd eich trafodaethau gyda'r cwmni a'r undebau llafur yn dwyn ffrwyth wrth gynnal rhywfaint o ragolygon cyflogaeth yn y ffatri, hyd yn oed os na lwyddwch i'w chadw ar agor.

O'r hyn a glywais o'r cyfweiliadau a roesoch y bore yma i'r cyfryngau, deallaf i'ch swyddogion fod mewn cysylltiad ag Alcoa dros y misoedd diwethaf, yn sicr ers trafod y pecyn toriadau gyda'r gweithlu fis Ebrill diwethaf. A wyddoch a roddwyd unrhyw arwydd i'ch swyddogion fod cyhoeddiad o'r fath yn yr arfaeth? A fuont yn trafod gweddill y grant RSA a oedd ar gael i Alcoa a sut y gellid defnyddio'r arian hwnnw i barhau ar y safle? Gobeithio y bydd y trafodaethau a gewch yn llwyddiannus, ond pa fesurau wrth gefn yr ydych yn eu rhoi ar waith i liniaru effaith colli'r swyddi hyn ar y ddinas a'r bobl dan sylw, drwy sicrhau y dônt o hyd i swyddi eraill? Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau am y pwyntiau hynny, Weinidog.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr oedd y cyhoeddiad yn syndod. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr oeddem yn ymwybodol o'r anawsterau a oedd gan y ffatri. Fodd bynnag, yn fy nhrafodaethau gyda'r undebau ddoe, dywedwyd wrthyf nad oeddent yn ymwybodol bod y cyhoeddiad hwn yn yr arfaeth, er iddynt fod yn trafod gyda'r cwmni ynghylch yr ymarfer torri costau yn y gwanwyn. Yr oedd yn pryderu bryd hynny y gallai fod yn rhagarwydd o gyhoeddiad, ond yn sicr yr oedd yr amseru'n syndod iddynt. Cafodd fy swyddogion, gan gynnwys y swyddog achosion RSA, gyfarfod yn ddiweddar iawn gyda chynrychiolwyr y cwmni ar 6 Tachwedd. Hyd y gwn i, ni roddodd y cwmni unrhyw arwydd bryd hynny ei fod am wneud y cyhoeddiad hwn.

O ran lliniaru, byddwn yn gwneud popeth posibl i gadw cynifer â phosibl o swyddi yn Abertawe ac i gadw'r gweithredu yn y ffatri.

at the plant. However, if the company confirms this decision at the end of the 90-day consultation, we will do everything that we can, as Team Wales, to work with the company, the unions and the workforce to identify other opportunities for the workforce, whether through alternative employment, training or whatever the individual workers need and want. In the first instance, my concern is to try to keep the operation going.

**Val Lloyd:** Thank you for your statement, Minister. As you said, it is disappointing news that Alcoa has decided to shut this long-established Swansea plant. It is, of course, in your constituency, but many other AMs have constituents who work there, making it a widespread problem that will have economic knock-on effects. The decision therefore affects people around the Swansea area. As has been alluded to, the season also makes it a harder blow to bear. It is never good to hear such news, but, at this time of year, with the extra expense, it is all the more painful.

I am grateful for the comprehensive details that you have given of what you will do to assist the plant and, hopefully, to safeguard jobs. I know that you have highlighted and praised the workforce's specific skills, and have given your firm assurance in this regard, but would you emphasise that you will ensure that, in addition to what you have already outlined, support can be offered to the workforce if necessary to widen its skills base and to ensure that it has the optimum chance of continued employment, albeit elsewhere in the locality?

**Andrew Davies:** I more than happy to give that assurance. We have a good record in helping companies to turn their operations around, even in similar sectors. For example, when a similar proposal came forward from Dolgarrog Aluminium Ltd in north Wales, we worked with it, and we will explore every opportunity now. I will certainly not leave any stone unturned in exploring what we can do to keep the operation going in Swansea. If the company confirms its decision after the 90-day period, we will work with the

Fodd bynnag, os bydd y cwmni'n cadarnhau'r penderfyniad hwn ar ddiwedd y 90 diwrnod o ymgynghori, gwnawn bopeth a allwn fel Tîm Cymru i weithio gyda'r cwmni, yr undebau a'r gweithlu i nodi cyfleoedd eraill i'r gweithlu, boed drwy gyflogaeth arall, hyfforddiant neu beth bynnag fydd ar weithwyr unigol ei angen a'i eisiau. Yn y lle cyntaf, fy mhryder yw ceisio cadw'r gweithredu i fynd.

**Val Lloyd:** Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud, mae'n siomedig fod Alcoa wedi penderfynu cau'r ffatri sefydledig hon yn Abertawe. Wrth gwrs, mae yn eich etholaeth chi, ond mae gan nifer o AC etholwyr sy'n gweithio yno, sy'n golygu ei bod yn broblem eang a fydd yn cael sgil-ffeithiau economaidd. Mae'r penderfyniad, felly, yn effeithio ar bobl o amgylch ardal Abertawe. Fel y cyfeiriwyd, mae'r tymor yn ei gwneud yn ergyd drymach. Nid yw clywed newyddion fel hyn byth yn beth da, ond, ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, gyda'r gost ychwanegol, mae'n fwy poenus byth.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y manylion cynhwysfawr a roesoch am yr hyn y byddwch yn ei wneud i gynorthwyo'r ffatri, ac i ddiogelu swyddi, gobeithio. Gwn eich bod wedi tanlinellu a channol sgiliau penodol y gweithlu ac wedi rhoi'ch sicrwydd yn y cyd-destun hwn, ond a wnewch chi bwysleisio y byddwch yn sicrhau y gellir cynnig cymorth i'r gweithlu, os bydd angen, i ehangu ei sylfaen sgiliau a sicrhau y caiff y cyfle gorau posibl o ran cyflogaeth barhaus, er mewn mannau eraill yn yr ardal, hwyrach, yn ogystal â'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i amlinellu'n barod?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon rhoi'r sicrwydd hwnnw. Mae gennym enw da o ran helpu cwmnïau i adfer eu gweithrediadau, hyd yn oed mewn sectorau tebyg. Er enghraifft, pan ddaeth cynnig tebyg gan Dolgarrog Aluminium Ltd yn y gogledd, buom yn gweithio gyda'r cwmni, a byddwn yn ymchwilio i bob cyfle yn awr. Yn sicr, byddaf yn ymchwilio i bob posibilrwydd o ran yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i gadw'r gweithrediadau i fynd yn Abertawe. Os bydd y cwmni'n cadarnhau ei benderfyniad ar ôl y

workforce, the unions and the company to help those affected. We have a good track-record in doing that, as well as in putting together rescue packages and helping companies to invest. We will do everything that we can to help the company and the workers, whichever eventuality comes to pass.

**Edwina Hart:** As Val said, the plant is in your constituency of Swansea West, Andrew, but it is nevertheless close to my Gower constituency, and I have friends, neighbours and constituents who work at the plant, and who have enjoyed employment there since the 1960s. Those jobs have always been highly valued in the area. From talking to people who work there, I am aware of the hint of uncertainty that has surrounded the plant for the past 10 years—as is often the case with multinationals, which make decisions according to what is best for them in the marketplace, irrespective of the quality of the staff and any help that a regional government may be able to give them. I am pleased that your officials have engaged so well with Alcoa, and I hope that your meetings go well on Friday. I assure you that people in Wales would like Alcoa to stay there, with those well paid jobs.

My concern relates to the unions and the rights of workers, and I would like to see the same standards applied across Europe. What will you be doing to work with the unions to help to protect the interests of workers at the plant? This is particularly pertinent when you think that, at this time of year, it must be difficult for the families concerned, facing potential redundancies, and I want to ensure that the Assembly Government does everything that it can to engage with the union to look after the interests of workers at that plant.

**Andrew Davies:** The plant has gone through different cycles and, only four years ago, we were looking to invest to expand production there. Clearly, the market situation and the price of electricity and raw materials have made the operation difficult. However, as a Government, we have extremely good relations with the trade unions. I have been in

cyfnod o 90 diwrnod, byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r gweithlu, yr undebau a'r cwmni i helpu'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt. Mae gennym enw da wrth wneud hynny yn ogystal â llunio pecynnau adfer a helpu cwmnïau i fuddsoddi. Byddwn yn gwneud popeth a allwn i helpu'r cwmni a'r gweithwyr, waeth beth fydd yn digwydd.

**Edwina Hart:** Fel y dywedodd Val, mae'r ffatri yn eich etholaeth chi, Andrew, sef Gorllewin Abertawe. Serch hynny, mae'n agos i'm hetholaeth i ym Mhenrhyn Gŵyr ac mae gennyf ffrindiau, cymdogion ac etholwyr sy'n gweithio yn y ffatri ac sydd wedi'u cyflogi yno ers y 1960au. Mae gwerth mawr i'r swyddi hynny yn yr ardal. O siarad â'r bobl sy'n gweithio yno, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r awgrym o ansicrwydd sydd wedi amgylchynu'r ffatri ers 10 mlynedd—rhywbeth sy'n gyffredin gyda chwmnïau aml-wladol sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau yn ôl yr hyn sydd orau iddynt hwy yn y farchnad, waeth beth yw safon y staff ac unrhyw gymorth y gallai llywodraeth ranbarthol ei roi iddynt. Yr wyf yn falch fod eich swyddogion wedi ymgysylltu mor dda ag Alcoa, a gobeithio yr aiff eich cyfarfodydd yn dda ddydd Gwener. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau y byddai'n dda gan bobl yng Nghymru pe byddai Alcoa yn aros yno, gyda'r swyddi hynny sy'n talu cyflogau da.

Mae fy mhryder yn ymwneud â'r undebau a hawliau gweithwyr, a byddwn yn dymuno gweld defnyddio'r un safonau ledled Ewrop. Beth fyddwch chi'n ei wneud i weithio gyda'r undebau i helpu diogelu buddiannau'r gweithwyr yn y ffatri? Mae hyn yn arbennig o berthnasol pan feddyliwch, ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, ei bod yn anodd i'r teuluoedd dan sylw, mae'n siŵr, wrth iddynt wynebu diswyddiadau posibl, ac yr wyf am sicrhau y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud popeth a all i ymgysylltu â'r undeb i ddiogelu buddiannau'r gweithwyr yn y ffatri honno.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r ffatri wedi mynd drwy gylchoedd gwahanol, a chwta pedair blynedd yn ôl yr oeddem yn edrych ar fuddsoddi ac ehangu cynhyrchiant yno. Yn amlwg, mae sefyllfa'r farchnad a phris trydan a deunydd crai wedi ei gwneud yn anodd cynnal y gweithrediadau. Fodd bynnag, fel Llywodraeth mae gennym berthynas dda

regular dialogue with Paul Collier, the local full-time official with Amicus, Gareth Jones of the Transport and General Workers' Union, and Andy Richards, the regional secretary. We have had many discussions over many months about the operation at Alcoa, and I have made it clear to them, not least in the discussions that I had with them yesterday, that we will work closely with them on any rescue plan that we can put together with the company to keep the operation at Swansea. If the company confirms its plans, however, we will work with the unions and the workforce to identify alternative job or training opportunities. The unions have a central role to play, and we will work closely with them.

iawn â'r undebau llafur. Yr wyf wedi bod yn trafod yn rheolaidd gyda Paul Collier, y swyddog llawn amser lleol gydag Amicus, Gareth Jones o Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol ac Andy Richards yr ysgrifennydd rhanbarthol. Cawsom lawer trafodaeth dros nifer o fisoedd ynghylch y gweithrediad yn Alcoa ac yr wyf wedi egluro wrthynt, yn enwedig yn y trafodaethau a gefais gyda hwy ddoe, y byddwn yn gweithio'n agos gyda hwy ar unrhyw gynllun adfer y gallwn ei lunio gyda'r cwmni i gadw'r gweithrediad yn Abertawe. Os bydd y cwmni'n cadarnhau ei gynlluniau, fodd bynnag, byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r undebau a'r gweithlu i nodi cyfleoedd swyddi neu hyfforddiant amgen. Mae gan yr undebau ran ganolog i'w chwarae, a byddwn yn gweithio'n agos gyda hwy.

4.00 p.m.

### **Datganiad am Farwolaethau o Ganlyniad i Wenwyno Carbon Monocsid Statement on Deaths as a Result of Carbon Monoxide Poisoning**

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I am pleased to make this statement, as it highlights a serious issue—the dangers of carbon monoxide poisoning. Carbon monoxide gas is produced by burning fuel. As we know, it is poisonous and even breathing in a small amount can cause loss of consciousness and death. In the UK, more than 50 people die from accidental carbon monoxide poisoning every year. As it has no smell or colour, carbon monoxide is hard to detect. It is therefore easy to breathe it in without realising.

Carbon monoxide is produced when fuels such as gas, oil, coal and wood do not burn fully. When a fire burns in an enclosed room, the oxygen in the room is gradually used up and replaced with carbon dioxide. Following a build-up of carbon dioxide in the air, the fuel is prevented from burning fully, and starts releasing carbon monoxide instead.

The most common cause of carbon monoxide poisoning is the inadequate ventilation or poor maintenance of heating appliances in the home. Gas stoves, fires and boilers, gas-

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf yn falch gwneud y datganiad hwn, gan ei fod yn tynnu sylw at fater difrifol—peryglon gwenwyn carbon monocsid. Cynhyrchir nwy carbon monocsid drwy losgi tanwydd. Fel y gwyddom, mae'n wenwynig a gall hyd yn oed anadlu ychydig bach arwain at fynd yn anymwybodol a marw. Yn y DU, mae dros 50 o bobl yn marw o wenwyn carbon monocsid damweiniol bob blwyddyn. Gan nad oes iddo arogl na lliw, mae'n anodd canfod carbon monocsid. Mae'n hawdd ei anadlu felly yn ddiarwybod.

Cynhyrchir carbon monocsid pan na fydd tanwydd fel nwy, olew, glo a choed yn llosgi'n llawn. Pan fydd tân yn llosgi mewn ystafell gaeedig, caiff yr ocsigen yn yr ystafell ei ddefnyddio'n raddol a'i ddisodli gan garbon deuocsid. Ar ôl i garbon deuocsid gronni yn yr aer, caiff y tanwydd ei atal rhag llosgi'n llawn, a bydd yn dechrau rhyddhau carbon monocsid yn lle hynny.

Y rheswm mwyaf cyffredin dros wenwyn carbon monocsid yw system awyru annigonol neu ddiffyg cynnal a chadw cyfarpar gwresogi yn y cartref. Mae ffyrnau, tanau a



powered water heaters, paraffin heaters, solid-fuel powered stoves, boilers and room heaters are all potential sources. Carbon monoxide gas can be given off when an appliance is not working properly, if the flue is blocked or leaking, or if the room is not sufficiently ventilated.

By law, social and private landlords are generally responsible for making sure that gas fittings and flues are maintained in good order, and that gas appliances and flues are checked for safety once in a period of 12 months. They must also keep a record of the safety checks for at least two years, and issue the latest certificate to existing tenants and any new tenants before they move in. Regular safety checks of heating installations are also a requirement of the Welsh housing quality standard, which is applicable to all social housing landlords in Wales.

In the private rental sector, guidance on the housing health and safety rating system clearly states that landlords are responsible, for the purposes of enforcement, for the provision and proper working condition of gas, solid fuel and oil appliances. While carbon monoxide detectors provide a useful means of protection, they are no substitute for properly maintained appliances and flues. New research suggests that faulty gas appliances are still being used in many homes, and that public awareness of the risk of carbon monoxide poisoning is worryingly low.

The most reliable way of checking carbon monoxide levels in the home is to install a carbon monoxide detector. Such detectors are available from most DIY and hardware stores. However, they cannot be relied upon entirely as they are a warning system, and not a replacement for the regular servicing of appliances. Nevertheless, they can help save lives.

Health and safety is not, in general, devolved

boeleri nwy, gwresogyddion dŵr sy'n cael eu cynhesu gan gan nwy, gwresogyddion paraffin, ffyrnau sy'n cael eu cynhesu gan danwydd solet, boeleri a gwresogyddion ystafell i gyd yn ffynonellau posibl. Gall nwy carbon monocsid gael ei ryddhau pan na fydd cyfarpar yn gweithio'n iawn, os bydd y ffliw wedi'i rhwystro neu'n gollwng, neu os na fydd yr ystafell wedi'i hawyru'n ddigonol.

Yn ôl y gyfraith, mae landlordiaid cymdeithasol a phreifat yn gyfrifol yn gyffredinol am sicrhau bod ffitiadau a ffliwiau nwy yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw a'u bod mewn cyflwr da, a bod cyfarpar nwy a ffliwiau'n cael eu harchwilio unwaith bob 12 mis i sicrhau eu bod yn ddiogel. Rhaid iddynt hefyd gadw cofnod o'r archwiliadau diogelwch am o leiaf ddwy flynedd, a rhoi'r dystysgrif ddiweddaraf i denantiaid presennol ac unrhyw denantiaid newydd cyn iddynt symud i mewn. Mae gwneud archwiliadau diogelwch ar osodiadau gwresogi yn rheolaidd hefyd yn un o ofynion safon ansawdd tai Cymru, sy'n gymwys i bob landlord tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

Yn y sector rhentu preifat, mae canllawiau ar y system mesur iechyd a diogelwch ar gyfer tai yn dweud yn glir fod landlordiaid yn gyfrifol, at ddibenion gorfodi, am ddarparu cyfarpar nwy, tanwydd solet ac olew ac am sicrhau eu bod yn gweithio'n iawn. Er bod synwryddion carbon monocsid yn ddull diogelu defnyddiol, ni allant gymryd lle cyfarpar a ffliwiau sy'n cael eu cynnal a'u cadw'n briodol. Mae gwaith ymchwil newydd yn awgrymu bod cyfarpar nwy diffygiol yn dal i gael ei ddefnyddio mewn nifer o gartrefi, a bod ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o risg gwenwyn carbon monocsid yn bryderus o isel.

Y ffordd fwyaf dibynadwy i archwilio lefelau carbon monocsid yn y cartref yw gosod synwrydd carbon monocsid. Mae synwryddion o'r fath ar gael yn y rhan fwyaf o siopau DIY a nwyddau metel. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir dibynnu arnynt yn llwyr am mai system rybuddio ydynt, ac ni allant gymryd lle'r broses reolaidd o gynnal a chadw cyfarpar. Serch hynny, gallant helpu achub bywydau.

Yn gyffredinol, nid yw iechyd a diogelwch

to Wales, and there are no regulations requiring the installation of carbon monoxide detectors in homes. The Health and Safety Executive is currently reviewing domestic gas safety in the UK, and Welsh Assembly Government officials are working with HSE on that review to produce proposals that will put in place a modern and effective gas safety regime. Without wishing to prejudice the outcome of the gas safety review, I am considering what can be done to reduce the risk of carbon monoxide poisoning for vulnerable households in Wales.

The fire and rescue services aim to conduct some 50,000 home safety checks in Wales this coming year. I will ask the next meeting of the Wales Fire and Rescue Service Advisory Committee to consider what can be done to raise awareness of the issue and protect vulnerable households, including houses in multiple occupation, against carbon monoxide poisoning. I also want to talk to local authorities about houses in multiple occupation, and what is known about the risks for that sector. I want to explore what opportunities might exist through their liaison with private landlord groups, and their activities in respect of licensing and the health and safety rating, to raise awareness of the need for action.

There may also be opportunities to help vulnerable households through the home energy efficiency scheme, and I have asked the Eaga Partnership, which runs the scheme, to look at how advice on and protection against carbon monoxide poisoning can be included. It has been asked to consider issues such as installing detectors, the possibility of including a general health check based around the scheme's existing annual service visit, to encompass any existing gas appliances, and advice literature.

I will update the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in the new year on the results of these deliberations, and my conclusions as to what practical action the Assembly Government might take to prevent deaths by carbon monoxide.

wedi ei ddatganoli i Gymru, ac nid oes rheoliadau sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol gosod synwryddion carbon monocsid yn y cartref. Mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch yn adolygu diogelwch nwy domestig yn y DU ar hyn o bryd, ac mae swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gweithio gyda HSE ar yr adolygiad hwnnw i lunio cynigion a fydd yn rhoi cyfundrefn diogelwch nwy fodern ac effeithiol ar waith. Heb beryglu canlyniad yr adolygiad diogelwch nwy, yr wyf yn ystyried beth y gellir ei wneud i leihau risg gwenwyn carbon monocsid i gartrefi diamddiffyn yng Nghymru.

Mae'r gwasanaethau tân ac achub yn anelu at wneud tua 50,000 o archwiliadau diogelwch yn y cartref yng Nghymru yn ystod y flwyddyn sydd i ddod. Byddaf yn gofyn i gyfarfod nesaf Pwyllgor Cyngori Gwasanaeth Tân ac Achub Cymru ystyried beth y gellir ei wneud i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth am y mater a diogelu cartrefi diamddiffyn, gan gynnwys tai amlfeddiant, rhag gwenwyn carbon monocsid. Yr wyf hefyd am siarad ag awdurdodau lleol am dai amlfeddiant, a'r hyn sy'n hysbys am y risgiau i'r sector hwnnw. Yr wyf am edrych ar y cyfleoedd a all fod ar gael drwy eu cysylltiad â grwpiau landlordiaid preifat, a'u gweithgareddau wrth drwyddedu a mesur iechyd a diogelwch, er mwyn cynyddi ymwybyddiaeth am yr angen i weithredu.

Efallai y bydd cyfleoedd hefyd i helpu cartrefi diamddiffyn drwy'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i Bartneriaeth Eaga, sy'n rhedeg y cynllun, edrych ar y ffordd y gellir cynnwys cyngor ar wenwyn carbon monocsid a diogelu rhagddo. Gofynnwyd i'r bartneriaeth ystyried materion megis gosod synwryddion, posibilrwydd cynnwys archwiliad iechyd cyffredinol ar sail ymweliad cynnal a chadw blynyddol y cynllun, i gwmpasu unrhyw gyfarpar nwy presennol, a llenyddiaeth gynghori.

Byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn y flwyddyn newydd am ganlyniadau'r trafodaethau hyn, a'm casgliadau ynglŷn â pha gamau ymarferol y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eu cymryd i

atal marwolaethau oherwydd carbon monocsid.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I thank the Minister for her positive response to this issue. You will be aware that there have been a number of deaths from carbon monoxide poisoning in my area, and I am pleased that you are prepared to take action that will lead to a reduction in the risks associated with carbon monoxide.

You will also be aware of the campaign to get all homes to fit a carbon monoxide detector, led by Anne Mitchell of Cwmbran. She is the mother of Alex, who died last year from carbon monoxide poisoning, following the faulty installation of a new fire by a CORGI registered technician. I am sure that Mrs Mitchell will be pleased to see the Assembly do what it can to reduce the risk of poisoning.

You mentioned the Welsh quality housing standard. Would you consider whether you could include the installation of carbon monoxide detectors within the standard that you set for social housing? I would like carbon monoxide detectors to become as commonplace as smoke detectors. As you said in your statement, they can save lives, although they are no substitute for good maintenance.

You also mentioned the worryingly low level of awareness of the risks. Would you therefore consider undertaking a high-profile public awareness campaign? I doubt whether many in the Chamber would know that CORGI registration in itself does not mean that a fitter is competent for all appliances. Along with the other actions that you outlined, I am confident that, through those measures, we can reduce deaths from carbon monoxide in Wales. Finally, could you outline the timeframe for the actions that you intend to take?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you, Jocelyn, for raising this issue and asking for a statement on what is an important issue for us. Carbon monoxide is in the news more than ever, following the unfortunate deaths in Corfu, which illustrated the dangers to the public. It is important that we look at all aspects of

**Jocelyn Davies:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb cadarnhaol i'r mater hwn. Gwyddoch fod nifer o farwolaethau o ganlyniad i wenwyn carbon monocsid wedi digwydd yn fy ardal i, ac yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn barod i gymryd camau a fydd yn arwain at leihau'r risgiau sy'n gysylltiedig â charbon monocsid.

Fe wyddoch hefyd am yr ymgyrch i sicrhau bod pob cartref yn gosod synhwyrdd carbon monocsid, dan arweiniad Anne Mitchell o Gwmbrân. Hi yw mam Alex, a fu farw y llynedd o wenwyn carbon monocsid, ar ôl i dân newydd gael ei osod yn ddiffygiol gan dechnegydd CORGI cofrestredig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Mrs Mitchell yn falch gweld bod y Cynulliad yn gwneud yr hyn a all i leihau risg gwenwyno.

Yr oeddech yn sôn am safon ansawdd tai Cymru. A fydddech yn ystyried a allech gynnwys gosod synwryddion carbon monocsid yn y safon y byddwch yn ei gosod ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol? Hoffwn i synwryddion carbon monocsid fod mor gyffredin â synwryddion mwg. Fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud yn eich datganiad, gallant achub bywydau, er na all dim gymryd lle dull cynnal a chadw da.

Soniecch hefyd am y lefel bryderus o isel o ymwybyddiaeth o'r risgiau. A fydddech felly'n ystyried trefnu ymgyrch broffil uchel ymhlith y cyhoedd? Yr wyf yn amau a fyddai llawer yn y Siambr yn gwybod nad yw cofrestriad CORGI, ynddo'i hun, yn golygu bod gosodwr yn gymwys i osod pob cyfarpar. Ynghyd â'r camau eraill a amlinellwyd gennych, yr wyf yn hyderus, drwy'r mesurau hynny, y gallwn leihau nifer y marwolaethau oherwydd carbon monocsid yng Nghymru. Yn olaf, a allech amlinellu'r amserlen ar gyfer y camau y bwriadwch eu cymryd?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch, Jocelyn, am godi'r mater hwn ac am ofyn am ddatganiad ar yr hyn sy'n fater pwysig inni. Mae carbon monocsid yn y newyddion yn fwy nag erioed, yn dilyn y marwolaethau anffodus yn Corfu, a ddangosodd y peryglon i'r cyhoedd. Mae'n bwysig inni edrych ar bob agwedd ar hyn, fel

this, as you suggested. The Welsh housing quality standard is an aspect that I am concerned with, and I have considerable influence over how we deal with it. I will certainly take that forward. I was also interested in what you said about public awareness campaigns. They would possibly have to be national campaigns, and I will take that up with my colleagues in Westminster to see whether something more proactive can be done on a national basis.

The timeframe is important. I aim to have discussions with the fire service and with other organisations as soon as possible and I anticipate making a statement to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in early January. If Plenary is agreeable, I am more than happy to update you with a statement here. Anne Mitchell has got a campaign going, and you can understand why. I hope that what we can do in the Assembly will help to prevent further deaths in future.

**Mark Isherwood:** We welcome this statement on what is a serious issue. As you say, faulty gas appliances are still being used in many homes and public awareness of the risks of carbon monoxide poisoning is worryingly low.

In considering what can be done to reduce the risk of carbon monoxide poisoning for vulnerable households in Wales, I will refer to a number of cases. In July, a coroner called on a north Wales council to check homes after a couple were found dead from gas fumes. In January, Alwyn Roberts and his wife Shirley died because a chimney flue from their solid fuel stove was blocked. A verdict of accidental death was recorded. The north-west Wales deputy coroner demanded a full investigation to ensure that the carbon monoxide poisoning tragedy was not repeated. Concluding the inquest at Caernarfon, the coroner said that it was important to highlight the tragic consequences when corners are cut and guidelines ignored.

yr awgrymech. Mae safon ansawdd tai Cymru yn agwedd sydd o bwys imi, ac mae gennyf ddylanwad sylweddol dros y ffordd y deliwn â hi. Byddaf yn sicr yn gweithredu ar hynny. Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb hefyd yn yr hyn a ddywedech am ymgyrchoedd ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd. Hwyrach y byddai'n rhaid iddynt fod yn ymgyrchoedd cenedlaethol, a byddaf yn codi hynny gyda'm cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan i weld a ellir gwneud rhywbeth mwy rhagweithiol yn genedlaethol.

Mae'r amserlen yn bwysig. Bwriadaf gael trafodaethau gyda'r gwasanaeth tân a chyda sefydliadau eraill cyn gynted â phosibl, a rhagwelaf y byddaf yn gwneud datganiad i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ddechrau mis Ionawr. Os yw'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn cytuno, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ichi yma. Mae gan Anne Mitchell ymgyrch ar waith, a gallaf ddeall pam. Gobeithio y bydd yr hyn y gallwn ni i wneud yn y Cynulliad yn helpu atal rhagor o farwolaethau yn y dyfodol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Croesawn y datganiad hwn am yr hyn sy'n fater pwysig. Fel y dywedwch, mae cyfarpar nwy diffygiol yn dal i gael ei ddefnyddio mewn nifer o gartrefi ac ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o risgiau gwenwyn carbon monocsid yn bryderus o isel.

Wrth ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei wneud i leihau risg gwenwyn carbon monocsid i gartrefi diamddiffyn yng Nghymru, cyfeiriaf at nifer o achosion. Ym mis Gorffennaf, gofynnodd crwner i gyngor yn y gogledd archwilio cartrefi ar ôl i bâr gael eu darganfod yn farw oherwydd mygdarthau nwy. Ym mis Ionawr, bu farw Alwyn Roberts a'i wraig Shirley am fod fflw simnai o'u ffwrn tanwydd solet wedi'i rhwystro. Cofnodwyd dyfarniad o farwolaeth ddamweiniol. Mynnodd dirprwy grwner y gogledd-orllewin ymchwiliad llawn i sicrhau na fyddai'r drychineb gwenwyn carbon monocsid yn digwydd eto. Wrth derfynu'r cwest yng Nghaernarfon, dywedodd y crwner ei bod yn bwysig tynnu sylw at y canlyniadau trasig pan gaiff corneli eu torri a chanllawiau eu hanwybyddu.

In September, the fire safety experts, Kids Safety, warned that students were not sufficiently well informed about the dangers of carbon monoxide leaks from faulty gas cookers, fires and boilers, and said that a poor level of advice was offered to students on safety equipment to protect against carbon monoxide poisoning. As we have heard, in October, a rogue tradesman was jailed for two years for killing a 14-year-old girl, Alex Mitchell, after botching a job at her home. He made a fatal area in installing a new fire. He was not properly accredited to carry out that type of work and his failure to carry out checks led to excessive gas supply to the burners and the catalytic converter failed. As we heard, he was registered to install gas boilers with CORGI, but Cardiff Crown Court heard that he was not qualified to fit the flueless gas fire. Subsequently, the former world boxing champion Robbie Regan has backed the campaign by Anne Mitchell, Alex's mother, to raise awareness of the dangers of carbon monoxide poisoning. Bearing in mind all of these points, what action are you considering to support this campaign to ensure that appropriate advice is provided to students? How will you work with colleagues across departments in the Assembly Government to support the full investigation demanded by the north-west Wales deputy coroner to ensure that such tragedies are not repeated and to tackle rogue tradesmen?

**Edwina Hart:** Every death, of course, is a very serious matter. We must recognise what we can do across Government; we can link across the departments. My first priority will be to look to my own portfolio, and the fire service is already out and about doing 50,000 safety checks in households.

4.10 p.m.

I take on board the points that you have made. I do not think that people realise the dangers of carbon monoxide. You may keep your car engine running in a garage, or you may keep a petrol lawn mower in the garage, where there may be no ventilation. That can be dangerous. Therefore, Jocelyn's point about publicity campaigns is a good one.

Ym mis Medi, rhybuddiodd yr arbenigwyr diogelwch tân, Kids Safety, na roddir digon o wybodaeth i fyfyrwyr am beryglon gollyngiadau carbon monocsid o ffyrnau, tanau a boeleri nwy diffygiol, a dywedodd mai gwael oedd y cyngor a roddir i fyfyrwyr am offer diogelwch i ddiogelu rhag gwenwyn carbon monocsid. Fel y clywsom, ym mis Hydref dedfrydwyd masnachwr twyllodrus i garchar am ddwy flynedd am ladd Alex Mitchell, 14 mlwydd oed, ar ôl gwneud cawl o'i waith yn ei chartref. Gwnaeth wall anghueol wrth osod tân newydd. Nid oedd wedi'i achredu'n briodol i wneud y math hwnnw o waith, ac oherwydd iddo fethu gwneud archwiliadau, yr oedd gormod o nwy'n dod i mewn i'r llosgyddion a methodd y trawsnewidydd catalytig. Fel y clywsom, yr oedd wedi'i gofrestru i osod boeleri nwy gyda CORGI, ond clywodd Llys y Goron yng Nghaerdydd nad oedd yn gymwys i osod y tân nwy di-ffliw. O ganlyniad, mae cyn bencampwr paffio'r byd, Robbie Regan, wedi cefnogi'r ymgyrch gan Anne Mitchell, mam Alex, i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o beryglon gwenwyn carbon monocsid. Gan gofio'r holl bwyntiau hyn, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu hystyried i gefnogi'r ymgyrch hon i sicrhau rhoi cyngor priodol i fyfyrwyr? Sut y byddwch yn gweithio gyda chyd-Aelodau ar draws adrannau yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r ymchwiliad llawn a fyynnir gan ddirprwy grwner y gogledd-orllewin i sicrhau na fydd trasiedïau o'r fath yn digwydd eto, ac i fynd i'r afael â masnachwyr twyllodrus?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae pob marwolaeth, wrth gwrs, yn fater difrifol iawn. Rhaid inni gydnabod beth y gallwn ei wneud ar draws y Llywodraeth; gallwn gysylltu ar draws yr adrannau. Fy mlaenoriaeth gyntaf fydd edrych ar fy mhortffolio fy hun, ac mae'r gwasanaeth tân eisoes yn gwneud 50,000 o archwiliadau diogelwch mewn cartrefi.

Yr wyf yn derbyn y pwyntiau a wnaethoch. Ni chredaf fod pobl yn sylweddoli peryglon carbon monocsid. Efallai y byddwch yn gadael injan eich car i droi mewn garej, neu gallwch gadw peiriant petrol i dorri gwair yn y garej, lle nad oes dim awyru. Gall hynny fod yn beryglus iawn. Felly, mae pwynt Jocelyn am ymgyrchoedd cyhoeddusrwydd

Those campaigns may have to be tailored to different groups and we may want to suggest that literature is distributed through colleges and in student accommodation. I will take up all of those points and will, hopefully, be able to report on them in January. Our message must be that people should take care. When it gets very cold, people without adequate heating in their homes might light their ovens to get extra heat, for example. That can be exceptionally dangerous with some appliances. We have to get that key message across. It is important that I take up all of the good ideas in response to this statement and put them into the melting pot so that we can get a good policy across the Government to help with this situation—that is, of course, within the powers of the Welsh Assembly Government.

**Mick Bates:** On behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, I thank you for the statement, Minister. I believe that it was Jocelyn who raised the issue a few weeks ago in the Chamber. We all wish to minimise risk in all areas, and that, in general, is what this is about. I will not add further examples to the cases mentioned by previous speakers, except to say that this affects people from all walks of society: recently, a millionaire's daughter died from carbon monoxide poisoning. The essential issue is to continue with the CORGI process to ensure that people are trained and install appliances properly.

There is also the issue of the data. When I looked through the data on carbon monoxide related deaths, I found some of them difficult to analyse. I was surprised to discover, from the most recent figures that I found, quoted in Hansard, that only a small proportion of deaths from carbon monoxide poisoning were accidents; a high proportion were suicides. When you bring forward your report to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, it would be useful for us to have up-to-date data. I am sure that you will ensure that that happens.

There is one challenge here: everyone has

yn un da. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid llunio'r ymgyrchoedd hynny ar gyfer grwpiau gwahanol, ac efallai y byddwn am awgrymu bod llenyddiaeth yn cael ei dosbarthu i golegau a lletyau myfyrwyr. Byddaf yn delio â'r holl bwyntiau hynny a byddaf, gobeithio, yn gallu cyflwyno adroddiad arnynt ym mis Ionawr. Rhaid i'n neges annog pobl i fod yn ofalus. Pan fydd yn oer iawn, efallai y bydd pobl nad oes ganddynt system wresogi ddigonol yn eu cartrefi yn cynnwys eu ffyrnau i gael gwres ychwanegol, er enghraifft. Gall hynny fod yn beryglus iawn gyda rhai mathau o gyfarpar. Rhaid inni gyfleu'r neges allweddol honno. Mae'n bwysig imi ystyried yr holl syniadau da mewn ymateb i'r datganiad hwn, a'u trafod yn ddwys fel y gallwn gael polisi da ar draws y Llywodraeth i helpu gyda'r sefyllfa hon—hynny yw, wrth gwrs, o fewn pwerau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**Mick Bates:** Ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, diolchaf i chi am y datganiad, Weinidog. Credaf mai Jocelyn a gododd y mater ychydig wythnosau'n ôl yn y Siambr. Yr ydym bob un yn dymuno lleihau risgiau ym mhob maes a dyna, yn gyffredinol, yw diben hyn. Nid ychwanegaf unrhyw enghreifftiau pellach at yr achosion a grybwyllwyd gan siaradwyr blaenorol, ar wahân i ddweud bod hyn yn effeithio ar bobl o bob dosbarth mewn cymdeithas: yn ddiweddar, bu farw merch miliynydd o ganlyniad i wenwyn carbon monocsid. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw parhau'r broses CORGI i sicrhau y caiff pobl eu hyfforddi a'u bod yn gosod cyfarpar yn iawn.

Mae yna fater o ran data hefyd. Pan edrychais drwy'r data ar farwolaethau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â charbon monocsid, gwelais fod rhywfaint yn anodd ei ddadansoddi. Cefais fy synnu o weld, o'r ffigurau diweddaraf a gefais, o Hansard, mai cyfran fach yn unig o farwolaethau o wenwyn carbon monocsid a oedd yn ddamweiniau; yr oedd cyfran uchel yn achosion o hunanladdiad. Pan fyddwch yn cyflwyno eich adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, byddai'n ddefnyddiol inni gael y data diweddaraf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Mae yma un her: mae pawb wedi cyfaddef

admitted that raising awareness is crucial. That cannot be a one-off. There has to be a continuous campaign. Given your commitment—which is obvious in your making this statement today—is it possible to challenge some of the media, particularly the television media, to run a campaign for free? The media has some responsibility in trying to minimise the risk and to save lives with regard to such issues. It is often extremely expensive for the Government to undertake public safety campaigns. Will you use your good offices to challenge the media, saying, ‘We have this issue of deaths in Wales from carbon monoxide poisoning; it is a pernicious, odourless, colourless gas. Why do you not help us to do something in Wales on a regular basis?’.

**Edwina Hart:** I am certainly happy to take up the points made by Mick Bates and to provide more detailed data for committee. However, the aim of my report to the committee will not be to go over the data, but to find solutions to take the agenda forward. Mick is right that carbon monoxide poisoning can happen to anyone. However, when you are on a more limited budget and you have to think twice about whether you can afford to have the chimney swept, you might say to yourself that the appliances will be all right. When you are have a higher income, it may be in your diary to do these things every year. It is important that we recognise that there are difficulties. Also, now that we are into the winter, I am thinking in particular of homeless people who may be going into unventilated buildings, getting comfortable, and starting to burn stuff. That could be dangerous. It is important that, when we look at what we can do, we prioritise key groups first, as well as get the general message across.

**Lynne Neagle:** Thank you, Minister, for making this very important statement today. I would like to take this opportunity to commend the bravery of Alex Mitchell’s mother, who is campaigning so that we can all learn the lessons of the tragic death of Alex, who was only 14 when she died last year. I have been working with Mrs Mitchell

bod cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth yn hanfodol. Ni all hynny fod yn un digwyddiad unigol. Rhaid cael ymgyrch barhaus. O gofio’ch ymrwymiad—sy’n amlwg gan eich bod yn gwneud y datganiad hwn heddiw—a yw’n bosibl herio rhai o’r cyfryngau, yn enwedig teledu, i gynnal ymgyrch am ddim? Mae gan y cyfryngau rywfaint o gyfrifoldeb dros geisio lleihau’r risg ac achub bywydau mewn perthynas â materion o’r fath. Mae’n aml yn gostus iawn i’r Llywodraeth gynnal ymgyrchoedd diogelwch y cyhoedd. A wnewch chi ddefnyddio eich dylanwad i herio’r cyfryngau a dweud, ‘Mae gennym broblem marwolaethau yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i wenwyn carbon monocsid; mae’n nwy dinistriol, diarogl, di-liw. Pam na wnewch chi ein helpu i wneud rhywbeth yng Nghymru yn rheolaidd?’.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn sicr yn hapus i ystyried y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Mick Bates a rhoi data manylach i’r pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, nid trafod y data fydd nod fy adroddiad i’r pwyllgor, ond dod o hyd i atebion i symud yr agenda yn ei blaen. Mae Mick yn iawn i ddweud y gall unrhyw un ddioddef gwenwyn carbon monocsid. Fodd bynnag, pan nad oes gennych lawer o arian a phan fydd raid ichi feddwl ddwywaith a allwch fforddio cael rhywun i lanhau eich simnai, efallai y byddwch yn dweud wrthyhych eich hun y bydd y cyfarpar yn iawn. Pan fydd gennych incwm uwch, efallai y byddwch eisoes wedi trefnu bod y pethau hyn yn cael eu gwneud bob blwyddyn. Mae’n bwysig inni gydnabod bod yna anawsterau. Hefyd, gan fod y gaeaf yn awr wedi dod, yr wyf yn meddwl yn arbennig am bobl ddigartref a all fod yn mynd i mewn i adeiladau sydd heb eu hawyru, gwneud eu hunain yn gyfforddus a dechrau llosgi pethau. Gallai hynny fod yn beryglus. Mae’n bwysig, pan edrychwn ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud, ein bod yn blaenoriaethu grwpiau allweddol yn gyntaf, yn ogystal â chyfleu’r neges gyffredinol.

**Lynne Neagle:** Diolch, Weinidog, am wneud y datganiad pwysig iawn hwn heddiw. Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i gymeradwyo dewrder mam Alex Mitchell, sy’n ymgyrchu er mwyn i ni bob un allu dysgu gwersi o farwolaeth drasig Alex, nad oedd ond 14 oed pan fu farw y llynedd. Yr wyf wedi bod yn gweithio gyda Mrs Mitchell, a gwn ei bod

and I know that she was delighted, when I spoke to her yesterday, that we would be discussing this issue in the Assembly today.

Other Members have referred to the need to raise public awareness. As we have heard, in Alex's case, the fitter who installed the gas fire was CORGI registered, but was not registered to fit that particular appliance, which was a crucial distinction with devastating results for the Mitchells. When I met CORGI last week, it was keen to see the UK Government lobbied on the need to levy gas suppliers to fund more awareness work. Are you willing to take that up with the UK Government, and also with gas suppliers, so that we can see effective awareness work funded? As you know, Mrs Mitchell also wants audible alarms fitted with all new gas work; would you be willing to make representations to CORGI, gas-fire manufacturers and gas suppliers to see whether that is possible? There is a growing campaign for such a change in regulations, and political support from the Assembly is crucial.

**Edwina Hart:** Like you, I applaud Anne Mitchell's campaign. It must be very difficult, after the death of a child, to feel positive about anything, but the fact that she is campaigning is a positive step; let us hope that the campaign bears fruition and leads to the lives of other young people being saved. I would be pleased for my officials to liaise with CORGI on its views on levying gas suppliers, and to make representations to the UK Government on this issue. I will make inquiries about the nature of audible alarms, which are essential in some circumstances, and will report back to committee on these points in January. We want an integrated approach in taking these issues forward, in terms of the practicalities of detectors, advice to vulnerable groups and how that can be done across various Government departments.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, I want to mention a group that has already been mentioned today, namely students. As many parents know, when your child moves out of student

wrth ei bodd, pan siaradais â hi ddoe, y byddem yn trafod y mater hwn yn y Cynulliad heddiw.

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi cyfeirio at yr angen am wneud y cyhoedd yn fwy ymwybodol. Fel y clywsom, yn achos Alex yr oedd y ffitiwr a osododd y tân nwy wedi'i gofrestru gyda CORGI, ond nid oedd wedi'i gofrestru i osod y cyfarpar penodol hwnnw. Yr oedd yna wahaniaeth hanfodol, gyda chanlyniadau trychinebus i'r teulu Mitchell. Pan gefais gyfarfod gyda CORGI yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd yn awyddus i weld pobl yn llobio Llywodraeth y DU am yr angen am godi treth ar gyflenwyr nwy i ariannu mwy o waith ymwybyddiaeth. A ydych yn barod i godi hynny gyda Llywodraeth y DU, a hefyd gyda chyflenwyr nwy, fel y gallwn weld ariannu gwaith ymwybyddiaeth effeithiol? Fel y gwyddoch, mae Mrs Mitchell hefyd am weld larymau sŵn yn cael eu gosod gyda phob gwaith nwy newydd; a fydddech yn barod i gyflwyno sylwadau i CORGI, gwneuthurwyr tân nwy a chyflenwyr nwy i weld a yw hynny'n bosibl? Mae ynar ymgyrch gynyddol am newid felly yn y rheoliadau, ac mae cymorth gwleidyddol gan y Cynulliad yn hanfodol.

**Edwina Hart:** Fel chi, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo ymgyrch Anne Mitchell. Rhaid ei bod yn anodd iawn, ar ôl marwolaeth plentyn, i deimlo'n gadarnhaol ynghylch dim, ond mae'r ffaith ei bod yn ymgyrchu yn gam cadarnhaol; gobeithio y bydd yr ymgyrch yn dwyn ffrwyth ac yn arwain at achub bywydau pobl ifanc eraill. Byddwn yn fodlon i'm swyddogion gysylltu â CORGI ynghylch ei safbwyntiau ar godi treth ar gyflenwyr nwy, ac i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU ar y mater hwn. Byddaf yn ymholi ynghylch natur larymau sŵn, sy'n hanfodol mewn rhai amgylchiadau, a byddaf yn adrodd yn ôl i'r pwyllgor ar y pwyntiau hyn ym mis Ionawr. Yr ydym am gael dull integredig o ddatblygu'r materion hyn, o ran ymarferoldeb synwryddion, cyngor i grwpiau diamddiffyn a sut y gellir gwneud hynny ar draws amrywiol adrannau'r Llywodraeth.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, hoffwn sôn am grŵp y soniwyd amdanynt eisoes heddiw, sef myfyrwyr. Fel y gŵyr nifer o rieni, pan fydd eich plentyn yn symud allan o lety myfyrwyr



accommodation and into private accommodation, one of the first things that you buy is a carbon monoxide detector, if the house has gas appliances. When you look at the possible effect that you can have on producing safe home environments, will you look at houses in multiple occupation—not just student houses but houses that other people also occupy? Just as hard-wired fire detectors are now very much the norm, hard-wired carbon monoxide detectors should also become the norm. Will you work with your colleagues in local government to make that part of the licensing system for HMOs?

**Edwina Hart:** I am happy to take up Janet's point, because I am concerned about HMOs. From my own experience of my daughter living in student accommodation, I know of the things that you worry about on a practical level. It is important that, as the Government of Wales, we see what issues we can develop in order to have a positive impact on this agenda. I am also concerned about bed-and-breakfast accommodation being used, and I will extend my discussion with Welsh local government into that area.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you, Minister, for this important statement. When you look at the various groups with which we will need to communicate, will you bear in mind the black minority ethnic communities? Many BME communities live in poorer housing. I am particularly thinking of asylum seekers who will be in poorer housing and who may have language difficulties. We need to find a way of reaching those difficulties to reach groups, to ensure that everyone has equal access to the safety aspects of the regulations, or whatever it is that you will be able to do to help.

**Edwina Hart:** I am minded that we have to look at vulnerable groups, and there are language issues associated with any literature that we might wish to produce. That will be foremost in my considerations if we decide to produce literature. In terms of publicity and literature, we also have to look at it nationally to see what further joint work we can do, which is important.

ac i lety preifat, un o'r pethau cyntaf y byddwch yn ei brynu yw synhwyrdd carbon monocsid, os oes cyfarpar nwy yn y tŷ. Pan fyddwch yn edrych ar yr effaith bosibl y gallwch ei chael ar greu amgylcheddau diogel mewn cartrefi, a fyddwch yn edrych ar dai amlfeddiant—nid tai myfyrwyr yn unig, ond tai lle y mae pobl eraill hefyd yn byw? Yn union fel y mae synwryddion tân wedi eu gwifrio yn gyffredin bellach, dylai synwryddion carbon monocsid wedi eu gwifrio hefyd fod yn gyffredin. A wnewch chi weithio gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau mewn llywodraeth leol i wneud hynny'n rhan o'r system drwyddedu ar gyfer tai amlfeddiant?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn hapus i drafod pwynt Janet, gan fy mod yn pryderu ynghylch tai amlfeddiant. Yn fy mhrofiad fy hun gan fod fy merch yn byw mewn llety myfyrwyr, gwn am y pethau y byddwch yn poeni yn eu cylch ar lefel ymarferol. Mae'n bwysig, fel Llywodraeth Cymru, inni weld pa faterion y gallwn eu datblygu er mwyn cael effaith gadarnhaol ar yr agenda hon. Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu ynghylch defnyddio llety gwely a brecwast, a byddaf yn ehangu fy nhrafodaeth gyda llywodraeth leol Cymru i'r maes hwnnw.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch, Weinidog, am y datganiad pwysig hwn. Pan fyddwch yn edrych ar yr amrywiol grwpiau y bydd angen inni gyfathrebu â hwy, a wnewch ystyried cymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig? Mae nifer o gymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn byw mewn tai o safon is. Yr wyf yn meddwl yn benodol am geiswyr lloches a fydd mewn tai o safon is ac a all fod ag anawsterau iaith. Mae angen inni gael hyd i ffordd i gyrraedd y grwpiau hynny sy'n anodd eu cyrraedd, er mwyn sicrhau bod pawb yn cael mynediad cyfartal i agweddau diogelwch y rheoliadau, neu beth bynnag y gallwch ei wneud i helpu.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod angen inni edrych ar grwpiau diamddiffyn, ac mae problemau ieithyddol mewn perthynas ag unrhyw lenyddiaeth y gallem fod am ei chynhyrchu. Dyna fydd fy mhrif ystyriaeth os byddwn yn penderfynu cynhyrchu llenyddiaeth. O ran cyhoeddusrwydd a llenyddiaeth, mae angen hefyd inni edrych ar hyn yn genedlaethol i weld pa waith pellach y

gallwn ei wneud ar y cyd, sy'n bwysig.

I will finish by thanking Members for the exceptionally positive contributions today, which will help to focus Government work in this area.

Hoffwn gloi drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidogion am y cyfraniadau eithriadol o gadarnhaol heddiw, a fydd yn ein helpu i roi ffocws i waith y Llywodraeth yn y maes hwn.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifio Bwyd Cychwyn Iach) (Cymru) 2006**  
**Approval of the Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

Motion (NDM3334): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3334): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifio Bwyd Cychwyn Iach) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*regrets the impact on Welsh families of the decision by the UK Department of Health to reduce the upper age limit for children in qualifying families to receive healthy start vouchers.*

*yn gresynu at effaith penderfyniad Adran Iechyd y DU ar deuluoedd Cymru i ostwng terfyn oedran uchaf plant teuluoedd sy'n gymwys i dderbyn talebau cychwyn iach.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM3334 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM3334 enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 7 November 2006. (NDM3334)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifio Bwyd Cychwyn Iach) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3334)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14*

*November 2006 in relation to the draft the Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2006. (NDM3335)*

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM3334 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the impact on Welsh families of the decision by the UK Department of Health to reduce the upper age limit for children in qualifying families to receive healthy start vouchers.*

These regulations do a lot of good things; in fact, they are a great improvement on the old regulations. They were used in the past, for example, to entitle families to twice as much milk formula as a baby of the appropriate age should consume. Therefore, there was a great need to upgrade and modernise the regulations. However, my amendment refers to the fact that there is a serious downside.

4.20 p.m.

The previous regulations applied to children up to the age of five, but now the regulations apply only to children up to the age of four. To be honest, this is not very logical. When I raised this in committee, I was pleased that Lynne Neagle expressed similar concerns. Five is generally accepted as the key age when, for example, compulsory school education begins and so on. Despite the laudable efforts that are being made to get young people into early-years education, it is still the case that some of the most deprived families do not access early-years education.

*Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifio Bwyd Cychwyn Iach) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifio Bwyd Cychwyn Iach) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3335)*

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiai welliant 1 i NDM3334 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at effaith penderfyniad Adran Iechyd y DU ar deuluoedd Cymru i ostwng terfyn oedran uchaf plant teuluoedd sy'n gymwys i dderbyn talebau cychwyn iach.*

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn gwneud nifer o bethau da; mewn gwirionedd, maent yn welliant ardderchog ar yr hen reoliadau. Fe'u defnyddiwyd yn y gorffennol, er enghraifft, i roi hawl i deuluoedd gael dwywaith cymaint o fformiwla llaeth ag y dylai babi o'r oed priodol ei gael. Felly, yr oedd dirfawr angen diweddarau a moderneiddio'r rheoliadau. Fodd bynnag, mae fy ngwelliant yn cyfeirio at y ffaith fod yna anfanteision difrifol.

Yr oedd y rheoliadau blaenorol yn gymwys i blant hyd at bump oed, ond bellach i blant hyd at bedair oed yn unig y mae'r rheoliadau'n gymwys. A bod yn onest, nid yw hyn yn rhesymegol iawn. Pan godais hyn yn y pwyllgor, yr oeddwn yn falch gweld bod gan Lynne Neagle bryderon tebyg. Derbynnir yn gyffredinol mai pump yw'r oed allweddol, er enghraifft, pan fydd addysg orfodol mewn ysgol yn dechrau, ac ati. Er gwaethaf yr ymdrechion canmoladwy a wneir i gael pobl ifanc i mewn i addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar, mae'n wir o hyd nad yw rhai o'r teuluoedd mwyaf difreintiedig yn manteisio ar addysg y

blynyddoedd cynnar.

One cannot amend the regulations themselves because the welfare food scheme is administered by the Department of Health, which provides a budget of £9 million for Wales. I take this opportunity to ask the Minister whether he actually argued for more money. Did Oliver say 'more, please'? The important thing to note is that, although the new regulations will allow a wider range of food and more flexible schemes, there has been no increase in the budget allocated to it, hence the obvious, very pragmatic decision to lower the cut-off point at which children are no longer eligible for these foods.

I strongly support the important provision of welfare food. I remember with great fondness—early childhood memories—going to get the wonderful concentrated orange juice in the early 1950s. That scheme has existed from then until today, but it is time to move on, and these regulations represent that. I particularly welcome the healthy start vouchers in the new scheme, which will be exchangeable at retail outlets. What progress has the Minister made on this so far?

I wish to make a plea that he does some hard, detailed work to ensure that the vouchers are available at Spar and corner shops and through food co-operatives. Retail outlets have to apply to participate in the scheme, and it should not be a scheme in which only the big supermarket chains participate. After all, the big supermarkets ignore our most deprived areas—they do not make money for them. The big supermarkets are inaccessible to our most deprived families, because they do not have cars to get to them. They rely on corner shops, so for the scheme to work well these vouchers have to be available in corner shops, and that means that corner shops must offer a wider range of produce than, sadly, they do in many areas. Does the Minister have any plans to make up for the gap between the ages of four and five that this scheme creates? What plans does he have, in detail, to ensure that these vouchers are exchangeable at corner shops?

Ni allwn wella'r rheoliadau ein hunain gan mai'r Adran Iechyd, sy'n darparu cyllideb o £9 miliwn i Gymru, sy'n gweinyddu'r cynllun bwyd lles. Yr wyf yn manteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ofyn i'r Gweinidog a fu'n dadlau mewn gwirionedd dros gael mwy o arian. A ofynnodd Oliver am fwy? Y peth pwysig i'w nodi yw hyn: er y bydd y rheoliadau newydd yn caniatáu amrywiaeth ehangach o fwyd a chynlluniau mwy hyblyg, ni fu cynnydd yn y gyllideb a ddyrennir ar gyfer hyn, a dyna pam y cafwyd y penderfyniad amlwg a phragmatig iawn i ostwng y terfyn oed ar gyfer plant sy'n gymwys i gael y bwyd hwn.

Cefnogaf yn gryf y ddarpariaeth bwysig o fwydydd lles. Mae gennyf atgofion melys o'm plentyndod cynnar o fynd i gael y sudd oren cryf bendigedig ar ddechrau'r 1950au. Mae'r cynllun hwnnw wedi para hyd heddiw, ond mae'n bryd symud ymlaen, ac mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn cynrychioli hynny. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch gweld y talebau cychwyn iach yn y cynllun newydd, y gellir eu cyfnewid mewn manau manwerthu. Pa gynnydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei wneud mewn perthynas â hyn mor belled?

Hoffwn alw arno i wneud gwaith caled a manwl i sicrhau bod y talebau ar gael mewn siopau Spar a siopau cornel a thrwy gydweithfeydd bwyd. Rhaid i fannau manwerthu wneud cais am gymryd rhan yn y cynllun, ac ni ddylai fod yn gynllun y mae'r archfarchnadoedd cadwyn mawr yn unig yn cymryd rhan ynddo. Wedi'r cyfan, mae'r archfarchnadoedd mawr yn anwybyddu ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig—nid ydynt yn creu arian iddynt. Nid yw'r archfarchnadoedd mawr yn gyfleus i'n teuluoedd mwyaf difreintiedig, gan nad oes ganddynt geir i'w cyrraedd. Maent yn dibynnu ar siopau cornel. Felly, er mwyn i'r cynllun weithio'n dda mae angen i'r talebau hyn fod ar gael mewn siopau cornel, ac mae hynny'n golygu bod yn rhaid i siopau cornel gynnig amrywiaeth ehangach o gynnyrch nag a geir mewn llawer ardal, yn anffodus. A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i wneud iawn am y bwch rhwng pedair a phump oed y mae'r cynllun hwn yn ei greu? Pa gynlluniau sydd ganddo, yn fanwl, i sicrhau y gellir cyfnewid y talebau hyn mewn siopau

cornel?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru also welcomes this scheme and will support the regulations. Like the Liberal Democrats, we realise that the Minister, to use his own words in committee, is not the master of his own destiny with regard to the implementation of the scheme, as it is a Department of Health scheme. Will the Minister assure us that he will carefully review the way in which the scheme rolls out and how appropriate it is for our needs, and that, if necessary, he will seek more autonomy to administer the scheme differently if he finds, through monitoring, that it is not as effective as he would wish?

Like Jenny Randerson, I remind the Minister that the issue of the outlets through which the scheme will be accessible was raised in committee. My recollection is that the Minister said that he would ask officials to look at what outlets the Department of Health was proposing to use. I also recall that we urged him at that time to see whether it was possible to work with the conglomerates of organisations such as Spar—which have an overview of many small community shops that are active in some of our poorest communities—to encourage them to participate in the scheme, and to see whether there is anything that the Assembly Government can do, perhaps using local procurement, to encourage a higher quality of fresh food. There is real issue about the quality and variety of fresh food that such small shops are able to stock. Can the Minister give us any update today on where his officials' investigations in that regard have reached?

One of the major disadvantages of the current scheme is that the provision of free milk powder has acted as a major disincentive to breast-feeding in some of the groups in which we would most want to encourage breast-feeding. That is another reason why the scheme is welcomed. I remind the Minister that the growth charts that we currently use represent an additional disincentive to breast-feeding; they are still based on growth rates for bottle-fed babies which, as we know, are slower to begin with than the growth rates for breast-fed babies. We know that that has, in

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae Plaid Cymru hefyd yn croesawu'r cynllun hwn a byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau. Fel y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sylweddolwn na all y Gweinidog gymryd yr awenau o ran gweithredu'r cynllun hwn, fel y dywedodd yn y pwyllgor, gan mai cynllun yr Adran Iechyd ydyw. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y bydd yn adolygu'r modd y cyflwynir y cynllun yn ofalus, a pha mor briodol ydyw ar gyfer ein hanghenion, ac os bydd angen, y bydd yn ceisio rhagor o ymreolaeth er mwyn gweinyddu'r cynllun yn wahanol os bydd yn gweld, drwy fonitro, nad yw mor effeithiol ag y byddai'n dymuno?

Fel Jenny Randerson, hoffwn atgoffa'r Gweinidog fod mater manau manwerthu a fydd yn gweithredu'r cynllun wedi ei drafod yn y pwyllgor. Cofiaf i'r Gweinidog ddweud y byddai'n gofyn i swyddogion edrych ar y manau manwerthu yr oedd yr Adran Iechyd yn bwriadu eu defnyddio. Cofiaf hefyd inni ei annog bryd hynny i weld a oedd yn bosibl gweithio gyda chyd-dyriadau sefydliadau fel Spar—sydd â throsolwg ar nifer o'r siopau bach cymunedol yn rhai o'n cymunedau tlotaf—i'w hannog i gymryd rhan yn y cynllun, ac i weld a oes unrhyw beth y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud, efallai gan ddefnyddio prosesau caffael lleol, i'w hannog i werthu bwyd ffres o safon uwch. Mae problem wirioneddol ynghylch ansawdd ac amrywiaeth y bwyd ffres y gall siopau bach eu stocio. A all y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni heddiw am y cynnydd a wnaeth ei swyddogion wrth ymchwilio i hyn?

Un o brif anfanteision y cynllun presennol yw bod darparu powdwr llaeth am ddim wedi bod yn wrthanogaeth fawr i fwydo o'r fron ymhlith rhai o'r grwpiau lle y byddem yn fwyaf awyddus i annog mamau i fwydo o'r fron. Dyna reswm arall pam y croesewir y cynllun. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Gweinidog bod y siartiau twf a ddefnyddiwn ar hyn o bryd yn wrthanogaeth ychwanegol i fwydo o'r fron; maent yn dal yn seiliedig ar gyfraddau twf ar gyfer babanod sy'n cael eu bwydo â photel ac sydd, fel y gwyddom, yn arafach i ddechrau na'r cyfraddau twf ar gyfer babanod sy'n cael

the past, caused anxiety with mothers who are concerned that their babies are not growing fast enough if they are breast-feeding them. I take this opportunity to ask the Minister in this debate to update the Assembly on progress towards introducing in Wales the new World Health Organization growth standards, which are based on the normal growth rates for breast-fed infants. Introducing the new growth rates would be a useful complement to the work that will now be done through the Healthy Start scheme to encourage breast-feeding and to reduce dependency on bottled milk.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** We need to start from an understanding of our role in these regulations, which is fairly subsidiary. Before these regulations come into being, our role is to administer the scheme. Therefore, we had no say on the nature or essence of the scheme. We were simply involved in the administration of the repayments. To characterise the scheme as one on which we, as an Assembly Government, had anything other than marginal influence, would slightly misrepresent the situation. These regulations, if we pass them, do not substantially change the essence of the scheme—this is essentially a scheme that is run from Westminster. However, if we do pass these regulations today, it will give us some discretion in deciding on the types of food that can be exchanged for the vouchers. That is the rather limited role that we have. It would be wrong to inflate people's expectations in terms of what we can deliver in relation to these regulations.

In trying to address a number of the specific points that were raised, my understanding is that this scheme was never fully subscribed to in the past. Therefore, even though it is presently set at £9 million, I think that the allocation was higher some years ago. Therefore, the present tariff of £9 million is more a reflection of compliance or uptake of the scheme than an effective cut.

The decision to bring down the eligibility age should not be seen as a cut in the amount of

eu bwydo o'r fron. Gwyddom fod hynny, yn y gorffennol, wedi peri pryder ymysg mamau sy'n poeni nad yw eu babanod yn tyfu'n ddigon cyflym os ydynt yn eu bwydo o'r fron. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ofyn i'r Gweinidog yn y ddadl hon roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynlluniad am y cynnydd a wnaed i gyflwyno safonau twf newydd Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd yng Nghymru, sy'n seiliedig ar y cyfraddau twf arferol ar gyfer babanod sy'n cael eu bwydo o'r fron. Byddai cyflwyno'r cyfraddau twf newydd yn ychwanegiad defnyddiol at y gwaith a wneir bellach drwy'r cynllun Cychwyn Iach i annog mamau i fwydo o'r fron ac i leihau dibyniaeth ar laeth potel.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae angen inni ddechrau deall ein rôl yn y rheoliadau hyn, sy'n gymharol israddol. Cyn sefydlu'r rheoliadau hyn, ein rôl yw gweinyddu'r cynllun. Felly, nid oedd gennym unrhyw ddylanwad ar natur na hanfod y cynllun. Gweinyddu'r ad-daliadau yn unig yr oeddem yn ei wneud. Byddai nodi bod y cynllun yn un lle yr oedd gennym ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, unrhyw beth mwy na dylanwad ymylol yn camddehongli'r sefyllfa braidd. Nid yw'r rheoliadau hyn, os byddwn yn eu derbyn, yn newid hanfod y cynllun yn sylweddol—cynllun a gaiff ei redeg o San Steffan yw hwn yn ei hanfod. Fodd bynnag, os byddwn yn derbyn y rheoliadau hyn heddiw, bydd yn rhoi rhywfaint o ryddid inni wrth benderfynu'r mathau o fwyd y gellir eu cyfnewid am y talebau. Dyna'r rôl gyfyngedig sydd gennym. Byddai'n anghywir codi disgwyliadau pobl am yr hyn y gallwn ei ddarparu mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau hyn.

Wrth geisio ymdrin â nifer o'r pwyntiau penodol a godwyd, deallaf na chefnogwyd y cynllun hwn yn llawn yn y gorffennol. Felly, er ei fod wedi'i osod ar £9 miliwn ar hyn o bryd, credaf fod y dyraniad yn uwch rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Felly, mae'r tariff presennol o £9 miliwn yn fwy o adlewyrchiad o gydymffurfio neu nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio ar y cynllun nag yw o doriad effeithiol.

Ni ddylid ystyried y penderfyniad i ostwng yr oed cymwys fel gostyngiad yn yr arian sydd

money that is available to the scheme. Rather, it is a re-concentration of the money that is available on a slightly smaller age group. That smaller age group was chosen in order to concentrate our efforts, and the benefits of the scheme, on that smaller population. If the age of eligibility went back up to five and if the pool stayed the same, the level of support would be spread thinner. However, if we want to concentrate the benefit to deliver the best impact, it was felt that we would get a better result by concentrating it on the first four years of life.

Within the Welsh context, as we have free school breakfasts, as we are moving towards reception class, and as we are moving towards the Flying Start programme and the foundation phase, there is a good, coherent argument as to whether or not we should be concentrating the benefit of this scheme more effectively on four-year-olds. You could extend it to five-year-olds but because the money going into the scheme has not been reduced, it would mean that the amount of provision would be spread over a wider number of children.

4.30 p.m.

On the outlets that can use this scheme, a wide range of outlets can be used, including corner shops and farmers' markets. I would urge anyone who can have any influence on such outlets, or people who are involved in, for example, farmers' markets, to make an application to become an accredited outlet for this scheme. The Department of Health has primary responsibility for promoting this scheme, but I will be looking, with my officials, to see whether there are ways in which we can do our bit to promote it incidentally through the Assembly Government's activities to promote various preventive healthcare measures in Wales.

Therefore, I am pleased that there seems to be unanimous support for these regulations. Hopefully, today's debate will heighten awareness of this scheme, so that several of those outlets that are probably not fully aware of it at present—and many outlets are not as

ar gael ar gyfer y cynllun. Yn hytrach, mae'n golygu bod yr arian sydd ar gael yn cael ei ail-gyfeirio at grŵp oed ychydig yn llai. Dewiswyd y grŵp oed llai hwnnw er mwyn canolbwyntio ein hymdrechion, a buddiannau'r cynllun, ar y boblogaeth lai honno. Pe byddai'r oed cymwys yn mynd yn ôl i bump a phe byddai'r gronfa'n dal yr un fath, byddai lefel y cymorth i unigolion yn is. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am ganolbwyntio'r budd er mwyn darparu'r effaith orau, teimlwyd y byddem yn cael canlyniad gwell drwy ei ganolbwyntio ar y pedair blynedd cyntaf mewn bywyd.

Yng nghyd-destun Cymru, gan ein bod yn cynnig brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion, wrth inni symud tuag at ddosbarthiadau derbyn, ac wrth inni symud tuag at y rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg a'r cam sylfaen, mae yna ddadl dda, resymegol a ddylem ganolbwyntio buddiannau'r cynllun hwn yn fwy effeithiol ar blant pedair oed. Gallech ei ymestyn i blant pump oed, ond oherwydd nad yw'r arian sy'n mynd i mewn i'r cynllun wedi'i leihau, byddai'n golygu y byddai swm y ddarpariaeth yn cael ei rannu dros nifer ehangach o blant.

O ran y manau manwerthu a all ddefnyddio'r cynllun hwn, gellir defnyddio amrywiaeth eang o fannau manwerthu, gan gynnwys siopau cornel a marchnadoedd ffermwyr. Byddwn yn erfyn ar unrhyw un a all ddylanwadu ar fannau manwerthu o'r fath, neu ar bobl sy'n gysylltiedig, er enghraifft, â marchnadoedd ffermwyr, i wneud cais am fod yn un o fannau manwerthu achrededig y cynllun hwn. Yr Adran Iechyd sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am hyrwyddo'r cynllun hwn, ond byddaf yn edrych, gyda'm swyddogion, i weld a oes ffyrdd y gallwn gyfrannu at ei hyrwyddo o bryd i'w gilydd drwy weithgareddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo amrywiol fesurau gofal iechyd ataliol yng Nghymru.

Felly, yr wyf yn falch fod cefnogaeth unfrydol, mae'n ymddangos, i'r rheoliadau hyn. Gobeithio y bydd y ddadl heddiw yn gwella ymwybyddiaeth o'r cynllun, er mwyn i nifer o'r manau manwerthu hynny nad ydynt efallai yn hollol ymwybodol ohono ar

aware as they should be—will use this opportunity to make a formal application, and so spread the benefit and make it more readily accessible.

hyn o bryd—ac mae nifer o fannau manwerthu nad ydynt mor ymwybodol ag y dylent fod—yn manteisio ar y cyfle hwn i wneud cais ffurfiol, a thrwy hynny ledaenu'r budd a'i wneud yn fwy cyfleus.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 1: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3334): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006.*

Cynnig (NDM3334): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifió Bwyd Cychwyn Iach) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM3334): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.*

*Motion (NDM3334): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Law, Trish



Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3335): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3335): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf y Loteri Genedlaethol 2006 i'r Prif  
 Weinidog  
 Delegation of Functions under the National Lottery Act 2006 to the First  
 Minister**

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all functions of the National Assembly contained within the National Lottery Act 2006 and the National Lottery etc. Act 1993 as amended by the National Lottery Act 2006 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM3336)*

Since the start of the National Lottery 12 years ago, Wales has received almost £1 billion in lottery grants, distributed via some 26,000 big and small grants. The National Lottery Act 2006 introduced major reforms on the licensing and regulation of the National Lottery, and established the Big

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn Neddf y Loteri Genedlaethol 2006 a Deddf y Loteri Genedlaethol etc. 1993 fel y'i diwygiwyd gan Ddeddf y Loteri Genedlaethol 2006, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw. (NDM3336)*

Ers dechrau'r Loteri Genedlaethol 12 mlynedd yn ôl, mae Cymru wedi cael bron i £1 biliwn mewn grantiau loteri, wedi'i ddosbarthu drwy gyfrwng tua 26,000 o grantiau bach a mawr. Yr oedd Deddf y Loteri Genedlaethol 2006 yn cyflwyno diwygiadau sylweddol yn y ffordd y caiff y

Lottery Fund as a successor to the Community Fund, the New Opportunities Fund, and the Millennium Commission—a most welcome streamlining of lottery distributors. In creating the Big Lottery Fund, the UK Government recognised the need for greater devolution in its governance. For the first time, the Assembly was given the power to issue policy directions directly to a UK-wide lottery distributor, setting the strategic framework for its operations in Wales.

Lottery funding should build on its success in a sustainable way. The Government remains firmly wedded to the principle of additionality, and there is no intention to divert lottery funding, or to undermine the independence of the distributors. However, they need to work in a joined-up way, and deliver against our priorities in Wales, particularly social justice and fairness; after all, £1 staked by someone on a low income is a bigger contribution than £1 staked by someone on a high income.

Our policy aims are broad and high level. They include issues such as enabling a healthier and more physically active population, and a more active community. I hope that we can all agree this afternoon on such broad aims. The broad and high-level nature of these directions will allow the Big Lottery Fund to develop innovative programmes, which will give the fund the scope that it needs to be flexible and creative in its funding, to deliver solutions to the needs of the people of Wales, and to complement several of our core priorities.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the delegation of these functions as another step towards proper devolution. I will ask the Minister to clarify some points. How exactly will this new arrangement operate? Can we have your assurance that there will be positive engagement with Assembly Members, and even the culture committee, so that they are involved in the discussions and decisions, perhaps regarding the choice of chair, and so

Loteri Genedlaethol ei thrwyddedu a'i rheoleiddio, a sefydlwyd y Gronfa Loteri Fawr fel olynnydd i'r Gronfa Gymunedol, y Gronfa Cyfleoedd Newydd a Chomisiwn y Mileniwm—ymgais a groesawyd i symleiddio dosbarthwyr y loteri. Wrth greu'r Gronfa Loteri Fawr, cydnabu Llywodraeth y DU yr angen am ddatganoli ei dulliau llywodraethu ymhellach. Am y tro cyntaf, rhoddwyd pŵer i'r Cynulliad roi cyfarwyddiadau polisi yn uniongyrchol i ddosbarthwr loteri a oedd yn gweithredu ledled y DU, gan osod y fframwaith strategol ar gyfer ei weithrediadau yng Nghymru.

Dylai cyllid y loteri adeiladu ar ei llwyddiant mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr o hyd i egwyddor ychwanegolrwydd, ac nid oes unrhyw fwriad i arallgyfeirio cyllid y loteri, nac i danseilio annibyniaeth y dosbarthwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae angen iddynt weithio mewn ffordd gydgyssylltiedig, a chyflawni yn erbyn ein blaenoriaethau yng Nghymru, yn arbennig cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a thegwch; wedi'r cyfan, mae £1 a delir gan rywun sydd ar incwm isel yn fwy o gyfraniad na £1 a delir gan rywun sydd ar incwm uchel.

Mae ein nodau polisi yn eang ac ar lefel uchel. Maent yn cynnwys materion megis galluogi poblogaeth iachach sy'n fwy gweithgar yn gorfforol, a chymuned fwy gweithgar. Gobeithio y gallwn i gyd gytuno y prynhawn yma ar nodau eang felly. Bydd natur eang a lefel uchel y cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn galluogi'r Gronfa Loteri Fawr i ddatblygu rhaglenni arloesol, a fydd yn rhoi'r cyfle sydd ei angen ar y gronfa i fod yn hyblyg ac yn greadigol gyda'i chyllid, i ddarparu atebion ar gyfer anghenion pobl Cymru, ac i ategu nifer o'n blaenoriaethau craidd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu dirprwyo'r swyddogaethau hyn fel cam arall tuag at ddatganoli go iawn. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog egluro rhai pwyntiau. Sut yn union y bydd y trefniant newydd hwn yn gweithio? A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y caiff Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a hyd yn oed y pwyllgor diwylliant, eu cynnwys mewn ffordd gadarnhaol, er mwyn iddynt fod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau a'r penderfyniadau, efallai o ran

that the arrangement is not only fair, but is seen to be fair and just? I seek your reassurance about equality in terms of the distribution of lottery funding, because many perceive now that perhaps Communities First is benefiting one party's favourite ward or region rather than other parts of Wales.

dewis cadeirydd, ac er mwyn sicrhau bod y trefniant nid yn unig yn deg, ond y caiff ei weld fel trefniant teg a chyfiawn? Gofynnaf am sicrwydd gennyh yngŷn â chydaddoldeb wrth ddsbarthu cyllid y loteri, gan fod llawer o'r farn ar hyn o bryd fod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, efallai, yn ffafrio hoff ward neu ranbarth un blaid ar draul rhannau eraill o Gymru.

**Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** I reassure you that the directions to the lottery distributors will be public. The whole process is entirely transparent—the list of grants is a matter of public record and, of course, lottery distributors are frequent attendees at culture committee meetings, so there is plenty of opportunity for democratic scrutiny. Heritage Lottery Fund representatives were very welcome guests at the last culture committee meeting. They outlined their vision, not just in terms of investment in buildings, but in terms of their wider agenda for investment in the heritage of Wales.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Gallaf eich sicrhau y caiff y cyfarwyddiadau i ddsbarthwyr y loteri eu cyhoeddi. Mae'r holl broses yn hollol eglur—mae'r rhestr grantiau yn gofnod cyhoeddus, ac wrth gwrs, mae dosbarthwyr y loteri yn aml yn mynychu cyfarfodydd y pwyllgor diwylliant. Felly, mae digon o gyfle i gynnal proses graffu ddemocrataidd. Croesawyd cynrychiolwyr Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri i gyfarfod diwethaf y pwyllgor diwylliant. Buont yn amlinellu eu gweledigaeth, nid yn unig o ran buddsoddi mewn adeiladau, ond o ran eu hagenda ehangach ar gyfer buddsoddi yn nhreftadaeth Cymru.

*Cynnig (NDM3336): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3336): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.36 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.36 p.m.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru Annual Report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call the Deputy Minister to speak, I ask Assembly Members to note the time—we do not have that much and, therefore, succinct speeches will be welcomed.

**The Deputy Minister (John Griffiths):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the publication of the annual report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales for the period 2005-06, a copy of which was e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2006. (NDM3337)*

We welcome the publication of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales's fourth annual report. It is highly informative and covers the trends and service quality issues that face us today. It also covers the way in which CSIW has undertaken its duties. The findings of the report indicate generally that the framework of regulations and national minimum standards has created an understanding of what makes good quality care and support, which has enabled many providers to improve their standards. It is pleasing to note that day-care services for

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar y Dirprwy Weinidog i lefaru, gofynnaf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad sylwi ar yr amser—nid oes gennym lawer o amser, ac felly bydd areithiau cryno yn cael croeso.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog (John Griffiths):** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ar gyfer y cyfnod 2005-06, yr e-bostiwyd copi ohono at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3337)*

Croesawn gyhoeddi pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru. Mae'n llawn gwybodaeth ac yn cyfeirio at y tueddiadau a'r materion ansawdd gwasanaeth sy'n ein hwynebu heddiw. Mae hefyd yn cyfeirio at y ffordd y mae ASGC wedi cyflawni ei dyletswyddau. Yn gyffredinol, dengys datganfyddiadau'r adroddiad fod y fframwaith rheoliadau a'r safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol wedi creu dealltwriaeth o'r hyn sy'n arwain at ofal a chymorth o ansawdd da, sydd wedi galluogi nifer o ddarparwyr i wella'u safonau. Mae'n

children under the age of eight have performed well. This is a significant achievement. CSIW, in responding to these improvements, has adopted a more proportionate approach to inspection in this area. Therefore, in 2006-07, CSIW will undertake approximately 1,000 fewer inspections. This will enable resources to be targeted on the areas of most need, which will ensure a more intelligent approach to inspection.

However, we remain concerned about those areas that are not performing consistently to the standards set by the Welsh Assembly Government. We are particularly concerned about the findings in the report regarding residential services for both children and adults. It is essential that core care practices are firmly put in place, particularly regarding issues such as statements of purpose, individual care plans for service users, the number and suitability of staff, training and support for staff, risk management, adequate record keeping and premises. The Welsh Assembly Government has already taken steps to address some of these issues. It has given a strong commitment in its consultation document, 'Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities', to develop a comprehensive commissioning framework for social services and to strengthen the support given to monitoring the quality of the services provided.

We are also concerned about the issues raised in the report regarding the recruitment and proper vetting of staff. To help address these concerns, a national plan for the social care workforce is being developed, in collaboration with the Care Council for Wales.

4.40 p.m.

We are also taking steps to accelerate the improvement in services for looked-after children across the various care settings. We aim to create a positive environment for residential and foster-care settings. We are currently developing mechanisms to provide the right support for this and, in February 2007, we will bring forward regulations to drive up the quality of care in children's homes, which will require managers and staff

bleser sylwi bod gwasanaethau gofal dydd i blant o dan wyth oed wedi perfformio'n dda. Mae hwn yn llwyddiant pwysig. Mae ASGC, wrth ymateb i'r gwelliannau hyn, wedi mabwysiadu dull mwy cymesur o arolygu'r maes hwn. Felly, yn 2006-07 bydd ASGC yn cynnal tua 1,000 o arolygiadau yn llai. Bydd hyn yn galluogi targedu adnoddau at y meysydd lle y mae eu hangen fwyaf, a fydd yn sicrhau dull mwy deallus o arolygu.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dal yn bryderus am y meysydd hynny nad ydynt yn llwyddo'n gyson i gyrraedd y safonau a bennwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr ydym yn pryderu'n arbennig am ddarganfyddiadau'r adroddiad ynglŷn â gwasanaethau preswyl i blant ac oedolion. Mae'n hanfodol i arferion gofal craidd ymsefydlu'n gadarn, yn arbennig mewn materion megis datganiadau diben, cynlluniau gofal unigol i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau, nifer y staff a'u haddasrwydd, hyfforddiant a chymorth i staff, rheoli risg, cadw cofnodion digonol, ac adeiladau. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eisoes wedi cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hyn. Rhoddodd ymrwymiad cryf yn ei dogfen ymgynghori, 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol', i ddatblygu fframwaith comisiynu cynhwysfawr ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac i atgyfnerthu'r cymorth a roddir i fonitro ansawdd y gwasanaethau a ddarperir.

Yr ydym hefyd yn pryderu am y materion a godwyd yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn â recriwtio staff a'u fetio'n briodol. Er mwyn helpu ymdrin â'r pryderon hyn, mae cynllun cenedlaethol wrthi'n cael ei ddatblygu ar gyfer y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, mewn cydweithrediad â Chyngor Gofal Cymru.

Yr ydym hefyd yn cymryd camau i gyflymu'r broses o wella gwasanaethau ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal yn yr amrywiol leoliadau gofal. Ein nod yw creu amgylchedd cadarnhaol ar gyfer lleoliadau gofal preswyl a gofal maeth. Yr ydym wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn datblygu systemau i ddarparu'r cymorth priodol yn hyn, ac ym mis Chwefror 2007 byddwn yn cyflwyno rheoliadau i wella ansawdd gofal mewn cartrefi plant. Bydd y

to have relevant qualifications and be registered with the Care Council for Wales. We are also exploring the potential of establishing a Welsh centre of excellence for the care of looked-after children, to support implementation and the sharing of best practice. Where we see good quality services, there is evidence of strong leadership and management by the service itself, and it is vital that this is developed across Wales.

We support the regulatory reforms that are being taken forward by CSIW, which will enable it to target its resources by matching the intensity of regulation with service users' needs. This is integral to support the necessary changes to practice, leadership and management. This report also indicates that regulation in isolation cannot raise the standards of care; it suggests that underlying issues need to be strengthened at a strategic level, involving all organisations that have a stake in the delivery of services. It points to the need to rebalance the roles of providers, commissioners and regulators; 'Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities' looks at that and the role of commissioning within a 10-year strategy framework.

In conclusion, in addition to CSIW's contribution to service improvement, particularly the progress on reforming regulation in Wales, we are pleased to note that CSIW continues to meet its key targets.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will begin by adding my thanks to the inspectorate for its report. It reflects a huge body of valuable work and provides us with a wealth of information that shows how we are, or are not, meeting the needs of some of our most vulnerable citizens. So much could be said, because there is so much information in the report, and so many questions could be raised with the Government. However, as the chair of the new cross-party group on children's issues, I will focus on some of the points on children's services raised in this report.

None of us could disagree with the Deputy

rheini'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i reolwyr a staff feddu ar gymwysterau perthnasol a bod wedi'u cofrestru gyda Chyngor Gofal Cymru. Yr ydym hefyd yn ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o sefydlu canolfan ragoriaeth yng Nghymru ar gyfer gofal i blant sy'n cael gofal, i gynorthwyo wrth roi arfer gorau ar waith a'i rannu. Lle y gwelwn wasanaethau o safon uchel, mae tystiolaeth o arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth gref gan y gwasanaeth ei hun, ac mae'n hanfodol i hyn gael ei ddatblygu ledled Cymru.

Yr ydym o blaid y diwygiadau rheoliadol sy'n cael eu gweithredu gan ASGC, a fydd yn ei galluogi i dargedu ei hadnoddau drwy gydweddu dwysedd rheoleiddio ag anghenion defnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Mae hyn yn hanfodol er mwyn cefnogi'r newidiadau angenrheidiol mewn arfer, arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth. Mae'r adroddiad hwn hefyd yn nodi na all rheoliadau ar eu pen eu hunain godi safonau gofal; awgryma fod angen atgyfnerthu materion sylfaenol ar lefel strategol, gan gynnwys yr holl sefydliadau sy'n ymwneud â darparu gwasanaethau. Dywed fod angen ailgydbwysu rolau darparwyr, comisiynwyr a rheoleiddwyr; mae 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol' yn ystyried hynny a rôl comisiynu o fewn fframwaith strategol 10 mlynedd.

I gloi, yn ogystal â chyfraniad ASGC i wella gwasanaethau, yn arbennig y cynnydd wrth ddiwygio rheoliadau yng Nghymru, mae'n bleser gennym sylwi bod ASGC yn parhau i gyrraedd ei thargedau allweddol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Dechreuaf drwy ychwanegu fy niolch i'r arolygiaeth am ei hadroddiad. Mae'n adlewyrchu corff aruthrol o waith gwerthfawr ac yn rhoi cyfoeth o wybodaeth inni sy'n dangos sut yr ydym, neu sut nad ydym, yn llwyddo i ddiwallu anghenion rhai o'n dinasyddion mwyaf diamddiffyn. Gellid dweud cymaint, gan fod cymaint o wybodaeth yn yr adroddiad, a gellid codi cynifer o gwestiynau gyda'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, fel cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol newydd ar faterion plant, canolbwytiaf ar rai o'r pwyntiau'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau plant a godwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Ni allai neb ohonom anghytuno â'r Dirprwy

Minister when he said that the Government aims to create positive experiences. However, the evidence shows—and I am sure that he would agree—that it is still a long way from succeeding. I hope that I did not detect any complacency in the Deputy Minister's comments because there is clearly no room for that. It is pleasing to see, in this report, that there have been some improvements with regard to fostering, notably with regard to the practice in relation to Criminal Records Bureau checks, which were identified as a problem last year, and developing appropriate policy frameworks.

Major concerns do remain, including issues around the recruitment of staff and carers, training and support for staff and carers, and information services and information sharing. The Minister and the Government need to address these issues urgently. On the recruitment and retention of carers, for example, it is vital to increase the level of the fees paid, to more accurately reflect the cost of caring for a child. We cannot afford to keep losing foster carers to the private sector. Voices from Care, the organisation that speaks for, and is made up of, young people with experiences of care, is concerned about the extent to which fostering and children's homes services are being privatised. The organisation believes that while there is a role for positive private sector providers, there is a risk that this makes children and young people vulnerable to market factors, which it feels is inappropriate. We need to keep foster carers in the public sector and, to do so, we need to value them as the key professionals that they are in the childcare team; we are a long way from doing that.

In terms of support for foster carers, I take this opportunity to welcome the Government's decision to fund the Fostering Network's dedicated helpline for foster carers. Previously, foster carers in Wales relied on helpline services from England, which became obviously inappropriate as the regulatory framework changed and became more distinctive. I am glad that the Government has decided to fund this important project, and I look forward to its formal launch in the new year. However, I

Weinidog pan ddywedodd mai nod y Llywodraeth yw creu profiadau cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, dengys y dystiolaeth—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n cytuno—fod ganddi lawer i'w wneud cyn llwyddo. Gobeithio nad yw sylwadau'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn awgrymu ei fod yn barod i orffwys ar ei rwyfau, gan nad oes lle i hynny, yn amlwg. Mae'n bleser gweld, yn yr adroddiad hwn, fod yna rai gwelliannau o ran maethu, yn arbennig yn yr arfer mewn cysylltiad â gwiriadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol, a nodwyd fel problem y llynedd, a datblygu fframweithiau polisi priodol.

Erys pryderon mawr, gan gynnwys materion yn ymwneud â recriwtio staff a gofawyr, hyfforddiant a chymorth i staff a gofawyr, a gwasanaethau gwybodaeth a rhannu gwybodaeth. Mae angen i'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth ymdrin â'r materion hyn ar fyrder. O ran recriwtio a chadw gofawyr, er enghraifft, mae'n hanfodol cynyddu lefel y ffioedd a delir, i adlewyrchu'n well y gost o ofalu am blentyn. Ni allwn fforddio colli mwy o ofalwyr maeth i'r sector preifat. Mae Voices from Care, y sefydliad sy'n cynrychioli pobl ifanc sydd â phrofiad o ofal ac sy'n cynnwys pobl ifanc o'r fath, yn pryderu ynghylch y graddau y mae gwasanaethau maethu a chartrefi plant yn cael eu preifateiddio. Er bod rhan gan ddarparwyr cadarnhaol o'r sector preifat i'w chwarae, cred y sefydliad fod perygl i hyn wneud plant a phobl ifanc yn agored i ffactorau'r farchnad, sy'n amhriodol, yn ei farn ef. Mae angen inni gadw gofawyr maeth yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac i wneud hynny mae angen inni eu gwerthfawrogi fel gweithwyr proffesiynol allweddol yn y tîm gofal plant, gan mai dyna ydynt; yr ydym ymhell o wneud hynny.

O ran cymorth i ofalwyr maeth, manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i groesawu penderfyniad y Llywodraeth i ariannu llinell gymorth benodedig y Rhwydwaith Maethu ar gyfer gofawyr maeth. Byddai gofawyr maeth yng Nghymru yn dibynnu gynt ar wasanaethau llinell gymorth o Loegr, a ddaeth yn amlwg yn amhriodol wrth i'r fframwaith rheoleiddio newid a dod yn fwy penodol i Gymru. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu ariannu'r prosiect pwysig hwn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei lansio'n ffurfiol yn y flwyddyn



seek the Government's assurance that that funding will be maintained, as it would be most regrettable if that service were lost when the initial funding stream ends.

The Deputy Minister noted some real concerns about children's home services, and these persist. The extent to which they persist is a worry, as the trends continue. The progress towards a qualified workforce is too slow, and points have been raised with me as to whether we can somehow increase the accreditation of prior learning, and the recognition of the existing skills of staff who are perhaps not academically inclined but who have a huge wealth of experience that many children in care value enormously. There are also concerns about appropriate staffing levels in homes, which have worsened since last year, and that is very worrying.

Arrangements for contact with family and significant others are still a concern in 18 per cent of the sample, which is far too much. We know how important it is for looked-after children to maintain contact with their roots. Of course, that becomes difficult when more children are increasingly placed out of county, and a long way from home. We also have to be concerned for those children from English authorities who are placed in Welsh authorities, and who may find it extremely difficult to have regular contact with their families.

The inadequacies of placement planning are getting worse, not better. Inadequacies were found in 33 per cent of the sample, compared with 20 per cent last year. This has really got to be addressed, as have the poor arrangements for health and education. The plans were simply not detailed enough in nearly a third of the sample, and I am sure that the Government would agree that that is unacceptable.

I hope that the Ministers will agree that this is a worrying situation. The facts are well known about the poor mental health and poor educational attainment of looked-after children, and I simply do not detect sufficient progress. Voices from Care Cymru believes

newydd. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf am sicrwydd y Llywodraeth y caiff yr arian ei gynnal, oherwydd byddai'n drueni garw pe collid y gwasanaeth hwnnw wrth i'r ffrwd ariannu gychwynnol ddod i ben.

Nododd y Dirprwy Weinidog rai pryderon gwirioneddol ynghylch gwasanaethau cartref i blant ac mae'r rhain yn parhau. Mae'r graddau y maent yn parhau yn bryder, wrth i'r tueddiadau barhau. Mae'r cynnydd tuag at weithlu cymwys yn rhy araf, a chodwyd pwyntiau gyda mi am y cwestiwn a allwn rywsut gynyddu achredu dysgu blaenorol, a chydabod sgiliau presennol staff nad ydynt efallai yn academiaidd, ond sydd â chyfoeth mawr o brofiad y mae llawer o blant mewn gofal yn ei werthfawrogi'n fawr iawn. Mae yna bryderon hefyd ynghylch lefelau staffio priodol mewn cartrefi, sydd wedi gwaethygu ers y llynedd, ac mae hynny'n bryder mawr.

Mae trefniadau ar gyfer cyswllt â'r teulu a phobl eraill sydd o bwys yn dal yn bryder mewn 18 y cant o'r sampl, sydd lawer yn ormod. Gwyddom mor bwysig ydyw i blant sy'n cael gofal gadw cysylltiad â'u gwreiddiau. Wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n mynd yn anos pan fydd mwy o blant yn cael eu lleoli'n gynyddol y tu allan i'r sir, ac ymhell oddi cartref. Mae angen hefyd inni bryderu am y plant hynny o awdurdodau yn Lloegr sy'n cael eu gosod gydag awdurdodau yng Nghymru ac yn ei chael yn anodd iawn efallai i gadw mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â'u teuluoedd.

Mae'r diffygion wrth gynllunio lleoliadau yn gwaethygu, nid yn gwella. Gwelwyd diffygion mewn 33 y cant o'r sampl, o'i gymharu ag 20 y cant y llynedd. Mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hyn, ynghyd â'r trefniadau gwael ar gyfer iechyd ac addysg. Yn syml, nid oedd y cynlluniau'n ddigon manwl mewn bron un rhan o dair o'r sampl, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn cytuno bod hynny'n annerbyniol.

Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidogion yn cytuno bod hyn yn sefyllfa bryderus. Mae'r ffeithiau'n hysbys iawn ynglŷn ag iechyd meddwl gwael a chyrhaeddiad addysgol gwael plant sy'n cael gofal, ac yn syml, ni allaf weld cynnydd digonol. Cred Voices

that one of the keys to addressing some of the problems facing individual children due to these systemic failures is the provision of a truly independent and centrally funded advocacy service. I would welcome some comment by the Government on that.

We must pay tribute to the great efforts of many of those foster carers, people working in children's homes, and social workers who work with looked-after children, although many of them are struggling to provide high-quality experiences for children and young people in difficult circumstances, and they are often underresourced. The outcomes for too many are still too poor, and I press the Ministers to make it their highest priority to address the systemic failures identified in the report.

**Val Lloyd:** I am mindful of your comments about time constraints, Deputy Presiding Officer, so I will keep my remarks to issues cited in the report that have also been brought to my attention as constituency issues.

I am pleased by the improvements in this sector, particularly with regard to day-care children's services. It is reassuring that CSIW has met its targets on regulatory responsibilities. However, there are several important concerns, and I highlight those that have been brought to my personal attention.

The report consistently identifies staffing as a problem across the range of care services. I am concerned by the apparent lack of adequate structure for recruitment practices, and by the need for appropriate staff training, supervision and appraisal. This is a vital service, more so because it will be used by the most vulnerable people in Wales. We must get it right, therefore, and get the right staff to deliver the best care. However, getting the right staff also means having an efficient vetting procedure, and I am well aware of one small domiciliary care provider in Swansea which is finding it difficult to recruit the appropriate number of staff because of the time that it takes for Criminal Records Bureau disclosures to come back. I know that that is outwith your responsibility, Minister, and I am not suggesting that CRB

From Care Cymru mai un o'r atebion i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau sy'n wynebu plant unigol oherwydd y methiannau systemig hyn yw darparu gwasanaeth eirioli a ariennir yn ganolog sy'n wirioneddol annibynnol. Byddwn yn croesawu sylwadau gan y Llywodraeth am hynny.

Rhaid inni roi teyrnged i ymdrechion mawr nifer o'r gofalwyr maeth hynny, pobl sy'n gweithio mewn cartrefi plant a gweithwyr cymdeithasol sy'n gweithio gyda phlant sy'n cael gofal, er bod nifer ohonynt yn ymdrechu i roi profiadau o safon i blant a phobl ifanc mewn amgylchiadau anodd, ac yn aml ni chânt adnoddau digonol. Mae'r canlyniadau i ormod yn dal yn rhy wael, a phwysaf ar y Gweinidogion i roi'r flaenoriaeth fwyaf i fynd i'r afael â'r methiannau systematig a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn cofio'ch sylwadau am y cyfyngiadau amser, Ddirprwy Lywydd, felly, byddaf yn cyfyngu fy sylwadau i faterion yn yr adroddiad a ddygwyd i'm sylw hefyd fel materion etholaethol.

Yr wyf wedi fy mhlesio gan y gwelliannau yn y sector hwn, yn enwedig o ran gwasanaethau gofal dydd i blant. Mae'n galonogol bod ASGC wedi cyrraedd ei dargedau o ran cyfrifoldebau rheoleddio. Fodd bynnag, mae yna nifer o bryderon pwysig, ac yr wyf am dynnu sylw at y rhai a ddygwyd i'm sylw i'n bersonol.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'n gyson bod staffio'n broblem mewn amrywiaeth o wasanaethau gofal. Pryderaf am y diffyg strwythur digonol sydd i'w weld ar gyfer arferion recriwtio, ac am yr angen i hyfforddi, goruchwyllo a gwerthuso staff yn briodol. Mae hwn yn wasanaeth hanfodol, yn fwy felly oherwydd caiff ei ddefnyddio gan y bobl sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni felly wneud hyn yn gywir a chael y staff cywir i gyflwyno'r gofal gorau. Fodd bynnag, mae cael y staff cywir hefyd yn golygu cael proses effeithlon o archwilio, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o un darparwr gofal cartref bach yn Abertawe sy'n ei chael yn anodd recriwtio'r nifer priodol o staff oherwydd yr amser y mae'n ei gymryd i ddatgeliadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol ddod yn ôl. Gwn fod hynny y tu

checks are not absolutely necessary, given the nature of the service, but I do know that delays cause logistical headaches for small companies, and have an impact on the service that can be given to vulnerable people.

I would like to see further improvements in the way in which care services are delivered. No matter how good they are, they can always be better. There is a need to drive up standards and to build on the progress achieved in recent years. I seek an assurance that the Minister and his team will continue to work closely with CSIW to develop a first-class service in Wales.

4.50 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** When reading this interesting report, I was pleased to see some key improvements in the quality of the environment in care homes, especially improvements in the examples of councils collaborating with the independent sector to provide training to staff. In terms of the crude numbers, it is good to see a reduction in the number of complaints.

However, I want to take this opportunity to express my concern about the finding of staff shortages, which will have an impact on the amount of time available for the training of staff. It is important to remember that the vast majority of homes are now in the independent sector. Many are part of large, even international, chains of providers. Although the overall number of places in care homes has not varied much, uneven provision across Wales is a serious cause for concern. It is not an issue that is easily dealt with when the majority of providers are in the independent sector, because it comes down to a question of the market.

I want to register particular concerns about the placement of elderly mentally infirm people, particularly the lack of such placements in some parts of Wales, such as Cardiff. We must look at why these placements do not exist. When I talk to people in the sector, they tell me that it is largely because the fees paid are often

hwnt i'ch cyfrifoldeb chi, Weinidog, ac nid wyf yn awgrymu nad yw gwiriadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol yn gwbl angenrheidiol, o ystyried natur y gwasanaeth. Ond gwn fod oedi yn achosi cur pen o ran logisteg i gwmnïau bach, a'u bod yn cael effaith ar y gwasanaeth y gellir ei roi i bobl sy'n agored i niwed.

Hoffwn weld gwelliannau pellach yn y modd y darperir gwasanaethau gofal. Waeth pa mor dda ydynt, gallant bob amser fod yn well. Mae angen codi safonau ac adeiladu ar y cynnydd a welwyd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Gofynnaf am sicrwydd y bydd y Gweinidog a'i dîm yn parhau i gydweithio'n agos ag ASGC i ddatblygu gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** Wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad diddorol hwn, yr oeddwn yn falch gweld rhai gwelliannau allweddol yn safon yr amgylchedd mewn cartrefi gofal, yn arbennig welliannau yn yr enghreifftiau o gynghorau'n cydweithio â'r sector annibynnol i roi hyfforddiant i staff. O ran y niferoedd bras, mae'n dda gweld lleihad yn nifer y cwynton.

Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gymryd y cyfle hwn i fynegi fy mhryder am y darganfyddiad am brinder staff, a fydd yn cael effaith ar yr amser sydd ar gael i hyfforddi staff. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod y mwyafrif helaeth o gartrefi yn awr yn y sector annibynnol. Mae nifer yn rhan o gadwyni mawr, rhyngwladol hyd yn oed, o ddarparwyr. Er nad yw nifer y lleoedd cyffredinol mewn cartrefi gofal wedi amrywio lawer, mae darpariaeth anghyson ar draws Cymru yn achosi pryder mawr. Nid yw'n fater y gellir mynd i'r afael ag ef yn hawdd pan fydd mwyafrif y darparwyr yn y sector annibynnol, gan mai cwestiwn o farchnad yw hyn yn y diwedd.

Hoffwn nodi pryderon penodol ynghylch lleoli henoed bregus eu meddwl, yn arbennig prinder lleoliadau o'r math mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, megis Caerdydd. Rhaid inni edrych i weld pam nad yw'r lleoedd hyn ar gael. Pan siaradaf â phobl yn y sector, dywedant wrthyf fod hyn yn bennaf oherwydd bod y ffioedd a delir yn aml yn

inadequate to reflect the far more complex issues involved in dealing with elderly mentally ill patients, who are, after all, most vulnerable. I raised that with the Minister earlier. We must encourage the provision of sufficient places for these most vulnerable patients as a matter of urgency.

Although the number of places has not decreased by a significant amount across Wales, too many of those placements are in rural areas. By definition, most people live in urban areas, and so the inescapable logic of that is that elderly people and young vulnerable people are placed many miles from their families, whose homes are in urban areas. It is a particular problem that we need to address in one way or another. I am also particularly concerned by the fact that all this moving people around the country hides the fact that a large number of children from outside Wales are placed in Wales, many in Powys. That is a popular area to place these children, but it is many miles from their families, and, normally, that would not be appropriate.

It is worth repeating the most important messages of the report. The first is the need for stronger commissioning, and, by implication, that requires the NHS and local authorities to work more closely together. We are not talking about more specialist placements, but about the need for regional commissioning. I want to ask the Minister where regional commissioning now stands in relation to the decision that was announced yesterday about local service boards, as I fear that that could lead to regional commissioning being put on the back boiler by local authorities, when we need to do everything possible to encourage local authorities to work together.

It is also important for us all to bear in mind that the report recognises that regulation upon regulation does not, on its own, bring about the changes that we want. Given that this sector is so dependent on the independent sector, if you apply regulations particularly frequently or too stringently, it will force people out and will cause destabilisation.

annigonol i adlewyrchu'r materion llawer mwy cymhleth sydd gysylltiedig â delio â chleifion hŷn sydd â salwch meddwl, sef y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed, wedi'r cyfan. Codais hynny gyda'r Gweinidog yn gynharach. Rhaid inni darparu lleoedd digonol i'r cleifion hyn sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, a hynny ar frys.

Er nad yw nifer y lleoedd wedi gostwng lawer ledled Cymru, mae gormod o'r lleoliadau hyn mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Drwy ddiffiniad, mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn byw mewn ardaloedd trefol, ac felly rhesymeg anochel hynny yw bod yr henoed a phobl ifanc sy'n agored i niwed yn cael eu lleoli filltiroedd lawer oddi wrth eu teuluoedd syd â'u cartrefi mewn ardaloedd trefol. Mae hyn yn broblem arbennig y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hi mewn rhyw ffordd neu ei gilydd. Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu'n benodol am y ffaith fod yr holl broses o symud pobl o amgylch y wlad yn cuddio'r ffaith fod nifer fawr o blant o'r tu allan i Gymru yn cael eu lleoli yng Nghymru, lawer ohonynt ym Mhowys. Mae honno'n ardal boblogaidd i leoli'r plant hynny, ond mae ymhell iawn oddi wrth eu teuluoedd, ac fel rheol ni fyddai hynny'n briodol.

Mae'n werth ailadrodd negeseuon pwysicaf yr adroddiad. Yr un gyntaf yw'r angen am gomisiynu cryfach, a thrwy oblygiad mae hynny'n gofyn i'r GIG ac awdurdodau lleol gydweithio'n agosach. Nid ydym yn sôn am leoliadau mwy arbenigol, ond am yr angen am gomisiynu rhanbarthol. Hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog beth yw'r sefyllfa o ran comisiynu rhanbarthol erbyn hyn mewn perthynas â'r penderfyniad a gyhoeddwyd ddoe ynghylch byrddau gwasanaeth lleol. Yr wyf yn ofni y gallai hynny olygu bod awdurdodau lleol yn rhoi blaenoriaeth isel i gomisiynu rhanbarthol, pan fydd angen inni wneud popeth posibl i annog awdurdodau lleol i gydweithio.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig ini bob un gofio bod yr adroddiad yn cydnabod nad yw un rheoliad ar ôl y llall, ar ei ben ei hun, yn rhoi'r newidiadau y mae arnom eu heisiau. O gofio bod y sector hwn mor ddibynnol ar y sector annibynnol, os byddwch yn defnyddio'r rheoliadau yn aml iawn neu'n rhy llym, bydd yn diflasu pobl ac yn achosi

Those are the words of the inspector, not mine. I would be grateful for some responses when you have the opportunity to respond.

ansefydlogrwydd. Geiriau'r arolygydd yw'r rheini, nid fy ngeiriau i. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am rai ymatebion pan gewch gyfle i ymateb.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I invite the Business Minister to propose a procedural motion to extend this Plenary meeting.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol i ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn hwn.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting until 6.00 p.m.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 6.00 p.m.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Are there 10 Members in favour? I see that there are. Therefore, I call for a vote to extend the meeting by half an hour.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod o blaid? Gwelaf fod. Felly, galwaf am bleidlais i ymestyn y cyfarfod hanner awr.

*Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.*

*Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Black, Peter  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

## **Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru: Parhad Annual Report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales: Continued**

**Gwenda Thomas:** In view of the time limit, I will focus on children's services. While recognising that there is more to do, I particularly welcome the improvement that the chief inspector noted had occurred in children's homes concerning complaints, bullying problems and behaviour management. I pass on my congratulations to all the staff who work so hard in the care sector to ensure these improvements. I was able to witness the dedication of care staff when I visited the secure unit at Hillside in my constituency last Friday, during its open day. Following the approval of Plenary, I welcome the positive step that Hillside will now come within the remit of the CSIW in terms of regulation and inspection, and that any duplication of inspecting agencies has been removed.

When the chief inspector gave evidence to the safeguarding vulnerable children review, he noted that important steps had been taken towards improving services. He also highlighted some problems regarding the implementation of plans and aspirations, and how quality outcomes for children are best delivered. Alongside that is the recognition in this year's annual report that there is a clear willingness to develop and improve services in the provision of social care, but that there is a requirement for a strategic response. As we have already heard, the Welsh Assembly Government has produced the recently ended consultation report, 'Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities', a 10-year strategy for social services. While welcoming the consultation, I have to say that I was surprised to find no reference to the 'Keeping Us Safe' report when considering the development of a strategy for children's services, particularly with regard to the most vulnerable children.

Of specific value is what the children and young people told us when they participated in the review. I very much welcome the subsequent assurance of the Minister for

**Gwenda Thomas:** Oherwydd y cyfyngiad amser, byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar wasanaethau plant. Er fy mod yn cydnabod bod mwy i'w wneud, croesawaf yn arbennig y gwelliant y sylwodd y prif arolygydd ei fod wedi digwydd mewn cartrefi plant o ran cwynion, problemau bwlio a rheoli ymddygiad. Hoffwn longyfarch yr holl staff sy'n gweithio mor galed yn y sector gofal i sicrhau'r gwelliannau hyn. Gwelais ymroddiad staff gofal wrth ymweld â'r uned ddiogel yn Hillside yn fy etholaeth ddydd Gwener diwethaf yn ystod ei diwrnod agored. Yn dilyn cymeradwyaeth y Cyfarfod Llawn, croesawaf y cam cadarnhaol y bydd Hillside yn awr yn dod o fewn cylch gwaith ASGC o ran rheoleiddio ac arolygu, a bod unrhyw ddyblygu o ran asiantaethau arolygu wedi ei ddileu.

Pan gyflwynodd y prif arolygydd dystiolaeth i'r adolygiad o ddiogelu plant sy'n agored i niwed, nododd fod camau pwysig wedi'u cymryd at wella gwasanaethau. Tynnodd sylw hefyd at rai problemau wrth weithredu cynlluniau a dyheadau, a'r ffordd orau i ddarparu canlyniadau o safon blant. Ynghyd â hynny, mae'r gydnabyddiaeth yn yr adroddiad blynyddol eleni fod parodrwydd clir i ddatblygu a gwella gwasanaethau wrth ddarparu gofal cymdeithasol, ond bod gofyn am ymateb strategol. Fel y clywsom eisoes, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad ymgynghori a ddaeth i ben yn ddiweddar, 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol', sef strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r ymgynghoriad, rhaid imi ddweud fy mod wedi synnu gweld nad oedd cyfeiriad at adroddiad 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel' wrth ystyried datblygu strategaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant, yn arbennig o ran y plant sydd fwyaf agored i niwed.

Mae'r hyn a oedd gan y plant a'r bobl ifanc i'w ddweud wrthym wrth gymryd rhan yn yr adolygiad o werth arbennig. Croesawaf sicrwydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a

Health and Social Services that the 'Keeping Us Safe' report and the Welsh Assembly Government's response to it will influence the development of the strategy. We must never forget that at the heart of service delivery and outcomes is the welfare of a vulnerable child, and that the protection of the vulnerable child is paramount.

**Trish Law:** I commend this excellent and comprehensive report, and congratulate the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales on presenting its fourth annual report in such a clear, positive and readable form. I personally thank the staff of the south-east Wales regional office in Pontypool for being most helpful and courteous in the dealings that I have had with them in recent months.

The CSIW is one of our cinderella agencies, which, away from the public gaze and the media spotlight, strives to ensure that the welfare of some of the most vulnerable people in our society—from babies to the very elderly—is safeguarded.

5.00 p.m.

However, today I want to focus on one issue in particular that is causing much controversy and consternation in Blaenau Gwent: the care of the elderly.

Labour-controlled Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council seems hell-bent on closing four of its five residential homes for older people. Its director of social services admits that there has been a lack of investment in these homes stretching back to the days of Gwent County Council in the 1990s. However, he claims that the real need for the closures is to divert resources to supporting the elderly in their own homes, or in so-called extra care sheltered housing developments. Nowhere in this report is there any mention whatsoever of the need to close residential care homes, although it does acknowledge that there is an increased emphasis these days on promoting independence and care at home. What is also clear from this report is that the rate of care home closures, which we have witnessed in recent years, is slowing down. Indeed, all the

Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedyn y bydd yr adroddiad 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel' ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru iddo yn dylanwadu ar ddatblygu'r strategaeth. Ni ddylem byth anghofio mai lles plant sy'n agored i niwed sydd wrth wraidd darparu gwasanaethau a chanlyniadau, a bod amddiffyn plant sy'n agored i niwed o'r pwys mwyaf.

**Trish Law:** Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad ardderchog a chynhwysfawr hwn, a hoffwn longyfarch Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ar gyflwyno ei phedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol mewn ffurf mor glir, cadarnhaol a darllenadwy. Yn bersonol, diolchaf i staff swyddfa ranbarthol y de-ddwyrain ym Mhont-y-pŵl am fod mor barod i helpu ac mor gwrtais yn eu hymwneud â mi dros y misoedd diwethaf.

ASGC yw un o'n hasiantaethau sinderela sydd, allan o olwg y cyhoedd a'r wasg, yn ceisio sicrhau bod lles rhai o'r bobl yn ein cymdeithas sydd fwyaf agored i niwed—o fabanod i bobl hen iawn—yn cael ei ddiogelu.

Fodd bynnag, heddiw yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar un mater yn arbennig sy'n peri cryn ddadlau a dychryn ym Mlaenau Gwent: gofal yr henoed.

Mae'n ymddangos bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent a reolir gan Lafur yn benderfynol o gau pedwar o'i gartrefi preswyl i bobl hŷn. Mae ei gyfarwyddwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn cyfaddef bod diffyg buddsoddi wedi bod yn y cartrefi hyn ers dyddiau Cyngor Sir Gwent yn y 1990au. Fodd bynnag, mae'n honni mai'r gwir reswm dros eu cau yw er mwyn dargyfeirio adnoddau i gynorthwyo'r henoed yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, neu mewn datblygiadau a elwir yn dai gyda gofal ychwanegol. Ni sonnir bod angen cau cartrefi gofal preswyl o gwbl yn yr adroddiad hwn, er ei fod yn cydnabod bod mwy o bwyslais erbyn hyn ar hyrwyddo annibyniaeth a gofal gartref. Yr hyn sydd hefyd yn glir o'r adroddiad hwn yw bod llai o gartrefi gofal yn cael eu cau, fel y gwelsom yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yn wir, mae'r holl arwyddion yn dangos bod

signs point to the trend of closures finally being reversed.

Three quarters of all applications for registration received by the CSIW in 2005-06 were for children's day care services. However, almost 20 per cent of all applications were for care homes for adults. That is nearly 250 new homes, which is a significant number. During 2005-06, CSIW received twice the number of applications to register care homes as it received the previous year. As I have said, the report points to a slowing down in the net reduction in the number of care homes. Referring to the increase in applications, the report states:

'A number of these have been determined and ... if all or most of the remaining applications go forward, there may be a growth in provision in 2006-07.'

There we have it; we are seeing greater demand for care home places among the elderly while blinkered councils lunge forward with their closure programmes. Who will benefit? It will be the private operators, of course. They have already cornered 86 per cent of the market in Wales and are on course to eat into local authorities' paltry 14 per cent share. It is not surprising that demand for care homes is on the increase, because the elderly population of Wales is also increasing. Over the next 15 years, more than a quarter of the population of Wales will be aged over 60 and the number of people over 85 will increase by a third, to 82,000. At the end of March this year, there were well over 26,000 people in nursing and residential homes in Wales, most of them in residential care. In Blaenau Gwent, 14 private care homes and five council-run homes accommodated 337 elderly people, and a further 400 people were in nursing homes. The closure of four of the five council homes in Blaenau Gwent will put a smile on the faces of private operators, especially with the demand for places increasing.

It is not within CSIW's remit, but I want to say a word about staff, as, in the debate about the proposed closures of homes in Blaenau Gwent, too little emphasis has been placed on

y duedd i'w cau yn dod i ben o'r diwedd.

Yr oedd tri chwarter yr holl geisiadau i gofrestru a gafodd ASGC yn 2005-06 am wasanaethau gofal dydd i blant. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd bron 20 y cant o'r holl geisiadau am gartrefi gofal i oedolion. Mae hynny bron yn 250 o gartrefi newydd, sy'n nifer sylweddol. Yn ystod 2005-06, cafodd ASGC ddwywaith nifer y ceisiadau i gofrestru cartrefi gofal ag a gafodd yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Fel y dywedais, mae'r adroddiad yn dangos bod y broses o leihau nifer y cartrefi gofal yn arafu. Wrth gyfeirio at y cynnydd mewn ceisiadau, dywed yr adroddiad:

Mae nifer o'r rhain wedi eu penderfynu ac ... os bydd pob cais sydd ar ôl, neu'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt, yn mynd yn eu blaen, efallai y bydd cynnydd mewn darpariaeth yn 2006-07.

Dyna ni; yr ydym yn gweld mwy o alw am leoedd mewn cartrefi gofal ymhlith yr henoed tra mae cynghorau dall yn bwrw ati gyda'u rhaglenni cau. Pwy fydd ar eu hennill? Y gweithredwyr preifat, wrth gwrs. Maent eisoes yn rheoli 86 y cant o'r farchnad yng Nghymru, ac maent ar y trywydd iawn i gipio cyfran bitw'r awdurdodau lleol o 14 y cant. Nid yw'n syndod bod y galw am gartrefi gofal yn cynyddu, oherwydd mae poblogaeth yr henoed yng Nghymru hefyd yn cynyddu. Dros y 15 mlynedd nesaf, bydd mwy na chwarter poblogaeth Cymru dros 60 oed, a bydd nifer y bobl dros 85 oed yn cynyddu un rhan o dair i 82,000. Ddiwedd mis Mawrth eleni, yr oedd ymhell dros 26,000 o bobl mewn cartrefi nyrsio a chartrefi preswyl yng Nghymru, a'r mwyafrif mewn cartrefi preswyl. Ym Mlaenau Gwent, yr oedd 337 o bobl hŷn yn byw mewn 14 o gartrefi gofal preifat a phum cartref sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan y cyngor, ac yr oedd 400 ychwanegol mewn cartrefi nyrsio. Bydd cau pedwar o'r pum cartref sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan y cyngor ym Mlaenau Gwent yn rhoi gwên ar wynebau gweithredwyr preifat, yn enwedig wrth i'r galw am leoedd gynyddu.

Nid yw o fewn cylch gwaith ASGC, ond hoffwn sôn am y staff, oherwydd yn y ddadl ar y cynnig i gau cartrefi ym Mlaenau Gwent, prin fu'r pwyslais a roddwyd ar werth staff



the value of care home staff. Staff in the public sector take a great deal of pride in their work, to which they are dedicated. The 10-year strategy for social services in Wales, published recently by the Welsh Assembly Government, reported that:

‘The numbers of direct care staff in local authorities with a care qualification has risen from 23.2 per cent in 2001 to 41.5 per cent in 2005, but this is not mirrored in private and voluntary organisations.’

Can someone please explain why, when we are witnessing an epidemic of delayed transfers of care—commonly known as bedblocking—in our hospitals, councils are closing homes that could accommodate people transferred from hospital, thereby freeing up critical hospital beds for needy patients? It does not make sense. In my opinion, council-run homes should be the hallmark of care standards in Wales, and their closure should not be seen as the easy option to save money.

**Lynne Neagle:** I begin by thanking the staff of CSIW for their continued hard work over the last year. I want to focus today on care homes for vulnerable adults. There are some who think that we regulate too much in this area and that we overburden the care sector with rules and red tape. I would like to talk about a local example of what happens when those rules are broken and how we can better react to that situation.

Many colleagues here today will have heard of Dr Das, his company, Puretruce Health Care Ltd, and the care homes he has owned for over a decade in south Wales. The Beeches in Blaenavon was one such care home, before a recent tribunal upheld CSIW’s decision to close it with immediate effect.

Anyone doubting the value of the tight regulation of care homes would do well to read the tribunal report concerning The Beeches, or that about Holly House in Caerphilly, also owned by Dr Das. That

cartrefi gofal. Mae staff yn y sector cyhoeddus yn ymfalchïo’n fawr yn eu gwaith y maent wedi ymroi iddo. Yn y strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, dywedwyd:

‘Mae nifer y staff gofal uniongyrchol mewn awdurdodau lleol sydd â chymhwyster ym maes gofal wedi cynyddu o 23.2% yn 2001 i 41.5% yn 2005, ond nid yw hyn yn wir mewn sefydliadau preifat a gwirfoddol.’

A all rhywun egluro, os gwelwch yn dda, a ninnau’n gweld epidemig o achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal—sy’n cael ei alw’n gyffredin yn flocio gwelyau—yn ein hysbytai, pam y mae cynghorau yn cau cartrefi a allai gymryd pobl wrth eu trosglwyddo o’r ysbyty, gan ryddhau gwelyau hanfodol mewn ysbytai i gleifion mewn angen? Nid yw’n gwneud synnwyr. Yn fy marn i, dylai cartrefi sy’n cael eu rhedeg gan gynghorau fod yn ddilysnod o safonau gofal yng Nghymru, ac ni ddylai eu cau gael ei ystyried fel y dewis hawdd i arbed arian.

**Lynne Neagle:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i staff ASGC am eu gwaith caled parhaus yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Heddiw yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar gartrefi gofal i oedolion diamddiffyn. Mae rhai’n credu ein bod yn rheoleiddio gormod yn y maes hwn, a’n bod yn llethu’r sector gofal â rheolau a biwrocratiaeth. Hoffwn sôn am enghraifft leol o’r hyn sy’n digwydd pan gaiff y rheolau hyn eu torri a sut y gallwn ymateb yn well i’r sefyllfa honno.

Bydd nifer o gyd-Aelodau sydd yma heddiw wedi clywed am Dr Das, ei gwmni, Puretruce Health Care Ltd, a’r cartrefi gofal y mae wedi bod yn berchen arnynt yn ne Cymru ers dros ddegawd. Yr oedd The Beeches ym Mlaenafon yn un cartref gofal o’r fath, cyn i dribiwnlys yn ddiweddar gadarnhau penderfyniad ASGC i’w gau ar unwaith.

Dylai unrhyw un sy’n amau gwerth rheoleiddio cartrefi gofal yn llym ddarllen adroddiad y tribiwnlys ar The Beeches, neu hwnnw ar Holly House yng Nghaerffili, a oedd hefyd yn eiddo i Dr Das. Mae’r

report details a litany of errors, oversights, half-truths, arm-chancing and downright terrible management, which both endangered and degraded vulnerable adults in my constituency, and which should never be allowed to happen again. Leaking ceilings, unlocked doors, untrained staff, unsafe lifting, dirty bandages, irregular medication, fire hazards, no trained manager, a lack of care planning, poor record keeping and no safety checks were all considered acceptable.

The word that stood out for me in the tribunal report was 'chaos': the home had been allowed to descend into a state of chaos. I want us, and the Minister in particular, to reflect today on how we as the responsible body allowed that home to get into a state of chaos. It did not happen overnight. One of the main frustrations that I encountered when speaking to relatives of those in care at The Beeches concerned the failure to address problems as they arose. Instead, the situation was allowed to escalate to a point of no return.

As an Assembly, we must consider a number of issues arising from the case of The Beeches and Holly House. First, are we happy that CSIW has the punitive powers to hit the owners of a failing home hard, before reaching for the nuclear option of deregistration? Do we want to see fixed penalties for rule breaking, for example? Minister, how does the Assembly Government intend to respond to the recommendations in the Hampton report, commissioned by the Treasury, to investigate regulation, inspection and enforcement? The message from the CSIW report is that the standard of care is worsening in Wales, and we must act urgently to halt and reverse that trend immediately.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Do you share my concern that a larger percentage of the sample of homes inspected by CSIW were not complying with child protection regulations, which is a real concern for the Assembly? Most Members would support any action that the Assembly Government can take to ensure that the laws are enforced.

adroddiad hwnnw'n manylu ar doreth o wallau, esgeulustod, hanner gwirionedd, mentro a rheolaeth ofnadwy, a oedd yn peryglu oedolion diamddiffyn yn fy etholaeth a'u diraddio ac na ddylid caniatáu iddo ddigwydd byth eto. Ystyriwyd bod nenfydau'n gollwng, drysau heb eu cloi, staff heb eu hyfforddi, dulliau codi anniogel, rhwymynnau budr, meddyginiaethau afreolaidd, peryglon tân, dim rheolwr wedi ei hyfforddi, diffyg cynllunio gofal, system wael o gadw cofnodion a dim archwiliadau diogelwch, i gyd yn dderbyniol.

Y gair a dynnodd fy sylw yn adroddiad y tribiwnlys oedd 'chaos': yr oedd y cartref mewn anhrefn lwyr. Yr wyf am i ni, a'r Gweinidog yn arbennig, fyfyrho heddiw ar sut y gwnaethom ni, fel y corff cyfrifol, adael i'r cartref hwnnw ddatblygu yn y fath fodd. Ni ddigwyddodd dros nos. Un o'r prif rwystredigaethau y clywais amdanynt wrth siarad â pherthnasau'r rhai a oedd yn cael gofal yn The Beeches oedd y methiant i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau wrth iddynt godi. Yn hytrach, gadawyd i'r sefyllfa waethygu nes cyrraedd pwynt lle na ellid ei thrawsnewid.

Fel Cynulliad, rhaid inni ystyried nifer o faterion sy'n codi o achos The Beeches a Holly House. Yn gyntaf, a ydym yn fodlon bod gan ASGC bwerau i gosbi perchnogion cartrefi sy'n methu yn llym, cyn eu dadgofrestru? A ydych am weld cosbau sefydlog am dorri rheolau, er enghraifft? Weinidog, sut mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu ymateb i argymhellion adroddiad Hampton, a gomisiynwyd gan y Trysorlys, i ymchwilio i reoleiddio, arolygu a gorfodi? Neges adroddiad ASGC yw bod safonau gofal yn gwaethygu yng Nghymru, a rhaid inni weithredu ar fyrder i roi diwedd ar y duedd honno a'i thrawsnewid ar unwaith.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A ydych chi fel finnau yn pryderu nad oedd canran uwch o'r sampl o gartrefi a arolygwyd gan ASGC yn cydymffurfio â rheoliadau amddiffyn plant, sy'n bryder gwirioneddol i'r Cynulliad? Byddai mwyafrif yr Aelodau'n cefnogi unrhyw gamau gweithredu y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eu cymryd i sicrhau bod y gyfraith yn cael ei gorfodi.

**Lynne Neagle:** We need to look at all areas where we are not seeing an improvement, but rather a decline. We need to aim for continuous improvement in all these areas.

Local government must be given clear guidance on where its responsibility lies, in terms of commissioning and when things go wrong. It is vital that councils offer frequent, honest and detailed assessments of care settings to relatives, particularly when something goes wrong, because you can bet that those relatives will be hearing another story from the owners of the care home.

We must also ask ourselves whether we are happy with the framework that we have put in place for the care of vulnerable adults. Do we have a coherent vision for what we want our care system to look like? That is why I welcome the publication 'Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities', which will help to shape the future of social services in Wales. In response to that document and the annual report of the CSIW, I urge the Minister to consider the key questions that I have set out today. Namely, do we believe that CSIW currently has all the powers it needs to properly react to situations such as that at The Beeches at an early enough stage? Can we ensure a speedier resolution once deregistration—a closure order—has been decided upon? Are we confident that the punishment fits the crime?

These questions deserve considered answers, because there will always be people and businesses that do not play by the rules. There will be failing homes in the future, and we need to be better prepared to deal with that.

**David Melding:** I was concerned to read the repeated concerns in the report about the level of staffing, and the recruitment, training and quality of staff. However, I think that it is fair to say that, on balance, the report is relatively optimistic. Standards are improving and CSIW is maturing as an organisation. In itself, it was a great reform, given this independent view of the care sector and the extension of inspection into domiciliary care, which is a well overdue reform and will drive

**Lynne Neagle:** Mae angen inni edrych ar bob maes lle nad ydym yn gweld safonau'n gwella, ond yn hytrach yn gostwng. Mae angen inni anelu at welliant parhaus ym mhob un o'r meysydd hyn.

Rhaid rhoi canllawiau clir i lywodraeth leol am ei chyfrifoldebau, o ran comisiynu a phan aiff pethau o'u lle. Mae'n hanfodol i gynghorau gynnig asesiadau rheolaidd, gonest a manwl o leoliadau gofal i berthnasau, yn enwedig pan aiff rhywbeth o'i le, oherwydd galwch fentro y bydd y perthnasau hynny'n cael stori arall gan berchnogion y cartref gofal.

Rhaid inni hefyd ofyn inni ein hunain a ydym yn fodlon ar y fframwaith a roddwyd ar waith gennym i ofalu am oedolion diamddiffyn. A oes gennym weledigaeth gydlynol ar gyfer ein system gofal? Dyna pam y croesawaf y cyhoeddiad 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol', a fydd yn helpu llunio dyfodol gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Wrth ymateb i'r ddogfen honno ac adroddiad blynyddol ASGC, anogaf y Gweinidog i ystyried y cwestiynau allweddol a gyflwynwyd gennyf heddiw, sef a ydym yn credu bod gan ASGC, ar hyn o bryd, yr holl bwerau y mae arni eu hangen i ymateb yn briodol yn ddigon cynnar i sefyllfaoedd fel honno yn The Beeches? A allwn sicrhau datrysiaid cyflymach ar ôl penderfynu dadgofrestru—gorchymyn cau? A ydym yn hyderus fod y gosb yn gweddu i'r drosedd?

Mae'r cwestiynau hyn yn haeddu atebion ystyriol, oherwydd fe fydd pobl a busnesau sy'n torri'r rheolau bob amser. Bydd cartrefi'n methu yn y dyfodol, ac mae angen inni fod mewn sefyllfa well i ymdrin â hynny.

**David Melding:** Yr oedd y pryderon a ailadroddir yn yr adroddiad ynghylch y lefel staffio, recriwtio a hyfforddi staff a'u safon yn peri pryder imi. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei bod yn deg dweud bod yr adroddiad yn gymharol optimistaidd at ei gilydd. Mae safonau'n gwella ac mae ASGC yn aeddfedu fel sefydliad. Ynddo'i hun, yr oedd yn ddiwygiad mawr, o ystyried y farn annibynnol hon am y sector gofal ac ehangu'r broses arolygu i gynnwys gofal yn y cartref,

up standards in general. Inevitably, speakers have concentrated this afternoon on the negatives, but it is appropriate to remember the more general and balanced picture.

I would like to look at the situation in children's services. Significant areas of concern remain with regard to children's homes. We are less reliant on children's homes, but children there are particularly vulnerable. One could also say this of the adult sector. If we have problems with the staffing of residential homes, we are placing a very vulnerable part of the population at risk.

5.10 p.m.

The lack of effective statements of purpose is mentioned by the inspectors several times. This is a key area on which to offer training and support to care providers, because if they do not get that right, the strategic direction of what they are trying to do is bound to falter. That has been a key issue throughout this, as have the need for effective care planning and accurate risk assessment. For years, we have known that the quality of care planning is variable. There are excellent examples out there, but, unfortunately, it is not always common practice. It is appropriate to focus on the effectiveness of care planning, and I am pleased to see that CSIW has much time has been spent on that; it is absolutely right to do that.

Another concern that it mentioned was the suitability of some staff in children's homes. That needs to be explored a bit further, because it could raise some very worrying risks indeed. It was not exactly the same list, but, broadly, the same concerns were expressed, relating to the suitability of placements and the statements of purpose with regard to organisations providing foster care services. In general, we are more reliant on foster care than children's homes. At the time of the Waterhouse report, many people said that they did not want to see all the bad practice and abuse that had been going on for far too long in children's homes somehow percolating into foster care as we moved

sy'n ddiwygiad y bu hir ddisgwyl amdano ac a fydd yn gwella safonau'n gyffredinol. Yn anochel, mae siaradwyr wedi canolbwyntio'r prynhawn yma ar y pethau negyddol, ond mae'n briodol cofio'r darlun mwy cyffredinol a chytbwys.

Hoffwn edrych ar sefyllfa gwasanaethau plant. Mae pryder sylweddol o hyd am gartrefi plant. Yr ydym yn llai dibynnol ar gartrefi plant, ond mae'r plant yno'n ddiamddiffyn iawn. Gallai hyn hefyd fod yn wir am y sector oedolion. Os oes problemau o ran staffio cartrefi preswyl, yr ydym yn peryglu rhan ddiamddiffyn iawn o'r boblogaeth.

Mae'r arolygwyr yn sôn droeon am ddiffyg datganiadau effeithiol o ddiben. Mae hwn yn faes allweddol i gynnig hyfforddiant a chymorth ynddo i ddarparwyr gofal, oherwydd os na wneir hynny'n iawn, mae cyfeiriad strategol yr hyn y maent yn ceisio'i wneud yn siŵr o fethu. Mae hynny'n fater allweddol drwy gydol hyn, ynghyd â'r angen am gynllunio gofal yn effeithiol ac asesu risg yn gywir. Ers blynyddoedd yr ydym yn ymwybodol fod safon y gwaith o gynllunio gofal yn amrywio. Mae yna enghreifftiau ardderchog, ond yn anffodus nid yw bob amser yn arfer cyffredin. Mae'n briodol canolbwyntio ar effeithiolrwydd cynllunio gofal, ac yr wyf yn falch gweld bod ASGC wedi treulio cryn amser ar hynny; mae'n gwbl gywir gwneud hynny.

Pryder arall a grybwyllwyd gan ASGC oedd addasrwydd rhai aelodau staff i weithio mewn cartrefi plant. Mae angen archwilio hynny ychydig ymhellach, oherwydd gallai dynnu sylw at ambell risg sy'n peri cryn ofid yn wir. Nid oedd y rhestr yn union yr un fath, ond, yn fras, mynegwyd yr un pryderon, yn ymwneud ag addasrwydd lleoliadau a'r datganiadau diben o ran sefydliadau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau gofal maeth. Yn gyffredinol, yr ydym yn dibynnu'n fwy ar ofal maeth nag ar gartrefi gofal. Adeg adroddiad Waterhouse dywedodd nifer o bobl nad oeddent am weld yr holl arfer gwael a cham-drin a oedd wedi bod yn digwydd yn rhy hir o lawer mewn cartrefi plant yn

towards a greater reliance on foster care for looked-after children.

I think that it was Jenny Randerson who mentioned the lack of consistency in standards across Wales. Of course, we do not expect the same everywhere, but we must be confident that there is a broadly consistent standard and an effective, appropriate and safe service throughout Wales. I note that the inspectors say that they now question how further improvements can be made in the system to achieve consistency. I thought that that was a bit curious given the nature of their report in general, which is pointing out good practice, trying to embed it and trying to improve the standards of those that are not quite at that mark.

I want to say something about looked-after children. Although this is somewhat peripheral to this afternoon's debate, it has an impact on the type of services that we want to see. An all-party group on looked-after children was established yesterday. It had fantastic support right across the political parties in the Assembly, and it is encouraging to see how much interest there is in this issue from all the parties. As Helen Mary Jones said earlier, the need for independent advocacy for looked-after children is paramount—it is the first concern. There is a great belief on the part of organisations such as Voices from Care, which represent people who have been in the care system, that, if it is effective, standards in general will improve as a result. I think that that will be the case.

We were told by young people who had been in care that the stability of placements was a key factor. Again, that is the paramount mark of a quality service. If there are stable placements and advocacy systems, we will see educational attainment, for instance, improve.

I wish to finish by commending Gwenda Thomas on her speech. We are used to hearing your excellent constructive and critical scrutiny speeches, Gwenda. You are a great friend of your own party, but, more importantly, as far as I am concerned, you are a great friend of the Assembly in pointing out

treiddio i ofal maeth wrth inni fynd i ddibynnu'n fwy ar ofal maeth i blant sy'n cael gofal.

Credaf mai Jenny Randerson a soniodd am y diffyg cysondeb o ran safonau ledled Cymru. Wrth gwrs, nid ydym yn disgwyl yr un fath ym mhob man, ond rhaid inni fod yn hyderus fod safon gyffredinol gyson a gwasanaeth effeithiol, priodol a diogel ledled Cymru. Sylwaf fod yr arolygwyr yn dweud eu bod bellach yn amau sut y gellir gwella'r system ymhellach i sicrhau cysondeb. Yr oedd hynny braidd yn rhyfedd imi o gofio natur eu hadroddiad yn gyffredinol, sy'n tynnu sylw at arfer da, ceisio'i ymgorffori a cheisio gwella safonau'r rhai nad ydynt wedi cyrraedd y fan honno eto.

Hoffwn sôn am blant sy'n cael gofal. Er nad yw hyn yn gwbl berthnasol i'r ddadl y prynhawn yma, mae'n effeithio ar y math o wasanaethau yr ydym am eu gweld. Sefydlwyd grŵp ambleidiol ddoe ar blant sy'n cael gofal. Cafodd gefnogaeth wych gan bob un o'r pleidiau gwleidyddol yn y Cynulliad, ac mae'n galonogol gweld faint o ddiddordeb sydd yn y mater hwn ymhlith pob plaid. Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones yn gynharach, mae'r angen am eiriolaeth annibynnol i blant sy'n cael gofal yn hollbwysig—dyna'r pryder cyntaf. Mae sefydliadau megis Voices from Care, sy'n cynrychioli pobl sydd wedi bod yn y system gofal, yn credu'n gryf, os yw'n effeithiol, y bydd safonau'n gwella'n gyffredinol o ganlyniad i hynny. Credaf mai dyna fydd yn digwydd.

Dywedwyd wrthym gan bobl ifanc a oedd wedi cael gofal fod sefydlogrwydd lleoliadau yn ffactor allweddol. Unwaith eto, dyna'r arwydd pennaf o wasanaeth o safon. Os bydd lleoliadau sefydlog a systemau eiriolaeth, fe welwn gyrhaeddiad addysgol, er enghraifft, yn gwella.

Hoffwn orffen drwy ganmol Gwenda Thomas am ei haraith. Yr ydym wedi arfer clywed eich areithiau adeiladol a beirniadol ardderchog ar graffu, Gwenda. Yr ydych yn gyfaill da i'ch plaid eich hun, ond yn bwysicach, yn fy marn i, yr ydych yn ffrind da i'r Cynulliad wrth dynnu sylw at yr angen

the need to take these issues very seriously. I, too, commend your report, 'Keeping us Safe'. It is very important to see it embedded in general strategies.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I now call Karen Sinclair, but I must protect the Minister's time, and I will call him at 5.19 p.m..

**Karen Sinclair:** One of the most significant aspirations of the National Assembly since its inception in 1999 has been to endeavour to raise the political profile and the precedence of social care in Wales to the level it deserves. Although there is some way to go before the sector starts to rival the big beasts of healthcare and education in the attention that it receives, important strides have been made towards creating a social care system of which we can be proud, and which provides effective care for some of the most vulnerable people in our society.

This report by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales helps us to assess where the sector is at present, and it provides an indicator as to where we should be focusing our attention in the next stage of reform, so that the system is fit for the challenges and changing demography of the twenty-first century.

One of the most important issues that the report highlights is the assertion that any change or improvement to social care must originate from within the system itself. To this end, one of the most important ways in which we can enhance and upgrade the social care system is by increasing the support that we give to managers working in the field.

From reading the report, it is clear that we need to renew our commitment to improving standards of support for managers. There is widespread agreement that care managers are fundamental to the provision of high-quality social care in our communities. However, it is sadly the case that such key individuals can often feel isolated or set apart from their fellow professionals. The need for better engagement and support for these managers, helping them to link up with their fellow professionals, is key in assisting their

am gymryd y materion hyn o ddifrif. Yr wyf fi hefyd yn cymeradwyo eich adroddiad, 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel'. Mae'n bwysig iawn gweld ei ymgorffori mewn strategaethau cyffredinol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar Karen Sinclair yn awr, ond rhaid imi ddiogelu amser y Gweinidog, ac fe'i galwaf ef am 5.19 p.m..

**Karen Sinclair:** Un o ddyheadau mwyaf arwyddocaol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ers ei sefydlu yn 1999 fu ceisio codi proffil gwleidyddol a blaenoriaeth gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru i'r lefel y mae'n ei haeddu. Er bod cryn waith i'w wneud eto cyn i'r sector ddechrau cystadlu â meysydd mawr gofal iechyd ac addysg o ran y sylw a gaiff, cymerwyd camau pwysig i greu system gofal cymdeithasol y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddi, ac sy'n rhoi gofal effeithiol i rai o'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymdeithas.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru yn ein helpu i asesu sefyllfa bresennol y sector, ac mae'n dangos ar beth y dylem fod yn canolbwyntio yn ystod y cam diwygio nesaf, er mwyn i'r system fod yn addas ar gyfer heriau a demograffeg yr unfed ganrif ar hugain sy'n newid.

Un o'r materion pwysicaf y mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw atynt yw'r dybiaeth ei bod yn rhaid i unrhyw newid neu welliant mewn gofal cymdeithasol ddeillio o'r system ei hun. I'r perwyl hwn, un o'r ffyrdd pwysicaf inni wella ac uwchraddio'r system gofal cymdeithasol yw drwy gynyddu'r cymorth a roddwn i reolwyr sy'n gweithio yn y maes.

Wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad, mae'n amlwg fod angen inni adnewyddu ein hymrwymiad i wella safonau'r cymorth a roddir i reolwyr. Ceir cytundeb eang fod rheolwyr gofal yn hanfodol i'r gwaith o ddarparu gofal cymdeithasol o safon yn ein cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus gall unigolion allweddol o'r fath deimlon aml wedi'u hynysu neu wedi'u gwahanu oddi wrth eu cydweithwyr proffesiynol. Mae'r angen am sicrhau gwell ymgysylltiad a chymorth i'r rheolwyr hyn, a fydd yn eu helpu i gysylltu

development and for building quality into the system.

Much has been done, for example in the registration of managers and in replacing managers' meetings with social care essential update seminars, which have provided opportunities for social care professionals to be updated and to meet fellow professionals. This has ensured that more social-care managers are able to key into good information-sharing networks. However, there is still much to be done at a local, regional and national level to tackle the alarming number of care managers who appear unaware of the support that is out there and available for them.

More also needs to be done to help those managers who seem to be denied the opportunity to engage in the process of workforce development, to gain knowledge and support in order to undertake their role more effectively. We face no greater responsibility as an Assembly than to ensure that we effectively take care of the most vulnerable in society. That is a challenge that we must not allow to pass us by.

The report highlights the stern challenges that we face in strategically building into the system the greater quality that we need. I welcome this report as an important part of achieving this aim.

CSIW has, however, to show its teeth when it is needed. An assurance is needed that, if there is a need to act, the reaction will be swift and emphatic.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I thank my colleagues for a good and well-informed debate. Important contributions were made across the board, in a non-partisan way. In many ways, David Melding summed up what I take to be the general thrust of the CSIW report. It casts light on areas that we have not previously been able to scrutinise in anything like the same way. Before CSIW was established, there were diverse standards

â'u cydweithwyr proffesiynol, yn allweddol i helpu eu datblygiad ac i ymgorffori safon yn y system.

Mae llawer wedi'i wneud, er enghraifft, wrth gofrestru rheolwyr a disodli cyfarfodydd rheolwyr gan seminarau gofal cymdeithasol i gyfleu'r newyddion hanfodol diweddaraf. Mae hyn wedi rhoi cyfleoedd i weithwyr gofal cymdeithasol proffesiynol gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf a chyfarfod â chydweithwyr proffesiynol. Mae hynny wedi sicrhau bod mwy o reolwyr gofal cymdeithasol yn gallu bod yn rhan o rwydweithiau da i rannu gwybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer i'w wneud eto ar lefel leol, rhanbarthol a chenedlaethol i fynd i'r afael â'r nifer frawychus o reolwyr gofal sy'n ymddangos yn anymwybodol o'r cymorth sydd ar gael iddynt.

Mae angen gwneud mwy hefyd i helpu'r rheolwyr hynny yr ymddengys nad ydynt yn cael y cyfle i ymgysylltu â'r broses o ddatblygu'r gweithlu, i gael gwybodaeth a chael cymorth er mwyn ymgymryd â'u rôl yn fwy effeithiol. Nid oes gennym ni, fel Cynulliad, gyfrifoldeb mwy na sicrhau ein bod yn gofalu'n effeithiol am y rhai mwyaf diamddiffyn mewn cymdeithas. Mae honno'n her y mae'n rhaid inni ei hwynebu.

Mae'r adroddiad yn tynny sylw ar yr heriau anodd sy'n ein hwynebu wrth inni geisio sicrhau'r safon well y mae arnom ei hangen yn y system yn strategol. Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn fel rhan bwysig o gyflawni'r nod hwn.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid i ASGC ddangos ei hawdurdod pan fydd angen. Mae angen sicrwydd, os bydd angen gweithredu, y bydd yr ymateb yn gyflym ac yn bendant.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Hoffwn ddiolch i'm cyd-Aelodau am ddadl dda a hyddysg. Gwnaethpwyd cyfraniadau pwysig yn gyffredinol, mewn ffordd amhleidiol. Mewn llawer ffordd, crynhôdd David Melding yr hyn a ystyriaf yn fwrddw cyffredinol adroddiad ASGC. Mae'n taflu goleuni ar feysydd nad ydym wedi gallu craffu arnynt gynt i'r un graddau o bell ffordd. Cyn i ASGC gael ei sefydlu, yr oedd

across Wales as every local authority did its own thing. CSIW is beginning to bring some order and consistency to the sector and while it is true that maybe, in some ways, the headline messages are slightly more negative than we would have liked, there is a tendency towards optimism in the report.

However, there can be no doubt that this is an area where complacency has no role. The need for improvement is outlined in the CSIW report.

In terms of addressing a number of the challenges that the CSIW report has outlined, we, as an Assembly Government, are trying to put in place a number of key measures that will address those concerns. As Gwenda Thomas said in her contribution to 'Keeping Us Safe', at the end of the day, it is not just the process that matters but it is the outcome. While we can concentrate on process as a means to an outcome, we must concentrate on the outcome as the final measure of our success or failure. I attended a Frank Buttle Trust presentation at lunchtime, and saw a good example of the type of ambition that we should have for our young people, and the type of outcome that we should aspire for them to achieve.

5.20 p.m.

Several of the key messages that have come through the CSIW report are based on training. The report said that, from managerial staff down, through many organisations, the capacity to deliver quality services is undermined by a lack of qualification and training. That is why we will bring forth regulations to tighten up the training and qualification requirements, particularly in children's homes, in the not-too-distant future. Hopefully, Members will remember the contributions made in this debate when they consider the regulations that need to be put in place.

As we speak, we are consulting on the fostering allowances, which Helen Mary referred to. The minimum fostering allowances will bring some consistency to this sector across Wales. While most local

safonau'n amrywio ledled Cymru gan fod pob awdurdod lleol yn gweithredu ar ei ben ei hun. Mae ASGC yn dechrau dod â rhywfaint o drefn a chysondeb i'r sector, ac er ei bod yn wir fod y prif negeseuon efallai, mewn rhai ffyrdd, ychydig yn fwy negyddol nag y byddem wedi hoffi, mae'r adroddiad yn tueddu at fod yn optimistaidd.

Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw hwn yn faes lle na ellir bod yn hunanfodlon. Amlinellir yr angen am wella yn adroddiad ASGC.

O ran mynd i'r afael â nifer o'r heriau a amlinellwyd yn adroddiad ASGC, yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ceisio rhoi nifer o fesurau allweddol ar waith a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hynny. Fel y dywedodd Gwenda Thomas yn ei chyfraniad i 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel', yn y pen draw mae'r canlyniad cyn bwysiced â'r broses. Er y gallwn ganolbwyntio ar broses fel modd o gyflawni canlyniad, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar y canlyniad fel yr hyn sy'n dangos ein llwyddiant neu ein pethiant yn y pen draw. Yr oeddwn yn bresennol yng nghyflwyniad Ymddiriedolaeth Frank Buttle amser cinio, a gwelais enghraifft dda o'r math o uchelgais a ddylai fod gennym ar gyfer ein pobl ifanc, a'r math o ganlyniad y dylem ddyheu amdano iddynt ei gyflawni.

Mae nifer o'r prif negeseuon sy'n cael eu cyfleu yn adroddiad ASGC yn seiliedig ar hyfforddiant. Dywedai'r adroddiad fod y gallu i gyflwyno gwasanaethau o safon, o'r rheolwyr i lawr, mewn nifer o sefydliadau, yn cael ei danseilio gan ddiffyg cymwysterau a hyfforddiant. Dyna pam y byddwn yn cyflwyno rheoliadau'n fuan i sicrhau bod y gofynion o ran hyfforddiant a chymwysterau yn fwy llym, yn enwedig mewn cartrefi plant. Gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'n cofio'r cyfraniadau a wnaethpwyd yn y ddadl hon pan fyddant yn ystyried y rheoliadau y mae angen eu rhoi ar waith.

Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn ymgynghori am y lwfansau maethu y cyfeiriodd Helen Mary atynt. Bydd yr isafswm lwfansau maethu yn dod â rhywfaint o gysondeb i'r sector hwn ledled Cymru. Er bod y rhan fwyaf o



authorities are probably meeting the minimum allowance standards, not all of them are, and that consultation will, hopefully, point us in the direction that we want to travel. Equally, I am glad that Helen Mary welcomed the phone service; as with all services, they must deliver if we are going to continue to support them. For me as a Minister, there will be no blank cheques to services that are not delivering their promise or potential.

Ensuring that people are able to access services at an appropriate level, and fairly conveniently, is a key issue in responding to the challenge, which we have outlined in our strategic directions paper, 'Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities'. The need for more robust commissioning processes is paramount. However, several contributions raised questions about how these provisions are being put in place. In other words, it is not just a question of commissioning, but of how those services are located. It is true that there is a fairly even spread of older people's homes throughout Wales, but, as Members have highlighted, there is an uneven spread of children's homes, particularly in Powys and Pembrokeshire. That raises the question of whether we are seeing examples of market failure, when we are heavily dependent on market provision, and whether we need to take a more critical look at how the market operates.

On the type of provision that people want, I believe that we had reference to the situation in Blaenau Gwent; it is interesting that the social services inspectorate report in Blaenau Gwent suggested that there was an overprovision of social care homes there. If every local authority, in terms of delayed transfers of care, was operating as well as Blaenau Gwent, there is no doubt that the level of delayed transfers of care would be much improved. There is a performance legacy in Blaenau Gwent, but, following the intervention that took place, I believe that people have been impressed at the high level of standards and improvement in that area, particularly in relation to social services provision.

Last Friday, I was at the Care Forum Wales care awards in Cardiff. There is no doubt that

awdurdodau lleol yn bodloni'r isafswm safonau lwfans, nid ydynt i gyd yn gwneud hynny, a bydd yr ymgynghori, gobeithio, yn ein troi i'r cyfeiriad yr hoffem ei deithio. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch fod Helen Mary wedi croesawu'r gwasanaeth ffôn; fel gyda phob gwasanaeth, rhaid iddynt lwyddo os ydym i barhau i'w cefnogi. I mi fel Gweinidog, ni fydd unrhyw sicciau agored am wasanaethau nad ydynt yn cyflawni eu haddewid na'u potensial.

Mae sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu cael gwasanaethau ar lefel briodol, ac yn lled hwylus, yn fater allweddol wrth ymateb i'r her, a amlinellwyd gennym yn ein papur cyfeiriadau strategol, 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol'. Mae'r angen am brosesau comisiynu cadarnach yn hollbwysig. Fodd bynnag, cododd nifer o'r rhai a gyfrannodd gwestiynau ynghylch sut y mae'r darpariaethau hyn yn cael eu rhoi ar waith. Mewn geiriau eraill, nid mater o gomisiynu yn unig mohono, ond sut caiff y gwasanaethau hynny eu lleoli. Mae'n wir dweud bod gwasgariad lled wastad o gartrefi'r henoed ledled Cymru, ond fel y mae Aelodau wedi tynnu sylw, mae gwasgariad anghyson o gartrefi plant, yn enwedig ym Mhowys a sir Benfro. Mae hynny'n codi'r cwestiwn a ydym yn gweld enghreifftiau o fethiant y farchnad, ac a oes angen inni ystyried yn fwy beirniadol sut mae'r farchnad yn gweithredu.

O ran y math o ddarpariaeth y mae pobl yn dymuno'i weld, credaf inni gael cyfeiriad at y sefyllfa ym Mlaenau Gwent; mae'n ddiddorol bod adroddiad yr arolygiaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ym Mlaenau Gwent wedi awgrymu bod gorddarpariaeth o gartrefi gofal cymdeithasol yno. Pe bai pob awdurdod lleol yn gweithredu mor effeithiol â Blaenau Gwent o ran oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, mae'n sicr y byddai lefel yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal lawer yn well. Mae Blaenau Gwent wedi etifeddu perfformiad, ond yn dilyn yr ymyriad a welwyd, credaf fod y safonau uchel a'r gwelliant yn y maes hwnnw, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, wedi gwneud argraff fawr ar bobl.

Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, bûm yn seremoni gwobrau gofal Fforwm Gofal Cymru yng

many of the people involved in the care sector are highly motivated, and many of the key providers in the care sector are keen to improve training. As an Assembly Government, we provide something in the order of £12 million of funding, and we work with local government to try to improve the level of qualification and training. However, I know that the independent sector is a keen and anxious partner in terms of improving standards, as articulated by Care Forum Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you agree that many of the voluntary and private sector members of Care Forum Wales provide exemplar care to the people of Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** That is not in question. In the sector—a number of Members highlighted this—the question is whether or not the present system is sufficiently resilient to deal with organisations that are underperforming. It is probably a weakness of CSIW's present arrangements that the only real option available to it, at the end of the day, is to deregister homes or possibly to institute proceedings. CSIW is looking at the range of options available to it, rather than the ultimate nuclear option of deregistration. An important discussion needs to take place with CSIW in terms of whether or not it needs an escalating range of mechanisms available to it, so that it can avail itself of them more effectively, depending on the level of performance. It is interesting that, in one of the instances highlighted in this debate, a tribunal appeal overruled, if I understand it correctly, the decision of CSIW in relation to one of the homes. That highlights the difficulty that CSIW faces in trying to monitor performance with the present range of tools at its disposal. Clearly, that is something that we need to revisit.

In conclusion, I am grateful for the response to this debate. It has been a good discussion and many important messages have been imparted and, as Minister, I take them on board.

Nghaerdydd. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw nifer o'r bobl sy'n gysylltiedig â'r sector gofal yn gryf eu cymhelliant, ac mae nifer o ddarparwyr allweddol y sector gofal yn awyddus i wella hyfforddiant. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn darparu tua £12 miliwn ac yn gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol i geisio gwella lefel cymwysterau a hyfforddiant. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod y sector annibynnol, fel partner, yn awyddus i wella safonau, fel y dywedwyd gan Fforwm Gofal Cymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych yn cytuno bod nifer o aelodau Fforwm Gofal Cymru sydd o'r sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat yn darparu gofal rhagorol i bobl Cymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny. Yn y sector—mae nifer o Aelodau wedi tynnu sylw at hyn—y cwestiwn yw a yw'r system bresennol yn ddigon cadarn i ddelio â sefydliadau sy'n tanberfformio. Mae'n debyg mai un o wendidau trefniadau presennol ASGC yw mai'r unig ddewis gwirioneddol sydd ganddi, yn y pen draw, yw dadgofrestru cartrefi neu ddwyn achos yn eu herbyn. Mae ASGC yn ystyried yr amrywiaeth dewisiadau sydd ar gael iddi, yn hytrach na'r dewis cnewyllol yn y pen draw, sef dadgofrestru. Mae angen cael trafodaeth bwysig gydag ASGC am y cwestiwn a oes angen iddi gynyddu'r amrywiaeth o ddulliau sydd ar gael iddi ai peidio, fel y gall fanteisio arnynt yn fwy effeithiol, gan ddibynnu ar lefel y perfformiad. Mae'n ddiddorol, yn un o'r enghreifftiau y tynnwyd sylw atynt yn y ddadl hon, fod apêl tribiwnlys wedi gwrthod penderfyniad ASGC, os deallaf yn gywir, mewn perthynas ag un o'r cartrefi. Mae hynny'n tynnu sylw at yr anhawster sy'n wynebu ASGC wrth geisio monitro perfformiad gyda'r amrywiaeth dulliau sydd ar gael iddi eu defnyddio ar hyn o bryd. Yn amlwg, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei ailystyried.

I gloi, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb a gafwyd i'r ddadl hon. Bu'n drafodaeth dda a chyflëwyd nifer o negeseuon pwysig, ac fel Gweinidog, byddaf yn eu hystyried.

*Cynnig (NDM3337): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3337): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Adroddiad Blynyddol 2005-06 Comisiynydd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru  
2005-06 Annual Report of the Health Service Commissioner for Wales**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** The motion on this item is not being proposed  
**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Nid yw'r cynnig ar y eitem hon yn cael ei gynnig.

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Plant yng Nghymru—Cânt eu Gweld, ond a Gânt eu Clywed? Children in Wales—Seen, But Are they Heard?

**Catherine Thomas:** I am glad to have the opportunity to debate this topic today, and I am pleased that both Sandy Mewies and Peter Black will be contributing. Gwenda Thomas's safeguarding vulnerable children review rightly pointed out the importance of ensuring that children and young people in Wales are heard and involved in decisions at all levels that affect their daily lives. We have made considerable progress in developing structures to ensure that the voices of children and young people are heard. For example, I welcome the regulations ensuring that every school has a school council, as we must ensure that children and young people are used to participating in the decisions that affect them from an early age. I also welcome the commitment of the Assembly Government to developing a school counselling strategy, as it is of real importance that we encourage children and young people to talk to someone if they have a problem or concern. Many children continue to suffer problems in their home lives, but do not have anyone to talk to and often feel that, even if they did, their voice would not be heard or believed. This must change.

5.30 p.m.

The creation of the post of Children's Commissioner for Wales, as the independent voice for children and young people, has been a major development. Its importance has been evident in many ways, especially in two key reports from the commissioner—'Telling Concerns', published in 2003, and 'Children Don't Complain', published in 2005. These reports highlighted the need to improve the way in which the statutory services encourage and support children and young people to raise any concerns that they may have about the services that they are receiving. I have little doubt that the commissioner will continue to challenge the Government, to ensure that it is implementing the recommendations of both these crucial reports.

**Catherine Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch am y cyfle i gael dadl ar y pwnc hwn heddiw, ac yr wyf yn falch fod Sandy Mewies a Peter Black yn cyfrannu ati. Yn gywir ddigon, yr oedd adolygiad Gwenda Thomas ddiogelu plant sy'n agored i niwed yn tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn cael eu clywed, a'u bod yn cymryd rhan mewn penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio ar eu bywydau bob dydd ar bob lefel. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol wrth ddatblygu strwythurau i sicrhau bod llais plant a phobl ifanc yn cael ei glywed. Er enghraifft, croesawaf y rheoliadau sy'n sicrhau bod gan bob ysgol gyngor ysgol, gan fod angen inni sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc yn gyfarwydd y ifanc â chyfranogi yn y penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio arnynt. Croesawaf hefyd ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu strategaeth gynghori i ysgolion, gan ei bod yn wirioneddol bwysig inni annog plant a phobl ifanc i siarad â rhywun os oes ganddynt broblem neu ofid. Mae nifer o blant yn dal i ddiodesdef problemau gartref ond neb i siarad â hwy, ac maent yn aml yn teimlo, hyd yn oed pe bai ganddynt rywun, na fyddent yn eu clywed na'u credu. Rhaid i hyn newid.

Yr oedd sefydlu swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, fel llais annibynnol i blant a phobl ifanc, yn ddatblygiad mawr. Tystiwyd i'w bwysigrwydd mewn llawer ffordd, yn enwedig mewn dau adroddiad allweddol gan y comisiynydd—'Datgan Pryderon', a gyhoeddwyd yn 2003, a 'Nid yw Plant yn Cwyno', a gyhoeddwyd yn 2005. Yr oedd yr adroddiadau hyn yn tynnu sylw at yr angen am wella'r ffordd y mae'r gwasanaethau statudol yn annog ac yn cefnogi plant a phobl ifanc i godi unrhyw bryderon a allai fod ganddynt am y gwasanaethau a gânt. Yr wyf yn holl sicr y bydd y comisiynydd yn dal i herio'r Llywodraeth, i sicrhau ei bod yn gweithredu argymhellion y ddau adroddiad allweddol hyn.

There are many areas that I wish that I had an opportunity to draw attention to this afternoon, but time will not permit me to do so; therefore, I have decided to focus on four areas in which I have a particular interest. I will begin by making a broad point about physical punishment. I am proud to be part of an Assembly that has consistently voted in support of changing the law and providing children with equal protection. I am also pleased that this issue has gained support from across the political spectrum. I must acknowledge the work of my colleague, Chris Chapman, and congratulate her and the Children are Unbeatable! campaign for putting this issue on the agenda. Although we have not been able to change the law in Wales, I believe that we have sent out a strong message that we respect the rights of children not to be hit. I urge all parties to begin to look at what we could put in place after May, with our new powers, to strengthen our commitment to ensuring that children receive equal protection. I believe that society needs to wake up and take note of the impact that physical punishment has on children. Research, conducted by Save the Children, into children's views on smacking includes quotes from children who were asked how they felt when they were smacked. One six-year-old girl replied, 'Inside, your body hurts'. If it is wrong for a man to strike a woman, and for a woman to strike a man, and for people in same-sex couples to strike each other, why is it acceptable to hit a child? Legislation must be secured to give children and young people the same legal protection as adults—no more, no less.

Yesterday saw the launch of the looked-after children all-party group. I welcome the establishment of the group and take this opportunity to acknowledge the role played by Voices from Care in setting it up. Many of us are painfully aware that the voices of children and young people who are in the care system are frequently not heard. Those young people are among the most vulnerable in society, although many of them are not made to feel that they are a part of society. It is startling to remember exactly how many such children there are. The chief inspector of social services' annual report for 2004-05

Mae yn nifer o feysydd y byddwn wrth fy modd yn cael y cyfle i dynnu sylw atynt y prynhawn yma, ond nid oes digon o amser imi wneud hynny; felly, yr wyf wedi penderfynu canolbwyntio ar bedwar maes y mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb penodol ynddynt. Dechreuaf drwy wneud pwynt cyffredinol am gosbi corfforol. Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn rhan o Gynulliad sydd wedi pleidleisio yn gyson o blaid newid y gyfraith a sicrhau diogelwch cyfartal i blant. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch fod y mater hwn wedi cael cefnogaeth ar draws y sbectrwm gwleidyddol. Rhaid imi gydnabod gwaith fy nghyd-Aelod, Chris Chapman, a'i llongyfarch hi a'r ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo Plant! am gynnwys y mater hwn ar yr agenda. Er nad ydym wedi llwyddo i newid y gyfraith yng Nghymru, credaf ein bod wedi cyfleu neges glir ein bod yn parchu hawliau plant i beidio â chael eu taro. Anogaf bob plaid i ddechrau edrych ar yr hyn y gallem ei roi ar waith ar ôl mis Mai, gyda'n pwerau newydd, er mwyn atgyfnerthu ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau bod plant yn cael diogelwch cyfartal. Credaf fod angen i gymdeithas ddeffro a sylwi ar yr effaith a gaiff cosbi corfforol ar blant. Mae gwaith ymchwil, a wnaed gan Gronfa Achub y Plant, am farn plant am guro yn cynnwys dyfyniadau gan blant y gofynnwyd iddynt sut yr oeddent yn teimlo wrth gael eu curo. Atebodd un ferch chwe oed, 'Y tu mewn, mae eich corff yn brifo'. Os yw'n anghywir i ddyn daro merch, ac i ferch daro dyn, ac i bobl mewn perthynas un-rhyw daro'i gilydd, pam y mae'n dderbyniol taro plentyn? Rhaid sicrhau deddfwriaeth i roi'r un lefel o ddiogelwch i blant a phobl ifanc ag i oedolion—dim mwy, dim llai.

Ddoe, lanswyd y grŵp hollbleidiol ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal. Croesawaf y ffaith fod y grŵp wedi'i sefydlu, a manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i gydnabod rôl Voices from Care yn y gwaith hwnnw. Mae nifer ohonom yn boenus o ymwybodol nad yw lleisiau plant a phobl ifanc sydd yn y system ofal yn aml yn cael eu clywed. Mae'r bobl ifanc hynny ymhlith y bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn mewn cymdeithas, er y bydd pobl yn gwneud i nifer ohonynt deimlo nad ydynt yn rhan o gymdeithas. Mae'n frawychus cofio'n union faint o blant felly sydd. Yr oedd adroddiad blynyddol prif arolygydd y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar

highlighted that we have 4,380 children in care in Wales. That figure has rightly caused alarm, particularly when you consider that during the same period in England there was a slight decline in the number of children in care. The chief inspector's report also highlights that, for the year ending 31 March 2005, 10.49 per cent of children in the care system had experienced three or more placements. How on earth can we expect these children and young people to rebuild their lives if they experience multiple placements? Minister, I know that this issue causes you concern and I urge you to consider what action the Assembly Government can take to address the situation, as I am sure that you will agree that it cannot be allowed to continue.

It is essential that decisions regarding the lives of looked-after children are made in full consultation with them—if it is about them, involve them. Being taken into the care system can be hugely traumatic, but the trauma can be lessened by communicating with the child about what is happening and why. Sadly, the reality is that this still does not occur often enough and it continues to be the exception rather than the norm. Despite the increased provision of advocacy services, a significant number of looked-after children are still going through a system whereby they are being 'done to' rather than being able to participate. If we want to improve the educational performance and general life chances of the children in our care system, our aim must be to ensure that every single one of them is fully involved in the decision-making process. Securing appropriate, as well as sufficient, independent advocacy services is fundamental to this aim. The social services direction paper sets out the objective of ensuring that service users are at the centre of the process, and are able to shape the service to their needs. Some of these children and young people will be greatly disempowered and traumatised when they come into contact with professionals and will need significant support to ensure that they can fully take part in the decisions made about them. I hope that the Minister will be able to commit the Assembly Government to ensuring that support and resources will be made available so that looked-after children

gyfer 2004-05 yn dangos bod gennym 4,380 o blant mewn gofal yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffigur wedi achosi braw, a hynny'n briodol, yn arbennig pan ystyriwch fod gostyngiad bach yn nifer y plant mewn gofal yn ystod yr un cyfnod yn Lloegr. Mae adroddiad y prif arolygydd hefyd yn tynnu sylw, am y flwyddyn a ddaeth i ben ar 31 Mawrth 2005, fod 10.49 y cant o blant yn y system ofal wedi bod mewn tri lleoliad neu fwy. Sut ar wyneb y ddaear y gallwn ni ddisgwyl i'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hyn ailadeiladu eu bywydau os cânt eu gosod mewn mwy nag un lleoliad? Weinidog, gwn fod y mater hwn yn peri pryder ichi ac fe'ch anogaf i ystyried pa gamau gweithredu y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa, gan fy mod yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno na ellir caniatáu i hyn barhau.

Mae'n hanfodol ymgynghori'n llawn â phlant sy'n cael gofal wrth wneud penderfyniadau yn ymwneud â'u bywydau—os ydynt yn ymwneud â hwy, dylech eu cynnwys. Gall cael eich derbyn i'r system ofal fod yn drawmatig iawn, ond gellir lleihau'r trawma drwy gyfathrebu â'r plentyn ynghylch yr hyn sy'n digwydd a pham. Yn anffodus, y gwir amdani yw nad yw hyn yn digwydd yn ddigon aml o hyd, ac y mae'n dal yn eithriad yn hytrach na'r norm. Er y ddarpariaeth gynyddol o wasanaethau eiriolaeth, mae nifer fawr o blant sy'n cael gofal yn dal i fynd drwy system lle caiff penderfyniadau eu gwneud drostynt, yn hytrach na system lle gallant gymryd rhan. Os ydym am wella perfformiad addysgol a chyfleoedd bywyd cyffredinol plant yn ein system ofal, rhaid inni anelu at sicrhau eu bod i gyd yn chwarae rhan lawn yn y broses benderfynu. Mae sicrhau gwasanaethau eiriolaeth annibynnol priodol, yn ogystal â digonol, yn sylfaenol i'r nod hwn. Mae papur cyfarwyddyd y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gosod allan yr amcan o sicrhau bod defnyddwyr gwasanaethau wrth wraidd y broses, ac y gallant lunio'r gwasanaeth i ddiwallu eu hanghenion. Bydd nifer o'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hyn yn ddi-rym ac wedi profi trawma difrifol wrth ddod i gysylltiad â gweithwyr proffesiynol, a bydd angen cefnogaeth sylweddol arnynt i sicrhau eu bod yn gallu cymryd rhan lawn yn y penderfyniadau a wneir amdanynt. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog ymrwymo Llywodraeth y

become the better-educated, better-informed and empowered service users that the direction paper wishes to develop.

I will now focus on disabled children and young people, for whom there is the potential to be among the most underrepresented in our communities. The report of the national working group on child protection and disability, 'It doesn't happen to disabled children', published by the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children in 2003, highlighted the fact that disabled children are 3.8 times more likely to be neglected, 3.8 times more likely to be physically abused, 3.1 times more likely to be sexually abused, and 3.9 times more likely to be emotionally abused. These statistics demonstrate the increased vulnerability of this particular group, which can be compounded by the failure to put systems in place by which they can communicate their concerns or needs.

In September, the UN committee on the rights of the child, at a meeting in Geneva, issued a general comment on the rights of children with disabilities. In it, it stated:

'The barrier is not the disability itself but it is a combination of social, cultural, attitudinal and physical barriers which children with disabilities encounter in their daily lives.'

We in the Assembly and our statutory partners should consider this comment when we examine the planning of services, and we must ask ourselves whether we are genuinely involving this group of children and young people in those key discussions. At times, disabled children and young people can become isolated from the decisions that are made about them. Sometimes, that is due to a belief that they would be unable to be involved in the decision-making process. More needs to be done to ensure that disabled children and young people are supported in getting their voices heard, as they do have views and preferences in terms of the way in which they receive services. I have seen this at first hand, as a Member who has been

Cynulliad i sicrhau y bydd cymorth ac adnoddau ar gael er mwyn i blant sy'n cael gofal ddod yn ddefnyddwyr gwasanaeth mwy addysgedig, mwy hyddysg a grymus yn unol â dymuniadau'r papur cyfarwyddyd.

Canolbwyntiaf yn awr ar blant a phobl ifanc anabl, sydd o bosibl ymhlith y grwpiau a gaiff eu tangynrychioli fwyaf yn ein cymunedau. Yr oedd adroddiad y gweithgor cenedlaethol ar amddiffyn plant ac anabled, 'It doesn't happen to disabled children', a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant yn 2003, yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod plant anabl 3.8 gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael eu hesgeuluso, 3.8 gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael eu cam-drin yn gorfforol, 3.1 gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael eu cam-drin yn rhywiol, a 3.9 gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael eu cam-drin yn emosiynol. Dengys yr ystadegau hyn natur ddiameddiffyn gynyddol y grŵp penodol hwn o blant, sy'n waeth oherwydd y methiant i roi systemau ar waith sy'n eu galluogi i gyfleu eu pryderon neu eu hanghenion.

Ym mis Medi, gwnaethpwyd sylw cyffredinol gan bwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn, mewn cyfarfod yng Nghenefa, am hawliau plant ag anabledau. Ynndo, dywedai:

Nid yr anabled ei hun yw'r rhwystr, ond cyfuniad o rwystrau cymdeithasol, diwylliannol, agweddol a chorfforol y daw plant ag anabledau ar eu traws yn eu bywyd bob dydd.

Dylem ni yn y Cynulliad a'n partneriaid statudol ystyried y sylw hwn pan archwiliwn y gwaith o gynllunio gwasanaethau, a rhaid inni holi'n hunain a ydym, mewn gwirionedd, yn cynnwys y grŵp hwn o blant a phobl ifanc yn y trafodaethau allweddol hynny. Ar adegau, gall plant a phobl ifanc gael eu hynysu o'r penderfyniadau a wneir amdanynt. Weithiau, mae hynny oherwydd y gred na fyddent yn gallu cymryd rhan yn y broses benderfynu. Mae angen gwneud mwy i sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc anabl yn cael eu cefnogi er mwyn i bobl glywed eu lleisiau, gan fod ganddynt farn a dewisiadau am y ffordd y byddant yn cael gwasanaethau. Yr wyf wedi gweld hyn yn bersonol, fel Aelod sydd wedi bod yn gysylltiedig ag

involved in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's review of service provision for young people with learning disabilities. During the past 18 months, the young people making up the reference group made a contribution of enormous value, and, without their input, the review would lack real credibility. I firmly believe that we need to focus more on whether disabled children and young people are receiving their rights, as set out in the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child as a whole, and not solely article 23, which specifically refers to disabled children and young people.

The final group of children and young people whom I want to speak about are those with mental health problems. I welcome the Minister for Health and Social Services' announcement that he will conduct a mid-point review of the CAMHS strategy, 'Everybody's Business'. It is vital that we scrutinise the strategy's implementation on the ground and rectify any gaps in service provision. It is also fundamental that this review does not seek to engage solely with those who are commissioning and providing services. Real and robust effort must be made to engage with those children and young people who are service users. Children and young people who receive a service from CAMHS do so for a variety of reasons, and have different experiences of the system. I hope that the Minister can commit the Assembly Government to involving and empowering children and young people in this review because, without their involvement, it would lack credibility and validity.

I have only managed to touch on a few of my concerns in relation to services and issues that impact on children and young people, but we all know that there are many other groups of children and young people for whom much more needs to be done to support them and for their voices to be heard. For example, the experiences of Gypsy and Traveller children and the need for an appropriate service for them are rarely heard, and there are the needs of young people giving evidence in court, particularly in cases of abuse, and the failure to use special

adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir i bobl ifanc sydd ag anableddau dysgu. Yn ystod y 18 mis diwethaf, mae'r bobl ifanc a oedd yn rhan o'r grŵp cyfeirio wedi gwneud cyfraniad gwerthfawr tu hwnt, a heb eu cyfraniad hwy ni fyddai i'r adolygiad hygrededd gwirioneddol. Credaf yn gryf fod angen inni ganolbwyntio'n fwy ar y cwestiwn a yw plant a phobl ifanc yn cael eu hawliau, fel y maent wedi eu gosod allan yng Nghonfensiwn y Cenedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn yn ei gyfanrwydd, ac nid erthygl 23 yn unig, sy'n cyfeirio'n benodol at blant a phobl ifanc anabl.

Y grŵp olaf o blant a phobl ifanc yr wyf am siarad amdanynt yw'r rheini sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Croesawaf gyhoeddiad y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bydd yn gwneud adolygiad canol-cyfnod o'r strategaeth CAMHS, 'Busnes Pawb'. Mae'n hanfodol inni graffu ar y gwaith o weithredu'r strategaeth ar lawr gwlad, ac unioni unrhyw fylchau yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Mae hefyd yn hollbwysig i'r adolygiad hwn beidio â cheisio ymgysylltu'n unig â'r rheini sy'n comisiynu ac yn darparu gwasanaethau. Rhaid gwneud ymdrech wirioneddol a chadarn i ymgysylltu â'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hynny sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau. Mae plant a phobl ifanc sy'n cael gwasanaeth gan CAMHS yn gwneud hynny am amryw resymau, ac mae ganddynt brofiadau gwahanol o'r system. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog ymrwymo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynnwys a grymuso plant a phobl ifanc yn yr adolygiad hwn oherwydd, heb eu cyfranogiad, ni fyddai'n gredadwy nac yn ddilys.

Yw wyf wedi llwyddo i sôn yn fras yn unig am rai o'm pryderon am wasanaethau a materion sy'n effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc, ond fe wyddom bob un fod nifer o grwpiau eraill o blant a phobl ifanc y mae angen gwneud mwy o lawer ar eu cyfer i'w cefnogi ac i sicrhau y clywir eu lleisiau. Er enghraifft, anaml y clywir am brofiadau plant Sipsiwn a Theithwyr a'r angen am wasanaeth priodol iddynt, yn ogystal ag anghenion pobl ifanc sy'n rhoi tystiolaeth yn y llys, yn arbennig mewn achosion o gam-drin, a'r methiant i ddefnyddio mesurau arbennig fel tystiolaeth



measures such as video evidence. These are just two other groups that need support for their voices and points of view to be heard. As I stated earlier, much has been done to encourage children and young people to get involved, but much more needs to be done to ensure that the voices of the most excluded and vulnerable children are heard. For this to happen, we all have a duty to listen.

5.40 p.m.

**Sandy Mewies:** I thank Catherine for allowing me to take part in this important debate, which asks the question to which we sadly know the answer. She has mentioned issues faced by children and young people who leave care, or have been in care. I recently met with young homeless people in Conwy. Some were from care situations, and they told us about the problems that they faced in getting accommodation. The same issues were faced by care leavers when I was a chair of social services, which was some years ago. When I used to meet with care leavers, they told me about the problems that they faced, which were exactly the same issues. Therefore, I was not surprised when one young man said to me, ‘I’ve been attending meetings like this for years—will this one make a difference? What are you going to do about it?’. Catherine is right, because the problems have been identified and the issues have been listened to, but is anything done about it? People must hear what is going on. I found it very disappointing to see such young people being so disillusioned by politicians at an early age. Therefore, it is up to politicians from all parties at all levels to take action, and to take it now.

**Peter Black:** I thank Catherine for raising this subject in Plenary. She raised a wide range of issues, and it is impossible to go through them all in the minute that I have in which to discuss this. I join Catherine in welcoming the school councils’ initiative. When I left school 28 years ago, my school had a school council, on which I served, and the school even had a sixth-form governor at

fideo. Dim ond dau grŵp arall yw’r rhain sydd ag angen cymorth i sicrhau clywed eu lleisiau a’u safbwyntiau. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae llawer wedi’i wneud i annog plant a phobl ifanc i gymryd rhan, ond mae angen gwneud mwy o lawer i sicrhau bod lleisiau’r plant a gaiff eu hallgáu fwyaf a’r plant mwyaf diamddiffyn yn cael eu clywed. Er mwyn i hyn ddigwydd, mae’n ddyletswydd arnom bob un i wrando.

**Sandy Mewies:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Catherine am ganiatáu imi gymryd rhan yn y ddadl bwysig hon, sy’n gofyn y cwestiwn y gwyddom yr ateb iddo, yn anffodus. Mae wedi sôn am broblemau sy’n wynebu plant a phobl ifanc sy’n gadael gofal, neu sydd wedi bod mewn gofal. Cyfarfûm â phobl ddiartref ifanc yng Nghonwy yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd rhai o safleoedd gofal, a dywedwyd wrthym am y problemau a oedd yn eu hwynebu wrth gael llety. Yr un materion oedd yn wynebu pobl a oedd yn gadael gofal pan oeddwn yn gadeirydd y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Pan arferwn gwrdd â phobl a oedd yn gadael gofal, byddent yn dweud wrthyf am y problemau a wynebant, a’r un problemau oeddent yn union. Felly, nid oedd yn syndod pan ddywedodd un dyn ifanc wrthyf, ‘Yr wyf wedi bod yn dod i gyfarfodydd fel y rhain ers blynyddoedd—a fydd hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth?’ Beth rydych yn bwriadu ei wneud amdano?’ Mae Catherine yn llygad ei lle, oherwydd mae’r problemau wedi eu nodi a’r problemau wedi eu clywed, ond a oes unrhyw beth yn cael ei wneud amdano? Rhaid i bobl glywed yr hyn sy’n digwydd. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig iawn gweld pobl ifanc felly’n cael eu dadrithio i’r fath raddau gan wleidyddion a hwythau mor ifanc. Felly, mae angen i wleidyddion o bob plaid ar bob lefel yw gweithredu, a hynny ar unwaith.

**Peter Black:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Catherine am godi’r pwnc hwn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae wedi codi amrywiaeth eang o faterion, ac nid yw’n bosibl imi sôn am bob un ohonynt yn ystod y funud sydd gennyf i drafod hyn. Ymunaf â Catherine i groesawu menter cynghorau ysgol. Pan adewais yr ysgol 28 mlynedd yn ôl, yr oedd gan fy ysgol gyngor ysgol, ac yr oeddwn yn aelod ohono. Yr

the time, so it was a very advanced school. The council instilled in us a sense of civic and community responsibility, and a desire to get involved, and look what happened to me—that is possibly a cautionary tale associated with the school council. This is a welcome introduction across Wales.

We had a discussion earlier about Voices from Care and the cross-party group that met last night. I was at the meeting for about half an hour, because I had to go to another meeting. Some of the issues that Voices from Care raised are very important, and if we are able to use the Assembly's powers after next May to put into effect some of those issues, we can make a huge difference in terms of looked-after children, particularly in terms of extending the duty of care to the age of 21, or possibly beyond that if the child goes into higher education. There is also a need for stronger and independent better-funded advocacy, which I know that the Minister is working on. Those two particular issues will be very important.

As a result of my interest in homelessness, I notice that many children who have been in care end up on the streets or homeless, and getting stability into their lives will be valuable and important in helping to tackle that problem.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I thank Catherine for raising this issue, and for giving me an opportunity to outline what the Assembly Government is doing in terms of listening to and learning from children and young people in Wales, to enable us to develop and deliver services that meet their needs and open doors for the most vulnerable children in our communities. I also thank Sandy and Peter Black for their comments.

I cannot do justice to the breadth and depth of Catherine's powerful presentation, but I will start by commenting on the importance of 'Keeping Us Safe: Report of the Safeguarding Vulnerable Children Review'. Children and young people made a valuable

oedd gan yr ysgol lywodraethwr chweched dosbarth hyd yn oed ar y pryd, felly, yr oedd yn ysgol ddatblygedig iawn. Yr oedd y cyngor yn rhoi inni syniad o gyfrifoldeb dinesig a chymunedol, a dymuniad i gymryd rhan, ac edrychwch beth ddigwyddodd i mi—dyna ichi stori rybuddiol, efallai, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r cyngor ysgol. Mae hwn yn gyflwyniad sy'n cael croeso ledled Cymru.

Cawsom drafodaeth yn gynharach am Voices from Care a'r grŵp trawsbleidiol a gyfarfu neithiwr. Yr oeddwn yn y cyfarfod am ryw hanner awr, oherwydd yr oedd yn rhaid imi fynd i gyfarfod arall. Mae rhai o'r materion a godwyd gan Voices from Care yn bwysig iawn, ac os gallwn ddefnyddio pwerau'r Cynulliad ar ôl mis Mai nesaf i roi rhai o'r materion hynny ar waith, gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth mawr o ran plant sy'n cael gofal, yn arbennig wrth ymestyn y ddyletswydd gofal i 21 oed, neu efallai y tu hwnt i hynny os bydd y plentyn yn mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch. Mae angen gwasanaethau eiriolaeth cryfach ac annibynnol sy'n cael eu hariannu'n well, a gwn fod y Gweinidog yn gweithio ar hynny. Bydd y ddau fater penodol hynny'n bwysig iawn.

Oherwydd fy niddordeb mewn digartrefedd, sylwaf fod nifer o blant sydd wedi bod mewn gofal yn byw ar y strydoedd neu'n ddigartref yn y pen draw, a bydd sicrhau sefydlogrwydd yn eu bywydau yn werthfawr ac yn bwysig i helpu mynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Hoffwn ddiolch i Catherine am godi'r mater hwnnw, ac am roi'r cyfle imi amlinellu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud o ran gwrandao ar blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru a dysgu ganddynt, i'n galluogi i ddatblygu a darparu gwasanaethau sy'n diwallu eu hanghenion ac yn agor drysau i'r plant mwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymunedau. Diolch hefyd i Sandy a Peter Black am eu sylwadau.

Ni allaf wneud cyfiawnder â hyd a lled cyflwyniad grymus Catherine, ond dechreuaf drwy roi sylwadau ar bwysigrwydd 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel: Adroddiad yr Adolygiad o Ddiogelu Plant sy'n Agored i Niwed'. Gwnaeth plant a phobl ifanc gyfraniad

contribution to that review. The whole review was child-focused and child-centred, and if we implement all the recommendations of that report, as I have said that we will do, we will be safeguarding children and young people and we will be putting their voices at the forefront in terms of our responsibilities, and learning from that evidence.

Catherine mentioned the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, and the Assembly Government's approach to children and young people is based on the principles enshrined in the convention. Article 12 sets out the right of all children and young people to express an opinion, and to have that opinion taken into account on any matter or procedure that affects them. 'Rights to Action' sets out the Welsh Assembly Government's position in more detail, and you also mentioned article 23 in relation to disabled children and young people. If we abide by article 12, it means that we must ensure that the review of children and adolescent mental health services embraces the needs, interests and experiences of children and young people who have suffered mental distress and have been troubled in their adolescence or at an earlier age. That binds us to recognise that children and young people are allowed to express their opinions on every policy and procedure. As you have laid out, listening to children is often the only reliable way that we have of understanding what children need and want from us as adults. For many children today, childhood is considerably shorter than it used to be. Children grow up in many different kinds of families and household structures, and communicate through a variety of media; they have a lot to tell us about childhood today—often as much as we think we have to tell them.

Listening to children is important if we are to safeguard them. You mentioned the Children's Commissioner for Wales and the importance of his independence and of his reports, such as 'Telling Concerns'. I understand that he has held an event today at which he has gathered together a group of young people to listen to them, as a demonstration of his independence and of his

gwerthfawr i'r adolygiad hwnnw. Yr oedd yr adolygiad cyfan yn canolbwyntio ar blant, a phlant oedd wrth ei wraidd. Os gweithredwn holl argymhellion yr adroddiad hwnnw, fel yr wyf wedi dweud y byddwn yn ei wneud, byddwn yn diogelu plant a phobl ifanc ac yn sicrhau bod eu lleisiau ar ben ein rhestr o gyfrifoldebau, ac yn dysgu o'r dystiolaeth honno.

Soniodd Catherine am gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn, ac mae ymagwedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad at blant a phobl ifanc yn seiliedig ar yr egwyddorion sydd wedi eu hymgorffori yn y confensiwn. Mae Erthygl 12 yn gosod allan hawl pob plentyn a pherson ifanc i fynegi barn, ac i'r farn honno gael ei hystyried am unrhyw fater neu weithdrefn sy'n effeithio arno. Mae 'Gweithredu'r Hawliau' yn gosod allan sefyllfa Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn fanylach, a soniech hefyd am erthygl 23 mewn perthynas â phlant a phobl ifanc anabl. Os cadwn at erthygl 12, golyga hynny fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr adolygiad o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed yn ymdrin ag anghenion, buddiannau a phrofiadau plant a phobl ifanc sydd wedi dioddef trallod meddyliol a gofid yn eu glaslencyndod neu'n gynharach yn eu bywydau. Mae hynny'n ein gorfodi i gydnabod bod hawl gan blant a phobl ifanc i fynegi eu barn am bob polisi a gweithdrefn. Fel yr ydych wedi ei osod allan, gwrando ar blant yw'r unig ffordd ddibynadwy sydd gennym, yn aml, i ddeall yr hyn y mae ar blant ei angen a'i eisiau gennym ni fel oedolion. I nnifer o blant heddiw, mae plentyndod lawer yn fyrrach nag a fu. Caiff plant eu magu mewn nifer o wahanol fathau o deuluoedd a chartrefi, a chyfathrebant drwy amrywiaeth o gyfryngau; mae ganddynt lawer i'w ddweud wrthym am blentyndod heddiw—gymaint, yn aml, ag a gredwn sydd gennym ni i ddweud wrthynt hwy.

Mae gwrando ar blant yn bwysig os ydym i'w diogelu. Soniech am Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru a phwysigrwydd ei annibyniaeth a'i adroddiadau, fel 'Datgan Pryderon'. Deallaf iddo gynnal digwyddiad heddiw gyda grŵp o bobl ifanc er mwyn gwrando arnynt, fel arwydd o'i annibyniaeth a'i rôl. Cydnabyddwn y bydd unrhyw un nad yw ei lais yn cael ei glywed wrth godi ei

role. We recognise that anyone who is denied a voice in raising their interests is made vulnerable, and that must influence how we take forward our policy and implement the recommendations outlined in 'Keeping Us Safe'. There have been too many examples in Wales and elsewhere of people in positions of trust victimising children, and it is vital that we provide children and young people with an opportunity to speak out when things go wrong.

We must also recognise the importance of the pro-active role that we are trying to play in developing children's roles as citizens in Wales. Catherine mentioned the important development of the statutory duty on School Councils UK—and Peter Black is the product of a school council. I am sure that we have many more politicians in the making in our Welsh schools today, thanks to school councils. This is about young people developing their skills for their own and for others' benefits, and also about ensuring that everyone's voice is heard so that we can use that imagination and energy. We can be proactive in how we take forward our thinking and planning.

I will comment on some of the points made, but I cannot do justice to them all. I particularly recognise last night's important development in setting up the all-party group on looked-after children. Voices from Care Cymru has always played an important role, and is represented again on Gwenda Thomas's review. It was also instrumental in promoting the policy changes that led to the development of the Children First programme in Wales, and to encouraging local authorities to set up local groups to inform service development. Therefore, looked-after children are now informing local authorities, engaging with them, and they have been fundamental in the Children First programme.

On the development of the all-party group, we have the opportunity to listen and learn about how we can strengthen services, improve outcomes for children and young people, and reshape our policies over the coming years in view of our new powers. It is

fuddiannau yn ddiameddiffyn, a rhaid i hynny ddylanwadu ar y modd y datblygwn ein polisiau a gweithredu'r argymhellion a amlinellir yn 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel'. Cafwyd gormod o enghreifftiau yng Nghymru a manau eraill o bobl mewn sefyllfa o ymddiriedaeth yn fictimeiddio plant, ac mae'n hanfodol inni roi cyfle i blant a phobl ifanc leisio'u pryderon pan aiff pethau o'u lle.

Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod pwysigrwydd y rôl ragweithiol yr ydym yn ceisio'i chyflawni wrth ddatblygu rolau plant fel dinasyddion yng Nghymru. Crybwyllodd Catherine bwysigrwydd datblygu'r ddyletswydd statudol ar Gynghorau Ysgol y DU—ac mae Peter Black yn gynnyrch cyngor ysgol. Mae'n siŵr gennyf fod gennym lawer mwy o ddarpar wleidyddion yn ein hysgolion yng Nghymru heddiw, diolch i'r cynghorau ysgol. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â phobl ifanc yn datblygu eu sgiliau er budd eraill ac er eu budd eu hunain, ac mae hefyd yn ymwneud â sicrhau llais i bawb fel y gallwn ddefnyddio'r dychymyg a'r egni hwnnw. Gallwn fod yn rhagweithiol yn y modd yr ydym yn datblygu ein syniadau a'n cynlluniau.

Gwnaf rai sylwadau am rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed, ond ni allaf wneud cyfiawnhad â phob un. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yn enwedig y ddatblygiad pwysig neithiwr, sef sefydlu grŵp hollbleidiol ar blant sy'n cael gofal. Mae Voices from Care Cymru wedi chwarae rhan bwysig iawn bob tro, ac fe'i cynrychiolir unwaith eto ar adolygiad Gwenda Thomas. Yr oedd hefyd yn allweddol wrth hyrwyddo'r newidiadau polisi a arweiniodd at ddatblygu'r rhaglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf yng Nghymru ac i annog awdurdodau lleol i sefydlu grwpiau lleol i ychwanegu at y broses o ddatblygu gwasanaethau. Felly, mae plant sy'n cael gofal bellach yn ychwanegu at awdurdodau lleol ac yn ymgysylltu â hwy, ac maent wedi bod yn allweddol yn y rhaglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf.

O ran datblygu'r grŵp hollbleidiol, mae gennym gyfle i wrando a dysgu am y modd y gallwn gryfhau gwasanaethau, gwella canlyniadau i blant a phobl ifanc, ac ail-lunio ein polisiau dros y blynyddoedd i ddod yng ngoleuni'n pwerau newydd. Mae'n ddiddorol

interesting that this debate followed the important debate on the CSIW's annual report, and John Griffiths mentioned the Welsh centre of excellence for looked-after children. That is an important development in strengthening standards and ensuring that we look at how we can strengthen training and qualifications, as Brian Gibbons said. That entire remit must embrace how we listen to children and young people in the care system when taking this forward.

I will mention briefly the importance of the national service framework for children and young people in relation to disabled children, and the fact that we now have a self-assessment audit tool that aims to improve the quality and equity of services available to children and their families, with specifically targeted standards for disabled children. Over the past two years, I have been pleased to meet with a network of disabled young people. That grew out of the important International Young Disabled People's Congress held in Swansea during the European Year of Disabled People, and has been supported over the past two years. I hope that it will continue to be supported into the future. We have learned a great deal from those young people throughout Wales about their needs and experiences.

5.50 p.m.

We look forward to the report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, because that reference group—which we hope will continue to be a reference group for the Assembly and the committee—will make sure that we take forward, and are empowered by, the messages of those young people.

The report of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee will also be important with regard to looking at children with special needs. We have put social inclusion at the heart of all our policies, and ensuring that we deliver the best possible services for some of our most vulnerable children and young people is a key priority in education. It is of paramount importance that children and young people have a voice to ensure that adults plan with them and not for

fod y ddadl hon wedi dilyn y ddadl bwysig ar adroddiad blynyddol ASGC, a soniodd John Griffiths am ganolfan ragoriaeth Cymru i blant sy'n cael gofal. Mae hynny'n ddatblygiad pwysig wrth atgyfnerthu safonau a sicrhau ein bod yn edrych ar y modd y gallwn argyferthu hyfforddiant a chymwysterau, fel y dywedodd Brian Gibbons. Rhaid i'r cylch gwaith cyfan hwnnw ystyried y modd yr ydym yn gwrandao ar blant a phobl ifanc yn y system gofal wrth ddatblygu hyn.

Crybwyllaf yn fyr bwysigrwydd y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant a phobl ifanc yng nghyd-destun plant anabl, a'r ffaith fod gennym bellach offeryn archwilio hunanasesu sy'n anelu at wella ansawdd a chyfartaledd y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i blant a'u teuluoedd gyda safonau sy'n targedu plant anabl yn benodol. Dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, yr oedd yn bleser imi gwrdd â rhwydwaith o bobl ifanc anabl. Tyfodd hynny allan o'r Gyngres Ryngwladol Pobl Ifanc Anabl a gynhaliwyd yn Abertawe yn ystod Blwyddyn Ewropeaidd Pobl Anabl, ac mae wedi ei gefnogi dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Gobeithio y bydd y gefnogaeth iddo yn parhau yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym wedi dysgu llawer iawn gan y bobl ifanc hynny ledled Cymru am eu hanghenion a'u profiadau.

Edrychwn ymlaen at adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, oherwydd bydd y grŵp cyfeirio hwnnw—a fydd yn parhau, gobeithio, yn grŵp cyfeirio ar gyfer y Cynulliad a'r pwyllgor—yn sicrhau y cawn ein grymuso gan negeseuon y bobl ifanc hynny ac yn eu datblygu.

Bydd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau hefyd yn bwysig o safbwynt edrych ar blant ag anghenion arbennig. Yr ydym wedi rhoi cynhwysiant cymdeithasol wrth wraidd pob un o'n polisïau, ac mae sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'r gwasanaethau gorau posibl i rai o'n plant a'n pobl ifanc mwyaf diamddiffyn yn flaenoriaeth allweddol ym maes addysg. Mae'n hollbwysig i blant a phobl ifanc cael llais i sicrhau bod oedolion yn cynllunio ar y

them. That is enshrined in the special educational needs code of practice. Once again, we must mark that theme all the way through our policies.

I will move on to talk about the importance of child and adolescent mental health strategy. It has rightly been addressed in this Chamber on many occasions, whether by the Government or the opposition, in questions and short debates. 'Everybody's Business', which is what it is all about, was launched in 2001 and it built upon the national service framework for children. There has been strong support from the Children's Commissioner for Wales and service managers at all levels and professions. However, I think that ensuring that children and young people have access to high-quality equitable and responsive services on the basis of their needs is accepted and is embedded in both 'Everybody's Business' and, now, in the targets. Brian Gibbons said yesterday that the specific CAMHS targets in the service and financial framework process are important. That is the basis on which we will hold people to account. The message coming through—and I mentioned article 23 and article 12 of the UN convention—is that we must ensure that the review of CAMHS taking place over the next 12 months, at all levels and through all agencies, engages with young people. I am glad that Brian Gibbons is here to take that on board. Catherine, it is important that you reflected that point today.

Moving on, the first point that you mentioned was on physical punishment, which children still have to endure. We agree with the view of the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, that corporal punishment should be prohibited by law. We support the Children are Unbeatable! campaign and will do so for a further year. We have also discussed with it the possibility of using new powers under the Government of Wales Act 2006 to promote positive parenting in conjunction with a public education campaign focusing on prevention rather than prohibition.

I will also just mention the important Help at Hand Week held in Llansawel in May, which was a very good example of children, young people, families and the whole community

cyd â hwy ac nid ar eu cyfer. Ymgorfforir hynny yn y cod ymarfer ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig. Unwaith eto, rhaid inni nodi'r thema honno drwy bob un o'n polisiau.

Symudaf ymlaen i siarad am bwysigrwydd strategaeth iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed. Ymdriniwyd â hi, a hynny'n briodol, yn y Siambr hon droeon, gan y Llywodraeth neu gan y gwrthbleidiau, mewn cwestiynau ac mewn dadleuon byr. Lansiodd 'Busnes Pawb', sef hanfod y peth, yn 2001 ac yr oedd yn adeiladu ar y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant. Cafwyd cefnogaeth gref gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru a rheolwyr gwasanaeth o bob lefel a phroffesiwn. Fodd bynnag, credaf y derbynnir y ffaith y dylid sicrhau bod gwasanaethau cyfartal ac ymatebol o safon ar gael i blant a phobl ifanc ar sail eu hanghenion, ac ymgorfforir hynny yn 'Busnes Pawb', ac yn y targedau, bellach. Dywedodd Brian Gibbons ddoe fod y targedau CAHMS penodol yn y broses fframwaith ariannol a gwasanaeth yn bwysig. Ar y sail honno y byddwn yn dwyn pobl i gyfrif. Y neges a ddaw yn glir—a chrybwyllais erthygl 23 ac erthygl 12 o gytundeb y Cenhedloedd Unedig—yw ei bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd yr adolygiad o CAMHS yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf, ar bob lefel a thrwy bob asiantaeth, yn ymgysylltu â phobl ifanc. Yr wyf yn falch fod Brian Gibbons yma i ystyried hynny. Catherine, mae'n bwysig eich bod wedi adlewyrchu'r pwynt hwnnw.

I symud ymlaen, y pwynt cyntaf ichi sôn amdano oedd cosb gorfforol y mae plant yn gorfod ei dioddef o hyd. Yr ydym yn cytuno â barn Pwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn y dylid gwahardd cosb gorfforol dan y gyfraith. Yr ydym yn cefnogi ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo Plant! a gwnawn hynny am flwyddyn arall. Yr ydym hefyd wedi trafod gyda hwy y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio pwerau newydd o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 i hyrwyddo rhianta cadarnhaol, ar y cyd ag ymgyrch addysg gyhoeddus yn canolbwyntio ar atal yn hytrach na gwahardd.

Crybwyllaf hefyd bwysigrwydd Wythnos Help wrth Law a gynhaliwyd yn Llansawel ym mis Mai. Yr oedd yn enghraifft dda iawn o blant, pobl ifanc, teuluoedd a'r gymuned

coming together. I know that some of the findings of that event will be presented to Assembly Members in January. That also links into our parenting action plan, and ensures that children and young people have a voice in how they found the activities during that week.

Finally, in my role as Minister for children, it is for me to be judged and tested on how we, as a Government, are taking this agenda forward. As I said right from the word go, this is underpinned not just by the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, but also by 'Keeping us Safe'. Every single recommendation will deliver what you have presented us with today, Catherine. The important points that you have made will now have a bearing on policy and practice.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

gyfan yn dod at ei gilydd. Gwn y caiff rhai o ddarganfyddiadau'r digwyddiad hwnnw eu cyflwyno i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ym mis Ionawr. Mae hynny hefyd yn cysylltu â'n cynllun gweithredu rhianta, ac yn sicrhau y caiff plant a phobl ifanc leisio'u barn am weithgareddau'r wythnos honno.

Yn olaf, yn fy rôl fel Gweinidog dros blant, fi sydd i gael fy marnu a'm profi am y ffordd yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, yn datblygu'r agenda hon. Fel y dywedais o'r cychwyn, ategir hyn gan 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel' yn ogystal â Chytundeb y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn. Bydd pob un argymhelliad yn gwireddu'r hyn a gyflwynwyd inni gennych heddiw, Catherine. Bydd y pwyntiau pwysig a wnaethoch yn awr yn dylanwadu ar bolisi ac arfer.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.55 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.55 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)