



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Mawrth 21 Tachwedd 2000
Tuesday 21 November 2000

Cynnwys Contents

- 2 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions to the First Minister
- 19 Datganiad ar Raglen Fusnes Flynyddol y Llywodraeth
Statement on the Annual Government Business Programme
- 47 Gweithredu'r Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref Newydd i Gymru
Implementation of the New Home Energy Efficiency Scheme for Wales
- 52 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 58 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 61 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Athrawon (Cofrestru Gorfodol)
(Cymru) 2000
*Composite Motion: Approval of the Teachers (Compulsory Registration) (Wales)
Regulations 2000*
- 62 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 62 Dadl ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad
Debate on the Report of the Committee on Standards of Conduct

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

Effaith Deddf Hawliau Dynol Ewrop 1998 ar Gymru Effect of European Human Rights Act 1998 on Wales

Q1 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister give a brief statement on the effect of the European Human Rights Act 1998 on Wales? (OAQ7888)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): The Human Rights Act 1998, which is a UK Parliament Act, gives people a clear statement of their basic rights and fundamental freedoms. The Act makes the rights contained in the European Convention on Human Rights enforceable through courts and tribunals in the UK. That has implications for the work of all public authorities in Wales, which are required to pay proper attention to the rights of citizens in their dealings with them and when making decisions that affect them. Its implications for Wales were discussed at a conference in Cardiff in May to celebrate the commencement of the implications of the Human Rights Act in Wales, and there will be a further conference in Llandudno on 1 December.

Helen Mary Jones: What consideration has the Government of Wales given to the recent Scottish judgment under section 6 of the Human Rights Act with regard to the human rights implications of the calling in of planning applications and the way in which that is conducted? If the answer is that no consideration has been given so far, will you undertake to ensure that consideration is given as a matter of urgency to this, particularly in the light of the Assembly's ongoing plans to review its planning guidance?

The First Minister: I give you that undertaking. I have just heard on the grapevine—and nothing more than that—of the recent Scottish judgment. If that has implications for Wales, I will write to Helen

C1 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ar effaith Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 Ewrop ar Gymru? (OAQ7888)

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Mae Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998, sydd yn Ddeddf Seneddol y DU, yn rhoi datganiad clir i bobl o'u hawliau a'u rhyddid sylfaenol. Sicrhaf'r Ddeddf y caiff yr hawliau a gynhwysir yn y Cytundeb Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol eu gorfodi drwy lysoedd a thribiwnlysoedd yn y DU. Mae i hynny oblygiadau i waith yr holl awdurdodau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, y mae'n ofynnol iddynt dalu sylw priodol i hawliau dinasyddion wrth iddynt ddelio â hwy ac wrth wneud penderfyniadau sydd yn effeithio arnynt. Trafodwyd ei goblygiadau i Gymru mewn cynhadledd yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Mai i ddathlu dechrau goblygiadau'r Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol yng Nghymru, a chynhelir cynhadledd arall yn Llandudno ar 1 Rhagfyr.

Helen Mary Jones: Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd Llywodraeth Cymru i'r dyfarniad diweddar yn Yr Alban o dan adran 6 y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol mewn perthynas â goblygiadau hawliau dynol wrth alw ceisiadau cynllunio i mewn a'r modd y gweithredir hynny? Os mai'r ateb yw na roddwyd unrhyw ystyriaeth i hyn hyd yma, a addawch sicrhau y rhoddir ystyriaeth i hyn fel mater o frys, yn arbennig yng ngoleuni cynlluniau parhaus y Cynulliad i adolygu ei arweiniad cynllunio?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rhoddaf yr addewid honno i chi. Yr wyf newydd glywed sibrydion—a dim mwy na hynny—o'r dyfarniad diweddar yn Yr Alban. Os oes goblygiadau i Gymru yn sgîl hynny, byddaf

Mary Jones, with copies to others on the intranet, to ensure that everybody understands what those implications might be.

yn ysgrifennu at Helen Mary Jones, ac yn dosbarthu copïau i eraill dros y fewnrwyd, er mwyn sicrhau bod pawb yn deall beth allai'r goblygiadau hynny fod.

Cynghorwyr Arbennig yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru Special Advisers in the National Assembly for Wales

Q2 Alison Halford: Will the First Minister make a statement about the appointment procedure and accountability of special advisers in the National Assembly for Wales? (OAQ7908)

C2 Alison Halford: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch y weithdrefn ar gyfer penodi cynghorwyr arbennig yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a'u hatebolrwydd? (OAQ7908)

The First Minister: Special advisers are appointed in accordance with the Civil Service Order in Council 1995 as amended in March 1999. They are accountable to their appointing ministers for the way in which they serve the objectives of the National Assembly for Wales. You will be aware that our special advisers were appointed in open competition and that advisers have never been appointed in that way before.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Penodir cynghorwyr arbennig yn unol â Gorchymyn y Gwasanaeth Sifil yng Nghyngor 1995 fel y'i diwygiwyd ym Mawrth 1999. Maent yn atebol i'r gweinidogion a'u penododd o ran y ffordd y maent yn gwasanaethu amcanion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Byddwch yn ymwybodol y penodwyd ein cynghorwyr arbennig mewn cystadleuaeth agored ac na phenodwyd cynghorwyr yn y dull hwnnw o'r blaen.

Alison Halford: That is exactly what I wanted to hear. I congratulate you on the fact that you have appointed your advisers in an open and fair way. Will you ensure that all special advisers are appointed in that way in future?

Alison Halford: Dyna'n union yr oeddwn am ei glywed. Hoffwn eich llongyfarch ar y ffaith eich bod wedi penodi eich cynghorwyr mewn dull agored a theg. A fyddwch yn sicrhau y penodir pob cynghorydd arbennig yn y dull hwn yn y dyfodol?

The First Minister: I can give that assurance on behalf of the partnership Government also. We anticipate that there will be two Liberal Democrat special advisers and I understand that they will be appointed through open competition in the same way as our original four—now reduced to three—were appointed.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw ichi ar ran y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hefyd. Yr ydym yn rhagweld y bydd dau gynghorydd arbennig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a deallaf y cânt eu penodi drwy gystadleuaeth agored yn yr un modd y cafodd y pedwar cynghorydd gwreiddiol—sydd bellach yn dri—eu penodi.

David Davies: Does the First Minister have any plans to appoint a special adviser to the opposition parties so that we might have some idea about the important Cabinet statements that are made in our name before the press hears about them?

David Davies: A oes gan Brif Weinidog Cymru unrhyw gynlluniau i benodi cynghorydd arbennig ar gyfer y gwrthbleidiau er mwyn inni allu cael rhyw fath o syniad o'r datganiadau Cabinet pwysig a gaiff eu gwneud yn ein henw cyn i'r wasg glywed amdanynt?

The First Minister: I am sorry if David Davies is making such an admission on his own behalf. I had always thought that he

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os yw David Davies yn gwneud cyfaddefiad o'r fath ar ei ran ei hun. Credais

suffered from delusions of adequacy. He has proved it by saying today that without a special adviser he is unable to keep up with the pace of the partnership Government of the National Assembly.

Jocelyn Davies: Do you consider these as political appointments? If not, why not?

The First Minister: They are political appointments. We took the initiative last year to ensure that within the overall description of political appointments, you can apply the principles of transparency, merit and the guidance of the civil service code on appointments to special advisors, just as you can to regular established civil servants.

erioed ei fod yn dioddef o gamdybiaethau am ei allu. Profodd hyn heddiw drwy ddweud na all ymdopi â chyflymder Llywodraeth bartneriaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol heb gynghorydd arbennig.

Jocelyn Davies: A yr ystyriwch y rhain fel penodiadau gwleidyddol? Os felly, pam lai?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Maent yn benodiadau gwleidyddol. Buom yn flaengar y llynedd er mwyn sicrhau y gallwch gymhwyso egwyddorion eglurder, teilyngdod ac arweiniad cod y gwasanaeth sifil ar benodi cynghorwyr arbennig o fewn disgrifiad cyffredinol penodiadau gwleidyddol, yn yr un modd ag y gallwch ar gyfer gweision sifil sefydledig arferol.

Cyrff Cyhoeddus a Ariennir gan y Cynulliad Public Bodies Funded by the Assembly

Q3 Val Feld: Will the First Minister make a statement on the economic and social implications of this administration's policy regarding location in respect of those public bodies funded directly by the Assembly? (OAQ7891)

The First Minister: Our general view is that decisions on the location of Assembly sponsored public bodies—quangos under the old terminology—are primarily a matter for the bodies themselves, taking into account guidance issued by the Assembly and their own business needs. Thus, for example, the Welsh Development Agency operates across Wales and has a regional structure relevant to its business clientele. Wales is also divided into five health authorities responsible for commissioning healthcare services within those five communities. Likewise, the 15 health trusts have a geographic and community spread across Wales. Local health groups are even more local. They are based on unitary authority areas and they have been established jointly within health authorities to bring greater local consideration to the planning and commissioning of health services.

C3 Val Feld: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch goblygiadau economaidd a chymdeithasol polisi'r weinyddiaeth hon ynghylch lleoliad mewn perthynas â'r cyrff cyhoeddus hynny a ariennir yn uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad? (OAQ7891)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ein barn gyffredinol yw bod y mater o lunio penderfyniadau ar leoliad cyrff cyhoeddus a ariennir gan y Cynulliad—cwangos yn ôl yr hen derminoleg—yn fater i'r cyrff eu hunain, gan ystyried yr arweiniad a gyhoeddwyd gan y Cynulliad a'u hanghenion busnes eu hunain. Felly, er enghraifft, gweithreda Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ledled Cymru ac mae ganddo strwythur rhanbarthol sydd yn berthnasol i'w gleientiaid busnes. Mae Cymru hefyd wedi'i rhannu'n bum awdurdod iechyd sydd yn gyfrifol am gomisiynu gwasanaethau gofal iechyd o fewn y pum cymuned hyn. Yn yr un modd, mae'r 15 ymddiriedolaeth iechyd wedi'u gwasgaru'n ddaearyddol ac yn gymunedol ledled Cymru. Mae'r grwpiau iechyd lleol yn fwy lleol hyd yn oed. Maent yn seiliedig ar ardaloedd awdurdod unedol ac fe'u sefydlwyd ar y cyd o fewn awdurdodau iechyd er mwyn rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth leol wrth gynllunio a chomisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd.

If the intention behind Val's question was to explore the possible location of the headquarters of new public agencies, this is a matter of on-going consideration with the new public bodies which have not yet taken their decision because they have not yet come into existence. I am thinking of bodies such as the Care Council for Wales and the National Council for Education and Training for Wales. We will take full account of representations that have been made repeatedly in the Assembly that full consideration should be given to locations outside Cardiff.

Val Feld: You will be aware that previous Labour governments have had strategies to locate public institutions outside of a capital to kick-start economic investment. Will you consider, with your Cabinet colleagues, developing a strategy to locate Assembly sponsored public bodies outside Cardiff and within that strategy to particularly look at a programme to develop Swansea as a second city in the way in which Glasgow is to Edinburgh?

The First Minister: I can hear some voices noting that Glasgow, strangely enough, is much larger than Edinburgh, although Edinburgh is the capital city. In some cases it is better to regionalise the functions rather than have a headquarters which itself would still be centralised although perhaps not in Cardiff. Both strategies might be appropriate for the National Council for Education and Training for Wales or for the Care Council for Wales. I am not making any commitment in advance but there are two issues about how much of the total employment of a quango should be in its headquarters and how much should be delegated to the regions. There are also UK public agencies. After all, we must remember that the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency, which came to Wales in the 1960s, employs far more civil servants in Wales than the National Assembly with some 4,000 civil servants compared to our 2,800.

Os mai'r bwriad y tu ôl i gwestiwn Val oedd archwilio lleoliad posibl pencadlys asiantaethau cyhoeddus newydd, mae hyn yn fater sydd yn cael ystyriaeth barhaus gyda'r cyrff cyhoeddus newydd nad ydynt wedi gwneud eu penderfyniad eto am nad ydynt wedi dod i fodolaeth hyd yma. Meddyliaf am gyrff fel Cyngor Gofal Cymru a Chyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Byddwn yn ystyried yn llawn y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd yn gyson yn y Cynulliad, sef y dylid rhoi ystyriaeth lawn i leoliadau y tu allan i Gaerdydd.

Val Feld: Byddwch yn ymwybodol y bu gan lywodraethau Llafur blaenorol strategaethau er mwyn lleoli sefydliadau cyhoeddus y tu allan i brifddinas er mwyn rhoi hwb i ddatblygiadau economaidd. A ystyriwch gyda'ch cydweithwyr yn y Cabinet, ddatblygu strategaeth i leoli cyrff cyhoeddus a ariennir gan y Cynulliad y tu allan i Gaerdydd ac o fewn y strategaeth honno er mwyn edrych yn benodol ar raglen i ddatblygu Abertawe fel ail ddinas yn yr un modd ag y mae Glasgow i Gaeredin?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gallaf glywed rhai lleisiau'n datgan fod Glasgow, yn rhyfedd iawn, yn llawer mwy na Chaeredin, er mai Caeredin yw'r brifddinas. Mewn rhai achosion, mae'n well rhanbartholi swyddogaethau yn hytrach na chael pencadlys a fyddai'n parhau i fod yn ganolog er na fyddai o reidrwydd wedi'i leoli yng Nghaerdydd. Gallai'r naill strategaeth a'r llall fod yn briodol ar gyfer Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant neu Gyngor Gofal Cymru. Nid wyf am wneud unrhyw ymrwymiad cynnar ond mae dau fater yn ymwneud â faint o bobl, o'r cyfanswm a gyflogir gan cwango, ddylai weithio yn ei bencadlys, a faint ohonynt y dylid eu dirprwyo i'r rhanbarthau. Mae hefyd asiantaethau cyhoeddus y DU. Wedi'r cyfan, rhaid inni gofio bod yr Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrrwyr a Cherbydau, a ddaeth i Gymru yn y 1960au, yn cyflogi llawer mwy o weision sifil yng Nghymru na'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyda thua 4,000 o weision sifil o'i gymharu â'n 2,800 ni.

Peter Rogers: Following the justifiable criticism from north Wales that the nearest Welsh European Funding Office was outside this Objective 1 area, an office has been opened in Colwyn Bay with a staffing level of one or two people. Do you consider that this is adequate for north Wales?

2:10 p.m.

The First Minister: WEFO is an interesting example. Apart from the payments office which has always been in Cathays Park alongside the Assembly's other finance functions, WEFO has inherited two non-Cardiff based offices, both of which were suitable to the previous disposition of European funds, such as the Objective 2 and 5b programmes. Therefore, they were located, as far as Objective 2 was concerned, in the heart of the Objective 2 area, namely in Mountain Ash and, in terms of the Objective 5b programme, which covers Powys, Gwynedd and Dyfed, in Machynlleth.

We chose not to disturb the residential or location pattern of serving north and mid Wales with the Machynlleth office. It is true that Machynlleth is not in the Objective 1 area. However, if you look at the Objective 1 map you will see that it is remarkably well connected. It is in that salient of Powys that sticks out into the heart of Ceredigion and Meirionnydd, due to the way in which the traditional Powys boundary almost reaches the Dyfi estuary.

We have also set up an office in Colwyn Bay, but you must have regard for the residential pattern that has been built up by the old Wales European Funding Office and the new Wales European Funding Office. We do not want to close down the Machynlleth office and move it half a mile down the road so that it is within the Objective 1 area nor necessarily to move half of the staff to Colwyn Bay. I am not sure that that would make much sense.

Peter Rogers: Yn dilyn y feirniadaeth deilwng o ogledd Cymru bod y Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru agosaf y tu allan i'r ardal Amcan 1 hon, agorwyd swyddfa ym Mae Colwyn gydag un neu ddau aelod o staff. A ystyriwch fod hyn yn ddigonol ar gyfer gogledd Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn enghraifft ddi-ddorol. Ar wahân i'r swyddfa taliadau sydd wedi'i lleoli ym Mharc Cathays erioed ochr yn ochr â swyddogaethau ariannol eraill y Cynulliad, mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru wedi etifeddu dwy swyddfa nad ydynt yng Nghaerdydd, gyda'r naill a'r llall yn addas ar gyfer dosbarthiad blaenorol arian Ewropeaidd, megis rhaglenni Amcan 2 a 5b. Felly, fe'u lleolwyd, o ran Amcan 2, yn nghanol ardal Amcan 2, sef Aberpennar ac, yn nhermau rhaglen Amcan 5b, sydd yn cwmpasu Powys, Gwynedd a Dyfed, ym Machynlleth.

Penderfynasom beidio ag amharu ar batrwm preswyl neu leoliad gwasanaethu gogledd a chanolbarth Cymru o swyddfa Machynlleth. Mae'n wir nad yw Machynlleth yn ardal Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch ar fap Amcan 1, fe welwch ei bod wedi'i chysylltu'n rhyfeddol o dda. Mae yn y rhan honno o Bowys sydd yn ymwithio i ganol Ceredigion a Meirionnydd, o ganlyniad i'r ffordd y mae ffin draddodiadol Powys bron yn cyrraedd aber Afon Dyfi.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi sefydlu swyddfa ym Mae Colwyn, ond rhaid i chi ystyried y patrwm preswyl a sefydlwyd gan hen Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru newydd. Nid ydym am gau swyddfa Machynlleth a'i symud hanner milltir i lawr y ffordd er mwyn iddi fod o fewn yr ardal Amcan 1 nac o anghenraid symud hanner y staff i Fae Colwyn. Nid wyf yn siŵr y byddai hynny'n gwneud llawer o synnwyr.

Ffurflen Cyfrifiad 2001
The 2001 Census Form

C4 Owen John Thomas: Sut a phryd y clywodd Prif Weinidog Cymru fod ffurflen cyfrifiad 2001 wedi cael ei hargraffu? (OAQ7896)

Q4 Owen John Thomas: How and when did the First Minister hear that the 2001 census form had been printed? (OAQ7896)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ar 3 Awst y clywais gyntaf gan Len Cook, y prif ystadegydd, ei bod yn rhy hwyr i ailystyried y cwestiynau hyn oherwydd bod y broses wedi mynd yn rhy bell o ran argraffu. Ni chofiaf drafod y manylion, sef pryd yr oedd y cytundeb argraffu wedi dechrau. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl gwneud rhagor o ymholiadau gyda swyddfa'r prif ystadegydd, gallaf ddweud bod y cytundeb wedi dechrau cyn imi gyfarfod â Len Cook ar 3 Awst. Dechreuwyd argraffu'r ffurflenni Cymraeg ar 27 Gorffennaf a'r fersiwn Saesneg ar 2 Awst, y diwrnod cyn imi gyfarfod â Len Cook yng Nghaerdydd.

The First Minister: It was on 3 August that I first heard from Len Cook, the chief statistician, that it was too late to reconsider these questions as the process had gone too far in terms of printing. I do not remember discussing the details, such as when the printing agreement began. However, after making further inquiries to the office of the chief statistician, I can say that the contract had begun before I met Len Cook on 3 August. The printing of the Welsh language forms began on 27 July and the English version on 2 August, the day before I met Len Cook in Cardiff.

Owen John Thomas: Yr oeddech yn gwybod ym mis Awst bod y ffurflenni cyfrifiad wedi cael eu hargraffu. Fodd bynnag, pan ofynnodd Simon Thomas, AS Ceredigion, gwestiwn am hyn, ni chafodd unrhyw wybodaeth tan 6 Tachwedd. A oes lle i gredu bod y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol wedi ceisio camarwain Cymru yn yr achos hwn? Oni fydddech yn cytuno mai swyddogaeth y swyddfa honno yw lledaenu gwybodaeth yn hytrach na'i chelu?

Owen John Thomas: You knew in August that the census forms had been printed. However, when Simon Thomas, the MP for Ceredigion, asked a question about this, he did not receive any information until 6 November. Is there any reason to believe that the Office of National Statistics has tried to mislead Wales in this case? Would you not agree that the function of that office is to disseminate information rather than conceal it?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni allaf ateb yn uniongyrchol ar ran swyddfa'r prif ystadegydd. Y cwbl y gallaf ei ddweud yw ein bod ni wedi derbyn gwybodaeth heddiw ynglŷn â dyddiad cychwyn y cytundeb i argraffu'r ffurflenni, sef 27 Gorffennaf ar gyfer y fersiwn Gymraeg a 2 Awst ar gyfer y fersiwn Saesneg. Dyma'r tro cyntaf inni gael y manylion oherwydd mai'r argraffwyr yn unig sydd yn gallu rhoi'r wybodaeth iawn ynglŷn â phryd y dechreuant ar y gwaith corfforol o argraffu'r ffurflenni. Arwyddwyd y cytundeb ym mis Chwefror eleni, ond dechreuodd yr argraffu ei hun ddiwedd Gorffennaf a dechrau Awst.

The First Minister: I cannot answer directly on behalf of the office of the chief statistician. All I can say is that we received information today regarding the start date of the contract to print the forms, namely 27 July for the Welsh version and 2 August for the English version. This is the first time that we have had these details, because it is only the printers that can give the correct information about when they started the physical task of printing the forms. The contract was signed in February this year, but the printing itself began at the end of July and the beginning of August.

Nick Bourne: As Labour Leader, will you allow your group a free vote in the Assembly

Nick Bourne: Fel Arweinydd y Blaid Lafur, a wnewch chi ganiatáu i'ch grŵp gael

on whether we should have a Welsh tick box in the forthcoming census?

The First Minister: I am not aware of any forthcoming vote on this issue.

Nick Bourne: Would you allow such a vote? Do you not regard it as an insult that there is no separate box for Wales as there is for Scotland and Ireland? Can we have such a vote and would you allow a free vote within your group? It is a matter of saying 'yes' or 'no'.

The First Minister: It is not a matter of 'yes' or 'no'; I am not the chief whip. These whipping issues are determined by the chief whip—

Nick Bourne: You are supposed to be the Leader—

The First Minister: Yes, but Karen Sinclair is the chief whip. Have you got it straight now, Nick? Perhaps you do not have a chief whip in your group. May I say that, as regards the material, rather than the silly points that you are making, there is an issue here. I strongly believe that a Welsh tick box should have been included in the census. It is unfortunate that the census form was designed just before devolution, to be brought into effect just after it. The issue of ethnic identity has now changed from one that was mostly related to ethnic origin—where your great, great-grandfather came from—to one of how you identify yourself now, post devolution. I am concerned that the quality of the census and returns in Wales will be corrupted, either by civil disobedience or by general reluctance to complete the census because of discontent about the absence of a Welsh tick box.

2:20 p.m.

There is a widespread feeling across the four parties on this. However, we have made every attempt to change the Government's

pleidlais rydd yn y Cynulliad ar pa un ai a ddyldid cael blwch ticio Cymraeg yn y cyfrifiad arfaethedig?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn ymwbybodol o unrhyw bleidlais arfaethedig ar y mater hwn.

Nick Bourne: A fyddech yn caniatáu pleidlais o'r fath? Onid ydych o'r farn bod peidio â chael blwch ar wahân i Gymru'n sarhad, gan fod blwch o'r fath yn bodoli ar gyfer Yr Alban ac Iwerddon? A allwn gael pleidlais o'r fath ac a fyddech yn caniatáu pleidlais rydd o fewn eich grŵp? Mae'n fater o ddweud 'ie' neu 'na'.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw'n fater o 'ie' neu 'na'; nid fi yw'r prif chwip. Y prif chwip sydd yn penderfynu ar y materion chwipio hyn—

Nick Bourne: Onid chi yw'r Arweinydd—

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ie, ond Karen Sinclair yw'r prif chwip. Ydych chi'n deall nawr Nick? Efallai nad oes gennych brif chwip yn eich grŵp chi. A allaf ddweud, o ran y deunydd, yn hytrach na'r pwyntiau gwirion yr ydych yn eu gwneud, bod mater pwysig dan sylw yma. Credaf yn gryf y dylai blwch ticio Cymraeg fod wedi'i gynnwys yn y cyfrifiad. Mae'n anffodus y cynlluniwyd y ffurflen cyfrifiad yn union cyn datganoli, ac y daeth i rym ychydig wedi hynny. Mae'r mater o hunaniaeth ethnig wedi newid o fod yn fater a oedd yn ymwneud yn bennaf â tharddiad ethnig—o ble daeth eich cyn, cyndaidd—i fod yn un sydd yn ymwneud â'ch hunaniaeth chi, yn dilyn datganoli. Pryderaf y bydd ansawdd y cyfrifiad a'r dychweliadau yng Nghymru yn cael ei ddifetha, naill ai oherwydd anufudd-dod sifil neu drwy amharodrwydd cyffredinol i gwblhau'r cyfrifiad oherwydd anfodlonrwydd ynghylch blwch ticio Cymraeg.

Ceir teimlad cryf ar draws y pedair plaid ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, gwnaethpwyd pob ymdrech i newid meddwl y Llywodraeth a'r

and the Office of National Statistics' mind. They state that it is too late to change the form and that it would involve £2.5 million to pulp and re-print the forms as well as make many other changes such as restructuring software for the machine reading of all the census forms. I am not in a position to provide that £2.5 million or to argue the toss with statisticians and people who prepared the census software and the machine reading systems. That is above my head. I also agree that the word 'other' is not a good idea. 'Own words' might have been better than 'other'. I have seen 'own words' being used on forms that are not in a tick box format. 'Own words' does not sound insulting in any way, but 'other' can be construed that way. As Helen Mary said last week, the problem now is that at the end of the day, it is unwise for us not to discourage civil disobedience because it will affect the grant that we receive in Wales if there is under-recording of the population, either in the whole of Wales or any area of Wales.

Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol. Nodwyd ei bod yn rhy hwyr newid y ffurflen ac y byddai'n costio £2.5 miliwn i wasgu'r ffurflenni'n fwydion a'u hail-argraffu yn ogystal â gwneud nifer o newidiadau eraill fel ailstrwythuro meddalwedd er mwyn i beiriant ddarllen holl ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad. Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i ddarparu'r £2.5 miliwn nac i ddadlau ar hyn gyda'r ystadegwyr a'r bobl sydd wedi paratoi meddalwedd y cyfrifiad a'r systemau peiriant darllen. Mae hyn y tu hwnt imi. Cytunaf hefyd nad yw'r gair 'arall' yn syniad da. Byddai 'geiriau eich hun' wedi bod yn well nag 'arall'. Rwyf wedi gweld 'geiriau eich hun' yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar ffurflenni nad ydynt ar fformat blwch ticio. Nid yw 'geiriau eich hun' yn swnio'n sarhaus mewn unrhyw ffordd, ond gellid dehongli 'arall' felly. Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary yr wythnos diwethaf, y broblem yn awr yw, ar ddiwedd y dydd, ei bod yn annoeth inni beidio â cheisio atal anufudd-dod oherwydd y bydd yn effeithio ar y grant a gawn yng Nghymru os tan-gofnodir y boblogaeth, naill ai yng Nghymru gyfan neu mewn unrhyw ran o Gymru.

Pwerau Deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad (Trafodaethau) Legislative Powers of the Assembly (Discussions)

Q5 Janet Davies: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the legislative powers of the Assembly? (OAQ7886)

C5 Janet Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch pwerau deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad? (OAQ7886)

The First Minister: I have frequent discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on a range of issues, not excluding occasional references to legislative powers for the Assembly, which, as she knows, are confined to secondary powers. In order to make the settlement work, we, through the Secretary of State for Wales, have input into the Cabinet consideration of what Bills to include in the Queen's Speech and we remain ever hopeful about its contents on 6 December. However, we will not know its contents until it is read out in the House of Lords in two weeks time.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Caf drafodaethau rheolaidd gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar amrywiaeth o faterion, gan gyfeirio'n achlysurol at bwerau deddfwriaethol ar gyfer y Cynulliad sydd, fel y gŵyr, wedi'u cyfyngu i bwerau eilaidd. Er mwyn gwneud i'r setliad weithio, yr ydym ni, drwy Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, wedi cyfrannu at ystyriaeth y Cabinet o ran pa Fesurau i'w cynnwys yn Araith y Frenhines a pharhawn i fod yn obeithiol ynglŷn â'i chynnwys ar 6 Rhagfyr. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn gwybod ei chynnwys nes caiff ei llefaru yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi ymhen pythefnos.

Janet Davies: Given that you recognise our

Janet Davies: O ystyried y cydnabyddwch

disabilities in operating within secondary legislation, does the Secretary of State show a recognition and understanding of the Beecher's Brook that the Assembly must jump to be effective or does he appear to be blissfully happy that they are kept in place?

The First Minister: You may be taking too much of a line from your party Leader's total misunderstanding of what Paul Murphy said when he spoke at a conference in Spain recently. He said that he expected the Assembly to acquire additional powers over time. Ieuan Wyn Jones got it the other way around. We are eager that every Bill that is relevant to Wales and to the Assembly gives the Assembly sufficient powers and resources to implement policies in a way that meets Wales's requirements. Janet referred to difficulties; there will be difficulties only if we cannot make the settlement work. We can make this work if Westminster listens to most, if not all, of our requests for primary legislation. It can do so by amending the Bills that are being considered, which are included in the Queen's Speech, to allow for however many Welsh clauses that are required. Or, we would like to think that it would include at least one piece of primary legislation for Wales in each Queen's Speech provided that the Assembly makes a strong enough bid, early enough. That is how we can make the settlement work.

Alun Cairns: In your discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales, have you made any progress in securing the benefits of operating aids to support Objective 1 and is the Chancellor now aware of those benefits, bearing in mind that he was not some weeks ago?

The First Minister: I was present when Alun asked Gordon Brown the question about operating aids in the Heronston Hotel in Bridgend. I would not have said that the Chancellor was unaware of the issue. There is a huge issue of dead weight when it comes

ein hanallu i weithredu o fewn deddfwriaeth eilaidd, a yw'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn cydnabod ac yn deall y naid fawr y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad ei chymryd er mwyn bod yn effeithiol neu a yw'n hollol fodlon eu bod yn cael eu cadw yn eu lle?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Efallai eich bod yn cymryd gormod o sylw o gamddealltwriaeth llwyr Arweinydd eich plaid o'r hyn a ddywedodd Paul Murphy pan lefarodd mewn cynhadledd yn Sbaen yn ddiweddar. Dywedodd ei fod yn disgwyl i'r Cynulliad dderbyn pwerau ychwanegol dros amser. Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi camddeall hyn yn llwyr. Yr ydym yn awyddus i bob Mesur sydd yn berthnasol i Gymru a'r Cynulliad roi'r pwerau a'r adnoddau digonol i'r Cynulliad gyflwyno polisiau mewn ffordd sydd yn bodloni gofynion Cymru. Cyfeiriodd Janet at anawsterau; dim ond os na allwn wneud i'r setliad weithio y bydd anawsterau. Gallwn wneud i hyn lwyddo os bydd San Steffan yn gwrandao ar y rhan fwyaf o'n gofynion, os nad pob un ohonynt, ar gyfer deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Gall wneud hynny drwy ddiwygio'r Mesurau a gaiff eu hystyried, a gaiff eu cynnwys yn Araith y Frenhines, er mwyn caniatáu ar gyfer cymaint o gymalau Cymreig â sydd eu hangen. Neu, hoffem feddwl y byddai'n cynnwys o leiaf un darn o ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol ar gyfer Cymru ym mhob Araith y Frenhines ar yr amod bod y Cynulliad yn gwneud cynnig digon cryf a digon cynnar. Dyna sut y gallwn sicrhau y bydd y setliad yn llwyddo.

Alun Cairns: Yn eich trafodaethau gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw gynnydd o ran sicrhau manteision cymhorthion gweithredu er mwyn cynnal Amcan 1 ac a yw'r Canghellor yn ymwybodol erbyn hyn o'r manteision hyn, gan gadw mewn cof nad oedd ychydig wythnosau'n ôl?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr oeddwn yn bresennol pan ofynnodd Alun y cwestiwn i Gordon Brown am gymhorthion gweithredu yng Ngwesty'r Heronston ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Ni fyddwn wedi dweud nad oedd y Canghellor yn ymwybodol o'r mater. Mae

to operating aids, because any operating aids that are applied across a region sometimes lead to the disadvantage of 90 per cent of the people who get them not doing anything with them. If you can find a precise way of targeting operating aids so that they contribute big advantages to the economy, then we are all for them and will continue to press the Chancellor to consider them. I do not think that that requires legislation.

mater pwysig o bwysau marw mewn perthynas â chymhorthion gweithredu, oherwydd gall unrhyw gymhorthion gweithredu a ddefnyddir ar draws rhanbarth arwain at anfantais pan na fydd 90 y cant o'r bobl sydd yn eu derbyn yn gwneud unrhyw ddefnydd ohonynt. Os gallwch ganfod ffordd benodol o dargedu cymhorthion gweithredu er mwyn iddynt gyfrannu manteision amlwg i'r economi, byddwn o'u plaid ac yn parhau i geisio darbwyllo'r Canghellor i'w hystyried. Nid wyf o'r farn bod angen deddfwriaeth ar gyfer hynny.

Dimensiwn Ewropeaidd Polisiâu'r Cynulliad **European Dimension of Assembly Policy**

C6 Dafydd Wigley: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ar ddimensiwn Ewropeaidd polisiâu'r Cynulliad? (OAQ7892)

Q6 Dafydd Wigley: Would the First Minister make a brief statement on the European dimension of Assembly policy? (OAQ7892)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae dimensiwn Ewropeaidd y Cynulliad o'r pwysigrwydd mwyaf. Mae gweithredoedd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd mewn meysydd megis amaethyddiaeth, yr amgylchedd a'r polisi datblygu rhanbarthol yn berthnasol i'n cyfrifoldebau yn y Cynulliad.

The First Minister: The Assembly's European dimension is of the greatest importance. The actions of the European Union in areas such as agriculture, the environment and the regional development policy are relevant to our responsibilities in the Assembly.

Gallaf roi engreiffitiau o'r manau lle'r ydym wedi camu ymlaen. Sefydlasom ein swyddfa ym Mrwsel yn yr haf gyda dau ddiplomat o Gymru am y tro cyntaf ers chwe chanrif. Arweiniodd Jane Davidson ddirprwyaeth y Deyrnas Unedig gerbron Cyngor Gweinidogion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd; y Gweinidog cyntaf o'r Cynulliad i arwain dirprwyaeth. Drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad, yr oedd yn dechrau gwneud hynny ar yr union foment yr oedd Elin Jones yn dweud wrth Carwyn Jones na ddylai fynd i Frwsel yn rhan o ddirprwyaeth y Deyrnas Unedig os oedd yn mynd i guddio o dan sgert Nick Brown, os wyf yn cofio'r ymadrodd a ddefnyddiodd Elin Jones. Yn ogystal, mae Carwyn Jones wedi bod ym Mrwsel yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf yn mynychu seminar ar ddyfodol y polisi defaid.

I can give examples of where progress has been made. We established our office in Brussels in the summer with two diplomats from Wales—our first in six centuries. Jane Davidson led the United Kingdom delegation before the Council of Ministers of the European Union; the first Minister from the Assembly to lead a delegation. By coincidence, she was undertaking that task at the very moment when Elin Jones was telling Carwyn Jones that he should not go to Brussels as part of the UK delegation if he was going to hide under Nick Brown's skirt, if I remember the phrase that Elin Jones used. In addition, Carwyn Jones has been in Brussels during the last few days attending a seminar on the future of the sheep policy.

Elin Jones: Pwynt o drefn.

Elin Jones: Point of order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cymeraf bwyntiau o

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will take

drefn ar ôl y datganiadau. Galwaf Dafydd Wigley i ofyn ei gwestiwn atodol.

points of order after the statements. I call Dafydd Wigley to ask his supplementary question.

Dafydd Wigley: Os yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn rhoi cymaint o bwyslais ar y dimensiwn Ewropeaidd, sut y mae'n egluro absenoldeb unrhyw drafodaeth ar faterion Ewropeaidd yn rhaglen waith ei Lywodraeth am y flwyddyn nesaf, a gyhoeddwyd heddiw? A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddweud wrthym beth a ddigwyddodd i'r papur a gyhoeddwyd yn dilyn cyfarfod Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd y Cynulliad ym mis Mehefin, lle cafodd pob plaid gyfle i gyflwyno eu sylwadau? Beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r papur hwnnw, pryd y mae'r Pwyllgor yn cyfarfod nesaf a phryd yr ydym am gael symud ymlaen â'r agenda holl bwysig, yn ei eiriau ef, yn ymwneud â'r berthynas rhwng y Cynulliad hwn a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd?

Dafydd Wigley: If the First Minister attaches so much importance to the European dimension, how does he explain the absence of any discussion on European issues in his Government's work programme for the next year, which was published today. Will the First Minister tell us what happened to the paper published after the Assembly's Committee on European Affairs met in June, where all parties had an opportunity to present their views? What has happened to that paper, when will the Committee next meet and when will we be able to move forward with the vital agenda, in his words, relating to the relationship between this Assembly and the European Union?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Faint o enghreifftiau y mae arnoch eu heisiau, Dafydd? Cyfeiriais at dair enghraifft yn fy ateb. Byddaf yn Barcelona ddydd Gwener yn mynychu cynhadledd llywyddion rhanbarthau â phwerau deddfwriaethol, a gadeirir gan Señor Jordi Pujol. Yn ogystal, bydd cyfarfod o'r Fforwm Ewropeaidd yn fuan. Felly, nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw eich problem, Dafydd. Fodd bynnag, mae croeso ichi ysgrifennu ataf os ydych yn meddwl bod bwlch yn ein polisi Ewropeaidd.

The First Minister: How many examples do you need, Dafydd? I referred to three examples in my answer. I will be in Barcelona on Friday attending a conference of presidents of regions with legislative power, chaired by Señor Jordi Pujol. In addition, there will soon be a meeting of the European Forum. Therefore, I am not sure what your problem is, Dafydd. However, you are welcome to write to me if you think that there is a gap in our European policy.

Christine Chapman: Given the proposed enlargement of the European Union, is the Assembly developing a strategy for Wales, and how will that affect Wales? In addition, how will Wales move forward when the Objective 1 period is over?

Christine Chapman: O ystyried ehangiad arfaethedig yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, a yw'r Cynulliad yn datblygu strategaeth ar gyfer Cymru, a sut bydd hynny'n effeithio ar Gymru? Yn ogystal, sut bydd Cymru'n symud yn ei blaen ar ôl i gyfnod Amcan 1 ddod i ben?

The First Minister: Enlargement is one of the subjects of the Barcelona conference. Enlargement and globalisation are the two big themes that are currently being considered by many of the other European regions and smaller nations that are not nation states. Regarding enlargement, the huge impact on us of the switch-over to eastern European countries that are expected

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ehangiad yw un o bynciau cynhadledd Barcelona. Ehangiad a materion byd-eang yw dau o'r themâu pwysig sydd yn cael eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd gan nifer o ranbarthau a gwledydd llai Ewropeaidd nad ydynt yn aelod-wladwriaethau. O ran ehangu, bydd y gwledydd yn nwyrain Ewrop y disgwylir iddynt ddod yn aelodau o'r Gymuned

to become members of the European Community in the next four years is having a major and negative impact on manufacturing employment in Wales at the moment, particularly the pressures on analogue television production at Hitachi in Christine's constituency and Panasonic in Cardiff. There is a real problem there and we need to get a handle on the enlargement process to ensure that we gain some of the benefits from it rather than losing the more labour-intensive low to medium technology assembly-line capabilities, which are being moved to eastern Europe.

Ewropeaidd yn ystod y pedair blynedd nesaf yn cael effaith enfawr arnom, o ran yr effaith amlwg a negyddol ar gyflogaeth ym maes gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, yn arbennig y pwysau ar y maes cynhyrchu teledu analog Hitachi yn etholaeth Christine a Panasonic yng Nghaerdydd. Mae problem wirioneddol yno ac mae angen inni gael rhywfaint o reolaeth dros y broses ehangu er mwyn inni allu sicrhau rhai manteision o ganlyniad i hyn yn hytrach na cholli'r gallu llinell-gyfosod technoleg llafur-dwys isel i ganolog, sydd yn cael eu symud i ddwyrain Ewrop.

2:30 p.m.

Trafodaethau gyda Gweinidogion yr Adran Nawdd Cymdeithasol Discussions with Ministers in the Department of Social Security

Q7 Ann Jones: What discussions has the First Minister had with Ministers in the Department of Social Security about the take up of the minimum income guarantee for pensioners, free television licences for the over 75s and winter fuel payments in Wales? (OAQ7883)

C7 Ann Jones: Pa drafodaethau a gafodd Prif Weinidog Cymru gyda Gweinidogion yn yr Adran Nawdd Cymdeithasol ynglŷn â nifer y bobl sydd wedi manteisio ar y gwarant isafswm incwm i bensiywyr, trwyddedau teledu am ddim i bobl dros 70 oed a thaliadau tanwydd gaeaf yng Nghymru? (QAQ7883)

The First Minister: Social security issues are not devolved to the Assembly and remain the responsibility of the Secretary of State for Social Security in the Westminster Government. Jane Hutt is a member of the inter ministerial group on older people. Edwina Hart and Jane Hutt met Jeff Rooker, the Minister of State for Social Security this morning. They discussed a wide range of issues affecting the lives of older and poorer people in Wales including the issue Ann has just raised; the take up of the minimum guarantee, the free television licence, the winter fuel payments and other changes in the benefits system. The winter fuel payment cheques have just gone out. As they are not taxed or means-tested, there is no problem with take-up.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw materion nawdd cymdeithasol wedi'u datganoli i'r Cynulliad a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Nawdd Cymdeithasol yn Llywodraeth San Steffan sydd yn parhau i fod yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Mae Jane Hutt yn aelod o'r grŵp rhyng-weinidogol ar bobl hŷn. Cyfarfu Edwina Hart a Jane Hutt â Jeff Rooker, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Nawdd Cymdeithasol y bore yma. Trafodwyd amrywiaeth eang o faterion sydd yn effeithio ar fywydau pobl hŷn a phobl dlotach yng Nghymru, yn cynnwys y materion a godwyd gan Ann yn awr; nifer y bobl sydd yn manteisio ar yr isafswm gwarant, y drwydded deledu am ddim, y taliadau tanwydd gaeaf a newidiadau eraill i'r system budd-daliadau. Mae'r sieciau taliadau tanwydd gaeaf newydd gael eu dosbarthu. Gan na chânt eu trethu, ac nad ydynt yn destun prawf moddion, nid oes problem o ran nifer y bobl sydd yn manteisio arnynt.

Ann Jones: Would Rhodri agree that pensioner poverty is still a problem,

Ann Jones: A fyddai Rhodri'n cytuno bod tlodi ymhlith pensiywyr yn parhau i fod yn

particularly in my area? Despite the welcome announcements last week by the Labour Government's Chancellor, Gordon Brown, of a £5 increase in the state pension and an increase in the winter fuel payment, much work remains to be done to tell pensioners in our areas what the Labour Government has secured for them during its time in office.

The First Minister: That is probably true. There are three categories of benefit payment. First, there are benefits such as the winter fuel payment, which has just been paid out. Everyone receives that as a cheque in the post and it is not taxed. Secondly, there are benefits that are not means-tested but are taxed. Thirdly, there are means-tested benefits, such as the minimum income guarantee. As Ieuan Wyn Jones mentioned last week, there is a stigma problem with those benefits that undoubtedly affects take-up. One major problem in solving pensioner poverty is how we persuade more people—either by advertising or by having more benefits workers—to forget about the stigma and to regard the benefit as a right, not as being equivalent to begging on the parish.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Er ein bod yn derbyn ac yn croesawu'r cynnydd mewn pensiynau a gyhoeddodd y Canghellor yn ei ddatganiad diweddar, a yw Rhodri'n derbyn y gallai rhai pensiynwyr golli'r hawl i lwfans megis lwfans rhent neu dreth gyngor a budd-daliadau eraill o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd hwnnw? A all ddwyn pwysau ar y Llywodraeth yn Llundain i godi'r trothwy ar gyfer hawlio'r budd-daliadau hyn fel bo pensiynwyr yn derbyn y cynnydd yn llawn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr ym mha le y byddai Ieuan yn ystyried gosod y trothwy, os yw am godi'r un presennol. Efallai ei fod yn cynnig cael gwared arno'n gyfan gwbl. Gall ysgrifennu ataf os oes problem o ran dosbarth o bensiynwyr sydd ar

broblem, yn arbennig yn fy ardal i? Er gwaethaf y cyhoeddiadau a groesawyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan Ganghellor y Llywodraeth Lafur, Gordon Brown, sef cynnydd o £5 ym mhensiwn y wladwriaeth a chynnydd yn y taliad tanwydd gaeaf, mae llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd er mwyn dweud wrth bensiynwyr yn ein hardaloedd am yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi'i sicrhau iddynt yn ystod ei chyfnod mewn grym.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n debyg fod hynny'n wir. Mae tri chategori o daliad budd-dâl. Yn gyntaf, ceir budd-daliadau fel y taliad tanwydd gaeaf, sydd newydd gael ei dalu. Mae pawb yn derbyn hwnnw fel siec drwy'r post ac ni chaiff ei drethu. Yn ail, ceir budd-daliadau nad ydynt yn destun prawf moddion, ond a gaiff eu trethu. Yn drydydd, ceir budd-daliadau sydd yn destun prawf moddion, fel y gwarant isafswm incwm. Fel y crybwyllodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yr wythnos diwethaf, mae problem stigma gyda'r budd-daliadau hyn sydd heb os yn effeithio ar nifer y bobl sydd yn manteisio arnynt. Un broblem amlwg wrth geisio datrys y broblem o dlodi ymhlith pensiynwyr yw sut y byddwn yn darbwylo mwy o bobl—naill ai drwy hysbysebu neu drwy gael mwy o weithwyr budd-daliadau—i anwybyddu'r stigma ac ystyried y budd-dâl fel hawl, nid fel cardota ar y plwyf.

Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Although we accept and welcome the increase in pensions announced by the Chancellor in his recent statement, does Rhodri accept that some pensioners could lose the right to allowances such as the rent or council tax allowance and other benefits as a result of that increase? Can he bring pressure to bear on the Government in London to raise the threshold for claiming these benefits so that pensioners receive the increase in full?

The First Minister: I am not sure where Ieuan would consider placing the threshold, if he wants to raise the current one. Perhaps he is proposing to get rid of it completely. He may write to me if there is a problem with one category of pensioners who are losing

eu colled am reswm arbennig. Bydd Ieuan wedi darllen datganiad y Papur Gwyn ar gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf a gyhoeddodd Gordon Brown yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin tua pythefnos yn ôl. Siaradai am sefydlu system erbyn 2003 i gynorthwyo dosbarth o bensiynwyr sydd yn eithaf helaeth yng Nghymru, sef y rhai sydd yn derbyn pensiwn galwedigaethol bach—gan y cyngor, y bwrdd dŵr neu'r bwrdd glo, er enghraifft. Ni all y pensiynwyr fyw arno, ond golyga eu bod yn colli budd-daliadau a roddir ar sail prawf moddion. Mae problem gyda'r dosbarth hwnnw, sydd yn helaeth yng Nghymru yn anffodus. Mae Gordon Brown yn bwriadu cael gwared ar y broblem honno erbyn y sefydlir y system newydd yn 2003.

out for a particular reason. Ieuan will have read the White Paper statement on next year's budget announced by Gordon Brown in the House of Commons about a fortnight ago. He spoke of establishing a system by 2003 to assist a category of pensioners of which there are many in Wales, namely those who receive a small occupational pension—from the council, the water board or the coal board, for example. The pensioners cannot live on it, but it means that they lose out on means-tested benefits. There is a problem with that category, which forms a large group in Wales unfortunately. Gordon Brown intends to get rid of that problem by the time the new system is in place in 2003.

Cyfarfod â Chynrychiolwyr Llywodraeth Ffrainc Meeting with Representatives of the French Government

Q8 Peter Rogers: What meetings has the First Minister had with representatives of the French Government to discuss how to best develop effective working relationships? (OAQ7895)

The First Minister: I have had a number of meetings with representatives of the French Government, both in my role as Secretary for Economic Development and, more recently, as First Minister. I met senior civil servants in June 1999 in Paris. I met the French Ambassador to the UK in April when he was in Aberystwyth for the excellent occasion of the unveiling of the Pennal Letter. I met the regional prefects in Lyon and Grenoble when I visited Rhône-Alpes in May. All these meetings have contributed to a better understanding by them about Wales and the new Assembly and to improved working relationships.

Peter Rogers: Given the Government's admission that Welsh consumers could be eating French beef that is older than 30 months of age, will Rhodri tell the French minister that French beef is to be banned from Wales under section 16 of the Food Safety Act 1990 and in accordance with article 30 of the Treaty of Rome?

The First Minister: Carwyn Jones is

C8 Peter Rogers: Pa gyfarfodydd a gafodd Prif Weinidog Cymru â chynrychiolwyr Llywodraeth Ffrainc i drafod y ffordd orau i ddatblygu perthnasau gweithio effeithiol? (QAQ7895)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf wedi cael sawl cyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr Llywodraeth Ffrainc, yn fy swyddogaeth fel Ysgrifennydd dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ac, yn fwy diweddar, fel Prif Weinidog Cymru. Cyfarfûm ag uwch weision sifil ym Mehefin 1999 ym Mharis. Cyfarfûm â Llysgennad Ffrainc yn y DU yn Ebrill pan oedd yn Aberystwyth ar gyfer yr achlysur gwych o ddadorchuddio Llythyr Pennal. Cyfarfûm â llywodraethwyr rhanbarthol yn Lyon a Grenoble pan ymwelais ag ardal y Rhôn a'r Alpau ym Mai. Cyfrannodd yr holl gyfarfodydd hyn at well dealltwriaeth ar eu rhan hwy o Gymru a'r Cynulliad newydd ac at berthnasau gwaith gwell.

Peter Rogers: O ystyried cyfaddefiaeth y Llywodraeth y gallai defnyddwyr yng Nghymru fod yn bwyta cig eidion o Ffrainc sydd yn hŷn na 30 mis, a wnaiff Rhodri ddweud wrth weinidog Ffrainc y dylid gwahardd cig eidion o Ffrainc o Gymru o dan adran 16 Deddf Diogelwch Bwyd 1990 ac yn unol ag erthygl 30 o Gytundeb Rhufain?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Awgrymodd

indicating strongly to me that this matter must be dealt with by the European Commission's Health and Consumer Protection Commissioner, Commissioner Byrne. We do not have the right to ban French beef unilaterally. However, I am sure that Nick Brown, Carwyn Jones and respective officials of the Assembly's Agriculture Department and the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food in London will draw this question forcibly to the attention of the European and French authorities.

Richard Edwards: Do you agree that the best way of ensuring effective working relations with the French Government is to ensure that no xenophobic Conservatives are involved?

The First Minister: I am trying to remember when I last met a non-xenophobic Conservative. There is an inclination in the Conservative Party to assert a unilateral monopoly over the Union Jack and patriotism, be it Welsh or UK-wide. That is regrettable and does not always result in getting the best bargain in negotiations with other countries. It involves wonderful political grandstanding but it does not always secure concessions from other countries.

The Presiding Officer: I have noted an indication for a point of order on this matter, which I will consider.

David Lloyd: Ar yr un trywydd, ond o gyfeiriad gwahanol efallai, a gytuna Prif Weinidog Cymru â'r angen i gydweithio ar safonau iechyd cyhoeddus o ganlyniad i'n profiad diweddaraf ym meysydd amaethyddiaeth ac iechyd? Dylem gydweithio â'n partneriaid yn Ffrainc.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Daw'r ddau faes hyn ynghyd pan ystyrir diogelwch bwyd. Daw'r ddau faes o dan gwmpas yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd newydd, sydd yn annibynnol er ei fod yn gorff cyhoeddus. Mae'r Senedd yn derbyn cyngor ganddo'n uniongyrchol, yn hytrach na chan weision sifil, sydd yn gyfrifol i'r Gweinidog. Dylem ystyried y

Carwyn Jones yn gryf imi y dylai Comisiynydd Iechyd a Diogelwch Defnyddwyr y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, Comisiynydd Byrne, ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Nid oes gennym hawl i wahardd cig eidion Ffrainc yn unochrog. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Nick Brown, Carwyn Jones a swyddogion o Adaran Amaethyddiaeth y Cynulliad, a swyddogion o'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn Llundain yn cyflwyno'r cwestiwn hwn yn rymus i'r awdurdodau Ewropeaidd a Ffrengig.

Richard Edwards: A gytunwch mai'r ffordd orau o sicrhau perthnasau gwaith effeithiol gyda Llywodraeth Ffrainc yw sicrhau nad oes unrhyw Geidwadwyr senoffobig yn gysylltiedig â hyn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ceisiaf gofio'r tro diwethaf imi gwrdd â Cheidwadwr nad oedd yn senoffobig. Mae tuedd yn y Blaid Geidwadol i sicrhau monopoli unochrog dros Jac yr Undeb a gwladgarwch, boed hynny yng Nghymru neu drwy'r DU gyfan. Mae hynny'n anffodus ac nid yw bob amser yn sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau mewn negodiadau â gwledydd eraill. Mae'n golygu trafodaethau gwleidyddol mawr ond nid yw bob amser yn sicrhau consesiynau gan wledydd eraill.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi nodi arwydd o bwynt o drefn ar y mater hwn, y byddaf yn ei ystyried.

David Lloyd: Along the same lines, but from a different angle perhaps, does the First Minister agree with the need to co-operate on public health standards as a result of our most recent experience in the areas of agriculture and health? We should co-operate with our partners in France.

The First Minister: These two areas converge when food safety is considered. Both fields come under the compass of the new Food Standards Agency, which is independent even though it is a public body. The Houses of Parliament receive advice directly from it, rather than from civil servants, who are responsible to the Minister.

mater hwn, ond ni allwn wneud penderfyniad unochrog arno.

We should consider this issue, but we cannot make a unilateral decision on it.

Rôl a Gweithredu Partneriaeth â Busnes Role and Implementation of Partnership with Business

Q9 Phil Williams: Would the First Minister make a brief statement on the role of the Partnership with Business and how it is being implemented? (OAQ7894)

C9 Phil Williams: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ynghylch rôl y Bartneriaeth â Busnes a sut y mae'n cael ei weithredu? (OAQ7894)

The First Minister: The National Assembly's partnership with business is fluid and flexible. It is primarily implemented through the development of good working relationships between Ministers, Assembly Members, officials and the business community. The Business Partnership Council will consider proposals for its further development at its next meeting, which will be held on 1 December.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae partneriaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol â busnes yn un rwydd a hyblyg. Fe'i gweithredir yn bennaf drwy ddatblygu perthynas waith dda rhwng Gweinidogion, Aelodau'r Cynulliad, swyddogion a'r gymuned fusnes. Bydd y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes yn ystyried cynigion i'w datblygu ymhellach yn ei gyfarfod nesaf, a gynhelir ar 1 Rhagfyr.

Phil Williams: The date for the next meeting of the Business Partnership Council was provisionally set and I scrupulously kept it clear. That date was replaced by two alternative dates which, at great embarrassment, I also scrupulously kept clear. On the date that was finally chosen, four members of the Business Partnership Council were already committed to another Assembly Committee. Does this not send a message to the business community that the Business Partnership Council is not regarded as being of any high importance?

Phil Williams: Pennwyd dyddiad yn amodol ar gyfer cyfarfod nesaf y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes a bûm yn ofalus iawn wrth ei gadw'n glir. Pennwyd dau ddyddiad arall yn lle'r dyddiad hwnnw, a bûm unwaith eto yn ofalus iawn i'w cadw'n glir, er cryn embaras imi. Ar y dyddiad a ddewiswyd yn derfynol, yr oedd pedwar aelod o'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes eisoes wedi ymrwymo i Bwyllgor Cynulliad arall. Onid yw hyn yn rhoi'r neges i'r gymuned fusnes nad ystyrir bod y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes o unrhyw bwys mawr?

The First Minister: I do not know the background to that question. I am only aware of the fact that the next meeting of the Business Partnership Council will be held on 1 December.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni wn am y cefndir i'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Yr wyf ond yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith y cynhelir cyfarfod nesaf y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes ar 1 Rhagfyr.

Phil Williams: It clashes with—

Phil Williams: Mae'n gwrthdaro â—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have had one supplementary question.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael un cwestiwn atodol.

Phil Williams: I did not get an answer.

Phil Williams: Ni chefais ateb.

The Presiding Officer: Order. It is not a matter for me whether Ministers answer questions. I only give them the opportunity to answer them.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'n fater imi a yw Gweinidogion yn ateb cwestiynau. Dim ond rhoi'r cyfle iddynt eu hateb yr wyf i.

Alun Cairns: I raised this issue with the First Minister last week. He said that he was completely unaware of the rearranging of the schedules. Is he in control as First Minister?

Alun Cairns: Codais y mater hwn â'r Prif Weinidog yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedodd nad oedd yn ymwybodol o gwbl o'r ffaith bod y trefniadau wedi eu newid. A yw mewn rheolaeth fel Prif Weinidog?

The First Minister: The attempt to organise a meeting of the Business Partnership Council seems to be the basis of that absurd, over-the-top, alleged supplementary question. It is a matter for me to be in control of my diary. However, as Phil said, and as you would say, many other people's diaries are also involved here. I do not control other people's diaries. I certainly do not write your diary, Alun. I write my own diary and attempt to organise all meetings possible. Your commitments, Phil's commitments and those of other people are difficult to compress into everybody's crowded diaries. I do not run your diaries for you. You may think that I do, Alun, but I do not.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ymddengys mai'r ymgais i drefnu cyfarfod o'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes yw sail y cwestiwn atodol honedig, hurt, dros ben llestri hwnnw. Mae'n fater imi reoli fy nyddiadur. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Phil, ac fel y dywedech chithau, mae dyddiaduron llawer o bobl eraill dan sylw yma hefyd. Ni reolaf ddyddiaduron pobl eraill. Yn sicr nid wyf yn llunio'ch dyddiadur chi, Alun. Lluniau fy nyddiadur fy hun gan geisio trefnu pob cyfarfod posibl. Mae'n anodd cywasgu'ch ymrwymadau chi, ymrwymadau Phil a rhai pobl eraill i ddyddiaduron llawn pawb. Nid wyf yn trefnu'ch dyddiaduron ar eich rhan. Efallai eich bod yn meddwl fy mod, Alun, ond nid wyf yn gwneud hynny.

Phil Williams: Yes, you do.

Phil Williams: Ydych, yr ydych yn gwneud hynny.

Y Llywydd: Dyna ddiwedd y sesiwn gwestiynau am heddiw.

The Presiding Officer: That is the end of today's question session.

Dafydd Wigley: Saved by the bell.

Dafydd Wigley: Mae hynny wedi achub eich croen.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dyna ddiwedd y sesiwn gwestiynau. Symudwn ymlaen i ddatganiad gan Brif Weinidog Cymru, sydd yn agored i gwestiynau.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is the end of the question session. We will move on to a statement by the First Minister, who is open to questions.

2.40 p.m.

Datganiad ar Raglen Fusnes Flynyddol y Llywodraeth Statement on the Annual Government Business Programme

The First Minister: With your permission, Presiding Officer, I have tabled a programme of proposals that the partnership Government intends to place before the National Assembly between now and the end of July 2001. The programme for government was made available yesterday. We are providing information to the Assembly and the country in a way that has not been done before. The

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gyda'ch caniatâd, Lywydd, yr wyf wedi cyflwyno rhaglen o gynigion y bwriada'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth eu gosod gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol rhwng hyn a diwedd Gorffennaf 2001. Cyhoeddwyd y rhaglen ar gyfer llywodraeth ddoe. Yr ydym yn rhoi gwybodaeth i'r Cynulliad a'r wlad mewn ffordd nas gwnaethpwyd o'r blaen. Y nod yw

aim is to enhance the profile of Plenary proceedings, and to encourage scrutiny and debate of the Government's intentions. A month or more ago, we formed a Government with the committed support of the Labour group and the Liberal Democrat group. We did so because we recognised the Assembly's responsibility to deliver for all the people of Wales. This partnership Government is based on the aim of enhancing social justice. That aim is part of the long tradition of both political groups.

The partnership Government was formed to create a stable government. However, this will be stability for a radical purpose. We mean to deliver a levelling up in health, education, skills and social development by targeting the less well-off and the more socially excluded areas in Wales. The need for innovative and effective government is great. The next decade will mark a further acceleration in the changing circumstances for Wales. The aim is to relate what we do in health, education, the environment and economic development to each other. We will transform Wales, its economy and society, so that we become leaders in the knowledge economy, in health gain and in educational achievements. In responding to this need, the opportunities for Wales are substantial.

The recent comprehensive spending review, delivered by the Labour Chancellor of the Exchequer for the whole of the United Kingdom, provides us with the opportunity of real and sustained growth in public expenditure for the first time in a generation. The proposed budget, which is being considered by this Assembly, is evidence of that opportunity. The opportunities for economic regeneration through European Union Objective 1 funding are there for the taking if the Assembly takes the lead, and all others fulfil their responsibilities. The opportunity of devolved self-government, offered by this Assembly, needs to be valued by the people of Wales. It will be valued when we prove our ability to deliver. It is because we have a responsibility to respond to these needs and take advantage of these

gwella proffil trafodion y Cyfarfod Llawn ac annog archwilio a thrafod ynghylch bwriadau'r Llywodraeth. Rhyw fis neu fwy yn ôl, ffurfiasom Lywodraeth gyda chefnogaeth ymrwymedig y grŵp Llafur a grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Gwnaethom hynny am ein bod yn cydnabod cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad i ddarparu ar gyfer holl bobl Cymru. Seilir y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon ar y nod o wella cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Mae'r nod hwnnw'n rhan o draddodiad hir y ddau grŵp gwleidyddol.

Ffurfiwyd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth er mwyn creu llywodraeth sefydlog. Fodd bynnag, sefydlogrwydd at ddiben radicalaidd fydd hyn. Bwriadwn sicrhau'r un safon o iechyd, addysg, sgiliau a datblygiad cymdeithasol i bawb drwy dargedu'r ardaloedd tlotach a'r rhai mwyaf allgaeedig yn gymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae'r angen am lywodraethu dyfeisgar ac effeithiol yn un dybryd. Yn y degawd nesaf bydd newidiadau yn amgylchiadau cyfnewidiol Cymru yn cyflymu eto. Y nod yw cydgyssylltu'r hyn a wnawn ym meysydd iechyd, addysg, yr amgylchedd a datblygu economaidd. Byddwn yn trawsnewid Cymru, ei heconomi a'i chymdeithas er mwyn inni arwain y blaen o ran yr economi wybodaeth, gwella iechyd a chyflawniadau addysgol. Wrth ymateb i'r angen hwn, mae gan Gymru gyfleoedd sylweddol.

Mae'r adolygiad o wariant cynhwysfawr diweddar, a gyflwynwyd gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys Llafur ar gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan, yn rhoi'r cyfle inni gael cynnydd gwirioneddol a chynaliadwy mewn gwariant cyhoeddus am y tro cyntaf ers cenedlaeth. Mae'r gyllideb arfaethedig, a ystyrir gan y Cynulliad hwn ar hyn o bryd, yn dyst i'r cyfle hwnnw. Gellir manteisio ar y cyfleoedd ar gyfer adfywio economaidd drwy arian Amcan 1 yr Undeb Ewropeaidd os bydd y Cynulliad yn cymryd yr awenau, ac os bydd yr holl bobl eraill yn cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau. Mae angen i bobl Cymru werthfawrogi'r cyfle ar gyfer hunanlywodraeth ddatganoledig a gynigir gan y Cynulliad hwn. Fe'i gwerthfawrogir pan brofw'n ein gallu i gyflawni. Oherwydd bod cyfrifoldeb arnom i ymateb i'r

opportunities that we formed the partnership Government. Our partnership agreement sets out our many shared policies and objectives. The business programme now tabled by the partnership Government shows this Government's urgent intentions. Within six weeks of our creation, we have tabled a programme of over 70 proposals, which we commit to bringing before you in the next eight months.

The three-year partnership agreement and the annual business programme are milestones in our Assembly's maturation. They represent the partnership Government's radical response to the challenges facing Wales. Until now, without a majority government, the Assembly has been prey to the politics of pettiness, trapped between an administration unable to bring forward a programme with the confidence that it could be achieved, and an opposition becoming addicted to the frivolous and the destructive. This programme represents a coming of age for this Assembly. It is a programme of purpose and direction, proposed by a partnership Government confident of its ability to deliver the specific actions and broad directions that Wales needs. A commitment to social justice is at the heart of our programme. The highest priority of this programme must be to address the poverty and the inequalities in health, lifestyle and life chances that are endemic in Wales.

Twenty years ago, a government alien to Wales, but with unfettered power over it, began a programme of action that unashamedly celebrated inequality. The theory was that if wealth, power and opportunity were sufficiently concentrated among the few, the benefits of their opulence would trickle down to all those communities that had been deliberately and wantonly dispossessed. Wales is a living repudiation of the trickle-down theory. At the heart of our programme for action is a commitment to target our efforts at empowering the poorest people and communities. We do that in the knowledge that when the poorest are equipped to maximise their contribution to life in Wales, we will all be the richer. We

anghenion hyn a manteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn y ffurfiasom y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Mae ein cytundeb partneriaeth yn nodi ein polisiau a'n hamcanion cytûn niferus. Mae'r rhaglen fusnes a gyflwynwyd yn awr gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn dangos bwriadau brys y Llywodraeth hon. O fewn chwe wythnos i'n creu, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno rhaglen o dros 70 o gynigion, yr ydym yn ymrwymo i'w cyflwyno ger eich bron yn ystod yr wyth mis nesaf.

Mae ein cytundeb partneriaeth tair blynedd a'r rhaglen fusnes flynyddol yn gerrig milltir yn aeddfediad ein Cynulliad. Cynrychiolant ymateb radicalaidd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i'r sialensau a wyneba Cymru. Hyd yn hyn, heb lywodraeth fwyafrifol, bu'r Cynulliad yn agored i wleidyddia dibwys, wedi ei ddal rhwng gweinyddiaeth na allai gyflwyno rhaglen gan fod yn hyderus y gellid ei chyflawni, a gwrthblaid a oedd yn dod yn gaeth i weithredu gwamal a niweidiol. Mae'r rhaglen hon yn adlewyrchu'r Cynulliad hwn yn dod i oed. Mae'n rhaglen a chanddi bwrpas a chyfeiriad, a gynigir gan Lywodraeth bartneriaeth sydd yn hyderus y gall gyflwyno'r camau penodol a'r cyfeiriadau eang sydd eu hangen ar Gymru. Mae ymrwymiad i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol wrth wraidd ein rhaglen. Rhaid mai blaenoriaeth uchaf y rhaglen hon yw mynd i'r afael â'r tloidi a'r anghydraddoldebau o ran iechyd, ffordd o fyw a chyfleoedd mewn bywyd sydd mor lliaws yng Nghymru.

Ugain mlynedd yn ôl dechreuwyd rhaglen weithredu a ddathlai anghydraddoldeb yn ddigywilydd gan lywodraeth a oedd yn hollol anghydnaws â Chymru, ond a oedd â phŵer dilyffethair drosti. Y theori oedd pe bai cyfoeth, pŵer a chyfle yn cael eu crynhoi ddigon ymhlith yr ychydig, byddai buddiannau eu cyfoeth yn rhaeadru i bob un o'r cymunedau hynny a gafodd eu difreinio'n fwriadol a direswm. Mae Cymru'n enghraifft sydd yn gwrthbrofi damcaniaeth rhaeadru. Wrth wraidd ein rhaglen weithredu mae ymrwymiad i dargedu ein hymdrechion tuag at ymrymuso'r bobl a'r cymunedau tlotaf. Gwnawn hynny gan wybod y byddwn oll yn gyfoethocach pan fydd modd i'r tlotaf wneud y cyfraniad gorau posibl i fywyd Cymru.

will bring forward proposals entitled Communities First, which will be our lead proposals for achieving the empowerment of the most disadvantaged communities in Wales.

The main themes in all our proposals for education, health, economic and rural development, housing and transport, are to increase and equalise opportunity, releasing the energies of the poorest and making all communities in Wales sustainable. In tackling the material poverty that scars Wales, it is also the Assembly's destiny to remedy the poverty of ambition that has for so long limited the development of Wales. This first annual programme is a step on the road to putting confidence and ambition into the heart of Wales. Our proposals for education aim to extend ever further the advantages of learning in all its diverse forms to all people in Wales, regardless of age or class. We recognise the primary importance of a foundation of quality education for everyone and of developing the basis upon which learning and continuous development can become an experience that all people in Wales have throughout their lives.

We recognise a substantial deficit in the knowledge and skills that we now bring to the workplace. That deficit must be removed quickly if we are to compete successfully in the diverse, high-value economic activities that are our way into global markets.

We will bring into being the new National Council for Education and Training for Wales, which will bring to fruition the work that Tom Middlehurst and many others undertook over a substantial period. That initiative has been made in Wales and then emulated by other parts of the United Kingdom. Its effect will be that the various forms of post-16 learning in schools, colleges and in the work place will be co-ordinated into well-planned, well-funded learning opportunities for all. It is a significant initiative.

Progress in education requires that a

Byddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion o'r enw Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, sef ein cynigion arweiniol er mwyn sicrhau bod y cymunedau sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf yng Nghymru yn cael awdurdod.

Y prif themâu ym mhob un o'n cynigion ar gyfer addysg, iechyd, datblygu economaidd a gwledig, tai a thrafnidiaeth yw rhoi mwy o gyfle a'r un cyfle i bawb, gan ryddhau'r egni ymhlith y tlotaf a sicrhau bod pob cymuned yng Nghymru yn gynaliadwy. Wrth fynd i'r afael â'r tlodi materol sydd yn creithio Cymru, tynged y Cynulliad hefyd fydd unioni'r diffyg uchelgais sydd wedi cyfyngu ar ddatblygiad Cymru cyhyd. Mae'r rhaglen flynyddol gyntaf hon yn gam ar y ffordd i roi hyder ac uchelgais yng nghraidd Cymru. Nod ein cynigion ar gyfer addysg yw ymestyn y manteision o ddysgu ar bob ffurf amrywiol i holl bobl Cymru ymhellach fyth, waeth beth fo'u hoedran neu'u dosbarth. Cydnabyddwn bwysigrwydd sylfaenol sylfaen addysg o safon i bawb a datblygu'r sail fel y gall holl bobl Cymru brofi dysgu a datblygu parhaol drwy gydol eu bywydau.

Cydnabyddwn fod diffyg sylweddol o ran yr wybodaeth a'r sgiliau yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno i'r gweithle ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid dileu'r diffyg hwnnw yn gyflym os ydym am lwyddo i gystadlu yn y gweithgareddau economaidd gwerth uchel, amrywiol a fydd yn rhoi inni fynediad i farchnadoedd byd-eang.

Byddwn yn sefydlu'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant newydd, a fydd yn cwblhau'r gwaith yr ymgymrodd Tom Middlehurst a llawer o bobl eraill ag ef dros gyfnod helaeth. Cyflwynwyd y fenter honno yng Nghymru ac yna fe'i hefelychwyd mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. O ran effaith bydd yn cydlynu'r mathau gwahanol o ddysgu ôl-16 mewn ysgolion, colegau ac yn y gweithle i greu cyfleoedd dysgu a gynllunnir ac a ariennir yn dda i bawb. Mae'n fenter arwyddocaol.

Mae cynnydd mewn addysg yn gofyn bod

foundation of high-quality, early years education be in place. We will bring forward proposals for extending nursery education and supporting smaller primary schools. Our objective will be the best early years education possible, achieved through diverse means and tailored to local circumstances.

We will review the curriculum in secondary schools, building on Curriculum 2000 and testing the advantage of a broad and diverse baccalaureate-type approach to post-16 learning. The review will focus on the demands of young people and the needs of the Welsh economy in future decades. We will report progress on our strategy for higher education and our proposals for extending access through reducing financial disincentives to participation in higher education by those from less well-off families. We will bring forward the results of the independent investigation into student hardship and funding in Wales, and make proposals that will encourage wider and more equal participation in higher and further education.

We will bring forward proposals to support and develop the teaching profession in Wales, recognising that our many objectives in education require innovative, enthusiastic, well-trained and well-rewarded teachers.

Our proposals for health and social care aim to address health inequalities and begin to make Wales a healthier place in which to grow up and grow old. We will continue to make progress on the important objective of achieving an efficient, well-resourced health service that responds quickly and effectively to patients' needs. However, we must also answer the questions about why we have such high levels, and such geographical concentrations, of ill-health in Wales. In large part the answer to our health problems will lie in my initial theme of making Wales a country where access to wealth and power is far more equally shared.

syllfaen addysg blynyddoedd cynnar o safon uchel yn ei lle. Byddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer ymestyn addysg feithrin a chynorthwyo ysgolion cynradd llai. Ein hamcan fydd darparu'r addysg blynyddoedd cynnar orau bosibl, wedi ei chyflawni drwy wahanol ddulliau ac wedi ei theilwra i amgylchiadau lleol.

Byddwn yn adolygu'r cwricwlwm mewn ysgolion uwchradd, gan adeiladu ar Gwricwlwm 2000 a phrofi pa mor fanteisiol fyddai ymagwedd eang ac amrywiol wedi ei seilio ar fagloriaeth tuag at ddysgu ôl-16. Bydd yr adolygiad yn canolbwyntio ar ofynion pobl ifanc ac anghenion economi Cymru yn y degawdau nesaf. Byddwn yn Byddwn yn adrodd ar y cynnydd a wneir ar ein strategaeth addysg uwch a'n cynigion i ymestyn mynediad drwy leihau'r ffactorau ariannol sydd yn atal y rheini o deuluoedd llai cyfoethog rhag cyfranogi mewn addysg uwch. Byddwn yn cyflwyno canlyniadau'r ymchwiliad annibynnol i ariannu a chaledi ymhlith myfyrwyr yng Nghymru, a gwneud cynigion a fydd yn annog cyfranogiad ehangach a mwy cyfartal mewn addysg uwch ac addysg bellach.

Byddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion i gynorthwyo a datblygu'r proffesiwn addysgu yng Nghymru, gan gydnabod bod ein hamcanion niferus o ran addysg yn gofyn am athrawon dyfeisgar, brwdfrydig wedi eu hyfforddi a'u gwobrwyo'n dda.

Nod ein cynigion ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yw mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd a dechrau gwneud Cymru yn lle iachach i dyfu a heneiddio ynddo. Byddwn yn parhau i wneud cynnydd ar yr amcan pwysig o gyflawni gwasanaeth iechyd effeithlon ag adnoddau da sydd yn ymateb yn gyflym ac effeithiol i anghenion cleifion. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd ateb y cwestiynau ynghylch pam bod gennym lefelau mor uchel, a'r fath ddwyseddau daearyddol, o salwch yng Nghymru. I raddau helaeth bydd yr ateb i'n problemau iechyd yn gysylltiedig â'm thema gyntaf sef sicrhau bod Cymru yn wlad lle y caiff mynediad i gyfoeth a phŵer ei rannu'n fwy cyfartal o lawer.

We will bring forward the NHS Wales strategy and consult on proposals for the re-allocation of resources within the health service in order to respond better to health inequalities. We will legislate for local health groups to co-ordinate better local health and social care. As a first step to a general review of how to ensure greater equality of access to health services, we will bring forward proposals to freeze prescription charges in Wales in 2001.

We are committed to creating a modern economy that can, through skills and enterprise, develop and market its own high quality products, developing a Wales with an increasingly high stake in the knowledge economy. When our economic foundations in knowledge, quality, innovation, research and design capabilities are in place, we will be far less prey to the vagaries of exchange rates and competition based solely on labour costs.

We will publish a new national economic development strategy that will provide clear direction for the Welsh economy and ensure that we can combine the advantages of indigenous development with the contribution of inward investment. We will take forward the review of business support services, ensuring that those firms that have the potential to grow have well-co-ordinated and accessible support systems. We will report on our progress in realising the potential of the European structural fund programmes. The priority given to the Objective 1 areas will be reinforced by the higher levels of regional selective assistance available in full development areas, and 65 per cent of the population of Wales is in the full development area

We will bring forward proposals to ensure that the rural communities of Wales can take full advantage of the modernisation and diversification of the Welsh economy. We will assist in developing the branding and marketing of Welsh food, taking steps to identify that brand with quality and food safety. Our proposed budget has provided greater support for diversification in hill

Byddwn yn cyflwyno strategaeth NHS Cymru ac yn ymgynghori ar gynigion i ailddyrranu adnoddau o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd er mwyn ymateb i anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn well. Byddwn yn deddfu i grwpiau iechyd lleol gydlynw gwell iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol lleol. Fel cam cyntaf tuag at adolygiad cyffredinol o sut i sicrhau mynediad mwy cyfartal i wasanaethau iechyd, byddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion i rewi taliadau presgripsiwn yng Nghymru yn 2001.

Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i greu economi fodern a all, drwy sgiliau a mentergarwch, ddatblygu a marchnata ei chynnyrch o safon uchel ei hun, gan ddatblygu Cymru yn wlad sydd â budd cynyddol uchel yn yr economi wybodaeth. Pan fydd ein sylfeini economaidd o ran medrau gwybodaeth, ansawdd, dyfeisgarwch, ymchwil a chynllunio yn eu lle, byddwn yn llawer llai agored i amrywiadau'r cyfraddau cyfnewid a chystadleuaeth yn seiliedig ar gostau llafur yn unig.

Byddwn yn cyhoeddi strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol newydd a fydd yn rhoi cyfeiriad eglur i economi Cymru ac yn sicrhau y gallwn gyfuno manteision datblygu cynhenid â chyfraniad mewnfuddsoddi. Byddwn yn cyflawni'r adolygiad o wasanaethau cymorth busnes, gan sicrhau bod systemau cymorth cydlynus a hygyrch gan y cwmnïau hynny sydd â'r potensial i dyfu. Rhown adroddiad ar ein cynnydd o ran gwireddu potensial y rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Caiff y flaenoriaeth a roddir i ardaloedd Amcan 1 ei hatgyfnerthu drwy sicrhau bod lefelau uwch o gymorth dethol rhanbarthol ar gael mewn ardaloedd datblygu llawn, ac mae 65 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru yn yr ardal datblygu llawn.

Byddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion i sicrhau y gall cymunedau gwledig Cymru fanteisio'n llawn ar y broses o foderneiddio ac arallgyfeirio economi Cymru. Byddwn yn cynorthwyo wrth ddatblygu brandio a marchnata bwyd Cymru, gan gymryd camau i uniaethu'r brand hwnnw ag ansawdd a diogelwch bwyd. Mae ein cyllideb arfaethedig wedi rhoi rhagor o gymorth ar

farming, Tir Gofal, organic production and an enhanced business support service. Lloyd George observed that there is no greater eloquence than action, and our intended actions in support of rural Wales have been made clear for all to see.

The economic and social success of Wales requires that we bring forward proposals that maintain and enhance the quality of our environment. We will propose a new spatial planning framework. That will relate to our vision of a modern economy and an integrated approach to our transport needs. Our proposed legislation for travel concessions will ensure that people with disabilities and older people will have greater opportunities to travel.

We will introduce legislation on housing specifically aimed at protecting the most disadvantaged in our communities. The national housing strategy will propose the means for enhancing housing opportunities for all, in owner-occupation, the private rented sector or in social and council housing.

We shall bring forward legislation aimed at extending the application of the Welsh Language Act 1993, which will increase the number of public organisations required to adopt Welsh language schemes.

2:50 p.m

We will bring forward proposals for improving the process of government and democracy in Wales. There will be legislation on the modernisation of political leadership and accountability in local government, building on the many innovations in place in Welsh councils. We will report on the progress of our review of the Assembly's quangos. We will review the work of our officials in the Government of Wales, seeking to ensure that their capacity to contribute to distinctive policy development in Wales is enhanced, while remaining part of the British home civil service.

gyfer arallgyfeirio mewn ffermio mynydd, Tir Gofal, cynhyrchu organig a gwell gwasanaeth cymorth busnes. Dywedodd Lloyd George nad oedd dim mwy huawdl na gweithred, ac yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod ein camau arfaethedig i gynorthwyo cefn gwlad Cymru yn eglur i bawb.

Mae llwyddiant economaidd a chymdeithasol Cymru yn gofyn ein bod yn cyflwyno cynigion a fydd yn cynnal a gwella ansawdd ein hamgylchedd. Cynigiwn fframwaith cynllunio gofodol newydd. Bydd hwnnw'n gysylltiedig â'n gweledigaeth o economi fodern ac ymagwedd integredig tuag at ein hanghenion trafndiaeth. Bydd ein deddfwriaeth arfaethedig ar gyfer consesiynau i deithwyr yn sicrhau y bydd pobl ag anableddau a phobl hŷn yn cael mwy o gyfleoedd i deithio.

Byddwn yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth yn ymwneud â thai wedi ei hanelu'n benodol at ddiogelu'r bobl sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf yn ein cymunedau. Bydd y strategaeth dai genedlaethol yn cynnig modd o wella cyfleoedd tai i bawb, boed yn ddeiliaid-feddianwyr, yn y sector rhentu preifat neu mewn tai cymdeithasol a thai cyngor.

Byddwn yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth gyda'r nod o ymestyn cwmpas Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, a fydd yn cynyddu nifer y sefydliadau cyhoeddus y bydd yn ofynnol iddynt fabwysiadu cynlluniau iaith Gymraeg.

Byddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion i wella'r broses lywodraethol a democrataidd yng Nghymru. Bydd deddfwriaeth ar gyfer moderneiddio arweinyddiaeth ac atebolrwydd gwleidyddol mewn llywodraeth leol, gan adeiladu ar y mentrau niferus sydd yn eu lle yng nghynghorau Cymru. Rhown adroddiad ar y cynnydd a wnawn wrth adolygu cwangos y Cynulliad. Byddwn yn adolygu gwaith ein swyddogion yn Llywodraeth Cymru, gan geisio sicrhau bod gwell cyfle ganddynt i gyfrannu tuag at ddatblygu polisiau unigryw yng Nghymru, tra'n aros yn rhan o wasanaeth sifil cartref Prydain.

We will proceed with the review of the Assembly's own procedures. I am determined that the Plenary sessions of this Assembly become the key forum for the democratic expression of all interests in Wales—the place where Government explains and justifies its purpose and is rigorously held to account for its delivery. I fear that, in the last year, the circumstance of a minority administration constrained the operation of the Assembly Plenary. There was an incentive to be timid, to propose only that which could not be contested. Hence, the perception of paint drying.

This programme shows the intention and ability of this partnership Government to be bold. We will invite public debate, wide contribution to and scrutiny of important policies as they are being developed. This is a programme that will deliver and capture the imagination of the people of Wales. There are those who profess that this Assembly is in some way ill-fitted for the purpose of meeting the needs of Wales. Such scepticism may either be based on some variant of English imperialism or Welsh nationalism. This partnership Government is steering a course for the Welsh ship of state which is based on enhancing democratic government and delivering Welsh responses, made in Wales, for the needs of Wales.

The programme put before the Assembly by its partnership Government is a testament to our determination and our capacity to deliver. This is a partnership Government with a programme and a radical purpose. I commend this programme to the National Assembly for Wales.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Given that you put your failure to govern effectively for the last 18 months down to the lack of a majority, now that you have that majority, were we not entitled to expect a programme containing a comprehensive package of measures and big ideas for Wales? Is it not surprising that, of the 70 measures announced, over 40 are commitments either to report on progress—

Awn ati i adolygu gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad ei hun. Yr wyf yn benderfynol o sicrhau bod Cyfarfodydd Llawn y Cynulliad hwn yn dod yn fforwm allweddol i fynegi'r holl fuddiannau yng Nghymru mewn modd democrataidd—lle y mae'r Llywodraeth yn egluro a chyfiawnhau ei phwrpas a lle y caiff ei dal i gyfrif ynglŷn â'r modd y mae'n cyflawni. Ofnaf, yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, i amgylchiadau'r weinyddiaeth leiafrifol gyfyngu ar weithrediad Cyfarfodydd Llawn y Cynulliad. Bu mantais o fod yn betrusgar, a dim ond cynnig yr hyn na ellid ei wrthwynebu. Felly cafwyd yr argraff o baent yn sychu.

Dengys y rhaglen hon fwriad a gallu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon i fod yn feiddgar. Byddwn yn gwahodd dadl gyhoeddus ynghylch polisiau pwysig, cyfraniad eang iddynt ac archwiliad manwl ohonynt wrth iddynt gael eu datblygu. Mae hon yn rhaglen a fydd yn cyflwyno ac yn cydio yn nychymyg pobl Cymru. Mae rhai'n honni bod y Cynulliad hwn yn anaddas at ddiben bodloni anghenion Cymru ryw ffordd neu'i gilydd. Mae drwgdybiaeth o'r fath naill ai'n seiliedig ar ryw amrywiolyn o imperialaeth Seisnig neu genedlaetholdeb Cymreig. Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon yn llywio hynt llong gwladwriaeth Cymru sydd yn seiliedig ar wella llywodraeth ddemocrataidd a chyflwyno ymatebion Cymreig, a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru, i anghenion Cymru.

Mae'r rhaglen a osodwyd gerbron y Cynulliad gan ei Lywodraeth bartneriaeth yn dyst i'n penderfyniad a'n gallu i gyflawni. Mae hon yn Llywodraeth bartneriaeth ag iddi raglen a phwrpas radicalaidd. Cymeradwyaf y rhaglen hon i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: O ystyried eich honiad ichi fethu â llywodraethu'n effeithiol yn ystod y 18 mis diwethaf oherwydd diffyg mwyafrif, gan fod mwyafrif gennyh bellach, onid oeddem yn haeddu disgwyl rhaglen sydd yn cynnwys pecyn cynhwysfawr o fesurau a syniadau mawr i Gymru? Nid yw'n syndod bod dros 40 o'r 70 o fesurau a gyhoeddwyd yn ymrwymadau i gyflwyno

whatever that means—to hold debates, or to follow-up plans already in the pipeline? Will you assure us that we will have a full debate on this statement so that we can examine it in detail and put forward alternative proposals?

Is it not true that, of the programme's few legislative proposals, the majority are concerned with implementing the Westminster programme in Wales on the one hand, and matters on which the Assembly has already agreed on the other? We welcome and support the initiatives on prescription charges, eye tests and free school milk. However, do you expect us to accept that this is a programme for government in Wales? What has happened to your plans to pilot a Welsh baccalaureate? Why has it been removed from your agenda? Is it not the case that this programme bears the hallmark of a Government that has simply drifted into power as a result of the Lib-Lab deal? Does not this Government have anything to offer Wales other than more of the same programme of the past 18 months of debate? What part of the programme will tackle real issues in Wales, such as inequalities in the health and education services? Is this not a major disappointment and a missed opportunity for the Government of Wales? Does it not show that the Government's real handicap is not the lack of a majority, but the lack of vision?

The First Minister: I am not sure whether that was ritual oppositionism or a variant on Welsh nationalism, to be followed in five minutes' time by a variant of English imperialism. When Ieuan says that there is no reference to the Welsh baccalaureate, he cannot have been listening—

Jocelyn Davies: He did not say that.

The First Minister: How often do you have to hear the word baccalaureate before you clock that it was included in what I have just read out? I am sorry if you did not want to pay attention to that before you got up to speak. There is no withdrawing from the

adroddiad ar gynnydd—beth bynnag yw ystyr hynny—cynnal dadleuon, neu weithredu ar gynlluniau sydd eisoes ar y gweill? A wnewch chi ein sicrhau y cawn ddadlawn ar y datganiad hwn fel y gallwn ei archwilio'n fanwl a chyflwyno cynigion amgen?

Onid yw'n wir bod y rhan fwyaf o'r ychydig gynigion deddfwriaethol yn y rhaglen yn ymwneud â gweithredu rhaglen San Steffan yng Nghymru ar yr un llaw, a materion y mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi cytuno arnynt ar y llaw arall? Croesawn a chefnogwn y mentrau sydd yn ymwneud â thaliadau presgripsiynau, profion llygaid a llaeth am ddim mewn ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn disgwyl inni dderbyn bod hon yn rhaglen ar gyfer llywodraethu yng Nghymru? Beth a ddigwyddodd i'ch cynlluniau i gynnal cynllun peilot o'r fagloriaeth Gymreig? Pam y'i dilewyd o'ch agenda? Onid yw'n wir bod y rhaglen hon yn nodweddu Llywodraeth a ymlwybrodd i rym o ganlyniad i'r cytundeb rhwng Llafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? Onid oes gan y Llywodraeth hon unrhyw beth i'w gynnig i Gymru heblaw yr un hen raglen o ddadleuon y 18 mis diwethaf? Pa ran o'r rhaglen a aiff i'r afael â materion gwirioneddol yng Nghymru, megis anghydraddoldebau yn y gwasanaethau iechyd ac addysg? Onid yw hyn yn siom fawr a chyfle wedi ei gollu i Lywodraeth Cymru? Onid yw'n dangos mai diffyg gweledigaeth yn hytrach na diffyg mwyafrif yw gwir anallu'r Llywodraeth?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni wn ai gwrthwynebiad defodol neu amrywiolyn o genedlaetholdeb Cymreig oedd hynny, i'w ddilyn ymhen pum munud gan amrywiolyn o imperialaeth Seisnig. Pan ddywed Ieuan nad oes cyfeiriad at y fagloriaeth Gymreig, mae'n rhaid nad oedd yn gwrando—

Jocelyn Davies: Ni ddywedodd hynny.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Pa mor aml y mae'n rhaid ichi glywed y gair bagloriaeth cyn ichi sylweddoli fy mod wedi ei gynnwys yn yr hyn yr wyf newydd ei ddarllen ichi? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os nad oeddech am dalu sylw i hynny cyn ichi godi i siarad. Ni thynnir yr

commitment to pilot that scheme. That is as plain as a pikestaff on the end of your nose. What more can I do? You say that many of the 70 points that have been made are aspirational or are references to debates that we will have. This is a work programme for the Assembly and an attempt to predict the work that the Assembly will undertake through legislation and executive actions that are sufficiently important to justify bringing them to Plenary, or aspirational matters that require debate so that we can steer a course with the approval of as many Assembly Members as possible. That is the normal practice of parliamentary assemblies in any country in the world. You include missions, visions and aspirations for debate and then you have the issue of executive actions, which require approval, and then you have legislation. There is a mixture of all three here.

To start doing 40 out of 70 is to mistake quantity for quality. The issue is how well wrapped up together must they be to begin the transformation of a poor society such as Wales, which is 20 per cent behind in terms of gross domestic product per capita. Do we commence the restoration of Welsh education across the board to reachieve what was once regarded as the best education system in the UK and regain the admiration of families in Wales? What will we do to prevent the tail of people without educational qualifications? How appropriate are those educational qualifications to the knowledge economy? How quickly can we get into the knowledge economy and where does that leave the health gain strategy in terms of health promotion? Are those themes relevant and are they wrapped up together? Can we get more bang for the buck by dovetailing those issues together to produce a healthier, wealthier and smarter Wales? That is our vision and I challenge you to follow it or to produce something better, rather than continuing with the narrow nit-picking nationalism that you have displayed once again, Ieuan.

Nick Bourne: Rarely have I heard such a partisan diatribe as the one that we have had from the First Minister today. It has been

ymrwymiad i gynnal peilot o'r cynllun hwnnw yn ôl. Mae hynny mor glir â hoel ar bost. Beth arall y gallaf ei wneud? Dywedwch fod llawer o'r 70 pwynt a wnaethpwyd yn ddyheadau neu'n cyfeirio at ddadleuon y byddwn yn eu cynnal. Mae hon yn rhaglen waith i'r Cynulliad ac yn ymgais i ragweld pa waith y bydd y Cynulliad yn ymgymryd ag ef drwy ddeddfwriaeth a champau gweithredol sydd yn ddigon pwysig i gyfiawnhau eu cyflwyno gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn, neu'n ddyheadau y mae angen eu trafod fel y gallwn lywio hynt gyda chymeradwyaeth cymaint o Aelodau'r Cynulliad â phosibl. Hwn yw'r arfer cyffredin mewn seneddau ledled y byd. Yr ydych yn cynnwys cenadwri, gweledigaethau a dyheadau i'w trafod ac yna bydd gennych gamau gweithredol, sydd angen eu cymeradwyo, ac wedyn ddeddfwriaeth. Ceir cymysgedd o bob un o'r tri yma.

Byddai dechrau gwneud 40 o'r 70 yn drysu rhwng maint ac ansawdd. Y mater yw pa mor gydlynus y mae'n rhaid iddynt fod er mwyn dechrau trawsnewid cymdeithas dlawd fel Cymru, y mae ei chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen 20 y cant yn is na'r cyffredin. A ydych yn dechrau drwy adfer addysg ledled Cymru er mwyn adennill yr hyn a fu ar un adeg yn system addysg orau y DU yn nhyb rhai ac adennill edmygedd teuluoedd yng Nghrymu? Beth a wnawn i atal y rhes o bobl sydd heb gymwysterau addysgol? Pa mor addas yw'r cymwysterau addysgol hynny o safbwynt yr economi wybodaeth? Pa mor gyflym y gallwn fynd i mewn i'r economi wybodaeth a beth fydd sefyllfa'r strategaeth gwella iechyd o ran hybu iechyd? A yw'r themâu hynny yn berthnasol ac a ydynt yn gydlynus? A allwn gael mwy o werth am arian drwy gydlynu'r materion hynny i sicrhau Cymru iachach, gyfoethocach a galluocach? Dyna'n gweledigaeth ac fe'ch heriaf i ddilyn hynny neu lunio rhywbeth gwell, yn hytrach na pharhau â'r cenedlaetholdeb cul sydd yn hollti blew yr ydych wedi ei ddangos unwaith eto, Ieuan.

Nick Bourne: Prin fy mod wedi clywed ymosodiad mor bleidiol â'r hyn a glywsom gan y Prif Weinidog heddiw. Bu'n hynod

deeply disappointing. He stated that he thought that he would hear something from English colonialism, but I am afraid I am going to disappoint him. The only part of the speech that made any sense at all was the quotation from Lloyd George that 'the finest eloquence is that which gets things done'. I agree with that. I disagree with much of the remainder. Lloyd George must be spinning in his grave, seeing the sell-out six part of your sorry administration.

Mick Bates: Would your action be different?

Nick Bourne: When we take over, you will see our action. We will return to this point, but it was disappointing that we first heard this Queen's Speech, mission statement, or whatever you chose to call it, on the *Waterfront* programme this weekend. It had not been discussed in Business Committee last week—it was only discussed this morning—but it was trailed by the Labour administration over the weekend. That is no way to treat this National Assembly and I hope that you will condemn that when you have an opportunity to deal with some of the salient points that we have not heard so far.

I turn to some of the specific areas. On education, the Welsh baccalaureate is mentioned, but you failed to mention that the pilot scheme will start in September 2003. That, by anybody's calculation, is after the next National Assembly elections.

Mick Bates: That should not worry you; you will not be here.

Nick Bourne: Are you anticipating still being in alliance with this sorry bunch thereafter or do you want to ditch them in advance of that? On tuition fees, do you condemn with us, as the Liberal Democrats probably do privately, the tuition fees that deter people from poorer backgrounds from studying? All the evidence is that they deter them and also people from ethnic minorities. You claimed that this was all about dealing with poverty, so perhaps you will deal with that.

siomedig. Dywedodd ei fod yn meddwl y byddai'n clywed rhywbeth gan wladychiaeth Seisnig, ond mae arnaf ofn y byddaf yn ei siomi. Yr unig ran o'r araith a oedd yn synhwyrol o gwbl oedd y dyfyniad gan Lloyd George sef 'the finest eloquence is that which gets things done'. Cytunaf â hynny. Ni chytunaf â'r rhan fwyaf o'r gweddill. Rhaid bod Lloyd George yn troi yn ei fedd, o weld chwe rhan fradychus eich gweinyddiaeth druenus.

Mick Bates: A fydddech yn gweithredu'n wahanol?

Nick Bourne: Pan fyddwn mewn grym, cewch weld sut y gweithredwn. Dychwelwn at y pwynt hwn, ond yr oedd yn siomedig inni glywed yr Araith Frenhines hon, datganiad cenadwri neu beth bynnag yr hoffech ei alw yn gyntaf ar raglen *Waterfront* y penwythnos hwn. Nis trafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes yr wythnos diwethaf—dim ond y bore yma y'i trafodwyd—ond cafodd gyhoeddusrwydd gan y weinyddiaeth Lafur dros y Sul. Nid dyna'r ffordd i drin y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn condemnio hynny pan gewch gyfle i ymdrin â rhai o'r pwyntiau perthnasol nad ydym wedi eu clywed hyd yn hyn.

Trof at rai o'r meysydd penodol. O ran addysg, soniwyd am y fagloriaeth Gymreig, ond ni chrybwyllasoch y bydd y cynllun peilot yn dechrau ym Medi 2003. Bydd hynny, ar unrhyw gyfrif, yn digwydd ar ôl etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Mick Bates: Ni ddylai hynny eich poeni; ni fyddwch yma.

Nick Bourne: A ragwelwch y byddwch mewn cynghrair o hyd gyda'r criw truenus hwn ar ôl hynny neu a ydych am gael gwared â hwy cyn hynny? Ar ffioedd hyfforddiant, a ydych, fel ninnau, yn condemnio, fel y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei wneud yn breifat fwy na thebyg, y ffioedd hyfforddiant sydd yn atal pobl o gefndir tlawd rhag astudio? Dengys yr holl dystiolaeth eu bod yn eu hatal hwy a phobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig hefyd. Yr oeddech yn honni bod hyn yn ymwneud â mynd i'r afael â thlodi, felly

efallai y byddwch yn ymdrin â hynny.

3:00 p.m.

I hope that all the people who are on the growing waiting lists listened to your comments on poverty. Those lists grow monthly. Do you stand by the target set by the Minister for Health and Social Services to reduce waiting lists by 15,000 by the spring? That would still be a sorry total, given the Government's commitment to reducing waiting lists as a first act after coming into government. This Government programme is long on words, but short on the action that matters to people in Wales. They are not as concerned about the Welsh baccalaureate as they are about the waiting list position.

The First Minister: Why are you raising it?

Nick Bourne: I am raising the waiting list position because it is important. I make no apology for that. On economic development—

The Presiding Officer: Order. We cannot have private discussions in this Chamber. The First Minister must wait for the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives to ask the question. Then, he will, or may, answer.

Nick Bourne: The latter, I suspect—he may answer.

On economic development, what about the sorry chaos of Objective 1? This is now roundly seen throughout Wales as a disaster. That could have made a difference to poverty throughout Wales, particularly in the Valleys and in west Wales, but people of all political backgrounds or no political background say that it is not working. What about the rural poor? There was little mention of agriculture and rural affairs in the statement. What about a commitment to clear labelling now, rather than sometime in the future? What about something on import restrictions so that we have concern for consumer safety in Wales? Peter Rogers raised that point eloquently

Gobeithiaf fod pawb sydd ar y rhestrau aros cynyddol wedi gwranddo ar eich sylwadau ynglŷn â thlodi. Mae'r rhestrau hynny'n cynyddu bob mis. A ydych yn cefnogi'r targed a bennwyd gan y Gweinidog dros lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i leihau'r rhestrau aros 15,000 erbyn y gwanwyn? Byddai hynny'n swm truenus, o ystyried ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i leihau'r rhestrau aros fel y weithred gyntaf ar ôl cael ei hethol. Mae rhaglen y Llywodraeth yn llawn geiriau ond yn brin o'r gweithredu sydd yn bwysig i bobl yng Nghymru. Nid ydynt yn poeni cymaint am y fagloriaeth Gymreig ag a wnânt am sefyllfa'r rhestrau aros.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Pam yr ydych yn ei godi?

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn codi sefyllfa'r rhestrau aros am ei bod yn bwysig. Nid ymddiheuraf am hynny. Ar ddatblygu economaidd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni allwn gael trafodaethau preifat yn y Siambr hon. Rhaid i'r Prif Weinidog aros i Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru ofyn y cwestiwn. Yna bydd, neu efallai y bydd, yn ateb.

Nick Bourne: Y dewis olaf, fe gredaf—efallai y bydd yn ateb.

Ar ddatblygu economaidd, beth am sefyllfa druenus Amcan 1? Cred bron pawb ledled Cymru bellach ei fod yn draed moch. Gallai hynny fod wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth i dlodi ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn y Cymoedd ac yng ngorllewin Cymru, ond dywed pobl o bob cefndir gwleidyddol neu ddim cefndir gwleidyddol o gwbl nad yw'n gweithio. Beth am y tlodion yng nghefn gwlad? Nid oedd fawr o sôn am amaethyddiaeth a materion gwledig yn y datganiad. Beth am ymrwymiad i labelu eglur yn awr, yn hytrach na rhywbryd yn y dyfodol? Beth am rywbeth i gyfyngu ar fewnforion er mwyn dangos ein bod yn pryderu ynglŷn â diogelwch

earlier, only to be dismissed as xenophobic. Are you concerned about that and, if so, what are we going to do to ensure that Wales's high hygiene standards are applied throughout the United Kingdom? What about making representations on post offices, the right to roam, fuel costs and country pursuits to Westminster? Those are the issues that matter to the rural poor.

On the environment, what about a commitment, given the flood situation, that funding for flood defences will not drop, but increase, annually? That budget has decreased. What about an undertaking not to build on the flood plains, pending a review, so that we do not face the situation that we faced during the past year.

On an integrated transport policy, the only action that we have seen is the unedifying sight of the Deputy First Minister in a hot air balloon and a helicopter. Could we have something a little more constructive on transport policy for the people who do not have those happy alternatives, and who use the car or public transport?

There is little to commend in this statement. We recognise that there has been a commitment to the arts and culture. We are happy to have trailed the need for a Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language, and we were glad that it has been recognised at last. Will you say something about a national art gallery for Wales and about the tourism potential of putting money into the arts?

In conclusion, we have had 'Betterwales.com', we have had partnership agreements à gogo, we have this and we had David Lloyd George's statement, with which I agree. Is it not time that he got down to some action after nine months, rather than just presenting words?

The First Minister: Lloyd George was very much in favour of action and put forward the

defnyddwyr yng Nghymru? Cododd Peter Rogers y pwynt hwnnw yn huawdl yn gynharach, ond fe'i gwawdiwyd fel un senophobic. A ydych yn pryderu ynghylch hynny ac, os felly, beth a wnawn i sicrhau bod safonau hylendid uchel Cymru yn cael eu cymhwyso ledled y Deyrnas Unedig? Beth am gynnig sylwadau ar swyddfeidd post, yr hawl i grwydro, costau tanwydd a gweithgareddau cefn gwlad i San Steffan? Dyna'r materion sydd o bwys i'r tlodion yng nghefn wlad.

O ran yr amgylchedd, beth am ymrwymiad, o ystyried y llifogydd, na fydd yr arian ar gyfer amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yn gostwng, ond y bydd yn cynyddu'n flynyddol? Mae'r gyllideb honno wedi gostwng. Beth am ymrwymiad i beidio ag adeiladu ar orlifdiroedd, cyn cynnal adolygiad, fel nad ydym yn wynebu'r sefyllfa a gawsom yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

O ran polisi trafndiaeth integredig, yr unig weithred a welsom yw'r olygfa gywilyddus o weld y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog mewn balwn aer poeth a hofrennydd. A allwn gael rhywbeth ychydig mwy adeiladol ynglŷn â pholisi trafndiaeth i'r bobl nad oes ganddynt y dewisiadau ffodus hynny, ac sydd yn defnyddio car neu drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus?

Nid oes llawer i'w gymeradwyo yn y datganiad hwn. Cydnabyddwn y cafwyd ymrwymiad i'r celfyddydau a diwylliant. Yr oeddem yn hapus i nodi'r ffaith bod angen Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg, ac yr oeddem yn falch bod hynny wedi ei gydnabod o'r diwedd. A ddywedwch rywbeth ynglŷn ag oriel gelf genedlaethol i Gymru a'r posibiladau o ran twristiaeth o roi arian i'r celfyddydau?

I gloi, cawsom 'Gwellcymru.com', cawsom gytundebau partneriaeth lu, cawsom hwn a chawsom ddatganiad David Lloyd George, yr wyf yn cytuno ag ef. Onid yw'n bryd iddo fynd ati a gweithredu ar ôl naw mis, yn hytrach na chwarae â geiriau?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn sicr yr oedd Lloyd George o blaid gweithredu a

people's budget in 1910. It was Winston Churchill who left the Liberal Party for the Conservatives. I think that Nick may have got confused between the two.

Nick Bourne is right that various newspapers indicated the intention to bring forward a work programme for the Assembly for a 12-month period, in principle, although this starts later and is a seven-month programme. However, the issue that we promoted in advance is that we wanted to give shape and structure to how the Assembly works, as a consequence of having a majority-based government. I do not think that anybody has accused us so far of revealing improperly any of the contents of this statement, but people have simply wondered what is its purpose and intent. The intent is clear: it is to give us shape and structure and a format for a work programme that is then available for scrutiny by opposition parties like Nick's and by the public and those who take an interest in politics in Wales.

On the Welsh baccalaureate, I am glad that Nick helped to correct Ieuan Wyn Jones's belief that it is absent from this statement. The issue about the Welsh baccalaureate being introduced in September 2003 arises from its original promoters. They said that it would take two to three years to build up the curriculum to sufficient industrial quality strength that you could offer it to schools, saying that it is no way likely to dilute the chances of a child who undertakes it getting into university, compared with the international baccalaureate or A-levels. They gave that statement, not us. If the people who invented the concept believe that it would take two to three years before you could introduce it officially in schools, then it is rich of Nick Bourne to moan about us taking the same view.

He mentioned this question of hardship and tuition fees: of course we are having an investigation into the way that access to higher and further education may be restricted by things like tuition fees, or by all

chyflwynodd gyllideb y bobl yn 1910. Winston Churchill a adawodd y Blaid Ryddfrydol er mwyn y Ceidwadwyr. Credaf fod Nick wedi cymysgu'r ddau.

Mae Nick Bourne yn gywir wrth ddweud bod gwahanol bapurau newydd wedi nodi'r bwriad i gyflwyno rhaglen waith ar gyfer y Cynulliad am gyfnod o 12 mis, mewn egwyddor, er bod hon yn dechrau'n ddiweddarach ac mai rhaglen saith mis ydyw. Fodd bynnag, y mater a hybwyd ymlaen llaw gennym oedd ein bod am sicrhau ffurf a strwythur i'r ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad yn gweithio, o ganlyniad i sicrhau llywodraeth fwyafrifol. Ni chredaf bod unrhyw un wedi ein cyhuddo hyd yn hyn o ddatgelu unrhyw ran o gynnwys y datganiad hwn yn amhriodol, ond bu pobl yn dyfalu ynglŷn â'i ddiben a'i fwriad. Mae'r bwriad yn eglur: sicrhau ffurf a strwythur inni a fformat ar gyfer rhaglen waith a fydd ar gael wedyn i gael ei harchwilio'n fanwl gan y gwrthbleidiau fel plaid Nick a chan y cyhoedd a'r rhai sydd yn ymddiddori yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru.

O ran y fagloriaeth Gymreig, yr wyf yn falch bod Nick wedi helpu i gywiro'r camsyniad a wnaeth Ieuan Wyn Jones drwy ddweud nad oedd yn y datganiad hwn. Mae'r ffaith bod y fagloriaeth Gymreig yn cael ei chyflwyno ym Medi 2003 yn deillio o'i hyrwyddwyr gwreiddiol. Dywedasant y byddai'n cymryd dwy neu dair blynedd i ddatblygu'r cwricwlwm yn ddigon cryf cyn ei gynnig i'r ysgolion, gan ddweud na fydd ar unrhyw gyfrif yn atal cyfle plentyn sydd yn ymgymryd â hi rhag mynd i'r brifysgol, o gymharu â'r fagloriaeth ryngwladol neu Safon Uwch. Hwy a wnaeth y datganiad hwnnw nid ni. Os yw'r bobl sydd yn gyfrifol am y cysyniad o'r farn y byddai'n cymryd dwy neu dair blynedd cyn y gellir ei chyflwyno'n swyddogol yn yr ysgolion, mae'n chwerthinllyd i Nick Bourne gwyno ein bod hefyd o'r un farn.

Soniodd am galedi a ffioedd hyfforddiant: wrth gwrs yr ydym yn ymchwilio i'r ffordd y gall mynediad i addysg uwch ac addysg bellach gael ei gyfyngu oherwydd ffactorau megis ffioedd hyfforddiant, neu ffactorau

the alternative factors. We want to target people from the communities and kinds of families who have traditionally not availed themselves of the huge opportunities of further or higher education. We hope to bring in the higher education review that is being carried out in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, but we hope to be able to report faster than that on this issue of access and hardship in higher education. We hope to do so over the next 12 months.

The comments that he made about waiting lists shows that he is not up-to-date with his reading on this matter. It was a bit rich because we have been able to announce a fall in waiting lists today, and Jane Hutt and I, and the whole of the Assembly, will welcome the fact that we have had a fall in hospital waiting lists. I hope that he will withdraw his inane comment on that subject.

On economic development, he falls into Alun Cairns's trap of continuing to repeat the rubbish about Objective 1, and somehow repeated rubbish becomes truth, just through constant repetition. The money from Objective 1 is now going quickly out of the doors, and the programme complement for Wales was accepted by the European Community faster than that of Merseyside, so he is not looking across the board at any of the other areas that have got Objective 1 programmes in the UK. He automatically assumes, because of the noises that come from Alun Cairns behind him that—because he cannot think of anything else to say—what he says must be true. I can certify that Alun Cairns's constant parrot-like cries about problems in Objective 1 are frequently-repeated rubbish.

As regards clear labelling and consumer safety, such individual issues are not mentioned here because they are too detailed. This is not a programme that includes absolutely everything that we expect to do in the next seven months; it includes the main issues that we can anticipate being brought before the Assembly. No doubt, there are matters that will arise and that we will bring before the Assembly, but this is the main and

eraill. Yr ydym am dargeddu pobl o'r cymunedau a'r mathau o deuluoedd nad ydynt yn hanesyddol wedi manteisio ar y cyfle i gael addysg bellach neu uwch. Gobeithiwn gynnwys yr adolygiad o addysg uwch a gynhelir gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ond y gobaith yw y gallwn roi adroddiad cyn hynny ar fater mynediad a chaledi mewn addysg uwch. Gobeithiwn wneud hynny yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf.

Dengys y sylwadau a wnaeth ynglŷn â'r rhestrau aros nad yw wedi darllen yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynglŷn â hyn. Yr oedd yn chwerthinllyd braidd gan ein bod yn gallu cyhoeddi heddiw bod y rhestrau aros wedi gostwng, a bydd Jane Hutt a minnau, a'r Cynulliad cyfan, yn croesawu'r ffaith bod rhestrau aros yr ysbytai wedi gostwng. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn tynnu ei sylw gwirion ar y pwnc hwnnw yn ôl.

O ran datblygu economaidd, mae'n cwmpo i'r un fagl ag Alun Cairns sef parhau i ailadrodd anwiredd am Amcan 1, a rhywsut neu'i gilydd daw anwiredd a ailadroddir yn wir, dim ond drwy ei ailadrodd dro ar ôl tro. Mae arian Amcan 1 yn cael ei hawlio'n gyflym, a derbyniwyd dogfen ategol y rhaglen Cymru gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd cyn dogfen Glannau Merswy, felly nid yw'n ystyried yr holl ardaloedd eraill sydd â rhaglenni Amcan 1 yn y DU. Mae'n rhagdybio, oherwydd y sŵn gan Alun Cairns y tu ôl iddo—am nad yw'n gallu meddwl am unrhyw beth arall i'w ddweud—bod yn rhaid bod yr hyn a ddywed yn wir. Gallaf ategu'r ffaith bod stŵr di-baid Alun Cairns am broblemau Amcan 1 yn aml yn anwiredd a ailadroddir dro ar ôl tro.

O ran labelu eglur a diogelwch defnyddwyr, ni sonnir am faterion unigol o'r fath yma am eu bod yn rhy fanwl. Nid yw'r rhaglen hon yn cynnwys popeth y disgwyliwn ei wneud yn ystod y saith mis nesaf; mae'n cynnwys y prif faterion y gallwn ragweld y byddant yn cael eu dwyn gerbron y Cynulliad. Yn ddiau, bydd materion yn codi a byddwn yn eu dwyn gerbron y Cynulliad, ond dyna brif fyrdwn strategol yr hyn yr ydym yn bwriadu ei

strategic thrust of what we intend to do, the links between the different elements, the themes and vision that they fit into, and how we intend to start transforming the country.

After all, Wales is a poor country with poor health and with, as yet, a small stake in the knowledge economy. However, I am sure that Nick will welcome, with me, the recent announcements by Lloyds TSB, General Motors and Unilever—and you cannot get three bigger names than those—all in the internet and knowledge economy, and all involving a minimum of 400 jobs in each of those projects.

He raised issues about the right to roam, the Post Office, and his view of the rural poor. His views are different to those of the administration. He mentioned flood protection. There are issues that are dealt with as part of the budget process rather than the work programme budget. This is not overtaking the budget process; the budget process is going on in parallel, so his mention of wanting more money to be put into flood protection will be taken forward as part of the budget process. On the issue of the flood protection crisis that we have seen over the past three or four weeks in many parts of Wales, but particularly in the north-east, Sue Essex, Edwina Hart and I will examine it once we have information from the Environment Agency and the three local authorities that were most affected. That is also not included here. You cannot include the response to the recent floods in the north-east, a response that needs to be short, medium and long-term.

Again, I found what he said about transport policy a bit rich. This includes provision for all pensioners, and those who have disabilities, to have free bus transport from 1 April 2002. Yet he says that there is no reference here to integrated public transport policy. What is his definition of integrated public transport policy?

wneud, y cysylltiadau rhwng y gwahanol elfennau, y themâu a'r weledigaeth y maent yn rhan ohoni, a sut y bwriadwn ddechrau trawsnewid y wlad.

Wedi'r cyfan, mae Cymru yn wlad dlawd gydag iechyd gwael a, hyd yn hyn, â rhan fach yn yr economi wybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Nick yn ymuno â mi i groesawu'r cyhoeddiadau diweddar gan Lloyds TSB, General Motors ac Unilever—ac ni allwch gael tri enw mwy na'r rheini—pob un yn ymwneud â'r rhyngwyd a'r economi wybodaeth, a phob un yn ymwneud â lleiafswm o 400 o swyddi ym mhob un o'r prosiectau hynny.

Cododd faterion yn ymwneud â'r hawl i grwydro, Swyddfa'r Post, a'i farn ar dlodion cefn gwlad. Mae ei farn yn wahanol iawn i farn y weinyddiaeth. Soniodd am amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd. Mae materion yr ymdrinnir â hwy fel rhan o broses y gyllideb yn hytrach na chyllideb y rhaglen waith. Nid yw hon yn bwysicach na phroses y gyllideb; mae proses y gyllideb yn mynd ymlaen ochr yn ochr â hi, felly caiff ei sylw ynglŷn â'r angen am ragor o arian ar gyfer amddiffyn rhag llifogydd ei ystyried fel rhan o broses y gyllideb. Ynglŷn â'r argyfwng o ran amddiffynfeydd rhag y llifogydd a welsom yn ystod y tair neu bedair wythnos diwethaf mewn sawl rhan o Gymru, ond yn enwedig yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, bydd Sue Essex, Edwina Hart a minnau yn ei ystyried unwaith y cawn wybodaeth gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r tri awdurdod lleol yr effeithiwyd arnynt fwyaf. Nid yw hynny wedi ei gynnwys yma ychwaith. Ni allwch gynnwys yr ymateb i'r llifogydd diweddar yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, sef ymateb y mae angen iddo fod yn un tymor byr, tymor canolig a thymor hir.

Unwaith eto, cefais yr hyn a ddywedodd am bolisi trafndiaeth yn chwerthinllyd braidd. Mae hyn yn cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer pob pensïynwr a'r rhai ag anabledau, i gael trafndiaeth ar fsysys am ddim o 1 Ebrill 2002. Er gwaethaf hyn dywed nad oes cyfeiriad at bolisi trafndiaeth gyhoeddus integredig. Beth yw ei ddiffiniad yntau o bolisi trafndiaeth gyhoeddus integredig?

Finally he mentioned a national art gallery. No, that is not mentioned here. There are some issues where he and we would differ. I must tell you, Nick, that I would have been disappointed had you expressed yourself pleased with this programme of work for the Assembly over the next year. It was not intended to please you, Nick.

3:10 p.m.

Mick Bates: The Liberal Democrats have always wanted a programme of business that will bring stability and, above all, credibility to the Assembly. After 18 months, because of the courage and determination of two parties, we have a clear agenda—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

We have a clear agenda for positive action. I agree that the theme for this action has to be the motto of the great Liberal, Lloyd George:

‘the finest eloquence is that which gets things done.’

At last, we have an agenda that will get things done for the sake of the people of Wales, not for individual egos, not for playing games with people’s livelihoods nor for petty whingeing to grab the headlines, but a forward-looking new agenda of social justice and sustainable development. I have heard criticism of the agriculture and rural affairs section of this document. I ask those people, who abolished the free advisory service to assist farmers? Who cut 25 per cent from the farmers’ payments? Those are the ones who caused the damage. I know that there are enough Members here who share the commitment to make this agenda work. For those who oppose it, search your souls and ask what you are doing for Wales.

First Minister, do you agree that this agenda is born from a shared desire to raise the prosperity and quality of life of the people of Wales and that it is high time that we lost the

Yn olaf, soniodd am oriel gelf genedlaethol. Na, ni sonnir am hynny yma. Mae rhai materion lle bydd ef a ninnau’n anghytuno. Rhaid imi ddweud wrthy ch, Nick, y byddwn wedi bod yn siomedig pe baech wedi dweud eich bod yn fodlon ar y rhaglen waith hon ar gyfer y Cynulliad yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid eich plesio chi, Nick, oedd y bwriad.

Mick Bates: Mae’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol erioed wedi dymuno cael rhaglen o fusnes a fydd yn dwyn sefydlogrwydd ac, yn anad dim, hygrededd i’r Cynulliad. Ar ôl 18 mis, oherwydd dewrder a phenderfyniad dwy blaid, mae gennym agenda eglur—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’]

Mae gennym agenda eglur ar gyfer camau adeiladol. Cytunaf mai arwyddair y Rhyddfrydwr mawr, Lloyd George ddylai fod yn thema ar gyfer y camau hyn:

‘yr huodledd pennaf yw hwnnw sydd yn cyflawni.’

O’r diwedd, mae gennym agenda a fydd yn sicrhau y gwneir pethau er mwyn pobl Cymru, nid er mwyn ego gwleidyddion unigol, nid er mwyn chwarae â bywoliaethau pobl, na chwyno am bethau dibwys er mwyn cipio’r penawdau, ond agenda newydd o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol a datblygu cynaliadwy sydd yn edrych ymlaen. Clywais feirniadaeth o’r adran yn y ddogfen hon sydd yn ymdrin ag amaethyddiaeth a materion gwledig. Gofynnaf i’r bobl hynny, pwy ddiddymodd y gwasanaeth ymgynghorol am ddim i gynorthwyo ffermwyr? Pwy leihaodd daliadau ffermwyr 25 y cant? Y rheini a achosodd y niwed. Gwn fod digon o Aelodau yma sydd yn rhannu’r ymrwymiad i sicrhau bod yr agenda hon yn gweithio. I’r rhai sydd yn ei gwrthwynebu, ymholwch a gofynnwch beth yr ydych yn ei wneud dros Gymru.

Brif Weinidog, a gytunwch fod yr agenda hon yn deillio o’r awydd a rennir i gynyddu ffyniant ac ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru ac mae’n hen bryd inni golli’r ddelwedd

whingeing image of Wales?

The First Minister: We share a vision that, somehow or other, we have to commence the transformation of the Welsh economy and society to a point whereby, in 10 years time, we can cease to hold the begging bowl and cease to have the begging bowl mentality because we will have achieved equality of standard of living or GDP per head, health, education, skill and qualification standards that you would expect in a normal, average part of western Europe or the UK. We are currently 20 per cent behind; somehow we have to make good that 20 per cent. Objective 1 will give us a kick-start. We must use it so that, by the time the eastern European countries enter the European Community and the question of European structural funds is reviewed in 2007, we will not need Objective 1 again, but, if we do, we will fight for it. However, I hope that, by then, we will be well on the way to having transformed ourselves into an average wealthy, well-qualified and healthy society. We are not that at the moment. We must get to grips with that problem and commence the transformation of Wales into a healthier, wealthier and smarter society.

The Presiding Officer: I normally allow 30 minutes for statements but as this is a substantial one, I am prepared to allow a further 15 minutes. I will try to call speakers from both sides even-handedly. I currently have more requests from Members of the opposition than of the Government. That may be an indication of their new interest in scrutiny.

Rod Richards: I am sure that Her Majesty will be eternally grateful to the First Minister for standing in for her, thereby saving her the embarrassment of reading out Rhodri's ramblings.

I take it, Llywydd, that the First Minister's sentence

'Wales is a living repudiation of the trickle-down theory'

is a reference to the First Minister's verbal

gwynfanus o Gymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rhannwn weledigaeth bod yn rhaid inni, ryw ffordd neu'i gilydd, drawsnewid economi a chymdeithas Cymru i'r fan lle y gallwn, ymhen 10 mlynedd, roi'r gorau i geisio cardod a rhoi'r gorau i feddylfryd cardota am ein bod wedi cyflawni'r un safon o fyw neu CMC y pen, yr un safonau o iechyd, addysg, sgiliau a chymwysterau a ddisgwylicch mewn rhan arferol, gyffredin o orllewin Ewrop neu'r DU. Yr ydym 20 y cant ar ei hôl hi ar hyn o bryd; ryw ffordd neu'i gilydd mae'n rhaid inni adfer yr 20 y cant hynny. Bydd Amcan 1 yn ysbardun inni. Rhaid inni ei ddefnyddio fel na fydd angen Amcan 1 arnom eto erbyn i wledydd dwyrain Ewrop ymaelodi â'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd ac i fater cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd gael ei adolygu yn 2007, ond os bydd ei angen arnom, byddwn yn brwydro i'w gael. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y byddwn, erbyn hynny, wedi mynd ati i drawsnewid ein hunain yn gymdeithas arferol, gyfoethog, gymwys ac iach. Nid ydym yn y sefyllfa honno ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno a dechrau trawsnewid Cymru yn gymdeithas fwy iach, cyfoethog a galluog.

Y Llywydd: Fel arfer caniatâf 30 munud ar gyfer datganiadau ond gan fod hwn yn un sylweddol, yr wyf yn barod i ganiatáu 15 munud ychwanegol. Ceisiaf alw ar siaradwyr o'r ddwy ochr, yn gyfartal. Ar hyn o bryd mae gennyf fwy o geisiadau gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau na'r Llywodraeth. Efallai bod hynny'n arwydd o'u diddordeb newydd mewn archwilio'n fanwl.

Rod Richards: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Ei Mawrhydi yn fythol ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am gymryd ei lle, ac yn ei harbed rhag yr embaras o ddarllen datganiad ffwndrus Rhodri.

Cymeraf, Lywydd, fod brawddeg y Prif Weinidog

'mae Cymru'n enghraifft sydd yn gwrthbrofi damcaniaeth rhaeadru'

yn gyfeiriad at falu awyr di-baid y Prif

diarrhoea, because that is what we get in this appalling statement. I do not know who wrote it, but if he or she were working for me, they would be down the road tomorrow. This statement shows a complete absence of leadership by the First Minister in this Assembly. He has been discussing Objective 1 and criticising other Members here. Let me read out to him what he just read out to the nation:

‘the opportunities for economic regeneration through European Union Objective 1 funding are there for the taking if the Assembly takes the lead.’

‘If the Assembly takes the lead.’ Where has he been for the last nine months—gestating? He is the leader in this Assembly; when he takes the lead, people will take the possibilities of Objective 1 money seriously. His statement was appalling and he should be ashamed of it. Some weeks ago, he appeased the German; today he stands in this Assembly, waves a piece of paper and says ‘stability in our time’.

The First Minister: ‘Stability for a radical purpose’ is what I actually said, Rod. I am sorry if the words ‘for a radical purpose’ escaped you or hit a button in your brain that rejected them. I am also sorry about the level of synthetic anger that you managed to generate when you stood up to attack the statement. I am not sure what you were trying to say. I hope that you were not trying to say that you agreed with the content of my statement because, given your party affiliations, and my comments on what happened to Wales during 18 years of Conservative Government, I would have been disappointed had you accepted the bulk of what I said. We are trying to put right a great deal of the damage caused by the Conservatives and go further by looking forward to 2010, when we hope to have completed the job that we are starting with this radical programme of transforming a society that is lagging behind in educational skills and qualifications, and in health and economic development. We must get into the knowledge economy. In order to do so, we

Weinidog, am mai hynny sydd gennym yn y datganiad ofnadwy hwn. Ni wn pwy a'i hysgrifennodd, ond pe bai'n gweithio imi, byddai ar y clwt yfory. Dengys y datganiad hwn ddiffyg arweinyddiaeth llwyr gan y Prif Weinidog yn y Cynulliad hwn. Mae wedi bod yn trafod Amcan 1 a beirniadu Aelodau eraill yma. Gadewch imi ddarllen iddo yr hyn y mae newydd ei ddarllen i'r genedl:

‘Gellir manteisio ar y cyfleoedd ar gyfer adfywio economaidd drwy arian Amcan 1 yr Undeb Ewropeaidd os bydd y Cynulliad yn cymryd yr awenau.’

‘Os bydd y Cynulliad yn cymryd yr awenau.’ Ym mhle y mae wedi bod yn ystod y naw mis diwethaf—yn myfyrio? Ef yw'r arweinydd yn y Cynulliad hwn; pan fydd ef yn cymryd yr awenau, bydd pobl yn ystyried posibiliadau arian Amcan 1 o ddifrif. Yr oedd ei ddatganiad yn warthus a dylai gywilyddio. Rai wythnosau yn ôl, cymododd â German; heddiw mae'n sefyll yn y Cynulliad hwn, yn chwifio darn o bapur gan ddweud ‘sefydlogrwydd yn ein cyfnod’.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: ‘Sefydlogrwydd at ddiben radicalaidd’ yw'r hyn a ddywedais mewn gwirionedd, Rod. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os collasoch y geiriau ‘at ddiben radicalaidd’ neu y bu iddynt daro rhan o'ch ymennydd a oedd yn eu gwrthod. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf hefyd ynglŷn â'r dicter ffug y llwyddasoch i'w fagu pan safasoch i ymosod ar y datganiad. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yr oeddech yn ceisio ei ddweud. Gobeithiaf nad oeddech yn ceisio dweud eich bod yn cytuno â chynnwys fy natganiad oherwydd, o gofio'ch cysylltiadau pleidiol, a'm sylwadau ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yng Nghymru yn ystod 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol, byddwn wedi bod yn siomedig pe baech wedi derbyn trwch yr hyn a ddywedais. Yr ydym yn ceisio unioni cryn dipyn o'r niwed a achosodd y Ceidwadwyr, a mynd ymhellach gan edrych ymlaen at 2010, pan fyddwn, gobeithiaf, wedi cwblhau'r gwaith yr ydym yn ei ddechrau gyda'r rhaglen radicalaidd hon i drawsnewid cymdeithas sydd ar ei hôl hi o ran sgiliau a chymwysterau addysgol, ac o ran iechyd a datblygu economaidd. Rhaid

must have a different set of educational skills and qualifications. We must put right the lagging areas of Wales in terms of social development through the Communities First programme and by targeting health expenditure to those areas that need it most.

All of this is totally foreign to Rod. His party has been in charge, and it took Wales the other way. Therefore, I would expect him to express strong 'anti' views on the programme's content. I do not expect Rod to agree with it, but I hope that he will have to live with it and that he will still be in politics when we achieve our aims and when Wales is transformed into a society that is unlike the one that his party left behind—not a country that is falling further behind the British average in health and economic development, but one that has caught up with the rest of Britain and that is hopefully overtaking it in terms of its standard of living and educational qualifications and health, as with the Irish Republic.

Tom Middlehurst: I welcome the statement and I hope that you agree that there is little in it that does not consolidate the work of the previous Cabinet. I take great pride in saying that because I think that we achieved a great deal in the first 17 months of this Assembly. It is difficult to accept criticisms from Ieuan Wyn Jones and others because their criticisms have little foundation. The fact is that there is much on which we can be judged fairly and positively.

We must also recognise that, as a consequence of the largesse of the Labour Government in Westminster, we are now able to deliver a positive agenda for Wales, which I welcome. Working in partnership with the Government in Westminster will ensure that we deliver a meaningful agenda for the people of Wales. I suggest that it is not the partnership in this Assembly that will be crucial in raising the standards and the quality of life for the people of Wales, but the partnership with local government, with our colleges and universities, with the

inni fod yn rhan o'r economi wybodaeth. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid inni gael set arall o sgiliau a chymwysterau addysgol. Rhaid inni wella'r ardaloedd sydd ar ei hôl hi yng Nghymru o ran datblygu cymdeithasol drwy'r rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a thrwy dargedu gwariant iechyd tuag at y meysydd hynny sydd ei angen fwyaf.

Mae hyn oll yn hollol ddieithr i Rod. Bu ei blaid ef mewn grym, gan fynd â Chymru i'r cyfeiriad arall. Felly, disgwyliwn iddo fynegi gwrthwynebiad cryf ar gynnwys y rhaglen. Ni ddisgwyliaf i Rod gytuno â hi, ond gobeithiaf y bydd yn rhaid iddo ymgodymu â hi ac y bydd yn parhau i weithio ym maes gwleidyddiaeth pan gyflawnwn ein nodau a phan gaiff Cymru ei thrawsnewid yn gymdeithas sydd yn annhebyg i'r un y gadawodd ei blaid ef ar ei hôl—nid gwlad sydd yn mynd fwyfwy ar ei hôl hi o ran safonau cyfartalog Prydain ym meysydd iechyd a datblygu economaidd, ond gwlad sydd wedi dal i fyny â gweddill Prydain ac sydd, gobeithio, yn ei goddiweddyd o ran safon byw a chymwysterau addysgol ac iechyd, fel yn achos Gweriniaeth Iwerddon.

Tom Middlehurst: Croesawaf y datganiad a gobeithiaf ichi gytuno nad oes fawr ynddo nad yw'n cydgyfnerthu gwaith y Cabinet blaenorol. Yr wyf yn hynod falch o ddweud hynny am fy mod o'r farn inni gyflawni cryn dipyn yn 17 mis cyntaf y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'n anodd derbyn beirniadaeth gan Ieuan Wyn Jones ac Aelodau eraill am nad oes fawr o sail i'w beirniadaeth. Y gwir amdani yw bod llawer y gellir ein barnu yn ei gylch yn deg ac yn adeiladol.

Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd, o ganlyniad i haelioni'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, y gallwn bellach gyflwyno agenda adeiladol i Gymru, a chroesawaf hynny. Drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn cyflwyno agenda ystyrlon i bobl Cymru. Awgrymaf nad y bartneriaeth yn y Cynulliad hwn fydd yn hollbwysig o ran gwella safonau ac ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru, ond y bartneriaeth â llywodraeth leol, gyda'n colegau a'n prifysgolion, gyda'r gymuned fusnes a'r sector gwirfoddol. Hwy yw ein

business community and the voluntary sector. They are our agents, with whom we must work to ensure that we deliver this ambitious agenda for Wales. It is ambitious, and I hope that you will accept that, if we are to succeed, we must strengthen those partnerships and I urge you to consider how we will achieve those objectives.

The First Minister: I am grateful for Tom's words, which are reflected in the section on local government and housing of the document that was provided with my statement to the Assembly. In the document, we refer to the start of a new partnership approach to providing quality services for the people of Wales jointly with local government. I agree entirely with Tom. The voluntary sector is very important to Wales, possibly because we have never had our own Assembly before. Our voluntary sector is strong and is an important partner. Similarly, local government has had to work hard to try to combat the worst deprivations of 18 years of Tory Government and, therefore, has an active equality agenda with which we can work easily and develop in partnership. I look forward to doing that.

I also look forward to working closely with the Labour Government in Westminster, as I said in my answer to Ann Jones's question earlier. Being able to work on correcting inequalities is a matter for central Government because it deals with pensions, social security and taxation and for us because we deal with health, education, transport, the environment and many of the other frontline services that are supplied sometimes jointly with local government. It is a partnership issue. We can do much more in partnership than we can if we work separately.

3:20 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: I will ask about a few points in this document that seem to me to reflect a shift in emphasis from that in 'Betterwales.com'. In both cases, I hope that I am wrong in that. First, why is the reference to the Children's Commissioner for Wales

hasiantau, y mae'n rhaid inni weithio â hwy er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cyflwyno'r agenda uchelgeisiol hon i Gymru. Mae'n uchelgeisiol, a gobeithiaf ichi dderbyn bod yn rhaid inni atgyfnerthu'r partneriaethau hynny er mwyn inni lwyddo, ac apeliaf arnoch i ystyried sut y byddwn yn cyflawni'r amcanion hynny.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Tom am ei gyfraniad, a adlewyrchir yn yr adran am lywodraeth leol a thai yn y ddogfen a ddarparwyd gyda'm datganiad i'r Cynulliad. Yn y ddogfen, cyfeiriwn at ddechrau ymagwedd bartneriaeth newydd tuag at ddarparu gwasanaethau o safon ar gyfer pobl Cymru ar y cyd â llywodraeth leol. Cytunaf yn llwyr â Tom. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn bwysig iawn yng Nghymru, efallai am nad oedd gennym Gynulliad o'r blaen. Mae ein sector gwirfoddol yn gryf ac yn bartner pwysig. Yn yr un modd, bu'n rhaid i lywodraeth leol weithio'n ddygn i geisio gwrthsefyll amddifadedd gwaethaf 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Doriaidd ac, felly, y mae ganddi agenda weithgar o ran cydraddoldeb y gallwn weithio'n rhwydd â hi a'i datblygu mewn partneriaeth. Edrychaf ymlaen at wneud hynny.

Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at weithio'n agos â'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i gwestiwn Ann Jones yn gynharach. Mae'r gallu i fynd ati i unioni anghydraddoldebau yn fater i'r Llywodraeth ganolog am ei fod yn ymwneud â phensiynau, nawdd cymdeithasol a threth ac i ninnau am ein bod yn ymdrin ag iechyd, addysg, trafniadaeth, yr amgylchedd a llawer o'r gwasanaethau rheng flaen eraill a ddarperir weithiau ar y cyd â llywodraeth leol. Mae'n fater o bartneriaeth. Gallwn wneud llawer mwy mewn partneriaeth nag y gallwn os gweithiwn ar wahân.

Helen Mary Jones: Holaf ynghylch ychydig o bwytiau yn y ddogfen hon yr ymddengys i mi ei bod yn newid pwyslais yr hyn a oedd yn 'Gwellcymru.com'. Yn y ddau achos, gobeithiaf fy mod wedi camgymryd yn hynny o beth. Yn gyntaf, pam y cyfeirir at

made under the health and social care heading, implying that it is a social care matter rather than a corporate commitment? I was concerned by that, given the emphasis that we have placed again and again on this commissioner being a commissioner for all the children of Wales.

If the First Minister looks carefully at the wording of the commitment—if it is one—does it imply that the Government of Wales is not expecting full powers for the commissioner in the Queen's Speech? Again it is placed under the social care heading and it refers, presumably, to legislation on initial powers. I would be grateful, First Minister, if you could unpack that, not only for me but for the voluntary organisations that work with children, which will be concerned about that possible emphasis in the document.

Is your colleague, the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities content with the one limited reference to equal opportunities matters in this document? We welcome the commitment to implementing the Stephen Lawrence report, but in 'Betterwales.com' and in various other documents that we have had before us, equality was supposed to be a major cross-cutting theme. That does not seem to be the message of this document. What is the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities' view? Does the First Minister know? Does the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities share my disappointment at what seems to be a step back from a full commitment to mainstreaming equality into all aspects of this Government's programme? I hope that that is not a matter on which the former Labour Cabinet has been badly influenced by its new friends and acquaintances.

The First Minister: Two thoughtful points, as I would expect. There is nothing behind any change of emphasis that you have observed on the Children's Commissioner or on equality of opportunity. The placing of the Children's Commissioner in the health and social care section simply reflects the fact

Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru o dan bennawd iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, gan awgrymu ei fod yn fater gofal cymdeithasol yn hytrach nag ymrwymiad corfforaethol? Yr oedd hynny yn fy mhryderu, o gofio'r pwyslais yr ydym wedi ei roi dro ar ôl tro ar y ffaith bod y comisiynydd hwn yn gomisiynydd dros holl blant Cymru.

Os edrycha'r Prif Weinidog yn ofalus ar eiriad yr ymrwymiad—os mai ymrwymiad ydyw—a awgryma nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn disgwyl cael pwerau llawn i'r comisiynydd yn Araith y Frenhines? Unwaith eto, daw o dan bennawd gofal cymdeithasol gan gyfeirio, fe debygaf, at ddeddfwriaeth ar gyfer pwerau cychwynnol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar, Brif Weinidog, pe gallech egluro hynny, nid yn unig i mi ond i'r sefydliadau gwirfoddol sydd yn gweithio â phlant, a fydd yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r pwyslais posibl hwnnw yn y ddogfen.

A yw'ch cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn fodlon ar yr un cyfeiriad byr at faterion cyfle cyfartal yn y ddogfen hon? Croesawn yr ymrwymiad i weithredu adroddiad Stephen Lawrence, ond yn 'Gwellcymru.com' ac mewn amryw o ddogfennau eraill a osodwyd ger ein bron, yr oedd cydraddoldeb i fod yn thema drawsbynciol o bwys. Ymddengys nad hynny yw neges y ddogfen hon. Beth yw barn y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau? A wŷr y Prif Weinidog? A yw'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn rhannu fy siom ynglŷn â'r cam yn ôl, i bob golwg, o'r ymrwymiad llawn i brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb ym mhob agwedd ar raglen y Llywodraeth hon? Gobeithiaf na fu i gyfeillion a chydabod newydd gael dylanwad drwg ar y cyn Gabinet Llafur wrth ymdrin â'r mater hwn.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dau bwynt ystyriol, fel y disgwyliwn. Nid oes unrhyw reswm dros unrhyw newid pwyslais a nodwyd gennych o ran y Comisiynydd Plant neu gyfle cyfartal. Wrth gynnwys y Comisiynydd Plant yn yr adran am iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yr ydym ond yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith mai Jane

that Jane Hutt is the Minister with overall responsibility for children and also the Minister with overall responsibility for health and social services. We must be careful about making any commitments that anticipate the results of the Queen's Speech, the content of which we have not been able to see. It is one of the difficulties posed by presenting this programme two or three weeks before the Queen's Speech rather than just after it. Neither we nor any Government department in Westminster can give any commitment about the content of the Queen's Speech, because it is always subject to last minute changes and adjustments. We cannot say what will be in the Queen's Speech. We have merely stated the position as it is today. That is all, and you should not read anything into that as regards the acquisition that we hope will come on 6 December. However, we cannot say anything more than that.

As regards equal opportunities, as you know, Edwina is not the sort of person to hide her light under a bushel. If she was unhappy about an absence of adequate commitments to equal opportunities, she would say so. You must remember, Helen Mary, that this is a work programme for a seven-month period whereas 'Betterwales.com' was a corporate plan intended to run for much longer than that. The fact that a matter is not seen as being likely to require a Plenary debate either because of an Executive action, legislation or because we want to bring forward some other mission, vision or issue over the next seven months, does not mean that it has lost its crucial importance as a cross-cutting issue to which we are all committed.

Brian Gibbons: It is disappointing and discouraging—[OPPOSITION MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear.']

The Presiding Officer: Order. I suspect that Brian intends to finish that sentence in his own way.

Brian Gibbons:—to have to put up with the continuing negativity and rubbish that we have heard from the opposition parties. Wales has a serious image of trying to get its

Hutt yw'r Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb cyffredinol dros blant ac mai hi hefyd yw'r Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb cyffredinol dros ieuchyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus cyn gwneud unrhyw ymrwymadau a fydd yn achub y blaen ar ganlyniadau Araith y Frenhines, na fu modd inni weld ei chynnwys. Dyna un o'r anawsterau sydd yn codi wrth gyflwyno'r rhaglen hon ddwy neu dair wythnos cyn Araith y Frenhines yn hytrach nag ychydig ar ei hôl hi. Ni allwn ni nac unrhyw adran o'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan roi unrhyw ymrwymiad ynglŷn â chynnwys Araith y Frenhines, am ei bod bob amser yn agored i newidiadau ac addasiadau munud olaf. Ni allwn ddweud beth fydd yn Araith y Frenhines. Dim ond nodi'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni a wnaethom. Dyna'r cwbl, ac ni ddylech ddyfalu ynglŷn â'r hyn y gobeithiwn ei gael ar 6 Rhagfyr. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn ddweud mwy na hynny.

O ran cyfle cyfartal, fel y gwyddoch, nid un swil yw Edwina. Pe bai'n anfodlon ar ddiffyg ymrwymadau digonol i gyfle cyfartal byddai wedi dweud hynny. Rhaid ichi gofio, Helen Mary, mai rhaglen waith ar gyfer cyfnod o saith mis ydyw tra bod 'Gwelcymru.com' yn gynllun corfforaethol a oedd i fod i redeg am lawer hwy na hynny. Ni olyga'r ffaith nad ystyrir y bydd mater yn debygol o fynnu cael ei drafod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn naill ai oherwydd gweithred gan y Weithrediaeth, deddfwriaeth neu am ein bod am gyflwyno rhyw genadwri, gweledigaeth neu fater arall yn ystod y saith mis nesaf, ei fod yn llai pwysig fel mater trawsbynciol hollbwysig yr ydym oll yn ymrwymedig iddo.

Brian Gibbons: Mae'n siomedig a thorcalonnus—[AELODAU'R GWRTHBLEIDIAU: 'Clywch, clywch.']

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Tybiaf fod Brian yn bwriadu gorffen y frawddeg honno yn ei ffordd ei hun.

Brian Gibbons:—bod yn rhaid dioddef yr agwedd negyddol a'r sothach parhaus a glywsom gan y gwrthbleidiau. Mae delwedd ddifrifol gan Gymru o fod yn ceisio ei siapio

act together and move forward. The stuff that we have heard from the opposition does us no credit whatsoever. The opposition said that we are not tackling inequality. Ieuan Wyn Jones happened not to notice the reference to the Welsh baccalaureate in the document. Equally, I do not suppose that he knows about the health inequalities fund. That has passed him by. We know that Plaid Cymru has voted against the new formula on local government allocation, which will give more money to the most hard-pressed local authorities in Wales. We know that we are moving forward on the new health formula and we are introducing the Communities First programme from April of next year. I have just received a message on what is happening in Cornwall on Objective 1. The message is that they will be giving out the money soon. We are at it already. It is a sign of the negativity in the opposition parties that, when we achieve things in Wales, they continually knock us rather than congratulate us. [PLAID CYMRU MEMBERS: 'Ask a question.']—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I need no help from the party on my right.

Brian Gibbons: Does Rhodri agree that in the Objective 1 area, Wales is outperforming the other regions in the United Kingdom in terms of distributing the money, and is outperforming the Irish Republic in terms of getting its complement document approved?

The First Minister: You are correct to draw to the attention of the parties that have either chosen to miss, or have genuinely missed, the reference to health inequalities being covered by the new health resource allocation formula. Work is continuing on that and we hope to be able present a document to the Assembly for consideration in the spring. That will be an important document on directing health expenditure where it needs to be directed. As regards Objective 1, my understanding is that Brian is correct. In comparison to other Objective 1 areas, we are ahead of the field, despite the constant repetition of this claim that it is a disaster

hi a symud ymlaen. Nid yw'r hyn a glywsom gan y gwrthbleidiau yn rhoi unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth inni o gwbl. Dywedodd yr wrthblaid nad ydym yn mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb. Ni sylwodd Ieuan Wyn Jones ar y cyfeiriad at y fagloraeth Gymreig yn y ddogfen. Yn yr un modd, ni thychiaf ei fod yn gwybod am y gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Collodd hynny. Gwyddom fod Plaid Cymru wedi pleidleisio'n erbyn y fformwla newydd ar ddyraniad llywodraeth leol, a fydd yn rhoi mwy o arian i'r awdurdodau lleol mwyaf anghenus yng Nghymru. Gwyddom ein bod yn symud ymlaen ar y fformwla iechyd newydd a'n bod yn cyflwyno'r rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf o Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr wyf newydd dderbyn neges ynglŷn â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yng Nghernyw o ran Amcan 1. Y neges yw y byddant yn dosbarthu'r arian yn fuan. Yr ydym eisoes yn ei wneud. Mae'r ffaith bod y gwrthbleidiau bob amser yn lladd arnom yn hytrach na'n llongyfarch pan gyflawnwn rywbeth yng Nghymru yn arwydd o'u agwedd negyddol. [AELODAU PLAID CYMRU: 'Gofynnwch gwestiwn.']—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes angen cymorth arnaf gan y blaid ar fy ochr dde.

Brian Gibbons: A gytuna Rhodri fod Cymru, yn ardal Amcan 1, yn perfformio'n well na'r rhanbarthau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig o ran dosbarthu'r arian, ac yn well na Gweriniaeth Iwerddon o ran sicrhau bod ei dogfen ategol wedi ei chymeradwyo?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i dynnu sylw'r pleidiau sydd naill ai wedi dewis colli, neu sydd, wirioneddol, wedi colli'r cyfeiriad, at anghydraddoldebau iechyd a gwmpesir gan y fformwla dyrannu adnoddau iechyd newydd. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar hynny a gobeithiwn y gallwn gyflwyno dogfen i'r Cynulliad ei hystyried yn y gwanwyn. Bydd honno'n ddogfen bwysig o ran cyfeirio'r gwariant ar iechyd lle y mae angen ei gyfeirio. Ynglŷn ag Amcan 1, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, mae Brian yn gywir. O gymharu â meysydd Amcan 1 eraill, yr ydym ar y blaen, er gwaethaf yr honiad byth a beunydd ei fod yn draed moch

area or chaos or whatever Alun Cairns feels like saying it is on any particular day. In comparison to other British Objective 1 areas and the Irish Republic Objective 1 areas, we are outperforming. What Brian said is correct.

Alun Cairns: I noticed that in response to the Leader of the Welsh Conservative Party, the First Minister poured scorn on and rejected with embarrassment the view that there has been a missed opportunity in Objective 1 which has alienated and frustrated the public, private and voluntary sectors. Does the First Minister agree with the Deputy First Minister, who admitted in the Economic Development Committee last week that there is united anxiety over the handling of Objective 1? If he does not agree with his deputy, I suggest that his head is in the sand.

The First Minister: We have always accepted—I have said it time and time again—that there is a problem with the structure of Objective 1. I have said that from the beginning and I will say it again now. There is no obvious way of deciding the allocation of priority between local and regional funding schemes under Objective 1. Putting together a team of consumers, main players and strategists to consider again how best to arbitrate between the claims of the local partnerships and the regional Objective 1 partnerships is a sensible way forward. I know most of the individuals involved, though not all. To set up a task and finish group of this kind is sensible. I believe that it will report to Christine Chapman as Chair of the Programme Monitoring Committee. I have no problem at all with that. If we can crack this problem that has existed from the start, of confusion as to whether local partnerships will be overrun by regional partnerships, or vice versa, then a great deal of the anxiety about either side of the local regional divide having too much of the resources will be resolved. It is a weakness in the structure. I look forward to the outcome of the task and finish group.

Alison Halford: I will ask Rhodri two

neu'n drychineb neu beth bynnag y mae awydd ar Alun Cairns ei alw ar unrhyw ddiwrnod penodol. O gymharu ag ardaloedd Amcan 1 eraill ym Mhrydain ac ardaloedd Amcan 1 Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, ni sydd yn perfformio orau. Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd Brian yn gywir.

Alun Cairns: Wrth iddo ateb Arweinydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, sylwais fod y Prif Weinidog wedi wfftio'r farn, a'i gwrthod mewn embaras, y collwyd cyfle o ran Amcan 1 sydd wedi digio a blino'r cyhoedd, y sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol. A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, a gyfaddefodd yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf fod pawb yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r modd yr ymdrinnir ag Amcan 1? Os na chytuna â'i ddirprwy, awgrymaf ei fod â'i ben yn y tywod.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym bob amser wedi derbyn—dywedais hyn dro ar ôl tro—fod problem o ran strwythur Amcan 1. Dywedais hynny o'r cychwyn ac fe'i dywedaf eto yn awr. Nid oes ffordd amlwg o bennu blaenoriaethau rhwng cynlluniau ariannu lleol a rhanbarthol o dan Amcan 1. Mae sefydlu tîm o ddefnyddwyr, prif chwaraewyr a strategwyr a fydd yn ystyried eto y ffordd orau i benderfynu ar geisiadau gan bartneriaethau lleol a phartneriaethau rhanbarthol Amcan 1 yn gam synhwyrol ymlaen. Yr wyf yn adnabod y rhan fwyaf o'r unigolion dan sylw, ond nid pob un. Mae'n synhwyrol sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen o'r fath. Credaf y bydd yn atebol i Christine Chapman fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar hynny. Os gallwn ddatrys y broblem hon sydd wedi bodoli ers y cychwyn cyntaf, ynglŷn â'r ansicrwydd pa un ai a fydd partneriaethau rhanbarthol yn drech na phartneriaethau lleol, neu fel arall, yna gellir tawelu cryn bryder bod naill ai'r ochr leol neu'r ochr rhanbarthol yn cael gormod o adnoddau. Mae hynny'n ddiffyg ar y strwythur. Edrychaf ymlaen at ganlyniad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen.

Alison Halford: Gofynnaf ddau gwestiwn

simple questions. When you devote so much of your life to improving the quality of life for the people in Wales, how do you continue to cope with the negative, boorish, backbiting, bullying and mind-blowingly pathetic comments of the opposition? [OPPOSITION MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] How do you keep your patience? The second question— [Interruption.]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I expect all parties to listen in relative silence to the questions being asked, out of courtesy.

3:30 p.m.

Alison Halford: I make my case well. How do you also cope with the fact that the opposition has reneged on this Assembly's promise to alleviate the yah-boo politics that are so despised by the public?

The First Minister: On the content of the opposition parties' contributions this afternoon, I never expected that any of the material before the Assembly today would appear in Conservative or Plaid Cymru manifestos. This is a programme for the partnership Government of the Labour Party and the Liberal Democrats. It is not there to help the Conservatives write their manifesto for the next general election or the next Assembly elections in 2003. No doubt they will abide by that encouragement to take a different view, otherwise they would be denying their own existence and what they did during their 18 years in charge in Wales from 1979 to 1997.

On the issue of behaviour, that is not a matter for me, but there is a lot of lower-third behaviour going on. I am as bad as anybody about it when sitting down, so I can hardly criticise it when standing up. I even occasionally permit myself to behave like that when standing up. You can sort of blame it on 13 years in the House of Commons, although that is not really an excuse.

Owen John Thomas: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod miloedd, os nad cannoedd o filoedd, o bobl yng Nghymru yn disgwyl

syml i Rhodri. Pan fyddwch yn ymroi cymaint o'ch bywyd i wella ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru, sut yr ydych yn ymdopi o hyd â'r sylwadau negyddol, anghwrtais, ceccrus, gormesol a hynod druenus y gwrthbleidiau? [AELODAU'R GWRTHBLEIDIAU: 'O.'] Sut yr ydych yn cadw'ch amynedd? Yr ail gwestiwn—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Disgwyliaf i bob plaid wrando'n gymharol dawel ar y cwestiynau a ofynnir, o ran cwrteisi.

Alison Halford: Cyflwynais fy achos yn dda. Sut yr ydych hefyd yn ymdopi â'r ffaith bod yr wrthblaid wedi torri addewid y Cynulliad hwn i ymwrthod â gwleidyddiaeth ceccrus y mae'n gas gan y cyhoedd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: O ran cynnwys cyfraniadau'r gwrthbleidiau y prynhawn yma, ni ddisgwyliais erioed y byddai unrhyw ddeunydd gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw yn ymddangos ym maniffesto'r Blaid Geidwadol neu Blaid Cymru. Mae hon yn rhaglen ar gyfer Llywodraeth bartneriaeth y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Nis lluniwyd i helpu'r Ceidwadwyr ysgrifennu eu maniffesto ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf neu etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad yn 2003. Byddant yn ddiau yn cadw at yr anogaeth honno i ddod i safbwynt gwahanol, fel arall byddent yn gwadu eu bodolaeth eu hunain a'r hyn a wnaethant yn ystod y 18 mlynedd pan oeddent mewn llywodraeth yng Nghymru o 1979 i 1997.

O ran ymddygiad, nid yw'n fater i mi, ond mae cryn dipyn o ymddygiad dosbarth trydydd is yma. Yr wyf cynddrwg â neb pan fyddaf yn fy sedd, felly prin fy mod yn gallu ei feirniadu pan fyddaf ar fy nhraed. Byddaf hyd yn oed yn ymddwyn yn y fath fodd pan fyddaf ar fy nhraed. Gellir rhoi'r bai i raddau ar 13 mlynedd yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, er nad yw hynny'n esgus mewn gwirionedd.

Owen John Thomas: You will be aware that thousands, if not hundreds of thousands, of people in Wales are expecting great things

rhywbeth mawr oddi wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yn arbennig, yr oedd y rhieni a fu'n ymdrechu am ddegawdau i gael chwarae teg i addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn disgwyl i'r Cynulliad—yn enwedig pan ddaethoch chi yn Brif Weinidog—wneud rhywbeth am hyn. Fodd bynnag, pan edrychwn ar y ddogfen hon, beth a welwn? Nodir y byddwch yn chwilio am fwy o ddeddfwriaeth i sicrhau bod cwmnïau fel BT, sydd eisoes yn gweithredu'n ddwyieithog, yn gorfod gwneud hynny o dan y ddeddf. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r bobl hyn eisiau mwy o fiwrocratiaeth. Mae arnynt eisiau'r hawl i gael darpariaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i'w plant heb ymdrechu.

Yn ystod y 50 mlynedd diwethaf, ers agor yr ysgol Gymraeg gyntaf yng Nghaerdydd, nid yw'r ymdrechu wedi peidio o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Mae rhywun yn rhywle yn ymdrechu yng Nghymru ar y funud hon. Yng Ngwlad y Basg yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd ddiwethaf—yr wyf yn dod at y cwestiwn, mae hwn yn bwnc pwysig—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae pob pwnc yn bwysig yn y Cynulliad hwn, fel ein cwestiynau. Yr ydym wedi treulio 53 munud ar y datganiad hwn. A wnewch chi ofyn cwestiwn?

Owen John Thomas: Yng Ngwlad y Basg yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd ddiwethaf, maent wedi sicrhau bod nifer y plant sydd yn derbyn addysg drwy gyfrwng y Fasseg wedi codi i 60 y cant. Yng Nghymru, ar ôl 50 mlynedd, 20 y cant yw'r ffigur. Nid yw hynny oherwydd nad yw pobl eisiau addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond oherwydd nad oes darpariaeth i sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Beth ydych chi am ei wneud am hyn yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf, oherwydd nid oes angen deddfwriaeth i wneud hyn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr oeddwn yn disgwyl cael fy nghwestiynu ar y ddogfen y prynhawn yma, ond yr ydych wedi codi mater pwysig i rieni a phlant yng Nghymru sydd yn awyddus i dderbyn addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Nid oes modd rhoi popeth mewn dogfen fel hon a chredaf fod Owen John yn derbyn hynny. Yr ydym yn

from the National Assembly. In particular, the parents who have been striving for decades for fair play for Welsh-medium education were expecting the Assembly—especially when you became First Minister—to do something about this. However, when we look at this document, what do we see? It states that you will seek further legislation to ensure that companies such as BT, who already conduct their business bilingually, must do so by law. However, these people do not want more bureaucracy. They want the right to have Welsh-medium education provision for their children without having to strive for it.

During the past 50 years, since opening the first Welsh-medium school in Cardiff, efforts have not ceased from year to year. There is someone striving somewhere in Wales as we speak. In the Basque country over the last 20 years—I am coming to the question, this is an important subject—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Every subject is important in this Assembly, as are our questions. We have spent 53 minutes on this statement. Will you ask a question?

Owen John Thomas: In the Basque country over the last 20 years, they have ensured that the number of children receiving education through the medium of Basque has risen to 60 per cent. In Wales, after 50 years, the figure is 20 per cent; not because people do not want Welsh-medium education, but because there is no provision to ensure that it will be available. What will you do about this over the next year, because legislation is not needed to do this?

The First Minister: I expected to be questioned on the document this afternoon, but you have raised an important issue for parents and children in Wales who are keen to receive education through the medium of Welsh. It is not possible to include everything in a document such as this and I believe that Owen John accepts that. We

disgwyl trafod materion deddfwriaethol, gweithredol neu weledigaethol. Yr ydym yn ceisio cadw cydbwysedd rhwng y ddarpariaeth a'r galw. Weithiau mae'r ddarpariaeth yn mynd o flaen y galw, ac i'r gwrthwyneb.

Ni wn am broblem na allwn ei datrys yn y modd confensiynol, drwy siarad â'r awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n rhan o'r bartneriaeth gydag awdurdodau lleol ar ddarparu ar gyfer y rheini sydd yn awyddus i gael addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg i'w plant. Os cyfyd problemau yn ystod y flwyddyn, megis awdurdod lleol yn benderfynol o beidio â chynnig darpariaeth i rieni sydd yn awyddus i sicrhau addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gallwn gynnal dadleuon, ac yn y blaen, yn y Cynulliad. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n wall neu'n dwll yn y ddogfen hon na bod ein hymateb ni i addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn warthus.

Richard Edwards: Do you agree that, aside from some thoughtful points from Helen Mary Jones, we have heard a raucous chorus of whine and whinge from the parties of Conservatism this afternoon, from the people who could not, would not and did not deliver for Wales for 18 long, dark years?

The First Minister: Like Richard, I was surprised that Helen Mary Jones made the only statesmanlike contribution on behalf of the opposition parties today, by actually reading the document. However, I do not want to damage her political career, if I can call it that. Reading such documents and asking perceptive questions, such as whether something will lead to an upgrading or downgrading of a subject, in a calm and statesmanlike way is what the Assembly should be about. That also relates perhaps to Alison Halford's earlier question. I do not want to damage her political career either, as she has a reputation for being quite rumbustious, to which she will no doubt return at the right moment. There are times to be serious and statesmanlike, today being one of those times.

David Melding: We are becoming used to

expect to discuss legislative, operative, or visionary issues. We are trying to keep a balance between the provision and the demand. Sometimes the provision outstrips the demand and vice versa.

I do not know of a problem that we cannot resolve in the conventional manner, by talking to local authorities. It is part of the partnership with local authorities on delivering for those who are keen to have Welsh-medium education for their children. If problems arise during the year, such as a local authority that is determined not to offer provision for parents who are keen to ensure Welsh-medium education, we can hold debates, and so on, in the Assembly. I do not believe that that is an omission or a hole in this document nor that our response to Welsh-medium education is disgraceful.

Richard Edwards: A gytunwch ein bod wedi clywed, ar wahân i rai pwyntiau ystyriol gan Helen Mary Jones, sŵn achwyn aflafar gan y pleidiau Ceidwadaeth y prynhawn yma, gan bobl nad oeddent yn gallu, yn dymuno nac wedi llwyddo i ddarparu ar gyfer Cymru am 18 o flynyddoedd hirfaith llwm?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fel Richard, synnais mai gan Helen Mary Jones oedd yr unig gyfraniad o safon gwladweinydd ar ran y gwrthbleidiau heddiw, am iddi ddarllen y ddogfen ei hun. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am niweidio ei gyrfa wleidyddol, os gallaf ei galw felly. Mae darllen dogfennau o'r fath a gofyn cwestiynau treiddgar, megis a fydd rhywbeth yn arwain at bwnc yn dod yn fwy pwysig neu'n llai pwysig mewn ffordd dawel, bwylllog yn enghraifft o'r hyn a ddylai ddigwydd yn y Cynulliad. Mae hynny hefyd yn ymwneud â chwestiwn cynharach Alison Halford. Nid wyf am niweidio ei gyrfa wleidyddol hithau chwaith, gan fod ganddi enw am fod yn go heriol, a bydd hi'n heriol eto ar yr adeg briodol heb os. Mae adegau pan fydd angen bod yn ddifrifol a phwylllog, a heddiw yw un o'r adegau hynny.

David Melding: Yr ydym yn dod yn

government by leak. However, is it not rich to criticise the opposition for not knowing about the leak in advance? Will you apologise to my colleague, Nick Bourne, for accusing him of not knowing about today's waiting list figures? Those figures will, in fact, be published tomorrow. Will you answer his question on whether you are committed to reducing waiting lists by 15,000 by March, which is the policy that you stated earlier this year?

The First Minister: I will return to you after discussions with Jane Hutt on that matter, which will take account of the latest information available following the recent fall in waiting list figures.

gyfarwydd â llywodraethu drwy ryddhau gwybodaeth ymlaen llaw. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'n hurt beirniadu'r wrthblaid am beidio â gwybod am wybodaeth ymlaen llaw? A wnewch ymddiheuro i'm cyd-Aelod, Nick Bourne, am ei gyhuddo o beidio â gwybod ffigurau'r rhestrau aros heddiw? Cyhoeddir y ffigurau hynny yfory mewn gwirionedd. A wnewch ateb ei gwestiwn a ydych yn ymrwymedig i leihau rhestrau aros 15,000 erbyn Mawrth, sef y polisi a nodwyd gennych yn gynharach eleni?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dychwelaf atoch ar ôl trafod â Jane Hutt ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw, a fydd yn ystyried yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf sydd ar gael yn dilyn y gostyngiad diweddar yn y nifer ar y rhestrau aros.

Gweithredu'r Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref Newydd i Gymru Implementation of the New Home Energy Efficiency Scheme for Wales

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): The new Home Energy Efficiency Scheme for Wales is part of a long-term programme to tackle fuel poverty, which will take about 10 years to achieve its intended effect. Our commitment to tackling the problem is clear from the draft budget proposals, which show substantial increases in funding over the next four years. Funding will increase incrementally as the scheme is established. This approach is important to ensure that the scheme, which involves many new approaches, is able to deliver against expectations.

It is important that the reports on the delayed introduction are put into context. The comparison with England is in terms of months for a programme that will take years to take effect in both countries. The Deputy Prime Minister acknowledged that in September when he referred, at the Labour Party conference, to the Government's target of 2010.

The Assembly assumed responsibility for the Home Energy Efficiency Scheme on 1 April this year. We inherited a scheme on which

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Mae'r Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref newydd i Gymru yn rhan o raglen tymor hir i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd, a fydd yn cymryd tua 10 mlynedd i gyrraedd ei nod arfaethedig. Mae ein hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem yn glir yn ôl cynigion y gyllideb ddrafft, sydd yn dangos cynnydd sylweddol o ran arian dros y pedair blynedd nesaf. Bydd yr arian yn cynyddu fesul cam wrth i'r cynllun ymsefydlu. Mae'r ymagwedd hon yn bwysig er mwyn sicrhau y gall y cynllun, sydd yn cynnwys llawer o ymagweddau newydd, gyflawni yn ôl y disgwyl.

Mae'n bwysig ystyried yr adroddiadau am yr oedi cyn cyflwyno'r cynllun yn eu cyd-destun. O gymharu â Lloegr yr ydym yn sôn am fisoedd ar gyfer rhaglen a fydd yn cymryd blynyddoedd i gael effaith yn y ddwy wlad. Cydnabu Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y Deyrnas Unedig hynny ym Medi pan gyfeiriodd at darged y Llywodraeth sef 2010, yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Lafur.

Daeth y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol am y Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref ar 1 Ebrill eleni. Etifeddassom gynllun yr ymgynghorodd

the previous Welsh Office had consulted, based on proposals, and which had an intended introduction date set by the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions. With hindsight, given all the work needed, that date proved impossible to meet. Aware that the development of the new scheme was taking longer than expected, we introduced improvements to the then current scheme inherited from the Government, as part of the incremental introduction of improved assistance for households at risk from the effects of fuel poverty.

That process concludes with, as reported in the media, the start of heating installations on 1 February next year. It has meant that, since 1 April, over 5,000 households in Wales have benefited from improved insulation measures, with 2,766 benefiting before the English scheme was launched in June.

Contrary to reports, our scheme started on 6 November, when the new regulations approved by the Assembly came into force. As of that date, households have been able to apply for assistance under the scheme and, if eligible, their homes will be surveyed, and recommended improvements to the insulation and heating approved. The insulation work can be installed under a transitional arrangement using existing installers from the old scheme, while we complete the tendering process to allow heating installations to start in February.

From that date, households will benefit from a scheme that provides assistance to a wider range of qualifying households than is the case in England. The provision of central heating will be available to the sick, the disabled and single parents with young children, in addition to those over 60 years of age. In England it is only available to the latter category.

3:40 p.m.

Edwina Hart: While regretting that this will necessitate two visits to homes with the

y Swyddfa Gymreig gynt yn ei gylch, yn seiliedig ar gynigion, ac yr oedd iddo ddyddiad cyflwyno arfaethedig a bennwyd gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau. O edrych yn ôl a chan ystyried yr holl waith yr oedd ei angen, yr oedd yn amhosibl ei gyflawni erbyn y dyddiad hwnnw. A ninnau'n ymwybodol ei bod yn cymryd mwy o amser na'r disgwyl i ddatblygu'r cynllun newydd, newidiasom y cynllun cyfredol bryd hynny a etifeddwyd gan y Llywodraeth, fel rhan o'r broses o gyflwyno cymorth fesul cam i gartref sydd mewn perygl oherwydd effeithiau tloidi tanwydd.

Daw'r broses honno i ben, fel y nodwyd yn y cyfryngau, drwy ddechrau gosod cyfarpar gwresogi ar 1 Chwefror y flwyddyn nesaf. Golygai fod dros 5,000 o gartrefi yng Nghymru wedi elwa ar well mesurau inswleiddio ers 1 Ebrill, gyda 2,766 yn elwa cyn i'r cynllun gael ei lansio yn Lloegr ym Mehefin.

Yn wahanol i'r adroddiadau, dechreuodd ein cynllun ar 6 Tachwedd, pan ddaeth y rheoliadau newydd a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad i rym. Ers hynny bu modd i gartrefi wneud cais am gymorth o dan y cynllun ac, os ydynt yn gymwys, arolygir eu cartrefi, a chymeradwyir y newidiadau i'r cyfarpar inswleiddio a gwresogi a argymhellir. Gellir gosod y cyfarpar inswleiddio o dan drefniant dros dro gan ddefnyddio gweithwyr gosod o'r hen gynllun, tra byddwn yn cwblhau'r broses dendro i ganiatáu i gyfarpar gwresogi gael eu gosod ym Chwefror.

O hynny ymlaen, bydd cartrefi yn elwa ar gynllun sydd yn rhoi cymorth i ystod ehangach o gartrefi cymwys nag yn Lloegr. Bydd darpariaeth gwres canolog ar gael i bobl sâl, yr anabl a rhieni sengl â phlant ifanc, yn ogystal â phobl dros 60 oed. Yn Lloegr, ni fydd ar gael ond i'r categori olaf.

Edwina Hart: Er ei bod yn anffodus y bydd hyn yn golygu dau ymweliad â chartrefi ac na

heating element missing this winter, help through improved insulation is available now. In spite of the delay no pensioner need be without assistance towards heating this winter. There are other forms of assistance, such as the home repair assistance, available through local authorities, on which the local care and repair agency will be able to advise.

When introducing any new major scheme, it takes time to establish it and to resolve teething troubles and fine-tune. As a result of the experience gained in England since June, we believe that we will achieve a smoother transition from the old to the new, which has been widely welcomed by the industry.

William Graham: This scheme received all-party support from the moment it was announced by Peter Law on 28 February. His press release at that time clearly stressed that the scheme would commence on 1 June 2000. However, the full benefits of this scheme will not be available until February 2001, months after it was announced and eight months behind its implementation in England. Given that this scheme had all-party support, why was there a delay in submitting the regulations? Why has it taken until September to agree who should run the scheme and why did it take so long for the tenders to be submitted? Why, when the regulations came into effect on 6 November, will it take a further four months—long and cold winter months—before the full benefits may be realised in Wales? Is it because, in the words of your Government colleague, Peter Black, who when asked about the delay in this scheme, which is already available in England, replied:

‘This is not England; this is Wales, and we will do things in our own way and in accordance with the regulations that we have drawn up, which are distinctively Welsh and different to those in England.’

The reality of those remarks is that your Government has badly let down disadvantaged people. What are you going to do about it?

fydd yr elfen wresogi ar gael y gaeaf hwn, mae cymorth ar gael yn awr o ran gwell cyfarpar inswleiddio. Er gwaethaf yr oedi ni fydd angen i'r un pensiynwr gael ei amddifadu o gymorth gwresogi y gaeaf hwn. Mae mathau eraill o gymorth ar gael drwy'r awdurdodau lleol, fel cymorth trwsio tŷ, y bydd yr asiantaeth gofal a thrwsio lleol yn gallu rhoi gwybodaeth yn ei gylch.

Wrth gyflwyno unrhyw gynllun newydd o bwys, mae'n cymryd amser i'w sefydlu a datrys mân broblemau a'i fireinio. O ganlyniad i'r profiad a gafwyd yn Lloegr ers Mehefin, credwn y gallwn symud yn fwy esmwyth o'r hen gynllun i'r un newydd y mae'r diwydiant wedi ei groesawu'n fawr.

William Graham: Cafodd y cynllun hwn gefnogaeth gan bob plaid o'r funud y'i cyhoeddwyd gan Peter Law ar 28 Chwefror. Pwysleisiodd ei ddatganiad i'r wasg ar y pryd y byddai'r cynllun yn dechrau ar 1 Mehefin 2000. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd buddion llawn y cynllun hwn ar gael tan Chwefror 2001, fisoedd ar ôl iddo gael ei gyhoeddi ac wyth mis yn ddiweddarach na'r cynllun yn Lloegr. O gofio bod pob plaid wedi cefnogi'r cynllun hwn, pam y bu oedi cyn cyflwyno'r rheoliadau? Pam nad oedd yn bosibl cytuno ar bwy a ddylai drefnu'r cynllun tan fis Medi a pham y cymerodd gymaint o amser i dendrau gael eu cyflwyno? Pam y bydd yn cymryd pedwar mis arall—misoedd hirfaith, oer y gaeaf—cyn i bobl yng Nghymru fanteisio ar yr holl fuddion, er i'r rheoliadau ddod i rym ar 6 Tachwedd? Ai'r rheswm dros hyn yw, yng ngeiriau un o gyd-Aelodau'ch Llywodraeth, Peter Black, a atebodd ar ôl cael ei holi ynglŷn â'r oedi yn y cynllun, a oedd eisoes ar gael yn Lloegr:

‘Nid Lloegr sydd dan sylw yma ond Cymru, a byddwn yn gwneud pethau yn ein ffordd ni ein hunain ac yn unol â'r rheoliadau a luniwyd, sydd yn nodweddiadol Gymreig ac yn wahanol i'r rheini yn Lloegr.’

Y gwir am y sylwadau hyn yw bod eich Llywodraeth wedi siomi pobl ddifreintiedig yn arw. Beth a wnewch ynglŷn â hynny?

Edwina Hart: We have not badly let down anybody. As I indicated to you, we made arrangements for a transitional scheme. I am only sorry that the scheme that is outlined will not be fully implemented until February. Part of the delay in implementing the scheme was due to the fact that we only received one tender for the scheme manager. Extensive discussions and analysis are required to consider value for money when you only receive one tender. The transitional approach to the introduction of the scheme has allayed some of the fears of the industry. As soon as I was made aware of the issues relating to this, I discussed them with my colleague, Peter Black, and I have made every effort to ensure that something like this will not happen again.

Janet Davies: Thank you for your statement, Minister. Do you agree that silver words are not an adequate substitute for action and delivery? I have taken on board what you said about having a hold-over programme and using the old scheme in the meantime. However, do you agree that this scheme is important to pensioners and others because insulation and central heating have a massive effect on preventing illness during the winter? They can even prevent death, when you consider the effects of hypothermia and pneumonia.

On another point, in the third paragraph, there is an ambiguous statement about governments. Can you explain to which governments you refer?

Despite your assurances that the old schemes will continue in the interim, the fact that this new scheme is being introduced must say that it is an improvement on the old schemes. Is the fact that it is not being introduced quickly due to incompetence? If so, has appropriate action been taken or is the delay really due to political fears that too little money was allocated to the scheme in this year's budget and, therefore, an attempt to cover up political embarrassment? I note that the original baseline of £8.9 million was reduced to £6.4 million for this year. There will possibly be a shortfall.

Edwina Hart: Nid ydym wedi siomi neb yn arw. Fel y dywedais wrthyhych, gwnaethom drefniadau ar gyfer cynllun trosiannol. Yr unig beth sydd yn edifar gennyf yw na chaiff y cynllun a amlinellir ei weithredu'n llawn tan Chwefror. Un o'r rhesymau dros y oedi cyn gweithredu'r cynllun oedd y ffaith mai dim ond un tendr ar gyfer rheolwr y cynllun a gawsom. Mae angen trafodaethau a dadansoddi helaeth er mwyn ystyried gwerth am arian lle na cheir ond un tendr. Mae'r ymagwedd drosiannol tuag at gyflwyno'r cynllun wedi lleddfu rhai o ofnau'r diwydiant. Cyn gynted ag yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r materion hyn, fe'u trafodais â'm cyd-Aelod, Peter Black, a gwneuthum bob ymdrech i sicrhau na fydd rhyw beth tebyg yn digwydd byth eto.

Janet Davies: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. A gytunwch na all geiriau teg gymryd lle gweithredu a chyflawni? Gwrandewais ar yr hyn a ddywedasoch ynglŷn â chael rhaglen dros dro a defnyddio'r hen gynllun yn y cyfamser. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch fod y cynllun hwn yn bwysig i bensiynwyr a phobl eraill am fod cyfarpar inswleiddio a gwres canolog yn cael effaith sylweddol o ran atal salwch yn ystod y gaeaf? Gallant hyd yn oed atal marwolaeth, o ystyried effeithiau hypothermia a niwmonia.

Ar bwynt arall, yn y trydydd paragraff, mae datganiad amwys ynglŷn â llywodraethau. A allwch egluro pa lywodraethau y cyfeirir atynt?

Er gwaethaf eich sicrwydd y bydd yr hen gynlluniau'n parhau yn y cyfamser, mae'r ffaith bod y cynllun newydd hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno yn golygu wrth reswm ei fod yn well na'r hen gynlluniau. A yw'n wir nad yw'n cael ei gyflwyno mor gyflym oherwydd anfedrusrwydd? Os felly, a gymerwyd camau priodol neu ai ofnau gwleidyddol na ddyrannwyd digon o arian i'r cynllun yn y gyllideb eleni oedd y gwir reswm dros yr oedi, ac felly mae'n ymgais i guddio embaras gwleidyddol? Nodais i'r gyllideb wreiddiol o £8.9 miliwn gael ei ostwng i £6.4 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn newydd. Bydd diffyg arian o bosibl.

How will you implement this scheme? Have councils been given information about it and when were they given that information? What machinery has been set up and have pensioners in Wales been informed about it by the National Assembly or have they been left to find out about this scheme from over the border?

Edwina Hart: You have raised several questions and I hope I can pick up on all of them. I need to go through the history of the scheme and the timetable of events to put some flesh on the bones. The consultation period ended on 31 August 1999 and we had analysed responses by December 1999. An amended scheme was submitted and it went to the Local Government and Housing Committee in February 2000. Peter Law launched the final scheme on 28 February 2000. We then commissioned new draft regulations in respect of that. Tenders were invited in March 2000. The current scheme was revised by the Assembly to increase the grant limit and provide more insulation measures as an interim step in April 2000.

Tenders were received in May 2000. A Plenary debate on the scheme was held on 16 May. The tender evaluation was completed and I have indicated the problems with the tender because there are a number of procurement issues involved in this. The tender was approved by Peter Law in September 2000 when the Eaga Partnership Limited was appointed, and the new regulations were debated on 6 November. There have been unforeseeable circumstances. On finance terms, we are committed to tackling fuel poverty. That has been shown in the baseline increases in the budget. Over 5,000 households have benefited from additional insulation measures under the old scheme from 1 April this year. 'Betterwales.com' set a target of helping 30,000 households by 2003 and I am confident that we will achieve that. Households can now apply, they will be assessed and insulation will be installed now, with heating to follow after 1 February 2001. I will make further inquiries of my

Sut y byddwch yn gweithredu'r cynllun hwn? A yw'r cynghorau wedi cael gwybod amdano a phryd y cawsant yr wybodaeth honno? Pa ddulliau gweithredu a sefydlwyd ac a yw pensïynwyr yng Nghymru wedi cael gwybod gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol neu a oeddent yn gorfod cael gwybodaeth am y cynllun hwn o Loegr?

Edwina Hart: Codasoch sawl cwestiwn a gobeithiaf y gallaf drafod pob un. Bydd angen imi adrodd hanes y cynllun ac amserlen y digwyddiadau er mwyn ichi gael ddeall ychydig o'r manylion. Daeth y cyfnod ymgynghori i ben ar 31 Awst 1999 a dadansoddwyd yr ymatebion gennym erbyn Rhagfyr 1999. Cyflwynwyd cynllun diwygiedig a drafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn Chwefror 2000. Lansiodd y cynllun terfynol gan Peter Law ar 28 Chwefror 2000. Yna comisiynwyd rheoliadau drafft newydd ynglŷn â hynny. Gofynnwyd am dendrau ym Mawrth 2000. Diwygiodd y Cynulliad y cynllun presennol i gynyddu terfyn y grant a darparu mwy o fesurau inswleiddio fel cam interim yn Ebrill 2000.

Cafwyd tendrau ym Mai 2000. Cynhaliwyd dadl ar y cynllun yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 16 Mai. Cwblhawyd y broses o werthuso'r tendrau a nodais fod problemau o ran y tendr am fod nifer o faterion caffael yn gysylltiedig â hyn. Cymeradwyodd Peter Law y tendr ym Medi 2000 pan benodwyd Eaga Partnership Cyfyngedig, a thrafodwyd y rheoliadau newydd ar 6 Tachwedd. Bu amgylchiadau na ellid eu rhagweld. O ran cyllid, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd. Profwyd hynny gan y cynnydd yn y llinell waelodol yn y gyllideb. Mae mwy na 5,000 o gartrefi wedi elwa ar y mesurau inswleiddio ychwanegol o dan yr hen gynllun o 1 Ebrill eleni. Pennwyd targed o helpu 30,000 o gartrefi erbyn 2003 yn 'Gwellycymru.com' ac yr wyf yn hyderus y cyflawnwn hynny. Gall cartrefi bellach wneud cais, fe'u hasesir a chaiff cyfarpar inswleiddio eu gosod yn awr, gyda chyfarpar gwresogi i ddilyn ar ôl 1 Chwefror 2001. Holaf fy swyddogion ymhellach ynglŷn â'r cyhoeddusrwydd ar gyfer y cynllun hwn,

officials on the publicity for this scheme, Janet, and what arrangements have been made in respect of local government and organisations to advertise it. When I respond to you, I will also make a general response and update Members on that.

Our scheme provides a greater range of assistance than England's. It is not only for pensioners; it is for the sick and disabled and lone parents with young children. That is important. The scheme also ensures that pensioners in high crime areas will also receive security measures. It is a far better scheme. I wish that all these problems with the scheme, the negotiation, the contract and so on, could have been dealt with differently, but they were not. All I can say is that this is a good scheme and it will be implemented on target. I am sorry for any disappointment caused by that fact that it has not been implemented already.

Pauline Jarman: In your statement, you are eager to emphasise that the scheme, when introduced, will provide central heating for sick and disabled people and single parents. However, the penultimate paragraph refers to the home repair assistance grant. Would you care to re-examine the information that you have been given, because it is, as it says, a repair facility? It does not provide for new central heating. Other than it being part of a disabled facilities grant, there is no way that the home repair assistance grant can provide new central heating for all those people for which the new scheme will provide.

Edwina Hart: That is correct. That penultimate paragraph refers to general assistance in those terms. Also, I recognise that I did not deal with Janet's earlier point about targets in paragraph 3. If John Prescott makes statements on targets, they are national Government targets.

Janet, a pha drefniadau a wnaethpwyd o safbwynt llywodraeth leol a sefydliadau yn ei hysbysebu. Pan ymatebaf ichi, byddaf hefyd yn rhoi ymateb cyffredinol a'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau am hynny.

Mae ein cynllun yn rhoi ystod ehangach o gymorth na chynllun Lloegr. Darpara nid yn unig ar gyfer pensïynwyr; darpara ar gyfer pobl sâl ac anabl a rhieni sengl â phlant ifanc. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'r cynllun hefyd yn sicrhau y caiff pensïynwyr mewn ardaloedd o drosedd uchel fesurau diogelwch hefyd. Mae'n gynllun llawer gwell. Edifarhaf na ellid bod wedi ymdrin â'r holl broblemau hyn o ran y cynllun, y broses negodi, y contract ac ati mewn ffordd wahanol, ond ni fu felly. Y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud yw bod hwn yn gynllun da ac y caiff ei weithredu yn unol â'r amserlen. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am unrhyw siom am na chafodd ei weithredu eisoes.

Pauline Jarman: Yn eich datganiad, yr ydych yn awyddus i bwysleisio'r ffaith y bydd y cynllun, ar ôl ei gyflwyno, yn darparu gwres canolog i bobl sâl ac anabl a rhieni sengl. Fodd bynnag, cyfeiria'r paragraff olaf ond un at y grant cymorth trwsio tŷ. A hoffech ailystyried yr wybodaeth a roesoch, am ei fod, fel y noda, yn gyfleuster trwsio? Nid yw'n darparu ar gyfer systemau gwres canolog newydd. Ar wahân i'r ffaith ei bod yn rhan o'r grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl, nid oes modd y gall y grant cymorth trwsio tŷ ddarparu system gwres canolog newydd i'r holl bobl y bydd y cynllun newydd yn darparu ar eu cyfer.

Edwina Hart: Mae hynny'n wir. Cyfeiria'r paragraff olaf ond un at y cymorth cyffredinol yn y termau hynny. Hefyd, cydnabyddaf imi beidio ag ymdrin â phwynt cynharach Janet ynglŷn â thargedau ym mharagraff 3. Pan fydd John Prescott yn gwneud datganiad ar dargedau, targedau cenedlaethol y Llywodraeth ydynt.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Elin Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 18. Holaf y Llywydd am

Elin Jones: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 18. I ask the Presiding

ei farn ynglŷn â chamddyfynnu o Gofnod y Trafodion. Cyfieiriaf yn benodol at sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog yn ystod cwestiynau, pan soniodd fy mod wedi cyfeirio, bythefnos yn ôl, at Carwyn Jones yn mynychu Cyngor y Gweinidogion y tu ôl i sgertiau Nick Brown. Ni chyfeiriais erioed at sgertiau Nick Brown, a bydd Cofnod y Trafodion yn cadarnhau hynny. Ddwywaith erioed y clywais unrhyw un yn cyfeirio at sgertiau Nick Brown, a Phrif Weinidog Cymru ei hun oedd hwnnw y prynhawn yma yn ystod cwestiynau, a'r wythnos diwethaf mewn darlith gyhoeddus yn Aberystwyth. Yr wyf yn syrffedu ar y camddyfynnu parhaus hwn gan Brif Weinidog Cymru. Anfonais gopi ato o'r Cofnod sydd yn cynnwys y sylwadau hynny, ond ni chefais ateb. Nid wyf yn deall pa bwynt y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ceisio'i wneud, ond nid yw hynny'n brofiad anghyffredin. Fodd bynnag, beth bynnag yw'r pwynt, camarweiniodd y Cynulliad ynglŷn â'm geiriau, a gwerthfawrogwn eich sylwadau ar hynny, Lywydd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ymddiheuraf os wyf wedi eich camddyfynnu. Dyfynnu o'm cof yr oeddwn. Ni roddodd Elin union eiriad yr hyn a ddywedodd hi, ond dyfynnu o'm cof yr oeddwn. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl ei bod yn gyd-ddigwyddiad bod Jane Davidson yn arwain dirprwyaeth ar yr union adeg pan oedd Elin yn cwyno nad oedd ein Gweinidogion byth yn arwain dirprwyaethau. Yr oedd yn gam ymlaen yn gyfansoddiadol ar yr union adeg yr oeddech chi'n cwyno nad oedd hynny byth yn digwydd oherwydd ein gwendid ni. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai dyna oedd y pwynt. Os yr wyf wedi camddyfynnu, ymddiheuraf. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o fod wedi derbyn eich llythyr, Elin, ond edrychaf i mewn i'r peth.

3:50 p.m.

Elin Jones: Yr oedd y llythyr yn Gymraeg, gyda llaw.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r pwynt yn sefyll. Yr oedd eich pwynt yn gamarweiniol oherwydd, drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad, yr oedd Jane

Officer about his view on misquoting from the Record of Proceedings. I refer specifically to the First Minister's comments during questions, when he mentioned that I had referred a fortnight ago to Carwyn Jones attending the Council of Ministers under Nick Brown's skirts. I have never referred to Nick Brown's skirts, and the Record of Proceedings will confirm that. I have only twice ever heard anyone referring to Nick Brown's skirts and that was the First Minister himself in today's question session, and last week in a public lecture in Aberystwyth. I am fed up of this continual misquoting by the First Minister. I have sent him a copy of the Record that includes those comments, but I have not received a response. I do not understand what point the First Minister is trying to make, but that is not unusual. However, whatever the point is, he has misled this Assembly as regards my words, and I would appreciate your comments on that, Presiding Officer.

The First Minister: Further to that point of order, I apologise if I have misquoted you. I was quoting from memory. Elin did not give the exact wording of what she said, I was quoting from memory. I thought that it was a coincidence that Jane Davidson was leading a delegation at the very moment when Elin was complaining that our Ministers never lead delegations. It was a step forward constitutionally, just as you were complaining that that never happened because of our weakness. I thought that that was the point. If I have misquoted, I apologise. I am not aware of having received your letter, Elin, but I will look into it.

Elin Jones: The letter was in Welsh, by the way.

The First Minister: The point remains. Your point was misleading because, by coincidence, Jane Davidson was leading a

Davidson yn arwain dirprwyaeth yng Nghyngor y Gweinidogion am y tro cyntaf ar yr adeg yr oeddech chi'n cwyno bod sefydliadau llywodraethol eraill y Deyrnas Unedig yn haeddu arwain dirprwyaethau i Gyngor Gweinidogion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ymateb graslon. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Cofnod y Trafodion, fel arfer, yn adlewyrchu'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn y sesiwn yn gywir.

Glyn Davies: I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 7.2, which refers to offensive language in this Chamber, specifically because of the use of the word xenophobic by Dr Richard Edwards, who has now left the Chamber. I was offended by how he used that word to describe the Welsh Conservatives. My position in supporting Peter Rogers was based on the public health of the people of Wales and not on xenophobia. I was offended by Dr Edwards's comment but I was more offended and outraged by its repetition by the First Minister. I did not mind his reference to the Union Jack because I am proud to be wrapped in the Union Jack and the Welsh flag. Accusing the Welsh Conservatives of xenophobia from that podium was outrageous. It is another example of the First Minister's sometimes snide and ill-considered remarks, which demonstrates the lack of leadership and dignity that he sometimes shows in his position.

The First Minister: Further to that point of order, when he reads the Record tomorrow morning he will see that I made no reference to xenophobic Conservatives.

Cynog Dafis: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gofynnaf inni fod ychydig yn fwy eang yn ein diffiniad o'r hyn sydd yn iaith amhriodol ac anwedus yn y lle hwn. Mae perygl y deugn i sefyllfa lle na fyddwn yn gallu siarad yn blaen a chyhuddgar am safbwyntiau pobl eraill. Dylem allu disgrifio iaith a syniadau fel rhai senoffobig a dylai fod modd inni ddefnyddio'r gair '*offensive*' os ydym yn credu bod syniadau rhywun yn

delegation in the Council of Ministers for the first time at the time you were complaining that other United Kingdom government organisations deserve to lead delegations to the European Union Council of Ministers.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the First Minister for his gracious reply. I am certain that the Record of Proceedings, as always, will accurately reflect what was said in the session.

Glyn Davies: Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2, sydd yn cyfeirio at iaith sydd yn peri tramgwydd yn y Siambr hon, yn benodol oherwydd y defnydd o'r gair senoffobig gan Dr Richard Edwards, sydd wedi gadael y Siambr bellach. Fe'm sarhawyd gan y ffordd y defnyddiodd y gair hwnnw i ddisgrifio Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Yr oedd fy safbwynt wrth gefnogi Peter Rogers yn seiliedig ar iechyd cyhoeddus pobl Cymru ac nid ar senoffobia. Fe'm sarhawyd gan sylw Dr Edwards ond fe'm sarhawyd a'm gwylltio'n fwy oherwydd i'r Prif Weinidog ei ailadrodd. Nid oedd ei gyfeiriad at Jac yr Undeb yn fy mhoeni oherwydd fy mod yn falch o chwifio Jac yr Undeb a baner Cymru. Yr oedd cyhuddo Ceidwadwyr Cymru o senoffobia o'r llwyfan hwnnw yn warthus. Dyma enghraifft arall o sylwadau Prif Weinidog Cymru sydd yn goeglyd a diystyriol ar adegau, sydd yn dangos y diffyg arweinyddiaeth ac urddas a ddengys weithiau yn ei swydd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, pan ddarllena'r Cofnod bore yfory gwêl na wneuthum unrhyw gyfeiriad at Geidwadwyr senoffobig.

Cynog Dafis: Further to that point of order, I ask that we be slightly broader in our definition of what is inappropriate and unbecoming language in this place. There is a danger that we will reach a situation where we will not be able to speak frankly and in an accusatory manner about other people's standpoints. We should be able to describe language and ideas as xenophobic and we should be able to use the word '*offensive*' if

offensive. Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn mynd i eithafion yn ein defnydd o iaith ond, ar y llaw arall, byddai'n drueni pe byddem yn cael ein cyfyngu gan orgwrteisi i'r fath raddau fel bod arnom ofn beirniadu unrhyw un.

Helen Mary Jones: Further to that point of order, I support Cynog Dafis's point. I have just accepted with good grace being described as a statesman. Nobody could describe me as a man by any stretch of the imagination.

David Davies: Further to that point of order, I wish to point out that in that discussion the words 'alien' and 'divisive' were also used about the previous Conservative Government. Richard Edwards described the Conservative Party as 'xenophobic' and when the Conservative Leader spoke, cries of 'rubbish' were heard from Brian Gibbons. I am—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I think that we should at least deal with points of order in an orderly manner.

David Davies: I am comfortable with a robust style of politics, but I would like to see some consistency. In the past, I have been severely criticised, as has the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives, for using terms that, I think, are far less controversial than those that we have heard today. We should all be treated in the same fashion so I ask for your consistency and for consistent rulings on this. On the subject of consistency, I must say that I found the comments about the 18 years of Conservative Government incredible given that 18 years ago that man's own party was nationalising industry—

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is not a point of order. I always seek consistency and do not always achieve it. I have recourse therefore, to the Record to ensure that we are as consistent as possible and I take advice on these matters. I take particular exception to words that are directed at Assembly Members. I did not hear the accusation that any Assembly Member of any party group

we believe that someone's ideas are offensive. It is important that we do not go to extremes in our use of language but, on the other hand, it would be a shame if we were restricted by over-courteousness to such an extent that we were afraid to criticise anybody.

Helen Mary Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cefnogaf bwynt Cynog Dafis. Yr wyf newydd dderbyn cael fy nisgrifio fel gwladweinydd yn raslon. Ni allai neb fy ngweld yn wrywaidd waeth faint o ddychymyg sydd ganddynt.

David Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, hoffwn nodi i'r geiriau 'estron' a 'rhaniadol' hefyd gael eu defnyddio i ddisgrifio'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol. Disgrifiodd Richard Edwards y Blaid Geidwadol fel 'senoffobig' a phan siaradodd Arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr, clywyd Brian Gibbons yn gweiddi 'lol'. Yr wyf—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Credaf y dylem o leiaf ymdrin â phwyntiau o drefn mewn modd trefnus.

David Davies: Yr wyf yn gyfforddus ag arddull gadarn o wleidyddiaeth, ond hoffwn weld peth cysondeb. Yn y gorffennol, cefais fy meirniadu'n llym, fel y cafodd Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, am ddefnyddio termau sydd, yn fy marn i, yn llawer llai dadleuol na'r rhai a glywyd heddiw. Dylem oll gael ein trin yn yr un modd felly gofynnaf am eich cysondeb ac am reolau cyson ar hyn. Ar y mater o gysondeb, rhaid imi ddweud i mi gredu bod y sylwadau ar 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol yn anhygoel o ystyried bod plaid y gŵr hwnnw 18 mlynedd yn ôl yn gwladoli diwydiant—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hynny'n bwynt o drefn. Ymdrechaf at gysondeb bob amser ac ni lwyddaf bob tro. Felly trof at y Cofnod i sicrhau ein bod mor gyson â phosibl a derbynïaf gyngor ar y materion hyn. Gwrthwynebaf yn arbennig eiriau a gyfeirir at Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Ni chlywais y cyhuddiad bod unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad o unrhyw blaid yn senoffobig.

was xenophobic.

Glyn Davies: I will check the Record.

The Presiding Officer: I will also check the Record, Glyn. We will ensure, therefore, that robust references—as has been said in this debate—which are part of strong debate, can still be made here. However, they should not be, in my view, personal references that indicate personal discourtesy or offence. That is the line that I have sought to draw. I will review the Record but I did not, on my first hearing, consider that the remarks consisted of disorderly, discriminatory or offensive language, as set out in Standing Orders.

Val Feld: Point of order. This is in a similar vein, under Standing Order No. 7.8 (iv), on discourteous and unbecoming conduct. We have returned to this issue several times over recent weeks, particularly since the signing of the partnership agreement. I ask you to take away and consider our statutory obligation to have due regard for equal opportunities in everything that we do, in relation to how this Chamber operates, not all of the time but some of the time.

This afternoon was another occasion when there was a clear gender divide. Much heckling came from men in the opposition parties. I was sad to hear it also coming from men in my party. That is taking us down a road that is very much akin to Westminster-style politics. You will note, when you look at the Record, that during the last debate, which lasted about 50 minutes, only two women rose to speak. That is a matter of great concern for us in terms of trying to establish a debating Chamber where robust argument takes place, but where everybody feels equally able to contribute and confident in knowing that their views will be heard. I ask you to take this matter away and consider the current guidance and whether it is appropriate.

Alun Cairns: Further to that point of order, I would hope that, when Members raise points of order, they should relate them to specific

Glyn Davies: Byddaf yn gwirio'r Cofnod.

Y Llywydd: Byddaf innau hefyd yn gwirio'r Cofnod, Glyn. Felly, byddwn yn sicrhau y gellir parhau i wneud cyfeiriadau cryf yma—fel y dywedwyd yn y drafodaeth hon—sydd yn rhan o drafodaeth gref. Fodd bynnag, yn fy marn i, ni ddylent fod yn gyfeiriadau personol sydd yn nodi anghwrteisi neu sarhad personol. Dyna'r llinell yr ymdrechais i'w thynnu. Byddaf yn adolygu'r Cofnod ond ni ystyriais, y tro cyntaf i mi glywed hyn, fod y sylwadau yn cynnwys iaith sydd yn groes i'r drefn, yn camwahaniaethu neu'n peri tramgwydd, fel y nodir yn y Rheolau Sefydlog.

Val Feld: Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn ar yr un trywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.8 (iv), ar ymddygiad anghwrtais ac amhriodol. Dychwelwyd at y mater hwn sawl gwaith dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, yn enwedig ers llofnodi'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Gofynnaf i chi fynd ymaith ac ystyried ein cyfrifoldeb statudol i ystyried cyfleoedd cyfartal ym mhopeth a wnawn, o ran y ffordd y mae'r Siambr hon yn gweithredu, nid drwy'r amser ond peth o'r amser.

Yr oedd achlysur arall y prynhawn yma pan gafwyd gwhaniaeth amlwg rhwng y menywod a'r dynion. Daeth y rhan fwyaf o'r heclo gan ddynion yn y gwrthbleidiau. Cefais fy siomi hefyd i'w glywed yn dod gan ddynion yn fy mhlaid i. Mae hynny'n ein harwain i lawr llwybr tebyg iawn i arddull gwleidyddiaeth San Steffan. Nodwch, pan edrychwch ar y Cofnod, yn ystod y ddadl ddiwethaf, a barhaodd am tua 50 munud, mai dim ond dwy fenyw a gododd i siarad. Mae hynny yn fater o bryder mawr inni o ran ceisio sefydlu Siambr drafod lle ceir dadlau cryf, ond lle teimla pawb fel ei gilydd y gallant gyfrannu a'u bod yn hyderus o wybod y caiff eu barn ei glywed. Gofynnaf i chi gymryd y mater hwn ac ystyried yr arweiniad presennol a pha un ai a yw'n briodol.

Alun Cairns: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, gobeithio, pan gwyd Aelodau bwyntiau o drefn, dylent eu cysylltu â

incidents rather than to a debate in general. I seek your guidance on that.

Gareth Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cyfeiriodd Val Feld at ddadl yr ydym newydd ei chael. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, nid dadl a gawsom, dim ond ymateb i ddatganiad. Mae dryswch ynglŷn â hyn, a hoffwn gael eglurhad ar beth yw'r disgwyliadau a beth yw'r sefyllfa pan wneir datganiadau o'r fath.

Alison Halford: Further to that point of order, I agree with Val Feld. I used the words 'bullying', 'boorish' and 'backbiting' and had to wait patiently while colleagues in front of me booed, jeered and shouted. I do not mind being booed, jeered and shouted at by certain people who should know how to behave better, but it does not do anything for the quality of debate or what people think of how we perform as a National Assembly. Difficult as your job is, Presiding Officer, you must take control of some of the more boorish, bullying and backbiting elements of our colleagues.

The Presiding Officer: I have been invited by Val Feld to review how the Standing Orders and, in particular, our obligation to equality are being carried through. I will certainly do that. I am torn between trying to ensure orderly debate and trying not to be authoritarian in the Chair. I try to call Members to speak so as to ensure a mix of party political viewpoint and of gender. I tried to do so in the previous debate and I am sorry if that did not seem to happen.

Ar bwynt Gareth ynglŷn â'r gwahaniaeth rhwng datganiad a dadl, mae hwn yn fater o gryn ofid imi. Yn ôl y Rheolau Sefydlog, dadl yw dadl a datganiad yw datganiad. Mae dadl yn golygu gwneud areithiau o hyd cymhedrol, hynny yw, ddim mwy na phum munud. Mae datganiadau yn arwain at gwestiynau. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi arfer caniatáu ychydig bach mwy o amser i brif lefaryddion y pleidiau wneud eu pwyntiau, er mwyn iddynt ragymadroddi ychydig, ond dim gormod, cyn gofyn eu cwestiynau. Fodd

digwyddiadau penodol yn hytrach nag at drafodaeth yn gyffredinol. Ceisiaf eich arweiniad ar hynny.

Gareth Jones: Further to that point of order, Val Feld referred to a debate that we have just had. As I understand it, we did not have a debate, only a response to a statement. There is confusion about this, and I would like clarification as to what is expected and what the situation is when such statements are made.

Alison Halford: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cytunaf â Val Feld. Defnyddiais y geiriau 'gormesol', 'anghwrtais' a 'cecrus' a gorfod aros yn amyneddgar tra yr oedd cyd-Aelodau o'm blaen yn bwio, hwtio a gweiddi. Nid oes ots gennyf fod pobl benodol a ddylai wybod sut i ymddwyn yn well yn bwio, hwtio a gweiddi arnaf, ond ni wna les i ansawdd y ddadl nag i'r modd y mae pobl yn meddwl yr ydym yn perfformio fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Er mor anodd yw eich swydd, Lywydd, rhaid i chi reoli rhai o elfennau anghwrtais, gormesol a checrus ein cydweithwyr.

Y Llywydd: Fe'm gwahoddwyd gan Val Feld i adolygu sut y gweithredir y Rheolau Sefydlog ac, yn arbennig, ein hymrwymiad i gydraddoldeb. Gwnaf hynny yn sicr. Caf fy nhynnu rhwng ceisio sicrhau trafodaeth drefnus a cheisio peidio â bod yn awdurdodaidd yn y Gadair. Ceisiaf alw ar Aelodau i siarad er mwyn sicrhau cymysgedd o safbwynt pleidiau gwleidyddol a chenedl. Ceisiais wneud hynny yn y drafodaeth flaenorol ac mae'n ddrwg gennyf os nad ymddengys i hynny ddigwydd.

On Gareth's point about the difference between a statement and a debate, this is a matter of considerable concern to me. Under the Standing Orders, a debate is a debate and a statement is a statement. A debate means making speeches of a moderate length, that is, no more than five minutes. Statements lead to questions. However, I have allowed parties' chief spokespeople slightly more time to make their points, so that they can have some preamble, but not too much, before asking their questions. However, I

bynnag, disgwyliaf, wrth inni fynd drwy'r amser sydd ar gael ar gyfer datganiad, i'r cwestiynau finiogi ychydig gan fy mod yn cymryd yn ganiataol fod llawer o'r cwestiynau wedi eu gofyn yn barod.

4:00 p.m.

Yr wyf yn hapus i'r Pwyllgor Busnes, yn eistedd fel pwyllgor i adolygu ein gweithdrefnau, i edrych eto ar y ffordd yr ydym yn trin datganiadau ac i roi cyngor i'r Dirprwy Lywydd a minnau ar y pwynt hwnnw. Fy mwriad bob amser yw sicrhau bod yr Aelodau sydd am ofyn cwestiynau yn cael gwneud hynny a'n bod yn cael cydbwysedd rhwng hynny a chyfle'r Llywodraeth i gyflwyno gwybodaeth i'r Cynulliad.

expect, as we go through the time available for a statement, the questions to become slightly sharper as I presume that many of the questions have already been asked.

I am happy for the Business Committee, sitting as a committee to review our procedures, to look again at the way in which we deal with statements and to give advice to the Deputy Presiding Officer and myself on that point. My intention at all times is to ensure that those Members who wish to ask questions are allowed to do so and that we have a balance between that and the Government's opportunity to present information to the Assembly.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): This is the business statement for the next three weeks. Business on Tuesday 28 November will include a motion to approve the changes to Standing Order No. 6.3 and a debate on the national housing strategy. Business on Thursday 30 November and Tuesday 5 December remains as I reported last week. On 30 November there will be a debate on the strategy to promote health and wellbeing, two further priorities in the programme for government. On Thursday 7 December, business will include a motion to adopt the Assembly's draft budget in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.3 and a motion to approve the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations 2000. Business on Tuesday 12 December will include a motion to approve the in-year adjustments in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.5, a motion to approve regulations under paragraph 6 of Schedule 1 to the Care Standards Act 2000 and a composite motion to approve three items of subordinate legislation. These three Orders will not be debated. On Thursday 14 December, business will include motions to approve two items of subordinate legislation and a debate on the second consultation of

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Dyma'r datganiad busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf. Bydd busnes ar ddydd Mawrth 28 Tachwedd yn cynnwys cynnig i gymeradwyo'r newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 a dadl ar y strategaeth tai genedlaethol. Erys y busnes ar ddydd Iau 30 Tachwedd a dydd Mawrth 5 Rhagfyr fel yr adroddwyd gennyf yr wythnos diwethaf. Ar 30 Tachwedd bydd trafodaeth ar y strategaeth i hyrwyddo iechyd a lles, dwy flaenoriaeth bellach yn y rhaglen ar gyfer llywodraeth. Ar ddydd Iau 7 Rhagfyr, bydd busnes yn cynnwys cynnig i fabwysiadu cyllideb ddrafft y Cynulliad yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.3 a chynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000. Bydd busnes ar ddydd Mawrth 12 Rhagfyr yn cynnwys cynnig i wella addasiadau o fewn y flwyddyn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.5 i gymeradwyo rheoliadau o dan baragraff 6 Amserlen 1 Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a chynnig cyfansawdd i gymeradwyo tair eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth. Ni ddadleuir y tair Rheol hon. Ar ddydd Iau 14 Rhagfyr, bydd busnes yn cynnwys cynigion i gymeradwyo dwy eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth a dadl ar ail ymgynghoriad y fenter Rhoi Cymunedau'n

the Communities First initiative.

Members should note that the Queen's Speech will be made in Parliament at Westminster on 6 December and it is anticipated that time will be made available to debate it in Plenary during the last week covered by this statement, before the Assembly rises. I will inform the Business Committee as soon as the date has been agreed.

I point out again that the timings against the items of business on my statement are indicative only. A certain amount of time needs to be allowed to make provisions for points of order, urgent questions and Government statements. As I pointed out to the Business Committee this morning, Government statements are mostly made, if not in the greatest majority of cases, in response to urgent questions under Standing Order No. 6.31. Business is a matter of trying to juggle various items in Plenary during the term.

On the advice of the Business Committee this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined in accordance with Standing Order No. 22.5 that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee. They are the Mink Keeping Order (Wales) 2000 and the Food Safety (General Food Hygiene) (Butchers' Shops) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2000. Arrangements will be made to post a copy of this statement to both the intranet and the internet later today.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. I therefore invite comments on the business statement?

William Graham: I reiterate the comments that I made in the Business Committee this morning. Indignation is not too strong a word to use when the Government brings forward what it sees as such an important programme and trails it first of all through the newspapers and on television. The programme should be brought to the Assembly first. The Assembly should not be treated with such contempt. It is a simple

Gyntaf.

Dylai'r Aelodau nodi y gwneir Araith y Frenhines yn y Senedd yn San Steffan ar 6 Rhagfyr a rhagwelir y rhoddir amser i gynnal dadl arni mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn ystod yr wythnos olaf a gwmpesir gan y drafodaeth hon, cyn i'r Cynulliad godi. Byddaf yn hysbysu'r Pwyllgor Busnes cyn gynted ag y cytunir ar y dyddiad.

Nodaf eto mai amseroedd dangosol yn unig a geir ar gyfer yr eitemau busnes yn fy natganiad. Mae angen caniatáu cyfnod penodol o amser i wneud darpariaethau ar gyfer pwyntiau o drefn, cwestiynau brys a datganiadau'r Llywodraeth. Fel y nodais i'r Pwyllgor Busnes fore heddiw, gwneir datganiadau'r Llywodraeth yn bennaf, os nad yn y mwyafrif o achosion, mewn ymateb i gwestiynau brys o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.31. Mae busnes yn fater o geisio jyglo eitemau amrywiol mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn ystod y tymor.

Ar gyngor y Pwyllgor Busnes fore heddiw, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5 na ddylid cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at Bwyllgor Pwnc sef Gorchymyn Cadw Mincod (Cymru) 2000 a Rheoliadau Diogelwch Bwyd (Hylendid Bwyd yn Gyffredinol) (Siopau Cigyddion) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000. Gwneir trefniadau i roi copi o'r datganiad hwn ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd yn ddiweddarach heddiw.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw rai. Felly estynaf wahoddiad ar gyfer sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

William Graham: Ailadroddaf y sylwadau a wneuthum yn y Pwyllgor Busnes fore heddiw. Nid yw dicter yn air rhy gryf i'w ddefnyddio pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn cyflwyno'r hyn a wêl fel rhaglen mor bwysig â'i llusgo yn gyntaf drwy'r papurau newydd a'r teledu. Dylid cyflwyno'r rhaglen i'r Cynulliad i ddechrau. Ni ddylid trin y Cynulliad â chymaint o ddirmyg. Mae'n fater syml a gofynnwn am yr ystyriaeth honno yn

matter and we ask for that consideration in the future. y dyfodol.

Jocelyn Davies: Following on from that point, will Andrew tell us when the Government intends to schedule the promised debate on the partnership agreement? Will it be next week? There is less than two hours business scheduled for next week and we are supposed to sit here from 2 p.m. until 5.30 p.m. To assist Andrew in that response I have 'Putting Wales First: A Partnership Agreement for the People of Wales' in front of me. I draw his attention to initiative number 4 under the heading 'Better Government: Putting Wales First':

'We will introduce a 'Protocol on Freedom of Information', by the end of 2000, building on existing Assembly practice and going beyond the requirements of the Westminster legislation, to develop a culture of openness and transparency in all of the Assembly's work.'

There are only a few weeks left to fulfil that commitment. Will you assure us that this commitment will apply to the business statement?

Andrew Davies: On William's first question, I refute absolutely any hint of discourtesy on the part of myself or the administration in bringing forward this statement. Standing Order No. 6.8 clearly indicates that it is in order for Assembly Secretaries to come forward to make statements on Government business. Under the protocol agreed with the four parties last year, it was agreed that statements would be given to party business managers 30 minutes before they were made. In this case, we made the information available over 24 hours before Rhodri made the statement today. To answer Jocelyn's and William's questions, I said in the Business Committee this morning that we will debate the partnership agreement, the programme for government and the detailed legislative programme that comes forward with the programme. I gave that commitment to the Business Committee today and I give the same commitment to the Assembly.

Jocelyn Davies: Yn dilyn y pwynt hwnnw, a ddywed Andrew wrthym pryd y bwriada'r Llywodraeth drefnu'r drafodaeth a addawyd ar y cytundeb partneriaeth? A fydd hyn wythnos nesaf? Llai na dwy awr o fusnes a drefnwyd ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf a disgwylir inni eistedd yma rhwng 2 p.m. a 5.30 p.m. I gynorthwyo Andrew yn yr ymateb hwnnw, mae gennyf 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf: Cytundeb Partneriaeth ar gyfer Pobl Cymru' o'm blaen. Tynnaf ei sylw at gynllun rhif 4 o dan y pennawd 'Gwell Llywodraeth: Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf':

'Byddwn yn cyflwyno 'Protocol ar Ryddid Gwybodaeth', erbyn diwedd 2000, gan adeiladu ar drefn bresennol y Cynulliad a mynd y tu hwnt i ofynion deddfwriaeth San Steffan, i ddatblygu diwylliant o fod yn agored a thryloyw yn holl waith y Cynulliad.'

Dim ond ychydig wythnosau sydd ar ôl i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwn. A roddwch sicrwydd inni y bydd yr ymrwymiad hwn yn berthnasol i'r datganiad busnes?

Andrew Davies: Ar gwestiwn cyntaf William, gwrthbrofaf yn llwyr unrhyw awgrym o anghwrteisi ar fy rhan i neu'r weinyddiaeth wrth gyflwyno'r datganiad hwn. Noda Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8 yn glir ei bod mewn trefn i Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad ddod ymlaen i wneud datganiadau ar fusnes y Llywodraeth. O dan y protocol y cytunwyd arno gyda'r pedair plaid y llynedd, cytunwyd y rhoddir y datganiadau i reolwyr busnes y pleidiau 30 munud cyn iddynt gael eu gwneud. Yn yr achos hwn, yr oedd yr wybodaeth ar gael dros 24 awr cyn i Rhodri wneud y datganiad heddiw. I ateb cwestiynau Jocelyn a William, dywedais yn y Pwyllgor Busnes fore heddiw y byddwn yn trafod y cytundeb partneriaeth, y rhaglen ar gyfer y llywodraeth a'r rhaglen ddeddfwriaeth fanwl a gyflwynir gyda'r rhaglen. Rhoddais yr ymrwymiad hwnnw i'r Pwyllgor Busnes heddiw a rhoddaf yr un ymrwymiad i'r Cynulliad.

**Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Athrawon (Cofrestru Gorfodol)
(Cymru) 2000**
**Composite Motion: Approval of the Teachers (Compulsory Registration) (Wales)
Regulations 2000**

Y Llywydd: Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.23A, byddwn yn pleidleisio ar y Gorchymyn hwn heb gynnal dadl.

The Presiding Officer: In accordance with Standing Order No. 22.23A, we will put this Order to a vote without debate.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

(a) approves under Standing Order No.22.23A the following draft Order:

(a) yn cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn drafft canlynol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.23A:

The Teachers (Compulsory Registration)(Wales) Regulations 2000 laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2000; and

Rheoliadau Athrawon (Cofrestru Gorfodol) (Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2000; a

(b) notes the report of the Legislation Committee relating to this draft Order laid in the Table Office on 31 October 2000.

(b) yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft hwn, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Hydref 2000.

*Cynnig: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison

Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Gareth Jones: Datganaf fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig.

Gareth Jones: I declare an interest as a registered teacher.

Y Llywydd: A wnaiff unrhyw Aelodau sydd â buddiant i'w ddatgan sefyll er mwyn i'r Clerc gael nodi eu henwau?

The Presiding Officer: Will any Members with an interest to declare stand so that the Clerk can note their names?

Jane Davidson, Andrew Davies, Mick Bates, Jenny Randerson, Huw Lewis, Christine Chapman, Owen John Thomas, Gareth Jones, Janet Ryder, Michael German *rose—*

Jane Davidson, Andrew Davies, Mick Bates, Jenny Randerson, Huw Lewis, Christine Chapman, Owen John Thomas, Gareth Jones, Janet Ryder, Michael German *a gododd—*

Pauline Jarman: I forgot to declare an interest when I made my previous contribution in response to the statement by the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities.

Pauline Jarman: Anghofiais ddatgan buddiant pan wneuthum fy nghyfraniad blaenorol mewn ymateb i'r datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau.

Dadl ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad Debate on the Report of the Committee on Standards of Conduct

David Melding: I propose that

David Melding: Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, in accordance with *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheolau*

Standing Order Nos. 6.5 and 16.1(v), notes the annual report of the Committee on Standards of Conduct laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2000.

The annual report highlights the Committee's activities and achievements during its first year. This has included establishing a clear procedure for dealing with complaints against Assembly Members and investigating and hearing two complaints referred to the Committee. An independent adviser on standards of conduct was appointed to the Assembly. That appointment was carried out in accordance with the principles used for public appointments, and were accountable and transparent. The selection panel comprised of the Presiding Officer, myself as Chair of the Committee on Standards of Conduct, and Elizabeth Filkin, the Parliamentary Commissioner for Standards. I want to put on record the Committee's thanks to Elizabeth Filkin for her generous and invaluable help during the whole appointment process.

4:10 p.m.

The Assembly appointed Mr Richard Penn as the independent adviser on standards on 15 March. Mr Penn has brought a wealth of experience to the post, including that of being chief executive of a large local authority and an equal opportunities commissioner. I also want to place on record the Committee's thanks to Richard Penn, who has discharged his duties with great diligence and expertise.

The Committee considered and responded to the sixth report of the Committee on Standards in Public Life, also known as the Neill Committee. Our response is included as an annex to the annual report. We conducted a major review of the registration and declaration of Members' interests and the Committee spent a considerable amount of time on this important item. Finally, to illustrate in a more general sense the Committee's role in raising awareness of issues relating to standards of conduct, it published a pocket guide on declarations for Assembly Members and a guide for the public on how to complain.

Sefydlog Rhifau 6.5 a 16.1(v), yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2000.

Amlyga'r adroddiad blynyddol weithgaredd a chyflawniadau'r Pwyllgor yn ystod ei flwyddyn gyntaf. Mae hyn wedi cynnwys sefydlu gweithdrefn glir ar gyfer ymdrin â chwynion yn erbyn Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac archwilio a gwrando ar ddwy gŵyn a gyfeiriwyd i'r Pwyllgor. Penodwyd cynghorydd annibynnol ar safonau ymddygiad i'r Cynulliad. Gweithredwyd y penodiad hwnnw yn unol â'r egwyddorion a ddefnyddir ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus, ac yr oeddent yn atebol a thryloyw. Yr oedd y panel dethol yn cynnwys y Llywydd, minnau fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, ac Elizabeth Filkin, y Comisiynydd Safonau Seneddol. Hoffwn gofnodi diolch y Pwyllgor i Elizabeth Filkin am ei help hael a gwerthfawr yn ystod yr holl broses benodi.

Penododd y Cynulliad Mr Richard Penn fel y cynghorydd annibynnol ar safonau ar 15 Mawrth. Mae Mr Penn wedi dod â phrofiad helaeth i'r swydd, yn cynnwys bod yn brif weithredwr awdurdod lleol mawr a chomisiynydd cyfle cyfartal. Yr wyf hefyd am gofnodi diolch y Pwyllgor i Richard Penn, a gyflawnodd ei ddyletswyddau yn ddiwyd iawn a chyda arbenigedd mawr.

Ystyriodd ac ymatebodd y Pwyllgor i chweched adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Safonau mewn Bywyd Cyhoeddus, a elwir hefyd yn Bwyllgor Neill. Caiff ein hymateb ei gynnwys fel atodiad i'r adroddiad blynyddol. Cynhaliwyd adolygiad mawr o'r broses o gofrestru a datgan buddiannau'r Aelodau a threuliodd y Pwyllgor gyfnod sylweddol o amser ar yr eitem bwysig hon. Yn olaf, i ddangos rôl y Pwyllgor wrth godi ymwybyddiaeth o faterion ym ymwneud â safonau ymddygiad mewn ystyr fwy cyffredinol, cyhoeddodd ganllaw poced ar ddatganiadau ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad a chanllaw ar gyfer y cyhoedd ar sut i gwyno.

As Chair, I commend the Committee's work, particularly its professional and non-partisan method of working. I owe a great debt of gratitude to all Committee members, past and present, for the way in which they have conducted themselves in sometimes difficult deliberations. The Committee was first chaired by Nick Bourne, until November 1999. We are grateful for his work in the first months of the Committee's existence. Karen Sinclair and John Griffiths have also left the Committee. More recent changes, although they are technically outside the remit of this annual report, have seen Janet Davies, Richard Edwards and Val Feld leave the Committee. I state the Committee's thanks for their contribution during their membership. I welcome the new members who have joined the Committee: our first returnee, Karen Sinclair, who is a valuable member, Christine Gwyther and Cynog Dafis.

The Committee has been well served by a dedicated secretariat. I must pay particular thanks to Barbara Wilson, who was the Committee Clerk until September. I am also grateful to the whole team, which is currently led by Julie Grant.

I want to look ahead and discuss the Committee's ongoing work and heavy workload although this is not, strictly speaking, in the scope of the annual report. We are taking forward some significant developments, ensuring that the issues that they raise are properly addressed. A revised guidance on the registration and declaration of Members' interests is due to be published in the new year. We will conduct a review of indirect interests. We want to continue with a programme of awareness raising work. It is important for Assembly Members and the wider public, who will be confident that Members observe the highest ethical standards.

We want to ensure that we work effectively with other Committees, especially in the way that declarations of interests are made, ensuring that that procedure is smooth, effective and well-understood. We also want

Fel Cadeirydd, cymeradwyaf waith y Pwyllgor, yn enwedig ei ddull proffesiynol ac amhleidiol o weithio. Mae fy nyled yn fawr i holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor, gan gynnwys cyn aelodau a'r rhai presennol, am y ffordd y maent wedi ymddwyn mewn trafodaethau a oedd yn anodd ar adegau. Cadeiriwyd y Pwyllgor i ddechrau gan Nick Bourne, tan fis Tachwedd 1999. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am ei waith ym misoedd cyntaf bodolaeth y Pwyllgor. Mae Karen Sinclair a John Griffiths hefyd wedi gadael y Pwyllgor. Gwelodd newidiadau mwy diweddar, er eu bod yn dechnegol y tu allan i gylch gorchwyl yr adroddiad blynyddol hwn, Janet Davies, Richard Edwards a Val Feld yn gadael y Pwyllgor. Nodaf ddiolch y Pwyllgor am eu cyfraniad yn ystod eu haelodaeth. Croesawaf yr aelodau newydd sydd wedi ymuno â'r Pwyllgor: y cyntaf i ddychwelyd, Karen Sinclair, sydd yn aelod gwerthfawr, Christine Gwyther a Cynog Dafis.

Gwasanaethwyd y Pwyllgor yn dda gan ysgrifenyddiaeth ymroddedig. Rhaid imi ddiolch yn arbennig i Barbara Wilson, a oedd yn Glerc i'r Pwyllgor tan fis Medi. Hefyd yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r tîm cyfan, a arweinir ar hyn o bryd gan Julie Grant.

Yr wyf am edrych ymlaen a thrafod gwaith parhaus y Pwyllgor a'r baich gwaith trwm er nad yw hyn, mewn gwirionedd, yng nghwmpas yr adroddiad blynyddol. Yr ydym yn gweithredu rhai datblygiadau sylweddol, gan sicrhau yr ymdrinnir yn briodol â'r materion a godir. Disgwylir cyhoeddi arweiniad diwygiedig ar y broses o gofrestru a datgan buddiannau Aelodau yn y flwyddyn newydd. Byddwn yn cynnal adolygiad o fuddiannau anuniongyrchol. Yr ydym am barhau â rhaglen o waith codi ymwybyddiaeth. Mae'n bwysig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd ehangach, a fydd yn hyderus bod yr Aelodau yn parchu'r safonau moesegol uchaf.

Yr ydym am sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio'n effeithiol â Phwyllgorau eraill, yn enwedig yn y modd y gwneir datganiadau o fuddiant, gan sicrhau bod y weithdrefn honno'n ddiffwdan, yn effeithiol ac y caiff ei deall yn

to make an assessment of the complaints system, especially the handling of complaints at their early stages. We want to ensure that it works efficiently and fairly to the Assembly Members and to the members of the public who are making the complaints.

It is fair to say, from my work, that Assembly Members have observed high standards. We can confidently report to the Assembly in Plenary that the standards have been at least of a satisfactory level. We must have robust and clearly understood structures to ensure that, if any breaches occur, they can be effectively investigated and the appropriate judgments can be made. That is why we have spent so much time on the complaints procedure and on the role of the independent adviser. We have been greatly assisted throughout this process by the Office of the Presiding Officer and by the Presiding Officer. I am grateful to him for the close working relationship that we have had and for the amount of time that he has devoted to this important area of work.

The Committee feels that it is important for Members to have every opportunity to contribute to this debate. We hope that priority will be given to other Assembly Members and the Presiding Officer has indicated that this will be so.

Glyn Davies: Do you agree, David, that it is a sad indictment of this Government that it has left its entire front bench unprotected, showing the low importance that it attaches to this important issue? It ought to be a rule in this place that a proper opposition could take the place of those on the front bench when they are absent. However, I would not want to upset the Llywydd by saying that.

David Melding: I am glad that you are committed to not upsetting anyone in the Chamber. I am sure that the front benchers are paying attention to this issue; they have televisions in their offices, no doubt.

There is a serious point here; the Committee

dda. Yr ydym hefyd am wneud asesiad o'r system gwyno, yn enwedig ymdrin â chwynion yn eu camau cychwynnol. Yr ydym am sicrhau ei bod yn gweithio'n effeithlon ac yn deg i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac aelodau'r cyhoedd sydd yn gwneud y cwynion.

Mae'n deg dweud, o'm gwaith i, bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi parchu safonau uchel. Gallwn adrodd yn hyderus i'r Cynulliad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn bod y safonau wedi bod o lefel foddhaol o leiaf. Rhaid inni gael strwythurau cadarn y gellir eu deall yn glir i sicrhau, os bydd unrhyw dor-rheol yn digwydd, y gellir ymchwilio i'r achos yn effeithiol a ffurfio barn briodol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi treulio cymaint o amser ar y weithdrefn gwyno ac ar rôl y cynghorydd annibynnol. Cawsom gymorth mawr drwy gydol y broses hon gan Swyddfa'r Llywydd a chan y Llywydd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddo am y berthynas waith agos a gawsom ac am yr amser y mae wedi ymroi i'r maes pwysig hwn o waith.

Teimla'r Pwyllgor ei bod yn bwysig i'r Aelodau gael pob cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Gobeithiwn y rhoddir blaenoriaeth i Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad ac mae'r Llywydd wedi nodi y bydd hyn yn digwydd.

Glyn Davies: A gytunwch, David, ei bod yn adlewyrchiad trist o'r Llywodraeth hon ei bod wedi gadael ei fainc flaen gyfan heb ei diogelu, gan ddangos y diffyg pwysigrwydd a roddda i'r mater pwysig hwn? Dylai fod yn rheol yn y lle hwn y gallai gwrthblaid wirioneddol gymryd lle'r rhai hynny ar y fainc flaen pan fyddant yn absennol. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn am achosi gofid i'r Llywydd drwy ddweud hynny.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn ymrwymedig i beidio ag achosi gofid i neb yn y Siambr. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y rhai ar y meinciau blaen yn talu sylw i'r mater hwn; mae ganddynt setiau teledu yn eu swyddfeydd, mae'n siŵr gen i.

Mae pwynt difrifol yma; nid yw'r Pwyllgor

has found no resistance or lack of co-operation from Assembly Members, and that extends to the Executive also. It is important that our work is given a high priority because the public demands the highest standards. The public not only demands the highest standards, but demands that the mechanisms are in place to ensure that the highest standards are demonstrated and made clear.

In conclusion, we hope that other Assembly Members who are not members of the Committee on Standards of Conduct will contribute to this debate. I will try to respond to all the contributions in winding up. Some members of the Committee will also take part, but it is a deliberate policy on our part to ensure that every opportunity is given to others to contribute. We on the Committee have deliberated the issues at great length during our meetings.

I commend the annual report to the Assembly and I hope that Members will recognise and support the importance of the Committee's work.

Richard Edwards: As David mentioned, I have been a member of the Committee on Standards of Conduct but I will no longer be serving on it. I would like to use the occasion of the publication of the first report to reflect on two or three aspects of our Code of Standards for Members that cause me concern.

The first is the vexed issue of declaration of interests. We saw earlier that a few of us have problems with this. As the report makes clear, this is a matter on which the Committee has deliberated repeatedly. Now we have a compromise between the broad approach of Westminster and the far more rigorous regime of local government. It is claimed that the code errs more on the side of local government in that, unlike Westminster or the Scottish Parliament, voting is prohibited if a Member personally stands to gain greater financial advantage than the generality of persons affected by the decision in question. However, how do you gauge that financial advantage? There may be clear-cut circumstances, but there are also

wedi canfod unrhyw wrthwynebiad na diffyg cydweithrediad gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ac mae hynny'n ymestyn i'r Weinyddiaeth hefyd. Mae'n bwysig y rhoddir blaenoriaeth uchel i'n gwaith oherwydd bod y cyhoedd yn mynnu'r safonau uchaf. Mae'r cyhoedd nid yn unig yn mynnu'r safonau uchaf, ond maent yn mynnu y caiff y safonau uchaf eu harddangos a'u gwneud yn glir.

I gloi, gobeithiwn y bydd Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad nad ydynt yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn cyfrannu at y drafodaeth hon. Ceisiaf ymateb i'r holl gyfraniadau wrth gloi. Bydd rhai o'r aelodau Pwyllgor hefyd yn cymryd rhan, ond mae'n bolisi pwrpasol ar ein rhan i sicrhau y rhoddir pob cyfle i eraill gyfrannu. Yr ydym ni ar y Pwyllgor wedi trafod y materion yn drylwyr iawn yn ystod ein cyfarfodydd.

Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad a gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gwaith y Pwyllgor ac yn ei gefnogi.

Richard Edwards: Fel y nododd David, bûm yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ond ni fyddaf yn gwasanaethu arno bellach. Hoffwn ddefnyddio achlysur cyhoeddi'r adroddiad cyntaf i adlewyrchu ar un neu ddau o agweddau ar ein Cod Safonau ar gyfer Aelodau sydd yn peri pryder imi.

Y cyntaf yw'r mater dadleuol o ddatgan buddiant. Gwelsom yn gynharach bod hyn yn broblem i rai ohonom. Fel yr eglura'r adroddiad, mae hwn yn fater y mae'r Pwyllgor wedi ei drafod droeon. Yn awr mae gennym gyfaddawd rhwng ymagwedd eang San Steffan a system llawer mwy trylwyr llywodraeth leol. Honnir bod y codau yn tueddu mwy tuag at ochr llywodraeth leol o ran hynny, yn wahanol i San Steffan neu Senedd yr Alban, caiff pleidleisio ei wahardd os bydd Aelod yn bersonol yn mynd i gael gwell mantais ariannol na'r mwyafrif o bersonau yr effeithir arnynt gan y penderfyniad dan sylw. Fodd bynnag, sut y mesurir y fantais ariannol honno? Efallai y bydd amgylchiadau clir, ond hefyd ceir

circumstances that are grey. I am uneasy about this. Whereas it is a criminal offence to fail to declare an interest, once it is declared, the Member can promote that interest with impunity. That could not happen in local government and, although the Assembly has far wider powers and areas of responsibility than local government, it strikes me as an anomaly. It also gives currency to the perception in local government, and possibly among the public, that less rigorous and, therefore, more questionable ethics apply in this body.

Another tricky issue is the use of Assembly resources, in particular Assembly stationery. The Committee's procedures and resources, as the report points out, are in danger of being abused for party political advantage, or at least perceived advantage, in this regard. The House Committee and you, Llywydd, have approved guidance that Assembly stationery should not be used for party political purposes.

At the moment this is interpreted, and I do not imply any criticism of the independent adviser, as extending to replies to unsolicited correspondence from constituents asking for the Member's party's view or policy on a particular topic. I ask whether that is a reasonable state of affairs. It strikes me as being pretty *Alice in Wonderland*. The more so because, as things stand, it is perfectly in order for regional list Members, serving the equivalent of eight Parliamentary constituencies, to incur vast expenditure at the National Assembly's expense and, therefore, at the taxpayer's expense, by sending letters introducing themselves and their parties and stating their positions in those parties, to constituents on their eighteenth birthdays, using Assembly resources. Doing so in eight parliamentary constituencies over a four-year period means tens of thousands of letters, potentially. Surely, political parties should shoulder that enormous cost, not the Assembly. There is much room to refine the guidance before we arrive at what I would consider to be a sensible and appropriate set of rules for a modern democracy.

amgylchiadau nad ydynt yn glir. Yr wyf yn anghyfforddus ynghylch hyn. Lle y mae'n drosedd i fethu â datgan buddiant, unwaith y bydd wedi'i ddatgan, gall yr Aelod hyrwyddo'r buddiant hwnnw heb gosb. Ni allai hynny ddigwydd mewn llywodraeth leol ac, er bod gan y Llywodraeth bwerau a meysydd cyfrifoldeb llawer ehangach na llywodraeth leol, ymddengys fel anghysondeb i mi. Hefyd bydd yn rhoi sail i'r si o fewn llywodraeth leol, ac o bosibl ymysg y cyhoedd, bod moeseg llai cadarn ac, felly, mwy dadleuol yn berthnasol yn y corff hwn.

Mater anodd arall yw'r defnydd o adnoddau'r Cynulliad, yn arbennig deunydd papur y Cynulliad. Mae gweithdrefnau ac adnoddau'r Pwyllgor, fel y noda'r adroddiad, mewn perygl o gael eu cam-ddefnyddio er budd pleidiau gwleidyddol, neu fudd cydnabyddedig, yn y mater hwn. Mae'r Pwyllgor Tŷ a chithau, Lywydd, wedi cymeradwyo'r arweiniad na ddylid defnyddio deunydd papur y Cynulliad at ddibenion pleidiau gwleidyddol.

Ar hyn o bryd dehonglir hyn, ac nid awgrymaf unrhyw feirniadaeth o'r cynghorydd annibynnol, fel ei fod yn ymestyn i atebion i ohebiaeth digymell gan etholwyr yn gofyn am farn plaid yr Aelod neu bolisi ar bwnc penodol. Gofynnaf a yw hynny'n sefyllfa resymol. Ymddengys fel rhywbeth allan o *Alice in Wonderland* braidd i mi. Yn fwy felly oherwydd, fel y saif pethau, mae'n hollol resymol i'r Aelodau rhestr rhanbarthol, sydd yn gwasanaethu'r hyn sydd yn cyfateb i wyth etholaeth Seneddol, i achosi gwariant mawr ar draul y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac felly, ar draul y trethdalwr, drwy anfon llythyrau yn cyflwyno eu hunain a'u pleidiau a nodi eu swyddi o fewn y pleidiau hynny, i etholaethau ar eu pen-blwydd yn ddeunaw oed, gan ddefnyddio adnoddau'r Cynulliad. Mae gwneud hynny mewn wyth etholaeth seneddol dros gyfnod o bedair blynedd yn golygu posiblwydd o ddegau o filoedd o lythyrau. Yn sicr, y pleidiau gwleidyddol ddylai ysgwyddo'r gost anferthol hon, nid y Cynulliad. Mae llawer o le i goethi'r arweiniad cyn inni ddod i'r hyn y byddwn yn ei ystyried yn set synhwyrol a phriodol o reolau ar gyfer democratiaeth

fodern.

4:20 p.m.

Brian Hancock: As a member of the Committee on Standards of Conduct since the beginning, I support this report and recommend it to the Assembly. I will emphasise points that have already been made.

The Committee, in some respects, had a slow start in getting to grips with understanding the procedures and arrangements. I hope that you agree that the report before you is a reasonable conclusion to our deliberations. Declarations of Members' interests and announcing those interests, and considering the complaints procedures, have been our major work. The cases that we have considered have also been mentioned.

In its work the Committee has striven, and continues to strive, to get to the bottom of cases, and to ascertain the details of every complaint. We strive to be fair and to maintain the confidentiality of allegations against Members, while Members may exploit the situation for publicity purposes. We strive to learn from events to ensure a fair and equitable approach and system. Consequently, we have improved the procedure during the learning curve of the past year, to which this report refers. I support the Committee's work and commend the report to the Assembly.

Peter Black: Hitherto, I have had unrecorded interest in the work of the Committee on Standards of Conduct although, as a member of the House Committee, I have been party to drawing up the guidance to which Richard Edwards referred. In that Committee, I made some of the points that he made about the need for that guidance to be robust and for it to consider the real world in terms of how it should be responded to.

This report is important, as it shows that the Assembly is finding its own way and setting its own standards. It shows that we can learn lessons from other parliaments, including Westminster, but that we are not slavishly

Brian Hancock: Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ers y dechrau, cefnogaf yr adroddiad hwn a byddaf yn ei argymhell i'r Cynulliad. Pwysleisiaf bwyntiau a wnaed eisoes.

Bu'r Pwyllgor, i ryw raddau, yn araf ar y dechrau wrth fynd i'r afael â deall y gweithdrefnau a'r trefniadau. Gobeithio y cytunwch fod yr adroddiad ger eich bron yn gasgliad rhesymol i'n trafodaethau. Bu datgan buddiannau'r Aelodau a chyhoeddi'r buddiannau hynny, ac ystyried y weithdrefn gwyno, yn brif waith inni. Crybwyllwyd hefyd yr achosion a ystyriwyd gennym ni.

Yn ei waith mae'r Pwyllgor wedi ymdrechu, a pharha i ymdrechu, i fynd at wraidd achosion, a chael manylion pob cynw. Ymdrechwn i fod yn deg a chynnal cyfrinachedd cyhuddiadau yn erbyn Aelodau, tra efallai bod Aelodau eraill yn defnyddio'r sefyllfa at ddibenion cyhoeddusrwydd. Ymdrechwn i ddysgu o ddigwyddiadau a sicrhau ymagwedd a system deg a chyfiawn. O ganlyniad, yr ydym wedi gwella'r weithdrefn yn ystod profiad dysgu'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf, y cyfeiria'r adroddiad ato. Cefnogaf waith y Pwyllgor a chymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad.

Peter Black: Hyd yma, yr wyf wedi cael buddiant heb ei gofnodi yng ngwaith y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad er, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Tŷ, cymerais ran yn y gwaith o lunio'r arweiniad y cyfeiriodd Richard Edwards ato. Yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw, gwneuthum rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth ef am yr angen i'r arweiniad hwnnw fod yn gadarn ac iddo ystyried y byd go iawn yn nhermau sut y dylid ymateb iddo.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn bwysig, gan ei fod yn dangos bod y Cynulliad yn canfod ei ffordd ei hun ac yn gosod ei safonau ei hun. Dengys y gallwn ddysgu gwersi gan seneddau eraill, gan gynnwys San Steffan,

following anyone else's lead. My only criticism is that this report was not available in bilingual format on the internet at 2 p.m. today, which is contrary to normal Assembly practice.

Many people have little confidence in politicians. To gain that confidence, we must uphold the highest possible standards of behaviour. The Assembly is a new institution and some people are ready to criticise it. Ensuring that every aspect of our behaviour meets the highest possible standards is the best way to diffuse such criticism. I am glad to see that, so far, the Committee has not found a proven case of misbehaviour by an Assembly Member.

There is concern that many complaints that come to the Committee on Standards of Conduct are relatively minor matters. Some would say that their referral is politically motivated. Nevertheless, they must be considered fully. That can often tie down the Committee and distract it from its other work. We must consider how we can fast-track one-off issues to ensure that we make the best use of the Committee's time. However, we must also balance that against the need to ensure that those issues are investigated and dealt with properly. That is a difficult balancing act, but hopefully one to which David, when he replies to the debate, will refer and perhaps mention how that can be addressed in the coming year.

Setting standards of behaviour is not a simple matter, especially when we talk about activities that have the potential to be classed as criminal offences under the Government of Wales Act 1998. In addition, a new factor that we must bear in mind is the Human Rights Act 1998. In this, we are in the same boat as a host of other public bodies and we all have lessons to learn from each other. For example, it was decided not to oblige Assembly Members to state whether they belonged to a private club because of the implications of the Human Rights Act. Nevertheless, Members are required to

ond nad ydym yn dilyn arweiniad unrhyw un arall yn slafaidd. Fy unig feirniadaeth yw nad oedd yr adroddiad hwn ar gael mewn fformat dwyieithog ar y rhyngwrwyd am 2 p.m. heddiw, sydd yn wahanol i arfer cyffredinol y Cynulliad.

Prin yw'r hyder sydd gan lawer o bobl mewn gwleidyddion. I ennill yr hyder hwnnw, rhaid inni gynnal y safonau ymddygiad uchaf posibl. Mae'r Cynulliad yn sefydliad newydd ac mae rhai pobl yn barod i'w feirniadu. Sicrhau bod pob agwedd ar ein hymddygiad yn cwrdd â'r safonau uchaf posibl yw'r ffordd orau i ddileu beirniadaeth o'r fath. Yr wyf yn falch o weld, hyd yn hyn, nad yw'r Cynulliad wedi canfod achos o gamymddwyn a brofwyd gan Aelod o'r Cynulliad.

Ceir pryder bod nifer o gwynion a ddaw i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn faterion gweddol fach. Byddai rhai yn dweud bod eu cyfeirio yn seiliedig ar gymhelliant gwleidyddol. Serch hynny, rhaid eu hystyried yn llawn. Yn aml gall hynny glymu'r Pwyllgor i lawr a thynnu ei sylw oddi wrth ei waith arall. Rhaid inni ystyried sut y gallwn ddefnyddio dull carlam ar gyfer materion unigryw i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o amser y Pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd gydbwyso hynny yn erbyn yr angen i sicrhau y caiff y materion hynny eu harchwilio a'u trin yn gywir. Mae hynny'n weithred gydbwyso anodd, ond gobeithio yn un y bydd David, pan fydd yn ymateb i'r ddadl, yn cyfeirio ati ac efallai yn crybwyll sut y gellir ymdrin â hynny yn y flwyddyn i ddod.

Nid yw gosod safonau ymddygiad yn fater syml, yn enwedig pan siaradwn am weithgareddau sydd â'r potensial o gael eu categoriedd fel troseddau o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Yn ogystal, ffactor newydd sydd rhaid inni ei ystyried yw Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998. Yn hyn o beth, yr ydym yn yr un sefyllfa â nifer o gyrff cyhoeddus eraill ac mae gennym oll wersi i'w dysgu gan ein gilydd. Er enghraifft, penderfynwyd peidio â gorfodi Aelodau'r Cynulliad i nodi pa un ai a oeddent yn perthyn i glwb preifat oherwydd goblygiadau'r Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol. Serch

declare if they are Freemasons, which I am not, and I do not believe that anyone has declared so to date. However, there is an interesting contrast in approach there that may need to be resolved. We should retain that need to declare whether Members are Freemasons, and if possible to encourage Members to voluntarily declare all other clubs to which they belong. We should be as open as possible in our declaration of interests.

The report notes the difficulty of defining indirect interest, as well as the enthusiasm of some Members in getting rather carried away with that. I may well be one of those Members, having served on a local council for 16 years and having had to apply myself to the far stricter regime of local government declarations of interest, to which Richard Edwards referred. We probably have the balance right in the National Assembly, but nevertheless it is difficult when you serve as a councillor to have to declare an interest and then find that you do not have to declare that same interest in the National Assembly. I have always erred on the side of caution, and I hope that David does not look too harshly upon me for that.

Point 5.2 of the report states that the Committee has become aware of the potential to use its procedures and resources for the pursuance of party political advantage, to which I have referred previously. That is a serious statement, but a rather ambiguous one, and I hope that David will clarify it in his reply. We must all be aware that not only do we need to maintain the highest possible standards, but that we need to use the Committee on Standards of Conduct sparingly and in the proper manner so as not to devalue its valuable work on behalf of the National Assembly.

David Davies: I commend this report and the committee's hard work. I make it clear that I am supportive of the Committee on Standards of Conduct. I wish to clarify a matter because of a perceived criticism of myself in the report. I was one of the two

hynny, gofynnir i'r Aelodau ddatgan os ydynt yn Seiri Rhyddion. Nid wyf yn un o'r Seiri Rhyddion, ac ni chredaf fod unrhyw un wedi datgan hynny hyd yma. Fodd bynnag, ceir gwahaniaeth diddorol mewn ymagwedd yma a allai fod angen ei ddatrys. Dylem gadw'r angen hwnnw i ddatgan pa un ai a yw Aelodau yn Seiri Rhyddion, ac os yn bosibl annog Aelodau i ddatgan yn wirfoddol yr holl glybiau eraill y maent yn perthyn iddynt. Dylem fod mor agored â phosibl yn ein datganiad o fuddiannau.

Noda'r adroddiad yr anhawster o ddiffinio buddiant anuniongyrchol, yn ogystal â brwdfrydedd rhai Aelodau wrth fynd braidd yn rhy bell gyda hyn. Efallai fy mod i'n un o'r Aelodau hynny, wedi gwasanaethu ar gyngor lleol am 16 mlynedd ac wedi gorfod cymhwyso fy hun i'r drefn llawer mwy llym o ddatgan buddiant mewn llywodraeth leol, y cyfeiriodd Richard Edwards ato. Mae'n debyg bod y cydbwysedd yn iawn yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ond serch hynny mae'n anodd pan fyddwch yn gwasanaethu fel cynghorydd i orfod datgan buddiant ac yna canfod nad oes rhaid i chi ddatgan yr un buddiant yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr wyf bob amser wedi ochri â phwyll, a gobeithio nad edrycha David yn rhy feiriadol arnaf oherwydd hynny.

Noda pwynt 5.2 o'r adroddiad fod y Pwyllgor wedi dod yn ymwybodol o'r potensial i ddefnyddio ei weithdrefnau a'i adnoddau gyda'r nod o gael mantais plaid wleidyddol, y cyfeiriais ato yn flaenorol. Mae hynny'n ddatganiad difrifol, ond yn un eithaf anelwig, a gobeithio y bydd David yn egluro hyn yn ei ateb. Rhaid i bawb fod yn ymwybodol bod angen inni nid yn unig gynnal y safonau uchaf posibl, ond hefyd bod angen inni ddefnyddio'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn gynnil ac yn y modd cywir er mwyn peidio â dibrisio ei waith gwerthfawr ar ran y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

David Davies: Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn a gwaith caled y pwyllgor. Egluraf fy mod yn gefnogol i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Dymunaf egluro mater oherwydd beirmiadaeth ymddangosiadol ohonof fi yn yr adroddiad. Yr oeddwn yn un

Members who were the subject of a complaint. I was reported to the Committee on Standards of Conduct after sending out an invitation to Welsh Members of Parliament to come and view an exhibition of materials relating to the law on Section 28 of the Local Government Act 1986. Regardless of the politics of Section 28, and I appreciate that I am in a minority in my views on that, it was a matter that was coming up before the Committee on which I was then serving, and was highly relevant to my work as an Assembly Member.

Since becoming an Assembly Member I have received numerous invitations from Assembly Members and Members of Parliament to all sorts of different events. I have received an invitation from Mick Bates to attend a milk conference, another from Robin Cook to view the Foreign Office, and I have received various invitations from the First Minister to do all sorts of other things. I am not complaining about that, it is part of the democratic process. I am supportive of what Mick Bates was trying to do. However, I do not understand why I was singled out to appear in front of this Committee. It was not just that somebody complained about me, because after that wet complaint was made, I issued complaints, as a matter of principle, against some of these other Members who had issued invitations. I explained to them that I was not opposed to what they were doing but that I wanted to see some consistency applied and, sadly, it did not seem that that consistency was being applied.

4:30 p.m.

On the criticism of the publicity that then ensued, I was certain that there would be publicity anyway. In the interest of open government—which is often espoused in this Chamber—I was not going to appear before the Committee and try to seek anonymity only to discover that somebody had spoken to the press. I did not have a guilty conscience following my actions, as they were entirely within my rights. For that reason, I was happy to talk openly about the subject.

o'r ddau Aelod a oedd yn destun cwyn. Cafodd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ei hysbysu ar ôl imi anfon gwahoddiad i Aelodau Seneddol Cymru i ddod i weld arddangosfa o ddeunyddiau sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r gyfraith ar Adran 28 Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 1986. Heb ystyried gwleidyddiaeth Adran 28, a gwerthfawrogaf fy mod yn y lleiafrif o ran fy marn ar hynny, yr oedd yn fater a ddaeth gerbron y Pwyllgor yr oeddwn yn ei wasanaethu bryd hynny, ac a oedd yn berthnasol iawn i'm gwaith fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad.

Ers dod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad derbyniais nifer o wahoddiadau gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac Aelodau Seneddol i bob math o ddiwyddiadau gwahanol. Derbyniais wahoddiad gan Mick Bates i fynychu cynhadledd laeth, un arall gan Robin Cook i weld y Swyddfa Dramor, a derbyniais nifer o wahoddiadau gan Brif Weinidog Cymru i wneud pob math o bethau eraill. Nid wyf yn cwyno am hynny, mae'n rhan o'r broses ddemocrataidd. Yr wyf yn gefnogol i'r hyn yr oedd Mick Bates yn ceisio ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, ni ddeallaf pam y'm dewiswyd i ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor hwn. Nid oedd hynny dim ond oherwydd i rywun gwyno amdanaf, oherwydd wedi i'r gŵyn lipa honno gael ei gwneud, cyflwynais gwynion, o ran egwyddor, yn erbyn rhai o'r Aelodau eraill hyn a oedd wedi cyflwyno gwahoddiadau. Esboniais iddynt nad oeddwn yn gwrthwynebu yr hyn yr oeddent yn ei wneud ond fy mod am weld peth cysondeb yn cael ei gymhwyso ac, yn anffodus, nid ymddengys bod y cysondeb hwnnw yn cael ei gymhwyso.

O ran y feirniadaeth ynglŷn â'r cyhoeddusrwydd a ddilynodd wedyn, yr oeddwn yn sicr y byddai cyhoeddusrwydd beth bynnag. Er budd llywodraeth agored—a gefnogir yn aml yn y Siambr hon—nid oeddwn yn mynd i ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor a cheisio bod yn ddiennw dim ond i ganfod bod rhywun wedi siarad â'r wasg. Yn sgîl yr hyn a wneuthum, nid oedd fy nghydwbybod yn fy mhigo, oherwydd yr oeddwn o fewn fy hawliau. Am y rheswm hwnnw, yr oeddwn yn fodlon i siarad yn

agored am y pwnc.

This complaint was dismissed on the grounds that proper guidance on the use of stationery had not been issued. Regardless of whether or not that guidance had been issued, the matter relating to section 28 of the Local Government Act 1986 was before the Committee at that time and, therefore, I should have had the right to raise it. I see a certain amount of inconsistency—I dare not use the word ‘hypocrisy’, given the current climate of the Chamber—in what Richard Edwards said. I know for a fact that Labour Members of Parliament in Wales are writing to constituents who have reached 18 years of age. Richard Edwards was making a point about Members elected through proportional representation. He knows that the majority of Labour Assembly Members were not elected through PR, and has raised the issue because he does not want Members elected through to have the same rights as those exercised by Labour MPs. That is inconsistent of him. Finally, I am disappointed that not one member of the Cabinet could be bothered to be present in the Chamber to hear this important debate.

Gwenda Thomas: Yn ystod y cyfnod y bûm yn aelod, cadeirid y Pwyllgor ar Safonau Ymddygiad gan David Melding. Diolchaf iddo am ei waith, ac am fod yn gwrtais a theg â phob Aelod o'r Cynulliad.

Wrth sôn am adnoddau'r Cynulliad a'r gwaharddiad ar eu defnyddio at bwrpasau personol, a oes lle inni fod yn fwy rhesymol ynglŷn â hyn, ac a oes angen eglurhad am yr hyn a olyga'r gair 'personol'? Efallai y dylai'r Pwyllgor ystyried hynny eto.

Gareth Jones: Bûm yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwn ers y dechrau. Diolchaf i Nick Bourne a David Melding am eu gwaith fel Cadeiryddion. Mae pwysigrwydd y Pwyllgor hwn yn golygu nad yw'r gwaith yn hawdd. Serch hynny, sicrhâf Aelodau y cafwyd trafodaethau trylwyr i geisio gwneud yr hyn sydd yn gywir ac yn unol â'r disgwyliadau. Mae'n bryder gennyf fod y cwynion a gyflwynwyd gerbron y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn

Diystyriwyd y gŵyn ar y sail na chyflwynwyd arweiniad cywir ar y defnydd o ddeunydd papur. Heb ystyried pa un ai a gyhoeddwyd yr arweiniad hwnnw ai peidio, yr oedd y mater sydd yn ymwneud ag adran 28 Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 1986 gerbron y Pwyllgor ar y pryd ac, felly, dylwn fod wedi cael yr hawl i'w godi. Gwelaf rywfaint o anghysondeb—ni fentraf ddefnyddio'r gair 'rhagrith', o ystyried yr hinsawdd bresennol yn y Siambr—yn yr hyn a ddywed Richard Edwards. Gwn fel ffaith fod Aelodau Seneddol Llafur Cymru yn ysgrifennu at etholwyr sydd wedi cyrraedd 18 oed. Yr oedd Richard Edwards yn gwneud pwynt am Aelodau yn cael eu hethol drwy gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Gŵyr nas etholwyd y mwyafrif o Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad drwy gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, a chododd y mater oherwydd nad yw am i'r Aelodau a etholir gael yr un hawliau â'r rhai a ymarferir gan AS Llafur. Mae hynny'n anghyson o'i ran ef. Yn olaf, yr wyf yn siomedig na allai unrhyw aelod o'r Cabinet drafferthu bod yn bresennol yn y Siambr i glywed y ddadl bwysig hon.

Gwenda Thomas: During my time as a member, the Committee on Standards of Conduct was chaired by David Melding. I thank him for his work, and for treating all Assembly Members courteously and fairly.

As regards Assembly resources and the prohibition on their use for personal purposes, is there scope to be more reasonable about this, and do we need clarification on what is meant by the word 'personal'? Perhaps the Committee could consider that again.

Gareth Jones: I have been a member of this Committee from the beginning. I thank Nick Bourne and David Melding for their work in chairing the Committee. The Committee's importance means that the work is not easy. However, I assure Members that we had exhaustive debates to try to do what was right and in accordance with expectations. I am concerned that the Committee has only dealt with what have been minor complaints.

fanion. Tanseiliodd hynny werth a phwysigrwydd y Pwyllgor ar adegau. Apeliâf ar bob Aelod i beidio â mabwysiadu'r ymagwedd honno at y Pwyllgor. Dylid ystyried beth yw ei bwrpas a'i werth, a cheisio cwyno am faterion o bwys yn unig.

Yr wyf yn pryderu hefyd fod y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn destun cyhoeddusrwydd diangen. Nid yw hynny wedi cyfrannu'n gadarnhaol at ddelwedd y Cynulliad.

Janice Gregory: I support Gwenda Thomas in her call to reconsider the guidance on the Committee's role, because Assembly Members are concerned about it. David Davies referred to his experience of the Committee on Standards of Conduct. I am a relatively new member of the Committee, but I feel that, when we receive papers, we are almost like a court of assizes at times, as David well knows. As Assembly Members, we are conscious of the public purse and I do not think that anybody would use Assembly stationery to send out information or invitations if that was not connected directly with Assembly business. I hope that no Assembly Member would do that. I know that I would not.

However, when I consider letters or matters of relevance to my constituency, I have to sit back and take stock and wonder whether or not I should write the letter on Assembly headed paper. I agree with David that Members of Parliament do not have that problem. I am sure, Llywydd, that as a former Member of that House, you recognise what I am saying. MPs do not have to consider whether they should use a House of Commons envelope for a particular letter. I do not have the time as a busy Assembly Member, as we all are, to wonder whether or not a piece of information should be written on Assembly stationery. I always try to use as a rule of thumb, whether I would be sending that letter if I were not an Assembly Member. The guidance is not clear and Assembly Members should be given clarity on this. There should be more leniency regarding what is sent out. If I wrote to someone saying 'Would you like to join the

That has undermined the value and importance of the Committee at times. I appeal to all Members not to adopt that approach to the Committee. Its purpose and value should be considered, and complaints should be limited to matters of importance.

I am also concerned that the Committee has been the subject of unnecessary publicity. That has not made a positive contribution to the Assembly's image.

Janice Gregory: Cefnogaf Gwenda Thomas yn ei galwad am ailystyried yr arweiniad ar rôl y Pwyllgor, oherwydd y mae Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn bryderus yn ei gylch. Cyfeiriodd David Davies at ei brofiad o'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Yr wyf fi'n aelod cymharol newydd o'r Pwyllgor, ond teimlaf, pan dderbyniwn bapurau, ein bod bron fel brawdlys ar adegau, fel y mae David yn gwybod yn iawn. Fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r pwrs cyhoeddus ac nid wyf yn meddwl y byddai neb yn defnyddio papur y Cynulliad i anfon gwybodaeth neu wahoddiadau i bobl pe na bai hynny'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â busnes y Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf na fyddai unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn gwneud hynny. Gwn na fyddwn i.

Fodd bynnag, pan ystyriaf lythyrau neu faterion o berthnasedd i'm hetholaeth, rhaid imi eistedd yn ôl a meddwl ac ystyried pa un ai a ddylwn ysgrifennu'r llythyr ar bapur pennawd y Cynulliad ai peidio. Cytunaf â David nad oes gan Aelodau Seneddol y broblem honno. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Lywydd, fel cyn Aelod o'r Tŷ hwnnw, y cydnabyddwch yr hyn a ddywedaf. Nid oes rhaid i ASau ystyried pa un ai a ddylent ddefnyddio amlen Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar gyfer llythyr arbennig. Nid oes gennyf yr amser fel Aelod prysur o'r Cynulliad, fel yr ydym oll, i feddwl pa un ai a ddylid ysgrifennu darn o wybodaeth ar ddeunydd papur y Cynulliad ai peidio. Fel rheol gyffredinol, ceisiaf ystyried a fyddwn yn anfon y llythyr hwnnw os na fyddwn yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Nid yw'r arweiniad yn glir a dylai Aelodau'r Cynulliad gael eglurhad am hyn. Dylid cael mwy o drugaredd o ran yr hyn a anfonir allan. Pe bawn yn ysgrifennu at rywun yn dweud 'A

Labour party?' it would be an issue for the Committee on Standards of Conduct. However, there are other matters that would not be issues for the Committee.

David Melding: I thank all Members who have taken part in this debate. It has been instructive. I will try to answer all the points that have been raised in the order that they were made.

Richard Edwards made several important points that reflected his experience on the Committee. We try to encourage people to make their declarations of interest at the start of a debate, but sometimes, because of the speed of the debate and the real time that we live in, it does not occur to Members until later that they should have made a declaration. I must say that, from my observation, matters of serious interest are not dealt with lightly. We are referring, in general, to things that are well known, such as a person's profession or the membership of a county borough council. Therefore, it is perhaps understandable that sometimes it slips someone's memory to mention that. To make the declaration in retrospect is not as elegant a process as we want to establish. We are trying to raise awareness of this so that Members make those declarations promptly.

The restriction on voting is a serious issue. You can be prosecuted if you vote without having made a declaration or if you have a direct interest. How you gauge that interest is covered in the guidance. I accept that the guidance is sometimes difficult and unclear. It is for Members, if they are in doubt, to ask for clarification. However, we try to indicate in the guidance that you should compare yourself to the average person in that situation. For example, if you are a farmer, compare yourself to the average farmer. If the average farmer would not receive as large a benefit from a particular measure as you would receive, then you have an interest that is greater than the average. However, it does not refer to the average member of public, because that would mean that everyone with any conceivable interest would have an

hoffech ymuno â'r blaidd Lafur?' byddai'n fater ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Fodd bynnag, ceir materion eraill na fyddent yn faterion ar gyfer y Pwyllgor.

David Melding: Diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl hon. Bu'n addysgol. Ceisiaf ateb yr holl bwyntiau a godwyd yn y drefn y'u codwyd.

Gwnaeth Richard Edwards sawl pwynt pwysig sydd yn adlewyrchu ei brofiad ar y Pwyllgor. Ceisiwn annog pobl i wneud eu datganiadau buddiant ar ddechrau trafodaeth, ond weithiau, oherwydd cyflymder y drafodaeth a'r oes wirioneddol yr ydym yn byw ynddo, ni feddylia'r Aelodau y dylent fod wedi gwneud datganiad tan yn ddiweddarach. Rhaid imi ddweud, o'm harsylwad i, nid ymdrinnir â materion o fuddiant difrifol yn ysgafn. Yr ydym yn cyfeirio, yn gyffredinol, at bethau sydd yn wybyddus, megis proffesiwn person neu aelodaeth cyngor bwrdeistref sirol. Felly, efallai ei fod yn ddealladwy bod rhywun yn anghofio crybwyll hynny weithiau. Nid yw gwneud y datganiad hwnnw, wrth edrych yn ôl, yn broses mor gain ag yr hoffem ei sefydlu. Yr ydym yn ceisio codi ymwybyddiaeth o hyn fel y gall yr Aelodau wneud y datganiadau hynny ar unwaith.

Mae'r cyfyngiad ar bleidleisio yn fater difrifol. Gellir eich erlyn os byddwch yn pleidleisio heb wneud datganiad neu os oes gennych fuddiant uniongyrchol. Caiff sut y byddwch yn mesur y buddiant hwnnw ei gwmpasu yn yr arweiniad. Derbyniaf fod yr arweiniad weithiau'n anodd ac yn aneglur. Dylai'r Aelodau, os oes ganddynt amheuaeth, ofyn am eglurhad. Fodd bynnag, ceisiwn nodi yn yr arweiniad y dylech gymharu eich hun â pherson cyffredin yn y sefyllfa honno. Er enghraifft, os ydych yn ffermwr, dylech gymharu eich hun â ffermwr cyffredin. Os na fyddai ffermwr cyffredin yn derbyn cymaint o fudd-dâl o fesur penodol ag y byddech chi'n ei dderbyn, mae gennych fuddiant sydd yn fwy na'r cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, ni chyfeiria at aelod cyffredin o'r cyhoedd, oherwydd byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai

interest of a level that prohibited them from voting. We do not believe, from the advice that we received from our lawyers, that that was the intention of the legislation.

Regarding the use of Assembly resources, we have referred a matter from the Committee to the House Committee to seek more specific guidance. That is the issue of letters of congratulation on acquiring the age of majority and the ability to vote.

Brian Hancock mentioned the non-partisan working of the Committee. This has been the greatest success of the Committee on Standards of Conduct. It is something that all members, no matter how long they have served on the Committee, have observed diligently. That is why the system is working and why we are discovering that some work needs further development. It is due to the fact that members of the Committee have been disciplined in their working methods.

I agree with Brian that the confidentiality of the process provides a measure of protection for Assembly Members against whom we have received complaints. That is valuable and that is why we still refuse to identify Members in our reports. It is up to Members if they want to make their own revelations. However, it is not a matter in which the Committee wants to engage.

4:40 p.m.

As Brian Hancock said, we are learning from experience. The Committee needs time. The Assembly has only been in existence for 18 months. Much of our revisions are made in the light of experience and we are improving the systems as we go along.

Peter Black made a series of telling points. Judging by his contribution, he would be an excellent member of the Committee. He referred to the need for robust guidance. We have spent a great deal of time on guidance and are still returning to the issue of guidance that can give an indication in practical circumstances. Members have asked when is a letter political or personal and,

pawb ag unrhyw fuddiant posibl yn cael buddiant o lefel a fyddai'n eu gwahardd rhag pleidleisio. Ni chredwn, o'r cyngor a dderbyniwyd gan ein cyfreithwyr, mai dyna oedd bwriad y ddeddfwriaeth.

O ran defnyddio adnoddau'r Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi cyfeirio mater o'r Pwyllgor i'r Pwyllgor Tŷ i gael arweiniad mwy penodol. Dyna fater y llythyrau llongyfarch ar gaffael oed y mwyafrif a'r gallu i bleidleisio.

Nododd Brian Hancock ddull gweithio amhleidiol y Pwyllgor. Hwn fu'r llwyddiant mwyaf y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Mae'n rhywbeth a arsylwyd yn fanwl gan yr holl aelodau, heb ystyried pa mor hir y maent wedi gwasanaethu ar y Pwyllgor. Dyna pam y mae'r system yn gweithio a pham yr ydym yn canfod bod angen datblygu peth gwaith ymhellach. Mae hyn oherwydd y ffaith y disgyblwyd aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu dulliau gweithio.

Cytunaf â Brian fod cyfrinachedd y broses yn darparu rhywfaint o ddiogelwch ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad y derbyniwyd cwynion yn eu herbyn. Mae hynny'n werthfawr a dyna pam yr ydym yn dal i wrthod nodi enwau Aelodau yn ein hadroddiadau. Lle'r Aelodau yw gwneud eu datgeliadau eu hunain os mynnant. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n fater yr hoffa'r Pwyllgor gymryd rhan ynddo.

Fel y dywedodd Brian Hancock, yr ydym yn dysgu o brofiad. Mae angen amser ar y Pwyllgor. Dim ond ers 18 mis y bu'r Cynulliad mewn bodolaeth. Gwneir llawer o'n hadolygiadau o ganlyniad i brofiad ac yr ydym yn gwella'r systemau wrth inni fynd yn ein blaenau.

Gwnaeth Peter Black gyfres o bwyntiau pwysig. O ystyried ei gyfraniad, byddai'n aelod gwych o'r Pwyllgor. Cyfeiriodd at yr angen am arweiniad cadarn. Treuliasom llawer o amser ar yr arweiniad ac yr ydym yn dal i ddychwelyd at y mater o arweiniad a all roi awgrym mewn amgylchiadau ymarferol. Gofynnodd Aelodau pryd y bydd llythyr yn wleidyddol neu'n bersonol ac, felly, yn

therefore, inappropriate. They have also asked how to deal with letters that are both political and personal. The Committee is considering possible letters that would indicate what would be acceptable or unacceptable and what may cause confusion and would warrant advice.

Peter also referred to the fact that the Assembly is setting its own procedures. The Committee has done this from the start. Our own experience has been fed into the system of committees on standards of conduct around the British Isles. I gave evidence to the Northern Ireland Assembly's inquiry on the establishment of a commission on standards of conduct. I welcome the fact that the Committee Clerk has taken part in meetings of the various secretariats of the committees on standards of conduct in Britain. We have already made an important contribution to that system.

I apologise that the report was not published bilingually and I will investigate that matter. I was not aware of it until Peter mentioned it.

The Assembly must be seen to have the highest standards. That must be publicly recognised. It is not good enough to have high quality internal procedures. People must have confidence in the Assembly's work and they must be aware that these processes are in place.

Peter raised the point that some matters seem minor. The crucial point is that, if a matter is referred to us, we must deal with it. There must be an investigation, which comes at a considerable cost. This needs to be considered but, as for everything else that we are reviewing, the Committee cannot make unilateral decisions. We must return to Plenary. What we discuss would often require a change in Standing Orders. Therefore, these matters must be measured and taken carefully. We are considering the question of which matters could be classified as technical or minor breaches and whether they could perhaps be dealt with in a parallel process that did not involve a full inquiry with the huge resources of the independent

amhriodol. Maent hefyd wedi gofyn sut y dylid ymdrin â llythyrau sydd yn wleidyddol ac yn bersonol. Ystyria'r Pwyllgor llythyrau posibl a fyddai'n dangos beth fyddai'n dderbyniol neu'n annerbyniol a beth allai achosi cymhlethdod a beth fyddai'n gwarantu cyngor.

Cyfeiriodd Peter hefyd at y ffaith y bydd y Cynulliad yn sefydlu ei weithdrefnau ei hun. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor hyn o'r dechrau. Cafodd ein profiad ein hunain ei fwydo i mewn i system y pwyllgorau safonau ymddygiad o amgylch Ynysoedd Prydain. Rhoddais dystiolaeth i ymchwiliad Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon ar sefydlu comisiwn ar safonau ymddygiad. Croesawaf y ffaith bod Clerc y Pwyllgor wedi cymryd rhan mewn cyfarfodydd o ysgrifenyddiaethau amrywiol y pwyllgorau ar safonau ymddygiad ym Mhrydain. Gwnaethom gyfraniad pwysig i'r system honno eisoes.

Ymddiheuraf na chyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad yn ddwyieithog a byddaf yn archwilio'r mater hwnnw. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol ohono tan i Peter ei grybwyll.

Rhaid i'r Cynulliad gael ei weld fel bod ganddo'r safonau uchaf. Rhaid cydnabod hynny'n gyhoeddus. Nid yw'n ddigon da cael gweithdrefnau mewnol o ansawdd uchel. Rhaid i bobl gael hyder yng ngwaith y Cynulliad a rhaid iddynt fod yn ymwybodol bod y gweithdrefnau hyn yn weithredol.

Cododd Peter y pwynt yr ymddengys nad yw rhai materion mor bwysig. Y pwynt holl bwysig yw, os caiff mater ei gyfeirio atom ni, rhaid inni ymdrin ag ef. Rhaid cael ymchwiliad, sydd yn golygu cost sylweddol. Mae angen ystyried hyn ond, fel ar gyfer popeth arall a archwiliwn, ni all y Pwyllgor wneud penderfyniadau unochrog. Rhaid inni ddychwelyd i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Byddai angen newid Rheolau Sefydlog yn aml ar gyfer yr hyn a drafodwn. Felly, rhaid mesur ac ystyried y materion hyn yn ofalus. Ystyriwn y cwestiwn o ba faterion y gellir eu dosbarthu yn dechnegol neu dor-rheolau bach a pha un a ellir ymdrin â hwy efallai mewn proses gyfochrog nad oedd yn cynnwys ymchwiliad llawn gydag adnoddau anferthol

adviser. Perhaps some sort of de minimus rule would be helpful in that regard. We must work this idea up carefully, seeking the views of the political parties in the Chamber and the endorsement of the Assembly in Plenary.

The implications of the Human Rights Act 1998 have been considered. At least one of our recommendations was based on legal advice that referred to that Act. The issue of freemasonry has not been referred to the Committee. It was not mentioned in our consultation with Members. If Members asked us for a view in light of the Human Rights Act, we would be obliged to consider it. As Members could have done so and have decided not to, I assume that they are comfortable with the requirement to declare membership of the Freemasons.

Peter referred to the cautious approach that Members take in declaring whatever interest that they think could be relevant. It is surely better to declare an interest that may not, in light of the legislation, need to be declared, than to make the mistake of not declaring interest that should be declared. We would always urge caution. Members should make the declaration, as they are better safe than sorry. That is pretty much how Members have worked, and we encourage that to continue.

The statement on the danger of political advantage obviously refers to what has happened outside the Committee. As I have said, the Committee has worked in exemplary fashion and in a completely non-partisan manner. However, from the number of inquiries that are made—and not every inquiry leads to a complaint—there has been evidence that known members of political parties are seeking to see whether Members can be embarrassed by diving straight into a full complaints process, rather than asking for clarification on a matter, or asking us to have a word with a Member if there may not have been strictly proper use of resources.

If a matter is referred to us, we must deal with it. We would be disappointed if parties

y cynghorydd annibynnol. Efallai y byddai rhyw fath o reol de minimus yn ddefnyddiol mewn perthynas â hynny. Rhaid inni adeiladu'r syniad hwn yn ofalus, gan geisio cael barn y pleidiau gwleidyddol yn y Siambr a chefnogaeth Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad.

Ystyriwyd goblygiadau Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998. Seiliwyd o leiaf un o'n hargymhellion ar gyngor cyfreithiol a gyfeiriodd at y Ddeddf honno. Ni chyfeiriwyd mater y Seiri Rhyddion at y Pwyllgor. Ni chyfeiriwyd ato yn ein hymgyngoriad â'r Aelodau. Pe bai'r Aelodau yn gofyn inni am farn yng ngoleuni'r Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol, byddai rheidrwydd arnom i'w hystyried. Oherwydd y gallai Aelodau fod wedi gwneud hynny a'u bod wedi penderfynu peidio, cymeraf yn ganiataol eu bod yn gyfforddus â'r angen i ddatgan aelodaeth o'r Seiri Rhyddion.

Cyfeiriodd Peter at yr ymagwedd bwyllog y cymer Aelodau wrth ddatgan pa bynnag fuddiant y credant y gallai fod yn berthnasol. Yn sicr, mae'n well datgan buddiant nad oes angen ei ddatgan yng ngoleuni'r ddeddfwriaeth, na gwneud y camgymeriad o beidio â datgan buddiant y dylid ei ddatgan. Argymhellwn eich bod yn cymryd pwyll bob amser. Dylai'r Aelodau wneud y datganiad, er mwyn bod yn ddiogel yn hytrach na bod yn edifar. Dyna'r ffordd y mae'r Aelodau wedi gweithio, ac anogwn i hynny barhau.

Mae'n amlwg bod y datganiad ar berygl mantais wleidyddol yn cyfeirio at yr hyn a ddigwyddodd y tu allan i'r Pwyllgor. Fel y dywedais, mae'r Pwyllgor wedi gweithio mewn modd arbennig ac mewn modd hollol amhleidiol. Fodd bynnag, o'r nifer o ymchwiliadau a wnaethpwyd—ac nid yw pob ymchwiliad yn arwain at gwyn—cafwyd tystiolaeth bod aelodau cydnabyddedig o bleidiau gwleidyddol yn ceisio gweld pa un ai a ellir creu embarás i'r Aelodau drwy fynd yn syth i mewn i weithdrefn gwyno lawn, yn hytrach na gofyn am eglurhad ar fater, neu ofyn inni gael gair ag Aelod os na chafwyd defnydd hollol briodol o adnoddau.

Os caiff mater ei gyfeirio atom ni, rhaid inni ymdrin ag ef. Byddem yn siomedig pe bai

started to line up potential complaints just to balance the books or with the motive of revenge because a Member of a particular party has been embarrassed. We want clear systems that ensure the highest standard of conduct. We do not want people embarrassed on minor matters that should not involve the Committee on Standards of Conduct. The Committee's purpose is to deal with serious issues of public concern relating to Members' interests and to general matters of Members' conduct.

David Davies commended the hard work of the Committee. We have met more often than we had anticipated and have had to deal with more work than we anticipated. That can be gauged by the independent adviser's workload; he is probably working twice as many hours as we had initially considered necessary when designing the contract. That indicates that there is an issue about the level of work with which the Committee must deal. I accept that Members and the public need educating about what is appropriate to refer to the Committee on Standards of Conduct and to the Assembly's advisers.

David referred to his own case. We have never referred to it ourselves and we have not mentioned you, David. That would have been more prudent. We have dealt with two cases in this annual report, and I doubt if other Assembly Members are aware of the identity of the other person. That indicates that the anonymity that the process is designed to deliver delivered. The other person—and I refer directly to you, David, as you raised the matter—handled himself or herself in a different way and were afforded a level of protection.

David Davies: I know who the other Member is, but I will not refer to that person. I, and I think a large number of people in this room, know who that other person is.

David Melding: I will respond directly to that. The reason that you know is that you have a particular interest in that matter. It is not surprising that you know, given those circumstances.

pleidiau yn dechrau rhestru cwynion posibl dim ond er mwyn mantoli'r cyfrifon neu gyda'r bwriad o dalu'r pwyth oherwydd bod Aelod o blaid benodol wedi dioddef embarás. Yr ydym am gael systemau clir sydd yn sicrhau'r safon ymddygiad uchaf. Nid ydym am i bobl deimlo embarás ar faterion bach na ddylai gynnwys y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Pwrpas y Pwyllgor yw ymdrin â materion pwysig o ran pryder y cyhoedd yn ymwneud â buddiannau'r Aelodau a materion cyffredinol o ymddygiad Aelodau.

Cymeradwyodd David Davies waith caled y Pwyllgor. Yr ydym wedi cwrdd yn amlach nag y rhagwelwyd ac wedi gorfod ymdrin â mwy o waith nag y rhagwelwyd. Gellir mesur hyn drwy faich gwaith y cynghorydd annibynnol; mae'n debyg ei fod yn gweithio ddwywaith cymaint o oriau ag yr ystyriwyd yn angenrheidiol i ddechrau wrth gynllunio'r contract. Noda hynny fod mater ynghylch lefel y gwaith y mae'n rhaid i'r Pwyllgor ymdrin ag ef. Derbyniaf fod angen addysgu'r Aelodau a'r cyhoedd ar yr hyn sydd yn briodol i'w gyfeirio at y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ac i gynghorwyr y Cynulliad.

Cyfeiriodd David at ei achos ei hun. Nid ydym erioed wedi cyfeirio ato ein hunain ac nid ydym wedi eich crybwyll, David. Byddai hynny'n fwy pwylllog. Ymdriniwyd â dau achos yn yr adroddiad blynyddol hwn, ac yr wyf yn amau os yw Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad yn ymwybodol o bwy yw'r person arall. Noda hynny fod yr anhysbysrwydd a gynlluniwyd ar gyfer y broses wedi'i gyflawni. Ymdriniodd y person arall—a chyfeiriaf yn benodol atoch chi, David, gan i chi godi'r mater—â'r sefyllfa mewn ffordd wahanol a chafodd lefel o ddiogelwch.

David Davies: Gwn pwy yw'r Aelod arall, ond ni chyfeiriaf at y person hwnnw. Yr wyf i, a chredaf fod nifer fawr o bobl yn yr ystafell hon yn gwybod, pwy yw'r person arall hwnnw.

David Melding: Ymatebaf yn uniongyrchol i hynny. Y rheswm y gwyddoch yw oherwydd bod gennych ddiddordeb arbennig yn y mater. Nid yw'n syndod eich bod yn gwybod, o ystyried yr amgylchiadau.

You said that you were singled out. I refute that. The Committee on Standards of Conduct deals with cases that are referred to it. We have no discretion in that process. We have not singled out a case and ignored others. We have dealt with all the cases that have been referred to us. Two of them are referred to in this report. We have not been inconsistent in whatever happened after your particular case. If you want to take that forward in private discussions, I would be happy to do that. I am confident that I could reassure you on that point.

Gwenda Thomas made some kind remarks about the Committee's work and about Nick Bourne and myself as Chairs to date. The Chair of such a Committee needs the support and goodwill of the Members and I have received that in bucketfuls. I am grateful for that, and I am sure that it will continue as long as I am up to the mark. Peter Black said that more clarification is required on use of stationery and on when items are considered personal or political. I have already referred to considering some standard letters that could illustrate whether a letter is appropriate, when it might not be, and when it is definitely not.

Gareth Jones referred to some of the technical matters with which the Committee has had to deal and the danger that such matters could bog down the Committee and impair its serious work of investigating and hearing complaints. We have completed a serious body of work on declarations of interests and other matters. That is the danger, and it is why we must be clear about fine-tuning the complaints process and knowing how it works in the future. I agree about publicity. It is not appropriate for the Committee's hearings to be public, when in investigation mode. We have considered that, but Members are afforded an element of protection if they are in camera, as it were.

Janice made the point about guidance. If in

Dywedasoeh i chi gael eich dewis. Anghytunaf â hynny. Mae'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn ymdrin ag achosion a gyfeiriwyd ato. Nid oes gennym unrhyw ddisgresiwn yn y broses honno. Nid ydym wedi dewis un achos penodol ac anwybyddu rhai eraill. Yr ydym wedi ymdrin â'r holl achosion a gyfeiriwyd atom. Cyfeirir at ddau ohonynt yn yr adroddiad hwn. Ni fuom yn anghyson o ran beth bynnag a ddigwyddodd ar ôl eich achos penodol chi. Os ydych am gyflwyno'r mater hwnnw mewn trafodaethau preifat, byddwn yn fodlon gwneud hynny. Yr wyf yn hyderus y gallwn eich sicrhau ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Gwnaeth Gwenda Thomas sylwadau caredig ar waith y Pwyllgor ac am Nick Bourne a minnau fel Cadeiryddion hyn yma. Mae angen cymorth ac ewyllys da yr Aelodau ar Gadeirydd Pwyllgor o'r fath a derbyniais lond trol o hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn parhau cyn belled ag y byddaf yn ateb y gofynion. Dywedodd Peter Black bod angen mwy o eglurhad ar y defnydd o ddeunydd papur ac ar pryd yr ystyrir bod eitemau yn bersonol neu'n wleidyddol. Cyfeiriais at ystyried rhai llythyrau safonol a allai ddynodi pa un ai a yw llythyr yn briodol ai peidio, pryd na fyddai'n briodol o bosibl, a phryd na fyddai'n sicr yn briodol.

Cyfeiriodd Gareth Jones at rai o'r materion technegol y mae'r Pwyllgor wedi gorfod ymdrin â hwy a'r perygl y gallai materion o'r fath fod yn fwrn ar y Pwyllgor ac amharu ar ei waith difrifol o ymchwilio a gwrandao ar gwynion. Cwblhawyd corff difrifol o waith ar ddatganiadau buddiant a materion eraill. Dyna'r perygl, a dyna pam bod yn rhaid inni fod yn glir am fanwl gyweirio'r broses gwyno a gwybod sut mae'n gweithio yn y dyfodol. Cytunaf ynglŷn â chyhoeddusrwydd. Nid yw'n briodol i wrandawiadau'r Pwyllgor fod ar gael i'r cyhoedd, pan fydd proses ymchwiliad. Ystyriwyd hynny, ond caiff Aelodau elfen o ddiogelwch os byddant o flaen y camera, fel petai.

Gwnaeth Janice y pwynt ynglŷn ag

doubt, one can ask the Office of the Presiding Officer for advice on particular items and whether or not they would be appropriate. I have done that myself for items that are put out by my office, seeking clearance that they were a proper call on public funds. I ask Members to do the same if they are in any doubt about where they stand and if the guidance is not sufficiently clear.

4:40 p.m.

Janice also made the point about the cost of investigations, and I return to that. Investigating the items that have been referred to us so far has cost a lot of public money. We must bear that in mind. That is why we are currently considering the procedure of handling complaints, and also how technical and minor matters are dealt with, as opposed to the larger items that would require thorough investigation and full use of Assembly resources via the independent adviser and the Committee's work.

I conclude by commending the report. I thank all those who have served on the Committee, especially the present membership, for their dedication, hard work and personal support, for which I am grateful.

The Presiding Officer: Before moving to a vote, I echo the thanks to the Chair and members of the Committee and also to the advisers and staff who serve it.

arweiniad. Os oes amheuaeth, dylid gofyn i Swyddfa'r Llywydd am gyngor ar eitemau penodol a pha un a fyddent yn briodol. Gwneuthum hynny fy hun ar gyfer eitemau a gyflwynir gan fy swyddfa, gan geisio eglurhâd eu bod yn ddefnydd cywir o arian cyhoeddus. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau wneud yr un peth os oes unrhyw amheuaeth ynghylch lle maent yn sefyll ac os nad yw'r arweiniad yn ddigon clir.

Hefyd gwnaeth Janice y pwynt am gost ymchwiliadau, a dychwelaf at hynny. Mae ymchwilio'r eitemau a gyfeiriwyd atom hyd yn hyn wedi costio llawer o arian cyhoeddus. Rhaid ystyried hynny. Dyna pam yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried y weithdrefn o ymdrin â chwynion, a hefyd sut yr ymdrinnir â materion technegol a materion bach, yn hytrach na'r eitemau mawr a fyddai'n gofyn am ymchwiliad trylwyr a defnydd llawn o adnoddau'r Cynulliad drwy'r cynghorydd annibynnol a gwaith y Pwyllgor.

Gorffennaf drwy gymeradwyo'r adroddiad. Diolch i bawb a wasanaethodd ar y Pwyllgor, yn enwedig yr aelodaeth bresennol, am eu hymroddiad, eu gwaith caled a'u cymorth personol, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn am hynny.

Y Llywydd: Cyn symud i bleidlais, ategaf y diolch i'r Cadeirydd ac aelodau'r Pwyllgor a hefyd i'r cynghorwyr a'r staff sydd yn ei wasanaethu.

*Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 44, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn

Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

David Davies

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

Y Llywydd: Dyna ddiwedd y sesiwn heddiw. Diolch i'r Aelodau am eu cydweithrediad.
The Presiding Officer: That concludes today's session. I thank Members for their co-operation.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.48 p.m.
The session ended at 4.48 p.m.*

