



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 20 Hydref 2010
Wednesday, 20 October 2010**

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|-----|---|
| 3 | Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Gwelliannau Dros Dro i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 27 ynghylch Amserlen y Gyllideb Flynyddol
Motion to Agree Temporary Amendments to Standing Order No. 27 in relation to the Annual Budget Timetable |
| 3 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services |
| 19 | Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth
Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport |
| 35 | Cwestiwn Brys: Cyllido S4C
Urgent Question: S4C Funding |
| 43 | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd ar Ddarparu Rhandiroedd yng Nghymru
The Sustainability Committee's Report into Allotment Provision in Wales |
| 58 | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu 'Cronfeydd Strwythurol: Gweithredu Rhaglenni 2007-13'
The Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report 'Structural Funds: Implementation of the 2007-13 Programmes' |
| 75 | Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Strategaeth Newid yn yr Hinsawdd
Welsh Conservatives Debate: Climate Change Strategy |
| 98 | Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time |
| 101 | Dadl Fer: Cosbau Llym yng Nghyswllt Grantiau Amaethyddol Ewropeaidd
Short Debate: Punitive Penalties in relation to European Agricultural Grants |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Trefn yn y Cynulliad.

The Presiding Officer: Order in the Assembly.

**Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Gwelliannau Dros Dro i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 27 ynghylch
Amserlen y Gyllideb Flynyddol
Motion to Agree Temporary Amendments to Standing Order No. 27 in relation
to the Annual Budget Timetable**

Cynnig NDM4561 Dafydd Elis-Thomas

Motion NDM4561 Dafydd Elis-Thomas

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 35.2:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 35.2:

1. Yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Hydref 2010; a

1. Considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 13 October 2010; and

2. Yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog a nodir yn Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes.

2. Approves the amendments to Standing Orders set out in the report of the Business Committee.

Peter Black: I move the motion.

Peter Black: Cynigiaf y cynnig.

Y Llywydd: Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau, felly, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, mae'r cynnig wedi ei gytuno.

The Presiding Officer: I see that there are no objections, therefore, in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiynau 1, OAQ(3)1708(HSS), a 2, OAQ(3)1736(HSS), yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 1, OAQ(3)1708(HSS), and 2, OAQ(3)1736(HSS), were withdrawn.

Sterileiddio Offer Meddygol

Sterilisation of Medical Equipment

3. Chris Franks: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sterileiddio offer meddygol yn ysbytai Cymru. OAQ(3)1736(HSS)

3. Chris Franks: Will the Minister make a statement on the sterilisation of medical equipment in Welsh hospitals. OAQ(3)1736(HSS)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): Individual health boards are responsible for ensuring that the equipment that is used in operations meets the appropriate clinical standards. All hospital sterilisation and disinfection units in Wales are accredited under the European Union medical devices directive 93/42/EEC.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Mae byrddau iechyd unigol yn gyfrifol am sicrhau bod y cyfarpar a ddefnyddir mewn llawdriniaethau yn bodloni'r safonau clinigol priodol. Mae pob uned sterileiddio a diheintio mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru'n cael ei hachredu o dan gyfarwyddeb 93/42/EEC dyfeisiau

Chris Franks: Thank you for that, Minister. Can you comment on the action that you took, along with Cardiff and Vale University Health Board, regarding cancelled operations due to the lack of sterile surgical equipment at the University Hospital of Wales? In a letter to Plaid Cymru, the board's chief executive, Jan Williams, admitted that the overall number of patients waiting for cardiac surgery increased from 148 to 199 between the end of April and August. Will you agree to monitor the situation on behalf of the constituents who have contacted me? In total, 87 operations were cancelled due to the issue with sterilisation. Would you also agree that cancelled operations cost money, which, in the light of the savage cuts that have been announced by the Conservative/Lib Dem Government in London, is money that we can ill afford to waste?

Edwina Hart: On that incident, it was reported in June and August of this year that UHW cancelled mainly cardiac operations due to concerns about the quality of the instruments provided. The hospital adopted the precautionary principle, based on risk assessment and the maintenance of patient safety during each incident. An additional 200,000 new instruments have been procured, and five new state-of-the-art washer-disinfectors have been commissioned and installed. Independent expert advice from Public Health Wales considers the response and the actions that were taken by Cardiff and Vale University Health Board to be exemplary in this regard. Obviously, this has an impact in terms of operations, and I will continue to monitor the position, as you request.

William Graham: I know that you take this matter seriously, Minister; sterilisation is a matter for all concerned in hospitals, and is a priority. Will any disciplinary action be taken in respect of such matters?

Edwina Hart: These incidents were to do with a sticky residue on instruments, and a white powdering on trays. I understand that this was resolved through a switch from blue to white tray liners. The white powder issue was resolved when the detergent that was used was switched from the pH neutral one

meddygol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Chris Franks: Diolch am hynny, Weinidog. A allwch chi sôn am y camau a gymerasoch chi, ynghyd â Bwrdd Iechyd Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro, ynghylch llawdriniaethau a ganslwyd oherwydd diffyg cyfarpar llawfeddygol di-haint yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru? Mewn llythyr at Blaid Cymru, cyfaddefodd prif weithredwr y bwrdd, Jan Williams, fod nifer cyffredinol y cleifion sy'n disgwyl am lawdriniaeth ar y galon wedi cynyddu o 148 i 199 rhwng diwedd mis Ebrill a mis Awst. A gytunwch i fonitro'r sefyllfa ar ran yr etholwyr sydd wedi cysylltu â mi? Canslwyd 87 o lawdriniaethau i gyd oherwydd y broblem sterileiddio. A fydech chi hefyd yn cytuno bod canslo llawdriniaeth yn costio arian, sydd, yng ngoleuni'r toriadau gwyllt a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Llundain, yn arian nad allwn fforddio ei wastraffu o gwbl?

Edwina Hart: O ran y digwyddiad hwnnw, rhoddwyd gwybod ym mis Mehefin a mis Awst eleni fod Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru wedi canslo llawdriniaethau ar y galon yn bennaf oherwydd pryderon am ansawdd yr offerynnau a ddarparwyd. Mabwysiadodd yr ysbyty'r egwyddor ragofalus, ar sail asesu risg a chadw'r claf yn ddiogel yn ystod pob digwyddiad. Mae 200,000 o offerynnau newydd ychwanegol wedi'u caffael, ac mae pump o'r teclynnau golchi-diheintio diweddaraf un wedi'u comisiynu a'u gosod. Yn ôl cyngor arbenigol annibynnol gan Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru, mae'r ymateb a'r camau a gymerwyd gan Fwrdd Iechyd Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro yn benigamp yn hyn o beth. Yn amlwg, mae hyn yn cael effaith o ran llawdriniaethau, a byddaf yn parhau i fonitro'r sefyllfa, fel y gofynnwch chi.

William Graham: Gwn eich bod yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif, Weinidog; mae sterileiddio'n fater i bawb sy'n ymwneud ag ysbytai, ac mae'n flaenoriaeth. A fydd unrhyw gamau disgyblu'n cael eu cymryd ynghylch materion felly?

Edwina Hart: Roedd y digwyddiadau hyn yn ymwneud â rhelyw gludiog ar offerynnau, a phowdwr gwyn ar hambyrddau. Deallaf fod hyn wedi'i ddatrys drwy newid o leinin glas i wyn yn yr hambyrddau. Cafodd mater y powdwr gwyn ei ddatrys pan newidiwyd y glanedydd a ddefnyddiwyd o'r un pH niwtral

that had been used for years, without incident, to an alkaline detergent. Therefore, these were practical matters. However, I am more than happy to write to you in detail regarding the actions that Cardiff and Vale University Health Board has undertaken.

**Gorchmynion Triniaeth Gymunedol
Iechyd Meddwl**

4. David Melding: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am Orchmynion Triniaeth Gymunedol Iechyd Meddwl. OAQ(3)1720(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: An eligible patient may be placed under a community treatment order and be treated safely in the community rather than under detention in hospital. This form of supervised community treatment can help prevent relapse, and is intended to help the patient maintain stable mental health outside hospital and to promote recovery.

David Melding: More extensive use is being made of supervised community treatment than may have been expected. The Mental Health Alliance report on supervised community treatment in Wales and England called for data to be published quarterly rather than annually. I understand that the NHS Information Centre, which only covers England, has accepted this recommendation. Will the Welsh Assembly Government follow suit, and publish data quarterly, so that we can monitor the situation? I am not saying that I am against these orders, but we need the data to ensure that we are fully informed about how this scheme is being used.

Edwina Hart: Thank you for that supplementary question, David. Like you, I am generally in favour of these orders. I will liaise with my officials positively to see whether that information can be collated in that manner.

Christine Chapman: On any day, 250,000 people in Wales have depression. Despite this fact, public awareness and understanding remain low. This lack of understanding means that people become more ill and fail to seek the help and support that they need to overcome the condition. Understanding depression is the first step on the road to recovery and self-help groups are key to this. Positive Steps in my constituency provides

a ddefnyddid ers blynnyddoedd, heb problem, i lanedydd alcalin. Felly, materion ymarferol oedd y rhain. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n fwy na bodlon ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch y camau y mae Bwrdd Iechyd Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro wedi'u cymryd.

**Mental Health Community Treatment
Orders**

4. David Melding: *Will the Minister make a statement on Mental Health Community Treatment Orders. OAQ(3)1720(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: Caiff claf cymwys ei osod o dan orchymyn triniaeth gymunedol a'i drin yn ddiogel yn y gymuned yn hytrach na chael ei gadw yn yr ysbyty. Gall y math hwn o driniaeth dan oruchwyliaeth yn y gymuned helpu i atal ail bwl, a'i bwriad yw helpu'r claf i gynnal iechyd meddwl sefydlog y tu allan i'r ysbyty a hyrwyddo ei wellhad.

David Melding: Mae triniaeth gymunedol dan oruchwyliaeth yn cael ei defnyddio'n helaethach nag y gellid fod wedi'i ddisgwyl. Roedd adroddiad y Gynghrair Iechyd Meddwl am driniaeth gymunedol dan oruchwyliaeth yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn galw am gyhoeddi data bob chwarter yn hytrach na phob blwyddyn. Deallaf fod Canolfan Wybodaeth y GIG, sy'n ymdrin â Lloegr yn unig, wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn. A fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dilyn yr esiampl hon, ac yn cyhoeddi data bob chwarter, er mwyn inni fonitro'r sefyllfa? Nid wyf yn dweud fy mod i'n gwrthwynebu'r gorchmynion hyn, ond mae angen y data arnom i sicrhau y cawn wybod yn llawn am y ffordd y mae'r cynllun hwn yn cael ei ddefnyddio.

Edwina Hart: Diolch i chi am y cwestiwn atodol hwnnw, David. Fel chithau, rwy'n gyffredinol o blaid y gorchmynion hyn. Byddaf yn cysylltu â'm swyddogion yn gadarnhaol i weld a ellir casglu'r wybodaeth honno yn y modd hwnnw.

Christine Chapman: Ar unrhyw ddiwrnod, mae iselder ar 250,000 o bobl yng Nghymru. Er hyn, prin yw ymwybyddiaeth a dealltwriaeth y cyhoedd o hyd. Mae'r diffyg dealltwriaeth hwn yn golygu y daw pobl yn salach a'u bod yn methu â cheisio'r cymorth a'r gefnogaeth sydd eu hangen arnynt i oresgyn y salwch. Deall iselder yw'r cam cyntaf ar y ffordd i wella ac mae grwpiau hunangymorth yn allweddol i hyn. Mae

valuable advice and support to people affected by depression and I was delighted to present members of the group with certificates last week for successfully completing an eight-week depression self-management course. With the help of Journeys, the charity, their lives have been transformed for the better. However, Minister, I understand that there are currently concerns about the funding of Journeys and its future viability. What assurances can you give that, as a result of the deep cuts that are being announced by the coalition Government today, organisations in Wales such as Journeys will not be overlooked, as they provide a vital service to all those affected by depression and their families and friends?

Edwina Hart: There is certainly cross-party consensus on mental health issues and depression. Obviously, in very difficult financial times we have to look at all budgets and we have to look at our relationship with the voluntary sector and what it provides. I can assure you that we will do this in a methodical and fair manner, because it is important to look at the services that the voluntary sector provides, which help so many people, so economically and so locally in many instances.

David Lloyd: Weinidog, byddwch yn cofio bod cryn bwyslais ar ehangu'r ddarpariaeth o driniaethau iechyd meddwl yn y gymuned yn y Mesur Arfaethedig Iechyd Meddwl (Cymru). A wnewch gadarnhau pwysigrwydd datblygu gwasanaethau cymunedol newydd i ni allu trin pobl yn gynharach yn eu salwch gan gynyddu'r tebygrwydd y byddant yn cael adferiad llwyr?

Edwina Hart: I thank Dr Lloyd for that supplementary question, because that is the purpose of what we are discussing in terms of mental health. It is important that we develop the primary care agenda fully, consider its accessibility to patients, and look at the myriad services that we need to provide. I am pleased that we are making such good progress with the legislation. I wish to place on record my thanks to the legislation committee that I appeared before for the way in which we dealt with quite a lot of amendments, which means that it will be an improved piece of legislation that will appear before Plenary very shortly.

Deintyddiaeth y GIG yng Nghymru

Positive Steps yn fy etholaeth i'n rhoi cyngor a chymorth gwerthfawr i bobl y mae iselder yn effeithio arnynt ac roedd yn bleser mawr gennyf gyflwyno tystysgrifau i aelodau o'r grŵp yr wythnos diwethaf am gwblhau wyth wythnos o gwrs hunanreoli iselder. Gyda chymorth Journeys, yr elusen, mae eu bywydau wedi'u trawsnewid er gwell. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, deallaf fod pryderon ar hyn o bryd am gyllido Journeys a'i hyfywdra yn y dyfodol. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch chi ei roi na fydd sefydliadau yng Nghymru fel Journeys yn cael eu diystyru, o ganlyniad i'r toriadau dwfn sy'n cael eu cyhoeddi gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid heddiw, am eu bod yn darparu gwasanaeth hanfodol i bawb y mae iselder yn effeithio arnynt ac i'w teuluoedd a'u cyfeillion?

Edwina Hart: Yn bendant, mae cydsynio trawsbleidiol ar faterion iechyd meddwl ac iselder. Yn amlwg, ar adegau ariannol anodd iawn, mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar bob cyllideb ac mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar ein perthynas â'r sector gwirfoddol a'r hyn a ddarpara. Gallaf eich sicrhau y gwnawn hyn mewn modd trefnus a theg, am ei bod yn bwysig edrych ar y gwasanaethau y mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn eu darparu, sy'n helpu cynifer o bobl, a hynny mewn modd mor ddiwastraff ac mor lleol mewn llawer achos.

David Lloyd: Minister, you will remember that there is quite an emphasis on increasing the provision of community treatment for mental ill-health in the Proposed Mental Health (Wales) Measure. Will you confirm the importance of developing new community services so that we can treat people earlier and increase the likelihood that they will make a full recovery?

Edwina Hart: Diolchaf i Dr Lloyd am y cwestiwn atodol hwnnw, oherwydd hwnnw yw diben yr hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod o ran iechyd meddwl. Mae'n bwysig inni ddatblygu'r agenda gofal sylfaenol yn llawn, ystyried pa mor hygyrch ydyw i gleifion, ac edrych ar y gwasanaethau di-rif y mae angen inni eu darparu. Rwy'n falch ein bod yn gwneud crystal cynnydd gyda'r ddeddfwriaeth. Hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch i'r pwyllgor deddfu yr ymddangosais ger ei fron am y ffordd yr ymdriniasom ag eithaf llawer o welliannau, sy'n golygu y bydd yn well darn o ddeddfwriaeth a fydd yn ymddangos gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn yn fuan iawn.

NHS Dentistry in Wales

5. Leanne Wood: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fynediad i ddeintyddiaeth y GIG yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)1693(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: The ability of patients to access NHS dental services has improved significantly over the last three years. However, I want to see further progress towards improving access to NHS dental care.

Leanne Wood: Minister, I am sure that you are aware that it costs £175,000 to put dentistry students through five years of training. Under the current system, they are required to spend only the first year of their career as a qualified practitioner in the NHS. After that, they are free to concentrate solely on private work. When you consider that there is a shortage of NHS dentists in some areas of Wales, do you agree that this needs to be looked at? One possible way to proceed would be to implement a Plaid Cymru policy to compel dentists to devote up to half their working week to the care of NHS patients. This would be possible even in the face of the savage cuts that are being announced in Westminster as we speak, because it would involve renegotiating the dental contract rather than any capital investment. Would you be prepared to consider this idea?

Edwina Hart: We always look at any issues when the opportunities arise to renegotiate contracts. The contract is negotiated on a UK basis and, therefore, the four nations would have to agree. Both the GP and the dental contract are coming up for renewal. It is important to recognise that dentists are, as you said, independent contractors to the national health service. I have discussed with LHBs the possibility of having directly employed dentists and, of course, you will note that in some of the new primary care centres we now have dental chairs. That might be the future. We have to look very carefully at what happens in terms of the comprehensive spending review, and at what further action we may need to take. Issues around the contract are now certainly open for discussion.

1.40 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, there are three

5. Leanne Wood: *Will the Minister make a statement on access to NHS dentistry in Wales. OAQ(3)1693(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: Mae gallu cleifion i gael at wasanaethau deintyddol y GIG wedi gwella'n sylweddol dros y tair blynedd ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weld cynnydd pellach tuag at ei gwneud yn haws cael at ofal deintyddol y GIG.

Leanne Wood: Weinidog, rwy'n siŵr y gwyddoch ei bod yn costio £175,000 i roi pum mlynedd o hyfforddiant i fyfyrwyr deintyddiaeth. O dan y system gyfredol, nid oes gofyn iddynt dreulio ond blwyddyn gyntaf eu gyrfa yn ymarferwr cymwysedig yn y GIG. Ar ôl hynny, maent yn rhydd i ganolbwyntio'n llwyr ar waith preifat. Pan ystyriwch fod prinder deintyddion y GIG mewn rhai ardaloedd o Gymru, a ydych chi'n cytuno bod angen edrych ar hyn? Un ffordd bosibl o symud ymlaen fyddai rhoi polisi Plaid Cymru ar waith i gymell deintyddion i ymroi hyd at hanner eu hwythnos waith i ofalu am gleifion y GIG. Byddai hyn yn bosibl er gwaethaf y toriadau gwyllt sy'n cael eu cyhoeddi yn San Steffan y funud hon, oherwydd byddai'n golygu ail-drafod y contract deintyddol yn hytrach na buddsoddi unrhyw gyfalaf. A fydddech chi'n fodlon ystyried y syniad hwn?

Edwina Hart: Edrychwn bob amser ar unrhyw faterion pan fydd y cyfleoedd yn codi i ail-drafod contractau. Mae'r contract yn cael ei gyd-drafod ar sail y DU ac, felly, byddai'n rhaid i'r pedair cenedl gytuno. Mae'r contractau meddygon teulu a deintyddion ar fin cael eu hadnewyddu. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod deintyddion, fel y dywedaso, yn gontractwyr annibynnol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Rwyf wedi trafod â Byrddau Iechyd Lleol y posibilrwydd o gael deintyddion a gyflogir yn uniongyrchol ac, wrth reswm, sylwch fod gennym bellach gadeiriau deintydd yn rhai o'r canolfannau gofal sylfaenol newydd. Hwyrach mai hynny yw'r dyfodol. Mae'n rhaid inni edrych yn ofalus iawn ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd o ran yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, ac ar y camau pellach y mae angen inni eu cymryd efallai. Mae'n sicr bod materion ynghylch y contract yn agored i'w trafod.

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, mae tri band

bands for dental charges for NHS treatment. Band 1 treatment, which costs £12, includes scaling and polishing. A constituent of mine who, although in work, is on a limited income, is required to pay dental charges. When she went for a filling, she was told by her dentist that she had to pay an additional £25 for a scale and polish. That charge was imposed upon her. Are the dentists who are contracted with the NHS able to withdraw certain elements of the service in such a way, or is that strictly against the conditions of the NHS dental services contract?

Edwina Hart: It is interesting that you raise that point today, because such issues have also been raised with me in my constituency. If the Member will allow it, I will ask my officials to look at this across to piece to see whether we have had any other complaints. I could then issue guidance to Members on the exact position on the contract, which might be helpful for them in their dealings with constituents.

Gofal Cleifion yn Ne-ddwyrain Cymru

6. Nick Ramsay: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynigion i wella gofal cleifion yn Ne Ddwyrain Cymru. OAQ(3)1690(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: We are taking forward a number of measures to improve the standards of patient care throughout Wales. These include improved efficiency through our programme of NHS reforms, increasing capacity, improving access to our health services, and ensuring that these services are safe and efficient for everyone in Wales.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you for that answer, Minister. In your discussions with the local health boards, will you ask them to pay particular attention to orthopaedic surgery and care? I have written several letters to you about the cases of constituents of mine, and I thank you for your actions. However, it seems that there is a broader overarching problem with orthopaedics, particularly with the knee replacement procedures in Gwent and south-east Wales. Just over the border in England, operations for knee replacements take far less time. In some cases, it is only a matter of weeks, compared with the nine months that one of my constituents had to wait in Monmouthshire. Can you look at why this is happening, Minister? While I

ar gyfer taliadau deintyddol am driniaeth y GIG. Mae triniaeth Band 1, sy'n costio £12, yn cynnwys digennu a sgleinio. Mae'n gofyn i un o'm hetholwyr i sydd ar incwm cyfyngedig, er ei fod yn gweithio, dalu costau deintyddol. Pan aeth hi i gael llenwad, dywedodd ei deintydd wrthi fod rhaid iddi dalu £25 ychwanegol am ddigennu a sgleinio. Gorfodwyd y gost honno arni. A ydy'r deintyddion sy'n cael eu contractio gyda'r GIG yn gallu tynnu'n ôl rai elfennau o'r gwasanaeth mewn ffordd felly, neu a ydy hynny'n mynd yn llwyr yn erbyn amodau contract gwasanaethau deintyddol y GIG?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n ddi-ddorol ichi godi'r pwynt hwnnw heddiw, oherwydd codwyd pethau felly gyda mi hefyd yn fy etholaeth i. Os bydd yr Aelod yn ei ganiatáu, gofynnaf i'm swyddogion edrych ar hyn yn gyffredinol i weld a ydym wedi cael unrhyw gwynion eraill. Gallwn wedyn roi arweiniad i'r Aelodau am union sefyllfa'r contract, a allai fod yn ddefnyddiol iddynt wrth ymdrin ag etholwyr.

Patient Care in South-east Wales

6. Nick Ramsay: *Will the Minister make a statement on proposals to improve patient care in South East Wales. OAQ(3)1690(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: Rydym yn cyflwyno nifer o fesurau i wella safonau gofal i gleifion ledled Cymru. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys gwell effeithlonrwydd drwy ein rhaglen o ddiwygiadau'r GIG, cynyddu gallu, sicrhau ei bod yn haws cael at ein gwasanaethau iechyd, a sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hyn yn ddiogel ac yn effeithlon i bawb yng Nghymru.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yn eich trafodaethau â'r byrddau iechyd lleol, a wnewch chi ofyn iddynt roi sylw arbennig i ofal a llawdriniaeth orthopedig? Rwyf wedi ysgrifennu nifer o lythyrau atoch am achosion ymhlith fy etholwyr i, a diolchaf ichi am weithredu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg bod problem gyffredinol ehangach gydag orthopaedeg, yn arbennig gyda'r llawdriniaethau pen-glin newydd yng Ngwent ac yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru. Ychydig dros y ffin yn Lloegr, mae llawdriniaethau ar gyfer pen-glin newydd yn cymryd llawer llai o amser. Dim ond wythnosau weithiau, o'u cymharu â'r naw mis y bu'n rhaid i un o'm hetholwyr innau aros yn Sir Fynwy. A allwch chi astudio pam

appreciate your assistance in individual cases, if something could be done about the overall waiting times and the structural problems that are causing them, I would be grateful.

Edwina Hart: Nick, you and other Members whose constituencies are in the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board have raised concerns with me, particularly about orthopaedics. I recall Jenny Randerson also raising specific concerns about waiting lists elsewhere during questions to the First Minister. I have made it quite clear to the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board that it is not acceptable for patients to wait more than six months. Senior officials have had meetings with the board to ensure that swift and decisive action is taken, and we have placed the health board under special measures in this regard. We have also ensured that the health board has developed comprehensive plans to deal with the issues. We are aware that it is waiting to appoint four senior orthopaedic surgeons, and it expects to treat all orthopaedic patients within the maximum waiting time by March 2011. It is incumbent on me to keep an eye on that, to make sure that it delivers in that respect.

To digress slightly and move onto the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board, given that issues were raised about it, Members will be interested to learn that the board has decided that no premium payments will be given and they will now be phased out. Therefore, I expect operations to return to normal in Cardiff and the Vale.

Jeff Cuthbert: Minister, as you know, Ysbyty Ystrad Fawr near Ystrad Mynach is due to be completed this time next year, and I look forward to attending the opening of that state-of-the-art facility. It is one of the first hospitals to be built with all single rooms and en-suite facilities for privacy, infection control and a more peaceful and flexible environment, which I am sure patients will greatly appreciate. At a cost to the public purse of £172 million, and providing 255 beds, it is the largest hospital to be built in Wales for the past 30 years. Critically, it will include an MRI scanner and, for the first time in the Rhymney valley, direct mental health service provision. Minister, do you agree that

mae hyn yn digwydd, Weinidog? Er fy mod i'n gwerthfawrogi eich cymorth mewn achosion unigol, pe gellid gwneud rhywbeth am yr amseroedd aros cyffredinol a'r problemau strwythurol sy'n eu hachosi, byddwn yn ddiolchgar.

Edwina Hart: Nick, rydych chi ac Aelodau eraill y mae eu hetholaethau ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan wedi codi pryderon gyda mi, yn arbennig am orthopaedeg. Rwy'n cofio Jenny Randerson hefyd yn codi pryderon penodol am restr aros mewn mannau eraill yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. Rwyf wedi egluro i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan nad yw'n dderbyniol i gleifion aros mwy na chwe mis. Mae uwch swyddogion wedi cael cyfarfodydd â'r bwrdd i sicrhau bod camau cyflym a phendant yn cael eu cymryd, ac rydym wedi gosod y bwrdd iechyd o dan fesurau arbennig yn hyn o beth. Rydym wedi sicrhau hefyd fod y bwrdd iechyd wedi datblygu cynlluniau cynhwysfawr i ymdrin â'r materion. Rydym yn gwybod ei fod yn disgwyl penodi pedwar uwch lawfeddyg orthopedig, a'i fod yn disgwyl trin pob claf orthopedig cyn pen yr amser aros mwyaf erbyn mis Mawrth 2011. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnaf gadw llygad ar hynny, i sicrhau ei fod yn cyflawni yn hynny o beth.

Gan wyro ychydig a symud ymlaen i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro, o ystyried y codwyd materion amdano, bydd yr Aelodau'n awyddus i gael gwybod bod y bwrdd wedi penderfynu na fydd dim taliadau premiwm yn cael eu rhoi ac y byddant yn awr yn cael eu dileu fesul dipyn. Felly, disgwyliaf i lawdriniaethau ddychwelyd i'r arfer yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro.

Jeff Cuthbert: Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, mae Ysbyty Ystrad Fawr ger Ystrad Mynach ar fin cael ei gwblhau'r adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf, ac edrychaf ymlaen at fynd i agoriad y cyfleuster tra modern hwnnw. Hwn yw un o'r ysbytai cyntaf i gael ei adeiladu gydag ystafelloedd sengl i gyd a chyfleusterau en-suite er preifatrwydd, rheoli heintiau ac amgylchedd mwy heddychlon a hyblyg, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd y cleifion yn gwerthfawrogi hyn yn fawr. Mae wedi costio £172 miliwn i'r cyhoedd, a darparu 255 o welyau, a hwn yw'r ysbyty mwyaf i gael ei adeiladu yng Nghymru ers 30 mlynedd. Yn allweddol, bydd yn cynnwys sganiwr MRI ac, am y tro cyntaf yng nghwm Rhymni,

the new hospital will provide good-quality healthcare, and that it is good news indeed for the people of the Rhymney valley?

Edwina Hart: I concur with your comments, and it is good that another new hospital is opening. I trust that the good news story about why we want people to have single rooms will not be misinterpreted. There was a story about that in the media. We have a holistic approach to health now, and look at how we can minimise infection, and that is the best way of doing that. I am delighted that we have been able to put that level of investment into your constituency.

Andrew R.T. Davies: The First Minister, in response to the leader of the opposition a fortnight ago, indicated the pressures that the health budget would face over the next few years. He specifically said that the Government would look at protecting hospital budgets. Given that your answers, and, indeed, the strategic framework document that the health department has issued, have, time and again, referred to community services and their enhancement, how can you just protect hospitals? How can you do just that if the direction of travel into community services can be resourced and services provided where patients want to be treated, which is in the community, and in the primary sector?

Edwina Hart: We have to recognise that, with the reform of the NHS, we have changed around the system, with an emphasis on preventative primary and community delivery. The secondary sector is very important, because that is where difficult decisions are made about patients, and operations are done, and there are high standards of care in that sector. In terms of the budget, until the outcome of the comprehensive spending review, I do not want to comment about any implications that there may or may not be for me. I assure you that there must be equity across the piece, whatever the budget settlement, in terms of delivering for the people of Wales.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Given that the Westminster Government has indicated that the health budget for England will be protected, if your Government were to decide to protect health spending, then there would be equity in the delivery of health spending

darpariaeth gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl uniongyrchol. Weinidog, a ydych chi'n cytuno y bydd yr ysbyty newydd yn darparu gofal iechyd o ansawdd da, a bod hwnnw'n newyddion da yn wir i bobl cwm Rhymni?

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau, ac mae'n beth da bod ysbyty newydd arall yn agor. Hyderaf na chamddehonglir y stori newyddion da ynghylch pam mae arnom eisiau i bobl gael ystafelloedd sengl. Roedd stori am hynny yn y cyfryngau. Mae gennym ymagwedd gyfannol at iechyd erbyn hyn, ac ystyriwn y ffyrdd y gallwn leihau heintiau, a dyna'r ffordd orau o wneud hynny. Rwyf wrth fy modd inni allu buddsoddi cymaint â hynny yn eich etholaeth.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Mewn ymateb i arweinydd yr wrthblaid bythefnos yn ôl, soniodd y Prif Weinidog am y pwysau a fyddai'n wynebu'r gyllideb iechyd dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Dywedodd yn benodol y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn edrych ar amddiffyn cyllidebau ysbyty. O ystyried bod eich atebion chi ac, yn wir, y ddogfen fframwaith strategol a gyhoeddwyd gan yr adran iechyd, wedi cyfeirio droeon at wasanaethau cymunedol a'u gwella, sut gallwch chi warchod ysbytai yn unig? Sut gallwch chi wneud hynny'n unig os gellir adnoddu'r cyfeiriad tuag at wasanaethau cymunedol a darparu gwasanaethau lle mae cleifion am gael eu trin, sef yn y gymuned, ac yn y sector sylfaenol?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod ein bod, ers diwygio'r GIG, wedi newid o amgylch y system, gyda phwyslais ar wasanaethau sylfaenol a chymunedol ataliol. Mae'r sector eilaidd yn bwysig iawn, oherwydd yno y gwneir penderfyniadau anodd am gleifion, ac yno gwneir llawdriniaethau, ac mae safonau gofal uchel yn y sector hwnnw. O ran y gyllideb, nes cael canlyniad yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, nid wyf am sôn am unrhyw oblygiadau a allai fod imi neu beidio. Rwy'n eich sicrhau chi ei bod yn rhaid cael cyfiawnder i bawb, ni waeth beth yw'r setliad cyllideb, o ran cyflenwi i bobl Cymru.

Andrew R.T. Davies: O ystyried bod Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi nodi y bydd y gyllideb iechyd i Loegr yn cael ei hamddiffyn, petai eich Llywodraeth chi am benderfynu amddiffyn gwariant ar iechyd, byddai cyfiawnder o ran gwario ar iechyd

in Wales for patients. Are you confident that you will be able to secure from the Minister for Business and Budget an equitable settlement for the health service in Wales, given that last year you choose to take £435 million out of the health service in Wales, and, up and down Wales, local health boards are having to shut services and grapple with massive budget deficits?

Edwina Hart: LHBs up and down Wales are looking strategically at what is required in the development of services. We have to recognise that health has moved on a great deal. There will be centres of excellence, and we need those for a whole host of clinical and patient safety reasons. It is not a slash-and-burn policy, but they are obviously looking at what they need to do. I do not intend to be lectured about what I am doing with regard to health expenditure. I was reading only last week an article about primary care trusts and the Royal College of Nursing's concerns about issues in that regard. I think that I actually cut something out about budget cuts forcing NHS hospitals to stop non-emergency surgery in one part of England. That was in an Essex primary care trust. We are managing our budgets properly and are working with the service to secure efficiencies and economies of scale. It is important that we recognise that we have to do that, and we are doing it. It is difficult, because inflation in the health sector is higher than normal inflation, and the pressures on the sector are enormous in terms of drugs budgets and so on, but we are working through the issues. I assure you that, as a Government, we will look at equity in terms of the budget settlements that we will make.

Gwasanaethau Integredig Cymorth i Deuluoedd

7. Joyce Watson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am wasanaethau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)1713(HSS)

The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): On 1 September, local authorities, in collaboration with their local health boards, in Wrexham, Newport, Rhondda Cynon Taf and Merthyr Tydfil,

yng Nghymru i gleifion. A ydych chi'n ffyddiog y byddwch chi'n gallu sicrhau setliad cyfiawn i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru gan y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb, o ystyried y dewisoch chi'r llynedd gymryd £435 miliwn allan o'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, a bod byrddau iechyd lleol, ar hyd a lled Cymru, yn gorfod cau gwasanaethau a mynd i'r afael â diffygion enfawr yn y gyllideb?

Edwina Hart: Mae Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ar hyd a lled Cymru'n edrych yn strategol ar yr hyn sy'n ofynnol i ddatblygu gwasanaethau. Mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod bod iechyd wedi symud ymlaen cryn dipyn. Bydd canolfannau rhagoriaeth, ac mae angen y rheini arnom ar gyfer llw o resymau clinigol a diogelwch cleifion. Nid polisi torri a llosgi mohono, ond maent yn amlwg yn ystyried yr hyn y mae angen iddynt ei wneud. Ni fwriadaf gael fy narlithio am yr hyn a wnaif o ran gwariant iechyd. Roeddwn yn darllen yr wythnos diwethaf erthygl am ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol a phryderon y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol am faterion yn hynny o beth. Rwy'n credu imi dorri rhywbeth allan am doriadau cyllideb yn gorfodi ysbytai'r GIG i roi'r gorau i lawdriniaeth nad yw'n argyfwng mewn un rhan o Loegr. Mewn ymddiriedolaeth gofal sylfaenol yn Essex oedd hynny. Rydym yn rheoli ein cyllidebau'n iawn ac yn gweithio gyda'r gwasanaeth i sicrhau effeithlonrwydd ac arbedion maint. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod ei bod yn rhaid inni wneud hynny, a'n bod yn ei wneud. Mae'n anodd, gan fod chwyddiant yn y sector iechyd yn uwch na chwyddiant arferol, ac mae'r pwysau ar y sector yn anferth o ran cyllidebau cyffuriau ac ati, ond rydym yn gweithio trwy'r problemau. Fe'ch sicrhaf y byddwn, fel Llywodraeth, yn edrych ar gyfiawnder o ran y setliadau cyllideb a wnawn.

Integrated Family Support Services

7. Joyce Watson: Will the Minister provide an update on integrated family support services in Wales. OAQ(3)1713(HSS)

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Ar 1 Medi, gweithredodd awdurdodau lleol, ar y cyd â'u byrddau iechyd lleol, yn Wrecsam, Casnewydd, Rhondda Cynon Taf a Merthyr

implemented their statutory integrated family support services and boards. Initially, IFSS will be accessible to families where parental substance misuse increases the vulnerability of the child.

Joyce Watson: You will know that the Flying Start initiative, which was set up by this Government to help families in deprived areas, was recently the subject of a positive interim report. One of the initiative's principal objectives is to provide one-to-one guidance to parents, as has happened in Pembrokeshire at the Plant Dewi centre, where parents have benefited from the support on offer. Do you agree, Deputy Minister, that providing health visitor and language programmes, and children information officers, is the correct approach in order to support families and give children the best possible start in life?

Gwenda Thomas: The Flying Start programme provides a range of services to families to improve the longer term outcomes for their children. We are developing this approach more broadly, through Families First, to ensure that where children and families need help, we provide a multi-agency and multi-intervention approach. Families First will complement IFSS and, of course, all authorities can move to modelling their children's services on the IFSS principle.

1.50 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: My understanding is that integrated family support services were initially based on five pilot schemes across Wales carried out by third sector organisations, including Barnardo's in Flintshire. The evaluation of the early parental intervention pilot project report, published in February, has now, at last, been made public and is very encouraging. It says that the pilot projects were able to impact positively on parental substance misuse, family functioning and child welfare, and that this is more evident in some projects than others. I understand that the Flintshire Barnardo's project was flagged up as perhaps the best of all. Why, therefore, am I being told by the third sector pilot projects that they have not been told how the findings of the report and the lessons learned will be used in

Tudful, eu byrddau a'u gwasanaethau integredig statudol cymorth i deuluoedd. I ddechrau, Gwasanaethau Integredig Cymorth i Deuluoedd ar gael i deuluoedd lle mae'r ffaith bod y rhieni'n camddefnyddio sylweddau yn gwneud y plentyn yn fwy agored i niwed.

Joyce Watson: Byddwch chi'n gwybod y bu menter Dechrau'n Deg, a sefydlwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon i helpu teuluoedd mewn ardaloedd o amddifadedd, yn destun adroddiad interim cadarnhaol yn ddiweddar. Un o brif amcanion y fenter yw darparu arweiniad un ac un i rieni, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn Sir Benfro yng nghanolfan Plant Dewi, lle mae'r rhieni wedi elwa ar y cymorth sydd ar gael. A ydych chi'n cytuno, Ddirprwy Weinidog, mai darparu rhaglenni iaith ac ymwelwyr iechyd, a swyddogion gwybodaeth plant, yw'r dull cywir i gefnogi teuluoedd ac i roi'r cychwyniad gorau posibl i blant mewn bywyd?

Gwenda Thomas: Mae rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg yn darparu amrywiaeth o wasanaethau i deuluoedd i wella'r canlyniadau tymor hwy i'w plant. Rydym yn datblygu'r dull hwn yn ehangach, drwy raglen Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf, i sicrhau y darparwn ddull amlasiantaeth ac aml-ymyriad, os oes angen help ar blant a theuluoedd. Bydd Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf yn ategu'r Gwasanaethau Integredig Cymorth i Deuluoedd ac, wrth reswm, gall pob awdurdod symud tuag at fodelu eu gwasanaethau plant hwy ar egwyddor y gwasanaethau hyn.

Mark Isherwood: Hyd y deallaf fi, roedd gwasanaethau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd yn seiliedig yn wreiddiol ar bum cynllun peilot ledled Cymru a gynhaliwyd gan sefydliadau'r trydydd sector, gan gynnwys Barnardo's yn Sir y Fflint. Mae adroddiad y gwerthusiad o brosiectau peilot ymyrraeth gynnar â rhieni, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Chwefror, erbyn hyn, o'r diwedd, wedi'i gyhoeddi ac mae'n galonogol iawn. Ynddo dywedir bod y prosiectau peilot yn gallu effeithio'n gadarnhaol ar rieni sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, trefn y teulu a lles y plant, a bod hyn yn amlycach mewn rhai prosiectau nag eraill. Deallaf fod prosiect Barnardo's Sir y Fflint wedi'i amlygu fel y gorau oll o bosib. Pam, felly, ydw i'n clywed gan brosiectau peilot y trydydd sector nad ydynt wedi cael gwybod sut bydd

the implementation of the new IFSS teams?

Gwenda Thomas: I do not accept that we have not taken heed of previous programmes, Mark, but I will give you a detailed response on that point. The option 1 programmes that led the way to the IFSS teams were evaluated by the University of Leeds, I think. That option clearly demonstrated benefits for children and that it could also reduce the number of children being taken into care. That was not necessarily the whole answer, but the IFSS principle was developed on the option 1 programme that we pioneered here in Wales. We also know that the Westminster Government has now commissioned Professor Munro to look at children's services and safeguarding. One programme that she will be looking at, I understand, is the Hackney way of working, and I think that we can proudly say that we have taken steps in Wales to put us at the forefront of this programme. We can probably offer the Westminster Government some information and help on how to develop this principle.

Peter Black: I believe that existing pilot schemes are very good and successful, but what timetable exists for considering new pilot schemes, particularly the one being bid for in Swansea? For what period would those pilot schemes run before they were evaluated, with decisions taken on whether they should be rolled out across Wales?

Gwenda Thomas: One of the roles of the national implementation board, and one of the responsibilities based in statute, is that it, along with local boards, has to respond to Ministers on the evaluation and constant monitoring of pioneer areas. The original budget has been set to cover the first three years, but, as I have already said, there is nothing to stop local authorities modelling their services to move towards this principle. I look to responding to Swansea very soon.

Argaeledd Cyffuriau yn y GIG

8. Paul Davies: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am argaeledd cyffuriau yn y GIG.*

canfyddiadau'r adroddiad a'r gwersi a ddysgwyd yn cael eu defnyddio wrth weithredu timau newydd y Gwasanaethau Integredig Cymorth i Deuluoedd?

Gwenda Thomas: Ni dderbyniaf nad ydym wedi ystyried rhaglenni blaenorol, Mark, ond rhoddaf ichi ymateb manwl i'r pwynt hwnnw. Gwerthuswyd y rhaglenni opsiwn 1 a arweiniodd y ffordd at y timau Gwasanaethau Integredig Cymorth i Deuluoedd gan Brifysgol Leeds, rwy'n credu. Roedd yr opsiwn hwnnw'n amlwg yn dangos budd i blant ac y gallai hefyd gwtogi ar niferoedd y plant sy'n cael eu derbyn i ofal. Nid hynny oedd yr ateb cyfan o reidrwydd, ond datblygwyd egwyddor y Gwasanaethau Integredig Cymorth i Deuluoedd ar y rhaglen opsiwn 1 a arloeswyd gennym yma yng Nghymru. Gwyddom hefyd fod Llywodraeth San Steffan bellach wedi comisiynu'r Athro Munro i edrych ar wasanaethau plant ac ar ddiogelu plant. Hyd y deallaf fi, un o'r rhaglenni y bydd yn eu hystyried yw dull gweithio Hackney, a chredaf y gallwn ddweud yn falch ein bod wedi cymryd camau yng Nghymru i'n rhoi ni ar flaen y rhaglen hon. Yn ôl pob tebyg, gallwn gynnig rhoi gwybod i Lywodraeth San Steffan sut i ddatblygu'r egwyddor hon, a'i helpu i wneud hynny.

Peter Black: Credaf fod y cynlluniau peilot presennol yn llwyddiannus ac yn dda iawn, ond pa amserlen sydd i ystyried cynlluniau peilot newydd, yn arbennig yr un y cynigir amdano yn Abertawe? Am ba gyfnod y byddai'r cynlluniau peilot hynny'n rhedeg cyn iddynt gael eu gwerthuso, gan benderfynu a ddylent gael eu cyflwyno fesul cam ledled Cymru?

Gwenda Thomas: Un o rolau'r bwrdd gweithredu cenedlaethol, ac un o'r cyfrifoldebau sydd mewn statud, yw ei bod yn rhaid i'r bwrdd, ynghyd â byrddau lleol, ymateb i Weinidogion am werthuso a monitro cyson y meysydd arloesi. Mae'r gyllideb wreiddiol wedi'i gosod i ymdrin â'r tair blynedd gyntaf ond, fel y dywedais eisoes, nid oes dim i atal awdurdodau lleol rhag modelu eu gwasanaethau i symud tuag at yr egwyddor hon. Gobeithiaf ymateb i Abertawe yn fuan iawn.

Availability of Drugs within the NHS

8. Paul Davies: *Will the Minister make a statement on the availability of drugs within*

OAQ(3)1741(HSS)

Edwina Hart: All drugs that are deemed clinically necessary and cost-effective by the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence or the all-Wales medicines strategy group are routinely provided to patients by the NHS in Wales.

Paul Davies: I am grateful, Minister, for that response. You will be aware that I have received representations from local pharmacies in my constituency expressing concern at Hywel Dda Local Health Board's instructions to GPs in the area to automatically prescribe branded generic medicines. I wrote to you last month to ask for your comments on this matter, given that branded generic products are frequently not available through wholesalers, meaning that pharmacies either need to refer back to GPs or order directly from manufacturers. This could lead to delays for patients and patient care could be compromised. Given the potentially severe nature of the situation, will you outline what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to help local pharmacies that are in this position?

Edwina Hart: Thank you for your question. I did respond to your letter and I am aware of the concerns of your pharmacists. These are issues that my officials are looking at. If it would be helpful, I will arrange for my pharmaceutical adviser to come down to meet you and your pharmacists to discuss those issues to show that we are being proactive as a Government.

Gareth Jones: Yr wyf wedi gohebu â chi ar y pwnc hwn o'r blaen, fel y gwyddoch, ers i bryderon gael eu mynegi imi gan etholwyr a fferyllwyr lleol ynghylch y ffaith nad oedd rhai cyffuriau ar gael mewn pryd i gleifion. Achosir y broblem gan farchnad lewyrchus ar gyfer mewnforio ac allforio cyfochrog o ganlyniad i brisio gwahanol o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn ôl gwerth cymharol y bunt.

Yr wythnos hon, dywedodd fferyllwyr lleol wrthyf am broblemau parhaus wrth gael cyflenwadau mewn pryd gan gyfanwerthwyr o amryw o wahanol gyffuriau, gan gynnwys Azilect, Sinemet Plus, Femara ac ati, i enwi

the NHS. OAQ(3)1741(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Mae'r holl gyffuriau a ystyrir yn rhai clinigol angenrheidiol a chost-effeithiol gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol neu grŵp strategaeth meddyginiaethau Cymru gyfan yn cael eu darparu'n rheolaidd i gleifion gan y GIG yng Nghymru.

Paul Davies: Rwy'n ddiolchgar, Weinidog, am yr ymateb hwnnw. Byddwch chi'n gwybod imi gael sylwadau gan fferyllfeydd lleol yn fy etholaeth yn mynegi pryder ynghylch cyfarwyddiadau Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda i feddygon teulu yn yr ardal ragnodi meddyginiaethau generig brand yn awtomatig. Ysgrifennais atoch fis diwethaf i ofyn am eich sylwadau am y mater hwn, o ystyried nad yw cynhyrchion generig brand yn aml ar gael drwy gyfanwerthwyr, gan olygu bod angen i fferyllfeydd naill ai gyfeirio'n ôl at feddygon teulu neu archebu'n uniongyrchol oddi wrth weithgynhyrchwyr. Gallai hyn arwain at oedi i gleifion a gallai gofal cleifion gael ei gyfaddawdu. O ystyried bod y sefyllfa'n un ddifrifol o bosibl, a wnewch chi amlinellu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i helpu fferyllfeydd lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa hon?

Edwina Hart: Diolch am eich cwestiwn. Ymatebais i'ch llythyr ac rwy'n ymwybodol o bryderon eich fferyllwyr. Mae'r rhain yn faterion y mae fy swyddogion yn edrych arnynt. Pe byddai'n ddefnyddiol, trefnaf i'm cynghorwr fferyllol ddod i lawr i gyfarfod â chi a'ch fferyllwyr i drafod y pethau hynny i ddangos ein bod yn rhagweithiol fel Llywodraeth.

Gareth Jones: I have corresponded with you on this topic before, as you know Minister, since concerns were expressed to me by constituents and local pharmacists because certain drugs were not available to patients within the required timescale. The problem is caused by a lucrative market for parallel importing and exporting resulting from differential pricing within the European Union according to the relative strength of the pound.

This week, a local pharmacist has told me of continuing problems with obtaining timely supplies from wholesalers of a number of drugs, including Azilect, Sinemet Plus, Femara and so on, to name but a few.

ychedig. Mae fferyllwyr yn y sefyllfa hon yn cael eu gorfodi i dreulio llawer o amser yn archebu cyflenwadau ychwanegol yn uniongyrchol gan yr amrywiol gynhyrchwyr ar wahân. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn parhau i wneud yr hyn y gall ei wneud i fonitro'r sefyllfa a chydweithio â chynhyrchwyr, cyfanwerthwyr a fferyllwyr i sicrhau bod cyffuriau hanfodol yn parhau i fod ar gael mewn pryd i gleifion?

Edwina Hart: Thank you for that question, Gareth. I think that that mirrors a general concern in Wales about what is happening. I understand from my advisers that the pharmacy supply chain is being monitored by chief pharmacists across the UK to ensure that medicines are available for patients who require them. In light of the questions and interest on this, I will certainly return to this subject and possibly issue a note to Members to give an indication of what is happening across Wales.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ(3)1706(HSS), yn ôl.

Ffioedd Defnyddio Ffôn a Theledu mewn Ysbytai

10. Lorraine Barrett: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gamau gweithredu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddiwygio ffioedd defnyddio ffôn a theledu mewn ysbytai. OAQ(3)1711(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: I know that this is an area in which you have an interest, Lorraine. You will be aware from my announcement on 24 September that I have decided that current contracts with providers of bedside hospital telephone and television systems should run their course and not be renewed. Patients will now be able to use their own mobile phones in designated areas of all Welsh hospitals.

Lorraine Barrett: I welcomed your announcement and I am grateful for the letter that you sent me following the announcement when I approached you about it. I agree with you about the telephone charges; they are extortionate. Most people now have a mobile phone and can text each other, which is a lifeline. However, over the last couple of years when I have been visiting family and friends too many times in hospitals, I have noticed the imposition of the large television

Pharmacists in this situation are forced to spend a great deal of time ordering further supplies direct from the various separate manufacturers. Can you reassure us that the Welsh Government continues to do what it can to monitor the situation and work with manufacturers, wholesalers and pharmacists to ensure the continued and timely availability of essential drugs to patients?

Edwina Hart: Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw, Gareth. Rwy'n credu bod hwnnw'n adlewyrchu pryder cyffredinol yng Nghymru am yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Deallaf gan fy nghynghorwyr fod y gadwyn gyflenwi fferylliaeth yn cael ei monitro gan brif fferyllwyr ledled y DU i sicrhau bod meddyginiaeth ar gael i gleifion y mae ei hangen arnynt. Yng ngoleuni'r cwestiynau a'r diddordeb am hyn, byddaf yn siŵr o ddychwelyd i'r pwnc hwn ac efallai'n cyhoeddi nodyn i'r Aelodau i roi syniad o'r hyn sy'n digwydd ledled Cymru.

The Presiding Officer: Question 9, OAQ(3)1706(HSS), is withdrawn.

Telephone and Television Charges in Hospitals

10. Lorraine Barrett: *Will the Minister provide an update on Welsh Assembly Government action to reform telephone and TV charges in hospitals. OAQ(3)1711(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: Gwn fod hwn yn faes sydd o ddiddordeb i chi, Lorraine. Byddwch yn gwybod yn sgil fy nghyhoeddiad ar 24 Medi fy mod wedi penderfynu y dylai contractau cyfredol gyda darparwyr systemau teledu a ffôn ymyl gwely mewn ysbytai redeg eu cwrs a pheidio â chael eu hadnewyddu. Bydd cleifion bellach yn gallu defnyddio eu ffonau symudol eu hunain mewn ardaloedd dynodedig yn holl ysbytai Cymru.

Lorraine Barrett: Croesawais eich cyhoeddiad ac rwy'n ddiolchgar am y llythyr a gefais gennych ar ôl y cyhoeddiad pan soniais wrthyhych am y peth. Cytunaf â chi am y taliadau ffôn; maen nhw'n grocbris. Erbyn hyn, mae gan y rhan fwyaf o bobl ffôn symudol ac maen nhw'n gallu anfon negeseuon testun at ei gilydd, sy'n werth y byd. Fodd bynnag, dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf tra bûm yn ymweld â theulu a ffrindiau gormod o weithiau mewn ysbytai,

sets in the wards. The University Hospital of Wales has the small bedside televisions to which you can connect your headphones, and they do not bother anyone. There is a charge, but I think that it is quite a reasonable charge, particularly for a whole week. Will you take the opportunity to work with all of the local health boards in Wales to see whether the big television sets in the main wards can be replaced by small bedside televisions? When you are ill, you do not really want to listen to the television, but then some people who are ill may just want to listen to something quietly at their bedside.

Edwina Hart: Thank you, Lorraine. I am aware from my own hospital visiting that, sometimes, large televisions can cause altercations even among the most mild-mannered patients who have probably wanted to turn the channel over from association football to something else. I fully understand the issues around bedside televisions because it is a very convenient service, and many patients definitely want to retain it. It is for that reason—before the current contracts end—that local health boards have been asked to look into alternative options to provide bedside television services for patients, which, I hope, will deal with the issue that you have raised today.

Darren Millar: Minister, not only are bedside televisions and telephones often charged for in hospitals, we have a situation where many patients will want to do some reading while they are in hospital. I think of the hospital library services, which are often not available in many hospitals in Wales. What are you doing to ensure that there are adequate sources of reading material for patients where they want to exercise their minds in other ways?

2.00 p.m.

Edwina Hart: The issue around library services in general has not been raised with me. However, I will take it up and make some inquiries about the availability of library services. The voluntary sector is helpful in terms of the books that it provides, so I will try to get an overall picture and write a letter to Members.

Buddsoddi Cyfalaf yn y GIG yng Nghymru

rwyf wedi sylwi ar osod y setiau teledu mawr yn y wardiau. Yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, mae'r setiau teledu bychain wrth ymyl y gwelyau a gallwch gysylltu eich clustffonau â hwy, ac nid ydynt yn ffwdanu neb. Mae tâl yn cael ei godi, ond rwy'n credu bod hwnnw'n dâl digon rhesymol, yn enwedig am wythnos gyfan. A wnewch chi achub ar y cyfle i weithio gyda'r holl fyrddau iechyd lleol yng Nghymru i weld a ellir cael setiau teledu bychain wrth ymyl gwelyau yn lle'r setiau teledu mawrion yn y prif wardiau? Pan fyddwch chi'n sâl, prin y byddwch chi am wrando ar y teledu, ond eto efallai bod rhai pobl sy'n sâl am wrando ar rywbeth yn dawel wrth ymyl eu gwely.

Edwina Hart: Diolch, Lorraine. Rwy'n gwybod o'm hymweliadau fy hun â'r ysbyty fod setiau teledu mawr, weithiau, yn gallu achosi cwerylau ymhlith y cleifion mwyaf addfwyn hyd yn oed a hwythau'n fwy na thebyg wedi ysu am newid y sianel o bêldroed i rywbeth arall. Deallaf yn llawn y materion ynghylch setiau teledu ymyl gwely gan ei fod yn wasanaeth cyfleus iawn, ac mae llawer o gleifion yn bendant am ei gadw. Am y rheswm hwnnw—cyn i'r contractau cyfredol ddod i ben—y gofynnwyd i fyrddau iechyd lleol ystyried dewisiadau eraill yn lle darparu gwasanaethau teledu ymyl gwely i gleifion a fydd, gobeithio, yn delio â'r mater a godasoch chi heddiw.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, nid yn unig y codir tâl am ffonau a setiau teledu ymyl gwely yn aml mewn ysbytai, ond mae gennym sefyllfa lle bydd llawer o gleifion am wneud ychydig o ddarllen tra byddant yn yr ysbyty. Rwy'n meddwl am y gwasanaethau llyfrgell ysbyty, nad ydynt ar gael yn aml mewn llawer o ysbytai yng Nghymru. Beth ydych chi'n gwneud i sicrhau bod ffynonellau digonol o ddeunydd darllen i gleifion os ydynt am ymarfer eu meddyliau mewn ffyrdd eraill?

Edwina Hart: Ni chodwyd y mater ynghylch gwasanaethau llyfrgell yn gyffredinol gyda mi. Fodd bynnag, af ar ei drywydd a gwnaf ymholiadau am argaeledd gwasanaethau llyfrgell. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn ddefnyddiol o ran y llyfrau a ddarpara, felly ceisiaf gael darlun cyffredinol ac ysgrifennaf llythyr at Aelodau.

Capital Investment in the Welsh NHS

11. Lynne Neagle: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am fuddsoddi cyfalaf yn y GIG yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)1685(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: Over the lifetime of this Assembly Government, we are allocating £1.4 billion of capital resources to the NHS in Wales to bring major improvements in the access to and quality of services provided.

Lynne Neagle: Thank you for that answer, Minister. The cuts to the Assembly Government's budget will unfortunately mean that you will face difficult choices in the weeks and months ahead. What assurances can you give that the lynchpin of the Clinical Futures programme in Gwent—the specialist and critical care centre earmarked for Cwmbran—will go ahead as planned, even if it means constructing it on a phased basis?

Edwina Hart: It is my intention that it will go ahead, even though it may be constructed on a phased basis. I do not know what capital allocations we will have, and that will be a matter for Jane Hutt to advise the National Assembly on. The Government will then make decisions on budget allocations in respect of revenue and capital expenditure.

Jonathan Morgan: Minister, I am sure that you would wish to join me in welcoming the fact that the Assembly Government will have more money to spend on health as a result of the comprehensive spending review announced at lunch time. Health expenditure in England is to increase and the Barnett consequential will mean that the Welsh Assembly Government will have more money to spend on the health service. Minister, you will know that I have been supportive of the quite considerable and radical reform that the Cardiff and Vale University Health Board is seeking to implement in my area, in particular the changes at Whitchurch Hospital where there are plans to move the acute hospital to Llandough and to revamp the Whitchurch site into a new modern health facility. Will the Minister confirm that the capital funding that had been allocated for that project is still available, and that it is still the intention of the Assembly Government to support the Cardiff and Vale health board's plans in

11. Lynne Neagle: *Will the Minister provide an update on capital investment in the Welsh NHS. OAQ(3)1685(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: Yn ystod oes y Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon, rydym yn dyrannu £1.4 biliwn o adnoddau cyfalaf i'r GIG yng Nghymru i achosi gwelliannau mawr o ran cael at wasanaethau a ddarperir ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau hynny.

Lynne Neagle: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Bydd y toriadau i gyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn golygu'n anffodus y byddwch chi'n wynebu dewisiadau anodd yn yr wythnosau a'r misoedd nesaf. Pa sicrhad y gallwch ei roi y bydd elfen hanfodol rhaglen Dyfodol Clinigol yng Ngwent—sef y ganolfan gofal critigol ac arbenigol a glustnodwyd i Gwmbrân—yn mynd yn ei blaen yn ôl y bwriad, hyd yn oed os yw hynny'n golygu ei hadeiladu fesul dipyn?

Edwina Hart: Rwy'n bwriadu iddi fynd yn ei blaen, er bydd efallai'n cael ei hadeiladu fesul dipyn. Ni wn pa ddyraniadau cyfalaf a fydd gennym, a bydd hwnnw'n fater i Jane Hutt gynghori'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ei gylch. Bydd y Llywodraeth yn gwneud penderfyniadau wedyn ar ddyraniadau cyllideb o ran gwariant cyfalaf a refeniw.

Jonathan Morgan: Weinidog, rwy'n siŵr y byddech yn dymuno ymuno â mi i groesawu'r ffaith y bydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad fwy o arian i'w wario ar iechyd o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant a gyhoeddwyd amser cinio. Mae gwariant iechyd yn Lloegr am gynyddu a bydd canlyniad Barnett yn golygu y bydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fwy o arian i'w wario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Weinidog, gwyddoch fy mod wedi cefnogi'r diwygio radical ac eithaf sylweddol y mae Bwrdd Iechyd Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro'n ceisio ei weithredu yn fy ardal i, yn arbennig y newidiadau yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd lle mae cynlluniau i symud yr ysbyty aciwt i Landochau ac ailwampio safle'r Eglwys Newydd yn gyfleuster iechyd modern newydd. A wna'r Gweinidog gadarnhau bod y cyllid cyfalaf a ddyrannwyd i'r prosiect hwnnw yn dal ar gael, a bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dal yn bwriadu cefnogi cynlluniau Bwrdd Iechyd Caerdydd a'r Fro yn yr Eglwys Newydd?

Whitchurch?

Edwina Hart: We all agree that we would wish to support what Cardiff and Vale University Health Board is doing in Whitchurch Hospital, and I thank you and other Cardiff Members for the way in which you have dealt with the issues around the reorganisation of services at that particular site. It is a key priority as part of the Cardiff and Vale health board's proposals, and I hope that nothing will put it off track.

Amser Aros ar gyfer Awdioleg

12. David Lloyd: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr amser aros ar gyfer awdioleg yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)1703(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: As at the end of August 2010, there were no patients waiting over 14 weeks for a first fitting of an adult hearing aid anywhere in Wales.

David Lloyd: Diolch yn fawr am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Gan gofio bod un mewn saith o bobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn drwm eu clyw neu'n fyddar ac y bydd nifer y bobl hŷn yn cynyddu dros y blynnyddoedd nesaf, sy'n golygu y bydd y nifer sy'n drwm eu clyw neu'n fyddar hefyd yn cynyddu yn yr un modd, beth sy'n digwydd i flaengynllunio gwasanaethau awdioleg i ymdopi â'r cynnydd yn y galw am y gwasanaethau hyn y byddwn yn ei weld yn y blynnyddoedd sydd i ddod?

Edwina Hart: There are many internal discussions taking place with my audiology adviser and with the voluntary sector about the large increase in the number of people accessing services. The decision will have to be taken in the round after taking budgetary considerations into account, but I am well aware of the points that you make about an ageing population and the requirement for access to services.

David Melding: Minister, you may know that there are increasing calls for some form of screening service for children to identify hearing loss early so that they can be helped in terms of their condition and also their educational attainment as a consequence. At the moment, this does not seem to be viable because of the number of audiologists. Are you looking at this as an area of service that could be developed?

Edwina Hart: I would have to look at it in the context of the budget; however, it is an

Edwina Hart: Cytunwn oll y dymunem gefnogi'r hyn y mae Bwrdd Iechyd Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro yn ei wneud yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd, a diolchaf i chi ac Aelodau eraill Caerdydd am y ffordd yr ydych wedi delio â'r materion ynghylch ad-drefnu gwasanaethau yn y safle arbennig hwnnw. Mae'n flaenoriaeth allweddol yn rhan o gynigion bwrdd iechyd Caerdydd a'r Fro, a gobeithiaf na fydd dim yn ei rhwystro.

Waiting Time for Audiology

12. David Lloyd: *Will the Minister provide an update on the waiting time for audiology in Wales. OAQ(3)1703(HSS)*

Edwina Hart: Fel ar ddiwedd mis Awst 2010, nid oedd unrhyw gleifion yn aros dros 14 wythnos am osod cymorth clyw cyntaf i oedolyn yn unman yng Nghymru.

David Lloyd: Thank you very much for that answer, Minister. Bearing in mind that one in seven of older people in Wales are hard of hearing or deaf and that the number of older people will increase in the coming years, which will mean that the number of people who are hard of hearing or deaf will increase as a consequence, what is happening in terms of forward planning of audiology services to enable them to cope with the increase in demand for these services in future years?

Edwina Hart: Mae llawer o drafodaethau mewnol yn digwydd â'm cynghorwr awdioleg a chyda'r sector gwirfoddol am y cynnydd mawr yn nifer y bobl sy'n cael at wasanaethau. Bydd rhaid gwneud y penderfyniad yn ei holl agweddau ar ôl ystyried y gyllideb, ond rwy'n ymwybodol iawn o'r pwyntiau a wnewch am boblogaeth sy'n heneiddio ac am y gofyniad i gael at wasanaethau.

David Melding: Weinidog, hwyrach eich bod yn gwybod bod galw cynyddol am ryw fath o wasanaeth sgrinio i blant i adnabod byddardod yn gynnar er mwyn eu helpu gyda'u cyflwr a hefyd eu cyrhaeddiad addysgol o ganlyniad. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw hyn fel petai'n ddichonadwy oherwydd nifer yr awdiolegwyr. A ydych chi'n edrych ar hwn yn faes gwasanaeth y gellid ei ddatblygu?

Edwina Hart: Byddai'n rhaid imi edrych arno yng nghyd-destun y gyllideb; fodd

area that should be developed as it is important. bynnag, mae'n faes a ddylai gael ei ddatblygu am ei fod yn bwysig.

Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth

Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport

Contractau'r Gemau Olympaidd

Olympic Contracts

1. Jenny Randerson: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gontractau'r Gemau Olympaidd y mae cwmnïau yng Nghymru wedi'u hennill. OAQ(3)1638(ECT)*

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A number of Welsh companies have secured tier 1 Olympic contracts. In addition, over 22 have secured associated tier 2 and 3 major supply chain contracts within tier 1 company supply chains, with a total value exceeding £37 million.

Jenny Randerson: Taking only the tier 1 contracts into consideration and comparing Wales with Northern Ireland and Scotland, you will be aware that Wales did relatively badly, in that we won only £570,000-worth of tier 1 contracts, compared to £22 million in Scotland and £17 million in Northern Ireland. Can you explain why Wales did relatively badly in that exercise?

The Deputy First Minister: As I have told you, Jenny, there were also a number of tier 2 and 3 contracts associated with the awarding of tier 1 contracts, which is a better reflection of Welsh businesses' success. You will be aware that almost another £700 million-worth of tier 1 contracts are to be awarded. You have asked me why Welsh companies have not done better, but what we need to know from the UK coalition Government is whether we will have our fair share of Olympic regeneration spending. We are waiting for that decision, which is now in dispute, and I hope that the Liberal Democrat Chief Secretary to the Treasury will listen carefully to our representations.

Jenny Randerson: To go back to the contracts and the question that I asked you, tier 2 and 3 contracts are very important, but Northern Ireland and Scotland are also doing

1. Jenny Randerson: *Will the Minister make a statement on Olympic contracts won by Welsh companies. OAQ(3)1638(ECT)*

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae nifer o gwmnïau yng Nghymru wedi sicrhau contractau Olympaidd haen 1. Hefyd, mae dros 22 wedi sicrhau contractau cadwyn gyflenwi mawr haen 2 a 3 cysylltiedig mewn cadwyni cyflenwi cwmni haen 1, sydd oll yn werth mwy na £37 miliwn.

Jenny Randerson: Gan ystyried y contractau haen 1 yn unig a chan gymharu Cymru â Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban, gwyddoch fod Cymru wedi gwneud yn gymharol wael, am inni ennill dim ond gwerth £570,000 o gontractau haen 1, o'i gymharu â £22 miliwn yn yr Alban a £17 miliwn yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. A allwch egluro pam wnaeth Cymru'n gymharol wael yn yr ymarfer hwnnw?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud wrthy, Jenny, roedd hefyd nifer o gontractau haen 2 a 3 yn gysylltiedig â dyfarnu contractau haen 1, sy'n adlewyrchu llwyddiant busnesau Cymru'n well. Byddwch chi'n gwybod bod gwerth bron i £700 miliwn arall o gontractau haen 1 i'w dyfarnu. Rydych wedi gofyn imi pam na wnaeth cwmnïau Cymru'n well, ond yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wybod gan Lywodraeth glymblaid y DU yw a fyddwn yn cael ein cyfran deg o wariant adfywio'r Gemau Olympaidd. Rydym yn disgwyl y penderfyniad hwnnw, sydd bellach yn cael ei drafod, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Democrat Rhyddfrydol sy'n Brif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys yn gwrando'n ofalus ar ein sylwadau.

Jenny Randerson: Gan ddychwelyd i'r contractau a'r cwestiwn a ofynnais ichi, mae contractau haen 2 a 3 yn bwysig iawn, ond mae Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban hefyd yn

extremely well on those in comparison with us. In view of how badly we did, why have you not made more personal representations to the UK Government? You say that you wish to do so, and that you are doing so on regeneration funding, but the important thing is securing those contracts. You said that £700 million-worth of contracts are still to be given out. What are you doing, through direct contact with the UK Government, to ensure that we do better on the remaining contracts than we did on the early ones?

The Deputy First Minister: I can assure you that we are working extremely hard with Welsh businesses. For example, we are hosting a number of visits to the London Organising Committee of the Olympic and Paralympic Games and the Olympic Delivery Authority, at which many representatives of the business community in Wales have been present. We have made direct representations to Lord Coe. A series of Olympics 2012 seminars and meet-the-buyer events have been held for businesses across Wales, and the enterprise team continues to provide advice and support. We have made tendering opportunities available by part-funding CompeteFor. We have done a great deal. However, I return to the point that I hope that we will get the support of Members on the opposite side of the Chamber for our claim for a full Barnett share of the regeneration spend on Olympic contracts, which has been denied to us by the UK Government.

David Lloyd: To reiterate, as Jenny Randerson outlined, there is no doubt that Wales is losing out in relation to the Olympics, not least as regards not having the Barnett consequential, which you just mentioned, Deputy First Minister, and all the lottery funding that we have also lost out on. The betrayals do not end there. In fact, in the last few days, the betrayals have been stacking up: after the passport office and our not getting any change to Barnett, today's betrayal is the threat to end S4C as we know it. Will you join me in deploring the coalition attack on S4C today?

The Deputy First Minister: Although the original question is on the Olympics, and I fully appreciate that, Dai is right to point out that we need to consider the kind of

gwneud yn dda iawn ar y rheini o'u cymharu â ni. O ystyried cynddrwg a wnaethom, pam nad ydych wedi gwneud mwy o sylwadau personol i Lywodraeth y DU? Dywedwch eich bod yn dymuno gwneud hynny, a'ch bod yn gwneud hynny ar gyllid adfywio, ond y peth pwysig yw sicrhau'r contractau hynny. Dywedasoed fod gwerth £700 miliwn o gontractau i'w dyfarnu o hyd. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud, drwy gysylltiad uniongyrchol â Llywodraeth y DU, i sicrhau y gwnawn ni'n well ar y contractau sy'n weddill nag y gwnaethom ar y rhai cynnar?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Gallaf eich sicrhau chi ein bod yn gweithio'n galed dros ben gyda busnesau Cymru. Er enghraifft, rydym yn cynnal nifer o ymweliadau â Phwyllgor Trefnu Gemau Olympaidd a Pharalympaidd Llundain ac Awdurdod Gweithredu'r Gemau Olympaidd, lle bu llawer o gynrychiolwyr o'r gymuned fusnes yng Nghymru'n bresennol. Rydym wedi gwneud sylwadau uniongyrchol i Arglwydd Coe. Cynhaliwyd cyfres o ddiwyddiadau cwrdd â'r prynwr a seminarau Gemau Olympaidd 2012 i fusnesau ledled Cymru, ac mae'r tîm menter yn dal yn rhoi cyngor a chymorth. Rydym wedi sicrhau bod cyfleoedd i dendro ar gael drwy ariannu rhan o CompeteFor. Rydym wedi gwneud cryn dipyn. Fodd bynnag, dychwelaf i'r pwynt y gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambr yn cefnogi ein cais am gyfran Barnett lawn o'r gwariant adfywio ar gontractau Olympaidd, a wrthodwyd inni gan Lywodraeth y DU.

David Lloyd: I ailadrodd, fel yr amlinellodd Jenny Randerson, does dim dwywaith bod Cymru ar ei cholled mewn perthynas â'r Gemau Olympaidd, nid lleiaf o ran peidio â chael canlyniad Barnett, yr ydych newydd sôn amdano, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, a'r holl gyllid loteri a gollasom hefyd. Nid yno y daw'r bradychu i ben. Mewn gwirionedd, yn yr ychydig ddiwrnodau diwethaf, pentyrro fu'r bradychiadau: ar ôl y swyddfa basbort a ninnau'n methu â chael unrhyw newid yn Barnett, y bradychiad heddiw yw bygwth rhoi pen ar S4C fel yr ydym yn ei hadnabod. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i resynu at ymosodiad y glymblaid ar S4C heddiw?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Er bod y cwestiwn gwreiddiol yn ymwneud â'r Gemau Olympaidd, ac rwy'n llawn werthfawrogi hynny, mae Dai yn llygad ei le fod angen inni

investment that is coming to Wales. To go back to the regeneration funding for the Olympics, this is a matter where the Welsh Assembly Government, the Scottish Government and the Northern Ireland Executive are all making the same claim, that is, that we are not getting our Barnett share of the amount that is being spent on regeneration. We now have a new Government in Westminster. Can we please have the necessary support to ensure that Wales gets its fair share of that spend?

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is indeed about the Olympics. I have accepted an urgent question of public importance about broadcasting matters, which will appear later. I will not call on Dr Dai Lloyd to speak then, because he has already talked about it.

William Graham: May I first respond to the Deputy First Minister's question as to the intentions of the Welsh Conservative group on the particular matter that he raised? May I remind him that we called for that from the previous Government? We will continue to call on this Government to do exactly what he wants, because we believe that the Barnett formula requires alteration in that particular respect.

2.10 p.m.

The Deputy First Minister will know of the success achieved by the Newport-based engineering firm, Cintec, in restoring the Mangi bridge in Delhi, which provided a gateway to the recent Commonwealth Games. Deputy First Minister, although you gave a good explanation of what you are doing to help firms, would you consider making grants available so that they can be certain that they understand, and are able to comply fully with, what is a very involved tendering process?

The Deputy First Minister: As you would imagine, it is very difficult for me to agree to grant applications on the floor of the Chamber, but if there is a business case to be put forward, it would be considered in the normal way.

Trydaneiddio'r Rheilffordd

2. Nerys Evans: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd rhwng Llundain ac Abertawe i economi Cymru. OAQ(3)1649(ECT)*

ystyried y math o fuddsoddiad sy'n dod i Gymru. Gan ddychwelyd i'r cyllid adfywio ar gyfer y Gemau Olympaidd, mae hwn yn fater lle mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, Llywodraeth yr Alban a Gweithrediaeth Gogledd Iwerddon oll yn honni'r un peth, hynny yw, nad ydym yn cael ein cyfran Barnett o'r swm sy'n cael ei wario ar adfywio. Mae gennym Lywodraeth newydd yn San Steffan erbyn hyn. A gawn ni'r gefnogaeth angenrheidiol os gwelwch yn dda i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chyfran deg o'r gwariant hwnnw?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Am y Gemau Olympaidd y mae'r cwestiwn hwn, yn wir. Rwyf wedi derbyn cwestiwn brys o bwysigrwydd cyhoeddus am faterion darlledu, a bydd hwnnw'n ymddangos yn nes ymlaen. Ni fyddaf yn galw ar Dr Dai Lloyd i siarad bryd hynny, am ei fod eisoes wedi siarad amdano.

William Graham: A gaf fi ymateb yn gyntaf i gwestiwn y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am fwiadau grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru ar y mater arbennig a gododd? A gaf fi ei atgoffa ein bod wedi galw am hynny oddi wrth y Llywodraeth flaenorol? Byddwn yn parhau i alw ar y Llywodraeth hon i wneud yn union yr hyn y mae ei eisiau, am ein bod yn credu bod gofyn newid fformiwla Barnett yn hynny o beth yn arbennig.

Bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gwybod am lwyddiant y cwmni peirianeg Cintec, sydd yng Nghasnewydd, yn adfer pont Mangi yn Delhi, a agorodd y drws i Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn ddiweddar. Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, er eich bod yn egluro'n dda yr hyn rydych chi'n ei wneud i helpu cwmnïau, a fyddech chi'n ystyried gwneud grantiau ar gael fel y gallant fod yn sicr eu bod yn deall, ac yn gallu cydymffurfio'n llawn â phroses dendro sy'n ddyrys iawn?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Fel y byddech yn ei ddychmygu, mae'n anodd iawn imi gytuno i ganiatáu ceisiadau ar lawr y Siambr, ond os oes achos busnes i'w gyflwyno, byddai'n cael ei ystyried yn y ffordd arferol.

Railway Electrification

2. Nerys Evans: *Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of railway electrification between London and Swansea for the Welsh economy. OAQ(3)1649(ECT)*

7. Nerys Evans : Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd rhwng Llundain ac Abertawe. OAQ(3)1648(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr oeddwn wedi fy mhlesio gan gyhoeddiad Llywodraeth flaenorol y Deyrnas Unedig ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Yr wyf yn disgwyl cyhoeddiad a rhagor o fanylion am yr hyn y bydd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn ei olygu o ran trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd yng Nghymru. Yr wyf o'r farn bod trydaneiddio prif linell reilffordd y Great Western yn hanfodol, am resymau economaidd ac amgylcheddol, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yn cael ei wireddu.

Nerys Evans: Mae trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd i Abertawe yn bwysig nid yn unig i economi de Cymru, ond hefyd i economi gorllewin Cymru—sir Gaerfyrddin a sir Benfro—hefyd. Mae'n warthus bod 37 y cant o rwydwaith rheilffyrdd y Deyrnas Unedig wedi'i drydaneiddio ac nad yw dim o'r cyfanswm hwnnw wedi'i leoli yng Nghymru. Mae'n warthus hefyd bod rhaid inni ymladd i gael un llinell wedi'i thrydaneiddio, sy'n dangos lle mae uchelgais Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym newydd wrando ar adolygiad gwariant y Canghellor, ac nid oedd unrhyw wybodaeth o gwbl ar gael ynghylch trydaneiddio'r llinell i Abertawe. A ydych mewn sefyllfa i roi mwy o wybodaeth inni am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf? Pa drafodaethau ydych chi wedi eu cael gyda'r Gweinidog yn Llundain ar y mater hwn?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Fel mae Nerys yn gwybod, yr oeddem yn llawenhau pan gafwyd cyhoeddiad gan y cyn-Weinidog dros drafnidiaeth y byddai'r cynllun hwn yn mynd yn ei flaen, ac yr oeddem yn dathlu'r ffaith bod gobaith y byddai Cymru, am y tro cyntaf, yn cael o leiaf un llinell wedi ei thrydaneiddio cyn belled ag Abertawe. Yr ydym wedi clywed, bellach, fod y Llywodraeth bresennol yn parhau i ystyried y mater. Yr oeddem yn hynod o siomedig na wnaethpwyd datganiad clir gan y Canghellor heddiw bod y cynllun hwn yn mynd yn ei flaen. Yr ydym yn deall yn awr o'r trafodaethau rhwng ein swyddogion na fydd cyhoeddiad tan yr wythnos nesaf. Mae'n bwysig inni danlinellu pa mor bwysig yw'r

7. Nerys Evans: What recent discussions has the Minister had regarding railway electrification between London and Swansea. OAQ(3)1648(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: I was pleased by the announcement of the previous UK Government on this matter. I am awaiting an announcement and further detail on what the comprehensive spending review will mean for the electrification of the railway in Wales. I consider the electrification of the Great Western main line to be essential for economic and environmental reasons and hope it is taken forward.

Nerys Evans: Electrification of the railway to Swansea is not only important to the economy of south Wales, but to the economy of west Wales—Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire—also. It is appalling that 37 per cent of the UK network is electrified and that none of that 37 per cent is in Wales. It is also disgraceful that we have to fight for the electrification of one line in Wales, which shows where the ambition of the UK Government lies. We have just listened to the Chancellor's comprehensive spending review, and there was no information at all about electrification of the line to Swansea. Can you give us more details on the latest situation? What discussions have you had with the Minister in London on this matter?

The Deputy First Minister: As Nerys knows, we were delighted when the former Minister for transport announced that this scheme would go ahead, and we celebrated the fact that, for the first time, there was hope that Wales would have at least one line electrified as far as Swansea. We have now heard that the present Government is still considering the matter. We were extremely disappointed that the Chancellor did not make a clear statement today that the scheme would go ahead. We now understand from the discussions between our officials that there will not be an announcement until next week. It is important that we underline the importance of this scheme to Wales. I had an opportunity to raise the matter with the

cynllun hwn i Gymru. Cefais gyfle i godi'r mater gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn Llundain ac un o'r Gweinidogion eraill yn yr adran. Yr wyf wedi cael dau gyfarfod i drafod y mater yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y cynllun yn mynd yn ei flaen, am y rhesymau amlwg yr ydych wedi'u hamlinellu, Nerys.

David Melding: It is my understanding that, in the coming months, the Westminster Government will be making clear its full programme for the prioritisation of electrification in Britain, and you will know that the Welsh Conservatives believe that the electrification of the Great Western main line all the way to Swansea is a huge priority. It is important that you reiterate the case to the Westminster Government and relay the support that you have from all parties in the Assembly, including the Welsh Conservatives. I daresay that getting colleagues in local authorities in Bristol and Swindon to voice their support would also be useful, because this scheme would be of great benefit to the English economy as well as that of Wales.

The Deputy First Minister: I thank you for that support, David; I know that there is cross-party support in the Assembly for the electrification scheme. I hear what you say; it is my understanding also that the Department for Transport will be making its programme clear in the coming weeks. I did find it a little surprising that the Chancellor was able to say today that certain schemes were going ahead, including an electrification scheme in the north-west of England, and other major infrastructure projects. I hope that all of the pressure that we can exert—including the pressure that I will be exerting in my meeting with Phillip Hammond, the Secretary of State for Transport, Theresa Villiers, the Minister who is responsible for this matter, and the Secretary of State for Wales—will convince the UK Government to deliver this project.

Tollau Pont Hafren

3. William Graham: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddefnyddio cardiau credyd/debyd i dalu tollau Pont Hafren. OAQ(3)1652(ECT)*

The Deputy First Minister: Following the introduction of card payments for the duration of the Ryder Cup, the Highways

Secretary of State in London and one of the other Ministers in the department. I have had two meetings to discuss the matter in the last few months, and I hope that the scheme will go ahead, for the obvious reasons that you have outlined, Nerys.

David Melding: Hyd y deallaf fi, yn y misoedd i ddod, bydd Llywodraeth San Steffan yn egluro ei rhaglen lawn i flaenoriaethu'r trydaneiddio ym Mhrydain, a byddwch chi'n gwybod bod Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n credu bod trydaneiddio prif reilffordd Great Western yr holl ffordd i Abertawe yn flaenoriaeth enfawr. Mae'n bwysig ichi ailadrodd yr achos i Lywodraeth San Steffan a chyfleu'r gefnogaeth sydd gennych gan bob plaid yn y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Mae'n ddiaw gennyf y byddai'n ddefnyddiol hefyd cael cydweithwyr mewn awdurdodau lleol ym Mryste a Swindon i leisio eu cefnogaeth, oherwydd byddai'r cynllun hwn o fudd mawr i economi Lloegr yn ogystal ag economi Cymru.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Diolchaf ichi am eich cefnogaeth, David; gwn fod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad i'r cynllun trydaneiddio. Clywaf yr hyn a ddywedwch; deallaf innau hefyd y bydd yr Adran Drafnidiaeth yn gwneud ei rhaglen yn glir yn yr wythnosau nesaf. Synnais ychydig o glywed bod y Canghellor yn gallu dweud heddiw fod rhai cynlluniau'n mynd yn eu blaenau, gan gynnwys cynllun trydaneiddio yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr, a phrosiectau seilwaith mawr eraill. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr holl bwysau y gallwn ni eu gosod-gan gynnwys y pwysau y byddaf innau'n eu gosod yn fy nghyfarfod â Phillip Hammond, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Theresa Villiers, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y mater hwn, ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru-yn darbwylo Llywodraeth y DU i gyflenwi'r prosiect hwn.

Severn Bridge Tolls

3. William Graham: *Will the Minister make a statement on the use of credit/debit cards for payment of Severn Bridge tolls. OAQ(3)1652(ECT)*

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Ar ôl cyflwyno taliadau cerdyn yn ystod Cwpan Ryder, mae Asiantaeth y Priffyrdd a Severn River

Agency and Severn River Crossing plc are working to put in place a permanent system that will not require personal identification number input at peak times early next year.

William Graham: Thank you for your answer, Deputy First Minister, which is a source of great encouragement. You will know that the tariff is a barrier to trade and that any way of ameliorating the cost would be of great help to Welsh businesses. Therefore, will that be implemented this year?

The Deputy First Minister: It is difficult for us to know, William, because this is a matter to be taken forward by the UK Government and the concessionaire. I understand that the permanent card payment system will be fully operational early next year, but that is the latest information that we have. The costs associated with implementing and managing a card system are a matter for the UK Government and the concessionaire.

Chris Franks: Are you as concerned as I am about the extra tax on the Welsh economy that is the Severn bridge tolls? I have met the Road Freight Association, which is worried about the impact of the tolls. What instructions have you given to the company carrying out the study that your department has commissioned? Who is it speaking to, and in what detail? What crossing management structure would the Welsh Government like to see once the debt to Severn River Crossing plc is paid off? These tolls have been called little more than a 'road poll tax', and given the recent hammer blows to the Welsh economy, will there be an opportunity to remove the tolls once the debt has been settled?

The Deputy First Minister: It is a little difficult to predict that, Chris, because the end date of the concession is flexible, until the debt has been paid off. As a result of the recession, the number of vehicles crossing the bridge has reduced, which could lengthen the period until the tolls come to an end. I can tell you, however, that we are taking forward the independent study that you referred to, which will consider the economic impact of the tolls. The study is being overseen by the economic research advisory panel, and it will explore in depth the magnitude of the impact of the tolls, as well as assessing the impact on the Welsh economy. I am also aware that the Welsh Affairs Committee is conducting an

Crossing plc yn gweithio i roi system barhaol ar waith tua dechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf na fydd yn gofyn cofnodi rhif adnabod personol ar adegau brig.

William Graham: Diolch am eich ateb, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, sy'n galonogol iawn. Byddwch chi'n gwybod bod y doll yn rhwystro masnach ac y byddai unrhyw ffordd o wella'r gost o fudd mawr i fusnesau Cymru. Felly, a fydd hynny'n cael ei weithredu eleni?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae'n anodd inni wybod, William, oherwydd mater yw hwn i'w ddatblygu gan Lywodraeth y DU a'r consesiynydd. Deallaf y bydd y system barhaol i dalu â chardiau yn gwbl weithredol tua dechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf, ond dyna'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf sydd gennyf. Mae'r costau sy'n gysylltiedig â gweithredu a rheoli system gardiau yn fater i Lywodraeth y DU a'r consesiynydd.

Chris Franks: A ydych chi'n poeni cymaint â mi am y dreth ychwanegol ar economi Cymru, sef tollau pont Hafren? Rwyf wedi cyfarfod â'r Gymdeithas Cludo Nwyddau ar y Ffyrdd, sy'n poeni am effaith y tollau. Pa gyfarwyddiadau a roddwyd gennych i'r cwmni sy'n cynnal yr astudiaeth a gomisiynwyd gan eich adran? Gyda phwy mae'n siarad, ac ym mha fanylder? Pa strwythur rheoli croesi yr hoffai Llywodraeth Cymru ei weld ar ôl i'r holl ddyled gael ei thalu i Severn River Crossing plc? Dywedwyd nad yw'r tollau hyn yn ddim llawer mwy na 'threth y pen ar ffyrdd', ac o ystyried yr ergydion nerthol diweddar i economi Cymru, a fydd cyfle i gael gwared ar y tollau pan fydd y ddyled wedi'i thalu?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Braidd yn anodd yw rhagweld hynny, Chris, gan fod dyddiad diwedd y consesiwn yn hyblyg, nes bod y ddyled wedi'i thalu. O ganlyniad i'r dirwasgiad, mae nifer y cerbydau sy'n croesi'r bont wedi lleihau, a allai gynyddu'r cyfnod tan ddaw'r tollau i ben. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud wrthy ch ein bod yn mynd ymlaen â'r astudiaeth annibynnol y cyfeiriasoch ati, a fydd yn ystyried effaith economaidd y tollau. Mae'r astudiaeth yn cael ei goruchwylio gan y panel cynghori ymchwil economaidd, a bydd yn archwilio'n fanwl faint o effaith y mae'r tollau'n ei chael, ac yn asesu'r effaith ar economi Cymru. Rwyf hefyd yn ymwybodol bod y Pwyllgor

inquiry into the future of the tolls, and I will have great pleasure in giving evidence to that committee when it comes to the Assembly after recess.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4, OAQ(3)1635(ECT), yn ôl.

Materion Cymreig yn cynnal ymchwiliad i ddyfodol y tollau, a bydd yn bleser mawr gennyf roi tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor hwnnw pan ddaw i'r Cynulliad ar ôl y gwyliau.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4, OAQ(3)1635(ECT), was withdrawn.

Blaenoriaethau

5. Paul Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweddill y Trydydd Cynulliad. OAQ(3)1669(ECT)

10. Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweddill tymor hwn y Cynulliad. OAQ(3)1693(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Fy mlaenoriaeth yw gwireddu gweledigaeth 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd' a buddsoddi mewn seilwaith cynaliadwy o ansawdd uchel.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Gwn y bydd yn cytuno bod gwella'r system drafnidiaeth yn bwysig oherwydd effaith positif hynny ar yr economi.

Hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog at stori sydd wedi bod yn flaenllaw yn fy etholaeth yn ddiweddar, sef bod mwy na £30,000 wedi'i wario ar asesu'r posibilrwydd o adeiladu ffordd osgoi i Aberdaugleddau. Mae pryderon bod yr arian hwn wedi'i wario heb i'r cynllun allu mynd ei ei flaen. Derbyniaf y bydd cyllidebau'n dynn yn y dyfodol agos, ond a all y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ddweud wrthym sut y mae ei adran yn asesu cynlluniau o'r fath, a pha drafodaethau y mae ef a'i swyddogion wedi'u cael gydag awdurdodau lleol am y cynllun penodol hwn i Aberdaugleddau?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Gobeithio y bydd Paul yn maddau imi, ond nid oes gennyf fanylion am y cynllun y mae'n cyfeirio ato. Ni wn a yw'n cael ei ystyried fel rhan o gynllun yr awdurdod lleol neu a yw'n rhan o gynllun un o'r ffyrdd sy'n dod o dan reolaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly, ymddiheuraf i Paul am nad wyf yn gallu rhoi ateb clir iddo heddiw, ond gobeithio y gall dderbyn y byddaf yn ysgrifennu ato maes o law gyda mwy o fanylion am y cynllun. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn gyffredinol

Priorities

5. Paul Davies: Will the Minister outline his priorities for the remainder of the Third Assembly. OAQ(3)1669(ECT)

10. Lynne Neagle: Will the Minister outline his priorities for the remainder of this Assembly term. OAQ(3)1693(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: My priority is to implement 'Economic Renewal: a new direction' and to invest in high-quality and sustainable infrastructure.

Paul Davies: I am grateful to the Deputy First Minister for that response. I know that he will agree that it is important to improve the transport system because of the positive impact that would have on the economy.

I wish to draw the Deputy First Minister's attention to a story that has been prominent in my constituency recently, namely that more than £30,000 has been spent on assessing the feasibility of developing a bypass to Milford Haven. There are concerns that that money has been spent although the scheme cannot progress. I accept that budgets will be tight in the near future, but can the Deputy First Minister tell us how his department is assessing such schemes, and what discussions has he and his officials had with local authorities about this specific scheme for Milford Haven?

The Deputy First Minister: I hope that Paul will forgive me, but I do not have any details about the scheme to which he refers. I do not know whether it is being considered as part of the local authority's plan or whether it is a part of a scheme for one of the roads that comes under the Assembly Government's control. Therefore, I apologise to Paul as I cannot give him a definitive answer today, but I hope that he can accept that I will write to him in due course with more details about the scheme. However, what happens

yw bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn amserlennu rhaglenni sydd, fel arfer, yn y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol, sydd wedi'i gyhoeddi, ac oherwydd y cwtogi amlwg ar wariant cyfalaf yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod, mae'n annhebyg y byddwn yn gallu ystyried unrhyw gynllun sydd heb ei gynnwys yn y rhaglen honno.

Lynne Neagle: As you know, Deputy First Minister, a number of important employers in Torfaen have received support from the Assembly Government's ProAct and ReAct schemes. That support has helped them to keep people in jobs and to allow those facing redundancy to retain and gain new skills. Given the scale of the cuts that we know are on the way from Westminster and the impact that they will have on the whole Welsh economy, what scope is there to introduce similar schemes on a longer-term basis in Wales?

2.20 p.m.

The Deputy First Minister: You point to an important part of the work that the Assembly Government was able to undertake during the recession: supporting key skills in companies across Wales. We recognise the benefits of the ProAct scheme and want to take that forward, and the Deputy Minister for Skills is responsible for doing that. However, I can tell you that a fund has been established as a successor to it, ProAct Skills Growth Wales, which will enable us to capture the most important element of it, namely developing skills for the future. Despite the challenging settlement that we are likely to get when we get the final figures today, one area that we would like to protect is skills.

Joyce Watson: One of the single biggest issues that will dictate the growth of the Welsh economy in years to come is access to broadband. It is central to the attractiveness of Wales to outside companies interested in investing here, and to the chances of Welsh business flourishing. I have received an awful lot of correspondence that states categorically that timing is crucial if Wales is not to be left behind. Do you agree that, without the provision of broadband being at the top of your agenda, Welsh businesses risk being left behind and consequently the economy will suffer? Will you agree to meet with me to discuss your plans to progress this agenda?

generally is that the Assembly Government schedules programmes that are, usually, in the national transport plan, which has been published, and because of the clear cuts in capital spending in forthcoming years, it is unlikely that we will be able to consider any other scheme not included in that programme.

Lynne Neagle: Fel y gwyddoch, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, mae nifer o gyflogwyr pwysig yn Nhorfaen wedi cael cymorth gan gynlluniau ProAct a ReAct Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r cymorth hwnnw wedi'u helpu i gadw pobl mewn swyddi ac i alluogi'r rheini sy'n wynebu cael eu diswyddo i gadw ac ennill sgiliau newydd. O ystyried maint y toriadau y gwyddom eu bod ar y ffordd o San Steffan a'r effaith a gânt ar economi gyfan Cymru, pa gyfle sydd i gyflwyno cynlluniau tebyg am y tymor hwy yng Nghymru?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Rydych chi'n cyfeirio at ran bwysig o'r gwaith y bu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gallu ei wneud yn ystod y dirwasgiad: cefnogi sgiliau allweddol mewn cwmnïau ledled Cymru. Rydym yn cydnabod budd cynllun ProAct ac rydym am fynd â hwnnw yn ei flaen, ac mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau'n gyfrifol am wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud wrthyf fod cronfa wedi'i sefydlu i'w holynu, sef ProAct Sgiliau Twf Cymru, a fydd yn ein galluogi i grisialu ei elfen bwysicaf, sef datblygu sgiliau at y dyfodol. Er gwaethaf y setliad heriol yr ydym yn debygol o'i gael pan gawn y ffigurau terfynol heddiw, un maes yr hoffem ei warchod yw sgiliau.

Joyce Watson: Un o'r materion mwyaf un a fydd yn pennu twf economi Cymru yn y blynyddoedd i ddod yw cael at fand eang. Mae'n ganolog i atyniad Cymru i gwmnïau allanol sydd â diddordeb mewn buddsoddi yma, ac i'r cyfleoedd i fusnesau Cymru ffynnu. Rwyf wedi cael cryn dipyn o ohebiaeth sy'n dweud yn ddiamod fod amseru'n allweddol er mwyn sicrhau nad yw Cymru'n cael ei gadael ar ôl. Heb fod darparu band eang ar frig eich agenda, a ydych chi'n cytuno bod busnesau Cymru'n mentro cael eu gadael y tu ôl ac y bydd yr economi'n dioddef o ganlyniad? A wnewch chi gytuno i gyfarfod â mi i drafod eich cynlluniau i symud yr agenda hwn yn ei flaen?

The Deputy First Minister: I would be happy to meet you, Joyce, because we have accepted the key need to improve our broadband accessibility. We currently have RIBS, the regional innovative broadband support scheme, which is still taking forward access to basic, first-generation broadband. That is now supplemented through a grant scheme that I launched at the Royal Welsh Show, so that people who still feel that they cannot get access to first-generation broadband can apply for a grant to ensure that they can get it. However, we have not left it there. Under the economic renewal programme, half the money that was being spent on the single investment fund under the old system will now be transferred into infrastructure, which will deal with some of the issues that you raised. Our expectation under that policy is that all businesses in Wales should get fast, quality broadband or next-generation broadband by 2016.

Leanne Wood: It seems that the Westminster coalition Government is about to relieve itself of the legal responsibility to fund Welsh-language broadcasting by leaving it to the BBC to pick up the tab for S4C's budget from the licence fee. Big questions will be posed about plurality, independence and the future of Welsh-language broadcasting. We have just heard that there will be a cut of 25 per cent to the budget of S4C, and these moves will threaten the future of many independent media companies that rely on the channel for commissions. It is estimated that more than 2,000 jobs in the independent television sector rely on S4C, so it is a major economic driver in this country. I know that jobs are a priority for you, Deputy First Minister, as is the future of our language. Do you agree that the Westminster Government is today delivering a hammer blow to the culture and economy of Wales with this callous and ill-conceived move? Can you tell us what we should do here in the Assembly on a united basis to safeguard the future of S4C?

The Deputy First Minister: Thank you for the question, Leanne. This is a worrying announcement, because our review of the creative industries found that the money spent through S4C, the BBC and the Welsh Assembly Government was a key driver for the creative industries. It is crucial that the

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Byddwn yn falch o gyfarfod â chi, Joyce, am ein bod wedi derbyn yr angen allweddol i wneud ein band eang yn fwy hygyrch. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym RIBS, y cynllun cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol, sy'n dal yn datblygu band eang sylfaenol, cenhedlaeth gyntaf. Mae hwnnw'n awr yn cael ei ategu drwy gynllun grant a lansiays yn Sioe Frenhinol Cymru, fel bod pobl sy'n dal yn teimlo nad allant gael at fand eang cenhedlaeth gyntaf yn gallu ymgeisio am grant i sicrhau y gallant ei gael. Fodd bynnag, nid hynny yw'r cyfan. O dan raglen adnewyddu'r economi, bydd hanner yr arian a oedd yn cael ei wario ar y gronfa fuddsoddi sengl o dan yr hen system yn cael ei drosglwyddo bellach i seilwaith, a fydd yn ymdrin â rhai o'r pethau a godasoch. O dan y polisi hwnnw, disgwyliwn y dylai pob busnes yng Nghymru gael band eang cyflym, o ansawdd neu fand eang cenhedlaeth nesaf erbyn 2016.

Leanne Wood: Mae fel petai Llywodraeth glymblaid San Steffan ar fin rhyddhau ei hun o'r cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol am ariannu darlledu Cymraeg drwy ei gadael i'r BBC dalu am gyllideb S4C o'r ffi drwydded. Bydd cwestiynau mawr yn cael eu gofyn am luosogrwydd, annibyniaeth a dyfodol darlledu Cymraeg. Rydym newydd glywed y bydd 25 y cant yn cael ei gwtogi ar gyllideb S4C, a bydd y camau hyn yn bygwth dyfodol llawer o gwmnïau cyfryngau annibynnol sy'n dibynnu ar y sianel honno am gomisiynau. Amcangyfrifir bod mwy na 2,000 o swyddi yn y sector teledu annibynnol yn dibynnu ar S4C, felly mae'n sbardun economaidd pwysig yn y wlad hon. Gwn fod swyddi'n flaenoriaeth i chi, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, fel y mae dyfodol ein hiaith. A ydych chi'n cytuno bod Llywodraeth San Steffan heddiw'n rhoi ergyd caled i ddiwylliant ac economi Cymru wrth gymryd y cam dideimlad a byrbwyll hwn? A allwch ddweud wrthym beth y dylem ei wneud yma yn y Cynulliad ar y cyd i ddiogelu dyfodol S4C?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Diolch am y cwestiwn, Leanne. Mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn peri gofid, oherwydd canfu ein hadolygiad o'r diwydiannau creadigol fod yr arian a warir drwy S4C, y BBC a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn sbardun pwysig i'r diwydiannau creadigol. Mae'n allweddol bod

UK Government treat us with respect when it makes announcements about the future of such an important sector. However, on this occasion, it did not have the courtesy to inform either the Minister for Heritage or S4C itself. The first the senior management of S4C knew that the announcement was to be made was when they received a telephone call from the press, and I find that absolutely shameful. We need to understand the importance of S4C. You rightly pointed out its importance to the Welsh language and to the creative industries, but it is also important for the Welsh economy. We in this institution have the right to be treated with respect, and I ask the Secretary of State for Culture, Olympics, Media and Sport to be ready to have a conversation with the Minister for Heritage and S4C to explore the decision in detail. We will not put up with the loss of the independence of S4C lightly in this place.

Val Lloyd: Deputy First Minister, I think I am right in saying that one of your priorities is research and development, and so I am sure that you will join me in congratulating Swansea University on securing a combined total of £46 million-worth of investment for groundbreaking research. The advanced sustainable manufacturing technologies project, more commonly, understandably, known as ASTUTE, will benefit greatly from that investment. It is aimed at growing Wales's manufacturing industry and creating a new state-of-the-art centre to develop renewable energy projects. Additionally, it is estimated that it will create 130 highly skilled jobs throughout Wales, assist around 350 enterprises, and even help with the progression and growth of 40 research and development projects in Wales. Would you therefore agree that that achievement by Swansea University is a perfect example of academia, business and Government working together to benefit the research and development community as well as the wider economy?

The Deputy First Minister: Yes, I agree with you about the success of Swansea University and the ASTUTE project. I was able to attend the launch of the project at Swansea University, and one of the key things that impressed me about it was the way in which the university, through the vice-chancellor, and the manufacturing

Llywodraeth y DU yn ein trin â pharch pan fydd yn gwneud cyhoeddiadau am ddyfodol sector mor bwysig. Fodd bynnag, y tro hwn, nid oedd ganddi'r cwrteisi i roi gwybod i'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth nac i S4C ei hun. Y tro cyntaf i uwch reolwyr S4C wybod bod cyhoeddiad am gael ei wneud oedd pan gawsant alwad ffôn oddi wrth y wasg, ac rwy'n credu bod hynny'n gwbl warthus. Mae angen inni ddeall pwysigrwydd S4C. Soniasoch yn briodol am ei phwysigrwydd i'r Gymraeg ac i'r diwydiannau creadigol, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig i economi Cymru. Yn y sefydliad hwn mae gennym yr hawl i gael ein trin â pharch, a gofynnaf i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Gemau Olympaidd, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon fod yn barod i gael sgwrs â'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth ac S4C i archwilio'r penderfyniad yn fanwl. Ni wnawn ddygyddod yn dawel â cholli annibyniaeth S4C yn y lle hwn.

Val Lloyd: Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, rwy'n credu ei bod yn gywir imi ddweud mai un o'ch blaenoriaethau yw ymchwil a datblygu, ac felly rwy'n siŵr yr ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Prifysgol Abertawe ar sicrhau cyfanswm cyfunol sy'n werth £46 miliwn o fuddsoddiad ar gyfer ymchwil a fydd yn torri tir newydd. Bydd y prosiect uwch dechnolegau gweithgynhyrchu cynaliadwy, a elwir yn fwy cyffredin, yn naturiol, yn ASTUTE, yn elwa'n fawr ar y buddsoddiad hwnnw. Ei nod yw tyfu diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu Cymru a chreu canolfan dra modern newydd i ddatblygu prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy. Hefyd, amcangyfrifir y bydd yn creu 130 o swyddi tra medrus ledled Cymru, yn cynorthwyo tua 350 o fentrau, a hyd yn oed yn helpu gyda dilyniant a thwf 40 o brosiectau ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru. A fydddech chi'n cytuno felly fod y cyflawniad hwnnw gan Brifysgol Abertawe yn enghraifft berffaith o'r byd academiaidd, y byd busnes a'r Llywodraeth yn cydweithio er budd y gymuned ymchwil a datblygu yn ogystal â'r economi ehangach?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Byddwn, cytunaf â chi am lwyddiant Prifysgol Abertawe a phrosiect ASTUTE. Bûm yn gallu mynd i lansiad y prosiect ym Mhrifysgol Abertawe, ac un o'r pethau allweddol a wnaeth argraff arnaf oedd y ffordd yr oedd y brifysgol, drwy'r is-ganghellor, a'r fforwm gweithgynhyrchu,

forum, through Roger Evans and me, were able to show that, by working together, the Welsh Assembly Government, academia and business can really drive value in the Welsh economy through research and development. More widely, I congratulate Swansea University on capturing research and development funding, and I know that it is well placed to move forward with that agenda. That is an area in which the Welsh Assembly Government would like to see universities proceed further.

Chris Franks: Deputy First Minister, in light of the severe cuts made by the Conservative-Lib Dem Government, how is it possible to ensure that adequate funds will be allocated by the Welsh Government so that Cardiff becomes a sustainable travel city, and so that it can continue to invest in public transport in the Valleys and the Vale of Glamorgan? What talks have you had regarding Cardiff's new electric buggies, which are designed to carry disabled and elderly passengers around pedestrian zones? Are you aware of any discussions with the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency regarding larger buggies to enable disabled people to have their guide dogs with them?

First, Wales suffered as a result of Labour's economic mismanagement, and now we are being dealt a massive blow by reckless Tory and Lib Dem cuts, which are hitting too quickly and too deeply, and which are hitting Wales the hardest. In the light of today's announcement on the comprehensive spending review, what will be your priorities for the rest of the third Assembly?

The Deputy First Minister: We are keen to develop the Sustainable Travel Towns initiative, but we will have to wait to see the final settlement before we know what future funds we can use to invest in later years. Cardiff Council has made great progress on the issue, and I was able to join it in introducing the new smartcard, the Iff card, which was launched only a few days ago. Therefore, it is making great strides. The reality is that much of the Sustainable Travel Towns initiative will relate to capital investment, and we may well see our capital budgets reduced as a result of the CSR. I was not aware of the proposal regarding electric

drwy Roger Evans a minnau, yn gallu dangos bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, y byd academiaidd a'r byd busnes, trwy gydweithio, yn wir yn gallu sbarduno gwerth yn economi Cymru drwy ymchwil a datblygu. Yn ehangach, rwy'n llongyfarch Prifysgol Abertawe am ddenu cyllid ymchwil a datblygu, a gwn ei bod mewn sefyllfa dda i symud ymlaen â'r agenda hwnnw. Mae hwnnw'n faes lle hoffai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weld prifysgolion yn datblygu ymhellach.

Chris Franks: Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, yng ngoleuni'r toriadau difrifol a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sut mae modd sicrhau y bydd digon o gyllid yn cael ei ddyrranu gan Lywodraeth Cymru fel bod Caerdydd yn ddinas teithio cynaliadwy yn y pen draw, ac er mwyn iddi barhau i fuddsoddi mewn cludiant cyhoeddus yn y Cymoedd ac ym Mro Morgannwg? Pa sgysiau a gawsoch chi ynghylch bygis trydanol newydd Caerdydd, sydd wedi'u cynllunio i gludo teithwyr anabl ac oedranus o amgylch parthau cerddwyr? A wyddoch chi am unrhyw drafodaethau â'r Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau ynghylch bygis mwy o faint er mwyn i bobl anabl gael eu cŵn tywys gyda hwy?

Yn gyntaf, dioddefodd Cymru o ganlyniad i gamreoli economaidd Llafur, ac erbyn hyn mae toriadau di-hid y Toriaid a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ergyd trwm inni, sy'n ein bwrw'n rhy gyflym ac yn rhy ddwfn, ac sy'n bwrw Cymru'n galetaf oll. Yng ngoleuni cyhoeddiad heddiw am yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, beth fydd eich blaenoriaethau am weddill y trydydd Cynulliad?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Rydym yn awyddus i ddatblygu menter y Trefi Teithio Cynaliadwy, ond bydd rhaid inni aros i weld y setliad terfynol cyn inni wybod pa gyllid y gallwn ei ddefnyddio yn y dyfodol i fuddsoddi mewn blynyddoedd diweddarach. Mae Cyngor Caerdydd wedi gwneud cynnydd mawr ar y mater, ac roeddwn yn gallu ymuno ag ef i gyflwyno'r cerdyn call newydd, cerdyn Iff, a lansiwyd ond ychydig ddyddiau'n ôl. Felly, mae'n llamu ymlaen. Y gwirionedd yw y bydd llawer o fenter y Trefi Teithio Cynaliadwy yn gysylltiedig â buddsoddi cyfalaf, ac mae'n ddigon posibl y gwelwn ein cyllidebau cyfalaf yn lleihau o

buggies that you have described, but I would be happy to discuss that with Cardiff Council when I meet it next.

Jeff Cuthbert: I was recently contacted by a constituent of mine who was waiting for a train at Aber station on the Rhymney valley line. When the two-carriage train arrived, the doors failed to open, leaving all 30 passengers stranded on the platform in the rain. Furthermore, a member of the National Assembly staff, who is also a constituent of mine, has complained to me that almost every train that he gets to and from Cardiff at peak times has only two carriages. I have written to Arriva Trains Wales about these issues, and have demanded an explanation as to why it continually under-resources its rolling stock on the Rhymney valley line. While I welcome your previous co-operation on this matter, can you assure me that you will make addressing these issues a priority during the remainder of this Assembly term?

2.30 p.m.

The Deputy First Minister: You are right to say that this issue needs to be addressed. The difficulty is that, in order to address it, we need extra rolling stock. It is not always easy to secure that rolling stock, because there is a high demand for additional stock throughout the UK due to the increase in passenger numbers. We have witnessed that in Wales, as others have witnessed elsewhere. However, my officials and I are considering how we can address this matter. If there is a way in which we can do it through, for example, an invest-to-save proposal, we will consider that as well.

Irene James: In the first round of Tory-Liberal cuts in June, we saw the scrapping of the Future Jobs fund. In this next round of cuts, we are seeing even more job cuts. With all these jobs leaving the economy, what is your assessment of the effect that it will have on future growth in Wales, as behind every job cut is a person, often with a family?

The Deputy First Minister: We have heard today that the number of likely job cuts in the

ganlyniad i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Nid oeddwn yn gwybod am y cynnig ynghylch bygis trydan a ddisgrifiwyd gennych, ond byddwn yn falch o drafod hwnnw â Chyngor Caerdydd pan fyddwn yn cyfarfod nesaf.

Jeff Cuthbert: Cysylltwyd â mi'n ddiweddar gan un o'm hetholwyr a oedd yn aros am drên yng ngorsaf Aber ar lein cwm Rhymni. Pan gyrhaeddodd y trên â dau gerbyd, methodd y drysau ag agor, gan adael pob un o'r 30 teithiwr ar y plattform yn y glaw. Hefyd, mae aelod o staff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sydd hefyd yn un o'm hetholwyr, wedi cwyno imi mai dim ond dau gerbyd sydd gan bron i bob trên y mae'n teithio arno'n ôl ac ymlaen i Gaerdydd ar adegau brig. Rwyf wedi ysgrifennu at Arriva Trains Wales am y pethau hyn, ac wedi mynnu iddynt egluro pam mae eu cerbydau bob amser yn annigonol ar lein cwm Rhymni. Er fy mod yn croesawu eich cydweithrediad blaenorol ar y mater hwn, a allwch chi fy sicrhau y byddwch yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yn ystod gweddill tymor y Cynulliad hwn?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Rydych chi'n iawn bod angen mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Yr anhawster yw bod angen cerbydau ychwanegol arnom er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag ef. Nid peth hawdd bob amser yw sicrhau'r cerbydau hynny, am fod galw mawr am stoc ychwanegol ledled y DU oherwydd y cynnydd yn niferoedd y teithwyr. Rydym wedi gweld hynny yng Nghymru, fel y mae eraill wedi'i weld mewn manau eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae fy swyddogion a minnau'n ystyried sut gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Os oes ffordd y gallwn ei wneud drwy, er enghraifft, cynnig buddsoddi i arbed, byddwn yn ystyried hynny hefyd.

Irene James: Yn rownd gyntaf y toriadau gan y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ym mis Mehefin, rhoddwyd y gorau i gronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol. Yn y rownd nesaf hon o doriadau, rydym yn gweld mwy o swyddi byth yn cael eu torri. Gyda'r holl swyddi hyn yn gadael yr economi, beth yw eich asesiad o'r effaith a gaiff ar dwf yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol, oherwydd y tu ôl i bob swydd a dorrir y mae person, a theulu ganddo'n aml?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Rydym wedi clywed heddiw ei bod yn debygol y bydd tua

public sector across the UK will be around 490,000, which is close enough to 0.5 million. In Wales, that will be around 25,000, which is a significant sum. Contracts placed by the Welsh Assembly Government and the public sector in Wales account for £4.5 billion a year, so if that is substantially reduced, there will be fewer contracts for the private sector to take up as well. Therefore, we could see job cuts in the public sector and job cuts in the private sector, as there will not be enough Government contracts to go around for investment. The other problem that we have in Wales is that the pace of economic recovery has been slow, compared with other parts of the United Kingdom. That is why the leaders of the three devolved administrations wrote to the Chancellor to point out that, by cutting too soon and too deeply, there would be a disproportionate effect in Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland.

Tir Diffaith

6. Gareth Jones: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am aildddefnyddio tir diffaith. OAQ(3)1689(ECT)*

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Fy adran i sy'n rheoli'r cynllun grant adfer tir sydd ar gael i'r sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat. Ymhlith yr hyn a gyflawnwyd hyd yma, mae cael gwared ar wastraff peryglus a defnyddio tir mewn amrywiaeth eang o ddulliau newydd, gan arwain at fanteision economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol.

Gareth Jones: Lle mae tir diffaith yn dod yn ddolur llygad, ac yn tanseilio rhagolygon ardal, pa fesurau all awdurdodau lleol, a Llywodraeth Cymru, eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem? Cyfeiriaf yn benodol—yr ydym yn gohebu ynglŷn â hyn—at safle amlwg hen bafiliwn y pier yn Llandudno, sydd mewn cyflwr truenus, fel y gwyddoch. Gan nad oes unrhyw arwyddion o gynlluniau i geisio ail-ddatblygu'r safle, a allwch chi gynnig unrhyw help ac anogaeth i'r awdurdodau lleol yn eu hymgais i gael trefn ar y safle, a budd ohono?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Mae cyflwr y pier yn Llandudno yn gwbl annerbyniol. Mae nifer o brosiectau wedi cael

490,000 o swyddi'n cael eu torri yn y sector cyhoeddus ledled y DU, sy'n ddigon agos i 0.5 miliwn. Yng Nghymru, bydd hynny tua 25,000, sy'n swm sylweddol. Mae contractau a osodir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru'n cyfrif am £4.5 biliwn y flwyddyn, felly os bydd hwnnw'n llawer llai, bydd llai o gontractau i'r sector preifat eu dechrau hefyd. Felly, gallem weld toriadau swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus a thoriadau swyddi yn y sector preifat, gan na fydd digon o gontractau Llywodraeth i'w dosbarthu ar gyfer buddsoddi. Y broblem arall sydd gennym yng Nghymru yw y bu'r economi'n araf yn gwella, o'i chymharu â rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Dyna pam yr ysgrifennodd arweinwyr y tair gweinyddiaeth ddatganoledig at y Canghellor i nodi y byddai torri'n rhy fuan ac yn rhy ddwfn yn effeithio'n anghymesur ar Gymru, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon.

Derelict Land

6. Gareth Jones: *Will the Minister make a statement on bringing derelict land into use. OAQ(3)1689(ECT)*

The Deputy First Minister: My department manages the land reclamation grant scheme accessible to the public and private sectors. Outputs achieved include the removal of hazards and the establishment of a wide range of new uses incorporating economic, social and environmental benefits.

Gareth Jones: Where derelict land is becoming an eyesore, undermining the prospects of an area, what measures can local authorities and the Welsh Government take to tackle the problem? I refer in particular—we are corresponding on this—to the prominent site of the old pier pavilion in Llandudno, which is in a deplorable condition, as you know. As there is no indication of redevelopment plans for the site, can you offer local authorities any help and encouragement in their quest to improve the site and benefit from it?

The Deputy First Minister: I recognise what you are saying. The condition of the pier at Llandudno is totally unacceptable. Several projects have been considered in the

eu hystyried yn y gorffennol. Mae'r pileri sydd ar ôl wedi cael eu cofrestru gan Cadw, felly bydd yr awdurdod lleol wedi ei gyfyngu o ran y math o ddefnydd y gellir ei wneud ohono. Deallaf fod y perchennog presennol yn byw yn Iwerddon, a bod trafodaethau ar y gweill, gyda'r awdurdod lleol, i weld a oes modd datblygu'r safle. Os ydych yn teimlo y byddai hynny o gymorth, yr wyf yn hapus i gael trafodaeth gyda chi, a chynrychiolwyr yr awdurdod lleol, i weld pa help y gallwn ei roi yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

Darren Millar: The pier in Llandudno is not the only pier in north Wales that is in need of significant investment and refurbishment. The pier in Colwyn Bay is in a deplorable state, and there is a great deal of concern about its safety, and the fact that it will need significant investment to bring it up to an appropriate standard. In fact, the local authority recently commissioned some work that estimated the cost of renovation at £5.5 million. The county borough council and the pier pressure group—established recently through the work of my colleague David Jones MP in the constituency—are working hard to secure those funds. Are there any Welsh Assembly Government funds that might assist with the redevelopment of the pier, given that this is a significant part of our tourism heritage and that it plays a significant role in the economy?

The Deputy First Minister: I am aware that there are a number of structures such as the piers at Llandudno and Colwyn Bay that need attention. I am not in a position, as I said to William, to make offers of grants across the Chamber. If Darren would like to write to me with details of the scheme, I will make sure that he gets a considered reply.

Lefelau Sgiliau

8. Joyce Watson: *Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i wella lefelau sgiliau yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)1642(ECT)*

The Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills (Lesley Griffiths): Improving our skills base is one of the five priorities for economic renewal. Better skills are vital for growth and prosperity in Wales. Delivering them is a shared responsibility for us as a Government, learning providers, employers and individuals.

past. The remaining pillars have been registered by Cadw, so the local authority will be limited in what it can do with it. I understand that the current owner lives in Ireland, and that discussions are under way with local authorities, to see whether the site can be developed. If you feel that it would help, I am happy to discuss with you and local authority representatives what help we can provide in that context.

Darren Millar: Nid y pier yn Llandudno yw'r unig bier yng ngogledd Cymru y mae angen buddsoddi'n sylweddol ynddo a'i ailwampio. Mae'r pier ym Mae Colwyn mewn cyflwr truenus, ac mae gofid mawr am ei ddiogelwch, a'r ffaith y bydd angen buddsoddi'n sylweddol ynddo er mwyn iddo gyrraedd safon briodol. Mewn gwirionedd, comisiynodd yr awdurdod lleol waith yn ddiweddar a amcangyfrifodd y byddai'n costio £5.5 miliwn i'w adnewyddu. Mae'r cyngor bwrdeistref sirol a charfan bwysu'r pier—a sefydlwyd yn ddiweddar drwy waith fy nghydweithiwr David Jones AS yn yr etholaeth—yn gweithio'n galed i sicrhau'r cyllid hwnnw. A oes unrhyw gyllid yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a allai gynorthwyo i ailddatblygu'r pier, o ystyried bod hwn yn rhan arwyddocaol o'n treftadaeth twristiaeth a'i bod yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn yr economi?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Gwn fod angen sylw ar nifer o strwythurau fel y pierau yn Llandudno a Bae Colwyn. Fel y dywedais wrth William, nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i gynnig grantiau ar draws y Siambr. Os hoffai Darren ysgrifennu ataf gan nodi manylion y cynllun, byddaf yn sicrhau y caiff ateb ystyriol.

Skills Levels

8. Joyce Watson: *What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to improve skills levels in Wales. OAQ(3)1642(ECT)*

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau (Lesley Griffiths): Gwella ein sylfaen sgiliau yw un o'r pum blaenoriaeth ar gyfer adnewyddu'r economi. Mae gwell sgiliau'n hanfodol ar gyfer twf a ffyniant yng Nghymru. Rydyn ni'r Llywodraeth, darparwyr dysgu, cyflogwyr ac unigolion yn gyfrifol ar y cyd am eu cyflawni.

Joyce Watson: Thank you for that answer, Deputy Minister. I am sure that you will agree that, in this time of severe spending cuts, it is imperative that we all join together in helping young people to reach their full potential for the future. There are a great number of initiatives taking place across Wales, in particular those that encourage people to consider the construction industry as a real career choice. Will you join me in congratulating initiatives such as the shared apprenticeship scheme, which has given many young people the best possible start in achieving success through the built environment? Will you also join me in offering congratulations on the tremendous work of organisations such as ConstructionSkills, the Construction Youth Trust and the Association of Women in Property in tackling the shortage of women who pursue careers in the construction industry?

Lesley Griffiths: I of course join you in congratulating the organisations to which you referred, and I agree with you that the shared apprenticeship scheme is an excellent initiative that enables employers to pool their resources to offer individuals a varied training experience. The Welsh Assembly Government's apprentice programme, as a whole, is allowing individuals to really take their career development forward.

You referred to the event that you will be hosting next month with CYT and the Women's Engineering Society. I welcome an event such as this, and I am sure that it will be very successful. It shows how the construction sector has changed over the years and how we are breaking down barriers. Nonetheless, I would not want us to take our eye off the ball; we really need to ensure that we challenge stereotypes as we take the economy forward.

Paul Davies: We have heard a lot about how expanding the skills base is essential for our businesses to thrive and create jobs. Higher Education Wales has called for a focus on high-level skills that go beyond level 4 skills, with a greater emphasis on postgraduate skills. We all acknowledge that the relationship between businesses and the HE sector in Wales needs to be strengthened and developed to best meet the needs of our economy. Will the Deputy Minister outline

Joyce Watson: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno ei bod, ar yr adeg hon o doriadau gwariant difrifol, yn allweddol inni oll ddod ynghyd i helpu pobl ifanc i gyrraedd eu potensial llawn at y dyfodol. Mae nifer mawr o fentrau'n digwydd ledled Cymru, yn arbennig y rheini sy'n annog pobl i ystyried y diwydiant adeiladu yn ddewis gyrfya go iawn. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch mentrau fel y cynllun rhannu prentisiaeth, sydd wedi rhoi'r cychwyn gorau posibl i lawer o bobl ifanc i lwyddo drwy'r amgylchedd adeiledig? A wnewch chi ymuno â mi hefyd i longyfarch sefydliadau fel Sgiliau Adeiladu, Construction Youth Trust ac Association of Women in Property ar eu gwaith aruthrol yn mynd i'r afael â'r prinder menywod sy'n mynd ar drywydd gyrfya yn y diwydiant adeiladu?

Lesley Griffiths: Rwyf fi, wrth gwrs, yn ymuno â chi i longyfarch y sefydliadau y cyfeiriasoch atynt, a chytunaf â chi fod y cynllun rhannu prentisiaeth yn fenter ragorol sy'n galluogi cyflogwyr i gydgyfrannu eu hadnoddau i gynnig profiad hyfforddiant amrywiol i unigolion. Mae rhaglen prentis Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ar y cyfan, yn galluogi unigolion i fynd ati i ddatblygu eu gyrfya o ddifrif.

Cyfeiriasoch at y digwyddiad y byddwch chi'n ei gynnal fis nesaf gyda CYT a Chymdeithas Peirianeg y Merched. Croesawaf ddigwyddiad fel hwn, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd yn llwyddiannus iawn. Mae'n dangos bod y sector adeiladu wedi newid dros y blynyddoedd a'n bod yn chwalu rhwystrau. Serch hynny, ni fyddwn am inni dynnu ein llygad oddi ar y bêl; mae angen inni sicrhau'n iawn ein bod yn herio ystrydebau wrth inni fynd â'r economi yn ei blaen.

Paul Davies: Rydym wedi clywed llawer am y ffordd y mae'n hanfodol ehangu'r sylfaen sgiliau er mwyn i'n busnesau ffynnu a chreu swyddi. Mae Addysg Uwch Cymru wedi galw am ganolbwyntio ar sgiliau lefel uchel sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i sgiliau lefel 4, gyda mwy o bwyslais ar sgiliau ôl-raddedig. Rydym oll yn cydnabod bod angen cryfhau a datblygu'r berthynas rhwng busnesau a'r sector AU yng Nghymru er mwyn bodloni anghenion ein heconomi yn y ffordd orau. A

what discussions she has had with her colleague the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning on this issue and update us on any progress made?

Lesley Griffiths: The Welsh workforce is becoming progressively better qualified. Part of that is to do with the fact that we now have more working-age adults educated to degree level. I have discussions with the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning about higher education, but you will appreciate that the subject is mainly within his portfolio. I will write to you about progress on that issue, however.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ddirprwy Weinidog, beth fydd effaith penderfyniad y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan i ddileu'r cap ar ffioedd dysgu i fyfyrwyr? A oes perygl gwirioneddol y bydd hynny'n arwain yng Nghymru at sefyllfa lle mae plant o deuluoedd incwm isel, a rhai efallai o deuluoedd incwm canolog, yn methu â manteisio ar y cyfle i gael addysg uwch, gan na fyddant mewn sefyllfa i dderbyn baich ariannol dyledion enfawr?

2.40 p.m.

Lesley Griffiths: I share your concerns that the proposals put forward by the Westminster coalition Government to remove the cap will have a huge impact on the number of graduates, which will have an impact on the skill levels of our workforce in the future. One area on which I have been focusing within my portfolio is science. We want to have a continual pipeline of graduates in science, as in all so-called STEM subjects, because we know how important science is for the economy and for innovation. A rise in tuition fees would deter people from lower-income households in particular from pursuing a university education and it will make our job as regards science, technology, engineering and mathematics that much more difficult.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidogion.

wna'r Dirprwy Weinidog amlinellu pa drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael â'i chydweithiwr y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am y mater hwn a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am unrhyw gynnydd a wnaethpwyd?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae gweithlu Cymru'n raddol gaffael gwell cymwysterau. Mae rhan o hynny'n ymwneud â'r ffaith bod gennym bellach fwy o oedolion oed gwaith sy'n cael eu haddysgu i lefel gradd. Rwy'n cael trafodaethau â'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am addysg uwch, ond byddwch yn gwerthfawrogi bod y pwnc yn perthyn yn bennaf i'w bortffolio ef. Ysgrifennaf atoch am gynnydd ar y mater hwnnw, fodd bynnag.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Deputy Minister, what will be the impact of the Westminster coalition Government's decision to remove the cap on student tuition fees? Is there a real danger that this will lead to a situation in Wales where children from low-income families, and perhaps some middle-income families, will be unable to take advantage of higher education, as they will not be in a position to take on the financial burden of huge debts?

Lesley Griffiths: Rhannaf eich pryderon y bydd y cynigion a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth clymblaid San Steffan i waredu'r cap yn effeithio'n aruthrol ar nifer y graddedigion, a fydd yn effeithio ar lefelau sgiliau ein gweithlu yn y dyfodol. Un maes y bûm yn canolbwyntio arno yn fy mhortffolio yw gwyddoniaeth. Mae arnom eisiau cael cyflenwad parhaus o raddedigion mewn gwyddoniaeth, fel ym mhob pwnc STEM fel y'i gelwir, am ein bod yn gwybod mor bwysig yw gwyddoniaeth i'r economi ac i arloesi. Byddai cynnydd mewn ffioedd dysgu'n rhwystro pobl o aelwydydd incwm is yn enwedig rhag mynd ar drywydd addysg brifysgol a bydd yn gwneud ein gwaith ni o ran gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianneg a mathemateg yn llawer anoddach.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ministers.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Cyllido S4C S4C Funding

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael ynghylch y datbygiadau diweddaraf yn ymwneud â chyllido S4C. EAQ(3)1308(HER)*

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *What discussions has the Minister had regarding the most recent developments on the funding of S4C. EAQ(3)1308(HER)*

Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones): Diolch am y cwestiwn. Dechreuaf drwy ddweud bod hwn yn ddiwrnod du iawn i ddarlledu yng Nghymru ac yn ddiwrnod digalon i ddarlledu yn Gymraeg. Mae'r ffordd y mae pobl Cymru a'u cynrychiolwyr wedi'u hanwybyddu yn tansellio'r hyn a alwyd gan y glymblaid yn Llundain yn agenda o barch, beth bynnag yw ystyr hynny.

The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones): Thank you for the question. I begin by saying that this is a very dark day for broadcasting in Wales and a sad day for Welsh-language broadcasting. The way in which the people of Wales and their representatives have been ignored undermines what has been called by the coalition in London the respect agenda, whatever that means.

I ateb y cwestiwn ar ei ben, bûm mewn cyfarfod â Mr Hunt ar 2 Hydref, a phwysleisiais yr angen i ddiogelu darlledu yn Gymraeg. Ysgrifennais ato'r wythnos diwethaf gyda'r un neges a'r cynnig i fod yn rhan o unrhyw adolygiad annibynnol i edrych am batrwm amgen i'r dyfodol. Nid oes unrhyw drafod o gwbl wedi bod ar yr awgrym y dylai S4C gael ei ariannu gan y BBC.

To answer the question on its head, I had a meeting with Mr Hunt on 2 October, and I stressed the need to protect Welsh-medium broadcasting. I wrote to him last week with the same message and the offer to play a part in any independent review to look for an alternative model for the future. There has been no discussion at all about the suggestion that S4C should be funded by the BBC.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno ein bod i gyd yn rhyfeddu at y ffordd sarhaus y mae'r Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan wedi ymdrin ag S4C, ac at ei hagwedd sarhaus tuag at Gymru a'r iaith Gymraeg. Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rhain, ond geiriau John Walter Jones, cadeirydd Awdurdod S4C—cyn-was sifil, dyn hynod o gwrtais a gofalus yn ei ddefnydd o eiriau. Pan fydd John Walter Jones yn defnyddio'r gair 'sarhaus' i ddisgrifio agwedd Llywodraeth San Steffan yn y mater hwn, gallwn fod yn gwbl glir ei fod yntau hefyd wedi'i ryfeddu a'i arswydo gan y ffordd y mae'r mater hwn wedi cael ei drin.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am sure that you would agree that we are all astounded at the contempt that the Westminster coalition Government has shown not just towards S4C, but also towards the Welsh people and indeed the language itself. Those are not my words, but those of John Walter Jones, chair of the S4C Authority—an ex-civil servant, an extremely courteous man who is careful in his use of words. When John Walter Jones uses the word 'contempt' to describe the Westminster Government's attitude in this matter, we can be absolutely clear that he too is amazed and appalled by the way in which this issue has been dealt with.

Mae rhai ohonom wedi bod yn disgwyl yn hir iawn i rywun gymryd lle John Redwood i symboleiddio agwedd sarhaus at Gymru. Bellach yr ydym wedi canfod y dyn hwnnw yn Jeremy Hunt. Mae'n ddyn nad oes ganddo

Some of us have been waiting very long for someone to replace John Redwood as the symbol of a contemptuous attitude towards Wales. We have now found that man in Jeremy Hunt. He is a man who knows

unrhyw wybodaeth am Gymru na diddordeb i gasglu gwybodaeth am Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n barod i wneud penderfyniad sy'n bellgyrhaeddol o ran darlledu yng Nghymru, o ran y diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru ac, fel y dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, o ran economi Cymru a'i gallu i symud o'r dirwasgiad.

Yr ydym wedi clywed yn gyson am yr agenda o barch yr oedd y glymblaid yn honni ei bod yn mynd i'w gweithredu wrth ymdrin â'r Cynulliad. Yn y sefyllfa hon, nid yw wedi ymgynghori â chi fel Gweinidog ac nid yw wedi ymgynghori ag S4C. Mae wedi gwneud penderfyniad cwbl annoeth ynglŷn â dyfodol S4C. Mae goblygiadau enfawr i'r penderfyniad hwnnw. A ydych yn ymuno â mi, Weinidog, i groesawu'r ffaith bod S4C wedi penderfynu mynd i adolygiad barnwrol ar y mater hwn, oherwydd bod y Gweinidog wedi gweithredu yn groes i ddeddf gwlad ac wedi gwneud penderfyniadau cyn cyflwyno Mesur, yn y naill dŷ na'r llall yn San Steffan, i newid sefyllfa statudol S4C fel darlledwr annibynnol? A fyddwch yn pwysu ar Jeremy Hunt i newid ei feddwl? Yr ydym yn deall hefyd, yn ogystal â gosod y cyfrifoldeb ariannol a'r cyfrifoldeb polisi ar gyfer S4C o dan y BBC, y bydd toriad o 25 y cant yn y cyllid a fydd ar gael i S4C o dan y drefn newydd hon. A wnewch barhau, fel yr ydych wedi bod yn gwneud, i frwydro hyd y gallwch i sicrhau bod Jeremy Hunt yn newid ei feddwl? Gobeithiaf y bydd ein cyfeillion yn y pleidiau sy'n ffurfio'r glymblaid yn Llundain yn sylweddoli mor annoeth yw'r penderfyniad hwn ac y byddant yn parhau i bwysu ar eu cyd-Aelodau yn y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan i ailfeddwl am y mater hwn cyn peryglu sefydliad sydd wedi bod yn eithriadol o bwysig o ran twf yr iaith Gymraeg yng Nghymru.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae mater yr adolygiad barnwrol yn fater i eraill benderfynu arno. Fodd bynnag, mae diffyg ymgynghori wedi bod yn siom ac wedi bod yn syfrdanol, o gofio pwysigrwydd y penderfyniad a'i effaith bellgyrhaeddol. Ni all fod yn swynhwyrol i wneud penderfyniad o'r fath mewn ffordd mor gyflym heb drafodaeth lawn. Wedi'r cwbl, gwasanaeth i bobl Cymru yw hwn, a dylai fod trafodaeth wedi digwydd yma cyn i'r penderfyniad cael ei wneud. Yr un peth

nothing about Wales and has no interest to learn about Wales. However, he is willing to make a far-reaching decision about broadcasting in Wales, about the creative industries in Wales and, as the Deputy First Minister said, about the Welsh economy and its ability to move out of recession.

We have heard constantly about the respect agenda that the coalition claimed would be implemented when dealing with the Assembly. In this situation, it has not consulted with you as Minister and has not consulted with S4C. It has made a wholly unwise decision on the future of S4C. That decision has huge implications. Do you join me, Minister, in welcoming the fact that S4C has decided to go to judicial review on this issue, on the basis that the Minister has acted contrary to the law of the land and made decisions before introducing a Bill, in either house at Westminster, to change S4C's statutory position as an independent broadcaster? Will you urge Jeremy Hunt to change his mind? We understand that, as well as giving the BBC financial responsibility and policy responsibility for S4C, there will be a cut of 25 per cent in the funding available to S4C under this new regime. Will you continue, as you have been doing, to fight as hard as you can to make sure that Jeremy Hunt changes his mind? I hope that our colleagues in the parties that make up the coalition in Westminster will realise how unwise this decision is and will continue to put pressure on their fellow members in the coalition Government in Westminster to rethink this decision before putting at risk an institution that has been extremely important in terms of the growth of the Welsh language in Wales.

Alun Ffred Jones: The matter of a judicial review is for others to decide. However, the lack of consultation has been disappointing and astounding, bearing in mind the importance of the decision and its far-reaching effects. It cannot be sensible to take such a decision so rapidly without full discussion. After all, this is a service for the people of Wales, and there should have been discussion here before the decision was taken. The one thing that is crucial now is to

sydd yn gwbl hanfodol bellach yw sicrhau annibyniaeth olygyddol S4C, sut bynnag mae gwneud hynny. Yr ydym wedi clywed lawer gwaith yn y Siambr am yr angen am luosogrwydd ac am amrywiaeth darlledwyr yng Nghymru. Mae gosod S4C i bob pwrpas o dan ddylanwad uniongyrchol un corff, y BBC, yn Llundain, yn milwrio yn erbyn yr holl ddadleuon hynny sydd wedi cael eu gwneud yma yng Nghymru. Felly, yr wyf yn barod iawn i drafod gyda Mr Hunt, neu un o'i Weinidogion. Yr wyf wedi cynnig gwneud hynny yn y llythyr y cyfeiriais ato. Yr wyf yn barod iawn i gymryd rhan mewn unrhyw drafodaethau i geisio sicrhau dyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru. Yn bendifaddau, nid yw hwn yn ddiwrnod y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddo yng Nghymru o safbwynt darlledu.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): Minister, I have several points to deal with. I will deal with the financial issue before looking at governance, briefly, and then at the issue of independence, which I agree is vital. First, we are disappointed with the financial settlement. I must say that I have not seen the statement yet. I am not sure whether it has been issued. Yesterday, there was a leak of information, but we do not know to what extent that is the full picture, as we have not seen the statement that I understand is to be made this afternoon. However, we are concerned about the financial position and the future of the creative industries in Wales. We are also very concerned about the need to protect the independence of S4C. I quite agree that that is absolutely fundamental, and that view has been expressed repeatedly at Westminster, and again this morning and again this afternoon. There are issues of governance and accountability that need to be dealt with within S4C. I think that that is commonly known to be the case, although I do not think that that should cloud the issues that we are looking at today. There are also commercial activity issues to be looked at in that commercial receipts have certainly declined over the past decade. However, let us put those matters to one side.

Like the Minister, I will not deal with the matter of a judicial review. As a lawyer, I know the dangers of commenting on legal proceedings, and that could be prejudicial, so let us put that to one side—

ensure the editorial independence of S4C, however that is done. We have heard many times in the Chamber about the need for plurality and for a variety of broadcasters in Wales. Placing S4C to all intents and purposes under the direct influence of one body, the BBC, in London, militates against all those arguments that have been made here in Wales. Therefore, I am very willing to discuss this with Mr Hunt or one of his Ministers. I have already offered to do that in the letter to which I referred. I am very willing to take part in any discussions to try to ensure the future of broadcasting in Wales. However, without a doubt, this is not a day of which we can be proud in Wales from the point of view of broadcasting.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Weinidog, mae gennyf nifer o bwytiau i ymdrin â hwy. Ymdriniaf â'r mater ariannol cyn edrych ar lywodraethu, yn fras, ac yna ar fater annibyniaeth, yr wyf yn cytuno ei fod yn hanfodol. Yn gyntaf, rydym yn siomedig â'r setliad ariannol. Mae'n rhaid imi ddweud nad wyf wedi gweld y datganiad eto. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw wedi'i gyhoeddi. Ddoe, cafodd gwybodaeth ei gollwng, ond ni wyddom i ba raddau y mae'r wybodaeth honno'n cyfleu'r darlun cyfan, am nad ydym wedi gweld y datganiad sydd i'w wneud y prynhawn yma, hyd y deallaf. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn poeni am sefyllfa ariannol a dyfodol y diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru. Rydym hefyd yn poeni'n fawr am yr angen i amddiffyn annibyniaeth S4C. Cytunaf yn llwyr fod hynny'n gwbl sylfaenol, ac mae'r farn honno wedi'i mynegi droeon yn San Steffan, ac eto'r bore yma ac eto'r prynhawn yma. Mae materion llywodraethu ac atebolrwydd y mae angen ymdrin â hwy yn S4C. Rwy'n credu bod hynny'n hysbys i bawb, ond nid wyf yn credu y dylai hynny gymylu'r pethau sydd dan sylw heddiw. Mae hefyd materion gweithgarwch masnachol i'w hastudio sef bod derbyniadau masnachol yn sicr wedi gostwng yn y degawd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni roi'r pethau hynny o'r neilltu.

Fel y Gweinidog, ni ymdriniaf â mater adolygiad barnwrol. A minnau'n gyfreithiwr, gwn am beryglon gwneud sylwadau am achos cyfreithiol, a gallai hynny fod yn niweidiol, felly gadewch inni roi hynny o'r neilltu—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I have, of course, checked this out. There are currently no legal proceedings, and therefore it is appropriate for anyone who wishes to comment to do so.

Nick Bourne: I will not comment, because I do not think it is advisable to do so, but I appreciate that it is quite right that this question should come forward. My view is that I do not want to comment on that matter, because it could be prejudicial, as I see it. However, let me come to what I think is the serious issue, which is the independence of S4C. I do not know what the statement says specifically about that, but it remains of major concern to me and my party here.

I make this offer to the Minister in all honesty, because I have felt for a long time that there could be nothing more specifically Welsh than Welsh-language broadcasting. I do not know why it is dealt with at Westminster—well, I can perhaps understand why that was historically—but it is high time that a cross-party approach was made. I am very happy to participate in that, as is my group, to establish how this could be devolved. I understand that this will not be within the BBC for the next two years; there will be a breathing space. I do not know whether the Minister is aware of that, but I think that, for the next two years, it will remain with the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, transferring to the BBC structure in year three or four—although in what way in particular I do not know. Let us try to get something out of this. The way to drive this forward is to look at how this can be devolved to this institution, if the Minister feels that that is a constructive way forward. I understand from discussions that I have had this morning that this is not the end of the road on this whole issue; it is something that we need to discuss. I think that there is a debate on S4C this afternoon at Westminster, in Westminster Hall, initiated by Guto Bebb. No doubt that will also contribute. However, we have time within which to push this issue forward. I think that the devolution of S4C to this body is the way forward.

2.50 p.m.

Alun Ffred Jones: I welcome any cross-party support that we can have on this issue. However, the truth of the matter is that this decision was taken in haste, and it was taken without consultation and without discussion.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Rwyf wedi, wrth reswm, bwrw golwg ar hyn. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes achos cyfreithiol, ac felly mae'n briodol i unrhyw sydd am wneud sylwadau wneud hynny.

Nick Bourne: Ni wnaf sylwadau, oherwydd ni chredaf ei bod yn ddoeth gwneud hynny, ond gwerthfawrogaf ei bod yn briodol y dylai'r cwestiwn hwn godi. Yn fy marn i, nid wyf am roi sylwadau am y mater hwnnw, oherwydd gallai fod yn niweidiol, fel y'i gwelaf. Fodd bynnag, gadewch imi drafod y mater difrifol, yn fy marn i, sef annibyniaeth S4C. Ni wn beth y mae'r datganiad yn ei ddweud yn benodol am hynny, ond mae'n dal yn peri gofid mawr i mi ac i'm plaid yma.

Gwnaf y cynnig hwn i'r Gweinidog yn hollol onest, gan imi deimlo ers cryn dipyn na allai fod dim byd sy'n fwy penodol Gymreig na darlledu Cymraeg. Ni wn pam mae'n cael sylw yn San Steffan—wel, gallaf ddeall pam ddigwyddai hynny'n hanesyddol efallai—ond mae'n hen bryd gwneud ymagwedd drawsbleidiol. Rwy'n fodlon iawn cyfranogi yn hynny, fel mae fy ngrŵp, i ganfod sut gellid datganoli hyn. Deallaf na fydd hyn yn rhan o'r BBC am y ddwy flynedd nesaf; bydd lle i anadlu. Ni wn a yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o hynny, ond credaf y bydd, am y ddwy flynedd nesaf, yn aros gyda'r Adran Diwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, gan drosglwyddo i strwythur y BBC ym mlwyddyn tri neu bedwar—er na wn ym mha ffordd yn arbennig. Gadewch inni geisio cael rhywbeth o hyn. Y ffordd i yrru hyn yn ei flaen yw ystyried sut gellir datganoli hyn i'r sefydliad hwn, os yw'r Gweinidog yn teimlo bod hynny'n ffordd adeiladol ymlaen. Deallaf o drafodaethau a gefais y bore yma nad hwn yw pen yr holl fater hwn; mae'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei drafod. Rwy'n credu bod dadl ar S4C y prynhawn yma yn San Steffan, yn Neuadd San Steffan, wedi'i chychwyn gan Guto Bebb. Mae'n siŵr y bydd honno hefyd yn cyfrannu. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym amser i wthio'r mater hwn yn ei flaen. Rwy'n credu mai datganoli S4C i'r corff hwn yw'r ffordd ymlaen.

Alun Ffred Jones: Croesawaf unrhyw gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol y gallwn ei chael ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, y gwirionedd yw bod y penderfyniad hwn wedi'i wneud ar frys, a hynny heb ymgynghori a heb drafod.

The respect agenda was certainly thrown out of the window without ceremony. The serious issue here is that we are now witnessing what amounts to an attack on Welsh-language broadcasting. It is important for us to realise and remember that S4C was set up because there were tensions within Wales. There had been a long and hard campaign. It was agreed that S4C was an important element in terms of a broader Welsh-language strategy, and, somehow or other, that has all been swept aside without consultation. This was thrown together almost in a matter of days; I cannot see that that is the way to create policy in any field, let alone this one.

If we can get cross-party support on any issues, I would welcome that, but it seems to me that all efforts, whether by your own party, other parties or no parties at all, have come to nothing and we have failed to impress upon the Government in London the sensitivities around this issue. Therefore, I welcome what you said about the independence of S4C, but this is a matter on which we must keep a close eye. As I have said before, it is vital that this discussion takes place within Wales, and that we are fully engaged as a Government, as an Assembly, and, just as importantly, as a wider civic society in Wales, so that any model that comes into being is one that has the stamp of approval of the people of Wales.

Nerys Evans: Cytunaf â sylwadau Rhodri Glyn a'ch sylwadau chithau bod heddiw yn ddiwrnod du iawn i ddarlledu yng Nghymru. A ydych yn rhannu'm siomedigaeth bod y camau hyn yn dod â gwleidyddiaeth yn ôl i'r trafodaethau ynglŷn â'r sianel, ac yn dangos diffyg dealltwriaeth a chydabyddiaeth o hanes sefydlu S4C, fel yr ydych newydd amlinellu? Yr hanes a'r gydnabyddiaeth honno sydd wedi sicrhau llwyddiant i'r sianel. Mae diffyg dealltwriaeth gan y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Llundain yn hynny o beth.

Yn anffodus, yr ydym wedi gweld trafodaethau gwleidyddol ynglŷn â'r sianel ers i hyn gael ei gyhoeddi ddoe, hyd yn oed gan rai sydd yn gweithio yn y BBC, ar y we. A gytunwch hefyd ei bod yn hollol anghredadwy bod S4C wedi clywed am hyn drwy'r wasg, a bod diffyg cyfathrebu hefyd

Mae'n sicr bod yr agenda parch wedi'i ddiystyru'n ddi-lol. Y mater difrifol yma yw ein bod bellach yn dyst i'r hyn sy'n ymosodiad ar ddarlledu Cymraeg. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli a chofio bod S4C wedi'i sefydlu am fod tensiynau yng Nghymru. Bu ymgyrch hir a chaled. Cytunwyd bod S4C yn elfen bwysig o ran strategaeth ehangach i'r Gymraeg, a, rhywsut neu'i gilydd, mae hynny oll wedi'i ddiystyru heb ymgynghori. Cafodd hyn ei lunio ar frys ymhen diwrnodau; ni allaf weld mai dyma'r ffordd i greu polisi mewn unrhyw faes, heb sôn am hwn.

Os gallwn gael cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol am unrhyw faterion, byddwn yn croesawu hynny, ond mae'n debyg imi fod yr holl ymdrechion, p'un ai gan eich plaid chi eich hun, pleidiau eraill neu ddim pleidiau o gwbl, wedi bod yn ddibwys a'n bod wedi methu ag argyhoeddi'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain o sensitifrwydd y mater hwn. Felly, croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedasoch am annibyniaeth S4C, ond mae hwn yn fater y mae'n rhaid inni gadw llygad barcud arno. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, mae'n hanfodol i'r drafodaeth hon ddigwydd yng Nghymru, a'n bod yn cael ein cynnwys yn llawn fel Llywodraeth, fel Cynlluniad, ac, yr un mor bwysig, fel cymdeithas ddinesig ehangach yng Nghymru, fel bod unrhyw fodel sy'n cael ei greu yn un a gafodd sêl bendith y Cymry.

Nerys Evans: I agree with Rhodri Glyn's comments and your comments that this is a very black day for broadcasting in Wales. Do you share my disappointment that these steps bring politics back into the discussions about the channel, and show a lack of understanding and recognition of the history of the establishment of S4C, as you have just outlined? It is that history and recognition that has ensured the success of the channel. The Minister and Government in London has shown a lack of understanding in that regard.

Unfortunately, we have seen political discussions about the channel since this was announced yesterday, even from those working in the BBC, on the internet. Would you also agree that it is quite unbelievable that S4C heard about this through the media, and that there was also a lack of

wedi bod gyda chi, fel Gweinidog, a chyda Llywodraeth Cymru? Mae'n dangos diffyg parch, nid yn unig o safbwynt clywed am y cynlluniau drwy'r wasg, ond o ran y ffaith na chafwyd unrhyw drafodaethau ynglŷn â'r opsiwn hwn gyda S4C na chithau fel Llywodraeth. A gytunwch fod yr agenda o barch drosodd, os bu un erioed?

Alun Ffred Jones: Yr wyf wedi gwneud fy nheimpladau yn ddigon clir ynglŷn â'r mater hwn o ddiffyg ymgynghori a diffyg trafodaeth. Yr hyn yr oeddwn wedi gofyn amdano—ac yr wyf yn dal i feddwl mai dyna'r ffordd ymlaen—oedd cael cynnal arolwg annibynnol sydd yn cynnwys yr holl elfennau sydd yn ymwneud â darlledu yng Nghymru a'r materion ieithyddol, fel bod yr holl fater yn cael ei wyntyllu a'n bod yn edrych ar unrhyw batrwm neu fodel newydd ar gyfer y dyfodol. Wedyn byddai rhywun yn gallu ystyried sut i gyflawni hynny mewn dull sydd yn gynaliadwy i'r dyfodol, ac, i ddod at eich pwynt am ariannu, sut i gadw hyn allan o'r arena wleidyddol y'i taflwyd yn ôl iddo ar ôl llwyddiant y setliad gwreiddiol gan y Llywodraeth Doriaidd flaenorol.

Nid oes unrhyw un yn dweud bod rhaid cadw'r model presennol—ni chredaf ei fod yn gynaliadwy ar hyn o bryd nac, yn sicr, wrth edrych ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, wrth roi'r cyfrifoldeb am ariannu hwn ar y BBC, y broblem yw ei fod wedyn yn creu tensiynau o fewn y BBC.

Gallwch ddychmygu y pwysau a fydd yn datblygu yn Llundain wrth i'r BBC geisio ymdopi â chyllideb sy'n crebachu, a'r pwysau y gall hynny ei roi hefyd ar BBC Cymru a BBC Wales a'r rhaglenni sydd eisoes dan warchae yno. Nid yw hwn yn ddiwrnod da iawn, ac nid oes unrhyw ddealltwriaeth o'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru yn cael ei ddangos o gwbl gan y Llywodraeth yn Llundain, hyd y gwelaf. Dylai hynny fod yn fater o bryder i bob un ohonom yn y Siambr ac i bawb y tu allan iddi.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae hwn yn ddiwrnod trist i mi hefyd. Fel eraill yma, sy'n parhau i gefnogi'r iaith a'n sianel Gymraeg, yr wyf yn siomedig iawn ynglŷn â chyflwr parhaol S4C â'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd ers ddoe. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai Llywodraeth

communication with you, as a Minister, and with the Welsh Government? It shows a lack of respect, not only with regard to hearing about the plans through the media, but in terms of the fact that there were no discussions about this option with S4C or you as a Government. Do you agree that the respect agenda is over, if it ever existed?

Alun Ffred Jones: I have made my feelings about this matter of the lack of consultation and discussion quite clear. What we called for—and I still believe that this is the way forward—was to have an independent inquiry that includes all the elements relating to broadcasting in Wales and the language issues, so that all matters are aired and that we look at any new pattern or model for the future. Then one could consider how that could be achieved in a way that is sustainable for the future, and, to come to your point about funding, how to keep this out of the political arena that it has been thrown back into following the success of the original settlement made by the previous Tory Government.

No-one is saying that we have to keep the current model—I do not think that that is sustainable at present, and certainly not for the future. However, by placing the responsibility for funding this on the BBC, the problem is that it then creates tensions within the BBC.

One can imagine the pressures that will build in London as the BBC tries to cope with a shrinking budget, and the pressures that could also place on BBC Cymru and BBC Wales and the programmes that are already under threat there. This is not a very good day, and there is no understanding of the situation in Wales being shown by the Government in London. That should be a matter of concern for us all in the Chamber and for everyone outside it.

Eleanor Burnham: This is a very sad day for me, too. Like others here, who continue to support the language and our Welsh-language channel, I am very disappointed about the continuing state of S4C and what has happened since yesterday. Do you agree that

Llundain dderbyn nad yw'r cynllun wedi ei ystyried yn ddigonol, ac ymrwymo i gynnal adolygiad llawn o reolaeth, trefn lywodraethol a strwythur cyllido S4C, fel y gellid rhoi darlledu yn yr iaith Gymraeg ar sylfaen gynaliadwy fel bod ein hiaith ac ansawdd a safonau rhaglenni yn yr iaith yn cael eu gwarchod? Gobeithiaf ein bod i gyd yn gallu cytuno ei bod hi'n hanfodol bwysig, fel yr ydych wedi dweud, cael annibyniaeth olygyddol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r newyddion yn cael ei ddarparu gan y BBC i S4C, ac nid yw o dan reolaeth S4C. Yr ydym yn cefnogi eich ymgyrch fel Gweinidog i wneud y gorau dros ein hiaith a S4C. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd digon o amser i drafod ymhellach gyda'n cyd-Aelodau ar draws y Cynulliad a chyda San Steffan.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod eich sylwadau yn gwbl ddiwyll, ac mae rhywun yn derbyn eich bod yn cefnogi'r iaith, wrth gwrs. Yn anffodus, mae'n rhaid ichi edrych ar y gweithredoedd, ac yr ydych yn rhan o glymblaid yn Llundain sydd wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwn. Dywedodd Simon Hughes yn glir iawn ar y radio y bore yma fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn rhan o'r penderfyniad, ac yr oedd yn falch ei fod yn gallu dweud hynny. Os felly, mae'n rhaid ichi gymryd y cyfrifoldeb am y penderfyniad hwn. Mae'n ddigon hawdd sôn am gynnal safonau, ond os ydych yn torri cyllideb unrhyw adran yn y Llywodraeth o 25 y cant, ni fyddwch yn cynnal safonau. Ffantasi yw hynny, ac waeth inni heb â byw mewn byd ffantasi. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud am annibyniaeth S4C, ond, unwaith eto, os mai'r BBC sydd yn ei ariannu, yna'r BBC fydd â'r hawl i alw'r diwn. Nid wyf yn credu bod y BBC yn dymuno gwneud hynny, ond mae'n rhaid inni ymladd am fodel sy'n sicrhau annibyniaeth. Yr wyf yn croesawu eich cefnogaeth i'r ymgyrch hwinnw, ond mae'n rhaid i chi wneud y pwynt hwinnw'n glir o fewn eich plaid eich hun yn y Llywodraeth sydd yn eich cynrychioli yn Llundain.

Y Llywydd: Yn olaf, ac yn fyr, Dai Lloyd.

David Lloyd: Diolch yn fawr, Llywydd. Yr wyf yn codi ar fy nhraed i fynegi siom, dicter a syndod ynglŷn â'r penderfyniad hwn. Dylai

the Government in London should accept that this scheme has not been adequately considered, and commit to holding a full review of the governance, management and financial structure of S4C, so that Welsh-language broadcasting can be placed on a sustainable foundation so that our language and the quality and standard of programmes in the language are safeguarded? I hope that we can all agree that it is essential, as you have said, to have editorial independence. At present, the news is provided by the BBC for S4C, and it is not managed by S4C itself. We support your campaign as Minister to do the best for our language and S4C. I hope that there will be sufficient time for further discussion with our fellow Members across the Assembly and with Westminster.

Alun Ffred Jones: I am sure that your comments are sincere, and one does accept that you support the language, of course. Unfortunately, you have to look at the actions, and you are part of the coalition in London that has made this decision. Simon Hughes stated clearly on the radio this morning that the Liberal Democrats were part of the decision, and he was proud to be able to say that. If that is the case, you have to take responsibility for this decision. It is very easy to talk about maintaining standards, but if you cut the budget of any Government department by 25 per cent, you will not be able to maintain standards. That is a fantasy, and we cannot live in a world of fantasy. I welcome what you say about the independence of S4C, but, once again, if the BBC is funding it, then the BBC will be able to call the shots. I do not believe that the BBC wishes to do that, but we have to fight for a model that will ensure independence. I welcome your support for that campaign, but you need to make that point clearly within your own party in the Government that represents you in London.

The Presiding Officer: Finally, and briefly, Dai Lloyd.

David Lloyd: Thank you, Presiding Officer. I am getting up to speak to express my disappointment, anger and shock at this

pob un ohonom ddweud yr un math o beth. Clywais yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog ac yr wyf yn ei gefnogi 100 y cant yn ei safiad dewr yn erbyn Llywodraeth Llundain, a wnaeth y penderfyniad hwn heb ddweud wrth y Cynulliad nac wrth S4C. Mae hyn yn taro at galon ein holl ddiwylliant yng Nghymru, ac mae'n bryd inni sefyll i fyny a mynegi ein dichter a phrotestio yn y termau cryfaf posibl. Mewn unrhyw gyfarfodydd y byddwch yn eu cael gyda Gweinidogion yn Llundain, Weinidog, gobeithiaf y byddant yn deall maint y dichter, siom a syndod fod y fath benderfyniad yn gallu cael ei wneud yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain heb ystyried unrhyw un yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn cytuno y dylem gael datganoli, ond mae'r agenda parch yn deilchion. Pa fath o agenda parch yw pan fo penderfyniadau fel hyn yn cael eu gwneud? [*Torri ar draws.*] Os wyt ti eisiau dweud rhywbeth, Peter, dywed ef, ond ar ddiwedd y dydd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydym yn disgwyl cwestiwn, nid araith, syr.

3.00 p.m.

David Lloyd: Gosod y cyd-destun oeddwn i, Lywydd. Ar ddiwedd y dydd, nid ydym wedi cael digon o amser i osod unrhyw gyd-destun, achos gwnaed y penderfyniad o fewn oriau. Mae disgwyl i ni naill ai ei dderbyn, gan rollo drosodd a pheidio ag ymateb, neu ymateb yn chwyrn. Fy marn i yw y dylem ymateb yn chwyrn. Mewn unrhyw gyfarfod a gewch gyda'r Gweinidogion yn Llundain, a wnewch chi drosglwyddo'r ymateb chwyrn hwnnw iddynt? Mae hyn yn hollol anfoddfaol. Mae'n taro ein calon fel cenedl.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ymatebaf yn gryno, yn ôl cyfarwyddyd y Llywydd. Y gwir amdani yw bod hwn yn benderfyniad ar frys sydd yn gyfleus i'r DCMS yn Llundain gan ei fod yn symud yr ariannu oddi wrtho yn glir ac yn ei alluogi i gyflwyno'r arbedion yr oedd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn benderfynol o'u gwneud. Dyna sydd wrth wraidd y penderfyniad hwn; nid oes ganddo ddim byd i'w wneud â lles darlledu yng Nghymru. Yr unig beth y byddwn yn ei ddweud yw er mwyn i bobl Cymru fynegi eu dichter, mae'n rhaid i ni—mae cyfrifoldeb arnaf i ond mae'n

decision. Every one of us should be making comments of that sort. I heard what the Minister has had to say and I support him 100 per cent in his brave stance against the Government in London, which has made this decision without informing the Assembly or S4C. This strikes at the heart of our entire culture in Wales, and it is time that we stood up and expressed our anger and protested in the strongest possible terms. In any meetings that you will have with Ministers in London, Minister, I hope that they will understand the scale of the anger, disappointment and shock that such a decision could be made in the twenty-first century without considering anyone in Wales. I agree that we should have devolution, but the respect agenda is in tatters. What kind of respect agenda is it when decisions such as this can be made? [*Interruption.*] If you have something to say, Peter, say it, but at the end of the day—

The Presiding Officer: Order. We are expecting a question, not a speech, sir.

David Lloyd: I was just placing this in its context, Presiding Officer. At the end of the day, we have not had enough time to set any context, because this decision was made within hours. We are expected either to accept it, by rolling over and failing to respond, or to respond strongly. My opinion is that we should respond strongly. In any meeting that you have with Ministers in London, I ask you to convey that strong response to them. This is completely unsatisfactory and strikes at the heart of our nation.

Alun Ffred Jones: I will respond briefly, as directed by the Presiding Officer. The truth is that this was a rapid decision that is convenient for the DCMS in London as it removes the funding from it entirely and enables it to deliver the savings that the Secretary of State is determined to make. That is at the heart of this decision; it has nothing to do with benefiting broadcasting in Wales. The only thing that I would say is that, in order for people in Wales to express their anger, we—there is a responsibility on me but it is broader than that as well—have

ehangach na hynny hefyd—ofalu ein bod yn gwneud y dadleuon hyn mewn ffordd synhwyrol a threfnus ac yn cynllunio ar gyfer model gwahanol na fydd yn bosibl i'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain ei wrthod. Mae'n rhaid i hynny ddod o Gymru ac mae'n rhaid i ni ei gynllunio, nid yn unig er mwyn darlledu yn gyffredinol a lles y Gymraeg, ond hefyd er lles pobl ifanc yn fy ardal i ac ar hyd a lled Cymru sydd yn dibynnu ar y gwasanaethau hyn er mwyn datblygu gyrfa synhwyrol a fydd yn rhoi bywoliaeth dda iddynt ac yn agor drysau cyfleoedd eraill i'r dyfodol. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol iawn ac mae'n rhaid inni gynllunio'n ofalus ar gyfer datrys sefyllfa anffodus iawn.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog am ateb y cwestiwn brys.

to ensure that we make these arguments in a sensible and organised way and plan for a different model that it will not be possible for the Government in London to refuse. That has to come from Wales and we have to design that, not only for broadcasting in general and the benefit of Welsh, but also for the benefit of young people in my area and across Wales who depend on these services in order to develop a sensible career that will give them a good livelihood and will open doors to other opportunities in the future. This is a very serious issue and we must plan carefully in order to solve a very unfortunate situation.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the Minister for answering the urgent question.

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd ar Ddarparu Rhandiroedd yng Nghymru The Sustainability Committee's Report into Allotment Provision in Wales

Cynnig NDM4562 Kirsty Williams

Motion NDM4562 Kirsty Williams

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi:

The National Assembly for Wales notes:

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd ar Ddarparu Rhandiroedd yng Nghymru a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Gorffennaf 2010.

The Report of the Sustainability Committee on Allotment Provision in Wales laid in the Table Office on 15 July 2010.

Kirsty Williams: I move the motion.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau y cynnig.

To begin with, I thank all those who were involved in the production of this report and all those who gave so freely of their time and expertise to the committee, while it undertook this inquiry. Special thanks go to the clerk, the deputy clerk and the research service, who assisted Members in the compilation of this report, and special mention should be made of the work of Leanne Wood who, as a member of the committee, was fundamental in persuading it to undertake this particular work, and who has a long track record of campaigning in this particular area.

I ddechrau, diolchaf i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â llunio'r adroddiad hwn a phawb a roes mor rhydd o'i amser a'i arbenigedd i'r pwyllgor, tra bu'n cynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn. Diolch yn arbennig i'r clerc, y dirprwy glerc a'r gwasanaeth ymchwil, a fu'n cynorthwyo'r Aelodau i lunio'r adroddiad hwn, a dylid sôn yn arbennig am waith Leanne Wood a oedd, yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, yn sylfaenol i'w berswadio i wneud y gwaith arbennig hwn, ac sydd â hanes maith o ymgyrchu yn y maes arbennig hwn.

As a committee, we decided to undertake this inquiry to highlight the role of allotments in building a sustainable society and to ensure that their potential towards delivering many of the Government's key priorities is recognised. As Assembly Members, I am sure that many of us receive correspondence from people who want an allotment, but are

Fel pwyllgor, penderfynasom gynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn i amlygu rôl rhandiroedd mewn adeiladu cymdeithas gynaliadwy ac i sicrhau bod eu potensial tuag at gyflenwi llawer o flaenoriaethau allweddol y Llywodraeth yn cael ei gydnabod. Fel Aelodau Cynulliad, rwy'n siŵr bod llawer ohonom yn cael gohebiaeth gan bobl sydd am

struggling to get any sort of response from local authorities. While the Government may have set out in 'One Wales: One Planet' that it was aiming for a 'huge' expansion in allotment and community growing, we are yet to see that happen. In fact, we found that some very basic things, such as how many people were waiting for allotments, or whether you could have a shed on your allotment site, needed to be addressed.

To turn to some of the key issues that arose during the inquiry and our recommendations, the committee received a great deal of positive evidence about groups coming together to create community spaces and about people being keen to live more sustainable lifestyles. However, we also heard from individuals who had been struggling to find space to grow their own produce and from people who had been battling to get local authorities to fulfil their obligations. The major message that we heard was that there must be greater clarity around allotments, and that the Government must provide a clear steer to local authorities about what it expects them to deliver on behalf of their citizens.

Greater clarity must be sought on establishing the supply and demand of allotments. It was made clear to the committee that there was no definitive picture of provision or demand in Wales. As part of this inquiry, we tried to establish how many people were on a waiting list for an allotment, and the average waiting time; however, we found that nobody held this very basic information. We were concerned that waiting lists were not consistently compiled by councils and that they do not always accurately reflect demand in an area. People told us that they are often put off registering for an allotment if the lists seem too long or if there were no suitable allotment sites in their area. We recommended, therefore, that a clear picture of allotment provision across Wales should be established. Without this clarity, it is unclear whether resources are being targeted in the right areas, and we believe that gaining a clear picture is an essential first step in addressing the problems in allotment provision.

We also sought to establish the legal position with regard to allotments and providing space, and again, we found a lack of clarity.

gael rhandir, ond sy'n cael trafferth i gael unrhyw fath o ymateb gan yr awdurdodau lleol. Er bod y Llywodraeth efallai wedi nodi yn 'Cymru'n Un: Cenedl Un Blaned' ei bod yn anelu at ehangu 'enfawr' mewn tyfu yn y gymuned ac mewn rhandiroedd, nid ydym wedi gweld hynny'n digwydd eto. Mewn gwirionedd, canfuom fod angen mynd i'r afael â rhai pethau sylfaenol iawn, fel faint o bobl a oedd yn aros am randiroedd, neu a allech chi gael sied ar eich safle rhandir.

Gan droi at rai o'r materion allweddol a gododd yn ystod yr ymchwiliad a'n hargymhellion, cafodd y pwyllgor lawer iawn o dystiolaeth gadarnhaol o grwpiau'n dod at ei gilydd i greu mannau cymunedol ac o bobl yn awyddus i fyw mewn ffyrdd mwy cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, clywsom hefyd gan unigolion a fu'n cael trafferth yn dod o hyd i le i dyfu eu cynnyrch eu hunain a chan bobl a fu'n brwydro i gael awdurdodau lleol i fodloni eu rhwymedigaethau. Y brif neges a glywsom oedd ei bod yn rhaid cael mwy o eglurder ynghylch rhandiroedd, a'i bod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth lywio awdurdodau lleol yn glir ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n disgwyl iddynt ei gyflenwi ar ran eu dinasyddion.

Mae'n rhaid cael mwy o eglurder am ganfod y cyflenwad rhandiroedd a'r galw amdanynt. Eglurwyd i'r pwyllgor nad oedd dim darlun pendant o'r ddarpariaeth na'r galw yng Nghymru. Yn rhan o'r ymchwiliad hwn, ceisiasom ganfod faint o bobl a oedd ar restr aros am randir, a'r amser aros cyfartalog; fodd bynnag, canfuom nad oedd neb yn cadw'r wybodaeth sylfaenol iawn hon. Roeddem yn poeni nad oedd rhestr aros yn cael eu llunio'n gyson gan gynghorau ac nad ydynt bob amser yn adlewyrchu'r gwir alw mewn ardal. Dywedodd pobl wrthym eu bod yn aml yn penderfynu peidio â chofrestru am randir os yw'r rhestr fel petaent yn rhy hir neu os nad oedd unrhyw safleoedd rhandir addas yn eu hardal. Argymellasom, felly, y dylid sefydlu darlun clir o ddarpariaeth rhandiroedd ledled Cymru. Heb yr eglurder hwn, nid yw'n glir a ydy adnoddau'n cael eu targedu yn yr ardaloedd cywir, a chredwn fod cael darlun clir yn gam cyntaf hanfodol i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau o ran darparu rhandiroedd.

Ceisiasom hefyd ganfod y sefyllfa gyfreithiol o ran rhandiroedd a darparu lle, ac eto, daethom ar draws ddiffyg eglurder. Er bod

While a number of changes had been made to the relevant legislation over the years, we found that this had been done in a piecemeal fashion that made it difficult for lay people—and professionals, in some cases—to interpret. In particular, we were concerned that there is no time limit under the Small Holdings and Allotments Act 1908 for local authorities to consider written requests for providing allotment space under Section 23(1). Furthermore, we were concerned that no guidance was given on what a reasonable timeframe for responding to those requests would be; this must be clarified. Although the failure of local authorities to react in a timely manner to requests for allotment space may not be against the law, we feel that it is certainly not in the spirit of the law, and this needs to be rectified. We have made recommendations to review the existing legislation with a view to bringing in a new law that is relevant to Wales today. Recognising that this will take time, we have also asked for guidance to be issued in the meantime to establish what a reasonable time frame is for local authorities to respond to requests.

As a committee, we wanted to see more land being used for allotment sites, including land that is currently owned by public bodies. However, we also want to see greater support for allotments to be set up on private land, as we recognise that the need for allotment space is so great that there may not be sufficient public land to meet demand.

Turning to the issue of planning constraints, we heard a number of confusing stories about when planning permission is and is not needed on allotment sites, and some worrying examples of multiple fees being requested for a single site; again, clarity needs to be brought to the situation. The committee wants to see a planning system that supports the establishment of growing spaces, not one that adds to the confusion. We certainly do not want to see the continuation of a situation in which people evoke the right to have chickens or rabbits on their allotments simply to ensure they can have a shed; to achieve this, we recommend to the Government that clarification and simplification is sought around planning rules for allotments.

There is also a need for more information and support if we are to make the aims of

nifer o newidiadau wedi'u gwneud yn y ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol dros y blynyddoedd, canfuom fod hyn wedi'i wneud mewn modd tameidiog a oedd yn ei gwneud yn anodd i bobl leyg—a phobl broffesiynol, mewn rhai achosion—ei dehongli. Yn arbennig, roeddem yn poeni nad oes dim terfyn amser o dan Ddeddf Tyddynnod a Rhandiroedd 1908 i awdurdodau lleol ystyried ceisiadau ysgrifenedig i ddarparu lle am randir o dan Adran 23(1). Hefyd, roeddem yn poeni nad oedd arweiniad wedi'i roi ar amserlen resymol i ymateb i'r ceisiadau hynny; mae'n rhaid egluro hyn. Er nad yw'n anghyfreithlon bod awdurdodau lleol wedi methu ag ymateb mewn pryd i geisiadau am le rhandir, teimlwn yn sicr nad yw yn naws y gyfraith, ac mae angen cywiro hyn. Rydym wedi gwneud argymhellion i adolygu'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol gyda'r bwriad o gyflwyno deddf newydd sy'n berthnasol i Gymru heddiw. Gan gydnabod y bydd hyn yn cymryd amser, rydym hefyd wedi gofyn am gyhoeddi arweiniad yn y cyfamser i ganfod beth yw amserlen resymol i awdurdodau lleol ymateb i geisiadau.

Fel pwyllgor, roedd arnom eisiau gweld mwy o dir yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer safleoedd rhandir, gan gynnwys tir sy'n eiddo ar hyn o bryd i gyrff cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, hoffem hefyd weld mwy o gefnogaeth i sefydlu rhandiroedd ar dir preifat, am ein bod yn cydnabod bod cymaint o angen lle rhandir nad oes efallai digon o dir cyhoeddus i ateb y galw.

Gan droi at fater cyfyngiadau cynllunio, clywsom nifer o storïau dryslyd ynghylch pryd mae angen caniatâd cynllunio neu beidio ar safleoedd rhandir, a rhai enghreifftiau sy'n peri gofid o ofyn am ffioedd lluosog am un safle; eto, mae angen egluro'r sefyllfa. Mae ar y pwyllgor eisiau gweld system gynllunio sy'n cefnogi sefydlu lleoedd tyfu, nid un sy'n ychwanegu at y dryswch. Yn bendant, nid ydym am weld y sefyllfa'n parhau lle mae pobl yn galw'r hawl i gadw ieir neu gwningod ar eu rhandiroedd dim ond i sicrhau y gallant gael sied; i wneud hyn, argymhellwn i'r Llywodraeth fod gofyn egluro a symleiddio'r rheolau cynllunio ar gyfer rhandiroedd.

Mae angen hefyd rhagor o wybodaeth a chymorth os ydym am gyrraedd y nod o

encouraging people to use growing space a success. We want to see adequate information and support made available for everyone. Starting an allotment can be difficult and costly, so we would like information to be available to people at the beginning of the process. Through providing clear information, we hope that there would be an increase in the number of people wanting to grow their own and live more sustainable lives.

As stated earlier, the recommendations that we have made are aimed at bringing clarity to this muddled area. We want to make it easier to access, develop and maintain an allotment site. We also made recommendations aimed at making sure that the benefits of allotments are recognised across Government departments. We welcome, therefore, the Minister's broad acceptance of all our recommendations except one. Even in the case of the one recommendation that was rejected, the Minister has undertaken to clarify the position with regard to planning and allotments in a future revision of technical advice note 16, which is very welcome. We hope that this will achieve the desired results.

3.10 p.m.

While we welcome the support that the Minister is offering to those local authorities in need of assistance to find workable solutions to deliver their allotment responsibilities, we hope that this will be done alongside work with all local authorities in order to develop a consistent approach to allotment provision across Wales. Hopefully, with guidance from the Government, greater clarity can be brought to allotment provision and a system can be developed that will be easy for everyone to understand, no matter which local authority area they live in. We hope that the review of legislation for allotments does not delay the much-needed guidance on a reasonable time frame for local authorities' consideration of a request for space. Finally, we hope that, once the review has been completed, new legislation can be brought forward that is relevant to Wales.

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I thank the Sustainability Committee for its work on the inquiry into allotment provision for Wales. You have,

annog pobl i ddefnyddio lle tyfu. Rydym am weld digon o wybodaeth a chymorth ar gael i bawb. Gall fod yn anodd ac yn ddud dechrau rhandir, felly hoffem petai gwybodaeth ar gael i bobl ar ddechrau'r broses. Drwy ddarparu gwybodaeth glir, gobeithiwn y byddai mwy o bobl sydd am dyfu eu bwyd eu hunain a byw'n fwy cynaliadwy.

Fel y dywedwyd yn gynharach, nod yr argymhellion a wnaethom yw dod ag eglurder i'r maes dryslyd hwn. Mae arnom eisiau ei gwneud yn haws cael safle rhandir, a'i ddatblygu a'i gynnal a'i gadw. Gwnaethom argymhellion hefyd gyda'r nod o sicrhau bod buddion rhandiroedd yn cael eu cydnabod ar draws adrannau Llywodraeth. Croesawn, felly, fod y Gweinidog yn derbyn yn fras ein holl argymhellion ond un. Hyd yn oed yn achos yr un argymhelliad a wrthodwyd, mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymrwmo i egluro'r sefyllfa o ran cynllunio a rhandiroedd mewn diwygiad o nodyn cyngor technegol 16 yn y dyfodol, sy'n galonogol iawn. Gobeithiwn y bydd hyn yn cyflawni'r canlyniadau dymunol.

Er ein bod yn croesawu'r cymorth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei gynnig i'r awdurdodau lleol hynny y mae angen eu cynorthwyo i ganfod atebion ymarferol i gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau rhandir, gobeithiwn y bydd hyn yn cael ei wneud ochr yn ochr â gwaith gyda phob awdurdod lleol i ddatblygu dull cyson o ddarparu rhandiroedd ledled Cymru. Gydag arweiniad gan y Llywodraeth, y gobaith yw y gellir dod â mwy o eglurder i faes darparu rhandiroedd ac y gellir datblygu system a fydd yn hawdd i bawb ei deall, ni waeth ym mha ardal awdurdod lleol maent yn byw. Gobeithiwn na fydd yr adolygiad o ddeddfwriaeth ar gyfer rhandiroedd yn oedi'r cyfarwyddyd y mae mawr ei angen ar amserlen resymol i awdurdodau lleol ystyried cais am lle. Yn olaf, gobeithiwn y gellir cyflwyno deddfwriaeth newydd sydd yn berthnasol i Gymru, ar ôl i'r adolygiad gael ei gwblhau.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd am ei waith ar yr ymchwiliad i ddarparu rhandiroedd i Gymru. Drwy'r gwaith hwn,

through this work, helped to draw attention to the many benefits that the use of allotments, community farms and gardens provide, and have also helped to focus the discussion on the way forward. We did not find your findings or recommendations entirely unexpected, because the Government recently consulted widely with many interests in this subject during the development of our Tidy Towns and local environmental quality improvement project grants, and our community-grown food action plan, which we published in July. As a Government, our priority is to oversee the adequate and timely supply of allotment land, and to assist in its development and management.

I very much agree with the principle of seeking to confer additional powers on Welsh Ministers, or amending the allotments Acts as they apply to Wales. The Wales Rural Observatory research programme will examine the major legislative issues, and the follow-up actions will be subject to its findings. One opportunity that we have, and one area that I am personally keen to explore, is how Part 4 of Schedule 7 to the Government of Wales Act 2006 would come into force following a 'yes' vote in next year's referendum. Part 1 of Schedule 7 provides that smallholdings and allotments would be a policy area within the legislative competence of the National Assembly, meaning that the National Assembly could legislate in that area to make any provision that could be made by Act of Parliament. That could include, for example, conferring powers on Welsh Ministers, and/or amending the allotment Acts as they apply to Wales.

To drive forward our current approach, and to encourage consensus around allotment provision, we have commissioned the Wales Rural Observatory to work with the Welsh Local Government Association, individual local authorities, and other members of our community-grown food task and finish group to map existing allotment provision, assess levels of demand and explore options for the future management of allotments. The results of this work will be used to identify land in a suitable location and condition for use as an allotment and for growing food.

At this point, I would like to listen to other Members' contributions to the debate.

rydych wedi helpu i dynnu sylw i'r buddion lawer a geir drwy ddefnyddio rhandiroedd, ffermydd a gerddi cymunedol, ac wedi helpu hefyd i ganolbwyntio'r drafodaeth ar y ffordd ymlaen. Nid oedd eich canfyddiadau na'ch argymhellion yn gwbl annisgwyl gennym, oherwydd bu'r Llywodraeth yn ymgynghori'n eang yn ddiweddar â llawer o fuddiannau yn y pwnc hwn yn ystod y broses o ddatblygu ein grantiau prosiect gwella ansawdd amgylcheddol lleol a Threfi Taclus, a'n cynllun gweithredu bwyd a dyfir yn y gymuned, a gyhoeddwyd gennym ym mis Gorffennaf. Fel Llywodraeth, ein blaenoriaeth yw goruchwyllo cyflenwad digonol ac amserol tir rhandir, a chynorthwyo i'w ddatblygu a'i reoli.

Cytunaf yn llwyr ag egwyddor ceisio cyflwyno pwerau ychwanegol i Weinidogion Cymru, neu newid y Deddfau rhandiroedd fel y maent yn berthnasol i Gymru. Bydd rhaglen ymchwil Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru yn archwilio'r prif faterion deddfwriaethol, a bydd y camau dilynol yn amodol ar ei chanfyddiadau. Un cyfle sydd gennym, ac un maes yr wyf yn bersonol awyddus i'w archwilio, yw'r ffordd y byddai Rhan 4 o Atodlen 7 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn dod i rym ar ôl pleidlais 'ie' yn refferendwm y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae Rhan 1 o Atodlen 7 yn amodi y byddai tyddynnod a rhandiroedd yn faes polisi yng nghymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan olygu y gallai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddeddfu yn y maes hwnnw i wneud unrhyw ddarpariaeth y gellid ei gwneud gan Ddeddf Seneddol. Gallai hynny gynnwys, er enghraifft, cyflwyno pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru, a/neu newid y Deddfau rhandir fel y maent yn berthnasol i Gymru.

I wthio ein dull cyfredol yn ei flaen, ac i annog cydsynio ynghylch darparu rhandiroedd, rydym wedi comisiynu Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru i weithio gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, awdurdodau lleol unigol, ac aelodau eraill o'n grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen bwyd a dyfir yn y gymuned i fapio darpariaeth bresennol rhandiroedd, asesu lefelau galw ac archwilio dewisiadau ar gyfer rheoli rhandiroedd yn y dyfodol. Defnyddir canlyniadau'r gwaith hwn i adnabod tir sydd mewn lle a chyflwr addas i'w ddefnyddio yn rhandir ac i dyfu bwyd.

Yn y man hwn, hoffwn wrando ar gyfraniadau Aelodau eraill at y ddadl.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the Minister. I think that we will start with Leanne Wood.

Leanne Wood: This committee inquiry was agreed after my office carried out some research that showed a growing waiting list for allotments in all parts of Wales. In some counties, people faced five, six or eight years on waiting lists before they had any hope of getting their own allotment. In short, there is not enough allotment space to meet demand, so we wanted to find out what could be done to expand the availability of allotment land.

Our inquiry found that the law relating to allotments is quite strong, and we received evidence that any risk of downgrading the law in relation to allotments would be a retrograde step. Therefore, any changes to the law should involve updating or strengthening, and certainly not reducing, the current provisions.

As the Chair of the committee has said, we also found it difficult to get an accurate picture of the supply or demand of allotments, because different local authorities use different criteria when compiling their lists. They all have different rules regarding overgrown plots and evictions, which means that allotment turnover varies throughout Wales. However, even though it was difficult to get an accurate picture of what was going on, the committee was left in no doubt at all that steps needed to be taken to expand the amount of land available. That is why recommendation 6 is so important.

The land owned by public bodies has the potential to play a huge role if it can be freed up for community-growing or allotment use. Therefore, I am pleased that the Minister has accepted this recommendation, but I am concerned that, under the financial implications section of the Minister's response to the recommendation, she states that, in acceptance, costs will be covered by existing budgets, mainly the rural development budget. Land is needed in urban as well as in rural areas, therefore I want to know, if possible, how the freeing up of land in non-rural areas will be paid for. That point also relates to the Minister's response to a number of the other recommendations.

The committee's inquiry has enabled us to listen and take evidence from experts, many

Y Llywydd: Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog. Rwy'n credu y dechreuwn ni gyda Leanne Wood.

Leanne Wood: Cytunwyd ar yr ymchwiliad pwyllgor hwn ar ôl i'm swyddfa i wneud ymchwil a ddangosodd fod rhestr aros gynyddol am randiroedd ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mewn rhai siroedd, roedd pobl yn wynebu pump, chwech neu wyth mlynedd ar restr aros cyn iddynt gael gobaith o gael eu rhandir eu hunain. Yn fyr, nid oes digon o le rhandir i ateb y galw, felly roeddem am gael gwybod beth ellid ei wneud i sicrhau bod mwy o dir rhandir ar gael.

Canfu ein hymchwiliad fod y gyfraith mewn perthynas â rhandiroedd yn eithaf cryf, a chawsom dystiolaeth y byddai unrhyw risg o israddio'r gyfraith mewn perthynas â rhandiroedd yn gam yn ôl. Felly, dylai unrhyw newidiadau yn y gyfraith fod i ddiweddarau neu gryfhau'r darpariaethau cyfredol, ac nid eu lleihau o gwbl.

Fel y dywedodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, fe'i cawsom yn anodd hefyd cael darlun cywir o'r cyflenwad rhandiroedd a'r galw amdanynt, gan fod gwahanol awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio gwahanol feini prawf wrth lunio eu rhestri. Mae ganddynt oll wahanol reolau ynghylch lleiniau sydd wedi tyfu'n wyllt a throi pobl allan, sy'n golygu bod trosiant rhandiroedd yn amrywio ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, er ei bod yn anodd cael darlun cywir o'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd, roedd y pwyllgor yn gwbl siŵr bod angen cymryd camau i ehangu'r tir sydd ar gael. Dyna pam mae argymhelliad 6 mor bwysig.

Gallai'r tir sy'n eiddo i gyrrff cyhoeddus chwarae rhan enfawr os gellir ei ryddhau ar gyfer tyfu yn y gymuned neu randiroedd. Felly, rwy'n falch bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn, ond rwy'n poeni ei bod yn dweud, o dan adran goblygiadau ariannol ymateb y Gweinidog i'r argymhelliad, o dderbyn, y bydd costau'n cael eu talu gan gyllidebau presennol, sef y gyllideb datblygu gwledig yn bennaf. Mae angen tir mewn ardaloedd trefol ac mewn ardaloedd gwledig, felly rwyf am wybod, os oes modd, sut bydd modd talu am ryddhau tir mewn ardaloedd nad ydynt yn wledig. Mae'r pwynt hwnnw hefyd yn gysylltiedig ag ymateb y Gweinidog i nifer o argymhellion eraill.

Mae ymchwiliad y pwyllgor wedi'n galluogi i wrando ar arbenigwyr a chael tystiolaeth

of whom were keen to impress upon us how food security could become a major problem in future years, as a result of climate change and peak oil. These are global problems, but Wales will not be immune to them. Some of our witnesses stressed the need to be prepared and to build resilience for a time when food could become unaffordable for the many.

I pushed for this inquiry not because I am a keen gardener, even though I am, but because we face this big food security problem. I know that the committee's report will not deliver an easy solution to those future food security problems, but it will do an important job in acknowledging those problems, and it makes recommendations to harness the keenness that many people have to produce their own food. This report is a good start, but its recommendations will need to be implemented, built upon and reviewed regularly in future. In the meantime, we should all do everything that we can to ensure that the enthusiasm that is out there for food growing is supported as much as possible. We will be very grateful for that in future years.

Angela Burns: I am delighted to speak today as a member of the Sustainability Committee that conducted the inquiry into allotment provision. I would like to add my thanks to those of the Chair to the clerks and all the researchers who worked on this inquiry. I also want to pay tribute to Leanne, because when Leanne first started sitting on the Sustainability Committee and said that she wanted to conduct an inquiry into allotments, I thought, 'Why?'. Why should the Assembly spend so much time and effort on looking at what is a very small issue, when there are such big problems for us to consider? However, Leanne, you and the inquiry completely convinced me of the need for us to look at this as an issue. Your passion, and the passion of many of the witnesses who came before us and the people to whom I have spoken in my constituency on this subject, is compelling.

I will not rehearse the arguments that other people have put forward today. I am delighted that the Minister accepted 15 of the 16 recommendations in full or in principle. I also understand her hesitancy over recommendation 16. However, I will ask you

ganddynt, a llawer ohonynt yn awyddus i gyfleu inni y gallai diogelwch bwyd fod yn broblem fawr yn y dyfodol, o ganlyniad i newid hinsawdd ac olew brig. Problemau byd-eang yw'r rhain, ond ni fydd Cymru'n rhydd rhagddynt. Pwysleisiodd rhai o'n tystion fod angen paratoi a magu cadernid ar gyfer adeg pan allai bwyd fod yn anfforddiadwy i lawer.

Nid am fy mod i'n arddwr brwd y gwithiais am yr ymchwiliad hwn, er fy mod i, ond am ein bod yn wynebu'r broblem fawr hon gyda diogelwch bwyd. Gwn na fydd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn rhoi ateb hawdd i'r problemau diogelwch bwyd hynny yn y dyfodol, ond bydd yn gwneud gwaith pwysig i gydnabod y problemau hynny, ac mae'n gwneud argymhellion i fanteisio ar y brwdfrydedd ymhlith lawer o bobl i gynhyrchu eu bwyd eu hunain. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ddechreuad da, ond bydd angen gweithredu ei argymhellion, eu meithrin ymhellach a'u hadolygu'n rheolaidd yn y dyfodol. Yn y cyfamser, dylem oll wneud popeth y gallwn i sicrhau bod y brwdfrydedd sy'n bodoli i dyfu bwyd yn cael ei gefnogi cymaint â phosibl. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn am hynny yn y dyfodol.

Angela Burns: Mae'n bleser gennyf siarad heddiw yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd a gynhaliodd yr ymchwiliad i ddarparu rhandiroedd. Hoffwn ychwanegu fy niolch innau at ddiolch y Cadeirydd i'r clerod a'r holl ymchwilyr a fu'n gweithio ar yr ymchwiliad hwn. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged hefyd i Leanne, oherwydd pan ddechreuodd Leanne eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd a dweud ei bod am gynnal ymchwiliad i randiroedd, meddyliais 'Pam?'. Pam ddylai'r Cynlluniad dreulio cymaint o amser ac ymdrech yn edrych ar fater bach iawn, a phroblemau mor fawr inni eu hystyried? Fodd bynnag, Leanne, rydych chi a'r ymchwiliad wedi fy argyhoeddi'n llwyr fod angen edrych ar hyn fel mater. Mae eich brwdfrydedd chi, a brwdfrydedd llawer o'r tystion a ddaeth ger ein bron a'r bobl y siaradais i â hwy yn fy etholaeth i am y pwnc hwn, yn nerthol.

Ni ymarferaf y dadleuon y mae eraill wedi'u cyflwyno heddiw. Rwyf wrth fy modd bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn 15 o'r 16 argymhelliad yn llawn neu mewn egwyddor. Deallaf hefyd ei phetruster ynghylch argymhelliad 16. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf un

one question, Minister. I was pleased to see you refer in your response to 'Appetite for Life', and you mentioned that schools are looking at the Welsh network of healthy school schemes. One of the schools in my constituency, the Blue School in Pembroke Dock, has the healthy schools scheme accreditation, and it is the first primary school in Wales to achieve that. You state in your response that

'These schools are required to develop a whole school approach to a range of health issues, including food and fitness. One of the suggested activities is a gardening club, especially if this involves the development of a vegetable garden or allotment.'

I particularly wanted to mention that because it is an interesting idea. My small children do a little bit of digging around in their primary school facility, which has brought home to them what they can do and where food comes from. They love watching various vegetables and flowers grow. However, a great many schools do not have that facility on site, and therefore they need to be able to go elsewhere. Minister, I now ask you to try to circle a square on this issue, because I have heard of instances where schools have said to interested parties, 'Yes, we would like to use part of your garden centre, nursery or field as allotments', but they have been unable to get the planning permission to change them into allotments, even though, looking at the wording, that would fit neatly and nicely into the concept of low-impact development. Minister, could you have a look at that area to see whether there is any way in which we can facilitate that, so that those who wish to participate can do so?

3.20 p.m.

There are many other benefits as well, not just for children but for their parents, because the children will drag them out to show them the things that they are growing. It will also help those enterprises to offer an alternative to what they already do. I would be happy to share with you at another time and in another place, if you so wish, the comments that I have received from people who have come to me to say that they want to do it, that they have had the go-ahead from everyone and that everyone thinks that it is a good idea. For

cwestiwn ichi, Weinidog. Roeddwn yn falch o'ch gweld yn cyfeirio yn eich ymateb at 'Blas am Oes', a soniasoch fod ysgolion yn edrych ar rwydwaith Cymru o gynlluniau ysgolion iach. Mae gan un o'r ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i, sef yr Ysgol Iach yn Noc Penfro, achrediad y cynllun ysgolion iach, a hon yw'r ysgol gynradd gyntaf yng Nghymru i gyflawni hynny. Rydych chi'n dweud yn eich ymateb

'Ei bod yn ofynnol i'r ysgolion hyn ddatblygu ymagwedd ysgol gyfan at amrywiaeth o faterion iechyd, gan gynnwys bwyd a ffitrwydd. Un o'r gweithgareddau a awgrymir yw clwb garddio, yn enwedig os yw hwn yn cynnwys datblygu gardd lysiau neu randir.'

Roeddwn am sôn yn arbennig am hynny am ei fod yn syniad diddorol. Mae fy mhlant bach i'n gwneud ychydig o balu yn y cyfleuster yn eu hysgol gynradd, sydd wedi gwneud iddynt sylweddoli'r hyn y gallant ei wneud ac o ble mae bwyd yn dod. Maen nhw wrth eu bodd yn gwyllo llysiau a blodau amrywiol yn tyfu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cyfleuster hwnnw gan lawer iawn o ysgolion ar y safle, ac felly mae angen eu bod yn gallu mynd i rywle arall. Weinidog, gofynnaf yn awr ichi geisio gosod cylch am sgwâr ar y mater hwn, oherwydd rwyf wedi clywed am achosion lle mae ysgolion wedi dweud wrth fuddgyfranogwyr, 'Hoffem ddefnyddio rhan o'ch canolfan arddio, planhigfa neu gae fel rhandiroedd', ond wedi methu wedyn â chael y caniatâd cynllunio i'w troi'n rhandiroedd, er byddai hynny, gan edrych ar y geiriad, yn cyd-fynd yn dda ac yn dwt â chysyniad datblygiad effaith isel. Weinidog, a allech chi edrych ar y maes hwnnw i weld a oes unrhyw ffordd y gallwn ni hwyluso hynny, fel y bod y rheini sydd am gyfranogi'n gallu gwneud hynny?

Mae llawer o fuddion eraill hefyd, nid i'r plant yn unig ond i'w rhieni, oherwydd bydd y plant yn eu tynnu allan i ddangos y pethau maent yn eu tyfu iddynt. Bydd hefyd yn helpu'r mentrau hynny i gynnig dewis arall yn lle'r hyn a wnânt eisoes. Byddwn yn falch o rannu â chi rywbryd arall ac yn rhywle arall, os dymunwch, y sylwadau a gefais oddi wrth bobl sydd wedi dod ataf i ddweud eu bod am wneud hynny, eu bod wedi cael cymeradwyaeth gan bawb a bod pawb yn credu ei bod yn syniad da. Er enghraifft, mae

example, 10 schools have bought into it, but they simply cannot get the change of use through even if it is classed as a low-impact development; they cannot, for example, change a little part of a nursery into such a facility. Therefore, Minister, I would be most grateful if you could look at that.

As I said earlier, Leanne, you have completely convinced me on this matter, but we now have to turn the report into action and make it happen. That is just one example of the kinds of hold-ups that it may well come across.

Joyce Watson: I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in the debate on the provision of allotments in Wales. Allotments can provide part of the solution to a number of issues that we discuss regularly in the Chamber, such as active lifestyles, community cohesion and sustainable development. The potential for community gardening is by no means exhausted in Wales, and development in this area could bring with it a number of benefits. As a member of the committee that worked on the report, I took a great interest in the good practice that already exists in this area, and I hope that the report goes some way towards building on that.

I would like to focus my contribution on recommendations 13, 14 and 15 of the report, which relate to the benefits of allotments to the community. As a committee, we took evidence from a number of witnesses who gave examples of how allotments can contribute to the surrounding area. The Soil Association told us that allotments can bring people together, as people talk to each other and learn from each other. Allotments can simultaneously be a private interest, resulting in personal satisfaction and benefit, as well as a social activity, engaging with others and discussing common interests.

I would like to highlight one scheme in my constituency, that is, Cymdeithas y Dalar in Llandeilo. The organisation uses community allotments as a means of creating links between local establishments, such as schools, and one school gardening club has over 100 members. If you visit Cymdeithas y Dalar's website, you will see that it aims to foster mutual respect and co-operation in all sectors of the community through the

10 ysgol wedi cytuno iddo, ond ni allant brosesu'r newid defnydd hyd yn oed os yw'n cael ei ddsbarthu fel datblygiad effaith isel; ni allant, er enghraifft, droi rhan fechan o feithrinfa yn gyfleuster felly. Felly, Weinidog, byddwn yn dra diolchgar pe gallech chi edrych ar hynny.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, Leanne, rydych wedi fy argyhoeddi'n llwyr o'r mater hwn, ond yn awr mae'n rhaid inni droi'r adroddiad yn gamau gweithredu a gwneud iddo ddigwydd. Dim ond un enghraifft yw honno o'r mathau o rwystrau y gallai ddod ar eu traws yn ddigon posibl.

Joyce Watson: Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl am ddarparu rhandiroedd yng Nghymru. Gall rhandiroedd ddarparu rhan o'r ateb i nifer o faterion a drafodwn yn rheolaidd yn y Siambr, fel ffyrdd gweithgar o fyw, cydlyniant cymunedol a datblygu cynaliadwy. Nid yw'r potensial am arddio cymunedol wedi'i ddihysbyddu yng Nghymru o bell ffordd, a gallai datblygu'r maes hwn gynnig nifer o fuddion. Fel aelod o'r pwyllgor a weithiodd ar yr adroddiad, bu gennyf ddiddordeb mawr yn yr arfer da sydd eisoes yn y maes hwn, a gobeithiaf y bydd yr adroddiad yn gwneud cryn dipyn tuag at feithrin hynny ymhellach.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio fy nghyfraniad ar argymhellion 13, 14 a 15 o'r adroddiad, sy'n gysylltiedig â buddion rhandiroedd i'r gymuned. Fel pwyllgor, cawsom dystiolaeth oddi wrth nifer o dystion a roes enghreifftiau o'r ffordd y gall rhandiroedd gyfrannu at yr ardal o'u cwmpas. Dywedodd Cymdeithas y Pridd wrthym fod rhandiroedd yn gallu dod â phobl ynghyd, gan fod pobl yn siarad â'i gilydd ac yn dysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd. Ar yr un pryd, gall rhandiroedd fod yn ddiddordeb preifat, sy'n dwyn boddhad a budd personol, yn ogystal â gweithgaredd cymdeithasol, gan ymgysylltu ag eraill a thrafod diddordebau cyffredin.

Hoffwn amlygu un cynllun yn fy etholaeth, sef Cymdeithas y Dalar yn Llandeilo. Mae'r gymdeithas yn defnyddio rhandiroedd cymunedol yn fodd o greu cysylltiadau rhwng sefydliadau lleol, fel ysgolion, ac mae gan glwb garddio un ysgol fwy na 100 o aelodau. Os byddwch yn ymweld â gwefan Cymdeithas y Dalar, byddwch chi'n gweld ei bod yn anelu at feithrin cydweithrediad a pharch rhwng holl sectorau'r gymuned

experience of working together and sharing skills and knowledge. I think that we would all agree that those are attributes that all schools should strive to achieve. Any organisation that offers something that is a little different and that might capture pupils' imagination and creative flair, as has happened in this case, is surely to be welcomed.

I note from the Minister's response that work is already going on in this area, including work on the community grown food action plan and the support for the garden exchange scheme in Ceredigion. The latter is a good example of the aesthetic benefits of allotments for a community, as underutilised gardens are used for vegetable growing. Doing so transforms unkempt areas of land into a looked-after and productive space, which in turn can lead to people taking pride in their area.

Recommendation 14 concerns the establishment of community growing projects that are based on the National Trust's model of encouraging people to give it a go. I wholeheartedly agree with that recommendation. I am a keen gardener and I can vouch for the satisfaction that comes from growing something successfully. The benefits for people who give it a go and produce their own food include having to spend less time at the supermarket, and if that were amplified and became a nation-wide activity, there would be greater food security, which has already been mentioned today. According to the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs' Food Statistics Pocketbook 2010, just 23 per cent of all fruit and vegetables that were consumed in the UK in 2008 were grown in the UK, which means that over three quarters of our fruit and vegetables were imported. I recognise that that is partly due to our taste for exotic produce that cannot be grown here, but for a country that has such a prominent farming history, I find that to be a remarkably low figure. If we can inspire people to grow their own food, we can reduce our dependency on imports and spend less on our groceries.

I conclude by thanking the witnesses who gave evidence to the committee. We gained a fascinating insight into the good practice that is already taking place. It is evident from the Minister's response that the Government is

drwy'r profiad o gydweithio a rhannu sgiliau a gwybodaeth. Rwy'n credu y cytunem oll fod y rheini'n briodoleddau y dylai pob ysgol ymdrechu i'w cyflawni. Mae unrhyw gymdeithas sy'n cynnig rhywbeth ychydig yn wahanol ac a allai danio dychymyg a dawn greadigol disgyblion, fel sydd wedi digwydd yma, yn siŵr o gael ei chroesawu.

Sylwaf o ymateb y Gweinidog fod gwaith eisoes yn mynd rhagddo yn y maes hwn, gan gynnwys gwaith ar y cynllun gweithredu tyfu bwyd yn y gymuned a'r gefnogaeth i'r cynllun cyfnewid gardd yng Ngheredigion. Mae'r olaf yn enghraifft dda o fuddion esthetig rhandiroedd i gymuned, gan fod gerddi segur yn cael eu defnyddio i dyfu llysiau. Mae gwneud hynny'n trawsnewid ardaloedd anniben o dir yn lle cynhyrchiol sy'n cael gofal, sy'n gallu golygu wedyn fod pobl yn ymfalchïo yn eu hardal.

Mae Argymhelliad 14 yn ymwneud â sefydlu prosiectau tyfu yn y gymuned sy'n seiliedig ar fodel yr Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol o annog pobl i roi cynnig arni. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r argymhelliad hwnnw. Rwy'n arddwr brwd a gallaf dystio i'r boddhad sy'n dod o dyfu rhywbeth yn llwyddiannus. Mae pobl sy'n rhoi cynnig arni ac sy'n cynhyrchu eu bwyd eu hunain yn elwa am nad oes rhaid iddynt dreulio cymaint o amser yn yr archfarchnad, a phetai hynny'n cael ei ehangu a phe byddai'n weithgarwch drwy'r genedl gyfan, byddai gwell diogelwch bwyd, fel y soniwyd eisoes heddiw. Yn ôl Llyfr Poced Ystadegau Bwyd 2010 Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, dim ond 23 y cant o'r holl ffrwythau a llysiau a fwytwyd yn y DU yn 2008 a gafodd eu tyfu yn y DU, sy'n golygu bod dros dri chwarter o'n ffrwythau a'n llysiau wedi'u mewnfario. Rwy'n cydnabod bod hynny'n rhannol oherwydd ein blas am gynnrych egstotig nad oes modd ei dyfu yma, ond am wlad sydd â hanes ffermio mor amlwg, ystyriaf fod y ffigur hwnnw'n syndod o isel. Os gallwn ysbrydoli pobl i dyfu eu bwyd eu hunain, gallwn ddibynnu llai ar fwyd sy'n cael ei fewnfario a gwario llai ar ein bwydydd.

I gloi, diolchaf i'r tystion a roes dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor. Cawsom olwg diddorol iawn ar yr arfer da sydd eisoes yn digwydd. Mae'n amlwg o ymateb y Gweinidog bod y Llywodraeth hefyd yn ymdrechu i fanteisio ar

also attempting to capitalise on the benefits of allotments. In my opinion, that is to be welcomed.

William Graham: Members have already outlined the cross-party acknowledgement of the wide-ranging benefits derived from cultivating an allotment. Not only does growing fresh, often organic produce, offer children an opportunity to gain a wider understanding of their food and how it is produced, it also generates savings for the family food budget. Working an allotment leads to a healthier lifestyle by promoting healthy eating and enhancing physical and mental health.

Traditionally a recreational hobby, allotments create opportunities for socialising and interaction between people of all ages and from all walks of life within a community. They also make a significant contribution to sustaining the biodiversity of the neighbourhood, particularly if located in an urban area. It is clear that there is a growing interest in and demand for allotments throughout Wales, and we must ensure that we support this demand and the opportunity to enhance all aspects of lifestyle that arise from cultivating an allotment.

The Minister has already indicated that she wishes to promote the requirements of the Small Holdings and Allotments Act 1908. This is legislation that is still being enforced and it places a legal duty on councils to provide a sufficient number of plots to meet local demand—you should not have to wait more than a reasonable period for one to become available. In fact, six people who are registered on the electoral roll may petition their council to meet its legal duty to provide allotments. Members will be aware of the significance of the Rhiwderin allotments in Newport, a site used for over a century and tended by successive generations. In response to a question concerning these allotments, the Minister stated that she was sure that every Assembly Member would like to see more statutory allotments. I trust that she will hope to bring this forward.

Minister, I ask you for an option for the wider establishment of statutory allotments to provide security for established allotment tenders. Such security would allow allotment holders to plan the development of their holdings, to build greenhouses, and to gain

fuddion rhandiroedd. Yn fy marn i, dylid croesawu hynny.

William Graham: Mae Aelodau eisoes wedi amlinellu'r gydnabyddiaeth drawsbleidiol i'r buddion amrywiol iawn sy'n deillio o drin rhandir. Nid yn unig y mae tyfu cynnyrch ffres, organig yn aml, yn gyfle i blant ddod i ddeall eu bwyd yn well a sut mae ei gynhyrchu, mae hefyd yn arbed cyllideb fwyd y teulu. Mae trin rhandir yn arwain at ffordd fwy iachus o fyw drwy hyrwyddo bwyta'n iach a gwella iechyd corfforol a meddyliol.

Mae rhandiroedd, sef hobi hamdden yn draddodiadol, yn creu cyfleoedd i bobl o bob oedran a phob lliw a llun gymdeithasu a rhyngweithio mewn cymuned. Maent hefyd yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at gynnal bioamrywiaeth y gymdogaeth, yn arbennig os ydynt mewn ardal drefol. Mae'n amlwg bod diddordeb cynyddol mewn rhandiroedd, a galw cynyddol amdanynt, ledled Cymru, ac mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cefnogi'r galw hwn a'r cyfle i wella pob agwedd ar ffordd o fyw sy'n deillio o drin rhandir.

Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi nodi ei bod yn dymuno hyrwyddo gofynion Deddf Tyddynnod a Rhandiroedd 1908. Deddfwriaeth yw hon sy'n cael ei gorfodi o hyd ac mae'n gosod dyletswydd gyfreithiol ar gynghorau i ddarparu nifer digonol o leiniau i ateb galw lleol-ni ddylai fod rhaid ichi aros mwy na chyfnod rhesymol cyn bod un ar gael. Mewn gwirionedd, caiff chwech o bobl sydd wedi'u cofrestru ar y gofrestr etholiadol ddeisebu eu cyngor i fodloni ei ddyletswydd gyfreithiol i ddarparu rhandiroedd. Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol o arwyddocâd rhandiroedd Rhiwderyn yng Nghasnewydd, safle a ddefnyddid ers canrif a rhagor ac a driniwyd gan genedlaethau olynol. Mewn ymateb i gwestiwn ynghylch y rhandiroedd hyn, dywedodd y Gweinidog ei bod yn siŵr y byddai pob Aelod Cynulliad yn hoffi gweld mwy o rhandiroedd statudol. Hyderaf y bydd yn gobeithio cyflwyno hyn.

Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi am ddewis i sefydlu rhandiroedd statudol yn ehangach i roi sicrwydd i'r rheini a fu'n trin rhandiroedd ers tro. Byddai sicrwydd felly'n galluogi deiliaid rhandiroedd i gynllunio datblygiad eu daliadau, i adeiladau tai gwydr, ac i gael

experience from cultivating crops and perhaps some livestock to enhance their diets and lifestyles and to meet the recommendations of the Sustainability Committee's report on allotment provision in Wales.

Irene James: I am grateful for the opportunity to speak on this report. The committee has produced an excellent report that makes for interesting reading. It has, of course, been produced at the time of increasing interest in allotments. People of all ages are seeing the attractions of growing and eating their own fruit and vegetables. Not only do they provide an excellent source of vitamins, the very act of growing and tending them, as I can testify, is a great way of getting exercise, and it gives a great deal of satisfaction. As I think we all know, fresh fruit and vegetables taste really good. It is one way, as Angela has already said, of encouraging children because, all too often, they are not prepared to try vegetables. However, there is a different meaning altogether when they have grown the vegetables themselves.

I have no doubt that the demand for allotments will increase. I was therefore pleased that the committee undertook as one of the criteria for its inquiry to look at more innovative approaches to the use of land for allotments. Many of the organisations that gave evidence indicated ways in which alternative supplies of private and public land could be used. I know that the Minister has indicated in her response to the report that a land bank of public and private land is being considered. I would be interested to learn how near we are to actually achieving it.

The need for local authorities to be less rigid in their thinking over matters such as plot sizes is long overdue. I do not want to see a reduction in the size of plots that people already have or see people being prevented from accessing larger plots; I simply want councils to allow individuals who would rather have a smaller, less time-intensive allotment to have access to one. This would allow full inclusion for anyone who wanted a plot and, of course, it is another way of alleviating some of the problems of waiting lists.

As I stated at the beginning, I am a keen grower of flowers, fruit and vegetables. I would like to see more people have the

profiad o dyfu cnydau ac efallai rhywfaint o dda byw i wella eu diet a'u ffordd o fyw ac i fodloni argymhellion adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd ar ddarparu rhandiroedd yng Nghymru.

Irene James: Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad am yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi llunio adroddiad rhagorol sy'n ddiddorol i'w ddarllen. Mae wedi'i lunio, wrth reswm, ar adeg o ddiddordeb cynyddol mewn rhandiroedd. Mae pobl o bob oedran yn gweld atyniadau tyfu a bwyta eu ffrwythau a'u llysiau eu hunain. Nid yn unig y maent yn darparu ffynhonnell ardderchog o fitaminau, mae'r union weithred o'u tyfu a'u trin, fel y gallaf fi dystio, yn ffordd wych o ymarfer corff, ac mae'n rhoi llawer iawn o foddhad. Fel y gwyddom oll rwy'n credu, mae ffrwythau a llysiau ffres yn blasu'n wych. Dyma un ffordd, fel y dywedodd Angela eisoes, o annog plant oherwydd, yn llawer rhy aml, nid ydynt yn fodlon rhoi cynnig ar lysiau. Fodd bynnag, mae ystyr gwbl wahanol pan fyddant wedi tyfu'r llysiau eu hunain.

Rwy'n hollol siŵr y bydd y galw am rhandiroedd yn cynyddu. Roeddwn yn falch felly bod y pwyllgor wedi cynnwys ymhlith meini prawf ei ymchwiliad edrych ar ddulliau mwy arloesol o ddefnyddio tir ar gyfer rhandiroedd. Roedd llawer o'r sefydliadau a roes dystiolaeth yn nodi ffyrdd y gellid defnyddio cyflenwadau amgen o dir preifat a chyhoeddus. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi nodi yn ei hymateb i'r adroddiad fod banc tir o dir cyhoeddus a phreifat yn cael ei ystyried. Hoffwn gael gwybod pa mor agos ydym at gyflawni hynny mewn gwirionedd.

Mae'n hen bryd i'r awdurdodau lleol fod yn fwy hyblyg wrth feddwl am faterion fel meintiau lleiniau. Nid wyf am weld y lleiniau sydd gan bobl yn barod yn lleihau na gweld pobl yn cael eu hatal rhag cael lleiniau mwy o faint; yn syml, rwyf am i gynghorau ganiatáu i unigolion gael rhandir llai o faint, sy'n mynnu llai o amser, pe byddai hynny'n well ganddynt. Byddai hyn yn caniatáu cynhwysiant llwyr i unrhyw un a oedd yn dymuno cael llain ac, wrth reswm, mae'n ffordd arall o leddfu rhai o'r problemau rhestri aros.

Fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, rwy'n un brwd am dyfu blodau, ffrwythau a llysiau. Hoffwn weld mwy o bobl yn cael y cyfle i rannu fy

opportunity to share my joy in growing produce. I see increasing the provision of allotments as one of the best ways of achieving this. I would therefore join with other Members in congratulating all committee members and staff on this report, and I thank everyone who came to give evidence. Let us ensure a bright future for allotments in Wales.

3.30 p.m.

Jane Davidson: I thank committee members, and other Members, for their contributions to this debate. It is worth pointing out that, although major opportunities would flow from a 'yes' vote in a referendum, as Leanne said, the law in relation to allotments is much stronger than that in relation to many other local authority functions. Many are expressed as general or specific discretionary powers, so it is hard for a complainant to show that an authority has acted wholly unreasonably. Section 23 of the Small Holdings and Allotments Act 1908 is specific in stating that an authority 'shall provide' a sufficient number of allotments. Therefore, we need to ensure that, whatever action is taken, the strength of that legislation is maintained.

Several Members focused on the land bank issue. It is important to create a land bank of public and private sector land. This is not just in the context of work that is done in rural areas; you will notice that the examples in our response to recommendation 6 are urban examples. One example is Ely Growing Together and another is in Ystradgynlais. There is another in Miskin, in Rhondda Cynon Taf, where £15,000 was given via our local environmental quality improvement projects grant scheme, to develop an area of wasteland to the rear of the school, which is currently subject to vandalism, fly-tipping and related fires. Two new allotments have been established there: one for the community, and one for the school. That kind of approach is particularly important. Over the past year, we have had over 400 allotment-related projects from my Tidy Towns initiative, and some 59 allotment garden areas are being adopted by local groups. Therefore, we have seen a huge expansion of opportunities.

It is important to point out that we need to

llawenydd wrth dyfu cynnyrch. Ystyriaif mai darparu mwy o randiroedd yw un o'r ffyrdd gorau o wneud hyn. Byddwn felly'n ymuno ag Aelodau eraill i longyfarch pob aelod o'r pwyllgor a'r staff am yr adroddiad hwn, a diolchaf i bawb a ddaeth i roi tystiolaeth. Gadewch inni sicrhau dyfodol disglair i randiroedd yng Nghymru.

Jane Davidson: Diolchaf i aelodau'r pwyllgor, ac i Aelodau eraill, am eu cyfraniadau at y ddadl hon. Er byddai cyfleoedd mawr yn deillio o bleidlais 'ie' mewn refferendwm, fel y dywedodd Leanne, mae'n werth nodi bod y gyfraith mewn perthynas â rhandiroedd yn llawer cryfach nag y mae mewn perthynas â llawer o swyddogaethau eraill yr awdurdod lleol. Mynegir llawer yn bwerau dewisol penodol neu gyffredinol, felly mae'n anodd i achwynydd ddangos bod awdurdod wedi gweithredu'n gwbl afresymol. Mae Adran 23 o Ddeddf Tyddynnod a Rhandiroedd 1908 yn benodol yn nodi y 'bydd' awdurdod yn 'darparu' nifer digonol o randiroedd. Felly, mae angen inni sicrhau bod cryfder y ddeddfwriaeth honno'n cael ei gynnal, pa gamau bynnag a gymerir.

Canolbwyntiodd nifer o Aelodau ar fater y banc tir. Mae'n bwysig creu banc tir o dir sector preifat a chyhoeddus. Nid yw hynny'n unig yng nghyd-destun gwaith a wneir mewn ardaloedd gwledig; byddwch yn sylwi bod yr enghreifftiau yn ein hymateb i argymhellid 6 yn enghreifftiau trefol. Un enghraifft yw Ely Growing Together ac mae un arall yn Ystradgynlais. Mae un arall ym Meisgyn, yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, lle rhoddwyd £15,000 drwy ein cynllun grant prosiectau gwella ansawdd amgylcheddol lleol, i ddatblygu ardal o dir diffaith y tu ôl i'r ysgol, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn destun fandaliaeth, tipio anghyfreithlon a thanau cysylltiedig. Mae dau randir newydd wedi'u sefydlu yno: un i'r gymuned, ac un i'r ysgol. Mae'r math hwnnw o ddull yn arbennig o bwysig. Dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, rydym wedi cael dros 400 o brosiectau cysylltiedig â rhandir o fy menter Trefi Taclus, ac mae tua 59 o ardaloedd o erddi rhandir yn cael eu mabwysiadu gan grwpiau lleol. Felly, rydym wedi gweld cyfleoedd yn ehangu'n sylweddol.

Mae'n bwysig nodi bod angen inni

use the word ‘planning’ technically in the context of allotments. Planning permission for allotments is not required, as it does not constitute development under town and country planning legislation. The current development control system already provides a means whereby allotment holders can find out whether any structures that they consider necessary for the working of allotments would require planning permission. That remains the responsibility of the local planning authority. In the context of ‘Appetite for Life’ and the foundation phase, we want primary and infant schools to work with others to encourage young people to be much closer to the growing process. Examples such as the one that Joyce mentioned in her constituency are good examples of ways in which people of all ages can come together on this important initiative.

Therefore, there is a major opportunity for us with a referendum. If that is not taken, any future Assembly could seek a further transfer of powers from the UK Government in this context. Unfortunately, we cannot provide authoritative guidance on time frames in an area for which we do not have legislative competence. That is why I believe that a strong message, in the context of a referendum, about community growing and food security is the way forward.

Kirsty Williams: I thank all colleagues from across the Chamber for their contributions to this afternoon’s debate. It is good to see that there are enthusiastic gardeners among Assembly Members and an enthusiasm for Government to pursue the recommendations that are outlined in our report.

I wish to stress the important part that you played, Leanne, in bringing this issue to the National Assembly’s attention—in the Chamber and in committee. As I said during the debate on canoeing, this is another good reason why we should have a ‘yes’ vote next March, so that we can pursue this agenda, as we hope to pursue the canoeing agenda. You are right to point out that this issue affects all Welsh communities, whether urban or rural. There is a real demand out there. The challenges in providing those spaces in rural and urban areas are sometimes different, but there is a desire from people throughout Wales and we have a responsibility, as do

ddefnyddio’r gair ‘cynllunio’ yn dechnegol yng nghyd-destun rhandiroedd. Nid yw caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer rhandiroedd yn ofynnol, am nad yw’n golygu datblygiad o dan ddeddfwriaeth cynllunio gwlad a thref. Mae’r system gyfredol i reoli datblygiad eisoes yn darparu modd lle gall deiliaid rhandir gael gwybod a fyddai angen caniatâd cynllunio ar unrhyw strwythurau yr ystyriant eu bod yn angenrheidiol er mwyn trin rhandiroedd. Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod cynllunio lleol yw hwnnw o hyd. Yng nghyd-destun ‘Blas am Oes’ a’r cyfnod sylfaen, mae arnom eisiau i ysgolion cynradd ac ysgolion babanod weithio gydag eraill i annog pobl ifanc i fod yn llawer agosach at y broses dyfu. Mae enghreifftiau fel yr un y soniodd Joyce amdani yn ei hetholaeth hi yn enghreifftiau da o ffyrdd y gall pobl o bob oedran ddod at ei gilydd ar y fenter bwysig hon.

Felly, mae cyfle mawr inni gyda refferendwm. Os nad achubir ar hwnnw, gallai unrhyw Gynulliad yn y dyfodol geisio trosglwyddo pwerau ymhellach o Lywodraeth y DU yn y cyd-destun hwn. Yn anffodus, ni allwn ddarparu arweiniad awdurdodol ar amserlenni mewn maes nad oes gennym gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ar ei gyfer. Dyna pam rwy’n credu mai neges gref, yng nghyd-destun refferendwm, am dyfu bwyd yn y gymuned a diogelwch bwyd yw’r ffordd ymlaen.

Kirsty Williams: Diolchaf i bob cydweinidog ar draws y Siambr am ei gyfraniadau at ddadl y prynhawn yma. Mae’n braf gweld bod garddwyr brwd ymhlith Aelodau’r Cynulliad a brwdfrydedd i’r Llywodraeth fynd ar drywydd yr argymhellion a amlinellir yn ein hadroddiad. Hoffwn bwysleisio’r rhan bwysig yr ydych chi wedi’i chwarae, Leanne, i ddod â’r mater hwn i sylw’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—yn y Siambr ac yn y pwyllgor. Fel y dywedais yn ystod y ddadl am ganŵio, mae rheswm da arall pam y dylem gael pleidlais ‘ie’ fis Mawrth nesaf, er mwyn inni fynd ar drywydd yr agenda hwn, fel y gobeithiwn fynd ar drywydd yr agenda canŵio. Rydych chi’n iawn i nodi bod y mater hwn yn effeithio ar holl gymunedau Cymru, boed y rheini’n rhai trefol neu wledig. Mae galw go iawn yma. Mae’r heriau i ddarparu’r lleoedd hynny mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol weithiau’n wahanol, ond mae dyhead gan bobl ledled

local authorities, to respond to that desire, regardless of location.

Angela, I think that your emphasis on children is right, and I am grateful that the Minister agrees with you that there is much scope for children's activities in this area.

Joyce, I think that your point on the wider social impact that allotments can have is relevant. In my constituency, the newly created allotments in the village of Llangatock on land owned by the community council represent more than just allotments; they are bringing people together, including those who have great skills in this respect, who are predominantly older people. They are mixing with their younger neighbours and passing those skills down through the generations. Allotments are also responsible for the rebirth of the village agricultural show, because why have an allotment unless you can have a competition at the end of the year to see who has grown the best carrots and leeks? In Llangatock, after an absence of 20 years, the village show is back, and allotments were the spark for that. The community now comes together again at the end of the growing season for some friendly competition about the produce, and a barbecue.

William, I am also grateful for your support in this afternoon's debate. As you said, local authorities have a responsibility, which they need to get to grips with.

Irene, I am not completely convinced that children growing their own will make them eat their vegetables; it certainly has not worked in my family, but maybe I could give it another go.

Irene James: I did not say that it would.

Kirsty Williams: You said that it might encourage that. However, you are right that it is vital, given the wider health benefits of eating fresh fruit and vegetables, as well as the exercise involved in doing the gardening, and the huge improvements that gardening can make to mental health issues. Growing fruit and vegetables and tending to gardens can have a massive therapeutic effect, and linking some of these projects with hospitals and GP services could have a big impact on individuals' lives, perhaps as an alternative to medication. If we could get people out doing some physical activity, they would see the

Cymru ac mae gennym gyfrifoldeb, fel sydd gan awdurdodau lleol, i ymateb i'r dyhead hwnnw, ni waeth beth yw'r lleoliad.

Angela, rwy'n credu bod eich pwyslais ar blant yn iawn, ac rwy'n ddiolchgar bod y Gweinidog yn cytuno â chi bod llawer o le i weithgareddau plant yn y maes hwn.

Joyce, rwy'n credu bod eich pwynt ar yr effaith gymdeithasol ehangach y gall rhandiroedd ei chael yn berthnasol. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae'r rhandiroedd newydd a grëwyd ym mhentref Llangatwg ar dir sy'n eiddo i'r cyngor cymunedol yn fwy na rhandiroedd; maent yn dod â phobl ynghyd, gan gynnwys y rheini sydd â sgiliau gwych yn hyn o beth, a rheini'n bobl hŷn yn bennaf. Maent yn cymysgu â'u cymdogion ieuengach ac yn trosglwyddo'r sgiliau hynny i lawr drwy'r cenedlaethau. Mae rhandiroedd hefyd yn gyfrifol am atgyfodi sioe amaethyddol y pentref, oherwydd beth yw diben rhandir os na allwch chi gael cystadleuaeth ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn i weld pwy sydd wedi tyfu'r moron a'r cennin gorau? Yn Llangatwg, ar ôl absenoldeb o 20 mlynedd, mae sioe'r pentref wedi dychwelyd, a'r rhandiroedd oedd wedi sbarduno hynny. Mae'r gymuned bellach yn dod at ei gilydd eto ar ddiwedd y tymor tyfu am gystadleuaeth gyfeillgar am y cynnyrch, a barbeciw.

William, rwy'n ddiolchgar hefyd am eich cefnogaeth yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Fel y dywedasoch, mae gan awdurdodau lleol gyfrifoldeb, ac mae angen iddynt fynd i'r afael ag ef.

Irene, nid wyf yn gwbl argyhoeddedig y bydd plant yn bwyta eu llysiau os ydynt wedi'u tyfu eu bwyd eu hunain; nid yw hynny wedi gweithio o gwbl yn fy nheulu i, ond hwyrach y gallwn roi cynnig arall arni.

Irene James: Ni ddywedais y byddai.

Kirsty Williams: Dywedasoch y gallai annog hynny. Fodd bynnag, rydych chi'n iawn ei bod yn hanfodol, o ystyried buddion iechyd ehangach bwyta ffrwythau a llysiau ffres, yn ogystal â'r ymarfer sydd ynghlwm wrth arddio, a'r gwelliannau enfawr y gall garddio eu gwneud mewn materion iechyd meddwl. Mae tyfu ffrwythau a llysiau a thrin gerddi'n gallu cael effaith therapiwtig enfawr, a thrwy gysylltu rhai o'r prosiectau hyn ag ysbytai a gwasanaethau meddyg teulu gellid effeithio'n fawr ar fywydau unigolion, efallai fel dewis yn lle meddyginiaeth. Pe gallem gael pobl allan yn gwneud

therapeutic effects that gardening can have.

In conclusion, I thank the Minister for her acceptance of the majority of the recommendations and for her commitment to take this work forward. In doing so, I press upon her the necessity to stress to the Wales Rural Observatory, which has been tasked by the Minister to take this agenda forward, that it should do so in a timely fashion so that we do not lose momentum on what is, as we have seen today, an issue, for once, that unites us.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you to the Chair of the committee.

Y cwestiwn yw a yw'r Cynulliad yn nodi adroddiad yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.38 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.38 p.m.*

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu 'Cronfeydd Strwythurol: Gweithredu Rhaglenni 2007-13'
The Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report 'Structural Funds: Implementation of the 2007-13 Programmes'

Cynnig NDM4564 Gareth Jones

Motion NDM4564 Gareth Jones

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, 'Cronfeydd Strwythurol: Gweithredu Rhaglenni 2007-13', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Gorffennaf 2010.

Notes the Enterprise and Learning Committee's report on Structural Funds: Implementation of the 2007-2013 Programmes which was laid in the Table Office on 7 July 2010.

Gareth Jones: Cynigiau y cynnig.

Gareth Jones: I move the motion.

A minnau'n Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ar ein hadroddiad ar gronfeydd strwythurol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a gweithredu rhaglenni 2007-13. Gan ein bod bron hanner ffordd drwy weithredu'r rhaglenni cyfredol, yr oedd yn amser addas i adolygu'r cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma a gwneud awgrymiadau ar gyfer gwella'r

gweithgarwch corfforol, byddent yn gweld yr effeithiau therapiwtig y gall garddio eu cael.

I gloi, diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am iddi dderbyn mwyafrif yr argymhellion ac am ei hymrwymiad i fynd â'r gwaith hwn yn ei flaen. Wrth wneud hynny, pwysaf arni fod angen pwysleisio i Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru, sydd wedi cael y dasg gan y Gweinidog o fynd â'r agenda hwn yn ei flaen, y dylai wneud hynny mewn modd diymdroi er mwyn inni beidio â cholli momentwm ar fater sydd, fel y gwelsom heddiw, am unwaith, yn ein huno.

Y Llywydd: Diolch i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor.

ffordd o weithredu'r rhaglenni am weddill y cyfnod. Yr wyf yn croesawu ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i'n hargymhellion, ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gallu dylanwadu ar bolisi yn y maes pwysig hwn. Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb o'r unigolion a'r sefydliadau sydd wedi cyfrannu at ein hymchwiliad. Efallai y dylwn nodi'n arbennig Plant y Cymoedd ym Mhen-y-graig, y Rhondda, a'n croesawodd ni i gynnal un o'n cyfarfodydd yno, lle cawsom gyfle i siarad ag amryw o bobl o brosiectau unigol.

Pan gyhoeddwyd ein hadroddiad gennym fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, yr oedd Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru wedi cytuno ar gyfanswm buddsoddiad o dros £2.4 biliwn, gyda chyfraniad o dros £1.2 biliwn o gronfeydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yr oedd cyfanswm o 164 o brosiectau wedi'u cymeradwyo, gyda 30 y cant wedi ei fuddsoddi mewn busnes, 44 y cant mewn pobl, a 25 y cant mewn adfywio cymunedol, yr amgylchedd a thrafnidiaeth.

3.40 p.m.

Yr oedd y pwyllgor yn bryderus bod y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd wedi disgyn 3.5 y cant rhwng 2006 a 2007 i sefyll ar 73.4 y cant o gyfartaledd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, er i Gomisiwn Ewrop ddweud wrthym fod y gostyngiad yng Nghymru wedi bod yn llai dramatig nag ydoedd mewn rhanbarthau neu aelod-wladwriaethau cyfagos. Gan nad yw'r ffigurau yr wyf newydd eu crybwyll yn adlewyrchu'r buddsoddiadau a wnaed o dan y rhaglen gydgyfeirio, gobeithiaf yn fawr y bydd y darlun yn well pan fydd ffigurau GDP 2008 ar gael.

Da oedd clywed gan swyddogion y Comisiwn fod y broses o wneud ceisiadau ac o ddewis prosiectau sy'n cael ei defnyddio gan WEFO yn cael ei hystyried yn enghraifft o arfer da. Eto, nid oedd y dystiolaeth a gawsom o'r prosiectau eu hunain yr un mor ganmoliaethus. Mae llawer wedi canfod y broses o wneud ceisiadau yn rhy hir ac yn rhy gymhleth. Yr wyf felly yn croesawu ymateb y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fod WEFO yn cydnabod bod lle i wella ac y bydd yn parhau i weithredu ar sail y gwersi a ddysgwyd.

delivery of programmes for the remainder of the term. I therefore welcome the Welsh Government's response to our recommendations, and I am glad that we have been able to influence policy in this important area. I want to thank all the individuals and organisations who contributed to our inquiry. Perhaps I should single out Valleys Kids in Penygraig, Rhondda, who hosted one of our meetings, where we were able to speak to a number of people from individual projects.

When we published our report last July, the Welsh European Funding Office had by then agreed a total investment of more than £2.4 billion, with a contribution of more than £1.2 billion from European Union funds. A total of 164 projects had been approved, with 30 per cent invested in business, 44 per cent in people, and 25 per cent in community regeneration, the environment and transport.

The committee was concerned that gross domestic product per capita in west Wales and the Valleys had fallen 3.5 per cent in 2006-07 to stand at 73.4 per cent of the European Union average, although we were told by the European Commission that the decline in Wales had been less dramatic than that seen in neighbouring member states or regions. As the figures that I have just cited do not reflect investments made under the convergence programme, I hope that the picture will be more complete when the 2008 GDP figures become available.

It was pleasing to hear from Commission officials that the project application and selection process employed by WEFO was regarded as an example of good practice. However, evidence that we received from the projects themselves was not as complimentary. Many have found the application process to be too long and overly complicated. I therefore welcome the Deputy First Minister's response that WEFO recognises that there is room for improvement and will continue to act on the lessons learned.

O ran y cynnydd hyd yma, yr oedd Llywodraeth Cymru a swyddogion y Comisiwn yn fodlon bod rhaglenni ar y trywydd iawn i gyrraedd eu hamcanion a'u targedau. Ar y pryd, fodd bynnag, yr oedd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn bryderus nad oedd unrhyw brosiectau wedi'u cymeradwyo o dan flaenoriaeth cydgyfeirio 4 cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop, sef moderneiddio a gwella ansawdd ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus (creu'r cysylltiadau). Yn wir, yr oedd rhaglen gydgyfeirio cronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop hefyd yn llusgo'n sylweddol y tu ôl i raglenni eraill. Dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wrthym fod y dirwasgiad wedi effeithio'n neilltuol ar raglen gydgyfeirio cronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop gan fod cynifer o'r prosiectau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â hi yn golygu gwariant cyfalaf a oedd yn gofyn am symiau mawr o gyllid cyfatebol. Bu inni argymhell felly y dylai WEFO roi ystyriaeth i'r dirwasgiad economaidd presennol wrth fonitro targedau ei brosiectau a'r canlyniadau mwy hirdymor i economi Cymru. Yn ogystal â hynny, fodd bynnag, credwn y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru adolygu'n rheolaidd sut y mae'n defnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol wrth ymateb i'r dirwasgiad. Yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymateb drwy ddweud ei bod yn adolygu targedau rhaglenni a pherthnasedd y rhaglenni yn eu cyfanrwydd.

Un o'r prif bethau a oedd yn ein poeni ni ynghylch y rhaglenni oedd rhaniad anwastad y cyllid rhwng y sectorau cyhoeddus, y sector preifat a'r sector di-elw. Mae'r dull o ddsbarthu'r cronfeydd ar gyfer y rownd raglennu hon wedi arwain at lai o brosiectau, a'r rheiny'n rhai mwy strategol. Dywedwyd wrthym y bydd tua 300 o brosiectau yn cael eu cymeradwyo o dan y rownd bresennol o gronfeydd strwythurol o'u cymharu â 3,000 o dan y rhaglen ariannu Amcan 1 wreiddiol. Ar yr adeg pan oeddem yn adrodd, yr oedd prosiectau a arweiniwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cyfrif am bron hanner y prosiectau a gymeradwywyd hyd hynny, ac eto yr oedd prosiectau a arweiniwyd gan y sector preifat yn cyfrif am lai nag 1 y cant. Dywedodd mudiadau'r trydydd sector wrthym eu bod yn bryderus nad oeddent bellach yn gallu cael unrhyw gyllid

With regard to the progress made to date, Welsh Government and Commission officials were content that programmes were well on track to achieve their objectives and targets. However, at the time, the Enterprise and Learning Committee was concerned that no projects had been approved under European social fund convergence priority 4, namely modernising and improving the quality of our public services (making the connections). Indeed, the convergence programme of the European regional development fund was also lagging well behind other programmes. The Deputy First Minister told us that the recession had particularly affected the European regional development fund convergence programme because so many of the projects related to it involved capital spend requiring large amounts of match funding. We therefore recommended that WEFO should consider factoring in the current economic downturn when monitoring its project targets and the longer-term outcomes for the Welsh economy. In addition to that, however, we also believe that the Welsh Government should regularly keep under review how it uses structural funds in responding to the recession. I am pleased that the Welsh Government has responded by saying that it is reviewing programme targets and the relevance of programmes as a whole.

One of the main issues of concern to us about these programmes was the uneven spread of funding across the public, private and not-for-profit sectors. The approach to the delivery of funds for this programming round has resulted in fewer albeit more strategic projects. We were told that about 300 projects will be approved under the current round of structural funds, as compared with 3,000 under the previous Objective 1 funding programme. At the time of reporting, Welsh Assembly Government-led projects accounted for nearly half of the projects approved, and yet private sector-led projects accounted for less than 1 per cent. Third sector organisations told us that they were very concerned that they were no longer able to access any convergence funding unless they worked with the strategic bids from local authorities or other large public sector

cydgyfeirio oni bai eu bod yn gweithio gyda'r bidiau strategol gan awdurdodau lleol neu gyrff mawr eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Bu inni argymhell y dylai fod dadansoddiad trylwyr o batrwm daearyddol a sectorol y contractau sy'n cael eu dyfarnu i'r prosiectau a gyllidir gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ddefnyddio mwy o ddychymyg i sicrhau bod ymgeiswyr llai yn y sector preifat a'r trydydd sector yn cael cyfle teg i ennill arian y cronfeydd strwythurol ar gyfer eu prosiectau. Yr wyf felly'n siomedig nad yw'r Llywodraeth ond wedi derbyn ein hargymhellion mewn egwyddor, gan fod cyrff y trydydd sector yn credu bod y sefyllfa bresennol yn cael effaith niweidiol iawn ar y sector gwirfoddol lleol a'r cymunedau y mae'n eu gwasanaethu.

Yr wyf yn poeni hefyd ynghylch sut y bydd rhaglen adfywio economaidd y Llywodraeth yn effeithio ar brosiectau sy'n cael eu harwain gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog roi ei sylwadau ar hynny yn ei ymateb.

We identified that the procurement process was a key contributor to delays in project spending and delivery and to discrimination against third sector organisations. We recommended that, in revising its procurement guidance, the Welsh European Funding Office should evaluate the impact of the procurement process, particularly on non-government sectors. The evaluation should include identifying when and where procurement is most effective, and when and where it is not—not only in terms of good governance and value for money, but also in the quality of service provided to the user. We also recommended that representations should be made to the UK Government to ensure that European Commission procurement rules do not work against Welsh interests in future. I am delighted that the Government has accepted these recommendations.

Tighter public sector budgets have huge implications for the implementation of EU structural funds programmes. The Welsh Assembly Government's targeted match funding scheme provides a central match-funding pot of last resort for the structural funds programmes. The Deputy First

bodies.

We recommended that there should be a rigorous analysis of the geographical and sectoral patterns of contracts awarded for EU-funded projects, and an altogether more imaginative approach adopted by the Welsh Government to ensure that smaller players in the private and third sectors have a fair chance to compete for structural funds for their projects. I am therefore disappointed that the Government has only accepted our recommendations in principle, as third sector organisations believe that the current situation is having a detrimental impact on the voluntary sector and the local communities that it serves.

I am also concerned about how the Government's economic renewal programme will affect projects led by the Welsh Assembly Government, and I would be grateful if the Deputy First Minister could comment on that in his response.

Nodwyd gennym fod y broses gaffael yn rhywbeth allweddol a oedd yn cyfrannu at oedi o ran gwariant a chyflenwi prosiectau ac at wahaniaethu yn erbyn sefydliadau'r trydydd sector. Wrth iddi adolygu ei chanllaw caffael, argymellasom y dylai Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru werthuso effaith y broses gaffael, yn enwedig ar sectorau anllywodraethol. Yn y gwerthusiad dylid adnabod pryd a ble mae caffael ar ei fwyaf effeithiol, a phryd a ble nad yw ar ei fwyaf effeithiol-nid yn unig o ran llywodraethu da a gwerth am arian, ond hefyd yn ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir i'r defnyddiwr. Argymhellwn hefyd y dylid gwneud sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU i sicrhau nad yw rheolau caffael y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gweithio yn erbyn buddiannau Cymru yn y dyfodol. Rwyf wrth fy modd bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn yr argymhellion hyn.

Mae cyllidebau sector cyhoeddus tynnach yn golygu goblygiadau enfawr i weithredu rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol yr UE. Mae cynllun arian cyfatebol wedi'i dargedu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu cronfa ganolog o arian cyfatebol sy'n ddewis olaf i'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol.

Minister told us that there was a substantial amount of targeted match funding available, and that lack of match funding would not be an issue for concern. My committee sought further assurances that this will indeed be the case, and it appears that the Government is still confident of its position.

Another concern of the committee was the monitoring and evaluation of projects. European Commission officials told us that WEFO's monitoring of the system was 'solid'. Yet, we heard evidence of possible multiple counting of project outcomes and the need for better communication between projects to ensure that they complement rather than duplicate efforts. Although we understand that collaboration between projects is being encouraged at a high level, we would like to see collaboration between projects at a local level to ensure that they are not targeting the same groups of people. The Government's response acknowledges the issue, but does not quite provide the detail on how this will be achieved.

Finally, it is important that Wales identifies the lessons from the 2007-13 programmes to date in order to plan effectively for the remainder of the programme period and beyond 2013. We would, therefore, like to see a rigorous, independent, mid-term evaluation of the whole of the structural funds programmes in contributing to set targets and high-level economic wellbeing indicators, including gross value added and gross domestic product. We were interested to hear that the South West Regional Development Agency has suggested that, in future funding periods, areas could be allocated a single pot of European funding that could be prioritised against EU and domestic strategies, and administered as a single fund within the appropriate geographical area. The South West Regional Development Agency has also procured a mid-term programme review from an external firm of consultants. I regret that our recommendation has been rejected.

In conclusion, I hope that our report did justice to the positive achievements of the Welsh Government and WEFO and to the plaudits that they have received from the European Commission. However, our inquiry also unveiled important issues that need to be

Dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wrthym fod swm sylweddol o arian cyfatebol wedi'i dargedu ar gael, ac na fyddai diffyg arian cyfatebol yn fater i boeni yn ei gylch. Gofynnodd fy mhwyllgor am sicrhad pellach mai dyma fydd yn wir, ac mae'n debyg bod y Llywodraeth yn dal yn ffyddiog o'i sefyllfa.

Un o bryderon eraill y pwyllgor oedd monitro a gwerthuso prosiectau. Dywedodd swyddogion y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wrthym fod dull Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru o fonitro'r system yn 'gadarn'. Ond eto, clywsom dystiolaeth o bosibilrwydd cyfrif canlyniadau prosiect fwy nag unwaith a'r angen i brosiectau gyfathrebu'n well i sicrhau eu bod yn ategu ymdrechion yn hytrach na'u dyblygu. Er ein bod yn deall bod cydweithio rhwng prosiectau'n cael ei annog ar lefel uchel, hoffem weld cydweithio rhwng prosiectau ar lefel leol i sicrhau nad ydynt yn targedu'r un grwpiau o bobl. Mae ymateb y Llywodraeth yn cydnabod y mater, ond nid yw'n manylu ar y ffordd y bydd hyn yn cael ei gyflawni.

Yn olaf, mae'n bwysig bod Cymru'n adnabod y gwersi o raglenni 2007-13 hyd yma er mwyn cynllunio'n effeithiol ar gyfer gweddill cyfnod y rhaglen a'r tu hwnt i 2013. Byddem, felly, yn hoffi gweld gwerthusiad trwyadl, annibynnol, canol tymor o'r cyfan o'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strategol o ran cyfrannu at dargedau a osodwyd a dangosyddion lles economaidd lefel uchel, gan gynnwys gwerth ychwanegol crynswth a chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Roedd yn ddiddorol gennym glywed bod Asiantaeth Datblygu Rhanbarthol De-orllewin Lloegr wedi awgrymu y gellid, mewn cyfnodau cyllido yn y dyfodol, dyrannu un gronfa o gyllid Ewropeaidd i ardaloedd a gellid ei blaenoriaethu mewn perthynas â strategaethau UE a domestig, a'i gweinyddu'n un gronfa yn yr ardal ddaeryddol briodol. Mae Asiantaeth Datblygu Rhanbarthol De-orllewin Lloegr hefyd wedi caffael adolygiad rhaglen canol tymor gan gwmni allanol o ymgynghorwyr. Rwy'n ddrwg gennyf fod ein hargymhelliad wedi'i wrthod.

I gloi, gobeithiaf fod ein hadroddiad wedi gwneud cyfiawnder â chyflawniadau cadarnhaol Llywodraeth Cymru a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru a chyfiawnder â'r clod a gawsant oddi wrth y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, datgelodd ein

addressed—for example, the need to engage smaller players from the private and third sectors within the more strategic approach adopted in the current round of funding; the need to address the fact that industry is not biting at the strategic level in convergence programmes; the need to improve communication between projects at a local level; the need to encourage the longer-term sustainability of projects; and the issue of how programmes and projects can adapt to changing economic circumstances.

3.50 p.m.

In monitoring and evaluating the structural funds commitments and spend, the legacy of these programmes is paramount. The overall aim and ultimate success of European structural funding will be sustainable structural improvements in the Welsh economy, along the lines of the Lisbon agenda for growth areas, such as the digital, creative and green industries, not forgetting improvements in the social inclusion agenda. We appreciate that Ministers need to balance those long-term objectives with getting Wales out of the current economic downturn and planning an exit strategy for the end of this funding round after 2013. However, Welsh Ministers must ensure that their long-term vision for the future Welsh economy is supported and enhanced by the structural funds programmes. They must continue to give Wales a strong voice in the development of future regional development policies in Europe.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Unwaith eto, hoffwn ddiolch i Gareth Jones am adroddiad y pwyllgor ac am y ffordd y cyflwynodd ymateb y pwyllgor i'r hyn a ddywedodd y Llywodraeth. Croesawaf yr adroddiad, ac yn ogystal â diolch i'r Cadeirydd, hoffwn ddiolch i holl aelodau'r pwyllgor a phawb sydd wedi rhoi tystiolaeth i'r ymchwiliad.

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru neu—i fod yn fanwl gywir—Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, sydd yn rhan o fy adran i, sydd yn gyfrifol am reoli pedair prif raglen y cronfeydd strwythurol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn gweithredu'r rhaglenni drwy eu rheoli ar y cyd â Chomisiwn Ewrop, ond yr ydym yn rhydd, i ryw raddau, i'w rhoi ar waith fel y mynnwn, cyn belled ag y gwnawn

ymchwiliad hefyd faterion pwysig y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy—er enghraifft, yr angen i gynnwys chwaraewyr llai o faint o'r sector preifat a'r trydydd sector yn y dull mwy strategol a fabwysiadwyd yn y cylch cyfredol o gyllid; yr angen i fynd i'r afael â'r ffaith nad yw diwydiant yn frwd ar y lefel strategol mewn rhaglenni cydgyfeirio; yr angen i brosiectau gyfathrebu'n well ar lefel leol; yr angen i annog cynaliadwyedd prosiectau yn y tymor hwy; a'r ffordd y gall rhaglenni a phrosiectau addasu i amgylchiadau economaidd newidiol.

Wrth fonitro a gwerthuso ymrwymadau a gwariant y cronfeydd strwythurol, mae etifeddiaeth y rhaglenni hyn yn holl bwysig. Nod cyffredinol a llwyddiant eithaf cyllid strwythurol Ewropeaidd fydd gwelliannau strwythurol cynaliadwy yn economi Cymru, yn debyg i feysydd agenda twf Lisbon, fel y diwydiannau digidol, creadigol a gwyrdd, heb anghofio'r gwelliannau yn yr agenda cynhwysiant cymdeithasol.

Gwerthfawrogwn fod angen i Weinidogion gydbwysu'r amcanion tymor hir hynny â chael Cymru allan o'r dirywiad economaidd cyfredol a chynllunio strategaeth ymadael ar gyfer diwedd y cylch cyllid hwn ar ôl 2013. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i Weinidogion Cymru sicrhau bod eu gweledigaeth tymor hir i ddyfodol economi Cymru'n cael ei chefnogi a'i chryfhau gan y rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol. Rhaid iddynt barhau i roi llais cryf i Gymru wrth ddatblygu polisiau datblygu rhanbarthol yn y dyfodol yn Ewrop.

The Deputy First Minister: Once again, I would like to thank Gareth for the committee report and for how he presented the committee's response to what the Government said. I welcome this report and, in addition to thanking the Chair, I would like to thank all the committee members and all those who gave evidence to the committee's inquiry.

The Welsh Assembly Government, or—more specifically—WEFO, which falls under my department, is the managing authority for the four main structural funds programmes in Wales. We administer the programmes through a process of shared management with the European Commission but we have areas of autonomy to implement the programmes within the framework of Commission

hynny yn unol â chanllawiau a rheolau'r Comisiwn. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos â'n partneriaid yn y maes hwn, sef llywodraeth leol, y sector preifat, y trydydd sector ac ati, i roi'r rhaglenni ar waith. Mae hynny'n cynnwys gweithio gyda phwyllgor monitro rhaglenni Cymru gyfan.

Yr ydym wedi cael cytundeb y Comisiwn i'n strategaeth ar gyfer y pedair rhaglen. Mae'n gydnaws â strategaethau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer hyrwyddo twf a swyddi cynaliadwy. Mae'r rhaglenni, felly, yn mynd i'r afael â'r prif anawsterau strwythurol sydd yn wynebu economi Cymru ac yn cryfhau ac yn ategu blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer creu swyddi, ysgogi menter a busnesau, gwella sgiliau gwaith ac adfywio cymunedau.

Ers cychwyn y rhaglenni tua diwedd 2007, mae gwaith da wedi'i wneud. Pan gefais y fraint o dywys Mr Barroso, Llywydd y Comisiwn, o amgylch y Senedd yn ystod ei ymweliad diweddar â Chymru, yr oedd yn uchel ei glod o'r ffordd y mae'r rhaglenni'n cael eu cynnal yng Nghymru. Dywedodd fod Cymru yn geffyl blaen o ran eu rhoi ar waith a gwario'n effeithiol.

Erbyn hyn mae dros £1.4 biliwn o arian y rhaglenni wedi'i ymrwymo ar gyfer 193 o brosiectau arloesol ac o safon uchel, gan gefnogi buddsoddiad o £2.9 biliwn. Dyna 76 y cant o'r holl arian sydd ar gael i Gymru oddi wrth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym eisoes wedi rhagori ar dargedau gwariant N+2 y cytunwyd arnynt gyda'r Comisiwn ar gyfer 2010, ac yr ydym ar y trywydd cywir i gyrraedd ein targedau ar gyfer y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod.

Mae ein buddsoddiad yn dechrau dwyn ffrwyth. Yn ôl y ceisiadau i WEFO, hyd at ddiwedd Medi 2010 mae dros 4,000 o swyddi wedi'u creu, mae 16,500 o bobl ddi-waith ac economaidd anweithgar wedi cael gwaith, mae 44,500 o bobl wedi ennill cymwysterau ac mae dros 1,000 o fentrau newydd wedi'u creu.

Yr ydym wedi dysgu gwersi o gynnal rhaglenni 2000-06, ac mae'r prosiectau yr ydym yn eu cefnogi y tro hwn yn rhai mwy

guidelines and regulations. We are working closely with our partners in local government and across the public, private and third sectors in implementing the programmes, including through the work of the all-Wales programme monitoring committee.

The strategy for the programmes has been agreed with the Commission and is aligned with the European Union's strategies for promoting sustainable growth and jobs. The programmes address the main structural challenges facing the Welsh economy and add strength and value to the Assembly Government's own priorities of creating jobs, stimulating enterprise and business growth, enhancing skills for jobs and regenerating communities.

Since the programmes got under way in late 2007, we have made good progress. European Commission President Barroso, whom I had the pleasure of showing around the Senedd on his recent visit to Wales, had high praise for the way that the programmes were being delivered in Wales, stating that in terms of effective delivery and spend Wales is ahead of the game.

More than £1.4 billion-worth of programme funds has been committed to 193 high-quality and innovative projects, with a total investment value of £2.9bn. This represents 76 per cent of the EU funding available to Wales. We have already exceeded the N+2 expenditure targets agreed with the Commission for 2010 and are firmly on track to meet our targets for future years.

We are also now beginning to see some of the results of our investments coming through. Claims submitted to WEFO up to the end of September 2010 indicate that over 4,000 jobs have been created, 16,500 unemployed and economically inactive people have found employment, 44,500 people have secured qualifications, and 1,000 new enterprises have been created.

We learnt lessons from the delivery of the 2000-06 programmes, and the projects that we are supporting this time are more strategic

strategol eu natur—fel y dywedais wrth y pwyllgor—a rhoddir mwy o bwyslais ar gydweithredu ac ar bartneriaeth. I'n rhaglenni lwyddo, rhaid cefnogi prosiectau blaengar ac uchel eu hansawdd a fydd yn esgor ar y canlyniadau y mae eu hangen ar Gymru. Ein nod yw cyrraedd yr holl dargedau a gwireddu'r holl ganlyniadau yr ydym wedi cytuno arnynt gyda'r Comisiwn, gan sicrhau, ar yr un pryd, ein bod yn cael gwerth yr arian a fuddsoddwn.

We are well aware that the programmes are being delivered in a difficult economic environment. The structural funds help us to support targeted and practical interventions to help businesses, individuals and communities through the recession and strengthen our economy for the recovery. Members will be aware of the ProAct and ReAct programmes, although ProAct has now given way to the Skills Growth Wales programme, which will assist people with their training needs as we come out of the recession.

We have recently agreed changes to the ERDF programmes with the all-Wales programme monitoring committee in order to reflect the new priorities of 'Economic Renewal: a new direction', a matter that we discussed with the committee this morning. We will also be focusing on areas such as developing twenty-first century broadband. We have benefited from the use of the JEREMIE fund, and yesterday we launched the publication of our framework for regeneration areas and the operational phase of JESSICA.

The committee has acknowledged the achievements of the Welsh structural funds programmes, and has made a number of positive suggestions for further improvements. I am happy to accept all of the committee's recommendations, with the exception of the one recommending a mid-term review. I believe that the approach to evaluation we have agreed with the PMC is more thorough and appropriate, and better reflects the guidance that we have received from the European Commission. I await the contributions of other committee members before making a final response.

David Melding: All committee members appreciated the leadership of our Chair, Gareth Jones, and also the hard work of the secretariat who supported our endeavours.

in nature—as I told the committee—with a stronger emphasis on collaboration and partnership. The programmes will only be successful if they support good quality and innovative projects that deliver the outputs and outcomes that Wales needs. Our aim is to achieve all of the targets and impacts that we have agreed with the Commission, while securing best value for the funds invested.

Rydym yn gwybod yn iawn fod y rhaglenni'n cael eu cyflenwi mewn amgylchedd economaidd caled. Mae'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn ein helpu i gefnogi ymyriadau ymarferol wedi'u targedu i helpu busnesau, unigolion a chymunedau drwy'r dirwasgiad ac i gryfhau ein heconomi ar gyfer y gwella. Bydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod am raglenni ProAct a ReAct, er bod ProAct bellach wedi ildio i raglen Sgiliau Twf Cymru, a fydd yn helpu pobl ifanc gyda'u hanghenion hyfforddiant wrth inni ddod allan o'r dirwasgiad.

Rydym wedi cytuno'n ddiweddar ar newidiadau yn y rhaglenni ERDF gyda phwyllgor monitro rhaglen Cymru gyfan er mwyn adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau newydd 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd', mater a drafodasom â'r pwyllgor y bore yma. Byddwn hefyd yn canolbwyntio ar feysydd fel datblygu band eang yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Rydym wedi elwa ar ddefnyddio cronfa JEREMIE, a ddoe lansiom gyhoeddiad ein fframwaith ar gyfer ardaloedd adfywio a chyfnod gweithredol JESSICA.

Mae'r pwyllgor wedi cydnabod cyflawniadau rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Cymru, ac wedi gwneud nifer o awgrymiadau cadarnhaol am welliannau pellach. Rwy'n falch o dderbyn holl argymhellion y pwyllgor, ac eithrio'r un sy'n argymhell adolygiad canol tymor. Credaf fod y dull gwerthuso y cytunasom arno gyda Phwyllgor Monitro'r Rhaglen yn fwy trwyadl a phriodol, a'i fod yn adlewyrchu'n well y cyfarwyddyd a gawsom gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Disgwyliaf gyfraniadau aelodau pwyllgor eraill cyn gwneud ymateb terfynol.

David Melding: Roedd yr holl aelodau pwyllgor yn gwerthfawrogi arweinyddiaeth ein Cadeirydd, Gareth Jones, a hefyd gwaith caled yr adran ysgrifenyddol a gefnogodd ein

Like him, I reflect with great pleasure on the visit that we made to Valleys Kids, where we had an excellent session. It is a wonderful organisation, bang in the middle of my electoral region, which is another reason to have appreciated the visit.

The Welsh Assembly Government has responded fairly positively to our report, but quite a few recommendations have only been accepted in principle. When the Government reacts in that way, the fear is that it has a slight reservation and that it may affect the speed of the implementation of particular recommendations. Therefore, I hope that the Government is earnest in wanting to adopt our recommendations to bring those improvements.

There are a few things that I want to mention that relate to recommendations that the Government has accepted in principle, with one exception. First of all, the feasibility of longer funding rounds for appropriate projects is important. We were impressed with the evidence that three years is sometimes not long enough to fulfil a project, and that some could run up to six years with great value. We have tried to make this round more strategic, so the capacity to have a longer funding round seemed to represent a strong principle. We are glad that you have accepted that recommendation, but we hope that it will become as operational as possible in the rest of the programme.

The need to build more research capacity between the business and academic sectors, so that we can leave a legacy of long-term wealth creation, is important. There are excellent universities in the areas affected by the structural funds, and there is a great need to involve the private sector, including small and medium-sized enterprises, in collaboration. We have heard a lot lately about the potential for SMEs to do more research and development, sometimes on behalf of larger companies, but it is a sector that could be more actively engaged. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government follows that up.

Talking of SMEs, the need for SME engagement—as Gareth referred to earlier—is key to economic resilience. If this area of Wales is to have a better long-term economic future, it will be because more small firms have become medium-sized firms and there is more business creation. That requires much

hymdrechion. Fel yntau, rwyf fi'n myfyrio â phleser mawr ar yr ymweliad a wnaethom â Valleys Kids, lle cawsom sesiwn ragorol. Mae'n gymdeithas fendigedig, yng nghanol fy rhanbarth etholiadol i, sy'n rheswm arall i werthfawrogi'r ymweliad.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymateb yn weddol gadarnhaol i'n hadroddiad, ond dim ond mewn egwyddor y derbyniwyd cryn dipyn o argymhellion. Pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn ymateb fel hynny, yr ofn yw bod ganddi ychydig o amheuaeth ac y gall effeithio ar gyflymder gweithredu argymhellion arbennig. Felly, gobeithiaf fod y Llywodraeth o ddifrif yn dymuno mabwysiadu ein hargymhellion i achosi'r gwelliannau hynny.

Mae ambell beth yr hoffwn sôn amdano sy'n gysylltiedig ag argymhellion y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u derbyn mewn egwyddor, ac eithrio un. Yn gyntaf oll, mae dichonoldeb cylchoedd cyllido hirach i brosiectau priodol yn bwysig. Roeddem yn rhyfeddu at y dystiolaeth nad yw tair blynedd weithiau'n ddigon hir i gyflawni prosiect, ac y gallai rhai bara hyd at chwe blynedd gyda gwerth mawr. Rydym wedi ceisio gwneud y cylch hwn yn fwy strategol, felly roedd y gallu i gael cylch cyllido hirach fel petai'n cynrychioli egwyddor gref. Rydym yn falch eich bod wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw, ond gobeithiwn y daw mor weithredol â phosibl yng ngweddill y rhaglen.

Mae'r angen i feithrin mwy o allu ymchwilio rhwng y sectorau busnes ac academaidd, er mwyn inni adael etifeddiaeth o greu cyfoeth tymor hir, yn bwysig. Mae prifysgolion rhagorol yn yr ardaloedd y mae'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn effeithio arnynt, ac mae angen cynnwys y sector preifat o ddifrif wrth gydweithio, gan gynnwys busnesau bach a chanolog. Rydym wedi clywed llawer yn ddiweddar am y potensial i fusnesau bach a chanolig wneud mwy o ymchwil a datblygu, weithiau ar ran cwmnïau mawr, ond mae'n sector y gellid ei gynnwys yn fwy. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n mynd ar drywydd hynny.

Wrth sôn am fusnesau bach a chanolig, mae'r angen i gynnwys busnesau bach a chanolig—fel y cyfeiriodd Gareth ato'n gynharach—yn allweddol i gadernid economaidd. Os yw'r ardal hon o Gymru am gael gwell dyfodol economaidd tymor hir, bydd hynny am fod mwy o gwmnïau bach wedi datblygu'n

more engagement with the SME sector. Gareth talked about procurement, which is essential, but the number of projects led by the private sector is less than 1 per cent. The Government, typically, says that 40-odd per cent of the value of the programme is with the private sector at any one time. In many respects, it is fulfilling the various contracts that the projects are able to give, but it is not there in a strategic capacity, and that is a big difference.

4.00 p.m.

The one area where I disagree with what the Deputy First Minister said this afternoon is on the need for a mid-term review. I am sorry that he has rejected that, although one has to be perfectly fair and say that he does not break any EU rules in doing so, and that there seems to be some support for the attitude that he has taken. However, we found from the evidence that it is of great value to how the programme can be implemented. We also found evidence that it was surprising that the Welsh Assembly Government had not picked up, and I think that effective monitoring and evaluation via a mid-term review would improve its performance in the second half of the project.

It is also appropriate that we talk about the challenge of reshaping the use of EU funds, because the economic situation has changed vastly from when this funding round was conceived. It is important, as the Chair said, that we now look to 2013 and beyond, because we could qualify for that particular round, and a full evaluation would help us to take advantage of anything that is available to us in the future. I have not quite got to the subject of broadband, which is a pity, but perhaps one of the other committee members will follow up and deal with that subject.

Christine Chapman: When the committee considered the report, it was in the context of the progress that has been made on structural funds in Wales. Millions of pounds have come into Wales in European structural funds and have helped to support businesses up and down Wales, providing training and employment opportunities and benefiting many Welsh citizens. Some very real improvements have been made to our

gwmnïau canolig a bod mwy o fusnes yn cael ei greu. Er mwyn hynny, mae angen cysylltu llawer mwy â'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig. Siaradodd Gareth am gaffael, sy'n hanfodol, ond mae nifer y prosiectau a arweinir gan y sector preifat yn llai nag 1 y cant. Yn nodweddiadol, dywed y Llywodraeth fod rhyw 40 y cant o werth y rhaglen yn perthyn i'r sector preifat ar unrhyw adeg. Mewn llawer o ffyrdd, mae'n bodloni'r contractau amrywiol y gall y prosiectau eu rhoi, ond nid yw yno mewn rhinwedd strategol, ac mae hwnnw'n wahaniaeth mawr.

Yr un maes lle anghytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y prynhawn yma yw'r angen am adolygiad canol tymor. Mae'n flin gennyf ei fod wedi gwrthod hwnnw, er bod rhaid i ddyn fod yn berffaith deg a dweud nad yw'n torri unrhyw reolau UE wrth wneud hynny, a bod fel petai tipyn o gefnogaeth i'w agwedd ef. Fodd bynnag, canfuom o'r dystiolaeth ei fod o werth mawr i'r modd y gellir gweithredu'r rhaglen. Canfuom dystiolaeth hefyd yr oedd yn syndod nad oedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi sylwi arni, ac rwy'n credu y byddai monitro a gwerthuso effeithiol drwy adolygiad canol tymor yn gwella ei pherfformiad yn ail hanner y prosiect.

Mae hefyd yn briodol inni siarad am yr her o ailffurfio'r modd y defnyddir cronfeydd yr UE, am fod y sefyllfa economaidd wedi newid yn helaeth o'r adeg y crëwyd y cyllid hwn. Mae'n bwysig, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, inni edrych bellach at 2013 a'r tu hwnt, oherwydd gallem gymhwyso am y cylch arbennig hwnnw, a byddai gwerthusiad llawn yn ein helpu i fanteisio ar unrhyw beth sydd ar gael inni yn y dyfodol. Nid wyf wedi cyrraedd pwnc band eang, sy'n drueni, ond hwyrach y bydd un o aelodau eraill y pwyllgor yn mynd ar drywydd hwnnw ac yn ymdrin â'r pwnc hwnnw.

Christine Chapman: Pan fu'r pwyllgor yn ystyried yr adroddiad, roedd yng nghydestun y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd ar gronfeydd strwythurol yng Nghymru. Mae miliynau o bunnoedd wedi dod i Gymru mewn cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd ac wedi helpu i gefnogi busnesau ar hyd a lled Cymru, gan ddarparu cyfleoedd hyfforddiant a chyflogaeth a rhoi budd i lawer o ddinasyddion Cymru. Mae rhai gwelliannau

communities through the use of those funds.

These projects are vital in my constituency, as they are in others. For example, the Cynon valley crime prevention scheme, Pupils Understanding Problems In their Locality, uses European funding to tackle underachievement and to raise skill levels and aspiration among young people. The Bridges into Work and JobMatch schemes use EU funding to help people to get into work. Building the Future Together aims to raise educational achievement among the most vulnerable young people. Structural funds provided money to support and develop many small businesses across Rhondda Cynon Taf and to upgrade the rail facilities in Abercynon, enhancing the park-and-ride provision there, which is about helping to develop better links between the Valleys and Cardiff. Those are very useful projects that have helped to turn around the lives of many people in my constituency. Without that funding and those projects, the recession would probably have been a lot worse. It is pretty grim at the moment, but the fact that these changes have taken place because of European funding is helping a little.

Many of the projects that I mentioned were delivered by consortia—for example, of local authorities working together. This collaborative, strategic working, which enables the achievement of vital goals, must be welcomed. However, as the committee pointed out in its recommendations, particularly in recommendation 11, and this was reinforced by our Chair, it is imperative that we do all that we can to ensure that small organisations feel involved in the allocation and delivery of structural funds. It was disappointing to take evidence from organisations that feel excluded from this. I am not sure what is happening in this regard, but we cannot afford to lose the expertise and enthusiasm of such organisations, because we need everyone to be involved. I applaud the strategic approach, which is essential, but we must somehow ensure that we follow that approach and also involve small organisations, because the programme will be richer for it.

real iawn wedi'u gwneud yn ein cymunedau drwy ddefnyddio'r cronfeydd hynny.

Mae'r prosiectau hyn yn hanfodol yn fy etholaeth i, fel y maen nhw mewn eraill. Er enghraifft, mae cynllun atal trosedd Cwm Cynon, sef Pupils Understanding Problems In their Locality, yn defnyddio cyllid Ewropeaidd i fynd i'r afael â thangyflawniad ac i godi lefelau sgiliau ac uchelgais ymhlith pobl ifanc. Mae cynlluniau Bridges into Work a Pharu â Swyddi yn defnyddio cyllid yr UE i helpu pobl i gael gwaith. Nod Adeiladu'r Dyfodol Gyda'n Gilydd yw codi cyflawniad addysgol ymhlith y bobl ifanc fwyaf agored i niwed. Roedd cronfeydd strwythurol yn darparu arian i gefnogi a datblygu llawer o fusnesau bach ledled Rhondda Cynon Taf ac i uwchraddio'r cyfleusterau rheilffordd yn Abercynon, gan wella'r ddarpariaeth parcio a theithio yno, sy'n helpu i ddatblygu gwell cysylltiadau rhwng y Cymoedd a Chaerdydd. Mae'r rheini'n brosiectau defnyddiol iawn sydd wedi helpu i weddnewid bywydau llawer o bobl yn fy etholaeth i. Heb y cyllid hwnnw a'r prosiectau hynny, mae'n ddigon posibl y byddai'r dirwasgiad wedi bod llawer yn waeth. Mae'n eithaf difrifol ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'r ffaith bod y newidiadau hyn wedi digwydd oherwydd cyllid Ewropeaidd yn helpu ychydig.

Cyflenwyd llawer o'r prosiectau y soniais amdanynt gan gonsortia—er enghraifft, o awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio. Mae'n rhaid croesawu'r cydweithio strategol hwn, sy'n golygu y gellir cyrraedd nodau hanfodol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd y pwyllgor yn ei argymhellion, yn arbennig yn argymhelliad 11, ac atgyfnerthwyd hyn gan ein Cadeirydd, mae'n holl bwysig i bob un ohonom wneud popeth y gallwn i sicrhau bod sefydliadau bach yn teimlo eu bod yn rhan o ddyrannu a chyflenwi cronfeydd strwythurol. Roedd yn siomedig cymryd tystiolaeth oddi wrth sefydliadau sy'n teimlo fel petaent wedi'u heithrio o hyn. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth sy'n digwydd yn hyn o beth, ond ni allwn fforddio colli arbenigedd a brwdfrydedd sefydliadau felly, achos mae angen arnom i bawb fod yn rhan ohono. Cymeradwyaf y dull strategol, sy'n hanfodol, ond mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau rywsut ein bod yn dilyn y dull hwnnw a hefyd yn cynnwys sefydliadau bach, oherwydd bydd y rhaglen yn gyfoethocach o ganlyniad.

Recommendation 9, which David Melding mentioned, is particularly crucial for future development. It is vital that we continue to do all that we can to use structural funds to enhance our research potential, making Wales the small, clever country that we aspire to be. Last year, the committee's investigation into higher education found that every £1 million invested in higher education generates over £5 million for the Welsh economy. Those who have completed postgraduate study were found to be the most entrepreneurial, and the report emphasised the mutual benefits of forging strong links between the business and academic worlds; you need to pay close attention to that recommendation, Deputy First Minister. Structural funds can and should be used to achieve that aim, delivering sustainable long-term investment in the economy of Wales.

Jenny Randerson: I thank the Chair very much for the lead that he gave us during the compilation of this very important project, which covered some fascinating evidence of great importance for all of Wales. I take this opportunity to emphasise a few of the recommendations that I regard as important, especially in terms of the learning process. I draw your attention to the committee's concern at the lack of private sector and third sector involvement in successful projects: the rate was very low in both cases. It is important that we involve the private and third sectors as much as possible, especially at a time when we still have considerable economic problems in Wales, and that we do not turn this process into a Government-only exercise. We need to stimulate those sectors and ensure that they are as strong as possible in the areas where EU funding is available.

I want to pick up on the problems of double counting and of duplication; I was very concerned to hear that some of the organisations that are in receipt of EU funding are convinced that they are targeting the same beneficiaries as other organisations. People are being counted twice—sometimes even three times—as benefiting from EU funding. They are, therefore, adding to the success on targets that the Minister has announced. I am not suggesting for one minute that this is being done deliberately,

Mae Argymhelliad 9, y soniodd David Melding amdano, yn arbennig o allweddol ar gyfer datblygu yn y dyfodol. Mae'n hanfodol inni barhau i wneud popeth y gallwn i ddefnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol i gryfhau ein potensial ymchwil, gan wneud Cymru y wlad fach, glyfar rydym yn dyheu iddi fod. Y llynedd, canfu ymchwiliad y pwyllgor i addysg uwch fod pob £1 miliwn a fuddsoddir mewn addysg uwch yn cynhyrchu dros £5 miliwn i economi Cymru. Canfuwyd mai'r rheini sydd wedi cwblhau astudiaeth ôl-raddedig yw'r mwyaf entrepreneuriaid, ac roedd yr adroddiad yn pwysleisio buddion magu cysylltiadau cryfion rhwng y byd busnes a'r byd academiaidd i'r ddwy ochr; mae angen ichi roi sylw agos i'r argymhelliad hwnnw, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Gellir a dylid defnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol i gyrraedd y nod hwnnw, gan gyflenwi buddsoddiad tymor hir cynaliadwy yn economi Cymru.

Jenny Randerson: Diolchaf yn fawr iawn i'r Cadeirydd am yr arweinyddiaeth a gawsom ganddo wrth lunio'r prosiect pwysig iawn hwn, a oedd yn cynnwys tystiolaeth ddiddorol o bwysigrwydd mawr i Gymru gyfan. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i bwysleisio ambell un o'r argymhellion sy'n bwysig yn fy marn i, yn enwedig o ran y broses ddysgu. Tynnaf eich sylw at ofid y pwyllgor ynghylch peidio â chynnwys y sector preifat a'r trydydd sector mewn prosiectau: roedd y gyfradd yn isel iawn yn y ddau achos. Mae'n bwysig inni gynnwys y sector preifat a'r trydydd sector cymaint â phosibl, yn enwedig ar adeg o broblemau economaidd sylweddol o hyd yng Nghymru, ac mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn troi'r broses hon yn ymarfer i Lywodraeth yn unig. Mae angen inni ysgogi'r sectorau hynny a sicrhau eu bod mor gryf â phosibl yn y meysydd lle mae cyllid yr UE ar gael.

Hoffwn sôn am broblemau cyfrif ddwywaith a dyblygu; roeddwn i'n pryderu'n fawr o glywed bod rhai o'r sefydliadau sy'n cael cyllid UE yn argyhoeddedig eu bod yn targedu'r un buddiolwyr â sefydliadau eraill. Mae pobl yn cael eu cyfrif ddwywaith—weithiau deirgwaith hyd yn oed—fel rhai sy'n elwa ar gyllid yr UE. Maent, felly, yn ychwanegu at y llwyddiant ar dargedau a gyhoeddodd y Gweinidog. Nid wyf yn awgrymu am un funud fod hyn yn cael ei wneud yn fwriadol, ond mae effeithiolrwydd

but the effectiveness of the whole process is blunted if you do not have a neat and tidy way of ensuring that people, targets and achievements are only counted once. It is worth pointing out that the same issue was raised when, in a different review, we looked at young people who are not in employment, education or training.

It is undoubtedly the case that the process is still very bureaucratic, and I realise that this, to a large extent, has nothing to do with the Deputy First Minister or the Welsh Assembly Government, and everything to do with the EU and its requirements. However, there are some things that we need to look at, perhaps, to see whether there could be a swifter decision-making process for applications. We were told that it could take up to a year to approve a project; that evidence came from organisations such as Bridges into Work and Building the Future Together. They are successful applicants; goodness knows what the unsuccessful applicants say about it. The procurement process was a source of great frustration to the organisations concerned. I very much regret that the Minister has not accepted our recommendation for a mid-term review, but I perhaps understand the reasons. It would have been helpful to have had that. The Minister accepted the recommendation on the organisations themselves not having to seek legal advice on state aid, and yet I have read the analysis that comes after his acceptance of that recommendation several times, and to all intents and purposes it rejects that recommendation. I am sorry about that, because it would be a way of making the whole process less complex, less expensive and less bureaucratic, yet would still ensure advice for organisations about state aid and legal compliance with those requirements.

4.10 p.m.

Finally, we had some interesting evidence about the use of EU funding in Cornwall for the development of broadband. This morning, the committee took up issues with the Minister that related to that. In Wales, we are still at the beginning of this process of using EU funding to develop broadband further, and I very much hope that the Minister and his officials will look closely—I am sure that they will—at the success of Cornwall, which is considerably ahead of us in developing

y broses gyfan yn cael ei phylu os nad oes gennych ffordd dwt a thaclus o sicrhau bod pobl, targedau a chyflawniadau'n cael eu cyfrif unwaith yn unig. Mae'n werth nodi bod yr un peth wedi codi wrth inni edrych, mewn gwahanol adolygiad, ar bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na hyfforddiant.

Mae'n sicr bod y broses yn dal yn fiwrocratig iawn, a sylweddolaf nad oes a wnelo hyn, i raddau helaeth, ddim â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog na Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a'i fod a wnelo popeth â'r UE a'i gofynion. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai pethau y mae angen inni edrych arnynt, efallai, i weld a allai fod proses benderfynu gyflymach am geisiadau. Dywedwyd wrthym y gallai gymryd hyd at flwyddyn i gymeradwyo prosiect; daeth y dystiolaeth honno o sefydliadau fel Bridges into Work ac Adeiladu'r Dyfodol Gyda'n Gilydd. Maent yn ymgeiswyr llwyddiannus; pwy a wŷr beth a ddywed yr ymgeiswyr aflwyddiannus amdani. Roedd y broses gaffael yn peri rhwystredigaeth fawr i'r sefydliadau dan sylw. Mae'n ddrwg iawn gennyf nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn ein hargymhelliad am adolygiad canol tymor, ond hwyrach y deallaf y rhesymau. Byddai wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol cael hynny. Derbyniodd y Gweinidog yr argymhelliad am y sefydliadau eu hunain yn peidio â gorfod ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol ar gymorth gwladwriaethol, ac eto rwyf wedi darllen y dadansoddiad a ddaw ar ôl iddo dderbyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw sawl gwaith, ac at bob diben mae'n gwrthod yr argymhelliad hwnnw. Rwy'n flin am hynny, oherwydd byddai'n ffordd o wneud y broses gyfan yn llai cymhleth, yn llai drud ac yn llai biwrocraidd, ond eto byddai'n sicrhau cyngor i sefydliadau ar gymorth gwladwriaethol a chydymffurfio'n gyfreithiol â'r gofynion hynny.

Yn olaf, cawsom dystiolaeth ddiddorol am ddefnyddio cyllid yr UE yng Nghernyw i ddatblygu band eang. Y bore yma, bu'r pwyllgor yn cyflwyno materion i'r Gweinidog a oedd yn gysylltiedig â hynny. Yng Nghymru, rydym yn dal ar ddechrau'r broses hon o ddefnyddio cyllid yr UE i ddatblygu band eang ymhellach, ac rwy'n mawr iawn obeithio y bydd y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion yn edrych yn ofalus—rwy'n siŵr y byddant—ar lwyddiant Cernyw, sydd

broadband using EU funding.

Jeff Cuthbert: I, too, thank Gareth Jones for his chairing of our work, and also the officials—the clerk and her colleagues—who, as always, gave a firm structure to our work. I also thank the witnesses who came to give of their time and information to enable us to compile the report.

I must declare an interest as a member of the Enterprise and Learning Committee, which produced this report, and also as chair of the all-Wales programme monitoring committee for the European structural funds, which is, of course, the subject of many of the report's recommendations, and of the Welsh Government's response. In light of that, I will restrict my contribution to commenting on one of the report's recommendations. Before I do so, however, I want to refer briefly to two of the points that have been raised in the debate so far. The first is the issue of so-called double counting. This has been discussed at the programme monitoring committee, and WEFO officials have been keen to point out that they are aware of the dangers, and look at this carefully. However, it must be understood that a person may be counted twice provided that that person has achieved a different outcome—different qualifications, or employment, or what-have-you. It is not a question of ever counting the same thing twice—we need to be clear on that, and that is certainly looked for.

Secondly, it is true that we encourage the private sector—whether we are talking about larger employers or SMEs—to become more engaged as potential project sponsors. It is absolutely true, as has been outlined, that the percentage of project sponsors from the private and third sectors is quite small. However, the bulk of beneficiaries in terms of procurement, and delivering on the ground, are in the private sector, followed by the third sector. Therefore, they are clearly involved in the delivery of the programme—not as sponsors, unfortunately, but, given the strategic nature of much of this, that is perhaps not too surprising. They are certainly involved, but we would like them to be involved to an even greater level.

The one recommendation that I want to talk about is recommendation 19, the final one. I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's

gryn dipyn o'n blaenau ni o ran datblygu band eang gan ddefnyddio cyllid UE.

Jeff Cuthbert: Rwyf innau, hefyd yn diolch i Gareth Jones am gadeirio ein gwaith, a hefyd i'r swyddogion—y clerwr a'i chydweithwyr—a oedd, fel arfer, yn rhoi strwythur cadarn i'n gwaith. Diolchaf hefyd i'r tystion a ddaeth i roi o'u hamser a'u gwybodaeth er mwyn inni lunio'r adroddiad.

Rhaid imi ddatgan budd fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, a luniodd yr adroddiad hwn, a hefyd yn gadeirydd pwyllgor monitro rhaglen Cymru gyfan ar gyfer y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd sydd, wrth reswm, yn destun llawer o argymhellion yr adroddiad, ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru. Yng ngoleuni hynny, cyfyngaf fy nghyfraniad i roi sylwadau ar un o argymhellion yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, cyn imi wneud hynny, rwyf am gyfeirio'n fras at ddau o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn y ddadl hyd yn hyn. Y cyntaf yw'r mater cyfrif dwbl fel y'i gelwir. Trafodwyd hwn ym mhwyllgor monitro'r rhaglen, a bu swyddogion Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru'n awyddus i nodi eu bod yn ymwybodol o'r peryglon, a'u bod yn edrych ar hyn yn ofalus. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid deall bod unigolyn yn gallu cael ei gyfrif ddwywaith ar yr amod bod yr unigolyn hwnnw wedi cyflawni gwahanol ganlyniad—gwahanol gymwysterau, neu gyflogaeth, neu beth bynnag. Nid mater o gyfrif yr un peth ddwywaith mohono byth—mae angen inni egluro hynny, ac yn sicr edrychir am hynny.

Yn ail, mae'n wir ein bod yn annog y sector preifat—p'un a siaradwn am gyflogwyr mwy o faint neu fusnesau bach a chanolig—i gymryd mwy o ran fel noddwyr prosiect posibl. Mae'n gwbl wir, fel yr amlinellwyd, fod y ganran o noddwyr prosiect o'r sector preifat a'r trydydd sector yn eithaf bach. Fodd bynnag, mae swmp y buddiolwyr o ran caffael, a chyflenwi ar lawr gwlad, yn y sector preifat, ac yna'r trydydd sector. Felly, mae'n amlwg eu bod yn ymwneud â chyflenwi'r rhaglen—nid fel noddwyr, yn anffodus, ond, o ystyried natur strategol llawer o hyn, efallai nad yw hynny'n fawr o syndod. Maen nhw'n bendant yn cael eu cynnwys, ond hoffem iddynt gael eu cynnwys i raddau mwy byth.

Yr un argymhelliad yr hoffwn sôn amdano yw argymhelliad 19, yr un olaf. Croesawaf yn llwyr y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad

acceptance of this recommendation outright. Our experience of the current round of structural funds programmes, as well as their legacy and their ultimate sustainability, must inform our policy-making when it comes to any future round of European funding that we might receive. In addition to its statutory duties, the all-Wales PMC has agreed to look at the future of EU cohesion policy in Wales, and to feed into the Welsh Assembly Government's submission to the European Commission on this matter.

We have much to be proud of in Wales, and despite the healthy arguments with opposition AMs and MEPs from time to time, President Barroso has, nevertheless, as the Deputy First Minister pointed out, praised our effective spending of European funds in Wales. We must use this as a benchmark in lobbying for a further round of funding, which includes the current competitiveness areas, as well as the convergence areas. We cannot allow cohesion policy to be re-nationalised, as a leaked Commission document earlier this year suggested. I am sure that I speak for the whole Chamber when I say that we would welcome regular updates from the Welsh Assembly Government about the latest on negotiations regarding future European funding.

The Deputy First Minister: To confirm Jeff's final point, yes, we will keep Members informed of discussions and negotiations on the future of regional policy. The First Minister and I had an opportunity, along with a number of representatives from other regions across Europe, to meet Mr Barroso in Brussels to plead the case on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government. I am grateful to you for the comments that you made about the way in which the private sector is involved in the delivery of many of the programmes. Therefore, I will not repeat that point, given that it was raised by Jenny Randerson.

I welcome the comments made by all Members, but I have only a short time to respond. To repeat the point made by David Melding on the mid-term review, I want to reiterate that the approach to the evaluation that we have agreed with the all-Wales programme monitoring committee is a more

Cymru wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn. Rhaid i'n profiad o'r cylch cyfredol o raglenni cronfeydd strwythurol, yn ogystal â'u hetifeddiaeth a'u cynaliadwyedd yn y pen draw, lywio ein polisiau pan fydd unrhyw gylch o gyllid Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol y gallem ei gael. Yn ogystal â'i ddyletswyddau statudol, mae pwyllgor monitro rhaglen Cymru gyfan wedi cytuno i edrych ar ddyfodol polisi cydlyniant yr UE yng Nghymru, ac i gyfrannu at gyflwyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar y mater hwn.

Mae gennym lawer i ymfalchio ynddo yng Nghymru ac, er gwaethaf y dadleuon iachus ag ACau a ASEau gwrthwynebol o bryd i'w gilydd, mae Arlywydd Barroso wedi canmol ein gwariant effeithiol o gyllid Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru, serch hynny, fel y nododd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio hwn yn feincnod wrth lobbio am gylch pellach o gyllid, sy'n cynnwys yr ardaloedd cystadleurwydd cyfredol, yn ogystal â'r ardaloedd cydgyfeirio. Ni allwn ganiatáu i bolisi cydlyniant gael ei ailwladoli, fel yr awgrymai dogfen a ddatgelwyd o'r Comisiwn yn gynharach eleni. Rwy'n siŵr fy mod i'n siarad ar ran y Siambr gyfan pan ddywedaf y byddem yn croesawu cael yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn rheolaidd oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am y cyd-drafodaethau ynghylch cyllid Ewropeaidd y dyfodol.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: I gadarnhau pwynt olaf Jeff, yn wir, byddwn yn rhoi gwybod i'r Aelodau am y trafodaethau a'r cyd-drafodaethau diweddaraf am ddyfodol polisi rhanbarthol. Cafodd y Prif Weinidog a minnau gyfle, ynghyd â nifer o gynrychiolwyr o ranbarthau eraill ledled Ewrop, i gyfarfod â Mr Barroso ym Mrwsel i bledio'r achos ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Rwy'n ddiolchgar ichi am y sylwadau a wnaethoch am y ffordd y mae'r sector preifat yn cael ei gynnwys mewn cyflenwi llawer o'r rhaglenni. Felly, ni ailadroddaf y pwynt hwnnw, o ystyried y cafodd ei godi gan Jenny Randerson.

Croesawaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan bob Aelod, ond dim ond amser byr sydd gennyf i ymateb. I ailadrodd y pwynt a wnaeth David Melding am yr adolygiad canol tymor, hoffwn ailadrodd bod y dull gwerthuso y cytunasom arno gyda phwyllgor monitro rhaglen Cymru gyfan yn ddull mwy

thorough and appropriate one, and better reflects the guidance that we have received from the European Commission. Therefore, I hope that Members will accept that.

Christine referred to the strong links between research and development and the agenda for jobs and growth, which we have recognised in the economic renewal programme. Therefore, we are also aligning the sector approach in the ERP with the priorities that we have identified for research and development. There is a dilemma here in that if you are going to have a more strategic approach to convergence projects, it makes it more difficult for smaller organisations to make individual applications. Jeff mentioned the private sector, which is involved in issues of procurement. I am pretty sure that it is possible, within some of the larger strategic projects, for smaller groups to benefit, although I appreciate that it is more difficult for them to make applications to sponsors.

Jenny Randerson made a few points, some of which were dealt effectively with by Jeff, namely the issue of double counting and the private sector. On the issue of the bureaucracy of the system, I thoroughly accept that there are some difficulties, particularly around the issue of procurement. I accept that we need to continue to address that issue in the future, along with the issue of state aid, which often means that we have an extra challenge in order to secure approval for projects.

I thank Members for the mostly positive way in which they have responded to the report and to the Government's recommendations.

Gareth Jones: Gan mai dim ond ychydig o amser sydd gennyf, trof yn gyntaf at y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i ddiolch iddo, ar ran y pwyllgor, am y modd y mae wedi ymateb. Trafodwyd materion o bwys gennym yn y pwyllgor, ac mae sawl Aelod y prynhawn yma wedi cyfeirio atynt. Mae'n anodd cael y cydbwysedd rhwng yr elfen strategol a'r mudiadau a'r cyrff sydd ar lawr gwlad, fel y tanlinellodd Christine. Mae'n bwysig cael y cydbwysedd hwnnw. Mae'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Jenny a David Melding hefyd yn faterion a ddaeth at ein sylw, a rhaid oedd inni roi amser iddynt. Mae'r holl fanylion hynny yng nghorff y dystiolaeth sy'n atodol i'n hadroddiad, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch chi a'ch swyddogion, Ddirprwy Brif

trwyadl a phriodol, ac yn un sy'n adlewyrchu'n well yr arweiniad a gawsom gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n derbyn hynny.

Cyfeiriodd Christine at y cysylltiadau cryfion rhwng ymchwil a datblygu a'r agenda ar gyfer swyddi a thwf, yr ydym wedi'u cydnabod yn rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi. Felly, rydym hefyd yn cysoni'r dull sector yn y Cynllun Adnoddau Menter â'r blaenoriaethau a nodwyd gennym ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu. Ceir penbleth yma oherwydd os ydych chi'n mynd i gael ymagwedd fwy strategol at brosiectau cydgyfeirio, mae'n ei gwneud yn anoddach i sefydliadau llai o faint wneud ceisiadau unigol. Soniodd Jeff am y sector preifat, sy'n cael ei gynnwys mewn materion caffael. Rwy'n weddol siŵr ei bod yn bosibl, yn rhai o'r prosiectau strategol mwy o faint, i grwpiau llai o faint elwa, er fy mod i'n gwerthfawrogi ei bod yn anoddach iddynt hwy wneud ceisiadau i noddwyr.

Gwnaeth Jenny Randerson ychydig o bwyntiau, ac ymdriniodd Jeff yn effeithiol â rhai ohonynt, sef mater cyfrif dwbl a'r sector preifat. O ran biwrocratiaeth y system, derbyniaf yn llwyr fod rhai anawsterau, yn arbennig ynghylch mater caffael. Derbyniaf fod angen inni barhau i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw yn y dyfodol, ynghyd â mater cymorth gwladwriaethol, sy'n aml yn golygu bod gennym her ychwanegol er mwyn sicrhau cymeradwyaeth i brosiectau.

Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am y ffordd gadarnhaol gan mwyaf y maent wedi ymateb i'r adroddiad ac i argymhellion y Llywodraeth.

Gareth Jones: As I have very little time left, I will turn first to the Deputy First Minister to thank him, on behalf of the committee, for the way in which he has responded. We discussed some important issues in committee, and several Members this afternoon have made reference to them. It is difficult to strike a balance between the strategic element and the organisations and bodies working at the grass roots, as Christine emphasised. It is important to strike the right balance. The points raised by Jenny and David Melding were also issues that were brought to our attention, and we had to pay due regard to them. All those issues can be found in the body of evidence attached to our report, and I am sure that you and your

Weinidog, yn cymryd sylw arbennig ohonynt.

officials, Deputy First Minister, will pay particular attention to them.

4.20 p.m.

Yr ydym wedi gwerthfawrogi cyfraniad Jeff Cuthbert, a deallwn ei sefyllfa fel cadeirydd y pwyllgor monitro rhaglenni Cymru gyfan. Mae eisoes wedi egluro ynghylch y cyfrif ddwywaith, a oedd yn fater a ddaeth at ein sylw fel pwyllgor. Yn gyffredinol—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod y pwyllgor yn cytuno—mae clod i'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd ati ac i'r defnydd a wneir o'r cronfeydd hyn, ac mae'r ganmoliaeth honno wedi dod o sawl cyfeiriad. Y cyfan y gallwn ni fel Aelodau ei wneud yw cyfeirio at agweddau lle yr ydym yn teimlo bod elfennau o wendid, ac yr ydych, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, wedi addo ystyried hynny. Un ohonynt yw'r adolygiad canol tymor, ac yr ydych wedi egluro pam nad ydych yn bwriadu dilyn y trywydd hwnnw a bod ffordd fwy effeithiol o fonitro, a rhaid inni dderbyn eich barn a'ch dehongliad yn hynny o beth.

We have appreciated Jeff Cuthbert's contribution, and we understand his position as chair of the all-Wales programme monitoring committee. He has already explained about the double counting, which was an issue drawn to the committee's attention. Generally speaking—and I am sure that the committee would agree—the Government approach to this and the use made of these funds has received plaudits from several directions. All that we as Members can do is refer to aspects where we felt that there were weaknesses, and you, Deputy First Minister, have pledged to consider those. One of them is the mid-term review, and you have explained why you do not intend to take that route and that there is a more effective means of monitoring, and we will have to accept your opinion and analysis in that regard.

Credaf fy mod yn siarad ar ran yr Aelodau i gyd wrth ddweud ein bod wedi cael sawl cyfle i wyntyllu sawl agwedd ar yr elfennau pwysig hyn, sy'n bwysig yn enwedig gan fod rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi wedi dod i fodolaeth ers inni ddechrau ar y gwaith hwn. Hefyd, fel y dywedodd Jeff Cuthbert, mae angen inni gynllunio tuag at y dyfodol. Credaf fod yr adroddiad a'r gwaith yr ydym wedi'i wneud wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol ac yn amserol.

I believe that I speak on behalf of all Members when I say that we have had many opportunities to air several aspects of these important elements, which are important particularly given that the economic renewal programme has come into being since we commenced this work. In addition, as Jeff Cuthbert said, we need to plan for the future. I believe that the report and the work that we have carried out has been useful and timely.

Felly, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Aelodau am y modd y bu iddynt weithredu, drwy fod yn dreiddgar iawn wrth ofyn eu cwestiynau. Diolch hefyd i'r clerc, y dirprwy glerc, a'r ymchwilydd, sydd wedi gweithio mor galed i ddod â'r adroddiad hwn ger ein bron. Dymunaf y gorau i Lywodraeth Cymru, gan fod hwn yn faes arbennig a phwysig, a mawr obeithiwn y byddwn yn gweld y llwyddiannau yr ydym yn haeddu eu gweld yng Nghymru.

Therefore, I wish to thank Members for the way in which they conducted themselves, by asking thorough and probing questions. I also thank the clerk, the deputy clerk, and the researcher, who have all worked so hard to bring this report before us. I wish the Government of Wales well, as this is an important area, and we greatly hope that we will see the successes that we deserve to see in Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to note the Enterprise and Learning Committee's report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, cytunir i'r cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Strategaeth Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Climate Change Strategy

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt and amendment 2 in the name of Peter Black.

Cynnig NDM4563 Nick Ramsay

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

Yn mynegi pryder nad yw Strategaeth Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cyflawni'r ymrwymadau a amlinellir yn agenda 'Cymru'n Un'.

Angela Burns: I move the motion.

The Welsh Conservatives are delighted that Wales as a nation, the Assembly and the Government, through cross-party support, places the issue of climate change so high on the agenda. The Assembly may recall that, last autumn, all parties signed a commitment to achieving a 40 per cent reduction in total emissions from Wales by 2020 from a 1990 baseline. There is no need to rehearse the arguments today as to why climate change, the loss of biodiversity and the need to refashion our society to embrace a more sustainable life on Earth is so incredibly important to us and to the generations to come. There also has to be recognition that, for many, their focus will be on their immediate needs, such as their jobs and homes, and that there is a growing scepticism and uncertainty in the general public's perceptions as to the reality of climate change, which was borne out by recent research in both the UK and the USA.

It is therefore all the more concerning that the Government's climate change strategy, which has been much consulted on, much talked about, and much referenced, fails to deliver on key objectives—objectives that are the cornerstone of our drive towards having a more sustainable future and that have been talked of by the Government and the Minister again and again as being absolute givens, and they are objectives that environmental agencies the length and breadth of Wales have used as the foundation for their

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt a gwelliant 2 yn enw Peter Black.

Motion NDM4563 Nick Ramsay

The National Assembly for Wales:

Expresses concern that the Welsh Assembly Government's Climate Change Strategy falls short of the commitments outlined in the 'One Wales' agenda.

Angela Burns: Cynigiau y cynnig.

Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru wrth eu bodd fod Cymru, fel cenedl, y Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth, drwy gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol, yn gosod mater newid hinsawdd mor uchel ar yr agenda. Hwyrach bod y Cynlluniad yn cofio bod pob plaid, yn ystod yr hydref y llynedd, wedi llofnodi ymrwymiad i gwtogi 40 y cant ar gyfanswm yr allyriadau o Gymru erbyn 2010, a hynny o waelodlin 1990. Nid oes angen ymarfer y dadleuon heddiw ynghylch pam mae newid hinsawdd, colli bioamrywiaeth a'r angen i ailffurfio ein cymdeithas i fyw'n fwy cynaliadwy ar y Ddaear mor hynod o bwysig i ni ac i'r cenedlaethau i ddod. Mae'n rhaid cydnabod hefyd y bydd llawer o bobl yn canolbwyntio ar eu hanghenion uniongyrchol hwy, fel eu swyddi a'u cartrefi, a bod ansicrwydd ac amheuaeth gynyddol yng nghanfyddiadau'r cyhoedd cyffredinol ynghylch realiti newid hinsawdd, a hynny'n sgil ymchwil diweddar yn y DU ac yn yr Unol Daleithiau.

Mae felly'n peri mwy o ofid byth fod strategaeth newid hinsawdd y Llywodraeth, yr ymgynghorwyd yn helaeth yn ei chylch, y siaradwyd yn helaeth amdani, ac y cyfeiriwyd yn helaeth ati, yn methu â chyflenwi amcanion allweddol-amcanion sy'n gonglfaen ein hymgais tuag at ddyfodol mwy cynaliadwy ac y soniodd y Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidog droeon eu bod yn gwbl sicr o ddigwydd, ac maent yn amcanion y mae asiantaethau amgylcheddol ar hyd a lled Cymru wedi'u defnyddio yn sail i'w

strategies and actions. This is a time when we need strong political leadership, but there appears to be a collective abrogation of commitment on the part of the Welsh Assembly Government, despite the 'One Wales' commitment that the Labour-Plaid administration would aim to achieve carbon-reduction equivalent emissions reductions of 3 per cent per year by 2011 in areas of devolved competence.

I want to make some points crystal clear. I accept that the Minister has a deep commitment to the environmental cause, and I also believe that she possesses an almost evangelical desire to move the cause further up the political agenda. However, reading the published environmental strategy makes it clear that her ministerial colleagues possess neither the same vision nor the belief that the vision is workable or achievable.

With regard to the 3 per cent cuts in emissions in devolved areas, Minister, would you explain to the Assembly how and why that 'One Wales' commitment has been so diluted, and why you are rowing back from your much-stated position, especially as we know that a 3 per cent reduction in emissions falls far short of the recommendations of the report of the Tyndall Centre for Climate Change Research, and as it is acknowledged by your Government and experts from the scientific fraternity to be too low? Research organisations such as the World Wildlife Fund, Friends of the Earth, and the RSPB think that a 3 per cent reduction in emissions is too low. Even your own 'Climate Change Strategy for Wales' states that

'the 3% target falls far short of the effort required'.

I appreciate that the climate change strategy states that you remain committed to 3 per cent, but the rub, Minister, is that you are no longer putting the onus for achieving this on Wales. Instead, when we miss our targets, as we surely will, given the lack of ambition, you will conveniently be able to hide behind others.

The 'Climate Change Strategy for Wales Delivery Plan for Emission reduction' sets out how you intend to implement policies and programmes to achieve reductions in

strategaethau a'u gweithredu. Mae hwn yn amser pan mae angen arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol gref arnom, ond mae'n debyg bod diddymiad cyfunol o ymrwymiad ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, er gwaethaf yr ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' y byddai'r weinyddiaeth Lafur-Plaid yn anelu at gyflawni gostyngiadau allyriadau cyfwerth â lleihau carbon o 3 y cant y flwyddyn erbyn 2011 mewn meysydd o gymhwysedd datganoledig.

Hoffwn wneud rhai pethau'n gwbl glir. Derbyniaf fod gan y Gweinidog ymrwymiad dwfn i'r achos amgylcheddol, a chredaf hefyd fod ganddi ddyhead sydd bron yn efengylaidd i symud yr achos yn agosach at frig yr agenda gwleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, drwy ddarllen y strategaeth amgylcheddol a gyhoeddwyd, mae'n amlwg nad oes gan ei chyd-weinidogion yr un weledigaeth na'r un gred fod y weledigaeth yn ymarferol neu'n gyraeddadwy.

O ran torri 3 y cant ar allyriadau mewn meysydd datganoledig, Weinidog, a wnewch chi egluro i'r Cynulliad sut a pham mae'r ymrwymiad hwnnw yn 'Cymru'n Un' wedi'i wanedu cymaint, a pham rydych chi'n cilio rhag eich safiad a ddatganwyd yn helaeth, yn enwedig a ninnau'n gwybod bod cwtogi 3 y cant ar allyriadau yn llawer llai nag argymhellion adroddiad Canolfan Tyndall ar gyfer Ymchwil Newid Hinsawdd, ac am fod eich Llywodraeth chi ac arbenigwyr o'r byd gwyddonol yn cydnabod bod hynny'n rhy isel? Mae sefydliadau ymchwil fel World Wildlife Fund, Cyfeillion y Ddaear, ac RSPB yn credu bod cwtogi 3 y cant ar allyriadau'n rhy isel. Mae hyd yn oed eich 'Strategaeth Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd' eich hun yn dweud bod

'y targed 3% yn llawer llai na'r ymdrech sy'n ofynnol'.

Gwerthfawrogaf fod y strategaeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn dweud eich bod yn dal wedi ymrwymo i 3 y cant, ond y drwg, Weinidog, yw nad ydych rhagor yn rhoi'r ddyletswydd i gyflawni hyn ar Gymru. Yn hytrach, pan fyddwn yn methu â chyrraedd ein targedau, fel y byddwn yn bendant, o ystyried y diffyg uchelgais, byddwch chi'n gallu cuddio'n gyfleus y tu ôl i eraill.

Mae 'Strategaeth Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd: Cynllun Cyflawni ar gyfer Lleihau Allyriadau' yn nodi'r ffordd y bwriadwch roi polisïau a rhaglenni ar waith i

greenhouse gases. However, page 3 of the document states that you anticipate that measures implemented by the Welsh Assembly Government will contribute only 0.89 per cent towards the 3 per cent target. You expect two thirds of the Welsh Assembly Government's target to be achieved by the policies of the UK Government and by wider sectoral contributions. Therefore, everybody, except Wales, has to contribute 2.11 per cent to your target. I think that this is lunacy. Let us be honest here and just say that our target is 0.89 per cent. I think that the concept of coming up with a target and then, without proper debate, saying that most of it is to be achieved by others is nonsense. Does the UK Government agree to contribute so heavily to your target; and what about the wider sectoral contributions? I understand this to mean business, local government, and the public sector. The strategy refers to 3 per cent in devolved areas, but the delivery plan clearly states that 1.2 per cent will be as a result of UK policies.

Let me elaborate on my earlier comment that some of your colleagues do not appear to be on board. Transport, which is the one area that we can be tough on, has to cut back by only 0.1 per cent. Transport affects all of us; it covers all of Wales and all areas of life. However, transport has to find only 0.1 per cent. Whereas 62.5 per cent of the transport budget is spent on roads, only 37.5 per cent goes on other forms of transport. We should change this. Instead, it is easy to go after a softer target, such as the poor old agricultural industry. Minister, I simply cannot support this amendment.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You do not need to stop now; you have 15 minutes.

Angela Burns: Oh, Lord; I will not rush this little bit, then. Thank you very much indeed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have 10 minutes left out of the 15 altogether. I would just remind you that that includes time for winding up.

Angela Burns: Let us look at some other aspects of strategy, Minister, such as behavioural changes. This report is littered with the words 'more' and 'expects', but

leihau nwyon tŷ gwydr. Fodd bynnag, ar dudalen 3 o'r ddogfen, dywedir eich bod yn rhagweld y bydd mesurau a weithredwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cyfrannu 0.89 y cant yn unig at y targed 3 y cant. Rydych chi'n disgwyl i ddwy ran o dair o darged Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gael ei gyflawni gan bolisiau Llywodraeth y DU a chan gyfraniadau sectoraidd ehangach. Felly, mae'n rhaid i bawb, heblaw Cymru, gyfrannu 2.11 y cant at eich targed. Rwy'n credu mai ffolineb yw hyn. Gadewch inni fod yn onest yma a dyweder mai 0.89 y cant yw ein targed. Rwy'n credu mai dwli yw'r cysyniad o osod targed ac yna dweud, heb ddadlau'n briodol, fod y rhan fwyaf ohono am gael ei gyflawni gan eraill. A ydy Llywodraeth y DU'n cytuno i gyfrannu mor helaeth at eich targed; a beth am y cyfraniadau sectoraidd ehangach? Deallaf fod hyn yn golygu'r byd busnes, llywodraeth leol, a'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r strategaeth yn cyfeirio at 3 y cant mewn meysydd datganoledig, ond mae'r cynllun cyflawni'n nodi'n glir y bydd 1.2 y cant o ganlyniad i bolisiau'r DU.

Gadewch imi ymhelaethu ar fy sylw cynharach ei bod yn ymddangos nad yw rhai o'ch cydweithwyr wedi ymrwymo. Mae'n rhaid cwtogi 0.1 y cant yn unig ar gludiant, sef yr un maes y gallwn fod yn gadarn arno. Mae cludiant yn effeithio ar bob un ohonom; mae'n ymdrin â Chymru gyfan a phob rhan o fywyd. Fodd bynnag, dim ond 0.1 y cant y mae'n rhaid i gludiant ei ganfod. Er bod 62.5 y cant o'r gyllideb cludiant yn cael ei gwario ar ffyrdd, dim ond 37.5 y cant sy'n mynd ar fathau eraill o gludiant. Dylem newid hyn. Yn hytrach, mae'n haws mynd ar drywydd targed meddalach, fel yr hen ddiwydiant amaethyddol, druan. Weinidog, ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn o gwbl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid oes angen ichi roi'r gorau iddi'n awr; mae gennych chwarter awr.

Angela Burns: O Arglwydd; ni frysiaf y darn bach hwn, felly. Diolch yn fawr iawn wir.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gennych 10 munud yn weddill o'r 15 i gyd. Byddwn yn eich atgoffa'n gyflym fod hynny'n cynnwys amser i ddirwyn i ben.

Angela Burns: Gadewch inni edrych ar rai agweddau eraill ar strategaeth, Weinidog, fel newidiadau ymddygiadol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn frith o eiriau fel 'mwy' a 'disgwyl',

there is a woeful lack of detail. There are many things to hope for, but no route through. There are woolly statements, such as, by 2020, you expect to see more people walking and cycling. This is meaningless unless accompanied by concrete policies, unlike the full reports published by the Sustainability Committee, which detail how to achieve carbon reductions. The majority of the conclusions published in these reports have been accepted in full by the Welsh Assembly Government. Minister, I ask you, how is it that none of them have made it through to the climate change strategy in any meaningful sense? Let us examine just one of them.

The Sustainability Committee's report on energy production called on the Welsh Assembly Government to explore the potential for local authorities in Wales to issue loans for the installation of domestic microgeneration technology, such as in the Kirklees scheme. However, page 65 of the climate change strategy fails to expand on this issue, stating only,

'We will develop and secure alternative funding sources to deliver a financing package to support loans for energy efficiency and microgeneration measures in "able to pay" households.'

There is no detail as to how this will be done, and yet this is a delivery plan.

The other elephant in the corner, Minister, is the fact that the climate change strategy really needs to overcompensate for the emissions performance of the traded sector, which comprises the rest of the emissions not covered by the devolved/non-devolved, 3 per cent, 'One Wales' non-Wales target. This is illustrated by the 6 per cent increase in greenhouse gas emissions in just one year.

Therefore, we have an undercompensating strategy that does not appear to have support from other Ministers. It reneges on the targets that we have all bought into, and it delivers woolly hopes and relies on others to do our work. It looks and feels like a frustrated ambition; a downplayed aspiration. It is a great shame for the Minister and for us all. The Welsh Conservatives will therefore be unable to support the Government's

and mae diffyg manylder truenus. Mae llawer o bethau i obeithio amdanynt, ond dim llwybr trwyddo. Mae datganiadau aneglur fel, erbyn 2020, rydych chi'n disgwyl gweld mwy o bobl yn cerdded ac yn beicio. Mae hyn yn ddiystyr heb fod polisiau cadarn yn gwmni iddo, yn wahanol i'r adroddiadau llawn a gyhoeddwyd gan y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, sy'n disgrifio sut i leihau carbon. Mae mwyafrif y casgliadau a gyhoeddwyd yn yr adroddiadau hyn wedi'u derbyn yn llawn gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi, pam nad oes yr un ohonynt wedi cyrraedd y strategaeth newid hinsawdd mewn unrhyw ffordd ystyrlon? Gadewch inni archwilio un ohonynt.

Roedd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd am gynhyrchu ynni yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i archwilio'r potensial i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ryddhau benthyciadau i osod technoleg microgynhyrchu ddomestig, fel yng nghynllun Kirklees. Fodd bynnag, nid yw tudalen 65 o'r strategaeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ymhelaethu ar hyn, gan ddweud yn unig,

'Byddwn yn datblygu ac yn sicrhau ffynonellau eraill o gyllid i gyflwyno pecyn cyllido i gefnogi benthyciadau ar gyfer mesurau microgynhyrchu a defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon mewn aelwydydd "sy'n gallu talu".'

Ni ddisgrifiwyd sut bydd hyn yn cael ei wneud, ac eto cynllun cyflawni yw hwn.

Y peth arall nad ellir ei anwybyddu, Weinidog, yw'r ffaith bod wir angen i'r strategaeth newid hinsawdd fynd dros ben llestri i wneud iawn am berfformiad allyriadau'r sector masnachu, sy'n creu gweddill yr allyriadau heb eu cynnwys yn nharged di-Gymru 'Cymru'n Un', datganoledig/heb ei ddatganoli o 3 y cant. Dangosir hyn gan y cynnydd o 6 y cant mewn allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr mewn un flwyddyn yn unig.

Felly, mae gennym strategaeth annigonol nad yw fel petai'n cael ei chefnogi gan Weinidogion eraill. Mae'n troi cefn ar y targedau y cytunasom oll iddynt, ac mae'n rhoi gobeithion cymylog ac yn dibynnu ar eraill i wneud ein gwaith. Mae'n edrych ac yn teimlo fel uchelgais rhwystredig; a dyhead sy'n ymddangos yn llai pwysig nag ydyw. Mae'n siomedig iawn i'r Gweinidog ac i bob un ohonom. Bydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru felly'n

amendment. However, we accept the amendments tabled by the Liberal Democrats, and we would be delighted to support those.

4.30 p.m.

I will end by highlighting why this is so incredibly important. The gravity of this situation can be easily underestimated as a result of the way in which sections of the popular media have sought to attack or cast doubt on climate science at every opportunity. While the situation is deteriorating, the realisation of the huge economic and job creation benefits of tackling climate change are growing. That is the key. The situation is deteriorating, our climate is getting worse and change is picking up, and we need every available tool to fight it. The 'Climate Change Strategy for Wales', which had an awful lot of potential, does not bring in enough of the other ministerial portfolios and does not let us be totally responsible for our own target. It should be 3 per cent for Wales.

Gwelliant 1 Jane Hutt

Dileu'r cyfan a rhoi'r canlynol yn ei le:

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

Yn nodi Strategaeth Newid yn yr Hinsawdd a Chynlluniau Cyflawni Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n amlinellu sut bydd Cymru'n cymryd camau mewn sectorau penodol fel trafnidiaeth, tai preswyl, gwastraff ac amaethyddiaeth i fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd a lleihau allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr gan 3% o flwyddyn i flwyddyn.

Yn croesawu cyfraniad traws-sector a hollbleidiol y Comisiwn Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, sydd wedi gweithio ochr yn ochr â'r Llywodraeth i ddatblygu'r Strategaeth a'i chymeradwyo'n derfynol.

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I move amendment 1.

Gwelliant 2 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn gresynu nad oes dangosyddion perfformiad amlwg er mwyn mesur

methu â chefnogi gwelliant y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, derbyniwn y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a byddai'n bleser inni gefnogi'r rheini.

Rwyf am gwblhau drwy amlygu pam mae hyn mor hynod o bwysig. Hawdd yw peidio â llawn werthfawrogi difrifoldeb y sefyllfa hon o ganlyniad i'r ffordd y mae rhannau o'r cyfryngau poblogaidd wedi ceisio ymosod ar wyddoniaeth hinsawdd, neu daflu amheuan arni, ar bob cyfle. Tra bo'r sefyllfa'n gwaethygu, sylweddolir mwyfwy'r buddion enfawr i'r economi ac i greu swyddi yn sgil mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Hwnnw yw'r allwedd. Mae'r sefyllfa'n gwaethygu, mae ein hinsawdd yn gwaethygu ac mae newid yn cyflymu, ac mae angen pob arf sydd ar gael arnom i'w ymladd. Nid yw 'Strategaeth Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd', a chanddi lawer iawn o botensial, yn dod i mewn â digon o'r portffolios gweinidogaethol eraill ac nid yw'n gadael inni fod yn gwbl gyfrifol am ein targed ein hun. Dylai fod 3 y cant i Gymru.

Amendment 1 Jane Hutt

Delete all and replace with:

The National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the Welsh Assembly Government's Climate Change Strategy and Delivery Plan which sets out how Wales will take action in specific sectors, such as transport, residential housing, waste and agriculture, in its fight against climate change and achieve a 3% year on year reduction in greenhouse gas emissions.

Welcomes the input of the cross sector, all-party Climate Change Commission which worked alongside Government to develop and give final approval to the Strategy.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Cynigiad welliant 1.

Amendment 2 Peter Black

Add as new point at end of motion:

Regrets that there are no identifiable performance indicators against which to

cyflawniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn erbyn y targedau yn y Strategaeth ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd.

Kirsty Williams: I move amendment 2.

I begin by thanking Angela Burns and the Welsh Conservatives for tabling this motion and giving us an early opportunity to discuss what is an extremely important strategy. The amendment highlights one of the greatest weaknesses of the strategy in its current form, namely, its performance indicators, which means that we cannot truly judge our collective performance on this important agenda. I will come back later to the issue around transparency, credibility and data.

I appreciate that many organisations and individuals, as well as the Minister, have spent a considerable amount of time working towards this moment, and I do not doubt, as Angela said, the sincerity of all those who have been involved in this process and their genuine desire to make a difference in this important area. The long-awaited publication of the Government's climate change strategy should be the point at which we stop theorising, talking and acknowledging that the problem is very serious, and commit once and for all to paper what we are going to do about the situation that we face, what is achievable and, most importantly of all, how reductions in carbon can be achieved. In some ways, this strategy misses that opportunity; it could have been so much more.

There are elements within the strategy that we commend and support. It recognises once again the seriousness of the situation that we face, and states clearly the Government's determination to try to do something about it. It is strong on its commitments to collaboration and working across the piece with organisations to deliver on this agenda. It is also strong with regard to the need to focus on attitudinal and behavioural change, and the commitment to measuring emissions from consumption. Those points are to be commended.

However, the danger with this strategy is that those things that are worthwhile, which the strategy has got spot on, have been clouded by some fancy footwork by the Government in relation to its own targets and the much-talked-about 3 per cent reduction. Whichever way you read it, it is clear that there has been a rowing back from the commitment made by

measure the Welsh Assembly Government's achievement of the targets in the Climate Change Strategy.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau welliant 2.

Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Angela Burns ac i Geidwadwyr Cymru am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn ac am roi cyfle cynnar inni drafod strategaeth sy'n hynod bwysig. Mae'r gwelliant yn amlygu un o wendidau mwyaf y strategaeth yn ei ffurf gyfredol, sef ei dangosyddion perfformiad, sy'n golygu nad allwn wir feirniadu ein perfformiad cyfunol ar yr agenda pwysig hwn. Dychwelaf yn ddiweddarach i'r mater ynghylch tryloywder, hygredd a data.

Gwerthfawrogaf fod llawer o sefydliadau ac unigolion, yn ogystal â'r Gweinidog, wedi treulio amser sylweddol yn gweithio tuag at y foment hon, ac, fel y dywedodd Angela, nid wyf yn amau didwylledd y rheini oll a fu'n ymwneud â'r broses hon na'u dyhead diffuant i wneud gwahaniaeth yn y maes pwysig hwn. Dylai cyhoeddi strategaeth y Llywodraeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd, y bu mawr aros amdani, fod yr adeg lle rydym yn rhoi'r gorau i ddamcaniaethu, siarad a chydabod bod y broblem yn ddifrifol iawn, ac ymrwymo unwaith ac am byth i gofnodi'r hyn yr ydym am ei wneud am y sefyllfa a wynebwn, yr hyn sy'n gyraeddadwy ac, yn bwysicaf oll, y ffordd y gellir gostwng carbon. Mewn rhai ffyrdd, mae'r strategaeth hon yn colli'r cyfle hwnnw; gallai fod wedi bod cymaint yn fwy.

Mae elfennau yn y strategaeth a gymeradwywn ac a gefnogwn. Mae'n cydnabod unwaith eto ddifrifoldeb y sefyllfa a wynebwn, ac yn nodi'n glir fod y Llywodraeth yn benderfynol o geisio gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Mae'n ymrwymo'n gryf i gydweithio a gweithio yn gyffredinol gyda sefydliadau i gyflawni'r agenda hwn. Mae hefyd yn gadarn o ran yr angen i ganolbwyntio ar newid agweddau ac ymddygiad, a'r ymrwymiad i fesur allyriadau o dreuliant. Dylid cymeradwyo'r pethau hynny.

Fodd bynnag, perygl y strategaeth hon yw bod y pethau hynny sy'n werth chweil, y mae'r strategaeth wedi'u cael yn llygad eu lle, wedi cael eu cymylu gan ryw droedio cymhleth gan y Llywodraeth mewn perthynas â'i thargedau ei hun a'r gostyngiad 3 y cant y soniwyd cymaint amdano. Pa ffordd bynnag y'i darllenwch, mae'n amlwg y ciliwyd oddi

the Welsh Assembly Government—a target that the Minister and the One Wales Government have long been committed to. In reality, the Government is relying heavily on other organisations, whether it be the UK Government or the European Union, to help to deliver on what we all believed was its own target. We all signed up to that as the Government’s target—the Government certainly stated that it was—and the change is very regrettable.

Having gone to the trouble of commissioning the Tyndall report to inform this strategy, it is very disappointing that a great deal of the very robust detail in that report has not found its way into the strategy, when, as Angela said, the Tyndall Centre and its report have indicated that we need to go much further than we have committed to doing to date. There are real concerns that, although it refers to the cuts in emissions that need to be made, and that could be made, the strategy does not give a clear and comprehensive description for each policy area and the actions that are going to be taken. Again, that is one of the weaknesses in the Government’s arguments today.

We have worked hard; the Minister, personally, has worked very hard, and people outside the Assembly have worked very hard to try to create a political consensus on this issue. I think that all parties in the Chamber have tried to play their part in that, but in the end a consensus is not good if it means pulling our punches and not asking difficult questions about the lack of transparency, credibility and ambition. The route map for achieving those things is not contained in this strategy.

Mohammad Asghar: The climate change strategy says that the Welsh Assembly Government will make

‘the most of opportunities to cut emissions’. Surely publishing a strategy with clear, measurable indicators, at least in line with ‘One Wales’ commitments, would be a good place to start. Although the rhetoric in the strategy is positive and espouses a commitment to tackling climate change, the issues are in the detail. It is concerning that the Welsh Assembly Government’s strategy waters down commitments outlined in the

wrth yr ymrwymiad a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—targed y mae’r Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru’n Un wedi hen ymrwymo iddo. Mewn gwirionedd, mae’r Llywodraeth yn dibynnu’n helaeth ar sefydliadau eraill, p’un ai Llywodraeth y DU neu’r Undeb Ewropeaidd, i helpu i gyflawni’r hyn yr oeddem oll yn credu ei fod yn darged iddi hi ei hun. Cytunasom oll i hwnnw fel targed y Llywodraeth—yn sicr, dyna ddywedodd y Llywodraeth ydoedd—ac mae’r newid yn anffodus iawn.

Ar ôl mynd i’r drafferth o gomisiynu adroddiad Tyndall i lywio’r strategaeth hon, mae’n siomedig iawn nad oes llawer iawn o’r manylion cadarn iawn yn yr adroddiad hwnnw wedi cyrraedd y strategaeth, ar ôl i Ganolfan Tyndall a’i hadroddiad ddweud, fel y dywedodd Angela, fod angen inni wneud llawer mwy nag yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i’w wneud hyd yma. Mae gwir bryderon nad yw’r strategaeth yn disgrifio’n glir nac yn gynhwysfawr bob maes polisi a’r camau sy’n mynd i gael eu cymryd, er ei bod yn cyfeirio at y toriadau mewn allyriadau y mae angen eu gwneud, ac y gellid eu gwneud. Eto, hwnnw yw un o’r gwendidau yn nadleuon y Llywodraeth heddiw.

Rydym wedi gweithio’n galed; mae’r Gweinidog, yn bersonol, wedi gweithio’n galed iawn, ac mae pobl y tu allan i’r Cynulliad wedi gweithio’n galed iawn i geisio creu cydsyniad gwleidyddol ar y mater hwn. Rwy’n credu bod pob plaid yn y Siambwr wedi ceisio chwarae ei rhan yn hynny, ond yn y pen draw nid yw cydsyniad yn dda i ddim os yw’n golygu ymatal a pheidio â gofyn cwestiynau anodd am y diffyg tryloywder, hygrededd ac uchelgais. Nid yw’r trywydd i gyflawni’r pethau hynny yn cael ei gynnwys yn y strategaeth hon.

Mohammad Asghar: Yn ôl y strategaeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd, bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’n gwneud

‘y mwyaf o gyfleoedd i dorri allyriadau’. Oni fyddai cyhoeddi strategaeth a chanddi ddangosyddion clir, mesuradwy, o leiaf yn unol ag ymrwymadau ‘Cymru’n Un’, yn fan cychwyn da? Er bod y rhethreg yn y strategaeth yn gadarnhaol ac yn arddel ymrwymiad i fynd i’r afael â’r newid yn yr hinsawdd, mae’r problemau yn y manylion. Mae’n peri gofid bod strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’n gwanedu’r

'One Wales' agreement of 2007. As we all know, climate change poses a number of severe challenges for Wales. The potential impact is vast and spans a number of sectors, from the environment to the economy to public health and so on. Failure to tackle climate change could have major consequences. Commentators have predicted a significant increase in deaths linked to climate change, while, over the next century, we may face severe risks from increased levels of erosion and tidal flooding.

It is essential, therefore, that the Assembly Government seizes every opportunity to tackle climate change as ambitiously as possible. The actions of Scandinavian countries on this issue are worth noting. Norway has revised its targets for tackling greenhouse gas emissions upwards in recent years and is now pledging to become carbon-neutral by 2030. Wales's new climate change strategy takes the opposite approach by watering down previously set targets. The delivery plan that accompanies the strategy says that the measures implemented by the Welsh Assembly Government will contribute 0.89 per cent towards the target of 3 per cent, which my colleague Angela just mentioned. That is less than a third. The bulk of the reductions will be made through UK Government policies and contributions by business, the public sector, local government, communities, individuals, the third sector and so on.

There was no mention of this in 'One Wales'. Additionally, the target of 3 per cent does not include traded emissions from heavy industry and power generation. These make up some 31 per cent of Welsh emissions. Crucially, the climate change strategy is also lacking important targets and measurable indicators. Terms such as 'significant improvement' lack any detail to allow proper analysis. For example, the Minister says that she wants to see more people walking and cycling by 2020, but what are the figures? How does such a vague approach fit in with the walking and cycling plan, which sets clear target indicators, but only up until 2013? The document also refers to a desire to see more people using public transport and car sharing,

ymrwymiaidau a amlinellwyd yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn 2007. Fel y gwyddom oll, mae'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn creu nifer o heriau difrifol i Gymru. Mae'r effaith bosibl yn helaeth ac mae'n rhychwantu nifer o sectorau, o'r amgylchedd i'r economi i iechyd cyhoeddus ac ati. Gallai methu mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd ddwyn canlyniadau difrifol. Mae sylwebyddion wedi proffwydo llawer mwy o farwolaethau mewn cysylltiad â newid hinsawdd, a, thros y ganrif nesaf, hwyrach y byddwn yn wynebu risgiau difrifol o lefelau cynyddol o erydu a llifogydd llanw.

Mae'n hanfodol, felly, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn achub ar bob cyfle i fynd i'r afael â newid hinsawdd mewn modd mor uchelgeisiol â phosibl. Mae'n werth sôn am gamau gwledydd Sgandinafia ar y mater hwn. Mae Norwy wedi diwygio ei thargedau i fynd i'r afael ag allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwyr tuag i fyny yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf ac mae bellach yn addo bod yn garbon niwtral erbyn 2030. Mae strategaeth newydd Cymru ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn gwneud y gwrthwyneb, gan wanedu targedau a osodwyd yn flaenorol. Yn ôl y cynllun cyflawni sy'n gwmni i'r strategaeth, bydd y mesurau a weithredir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n cyfrannu 0.89 y cant tuag at y targed o 3 y cant, y mae fy nghydweinig Angela newydd sôn amdano. Mae hwnnw'n llai na thraean. Bydd swmp y gostyngiadau'n cael eu gwneud drwy bolisiau Llywodraeth y DU a chyfraniadau gan fusnes, y sector cyhoeddus, llywodraeth leol, cymunedau, unigolion, y trydydd sector ac yn y blaen.

Ni soniwyd am hyn yn 'Cymru'n Un'. Hefyd, nid yw'r targed o 3 y cant yn cynnwys allyriadau masnach o gynhyrchu pŵer a diwydiannau trwm. Mae'r rhain yn creu tua 31 y cant o allyriadau Cymru. Yn allweddol, mae'r strategaeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd hefyd yn cynnwys prinder targedau pwysig a dangosyddion mesuradwy. Mae termau fel 'gwelliant sylweddol' yn brin o unrhyw fanylion i'w dadansoddi'n iawn. Er enghraifft, dywed y Gweinidog ei bod am weld mwy o bobl yn cerdded ac yn beicio erbyn 2020, ond ble mae'r ffigurau? Sut mae ymagwedd mor amhendant yn cyd-fynd â'r cynllun cerdded a beicio, sy'n gosod dangosyddion targed clir, ond tan 2013 yn unig? Mae'r ddogfen yn cyfeirio hefyd at

but how many is 'more'? Can the Minister give more detailed information on how the Assembly Government will achieve this?

4.40 p.m.

In her ministerial foreword to the plan, the Minister says that the strategy confirms the ambition of the Welsh Assembly Government. However, such vague aims confirm nothing about how ambitious the Welsh Assembly Government intends to be. Friends of the Earth has criticised the Welsh Assembly Government's ambition and has highlighted how, as we are saying, less than a third of the targeted cut in emissions will be delivered directly by the Welsh Assembly Government. The Assembly Government accepts that urgent and sustained action to cut emissions is required, and the climate change strategy is supposed to outline how this will be achieved. Therefore, why have the targets been watered down? Why does the strategy lack important measurable indicators? The Minister must be prepared to give more detail about these commitments, and outline just how ambitious the Assembly Government intends to be in tackling climate change.

Brian Gibbons: Nicholas Stern said that climate change was the most compelling example of market failure in history. At the root of this particular problem has been the lack of a real market accountability for, or effective regulation of, carbon emissions and other greenhouse gas emissions. In effect, greenhouse gases have been a free good despite their catastrophic consequences for our environment. It is totally unrealistic to believe that we can address this problem unless we tackle this fundamental underlying market failure. In Westminster, we see a Government that is led by a party that, three years ago, ignored the greatest financial crisis to have ever hit us and I do not see any commitment by that Government to intervene in the market to address market failure—an intervention that is required to address this challenge. It was well signalled in today's comprehensive spending review: only £1 billion pledged to the green investment bank, compared to the £2 billion pledged by Alistair Darling in his budget last March. We

ddyhead i weld mwy o bobl yn defnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus ac yn rhannu ceir, ond sawl un yw 'mwy'? A all y Gweinidog roi gwybod yn fanylach sut bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyflawni hyn?

Yn Rhagair y Gweinidog i'r cynllun, dywed fod y strategaeth yn cadarnhau uchelgais Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw nodau mor amhendiant yn cadarnhau dim am y graddau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n bwriadu bod yn uchelgeisiol. Mae Cyfeillion y Ddaear wedi beirniadu uchelgais Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac wedi amlygu y bydd llai na thraean o'r toriadau a dargedir mewn allyriadau, fel y dywedwn, yn cael ei gyflawni'n uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn derbyn bod gofyn gweithredu ar frys ac yn barhaus i dorri allyriadau, ac mae'r strategaeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd i fod i amlinellu sut bydd hyn yn cael ei wneud. Pam, felly, mae'r targedau wedi'u gwanedu? Pam mae prinder dangosyddion mesuradwy pwysig yn y strategaeth? Rhaid i'r Gweinidog fod yn barod i roi mwy o fanylion am yr ymrwymadau hyn, ac amlinellu'n union mor uchelgeisiol mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu bod wrth fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn y hinsawdd.

Brian Gibbons: Dywedodd Nicholas Stern mai'r newid yn yr hinsawdd oedd yr enghraifft fwyaf symbylol o fethiant y farchnad mewn hanes. Wrth wraidd y broblem arbennig hon fu diffyg gwir atebolrwydd y farchnad am allyriadau carbon ac allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr eraill, a diffyg eu rheoleiddio gan y farchnad. I bob pwrpas, mae nwyon tŷ gwydr wedi bod yn ddaioni rhydd er eu canlyniadau trychinebus i'n hamgylchedd. Mae'n gwbl afrealistig credu y gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon heblaw yr awn i'r afael â'r methiant sylfaenol hwn yn y farchnad. Yn San Steffan, gwelwn Lywodraeth sy'n cael ei harwain gan blaid a anwybyddodd, dair blynedd yn ôl, yr argyfwng ariannol mwyaf a'n bwriadodd erioed ac ni welaf unrhyw ymrwymiad gan y Llywodraeth honno i ymyrryd yn y farchnad i fynd i'r afael â methiant y farchnad—ymyriad sy'n ofynnol i fynd i'r afael â'r her hon. Fe'i hamlygwyd yn dda yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant heddiw: dim ond £1 biliwn a addawyd i'r banc buddsoddi

would have to be pretty green behind the ears if we were to believe that this is the greenest Government ever.

Darren Millar: Thank you for taking the intervention. Do you accept that, had it not been for pressure from the Conservative Party at Westminster, we would not have had the Climate Change Act 2008, and we would not be making the sort of progress that we have been making on a consensual basis, not only in Wales, but across the UK? It was David Cameron's leadership on this issue that got it to the top of the political agenda rather than it being on the inside pages of *The Guardian*, where it was previously.

Brian Gibbons: The Welsh Assembly Government has set itself a target of a 3 per cent reduction in greenhouse gas emissions within areas of devolved competence, as we have heard. However, if we look at the progress that has been made in reaching these targets, we see a very discouraging picture. Between 1990 and 1997—the period for which the most recent figures are available for Wales—the overall reductions have been in the order of 15 to 16 per cent, which is less than 1 per cent per year. That is the reality. That is not much different to the overall figure in the United Kingdom. However, the United Kingdom has more recent figures and they show an 8 per cent decline in greenhouse gas emissions in the last complete year of the figures. However, the commentaries on how that was achieved say that it was almost exclusively achieved because of the economic downturn. In short, a 5 per cent reduction in GDP in the United Kingdom was required to create an 8 per cent decline in greenhouse gas emissions. That is the scale of the challenges that we face. It is absurd to hear Darren, yesterday, and Angela, today, calling in the Assembly to increase the targets for reductions in greenhouse gas emissions to 6 and 9 per cent, when they have no effective strategy to address the issue, other than the massive reductions in GDP that would be required to deliver it.

That would simply be unacceptable on the grounds of social justice, because the very people who would have to pay the price for that would be the poorest and most disadvantaged in our community. That is

gwyrd, o'i chymharu â'r £2 biliwn a addawyd gan Alistair Darling yn ei gyllideb fis Mawrth diwethaf. Byddai'n rhaid inni fod yn weddol ddibrofiad er mwyn inni gredu mai hon yw'r Llywodraeth wyrddaf erioed.

Darren Millar: Diolch am gymryd yr ymyriad. A ydych chi'n derbyn, heb y pwysau oddi wrth y Blaid Geidwadol yn San Steffan, na fyddem wedi cael Deddf Newid Hinsawdd 2008, ac na fyddem yn gwneud y math o gynnydd y buom yn ei wneud gan gydsynio, nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond ledled y DU? Arweinyddiaeth David Cameron ar y mater hwn a'i rhoes ar frig yr agenda gwleidyddol yn hytrach nag ar dudalennau mewnol *The Guardian*, lle'r oedd o'r blaen.

Brian Gibbons: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gosod targed iddi'i hun o gwtogi 3 y cant ar allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr mewn meysydd o gymhwysedd datganoledig, fel y clywsom. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwn ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd i gyrraedd y targedau hyn, gwelwn ddarlun torcalonnus iawn. Rhwng 1990 a 1997—y cyfnod y mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf ar gael ar ei gyfer i Gymru—mae'r gostyngiadau cyffredinol wedi bod tua 15 i 16 y cant, sy'n llai nag 1 y cant y flwyddyn. Dyna'r gwirionedd. Nid yw hynny'n wahanol iawn i'r ffigur cyffredinol yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y Deyrnas Unedig ffigurau diweddaraf ac maent yn dangos 8 y cant o ostyngiad mewn allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr ym mlwyddyn gyflawn ddiwethaf y ffigurau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sylwadau ar y ffordd y cyflawnwyd hynny'n dweud ei fod wedi'i gyflawni bron yn gyfan gwbl oherwydd y dirywiad economaidd. Yn fyr, roedd gofyn 5 y cant o ostyngiad mewn CMC yn y Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn creu 8 y cant o ostyngiad mewn allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr. Dyna faint yr heriau a wynebwn. Mae'n wirion clywed Darren, ddoe, ac Angela, heddiw, yn galw yn y Cynulliad am gynyddu'r targedau i ostwng allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr i 6 a 9 y cant, pan nad oes ganddynt ddim strategaeth effeithiol i fynd i'r afael â'r peth, heblaw'r gostyngiadau enfawr mewn CMC a fyddai'n ofynnol i'w gyflawni.

Byddai hynny'n gwbl annerbyniol ar sail cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, oherwydd yr union bobl a fyddai'n gorfod talu'r pris am hynny fyddai'r tlotaf a'r mwyaf difreintiedig yn ein cymuned. Dim ond yma ar lefel y DU a

only the problem here at a UK and Welsh level. At a global level, Professor Tim Jackson from the University of Surrey, who is a well respected commentator in this area, said that if, by 2050, the whole world was to attain the current European standard of living, the world's economy would have to grow sixfold. If the only way to demonstrably reduce carbon is by depressing GDP, those projections from Professor Tim Jackson highlight how difficult a task that is, and the contributions of the opposition parties here would be minuscule.

I am not sure that we have an effective strategy for addressing global warming, whether here as an Assembly Government, or whether at the UK, EU or global level. I think that we are really struggling to deliver this. However, having listened to some of the fatuous comments from the opposition benches here today, it seems that they have not even got to square one in respect of addressing this particular challenge.

David Melding: I hope that I manage to make some comments that are not fatuous and that could even be welcomed by the great Dr Gibbons. I want to consider the issue of green jobs. I thought that I could best use my contribution to commend some good practice, because, inevitably in these debates, there is a certain tendency to concentrate on those areas that are falling well short of the mark—and, alas, the Welsh Assembly Government provides a lot of material in that respect. However, in the spirit of consensus, I do not want to dwell on that.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You are just making the point in passing. [*Laughter.*]

David Melding: Indeed. I commend the work of Business in the Community and particularly its green business skills forum. Business in the Community has carried out an excellent analysis of how many green jobs could be created in the Heads of the Valleys. It has estimated more than 3,000 via Arbed and other schemes—and I have to say that 'Arbed' seems to demand another vowel, but I will not provide one this afternoon. At present, as it was able to identify, the lack of a locally skilled workforce means that jobs go outside these communities, despite the fact that these public programmes are being delivered and are themselves beneficial on environmental grounds. However, we could

Chymru y mae hynny'n broblem. Yn fyd-eang, dywedodd yr Athro Tim Jackson, o Brifysgol Surrey, sy'n sylwebydd uchel ei barch yn y maes hwn, y byddai'n rhaid i economi'r byd dyfu chwe gwaith er mwyn i'r byd i gyd, erbyn 2050, gyrraedd y safon Ewropeaidd gyfredol o fyw. Os gostwng CMC yw'r unig ffordd o leihau carbon yn amlwg, mae'r rhagamcaniadau hynny gan yr Athro Tim Jackson yn amlygu mor anodd yw'r dasg honno, a byddai cyfraniadau'r gwrthbleidiau yma yn fach iawn.

Nid wyf yn siŵr bod gennym strategaeth effeithiol i fynd i'r afael â chynhesu byd-eang, boed yma yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad, neu ar lefel y DU, yr UE neu fyd-eang. Rwy'n credu ein bod yn trafferthu'n fawr i gyflawni hyn. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl gwrandao ar rai o'r sylwadau ynydd o feinciau'r wrthblaid yma heddiw, mae'n debyg nad ydynt hyd yn oed wedi cyrraedd y cam cyntaf o ran mynd i'r afael â'r her arbennig hon.

David Melding: Gobeithiaf y llwyddaf i wneud rhai sylwadau nad ydynt yn ffôl ac y gallai Dr Gibbons fawr eu croesawu hyd yn oed. Hoffwn ystyried mater swyddi gwyrdd. Roeddwn i'n credu mai'r ffordd orau y gallwn ddefnyddio fy nghyfraniad oedd cymeradwyo arfer da, oherwydd, yn anochel yn y dadleuon hyn, mae tuedd benodol i ganolbwyntio ar y meysydd hynny sy'n methu o ddifrif—ac, och, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n darparu llawer o ddeunydd yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, yn naws cydsynio, nid wyf am ganolbwyntio ar hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ond rydych chi'n gwneud y pwynt yn ddidaro. [*Chwerthin.*]

David Melding: Yn wir. Cymeradwyaf waith Busnes yn y Gymuned ac yn arbennig ei fforwm sgiliau busnes gwyrdd. Mae Busnes yn y Gymuned wedi cynnal dadansoddiad gwych o nifer y swyddi gwyrdd y gellid eu creu ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae wedi amcangyfrif mwy na 3,000 drwy gynllun Arbed a chynlluniau eraill—ac mae'n rhaid imi ddweud bod 'Arbed' fel petai'n mynnu llafariad arall, ond ni ddarparaf un y prynhawn yma. Ar hyn o bryd, fel yr oedd yn gallu ei nodi, mae'r diffyg gweithlu medrus lleol yn golygu bod swyddi'n mynd y tu allan i'r cymunedau hyn, er bod y rhaglenni cyhoeddus hyn yn cael eu cyflawni a'u bod eu hunain yn fuddiol ar sail amgylcheddol.

be reaping a double benefit if the local workforce were able to carry out more of these activities.

I commend the recently published analysis of the Heads of the Valleys that has been produced by the forum, and I hope that the Minister for environment will speak to the Deputy Minister for science, Lesley Griffiths, who I am pleased to say is here this afternoon, because I think that there is a skills issue here. They have identified more than 30 skillsets that are required to deliver the various schemes that are now public policy. The biggest one, which would contribute 12.5 per cent of those 3,000 jobs, would be to develop skills in solid wall technologies. We all know that many homes in Wales were built before the 1930s and in a fashion that means that they are quite difficult to insulate. We could develop a market for ourselves. We could have a local labour force for the firms that win these contracts, and we could then be exporting these skills. The firms, many of which might be local small and medium-sized enterprises, could be doing work in other parts of Britain or all around Europe, as modernising older housing stock is a common problem.

I hope that WAG can work with Business in the Community to ensure that a properly trained workforce is available locally. We must be ready with that trained workforce. Then, when the firms come in, they can deliver using that pool of local labour. At the moment, training the workforce is not usually a part of the contracts that are given, and therefore trained workers from other parts of the UK are brought in. There is a job of work to be done between the Welsh Assembly Government and the further education sector in particular.

4.50 p.m.

I will briefly mention two other subjects of great concern and interest to me. They are both a challenge but could also leave a positive legacy. The Deputy Presiding Officer and I share one outstanding characteristic, and that is that, in the past year or so, we have got on our bikes. I, for one, am enjoying it very much and I am also walking much more. In fact, my own personal bay window here seems to be reducing slightly as a result of my efforts.

Fodd bynnag, gallem fod yn elwa ddwywaith petai'r gweithlu lleol yn gallu cyflawni mwy o'r gweithgareddau hyn.

Cymeradwyaf y dadansoddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar o Flaenau'r Cymoedd sydd wedi'i gynhyrchu gan y fforwm, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn siarad â'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Lesley Griffiths, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud ei bod yma'r prynhawn yma, oherwydd rwy'n credu bod mater sgiliau yma. Maent wedi nodi mwy na 30 o setiau sgiliau sy'n ofynnol i gyflawni'r cynlluniau amrywiol sydd bellach yn bolisi cyhoeddus. Yr un fwyaf, a fyddai'n cyfrannu 12.5 y cant o'r 3,000 o swyddi hynny, fyddai datblygu sgiliau mewn technolegau wal solet. Gwyddom oll fod llawer o gartrefi yng Nghymru wedi'u hadeiladu cyn y 1930au ac mewn modd sy'n golygu eu bod yn eithaf anodd eu hinsiwleiddio. Gallem ddatblygu marchnad i ni'n hunain. Gallem gael llafurlu lleol i'r cwmnïau sy'n ennill y contractau hyn, a gallem wedyn fod yn allforio'r sgiliau hyn. Gallai'r cwmnïau, a llawer ohonynt efallai'n fusnesau bach a chanolig lleol, fod yn gwneud gwaith mewn rhannau eraill o Brydain neu ledled Ewrop, gan fod moderneiddio stoc dai hŷn yn broblem gyffredin.

Gobeithiaf y gall LICC weithio gyda Busnes yn y Gymuned i sicrhau bod gweithlu wedi'i hyfforddi'n briodol ar gael yn lleol. Rhaid inni fod yn barod gyda'r gweithlu hyfforddedig hwnnw. Wedyn, pan ddaw'r cwmnïau i mewn, gallant gyflawni gan ddefnyddio'r gronfa honno o lafur lleol. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw hyfforddi'r gweithlu fel arfer yn rhan o'r contractau a roir, ac felly mae gweithwyr hyfforddedig o rannau eraill o'r DU yn dod i mewn. Mae swydd o waith i'w gwneud rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r sector addysg bellach yn arbennig.

Soniaf yn fras am ddau bwnc arall sy'n peri gofid mawr ac sydd o ddiddordeb mawr i mi. Mae'r ddau'n her ond gallent hefyd adael etifeddiaeth gadarnhaol. Mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd a minnau'n rhannu un nodwedd eithriadol sef y buom, yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ar gefn ein beiciau. Rwyf fi fy hun yn ei fwynhau'n fawr iawn ac rwyf hefyd yn cerdded llawer mwy. Mewn gwirionedd, mae fy ffenestr gron bersonol fy hun yma fel petai'n lleihau ychydig o ganlyniad i'm

Eleanor Burnham: Not from here, it is not. [*Laughter.*]

David Melding: That was a withering remark from behind me, but a side-on view is probably better, Eleanor. [*Laughter.*]

Cycling and walking have to be a part of new urban design and also retrofitting. The Pont y Werin bridge, which I use a couple of times a week, has transformed the habits of many people who live in Penarth, or indeed those in Cardiff who want to come to Penarth, as they can now walk there. It is well used, as is the path that it connects to, which goes along the Taff. That is what we need to be doing, because people naturally want to take exercise, but often the physical facilities are not there for them to do so.

Finally, I was encouraged to hear that the Government is committed to increasing the level of woodland, particularly broadleaved woodland, for which Wales used to be renowned. There are still many wonderful broadleaved woodlands in Wales, but increasing their number would be a great gift to future generations. We may be leaving them an unfortunate legacy in respect of carbon emissions, but one thing that we could get right for our grandchildren and great grandchildren is to have more broadleaved woodlands in Wales.

Leanne Wood: Climate change politics has faced a number of challenges in recent times. There was deep disappointment following the failure of world leaders to reach a binding agreement on emissions-reduction targets in Copenhagen at the end of the year, and the negative publicity surrounding the scientists' evidence at the University of East Anglia, criticisms which later transpired to be unfounded and driven by financial interests. All have contributed to an increase in climate change scepticism.

These political developments require us all to stay strong and determined to continue with the cross-party consensus that has been built in the Assembly. That consensus delivered unanimous support for a reduction of 40 per cent in emissions by 2020, as was agreed by us all prior to the Copenhagen climate change summit. That consensus has meant cross-

hymdrechion.

Eleanor Burnham: Nid oddi yma, dyw e ddim. [*Chwerthin.*]

David Melding: Roedd hwnnw'n sylw llym o'r tu ôl imi, ond mae'n siŵr bod golwg o'r ochr yn well, Eleanor. [*Chwerthin.*]

Rhaid i feicio a cherdded fod yn rhan o ddylunio trefol newydd a hefyd ôl-ffitio. Mae Pont y Werin, a ddefnyddiaf ddwywaith yr wythnos, wedi trawsnewid arferion llawer o bobl sy'n byw ym Mhenarth, neu'n wir y rheini yng Nghaerdydd sydd am ddod i Benarth, am eu bod bellach yn gallu cerdded yno. Mae'n cael ei defnyddio'n helaeth, fel y mae'r llwybr y mae'n cysylltu ag ef, sy'n mynd ar hyd Afon Taf. Dyna y mae angen inni fod yn ei wneud, gan fod pobl yn naturiol am ymarfer, ond yn aml nid yw'r cyfleusterau ffisegol ar gael iddynt wneud hynny.

Yn olaf, roedd yn galonogol gennyf glywed bod y Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i gynyddu lefel y coetir, yn enwedig coetir llydanddail, yr oedd Cymru'n arfer bod yn enwog amdano. Mae llawer o goetiroedd llydanddail bendigedig i'w cael o hyd yng Nghymru, ond byddai cynyddu eu nifer yn rhodd fawr i genedlaethau'r dyfodol. Hwyrach ein bod yn gadael iddynt gymynrodd anffodus o ran allyriadau carbon, ond un peth y gallem ei wneud yn iawn i'n hwyrion a'n hwyresau a'n gorwyrion a'n gorwyrresau yw cael mwy o goetiroedd llydanddail yng Nghymru.

Leanne Wood: Mae gwleidyddiaeth newid hinsawdd wedi wynebu nifer o heriau yn ddiweddar. Roedd siom dwfn ar ôl i'r arweinwyr byd fethu â dod i gytundeb rhwymol ar dargedau lleihau allyriadau yn Copenhagen ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn, a'r cyhoeddusrwydd negyddol ynghylch tystiolaeth y gwyddonwyr ym Mhrifysgol East Anglia, y profwyd wedyn eu bod yn ddi-sail ac wedi'u sbarduno gan fuddiannau ariannol. Mae hyn oll wedi cyfrannu at fwy o amheuaeth ynghylch y newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Mae'r datblygiadau gwleidyddol hyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni i gyd aros yn gryf ac yn benderfynol o barhau â'r cydsyniad trawsbleidiol a adeiladwyd yn y Cynulliad. Cyflawnodd y cydsyniad hwnnw gefnogaeth unfrydol i gwtogi 40 y cant ar allyriadau erbyn 2020, fel y cytunwyd gennym oll cyn uwchgyhadledd newid hinsawdd

party support for the Plaid Cymru manifesto commitment and 'One Wales' target on the aim to reduce emissions by 3 per cent per annum in areas of devolved competence from 2011.

However, that 3 per cent target was agreed in 2007, when scientific advice did not recognise that far greater reductions would be needed if catastrophic climate change is to be avoided. The Tyndall Centre for Climate Change Research in Manchester has since stated that annual cuts of around 9 per cent are now needed.

Given that we know that a 3 per cent cut will not be enough, I am concerned that it appears in the strategy, if the opposition parties are right, as though less than 1 per cent of the annual 3 per cent reductions will be attributed to specific Welsh Assembly Government actions. That means that we will be heavily dependent on the actions of the European Union and, more worryingly, the UK Government, which could change its policies at any time and which has no way of being held to account by the Assembly.

The Stern review told us that we have a rapidly closing window of opportunity to avoid the most devastating impacts of climate change. We also know that the impacts of climate change are not evenly distributed, as it is the poorest people in the poorest countries who will suffer earliest and most. It will be the poorest people in Wales who suffer most and first, too. However, by the time that suffering sets in, it will be far too late to reverse the process. There really is a need for us to up our game, and fast.

On the national policy statement consultation events, which have recently been announced, for those who do not know, the national policy statements will be used by whatever body comes into being following the Infrastructure Planning Commission when the UK Government makes decisions about major energy infrastructure projects. Does it not say it all that no national energy policy statement consultation events will take place in Wales, despite the fact that these statements will determine the fate of major energy projects, such as the incinerator that is planned for Merthyr, the Wylfa nuclear power station, large windfarms, and any

Copenhagen. Mae'r cydsyniad hwnnw wedi golygu cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i ymrwymiad maniffesto Plaid Cymru a tharged 'Cymru'n Un' ar y nod i gwtogi 3 y cant y flwyddyn ar allyriadau mewn meysydd o gymhwysedd datganoledig o 2011.

Fodd bynnag, cytunwyd ar y targed hwnnw o 3 y cant yn 2007, pan nad oedd cyngor gwyddonol yn sylweddoli y byddai angen gostyngiadau llawer mwy er mwyn osgoi newid trychinebus yn yr hinsawdd. Mae Canolfan Tyndall ar gyfer Ymchwil i Newid yn yr Hinsawdd ym Manceinion wedi datgan ers hynny fod angen torri tua 9 y cant erbyn hyn.

O ystyried ein bod yn gwybod na fydd torri 3 y cant yn ddigon, rwy'n poeni ei bod yn ymddangos yn y strategaeth, os yw'r gwrthbleidiau'n iawn, y bydd llai nag 1 y cant o'r gostyngiadau 3 y cant blyneddol yn cael eu priodoli i gamau penodol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae hynny'n golygu y byddwn yn dibynnu'n drwm ar gamau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac, yn waeth byth, Llywodraeth y DU, a allai newid ei pholisïau ar unrhyw adeg ac sydd heb ffordd o gael ei dal yn atebol i'r Cynulliad.

Dywedodd adolygiad Stern wrthym fod gennym fwch o gyfle sy'n prysur gulhau i osgoi effeithiau mwyaf trychinebus y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Gwyddom hefyd nad yw effeithiau newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi'u dosbarthu'n gyfartal, oherwydd y bobl dlotaf yn y gwledydd tlotaf a fydd yn dioddef yn gynharach ac yn fwyaf. Y bobl dlotaf yng Nghymru fydd yn dioddef fwyaf a chyntaf, hefyd. Fodd bynnag, erbyn i'r dioddef hwnnw ddechrau, bydd yn llawer rhy hwyr gwrthdroi'r broses. Mae gwir angen inni wneud mwy, a hynny ar frys.

Ar ddigwyddiadau ymgynghori'r datganiad polisi cenedlaethol, a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, i'r rheini nad ydynt yn gwybod, bydd y datganiadau polisi cenedlaethol yn cael eu defnyddio gan ba gorff bynnag sy'n cael ei greu ar ôl y Comisiwn Cynllunio Seilwaith pan fydd Llywodraeth y DU yn gwneud penderfyniadau am brif brosiectau seilwaith ynni. Onid yw'n dweud o gwbl na fydd dim digwyddiadau ymgynghori datganiad polisi ynni cenedlaethol yn digwydd yng Nghymru, er bydd y datganiadau hyn yn pennu tynged prosiectau ynni pwysig, fel y llosgydd sydd ar y gweill i Ferthyr, gorsaf pŵer niwclear Wylfa,

future coal or gas-fired power stations? Wales should have more than a major say in determining these infrastructure projects in order that our climate change policies are not undermined by decisions taken by the UK Government at Westminster. I therefore urge the Minister to redouble her efforts yet again to press the case for the Assembly to acquire powers over energy-generating projects greater than 50 MW. Without those powers, cutting our greenhouse gas emissions will be an even bigger challenge than it is already.

Three and a half years have been spent developing this strategy, and it represents a start, but it is only a start, and we cannot afford to waste any more time. The scale is huge and the market has failed. I agree with Brian Gibbons on that. However, action needs to be implemented and progress needs to be measured. That work must start now.

Nick Ramsay: I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in this important debate on the increasingly important subject of climate change. I start by concurring with the opening remarks of my colleague, Angela Burns. She said that, in many respects, the Minister's heart is in the right place on this issue and what she has set out to achieve. Having said that, we have concerns about large aspects of this. To follow on from David Melding's comments regarding positive aspects, I also welcome the approach to broadleaved woodland in the strategy. If that is implemented, it will make a real contribution to improving the Welsh environment for the future. However, there is a lot in the strategy that, as our motion indicates, we cannot support, and we do not agree with the Government's amendment 1 and what lies behind it.

The strategy is full of targets and, instead of a 3 per cent cut in emissions by 2011, it reveals that less than a third of that will be delivered by the Assembly Government and even that not until 2020. When I consider what people were expecting from this strategy and when I drill down to the detail of it, I fear that there will be great disappointment. The Assembly Government, let us remember, promised us

'Urgent and sustained action to cut

ffermydd gwynt mawr, ac unrhyw orsafoedd pŵer yn y dyfodol sy'n cael eu tanio gan lo neu nwy? Dylai Cymru gael dweud ei dweud yn iawn wrth bennu'r prosiectau seilwaith hyn er mwyn sicrhau nad yw ein polisiau newid hinsawdd yn cael eu tanseilio gan benderfyniadau a wneir gan Lywodraeth y DU yn San Steffan. Rwy'n cymhell y Gweinidog felly i ailddyblu ei hymdrechion unwaith eto i bwysu'r achos i'r Cynulliad gaffael pwerau dros brosiectau cynhyrchu ynni dros 50 MW. Heb y pwerau hynny, bydd torri ein hallyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr yn fwy byth o her.

Treuliwyd tair blynedd a hanner yn datblygu'r strategaeth hon, ac mae'n ddechreuad, ond dim ond dechreuad, ac ni allwn fforddio gwastraffu mwy o amser o gwbl. Mae'r raddfa'n enfawr ac mae'r farchnad wedi methu. Cytunaf â Brian Gibbons ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cymryd camau ac mae angen mesur cynnydd. Mae'n rhaid i'r gwaith hwnnw ddechrau yn awr.

Nick Ramsay: Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl bwysig hon am bwnc mwyfwy pwysig y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Dechreuaf drwy gytuno â sylwadau agoriadol fy nghyd-weinidog, Angela Burns. Dywedodd hi fod calon y Gweinidog, mewn llawer o ffyrdd, yn y lle iawn ar y mater hwn a'r hyn yr aeth ati i'w gyflawni. Wedi dweud hynny, mae gennym bryderon am agweddau mawr ar hyn. I ddilyn sylwadau David Melding ynghylch agweddau cadarnhaol, rwyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ymagwedd at goetir llydandail yn y strategaeth. Os gweithredir hynny, bydd yn cyfrannu'n wirioneddol at wella amgylchedd Cymru at y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer yn y strategaeth nad allwn ei gefnogi, fel y mae ein cynnig yn ei nodi, ac nid ydym yn cytuno â gwelliant 1 y Llywodraeth a'r hyn sy'n sail iddo.

Mae'r strategaeth yn llawn targedau ac, yn lle cwtogi 3 y cant ar allyriadau erbyn 2011, mae'n datgelu y bydd llai na thraean o hynny'n cael ei gyflawni gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a hynny nid tan 2020 hyd yn oed. Pan ystyriaf yr hyn yr oedd pobl yn ei ddisgwyl gan y strategaeth hon a phan af at wraidd y peth, ofnaf y bydd siom mawr. Gadewch inni gofio fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi addo inni

'Gweithredu brys a pharhaus i dorri

emissions’.

However, I fear that the reality is that this strategy document has too many woolly ideas. It takes a woolly approach to this issue, and is full of watered-down targets and—although I do not like to say it—wishful thinking. That is a shame, because the sentiments behind the original strategy were good.

There is a distinct lack of detail in the strategy. My colleague, Darren, came under attack for talking about a lack of ambition, but I also feel that there is a lack of ambition and that more could have been set out here. If we are not ambitious for our environment, we will not be ambitious for future generations or for the future of Wales. It is quite reasonable, therefore, to call for further ambition. As has happened too often, concrete targets for 2020 have been replaced or have subsided and given way to vague aspirations.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will you take an intervention?

Nick Ramsay: In a moment, Brian. The strategy says that, by 2020, the Welsh Assembly Government expects to see more people walking and cycling, car-sharing and using public transport. I am delighted that David Melding and the Deputy Presiding Officer are pursuing that already, but no figures have been quoted and no proposals included in the strategy to tell us how these noble sentiments are to be achieved.

Brian Gibbons: To be clear, is it your position and that of your party that you will tie yourselves to a more ambitious set of targets than the 3 per cent target that the Minister has set? Can you outline how you will deliver that—without a catastrophic reduction in GDP, not least because Wales is one of the most carbon-intensive countries in the world? The price of your policy would be severe economic retraction in Wales. If you cannot give us that outline, you must adopt a different strategy.

5.00 p.m.

Nick Ramsay: Well done, Brian; your intervention succeeded in being longer than my speech so far. We are not ashamed to be embarrassed for Wales on this issue, as your Government seems to be. As for talking

allyriadau’.

Fodd bynnag, ofnaf mai’r gwirionedd yw bod gan y ddogfen strategaeth hon ormod o syniadau aneglur. Mae’n cymryd ymagwedd aneglur at y mater hwn, ac mae’n llawn targedau wedi’u gwanelu acer nad wyf yn hoffi ei ddweud-gobeithion ofer. Mae hynny’n drueni, oherwydd roedd y teimladau a oedd yn sail i’r strategaeth wreiddiol yn rhai da.

Mae prinder manylder arbennig yn y strategaeth. Ymosodwyd ar fy nghydweiniad, Darren, am siarad am ddiffyg uchelgais, ond rwyf innau hefyd yn teimlo bod diffyg uchelgais ac y gellid fod wedi nodi mwy yma. Os nad ydym yn uchelgeisiol i’n hamgylchedd, ni fyddwn yn uchelgeisiol i genedlaethau’r dyfodol nac i ddyfodol Cymru. Mae’n eithaf rhesymol, felly, galw am fwy o uchelgais. Fel sydd wedi digwydd yn rhy aml, mae targedau cadarn ar gyfer 2020 wedi’u disodli neu wedi cilio ac ildio i ddyheadau amwys.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch chi gymryd ymyriad?

Nick Ramsay: Ymhen munud, Brian. Yn ôl y strategaeth, erbyn 2020, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’n disgwyl gweld mwy o bobl yn cerdded ac yn beicio, yn rhannu ceir ac yn defnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus. Rwyf wrth fy modd fod David Melding a’r Dirprwy Lywydd eisoes yn mynd ar drywydd hynny, ond ni ddyfynnwyd unrhyw ffigurau ac ni chynhwyswyd unrhyw gynigion yn y strategaethau i ddweud wrthym sut mae’r bwriadau nobl hyn am gael eu cyflawni.

Brian Gibbons: I fod yn glir, ai ydych chi a’ch plaid yn dweud y byddwch yn clymu eich hunain wrth set fwy uchelgeisiol o dargedau na’r targed o 3 y cant y mae’r Gweinidog wedi’i osod? A allwch chi amlinellu sut byddwch yn cyflawni hynny heb ostyngiad trychinebus mewn CMC, nid lleiaf am mai Cymru yw un o’r gwledydd mwyaf dwys yn y byd o ran carbon? Pris eich polisi fyddai gwrthdynnu economaidd difrifol yng Nghymru. Os na allwch roi’r amlinelliad hwnnw, mae’n rhaid ichi fabwysiadu gwahanol strategaeth.

Nick Ramsay: Da iawn, Brian; llwyddodd eich ymyriad i fod yn hirach na’m haraith i hyd yn hyn. Nid oes arnom gywilydd am fod ag embaras i Gymru ar y mater hwn, fel yr ymddengys eich Llywodraeth chi. O ran

about a catastrophic decline in GDP, you only have to look at the economic legacy that your party has left for this country after 13 years in power to understand why this side of the Chamber will not take any lectures on how to be ambitious for Wales. The 3 per cent target for annual carbon reductions in areas of devolved competence has been watered down; that is the reality, and the Assembly Government has taken a back seat in delivering its own policy. A section of the strategy talks about wider sectoral contributions from business, local government and the public and third sectors; all of these need to be involved. I accept that there are areas in which the Assembly Government may not have the devolved competence to act; whether you like it or not, that is an issue, and we recognise it as such.

I believe that this strategy represents an abdication of responsibility in tackling climate change. I am sorry to say that, Brian, because I know that there were good intentions at the start of the process. However, we have been left with a strategy that has been watered down and is not ambitious enough. We will not be the ones who have to face the consequences of the issues that are not tackled; they will be faced by our children. That is why we have tabled today's motion. We would like to see much stronger action from the Assembly Government on this issue.

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I have been surprised by the tone of this debate. I have kept the Assembly fully informed of developments after every meeting of the Climate Change Commission for Wales. All parties have been able to nominate members to sit on the commission, and not one party has disassociated itself and its nominated members from the direction of this strategy. When I have reported to the Assembly after every meeting of the commission, not one party has disassociated itself from the issue of how and why we defined the target in the way that we did. Since the Climate Change Commission for Wales has been in place, every single meeting has been followed up with written and oral statements on taking the agenda

siarad am ostyngiad trychinebus mewn CMC, nid oes rhaid ichi ond edrych ar yr etifeddiaeth economaidd a adawodd eich plaid chi i'r wlad ar ôl 13 mlynedd mewn grym i ddeall pam na fydd yr ochr hon o'r Siambr yn derbyn unrhyw ddarlithoedd ynghylch sut i fod yn uchelgeisiol i Gymru. Mae'r targed 3 y cant ar gyfer gostyngiadau carbon blynyddol mewn meysydd o gymhwysedd datganoledig wedi'i wanedu; dyna'r gwir, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi trosglwyddo'r prif gyfrifoldeb am gyflawni ei pholisi ei hun. Mae rhan o'r strategaeth yn sôn am gyfraniadau sectoraidd ehangach gan fusnes, llywodraeth leol a'r sector cyhoeddus a'r trydydd sector; mae angen cynnwys y rhain i gyd. Derbyniaf fod meysydd lle nad oes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y cymhwysedd datganoledig i weithredu efallai; ni waeth a ydych chi'n ei hoffi, mae hynny'n broblem, ac rydym yn ei chydabod yn broblem.

Credaf fod y strategaeth hon yn ildio'r cyfrifoldeb am fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud hynny, Brian, achos rwy'n gwybod bod bwriadau da ar ddechrau'r broses. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym bellach strategaeth sydd wedi'i gwanedu ac nad yw'n ddigon uchelgeisiol. Nid ninnau fydd y rhai sy'n gorfod wynebu canlyniadau'r materion nad eir i'r afael â hwy; ein plant fydd yn eu hwynebu. Dyna pam rydym wedi cyflwyno cynnig heddiw. Hoffem weld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithredu'n llawer cryfach ar y mater hwn.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Mae naws y ddatl hon wedi'm synnu. Rwyf wedi rhoi gwybod yn llawn i'r Cynulliad am ddatblygiadau ar ôl pob cyfarfod gan Gomisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd. Bu pob plaid yn gallu enwebu aelodau i eistedd ar y comisiwn, ac nid oes un blaid wedi datgysylltu ei hun a'i haelodau enwebedig oddi wrth gyfeiriad y strategaeth hon. Pan wyf wedi adrodd i'r Cynulliad ar ôl pob un o gyfarfodydd y comisiwn, nid oes un blaid wedi datgysylltu ei hun oddi wrth y ffordd a'r rheswm y gwnaethom ddiffinio'r targed fel y gwnaethom. Ers i Gomisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd fod ar waith, mae pob un cyfarfod wedi'i ddilyn â datganiadau ysgrifenedig a llafar ar fynd â'r agenda yn ei flaen.

forward.

The specific issue that I wish to explore further is the definition of the target. This was supported by last year's consultation on the strategy, and was straightforward in terms of identifying the emissions that fall within the target. All direct greenhouse gas emissions in Wales, except those from heavy industry and the power generation industry, which are broadly defined as installations covered by the EU emissions trading scheme, are included in the definition. Members who suggested that heavy industry and the power generation industry are not accountable in any way should be aware that they are accountable under a specific trading scheme. Their financial contribution is recorded, as is their carbon reduction. We recognise the importance of reducing electricity consumption to reduce emissions, so we included emissions from large power plants by assigning them to the end user of the electricity—a move that was supported by all members of the commission.

We tried to identify what share of emissions was covered by devolved functions; to some extent, we addressed this yesterday. 'One Wales' contains a commitment that we would aim to achieve annual carbon reduction-equivalent emission reduction of 3 per cent per annum by 2011 in areas of devolved competence, and that we would set out specific sectoral targets for emissions from residential, public and transport sources. We also stated that we would work with heavy industry and the power generation industries to reduce emissions in those sectors. We are carrying out all of those aspirations. We tried to identify what share of emissions was covered by devolved functions; at the beginning of the process in 2007, we were operating in an area for which there was no data. For political purposes, people had put a target together in their manifestos for the election, which is absolutely fine, but we as a Government have a responsibility to turn political targets into data quantification. How would you decide, for example, what share of transport emissions related to UK Government interventions, such as fiscal measures, and what proportion related to Assembly Government functions on infrastructure development or land-use planning? Statistically, it is not possible.

Y mater penodol yr hoffwn ei archwilio ymhellach yw'r diffiniad o'r targed. Cefnogwyd hwn gan ymgynghoriad y llynedd ar y strategaeth, ac roedd yn syml o ran nodi'r allyriadau sy'n perthyn i'r targed hwnnw. Mae'r holl allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr uniongyrchol yng Nghymru, ar wahân i'r rheini o ddiwydiant trwm a'r diwydiant cynhyrchu pŵer, sy'n cael eu diffinio'n fras fel gosodiadau a gaiff eu cynnwys yng nghynllun masnachu allyriadau'r UE, yn cael eu cynnwys yn y diffiniad. Dylai'r Aelodau a awgrymodd nad yw diwydiant trwm a'r diwydiant cynhyrchu pŵer yn atebol mewn unrhyw ffordd wybod eu bod yn atebol o dan gynllun masnachu penodol. Mae eu cyfraniad ariannol yn cael ei gofnodi, a'u gostyngiad carbon. Rydym yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw defnyddio llai o drydan er mwyn lleihau allyriadau, felly rydym wedi cynnwys allyriadau o weithfeydd pŵer mawr trwy eu neilltuo i ddefnyddiwr y trydan yn y pen draw—cam a gefnogwyd gan holl aelodau'r comisiwn.

Ceisiaisom nodi pa gyfran o allyriadau a oedd yn cael ei chynnwys gan swyddogaethau datganoledig; i ryw raddau, aethom i'r afael â hyn ddoe. Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn cynnwys ymrwymiad y byddem yn anelu at gyflawni gostyngiad blynyddol o allyriadau sy'n cyfateb i ostwng carbon o 3 y cant y flwyddyn erbyn 2011 mewn meysydd o gymhwysedd datganoledig, ac y byddem yn gosod targedau sectoraidd penodol ar gyfer allyriadau o ffynonellau preswyl, cyhoeddus a chlodiant. Dywedasom hefyd y byddem yn gweithio gyda diwydiant trwm a'r diwydiannau cynhyrchu pŵer i leihau allyriadau yn y sectorau hynny. Rydym yn cyflawni'r holl ddyheadau hynny. Ceisiaisom nodi pa gyfran o allyriadau a oedd yn cael eu cynnwys gan swyddogaethau datganoledig; ar ddechrau'r broses yn 2007, roeddem yn gweithredu mewn maes lle nad oedd unrhyw ddata. At ddibenion gwleidyddol, roedd pobl wedi llunio targed yn eu manifestos ar gyfer yr etholiad, a oedd yn berffaith iawn, ond rydym ni fel Llywodraeth yn gyfrifol am droi targedau gwleidyddol yn fesuriadau data. Sut byddech chi'n penderfynu, er enghraifft, pa gyfran o allyriadau cludiant sy'n berthnasol i ymyriadau Llywodraeth y DU, fel mesurau ariannol, a pha gyfran sy'n berthnasol i swyddogaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar

Recognising that it would be clearer and more transparent to cover all emissions in a sector, rather than just the devolved emissions, meant that our strategy needed to provide the full picture of Assembly Government and UK Government action, as well as the action taken by other people, communities and organisations across Wales. In fact, when Nick Ramsay said that we do not have the levers in some areas, he was absolutely right: you cannot exercise levers that you do not have.

However, you can be ambitious on behalf of the people of Wales, which is why having an all-sector, all-party commission—which the two opposition parties now appear to be rowing back from—is a way of ensuring support in taking this agenda forward. This climate change strategy—

Angela Burns: Will you take an intervention?

Jane Davidson: You will get your chance to respond in a moment.

This climate change strategy was supported by commission members in the hope that the consensus would remain in this Assembly. Commission members have endorsed the fact that this is the most ambitious climate change strategy in the world. It is the most ambitious in the world because we are not looking at offsetting any of our emission reductions. The strategy confirms our level of ambition, and the detailed definition of a target. Many Members referred to the strategy as not being specific, but either they are just reading notes prepared by their central office, or they have not looked at the delivery plans, which are specific, and lay out specific actions being taken forward by the Assembly Government. A number of you referred to walking and cycling without one of you referring to the fact that there is an extant walking and cycling action plan, with targets for delivery against which the Assembly Government will be measured.

We are focusing on a range of areas. David Melding mentioned Arbed, and that has been the most successful programme in Assembly Government history in engaging with Welsh

ddatblygu seilwaith neu gynllunio defnydd tir? Yn ystadegol, mae'n amhosibl. Roedd cydnabod y byddai'n gliriach ac yn fwy tryloyw cynnwys pob allyriad mewn sector, yn hytrach na'r allyriadau datganoledig yn unig, yn golygu bod angen i'n strategaeth ddarparu'r darlun llawn o weithredu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y DU, yn ogystal â'r camau a gymerir gan bobl, cymunedau a sefydliadau eraill ledled Cymru. Mewn gwirionedd, pan ddywedodd Nick Ramsay nad oes gennym y dulliau cyflawni mewn rhai meysydd, roedd yn llygad ei le: ni allwch chi arfer dulliau nad ydynt gennych.

Fodd bynnag, gallwch fod yn uchelgeisiol ar ran pobl Cymru, a dyna pam mae cael comisiwn hollbleidiol, holl-sector—y mae'r ddwy wrthblaid bellach fel petaent yn cilio rhagddo—yn ffordd o sicrhau cefnogaeth i fynd â'r agenda hwn yn ei flaen. Cefnogwyd y strategaeth hon ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd—

Angela Burns: A wnewch chi gymryd ymyriad?

Jane Davidson: Cewch eich cyfle i ymateb mewn munud.

Cefnogwyd y strategaeth hon ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd gan aelodau'r comisiwn yn y gobaith y byddai'r cydsynio'n parhau yn y Cynulliad. Mae aelodau'r Comisiwn wedi cadarnhau'r ffaith mai hon yw'r strategaeth fwyaf uchelgeisiol yn y byd ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Hon yw'r mwyaf uchelgeisiol yn y byd am nad ydym yn edrych ar wneud iawn am unrhyw rai o'n gostyngiadau allyriadau. Mae'r strategaeth yn cadarnhau graddau ein huchelgais, a'r diffiniad manwl o darged. Cyfeiriodd llawer o Aelodau at y strategaeth yn un amhenodol, ond maent naill ai'n darllen nodiadau a baratowyd gan eu swyddfa ganolog, neu nid ydynt wedi edrych ar y cynlluniau cyflawni, sy'n benodol, ac sy'n nodi camau penodol sy'n cael eu cymryd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Cyfeiriodd nifer ohonoch at gerdded a beicio heb fod un ohonoch wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith bod cynllun gweithredu cerdded a beicio yn bod, gyda thargedau cyflawni y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cael ei mesur mewn perthynas â hwy.

Rydym yn canolbwyntio ar amryw feysydd. Soniodd David Melding am Arbed, a honno fu'r rhaglen fwyaf llwyddiannus yn hanes Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran ymgysylltu â

firms—at some point in the supply chain for every single one of the Arbed projects there is a Welsh firm. Therefore, I would hope that you would see that this Government has unequivocally delivered on a programme that is energy-efficient, contributes towards social justice and brings down emissions in a way that supports local investment.

We have soundly based the delivery plans on evidence. We have taken realistic assumptions about available funding and robust figures for emission reduction to underpin the analysis. I believe that the Assembly and the people of Wales are far better served by a policy based on sound evidence and robust cost-effectiveness assessment, and I would rather take a cautionary approach to assessing likely emission reductions, and strive to do better, than do what the opposition appears to want—to make overgenerous assumptions and statements that prove to be absolutely undeliverable. We are putting in place a governance framework to oversee the delivery of the strategy and the plans, which will include the independent support and challenge of the Climate Change Commission for Wales and the UK Committee on Climate Change. I would suggest that, if Members want to be involved in that commission as their party nominee, they can do so, but you would expect a close relationship between the party and their nominee in the way that this agenda is taken forward.

5.10 p.m.

Given that the climate change strategy contains clear targets, and that work on output measures is under way, you will not be surprised that we cannot support the amendment from Peter Black. We will be presenting initial work on the framework to the Climate Change Commission for Wales at its meeting in December. We are developing this work with the commission, not just to reflect the approach that we have taken all the way through on this strategy, which has been to work with organisations from the Confederation of British Industry to the Federation of Small Businesses, environmental organisations, the public sector and others, but also to link our progress reporting with the independent assessment that the commission will produce.

chwmniau Cymru—ar ryw adeg yn y gadwyn gyflenwi i bob un o brosiectau Arbed, mae cwmni o Gymru. Felly, byddwn yn gobeithio y byddech chi'n gweld bod y Llywodraeth hon wedi cyflawni'n glir ar raglen sy'n defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon, sy'n cyfrannu tuag at gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac sy'n gostwng allyriadau mewn modd sy'n cefnogi buddsoddiad lleol.

Rydym wedi seilio'r cynlluniau cyflawni'n gadarn ar dystiolaeth. Rydym wedi cymryd tybiaethau realistig am y cyllid sydd ar gael a ffigurau cadarn ar gyfer lleihau allyriadau i fod yn sail i'r dadansoddiad. Credaf fod polisi sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth gadarn ac asesiad cadarn o gost effeithiolrwydd yn gwasanaethu Cynulliad a phobl Cymru'n llawer gwell, a byddai'n well gen i fod yn rhagofalus wrth asesu gostyngiadau allyriadau tebygol, ac anelu at wneud yn well, na gwneud yr hyn y mae'r wrthblaid fel petai'n dymuno—sef gwneud tybiaethau a datganiadau rhy hael sy'n profi'n amhosibl i'w cyflawni. Rydym yn gosod fframwaith llywodraethu ar waith i oruchwylio'r broses o gyflawni'r strategaeth a'r cynlluniau, a fydd yn cynnwys cymorth a her annibynnol Comisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd a Chomisiwn y DU ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd. Os oes ar Aelodau eisiau cymryd rhan yn y comisiwn hwnnw yn enwebai i'w plaid, byddwn yn awgrymu y gallant wneud hynny, ond byddech yn disgwyl perthynas agos rhwng y blaid a'i henwebai yn y ffordd y datblygir yr agenda hwn.

O ystyried bod y strategaeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn cynnwys targedau clir, a bod gwaith ar fesurau allbwn wedi dechrau, ni fyddwch chi'n synnu o glywed na allwn gefnogi'r gwelliant gan Peter Black. Byddwn yn cyflwyno gwaith cychwynnol ar y fframwaith i Gomisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd yn ei gyfarfod ym mis Rhagfyr. Rydym yn datblygu'r gwaith hwn gyda'r comisiwn, nid yn unig i adlewyrchu'r dull a ddefnyddiwyd gennym drwy gydol y strategaeth hon, sef gweithio gyda sefydliadau o Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain i'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, cymdeithasau amgylcheddol, y sector cyhoeddus ac eraill, ond hefyd i gysylltu ein hadroddiadau am gynnydd â'r asesiad annibynnol y bydd y comisiwn yn ei lunio.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you wind up, please?

Jane Davidson: Finally, Friends of the Earth, which has been quoted today, has stated that the spending review fails on green promises. I hope that you will support our amendment, which is to note the strategy and welcome the work of the climate change commission, because to do any less betrays all of those people who have given so much to the development of this agenda in Wales.

Jonathan Morgan: I start by thanking all Members who have contributed to this important debate this afternoon. I do not think that anyone can be in any doubt that Members, from all political parties, feel deeply committed to this agenda. We are committed to seeing an improvement in how we manage our environment, and an improvement in the behaviours that contribute to long-term improvements in our environment. There is also commitment here to ensuring that Wales plays its part in helping the United Kingdom and the rest of the world to achieve a sustained reduction in carbon emissions. We have, as the Minister and others have alluded to, been part of this all-party consensus on what needs to be achieved. That consensus and ambition is still very much here today. However, there are clear, legitimate concerns, not just on this side of the Chamber, as to whether or not these targets are achievable, how they will be achieved and whether the strategy is strong enough in respect of how it expects those sustained reductions in carbon emissions to be achieved.

'One Wales' sets out in a stark way that the aim is to achieve an annual carbon reduction of 3 per cent in areas of devolved competence by next year. That sets the tone and the context, and it is clear to everyone, within and outside the Assembly, that the Assembly Government was expecting itself and its agencies to deliver a sustained reduction in carbon emissions of 3 per cent by next year in those areas of devolved competence. It was not expecting the Assembly Government to have, as part of a 3 per cent target, the larger element of it delivered by other people who were not part of that devolved competence remit. Therefore, we are right to question whether this target is applicable in the way that it is written into 'One Wales'. You only

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Jane Davidson: Yn olaf, mae Cyfeillion y Ddaear, a ddyfynnwyd heddiw, wedi dweud bod yr adolygiad o wariant yn methu ar addewidion gwyrdd. Gobeithiaf y byddwch chi'n cefnogi ein gwelliant, sef nodi'r strategaeth a chroesawu gwaith y comisiwn ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd, oherwydd mae gwneud unrhyw beth yn llai yn bradychu'r holl bobl hynny sydd wedi rhoi cymaint i ddatblygu'r agenda hwn yng Nghymru.

Jonathan Morgan: Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r holl Aelodau sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddatl bwysig hon y prynhawn yma. Nid wyf yn credu y gall unrhyw un amau o gwbl nad yw'r Aelodau, o bob plaid wleidyddol, yn teimlo ymrwymiad dwfn i'r agenda hwn. Rydym wedi ymrwymo i weld gwelliant yn y modd y rheolwn ein hamgylchedd, a gwelliant yn yr ymddygiad sy'n cyfrannu at welliannau tymor hir yn ein hamgylchedd. Mae hefyd ymrwymiad yma i sicrhau bod Cymru'n chwarae ei rhan i helpu'r Deyrnas Unedig a gweddill y byd i ostwng allyriadau carbon yn barhaus. Rydym, fel y crybwyllodd y Gweinidog ac eraill, wedi bod yn rhan o'r cydsyniad hollbleidiol ar yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud. Mae'r cydsyniad a'r uchelgais hwnnw yn dal yma heddiw i raddau helaeth iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae pryderon clir, dilys, nid ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr yn unig, ynghylch a ydy'r targedau hyn yn gyraeddadwy ai peidio, sut mae eu cyflawni ac a ydy'r strategaeth yn ddigon cryf o ran sut mae'n disgwyl cyflawni'r gostyngiadau parhaus hynny mewn allyriadau carbon.

Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn nodi mewn modd noeth mai'r nod yw cwtogi 3 y cant y flwyddyn ar garbon mewn meysydd o gymhwysedd datganoledig erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hynny'n gosod y naws a'r cyddestun, ac mae'n glir i bawb, y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Cynulliad, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn disgwyl iddi'i hun a'i hasiantaethau cyflawni gostyngiad parhaus mewn allyriadau carbon o 3 y cant erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf yn y meysydd hynny o gymhwysedd datganoledig. Yn rhan o darged 3 y cant, nid oedd yn disgwyl y byddai pobl eraill nad ydynt yn rhan o'r cylch gwaith gymhwysedd datganoledig hwnnw yn cyflawni'r elfen fwyaf ohono i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly, rydyn ni'n iawn i gwestiynu

have to read the Tyndall report to see the level of concern expressed with regard to how ambitious and deliverable this agenda is on the part of the Welsh Assembly Government.

Minister, we do not doubt your commitment; we know that you are deeply committed to this agenda. Many of us have spent almost 12 years working here as Assembly Members and have witnessed you in action in a variety of legislation committees looking at legislation to improve the environment. Angela Burns alluded in her introductory remarks to the fact that you approached this issue with almost an evangelist attitude. I thought that we were getting dangerously close to seeing you canonised as ‘St Jane the Evangelist’. Thankfully—for you and everyone else—we did not get that far. The fact is that people regard you as having a deep commitment. However, it is fair to say that there are clear failings in the way in which this target can be applied. There are also failings in the strategy, because much of it is aspirational and not necessarily measurable. As Members have said, the strategy talks about more people walking, cycling, car sharing and using public transport. These are all wonderfully aspirational things in order to see a change in culture and behaviour, but there is no rigour in the system that demonstrates how this can be measured and how the target can be achieved.

It is fair to say that when we are looking to persuade people throughout Wales that there needs to be a change in culture and attitude among individuals, families and communities, we have to be conscious of the fact that there is an agenda out there today that seeks to dispute the evidence and persuade people that climate change is not the threat that we all know that it is, and persuade them that it is some grand conspiracy that is trying to lead them up the garden path. We need to show the people of Wales that the targets are realistic, achievable and measurable, and that the Assembly Government can contribute towards a sustained reduction in carbon emissions. Otherwise, the people of Wales may happily

a ydy'r targed hwn yn berthnasol yn y ffordd y mae wedi'i ysgrifennu yn 'Cymru'n Un'. Y cyfan y mae'n rhaid ichi ei wneud yw darllen adroddiad Tyndall i weld cymaint y pryderir ynghylch mor uchelgeisiol a chyraeddadwy yw'r agenda hwn ar ran Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Weinidog, nid ydym yn amau eich ymrwymiad; gwyddom eich bod wedi ymrwymo'n ddwfn i'r agenda hwn. Mae llawer ohonom wedi treulio bron i 12 mlynedd yn gweithio yma yn Aelodau Cynulliad ac wedi'ch gwyllo'n gweithredu mewn amryw bwyllgor deddfu yn edrych ar ddeddfwriaeth i wella'r amgylchedd. Crybwyllodd Angela Burns yn ei sylwadau cyflwyniadol y ffaith eich bod wedi ystyried y mater ag agwedd efengylaidd bron. Roeddwn i'n credu ein bod yn dod yn beryglus o agos at eich gweld chi'n cael eich canoneiddio'n 'Santes Jane yr Efengylwr'. Diolch byth—i chi ac i bawb arall—nid aethom mor bell â hynny. Y ffaith yw bod pobl yn ystyried bod gennych ymrwymiad dwfn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud bod diffygion clir yn y ffordd y gellir cymhwyso'r targed hwn. Mae hefyd diffygion yn y strategaeth, oherwydd mae llawer ohoni'n llawn uchelgais ac nid o anghenraid yn fesuradwy. Fel y mae Aelodau wedi'i ddweud, mae'r strategaeth yn sôn am fwy o bobl yn cerdded, beicio, rhannu ceir a defnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn bethau uchelgeisiol iawn er mwyn gweld newid mewn diwylliant ac ymddygiad, ond nid oes manwl gywirdeb yn y system sy'n dangos sut mae modd mesur hyn a sut gellir cyrraedd y targed.

Mae'n deg dweud, pan fyddwn yn edrych i berswadio pobl ledled Cymru fod angen cael newid mewn diwylliant ac agwedd ymhlith unigolion, teuluoedd a chymunedau, ei bod yn rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod agenda yno heddiw sy'n ceisio dadlau'r dystiolaeth a pherswadio pobl nad yw newid yn yr hinsawdd yn golygu'r bygythiad y gwyddom oll ei fod, a'u perswadio mai rhyw gynllwyn crand ydyw sy'n ceisio eu twyllo. Mae angen inni ddangos i bobl Cymru fod y targedau'n realistig, yn gyrraeddadwy ac yn fesuradwy, ac y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyfrannu tuag at ostyngiad parhaus mewn allyriadau carbon. Fel arall, hwyrach y bydd pobl Cymru'n fodlon credu dadl y theori cynllwyn sy'n cael ei chyflwyno gan rai y tu

go along with the conspiracy theory argument that is being put forward by some outside of the Chamber. Those fears were alluded to by Leanne Wood and Angela Burns. We have to be conscious of that, and know that our job is to persuade people of the validity of our argument.

Other Members have referred to the potential benefit in green jobs and the huge economic contribution that could be made by changing our working patterns, by investing in a properly trained workforce, as David Melding mentioned, and by getting people to see those cultural changes as an intrinsic part of their everyday lives. Yesterday, I was delighted to be part of the Sustrans Bike It celebrations, at which a school in my constituency, Ysgol Gymraeg Melin Gruffydd, won the award for its contribution to the project. That is where we need to start: we need to get younger people and children to see the benefit and the excitement of that sort of cultural change. That, Minister, is the sort of measurable change that we can see, but the way in which the document is set out and the way in which we are struggling to reach the target gives the people of Wales the impression that the Government is simply not being strong enough with regard to how this needs to be delivered.

Finally, I believe that an improvement in our environment and in our carbon reductions can go hand in hand with an improvement in our economic performance. Unlike Dr Gibbons, I do not believe that we ought to celebrate the prospect of a downturn in our economic performance because it will enable us to achieve a reduction in carbon emissions. I do not think that the people of Wales would see it in that way, and I believe that we can link good, green economic growth to good, sustainable improvements in our environment in the long term.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there are objections. Therefore, I will defer all voting on this item until voting time. The Business Committee has agreed that votes should not be taken before 5 p.m.; as it is now 5.17 p.m., I intend to move straight to the votes.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisiau.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

allan i'r Siambr. Crybwyllodd Leanne Wood ac Angela Burns yr ofnau hynny. Mae'n rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o hynny, a gwybod mai ein gwaith ni yw argyhoeddi pobl o ddilysrwydd ein dadl.

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi cyfeirio at y budd posibl mewn swyddi gwyrdd a'r cyfraniad economaidd enfawr y gellid ei wneud drwy newid ein patrymau gwaith, trwy fuddsoddi mewn gweithlu a hyfforddwyd yn briodol, fel y soniodd David Melding, a thrwy gael pobl i ystyried y newidiadau diwylliannol hynny'n rhan annatod o'u bywydau pob dydd. Ddoe, roedd yn bleser gennyf fod yn rhan o ddatliadau Sustrans Bike It, lle enillodd ysgol yn fy etholaeth i, Ysgol Gymraeg Melin Gruffydd, wobwr am ei chyfraniad at y prosiect. Dyna ble mae angen inni ddechrau: mae angen inni gael pobl ieuengach a phlant i weld budd a chyffro'r math hwnnw o newid diwylliannol. Hwnnw, Weinidog, yw'r math o newid mesuradwy y gallwn ei weld, ond mae'r ffordd y mae'r ddogfen wedi'i gosod a'r ffordd yr ydym yn trafferthu i gyrraedd y targed yn rhoi'r argraff i bobl Cymru nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn ddigon cryf o ran sut mae angen cyflawni hyn.

Yn olaf, rwy'n credu y gall gwelliant yn ein hamgylchedd ac yn ein gostyngiadau carbon fynd law yn llaw â gwelliant yn ein perfformiad economaidd. Yn wahanol i Dr Gibbons, nid wyf yn credu y dylem ddatlu posibilrwydd dirywiad yn ein perfformiad economaidd oherwydd bydd yn gyfle inni ostwng allyriadau carbon. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai pobl Cymru'n ei gweld fel hynny, a chredaf y gallwn gysylltu twf economaidd gwyrdd, da â gwelliannau cynaliadwy, da yn ein hamgylchedd yn y tymor hir.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno i'r cynnig heb welliant. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, gohiriaf yr holl bleidleisio ar yr eitem hon nes yr amser pleidleisio. Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes wedi cytuno na ddylid cymryd pleidleisiau cyn 5 pm; ac mae bellach yn 5.17 p.m., bwriadaf symud yn syth i'r pleidleisio.

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Cynnig NDM4563: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Motion NDM4563: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4563: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.
Amendment 1 to NDM4563: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4563: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 2 to NDM4563: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM4563 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

Motion NDM4563 as amended:

The National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi Strategaeth Newid yn yr Hinsawdd a Chynlluniau Cyflawni Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n amlinellu sut bydd Cymru'n cymryd camau mewn sectorau penodol fel trafnidiaeth, tai preswyl, gwastraff ac amaethyddiaeth i fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd a lleihau allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr gan 3% o flwyddyn i flwyddyn.

Notes the Welsh Assembly Government's Climate Change Strategy and Delivery Plan which sets out how Wales will take action in specific sectors, such as transport, residential housing, waste and agriculture, in its fight against climate change and achieve a 3% year on year reduction in greenhouse gas emissions.

Yn croesawu cyfraniad traws-sector a hollbleidiol y Comisiwn Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, sydd wedi gweithio ochr yn ochr â'r Llywodraeth i ddatblygu'r Strategaeth a'i chymeradwyo'n derfynol.

Welcomes the input of the cross sector, all-party Climate Change Commission which worked alongside Government to develop and give final approval to the Strategy.

*Cynnig NDM4563 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 33, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion NDM4563 as amended: For 33, Abstain 11, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.

Davies, Paul
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4563 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
 Motion NDM4563 as amended agreed.*

5.20 p.m.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Cosbau Llym yng Nghyswllt Grantiau Amaethyddol Ewropeaidd Punitive Penalties in relation to European Agricultural Grants

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i gyflwyno pwnc gerbron y Cynulliad, ac, yn arbennig, gerbron y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig. Gwn ei fod yn fater y mae ganddi gryn gydymdeimlad yn ei gylch, a'i bod yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd y mater hwn i amaethwyr. Yr wyf yn cyfeirio'n benodol at y cosbau llym a osodir ar ffermwyr am fân gangymeriadau gweinyddol a mân doriadau yn rheolau'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Mewn rhai achlysuron, mae'r cosbau eithriadol o lym hyn yn golygu eu bod yn colli'r cymhorthdal yn gyfan gwbl am flwyddyn, ac mae goblygiadau mawr i hynny o ran hyfywedd y fferm. Gall arwain hefyd at sefyllfaoedd gwirioneddol ddifrifol o ran cyllid i ffermwyr. Gwyddom hefyd ei fod wedi arwain yn y gorffennol at drasiedfau oherwydd bod y sefyllfa sy'n wynebu ffermwyr wedi peri cryn bryder iddynt, a hynny'n arwain yn ei dro at ddirywiad yn eu hiechyd a hyd yn oed at ganlyniadau mwy difrifol.

Tynnwyd fy sylw at y mater hwn gan Gareth Vaughan, llywydd Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru. Ysgrifennodd ataf yn rhinwedd fy rôl fel Cadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig yn gofyn a fyddai'r is-bwyllgor yn ystyried cynnal ymchwiliad i'r mater hwn. Cyfeiriodd yn arbennig at yr angen i edrych ar y gymhariaeth rhwng y modd y mae'r cosbau hyn yn cael eu gosod yng Nghymru a'r modd y cânt eu gosod yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Awgrymodd Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru fod y cosbau hyn yn

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am grateful for this opportunity to present a topic before the Assembly, and, in particular, before the Minister for Rural Affairs. I know that it is a subject with which she has a great deal of sympathy and that she is very aware of the importance of this matter for farmers. I am referring specifically to the kind of punitive penalties imposed on farmers for minor administrative errors and for minor breaches of the rules of the common agricultural policy. In some cases, these exceptionally punitive penalties mean that farmers lose the grant entirely for a year, which has major implications for the farm's viability. It can lead to truly grave situations as regards finance for farmers. We also know in the past that it has led to tragedies, because the situation facing the farmer has caused them great concern, leading to a decline in their health and, in turn, to even more serious outcomes.

My attention was drawn to this matter by Gareth Vaughan, president of the Farmers Union of Wales. He wrote to me as the Chair of the Rural Development Sub-committee, asking whether the sub-committee would hold an inquiry into this matter. He referred in particular to the need to look at the comparison between the way in which these penalties are imposed in Wales and the way in which they are imposed in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland. The FUW suggested that these penalties are more

llymach yma, gan gynrychioli canran uwch o'r cyfanswm na'r hyn a geir yn y gwledydd eraill.

Gofynnodd hefyd inni edrych ar gymariaethau â gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop. Nid oedd yn bosibl gwneud hynny gan nad yw'r ffigurau ar gael. Rhaid dweud hefyd nad wyf wedi llwyddo i gael unrhyw ffigurau manwl ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Felly, rhaid imi dderbyn gair y ddau undeb amaethyddol—yr FUW ac NFU Cymru—y naill a'r llall yn dweud wrthyf fod y sefyllfa'n waeth yng Nghymru nag yn y gwledydd eraill.

Fel Cadeirydd yr is-bwyllgor, ysgrifennais atoch, Weinidog, ac yr ydych wedi ymateb yn llawn i'r llythyr a rhoi gwybodaeth gynhwysfawr i ni. Bu ichi nodi yn eich ymateb fod cynnydd sylweddol yn y cosbau hyn wedi bod yn 2009, a bod y rhan helaeth o'r cosbau hyn yn ymwneud ag adnabod anifeiliaid neu wallau o ran cofnodi symudiadau anifeiliaid. A derbyn y cynnydd a gafwyd, dywedwch mai dim ond 0.6 y cant o holl werth y taliadau hyn a ataliwyd fel cosb yn 2009. Byddwn yn dadlau bod 0.6 y cant yn ffigur sylweddol.

Yn eich ateb, yr ydych yn cymharu'r sefyllfa yn 2009 â'r sefyllfa yn 2008, pan oedd cyfanswm y gosb yn £783,470.23, sydd ynddo ei hun yn swm sylweddol. Erbyn 2009, fodd bynnag, yr oedd y ffigur hwnnw dros £2 filiwn—£2,165,237.40. Mae hwnnw'n swm sylweddol, er mai dim ond 0.6 y cant o'r cyfanswm ydyw.

Fel yr oeddech yn dweud, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cosbau hyn yn ymwneud â thagiau anifeiliaid, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech, fel merch fferm, yn derbyn bod y tagiau hyn yn aml yn diflannu oherwydd bod yr anifeiliaid tu allan, sy'n arwain at sefyllfaoedd lle mae modd colli'r tagiau. Gall cosbau o ran symudiadau anifeiliaid hefyd fod yn llym iawn. Gallai un anifail mewn 1,000 fod wedi'i gofnodi'n anghywir, neu heb ei gofnodi o gwbl, a byddai hynny'n arwain at gosb weddol lym.

Mae lefel y gosb yn poeni'r undebau, ond hefyd maent yn ei chael yn anodd canfod sut yn union y penderfynir ar lefel y gosb. Maent

punitive here, representing a higher percentage of the total than in the other nations.

He also asked us to look at comparisons with other European countries. It was not possible to do that, because the figures are not available. I must also say that I have not succeeded in securing any detailed figures regarding the position in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland, so I have to accept the word of the two agricultural unions—the FUW and NFU Cymru—which both tell me that the situation is worse in Wales than in the other nations.

As Chair of the sub-committee, I wrote to you, Minister, and you responded at length to that letter, giving us comprehensive information. You noted in your response that there was a significant increase in the penalties in 2009, and that the majority of those penalties were to do with the identification of animals or errors in recording animal movements. Accepting the increase, you said that it only represented 0.6 per cent of the total value of the payments in 2009. I would argue that 0.6 per cent is a significant figure.

In your response, you compare the position in 2009 with the position in 2008, when the total in penalties was £783,470.23, which is in itself a substantial sum. In 2009, however, that figure had exceeded £2 million—£2,165,237.40. That is a significant sum, even though it was only 0.6 per cent of the total.

As you said, the majority of these penalties appertain to animal tags, and I am sure that you, as a farmer's daughter, would accept that these tags often disappear, because the animals are outdoors, which can lead to situations where the tags can be lost. Penalties for animal movements can also be punitive. One animal in 1,000 can be misrecorded or not recorded at all, and that would lead to a severe penalty.

The level of the penalty concerns the unions, but they also find it difficult to discover how that level is determined. They note that the

yn nodi bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn tueddu i fod yn fwy llym o ran sut y mae'n gweinyddu'r cosbau hyn nag y mae'r Llywodraethau yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae cwestiwn hefyd yn codi ynglŷn â sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn penderfynu a yw'r gwall sydd wedi'i gyflawni gan y ffermwr yn un bwriadol ynteu'n un sy'n codi o ddiffyg gofal. Mae'r undebau'n dweud wrthyf nad yw'r diffiniad y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei ddefnyddio o'r hyn sy'n fwriadol yn y maes arbennig hwn o gosbau yn cyfateb i'r diffiniad cyfreithiol o 'fwriadol' mewn llys barn. Byddwn yn falch iawn felly, Weinidog, pe baech yn ymateb i hynny, gan fod goblygiadau mawr i hynny o ran sut yr ydych yn penderfynu ar y gosb. Nodwyd, er enghraifft, fod yn rhaid adrodd yn ôl ar symudiadau gwartheg i wasanaeth symud gwartheg Prydain o fewn tri diwrnod calendr yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn derbyn, Weinidog, y gall hynny fod yn anodd. Saith diwrnod yw'r cyfartaledd yn Ewrop. Gwn nad eich penderfyniad chi fel Gweinidog yng Nghymru yw hyn, ond a allwch esbonio pam mae'n rhaid adrodd ar symudiadau o fewn tri diwrnod yn y Deyrnas Unedig er bod modd aros cyhyd â saith diwrnod yn Ewrop?

Mae'r undebau'n poeni'n fawr y gall gwall bach iawn, diofal, arwain at 3 y cant o'r taliad yn cael ei ddwyn yn ôl fel cosb. Maent yn gofyn a oes modd bod yn llawer iawn mwy hyblyg a sensitif o ran y materion hyn.

Mae nifer o bwyntiau'n codi yn y maes hwn. Mae'n faes cymhleth ac mae amser yn mynd rhagddo felly nid wyf am fynd ar ôl yr holl fanylion sydd yn poeni'r ddau undeb, ond gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cydnabod bod eu pryderon yn rhai gwirioneddol, bod y materion hyn yn peri peth gofid, ac y gall y gofid hwnnw ddatblygu i fod yn ofid sydd â goblygiadau mawr o ran yr unigolion a'u busnesau.

5.30 p.m.

Ynghylch y gymhariaeth rhwng y sefyllfa yng Nghymru, yr Alban a Lloegr o ran taliadau piler 1, a yw'n bosibl ichi esbonio inni pam mae'r cosbau 177 y cant yn uwch

Welsh Government tends to be more heavy-handed in the manner in which it administers these penalties than the Governments in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland. There is also the question of the manner in which the Government decides whether the error made by the farmer is intentional or unintentional. The unions tell me that the definition used by the Welsh Government in this regard as regards intentional errors does not correspond with the definition of 'intentional' in a court of law. I would be pleased if you could respond to that point, because there are huge implications to that with regard to the way in which you decide on penalties. It was noted, for example, that cattle movements have to be reported to the British cattle movement service within three calendar days in the UK. I hope that you would accept, Minister, that that can be difficult. The average in Europe is seven calendar days. I know that it is not your decision as the Minister in Wales, but perhaps you could explain why it has to be done in three days in the UK when they can wait up to seven days in Europe.

The unions are very concerned that a very minor error—a careless mistake—can lead to a situation where 3 per cent of the payment is withheld as a penalty. They ask whether it is possible to be much more flexible and sensitive in these matters.

A number of points arise in this field. It is complex and time is marching on, so I will not pursue all the details of the concerns that both unions have, but I hope that you will acknowledge that they are real concerns and that they cause some anguish that can lead to great implications with regard to individuals and their businesses.

On the comparison between the position in Wales, England and Scotland, in terms of pillar 1 payments, perhaps you can explain to us why, on average, the costs are 177 per cent

nag yn yr Alban a 402 y cant yn uwch yma nag yn Lloegr, ar gyfartaledd? Mae'r gymhariaeth honno yn dangos bod agwedd wahanol yng Nghymru. Yr eironi mwyaf yw bod yn rhaid i ffermwyr, weithiau, aros yn hir iawn cyn cael y wybodaeth hon gennych chi a'r Llywodraeth. Nid yw'r wybodaeth sy'n cael ei chyflwyno iddynt bob amser yn gywir. Mae gennyf wybodaeth am ddau achos sydd wedi codi yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Yn un o'r achosion hynny, bu'n rhaid ichi newid y penderfyniad oherwydd bod y wybodaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r ffermwr yn wallus. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn hwyr neu yn wallus yn ei hymateb, nid yw'n cael ei chosbi. Pe bai ffermwr yn gweithredu felly, byddai ef neu hi yn cael ei gosbi neu ei chosbi yn o hallt. Felly, Weinidog, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cydnabod bod lle i bryderu am y sefyllfa hon. Yr wyf yn mawr obeithio eich bod wedi cael amser i ystyried a oes modd ichi edrych ar y sefyllfa hon unwaith yn rhagor a gweld a oes modd ymateb yn fwy hyblyg, sensitif a thrugarog.

Cefais gyfle i edrych ar yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Gweriniaeth Iwerddon yn ei alw yn siarter i'w cleientiaid. Yn y ddogfen honno, mae pwyslais ar hyblygrwydd a nodir yn amlwg iawn y manau lle na fyddant yn gweithredu cosbau oherwydd ei bod yn credu nad oes bwriad gwneud cam, er enghraifft, pe bai ffermwr yn gwneud camgymeriad o ran cofnodi tir. Nid oes modd i unrhyw beth twyllodrus ddigwydd yng Nghymru yn y cyd-destun hwnnw oherwydd mae'r ffurflen IACS, y system integredig gweinyddu a rheoli, ar gael, sy'n nodi'r ffeithiau hyn i gyd. Felly, pam cosbi rhywun am fân wall sydd â dim goblygiadau iddo, a'r gosb honno yn gallu bod yn eithafol? Mae'n ymddangos imi fod gan Weriniaeth yr Iwerddon agwedd wahanol tuag at y cosbau hyn. Sylweddolaf, Weinidog—a chredaf y byddai pawb sy'n ymwneud ag amaethyddiaeth yn sylweddoli—fod yn rhaid cael system o gosbau ac mae'n rhaid bod y system yn dryloyw a bod pawb yn gallu gweld yn glir fod cosbau llym os oes bwriad i dwyllo mewn unrhyw ffordd. Yr wyf yn gofyn am ychydig o hyblygrwydd a sensitifrwydd yn y mater hwn.

Mae Andrew R.T. Davies wedi gofyn imi am funud; rhoddaf ychydig yn fwy na munud ac

higher here than in Scotland and 402 per cent higher here than in England. That comparison demonstrates a different attitude in Wales. The greatest irony is that, sometimes, farmers have to wait a very long time before receiving this information from you and the Government. The information presented to them is not always accurate. I have information relating to two cases from Carmarthenshire. In one of those cases, you had to change the decision because the information presented to the farmer was inaccurate. However, when the Government is late or inaccurate in its response, it is not penalised. If a farmer acted in that manner, he or she would be heavily penalised. Therefore, Minister, I hope that you will acknowledge that there is cause for concern about this situation. I greatly hope that you have had the opportunity to consider whether it is possible for you to revisit this issue to establish whether you can respond in a more flexible, sensitive and compassionate way.

I had an opportunity to look at what the Government of the Republic of Ireland referred to as its charter for its clients. In that document, there is an emphasis on the need for flexibility and it notes clearly the circumstances in which it would not penalise people because there was no intention to do wrong, for example, if a farmer were to make a mistake with the recording of land. It is not possible for any deception to take place in Wales because we have the integrated administration and control system form, which notes all of these details. Therefore, why penalise someone for a minor error that has no implications, particularly when that penalty can be quite extreme? It appears to me that the Republic of Ireland has a very different attitude to these penalties. Minister, I realise—and I believe that everyone involved with agriculture would realise—that you need some system of penalties and that system must be transparent so that it is possible to see clearly that strict penalties are enforced if there is any intention to act in a deceitful manner. However, I am asking for some flexibility and sensitivity with regard to this matter.

Andrew R.T. Davies has asked me for one minute; I will give him slightly more than a

yr wyf yn siŵr, o adnabod Andrew, y bydd yn gwneud llawn ddefnydd o'r amser ychwanegol i wneud ei bwynt.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you, Rhodri Glyn. I listened intently to what you had to say. I also declare an interest as a partner in a business in receipt of agricultural support. This debate is timely, and it is a shame that it is a short debate, although I make no criticism of the Chamber being fairly empty. Rhodri Glyn makes points about the significant sums of money that are taken out of the industry, the distress caused by the inspections—which is great for many families, who are generally trying to do a darn good job in the agricultural community; and proportionality. It is important in this debate to understand the proportionality of the fine or sanction taken against the individual. I would be the first to say that we need accountability and transparency with regard to the flow of money going into the agriculture industry, but I believe—and Rhodri Glyn touched on the evidence for this—that, in Wales, this is dealt with with a heavier hand than is the case elsewhere. The higher costs that Rhodri Glyn touched on are something that I have seen myself as a farmer. That is widely acknowledged in the agricultural community as draining money away from the front line. It is something that we will be looking for reasoned answers on from the Minister.

To give two examples, when the Countryside Council for Wales passed over its inspection process to the inspectorate, farmers suddenly found themselves in breach of the rules through no fault of their own. They did not advise on the map; the Countryside Council for Wales did. I am grateful that the Minister has agreed to a meeting next month about the 1-metre rule for arable farms in Wales. It has the potential to take considerable sums of money from arable farmers, who are genuinely doing a job that they believe is in compliance and, through no fault of their own—but because of a simple administrative rule change—are going to cause a breach of the regulations. Thank you, Rhodri Glyn, for raising this important debate. I will listen intently to what the Minister has to say.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Llywodraeth Cymru yw'r asiantaeth dalu sy'n gweinyddu cyllid y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yng Nghymru. Yn

minute, and, knowing Andrew, I am sure that he will make full use of the additional time to make his point.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch, Rhodri Glyn. Gwrandewais yn astud ar yr hyn yr oedd gennych i'w ddweud. Datganaf hefyd fudd fel partner mewn busnes sy'n cael cymorth amaethyddol. Mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol, ac mae'n drueni mai dadl fer ydyw, er nad wyf yn beirniadu o gwbl fod y Siambr yn weddol wag. Mae Rhodri Glyn yn gweud pwyntiau am y symiau sylweddol o arian sy'n cael eu tynnu allan o'r diwydiant, y trallod a achosir gan arolygiadau—sy'n helaeth i lawer o deuluoedd, sy'n gyffredinol yn ceisio gwneud gwaith da iawn yn y gymuned amaethyddol; a chymesuredd. Mae'n bwysig yn y ddadl hon deall cymesuredd y ddirwy neu'r gosb a osodir yn erbyn yr unigolyn. Fi fyddai'r cyntaf i ddweud bod angen atebolrwydd a thryloywder arnom o ran llif arian yn mynd i mewn i'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth, ond rwy'n credu—a chrybwyllodd Rhodri Glyn dystiolaeth i hyn—fod hyn yn cael ei drin, yng Nghymru, yn llymach nag mewn mannau eraill. Mae'r costau uwch a grybwyllodd Rhodri Glyn yn rhywbeth a welais i fy hun fel ffermwr. Cydnabyddir yn helaeth yn y gymuned amaethyddol fod hynny'n sugno arian i ffwrdd o'r rheng flaen. Mae'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn chwilio am atebion rhesymegol iddo gan y Gweinidog.

I roi dwy enghraifft, pan drosglwyddodd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ei broses arolygu i'r arolygiaeth, gwelodd ffermwyr yn sydyn eu bod yn torri'r rheolau heb iddynt fod ar fai o gwbl. Ni wnaethant gynghori ar y map; Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru a wnaeth hynny. Rwy'n ddiolchgar bod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno i gyfarfod fis nesaf am y rheol 1 metr i ffermydd â'r yng Nghymru. Mae ganddi'r potensial i gymryd symiau sylweddol o arian oddi ar ffermwyr â'r, sy'n ddiffuant yn gwneud gwaith y credant ei fod yn cydymffurfio, ac sydd, heb iddynt hwy fod ar fai-ond oherwydd newid rheol weinyddol symlyn mynd i dorri'r rheoliadau. Diolch, Rhodri Glyn, am godi'r ddadl bwysig hon. Byddaf yn gwrando'n astud ar yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): The Welsh Government is the payment agency that administers the funding of the common agricultural policy in Wales.

ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dosbarthu tua £1.2 biliwn i ffermwyr Cymru o'r gyllideb Ewropeaidd hon. Mae Comisiwn Ewrop yn mynnu cael tystiolaeth bod rheolau cadarn ar waith yn yr asiantaeth dalu, ac mae rheoliadau'r amrywiol gynlluniau talu yn cynnwys gofynion manwl ar gyfer cosbi. Nod y Llywodraeth yw sicrhau bod unrhyw gosbau mor rhesymol â phosibl.

Fel asiantaeth dalu Cymru, rhaid i ni weinyddu'r gronfa Ewropeaidd yn unol â rheolau a rheoliadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'n ofyniad Ewropeaidd i ni leihau'r taliadau i ffermwyr os nad ydynt yn dilyn y rheolau perthnasol. Gall hyn olygu cyflwyno hawliadau'n hwyr, datgan gormod o dir neu rhy ychydig, neu fethu â bodloni gofynion y cynllun neu'r gofynion sy'n berthnasol i reolau trawsgydymffurfio. Daw cynigion i law yn rheolaidd ynghylch gofynion trawsgydymffurfio, ac maent, fel arfer, yn ymwneud â'r elfennau canlynol: lles anifeiliaid, yr amgylchedd, cyflwr amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol da, ac iechyd y cyhoedd, anifeiliaid a phlanhigion. Mae'r gofynion hyn yn gwbl sylfaenol i fodolaeth y gefnogaeth ariannol hon. Felly, nid yw'n syndod bod disgwyl i ni, fel asiantaeth dalu, gosbi lle nad yw ffermwyr yn cydymffurfio â'r gofynion, pa un a ydynt wedi gwneud hynny drwy gamgymeriad, drwy fod yn esgeulus, neu'n gwbl fwriadol.

Yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â rhai o'r achosion yr wyf wedi'u gweld, lle mae ffermwyr ar eu colled yn ariannol oherwydd camgymeriadau dilys. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r rheoliadau yn rhoi'r hawl i'r Llywodraeth leihau beth sydd, o bosibl, yn ymddangos fel cosb lem. Mae darpariaeth ar gyfer cywiro 'camgymeriad amlwg' heb gosb, ond dim ond mewn ambell achos y ceir gwneud hynny. Felly, er ein bod yn defnyddio'r ddarpariaeth i'r eithaf, nid yw'n bosibl gwneud hynny mewn rhai achosion.

Fel yn achos pob asiantaeth dalu, mae craffu gan Ewrop ar y ffordd y mae Cymru'n gweinyddu cyllid Ewropeaidd. Os gwelir, adeg archwiliad, nad yw Cymru'n cydymffurfio'n llwyr â rheolau ac â rheoliadau Ewrop, gall hynny gynyddu'r risg

During the past four years, the Government has distributed around £1.2 billion to Welsh farmers from this European budget. The European Commission requires evidence that firm rules be in place at the payment agency, and the regulations of the various payment schemes include detailed requirements for penalties. The Government aims to ensure that any penalties are as reasonable as possible.

As the Welsh payment agency, we must administer the European fund in accordance with the rules and regulations of the European Union. It is a European requirement to reduce payments to farmers if they do not follow the relevant rules. This may involve claims being submitted late, declaring too much or too little land, or failing to meet the requirements of the scheme or the requirements relating to cross-compliance rules. Proposals come to light regularly on cross-compliance requirements, and they are usually related to the following elements: animal welfare, the environment, good agricultural and environmental condition, and the health of the public, animals and plants. These requirements are absolutely fundamental to the existence of this financial support. Therefore, it is not surprising that we are expected, as a payment agency, to impose penalties where farmers do not comply with the requirements, whether they have done so mistakenly, negligently, or deliberately.

I sympathise with some of the cases that I have seen, where farmers have lost out financially because of genuine mistakes. However, the regulations do not give the Government the right to reduce what might, perhaps, seem like harsh penalties. There is provision for correcting 'obvious errors' without penalty, but it is possible to do so in only some cases. Therefore, although we use the provision as much as possible, it is not possible to do so in some cases.

As with each payment agency, there is European scrutiny regarding the way in which Wales administers European funding. If, during an audit, it appears that Wales is not complying fully with European rules and regulations, that can increase the risk of

o waharddiad i Gymru—sef cosb ariannol ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am beidio â dilyn gofynion rheoliadau Ewrop. Felly, er bod y rhan fwyaf o'r cymorthdaliadau'n cael eu hariannu gan Ewrop, Llywodraeth Cymru fyddai'n gyfrifol am dalu holl gostau'r gwaharddiad. Yn hynny o beth, effaith unrhyw waharddiad fyddai lleihau y gyllideb yr wyf i'n gyfrifol amdani, a'r gyllideb sydd, yn y pen draw, yn cael ei gwario er lles cymunedau cefn gwlad.

Mae gan Gymru record dda hyd yn hyn o ran canlyniadau y prosesau archwilio a chraffu hyn. Ar hyn o bryd, mae llawer llai o waharddiadau mewn grym ar gyfer Cymru o'i chymharu ag asiantaethau talu eraill ym Mhrydain ac Ewrop. Cymeradwyaeth archwiliad Ewropeaidd yw'r maen prawf pennaf ar gyfer system weinyddu unrhyw asiantaeth dalu. Mae'r broses archwilio'n craffu'n fanwl ar allu asiantaeth dalu i weinyddu cymorthdaliadau Ewropeaidd yn unol â gofynion Ewrop. Gall gwaharddiad ariannol olygu colli miliynau o bunnoedd cyhoeddus o goffrau'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n bosibl bod Aelodau wedi gweld adroddiadau yn y wasg am golledion o bron i £190 miliwn i Loegr a £34 miliwn i Ogledd Iwerddon yn sgîl archwiliadau Ewropeaidd. Er mwyn i ni yng Nghymru barhau i ddiogelu ein cyllidebau rhag cosbau ariannol sylweddol, mae'n hollbwysig bod ein gweinyddiaeth yn dal ati i gydymffurfio.

Rhodri, fel Cadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig, yr ydych chi wedi cael gweld, fel y soniwyd gennych, ddadansoddiad manwl o'r cosbau a roddwyd yng Nghymru yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Rhoddwyd mwy o gosbau trawsgydymffurfio i Gymru, ac i ranbarthau eraill, yn 2009. Dyna sy'n esbonio'r cynnydd sylweddol yn y cosbau yn 2009.

5.40 p.m.

Yr ydym wedi bod yn agored yn glŷn â'r wybodaeth hon ac yn cydnabod bod y cosbau ar gyfer y taliadau polisi amaethyddol cyffredin wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol eleni. Digwyddodd hyn o ganlyniad i ymateb adroddiad archwilwyr Ewropeaidd a gynhaliwyd yn 2008 wrth inni wneud y

disqualification for Wales—namely a financial penalty for the Assembly Government for failing to follow the requirements of European regulations. Therefore, although most of the grants are financed by Europe, the Assembly Government would be responsible for paying all of the costs of exclusion. In that regard, any ban would reduce the budget that I am responsible for, and the budget that, ultimately, is spent for the benefit of rural communities.

Wales has a good record so far regarding the results of these audit and scrutiny processes. Currently, there are far fewer restrictions in force for Wales compared with other payment agencies in Britain and Europe. European audit approval is the main criterion for any payment agency's administration system. The audit process closely scrutinises the payment agency's ability to administer the European grants in accordance with European requirements. Financial exclusion could mean losing millions of pounds of public money from the Government's coffers. It is possible that Members have seen press reports about losses of nearly £190 million in England and £34 million in Northern Ireland following European audits. In order for us in Wales to continue to protect our budgets from considerable financial penalties, it is crucial that our administration continues to comply.

Rhodri, as the Chair of the Rural Development Sub-committee, you have seen, as you mentioned, a detailed analysis of the penalties imposed in Wales during the past four years. A greater number of cross-compliance penalties were imposed upon Wales, and other regions, in 2009. That is the explanation for the significant increase in penalties in 2009.

We have been open about this information and recognise that the penalties for the common agricultural policy payments have increased significantly this year. This occurred as a result of the response of the European auditors' report undertaken in 2008 as we make the necessary changes to the

newidiadau angenrheidiol i'r tabl cosbau trawsgydymffurfio. Effaith hyn fu cysoni ein tabl ni â barn yr archwilwyr y dylid codi cosb ariannol uwch am fathau penodol o dorri rheolau trawsgydymffurfio. Sylweddolaf fod y newidiadau hyn wedi gadael eu hôl ar y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru, ond mae'n bosibl y gallwn ddal i ddisgwyl cosb ariannol, fel Llywodraeth, gan fod ein system ni, cyn 2009, heb fod yn ddigon llym ar ein cosbau i ffermwyr.

Yn ystod pedair blynedd diwethaf y cynllun ariannu amaethyddol, dyrannodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyfanswm o £1.2 biliwn o dan gynllun y taliad sengl a'r amrywiol gynlluniau o dan y rhaglen datblygu gwledig. Yn ystod y pedair blynedd hynny, felly, yr oedd cyfanswm y cosbau i'r diwydiant ffermio yn llai na £300,000, sef 0.25 y cant o'r taliadau, a hynny o dan yr holl categorïau ar gyfer torri'r rheolau. Ar gyfer cynllun 2009, fel y crybwyllais eisoes, mae ein data'n dangos bod gwerth y cosbau wedi cynyddu i 0.43 y cant o'r cymorthdaliadau a oedd yn werth £360 miliwn yn 2009.

Pan fyddwn yn cosbi, hoffwn i'r cosbau gydymffurfio'n union â'r gofynion, ond gan beidio â mynd y tu hwnt iddynt. Yn hynny o beth, yr ydym yn adolygu'n rheolaidd ein dull o weinyddu cymorthdaliadau Ewropeaidd er mwyn cadw'n gyson â rheoliadau Ewrop wrth iddynt newid, ac er mwyn ystyried unrhyw ganllawiau Ewropeaidd newydd ac adborth gan archwilwyr. Mae fy ymrwymiad i adolygu ein dull o weinyddu cymorthdaliadau Ewropeaidd yn amlwg o'r ffaith imi gytuno i addasu'r system cosbau trawsgydymffurfio, o glywed bod modd inni lacio rhywfaint ar y rheolau a bod y rheiny yn rhy lym. Felly, cyflwynwyd newidiadau yn 2009. Cytunais hefyd y gellid defnyddio'r newidiadau hyn yn ôl-weithredol ar gyfer y cynllun blaenorol er mwyn i ffermwyr Cymru fanteisio ar hyn. Yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, am weld y rheolau hyn yn dilyn yr egwyddor o gymesuredd. Dro ar ôl tro yn ystod y trafodaethau ar archwiliad iechyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, yr ydym wedi gwneud y pwynt i Gomisiwn Ewrop ein bod am weld y rheolau hyn yn gymesur ar gyfer yr hyn a gosbir. Wrth inni edrych ar ddylanwadu ar y trafodaethau sy'n

table of cross-compliance penalties. Its effect was to reconcile our table with the auditors' opinion that the financial penalty should be increased for certain types of cross-compliance breaches. I realise that these changes have left their mark on the farming industry in Wales, but it is possible that we can continue to expect a financial penalty, as a Government, as our system, before 2009, was not tough enough with regard to penalties for farmers.

Over the past four years of the agricultural funding scheme, the Assembly Government has allocated a total of £1.2 billion under the single payment scheme and the various schemes under the rural development programme. During those four years, therefore, the total value of the penalties for the farming industry was less than £300,000, which is 0.25 per cent of the payments, and that is under all categories for breaches of the rules. For the 2009 scheme, as I have already mentioned, our data indicate that the value of the penalties has increased to 0.43 per cent of the subsidies which were worth £360 million in 2009.

When we impose penalties, I would like the penalties to conform to the requirements, but not exceed them. In that regard, we regularly review our approach to the administration of European subsidies in order to remain consistent with European regulations as they change, and in order to consider any new European guidelines and feedback from the auditors. My commitment to revising our method of administering European grants is evident from the fact that I agreed to modify the system of cross-compliance penalties, after hearing that it was possible for us to relax the rules on that somewhat as they were too harsh. Therefore, changes were introduced in 2009. I also agreed that these changes could be used retrospectively for the previous scheme so that Welsh farmers could take advantage of this. We, as a Government, want to see these rules follow the principle of proportionality. Time after time during the negotiations on the common agricultural policy health check, we have made the point to the European Commission that we want these rules to be proportionate to the breach that has incurred the penalty. As we look at influencing the negotiations that will lead to

arwain at ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn 2013 a thu hwnt, byddwn yn gwneud y pwynt bod angen inni gael rheolau sy'n symlach i ni eu gweithredu yng Nghymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ni chredaf y byddai neb yn anghytuno â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh a'r agwedd a gymerwch tuag at y cosbau hyn. Wrth reswm, mae'n rhaid diogelu Llywodraeth Cymru rhag cael ei chosbi'n llym gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod y cosbau hyn yn cael eu gweinyddu yn ôl y rheoliadau. Yr awgrym a gefais yw eu bod yn llymach yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, os ystyriwch y gosb o beidio â chydabod symudiad anifeiliaid o fewn 28 diwrnod, gwelwch mai'r sgôr yn Lloegr oedd 0.1 y cant. Yng Nghymru, y sgôr oedd 1 y cant. Yr ydych bellach wedi'i ostwng i 0.4 y cant, sydd yn dal i fod bedair gwaith yn llymach na'r Alban. Mae gennyf enghreifftiau o'r un peth. I fynd yn ôl at y canrannau, mae'r sgôr 177 y cant yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn yr Alban, 402 y cant—os cofiaf yn iawn—yn fwy yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. A allwch esbonio hyn? A oes gennym ffermwyr sydd yn torri mwy o reolau yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr?

Elin Jones: Ni fedraf ymateb i'r union gwestiwn yr ydych yn ei ofyn, ond yr wyf yn fodlon ysgrifennu atoch gyda mwy o fanylion am yr ymateb. Os ydym am gymharu gwahanol weinyddiaethau, byddwn am dynnu eich sylw eto at y ffaith bod Lloegr wedi derbyn cosb ariannol oddi wrth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o tua £190 miliwn. Nid yw honno'n gosb y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi ei hwynebu. Fodd bynnag, o ran yr union resymau pam mae ein dehongliad o'r rheolau yn wahanol, yr wyf yn barod i roi gwybodaeth bellach ichi ar hynny yn ysgrifenedig.

Mae'n bwysig i Aelodau wybod ein bod wedi cael ein harchwilio fel Llywodraeth gan Lys Archwilwyr Ewrop o ran y cynllun taliad sengl yn ystod y mis hwn, a hefyd gan Gomisiwn Ewrop mewn perthynas â'n cynlluniau datblygu gwledig. Bydd hyn yn rhoi gwell amcan inni o'n system weinyddu bresennol ac i ba raddau y mae Cymru'n cydymffurfio â gofynion Ewrop. Mae hyn oll yn pwysleisio ymhellach fod pob agwedd ar

the reform of the common agricultural policy in 2013 and beyond, we will make the point that we need rules that are simpler for us to implement in Wales.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I do not believe that anyone would disagree with what you have said or your approach to these penalties. Naturally, it is necessary to safeguard the Welsh Government from being heavily penalised by the European Union, and it is necessary to ensure that these penalties are administered according to the regulations. The suggestion that I made was that they are stricter in Wales. For example, if you consider the cost of failing to acknowledge the movement of animals within 28 days, you will see that the score in England was 0.1 per cent. In Wales, the score was 1 per cent. You have now reduced it to 0.4 per cent, which is still four times stricter than Scotland. I have examples of the same thing. To go back to the percentages, the score is 177 per cent higher in Wales than in Scotland, 402 per cent—if I remember correctly—higher in Wales than in England. Can you explain this? Do we have more farmers breaking the rules in Wales than in England?

Elin Jones: I cannot respond to the exact question that you ask, but I am willing to write to you with further details on the response. If we are to compare different administrations, I would draw your attention again to the fact that England has been given a financial penalty from the European Union of some £190 million. That is not a penalty that this Government is faced with. However, on the exact reasons why our interpretation of the rules is different, I am prepared to provide you with further information on that in writing.

It is important for Members to be aware of the fact that we as a Government have been audited by the European Court of Auditors in respect of the single payment scheme this month, and also by the European Commission in respect of our rural development schemes. That will give us a better indication of our current administration system and the extent to which Wales complies with European requirements. This

system weinyddu Cymru o dan lygad barcod Comisiwn Ewrop, ac yr ydym yn gorfod sicrhau bod y systemau priodol yn eu lle ac ar waith bob amser. Yr wyf wedi gweld adroddiad cychwynnol yr archwiliad hwn, ac yr wyf wedi rhyfeddu at rai o'r mân bwyntiau a godwyd gan yr archwilwyr gyda'm swyddogion.

Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym am leihau maint y cosbau i ffermwyr. Wrth ymuno â chynllun, rhoddir taflenni gwybodaeth i ffermwyr sy'n cynnwys rheolau a gofynion y cynllun. Mae gofyn i ffermwyr lofnodi datganiad eu bod yn deall telerau'r cytundeb, a'u bod yn barod ac yn abl i lynu wrth reolau'r cynllun. Ambell waith, mae archwilwyr y Llywodraeth yn dod o hyd i ddiffygion amlwg ar rai ffermydd wrth gynnal eu hymweliadau a'u harchwiliadau. Er enghraifft, os gwelant fod gwartheg wedi colli eu tagiau clust— enghraifft y cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn ati— rhoddir 28 diwrnod i ffermwyr osod rhai newydd. Mae'n gwbl deg bod hyn yn troi'n gosb pan na fydd y ffermwyr hynny hyd yn oed wedi archebu tagiau newydd cyn pen 28 diwrnod.

Mae angen cosbi hefyd pan fydd hawliadau'n cael eu cyflwyno'n hwyr, pan gaiff tir anghywir ei gynnwys, neu pan na chaiff tir fferm ei gynnwys. Cyfrifoldeb ffermwyr yw gwneud yn siŵr bod eu ffurflenni cais sengl yn cael eu llenwi'n gywir. Mae swyddogion y Llywodraeth ar hyd a lled Cymru yn cynnig cefnogaeth i ffermwyr yn ystod y cyfnod pan fyddant yn llenwi eu ffurflenni ar gyfer y taliad sengl, ac yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod y rôl bwysig y mae'r undebau amaethyddol yn ei chwarae yn eu hamryw swyddfeydd ar hyd a lled y wlad o ran rhoi cymorth i ffermwyr wrth lenwi eu ffurflenni yn flynyddol.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o achosion poenus o gosb, a bu hynny'n enwedig o amlwg yn 2009. Yr wyf yn annog pob ffermwr i fuddsoddi ychydig mwy o amser er mwyn cydymffurfio â'r rheolau ac addysgu eu hunain amdanynt. Mae'r mwyafrif helaeth o ffermwyr yn llwyddo i wneud hyn gan osgoi cosbau o unrhyw fath. Yr wyf am gyrraedd sefyllfa lle mae mwy eto yn llwyddo i gydymffurfio fel bod llai o gosbau. Yr wyf yn barod i edrych yn barhaus ar y sefyllfa hon, ac er nad oes gennyf hyblygrwydd o dan

all emphasises further that all aspects of Wales's administration system are scrutinised closely by the European Commission, and we must ensure that appropriate systems are in place and are always applied. I have seen the initial report of that audit, and I have been staggered by some of the minor points raised by the auditors with my officials.

As a Government, we want to reduce the size of the penalties for farmers. When joining the scheme, farmers are given information leaflets containing the rules and requirements of the scheme. Farmers are required to sign a statement that they understand the conditions of the agreement, and that they are willing and able to comply with the scheme rules. On occasion, Government auditors find clear breaches on some farms when they conduct their visits and inspections. For instance, if they see cattle that are missing their ear tags—an example that Rhodri Glyn referred to—the farmers are given 28 days to fit new ones. It is entirely fair that that should lead to a penalty if those farmers have failed even to purchase new tags by the time the 28 days are up.

There is also a need to penalise when claims are submitted late, when the incorrect land has been included, or when farmland is not included. It is farmers' responsibility to ensure that their single payment forms are completed correctly. Assembly Government officials the length and breadth of Wales offer support to farmers during the period when they are completing their forms for the single payment, and I also acknowledge the important role that the agricultural unions play in their various offices throughout the country in assisting farmers to complete their forms annually.

I am aware of some damaging cases of penalties, and those were particularly evident in 2009. I encourage all farmers to invest a little more of their time in order to comply with the rules and to familiarise themselves with them. The vast majority of farmers succeed in doing that, and avoid any kind of penalty. I want to get to a position of yet more farmers managing to comply so that there are fewer penalties. I am prepared to keep this situation continually under review, and although I do not have any flexibility

y gyfundrefn bresennol, mae'n bwysig bod ein dehongliad yn gymesur â'r hyn sy'n ofynnol. Wrth inni edrych ar ddiwygio'r polisi amaeth cyffredin ar gyfer y blynyddoedd i ddod, yr wyf yn mawr obeithio y bydd Comisiwn Ewrop yn cefnogi'r alwad gan nifer o wledydd Ewrop i leihau'r gofynion a rhoi mwy o'r hyblygrwydd y cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn ato.

under the current arrangements, it is important that our interpretation is proportionate to what is required. As we consider the reform of the common agricultural policy in the coming years, I hope that the European Commission will support the demands from several European countries to reduce the requirements and to allow more of the flexibility that Rhodri Glyn referred to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's business to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.49 p.m.

The meeting ended at 5.49 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democrat Rhyddfrydol Annibynnol – Independent Liberal Democrat)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 German, Veronica (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)