



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher 21 Mehefin 2000**  
**Wednesday 21 June 2000**

**Cynnwys**  
***Contents***

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol  
*Questions to the Secretary for Health and Social Services*
- 11 Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16  
*Questions to the Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training*
- 19 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 24 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16  
*The Post-16 Education and Training Committee Report*
- 49 Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad  
*The New Assembly Building*
- 81 Dadl Fer: Adeiladu Argaeau a Chymunedau Lleol  
*Short Debate: Dam Building and Local Communities*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Secretary for Health and Social Services**

### **Anghydraddoldeb Iechyd yng Nghymru Health Inequalities in Wales**

**Q1 Lynne Neagle:** What plans are there to tackle health inequalities in Wales? (OAQ5954)

**The Secretary for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** Tackling health inequalities is a high priority in my portfolio and in Betterwales.com, which outlines what we aim to achieve in Wales over the next 10 years. This will progress through a two-pronged approach, which involves tackling the underlying causes of ill health and improving access to services for the most disadvantaged people and communities in Wales.

**Lynne Neagle:** Do you agree that if we are serious about tackling health inequalities, we must target more resources at areas with the greatest needs? Gwent, for example, has some of the worst health in Wales but has fewer beds per head than any other part of Wales. I welcome the review of the NHS allocation formula but it will not begin to be phased in until 2002-03. Will you, therefore, look at top-slicing money to direct additional funds to health authorities with the greatest health needs and ill health?

**Jane Hutt:** The health improvement programme is a major way in which we will tackle health inequality. I will expect every health improvement programme in Wales—the health authorities' programme to tackle inequalities and improving health—to reflect the need to tackle health inequalities. With the extra money that we have allocated over the past few weeks—the £40 million to tackle unacceptably high waiting lists and waiting times—and additional money that I have distributed to health authorities to

**C1 Lynne Neagle:** Pa gynlluniau sydd ar y gweill i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru? (OAQ5954)

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn flaenoriaeth uchel yn fy mhortffolio ac yn Gwellcymru.com, sydd yn amlinellu yr hyn y bwriadwn ei gyflawni yng Nghymru dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Ceir ymdriniaeth ddwybig i roi hyn ar waith, ac mae'n golygu mynd i'r afael ag achosion gwaelodol afiechyd a gwella mynediad at wasanaethau i'r bobl a'r cymunedau sydd dan fwyaf o anfantais yng Nghymru.

**Lynne Neagle:** A ydych yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni, os ydym o ddifrif am fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd, dargedu mwy o adnoddau at yr ardaloedd sydd yn fwyaf eu hangen? Ceir yng Ngwent, er enghraifft, beth o'r iechyd gwaethaf yng Nghymru ond mae ganddi lai o welyau y pen nag unrhyw ran arall o Gymru. Croesawaf yr adolygiad o fformwla dyrannu'r NHS ond ni ddechreuir ei gyflwyno tan 2002-03. A wnewch chi, felly, ystyried brig-dorri arian er mwyn cyfeirio mwy o gyllid tuag at yr awdurdodau iechyd sydd yn fwyaf eu hangen o safbwynt iechyd ac afiechyd?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r rhaglen gwella iechyd yn ffordd bwysig a ddefnyddir gennym i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Byddaf yn disgwyl i bob rhaglen gwella iechyd yng Nghymru—rhaglen yr awdurdodau lleol i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau a gwella iechyd—adlewyrchu'r angen i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Gyda'r arian ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd gennym dros yr wythnosau diwethaf—y £40 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â rhestrau aros ac amserau aros annerbyniol o uchel—a'r arian ychwanegol

respond to cardiac, cancer, mental health and other priorities that the Committee has set, I expect them to tackle health inequalities and ensure that the resources given to those health authorities are reflected in how money is allocated and distributed.

**Geraint Davies:** Peter Law recently announced the Communities First initiative to tackle deprivation in our communities. Do you think that there should be a health nucleus in this initiative, bearing in mind the close relationship between ill health and deprivation?

**Jane Hutt:** We had a good debate about this in the Health and Social Services Committee in which we looked at the concept of health action zones, which you had raised in this Chamber. We looked at this in the context of Communities First. Dai Lloyd had visited a health action zone and brought back information, which was helpful. We recognise that health action is a key part of Communities First, as is economic development, educational improvement and environmental and social action. I assure you that we see health as a key part. Peter endorses this, and his interest in health, having served as chair of a health trust and a health authority, is reflected in how we would like to see Communities First progress.

**Nick Bourne:** Does Jane Hutt agree that the health service in rural areas does not compare favourably with that in urban areas and that health inequalities must be addressed as a matter of priority? Will Jane talk about the worrying deficit in the Dyfed Powys Health Authority and the advice and help that she is offering in this rather worrying situation?

**Jane Hutt:** We are undertaking a review of the current arrangements for allocating financial resources to the NHS, and issues of rurality and socio-economic deprivation are

yr wyf wedi'i ddsbarthu i awdurdodau iechyd mewn ymateb i iechyd y galon, canser, iechyd meddwl a'r blaenoriaethau eraill a bennwyd gan y Pwyllgor, disgwyliaf iddynt fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd a sicrhau bod yr adnoddau a roddir i'r awdurdodau iechyd hynny yn cael eu hadlewyrchu yn y ffordd y dyrannir ac y dosbarthir arian.

**Geraint Davies:** Cyhoeddodd Peter Law y cynllun Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn ddiweddar i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadiad yn ein cymunedau. A ydych yn credu y dylai fod cnewyllyn iechyd yn y fenter hon, o gofio'r berthynas agos rhwng afiechyd ac amddifadiad?

**Jane Hutt:** Cawsom ddadl dda am hyn yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol lle'r edrychasom ar gysyniad parthau gweithredu iechyd, a godwyd gennych chi yn y Siambr hon. Edrychasom ar hyn yng nghyd-destun Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Yr oedd Dai Lloyd wedi ymweld â pharth gweithredu iechyd a daeth â gwybodaeth yn ôl, a fu'n fuddiol. Cydnabyddwn fod gweithredu ynglyn ag iechyd yn rhan allweddol o Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, fel y mae datblygu economaidd, gwelliannau addysgiadol a gweithredu amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol. Mae Peter yn ategu hyn ac mae ei ddiddordeb mewn iechyd, wedi gwasanaethu fel cadeirydd ymddiriedolaeth iechyd ac awdurdod iechyd, wedi'i adlewyrchu yn y ffordd yr hoffem weld Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn mynd rhagddo.

**Nick Bourne:** A yw Jane Hutt yn cytuno nad yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn cymharu'n ffafriol â'r gwasanaeth mewn ardaloedd trefol a bod yn rhaid rhoi sylw i anghydraddoldebau iechyd fel mater o flaenoriaeth? A wnaiff Jane sôn am y diffyg ariannol yn Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys sydd yn peri pryder a'r cyngor a'r help y mae hi'n ei gynnig yn y sefyllfa byrderus hon?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym wrthi'n cynnal adolygiad o'r trefniadau cyfredol i ddyrannu adnoddau ariannol i'r NHS, ac mae ystyriaethau'n ymwneud â natur wledig ac

part of the terms of reference. We will examine issues relating to poverty, deprivation, and social exclusion and compare areas across Wales and look at poverty at a local level and at a broader health authority level. Today, in the Committee, we discussed the recent District Auditor's report on Dyfed Powys and next week we will talk to the health authority. We will question it about its health improvement programme and whether it tackles health inequalities. That will raise useful discussions about tackling rural poverty in terms of health inequalities.

**Michael German:** The National Institute for Clinical Excellence's decision to ration the drug beta interferon was leaked today. It stated that the relief the drug brings to MS sufferers is only marginal. Do you now admit that rationing on the basis of cost is widespread in the NHS in Wales and that as a result of this decision, those who have to rely on the NHS get worse treatment than those who are better off, thereby contributing to increasing health inequalities in Wales?

**Jane Hutt:** There is an inverse care law that we have talked about in this Chamber before. The poorest people in Wales have the poorest health and unfortunately, often have the poorest services as well. There are also low expectations among those people and communities. We are now developing a new health planning system and health improvement programmes in the NHS. They have to be approved by the Assembly and myself to ensure that we do not have that kind of disparity and inequality of resource allocation. Obviously, this will be addressed in our resource allocation review, which will look carefully at why this inequity of access and service exists. The review will also examine whether there is an inequity of distribution that we need to tackle. The Assembly has the opportunity to deal with issues such as postcode prescribing and we must look to the advice and guidance that we

amddifadiad cymdeithasol-economaidd yn rhan o'r cylch gorchwyl. Byddwn yn edrych ar ystyriaethau'n ymwneud â thlodi, amddifadiad ac allgáu cymdeithasol ac yn cymharu ardaloedd ar draws Cymru gan edrych ar dlodi ar lefel leol ac ar lefel ehangach yr awdurdodau iechyd. Heddiw, yn y Pwyllgor, trafodasom adroddiad diweddar yr Archwiliwr Dosbarth ar Ddyfed Powys a'r wythnos nesaf byddwn yn siarad â'r awdurdod iechyd. Byddwn yn ei holi am ei raglen gwella iechyd ac a yw'n mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Bydd hynny'n codi trafodaethau buddiol ynglyn â thlodi yng nghefn gwlad yn nhermau anghydraddoldebau iechyd.

**Michael German:** Heddiw cafodd penderfyniad y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol i ddogni'r cyffur beta interferon ei ryddhau'n ddirgel. Dywedai mai dim ond ymylol yw'r rhyddhad a rydd y cyffur i ddiodefwr MS. A ydych chi bellach yn cyfaddef bod dogni ar sail cost yn gyffredin yn yr NHS yng Nghymru ac, o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniad hwn, y bydd y rheini sydd yn dibynnu ar yr NHS yn cael gwaeth triniaeth na'r rheini sydd yn fwy cefnog, gan gyfrannu felly at anghydraddoldebau iechyd cynyddol yng Nghymru?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae yna ddeddf gofal wrthdro y cyfeiriwyd ati o'r blaen yn y Siambr hon. Y bobl dlotaf yng Nghymru sydd â'r iechyd gwaelaf ac, yn anffodus, nhw sydd â'r gwasanaethau gwaelaf hefyd. Ceir hefyd ddisgwyliadau isel ymysg y bobl a'r cymunedau hynny. Yr ydym bellach yn datblygu system cynllunio iechyd newydd a rhaglenni gwella iechyd yn yr NHS. Rhaid iddynt gael eu cymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad a minnau i sicrhau nad ydym yn cael y math yna o wahaniaeth ac anghydraddoldeb o ran dyrannu adnoddau. Rhoddir sylw i hyn yn amlwg yn ein hadolygiad dyrannu adnoddau, a fydd yn edrych yn ofalus ar pam fod yr anghydraddoldeb hwn o ran mynediad a gwasanaeth yn bodoli. Bydd yr adolygiad yn edrych hefyd i weld a oes anghydraddoldeb dosbarthu y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae gan y Cynulliad gyfle i ddelio â materion fel rhoi presgripsiynau ar sail codau

will be getting from NICE. I want to refer to its statement this morning. Hopefully, we will come on to that in further questions.

post a rhaid inni edrych ar y cyngor a'r canllawiau a gawn gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol. Yr wyf am gyfeirio at ei ddatganiad y bore yma. Gobeithiaf y down at hynny mewn cwestiynau pellach.

### **Rhaglen Ailgartrefu Pobl ag Anableddau Dysgu Learning Disability Resettlement Programme**

**Q2 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will Jane Hutt make a brief statement on the progress of the learning disability resettlement programme? (OAQ5921)

**C2 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff Jane Hutt ddatganiad byr ar gynnydd y rhaglen i ailgartrefu pobl ag anableddau dysgu? (OAQ5921)

**Jane Hutt:** Three of the long-stay learning disability hospitals in Powys and the Ely Hospital in Cardiff have closed over the last year or so. This year's allocations to local and health authorities include sufficient resources to complete the resettlement programme from Llanfrechfa Grange Hospital. I remain committed to completing the resettlement programme at Hensol Hospital and developing and implementing a comprehensive resettlement programme for Bryn y Neuadd Hospital as quickly as resources allow.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae tri o'r ysbytai anableddau dysgu arhosiad hir ym Mhowys ac Ysbyty Trelái yng Nghaerdydd wedi cau dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn fras. Mae'r dyraniadau eleni i awdurdodau lleol ac iechyd yn cynnwys adnoddau digonol i gwblhau'r rhaglen ailsefydlu o Ysbyty Llanfrechfa Grange. Yr wyf yn dal wedi ymrwymo yn llwyr i gwblhau'r rhaglen ailsefydlu yn Ysbyty Hensol a datblygu a gweithredu rhaglen ailsefydlu gynhwysfawr ar gyfer Ysbyty Bryn y Neuadd cyn gynted ag y bydd adnoddau'n caniatáu.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You have outlined in your answer the importance of this programme. Bearing in mind that we are about to enter the budget process for the next financial year, can you give an assurance that the resettlement procedure will be continued in establishments such as Hensol and Bryn y Neuadd?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydych wedi amlinellu pwysigrwydd y rhaglen hon yn eich ateb. A chofio ein bod ar fin dechrau ar broses y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, a allwch chi roi sicrwydd y bydd y drefn ailsefydlu yn parhau mewn sefydliadau megis Hensol a Bryn y Neuadd?

**Jane Hutt:** I assure you that the resettlement programme is continuing in those hospitals. In Bryn y Neuadd, the comprehensive resettlement programme is starting from scratch and I am pleased to say that the resettlement is progressing there. Recent care packages have been agreed for 16 people to be resettled from the hospital into the community. As this is a priority of the Health and Social Services Committee, I have asked the health authorities to consider—and we are discussing with them—how we meet this objective, particularly in Bryn y Neuadd, given that the other resettlement programmes are progressing according to our resources.

**Jane Hutt:** Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi fod y rhaglen ailsefydlu yn parhau yn yr ysbytai hynny. Ym Mryn y Neuadd, mae'r rhaglen ailsefydlu gynhwysfawr yn dechrau o'r dechrau ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod yr ailsefydlu yn mynd rhagddo yno. Cytunwyd yn ddiweddar ar becynnau gofal i ailsefydlu 16 o bobl o'r ysbyty i'r gymuned. Gan fod hyn yn flaenoriaeth i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r awdurdodau iechyd ystyried—ac yr ydym yn trafod gyda hwy—sut y gallwn gyflawni'r amcan hwn, yn enwedig ym Mryn y Neuadd, o gofio bod y rhaglenni ailsefydlu eraill yn mynd rhagddynt yn unol â'n

You have my commitment that it is on the agenda.

**Kirsty Williams:** I have visited Llanfrechfa Grange and Hensol learning disability hospitals. The conditions in which the residents are living are appalling despite the best efforts of the health authority. The current rate of resettlement will mean that more patients will die rather than be resettled. Do you have a timescale by which you will complete the resettlement programme, bearing in mind that our Scottish colleagues have recently made a commitment to ensure that all their learning disability hospitals are closed within four years?

**Jane Hutt:** I share your concerns about people remaining in the hospitals. I have visited Bryn y Neuadd and talked to the residents and received delegations at the Assembly. I understand that Gwent Health Authority is consulting about the reprovisioning of learning disability services from Llanfrechfa Grange particularly. I cannot anticipate the outcome of these consultations at the moment. However, we are moving forward. We have a target in 'Betterwales.com' to reduce the numbers of residents in long-stay learning disability hospitals to 250 by March 2003. In terms of our discussions on the budget, we must ensure that we get the comprehensive resettlement programme underway to ensure that we can reach a target of not having anybody left in those learning disability hospitals.

2:12 p.m.

**Peter Rogers:** Will the Secretary for Health and Social Services set a deadline for individually costed programmes to facilitate speedy resettlement?

**Jane Hutt:** That is the intention of having a comprehensive resettlement programme, so that the packages required for the remaining residents are developed. However, we need the resources. That is why we have held discussions with the health authorities and the views of the Health and Social Services

hadnoddau. Rhoddaf fy addewid ichi ei fod ar yr agenda.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf wedi ymweld ag ysbytai anableddau dysgu Llanfrechfa Grange a Hensol. Mae'r amodau y mae'r preswylwyr yn byw ynddynt yn arswydus er gwaethaf ymdrechion gorau'r awdurdod iechyd. Bydd y gyfradd ailsefydlu fel y mae yn golygu y bydd mwy o gleifion yn marw yn hytrach na chael eu hailsefydlu. A oes gennych amserlen i ddweud erbyn pryd y byddwch wedi cwblhau'r rhaglen ailsefydlu, o gofio bod ein cydweithwyr yn yr Alban wedi gwneud addewid yn ddiweddar y bydd eu holl ysbytai anableddau dysgu wedi cau o fewn pedair blynedd?

**Jane Hutt:** Rhannaf eich pryderon fod pobl yn dal i fod yn yr ysbytai. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â Bryn y Neuadd ac wedi siarad â'r preswylwyr ac wedi derbyn dirprwyaethau yn y Cynulliad. Deallaf fod Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent yn ymgynghori ynglyn â symud y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau anableddau dysgu o Lanfrechfa Grange yn enwedig. Ni allaf ragweld canlyniad yr ymgynghoriadau hyn ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn symud ymlaen. Mae gennym darged yn 'Gwellcymru.com' i ostwng nifer y preswylwyr mewn ysbytai anableddau dysgu arhosiad hir i 250 erbyn Mawrth 2003. O ran ein trafodaethau ar y gyllideb, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y rhaglen ailsefydlu gynhwysfawr yn cael ei rhoi ar y gweill i sicrhau y gallwn gyrraedd targed o beidio â chael neb ar ôl yn yr ysbytai hyn ar gyfer anableddau dysgu.

**Peter Rogers:** A wnaiff yr Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol bennu dyddiad terfyn ar gyfer rhaglenni wedi'u costio'n unigol i hwyluso ailsefydlu cyflym?

**Jane Hutt:** Dyna'r bwriad wrth gael rhaglen ailsefydlu gynhwysfawr, fel y bydd y pecynnau sydd yn ofynnol ar gyfer y preswylwyr sydd yn weddill yn cael eu datblygu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod â'r adnoddau. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r awdurdodau iechyd ac

Committee mean that we must ensure that this is high up on the agenda, so that the care packages are developed. They are often complex packages.

mae barn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn golygu bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod hyn yn uchel ar yr agenda, fel bod y pecynnau gofal yn cael eu datblygu. Maent yn aml yn becynnau cymhleth.

### **Canolfan Iechyd Cymru Wales Centre for Health**

**C3 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff Jane Hutt ddatganiad byr ar rôl Canolfan Iechyd Cymru? (OAQ5937)

**Q3 Elin Jones:** Will Jane Hutt make a brief statement on the role of the Wales Centre for Health? (OAQ5937)

**Jane Hutt:** The Wales Centre for Health will provide an overall focus for the health improvement agenda in Wales. I am glad that we are about to appoint a project manager for the Wales Centre for Health. It will be an important gateway to the national network of experience, skills and knowledge, and provide a central health information resource. It will be about promoting effective action to address health and wellbeing needs in Wales.

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd Canolfan Iechyd Cymru yn rhoi ffocws cyffredinol i'r agenda gwella iechyd yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod ar fin penodi rheolwr prosiect i Ganolfan Iechyd Cymru. Bydd yn borth pwysig at y rhwydwaith cenedlaethol o brofiad, sgiliau a gwybodaeth, ac yn darparu adnodd canolog o wybodaeth iechyd. Ei hanfod fydd hyrwyddo gweithredu effeithiol er mwyn rhoi sylw i anghenion iechyd a lles yng Nghymru.

**Elin Jones:** Er mwyn rhoi sylw strategol i iechyd cyhoeddus, rhaid sicrhau bod data iechyd priodol ar gael ar bob lefel—ar lefel ward yn ogystal ag ar lefel awdurdod lleol. A yw'r Ysgrifennydd yn barod i ymrwymo i sicrhau bod buddsoddiad teilwng yn cael ei neilltuo er mwyn creu sail ystadegol berthnasol i gynllunio iechyd cyhoeddus?

**Elin Jones:** In order to give strategic attention to public health, we must ensure that appropriate health data is available on every level—on ward level as well as a local authority level. Is the Secretary prepared to commit to ensuring that a worthy investment is set aside to create a relevant statistical basis for public health planning?

**Jane Hutt:** That is vital. Attention to public health through 'Better Health, Better Wales', which laid the foundations for the Wales Centre for Health, provides us with the impetus for that. In terms of public health, it is clear that we have a great deal of information, provided by the Chief Medical Officer's report, and the Centre will push that forward.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n hanfodol. Mae sylw i iechyd y cyhoedd drwy 'Gwell Iechyd, Gwell Cymru', a osododd y sylfaen ar gyfer Canolfan Iechyd Cymru, yn rhoi'r ysgogiad inni ar gyfer hynny. Yn nhermau iechyd cyhoeddus, mae'n amlwg bod gennym lawer iawn o wybodaeth, a ddarperir yn adroddiad y Prif Swyddog Meddygol, a bydd y Ganolfan yn gwthio hynny ymlaen.

**Mick Bates:** What plans do you have to establish a rural health centre, which would show our commitment to the problems encountered in delivering healthcare in rural areas?

**Mick Bates:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i sefydlu canolfan iechyd gwledig, a fyddai'n dangos ein hymrwymiad i'r problemau a wynebir wrth gyflwyno gofal iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig?

**Jane Hutt:** We visited the Institute of Rural Health together recently, and I am aware that it has a valuable role in developing a national centre for health. I see that body as a partner

**Jane Hutt:** Ymwelsom â'r Sefydliad Iechyd Gwledig gyda'n gilydd yn ddiweddar, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod iddo rôl werthfawr yn datblygu canolfan iechyd genedlaethol.



in the Wales Centre for Health. We must ensure that the Wales Centre for Health embraces rural as well as urban needs as part of the public health agenda.

Gwelaf y corff hwnnw fel partner i Ganolfan Iechyd Cymru. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod Canolfan Iechyd Cymru yn cwmpasu anghenion gwledig yn ogystal â threfol fel rhan o agenda iechyd y cyhoedd.

### **Rhestrau Aros (Triniaethau Arferol) Waiting Lists (Routine Treatment)**

**Q4 Richard Edwards:** How does Jane Hutt intend to eliminate waiting lists in areas of routine treatment such as cataracts and hip replacements? (OAQ5952)

**C4 Richard Edwards:** Sut mae Jane Hutt yn bwriadu cael gwared ar restrau aros mewn meysydd lle rhoddir triniaeth arferol megis cataractau a chluniau newydd? (OAQ5952)

**Jane Hutt:** Last month over £40 million was made available to health authorities to tackle unacceptable waiting lists, waiting times and emergency pressures. Each health authority and trust is expected to use that money to meet challenging targets, including the elimination of waiting times of over six months for cataract treatment.

**Jane Hutt:** Fis diwethaf rhyddhawyd dros £40 miliwn i'r awdurdodau iechyd i fynd i'r afael â rhestrau aros annerbyniol, amserau aros a phwysau mewn argyfwng. Disgwylir i bob awdurdod ac ymddiriedolaeth iechyd ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i gyflawni targedau llym, gan gynnwys dileu amserau aros o ragor na chwe mis am driniaeth cataract.

**Richard Edwards:** I welcome the extra investment to which you referred. In anticipation of Conservative supplementary question, do you agree that the current situation in relation to routine operations stems directly from the total lack of commitment given by the former Tory Government to the health service, as well as its blatant failure to tackle structural reforms needed to eliminate waiting lists?

**Richard Edwards:** Croesawaf y buddsoddiad ychwanegol y cyfeiriwch ato. Gan ragweld cwestiwn atodol gan y Ceidwadwyr, a ydych yn cytuno bod y sefyllfa bresennol mewn perthynas â llawdriniaethau arferol yn deillio'n uniongyrchol o ddiffyg ymroddiad llwyr y Llywodraeth Doriaidd flaenorol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, yn ogystal â'i methiant digywilydd i fynd i'r afael â'r diwygiadau strwythurol a oedd yn ofynnol i ddileu rhestrau aros?

**Jane Hutt:** We talked this morning about the after-effects of the internal market in relation to the situation in Dyfed Powys, which, unfortunately, lost planning direction and increased the competition in that area, having a detrimental effect on the health of its communities.

**Jane Hutt:** Siaradasom y bore yma am ôl-ffeithiau'r farchnad fewnol mewn perthynas â'r sefyllfa yn Nyfed Powys sydd, yn anffodus, wedi colli'r awenau o safbwynt cynllunio ac wedi cynyddu'r gystadleuaeth yn yr ardal honno, gydag effaith niweidiol ar iechyd ei gymunedau.

**Pauline Jarman:** Do you accept that paying private hospitals to treat NHS patients in order to reduce waiting lists may have benefits in the short term, but in the long term it is a scandalous waste of public money, which could be better invested in the NHS?

**Pauline Jarman:** A ydych yn derbyn y gallai fod manteision yn y tymor byr o dalu ysbytai preifat i drin cleifion NHS er mwyn lleihau rhestrau aros ond, yn y tymor hir, ei fod yn wastraff gwarthus o arian cyhoeddus, y byddai'n well ei fuddsoddi yn yr NHS?

**Jane Hutt:** I want to ensure that we use all the NHS's resources to deal with waiting times and clinical priorities in Wales. We want our health authorities to use all the resources of the NHS in Wales. We have a small private sector in Wales, in any case. Therefore I would see this as being marginal in any proposals from trusts and health authorities.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the Secretary make her commitment to reduce the waiting list by 15,000 by March 2001 a matter of confidence? Will she resign if she fails and that target, like many others in the past, is not met?

**Jane Hutt:** As I said to your colleague David Melding in the Health and Social Services Committee this morning, this is about targets that have been agreed with the health service. We call them 'deliverables' and I expect them to be so.

**Jenny Randerson:** When you set and announced your targets for waiting lists and so on, you did not set targets for orthopaedics. In Bro Taf Health Authority, patients now wait up to three and a half years for hip replacements. That is considerably longer than the waiting time when the Conservatives left office and is far worse than of England. What will you do about this situation, which is unacceptable in a civilised society?

**Jane Hutt:** I am awaiting plans from the trusts and health authorities on how they will reduce waiting times for orthopaedics. We will produce those plans in the summer. However, new orthopaedic surgeons have already been appointed locally, which is a positive step forward.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf am sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio holl adnoddau'r NHS i ddelio â rhestrau aros a blaenoriaethau clinigol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym am i'n hawdurdodau iechyd ddefnyddio holl adnoddau'r NHS yng Nghymru. Sector preifat bach sydd gennym yng Nghymru, beth bynnag. Byddwn felly yn ystyried hyn yn rhywbeth ymylol mewn unrhyw gynigion o du ymddiriedolaethau ac awdurdodau iechyd.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff yr Ysgrifennydd ei haddewid i leihau'r rhestr aros o 15,000 erbyn Mawrth 2001 yn fater o hyder? A wnaiff hi ymddiswyddo os metha ac na chaiff y targed hwnnw, fel cynifer o dargedau eraill yn y gorffennol, ei gyflawni?

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y dywedais wrth eich cyd-Aelod David Melding yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma, yr ydym yn sôn am dargedau y cytunwyd arnynt gyda'r awdurdod iechyd. Galwn hwy yn dargedau 'cyflawnadwy' a disgwyliaf iddynt gael eu cyflawni.

**Jenny Randerson:** Pan wnaethoch chi osod a chyhoeddi eich targedau ar gyfer rhestrau aros ac ati, ni wnaethoch osod targedau ar gyfer orthopedeg. Yn Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf, mae cleifion bellach yn disgwyl hyd at dair blynedd a hanner am glun newydd. Mae hynny gryn lawer yn hwy na'r amser aros pan ymadawodd y Ceidwadwyr â'r Llywodraeth ac mae'n llawer gwaeth nag yn Lloegr. Beth wnewch chi am y sefyllfa hon, sydd yn annerbyniol mewn cymdeithas wâr?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn disgwyl am gynlluniau oddi wrth yr ymddiriedolaethau a'r awdurdodau iechyd ar sut y byddant yn lleihau amserau aros i orthopedeg. Byddwn yn llunio'r cynlluniau hynny yn yr haf. Fodd bynnag, mae milfeddygon orthopedig newydd wedi'u penodi'n lleol, sydd yn gam positif ymlaen.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16** **Questions to the Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training**

### **Pobl Ifanc sydd wedi'u Hallgáu'n Gymdeithasol (Addysg Uwch)** **Young People from Socially Excluded Backgrounds (Higher Education)**

**Q1 Richard Edwards:** Does The Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training have plans to examine ways of encouraging young people from socially excluded backgrounds into higher education? (OAQ5897)

**The Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training (Tom Middlehurst):** My response to this question will possibly also cover John Griffiths's question 3. However, that is for him to decide.

The Higher Education Funding Council for Wales has established a range of programmes and initiatives designed to support institutions in responding to the educational support needs of what might be described as non-traditional students. For example, the council has a scheme aimed at developing compact arrangements and other links between higher education institutions and schools in order to motivate pupils to stay on in school and progress to higher education. The Assembly has asked the council to continue to work with institutions to promote the recruitment of students from under-represented groups and to ensure that these students' pastoral needs are met.

**Richard Edwards:** Thank you for that answer. Do you therefore agree that financial inducement should be given to higher education institutions that can demonstrate commitment to, and a strategy for, widening participation?

**Tom Middlehurst:** The funding council has responded positively to that. It has introduced a weighting factor, which gives institutions extra funding for students recruited from disadvantaged backgrounds. That identification is made by students' postcode area. Therefore we can target resources at areas that are particularly

**C1 Richard Edwards:** A oes gan yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a hyfforddiant Ôl-16 gynlluniau i ymchwilio i ffyrdd o annog mwy o bobl ifanc o gefndiroedd sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n gymdeithasol i symud ymlaen i addysg uwch? (OAQ5897)

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 (Tom Middlehurst):** Mae'n bosibl y bydd fy ymateb i'r cwestiwn hwn yn delio hefyd â chwestiwn 3 gan John Griffiths. Fodd bynnag, mater iddo ef i'w benderfynu yw hynny.

Mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru wedi sefydlu ystod o raglenni a chynlluniau a fwriadwyd i gynorthwyo sefydliadau i ymateb i anghenion cefnogaeth addysgol y rheini y gellid eu disgrifio fel myfyrwyr anhraddodiadol. Er enghraifft, mae gan y cyngor gynllun sydd â'r nod o ddatblygu trefniadau compact a chysylltiadau eraill rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch ac ysgolion er mwyn ysgogi disgyblion i aros yn yr ysgol a symud ymlaen i addysg uwch. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi gofyn i'r cyngor barhau i weithio gyda sefydliadau i hyrwyddo'r gwaith o recriwtio myfyrwyr o grwpiau nad ydynt wedi'u cynrychioli'n ddigonol a sicrhau bod anghenion bugeiliol y myfyrwyr hyn yn cael eu diwallu.

**Richard Edwards:** Diolch i chi am yr ateb hwnnw. A ydych chi'n cytuno felly y dylid rhoi cymhelliad ariannol i sefydliadau addysg uwch sydd yn gallu dangos ymrwymiad i, a strategaeth ar gyfer, ehangu cyfranogiad?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Mae'r cyngor cyllido wedi ymateb yn bositif i hynny. Mae wedi cyflwyno ffactor pwysoli, sydd yn rhoi cyllid ychwanegol i sefydliadau ar gyfer myfyrwyr a recriwtir o gefndiroedd difreintiedig. Seilir hynny ar ardal cod post y myfyrwyr. Gallwn felly dargedu adnoddau at ardaloedd sydd wedi'u hamddifadu'n neilltuol.

deprived.

**William Graham:** Will the Secretary confirm that policies of setting A-level entry grades by postcode will not be tolerated in Wales and that students' standards will not be dumbed-down in an attempt to set social inclusion above academic prowess?

**Tom Middlehurst:** I think that we all accept that we are trying to get more students into the higher education system. Whatever the mechanisms, we should welcome that initiative. I do not want the quality of students entering higher education diminished. I want adequate and effective support for students in their school years to enable them to obtain the qualifications necessary to enter university. This Government has taken many initiatives to support students, not least mature students and people returning to learning. We are promoting a ladder of opportunity through the further education sector, for example, to ensure that people, if they are able, can access higher education.

**Christine Humphreys:** Thank you for that answer. However, we must accept that it is not only among social excluded youngsters that we have a problem. Recent analysis has shown that there is a shortfall in applications from the state sector. That accounts for the failure to achieve proportionate offers to students from top universities. The latest Universities and Colleges Admissions Service figures show a decline in the numbers of students applying for university places in Wales. The only area showing an increase in applications to universities is Scotland. What advice would Tom Middlehurst give to students in state sector schools in Wales regarding their choices of university?

2:22 p.m.

**Tom Middlehurst:** I want to talk about the state sector and the situation in Welsh higher education. We have performed relatively better than any other part of the United

**William Graham:** A wnaiff yr Ysgrifennydd gadarnhau na chaiff polisi o bennu graddau mynediad Safon Uwch yn ôl cod post ei oddef yng Nghymru ac na chaiff safonau myfyrwyr eu gostwng mewn ymgais i osod cynhwysiant cymdeithasol uwchlaw gallu academiaidd?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Credaf ein bod i gyd yn derbyn ein bod yn ceisio cael mwy o fyfyrwyr i mewn i'r system addysg uwch. Beth bynnag fo'r mecanweithiau, dylem groesawu'r fenter honno. Nid wyf am i ansawdd myfyrwyr sydd yn mynd i mewn i addysg uwch gael ei gwanhau. Yr wyf am gael cefnogaeth ddigonol ac effeithiol i fyfyrwyr yn eu blynyddoedd ysgol i'w galluogi i ennill y cymwysterau angenrheidiol i fynd i brifysgol. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi ymgymryd â llawer o gynlluniau i gefnogi myfyrwyr, nid leiaf fyfyrwyr aeddfed a phobl sydd yn dychwelyd i ddysgu. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo grisiau cyfle drwy'r sector addysg bellach, er enghraifft, i sicrhau y gall pobl, os yw'r gallu ganddynt, fynd i mewn i addysg uwch.

**Christine Humphreys:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dderbyn nad dim ond ymysg pobl ifanc sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n gymdeithasol y mae gennym broblem. Dengys dadansoddiad diweddar ddiffyg mewn ceisiadau o'r sector gwladol. Hynny sydd i gyfrif am y methiant i sicrhau cynigion cymesur i fyfyrwyr oddi wrth y prifysgolion gorau. Dengys ffigurau diweddaraf y Gwasanaeth Mynediad i Brifysgolion a Cholegau ostyngiad yn nifer y myfyrwyr o Gymru sydd yn ymgeisio am le mewn prifysgol. Yr unig ardal sydd yn dangos cynnydd yn y ceisiadau i brifysgolion yw'r Alban. Pa gyngor fyddai Tom Middlehurst yn ei roi i fyfyrwyr yn ysgolion y sector gwladol yng Nghymru ynglyn â'u dewis o brifysgol?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Yr wyf am siarad am y sector gwladol a'r sefyllfa o fewn addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi perfformio'n well yn gymharol nag unrhyw

Kingdom in attracting entrants from the state sector. In the 1997/98 statistics—the latest ones, regrettably—88 per cent of first-time degree students in higher education came from state schools compared with 81 per cent in England and Scotland. We perform well in attracting students from disadvantaged backgrounds, which comprise 50 per cent of new entrants in Wales compared with an average of 12 per cent in the UK. We perform particularly well in terms of mature students. Ninety per cent of all undergraduate students in Wales have had no previous higher education compared with 50 per cent in England and 70 per cent in Scotland. That shows that we are tackling the issues in Wales. We are heading in the right direction. I am not complacent. I know that much more needs to be done. Government policies need to be targeted at providing support for students from whatever circumstances they may come.

**John Griffiths:** We have recently seen statistics showing the indefensible nature of the private schools intake of the so-called top universities in England. One sure-fire way of ending this ongoing debate would be to take effective steps to greatly reduce if not totally eliminate the number of pupils going to private schools in Britain. Could some long-term thought be given to strategies to achieve that?

**Tom Middlehurst:** We want a greater involvement of students in the higher education sector in Wales. I have the responsibility of promoting wider participation and involvement and I will do all I can to encourage increased numbers of people obtaining higher education and the entailing benefits.

**Owen John Thomas:** The recent Higher Education Funding Council's report on participation rates for Welsh students in higher education revealed that eight out of 22 local authorities in Wales have participation rates significantly lower than the UK average. Considering that the Welsh A-level results have been considerably better than the UK average, does this demonstrate that

ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig o ran denu myfyrwyr newydd o'r sector gwladol. Yn ystadegau 1997/98—y rhai diweddaraf, yn anffodus—deuai 88 y cant o'r myfyrwyr gradd tro-cyntaf o ysgolion gwladol o'i gymharu â 81 y cant yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Yr ydym yn perfformio'n dda yn denu myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd difreintiedig, sef 50 y cant o'r myfyrwyr newydd yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â 12 y cant ar gyfartaledd yn y DU. Yr ydym yn perfformio'n neilltuol o dda yn nhermau myfyrwyr aeddfed. Mae naw deg y cant o'r holl fyfyrwyr israddedig yng Nghymru heb unrhyw addysg uwch flaenorol o'i gymharu â 50 y cant yn Lloegr a 70 y cant yn yr Alban. Dengys hynny ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Nid wyf yn hunanfodlon. Gwn fod angen gwneud llawer mwy. Mae angen targedu polisïau'r Llywodraeth at ddarparu cefnogaeth i fyfyrwyr o ba amgylchiadau bynnag y dônt.

**John Griffiths:** Yn ddiweddar yr ydym wedi gweld ystadegau yn dangos bod y rhai a elwir yn brifysgolion pennaf Lloegr yn derbyn myfyrwyr o ysgolion preifat mewn modd na ellir ei amddiffyn. Un ffordd sicr o roi terfyn ar y ddadl barhaus hon fyddai cymryd camau effeithiol i leihau yn ddirfawr os nad i ddileu yn llwyr y nifer o ddisgyblion sydd yn mynd i ysgolion preifat ym Mhrydain. A ellir ystyried strategaethau i gyflawni hynny yn y tymor hir?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Yr ydym am gynnwys myfyrwyr fwyfwy yn y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Fi sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb am hyrwyddo cyfranogiad ac ymwneud ehangach a byddaf yn gwneud popeth a allaf i annog niferoedd mwy o bobl i gael addysg uwch a'r manteision a ddaw yn sgîl hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Datgelodd adroddiad diweddar y Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch ar gyfraddau cyfranogi myfyrwyr Cymru mewn addysg uwch fod gan wyth allan o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru gyfraddau cyfranogi sylweddol is na chyfartaledd y DU. Ac ystyried bod canlyniadau Safon Uwch Cymru wedi bod yn sylweddol well na chyfartaledd y DU, a yw hyn yn dangos bod

access funds are having the desired effect of attracting young people in Wales into higher education?

**Tom Middlehurst:** It demonstrates that we need to exercise greater efforts within the higher education sector to provide increased opportunities for access to higher education. I am concerned to address those issues. The Subject Committee in its review of higher education that will commence in the autumn will want to address some of those fundamental issues.

cronfeydd mynediad yn cael yr effaith a ddymunir o ddenu pobl ifanc yng Nghymru i mewn i addysg uwch?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Mae'n dangos bod angen inni ymdrechu'n fwy o fewn y sector addysg uwch i ddarparu mwy o gyfleoedd ar gyfer mynediad i addysg uwch. Yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i roi sylw i'r materion hynny. Bydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn ei adolygiad o addysg uwch a fydd yn dechrau yn yr hydref am roi sylw i rai o'r ysyriaethau sylfaenol hynny.

### Llais Ifanc Young Voice

**Q2 Kirsty Williams:** How will Tom Middlehurst ensure that future membership of Young Voice-Llais Ifanc represents each area of Wales? (OAQ5895)

**Tom Middlehurst:** Young Voice-Llais Ifanc has no formal membership. It is at the developmental stage. The initiative has been designed to be open to all young people in Wales. If by 'membership' you were referring to the participants at the Young Voice-Llais Ifanc 'Breaking Barriers' conference on 7 July, all the local authorities in Wales have been invited to nominate at least two people from their area to join the conference in Cardiff. The conference will also link up live with young people from all over Wales via regional teleconferencing and the internet.

**Kirsty Williams:** It can be difficult to ensure that organisations and conferences like the one in July are not swamped by mini-AMs or would-be politicians. We need to ensure that all young people in Wales—no matter which geographical area of Wales they come from or which structures they come from whether formal education or the youth work sector—have a true mandate among young people and are not just placements. How will you ensure that the people who take part in these conferences have a mandate from young people themselves?

**C2 Kirsty Williams:** Sut y bydd Tom Middlehurst yn sicrhau bod aelodau Young Voice-Llais Ifanc yn y dyfodol yn cynrychioli pob ardal o Gymru? (OAQ5895)

**Tom Middlehurst:** Nid oes aelodaeth ffurfiol i Young Voice-Llais Ifanc. Mae'n cael ei ddatblygu y mae ar hyn o bryd. Cynlluniwyd y fenter i fod yn agored i holl bobl ifanc Cymru. Os oeddech drwy 'aelodaeth' yn cyfeirio at y cyfranogwyr yng nghynhadledd Young Voice-Llais Ifanc 'Chwalu'r Ffin' ar 7 Gorffennaf, mae'r holl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru wedi cael gwahoddiad i enwebu o leiaf ddau berson o'u hardal i ymuno â'r gynhadledd yng Nghaerdydd. Bydd y gynhadledd hefyd yn cysylltu'n fyw â phobl ifanc ym mhob rhan o Gymru drwy delegynadleda rhanbarthol a'r rhyngrwyd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gall fod yn anodd sicrhau nad yw cyrff a chynadledau fel yr un yng Ngorffennaf yn cael eu boddi gan gyw-ACau neu egin wleidyddion. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod gan holl bobl ifanc Cymru—ni waeth o ba ardal ddaeryddol o Gymru y dônt nac o ba strwythurau boed hynny'n addysg ffurfiol neu'r sector gwaith ieuenctid—fandad gwirioneddol ymysg pobl ifanc ac nad wedi'u gosod yno yn unig y maent. Sut y byddwch chi'n sicrhau bod gan y bobl sydd yn cymryd rhan yn y cynadledau hyn fandad oddi wrth bobl ifanc eu hunain?

**Tom Middlehurst:** We do not want to be overly prescriptive. We want this initiative to develop organically—from the bottom up—driven by the needs and aspirations of young people. We—the men and women in suits—ought to take a back seat and allow our young people in Wales to express their voice through this opportunity. The conference on 7 July is a groundbreaking event, and we should build on that exciting initiative. We do not have all the answers—we are looking for the answers from our future generation, which is represented by our young people. I want to encourage full participation from all corners of Wales from whatever background. I urge Members, in spite of my plea to give the floor to young people, to show their support for those young people by attending the conference on 7 July.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae Tom Middlehurst wedi codi cwestiwn cefnogaeth i'r gynhadledd drwy ein presenoldeb. Dyna fy mhroblem i fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ac fel un sydd â diddordeb arbennig mewn materion ieuenctid. A yw'n cytuno ei bod yn broblem fod y gynhadledd hon yn digwydd ar yr un diwrnod â chyfarfodydd dau bwyllgor rhanbarth? Gwn am eraill, megis Elin Jones—ein llefarydd ar y materion hyn—na all fod yn bresennol ychwaith. A fedrwch chi sicrhau yn y dyfodol—os yw hi'n rhy hwyr i newid dyddiad y gynhadledd hon—fod modd i Aelodau Cynulliad, yn enwedig y rhai sydd â diddordeb uniongyrchol yn y maes hwn, fod yn bresennol?

**Tom Middlehurst:** I acknowledge that it creates problems for some Assembly Members and I believe that those who have organised this conference recognise that, but there will never be a date that suits everyone. I am encouraged, however, that the Deputy Presiding Officer, the First Secretary, Rosemary Butler, Andrew Davies and myself—and many others I am sure—will be there to show our support on the day. This conference has been organised by the Young Voice-Llais Ifanc co-ordinating team and we should respond as best we can to their initiative. I recognise that it is difficult for Members, not least because of the

**Tom Middlehurst:** Nid ydym am fod yn orgyfarwyddol. Yr ydym am i'r fenter hon ddatblygu'n organig—o'r gwaelod i fyny—wedi'i gyrru gan anghenion a dyheadau pobl ifanc. Dylem ni—y dynion a'r menywod mewn siwtiau—gymryd sedd gefn a chaniatáu i bobl ifanc Cymru fynegi eu llais drwy'r cyfle hwn. Mae'r gynhadledd ar 7 Gorffennaf yn torri tir newydd, a dylem adeiladu ar y fenter gyffrous hon. Nid yw'r holl atebion gennym—yr ydym yn chwilio am atebion oddi wrth genhedlaeth y dyfodol, a gynrychiolir gan ein pobl ifanc. Yr wyf am annog cyfranogiad llawn o bob cornel o Gymru o ba gefndir bynnag. Anogaf yr Aelodau, er gwaethaf fy mhle am roi'r llawr i bobl ifanc, i ddangos eu cefnogaeth i'r bobl ifanc hynny drwy ddod i'r gynhadledd ar 7 Gorffennaf.

**Cynog Dafis:** Tom Middlehurst has raised the question of support for the conference through our attendance. That is my problem as Chair of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee and as someone who has a special interest in youth issues. Does he agree that it is a problem that this conference is taking place on the same day as two regional committee meetings? I know of others, such as Elin Jones—our spokesperson on these issues—who cannot be present either. Could you ensure in future—if it is too late to change the date of this conference—that it is possible for Assembly Members, particularly those with a direct interest in this field, to be present?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Cydnabyddaf ei fod yn creu problemau i rai Aelodau o'r Cynulliad a chredaf fod y rheini a drefnodd y gynhadledd hon yn cydnabod hynny, ond ni cheir dyddiad fyth a fydd yn addas i bawb. Calonogir fi, beth bynnag, y bydd y Dirprwy Lywydd, y Prif Ysgrifennydd, Rosemary Butler, Andrew Davies a minnau—a llawer o rai eraill yr wyf yn siwr—yno i ddangos ein cefnogaeth ar y diwrnod. Trefnwyd y gynhadledd hon gan dîm cydlynu Young Voice-Llais Ifanc a dylem ymateb orau y medrwn i'r fenter honno. Cydnabyddaf ei bod yn anodd i'r Aelodau, nid leiaf oherwydd yr ymrwymiadau sylweddol sydd

considerable commitments that they have in their constituencies.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Several weeks ago the Joseph Rowntree Foundation produced a report suggesting that young people, while being interested in politics and political issues, were completely and utterly disinterested in politicians. Bearing in mind that this scheme has been initiated by politicians and supported by them, how do we overcome this problem?

**Tom Middlehurst:** We provided the opportunity and the basis upon which we can develop this initiative. It is important, however, that the initiative is being taken forward by a co-ordinating team—a broad-based organisation, well represented by young people. All we have provided is the kick-start to the process, but I want the ownership to be in the hands of the young people of Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Jane Davidson):** It is not often that I get up as Deputy Presiding Officer, but two points need to be made from the Office of the Presiding Officer's point of view, which it would be difficult for the Presiding Officer to make from the chair. First, this conference was not initiated by politicians—that is important. The conference was initiated by young people who approached the Office of the Presiding Officer about using the Chamber, and the date was set with the young people. The direct involvement of politicians came later.

**The Presiding Officer:** Do you have a question?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am clarifying a point of view as Deputy Presiding Officer. Does the Secretary agree that this is an Assembly initiative that is being supported by the Executive, rather than an Executive initiative that is being carried out in the Assembly?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Yes, I agree.

ganddynt yn eu hetholaethau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nifer o wythnosau yn ôl cynhyrchodd Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree adroddiad yn awgrymu bod pobl ifanc, er bod ganddynt ddiddordeb mewn gwleidyddiaeth a materion gwleidyddol, heb unrhyw ddiddordeb o fath yn y byd mewn gwleidyddion. A chofio bod y cynllun hwn wedi ei ddechrau gan wleidyddion a'i gefnogi ganddynt, sut y mae goresgyn y broblem hon?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Ni a ddarparodd y cyfle a'r sylfaen y gallwn ddatblygu'r fenter hon arni. Mae'n bwysig, fodd bynnag, mai tîm cydlynus sydd yn tywys y fenter yn ei blaen—corff eang ei seiliau, gyda chynrychiolaeth dda o bobl ifanc arno. Y cyfan a ddarparwyd gennym ni oedd cicdaniad i'r broses, ond yr wyf am i'r berchnogaeth fod yn nwylo pobl ifanc Cymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (Jane Davidson):** Nid yn aml y byddaf yn codi fel Dirprwy Lywydd, ond mae angen gwneud dau bwynt o safbwynt Swyddfa'r Llywydd, y byddai'n anodd i'r Llywydd eu gwneud o'r gadair. Yn gyntaf, nid gwleidyddion a ddechreuodd y fenter hon—mae hynny'n bwysig. Cafodd ei hysgogi gan bobl ifanc a gysylltodd â Swyddfa'r Llywydd ynglyn â defnyddio'r Siambr, a chafodd y dyddiad ei bennu gyda'r bobl ifanc. Yn ddiweddarach y bu'r gwleidyddion â rhan uniongyrchol.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gennych gwestiwn?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn egluro safbwynt fel Dirprwy Lywydd. A yw'r Ysgrifennydd yn cytuno mai menter o du'r Cynulliad sydd yn cael ei chefnogi gan y Weithrediaeth, yn hytrach na menter gan y Weithrediaeth sydd yn cael ei chynnal gan y Cynulliad, yw hon?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Ydwyf, yr wyf yn cytuno.



**The Presiding Officer:** Question 3 has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae Cwestiwn 3 wedi ei dynnu'n ôl.

**Dyledion Myfyrwyr (Effaith Ffioedd Hyfforddi)  
Student Debt (Impact of Tuition Fees)**

**Q4 Peter Black:** What measures are available to the National Assembly to alleviate the impact of tuition fees on student debt? (OAQ5887)

**C4 Peter Black:** Pa fesurau sydd ar gael i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol liniaru effaith ffioedd hyfforddi ar ddyledion myfyrwyr? (OAQ5887)

**Tom Middlehurst:** I repeat that the question of tuition fees and student support rests with the Department for Education and Employment. The function has not been devolved to the National Assembly for Wales. However, the National Assembly makes access funds available to Welsh higher education institutions so that it can provide selective help at its discretion to students who experience financial difficulties while studying or who might otherwise be unable to take up their courses because of financial reasons.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Ailadroddaf fod mater ffioedd hyfforddi a chefnogaeth i fyfyrwyr yn aros gyda'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Nid yw'r swyddogaeth wedi'i datganoli i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn darparu cronfeydd mynediad i sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru fel y gallant roi help dethol yn ôl eu disgrisiwn i fyfyrwyr sydd yn wynebu anawsterau ariannol tra'n astudio neu na fyddent yn medru ymgymryd â'u cyrsiau fel arall efallai am resymau ariannol.

2:32 p.m.

**Peter Black:** Do you agree with the view of the independent Cubie committee of the Scottish Parliament, which has been echoed by the Vice Chancellor of the University of Durham, Sir Kenneth Calman and Oxford University's Professor John Stein that a major barrier to applying for a place at university is the prospect of student poverty and debt? Will you take up the matter of tuition fees with DfEE and ask it to follow the example of the administration in Scotland and abolish them for England and Wales?

**Peter Black:** A ydych yn cytuno â barn pwyllgor annibynnol Cubie Senedd yr Alban, a ategwyd gan Is-ganghellor Prifysgol Durham, Syr Kenneth Calman a'r Athro John Stein o Brifysgol Rhydychen, fod y rhagolygon tlodi a dyled i fyfyrwyr yn rhwystr mawr rhag ymgeisio am le mewn prifysgol? A wnewch chi godi mater y ffioedd hyfforddi gyda'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth a gofyn iddi ddilyn esiampl gweinyddiaeth yr Alban a'u diddymu yng Nghymru a Lloegr?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Evidence shows that the system is working well in England and Wales. There are mechanisms in place to provide support for students. It is worth recounting that, after means testing, over a third of students will not pay tuition fees. A third will pay reduced fees and only about a third will pay the full tuition fee. In addition, there are many opportunities for students to support themselves through university. It is worth suggesting at this stage that the advantages of the investment that people

**Tom Middlehurst:** Dengys tystiolaeth fod y system yn gweithio'n dda yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae mecanweithiau wedi eu sefydlu i ddarparu cefnogaeth i fyfyrwyr. Mae'n werth dweud na fydd dros draean y myfyrwyr yn talu ffioedd hyfforddi, ar ôl y prawf moddion. Bydd traean yn talu ffioedd is a dim ond rhyw draean fydd yn talu'r ffi hyfforddi yn llawn. Yn ychwanegol, mae llawer o gyfleoedd i fyfyrwyr gynnal eu hunain drwy'r brifysgol. Mae'n werth awgrymu ar yr adeg hon fod manteision y

make in their education are obvious in terms of their employment prospects and earning capacity. That was borne out in the Dearing report, which produced the current arrangements for student support.

**Elin Jones:** Gan fod Llywodraeth Blair am gael gwared ar elitiaeth o fewn colegau meddygol, a yw'r Ysgrifennydd yn credu bod rhagolwg pob myfyriwr meddygol o wynebu dyled o tua £50,000 ar ddiwedd cyfnod astudio yn mynd i fod yn rhwystr i Goleg Meddygol Prifysgol Cymru a'i ddymuniad i recriwtio myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd difreintiedig yng Nghymru?

**Tom Middlehurst:** The University of Wales College of Medicine will not be disadvantaged more than any other college, and students in Wales will not be disadvantaged. The University of Wales College of Medicine's reputation will ensure that there will always be a heavy load of applications to enter that college.

**Peter Rogers:** As so many successful Assembly Members have benefited from free education, would Tom Middlehurst consider backdating fees to ensure that everybody who has enjoyed a university education is now forced to pay?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Past and present Governments have always expected some contribution from people in support of their higher education. There is nothing new in that principle. As a Government and the Assembly, we have tried to refocus that so that those in greatest need receive the support that they require.

buddsoddiad a wna pobl yn eu haddysg yn amlwg o ran eu rhagolygon gwaith a'u gallu i ennill cyflog. Cafodd hynny ei gadarnhau yn adroddiad Dearing, a luniodd y trefniadau cyfredol ar gyfer cefnogi myfyrwyr.

**Elin Jones:** Because the Blair Government wants to get rid of elitism in medical colleges, does the Secretary believe that the prospect of every medical student of facing a debt of about £50,000 at the end of the study period will be an obstacle to the University of Wales College of Medicine in its wish to recruit students from underprivileged backgrounds in Wales?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Ni fydd Coleg Meddygol Prifysgol Caerdydd o dan fwy o anfantais nag unrhyw goleg arall, ac ni fydd myfyrwyr o Gymru o dan anfantais. Bydd enw da Coleg Meddygol Prifysgol Caerdydd yn sicrhau bod baich trwm o geisiadau am fynediad i'r coleg hwnnw bob amser.

**Peter Rogers:** Gan fod cynifer o Aelodau llwyddiannus y Cynulliad wedi elwa o addysg am ddim, a fyddai Tom Middlehurst yn ystyried ôl-ddyddio ffioedd i sicrhau bod pawb sydd wedi mwynhau addysg prifysgol yn cael ei orfodi i dalu bellach?

**Tom Middlehurst:** Mae Llywodraethau'r gorffennol a'r presennol wastad wedi disgwyl rhyw gyfraniad gan bobl i gynnal eu haddysg uwch. Nid oes dim yn newydd yn yr egwyddor honno. Fel Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi ceisio edrych o'r newydd ar y ffocws fel bod y rheini sydd â'r angen mwyaf yn derbyn y gefnogaeth y mae ei hangen arnynt.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I raise a point of order on the Business Secretary, Andrew Davies's comments during yesterday's business statement on Nant-y-gwyddon. I was not present during the exchanges, but I have seen a videotape of them. Three serious matters arise from his comments. I ask for your response, Presiding Officer, to each of them.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Codaf bwynt o drefn ynglyn â sylwadau'r Trefnydd, Andrew Davies yn ystod y datganiad busnes ar Nant-y-gwyddon ddoe. Nid oeddwn yn bresennol yn ystod y dadlau, ond yr wyf wedi gweld tâp fideo ohono. Mae tri mater difrifol yn codi o'i sylwadau. Gofynnaf am eich ymateb, Lywydd, i bob un ohonynt.

First, he called into question my integrity, as Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales’s business manager. Secondly, he referred in open Plenary to discussions with another business manager. Equally seriously, he referred to them selectively. He used his position as Business Secretary whose office depends on maintaining good relations with all parties, to score partisan party political points in a way that will seriously damage his ability to maintain those relations in the future.

I will deal with each of these briefly. It is a fundamental principle of debate that a Member upon whom an attack is made in open Plenary is informed in advance. Andrew Davies knew that I would not be present yesterday, because I had told him. He did not give me notice that he would call my integrity into question and he launched his attack in my absence. I totally refute the allegation that promises made to him were not kept. The Cabinet was fully informed of our position in relation to the motion on Nant-y-gwyddon at all stages. The fact that he did not like what he heard is a different matter.

He also referred to the role of Jocelyn Davies. Let me tell him and the Assembly that Jocelyn is a valued member of our team and his attack on her yesterday was both unwarranted and unjustified. His attack on Geraint Davies, I put down to party politics.

No democratic institution can survive unless there is total trust between business managers. Andrew Davies is an experienced politician and he broke that trust yesterday. It was not done in the heat of the moment, from where you can quickly pass it over; he read from a prepared text. He referred in open Plenary to discussions held between us and, equally seriously, he did so selectively and out of context.

Let me spell it out clearly and unambiguously: you never ever under any circumstances—and certainly not to gain

Yn gyntaf, cododd amheuaeth ynghylch fy ngonestrwydd, fel rheolwr busnes Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Yn ail, cyfeiriodd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn agored at drafodaethau gyda rheolwr busnes arall. Yr un mor ddifrifol, cyfeiriodd atynt yn ddetholus. Defnyddiodd ei safle fel Trefnydd, y mae ei swydd yn dibynnu ar gynnal cysylltiadau da gyda phob plaid, i sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol pleidiol mewn ffordd a fydd yn niweidio’i allu i gynnal y cysylltiadau hynny i’r dyfodol yn ddifrifol.

Byddaf yn delio â phob un o’r rhain yn fyr. Mae’n egwyddor sylfaenol mewn dadl fod Aelod yr ymosodir arno mewn Cyfarfod Llawn agored yn cael gwybod hynny ymlaen llaw. Gwyddai Andrew Davies na fyddwn yn bresennol ddoe, gan imi ddweud wrtho. Ni roddodd rybudd imi y byddai’n bwrw amheuaeth ar fy ngonestrwydd a lansiodd ei ymosodiad yn fy absenoldeb. Gwrthodaf yn llwyr yr honiad na chadwyd addewidion a wnaethpwyd iddo. Rhoddwyd gwybodaeth lawn i’r Cabinet am ein safbwynt ni mewn perthynas â’r cynnig ar Nant-y-gwyddon bob cam o’r ffordd. Mae’r ffaith na hoffai’r hyn a glywodd yn fater gwahanol.

Cyfeiriodd hefyd at rôl Jocelyn Davies. Gadewch imi ddweud wrtho ac wrth y Cynulliad fod Jocelyn yn aelod gwerthfawr o’n tîm a bod ei ymosodiad arni ddoe yn ddi-alw-amdano ac heb gyfiawnhad. Priodolaf ei ymosodiad ar Geraint Davies i wleidyddiaeth plaid.

Ni all unrhyw sefydliad democrataidd oroesi onid oes ymddiriedaeth lwyr rhwng rheolwyr busnes. Mae Andrew Davies yn wleidydd profiadol a thorodd yr ymddiriedaeth honno ddoe. Nid yng ngwres y foment y gwnaethpwyd hynny, lle gallech anghofio amdano yn gyflym; darllenai o destun a oedd wedi’i baratoi. Cyfeiriodd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn agored at drafodaethau rhyngom ac, yr un mor ddifrifol, gwnaeth hynny yn ddetholus ac allan o gyd-destun.

Gadewch imi wneud hyn yn hollol glir a diamwys: nid ydych byth o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau—ac yn sicr nid i ennill

party advantage—disclose the contents of discussions between business managers. That is a golden rule. Otherwise, the trust which is essential for the effective running of this institution is severely, if not irreparably, damaged.

Andrew Davies went further yesterday. He did not disclose the full contents of those discussions, and what he disclosed he did so selectively and out of context. I do not propose to catalogue them before you today. However, he indicated yesterday that I had sought a request for a deferment on 6 June. That was not the case. The request came from his side.

The Business Secretary is in a unique position in this Assembly. He must act as a bridge between parties. Yesterday, not only did he destroy the bridge, he systematically removed the pillars on which it rested. He needs to be able to count on all-party support to carry through the Assembly's business. He seemed to forget that his is a minority administration that is dependent on the good will of other parties. I am dismayed that so many Members have invested so much time in ensuring that the Assembly's institutions run smoothly and that he, as Business Secretary, was happy to jeopardise that in a cavalier fashion yesterday. He acted in a crude, partisan way, seeking to score cheap party political points. He may have cheered himself up by scoring those points, but he has lost much more in the process. These are matters on which I seek your ruling, Llywydd.

**Pauline Jarman:** Further to that point of order, I also refer to Andrew Davies's remarks yesterday and his personal criticism of the chief executive of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. I hereby declare an interest as a member and leader of that authority. The claim was made that that authority did not co-operate in the production of documents to enable an inquiry to proceed. I have clear evidence that that was untrue. I ask Andrew Davies to apologise and to retract those comments in the light of clear

mantais plaid—yn dadlennu cynnwys trafodaethau rhwng rheolwyr busnes. Mae hynny yn rheol euraid. Fel arall, caiff yr ymddiriedaeth sydd yn hanfodol er mwyn rhedeg y sefydliad hwn yn effeithiol ei niweidio'n ddifrifol, os nad y tu hwnt i'w adfer.

Aeth Andrew Davies ymhellach ddoe. Ni ddadlennodd gynnwys y trafodaethau hynny yn llawn, ac yr oedd yr hyn a ddadlennodd yn ddetholus ac allan o gyd-destun. Ni fwriadaf eu rhestru ger eich bron heddiw. Fodd bynnag, nododd ddoe imi geisio cais am ohiriad ar 6 Mehefin. Nid felly y bu. O'i ochr ef y daeth y cais.

Mae'r Trefnydd mewn sefyllfa unigryw yn y Cynulliad hwn. Rhaid iddo weithredu fel pont rhwng pleidiau. Ddoe, nid yn unig y dinistriodd y bont, ond aeth ati'n systematig i dynnu'r pileri y gorffwysai arnynt. Mae angen iddo allu dibynnu ar gefnogaeth o bob plaid i gyflawni busnes y Cynulliad. Yr oedd yn ôl pob golwg wedi anghofio mai i weinyddiaeth leiafrifol y perthyn, sydd yn ddibynnol ar ewyllys da y pleidiau eraill. Digalonnir fi fod cynifer o Aelodau wedi buddsoddi cymaint o amser i sicrhau bod sefydliadau'r Cynulliad yn rhedeg yn esmwyth a'i fod ef, fel Trefnydd, yn hapus i beryglu hynny mewn ffordd ddi-hid ddoe. Gweithredodd mewn modd anaeddfed, pleidgar i sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol rhad. Efallai iddo godi ei galon ei hun drwy sgorio'r pwyntiau hynny, ond mae wedi colli llawer mwy yn y broses. Mae'r rhain yn faterion y ceisiaf eich dyfarniad arnynt, Lywydd.

**Pauline Jarman:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cyfeiriaf innau hefyd at sylwadau Andrew Davies ddoe a'i feirniadaeth bersonol o brif weithredwr Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o'r awdurdod hwnnw a'i arweinydd. Honnwyd na chydweithredodd yr awdurdod drwy gyflwyno dogfennau i alluogi ymchwiliad i fynd rhagddo. Mae gennyf dystiolaeth glir nad yw hynny'n wir. Gofynnaf i Andrew Davies ymddiheuro a thynnu'r sylwadau

evidence to the contrary.

**The Business Secretaary (Andrew Davies):** Yesterday, Plaid Cymru's environment spokesperson raised a question about my business statement and the fact that a debate on Nant-y-gwyddon had not been tabled. She proceeded to make a clear allegation that it was due to this administration's failure that it had not been tabled. I felt that, in that circumstance, Members who may not have been aware of what has happened on this issue for many months—as I indicated in my chronology—needed to be given the full picture of what had happened. I felt—

**Several Assembly Members** *rose*—

**Andrew Davies:** I did not interrupt anyone else when they made their statement. As a member of the Executive, and as Business Secretary, I felt that not only my integrity, but the integrity of this administration was called into question. As I robustly said yesterday, the administration sought to resolve this issue, not only for the people of the Rhondda who live near Nant-y-gwyddon, but also for the people of Wales, because there were wider lessons to be learnt. If there are inaccuracies in the chronology, which was long, I will consider them; and if a remedy is sought, I will provide one.

2:42 p.m.

Presiding Officer, I would not usually have raised this issue yesterday, but I had been politically attacked. I felt that it was incumbent on me to defend not only myself, but the administration, which has behaved properly and ethically. We have undertaken negotiations, primarily with Plaid Cymru, on how we can resolve this issue. I am sorry that Ieuan does not like what he heard. I have—or had—a good relationship with Ieuan, which goes back to when we fought the referendum campaign together, when maybe it was not a popular campaign in which to be involved. I respect Ieuan and his integrity. However, if my integrity is attacked I have every right, as a member of the administration, to defend

hynny yn ôl yn wyneb tystiolaeth glir i'r gwrthwyneb.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Ddoe, cododd llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar yr amgylchedd gwestiwn am fy natganiad busnes a'r ffaith nad oedd dadl ar Nant-y-gwyddon wedi ei chyflwyno. Aeth yn ei blaen i wneud honiad clir mai methiant y weinyddiaeth hon oedd i gyfrif pan na chafodd ei chyflwyno. Teimlwn, yn y sefyllfa honno, fod angen i Aelodau nad ydynt efallai'n ymwybodol o'r hyn a fu'n digwydd ar y mater hwn ers misoedd lawer—fel y nodais yn fy nghronoleg lawn—gael darlun llawn o'r hyn oedd wedi digwydd. Teimlwn—

**Sawl Aelod Cynulliad** *a gododd*—

**Andrew Davies:** Ni thorrtais ar draws unrhyw un arall tra'r oeddynt yn gwneud eu datganiad. Fel aelod o'r Weithrediaeth, ac fel Trefnydd, teimlwn fod amheuaeth wedi'i bwrw nid yn unig ar fy ngonestrwydd i, ond ar onestrwydd y weinyddiaeth hon. Fel y dywedais yn gryf ddoe, ceisiodd y weinyddiaeth ddatrys y mater hwn, nid yn unig ar gyfer pobl y Rhondda sydd yn byw gerllaw Nant-y-gwyddon, ond hefyd ar gyfer pobl Cymru, am fod gwersi ehangach i'w dysgu. Os oes gwallau yn y gronoleg, a oedd yn hir, byddaf yn eu hystyried; ac os ceisir cam i unioni hynny, byddaf yn darparu un.

Lywydd, ni fyddwn fel arfer wedi codi'r mater hwn ddoe, ond ymosodwyd arnaf yn wleidyddol. Teimlwn fod rheidrydd arnaf i amddiffyn nid yn unig fy hunan, ond y weinyddiaeth, sydd wedi ymddwyn yn briodol a moesegol. Yr ydym wedi cynnal negodiadau, yn bennaf gyda Phlaid Cymru, ar sut y gallwn ddatrys y mater hwn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw Ieuan yn hoffi'r hyn a glywodd. Mae—neu yr oedd—gennyf berthynas dda ag Ieuan, sydd yn mynd yn ôl i'r adeg pan ymladdasom ymgyrch y refferendwm gyda'n gilydd, pan nad oedd efallai yn ymgyrch boblogaidd i fod yn rhan ohoni. Parchaf Ieuan a'i onestrwydd. Fodd bynnag, os ymosodir ar fy ngonestrwydd i,

myself. That is what I did yesterday.

**The Presiding Officer:** Several points have been made, to which I will respond. In view of the seriousness of what has been said, I will return to this if necessary. The Business Secretary indicated that he is prepared to review what was said yesterday in the chronology and return to this matter if necessary.

Ieuan asked about what I might describe as traditional Westminster courtesies. That is, informing in advance when it is intended to make a statement about a Member. I hope that those courtesies apply here and will apply in future. Information should be provided in advance to ensure that people can respond—as the three of you did today—to the issue in open Plenary.

There are important issues here relating to the Business Committee and the relationship between business managers. I must confess that, when I first saw the Government of Wales Act 1998 and subsequently the National Assembly Advisory Group report—some of you were there—I thought to myself, ‘This will never work; how can you construct a Business Committee that will do all the work that I traditionally observed in Westminster under the so-called usual channels, along with the leader of the house functions? There are serious tensions in the Business Committee.’ The Office of the Presiding Officer has an important role, as my colleague, Jane Davidson, has chaired the Business Committee since its inception. I am pleased that there has been a decision to publish the minutes of the Business Committee. I believe that that will happen within the next few weeks—six weeks after that meeting. This is an important step in the openness of our politics.

Following this exchange, it might be appropriate for the Business Committee to consider whether there is room for a protocol on the relations between the business

mae gennyf bob hawl, fel aelod o'r weinyddiaeth, i amddiffyn fy hun. Dyna'r hyn a wneuthum ddoe.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae sawl pwynt wedi'i wneud, a byddaf yn ymateb iddynt. Yn wyneb difrifoldeb yr hyn a ddywedwyd, dychwelaf at hyn os bydd rhaid. Nododd y Trefnydd ei fod yn barod i edrych eto ar yr hyn a ddywedwyd ddoe yn y gronoleg a dod yn ôl at y mater hwn os bydd rhaid.

Gofynnodd Ieuan ynglyn â'r hyn y byddwn i efallai'n ei ddisgrifio fel trefn gwrtteisrwydd draddodiadol San Steffan. Hynny yw, rhoi gwybod ymlaen llaw pan fwriedir gwneud datganiad am Aelod. Gobeithiaf y bydd y drefn honno yn cael ei harddel yma ac y bydd ar waith yn y dyfodol. Dylid rhoi gwybodaeth ymlaen llaw i sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu ymateb—fel y gwnaeth y tri ohonoch heddiw—i'r mater mewn Cyfarfod Llawn agored.

Mae materion pwysig yma yn ymwneud â'r Pwyllgor Busnes a'r berthynas rhwng rheolwyr busnes. Rhaid imi gyfaddef, pan welais Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 gyntaf ac adroddiad Grwp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi hynny—yr oedd rhai ohonoch yno—imi feddwl wrthyf fy hun, ‘Wnaiff hyn fyth weithio; sut y gallwch chi lunio Pwyllgor Busnes a fydd yn gwneud yr holl waith yr arferwn ei weld yn San Steffan o dan y sianelau arferol, fel y'u gelwir, ynghyd â swyddogaethau arweinydd y ty? Mae tensiynau difrifol yn y Pwyllgor Busnes.’ Mae i Swyddfa'r Llywydd rôl bwysig, gan mai fy nghyd-Aelod, Jane Davidson, sydd wedi cadeirio'r Pwyllgor Busnes ers ei sefydlu. Yr wyf yn falch y cafwyd penderfyniad i gyhoeddi cofnodion y Pwyllgor Busnes. Credaf y bydd hynny'n digwydd o fewn yr wythnosau nesaf—chwe wythnos ar ôl y cyfarfod hwnnw. Mae hwn yn gam pwysig yn natur agored ein gwleidyddiaeth.

Yn dilyn y dadlau yma, efallai mai priodol fyddai i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ystyried a oes lle i brotocol ar y berthynas rhwng y rheolwyr busnes. Awgrym yw hynny. Gallai gael ei

managers. That is a suggestion. It might be regarded as cumbersome and difficult. However, it might be helpful to all of us, where there may be a conflict of roles—as occurs occasionally in the Assembly—between the role of the leader of the house equivalent, the business manager equivalent and the robust politician, for those roles to be clarified.

While commenting on these matters and on the party political nature of some of our debates, it might be appropriate for me to note that I have recently observed a tendency for internal elections, which may be taking place in political parties, to become the subject of discussion in this Chamber. I have external views on such matters. However, I hope that we can conduct the internal affairs of our parties openly and democratically, allowing for robust points to be made without breaching the protocol on Members' conduct in the Chamber and the common courtesies by which I hope that we can all abide.

I will leave it there, but I am grateful to Andrew for indicating that he is prepared to revisit this if necessary. I hope that that satisfies some of the concerns raised by Ieuan.

ystyried yn feichus ac anodd. Fodd bynnag, byddai o gymorth i bawb ohonom, lle gall fod gwrthdaro rhwng swyddogaethau—fel sydd yn digwydd o dro i dro yn y Cynulliad—rhwng rôl y sawl sydd yn cyfateb i arweinydd y ty, y sawl sydd yn cyfateb i'r rheolwr busnes a'r gwleidydd cadarn, gael eglurhad o'r swyddogaethau hynny.

Tra'n ymdrin â'r materion hyn ac â natur wleidyddol bleidiol rhai o'n dadleuon, efallai mai priodol fyddai imi nodi fy mod yn ddiweddar wedi sylwi ar duedd i etholiadau mewnol, a allai fod yn cael eu cynnal mewn pleidiau gwleidyddol, ddod yn destun trafod yn y Siambr hon. Mae gennyf farn allanol ar faterion o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y gallwn gynnal materion mewnol ein pleidiau yn agored a democrataidd, gan ganiatáu i bwyntiau cryf gael eu gwneud heb dorri'r protocol ar ymddygiad Aelodau yn y Siambr a'r cwrteisi cyffredin y gobeithiaf y gall pawb ohonom gadw ato.

Fe'i gadawaf ar hynny, ond yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Andrew am nodi ei fod yn barod i edrych eto ar hyn os bydd raid. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n ateb rhai o'r pryderon a godwyd gan Ieuan.

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 The Post-16 Education and Training Committee Report**

**Cynog Dafis:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.5 a 9.9, yn nodi adroddiad cynnydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mehefin 2000.*

Pan oeddwn yn blentyn, yr oeddwn yn arfer mynd i'r sinema unwaith yr wythnos, naill ai ar nos Lun neu ar nos Iau. Yr oedd wastad bictiwr bach a phictiwr mawr. Y pictiwr mawr oedd y prif atyniad ac yr oedd pobl yn eistedd drwy'r pictiwr bach er mwyn gweld y llall. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol mai'r pictiwr bach wyf fi y prynhawn yma a'n bod i gyd yn aros am y pictiwr mawr. Fodd bynnag, ar adegau, yr oedd mwy o sylwedd yn y pictiwr

**Cynog Dafis:** I propose that

*the National Assembly in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 6.5 and 9.9, notes the progress report from the Post-16 Education and Training Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 June 2000.*

When I was a child, I used to go to the cinema once a week, either on a Monday evening or on a Thursday evening. There was always a short film and a main feature. The main feature was the main attraction and people would sit through the short film to see the other. I am aware that I am the short film this afternoon and that we are all waiting for the main feature. However, at times, there was more substance in the short film than in

bach nag yn y pictiwr mawr. Efallai mai dyna sut y bydd hi y prynhawn yma.

Braint fawr fu cadeirio'r Pwyllgor pwysig hwn, a braint hefyd yw cyflwyno ei adroddiad. Bu'r cadeirio yn waith caled, ond hefyd yn bleser. Peth boddhaus oedd gweithio gyda chlwstwr o aelodau galluog a hynaws—mae'r seboni'n dechrau—a meithrin perthynas gadarnhaol ar draws ffiniau pleidiau at bwrpas adeiladol. Efallai fod y ffaith fy mod yn hyn nag aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn gymorth imi gadw trefn arnynt. Cafwyd cydweithio buddiol gyda'r Clerc a'r Dirprwy Glerc sydd wedi gwasanaethu'r Pwyllgor yn ddiflino, yn broffesiynol a chyda gallu ac ymroddiad. Gwerthfawrogir eu gwaith yn fwy nag y gallaf ddweud. Cefais y berthynas gydag Tom Middlehurst, fel Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, yn un agored, gyfeillgar a chydweithredgar. Ychydig iawn o wrthdaro sydd wedi bod rhyngom a dim ond unwaith neu ddwy y bu inni godi ein lleisiau. Teimlais ar adegau na fu digon o wrthdaro rhyngom. Dychwelaf at hynny cyn diwedd fy nghyfraniad.

Yng nghyfarfodydd cyntaf y Pwyllgor cawsom ein harwain i gyfeiriad cynnal comisiynau polisi estynedig. Richard Davies biau'r ymadrodd hwnnw. Penderfynasom gymryd ein rôl o ran cyfrannu at ddatblygu polisi yn gyfan gwbl o ddifrif. Derbyniasom gael ein harwain, ond nid wrth ein trwynau. Er enghraifft, mynnodd y Pwyllgor fod yr ystyriaeth o argymhellion y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant yn cael ei gwneud o ddifrif, nid drwy roi sêl bendith awtomatig. Cofiaf Christine Humphreys yn dweud nad eu nodi â stamp rwber yn unig y dylem ei wneud.

Yn ail, mynnodd y Pwyllgor mai diwylliant a'r celfyddydau fyddai pwnc yr ail adolygiad. Nid oedd hynny'n fwiad gwreiddiol. Yn drydydd, penderfynodd y Pwyllgor y dylai gomisiynu dogfen strategol ar ddyfodol y Gymraeg, ei thrafod a phenderfynu ar y mater. Penderfynwyd hefyd y dylid cynnal cyfarfod i ystyried dogfen Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ar uno colegau a

the main feature. That is how it might be this afternoon.

It has been a great honour to chair this important Committee, and it is also an honour to present its report. Chairing the Committee has been hard work, but also a pleasure. It has been satisfying to work with a group of able and gracious members—the soft-soaping begins—and to nurture a positive relationship across party boundaries with a constructive purpose. Perhaps the fact that I am older than the other members of the Committee has helped me to keep them under control. We have had beneficial collaboration with the Clerk and the Deputy Clerk, who have served the Committee tirelessly, professionally and with competency and dedication. Their work is appreciated more than I can say. I found the relationship with Tom Middlehurst, as Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training, to be open, friendly and co-operative. There has been little friction between us and our voices were raised only once or twice. At times, I felt that there was not enough friction between us. I will return to that before the end of my contribution.

In the Committee's first meetings, we were led in the direction of holding extended policy commissions. That phrase belongs to Richard Davies. We decided to take our role in terms of contributing to policy development totally seriously. We accepted being led, but not by our noses. For example, the Committee insisted that the consideration of ETAG's recommendations was to be undertaken seriously, not by giving them an automatic seal of approval. I remember Christine Humphreys saying that we should not merely rubber-stamp them.

Secondly, the Committee insisted that the subject of the second review would be culture and the arts. That was not an original intention. Thirdly, the Committee decided that it should commission a strategic document on the future of the Welsh language, discuss it and make a decision on the matter. It was also decided that a meeting should be held to consider the Higher



phrifysgolion.

Teg yw nodi, serch hynny, inni gael y cyfle i fabwysiadu'r ymagwedd bwyllog hon at bethau gan na fu'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â phynciau a oedd yn destun ymrafael mawr ar y pryd. Cawsom y fantais honno. Nid oedd gennym gig eidion ar yr asgwrn ar ein platiâu ni. Ni fu'n rhaid inni ddelio â thâl ar sail perfformiad i athrawon. Er hynny, bu aelodau'r Pwyllgor o dan bwysau mawr o amryw gyfeiriadau yn ystod y drafodaeth ar y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyffordiant ac, at ei gilydd, credaf inni gadw'n pwyll.

Gwrthodasom hefyd y demtasiwn i gwrso ambell sgwarnog ddeniadol—er enghraifft, y ffrae ynglyn â strategaeth ddrama Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Trafodasom y mater hwnnw yng nghyd-destun yr adolygiad o bolisi diwylliant a'r celfyddydau, ond nid aethom ati i geisio newid penderfyniadau bryd hynny. Nid oeddem yn teimlo mai dyna oedd ein swyddogaeth fel Pwyllgor. Efallai inni ddylanwadu ar ddigwyddiadau, ond ni fu inni bwysu am newidiadau. Beirniadwyd y Pwyllgor gan rai Aelodau Seneddol am na fu inni ymhél â chwestiwn y strategaeth ddrama yn yr un modd ag y byddai pwyllgor dethol yn San Steffan wedi gwneud. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn hyderus bod ein penderfyniad i feddwl yn strategol yn golygu y bydd ein cyfraniad yn fwy ffrwythlon o lawer na phe baem yn dilyn ambell sgandal benodol yn y modd hwnnw.

Trof at rai o'r materion y buom yn ymwneud â hwy. Nid wyf am ddweud llawer am broses ETAG oherwydd cafwyd dadl lawn yn Ionawr ar y chwyldro trefniadol y mae ein hargymhellion ni yn ei olygu. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi parhau i ddilyn y broses ac wedi cynnig sylwadau a beirniadaeth—er enghraifft, ar y dogfennau ar y consortia cymunedol a'r pwyllgorau rhanbarthol. Yr ydym wedi awgrymu newidiadau i argymhellion y Cabinet a'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn y meysydd hynny. Yr ydym wedi dilyn y broses ddeddfwriaethol yn San Steffan yn weddol ofalus. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn cadw llygad barcud ar waith y

Education Funding Council for Wales's document on merging colleges and universities.

It is fair to note, however, that we had an opportunity to adopt this cautious approach to things because we did not have to tackle issues that were controversial at the time. We had that advantage. We did not have beef on the bone on our plates. We did not have to deal with performance-related pay for teachers. However, the Committee members were under considerable pressure from many directions during the discussion on ETAG and, in general, I think that we kept our heads.

We also resisted the temptation to go on the occasional wild goose chase, however attractive—for example, the dispute about the Arts Council for Wales's drama strategy. We discussed that matter in the context of the review of the culture and arts policy, but we did not try to reverse decisions at that time. We did not feel that that was our function as a Committee. Perhaps we influenced events, but we did not press for changes. The Committee was criticised by some Members of Parliament because we did not deal with the drama strategy in the same way as a select committee in Westminster would have done. However, I am confident that our decision to think strategically means that our contribution will be far more productive than if we followed some specific scandal in that manner.

I turn to some of the matters in which we have been involved. I will not say much about the ETAG process because we had a full debate in January on the procedural revolution that our recommendations will mean. However, we have continued to follow that process and have offered comments and criticisms—for example, on the documents on the community consortia and regional committees. We have suggested changes to the recommendations of the Cabinet and the Assembly Secretary in those areas. We have followed the legislative process in Westminster quite carefully. I hope that we will keep a close eye on the work of the new

cyngor cenedlaethol newydd, er enghraifft ynglyn â llunio fformwla cyllido cyffredin. Bwriadwn gwrdd â'r cyngor newydd pan ddaw i fodolaeth ar ffurf gysgodol yn Awst neu Medi.

2:52 p.m.

Yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio ar yr adolygiad o bolisi diwylliant a'r celfyddydau ers dechrau'r flwyddyn. Penodasom un o ffigyrau mwyaf galluog y byd celfyddydau, Ceri Sherlock, yn gynghorydd arbenigol inni. Mae'r penodiad hwnnw wedi talu ar ei ganfed, gyda Ceri Sherlock yn rhoi ystyr newydd i'r term 'ychwanegu gwerth'. Bu ei gyfraniad yn amhrisiadwy.

Yr ydym wedi cwrdd tua naw gwaith yng Nghaerdydd ynglyn â'r adolygiad, a phedair gwaith yn y rhanbarthau. Yr ydym wedi derbyn tystiolaeth lafar—deallaf na ddylwn ddefnyddio'r gair 'tystiolaeth', ond dyna ydyw—gan 56 o gyrff ac unigolion. Derbyniasom gannoedd o eitemau ysgrifenedig. Dangoswyd diddordeb aruthrol yn yr adolygiad a bu'r ymateb yn galonogl. Gwerthfawrogwyd y broses agored yr ydym wedi ei rhoi ar waith.

Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd y cyfnod crynhoi, gwerthuso a drafftio a chaiff ein hadroddiad ei gyhoeddi ym mis Medi. Ni fyddai'n briodol imi ragddyfalu casgliadau'r adroddiad, ond yr wyf yn eithaf hyderus y bydd yn agor pennod newydd o ran polisi diwylliannol. Bydd yn ei wneud yn fwy tryloyw, Cymreig a democrataidd. Bydd hefyd yn nes at y bobl ac yn pwysleisio cyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau yn gymaint â'u derbyn a'u gwerthfawrogi. Caf fy nhemtio i ddefnyddio'r gair 'gwerinol', ond byddai hynny'n tueddu at y sentimental a gallai achosi trafferth i'r cyfieithydd.

Cyfeiriais at y penderfyniad i gomisiynu dogfen strategol gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar ddyfodol y Gymraeg. Cawn gyfle i drafod hynny yn y ddatl hir-ddisgwyliedig ar y Gymraeg yr wythnos nesaf. Bydd y ddogfen yn torri tir newydd o ran cynllunio a hyrwyddo'r prosiect o greu Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog. Mae'r gwahoddiad a roesom i Fwrdd yr Iaith wedi rhoi'r cyfle

national council, for example regarding creating a common funding formula. We intend to meet the new council when it comes into existence in shadow form in August or September.

We have been working on the review of arts and cultural policy since the beginning of the year. We appointed one of the most able people in the arts world, Ceri Sherlock, as our expert adviser. That appointment has paid dividends, with Ceri Sherlock giving a new meaning to the term 'added value'. His contribution has been invaluable.

We have met about nine times in Cardiff regarding the review, and four times in the regions. We have received oral evidence—I understand that I should not use the word 'evidence', but that is what it is—from 56 bodies and individuals. We have received hundreds of written items. Exceptional interest was shown in the review and the response has been encouraging. The open process that we have put in place has been appreciated.

We have reached the summarising, evaluating and drafting stage and our report will be published in September. It would not be appropriate for me to envisage the report's conclusions, but I am quite confident that it will open a new chapter in cultural policy. It will make it more transparent, Welsh and democratic. It will also be closer to the people and will emphasise participation in the arts as well as receiving and appreciating them. I am tempted to use the word 'gwerinol', but that would lean towards the sentimental and could cause the translator problems.

I referred to the decision to commission a strategic document by the Welsh Language Board on the future of the Welsh language. We will have an opportunity to discuss that in the long awaited debate on the Welsh language next week. The document will break new ground in planning and promoting the project of creating a truly bilingual Wales. The invitation that we gave to the

iddo wneud gwaith arloesol sydd yn agor pennod newydd mewn cynllunio ieithyddol yng Nghymru. Bydd yn rhoi sylfaen polisi defnyddiol inni. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor hefyd esgor ar gynllun iaith y Cynulliad, sydd yn canlyn o gynllun iaith y Swyddfa Gymreig.

Cynhaliasom hefyd adolygiad byr o waith Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru yn Nhachwedd 1999. Ymwelasom ag Aberystwyth, gan dderbyn tystiolaeth gan swyddogion ac aelodau o lys a chyngor y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol a chyrrff eraill ym maes llyfrgellyddiaeth a gwasanaeth gwybodaeth. Cyflwynasom ein sylwadau ar ffurf llythyr i'r llyfrgellydd. Pwysleisiodd y llythyr hwnnw yr angen i gynyddu hygyrchedd y deunyddiau sydd ar gael yn y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol—trysorfa'r genedl— a'r angen i'r llyfrgell gyfrannu at amcanion y Cynulliad o ran cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a dysgu gydol oes. Yr oedd y llyfrgell yn barod iawn i feddwl ar hyd y llinellau hynny.

Yn yr hydref, os bydd y Pwyllgor yn fyw ac iach a thrwy ras y Prif Ysgrifennydd, byddwn yn mentro ar ein hymgymeriad mwyaf uchelgeisiol sef adolygiad o addysg uwch. Cytunasom ar y cylch gwaith canlynol. Mae'n werth imi ei amlinellu fel enghraifft o'r math o gwmpas y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael ag ef. Ein cylch gwaith yw dod o hyd i weledigaeth ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru a sut y dylai wasanaethu anghenion y wlad, a datblygu strategaeth dymor hir ar gyfer gwneud y mwyaf o gyfraniad y sector. Dylai'r astudiaeth gymryd ystyriaeth o'r dimensiynau cenedlaethol, Prydeinig, Ewropeaidd a rhyngwladol, ynghyd â chenadaethau mewn perthynas â dysgu, ymchwil, diwylliant, galwedigaeth a'r economi o fewn y sector. Dylai'r astudiaeth ystyried yn arbennig yr ystod o ddisgyblaethau a gweithgareddau o fewn addysg uwch, y portffolio o ymchwil sydd yn cael ei wneud gan y sector a maint a phatrwm y cyllid ymchwil a geir wrth Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, y cynghorau ymchwil a ffynonellau eraill. Dylai'r astudiaeth hefyd ystyried cenhadaeth economiadd sefydliadau addysg uwch mewn perthynas â chreu cyfoeth a swyddi ac ecsploriaeth masnachol

Language Board has given it the opportunity to carry out pioneering work that opens a new chapter in linguistic planning in Wales. It will give us a useful policy basis. The Committee must also bring forth an Assembly language scheme, that follows on from the Welsh Office's language scheme.

We also held a short review of the work of the National Library of Wales in November 1999. We visited Aberystwyth and received evidence from officials and members of the National Library's court and council and other bodies in the field of librarianship and information service. We presented our remarks by letter to the librarian. That letter emphasised the need to increase the accessibility of the materials that are available in the National Library—the nation's heritage—and the need for the library to contribute towards the Assembly's aims regarding social inclusion and lifelong learning. The library was very willing to think along those lines.

In the autumn, if the Committee is alive and well and with the First Secretary's grace, we will venture on our most ambitious undertaking, that is a review of higher education. We have agreed on the following remit. It is worth me outlining it as an example of the kind of range that we will tackle. Our remit is to identify a vision for higher education in Wales and how it should serve the country's needs, and to develop a long-term strategy for optimising the sector's contribution. The study should take account of the national, British, European and international dimensions, together with the teaching, research, cultural, vocational and economic missions within the sector. The study should address in particular the range of disciplines and activities within higher education, the portfolio of research undertaken within the sector and the amount and the pattern of research funding obtained from the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, the research councils and other sources. The study should also consider the economic mission of higher education institutions in relation to wealth and job creation and the commercial exploitation of knowledge; the scope for collaboration and

gwybodaeth; y posibiladau ar gyfer cydweithio ac integreiddio o fewn y sector addysg uwch a phartneriaeth rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch ac ysgolion, sefydliadau addysg bellach ac eraill er mwyn codi safonau dysgu ac ymchwil yn barhaus. Dylai hefyd ystyried cynhaliaeth ariannol myfyrwyr ac effaith hynny ar grynswth a phatrwm recriwtio; pwerau statudol y Cynulliad, sydd yn ddiddorol iawn, ac unrhyw gyfyngiadau y maent yn eu rhoi ar ddatblygiad strategol addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Dylai'r astudiaeth polisi ddisgrifio cyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygu strategol, gwneud argymhellion ar gyfer gweithredu a gosod targedau i gyflawni, gyda phob ystyriaeth i flaenoriaethau a chyfyngiadau ar adnoddau. Rhaid oedd cynnwys hynny.

Mae hynny'n uchelgeisiol ac yn bellgyrhaeddol. Rydym wedi hysbysebu am gynghorydd arbenigol a deallaf fod cryn ddiddordeb. Byddwn yn gwneud y gwaith yma tan wanwyn 2001. Mae llawer i'w ddweud o blaid dull gweithredu y Pwyllgor. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo ar y cyfan i osgoi ymrafael rhyngbleidiol, yn rhannol drwy baratoi briff manwl ymlaen llaw ar gyfer yr Aelodau fel eu bod yn gweithio fel tîm yn hytrach nag fel carfannau o fewn y Pwyllgor.

Er hynny, nid yw'r broses heb ei diffygion. Weithiau teimlaf fod y berthynas o fewn y Pwyllgor yn rhy gyfforddus ac efallai nad yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn cael amser digon caled. Wedi'r cyfan, mae craffu llym i fod ar yr Ysgrifennydd ac ar eraill o fewn y broses ddemocrataidd.

**The First Secretary:** That is your career done for, Tom.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mine too.

Yr wyf yn gwbl anafdlon ar hyd a lled a miniogrwydd y craffu ar raglenni fel y Fargen Newydd a'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Credaf mai'r acronym Cymraeg yw CCNC. Mae angen inni fod yn fwy trwyadl yn y gwaith craffu. Mae angen inni ystyried y materion hyn ymhellach. Nid ydym wedi gwneud unrhyw waith ar is-ddeddfwriaeth er mai is-ddeddfwriaeth yw un

integration within the higher education sector and also partnership between higher education institutions and schools, further education institutions and others in order to continually raise standards of teaching and research. It should also consider student financial support and its effect on the volume and pattern of recruitment; the Assembly's statutory powers, which are most interesting, and any constraints they impose on the strategic development of higher education in Wales. This policy study should describe the opportunities for strategic development, make recommendations for action and set targets for achievement, having due regard for priorities and constraints on resources. That had to be included.

That is ambitious and far-reaching. We have advertised for a specialist adviser and I understand that there is great interest. We will do this work until spring 2001. There is a great deal to be said in favour of the *modus operandi* of the Committee. On the whole we have succeeded in avoiding inter-party conflict, partially through providing a detailed brief beforehand to all Members so that they work as a team rather than as groups within the Committee.

In spite of that, the process is not without its faults. Sometimes I feel that the relationship within the Committee is too cosy and that perhaps the Assembly Secretary is not having a hard enough time. After all, there should be sharp scrutiny of the Secretary and others within the democratic process.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae wedi canu ar eich gyrfa chi, Tom.

**Cynog Dafis:** A'm gyrfa innau hefyd.

I am totally unhappy with the length and breadth and incisiveness of scrutiny on programmes like the New Deal and on the Assembly sponsored public bodies. I believe that the Welsh acronym is CCNC. We need to be more thorough in scrutiny work. We need to consider these matters further. We have not done any work on subordinate legislation although subordinate legislation is

o gyfrifoldebau'r Pwyllgorau.

Er mwyn i'r Pwyllgorau wneud eu gwaith yn effeithiol, mae angen mwy o amser ac adnoddau arnynt. Yn fy marn i, mae democratiaeth yn teilyngu amser ac adnoddau.

Llywydd, bydd y Cynulliad wrth fynd yn ei flaen yn ennill pwerau ychwanegol ac yn tyfu'n senedd gyflawn. Daw'r ffin rhwng gweithrediaeth a deddfwrfa yn fwy eglur. Gobeithiaf y bydd elfennau gorau y system bwyllgorau sydd gennym yn cael eu cadw i'r dyfodol, pa ffurf bynnag y bydd y Cynulliad yn ei mabwysiadu. Ar lawer ystyr, y Pwyllgorau yw'r agwedd fwyaf llwyddiannus ar y model rhyfedd o lywodraeth sydd gennym yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

**Tom Middlehurst:** In what seems a short year, the Committee has got to grips with a challenging remit, which covers post-16 education and training, arts and culture, sports and recreation, Welsh language and youth service amongst others. I have been encouraged by the way in which we have worked together to break down the barriers and to find common ground. I note the warning in Cynog's contribution regarding that relationship in future. We have become used to a new and open style of dealing with important issues. The Committee has evolved a collaborative and participative method of working. It has also initiated a direct and continuing dialogue with our partners throughout Wales, not just in our meetings in Cardiff Bay, but also in our committee sittings outside Cardiff.

3:02 p.m.

It has been a challenging and rewarding experience. The Committee's work brings us closer to the wealth of talent and experience that we have in every part of the country. Wales is a remarkable place. What I have heard in evidence from many people and institutions has hugely enriched our thinking about what is possible in policy development and administration. That certainly makes for better government. I place on record my thanks to all members of the Committee for

one of the responsibilities of the Committees.

In order for the Committees to carry out their work effectively, they need more time and resources. In my opinion, democracy deserves time and resources.

Presiding Officer, the Assembly as it proceeds will gain extra powers and will grow into a complete parliament. The boundary between the executive and legislature will become clearer. I hope that the best elements of our committee structure will be retained for the future, whatever form the Assembly adopts. In many ways, the Committees are the most successful aspect of this strange model of government that we have in the National Assembly.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Yn yr hyn sydd yn ymddangos yn flwyddyn fer, mae'r Pwyllgor wedi ymraffael â chylch gwaith trwm, yn ymdrin ag addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16, celfyddydau a diwylliant, chwaraeon ac adloniant, yr iaith Gymraeg a'r gwasanaeth ieuenctid ymysg eraill. Calonogwyd fi gan y ffordd yr ydym wedi cydweithio i ddymchwel y rhwystrau a chanfod tir cyffredin. Nodaf y rhybudd yng nghyfraniad Cynog ynglyn â'r berthynas honno i'r dyfodol. Yr ydym wedi ymgyfarwyddo â ffordd newydd ac agored o ddelio â materion pwysig. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi esblygu dull gweithio cydweithredol a chyfranogol. Mae hefyd wedi agor deialog uniongyrchol a pharhaus gyda'n partneriaid ledled Cymru, nid dim ond yn ein cyfarfodydd ym Mae Caerdydd, ond hefyd wrth i'n pwyllgorau gwrdd y tu allan i Gaerdydd.

Bu'n brofiad llawn her a boddhad. Mae gwaith y Pwyllgor yn dod â ni'n nes at y cyfoeth o dalent a phrofiad sydd gennym ym mhob rhan o'r wlad. Mae Cymru yn lle hynod. Mae'r hyn a glywais mewn tystiolaeth gan nifer o bobl a sefydliadau wedi cyfoethogi ein barn yn ddirfawr o ran yr hyn sydd yn bosibl wrth ddatblygu polisi a gweinyddu. Mae hynny yn sicr yn golygu gwell llywodraeth. Cofnodaf fy niolch i holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu hymroddiad wrth

their commitment in delivering this new style of managing and developing policy. I want particularly to acknowledge Cynog's role as Chair: he is business-like and focused, and his efficient time management has ensured that the Committee functions effectively. Perhaps others can learn from that.

I would also like to pay tribute to the work of the clerks and all the staff and advisers who have serviced the Committee. There has been a significant demand on them and they have responded willingly and effectively. I thank other members of the Committee for their spirited and thorough approach to the important Education and Training Action Plan for Wales. This was our first major piece of work, which rightly has taken up much of the Committee's time. In doing so, it is providing a model for other committees to follow when conducting policy reviews. I look forward to working with the Committee in the future to ensure that each act is implemented in a balanced and evolutionary way. It is important that the Committee continues to review and inform our approach to adapting policy to meet the fast-changing requirements of Wales in the twenty-first century.

In addition to the study on ETAG, I am pleased that we have been able to examine a number of other subjects in depth. Cynog referred to some of them, for example our study on the role of the National Library of Wales. This has made a substantial contribution in enabling the library to define its future role. The Court and the Council of the National Library and the National Librarian greatly valued what we said on our visit and I look forward to their acting upon it.

The Welsh Language Board similarly appreciated the extent to which the Committee engaged directly with it to examine its policies. I, for my part, found it extremely valuable to hear the views of the Committee on Welsh language policy development. This is an area where I want to proceed on the basis of the greatest possible degree of consensus. The positive and

gyflwyno'r patrwm newydd hwn o reoli a datblygu polisi. Hoffwn gydnabod rôl Cynog fel Cadeirydd yn arbennig: mae'n drefnus a phwrpasol, a thrwy reoli'r amser mor alluog mae wedi sicrhau bod y Pwyllgor yn gweithio'n effeithiol. Efallai y gall eraill ddysgu o hynny.

Hoffwn hefyd dalu teyrnged i waith y clercod a'r holl staff ac ymgynghorwyr sydd wedi gwasanaethu'r Pwyllgor. Bu galwadau sylweddol arnynt a buont yn barod ac effeithiol eu hymateb. Diolchaf i aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor am ymdrin mor fywiog a thrylwyr â'r Cynllun Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant pwysig i Gymru. Hwn oedd ein darn mawr cyntaf o waith, ac aeth â llawer o amser y Pwyllgor yn gwbl briodol. Drwy hynny, mae'n cynnig model i bwyllgorau eraill ei ddilyn wrth gynnal adolygiadau polisi. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda'r Pwyllgor yn y dyfodol i sicrhau bod pob deddf yn cael ei rhoi ar waith mewn modd cytbwys ac esblygol. Mae'n bwysig bod y Pwyllgor yn parhau i adolygu a goleuo'r ffordd yr ydym yn mynd ati i addasu polisi i ateb gofynion cyfnewidiol Cymru yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Yn ychwanegol at yr astudiaeth ar y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, yr wyf yn falch inni allu edrych ar nifer o bynciau eraill mewn manylder. Cyfeiriodd Cynog at rai ohonynt, er enghraifft ein hastudiaeth o rôl Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru. Gwnaeth hyn gyfraniad sylweddol tuag at alluogi'r llyfrgell i ddiffinio ei rôl i'r dyfodol. Mae Llys a Chyngor y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol a'r Llyfrgellydd Cenedlaethol yn mawr werthfawrogi'r hyn a ddywedasom ar ein hymweliad ac edrychaf ymlaen iddynt weithredu arno.

Yr oedd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yntau yn gwerthfawrogi bod y Pwyllgor wedi gweithio mor uniongyrchol gydag ef i archwilio ei bolisiau. Bu'n eithriadol o werthfawr i mi, fy hun, glywed barn y Pwyllgor ar ddatblygu polisi iaith Gymraeg. Mae hwn yn faes yr wyf am symud ymlaen arno ar sail cael cymaint o gonsensws â phosibl. Mae'r agwedd gadarnhaol a chydweithredol a

collaborative approach that has been adopted on language issues within the Committee bodes well for the future. I look forward to the full debate on the language, which will take place next week.

Last autumn the Committee was able to study the corporate plans for the Assembly sponsored public bodies that we cover. Our discussions were useful in helping me take decisions about priorities and budget setting. I know that the Committee will be looking to connect ASPBs' activities with the National Assembly's policies and strategies, and keeping their activities and their outcomes under review.

The Committee's policy development study on the arts and culture in Wales was a major undertaking and I compliment the Chair and fellow members on their concentrated effort on this review. Ceri Sherlock also has made a considerable contribution to facilitating that process. Never before have the arts in Wales been subject to such intense scrutiny and been debated so openly and positively. Never before has there been such deliberate and organised consultation with practising artists and representative organisations.

I believe that the Committee will consolidate the work we have done to produce a report with clear recommendations on the best way to proceed. I will certainly give those recommendations full consideration in the decisions that I have to take. We also need to look ahead, however. The work programme over the next few months is no less substantial: a policy development study on higher education, to which Cynog has referred, begins in the autumn. Widening access to higher education remains a priority of the National Assembly. The Assembly will need to ensure that it selects and targets areas to promote participation in higher education, that it is active in recruiting students from under-represented groups and that it ensures that students' pastoral and care needs are met. I am sure that the results of these efforts will show in the future and that

fabwysiadwyd o fewn y Pwyllgor ar faterion iaith yn argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y dyfodol. Edrychaf ymlaen at y ddatlawn ar yr iaith, a gynhelir yr wythnos nesaf.

Yr hydref diwethaf bu'r Pwyllgor yn astudio'r cynlluniau corfforaethol ar gyfer y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad sydd yn dod o dan ein cochl ni. Bu ein trafodaethau'n fuddiol wrth fy helpu i benderfynu ar flaenoriaethau a phennu'r gyllideb. Gwn y bydd y Pwyllgor am gydgyssylltu gweithgareddau'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad gyda pholisiau a strategaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a pharhau i adolygu eu gweithgareddau a'u canlyniadau.

Yr oedd astudiaeth datblygu polisi y Pwyllgor ar y celfyddydau a diwylliant yng Nghymru yn ymgymeriad mawr a thalaf deyrnged i'r Cadeirydd a chyd-aelodau ar eu hymdrech ddwys ar yr adolygiad hwn. Mae Ceri Sherlock hefyd wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol tuag at hwyluso'r broses. Ni fu'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru erioed o'r blaen yn destun manylu mor graff ac ni chafwyd trafodaeth mor agored a phositif ychwaith. Ni chafwyd ymgynghoriad mor fwriadus a threfnus erioed o'r blaen gydag artistiaid gweithredol a chyrrff cynrychiadol.

Credaf y bydd y Pwyllgor yn cyfnerthu'r gwaith a wnaethom i lunio adroddiad gydag argymhellion clir ynglyn â'r ffordd orau ymlaen. Byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried yr argymhellion hynny yn llawn yn y penderfyniadau y mae'n rhaid imi eu cymryd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni edrych ymlaen hefyd. Nid yw'r rhaglen waith dros y misoedd nesaf yn llai sylweddol: mae astudiaeth datblygu polisi ar addysg uwch, y cyfeiriodd Cynog ati, yn dechrau yn yr hydref. Mae ehangu mynediad i addysg uwch yn dal yn flaenoriaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Bydd angen i'r Cynulliad sicrhau ei fod yn dewis a thargedu ardaloedd i hyrwyddo cyfranogiad mewn addysg uwch, ei fod yn mynd ati'n ddiwyd i recriwtio myfyrwyr o grwpiau nas cynrychiolir yn ddigonol a'i fod yn sicrhau bod anghenion bugeiliol a gofal myfyrwyr yn cael eu

the Committee will have a key role in taking this forward.

In addition we are now at an important stage in the development of youth policy in Wales. The Assembly's policy unit is working with an expert advisory group, to advise the Assembly on the future direction of policy on young people. That report is now in preparation. It will examine the needs of young people in the round and set out how we can do a better job of supporting them and helping them to make the most of their lives. The Post-16 Education and Training Committee will have a key role in the development of the detailed policy in response to that report. There will be an important role for the Pre-16 Education Committee and others as well to work on the links with the Assembly strategy for children and young people and other related strategies.

Consensus and partnership working are prerequisites to radical reform. The Committee has already shown that new ways of working can have major benefits for Wales. Issues that the Committee has considered address people's concerns in all parts of Wales. The Assembly, through its committees, will tackle issues that will impact upon and be in the interest of all our people, whether in the north, south, east or west. It is an inclusive approach for the mutual benefit of all. However, we must work even harder and more productively to meet the challenging agenda set in 'Betterwales.com'. I look forward to working with the committee in doing just that.

**Elin Jones:** Mae'n briodol nodi, wrth ddechrau fy nghyfraniad y prynhawn yma, mor gynhyrchiol a gwerthfawr fu fy mhrofiad fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg ac Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae'r Aelodau wedi gweld ffrwyth cynnyrch y Pwyllgor yn yr adroddiad y prynhawn yma. Yr oedd yr amserlen yn llawn dros y flwyddyn ac yr ydym wedi cyflawni llawer. Mae'n debyg nad yw hi'n

diwallu. Yr wyf yn siwr y bydd ffrwyth yr ymdrechion hyn i'w weld yn y dyfodol ac y bydd gan y Pwyllgor rôl allweddol wrth symud hyn yn ei flaen.

Yn ogystal, yr ydym yn awr mewn cyfnod pwysig yn natblygiad polisi ieuencid yng Nghymru. Mae uned polisi'r Cynulliad yn gweithio gyda grwp ymgynghorol arbenigol, i gynghori'r Cynulliad ynglyn â chyfeiriad polisi pobl ifanc i'r dyfodol. Mae'r adroddiad hwnnw yn cael ei baratoi yn awr. Bydd yn edrych ar anghenion pobl ifanc yn drylwyr ac yn nodi sut y gallwn fynd ati'n well i'w cefnogi a'u helpu i wneud y gorau o'u bywydau. Bydd gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 rôl allweddol yn natblygiad y polisi manwl mewn ymateb i'r adroddiad hwnnw. Bydd yna rôl bwysig i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ac eraill hefyd i weithio ar ddolenni cyswllt gyda strategaeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc a strategaethau eraill cysylltiol.

Mae consensws a gweithio drwy bartneriaeth yn rhagangenrheidiau i ddiwygio radical. Mae'r Pwyllgor eisoes wedi dangos y gall ffyrdd newydd o weithio ddod â manteision mawr i Gymru. Mae materion a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor wedi rhoi sylw i bryderon pobl ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Bydd y Cynulliad, drwy ei bwyllgorau, yn mynd i'r afael â materion a fydd yn effeithio ar ac er budd i bawb, boed hwy yn y gogledd, y de, y dwyrain neu'r gorllewin. Mae'n ymdriniaeth gynhwysol er budd cyffredinol i bawb. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni weithio'n galetach ac yn fwy cynhyrchiol fyth i ymateb i'r agenda anodd a nodir yn 'Gwellcymru.com'. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda'r pwyllgor i wneud hynny.

**Elin Jones:** It is appropriate to note, as I begin my contribution this afternoon, that being a member of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee over the past year has been a productive and valuable experience. Members have seen the fruits of the Committee's work in the report this afternoon. The timetable was full over the year and we have accomplished a great deal. It is probably not appropriate for me to



briodol imi gymeradwyo'n ormodol rôl y Cadeirydd yn y Pwyllgor. Gadawaf hynny i bleidiau eraill os dymunant wneud hynny.

Mae'n deg dweud mai un o'r rhesymau inni gyflawni cymaint fel Pwyllgor yw ein bod wedi cael ein gweithio mor galed dros y flwyddyn a hynny gan y Cadeirydd yn benodol. Y patrwm arferol i weithgaredd y Pwyllgor yw dechrau gwaith tua 8.30 a.m., ac yn aml, yr ydym yn dal wrthi tan 1.00 p.m. Cawn 10 munud am goffi fel arfer ac mae hynny'n gyfle am goffi neu yn gyfle i lunio a danfon datganiad i'r wasg. Yr ydym wedi setlo i mewn i arfer rhyfedd fel aelodau o'r Pwyllgor. Mae aelodau dwy o'r pedair plaid yn defnyddio'r 10 munud i yfed coffi ac mae'r ddwy blaid arall yn danfon datganiadau i swyddfa'r wasg ar y pedwerydd llawr. Gadawaf i'r Cynulliad ddyfalu pa ddwy blaid sydd yn gwneud pa ddwy weithgaredd. Nid wyf yn cytuno gyda'r polisi, *'name and shame'*.

Mae'r gwaith wedi bod yn galed yn y Pwyllgor ac ambell waith, mae gwleidyddiaeth y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn galed. Yn nyfnder trafodaethau'r Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant er enghraifft, yr oedd gwleidyddiaeth galed yn digwydd. Efallai bod y math hwnnw o wleidyddiaeth o'n blaenau wrth inni drafod canlyniadau'r adroddiad diwylliant a chelfyddydau. Cawn weld. Fodd bynnag, mae ysbryd y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn dda ac yn bositif.

Nid wyf am fod yn rhy gysurus fel y rhybuddiodd y Cadeirydd ond credaf ei bod hi'n briodol i dalu teyrnged i rôl ac ymagwedd Ysgrifennydd y Pwyllgor. Mae ei gyfraniad i waith y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn bositif iawn ac mae'r ffaith ei fod yn paratoi adroddiad ysgrifenedig, cynhwysfawr i bob pwyllgor sydd yn galluogi'r Pwyllgor i gwestiynu a monitro gwaith yr Ysgrifennydd wedi bod yn gyfraniad positif ac yn caniatáu inni hefyd drafod materion cyfredol. Mae hyn yn arfer da, ac hoffwn weld pob ysgrifennydd yn ystyried paratoi adroddiadau ysgrifenedig tebyg i bob pwyllgor pwnc.

Erbyn hyn, mae'r Pwyllgor yn teimlo braidd

commend too highly the Chairman's role in the Committee. I leave that to the other parties if they wish to do so.

It is fair to say that one of the reasons we have accomplished so much as a Committee is because we have been worked so hard over the year by the Chairman specifically. The usual pattern for the Committee's deliberations is to start work at 8.30 a.m. and we are often still working at 1.00p.m. We usually have 10 minutes for coffee, which is an opportunity to have a coffee or an opportunity to draw up and send a press release. We have settled into a strange routine as Committee members. Members of two of the four parties use the 10 minutes to drink coffee and the other two parties release statements to the press office on the fourth floor. I will leave it to the Assembly to guess which two parties do what activity. I do not agree with the name and shame policy.

The work in the Committee has been hard and occasionally, the politics of the Committee has been hard. In the depths of the Education and Training Action Group discussions for example, some hard politicking took place. Perhaps that kind of politicking will be seen again as we discuss the conclusions of the art and culture report. We shall see. However, the spirit of the Committee as been good and positive.

I do not want to be too comfortable as the Chairman warned but I believe it is appropriate to pay tribute to the role and approach of the Committee Secretary. His contribution to the Committee's work has been very positive and the fact that he prepares a comprehensive, written report for every committee that enables the Committee to question and monitor the Secretary's work has been a positive contribution and also enables us to discuss current issues. This is good practice and I would like to see every secretary considering preparing similar written reports for every subject committee.

By now, the Committee is beginning to feel

yn amddifynnol o'r Ysgrifennydd. Yn ystod yr adolygiad celfyddydau, clywsom alwadau am weinidog diwylliant. Fel Pwyllgor, ar draws y pleidiau, yr ydym yn dechrau syrffedu ar y galwadau arwynebol hyn. Ymatebwn drwy ddweud fod gennym weinidog diwylliant a Tom yw ei enw. Mae gwrs inni yma. Mae ystod gwaith y Pwyllgor yn fwy eang nag addysg ôl-16. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn trafod darlledu yr wythnos hon. Trafodasom y loteri yn y Siambr bythefnos yn ôl a thrafodwn yr iaith Gymraeg yr wythnos nesaf. Daw'r materion hyn i gyd o dan gyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Os oes rhywrai'n ystyried ailstrwythuro Pwyllgorau a'r posibilirwydd o gyfuno addysg cyn ac ôl-16, mae'n bwysig eu bod yn talu sylw llawn i bwysigrwydd a phwysau gwaith swyddogaethau cyfredol y Pwyllgor hwn, megis hyfforddiant, diwylliant, treftadaeth a'r Gymraeg, a bod sylw haeddiannol a chytbwys yn cael ei roi i bob agwedd ar waith y Pwyllgor.

3:12 p.m.

Mae gan y Pwyllgor gyfrifoldeb am ddwy elfen o waith sydd yn fewnol i'r Cynulliad hwn. Cyfeiria'r adroddiad at un o'r agweddau hyn. Cyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor yw llunio cynllun iaith i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'w drafod ac i'w gytuno gan y Cynulliad cyfan. Noda'r adroddiad i is-bwyllgor o'r Pwyllgor gael ei benodi ryw chwe mis yn ôl i edrych ar y gwaith hwn. Nid yw'r is-bwyllgor wedi cyfarfod eto, yn anffodus. Mae angen symud y gwaith hwn ymlaen ar fyrder. Mae cynllun iaith cyfredol yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig yn ddiffygiol ar gyfer ein sefyllfa newydd. Mae angen gweithredu cynllun sydd yn ein galluogi i gynnig gwasanaeth cyflawn ddwyieithog i bobl Cymru ac i ni ein hunain.

Swyddogaeth fewnol arall y Pwyllgor, yn ôl fy nealltwriaeth i, yw cymryd trosolwg ar broses archifo trafodion a gwaith y Cynulliad. Darllenais erthygl mewn cylchgrawn archifo yn ddiweddar a oedd yn cymharu systemau archifo'r gwahanol gyrff llywodraethol yn ynysoedd Prydain. Methais â dod â'r erthygl yma heddiw er mwyn gallu dyfynnu ohoni'n uniongyrchol gan imi

quite defensive of the Secretary. During the arts review, we heard calls for a culture minister. As a Committee, across the parties, we are beginning to tire of these superficial demands. We react by saying that we have a minister for culture and his name is Tom. There is a lesson for us here. The Committee's remit is wider than post-16 education. The Committee will discuss broadcasting this week. We discussed the lottery in the Chamber a fortnight ago and we will be discussing the Welsh language next week. All of these issues come under the auspices of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee. If anyone is considering restructuring Committees and the possibility of combining pre and post-16 education, it is important that they pay full attention to the importance and pressure of work of the existing functions of this Committee, such as training, culture, heritage and the Welsh language, and that appropriate and balanced attention is given to every aspect of the Committee's work.

The Committee has responsibility for two elements of work that are internal to this Assembly. The report refers to one of those aspects. It is the Committee's responsibility to draw up a language scheme for the National Assembly to be discussed and agreed by the whole Assembly. The report notes that a sub-committee of the Committee was appointed some six months ago to examine this work. The sub-committee has not yet met, unfortunately. This work needs to be moved forward urgently. The existing language scheme of the former Welsh Office is inadequate for our new situation. There is a need to implement a scheme that enables us to offer the people of Wales and ourselves a full bilingual service

Another internal function of the Committee, according to my understanding, is to take an overview of the process of archiving the Assembly's proceedings and work. I read an article in an archiving journal recently, which compared the archiving systems of the various governmental bodies in the British Isles. I have failed to bring the article with me today so that I could quote from it

anhofio ei harchifo. Nid yw'r erthygl gennyf bellach; yr wyf wedi ei cholli. Gallai hynny fod yn wers i'r Cynulliad, o bosibl. Yr oedd neges yr erthygl yn glir ac yn gyfan gwbl ddilornus o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn. Nodai mai syniad y Cynulliad o archifo oedd bocs cardfwrdd yn llawn allbrintiau cyfrifiadurol. Mae'n annerbyniol mai dyma'r sefyllfa o hyd. Codais y mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor a chyda Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Mae'n hen bryd i ni, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gael cynllun archifo a fyddai'n cynnwys archifo print, electronig, sain a fideo. Gwn y gwneir gwaith ar yr ochr sain a fideo ym mhwyllgor gweithredol cwmni darlledu'r Cynulliad, ond credaf fod angen edrych ar gynllun i archifo print ac electronig hefyd.

Cyflawnwyd gwaith pwysig yn y Pwyllgor ac mae mwy i'w gyflawni eto, yn enwedig gyda'r adolygiad o addysg uwch sydd i ddigwydd yn yr hydref. Bydd yr adolygiad o bwysigrwydd tyngedfennol i lwyddiant economaidd a diwylliannol y genedl hon ac mae'n bwnc o bwys i mi mewn etholaeth sydd yn cynnwys dwy o brifysgolion Cymru. Nid oes canlyniad ar hyn o bryd i'r adolygiad o'r celfyddydau a diwylliant ond daw negeseuon clir a phendant ohono. Mae'r negeseuon hyn yn berthnasol i'n trafodaethau yn hwyrach y prynhawn yma yn nadl 'y pictiwr mawr', fel y galwodd Cynog hi. Daw negeseuon pwysig ar gyfer y pictiwr mawr o'r pictiwr bach. Yn ystod yr adolygiad o'r celfyddydau a diwylliant clywsom negeseuon o falchder cenedlaethol, cydwladol ac amlddiwylliannol. Clywsom negeseuon gan Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol, Cynllun Celfyddydau Amlddiwylliannol Caerdydd a'r Fro—CADMAD—a Sgrîn. Clywsom negeseuon o greadigrwydd a hyder diwylliannol gan ein hysgrifenywyr, canolfannau theatr a'n hartistiaid gweledol yng Nghymru. Mae'n bosibl na chlywodd Aelodau Plaid Geidwadol Cymru y negeseuon pwysig hynny yng nghyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor yn Llandudno, Llanfair ym Muallt a Chaerfyrddin, gan nad oedd yr un ohonynt yn bresennol. Pe bai Aelod o'r blaid honno wedi bod yn bresennol efallai y byddent wedi bod

directly because I forgot to archive it. I no longer have the article; I have lost it. That could be a lesson to the Assembly, perhaps. The message in the article was clear and was completely derogatory of this National Assembly. It noted that the Assembly's idea of archiving was a cardboard box full of computer printouts. It is unacceptable that that situation remains. I have raised this matter in the Committee and with the Office of the Presiding Officer. It is high time that we, as a National Assembly, had an archiving scheme that would include print, electronic, audio and video archiving. I know that work on the audio and video side is being undertaken by the Assembly broadcasting company's executive committee, but I think that we should also look at a scheme for electronic and print archiving.

Important work has been accomplished in the Committee and there is more to be done, particularly with the review of higher education which is to be held in the autumn. The review will be of crucial importance to the cultural and economic success of this nation and it is a subject of importance to me in a constituency which includes two of Wales's universities. As yet, there is no outcome to the arts and culture review but clear and definite messages come out of it. These messages are relevant to our discussions later on this afternoon in the 'main feature' debate, as Cynog called it. The short film has important messages for the main feature. During the arts and culture review, we heard messages of national, international and multicultural pride. We heard those messages from Welsh National Opera, the National Eisteddfod, Cardiff and District Multicultural Arts Development—CADMAD—and Sgrîn. We heard messages of creativity and cultural confidence from Wales's writers, theatric centres and visual artists. It is possible that Welsh Conservative Party Members did not hear those important messages at the Committee meetings in Llandudno, Builth Wells and Carmarthen, as none of them were present. Had a Member of that party been present perhaps they would have had a more enlightened view of the main feature this afternoon.

yn fwy goleuedig eu barn ar y pictiwr mawr y prynhawn yma.

Ar ôl misoedd o wrando ar y dystiolaeth yn yr adolygiad o'r celfyddydau, mae'n amlwg fod angen yn ein cymunedau am ddadeni diwylliannol cyfoes a Chymreig. Mae gennym gyfle yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ddechrau ar y dadeni hwnnw drwy bleidleisio heddiw i fuddsoddi mewn darn o gelfyddyd gweledol ymarferol ac anghenrheidiol a fydd yn symbol i'r byd o ddiwylliant a democratiaeth Cymru yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Dyna fy ymgais i gyfuno'r pictiwr bach a'r pictiwr mawr.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Before I say what I intended to say this afternoon, I wish to respond to Elin Jones's criticisms of my non-attendance at three of the roadshows. Members will be aware that the Conservative group in the Assembly undertook a visit to Scotland, which clashed with the beginning of the first roadshow. While Elin was in Carmarthen, I was listening to the debate on higher education tuition fees in the Scottish Parliament—a debate that we are not likely to have here. It was a privilege to be in Scotland to listen to that debate.

During the second meeting in Builth Wells to which Elin Jones referred, I was on a pre-arranged meeting with the Committee on European Affairs in Brussels with the First Secretary, the previous First Secretary and many others. I was pleased that Elin mentioned the third meeting in Llandudno. However, as she is aware, I am a member of the Pre-16 Education Committee as well as the Post-16 Education and Training Committee, which is a tremendous responsibility and workload. At the time, we were in Glasgow with Huw Lewis visiting the Scottish Council for Educational Technology. [*Laughter.*] It is all very well for Elin Jones to point out my non-attendance. However, I assure her that I was working very hard on all three occasions, undertaking my duties as an Assembly Member. I can easily defend the criticism.

After months of listening to the evidence in the arts review, it is obvious that there is a need in our communities for a contemporary and Welsh cultural renaissance. We have an opportunity in the National Assembly to start that renaissance by voting today to invest in a practical and essential piece of visual art that will be a symbol to the world of the culture and democracy of Wales in the twenty-first century.

That is my attempt to merge the short film with the main feature.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cyn imi ddweud yr hyn y bwriadwn ei ddweud y prynhawn yma, yr wyf am ymateb i feirniadaeth Elin Jones na fûm yn bresennol mewn tair o'r sioeau pen ffordd. Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol i grwp y Ceidwadwyr yn y Cynulliad fynd ar ymweliad â'r Alban, a oedd yn gwrthdaro gyda dechrau'r sioe ben ffordd gyntaf. Tra'r oedd Elin yng Nghaerfyrddin, yr oeddwn i'n gwrandao ar y ddadl ar ffioedd hyfforddi addysg uwch yn Senedd yr Alban—trafodaeth nad ydym yn debygol o'i chael yma. Yr oedd yn fraint fod yn yr Alban i wrando ar y ddadl honno.

Yn ystod yr ail gyfarfod yn Llanfair ym Muallt y cyfeiriodd Elin Jones ato, yr oeddwn mewn cyfarfod a drefnwyd ymlaen llaw gyda'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ym Mrwsel gyda'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, y Prif Ysgrifennydd blaenorol a llawer o bobl eraill. Yr wyf yn falch i Elin sôn am y trydydd cyfarfod yn Llandudno. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyr, yr wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn ogystal â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, sydd yn gyfrifoldeb a baich gwaith aruthrol. Ar y pryd, yr oeddem yn Glasgow gyda Huw Lewis yn ymweld â Chyngor yr Alban dros Dechnoleg Addysgol. [*Chwerthin.*] Hawdd yw hi i Elin Jones dynnu sylw at fy absenoldeb. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ei sicrhau y bûm yn gweithio'n galed iawn ar y tri achlysur, yn ymgymryd â'm dyletswyddau fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Gallaf amddiffyn y

feirniadaeth yn hawdd.

At the risk of turning this debate into an Oscar ceremony, I thank Julia Annand, the Clerk, and Stephen Thomas, the Deputy Clerk, of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee who have worked tremendously hard over the past year. In addition, I thank our Chairman Cynog Dafis, who has done a sterling job in supporting the work and role of the Committee. We have benefited from Cynog's parliamentary experience. His experience of the political process, dealing with officials, and knowing how to try to get the Committee's way on certain things has been useful in much of the work that we have undertaken.

We have much to celebrate regarding the work of the Committee. As you have heard, we have been a busy and hardworking Committee. I tend to enjoy committee work more than Plenary work. I find that working in committee on detailed policy, reviews and studies is far more beneficial to the people I represent than sitting in Plenary for an afternoon. The work of the Committee has generally been productive. My work in the Post-16 Education and Training Committee has been valuable to me as an Assembly Member. I hope that we have contributed significantly to the political process in the past 12 months. People who have visited the Committee meetings, particularly those who were present during the discussion on the ETAG report, discovered that Committee members were open to arguments and that we had a transparent process in considering the report. They were encouraged by the methods that we employed to analyse this detailed report and to reach a recommendation. They may not all have agreed with our recommendation, but most people who attended those meetings approve the way in which we conducted ourselves in that difficult debate.

We have responded well to Government requests. The ETAG inquiry was requested by Government. The administration asked us to produce a report and recommendations

Er bod perygl o droi'r ddadl hon yn seremoni Oscars, diolchaf i Julia Annand, y Clerc, a Stephen Thomas, Dirprwy Glerc y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 sydd wedi gweithio'n aruthrol o galed dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yn ogystal, diolchaf i'n Cadeirydd Cynog Dafis, a wnaeth waith ardderchog yn cynnal gwaith a rôl y Pwyllgor. Yr ydym wedi elwa o brofiad seneddol Cynog. Mae ei brofiad o'r broses wleidyddol, yn delio â swyddogion, ac yn gwybod sut mae ceisio cael ffordd y Pwyllgor ar rai pethau wedi bod yn fuddiol mewn llawer o'r gwaith yr ymgyngherasom ag ef.

Mae gennym lawer i'w ddathlu ynglyn â gwaith y Pwyllgor. Fel yr ydych wedi clywed, buom yn Bwyllgor prysur a gweithgar. Tueddaf i fwynhau gwaith pwyllgor yn fwy na gwaith y Cyfarfod Llawn. Teimlaf fod gweithio mewn pwyllgor ar bolisi, adolygiadau ac astudiaethau manwl yn llawer mwy buddiol i'r bobl yr wyf yn eu cynrychioli nag eistedd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn am brynhawn. Yn gyffredinol bu gwaith y Pwyllgor yn gynhyrchiol. Bu fy ngwaith yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yn werthfawr imi fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf inni gyfrannu'n sylweddol at y broses wleidyddol yn y 12 mis diwethaf. Canfu pobl a ymwelodd â chyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor, yn enwedig y rheini oedd yn bresennol yn ystod y drafodaeth ar adroddiad y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, fod aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn agored i glywed dadleuon a bod gennym broses dryloyw wrth ystyried yr adroddiad. Calonogwyd hwy gan y dulliau a ddefnyddiwyd i ddadansoddi'r adroddiad manwl hwn ac i gyrraedd argymhelliad. Efallai nad oeddynt oll yn cytuno â'n hargymhelliad, ond yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl a ddaeth i'r cyfarfodydd hynny yn cymeradwyo ein hymarweddiad yn y ddadl anodd honno.

Yr ydym wedi ymateb yn dda i geisiadau'r Llywodraeth. Y Llywodraeth a ofynnodd am ymchwiliad y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Gofynnodd y weinyddiaeth

and the Committee undertook that in the correct way. We have also begun to work well on our own initiative. That makes it sound like a nursery school, where you are also asked to work on your own initiative. However, the arts review, for example, was initiated by the Post-16 Education and Training Committee members, who have considerable interest in the arts. I believe that we will arrive at a forward-looking set of recommendations that will meet the Assembly's expectations.

3:22 p.m.

The Committee has begun to set a standard in working methods. Our methods are right. We have held information-gathering sessions in which people have been able to come in and provide information to the committee, not only on ETAG, but also on the arts review. I expect that the same will happen in the higher education review. As Elin outlined, we held four roadshows across Wales, enabling organisations that might otherwise not have been able to come to the Assembly to provide valuable information to the Committee. So we have been able to widen the Committee's ability to reach out to Wales and to contact those parts of Wales that otherwise might not have been able to contact the Assembly Committee.

I hope that other Committees will consider this method of working, particularly if undertaking reviews. It is no good to just sit here and make decisions. It is a good idea to take Committees out into Wales to meet the organisations that are affected by our decisions, even if that means some members are unable to attend those meetings.

I add my thanks to Cynog, especially for the ETAG report. It was encouraging that when we had finished the report, it not only contained the recommendations of the majority of the Committee but also my own reservations about many of the Committee's finalised recommendations. It is unusual, I think—correct me if I am wrong—to have a minority view expressed in a major

inni lunio adroddiad ac argymhellion ac ymgymerodd y Pwyllgor â hynny yn y ffordd gywir. Yr ydym hefyd wedi dechrau gweithio'n dda ar ein menter ein hunain. Mae hynny'n gwneud iddo swnio fel ysgol feithrin, lle gofynnir hefyd ichi weithio ar eich menter eich hun. Fodd bynnag, aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, sydd â chryn ddiddordeb yn y celfyddydau, gychwynnodd yr adolygiad o'r celfyddydau, er enghraifft. Credaf y byddwn yn diweddu gyda set o argymhellion blaengar a fydd yn bodloni disgwyliadau'r Cynulliad.

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi dechrau gosod safon mewn dulliau gwaith. Mae ein dulliau ni yn iawn. Cynhaliasom sesiynau casglu gwybodaeth lle mae pobl wedi gallu dod i mewn a rhoi gwybodaeth i'r pwyllgor, nid yn unig ar y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, ond hefyd ar adolygiad y celfyddydau. Disgwyliaf y bydd yr un peth yn digwydd yn yr adolygiad addysg uwch. Fel yr amlinellodd Elin, cynhaliasom bedair sioe ben ffordd ar draws Cymru, gan alluogi cyrff na fyddent wedi gallu dod i'r Cynulliad fel arall efallai i roi gwybodaeth werthfawr i'r Pwyllgor. Felly yr ydym wedi gallu ehangu gallu'r Pwyllgor i ymestyn allan i Gymru a chysylltu â'r rhannau hynny o Gymru na fyddent fel arall wedi gallu cysylltu â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol efallai.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Pwyllgorau eraill yn ystyried y dull hwn o weithio, yn enwedig os ydynt yn ymgymryd ag adolygiadau. Nid yw eistedd yma a gwneud penderfyniadau yn ddigon. Syniad da yw mynd â'r Pwyllgorau allan i Gymru i gwrdd â'r cyrff yr effeithir arnynt gan ein penderfyniadau, hyd yn oed os yw'n golygu na all rhai aelodau fynychu'r cyfarfodydd hynny.

Ychwanegaf fy niolch i Cynog, yn enwedig am yr adroddiad ar y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Ar ôl inni orffen yr adroddiad, yr oedd yn galonogol ei fod nid yn unig yn cynnwys argymhellion mwyafrif y Pwyllgor ond hefyd fy amheuan i ynglyn â nifer o argymhellion terfynol y Pwyllgor. Mae'n anarferol, mi gredaf—cywirwch fi os wyf yn anghywir—cael barn leiafrifol wedi

Committee report. I am grateful to Cynog for allowing my reservations and concerns as a representative of the Welsh Conservative Party to be included in the final report debated in Plenary. That demonstrates a maturity in the political process upon which the Assembly has embarked.

As Cynog mentioned earlier, we have appointed Ceri Sherlock as our arts adviser. Other Committees have also appointed advisers. It is encouraging that we can bring people from outside the Assembly into the political process to provide expert advice and guidance. As politicians, we cannot be expected to have all the information at our fingertips and a firm grasp of every issue that we encounter. Having this extra guidance and expert advice has been invaluable, particularly for the arts review.

The arts review has been our most exciting work. I put it above the ETAG review, which I did not consider exciting. It was challenging and structural in our examination of the methods used to deliver post-16 education. Therefore, although it was not an exciting review, it was a functional and structural one.

It is also important for the Post-16 Education and Training Committee to be able to continue to monitor the work that it has already undertaken. Cynog referred to the ETAG report. Now that these recommendations have been made, we need to be able to monitor the work being done in Parliament and the implementation of this report to ensure that the final outcome reflects the Committee's intentions.

Members will be aware that the arts review is a review of arts and culture, not of the Arts Council of Wales, although if you read newspapers and watch the television news, you might think otherwise. As a Committee, we recognise the tremendous concern that arts organisations have about the Arts

ei mynegi mewn adroddiad Pwyllgor pwysig. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Cynog am ganiatáu i'm hamheuon a'm pryderon fel cynrychiolydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru gael eu cynnwys yn yr adroddiad terfynol i'w drafod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae hynny'n dangos aeddfedrwydd yn y broses wleidyddol y mae'r Cynulliad yn dechrau arni.

Fel y soniodd Cynog yn gynharach, yr ydym wedi penodi Ceri Sherlock fel ein cynghorydd ar y celfyddydau. Mae Pwyllgorau eraill hefyd wedi penodi cynghorwyr. Mae'n galonogol ein bod yn gallu dod â phobl o'r tu allan i'r Cynulliad i mewn i'r broses wleidyddol i roi cyngor ac arweiniad arbenigol. Fel gwleidyddion, ni ellir disgwyl inni fod â'r holl wybodaeth ar flaenau ein bysedd ac amgyffred llawn o bob pwnc y down wyneb yn wyneb ag ef. Bu'r arweiniad a'r cyngor arbenigol ychwanegol hwn yn amhrisiadwy, yn enwedig ar gyfer adolygiad y celfyddydau.

Adolygiad y celfyddydau oedd ein gwaith mwyaf cyffrous. Yn fwy felly nag adolygiad y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, nad ystyriais yn gyffrous. Yr oedd yn her ac yn strwythurol yn ein harchwiliad o'r dulliau a ddefnyddir i gyflwyno addysg ôl-16. Felly, nid adolygiad cyffrous mohono, ond un ymarferol a strwythurol.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd fod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yn gallu parhau i fonitro'r gwaith y mae eisoes wedi ymgymryd ag ef. Cyfeiriodd Cynog at adroddiad y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Gyda'r argymhellion hyn wedi'u gwneud bellach, mae angen inni allu monitro'r gwaith sydd yn cael ei wneud yn y Senedd a gweithrediad yr adroddiad hwn i sicrhau bod y canlyniad terfynol yn adlewyrchu bwriadau'r Pwyllgor.

Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol mai adolygiad o'r celfyddydau a diwylliant yw adolygiad y celfyddydau, nid o Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, er y gallech dybio'n wahanol os ydych yn darllen papurau newydd ac yn gwyllo'r newyddion ar y teledu. Fel Pwyllgor, cydnabyddwn y pryder enfawr

Council of Wales. However, we will be able to take an objective view. Every organisation has its own view of the arts council. Each has had its own problems with the arts council, whether financial or administrative. However, the Committee must take an objective view and produce a report that is not steered in any one direction by any one group of organisations. We will be able to do that at the end of our deliberations.

In terms of our higher education review, the National Assembly needs to have a firm understanding of the pressures within higher education but also the tremendous potential that exists within HE institutions, particularly in research and development. There are first-class institutions in Wales, and it will give the Assembly the opportunity to conduct its inquiry about their methods of working, where there is potential growth and difficulties and celebrate the work that goes on in the higher education sector. We have also heard that there will be a review of student recruitment and retention, which will include student financial support. While the Assembly does not have the power to alter the tuition fees situation in Wales, it is important for it to take a considered view, particularly through the Committee, on students' financial affairs when they enter higher education institutions.

I only have two criticisms. The first relates to the Committee's considerable remit. As you know, the Committee's remit is post-16 education and training, arts, culture, Welsh language and sport. This is not a criticism of the Executive and the way that it has divided the subjects. However, with such a wide remit, it can be difficult to give proper consideration to the many subjects for which we have competence and to undertake proper scrutiny of the many ASPBs that come within our remit. We must consider carefully how we structure our work programme in the future. For example, we will conduct the higher education review this autumn, 18 months after we were elected. That is a major plank of our education system in Wales and

sydd gan gyrff celfyddydol ynglyn â Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gallwn ni edrych ar hyn yn wrthrychol. Mae gan bob corff ei farn unigol am gyngor y celfyddydau. Mae gan bob un ei broblemau ei hun gyda chyngor y celfyddydau, boed y rheini'n ariannol ynteu'n weinyddol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r Pwyllgor fod yn wrthrychol a llunio adroddiad nad yw wedi'i lywio i ryw gyfeiriad gan unrhyw grwp unigol o gyrff. Byddwn yn gallu gwneud hynny ar ddiwedd ein trafodaethau.

Yn nhermau ein hadolygiad addysg uwch, mae angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod â dealltwriaeth gref o'r pwysau o fewn addysg uwch ond hefyd o'r potensial aruthrol sydd o fewn sefydliadau AU, yn enwedig mewn ymchwil a datblygu. Mae sefydliadau o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru, a bydd yn rhoi'r cyfle i'r Cynulliad gynnal ei ymchwiliad ei hun i'w dulliau gweithio, ble mae twf yn bosibl a ble mae anawsterau, a dathlu'r gwaith sydd yn mynd ymlaen yn y sector addysg uwch. Yr ydym wedi clywed hefyd y ceir adolygiad o faes recriwtio a chadw myfyrwyr, a fydd yn cynnwys cefnogaeth ariannol i fyfyrwyr. Er nad oes gan y Cynulliad y grym i newid y sefyllfa o ran ffioedd hyfforddi yng Nghymru, mae'n bwysig iddo bwysio a mesur a llunio barn, yn enwedig drwy'r Pwyllgor, am faterion ariannol myfyrwyr wrth iddynt fynd i mewn i sefydliadau addysg uwch.

Dwy feirniadaeth yn unig sydd gennyf. Mae'r gyntaf yn ymwneud â chylch gwaith sylweddol y Pwyllgor. Fel y gwyddoch, addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16, y celfyddydau, diwylliant, yr iaith Gymraeg a chwaraeon yw cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor. Nid beirniadaeth o'r Weithrediaeth a'r ffordd y mae wedi rhannu'r pynciau mo hyn. Fodd bynnag, gyda chylch gwaith mor eang, gall fod yn anodd rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i'r llu o bynciau sydd o dan ein gallu a mynd ati i fanylu'n briodol ar lawer o'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad sydd o fewn ein cylch gwaith. Rhaid inni ystyried yn ofalus sut yr ydym yn strwythuro ein rhaglen waith yn y dyfodol. Er enghraifft, byddwn yn cynnal adolygiad addysg uwch yr hydref hwn, 18 mis ar ôl inni



it has taken us 18 months to get there. This is not a criticism but an observation that the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's wide remit could lead to problems in how we allocate time for our work.

Secondly, on the Committee's scrutiny role and in support of what Cynog Dafis said earlier, it is important that we do a balancing act. We are here to contribute towards policy through such means as the ETAG report, the arts review and the higher education review but we are also here to scrutinise the Executive's work and that of the ASPBs, which mostly carry out decisions taken here at an arm's length. I hope that we can develop our scrutiny role in the year ahead and in a year's time when we return with our second year report, I hope that we can highlight those areas of scrutiny where we have been effective. It is a balancing act but that is due to the nature of our devolved set-up.

In conclusion, I reiterate my thanks to those who have worked hard for the Committee and the officials who, I suspect, have had a dreadful time during the past 12 months trying to cope with such a proactive Committee and Secretary. I am sure that it has been difficult for them to keep up with us. If we can address some of those criticisms, we will see an effective Post-16 Education and Training Committee of which people in the education sector will be proud.

**Christine Humphreys:** Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, manteisiaf ar y cyfle i gyfleu fy ngwerthfawrogiad o'i waith. Diolchaf, yn enwedig, i'r Cadeirydd am y profiad o ddysgu oddi wrtho a diolchaf i'm cyd-aelodau a'r swyddogion.

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi datblygu patrwm sydd yn gosod enghraifft dda i Bwyllgorau eraill, ac mae adolygiad y celfyddydau a diwylliant

gael ein hethol. Mae hon yn elfen fawr o'n cyfundrefn addysg yng Nghymru ac mae wedi cymryd 18 mis inni gyrraedd yma. Nid beirniadaeth mo hynny ond sylw y gallai cylch gwaith eang y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 arwain at broblemau yn y ffordd yr ydym yn dyrannu amser ar gyfer ein gwaith.

Yn ail, ar rôl fanylu'r Pwyllgor a chan gefnogi'r hyn a ddywedodd Cynog Dafis yn gynharach, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cadw'r fantol yn wastad. Yr ydym yma i gyfrannu at bolisi drwy bethau fel adroddiad y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, adolygiad y celfyddydau a'r adolygiad addysg uwch ond yr ydym yma hefyd i fanylu ar waith y Weithrediaeth a'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad, sydd gan mwyaf yn rhoi penderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd yma ar waith o hyd braich. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddatblygu ein rôl fanylu yn y flwyddyn i ddod a gobeithiaf, ymhen blwyddyn pan ddychwelwn gyda'n hail adroddiad blynyddol, y gallwn amlygu'r meysydd manylu hynny lle buom yn fwyaf effeithiol. Mae'n golygu cadw'r fantol yn wastad ond mae hynny i'w briodoli i natur ein cyfundrefn ddatganoledig.

I gloi, hoffwn ailadrodd fy niolch i'r rheini a weithiodd mor galed dros y Pwyllgor ac i'r swyddogion sydd, yr wyf yn amau, wedi cael amser ofnadwy dros y 12 mis diwethaf yn ceisio ymdopi gyda Phwyllgor ac Ysgrifennydd mor rhagweithiol. Yr wyf yn siwr iddi fod yn anodd iddynt gadw i fyny â ni. Os gallwn roi sylw i rai o'r beirniadaethau, fe welwn Bwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 effeithiol y bydd pobl yn y sector addysg yn falch ohono.

**Christine Humphreys:** As a member of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee, I take this opportunity to convey my appreciation of its work. I thank, in particular, the Chairman for the experience of learning from him and I thank my fellow members and the officials.

The Committee has developed a pattern that sets a good example to other Committees, and the arts and culture review has given the

wedi rhoi enghraifft i boblogaeth Cymru o'r Cynulliad ar waith. Gwerthfawrogir y ffaith ein bod wedi cynnal cymaint o'n sesiynau y tu allan i Gaerdydd gan y cyfranwyr a'r gynulleidfa. Er hynny, credaf fod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad wynebu'r broblem o sut y gall roi mwy o gyhoeddusrwydd i waith y Pwyllgorau symudol. Yr un yw'r broblem gyda'r Pwyllgorau Rhanbarth. Gwneir gwaith da pan ydym yn gadael Caerdydd ac yn teithio i ardaloedd eraill ond nid oes llawer o bobl yn ymwybodol ein bod yn ymweld â'u hardaloedd; yn wir, nid yw rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymwybodol ein bod yn cyfarfod y tu allan i Gaerdydd.

Nid wyf yn mynd i ganolbwyntio ar waith y Pwyllgor mewn dyfnder gan fod Cynog, Elin a Jonathan wedi gwneud hynny eisoes. Teimlaf fy mod mewn perygl o ailadrodd yr hyn y maent wedi ei ddweud. Hoffwn wneud cyfraniad byr, oherwydd yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod Aelodau eraill hefyd yn awyddus i gyfrannu.

3:32 p.m.

Hoffwn dynnu sylw at ddau neu dri o gyfrifoldebau'r Pwyllgor. Fel y dywedodd rhai cyfranwyr, yr wyf hefyd yn falch fod y Pwyllgor wedi penderfynu dechrau adolygiad o addysg uwch yn yr hydref a bod ei gylch gorchwyl yn cynnwys archwilio cyllid ymchwil—sut y mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru a chyrrff eraill yn ariannu gwaith ymchwil—a chefnogaeth ariannol i fyfyrwyr. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'r mater o ariannu gwaith ymchwil yn bwysig, ac yn un y dylai'r Pwyllgor ei ystyried mewn dyfnder. Yr wyf yn falch y byddwn yn gwneud hynny.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae Cymru'n derbyn 4.3 y cant yn unig o incwm cyrff ariannu. Mae hyn yn llai na'r hyn y dylem ei dderbyn yn nhermau ein poblogaeth ac yn llai nag y byddem yn ei dderbyn pe baem yn defnyddio fformwla Barnett. Y tu mewn i hyn, mae ein prifysgolion newydd yn dioddef yn fwy na'r rhai mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig ac yn derbyn 0.14 y cant yn unig o'r arian sydd ar gael. Mae hyn yn golygu bod ein prifysgolion newydd yn derbyn 14c yn unig o bob £10 sydd yn cael ei wario yn y

population of Wales an example of the Assembly at work. The fact that we have held so many of our sessions outside Cardiff is appreciated by contributors and by the audience. However, I believe that the Assembly must face the problem of how it can give more publicity to the mobile Committees' work. The same is true of the Regional Committees. Good work is done when we leave Cardiff and travel to other areas but not many people are aware that we visit their areas; indeed, some Assembly Members are not aware that we meet outside Cardiff.

I will not focus on the Committee's work in depth because Cynog, Elin and Jonathan have already done so. I feel that I am in danger of repeating what they have said. I want to make a short contribution, because I know that other Members are also keen to contribute.

I want to highlight two or three of the Committee's responsibilities. As some contributors said, I am also glad that the Committee has decided to begin a review of higher education in the autumn and that its terms of reference include looking into research funding—how the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales and other bodies fund research work—and financial support for students. That is important. The matter of funding research work is important and one that the Committee should consider in depth. I am glad that we will do that.

At present, Wales only receives 4.3 per cent of funding bodies' income. This is less than we should receive in terms of our population and less than we would receive if we used the Barnett formula. Within this, our new universities suffer more than those in any other part of the United Kingdom and receive only 0.14 per cent of the money available. This means that our new universities receive only 14p of every £10 spent in the United Kingdom. According to the National Association of Teachers in Further and

Deyrnas Unedig. Yn ôl Cymdeithas Genedlaethol Athrawon Addysg Bellach ac Uwch, nid yw ein prifysgolion newydd yn derbyn ond 40 y cant o arian ymchwil, tra bod yr hen brifysgolion yn derbyn 96 y cant, er bod ganddynt yr un nifer o fyfyrwyr. Nid wyf yn dadlau y dylem leihau'r arian sydd yn cael ei ddenu i Gymru drwy ymchwil *blue-sky* yn yr hen brifysgolion. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y gwnaiff yr adolygiad lwyddo i fynd i'r afael â sut i ddenu mwy o arian ymchwil i'n prifysgolion newydd.

Hoffwn grybwyll y mater o gefnogaeth ariannol i fyfyrwyr. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y Pwyllgor yn ystyried y mater hwn hefyd. Dengys ymchwil diweddar fod 25 y cant o fyfyrwyr yn gweithio am 40 awr yr wythnos ac 18 y cant yn gweithio mwy na 30 awr yr wythnos er mwyn sicrhau bod ganddynt arian i fyw arno. Ar gyfartaledd, mae myfyrwyr yn gadael addysg uwch mewn dyled o dros £5,000 ac amcangyfrifir y gallai'r ffigur hwnnw gyrraedd £12,000 yn y dyfodol. Mae gwaith academiaidd y nifer uchel o fyfyrwyr sydd yn gweithio yn dioddef. Mae eu dyled yn golygu bod llai o raddedigion yn ymuno â'r sector cyhoeddus, sydd yn golygu ein bod ni, fel cymdeithas, yn colli eu sgiliau.

Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan; nad ydym yn gallu cael gwared ar ffioedd hyfforddiant yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, edrychaf ymlaen at drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor yn ystod yr adolygiad ar sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r cronfeydd mynediad i geisio cynorthwyo myfyrwyr yng Nghymru.

I orffen, hoffwn edrych ar gyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor am yr iaith Gymraeg. Cyfeiriodd Elin at y ffaith nad ydym wedi cyfarfod eto fel is-bwyllgor i ddiwygio cynllun iaith y Cynulliad. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud ar hyn ac edrychaf ymlaen at fod yn rhan o'r broses honno.

Hoffwn sôn yn gyflym am waith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Mae lle iddo fod yn rhan o'n gwaith ar ieithoedd lleiafrifol ac i gydweithio gyda ni i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'r Cynulliad ar gael i bobl Cymru pa bynnag iaith y maent yn ei siarad.

Higher Education, our new universities only receive 40 per cent of research money, while old universities receive 96 per cent, even though both have the same number of students. I do not argue that we should reduce the money attracted to Wales through blue-sky research in the old universities. However, I hope that the review will succeed in getting to grips with how to attract more research money to our new universities.

I want to mention the matter of financial support for students. I am glad that the Committee will also consider this matter. Recent research shows that 25 per cent of students work 40 hours a week and 18 per cent work more than 30 hours a week to ensure that they have money on which to live. On average, students leave higher education in debt of over £5,000 and it is estimated that that figure could reach £12,000 in future. The academic work of the high number of students who work suffers. Their debt means that fewer graduates join the public sector, which means that we, as a society, lose out on their skills.

I agree with what Jonathan said; we cannot get rid of tuition fees in Wales. However, I look forward to the Committee's discussions during the review on how we can use the access funds to try to help students in Wales.

To conclude, I want to look at the Committee's responsibility for the Welsh language. Elin referred to the fact that we have not yet met as a sub-committee to revise the Assembly's Welsh language scheme. There is much work to do on this and I look forward to being part of that process.

I want to mention quickly the work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. There is scope for it to be part of our work on minority languages and to collaborate with us to ensure that the Assembly's services are available to the people of Wales whichever language they speak.

**John Griffiths:** I add my appreciation to that already expressed by other members of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee of the way in which Cynog Dafis has chaired the Committee. He has led it impressively, which has led to a constructive way forward for the Committee and the Assembly as a whole. The major work with which we dealt, namely the ETAG debate, was well handled and had a great deal of cross-party agreement. It was an early sign that the Assembly could operate effectively in committee and demonstrated a constructive way forward for other committees and the Assembly.

One thing that struck me early on in the process is how necessary it is to better train the workforce in Wales and improve people's skills. We all recognise that. It is also important to tie in education and training in Wales with our economic needs. There was recognition that that need not be something that is narrow in its approach. It is possible to give people general education and training, enabling them to meet the needs of a variety of employers and industries. More importantly, it gives them the ability to adapt to the changing requirements of employers. We all know that we live in times of great socio-economic change. People must re-train and go through several revolutions in one working lifetime. In committee, we considered giving people a general basis of training and education which would enable them to adapt as necessary through their working lifetime, where they must constantly revolutionise their own skills and training. Those points were effectively addressed and flagged up as an important way forward.

The voluntary sector can contribute to the needs of Wales in terms of education and training and, importantly, it can address the social inclusion agenda. It is often the case that the people most in need of education and training are the most reluctant to undertake it. This is sometimes due to bad experiences of education, perhaps at the hands of a

**John Griffiths:** Ychwanegaf fy ngwerthfawrogiad i o'r ffordd y mae Cynog Dafis wedi cadeirio'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 at yr hyn a fynegwyd eisoes gan aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor. Rhoddodd arweiniad gwefreiddiol, sydd wedi arwain at ffordd adeiladol ymlaen i'r Pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad cyfan. Cafodd y gwaith mawr yr ydym wedi delio ag ef yn barod, sef y ddadl ar y Grwp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, ei gynnal yn dda a chafwyd llawer iawn o gytuno ar draws y pleidiau. Yr oedd yn arwydd cynnar y gallai'r Cynulliad weithredu'n effeithiol drwy bwyllgor a dangosodd ffordd adeiladol ymlaen i bwyllgorau eraill a'r Cynulliad.

Un peth a'm tarodd yn gynnar yn y broses oedd pa mor angenrheidiol yw hyfforddi gweithlu Cymru yn well a gwella sgiliau pobl. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod hynny. Mae hefyd yn bwysig clymu addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru wrth ein hanghenion economaidd. Cydnabuwyd nad oedd yn rhaid i'n hymdriniaeth ar hynny fod yn gul. Mae'n bosibl rhoi addysg a hyfforddiant cyffredinol i bobl, gan eu galluogi i fodloni anghenion amrywiaeth o gyflogwyr a diwydiannau. Yn fwy pwysig, mae'n rhoi'r gallu iddynt i addasu yn ôl gofynion cyfnewidiol cyflogwyr. Gwyr pawb ohonom ein bod yn byw mewn adegau o newid cymdeithasol-economaidd mawr. Rhaid i bobl ailhyfforddi a mynd drwy sawl cylchdro mewn oes waith. Yn y pwyllgor, ystyriasom roi sylfaen gyffredinol o addysg a hyfforddiant i bobl a fyddai'n eu galluogi i addasu fel sydd yn ofynnol drwy gydol eu hoes waith, lle mae'n rhaid iddynt chwyldroi eu sgiliau a'u hyfforddiant eu hunain yn barhaus. Rhoddwyd sylw effeithiol i'r pwyntiau hyn ac amlygwyd hwy fel ffordd bwysig ymlaen.

Gall y sector gwirfoddol gyfrannu at anghenion Cymru yn nhermau addysg a hyfforddiant ac, yn bwysig, gall ymddrin â'r agenda cynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Yn aml, y bobl sydd â'r angen mwyaf am addysg a hyfforddiant yw'r mwyaf amharod i ymgymryd â hwy. Weithiau mae hyn oherwydd profiadau gwael o addysg,

sarcastic teacher or as a result of an education system that was not as responsive as it should have been to the needs of disadvantaged people.

To draw those people back into education or training on the first rung of the ladder requires a sensitive approach that does not foresee them progressing straight into a formal course with an exam at the end of it. Often they do not feel ready to undertake that sort of education. Voluntary organisations such as the Workers' Education Association and many others perform valuable work in drawing people back into education, on courses that often show a great deal of imagination in terms of the scope of subjects that can be pursued. Once people get back into the system, they often go on to do all sorts of things. Many go to university and often obtain impressive results. I want to commend that aspect of the education and training agenda. It is something to which the Committee referred several times. I know that the Committee in its entirety valued that sort of work and the contributions that those people make.

I will say a few words about education for education's sake. We can become so tied up with meeting the education and training needs of employers in Wales and anticipating what their future needs might be, that we lose sight of everyone's right to pursue education for its own sake and not because they want to enter a worthwhile career, although that is a laudable aim and we should encourage it whenever possible. While recognising that it is important to equip the people of Wales with the skills and education that they are likely to need in the economy of the future, it must be right to allow and encourage people to undertake education out of curiosity and a burning desire to learn about a particular subject or range of subjects. We should not lose sight of, nor undervalue, that in addressing the future skills, training and education needs of the Welsh economy.

3:42 p.m.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae hyn yn gyfle i grynhoi a

oherwydd athro gwawdlyd efallai neu mae'n deillio o gyfundrefn addysg nad oedd mor barod ag y dylai fod i ymateb i anghenion pobl sydd â diffyg mantais.

Er mwyn tywys y bobl hyn yn ôl i addysg neu hyfforddiant ar ffon gyntaf yr ysgol rhaid mynd ati mewn ffordd sensitif nad yw'n eu rhagweld yn mynd ymlaen yn syth i gwrs ffurfiol gydag arholiad ar ei ddiwedd. Yn aml nid ydynt yn teimlo'n barod i ymgymryd â'r math hwnnw o addysg. Mae mudiadau gwirfoddol megis Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr a lluo o rai eraill yn gwneud gwaith gwerthfawr yn denu pobl yn ôl i addysg, ar gyrsiau sydd yn aml yn dangos llawer iawn o ddychymyg o ran cwmpas y pynciau y gellir eu dilyn. Unwaith y mae pobl yn ôl yn y gyfundrefn, ânt rhagddynt yn aml i wneud pob math o bethau. Mae llawer yn mynd i brifysgol ac yn cael canlyniadau ardderchog yn aml. Hoffwn gannol yr agwedd honno o'r agenda addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae'n rhywbeth y cyfeiriodd y Pwyllgor ato droeon. Gwn fod y Pwyllgor yn ei gyfanrwydd yn gwerthfawrogi'r math hwnnw o waith a'r cyfraniad a wneir gan y bobl hynny.

Hoffwn ddweud ychydig eiriau am addysg er mwyn addysg. Gall pawb ohonom ymgolli cymaint mewn diwallu anghenion addysg a hyfforddiant cyflogwyr yng Nghymru a rhagweld beth fydd eu hanghenion i'r dyfodol nes inni golli golwg ar hawl pawb i fynnu addysg er ei mwyn ei hun ac nid am eu bod am gael gyrfa werth chweil, er bod hynny yn nod canmoladwy ac y dylem ei annog pa le bynnag y mae'n bosibl. Tra'n cydnabod ei bod yn bwysig arfogi pobl Cymru gyda'r sgiliau a'r addysg y mae'n fwyaf tebygol y bydd eu hangen arnynt yn economi'r dyfodol, rhaid ei bod yn iawn ganiatáu i bobl, a'u hannog, i ymgymryd ag addysg o gywreinerwydd ac awydd angerddol i ddysgu am bwnc penodol neu ystod o bynciau. Ni ddylem golli golwg o hynny, na'i danbrizio wrth ymdrin ag anghenion economi Cymru am sgiliau, hyfforddiant ac addysg i'r dyfodol.

**Cynog Dafis:** This an opportunity to

gwneud sylwadau ar y themâu a godwyd ac i gyfeirio'n fyr at bob un o'r siaradwyr. Diolch i Tom Middlehurst am ei sylwadau. Gallaf ddweud yn ddiffuant fod pawb yn teimlo bod y deialog a'r cydweithio rhwng Tom Middlehurst, myfi fel Cadeirydd, a gweddill y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn ffrwythlon a defnyddiol.

Mae pwyslais Tom ar gonsensws, er enghraifft ar bolisi iaith, yn allweddol. Os ydym am symud ymlaen i ddatblygiadau polisi newydd, mae'n rhaid inni weithio ar sail consensws. Ni ddaw hi fel arall. Golyga hynny ildio ar adegau. Mae'n golygu nad ydych yn cael eich ffordd eich hunan bob tro. Soniodd Elin am barodrwydd Tom Middlehurst i wrando. Yn achos adroddiad ETAG, dangosodd Tom barodrwydd i gyfaddawdu a arweiniodd wedyn at gonsensws. Credaf fod y dull yr ydym wedi'i fabwysiadu o nodi lle mae anghytundeb yn bod fel rhan o'r adroddiad—soniodd Jonathan Morgan am hyn—yn gymorth yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Gwnaeth Elin bwynt ynghylch y cynllun iaith. Mae hynny'n aros i gael ei gyflawni ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn bwrw ymlaen gydag ef cyn gynted ag sydd yn bosibl. Mae'n sefyllfa ddiddorol oherwydd bydd yn rhaid i'n cynllun iaith gael ei gymeradwyo gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, corff cyhoeddus sydd yn atebol i ni. Mae cwestiwn yno ynglyn ag atebolrwydd democrataidd a phroses cyfreithiol. Gallem gael '*ding-donger*' hir iawn rhyngom a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, ond yr wyf yn siwr y cawn gonsensws ar hynny hefyd.

Gwnaeth Jonathan Morgan bwynt pwysig wrth ddweud ein bod wedi cymryd amser hir i ddod at bwnc megis addysg uwch. Mae hynny'n dangos mai ofer yw inni feddwl bod y Pwyllgorau yn gallu rhedeg Cymru, fel petai. Nid hynny yw eu swyddogaeth, yn fy marn i. Dyna lle y mae'n rhaid inni dderbyn y gwahaniad rhwng y Weithrediaeth a'r gweddill ohonom.

Mae'n rhaid cael digon o *capacity* ac o adnoddau i sicrhau rhedeg y wlad o ddydd i ddydd. Wedyn gall y Pwyllgor ymyrryd yn ôl

summarise and comment on the themes that have been raised and to refer briefly to each of the speakers. I thank Tom Middlehurst for his comments. I can sincerely say that everyone feels that the dialogue and collaboration between Tom Middlehurst, myself as Chair, and the rest of the Committee, has been fruitful and useful.

Tom Middlehurst's emphasis on consensus, for example on the language policy, is key. If we are to move forward to new policy developments, we must work on the basis of consensus. It will not happen otherwise. That means yielding at times. It means that you cannot have your own way every time. Elin mentioned Tom Middlehurst's willingness to listen. In the case of the ETAG report, Tom showed a willingness to compromise that then led to consensus. I believe that the method that we have adopted of noting where there is disagreement as part of the report—Jonathan Morgan mentioned this—assists in that direction.

Elin made a point about the language scheme. That is waiting to be fulfilled and it is important that we proceed with it as soon as possible. It is an interesting situation as our language scheme must be approved by the Welsh Language Board, a public body that is accountable to us. There is a question there about democratic accountability and legal process. We could have a lengthy '*ding-donger*' between us and the Welsh Language Board, but I am sure that we will find consensus on that also.

Jonathan Morgan made an important point in saying that we took a long time to come to a subject such as higher education. That shows that it is futile to think that the Committees can run Wales, as it were. That is not their function, in my view. That is where we must accept the separation between the Executive and the rest of us.

We must have sufficient capacity and resources to ensure the day-to-day running of the country. Then the Committee can

yr hyn y mae'n dewis ei wneud o bryd i'w gilydd, a dangos anfodlonrwydd, ond yn bwyllog, ac adeiladu argymhellion ynglyn â pholisi sydd wedyn yn gallu dod yn sail i gonsensws a newid cyfeiriad.

intervene according to what it chooses to do from time to time, and show dissatisfaction, but in a considered way, and build recommendations as regards policy that can then become the basis for consensus and a change of direction.

Soniodd Jonathan Morgan hefyd am bwysigrwydd monitro gweithredu argymhellion. Bydd hynny'n haws wrth i amser fynd ymlaen. Ni fydd angen yr ymchwiliadau hir hyn o hyd. Fodd bynnag, unwaith y mae argymhellion wedi cael eu gwneud, mae'r gwaith o fonitro eu gweithredu yn allweddol.

Jonathan Morgan also mentioned the importance of monitoring the implementation of recommendations. That will become easier with time. We will not need these lengthy reviews all the time. However, once recommendations have been made, the work of monitoring their implementation is crucial.

Siaradodd Christine Humphreys am addysg uwch yn arbennig. Cododd gwestiynau a phroblemau ynglyn ag ymchwil ac yn y blaen, a barn rhai bod annhegwch o fewn y sector a rhwng gwahanol gategoriâu o sefydliadau addysg uwch. Mae hynny'n enghraifft dda o'r modd y bydd gwaith y Pwyllgor yn amlygu'r holl ystyriaethau hynny ac yn ein galluogi i awgrymu atebion. Rhoddodd John Griffiths araith ddefnyddiol. Pwysleisiodd nid yn unig sgiliau—mae hynny'n bwysig fel rhan o ddatblygu economaidd a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol—ond addysg anffurfiol a galluogi pobl i ddychwelyd i'r broses ddysgu heb orfod wynebu, o angenrhaid, fygythiad arholiad, prawf neu'r angen i gael cymhwyster bob tro. Mae'r cam cyntaf yn ôl i ddysgu yn eithriadol o bwysig.

Christine Humphreys spoke about higher education in particular. She raised questions and problems about research and so on, and the view of some people that unfairness exists within the sector and between the various categories of higher education institutions. That is a good example of how the Committee's work will bring all those considerations to the fore and enable us to suggest solutions. John Griffiths gave a useful speech. He emphasised not only skills—that is important as part of economic development and social inclusion—but informal education and enabling people to return to the learning process without, necessarily, having to face the threat of an exam, a test or the need to have a qualification every time. The first step back to learning is exceptionally important.

Ynglyn â'i berorasiwn a'i bwyslais ar ddysgu er mwyn dysgu, dywedasom yn ein hargymhellion mai gwerthoedd addysgol a ddylai fod yn flaenaf. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig cofio hynny. Dywedaf 'Amen' brwdfrydig i ymateb John Griffiths.

On his peroration and his emphasis on education for education's sake, we said in our recommendations that educational values must be paramount. It is exceptionally important to remember that. I say an enthusiastic 'Amen' to John Griffiths's response.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0  
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine

Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion adopted.*

### **Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad The New Assembly Building**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr eitem nesaf o fusnes yw'r ddadl ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Oherwydd fy niddordeb yn y mater hwn, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd, Jane Davidson, wedi cytuno i gadeirio gweddill y sesiwn

**The Presiding Officer:** The next item of business is the debate on the new Assembly building. Because of my interest in this matter, the Deputy Presiding Officer, Jane Davidson, has agreed to chair the rest of the session.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Due to the large number of requests to speak in this debate, and to protect the time of the short debate, which is due to start at 5 p.m., I will impose a time limit, under Standing Order No. 7.3. The limit will be five minutes for

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Oherwydd y nifer fawr o geisiadau am gael siarad yn y ddadl hon, ac i ddiogelu amser y ddadl fer, sydd i fod i ddechrau am 5 p.m., byddaf yn pennu cyfyngiad amser, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.3. Y cyfyngiad fydd pum munud i'r



opening and closing speeches and amendments, and three minutes for other contributions. I want to try to ensure that as many as possible of those who have requested to speak are called to do so.

I have selected amendments 1 and 4 in the name of Glyn Davies, amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Andrew Davies and amendment 5 in the name of Owen John Thomas.

**The First Secretary:** I propose that

*the Assembly, having considered the work undertaken by officials and encapsulated in the document entitled 'National Assembly for Wales New Building Project Information' laid in the Table Office on 14 June, resolves to pursue Option E described in that document.*

I also propose amendment 2 in the name of Andrew Davies. Delete all after '*resolves*' and insert:

*to adopt Option A as described in that document.*

I also propose amendment 3 in the name of Andrew Davies. Delete all after '*resolves*' and insert:

*to continue to proceed with Option B as described in that document.*

When I made my last statement on this matter on 22 March, I promised that, within three months or thereabouts, I would have prepared a series of costed options and a Cabinet recommendation and that it would then be over to the Assembly. That is what we have done. I hope that we can debate this issue in the same good-natured manner as the previous debate, although that was almost like a love-in at times. I must ask Tom what the secret is. This will be the first vote on the principle of the new building or other solutions to our accommodation problems. It will be a free vote and I trust that it will be the final vote.

This debate will require a series of judgments

areithiau agoriadol a chau a'r gwelliannau, a thair munud i gyfraniadau eraill. Yr wyf am geisio sicrhau bod cynifer â phosibl o'r rheini sydd wedi gofyn am gael siarad yn cael eu galw i wneud hynny.

Yr wyf wedi dewis gwelliannau 1 a 4 yn enw Glyn Davies, gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Andrew Davies a gwelliant 5 yn enw Owen John Thomas.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad, ar ôl ystyried y gwaith a wnaed gan swyddogion ac a ddisgrifir yn y ddogfen 'Gwybodaeth am Broject Adeilad Newydd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mehefin, yn penderfynu mynd am Ddewis E fel y'i disgrifir yn y ddogfen honno.*

Cynigiau hefyd welliant 2 yn enw Andrew Davies. Dileu popeth ar ôl '*penderynu*' a rhoi yn ei le:

*mabwysiadu Dewis A fel y'i disgrifir yn y ddogfen honno.*

Cynigiau hefyd welliant 3 yn enw Andrew Davies. Dileu popeth ar ôl '*penderynu*' a rhoi yn ei le:

*parhau i symud ymlaen â Dewis B fel y'i disgrifir yn y ddogfen honno.*

Pan wneuthum fy natganiad diwethaf ar y mater hwn ar 22 Mawrth, addewais y byddwn, o fewn rhyw dri mis yn fras, wedi paratoi cyfres o opsiynau wedi'u costio ac argymhelliad gan y Cabinet ac mai mater i'r Cynulliad fyddai hyn wedyn. Dyna'r hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud. Gobeithiaf y gallwn drafod y mater hwn yn yr un modd hynaws â'r ddadl flaenorol, er bod honno'n ymdebygu braidd i sesiwn garu ar adegau. Rhaid imi holi Tom beth yw'r gyfrinach. Hon fydd y bleidlais gyntaf ar egwyddor yr adeilad newydd neu atebion eraill i'n problemau o ran adeilad. Bydd yn bleidlais rydd a hyderaf mai hon fydd y bleidlais derfynol.

Bydd y ddadl hon yn golygu cyfres o

on whether this Chamber is supportable as a permanent debating Chamber; if not, whether we should solve our debating Chamber needs functionally, at a moderate cost, by building an extension to this building at first and second floor levels, at a cost of £13.5 million, or spend double that amount—£27 million—on the new building scheme, which we inherited from the old Welsh Office. Both proposed buildings are extensions to Crickhowell House. It is easy to see that the first is an extension because it is so, at the first and second floors. The second purports to be a new building, although it would be attached to this building at ground floor corridor level.

The circumstances of this afternoon's vote, or series of votes, are unusual, special and almost anomalous. First, this is a parliamentary matter and not a matter of government policy. It is about our accommodation. Therefore, backbenchers have more rights than they normally have, as regards whipping and other arrangements. It is not a policy matter, but one in which we all have an interest, which is why Labour has chosen to have a free vote. Furthermore, we took a confirmatory vote on aspects of the Richard Rogers Partnership building scheme on site 1E behind this building on 26 January. That vote was not on the principle, but on revisions, on the timetable and the estimated cost. Departure from that, five months later would involve asking the Assembly to change from the original course that it chose in January. That vote was anomalous because it did not test the principle of whether the Assembly, as a client for the Richard Rogers Partnership, wanted the new building. It almost allowed us to slide into it without studying it and without supporting it or not.

3:52 p.m.

Today, being judgment day, is part of the Assembly's growing-up process. To paraphrase the famous ringing declaration after Labour won its huge majority in 1945, 'we are the masters now', today we must say that 'we are the clients now', regardless of

benderfyniadau i weld a ellir cefnogi'r Siambr hon fel Siambr drafod barhaol; os na ellir, a ddylem ddatrys ein hangen am Siambr drafod o safbwynt ymarferol, am gost gymedrol, drwy godi estyniad at yr adeilad hwn ar lefel y llawr cyntaf a'r ail lawr, am gost o £13.5 miliwn, ynteu wario dwbl y swm hwnnw—£27 miliwn—ar gynllun yr adeilad newydd, a etifeddwyd gennym oddi wrth yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig. Mae'r ddau adeilad arfaethedig yn estyniadau at Dy Crucywel. Mae'n hawdd gweld bod y cyntaf yn estyniad oherwydd dyna ydyw, ar y llawr cyntaf a'r ail lawr. Mae'r ail yn honni bod yn adeilad newydd, er y byddai ynghlwm wrth yr adeilad hwn ar lefel coridorau'r llawr isaf.

Mae amgylchiadau pleidlais y prynhawn yma, neu'r gyfres o bleidleisiau, yn anarferol, arbennig a bron iawn yn anomalaidd. Yn gyntaf, mater seneddol yw hwn, nid mater o bolisi llywodraeth. Mae a wnelo ag adeilad ar ein cyfer. Felly, mae gan aelodau'r meinciau-cefn fwy o hawliau nag sydd ganddynt fel arfer, o safbwynt chwipio a threfniadau eraill. Nid mater polisi mohono, ond un y mae gan bawb ohonom fuddiant ynddo, a dyna pam y mae Llafur wedi penderfynu cael pleidlais rydd. Heblaw hynny, cymerasom bleidlais gadarnhau ar agweddau o gynllun adeilad Partneriaeth Richard Rogers ar safle 1E y tu cefn i'r adeilad hwn ar 26 Ionawr. Nid pleidlais ar yr egwyddor oedd honno, ond ar ddiwygiadau, ar yr amserlen a'r gost dybiedig. Byddai gwyro oddi wrth hynny, bum mis yn ddiweddarach, yn golygu gofyn i'r Cynulliad newid oddi ar y llwybr gwreiddiol a ddewisodd yn Ionawr. Yr oedd y bleidlais honno yn anomalaidd am na roddodd brawf ar yr egwyddor pa un yr oedd y Cynulliad, fel cleient i Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers, am gael yr adeilad newydd. Gadawyd iddo lithro ar ein traws bron heb ei astudio a heb ei gefnogi neu beidio.

Mae heddiw, sef dydd y farn, yn rhan o broses aeddfedu'r Cynulliad. I aralleirio'r datganiad enwog hwnnw a fu'n diasbedain ar ôl i Lafur ennill ei mwyafrif enfawr yn 1945, 'ni yw'r meistri yn awr', heddiw rhaid i ninnau ddweud mai 'ni yw'r cleientiaid yn

whether we inherited this scheme or not. Therefore, the Assembly should not just accept what it has inherited from the Welsh Office but vote either on the Richard Rogers Partnership, on the courtyard option or on doing nothing. That is our choice today and we have managed to reach this stage within three months from when I announced my review.

These judgment calls are difficult ones. They are all embodied in the amendments before the Assembly today. There is a huge majority in this Assembly that considers this Chamber to be inadequate. It is inadequate because it was always intended to be a temporary solution. If you do not agree with that, you can vote for amendments 1 and 2. For a new Chamber, other committee rooms, improvement of public access at a minimum cost, the Chamber on stilts over the car park in the courtyard must be the right choice. Finally, if you want to spend twice that money you can vote for the Richard Rogers Partnership design on site 1E. You know the cost, but paying that extra money does not guarantee getting a landmark building. That is the judgment call, which supporters of the Richard Rogers option must justify today. They have to believe that the Richard Rogers Partnership design gives Wales a prestige, landmark building that justifies an extra £13 to £14 million.

The Richard Rogers building will be supported by those who believe that it is worth paying that extra money for the prestige. Is prestige worth £13 to £14 million on top of the functional option? The Cabinet does not think so. The factors that led me to seek a review included the continued doubts and speculation about the original decision to locate the Assembly home in the Bay as opposed to the City Hall or other possible locations. I heard doubts, mainly from civil servants, about the operational problems caused by the split site between the 2,000 civil servants in Cathays Park and the new democratic end of the Assembly set up in the bay.

Both options before us are effectively

awr', ni waeth ai etifeddu'r cynllun a wnaethom ai peidio. Felly, ni ddylai'r Cynulliad ei dderbyn dim ond am iddo ei etifeddu oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gymreig; dylai bleidleisio un ai ar Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers, ar opsiwn y cwrt neu ar wneud dim. Dyna ein dewis ni heddiw ac yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gyrraedd y fan hon o fewn tri mis o'r adeg i mi gyhoeddi fy adolygiad.

Mae gorfod barnu fel hyn yn anodd. Mae'r dadleuon i gyd wedi'u hymgorffori yn y gwelliannau gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw. Mae mwyafrif enfawr yn y Cynulliad hwn sydd o'r farn bod y Siambr hon yn annigonol. Mae'n annigonol am mai fel ateb dros dro y'i bwriadwyd erioed. Os nad ydych yn cytuno â hynny, gallwch bleidleisio dros welliannau 1 a 2. I gael Siambr newydd, ystafelloedd pwyllgora eraill, gwella mynediad i'r cyhoedd am y gost isaf, y Siambr ar byst uwchlaw'r maes parcio yw'r dewis iawn. Yn olaf, os ydych am wario dwbl yr arian hwnnw gallwch bleidleisio o blaid cynllun Partneriaeth Richard Rogers ar safle 1E. Gwyddoch y gost, ond nid yw talu'r arian ychwanegol hynny yn gwarantu cael adeilad a fydd yn troi pennau. Dyna y mae'n rhaid ei farnu, yr hyn y mae'n rhaid i gefnogwyr opsiwn Richard Rogers ei gyfiawnhau heddiw. Rhaid iddynt gredu bod cynllun Partneriaeth Richard Rogers yn rhoi i Gymru adeilad neilltuol, o fri sydd yn cyfiawnhau £13 i £14 miliwn ychwanegol.

Caiff adeilad Richard Rogers ei gefnogi gan y rheini sydd yn credu ei bod yn werth talu'r arian ychwanegol i gael y bri. A yw bri yn werth £13 i £14 miliwn ar ben yr opsiwn ymarferol? Nid yw'r Cabinet yn credu hynny. Ymysg y ffactorau a barodd imi geisio adolygiad yr oedd yr amheuon a'r dyfalu parhaus ynglyn â'r penderfyniad gwreiddiol i leoli cartref y Cynulliad yn y Bae yn hytrach nag yn Neuadd y Ddinas neu leoliadau eraill posibl. Clywais amheuon, gan weision sifil yn bennaf, ynglyn â'r problemau gweithredol a gâi eu hachosi o gael dau safle wedi eu rhannu rhwng y 2,000 o weision sifil ym Mharc Cathays ac elfen ddemocrataidd newydd y Cynulliad yn y bae.

Estyniadau yw'r ddau opsiwn ger ein bron

extensions. We should build the extension that accepts that it is an extension and not the one that pretends to be a free-standing new building. Although, there are inevitably cavaliers, roundheads and hairshirts among 60 people, the roundhead option, namely, an answer to our accommodation needs at a cost of £13 to £14 million, is the right way forward and I commend the motion to the Chamber.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose amendment 1. After ‘*Assembly having*’ delete all and insert:

*regard to issues involving procurement requirements, absence of costings, logistical difficulties and contractual obligations in relation to site 1E gives no credence to the irresponsible and cynical Cabinet proposal to build over the courtyard car park.*

I also propose amendment 4. After the word ‘*resolves*’ delete all and insert:

*not to proceed with any new building.*

When I first saw a sketch of the mini conservatory, which is being recommended to the Assembly by the First Secretary and his Cabinet today, it reminded me of my first day at primary school. What seemed like a massive redbrick edifice confronted this little five-year old lad from the hills, an edifice, which had a weird little extension around the back next to the staff car park. One of the not-so-new-boys told me, rather indelicately, that the weird little extension was the school bog. Indeed, it was. So, there you have it, the First Secretary’s idea of a new landmark building—the new debating Chamber for a new democracy is that it resembles a toilet block, except that it would cost anything up to £20 million and be raised on stilts above a car park—a £20 million bog on stilts.

Of course, it will not be built. It is just a sordid, squalid little stunt designed solely for the purpose of saving Rhodri Morgan’s skin. The real debate is whether to go ahead with the original Richard Rogers extension or not

heddiw i bob pwrpas. Dylem godi’r estyniad sydd yn derbyn mai estyniad yw ac nid yr un sydd yn cymryd arno fod yn adeilad newydd yn sefyll ar ei ben ei hun. Er ei bod yn anochel cael cafaliriaid, pengrynwyr a chrysau rhawn ymysg 60 o bobl, opsiwn y pengrynwyr, sef ateb ein hangen am adeilad am gost o £13 i £14 miliwn, yw’r ffordd iawn ymlaen ac argymhellaf y cynnig i’r Siambr.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Dileu popeth ar ôl y gair ‘*Cynigiaf*’ a rhoi yn ei le:

*nad yw’r Cynulliad, o ystyried materion yn ymwneud â gofynion caffael, diffyg manylion ynglŷn â chostau, anawsterau ymarferol a rhwymedigaethau cytundebol mewn perthynas â safle 1E, yn rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i gynnig anghyfrifol a sinigaidd y Cabinet i adeiladu dros faes parcio’r cwrt.*

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 4. Dileu popeth ar ôl y gair ‘*penderfynu*’ a rhoi yn ei le:

*peidio â symud ymlaen ag unrhyw adeilad newydd.*

Y tro cyntaf y gwelais fraslun o’r ystafell wydr bach, a argymhellir i’r Cynulliad gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd a’i Gabinet heddiw, fe’m hatgoffwyd o’m diwrnod cyntaf yn yr ysgol gynradd. Gwelais yr hyn a edrychai fel adeilad brics coch enfawr yn wynebu’r bachgen bach yma o’r brynau, adeilad oedd ag estyniad bach rhyfedd rownd y cefn drws nesaf i faes parcio’r staff. Dywedodd un o’r bechgyn dipyn-llai-newydd wrthyf, braidd yn ddi-chwaeth, mai ty bach yr ysgol ydoedd. Yn wir, dyna oedd. Felly, dyna chi, syniad y Prif Ysgrifennydd o adeilad newydd o fri—Siambr drafod newydd i ddemocratiaeth newydd sydd yn ymdebygu i floc toiledau, ar wahân i’r ffaith y byddai’n costio unrhyw beth hyd at £20 miliwn ac y câi ei godi ar byst uwchlaw’r maes parcio—ty bach £20 miliwn ar byst.

Wrth gwrs, ni chaiff ei godi. Nid yw’n ddim ond rhyw stynt wael, druenus a fwriadwyd at un pwrpas yn unig, sef achub croen Rhodri Morgan. Y ddadl go-iawn yw a ddylid bwrw ymlaen ag estyniad gwreiddiol Richard

go ahead with the new building, which is our preferred option. The Welsh Conservatives' view on this issue has not changed from the beginning, from which point I have consistently sought to convey two messages. The principle message was and remains that the Assembly should not spend £30 million of scarce resources on a new debating Chamber. Certainly, not before the Assembly has some solid achievements to its name. Our view remains that this money should be spent on the services that directly benefit the people of Wales. We must first convince Wales, through achievement and delivery, that spending on our own premises is justified. Architecture immortalises and glorifies something, hence there can be no architecture when there is nothing to glorify.

My second message is that I respect the views of those who have genuinely disagreed with us on this, but I have nothing but contempt—sheer, undiluted contempt—for the position adopted by the First Secretary and the Cabinet today. First Secretary, through your little stunt, you have demeaned yourself and you continue to do so now. The Cabinet has brought discredit upon itself and its party. You all seek to discredit this Assembly shamefully for one reason, namely, in a vain attempt to save Rhodri Morgan's face—

**The First Secretary:** What about the building?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We will have one speaker at a time. Glyn, will you reconsider your statement in light of the protocol on Members' conduct in the Chamber?

**Glyn Davies:** I have reconsidered my statement and I am perfectly content with everything that I have said.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Continue by concentrating on the issue under discussion within your five-minute deadline.

**Glyn Davies:** The First Secretary is putting forward a motion that he knows will not go

Rogers neu beidio â bwrw ymlaen â'r adeilad newydd, sef yr opsiwn a ffafriwn ni. Nid yw barn Ceidwadwyr Cymru ar y mater hwn wedi newid o'r dechrau, ac yr wyf fi wedi ceisio cyfleu dwy neges yn gyson ers hynny. Y neges pennaf bryd hynny ac o hyd yw na ddylai'r Cynulliad wario £30 miliwn o adnoddau prin ar Siambr drafod newydd. Yn sicr, nid cyn bod gan y Cynulliad rai llwyddiannau pendant i'w enw. Yr ydym yn dal i gredu y dylid gwario'r arian hwn ar wasanaethau sydd o fudd uniongyrchol i bobl Cymru. Rhaid inni argyhoeddi Cymru, drwy gyflawni a chyflwyno, fod cyfiawnhad i wario ar ein hadeilad ein hunain. Mae pensaernïaeth yn anfarwoli ac yn mawrygu rhywbeth, felly ni ellir cael pensaernïaeth lle nad oes dim i'w fawrygu.

Fy ail neges yw fy mod yn parchu barn y rheini sydd wedi anghytuno'n ddiffuant â ni ar hyn, ond nid oes gennyf ddim ond dirmyg—dirmyg pur, digymysg—i'r safbwynt a fabwysiadwyd gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd a'r Cabinet heddiw. Brif Ysgrifennydd, drwy eich stynt fach chi, yr ydych wedi iselhau eich hun ac yr ydych yn parhau i wneud hynny yn awr. Mae'r Cabinet wedi dwyn anfri arno ei hun a'i blaid. Yr ydych oll yn ceisio dwyn anfri gwaradwyddus ar y Cynulliad hwn am un rheswm, sef, mewn ymgais ofer i achub wyneb Rhodri Morgan—

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Beth am yr adeilad?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Un siaradwr yn unig ar y tro. Glyn, a wnewch chi ailystyried eich datganiad yng ngoleuni'r protocol ar ymddygiad Aelodau yn y Siambr?

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf wedi ailystyried fy natganiad ac yr wyf yn berffaith fodlon â phopeth a ddywedais.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cariwch ymlaen gan ganolbwyntio ar y mater o dan drafodaeth o fewn eich terfyn amser o bum munud.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn cyflwyno cynnig y gwyr yn iawn na fydd yn

ahead. He may not even want it to go ahead. He knows that everyone outside the Government's pay roll influence will not vote for this proposal. He is knowingly putting forward a proposal that would offer appalling value for money, which has not been costed or investigated in any meaningful way. It is a proposal, which has been comprehensively rubbished by Lord Rogers himself. What disgusts the Welsh people most is that the First Secretary knows that even if he goes ahead with his £20 million bog on stilts, the Assembly would be contractually obliged to build the Rogers building. His motion is a charade and an appalling stunt.

When Members of the Cabinet press their 'in favour' buttons today, they will be backing their own motion and everyone else in this Chamber will be looking down on them and judging them as being a disgrace to democracy. The decision will hang around their necks like dead albatrosses smelling until time eventually withers the rotting carcasses. However, First Secretary, you will not be so lucky. Your albatross carcass will never wither. You simply could not reach a decision on this issue. You sit there in the First Secretary's seat shouting at me and you cannot make this decision. Therefore, you come up with this ludicrous carbuncled option just to avoid making a real decision while the rest of us must decide without you. Go and hide under the desk if you must. Today, we must settle this issue. I ask fellow AMs to think carefully about their vote. Think about the opinion and the needs of the people of Wales and I hope that you will support me. In the interest of an expression of opinion, I formally withdraw my amendment 1—

**The First Secretary:** Who is dithering now?

**Glyn Davies:** —and move amendment 4 calling for the abandonment of the new extension, the effect of which—

**The First Secretary:** Who is dithering now?

mynd rhagddo. Efallai hyd yn oed nad yw am iddo fynd rhagddo. Gwyr na fydd neb y tu allan i ddylanwad cyflogres y Llywodraeth yn pleidleisio ar y cynnig hwn. Mae o fwriad yn cyflwyno cynnig a fyddai'n cynnig gwerth echrydus am arian, nad yw wedi'i gostio ac nad ymchwiliwyd iddo mewn unrhyw ffordd ddilys. Mae'n gynnig sydd wedi ei ddilorni'n llwyr gan yr Arglwydd Rogers ei hun. Yr hyn y mae pobl Cymru yn ffieiddio fwyaf ato yw bod y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn gwybod, hyd yn oed os aiff ymlaen â'i dy bach £20 miliwn ar byst, y byddai'r Cynulliad yn dal o dan rwymedigaeth gytundebol i godi adeilad Rogers. Cynnig gwneud yw hwn ac mae'n stýnt echrydus.

Pan fydd Aelodau'r Cabinet yn pwyso eu botymau 'o blaid' heddiw, byddant yn cefnogi eu cynnig eu hunain a bydd pawb arall yn y Siambr hon yn edrych i lawr arnynt gan eu barnu'n warth ar ddemocratiaeth. Bydd y penderfyniad hwn yn hongian o amgylch eu gyddfau fel albatrosod marw yn drewi nes i amser maes o law grino'r ysgerbydau pydredig. Fodd bynnag, Brif Ysgrifennydd, ni fyddwch chi mor lwcus. Ni wnaiff eich ysgerbwd albatros chi fyth grino. Yr ydych wedi methu â dod i benderfyniad ar y mater hwn. Yr ydych yn eistedd yno yn sedd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn gweiddi arnaf ac ni allwch wneud y penderfyniad hwn. Felly, yr ydych yn dyfeisio'r opsiwn carbunclog chwerthinllyd hwn yn unswydd er mwyn osgoi gwneud penderfyniad iawn tra bo'r gweddill ohonom yn gorfod penderfynu heboch. Ewch i guddio o dan y ddesg os mynnwch. Heddiw, rhaid inni setlo'r mater hwn. Gofynnaf i'm cyd-Aelodau ystyried eu pleidlais yn ofalus. Meddyliwch am farn ac anghenion pobl Cymru a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn fy nghefnogi. Er budd mynegi barn, yr wyf yn tynnu fy ngwelliant rhif 1 yn ôl yn ffurfiol—

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Pwy sydd yn tindrôl'n awr?

**Glyn Davies:** —ac yn cynnig gwelliant 4 sydd yn galw am roi'r gorau i'r estyniad newydd, sydd mewn gwirionedd—

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Pwy sydd yn tin-

droi'n awr?

**Glyn Davies:** —will be a vote of no confidence in the First Secretary and his Cabinet.

**Glyn Davies:** —yn bleidlais o ddiffyg hyder yn y Prif Ysgrifennydd a'i Cabinet.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Only one person should speak at a time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond un person a ddylai siarad ar y tro.

4:02 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** Deputy Presiding Officer, the bad temper and shouting being exhibited is completely counter-productive to sensible debate. We should debate this in a much calmer atmosphere than that exhibited by some Members of the Cabinet.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ddirprwy Lywydd, mae'r dymer ddrwg a'r gweiddi sydd yn cael eu gweld yma yn gwbl wrthgynhyrchiol i ddadl synhwyrol. Dylem drafod hyn mewn awyrgylch llawer tawelach na'r hyn a welir gan rai o Aelodau'r Cabinet.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I would be grateful if Members confined their comments to the building. I indicated at the beginning that there is little time for this debate. Many Members have indicated that they want to speak, but it is unlikely that everyone will be able to do so. If I have to intervene again that will further restrict the time. I ask Members to help by keeping within time limits and focusing on the issues in hand, namely speaking on the motion or the amendments to the motion.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Aelodau yn cyfyngu eu sylwadau i'r adeilad. Nodais ar y dechrau nad oes fawr o amser ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi nodi eu bod am siarad, ond mae'n annhebygol y gall pawb wneud hynny. Os bydd rhaid i mi ymyrryd eto bydd hynny'n cyfyngu ymhellach ar yr amser. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau helpu drwy gadw o fewn y cyfyngiadau amser a chanolbwyntio ar y materion dan sylw, sef siarad ar y cynnig neu'r gwelliannau i'r cynnig.

I understand that Owen John Thomas's amendment 5 has been withdrawn.

Deallaf fod gwelliant 5 gan Owen John Thomas wedi ei dynnu'n ôl.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Gwyr Aelodau fy marn ar y pwnc hwn. Yn wreiddiol, cefnogais Neuadd y Ddinas fel cartref i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r dewis hwnnw ar gael heddiw, felly nid oes gennyf amheuaeth ynglyn â chymeradwyo cynllun Richard Rogers. Dylem gefnogi hwnnw.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Members know my opinion on this subject. Originally, I supported the City Hall as a home for the Assembly. However, that choice is not available today, therefore I have no doubt about approving Richard Rogers's plan. We should support that.

Dylem ystyried tri pheth. A oes angen adeilad newydd? Os oes, pa gynlluniau sydd yn ateb y gofynion? Hefyd, a yw'r gost yn rhesymol?

We should consider three things. Is a new building needed? If so, which plans meet the requirements? Also, is the cost reasonable?

O safbwynt yr angen, ar ôl eistedd yma dro ar ôl tro, a gadael ar ôl tair awr â'm pen yn hollti, yr wyf yn sicr nad yw'r adeilad hwn yn addas. Nid yw'r ystafelloedd pwyllgora'n addas ychwaith, gan nad oes fawr o le ar gyfer y cyhoedd. Mae'r adeilad yn ddiffygiol

In terms of need, having sat here time after time, and left after three hours with a splitting headache, I am sure that this building is not suitable. The committee rooms are not suitable either, because there is not much room for the public. The building

o safbwynt urddas. Mae angen inni gael adeilad y gallwn ymfalchio ynddo. Nid yw'n deg bod Aelodau yn eistedd y tu ôl i bileri. Nid yw'n deg ar y cyhoedd nac ar y wasg.

lacks dignity. We need something of which we can be proud. It is not fair that Members sit behind pillars. It is not fair on the public or the press.

O safbwynt y dewisiadau eraill, mae'n anodd gweld sut y bydd cynllun y Llywodraeth yn ateb y gofynion hyn. Nid yw'n rhoi sicrwydd o Siambr effeithiol. Nid yw'n ateb y gofynion ar gyfer ystafelloedd pwyllgora, ac o safbwynt gweledol, mae'n drychinebus.

Regarding the other options, it is hard to see how the Government's plan will meet these requirements. It gives no assurance of an effective Chamber. It does not meet the requirements for committee rooms, and visually, it is awful.

Mae'n rhoi neges i'r byd sydd yn adlewyrchu Cynulliad heb weledigaeth a chenedl sydd yn ddiffygiol mewn hunanhyder. Os hyn yw maint ein hunan-barch, pa hawl sydd gennym, fel Cynulliad, i ddisgwyl cefnogaeth ac ymddiriedaeth gan bobl Cymru?

It gives a message to the world that reflects an Assembly without vision and a nation that is lacking in self-confidence. If that is the size of our self-respect, what right have we, as an Assembly, to expect support and trust from the people of Wales?

Mae cynllun Richard Rogers yn rhesymol. Mae'n dderbyniol yn gyllidol os cymharwch ef â'r £260 miliwn sydd yn cael ei wario ar swyddfeydd newydd yn Llundain neu'r £230 miliwn sydd yn cael ei wario ar Senedd newydd yr Alban. Cofiwch y byddai Neuadd Sir De Morgannwg wedi costio £40 miliwn yn nhermau prisiau heddiw. Nid yw'r gost yn afresymol.

Richard Rogers's plan is reasonable. It is financially acceptable if you compare it with the £260 million that is being spent on new offices in London or the £230 million that is being spent on the new Scottish Parliament. Remember that South Glamorgan County Hall would have cost £40 million at today's prices. The cost is not unreasonable.

Gofynnaf i'r Torïaid faint o ysbytai plant y gellid eu hadeiladu o sgrapio'r Trident neu o werthu Buckingham Palace i'r Siapaniaid fel a ddigwyddodd gydag adeilad y GLC.

I ask the Tories how many children's hospitals could have been built by scrapping Trident or selling Buckingham Palace to the Japanese as happened with the GLC building.

I earnestly hope that today we put this issue firmly to bed. I hope that we have the vision to build for the future, as did our forefathers a century ago, when they had the vision of Cathays Park as a splendid civic centre. Civic buildings have a purpose that go beyond their direct function. They reflect how a community regards its institutions. That is equally true of national, regional or local edifices. It is true not only of Government buildings, but also of arts, sport and particularly religious buildings.

Mawr obeithiaf y byddwn yn rhoi'r mater hwn i'w wely. Gobeithiaf fod gennym y weledigaeth i adeiladu ar gyfer y dyfodol, fel y gwnaeth ein cyndeidiau ganrif yn ôl, pan gawsant weledigaeth am Barc Cathays fel canolfan ddinesig ysblennydd. Mae i adeiladau dinesig ddiben sydd yn mynd y tu hwnt i'w swyddogaeth uniongyrchol. Maent yn adlewyrchu sut y mae cymuned yn ystyried ei sefydliadau. Mae hynny yr un mor wir am adeiladau cenedlaethol, rhanbarthol neu leol. Mae'n wir nid yn unig am adeiladau Llywodraeth, ond hefyd am adeiladau celfyddydol, chwaraeon a chrefyddol yn arbennig.

Big Ben means something more than a tall clock. The capitol in Washington and those

Mae Big Ben yn golygu rhywbeth mwy na chloc tal. Mae'r capitol yn Washington a



splendid state capitols reflect America's regard for freedom. Wales has had its share of buildings, which have reflected our values. The splendid cathedrals at St David's and Llandaff, for example, and a host of simple chapels built by every community to show that they believed in something greater. Most of all, some of our national university buildings in Bangor, Cardiff and elsewhere, which were built using the pennies of slate quarrymen and coal miners to reflect their passion for education and the liberation that that meant for our people.

They could have built a shoddy, functional, nineteenth century lean-to, but they had the vision to build something that was a worthy temple of a worthy dream. Do we, as the first elected Assembly of our nation in 600 years, not also have a vision for our nation? Do we not have a dream also? Is it symbolised by nothing more than a cut-price, lean-to, functional appendage to a mediocre office block? Come on, colleagues, come on. We can do better than this. For once, let us put our party divisions behind us. Let us be bold. Let us show that we have a little self-respect. Let us show that we believe that this Assembly is here to stay and to work for Wales. Let us show that we have the confidence in our country's future, in Cardiff's magnificent waterfront, in this Assembly's role, and in ourselves as representatives of the Welsh people. Let us vote—dare I say let us vote unanimously?—to go ahead without further delay with the Richard Rogers building and to commit ourselves to making the Assembly of central relevance to the Welsh nation. It is a practical means of driving forward our national regeneration, and a symbol of the new, positive Wales, of which our children may be proud.

**Michael German:** Yesterday a young homeless person called 'CJ' visited me here at the Assembly. He sells *The Big Issue* in Cardiff. He asked me straight out why we are spending several million pounds on a new building when he has no place to live. It is a difficult question. It is an uncomfortable question for those of us, like me, who believe

chapelau ysblennydd y taleithiau yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd rhyddid i America. Cafodd Cymru ei chyfran o adeiladau, i adlewyrchu ein gwerthoedd. Cadeirlannau ysblennydd Ty Ddewi a Llandaf, er enghraifft, a llu o gapeli syml a godwyd gan bob cymuned i ddangos eu bod yn credu mewn rhywbeth mwy. Yn bennaf oll, rhai o adeiladau ein prifysgol genedlaethol ym Mangor, Caerdydd a manau eraill, a godwyd gyda cheiniogau'r chwarelwyr a'r glowyr i adlewyrchu eu brwdfrydedd dros addysg a'r waredigaeth a olygai i'n pobl.

Gallent fod wedi codi estyniad gwael, ymarferol, yn perthyn i'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, ond yr oedd ganddynt y weledigaeth i godi rhywbeth a oedd yn deml deilwng i freuddwyd deilwng. Onid oes gennym ninnau, fel Cynulliad etholedig cyntaf ein cenedl mewn 600 mlynedd, weledigaeth hefyd i'n cenedl? Onid oes gennym ninnau freuddwyd? A symboleiddir hi gan ddim mwy nag estyniad ymarferol, am bris gostyngol at floc swyddfeydd cyffredin? Dewch o 'na, gyd-Aelodau, dewch o 'na. Am unwaith, gadewch inni anghofio rhaniadau pleidiol. Gadewch inni fod yn eofn. Gadewch inni ddangos bod gennym rywffaint o hunanbarch. Gadewch inni ddangos ein bod yn credu bod y Cynulliad hwn yma i aros ac i weithio dros Gymru. Gadewch inni ddangos bod gennym yr hyder yn nyfodol ein gwlad, yng nglan y dwr godidog Caerdydd, yn rôl y Cynulliad hwn, ac ynom ni ein hunain fel cynrychiolwyr pobl Cymru. Gadewch inni bleidleisio—a fentraff ddweud yn unfrydol?—i fwrw ymlaen heb oedi pellach ag adeilad Richard Rogers ac ymrwymo i wneud y Cynulliad yn ganolog o ran ei bwysigrwydd i genedl Cymru. Mae'n ffordd ymarferol o yrru ein hadfywiad genedlaethol yn ei flaen, ac yn symbol o Gymru newydd, bositif, y gall ein plant fod yn falch ohoni.

**Michael German:** Ddoe ymwelodd person ifanc digartref a elwir yn 'CJ' â mi yma yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n gwerthu *The Big Issue* yng Nghaerdydd. Gofynnodd imi'n blaen pam yr ydym yn gwario sawl miliwn o bunnoedd ar adeilad newydd pan nad oes ganddo le i fwy. Mae'n gwestiwn anodd. Mae'n gwestiwn anghyfforddus i'r rheini ohonom, fel minnau,

that today we should support Lord Rogers's design for a new Chamber. It goes to the heart of the debate. Whose building is this?

I agree that if we were to spend millions of pounds on plush new offices or creature comforts for our own benefit—and ours alone—then CJ's question would shame us all. It shames members of the Conservative Party, which, when in government, authorised £300 million for new parliamentary offices and £3 billion to £4 billion for the Millennium Dome. The truth is, however, that we are not building for ourselves; we are building a public, national building, which belongs as much to CJ as to us in this Chamber.

It will be a building where the people of Wales can access freely those who have been elected to represent them; where people can meet them, hear them and hold them to account. When, however, a homeless man came to the Assembly yesterday to speak to me, there was no room available here for me to hear his concerns. There were no committee rooms spare, no conference rooms, no room in the milling area; there was nowhere for us to go. Is that the way to give those excluded from our society a sense of ownership of the democratic process? I do not think so.

We must admit to ourselves that we have already failed to live up to that one central recommendation of the National Assembly Advisory Group, that we should give Wales an Assembly that is open and accessible to all. That would also not be the case if the Cabinet's plans for the car park conservatory were adopted today. We all know that such a building would cost as much as the Rogers building in the long term.

I wonder, Rhodri, whether on your recent visit to Sydney, Australia, thought what fools they were for building a stupid opera house and an ugly harbour bridge? Did they not

sydd yn credu y dylem heddiw gefnogi cynllun yr Arglwydd Rogers am Siambr newydd. Mae'n mynd at galon y ddadl. Adeilad pwy yw hwn?

Pe baem i wario miliynau o bunnoedd ar swyddfeydd newydd moethus neu gysuron corfforol er ein budd ein hunain—ac i fudd neb ond ni—cytunaf y byddai cwestiwn CJ yn dwyn gwarth ar bawb ohonom. Mae'n dwyn gwarth ar aelodau'r Blaid Geidwadol, a roddodd ganiatâd, tra'r oedd yn blaid y llywodraeth, i wario £300 miliwn ar swyddfeydd seneddol newydd a £3 biliwn i £4 biliwn ar Ddôm y Mileniwm. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw nad adeiladu ar ein cyfer ein hunain yr ydym ond codi adeilad cyhoeddus, cenedlaethol, sydd yn gymaint eiddo i CJ ag i bawb ohonom yn y Siambr hon.

Bydd yn adeilad lle gall pobl Cymru gyrraedd y rheini a etholwyd i'w cynrychioli yn hawdd; lle gall pobl gwrdd â hwy, gwranddo arnynt a'u dal i gyfrif. Fodd bynnag, pan ddaeth dyn digartref i'r Cynulliad ddoe i siarad â mi, nid oedd ystafell ar gael yma imi wrando ar ei bryderon. Nid oedd ystafelloedd pwyllgor sbâr, dim ystafelloedd cynadledda, na lle yn y neuadd; nid oedd dim lle o gwbl inni fynd iddo. Ai dyna'r ffordd i roi i'r rheini sydd wedi'u hallgáu o'n cymdeithas ymdeimlad o berchnogaeth dros y broses ddemocrataidd? Ni chredaf felly.

Rhaid inni gyfaddef ein bod eisoes wedi methu â gwireddu'r un argymhelliad canolog hwnnw a wnaethpwyd gan Grwp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sef y dylem roi Cynulliad i Gymru a fydd yn agored i bawb ac o fewn cyrraedd pawb. Ni châi hynny ei wireddu ychwaith pa câi cynlluniau'r Cabinet ar gyfer ystafell wydr yn y maes parcio eu derbyn heddiw. Gwyr pawb ohonom y byddai adeilad felly yn costio cymaint ag adeilad Rogers yn y tymor hir.

Ys gwn i, Rhodri, a oeddech chi'n meddwl ar eich ymweliad diweddar â Sydney, Awstralia, gymaint ffyliaid yr oeddynt i godi ty opera gwirion a phont hyll dros yr harbwr?

realise that they could have made do with a wendy house and a pontoon bridge? I wonder, Rhodri, whether the city fathers here in Cardiff were right to build the City Hall? The truth is that you cannot outbid a Conservative Party that never wanted an Assembly in the first place, and neither will you convince those who voted 'no' that it is worth the money, even though, as we all know, the Conservatives here want the new building but have not got the guts to vote for it. Scrapping the building will not win you their votes, Rhodri. The only way to do that is to scrap the whole thing and make do with a Secretary of State. We must vote for the Rogers building, so that we can say to the people of Wales that we want the best for Wales and we want the best for Wales for generations to come. We want to make a powerful statement that we are a confident country, that we can take on the rest of the world, and that we are not afraid of the world outside us.

Before he left, CJ had a look around this Chamber. He thought that it was small and unimpressive, not fit for a council, let alone a parliament. He would still prefer a home to an assembly building, but, if we have a bit of courage today, we can make sure that he gets both.

4:12 p.m.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Everybody knows that I was disappointed when the Richard Rogers design was put on hold after we voted to go ahead with it in January. I was also disappointed when I saw the proposals to build what looks like a shed on stilts in the rear car park. It looks like something in which you would boil cabbage. However, it is one of the options and we must consider it. We are told that the shed option—as I will call it—will cost £13 million. However, how can a cost be put on something that has not yet been designed? I am told it is only conceptual but even the conceptual plans show that serious questions have to be addressed about access. Do not even think about a bomb scare when the only exit is via a lift. Disability Wales will have a view on that. I do not think that it is an option

Oni sylweddolent y byddai ty wendy a phont pontwn wedi bod yn ddigonol? Ys gwn i, Rhodri, a oedd tadau'r ddinas yma yng Nghaerdydd yn iawn i godi Neuadd y Ddinas? Y gwir yw na allwch drechu ar Blaid Geidwadol nad oedd am weld Cynulliad yn y lle cyntaf, nac ychwaith argyhoeddi'r rheini a bleidleisiodd 'na' y bydd yn werth yr arian, er gwaethaf y ffaith, fel y gwyr pawb ohonom, fod y Ceidwadwyr yma am gael yr adeilad newydd ond nid oes ganddynt ddigon o asgwrn cefn i bleidleisio drosto. Ni fydd dileu'r adeilad yn ennill eu pleidleisiau hwy ichi, Rhodri. Yr unig ffordd o wneud hynny yw dileu'r cyfan a bodloni ar Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Rhaid inni bleidleisio dros adeilad Rogers, fel y gallwn ddweud wrth bobl Cymru ein bod am gael y gorau i Gymru ac yr ydym am gael y gorau i Gymru am genedlaethau i ddod. Yr ydym am wneud datganiad grymus ein bod yn wlad hyderus, y gallwn herio gweddill y byd, ac nad oes ofn y byd tu allan arnom.

Cyn iddo adael, cafodd CJ gip ar y Siambr hon. Meddyliai ei bod yn fach a di-nod, ddim yn addas i gyngor, heb sôn am senedd. Byddai'n dal yn well ganddo gael cartref nag adeilad i'r cynulliad, ond, os bydd gennym ychydig o ddewrder heddiw, gallwn wneud yn siwr ei fod yn cael y ddau.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Gwyr pawb fy mod yn siomedig pan gafodd cynllun Richard Rogers ei atal ar ôl inni bleidleisio i fwrw ymlaen ag ef yn Ionawr. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig hefyd pan welais y cynlluniau i godi'r hyn sydd yn edrych fel sied ar byst yn y maes parcio yn y cefn. Mae'n edrych fel rhywbeth i ferwi bresych ynddo. Fodd bynnag, mae'n un o'r opsiynau a rhaid inni ei ystyried. Dywedir wrthym y bydd opsiwn y sied—fel y byddaf yn ei alw—yn costio £13 miliwn. Fodd bynnag, sut y gellir rhoi cost ar ryw beth nad yw wedi ei ddylunio eto? Dywedir wrthyf mai cysyniad yn unig yw ond mae hyd yn oed y cynlluniau cysyniadol yn dangos bod yn rhaid rhoi sylw i bryderon difrifol ynglyn â mynediad. Peidiwch hyd yn oed â meddwl am fygythiad bom pan mai'r lifft fydd yr unig allanfa. Bydd gan Anabledd Cymru farn

because we would have to get permission from our landlords, Grosvenor Waterside, and they have other plans for the piece of land adjacent to the car park.

We are told that the people do not want this Chamber. Many people I know, some of whom have come here today, find that offensive. Of course there are people who are against this proposal. However, I have received letters and e-mails that show that many are in favour of it. At the end of the day, real politicians with guts must make decisions. Every one of our popular landmark buildings was opposed before they were built: the City Hall, St David's Hall and the Millennium Stadium. A brave decision was taken on those buildings and I ask you to take a brave decision today.

On the radio this morning, someone from Llanelli said that his taxes go towards paying for the Scottish Parliament, the new Greater London Assembly building and the lavish Westminster buildings for MPs. He wants value for money from his taxes. Why should they not go towards a new National Assembly Chamber? This is not just about providing a facility where we can all see and hear each other properly in a pillar-free environment. It is about giving the public an open, exciting and welcoming place to come, where they can feel part of our new democracy. It is not good enough that those in the public gallery can only see the top or the back of our heads.

If we do not endorse the Rogers building today and go for the shed instead, we will have to go out to open competition. We have done that once. If we do that again we will be saying to all world-renowned architects not to bother spending time, energy and money submitting designs, because in Wales we do not want a stunning building fit for its people to enjoy and participate in our fledgling democracy. If they are lucky enough to be chosen we would waste at least a year of their time and taxpayers' money as we dithered and probably damage their

ar hynny. Ni chredaf ei fod yn opsiwn oherwydd byddai'n rhaid inni gael caniatâd ein landlordiaid, Grosvenor Waterside, ac mae ganddynt hwy gynlluniau eraill ar gyfer y darn o dir gerllaw'r maes parcio.

Dywedir wrthym nad yw pobl am gael y Siambr hon. Mae llawer o bobl yr wyf fi yn eu hadnabod, rhai ohonynt sydd yma heddiw, yn teimlo bod hynny yn sarhaus. Wrth gwrs ceir pobl sydd yn erbyn y cynnig hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi derbyn llythyron a negeseuon e-bost sydd yn dangos bod llawer o'i blaid. Yn y pen draw, rhaid i wleidyddion go-iawn gydag asgwrn cefn lunio penderfyniadau. Gwrthwynebwyd pob un o'n hadeiladau amlycaf cyn iddynt gael eu codi: Neuadd y Ddinas, Neuadd Dewi Sant a Stadiwm y Mileniwm. Gwnaethpwyd penderfyniad dewr ar yr adeiladau hynny a gofynnaf ichi gymryd penderfyniad dewr heddiw.

Ar y radio y bore yma, dywedodd rhywun o Lanelli fod ei drethi yn mynd tuag at dalu am Senedd yr Alban, adeilad newydd Cynulliad Llundain Fawr a'r adeiladau moethus i ASau yn San Steffan. Mae am gael gwerth am arian o'i drethi. Pam na ddylent fynd tuag at Siambr newydd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Nid mater o ddarparu cyfleuster lle gall pawb ohonom weld a chlywed ein gilydd yn iawn mewn amgylchedd dibiler yw hwn yn unig. Mae'n fater o gynnig lle agored, cyffrous a chroesawgar i'r cyhoedd ddod iddo, lle gallant deimlo'n rhan o'n democratiaeth newydd. Nid yw'n ddigon da nad yw'r rheini yn yr oriel gyhoeddus ond yn gallu gweld top neu gefnau ein pennau.

Os na chefnogwn ni adeilad Rogers heddiw a mynd am y sied yn ei le, bydd yn rhaid inni fynd allan i gystadleuaeth agored. Gwnaethom hynny unwaith. Os gwnawn ni hynny eto byddwn yn dweud wrth holl benseiri adnabyddus ar draws y byd i beidio â gwastraffu amser, egni ac arian ar gyflwyno cynlluniau, oherwydd yng Nghymru nid ydym am gael adeilad trawiadol sydd yn addas i'w phobl fwynhau a chyfranogi yn ein hegin ddemocratiaeth. Os ydynt yn ddigon lwcus i gael eu dewis byddem yn gwastraffu o leiaf flwyddyn o'u hamser ac arian y

professional reputation. We would then change our minds and go elsewhere for something completely different. If you had a real idea of what it would cost, common sense would have to prevail today. Dismiss the shed on stilts and support the Richard Rogers building.

**Nick Bourne:** People who have watched the performance of the First Secretary on television or from the public gallery will be thinking, 'never more, never again a glad confident morning'. It was an extraordinary display on such an important issue. The First Secretary opened by suggesting that this had never been the subject of debate before: it is the subject of debate virtually every month.

People who suggest that the Welsh Conservatives did not want a different home for this Assembly should remember that along with most people here we wanted the City Hall. It seemed that the First Secretary also wanted the City Hall when he gave a seminar on 22 March. There was a long discourse about how the City Hall might be a viable option based on costs that were going to be revealed to us. I asked a question to the Finance Secretary on that subject. I was told that the figures were in the public domain. I have searched in vain for them because they are not in the public domain. We were promised figures on the cost to transfer to the City Hall. The City Hall appeared to be back in the frame, then it dropped out. This debate is about saving face. First Secretary, you know that at the end of the day the Richard Rogers design will go ahead and that is what this is all about.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Could we please focus on the building and the proposed amendments?

**Nick Bourne:** That is what I am doing. First Secretary, you know that the £13 million for this new building would be wasted on a lean-to shed. You said in your initial comments that we must judge whether it is worth

trethdalwyr wrth inni din-droi ac mae'n bur debyg y niweidiwn eu henw da proffesiynol. Wedyn byddem yn newid ein meddyliau ac yn mynd at rywun arall am rywbeth cwbl wahanol. Pe bai gennych wir syniad o'r hyn y byddai'n ei gostio, byddai'n rhaid i synnwyr cyffredin drechu heddiw. Gwrthodwch y sied ar byst a chefnogwch adeilad Richard Rogers.

**Nick Bourne:** Bydd pobl a fu'n gwyllo perfformiad y Prif Ysgrifennydd ar y teledu neu o'r oriel gyhoeddus yn meddwl, 'byth mwy, byth eto y ceir bore llawen, llawn hyder'. Yr oedd yn berfformiad rhyfedd iawn ar fater mor bwysig. Agorodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd drwy awgrymu na fu hyn yn destun dadl erioed o'r blaen: mae'n destun dadl bob mis bron.

Dylai'r bobl sydd yn awgrymu nad oedd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig am gael cartref gwahanol i'r Cynulliad hwn gofio ein bod ni, fel y rhan fwyaf o bobl yma, am gael Neuadd y Ddinas. Ymddangosai fod y Prif Ysgrifennydd am gael Neuadd y Ddinas pan roddodd seminar ar 22 Mawrth. Cafwyd araith hir ar sut y gallai Neuadd y Ddinas hefyd fod yn opsiwn dichonadwy ar sail costau oedd i gael eu dadlennu inni. Gofynnais gwestiwn i'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid ar y pwnc hwnnw. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod y ffigurau yn eiddo cyhoeddus. Yr wyf wedi chwilio'n ofer amdanynt oherwydd nid ydynt yn eiddo cyhoeddus. Addawyd ffigurau inni ar y gost o drosglwyddo i Neuadd y Ddinas. Ymddangosai fod Neuadd y Ddinas yn ôl yn y ffrâm, yna cafodd ei gollwng. Dadl am arbed wyneb yw hon. Brif Ysgrifennydd, yn y pen draw gwyddoch y bydd cynllun Richard Rogers yn mynd rhagddo a dyna sydd wrth wraidd hyn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A gawn ni ganolbwyntio ar yr adeilad a'r gwelliannau arfaethedig os gwelwch yn dda?

**Nick Bourne:** Dyna yr ydwyf yn ei wneud. Brif Ysgrifennydd, gwyddoch y byddai'r £13 miliwn am yr adeilad newydd hwn yn cael ei wastraffu ar sied groes. Dywedasoeh yn eich sylwadau cychwynnol fod yn rhaid inni farnu

paying an extra £13 million for prestige. What is important is not the building that we are in but what we do in the building. Let me contrast two systems. Singapore has an administration that works and is based in a makeshift building. Malaysia has a system that we would not want to emulate, and is based in the sort of building in which you once believed, but now you want a cheaper option. What we deliver in this building is what is important for the people of Wales; not the building in which we are based. I am glad that you are nodding in agreement.

Therefore, I hope that you will support the proposal that it is more important to spend this money on something of public significance, such as a national hospital, rather than on a new debating Chamber. That would be an effective testament to what the people of Wales want. I agree with Lorraine Barrett that some people are in favour of this new building, but they are a distinct minority. People from every corner of Wales have signed petitions, which I have here, saying that they are against this new building, Lorraine. I accept that some are not, but regardless of how they voted in the referendum, which is history as far as I am concerned, most people do not want this new building. I hope that Members will vote accordingly today.

**Ron Davies:** I was one of those who welcomed Rhodri's decision to conduct a review, because there had been so much debate and concern about the project. It was perfectly understandable that when Rhodri became First Secretary he wanted to reassure himself of the financial basis on which we were making a decision.

There are two key findings in the review, which I welcome. The first was in the National Audit Office's review, which states:

'The decision to locate in the bay was the correct one.'

The second finding was in the Turner and

a yw hi'n werth talu £13 miliwn ychwanegol er mwyn bri. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw nid yr adeilad yr ydym ynddo ond yr hyn a wnawn yn yr adeilad. Gadewch imi wrthgyferbynnu dwy gyfundrefn. Mae gan Singapôr weinyddiaeth sydd wedi'i lleoli ac sydd yn gweithio o adeilad dros dro. Mae gan Faleisia gyfundrefn na fyddem am ei hefelychu, a leolir yn y math o adeilad y credech chi ynddo unwaith, ond bellach yr ydych am gael opsiwn rhatach. Yr hyn a gyflawnwn yn yr adeilad hwn sydd o bwys i bobl Cymru, nid yr adeilad yr ydym wedi ein lleoli ynddo. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn nodio eich cytundeb.

Felly, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cefnogi'r cynnig ei bod yn bwysicach gwario'r arian hwn ar rywbeth sydd o arwyddocâd cyhoeddus, megis ysbyty cenedlaethol, yn hytrach nag ar Siambr drafod newydd. Byddai hynny yn destament effeithiol i'r hyn y mae pobl Cymru yn ei ddymuno. Cytunaf â Lorraine Barrett fod rhai pobl o blaid yr adeilad newydd hwn, ond lleiafrif ydynt yn sicr. Mae pobl o bob cwr o Gymru wedi llofnodi deisebau, sydd gennyf yma, yn dweud eu bod yn erbyn yr adeilad newydd hwn, Lorraine. Derbyniaf nad yw pawb, ond ni waeth sut y bu iddynt bleidleisio yn y refferendwm, sydd yn hanes yn fy marn i, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o bobl am gael yr adeilad newydd hwn. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn pleidleisio yn unol â hynny heddiw.

**Ron Davies:** Yr oeddwn i yn un o'r rheini a groesawodd benderfyniad Rhodri i gynnal adolygiad, am fod cymaint o drafod a phryder wedi bod ynglyn â'r prosiect. Yr oedd yn gwbl ddealladwy fod Rhodri, pan ddaeth yn Brif Ysgrifennydd, am sicrhau ei hun ynglyn â'r sylfaen ariannol yr oeddem yn gwneud penderfyniad arni.

Mae dau gasgliad allweddol yn yr adolygiad, a groesawaf. Yr oedd y cyntaf yn adolygiad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol sydd yn datgan:

'Y penderfyniad i ymleoli yn y bae oedd y penderfyniad cywir.'

Yr oedd yr ail gasgliad yn adolygiad Grwp

Townsend Group's review, which states:

'The proposed scheme...'—the Richard Rogers option—

'...represents value in both functional and unit cost terms.'

I welcome those findings. However, I take issue with the Cabinet's recommendation. I am at a loss to understand why it feels that we do not already have a policy. The decision we made on 26 January was clear. That motion said that we agree that the development should now proceed. That seems to be clear and unequivocal and there is nothing in this report that suggests why that motion should not be implemented.

I also take issue with the argument that the Cabinet's recommendations represent a cut-price compromise or some alternative that will save us money. The National Audit Office insists that comparisons of this nature are done on the basis of the net present cost. That is the Treasury requirement. The report indicates that, using the net present costs as the basis for comparison, the Richard Rogers option calculates at £76 million and the car park option at £72 million over 15 years. If anybody thinks that by voting for the compromise option today, millions of pounds will be available to spread around Wales on their favoured options, they should think again, particularly as the car park option is nothing more than a design concept. The figure of £72 million bears no resemblance to the figure that we are likely to pay at the end.

After some three years of debate, to which I have been closer than most people in this Chamber, we must arrive at a firm decision that will allow us to proceed. It will disillusion people about the Assembly's workings if we have endless debates about where we have our debates and do not set about the task of improving economic and social conditions for the people of Wales. We will rapidly lose their support. There is only one decision that we can make that will

Turner a Townsend, ac yn datgan:

'Mae'r cynllun arfaethedig...'—opsiwn Richard Rogers—

'...yn cynrychioli gwerth mewn termau ymarferol a themau cost fesul uned.'

Croesawaf y casgliadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, anghytunaf ag argymhelliad y Cabinet. Methaf ddeall pam ei fod yn teimlo nad oes gennym bolisi yn barod. Yr oedd y penderfyniad a wnaethom ar 26 Ionawr yn glir. Dywedodd y cynnig hwnnw ein bod yn cytuno y dylai'r datblygiad fynd rhagddo yn awr. Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn glir a diamwys ac nid oes unrhyw beth yn yr adroddiad hwn sydd yn awgrymu pam na ddylai weithredu'r cynnig hwnnw.

Anghytunaf hefyd â'r ddadl fod argymhellion y Cabinet yn cynrychioli cyfaddawd rhatach neu ryw opsiwn amgen a fydd yn arbed arian inni. Mae'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn mynnu bod cymariaethau o'r math hwn yn cael eu gwneud ar sail y gost net ar y pryd. Dyna ofyniad y Trysorlys. A defnyddio'r costau net ar hyn o bryd fel sylfaen cymharu, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi bod opsiwn Richard Rogers yn rhoi ffigur o £76 miliwn ac opsiwn y maes parcio £72 miliwn dros 15 mlynedd. Os oes unrhyw un yn meddwl, drwy bleidleisio am opsiwn y cyfaddawd heddiw, y bydd miliynau o bunnoedd ar gael i'w lledaenu o amgylch Cymru ar eu hoff opsiynau, dylent ailfeddwl, yn enwedig gan nad yw opsiwn y maes parcio yn ddim mwy na chysyniad dylunio. Nid oes unrhyw debygrwydd rhwng y ffigur o £72 miliwn a'r ffigur yr ydym yn debygol o'i dalu yn y diwedd.

Ar ôl rhyw dair blynedd o drafod, y bûm i'n nes ato na'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn y Siambr hon, rhaid inni ddod i benderfyniad pendant a fydd yn caniatáu inni fwrw ymlaen. Bydd yn dadrithio pobl ynglyn â phrosesau'r Cynulliad os cawn ddadleuon diddiwedd am ble i gynnal ein dadleuon ac nad ydym yn bwrw ati gyda'r dasg o wella amodau economaidd a chymdeithasol ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Buan iawn y collwn ni eu cefnogaeth. Nid oes ond un penderfyniad y

bring about a resolution to this debate. The Richard Rogers option is a costed option for which we have approval and with which we can proceed immediately. The alternative option is nothing more than a design concept. We do not have an architect, a design brief or planning consent. The costs are unsure, we do not have the landlord's consent and we are likely to end up with a legal suit against us for breach of contract. The landlord will not give us consent under those circumstances. There are major questions about accessibility and sustainability. If we think that we can resolve these in two years without further endless argument and delay, we are denying the history of the last two years. We have a clear option; the Richard Rogers option exists, it has the benefit of widespread support inside and outside this Chamber and represents the only alternative available to us to end the debate and get on with the building.

**Val Feld:** I speak in favour of what I will call Rhodri's roundel, which is the Cabinet's proposal. I do so, Dafydd, as someone who has also had a dream all her life that there would come a time when people across Wales would support their own political institution. I have given a great deal of thought to this building, the amount of money it will cost and the signals that it will send out. I have no doubt that buildings send out important signals. However, there are far too many examples across the world of grand, civic buildings built by governments as monuments to political ideology but without substantive, solid foundations in their countries for those ideologies and aspirations. You only need to look to eastern Europe to the former communist countries to see the signals that were sent out by the kind of buildings that were built during those years of communism.

4:22 p.m.

People will judge this new democracy on how it affects their daily lives. We say over and over in this Chamber. Only a small proportion of the people of Wales will ever

gallwn ei wneud a fydd yn dod â'r ddadl hon i ben. Mae opsiwn Richard Rogers yn opsiwn sydd wedi ei gostio, y mae gennym gymeradwyaeth iddo ac yn un y gallwn fwrw ymlaen ag ef ar unwaith. Nid yw'r opsiwn amgen yn ddim mwy na chysyniad dylunio. Nid oes gennym bensaer, briff dylunio na chaniatâd cynllunio. Mae'r costau yn ansicr, nid ydym wedi cael cydsyniad y landlord ac yr ydym yn debygol o wynebu achos cyfreithiol am dor-contract. Ni fydd y landlord yn cydsynio o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny. Mae cwestiynau mawr ynglyn â mynediad a chynaliadwyedd. Os credwn y gallwn ddatrys y rheini mewn dwy flynedd heb ddadlau ac oedi pellach diddiwedd, yr ydym yn gwadu hanes y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Mae gennym opsiwn clir; mae opsiwn Richard Rogers yn bodoli, mae ganddo'r fantais o gefnogaeth eang o'r tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Siambr hon ac mae'n cynrychioli'r unig ddewis amgen sydd ar gael inni i roi terfyn ar y ddadl a bwrw ymlaen â'r adeilad.

**Val Feld:** Siaradaf o blaid yr hyn a alwaf yn rondel Rhodri, sef cynnig y Cabinet. Gwnaf hyn, Dafydd, hefyd fel rhywun y bu ganddi freuddwyd gydol ei hoes y deuai amser pan fyddai pobl ar draws Cymru yn cefnogi eu sefydliad gwleidyddol eu hunain. Yr wyf wedi meddwl llawer am yr adeilad hwn, y swm o arian y bydd yn ei gostio a'r negeseuon y bydd yn eu cyfleu. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf fod adeiladau yn cyfleu negeseuon pwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer gormod o enghreifftiau ar draws y byd o adeiladau dinesig, crand a godwyd gan lywodraethau fel cofadeiliau i ideolegau gwleidyddol ond heb sylfeini cadarn, o sylwedd yn eu gwledydd i'r ideolegau a'r dyheadau hynny. Nid oes rhaid ichi ond edrych tua dwyrain Ewrop i'r cyn wledydd comiwnyddol i weld y negeseuon a gafodd eu cyfleu gan y math o adeiladau a godwyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd hynny o gomiwnyddiaeth.

Bydd pobl yn barnu'r ddemocratiaeth newydd hon ar sut y mae'n effeithio ar eu bywydau beunyddiol. Yr ydym yn dweud hynny drosodd a throsodd yn y Siambr hon.



come to this building. However, all of the people of Wales will use our health and education services. The problem we currently have is that, in far too many places in Wales, people do not know what we do. They do not understand what the Assembly is here to achieve. I want the £15 million—or perhaps less if Ron says so, but whatever it is, there is a substantial amount of money to be saved—to be used to take this Assembly and its Committees and its work out to the rest of Wales. I ask Rhodri and Edwina to respond on how we could use these resources to take our work to west and north Wales where people do not understand enough about what we are doing. One great success in our work over the last year is the regional committee meetings where people come and engage with us. There is much more work that we can do on that. I would like to see us take the Plenary sessions to Caernarfon or Bangor and let people see what we do. There is much work to do to build the confidence of the people of Wales in our activities. That will happen as a result of what we do, not as a result of the building that we occupy.

**Owen John Thomas:** On 22 March, when the First Secretary announced that he was putting on hold the proposals for the new National Assembly, there was more than a flutter of support from the general public. These hopes were raised again in the debate on 4 April, when Rhodri described a two-option scenario that envisaged housing the National Assembly in the City Hall and delivering Crickhowell House into the hands of the local authority. However, it would seem from Sir John Bourn's report on this issue that the City Hall was ruled out as an option in the very early stages of this three-month hiatus. It would appear that this unfortunate, lengthy delay could have been considerably reduced.

Unwaith y chwalwyd y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio Neuadd y Ddinas, yr oedd yn amlwg fod y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn barod i roi rhwydd hynt i gynllun gwreiddiol, blaengar Richard Rogers ar wahân i grwp y

Dim ond cyfran fechan o bobl Cymru a ddaw i'r adeilad hwn byth. Fodd bynnag, bydd holl bobl Cymru yn defnyddio ein gwasanaethau iechyd ac addysg. Y broblem sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yw nad yw pobl, mewn llawer gormod o leoedd yng Nghymru, yn gwybod beth a wnawn. Nid ydynt yn deall beth y mae'r Cynulliad yma i'w gyflawni. Yr wyf am i'r £15 miliwn—efallai llai os yw Ron yn dweud hynny, ond beth bynnag yw, mae swm sylweddol o arian i'w arbed—gael ei ddefnyddio i fynd â'r Cynulliad hwn a'i Bwyllgorau a'i waith allan i weddill Cymru. Gofynnaf i Rhodri ac Edwina ymateb ar sut y gallem ddefnyddio'r adnoddau i fynd â'n gwaith i orllewin a gogledd Cymru, lle nad yw pobl yn deall digon am yr hyn a wnawn. Un llwyddiant mawr yn ein gwaith dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yw cyfarfodydd y pwyllgorau rhanbarth, lle mae pobl yn dod ac yn cydweithio â ni. Hoffwn ein gweld yn mynd â'r Cyfarfod Llawn i Gaernarfon neu Fangor ac yn gadael i bobl weld beth a wnawn. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud i ennyn hyder pobl Cymru yn ein gweithgareddau. Bydd hynny'n digwydd ar sail yr hyn a wnawn, nid ar sail yr adeilad yr ydym ynddo.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ar 22 Mawrth, pan gyhoeddodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd ei fod yn rhewi'r cynigion ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol newydd, cafwyd mwy na siffrwd o gefnogaeth ymysg y cyhoedd. Codwyd y gobeithion hyn eto yn y ddadl ar 4 Ebrill, pan ddisgrifiodd Rhodri senario dau opsiwn a ragwelai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymgartrefu yn Neuadd y Ddinas a Thy Crucywel yn cael ei drosglwyddo i ddwylo'r awdurdod lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymddangos o adroddiad Syr John Bourn ar y mater hwn i Neuadd y Ddinas gael ei diystyru fel opsiwn yn gynnwys iawn yn y bwloch hwn o dri mis. Mae'n ymddangos y gallai'r oedi anffodus, maith hwn fod wedi ei gwtogi'n sylweddol.

Once the possibility of using the City Hall had been abandoned, it was obvious that the majority of National Assembly Members were willing to give the go-ahead for Richard Rogers's original and innovative plan, with the exception of the Welsh Conservative

Ceidwadwyr Cymreig a gredai y gwnâi unrhyw beth y tro i Gymru.

group who believe that anything will do for Wales.

Byddai hyn wedi bod yn benderfyniad rhesymol ac anrhydeddus ac yn glod i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, ond nid felly y bu. Dyfeisiwyd dewis arall—un sydd yn agos at safbwynt y Ceidwadwyr—yn cynnig cynllun rhad i geisio twyllo 51 o Aelodau i gyfaddawdu ag wyth Aelod nad ydynt hyd yn oed yn credu yn egwyddor datganoli.

This would have been a reasonable and honourable decision that would have been to the First Secretary's credit, but that did not happen. Another option was invented—one which is close to the Conservatives' standpoint—that offered a cheap plan to try to deceive 51 Members into compromising with eight Members who do not even believe in the principle of devolution.

Could it be that Rhodri had recently read Graham Henry's theory of the Welsh suffering from a national inferiority complex? A building with a capital cost of only a twelfth of that of Scotland's would surely appeal to the inferior Welsh personified by the eight Conservative AMs. Option E's most outstanding feature would be its inability to be seen. Despite the uplift it would receive from several well-placed stilts, surrounded on three out of four sides by the wings of an office block, 75 per cent of it would be permanently hidden from view, unlike the prestigious, eye-catching Option B. Option E would not share a waterfront position with the Pierhead building. The opportunity of portraying Wales as a young, modern, outward-looking democracy would be lost were we to opt for a retiring, four-legged mushroom cringing in the shadow of a five storey office block.

Ys gwn i a ddarllenodd Rhodri'n ddiweddar ddamcaniaeth Graham Henry fod y Cymry'n dioddef o gymhlethdod israddoldeb cenedlaethol? Mae'n sicr y byddai adeilad sydd â chost gyfalaf o ddim ond un rhan o ddeuddeg o gost adeilad yr Alban yn apelio at Gymry israddol, fel y'u personolir gan yr wyth AC Ceidwadol. Un o nodweddion mwyaf trawiadol Opsiwn E fyddai ei anallu i gael ei weld. Er iddo gael ei godi gan nifer o byst wedi eu lleoli'n bwrpasol, wedi'i amgylchynu ar dair o'i bedair ochr gan adeiniau bloc swyddfeydd, byddai 75 y cant ohono wedi ei guddio o'r golwg yn barhaol, yn wahanol i Opsiwn B sydd yn adeilad o fri ac yn hoelio sylw. Ni fyddai Opsiwn E yn rhannu lleoliad ar lan y dwr gydag adeilad Pierhead. Câi'r cyfle i bortreadu Cymru fel democratiaeth ifanc, fodern, yn edrych tuag allan ei golli pe baem yn dewis madarchen swil ar bedair coes yn gwingo yng nghysgod bloc swyddfeydd pum llawr.

Galleu ei alw'n fadarch Morgan, efallai. Nid yw cynnig Opsiwn E yn deilwng o'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ac nid yw'n ddigon da i gynrychioli pobl Cymru. Ymgais yw Opsiwn E i glosio at ddymuniadau'r grwp Ceidwadol, y grwp a gyrhaeddodd uchafbwynt ei ddyheadau dros Gymru drwy wrthwynebu sefydlu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, y corff y maent yn dal i geisio ei danseilio heddiw.

We could call it Morgan's mushroom, perhaps. Proposing Option E is not worthy of the First Secretary and it is not good enough to represent the people of Wales. Option E is an attempt to cosy up to the Conservative group, which reached the height of its wishes for Wales by opposing the establishment of the National Assembly, the body that they are still trying to undermine today.

One is tempted to ponder how and why the Conservatives have lost touch with their traditional supporters in the world of business and finance. Only yesterday, representatives of the Cardiff Bay Business Forum pointed out that office accommodation in the bay would be harder to let if Option B

Cawn ein temtio i ddyfalu sut a pham y mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi colli cysylltiad â'u cefnogwyr traddodiadol ym myd busnes a chyllid. Dim ond ddoe, dywedodd cynrychiolwyr Fforwm Busnes Bae Caerdydd y byddai swyddfeydd yn y bae yn fwy anodd i'w gosod pe byddem yn rhoi'r

were abandoned. In other words, the bay would be a less attractive business proposition without a building of national significance as its centrepiece. Our vote on this issue will decide the image viewed on television screens and seen in newspapers throughout the world whenever and wherever Wales is mentioned. The sum of £27 million is a small investment in our built environment but a sound investment in marketing our national profile and a firm statement of the rights of small nations in all corners of the world. Option E has none of these virtues.

**Richard Edwards:** I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate and to express my view without fear or favour, and untroubled by press articles designed to intimidate. If you cannot do as you think right in public life, especially on important issues, what is the point of being in public life at all? Perhaps I am being naïve, but then I believe that there is too much cynicism in politics and even more so in our wretched media. In any case, is this not supposed to be the new politics?

I will not rehearse the reasons why the present Chamber is unacceptable; they are self-evident to all but those who oppose devolution in any case. As for the bolt-on lean-to in the car park, it is not a viable alternative. It is a compromise that satisfies no one. Those who want an appropriate symbol for Welsh democracy will be disappointed and those who argue against any additional expenditure will remain disgruntled. Although it is understandable, I regret how reopening the debate has served to maximise our difficulties in taking this important decision and has played into the hands of the enemies of devolution and the Assembly.

The way that this has happened typifies what seems to be a defensive mindset on devolution—always on the back foot and allowing opponents to dictate the debate. This defensive, apologetic approach compromises the performance of our fledgling Assembly and is in danger of

gorau i Opsiwn B. Mewn geiriau eraill, byddai'r bae yn opsiwn busnes llai deniadol heb adeilad o arwyddocâd cenedlaethol yn ffocws iddo. Ein pleidlais ni ar y mater hwn a fydd yn pennu pa ddelwedd a welir ar sgriniau teledu ac mewn papurau newydd ledled y byd pa bryd ac ym mhle bynnag y sonnir am Gymru. Buddsoddiad bach yn ein hamgylchedd adeiledig yw'r swm o £27 miliwn ond mae'n fuddsoddiad doeth i farchnata ein proffil cenedlaethol ac yn ddatganiad cadarn o hawliau cenedloedd bach ym mhob cwr o'r byd. Nid oes i Opsiwn E yr un o'r rhinweddau hyn.

**Richard Edwards:** Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl hon a mynegi fy marn heb ofn na ffafriaeth, a heb fy nghyffroi gan erthyglau yn y wasg a fwriadwyd i godi ofn. Os na allwch wneud yr hyn a dybiwch sydd yn iawn mewn bywyd cyhoeddus, yn enwedig ar faterion pwysig, pa ddiben sydd mewn bod mewn bywyd cyhoeddus o gwbl? Efallai fy mod yn bod yn naif, ond wedyn credaf fod llawer gormod o sinigiaeth mewn gwleidyddiaeth a mwy fyth yn ein cyfryngau enbydus. Beth bynnag, onid gwleidyddiaeth newydd sydd i fod gennym yma?

Nid wyf am fynd dros y rhesymau pam fod y Siambr hon yn annerbyniol; maent yn amlwg i bawb ond y rheini sydd yn gwrthwynebu datganoli beth bynnag. O ran yr estyniad yn y maes parcio, nid yw'n ddewis amgen dichonadwy. Cyfaddawd ydyw nad yw'n bodloni neb. Bydd y rheini sydd am gael symbol priodol i ddemocratiaeth Cymru yn siomedig a'r rheini sydd yn dadlau yn erbyn unrhyw wariant ychwanegol yn parhau'n anfodlon. Er ei fod yn ddealladwy, mae'n flin gennyf fod ailagor y ddatl wedi chwyddo ein gwahaniaethau wrth lunio'r penderfyniad pwysig hwn ac wedi chwarae i ddwylo gelynyon datganoli a'r Cynulliad.

Mae'r modd y digwyddodd hyn yn nodweddiadol o'r hyn sydd, yn ôl pob golwg, yn gyfeiriad meddwl amddiffynnol ar ddatganoli—wastad ar y droed ôl ac yn gadael i'r gwrthwynebwyr arwain y ddatl. Mae'r agwedd amddiffynnol, ymddiheuro hon yn peryglu perfformiad ein hegin

allowing the prophecies of Conservative jeremiahs to become self-fulfilling jeremiahs who spent 18 long years systematically removing all vestiges of democracy in this country. Of course, they do not think that democracy is worth paying for. I believe that it is and that future generations will judge us harshly if we duck the need for an appropriate, accesible new Chamber now for short-term expedience dictated by the enemies of devolution. We risk undermining the potential of the Assembly and of democracy in Wales. This is a long-term investment in Welsh democracy. The decision falls to us because we are the first elected Assembly Members, but it is not about us. We are 60 transient politicians, here today, gone tomorrow. We are temporary keepers of our offices in this body, which I hope and trust will outlive us all.

I know that the public is sceptical and that the Assembly needs to prove itself. That point is frequently made by those out to wreck the Assembly. It is a brand new institution and it will take many years for it to take root properly. We are all embarked on a long-term enterprise requiring a long-term vision. It requires courage, leadership and vision. Let us not kow-tow to the forces of Conservatism that held this country in thrall for 18 long years and gave the Assembly such a rotten inheritance. Let us extend our vision beyond the end of our noses.

4:32 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** No one will be surprised to hear that I am a strong supporter of the Richard Rogers design. After all, I am an Assembly Member representing a Cardiff constituency. I was a supporter of the City Hall option but that ceased to be realistic when the decision was taken to use and refurbish this building, which had previously been a great source of financial embarrassment to the Government as it stood half-empty and expensive to maintain. It was a daily drag on the NHS budget because of

Gynulliad ac mae mewn perygl o ganiatáu i broffwydoliaethau jeremeias Ceidwadol ddod yn jeremeias hunangyflawnol a dreuliodd 18 mlynedd hir yn dileu'n systematig holl olion democratiaeth o'r wlad hon. Wrth gwrs, ni chredant hwy fod democratiaeth yn werth talu amdani. Credaf fi ei bod ac y bydd cenedlaethau'r dyfodol yn ein barnu'n hallt os osgown yr angen am Siambr briodol, hygyrch newydd yn awr er mwyn hwylustod tymor byr a fynnir gan elynion datganoli. Mae perygl inni danseilio potensial y Cynulliad a democratiaeth yng Nghymru. Buddsoddiad tymor hir yn democratiaeth Cymru yw hwn. Mae'r penderfyniad yn disgyn arnom ni gan mai ni yw Aelodau etholedig cyntaf y Cynulliad, ond nid oes a wnelo â ni. Trigain o wleidyddion dros dro ydym ni, yma heddiw, wedi mynd yfory. Ceidwaid dros dro ein swyddi yn y corff hwn ydym ni, a gobeithiaf a hyderaf y bydd y swyddi hynny yn goroesi pawb ohonom.

Gwn fod gan y cyhoedd amheumon a bod angen i'r Cynulliad profi ei hun. Gwneir y pwynt yn fynych gan y rheini sydd am ddryllio'r Cynulliad. Mae'n sefydliad newydd sbon a bydd yn cymryd blynyddoedd lawer iddo wreiddio'n iawn. Mae pawb ohonom wedi dechrau ar fenter dymor hir lle mae angen gweledigaeth tymor hir. Rhaid wrth ddewrder, arweinyddiaeth a gweledigaeth. Gadewch inni beidio â chowtowio i rymoedd Ceidwadaeth a gaethiwodd y wlad hon am 18 mlynedd hir a rhoi i'r Cynulliad etifeddiaeth mor sâl. Gadewch inni ymestyn ein gweledigaeth y tu hwnt i flaenau ein trwynau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni fydd neb yn synnu clywed fy mod yn cefnogi cynllun Richard Rogers yn gryf. Wedi'r cyfan, yr wyf yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad sydd yn cynrychioli etholaeth yng Nghaerdydd. Yr oeddwn yn cefnogi opsiwn Neuadd y Ddinas ond peidiodd hynny â bod yn realistig pan benderfynwyd defnyddio ac adnewyddu'r adeilad hwn, a fu gynt yn ffynhonnell embaras mawr i'r Llywodraeth gan ei fod yn sefyll yn hanner gwag ac yn ddud i'w gynnal. Yr oedd yn faich beunyddiol ar

the deal set up by the Conservative Secretary of State for Wales.

I was amazed when Rhodri announced that he was putting the new building on hold. His long speech citing the advantages of a move to the City Hall was based on facts that had all been looked at before. The papers and figures were available and should have been looked at before any decision to delay was made. Nick Bourne, if you want to see the figures on the City Hall, press the Chamberweb on the 'Supporting Papers' option. You will find the letter from the auditor.

What has this three month delay achieved—another confirmation of the figures? I hope that it has achieved another confirmation of the building. The project price has increased because the lean-to for the car park was designed.

I will turn to the positive reasons why we need this building. There are practical and aesthetic reasons. It has been said time and time again that Wales needs a new symbol. Hopefully the new building will be that symbol in the same way that Sydney Opera House is a symbol and the Houses of Parliament are a symbol not only of London but of the United Kingdom. The Assembly will not establish itself in the national consciousness until it looks like a proper parliament.

The key issue is that these symbols are of great economic importance to the country. The Houses of Parliament are symbols of democracy worldwide. They bring in millions of pounds in the tourist trade. The new building needs to be a symbol not only of Wales but of the redevelopment of Wales. Unfortunately, and in many ways in Cardiff Bay, that stalled when Rhodri made his announcement. Investors would not sign until they knew the final grand plan. This is an all or nothing decision. The lean-to is not an option. It will not solve the problem of public access and it will not provide a national symbol except for national car parks.

gyllideb yr NHS oherwydd y cytundeb a sefydlwyd gan y Ceidwadwr oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

Rhyfeddais pan gyhoeddodd Rhodri ei fod yn rhewi cynllun yr adeilad newydd. Seiliwyd ei araith hir a nodai fanteision symud i Neuadd y Ddinas ar ffeithiau a oedd wedi eu hystyried i gyd o'r blaen. Yr oedd y papurau a'r ffigurau ar gael a dylid bod wedi edrych arnynt cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad i oedi. Nick Bourne, os ydych am weld y ffigurau ar Neuadd y Ddinas, dewiwch yr opsiwn 'Papurau Cefnogi' ar We'r Siambr. Fe welwch lythyr yr archwiliwr.

Beth a gyflawnodd yr oedi hwn o dri mis—cadarnhau'r ffigurau unwaith yn rhagor? Gobeithiaf ei fod wedi arwain at gadarnhau'r adeilad unwaith yn rhagor. Mae pris y prosiect wedi cynyddu am fod yr estyniad ar gyfer y maes parcio wedi'i ddylunio.

Trof at y rhesymau cadarnhaol pam fod arnom angen yr adeilad hwn. Mae rhesymau ymarferol ac esthetig. Dywedwyd dro ar ôl tro fod angen symbol newydd ar Gymru. Gobeithio mai'r adeilad newydd fydd y symbol hwnnw yn yr un ffordd ag y mae Ty Opera Sydney yn symbol a Thy'r Cyffredin a Thy'r Arglwyddi yn symbol nid yn unig o Lundain ond o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Ni fydd y Cynulliad yn sefydlu ei hun yn ymwybyddiaeth y genedl hyd nes y bydd yn edrych fel gwir senedd.

Yr ystyriaeth allweddol yw bod y symbolau hyn o bwys mawr yn economaidd. Mae Ty'r Cyffredin a Thy'r Arglwyddi yn symbolau democratiaeth drwy'r byd. Dônt a miliynau o bunnoedd i mewn drwy gyfrwng y diwydiant twristiaeth. Mae angen i'r adeilad newydd fod yn symbol nid yn unig o Gymru ond o ailddatblygiad Cymru. Yn anffodus, ac mewn sawl modd ym Mae Caerdydd, cafodd hyn ei atal pan wnaeth Rhodri ei gyhoeddiad. Ni fynnai buddsoddwyr lofnodi hyd nes y gwyddent y cynllun mawr terfynol. Mae hwn yn benderfyniad terfynol. Nid yw'r estyniad yn opsiwn. Ni fydd yn datrys problem mynediad i'r cyhoedd ac ni fydd yn creu symbol cenedlaethol ac eithrio i'r meysydd

parcio cenedlaethol.

It will be poor value for money. New buildings are not generally popular but a poll in the *South Wales Echo* today shows that a massive majority is in favour of the new building. I beg you to support the Richard Rogers design.

**Brian Gibbons:** In my constituency, one third of the ward are in the lowest 10 per cent in terms of social deprivation. The ward in which I have lived for the last 20 years is one of the worst in Wales. I came to the National Assembly to help to achieve a quantum change in Wales. We need the confidence, self-belief and vision to do this. The way in which we set about our work could deliver that.

We have heard the Conservatives' viewpoint, whose trajectory of vision is grass-high in a cow pat. I would not expect amore from them because that is the height of their vision for Wales and its people. The compromise shed in the back typifies many of Wales's problems that stem from the idea that just good enough is good enough. Just good enough is not good enough anymore if we are to achieve the quantum change to make Wales a qualitatively better place. The shed in the back would be a monument to mediocrity. Mediocrity has plagued us for the last 75 years in Wales. I do not claim to be a culture vulture, but the Richard Rogers building offers Wales an image of the best. It has creativity, imagination and it offers a solution to our functional problems. It offers our people a chance to engage with the new democracy that we are building in Wales. It is a place of which we can be proud.

I have not brought constituents to this building to date because it is an embarrassment. I hope that the new Richard Rogers building will be something of which we can be proud, to show what Wales can achieve. Let us have the vision and the confidence to go forward. Let us go forward and try to get the best for Wales and our future.

Bydd yn rhoi gwerth gwael am arian. Nid yw adeiladau newydd yn boblogaidd yn gyffredinol ond dengys arolwg yn y *South Wales Echo* heddiw fod mwyafrif enfawr o blaid yr adeilad newydd. Erfyniaf arnoch i gefnogi cynllun Richard Rogers.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn fy etholaeth i, mae un rhan o dair o'r ward yn y 10 y cant isaf o ran amddifadedd cymdeithasol. Mae'r ward y bûm yn byw ynddi am yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf yn un o'r gwaethaf yng Nghymru. Deuthum i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i helpu i gyflawni newid cwantwm yng Nghymru. Mae arnom angen hyder, ffydd ynom ein hunain a gweledigaeth i wneud hyn. Gallai'r ffordd yr ydym yn ymgymryd â'n gwaith wireddu hynny.

Clywsom safbwynt y Ceidwadwyr, y mae eu gweledigaeth cyn uchod â'r borfa mewn tom gwartheg. Ni fyddwn yn disgwyl mwy ganddynt oherwydd dyna uchder eu gweledigaeth i Gymru a'i phobl. Mae'r cyfaddawd o sied yn y cefn yn nodweddiadol o lawer o broblemau Cymru sydd yn deillio o'r syniad bod digon da o'r braidd yn ddigon da. Nid yw digon da o'r braidd yn ddigon da mwyach os ydym i gyflawni'r newid cwantwm i wneud Cymru yn well lle o ran ansawdd. Byddai'r sied yn y cefn yn gofeb i gyffredinedd. Bu cyffredinedd yn bla arnom am y 75 mlynedd diwethaf yng Nghymru. Ni honnaf fod yn lleibiwr diwylliant, ond mae adeilad Richard Rogers yn cynnig delwedd o'r gorau i Gymru. Mae iddo greadigedd, dychymyg ac mae'n cynnig ateb i'n problemau ymarferol. Mae'n cynnig cyfle i'n pobl ymwneud â'r ddemocratiaeth newydd yr ydym yn ei llunio yng Nghymru. Mae'n lle y gallwn fod yn falch ohono.

Nid wyf wedi dod ag etholwyr i'r adeilad hwn eto am ei fod yn embaras. Gobeithiaf y bydd adeilad newydd Richard Rogers yn rhywbeth y gallwn fod yn falch ohono, i ddangos beth y gall Cymru ei gyflawni. Gadewch inni gael y weledigaeth a'r hyder i symud ymlaen. Gadewch inni symud ymlaen a cheisio cael y gorau i Gymru a'n dyfodol.

**Alun Cairns:** I feel as though we are acting out a scene from *Groundhog Day*. We have been here on so many occasions in the past. Yet, here we are again debating this monstrosity of a purpose-built palace in Cardiff Bay. After Rhodri Morgan was elected First Secretary by Assembly Members, he generated an enormous amount of good will. The public reacted by saying that he had saved the day. Their man had stopped this purpose-built palace being built. He took the high ground and stood on the political fence. He considered the City Hall and Cardiff Bay options. However, we have the new, lean-to option today—the so-called compromise building. Having sat on that political fence, the First Secretary had to come down one way or another. Therefore, he devised the alternative project of the compromise building to dig himself out of the hole in which he found himself. Instead of digging himself out, he has taken the Cabinet down with him. They are digging deeper by the minute, with every contribution that is being made.

The lean-to has not been costed. It has not been planned in detail. It does not even have an architect. Richard Rogers won the competition for the Assembly building on site 1E. Therefore, we only have the concept diagrams of the lean-to, which were presented last week. It has been described as something in which to boil cabbage. Glyn Davies called it a bog. Even Alun Pugh, who will support it today, said in the presentation last week that it was a non-starter from the outset because we are contractually obliged to build something on site 1E. That demonstrates the farce of this compromise building, this lean-to, this bog, this something in which to boil a cabbage that has been presented by the Cabinet.

**David Davies:** Has it not been called that because it will be largely full of cabbages?

**Alun Cairns:** I am not sure whether I would prefer to boil a cabbage or a Cabinet in the building. The public will react and call on us to boil a cabbage in it.

**Alun Cairns:** Teimlaf fel pe baem yn actio golygfa o *Groundhog Day*. Buom yma gynifer o weithiau yn y gorffennol. Ond, dyma ni unwaith eto yn trafod y palas pwrpasol erchyll hwn ym Mae Caerdydd. Ar ôl i Rhodri Morgan gael ei ethol yn Brif Ysgrifennydd gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ysgogodd ewyllys da aruthrol. Ymatebodd y cyhoedd drwy ddweud iddo achub y dydd. Yr oedd eu dyn hwy wedi atal y palas pwrpasol hwn rhag cael ei godi. Hawliodd y tir uchel a safodd ar y ffens wleidyddol. Ystyriodd opsiynau Neuadd y Ddinas a Bae Caerdydd. Fodd bynnag, heddiw mae opsiwn newydd yr estyniad o'n blaenau—adeilad y cyfaddawd fel y'i gelwir. Wedi eistedd ar y ffens wleidyddol honno, rhaid oedd i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ddod i lawr un ffordd neu'r llall. Felly, dyfeisiodd brosiect amgen adeilad y cyfaddawd i gloddio'i ffordd allan o'r twll y cafodd ei hun ynddo. Yn lle cloddio'i hun allan, mae wedi tynnu'r Cabinet i lawr gydag ef. Maent yn cloddio'n ddyfnach wrth y funud, gyda phob cyfraniad a wneir.

Nid yw'r estyniad wedi ei gostio hyd yn oed. Nid yw wedi ei gynllunio'n fanwl. Nid oes iddo bensaer hyd yn oed. Enillodd Richard Rogers y gystadleuaeth am adeilad i'r Cynulliad ar safle 1E. Felly, nid oes gennym ond diagramau cysyniad yr estyniad a gyflwynwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Fe'i disgrifiwyd fel rhywbeth i ferwi bresych ynddo. Galwodd Glyn Davies ef yn gachdy. Dywedodd hyd yn oed Alun Pugh, a fydd yn ei gefnogi heddiw, yn y cyflwyniad yr wythnos diwethaf na ddeuai unrhyw beth ohono o'r dechrau am fod rhwymedigaeth gytundebol arnom i godi rhywbeth ar safle 1E. Mae hynny'n dangos ffars adeilad y cyfaddawd, yr estyniad hwn, y ty bach, rhywbeth i ferwi bresych ynddo a roddwyd gerbron gan y Cabinet.

**David Davies:** Oni alwyd ef yn hynny gan y bydd yn llawn gan mwyaf o fresych?

**Alun Cairns:** Nid wyf yn siwr a fyddai'n well gennyf ferwi bresychen ynteu Gabinet yn yr adeilad. Bydd y cyhoedd yn ymateb ac yn galw arnom i ferwi bresychen ynddo.

The building has been called a new symbol: a symbol of democracy and a symbol for the new Wales. What better symbols than a fine health service or high education standards? That is what we are supposed to achieve in this Assembly, not a purpose-built palace because of Assembly Members who are full of self-importance. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] You should be humble like the Conservatives.

Mae'n amlwg bod Rhodri Morgan yn sylweddoli y bydd cynllun Richard Rogers yn mynd ymlaen. Mae'n amlwg fod digon o gefnogaeth yn y Cynulliad i gynllun Richard Rogers. Fodd bynnag, yr unig gynllun a wnaiff gyffwrdd yn wirioneddol â'r bobl a'n hetholodd i'r fan hon yw cynllun y Blaid Geidwadol i aros lle yr ydym.

**Delyth Evans:** I will vote in favour of the Richard Rogers design. I support it for two reasons. First, because of its significance for democracy in Wales and, secondly, for what it will achieve for Wales abroad. The most important feature of the Rogers design—a central element of the design—is its public access. The design of the milling area, the public galleries and the whole concept of the building focuses on openness and accountability. That is entirely fitting for the new democracy that we have in Wales. I have no doubt that people from all over Wales will want to come to see the new Chamber. It will be a source of great pride to us and will give a new impetus, relevance and dynamism to our deliberations.

In terms of our international standing, let us consider other recent building projects elsewhere in Europe. The Tate Gallery in St Ives, the Guggenheim museum in Bilbao and the new Holocaust museum in Berlin have contributed significantly to the image and stature of their respective regions and countries. Similarly, if we opt for the Rogers building, we will, at a stroke, re-position Wales on the international stage. Val Feld's comparison to great buildings in eastern Europe is inappropriate. The Rogers design is a modest building, but it is appropriate to its purpose, as all great buildings are. I do not

Galwyd yr adeilad yn symbol newydd: symbol o ddemocratiaeth a symbol i'r Gymru newydd. Pa well symbolau na gwasanaeth iechyd da neu safonau addysg uchel? Dyna'r hyn yr ydym i fod i'w gyflawni yn y Cynulliad hwn, nid palas pwrpasol oherwydd Aelodau o'r Cynulliad sydd yn llawn hunanbwysigrwydd. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Dylech fod yn ostyngedig fel y Ceidwadwyr.

It is obvious that Rhodri Morgan realises that the Richard Rogers design will go ahead. It is obvious that there is enough support in the Assembly for Richard Rogers's design. However, the only plan that will truly touch the people who elected us to this place is the Conservative Party's plan to stay where we are.

**Delyth Evans:** Byddaf yn pleidleisio o blaid cynllun Richard Rogers. Cefnogaf ef am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, oherwydd ei arwyddocâd i ddemocratiaeth yng Nghymru ac, yn ail, oherwydd yr hyn y bydd yn ei gyflawni dros Gymru dramor. Nodwedd bwysicaf cynllun Rogers—elfen ganolog o'r cynllun—yw'r mynediad i'r cyhoedd. Mae cynllun y neuadd, yr orielau cyhoeddus a holl gysyniad yr adeilad yn canolbwyntio ar fod yn agored ac yn atebol. Mae hynny'n gwbl briodol ar gyfer y ddemocratiaeth newydd sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth y bydd pobl o bob rhan o Gymru am ddod i weld y Siambr newydd. Bydd yn achos balchder mawr inni a rhydd symbyliad, perthnasedd ac egni newydd i'n trafodaethau.

O ran ein statws rhyngwladol, gadewch inni ystyried prosiectau adeiladu diweddar mewn manau eraill yn Ewrop. Mae Oriol y Tate yn St Ives, amgueddfa Guggenheim yn Bilbao ac amgueddfa newydd yr Holocaust yn Berlin wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol at ddelwedd a statws eu rhanbarthau a'u gwledydd. Yn yr un modd, os dewiswn ni adeilad Rogers, byddwn, ar amrantiad, yn ail-leoli Cymru ar y llwyfan rhyngwladol. Mae cymhariaeth Val Feld gydag adeiladau mawr yn nwyrain Ewrop yn amhriodol. Adeilad cymedrol yw cynllun Rogers, ond mae'n briodol i'w ddiben, fel y mae pob adeilad mawr. Nid wyf



overstate the case when I say that that building will redefine Wales as a creative, confident, modern open democracy. That is what successful building projects can achieve, and that is what we would achieve with the Richard Rogers design.

4:42 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A group of people with learning disabilities visited me in the Assembly today. Their main focus was on asking me difficult questions about our plans on resettlement and advocacy. I was glad to be able to answer them. However, as part of that visit, I had to show them around this building. Their reactions were interesting. Their reaction to this room was, 'it is a bit scruffy'. That summed it up. Their reaction to the committee rooms was that they were poky.

While we were waiting to have a cup of coffee, some of them noticed the picture of the new building. One by one, they rose and walked over to look at it. They said, 'it is beautiful'. It is beautiful and we deserve it. The people of Wales deserve it, not us in this Chamber. It is not about us. It is worth saying to the public that Assembly Members' accommodation will remain the same. Our offices will remain where they are. The new building is for those who visited me today and for all our other constituents who want to come here. Our nation deserves that.

As we all know, the Conservatives did not want devolution, they do not want Wales to be proud of itself and they do not want the National Assembly to work. Therefore, it is no wonder that they are not going—

**Alun Cairns** *rose—*

**Helen Mary Jones:** No, I am sorry. Your colleagues did not give way to me, Alun. You have spoken enough this afternoon. In terms of self-importance, I think that the pot calling the kettle black award has been granted this afternoon.

yn gor-ddweud yr achos wrth ddweud y bydd yr adeilad yn ailddiffinio Cymru fel democratiaeth greadigol, hyderus, fodern ac agored. Dyna'r hyn y gall prosiectau adeiladu llwyddiannus ei gyflawni, a dyna'r hyn y byddem ni'n ei gyflawni gyda chynllun Richard Rogers.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ymwelodd grwp o bobl ag anableddau dysgu â mi yn y Cynulliad heddiw. Eu prif ffocws oedd gofyn cwestiynau anodd imi am ein cynlluniau ar ailsefydlu ac eiriolaeth. Yr oeddwn yn falch o allu eu hateb. Fodd bynnag, fel rhan o'r ymweliad hwnnw, yr oedd yn rhaid imi eu tywys o amgylch yr adeilad hwn. Yr oedd eu hymatebion yn ddiddorol. Eu hymateb i'r ystafell hon oedd, 'mae braidd yn ddi-raen'. Dyna'r gwir yn gryno. Eu hymateb i'r ystafelloedd pwyllgora oedd eu bod braidd yn gyfyng.

Tra yr oeddem yn disgwyl i gael cwpanaid o goffi, sylwodd rhai ohonynt ar y llun o'r adeilad newydd. Fesul un, codasant a cherdded draw i edrych arno. 'Mae'n hardd', dywedasant. Mae yn hardd ac yr ydym yn ei haeddu. Mae pobl Cymru yn ei haeddu, nid ni yn y Siamb hon. Nid yw'n ymwneud â ni. Mae'n werth dweud wrth y cyhoedd y bydd ystafelloedd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn aros yr un fath. Bydd ein swyddfeydd yn aros yn lle y maent. Mae'r adeilad newydd ar gyfer y rhai a ymwelodd â mi heddiw a'n holl etholwyr eraill sydd am ddod yma. Mae ein cenedl yn haeddu hynny.

Fel y gwyr pawb ohonom, nid oedd y Ceidwadwyr am gael datganoli, nid ydynt am i Gymru fod yn falch ohoni ei hun ac nid ydynt am i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol weithio. Felly, nid yw'n syndod nad ydynt yn mynd i—

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd—*

**Helen Mary Jones:** Na, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Nid ildiodd eich cyd-Aelodau chi i mi, Alun. Yr ydych wedi siarad digon y prynhawn yma. Yn nhermau hunanbwysigrwydd, tybiaf fod gwobr y crochan yn galw'r tegell yn ddu wedi ei

dyfarnu y prynhawn yma.

The Conservatives do not want the Assembly to work and they do not want the nation to be proud of itself. That is their standpoint. However, at least their stance is clear. I do not propose to say anything about the Cabinet's proposals. There is nothing worth saying on that.

**John Griffiths:** There is one good thing about the layout of this Chamber: thankfully, because I sit behind a pillar, I often cannot see the Conservative Members. Listening to their pathetic performance today, personified by Glyn Davies's rant, makes me certain that that is the best part of this Chamber. I am screened from having to look at them and am often unable to hear them. That is a wonderful aspect of this Chamber.

However, I concede all the points made about the inadequacies of this Chamber. It is not what Wales needs to symbolise what the Assembly means to the people of Wales and the new politics in Wales. I understand those who argue that what we achieve means far more than what a building can present. However, symbolism is important. Traditionally, Wales has lacked confidence for many historical reasons. The new building is about promoting a new Wales. It is symbolically important. It flags up to the world that there is a new Wales, a new political settlement in Wales and a new self-confidence in Wales. I notice that constantly when I travel across Wales and speak to people in my constituency. There is a new sense of optimism, symbolised by the new political settlement in Wales. We badly need a new building to symbolise that and to take things forward to show the world that Wales is serious about its new democracy. I make no apologies for thinking that symbolism is important.

Many of these arguments were rehearsed the first time around and I, along with other Members, made many of these points.

Nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr am i'r Cynulliad weithio ac nid ydynt am i'r genedl fod yn falch ohoni ei hun. Dyna eu safbwynt hwy. Fodd bynnag, o leiaf mae eu safiad yn glir. Nid wyf yn bwriadu dweud unrhyw beth am gynigion y Cabinet. Nid oes dim gwerth ei ddweud am hynny.

**John Griffiths:** Mae un peth da ynglyn â cynllun y Siambr hon: diolch byth, am fy mod yn eistedd y tu ôl i golofn, ni allaf weld yr Aelodau Ceidwadol yn aml. Mae gwranddo ar eu perfformiad truenus heddiw, a nodweddiwyd gan refru Glyn Davies, yn fy ngwneud yn siwr mai dyna'r peth gorau am y Siambr hon. Mae gennyf sgrîn rhag gorfod edrych arnynt ac yn aml ni allaf eu clywed. Mae hynny'n nodwedd ragorol ar y Siambr hon.

Fodd bynnag, cytunaf â'r holl bwyntiau a wnaethpwyd ynglyn ag annigonolrwydd y Siambr hon. Nid dyma'r hyn sydd ei angen ar Gymru fel symbol o'r hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei olygu i bobl Cymru a'r wleidyddiaeth newydd yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn deall y rheini sydd yn dadlau bod yr hyn a gyflawnwn yn golygu llawer mwy na'r hyn y gall adeilad ei gyfleu. Fodd bynnag, mae symbolaeth yn bwysig. Yn draddodiadol, bu gan Gymru ddiffyg hyder am lu o resymau hanesyddol. Hyrwyddo Cymru newydd yw hanfod yr adeilad newydd. Mae'n bwysig o ran symboliaeth. Mae'n datgan i'r byd fod Cymru newydd, cyfundrefn wleidyddol newydd yng Nghymru a hunanhyder newydd yng Nghymru. Sylwaf ar hynny'n barhaus wrth deithio ar draws Cymru a siarad â phobl yn fy etholaeth. Mae teimlad newydd o optimistiaeth, wedi'i symboleiddio gan y gyfundrefn wleidyddol newydd yng Nghymru. Mae mawr angen adeilad newydd arnom yn symbol o hynny ac i symud pethau ymlaen i ddangos i'r byd fod Cymru o ddifrif am ei democratiaeth newydd. Nid ymddiheuraf am feddwl bod symbolaeth yn bwysig.

Aethpwyd dros lawer o'r dadleuon hyn ar y cynnig cyntaf, a gwneuthum i, a llawer o Aelodau eraill, lawer o'r pwyntiau hyn. Nid

Nothing has changed. It was right to have a fresh look at things and that Rhodri sought to satisfy himself of the figures. I fully respect that. It was necessary. We have all taken the opportunity to have a fresh look at issues. I am happy that everything I said the first time around remains true. It is still as important now as it was then. I will be voting accordingly.

**The Finance Secretary (Edwina Hart):** I take the opportunity to place on record my thanks to the Deputy Presiding Officer for the way in which the debate has been conducted. It has, in the main, been a well-reasoned and dignified debate. I turn to the non-dignified aspects of the debate. Glyn Davies's contribution had no substance and was naked political opportunism at its worst. The tones of his remarks were unworthy of this Chamber. The Cabinet is not a disgrace to democracy. Democracy is about taking responsibility, something Glyn and his party have never done. You cavalierly disregard and disown your 18 years of administration when it suits you. Your leader, Nick Bourne's, personal attack on the First Secretary was particularly unworthy. The Cardiff City Hall costs are in the public domain. A Commons answer by the then Secretary of State for Wales, Ron Davies, on Friday 28 November 1997, to a question by Rhodri Morgan indicated all the costs of the City Hall. Those are on record in Hansard.

**Alun Cairns** *rose—*

**Edwina Hart:** I will not give way. I have five minutes like you and I want to use them more profitably than you did. I turn to some of the other comments raised in the debate. I understand where some of the comments are coming from and I understand some of the issues raised. I accept that they were made in the best possible spirit. However, I contend, on behalf of the administration, that the issues that you need to consider are the justification and need for an additional building, whether that need is accepted by all and ensuring that we meet that need in the most cost-effective way. Like the majority of

oes unrhyw beth wedi'i newid. Yr oedd yn briodol edrych o'r newydd ar bethau a bod Rhodri am fodloni ei hun ynglyn â'r ffigurau. Parchaf hynny yn llwyr. Yr oedd yn angenrheidiol. Yr ydym oll wedi achub ar y cyfle i edrych o'r newydd ar yr ystyriaethau. Yr wyf yn falch bod popeth a ddywedais y tro cyntaf yn dal yn wir. Mae'n dal yr un mor bwysig yn awr ag yr oedd bryd hynny. Byddaf yn pleidleisio yn unol â hynny.

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle i gofnodi fy niolch i'r Dirprwy Lywydd am y ffordd y mae'r ddadl wedi ei chynnal. Ar y cyfan, bu'n ddadl resymegol ac urddasol. Trof at agweddau diurddas y ddadl. Nid oedd sylwedd i gyfraniad Glyn Davies a dyna oportiwnistiaeth wleidyddol bur ar ei gwaethaf. Nid oedd tôn ei sylwadau yn deilwng o'r Siambr hon. Nid yw'r Cabinet yn warth ar ddemocratiaeth. Mae democratiaeth yn golygu cymryd cyfrifoldeb, rhywbeth nad yw Glyn a'i blaid erioed wedi ei wneud. Yr ydych yn diystyru a gwadu 18 mlynedd eich gweinyddiaeth yn hwylus pan fo hynny o fudd ichi. Yr oedd ymosodiad personol eich arweinydd, Nick Bourne, ar y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn neilltuol o annheilwng. Mae costau Neuadd y Ddinas, Caerdydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Nododd ateb yn Nhy'r Cyffredin gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, Ron Davies, ddydd Gwener 28 Tachwedd 1997, i gwestiwn gan Rhodri Morgan holl gostau Neuadd y Ddinas. Mae'r rheini wedi eu cofnodi yn Hansard.

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd—*

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf am ildio. Mae gennyf bum munud fel chithau ac yr wyf am eu defnyddio'n fwy buddiol nag a wnaethoch chi. Trof at rai o'r sylwadau eraill a godwyd yn y ddadl. Deallaf o ble y mae rhai o'r sylwadau'n dod a deallaf rai o'r ystyriaethau a godwyd. Yr wyf yn derbyn iddynt gael eu gwneud yn yr ysbryd gorau posibl. Fodd bynnag, dadleuaf, ar ran y weinyddiaeth, mai'r materion y mae angen i chi eu hystyried yw'r cyfiawnhad a'r angen am adeilad ychwanegol, pa un a yw pawb yn derbyn yr angen hwnnw a sicrhau ein bod yn diwallu'r angen yn y ffordd fwyaf cost

Members, I share the view that the current Chamber, committee rooms and facilities for the public are not good enough. There are serious limitations to the facilities for the general public and we are not well placed to engage them fully in the democratic process, which is essential if we are genuinely committed to dealing with the democratic deficit for which the Assembly was established. With this in mind and accepting that we must do something, the Cabinet has sought to provide the Assembly with a less costly alternative of building a Chamber in the car park at the rear of the building. That meets the criteria of operational needs and is acceptable in cash-cost terms.

Much has been said about whether it was right to re-open discussions on the new Chamber. I believe that it was and I am pleased that others have indicated that they thought that Rhodri was right to examine the costs. It is important that all decisions are made on the basis of clear financial information. We now have cost options that we can review. It is always a brave person who says 'stop, we should look and evaluate any plan properly'. The First Secretary is to be commended for ensuring that all viable issues are discussed. Whatever the outcome of today's debate, the Cabinet, and myself as Finance Secretary, will ensure that any building project will keep to the agreed contract in terms of building requirements and costs. It is not easy to take difficult decisions. It is even harder some days to defend them. However, the Cabinet is right to lay before you the car park option. It would be wrong of us as an Executive if we had found a more cost-effective option and we were not prepared to have a discussion on that information in the Chamber. I urge Members to carefully consider the options. The Cabinet's recommendation is before you. We agreed to make the recommendation after lengthy discussion and debate among ourselves and I ask you to support it. I trust that my remarks in my right of reply will be taken in the genuine spirit that I have made them.

effeithiol. Fel mwyafrif yr Aelodau, rhannaf y farn nad yw'r Siambr bresennol, yr ystafelloedd pwyllgora na'r cyfleusterau ar gyfer y cyhoedd yn ddigon da. Mae cyfyngiadau difrifol i'r cyfleusterau ar gyfer y cyhoedd ac nid ydym mewn sefyllfa dda i'w cynnwys yn llawn yn y broses ddemocrataidd, sydd yn hanfodol os ydym yn ymrwymo o ddifrif i ddelio â'r diffyg democrataidd y sefydlwyd y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael ag ef. Gyda hynny mewn cof a chan dderbyn bod yn rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth, ceisiodd y Cabinet ddarparu opsiwn rhatach o godi Siambr yn y maes parcio yng nghefn yr adeilad. Mae hynny'n bodloni'r meini prawf o ran anghenion gweithredol ac mae'n dderbyniol yn nhermau'r gost mewn arian.

Dywedwyd llawer ynglyn â phriodoldeb ailagor y trafodaethau am y Siambr newydd. Credaf fod hynny'n briodol ac yr wyf yn falch i eraill nodi eu bod o'r farn bod Rhodri yn iawn i archwilio'r costau. Mae'n bwysig bod pob penderfyniad yn cael ei wneud ar sail gwybodaeth ariannol glir. Bellach mae gennym opsiynau cost y gallwn eu hadolygu. Person dewr bob amser sydd yn dweud, 'stopiwch, dylem edrych a chloriannu unrhyw gynllun yn briodol'. Mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i'w ganmol am sicrhau bod pob mater dichonadwy yn cael ei drafod. Beth bynnag fydd canlyniad y ddadl heddiw, bydd y Cabinet, a minnau fel Ysgrifennydd Cyllid, yn sicrhau bod unrhyw brosiect adeiladu yn cadw at y contract y cytunir arno yn nhermau gofynion adeiladu a chostau. Nid yw'n hawdd gwneud penderfyniadau anodd. Mae hyd yn oed yn anos rai diwrnodau i'w hamddiffyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Cabinet yn iawn i gyflwyno opsiwn y maes parcio ger eich bron. Byddem yn methu fel Gweithrediaeth pe baem wedi canfod opsiwn mwy cost-effeithiol ac nad oeddem yn barod i gael trafodaeth ar yr wybodaeth honno yn y Siambr. Anogaf yr Aelodau i ystyried yr opsiynau'n ofalus. Mae argymhelliad y Cabinet o'ch blaenau. Cytunasom i wneud yr argymhelliad ar ôl trafodaeth a dadl faith ymysg ein gilydd a gofynnaf ichi ei gefnogi. Hyderaf y bydd fy sylwadau yn fy hawl i ymateb yn cael eu derbyn yn yr ysbryd diffuant y gwneuthum hwy ynddo.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 49.  
Amendment 2: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 49.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Amendment rejected*

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

4:52 p.m.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22.  
Amendment 3: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 22.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

*the Assembly, having considered the work undertaken by officials and encapsulated in the document entitled 'National Assembly for Wales New Building Project Information' laid in the Table Office on 14 June resolves to continue to proceed with Option B as described in that document.*

The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Essex, Sue  
 Graham, William  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*fod y Cynulliad, ar ôl ystyried y gwaith a wnaed gan swyddogion ac a ddisgrifir yn y ddogfen 'Gwybodaeth am Broject Adeilad Newydd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mehefin, yn penderfynu parhau i symud ymlaen â Dewis B fel y'i disgrifir yn y ddogfen honno.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.*

*Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William

Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

Law, Peter  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

*Amended motion adopted.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** As Kirsty Williams's voting panel failed on the final vote, I ask her to confirm her vote verbally.

**Kirsty Williams:** I confirm that I voted for.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The resolution's effect is that the Assembly has reaffirmed its decision of 26 January. I thank Members for their brevity in this debate ahead of the stop-clocks being introduced in the Chamber.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gan i banel pleidleisio Kirsty Williams fethu ar y bleidlais olaf, gofynnaf iddi gadarnhau ei phleidlais ar lafar.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cadarnhaf imi bleidleisio o blaid.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Effaith y penderfyniad yw bod y Cynulliad wedi ailgadarnhau ei benderfyniad ar 26 Ionawr. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am fod yn fyr yn y ddadl hon cyn i'r stopglociau gael eu cyflwyno yn y Siambr.

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Adeiladu Argaeau a Chymunedau Lleol Dam Building and Local Communities

**Janet Davies:** I did not realise that speaking on dam building would follow straight after other people speaking on the damn building. Dam building is an important issue not only in Wales but also throughout the world. Dams provide the infrastructure for water storage and for energy production. They are essential to give a decent standard of life, and as far as water is concerned, essential for life itself. They can be splendid civil engineering projects—a matter of pride for their builders and funders.

However, the effects on local communities may be less beneficial. Unlike the building for the Government of Wales, for which we have just voted, these dams can tear communities apart rather than bring them together. In Wales, we have a long experience of the effects of dam building—the flooding of Cwm Tryweryn in the 1960s, with pictures of people having to leave their homes, was an event that changed our politics. It is a legend. The perceived threats to the language and culture of that area have reverberated down the years, right down to this Assembly. That flooding brought people out fighting to save their homes and their way of life in other threatened areas—in the Senni Valley in Breconshire and at Cwm Nant yr Eira in Montgomeryshire. Those people stopped the flooding of their valleys and killed those developments.

At present in Wales the greatest threat to a community is not from new dam building, but from a lack of maintenance. In the region that I represent—South Wales West—a dam in Cwm Clydach, which was built in 1829 to serve a mill, is now giving rise to major concerns about its safety. The question of responsibility for repair is bouncing around in various quarters, and I make a plea to the Assembly to sort this out. It is likely that safety is compromised for the village of

**Janet Davies:** Ni sylweddolais y byddai'r ddadl ar adeiladu 'dam' yn dilyn yn syth ar ôl dadl y *damn* adeilad. Mae adeiladu argaeau yn fater pwysig nid yn unig yng Nghymru ond drwy'r byd. Mae argaeau'n darparu'r seilwaith ar gyfer storio dwr a chynhyrchu ynni. Maent yn hanfodol i roi safon byw resymol a, chyn belled ag y mae dwr yn y cwestiwn, mae'n hanfodol i fywyd ei hun. Gallant fod yn brosiectau peirianeg sifil gogoneddus—yn ennyn balchder yn eu hadeiladwyr a'u cyllidwyr.

Fodd bynnag, gall yr effeithiau ar gymunedau lleol fod yn llai llesol. Yn wahanol i'r adeilad ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru, yr ydym newydd bleidleisio arno, gall yr argaeau hyn rwygo cymunedau yn hytrach na dod â hwy at ei gilydd. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym brofiad hir o effeithiau codi argaeau—yr oedd boddi Cwm Tryweryn yn y 1960au, gyda lluniau o bobl yn gorfod gadael eu cartrefi, yn ddigwyddiad a newidiodd ein gwleidyddiaeth. Mae'n chwedl. Mae'r bygythiadau cydnabyddedig i iaith a diwylliant yr ardal honno wedi dadseinio dros y blynyddoedd, hyd at y Cynulliad hwn. Daeth y boddi hwnnw â phobl allan yn ymladd i achub eu cartrefi a'u ffordd o fyw mewn ardaloedd eraill a oedd o dan fygythiad—yng Nghwm Senni yn Sir Frycheiniog a Chwm Nant yr Eira yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Ataliodd y bobl hynny eu cymoedd rhag cael eu boddi a lladdasant y datblygiadau hynny.

Ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru daw'r bygythiad mwyaf i gymuned nid o adeiladu argaeau newydd ond o ddiffyg cynnal a chadw. Yn y rhanbarth a gynrychiolaf i—Gorllewin De Cymru—mae argae yng Nghwm Clydach, a godwyd yn 1829 i wasanaethu melin, yn awr yn peri pryder mawr ynghylch ei ddiogelwch. Mae'r cwestiwn o gyfrifoldeb am atgyweirio yn sbuncio'n ôl ac ymlaen mewn amryw fannau, a hoffwn apelio i'r Cynulliad ddatrys hyn. Mae'n debygol bod diogelwch pentref



Neath Abbey. It is more important that that is resolved than continuing to pass the buck. The argument of responsibility is based on the capacity of the dam—but if that dam goes, some people will not be looking too comfortable—and I am not talking about the local residents.

As I have already said, water and energy are vital to communities. The principle of their provision should be for the benefit of the greatest possible number, and the disbenefit of the fewest possible. The numbers of people affected should not be the only factor taken into consideration, but also the degree to which they are affected and what can be lost with the erection of a dam and the flooding of a valley. This is a principle that involves human rights, which has global application.

With the privatisation of the water industry in England and Wales—and how lucky Scotland was to get away with that one—concerns have been raised from time to time about future attempts to flood more Welsh valleys. However, with the great uncertainty lying over Welsh Water and its future ownership, we cannot tell whether this is a matter for concern or not at present. Perhaps many of us find the ideas of mutualisation currently floating around Yorkshire the most acceptable form of ownership. Building dams—not for the benefit of local communities, but for the pride or the profit of the few—could well appeal to some in this Chamber. I can see their eyes lighting up at the thought, but I think that most of us are more concerned about people in their communities.

However, we should not only be concerned about people in Welsh communities, but about people in communities who we do not know personally. The people of Wales have historically shown international solidarity and caring. One of the reasons that I worked for a Welsh parliament was for Wales to have a direct role in working for peace and international harmony directly through its own government body. Of course, it was too

Mynachlog Nedd yn y fantol. Mae'n bwysicach fod hynny'n cael ei ddatrys na pharhau i gyfnewid y cyfrifoldeb. Seilir y ddadl am gyfrifoldeb ar gynhwysedd yr argae—ond os chwala'r argae, bydd rhai pobl yn edrych yn ddigon anghyfforddus—ac nid sôn yr wyf am y trigolion lleol.

Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae dwr ac ynni yn hanfodol i gymunedau. Dylai egwyddor eu darparu fod er mantais i'r nifer mwyaf posibl, ac anfantais i'r lleiaf posibl. Nid y nifer o bobl yr effeithir arnynt yw'r unig ffactor y dylid ei gymryd i ystyriaeth, ond hefyd i ba raddau yr effeithir arnynt a beth y gellir ei golli wrth adeiladu argae a boddi cwm. Mae'r egwyddor hon yn ymwneud â iawnderau dynol, sydd yn berthnasol ledled y byd.

Yn sgîl preifateiddio'r diwydiant dwr yng Nghymru a Lloegr—ac o mor lwcus yr oedd yr Alban i gael ymwared rhag hynny—codwyd pryderon o bryd i'w gilydd ynglyn ag ymdrechion yn y dyfodol i fodd mwy o gymoedd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gyda'r ansicrwydd mawr sydd yn wynebu Dwr Cymru a'i berchnogaeth i'r dyfodol, ni allwn ddweud a yw hyn yn rhywbeth i boeni yn ei gyloch ai peidio ar hyn o bryd. Efallai fod llawer ohonom yn teimlo mai'r syniadau ynglyn â chydberchnogaeth sydd yn y gwynt yn Swydd Efrog ar hyn o bryd yw'r math mwyaf derbyniol o berchnogaeth. Mae'n bosibl iawn y byddai adeiladu argaeau—nid er budd cymunedau lleol, ond er mwyn balchder neu elw i'r ychydig—yn apelio i rai yn y Siambr hon. Gwelaf eu llygaid yn gloywi wrth feddwl am y peth, ond tybiaf fod y rhan fwyaf ohonom yn poeni mwy am bobl yn eu cymunedau.

Fodd bynnag, nid am bobl yng nghymunedau Cymru yn unig y dylem boeni, ond am bobl mewn cymunedau nad ydym yn eu hadnabod yn bersonol. Yn hanesyddol mae pobl Cymru wedi dangos cydgefnoeth a chydymdeimlad rhyngwladol. Un o'r rhesymau i mi weithio dros senedd i Gymru oedd er mwyn i Gymru gael rôl uniongyrchol yn gweithio dros heddwch a chytgord rhyngwladol yn uniongyrchol drwy ei chorff

much to hope that such a role would be given to our Welsh government initially, but I hope that one day our formal powers will extend that far. In the meantime, as a country that knows only too well the effects of oppression in general and of dam building in particular, we should show moral support, and lobby for other people who are threatened—people in India, for example, who are fighting dam building.

Some of you will have been at the presentation here on the proposed Ilisu dam on the Tigris river in Kurdistan, given by the Welsh-Kurdish network. The Turkish Government is planning to build a dam at Ilisu that will force the involuntary resettlement of 25,000 people and will affect 11,000 more adversely. This is a massive number of people to be affected, but before we jump to their support we need to ask some questions. Is there an alternative for the supply of water and for the production of energy? Will the dam achieve greater benefit than loss? Would resettlement be fully funded and steps taken to ensure that the Kurdish culture in the area is not only safeguarded but strengthened? Will people's livelihoods be safe? Will any heritage be destroyed? What is happening to the local wildlife? The answers that I have found are not encouraging.

5:02 p.m.

First, as part of a large complex of dams, this particular one is not intended to supply water, only to produce energy. It will not have any effects on irrigating land or on producing water for drinking or other uses. As far as water is concerned, its construction is entirely negative. Downstream seasonal floods are needed to maintain ecosystems and agriculture. These floods will be lost with the inevitable effects on agriculture and existing flora and fauna. The purpose of the dam is the production of energy, yet Turkey is blessed with a great deal of sunshine—enough to provide its present energy needs 11,000 times over. Turkey also appears to be wasteful in the way that it uses energy, although I am wary of being critical, because

llywodraethol ei hun. Wrth gwrs, yr oedd yn ormod i obeithio y câi rôl felly ei rhoi i lywodraeth Cymru ar y dechrau, ond gobeithiaf ryw ddydd y bydd ein pwerau ffurfiol yn ymestyn cyn belled â hynny. Yn y cyfamser, fel gwlad nad yw ond yn rhy gyfarwydd ag effeithiau gorthrwm yn gyffredinol a chodi argaeau yn arbennig, dylem ddangos mwy o gefnogaeth foesol, a lobio dros bobl sydd dan fygythiad—pobl yn India, er enghraifft, sydd yn ymladd yn erbyn adeiladu argaeau.

Bydd rhai ohonoch wedi bod yn bresennol yn y cyflwyniad yma ar argae arfaethedig Ilisu ar afon Tigris yng Nghwrdistan, a roddwyd gan rwydwaith Cymru-Cwrdistan. Mae Llywodraeth Twrci yn bwriadu adeiladu argae yn Ilisu a fydd yn gorfodi 25,000 o bobl i gael eu hail-leoli yn groes i'w hewyllys ac yn effeithio'n andwyol ar 11,000 arall. Mae hynny'n nifer enfawr o bobl yr effeithir arnynt, ond cyn inni neidio i'w cefnogi mae angen inni ofyn rhai cwestiynau. A oes opsiwn amgen i gyflenwi dwr a chynhyrchu ynni? A fydd yr argae yn peri mwy o fudd nag o golled? A gâi'r ail-leoli ei gyllido'n llawn gan gymryd camau i sicrhau bod y diwylliant Cwrdaidd yn yr ardal nid yn unig yn cael ei ddiogelu ond ei gryfhau? A fydd bywoliaeth pobl yn saff? A gaiff unrhyw etifeddiaeth ei dinistrio? Beth sydd yn digwydd i fywyd gwyllt yn lleol? Nid yw'r atebion a gefais yn galonogol.

Yn gyntaf, fel rhan o gyfres fawr o argaeau, nid yw'r un penodol hwn wedi'i fwriadu i gyflenwi dwr, dim ond i gynhyrchu ynni. Ni chaiff unrhyw effaith ar ddyfrio tir nac ar gyflenwi dwr i'w yfed ac at ddibenion eraill. Cyn belled ag y mae dwr yn bod, mae'r adeiladu yn gwbl negyddol. Mae angen llifogydd tymhorol yn is i lawr yr afon i gynnal ecosystemau ac amaethyddiaeth. Collir y llifogydd hyn gyda'r effeithiau anochel ar amaethyddiaeth a'r planhigion a'r ffawna presennol. Diben yr argae yw cynhyrchu trydan, ond mae Twrci wedi'i bendithio â llawer iawn o heulwen—digon i gyflenwi ei hanghenion ynni ar hyn o bryd 11,000 gwaith drosodd. Mae'n ymddangos hefyd fod Twrci yn wastraffus yn y ffordd y

we in Wales need to get our own act together before we can criticise others for energy wasting. At the end of the day, however, it does not need this dam for its own energy.

If we look further, there are no signs that international standards on involuntary resettlement will be met. So far, there has been minimal consultation with the people affected. Arbitrary arrests and abuses of human rights in the area give rise to fears that this is part of ethnic cleansing, and such fears cannot be rejected as unrealistic in view of the Kurdish nation's history. The dam will flood the town of Hasankeyf. This has been described as 'the historical jewel in the crown of Kurdish culture.'

Its archaeological remains date back 10,000 years, and they will be lost. Environmentally, it has been agreed that waterborne diseases, such as malaria, will appear for the first time in the area. Taken with other dams in the area, the Turkish Government will have the capacity to control 50 per cent of the downstream river flow to Syria and Iraq. The lack of stability in the Middle East means that this must be of global concern. Creating conditions for a future war over water is the last thing that is needed. As far as wildlife is concerned, I can find no reference to measures for its protection. The answers to all my questions, therefore, have been negative—far more so than I originally expected.

All these points move me towards supporting the Kurdish campaign against the dam. Global warming and climate change are now acknowledged to be serious and real. They will affect the water supply in regions differently, in ways that we do not yet understand. Communities and nations not now threatened may well be so in the future. A need for water could be the basis for future wars. Making massive changes in the supply of water to a large region is the last thing that we should support. Civilised nations should be offering a helping hand in these circumstances, but are we doing so in this

mae'n defnyddio ynni, er fy mod yn ofalus rhag beirniadu, oherwydd mae angen i ni yng Nghymru roi trefn ar bethau yma cyn y gallwn feirniadu eraill am wastraffu ynni. Yn y pen draw, fodd bynnag, nid oes angen yr argae hwn arni at ei hanghenion ynni ei hun.

Os edrychwn ymhellach, nid oes unrhyw arwyddion y caiff safonau rhyngwladol ar ail-leoli anwirfoddol eu cyflawni. Hyd yma, ni chafwyd ond yr ymgynghori lleiaf â'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt. Mae arestio mympwyol a thorri iawnderau dynol yn yr ardal yn peri ofnau mai rhan o lanhau ethnig yw hyn, ac ni ellir gwrthod ofnau o'r fath fel rhywbeth afrealistig o gofio hanes y genedl Gwrdaidd. Bydd yr argae yn boddi tref Hasankeyf. Disgrifiwyd hon fel yr 'em hanesyddol yng nghoron y diwylliant Cwrdaidd'.

Mae ei holion archeolegol yn dyddio'n ôl 10,000 o flynyddoedd, a chânt eu colli. Yn amgylcheddol, cytunwyd y bydd clefydau a gludir gan ddwr, megis malaria, yn ymddangos yn yr ardal am y tro cyntaf. O'i ystyried ynghyd â'r argaeau eraill yn yr ardal, bydd Llywodraeth Twrci yn gallu rheoli 50 y cant o'r llif yn is i lawr yr afon i Syria ac Irac. Mae'r diffyg sefydlogrwydd yn y Dwyrain Canol yn golygu bod hyn o reidrwydd yn peri pryder drwy'r byd. Creu'r amodau ar gyfer rhyfel dros ddwr yn y dyfodol yw'r peth olaf sydd ei angen. Cyn belled ag y mae bywyd gwyllt yn y cwestiwn, ni allaf ganfod unrhyw gyfeiriad at fesurau i'w amddiffyn. Negyddol, felly, fu'r atebion i'm holl gwestiynau—yn llawer mwy felly nag a ddisgwyliwn yn wreiddiol.

Mae'r holl bwyntiau hyn yn fy nhywys tuag at gefnogi'r ymgyrch Gwrdaidd yn erbyn yr argae. Erbyn hyn cydnabyddir bod cynhesu byd-eang a newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ddifrifol a real. Byddant yn effeithio ar y cyflenwad dwr mewn rhanbarthau yn wahanol, mewn ffyrdd nad ydym yn eu deall eto. Mae'n bosibl iawn y bydd cymunedau a chenhedloedd nad ydynt dan fygythiad yn awr dan fygythiad yn y dyfodol. Gallai angen am ddwr fod yn sail i ryfeloedd y dyfodol. Gwneud newidiadau enfawr i'r cyflenwad dwr i ranbarth mawr yw'r peth olaf y dylem ei gefnogi. Dylai cenhedloedd gwâr fod yn

country?

The Ilisu dam will not provide water to improve agricultural production, nor energy for machinery that could not be produced far less harmfully. It will not improve the economic base of local agriculture. It will not enable the people who live in those local communities to produce surplus foods to sell. Even if they were to succeed in doing this, the protectionism of the developed countries and our barriers to free trade would probably make it impossible for them to do so. Our record of giving a fair deal to less developed countries is not good. Rather than work with the World Trade Organisation to help less developed countries to get on their economic feet we are doing the opposite.

Why then is the UK Government guaranteeing £200 million for this project through the UK Export Credits Guarantee Department? We have heard a lot about money and what things cost this afternoon. However, £200 million of our money will go to destroy Kurdish communities and heritage and threaten the countries downstream.

We all remember the selling of arms to Iraq, because the UK Government feared Iran. We know where that led. Do we want the UK Government to keep interfering? The least it should do is to keep away from such controversial projects so as to prevent the repetition of past mistakes. I would like this Assembly to lobby the UK Government on its actions, to ask it to consider whether they are wise and to draw back on its commitment to the dam on the Tigris.

Solidarity means understanding ordinary people and their needs and helping them. It is too easy to go along with the strong. We hear about champions for groups in this Assembly. I often think that that is not a sensible use of the word. However, perhaps this Assembly could be a champion of the

cynnig cymorth o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, ond a ydym ni'n gwneud hynny yn y wlad hon?

Ni fydd argae Ilisu yn darparu dwr i wella cynhyrchiad amaethyddol, nac ynni ar gyfer peiriannau na ellid ei gynhyrchu yn llawer llai niweidiol. Ni fydd yn gwella sylfaen economaidd amaethyddiaeth leol. Ni fydd yn galluogi'r bobl sydd yn byw yn y cymunedau lleol hynny i gynhyrchu bwyd dros ben i'w werthu. Hyd yn oed pe baent yn llwyddo i wneud hynny, mae'n debyg y byddai diffyndollaeth y gwledydd datblygedig a'n rhwystrau i atal masnachu rhydd yn ei gwneud yn amhosibl iddynt wneud hynny. Nid yw ein record o roi bargaen deg i wledydd llai datblygedig yn dda. Yn hytrach na gweithio gyda Chorff Masnachu'r Byd i helpu gwledydd llai datblygedig i gael eu traed oddi tanynt yn economaidd yr ydym yn gwneud y gwrthwyneb.

Pam felly y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gwarantu £200 miliwn i'r prosiect hwn drwy Adran Warantu Credydau Allforio'r DU? Clywsom lawer am arian a'r hyn y mae pethau'n ei gostio y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, bydd £200 miliwn o'n harian ni yn mynd i ddinistrio cymunedau ac etifeddiaeth Gwrdaidd a bygwth y gwledydd yn is i lawr yr afon.

Mae pawb ohonom yn cofio am y gwerthu arfau i Irac, am fod Llywodraeth y DU yn ofni Iran. Gwyddom at beth yr arweiniodd hynny. A ydym am i Lywodraeth y DU ddal i ymyrryd? Y peth lleiaf y dylai ei wneud yw cadw draw oddi wrth brosiectau mor ddadleuol fel nad ailadroddir camgymeriadau'r gorffennol. Hoffwn i'r Cynulliad hwn lobio Llywodraeth y DU ar ei gweithredoedd, gofyn iddi ystyried a ydynt yn ddoeth ac iddi dynnu ei hymrwymiad i'r argae ar afon Tigris yn ôl.

Mae cydgefngogaeth yn golygu deall pobl gyffredin a'u hanghenion a'u helpu. Mae'n rhy hawdd cyd-fynd â'r sawl sydd yn gryf. Clywn am y rhai sydd yn pleidio achos grwpiau yn y Cynulliad hwn. Meddyliaf yn aml nad yw sôn am 'champion' yn ddefnydd synhwyrol o'r gair yn Saesneg. Fodd bynnag,

suffering people of the world, rather than fund their oppressors.

I have allowed enough time for Christine Humphreys and David Davies to speak.

**Christine Humphreys:** Diolchaf i Janet am godi'r mater hwn. Mae achos argae Ilisu yn un truenus dros ben, ac fel y dywedodd Janet yn gynharach, mae adleisiau cryf i ni yng Nghymru o fodd Cwm Elan ar ddechrau'r ganrif ddiwethaf a Chwm Tryweryn yn y 1950au.

Bydd argae Ilisu yn gyrru 25,000 o bobl o'u cartrefi a bydd 11,000 arall yn colli tir. Ni chredaf fod Janet wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith y bydd y cynllun hwn hefyd yn atal 50 y cant o lif yr afon Tigris i mewn i Syria ac Irac. Mae hynny'n sicr o gynyddu tyndra rhwng y gwledydd â Thwrci ynglyn â hawliau dwr. Un pwynt sydd yn fy mhoeni, fel y mae'n poeni Janet, yr wyf yn sicr, yw'r ffaith fod cwmni o Brydain ymhlith yr is-gontactwyr ar gynllun yr argae. Drwy'r Adran Warantu Credydau Allforio, mae Llywodraeth Prydain yn cynnal gwaith y cwmni hwn ar yr argae gyda £12, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, £200 miliwn o arian trethdalwyr Prydain—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, yr wyf yn cael trafferth gyda ffigurau yn Gymraeg.

Mae'n rhaid inni bwyso ar Lywodraeth Prydain i beidio â gwastraffu ein harian ar gefnogi'r prosiect anfoesol hwn. Diolchaf eto i Janet am godi'r mater ac am fy atgoffa am ddatganiad barn gan Cynog Dafis, Ron Davies, Glyn Davies a Mike German, sydd yn galw ar Lywodraeth Prydain i wrthod hybu'r cynllun. Byddaf yn sicr o arwyddo'r datganiad barn ar ôl y cyfarfod hwn a gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau eraill nad ydynt wedi'i arwyddo yn gwneud hynny hefyd.

**David Davies:** I also thank Janet for a fascinating speech. It was an interesting and wide-ranging speech on dams, beginning with a problem in her constituency. I have been confronted with what sounds to me to be a similar problem in an area adjacent to my constituency, involving people who live

efallai y gall y Cynulliad hwn bleidio achos y rhai sydd yn dioddef yn y byd, yn hytrach na noddi eu gorthrymwyr.

Yr wyf wedi caniatáu digon o amser i Christine Humphreys a David Davies siarad.

**Christine Humphreys:** I thank Janet for raising this matter. The case of Ilisu dam is a very sad one, and as Janet said earlier, there are strong echoes for us in Wales of the drowning of the Elan Valley at the beginning of the last century and of Tryweryn Valley in the 1950s.

The Ilisu dam will drive 25,000 people from their homes and 11,000 others will lose land. I do not think that Janet referred to the fact that this scheme will also prevent 50 per cent of the river Tigris's flow into Syria and Iraq. That is sure to increase tension between the countries and Turkey on water rights. One point that concerns me, as it does Janet, I am sure, is the fact that among the subcontractors on the dam scheme is a company from Britain. Through the Export Credit Guarantee Department, the British Government is supporting this company's work on the dam with £12, sorry, £200 million of British taxpayers money—sorry, I have difficulty with figures in Welsh.

We must put pressure on the British Government not to waste our money on supporting this immoral project. I thank Janet again for raising this matter and for reminding me about the statement of opinion by Cynog Dafis, Ron Davies, Glyn Davies and Mike German, which calls on the British Government to refuse to promote the scheme. I will be sure to sign the statement of opinion after this meeting and I hope that other Members who have not signed it will do so also.

**David Davies:** Diolchaf innau hefyd i Janet am araith gyfareddol. Yr oedd yn araith ddiddorol ac eang ei chwmpas ar argaeau, gan ddechrau gyda phroblem yn ei hetholaeth. Fe'm wynebwyd gan yr hyn sydd yn swnio'n imi fel problem gyffelyb mewn ardal gerllaw fy etholaeth i, yn cynnwys pobl

in my constituency. Having done a little research on this, I point out that there is a body officially responsible for the maintenance of dams, whether in public or private control. It has the power to impose the obligation to undertake maintenance work on the owners of dams if there is a question about their safety. Such an issue arises in the Croesyceiliog area of Torfaen and I am taking a close interest in it.

Janet then went on to the history of the Tryweryn dam. That happened a long time ago—certainly before I was born. [*Laughter.*] Sorry, it is not that long ago for those who were born then.

My only comment on that, and it is a serious one, is that maybe it was a bad planning decision, but ultimately it was a planning decision. It saddens me that it has been politicised to such an extent. We often hear about how the English have come here and taken our water, and I do not accept that argument. We all benefited from it, except for the people who lost their land. I do not like to see it become an English-Welsh matter. It is a dangerous argument. It was a planning decision: I do not feel qualified to comment on whether it was good or bad.

5:12 p.m.

The third and final part of Janet's dissertation was on the building of dams around the world. She mentioned India and Kurdistan. We must be careful here because it is possible that we are merely seeing one side of the argument. I am not suggesting that you are wrong, Janet, but we need to look closely at all sides of the argument before signing up to statements of opinion. It concerns me that we are coming down against these projects because often the people who benefit from the construction of these projects are the men, women and children of the dammed area. We must bear that in mind.

**The Secretary for the Environment, Planning and Transport (Sue Essex):** Thank you, Janet; you used a very ingenious

sydd yn byw yn fy etholaeth i. Wedi gwneud ychydig o ymchwil ar hyn, hoffwn ddweud bod corff sydd yn gyfrifol yn swyddogol am gynnal a chadw argaeau, boed y rheini o dan reolaeth gyhoeddus neu breifat. Mae ganddo'r grym i roi gorfodaeth ar berchnogion argaeau i ymgymryd â gwaith cynnal a chadw os oes cwestiwn ynglyn â'u diogelwch. Mae mater o'r fath yn codi yn ardal Croesyceiliog o Dorfaen ac yr wyf yn cymryd diddordeb agos ynddo.

Aeth Janet ymlaen wedyn at hanes argae Tryweryn. Digwyddodd hynny amser maith yn ôl—yn sicr cyn fy ngeni i. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid yw cyn belled â hynny'n ôl i'r rheini a oedd wedi'u geni ar y pryd.

Fy unig sylw ar hynny, ac mae'n un difrifol, yw ei fod efallai yn benderfyniad cynllunio gwael, ond mai penderfyniad cynllunio ydoedd yn y pen draw. Mae'n fy nhristâu iddo gael ei wleidyddoli i'r fath raddau. Clywn yn aml sut y daeth y Saeson yma a mynd â'n dwr, ac nid wyf yn derbyn y ddadl honno. Mae pawb ohonom wedi elwa o hynny, ac eithrio'r bobl a gollodd eu tir. Nid wyf yn hoffi ei weld yn mynd yn fater Saeson-Cymry. Mae'n ddadl beryglus. Penderfyniad cynllunio ydoedd. Ni theimlaf fy mod mewn sefyllfa i ddweud a oedd yn dda ynteu'n ddrwg.

Soniai trydedd rhan a rhan olaf ymdriniaeth Janet am adeiladu argaeau o amgylch y byd. Soniodd am India a Chwrddistan. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus yma oherwydd mae'n bosibl nad ydym ond yn gweld un ochr i'r ddadl. Nid wyf yn awgrymu eich bod yn anghywir, Janet, ond mae angen inni edrych yn ofalus ar bob ochr i'r ddadl cyn llofnodi datganiadau barn. Mae'n fy mhoeni ein bod yn barnu yn erbyn y prosiectau hyn oherwydd yn aml y bobl sydd yn elwa o godi'r prosiectau hyn yw dynion, menywod a phlant yr ardal sydd wedi ei chondemnio. Rhaid inni gadw hynny mewn cof.

**Ysgrifennydd yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth (Sue Essex):** Diolch ichi,

mix of subjects and arguments to get to the core of what you wanted to say. However, like David, I found it very interesting. I did not know what we would get this afternoon, but there was a very interesting and important set of questions.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Will you confirm that the problems with the Cwm Clydach dam have been forcefully brought to your attention? Will you give assurances this afternoon that you will attend a meeting in the community, and that we can now proceed to arrange a date?

**Sue Essex:** I have had letters from you about this, and I know the concerns locally. David alerted me to the problems of building structures. You have my assurance that I will come. I know that efforts are being made now to resolve this issue, but I would be happy to come and meet residents and look at the issues that concern you.

I want to start—I shall try and be brief because it has been a long and exciting afternoon—with the point of the drowning of the Welsh valleys. As David said, it is an emotive issue, but quite understandably so when people lose their homes, their communities and their history. That, in effect, is what happens: people lose their roots. You can understand why this is extremely emotive. This did not just happen in Wales, but in many locations across the world. The same kind of process happens whatever your nationality or origin: losing your roots and losing the land that might have sustained communities for hundreds of years.

To reassure people as to the Welsh situation—although I accept the points that Janet made about the privatisation of water, which is something with which I did not agree—what has been learned, in terms of the environment, is how to garner and look after resources in a much more meaningful way. Through the Environment Agency and its local environment action plans, and through various other ways, we are now

Janet; defnyddiasoch gymysgedd gywrain iawn o bynciau a dadleuon i fynd at galon yr hyn yr oeddech am ei ddweud. Fodd bynnag, fel David, fe'i cefais yn ddiddorol iawn. Ni wyddwn beth y byddem yn ei gael y prynhawn yma, ond cafwyd cyfres ddiddorol a phwysig iawn o gwestiynau.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A wnewch chi gadarnhau bod y problemau gydag argae Cwm Clydach wedi eu dwyn i'ch sylw yn gryf? A rowch chi sicrwydd y prynhawn yma y byddwch yn mynychu cyfarfod yn y gymuned, ac y gallwn fwrw ati yn awr i drefnu dyddiad?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf wedi cael llythyrau oddi wrthyhych ynglyn â hyn, a gwn am y pryderon yn lleol. Tynnodd David fy sylw at broblemau strwythurau adeiledig. Rhoddaf sicrwydd y byddaf yn dod. Gwn fod ymdrechion yn cael eu gwneud yn awr i ddatrys y mater hwn, ond byddwn yn falch o ddod i gwrdd â'r trigolion ac edrych ar y materion sydd yn peri pryder ichi.

Yr wyf am ddechrau—ceisiaf fod yn fyr oherwydd bu'n brynhawn hir a chyffrous—gyda'r pwynt am fodd cymoedd Cymru. Fel y dywedodd David, mae'n fater emosiynol, ond mae hynny'n ddealladwy pan fo pobl yn colli eu cartrefi, eu cymunedau a'u hanes. Dyna, mewn gwirionedd, sydd yn digwydd: mae pobl yn colli eu gwreiddiau. Gallwch ddeall pam fod hyn mor emosiynol. Nid yng Nghymru yn unig y digwyddodd hyn, ond mewn llawer man ar draws y byd. Ceir yr un math o broses beth bynnag fo'ch cenedl neu'ch tarddiad: colli eich gwreiddiau a cholli'r tir sydd efallai wedi cynnal cymunedau am gannoedd o flynyddoedd.

I dawelu meddyliau pobl ynglyn â sefyllfa Cymru—er fy mod yn derbyn pwyntiau Janet am breifateiddio dwr, sydd yn rhywbeth nad oeddwn yn cytuno ag ef—yr hyn sydd wedi'i ddysgu, yn nhermau'r amgylchedd, yw sut y mae casglu a gofalu am adnoddau mewn ffordd lawer mwy ystyrion. Drwy Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'i chynlluniau gweithredu amgylcheddol lleol, a thrwy amryw ffyrdd eraill, yr ydym yn awr yn gallu ceisio rheoli'r

much more able to try and control abstraction of water, and look carefully at using water resources sensibly.

The last dam built in Wales was, I think, in the 1970s. By today we have learned many lessons and I feel that there are good measures in place that would never let that happen again. It is always difficult to use the word 'never' because something always comes along, but I do not envisage that happening in my lifetime. We know that climate change is occurring, but it seems as though the way climate change will affect Wales will be that there may be some decreasing rainfall in the summer. That is probably going to be more than adequately compensated in Wales by additional flow in rivers during winter.

Those emotional and physical lessons—physical because we lost some valuable landscapes—have been learnt in Wales. It is important that we look at those lessons and, as Janet said, look at the wider international context.

The Ilisu dam has a public profile and the campaign is worldwide. Dams are built across a whole range of countries and have varying effects on local communities. We must keep this issue in a world perspective. Local communities undertake much action, not just in India but also in South America, because of the contest between the large projects and their implications for local communities. In some areas in the world, there are no resettlement programmes and people have to fend for themselves. I did not attend the presentation on the Ilisu dam but I accept Janet's points. This issue is not primarily a concern of this Assembly in terms of our statutory functions but we have a moral responsibility and I am pleased to hear the reference to a statement of opinion.

The Government has, as Janet said, gone along the path of export credits but there are areas of concern that the Government is examining. I will read these out. The four areas concerned, which I think cover some of the points that were raised, are resettlement programmes reflecting international

gwaith o dynnu dwr, ac edrych yn ofalus ar ddefnyddio adnoddau dwr yn synhwyrol.

Credaf mai yn y 1970au y codwyd yr argae diwethaf yng Nghymru. Erbyn heddiw yr ydym wedi dysgu llawer o wersi a theimlaf fod mesurau da wedi'u sefydlu na fyddent byth yn gadael i hynny ddigwydd eto. Mae bob amser yn anodd defnyddio'r gair 'byth' oherwydd mae rhywbeth wastad yn dod i law, ond ni ragwelaf hynny'n digwydd yn fy oes i. Gwyddom fod yr hinsawdd yn newid, ond mae'n ymddangos mai'r ffordd y bydd y newid yn effeithio ar Gymru yw y ceir llai o law yn yr haf. Mae'n debyg y bydd y llif ychwanegol yn yr afonydd dros y gaeaf yn mwy na gwneud iawn am hynny.

Mae'r gwersi emosiynol a chorfforol hynny—corfforol am inni golli rhai tirluniau gwerthfawr—wedi'u dysgu yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar y gwersi hynny ac, fel y dywedodd Janet, yn edrych ar y cyd-destun rhyngwladol ehangach.

Mae i argae Ilisu broffil cyhoeddus ac mae'r ymgyrch yn fyd-eang. Codir argaeau ar draws amrediad o wledydd a chânt effeithiau amrywiol ar gymunedau lleol. Rhaid inni gadw'r mater hwn mewn persbectif byd-eang. Mae cymunedau lleol yn gweithredu'n ddiwyd, nid dim ond yn India ond hefyd yn Ne America, oherwydd y gwrthdaro rhwng y prosiectau mawr a'u goblygiadau i gymunedau lleol. Mewn rhai rhannau o'r byd, nid oes rhaglenni ail-leoli ac mae pobl yn gorfod ymdopi drostynt eu hunain. Ni fûm yn y cyflwyniad ar argae Ilisu ond derbynias bwyntiau Janet. Nid yw'r mater hwn yn fater i'r Cynulliad hwn yn ei hanfod yn nhermau ein swyddogaethau statudol ond mae gennym gyfrifoldeb moesol ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed cyfeirio at ddatganiad barn.

Fel y dywedodd Janet, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi mynd ar hyd y llwybr credydau allforio ond mae meysydd sydd yn peri pryder y mae'r Llywodraeth yn edrych arnynt. Fe'u darllenaf ar goedd. Y pedwar maes dan sylw, sydd mi dybiaf yn ymdrin â rhai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd, yw rhaglenni ail-leoli sydd yn



standards and including independent monitoring, provision of water treatment plants upstream to ensure that water quality is maintained, assurance that downstream flows will be maintained at all times, and a detailed plan to preserve as much of the archaeological heritage of the towns as possible. This may not go far enough, but it would be incumbent upon our Members of Parliament, some of whom sit in this Chamber, to use all their powers to ensure that those concerns are met and adhered to.

In terms of what we can do if we have concerns—obviously Janet, Christine and others do—we should make our voices heard by writing as individual Members. It is quite difficult to address this issue, as it is not close to home. However, we are one community across the world. That certainly comes true to me with my environmental hat. The environment is about people and how they live their lives and not just about the physical environment. It is hard to draw boundaries and say who is responsible for what. As the Assembly grows, we will not take such a rigid view. We all have a right to express our opinions. I thank Janet for raising this issue today. It is important that we can debate issues like this.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close. I thank Members. That is the end of today's session.

adlewyrchu safonau rhyngwladol gan gynnwys monitro annibynnol, darparu gweithfeydd trin dwr i fyny'r afon i sicrhau bod ansawdd y dwr yn cael ei gynnal, sicrwydd y cynhelir y llif yn is i lawr yr afon bob amser, a chynllun manwl i gadw cymaint â phosibl o etifeddiaeth archeolegol y trefi. Efallai nad yw hyn yn mynd yn ddigon pell, ond byddai'n ddyletswydd ar ein Haelodau Seneddol, rhai ohonynt yn eistedd yn y Siambr hon, i ddefnyddio'u holl bwerau i sicrhau bod yr elfennau hynny yn cael eu cyflawni ac y cedwir atynt.

O ran yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud os oes gennym bryderon—mae'n amlwg bod gan Janet, Christine ac eraill—dylem godi ein lleisiau drwy ysgrifennu fel Aelodau unigol. Mae'n gymharol anodd mynd i'r afael â'r pwnc hwn, gan nad yw'n agos adref. Fodd bynnag, un gymuned ydym ar draws y byd. Mae hynny yn sicr yn dod yn wir i mi gyda'm het amgylcheddol. Mae a wnelo'r amgylchedd â phobl a sut y maent yn byw eu bywydau, nid dim ond yr amgylchedd corfforol. Mae'n anodd tynnu ffiniau a dweud pwy sydd yn gyfrifol am beth. Wrth i'r Cynulliad dyfu, ni fyddwn yn cymryd golwg mor haearnidd. Mae hawl gan bawb ohonom i fynegi barn. Diolchaf i Janet am godi'r mater hwn heddiw. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gallu trafod materion fel hyn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â gweithgareddau heddiw i ben. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau. Dyna ddiwedd sesiwn heddiw.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.21 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.21 p.m*