



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings

Dydd Mawrth, 17 Tachwedd 2010
Tuesday, 17 November 2010

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Ethol Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro Election of Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer
3	Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb Questions to the Minister for Business and Budget
21	Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth Questions to the Minister for Heritage
39	Cwestiynau i Gynrychiolydd Comisiwn y Cynulliad Questions to the Representative of the Assembly Commission
42	Cynnig i Benodi Comisiynydd Safonau Motion to Appoint a Standards Commissioner
45	Dyfodol Darlledu Cymraeg The Future of Welsh Broadcasting
61	Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Problemau Iechyd Cyhoeddus Welsh Conservatives Debate: Public Health Problems
89	Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Glastir Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Glastir
114	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time
120	Dadl Fer: Gwasanaethau Iechyd yn Sir Benfro Short Debate: Health Services in Pembrokeshire

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

Ethol Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro Election of Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Good morning. In the absence of the Presiding Officer, I ask the Assembly to elect a temporary Deputy Presiding Officer for the duration of today's Plenary meeting. Therefore, I invite nominations.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Bore da. Yn absenoldeb y Llywydd, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad ethol Dirprwy Lywydd dros dro ar gyfer Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Felly, gwahoddaf enwebiadau.

Peter Black: I nominate William Graham.

Peter Black: Enwebaf William Graham.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: William Graham has been nominated. Are there any other nominations? I see that there are none. Therefore, William Graham has been elected Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer for the duration of today's Plenary meeting.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae William Graham wedi'i enwebu. A oes unrhyw enwebiadau eraill? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, etholwyd William Graham yn Ddirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro ar gyfer y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb Questions to the Minister for Business and Budget

Yr Adolygiad Cynhwysfawr o Wariant

The Comprehensive Spending Review

1. Irene James: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y toriadau a orfodwyd ar gyllideb cyfalaf Cymru yn adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant diweddar Llywodraeth y DU. OAQ(3)1214(BB)*

1. Irene James: *Will the Minister make a statement on the cuts imposed on the Welsh capital budget in the recent UK Government comprehensive spending review. OAQ(3)1214(BB)*

The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt): The Welsh capital budget will reduce by 40 per cent over the spending review period to its lowest level since devolution. This will have a major impact on our ability to invest in schools, hospitals and the infrastructure that is needed to secure the economic recovery.

Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt): Bydd cyllideb cyfalaf Cymru'n lleihau 40 y cant dros gyfnod yr adolygiad o wariant i'w lefel isaf ers datganoli. Bydd hyn yn effeithio o ddifrif ar ein gallu i fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion, ysbytai a'r seilwaith sydd ei angen i sicrhau bod yr economi'n gwella.

Irene James: Thank you for that response, Minister. With the massive scale of cuts we are facing, how much end-of-year flexibility do you estimate being available to the Assembly Government for the next financial year?

Irene James: Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. O ystyried y toriadau enfawr sydd o'n blaenau, yn ôl eich amcangyfrifon, faint o hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn a fydd ar gael i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf?

Jane Hutt: The UK coalition Government announced in the spending review its intention to abolish the existing end-of-year flexibility arrangements and write off all

Jane Hutt: Cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth glymblaid y DU yn yr adolygiad o wariant ei bod yn bwriadu dileu'r trefniadau hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn sy'n bodoli

accumulated stocks. The Assembly Government strongly opposed the writing off of EYF stocks, which would cost Wales £400 million.

Jonathan Morgan: In evidence to the Public Accounts Committee, your officials and the Permanent Secretary confirmed that even when your party was in power in Westminster, you were planning as far back as the autumn of 2009 for a year-on-year reduction in revenue of 3 per cent and a year-on-year reduction in capital of 10 per cent. Is it not the case, Minister, that the settlement that you have been given for the next financial year onwards is better than you planned for?

Jane Hutt: The settlement for capital is worse than we planned for, and that was the point of Irene's question. There will be a 40 per cent cut in the capital budget, and if you compare that with the rest of the UK—and we have made this point, Jonathan, as you know—you find that Wales has fared far worse than the rest of the devolved administrations, which have suffered an average of 29 per cent in capital. When you add to that the loss of the St Athan project, the fact that rail electrification is nowhere in sight, and the loss of the Newport passport office, you know where we are, because Wales is being bypassed by this Government.

Effaith yr Adolygiad Cynhwysfawr o Wariant

2. David Lloyd: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant ar gyllideb Cymru. OAQ(3)1212(BB)*

Jane Hutt: The settlement announced by the UK Government in the spending review means that, in real terms, our budget next year will be £186 million lower than it is this year, and £1.8 billion lower by 2014-15. This represents the biggest cut to the Welsh budget in a generation.

David Lloyd: I realise that Liberal Democrat

ar hyn o bryd a dileu'r holl stociau sydd wedi cronni. Roedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwrthwynebu dileu stociau Hyblygrwydd Diwedd Blwyddyn yn gryf, a fyddai'n costio £400 miliwn i Gymru.

Jonathan Morgan: Mewn tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, cadarnhaodd eich swyddogion a'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol eich bod yn cynllunio, hyd yn oed pan oedd eich plaid mewn grym yn San Steffan, mor bell yn ôl â hydref 2009 ar gyfer cwotgi 3 y cant y naill flwyddyn ar ôl y llall ar refeniw a chwotgi 10 y cant y naill flwyddyn ar ôl y llall ar gyfalaf. Onid yw'n wir, Weinidog, fod y setliad a roddwyd ichi ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf ymlaen yn well na'r setliad y buoch yn cynllunio ar ei gyfer?

Jane Hutt: Mae'r setliad ar gyfer cyfalaf yn waeth nag yr oeddem wedi cynllunio ar ei gyfer, a hwnnw oedd diben cwestiwn Irene. Bydd toriad o 40 y cant yn y gyllideb cyfalaf, ac os cymharwch chi hynny â gweddill y DU—ac rydym wedi gwneud y pwynt hwn, Jonathan, fel y gwyddoch—gwelwch fod Cymru wedi gwneud yn llawer gwaeth na gweddill y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig, sydd wedi dioddef 29 y cant mewn cyfalaf ar gyfartaledd. Pan ychwanegwch at hynny golled prosiect Sain Tathan, y ffaith nad yw trydaneiddio'r rheilffyrdd mewn golwg o gwbl, a bod swyddfa basbort Casnewydd wedi'i cholli, rydych yn gwybod ein sefyllfa, gan fod Cymru'n cael ei hosgoi gan y Llywodraeth hon.

Impact of the Comprehensive Spending Review

2. David Lloyd: *Will the Minister make a statement regarding the impact of the comprehensive spending review on Wales' budget. OAQ(3)1212(BB)*

Jane Hutt: Mae'r setliad a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU yn yr adolygiad o wariant yn golygu y bydd ein cyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf, mewn termau real, £186 miliwn yn is nag y mae eleni, ac £1.8 biliwn yn is erbyn 2014-15. Hwn yw'r toriad mwyaf i gyllideb Cymru mewn cenhedlaeth.

David Lloyd: Sylweddolaf fod

betrayals are stacking up day on day, but on the CSR cuts, what are the implications for Wales of raising tuition fees in England?

Jane Hutt: It is important that we await further developments as far as the UK coalition Government is concerned, but I refer you to the statement made by Leighton Andrews, the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning on 3 November. He said that we have made it clear that our policy for higher education in Wales should widen participation in education and maximise the economic, social and cultural impact of universities on learners and the wider community. As he said in his statement to the Assembly on 12 October, there is a risk to us in that the Browne proposals could cost the Assembly Government an additional £70 million per year. It is quite clear that we have to await further developments and the Welsh Government's response to them.

Nick Ramsay: I was pleased to hear you reel off a list of things that you do not think the current UK Government is doing for Wales, such as rail electrification and the St Athan project. I do wonder why the previous Labour Government did not deliver on any of these schemes in over 10 years, but there we are.

According to the Office for National Statistics, the number of people unemployed in the UK fell by 9,000 in the three months to September, and recent figures also show that the claimant count of those out of work and receiving benefits fell slightly in October by 3,700. Would you therefore agree that, contrary to some of the doomsday scenarios painted by people who are talking Wales down in the Chamber, the overall picture is not totally negative and that, in fact, the budgetary priorities of the UK Government are assisting Wales and our budget decisions here?

Jane Hutt: I wonder whether you noticed, as I did, the report by a recruitment company—it appeared in the business section of the *Western Mail* last week, I believe—that said

bradychiadau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn pentyrru'n uwch bob dydd, ond o ran y toriadau'r Adolygiad Cynhwysfawr o Wariant, beth mae codi'r ffioedd dysgu yn Lloegr yn ei olygu i Gymru?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig inni ddisgwyl datblygiadau pellach o ran Llywodraeth glymblaid y DU, ond fe'ch cyfeiriau at y datganiad a wnaethpwyd gan Leighton Andrews, y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 3 Tachwedd. Dywedodd ein bod wedi egluro y dylai ein polisi ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru ehangu cyfranogiad mewn addysg a gwneud y mwyaf o effaith economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol prifysgolion ar ddysgwyr ac ar y gymuned ehangach. Fel y dywedodd yn ei ddatganiad i'r Cynulliad ar 12 Hydref, mae perygl inni y gallai cynigion Browne gostio £70 miliwn ychwanegol y flwyddyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n eithaf amlwg ei bod yn rhaid inni ddisgwyl datblygiadau pellach a disgwyl ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru iddynt.

Nick Ramsay: Roeddwn yn falch o'ch clywed yn rhestru'r pethau nad ydych yn credu bod Llywodraeth gyfredol y DU yn eu gwneud i Gymru, fel trydaneiddio'r rheilffyrdd a phrosiect Sain Tathan. Tybed pam na chyflawnodd y Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol unrhyw un o'r cynlluniau hyn mewn mwy na 10 mlynedd, ond dyna ni.

Yn ôl y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, gostyngodd nifer y bobl ddi-waith yn y DU i 9,000 yn llai yn y tri mis i fis Medi, ac mae ffigurau diweddar hefyd yn dangos bod nifer y bobl ddi-waith sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau wedi syrthio ychydig ym mis Hydref i 3,700 yn llai. A gytunech chi felly, yn groes i rai o'r sefyllfaoedd Dydd y Farn sy'n cael eu cyfleu gan bobl sy'n difrïo Cymru yn y Siambr, nad yw'r darlun cyffredinol yn gwbl negyddol a bod blaenoriaethau cyllidebol Llywodraeth y DU, mewn gwirionedd, yn cynorthwyo Cymru a'n penderfyniadau cyllideb yma?

Jane Hutt: Tybed a sylwasoch chi, fel y sylwais i, fod adroddiad gan gwmni recriwtio—ymddangosodd yn adran fusnes y *Western Mail* yr wythnos diwethaf, rwy'n

that there are 18 people chasing each job in Wales, on average. Of course, the number of people chasing those jobs is far higher in areas such as Merthyr Tydfil, where we are seeking to target and support the most vulnerable.

Let me just make one point regarding the latest labour market statistics for Wales, which came out today. They continue to show some positive signs, with unemployment down and employment levels up over both the year and the quarter. However, we have to recognise that the picture remains volatile and uncertain. Big risks remain, in particular as a result of the UK Government's spending review. That is reflected in the overall level of our own budget, which may threaten progress going forward.

Nick Ramsay: I will be nicer to you in my second supplementary question, Minister, because the situation in which you find yourself is no more your fault than it is of the current UK Government. We all know that the blame lies with the previous UK administration. I will turn our attention specifically to the announcement of the draft budget this afternoon, Minister, and the issue of our commitment to protecting the health budget, of which many people are aware. I am not sure what you are going to announce later, but will you give us an assurance that you have looked carefully at health spending in Wales and have reconsidered some of the harsher cuts that we believe you are planning in order to provide a budget that is not balanced in favour of the NHS in Wales? Many people beyond the Chamber are very concerned about this afternoon's budget. While your Government is not to blame for the situation in which it finds itself, do you agree that the NHS deserves protection? That is what people want.

Jane Hutt: As far as the Minister for health is concerned, she put the record straight in last week's opposition debate when she made the point that if we were to protect health services in real terms in 2011-12, that would mean cuts of £340 million in other crucial budgets. Edwina Hart asked what you would

credu—wedi dweud bod 18 o bobl yn ymgeisio am bob swydd yng Nghymru, ar gyfartaledd. Wrth gwrs, mae nifer y bobl sy'n mynd ar drywydd y swyddi hynny'n llawer uwch mewn ardaloedd fel Merthyr Tudful, lle rydym yn ceisio targedu a chefnogi'r mwyaf agored i niwed.

Gadewch imi ddweud un peth yn unig am ystadegau diweddaraf y farchnad lafur i Gymru, a ryddhawyd heddiw. Maent yn dal yn dangos rhai arwyddion cadarnhaol, a diweithdra wedi gostwng a lefelau cyflogaeth wedi cynyddu dros y flwyddyn a thros y chwarter. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod bod y darlun yn dal yn gyfnewidiol ac yn ansicr. Mae risgiau mawr o hyd, yn arbennig o ganlyniad i adolygiad o wariant Llywodraeth y DU. Adlewyrchir hynny yn lefel gyffredinol ein cyllideb ni ein hunain, a allai fygwth cynnydd wrth symud ymlaen.

Nick Ramsay: Byddaf yn fwy clên tuag atoch yn fy ail gwestiwn atodol, Weinidog, oherwydd nid oes mwy o fai arnoch chi am eich sefyllfa gyfredol nag sydd ar Lywodraeth gyfredol y DU. Gwyddom oll mai gweinyddiaeth flaenorol y DU sydd ar fai. Trof ein sylw'n benodol i gyhoeddiad y gyllideb ddrafft y prynhawn yma, Weinidog, a'n hymrwymiad i warchod y gyllideb iechyd, y mae llawer o bobl yn ymwybodol ohono. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth rydych yn mynd i'w gyhoeddi'n nes ymlaen, ond a wnewch chi'n sicrhau eich bod wedi edrych yn ofalus ar wariant iechyd yng Nghymru a'ch bod wedi ailystyried rhai o'r toriadau mwy difrifol y credwn eich bod yn eu cynllunio er mwyn darparu cyllideb nad yw wedi'i mantoli o blaid y GIG yng Nghymru? Mae llawer o bobl y tu hwnt i'r Siambr yn poeni'n fawr am gyllideb y prynhawn yma. Er nad yw eich Llywodraeth chi ar fai am ei sefyllfa, a gytunwch fod y GIG yn haeddu cael ei warchod? Hwnnw y mae ar bobl ei eisiau.

Jane Hutt: O ran y Gweinidog dros iechyd, cadarnhaodd y gwir yn nadl yr wrthblaid yr wythnos diwethaf pan eglurodd, petaem am warchod gwasanaethau iechyd mewn termau real yn 2011-12, byddai hynny'n golygu torri £340 miliwn mewn cyllidebau allweddol eraill. Gofynnodd Edwina Hart beth fydddech

choose. You have not told us yet. What you would choose: social services, housing, or the fuel poverty agenda? Also, to put the record straight, the UK coalition Government is counting social care in its so-called real terms increase. By doing that, as the Nuffield Trust said, it means that there is a reduction in the UK Government health budget of 0.5 per cent over the next four years. Our priority is to protect health, and that has been made quite clear in the planning of this budget.

Alun Davies: Minister, the figures that you have given us in answers to questions today have been quite shocking, including the £500 million cut to the NHS that the Conservatives are making in England. However, this afternoon, I would like to question you about not only the £1.8 billion cut in funding that we are seeing to the Government here, but also the £18 billion reduction in welfare benefits. That will have a real impact on many of the most vulnerable people and communities across Wales. Minister, I will not ask you to give us a glimpse of what you are going to announce later this afternoon, but will you assure us that this Government will always stand up for the poorest and the vulnerable, and that it will do its best to protect front-line services and look to protect the communities that are suffering these appalling cuts?

Jane Hutt: I made it quite clear in earlier comments that I believe that this will be a fair and just budget that stands up for the people of Wales, particularly the most vulnerable, and the economic recovery, and that we will do what we can to mitigate the impact of the UK spending review and the £18 billion cut to welfare benefits.

Peter Black: Minister, you will know from today's newspaper that there has been some controversy over the powers that were transferred to the Assembly by the previous Labour Government, in that the cost of those functions was not fully transferred to us. What conversations have you had with Treasury Ministers around the comprehensive spending review and other issues in order to

chi'n ei ddewis. Nid ydych wedi dweud wrthym eto. Beth fydddech chi'n ei ddewis: gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, tai neu'r agenda tlodi tanwydd? Hefyd, i gywiro'r gwall, mae Llywodraeth glymblaid y DU yn cyfrif gofal cymdeithasol yn ei chynnydd termau real fel y'i gelwir. Drwy wneud hynny, fel y dywedodd Ymddiriedolaeth Nuffield, mae'n golygu bod cyllideb iechyd Llywodraeth y DU yn gostwng 0.5 y cant dros y pedair blynedd nesaf. Ein blaenoriaeth yw gwarchod iechyd, a gwnaethpwyd hynny'n ddigon clir wrth gynllunio'r gyllideb hon.

Alun Davies: Weinidog, mae'r ffigurau a roesoch inni mewn atebion i gwestiynau heddiw wedi bod yn eithaf ysgytiol, gan gynnwys y toriad o £500 miliwn i'r GIG y mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei wneud yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, y prynhawn yma, hoffwn eich holi nid yn unig am y toriad £1.8 biliwn mewn cyllid yr ydym yn ei weld i'r Llywodraeth yma, ond hefyd y gostyngiad £18 biliwn mewn budd-daliadau lles. Bydd hynny'n effeithio o ddifrif ar rai o'r bobl a'r cymunedau mwyaf agored i niwed ledled Cymru. Weinidog, ni ofynnaf ichi roi cipolwg inni ar yr hyn y byddwch chi'n ei gyhoeddi'n nes ymlaen y prynhawn yma, ond a wnewch chi'n sicrhau y bydd y Llywodraeth hon bob amser yn amddiffyn y tlotaf a'r agored i niwed, ac y bydd yn gwneud ei gorau i warchod gwasanaethau rheng flaen a cheisio gwarchod y cymunedau sy'n dioddef y toriadau ofnadwy hyn?

Jane Hutt: Eglurais yn iawn mewn sylwadau cynharach fy mod i'n credu y bydd hon yn gyllideb deg a chyfiawn sy'n amddiffyn pobl Cymru, yn enwedig y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed, ac sy'n gwella'r economi, ac y byddwn yn gwneud yr hyn a allwn i liniaru effaith adolygiad o wariant y DU a'r toriad £18 biliwn i fudd-daliadau lles.

Peter Black: Weinidog, byddwch chi'n gwybod o bapur newydd heddiw y bu tipyn o ddadlau dros y pwerau a drosglwyddwyd i'r Cynulliad gan y Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol, sef nad oedd cost y swyddogaethau hynny wedi'i throsglwyddo'n llawn i ni. Pa sgysiau a gawsoch chi â Gweinidogion y Trysorlys ynghylch yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant a phethau eraill er mwyn ceisio

try to recover some of the costs of those functions?

adennill rhywfaint o gostau'r swyddogaethau hynny?

1.40 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I was surprised that you withdrew your question about the loss of end-of-year flexibility, as I am sure that you agree that we need to hold on to it to provide us with the opportunity to manage our budget responsibilities. In response to the particular point that you raised, over the last few years, functions and responsibilities have, of course, been transferred to Wales from the UK Government and there has been a transfer of some financial support for those additional responsibilities. However, it has not been sufficient to cover the increasing demand for those services. This shortfall further highlights the need for the UK Government to implement a fairer funding formula for Wales, as recommended by the Holtham commission. I am sure that you will be saying that to the Chief Secretary to the Treasury next Monday, Peter.

Jane Hutt: Roeddwn i'n synnu eich bod wedi tynnu'n ôl eich cwestiwn am golli hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn, am fy mod i'n siŵr y cytunwch fod angen inni gadw gafael ynddo i roi'r cyfle inni reoli ein cyfrifoldebau cyllideb ein hunain. Mewn ymateb i'r pwynt arbennig a godasoch, dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, mae swyddogaethau a chyfrifoldebau, wrth reswm, wedi'u trosglwyddo i Gymru oddi wrth Lywodraeth y DU a throsglwyddwyd rhywfaint o gymorth ariannol ar gyfer y cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni fu'n ddigonol i ateb y galw cynyddol am y gwasanaethau hynny. Mae'r diffyg hwn yn amlygu ymhellach fod angen i Lywodraeth y DU weithredu fformiwla cyllido tecach i Gymru, fel y mae comisiwn Holtham wedi'i argymhell. Rwy'n siŵr y byddwch chi'n dweud hynny wrth Brif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys ddydd Llun nesaf, Peter.

Peter Black: I am not surprised that you tried not to answer my question, Minister, but I am surprised that you do not understand that one of the reasons why end-year flexibility has been ended is because of its abuse in Scotland, where reserves of £3.5 billion have been built up. By ending end-year flexibility carry over, we are at least addressing an imbalance in the Barnett formula.

Peter Black: Ni synnaf eich bod wedi ceisio peidio ag ateb fy nghwestiwn, Weinidog, ond rwy'n synnu nad ydych yn deall mai un o'r rhesymau pam y mae hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn wedi dod i ben yw oherwydd ei gam-drin yn yr Alban, lle mae cronfeydd wrth gefn o £3.5 biliwn wedi'u cronni. Drwy roi pen ar ddwyn drosodd hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn, rydym yn mynd i'r afael ag anghydbwysedd yn fformiwla Barnett o leiaf.

I understand that you accept that we have not had the full transfer of funds, and you recognise that that is a failure of the previous Government and the agreements made with it. We will be taking that up with Danny Alexander, but will you also take that up, now that it is in the open? How much money will you ask the Treasury to give to the Assembly Government to make up that shortfall?

Deallaf eich bod yn derbyn nad ydym wedi cael y trosglwyddiad llawn o gyllid, a'ch bod yn cydnabod mai methiant y Llywodraeth flaenorol yw hwnnw a'r cytundebau a wnaethpwyd gyda hi. Byddwn yn sôn am hynny wrth Danny Alexander, ond a wnewch chi hefyd fynd ar drywydd hynny, am ei fod bellach yn hysbys? Faint o arian y byddwch chi'n gofyn i'r Trysorlys ei roi i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i wneud iawn am y diffyg hwnnw?

Jane Hutt: I wonder if you are standing up for Wales when you dismiss the fact that we

Jane Hutt: Tybed a ydych chi'n amddiffyn Cymru pan ddiystyrwch y ffaith ein bod am

are to lose £400 million as a result of the loss of end-year flexibility. I hope that you will be bringing that to the attention of the Chief Secretary to the Treasury on Monday.

Effaith y Gyllideb

3. David Melding: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith cyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar Ganol De Cymru. OAQ(3)1223(BB)*

Jane Hutt: We will publish our spending plans this afternoon. Our spending plans are framed by the settlement that we received from the UK Government—the worst since devolution. Our challenge is to manage this settlement to minimise the impact in all parts of Wales and to deliver the best possible outcomes.

David Melding: I commend your final comment; that is absolutely the way that we should all behave. We should seek out efficiencies and smarter working. In that vein, will you commend the Vale of Glamorgan Council, particularly the foster care team? The team is now using new technology in the form of digital pens, which means that reports can be written immediately following visits—people do not necessarily have to return to the office. That has led to great efficiencies and a reduction in the number of overtime hours worked, sickness levels have fallen, and there have been general efficiency gains. As a further example, I understand that Barry Island Primary School is now taking the register on iPads, which greatly aids the analysis of absentees and has health and safety advantages. Again, it is a new and more effective form of working.

Jane Hutt: I am delighted to join you in commending the Vale of Glamorgan foster care team for the way in which it has embraced new technology. Indeed, I have also seen that as a result of an invest-to-save loan that we provided to Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board for its district nurses to do the same thing. Last night, I was able to get to Barry Island Primary School—Mr Andrews's former school—to congratulate it on winning yet another award

golli £400 miliwn o ganlyniad i golli hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn. Gobeithiaf y byddwch chi'n dod â hynny i sylw Prif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys ddydd Llun.

Impact of the Budget

3. David Melding: *Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of the Welsh Assembly Government's budget on South Wales Central. OAQ(3)1223(BB)*

Jane Hutt: Byddwn yn cyhoeddi ein cynlluniau gwariant y prynhawn yma. Mae'r setliad a gawsom gan Lywodraeth y DU—y gwaethaf ers datganoli—yn cyfyngu ar ein cynlluniau gwariant. Ein her yw rheoli'r setliad hwn i leihau'r effaith cymaint â phosibl ym mhob rhan o Gymru a sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau posibl.

David Melding: Cymeradwyaf eich sylw olaf; yn y ffordd honno'n union y dylem oll ymddwyn. Dylem chwilio am effeithlonrwydd a dulliau gweithio craffach. Yn hynny o beth, a wnewch chi gymeradwyo Cyngor Bro Morgannwg, yn enwedig y tîm gofal maeth? Mae'r tîm bellach yn defnyddio technoleg newydd ar ffurf pennau digidol, sy'n golygu bod modd llunio adroddiadau ar unwaith ar ôl ymweliadau—nid oes rhaid i bobl ddychwelyd i'r swyddfa o reidrwydd. Yn sgil hynny, cafwyd effeithlonrwydd mawr a gostyngwyd nifer yr oriau goramser a weithir, mae lefelau salwch wedi gostwng, ac enillwyd effeithlonrwydd cyffredinol. Er enghraifft bellach, deallaf fod Ysgol Gynradd Ynys y Barri bellach yn cadw'r gofrestr ar iPad, sy'n cynorthwyo'n fawr yn y broses o ddadansoddi absenolion ac sy'n fanteisiol o ran iechyd a diogelwch. Eto, mae'n ffordd newydd a mwy effeithiol o weithio.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf wrth fy modd yn ymuno â chi i gymeradwyo tîm gofal maeth Bro Morgannwg am y ffordd y mae wedi manteisio ar dechnoleg newydd. Rwyf hefyd wedi gweld hynny o ganlyniad i fenthyciad buddsoddi i arbed a ddarparasom i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro er mwyn i'w nyrsys ardal wneud yr un peth. Neithiwr, llwyddais i fynd i Ysgol Gynradd Ynys y Barri—hen ysgol Mr Andrews—i'w llongyfarch am ennill gwobr arall eto am fod

for being the best school in Wales for information and communications technology. I was told about the use of the iPad in the playground for registration.

Leanne Wood: Minister, listening to Nick Ramsay on behalf of the Tories earlier talking about the cuts made me feel as if I was in a George Orwell novel. Over the next few years, the Assembly will make the toughest budget decisions in its history, the blame for which lies squarely with his Government, which is seeking to make the public sector and the most vulnerable people in our society carry the can for a problem not of their making. I am sure that you share my concern that the socially regressive Tories and their collaborators, the Lib Dems, will make people in poverty even poorer. What hope can you give to the most vulnerable people in Wales, and those organisations that support them, who will be watching today's budget announcement with considerable anxiety?

Jane Hutt: This is a serious time for Wales and for the One Wales Government in taking these difficult decisions. The draft budget, which I will present this afternoon, and which you will just have to await, will take on board the importance of protecting the vulnerable, tackling child poverty, and supporting the economic recovery that will bring the jobs that are so important to the communities that we serve.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I remind Members that this is a question about South Wales Central.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, one of the dire needs in South Wales Central is the refurbishment of Cardiff Central and Queen Street stations. Network Rail tells me that, in the current year's budget, which has not been affected by anything dastardly—in your eyes—done by the UK Government, a small amount of money had been set aside for the refurbishment of a ticket office on the south side of Cardiff Central station. According to Network Rail, that money now appears to have disappeared. Indeed, the Deputy First

yr ysgol orau yng Nghymru am dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Soniwyd wrthyf am ddefnyddio'r iPad ar y buarth chwarae ar gyfer cofrestru.

Leanne Wood: Weinidog, wrth wrando ar Nick Ramsay ar ran y Toriaid yn gynharach yn siarad am y toriadau, roeddwn i'n teimlo fel petawn mewn nofel gan George Orwell. Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, bydd y Cynulliad yn gwneud y penderfyniadau cyllideb anoddaf yn ei hanes, ac ar ei Lywodraeth yntau'n llwyr y mae'r bai am hynny, sy'n ceisio gwneud i'r sector cyhoeddus a'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas ddwyn y baich ar gyfer problem nad ydynt yn gyfrifol amdani. Rwy'n siŵr ichi rannu fy mhryder y bydd y Toriaid sy'n ymgilio'n gymdeithasol a'u cydweithwyr, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn gwneud pobl mewn tloedi yn dlotach byth. Pa obaith y gallwch ei roi i'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yng Nghymru, a'r sefydliadau hynny sy'n eu cefnogi, a fydd yn gwylio cyhoeddiad cyllideb heddiw gan bryderu o ddifrif calon?

Jane Hutt: Mae hon yn adeg ddifrifol i Gymru ac i Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un wrth wneud y penderfyniadau anodd hyn. Bydd y gyllideb ddrafft, y byddaf yn ei chyflwyno'r prynhawn yma, ac y bydd rhaid ichi aros amdani, yn ystyried mor bwysig yw amddiffyn yr agored i niwed, mynd i'r afael â thloedi plant, a chefnogi gwellhad yr economi a fydd yn dod â'r swyddi sydd mor bwysig i'r cymunedau a wasanaethwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau mai cwestiwn am Ganol De Cymru yw hwn.

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, un o'r anghenion enbyd yng Nghanol De Cymru yw ailwampio gorsafoedd Canol Caerdydd a Stryd y Frenhines. Yn ôl Network Rail, yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn gyfredol, nad oes dim byd gwarthus wedi effeithio arni—yn eich tyb chi—a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU, roedd ychydig bach o arian wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer ailwampio swyddfa docynnau ar ochr ddeheuol gorsaf Canol Caerdydd. Yn ôl Network Rail, mae'r arian hwnnw bellach fel petai wedi diflannu. Yn

Minister, in a response to me, indicated that there was no money in his budget for that refurbishment. Why has the budget been reorganised in this way, in the middle of the financial year?

Jane Hutt: Jenny, you bemoan the fact that we do not have the capital available, but you do not seem prepared to take responsibility for the fact that your party, in coalition with the Conservatives, is making the biggest cut in the UK of 40 per cent to the capital budget. It is a serious point, because this is an issue—*[Interruption.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Jane Hutt: This issue is about infrastructure for transport, housing, schools and education. Let me remind you of the impact of the cuts. We had a June budget in which £183 million was taken from our budget for this year, and that included £47 million in capital funds. The responsibility lies at the doors of the Government that you support. It certainly does not lie at the door of this Government.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 4, OAQ(3)1210(BB), has been withdrawn.

Trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU

5. Nerys Evans: *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda Llywodraeth y DU. OAQ(3)1239(BB)*

Jane Hutt: I have met with the Chief Secretary to the Treasury bilaterally and with the Ministers for finance of the other devolved administrations.

Nerys Evans: Yr ydych wedi amlinellu'n glir y difrod y mae Llywodraeth glymblaid San Steffan wrthi'n ei wneud i economi Cymru, gan beryglu swyddi a thorri cyllideb i lefelau llwm iawn. Mae hyn uwchben annhegwch y tanwariant yng Nghymru dros y degawd diwethaf o ganlyniad i fformiwla Barnett. A allwch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni ynghylch y trafodaethau rhwng Llywodraeth

wir, dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, mewn ymateb i mi, nad oedd arian yn ei gyllideb ar gyfer y gwaith ailwampio hwnnw. Pam mae'r gyllideb wedi'i had-drefnu yn y ffordd hon, yng nghanol y flwyddyn ariannol?

Jane Hutt: Jenny, rydych yn cwyno am nad yw'r cyfalaf ar gael inni, ond nid ydych fel petaech yn fodlon cymryd cyfrifoldeb am y ffaith bod eich plaid chi, mewn clymblaid â'r Ceidwadwyr, yn gwneud y toriad mwyaf yn y DU o 40 y cant i'r gyllideb cyfalaf. Mae'n bwynt difrifol, oherwydd mae hwn yn fater—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud â seilwaith ar gyfer cludiant, tai, ysgolion ac addysg. Gadewch imi eich atgoffa chi o effaith y toriadau. Roedd gennym gyllideb ym mis Mehefin a oedd yn cynnwys £183 miliwn a gymerwyd o'n cyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn hon, ac roedd hynny'n cynnwys £47 miliwn o gyllid cyfalaf. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn gorwedd wrth ddrysau'r Llywodraeth a gefnogwch chi. Mae'n siŵr nad yw'n gorwedd wrth ddrws y Llywodraeth hon.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae cwestiwn 4, OAQ(3)1210(BB), wedi'i dynnu'n ôl.

Discussions with the UK Government

5. Nerys Evans: *What recent discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government. OAQ(3)1239(BB)*

Jane Hutt: Rwyf wedi cwrdd â Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys ar y ddwy ochr ac wedi cwrdd â Gweinidogion cyllid y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill.

Nerys Evans: You have clearly outlined the havoc that the Westminster Government coalition is wreaking on the Welsh economy, jeopardising jobs and cutting budgets to the bone. This is in addition to the past decade of unfair underinvestment in Wales under the Barnett funding formula. Can you give us an update on discussions between the Welsh Government and the UK Government to

Cymru a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ar ddiwygio'r fformiwla? Mae'n dda gweld consensws trawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad ar y pwynt hwn, ond a newidir y fformiwla cyllido mewn gwirionedd, neu a yw'n enghraifft arall mewn rhestr hir o ddiffyg llais a hygredd yr Aelodau Cynulliad y mae eu pleidiau wedi ffurfio Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ar y lefel Brydeinig?

Jane Hutt: I was pleased that we were able to be united in this Chamber to support the motion backing the Holtham commission's report. The report dealt in particular with the importance of reforming the Barnett formula and with instigating a funding floor, which would halt the convergence that disadvantages us under the terms of our financial settlement. Not only have I drawn this to the attention of the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, Danny Alexander, I have discussed it with him, and I am sure that the matter will be on the agenda at Monday's meeting of the Finance Committee.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Minister, one of the proposals in England is for a cancer drugs fund. In your discussions with the Westminster Government, have you managed to elicit any Barnett consequentials from such a fund, and if you have, will you make that money available to the national health service in Wales?

Jane Hutt: These are matters for the Minister for Health and Social Services in the Welsh Assembly Government.

1.50 p.m.

Alun Davies: Reading through the UK Government's budget, one of its more shocking aspects is the very different way in which Wales is treated to Scotland and Northern Ireland. Both of those countries have been given sweeteners in the settlement, whether that is a fossil fuel allowance, funding loans, or a way of resolving the collapse of the Presbyterian Mutual Society. What we have seen in Wales is the closure of Newport Regional Passport Office, the rejection of the Severn barrage, and the cancellation of the academy at St Athan. That is very different treatment for different parts

reform the formula? It is good to see cross-party consensus in the Assembly on this point, but will the funding formula actually be reformed, or is it just another in a long list of examples of those Assembly Members whose parties have formed the United Kingdom Government lacking influence and credibility at the British level?

Jane Hutt: Roeddwn yn falch y gallem fod yn unedig yn y Siambr hon i gefnogi'r cynnig sy'n cefnogi adroddiad comisiwn Holtham. Roedd yr adroddiad yn ymdrin yn arbennig â phwysigrwydd diwygio fformiwla Barnett ac yn ymdrin â sefydlu arian gwaelodol, a fyddai'n atal y cydgyfeirio sy'n ein hanfanteisio o dan delerau ein setliad ariannol. Rwyf wedi sôn am hyn wrth Brif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys, Danny Alexander, rwyf wedi'i drafod ag ef, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd y mater ar yr agenda yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyllid ddydd Llun.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Weinidog, un o'r cynigion yn Lloegr yw cynnig am gronfa cyffuriau canser. Yn eich trafodaethau â Llywodraeth San Steffan, a ydych wedi llwyddo i fynnu unrhyw symiau canlyniadol Barnett o gronfa felly, ac os felly, a fyddwch chi'n gwneud yr arian hwnnw ar gael i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: Materion yw'r rhain i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Alun Davies: Gan ddarllen cyllideb Llywodraeth y DU, un o'r agweddau mwy ysgytiol arni yw'r ffordd wahanol iawn y mae Cymru'n cael ei thrin o'i chymharu â'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae'r ddwy wlad hynny wedi cael cildyrnau yn y setliad, boed hwnnw'n lwfans tanwydd ffosil, benthyciadau cyllid, neu fodd o ddatrys methiant y Gymdeithas Gydfuddiannol Bresbyteriaidd. Yr hyn a welsom yng Nghymru yw cau Swyddfa Basbort Ranbarthol Casnewydd, gwrthod morglawdd Hafren, a chanslo'r academi yn Sain Tathan. Mae honno'n driniaeth wahanol iawn i

of the United Kingdom. Will you assure us, Minister, that you will continue to fight hard for Wales and to ensure that Wales is put at the top of the UK agenda? It appears that the two parties opposite are doing nothing about that.

Jane Hutt: I have made these points to the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, and at quadrilateral meetings of the Ministers for finance, and said that this is part of the respect agenda. Also, the Chancellor's spending review itself highlighted the importance of looking not only to protect the vulnerable, but to support those regions that have been particularly dependent on the public sector. We have lost out on the disrespect agenda in relation to the public spending settlement, and we have also not benefited from the infrastructure funds that are so important to capital investment.

Eleanor Burnham: Weinidog, pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael ar hyn o bryd gyda'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ynglŷn ag ariannu S4C a sicrhau dyfodol llewyrchus iddo?

Jane Hutt: That is a matter for the Minister for Heritage and I am sure that in the debate on S4C this afternoon more will be discussed and revealed.

Rhodri Morgan: Following the news overnight that George Osborne, the Chancellor of the Exchequer, is preparing to make available several billions to the Irish Republic, we can now see a pattern. Scotland is getting something extra in the renewables fund, Northern Ireland, as Alun Davies has just said, is getting something extra for the Presbyterian Mutual Society, the Irish Republic, for which George Osborne has absolutely no responsibility, will, we understand, get something extra. Therefore, the only part of these islands that is getting absolutely nothing apart from a £900 million reduction in the money available to it next year is Wales. Is that not a shocking indictment of where Wales stands in the priorities of this new, Con-Dem coalition?

wahanol rannau o'r Deyrnas Unedig. A wnewch chi ein sicrhau ni, Weinidog, y byddwch chi'n parhau i ymladd yn galed dros Gymru a sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei gosod ar frig agenda'r DU? Mae'n ymddangos nad yw'r ddwy blaid gyferbyn yn gwneud dim am hynny.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf wedi gwneud y pwyntiau hyn i Brif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys, ac mewn cyfarfodydd pedrochr o Weinidogion cyllid, ac wedi dweud bod hyn yn rhan o'r agenda parch. Hefyd, roedd adolygiad y Canghellor o wariant yn amlygu mor bwysig yw ceisio amddiffyn yr agored i niwed, ond hefyd cefnogi'r rhanbarthau hynny a fu'n arbennig o ddibynnol ar y sector cyhoeddus. Rydym ar ein colled ar yr agenda amharch mewn perthynas â'r setliad gwariant cyhoeddus, ac nid ydym wedi elwa ychwaith ar y cronfeydd seilwaith sydd mor bwysig i fuddsoddiad cyfalaf.

Eleanor Burnham: Minister, what discussions have you had with the Department for Culture, Media and Sport about funding S4C and ensuring that it has a prosperous future?

Jane Hutt: Mater yw hwnnw i'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd mwy'n cael ei drafod a'i ddatgelu yn y dadl ar S4C y prynhawn yma.

Rhodri Morgan: Yn dilyn y newyddion dros nos fod George Osborne, Canghellor y Trysorlys, yn paratoi i ryddhau sawl biliwn i Weriniaeth Iwerddon, gallwn weld patrwm erbyn hyn. Mae'r Alban yn cael rhywbeth ychwanegol yn y gronfa ynni adnewyddadwy, mae Gogledd Iwerddon, fel y mae Alun Davies newydd ei ddweud, yn cael rhywbeth ychwanegol i'r Gymdeithas Gydfuddiannol Bresbyteraidd, bydd Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, nad oes gan George Osborne gyfrifoldeb amdani o gwbl, yn cael rhywbeth ychwanegol, fel y deallwn. Felly, yr unig ran o'r ynysydd hyn nad yw'n cael dim byd o gwbl ar wahân i gwtogi £900 miliwn ar yr arian sydd ar gael iddi'r flwyddyn nesaf yw Cymru. Onid yw hynny'n ddiad cywilyddus o safle Cymru ym mlaenoriaethau'r glymblaid newydd Con-Dem hon?

Jane Hutt: That follows on from the point made earlier. It would be very good news indeed, and would demonstrate some influence from the other side of the Chamber, if we had good news about rail electrification. Are we going to get good news about rail electrification? So far, we have not had good news on any of the capital investments, nor, indeed, as Alun Davies described them, any of the sweeteners given to the other devolved administrations. We have the worst settlement in revenue and capital.

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n dilyn y pwynt a wnaethpwyd yn gynharach. Byddai'n newyddion da iawn yn wir, a byddai'n arwydd o ryw ddylanwad o ochr arall y Siambr, petai gennym newyddion da am drydaneiddio'r rheilffordd. A ydyn ni'n mynd i gael newyddion da am drydaneiddio'r rheilffordd? Hyd yn hyn, nid ydym wedi cael newyddion da am unrhyw un o'r buddsoddiadau cyfalaf, nac, yn wir, unrhyw un o'r cildyrnau, fel y'u disgrifiwyd gan Alun Davies, a roddwyd i'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Gennym ni mae'r setliad gwaethaf o ran refeniw a chyfalaf.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind Members that 'Con-Dem' is not the accepted term in the Chamber. It would be helpful if there were a little less noise from the right-hand side, so that we could hear what the questioners are saying.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwy'n atgoffa'r Aelodau nad 'Con-Dem' yw'r term a dderbynnir yn y Siambr. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol petai ychydig llai o sŵn o'r ochr dde, er mwyn inni allu clywed yr hyn y mae'r cwestiynwyr yn ei ddweud.

Toriadau Llywodraeth y DU

UK Government's Cuts

6. Sandy Mewies: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am doriadau Llywodraeth y DU i gyllideb cyfalaf Cymru. OAQ(3)1207(BB)*

6. Sandy Mewies: *Will the Minister make a statement on the UK Government's cuts to Wales' capital budget. OAQ(3)1207(BB)*

Jane Hutt: The UK Government announced that the Welsh capital budget will reduce by 40 per cent in real terms over the spending review period. This is significantly greater than the average reduction to departmental budgets and presents us with significant challenges.

Jane Hutt: Cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU y bydd cyllideb cyfalaf Cymru'n lleihau 40 y cant mewn termau real dros gyfnod yr adolygiad o wariant. Mae hyn yn llawer mwy na'r gostyngiad cyfartalog i gyllidebau adrannol ac mae'n cyflwyno heriau sylweddol inni.

Sandy Mewies: Minister, a massive 40 per cent real-terms cut in capital budgets will undoubtedly have major impacts on both public services and the private sector, and the 25 per cent hit that capital takes in the first year will be the most damaging. It will be very interesting to see, despite the noises off, how the Tories and Lib Dems justify the impact that it will have in their constituencies, and on their constituents, in the run-up to the election in May. They will blame anyone but themselves. I am particularly concerned about the capital projects and planned capital projects in my own constituency, Delyn, which may now be under threat. Minister, what are you doing to ensure that key capital projects across Wales can be protected in the face of these

Sandy Mewies: Weinidog, bydd toriad termau real enfawr o 40 y cant mewn cyllidebau cyfalaf yn siŵr o effeithio'n sylweddol ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus ac ar y sector preifat, a'r ergyd o 25 y cant i'r gyllideb yn y flwyddyn gyntaf fydd y mwyaf niweidiol. Bydd yn ddiddorol iawn gweld, er gwaethaf y sŵn y tu ôl, ym mha ffordd y bydd y Torïaid a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cyfiawnhau'r effaith a gaiff yn eu hetholaethau hwy, ac ar eu hetholwyr hwy, wrth nesáu at yr etholiad ym mis Mai. Byddant yn rhoi'r bai ar unrhyw un heblaw eu hunain. Rwy'n poeni'n arbennig am y prosiectau cyfalaf a'r prosiectau cyfalaf sydd wedi'u cynllunio yn fy etholaeth innau, Delyn, a all fod o dan fygythiad yn awr. Weinidog, beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i

devastating cuts?

Jane Hutt: It is important to recognise that it is only a month since we found out our budget settlement, and the capital settlement is significantly lower than our most cautious planning assumptions. We have to recognise that the management of our capital programme over the last few years has been to counteract directly the impact of the recession and to support the private sector to recover, particularly the construction industry. That is why we have brought forward capital and enabled that investment not only to be used for schools, housing and transport, but also to provide opportunities in relation to health. That investment has benefited your constituency as well as constituencies across Wales.

It is important to put on record that bringing forward capital funding of £28 million for the housing programme, £16.7 million for the economy and transport and £28.2 million for health and social services were the actions of a responsible Government. We did not make the capital cut this year, when the June budget asked us to make a cut of £47 million. We were announcing contracts for building schools when, in England, Michael Gove was cancelling contracts to build schools.

Paul Davies: Of course, budgets will be under pressure over the next few years as, unfortunately, cuts will have to be made to tackle this huge deficit. However, when deciding on major capital projects, will the Minister outline what criteria the Welsh Assembly Government will use to decide which capital projects will go ahead and which will not?

Jane Hutt: Thank you, Paul, for recognising the difficulties that we face in the Assembly Government as a result of the 40 per cent capital cut. We have laid out clearly what our priorities are. Importantly, there will be support for our public services, and the investment that we make in the public sector also has a beneficial impact on the private

sicrhau y gellir amddiffyn prosiectau cyfalaf allweddol ledled Cymru yn wyneb y toriadau distrywiol hyn?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig cydnabod mai dim ond mis yn ôl y cawsom wybod am ein setliad cyllideb, ac mae'r setliad cyfalaf yn llawer is nag ydoedd yn ein tybiaethau cynllunio mwyaf gofalus. Mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod mai dull rheoli ein rhaglen cyfalaf dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf fu gwrthweithio'n uniongyrchol effaith y dirwasgiad a chefnogi'r sector preifat i wella, yn arbennig y diwydiant adeiladu. Am y rheswm hwnnw yr ydym wedi dwyn cyfalaf ymlaen a chaniatáu i'r buddsoddiad hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer ysgolion, tai a chlundiant, ond hefyd i roi cyfleoedd mewn perthynas ag iechyd. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwnnw wedi bod o fudd i'ch etholaeth chi yn ogystal ag etholaethau ledled Cymru.

Mae'n bwysig cofnodi mai camau Llywodraeth gyfrifol oedd dwyn ymlaen £28 miliwn o gyllid cyfalaf i'r rhaglen dai, £16.7 miliwn i'r economi a chlundiant a £28.2 miliwn i iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Ni thorasom y cyfalaf eleni, pan ofynnodd cyllideb mis Mehefin inni dorri £47 miliwn. Roeddem yn cyhoeddi contractau i adeiladu ysgolion tra bu Michael Gove, yn Lloegr, yn canslo contractau i adeiladu ysgolion.

Paul Davies: Wrth reswm, bydd cyllidebau o dan bwysau dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf oherwydd, yn anffodus, bydd yn rhaid gwneud toriadau i fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg enfawr hwn. Fodd bynnag, wrth benderfynu ar brosiectau cyfalaf mawr, a wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa feini prawf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n eu defnyddio i benderfynu pa brosiectau cyfalaf a fydd yn mynd yn eu blaenau, a pha rai na fyddant?

Jane Hutt: Diolch, Paul, am gydnabod yr anawsterau a wynebwn yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ganlyniad i dorri 40 y cant o'r cyfalaf. Rydym wedi nodi ein blaenoriaethau'n glir. Yn bwysig, bydd cymorth i'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac mae'r buddsoddiad a wnawn yn y sector cyhoeddus hefyd yn effeithio'n fuddiol ar y

sector via contracts, particularly in the building of schools, hospitals and roads and in social housing. That is where we have made our investment through the strategic capital investment fund and the Ministers now have to make difficult decisions with regard to managing the 40 per cent cut to capital programmes.

Chris Franks: There is great concern about spending on school refurbishment and rebuilding following the cuts made by the UK Government. There is particular concern about the future of St Cyres School in Penarth and new schools in the west of Cardiff. What assurances can you give regarding capital funding ahead of this afternoon's announcement on the budget? Do you agree that in light of Conservative spending commitments on health, there would undoubtedly be massive cuts to education capital funding, which would hit our pupils, teachers and other school staff? Minister, the drop in the capital investment budget of 40 per cent could have a devastating impact on plans to provide modern, high-quality school and college buildings. I know that you are aware of the ambitious proposals to create a Penarth learning centre to replace St Cyres School and special needs schools. St Cyres has suffered from—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you come to the question please?

Chris Franks: What hope is there that the Welsh Government can financially support efforts to fund this scheme?

Jane Hutt: Some very difficult decisions will have to be made on the planned arrangements for school funding and rebuilding, as in the case of St Cyres School in Penarth and Dinas Powys. The twenty-first century schools programme is a partnership with local government. The Vale of Glamorgan Council was advised in July that the Assembly Government had approved in principle an application for a capital grant for the Penarth learning community. However, the pressure that we face from the capital budget means that, when business planning with the authority, we have to look very carefully at

sector preifat drwy gontractau, yn enwedig o ran adeiladu ysgolion, ysbytai a ffyrdd ac mewn tai cymdeithasol. Yno y gwnaethom ein buddsoddiad drwy'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol ac mae'n rhaid bellach i'r Gweinidogion wneud penderfyniadau anodd o ran rheoli'r toriad o 40 y cant i raglenni cyfalaf.

Chris Franks: Pryderir yn fawr am wario ar ailwampio ac ailadeiladu ysgolion yn dilyn y toriadau a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU. Pryderir yn arbennig am ddyfodol Ysgol St Cyres ym Mhenarth ac ysgolion newydd yng ngorllewin Caerdydd. Pa sicrhad y gallwch ei roi ynghylch cyllid cyfalaf o flaen cyhoeddiad y prynhawn yma ar y gyllideb? A ydych chi'n cytuno, yng ngoleuni ymrwymadau gwariant y Ceidwadwyr ar iechyd, y byddai toriadau enfawr yn anochel i gyllid cyfalaf addysg, a fyddai'n bwrw ein disgyblion, ein hathrawon a staff ysgol eraill? Weinidog, gallai'r gostyngiad o 40 y cant yn y gyllideb buddsoddi cyfalaf effeithio mewn modd dinistriol ar gynlluniau i ddarparu adeiladau ysgol a choleg modern a graenus. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r cynigion uchelgeisiol i greu canolfan ddysgu Penarth yn lle Ysgol St Cyres ac ysgolion anghenion arbennig. Mae Ysgol St Cyres wedi dioddef o—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch chi ofyn y cwestiwn os gwelwch yn dda?

Chris Franks: Pa obaith sydd y gall Llywodraeth Cymru roi cymorth ariannol i'r ymdrechion i ariannu'r cynllun hwn?

Jane Hutt: Bydd rhaid gwneud rhai penderfyniadau anodd iawn am y trefniadau a gynlluniwyd i ariannu ac ailadeiladu ysgolion, fel yn achos Ysgol St Cyres ym Mhenarth a Dinas Powys. Partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol yw rhaglen ysgolion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dywedwyd wrth Gyngor Bro Morgannwg ym mis Gorffennaf fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cymeradwyo mewn egwyddor gais am grant cyfalaf ar gyfer cymuned ddysgu Penarth. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pwysau a wynebwn o'r gyllideb cyfalaf yn golygu, wrth gynllunio busnes gyda'r awdurdod, fod yn rhaid inni

all these important schemes, as the Minister will be doing in partnership with local government.

I will also return to the point that was made about the capital programme. We sought to ensure not only that our capital programme would provide fiscal stimulus for the construction sector and other parts of the private sector, but also that we had the best possible facilities to deliver health and education. Edwina made the point last week, in the opposition debate on health spend, that if you invest in capital, you can save on revenue costs for maintenance.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 7, OAQ(3)1246(BB), has been withdrawn.

2.00 p.m.

Dyranu Cyllid ar gyfer y Portffolio Plant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes

8. Chris Franks: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyraniad cyllid ar gyfer y portffolio plant, addysg a dysgu gydol oes. OAQ(3)1222(BB)*

Jane Hutt: The allocation of funding to the children, education and lifelong learning portfolio is undertaken as part of our annual planning process. The current year's allocation, as set out in the final budget of December 2009, amounts to over £1.8 billion. We are publishing the draft budget later today.

Chris Franks: Wales has high levels of under-25s who are not in education, employment or training, particularly in Rhondda Cynon Taf. The number of job placements in Wales has dropped by 31,000, according to the latest UK Government figures. Do you agree with Plaid's call to protect money spent on schools and skills, in light of the cuts imposed by Ministers in London? Also, what money will be made available to fund a new national literacy plan that will provide support for learners aged seven and eight? Minister, would you agree that the opposition's commitment on health spending is absolute fantasy economics and could mean that the money spent on schools,

edrych yn ofalus iawn ar yr holl gynlluniau pwysig hyn, fel y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei wneud mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol.

Dychwelaf hefyd i'r pwynt a wnaethpwyd am y rhaglen cyfalaf. Ceisiasom sicrhau y byddai ein rhaglen cyfalaf yn rhoi hwb ariannol i'r sector adeiladu a rhannau eraill o'r sector preifat, ond bod gennym hefyd y cyfleusterau gorau posibl i gyflawni iechyd ac addysg. Dywedodd Edwina'r wythnos diwethaf, yn nadl yr wrthblaid am wariant iechyd, y gallwch arbed ar gostau refeniw ar gyfer cynnal a chadw os buddsoddwch chi mewn cyfalaf.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae Cwestiwn 7, OAQ(3)1246(BB), wedi'i dynnu'n ôl.

Allocation of Funding to the Children, Education and Lifelong Learning Portfolio

8. Chris Franks: *Will the Minister make a statement regarding the allocation of funding to the children, education and lifelong learning portfolio. OAQ(3)1222(BB)*

Jane Hutt: Mae cyllid yn cael ei ddyrannu i'r portffolio plant, addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn rhan o'n proses gynllunio flynyddol. Mae dyraniad y flwyddyn gyfredol, fel y'i nodir yng nghyllideb derfynol mis Rhagfyr 2009, yn fwy na £1.8 biliwn. Rydym yn cyhoeddi'r gyllideb ddrafft yn ddiweddarach heddiw.

Chris Franks: Mae yng Nghymru lefelau uchel o bobl dan 25 nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant, yn arbennig yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae nifer y lleoliadau swydd yng Nghymru wedi syrthio 31,000, yn ôl ffigurau diweddaraf Llywodraeth y DU. A ydych chi'n cytuno â chais Plaid i warchod arian sy'n cael ei wario ar ysgolion a sgiliau, yng ngoleuni'r toriadau a orfodwyd gan Weiniogion yn Llundain? Hefyd, pa arian a fydd ar gael i ariannu cynllun llythrennedd cenedlaethol newydd a fydd yn rhoi cymorth i ddysgwyr saith ac wyth oed? Weiniog, a fydddech chi'n cytuno bod ymrwymiad yr wrthblaid i wariant iechyd yn economeg ffantasi llwyr ac y gallai olygu cwtogi

skills and training is cut by a quarter?

Jane Hutt: The Chamber welcomed the education budget for the current financial year, in which an additional £20 million was committed for investment in supporting skills-based responses to tackle unemployment among young people, including those in your region. This investment included the young person's guarantee. We had that £20 million commitment, but the Future Jobs fund, which was providing jobs for young people, including those in your region, was cancelled by the new UK coalition Government. This went against the needs of, and opportunities for, the young people whom you seek to represent.

Darren Millar: Minister, as you know, there are reviews under way across Wales in respect of modernising primary school services, particularly in Conwy, Denbighshire and other parts of north Wales. There is a great deal of anxiety about schools such as Ysgol Betws Gwerful Goch in my constituency. Clearly, the schools budget is very important in helping to maintain small rural schools in communities that need to retain them. Very often, those small schools are at the heart of their communities. What assurances can you give—in respect of your claims about wanting to protect the schools budget—that there will be sufficient resources in the draft budget to be released this afternoon to ensure that schools like that can continue to exist in the future?

Jane Hutt: I suggest that you wait until the draft budget announcement this afternoon, Darren.

Gwerth am Arian

9. Joyce Watson: *Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau gwerth am arian ar draws adrannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. OAQ(3)1218(BB)*

Jane Hutt: The duty to safeguard public funds and ensure value for money is at the heart of all Assembly Government spending, especially in these challenging financial

chwarter ar yr arian sy'n cael ei wario ar ysgolion, sgiliau a hyfforddiant?

Jane Hutt: Croesawodd y Siambr y gyllideb addysg ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol, ac ynddi ymrwymwyd £20 miliwn ychwanegol i'w fuddsoddi mewn cefnogi ymatebion seiliedig ar sgiliau i fynd i'r afael a diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc, gan gynnwys y rheini yn eich rhanbarth chi. Roedd y buddsoddiad hwn yn cynnwys y warant i bobl ifanc. Roedd gennym yr £20 miliwn hwnnw o ymrwymiad, ond canslwyd Cronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol, a oedd yn darparu swyddi i bobl ifanc, gan gynnwys y rheini yn eich rhanbarth chi, gan Lywodraeth glymblaid newydd y DU. Roedd hyn yn groes i anghenion y bobl ifanc y ceiswch eu cynrychioli, ac yn groes i gyfleoedd iddynt.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, fel y gwyrddoch, mae adolygiadau wedi dechrau ledled Cymru o ran moderneiddio gwasanaethau ysgolion cynradd, yn arbennig yng Nghonwy, sir Ddinbych a rhannau eraill o'r gogledd. Mae llawer iawn o ofid am ysgolion fel Ysgol Betws Gwerful Goch yn fy etholaeth i. Yn amlwg, mae'r gyllideb ysgolion yn bwysig iawn wrth helpu i gynnal ysgolion gwledig bach mewn cymunedau y mae angen iddynt eu cadw. Yn aml iawn, mae'r ysgolion bach hynny wrth wraidd eu cymunedau. Pa sicrhad y gallwch ei roi—o ran eich honiadau am ddymuno gwarchod y gyllideb ysgolion—y bydd digon o adnoddau yn y gyllideb ddrafft i'w rhyddhau'r prynhawn yma i sicrhau bod ysgolion fel honno'n gallu parhau i fodoli yn y dyfodol?

Jane Hutt: Awgrymaf ichi aros tan i'r gyllideb ddrafft gael ei chyhoeddi'r prynhawn yma, Darren.

Value for Money

9. Joyce Watson: *What steps is the Minister taking to ensure value for money across Welsh Assembly Government departments. OAQ(3)1218(BB)*

Jane Hutt: Mae'r ddyletswydd i ddiogelu cyllid cyhoeddus ac i sicrhau gwerth am arian wrth wraidd holl wariant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn enwedig yn yr amseroedd

times. Maximising efficiency and ensuring value for money in public service delivery is central to the work of the efficiency and innovation board.

Joyce Watson: Thank you for that response, Minister. I am sure that you would like to stress, as you have, the importance of achieving value for money at a time when the comprehensive spending review has disproportionately affected Wales. There is, of course, a fine line between ensuring value for money and cutting vital services, as the UK Government has done in cutting child benefit, housing benefit and legal aid. Will you, Minister, give your assurances that you will endeavour to retain key services in the face of the poor deal that Wales has received from the Westminster Government through its comprehensive spending review?

Jane Hutt: Again, I am minded to say that you should wait for this afternoon's draft budget. However, we have been clear, throughout the process of planning for this difficult draft budget, in recognising that we were always going to play a part in reducing the UK deficit, and that our priority is protecting funding for health, schools, skills and universal benefits. Importantly, we also recognise that these priorities are even more important in light of the unfair settlement that Wales has received in the spending review, with a funding formula that is unfair anyway. We also recognise that we have a responsibility to support the recovery of the economy in Wales.

David Melding: Promoting efficiency in public spending is obviously a key part of achieving outcomes. I am pleased that you recognise that, whatever our differences on performance. In my experience, many departments fail to make a distinction between monitoring and evaluating. These key skills need to be promoted among those who are responsible for the oversight of public sector budgets.

Jane Hutt: That is a fair point, David. Clearly, the importance of distinguishing

ariannol heriol hyn. Mae sicrhau'r effeithlonrwydd mwyaf a gwerth am arian wrth gyflawni gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wrth wraidd gwaith y bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi.

Joyce Watson: Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Rwy'n siŵr yr hoffech bwysleisio, fel y gwnaethoch, mor bwysig yw cael gwerth am arian ar adeg pan mae'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant wedi effeithio'n anghymesur ar Gymru. Wrth reswm, llinell denau sydd rhwng sicrhau gwerth am arian a thorri gwasanaethau hanfodol, fel y mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi'i wneud wrth dorri budd-dal plant, budd-dal tai a chymorth cyfreithiol. A wnewch chi, Weinidog, sicrhau y byddwch chi'n ymdrechu i gadw gwasanaethau allweddol yn wyneb y fargen sâl a gafodd Cymru gan Lywodraeth San Steffan drwy ei hadolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant?

Jane Hutt: Eto, mae'n rhaid imi ddweud y dylech aros am y gyllideb ddrafft y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, rydym wedi bod yn glir, drwy gydol y broses o gynllunio ar gyfer y gyllideb ddrafft anodd hon, wrth gydnabod ein bod bob amser yn mynd i chwarae rhan mewn lleihau diffyg y DU, ac mai ein blaenoriaeth ni yw amddiffyn cyllid i iechyd, ysgolion, sgiliau a buddion i bawb. Yn bwysig, rydym hefyd yn cydnabod bod y blaenoriaethau hyn yn bwysicach byth yng ngoleuni'r setliad annheg a gafodd Cymru yn yr adolygiad o wariant, gyda fformiwla ariannu sy'n annheg beth bynnag. Rydym yn cydnabod hefyd fod gennym gyfrifoldeb i gefnogi economi Cymru i wella.

David Melding: Mae'n amlwg bod hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn rhan allweddol o gyflawni canlyniadau. Rwy'n falch eich bod yn cydnabod hynny, ni waeth beth yw ein gwahaniaethau o ran perfformiad. Yn fy mhrofiad i, mae llawer o adrannau'n methu â gwahaniaethu rhwng monitro a gwerthuso. Mae angen i'r sgiliau allweddol hyn gael eu hyrwyddo ymhlith y rheini sy'n gyfrifol am oruchwylio cyllidebau sector cyhoeddus.

Jane Hutt: Mae hwnnw'n bwynt teg, David. Yn amlwg, dylai pwysigrwydd gwahaniaethu

between monitoring and evaluation should steer our spending decisions. Certainly, that is part of the intention of the efficiency and innovation programme.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Would you agree, Minister, that the important thing—I am sure that you have done this—is to look at the budget in a holistic manner? You have to balance cutting back in certain areas with investing in other areas in order to ensure that Wales is able to get out of the recession. Do you agree that ring-fencing 40 per cent, or perhaps more, of the budget would mean that you had little or no room for manoeuvre to invest in the economy to ensure that Wales gets out of this recession?

Jane Hutt: It is important to consider the determinants of health and ill health. If you invest in housing and support for social services, and if you tackle child poverty, you are preventing ill health, which can be very costly for the NHS. It is important that we look at this from a holistic point of view. That certainly came out in my budget tour and discussions. People told me to look at prevention, at public health and at making sure that we stop people from being ill. We can do that by making sure that we have good housing and good job opportunities, and by protecting the most vulnerable.

Mick Bates: I have already raised concerns about the proposed changes to trunk road agreements under which your Government expects to deliver savings through the abolition of the Mid Wales Trunk Road Agency. I am concerned that, in Scotland, similar changes to trunk road agreements led to a significant loss of business for the local authorities that deliver the agreements. What analysis has been undertaken across the Welsh Government departments with responsibility for transport and local government to assist the value for money impact on local authorities that have previously delivered the trunk road agreement?

Jane Hutt: I answered this question in my

rhwng monitro a gwerthuso lywio ein penderfyniadau gwariant. Yn sicr, mae hynny'n rhan o fwriad y rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A fydddech chi'n cytuno, Weinidog, mai'r peth pwysig—rwy'n siŵr eich bod wedi gwneud hyn—yw edrych ar y gyllideb mewn modd cyfannol? Mae'n rhaid ichi gael cydbwysedd rhwng cwtogi mewn rhai meysydd a buddsoddi mewn meysydd eraill er mwyn sicrhau bod Cymru'n gallu dod allan o'r dirwasgiad. A ydych chi'n cytuno y byddai neilltuo 40 y cant o'r gyllideb, neu ragor efallai, yn golygu na fyddai gennych fawr o le i symud, os o gwbl, er mwyn buddsoddi yn yr economi i sicrhau bod Cymru'n dod allan o'r dirwasgiad hwn?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig ystyried penderfynyddion iechyd ac afiechyd. Os buddsoddwch mewn tai a chymorth i wasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac os ewch i'r afael â thlodi plant, rydych chi'n atal afiechyd, sy'n gallu bod yn gostus iawn i'r GIG. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried hyn o safbwynt cyfannol. Roedd hynny'n bendant yn amlwg yn fy nhaith a'm trafodaethau cyllideb. Dywedodd pobl wrthyf am edrych ar atal, ar iechyd y cyhoedd ac ar sicrhau yr ataliwn pobl rhag bod yn sâl. Gallwn wneud hynny drwy sicrhau bod gennym dai da a chyfleoedd swyddi da, a thrwy amddiffyn y rheini sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed.

Mick Bates: Rwyf eisoes wedi codi pryderon am y newidiadau arfaethedig mewn cytundebau cefnffyrdd lle mae eich Llywodraeth yn disgwyl arbed drwy ddiddymu Asiantaeth Cefnffyrdd Canolbarth Cymru. Rwy'n pryderu bod newidiadau tebyg mewn cytundebau cefnffyrdd, yn yr Alban, wedi arwain at golli busnes sylweddol i'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n cyflenwi'r cytundebau. Pa ddadansoddiad a wnaethpwyd ar draws adrannau Llywodraeth Cymru sydd â chyfrifoldeb am drafnidiaeth a llywodraeth leol i gynorthwyo'r effaith gwerth am arian ar awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi cyflenwi'r cytundeb cefnffyrdd o'r blaen?

Jane Hutt: Atebais y cwestiwn hwn yn fy

capacity as Minister for business yesterday and said that consultation was ongoing in relation to the Mid Wales Trunk Road Agency arrangements. Following on from David's point, I made the point very clearly that this is about ensuring that we have the best efficiency gain for the delivery of our services. That will mean some tough and hard choices about who delivers what and where. I know that that is also part of Carl Sargeant's review of the delivery of local government services.

Lynne Neagle: Do you agree, Minister, that attacking the Assembly Government demonstrates the sheer brass neck of the Conservative Party? The Assembly Government has been dealt a very hard hand and is trying very hard to mitigate the effects of significant cuts in public services to protect the people of Wales.

Jane Hutt: Yes. It is my responsibility this afternoon, after I have answered questions, to table the most difficult budget since devolution. It will be the most difficult budget for a generation given the cuts in public spending. It behoves the whole Assembly to rise up to the challenge of being responsible in how we protect the most vulnerable, support our economic recovery and make sure that we are clear about our priorities. If we are clear, as a Government, about our principles and our priorities, it will steer us and guide us through this very difficult and taxing time. We seek to serve the people and the economy of Wales.

rhinwedd yn Weinidog dros fusnes ddoe a dywedais fod ymgynghoriad yn parhau mewn perthynas â threfniadau Asiantaeth Cefnffyrdd Canolbarth Cymru. Gan ddilyn pwynt David, eglurais yn gynnar iawn fod hyn yn ymwneud â sicrhau yr enillwn yr effeithlonrwydd gorau am gyflenwi ein gwasanaethau. Bydd hynny'n golygu rhai penderfyniadau caled ynghylch pwy sy'n cyflenwi beth a ble. Gwn fod hynny hefyd yn rhan o adolygiad Carl Sargeant o gyflenwi gwasanaethau llywodraeth leol.

Lynne Neagle: A ydych chi'n cytuno, Weinidog, fod ymosod ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn arddangos amarch llwyr y Blaid Geidwadol? Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cael cam gwag ac mae'n ceisio'n galed iawn lliniaru effeithiau toriadau sylweddol mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i amddiffyn pobl Cymru.

Jane Hutt: Ydw. Fy nghyfrifoldeb i'r prynhawn yma, ar ôl imi ateb cwestiynau, yw cyflwyno'r gyllideb anoddaf ers datganoli. Hon fydd y gyllideb anoddaf i genhedlaeth o ystyried y toriadau mewn gwariant cyhoeddus. Mae'r Cynulliad cyfan dan rwymedigaeth i ateb yr her i fod yn gyfrifol yn y ffordd yr ydym yn amddiffyn y mwyaf agored i niwed, cefnogi ein heconomi i wella a sicrhau ein bod yn deall ein blaenoriaethau'n glir. Os ydyn ni'n glir, fel Llywodraeth, am ein hegwyddorion a'n blaenoriaethau, bydd yn ein llywio ac yn ein tywys drwy'r amser anodd a heriol iawn hwn. Ceisiwn wasanaethu pobl ac economi Cymru.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth Questions to the Minister for Heritage

Twristiaeth

1. Leanne Wood: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd twristiaeth i Gymru. OAQ(3)1327(HER)*

The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones): Latest research shows that tourism expenditure contributes around £4 billion annually to the Welsh economy and supports around 100,000 jobs. Unlike many other sectors, tourism is rooted in the country and the jobs created by tourism cannot be

Tourism

1. Leanne Wood: *Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of tourism to Wales. OAQ(3)1327(HER)*

Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones): Dengys yr ymchwil diweddaraf fod gwariant ar dwristiaeth yn cyfrannu tua £4 biliwn y flwyddyn at economi Cymru ac yn cefnogi tua 100,000 o swyddi. Yn wahanol i lawer o sectorau eraill, mae twristiaeth wedi'i gwreiddio yn y wlad

relocated to a country with lower labour costs.

Leanne Wood: There are very many reasons to visit Wales, but one is that our country has a unique culture and language. Visitors from America have already come here for the language boot camps organised by an organisation called Say Something in Welsh. These boot camps are held in Tresaith on the west coast.

2.10 p.m.

The popularity of our language in the United States is highlighted by the Say Something in Welsh website; users from nearly every American state have signed up for a free beginners course. Given that a recent report from Tourism Intelligence International, entitled 'How Americans will travel in 2015', said that US citizens will increasingly buy holidays with sense and sensibility and look for status and self-improvement on their holidays, do you think that there is room to explore the possibility of expanding the marketing of Wales as a cultural destination, not just for Americans as tourists but for people from all over the world?

Alun Ffred Jones: The simple answer is 'Yes, of course there is'. Language learning holidays are certainly big business in the west of Ireland, and there is an excellent example in north Wales, in Nant Gwrtheyrn on the Llŷn peninsula, where language courses and accommodation are offered in a former quarrying village. The centre received support from the Assembly Government to the tune of £350,000 in 2008, and has proved to be a great success. Other opportunities are offered by some of our universities, in Lampeter and Glamorgan. I also stress that less formal learning of the Welsh language is something that we are encouraging within the hospitality industry in general.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): Good afternoon, Minister. I asked you some time ago about the tourism advisory panel, which was set up following the demise of the Wales Tourist Board to provide advice and to help scrutinise Visit

ac ni ellir symud y swyddi a grëir gan dwristiaeth i wlad a chanddi gostau llafur is.

Leanne Wood: Mae llawer iawn o resymau dros ymweld â Chymru, ond un ohonynt yw diwylliant ac iaith unigryw ein gwlad. Bu ymwelwyr o America yma eisoes ar gyfer y gwrsylloedd iaith a drefnir gan gymdeithas o'r enw Say Something in Welsh. Cynhelir y gwrsylloedd hyn yn Nhresaith ar arfordir y gorllewin.

Amlygir mor boblogaidd yw ein hiaith yn yr Unol Daleithiau ar wefan Say Something in Welsh; mae defnyddwyr o bron pob talaith yn America wedi cofrestru ar gyfer cwrs am ddim i ddechreuwyr. O ystyried y dywedodd adroddiad diweddar gan Tourism Intelligence International, dan y teitl '*How Americans will travel in 2015*', y bydd dinasyddion yr Unol Daleithiau'n gynyddol yn prynu gwyliau gyda synnwyr a theimladrwydd ac yn chwilio am statws a hunanwelliant ar eu gwyliau, a ydych chi'n credu bod cyfle i archwilio'r posibilrwydd o farchnata Cymru'n ehangach fel cyrchfan diwylliannol, nid i Americanwyr yn unig fel twristiaid ond i bobl o bedwar ban?

Alun Ffred Jones: Yr ateb syml yw 'Ydw, wrth gwrs'. Mae'n sicr bod gwyliau dysgu iaith yn fusnes mawr yng ngorllewin Iwerddon, ac mae enghraifft ragorol yng ngogledd Cymru, yn Nant Gwrtheyrn ym Mhen Llŷn, lle cynigir cyrsiau iaith a llety mewn hen bentref chwarela. Cafodd y ganolfan £350,000 o gymorth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 2008, a bu'n llwyddiant ysgubol. Cynigir cyfleoedd eraill gan rai o'n prifysgolion, yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan a Morgannwg. Pwysleisiaf hefyd fod dysgu Cymraeg mewn modd llai ffurfiol yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei annog yn y diwydiant lletygarwch yn gyffredinol.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Prynawn da, Weinidog. Gofynnais ichi ychydig yn ôl am y panel cynghori ar dwristiaeth, a sefydlwyd ar ôl cwmp Bwrdd Croeso Cymru i roi cyngor ac i helpu i graffu ar Croeso Cymru. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn

Wales. I think that it meets six times a year, but it does not publish agendas or minutes. Will the Minister tell us why that is? If we are to scrutinise Visit Wales, it would help if we had some indication of what the tourism advisory panel's advice is.

Alun Ffred Jones: I was unaware that the deliberations of the partnership were not public knowledge. It is an open forum for wide-ranging discussions, and it is currently discussing skills within the tourism industry, which is an important issue. There are open and robust exchanges within the panel, and I appreciate the work that it does. I will certainly look into the issue that you have raised. If it is deemed to be of advantage to the Assembly in general, I will certainly consider it.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for that response from the Minister. It would be of use to Members. I very much value the work that the panel does, which I am sure is of great assistance to the tourism industry. However, a published record would help us to properly scrutinise the activities of Visit Wales. If an agenda were published in advance, if it is an open meeting—I was unaware of that—it would mean that people could go along to hear what is discussed.

Alun Ffred Jones: I may have misled you there. It is not an open meeting—I am sorry; I did not mean to say that. What I meant to say was that the discussions are open and free-ranging and that the advisory panel is in charge of the agenda and all its deliberations. However, I will certainly consider the matters that you have raised, as they are legitimate concerns.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, an important stimulant for tourism in Wales is the people who come here to watch international rugby matches. You will be well aware that those people will be badly affected if the proposed strike among Arriva Trains Wales drivers goes ahead. Minister, this is an issue that will not just impact on those who want to come to the rugby match from across Wales and beyond; it will also have an impact on our

cwrdd chwe gwaith y flwyddyn, ond nid yw'n cyhoeddi agendâu na chofnodion. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud pam wrthym? Os ydym am graffu ar Croeso Cymru, byddai'n helpu petai gennym ryw syniad o gyngor y panel cynghori ar dwristiaeth.

Alun Ffred Jones: Nid oeddwn i'n gwybod nad oedd trafodaethau'r bartneriaeth yn wybodaeth gyhoeddus. Mae'n fforwm agored i drafodaethau eang iawn, ac ar hyn o bryd mae'n trafod sgiliau yn y diwydiant twristiaeth, sy'n fater pwysig. Ceir trafodaethau agored a chadarn yn y panel, a gwerthfawrogaf y gwaith a wna. Byddaf yn siŵr o ystyried y mater a godasoch. Os ystyrir ei fod o fantais i'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol, byddaf yn siŵr o'i ystyried.

Nick Bourne: Rwy'n ddiolchgar am yr ymateb hwnnw gan y Gweinidog. Byddai o ddefnydd i'r Aelodau. Gwerthfawrogaf yn fawr iawn y gwaith a wna'r panel, ac rwy'n siŵr ei fod o gymorth mawr i'r diwydiant twristiaeth. Fodd bynnag, byddai cofnod cyhoeddedig yn ein helpu i graffu'n iawn ar weithgareddau Croeso Cymru. Pe byddai agenda'n cael ei gyhoeddi ymlaen llaw, os yw'n gyfarfod agored—nid oeddwn yn gwybod hynny—byddai'n golygu y gallai pobl fynd i glywed yr hyn a drafodir.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae'n bosibl imi eich camarwain yno. Nid cyfarfod agored mohono—mae'n flin gennyf; nid oeddwn wedi bwriadu dweud hynny. Yr hyn yr oeddwn wedi bwriadu ei ddweud oedd bod y trafodaethau'n agored ac yn rhydd a bod y panel cynghori yn gyfrifol am yr agenda a'i holl ystyriaethau. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn siŵr o ystyried y materion a godwyd gennych, am eu bod yn bryderon dilys.

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, un peth pwysig sy'n ysgogi twristiaeth yng Nghymru yw'r bobl sy'n dod yma i wylïo gemau rygbi rhyngwladol. Byddwch chi'n gwybod yn iawn y bydd y streic arfaethedig ymhlith gyrwyr Arriva Trains Cymru, os bydd yn mynd yn ei blaen, yn effeithio'n wael ar y bobl hynny. Weinidog, mae hwn yn fater na fydd yn effeithio'n unig ar y rheini sydd am ddod i'r gêm rygbi o rannau o Gymru a'r tu

reputation throughout the world. What discussions have you had with the Minister with responsibility for transport to ensure that efforts are led by the Government to encourage the two parties concerned to get around the table to sort the problem out, if at all possible, and to mitigate the problems that the proposed strike will cause?

Alun Ffred Jones: Any strike during an international match of any kind, especially a rugby international, would certainly have an adverse effect and would add to the traffic problems within the city. We would not wish to see that. I have not had any discussions with my colleague with regard to the strike and I am unaware of whether it is a UK-wide strike. If it is, our influence would be limited, but I am happy to have discussions about the issue. If we have any leverage, I am more than happy to do that.

Gwella Lefelau Gweithgarwch Corfforol

2. Andrew R.T. Davies: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am unrhyw gynllun gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella lefelau gweithgarwch corfforol yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)1337(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: In January, we launched 'Creating an Active Wales', which details actions and initiatives that the Welsh Assembly Government and partners will deliver to improve physical activity levels in Wales. Supporting this, the Change4Life campaign is helping families to move more, eat better and, hopefully, live longer.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you for that answer, Minister. One of the goals of 'One Wales' was to increase the number of coaches available for participation sports. One of the things that I come across in my travels—my sons play quite a bit of rugby—is the need to ensure sufficient voluntary rugby coaches at the village or community level. What initiatives has the Government undertaken to meet this 'One Wales' commitment in connection with governing bodies, namely the Welsh Rugby Union for

hwnt; bydd hefyd yn cael effaith ar ein henw da ledled y byd. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch â'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth i sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn arwain ymdrechion i annog y ddwy blaid dan sylw i eistedd o amgylch y bwrdd i ddatrys y broblem, os yw hynny'n bosibl o gwbl, ac i liniaru'r problemau y bydd y streic arfaethedig yn eu hachosi?

Alun Ffred Jones: Byddai unrhyw streic yn ystod gêm ryngwladol o unrhyw fath, yn enwedig gêm rygbi ryngwladol, yn bendant yn cael effaith andwyol a byddai'n ychwanegu at y problemau traffig yn y ddinas. Ni fyddem yn dymuno gweld hynny. Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau â'm cydweithiwr ynglŷn â'r streic ac nid wyf yn gwybod ai streic ledled y DU ydyw. Os felly, prin fyddai ein dylanwad, ond rwy'n fodlon trafod y mater. Os oes gennym unrhyw ddylanwad, rwy'n fwy na bodlon gwneud hynny.

Improve Physical Activity Levels

2. Andrew R.T. Davies: *Will the Minister provide an update on any Welsh Assembly Government initiative to improve physical activity levels in Wales. OAQ(3)1337(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: Ym mis Ionawr, lanswyd 'Creu Cymru Egnïol' gennym, sy'n disgrifio camau a mentrau y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i phartneriaid yn eu cyflenwi i wella lefelau gweithgarwch corfforol yng Nghymru. Gan gefnogi hyn, mae ymgyrch Newid am Oes yn helpu teuluoedd i symud mwy, bwyta'n well a, gobeithio, byw'n hirach.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Un o nodau 'Cymru'n Un' oedd cynyddu nifer yr hyfforddwyr sydd ar gael ar gyfer chwaraeon cyfranogi. Un o'r pethau yr wyf yn dod ar eu traws wrth deithio—mae fy meibion yn chwarae cryn dipyn o rygbi—yw bod angen sicrhau digon o hyfforddwyr rygbi gwirfoddol mewn pentrefi neu gymunedau. Pa fentrau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u sefydlu i fodloni'r ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un' hwn mewn cysylltiad â chyrrff llywodraethu, sef Undeb

rugby, or with local authorities?

Alun Ffred Jones: Sport Wales has launched an initiative to increase the number of coaches and there is a specific target to be met over a certain period. It is operating through the various sports bodies, which have direct contact with volunteers on the ground. It is working not only to increase the number of qualified coaches at all levels, including the higher levels, but also to increase the number of volunteers on the ground to help with situations such as those which you referred to. We have put additional money into the scheme during this year, and that will continue into the future, because we see this as the way to grow sport in general and also to increase the fitness levels of young people.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): Once we have solved the problems of volunteer coaches who are willing to give of their time and expertise to support sporting activity within their community, they will need somewhere to go. Creating good sporting facilities in our communities is vital to drive up participation levels. One such situation is that of Brecon Rugby Football Club, where children, both girls and boys, play rugby from the age of six. However, their ability to do so and to compete in leagues is hampered by a lack of facilities at the club's grounds. What discussions have you had with the sports council and with the Minister for budget ahead of this afternoon's budget about being able to provide resources from within your budget to help to improve sporting facilities throughout our communities?

Alun Ffred Jones: The issue of sporting facilities is difficult. As you know, there is huge pressure on local authorities, which would be increased if we were to ring-fence huge sections of the main Assembly Government budget. We are in discussions with local authorities, through Sport Wales in the main, to see how we can rationalise and sustain the present network of leisure centres and other sporting facilities. The problem to which you referred, which is usually caused

Rygbi Cymru ar gyfer rygbi, neu gydag awdurdodau lleol?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae Chwaraeon Cymru wedi lansio menter i gynyddu nifer yr hyfforddwyr ac mae targed penodol i'w gyrraedd dros gyfnod penodol. Mae'n gweithredu drwy'r amryw gyrff chwaraeon, sy'n cysylltu'n uniongyrchol â gwirfoddolwyr ar lawr gwlad. Gweithia nid yn unig i gynyddu nifer yr hyfforddwyr cymwysedig ar bob lefel, gan gynnwys y lefelau uwch, ond hefyd i gynyddu nifer y gwirfoddolwyr ar lawr gwlad i helpu gyda sefyllfaoedd fel y rheini y cyfeiriasoch atynt. Rydym wedi rhoi arian ychwanegol yn y cynllun yn ystod y flwyddyn hon, a bydd hynny'n parhau i'r dyfodol, oherwydd ystyriwn mai hon yw'r ffordd i dyfu chwaraeon yn gyffredinol a hefyd i gynyddu lefelau ffitrwydd pobl ifanc.

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Ar ôl inni ddatrys problemau hyfforddwyr gwirfoddol sy'n fodlon rhoi o'u hamser a'u harbenigedd i gefnogi gweithgarwch chwaraeon yn eu cymuned, bydd angen rhywle arnynt i fynd. Mae'n hanfodol creu cyfleusterau chwaraeon da yn ein cymunedau er mwyn cynyddu'r lefelau cyfranogi. Un sefyllfa felly yw Clwb Rygbi Aberhonddu, lle mae plant, yn ferched ac yn fechgyn, yn chwarae rygbi o chwech oed. Fodd bynnag, mae diffyg cyfleusterau ar dir y clwb yn rhwystro eu gallu i wneud hynny ac i gystadlu mewn cynghreiriau. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch â'r cyngor chwaraeon ac â'r Gweinidog dros y gyllideb cyn cyllideb y prynhawn yma ynghylch gallu darparu adnoddau o'ch cyllideb i helpu i wella cyfleusterau chwaraeon drwy ein cymunedau cyfan?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae mater cyfleusterau chwaraeon yn anodd. Fel y gwyddoch, mae pwysau anferth ar awdurdodau lleol, a byddai hynny'n cynyddu petaem yn neilltuo rhannau enfawr o brif gyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Rydym wrthi'n trafod ag awdurdodau lleol, drwy Chwaraeon Cymru yn bennaf, i weld sut gallwn resymoli a chynnal y rhwydwaith presennol o ganolfannau hamdden a chyfleusterau chwaraeon eraill. Mae'r broblem y

by a lack of pitches locally, is common and one that I could go on about, because it affects every community in Wales where you have local clubs that have a thorough system of sports teams from an early age, but find it extremely difficult to provide pitches for all of them. One answer that we have found in my neck of the woods is to ensure that there is good partnership working with the local authority and the local schools. Where that is done, it at least helps, but there is limited scope within my budget to provide such facilities, and the squeeze on lottery funding means that Sport Wales's ability to meet those demands have also been curtailed. Hopefully, that situation will change over the coming years.

2.20 p.m.

Mick Bates: One way to improve physical activity levels is to enable young Welsh people to achieve sporting excellence. A constituent of mine attends the high-performance Wrexham Tennis Academy, and he hoped to progress his tennis career through studying an advanced apprenticeship in sporting excellence, which helps young people to realise their potential. When I visited the centre, I was told that students from England receive £2,500 per annum to help fund their apprenticeships, yet Welsh students receive no support at all. Is that fair? What are you doing to ensure that we deliver these advanced apprenticeships in sporting excellence in all sports in Wales, so that my constituent, and other young Welsh students, receive the support that they deserve, and increase their physical activity?

Alun Ffred Jones: That is an issue for Sport Wales, in the main, and for the individual sporting authorities throughout Wales. They will spend their money in the way that they think best. As I explained, the main thrust of our policy at the moment is to increase the number of coaches, and some of those will be at the highest level, and others at volunteer level. I doubt whether the situation that you have described will continue for very long, given the deep cuts that are being made to the

cyfeiriasoch ati, a achosir fel arfer gan ddiffyg meysydd chwarae lleol, yn un gyffredin a gallwn ymhelaethu arni, am ei bod yn effeithio ar bob cymuned yng Nghymru lle mae clybiau lleol sydd â system drwyadl o dimau chwaraeon o oedran ifanc, ond sy'n ei chael yn anodd iawn darparu caeau i bob un ohonynt. Un ateb a ganfuom yn fy ardal i yw sicrhau bod gwaith partneriaeth da gyda'r awdurdod lleol a'r ysgolion lleol. Os gwneir hynny, mae'n helpu o leiaf, ond prin yw'r cyfle yn fy nghyllideb i ddarparu cyfleusterau felly, ac mae'r wasgfa ar gyllid y loteri'n golygu y cwtogwyd hefyd ar allu Chwaraeon Cymru i fodloni'r gofynion hynny. Y gobaith yw y bydd y sefyllfa honno'n newid dros y blynyddoedd i ddod.

Mick Bates: Un ffordd o wella lefelau gweithgarwch corfforol yw galluogi Cymry ifanc i gyflawni rhagoriaeth chwaraeon. Mae un o'm hetholwyr yn mynychu Academi Tennis Wrecsam perfformiad uchel, ac roedd yn gobeithio datblygu ei yrfa tennis drwy astudio uwch brentisiaeth mewn rhagoriaeth chwaraeon, sy'n helpu pobl ifanc i gyflawni hyd eithaf eu gallu. Pan ymwelais â'r ganolfan, dywedwyd wrthyf fod myfyrwyr o Loegr yn cael £2,500 y flwyddyn i helpu i ariannu eu prentisiaethau, ond eto nid yw myfyrwyr Cymru'n cael cymorth o gwbl. A ydy hynny'n deg? Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'r uwch brentisiaethau hyn mewn rhagoriaeth chwaraeon ym mhob math o chwaraeon yng Nghymru, fel bod fy etholwr i, a myfyrwyr ifanc eraill o Gymru, yn cael y cymorth a haeddant, ac yn gwneud mwy o weithgarwch corfforol?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mater yw hwnnw i Chwaraeon Cymru, yn bennaf, ac i'r gwahanol awdurdodau chwaraeon ledled Cymru. Byddant yn gwario eu harian yn y ffordd sydd orau yn eu tyb hwy. Fel yr eglurais, prif fwriad ein polisi ar hyn o bryd yw cynyddu nifer yr hyfforddwyr, a bydd rhai o'r rheini ar y lefel uchaf, ac eraill ar lefel wirfoddol. Nid wyf yn credu y bydd y sefyllfa a ddisgrifiasoch yn para'n hir iawn, o ystyried y toriadau dwfn sy'n cael eu gwneud

sports budget by the Westminster Government. Be that as it may, here in Wales, the decisions on how to spend the money are for the individual sporting authorities. There is support for some of our top-level athletes through Sport Wales.

Twristiaeth yng Ngorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro

3. Angela Burns: *Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i gefnogi twristiaeth yng Ngorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro. OAQ(3)1344(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: We have allocated £710,000 to South West Wales Tourism Partnership for 2010-11 for the promotion and development of its regional tourism priorities, which are aligned to our national priorities. We are also supporting the marketing area partnerships of Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire.

Angela Burns: Thank you for that answer, Minister. In your response earlier to Leanne Wood, you emphasised the importance of tourism to the economy of Wales, and the many millions of pounds that it contributes. I would like to raise some of the concerns of the walkers of Wales, because under the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000, public access routes should be kept open to the public, and yet, in south Wales in particular, this is not happening. For example, in Carmarthenshire less than 35 per cent of these routes are currently open and accessible to walkers, or anyone else who wishes to visit and enjoy our countryside. I wonder what you might be able to do to reverse that situation.

Alun Ffred Jones: The issue of keeping public paths open is a matter for the local authorities, in the main, and they decide on their spending priorities. There has always been pressure on this particular budget, as I know from my own experience, but if the situation has deteriorated in any particular county, then it would be better to address those concerns to the local council. We know that pathways and walking are important to the tourism industry, and in Pembrokeshire, of course, the coastal pathway is especially

i'r gyllideb chwaraeon gan Lywodraeth San Steffan. Beth bynnag am hynny, yma yng Nghymru, y gwahanol awdurdodau chwaraeon sy'n penderfynu sut i wario'r arian. Mae cymorth ar gael i rai o'n hathletwyr gorau drwy Chwaraeon Cymru.

Tourism in Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire

3. Angela Burns: *What steps is the Minister taking to support tourism in Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire. OAQ(3)1344(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: Rydym wedi dyrannu £710,000 i Bartneriaeth Twristiaeth De-orllewin Cymru ar gyfer 2010-11 i hyrwyddo a datblygu ei blaenoriaethau twristiaeth ranbarthol, sy'n gyson â'n blaenoriaethau cenedlaethol. Rydym hefyd yn cefnogi partneriaethau ardal farchnata sir Benfro a sir Gaerfyrddin.

Angela Burns: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yn eich ymateb yn gynharach i Leanne Wood, pwysleisiasoch mor bwysig yw twristiaeth i economi Cymru, ac mor bwysig yw'r miliynau lawer o bunnoedd y mae'n eu cyfrannu. Hoffwn sôn am rai o bryderon cerddwyr Cymru oherwydd, o dan Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000, dylid cadw llwybrau mynediad cyhoeddus ar agor i'r cyhoedd ond eto, yn ne Cymru'n arbennig, nid yw hyn yn digwydd. Er enghraifft, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae llai na 35 y cant o'r llwybrau hyn ar agor ac yn hygyrch i gerddwyr ar hyn o bryd, neu i unrhyw un arall sydd am ymweld a mwynhau ein cefn gwlad. Tybed beth allech chi ei wneud i unioni'r sefyllfa honno.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol, yn bennaf, yw cadw llwybrau cyhoeddus ar agor a hwy sy'n penderfynu eu blaenoriaethau gwariant. Bu pwysau bob amser ar y gyllideb arbennig hon, fel y gwn o'm profiad personol, ond os yw'r sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu mewn unrhyw sir arbennig, byddai'n well cyfeirio'r pryderon hynny at y cyngor lleol. Gwyddom fod llwybrau a cherdded yn bwysig i'r diwydiant twristiaeth, ac yn sir Benfro, wrth reswm, mae llwybr yr arfordir yn enwedig o effeithiol, gan ddenu

effective, bringing in millions of pounds annually. I am sure that you will join me in celebrating the fact that the Pembrokeshire coastline came second in *National Geographic's* list of the best world-wide coastal destinations.

Nerys Evans: Mae gorllewin Cymru yn drysor inni yn y maes twristiaeth, ac, fel y dywedoch, mae wedi dod yn ail yn rhestr lleoliadau arfordirol gorau'r byd *National Geographic*, sy'n destun balchder inni i gyd. Yn ogystal, mae'r cylchgrawn *Countryfile Magazine* wedi dyfarnu bod un castell yn yr etholaeth wedi cyrraedd y rhestr fer am yr adfail mwyaf rhamantus ym Mhrydain. Mae castell Llansteffan, sydd yn fy mhlwyf genedigol, yn lle hyfryd iawn. A gytunwch fod hyn yn newyddion da i'r economi lleol, gan dynnu sylw cynulleidfa ehangach ar draws Prydain at bentref a chastell Llansteffan? A fyddwch yn annog pobl i bleidleisio dros gastell Llansteffan ar wefan *Countryfile Magazine* cyn 26 Tachwedd?

Alun Ffred Jones: Yr ydych wedi gwneud y cais, a byddaf, wrth gwrs, yn cefnogi castell Llansteffan yn llawen, sy'n gastell hynod ramantus. Mae gan yr ardal nifer o atyniadau llwyddiannus eisoes, a brofir gan y ffigurau sy'n dangos nifer yr ymwelwyr i'r ardal. Bydd yr atyniadau hynny hefyd yn cael eu gwella dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, gan fod £4.5 miliwn o arian ychwanegol yn cael ei wario ar y prosiect Un Ardd Hanesyddol mewn ardal eang yn sir Gaerfyrddin, a hefyd £4 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar greu canolfan ddŵr ar arfordir sir Benfro. Felly, er gwaethaf y sefyllfa ariannol dynn sydd ohoni, mae arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi yn y diwydiant twristiaeth, a fydd o fudd mawr i'r ardal yn y dyfodol.

Cynllun Nofio am Ddim

4. Irene James: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynllun nofio am ddim Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. OAQ(3)1311(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: Free swimming in Wales continues to be successful. More than 650,000 free sessions were taken by children and young people in 2009-10, and over

miliynau o bunnoedd bob blwyddyn. Rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i ddathlu'r ffaith bod morlin sir Benfro wedi dod yn ail yn rhestr *National Geographic* o'r cyrchfannau arfordirol gorau yn y byd.

Nerys Evans: West Wales is a treasure in the area of tourism, and, as you said, has come second in *National Geographic's* list of the best coastlines in the world, of which we can all be proud. In addition, *Countryfile Magazine* has determined that one castle in the constituency has made the shortlist for the most romantic ruin in Britain. Llanstephan castle, which is in my birth parish, is very beautiful. Do you agree that this is good news for the local economy, drawing the attention of a wider audience across Britain to Llanstephan village and castle? Would you encourage people to vote for Llanstephan castle on *Countryfile Magazine's* website before 26 November?

Alun Ffred Jones: You have made the request, and I will, of course, readily support Llanstephan castle, which is wonderfully romantic. The area already has many successful attractions, which is proven by the figures of the number of visitors to the area. Those attractions will also be improved over the next few years, as an additional £4.5 million will be spent on the One Historic Garden project in the wider area in Carmarthenshire, and also £4 million on creating a water centre on the Pembrokeshire coast. Therefore, despite the tight financial situation, money is being invested in the tourism industry, which will be of great benefit to the area in future.

Free Swimming Scheme

4. Irene James: *Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's free swimming scheme. OAQ(3)1311(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae nofio am ddim yng Nghymru'n parhau i lwyddo. Manteisiwyd ar fwy na 650,000 o sesiynau am ddim gan blant a phobl ifanc yn 2009-10, a mwy na

700,000 by those aged 60 plus. We have now extended the scheme for young people to the weekends in line with our 'One Wales' commitment.

Irene James: Thank you for that response, Minister. As we are all aware, those who lead a healthier lifestyle cost the NHS far less and, on average, live longer. Exercise is a big part of any healthy lifestyle, and swimming is a great form of exercise. Everyone but the Tories opposite recognises that because of savage Liberal-Tory cuts, budgets are tight. I, however, feel strongly that cutting free swimming would, in the long term, be a false economy. Will you take this opportunity to once again express the Government's commitment to continuing the free swimming scheme?

Alun Ffred Jones: I am happy to do so. The free swimming scheme will continue to be supported in future. The scheme has been tweaked over the years and there will now be an increase in the number of structured sessions, so that more young people learn how to swim. They will then be able to continue with that pastime and, hopefully, be healthier throughout their lifetime.

Chris Franks: Does the Minister agree that for the scheme to be successful pools need to be open and accessible to those entitled to free swimming? I have received a number of representations from people affected by the closure of the Treherbert swimming pool, which was closed by Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council in April 2009. Will you congratulate the efforts of the local people who are trying to reopen the pool and to operate it as a community-led operative? I would also like to alert you to the lack of changing room hoists for disabled people at Barry swimming pool, making it almost impossible for severely disabled people to use the facility. Can your department discuss with the Vale of Glamorgan Council the free swimming scheme and facilities suitable for all?

Alun Ffred Jones: With reference to

700,000 gan y rheini sy'n 60 oed a hŷn. Rydym bellach wedi estyn y cynllun i bobl ifanc i'r penwythnosau yn unol â'n hymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un'.

Irene James: Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Fel y gwyddom oll, mae'r rheini â ffordd fwy iachus o fyw yn costio llawer llai i'r GIG ac, ar gyfartaledd, yn byw'n hirach. Mae ymarfer yn rhan fawr o unrhyw ffordd iachus o fyw, ac mae nofio'n ffordd wych o ymarfer. Mae pawb ond y Torïaid gyferbyn yn cydnabod bod cyllidebau'n dynn oherwydd toriadau gwyllt gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Torïaid. Fodd bynnag, rwyf fi'n teimlo'n gryf mai camgymeriad fyddai torri nofio am ddim, yn y tymor hir. A wnewch chi fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i fynegi unwaith eto ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i barhau'r cynllun nofio am ddim?

Alun Ffred Jones: Rwy'n falch o wneud hynny. Bydd y cynllun nofio am ddim yn parhau i gael ei gefnogi yn y dyfodol. Gwnaethpwyd mân addasiadau yn y cynllun dros y blynyddoedd a bydd nifer y sesiynau strwythuredig yn cynyddu bellach, fel bod mwy o bobl ifanc yn dysgu sut i nofio. Gallant barhau wedyn â'r gweithgaredd hwnnw a, gobeithio, bod yn fwy iachus drwy gydol eu hoes.

Chris Franks: A ydy'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen i byllau fod ar agor ac yn hygyrch i'r rheini sy'n gallu hawlio nofio am ddim, er mwyn i'r cynllun lwyddo? Rwyf wedi cael nifer o sylwadau gan bobl y mae cau pwll nofio Treherbert wedi effeithio arnynt, a gaewyd gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ym mis Ebrill 2009. A wnewch chi longyfarch ymdrechion y bobl leol sy'n ceisio ailagor y pwll a'i weithredu fel cydweithfa a arweinir gan y gymuned? Hoffwn hefyd roi gwybod ichi am y diffyg teclynnau codi i bobl anabl yn yr ystafelloedd newid ym mhwl nofio'r Barri, sy'n ei gwneud yn amhosibl bron i bobl ag anabledd difrifol ddefnyddio'r cyfleuster. A all eich adran drafod y cynllun nofio am ddim a chyfleusterau sy'n addas i bawb â Chyngor Bro Morgannwg?

Alun Ffred Jones: Gan gyfeirio at bwl

Treherbert swimming pool, I understand that a meeting involving Rhondda Cynon Taf council and Treherbert swimming pool action committee, which is now formally constituted, to discuss the matter has been arranged to take place later this week. It is worth noting that Sport Wales reports that across Wales about 15 local authority swimming pools have closed in the past few years, but 12 have opened and, if you include some of the private swimming pools, the number increases to 27.

With regard to Barry swimming pool, I have been advised that a hoist for people with disabilities to access the swimming pool is available at that location. However, I will make further inquiries.

Blaenoriaethau

5. Lynne Neagle: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweddill tymor hwn y Cynulliad. OAQ(3)1353(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: I remain committed to fulfilling my 'One Wales' commitments, including securing a thriving future for the Welsh language, encouraging more physical activity for better health, increasing tourism by maximising the economic value of our heritage, and modernising the public library network.

2.30 p.m.

Lynne Neagle: I know that you are well aware of my continued concerns regarding the decision to remove funding from Gwent Theatre. In your remit letter to the arts council, you state that it has a duty under the Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2010 towards combating child poverty in Wales, and one of the Welsh Government's 'One Wales' commitments is that high-quality cultural experiences be available to all people, irrespective of where they live or their background. I fail to see how the actions of the arts council, in removing provision from some of the poorest communities in Wales, complies with the Measure or your remit letter. While I appreciate that the arts council is an arm's-length body, it is meant to be accountable to the Assembly through you

nofio Treherbert, deallaf fod cyfarfod wedi'i drefnu rhwng cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf a phwyllgor gweithredu pwll nofio Treherbert, a gyfansoddwyd yn ffurfiol bellach, i drafod y peth yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon. Mae'n werth nodi bod Chwaraeon Cymru'n rhoi gwybod bod tua 15 o byllau nofio awdurdod lleol wedi cau ledled Cymru yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, ond bod 12 wedi agor ac, os byddwch yn cynnwys rhai o'r pyllau nofio preifat, mae'r nifer yn cynyddu i 27.

O ran pwll nofio'r Barri, rwyf wedi clywed bod teclyn codi ar gael yno er mwyn i bobl ag anableddau fynd i mewn i'r pwll nofio. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf ymholiadau pellach.

Priorities

5. Lynne Neagle: *Will the Minister outline his priorities for the remainder of this Assembly term. OAQ(3)1353(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: Rwyf wedi ymrwymo o hyd i fodloni f'ymrwymiaidau 'Cymru'n Un', gan gynnwys sicrhau dyfodol ffyniannus i'r iaith Gymraeg, annog mwy o weithgarwch corfforol er gwell iechyd, cynyddu twristiaeth drwy wneud y mwyaf o werth economaidd ein treftadaeth, a moderneiddio'r rhwydwaith o lyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus.

Lynne Neagle: Gwn eich bod yn gwybod yn iawn am fy mhryderon parhaus ynghylch y penderfyniad i dynnu cyllid oddi ar Theatr Gwent. Yn eich llythyr cylch gwaith i'r cyngor celfyddydau, dywedwch fod ganddo ddyletswydd o dan Fesur Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2010 tuag at ymladd tlodi plant yng Nghymru, ac un o ymrwymiaidau Llywodraeth Cymru yn 'Cymru'n Un' yw bod profiadau diwylliannol o ansawdd ar gael i bawb, ni waeth ble mae'n byw na beth yw ei gefndir. Ni allaf weld sut mae camau'r cyngor celfyddydau, wrth waredu darpariaeth o rai o'r cymunedau tlotaf yng Nghymru, yn cydymffurfio â'r Mesur na'ch llythyr cylch gwaith. Er fy mod i'n gwerthfawrogi mai corff hyd braich yw'r cyngor celfyddydau, dylai fod yn atebol i'r Cynulliad drwoch chi

as Minister. Will you, in the interests of the poorest communities, and in particular some of the poorest children in Wales, intervene in this matter to review this decision?

Alun Ffred Jones: The arm's-length principle is an important one, and I do not regard it as my duty to intervene in individual decisions. I have raised the matter with the arts council and I met with its representatives this morning. In fact, I also met with some members of the theatre and education group to which you referred. The arts council has been reviewing its policy in this area and it will be making a statement in the coming months to show exactly how it intends to carry out its remit and address the issue of arts experiences for young people. I hope that that will enable people to have a constructive dialogue with the arts council, and with me, to see whether that is effective in the long-term.

Mohammad Asghar: In an answer to a written question, you outlined some of the discussions your officials were having with other nations that may wish to base their pre-games training for London 2012 in Wales. I welcome the fact that a memorandum of understanding has been signed with the full Paralympic teams from Australia, New Zealand, and South Africa, and I hope that other teams will look to utilise the 31 Olympic-standard training sites we have in Wales. Minister, will you provide an update on the progress of ongoing discussions with the Irish triathlon team, the Trinidad and Tobago Olympic team and the US Paralympic track cycling team, as well as the other Olympic and Paralympic committees that have visited Wales and are yet to make their decision?

Alun Ffred Jones: Many of the facilities are already almost fully booked for the pre-Olympic period, but there are ongoing discussions. I will certainly write to you with all the relevant details about the state of play with regard to some of the countries that you referred to and any others that have come to our attention recently.

fel Gweinidog. A wnewch chi ymyrryd yn y mater hwn, er budd y cymunedau tlotaf, ac yn arbennig rhai o'r plant tlotaf yng Nghymru, i adolygu'r penderfyniad hwn?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae'r egwyddor hyd braich yn un bwysig, ac ni ystyriaf mai fy nyletswydd i yw ymyrryd mewn penderfyniadau unigol. Rwyf wedi codi'r mater gyda'r cyngor celfyddydau a chyfarfûm â'i gynrychiolwyr y bore yma. A dweud y gwir, cyfarfûm hefyd â rhai o aelodau'r grŵp theatr ac addysg y cyfeiriasoch ato. Bu'r cyngor celfyddydau'n adolygu ei bolisi yn y maes hwn a bydd yn gwneud datganiad yn y misoedd i ddod i ddangos sut yn union y mae'n bwriadu cyflawni ei gylch gwaith a mynd i'r afael â mater profiadau celfyddydau i bobl ifanc. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn galluogi pobl i gael sgwrs adeiladol â'r cyngor celfyddydau, a chyda minnau, i weld a yw hynny'n effeithiol yn y tymor hir.

Mohammad Asghar: Mewn ateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig, amlinellasoch rai o'r trafodaethau yr oedd eich swyddogion yn eu cael â chenedloedd eraill a allai ddymuno hyfforddi yng Nghymru i baratoi ar gyfer gemau Llundain 2012. Croesawaf y ffaith bod memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth wedi'i lofnodi gyda'r timau Paralympaidd llawn o Awstralia, Seland Newydd, a De Affrica, a gobeithiaf y bydd timau eraill yn ceisio defnyddio'r 31 o safleoedd hyfforddi o safon Olympaidd sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Weinidog, a wnewch chi roi gwybod am gynnydd diweddaraf y trafodaethau parhaus â thîm triathlon Iwerddon, tîm Olympaidd Trinidad a Tobago a thîm beicio trac Paralympaidd yr Unol Daleithiau, yn ogystal â'r pwyllgorau Olympaidd a Pharalympaidd eraill sydd wedi ymweld â Chymru nad ydynt wedi gwneud eu penderfyniadau eto?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae llawer o'r cyfleusterau eisoes bron yn llawn ar gyfer y cyfnod cyn y Gemau Olympaidd, ond mae trafodaethau'n parhau. Byddaf yn siŵr o ysgrifennu atoch gyda'r holl fanylion perthnasol am y sefyllfa o ran rhai o'r gwledydd y cyfeiriasoch atynt ac unrhyw rai eraill sydd wedi dod i'n sylw'n ddiweddar.

David Lloyd: Gan fod yr arian wedi'i gyhoeddi eisoes, a allwch ddweud wrthyf y diweddaraf ynglŷn ag amserlen datblygu ac adnewyddu Oriel Gelf Glynn Vivian yn Abertawe?

David Lloyd: As the money has already been announced, can you give me an update on the timetable for developing and renovating the Glynn Vivian Art Gallery in Swansea?

Alun Ffred Jones: Fe wyddoch fod grant o £3.5 miliwn gan gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cael ei ddynodi i'r oriel, ond mae angen gwario'r arian hwnnw o fewn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol, ac mae problemau wedi bod ynglŷn â sicrhau cytundeb gyda'r awdurdod lleol. Fodd bynnag, caf ar ddeall bod y trafodaethau hynny yn dal i ddigwydd, a bod gobaith y bydd gwaith yn dechrau yn yr oriel yn fuan. Yr ydym i gyd yn gobeithio bod hynny'n wir, er mwyn inni sicrhau y bydd y gwelliannau cyffrous hynny yn yr oriel wych honno, sydd â thraddodiad mor odidog, yn digwydd ac y bydd gan Abertawe oriel o'r ansawdd mae'n ei haeddu.

Alun Ffred Jones: You will know that a grant of £3.5 million from the Assembly Government's strategic capital investment fund has been designated for the gallery, but that money must be spent within the current financial year and there have been problems in securing a contract with the local authority. However, I am given to understand that those discussions are still taking place, and that there is hope that work will soon start in the gallery. We all hope that that is true, so that we can ensure that those exciting improvements take place in that wonderful gallery, which has such a magnificent history, and so that Swansea will have a gallery of the quality that it deserves.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn sicr eich bod yn ymwybodol o anfodlonrwydd ymhlith pobl flaenllaw Cymru ynglŷn â'r Mesur iaith arfaethedig. A allwch wneud datganiad diamwys ynglŷn â statws swyddogol ein hiaith Gymraeg y mae'r bobl hynny'n dweud nad yw'n bodoli yn y Mesur arfaethedig?

Eleanor Burnham: I am sure that you are aware of the dissatisfaction of prominent Welsh people with the proposed Welsh language Measure. Can you make an unambiguous statement about the official status of our Welsh language, a statement that those people claim is missing in the proposed Measure?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae datganiad diamwys ar ddechrau'r Mesur arfaethedig ynglŷn â statws swyddogol yr iaith Gymraeg yng Nghymru, ac mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn dangos sut yr ydym yn bwriadu hyrwyddo'r statws hwnnw er mwyn cael canlyniadau ymarferol a chadarnhaol i'r Gymraeg, sef holl fwriad y ddeddfwriaeth. Bydd nifer o welliannau yn cael eu cyflwyno a fydd yn cryfhau'r Mesur arfaethedig, diolch i'r trafodaethau yn y pwyllgorau a chyda chyrrff y tu allan.

Alun Ffred Jones: There is an unambiguous statement at the start of the proposed Measure about the official status of the Welsh language in Wales, and the proposed Measure shows how we intend to promote that status in order to generate practical and positive outcomes for the Welsh language, which is the purpose of the legislation. Several amendments will be introduced that will strengthen the proposed Measure, thanks to the discussions in the committees and with external bodies.

Eleanor Burnham: Nid ydych wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn. Mae anfodlonrwydd mawr ledled Cymru ymysg pobl flaenllaw. A ydych wedi ateb eu cwestiynau hwy yn hyn o beth, a'u honiadau nad ydych wedi gwneud digon? Mae'r sefyllfa wedi bod yn draed moch, gan eich bod wedi gorfod cyflwyno mwy na 100 o welliannau i'ch Mesur arfaethedig eich hun.

Alun Ffred Jones: Fel y dywedaso, mae pob math o honiadau, ond yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn cyflawni'r addewidion a wnaethom yn 'Cymru'n Un', ac mae datganiad clir ynglŷn â statws swyddogol y Gymraeg ar ddechrau'r Mesur arfaethedig. Mewn byd perffaith, byddwn wedi cael mwy o amser i lunio'r Mesur arfaethedig, ac mae'n bosibl y gallai fod yn fwy perffaith nag y mae. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried yr amser a ganiateir gan y broses yr ydym yn mynd drwyddi, mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn cyflawni'r addewidion i gyd ac mae'n gam sylweddol ymlaen o ran sicrhau yr hyn yr ydym ei eisiau, sef gweld mwy o bobl yn siarad y Gymraeg ac yn ei defnyddio. Mae fy mhwyslais i ar yr hyn sy'n ymarferol, ac nid ar y theori.

Hyrwyddo Prosiectau Celf yng Nghymru

6. Mohammad Asghar: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y trafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael yn gysylltiedig â hyrwyddo prosiectau celf yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)1346(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: I met the Arts Council of Wales last week for a scheduled biannual meeting. We discussed progress against my strategic priorities for the arts, in the context of the ongoing investment review and the current financial climate.

Mohammad Asghar: The last time that you took questions, Nick Ramsay, William Graham, other Members and I were all concerned about the Arts Council of Wales's decision to withdraw funding for Gwent Theatre. While I largely support the arm's-length principle and appreciate the need to make tough spending decisions, I am

Eleanor Burnham: You have not answered my question. There is widespread dissatisfaction among prominent Welsh people. Have you answered their questions on this matter and their accusations that you have not done enough? The situation has been a real mess as you have had to table more than 100 amendments to your own proposed Measure.

Alun Ffred Jones: As you said, there have been all sorts of claims, but what I am saying is that the proposed Measure fulfils the promises that we made in 'One Wales', and there is a clear statement about the official status of the Welsh language at the start of the proposed Measure. In a perfect world, I would have had more time to draw up the proposed Measure, and it is possible that it could be more perfect than it is. However, considering the time allowed by the process that we are following, the proposed Measure fulfils all the promises and is a significant step forward to ensure what we want to see, which is more people being able to speak Welsh and doing so. My emphasis is on what is practical, not the theory.

Promoting Arts Projects in Wales

6. Mohammad Asghar: *Will the Minister provide an update on discussions he has had linked to promoting arts projects in Wales. OAQ(3)1346(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: Cyfarfûm â Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru'r wythnos diwethaf am gyfarfod chwe-misol a drefnwyd. Rydym wedi trafod cynnydd mewn perthynas â'm blaenoriaethau strategol i'r celfyddydau, yng nghyd-destun yr adolygiad parhaus o fuddsoddiad a'r hinsawdd ariannol sydd ohoni.

Mohammad Asghar: Y tro diwethaf ichi dderbyn cwestiynau, roedd Nick Ramsay, William Graham, Aelodau eraill a minnau oll yn poeni am benderfyniad Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i dynnu cyllid yn ôl oddi wrth Theatr Gwent. Er fy mod i'n cefnogi'r egwyddor hyd braich i raddau helaeth ac yn gwerthfawrogi bod angen gwneud

concerned that the closure of the theatre will have a severe impact on the opportunities that many young local people will have to enjoy involvement in, and access to, the arts. You said that you would convey the feeling that had been voiced by Members to the arts council in forthcoming meetings, and that you expected issues linked to the announcement on Gwent Theatre to come up in those discussions. Can you give us a flavour of those discussions, Minister? Should the cuts go ahead, what role can the Welsh Assembly Government play in supporting and promoting the existence of local theatre groups such as Gwent Theatre?

Alun Ffred Jones: Either you believe in the arm's-length principle or you do not. You cannot have it both ways—although politicians often try. I have been in discussion with the arts council with regard to some of the decisions; they were not taken lightly, but the process is a transparent one, and it has been undertaken professionally.

With regard to the wider aspect of promoting exciting experiences for young people through the theatre in all parts of Wales, the arts council is developing a strategy almost as we speak. It had a discussion yesterday about it, and a discussion paper will be released within the next few months to give us a flavour of how it hopes to proceed. It is important to note that the arts council supports many community groups in many areas of Wales, including in the Valleys, and that work is ongoing.

Veronica German: One unsung organisation that reaches into the hearts of our communities is Tŷ Cerdd. It provides support to around 400 music-promoting societies throughout Wales, giving financial assistance that enables them to purchase music and other things that help with their activities. It helps over 20,000 people to participate in music throughout the year. Without that help, many choirs and bands in our poorest communities would find it difficult to carry on their activities. It also has a music lending library and a research facility, and does

penderfyniadau anodd am wariant, rwy'n poeni y bydd cau'r theatr yn effeithio'n ddifrifol ar y cyfleoedd a gaiff llawer o bobl ifanc leol i fwynhau cymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau, a chael atynt. Dywedasoch y byddech yn cyfleu'r teimlad a leisiwyd gan Aelodau i'r cyngor celfyddydau mewn cyfarfodydd a oedd ar ddod, a'ch bod yn disgwyl i faterion cysylltiedig â'r cyhoeddiad am Theatr Gwent godi yn y trafodaethau hynny. A allwch chi roi blas inni ar y trafodaethau hynny, Weinidog? Os bydd y toriadau'n digwydd, pa ran y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei chwarae mewn cefnogi a hyrwyddo bodolaeth grwpiau theatr lleol fel Theatr Gwent?

Alun Ffred Jones: Rydych naill ai'n credu yn yr egwyddor hyd braich neu beidio. Ni allwch ei chael hi'r ddwy ffordd—er bod gwleidyddion yn aml yn rhoi cynnig ar hynny. Rwyf wedi trafod rhai o'r penderfyniadau â'r cyngor celfyddydau; nid ar chwarae bach y'u gwnaethant, ond mae'r broses yn un dryloyw, ac fe'i gwnaethpwyd mewn modd proffesiynol.

O ran yr agwedd ehangach ar hyrwyddo profiadau cyffrous i bobl ifanc drwy'r theatr ym mhob rhan o Gymru, mae'r cyngor celfyddydau yn datblygu strategaeth bron wrth inni siarad. Cafodd drafodaeth amdani ddoe, a bydd papur trafod yn cael ei ryddhau ymhen yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf i roi blas inni ar y ffordd y mae'n gobeithio symud ymlaen. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod y cyngor celfyddydau'n cefnogi llawer o grwpiau cymunedol mewn llawer ardal o Gymru, gan gynnwys y Cymoedd, a bod gwaith yn mynd rhagddo.

Veronica German: Un sefydliad di-glod sy'n cyrraedd calonnau ein cymunedau yw Tŷ Cerdd. Mae'n rhoi cymorth i ryw 400 o gymdeithasau ledled Cymru sy'n hyrwyddo cerddoriaeth, gan roi cymorth ariannol sy'n eu galluogi i brynu cerddoriaeth a phethau eraill sy'n helpu gyda'u gweithgareddau. Mae'n helpu dros 20,000 o bobl i gymryd rhan mewn cerddoriaeth drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Heb y cymorth hwnnw, byddai llawer o gorau a bandiau yn ein cymunedau tlotaf yn ei chael yn anodd parhau eu gweithgareddau. Mae ganddo hefyd lyfrgell

projects with children and schools, looking particularly at Welsh composers. It is estimated that, for every pound that Tŷ Cerdd spends, its member societies generate a further £10 towards the arts economy. Again, this is an organisation that is under threat of cuts from the arts council—

benthyg cerddoriaeth a chyfleuster ymchwil, ac mae'n gwneud prosiectau gyda phlant ac ysgolion, gan edrych yn arbennig ar gyfansoddwyr o Gymru. Am bob punt y mae Tŷ Cerdd yn ei gwario, amcangyfrifir bod ei aelod-gymdeithasau'n cynhyrchu £10 pellach tuag at economi'r celfyddydau. Eto, mae hwn yn sefydliad sydd o dan fygythiad toriadau gan y cyngor celfyddydau—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you come to the question please?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch ofyn y cwestiwn os gwelwch yn dda?

2.40 p.m.

Veronica German: Do you agree that this is money well spent, and that this is just the sort of organisation that produces money for the arts that the arts council should be funding in future?

Veronica German: A ydych chi'n cytuno bod hwn yn arian wedi'i wario'n dda, ac mai hwn yw'r union fath o sefydliad sy'n cynhyrchu arian i'r celfyddydau y dylai'r cyngor celfyddydau fod yn ei ariannu yn y dyfodol?

Alun Ffred Jones: I have no intention of making any comment on individual decisions taken by the arts council. I repeat that you either believe in the arm's-length principle or you do not. You can have it either way, but you cannot have it both ways. The arts investment review was undertaken by the arts council in order to ensure a sustainable future for arts organisations throughout Wales. Of course, there are winners and losers with such a review. The arts council came here to explain its procedures, the way it had conducted the review and its intentions. Unfortunately, very few Assembly Members took the opportunity to go to that meeting. That is a great pity, because it would have explained a great deal of the background to the thinking behind the review. I am perfectly happy that the review was done professionally and in a transparent way. Obviously, some of the individual decisions are very difficult to stomach for the individual organisations, but the arts council is still in constant dialogue with practically all of those organisations and is mapping out a future for many of them with different funding arrangements. I hope that Tŷ Cerdd may be one of those that find a different way of working that will enable it to carry on much of the good work that it has already done.

Alun Ffred Jones: Nid wyf yn bwriadu gwneud unrhyw sylw am benderfyniadau penodol a wnaethpwyd gan y cyngor celfyddydau. Dywedaf eto eich bod naill ai'n credu yn yr egwyddor hyd braich neu beidio. Gallwch ei chael y naill ffordd neu'r llall, ond ni allwch ei chael y ddwy ffordd. Cynhaliodd y cyngor celfyddydau adolygiad o fuddsoddiad yn y celfyddydau er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol cynaliadwy i sefydliadau'r celfyddydau ledled Cymru. Wrth reswm, mae rhai ar eu hennill a rhai ar eu colled gydag adolygiad felly. Daeth y cyngor celfyddydau yma i egluro ei weithdrefnau, y ffordd yr oedd wedi cynnal yr adolygiad a'i fwradau. Yn anffodus, prin iawn oedd yr Aelodau Cynulliad a achubodd y cyfle i fynd i'r cyfarfod hwnnw. Mae hynny'n siom mawr, oherwydd byddai wedi egluro llawer iawn o gefndir y meddylfryd y tu ôl i'r adolygiad. Rwy'n berffaith fodlon fod yr adolygiad wedi'i wneud yn broffesiynol ac mewn modd tryloyw. Yn amlwg, mae rhai o'r penderfyniadau unigol yn anodd iawn i'r sefydliadau unigol eu stumogi, ond mae'r cyngor celfyddydau yn dal yn trafod yn gyson â bron pob un o'r sefydliadau hynny ac mae'n mapio dyfodol i lawer ohonynt gyda gwahanol drefniadau cyllido. Gobeithiaf y gall Tŷ Cerdd fod ymhlith y rheini sy'n canfod ffordd wahanol o weithio a fydd yn ei alluogi i barhau â llawer o'r gwaith da a

wnaeth eisoes.

Cefnogi ein Hamgylchedd Hanesyddol

7. Christine Chapman: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr hyn mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i gefnogi ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol. OAQ(3)1312(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: My historic environment ambition statement and action plan set out a large number of initiatives and actions to support Wales's rich and diverse historic environment for the benefit and wellbeing of people in Wales as well as visitors. I gave a statement reporting progress on actions to Members last week.

Christine Chapman: I welcomed that statement. If you remember, I put some questions to you on that. I welcome the statement on the work that the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to promote and safeguard our historic environment. Last weekend, once again, we saw the way in which our historic environment becomes a focal point for communities all around Wales as people gathered at their local cenotaphs to pay their respects to those who lost their lives as a result of war. During your statement last week, you talked about offering community groups access to the expertise of the professionals within the heritage industry. That being the case, we need to ensure that groups of volunteers know where to go and who to speak to to access support. Minister, how will you ensure that people know where to go so that their enthusiasm is not wasted?

Alun Ffred Jones: I suppose it depends on the nature of the group and what it intends to do. I am clear that in many of the organisations that the Government supports, there is a desire to reach out to those groups and bring them into a more fruitful and energetic relationship with those institutions so that they can help to promote the work that the institutions already do, while linking them more closely with community activity and events. In particular, if there are

Support for our Historic Environment

7. Christine Chapman: *Will the Minister provide an update on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to support our historic environment. OAQ(3)1312(HER)*

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae fy nghynllun gweithredu a datganiad uchelgais amgylchedd hanesyddol yn nodi nifer mawr o fentrau a champau i gefnogi amgylchedd hanesyddol helaeth ac amrywiol Cymru er budd a lles pobl yng Nghymru yn ogystal ag ymwelwyr. Rhoddais ddatganiad yr wythnos diwethaf i roi gwybod am gynnydd y camau i'r Aelodau.

Christine Chapman: Croesawais y datganiad hwnnw. Os cofiwch chi, gofynnais rai cwestiynau ichi am hynny. Croesawaf y datganiad am y gwaith y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i hyrwyddo a diogelu ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol. Y penwythnos diwethaf, unwaith eto, gwelsom y ffordd y mae ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol yn dod yn ganolbwynt i gymunedau ledled Cymru wrth i bobl ymgasglu wrth eu cofadeiladau lleol i ddangos eu parch i'r rheini a gollodd eu bywydau o ganlyniad i ryfel. Yn ystod eich datganiad yr wythnos diwethaf, siaradasoch am gynnig arbenigedd y gweithwyr proffesiynol yn y diwydiant treftadaeth i grwpiau cymunedol. Os felly, mae angen inni sicrhau bod grwpiau o wirfoddolwyr yn gwybod ble i fynd a phwy i siarad ag ef i gael y cymorth. Weinidog, sut byddwch chi'n sicrhau bod pobl yn gwybod ble i fynd i sicrhau na fydd eu brwdfrydedd yn mynd yn segur?

Alun Ffred Jones: Cymeraf ei bod yn dibynnu ar natur y grŵp a'r hyn y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud. Rwy'n gwybod bod dyhead yn llawer o'r sefydliadau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cefnogi i estyn allan i'r grwpiau hynny a'u cynnwys mewn perthynas fwy ffrwythlon ac egniol â'r sefydliadau hynny fel y gallant helpu i hyrwyddo'r gwaith a wna'r sefydliadau eisoes, gan eu cysylltu hwy'n agosach â digwyddiadau a gweithgarwch cymunedol. Yn arbennig, os

commemorative events being held, it is incumbent on those organisations to involve themselves and bring their expertise to those community groups. In that way, I think that we can make the money go a long way and ensure that the enthusiasm of local groups is supported by professional help. I think that I will have to write to you with more detailed information on that.

William Graham: Minister, you may have seen today's news that the River Wye has been given the accolade of the public's favourite river in Wales and England. This summer's exhibition at Chepstow Museum, entitled 'The Wye Tour and its Artists', showed that the area has been popular with tourists since the eighteenth century, with works such as J.M.W. Turner's groundbreaking pictures of Tintern abbey. How is your Government capitalising on the British public's affection for the Wye to increase the number of tourist visits to Monmouthshire?

Alun Ffred Jones: We are doing this in more ways than one. I attended the exhibition at Chepstow Museum, which was supported with money from the Welsh Assembly Government in order to ensure that the museum could put on such an exhibition and host some of the very valuable paintings and drawings that were there. It was a wonderful exhibition and provided another attraction for visitors who were either passing through or who had come specifically to that area. During the same visit, I went up the valley, where the local tourist partnership has developed paths and walks along the Wye, again supported by Visit Wales. I was struck, as I often am, by the enthusiasm of local practitioners and businesses and it showed once again that partnership can work when the Government can supply some expertise and some money, but where the enthusiasm and know-how comes from local communities. I thought that those were two prime examples of best practice.

oes digwyddiadau coffaol yn cael eu cynnal, mae'n rhaid i'r sefydliadau hynny gynnwys eu hunain a chynnig eu harbenigedd i'r grwpiau cymunedol hynny. Yn y ffordd honno, credaf y gallwn wneud i'r arian fynd yn bell a sicrhau bod cymorth proffesiynol yn cefnogi brwdfrydedd grwpiau lleol. Rwy'n credu y bydd rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch gyda gwybodaeth fanylach am hynny.

William Graham: Weinidog, hwyrach y gwelsoch y newyddion heddiw fod Afon Gwy wedi cael yr anrhydedd o gael ei henwi'n hoff afon y cyhoedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Roedd yr arddangosfa yn ystod yr haf eleni yn Amgueddfa Cas-gwent, dan y teitl 'The Wye Tour and its Artists', yn dangos y bu'r ardal yn boblogaidd ymhlith twristiaid ers y ddeunawfed ganrif, gyda gwaith fel lluniau arloesol J.M.W. Turner o abat y Tyndyrn. Sut mae eich Llywodraeth chi'n elwa ar hoffter cyhoedd Prydain tuag at afon Gwy i gynyddu nifer yr ymweliadau gan dwristiaid â sir Fynwy?

Alun Ffred Jones: Rydym yn gwneud hyn mewn mwy nag un ffordd. Euthum i'r arddangosfa yn Amgueddfa Cas-gwent, a gefnogwyd ag arian gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn sicrhau y gallai'r amgueddfa gynnal arddangosfa felly a chrosawu rhai o'r paentiadau a'r lluniadau gwerthfawr iawn a oedd yno. Roedd yn arddangosfa fendigedig ac roedd yn atyniad arall i ymwelwyr a oedd naill ai'n galw heibio neu a ddaeth yn benodol i'r ardal honno. Yn ystod yr un ymweliad, euthum i fyni'r cwm, lle mae'r bartneriaeth dwristiaeth leol wedi datblygu llwybrau a theithiau cerdded ar hyd Afon Gwy, eto gyda chymorth Croeso Cymru. Cefais fy nharo, fel yn aml, gan frwdfrydedd busnesau ac ymarferwyr lleol ac roedd yn dangos unwaith eto fod partneriaeth yn gallu gweithio pan all y Llywodraeth gyflenwi ychydig o arbenigedd ac ychydig o arian, ond lle daw'r brwdfrydedd a'r wybodaeth o gymunedau lleol. Roeddwn i'n meddwl bod y rheini'n ddwy enghraifft wych o arfer gorau.

Gareth Jones: Nid yw'n anghyffredin clywed pobl yn cwyno am wastraff honedig o arian ar warchod adeiladau neu ddogfennau hanesyddol sydd ag arwyddocâd pwysig yn hanes Cymru. A gytunwch fod yr agwedd hon yn adlewyrchu diffyg ymwybyddiaeth neu fwllch mewn addysg ynghylch hanes Cymru ac mai un ffordd o fynd i'r afael â hyn yn yr oes fodern yw sefydlu casgliadau ar-lein, fel y prosiect Casglu'r Tlysau? Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai modd gwneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r cyfrwng hwn, er enghraifft drwy ddarparu copïau digidol o gyfeirlyfrau pwysig fel y rhai sy'n ymwneud â henebion a gynhyrchwyd gan yr hen gomisiynwyr sir yn y dyddiau a fu. I ba raddau y gallwch gefnogi a hyrwyddo hynny i'r dyfodol?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae hi'n drueni nad yw rhai pobl yn gweld gwerth yn eu treftadaeth a'u hanes eu hunain. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu, i ryw raddau, y sefyllfa drist o safbwynt dysgu hanes yn ein hysgolion. Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr fod sicrhau mynediad rhwydd i'r wybodaeth hon ar-lein yn eithriadol o bwysig er mwyn galluogi pobl ym mhob rhan o Gymru sydd naill ai'n methu neu'n dewis peidio â theithio, i weld rhai o'n casgliadau. Yn sicr, o ran y dogfennau sy'n ymwneud ag olion archeolegol a chofnodion ac yn y blaen, mae'r wefan Archwilio yn cynnwys degau o filoedd o ddogfennau er mwyn i bobl weld lle mae'r wybodaeth honno. Mae datblygiad Casgliad y Werin Cymru hefyd yn gyffrous iawn. Mae'r casgliad yn cynnwys dogfennau, lluniau ac yn y blaen o bob sefydliad treftadaeth yng Nghymru. Bydd hynny'n wasanaeth eithriadol o bwysig i ni, ond hefyd i bobl ar draws y byd. Mae'n wefan wirioneddol gyffrous a byddaf yn parhau i'w chefnogi er gwaethaf y sefyllfa ariannol bresennol oherwydd ei bod yn un o'r datblygiadau pwysicaf o safbwynt gwneud yr hyn yr ydych yn gofyn i mi ei wneud.

Rhodri Morgan: As William Graham has rightly pointed out, the River Wye has been recognised as the most loved, superb, clean and incredible river anywhere in England and Wales. I would like to put in a plea on behalf of the River Taff as the most phenomenally improved river in Britain, given that it used

Gareth Jones: It is not unusual to hear people complaining about the alleged waste of money on protecting buildings or historical documents that have great historical significance to Wales. Do you agree that this attitude shows a lack of awareness or a gap in their education about the history of Wales and that one way of getting to grips with that in the modern age is by establishing online collections, such as Gathering the Jewels? It would be useful if we could make more use of that medium, for example, by providing digitised copies of important reference books such as those on ancient monuments that were produced by the old county commissioners in days of yore. To what extent could you look to support and promote that for the future?

Alun Ffred Jones: It is a pity that some people do not recognise the value of their own heritage and history. This reflects, to some extent, the sad state of affairs regarding the teaching of history in our schools. Having said that, I agree totally that ensuring easy online access to this information is extremely important in order to enable people in all parts of Wales who either cannot or choose not to travel, to see some of our collections. Certainly, on the documents regarding archaeological remains and records and so on, the Archwilio website contains tens of thousands of documents so that people can see where that information is available. The development of People's Collection Wales is also very exciting. The collection contains documents, pictures and so on from every heritage organisation in Wales. That service will be extremely important to us, but also to people across the world. It is a truly exciting website and I will continue to support it, despite the present financial situation, because it is one of the most important developments in respect of doing what you are asking me to do.

Rhodri Morgan: Fel y mae William Graham wedi'i ddweud yn briodol, cydnabuwyd mai Afon Gwy yw'r afon fwyaf annwyl, ragorol, glân ac anhygoel yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Hoffwn gyflwyno ple ar ran Afon Taf fel yr afon sydd wedi gwella'n fwyaf syfrdanol ym Mhrydain, o ystyried ei bod yn arfer bod yn

to run inky black, it used to be very smelly and totally dead of fish life when I was a boy playing on its banks. It has now become a major salmon river, containing some 500 salmon.

2.50 p.m.

These salmon are very important American visitors; although they were born here in the first place, they go across to America and then come back. In 20 years' time, it is estimated that there will be some 2,000 salmon in the River Taff, and the Rhondda, the Cynon and the Taff's other tributaries. By that time, it will be possible to fish for salmon, keep some of them and eat salmon and sewin from the River Taff, when it reaches its full carrying capacity.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I missed the question there.

Alun Ffred Jones: It is superb news and I endorse everything that Rhodri said.

ddu fel inc, ei bod yn arfer drewi a'i bod yn gwbl amddifad o bysgod pan oeddwn innau'n fachgen yn chwarae ar ei glannau. Erbyn hyn, mae'n afon bwysig i'r eog, a hithau'n cynnwys tua 500 o eogiaid.

Mae'r eogiaid hyn yn ymwelwyr Americanaidd pwysig iawn; er iddynt gael eu geni yma yn y lle cyntaf, maent yn mynd draw i America ac yna'n dychwelyd. Ymhen 20 mlynedd, amcangyfrifir y bydd tua 2,000 o eogiaid yn Afon Taf, ac yn Afon Rhondda, Afon Cynon a llednentydd eraill Afon Taf. Erbyn hynny, bydd modd pysgota am eogiaid, cadw rhai ohonynt a bwyta eog a sewin o Afon Taf, pan fydd yn cludo cymaint ag y gall.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Ni chlywais y cwestiwn yno.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae'n newyddion bendigedig ac rwy'n cefnogi popeth a ddywedodd Rhodri.

Cwestiynau i Gynrychiolydd Comisiwn y Cynulliad Questions to the Representative of the Assembly Commission

Llwyddiant System TG Newydd yr Aelodau

1. Jenny Randerson: *A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am lwyddiant y system TG newydd ar gyfer Aelodau. OAQ(3)0046(AC)*

The Assembly Commissioner for Assembly Resources (Peter Black): A new, up-to-date IT system has been created to enable the Assembly to separate its systems from those of the Welsh Government, to improve business continuity and to enable the Assembly to make appropriate, cost-effective choices for future ICT provision. The system's design was based on an extensive consultation exercise with all users, including Members, their staff and Assembly staff. Between July and October this year, the system was installed for 800 users at over 80 locations, including Tŷ Hywel, constituency offices and in homes. Fifty applications were migrated from the old system to the new. This was not just a regular equipment refresh;

Success of the New IT System for Members

1. Jenny Randerson: *Will the Commissioner make a statement on the success of the new IT system for Members. OAQ(3)0046(AC)*

Comisiynydd Adnoddau'r Cynulliad (Peter Black): Crëwyd system TG newydd wedi'i diweddarau er mwyn i'r Cynulliad wahanu ei systemau oddi wrth systemau Llywodraeth Cymru, i wella parhad busnes ac i alluogi'r Cynulliad i wneud dewisiadau priodol, cost effeithiol ar gyfer darparu TGCh yn y dyfodol. Roedd cynllun y system yn seiliedig ar ymarfer ymgynghori helaeth â phob defnyddiwr, gan gynnwys Aelodau, eu staff a staff y Cynulliad. Rhwng mis Gorffennaf a mis Hydref eleni, gosodwyd y system ar gyfer 800 o ddefnyddwyr mewn mwy nag 80 o leoedd, gan gynnwys Tŷ Hywel, swyddfeydd etholaeth ac mewn cartrefi. Symudwyd hanner cant o gymwysiadau o'r hen system i'r un newydd.

the whole system was changed, including an external data centre and a new operating platform. This has proved to be extremely challenging and we know that some Members have problems, which we are working to resolve. We apologise for the inconvenience that these problems have caused to Members and to their constituents. With our contractor, Siemens, we are working hard to resolve all remaining issues as quickly as possible, so that all Members are able to benefit fully from the new system and the improvements that have been made.

Jenny Randerson: Thank you for that, Commissioner. I have raised this because I have had the new system in my offices for the last two months, and we still have considerable snags, as they are called in the building trade. I appreciate entirely what you said, that this has been a very big project, however, I feel that it should have been trialled more thoroughly on a smaller basis in order to overcome some of the snags, which I know that many Members have suffered from, before it was rolled out. I am driven to ask this question because we still cannot use our caseworker system, either in my constituency office or at the Assembly. Yesterday, for example, I had an urgent piece of casework to deal with on behalf of a constituent whose son is in prison, and I was unable to find and access the previous letters that I had sent on her behalf. It is really hampering me in my job. Above all, Commissioner, it is hampering my staff, whose morale has plummeted as a result of this problem.

Peter Black: I would first like to repeat the apology for the inconvenience that this has caused Members. The system was rolled out to Commission staff before being rolled out to Assembly Members and their support staff. We did not encounter the sorts of problems in that roll-out that we have subsequently experienced—largely, I think, because of the complexity of the system for Assembly Members. There are 108 supported sites for Assembly Members, comprising constituency office lines, home lines and sites for some support staff who are also full-time home

Nid mater o adnewyddu cyfarpar yn unig oedd hwn: newidiwyd y system gyfan, gan gynnwys canolfan data allanol a llwyfan gweithredu newydd. Bu hyn yn heriol iawn a gwyddom fod problemau gan rai Aelodau, a ninnau'n gweithio i'w datrys. Ymddiheurwn am yr anghyfleustra y mae'r problemau hyn wedi'u hachosi i'r Aelodau ac i'w hetholwyr. Gyda'n contractwr, Siemens, rydym yn gweithio'n galed i ddatrys pob mater sy'n weddill cyn gynted â phosibl, fel bod pob Aelod yn gallu elwa'n llawn ar y system newydd a'r gwelliannau sydd wedi'u gwneud.

Jenny Randerson: Diolch ichi am hynny, Gomisiynydd. Rwyf wedi codi hyn oherwydd bu'r system newydd yn fy swyddfeydd ers deufis bellach, ac mae gennym rwystrau sylweddol o hyd, fel y'u gelwir yn y maes adeiladu. Gwerthfawrogaf yn llwyr yr hyn a ddywedasoch, sef y bu hwn yn brosiect mawr iawn, ond rwy'n teimlo y dylid fod wedi'i dreialu'n fwy trwyadl ar raddfa lai er mwyn goresgyn rhai o'r rhwystrau, y gwn fod llawer o'r Aelodau wedi'u dioddef, cyn ei gyflwyno'n llawn. Fe'm cymhellwyd i ofyn y cwestiwn hwn oherwydd nid ydym yn gallu defnyddio ein system gweithiwr achos o hyd, nid yn fy swyddfa etholaeth i nac yn y Cynulliad. Ddoe, er enghraifft, roedd gennyf ddarn brys o waith achos i ymdrin ag ef ar ran etholwr sydd â mab yn y carchar, ac nid oeddwn yn gallu canfod na chael at y llythyrau blaenorol a anfonais ar ei rhan. Mae'n fy rhwystro'n sylweddol yn fy swydd. Uwchlaw popeth, Gomisiynydd, mae'n rhwystro fy staff, ac mae eu morâl hwythau wedi gostwng o ddifrif o ganlyniad i'r broblem hon.

Peter Black: Hoffwn yn gyntaf ailadrodd yr ymddiheuriad am yr anghyfleustra y mae hyn wedi'i achosi i'r Aelodau. Cafodd y system ei chyflwyno fesul dipyn i staff y Comisiwn cyn cael ei chyflwyno fesul dipyn i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'u staff cefnogi. Ni ddaethom ar draws y mathau o broblemau yn y broses honno y daethom ar eu traws wedyn—yn bennaf, rwy'n credu, oherwydd cymhlethdod y system i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae 108 o safleoedd a gynhelir i Aelodau'r Cynulliad, sy'n cynnwys llinellau swyddfa etholaeth, llinellau cartref a safleoedd i rai staff cefnogi

workers. On top of that, there are 45 ad hoc users. Clearly, it has been a very complex operation, and there have been teething problems.

I understand the issue in relation to the casework system. I am familiar with the casework system that Jenny uses. It was not designed for a network system. Part of the problem is that it sits on the P drive, which has not yet been migrated across to the new system. That will take place over the next two weekends. One of the reasons why it has not been migrated across is because of the complexity involved with the P drive, with regard to permissions. [*Interruption.*] Would you like me to be more technical? [*Laughter.*]

The Assembly has designed its own caseworker system, which is also available for Assembly Members to use and is slowly being taken up by Members. I hope that the problems that Jenny is having with her casework system, and that other Members have also had, will be resolved once that P: drive migration has taken place.

Codi Ymwybyddiaeth y Cyhoedd am Rôl y Cynulliad

2. Gareth Jones: *Beth mae'r Comisiwn yn ei wneud yn y gogledd i godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd am rôl y Cynulliad. OAQ(3)0047(AC)*

Peter Black: We use a range of facilities of the Assembly in north Wales, including the bus, outreach teams and the north Wales office, all of which engage directly with individuals, organisations, schools and groups across north Wales. We encourage active participation in democracy in a variety of innovative ways, including video evidence-gathering for committee inquiries and targeted items for local, regional and community newspapers. E-democracy initiatives such as videos, blogs and social networking sites are also used to improve local awareness and for particular awareness-raising campaigns such as Vote 2011.

sydd hefyd yn weithwyr cartref amser llawn. Ar ben hynny, mae 45 o ddefnyddwyr unswydd. Yn amlwg, bu'n weithrediad cymhleth iawn, a chafwyd problemau cychwynnol.

Deallaf y mater mewn perthynas â'r system gwaith achos. Rwy'n gyfarwydd â'r system gwaith achos y mae Jenny'n ei defnyddio. Ni chafodd ei chynllunio ar gyfer system rhwydwaith. Un rhan o'r broblem yw ei bod yn eistedd ar y gyriant P, nad yw eto wedi'i symud draw i'r system newydd. Bydd hynny'n digwydd dros y ddau benwythnos nesaf. Un o'r rhesymau pam na'i symudwyd draw yw oherwydd cymhlethdod y gyriant P, o ran caniatâd. [*Torri ar draws.*] A hoffech imi fod yn fwy technegol? [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cynllunio ei system gweithwyr achos ei hun, sydd hefyd ar gael i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ei defnyddio ac sy'n araf ddechrau cael ei defnyddio gan yr Aelodau. Gobeithiaf y bydd y problemau y mae Jenny'n eu cael gyda'i system gwaith achos, ac a gafodd Aelodau eraill hefyd, yn cael eu datrys pan fydd y gyriant P wedi'i symud.

Public Awareness of the Role of the Assembly

2. Gareth Jones: *What is the Commission doing in north Wales to increase public awareness of the role of the Assembly. OAQ(3)0047(AC)*

Peter Black: Defnyddiwn amrywiaeth o gyfleusterau'r Cynulliad yn y gogledd, gan gynnwys y bus, timau allgymorth a swyddfa gogledd Cymru, sydd i gyd yn ymgysylltu'n uniongyrchol ag unigolion, sefydliadau, ysgolion a grwpiau ledled y gogledd. Rydym yn annog pobl i fynd ati i gyfranogi mewn democratiaeth mewn amryw ffyrdd arloesol, gan gynnwys casglu tystiolaeth fideo ar gyfer ymchwiliadau pwyllgor ac eitemau a dargedir ar gyfer papurau newydd lleol, rhanbarthol a chymunedol. Defnyddir hefyd fentrau E-ddemocratiaeth fel fideos, blogiau a safleoedd rhwydweithio cymdeithasol i wella ymwybyddiaeth leol ac ar gyfer ymgyrchoedd arbennig i hybu ymwybyddiaeth fel Pleidleisiwch 2011.

Gareth Jones: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Gomisiynydd. Ers y bleidlais unfrydol ddiweddar o blaid refferendwm ar bwerau Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn y dyfodol, a fedrwch roi rwy o fanylion o ran yr hyn y mae'r Comisiwn yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, ac yn bwriadu ei wneud yn y dyfodol, i godi ymwybyddiaeth o rôl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn y refferendwm hwnnw, a hefyd etholiadau'r Cynulliad ym mis Mai 2011? Fel Aelod o'r gogledd, bydd gennyf ddiddordeb penodol mewn gwybod pa weithgareddau sydd yn cael eu cynllunio ar gyfer y gogledd, gan wneud defnydd, efallai, o ofod cyhoeddus pencadlys Llywodraeth Cymru yng Nghyffordd Llandudno.

Peter Black: You will be aware that the Commission has to stay neutral in the referendum campaign, but as part of the Vote 2011 activities the bus will be used by the outreach team with the purpose of increasing awareness and understanding of Vote 2011 by giving clear and impartial information about the election and referenda. It will be travelling around the 22 local authorities before March and, by 5 May, it will have visited all 40 constituencies. It will be used in a variety of ways, as a drop-in information centre and as a place for pre-arranged groups to be invited for a discussion on an issue to do with voting or barriers to voting. As part of the bus tour, the Presiding Officer will be holding workshops on the bus with first-time voters in north, mid and south Wales. There is a whole range of other information that I can let you have, if you wish, but that is the general gist of the sort of work that we will be doing as part of Vote 2011.

Gareth Jones: Thank you for that answer, Commissioner. Since the recent unanimous vote in favour of a referendum on the future powers of the Welsh Government and the National Assembly, can you give more details on what the Commission is doing currently, and intends doing in future, to raise awareness of the role of the National Assembly before that referendum and the Assembly elections in May 2011? As a Member from north Wales, I am especially interested in learning what activities are being planned for north Wales and which may make use of the public space in the Welsh Government's headquarters in Llandudno Junction.

Peter Black: Byddwch chi'n gwybod ei bod yn rhaid i'r Comisiwn aros yn niwtral yn ymgyrch y refferendwm, ond yn rhan o weithgareddau Pleidleisiwch 2011 bydd y bws yn cael ei ddefnyddio gan y tîm allgymorth gyda'r diben o hybu ymwybyddiaeth a dealltwriaeth am Pleidleisiwch 2011 drwy roi gwybodaeth glir a diduedd am yr etholiad a'r refferenda. Bydd yn teithio o amgylch y 22 awdurdod lleol cyn mis Mawrth ac, erbyn 5 Mai, bydd wedi ymweld â'r 40 etholaeth i gyd. Bydd yn cael ei ddefnyddio mewn amryw ffyrdd, fel canolfan wybodaeth galw heibio a lle i wahodd grwpiau a drefnir ymlaen llaw i drafod mater sy'n ymwneud â phleidleisio neu rwystrau rhag pleidleisio. Yn rhan o'r daith bws, bydd y Llywydd yn cynnal gweithdai ar y bws gyda phobl sy'n pleidleisio am y tro cyntaf yn y gogledd, y canolbarth a'r de. Mae amrywiaeth fawr o wybodaeth arall y gallaf ei rhoi ichi, os mynnwch, ond hwnnw yw diben cyffredinol y math o waith y byddwn yn ei wneud yn rhan o Pleidleisiwch 2011.

Cynnig i Benodi Comisiynydd Safonau Motion to Appoint a Standards Commissioner

Cynnig NDM4584 Jeff Cuthbert

Motion NDM4584 Jeff Cuthbert

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn mynegi ei ddiolchgarwch am gyfraniad

1. Expresses its gratitude for the contribution

Richard Penn yn ystod yr un mlynedd ar ddeg y mae wedi gwasanaethu'r Cynulliad, yn gyntaf fel y Cynghorydd ar Safonau ac yna fel y Comisiynydd Safonau;

of Richard Penn during the eleven years he has served the Assembly, first as Adviser on Standards and then as Commissioner for Standards;

2. O dan adran 1(2) o Fesur Comisiynydd Safonau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru 2009, yn penodi Gerard Elias CF yn Gomisiynydd Safonau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru o dan y Mesur hwnnw, am gyfnod o chwe blynedd gan ddechrau ar 1 Rhagfyr 2010.

2. Acting under section 1(2) of the National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards Measure 2009, appoints Gerard Elias QC as National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards under that Measure, for a term of six years beginning on 1 December 2010.

Jeff Cuthbert: I move the motion.

Jeff Cuthbert: Cynigaf y cynnig.

I start by paying tribute to Richard Penn for the excellent work that he has done, first as the Assembly's independent adviser on standards, and more recently as the National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards. He has provided wise counsel and guidance to the National Assembly, and particularly to the Committee on Standards of Conduct. He has also played a valuable role in advising Members on matters to do with their standards of conduct. I believe that he has played a significant part in ensuring the high standards of which the Assembly can rightly be proud. The Assembly should be very grateful to him for all his work over the years.

Dechreuaf drwy dalu teyrnged i Richard Penn am y gwaith rhagorol y mae wedi'i wneud, yn gyntaf yn gynghorwr annibynnol i'r Cynulliad ar safonau, ac yn ddiweddarach yn Gomisiynydd Safonau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae wedi rhoi cyngor ac arweiniad doeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac yn arbennig i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Mae hefyd wedi chwarae rhan werthfawr mewn cynghori Aelodau am faterion sy'n ymwneud â'u safonau ymddygiad. Credaf ei fod wedi chwarae rhan arwyddocaol mewn sicrhau'r safonau uchel y gall y Cynulliad ymfalchïo'n haeddiannol ynddynt. Dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn ddiolchgar iawn iddo am ei holl waith dros y blynnyddoedd.

The appointment that the Assembly is considering today comes as a consequence of the passing of the National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards Measure 2009. This was a key piece of work for the National Assembly and followed recommendations made in the Woodhouse report in 2002, the passing of the Government of Wales Act 2006 and two consultations and an inquiry by the Committee on Standards of Conduct.

Mae'r penodiad y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei ystyried heddiw yn ffrwyth derbyn Mesur 2009 Comisiynydd Safonau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Roedd hwn yn ddarn allweddol o waith i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac roedd yn dilyn argymhellion a wnaethpwyd yn adroddiad Woodhouse yn 2002, derbyn Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 a dau ymgynghoriad ac ymchwiliad gan y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad.

The culmination of all of these was the creation of a statutory post of National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards who will have important new powers to carry out rigorous investigations of complaints against Members. This is of great significance to the people of Wales and will give them increased confidence in their elected representatives by enshrining in law

Ffrwyth y rhain i gyd oedd creu swydd statudol Comisiynydd Safonau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a fydd â phwerau newydd pwysig i gynnal ymchwiliadau trwyadl i gwynion yn erbyn Aelodau. Mae hyn o arwyddocâd mawr i bobl Cymru a bydd yn rhoi mwy o ffydd iddynt yn eu cynrychiolwyr etholedig drwy gynnwys mewn cyfraith bwerau ac annibyniaeth

the powers and independence of the Assembly's commissioner for standards. The Measure was granted Royal Approval in December 2009 and today's proposal to appoint the first statutory commissioner completes the process of bringing that Measure into effect. It is worth noting that this Measure was also the first committee-proposed Measure to be approved by the National Assembly.

3.00 p.m.

The process of selecting Gerard Elias has been open and transparent. I chaired a selection panel that consisted of me, Claire Clancy, the Chief Executive and Clerk of the National Assembly, Stuart Allan, the Scottish Parliamentary Standards Commissioner, and Kathryn Bishop, who has extensive public and private sector experience as an independent assessor. We received a wide range of applications, and the panel unanimously recommended the appointment of Gerard Elias. Subsequently, Mr Elias attended a public confirmation hearing with the Committee on Standards of Conduct. This is only the second time that such a procedure has been followed in the National Assembly, and it enabled all committee members to question Mr Elias about his approach to the office. The committee unanimously confirmed the decision of the appointments panel, and recommended his appointment to the full Assembly.

Gerard Elias QC has a legal career spanning over 40 years. He is a barrister and has most recently been leading counsel to the Baha Mousa inquiry. He also has many years' experience in the field of professional discipline at a high-profile UK level. It is difficult to think of someone more qualified or suited to act as the National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

comisiynydd safonau'r Cynulliad. Rhoddwyd i'r Mesur Gymeradwyaeth Frenhinol ym mis Rhagfyr 2009 ac mae cynnig heddiw i benodi'r comisiynydd statudol cyntaf yn cwblhau'r broses o weithredu'r Mesur hwnnw. Mae'n werth nodi mai'r Mesur hwn hefyd oedd y Mesur cyntaf a gynigiwyd gan bwyllgor i gael ei gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Bu'r broses o ddewis Gerard Elias yn un agored a thryloyw. Cadeiriais banel dewis a oedd yn fy nghynnwys innau, Claire Clancy, Prif Weithredwr a Chlerc y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Stuart Allan, Comisiynydd Safonau Seneddol yr Alban, a Kathryn Bishop, sydd â phrofiad helaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat yn aseswr annibynnol. Cawsom ystod eang o geisiadau, ac argymhellodd y panel yn unfrydol benodi Gerard Elias. Wedyn, aeth Mr Elias i wrandawriad cadarnhau cyhoeddus gyda'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Hwn yw'r ail dro yn unig i weithdrefn felly gael ei dilyn yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a galluogodd bob aelod o'r pwyllgor i holi Mr Elias am ei ymagwedd at y swydd. Cadarnhaodd y pwyllgor yn unfrydol benderfyniad y panel penodiadau, ac argymhellodd ei benodi i'r Cynulliad llawn.

Mae gyrfa gyfreithiol Gerard Elias QC yn rhychwantu dros 40 mlynedd. Mae e'n fargyfreithiwr ac yn ddiweddaraf oll bu'n gwmsler arweiniol i ymchwiliad Baha Mousa. Mae ganddo hefyd lawer blwyddyn o brofiad ym maes disgyblu proffesiynol yn y DU ar lefel proffil uchel. Anodd yw meddwl am rywun mwy cymwysedig neu fwy addas i fod yn Gomisiynydd Safonau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cynigir cytuno i'r cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, cytunir ar y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

Dyfodol Darlledu Cymraeg The Future of Welsh Broadcasting

Cynnig NNDM4583 Eleanor Burnham, Alun Davies, Nick Bourne, Rhodri Glyn Thomas

Motion NNDM4583 Eleanor Burnham, Alun Davies, Nick Bourne, Rhodri Glyn Thomas

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn credu bod S4C annibynnol yn hanfodol ar gyfer dyfodol darlledu cyhoeddus a'r diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru.

The National Assembly for Wales believes an independent S4C is essential for the future of public broadcasting and the Creative Industries in Wales.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiaf y cynnig. Mae'n bleser ei gynnig ar ran fy nghyd-Aelodau, Nick Bourne, Eleanor Burnham ac Alun Davies.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I move the motion; it is a pleasure to move it on behalf of my fellow Members, Nick Bourne, Eleanor Burnham and Alun Davies.

Mae'r cynnig yn cydnabod bod S4C annibynnol yn hanfodol ar gyfer darlledu cyhoeddus a'r diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru i'r dyfodol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn canolbwyntio yn y ddadl hon ar yr egwyddor sylfaenol honno. Mae rhai pobl wedi ceisio defnyddio'r ddadl bod Awdurdod S4C yn ddiffygiol mewn rhyw ffordd ar hyn o bryd, a bod lle i'w feirniadu ynglŷn â rhai o'r penderfyniadau a wnaeth, gan ddefnyddio hynny fel esgus i geisio cael gwared ar yr awdurdod. Os oes diffygion gan yr awdurdod ar ei ffurf bresennol, gadewch inni ddelio â'r diffygion hynny mewn ffordd synhwyrol, a pheidio â chael gwared ar drefn sydd wedi gwasanaethu S4C yn arbennig o dda ers 28 mlynedd. Nid oes rheswm i gredu bod unrhyw ddiffyg yn y drefn os oes cwestiynau yn codi ynglŷn â'r ffordd mae'r awdurdod wedi ymddwyn yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf.

The motion recognises that an independent S4C is essential for the future of public broadcasting and the creative industries in Wales. It is important that we concentrate in this debate on that fundamental principle. Some people have been trying to use the argument that the S4C Authority is in some way deficient at present, and that there is room to criticise it regarding some of the decisions that it has taken, as an excuse to try to abolish the authority. If there are deficiencies in relation to the authority in its current form, let us deal with those deficiencies in a sensible way, and not abolish a system that has served S4C particularly well for 28 years. There is no reason to believe that there is any deficiency in the system if questions arise regarding the way in which the authority has behaved over the past few months.

Mae ymgais wedi ei wneud hefyd i ddweud bod perfformiad a ffigurau gwyltio S4C rywsut neu'i gilydd yn methu o gymharu â BBC Alba. Mae hon yn ddadl gwbl gamarweiniol, gan nad yw ffigurau gwyltio S4C a BBC Alba yn cael eu casglu yn yr un modd—yn wir, nid yw ffigurau gwyltio BBC Alba yn cael eu casglu o gwbl; maent yn cael eu nodi mewn pŵl o 1,000 o bobl. Nid oes unrhyw ystyriaeth yn cael ei rhoi i ffigurau gwyltio rhaglenni unigol, ac nid oes modd gwybod beth yn union mae'r bobl sy'n honni eu bod yn gwyltio BBC Alba yn ei wyltio ar y sianel honno. Felly, mae'r ddadl a

Efforts have also been made to argue that S4C, in respect of its performance and viewing figures, is somehow failing in comparison with BBC Alba. This is an utterly misleading argument, because the S4C viewing figures and the BBC Alba figures are not gathered in the same way—indeed, viewing figures for BBC Alba are not gathered at all; they are noted in a poll of 1,000 people. No consideration is given to individual programmes and there is no way of knowing what exactly the people who claim to have watched BBC Alba watch on that particular channel. Therefore, the

gyflwynwyd fod BBC Alba rywsut yn fodel ar gyfer S4C yn gwbl gamarweiniol. Os edrychwch ar hanes S4C dros 28 mlynedd, megis dechrau ar ei waith a'i ddatblygiad mae BBC Alba. Nid yw'r argraff a roddwyd yn ddim mwy na phropaganda llwyr i geisio dadlau bod y model gan y BBC yn yr Alban yn hynod lwyddiannus. Nid oedd y bobl a geisiodd orfodi'r propaganda hwnnw arnom yn cydnabod bod adroddiad yn dangos bod Gaeleg yr Alban wedi marw i bob pwrpas, ac nad oes fawr neb yn ei defnyddio na'i throsglwyddo o genhedlaeth i genhedlaeth. Pa fath o lwyddiant yw hynny i sianel a sefydlwyd dan y BBC yn yr Alban er mwyn gwarchod a hyrwyddo'r iaith Aeleg? Gadewch inni lawenhau yn y ffaith bod S4C wedi chwarae rhan hynod bwysig yn yr adfywiad a welsom nid yn unig yn nifer y bobl sy'n siarad y Gymraeg, ond hefyd yn nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Yr oedd peth o'r feirniadaeth a wnaed o raglenni S4C yn ymwneud â rhaglenni plant, sydd yn uned hynod lwyddiannus o fewn S4C. Ond, nid yw ffigurau rhaglenni plant yn cael eu casglu, felly nid oedd hynny hyd yn oed yn cael ei gofnodi.

Rhaid cofio bod ffigurau'r Bwrdd Ymchwil Cynulleidfa Darlledwyr yn gamarweiniol gan mai nifer cymharol fach sydd yn siarad Cymraeg—1 y cant o boblogaeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Ni allwch gael darlun clir ynglŷn ag arferion gwyllo pobl o ffigurau cyffredinol fel hynny. Nid oes tystiolaeth o gwbl i brofi y byddai S4C yn fwy lwyddiannus dan unrhyw fodel rheoleiddio arall. Yr hyn sydd gennym yw 28 mlynedd o dystiolaeth bod S4C wedi bod yn hynod lwyddiannus.

Mae egwyddor annibyniaeth yn eithriadol o bwysig—ac nid annibyniaeth yng nghydestun comisiynu rhaglenni nac annibyniaeth yn yr elfen greadigol yn unig, ond annibyniaeth lwyr i S4C. Nid oes gennyf broblem gydag ariannu S4C drwy'r drwydded; mae'n syniad arbennig o dda. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni gofio mai trwydded ar gyfer darlledu cyhoeddus yw'r drwydded honno, ac nid trwydded bersonol i'r BBC. Mae Syr Michael Lyons, yn ei lythyr—mae'n gwbl warthus ei fod wedi

argument being put forward that BBC Alba is in one way or another a model for S4C is utterly fatuous. If you look at the history of S4C over 28 years, BBC Alba is only just starting its work and its development. The impression being given is nothing more than utter propaganda to try to argue that this BBC model in Scotland is exceptionally successful. The people who were trying to force that propaganda on us did not recognise that there was a report that showed that the Gaelic language in Scotland is more or less dead, and that hardly anyone uses it or transfers it from one generation to the next. What sort of success is that for a channel that was established under the BBC in Scotland to promote and protect the Gaelic language? Let us take pride in the fact that S4C has played a very important role in the rejuvenation that we have seen not only in the number of people speaking Welsh but in the number of people using Welsh. Some of the criticism made of S4C programming related to children's programmes, which is an exceptionally successful department within S4C. However, no figures are gathered for children's programming, so that was not even registered.

We must remember that the Broadcasters' Audience Research Board figures are misleading, because of the relatively small number of people who speak Welsh—1 per cent of the population of the United Kingdom. You cannot have a clear picture of people's viewing habits from general figures of that sort. There is no evidence whatsoever to prove that S4C would be more successful under a different regulation model. What we currently have is 28 years of evidence that S4C has been exceptionally successful.

The principle of independence is exceptionally important—and we are talking about independence not only in the creative element of commissioning or independence, but total independence for S4C. I have no problem with S4C being funded through the licence fee; that is an excellent idea. However, let us bear in mind that the licence fee is a licence fee for public broadcasting, and not a personal licence fee for the BBC. Sir Michael Lyons, in his letter—it is appalling that he chose to publish that letter

dewis cyhoeddi'r llythyr hwnnw cyn bod S4C wedi cael cyfle i'w dderbyn hyd yn oed—yn rhoi'r argraff bod y BBC wedi dod i achub S4C a'i fod, yn hael iawn, yn barod i rannu ychydig o arian ei drwydded gydag S4C, ond, wrth gwrs, y byddai'n rhaid i'r BBC gael rôl yn goruchwyllo'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd. Byddai'n gwbl annerbyniol i S4C gael ei ariannu drwy'r BBC. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod beth fyddai canlyniadau hynny, yn sicr wedi 2015, o ran ariannu S4C i'r dyfodol ac o ran comisiynu o'r sector annibynnol i S4C.

Nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r syniad o bartneriaeth rhwng S4C a'r BBC. Mae'n siŵr bod modd gwneud rhai arbedion a fyddai'n fuddiol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, dylai fod yn bartneriaeth deg a chyfartal, nid un sy'n gosod S4C mewn sefyllfa lle mae'n israddol i'r BBC. Yr oedd llythyr Syr Michael Lyons yn ymddangos fel ymgais i gymryd S4C drosodd a'i wneud yn un o sianelau'r BBC, yn union fel BBC Alba yn yr Alban. Yr ydym yn sôn am sefyllfa gwbl wahanol. Yr ydym yn sôn am sefydliad sydd wedi gwasanaethu Cymru, yr iaith Gymraeg a'r economi yng Nghymru yn dda. Pan ydym yn sôn am fuddsoddiad y Llywodraeth yn S4C dros y 28 mlynedd diwethaf, gadewch inni gofio hefyd am yr hyn y mae S4C wedi ei gyfrannu i economi Cymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae oddeutu £100 miliwn yn dod yn ôl i'r economi yng Nghymru drwy weithgareddau S4C.

Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod bod y sefyllfa o ran plwraliaeth o fewn darlledu cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn fregus iawn. Ni allwn fforddio colli darlledwr cyhoeddus arall. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod pa mor bwysig yw'r diwydiannau creadigol i unrhyw fath o adfywiad economaidd yng Nghymru. Ni allwn fforddio sefyllfa lle mae S4C yn peidio â chomisiynu yn uniongyrchol oddi wrth y sector annibynnol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn y prynhawn yma a dyna pam yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd pob Aelod yn ei gefnogi. Mae S4C yn sefydliad hynod bwysig ar gyfer darlledu cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ac ar gyfer dyfodol yr economi o ran y diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru. Mae gan S4C hanes i ymfalchïo ynddo a dyfodol disglair i'w wynebu. Os oes

before S4C had even received a copy of it— gave the impression that the BBC had somehow come to save S4C and that it was, extremely generously, eager to share some of its licence fee with S4C, but that the BBC would, of course, have to take a role in overseeing what was happening. It would be entirely unacceptable for S4C to be funded through the BBC. We all know what the outcome of that would be, certainly after 2015, for the funding of S4C for the future and for commissioning from the independent sector for S4C.

I do not oppose the concept of a partnership between S4C and the BBC. I am sure that there is a means there to make some savings that would be beneficial for the future. However, it should be a fair and equal partnership, rather than a partnership that placed S4C in a junior position to the BBC. Sir Michael Lyons's letter appeared to me to be an attempt to take over S4C and to make it one of the BBC's channels, just as is the case with BBC Alba in Scotland. We are talking here of a situation that is entirely different. We are talking about an institution that has served Wales, the Welsh language and the Welsh economy well. When we talk of Government investment in S4C over the last 28 years, let us also bear in mind what S4C has contributed to the Welsh economy. At present, that sum is somewhere in the region of £100 million coming back to the Welsh economy through the activities of S4C.

We all know that the situation with plurality in public broadcasting in Wales is very fragile. We cannot afford to lose another public broadcaster. We all know how important the creative industries are to any kind of economic regeneration in Wales. We cannot afford to find ourselves in a situation where S4C ceases to commission directly from the independent sector. That is why we have tabled this motion this afternoon, and that is why I hope that all Members will support the motion. S4C is a very important institution for public broadcasting in Wales and for the future of the Welsh economy via the creative industries in Wales. S4C has a history of which it can be proud and a bright future ahead of it. If there are problems in the present, let us deal with those problems, but

problemau yn bodoli yn y presennol, gadewch inni ddelio â'r problemau hynny, ond peidiwch â thanseilio a diddymu model sydd wedi gwasanaethu Cymru yn arbennig o dda am bron i 30 mlynedd.

3.10 p.m.

Nick Bourne: As Rhodri Glyn Thomas has said, it is important that we unanimously reaffirm, on a cross-party basis, in the National Assembly that we believe, as the motion states, that an independent S4C is essential for the future of public broadcasting and the creative industries in Wales.

I will say a little more about the creative industries before moving to talk about S4C. I want to confirm, first of all, that creative industries are vital for, and vibrant in, Wales. Outside of London, we have the most vibrant creative industries in these islands. I would like to welcome the new creative industries panel and the Digital Wales advisory board recently appointed by the Welsh Assembly Government. We need more reliable and timely information, so I hope that, from the outset, both those bodies will note the recommendation of Professor Ian Hargreaves that a comprehensive mapping exercise of Welsh creative industries should be undertaken.

The sector skills council data suggests that Welsh creative industries provide between 22,000 and 30,000 jobs and contribute between £450 million and £500 million to the Welsh economy every year. That is massive—it is a considerable economic input. That is additional to their immense cultural and social value. Welsh cultural life is vibrant. *Pen Talar*, for example, is winning critical and audience acclaim for S4C. Music lovers of all ages were recently attracted to the Sŵn festival across Cardiff and National Theatre Wales has begun to embed itself in Welsh life with a series of excellent productions across Wales—not just in Cardiff, but in Swansea, Barmouth, Bridgend, Prestatyn and Brecon.

let us not undermine and do away with a model that served Wales exceptionally well for almost 30 years.

Nick Bourne: Fel y mae Rhodri Glyn Thomas wedi'i ddweud, mae'n bwysig inni ailddatgan yn unfrydol, yn drawsbleidiol, yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ein bod yn credu, yn unol â'r cynnig, fod S4C annibynnol yn hanfodol ar gyfer dyfodol darlledu cyhoeddus a'r diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru.

Dywedaf ychydig yn rhagor am y diwydiannau creadigol cyn symud ymlaen i siarad am S4C. Hoffwn gadarnhau, yn gyntaf oll, fod diwydiannau creadigol yn hanfodol i Gymru, ac yn ffyniannus yng Nghymru. Y tu allan i Lundain, mae gennym y diwydiannau creadigol mwyaf ffyniannus yn yr ynysoedd hyn. Hoffwn groesawu'r panel diwydiannau creadigol newydd a bwrdd cyngori Cymru Ddigidol a benodwyd yn ddiweddar gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae angen arnom wybodaeth fwy dibynadwy ac amserol, felly gobeithiaf y bydd y ddau gorff hyn, o'r cychwyn cyntaf, yn nodi argymhelliad yr Athro Ian Hargreaves sef y dylid gwneud ymarfer mapio cynhwysfawr o ddiwydiannau creadigol Cymru.

Mae data'r cyngor sgiliau sector yn awgrymu bod diwydiannau creadigol Cymru'n darparu rhwng 22,000 a 30,000 o swyddi ac yn cyfrannu rhwng £450 miliwn a £500 miliwn at economi Cymru bob blwyddyn. Mae hynny'n enfawr—mae'n gyfraniad sylweddol at yr economi. Mae hynny'n ychwanegol at eu gwerth diwylliannol a chymdeithasol aruthrol. Mae bywyd diwylliannol Cymru'n ffynnu. Mae *Pen Talar*, er enghraifft, yn ennill clod ymlith beirniaid a chynulleidfaoedd i S4C. Denwyd rhai o bob oedran sy'n mwynhau cerddoriaeth yn ddiweddar i ŵyl Sŵn ledled Caerdydd ac mae National Theatre Wales wedi dechrau cynnwys ei hun ym mywyd Cymru gyda chyfres o gynyrchiadau rhagorol ledled Cymru—nid yng Nghaerdydd yn unig, ond yn Abertawe, Abermo, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Prestatyn ac Aberhonddu.

Moving on to S4C, it is natural that concerns have been expressed about the changes announced to S4C's funding arrangements. This motion does not raise particular concerns about the funding settlement itself, which is a tough settlement, but it is about the independence and the security of funding into the future. I hope that this debate in our democratic forum can set out clearly our common ground. All parties, in the wider sense of the word, are clear that independence for S4C is crucial, and I agree that that is not just about the commissioning and editorial aspects, but about S4C's functioning independence from the BBC, so that it is not a satellite or an offset of the BBC. I know from speaking to Cheryl Gillan and David Jones that they are supportive of this and that they are in dialogue with the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, which also recognises the importance of this and the ongoing security of funding post-2014, which we have not heard anything about.

It is important that there is a clear independent revenue stream. What is characterised as the BBC licence fee is not actually the BBC licence fee, but a broadcasting licence fee. We must, therefore, be clear that there must be a formula that guarantees funding for S4C into the future. We must nail that, because it is vital. Like Rhodri Glyn Thomas, I have no problem with S4C being paid for out of the licence fee—indeed, I find it quite attractive that that should be done; that is what the licence fee is for.

Therefore, it is incumbent on us as elected Members to embrace our responsibility in relation to broadcasting, although we will all have different views about how it is handled. It is a difficult area, because you could not think of anything more local, or more global, than broadcasting. Therefore, how responsibility over broadcasting is handled is not as straightforward as saying that it should be done here or there. However, there is a role for the National Assembly, hence the debate today.

The BBC Trust and the S4C Authority are

Gan symud ymlaen i S4C, mae'n naturiol bod pryderon wedi'u mynegi am y newidiadau a gyhoeddwyd yn nhrefniadau ariannu S4C. Nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn codi pryderon arbennig am y setliad cyllid ei hun, sy'n setliad caled, ond mae'n ymwneud ag annibyniaeth a diogelu cyllid i'r dyfodol. Gobeithiaf y gall y ddadl hon yn ein fforwm democratig nodi'n glir ein tir cyffredin. Mae pob plaid, yn ystyr ehangach y gair, yn cytuno bod annibyniaeth i S4C yn allweddol, ac rwy'n cytuno nad yw'n ymwneud yn unig â'r agweddau comisiynu a golygu, ond ag annibyniaeth gweithredu S4C ar y BBC, fel nad yw'n is-sianel nac yn gangen o'r BBC. Gwn o siarad â Cheryl Gillan a David Jones eu bod yn cefnogi hyn a'u bod wrthi'n trafod â'r Adran Diwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, sydd hefyd yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw hyn a diogelwch parhaus cyllid ar ôl 2014, nad ydym wedi clywed dim amdano.

Mae'n bwysig bod ffrwd refeniw annibynnol clir. Nid ffi trwydded y BBC mewn gwirionedd yw'r hyn a nodweddir yn ffi trwydded y BBC, ond ffi'r drwydded ddarlledu. Rhaid, felly, inni fod yn glir ei bod yn rhaid cael fformiwla sy'n sicrhau cyllid i S4C i'r dyfodol. Mae'n rhaid inni gael hynny'n iawn, am ei fod yn hanfodol. Fel Rhodri Glyn Thomas, nid oes gennyf broblem o gwbl gyda thalu am S4C allan o ffi'r drwydded—yn wir, mae'n eithaf deniadol imi y dylid gwneud hynny; hwnnw yw diben ffi'r drwydded.

Felly, mae'n rheidrydd arnom fel Aelodau etholedig arddel ein cyfrifoldeb mewn perthynas â darlledu, er bydd gennym oll wahanol farn am y ffordd y caiff ei drin. Mae'n faes anodd, oherwydd ni allech chi feddwl am ddim sy'n fwy lleol, nac yn fwy byd-eang, na darlledu. Felly, nid yw'r ffordd y mae cyfrifoldeb am ddarlledu'n cael ei drin mor syml â dweud y dylid ei wneud yma neu acw. Fodd bynnag, mae rôl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac felly'r ddadl heddiw.

Mae Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC ac Awdurdod

shortly to begin discussions on governance. The chair of the BBC Trust said last week that he would like to move quickly to settle the future of the existing partnership. Again, like Rhodri Glyn Thomas, I recognise the value of partnership on some matters that already exist, which has yielded popular S4C programmes such as *Pobol y Cwm* and *Newyddion*.

I also want to recognise at this stage the important role that Menna Richards has had in the past as director of BBC Wales—I say in the past, because I know that she is retiring. I hope that we can send a message from here to wish her well in the future. I also want to welcome Elan Closs Stephens to the post of BBC trustee for Wales, which is good news. She will oversee discussions with S4C on behalf of the trust and that is a welcome development, as she clearly understands this area like few others, with clarity and depth.

Again, I am in a broad measure of agreement with what Rhodri Glyn has said.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Could you wind up, please?

Nick Bourne: Certainly. He referred to some of the problems within S4C, and they have to be addressed separately, I agree. There are issues that need to be addressed. However, above all, let us send out a clear message about the independence of S4C in the future. It needs full independence, and I hope that all Members will vote in favour of that clear proposition.

Alun Davies: I very much welcome this debate on the future of S4C. I would particularly like to welcome the contribution just made by the leader of the opposition. Debates of this sort, which are inevitably critical of the United Kingdom Government, can be easy for those of us on this side of the Chamber, and it is incumbent upon us to say that some of the more difficult decisions taken by both the Welsh Liberal Democrats and the Welsh Conservatives on this issue are warmly welcomed on this side of the Chamber. Certainly, the criticisms that I

S4C ar fin dechrau trafod llywodraethu. Dywedodd cadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC yr wythnos diwethaf y byddai'n hoffi symud yn gyflym i gadarnhau dyfodol y bartneriaeth sy'n bodoli. Eto, fel Rhodri Glyn Thomas, rwy'n cydnabod gwerth partneriaeth ar rai materion sydd eisoes yn bodoli, sydd wedi cynhyrchu rhaglenni S4C poblogaidd fel *Pobol y Cwm* a *Newyddion*.

Hoffwn hefyd gydnabod ar hyn o bryd y rôl bwysig a fu gan Menna Richards yn y gorffennol yn gyfarwyddwr BBC Cymru—dywedaf yn y gorffennol, am fy mod i'n gwybod ei bod yn ymddeol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn anfon neges oddi yma i ddymuno'n dda iddi yn y dyfodol. Hoffwn hefyd groesawu Elan Closs Stephens i swydd ymddiriedolwr Cymru'r BBC, sy'n newyddion da. Bydd hi'n goruchwyllo trafodaethau â S4C ar ran yr ymddiriedolaeth ac mae hwnnw'n ddatblygiad calonogol, am ei bod hi'n amlwg yn un o'r rhai prin sy'n deall y maes hwn, yn glir ac yn ddwfn.

Eto, rwy'n fras gytuno â'r hyn y mae Rhodri Glyn wedi'i ddweud.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch chi ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Nick Bourne: Gallaf wir. Cyfeiriodd at rai o'r problemau yn S4C, ac mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy ar wahân, rwy'n cytuno. Mae pethau y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy. Fodd bynnag, uwchlaw popeth, gadewch inni anfon neges glir am annibyniaeth S4C yn y dyfodol. Mae angen annibyniaeth lwyr arni, a gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod yn pleidleisio o blaid y cynigiad clir hwnnw.

Alun Davies: Croesawaf yn frwd y ddadl hon am ddyfodol S4C. Hoffwn groesawu'n arbennig y cyfraniad y mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid newydd ei wneud. Gall dadleuon o'r math hwn, sy'n anochel yn beirniadu Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, fod yn hawdd i'r rheini ohonom ar yr ochr hon ar y Siambr, ac mae'n rhaid inni ddweud bod rhai o'r penderfyniadau anoddach a wneir gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru a Cheidwadwyr Cymru ar y mater hwn yn cael croeso cynnes ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr. Yn wir, ni ddylid dehongli'r beirniadaethau a

make of the UK Government on this matter should not be interpreted as criticisms of either the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats or the leader of the Welsh Conservatives, both of whom I know have a deep personal commitment to these matters that goes beyond the simply political. It is important that we maintain the broad consensus that we have in this place about the future of S4C, which should be a well-funded future, and also an independent future. I very much welcome the letter that was sent by the leaders of all four parties represented here to the Prime Minister on this matter some weeks ago. I endorsed everything that was said in that letter. To pick up on the point that the leader of the opposition made in closing, there have certainly been problems within S4C. It has not helped itself in how it has dealt with those problems over the last month. The authority has lost its credibility, and should be replaced immediately to ensure that the channel has the credible leadership it needs to move forward. That needs to be said.

As for where we are today, the actions of the Department for Culture, Media and Sport in bullying S4C over the summer and attempting to force it to accept illegal cuts, are among the most appalling examples of bullying by a Government of a public-service broadcaster that we have seen in the United Kingdom. It is important to recognise that a public-service broadcaster, in the British constitution, has always been seen as being at arm's length from Government, and not a state broadcaster. That is an important distinction, which was thrown aside by the DCMS over the summer. That department intervened in the internal management of a public-service broadcaster, which should not happen in the United Kingdom, and attempted to force it to accept something that was clearly illegal, bullying it and repeating comments made in a private meeting. That is an appalling way for a Government department to operate, and an appalling way for a Cabinet Minister to operate. The Government might have had access to private information, but those of us here, who represent the viewers of S4C, find out what is happening through leaks and briefings, while that same Cabinet Minister talks about a new

wnaf o Lywodraeth y DU ar y mater hwn fel beirniadaethau o arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru neu arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, a minnau'n gwybod bod gan y ddau ohonynt ymrwymiad personol dwfn i'r materion hyn sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i wleidyddiaeth bur. Mae'n bwysig inni gynnal y cydsyniad eang sydd gennym yma am ddyfodol S4C, a ddylai fod yn ddyfodol wedi'i ariannu'n dda, a hefyd yn ddyfodol annibynnol. Croesawaf yn fawr iawn y llythyr ar y mater hwn a anfonwyd gan arweinwyr y pedair plaid a gynrychiolir yma at y Prif Weinidog rai wythnosau yn ôl. Roeddwn yn cefnogi popeth a ddywedwyd yn y llythyr hwnnw. I sôn am y pwynt a wnaeth arweinydd yr wrthblaid wrth gloi, mae'n bendant y bu problemau yn S4C. Nid yw wedi helpu ei hun yn y ffordd y mae wedi ymdrin â'r problemau hynny dros y mis diwethaf. Mae'r awdurdod wedi colli ei hygyrdd, a dylid ei ddisodli ar unwaith i sicrhau bod gan y sianel yr arweinyddiaeth gredadwy sydd ei hangen arni i symud ymlaen. Mae angen dweud hynny.

O ran ein sefyllfa heddiw, mae camau'r Adran Diwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon wrth fwlio S4C dros yr haf a cheisio ei gorfodi i dderbyn toriadau anghyfreithlon, ymhlith yr enghreifftiau mwyaf ofnadwy a welsom yn y Deyrnas Unedig o Lywodraeth yn bwlio darlledwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod darlledwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, yng nghyfansoddiad Prydain, wedi cael ei ystyried erioed fel rhywbeth hyd braich oddi wrth lywodraeth, ac nid darlledwr gwladol. Mae hwnnw'n wahaniaeth pwysig, a daflwyd o'r neilltu gan yr Adran Diwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon dros yr haf. Ymyrodd yr adran honno yn rheolaeth fewnol darlledwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, ac ni ddylai hynny ddigwydd yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Ceisiodd hefyd ei orfodi i dderbyn rhywbeth a oedd yn amlwg yn anghyfreithlon, gan ei fwlio ac ailadrodd sylwadau a wnaethpwyd mewn cyfarfod preifat. Mae honno'n ffordd ofnadwy i adran Llywodraeth weithredu, ac yn ffordd ofnadwy i Weinidog Cabinet weithredu. Hwyrach y bu gwybodaeth breifat ar gael i'r Llywodraeth, ond mae'r rheini ohonom yma, sy'n cynrychioli gwylwyr S4C, yn cael gwybod beth sy'n digwydd drwy

politics. I do not believe you, Jeremy Hunt. I do not believe a word that you have said on this. The message from the Assembly needs to be clear: the bullying of a public-service broadcaster in this way is wholly unacceptable.

On the BBC, I do not trust it when it comes to Wales. We have seen around an 18 per cent fall in English-language output since 2003. Anyone who was listening to Radio 4 this morning will know that Wales simply does not exist on the BBC's agenda. It will talk about Scotland, it will refer to Northern Ireland, and it is obsessed with London, but it ignores this place, and this country, and it needs to understand that if it is to take responsibility for S4C, then we will insist—I believe that we should—on a mechanism to ensure that S4C is well-funded into the future.

3.20 p.m.

What Michael Lyons said in his letter last week, or the week before, that the BBC Trust will require oversight to ensure that the licence fee is well spent, was appalling. We need to ensure that the independence of S4C is not simply creative independence, as he suggests, but editorial, structural and legal independence. We need to ensure that in order to guarantee its future. The BBC has just cut the programming that it provides to S4C. Let us say to the BBC—Mark Thompson is here later in the week—that since Welsh speakers form about 1 per cent of the UK population, let us see 1 per cent of the BBC's income spent on Welsh-language broadcasting. That would mean £475 million to be spent on Welsh-language broadcasting, which would give us the sort of broadcasting that we want and deserve into the future. I hope that the motion and the debate will cement the consensus in the Chamber on this matter, and that we will be able to argue the case for S4C, its independence and its financial underpinning on the basis of unity and consensus.

sibrydion a sesiynau gwybodaeth, tra bod yr un Gweinidog Cabinet hwnnw'n siarad am wleidyddiaeth newydd. Nid wyf yn eich credu chi, Jeremy Hunt. Nid wyf yn credu gair a ddywedasocho am hyn. Mae angen i'r neges oddi wrth y Cynulliad fod yn glir: mae'n gwbl annerbyniol bwlio darlledwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn y modd hwn.

O ran y BBC, nid oes gennyf ffydd ynddo pan ddaw i Gymru. Rydym wedi gweld cynnyrch Saesneg yn gostwng tua 18 y cant ers 2003. Bydd unrhyw un a oedd yn gwrandao ar Radio 4 y bore yma yn gwybod nad yw Cymru'n bod ar agenda'r BBC. Bydd yn siarad am yr Alban, bydd yn cyfeirio at Ogledd Iwerddon, ac mae wedi gwirioni ar Lundain, ond mae'n anwybyddu'r lle hwn, a'r wlad hon, ac mae angen iddo ddeall, os bydd yn gyfrifol am S4C, y byddwn yn mynnu—rwy'n credu y dylem—ar fecanwaith i sicrhau bod S4C yn cael ei hariannu'n dda i'r dyfodol.

Roedd yr hyn a ddywedodd Michael Lyons yn ei lythyr yr wythnos diwethaf, neu'r wythnos gynt yn ofnadwy, sef y bydd angen goruchwyllo Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC i sicrhau bod ffi'r drwydded yn cael ei gwario'n dda. Mae angen inni sicrhau nad annibyniaeth greadigol yn unig yw annibyniaeth S4C, fel y mae yntau'n ei awgrymu, ond annibyniaeth olygyddol, strwythurol a chyfreithiol. Mae angen inni sicrhau hynny er mwyn sicrhau ei dyfodol. Mae'r BBC newydd gwtogi ar y rhaglenni y mae'n eu darparu i S4C. Gadewch inni ddweud wrth y BBC—mae Mark Thompson yma'n ddiweddarach yn yr wythnos—gan fod siaradwyr Cymraeg yn ffurfio tuag 1 y cant o boblogaeth y DU, gadewch inni weld 1 y cant o incwm y BBC yn cael ei wario ar ddarlledu Cymraeg. Byddai hynny'n golygu gwario £475 miliwn ar ddarlledu Cymraeg, a fyddai'n rhoi inni'r math o ddarlledu yr ydym am ei gael ac yn ei haeddu i'r dyfodol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y cynnig a'r ddadl yn cadarnhau'r cydsyniad yn y Siambr ar y mater hwn, ac y byddwn yn gallu dadlau'r achos dros S4C, ei hannibyniaeth a'i sylfaen ariannol ar sail undod a chydsyniad.

Eleanor Burnham: I concur with everything that has been said so far.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i gyfrannu'n fyr mewn dadl mor hanfodol bwysig i'n hiaith, ein cenedl, darlledu, y diwydiannau creadigol ac yn y blaen. Dyna'r pwynt, onid e? Mae cymaint yn y fantol.

We must acknowledge that the basic tenet must be the independence of S4C. We should remember that the BBC already has a monopoly in Wales. It produces Welsh-language news for S4C, and it has its own radio and television programmes in Welsh and English. Therefore, in effect, it already has a monopoly. There is a democratic deficit here, which some of us have been discussing for many years. It is not my business to poke my nose into what has happened with regard to the lack of governance and the unseemly spectacle in relation to S4C over the last six months, and I do not want to rehearse that. It is very sad, and we should just move on.

I disagree a little with Rhodri Glyn's assertion that we do not need to revisit the structure of S4C. The demise of Barcud Derwen and many other small indies that have been swept up, almost vacuumed, into the control of S4C—I am sure that Rhodri Glyn will jump to his feet if he disagrees with me—desperately needs to be looked at. There are many unhappy people who have lost their jobs over the years, and the indies have contracted—I mean that they have been reduced, rather than sub-contracted, or whatever the technical expression may be—to such a degree that they are under huge pressure. With regard to north-west Wales, which is part of my region—I nearly called it an empire; it feels like one—it is important that we do our very best. These are very important people. I met a very nice young couple the other day who are working at the cutting edge of new broadcasting and filmmaking. It is important for us all to help such people, because there is a lot of creativity around.

If I had my way, I would cut the salaries of all those in the higher echelons in BBC UK, because they are monstrously extravagant. I

Eleanor Burnham: Cytunaf â phopeth a ddywedwyd hyd yma.

I welcome the opportunity to briefly contribute to a debate that is so important to our language, nation, broadcasting, the creative industries and so on. That is the point, is it not? So much hangs in the balance.

Mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod ei bod yn rhaid i annibyniaeth S4C fod y daliad sylfaenol. Dylem gofio fod gan y BBC fonopoli yng Nghymru eisoes. Mae'n cynhyrchu newyddion Cymraeg i S4C, ac mae ganddo ei raglenni radio a theledu ei hun yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg. Felly, i bob pwrpas, mae monopoli ganddo'n barod. Mae diffyg democratig yma, y bu rhai ohonom yn ei drafod ers blynyddoedd. Nid fy musnes i yw gwthio fy nhrwyn i'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd o ran diffyg llywodraethu a'r sioe anwedus mewn perthynas ag S4C dros y chwe mis diwethaf, ac nid wyf am ymarfer hynny. Mae'n drist iawn, a dylem symud ymlaen.

Anghytunaf ychydig â honiad Rhodri Glyn nad oes angen inni ailystyried strwythur S4C. Mae angen edrych ar frys ar dranc Barcud Derwen a llawer o gwmnïau annibynnol bach eraill sydd wedi'u sgubo, eu sugno bron, i reolaeth S4C—rwy'n siŵr y bydd Rhodri Glyn yn neidio i'w draed os yw'n anghytuno â mi. Mae llawer o bobl anhapus sydd wedi colli eu swyddi dros y blynyddoedd, ac mae'r cwmnïau annibynnol wedi'u cywasgu cymaint eu bod o dan bwysau enfawr. O ran gogledd-orllewin Cymru, sy'n rhan o'r rhanbarth i—bron imi ei alw'n ymerodraeth; mae'n teimlo fel un—mae'n bwysig inni wneud ein gorau glas. Mae'r rhain yn bobl bwysig iawn. Cyfarfûm â phâr ifanc clên iawn y diwrnod o'r blaen sy'n gweithio ar flaen y gad o ran gwneuthur ffilmiau a darlledu newydd. Mae'n bwysig i bob un ohonom helpu pobl felly, am fod llawer o greadigrwydd o gwmpas.

Petawn i'n cael fy ffordd, byddwn yn torri cyflogau pob un o'r rheini yn haenau uwch BBC UK, am eu bod yn aruthrol o afradlon.

cannot imagine why people are moaning about what we as backbenchers get, namely £53,000—they do not understand that Mark Thompson gets £0.75 million. Are we so innumerate in Wales that we do not understand the difference? It is a huge challenge, and we should be cutting down to size some of the obscene people who are saying the most appalling things about women. I am sorry to bring this up again, but the BBC is getting rid of women of a certain age, and yet there are older men in the BBC who are still marching on. I make that point in passing and hope that I can do so without being cut off.

Considering the huge importance of S4C, I am delighted that the letter was sent on behalf of all party leaders in the Assembly, and we will be applying as much pressure as we can. I had hoped a few years ago—it is perhaps unrealistic—that we could have one S4C channel for youngsters, and another for older people. We are living in a difficult age, when it is difficult for one channel to be all things to all men. Why can there not be some productive blue-sky thinking? Cyw has been fantastic.

Before I forget or get cut off, I would like to pay tribute to Menna Richards, who is leaving the BBC, and to welcome Elan Closs Stephens, who I think is phenomenal. I wish her all the best in what she can do to help S4C.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You had another three-quarters of a minute—

Eleanor Burnham: Oh, did I really? Well, in that case—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: No, it is too late now. You have finished. I call Paul Davies. [*Laughter.*]

Eleanor Burnham: If that is the case, let us march on; let us do our best, because S4C is a gem that we need to make shine once again.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddatl hon y prynhawn yma. Dywedaf o'r cychwyn fy mod yn poeni

Ni allaf ddychmygu pam mae pobl yn cwyno am yr hyn a gawn ninnau ar y meinciau cefn, sef £53,000-nid ydynt yn deall bod Mark Thompson yn cael £0.75 miliwn. A ydym mor anrhifog yng Nghymru nad ydym yn deall y gwahaniaeth? Mae'n her anferth, a dylem fod yn torri crib rhai o'r bobl anllad sy'n dweud y pethau mwyaf ofnadwy am fenywod. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf sôn am hyn eto, ond mae'r BBC yn cael gwared ar fenywod o oedran penodol, ac eto mae dynion hŷn yn y BBC sy'n dal yn bwrw ymlaen. Rwy'n gwneud y pwynt hwnnw wrth fynd heibio a gobeithiaf y gallaf wneud hynny heb gael fy atal.

O ystyried cryn bwysigrwydd S4C, rwyf wrth fy modd bod y llythyr wedi'i anfon ar ran arweinwyr yr holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad, a byddwn yn pwysu cymaint ag y gallwn. Roeddwn wedi gobeithio rai blynyddoedd yn ôl—hwyrach ei bod yn afrealistig—y gallem gael un sianel S4C i ieuencid, ac un arall i bobl hŷn. Rydym yn byw mewn oes anodd, sy'n ei gwneud yn anodd i un sianel fod yn bopeth i bawb. Pam na ellir cael rhyw feddwl awyr las cynhyrchiol? Mae Cyw wedi bod yn wych.

Cyn imi anghofio neu cyn i rywun dorri ar fy nhraws, hoffwn dalu teyrnged i Menna Richards, sy'n gadael y BBC, a chrosawu Elan Closs Stephens, sy'n rhyfeddol yn fy marn i. Dymunaf y gorau iddi yn yr hyn y gall ei wneud i helpu S4C.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Roedd gennyhych dri chwarter munud arall—

Eleanor Burnham: O, wir? Wel, os felly—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Na, mae'n rhy hwyr erbyn hyn. Rydych wedi gofyn. Galwaf Paul Davies. [*Chwerthin.*]

Eleanor Burnham: Os felly, gadewch inni fwrw ymlaen; gadewch inni wneud ein gorau glas, gan fod S4C yn drysor y mae angen inni wneud iddi sgleinio unwaith eto.

Paul Davies: I am pleased to have the opportunity to participate in this debate this afternoon. I wish to say at the outset that I am

am y datblygiadau o ran S4C dros yr wythnosau diwethaf. Dywedaf hynny gan fy mod yn credu y gall y cynlluniau i newid y strwythur a strwythur ariannu S4C fygwth annibyniaeth y sianel. Mae'n amlwg bod y penderfyniad wedi achosi pryder, gan ein bod wedi gweld llawer o drafodaethau ar hyd a lled Cymru ar y mater. Mae S4C yn hynod o bwysig i'n diwylliant ac i ddyfodol yr iaith Cymraeg. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae annibyniaeth S4C yn hollbwysig, ac yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau plwraliaeth yng Nghymru. Gwn fod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol a'r BBC wedi ymrwmo i sicrhau annibyniaeth y sianel, a chroesawaf hynny. Dyna'r hyn y mae arweinwyr y pedair plaid wedi galw amdano yn y llythyr y maent wedi'i anfon at Lywodraeth Prydain. Mewn gwlad lle yr ydym yn gweld y galw am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn cynyddu, mae'n hanfodol bod ein plant a chenedlaethau i ddod yn cael y cyfle i wrando ar yr iaith Cymraeg tu fewn a thu allan i'r dosbarth, ac felly mae S4C yn hollbwysig i sicrhau bod plant yn cael y cyfle i wneud hynny.

Yn naturiol, mae S4C yn bwysig i hyrwyddo defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn ein cymunedau, a deallaf yn iawn fod llawer yn teimlo y gall y ffaith y bydd y BBC yn gyfrifol am S4C olygu bod y sianel yn cael ei llyncu i mewn i'r BBC. Byddai hynny'n niweidiol i blwraliaeth. Cydymdeimlaf â'r safbwynt hwnnw, a dyna pam mae'n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Prydain yn ymateb yn bositif i'r llythyr a anfonwyd gan arweinwyr y pedair plaid a sefydlu adolygiad annibynnol i S4C. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr adolygiad annibynnol yn dod i'r casgliad bod yr amser wedi dod i ddatganoli S4C i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n rhaid datganoli'r sianel gyda'r strwythur ariannu priodol. Byddai datganoli S4C heb y cyllid priodol yn annerbyniol.

Fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn, yr ydym wedi clywed yn ddiweddar am bwysigrwydd S4C i economi Cymru. Mae'r ffaith bod y sianel yn werth rhyw £90 miliwn i'n heconomi yn dangos y pwysigrwydd hwnnw. Mae'n werth nodi pwysigrwydd S4C i ddiwydiannau creadigol Cymru. Mae'r adroddiad gan Brifysgol Caerdydd, sydd yn sôn am

concerned about the developments with regard to S4C over the past few weeks. I say that because I think that the plans to change the structure and funding structure of S4C could threaten the independence of the channel. It is clear that the decision has caused concern, as we have seen a great deal of debate throughout Wales on the issue. S4C is extremely important to our culture and to the future of the Welsh language. As has already been said, the independence of S4C is crucial, and essential for ensuring plurality in Wales. I know that the UK Government and the BBC have committed to ensuring the independence of the channel, and I welcome that. That is what the leaders of the four parties have called for in the letter that they have sent to the UK Government. In a nation where we see demand for Welsh-medium education increasing it is crucial that our children and future generations have the opportunity to hear the Welsh language inside and outside the classroom. S4C is crucial in ensuring that children have that opportunity.

Naturally, S4C is important in promoting the use of the Welsh language in our communities, and I fully understand that many believe that the fact that the BBC will become responsible for S4C could mean that the channel will become subsumed by the BBC. That would be damaging to plurality. I sympathise with that viewpoint, and that is why it is crucial that the British Government responds positively to the letter sent by the leaders of the four parties and establishes an independent review into S4C. I hope that an independent review would conclude that the time has come to devolve responsibility for S4C to the Assembly. However, the channel would have to be devolved with the appropriate funding structure. To devolve S4C without the appropriate funding would be unacceptable.

As Rhodri Glyn said, we have recently heard about the importance of S4C to the Welsh economy. The fact that the channel is worth some £90 million to our economy demonstrates that importance. It is worth noting the importance of S4C to the creative industries in Wales. The Cardiff University report, which talks about the importance of

bwysigrwydd S4C i economi Cymru, wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod S4C yn gyfrifol am greu dros 2,000 o swyddi yn y sector creadigol yng Nghymru. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym wedi gweld llawer o waith da yn ddiweddar yn yr ardal hon—fel y soniodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid—fel llwyddiant y gyfres ddrama *Pen Talar*. Mae hyn yn dangos cyfraniad arbennig S4C i'n diwylliant a'n cymdeithas.

Fodd bynnag, mae elfennau o fewn y sianel y mae angen eu datblygu a'u gwella—dyna pam y byddai adolygiad annibynnol yn help enfawr. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y pleidiau gwleidyddol yn y Cynulliad yn cydnabod bod diwygio'r sianel yn angenrheidiol. Fel y dywedwyd, mae S4C wedi cydnabod hyn yn y ddogfen ar y broses adnewyddu a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar. Yr wyf yn teimlo'n gryf y dylai S4C barhau i fod yn ddarlledwr Cymraeg yn unig, er bod rhai pobl a rhai arolygon barn yn awgrymu y dylai ddarlledu rhaglenni Saesneg er mwyn denu rhagor o wylwyr. Nid wyf yn credu hyn. Byddai newid sylweddol o'r fath yn cael effaith enfawr ar ein diwylliant Cymreig. Sefydlwyd S4C fel sianel i'r iaith Gymraeg, a byddai newid i ddarlledu rhaglenni Saesneg yn niweidiol i'r iaith Gymraeg.

Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld consensws gwleidyddol ar yr iaith Gymraeg, ac yr ydym wedi cael datblygiadau positif sylweddol ar yr iaith. Gobeithiaf y gallwn barhau'n bositif gyda'n gilydd i sicrhau dyfodol llwyddiannus i S4C. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gydag Aelodau o bob plaid i ddatganoli cyfrifoldeb dros S4C yn y dyfodol agos.

3.30 p.m.

I gloi, croesawaf yr agwedd drawsbleidiol at S4C ac ymrwymiad pawb yn y Siambr i gadw annibyniaeth S4C. Mae S4C wedi gwneud gwaith gwych dros y blynyddoedd—mae'n waith y gallwn i gyd ei ddathlu. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y gwaith hwn yn parhau yn y dyfodol.

S4C to the Welsh economy, drew attention to the fact that S4C is responsible for generating more than 2,000 jobs in the creative sector in Wales. Of course, we have seen a great deal of good work in this area recently—as the leader of the opposition mentioned—such as the success of the drama series *Pen Talar*. This shows the unique contribution that S4C makes to our society and culture.

However, there are elements of the channel that need to be improved and changed—that is why an independent review would be a great help. I welcome the fact that the political parties in the Assembly recognise that changes within the channel are necessary. As has already been said, S4C has recognised this in the renewal process document that it published recently. I feel very strongly that S4C should continue to be a Welsh-only broadcaster, although some people and some opinion polls have suggested that S4C should also broadcast English-medium programmes to attract greater numbers of viewers. I do not believe that. A significant change such as that would have a huge impact on our Welsh culture. S4C was established as a Welsh-language channel, and changing to broadcast English-medium programmes would be damaging to the Welsh language.

In recent years, we have seen political consensus on the Welsh language, and we have taken significant steps forward for the language. I very much hope that we can remain positive and work together to ensure a successful future for S4C. I look forward to working with Members from all parties to devolve responsibility for S4C in the near future.

In conclusion, I welcome the cross-party attitude towards S4C and the commitment shown by all in the Chamber for maintaining its independence. S4C has done some excellent work over the years—it is something that we can all celebrate. I look forward to seeing that work continuing in the future.

Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Dafydd) **The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones)**

Ffred Jones): Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu at ddadl wirioneddol bwysig, ac yr wyf yn falch bod y cynnig hwn wedi dod gerbron gyda chefnogaeth y pedair plaid yn y Cynulliad, sy'n dangos bod mesur o gytundeb yma yng Nghymru ar y mater hwn. Arwydd pellach o'r cytundeb hwnnw wrth gwrs oedd y llythyr a anfonwyd gan arweinwyr y pedair plaid yn galw am adolygiad annibynnol o S4C. Yr oedd hyn yn ddatblygiad arwyddocaol iawn.

Camaf yn ôl o'r sefyllfa i nodi pwysigrwydd y gwasanaeth teledu Cymraeg hwn. Mae ieithoedd lleiafrifol yn wynebu'r un broblem ar draws y byd, a'r broblem honno yw creu byd cyflawn a chyfoes yn yr ieithoedd hynny sy'n apelio i bobl ifanc. Mae'n frwydr eithriadol o anodd, ac nid yw'r bobl sy'n perthyn i'r ieithoedd mwyafrifol yn deall pa mor anodd ydyw. Mae gwasanaeth S4C yn hanfodol yn yr ymdrech i greu'r byd a'r cyd-destun hwnnw. Hefyd, wrth gwrs, mae cyfeiriad wedi bod at y gwasanaeth Cyw ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc, ac unwaith eto, mae'r gwasanaeth hwnnw yn eithriadol o bwysig i deuluoedd ifanc—i famau a phlant ifanc yn bennaf—wrth geisio atgyfnerthu trosglwyddo iaith o rieni i blant. Gwyddom fod colledion cyson yng Nghymru yn digwydd, hyd yn oed mewn teuluoedd lle mae'r Gymraeg yn iaith i un o'r rhieni. Mae'r gwasanaeth hwn, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yn eithriadol o bwysig.

Mae i argymhellion y Llywodraeth yn Llundain oblygiadau pellgyrhaeddol. Er mwyn ceisio gweld a oedd consensws yma yng Nghymru, fe drefnodd y Llywodraeth fforwm bythefnos yn ôl i drafod dyfodol y gwasanaeth. Daeth cynrychiolwyr o'r byd darlledu, y sector teledu annibynnol, arweinwyr undeb a mudiadau iaith ynghyd i drafod eu pryderon ynglŷn â chyllido a threfn lywodraethol y sianel i'r dyfodol. Yr oedd siarad plaen a mesur o gytundeb hefyd ymhlith y rhai a ddaeth at ei gilydd i gynrychioli pawb sydd â diddordeb mewn sicrhau dyfodol sicr i'r sianel.

Atefag fy mod yn rhannu gofidiau Rhodri Glyn Thomas ynglŷn â llythyr Syr Michael Lyons, oherwydd yr oedd rhyw naws yn y

Jones): I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this really important debate, and I am pleased that the motion has been tabled with the support of the four Assembly parties, showing that there is a measure of agreement here in Wales on this issue. That agreement was further demonstrated in the letter sent by the four party leaders calling for an independent review of S4C. It was a very significant development.

I take a step back from the situation to note the importance of this Welsh-language television service. Minority languages are facing the same problem across the world, and that problem is the creation of a complete and modern world in those languages that appeals to young people. It is an extremely difficult battle, and the people who speak majority languages do not understand how difficult it is. S4C's service is essential in the effort to create that world and that context. Also, of course, reference has been made to the Cyw service for children and young people and, once again, that service is extremely important to young families—to mothers and young children especially—in trying to consolidate the transfer of the language from parent to child. We know that regular losses occur in Wales, even in families where Welsh is spoken by one of the parents. This service, in that context, is extremely important.

The recommendations of the Government in London have far-reaching implications. In order to see whether there was consensus here in Wales, the Government arranged a forum a fortnight ago to discuss the future of the service. Representatives of the broadcast world, the independent television sector, leaders of unions and language movements came together to discuss their concerns about funding and the governance arrangements of the channel in the future. There was plain speaking and a degree of agreement also among those who came together to represent everyone with an interest in ensuring a robust future for the channel.

I will add that I share Rhodri Glyn Thomas's concerns about Sir Michael Lyons's letter, because there was some suggestion in that

llythyr hwnnw yn awgrymu mai'r BBC fyddai'n cymryd drosodd y gwasanaeth i'r dyfodol, gyda rhyw olwg tadol dros y cyfan a oedd yn digwydd. Yr oedd yn nawddoglyd braidd yn ei syniadau.

Mae pawb yn dweud yn gyson fod angen sicrhau annibyniaeth, a rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fydd gan neb anhawster o ran sicrhau annibyniaeth olygyddol a chreadigol, fel y'i gelwir, ond mae annibyniaeth drefniadol a rheolaethol hefyd yn eithriadol o bwysig yn y setliad a wneir yn y misoedd nesaf. Rhaid i'r neges honno fod yn glir iawn o'r fan hon. Hefyd, bydd rhaid wrth eglurder ynglŷn â'r cyllido y tu hwnt i'r setliad presennol. Ni allwch gael setliad sy'n sôn am drefniant ariannol sy'n para am ychydig o flynyddoedd a gadael y cyfan wedyn i amgylchiadau'r funud. Fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn, nid arian y BBC yw hwn; arian trethdalwyr ar gyfer darlledu cyhoeddus ydyw, ac ni ddylai'r BBC ei drin fel rhyw boced o arian mae'n ei roi mewn caredigrwydd mawr i sector o'r boblogaeth. Felly, mae sicrhau trefniant ariannol cadarn i'r dyfodol mor bwysig ag annibyniaeth.

Byddwn yn ychwanegu un mater arall sydd wedi cael ei grybwyll gan fwy nag un o'r blaen. Yn y trafodaethau a fydd yn digwydd rhwng DCMS, y BBC ac S4C, credaf fod angen llais sy'n cynrychioli buddiannau Cymru. Nid oes rhaid iddo fod yn llais o'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru, ond credaf y byddai hynny yn rhoi mesur o gysur i'r gwylwyr a'r rhai sydd wedi cefnogi'r sianel. Mae'r ffigurau yn dangos bod cyfran uchel o wylwyr S4C yn Gymry di-Gymraeg, sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaeth is-deitlau neu sy'n mwynhau edrych ar y lluniau, am wn i. Hoffwn hefyd danlinellu pwysigrwydd cael llais o Gymru yn cynrychioli buddiannau'r diwydiant, sef y sector annibynnol, ond mae angen cynrychiolaeth ehangach na hynny i sicrhau y bydd y dêl rhwng DCMS ac S4C yn un fydd yn bodloni pawb sydd â budd y sianel yn agos at eu calonnau. Mae hwn yn gyfnod cyffrous iawn ar un ystyr, ond mae hefyd yn gyfnod llawn peryglon. Mae'n rhaid i bawb barchu dymuniadau'r mwyafrif sydd yma heddiw er budd y sianel ac i sicrhau trefniant cadarn fydd yn sicrhau plwraliaeth

letter that the BBC would take over the service in the future, with some supervisory role over all that was happening. It was quite patronising in its ideas.

Everyone constantly raises the need to ensure independence, and we must be clear about this. I am sure that no-one will have difficulty with the notion of ensuring editorial and creative independence, as it is called, but organisational and managerial independence is also vital in the settlement to be made in the coming months. That message has to be very clear from here. Also, funding beyond the current settlement has to be clear. You cannot have a settlement that mentions a financial arrangement that lasts for a few years and then leave it all to the circumstances of the moment. As Rhodri Glyn said, this is not the BBC's money; it is taxpayers' money for public broadcasting, and the BBC should not treat it like some pocket of money given out of the goodness of its heart to a sector of the population. Therefore, ensuring a firm financial arrangement for the future is as important as independence.

I would include one other issue that has been mentioned by more than one person before now. In the discussions that will take place between the DCMS, the BBC and S4C, we will need a voice that represents the interests of Wales. It need not be a voice from the Government in Wales, but I believe that that would provide a measure of comfort to the channel's viewers and supporters. The figures show that a high proportion of S4C's viewers are Welsh people who do not speak Welsh but who watch it with subtitles or, for all I know, enjoy looking at the pictures. I would also like to underline the importance of having a voice from Wales that represents the interests in the industry, namely the independent sector, but wider representation than that is needed to ensure that the deal between the DCMS and S4C is one that will satisfy everyone who has the interests of the channel at their heart. This is a very exciting time in one sense, but it is also strewn with dangers. Everyone must respect the wishes of the majority here today for the sake of the channel and to secure arrangements that will

ym myd darlledu yng Nghymru a diogelu'r gwasanaeth hanfodol hwn er dyfodol y Gymraeg a'i diwylliant a chymunedau ar draws Cymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I do not want to comment on each contribution to this debate, because all of the contributions have complemented one another and a number of very important points have been raised by all of the parties represented here. The point was made about the leaders' letter, which has gone to the Minister, and we await a reply. I, too, commend Nick Bourne and Kirsty Williams for taking a brave but principled stance on this particular matter and for not putting party loyalty above fighting for a principle in which I know they both believe passionately.

I would also like to comment on Alun's remark that he does not trust the BBC. I do not particularly want to go down that path. We have evidence that the BBC Trust in London does not understand Wales. There is solid evidence in the way in which it has failed to deal with devolution over the past 11 years that the BBC Trust in London does not understand Wales. If it cannot understand devolution, why should we think that it would be able to appreciate the Welsh language and the importance of S4C to it? It is beyond its capability.

Eleanor Burnham referred to Menna Richards, and we would all pay tribute to Menna's contribution to public broadcasting in Wales. However, it will not be Menna Richards's successor who will decide what the role of S4C will be if we allow the BBC to take it over, as Sir Michael Lyons was clearly trying to do in that public letter. He stated clearly that the BBC would take over, that it would be in charge and that S4C would do as it is told. He stated that the BBC would decide on the content and the future of S4C. If that were to happen, the decisions would be taken by the trust in London. There would be one representative for Wales. I cannot think of anyone better to represent Wales on the BBC Trust in London than Elan Closs Stephens, as her contribution to public broadcasting in Wales as chair of S4C and the many other positions that she has held

ensure pluralism in broadcasting in Wales and protect this vital service for the future of the Welsh language, its culture and its communities.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Nid wyf am sôn am bob un cyfraniad at y ddadl hon, oherwydd mae'r holl gyfraniadau wedi ategu ei gilydd ac mae nifer o bwyntiau pwysig wedi'u codi gan yr holl bleidiau a gynrychiolir yma. Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt am lythyr yr arweinwyr, sydd wedi mynd at y Gweinidog, a disgwyliwn ateb. Rwyf fi, hefyd, yn cymeradwyo Nick Bourne a Kirsty Williams am eu hagwedd ddewr ond egwyddorol at y mater arbennig hwn ac am beidio â rhoi teyrngarwch i blaid uwchlaw ymladd dros egwyddor y gwn fod y ddau ohonynt yn credu'n angerddol ynddi.

Hoffwn hefyd sôn am sylw Alun nad oes ganddo ffydd yn y BBC. Nid wyf am ddilyn y trywydd hwnnw'n arbennig. Mae gennym dystiolaeth nad yw Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC yn Llundain yn deall Cymru. Mae'r ffordd y mae wedi methu ag ymdrin â datganoli dros yr 11 mlynedd ddiwethaf yn dystiolaeth gadarn nad yw Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC yn Llundain yn deall Cymru. Os nad yw'n gallu deall datganoli, pam ddylem feddwl y byddai'n gallu gwerthfawrogi'r iaith Gymraeg a phwysigrwydd S4C iddi? Mae y tu hwnt i'w allu.

Cyfeiriodd Eleanor Burnham at Menna Richards, a byddem oll yn talu teyrnged i gyfraniad Menna at ddarlledu cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, nid olynnydd Menna Richards a fydd yn penderfynu beth fydd rôl S4C os byddwn yn caniatáu i'r BBC ei chymryd drosodd, fel yr oedd Syr Michael Lyons yn amlwg yn ceisio ei wneud yn y llythyr cyhoeddus hwnnw. Dywedodd yn glir y byddai'r BBC yn cymryd drosodd, y byddai'n rheoli ac y byddai S4C yn gwneud fel y dywedir wrthi. Dywedodd y byddai'r BBC yn penderfynu ar gynnwys a dyfodol S4C. Pe byddai hynny'n digwydd, byddai'r penderfyniadau'n cael eu gwneud gan yr ymddiriedolaeth yn Llundain. Byddai un cynrychiolydd i Gymru. Ni allaf feddwl am neb gwell i gynrychioli Cymru ar Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC yn Llundain nag Elan Closs Stephens, am fod ei chyfraniad at

make her an ideal choice as a trustee. However, she is one trustee who would have to influence the other trustees and enlighten them about the role and the importance of S4C.

3.40 p.m.

Let us remember that we are talking about a public broadcaster. I referred earlier to the propaganda about BBC Alba and how successful that is. One can see, on that basis, how not having plurality in public broadcasting in Wales creates a situation in which lines of propaganda can be broadcast without question or challenge by anyone—people accept them because they have heard them on the BBC. We cannot afford to lose the influence of a public broadcaster such as S4C.

Next week, Lord Roberts, who should know something about the importance of S4C given that he was responsible for establishing it in statute, is moving an amendment in the House of Lords, calling on the Government to take S4C out of the Public Bodies (Reform) Bill. It should not be there. It is not a public body. It is a public broadcaster. It is different in nature to all of the other organisations referred to in that particular Bill. Lord Roberts and Lord Elystan Morgan have raised serious questions in a select committee about trying to use secondary legislation to change primary legislation and change a situation that has been established in statute. One hopes that their lordships will have due influence on DCMS and the Minister in this matter.

The leaders' letter is very important. The fact that, in this debate, we have been able to support the letter and the call for an independent review on a cross-party basis is very important. If there is an agenda of respect, and if Jeremy Hunt is aware of the promise that was made to us about that agenda, surely he cannot ignore a letter from the four party leaders here. Surely he cannot ignore a debate that has shown total unity, with Members stating categorically that an

ddarlledu cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn gadeirydd S4C a'r swyddi eraill lawer a fu ganddi yn ei gwneud hi'n ddewis delfrydol fel ymddiriedolwr. Fodd bynnag, un ymddiriedolwr ydyw a fyddai'n gorfod dylanwadu ar yr ymddiriedolwyr eraill a'u goleuo am rôl a phwysigrwydd S4C.

Gadewch inni gofio ein bod yn siarad am ddarlledwr cyhoeddus. Cyfeiriais yn gynharach at y propaganda a BBC Alba ac mor llwyddiannus yw hwnnw. Gall dyn weld, ar y sail honno, y ffordd y mae peidio â chael lluosogaeth mewn darlledu cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn creu sefyllfa lle gellir darlledu llinellau propaganda heb gwestiwn na her gan neb—mae pobl yn eu derbyn am iddynt eu clywed ar y BBC. Ni allwn fforddio colli dylanwad darlledwr cyhoeddus fel S4C.

Yr wythnos nesaf, bydd Arglwydd Roberts, a ddylai wybod rhywbeth am bwysigrwydd S4C o ystyried ei fod yn gyfrifol am ei sefydlu mewn statud, yn cynnig gwelliant yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi, gan alw ar y Llywodraeth i dynnu S4C allan o'r Mesur Cyrff Cyhoeddus (Diwygio). Ni ddylai fod yno. Nid corff cyhoeddus mohono. Darlledwr cyhoeddus ydyw. Mae'n wahanol ei natur i'r holl sefydliadau eraill y cyfeirir atynt yn y Mesur arbennig hwnnw. Mae Arglwydd Roberts ac Arglwydd Elystan Morgan wedi codi cwestiynau difrifol mewn pwyllgor dethol am geisio defnyddio is-ddeddfwriaeth i newid deddfwriaeth sylfaenol a newid sefyllfa a sefydlwyd mewn statud. Mae dyn yn gobeithio y bydd eu harglwyddiaethau'n cael dylanwad priodol ar yr Adran Diwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ac ar y Gweinidog yn hyn o beth.

Mae llythyr yr arweinwyr yn bwysig iawn. Mae'r ffaith y buom yn gallu cefnogi, yn y ddadl hon, y llythyr a'r galw am adolygiad annibynnol trawsbleidiol yn bwysig iawn. Os oes agenda parch, ac os yw Jeremy Hunt yn ymwybodol o'r addewid a wnaethpwyd inni am yr agenda hwnnw, siawns nad all anwybyddu llythyr oddi wrth y pedwar arweinydd plaid yma. Siawns nad all anwybyddu dadl sydd wedi dangos undod llwyr, gydag Aelodau'n dweud yn ddiamod

independent S4C is essential for the future of public broadcasting and the creative industries in Wales. Surely he must respect that, and he must rethink the decision. As I said earlier, I have no problem with S4C being financed through the licence. Let us welcome that. However, we want to ensure that it is a financial contribution that goes to S4C directly from the licence, and that S4C has security of tenure for the future. At the moment, we would be in the hands of the BBC Trust in London from 2015. I do not want to be in that position. It is not that I do not trust those in the BBC Trust; it is because we know that they just do not understand Wales and they certainly will not understand the Welsh language.

bod S4C annibynnol yn hanfodol i ddyfodol darlledu cyhoeddus a'r diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru. Siawns ei bod yn rhaid iddo barchu hynny, a'i bod yn rhaid iddo ailystyried y penderfyniad. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, nid oes gen i broblem ynghylch ariannu S4C drwy'r drwydded. Gadewch inni groesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, rydym am sicrhau ei fod yn gyfraniad ariannol sy'n mynd i S4C yn uniongyrchol o'r drwydded, a bod gan S4C sicrwydd deiliadaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ar hyn o bryd, byddem yn nwylo Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC yn Llundain o 2015. Nid wyf am fod yn y sefyllfa honno. Nid yw hynny gan fy mod i'n drwgdybio'r rheini yn Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC, ond oherwydd ein bod yn gwybod nad ydynt yn deall Cymru ac na fyddant yn deall yr iaith Gymraeg o gwbl.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is to approve the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cwestiwn yw cymeradwyo'r cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, cytunir ar y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Problemau Iechyd Cyhoeddus Public Health Problems

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt and amendment 2 in the name of Peter Black.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt a gwelliant 2 yn enw Peter Black.

Cynnig NDM4588 Nick Ramsay

Motion NDM4588 Nick Ramsay

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

The National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn nodi â phryder bod llawer o broblemau iechyd y cyhoedd yn dod yn fwy amlwg yng Nghymru;

1. Notes with concern the increasing prevalence of many public health problems in Wales;

2. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ganolbwyntio adnoddau ar fesurau ataliol, er mwyn cyflawni gwell canlyniadau iechyd y cyhoedd.

2. Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to focus resources on preventative measures, to achieve better public health outcomes.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I move the motion.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Cynigiau y cynnig.

There are two amendments on the agenda this afternoon. I will deal with the second amendment first. We agree with that amendment, as we believe that environmental health officers have a very important role in delivering improvements in public health. Indeed, I had the pleasure of speaking at a conference for environmental health officers last year. Hearing advice and evidence from all of the participants at that conference built on the picture that we are trying to establish of a joined-up public health message that drives forward the preventative agenda.

Mae dau welliant ar yr agenda'r prynhawn yma. Trof at yr ail welliant yn gyntaf. Cytunwn â'r gwelliant hwnnw, am ein bod yn credu bod gan swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd ran bwysig iawn i'w chwarae mewn gwella iechyd y cyhoedd. Yn wir, cefais y pleser o siarad mewn cynhadledd i swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd y llynedd. Roedd clywed cyngor a thystiolaeth gan bob un o'r cyfranogwyr yn y gynhadledd yn ychwanegu at y darlun yr ydym yn ceisio ei lunio o neges iechyd cyhoeddus gydgyssylltedig sy'n gwthio'r agenda ataliol yn ei flaen.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro (William Graham) i'r Gadair am 3.43 p.m.
The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer (William Graham) took the Chair at 3.43 p.m.*

Amendment 1 on behalf of the Government is a delete-all amendment, regrettably. I am not sure what was offensive to the Government in the original motion, but it has submitted a delete-all amendment. It will come as no surprise that we will not accept that amendment. In particular, I refer to point 3, which calls upon the Assembly to look at the Government's 'Our Healthy Future' strategy. I am somewhat concerned that the Government believes that this strategy is driving forward the public health agenda.

Gwelliant dileu popeth yw Gwelliant 1 ar ran y Llywodraeth, yn anffodus. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth oedd wedi peri tramgwydd i'r Llywodraeth yn y cynnig gwreiddiol, ond mae wedi cyflwyno gwelliant dileu popeth. Ni fydd yn syndod na fyddwn ni'n derbyn y gwelliant hwnnw. Yn arbennig, cyfeiriaf at bwynt 3, sy'n galw ar y Cynulliad i edrych ar strategaeth 'Ein Dyfodol Iach' y Llywodraeth. Rwy'n poeni rhywfaint fod y Llywodraeth yn credu bod y strategaeth hon yn gwthio'r agenda iechyd cyhoeddus yn ei flaen.

When you start looking at some of the headings within that strategy, notably accountability, for example, and look at waiting times, in-patient and day-case treatment, and the number of people waiting over 14 weeks, you will see that, in March 2009, there were 288 people waiting, and in March 2010, there were 16,480 people waiting. That is an astronomical increase of 5,622 per cent. I am at a loss as to quite how that can be put up as a model to be considered. If we also look at the investment in the prevention of ill health and treatment in care in that document, we only need to look at cardiac rehabilitation to see that it is only available to three in 10 people in Wales. If we look at diabetes or optometry, we see that both areas are of grave concern. On stroke, again, in August, the Sentinel review touched on the fact that, sadly, while there have been improvements in Wales, we are still propping

Pan fyddwch yn dechrau edrych ar rai o'r penawdau yn y strategaeth honno, yn enwedig atebolrwydd, er enghraifft, ac yn edrych ar amseroedd amser, triniaeth cleifion mewnol ac allanol, a nifer y bobl sy'n aros dros 14 wythnos, byddwch chi'n gweld bod 288 o bobl yn aros ym mis Mawrth 2009, a bod 16,480 o bobl yn aros ym mis Mawrth 2010. Mae hwnnw'n gynnydd aruthrol o 5,622 y cant. Ni allaf gredu sut yn union y gellir cyflwyno hwnnw fel model i'w ystyried. Os edrychwn hefyd ar y buddsoddiad mewn atal afiechyd a thriniaeth mewn gofal yn y ddogfen honno, dim ond edrych ar adsefydlu cardiaidd sydd angen inni ei wneud i weld nad yw ar gael ond i dri o bob 10 o bobl yng Nghymru. Os edrychwn ar ddiabetes neu optometreg, gwelwn fod y ddau faes yn peri gofid difrifol. O ran strôc, eto, ym mis Awst, roedd adolygiad Sentinel yn crybwyll y ffaith ein bod, yn anffodus, yn

up the United Kingdom's league table for stroke services, as it were. It is a little concerning to find that the Government is seriously asking the Assembly to endorse that strategy.

Public health is a situation on which we should all agree because, surely, prevention is better than cure. Obviously, it is far cheaper in the first place and, ultimately, a healthy workforce and community is a prosperous community. Sadly, in looking at many of the key indicators in Wales, such as obesity, for example, we find that six out of 10 men or 50 per cent of women are either overweight or obese. If we look at sexually transmitted infections, for example, such as HIV and AIDS in Wales, we see that the ratio is 36 cases per 100,000. If you look at the rest of the United Kingdom, you will see that that figure falls to 14 cases per 100,000. In continental Europe, Germany has three cases per 100,000 and France has nine cases per 100,000. This clearly shows a real issue either in relation to the public's ability to take on board the message that the Government is giving or perhaps that message needs refining and rebalancing so that we hit the target audience. We need to bring the figures more in line with those in the rest of the United Kingdom; instead of trailing the rest of the United Kingdom, we could be leading the United Kingdom.

Alcohol misuse is also a big issue in Wales. A total of 45 per cent of adults drink more than the recommended daily allowance, and 1,000 deaths a year are attributed to alcohol in Wales. Not only is there the emotional consequence of those statistics to think about, there is also the cost in pounds, shillings and pence to the national health service and society at large.

It is fair to point out that significant improvements have been made in the smoking statistics in Wales. The Assembly and the Assembly Government can take credit in relation to that, but more action is

dal yn cynnal tabl cynghrair y Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer gwasanaethau strôc, fel petai, er bod gwelliannau wedi'u cael yng Nghymru. Mae'n peri gofid braidd wrth ganfod bod y Llywodraeth yn gofyn o ddifrif i'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r strategaeth honno.

Sefyllfa yw iechyd cyhoeddus y dylem oll gytuno arni oherwydd siawns bod atal yn well na gwella. Yn amlwg, mae'n llawer rhatach yn y lle cyntaf ac, yn y pen draw, mae gweithlu a chymuned iachus yn golygu cymuned ffyniannus. Yn anffodus, wrth edrych ar lawer o'r dangosyddion allweddol yng Nghymru, fel gordewdra, er enghraifft, rydym yn canfod bod chwech allan o bob 10 dyn neu 50 y cant o fenywod naill ai dros eu pwysau neu'n ordew. Os edrychwn ar heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol, er enghraifft, fel HIV ac AIDS yng Nghymru, gwelwn mai'r gymhareb yw 36 achos i bob 100,000. Os edrychwch ar weddill y Deyrnas Unedig, byddwch yn gweld bod y ffigur hwnnw'n gostwng i 14 achos i bob 100,000. Yng nghyfandir Ewrop, mae gan yr Almaen dri achos i bob 100,000 ac mae gan Ffrainc naw achos i bob 100,000. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn dangos problem go iawn naill ai mewn perthynas â gallu'r cyhoedd i gofio'r neges y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei chyfleu neu efallai bod angen mireinio'r neges honno a'i haddasu er mwyn inni gyrraedd y gynulleidfa darged. Mae angen inni unioni'r ffigurau'n fwy â'r rheini yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig; yn lle llusgo'r tu ôl i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig, gallem fod yn arwain y Deyrnas Unedig.

Mae camddefnyddio alcohol hefyd yn broblem fawr yng Nghymru. Mae 45 y cant o oedolion i gyd yn yfed mwy na'r symiau dyddiol a argymhellir, ac mae 1,000 o farwolaethau'r flwyddyn yn cael eu priodoli i alcohol yng Nghymru. Mae canlyniad emosiynol yr ystadegau hynny i'w ystyried, ond hefyd y gost mewn punnoedd, sylltau a cheiniogau i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a'r gymdeithas gyffredinol.

Mae'n deg dweud bod gwelliannau sylweddol wedi'u gwneud yn yr ystadegau ysmegu yng Nghymru. Gall y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dderbyn clod mewn perthynas â hynny, ond mae rhagor o

required on that front because, sadly, 5,650 people a year still die prematurely from smoking-related illnesses in Wales.

In the last fortnight, we have heard that 7,000 more people have been diagnosed with type 2 diabetes in Wales this year. That means that there are 150,000 people in Wales with diabetes. Obviously, the issue relating to type 1 diabetes and juvenile diabetes is a far bigger and more intricate problem for us to try to solve.

Dealing with these figures will sadly require a great deal of determination, effort and resource on behalf of whoever forms the Government. We cannot let up on that drive. From this side of the Chamber, we would desperately like to see greater community engagement, through community pharmacists and optometrists, for example. We have led debates in the Chamber to promote the argument for prevention so that people can have information that is accessible, in an environment that they find friendly, which is not a prohibitive environment, and that they can feel free to walk into. I would be most grateful if the Minister, in responding to the debate today, could highlight the actions that this Government is taking to develop that strategy and, in particular, to resource the strategy. The First Minister's assertion that hospitals are the priority flies in the face of much of the evidence that has been put before us about the development of community and primary care, and indeed the Minister's own initiatives.

On the alcohol front, there is the minimum pricing that the Government talked much about in August via a press release. However, we still have not seen a statement of what the Minister's intention is in that respect. I happen to think that the best approach to that is an England-and-Wales approach, but I think that it would be beneficial today to hear whether the Government is taking that forward via, as we found out in August, a proposed LCO.

3.50 p.m.

weithredu'n ofynnol yn hynny o beth oherwydd, yn anffodus, mae 5,650 o bobl y flwyddyn yn dal yn marw cyn eu hamser o afiechydon sy'n gysylltiedig ag ysmegu yng Nghymru.

Yn y pythefnos diwethaf, rydym wedi clywed bod 7,000 rhagor o bobl wedi cael diagnosis o ddiabetes math 2 yng Nghymru eleni. Mae hynny'n golygu bod diabetes ar 150,000 o bobl yng Nghymru. Yn amlwg, mae'r mater mewn perthynas â diabetes math 1 a diabetes ymhlith pobl ifanc yn broblem lawer mwy o faint a mwy cymhleth inni geisio ei datrys.

Yn anffodus, bydd cryn dipyn o benderfyniad, ymdrech a dyfeisgarwch yn ofynnol i ymdrin â'r ffigurau hyn ar ran pw y bynnag sy'n ffurfio'r Llywodraeth. Ni allwn arafu'r ymdrech hwnnw. O'r ochr hon o'r Siambr, rydym yn ysu am weld mwy o ymgysylltu â'r gymuned, drwy fferyllwyr ac optometryddion cymunedol, er enghraifft. Rydym wedi arwain dadleuon yn y Siambr i hyrwyddo'r ddadl dros atal fel bod pobl yn gallu cael gwybodaeth sy'n hygyrch, mewn amgylchedd sy'n gyfeillgar iddynt heb fod yn waharddol ac y gallant deimlo'n rhydd i gerdded i mewn iddo. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar dros ben pe gallai'r Gweinidog, wrth ymateb i'r ddadl heddiw, amlygu'r camau y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn eu cymryd i ddatblygu'r strategaeth honno ac, yn arbennig, i adnoddau'r strategaeth. Mae honiad y Prif Weinidog mai ysbytai yw'r flaenoriaeth yn mynd yn groes i lawer o'r dystiolaeth a roddwyd ger ein bron am ddatblygu gofal cymunedol a gofal sylfaenol ac, yn wir, mentrau'r Gweinidog ei hun.

O ran alcohol, ceir y prisiau lleiaf y soniodd y Llywodraeth yn helaeth amdanynt ym mis Awst drwy ddatganiad i'r wasg. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym wedi gweld datganiad o hyd o fwriad y Gweinidog yn hynny o beth. Rwy'n digwydd credu mai'r ymagwedd orau at hynny yw ymagwedd Cymru a Lloegr, ond rwy'n credu y byddai'n fuddiol heddiw clywed a ydy'r Llywodraeth yn mynd ymlaen â hynny drwy Orchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol arfaethedig, fel y canfuom ym mis Awst.

On the figures that are used for sexually transmitted infections and pregnancies among young people, it is vital that we join up the education message. I am aware that the Minister for health and the Minister for education have done some work on this and have brought more material into the public domain to be used by teachers and experts in that field. However, there is a growing concern among teachers about the ability to access adequate training, because it is a sensitive and difficult subject for some people to broach. I was surprised to find that there is no formal INSET training for teachers to access that would allow them to be in tune with best practice, so that youngsters can take on board that message. I would be grateful if the Minister stated in her reply whether there is any scope to increase the toolkit that is available to people who come into contact with young people, so that we can get on top of these figures.

Above all, we need to drive this message across Government in a more unified way. Questions were asked earlier about heritage and sport, and there were many questions on physical fitness. We often hear the Minister for the Economy and Transport talk about investing in green options such as cycling and walking routes. I have already touched on education and the Minister for health's responsibility in that regard. We believe that there should be a far better joined up and cohesive approach to delivering this public health message across Government. That is why we need to get behind the message to try to drive forward a stronger, more direct and more accountable public health message that will bring these indices down in Wales, so that we can lead the field in public health, rather than be propping up the league tables of many of the statistics that I have mentioned today.

I hope that the motion will find favour with the Assembly today, although I do not hold my breath as there is a 'delete all' amendment before us. However, in having this debate, I hope that people will feel free to put their point forward so that we can

O ran y ffigurau a ddefnyddir ar gyfer heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol a beichiogrwydd ymhlith pobl ifanc, mae'n hanfodol inni gydgysylltu'r neges addysg. Rwy'n gwybod bod y Gweinidog dros iechyd a'r Gweinidog dros addysg wedi gwneud rhywfaint o waith ar hyn ac wedi cyhoeddi mwy o ddeunydd i'w ddefnyddio gan athrawon ac arbenigwyr yn y maes hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, pryderir mwyfwy ymhlith athrawon am y gallu i gael at hyfforddiant digon da, oherwydd mae'n bwnc sensitif ac anodd i rai pobl ei drafod. Synnais o gael gwybod nad oes unrhyw hyfforddiant ffurfiol mewn swydd ar gael i athrawon a fyddai'n eu galluogi i fod yn ymwybodol o arfer gorau, fel y gall ieuencid gofio'r neges honno. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar petai'r Gweinidog yn nodi yn ei hateb a oes unrhyw gyfle i ychwanegu at y pecyn cymorth sydd ar gael i bobl sy'n dod i gysylltiad â phobl ifanc, er mwyn inni fynd i'r afael â'r ffigurau hyn.

Uwchlaw popeth, mae angen inni gyfleu'r neges hon ar draws y Llywodraeth mewn modd mwy unedig. Gofynnwyd cwestiynau'n gynharach am dreftadaeth a chwaraeon, ac roedd llawer o gwestiynau am ffitrwydd corfforol. Clywn y Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yn siarad yn aml am fuddsoddi mewn dewisiadau gwyrdd fel llwybrau beicio a cherdded. Rwyf eisoes wedi crybwyll addysg a chyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros iechyd yn hynny o beth. Credwn y dylai fod dull llawer mwy cydgysylltiedig a chydlynol o gyfleu'r neges hon am iechyd cyhoeddus ar draws y Llywodraeth. Am y rheswm hwnnw y mae angen inni gefnogi'r neges i geisio trosglwyddo neges gryfach, fwy uniongyrchol a mwy atebol am iechyd cyhoeddus a fydd yn dod â'r mynegeion hyn i lawr yng Nghymru, er mwyn inni allu fod ar flaen y gad mewn iechyd cyhoeddus, yn hytrach na chynnal tablau cynghrair llawer o'r ystadegau y soniais amdanynt heddiw.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y cynnig yn ennill bodd y Cynlluniad heddiw, er nad wyf yn disgwyl gormod gan fod gwelliant 'dileu popeth' o'n blaenau. Fodd bynnag, o gael y ddadl hon, gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn teimlo'n rhydd i gyflwyno eu pwynt er mwyn inni allu symud

progress the public health agenda in Wales.

yr agenda iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ei flaen.

Gwelliant 1 Jane Hutt

Amendment 1 Jane Hutt

Dileu popeth a rhoi yn ei le:

Delete all and replace with:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn nodi'r cynnydd yn y disgwyliad oes yng Nghymru sy'n ddangosydd allweddol o welliant yn iechyd y cyhoedd;

1. Notes the increase in life expectancy in Wales which is a key indicator of improvement in public health;

2. Yn nodi'r heriau sy'n parhau ym maes iechyd y cyhoedd;

2. Notes the public health challenges that remain;

3. Yn nodi bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y trywydd iawn i fodloni ymrwymiad Cymru'n Un ynghylch iechyd y cyhoedd drwy'r strategaeth 'Ein Dyfodol Iach'.

3. Notes that the Welsh Assembly Government is on course to meet the One Wales commitment on public health, through the 'Our Healthy Future' strategy.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): I move amendment 1.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau welliant 1.

Gwelliant 2 Peter Black

Amendment 2 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as new point at end of motion:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i gefnogi capasiti iechyd yr amgylchedd yng Nghymru er mwyn i wasanaethau iechyd yr amgylchedd gael y màs critigol er mwyn gallu mynd i'r afael yn iawn â phroblemau presennol a phosibl ym maes iechyd y cyhoedd.

Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to do all it can to support environmental health capacity in Wales so that environmental health services have the critical mass to properly address current and potential public health issues.

Veronica German: I move amendment 2.

Veronica German: Cynigiau welliant 2.

It seems that the Conservatives are all over the place on this; one minute they are calling for the NHS budget to be ring-fenced, and the next they want the public health budget to be joined up with all the areas that have just been mentioned, such as the economy, sustainable communities, sport and housing, which are not in the health budget. I remain confused by that, because all of these areas would be under threat—

Mae fel petai'r Ceidwadwyr dros y lle i gyd gyda hyn; un funud maen nhw'n galw am neilltuo cyllideb y GIG, a'r funud nesaf maent am gydgyssylltu'r gyllideb iechyd cyhoeddus â'r holl feysydd y soniwyd amdanynt yn awr, fel yr economi, cymunedau cynaliadwy, chwaraeon a thai, nad ydynt yn rhan o'r gyllideb iechyd. Mae hynny'n dal yn fy nrysu, oherwydd byddai'r holl feysydd hyn o dan fygythiad—

Andrew R.T. Davies: The point that I made

Andrew R.T. Davies: Y pwynt a wneuthum

in my opening remarks is that there is no synergy between those initiatives. Whoever is in Government, there needs to be a joined-up approach to deliver a joined-up message, and that is the message that should be unified across Government.

Veronica German: I agree with the sentiment, but by ring-fencing the budget you would immediately have a detrimental effect on all those other areas. Therefore, your argument does not make sense.

Amendment 2 makes a specific recommendation about protecting environmental health services, which are delivered through local government, which would be severely hit by your ideas for ring-fencing. These services are often unseen, but are highly valuable services. It is telling that the first function of local government, before it had all its other functions such as housing, drainage and food hygiene, was environmental health. Other challenges have been added to those, such as obesity and skin cancer. A recent survey by environmental health experts of food hygiene trainers highlighted some worrying trends. Fifty per cent of the trainers report that they have seen a downturn in the take-up of training. The significance of that is that a quarter of prosecutions for food-hygiene-related offences in the UK relate to a failure to comply with the requirements for training. There is a real risk that we could see an increase in food poisoning incidents due to a lack of awareness in companies, and if there were a reduced capacity to inspect.

Winter deaths are another problem. We have seen a sharp rise in winter deaths. Excess deaths are often likely to occur in the private rented sector, owner-occupied homes and homes built before 1850. A high proportion of older people live in those sorts of homes. The environmental health officers again have a role to play in looking at what the situation is in those houses. Students and transient populations often have problems with boilers, carbon monoxide poisoning and safe electricity, and these again are dealt with by environmental health officers. We do not

yn fy sylwadau agoriadol yw nad oes unrhyw synergedd rhwng y mentrau hynny. Ni waeth pwy sydd mewn grym, mae angen dull cydgysylltiedig i gyfleu neges gydgysylltiedig, a honno yw'r neges a ddylai fod yn unedig ar draws y Llywodraeth.

Veronica German: Cytunaf â'r teimlad, ond drwy neilltuo'r gyllideb byddech yn cael effaith andwyol ar unwaith ar yr holl feysydd eraill hynny. Felly, nid yw eich dadl yn ddealladwy.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn gwneud argymhelliad penodol am amddiffyn gwasanaethau iechyd yr amgylchedd, sy'n cael eu darparu drwy lywodraeth leol, a fyddai'n cael eu bwrw o ddifrif gan eich syniadau ar gyfer neilltuo. Mae'r gwasanaethau hyn yn aml yn anweledig, ond yn wasanaethau tra gwerthfawr. Mae'n ddiddorol mai iechyd cyhoeddus oedd swyddogaeth gyntaf llywodraeth leol, cyn iddi gael ei holl swyddogaethau eraill fel tai, draeniad a hylendid bwyd. Ychwanegwyd heriau eraill at y rheini, fel gordewdra a chanser y croen. Roedd arolwg diweddar gan arbenigwyr iechyd yr amgylchedd o hyfforddwy hylendid bwyd yn amlgu rhai tueddiadau sy'n peri gofid. Dywed pum deg y cant o'r hyfforddwy eu bod wedi gweld y nifer sy'n cael hyfforddiant yn gostwng. Arwyddocâd hynny yw bod chwarter o erlyniadau am droseddau cysylltiedig â hylendid bwyd yn y DU yn berthnasol i ddiffyg cydymffurfio â'r gofynion am hyfforddiant. Mae gwir berygl y gallem weld achosion o wenwyn bwyd yn cynyddu oherwydd diffyg ymwybyddiaeth mewn cwmnïau, a phe byddai llai o arolygwyr.

Mae marwolaethau'r gaeaf yn broblem arall. Rydym wedi gweld nifer marwolaethau'r gaeaf yn codi'n sydyn. Mae gormodedd o farwolaethau'n aml yn debygol o ddigwydd yn y sector rhentu preifat, mewn cartrefi yn eiddo i berchen-feddianwyr ac mewn cartrefi a godwyd cyn 1850. Mae cyfran fawr o bobl hŷn yn byw yn y mathau hyn o gartrefi. Eto, mae gan swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd ran i'w chwarae mewn edrych ar y sefyllfa yn y tai hynny. Mae myfyrwyr a phoblogaethau dros dro yn aml yn cael problemau gyda boeleri, gwenwyn carbon monocsid a thrydan

want to return to a situation in which they do the very basics. They carry out a whole range of work, of which not many people are even aware. They enforce the ban on smoking in public places and they would enforce the new law on sunbeds and the law on skin piercing, tattooing and so on.

They are now fighting to maintain their capacity. They are concerned that they will be an easy hit, because people do not see them, they do not know that they are there and their work is not something that is talked about. We need to recognise that when environmental health is effective, we do not see it, but if it is diminished to a point where it cannot effectively deliver, we will notice that. Unfortunately, it is the most vulnerable groups that will notice that first. Therefore, we have tabled amendment 2 for these services to be protected as much as they can be.

Nick Bourne: It is a great privilege to have the opportunity to speak in this important debate on public health. Over the years, the Assembly Government with the general, if not universal, support of the whole Assembly has committed resources to addressing public health problems in Wales. That is a point that can be fairly made. However, in spite of those efforts, public health problems seem to continue to mount in Wales. This is partly for historic reasons and it is partly associated with massive areas of poverty, particularly in the Valleys.

These health problems are often associated with lifestyle choices, such as the dramatic increase in obesity, diabetes, alcohol misuse, smoking and sexually transmitted diseases. The point has been made by Andrew R.T. Davies that 60 per cent of men and 50 per cent of women in Wales are either overweight or obese. That is not confined to adults as a fifth of our children are also classed as obese. Some 153,000 people in Wales have been diagnosed with diabetes and an estimated further 50,000 have the

diogel, ac ymdrinnir â'r rhain hefyd gan swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd. Nid ydym am ddychwelyd i sefyllfa lle gwnânt y pethau sylfaenol iawn yn unig. Maent yn gwneud gwaith amrywiol iawn, heb fod llawer o bobl hyd yn oed yn ymwybodol ohono. Maent yn gorfodi'r gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus a byddent yn gorfodi'r ddeddf newydd ar welyau haul a'r ddeddf ar dyllu croen, tatws ac ati.

Maen nhw bellach yn ymladd i gadw eu swyddi. Pryderant y byddant yn darged hawdd, gan nad yw pobl yn eu gweld, am nad ydynt yn gwybod eu bod yno ac am nad yw eu gwaith yn rhywbeth y siaredir amdano. Mae angen inni gydnabod bod gwaith iechyd yr amgylchedd, os yw'n effeithiol, yn anweledig, ond os caiff ei leihau i lefel lle nad yw'n gallu cyflawni'n effeithiol, byddwn yn sylwi ar hynny. Yn anffodus, y grwpiau mwyaf agored i niwed a fydd yn sylwi ar hynny gyntaf. Felly, rydym wedi cyflwyno gwelliant 2 i amddiffyn y gwasanaethau hyn cymaint ag sy'n bosibl.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n ffrainc fawr gennyf gael y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl bwysig hon ar iechyd cyhoeddus. Dros y blynyddoedd, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gyda chefnogaeth gyffredinol, os nad llwyr, y Cynulliad i gyd, wedi ymrwymo adnoddau i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt y gellir ei wneud yn deg. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf yr ymdrechion hynny, mae problemau iechyd cyhoeddus fel petaent yn pentyrru yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn digwydd yn rhannol am resymau hanesyddol ac mae'n rhannol gysylltiedig ag ardaloedd enfawr o dlodi, yn arbennig yn y Cymoedd.

Mae'r problemau iechyd hyn yn aml yn gysylltiedig â dewisiadau ffordd o fyw, fel y cynnydd dramatig mewn gordewdra, diabetes, camddefnyddio alcohol, ysmegu a chlefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol. Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt gan Andrew R.T. Davies fod 60 y cant o ddynion a 50 y cant o fenywod yng Nghymru naill ai dros eu pwysau neu'n ordew. Nid oedolion yn unig mo'r rheini gan fod un o bob pump o'n plant hefyd wedi'u dosbarthu'n ordew. Mae tua 153,000 o bobl yng Nghymru wedi cael

condition without knowing it. Binge drinking remains a massive problem. We are waiting to hear from the Minister which direction she intends to take on the issue of minimum pricing, whether we will have minimum pricing or a prohibition on loss-leaders in supermarkets and so on, and whether it is to be tackled on an England-and-Wales basis or just on a Wales basis. These are important questions and the answers do not necessarily require massive budget commitments; indeed, they are pretty much budget neutral. We await those important decisions and taking the right direction would contribute massively to tackling the alcohol problem that we face. The number of cases of people with sexually transmitted diseases is higher in Wales than in nearly all European countries. I think that it is higher than them all, excluding Scandinavia, where it is also high.

Not only is this an issue of resources—which it is—but it is first of all an issue of the impact that this has on individuals and their wellbeing. There is a cost implication to the NHS in Wales. Each year, £500 million is spent on treating diabetes, £85 million on treating alcohol abuse and a staggering £386 million on treating the effects of smoking. There is an increasing cost with the increase of these problems, and it is not sustainable in human or in economic terms. We have to look at how we tackle this. It is certainly partly about education, but it is also about early intervention in the health service; it is not just about awareness, although that is an issue.

4.00 p.m.

We need to take a tough line with those who regularly and persistently sell alcohol to children, by allowing local councils and the police to close down shops or bars found to be selling it illegally. I appreciate that that is not a devolved area, but we tackle these issues in partnership with the Westminster Government. The fine for selling alcohol to children probably needs to be increased to the maximum. We have been supportive of the

diagnosis o ddiabetes ac amcangyfrifir bod y cyflwr ar 50,000 o bobl eraill heb yn wybod iddynt. Mae goryfed mewn pylliau'n broblem enfawr o hyd. Rydym yn disgwyl clywed gan y Gweinidog pa gyfeiriad y mae'n bwriadu ei ddewis o ran prisiau lleiaf, a fyddwn ni'n cael prisiau lleiaf neu waharddiad ar arweinwyr colled mewn archfarchnadoedd ac ati, ac a fydd yn cael sylw ar sail Cymru a Lloegr neu ar sail Cymru yn unig. Mae'r rhain yn gwestiynau pwysig ac nid yw'r atebion o reidrwydd yn gofyn am ymrwymadau enfawr o'r gyllideb; yn wir, maen nhw crystal â bod yn niwtral o ran cyllideb. Disgwylw'n y penderfyniadau pwysig hynny a byddai dewis y cyfeiriad cywir yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at fynd i'r afael â'r broblem alcohol a wynebwn. Mae nifer yr achosion o bobl â chlefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol yn uwch yng Nghymru nag ym mron holl wledydd Ewrop. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn uwch na'r cyfan ohonynt, ac eithrio Sgandinafia, lle mae hefyd yn uchel.

Nid yn unig y mae hyn yn fater o adnoddau—fel y mae—ond yn gyntaf mae'n fater o'r effaith a gaiff hyn ar unigolion a'u lles. Mae'n golygu cost i'r GIG yng Nghymru. Bob blwyddyn, mae £500 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar drin diabetes, £85 miliwn ar drin cam-drin alcohol a £386 miliwn aruthrol ar drin effeithiau ysmegu. Mae'r gost yn cynyddu wrth i'r problemau hyn waethygu, ac nid yw'n gynaliadwy mewn termau dynol nac economaidd. Mae'n rhaid inni ystyried y ffordd yr awn i'r afael â hyn. Mae'n sicr yn ymwneud yn rhannol ag addysg, ond mae hefyd yn ymwneud ag ymyrryd yn gynnar yn y gwasanaeth iechyd; nid ymwybyddiaeth yn unig sydd dan sylw, er bod hynny'n broblem.

Mae angen inni fod yn llym gyda'r rheini sy'n gwerthu alcohol i blant yn rheolaidd ac yn ddyfal, drwy ganiatáu i gynghorau lleol a'r heddlu gau siopau neu fariâu os canfyddir eu bod yn ei werthu'n anghyfreithlon. Gwerthfawrogaf nad maes datganoledig mo hwn, ond awn i'r afael â'r pethau hyn mewn partneriaeth â Llywodraeth San Steffan. Yn ôl pob tebyg, mae angen cynyddu'r ddirwy am werthu alcohol i blant i'r mwyafswm.

Assembly Government on a range of issues, such as banning tobacco products in shops and curbing the use of tobacco vending machines, and we would be similarly supportive of the right approach on alcohol. We look forward to what the Minister has to say on that.

It is worth saying as well that public health problems are particularly common in less affluent groups of society and less affluent parts of Wales, and we have to recognise that in targeting resources in the health service. By the effective targeting of resources at our most deprived communities, we can, I believe, achieve significant improvements in public health, deliver cost savings in the NHS that can then be invested elsewhere, and, vitally, improve the happiness and wellbeing of individuals up and down Wales. I commend this motion.

Brian Gibbons: Sir Michael Marmot, the current president of the British Medical Association, is one of the most senior and best-respected authorities on public health, not just in the United Kingdom, but, I would suggest, in the world. He recently produced a compelling review of public health and health equalities issues called 'Fair Society, Healthy Lives'. One of the messages is that:

'the more favoured people are, socially and economically, the better their health. This link between social conditions and health is not a footnote to the 'real' concerns with health – health care and unhealthy behaviours – it should become the main focus.'

In making recommendations as to how we genuinely tackle public health, he outlined six areas for action to improve health and to tackle health inequalities: give children a better start in life; enable everyone to maximise their abilities; enable everyone to have control over their lives; create fair employment and work for all; create healthy and sustainable communities; and strengthen the role and impact of ill-health prevention.

Rydym wedi cefnogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar amryw bethau, fel gwahardd cynhyrchion tybaco mewn siopau a rheoli'r ffordd y defnyddir peiriannau gwerthu tybaco, a byddem yn cefnogi mewn modd tebyg yr ymagwedd gywir at alcohol. Edrychwn ymlaen at yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud am hynny.

Mae'n werth dweud hefyd fod problemau iechyd cyhoeddus yn arbennig o gyffredin mewn grwpiau llai cyfoethog o gymdeithas a rhannau llai cyfoethog o Gymru, ac mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod hynny wrth dargedu adnoddau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Drwy dargedu adnoddau'n effeithiol at ein cymunedau mwyaf amddifadus, gallwn, rwy'n credu, gyflawni gwelliannau sylweddol mewn iechyd cyhoeddus, arbed costau i'r GIG y gellir eu buddsoddi wedyn yn rhywle arall, ac, yn hanfodol, gwella hapusrwydd a lles unigolion ar hyd a lled Cymru. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn.

Brian Gibbons: Syr Michael Marmot, llywydd Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ar hyn o bryd, yw un o'r awdurdodau uchaf ac uchaf ei barch ar iechyd cyhoeddus, ac nid yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn unig, ond, awgrymwn, yn y byd. Yn ddiweddar, cyflwynodd adolygiad diddorol iawn o faterion cydraddoldeb iechyd ac iechyd cyhoeddus o'r enw 'Fair Society, Healthy Lives'. Hon yw un o'r negeseuon:

Po fwyaf ffafredig yw pobl, yn gymdeithasol ac enomaidd, y gorau eu hiechyd. Nid yw'r cyswllt hwn rhwng amodau cymdeithasol ac iechyd ddim ond yn droednodyn i'r gwir bryderon gydag iechyd — gofal iechyd ac ymddygiadau sydd ddim yn iach — dylai ddod yn brif ffocws.

Wrth argymhell y ffordd y gallwn fynd i'r afael go iawn ag iechyd cyhoeddus, amlinellodd chwe maes gweithredu i wella iechyd ac i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb iechyd: rhoi gwell cychwyn mewn bywyd i blant; galluogi pawb i wneud y mwyaf o'u galluoedd; galluogi pawb i gael rheolaeth ar eu bywydau; creu gwaith a chyflogaeth deg i bawb; creu cymunedau iachus a chynaliadwy; a chryfhau rôl ac effaith atal salwch.

If you look at that list, five of the six actions have little to do directly, or indeed indirectly, with our mainstream health services per se. These recommendations are about improving the quality of people's lives and, in the words of Sir Michael Marmot's report, delivering improved public health is

'a matter of fairness and social justice'.

Faced, as we are, with a UK Government with policies that favour the better-off at the expense of the less-advantaged in society, the real challenge of tackling public health, or even health inequalities, will be made much more difficult, if not impossible. We simply will not be able to tackle ill-health or inequalities if people are unable to secure a job, if their incomes are being driven down—as is increasingly the case with those on benefit—or if people cannot be assured that they will have a roof over their head or a bed to sleep in.

The final part of Sir Michael's report deals with preventive health services. It is in this area that the Assembly Government's commitment to maintaining its free prescription scheme fits in very well indeed. Preventing ill-health and controlling chronic disease usually involves multiple drug treatments as well as lifestyle changes. In many instances, these treatments will incur a substantial cost. Indeed, if we look at the example of England, the current cost of a prescription item is £7.10.

Rhodri Morgan: That is not the cost; it is the charge to the patient.

Brian Gibbons: Yes, and if you want to get a season ticket for a whole year it is over £100. People start paying for prescriptions once their income is above jobseeker's allowance or income support level, which means that they are paying for prescriptions when they reach the rate of £50 to £65 per week. Therefore, people just above that level could be paying close to twice their weekly income in prescription charges if the

Os edrychwch ar y rhestr honno, prin iawn a wnelo pump o'r chwe cham yn uniongyrchol, neu'n wir yn anuniongyrchol, â'n gwasanaethau iechyd prif ffrwd ynddynt eu hunain. Mae'r argymhellion hyn yn ymwneud â gwella ansawdd bywydau pobl ac, yng ngeiriau adroddiad Syr Michael Marmot, mae gwella iechyd cyhoeddus

yn fater o degwch a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

A ninnau'n wynebu Llywodraeth y DU â pholisïau sy'n ffafrio'r mwy cyfoethog ar draul y llai breintiedig mewn cymdeithas, bydd y gwir her wrth fynd i'r afael ag iechyd cyhoeddus, neu hyd yn oed anghydraddoldeb iechyd, yn llawer anoddach, os nad amhosibl. Ni fyddwn ni'n gallu mynd i'r afael ag afiechyd neu anghydraddoldeb os nad yw pobl yn gallu sicrhau swydd, os yw eu hincymau'n cael eu gostwng—fel sy'n digwydd mwyfwy gyda'r rheini ar fudd-daliadau—neu os na all pobl fod yn siŵr y bydd to dros eu pennau neu wely iddynt gysgu ynddo.

Mae'r rhan olaf o adroddiad Syr Michael yn ymdrin â gwasanaethau iechyd ataliol. I'r maes hwn y mae ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynnal ei gynllun presgripsiynau am ddim yn cyfateb yn dda iawn wir. Mae atal afiechyd a rheoli clefyd cronig fel arfer yn golygu triniaethau â mwy nag un cyffur yn ogystal â newidiadau ffordd o fyw. Yn aml, bydd y triniaethau hyn yn gostus iawn. Yn wir, os edrychwn ar Loegr er enghraifft, cost eitem presgripsiwn ar hyn o bryd yw £7.10.

Rhodri Morgan: Nid y gost yw hynny, ond y tâl a godir ar y claf.

Brian Gibbons: Ie, ac os ydych am gael tocyn tymor am flwyddyn gron mae'n costio dros £100. Mae pobl yn dechrau talu am bresgripsiynau pan fydd eu hincwm uwchlaw lefel y lwfans ceisio gwaith neu gymhorthdal incwm, sy'n golygu eu bod yn talu am bresgripsiynau pan fyddant yn cyrraedd y gyfradd o £50 i £65 yr wythnos. Felly, gallai pobl ychydig uwchlaw'r lefel honno fod yn talu'n agos at ddwywaith eu hincwm

challenges that Sir Michael laid out in his document are to be addressed. Indeed, 50 per cent of the working population in Wales is on wages of less than £10 per hour. Therefore, the significant cost to the individual of responding to the preventative health agenda is clear to see. Indeed, we know that the greater your risk of ill health, the lower your income is likely to be. Therefore, the cost of addressing the preventive health agenda is likely to be greatest on those who are on low incomes but are not eligible for free prescriptions because they earn above the jobseeker's allowance and income support level.

Rhodri Morgan: When we introduced free prescriptions, it was noticeable that the people who came up to me in the street to thank me, by hugging me or patting me on the back or whatever, were caterers, cleaners, carers and other people in the category that you are describing, who usually had multiple prescription items.

Brian Gibbons: Absolutely. Therefore, if we are to be serious about investing in the preventive health agenda, we need full support for the universal free prescription scheme that we have in Wales. That makes sense from the point of view of the preventive agenda, of promoting public health, and in getting people into work and making work pay.

Mohammad Asghar: It is very worrying to highlight the prevalence of so many public health problems in Wales. It is every Government's job to look after health; it should be a top priority in their manifesto. Such problems threaten the healthy future of our nation and, if not addressed, could potentially cripple NHS finances.

Incessant media reports focusing on a Welsh drinking culture make for grim reading, while rising levels of obesity, which colleagues have mentioned, childhood obesity and diabetes rates are a major cause for concern in Wales. Over 25 per cent of Welsh adults binge-drink each year and 24 per cent of the adult population are smokers. This could be hugely damaging to public health in future

wythnosol mewn taliadau presgripsiwn os eir i'r afael â'r heriau y mae Syr Michael wedi'u nodi yn ei ddogfen. Yn wir, mae 50 y cant o'r boblogaeth waith yng Nghymru ar gyflogau sy'n llai na £10 yr awr. Felly, mae'r gost sylweddol i'r unigolyn os ymatebir i'r agenda iechyd ataliol yn amlwg i'w gweld. Yn wir, rydym yn gwybod mai mwyaf eich risg o salwch, isaf y mae eich incwm yn debygol o fod. Felly, mae'r gost o fynd i'r afael â'r agenda iechyd ataliol yn debygol o fod ar ei mwyaf i'r rheini sydd ar incymau isel ond nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael presgripsiynau am ddim am eu bod yn ennill uwchlaw lefel y lwfans ceisio gwaith a'r cymhorthdal incwm.

Rhodri Morgan: Pan gyflwynasom bresgripsiynau am ddim, roedd yn amlwg bod y bobl a ddaeth ataf yn y stryd i ddiolch imi, drwy fy nghofleidio neu guro fy nghefn neu beth bynnag, yn arlwywyr, yn lanhawyr, yn ofalwyr ac yn bobl eraill yn y categori a ddisgrifiwch, a oedd fel arfer yn cael mwy nag un eitem ar bresgripsiwn.

Brian Gibbons: Yn union. Felly, os ydym am fuddsoddi o ddifrif yn yr agenda iechyd ataliol, mae angen cefnogaeth lwyr arnom i'r cynllun presgripsiynau am ddim i bawb sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n synhwyrol o safbwynt yr agenda ataliol, hyrwyddo iechyd cyhoeddus, a chael pobl i mewn i waith a gwneud i waith dalu ffordd.

Mohammad Asghar: Mae'n peri cryn ofid amlygu mor gyffredin yw cynifer o broblemau iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Gwaith pob Llywodraeth yw gofalu am iechyd; dylai fod yn brif flaenoriaeth ar ei maniffesto. Mae problemau felly'n bygwth dyfodol iachus ein cenedl ac, os nad eir i'r afael â hwy, hwyrach y gallent barlysu cyllid y GIG.

Profiad annymunol yw darllen yr adroddiadau di-baid yn y cyfryngau sy'n canolbwyntio ar ddiwylliant yfed Cymru, ac mae lefelau gordewdra cynyddol, y soniodd fy nghyd-aelodau amdanynt, cyfraddau diabetes a gordewdra ymhlith plant yn peri gofid mawr yng Nghymru. Mae mwy na 25 y cant o oedolion Cymru'n goryfed mewn pyliau bob blwyddyn ac mae 24 y cant o

years and could have alarming consequences for NHS finances in years to follow. While I welcome any steps that have been taken to try to improve public health, the Welsh Assembly Government should target and focus resources more effectively towards preventive measures. Every effort must be made to ensure that these public health problems do not manifest themselves in the first place.

The root causes behind many of these public health issues, such as why so many people are binge drinking on such a regular basis, must be addressed. Estimates suggest that the Welsh NHS spends up to £500 million, which is £0.5 billion, Minister, each year on treatments linked directly to diabetes. I recently raised with the First Minister the fact that 2,000 new cases were diagnosed in Gwent alone during 2009-10. Many parts of South Wales East are among the worst hit in Wales, and estimates suggest that thousands remain undiagnosed. We are also seeing worrying trends with young children in Wales being diagnosed with type 2 diabetes, which is often specifically linked to lifestyle.

The Assembly Government must work to improve awareness-raising and screening services. We must see better self-management and early diagnosis. Currently, only one in 50 diabetics has completed the free education courses available through local health boards. That must improve, Minister.

4.10 p.m.

Obesity, and increasingly childhood obesity, are also a major problem in Wales. Estimates suggest that we have one of the highest levels of childhood obesity in the world. The consequences for the future are particularly devastating. The *British Medical Journal* predicts that obesity could bankrupt the national health service. Therefore, the Welsh figures are particularly troubling, and the need to shift worrying lifestyle trends is

oedolion y boblogaeth yn ysmegu. Gallai hyn wneud niwed ofnadwy i iechyd cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol a gallai ddwyn canlyniadau ofnadwy i gyllid y GIG yn y blynyddoedd i ddilyn. Er fy mod i'n croesawu unrhyw gamau a gymerwyd i geisio gwella iechyd cyhoeddus, dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dargedu a chanolbwyntio adnoddau'n fwy effeithiol tuag at fesurau ataliol. Rhaid gwneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau nad yw'r problemau iechyd cyhoeddus hyn yn dod i'r amlwg yn y lle cyntaf.

Mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag achosion gwaelodol llawer o'r materion iechyd cyhoeddus hyn, fel pam mae cynifer o bobl yn goryfed mewn pyliau mor rheolaidd. Yn ôl amcangyfrifon, mae GIG Cymru'n gwario hyd at £500 miliwn, sef £0.5 biliwn, Weinidog, bob blwyddyn ar driniaethau sy'n gysylltiedig yn uniongyrchol â diabetes. Soniais yn ddiweddar wrth y Prif Weinidog am y ffaith bod 2,000 o achosion newydd wedi'u cael yng Ngwent yn unig yn ystod 2009-10. Mae llawer o rannau o Ddwyrain De Cymru ymhlith y rhai a fwriwyd waethaf yng Nghymru, ac mae amcangyfrifon yn awgrymu bod miloedd heb gael diagnosis eto. Rydym hefyd yn gweld tueddiadau sy'n peri gofid ymhlith pobl ifanc yng Nghymru'n cael diagnosis o ddiabetes math 2, sy'n aml yn cael ei gysylltu'n benodol â ffordd o fyw.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio i wella gwasanaethau hybu ymwybyddiaeth a sgrinio. Rhaid inni weld gwell hunanreoli a diagnosis cynnar. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond un o bob 50 â diabetes sydd wedi cwblhau'r cyrsiau addysg am ddim sydd ar gael drwy fyrddau iechyd lleol. Rhaid i hynny wella, Weinidog.

Mae gordewdra, a gordewdra ymhlith plant yn gynyddol, hefyd yn broblem fawr yng Nghymru. Yn ôl amcangyfrifon, mae gennym un o'r lefelau gordewdra uchaf ymhlith plant yn y byd. Mae'r canlyniadau i'r dyfodol yn arbennig o ddistrywiol. Yn ôl *British Medical Journal* gallai gordewdra dorri'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Felly, mae ffigurau Cymru'n achosi gofid arbennig, ac mae'r angen i newid ffyrdd o fyw sy'n peri gofid yn

essential.

I note initiatives such as MEND—Mind, Exercise, Nutrition...Do It!—which is a great initiative, but as childhood obesity problems continue to grow, I hope that the Minister can outline how big an impact she expects the programme to have, because the problem is threatening to spiral out of control. In tackling obesity, it is absolutely essential to promote information choices. Public health problems can stop individuals from fulfilling their potential in life. It is concerning that many health problems are increasingly prevalent among less affluent groups in society, and the consequences of that are worrying. The Assembly Government needs to do more to target early intervention. Information on the importance of healthy behaviour must be accessible and reach all sections of society. People across Wales must realise that their health should always be a major priority for the Government.

Jeff Cuthbert: As you know, I am chair of the Assembly's cross-party group on healthy living, and I therefore take a close political interest in the issue of public health improvement. As a type 2 diabetic, I have a personal interest in the matter, and I know from first-hand experience how making changes to one's lifestyle can affect one's quality of life. While the Welsh Assembly Government cannot tell people what to do with regard to how they live their lives, it is its duty to encourage and enable people to live healthier lifestyles.

This year's National Healthy Living Week occurred in September. Activities took place across Wales at a community level, and dozens of organisations took part. We held our usual event here in the Senedd, and many different groups exhibited their work and demonstrated how they contribute to the public health agenda in Wales. Health Challenge Wales continues to play an integral part in the cross-party group as well as in the organisation of National Healthy Living Week. One of Health Challenge Wales's core messages is in line with the cross-party

hanfodol.

Sylwaf ar fentrau fel MEND—*Mind, Exercise, Nutrition...Do It!*—sy'n fenter wych, ond wrth i broblemau gordewdra ymhlith plant waethygu o hyd, gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog amlinellu cymaint o effaith y mae'n disgwyl i'r rhaglen ei chael, oherwydd mae'r broblem yn bygwth sbiral allan o reolaeth. Wrth fynd i'r afael â gordewdra, mae'n gwbl hanfodol hyrwyddo dewisiadau gwybodaeth. Gall problemau iechyd cyhoeddus atal unigolion rhag bodloni eu potensial mewn bywyd. Mae'n peri gofid bod llawer o broblemau iechyd yn fwyfwy cyffredin ymhlith grwpiau llai cyfoethog mewn cymdeithas, ac mae canlyniadau hynny'n achos pryder. Mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud mwy i dargedu ymyrraeth gynnar. Rhaid i wybodaeth am bwysigrwydd ymddygiad iachus fod ar gael a rhaid iddi gyrraedd pob rhan o'r gymdeithas. Rhaid i bobl ledled Cymru sylweddoli y dylai eu hiechyd fod yn brif flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth bob amser.

Jeff Cuthbert: Fel y gwyddoch, fi yw cadeirydd grŵp trawsbleidiol y Cynulliad ar fyw'n iachus, ac mae gennyf felly ddiddordeb gwleidyddol brwd ym mater gwella iechyd cyhoeddus. A minnau'n dioddef o ddiabetes math 2, mae gennyf ddiddordeb personol yn y peth, a gwn o brofiad personol fod newid eich ffordd o fyw'n gallu effeithio ar eich ansawdd bywyd. Er nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gallu dweud wrth bobl beth i'w wneud o ran eu ffordd o fyw, mae'n ddyletswydd arni annog a galluogi pobl i fyw mewn ffyrdd mwy iachus.

Cafwyd Wythnos Genedlaethol Byw'n Iach eleni ym mis Medi. Cynhaliwyd gweithgareddau ledled Cymru ar lefel gymunedol, a bu dwsinau o gymdeithasau'n cymryd rhan. Cynaliasom ein digwyddiad arferol yma yn y Senedd, a bu llawer o wahanol grwpiau'n arddangos eu gwaith ac yn arddangos eu cyfraniad at yr agenda iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae Her Iechyd Cymru'n dal yn chwarae rhan annatod yn y grŵp trawsbleidiol yn ogystal ag wrth drefnu Wythnos Genedlaethol Byw'n Iach. Mae un o negeseuon craidd Her Iechyd

group—preventing ill health from occurring in the first place. By making small changes to our lifestyle, we can bring wholesale benefits to ourselves in the longer term as well as help to alleviate unsustainable pressures on the national health service.

It is important that we adopt a holistic approach to a healthier lifestyle, as well as doing more exercise, adopting a more nutritious diet, and consuming alcohol responsibly, as you mentioned—I gather that someone was saying last week that I do not enjoy the odd bottle of Welsh beer and cider, but I certainly do—and giving up smoking. We must also consider other aspects such as mental and reproductive health, as well as the delivery apparatus by which we promote our message of a healthier lifestyle. If we can do that, it becomes a win-win situation: people's general health and wellbeing should improve thanks to the dissemination of responsible advice and support from the Welsh Assembly Government and partner organisations, so that we all work together for a better outcome. We have done a lot in Wales to put the structures in place to tackle public health problems and in ensuring that there is a preventative strategy for dealing with future NHS pressures.

Perhaps our biggest achievement was the public smoking ban of 2007. It has had immediate short-term benefits, and will have much longer-term implications for public health. We have also broadened screening for bowel and breast cancer, and have pioneered an exercise referral scheme for GPs and health professionals to help introduce persons with chronic conditions to a structured exercise routine. However, that is not to say that there is not more to do. Strategy documents, such as 'Our Healthy Future', as well as the latest annual report of the chief medical officer, acknowledge the challenges that lie ahead. These will be brought into much sharper focus, given the tight financial climate over the next few years.

Cymru yn unol â'r grŵp trawsbleidiol-sef atal afiechyd yn y lle cyntaf. Drwy wneud newidiadau bach yn ein ffordd o fyw, gallwn ddod â buddion helaeth i'n hunain yn y tymor hwy yn ogystal â helpu i leddfu pwysau anghynaliadwy ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Mae'n bwysig inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd gyfannol at ffordd fwy iachus o fyw, yn ogystal â gwneud mwy o ymarfer, bwyta diet mwy maethlon, ac yfed alcohol yn gyfrifol, fel y soniasoch—casglaf fod rhywun wedi dweud yr wythnos diwethaf nad wyf yn mwynhau ambell botel o gwrw neu seidr Cymreig, ond mi ydw i'n bendant—a rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu. Rhaid hefyd inni ystyried agweddau eraill fel iechyd meddwl ac iechyd atgenhedlu, yn ogystal â'r cyfarpar a ddefnyddiwn i hyrwyddo ein neges am ffordd fwy iachus o fyw. Os gallwn wneud hynny, bydd pawb ar ei ennill: dylai iechyd a lles cyffredinol pobl wella o ganlyniad i ledaenu cyngor a chymorth cyfrifol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i sefydliadau partner, er mwyn inni oll gydweithio er canlyniad gwell. Rydym wedi gwneud llawer yng Nghymru i roi'r strwythurau ar waith i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau iechyd cyhoeddus ac wrth sicrhau bod strategaeth ataliol i fynd i'r afael â phwysau ar y GIG yn y dyfodol.

Hwyrach mai ein cyflawniad mwyaf oedd y gwaharddiad ysmegu cyhoeddus yn 2007. Mae wedi dwyn buddion tymor byr ar unwaith, a bydd ganddo oblygiadau llawer mwy parhaol i iechyd cyhoeddus. Rydym hefyd wedi ehangu sgrinio am ganser y coluddyn a'r fron, ac rydym wedi arloesi cynllun atgyfeirio ymarfer er mwyn i feddygon teulu a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol helpu i gyflwyno pobl â chyflyrau cronig i drefn ymarfer corff â strwythur. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes rhagor i'w wneud. Mae dogfennau strategaeth, fel 'Ein Dyfodol Iach', yn ogystal ag adroddiad blynyddol diweddaraf y prif swyddog meddygol, yn cydnabod yr heriau sydd o'n blaenau. Bydd y rhain yn dod yn llawer amlycach, o ystyried yr hinsawdd ariannol dynn dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: **Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** A ydych

Are you looking to intervene, Rhodri? No? I call Brian Gibbons. Sorry, I mean Jeff Cuthbert.

Jeff Cuthbert: Thanks. Right. [*Laughter.*] I was slightly thrown by that. The cuts being passed down to us cannot be allowed to detract from our long-term goal of improving public health in Wales. As my colleague Irene James suggested during ministerial questions earlier, getting rid of beneficial measures such as free swimming, which builds exercise into people's daily routines, would be a completely false economy. As well as the spending cuts that will unfortunately hit us hard in the years to come, we also have many long-standing obstacles here in Wales. Our legacies of heavy industry and historical deprivation have meant that, in the past, healthy lifestyles were very much an afterthought to simply getting by in life. There is a risk that, as financial pressures bite on family finances, this sort of attitude could return. That is why it is so important that we carry on with the good work that we have done here in Wales. I am thinking particularly of the cross-party group that I chair. We look forward to playing our part in ensuring that this work continues.

David Melding: I wish to start by reminding Members that, in the 1980s and 1990s, Wales led the way in Europe on some simple public health messages that really did have a big impact. It would be wrong to say that, in the past 10 years, we have not achieved in the arena of public health, but I think that there has been a lack of vitality compared with those early days. I think that we need to return to this idea of excitement in our public health campaigns and really engage patients and encourage them to be responsible and remind them that many aspects of a healthy lifestyle are of great benefit and enjoyment and that it is not all doom and gloom and stopping people from enjoying themselves. Talking about people being stopped from enjoying themselves, I will give way to Dr Gibbons.

Brian Gibbons: David, I am not too sure that your recollection of those days as halcyon

chi'n ceisio ymyrryd, Rhodri? Na? Galwaf Brian Gibbons. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, rwy'n meddwl Jeff Cuthbert.

Jeff Cuthbert: Diolch. Iawn. [*Chwerthin.*] Fe'm lloriwyd ychydig gan hynny. Ni ellir caniatáu i'r toriadau sy'n cael eu trosglwyddo inni leihau ar ein nod tymor hir o wella iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Fel yr awgrymodd fy nghyd-aelod Irene James yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r gweinidog yn gynharach, byddai cael gwared ar fesurau buddiol fel nofio am ddim, sy'n ymgorffori ymarfer yn nhrefn feunyddiol pobl, yn ffolineb llwyr. Yn ogystal â'r toriadau gwariant a fydd yn ein bwrw'n galed yn anffodus yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, mae gennym hefyd lawer o rwystrau maith yma yng Nghymru. Mae ein hetifeddiaeth o ddiwydiant trwm ac amddifadedd hanesyddol wedi golygu bod ffyrdd iachus o fyw, yn y gorffennol, yn dod yn ail i raddau helaeth iawn i oroesi. Wrth i'r pwysau ariannol effeithio ar gyllid teuluoedd, mae perygl y gallai'r math hwn o agwedd ddychwelyd. Dyna pam mae mor bwysig inni barhau'r gwaith da a wnaethom yma yng Nghymru. Rwy'n meddwl yn arbennig am y grŵp trawsbleidiol yr wyf innau'n ei gadeirio. Edrychwn ymlaen at chwarae ein rhan i sicrhau bod y gwaith hwn yn parhau.

David Melding: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy atgoffa'r Aelodau fod Cymru, yn y 1980au a'r 1990au, ar flaen y gad yn Ewrop o ran rhai negeseuon iechyd cyhoeddus syml iawn a gafodd gryn dipyn o effaith. Byddai'n anghywir dweud nad ydym wedi cyflawni yn arena iechyd cyhoeddus yn y 10 mlynedd ddiwethaf, ond rwy'n credu y bu diffyg egni o'u cymharu â'r dyddiau cynnar hynny. Rwy'n credu bod angen inni ddychwelyd i'r syniad hwn o gyffro yn ein hymgyrchoedd iechyd cyhoeddus ac ennyn diddordeb cleifion a'u hannog i fod yn gyfrifol a'u hatgoffa bod llawer o agweddau ar ffordd iach o fyw yn fuddiol iawn ac yn bleserus iawn ac nad gofid a gwae mo'r cyfan nac atal pobl rhag mwynhau eu hunain. Wrth sôn am atal pobl rhag mwynhau eu hunain, ildiaf i Dr Gibbons.

Brian Gibbons: David, nid wyf yn rhy siŵr bod eich atgofion am y dyddiau hynny fel yr

days is quite accurate. Indeed, I remember a Government that came to power in, I think, 1979. The first thing that it did after coming to power was to stick the Black report on health inequalities into the shredder. That pretty much dictated how public health went over the next 18 years.

David Melding: I think that you would be generous enough to concede that, in the 1980s, the Welsh Office established schemes on cardiac health that led European best practice. I remember international conferences and large articles in the *Western Mail* about how successful the Government's strategies were. I think that it is important to focus on public health messages here. There is a whole issue about health inequalities that should not be avoided, but it is not the subject of my contribution this afternoon. For those on drastically below-average incomes in particular, income has a big effect on life chances, and I certainly do not deny that.

I wish to start by looking at physical activity, because I think that, in many ways, it is the key to a healthy life. In fairness, the Government has had a strategy that has tried to get adults to be more physically active. Quite a lot of money has been put into it. It has been reviewed, and it was rather savaged in the Audit Committee when I was its Chair, but its intentions were good. However, it failed in some basic marketing, such as that of the simple message of what people should aim to do. The slogan of '5x30' was never understood by the public. People just did not realise what that meant, which was that, for five days a week, you should aim to exercise for at least 30 minutes. People did not understand that they could do that in chunks of 10 minutes, for example, if they wanted to do so. These very basic messages just did not get across. When we look at physical activity, we have to remember issues such as urban design. The most feasible physical activity for people to do and to sustain throughout their lives is to walk. In many urban environments, the barriers to walking are colossal, and the car continues to be king. We must look at that. I congratulate Cardiff

oes aur yn gwbl gywir. Yn wir, rwy'n cofio Llywodraeth a ddaeth i rym ym 1979, rwy'n credu. Y peth cyntaf a wnaeth ar ôl dod i rym oedd gosod adroddiad Black ar anghydraddoldeb iechyd yn y peiriant rhwygo. Roedd hynny fwy neu lai'n pennu sut fuodd hi i iechyd cyhoeddus am y 18 mlynedd nesaf.

David Melding: Rwy'n credu y byddech chi'n ddigon hael i gytuno bod y Swyddfa Gymreig, yn y 1980au, wedi sefydlu cynlluniau ar iechyd cardiaidd a arweiniodd arfer gorau yn Ewrop. Rwy'n cofio cynadleddau rhyngwladol ac erthyglau mawrion yn y *Western Mail* am lwyddiant mawr strategaethau'r Llywodraeth. Rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n bwysig canolbwytio ar negeseuon iechyd cyhoeddus yma. Mae mater cyfan am anghydraddoldeb iechyd na ddylid ei osgoi, ond nid hwnnw yw testun fy nghyfraniad y prynhawn yma. I'r rheini ar incymau sydd ymhell islaw'r cyfartaledd yn arbennig, mae incwm yn cael effaith fawr ar gyfleoedd bywyd, ac nid wyf yn gwadu hynny o gwbl.

Hoffwn ddechrau drwy edrych ar weithgarwch corfforol, oherwydd rwy'n credu mai hwnnw, mewn llawer ffordd, yw'r allwedd i fywyd iach. Gyda thegwch, bu gan y Llywodraeth strategaeth sydd wedi ceisio annog oedolion i wneud mwy o weithgarwch corfforol. Gwariwyd cryn dipyn o arian arni. Mae wedi cael ei hadolygu, a chafodd ei thynnu'n gareiau braidd yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio pan oeddwn i'n Gadeirydd arno, ond roedd ei bwriadau'n rhai da. Fodd bynnag, methodd â gwneud rhyw farchnata sylfaenol, fel marchnata neges syml yr hyn y dylai pobl anelu at ei wneud. Ni ddeallodd y cyhoedd byth y slogan '5x30'. Nid oedd pobl yn sylweddoli beth oedd ystyr hynny, sef y dylech anelu at ymarfer am 30 munud o leiaf am bum diwrnod yr wythnos. Nid oedd pobl yn deall y gallent wneud hynny mewn darnau o 10 munud, er enghraifft, petaent am wneud hynny. Ni chafodd y negeseuon sylfaenol iawn hyn eu cyfleu. Pan edrychwn ar weithgarwch corfforol, mae'n rhaid inni gofio pethau fel dylunio trefol. Y gweithgarwch corfforol mwyaf ymarferol i bobl ei wneud ac i barhau i'w wneud gydol eu hoes yw cerdded. Mewn llawer o

Council at the moment—although not in every aspect—on its attempts to grapple with Cardiff's urban design. They are a start and a move in the right direction.

4.20 p.m.

Schools also have a big role to play in relation to physical activity. The old idea was that physical education was about elite sports and giving more opportunities to pupils who were outstanding athletes. It should be about that, of course, but effective teaching in that area can also establish habits of enjoying some form of physical activity among all pupils for life. There is a physical activity that can suit even the least athletic. I did not exactly excel at games in school, but I enjoyed quite a lot of the games that we played. That is what we have to aim at and remember.

Linked to physical activity is healthy eating and nutrition. I will not repeat the messages on obesity, because I want to talk about more positive issues. We should cherish a love of food, we should enjoy what we eat and we should understand where it comes from and enjoy the process of cooking. If we do all of that, we are less likely to eat rubbish or, at least, only as an occasional treat when we want something that is high in sugar and fat—to do that as part of a routine diet is not good. We need to return to the basic principles of good nutrition. I remind Members that it was during the second world war that we reached the height of nutritional health, and that was at a time when many foods were scarce.

There is a lot more to talk about, but I can see that the clock has already gone red, and I do not want to test your patience, Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer, after the admirable way in which you tackled the former First Minister and his occasional sedentary remarks.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: How kind.

amgylcheddau trefol, mae'r rhwystrau rhag cerdded yn anferthol, ac mae'r car yn teyrnasu o hyd. Mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar hynny. Llongyfarchaf Gyngor Caerdydd ar hyn o bryder nad ym mhob agwedd-am ei ymdrechion i fynd i'r afael â dylunio trefol Caerdydd. Maent yn ddechreuad ac yn gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

Mae gan ysgolion ran fawr i'w chwarae hefyd mewn perthynas â gweithgarwch corfforol. Yr hen syniad oedd bod addysg gorfforol yn ymwneud â chwaraeon elitaidd a rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd i ddisgyblion a oedd yn athletwyr eithriadol. Dylai wneud hynny, wrth reswm, ond mae addysgu effeithiol yn y maes hwnnw hefyd yn gallu sefydlu arferion o fwynhau rhyw fath o weithgarwch corfforol ym mhob disgybl am oes. Nid oeddwn i'n rhagori mewn chwaraeon yn yr ysgol, ond roeddwn i'n mwynhau cryn dipyn o'r gemau a chwaraeem. At hynny y mae'n rhaid inni anelu ac mae'n rhaid inni ei gofio.

Un peth sy'n gysylltiedig â gweithgarwch corfforol yw bwyta'n iach a maeth. Ni ailadroddaf y negeseuon am ordewdra, oherwydd rwyf am siarad am bethau mwy cadarnhaol. Dylem feithrin cariad at fwyd, dylem fwynhau'r hyn a fwytawn a dylem ddeall o ble mae'n dod a mwynhau'r broses o goginio. Os gwnawn ni hynny oll, rydym yn llai tebygol o fwyta sothach neu, o leiaf, ei fwyta'n achlysurol yn unig pan fydd arnom eisiau rhywbeth â llawer o siwgr a braster—nid yw'n dda gwneud hynny'n fater o arfer. Mae angen inni ddychwelyd i egwyddorion sylfaenol maeth da. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau mai yn ystod yr ail ryfel byd y cyraeddasom anterth iechyd maethol, ac roedd hwnnw'n amser pan oedd llawer o fwydydd yn brin.

Mae llawer mwy i siarad amdano, ond gallaf weld bod y cloc eisoes wedi troi'n goch, ac nid wyf am drethu eich amynedd, Ddirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro, ar ôl y ffordd gampus yr aethoch i'r afael â'r Prif Weinidog blaenorol a'i ambell sylw eisteddog.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Rydych mor garedig.

David Lloyd: It is a pleasure to contribute to this debate on public health and the widespread recognition in the Chamber that health is more than the health service. While it is true to say that life expectancy has increased in Wales, significant public health challenges remain, as we have heard. Those challenges usually lie outside the health service. One of the most significant steps forward was in the piping of water in Victorian times and the recognition of the importance of hygiene in relation to infectious disease control. The simple measure of piping our water supply had a dramatic effect on human health. In addition, an improvement in diet and living conditions, better sanitation and mass immunisation have all contributed to the life expectancy rates that we see nowadays.

A long time ago, as a GP, I recognised very early that most of the preventive aspects of health lay outside what I could do as a GP, which is how I got involved in local government in the first place. Local government has a tremendous contribution to make to the whole health agenda, because most of the determinants of ill health lie within its responsibilities. With regard to what makes people ill in the first place, No. 1 is poor housing. Poor housing—cold, damp and dusty houses—equals poor health. The life expectancy of homeless people or a rough sleeper is 47 years, while the rest of us can live into our 80s. The recent changes to housing benefit will not help the adverse housing situation; they are likely to make the situation worse and make those health statistics worse.

Education is important and resides within local government. That encompasses the agenda that David Melding has just talked about, namely discovering healthy eating and the importance of physical exercise and activity. It is also important to raise awareness about alcohol, and Government has a statutory role here and I, for one, support minimal alcohol pricing. We have to make alcohol more expensive. Sexual health is also about education. It is important to raise self-esteem and self-worth among

David Lloyd: Mae'n bleser cyfrannu at y ddadl hon ar iechyd cyhoeddus a'r gydnabyddiaeth helaeth yn y Siambr fod iechyd yn golygu mwy na'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Er ei bod yn wir dweud bod disgwyliad oes wedi cynyddu yng Nghymru, mae heriau sylweddol yn parhau ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus, fel y clywsom. Mae'r heriau hynny fel arfer y tu allan i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Un o'r camau mwyaf sylweddol ymlaen oedd peipio dŵr yn yr oes Fictoraidd a chydabod mor bwysig yw hylendid mewn perthynas â rheoli clefydau heintus. Cafodd y cam syml o beipio ein cyflenwad dŵr effaith ddramatig ar iechyd pobl. Hefyd, mae gwell diet ac amodau byw, gwell glanweithdra ac imiwneiddiad torfol hefyd wedi cyfrannu oll at y cyfraddau disgwyliad oes a welwn erbyn hyn.

Amser maith yn ôl, a minnau'n feddyg teulu, sylweddolais yn fuan iawn fod y rhan fwyaf o'r agweddau ataliol ar iechyd yn gorwedd y tu hwnt i'r hyn y gallwn i'r meddyg teulu ei wneud, ac am y rheswm hwnnw y dechreuais gymryd rhan mewn llywodraeth leol yn y lle cyntaf. Mae gan lywodraeth leol gyfraniad anferthol i'w wneud at yr agenda iechyd cyfan, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o benderfynyddion afiechyd yn perthyn i'w chyfrifoldebau. O ran yr hyn sy'n gwneud pobl yn sâl yn y lle cyntaf, Rhif 1 yw tai gwael. Mae tai gwael-cartrefi oer, llaith a llychlyd-yn golygu iechyd gwael. Disgwyliad oes pobl ddigartref neu rywun sy'n cysgu ar y stryd yw 47 oed, a'r gweddill ohonom yn gallu byw i'n 80au. Ni fydd y newidiadau diweddar yn y budd-dal tai'n helpu'r sefyllfa dai andwyol; maent yn debygol o waethygu'r sefyllfa a gwaethygu'r ystadegau iechyd hynny.

Mae addysg yn bwysig ac mae'n perthyn i lywodraeth leol. Mae hynny'n amlinellu'r agenda y mae David Melding newydd sôn amdano, sef darganfod bwyta'n iach a phwysigrwydd ymarfer a gweithgarwch corfforol. Mae hefyd yn bwysig hybu ymwybyddiaeth am alcohol, ac mae gan y Llywodraeth rôl statudol yma ac rwyf fi, am un, yn cefnogi prisiau lleiaf alcohol. Mae'n rhaid inni wneud alcohol yn ddrutach. Mae iechyd rhywiol hefyd yn ymwneud ag addysg. Mae'n bwysig hybu hunan-barch a

young people so that they value themselves better and are less likely to engage in dangerous activities.

Environmental health also resides within local government. The smoking ban has been pivotal in improving public health in Wales. No longer will we have 400 deaths from passive smoking in Wales. That has gone as a result of that legislation. Obviously, I am aware that the tobacco control measures are being reviewed in Westminster now. It is likely that there will be a slackening of the strict tobacco control measures, which is a betrayal of what we want to see, with those for vendors in shops likely to be rolled back by the present Government in Westminster. That would be a retrograde step.

Jonathan Morgan: Dai, could you tell the Assembly what evidence there is to suggest that a ban on tobacco displays in shops reduces the incidence of smoking?

David Lloyd: There is widespread evidence from around the globe that, if you make tobacco less attractive and available, just as with alcohol, that pays: people do not buy tobacco, and children do not start smoking. That is the evidence.

On public transport, that mostly lies within the ambit of local government. There is one death per day resulting from road traffic accidents in Wales and nine per day in the United Kingdom. That is the importance of public transport to the general public health agenda. Regarding physical activity and playing fields, I am pleased to acknowledge the support of most Assembly Members for my Proposed Playing Fields (Community Involvement in Disposal Decisions) (Wales) Measure, which aims to protect playing fields. Cardiff, in particular, and other cities, such as Swansea, have large open playing areas that need to be protected, because physical inactivity is a major source of the public ill health that we face today, in addition to smoking. We have to stop our young people from starting to smoke. The

hunanwerth ymhlith pobl ifanc fel eu bod yn gwerthfawrogi eu hunain yn well ac yn llai tebygol o gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau peryglus.

Mae iechyd yr amgylchedd hefyd yn perthyn i lywodraeth leol. Bu'r gwaharddiad ysmegu'n allweddol i wella iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Nid mwyach y cawn 400 o farwolaethau yn sgil ysmegu goddefol yng Nghymru. Mae hynny wedi mynd o ganlyniad i'r ddeddfwriaeth honno. Yn amlwg, rwy'n gwybod bod y mesurau rheoli tybaco'n cael eu hadolygu yn San Steffan yn awr. Mae'n debygol y bydd y mesurau rheoli tybaco caeth yn cael eu llacio, sy'n bradychu'r hyn yr ydym am ei weld, a'r rheini i werthwyr mewn siopau'n debygol o gael eu rholio'n ôl gan y Llywodraeth bresennol yn San Steffan. Byddai hwnnw'n gam yn ôl.

Jonathan Morgan: Dai, a allech chi ddweud wrth y Cynulliad pa dystiolaeth sydd i awgrymu bod gwaharddiad ar arddangosiadau tybaco mewn siopau'n cwtogi ar ysmegu?

David Lloyd: Mae tystiolaeth helaeth o bedwar ban ei bod yn talu ffordd gwneud tybaco'n llai deniadol a sicrhau nad yw ar gael cymaint, yn union fel alcohol: nid yw pobl yn prynu tybaco, ac nid yw plant yn dechrau ysmegu. Dyna'r dystiolaeth.

O ran cludiant cyhoeddus, mae hwnnw'n perthyn gan mwyaf i gwmpasiad llywodraeth leol. Mae un farwolaeth y dydd o ganlyniad i ddamweiniau traffig ffordd yng Nghymru a naw y dydd yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Dyna yw pwysigrwydd cludiant cyhoeddus i'r agenda iechyd cyhoeddus cyffredinol. O ran gweithgarwch corfforol a meysydd chwarae, rwy'n falch o gydnabod cefnogaeth y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad i'm Mesur Meysydd Chwarae Arfaethedig (Cynnwys y Gymuned mewn Penderfyniadau Gwaredu) (Cymru), sy'n anelu at warchod meysydd chwarae. Mae yng Nghaerdydd, yn arbennig, a dinasoedd eraill, fel Abertawe, feysydd chwarae agored mawr y mae angen eu gwarchod, gan fod anweithgarwch corfforol yn ffynhonnell bwysig o'r afiechyd cyhoeddus a wynebwn heddiw, yn ogystal ag

average age of taking up smoking in this country is 11. Attractive tobacco displays are part of the equation whereby children as young as seven start smoking in Wales. We have to tackle that, as over 5,000 people in Wales die from the effects of smoking-related diseases every year.

However, the overwhelming public health challenges—and the reason why Welsh health statistics are worse than the UK average—are poverty and deprivation. Wales has the worst health statistics because of our high levels of poverty. The recent Westminster Government's enterprise, with the public sector cuts scenario, the job cuts scenario, scrapping child trust funds and raising VAT—

There was an intervention, I am pleased to announce, so I believe that I still have time.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: You have some time, but please draw your remarks to a close now.

David Lloyd: That agenda is likely to make the poorer people in Wales even poorer, thereby undermining their health. Poverty is the major reason why public health challenges remain.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: Please wind up now.

David Lloyd: That needs to be addressed, so we will not take any messages from the other side of the Chamber on the importance of public health unless they start tackling the poverty agenda in a truly meaningful fashion.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): I accept the point of the original motion that some public health challenges remain, such as persistent inequalities in health, a growth in binge drinking and sexual health problems such as sexually transmitted infections. However, I do not accept, by implication, that the picture

ysmygu. Mae'n rhaid inni atal ein pobl ifanc rhag dechrau ysmegu. Yr oedran cyfartalog i ddechrau ysmegu yn y wlad hon yw 11. Mae arddangosiadau tybaco deniadol yn rhan o'r peth sy'n achosi i blant mor ifanc â saith oed ddechrau ysmegu yng Nghymru. Mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hynny, gan fod mwy na 5,000 o bobl yng Nghymru'n marw o effeithiau clefydau sy'n gysylltiedig ag ysmegu bob blwyddyn.

Fodd bynnag, yr heriau aruthrol ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus—a'r rheswm pam mae ystadegau iechyd Cymru'n waeth na chyfartaledd y DU—yw tlodi ac amddifadedd. Gan Gymru y mae'r ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf oherwydd ein lefelau tlodi uchel. Mae menter ddiweddar Llywodraeth San Steffan, gyda sefyllfa'r toriadau sector cyhoeddus, y sefyllfa torri swyddi, dileu cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant a chynyddu TAW—

Roedd ymyriad, rwy'n falch o gyhoeddi, felly rwy'n credu bod gennyf amser o hyd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Mae gennych rywfaint o amser, ond a wnewch chi ddirwyn eich sylwadau i ben yn awr.

David Lloyd: Mae'r agenda hwnnw'n debygol o wneud y bobl dlotach yng Nghymru'n dlotach byth, gan danseilio eu hiechyd felly. Tlodi yw'r prif reswm y mae heriau iechyd cyhoeddus yn parhau.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Dirwynwch i ben yn awr os gwelwch yn dda.

David Lloyd: Mae angen mynd i'r afael â hynny, felly ni chymerwn unrhyw negeseun o ochr arall y Siambr am bwysigrwydd iechyd cyhoeddus oni fyddant yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r agenda tlodi mewn modd gwir ystyrlon.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Derbyniaf bwynt y cynnig gwreiddiol fod rhai heriau iechyd cyhoeddus yn parhau, fel anghydraddoldeb parhaus mewn iechyd, a thwf goryfed mewn pylliau a phroblemau iechyd rhywiol fel heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn derbyn,

of public health is completely negative. There have been successive reports from the chief medical officer, and 'Our Healthy Future'. You can also see that we have been examining the reorientation of resources towards prevention since the Wanless report of 2003. Therefore, the Government has tabled an amendment with a wording that more accurately reflects the true position of public health in Wales. In his speech, Andrew outlined a number of key areas, as did all other speakers, with regard to the public health agenda. One to which I want to turn is smoking. There have been some positive news stories on the public health agenda with regard to smoking. The number of 15 to 16-year-old boys smoking has dropped from 21 per cent in 1998 to 9 per cent in 2010. Meanwhile, smoking among girls in that age group has fallen from 29 per cent in 1998 to 14 per cent in 2010. These are good statistical changes. Our three national smoking prevention programmes have involved more than 25,000 young people during the year. In 2009-10, almost 15,000 people contacted Stop Smoking Wales, which helps people to give up smoking. Of the people who participated substantially in the support programme, over 60 per cent reported that they quit after four weeks. I think that that is good. Following the ban on smoking in public areas, the research is quite clear, with evidence of reduced exposure to environmental tobacco smoke, particularly in pubs, clubs, bars, and at work. However, we need to maintain this downward trend and limit exposure to second-hand smoke. A tobacco control action plan will be developed by the end of 2010.

4.30 p.m.

On the smoking agenda, there has been some success, but there will always be more work to do. That leads me into some of the points that David Melding made about how we campaign. I have been discussing with the chief medical officer and Professor Sir Mansel Aylward in Public Health Wales the different ways of getting messages across, to make the agenda of preventative health

trwy oblygiad, fod y darlun iechyd cyhoeddus yn gwbl negyddol. Cafwyd adroddiadau olynol gan y prif swyddog meddygol, ac 'Ein Dyfodol Iach'. Gallwch hefyd weld y buom yn archwilio ailgyfeirio adnoddau tuag at ataliad ers adroddiad Wanless yn 2003. Felly, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno gwelliant gyda geiriad sy'n adlewyrchu'n gywirach wir sefyllfa iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yn ei araith, amlinellodd Andrew nifer o feysydd allweddol, fel y gwnaeth bob siaradwr arall, o ran yr agenda iechyd cyhoeddus. Un yr hoffwn ddychwelyd iddo yw ysmegu. Cafwyd rhai straeon newyddion da ar yr agenda iechyd cyhoeddus o ran ysmegu. Mae nifer y bechgyn 15 i 16 oed sy'n ysmegu wedi gostwng o 21 y cant ym 1998 i 9 y cant yn 2010. Yn y cyfamser, mae ysmegu ymhlith merched yn y grŵp oedran hwnnw wedi gostwng o 29 y cant ym 1998 i 14 y cant yn 2010. Mae'r rhain yn newidiadau ystadegol da. Mae ein tair rhaglen genedlaethol i atal ysmegu wedi cynnwys dros 25,000 o bobl ifanc yn ystod y flwyddyn. Yn 2009-10, bu i bron 15,000 o bobl gysylltu â Dim Smygu Cymru, sy'n helpu pobl i roi'r gorau i ysmegu. O'r bobl a gyfranogodd yn sylweddol yn y rhaglen gefnogi, dywedodd dros 60 y cant eu bod wedi rhoi'r gorau iddi ar ôl pedair wythnos. Rwy'n credu bod hynny'n eithaf da. Yn dilyn y gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus, mae'r ymchwil yn eithaf clir, gyda thystiolaeth o fod yn agored i lai o fwg tybaco amgylcheddol, yn arbennig mewn tafarndai, clybiau, bariâu, ac yn y gwaith. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni gynnal y duedd hon tuag i lawr a chyfyngu ar y mwg ail law sydd o'n cwmpas. Bydd cynllun gweithredu rheoli tybaco'n cael ei ddatblygu erbyn diwedd 2010.

O ran yr agenda ysmegu, cafwyd rhywfaint o lwyddiant, ond bydd bob amser mwy o waith i'w wneud. Mae hynny'n fy arwain at rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth David Melding am y ffordd yr ymgyrchwn. Rwyf wedi bod yn trafod â'r prif swyddog meddygol, a'r Athro Syr Mansel Aylward yn Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru, y gwahanol ffyrdd o gyfleu negeseuon, i wneud agenda mesurau iechyd

measures and so forth more exciting, accessible and understandable. That is the task that I have now set, and work is being undertaken by my department and Public Health Wales. It is a matter of asking whether I need to consider engaging with people differently; whether I need to use different media; and whether I need to target better. In looking at some of the issues to do with teenage pregnancy, midwives have said to me, 'Why do you not send us into schools? Why don't you get us to go in to see eight or nine-year-olds to talk about any baby brothers or sisters they may have had and then repeat the discussions when they are 13 and say to girls, "If you do become pregnant, please don't carry on smoking; please eat, and please make sure that you have a healthy child"'. There are many different ways of doing things, so I take on board the points that David made.

Turning to the amendment tabled in Peter Black's name, I recognise the important contribution that local environmental health departments make to improving people's quality of health, Veronica, and to ensuring that we live in healthy environments. I fully support this role. I would not wish to determine how individual departments discharge their responsibilities, the majority of which, of course, are statutory functions, as the capacity of environmental health departments is a matter for each local authority to address. However, we shall be supporting the amendment. You went on to discuss their role and functions in certain key areas. I particularly picked up on the environmental health issues where they have statutory responsibilities, which they undertake very well.

On food safety, the First Minister announced his intention to undertake a review of food law enforcement activities in Wales in Plenary in July this year while updating Members on the Pennington report. I am pleased that the Food Standards Agency has been able to accept the First Minister's commission to undertake a food safety review in Wales. Hopefully, we will have an interim report by Christmas and a full report

ataliol ac yn y blaen yn fwy cyffrous, hygyrch a dealladwy. Honno yw'r dasg yr wyf bellach wedi'i gosod, ac mae gwaith yn cael ei wneud gan fy adran i ac Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru. Mae'n fater o ofyn a oes angen imi ystyried ymgysylltu â phobl yn wahanol; a oes angen imi ddefnyddio gwahanol gyfryngau; ac a oes angen imi dargedu'n well. Wrth edrych ar rai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â beichiogrwydd ymhlith merched yn eu harddegau, mae bydwragedd wedi dweud wrthyf, 'Pam nad ydych chi'n ein hanfon ni i ysgolion? Pam na wnewch chi'n hanfon ni i weld plant wyth neu naw oed i siarad am unrhyw frodyr neu chwiorydd bach newydd sydd ganddynt ac yna ailadrodd y trafodaethau pan fyddant yn 13 a dweud wrth ferched, "Os byddwch chi'n beichiogi, peidiwch â pharhau i ysmegu; cofiwch fwyta, a sicrhewch y cewch chi blentyn iach"'. Mae llawer o wahanol ffyrdd o wneud pethau, felly cofiaf y pwyntiau a wnaeth David.

Gan droi at y gwelliant a gyflwynwyd yn enw Peter Black, rwy'n cydnabod y cyfraniad pwysig a wna adrannau iechyd yr amgylchedd lleol at wella ansawdd iechyd pobl, Veronica, ac at sicrhau ein bod yn byw mewn amgylcheddau iachus. Rwy'n llwyr gefnogi'r rôl hon. Ni fyddwn yn dymuno pennu sut mae adrannau unigol yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau, a'r mwyafrif ohonynt, wrth reswm, yn swyddogaethau statudol, gan fod gallu adrannau iechyd yr amgylchedd yn fater i bob awdurdod lleol fynd i'r afael ag ef. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant. Aethoch ymlaen i drafod eu rôl a'u swyddogaethau mewn rhai meysydd allweddol. Sylwais yn arbennig ar y materion iechyd yr amgylchedd lle mae ganddynt gyfrifoldebau statudol, a gyflawnant yn dda iawn.

O ran diogelwch bwyd, cyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog ei fwriad i gynnal adolygiad o weithgareddau gorfodi cyfraith bwyd yng Nghymru mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Gorffennaf eleni wrth roi gwybod y diweddaraf i'r Aelodau am adroddiad Pennington. Rwy'n falch bod yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd wedi gallu derbyn comisiwn y Prif Weinidog i gynnal adolygiad o ddiogelwch bwyd yng Nghymru. Gobeithir y

at a later date. There is definitely a role there for local government. You also alluded to their wider responsibilities, particularly during periods of harsh weather and so forth, and how they monitor other premises and housing. That is very important to the overall health agenda.

A number of key issues were picked up by other speakers. I was particularly struck by the points about obesity. The obesity pathway, the national dietetic capacity grant scheme and the Change4Life campaign will hopefully start to address some of these issues. Evidence from the Forsyth report highlights that intervention must be a long-term fixture on this agenda; we cannot have short-term initiatives in this regard. The majority of our strategies targeting this area have only been in place since 2005, so we will have to see how they develop and run in the long term. There are some exceptionally negative statistics in Wales for this issue, with 22 per cent of children aged over 3 noted as being overweight, and 5 per cent recorded as being obese. Those percentages are much higher than those of England. There are issues for us to tackle in that agenda as a whole.

Many Members have picked up on the points about the role of education. I work closely with the Minister for education in looking at how we deliver this agenda in schools. It is important that we focus on it, particularly in those areas where children do not practice good habits. That brings us to issues such as nutrition, and the fact that it is fun to have certain foods, and it is fun to cook, and it is important that you learn how. The more initiatives of that nature are undertaken, the better the indications that people have better skills and better diets as a consequence. That is quite an important issue for us to develop.

I am conscious of time left in this debate, and I do not think that I will be able to get through all of the points made. However, there are a couple that I would like to address, if I may. I wish to turn to diabetes, which is one of the major issues that have

byddwn yn cael adroddiad interim erbyn y Nadolig ac adroddiad llawn yn nes ymlaen. Mae'n bendant bod rôl yno i lywodraeth leol. Crybwyllasoch hefyd eu cyfrifoldebau ehangach, yn arbennig yn ystod cyfnodau o dywydd garw ac ati, a'r ffordd y maent yn monitro safleoedd a thai eraill. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn i'r agenda iechyd cyffredinol.

Sylwyd ar nifer o faterion allweddol gan siaradwyr eraill. Fe'm tarwyd yn arbennig gan y pwyntiau am ordewdra. Bydd y llwybr gordewdra, y cynllun grant gallu deietetig cenedlaethol ac ymgyrch Newid am Oes yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r pethau hyn, gobeithio. Mae tystiolaeth o adroddiad Forsyth yn amlygu ei bod yn rhaid i ymyriad fod yn eitem tymor hir ar yr agenda hwn; ni allwn gael mentrau tymor byr yn hyn o beth. Dim ond ers 2005 y bu mwyafrif ein strategaethau sy'n targedu'r maes hwn yn eu lle, felly bydd rhaid inni weld sut byddant yn datblygu ac yn rhedeg yn y tymor hir. Mae rhai ystadegau eithriadol o negyddol yng Nghymru ar gyfer y mater hwn, gyda 22 y cant o blant dros 3 wedi'u nodi'n rhai dros eu pwysau, a 5 y cant wedi'u cofnodi'n ordew. Mae'r canrannau hynny'n llawer uwch na chanrannau Lloegr. Mae materion inni fynd i'r afael â hwy yn yr agenda hwnnw ar y cyfan.

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi sylwi ar y pwyntiau am rôl addysg. Gweithiaf yn agos gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg yn edrych ar y ffordd yr ydym yn cyflenwi'r agenda hwn mewn ysgolion. Mae'n bwysig inni ganolbwyntio arno, yn arbennig yn y meysydd hynny lle nad yw plant yn magu arferion da. Mae hynny'n ein harwain at faterion fel maeth, a'r ffaith ei bod yn hwyl cael rhai bwydydd, a'i bod yn hwyl coginio, a'i bod yn bwysig ichi ddysgu sut. Mwyaf y mentrau felly a gynhelir, gwell yr arwyddion bod pobl yn cael gwell sgiliau a gwell diet o ganlyniad. Mae hwnnw'n fater eithaf pwysig inni ei ddatblygu.

Rwy'n ymwybodol o'r amser sy'n weddill yn y ddadl hon, ac nid wyf yn credu y gallaf sôn am yr holl bwyntiau a wnaethpwyd. Fodd bynnag, mae dau yr hoffwn fynd i'r afael â hwy, os caf fi. Hoffwn droi at ddiabetes, sef un o'r prif faterion y canolbwyntiwyd arnynt

been focused on in this discussion. Obviously, Jeff and others have commented on it, and we have been working very well with Diabetes UK to develop a prevention leaflet for type 2 diabetes, entitled 'Diabetes—avoid it if you can'. There is some mythology that type 2 diabetes is not that serious, that it is something that you can deal with, and so on. We have to get the messages across about the wider issues about diabetes regarding how you deal with your diet and how you live so that, if you get diabetes, you learn to live with and manage it properly. Local health boards have established local diabetes planning and delivery groups to lead, manage and report to the LHBs and to the Assembly Government, as we must comply with the national framework by 2013. There will be structured education to promote effective self-care, which is integral to our policy as it is set out in the national service framework, and that is reinforced by NICE clinical guidelines.

It was good to have the contributions of two general practitioners on various aspects of today's debate. What is nice about debates in the Assembly is that we can draw on people's wide experiences when we discuss issues such as this. I was also pleased to see the British Medical Association's press release about this issue, which said that we should all recognise that the Government must take a wider view in the health budget and deal with the causes of ill health—which also emerged in the debate—such as poor housing, poor educational attainment, lack of job opportunities and many other determinants of health. They are all factors that contribute to and are related to ill health in Wales, which the NHS must treat. Therefore, we cannot afford to treat sickness without putting right the causes of that ill health. That has come through clearly during the debate, and I welcome the discussion that we have had on this subject—it shows us at our best.

Jonathan Morgan: I thank all those Members who contributed to what has been a constructive debate with a number of important points made. Please forgive me if I

yn y drafodaeth hon. Yn amlwg, mae Jeff ac eraill wedi sôn amdano, a buom yn gweithio'n dda iawn gyda Diabetes UK i ddatblygu taflen atal ar gyfer diabetes math 2, dan y teitl 'Diabetes—sut i'w osgoi os oes modd'. Mae rhyw fytholeg nad yw diabetes math 2 mor ddifrifol â hynny, ei fod yn rhywbeth y gallwch ymdopi ag ef, ac ati. Mae'n rhaid inni gyfleu'r negeseuon am y materion ehangach am ddiabetes ynghylch y ffordd yr ymdopwch â'ch diet a'r ffordd rydych chi'n byw fel eich bod yn dysgu, os byddwch yn cael diabetes, sut i fyw gydag ef a'i reoli'n iawn. Mae byrddau iechyd lleol wedi sefydlu grwpiau cynllunio a chyflenwi diabetes lleol i arwain, rheoli ac adrodd i'r Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ac i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac mae'n rhaid inni gydymffurfio â'r fframwaith cenedlaethol erbyn 2013. Bydd addysg strwythuredig i hyrwyddo hunanofal effeithiol, sy'n annatod i'n polisi am ei fod wedi'i osod yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, ac mae hwnnw'n cael ei atgyfnerthu gan ganllawiau clinigol NICE.

Roedd yn dda cael cyfraniadau dau feddyg teulu at agweddau amrywiol ar y ddadl heddiw. Yr hyn sy'n braf am ddadleuon yn y Cynulliad yw y gallwn ni ddefnyddio profiadau helaeth pobl wrth inni drafod materion fel hwn. Roeddwn hefyd yn falch o weld datganiad Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain i'r wasg am y mater hwn, a oedd yn dweud y dylem oll gydnabod ei bod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ystyried y gyllideb iechyd yn ehangach ac ymdrin ag achosion afiechyd—a gododd hefyd yn y ddadl—fel tai gwael, cyrhaeddiad addysgol gwael, diffyg cyfleoedd swydd a llawer o benderfynyddion iechyd eraill. Maent oll yn ffactorau sy'n cyfrannu at afiechyd yng Nghymru ac sy'n gysylltiedig ag afiechyd, y mae'n rhaid i'r GIG ei drin. Felly, ni allwn fforddio trin salwch heb unioni achosion yr afiechyd hwnnw. Mae hynny wedi bod yn amlwg yn ystod y ddadl, a chroesawaf y drafodaeth a gawsom ar y pwnc hwn—mae'n ein dangos ni ar ein gorau.

Jonathan Morgan: Diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau hynny a gyfrannodd at ddadl adeiladol gyda nifer o bwyntiau pwysig wedi'u gwneud. Maddeuwch imi os na

do not get through all of them.

David Melding mentioned some of the big societal change that we must face, and the fact that we have to get over this cultural shift to make people see their lives in a healthier way and to see exercise as part of their weekly or even daily routine. It reminded me of a brilliant article that I read a couple of years ago in *The Times*. It talked about the big shift in American attitudes towards the concept of suing the fast food giants. An American man was quoted in the article as saying that Burger King, McDonald's and KFC had ruined his life. That summed up the problem that we face, namely that some people—mostly in America—spend a lot of time visiting these fast food places. His attitude was that it was the fault of these three particular companies that he had become so overweight—he did not see it as his responsibility.

In the past 11 and a half years, we have seen a major shift in our attitude towards smoking and the damage that it does, and I was extremely proud to be part of the Assembly's consensus that brought in the ban on smoking in enclosed public places. However, beyond that major change, we have done little to address the major problems of public health. I accept that there have been smoking cessation plans and that there is more of an emphasis on dealing with obesity, but the only major thing that we have done over the past 11 and a half years is to ban smoking in enclosed public places. I am not saying that that was somehow a small thing—it was a major step for us to take—but it was the only step in a country that has one of the worst rates for obesity, problems of diabetes, smoking, consumption of alcohol, and the development of cancer and problems associated with recovering from it. In comparison with the rest of the UK and Europe, we fare very badly.

In Wales and across the United Kingdom at the moment, we are storing up a time bomb in respect of the consumption of alcohol. People in their late 20s and early 30s are

fyddaf yn sôn am bob un ohonynt.

Soniodd David Melding am rai o'r newidiadau cymdeithasol mawr y mae'n rhaid inni eu hwynebu, a'r ffaith ei bod yn rhaid inni oresgyn y newid diwylliannol hwn i wneud i bobl ystyried eu bywydau mewn modd mwy iachus ac i ystyried ymarfer yn rhan o'u trefn wythnosol neu ddyddiol hyd yn oed. Roedd yn fy atgoffa o erthygl wych a ddarllenais ddwy flynedd yn ôl yn *The Times*. Roedd yn sôn am y newid mawr yn agweddau'r Americanwyr tuag at gysyniad siwio'r cewri bwyd brys. Dyfynnwyd Americanwr yn yr erthygl yn dweud bod Burger King, Macdonalds a KFC wedi difetha ei fywyd. Roedd hynny'n crynhoi'r broblem a wynebwn, sef bod rhai pobl-yn America gan mwyaf-yn treulio llawer o amser yn ymweld â'r manau bwyd brys hyn. Yn ei farn ef, y tri chwmni arbennig hyn oedd ar fai am iddo fagu cymaint o bwysau-nid oedd yn ystyried mai ei gyfrifoldeb ef ei hun ydoedd.

Yn yr 11 mlynedd a hanner diwethaf, rydym wedi gweld newid mawr yn ein hagwedd tuag at ysmegu a'r niwed a wna, ac roeddwn yn falch dros ben o fod yn rhan o gydsyniad y Cynulliad a gyflwynodd y gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn manau cyhoeddus caeedig. Fodd bynnag, y tu hwnt i'r newid mawr hwnnw, nid ydym wedi gwneud llawer i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau mawr iechyd cyhoeddus. Derbyniaf y cafwyd cynlluniau rhoi'r gorau i ymysgu a bod mwy o bwyslais ar ymdrin â gordewdra, ond yr unig beth mawr a wnaethom dros yr 11 mlynedd a hanner diwethaf yw gwahardd ysmegu mewn manau cyhoeddus caeedig. Nid wyf yn dweud bod hwnnw rywsut yn beth bach-roedd yn gam mawr inni ei gymryd-ond hwnnw oedd yr unig gam mewn gwlad sydd ag un o'r cyfraddau gwaethaf ar gyfer gordewdra, problemau diabetes, ysmegu, yfed alcohol, a datblygu canser a phroblemau sy'n gysylltiedig â gwella ohono. O'n cymharu â gweddill y DU ac Ewrop, nid ydym yn gwneud yn dda iawn o gwbl.

Yng Nghymru a ledled y Deyrnas Unedig ar hyn o bryd, rydym yn storio bom amser o ran yfed alcohol. Mae pobl tua diwedd eu 20au a dechrau eu 30au yn datblygu canser yr afu ac

developing and dying from liver cancer. It is not just a Welsh problem—it is a problem across the UK. Nick Bourne was right when he said that we need to know where we are in dealing with this. Are we going to deal with loss leaders and minimum pricing, or are we going to have a significant shift in the powers of this institution and local authorities to better plan our town and city centres to stop the huge supply of alcohol licences that is leading to this explosion? It is that sort of debate around alcohol that we need to have.

4.40 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: For balance, on preventative health medicine, we have introduced bowel cancer screening, two-view readings for breast cancer, new ways of examining cervical cytology, and free school breakfasts. All these are big contributions to preventative health. We are leading the world in retinopathy screening.

Jonathan Morgan: I do not doubt that those are important developments, but we are not going nearly far enough with screening. We are not screening those in their 50s for bowel cancer. If you live in Scotland and are in your 50s, you will be screened for bowel cancer. We are lagging behind the rest of the UK on some of these screening issues. While we are doing the sorts of things that you talked about, Brian, we are not looking at some of the big strategic issues. We have a Licensing Act that counts against local authorities planning their towns and cities better. The fact that there is a pub in one property does not prevent the owner of a neighbouring property from applying for an alcohol licence. The supply of alcohol licences is not a reason to vote against a local authority issuing an alcohol licence. The powers in the Licensing Act are geared towards those who want a new licence or those who want an extension of an existing licence. We have a planning system that goes against healthy living and exercise. Estates the length and breadth of Wales have been developed without any thought given to open spaces for walking and cycling. That is what we must start dealing with. It is not just the smaller

yn marw ohono. Nid problem yng Nghymru yn unig mohoni—mae'n broblem ledled y DU. Roedd Nick Bourne yn llygad ei le pan ddywedodd fod angen inni wybod ble ydyn ni o ran ymdrin â hyn. A ydyn ni'n mynd i ymdrin ag arweinwyr colled a phrisiau lleiaf, neu a ydyn ni'n mynd i gael newid sylweddol ym mhwerau'r sefydliad hwn ac awdurdodau lleol i gynllunio canol ein trefi a'n dinasoedd yn well i atal y cyflenwad enfawr o drwyddedau alcohol sy'n arwain at y ffrwydrad hwn? Y math hwnnw o ddadl am alcohol y mae angen inni ei gael.

Brian Gibbons: Ar gyfer cydbwysedd, o ran meddygaeth iechyd ataliol, rydym wedi cyflwyno sgrinio canser y coluddyn, darlenniadau dau olwg ar gyfer canser y fron, ffyrdd newydd o archwilio cytolog serfigol, a brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion. Mae'r holl bethau hyn yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at iechyd ataliol. Rydym yn arwain y byd o ran sgrinio retinopat heg.

Jonathan Morgan: Rwy'n siŵr bod y rheini'n ddatblygiadau pwysig, ond nid ydym yn gwneud hanner digon gyda sgrinio. Nid ydym yn sgrinio'r rheini yn eu 50am am ganser y coluddyn. Os ydych chi'n byw yn yr Alban a chithau yn eich 50au, byddwch chi'n cael eich sgrinio am ganser y coluddyn. Rydym yn llusgo'r tu ôl i weddill y DU ar rai o'r materion sgrinio hyn. Er ein bod yn gwneud y mathau o bethau y siaradasoch amdanynt, Brian, nid ydym yn edrych ar rai o'r pethau strategol mawr. Mae gennym Ddeddf Trwyddedu sy'n cyfrif yn erbyn awdurdodau lleol yn cynllunio eu trefi a'u dinasoedd yn well. Nid yw'r ffaith bod tafarn mewn un adeilad yn atal perchennog eiddo cyfagos rhag ymgeisio am drwydded alcohol. Nid yw'r cyflenwad trwyddedau alcohol yn rheswm dros bleidleisio yn erbyn awdurdod lleol yn cyhoeddi trwydded alcohol. Mae'r pwerau yn y Ddeddf Trwyddedu wedi'u targedu at y rheini sydd am drwydded newydd neu'r rheini sydd am estyn trwydded bresennol. Mae gennym system gynllunio sy'n mynd yn groes i fyw'n iach ac ymarfer. Datblygwyd ystadau ar hyd a lled Cymru heb ystyried manau agored i gerdded a beicio o gwbl. Mae'n rhaid inni ddechrau ymdrin â

aspects of Government policy; big strategic changes are required.

It is about the need, after what I hope will be a successful referendum in March, to introduce new public health legislation. If you look at any of the major western European countries that have tackled public health in a meaningful way, you will see that they have used legislation to achieve that, but they have done it in a co-ordinated way. That is the problem. We have a health department that is desperately trying to address public health issues and, sadly, on all the major key indicators, not having much success in reversing our problems. However, we need this to happen across the Assembly Government departments. We cannot just say that it is down to poverty and economic performance. The fact of the matter is that when Blair was Prime Minister, between 1997 and 2006, we had unprecedented increases in economic growth, yet we saw no marked improvement in the public health of the people of this country. It is not just about poverty and housing, however important they are. You cannot say that it is down to that and nothing else. It is down to Government intervention and to the Government taking a strategic approach to dealing with this important matter, because if we do not start dealing with diabetes, obesity, smoking rates, drinking rates and the problems that many of our young children face now, the national health service of 10, 20 or 30 years' time will be unable to cope.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is that the motion be agreed without amendment. Is there any objection? I see that there is. Therefore, voting under this item will be deferred until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

hynny. Nid yr agweddau llai ar bolisi Llywodraeth yn unig sy'n bwysig; mae newidiadau strategol mawr yn ofynnol.

Mae'n ymwneud â'r angen, ar ôl yr hyn y gobeithiaf y bydd yn refferendwm llwyddiannus ym mis Mawrth, i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth iechyd cyhoeddus newydd. Os edrychwch ar unrhyw un o'r prif wledydd yng ngorllewin Ewrop sydd wedi mynd i'r afael ag iechyd cyhoeddus mewn modd ystyrllon, gwelwch eu bod wedi defnyddio deddfwriaeth i wneud hynny, ond eu bod wedi'i wneud mewn modd cydgyssylltiedig. Honno yw'r broblem. Mae gennym adran iechyd sy'n ceisio'n enbyd mynd i'r afael â materion iechyd cyhoeddus ac, yn anffodus, mewn perthynas â'r holl ddangosyddion allweddol pwysig, nid yw'n llwyddo rhyw lawer i wrthdroi ein problemau. Fodd bynnag, mae angen arnom i hyn ddigwydd ar draws adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ni allwn ddweud yn unig mai tloidi a pherfformiad economaidd sydd ar fai. Y gwirionedd yw, pan oedd Tony Blair yn Brif Weinidog rhwng 1997 a 2006, cawsom gynydd digysail mewn twf economaidd ond eto ni welsom ddim gwelliant amlwg yn iechyd cyhoeddus pobl y wlad hon. Nid yw'n ymwneud â thloidi a thai yn unig, ni waeth pa mor bwysig ydyn nhw. Ni allwch ddweud mai hynny yw'r broblem a dim byd arall. Mae'n ymwneud ag ymyriad y Llywodraeth a'r Llywodraeth yn mabwysiadu dull strategol o ymdrin â'r mater pwysig hwn, oherwydd os na ddechreuwn ymdrin â diabetes, gordewdra, cyfraddau ysmegu, cyfraddau yfed a'r problemau y mae llawer o'n pobl ifanc yn eu hwynebu yn awr, ni fydd y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn gallu ymdopi ymhen 10, 20 neu 30 mlynedd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Y cynnig yw cytuno ar y cynnig heb welliant. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, bydd y pleidleisiau o dan yr eitem hon yn cael ei ohirio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

**Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru
Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate**

Glastir

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: The Presiding Officer has selected amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt and amendment 2 in the name of Nick Ramsay.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Mae'r Llywydd wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt a gwelliant 2 yn enw Nick Ramsay.

Cynnig NDM4590 Peter Black

Motion NDM4590 Peter Black

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

The National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn mynegi pryder y gallai cyflwyno Glastir arwain at golli parhad gwelliannau amaeth-amgylcheddol a gyflawnwyd gan y cynlluniau Tir Gofal a Tir Cynnal;

1. Expresses concern that the continuity of agri-environmental improvements delivered by the Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal schemes could be lost under the introduction of Glastir;

2. Yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd Tir Mynydd wrth gynnal hyfywedd ffermio mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol ac yn mynegi pryder am yr effaith y byddai colli taliadau Tir Mynydd yn ei chael ar ffermwyr sy'n gweithio yn yr ardaloedd hyn;

2. Acknowledges the importance of Tir Mynydd in maintaining the viability of farming in less-favoured areas and expresses concern that the loss of Tir Mynydd payments will have a negative effect on farmers who operate in these areas;

3. Yn nodi mai'r unig ffordd y cyflawnir y gwelliannau amgylcheddol y mae'r llywodraeth yn dymuno'u cyflawni drwy Glastir yw os yw'r cynllun yn ddeniadol i dirfeddianwyr a bod ffermwyr yn gallu cymryd rhan ynddo; ac

3. Notes that the environmental improvements that the government seeks to deliver through Glastir will only be delivered if the scheme is attractive to land owners, and farmers are able to participate; and

4. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

4. Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

a) ohirio'r dyddiad y bydd Glastir yn dod i rym;

a) delay the implementation date of Glastir;

b) adolygu'r meini prawf ar gyfer gwneud cais a chreu ail gylch o geisiadau fel bo mwy o ffermwyr yn gallu manteisio ar y cynllun; ac

b) revise the application criteria and establish a second round of applications to enable more farmers to benefit from the scheme; and

c) pennu targed ar gyfer nifer y ffermwyr sy'n ymuno â'r cynllun.

c) establish a target for the number of farmers to join the scheme.

Kirsty Williams: I move the motion.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiaf y cynnig.

I begin by saying that we will support the Conservatives' amendment to our motion, amendment 2. I assume that all those Members who are interested enough to stay

Dechreuaf drwy ddweud y byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr i'n cynnig ni, sef gwelliant 2. Cymeraf nad oes angen imi egluro dryswch system Glastir i'r holl

in the Chamber do not need me to spell out to them the intricacies of the Glastir system. I am sure that all Members here are perfectly aware what the proposals are and will understand that they mean a fundamental shake-up in the agri-environment support scheme that we currently have in Wales, and in support for upland farmers in particular.

We have a proud tradition in Wales of developing and implementing cutting-edge agri-environment schemes, and an understanding of the necessity of supporting communities in areas where it is particularly challenging to farm. We should be rightly proud of the work that has gone on in recent years, most recently under the Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal schemes, which has demonstrated a willingness on the part of the farming industry to engage in this particular area and a willingness from this National Assembly, and from Welsh Assembly Governments of a variety of descriptions, to support them in that. The number of farmers who have participated in these schemes has gradually grown. Indeed, in the case of Tir Gofal, people have been on a waiting list to get into that scheme. I genuinely believe that the proposals under Glastir that are now being put before us put at risk the tremendous work and efforts that have gone on in this area. We must take the time to take stock and adjust what the Welsh Assembly Government is intending to do.

I guess that the fairest way to judge the Glastir scheme is to examine it by the Government's own stated objectives. They have been given here on numerous occasions by the Minister, and echoed by her officials in the events that they have been holding the length and breadth of Wales when presenting the scheme to farmers—most recently, here in the Assembly this morning. I am grateful to the Minister for making her officials available to brief Members in that way.

The first rationale behind the introduction of the new Glastir scheme is that the Government claims that the schemes as they are currently constituted do not meet the future challenges of climate change and a whole raft of environmental factors that have

Aelodau hynny sydd â digon o ddi-ddordeb i aros yn y Siambr. Rwy'n siŵr bod pob Aelod yma'n gwybod yn iawn beth yw'r cynigion ac y bydd yn deall eu bod yn golygu addrefnu sylfaenol yn y cynllun cefnogi amaeth-amgylchedd sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru, ac yn y cymorth i ffermwyr mynydd.

Mae gennym draddodiad balch yng Nghymru o ddatblygu a gweithredu'r cynlluniau amaethyddol mwyaf arloesol, ac rydym yn deall bod angen cefnogi cymunedau mewn ardaloedd lle mae ffermio'n arbennig o heriol. Dylem ymfalchïo'n haeddiannol yn y gwaith sydd wedi digwydd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac yn ddiweddaraf o dan gynllun Tir Gofal a chynllun Tir Cynnal, sydd wedi arddangos parodrwydd ar ran y diwydiant ffermio i ymgymryd â'r maes arbennig hwn a pharodrwydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn, a chan Lywodraethau Cynulliad Cymru o amryw ddisgrifiadau, i'w cefnogi yn hynny o beth. Mae nifer y ffermwyr sydd wedi cyfranogi yn y cynlluniau hyn wedi tyfu'n raddol. Yn wir, yn achos Tir Gofal, bu pobl ar restr aros i gael i mewn i'r cynllun hwnnw. Credaf yn ddiffuant fod y cynigion o dan system Glastir sy'n cael eu cyflwyno inni yn awr yn peryglu'r gwaith a'r ymdrechion aruthrol a gafwyd yn y maes hwn. Mae'n rhaid inni gymryd yr amser i ailedrych ar bethau ac addasu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n bwriadu ei wneud.

Tybiaf mai'r ffordd decaf o feirniadu cynllun Glastir yw ei archwilio yn ôl yr amcanion a ddatganodd y Llywodraeth ei hun. Fe'u rhoddwyd yma ar nifer o achlysuron gan y Gweinidog, ac fe'u hatseiniwyd gan ei swyddogion yn y digwyddiadau y buont yn eu cynnal ar hyd a lled Cymru wrth gyflwyno'r cynllun i ffermwyr—yn ddiweddaraf, yma yn y Cynlluniad y bore yma. Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am wneud ei swyddogion ar gael i roi gwybodaeth i'r Aelodau yn y ffordd honno.

Y sail resymegol gyntaf i gyflwyno cynllun newydd Glastir yw bod y Llywodraeth yn honni nad yw'r cynlluniau fel y'u cyfansoddwyd ar hyn o bryd yn ateb heriau newid hinsawdd yn y dyfodol ac mae archwiliad iechyd y PAC wedi amlygu lluo o

been brought to the Government's attention by the CAP health check. I would argue that, while the linkages may not be clearly delineated, or specifically spelled out, only those who know very little about farming would argue that the current activities under those schemes—indeed, general farming activities—do not go some way towards contributing to that particular agenda. I have seen the presentation slides and the lovely, colourful flowchart that tests each of the current support schemes against these environmental goals, and scores them with a 'yes' or a 'no' according to whether that scheme is specifically aimed at addressing those issues. I have heard that flowchart described as a seminal piece of work in identifying which parts of Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal meet these wider agricultural and environmental goals. I would not describe it as seminal; I would describe it as simplistic, because anyone who knows anything about the industry appreciates that the work going on under these schemes contributes to issues around water management and carbon capture. That is happening at the moment; it might not be directly stated in the agreements between farmers and the Government, or in the actual policy, but in reality, on the ground, that is what is happening.

Even if it were the case that there was a mismatch between what we are currently doing and the current environmental challenges, it begs the question as to why the current schemes cannot be adjusted rather than us having to go through a wholesale scrapping and reorganisation. One has to wonder how the Government can even make these claims, because it has admitted that there was no baseline assessment of the state of biodiversity or environmental issues on farms before they entered into Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal agreements. Therefore, the Government cannot calculate what difference and what benefits the payments under those systems have brought. To say that those schemes do not align with stated goals simply defies belief, given that the Government itself admits that it has no baseline and it has not been monitoring outcomes carefully.

ffactorau amgylcheddol i'r Llywodraeth. Er nad yw'r dolenni efallai wedi'u darlunio'n amlwg, na'u hamlygu'n benodol, byddwn yn dadlau mai dim ond y rheini sy'n gwybod ychydig iawn am ffermio a fyddai'n dadlau nad yw'r gweithgareddau cyfredol o dan y cynlluniau hynny-yn wir, gweithgareddau ffermio cyffredinol-yn gwneud rhywfaint tuag at gyfrannu at yr agenda arbennig hwnnw. Rwyf wedi gweld y sleidiau cyflwyniad a'r siart llif lliwgar, hyfryd sy'n profi pob un o'r cynlluniau cymorth cyfredol mewn perthynas â'r nodau amgylcheddol hyn, ac yn eu sgorio ag 'ie' neu 'na' yn ôl barnu a ydy'r cynllun wedi'i anelu'n benodol at fynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Rwyf wedi clywed y siart llif hwnnw'n cael ei ddisgrifio fel darn o waith arloesol o ran adnabod pa rannau o gynllun Tir Gofal a chynllun Tir Cynnal sy'n bodloni'r nodau amgylcheddol ac amaethyddol ehangach hyn. Ni fyddwn yn ei ddisgrifio'n rhywbeth arloesol: byddwn yn ei ddisgrifio'n rhywbeth gor-syml, gan fod unrhyw un sy'n gwybod unrhyw beth am y diwydiant yn gwerthfawrogi bod y gwaith a wneir yn y cynlluniau hyn yn cyfrannu at faterion rheoli dŵr a dal carbon. Mae hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd: efallai nad yw wedi'i nodi'n uniongyrchol yn y cytundebau rhwng ffermwyr a'r Llywodraeth, nac yn y polisi gwirioneddol, ond mewn gwirionedd, ar lawr gwlad, hynny sy'n digwydd.

Hyd yn oed pe byddai'n wir bod bwch rhwng yr hyn a wnawn ar hyn o bryd a'r heriau amgylcheddol cyfredol, mae'n peri'r cwestiwn pam nad ellir addasu'r cynlluniau cyfredol yn hytrach na ninnau'n gorfod rhoi'r gorau i'r cyfan a'i ad-drefnu. Mae'n rhaid i rywun feddwl tybed sut gall y Llywodraeth wneud yr honiadau hyn hyd yn oed, oherwydd mae wedi cyfaddef nad oedd unrhyw asesiad cychwynnol o gyflwr materion bioamrywiaeth neu amgylcheddol ar ffermydd cyn iddynt ymrwymo i gytundebau cynllun Tir Gofal a chynllun Tir Cynnal. Felly, ni all y Llywodraeth gyfrifo pa wahaniaeth a pha fuddion a achoswyd gan y taliadau o dan y systemau hynny. Ni ellir credu nad yw'r cynlluniau hynny'n cyd-fynd â nodau a ddatganwyd, o ystyried bod y Llywodraeth ei hun yn cyfaddef nad oes ganddi ddim gwaelodlin ac na fu'n monitro'r

That brings us to the second of the Government's stated desires for the Glastir scheme. The Government says that it is to be an outcome-focused agri-environment scheme, although there is little detail to explain what outcomes the Government hopes to deliver—there is no detail about that. A lot of hope is being placed on Glastir. Week after week, I sit on the Sustainability Committee and listen to environmental bodies and campaigning organisations saying that it does not matter about various current problems, because they will all be solved by Glastir. It does not matter that we failed on this particular aspect, they say, because Glastir will solve the problem. The issue is that those outcomes will only be achieved if farmers enter into this scheme.

4.50 p.m.

Anecdotal evidence to date suggests that they are not coming forward in large enough numbers for it to be the instrument of change that so many people want it to be. The ultimate outcome by which we can judge Glastir is the number of farmers that the Minister expects to enter into the scheme, and, up until this point, the Minister has not been willing to state a target, which is an issue that my colleagues want to talk about later, and she is not willing, with less than a week to go, to state how many applications have been received to date.

The third reason that we need a Glastir scheme, we are told, is that we need an environmental scheme that is open to all, in a way that current schemes are not. That is technically true of Glastir, and that is an improvement, particularly for those in the dairy sector. Technically, this scheme is open to all. However, the complexity of its prescriptions and the high number of points needed to qualify for this scheme mean that, in reality, the scheme is far from open to all. You can apply, but it is by no means certain that you will get into the scheme, even if you wish to participate. The Minister knows that,

canlyniadau'n ofalus.

Mae hynny'n ein harwain at yr ail ddymuniad a nodwyd gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer cynllun Glastir. Dywed y Llywodraeth ei bod yn rhaid iddo fod yn gynllun amaeth-amgylchedd sy'n canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau, er nad oes llawer o fanylion i egluro pa ganlyniadau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gobeithio eu cyflawni—nid oes manylion o gwbl am hynny. Mae llawer o obaith yn cael ei osod ar gynllun Glastir. Y naill wythnos ar ôl y llall, eisteddaf ar y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd a gwrandawaf ar gyrff amgylcheddol a chymdeithasau ymgyrchu'n dweud nad oes gwahaniaeth am broblemau cyfredol amrywiol, oherwydd bydd Glastir yn eu datrys i gyd. Nid oes gwahaniaeth ein bod wedi methu ar yr agwedd arbennig hon, dywedant, oherwydd bydd Glastir yn datrys y broblem. Ond ni fydd y canlyniadau hynny'n cael eu cyflawni heblaw bod ffermwyr yn ymuno â'r cynllun hwn.

Mae tystiolaeth storiol hyd yma'n awgrymu nad ydynt yn cyflwyno eu hunain mewn niferoedd digon mawr iddo achosi'r newid y mae cynifer o bobl am iddo ei achosi. Y canlyniad eithaf y gallwn ei ddefnyddio i feirniadu Glastir yw nifer y ffermwyr y mae'r Gweinidog yn disgwyl iddynt ymuno â'r cynllun a, hyd yma, ni fu'r Gweinidog yn fodlon nodi targed, sy'n fater y mae fy nghyd-weinidogion am siarad amdano'n nes ymlaen, ac nid yw'n fodlon dweud, a llai nag wythnos i fynd, sawl cais a gafwyd hyd yma.

Y trydydd rheswm y mae angen cynllun Glastir arnom, mae'n debyg, yw bod angen cynllun amgylcheddol arnom sy'n agored i bawb, mewn ffordd nad yw'r cynlluniau cyfredol. Mae hynny'n dechnegol wir am gynllun Glastir, ac mae hynny'n welliant, yn arbennig i'r rheini yn y sector godro. Yn dechnegol, mae'r cynllun hwn ar agor i bawb. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd cymhlethdod ei gyfarwydddebau a nifer uchel y pwyntiau sydd eu hangen i fod yn gymwys am y cynllun hwn, a dweud y gwir, mae'r cynllun yn bell o fod ar agor i bawb. Gallwch ymgeisio, ond nid ydych yn sicr o gwbl o

and her own pilot programmes demonstrated that only 50 per cent of the farms in the pilot programmes actually accrued enough points to be able to successfully enter the scheme. Therefore, the issue is that the way that the prescriptions are currently drawn and the high number of points needed mean that many farmers will simply not be able to access the scheme, even if they want to.

Take the case of some farmers in my constituency who only this week, as they prepared to fill in their Glastir application forms, received new Glastir maps, only to find that large parts of their holdings had suddenly been allocated under a protection 6 zone, which means that significant parts of their farms are no longer applicable to large sections of the Glastir prescriptions. They had thought that they would have enough points to enter the scheme, but it turns out that they are no longer able to do so. Therefore, it is disingenuous for the Minister to say that this scheme is open to all. It is simply not true. She knows that farmers, even if they want to, will not necessarily get into the scheme because of the prescriptions.

The final reason why the Minister says that we need this new system is because she wants to bring in a simpler and less bureaucratic system for farmers. I could not agree more with that, however, I do not agree with the suggestion that Glastir is simple and less bureaucratic—you only have to see the packs that have arrived for farmers. While those documents, in some ways, are simple, they are also downright insulting to some people. A classic example is the pencil drawing with a caption underneath stating, 'An example of rubbish'. That example is second only to the pencil drawing of a bat box, with a title underneath stating, 'A bat box'. I suggest that most people in the farming industry know what farm rubbish looks like and what a bat box looks like. The booklets and the forms swing from one extreme to the other, from being downright insulting on one hand to being simply

gael eich derbyn i'r cynllun, hyd yn oed os ydych yn dymuno cyfranogi. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod hynny, ac roedd ei rhaglenni peilot ei hun yn dangos mai dim ond 50 y cant o'r ffermydd yn y rhaglenni peilot a gronnodd ddigon o bwyntiau mewn gwirionedd i allu ymuno â'r cynllun yn llwyddiannus. Felly, y mater yw'r ffordd y mae'r cyfarwydddebau'n cael eu llunio ar hyn o bryd ac mae'r ffaith bod angen cynifer o bwyntiau'n golygu na fydd llawer o ffermwyr yn gallu cael at y cynllun o gwbl, hyd yn oed petaent am wneud hynny.

Ystyriwch achos rhai ffermwyr yn fy etholaeth i; yr wythnos yma, wrth iddynt baratoi at lenwi eu ffurflenni cais Glastir, cawsant fapiau Glastir newydd, i weld bod rhannau mawr o'u daliad wedi cael eu dyrannu'n sydyn o dan Barth gwarchod 6, sy'n golygu bod rhannau sylweddol o'u ffermydd yn anghymwys bellach i rannau mawr o gyfarwydddebau Glastir. Roeddent wedi meddwl y byddai ganddynt ddigon o bwyntiau i ymuno â'r cynllun ond, fel mae'n digwydd, ni allant wneud hynny rhagor. Felly, mae'n annidwyll i'r Gweinidog ddweud bod y cynllun hwn ar agor i bawb. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae'n gwybod na fydd ffermwyr yn gallu ymuno â'r cynllun o reidrwydd oherwydd y cyfarwydddebau, hyd yn oed petaent yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

Y rheswm olaf pam y mae angen y system newydd hon arnom, yn ôl y Gweinidog, yw am ei bod hi am gyflwyno system symlach a llai biwrocratig i ffermwyr. Ni allwn gytuno mwy â hynny, ond, nid wyf yn cytuno â'r awgrym bod Glastir yn syml ac yn llai biwrocratig—y cyfan mae'n rhaid ichi ei weld yw'r pecynnau sydd wedi cyrraedd i'r ffermwyr. Er bod y dogfennau hynny'n syml, mewn rhai ffyrdd, maent hefyd yn gwbl sarhaus i rai pobl. Un enghraifft nodweddiadol yw'r lluniad pensil gyda phennawd oddi tano yn dweud, 'Enghraifft o sbwriel'. Ni ddaw'r enghraifft honno'n ail ond i'r lluniad pensil o flwch ystlumod, a theitl oddi tano'n dweud 'Blwch ystlumod'. Awgrymaf fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn y diwydiant ffermio'n gwybod sut olwg sydd ar sbwriel fferm a sut olwg sydd ar flwch ystlumod. Mae'r llyfrynnau a'r ffurflenni'n symud rhwng y naill ben a'r llall, o fod yn

impenetrable on the other. It does not make sense. The way that some of the prescriptions have been described in the guidance is simply nonsensical. Farmers are having great difficulty in identifying how they can maximise their points to enter this scheme and there is simply not enough support available from people who supposedly know how to fill in these forms for them to be able to do so.

I acknowledge that the Minister has made some provisions for people to be able to carry over their Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal arrangements, which I welcome very much. That demonstrates that the Minister is willing to listen on occasion to the concerns of the farming industry. However, she knows that there is a huge amount of disquiet currently as we approach this crucial deadline.

I will leave it at that, even though I have not even begun to go into the issue of income loss and the effect that that will have on maintaining farming families in the uplands, or the complexities of people being able to exercise their rights to graze their animals on common land, and whether they can access Glastir through that commons element.

Gwelliant 1 Jane Hutt

Dileu popeth a rhoi yn ei le:

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. Yn cydnabod yr hyn sydd wedi'i gyflawni gan y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol presennol;

2. Yn nodi nad yw'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol presennol yn mynd i'r afael â'r heriau yn y dyfodol o ran y newid yn yr hinsawdd, dal carbon a rheoli dŵr, fel y nodir yn Archwiliad Iechyd y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin ac nad oeddent wedi'u cynllunio i fynd i'r afael â hwy;

3. Yn nodi na fydd Glastir yn llawn weithredol tan 2014 ac yn croesawu'r trefniadau trosiannol a roddwyd yn eu lle ar gyfer Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal a Thir Mynydd ar gyfer 2012 a 2013.

gwbl sarhaus ar y naill law i fod yn gwbl astrus ar y llall. Nid yw'n ddealladwy. Mae'r ffordd y mae rhai o'r cyfarwydddebau wedi'u disgrifio yn y canllaw yn nonsens llwyr. Mae ffermwyr yn ei chael yn anodd iawn adnabod sut gallant wneud y mwyaf o'u pwyntiau i ymuno â'r cynllun hwn ac nid oes digon o gymorth ar gael gan bobl sy'n gwybod, mae'n debyg, sut i lenwi'r ffurflenni hyn er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud hynny.

Rwy'n cydnabod bod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud rhai darpariaethau i bobl allu cario drosodd eu trefniadau o gynllun Tir Gofal a chynllun Tir Cynnal, a chroesawaf hynny'n fawr iawn. Mae hynny'n arddangos bod y Gweinidog yn fodlon gwrando weithiau ar bryderon y diwydiant ffermio. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gwybod bod llawer iawn o anesmwythyd ar hyn o bryd wrth inni nesáu at y terfyn amser allweddol hwn.

Ni ddywedaf ragor, er nad wyf wedi dechrau sôn hyd yn oed am golli incwm a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar gynnal teuluoedd ffermio yn y mynyddoedd, neu gymhlethdodau pobl yn gallu arfer eu hawliau i bori eu hanifeiliaid ar dir comin, ac a allant gael at gynllun Glastir drwy'r elfen honno o dir comin.

Amendment 1 Jane Hutt

Delete all and replace with:

The National Assembly for Wales:

1. Acknowledges the achievements of the current agri-environmental schemes;

2. Notes that the existing agri-environmental schemes do not and were not designed to meet the future challenges of climate change, carbon capture and water management, as set out in the Common Agricultural Policy Health check;

3. Notes that Glastir will not be fully up and running until 2014 and welcomes the transitional arrangements put in place for Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal and Tir Mynydd for 2012 and 2013.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Cynigaf welliant 1.

Gwelliant 2 Nick Ramsay

Cynnwys pwynt 4 newydd ac ail-rifo:

Yn cydnabod y perygl os na fydd llawer yn cymryd rhan yn Glastir y gallai hynny arwain at anghofio am dir yr ucheldir ac y bydd hynny'n arwain at effaith gymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol niweidiol.

Nick Ramsay: I move amendment 2.

Kirsty, the pictures of the bat box might well have been lost on some of the farmers, but I certainly appreciated them as I waded through some of the documents. As the Minister will know from my somewhat extensive discussions with her, I have sometimes found the whole Glastir system difficult to get to grips with, as a lay person in relation to farming. I think that I am acquiring some understanding of it. It is complicated, and so it is not surprising that there have been concerns, but I hope that the debate and the Minister's response to it will alleviate those concerns and will ultimately result in a system with which everyone is happy. We are happy to support all four points of the Liberal Democrats' motion.

There is, clearly, deep concern among farmers and environmental groups about whether Glastir is yet fit for purpose and whether it will be attractive enough to result in the participation that it needs in order to deliver on the Assembly Government's objectives. The loss of family farms, as we all know too well, risks doing irreparable damage to the rural and often Welsh-speaking communities of Wales, and I hope that the Assembly Government will at least recognise that point, and in so doing support amendment 2.

Following on from Kirsty Williams's opening remarks, it is hard to escape the conclusion that, in some key respects, Glastir has been rushed. In speaking in the debate, I do not want to cast a shadow across it in its

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): I move amendment 1.

Amendment 2 Nick Ramsay

Insert as new point 4 and renumber:

Recognises the risk that low participation in Glastir will lead to land abandonment in the uplands and the detrimental social and environmental impact this will have.

Nick Ramsay: Cynigaf welliant 2.

Kirsty, mae'n ddigon posibl bod y lluniau o'r blwch ystumod yn ddibwys i rai o'r ffermwyr, ond roeddwn innau'n bendant yn eu gwerthfawrogi wrth imi straffaglu trwy rai o'r dogfennau. Fel y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei wybod o'm trafodaethau eithaf helaeth â hi, rwyf wedi cael system gyfan Glastir yn anodd mynd i'r afael â hi weithiau, fel person llewg mewn perthynas â ffermio. Rwy'n credu fy mod i'n dechrau deall rhywfaint ohoni. Mae'n gymhleth, ac felly nid yw'n syndod y bu pryderon, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y ddadl ac ymateb y Gweinidog iddi'n lliniaru'r pryderon hynny ac yn arwain yn y pen draw at system y mae pawb yn fodlon arni. Rydym yn fodlon cefnogi pob un o bedwar pwynt cynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Yn amlwg, pryderir yn ddwfn ymhlith ffermwyr a grwpiau amgylcheddol a ydy Glastir yn addas eto at ddiben ac a fydd yn ddigon deniadol i arwain at y cyfranogiad sydd ei angen arno er mwyn cyflawni amcanion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae colli ffermydd teuluol, fel y gwyddom oll yn rhy dda, yn peryglu gwneud niwed anadferadwy yng nghymunedau gwledig Cymru, sy'n rhai Cymraeg yn aml, a gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod hynny o leiaf, ac wrth wneud hynny'n cefnogi gwelliant 2.

Gan ddilyn sylwadau agoriadol Kirsty Williams, mae'n anodd dianc rhag y casgliad bod Glastir, mewn rhai ffyrdd allweddol, wedi'i frysio. Wrth siarad yn y ddadl, nid wyf am fwrw cysgod arni'n gyfan gwbl; gwn fod

entirety; I know that Glastir has, in many ways, been governed by elements that are out of our control that result from European legislation. Nonetheless, my discussions with the Minister and with farmers have suggested that, to date, it has been rushed, and that too little attention has been paid to the practical implications on the ground. At the moment, entry into the scheme is simply not an attractive proposition for many farmers. Indeed, there are some instances where the incentives in Glastir are so poor that the only way for farmers to survive—many of whom have carried out considerable environmental works through the previous agri-environment schemes—will be to increase production, which will inevitably bring additional pressures to bear on the environment.

Amendment 2 refers to the uplands. The loss of Tir Mynydd and the failure of Glastir to make up the shortfall, despite the 20 per cent premium, as well as the absence of a distinction between severely disadvantaged and disadvantaged areas, will be a major blow to those who farm there. Add to that the complexities of bringing common land into Glastir and there is a real risk that the end result will be the abandonment of large areas of land, which has the potential to do lasting damage to the environment and to the members of the communities who live there.

As I say, my contribution is not all negative. The aim of Glastir was laudable: to have a scheme that was accessible to all, and that delivered measurable improvements to the environment were all aspects that should be welcomed. Sadly, for all the Minister's hard work in this area, in altering some of the most impractical prescriptions, extending the deadline for applications, holding surgeries the length and breadth of Wales and lengthening the opening hours of the divisional offices, the fact remains that we feel that the Government has ignored the voice of agriculture to too great an extent, which has all but begged her to reconsider the introduction of Glastir, given that its shortcomings are so considerable. We do not feel that it is fit for the purpose for which it was intended, and as long as that remains the case, it will struggle to achieve the participation needed to maintain the

Glastir, mewn llawer ffordd, wedi'i lywodraethu gan elfennau sydd y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth o ganlyniad i ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd. Serch hynny, mae fy nhrafodaethau â'r Gweinidog a ffermwyr wedi awgrymu ei bod wedi'i brysio, hyd yma, ac nad oes digon o sylw wedi'i roi i'r goblygiadau ymarferol ar lawr gwlad. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw ymuno â'r cynllun yn gynnig deniadol i lawer o ffermwyr o gwbl. Yn wir, mewn rhai achosion mae'r cymhellion yn nghynllun Glastir mor wan mai'r unig ffordd i ffermwyr oroesi—a llawer ohonynt wedi gwneud gwaith amgylcheddol sylweddol drwy'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd blaenorol—fydd cynhyrchu mwy, a fydd yn anochel yn gosod pwysau ychwanegol ar yr amgylchedd.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn cyfeirio at yr ucheldir. Mae colli Tir Mynydd a methiant Glastir â gwneud iawn am y diffyg, er gwaethaf y premiwm 20 y cant, yn ogystal ag absenoldeb gwahaniaeth rhwng ardaloedd dan anfantais fawr ac ardaloedd dan anfantais, yn ergyd difrifol i'r rheini sy'n ffermio yno. Ychwanegwch at hynny gymhlethdodau cyflwyno tir comin i gynllun Glastir ac mae gwir berygl mai'r canlyniad yn y pen draw fydd gadael ardaloedd mawr o dir, a gallai hynny wneud niwed parhaol i'r amgylchedd ac i aelodau'r cymunedau sy'n byw yno.

Fel y dywedaf, nid yw fy nghyfraniad yn negyddol i gyd. Roedd nod Glastir yn ganmoladwy: dylid croesawu cynllun a oedd yn hygyrch i bawb, ac a gyflawnodd welliannau mesuradwy yn yr amgylchedd. Yn anffodus, am holl waith caled y Gweinidog yn y maes hwn, wrth addasu rhai o'r cyfarwyddebau mwyaf anymarferol, estyn y terfyn amser i geisiadau, cynnal cymorthfeydd ar hyd a lled Cymru ac estyn oriau agor y swyddfeydd adrannol, mae'n wir o hyd ein bod yn teimlo bod y Llywodraeth wedi anwybyddu llais amaethyddiaeth i raddau rhy helaeth, sydd wedi gwneud popeth ond ymbil arni i ailystyried cyflwyno Glastir, o ystyried bod ei ddiffygion mor sylweddol. Nid wyf yn teimlo ei fod yn addas at y diben y'i bwriadwyd ato, a chyhyd â bod hynny'n wir, bydd yn trafferthu i gyflawni'r cyfranogiad sydd ei angen i gynnal cyflwr cynefinoedd a'r amgylchedd, heb sôn am eu

condition of habitats and the environment, let alone improve them, as everyone here would want it to do.

We feel that, in this light, it would be prudent for the Minister to delay the introduction of Glastir. The deadline will fall later in November—I think that it will be 22 November—and that is why this debate is timely. To conclude, it would be prudent for you to delay Glastir, Minister, because the flaws in the application criteria that have discouraged so many landowners from applying need to be put right and we need to ensure that farming communities and landowners in some of the most challenging and isolated areas of the uplands have a viable future.

5.00 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: In case anyone who might be watching does not understand what the debate is about, Glastir is the scheme that will replace Tir Gofal, Tir Cynnal, Tir Mynydd, the organic farming scheme and the organic farming conversion scheme. It does not actually replace the single payment scheme, but it is designed to cover the costs incurred for the income forgone as a consequence of farmers delivering environmental outcomes on behalf of the taxpayer. It is made up of several elements. The points threshold that our leader mentioned earlier is set at 28 points per hectare of eligible land. The point that I would like to make, which I believe has a particular resonance in north Wales, is that the changes made that relate to farmers in the uplands in less favoured areas will be huge, and in a negative way. I will come on to that in a minute.

These farmers have traditionally benefited from the Tir Mynydd scheme, which has encouraged them to undertake invaluable agri-environment work in areas of Wales that are very difficult to farm and to cultivate the more low-lying areas of the country. In fact, Tir Mynydd has been an important element in making farming in these areas viable in the first place. The National Farmers Union Cymru and the Farmers Union of Wales have

gwella, fel y byddai pawb yma'n dymuno iddo ei wneud.

Teimlwn, yng ngoleuni hyn, y byddai'n ddoeth i'r Gweinidog ohirio cyflwyno Glastir. Bydd y terfyn amser yn ddiweddarach ym mis Tachwedd—rwy'n credu mai 22 Tachwedd—a dyna pam mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol. I gloi, byddai'n ddoeth ichi oedi Glastir, Weinidog, oherwydd mae angen unioni'r diffygion yn y meini prawf ymgeisio sydd wedi annog cynifer o dirfeddianwyr i beidio ag ymgeisio ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod dyfodol hyfyw gan gymunedau ffermio a thirfeddianwyr yn rhai o'r ardaloedd mwyaf heriol ac anghysbell o'r ucheldir.

Eleanor Burnham: Rhag ofn bod unrhyw un sy'n gwyllo nad yw'n deall yr hyn y mae'r ddadl yn ei drafod, Glastir yw'r cynllun a fydd yn disodli Tir Gofal, Tir Cynnal, Tir Mynydd, y cynllun ffermio organig a'r cynllun troi at ffermio organig. Nid yw'n disodli cynllun y taliad sengl fel y cyfryw, ond fe'i cynlluniwyd i dalu'r costau yr aethpwyd iddynt am yr incwm a hepgorwyd am fod ffermwyr yn cyflenwi canlyniadau amgylcheddol ar ran y trethdalwr. Mae'n cynnwys nifer o elfennau. Mae'r trothwy pwyntiau y soniodd ein harweinydd amdano'n gynharach wedi'i osod ar 28 o bwyntiau am bob hectar o dir cymwys. Y pwynt yr hoffwn ei wneud, a chredaf fod ganddo arwyddocâd arbennig yng ngogledd Cymru, yw y bydd y newidiadau a wnaethpwyd sy'n berthnasol i ffermwyr yn yr ucheldir mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol yn enfawr, a hynny mewn modd negyddol. Soniaf am hynny ymhen munud.

Yn draddodiadol, mae'r ffermwyr hyn wedi elwa ar gynllun Tir Mynydd, sydd wedi'u hannog i wneud gwaith amaeth-amgylchedd amhrisiadwy mewn ardaloedd o Gymru sy'n anodd iawn eu ffermio ac i amaethu'r ardaloedd is o'r wlad. Mewn gwirionedd, bu Tir Mynydd yn elfen bwysig wrth wneud ffermio yn yr ardaloedd hyn yn ymarferol yn y lle cyntaf. Bu Undeb Cenedlaethol Amaethwyr Cymru ac Undeb Amaethwyr

been trying to work with the Minister and officials to minimise the great impact that we believe will be on farmers in these less favoured areas as a result of the withdrawal of Tir Mynydd. However, we continue to question whether the 20 per cent top-up offered to farmers in less favoured areas entering the Glastir contract will be sufficient to compensate farmers for the money that will be lost due to the withdrawal of Tir Mynydd.

To further compound the difficulties, I believe that the Minister needs to revisit the issue of differentiation between severely disadvantaged areas and disadvantaged areas. We know that, under Tir Mynydd, there was a differential in payments, with land classified as being in a severely disadvantaged area receiving a higher payment. I will give you one example. The *Daily Post* from 11 November contained the farm and country supplement, which I am sure you are very familiar with, Minister. It looked at the case of farmer Michael Atkin. I am sure that he will not mind being mentioned, because he is already in the paper. He said that, under the existing Tir Mynydd scheme, he receives £21,000 in support payments per year, but that under Glastir, his payments will fall to—wait for it—£3,500. Most of us who are numerate will know that that is quite a difference. He plans to ignore the Glastir scheme and abandon organic farming just to make ends meet. This will result in the stocking level on his 300-acre holding doubling for sheep and rising by 50 per cent for cattle. It does not take much intelligence to realise that, if this situation is replicated across Wales, it could lead to a great increase in the intensity of farming, which will hardly help our agriculture sector contribute to the reduction of our nation's carbon emissions.

I would also like to take this opportunity to briefly raise the important issue of common land and the Glastir scheme. We have major concerns about the practicality of commoners' and graziers' associations applying to join the Glastir scheme. I am sure that the Minister is listening carefully and that she is going to tell us how there are no

Cymru yn ceisio gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog a swyddogion i gwtogi cymaint â phosibl ar yr effaith fawr y credwn y bydd tynnu Tir Mynydd yn ôl yn ei chael ar ffermwyr yn yr ardaloedd llai ffafriol hyn. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn dal yn holi a fydd y swm atodol o 20 y cant a gynigir i ffermwyr mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol sy'n ymuno â chontract Glastir yn ddigon i ddigolledu ffermwyr am yr arian a gollir oherwydd tynnu Tir Mynydd yn ôl.

I gymhlethu'r anawsterau ymhellach, credaf fod angen i'r Gweinidog ailystyried gwahaniaethu rhwng ardaloedd dan anfantais fawr ac ardaloedd dan anfantais. Gwyddom fod gwahaniaeth cyfradd mewn taliadau, dan gynllun Tir Mynydd, gyda thaliad uwch i'r tir a ddsbarthwyd mewn ardal dan anfantais fawr. Rhoddaf un enghraifft i chi. Roedd y *Daily Post* o 11 Tachwedd yn cynnwys yr atodiad fferm a gwlad, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gyfarwydd iawn ag ef, Weinidog. Roedd yn edrych ar achos y ffermwr Michael Atkin. Rwy'n siŵr na fydd gwahaniaeth ganddo gael ei enwi, am ei fod eisoes yn y papur. Dywedodd ei fod yn cael £21,000 o daliadau cymorth bob blwyddyn o dan gynllun presennol Tir Mynydd, ond y bydd ei daliadau o dan gynllun Glastir yn syrthio i—arhoswch—£3,500. Bydd y rhan fwyaf ohonom sy'n rhifog yn gwybod bod hwnnw'n dipyn o wahaniaeth. Mae'n bwriadu anwybyddu cynllun Glastir a throï ei gefn ar ffermio organig er mwyn cael dau ben llinyn ynghyd. Bydd hyn yn golygu bod lefel y stoc ar ei ddaliad 300-erw yn dyblu ar gyfer defaid ac yn codi 50 y cant ar gyfer gwartheg. Nid yw'n cymryd llawer o ddeallusrwydd i sylweddoli, petai'r sefyllfa hon yn cael ei haildrodd ledled Cymru, y gallai arwain at gynnydd mawr yn nwyster ffermio, a phrin y bydd hynny'n helpu ein sector amaethyddiaeth i gyfrannu at leihau allyriadau carbon ein cenedl.

Hoffwn fanteisio hefyd ar y cyfle hwn i sôn yn fras am bwynt pwysig tir comin a chynllun Glastir. Mae gennym bryderon mawr am ymarferoldeb cymdeithasau cominwyr a phorwyr yn ymgeisio i ymuno â chynllun Glastir. Rwy'n siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn gwrando'n astud a'i bod yn mynd i ddweud wrthym nad oes problemau

problems with that. However, at the moment, we believe that there is a problem. The majority of common land—about 8 per cent of Wales's total land mass—is categorised as less favoured, and 18 per cent of Welsh farmers declare common land on their single payment scheme application form. Indeed, in some areas, communities are entirely reliant on common grazing rights. However, we do not believe that the EU rules associated with agri-environment schemes properly take into account the unique nature of common land management in the UK. We are also concerned that, although there may be commons where the majority want or have little financial alternative but to sign up to Glastir, the chances of the majority being large enough to meet the 80 per cent criteria set by the Welsh Government and the EU are difficult to say the least. So, Minister, I hope that you have made representations to your counterparts in the UK Government and other devolved administrations and to your colleagues in the EU on this matter.

To conclude, the extension of opening hours in divisional offices is obviously to be commended. It is hoped that it will make it easier for farmers to physically deliver the forms or to seek advice. However, in our view, it does nothing to address the principal issue of encouraging as many farmers as possible to enter the scheme. This will be achieved only if the scheme is made more accessible, as Kirsty has previously mentioned, by revising the current prescriptions, adding new prescriptions and making it feasible for farmers to get to the 28-point threshold required to access Glastir.

Joyce Watson: I am grateful for the opportunity to speak during this debate on agri-environment schemes. We all recognise the importance of these schemes to the livelihood of farmers and the rural economy. However, I am a little surprised by some of the statements made by the Liberal Democrats. The existing schemes have played an important role in supporting farmers and in promoting sustainability, and I am confident that the conversion to Glastir will not result in the loss of the improvements already delivered, as the

gyda hynny. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, credwn fod problem. Mae mwyafrif y tir comin—sef tuag 8 y cant o dirfas cyfan Cymru—wedi'i gategoreiddio fel tir llai ffafrïol, ac mae 18 y cant o ffermwyr Cymru'n datgan tir comin ar eu ffurflen gais i gynllun y taliad sengl. Yn wir, mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae rhai cymunedau'n dibynnu'n llwyr ar hawliau pori tir comin. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn credu bod rheolau'r UE sy'n gysylltiedig â chynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd yn ystyried yn iawn natur unigryw rheoli tir comin yn y DU. Er bod tiroedd comin o bosibl lle mae'r mwyafrif am ymuno â Glastir neu'n brin o ddewis ariannol arall, rydym hefyd yn poeni bod y gobaith y bydd y mwyafrif yn ddigon mawr i fodloni'r meini prawf 80 y cant a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru a'r UE yn anodd a dweud y lleiaf. Felly, Weinidog, gobeithiaf eich bod wedi gwneud sylwadau i'ch cymheiriaid yn Llywodraeth y DU a gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill ac i'ch cydweithwyr yn yr UE ar y mater hwn.

I gloi, mae'n amlwg bod estyn oriau agor mewn swyddfeydd adrannol i'w gymeradwyo. Gobeithir y bydd yn ei gwneud yn haws i ffermwyr ddsbarthu'r ffurflenni yn gorfforol neu ofyn am gyngor. Fodd bynnag, yn ein barn ni, nid yw'n gwneud dim i fynd i'r afael â'r prif fater sef annog cynifer o ffermwyr â phosibl i ymuno â'r cynllun. Ni chyflawnir hyn oni wneir y cynllun yn fwy hygrych, fel y soniodd Kirsty yn flaenorol, drwy adolygu'r cyfarwyddbau cyfredol, ychwanegu cyfarwyddbau newydd a'i gwneud yn bosibl i ffermwyr gyrraedd y trothwy 28 pwynt sy'n ofynnol i gael at gynllun Glastir.

Joyce Watson: Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn ystod y ddadl hon ar gynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd. Rydym oll yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw'r cynlluniau hyn i fywoliaeth ffermwyr ac i'r economi wledig. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n synnu ychydig at rai o'r datganiadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae'r cynlluniau presennol wedi chwarae rhan bwysig mewn cefnogi ffermwyr ac mewn hyrwyddo cynaliadwyedd, ac rwy'n ffyddiog na fydd troi at gynllun Glastir yn golygu y bydd y gwelliannau a gafwyd eisoes yn cael eu colli,

Liberal Democrats believe will be the case.

I will focus, as others have done, on the call by the Liberal Democrats to delay the implementation date of Glastir. We are all aware that the scheme will be introduced in January 2012, but that there will be a transitional period that means that the scheme will not be up and running fully until 2014. It is important that all relevant parties are given sufficient time to adjust to the new scheme. I believe that two years should be sufficient. Any delay on top of this is unnecessary and unhelpful.

The good work that has already been done as part of Tir Cynnal to encourage practices that benefit the environment will be maintained and should be built upon following the implementation of Glastir. We must not forget that, as has been alluded to, the current schemes were not intended to meet the challenges of climate change. There will be a stronger emphasis on environmental protection and responsibility under Glastir, and it will look at targeted environmental actions to support areas such as biodiversity. That is crucial to ensure the stability of microclimates. I do not believe that there is an argument for saying that the good environmental work done so far under the current schemes will not be carried forward to Glastir, as has been suggested this afternoon.

I will turn now to another area of concern for the Liberal Democrats, namely the payments made under the Tir Mynydd scheme to farmers in less favoured areas. The figures do not support their view. To clarify this point, there will be no dedicated measure for less favoured areas under Glastir. However, there will be a premium of 20 per cent for all such areas entering the all-Wales element of Glastir, including for all dairy farmers, who are currently excluded from receiving those payments. That has been recognised by previous speakers. Although arrangements have yet to be finalised, projections suggest that there will be a base payment of £28 per hectare with farmers within the current less favoured area boundaries receiving £33.60 per hectare. This compares to £24 and £28 respectively under the current arrangements.

fel y cred y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Canolbwytiaf, fel eraill, ar y cais gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i ohirio dyddiad gweithredu Glastir. Gwyddom oll y bydd y cynllun yn cael ei gyflwyno ym mis Ionawr 2012, ond y bydd cyfnod pontio sy'n golygu na fydd y cynllun yn gwbl weithredol tan 2014. Mae'n bwysig bod pob parti perthnasol yn cael digon o amser i addasu i'r cynllun newydd. Credaf y dylai dwy flynedd fod yn ddigonol. Mae unrhyw ohiriad ar ben hyn yn ddianghenraid ac yn ddi-fudd.

Bydd y gwaith da a wnaethpwyd eisoes yn rhan o gynllun Tir Cynnal i annog arferion sydd o fudd i'r amgylchedd yn cael ei gynnal a dylid ei feithrin ymhellach ar ôl gweithredu Glastir. Mae'n rhaid inni gofio, fel y crybwyllwyd, nad bwriad y cynlluniau cyfredol oedd ateb heriau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Bydd pwyslais cryfach ar warchod yr amgylchedd a chyfrifoldeb amdano o dan gynllun Glastir, a bydd yn edrych ar gamau amgylcheddol a dargedir i gefnogi meysydd fel bioamrywiaeth. Mae hynny'n allweddol i sicrhau sefydlogrwydd microhinsodau. Nid wyf yn credu bod dadl dros ddweud na fydd y gwaith amgylcheddol da a wnaethpwyd hyd yma o dan y cynlluniau cyfredol yn cael ei ddwyn ymlaen i gynllun Glastir, fel yr awgrymwyd y prynhawn yma.

Trof yn awr at rywbeth arall sy'n peri gofid i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sef y taliadau a wnaethpwyd o dan gynllun Tir Mynydd i ffermwyr mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol. Nid yw'r ffigurau'n cefnogi eu barn. I egluro'r pwynt hwn, ni fydd mesur un pwrpas ar gyfer ardaloedd llai ffafriol o dan gynllun Glastir. Fodd bynnag, bydd premiwm o 20 y cant ar gyfer pob ardal felly sy'n ymuno ag elfen Cymru gyfan Glastir, gan gynnwys i bob ffermwr godro, sydd wedi'i hepgor ar hyn o bryd rhag cael y taliadau hynny. Mae siaradwyr blaenorol wedi cydnabod hyn. Er bod trefniadau heb eu cadarnhau eto, mae rhagamcaniadau'n awgrymu y bydd taliad sylfaenol o £28 yr hectar, gyda'r ffermwyr o fewn ffiniau cyfredol yr ardaloedd llai ffafriol yn cael £33.60 yr hectar. Mae hyn yn cymharu â £24 a £28 yn y drefn honno o dan

Therefore, the argument that payments under the Tir Mynydd scheme will be lost does not seem to stand up. According to current projections, farmers will receive more money under Glastir than they currently receive.

Kirsty Williams: Joyce, will you give way?

Joyce Watson: I did not intervene while anyone else was speaking, so I do not see why anyone should intervene during my contribution. [*Laughter.*]

I take this opportunity to welcome this scheme and the initiatives that the Welsh Assembly Government has implemented in relation to securing the livelihoods of farmers and supporting the environment. These include the Wales rural network, which seeks to promote best practice among rural organisations and help rural communities to get through the difficulties caused by the current economic climate. Another example is the young entrants' support scheme, which offers guidance and grant aid to encourage young people to enter the farming industry. Current projections show that the whole of the scheme's budget for the first year will be spent. This shows that there is a demand for the support that the Government is offering.

Therefore, it is interesting to compare the positive step that the Welsh Assembly Government is taking with the actions of the Liberal Democrats in Westminster, who have supported the decision to scrap the Sustainable Development Commission. Perhaps the Welsh Liberal Democrats would be better off raising their concerns with their Westminster colleagues and supporting the actions taken by the Government in Wales.

5.10 p.m.

Veronica German: In the last few weeks, the Minister has made the startling admission that she has absolutely no targets relating to uptake by which to judge the success of the scheme. We know that 80 per cent of farmers expressed an interest in joining the scheme, back when they were completing their single

y trefniadau cyfredol. Felly, nid yw'r ddadl y bydd taliadau o dan gynllun Tir Mynydd yn cael eu colli fel petai'n dal dŵr. Yn ôl y rhagamcaniadau cyfredol, bydd ffermwyr yn cael mwy o arian o dan gynllun Glastir nag y cânt ar hyn o bryd.

Kirsty Williams: Joyce, a wnewch chi ildio?

Joyce Watson: Ni wnes i ymyrryd tra bod unrhyw un arall yn siarad, felly ni welaf pam y dylai unrhyw un ymyrryd yn ystod fy nghyfraniad i. [*Chwerthin.*]

Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i groesawu'r cynllun hwn a'r mentrau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u gweithredu mewn perthynas â bywoliaeth ffermwyr a chefnogi'r amgylchedd. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys rhwydwaith gwledig Cymru, sy'n ceisio hyrwyddo arfer gorau ymhlith cymdeithasau gwledig a helpu cymunedau gwledig i oresgyn yr anawsterau a achosir gan yr hinsawdd economaidd sydd ohoni. Un enghraifft arall yw'r cynllun cefnogi dyfodiaid ifanc, sy'n cynnig cyfarwyddyd a chymorth grant i annog pobl ifanc i mewn i'r diwydiant ffermio. Dengys rhagamcaniadau cyfredol y bydd holl gyllideb y cynllun ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyntaf yn cael ei gwario. Mae hyn yn dangos bod galw am y cymorth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei gynnig.

Felly, mae'n ddiddorol cymharu'r cam cadarnhaol y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei gymryd â chymharu'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn San Steffan, sydd wedi cefnogi'r penderfyniad i roi'r gorau i'r Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy. Hwyrach y byddai'n well ar Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru petaent yn codi eu pryderon gyda'u cydweithwyr yn San Steffan ac yn cefnogi'r camau a gymerir gan y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru.

Veronica German: Yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyfaddef yn rhyfeddol nad oes ganddi unrhyw dargedau o gwbl mewn perthynas â nifer y rhai sy'n ymuno i'w defnyddio i feirniadu llwyddiant y cynllun. Gwyddom fod 80 y cant o ffermwyr wedi mynegi

farm payment forms, so, logically, we would have expected the Minister and her officials to have some sort of benchmark against which to measure the success of uptake.

However, at a recent NFU conference, I understand that the Minister made it her aspiration for some 10,000 farmers to enter Glastir by the time the scheme finally becomes fully operational in 2014. Given that the current Tir Cynnal and Tir Gofal schemes have approximately 7,000 participants between them, we would need at least 7,000 to stay where we are now, without making any advances in the number of farms undertaking this work through the agri-environment scheme. If we do not reach that figure, it would surely mean that the Minister has failed and that Glastir would have to be taken back to the drawing board. That is not something that anyone particularly wants when something is fully operational. We could avoid that if the Minister took time now to look again at the scheme, looking at the potential barriers to uptake and listening to what farmers are telling her.

As Kirsty has already mentioned, many in the agriculture sector have expressed real and grave concerns, not just about the scheme itself, but about the bureaucratic nightmare that is the application process and the very high bar that has been set for the entry criteria. We are really concerned that these factors combined will put farmers off even bothering to apply for the scheme before the deadline for applications on 22 November. The effect on our natural landscape, as well as on the agriculture sector and rural communities, would be devastating if farmers decided simply not to bother because it was not worth the effort. This concern is echoed by many in the sector. The great agri-environment work that has already been achieved through previous schemes will be lost as farmers look to recoup the losses that they will suffer by pulling out. This effect on our landscape will have far-reaching consequences; it will affect the vital tourism industry in rural Wales, not to mention the

diddordeb mewn ymuno â'r cynllun, pan oeddent yn llenwi eu ffurflenni taliad fferm sengl, felly, yn rhesymegol, byddem wedi disgwyl i'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion fod â rhyw fath o feincnod ar gyfer mesur llwyddiant yr ymuno.

Fodd bynnag, mewn cynhadledd Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr yn ddiweddar, deallaf fod y Gweinidog wedi'i wneud yn uchelgais iddi fod rhyw 10,000 o ffermwyr yn ymuno â Glastir erbyn yr amser y daw'r cynllun yn gwbl weithredol o'r diwedd yn 2014. O ystyried bod gan gynlluniau cyfredol Tir Cynnal a Thir Gofal ryw 7,000 o gyfranogwyr rhyngddynt, byddai angen o leiaf 7,000 arnom i aros yn ein sefyllfa gyfredol, heb gynyddu nifer y ffermydd sy'n gwneud y gwaith hwn drwy'r cynllun amaeth-amgylchedd. Os na chyrrhaeddwn y ffigur hwnnw, byddai'n siŵr o olygu bod y Gweinidog wedi methu ac y byddai'n rhaid ailfeddwl Glastir. Nid yw hynny'n rhywbeth y mae ar neb ei eisiau'n arbennig pan fydd rhywbeth yn gwbl weithredol. Gallem osgoi hynny petai'r Gweinidog yn cymryd amser yn awr i edrych eto ar y cynllun, gan edrych ar y rhwystrau posibl rhag ymuno a gwrandao ar yr hyn y mae ffermwyr yn ei ddweud wrthi.

Fel y mae Kirsty eisoes wedi sôn, mae llawer yn y sector amaethyddiaeth wedi mynegi pryderon real a difrifol, nid yn unig am y cynllun ei hun, ond am yr hunllef fiwrocratig sef y broses ymgeisio a'r trothwy uchel iawn sydd wedi'i osod ar gyfer y meini prawf mynediad. Rydym yn poeni o ddifrif y bydd y ffactorau hyn gyda'i gilydd yn annog ffermwyr i beidio â ffwdanu ymgeisio am y cynllun hyd yn oed cyn y terfyn amser am geisiadau ar 22 Tachwedd. Byddai'r effaith ar ein tirwedd naturiol, yn ogystal ag ar y sector amaethyddiaeth a'r cymunedau gwledig, yn ofnadwy petai ffermwyr yn penderfynu peidio â ffwdanu am nad oedd yn werth yr ymdrech. Mae llawer yn y sector yn atseinio'r pryder hwn. Bydd y gwaith amaeth-amgylchedd gwych a gyflawnwyd eisoes drwy gynlluniau blaenorol yn cael ei golli wrth i ffermwyr geisio adennill y colledion y byddant yn eu dioddef drwy droi cefn arnynt. Bydd yr effaith hon ar ein tirwedd yn dwyn canlyniadau pellgyrhaeddol;

contribution of previous schemes to halt the loss of biodiversity, as well as the Government's targets on reducing carbon emissions.

The Government has already missed its target of halting the loss of biodiversity by 2010, and it certainly will not help to achieve the 2020 target if farmers do not enrol in the new scheme, keeping up the work that they have already undertaken to preserve and nurture biodiversity. We therefore urge the Minister to look again at the criteria involved in accessing the Glastir scheme and to listen to those on the ground who are willing to talk about the problems that they foresee. She should reopen Glastir in a way that allows the nearly 15 per cent of farmers who did not even express an interest in it on the single farm payment form, and those who decided that they did not want to go ahead with it after looking at what they had to do, to re-examine the options available to them. We urge the Minister to encourage as many farmers as possible to join.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ymateb i'r hyn a ddywedodd Veronica German. Os clywais yn gywir, dywedodd ein bod wedi methu â bodloni'r targedau bioamrywiaeth ar gyfer 2010 felly dylem ohirio dechrau'r cynllun newydd hwn, ac y byddai hynny'n ein galluogi i gyflawni'r targedau. Y gwir amdani yw y byddai gohirio dyddiad dechrau'r cynllun newydd yn golygu na fyddai unrhyw beth yn cael ei wneud yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw ac y byddem hyd yn oed ymhellach ar ei hôl hi o ran cyflawni'r targedau arbennig hyn.

Hoffwn ymateb hefyd i rai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd ynglŷn â faint o bobl fydd wedi ymaelodi erbyn dydd Llun nesaf. Rhoddwyd yr argraff na fydd ffermwyr, os nad ydynt wedi ymaelodi erbyn dydd Llun, yn gallu ymaelodi â chynllun Glastir byth. Eglurodd aelodau'r Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig mewn llythyr at y Gweinidog fod ffermwyr yn pryderu am y cynllun hwn a'i oblygiadau i'w busnesau, ac yn gofyn am gyfnod trosiannol er mwyn i ffermwyr gael mwy o amser i ystyried ac i sicrhau na fyddai

bydd yn effeithio ar y diwydiant twristiaeth hanfodol yng Nghymru wledig, heb sôn am gyfraniad cynlluniau blaenorol i atal colled bioamrywiaeth, yn ogystal â thargedau'r Llywodraeth ar leihau allyriadau carbon.

Mae'r Llywodraeth eisoes wedi methu â chyrraedd ei tharged o atal colled bioamrywiaeth erbyn 2010, ac ni fydd o fudd o gwbl i gyflawni targed 2010 os na fydd ffermwyr yn ymrestru yn y cynllun newydd, gan barhau'r gwaith a wnaethant eisoes i warchod a meithrin bioamrywiaeth. Rydym felly'n cymhell y Gweinidog i ailedrych ar y meini prawf sydd ynghlwm wrth gael at gynllun Glastir ac i wrando ar y rheini ar lawr gwlad sy'n fodlon siarad am y problemau a ragwelant. Dylid ailagor Glastir mewn ffordd sy'n caniatáu i'r 15 y cant bron o ffermwyr na fynegasant ddi-ddordeb ynddo hyd yn oed ar ffurflen y taliad sengl, a'r rheini a benderfynodd nad oeddent am fwrw ymlaen ag ef ar ôl edrych ar yr hyn yr oedd rhaid iddynt ei wneud, i ailarchwilio'r dewisiadau sydd ar gael iddynt. Cymhellwn y Gweinidog i annog cynifer o ffermwyr â phosibl i ymuno.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I would like to begin by responding to what Veronica German said. If I heard her correctly, she said that we had failed to meet the biodiversity figures for 2010 and that we should, therefore, postpone the start date for the new scheme, allowing us to meet the targets. The truth is that postponing the start date for the new scheme would mean that nothing would be done during that period and that we would be even further away from meeting those particular targets.

I would also like to respond to some of the points made about the number of people who will have joined by next Monday. The impression was given that farmers will never be able to join Glastir if they have not done so by Monday. Members of the Rural Development Sub-committee, in a letter to the Minister, explained that farmers were concerned about the scheme and its implications for their businesses, and asked for a transition period so that farmers could have more time to consider and ensure that

ffermwyr ar eu colled, o'i gymharu â pharhau i fod yn rhan o gynllun Tir Gofal. Penderfynodd y Gweinidog ohirio'r toriadau llawn ar gynlluniau Tir Mynydd a Tir Gofal a chaniatáu i'r ffermwyr barhau o fewn y cynlluniau hynny. Mae hynny'n golygu bod rhai ffermwyr wedi penderfynu parhau yn eu sefyllfa bresennol am y dyfodol agos, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu na allant ymuno â Glastir ymhen blwyddyn neu ddwy flynedd, pan ddaw eu cytundebau presennol i ben. Dywedaf hynny gan fy mod newydd dderbyn e-bost, fel y mae'n digwydd, gan un o'm hetholwyr sydd yn ymgynghorydd amaethyddol. Mae'n cynghori ffermwyr ynglŷn â materion megis ymaelodi â Glastir, a'u cynorthwyo i lenwi'r ffurflenni. Mae'n gwneud apêl, Weinidog, nid i chi ohirio'r cynllun ond i chi ymestyn y dyddiad cau o ryw bythefnos. Yng ngeiriau'r ymgynghorydd hwn, mae problem wedi bod oherwydd bod proffwydi gwae wedi bod yn brawychu ffermwyr, gyda phob math o storïau ynglŷn â'r goblygiadau o ymuno â Glastir. Mae llawer o ffermwyr wedi oedi. Maent wedi penderfynu peidio ag ymaelodi ar ôl dangos diddordeb, a bellach yn ailfeddwl. Mae'r ymgynghorydd yn ofni na fydd y rhai sydd am ymuno'n syth yn gallu gwneud hynny gan na allant gwblhau'r gwaith erbyn dydd Llun nesaf.

Kirsty Williams: Rhodri, that is an admirable defence of your Minister and of this scheme, but, if Glastir is the attractive proposition that you now say that it is, despite the concerns that you have expressed previously, surely people would not want to delay, and would not have been frightened, but would be banging down the doors of the divisional offices to get their forms in. You know as well as I do that that is not the situation. Do you not agree that means that an opportunity has been lost here? Glastir could have been designed in such a way that we did not have to put these mitigating factors in, because people would actively want to join and be a part of it. This is a missed opportunity. Had it been constructed in a different way, we could have had that situation.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Kirsty, you obviously have not listened to a word that I

they would not lose out, compared to remaining part of the Tir Gofal scheme. The Minister decided to postpone the full cuts to the Tir Mynydd and Tir Gofal schemes, and to allow farmers to continue within those schemes. That means that some farmers have decided to continue in their current situation for the immediate future, but that does not mean that they cannot join Glastir a year or two years hence, when their present agreements come to an end. I say that as I have, as it happens, just received an email from one of my constituents who is an agricultural consultant. He advises farmers on matters such as joining Glastir, and helps them with filling out the forms. He makes an appeal, Minister, not for you to postpone the scheme, but for you to extend the closing date by about a fortnight. In the words of this consultant, there has been a problem because scaremongering has alarmed farmers, with all sorts of stories about the implications of joining Glastir. Many farmers have delayed. They have decided not to join after having expressed an interest, and are now reconsidering. The consultant is concerned that those who want to join immediately will not be able to do so, as they will not be able to complete the work by next Monday.

Kirsty Williams: Rhodri, mae hwnnw'n amddiffyniad campus o'ch Gweinidog a'r cynllun hwn, ond, os yw Glastir y cynnig deniadol y dywedwch bellach ei fod, er gwaethaf y pryderon a fynegasoch yn flaenorol, siawns na fyddai pobl am oedi, ac na fyddent wedi cael ofn, ond y byddent yn curo drysau'r swyddfydd adrannol i lawr gyflwyno eu ffurflenni. Rydych chi'n gwybod cystal â mi nad honno yw'r sefyllfa. Onid ydych chi'n cytuno bod hynny'n golygu bod cyfle wedi'i golli yma? Gallai Glastir fod wedi'i gynllunio mewn ffordd nad oedd rhaid inni gynnwys y ffactorau lliniaru hyn, oherwydd byddai pobl yn dymuno ymuno a bod yn rhan ohono. Mae hwn yn gyfle wedi'i golli. Pe byddai wedi'i adeiladu mewn ffordd wahanol, gallem fod wedi cael y sefyllfa honno.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Kirsty, mae'n amlwg nad ydych wedi gwrandao ar air a ddywedais.

have said. I was not defending the Minister; I was quoting to you what an agricultural consultant said about the scheme and about the effects of what some people had been saying about it on farmers' decisions. Those were not my words; it was an agricultural consultant who said that. He asked the Minister whether she would consider allowing a further fortnight for people to show interest at this particular point, if they wanted to join immediately. I also said that the Minister came back to the committee and said, 'I understand the fears that you raise'. I did raise concerns as an individual Member and as Chair of the Rural Development Subcommittee, and the Minister came back and said, 'I understand that there are concerns, and, therefore, I will not introduce the cuts in Tir Mynydd and Tir Gofal immediately. Farmers will be allowed a transitional period'. She made that decision and some people have taken advantage of that. That is all that I said. I did not mount a great defence. I think that the Minister is quite capable of defending herself; I do not have to defend her. I am concerned about certain elements. I have spoken to farmers, and farmers in my own constituency have come to me with concerns, and I have raised those concerns with the Minister. However, there is an issue of proportionality with regard to how some people have responded to this. I agree totally that the previous schemes were excellent, but they were of their time. There has to be a move now to recognise the agenda that has been set by Europe, and that is what the Minister is doing. It has not been easy. It probably will not be easy for the foreseeable future, and we must address the issues as they arise. However, to condemn the whole process, the new scheme, and the Minister, is totally out of order.

Mick Bates: I think that all of us in this Chamber today feel a sense of disappointment that there is so much fear and frustration about the implementation of Glastir. Many of us agree with the principles of Glastir: simplification, the need to move on, and the need to connect a good, environmentally sound agricultural system to food production. None of us want to see further depopulation of the hills from once-viable family farms, so profitability has to be

Nid oeddwn yn amddiffyn y Gweinidog; roeddwn yn dyfynnu ichi'r hyn a ddywedodd ymgynghorydd amaethyddol am y cynllun ac am effeithiau'r hyn y bu rhai pobl yn dweud amdano ar benderfyniadau ffermwyr. Nid fy ngeiriau i oedd y rheini; ymgynghorydd amaethyddol a ddywedodd hynny. Gofynnodd i'r Gweinidog a fyddai'n ystyried caniatáu pythefnos pellach i bobl ddangos diddordeb yn y man arbennig hwn, pe byddent am ymuno ar unwaith. Dywedais hefyd fod y Gweinidog wedi dod yn ôl i'r pwyllgor a dweud, 'Deallaf yr ofnau a godwch'. Codais bryderon fel Aelod unigol ac fel Cadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig, a daeth y Gweinidog yn ôl a dweud, 'Deallaf fod pryderon, ac felly, ni chyflwynaf y toriadau yng nghynlluniau Tir Mynydd a Thir Gofal ar unwaith. Caniateir cyfnod pontio i ffermwyr'. Gwnaeth y penderfyniad hwnnw ac mae rhai pobl wedi cymryd mantais o hwnnw. Dyna'r cyfan a ddywedais. Ni euthum ar ymgyrch amddiffyn fawr. Rwy'n credu bod y Gweinidog yn hen ddigon cymwys i amddiffyn ei hun; nid oes rhaid imi ei hamddiffyn. Rwy'n poeni am rai elfennau. Rwyf wedi siarad â ffermwyr, a daeth ffermwyr yn fy etholaeth ataf i leisio pryderon, ac rwyf wedi sôn am y pryderon hynny wrth y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, ceir problem cymesuredd o ran y ffordd y mae rhai pobl wedi ymateb i hyn. Cytunaf yn llwyr fod y cynlluniau blaenorol yn rhagorol, ond roeddent o'u cyfnod. Mae'n rhaid newid bellach i gydnabod yr agenda a osodwyd gan Ewrop, a dyna y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud. Ni fu'n hawdd. Yn ôl pob tebyg, ni fydd yn hawdd hyd y gellir ei ragweld, a rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r problemau wrth iddynt godi. Fodd bynnag, i gondemnio'r broses gyfan, mae'r cynllun newydd, a'r Gweinidog, yn gwbl ddi-drefn.

Mick Bates: Rwy'n credu bod pob un ohonom yn y Siambr hon heddiw'n teimlo rhywfaint o siom am fod cymaint o ofn a rhwystredigaeth ynghylch gweithredu Glastir. Mae llawer ohonom yn cytuno ag egwyddorion Glastir: symleiddio, bod angen symud ymlaen, a bod angen cysylltu system amaethyddol dda, amgylcheddol gadarn â chynhyrchu bwyd. Nid oes yr un ohonom am weld y bryniau'n cael eu diboblogi o ffermydd teuluol a arferai fod yn

a key factor in all of this.

ddichonadwy, felly mae'n rhaid i broffidioldeb fod yn ffactor allweddol yn hyn oll.

5.20 p.m.

The first contact that many people in the farming industry had with Glastir was with a long and complex list of options—not just 10, 20 or even 30 options, but an option menu of 40 different bits. That created the perception initially that it was a very complicated scheme. The heart of the problem lies in the lack of good communication about the advantages of this scheme and how the all-Wales elements can lead to the targeted elements, which are extremely well-founded in good, sustainable agricultural practice. At the heart of this scheme is a better land management system, but faced with those 40 options and an immediate desire to see how it compared with previous schemes, many people thought that this scheme, despite its sound environmental credentials, did not match up.

Y cyswllt cyntaf a gafodd llawer yn y diwydiant ffermio â Glastir oedd rhestr faith a chymhleth o ddewisiadau—nid 10, 20 neu hyd yn oed 30 o ddewisiadau, ond dewislen o 40 o wahanol ddarnau. Roedd hynny'n creu'r teimlad i ddechrau mai cynllun cymhleth iawn oedd hwn. Wrth wraidd y broblem y mae diffyg cyfathrebu da am fanteision y cynllun hwn a'r ffordd y gall elfennau Cymru gyfan arwain at yr elfennau a dargedir, sydd â sylfaen gadarn iawn mewn arfer amaethyddol da, cynaliadwy. Wrth wraidd y cynllun hwn mae gwell system rheoli tir, ond o wynebu'r 40 dewis hynny a dyhead uniongyrchol i weld sut oedd yn cymharu â chynlluniau blaenorol, credai llawer o bobl nad oedd y cynllun hwn yn taro deuddeg, er gwaethaf ei gymwysterau amgylcheddol cadarn.

To come back to my theme of good communication, in simplifying what were four or five different schemes into one scheme, surely the first step would have been for the Minister to say, 'In doing this, I am giving you value for money; there is going to be a saving in the amalgamation of these schemes into one scheme, called Glastir'. That would have helped initially with justifying the whole programme—and that is to farmers, not to us as politicians debating the finer points of issues about Glastir. Therefore, the perception was of a complex scheme that was not understood and did not offer value for money in amalgamating highly successful schemes. Tir Gofal was recognised as a leading agri-environment scheme throughout Europe, and yet we were abandoning the scheme. We moved on to Glastir, and, in my view, there was a lack of good communication. We also had an amalgamation of schemes, which required advice. I turn here to a recommendation in a report of the Rural Development Sub-Committee about project officers, which you rejected, Minister. The problems with ensuring that Glastir is the success that it needs to be—and I emphasise that it needs to

I ddychwelyd i'm thema o gyfathrebu da, wrth symleiddio'r hyn a oedd yn bedwar neu bum gwahanol gynllun yn un, siawns mai'r cam cyntaf fyddai wedi bod i'r Gweinidog ddweud, 'Wrth wneud hyn, rwy'n rhoi gwerth am arian ichi; bydd arbediad wrth gyfuno'r cynlluniau hyn yn un, o'r enw Glastir'. Byddai hynny wedi helpu i ddechrau i gyfiawnhau'r holl raglen—a hynny yw i ffermwyr, nid i ni fel gwleidyddion yn dadlau manion Glastir. Felly, y canfyddiad oedd cynllun cymhleth nad oedd yn cael ei ddeall ac nad oedd yn cynnig gwerth am arian wrth gyfuno cynlluniau llwyddiannus iawn. Cydnabuwyd Tir Gofal yn gynllun amaeth-amgylchedd blaenllaw ledled Ewrop, ac eto roeddem yn troi cefn ar y cynllun. Symudasant ymlaen i gynllun Glastir ac, yn fy marn i, roedd diffyg cyfathrebu da. Cawsom hefyd gyfuno cynlluniau, yr oedd gofyn cyngor arnynt. Trof yma at argymhelliad mewn adroddiad gan yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig am swyddogion prosiect, a wrthodoch chi, Weindog. Mae'r problemau wrth sicrhau bod Glastir yn llwyddo fel y mae angen iddo lwyddo—a phwysleisaf fod angen iddo lwyddo—yn codi o'r ffaith na dderbyniasoch yr

be a success—arise out of the fact that you did not accept that recommendation and recognise that project officers were essential to promote the scheme and ensure that as many farmers as possible saw the advantage of entering the all-Wales element, and then the targeted element of the scheme.

I know of farmers who see the emphasis on all the work being done on improved land as a barrier to profitability. Many farmers have worked out a simple equation, which is that on a holding of, say, 100 ha, the total payment per annum for management fees and so on would be in excess of £3,000. In today's marketplace, most people see the bureaucratic burden of 40 options, and of looking into those, as too complex. They can replace that income by simply keeping a few extra tens of sheep, for example. That is one of the big remaining battles.

I want to see this scheme succeed, because I know that the targeted element that you have offered for capital grants is extremely important. I would like to conclude my remarks by discussing that element, because I believe that the catchment principle within the targeted element—the principle of co-operation in certain areas to deliver better food production and better environmental standards—will be enhanced by enabling farmers to work together. However, it appears that there is no clear guidance at present on the benefits for farmers of working together. You will be aware of a model for that in my constituency, Pontbren, of which my farming business was a member. It operated successfully in a co-operative way to deliver not only good farming practice, but environmental benefits.

Like Rhodri Glyn, I urge you, Minister, to extend the period of application and ensure that communications are better in order to sell a simpler scheme, with fewer options, possibly, that the majority of farmers will enter.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Mae'n siŵr fod y ddadl hon yn adlewyrchiad o'r tensiwn sy'n gallu amlygu weithiau rhwng buddiannau amgylcheddol a

argymhelliad hwnnw a chydnabod bod swyddogion prosiect yn hanfodol i hyrwyddo'r cynllun a sicrhau bod cynifer o ffermwyr â phosibl yn gweld mantais ymuno â'r elfen Cymru gyfan, ac yna elfen a dargedir y cynllun.

Gwn am ffermwyr sy'n ystyried bod y pwyslais ar yr holl waith sy'n cael ei wneud ar dir wedi'i wella yn rhwystro proffidoldeb. Mae llawer o ffermwyr wedi cyfrifo hafaliad syml, sef ar ddaliad o 100 ha, dyweder, byddai cyfanswm y taliad blynyddol am ffioedd rheoli ac ati yn fwy na £3,000. Yn y farchnadfa sydd ohoni, mae'r rhan fwyaf yn ystyried bod baich biwrocratig 40 o ddewisiadau, ac astudio'r rheini, yn rhy gymhleth. Gallant ddisodli'r incwm hwnnw drwy gadw ychydig o ddegau ychwanegol o ddefaid, er enghraifft. Hwnnw yw un o'r brwydrau mawr sy'n parhau.

Hoffwn weld y cynllun hwn yn llwyddo, oherwydd rwy'n gwybod bod yr elfen a dargedir a gynigiasoch ar gyfer grantiau cyfalaf yn hynod o bwysig. Hoffwn gwblhau fy sylwadau drwy drafod yr elfen honno, am fy mod yn credu y bydd yr egwyddor dalgylch yn yr elfen a dargedir-egwyddor cydweithredu mewn rhai ardaloedd i gynhyrchu bwyd yn well a gwella safonau amgylcheddol-yn well drwy alluogi ffermwyr i gydweithio. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg nad oes cyfarwyddyd clir ar hyn o bryd ar fuddion cydweithio i ffermwyr. Byddwch chi'n gwybod am fodel ar gyfer hynny yn fy etholaeth i, Pontbren, yr oedd fy musnes ffermio'n aelod ohono. Roedd yn gweithredu'n llwyddiannus mewn modd cydweithredol i gyflenwi arfer ffermio da, ond hefyd buddion amgylcheddol.

Fel Rhodri Glyn, rwy'n eich cymell chi, Weinidog, i estyn y cyfnod ymgeisio ac i sicrhau cyfathrebu gwell er mwyn gwerthu cynllun symlach, gyda llai o ddewisiadau, efallai, y bydd mwyafrif y ffermwyr yn ymuno ag ef.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): This debate no doubt reflects the tension that can sometimes arise between environmental and agricultural interests. The

rhai amaethyddol. Yr oedd yr undebau amaethyddol yn galw yn gynharach eleni am ohirio Glastir, ac mae'r mudiadau amgylcheddol yn dadlau dros beidio â'i ohirio a chadw at yr amserlen o gyflwyno yn 2012. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol heddiw, bum diwrnod cyn dyddiad cau ceisiadau Glastir, yn galw am ei ohirio, ond nid yw'n glir i mi o'r cynnig nac o'r cyfraniadau tan pryd y byddai'r gohriad hwnnw. Daeth awgrym yn ystod y ddadl oddi wrth Rhodri Glyn a Mick Bates ynglŷn ag ymestyn y dyddiad cau ar gyfer ceisiadau Glastir. Mae hynny'n awgrym gwahanol, a rhof rywfaint o ystyriaeth iddo, ond yr wyf yn methu â gwneud hynny'r prynhawn yma.

Felly, er bod tensiwn rhwng yr amgylcheddol a'r amaethyddol ar adegau, yr hyn yr wyf wedi ceisio ei gyflawni wrth gyflwyno Glastir yw troedio'r llwybr canol a chynnig mwy o gyfleon i ffermwyr sydd eisiau integreiddio cynhyrchu bwyd a rheolaeth tir cynaliadwy i wneud hynny. Mae diffygion incwm ffermwyr fel cynhyrchwyr bwyd yn cael eu digolledu gan y taliad sengl, a oedd yn erth tua £290 miliwn eleni. Mae cyllideb gwerth tua £90 miliwn ar gael i Glastir a'r cynlluniau trosiannol yn 2012, ac mae'r gyllideb honno wedi ei chadarnhau yn y gyllideb a gyflwynwyd heddiw. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd rhai'n derbyn llai o arian o dan gyfundrefn Glastir na'r cyfuniad presennol o gynlluniau, yn enwedig os yw ffermwr yn derbyn Tir Gofal, Tir Mynydd a thaliadau cynnal organig.

Mae Tir Gofal yn derbyn cyfran uchel o daliadau echel 2, er mai dim ond ychydig dros 3,000 o ffermwyr sydd yn y cynllun. O fewn y 3,000 hynny o ffermwyr, mae rhai'n derbyn taliadau sylweddol iawn. Dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, derbyniodd pum ffermwr yng Nghymru daliadau gwerth dros £400,000 yr un. Derbyniodd un o'r rhain daliadau gwerth £1.2 miliwn eleni. Nid yw'n syndod, felly, fod rhai'n awyddus i weld parhad Tir Gofal ac yn feiriadol o Glastir. Fodd bynnag, bwriad Glastir wastad oedd rhannu'r gacen echel 2 yn fwy gwastad ymysg mwy o ffermwyr. Yr wyf yn parhau i fod yn argyhoeddedig bod cyfeiriad Glastir yn gywir, sef ariannu ffermwyr i reoli eu tir

agricultural unions were calling earlier this year for the postponement of Glastir, and the environmental movements argue against that and for keeping to the timetable of introduction in 2012. The Liberal Democrats are calling today, five days before the closing date for Glastir applications, for it to be postponed, but it is not clear to me from the motion or the contributions until when that postponement would be. A suggestion was made during the debate by Rhodri Glyn and Mick Bates about extending the closing date for Glastir applications. That is a different suggestion, and I will give some consideration to it, but I cannot do that this afternoon.

Therefore, although there is tension between the agricultural and environmental at times, what I have tried to achieve in introducing Glastir is to take the middle ground and provide more opportunities for farmers who want to integrate food production and sustainable land management to do so. The shortfall in income experienced by farmers as food producers is compensated by the single payment, which was worth some £290 million this year. A budget of around £90 million is available for Glastir and the transitional schemes in 2012, and that budget has been confirmed in the budget announced today. I am aware that some will receive less money under the Glastir regime than under the present combination of schemes, particularly if farmers are receiving Tir Gofal, Tir Mynydd, and organic maintenance payments.

Tir Gofal takes a large percentage of axis 2 payments, although only just over 3,000 farmers are in the scheme. Within those 3,000 farmers, there are some who receive very significant payments. Over the past five years, five farmers in Wales received payments worth over £400,000 each. One of these farmers received payments worth £1.2 million this year. It is not surprising, therefore, that some are keen to see Tir Gofal continue and are critical of Glastir. However, the aim of Glastir was always to share out the axis 2 cake more equally among more farmers. I remain convinced that the direction of Glastir is right, namely funding farmers to manage their land in a way that reduces the

mewn ffordd sy'n lleihau'r effaith ar yr amgylchedd ac ar newid yn yr hinsawdd. Fy ngweledigaeth ar gyfer amaethu yng Nghymru yw gweld mwy o fwyd ac ystod ehangach o fwydydd yn cael eu cynhyrchu yng Nghymru, ond gydag effaith lai ar yr amgylchedd a'r hinsawdd.

Cafodd Tir Gofal ei lansio yn 1999 a Thir Cynnal yn 2005. Mae eu hamcanion yn adlewyrchu syniadau a pholisïau eu cyfnod. Gosododd archwiliad iechyd 2008 y polisi amaeth cyffredin heriau newydd i amaeth. Y byrdwn mawr yn awr yw cael ffermwyr i reoli eu tir yn gynaliadwy, mewn ffordd a fydd yn rhoi sylw i newid yn yr hinsawdd a defnyddio adnoddau naturiol yn gynaliadwy—carbon, dŵr, pridd, cynefinoedd a bioamrywiaeth. Er mwyn cwrdd â'r heriau newydd hyn, mae pedair agwedd i Glastir. Mae'r lefel Cymru gyfan, sef yr hyn yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r siaradwyr, ac eithrio Mick Bates, wedi cyfyngu eu hunain iddo heddiw. Wedyn mae'r lefel sydd wedi ei thargedu, sy'n rhoi blaenoriaeth benodol i reolaeth dŵr a storio carbon. Yna mae'r cynllun plannu coed, sy'n gynllun sylweddol, a'r cynllun ar gyfer effeithlonrwydd ynni ar ffermydd.

Yr wyf yn cytuno â'r cynnig ei bod yn bwysig nad ydym yn colli rhai o'r enillion sydd wedi dod yn sgîl Tir Gofal a Thir Cynnal. Am y rheswm hwnnw, cyhoeddais ym mis Gorffennaf 2009 y byddem yn ymestyn cytundebau Tir Gofal a Thir Cynnal tan 2013. Yr oeddwn wedi gwneud hynny er mwyn hwyluso'r newid i Glastir. Mae'r opsiynau rheoli sydd ar gael o dan yr elfen Cymru gyfan yn digolledu ffermwyr am gynnal y gwelliannau amgylcheddol a gafodd eu gwneud drwy'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol presennol. Bydd Glastir yn gwneud yn siŵr na fydd y buddsoddiadau hynny'n mynd yn ofer. Mae trefniadau pontio hefyd ar gyfer Tir Mynydd, gyda thaliadau ymadael yn cael eu talu yn 2012 a 2013.

5.30 p.m.

Nick Ramsay: Is the Minister aware of an issue that has come to my attention in discussing this with farmers, namely the difference between the number of farmers

impact on the environment and on climate change. My vision for farming in Wales is to see more food and a broader range of foods produced in Wales, but with less of an impact on the environment and the climate.

Tir Gofal was launched in 1999 and Tir Cynnal in 2005. Their aims reflect the ideas and policies of their time. The common agricultural policy health check set new challenges for agriculture. The main thrust now is to get farmers to manage their land sustainably, in a way that addresses climate change and uses natural resources—carbon, water, soil, habitats and biodiversity—sustainably. In order to meet those new challenges, there are four aspects to Glastir. There is the all-Wales level, which is what most speakers, with the exception of Mick Bates, have restricted themselves to today. Then there is the targeted level, which gives specific priority to water management and carbon storage. Then there is the woodland creation scheme, which is a substantial scheme, and the on-farm energy efficiency scheme.

I agree with the motion that it is important that we do not lose some of the gains that have come in the wake of Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal. For that reason, I announced in July 2009 that I would extend Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal agreements until 2013. I did that in order to facilitate the move to Glastir. The management options available under the all-Wales element compensate farmers for sustaining environmental improvements made through the current agri-environmental schemes. Glastir will ensure that these investments are not lost. There are also transitional arrangements in place for Tir Mynydd, with exit payments being paid in 2012 and 2013.

Nick Ramsay: A ydy'r Gweinidog yn gwybod am fater a ddaeth i'm sylw wrth drafod hyn â ffermwyr, sef y gwahaniaeth rhwng nifer y ffermwyr sy'n cofrestru ar

who are registering for the scheme and those who ultimately intend to follow through with it, as some may feel an obligation to apply for it but are sceptical about whether it is for them? Are you aware of that issue and have you had any discussions with farmers about it?

Elin Jones: No farmer is under any obligation to apply for Glastir. Ultimately, those farmers involved will decide whether to sign a five-year management agreement next year. However, unless the application comes in by next Monday, there will be no opportunity next year to join for 2012.

I raddau helaeth, bydd y broses pontio hon gyda'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol a Thir Mynydd yn golygu na fydd rhai ffermwyr o dan bwysau ariannol i ymuno â Glastir yn ei flwyddyn gyntaf yn 2012, a gallant ohirio dod i mewn tan 2013 neu 2014. Er hynny, yr wyf yn fwy ymwybodol na neb, o ystyried nifer y ffermwyr yr wyf wedi'u cyfarfod dros y mis diwethaf, o'r feirniadaeth dorfol ar Glastir a hefyd rai o'r problemau ymarferol y mae rhai ffermwyr yn eu hwynebu wrth edrych ar ofynion Glastir—cyfeiriodd Kirsty at rai ohonynt.

Cred rhai hefyd nad yw'r cymhelliad ariannol yn ddigonol i fynd i mewn i Glastir. Fodd bynnag, yn hynny o beth, mae'n dwylo wedi'u clymu gan reoliadau Ewrop, sy'n caniatáu taliad ariannol am waith amgylcheddol ar sail incwm a gollir neu gostau a ysgwyddir yn unig. Mae'r gyfundrefn hon, o dan reoliadau Ewrop, wedi bod yn broblem inni wrth ddatblygu Glastir.

Mae gennyf i ac eraill, felly, ddiddordeb yn y nifer a fydd yn gwneud cais erbyn dydd Llun nesaf. Fe fyddaf yn awyddus i ddadansoddi'r ceisiadau hynny i weld, er enghraifft, faint o'r ffermwyr sydd o ardaloedd llai ffafriol neu o dir isel, faint o ffermwyr llaeth, sawl un ohonynt sydd ond yn derbyn taliadau Tir Mynydd ar hyn o bryd ac felly'n mynd mewn i gynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol am y tro cyntaf, a faint ohonynt fydd yn llwyddo i gyd-redeg cynllun Tir Gofal neu Tir Cynnal gyda Glastir yn 2012. Byddaf yn hapus i

gyfer y cynllun a'r rheini sy'n bwriadu ei gyflawni yn y pen draw, gan fod rhai'n teimlo rhwymedigaeth i ymgeisio amdano ond yn amau nad yw'n addas iddynt hwy? A ydych chi'n ymwybodol o'r mater hwnnw ac a ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau â ffermwyr amdano?

Elin Jones: Nid yw'r un ffermwr o dan unrhyw rwymedigaeth i ymgeisio am gynllun Glastir. Yn y pen draw, bydd y ffermwyr hynny dan sylw'n penderfynu a fyddant yn llofnodi cytundeb rheoli pum mlynedd y flwyddyn nesaf. Fodd bynnag, heblaw bod y cais yn cyrraedd erbyn dydd Llun nesaf, ni fydd cyfle'r flwyddyn nesaf i ymuno ar gyfer 2012.

To a large extent, the transition process for the agri-environment and Tir Mynydd schemes will mean that some farmers will be under no financial pressure to join Glastir in its first year in 2012, and they may delay going into it until 2013 or 2014. Nevertheless, I am aware more than anyone, given the number of farmers I have met over the past month, of mass criticism of Glastir and also of some of the practical problems that some farmers face when considering the Glastir requirements—some of which Kirsty mentioned.

Some also believe that the financial incentive for entering Glastir is not enough. However, in that respect, our hands are tied by European regulations that allow a financial payment for environmental work based solely on lost income or costs incurred. This system, under European regulations, has been a problem for us in developing Glastir.

I, and others, are therefore interested in the number of applications received by next Monday. I will be anxious to analyse those applications so see, for example, how many of the farmers are from less favoured areas of or from the lowlands, how many are dairy farmers, how many are currently in receipt of Tir Mynydd payments only and are therefore first-time entrants to an agri-environmental scheme, and how many will succeed in running the Tir Gofal or Tir Cynnal schemes jointly with Glastir in 2012. I will be happy

wneud datganiad llafar i'r Cynulliad, cyn y Nadolig os bydd yr amserlen yn caniatáu, ar y dadansoddiad hwnnw yn sgîl yr hyn a ddaw i law ddydd Llun nesaf. Byddaf hefyd yn cymryd y cyfle, ar ôl dydd Llun, i ystyried y camau nesaf ar Glastir.

Mae'r cynnig yn gofyn am rif targed ar gyfer nifer y ffermwyr i ymuno â Glastir. Ar hyn o bryd, mae dros 7,000 o ffermwyr o fewn Tir Gofal a Tir Cynnal, o gymharu â 17,000 sy'n derbyn y taliad sengl. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud, un o fwiadau Glastir yw ymestyn nifer y ffermwyr sy'n derbyn taliadau am wneud gwaith amaeth-amgylcheddol. Felly, pan fydd y cynllun wedi'i gyflwyno'n llawn yn 2014, dim ond os bydd mwy na'r 7,300 hynny yng nghytundeb Glastir bryd hynny y bydd Glastir yn llwyddiannus yn ein barn ni. Dyna pam y soniais am y ffigur o 10,000 yng nghynhadledd Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr yn ddiweddar.

Ddeunaw mis wedi imi gyhoeddi'r newid i Glastir, a phum diwrnod cyn y dyddiad cau ar gyfer y rownd gyntaf, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gosod cynnig yn gofyn am ohirio'r cynllun.

I would like to conclude by saying that the decision

'over the Axis 2 review is forward thinking and a step in the right direction towards an agri-environment scheme which works for farmers and for wildlife... The decision is the best solution to ensure an effective land management scheme'.

Those are not my words. They are quoted from a Lib Dem press release made when I announced Glastir in May 2009. Then again, I have learned over the years never to expect consistency from the Lib Dems.

Kirsty Williams: Thank you, Minister. The disappointment for me this afternoon is that in sharing your vision to have a better balance between food production and sustainable food production—and we acknowledge that farming can bring a lot to

to make an oral statement to the Assembly, before Christmas if the schedule will allow, on that analysis in light of what comes in next Monday. I will also take the opportunity, after Monday, to consider the next steps for Glastir.

The motion asks for a target figure for the number of farmers who join Glastir. Currently, over 7,000 farmers are in Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal, compared to the 17,000 who receive the single farm payment. As I have said, one of the intentions in Glastir is to extend the number of farmers receiving payments for undertaking agri-environmental work. So, when the scheme has been fully rolled out in 2014, Glastir will only be judged a success in our opinion if there are more than the 7,300 currently signed up to the Glastir agreement. That is why I mentioned the figure of 10,000 at the recent NFU conference.

Eighteen months after I announced the change to Glastir and five days before the deadline for the first round, the Liberal Democrats are proposing a motion requesting that the scheme be deferred.

Hoffwn gloi drwy ddweud bod y penderfyniad

am adolygiad Echel 2 yn un craff ac yn gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir tuag at gynllun amaeth-amgylchedd sy'n gweithio i ffermwyr ac i fywyd gwylt ... Y penderfyniad yw'r ateb gorau i sicrhau cynllun rheoli tir effeithiol.

Nid fy ngeiriau i mo'r rheini. Fe'u dyfynnwyd o ddatganiad i'r wasg a wnaethpwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol pan gyhoeddais Glastir ym mis Mai 2009. Eto i gyd, rwyf wedi dysgu dros y blynyddoedd i beidio byth â disgwyl cysondeb oddi wrth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Kirsty Williams: Diolch, Weinidog. Y siom imi'r prynhawn yma wrth rannu eich gweledigaeth i gael gwell cydbwysedd rhwng cynhyrchu bwyd a chynhyrchu bwyd yn gynaliadwy—ac rydym yn cydnabod bod ffermio'n gallu cyfrannu llawer i'ch helpu i

the table to help you meet your environmental goals—the reality of Glastir is very different to the hopes and aspirations that were raised by your initial statement. As we are in this crucial period when we are expecting people to fill out the forms, you know as well as I do that those aspirations that you and all those environmental organisations have, will only be fulfilled if farmers actually fill in those forms and sign those agreements. You know as well as I do that there is real concern in the farming industry about the practical implementation of this scheme. I would not disagree with the direction. The problem is that we are in danger of walking into a situation where we will not achieve what we want because of the limitations of this scheme.

I made a mistake at the beginning by assuming that people in the Chamber would understand how this scheme will work; obviously not in some cases. Joyce, you seemed not to realise that there is no straight swap between Glastir and Tir Mynydd payments. The people who are most likely to lose out under this scheme are not those in Tir Gofal or those in Tir Cynnal, but those who, unable to get into either of those schemes, rely on Tir Mynydd payments to maintain a viable business and will not be able to get into Glastir. It is simply disingenuous to say that there will be no loss of income, because the Minister has admitted that she has carried out no scoping project whatsoever to identify what the losses will be. For you to stand there and say that there will be no loss of income is simply not borne out by the facts. Your own Minister has acknowledged that she has not carried out that work.

The issue is that we need farmers to go into this scheme, but the way that it is currently constituted means that they will simply choose not to do so. That is because it does not pass the Government's own test. Is it simple to fill out the forms and access the scheme? No, it is not. Is it open to all? No, it is not. The Minister's own pilot study showed that 50 per cent of the farms that tried to accrue the points to get into the scheme failed to do so. It is simply not open

gyrraedd eich nodau amgylcheddol—yw bod realiti Glastir yn wahanol iawn i'r gobeithion a'r dyheadau a godwyd yn eich datganiad gwreiddiol. A ninnau yn y cyfnod allweddol hwn pan ydym yn disgwyl i bobl llenwi'r ffurflenni, gwyddoch cystal â mi na fydd y dyheadau hynny sydd gennych chi a'r holl sefydliadau amgylcheddol hynny yn cael eu bodloni, heblaw bod ffermwyr yn llenwi'r ffurflenni hynny ac yn llofnodi'r cytundebau hynny. Gwyddoch cystal â mi fod pryder go iawn yn y diwydiant ffermio am weithredu'r cynllun hwn yn ymarferol. Ni fyddwn yn anghytuno â'r cyfeiriad. Y broblem yw ein bod yn mentro cerdded i sefyllfa lle na fyddwn yn cyflawni'r hyn a ddymunwn oherwydd cyfyngiadau'r cynllun hwn.

Gwneuthum gamgymeriad ar y dechrau drwy dybio y byddai pobl yn y Siambr yn deall sut bydd y cynllun hwn yn gweithio; roeddwn i'n amlwg yn anghywir mewn rhai achosion. Joyce, roedd fel petai nad oeddech yn sylweddoli nad oes cyfnewid union rhwng taliadau Glastir a thaliadau Tir Mynydd. Nid y rheini yng nghynllun Tir Gofal nac yng nghynllun Tir Cynnal yw'r bobl sy'n fwyaf tebygol o fod ar eu colled o dan y cynllun hwn, ond y rheini sy'n dibynnu ar daliadau Tir Mynydd, am nad allant ymuno â'r un o'r cynlluniau hyn, i gynnal busnes hyfyw ac na fyddant yn gallu cael i mewn i gynllun Glastir. Mae'n hollol annidwyll dweud na fydd incwm yn cael ei golli, oherwydd mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyfaddef nad yw wedi cynnal dim prosiect cwmpasu o gwbl i adnabod beth fydd y colledion. Nid ar sail ffaith y sefwch yno a dweud na fydd incwm yn cael ei golli. Mae eich Gweinidog eich hun wedi cydnabod nad yw hi wedi gwneud y gwaith hwnnw.

Y broblem yw bod arnom angen i ffermwyr fynd i mewn i'r cynllun hwn, ond mae'r ffordd y mae wedi'i gyfansoddi ar hyn o bryd yn golygu y byddant yn dewis peidio. Byddant yn gwneud hynny am nad yw'n bodloni prawf y Llywodraeth ei hun. A yw'n syml llenwi'r ffurflenni a chael at y cynllun? Nac yw. A yw ar agor i bawb? Nac yw. Dangosodd astudiaeth beilot y Gweinidog ei hun fod 50 y cant o'r ffermydd a geisiodd gronni'r pwyntiau i gael i mewn i'r cynllun

to all, and—

Elin Jones: Would you acknowledge that that pilot scheme was for Tir Gofal applicants in Meirionnydd? It was intended to prove whether it was possible to run Tir Gofal management agreements with Glastir, and it found that 50 per cent were not able to do that. That is why I introduced the Tir Mynydd exit payment.

Kirsty Williams: I acknowledge that Meirionnydd farmers played a part in the pilot study, but the last time I looked, Montgomeryshire farmers, who I know took part in that pilot study, were not based in Meirionnydd. My understanding of the pilot is that it used a much broader base. If that is not the case, and if what you are saying is correct—and I have no reason to say that you would not discuss the pilot fully—then it is even more worrying that you have not taken a broader cross-sample of farming businesses across Wales to find out what effect the scheme will have before moving forward.

It demonstrates that your assertion that this is an opportunity for all is simply not correct. That is a missed opportunity, because there is not a single farming business in Wales that does not have something to contribute to your goals for a better balance between food production and agri-environment. That is what we should have been aiming for with this particular scheme—a scheme that would allow as many farms as possible to participate and make the changes in farming practice that will deliver those environmental outcomes. I fear that what we will have instead is a scheme that will put farming businesses off participating in this type of activity, and the good work that has been secured under Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal will be lost. That momentum will be lost.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there are objections, and so I will defer voting until voting time.

wedi methu â gwneud hynny. Nid yw ar agor i bawb o gwbl, ac—

Elin Jones: A fyddech chi'n cydnabod bod y cynllun peilot hwnnw ar gyfer ymgeiswyr Tir Gofal ym Meirionnydd? Ei fwriad oedd profi a oedd yn bosibl rhedeg trefniadau rheoli Tir Gofal gyda Glastir, a chanfu nad oedd 50 y cant yn gallu gwneud hynny. Am y rheswm hwnnw y cyflwynais daliad ymadael Tir Mynydd.

Kirsty Williams: Rwy'n cydnabod bod ffermwyr Meirionnydd wedi chwarae rhan yn yr astudiaeth beilot, ond y tro diwethaf imi edrych, nid oedd ffermwyr sir Drefaldwyn, y gwn iddynt gymryd rhan yn yr astudiaeth beilot honno, yn Sir Feirionnydd. Fel y deallaf fi, defnyddiodd yr astudiaeth beilot sylfaen lawer ehangach. Os nad felly, ac os yw'r hyn a ddywedwch yn gywir—ac nid oes rheswm gennyf dros ddweud na fyddech yn trafod y peilot yn llawn—mae'n peri mwy o ofid byth nad ydych wedi cymryd croes-sampl ehangach o fusnesau ffermio ledled Cymru i gael gwybod pa effaith a gaiff y cynllun cyn bwrw ymlaen.

Mae'n arddangos bod eich honiad bod hwn yn gyfle i bawb yn anghywir. Mae hwnnw'n gyfle wedi'i golli, oherwydd nid oes un busnes ffermio yng Nghymru nad oes ganddo rywbeth i'w gyfrannu at eich nodau am well cydbwysedd rhwng cynhyrchu bwyd ac amaeth-amgylchedd. At hynny y dylasem fod yn anelu gyda'r cynllun arbennig hwn—cynllun a fyddai'n caniatáu i gynifer o ffermydd â phosibl gymryd rhan a gwneud y newidiadau mewn arfer ffermio a fydd yn cyflenwi'r canlyniadau amgylcheddol hynny. Ofnaf mai'r hyn a fydd gennym yn hytrach fydd cynllun a fydd yn annog busnesau ffermio i beidio â chyfranogi yn y math hwn o weithgarwch, ac y bydd y gwaith da a sicrhawyd o dan gynllun Tir Gofal a chynllun Tir Cynnal wedi'i golli. Bydd y momentwm hwnnw wedi'i golli.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Y cynnig yw cytuno ar y cynnig heb welliant. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod, ac felly gohiriaf y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Does anyone wish for the bell to be rung and the meeting adjourned? I see that no-one does.

A oes unrhyw un yn dymuno canu'r gloch a gohirio'r cyfarfod? Gwelaf nad oes.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Cynnig NDM4588: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Motion NDM4588: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4588: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.
Amendment1 to NDM4588: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor

Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 1.
Amendment 1 agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4588: O blaid 44, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2 to NDM4588: For 44, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Veronica
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Watson, Joyce
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
 The following Member abstained:

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 2.
 Amendment 2 agreed.*

5.40 p.m.

Cynnig NDM4588 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM4588 as amended:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn nodi'r cynnydd yn y disgwyliad oes yng Nghymru sy'n ddangosydd allweddol o welliant yn iechyd y cyhoedd;

1. Notes the increase in life expectancy in Wales which is a key indicator of improvement in public health;

2. Yn nodi'r heriau sy'n parhau ym maes iechyd y cyhoedd;

2. Notes the public health challenges that remain;

3. Yn nodi bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y trywydd iawn i fodloni ymrwymiad Cymru'n Un ynghylch iechyd y cyhoedd drwy'r strategaeth 'Ein Dyfodol Iach'.

3. Notes that the Welsh Assembly Government is on course to meet the One Wales commitment on public health, through the 'Our Healthy Future' strategy.

4. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i gefnogi capasiti iechyd yr amgylchedd yng Nghymru er mwyn i wasanaethau iechyd yr amgylchedd gael y màs critigol er mwyn gallu mynd i'r afael yn iawn â phroblemau presennol a phosibl ym maes iechyd y cyhoedd.

4. Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to do all it can to support environmental health capacity in Wales so that environmental health services have the critical mass to properly address current and potential public health issues.

Cynnig NDM4588 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.

Motion NDM4588 as amended: For 37, Abstain 0, Against 9.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 German, Veronica
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Asghar, Mohammad
 Bourne, Nick
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Ramsay, Nick

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM4588 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
 Motion NDM4588 as amended agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4590: O blaid 15, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 30.
 Motion NDM4590: For 15, Abstain 1, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Veronica
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Law, Trish

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Hart, Edwina

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4590: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.
Amendment 1 to NDM4590: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4590: O blaid 15, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 2 to NDM4590: For 15, Abstain 1, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Hart, Edwina

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM4590 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. Yn cydnabod yr hyn sydd wedi'i gyflawni gan y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol presennol;

2. Yn nodi nad yw'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol presennol yn mynd i'r afael â'r heriau yn y dyfodol o ran y newid yn yr hinsawdd, dal carbon a rheoli dŵr, fel y nodir yn Archwiliad Iechyd y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin ac nad oeddent wedi'u cynllunio i fynd i'r afael â hwy;

Motion NDM4590 as amended:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Acknowledges the achievements of the current agri-environmental schemes;

2. Notes that the existing agri-environmental schemes do not and were not designed to meet the future challenges of climate change, carbon capture and water management, as set out in the Common Agricultural Policy Health check;

3. *Yn nodi na fydd Glastir yn llawn weithredol tan 2014 ac yn croesawu'r trefniadau trosiannol a roddwyd yn eu lle ar gyfer Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal a Thir Mynydd ar gyfer 2012 a 2013.*

3. *Notes that Glastir will not be fully up and running until 2014 and welcomes the transitional arrangements put in place for Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal and Tir Mynydd for 2012 and 2013.*

*Cynnig NDM4590 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.
Motion NDM4590 as amended: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Veronica
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM4590 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Motion NDM4590 as amended agreed.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Gwasanaethau Iechyd yn Sir Benfro Health Services in Pembrokeshire

Paul Davies: I have agreed that Angela Burns and Alun Davies may have a minute each of my time. I have brought forward the debate on health services in Pembrokeshire because, as the Assembly Member for Preseli Pembrokeshire, I am passionate about the

Paul Davies: Rwyf wedi cytuno y caiff Angela Burns ac Alun Davies funud yr un o'm hamser. Rwyf wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl am wasanaethau iechyd yn sir Benfro oherwydd rwy'n un brwd am y materion y mae fy etholwyr yn ymboeni amdanynt, a minnau'n

issues that my constituents care about. One issue that the people I represent care about deeply is our health service. That is clear from the constituency-wide survey that my colleagues and I have been conducting in Preseli Pembrokeshire over the past two months—the NHS is clearly their top priority. I firmly believe that I was elected three and a half years ago in response to the threats that existed then to services at Withybush General Hospital. At that time, one of my key pledges was to protect local health services in Pembrokeshire, and that continues to be one of my key priorities.

Some of us have recently been accused of scaremongering for daring to raise concerns about the reduction of services at Withybush General Hospital. Clearly, it is not scaremongering when the facts are staring us in the face. Orthodontic services have recently been transferred from Withybush hospital to Swansea, and in the last few days post-mortem services have been transferred from Pembrokeshire to Glangwili hospital in Carmarthen. It is not scaremongering when Haverfordwest Town Council, a democratically elected body, called a public meeting two weeks ago to discuss the concerns of the people that it represents and the representations that it had received from local residents. Surely, Alun Jones, chairman of the Pembrokeshire local committee of the Hywel Dda Community Health Council, is not scaremongering in saying, on hearing the news that post-mortem services were being lost at Withybush hospital, that he and his members were concerned at the news of yet another transfer of services away from Withybush General Hospital. It is simply disingenuous of people to accuse others of scaremongering in this context.

It is definitely not scaremongering when a document such as the 'Rural Health Services Strategy Spend to Save Plan' was put together by Hywel Dda Local Health Board, and we were only told about it when it was leaked in August of this year. The document clearly talks about the centralisation of high-risk, consultant-led obstetric services at Glangwili hospital, the centralisation of acute

Aelod y Cynulliad ar gyfer Preseli Sir Benfro. Un peth y mae'r bobl a gynrychiolaf yn ymboeni'n ddwfn amdano yw ein gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae hynny'n amlwg o'r arolwg drwy'r etholaeth gyfan y bu fy nghydweithwyr a minnau'n ei gynnal ym Mhreseli Sir Benfro dros y ddeufis ddiwethaf-mae'n amlwg mai'r GIG yw eu prif flaenoriaeth. Credaf yn gadarn y cefais fy ethol dair mlynedd a hanner yn ôl mewn ymateb i'r bygythiadau ar y pryd i wasanaethau yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwyn Helyg. Ar y pryd, un o'm prif addewidion oedd amddiffyn gwasanaethau iechyd lleol yn sir Benfro, a honno yw un o'm blaenoriaethau allweddol o hyd.

Cyhuddwyd rhai ohonom yn ddiweddar o godi bwganod am fentro codi pryderon am leihau gwasanaethau yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwyn Helyg. Yn amlwg, nid codi bwganod mohono pan fydd y ffeithiau'n gwbl amlwg inni. Trosglwyddwyd gwasanaethau orthodontig yn ddiweddar o ysbyty Llwyn helyg i Abertawe, ac yn yr ychydig ddiwrnodau diwethaf trosglwyddwyd gwasanaethau post-mortem o sir Benfro i ysbyty Glangwili yng Nghaerfyrddin. Nid codi bwganod mohono pan fydd Cyngor Tref Hwlfordd, corff a etholwyd yn ddemocratig, yn galw cyfarfod cyhoeddus bythefnos yn ôl i drafod pryderon y bobl a gynrychiola a'r sylwadau a gafodd gan breswylwyr lleol. Siawns nad yw Alun Jones, cadeirydd pwyllgor lleol sir Benfro ar Gyngor Iechyd Cymunedol Hywel Dda, yn codi bwganod ar neb wrth ddweud, ar glywed y newyddion bod ysbyty Llwyn Helyg yn colli gwasanaethau post-mortem, ei fod ef a'i aelodau'n poeni am y newyddion bod gwasanaeth arall eto'n cael ei drosglwyddo i ffwrdd o Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwyn Helyg. Annidwylledd llwyr yw pobl yn cyhuddo eraill o godi bwganod yn y cyd-destun hwn .

Nid codi bwganod mohono o gwbl pan gafodd dogfen fel 'Cynllun Gwario i Arbed Strategaeth Gwasanaethau Iechyd Gwledig' ei llunio gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda, heb inni glywed sôn amdani nes iddi gael ei rhydau'n ddamweiniol ym mis Awst eleni. Mae'r ddogfen yn siarad yn amlwg am ganoli gwasanaethau obstetrig uchel eu risg, a arweinir gan ymgynghorwyr yn ysbyty

paediatric services at Glangwili, and the centralisation of complex medical, surgical and trauma services at Glangwili. In other words, all those services will be transferred from Worthybush hospital in Haverfordwest to Glangwili hospital in Carmarthen.

I fully appreciate that the document has been withdrawn and replaced by other documents. Indeed, the local health board has apologised for its publication. However, it is worrying that a document of this nature was put together in the first place, because it smacks of the 'Designed to Deliver' document produced some four or five years ago that was rejected by the people of Pembrokeshire. I am concerned that the documents that have replaced the one that was leaked in August are still unclear, but I accept that I have an opportunity to express my views and to comment on those. I will be doing so in due course.

However, one issue that the Minister could clarify is why a document such as the one leaked in August was produced in the first place. In her response, could she tell us whether she asked the local health board for such a document or whether the board took it upon itself to produce it? I would be very grateful for an explanation on this matter. Given these concerns, I have highlighted this issue to the Assembly's Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee, which is undertaking an inquiry into NHS reviews. I have asked it to include the Hywel Dda health board area in its inquiry given that services have been lost at Worthybush hospital recently.

It is extremely important that people can easily access the health services that they need locally, should they live in Crymych or Cardiff, Haverfordwest or Harlech, St Davids or Swansea. The job of politicians, and particularly politicians who are responsible for public services, is to ensure equality of access to health services across Wales. Indeed, the 'One Wales' agreement states:

Glangwili, canoli gwasanaethau paediatrig aciwt yng Nglangwili, a chanoli gwasanaethau meddygol, llawfeddygol a thrawma cymhleth yng Nglangwili. Mewn geiriau eraill, bydd yr holl wasanaethau hynny'n cael eu trosglwyddo o ysbyty Llwyn Helyg yn Hwlfordd i ysbyty Glangwili yng Nghaerfyrddin.

Gwerthfawrogaf yn llawn bod y ddogfen wedi'i thynnu'n ôl a bod dogfennau eraill wedi cymryd ei lle. Yn wir, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi ymddiheuro am ei chyhoeddi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n destun gofid bod dogfen o'r natur hon wedi'i llunio yn y lle cyntaf, am ei bod yn sawru o ddogfen 'Cynllun Cyflenwi' a luniwyd rhyw bedair neu bum mlynedd yn ôl a wrthodwyd gan bobl sir Benfro. Rwy'n poeni bod y dogfennau a ddisodlodd yr un a ryddhawyd ar ddamwain ym mis Awst yn dal yn aneglur, ond derbyniaf fod gennyf gyfle i fynegi fy marn ac i roi sylwadau amdani. Byddaf yn gwneud hynny maes o law.

Fodd bynnag, un peth y gallai'r Gweinidog ei egluro yw pam y lluniwyd dogfen fel yr un a ryddhawyd yn ddamweiniol ym mis Awst yn y lle cyntaf. Yn ei hymateb, a allai ddweud wrthym a ofynnodd hi i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol am ddogfen felly neu a aeth y bwrdd ati ar ei liwt ei hun i'w llunio? Byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn i gael eglurhad am y mater hwn. O ystyried y pryderon hyn, rwyf wedi amlygu'r mater i Bwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol y Cynlluniad, sy'n cynnal ymchwiliad i adolygiadau'r GIG. Rwyf wedi gofyn iddo gynnwys ardal bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda yn ei ymchwiliad o ystyried bod ysbyty Llwyn Helyg wedi colli gwasanaethau yn ddiweddar.

Mae'n hynod bwysig bod pobl yn gallu cael yn hawdd at y gwasanaethau iechyd sydd eu hangen arnynt yn lleol, ni waeth a ydynt yn byw yng Nghrymych neu yng Nghaerdydd, yn Hwlfordd neu yn Harlech, yn Nhyddewi neu yn Abertawe. Gwaith gwleidyddion, ac yn arbennig gwleidyddion sy'n gyfrifol am wasanaethau cyhoeddus, yw sicrhau bod yr un gwasanaethau iechyd ar gael i bawb ledled Cymru. Yn wir, dywed cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un':

‘We aspire to a world-class health service that is available to everyone, irrespective of whom they are or where they live in Wales, and at the time when they need it.’

Of course, I very much agree with that statement, but I can tell you from talking to my constituents that it certainly does not feel like that to them at the moment. Let me give you some real life examples of experiences that some people in Pembrokeshire have endured. A woman who suffered a bleed in the head in July this year waited 17 weeks before receiving an MRI scan, after initially been told that she would receive a referral within three weeks on the NHS. Due to the long wait, she decided to go private for the MRI scan. Let me remind you of a case that I brought to the Chamber’s attention in May this year, in which a 90-year-old woman was told that she would have to wait for up to two years to have her hearing aid tested. I am sure that all of us in the Chamber would agree that cases such as these are completely unacceptable, and yet they are still a reality for many people in the area that I represent.

There are areas of Pembrokeshire that are not only limited by their rurality, but are classified as areas of deprivation. As such, it is more important than ever to ensure that their local health services are protected. I fully recognise that delivering health services in rural areas such as that which I represent is very challenging. A major challenge is that of people having to travel long distances to attend their nearest hospital. This is made even more complicated by the lack of regular public transport, which adds to the cost and the time it takes to access health care. I am given to understand that distance plays a huge part in delayed diagnosis of certain chronic conditions. If distance has a knock-on effect by decreasing survival rates, it is even more important that services in hospitals such as Withybush are sustained and not centralised.

As retired surgeon Peter Milewski said,

‘If you have a heart attack in St Davids, or

‘Ein huchelgais yw creu gwasanaeth iechyd o’r radd flaenaf sydd ar gael i bawb pan fo’i angen arnynt, waeth pwy ydynt neu ymhle y maent yn byw yng Nghymru.’

Wrth reswm, cytunaf yn fawr iawn â’r datganiad hwnnw, ond gallaf ddweud wrthyfch o siarad â’r hetholwyr nad yw’n teimlo fel hynny iddynt hwy o gwbl ar hyn o bryd. Gadewch imi roi ichi rai enghreifftiau go iawn o brofiadau y mae rhai pobl yn sir Benfro wedi’u dioddef. Bu i fenyw a ddiodefodd waedu yn ei phen ym mis Gorffennaf eleni aros 17 wythnos cyn cael sgan MRI, ar ôl cael gwybod yn wreiddiol y byddai’n cael ei hatgyfeirio ymhlen tair wythnos ar y GIG. Am iddi aros mor hir, penderfynodd gael y sgan MRI yn breifat. Gadewch imi eich atgoffa o achos y soniais wrth y Siambr amdano ym mis Mai eleni, pan ddywedwyd wrth fenyw 90 oed y byddai’n rhaid iddi aros hyd at ddwy flynedd i gael prawf i’w chymorth clyw. Rwy’n siŵr y byddai pob un ohonom yn y Siambr yn cytuno bod achosion fel y rhain yn gwbl annerbyniol, ac eto maent yn dal yn realiti i lawer o bobl yn yr ardal a gynrychiolaf.

Ceir ardaloedd yn sir Benfro y cyfyngir arnynt gan eu natur wledig, ond sydd hefyd wedi’u dosbarthu’n ardaloedd o amddifadedd. Fel y cyfryw, mae’n bwysicach nag erioed sicrhau bod eu gwasanaethau iechyd lleol yn cael eu gwarchod. Rwy’n cydnabod yn llawn ei bod yn heriol iawn darparu gwasanaethau iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel y rhai a gynrychiolaf. Un her fawr yw bod pobl yn gorfod teithio pellteroedd i fynd i’w hysbyty agosaf. Mae hyn yn gymhlethach byth oherwydd y diffyg cludiant cyhoeddus rheolaidd, sy’n ychwanegu at y gost a’r amser a gymerir i gael gofal iechyd. Rwyf ar ddeall bod pellter yn chwarae rhan enfawr mewn oedi cyn cael diagnosis o gyflyrau cronig penodol. Os yw pellter yn cael effaith ganlyniadol drwy ostwng cyfraddau goroesi, mae’n bwysicach byth cynnal gwasanaethau mewn ysbytai fel Llwyn Helyg ac nid eu canoli.

Fel y dywedodd y llawfeddyg sydd wedi ymddeol Peter Milewski,

‘Os cewch chi drawiad ar y galon yn

fall and rupture your spleen, are you really going to get to Glangwili in Carmarthen in time?...You can save plenty of money centralising services at very little cost—just the death of two or three young people.'

I fully accept and welcome the fact that we have seen additional investment in a new accident and emergency facility at Withybush hospital, which the Minister opened earlier this year. However, I have already been told by some of my constituents that they have waited for four, five or even six hours to be seen at this new department due to staff shortages. What is the point of having a new accident and emergency facility without enough staff? Clearly, the staff do a great job in very difficult circumstances, but it is the responsibility of the local health board to address these issues. I accept that this can be very difficult, but surely this is what the local health board gets paid for: to deal with some of these difficult problems. Although we have seen this additional investment, I have to say that it has always been at the back of my mind that, once this investment was made, there would always be a temptation to centralise other services away from Withybush and to transfer certain services eastwards to Carmarthen.

It is essential that an area that draws in tens of thousands of visitors and tourists each year has sufficient health provisions to cope with the frequency of visitors. Understandably, people want to holiday in areas where they feel safe, not where health services are few and far between.

5.50 p.m.

As I mentioned earlier, I recently attended a public meeting arranged by Haverfordwest Town Council, along with my colleague, Angela Burns. The people who attended that meeting were extremely disappointed that the senior management of the health board or, indeed, representatives of the Hywel Dda Local Health Board were not present to address the concerns of local residents. Of

Nhyddewi, neu os byddwch chi'n cwmpo ac yn torri llengig eich dueg, a ydych chi'n wir yn mynd i gyrraedd Glangwili yng Nghaerfyrddin mewn pryd?...Gallwch arbed digonedd o arian yn canoli gwasanaethau heb lawer iawn o gost—dim ond marwolaeth dau neu dri o bobl ifanc.'

Derbyniaf a chroesawaf yn llwyr y ffaith inni weld buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn cyfleuster damweiniau ac achosion brys newydd yn ysbyty Llwyn Helyg, a agorwyd gan y Gweinidog yn gynharach eleni. Fodd bynnag, rwyf eisoes wedi clywed oddi wrth rai o'm hetholwyr eu bod wedi aros pedair, pump neu hyd yn oed chwe awr i gael eu gweld yn yr adran newydd hon am fod prinder staff. Beth yw diben cael cyfleuster damweiniau ac achosion brys newydd heb ddigon o staff? Yn amlwg, mae'r staff yn gwneud gwaith gwyach mewn amgylchiadau anodd iawn, ond cyfrifoldeb y bwrdd iechyd lleol yw mynd i'r afael â'r pethau hyn. Derbyniaf y gall hyn fod yn anodd iawn, ond onid am hyn y mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yn cael ei dalu: sef ymdrin â rhai o'r problemau anodd hyn. Er ein bod wedi gweld y buddsoddiad ychwanegol hwn, mae'n rhaid imi ddweud y bu bob amser yng nghefn fy meddwl y byddai temtasiwn bob amser, ar ôl gwneud y buddsoddiad hwn, i ganoli gwasanaethau eraill i ffwrdd o Lwyn Helyg a throsglwyddo rhai gwasanaethau tua'r dwyrain i Gaerfyrddin.

Mae'n hanfodol bod gan ardal sy'n denu degau ar filoedd o ymwelwyr a thwristiaid bob blwyddyn ddigon o ddarpariaethau iechyd i ymdopi â'r ymwelwyr aml. Wrth reswm, mae pobl am fynd ar wyliau mewn ardaloedd lle maent yn teimlo'n ddiogel, nid lle mae gwasanaethau iechyd yn brin.

Fel y soniais yn gynharach, bûm yn ddiweddar mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus a drefnwyd gan Gyngor Tref Hwlfordd, ynghyd â'm cydweithwraig, Angela Burns. Roedd y bobl yn y cyfarfod hwnnw'n siomedig iawn nad oedd uwch reolwyr y bwrdd iechyd nac, yn wir, cynrychiolwyr Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda yn bresennol i fynd i'r afael â phryderon preswylwyr lleol.

course, the Minister has made it clear in the past that operational, day-to-day issues are matters for the local health boards to address and I am sure that the Minister would agree that it is absolutely essential that the people who run our health service engage with our communities. I believe that the health service should be open, transparent and accountable to the people it serves.

I fully accept that health services must be delivered safely and that patient safety must be of paramount importance. I also accept that some services have been lost at Withybush hospital, it seems, due to the difficulty in recruiting staff. This creates problems in delivering health services in Pembrokeshire. I am given to understand that there are still problems recruiting middle and junior grade doctors and it is felt that more rural or isolated areas like Pembrokeshire are unable to attract doctors over areas like Cardiff and other urban areas. However, it is clear that more needs to be done to attract junior doctors to posts at more rural hospitals. While I appreciate that the Minister has worked with the Home Office on this issue, I would be grateful for an update from the Minister, in her response, on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to support the local health board to attract staff to areas like Pembrokeshire.

These shortages, not only of junior doctors but all levels of staff, create fear among the current staff and the local community. By not employing more staff to cover the services, a hospital becomes unsustainable. It also means that the staff who are employed face being overworked and overstretched, leading to lower levels of morale. I hope that the recruitment problems in certain areas of healthcare are not being used as a reason for not employing staff in other departments. I hope that these problems are not being used as an excuse to reduce services at Withybush hospital or, as someone said recently of the threat to downgrade the hospital, that we will not see its death by a 1,000 cuts. The Welsh Assembly Government and the local health board must be determined to address the

Wrth reswm, mae'r Gweinidog wedi egluro yn y gorffennol fod materion gweithredol, pob dydd yn faterion i'r byrddau iechyd lleol fynd i'r afael â hwy ac rwy'n siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno ei bod yn gwbl hanfodol i'r bobl sy'n rhedeg ein gwasanaeth iechyd ymgysylltu â'n cymunedau. Credaf y dylai'r gwasanaeth iechyd fod yn agored, yn dryloyw ac yn atebol i'r bobl a wasanaetha.

Derbyniaf yn llwyr ei bod yn rhaid i wasanaethau iechyd gael eu darparu'n ddiogel a'i bod yn rhaid i ddiogelwch cleifion fod yn holl bwysig. Derbyniaf hefyd fod rhai gwasanaethau wedi'u colli yn ysbyty Llwyn Helyg, mae'n debyg, oherwydd yr anhawster yn recriwtio staff. Mae hyn yn creu problemau wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd yn sir Benfro. Rwyf ar ddeall bod problemau'n parhau wrth geisio recriwtio meddygon canol ac iau ac y teimlir bod ardaloedd mwy gwledig neu anghysbell fel sir Benfro'n methu â denu meddygon wrth gystadlu ag ardaloedd fel Caerdydd ac ardaloedd trefol eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg bod angen gwneud mwy i ddenu meddygon iau i swyddi mewn ysbytai mwy gwledig. Er fy mod i'n gwerthfawrogi bod y Gweinidog wedi gweithio gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref ar y mater hwn, byddwn yn ddiolchgar cael gwybod y diweddaraf oddi wrth y Gweinidog, yn ei hymateb, am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i gefnogi'r bwrdd iechyd lleol i ddenu staff i ardaloedd fel sir Benfro.

Mae'r prinderau hyn, o ran meddygon iau ond hefyd staff ar bob lefel, yn creu ofn ymhlith y staff cyfredol a'r gymuned leol. Drwy beidio â chyflogi mwy o staff i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau, daw ysbyty'n anghynaliadwy. Mae'n golygu hefyd fod y staff sy'n cael eu cyflogi'n cael eu gorweithio a'u gwthio'n rhy bell, gan arwain at lefelau morâl is. Gobeithiaf nad yw'r problemau recriwtio mewn rhai meysydd gofal iechyd yn cael eu defnyddio fel rheswm dros beidio â chyflogi staff mewn adrannau eraill. Gobeithiaf nad yw'r problemau hyn yn cael eu defnyddio yn esgus i leihau gwasanaethau yn ysbyty Llwyn Helyg neu, fel y dywedodd rhywun yn ddiweddar am y byggythiad i israddio'r ysbyty, na fyddwn yn gweld ei farwolaeth fesul 1,000 o doriadau. Rhaid i

problems of recruitment and they must be resolute to ensure that services are not reduced at the hospital. It is critical that a recruitment strategy is put in place to ensure that no more services are transferred to Glangwili hospital or elsewhere.

We hear a lot about delivering more health services in our communities and closer to people's homes. This means delivering more of our health services through the primary care sector. I agree that this is a laudable aspiration. However, investment is needed in those services before we have a sensible and rational debate about the services being delivered through our hospitals.

I recently wrote to the Minister outlining how the 2006 primary care estate strategy in Pembrokeshire highlighted two existing surgeries in Milford Haven as being priorities for replacement. I was pleased to see that these proposals are being considered fully and are going through the scrutiny process. Milford Haven has an urban population with significant needs and, as a consequence, it has increased health and social care demands. Naturally, this puts a weight on primary care facilities. The existing surgeries lack space, and therefore the potential to alter or develop their building is limited. As I have said before, a new primary care resource centre would greatly facilitate inter-agency working and continuity of care. It would allow for a greater range of services and for chronic disease management to be delivered within the area.

It is clear that downgrading some services at a district general hospital will have an effect on other services at that hospital. As Peter Milewski, a retired former surgeon at Withybush hospital has said,

'You can't break up a district general hospital, a certain number of core services are interdependent and if you remove one the

Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol fod yn benderfynol o fynd i'r afael â phroblemau recriwtio ac yn benderfynol o sicrhau nad yw gwasanaethau'n cael eu lleihau yn yr ysbyty. Mae'n allweddol bod strategaeth recriwtio'n cael ei rhoi yn ei lle i sicrhau nad oes mwy o wasanaethau'n cael eu trosglwyddo i ysbyty Glangwili neu rywle arall.

Rydym yn clywed llawer am ddarparu mwy o wasanaethau iechyd yn ein cymunedau ac yn agosach at gartrefi pobl. Mae hyn yn golygu darparu mwy o'n gwasanaethau iechyd drwy'r sector gofal sylfaenol. Cytunaf fod hwn yn uchelgais canmoladwy. Fodd bynnag, mae angen buddsoddi yn y gwasanaethau hynny cyn inni gael dadl synhwyrol a rhesymegol am y gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu drwy ein hysbytai.

Ysgrifennais yn ddiweddar at y Gweinidog yn amlinellu'r ffordd yr oedd strategaeth ystâd gofal sylfaenol 2006 yn sir Benfro yn amlygu dwy feddygfa bresennol yn Aberdaugleddau fel blaenoriaethau i'w disodli. Roeddwn yn falch o weld bod y cynigion hyn yn cael eu hystyried yn llawn a'u bod yn destun y broses graffu. Mae gan Aberdaugleddau boblogaeth drefol a chanddi anghenion sylweddol ac, o ganlyniad, mae ganddi fwy o ofynion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yn naturiol, mae hyn yn rhoi pwysau ar gyfleusterau gofal sylfaenol. Mae prinder lle yn y meddygfeydd presennol, ac felly prin yw'r cyfleoedd i addasu neu ddatblygu eu hadeilad. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, byddai canolfan adnoddau gofal sylfaenol newydd yn hwyluso gwaith rhyngasiantaethol yn fawr a pharhad gofal hefyd. Byddai'n caniatáu ystod fwy o wasanaethau a rheoli clefydau cronig yn yr ardal.

Mae'n amlwg y bydd israddio rhai gwasanaethau mewn ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth yn effeithio ar wasanaethau eraill yn yr ysbyty hwnnw. Fel y mae Peter Milewski, cyn-lawfeddyg sydd wedi ymddeol o ysbyty Llwyn Helyg, wedi dweud,

'Ni allwch rannu ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth yn ddarnau, mae nifer penodol o wasanaethau craidd yn dibynnu ar ei gilydd ac os cewch

others will gradually go—it's a house of cards.'

It is therefore essential that the Welsh Assembly Government recognises that delivering health services in a rural area will inevitably be more expensive than in an urban area. Running a rural hospital will cost more than running an urban one.

Finally, I urge the Minister for Health and Social Services to give local health services in Pembrokeshire the support that they deserve. I hope that, today, she will reassure us that Withybush hospital will continue to be a district general hospital, that its services will be retained, and that the relentless drive for centralisation will be stopped, as it is not in the interests of the people whom I represent.

Alun Davies: I would like to thank Paul Davies for bringing this important issue to the Assembly's attention this afternoon and for allowing me to contribute to the debate. As Paul indicated in his contribution, we discovered by reading the *Western Telegraph* website last Thursday that post-mortem and histopathology services were being removed from Withybush hospital. That was news to us, and it was also news to members of the Hywel Dda Local Health Board, who were in a meeting with members of the general public at the time. They denied all knowledge of the story. While it was embarrassing for them, it is also indicative of an organisation that does not understand how to communicate internally or with the wider general public.

The lack of engagement with the public and within the board itself is simply unacceptable. I accept the board's statement that staff shortages prompted the decision to move these services temporarily to the West Wales General Hospital in Glangwili, and I believe that we all accept that the double-checking of tissue samples from biopsies is absolutely critical to ensure that mistakes are not made. We need to ensure that we have a safe and accurate service for patients, including my constituents. I also accept that these services will return to Withybush in the normal way.

chi wared ar un bydd y lleill yn mynd yn raddol—mae'n dŷ o gardiau.'

Mae'n hanfodol felly i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gydnabod y bydd darparu gwasanaethau iechyd mewn ardal wledig yn ddrutach yn anochel nag mewn ardal drefol. Bydd rhedeg ysbyty gwledig yn costio mwy na rhedeg un trefol.

Yn olaf, rwy'n cymhell y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i roi'r cymorth i wasanaethau iechyd lleol yn sir Benfro y maent yn ei haeddu. Gobeithiaf, heddiw, y bydd yn ein sicrhau y bydd ysbyty Llwyn Helyg yn parhau i fod yn ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth, y cedwir ei wasanaethau, ac y bydd yr ymgais di-baid i ganoli'n cael ei atal, am nad yw er budd y bobl a gynrychiolaf.

Alun Davies: Hoffwn ddiolch i Paul Davies am ddod â'r mater pwysig hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma ac am ganiatáu imi gyfrannu at y ddadl. Fel y nododd Paul yn ei gyfraniad, cawsom wybod drwy ddarllen gwefan y *Western Telegraph* ddydd Iau diwethaf fod gwasanaethau post-mortem a histopatholeg yn cael eu symud o ysbyty Llwyn Helyg. Roedd hynny'n newyddion i ni, ac roedd hefyd yn newyddion i aelodau Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda, a oedd mewn cyfarfod ag aelodau'r cyhoedd cyffredinol ar y pryd. Bu iddynt oll wadu eu bod yn gwybod am y stori. Roedd yn chwithig iddynt hwy, ond mae hefyd yn arwydd o sefydliad nad yw'n deall sut i gyfathrebu'n fewnol na chyfathrebu â'r cyhoedd cyffredinol ehangach.

Mae'r diffyg ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd ac ymgysylltu â'r bwrdd ei hun yn gwbl annerbyniol. Derbyniaf ddatganiad y bwrdd fod prinderau staff wedi ysgogi'r penderfyniad i symud y gwasanaethau hyn dros dro i Ysbyty Cyffredinol Gorllewin Cymru yng Nglangwili, a chredaf ein bod oll yn derbyn ei bod yn gwbl allweddol archwilio samplau meinwe biopsi ddwywaith i sicrhau nad oes camgymeriadau'n cael eu gwneud. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym wasanaeth diogel a chywir i gleifion, gan gynnwys fy etholwyr i. Derbyniaf hefyd y bydd y gwasanaethau hyn yn dychwelyd i

Lwyn Helyg yn y ffordd arferol.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Thank you, Alun.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Trefn. Diolch, Alun.

Alun Davies: If I could just—

Alun Davies: Pe gallwn i'n gyflym—

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. No, your minute is up. I call on Angela Burns to speak.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Trefn, Na, mae eich munud ar ben. Galwaf Angela Burns i siarad.

Angela Burns: I thank Paul for allowing me to take a minute of the debate. To reiterate what Paul and Alun have said, it is three years and five months, almost to the day, since I introduced a short debate on the future of Withybush hospital. Yet here we are today, still talking about it. It is incredibly important that we are talking about it, and the reason why, Minister, is simple: a lack of planning and investment. Either the guys over there are not listening to your mood music, or they are simply not doing the necessary planning. Alun has just raised a point about the histopathology department. Nine consultants are needed, but they had not thought about that over the preceding year and a half. There are loads of departments without the consultants that they need. This is a known shortage. Sixty-five per cent of the 2,000 casework cases that I have dealt with in the last three-and-a-half years are to do with the LHB. I have to write to the board almost every week. We should not run anything like this. There are serious issues that need to be addressed now. We do not want to be talking about Withybush hospital in three-and-a-half years' time. More importantly, we want Withybush hospital to be there in three-and-a-half years' time.

Angela Burns: Diolchaf i Paul am ganiatáu imi gael munud o'r ddadl. I ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd Paul ac Alun, mae'n dair blynedd a phum mis, i'r diwrnod bron, ers imi gyflwyno dadl fer ar ddyfodol ysbyty Llyn Helyg. Ond eto rydym yma heddiw, yn siarad amdano o hyd. Mae'n anhygoel o bwysig ein bod yn siarad amdano, ac mae'r rheswm am hynny, Weinidog, yn syml: diffyg cynllunio a buddsoddi. Naill ai nad yw'r rheini acw'n gwranddo ar eich cerddoriaeth atmosfferig, neu nid ydynt yn gwneud y gwaith cynllunio sydd ei angen. Mae Alun newydd godi pwynt am yr adran histopatholeg. Mae angen naw ymgynghorydd, ond nid oeddent wedi meddwl am hynny dros y flwyddyn a hanner gynt. Mae llwyth o adrannau heb yr ymgynghorwyr sydd eu hangen arnynt. Mae prinder hysbys. Mae 65% o'r 2,000 o achosion gwaith achos yr ymdriniais â hwy yn ystod y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf yn ymwneud â'r Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol. Mae'n rhaid imi ysgrifennu at y bwrdd bron bob wythnos. Ni ddylem weithredu dim tebyg i hyn. Mae materion difrifol y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy'n awr. Nid ydym am fod yn siarad am ysbyty Llyn Helyg ymhen tair blynedd a hanner. Yn fwy pwysig, rydym am i ysbyty Llyn Helyg fod yno ymhen tair blynedd a hanner.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I call on the Minister for Health and Social Services to reply to the debate.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Trefn. Galwaf y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ateb y ddadl.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): Thank you very much indeed, Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer. I congratulate you on the way that you have conducted business this afternoon. I am delighted that this issue has been chosen for debate, as it enables us to highlight the

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Diolch yn fawr iawn, Ddirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro. Rwy'n eich llongyfarch am y ffordd yr ydych wedi cynnal y trafodion y prynhawn yma. Rwyf wrth fy modd fod y mater hwn wedi'i ddewis ar gyfer dadl, am ei fod yn ein

extent to which this Government has invested in health services in Pembrokeshire, which is a true model of our commitment to improving health in rural areas.

In summary, since 2007, we have invested over £18 million-worth of capital expenditure in Pembroke to reconfigure and improve a whole range of services. This has included, just at Withybush hospital, the provision of a new accident and emergency department, new operating theatres, a new MRI scanner and an upgraded pharmacy. It has also provided much-needed additional capacity for the provision of renal dialysis services via the construction of a temporary unit. A further capital investment of £8 million is planned in the next two to three years to provide a larger permanent renal unit on the Withybush site, which should put paid to the claims that the future of Withybush is unclear. It should also reassure Members that it will continue to be a major provider of healthcare in the area as a key to the delivery of modern healthcare in the three counties. I will return to that later.

Investment has also been made in the redevelopment of south Pembrokeshire community hospital. In primary care, a number of improvement grants applications, totalling £253,000, have also been approved since 2007. Clearly, this area is a major beneficiary of the work that we have taken forward under the rural health plan. The wide range of projects funded from the rural health innovation fund will help us to develop new ways of providing services and improving access to services for those living in rural areas. Fifteen local projects have also received more than £0.5 million from the rural health fund to improve services, such as Hospice at Home, mobile outreach services and community warden schemes. Hywel Dda Local Health Board has been designated as one of two development sites. It will pilot a model of care and support for rural communities. I expect that people will see a real difference as these projects are developed. As you indicated, a major new community health development is also planned in Milford Haven for 17,000 patients. It will bring together two GP

galluogi i amlygu i ba raddau y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau iechyd yn sir Benfro, sy'n gwir fodel o'n hymrwymiad i wella iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Yn gryno, ers 2007, rydym wedi buddsoddi gwerth dros £18 miliwn o wariant cyfalaf ym Mhenfro i ad-drefnu a gwella ystod llong gwlad o wasanaethau. Mae hyn wedi cynnwys, fel yn ysbyty Llwyn Helyg, darparu adran damweiniau ac achosion brys newydd, theatrau llaw-drin newydd, sganiwr MRI newydd a fferyllfa wedi'i huwchraddio. Darparodd hefyd allu ychwanegol yr oedd mawr ei angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau dialysis arenol drwy adeiladu uned dros dro. Mae buddsoddiad cyfalaf pellach o £8 miliwn wedi'i gynllunio yn y ddwy i dair blynedd nesaf i ddarparu uned arenol barhaol fwy o faint ar safle Llwyn Helyg, a ddylai roi taw ar yr honiadau bod dyfodol Llwyn Helyg yn ansicr. Dylai hefyd sicrhau'r Aelodau y bydd yn parhau i fod yn ddarparwr pwysig gofal iechyd yn yr ardal fel allwedd i ddarparu gofal iechyd modern yn y tair sir. Dychwelaf i hynny'n nes ymlaen.

Buddsoddwyd hefyd mewn ailddatblygu ysbyty cymunedol yn ne sir Benfro. Mewn gofal sylfaenol, mae nifer o geisiadau grantiau gwella, sef cyfanswm o £253,000, wedi'u cymeradwyo hefyd ers 2007. Yn amlwg, yr ardal hon yw un o brif fuddiolwyr y gwaith a wnaethom o dan y cynllun iechyd gwledig. Bydd yr ystod eang o brosiectau a ariennir o'r gronfa arloesi iechyd gwledig yn ein helpu i ddatblygu ffyrdd newydd o ddarparu gwasanaethau a sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar gael yn haws i'r rheini sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae pymtheg o brosiectau lleol hefyd wedi cael mwy na £0.5 mhilion o'r gronfa iechyd gwledig i wella gwasanaethau, fel Hosbis yn y Cartref, gwasanaethau allgymorth symudol a chynlluniau warden cymunedol. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda wedi'i ddynodi'n un o ddau safle datblygu. Bydd yn treialu model o ofal a chymorth i gymunedau gwledig. Disgwyliaf y bydd y bobl hyn yn gweld gwir wahaniaeth wrth i'r prosiectau hyn gael eu datblygu. Fel y nodasoch, mae datblygiad iechyd cymunedol newydd pwysig hefyd ar y gweill yn Aberdaugleddau ar gyfer 17,000 o

practices currently operating from inadequate premises, enabling more services to be provided closer to people's homes. Dedicated sessions will be introduced for anti-smoking clinics, asthma clinics, diabetic clinics, a well-woman clinic, and minor surgery and other things will be available there. The new facility will include district nurses, health visitors and a pharmacy along with the GP practice. This development mirrors the aims of 'Setting the Direction', basing community services within new primary care developments. This investment will result in improvements in access to services, which is a challenge in rural areas, as you indicated in your contribution, Paul.

gleifion. Bydd yn dod ynghyd â dwy feddygfa deulu sy'n gweithredu ar hyn o bryd o safle annigonol, er mwyn darparu mwy o wasanaethau'n agosach at gartrefi pobl. Bydd sesiynau pwrpasol yn cael eu cyflwyno ar gyfer atal ysmegu, clinigau asthma, clinigau diabetig, clinig menyw iach, a bydd mân lawdriniaeth a phethau eraill ar gael yno. Bydd y cyfleuster newydd yn cynnwys nyrsys ardal, ymwelwyr iechyd a fferyllfa ynghyd â'r feddygfa deulu. Mae'r datblygiad hwn yn adlewyrchu nodau 'Gosod y Cyfeiriad', gan osod gwasanaethau cymunedol mewn datblygiadau gofal sylfaenol newydd. Bydd y buddsoddiad hwn yn arwain at welliannau o ran cael at wasanaethau, sy'n her mewn ardaloedd gwledig, fel y nodasoch yn eich cyfraniad, Paul.

6.00 p.m.

To look at some of the issues around waiting times, we all come across issues in individual casework. We will always have constituents who will not be satisfied with the service, and quite rightly so, but they are an overall minority, even though I wish we did not have a single complaint. I understand the angst of Members when these cases come to them and what they want local health boards to do to resolve the issues. However, waiting-time targets have been consistently met in the Hywel Dda Local Health Board, with significant growth in access—even to NHS dental services—since 2006, with over 40,000 additional NHS patients.

I edrych ar rai o'r pethau ynghylch amseroedd aros, rydym oll yn dod ar draws pethau mewn gwaith achos unigol. Bydd bob amser gennym etholwyr na fyddant yn fodlon ar y gwasanaeth, a hynny'n ddigon priodol, ond maent yn lleiafrif cyffredinol, er fy mod i'n dymuno na fyddai gennym yr un gŵyn. Deallaf ing Aelodau pan ddaw'r achosion hyn atynt hwy a'r hyn y mae arnynt eisiau i fyrddau iechyd lleol ei wneud i ddatrys y materion. Fodd bynnag, mae targedau amser aros wedi'u bodloni'n gyson ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda gyda thwf sylweddol mewn mynediad—hyd yn oed at wasanaethau deintyddol y GIG—ers 2006, gyda mwy na 40,000 o gleifion GIG ychwanegol.

The LHB can be congratulated on the innovative approach that it is taking on some issues. For example, in Pembrokeshire, there has been a successful joint appointment between health services and social services. The council director of social services spends 50 per cent of his time as Pembrokeshire's locality director. This is a pilot project that has already shown itself to be successful in breaking down barriers between health and social care. This is important in rural areas if we are to create a truly integrated service. I am also pleased to have approved another innovative project this week, which

Gellir llongyfarch y Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol am ei ddull arloesol mewn rhai materion. Er enghraifft, yn sir Benfro bu penodiad llwyddiannus ar y cyd rhwng y gwasanaethau iechyd a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae cyfarwyddwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol y cyngor yn treulio hanner ei amser yn gyfarwyddwr ardal i sir Benfro. Mae hwnnw'n brosiect peilot sydd eisoes wedi dangos ei hun yn llwyddiannus yn chwalu rhwystrau rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Mae hyn yn bwysig mewn ardaloedd gwledig os ydych am greu gwasanaeth cwbl integredig. Rwyf hefyd yn

demonstrates a willingness to undertake joint agency work. We have agreed to fund a pilot scheme for a crisis intervention service in Pembrokeshire to work with the children of substance-misusing parents in line with our wish to tackle the hidden harm agenda. That project will develop a model for co-working between teams and across boundaries, providing intensive support for identified families. It will begin in January. To look at the financial position and outlook in Hywel Dda, because we must be honest about these issues, like other health boards, it faces challenges, but it is confident that those challenges will be successfully addressed over the next three to four years.

I must now turn to the future of Withybush hospital. I have already assured you that there is a future for the hospital, but we must support the LHB in considering the future shape of the service in the area. The health board's response to the rural health plan is 'Right Care, Right Place, Right Time....Every Time'. It describes its vision for providing healthcare closer to home and how it intends to take up to 40 per cent of patients out of hospital. With significantly fewer patients, hospital services will be different, but that does not mean that we will downgrade hospitals; it means that the services might be different. Stakeholders and the public must be part of these discussions, and early engagement is vital. However, at this stage, there is nothing to discuss, as this work is not complete. Clinicians are now driving forward those discussions, which is the proper place from which they should be driven, and they are looking to provide safe and effective services as close to people's homes as possible.

We must recognise that, in the Hywel Dda area, the four district general hospitals are safe. It is important to recognise that, because the issues about rural Wales are not confined to Pembrokeshire. There are also issues around Bronglais hospital, and I was pleased to give my commitment on that.

falch o fod wedi cymeradwyo prosiect arloesol arall yr wythnos hon, sy'n arddangos parodrwydd i wneud gwaith asiantaeth ar y cyd. Rydym wedi cytuno i ariannu cynllun peilot ar gyfer gwasanaeth ymyrryd mewn argyfwng yn sir Benfro i weithio gyda phlant y mae eu rhieni'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, yn unol â'n dymuniad i fynd i'r afael â'r agenda niwed cudd. Bydd y prosiect hwnnw'n datblygu model i gydweithio rhwng timau ac ar draws ffiniau, gan ddarparu cymorth dwys i'r teuluoedd a nodir. Bydd yn dechrau ym mis Ionawr. Gan droi at y rhagolwg a'r sefyllfa ariannol yn Hywel Dda, am fod rhaid inni fod yn onest am y pethau hyn, fel byrddau iechyd eraill, mae'n wynebu heriau, ond mae'n ffyddiog y bydd yr heriau hynny'n cael sylw'n llwyddiannus dros y tair i bedair blynedd nesaf.

Rhaid imi droi'n awr at ddyfodol ysbyty Llwyn Helyg. Rwyf eisoes wedi'ch sicrhau chi fod dyfodol i'r ysbyty, ond mae'n rhaid inni gefnogi'r Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol wrth ystyried ffurf y gwasanaeth yn y dyfodol yn yr ardal. Ymateb y bwrdd iechyd i'r cynllun iechyd gwledig yw 'Gofal Cywir, Lle Cywir, Amser Cywir ... Bob Amser'. Mae'n disgrifio ei weledigaeth ar gyfer darparu gofal iechyd yn agosach at gartref a'r ffordd y mae'n bwriadu mynd â hyd at 40 y cant o gleifion allan o'r ysbyty. Gyda llawer llai o gleifion, bydd gwasanaethau ysbyty'n wahanol, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu y byddwn yn israddio ysbytai; mae'n golygu y gallai'r gwasanaethau fod yn wahanol. Rhaid i randdeiliaid a'r cyhoedd fod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hyn, ac mae ymgysylltu cynnar yn hanfodol. Fodd bynnag, yn y man hwn, nid oes dim i'w drafod, am nad yw'r gwaith hwn yn gyflawn. Mae clinigwyr bellach yn gwthio'r trafodaethau hynny ymlaen, ac oddi yno y dylid eu gwthio ymlaen, ac maent yn gobeithio darparu gwasanaethau diogel ac effeithiol mor agos at gartrefi pobl â phosibl.

Rhaid inni gydnabod bod y pedwar ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth, yn ardal Hywel Dda, yn ddiogel. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod hynny, oherwydd nid yw'r materion am Gymru wledig yn gyfyngedig i sir Benfro. Mae hefyd materion ynghylch ysbyty Bronglais, ac roeddwn i'n falch o roi fy ymrwymiad i hynny.

Alun alluded to the difficulty with the histopathology services at Withybush. I understood exactly what he said about the way that the board deals with some of these issues. There is an issue about how boards deal with the public, how they share information with them and how they tell people what is going on. At the end of the day, they must be open and honest about this. It is important to provide safe services. It is a temporary course of action that has been agreed with the coroner and is supported by the community health council.

I will now turn to some of the other issues in Withybush. Transport is also of particular importance in rural areas in securing equitable access to services. You made a good point about the difficulties of travel. We have tried to address some of those issues within the rural health plan and, more recently, in the non-emergency patient transport review, led by Win Griffiths. One of the pilot projects on adopting an integrated transport system, which will focus on rural transport, is within Hywel Dda. The LHB has commissioned the county council's social care vehicles to help to improve patient discharge and hospital transport. It has worked effectively with the third sector and the British Red Cross on some of these issues.

Turning to the workforce issues that have been raised, I acknowledge that there are difficulties in recruiting a medical workforce in some parts of Wales, and that Hywel Dda LHB is experiencing such problems at present. The health board is working closely with the Wales Deanery to ensure that training posts are appropriate and well supported so that they are attractive to trainee doctors. The national recruitment process for all trainee doctors has just started, and my officials will monitor the outcomes with the Wales Deanery. The health board has participated in recent UK medical careers events with the deanery to promote the health board to potential applicants. My officials continue to monitor the effectiveness of the various agreed strategies to recruit and retain doctors by the junior doctor review group.

Cyfeiriodd Alun at yr anhawster gyda'r gwasanaethau histopatholeg yn Llwyn Helyg. Deallais yn union yr hyn a ddywedodd am y ffordd y mae'r bwrdd yn ymdrin â rhai o'r materion hyn. Mae mater ynghylch y ffordd y mae'r bwrdd yn ymdrin â'r cyhoedd, sut mae'n rhannu gwybodaeth â hwy a sut mae'n dweud wrth bobl beth sy'n digwydd. Ar ddiwedd y dydd, rhaid iddynt fod yn agored ac yn onest am hyn. Mae'n bwysig darparu gwasanaethau diogel. Cam gweithredu dros dro ydyw sydd wedi'i gytuno â'r crwner ac a gefnogir gan y cyngor iechyd cymunedol.

Trof yn awr at rai o'r materion eraill yn Llwyn Helyg. Mae cludiant hefyd yn arbennig o bwysig mewn ardaloedd gwledig i sicrhau bod mynediad teg at wasanaethau. Gwnaethoch bwynt da am anawsterau teithio. Rydym wedi ceisio mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hynny yn y cynllun iechyd gwledig, ac, yn ddiweddarach, yn yr adolygiad o gludiant cleifion heb fod argyfwng, a arweiniwyd gan Win Griffiths. Mae un o'r prosiectau peilot ar fabwysiadu system gludiant integredig, a fydd yn canolbwyntio ar gludiant gwledig, y tu mewn i Hywel Dda. Mae'r Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol wedi comisiynu cerbydau gofal cymdeithasol y cyngor sir i helpu i wella prosesau rhyddhau cleifion a chludiant ysbyty. Mae wedi gweithio'n effeithiol gyda'r trydydd sector a'r Groes Goch Brydeinig ar rai o'r pethau hyn.

Gan droi at y materion gweithlu a godwyd, rwy'n cydnabod bod anawsterau wrth recriwtio gweithlu meddygol mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, a bod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda yn cael problemau felly ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd yn gweithio'n agos gyda Deoniaeth Cymru i sicrhau bod swyddi hyfforddiant yn briodol ac yn cael eu cefnogi'n dda fel eu bod yn ddeniadol i feddygon dan hyfforddiant. Mae'r broses recriwtio genedlaethol i'r holl feddygon dan hyfforddiant newydd ddechrau, a bydd fy swyddogion yn monitro'r canlyniadau gyda Deoniaeth Cymru. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd wedi cyfranogi mewn digwyddiadau gyrfaoedd meddygol y DU yn ddiweddar gyda'r ddeoniaeth i hyrwyddo'r bwrdd iechyd i ymgeiswyr posibl. Mae fy swyddogion yn parhau i fonitro effeithiolrwydd y

We have also been fortunate within Wales that we can provide accommodation for junior doctors, which I hope will encourage them to come to us. However, I acknowledge that further work needs to be done in that area.

I happen to think that west Wales and the Hywel Dda Local Health Board are attractive places to work, and that we need to do more marketing of the area within Wales. We also have to look at what we do with medical education in the future, because it is important that we have people coming through the system who go out to district general hospitals, and who might be encouraged to stay in that area.

Finally, I was terribly irritated and upset by what happened during the summer. The leaking of a document and report breaches all elements of trust for the public. I want to make it clear that LHBs are responsible for dealing with issues in their area. They have not had any instructions from the Government regarding any grand plans or designs, because we must recognise that you have to take people with you to make changes in services. You will sometimes make changes that will not be popular—someone will always object to health issues that are raised. You must try to persuade people that decisions are right. You will only do that with proper clinical engagement, which we have seen in other parts of Wales. We have successfully achieved change where we have had proper clinical engagement. However, I have made it clear to local health board chairs—as recently as today—that the important thing is to take people with you and explain why you are doing something, so that nothing comes as a nasty shock in a meeting where everyone is present. That will create an element of trust between the public, patients, consultants and the health boards. My role and function is to engender a sense of responsibility about how they deal with issues within their localities, so that I will not be faced with another short debate like this. However, I can reassure you about the future of Worthy General Hospital.

strategaethau amrywiol y cytunwyd arnynt i recriwtio a chadw meddygon gan y grŵp adolygu meddygon iau. Buom yn ffodus hefyd yng Nghymru y gallwn ddarparu llety i feddygon iau, a gobeithiaf y bydd hyn yn eu hannog i ddod atom. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n cydnabod bod angen gwneud gwaith pellach yn y maes hwnnw.

Rwy'n digwydd credu bod gorllewin Cymru a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda yn lleoedd deniadol i weithio, a bod angen inni farchnata'r ardal yn fwy yng Nghymru. Mae'n rhaid hefyd inni edrych ar yr hyn a wnawn gydag addysg feddygol yn y dyfodol, oherwydd mae'n bwysig bod gennym bobl yn dod drwy'r system sy'n mynd allan i ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth, ac a allai gael eu hannog i aros yn yr ardal honno.

Yn olaf, cefais fy nghythrudo a'm cynhyrfu'n ofnadwy gan yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ystod yr haf. Mae rhyddhau dogfen ac adroddiad yn ddamweiniol yn torri pob elfen o ffydd i'r cyhoedd. Rwyf am ei gwneud yn glir bod Byrddau Iechyd Lleol yn gyfrifol am ymdrin â materion yn eu hardal. Nid ydynt wedi cael unrhyw gyfarwyddiadau gan y Llywodraeth ynghylch unrhyw gynlluniau neu ddyluniadau mawr, gan fod rhaid inni gydnabod fod rhaid ichi fynd â phobl gyda chi i wneud newidiadau mewn gwasanaethau. Byddwch weithiau'n gwneud newidiadau a fydd yn amhoblogaidd-bydd rhywun bob amser yn gwrthwynebu materion iechyd a godir. Rhaid ichi geisio darbwyllo pobl fod penderfyniadau'n iawn. Ni wnewch chi hynny heb ymgysylltu clinigol priodol, a welsom mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Rydym wedi cael newid lle cawsom ymgysylltu clinigol priodol. Fodd bynnag, rwyf wedi'i gwneud yn glir i gadeiryddion byrddau iechyd lleol-mor ddiweddar â heddiw-mai'r peth pwysig yw mynd â phobl gyda chi ac egluro pam rydych chi'n gwneud rhywbeth, fel na ddaw dim fel sioc gas mewn cyfarfod lle mae pawb yn bresennol. Bydd hynny'n creu elfen o ymddiriedaeth rhwng y cyhoedd, cleifion, ymgynghorwyr a'r byrddau iechyd. Fy rôl a'm swyddogaeth i yw peri ymdeimlad o gyfrifoldeb am y ffordd yr ymdriniant â materion yn eu hardaloedd, fel na fyddaf yn wynebu dadl fer arall fel hon. Fodd bynnag, gallaf eich sicrhau chi am

ddyfodol Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwyn Helyg.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: **Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Daw hynny
That brings today's proceedings to a close. â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.07 p.m.

The meeting ended at 6.07 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democrat Rhyddfrydol Annibynnol – Independent Liberal Democrat)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Veronica (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)

Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)