



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 12 Hydref 2004**

**Tuesday, 12 October 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 27 Datganiad Busnes  
Business Statement
- 31 Datganiad ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adroddiad y Pwyllgor  
Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ynghylch Tai ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Social Justice and  
Regeneration Committee's Report on Housing for Older People
- 46 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin  
(Modwleiddio) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004  
Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales)  
(Amendment) Regulations 2004
- 47 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Y Dreth Gyngor  
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): Council Tax
- 75 Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31: Diwygio Arfaethedig i Reoliadau'r Gwasanaeth  
Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2004  
Debate under Standing Order No. 31: Proposed Amendment of the National Health  
Service (General Medical Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2004

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Gwaith Partneriaethau Diogelwch Cymunedol The Work of Community Safety Partnerships**

**Q1 Sandy Mewies:** Will the First Minister make a statement regarding the work of community safety partnerships in Wales? (OAQ38187)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The community safety partnerships are working hard to develop and deliver local strategies that reduce crime, anti-social behaviour and substance misuse. They are having a real impact in the communities that they serve and, since their introduction, crime has fallen by 25 per cent. A person's chance of being a victim of crime is now at its lowest level in 20 years.

**Sandy Mewies:** Would you agree that community safety partnerships provide an excellent platform for the police, local government and other agencies, to co-operate on in the fight against crime and anti-social behaviour? Do you also agree that innovative community-safety-partnership-led initiatives, such as the recent entertainment event in Holywell in my constituency of Delyn gave people the opportunity to work for the good of their own communities?

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with the details of that but I endorse the wider point about the partnerships. In the current financial year, 2004-05, the partnerships will share £7.5 million of Home Office funding and £3.5 million from the Assembly Government safer communities fund. That is an example of Westminster and the Welsh Assembly Government working together, and is the spirit of partnership that needs to be delivered at the local level.

**David Lloyd:** Beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei

**C1 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar waith partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru? (OAQ38187)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn gweithio'n galed i ddatblygu a chyflawni strategaethau lleol sy'n gostwng troseddu, ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a'r camddefnydd o sylweddau. Cânt effaith sylweddol yn y cymunedau a wasanaethant ac, ers eu cyflwyno, mae troseddu wedi gostwng o 25 y cant. Mae'r tebygolrwydd y bydd rhywun yn dioddef gan droseddu ar ei isaf yn awr er 20 mlynedd.

**Sandy Mewies:** A gytunwch fod partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn cynnig cyfle rhagorol i'r heddlu, llywodraeth leol ac asiantaethau eraill gael cydweithredu yn y frwydr yn erbyn troseddu ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno bod mentrau arloesol a arweinir gan bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, fel y digwyddiad adloniadol diweddar yn Nhreffynnon yn fy etholaeth, sef Delyn, wedi rhoi cyfle i bobl weithio er lles eu cymunedau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r manylion am hynny ond ategaf y pwynt mwy cyffredinol am y partneriaethau. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol, 2004-05, bydd y partneriaethau'n rhannu £7.5 miliwn o gyllid y Swyddfa Gartref a £3.5 miliwn o gronfa cymunedau diogelach Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n enghraifft o'r cydweithio rhwng San Steffan a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a dyna'r math o bartneriaeth frwd y mae'n rhaid ei sicrhau ar lefel leol.

**David Lloyd:** What is the Government doing

wneud i leihau'r baich biwrocratiaeth ar blismona?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny drwy leihau gwaith papur a gwneud mwy o'r gweithlu sydd yn gweithio i'r heddlu ar yr ochr sifil. Mae hynny'n golygu y gall plismyn fod allan ar y strydoedd yn gwneud y gwaith y maent yn arbenigo ynddo. Mae cael llai o waith papur a chyflogi mwy o bobl ar yr ochr sifil yn rhyddhau'r plismyn i wneud eu gwaith plismona.

**Mark Isherwood:** What action does the First Minister propose to address concerns that Victim Support Flintshire raised with me last month, that the voluntary sector still does not have any representation on the main board of the community safety partnership and therefore has no opportunity to inform, assist and advise decision making or to share in developing policy to address the issues that concern the community?

**The First Minister:** We have allocated £128,000 to Flintshire community safety partnership from the safer communities fund. Since 1999, we have allocated more than £2 million and its success is evident in terms of the figures. I cannot say how decisions are made locally, in that we are not involved—I do not think that we have local representation either. It is for the local authorities and the police to determine what they regard as the appropriate structure. I cannot comment on the detail, but if you have a complaint, it is probably best that you write to me or Edwina Hart on behalf of the people who raised this with you.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I understand from the latest Welsh Local Government Association report on community safety that there is a concern about a lack of funding and resources and the local authority support for the voluntary sector. What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to reassure people?

**The First Minister:** That sounds much like the question that Mark Isherwood has just asked. Perhaps if Edwina Hart were to write to you and Mark, she could explain the

to reduce the bureaucratic burden on the police?

**The First Minister:** We are doing that by reducing paperwork and making the most of those employed by the police on the civilian side. That means that the policemen can be on the streets doing the work that they specialise in. Reducing paperwork and employing more civilian staff frees the police up to do their police work.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pa gamau y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cynnig eu cymryd i ymateb i bryderon a gododd Cymorth i Ddiodefwyr Sir y Fflint gyda mi y mis diwethaf, i'r perwyl nad oes gan y sector gwirfoddol unrhyw gynrychiolydd eto ar brif fwrdd y bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol ac felly nad oes ganddo gyfle i ddylanwadu, i helpu ac i gynghori ar benderfyniadau neu i gymryd rhan yn y gwaith o ddatblygu polisi i ymdrin â materion sydd o bwys i'r gymuned?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi dyrannu £128,000 i bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol sir y Fflint o'r gronfa cymunedau diogelach. Er 1999, yr ydym wedi dyrannu mwy na £2 filiwn ac mae ei llwyddiant yn amlwg o'r ffigurau. Ni allaf ddweud sut y gwneir penderfyniadau'n lleol, gan nad ydym yn ymwneud â hynny—ni chredaf fod gennym gynrychiolaeth leol ychwaith. Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol a'r heddlu yw pennu'r hyn a ystyriant yn strwythur priodol. Ni allaf wneud sylw am y manylion, ond os oes gennych gŵyn, mae'n debyg mai'r peth gorau fyddai ichi ysgrifennu ataf fi neu at Edwina Hart ar ran y rhai a gododd hyn gyda chi.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Deallaf o adroddiad diweddaraf Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar ddiogelwch cymunedol fod pryder ynghylch prinder cyllid ac adnoddau a'r gefnogaeth gan awdurdodau lleol i'r sector gwirfoddol. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i roi sicrwydd i bobl?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n swnio'n debyg iawn i'r cwestiwn y mae Mark Isherwood newydd ei ofyn. Efallai, pe ysgrifennai Edwina Hart atoch chi ac at

function as it is determined locally. It is not a matter for us. We provide just under a third of the funding, which is £3.5 million, together with £7.5 million from the Home Office. That does not mean that we have representation either, because it is a local issue. I will ensure that Edwina replies to you and Mark.

Mark, y gallai egluro'r modd y caiff y swyddogaeth ei phennu'n lleol. Nid yw'n fater i ni. Darparwn ychydig yn llai na hanner y cyllid, sef £3.5 miliwn, ynghyd â £7.5 miliwn o'r Swyddfa Gartref. Nid yw hynny'n golygu bod gennym ni gynrychiolaeth ychwaith, gan mai mater lleol ydyw. Sicrhaf y bydd Edwina yn rhoi ateb i chi ac i Mark.

### **Tlodi mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig Poverty in Rural Areas**

**Q2 Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister make a statement on measures taken by his Government to tackle poverty in rural areas? (OAQ38208)

**C2 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y camau a gymerwyd gan ei Lywodraeth i fynd i'r afael â thlodi mewn ardaloedd gwledig? (OAQ38208)

**The First Minister:** We have a range of programmes and policies aimed at combating poverty in rural Wales. These include rural housing and the homebuy scheme, the rural development plan, Communities First partnerships in specific rural areas, and EU structural funds.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennym amryw o raglenni a pholisïau sydd â'r amcan o ymladd yn erbyn tlodi yng Nghymru wledig. Yn eu plith y mae tai gwledig a'r cynllun prynu cartref, y cynllun datblygu gwledig, partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig, a chronfeydd strwythurol yr UE.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for that answer. However, poverty, especially when it threatens your way of life, leads to increased stress and anxiety. Last year, 11 Welsh farmers committed suicide. Helplines are busy, with 70 per cent of the calls from women, yet your Government has seen fit to reduce rural stress budgets. What will you do to reinstate those budgets, assist those helplines and save lives?

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i chi am yr ateb hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae tlodi, yn enwedig os yw'n bygwth eich ffordd o fyw, yn peri mwy o straen a phryder. Y llynedd, gwnaeth 11 o ffermwyr Cymru eu lladd eu hunain. Mae'r llinellau cymorth yn brysur, ac oddi wrth fenywod y daw 70 y cant o'r galwadau, ac eto mae'ch Llywodraeth wedi gweld yn dda i leihau cyllidebau ar gyfer straen gwledig. Beth a wnewch i adfer y cyllidebau hynny, i gynorthwyo'r llinellau cymorth hynny ac i achub bywydau?

**The First Minister:** I am as sympathetic as you are when it comes to families for whom the stress becomes too much, or close to too much, and who need to turn to a helpline. There were two helplines available to people in rural Wales, which have now been merged. Any calls made to the old rural stress helpline are diverted to the main helpline operator, so the service will continue to function just as well, even though it does not operate under the same label.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennyf gymaint o gydymdeimlad â chi mewn cysylltiad â theuluoedd y mae'r straen yn mynd yn ormod, neu bron yn ormod, iddynt ac sy'n gorfod troi at linell gymorth. Yr oedd dwy linell gymorth ar gael i rai yng Nghymru wledig, ac maent bellach wedi'u huno. Mae pob galwad a wneir i'r hen linell gymorth ar gyfer straen gwledig yn cael ei dargyfeirio i gysylltwr y brif linell gymorth, felly bydd y gwasanaeth yn dal i redeg cystal ag y bu, er nad yw'n cael ei redeg o dan yr un enw.

**Brynle Williams:** The Prince of Wales has expressed his concern about the hardships many people on low incomes experience in

**Brynle Williams:** Mae Tywysog Cymru wedi mynegi pryder ynghylch y cyni y mae llawer sydd ar incwm isel yn ei brofi mewn

rural areas. He is keen to focus on finding solutions to the poor quality of life of many people in isolated pockets of the country. Do you share his view and what are you doing to improve the situation of people in rural Wales?

**The First Minister:** Unemployment is low in rural areas, but that is not to ignore the fact that there will be pockets of people who are employed but on low incomes, or of high unemployment against a general background of unemployment of less than 2 per cent. To combat that, we continue to assist farm incomes to improve: they are on the up, although dairy farming is an exception to that general rule. We also continue to provide a range of services through Farming Connect and so forth to assist farmers to diversify out of loss-making activities such as dairy farming.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Sut y bydd eich cyllideb trafniadaeth arfaethedig, sydd wedi'i rhewi bron, yn cyfrannu at hybu mynediad at waith a gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl fwyaf tlawd ardaloedd gwledig Cymru, ac felly yn cyfrannu at ymladd yn erbyn tlodi yn yr ardaloedd hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd Andrew Davies, fel y Gweinidog perthnasol, yn rhoi manylion yn ystod yr wythnos i ddod, ac yn y cyhoeddiadau a fydd yn cael eu gwneud yr wythnos nesaf pan fyddwn yn trafod y gyllideb yn llawn. O'm trafodaethau gydag ef, gwn fod un neu ddau brosiect perthnasol o ran ein rhwydwaith ffyrdd, sydd yn gwasanaethu Cymru wledig.

ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'n awyddus i ganolbwyntio ar ganfod atebion er mwyn gwella'r ansawdd bywyd gwael sydd gan lawer mewn llecynnau diarffordd yn y wlad. A ydych yn cyd-weld ag ef a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i wella sefyllfa pobl yng Nghymru wledig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae diweithdra'n isel mewn ardaloedd gwledig ond, wrth ddweud hynny, nid ydys yn anwybyddu'r ffaith y ceir rhai yma ac acw sydd mewn gwaith ond bod eu hincwm yn isel, neu lecynnau lle y mae diweithdra'n uchel er bod diweithdra'n gyffredinol yn llai na 2 y cant. I wrthweithio hynny, parhawn i helpu i gynyddu incymau ffermydd: maent ar gynnydd, er bod ffermio llaeth yn eithriad i'r rheol gyffredinol honno. Yr ydym hefyd yn dal i ddarparu amryw o wasanaethau drwy Cyswllt Ffermio ac yn y blaen i helpu ffermwyr i arallgyfeirio a rhoi'r gorau i weithgareddau sy'n gwneud colled fel ffermio llaeth.

**Helen Mary Jones:** How will your proposed transport budget, which has almost been frozen, contribute to promoting access to work and services for the poorest people in rural Wales, and therefore contribute to the fight against poverty in those areas?

**The First Minister:** Andrew Davies, as the relevant Minister, will provide details during the coming week, and in the announcements that will be made next week, when we have a full debate on the budget. From my discussions with him, I know that there are one or two relevant projects in terms of our roads network, which serve rural Wales.

### **Tlodi Plant Child Poverty**

**Q3 Ann Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on progress towards tackling child poverty in Wales? (OAQ38211)

**Q8 Lynne Neagle:** What discussions has the First Minister had with UK colleagues on child poverty? (OAQ38202)

**C3 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant yng Nghymru? (OAQ38211)

**C8 Lynne Neagle:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael â chyd-Weinidogion yn y DU ynghylch tlodi plant? (OAQ38202)

**The First Minister:** Our budget announcements of significant investments in early years and other children's services will contribute to our anti-child-poverty strategy, which will be launched in the Assembly on 1 December. I discussed several issues, including child poverty, with Andrew Smith, the then Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, on 6 May this year.

**Ann Jones:** I am pleased to see that the early years budget will look at targeting children in deprived areas. We currently operate the dental fissure sealant programme for children in Communities First areas. Will you ensure that this treatment can continue and be extended to all children in Wales? The programme prevents tooth decay and therefore gives children a better quality of life.

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** The early years budget allocation, which has been the leading item in the budget announcements that have been made so far to Assembly Members, has been based on the principle that the earlier that you use Government money to intervene, the greater the effect on the removal of social inequalities. As I was told in Finland, if you intervene at the ante-natal level, that has the biggest effect of all; if not ante-natal, then between birth and three years of age; if not between birth and three, then between three and seven, and so forth. The achievements of the fissure sealant programme are impressive. It does not appear to have any bad side effects, and it is having a tremendous affect in Communities First areas. I will have to take further advice as to whether it will be rolled out across the rest of Wales, highly desirable though that may be.

**Lynne Neagle:** I am delighted that the draft budget provides significant extra investment for early years; it is, as you say, an important recognition of the crucial role that early years intervention can have on the life chances of our children. I also welcome the recognition

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y buddsoddiadau sylweddol a gyhoeddwyd yn ein cyllideb yng ngwasanaethau'r blynyddoedd cynnar a gwasanaethau eraill ar gyfer plant yn cyfrannu at ein strategaeth i ymladd yn erbyn tlodi plant, a gaiff ei lansio yn y Cynulliad ar 1 Rhagfyr. Trafodais sawl mater, gan gynnwys tlodi plant, gydag Andrew Smith, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau ar y pryd, ar 6 Mai eleni.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o weld y bydd y gyllideb ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar yn ceisio targedu plant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn rhedeg y rhaglen selio tyllau yn y geg ar gyfer plant mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. A wnewch sicrhau y bydd modd i'r driniaeth hon barhau ac y gellir ei hystemyn i gynnwys yr holl blant yng Nghymru? Mae'r rhaglen hon yn atal pydredd mewn dannedd ac mae felly'n rhoi gwell ansawdd bywyd i blant.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r dyraniad yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar, sef y brif eitem yn y datganiadau am y gyllideb a wnaed hyd yma i Aelodau'r Cynulliad, wedi'i seilio ar yr egwyddor mai po gynharaf y defnyddir arian Llywodraeth i ymyrryd, mwyaf effeithiol fydd hynny i ddileu anghydraddoldebau cymdeithasol. Fel y dywedwyd wrthyf yn y Ffindir, os ymyrrir ar y lefel gynenedigol, hynny a gaiff yr effaith fwyaf oll; os nad ymyrrir cyn y geni, dylid gwneud hynny rhwng y geni a thair blwydd oed; os na wneir rhwng y geni a thair blwydd oed, dylid gwneud rhwng tair a saith oed, ac yn y blaen. Mae cyflawniadau'r rhaglen selio tyllau'n drawiadol. Nid yw'n ymddangos ei bod yn cael unrhyw sgîl-ffeithiau gwael, ac mae'n cael effaith aruthrol mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Bydd yn rhaid imi gael gwybodaeth bellach ynghylch a roddir hi ar waith yng ngweddill Cymru, er mor ddymunol y byddai hynny.

**Lynne Neagle:** Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y gyllideb ddrafft yn cynnig buddsoddiad ychwanegol sylweddol ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar; fel y dywedwyd, mae'n gydnabyddiaeth bwysig i'r ffaith y gall ymyrryd yn y blynyddoedd cynnar chwarae

in a recent Welsh Assembly Government paper to the Economic Development and Transport Committee that one early years centre per local authority is insufficient. In view of this, and in view of the extra investment, are you in a position to state whether the forthcoming child poverty strategy will include a commitment for a children's centre for every deprived community in Wales as a first step towards matching the level of investment in England?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure about the level of investment in England, but I am aware of the number of centres proposed in England. Additional funding of £15 million is being made available in 2006-07, and £35 million in 2007-08. Through Cymorth, the children and youth support fund is being expanded by over £29 million during the budget period, in addition to the early years initiative. Those children most in need will receive an additional £40 million over the budget period through the Children First programme, which funds work with children looked-after by local authorities, children in need of protection and disabled children.

**Leanne Wood:** You may be aware of a cross-party campaign launched today to provide free, nutritional school meals to every schoolchild in Wales. This would be a health measure, it would contribute to the reduction of anti-social behaviour during lunchtimes and so on, and it could help to reduce child poverty. The scheme would pay for itself in the long run, but even in the short term, the relatively low costs are worth paying. Would you be prepared to back the campaign?

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with the campaign, but it sounds as if it is based on the same principles as the free breakfast programme, although we are advised that it is free breakfasts that have the most beneficial impact on improving children's concentration and social behaviour. I also understand that people in many other countries, and in older generations, such as my generation, believe that nutritious school lunches—although they

rhan hanfodol mewn cysylltiad â chyfleoedd bywyd ein plant. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r gydnabyddiaeth mewn papur diweddar o eiddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth nad yw un ganolfan ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar ym mhob awdurdod lleol yn ddigon. Yng ngolwg hynny, ac yng ngolwg y buddsoddi ychwanegol, a ydych mewn lle i ddweud a fydd y strategaeth ar dlodi plant sydd ar ddod yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i ddarparu canolfan plant ym mhob cymuned ddifreintiedig yng Nghymru fel cam cyntaf tuag at gyrraedd yr un lefel o fuddsoddi ag a geir yn Lloegr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr ynghylch lefel y buddsoddi yn Lloegr, ond gwn am nifer y canolfannau a gynigiwyd yn Lloegr. Darperir cyllid ychwanegol o £15 miliwn yn 2006-07, a £35 miliwn yn 2007-08. Bydd cynnydd o fwy na £29 miliwn yn Cymorth, cronfa gymorth i blant a phobl ifanc, yn ystod cyfnod y gyllideb, yn ogystal â menter y blynyddoedd cynnar. Bydd y plant mwyaf anghenus yn cael £40 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros gyfnod y gyllideb drwy raglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf, sy'n talu am waith gyda phlant sy'n derbyn gofal gan awdurdodau lleol, plant y mae angen eu hamddiffyn a phlant anabl.

**Leanne Wood:** Efallai y gwyddoch am ymgyrch drawsbleidiol a lansiwyd heddiw dros ddarparu prydau maethol am ddim yn yr ysgol i bob plentyn ysgol yng Nghymru. Byddai hynny'n fesur ar gyfer iechyd, cyfrannai at ostwng ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn ystod amser cinio ac yn y blaen, a gallai helpu i leihau tlodi plant. Byddai'r cynllun yn talu amdano'i hun yn y tymor hir, ond hyd yn oed yn y tymor byr, mae'r costau cymharol isel yn werth eu talu. A fydddech yn barod i gefnogi'r ymgyrch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r ymgyrch, ond mae'n swnio fel pe byddai'n seiliedig ar yr un egwyddorion â'r rhaglen brecwastau am ddim, er mai'r cyngor a gawsom oedd mai brecwastau am ddim a gaiff yr effaith fwyaf llesol ar wella gallu plant i ganolbwyntio a'u hymddygiad cymdeithasol. Deallaf hefyd fod rhai mewn sawl gwlad arall, ac mewn cenedlaethau hyn, fel fy ngenhedlaeth i, yn credu bod ciniawau



were not always nutritious or terribly tasty, but were of a reasonable standard, shall we say—did have a beneficial effect. However, they were not as beneficial as free breakfasts. That is the spirit in which I will consider any documentation that you provide.

**Jonathan Morgan:** According to Barnardo's and Transport 2000, a child living in a deprived community is five times more likely to be hit by a car while out and about. Do you intend to push further the 20 mph zones that we have seen in some parts of Wales, in order to reduce the likelihood of children in deprived communities facing such a risk?

**The First Minister:** Extending the 20 mph limit area was a previous commitment. I do not have information with me on this, but I will write to you about the impact that any budget announcements that have been made, or will be made by Andrew Davies tomorrow, will have on that programme. We warmly welcome that programme, because of the effect that you correctly identified, and its impact on people in deprived areas.

### **Ariannu'r Ysbyty i Blant yn y Dyfodol Future Funding of the Children's Hospital**

**Q4 William Graham:** Will the First Minister make a statement concerning the future funding of the children's hospital? (OAQ38219)

**The First Minister:** Given the approaching completion of phase 1 of the children's hospital, with its £10 million investment programme, options for the development of phase 2 are being reviewed. Further funding will be considered, along with other health spending priorities announced earlier today by Jane Hutt.

**William Graham:** Would you give a commitment to provide funding for *Llais y Plant* in north Wales?

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with the project, but if you write to me, I will respond.

ysgol maethlon—er nad oeddent bob amser yn faethlon neu'n arbennig o flasus, ond eu bod o safon weddol, os caf ddweud hynny—yn gwneud lles. Er hynny, nid oeddent mor llesol â brecwastau am ddim. Yn yr ybryd hwnnw y byddaf yn ystyried unrhyw ddogfennau a ddarparwch.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn ôl Barnardo's a Transport 2000, mae plentyn sy'n byw mewn cymuned ddifreintiedig bum gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael ei daro gan gar pan yw allan. A ydych yn bwriadu hyrwyddo ymhellach y parthau 20 mya a welsom mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, fel y bydd plant mewn cymunedau difreintiedig yn llai tebygol o wynebu perygl o'r fath?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaed ymrwymiad o'r blaen i ymestyn ardaloedd â chyfyngiad 20 mya. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw wybodaeth am hyn wrth law, ond ysgrifennaf atoch am yr effaith y bydd unrhyw gyhoeddiadau ar y gyllideb a wnaed, neu a wneir gan Andrew Davies yfory, yn eu cael ar y rhaglen honno. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r rhaglen honno'n fawr, oherwydd yr effaith a nodasoch, a'i heffaith ar bobl mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig.

**C4 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar sut y caiff yr ysbyty i blant ei ariannu yn y dyfodol? (OAQ38219)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gan fod rhan 1 yr ysbyty i blant bron â'i chwblhau, a'i rhaglen fuddsoddi o £10 miliwn, mae'r dewisiadau ar gyfer datblygu rhan 2 yn cael eu hadolygu. Ystyrir rhoi cyllid pellach, ochr yn ochr â blaenoriaethau eraill ar gyfer gwariant ar iechyd a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach heddiw gan Jane Hutt.

**William Graham:** A wnewch ymrwymo i ddarparu cyllid ar gyfer *Llais y Plant* yn y Gogledd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r prosiect hwnnw, ond os ysgrifennwch ataf, ymatebaf.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o waith Teen Cancer Challenge, a'r gwaith pwysig y mae'n ei wneud gyda phlant a phobl ifanc yn eu harddegau sy'n dioddef o ganser, ynghyd â'i fwriad i sicrhau gwasanaeth ochr yn ochr â'r ysbyty plant yng Nghaerdydd. A dderbyniwch y byddai hwnnw'n wasanaeth defnyddiol a derbyniol ac a allwch chi, fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, ei gefnogi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn ddigon o'r manylion i ddweud yn awr a wyf yn cefnogi unrhyw gynnydd i ddarparu gwasanaeth nad yw ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o rai agweddau ar hyn, gan gynnwys banc canser Cymru, a gaiff ei ystyried fel y banc canser gorau sy'n ymwneud â geneteg yn y DU. Ni wn lawer ynglŷn â Teen Cancer Challenge. Fodd bynnag, os gallwch roi manylion unrhyw gais sydd ganddo nad yw wedi'i ariannu hyd yn hyn, gallaf fi neu Jane Hutt gysylltu â chi.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I support Rhodri Glyn's comments on Teen Cancer Challenge, and I ask you to closely consider the service that it provides, which is over and above what the medical profession can provide and provides support for teenagers who suffer from cancer.

**The First Minister:** Cancer is at the heart of the initial phase of the children's hospital on the medical side. Oncology services are being transferred from Llandough Hospital to the University Hospital of Wales, and a new children's assessment service will be provided at Llandough Hospital. A considerable investment is being made in improving children's services and bringing them into the twenty-first century as part of phase one. However, you and Rhodri Glyn are right to emphasise that dealing with cancer is not simply a matter of receiving the medical treatment that is required; it is also about the morale of the children and their families, who need considerable support to help them to get through their crises.

**Kirsty Williams:** Following recent publicity, the specialist area of paediatrics has been put under a great deal of pressure. Many doctors have left paediatrics to work in less controversial areas of medicine. What is your

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You will be aware of the work of Teen Cancer Challenge, and the important work that it is doing with children and teenagers suffering from cancer, and of its intention to provide services in tandem with the children's hospital in Cardiff. Do you accept that that would be a useful and acceptable service and, as First Minister, can you support it?

**The First Minister:** I do not have sufficient detail to tell you now whether I support any proposal to provide a service that is not currently available. I am aware of some aspects of this, including the Welsh cancer bank, which is considered to be the best cancer bank dealing with genetics in the UK. I do not know a great deal about Teen Cancer Challenge. However, if you can provide any details on proposals that have yet to be funded, I or Jane Hutt can reply to you.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Ategaf sylwadau Rhodri Glyn am Teen Cancer Challenge, a gofynnaf ichi ystyried yn fanwl y gwasanaeth y mae'n ei ddarparu, gan ei fod yn ychwanegol at yr hyn y gall meddygon ei ddarparu ac yn cynorthwyo rhai yn eu harddegau sy'n dioddef o ganser.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae lle canolog i feddygaeth canser yn rhan gyntaf yr ysbyty i blant. Trosglwyddir gwasanaethau oncoleg o Ysbyty Llandochau i Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, a darperir gwasanaeth asesu plant newydd yn Ysbyty Llandochau. Buddsoddir swm sylweddol i wella gwasanaethau i blant a'u dwyn i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain fel rhan o ran 1. Fodd bynnag, mae'n briodol i chi a Rhodri Glyn bwysleisio bod delio â chanser yn ymwneud â mwy na derbyn y driniaeth feddygol sydd ei hangen; mae hefyd yn ymwneud â morâl y plant a'u teuluoedd, y mae arnynt angen cryn gymorth i'w helpu i ddygymod â'u hargyfyngau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn dilyn cyhoeddusrwydd diweddar, mae maes arbenigol pediatreg o dan gryn bwysau. Mae llawer o feddygon wedi gadael pediatreg i weithio mewn meysydd meddygol llai dadleuol. Pa gamau y

Government doing to ensure that we have adequate paediatric cover at consultant and junior doctor levels in order to sustain children's services in every hospital?

**The First Minister:** The area of law that involves allegations being made against paediatricians, be they true, false or result in an open verdict, who rise to prominence by giving evidence in cases that involve allegations of Munchausen syndrome by proxy, is narrow. These difficult cases, whereby mysterious cot deaths or non-accidental, injury-related deaths take place, cause this problem. However, I do not think that it is that widespread. We are aware of some paediatricians who feel under pressure—it would be wholly inappropriate for me to name names today—but we are not aware of major problems regarding people no longer wishing to work in paediatrics, although there are one or two cases whereby paediatricians are conscious that unpleasant pressure may be placed on them by people who feel that they have been wrongly accused.

mae'ch Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y cawn wasanaeth digonol gan ymgynghorwyr a meddygon iau ym maes pediatreg fel y gellir cynnal gwasanaethau i blant ym mhob ysbyty?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae maes y gyfraith sy'n ymwneud â chyhuddiadau, boed hwy'n wir, yn anwir neu'n rhai sy'n arwain at reithfarn agored, yn erbyn pediatregwyr sy'n dod i amlygrwydd drwy roi tystiolaeth mewn achosion sy'n ymwneud â chyhuddiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â syndrom Munchausen drwy ddirprwy, yn un cyfyng. Yr achosion anodd hyn, lle y ceir marwolaethau anesboniadwy yn y crud neu farwolaethau sy'n ymwneud ag anafiadau nad ydynt yn ddamweiniol, sy'n peri'r broblem hon. Er hynny, ni chredaf ei bod mor gyffredin â hynny. Gwyddom am rai pediatregwyr sy'n teimlo eu bod dan bwysau—cwbl amhriodol fyddai imi enwi neb heddiw—ond ni wyddom am unrhyw broblemau mawr a gafwyd am fod rhai nad ydynt bellach yn dymuno gweithio mewn pediatreg, er bod un neu ddau achos lle y gŵyr pediatregwyr y gallant ddod o dan bwysau annymunol gan rai sy'n teimlo eu bod wedi'u cyhuddo ar gam.

### **Dyfodol Culturenet Cymru The Future of Culturenet Cymru**

**Q5 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of Culturenet Cymru? (OAQ38221)

**C5 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddyfodol Culturenet Cymru? (OAQ38221)

**The First Minister:** I would expect to see Culturenet Cymru build on the successful work that it has undertaken since it was established.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Disgwyliaf y bydd Culturenet Cymru yn parhau â'r gwaith llwyddiannus a wnaeth ers ei sefydlu.

**Peter Black:** As you know, serious accusations have been made that the 100 Welsh heroes poll was fixed to ensure that Aneurin Bevan won. A total of £150,000 of public money was spent on the poll and yet, thus far, Culturenet Cymru has hidden behind legal threats to avoid scrutiny. Do you believe that that is the proper way for a publicly funded body to behave? Will you undertake today to publish in full the details of all the investigations carried out by the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport into the allegations so that we can make our own judgment on them?

**Peter Black:** Fel y gwyddoch, gwnaed honiadau difrifol i'r perwyl bod pŵl 100 arwyr Cymru wedi'i rigio i sicrhau mai Aneurin Bevan a enillai. Gwariwyd cyfanswm o £150,000 o arian cyhoeddus ar y pŵl ac eto, hyd yma, mae Culturenet Cymru wedi cuddio y tu ôl i fgythiadau cyfreithiol i osgoi craffu arno. A gredwch mai felly y dylai corff a ariannir gan y cyhoedd ymddwyn? A wnewch ymgymryd heddiw i gyhoeddi manylion llawn yr holl ymchwiliadau a wnaeth y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon i'r honiadau fel y gallwn farnu yn eu cylch ein

hunain?

**The First Minister:** That is so over the top that I think that you will be deeply ashamed when you read the Record tomorrow. The only evidence that any of us is aware of regarding attempts to fix the Culturenet Cymru 100 Welsh heroes poll is the admission by a prominent member of the pro-Owain-Glyndŵr campaign, who worked in the public sector for the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, as I recall, that he e-mailed all his friends—and it was a public sector e-mail, as I recall—telling them that Owain Glyndŵr was behind Aneurin Bevan and asking them get their vote, or multiple votes, in for him. That is the only evidence that we have.

2.20 p.m.

You will be aware that an information technology manager sacked for gross misconduct has made many allegations. However, that is not uncommon after someone has been sacked for that reason. There is no basis for saying anything other than that Culturenet Cymru has received legal advice and has been told that some of the allegations are potentially defamatory but that pursuing them would be a waste of public money. End of sports.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld sefydlu Culturenet Cymru, a gwnaeth y corff llawer o waith diddorol hyd yma. Golygodd un elfen o'i waith fod mwy o bobl yn ymwybodol o arwyr Cymru. Fel y soniodd Peter, mae'r cyhuddiad yn y cyswllt hwn yn un difrifol. Mae'n bwysig, felly, y cynhelir ymchwiliad annibynnol, o hyd braich, ac nid gan y bobl sy'n gyfrifol am y maes. A fydddech chi'n fodlon ystyried cynnal ymchwiliad annibynnol i'r mater hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O ran profi cyhuddiadau a chael pobl i dderbyn eu bod yn euog o geisio twyllo a dylanwadu ar y canlyniad terfynol, dim ond un enghraifft sydd gennym, ac mae honno'n ymwneud ag elfen arall o'r sefyllfa y cyfeiriodd Peter ati. Nid dyma'r tro cyntaf imi glywed am rywun a gollodd ei swydd yn

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny mor eithafol fel y credaf y bydd cywilydd mawr arnoch pan ddarllenwch y Cofnod yfory. Yr unig dystiolaeth y gŵyr unrhyw un ohonom amdani ynghylch ymdrechion i rigio pŵl 100 arwyr Cymru Culturenet Cymru yw'r cyfaddefiad gan aelod amlwg o'r ymgyrch o blaid Owain Glyndŵr, a oedd yn gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru, os cofiaf yn iawn, iddo anfon negeseuon drwy'r e-bost at ei holl ffrindiau—a neges e-bost yn y sector cyhoeddus ydoedd, os cofiaf yn iawn—yn dweud wrthynt fod Owain Glyndŵr ar ôl Aneurin Bevan ac yn gofyn iddynt anfon pleidlais, neu bleidleisiau lluosog, drosto. Dyna'r unig dystiolaeth sydd gennym.

Gwyddoch fod rheolwr technoleg gwybodaeth a ddiswyddwyd am gamymddwyn dybryd wedi gwneud sawl honiad. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n beth anghyffredin wedi i rywun gael ei ddiswyddo am y rheswm hwnnw. Nid oes unrhyw sail i ddweud dim heblaw bod Culturenet Cymru wedi cael cyngor cyfreithiol a'i fod wedi cael gwybod y gallai rhai o'r honiadau fod yn ddifenyddol ond mai gwastraff arian cyhoeddus fyddai cymryd camau yn eu cylch. Dyna ben arni.

**Owen John Thomas:** I was pleased to see Culturenet Cymru established. It has undertaken a great deal of interesting work to date, one aspect of which has meant that many more people now know more about Wales's heroes. As Peter said, the allegation surrounding this issue is serious. It is important, therefore, that an independent, arm's-length inquiry is held, and not by those responsible for this area. Would you be prepared to consider holding an independent inquiry into this matter?

**The First Minister:** As regards substantiating allegations and getting people to accept that they are guilty of attempting to skew the outcome, I know of only one allegation, and this relates to another aspect of the situation outlined by Peter. This is not the first time that I have heard of a sacked

gwneud cyhuddiadau ac yn taflu mwd. Serch hynny, nid yw hynny'n cyfiawnhau gwario arian cyhoeddus naill ai ar achos o enllib, fel sy'n bosibl yn ôl y cyngor a roddwyd i Culturenet Cymru, neu ar gynnal ymchwiliad i gyhuddiadau gan berson a ddiswyddwyd. Nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr. Ysgrifennodd Alun Pugh at Peter Black ddoe i egluro'r sefyllfa. Mae gwasanaeth archwilio mewnol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ystyried y sefyllfa a phenderfynu nad oes diben cynnal ymchwiliad pellach.

**Lisa Francis:** Culturenet Cymru works in partnership with the Welsh Books Council to bring to the world books from the past that are difficult to locate or out of print. Do you anticipate that this will continue if your Government brings the Welsh Books Council under its control? Legally, can you do this, because you must know that the Welsh Books Council is made up of elected representatives from county councils?

**The First Minister:** The Welsh Books Council is not a quango and has not been considered. It is not a problem.

employee making allegations and slinging some mud about. However, this does not justify spending public money on either a libel action, which, according to the advice given to Culturenet Cymru, would be possible, or on an inquiry into allegations made by a sacked employee. That does not make sense. Alun Pugh wrote to Peter Black yesterday to clarify the situation. The Assembly Government's internal auditors have looked into the issue and come to the conclusion that a further inquiry would be futile.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae Culturenet Cymru yn gweithio ar y cyd â Chyngor Llyfrau Cymru i gyhoeddi llyfrau o'r gorffennol y mae'n anodd dod o hyd iddynt neu sydd allan o brint. A ragwelwch y bydd hyn yn parhau os bydd eich Llywodraeth yn dwyn Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru o dan ei rheolaeth? O dan y gyfraith, a allwch wneud hynny, gan eich bod yn sicr o wybod bod Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr etholedig o gynghorau sir?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid cwango yw Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru ac nis ystyriwyd. Nid yw hynny'n broblem.

### **Atebolrwydd Cyrff Cyhoeddus The Accountability of Public Bodies**

**Q6 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the accountability of public bodies? (OAQ38190)

**The First Minister:** The Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 received Royal Assent on 16 September. The Act will enable a single public audit body for Wales to become functional from 1 April next year. The new body will rationalise audit services in Wales, increase joint working and work planning between audit and regulatory bodies, and help the development of best audit practices.

**Jocelyn Davies:** As you know, Education and Learning Wales and the Welsh Development Agency are subject to stringent value-for-money audits by the National Audit Office. The audit reports are published, and they have led to millions of pounds of public

**C6 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar atebolrwydd cyrff cyhoeddus? (OAQ38190)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhoddwyd Cydsyniad Brenhinol i Ddeddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 ar 16 Medi. Bydd y Ddeddf yn galluogi corff archwilio cyhoeddus sengl i Gymru i ddod yn weithredol o 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Bydd y corff newydd yn rhesymoli gwasanaethau archwilio yng Nghymru, yn sicrhau mwy o weithio a chynllunio gwaith ar y cyd rhwng cyrff archwilio a chyrrff rheoliadol, ac yn helpu i ddatblygu'r arferion archwilio gorau.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Fel y gwyddoch, caiff Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru eu harchwilio'n llym gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol i sicrhau gwerth am arian. Cyhoeddir yr adroddiadau archwilio, ac maent wedi arwain at arbed

money being saved. Can you assure us that when these functions are taken in-house, these important value-for-money audits will continue?

**The First Minister:** Indeed. The National Audit Office's freedom to audit Assembly sponsored public bodies will not be restricted or changed. The office audits these bodies in exactly the same way as it audits departments of the Assembly administration. The office's function and throw as regards ASPBs will not be altered by the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004. It will be able to audit Assembly Government departments and remaining ASPBs after 1 April next year. The situation will not change.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** You will be aware that one of the main reasons given for bringing the Welsh Tourist Board, the WDA and ELWa in-house is to increase their accountability to the National Assembly for Wales. The Minister for Economic Development and Transport has two of those quangos in his purview, yet he is only subjected to scrutiny for 15 minutes once every three weeks in Plenary, and for 45 minutes in committee every three weeks or so. Do you agree that once the WDA and WTB are mainstreamed into the Minister's portfolio, the time available for scrutinising the Minister must be extended?

**The First Minister:** I think that it already has been extended, because it is relatively rare for a Minister's Plenary questions to last only 15 minutes; my experience in keeping an eye on the clock suggests that it is more like 25 minutes—although that is a matter for the Llywydd, not for me; there is no criticism implied there. However, the original 15-minute convention has experienced a fair degree of creep over the last three, four or five years. I see no harm in that; it is proper.

Merging ASPBs into the administration will have some impact, but the main issue is that there will be no confusion in future as to ministerial accountability. It is clear that it

miliynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus. A allwch ein sicrhau, pan ymgorfforir y swyddogaethau hyn, y bydd yr archwiliadau pwysig hyn ar werth am arian yn parhau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn wir. Ni fydd cyfyngu neu newid ar ryddid y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol i archwilio cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r swyddfa'n archwilio'r cyrff hyn yn yr un modd yn union ag y mae'n archwilio adrannau gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad. Ni fydd swyddogaeth y swyddfa a'i chwmpas o ran CCNC yn cael eu newid drwy Ddeddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004. Bydd yn gallu archwilio adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r CCNC sy'n weddill ar ôl 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Ni fydd y sefyllfa'n newid.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Gwyddoch mai un o'r prif resymau a roddir dros ymgorffori Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, y WDA ac ELWa yw y byddant yn dod yn fwy atebol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae dau o'r cwangos hynny yn rhan o faes y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, ac eto ni fydd ond yn cael ei holi am 15 munud unwaith bob tair wythnos yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ac am 45 munud yn y pwyllgor bob tair wythnos fwy neu lai. A ydych yn cytuno bod rhaid ymestyn yr amser sydd ar gael i holi'r Gweinidog ar ôl cynnwys y WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn ei bortffolio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf ei fod wedi'i ymestyn eisoes, gan mai'n gymharol anaml y bydd cwestiynau i Weinidogion yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn parhau am 15 munud yn unig; yn ôl fy mhrofiad i wrth gadw golwg ar y cloc, mae'n agosach i 25 munud—er mai mater i'r Llywydd yw hynny, nid i mi; nid wyf yn golygu unrhyw feirniadaeth wrth ddweud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arfer gwreiddiol o 15 munud wedi cynyddu'n eithaf sylweddol dros y tair, pedair neu bum mlynedd diwethaf. Ni welaf unrhyw ddrwg yn hynny; mae'n briodol.

Bydd ymgorffori CCNC yn y weinyddiaeth yn cael rhywfaint o effaith, ond y peth pwysicaf yw na fydd unrhyw ddrysych yn y dyfodol ynghylch atebolrwydd gweinidogol.

will be the Minister who will be responsible. At present, the Minister is responsible for the strategy and for the remit letter, but responsibility for value for money lies with the board of the ASPB, and responsibility for regularity and propriety lies with the chief executive. This will be simplified where the role will be transferred to a Minister, the Permanent Secretary or possibly the head of department in future if we introduce such changes.

**Michael German:** I should have said that in the Chamber, it is every four weeks, not every three weeks. All you have said, First Minister, indicates that the responsibility of the Minister will become even greater. One of the findings of the Richard commission was that we do not have an appropriate culture of scrutiny in the National Assembly, particularly in our committees. Given all that you have just said, is it not the consequence that Ministers will now have to be open for further scrutiny, and that more time will have to be made available to question Ministers who have quangos under their portfolios? How far should this go?

**The First Minister:** Appropriate scrutiny in committees is not a matter for me; it is a matter for the Panel of Chairs and the Clerk to discuss with the Presiding Officer. There is an argument over whether or not it is possible to properly scrutinise a Minister who is a member of the committee. It is quite a difficult task. When I was one of the relevant Ministers, I did not find it to be a satisfactory format. There was no clear divide between when you were participating in a committee and when you were being scrutinised by the committee of which you were a member. It was messy. We are open to any thoughts on how to overcome this.

In respect of your point on the Richard commission, you misunderstand the implications of what was said on this issue. My understanding was that the Richard commission did not find it satisfactory, not because of the quantity involved, but because of the points that I have made now—that there is confusion in the Minister's role as a member of the committee and in being scrutinised by it.

Bydd yn amlwg mai'r Gweinidog fydd yn gyfrifol. Ar hyn o bryd, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y strategaeth ac am y llythyr cylch gwaith, ond bwrdd y CCNC sy'n gyfrifol am sicrhau gwerth am arian, a'r prif weithredwr sy'n gyfrifol am reoleidd-dra ac uniondeb. Caiff hynny ei symleiddio os trosglwyddir y rôl i Weinidog, i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol neu i bennaeth adran, o bosibl, yn y dyfodol os cyflwynwn newidiadau o'r fath.

**Michael German:** Dylaswn ddweud mai pob pedair wythnos y digwydd hynny yn y Siambr, nid pob tair wythnos. Mae'r cwbl a ddywedasoch, Brif Weinidog, yn dangos y bydd cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog yn fwy byth. Un o ddarganfyddiadau comisiwn Richard oedd nad oes gennym arferion priodol o ran craffu yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn enwedig yn ein pwyllgorau. Yng ngolwg y cwbl yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, oni fydd hyn yn golygu y bydd Gweinidogion yn gorfod bod yn agored i graffu pellach yn awr, ac y bydd yn rhaid neilltuo mwy o amser i holi Gweinidogion â chanddynt gwangos o fewn eu portffolio? Pa mor bell y dylai hynny fynd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid mater i mi yw craffu priodol mewn pwyllgorau; mae'n fater i'w drafod gan Banel y Cadeiryddion a'r Clerc gyda'r Llywydd. Mae dadl ynghylch a oes modd craffu'n iawn ar waith Gweinidog sy'n aelod o'r pwyllgor. Mae'n waith eithaf anodd. Pan oeddwn i'n un o'r Gweinidogion dan sylw, nis cefais yn ddull boddhaol. Nid oedd rhaniad pendant rhwng yr adeg yr oeddech yn cymryd rhan mewn pwyllgor a'r adeg y craffid ar eich gwaith gan y pwyllgor yr oeddech yn aelod ohono. Yr oedd yn anhrefnus. Yr ydym yn barod i ystyried unrhyw syniadau am y modd i ddatrys hyn.

O ran eich pwynt am gomisiwn Richard, yr ydych yn camddeall goblygiadau'r hyn a ddywedwyd am y mater hwn. Yn ôl a ddeallais, nid oedd comisiwn Richard yn ei gael yn anfodddhaol oherwydd yr amser a neilltuid, ond oherwydd y pwyntiau yr wyf newydd eu gwneud—bod dryswch ynghylch rôl y Gweinidog fel aelod o'r pwyllgor ac wrth gael ei holi ganddo.

**Michael German:** On that point, I do not think that Lord Richard was only talking about that matter. He was talking about the way in which committees currently scrutinise Ministers. As one Labour member said, it was a matter of depth as opposed to breadth. All that you have said so far, First Minister, indicates that we need more time for scrutinising Ministers, which means that we must move—and your party has resisted this—to more time for scrutiny, therefore more time in committee meetings. The three-week cycle that you have given us will not be satisfactory when the quangos are brought in-house. Therefore, do you believe that we should return to the two-week cycle?

**The First Minister:** These are all matters to be discussed between the parties, the Panel of Chairs, and the Presiding Officer. They are not matters for me. I have no problems with spending 24-hours a day scrutinising Ministers if it is thought appropriate. We can be here all day; we are not part-timers, as you will have noticed. We are always available for scrutiny, provided that it has the required depth. The key to effective scrutiny is quality, not the number of minutes spent on it.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Fel y cofiwch, Brif Weinidog, yr oedd adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio ar y cyrff iechyd ym mis Ebrill yn hynod feiriadol o'r rhestrau aros hir yng Nghymru. Y nod, mae'n debyg, yw bod eich Llywodraeth yn amcanu i gyflawni'r canlynol:

'the removal of existing waiting lists and the reasonable wait for treatment of all citizens.'

Mae gennyf ddau achos yn fy etholaeth yn ymwneud ag ysbyty Gobowen. Mae un claf yn gorfod disgwyl 20 mis cyn gweld arbenigwr yn y lle cyntaf, a 18 mis arall cyn cael triniaeth, sy'n golygu tair blynedd a dau fis o ddisgwyl.

2.30 p.m.

Mae'r etholwr arall yn gorfod disgwyl 18 mis

**Michael German:** Ynghylch y pwynt hwnnw, ni chredaf mai am y mater hwnnw'n unig yr oedd yr Arglwydd Richard yn sôn. Yr oedd yn sôn am y modd y mae pwyllgorau'n craffu ar waith Gweinidog ar hyn o bryd. Fel y dywedodd un aelod o Lafur, yr oedd yn fater o fanylder yn hytrach nag ehangder. Mae'r cwbl a ddywedasocho hyd yma, Brif Weinidog, yn dangos bod arnom angen mwy o amser i holi Gweinidogion, ac mae hynny'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid inni gymryd camau—a wrthwynebwyd gan eich plaid—i gael mwy o amser ar gyfer craffu, ac felly mwy o amser mewn cyfarfodydd pwyllgor. Ni fydd y cylch tair wythnos a roesocho i ni'n foddhaol ar ôl ymgorffori'r cwangos. Gan hynny, a gredwch y dylem fynd yn ôl at y cylch pythefnosol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r rhain i gyd yn faterion i'w trafod rhwng y pleidiau, Panel y Cadeiryddion, a'r Llywydd. Nid ydynt yn faterion i mi. Nid oes gennyf wrthwynebiad i dreulio pob awr o'r dydd a'r nos yn holi Gweinidogion os tybir bod hynny'n briodol. Gallwn fod yma drwy'r dydd; nid ydym yn weithwyr rhan amser, fel y byddwch wedi sylwi. Yr ydym ar gael i'n holi bob amser, ar yr amod y gwneir hynny'n ddigon manwl. Ansawdd yw'r allwedd i graffu effeithiol, nid nifer y munudau a dreulir arno.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** As you will recall, First Minister, the Audit Commission report on the health bodies published in April was extremely critical of the long waiting lists in Wales. The objective, it seems, is to ensure that your Government should aim to achieve:

dileu'r rhestrau aros presennol a sicrhau cyfnod aros rhesymol am driniaeth i bob dinesydd.

I have two cases in my constituency which relate to Gobowen hospital. One patient has to wait 20 months for an initial consultation with a specialist, and a subsequent 18 months for treatment, which means three years and two months of waiting.

The other constituent has to wait 18 months



i weld yr arbenigwr, a 18 mis arall am driniaeth. A yw'n rhesymol i'r ddau glaf hynny, yn unol ag adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio, ddisgwyl dros dair blynedd am driniaeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nac ydyw, ond efallai fod ffactorau unigol sy'n berthnasol i achosion y cleifion hynny nad wyf yn ymwybodol ohonynt. Credaf inni gael ffigurau gan ysbyty Gobowen erbyn hyn sydd yn dangos mai rhwng 14 a 15 mis yw'r cyfartaledd o ran y rhestr aros am driniaeth. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r amser aros o ran cleifion allanol. Y pwynt pwysig, a'r hyn a ddywedodd y Comisiwn Archwilio ac eraill ynghylch strwythur y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol o ran aros am lawdriniaeth ddewisol oer yng Nghymru, yw nad ydym wedi gallu rhwystro pobl a gaiff eu derbyn i'r ysbyty gydag argyfyngau meddygol rhag boddi'r llawfeddygaeth a thriniaeth arall ar yr ochr llawdriniaeth ddewisol oer gystal â Lloegr. Nid ydym wedi llwyddo i wahanu'n briodol rhwng yr argyfyngau meddygol, sydd yn llawer mwy niferus yng Nghymru, â'r llawdriniaeth ddewisol oer.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Buoch mewn llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad ers dros bum mlynedd, ac mae ffigurau rhestrau aros yn parhau i fod yn echrhydus o uchel. Rhoddaf enghraifft o'r math o wahaniaeth ofnadwy sydd rhwng rhestrau aros yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae nifer y cleifion sydd yn disgwyl am fwy na 12 mis am driniaeth mewn ysbyty yn Lloegr yn 61. Ar sail poblogaeth, golyga hynny mai tri o bobl a ddylai fod yn aros yng Nghymru, ond 8,597 yw'r ffigur yng Nghymru, a bu 3,925 yn disgwyl am driniaeth orthopedig. A ydych yn derbyn bellach fod y ffigurau hynny yn sgandal llwyr? Beth a wnewch i sicrhau bod y ffigurau hynny yn lleihau i rywbeth tebyg i'r ffigurau yn Lloegr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'n fater o'r hyn y byddem yn ei wneud, ond yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud. Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi'r targedau newydd: hynny yw, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r cynllun ail gynnig, sydd wedi dechrau lleihau y rhestrau aros hir, ar gyfer triniaeth orthopedig yn enwedig. Bydd y targed ar gyfer y cynllun yn newid o 18 mis i 12 mis ar 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Felly, mae rhaglenni'n bod ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydych

to see the specialist, and another 18 months for treatment. Is it reasonable for those two patients, given the Audit Commission's report, to wait over three years for treatment?

**The First Minister:** It is not, but there may be individual factors relevant to those patients' cases that I am not aware of. I think that we have now received figures from Gobowen hospital that show that between 14 and 15 months is the median in terms of the waiting time for treatment. I am not sure what the waiting time is for out-patients. The important point, and what has been said by the Audit Commission and others about the structure of the national health service in terms of waits for cold elective surgery in Wales, is that we have not managed to prevent emergency admissions from swamping the surgery and other treatments on the cold elective surgery side as well as England has done. We have not managed to get the right insulation between the medical emergencies, which are far more frequent in Wales, and the cold elective surgery.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You have governed in the Assembly for over five years, and the waiting list figures continue to be shockingly high. I will give an example of the appalling difference between waiting lists in England and Wales. The number of patients waiting over 12 months for hospital treatment in England is 61. On a population basis, that means that three people should be waiting in Wales, but the figure in Wales is 8,597, and 3,925 have been waiting for orthopaedic treatment. Do you now accept that those figures are a total scandal? What action will you take to ensure that those figures are reduced to something like the figures in England?

**The First Minister:** It is not a matter of what we will do, but what we have done. We have published the new targets: that is, we have introduced the second offer scheme, which has begun to reduce the long waiting lists, for orthopaedic treatment in particular. The target for the scheme will change from 18 months to 12 months on 1 April next year. Therefore, the programmes are already in place. You are refusing to acknowledge what

yn ceisio peidio â chydabod yr hyn a gyhoeddwyd ac a weithredwyd eisoes. Ar rai rhestrau aros, mae pobl yng Nghymru yn aros am lai o amser na phobl yn Lloegr. Er enghraifft, ar gyfer llawdriniaeth cataract, pedwar mis yw'r targed yng Nghymru, ond chwe mis ydyw yn Lloegr. O ran cael mynediad at ofal sylfaenol, 24 awr yw'r targed yng Nghymru, ond 48 awr ydyw yn Lloegr. Felly, ar gyfer rhai agweddau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, rhaid aros am fwy o amser yn Lloegr nag yng Nghymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** To return to the Audit Commission's report, it makes it clear that, by any measure, waiting times in Wales are substantially higher as a rule than they are in England. People in Wales are fed up with waiting for action from your Government on this. You have decided, for the first time that I can recall, to increase spending on health in this year's budget, which is for the next three years, by less than the increase in England. Is it not time that you apologised for the mess you have created in the health service, and time that you told us that you will change your policy?

**The First Minister:** Is it not time that you recognised that some parts of the health service in Wales respond to patient's needs faster? I do not know why you should shake your head and try to say that that could not possibly be the case simply because it does not fit in with your mud-slinging attacks. Four months is shorter than six months. Provided you accept that simple mathematical truth, then what I have said is the case. There is a four-month waiting list for cataract treatment in Wales, and a six-month waiting list in England. That is a plain and simple fact that you will not recognise. I put it to you week after week, yet you never accept that the waiting list is shorter for cataract treatment, because it does not fit in with your sales patter. You wish to go around Wales spreading doom and gloom. Similarly, on primary care, you will not accept that 24 hours is half of 48 hours, yet the wait target to access to primary care is 24 hours in Wales, and 48 hours in England. That is relevant, because, if we are to solve the Wanless problem, as he correctly defined it,

has already been announced and implemented. On some waiting lists, people in Wales wait for less time than people in England do. For example, for cataract surgery, the target in Wales is four months, but it is six months in England. In terms of access to primary care, the target in Wales is 24 hours, but it is 48 hours in England. Therefore, for some aspects of the national health service, you must wait longer in England than in Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gan droi'n ôl at adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio, mae'n egluro bod amseroedd aros yng Nghymru'n hwy o lawer, yn ôl unrhyw ffon fesur, nag y maent yn Lloegr, at ei gilydd. Mae pobl yng Nghymru wedi blino ar ddisgwyl i'ch Llywodraeth gymryd camau ar hyn. Yr ydych wedi penderfynu, am y tro cyntaf hyd y cofiaf, y byddwch yn cynyddu'r gwariant ar iechyd yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn hon, sydd ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, yn llai nag a wneir yn Lloegr. Onid yw'n bryd ichi ymddiheuro am y llanastr a wnaethoch yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac onid yw'n bryd ichi ddweud wrthym y byddwch yn newid eich polisi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Onid yw'n bryd i chi gydnabod bod rhai rhannau o'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru'n diwallu anghenion cleifion yn gynt? Ni wn pam yr ydych yn ysgwyd eich pen ac yn ceisio dweud na allai hynny fod yn wir gan nad yw'n cyd-fynd â'ch pardduo. Mae pedwar mis yn fyrrach na chwe mis. Ar yr amod y derbyniwch y gwirionedd mathemategol syml hwnnw, mae'r hyn a ddywedais yn wir. Mae rhestr aros o bedwar mis am driniaeth ar gataractau yng Nghymru, a rhestr aros o chwe mis yn Lloegr. Mae honno'n ffaith syml na wnewch ei derbyn. Yr wyf yn ei chynnig i chi'r naill wythnos ar ôl y llall, ac eto ni wnewch byth dderbyn bod y rhestr aros am driniaeth ar gataractau'n fyrrach, gan nad yw hynny'n cyd-fynd â'ch parabl. Yr ydych am fynd o gwmpas Cymru'n lledaenu anobaith. Yn yr un modd, ynghylch gofal sylfaenol, ni dderbyniwch fod 24 awr yn hanner 48 awr, ac eto mae'r targed ar gyfer aros am ofal sylfaenol yn 24 awr yng Nghymru, ac yn 48 awr yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n berthnasol, oherwydd, os ydym i ddatrys y broblem a

then you must ask how we prevent emergency care in our hospitals from being flooded by people who therefore knock out and cause cancellations of cold elective surgery treatment. The answer is that we must give them better treatment and almost instant access to the primary care side. That is why we have set our wait targets for access to primary care at half those in England, and why it fits in with our particular problem.

Similarly, why do we spend so much money on medical assessment units? It is to try to prevent people from flooding hospitals on the accident and emergency side, thereby causing cancellations of cold elective surgery. That is the big problem. You correctly identified it, but you do not want anyone to find a solution. If you ever want to suggest a solution, I would give you five minutes at this podium instead of me.

**Y Llywydd:** Dim eto.

nododd Wanless, ac a ddiffiniwyd yn gywir ganddo, rhaid gofyn sut y gellir atal y cyfleusterau yn ein hysbytai rhag cael eu boddi gan bobl sy'n ceisio gofal brys gan beri disodli a diddymu llawdriniaethau dewisol oer. Yr ateb yw bod rhaid rhoi gwell triniaeth iddynt a mynediad ar unwaith bron i'r ochr gofal sylfaenol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi gosod ein targedau aros ar gyfer mynediad i ofal sylfaenol ar hanner y rhai yn Lloegr, a pham y mae hynny'n briodol i'r broblem benodol sydd gennym ni.

Yn yr un modd, pam yr ydym yn gwario cymaint o arian ar unedau asesu meddygol? Gwneir hynny er mwyn ceisio peri na fydd gormod o bobl yn defnyddio'r cyfleusterau ar gyfer damweiniau ac achosion brys mewn ysbytai, gan beri diddymu llawdriniaethau dewisol oer. Dyna'r broblem fawr. Gwnaethoch ei diffinio'n gywir, ond nid ydych am i neb ganfod ateb. Os byth y byddwch am awgrymu ateb, rhoddwn bum munud i chi ar y podiwm hwn yn fy lle.

**The Presiding Officer:** Not yet.

### **Effaith Gwahardd Hela â Chwn The Impact of a Ban on Hunting With Dogs**

**Q7 Glyn Davies:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State about the impact of a ban on hunting with dogs in Wales? (OAQ38200)

**The First Minister:** I last met the Secretary of State on Monday, 4 October, to discuss a range of issues.

**Glyn Davies:** You will recall that the Assembly agreed that any decision to ban hunting with dogs in Wales should be made in the Chamber. You have referred to the differences between hunting with dogs in Wales and in England. We all know how wobbly and vague you get when talking about new powers for the Assembly, but in your discussions with the Secretary of State, what steps did you take to put into effect the Assembly's decision that any decision to ban hunting with dogs should take place in the Assembly?

**The First Minister:** I wrote to Jack Straw,

**C7 Glyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol am effaith gwahardd hela â chwn ar Gymru? (OAQ38200)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyfarfûm â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ddiwethaf ddydd Llun, 4 Hydref, i drafod amryw o faterion.

**Glyn Davies:** Byddwch yn cofio bod y Cynulliad wedi cytuno y dylai unrhyw benderfyniad i wahardd hela â chwn yng Nghymru gael ei wneud yn y Siambr. Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at y gwahaniaethau rhwng hela â chwn yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod mor sigledig ac amhendant y byddwch wrth sôn am bwerau newydd i'r Cynulliad ond, yn eich trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, pa gamau a gymerasoch i weithredu ar sail penderfyniad y Cynulliad mai yn y Cynulliad y dylid gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad i wahardd hela â chwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ysgrifennais at Jack

who was the Home Secretary at the time, asking him to take into account the request of the previous Assembly—if I recall correctly, this was in 2001—to allow us to make that decision. He replied that he could not see any way of allowing that, because many hunts near the Wales-England border hunt across that border. He therefore thought that it would be unacceptable.

There are other areas where, as you correctly identified, there is a different pattern of hunting foxes, with gun and foot packs. That is much more common among the 56 hunts in Wales. As far as I am aware, and I will write to you if I am wrong, the Bill, as it is presently constituted, allows for the continued use of dogs to flush out foxes for the purposes of pest control. If I am wrong about that, I will write to you.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you agree that the issue of hunting with dogs has been a clear exercise in democracy and that we all have responsibility to keep within the law and accept a democratic decision, and that hunters should start looking for something else to do?

**The First Minister:** The election promise was that Parliament should be allowed to reach a conclusion on this. It was not specific about what that conclusion should be, but it was clear that the issue could not remain in suspended animation, whereby the House of Commons kept voting for something again and again—it is probably four times already—and no conclusion was reached because of the sharp differences of opinion between the elected and unelected houses. Somehow or other, for Parliamentary democracy to retain its credibility, that original manifesto promise for Parliament to reach a conclusion on the issue probably needs to be implemented.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'r Mesur Hela yn rhwystro ffermwr rhag defnyddio cŵn i godi llwynogod o'r fforestydd a'r tir garw yn ardaloedd mynyddig Cymru. Felly, beth fyddwch yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod y sefyllfa honno'n cael ei newid ar gyfer ffermwr Cymru er mwyn rheoli llwynogod?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wastad wedi bod o

Straw, yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ar y pryd, gan ofyn iddo ystyried cais y Cynulliad blaenorol—os cofiaf yn iawn, yr oedd hynny yn 2001—i adael i ni benderfynu ar hynny. Atebodd na allai weld unrhyw fodd i ganiatáu hynny, gan fod llawer o helfeydd ger y ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yn croesi'r ffin honno. Gan hynny, yr oedd yn credu na fyddai'n dderbyniol.

Mae ardaloedd eraill, fel y dywedasochn, lle y ceir patrwm gwahanol o hela llwynogod, gyda rhai ar droed â drylliau a helgwn. Mae hynny'n llawer mwy cyffredin ymysg y 56 o helfeydd yng Nghymru. Hyd y gwn i, ac ysgrifennaf atoch os wyf yn anghywir, mae'r Mesur, ar ei ffurf bresennol, yn caniatáu defnyddio cŵn o hyd i hela llwynogod at ddibenion difa plâu. Os wyf yn anghywir ynghylch hynny, ysgrifennaf atoch.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ydych yn cytuno bod mater hela â chŵn wedi'i drafod drwy dull democrataidd eglur a bod cyfrifoldeb gennym i gyd i ufuddhau i'r gyfraith a derbyn penderfyniad democrataidd, ac y dylai helwyr ddechrau chwilio am ryw beth arall i'w wneud?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr addewid yn yr etholiad oedd y byddid yn caniatáu i'r Senedd ddod i gasgliad ar hyn. Ni ddywedwyd yn bendant ba gasgliad y dylid dod iddo, ond yr oedd yn amlwg na allai'r mater aros yn ei unfan, fel bod Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn dal i bleidleisio o blaid rhywbeth dro ar ôl tro—mae'n debyg ei fod wedi gwneud hynny pedair gwaith yn barod—heb gael penderfyniad oherwydd y gwahaniaethau barn pendant rhwng y tŷ etholedig a'r tŷ anetholedig. Rywsut neu'i gilydd, er mwyn i ddemocratiaeth seneddol gadw ei hygredd, mae'n debyg bod rhaid gweithredu ar sail yr addewid wreiddiol yn y manifesto y byddai'r Senedd yn penderfynu ar y mater.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The Hunting Bill prevents farmers from using dogs to flush out foxes from forests and scrub land in the mountainous areas of Wales. Therefore, what will you do to ensure that that is changed for Welsh farmers so that they can control foxes?

**The First Minister:** I have always been in

blaid caniatáu i'r ffermwyr ddefnyddio cŵn, nid at ddibenion sbort, ond er mwyn rheoli niferoedd llwynogod, yn enwedig yn ystod y tymor ŵyna. Mae hynny'n hollol rhesymol, ond, cyn belled ag y gwn i, mae geiriad presennol y Mesur yn caniatáu i'r math hwnnw o hela—os hela ydyw—barhau. Fodd bynnag, os wyf yn anghywir, ysgrifennaf atoch.

favour of allowing farmers to use dogs, not for the purposes of sport, but to control the fox population, particularly during the lambing season. That is eminently reasonable, but, as far as I am aware, the Bill as it is currently worded will allow such hunting—if it is hunting—to continue. However, if I am incorrect, I will write to you.

### **Strategaeth Trafnidiaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad The Assembly Government's Transport Strategy**

**Q9 John Griffiths:** Will the First Minister make a statement on progress with the Assembly Government's transport strategy? (OAQ38213)

**C9 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar hynt strategaeth trafndiaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? (OAQ38213)

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** Good progress has been made on delivering our integrated transport agenda but the pace of change has not been quick enough and that is why we are seeking increased powers over transport as detailed in the draft Transport (Wales) Bill, which was published earlier this year. The Minister for Economic Development and Transport is also undertaking a review of current transport programmes to ensure that they are in line with our strategic priorities.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaed cynnydd da ar gyflawni ein hagenda ar drafndiaeth integredig ond ni fu'r newid yn ddigon cyflym a dyna pam yr ydym yn ceisio mwy o bwerau dros drafndiaeth fel y nodir yn y Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) drafft, a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach eleni. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn cynnal adolygiad o'r rhaglenni trafndiaeth presennol i sicrhau eu bod yn gyson â'n blaenoriaethau strategol.

**John Griffiths:** As I have mentioned on several occasions, there continues to be strong feeling in Newport and the surrounding area that when the passenger rail link from Ebbw Vale to Cardiff is established, the link to Newport should be established at the same time. That feeling is underpinned by the longstanding economic and social ties between Ebbw Vale and Newport, whereby Newport is a natural location for jobs, shopping and leisure activities. Will you assure me that the Welsh Assembly Government will continue to explore overcoming the barriers that are seen, by some at least, as preventing the establishment of a Newport to Ebbw Vale passenger rail link at the same time as the link to Cardiff?

**John Griffiths:** Fel yr wyf wedi dweud ar sawl achlysur, mae teimlad cryf o hyd yng Nghasnewydd a'r cyffiniau y dylid sefydlu'r cyswllt rheilffordd â Chasnewydd yr un pryd â'r cyswllt rheilffordd teithwyr o Lynebwy i Gaerdydd. Mae'r teimlad hwnnw'n seiliedig ar y cysylltiadau economaidd a chymdeithasol hirsefydlog rhwng Glynebwy a Chasnewydd, sy'n golygu bod Casnewydd yn lleoliad naturiol ar gyfer swyddi, siopa a gweithgareddau hamdden. A wnewch fy sicrhau y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dal i geisio chwalu'r rhwystrau a ystyrir, gan rai o leiaf, yn rhai sy'n atal sefydlu cyswllt rheilffordd teithwyr rhwng Casnewydd a Glynebwy yr un pryd â'r cyswllt â Chaerdydd?

**The First Minister:** There has been a problem with Network Rail, which you correctly identified, as regards getting the service into Newport as was originally envisaged, and that was why the service was switched to Cardiff. The train does not then have to go through the tunnel and use the signal box on the west side of the Gaer tunnel. The service to Cardiff will open in 2006, and although Newport station may be reconfigured or the signal box may be redone, it may still be 2009 before the hourly service to Newport is introduced. That is three years later than the service to Cardiff, and we all regret that, but it is better to get the service to Cardiff going in 2006, than to wait until 2009 to introduce both services simultaneously.

**Janet Davies:** It is three years now since the then Environment, Planning and Transport Committee published its final report on its policy review of public transport. One of the recommendations that your Government took on board was to improve long-distance coach provision. That has not happened—if anything, provision has deteriorated. People are tired of words on paper. Will you show the leadership expected of a First Minister and ensure that we have an adequate long-distance coach network and effective services?

**The First Minister:** It is difficult to address every single aspect of public transport provision and move it all forward together at the pace that some people might like. As with the issue of the Ebbw Vale to Newport train service, and whether it should be introduced at the same time as the Cardiff service, people look at free local bus services for people aged over 60 or people with disabilities, and ask why the same provision is not available on the trains: every time you want to do something, someone will ask whether that creates an anomaly in another part of the transport system. It is always possible to argue that. Most people understand that, with the opening of the Vale of Glamorgan railway line, the Ebbw Vale railway line and the introduction of free bus services, we have made a major commitment to public transport. That is one of the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bu problem mewn cysylltiad â Network Rail, a nodasoch, o ran mynd â'r gwasanaeth i Gasnewydd fel y rhagwelwyd yn wreiddiol, a dyna pam y penderfynwyd mynd â'r gwasanaeth i Gaerdydd yn lle hynny. Drwy wneud hynny, nid oes raid i'r trê'n fynd drwy'r twnnel a defnyddio'r caban signalau ar ochr orllewinol twnnel y Gaer. Bydd y gwasanaeth i Gaerdydd yn agor yn 2006, ac er y gellid ad-drefnu gorsaf Casnewydd neu ailwampio'r caban signalau, gellid gorfod disgwyl tan 2009 i gyflwyno'r gwasanaeth bob awr i Gasnewydd. Mae hynny dair blynedd yn hwyrach na'r gwasanaeth i Gaerdydd, ac mae hynny'n ofid i ni i gyd, ond gwell yw cael cychwyn y gwasanaeth i Gaerdydd yn 2006 na disgwyl tan 2009 i gyflwyno'r ddau wasanaeth yr un pryd.

**Janet Davies:** Mae tair blynedd bellach ers i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, fel yr oedd ar y pryd, gyhoeddi ei adroddiad terfynol ar ei adolygiad polisi o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Un o'r argymhellion a dderbyniodd eich Llywodraeth oedd y dylid gwella'r ddarpariaeth coetsis ar deithiau hirbell. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny—os rhywbeth, mae'r ddarpariaeth wedi dirywio. Mae pobl wedi blino ar weld geiriau ar bapur. A wnewch ddangos yr arweiniad a ddisgwylir gan Brif Weinidog a sicrhau y cawn rwydwaith coetsis digonol ar gyfer teithiau hirbell a gwasanaethau effeithiol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Anodd yw ymdrin â phob un agwedd ar y ddarpariaeth drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus a symud y cwbl ymlaen mor gyflym ag y carai rhai. Yn yr un modd â'r gwasanaeth trê'n o Lynebwy i Gasnewydd, ac a ddylid ei gyflwyno yr un pryd â'r gwasanaeth i Gaerdydd, mae rhai'n edrych ar wasanaethau bysiau lleol am ddim i rai dros 60 oed neu rai ag anabledau, ac yn gofyn pam nad yw'r un ddarpariaeth ar gael ar y trenau: bob tro y dymunwch wneud rhywbeth, bydd rhywun yn gofyn a yw hynny'n creu anghysonder mewn rhan arall o'r system drafnidiaeth. Gellir dadlau ar sail hynny bob amser. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn deall ein bod wedi gwneud ymrwymiad mawr i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, drwy agor rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg, drwy reilffordd Glynebwy a thrwy gyflwyno gwasanaethau bysiau am ddim. Dyna un o gyflawniadau

Assembly's proudest achievements over the last five and a half years, as it will be during the next three or four years.

**Catherine Thomas:** Do you agree that the free bus pass scheme is an excellent initiative, of which this Government should be proud? It has provided many people across Wales with more freedom and greater options. With that in mind, I ask you to welcome constituents of mine who are members of Llanelli hospital's league of friends, who do invaluable work in my constituency, and who have used their bus passes to travel to the Assembly today. *[Interruption.]*

**The First Minister:** I commend that. With a little initiative, I am told that it is possible to get from Cardiff, not only to Llanelli, but to Aberystwyth using different local services; it would show exceptional initiative to reach Colwyn Bay using local bus services. Judging by the noises off when you were asking your question, Catherine, it is evident that if ever the dark day dawned in which a government of a Conservative stripe were elected, the free bus pass scheme would not last long.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10 (OAQ38199) has been withdrawn.

mwyaf clodwiw'r Cynulliad dros y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf, fel y bydd yn ystod y tair neu bedair blynedd nesaf.

**Catherine Thomas:** A ydych yn cytuno bod y cynllun tocynnau bws am ddim yn fenter ragorol, y dylai'r Llywodraeth hon ymfalchïo ynddi? Mae wedi rhoi mwy o ryddid a mwy o ddewis i bobl ledled Cymru. Gan gofio hynny, gofynnaf ichi groesawu rhai o'm hetholwyr sy'n aelodau o gymdeithas cyfeillion ysbyty Llanelli, sy'n gwneud gwaith amhrisiadwy yn fy etholaeth, ac a ddefnyddiodd eu trwyddedau bws i ddod i'r Cynulliad heddiw. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cymeradwyaf hynny. O gael ychydig o fenter, dywedir wrthyf fod modd mynd o Gaerdydd, nid yn unig i Lanelli, ond i Aberystwyth gan ddefnyddio gwahanol wasanaethau lleol; dangosid menter eithriadol pe gellid cyrraedd Bae Colwyn drwy ddefnyddio gwasanaethau bws lleol. A barnu yn ôl y sŵn tu ôl pan oeddech yn gofyn eich cwestiwn, Catherine, mae'n amlwg, os byth y deuai'r diwrnod du yr etholid llywodraeth Geidwadol, na fyddai'r cynllun tocynnau bws am ddim yn parhau'n hir.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 10 (OAQ38199) yn ôl.

### **Effaith Cau Swyddfeydd Post The Impact of Post Office Closures**

**Q11 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact of post office closures on local communities? (OAQ38214)

**The First Minister:** Post office closures can have a serious impact on communities, and that is why we introduced the post office development fund, which has provided funding of £4.1 million to 105 post offices across Wales to help them to modernise or improve their security and make them more attractive places in which to do business. These branches have been given that opportunity to diversify services to the benefit of local residents. That is complementary to the rural post office scheme, which is run by the Department of

**C11 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar effaith cau swyddfeydd post ar gymunedau lleol? (OAQ38214)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cau swyddfeydd post yn gallu cael effaith ddifrifol ar gymunedau, a dyna pam y cyflwynasom gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, a ddarparodd gyllid o £4.1 miliwn i 105 o swyddfeydd post ledled Cymru i'w helpu i foderneiddio neu wella eu diogeledd a pheri iddynt fod yn fannau mwy deniadol i fasnachu. Mae'r canghennau hynny wedi cael cyfle o'r fath i arallgyfeirio eu gwasanaethau er budd trigolion lleol. Mae hynny'n mynd law yn llaw â chynllun y swyddfeydd post gwledig, sy'n cael ei redeg gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac sydd

Trade and Industry to largely the same end.

â'r un nod gyffredinol.

**Jenny Randerson:** You will be aware that an announcement made a few weeks ago stated that an additional 10 sub-post offices in Cardiff are scheduled for closure—it was announced a few weeks ago. The reason given for the closures was that business has declined so steeply that those post offices are no longer viable. Will you admit today that this is a direct result of the UK Government's policies that dragooned pensioners and benefit recipients into using banks instead of post offices, and will you join the Labour MPs and the many others who condemn the Government's tactics as being akin to bullying?

**Jenny Randerson:** Gwyddoch fod cyhoeddiad wedi'i wneud ychydig wythnosau'n ôl i'r perwyl bod 10 o is-swyddfeydd post ychwanegol yng Nghaerdydd wedi'u rhestru i'w cau—cyhoeddwyd hynny ychydig wythnosau'n ôl. Y rheswm a roddwyd am eu cau oedd bod busnes wedi dirywio mor gyflym fel nad oedd y swyddfeydd post hynny'n ddichonadwy bellach. A wnewch gyfaddef heddiw fod hynny'n ganlyniad uniongyrchol i bolisiau Llywodraeth y DU sydd wedi gorfodi pensiynewyr a rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau i ddefnyddio banciau yn lle swyddfeydd post, ac a wnewch ymuno â'r ASau Llafur a'r llu o rai eraill sy'n condemnio tactegau'r Llywodraeth gan ddweud eu bod yn debyg i fwlio?

**The First Minister:** There are many business reasons for closing down a sub-post office for example, the sub-postmaster or mistress may want to retire, and has no wish to continue or do not want to try to overcome the undoubted dip in business caused by losing the vast bulk of benefit claimants after benefits were paid directly into bank accounts. It is interesting to hear from noises off that some political parties believe that you can return to making benefit payments through the post office when the cost of such a transaction is 10 times higher than making a payment directly to a bank account, even though their main finance spokesman says that he will find ways to reduce waste and transfer services to the front line. I do not know how you can do that when every time you are presented with a way of reducing transaction costs, you oppose it for other reasons. That is a problem in the run up to an election: wanting to save everything while cutting the cost of everything, and you cannot do that. If the transaction costs of doing business through direct payments are one tenth of the cost of walking into a branch, you must find another way of generating business. It can be done; it requires business energy, a grant from us, and maybe there will then be a way to create a viable business. The reason for closing the post office will frequently be that the sub-postmaster or mistress has reached an age when they do not want to continue. [Interruption.]

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llawer o resymau sy'n ymwneud â busnes dros gau is-swyddfa bost: er enghraifft, gallai'r is-bostfeistr neu is-bostfeistres ddymuno ymddeol, a bod heb ddymuniad i barhau neu geisio trechu'r anhawster oherwydd y gostyngiad pendant a fu yn y busnes yn sgîl colli'r rhan helaethaf o'r hawlwyd budd-daliadau ar ôl dechrau talu budd-daliadau'n uniongyrchol i gyfrifon banc. Diddorol yw clywed o'r swm y tu ôl fod rhai pleidiau gwleidyddol yn credu y gellir mynd yn ôl at dalu budd-daliadau drwy'r swyddfa bost er bod cost trafodion o'r fath 10 gwaith yn uwch na chost talu'n uniongyrchol i gyfrif banc, er bod eu prif lefarydd ar gyllid yn dweud y daw o hyd i ddulliau o leihau gwastraff a throsglwyddo gwasanaethau i'r rheng flaen. Ni wn sut y gallwch wneud hynny a chithau, bob tro y cynigir modd ichi leihau costau trafodion, yn ei wrthwynebu am resymau eraill. Dyna'r broblem a geir yn y cyfnod cyn etholiad: dymuno arbed popeth gan dorri costau popeth ar yr un pryd, ac ni ellir gwneud hynny. Os yw cost trafodion a wneir drwy dalu'n uniongyrchol yn un rhan o ddeg y gost o wneud hynny mewn cangen, rhaid cael hyd i fodd arall i greu busnes. Gellir gwneud hynny; mae'n gofyn brwdfrydedd mewn busnes, grant oddi wrthym ni, ac efallai y bydd modd wedyn i greu busnes dichonadwy. Y rheswm a geir yn aml dros gau swyddfa bost yw bod yr is-bostfeistr neu is-bostfeistres wedi cyrraedd oedran pan nad yw'n dymuno dal ati. [Torri



*ar draws.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I encourage the First Minister not to pay any attention to so called ‘noises off’ in case he encourages Members to make more.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Anogaf y Prif Weinidog i beidio â thalu unrhyw sylw i'r sŵn y tu ôl, fel y'i gelwir, rhag ofn iddo gymell Aelodau i wneud mwy ohono.

### **Economi Leol Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy The Local Economy of Alyn and Deeside**

**Q12 Carl Sargeant:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the local economy of Alyn and Deeside? (OAQ38186)

**C12 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar economi leol Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy? (OAQ38186)

**The First Minister:** The Alyn and Deeside local economy is performing exceptionally well. The Assembly Government has supported 124 regional selective assistance or Assembly investment grant projects with grants in excess of £15 million. The projects are expected to create over 2,300 jobs and safeguard or maintain almost 1,000 others. In August this year—the latest figures—claimant count unemployment in Alyn and Deeside was 36 per cent lower than in August 1999.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae economi leol Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy yn perfformio'n eithriadol o dda. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cefnogi 124 o brosiectau drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol neu grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad gan roi grantiau sy'n werth mwy na £15 miliwn. Disgwylir y bydd y prosiectau hynny'n creu mwy na 2,300 o swyddi ac yn cadw neu'n diogelu bron 1,000 o rai eraill. Ym mis Awst eleni—y ffigurau diweddaraf—yr oedd diweithdra yn ôl nifer yr hawlwy'r budd-dal yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy 36 y cant yn is nag yn Awst 1999.

**Carl Sargeant:** As a directly elected Member, I am sure that you agree that we are rightly proud of the sustained improvement in the local economy and the genuine hard work that the Government and the people of my constituency have put in to ensure that it continues. Bearing that in mind, do you agree that it would not be good to rest on our laurels? Continued economic development is necessary, and the Flintshire gateway project will provide sufficient foresight and a sustainable contribution to the future economic development of north Wales.

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch ei bod yn briodol inni ymfalchïo yng ngwelliant parhaus yr economi leol a'r gwaith caled a wnaeth y Llywodraeth a phobl fy etholaeth i sicrhau ei fod yn parhau. Gan gofio hynny, a ydych yn cytuno nad peth da fyddai inni orffwys ar ein bri? Mae angen datblygu economaidd parhaus, a bydd prosiect porth sir y Fflint yn cynnig rhagofal digonol a chyfraniad cynaliadwy i ddatblygiad economaidd y Gogledd yn y dyfodol.

**The First Minister:** You are right to refer to the fact that the Deeside industrial park is virtually full. You must ask yourself what will happen when that park becomes full, whether you will say that that is enough when Flintshire or Alyn and Deeside closes to new business, or whether you want it to continue to develop and to continue in its role as the economic powerhouse of north-east Wales. A project, something like the northern gateway is probably needed following the failure of the traffic road development to gain the support of the public inquiry inspector. We

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n briodol ichi gyfeirio at y ffaith bod parc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy bron yn llawn. Rhaid gofyn beth a ddigwydd wedi i'r parc hwnnw lenwi, a ddywedir bod hynny'n ddigon pan fydd sir y Fflint neu Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy yn cau'r drws ar fusnes newydd, neu a ydys am ei weld yn dal i ddatblygu a pharhau â'i rôl fel ysgogydd economaidd y Gogledd-ddwyrain. Mae'n debyg bod angen prosiect cyffelyb i borth y gogledd ar ôl methu ag ennill cefnogaeth yr arolygydd yn yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i ddatblygu ffyrdd

are working closely with the Defence Aviation Repair Agency, Royal Air Force Sealand, the Welsh Development Agency, Corus, Defence Estates, and the Environment Agency and so on to see how we can bring that northern gateway project into being.

ar gyfer traffig. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos ag Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn, yr Awyrlu Brenhinol yn Sealand, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Corus, Ystadau Amddiffyn, ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac yn y blaen i weld sut y gallwn gyflawni prosiect porth y gogledd.

### **Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru The National Eisteddfod of Wales**

**Q13 Lisa Francis:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the National Eisteddfod of Wales? (OAQ38207)

**C13 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ38207)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government recognises the importance of the National Eisteddfod in supporting and promoting Welsh culture and the Welsh language. That is reflected by the fact that the Eisteddfod is one of the largest grant recipients of the Welsh Language Board. In the light of the recent controversy, I should perhaps add that we have made it clear that we are sympathetic to the appeals by the National Eisteddfod, but we are unable to write a blank cheque every year to cover losses made by the National Eisteddfod.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol wrth hybu a hyrwyddo diwylliant Cymreig a'r Gymraeg. Adlewyrchir hynny gan y ffaith bod yr Eisteddfod ymysg y rhai sy'n derbyn y grantiau mwyaf gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Yng ngolwg y dadlau diweddar, efallai y dylwn ychwanegu ein bod wedi egluro ein bod yn cydymdeimlo â'r apelau gan yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol, ond na allwn roi sicc wag bob blwyddyn i dalu am golledion a wnaed gan yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol.

2.50 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** If the Eisteddfod is expected to make cuts of £200,000 per annum, and it already raises 89 per cent of its income, how do you seriously expect it to continue without your Government giving it extra funding?

**Lisa Francis:** Os oes disgwyl i'r Eisteddfod wneud toriadau o £200,000 y flwyddyn, a hithau eisoes yn codi 89 y cant o'i hincwm, sut y gallwch ddisgwyl iddi barhau os na fydd eich Llywodraeth yn rhoi cyllid ychwanegol iddi?

**The First Minister:** If you could have a word with Oliver Letwin about a future Conservative Government's funding policy so that he is clear that he will be writing blank cheques for this, that and every other body, perhaps he can explain how he will achieve the cuts that he has been talking about. It is important that people recognise that the Welsh Language Board, in the light of figures provided by the Eisteddfod, has released a grant of £40,000 over the past months and is bringing forward a grant of £87,000, which would have been paid in January to the period before Christmas to solve some of the Eisteddfod's acute cash-flow problems. Meanwhile, we continue to ask for its business plan for the next five

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os gallech gael gair gydag Oliver Letwin ynghylch polisi cyllido gan Lywodraeth Geidwadol yn y dyfodol fel y caiff ddeall y bydd yn ysgrifennu sieciau gwag ar gyfer y corff yma a'r corff arall, efallai y gall egluro sut y bydd yn sicrhau'r toriadau y bu'n sôn amdanynt. Mae'n bwysig i bobl sylweddoli bod Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, yng ngoleuni ffigurau a ddarparwyd gan yr Eisteddfod, wedi rhoi grant o £40,000 dros y misoedd diwethaf a'i fod yn dwyn ymlaen grant o £87,000, a fyddai wedi'i dalu ym mis Ionawr, i'r cyfnod cyn y Nadolig i ddatrys rhai o'r problemau dwys sydd gan yr Eisteddfod o ran ei llif arian. Yn y cyfamser, yr ydym yn dal i ofyn am ei chynllun busnes ar gyfer y pum

years to see whether it cuts the mustard.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A ydych yn derbyn bod Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru yn creu darlun arbennig o dda, nid yn unig o ddiwylliant Cymru, ond o'r genedl Gymreig i ymwelwyr o bob rhan o'r byd? Onid oedd Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Casnewydd a'r Cylch 2004 yn llwyddiant enfawr o ran cyflwyno diwylliant Cymraeg i lawer o drigolion di-Gymraeg Cymru? Oni fu'r gost gysylltiedig a'r gwariant yng Nghasnewydd yn fuddsoddiad pwysig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid newydd sbon yw gwneud y gwaith cenhadol hwn o ddod â phrifwyl symudol i ardal dra di-Gymraeg. Felly, nid yw'n newydd i'r Eisteddfod dderbyn gwahoddiad i ardal fel Casnewydd i gyfiawnhau ychwanegiad digwestiwn i'w grant gan fwrdd yr iaith. Mae pawb yn derbyn mai dim ond wrth iddi gyflwyno cynllun busnes sy'n dangos y ffordd y bydd yn torri'i chostau neu'n ennill incwm newydd sy'n ddichonadwy ac o fewn synnwyr cyffredin, y gallwn ni fod yn gefnogol. Ni allwn ddweud, 'ocê', i bob colled yr ydych yn ei gwneud bob blwyddyn, ac ysgrifennu sic eiddau'r golled honno.

mlynedd nesaf i weld a yw'n ddigon da.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Do you accept that the National Eisteddfod of Wales creates an exceptionally positive image, not only of Welsh culture, but of the Welsh nation to visitors from all parts of the world? Was the Newport and District National Eisteddfod 2004 not a huge success in introducing Welsh-language culture to many of Wales's non-Welsh-speaking inhabitants? Was the associated cost and expenditure in Newport not an important investment?

**The First Minister:** There is nothing new about this kind of missionary work in bringing Wales's principal peripatetic festival to a predominantly English-speaking region. Therefore, the fact that the Eisteddfod was invited to Newport so as to justify an automatic increase in its grant from the language board is nothing new. Everyone accepts that, were it to present a business plan that shows how it will cut costs and attract new income, showing its viability and rationality, we can then be sympathetic. We cannot say, 'okay', to every loss that you make every year, and write a cheque to write off that debt.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I have one change to report to this week's business. The motion to elect members to the Local Government Partnership Council has been withdrawn from today's agenda because it came to our attention this morning that the motion as tabled is probably defective. I do not want to intentionally mislead the Assembly and will therefore, with your agreement, Llywydd, table a revised no-named day motion today with a motion to suspend Standing Orders, in order to allow the motion to be taken tomorrow.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined under Standing Order No. 24.6 that the

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig i ethol aelodau i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol wedi'i thynnu'n ôl o'r agenda heddiw gan iddi ddod i'n sylw y bore yma fod y cynnig fel y'i cyflwynwyd yn ddiffygiol, yn ôl pob tebyg. Nid wyf yn dymuno camarwain y Cynulliad yn fwriadol a byddaf, felly, gyda'ch cytundeb, Lywydd, yn cyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod diwygiedig heddiw gyda chynnig i ohirio Rheolau Sefydlog, fel y gellir trafod y cynnig yfory.

Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ymhellach i'r trafodion y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6 nad oes angen

following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extensive consideration: the Oil and Fibre Plant Seed (Wales) Regulations 2004, and the Polish Potatoes (Notification) (Wales) Order 2004.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. Er nad oedd gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes drafft— [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Trefn. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, byddaf yn caniatáu i Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol siarad yn fyr am y datganiad busnes.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Hoffwn, Drefnydd, ichi neilltuo amser yn yr wythnosau nesaf i'r Cynulliad gael trafod sefyllfa cynweithwyr Friction Dynamics, Caernarfon, a'r ffordd y mae'r perchennog, Craig Smith, wedi gwneud sbort ar ben deddfau diwydiannol a chyflogaeth. Er nad cyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol y Cynulliad yw'r mater hwn, fel yn achos pensiynau cyn-weithwyr Allied Steel and Wire Ltd, mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i gynrychioli ein gweithwyr a gwarchod eu hawliau.

Mr Craig Smith is taking the mickey out of the system and is making an ass of the law. Let us consider the facts: a company called Friction Dynamics, owned by Smith, goes into liquidation to avoid paying the workers what is theirs by right, and, hey presto, without a hitch, a new company emerges called Dynamex Friction, operating on the same site, owned by Mr Smith. A year down the line, it emerges that he owns this company also. The workers are still awaiting payment, and all that they have had from Labour Ministers in Cardiff and in London are warm words and the wringing of hands, the gist being 'We cannot do anything'. The workers and I want to know whether you want to do anything about it. This issue deserves an airing in the Chamber.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, I thank you for agreeing to my request this morning for a debate to be held some time within the next month or so on matters relating to the health

cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth canlynol i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaeth: Rheoliadau Hadau Planhigion Olew a Ffibr (Cymru) 2004, a Gorchymyn Hysbysu ynghylch Tatws sy'n Deillio o Wlad Pwyl (Cymru) 2004.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Although there were no objections to the draft business statement— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Order. Under Standing Order No. 5.4, I will allow one Member from each political group to speak briefly on the business statement.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Business Minister, I would like you to allocate some time in the coming weeks for a discussion on the situation facing former employees of Friction Dynamics, Caernarfon, and the way in which its owner, Craig Smith, has flouted industrial and employment laws. Although this matter is not directly the Assembly's responsibility, as in the case of the pensions of former Allied Steel and Wire Ltd workers, we have a duty to represent working people and defend their rights.

Mae Mr Craig Smith yn cael hwyl am ben y system ac yn gwneud ffŵl o'r gyfraith. Gadewch inni ystyried y ffeithiau: mae cwmni o'r enw Friction Dynamics, sy'n eiddo i Smith, yn ei ddiddymu ei hun i osgoi talu i'r gweithwyr yr hyn sy'n ddyledus iddynt, ac, am wyrth, heb unrhyw rwystr, daw cwmni newydd i'r golwg o'r enw Dynamex Friction, sy'n gweithredu ar yr un safle sy'n eiddo i Mr Smith. Flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, canfyddir mai ef sy'n berchen ar y cwmni hwn hefyd. Mae'r gweithwyr yn dal i ddisgwyl cael eu talu, a'r cwbl a gawsant gan Weinidogion Llafur yng Nghaerdydd ac yn Llundain yw geiriau caredig a gwasgu dwylo, a swm a sylwedd hynny yw 'Nid oes dim y gallwn ei wneud'. Mae'r gweithwyr a minnau am wybod a ydych yn dymuno gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Dylid gwyntyllu'r mater hwn yn y Siambr.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Drefnydd, diolchaf i chi am dderbyn fy nghais y bore yma am ddadl i'w chynnal rywbrud o fewn y mis nesaf, fwy neu lai, ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r

service, in particular the cross-border issues that David Melding raised with you last week. However, a serious point is that requests made by colleagues this morning in relation to Blaenau Gwent social services have been denied. We feel that an oral Assembly statement is needed on this matter, because it is not a minor issue; we are talking about children in the care of local authorities, and Blaenau Gwent local authority, in particular, is dismally failing these children. It is important that we have further updates and further opportunities to have discussions on this in the Chamber. It is not good enough to just have them in the Health and Social Services Committee; they need to be held here, as other Members, in particular the Member for Blaenau Gwent, who is not a member of the Health and Social Services Committee, no doubt wish to raise concerns.

**Kirsty Williams:** I point out to Jonathan that if he had made himself available at the Health and Social Services Committee last week instead of attending his party conference, he would have had the opportunity to ask about the situation in Blaenau Gwent. Under Standing Orders, it is also possible for the constituency Member for Blaenau Gwent to attend the Health and Social Services Committee and, with the Chair's permission, to ask questions that may be of concern to his constituents. That opportunity is available.

On the request made this morning by the Welsh Liberal Democrat group, we believe that a debate on anti-social behaviour is necessary, particularly in view of the news of the £350 million shortfall across the UK with regards to the employment of extra police and community support officers. Those are figures released by the Association of Police Authorities.

Given the First Minister's statement during questions today that Ministers are available 24 hours a day to be scrutinised by backbench Assembly Members, will the Business Minister make a statement on a return to a two-week committee cycle to allow that scrutiny to take place?

gwasanaeth iechyd, yn enwedig y materion trawsffiniol a gododd David Melding gyda chi yr wythnos diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod ceisiadau gan gyd-Aelodau y bore yma mewn cysylltiad â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Blaenau Gwent wedi'u gwrthod. Teimlwn fod angen datganiad llafar yn y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn, gan nad yw'n fater dibwys; yr ydym yn sôn am blant sydd yng ngofal awdurdodau lleol, ac mae awdurdod lleol Blaenau Gwent, yn benodol, yn gwneud cam mawr â'r plant hyn. Mae'n bwysig inni gael gwybodaeth bellach am ddatblygiadau a chyfleoedd pellach i drafod hyn yn y Siambr. Nid yw'n ddigon da gwneud hynny yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn unig; rhaid gwneud hynny yma, gan ei fod yn sicr y bydd Aelodau eraill, a'r Aelod dros Flaenau Gwent yn benodol, gan nad yw'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn dymuno mynegi pryderon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Dywedaf wrth Jonathan, pe buasai'n bresennol yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf yn lle bod yng nghynhadledd ei blaid, y cawsai gyfle i holi am y sefyllfa ym Mlaenau Gwent. O dan Reolau Sefydlog, mae hefyd yn bosibl i'r Aelod etholaeth dros Flaenau Gwent fod yn bresennol yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a, gyda chaniatâd y Cadeirydd, gofyn cwestiynau a all fod o bwys i'w etholwyr. Mae'r cyfle hwnnw ar gael.

Ynghylch y cais a wnaed y bore yma gan grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, credwn fod angen dadl ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, yn enwedig yng ngolwg y newydd am y diffyg o £350 miliwn ledled y DU mewn cysylltiad â chyflogi rhagor o heddweision a swyddogion cymorth cymunedol. Ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd gan Gymdeithas yr Awdurdodau Heddlu yw'r rhain.

Yng ngolwg datganiad y Prif Weinidog yn ystod cwestiynau heddiw fod Gweinidogion ar gael ddydd a nos i'w holi gan Aelodau Cynulliad y meinciau cefn, a wnaiff y Trefnydd ddatganiad ar ddychwelyd i gylch pwyllgorau pythefnosol fel y gall y craffu hwnnw ddigwydd?

**Peter Law:** Further to the point on Blaenau Gwent social services, I have every confidence in the work that the Minister is doing in relation to Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council and its social services department. As I said last week, I have seen improvements. The report was dated 31 July; it is now October, and the fact that the council has accepted that it has difficulties and that it needs to move forward, with the support of the Minister, shows that the situation is improving for looked-after children in Blaenau Gwent.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I was so pleasantly surprised that there were no objections that I forgot procedure and went to sit down. I apologise.

On Alun Ffred's point about Friction Dynamics, this was not raised in Business Committee this morning. I need to take the matter to the relevant Minister, and I will bring it back to you.

On the two-week committee cycle, you know, Kirsty, that I am in the process, in the run-up to Christmas, of reviewing the committee timetable. As reviews come before decisions, I have nothing to report at this point.

Jonathan, I do not intend to make time available at this stage on Blaenau Gwent, but this is not an attempt to thwart a debate on the matter. As Kirsty so pointedly told you, it was discussed last week at the Health and Social Services Committee. The chief inspector has established a programme of action under the protocol for dealing with serious concerns, and discussions held last week in committee reflected his work in establishing baselines and setting targets. Jane Hutt will continue to report progress on this to the committee, and a statement will be made to the Assembly at the appropriate time. I hope that that reassures you.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.*

**Peter Law:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt a wnaed am wasanaethau cymdeithasol Blaenau Gwent, mae gennyf bob ffydd yn y gwaith y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud mewn cysylltiad â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent a'i adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, yr wyf wedi gweld gwelliannau. Dyddiad yr adroddiad oedd 31 Gorffennaf; mae bellach yn fis Hydref, ac mae'r ffaith bod y cyngor wedi derbyn ei fod mewn trafferthion a bod angen iddo symud ymlaen, gyda chymorth y Gweinidog, yn dangos bod y sefyllfa'n gwella i blant sy'n derbyn gofal ym Mlaenau Gwent.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Yr oedd yn gymaint o bleser annisgwyl i mi nad oedd unrhyw wrthwynebiad fel yr anghofiais y weithdrefn a mynd i eistedd. Ymddiheuraf am hynny.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Alun Ffred am Friction Dynamics, ni chodwyd hyn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma. Bydd yn rhaid imi ddwyn y mater i sylw'r Gweinidog perthnasol, a deuf yn ôl atoch.

Ynghylch y cylch pwyllgorau pythefnosol, gwyddoch, Kirsty, fy mod wrthi, yn y cyfnod cyn y Nadolig, yn adolygu amserlen y pwyllgorau. Gan fod adolygiadau'n dod o flaen penderfyniadau, nid oes gennyf ddim i'w adrodd ar hyn o bryd.

Jonathan, nid wyf yn bwriadu neilltuo amser ar hyn o bryd i drafod Blaenau Gwent, ond nid yw hynny'n ymgais i rwystro dadl ar y mater. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty wrthyf mor glir, fe'i trafodwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'r prif arolygydd wedi pennu rhaglen weithredu o dan y protocol ar gyfer trafod pryderon difrifol, ac yr oedd y trafodaethau a gynhaliwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn y pwyllgor yn adlewyrchu'r gwaith a wnaeth o ran sefydlu llinellau sylfaen a gosod targedau. Bydd Jane Hutt yn dal i adrodd ar y cynnydd ar hyn i'r pwyllgor, a rhoddir datganiad i'r Cynulliad ar yr adeg briodol. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n tawelu'ch meddwl.

*Business statement adopted.*

3.00 p.m.

**Datganiad ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adroddiad y Pwyllgor  
Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ynghylch Tai ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Social Justice  
and Regeneration Committee's Report on Housing for Older People**

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I welcome the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's review and report on housing for older people. It demonstrates the committee's commitment, as well as my own, to taking forward this important aspect of the strategy for older people. Much hard work went into compiling this report, and I am also encouraged by the close cross-party co-operation that has taken place, particularly as it ensured that the focus did not deviate from older people and their many needs.

The report makes 26 recommendations, which are cross-sector in scope, notably on housing, health and social care. If you have had an opportunity to read your budget papers you will see that there is a good news story in my budget on the social housing grant and Wanless money, which I hope will help us with regard to closer working between health and social care. The committee considered several important issues such as joint provision, occupational therapist services, sheltered housing and extra-care schemes, as well as the valuable contribution that the voluntary sector makes to service provision. During the research and evidence-gathering phases of the review, several visits were made to social care schemes as well as to several care and repair agencies. It is fair to say that the committee was impressed with what it saw. Members were not only struck by the range and quality of services offered, and the innovation and good practice in existence, but by the high degree of professionalism, dedication and commitment exhibited by these organisations and their staff.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Croesawaf adolygiad ac adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ynghylch tai ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Dengys ymrwymiad y pwyllgor, a'm hymrwymiad i, i hyrwyddo'r agwedd bwysig hon ar y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ganlyniad i lawer o waith caled, ac fe'm calonogwyd gan y cydweithredu clòs a fu rhwng y pleidiau, yn enwedig gan fod hynny wedi sicrhau nad oedd y sylw'n troi oddi wrth bobl hŷn a'u hanghenion lawer.

Mae'r adroddiad yn gwneud 26 o argymhellion, a'r rheini'n cwmpasu sawl sector, yn enwedig ar dai, iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Os cawsoch gyfle i ddarllen eich papurau cyllideb, gwelwch fod newydd da yn fy nghyllideb ar y grant tai cymdeithasol ac arian Wanless, a fydd o gymorth i ni, yr wyf yn gobeithio, o ran sicrhau cydweithio agosach rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Ystyriodd y pwyllgor sawl pwnc pwysig fel darparu ar y cyd, gwasanaethau therapyddion galwedigaethol, tai gwarchod a chynlluniau gofal ychwanegol, yn ogystal â chyfraniad gwerthfawr y sector gwirfoddol at ddarparu gwasanaethau. Yn ystod camau ymchwil a chasglu tystiolaeth yr adolygiad, cafwyd sawl ymweliad â chynlluniau gofal cymdeithasol yn ogystal â sawl asiantaeth gofal a thrwsio. Teg yw dweud bod gan y pwyllgor feddwl mawr o'r hyn a welodd. Trawyd Aelodau gan amrywiaeth ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau a gynigir, a'r arloesi a'r arferion da a geir, a hefyd gan y proffesiynoldeb, yr ymroddiad a'r ymrwymiad mawr a amlygwyd gan y cyrff hyn a'u staff.

The report was the product of wide-ranging consultation, orally and in correspondence, while the appointment of an expert adviser was also important in terms of guidance, knowledge and expertise. However, consultation is often an ongoing process, and as the report is now in the public domain we would welcome comments and observations from all interested parties and individuals on the content, recommendations and further direction that we must take in policy.

Research has shown that, over the next 40 years, the population will age significantly. Older people are more likely than younger people to experience poor housing conditions, to lack modern amenities or facilities in their own homes and to need adaptations to enable them to live independently. Despite being homeowners, many older people have relatively low incomes and limited savings and, as a consequence, they often face major difficulties in coping with repairs, improvements and adaptation costs. Older people are also significantly more likely to suffer from a long-term illness that limits their activities and requires some form of care, support or adaptation to their homes.

Most of these issues are covered in the report, and I fully accept most of the report's recommendations, as my written statement made clear. The recommendations are principally focused on the need for more integrated care and joint working, increased funding for domiciliary care, the need for more sheltered housing, specialised accommodation and extra-care facilities, continued support for care and repair services, solutions to the shortage of occupational therapists, a review of the disabled facilities grants regime, and consideration of equity release schemes and other loan mechanisms as viable options. Several of the recommendations call for further guidance and research, while others, such as the disabled facilities grant review, alternative loan packages and continued support for care and repair are already being taken forward.

On extra-care housing schemes, several registered social landlords have engaged closely with individual local authorities and

Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn ganlyniad i ymgynghori eang, ar lafar a drwy ohebu, ac yr oedd penodi cynghorwr arbenigol hefyd yn bwysig o ran cael cyfarwyddyd, gwybodaeth ac arbenigedd. Fodd bynnag, proses barhaus yw ymgynghori'n aml, a chan fod yr adroddiad wedi'i gyhoeddi bellach byddem yn croesawu sylwadau ar y cynnwys, yr argymhellion a'r cyfeiriad y dylem ei ddilyn yn ein polisi yn y dyfodol gan y rhai â diddordeb.

Mae ymchwil wedi dangos y bydd y boblogaeth yn heneiddio'n sylweddol dros y 40 mlynedd nesaf. Mae pobl hŷn yn fwy tebygol na phobl iau o brofi amgylchiadau tai gwael, o fod heb fwynderau a chyfleusterau modern yn eu cartrefi ac o fod ag angen addasiadau i'w galluogi i fyw'n annibynnol. Er eu bod yn berchen ar eu cartrefi, mae incwm llawer o bobl hŷn yn gymharol isel ac ychydig o gynilion sydd ganddynt ac, o ganlyniad, maent yn aml yn wynebu anawsterau mawr wrth ymdopi â chostau atgyweirio, gwella ac addasu. Mae pobl hŷn yn fwy tebygol o lawer hefyd o ddiodef gan salwch tymor hir sy'n cyfyngu ar eu gweithgareddau ac yn gofyn rhyw fath o ofal, cymorth neu addasu ar eu cartrefi.

Ymdrinnir â'r rhan fwyaf o'r materion hyn yn yr adroddiad, ac yr wyf yn llwyr dderbyn y rhan fwyaf o argymhellion yr adroddiad, fel yr oedd fy natganiad ysgrifenedig yn egluro. Mae'r argymhellion yn ymwneud yn bennaf â'r angen am fwy o ofal integredig a gweithio ar y cyd, mwy o gyllid ar gyfer gofal yn y cartref, yr angen am fwy o dai gwarchod, tai arbenigol a chyfleusterau gofal ychwanegol, cymorth parhaus i wasanaethau gofal a thrwsio, atebion i ddatrys prinder therapyddion galwedigaethol, adolygiad o gyfundrefn y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl, ac ystyriaeth i gynlluniau rhyddhau ecwiti a dulliau benthyca eraill fel dewisiadau dichonol. Mae nifer o'r argymhellion yn galw am ganllawiau ac ymchwil pellach, tra bo eraill, fel yr adolygiad o'r grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl, pecynnau benthyca gwahanol a chymorth parhaus ar gyfer gofal a thrwsio yn cael eu hyrwyddo eisoes.

Ynghylch cynlluniau tai â gofal ychwanegol, bu sawl landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig yn ymwneud yn agos ag awdurdodau lleol a



health partnerships in developing housing schemes for the elderly. However, I also recognise that in some rural areas the degree of need may be insufficient to support the development of specialised forms of provision such as the type of extra-care schemes that have now been completed in some of our towns and cities. In these areas, and elsewhere, there will often be a need for small-scale solutions, and I recognise the need for funding mechanisms and strategic planning to incorporate the flexibility to support such solutions. This will be reflected in the revised guidance that we will provide in support of recommendation 2.

Clarification of the role that sheltered housing and other specialised accommodation can play in the overall range of provision will be informed by the research projects that I have agreed to support under recommendations 18 and 19. These should also help to provide examples of good practice and the lessons that have been learnt from earlier schemes.

The strategy for older people, introduced by the Welsh Assembly Government, offers a comprehensive and integrated approach and follows extensive consultation with all partners, including older people themselves. Moreover, it provides a framework for all statutory bodies in Wales to plan for the implications of an ageing society, address age discrimination and improve services for older people now. Local authorities and the voluntary sector are making excellent progress in implementing this ground-breaking strategy, which we are supporting with funding of £10 million over four years.

One of the key commitments in the older people's strategy, in relation to housing and independence, is to conduct a national debate on meeting the future housing needs of older people. The Assembly's Cabinet sub-committee on older people has also identified this issue as a main priority.

phartneriaethau iechyd penodol wrth ddatblygu cynlluniau tai ar gyfer yr henoed. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod y gallai maint yr angen mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig fod yn annigonol i gyfiawnhau datblygu mathau o ddarpariaeth arbenigol fel y math o gynlluniau gofal ychwanegol sydd wedi'u cwblhau bellach yn rhai o'n trefi a'n dinasoedd. Yn yr ardaloedd hyn, ac mewn mannau eraill, bydd angen cael atebion ar raddfa fach yn aml, a chydabyddaf yr angen am ddulliau cyllido a chynllunio strategol a fydd yn ddigon hyblyg i hwyluso atebion o'r fath. Adlewyrchir hynny yn y canllawiau diwygiedig a roddwn i ategu argymhelliad 2.

Rhoddir gwedd eglurach ar y rhan y bydd tai gwarchod a mathau eraill o dai arbenigol yn gallu ei chwarae yn amrediad cyffredinol y ddarpariaeth gan y prosiectau ymchwil yr wyf wedi cytuno i'w cynnal o dan argymhellion 18 a 19. Mae'n debyg y bydd y rhain hefyd yn fodd i gynnig enghreifftiau o arferion da a gwersi a ddysgwyd o gynlluniau cynharach.

Mae'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn cynnig dull gweithredu cynhwysfawr ac integredig ac yn dilyn ymgynghori eang â'r holl bartneriaid, gan gynnwys pobl hŷn. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'n cynnig fframwaith i'w ddefnyddio gan yr holl gyrff statudol yng Nghymru i gynllunio ar gyfer yr hyn y bydd cymdeithas sy'n heneiddio yn ei olygu, i ymdrin â gwahaniaethu ar sail oed ac i wella gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn awr. Mae awdurdodau lleol a'r sector gwirfoddol yn gwneud cynnydd rhagorol wrth weithredu'r strategaeth arloesol hon, y rhesom £10 miliwn o gyllid i'w hyrwyddo dros bedair blynedd.

Un o'r prif ymrwymadau yn y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, mewn cysylltiad â thai ac annibyniaeth, yw y cynhelir dadl genedlaethol ar ddiwallu anghenion tai pobl hŷn yn y dyfodol. Mae is-bwyllgor Cabinet y Cynulliad ar bobl hŷn wedi nodi'r mater hwn fel prif flaenoriaeth hefyd.

In parallel with the preparation for the national debate, work is continuing to ensure that the housing, health and social care needs of older people are more closely aligned. Ensuring that there are strong links at every level between health, social care and housing is, of course, particularly relevant to taking forward the Wanless report and the Wales care strategy group report by actively promoting independence or preventing people from moving to a higher level of dependence. As a step forward on this, we will be establishing an integrated housing, health and social care officials team. The publication of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's report is therefore both timely and helpful in providing context and evidence for the further important work that is to follow on housing and older people.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawaf ddatganiad gan Weinidog ar adroddiad sy'n cyflwyno 26 o argymhellion pan fo 19 ohonynt yn cael eu derbyn yn llawn, pedwar wedi eu derbyn yn rhannol, un dan ystyriaeth a dim ond dau wedi eu gwrthod. Mae hwnnw'n ymateb sylweddol. Cawsom gyfle ychydig wythnosau yn ôl i drafod yr adroddiad, sy'n un pwysig. Cyfeiriaf at rai o'r argymhellion a wnaethpwyd. Mae argymhelliad 7 yn sôn am brinder therapyddion galwedigaethol. Derbyniwch fod yn rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny a chydnabyddwch fod angen hyfforddi mwy o therapyddion. Fodd bynnag, mae'r broblem yn llawer mwy na hynny oherwydd mae problem o ran sicrhau ein bod yn cadw'r therapyddion hynny mewn gwaith ac o ran creu lleoliadau iddynt a sicrhau bod swyddi ar gael. Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny, o dderbyn bod angen dirfawr am therapyddion galwedigaethol?

Mae argymhelliad 8 yn cyfeirio at y cymhorthdal ar gyfer addasu tai ar gyfer pobl anabl. Credaf fod tystiolaeth gyffredinol fod darpariaeth yn amrywio yn fawr rhwng siroedd ac awdurdodau yng Nghymru. Yr oedd un o fy etholwyr yn derbyn gwasanaeth llawn pan oedd yn byw yng Ngwynedd ond ni allodd gael gwasanaeth i'r un lefel yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod pawb yn cael eu trin yn gyfartal? Nid oes dim

Ochr yn ochr â'r paratoi ar gyfer y ddatgenedlaethol, mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i sicrhau y bydd anghenion pobl hŷn o ran tai, iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn cael eu trafod gyda'i gilydd fwyfwy. Mae'r angen i sicrhau cysylltiadau cryf ar bob lefel rhwng iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a thai yn arbennig o berthnasol, wrth gwrs, wrth hyrwyddo adroddiad Wanless ac adroddiad grŵp strategaeth gofal Cymru drwy hybu annibyniaeth neu atal pobl rhag mynd yn fwy dibynnol. Er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â hyn, byddwn yn sefydlu tîm integredig o swyddogion tai, iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Gan hynny, mae cyhoeddi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio'n amserol ac yn gymorth o ran cynnig cyd-destun a thystiolaeth ar gyfer y gwaith pwysig pellach a fydd yn dilyn ar dai a phobl hŷn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I welcome a Minister's statement on a report that makes 26 recommendations when 19 are fully accepted, four are partially accepted, one is being considered and only two have been rejected. That is quite a response. We had the opportunity some weeks ago to discuss the report, which is important. I will refer to some of the recommendations. Recommendation 7 refers to the shortage of occupational therapists. You accept that we must tackle this issue and you acknowledge the fact that we need to train more therapists. However, the problem is far more extensive than that because there is a problem in ensuring that we retain those therapists in their posts, in creating placements for them and in ensuring that jobs are available. How do you intend to tackle those problems, bearing in mind that there is a dire shortage of occupational therapists?

Recommendation 8 refers to disability facilities grants. I believe that there is general evidence that provision varies greatly from one county to another and from one authority to another in Wales. One of my constituents received a full service when he lived in Gwynedd but did not receive the same level of service in Carmarthenshire. How will you ensure that everyone is treated equally? There is nothing in your response that refers to

yn eich ymateb sy'n cyfeirio at wneud sylwadau i'r Gweinidog priodol yn Llundain i sicrhau y ceir gwared ar y prawf modd, sef un o'r problemau mwyaf, ac y caiff treth ar werth ei ostwng ar y gwaith a gyflawnir. Byddai'r ddau newid hynny yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr.

Mae argymhelliad 22 yn cyfeirio at bentrefi i'r henoed. Derbyniwn fod y boblogaeth yn heneiddio a bod pobl yn llawer iachach yn awr wrth iddynt heneiddio nag yn y gorffennol. Felly, mae angen iddynt fod mewn sefyllfa lle y maent yn annibynnol ond bod elfen o oruchwyliaeth hefyd. Soniasoch am y prosiect yn Abertawe. Onid oes angen llawer mwy o arbrofi yn y maes hwn i weld beth a all ddigwydd? Dywedasoch nad yw'r gyllideb yn ddibendraw, a derbynias hynny. Fodd bynnag, a oes diffyg yn y gyllideb ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol? Dywedodd y Canghellor yn San Steffan fod £450 miliwn ar gael ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol drwy Brydain. Mae'r swm ar gyfer Cymru o'i gymharu â hynny yn ymddangos yn fach iawn.

Mae argymhelliad 23 yn cyfeirio at bobl mewn cartrefi gofal. Yn ystod y broses o gasglu'r wybodaeth ar gyfer yr adroddiad, gwelwyd bod llawer o bobl yn byw mewn cartrefi o'r fath am flynyddoedd maith a'u bod yn eu hystyried yn gartrefi iddynt hwy bellach. Eto i gyd, nid oes ganddynt hawliau. Pan fydd cartref yn cau, caiff trigolion eu symud i gartref arall heb reolaeth dros eu bywydau eu hunain. Yr ydych wedi derbyn yn rhannol fod y canllawiau presennol yn annigonol, gan ddweud eich bod yn barod i'w hystyried. Yr ydych wedi sôn am siarter hawliau gwirfoddol, ond a ydych wedi ystyried siarter hawliau statudol? A ydych hefyd wedi ystyried ymgyrch Ken Mack yn y Gogledd? Mae nifer o bobl wedi ymateb i'r ymgyrch hon gan eu bod o'r farn bod gan bobl sy'n byw mewn cartrefi gofal yr un hawliau â phobl sy'n byw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, ynghyd â'r un hawliau dynol â phawb arall.

3.10 p.m.

Mae'r cloc wedi parhau i redeg ers y siaradwr diwethaf, felly nid wyf yn gwybod faint o amser sydd gennyf yn weddill. Ymddiheuraf

making representation to the appropriate Minister in London to ensure that the means test, which is one of the greatest problems, is withdrawn, and that VAT on the work carried out is reduced. Those two changes would make a great difference.

Recommendation 22 refers to retirement villages. We accept that the population is ageing and that people are now much healthier as they grow older than was the case in the past. Therefore, they need to be in a situation where they are independent but where there is also some element of supervision. You mentioned the project in Swansea. Do we not need to experiment far more in this area to see what can be done? You mentioned that the budget is not limitless, and I accept that. However, is there a shortfall in the budget for social housing? The Chancellor in Westminster said that £450 million is available for social housing throughout Britain. The sum for Wales appears to be extremely small in comparison.

Recommendation 23 refers to people in care homes. During the process of gathering information for the report, it became apparent that many people live in such homes for many years and that they perceive them as their own homes. However, they do not have rights. When a home closes, residents are moved to another home without being given a say in decisions concerning their own lives. You have acknowledged to some extent that current guidelines are inadequate and have stated that they will be reconsidered. You referred to a voluntary charter of rights, but have you considered a statutory charter of rights? Have you also considered Ken Mack's campaign in north Wales? Many people have responded to the campaign because they believe that care home residents have the same rights as people living in their own homes, as well as the same human rights as each and every one of us.

The clock was not reset following the last speaker's contribution, so I do not know how much time I have left. I apologise if I have

os ydwyf wedi mynd tu hwnt i'r amser oedd gennyf. Yr wyf am wneud un pwynt wrth derfynu.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid dadl yw hon, ond datganiad.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Derbyniaf hynny, a gofynnaf gwestiwn i derfynu.

Mae argymhellion 12 a 13 yn ymwneud â rhyddhau ecwiti a rhoi cyfle i bobl fenthyg arian. Nid ydych wedi derbyn yr argymhellion hynny, Weinidog, gan eich bod yn parhau i ystyried rhyddhau ecwiti. Sut y bwriadwch sicrhau bod arian ar gael i ganiatáu i bobl wneud gwaith angenrheidiol ar eu tai pan fo'u harian i gyd wedi'i glymu yn eu heiddo?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for your positive contribution on the report and on how I am taking forward the recommendations. On recommendations 12 and 13, I made it clear in my written response to the committee's report that I must discuss equity release with my UK counterparts; it is a UK matter, not just a Welsh matter. I will pursue the subject because it is important that people can use their home as an asset in order to improve their conditions. I am wary of equity release schemes, about which there are concerns. I would not want the Assembly Government to recommend that people take part in such schemes without first doing further work on this area. I will take the matter forward and keep the committee updated on progress on the implementation of the report.

On care homes, we have considered the voluntary charter of rights, and I am prepared to consider a statutory charter. I think that we will encounter obstacles, but I will discuss it with my colleague, Jane Hutt, who has primary responsibility in this area. We are both aware of Ken Mack's campaign in north Wales, which, as I understand it, has received a great deal of public support.

The lack of occupational therapists is an issue of concern that I have discussed with the Minister for Health and Social Services. She

exceeded the allocated time. I want to make one further point in drawing to a close.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are responding to a statement, not a debate.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I accept your guidance, and will ask a question to conclude.

Recommendations 12 and 13 relate to releasing equity and giving people an opportunity to borrow money. You have not accepted these recommendations, Minister, as you are still considering equity release. How do you intend to ensure that funding is available for people who need to carry out necessary alterations to their homes when all of their money is tied up in their property?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch am eich cyfraniad cadarnhaol ar yr adroddiad ac ar y modd yr wyf yn hyrwyddo'r argymhellion. Ynghylch argymhellion 12 a 13, eglurais yn fy ymateb ysgrifenedig i adroddiad y pwyllgor y bydd yn rhaid imi drafod rhyddhau ecwiti gyda fy nghymheiriaid yn y DU; mater i'r DU ydyw, nid i Gymru'n unig. Byddaf yn gweithredu ar y mater hwn gan ei fod yn bwysig i bobl allu defnyddio eu cartref fel ased er mwyn gwella eu hamgylchiadau. Yr wyf yn ochelgar ynghylch cynlluniau rhyddhau ecwiti, gan fod pryderon yn eu cylch. Ni fyddwn am weld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn argymhell y dylai pobl gymryd rhan mewn cynlluniau o'r fath heb wneud gwaith pellach yn y maes hwn. Byddaf yn delio â'r mater ac yn rhoi gwybod i'r pwyllgor ar y cynnydd a wneir wrth roi'r adroddiad ar waith.

Ynghylch cartrefi gofal, yr ydym wedi ystyried y siarter hawliau wirfoddol, ac yr wyf yn barod i ystyried siarter statudol. Credaf y byddwn yn wynebu rhwystrau, ond fe'i trafodaf gyda fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, sydd â'r prif gyfrifoldeb yn y maes hwn. Mae'r ddwy ohonom yn gwybod am ymgyrch Ken Mack yn y Gogledd, sydd wedi denu llawer o gefnogaeth gan y cyhoedd, yr wyf yn deall.

Mae prinder therapyddion galwedigaethol yn destun pryder yr wyf wedi'i drafod gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

is also concerned about how we can attract more occupational therapists to work in the public sector in Wales. We need to work on this. One of the obstacles to accessing the disabled facilities grant is the fact that we do not have occupational therapists to carry out assessments. Our work on reviewing the grant is well advanced, and I hope to include the subject in my report to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee next week, indicating the way forward. It is clear that means testing for people with children who want to claim disabled facilities grant is difficult. I hope that specific recommendations will emerge which can be discussed in committee.

I am happy to take forward your point about improvements to VAT arrangements. On retirement villages, experiments are being conducted. A retirement village cannot be built in a location that has no links with the local community. Would we want lush, grand retirement villages across Wales that do not have any links with communities? We need to consider how and why these villages should be used and integrated. I will update the committee on local issues in this regard and on any information we receive about how these villages have worked in other parts of the UK.

**Mark Isherwood:** During the debate on the report on 29 September, I stated that I know from personal experience that older people

‘seek a voice in the management of their homes, and priority must be given in older people’s forums and beyond to enabling older people to engage directly with their housing services.’

I, therefore, particularly welcome your acceptance of recommendation 1, along with the other 18 acceptances of recommendations made.

With reference to recommendation 7, and your acceptance of the need to address the shortage of occupational therapists, I commend the open referral system put into

Cymdeithasol. Mae hithau’n ymboeni am y modd y gallwn ddenu rhagor o therapyddion galwedigaethol i weithio yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni weithio ar hyn. Un o’r rhwystrau rhag cael grant cyfleusterau i’r anabl yw’r ffaith nad oes gennym ddigon o therapyddion galwedigaethol i wneud asesiadau. Mae ein gwaith ar adolygu’r grant yn mynd rhagddo’n dda, a gobeithiaf gynnwys y pwnc hwnnw yn fy adroddiad i’r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yr wythnos nesaf, gan nodi’r ffordd ymlaen. Mae’n amlwg bod cynnal prawf moddion ar gyfer rhai sydd â phlant sy’n dymuno hawlio grant cyfleusterau i’r anabl yn fater anodd. Gobeithiaf y bydd argymhellion penodol yn codi y gellir eu trafod yn y pwyllgor.

Yr wyf yn barod i drafod y pwynt a wnaethoch am welliannau i drefniadau TAW. Ynghylch pentrefi i’r henoed, mae arbrofion yn cael eu cynnal. Ni ellir codi pentref i’r henoed mewn man sydd heb gysylltiadau â’r gymuned leol. A fyddem am gael pentrefi mawreddog, glaswelltog i’r henoed ledled Cymru nad oedd ganddynt unrhyw gysylltiadau â chymunedau? Rhaid inni ystyried ym mha fodd ac i ba ddiben y dylid defnyddio’r pentrefi hyn a’u hintegreiddio. Rhoddaf wybod i’r pwyllgor am faterion lleol sy’n codi mewn cysylltiad â hyn ac am unrhyw wybodaeth a gawn am y modd y mae pentrefi o’r fath wedi gweithio mewn rhannau eraill o’r DU.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn ystod y ddaol ar yr adroddiad ar 29 Medi, dywedais fy mod yn gwybod o brofiad personol fod pobl hŷn

‘am chwarae rhan wrth reoli eu cartrefi, a rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth mewn fforymau i bobl hŷn a thu hwnt i’w galluogi i gyfathrebu’n uniongyrchol â’u gwasanaethau tai.’

Gan hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu’n benodol y ffaith eich bod yn derbyn argymhelliad 1, ynghyd â’r 18 argymhelliad arall a dderbyniasoch.

Gan gyfeirio at argymhelliad 7, a’r ffaith eich bod yn derbyn bod angen rhoi sylw i brinder therapyddion galwedigaethol, cymeradwyaf y system atgyfeirio agored a roddwyd ar waith

practice at the Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust. This works well by adopting good practice and unblocking bureaucracy. It gives private sector standards to public sector patients, and shrinks waiting lists at little or no cost. I urge you to discuss this with your colleague, the Minister for Health and Social Services.

In respect of recommendation 12, which is under consideration with regard to encouraging the UK Government to remove equity release loans from Consumer Credit Act 1974, will you clarify whether or not this relates to the removal of equity release loans for home improvement and transferring that through the mortgage code, which the Financial Services Authority spoke about in evidence to the committee? In the meantime, will you use your good offices, collectively, to convey the message that persons redeeming or repaying their mortgages are put at a disadvantage in these circumstances? If the mortgage can be left open with only £1, mortgage-holders can access low-cost mortgage funds for home improvement from reputable high-street lenders.

I am concerned about your non-acceptance of recommendation 13. When I spoke on 29 September, I stated that this recommendation:

‘calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to establish and fund a not-for-profit Welsh home improvement lending agency to provide essential home repair funding for financially excluded home owners. I therefore call on the Minister to give a true working partnership role to the Council of Mortgage Lenders on this matter. The council created and promoted this scheme, it will fund the loans, and its members alone have the innovative skills and expertise that the Welsh Assembly Government will need to draw upon for guidance. This is truly an example of ethical business in the community and real public-private partnership.’

I am therefore concerned that you indicate that this is not feasible, when the feedback that I have consistently and recently received from the Council of Mortgage Lenders, is that it was keen to take this scheme forward

yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Siroedd Conwy a Dinbych. Mae'n llwyddo drwy fabwysiadu arferion da a thorri biwrocratiaeth. Mae'n cynnig safonau'r sector preifat i gleifion y sector cyhoeddus, ac yn lleihau rhestrau aros heb fawr o gost. Fe'ch anogaf i drafod hyn gyda'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Gyda golwg ar argymhelliad 12, sy'n cael ei ystyried mewn cysylltiad ag annog Llywodraeth y DU i eithrio benthyciadau rhyddhau ecwiti o Ddeddf Credyd Defnyddwyr 1974, a wnewch egluro a yw hyn yn ymwneud ag eithrio benthyciadau rhyddhau ecwiti i wella cartrefi a'u trosglwyddo drwy'r cod morgeisi, y soniodd yr Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol amdano yn ei dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor? Yn y cyfamser, a fyddwch mor gymwynasgar, gyda'ch gilydd, â chyfleu'r neges bod rhai sy'n clirio neu'n ad-dalu eu morgais yn cael eu rhoi dan anfantais yn yr amgylchiadau hyn? Os gellir gadael y morgais yn agored a dim ond £1 ynddo, gall deiliaid morgeisi gael arian morgais ar gost isel ar gyfer gwella eu cartrefi oddi wrth fenthycwyr dibynadwy ar y stryd fawr.

Yr wyf yn bryderus am nad ydych yn derbyn argymhelliad 13. Pan siaredais ar 29 Medi, dywedais fod yr argymhelliad hwn:

‘yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sefydlu ac ariannu asiantaeth benthyciadau gwella cartrefi di-elw i Gymru i ddarparu cyllid hanfodol i drwsio cartrefi i berchnogion cartrefi sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n ariannol. Galwaf felly ar y Gweinidog i roi rôl bartneriaeth waith wirioneddol i'r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgais yn hyn o beth. Y cyngor a greodd ac a hyrwyddodd y cynllun hwn ac a fydd yn ariannu'r benthyciadau, a dim ond ei aelodau sy'n meddu ar y sgiliau a'r arbenigedd arloesol y bydd eu hangen ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'w thywys. Mae hon yn enghraifft ardderchog o fusnes egwyddorol yn y gymuned a phartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat gwirioneddol.’

Yr wyf yn bryderus felly eich bod yn dweud nad yw hyn yn ddichonol, a minnau wedi cael adborth cyson a diweddar oddi wrth y Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgais i'r perwyl ei fod yn awyddus i fwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun

with you and was concerned that it is now many months since it had heard from you. I will not name local authorities in north Wales, for fear of embarrassing the housing officers who should not be exposed here, but senior housing officers in north Wales have emphasized to me how important they consider the acceptance of this particular scheme to be.

Moving to recommendation 20, which is partly accepted, although guidance already exists or is not appropriate, will you clarify this, as it is so crucial to the delivery of the report's recommendations?

With regard to recommendation 22, which is not accepted because the social housing grant budget is limited, I urge you to work with registered social landlords, and the voluntary and private sectors by accessing imaginative funds from many sources to roll out this scheme because there are so many good practice models in other parts of the United Kingdom and overseas that we could consider.

In terms of recommendation 23, again partly accepted in terms of providing guidance on residential home closures, Rhodri Glyn referred to Ken Mack—as I did on 29 September—who highlights the high and tragic incidence of early deaths among residents evicted through care-home closures. No older person is expendable and no life represents a price worth paying for dogma about the private sector. I hope that this will be fully accepted and that practical measures can be put in place to deliver that.

Recommendation 24 is, again, partly accepted. It highlights the need for local planning authorities to encourage a variety of ownership forms. You have stated that we may revisit this after research into sheltered housing is completed. Sheltered housing is crucial, but my recollection is that this dealt with the full range of ownership models, be it full ownership, shared ownership, tenancy, or residency. We need to consider this in the whole.

Finally, I refer to recommendation 25, which

hwn gyda chi a'i fod yn bryderus bod misoedd lawer wedi mynd heibio ers iddo glywed gennych. Nid enwaf awdurdodau lleol yn y Gogledd, rhag peri annifyrrwch i swyddogion tai na ddylid tynnu sylw atynt yma, ond mae uwch swyddogion tai yn y Gogledd wedi dweud wrthyf mor bwysig yw derbyn y cynllun hwn yn eu barn hwy.

Gan droi at argymhelliad 20, sydd wedi'i dderbyn yn rhannol, er bod canllawiau'n bod eisoes neu heb fod yn briodol, a wnewch egluro hyn, gan ei fod yn rhan mor hanfodol o wireddu argymhellion yr adroddiad?

O ran argymhelliad 22, nas derbynnir gan fod cyllideb y grant tai cymdeithasol yn gyfyngedig, pwysaf arnoch i weithio gyda landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, a'r sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat drwy ddenu arian o sawl ffynhonnell i roi'r cynllun hwn ar waith gan fod nifer mawr o batrymau o arfer da mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig ac mewn gwledydd tramor y gallem eu hystyried.

Ynghylch argymhelliad 23, sydd hefyd wedi'i dderbyn yn rhannol o ran cyhoeddi canllawiau ar gau cartrefi preswyl, cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn at Ken Mack—fel y gwneuthum i ar 29 Medi—sy'n tynnu sylw at y nifer mawr o achosion trist o farwolaethau cynnar ymysg preswylwyr a gollasant eu cartrefi yn sgîl cau cartrefi gofal. Ni ellir hepgor yr un person hyn ac nid yw'r un bywyd yn bris gwerth ei dalu am ddogma ynghylch y sector preifat. Gobeithiaf y caiff hyn ei dderbyn yn llwyr ac y gellir cymryd camau ymarferol i gyflawni hynny.

Mae argymhelliad 24 hefyd wedi'i dderbyn yn rhannol. Mae'n tynnu sylw at yr angen i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol hyrwyddo gwahanol fathau o berchnogaeth. Dywedasoeh y gallem ailystyried hyn ar ôl cwblhau'r ymchwil i dai gwarchod. Mae tai gwarchod yn hollbwysig, ond yn ôl yr hyn a gofiaf, yr oedd hyn yn ymwneud â'r holl fathau o berchnogaeth, boed yn berchnogaeth lawn, yn berchnogaeth ar y cyd, yn denantiaeth, neu'n breswyliaeth. Rhaid inni ystyried pob agwedd ar hyn.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriaf at argymhelliad 25, sydd

has been accepted. This recommendation highlights the need to work with local authorities to ensure sufficient resources for care homes. Again, I refer to my comment on 29 September:

‘The Wales care strategy group report predicted a significant increase in the demand for care home and nursing care services over the next 17 years. If the Wanless report’s recommendations to provide additional services to support individuals in the community are implemented, the amount by which the capacity of the care home sector will need to increase may be reduced, but they are unlikely to eliminate the need for growth altogether. How do we square that ... with the reality that care homes are closing and care beds are being lost in their hundreds across Wales, with north Wales hit particularly hard?’

You mentioned the social—

3.20 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have been generous with time. This is a statement. Perhaps it is not an altogether satisfactory procedure for dealing with a detailed Government response, but I would be grateful for a question towards the end of your remarks.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister recognise that, even with the increases in the social housing grant proposed up to 2008, the grant, including Wanless, will still be less than it was in 1997? Will the Minister recognise that, unless we can put dogma aside and focus on outcomes for older people, we will never achieve the best practice models to which we all aspire?

**Edwina Hart:** There is no dogma on this side of the Chamber. We are establishing an older persons’ commissioner and are ensuring the rights of older people. I thank my colleague the Finance Minister for what I regard as an excellent settlement in terms of the social housing grant and my budget in general. You referred several times in your contribution to what you said on 29 September. In response I ask you to please read my report and not say that I have not

wedi’i dderbyn. Mae’r argymhelliad hwn yn tynnu sylw at yr angen i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod digon o adnoddau ar gael ar gyfer cartrefi gofal. Unwaith eto, cyfeiriaf at fy sylw ar 29 Medi:

‘Rhagwelodd adroddiad grŵp strategaeth gofal Cymru gynnydd sylweddol yn y galw am wasanaethau cartrefi gofal a gofal nyrsio yn ystod y 17 mlynedd nesaf. Pe rhoddir argymhellion adroddiad Wanless i ddarparu gwasanaethau ychwanegol i gynorthwyo unigolion yn y gymuned ar waith, mae’n bosibl na fydd angen i gapasiti’r sector cartrefi gofal gynyddu cymaint, ond nid ydynt yn debygol o ddileu’r angen am dwf yn llwyr. Sut y gallwn gysoni hynny ... gyda’r ffaith bod cartrefi gofal yn cau a bod cannoedd o welyau gofal yn cael eu colli ledled Cymru, a hynny’n arbennig o wir yn y Gogledd?’

Soniasoch am—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Bûm yn hael ag amser. Datganiad yw hwn. Efallai nad yw’n weithdrefn gwbl foddhaol i ddelio ag ymateb manwl gan y Llywodraeth, ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael cwestiwn tua diwedd eich sylwadau.

**Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod y bydd y grant tai cymdeithasol, hyd yn oed o gynnwys y cynnydd a gynigir hyd at 2008 a Wanless, yn dal i fod yn llai nag yr oedd yn 1997? A wnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod, os na allwn roi dogma o’r neilltu a chanolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau i bobl hŷn, na wnawn byth sicrhau’r modelau arferion gorau yr ydym oll yn dyheu amdanynt?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes unrhyw ddogma yr ochr hon i’r Siambr. Yr ydym yn sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn ac yn sicrhau hawliau pobl hŷn. Diolchaf i’m cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Cyllid, am yr hyn a ystyriaf yn setliad rhagorol o ran y grant tai cymdeithasol a’r cyllideb yn gyffredinol. Cyfeiriasoch sawl gwaith yn eich cyfraniad at yr hyn a ddywedasoch ar 29 Medi. Mewn ymateb, gofynnaf ichi ddarllen fy adroddiad a pheidio â dweud nad wyf wedi derbyn



accepted recommendations. I have accepted some recommendations and have qualified others. You also said that senior housing officers in north Wales are concerned about what we are doing. It would be nice if all those senior housing officers across Wales would present their housing strategies to me, so that I can consider the strategies that are required on housing.

**Peter Black:** We had a debate on this issue only the other week, so I will not go through the report recommendation by recommendation, even though we had limited time to do that. Two issues arise from this statement. Like Mark Isherwood, I am concerned about the Welsh home improvement agency. It is important that we have something up and running as soon as possible in terms of equity release. I accept that you have received advice from your officials that, as it is laid out in the report, this is not feasible. However, it is important that we get something up and running so that we can tap into that source of funding and assist people to remain in their own homes and to invest in their property. The key to this is enabling people to live independently in their own communities. Central to that are the resources available to those people, not only in terms of money, but also in terms of the care resources provided by local authorities and other statutory agencies and the money available to pay for those services and to improve the properties in which older people live.

In that context, I am disappointed by the budget published yesterday. I accept that you have £10 million in the budget for Wanless, although it will not be available until the year after next. However, the disabled facilities grant was cut about two years ago. That cut has been carried through in the budget for the next three years, which, effectively, means five years with £40 million less for the disabled facilities grant. That will be a problem for those carrying out adaptations, and having to wait to receive the money to carry out adaptations. Also, given that there has not been an increase in the budget for the home energy efficiency scheme, important as that scheme is, we must be concerned that we are not getting to the heart of tackling fuel poverty.

argymhellion. Yr wyf wedi derbyn rhai argymhellion ac wedi amodi eraill. Dywedasoch hefyd fod uwch swyddogion tai yn y Gogledd yn bryderus ynghylch yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud. Byddai'n beth braf pe bai pob un o'r uwch swyddogion tai hynny ledled Cymru'n cyflwyno eu strategaethau tai i mi, fel y gallaf ystyried y strategaethau sy'n ofynnol ar dai.

**Peter Black:** Nid oes ond rhyw wythnos ers inni gael dadl ar y pwnc hwn, felly nid af drwy'r adroddiad fesul argymhelliad, er mai ychydig o amser a gawsom i wneud hynny. Mae dau fater yn codi o'r datganiad hwn. Fel Mark Isherwood yntau, yr wyf finnau'n bryderus ynghylch asiantaeth gwella cartrefi Cymru. Mae'n bwysig inni gychwyn rhywbeth cyn gynted ag y bo modd o ran rhyddhau ecwiti. Derbyniaf eich bod wedi cael cyngor gan eich swyddogion i'r perwyl nad yw hyn, fel y'i nodwyd yn yr adroddiad, yn ddichonol. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig inni gychwyn rhywbeth fel y gallwn wneud defnydd o'r ffynhonnell gyllid honno a helpu pobl i aros yn eu cartrefi a buddsoddi yn eu heiddo. Yr allwedd i hyn yw galluogi pobl i fyw'n annibynnol yn eu cymunedau. Mae lle canolog yn hyn i'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r bobl hynny, nid yn unig o ran arian, ond hefyd o ran yr adnoddau gofal a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau statudol eraill a'r arian sydd ar gael i dalu am y gwasanaethau hynny ac i wella'r tai y mae pobl hyn yn byw ynddynt.

Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr wyf wedi siomi yn y gyllideb a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Yr wyf yn derbyn bod gennych £10 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Wanless, er na fydd ar gael tan y flwyddyn ar ôl y nesaf. Fodd bynnag, torrwyd y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl tua dwy flynedd yn ôl. Mae'r toriad hwnnw wedi parhau yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf ac mae hynny, i bob pwrpas, yn golygu y bydd pum mlynedd ac ynddynt £40 miliwn yn llai ar gyfer y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl. Bydd hynny'n peri problem i rai sy'n gwneud addasiadau, ac yn gorfod disgwyl i gael yr arian i wneud addasiadau. Hefyd, gan na fu cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, er ei bwysiced, yr ydym yn sicr o bryderu nad ydym yn mynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd.

There is, again, a standstill budget for community fire safety. Of more concern is the rapid response adaptations budget, which is an important budget and which was commended in the process of producing this report. One million pounds was set aside for that, and it is providing for sterling work in helping people to stay in their own homes, but that budget will remain at £1 million for the next three years. If we are serious about investing in our older people, and enabling them to stay in their homes, we must put our money where our mouth is and invest in those budgets, as well as in Wanless and other areas. Will you consider that, and discuss with the Finance Minister whether those issues can be addressed before the final budget is published?

**Edwina Hart:** We will have an opportunity to discuss the issue in the committee's response to the budget. I am delighted with the settlement that I have had. As a former Finance Minister, I fully understand the difficulties that a Finance Minister has in delivering all of the Government's priorities across portfolios. There is genuine growth within my budget to deal with some of these issues, particularly with regard to social housing. I will certainly look at your point regarding the Welsh home improvement agency. After discussing this with my officials, my concern is that I must take a broader view on these matters, but I will report back positively to committee, if I am able to do so. I agree that independent living is the key to many of these issues, and we must do what we can to allow people to stay in their own homes. I welcome the Wanless money, which will give me the opportunity to consider further issues around that. On the disabled facilities grant, it is interesting to see the review findings, which may lead to us spending our money more wisely in that area and getting better results.

We are on target in terms of fuel poverty. We are managing within the budget with regard to capacity and what is required. The same is true of fire safety. I agree that the rapid response adaptation scheme has been first class. There will be capacity issues for care and repair in that, but I will take your points on board, and I am sure that you will raise

Ni welwyd cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer diogelwch tân cymunedol unwaith eto. Yr hyn sy'n peri mwy o bryder yw'r gyllideb ar gyfer addasiadau brys, sy'n gyllideb bwysig ac yn un a ganmolwyd yn ystod y gwaith o gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Neilltuwyd £1 filiwn ar gyfer hynny, ac mae'n darparu ar gyfer gwaith rhagorol i helpu pobl i aros yn eu cartrefi, ond bydd y gyllideb honno'n aros ar £1 filiwn am y tair blynedd nesaf. Os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch buddsoddi yn ein pobl hŷn, a'u galluogi i aros yn eu cartrefi, rhaid inni roi ein harian ar ein gair a buddsoddi yn y cyllidebau hynny, yn ogystal ag ym maes Wanless a meysydd eraill. A wnewch ystyried hynny, a thrafod gyda'r Gweinidog Cyllid a ellir ymdrin â'r materion hynny cyn cyhoeddi'r gyllideb derfynol?

**Edwina Hart:** Cawn gyfle i drafod y mater hwn yn ymateb y pwyllgor i'r gyllideb. Yr wyf wrth fy modd gyda'r setliad a gefais. A minnau'n gyn-Weinidog Cyllid, yr wyf yn llwyr ddeall yr anawsterau a ddaw i ran Gweinidog Cyllid wrth gyflawni holl flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth yn yr holl bortffolios. Mae cynnydd gwirioneddol yn fy nghyllideb i ddelio â rhai o'r materion hynny, yn enwedig o ran tai cymdeithasol. Byddaf yn sicr o ystyried y pwynt a wnaethoch ynghylch asiantaeth gwella cartrefi Cymru. A minnau wedi trafod hyn gyda'm swyddogion, credaf ei bod yn bwysig imi fwrw golwg ehangach ar y materion hyn, ond adroddaf yn ôl yn gadarnhaol i'r pwyllgor, os gallaf. Cytunaf mai byw'n annibynnol yw'r allwedd i lawer o'r materion hyn, a rhaid inni wneud yr hyn a allwn i ganiatáu i bobl aros yn eu cartrefi. Croesawaf yr arian ar gyfer Wanless, a fydd yn rhoi cyfle imi ystyried materion pellach sy'n ymwneud â hynny. Ynghylch y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl, diddorol yw gweld darganfyddiadau'r adolygiad, a allai beri inni wario ein harian yn ddoethach yn y maes hwn a chael gwell canlyniadau.

Yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn o ran tlodi tanwydd. Yr ydym yn gallu gydymod â'r gyllideb sydd gennym o ran capasiti a'r hyn sy'n ofynnol. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ddiogelwch tân. Cytunaf y bu'r cynllun addasiadau brys yn rhagorol. Bydd materion sy'n ymwneud â chapasiti yn codi mewn cysylltiad â gofal a thrwsio yn hynny o beth,

them again in committee.

**Janice Gregory:** As Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, I thank you for your response to this policy review on housing for older people. A group of my disabled constituents, the Ogmere disabled group, visited me today and they appreciated the committee's work on housing for older people and the recognition of their needs in the report's recommendations. I have listened this afternoon with delight. I am extremely proud of the report, and while listening to colleagues on the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee I recalled the positive cross-party working in compiling this report. While I am sure that the suggestions and criticisms are well-intentioned, I would like all Members to know that there was good cross-party working on this report, and that we recognised the needs of the older people in Wales.

I, too, pay tribute to those who contributed. I will not labour that point, because I had an opportunity to pay tribute when we had the debate, but it is important for us to recognise the quality of submissions to the report and, from your responses today, Minister, I can see that you and the Minister for Health and Social Services have taken that on board. Finally, as a committee Chair, as I am sure that all other committee Chairs will know, when you undertake a report, you hope that it will make a difference. When we undertook this report, I do not think that we realised that it would be completed at such an opportune time. It has clearly focused the thinking of the Finance Minister in drawing up her budget and I am grateful to you, Minister, the Minister for Health and Social Services, and the Finance Minister, for your contributions.

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you, Janice. What is important now is for us to take the report forward positively. Politics is the art of the possible, and in drawing up reports we all want things that we cannot necessarily get, but we must try to get the maximum out of these recommendations. It is important that

ond ystyriaif y pwyntiau a wnaethoch, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnewch eu codi eto yn y pwyllgor.

**Janice Gregory:** Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, diolchaf i chi am eich ymateb i'r adolygiad polisi hwn ar dai ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Daeth grŵp o'm hetholwyr anabl, grŵp pobl anabl Ogwr, i'm gweld heddiw ac yr oeddent yn gwerthfawrogi gwaith y pwyllgor ar dai ar gyfer pobl hŷn a'r gydnabyddiaeth i'w hanghenion yn argymhellion yr adroddiad. Mae'r hyn a glywais y prynhawn yma wedi fy mhlesio. Yr wyf yn falch iawn o'r adroddiad ac, wrth wrando ar gyd-aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, cofiais y gweithio trawsbleidiol cadarnhaol a gafwyd wrth lunio'r adroddiad hwn. Er fy mod yn sicr bod bwriad da i'r awgrymiadau a'r beirniadaethau, carwn i'r holl Aelodau gael gwybod bod gweithio trawsbleidiol da wedi bod ar yr adroddiad hwn, a'n bod yn cydnabod anghenion pobl hŷn yng Nghymru.

Talaf innau deyrnged i'r rhai a gyfrannodd. Ni fanylaf ar y pwynt hwnnw, gan imi gael cyfle i dalu teyrnged pan gawsom y ddadl, ond mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod ansawdd yr hyn a gyflwynwyd ar gyfer yr adroddiad ac, yn ôl eich ymatebion heddiw, Weinidog, gallaf weld eich bod chi a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi sylweddoli hynny. Yn olaf, fel Cadeirydd pwyllgor, fel y gŵyr pob Cadeirydd pwyllgor arall yr wyf yn siŵr, pan ymgwymerwch ag adroddiad, yr ydych yn gobeithio y bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Pan ymgymerasom â'r adroddiad hwn, ni chredaf ein bod wedi sylweddoli y câi ei gwblhau ar adeg mor gyfleus. Mae'n amlwg ei fod wedi canolbwyntio meddwl y Gweinidog Cyllid wrth iddi baratoi ei chyllideb ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi, Weinidog, i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac i'r Gweinidog Cyllid, am eich cyfraniadau.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch, Janice. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yn awr yw ein bod yn hyrwyddo'r adroddiad hwn mewn modd positif. Gwyddor y posibl yw gwleidyddiaeth, ac wrth lunio adroddiadau yr ydym oll am gael pethau na fydd modd inni eu cael o reidrwydd, ond rhaid inni geisio cael y mwyaf posibl o'r

the report has put older people and what they want first. That is essential and shows excellent cross-party working. However, I have to accept the points made by other Members, because this is politics and politics will always be made according to the budget. However good the budget or the report, someone will always want something else: that is the reality of politics. It is important that the report had cross-party support. The majority of the recommendations have been accepted in full, and it is now up to us to deliver on this report positively. In the light of the Presiding Officer's comments, we will need to discuss this report in committee again so that we can get at the detail of its implementation.

**The Presiding Officer:** I believe that we have time for one or two short questions.

**Sandy Mewies:** I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's response to this policy review. The fact that you have accepted so many of the recommendations sends out the clear message that the Government recognises the importance of supporting older people so that they can remain in their own homes. That has been made explicit in the draft budget that was just announced.

Like Rhodri Glyn, I am particularly pleased that the recommendation on occupational therapists has been accepted, but, like him, I feel that a proper career structure and hierarchy should be provided. Finally, I am particularly pleased that you have recognised the need for specialised supported accommodation and I hope that you will reassure me that the special needs of people who are suffering from dementia, such as Alzheimer's disease, will be recognised in your work.

3.30 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** Dementia and that specialist work is a key issue. On occupational therapists, my colleague, the Minister for Health and Social Services, is in the Chamber today, and she and I are fully aware of the

argymhellion hyn. Mae'n bwysig bod yr adroddiad wedi rhoi'r lle blaenaf i bobl hŷn a'u dymuniadau. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig ac yn dangos y gweithio trawsbleidiol rhagorol a fu. Er hynny, rhaid imi dderbyn y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Aelodau eraill, am mai gwleidyddiaeth yw hyn a bydd gwleidyddiaeth yn dilyn y gyllideb bob amser. Er cystal y bydd cyllideb neu adroddiad, bydd rhywun bob amser sydd am gael rhywbeth arall: dyna natur gwleidyddiaeth. Mae'n bwysig bod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i'r adroddiad. Mae'r mwyafrif o'r argymhellion wedi'u derbyn yn llawn, a mater i ni'n awr yw gweithredu ar sail yr adroddiad hwn. Yng ngoleuni sylwadau'r Llywydd, bydd yn rhaid inni drafod yr adroddiad hwn yn y pwyllgor eto fel y gallwn ymdrin yn fanwl â'r dull o'i roi ar waith.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf fod gennym ddigon o amser ar gyfer un neu ddau o gwestiynau byr.

**Sandy Mewies:** Croesawaf ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r adolygiad polisi hwn. Mae'r ffaith eich bod wedi derbyn cynifer o'r argymhellion yn dangos yn glir fod y Llywodraeth yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw cynorthwyo pobl hŷn fel y gallant aros yn eu cartrefi. Gwelwyd hynny'n eglur yn y gyllideb ddrafft sydd newydd gael ei chyhoeddi.

Yn yr un modd â Rhodri Glyn, yr wyf yn arbennig o falch bod yr argymhelliad ar therapyddion galwedigaethol wedi'i dderbyn, ond, fel yntau, teimlaf y dylid darparu hierarchaeth a strwythur gyrfa briodol. Yn olaf, yr wyf yn arbennig o falch eich bod wedi cydnabod yr angen am lety â chymorth arbenigol a gobeithiaf y gwnewch fy sicrhau y bydd anghenion arbennig y rhai sy'n dioddef gan orffwylledd, fel clefyd Alzheimer, yn cael eu cydnabod yn eich gwaith.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gorffwylledd a'r gwaith arbenigol hwnnw'n fater allweddol. Yngylch therapyddion galwedigaethol, mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn y

problems associated with that issue, and you have our assurance that all the necessary work will be undertaken.

**Christine Chapman:** Recently, I held a consultation meeting with older people in the Cynon Valley on a commissioner for older people. It was felt that while communities are now benefiting from regeneration, those communities are still failing to reach out to older people. Do you agree that if older people are to play a key role in Welsh life, we should ensure that housing developments cater for mixed ages, so that older people are not marginalised and are instead well-integrated into society? Will you comment on any best practice that you may have experienced during our recent visit to Poundbury?

**Edwina Hart:** I believe that people are best placed within their own communities, where they can make their own choices. The essential issue is lifetime homes and the standard of build, so that people can remain in their houses from cradle to grave without any adaptations or alterations being needed. We can dictate that within the social housing sector with our Welsh housing quality standard for 2012, but we cannot necessarily do that in the private sector. There are issues around that. When I visited Poundbury, I was impressed by the mixture of expensive housing and social housing—you could not tell the difference. The development was well-integrated, and it is a tribute to the work that Prince Charles has undertaken in that area.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Recommendation 11 highlights the importance of security and safety in the home for older people. Do you agree that additional powers for social landlords to deal with anti-social behaviour among tenants will be important in improving the quality of life of many old people who have to put up with terrible behaviour from people who should know far better? Do you agree that the additional measures that we passed a few weeks ago should go some way towards improving the lives of people who are caught up in such terrible situations?

Siambwr heddiw, ac mae hi a minnau'n llwyr ymwybodol o'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r mater hwnnw, ac yr ydym yn eich sicrhau y gwneir yr holl waith angenrheidiol.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn ddiweddar, cynhaliais gyfarfod ymgynghori gyda phobl hŷn yng Nghwm Cynon ar gomisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Teimlwyd, er bod cymunedau bellach yn elwa ar waith adfywio, fod y cymunedau hynny'n dal i fethu â chyrraedd pobl hŷn. A ydych yn cytuno, os yw pobl hŷn i chwarae rhan allweddol ym mywyd Cymru, y dylem sicrhau bod datblygiadau tai'n darparu ar gyfer cymysgedd o oeddrannau, fel na chaiff pobl hŷn eu gwthio i'r mylon ac fel y cânt eu hintegreiddio'n dda i gymdeithas yn lle hynny? A wnewch sylw am unrhyw enghreifftiau o arferion da a welsoch, o bosibl, yn ystod ein hymweliad â Poundbury yn ddiweddar?

**Edwina Hart:** Credaf mai'r lle gorau i bobl yw eu cymunedau eu hunain, lle y gallant ddewis drostynt eu hunain. Y mater hollbwysig yw cartrefi gydol oes a safon yr adeiladu, fel y gall pobl aros yn eu tai o'r crud i'r bedd heb fod angen unrhyw addasiadau neu newidiadau. Gallwn fynnu hynny yn y sector tai cymdeithasol drwy safon ansawdd tai Cymru ar gyfer 2012, ond ni fyddwn o reidrwydd yn gallu gwneud hynny yn y sector preifat. Mae materion yn codi mewn cysylltiad â hynny. Pan ymwelais â Poundbury, fe'm trawyd gan y cymysgedd o dai drud a thai cymdeithasol—ni ellid gweld y gwahaniaeth rhyngddynt. Yr oedd y datblygiad wedi'i integreiddio'n dda, ac mae'n glod i'r gwaith a wnaeth y Tywysog Siarl yn yr ardal honno.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae argymhelliad 11 yn tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd diogeldd a diogelwch yn y cartref i bobl hŷn. A ydych yn cytuno y bydd pwerau ychwanegol i landlordiaid cymdeithasol gael delio ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ymysg tenantiaid yn bwysig wrth wella ansawdd bywyd llawer o bobl hŷn sy'n gorfod dioddef ymddygiad gwarthus gan rai a ddylai wybod yn well? A ydych yn cytuno bod y mesurau ychwanegol a dderbyniasom ychydig wythnosau'n ôl yn debygol o gyfrannu rywfaint at wella bywydau rhai sy'n wynebu sefyllfaoedd ofnadwy o'r fath?

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that we use the powers that are available to us to ensure that older people can have a pleasant life within their own homes and environment. It is particularly important that we recognise that older people become stressed sometimes because of the behavioural problems around them. That stress can lead to poor health and very real problems in the long term.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig inni ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd ar gael i ni er mwyn sicrhau bod modd i bobl hŷn gael bywyd dymunol yn eu cartrefi a'u cynefin. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig inni gydnabod bod pobl hŷn yn teimlo straen weithiau oherwydd y problemau ymddygiad o'u cwmpas. Gall y straen hwnnw arwain at iechyd gwael a phroblemau sylweddol yn y tymor hir.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin  
(Modwleiddio) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004  
Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation)  
(Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 October 2004, on the draft regulations, the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales)(Amendment) Regulations 2004; and*

*a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 5 Hydref 2004, mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004; ac*

*b) approves the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004; and*

*i) rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004; a'r*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004. (NDM2117)*

*ii) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004. (NDM2117)*

*Cynnig (NDM2117): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2117): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)  
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Y Dreth Gyngor  
Council Tax**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.  
**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose that

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales condemns the Labour Assembly Government's policy on funding local authorities which has caused excessive increases in council tax.* (NDM2118)

We have chosen council tax as the subject of the minority party debate today because during the next six months, it will become the most important issue in Welsh politics. The first reason for that is that council tax has already reached unsustainable levels. Many people are saying that. I have heard the Westminster Minister responsible for local government say that it has reached the limits of acceptability. The second reason for that is the impact of revaluation on council tax across Wales. In some areas, the impact will be extreme. In Powys, 1,600 people will see their council tax rise by three bands. While the full impact of that will not be felt for three years, there is no doubt that there will be a great deal of concern as people realise just what it means for them. The third reason for that is that there will be an element of catch-up. Last year, I recall hearing the finance spokesman for the Welsh Local Government Association, who was then the leader of Cardiff County Council, say that the council had imposed an increase last year that it could not possibly match in future years. There is no doubt that there was an element of pre-election holding back of council tax last year. For all those reasons, this will be a major issue in the coming year.

**Peter Law:** Do you accept that we dealt with the revaluation responsibly and appropriately? The previous Conservative Government told everybody to rip up their forms. I think that it was Heseltine who said 'Rip the form up'.

**Glyn Davies:** No, Peter. As a party we have not attacked the principle of council tax. However, I do not want to address that in today's speech; I will focus on the fact that council tax has reached unsustainable levels, and that it will punish the people of Wales. I hope that you will address that issue if you make a contribution later.

*Cenedlaethol Cymru yn condemnio polisi Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad ar ariannu awdurdodau lleol am ei fod wedi arwain at godiadau eithafol yn y dreth gyngor.* (NDM2118)

Yr ydym wedi dewis y dreth gyngor yn destun i'r ddadl plaid leiafrifol heddiw gan mai hwn, yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf, fydd y pwnc pwysicaf yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru. Y rheswm cyntaf am hynny yw bod y dreth gyngor eisoes wedi cyrraedd lefelau anghynaliadwy. Mae llawer o bobl yn dweud hynny. Clywais y Gweinidog yn San Steffan sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol yn dweud ei bod wedi cyrraedd terfyn yr hyn sy'n dderbyniol. Yr ail reswm am hynny yw effaith yr ailbrisió ar y dreth gyngor ledled Cymru. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, bydd yr effaith yn eithafol. Ym Mhowys, bydd 1,600 o bobl yn gweld eu treth gyngor yn codi o dri band. Er na theimlir holl effaith hynny am dair blynedd, nid oes amheuaeth na fydd llawer iawn o bryder wrth i bobl sylweddoli'r hyn y mae'n ei olygu iddynt hwy. Y trydydd rheswm am hynny yw y bydd rhywaint o gau ar y bwlch. Y llynedd, cofiaf glywed llafarydd cyllid Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a oedd bryd hynny'n arweinydd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd, yn dweud bod y cyngor wedi pennu codiad y llynedd na allai byth bennu ei debyg ym mlynnyddoedd y dyfodol. Nid oes amheuaeth na ddaliwyd y dreth gyngor yn ôl y llynedd i ryw raddau cyn yr etholiadau. Am yr holl resymau hynny, hwn fydd y pwnc mawr yn y flwyddyn sydd i ddod.

**Peter Law:** A ydych yn derbyn ein bod wedi trafod yr ailbrisió mewn modd cyfrifol a phriodol? Dywedodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol wrth bawb am rwygo eu ffurflenni'n ddarnau. Credaf mai Heseltine a ddywedodd 'Rhwygwch y ffurflen yn ddarnau'.

**Glyn Davies:** Nac ydwyf, Peter. Nid ydym wedi ymosod fel plaid ar egwyddor y dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, ni ddymunaf ymdrin â hynny yn fy araith heddiw; canolbwyntiaf ar y ffaith bod y dreth gyngor wedi cyrraedd lefelau anghynaliadwy, ac y bydd yn cosbi pobl Cymru. Gobeithiaf y gwnewch chi ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw os cyfrannwch yn



ddiweddarach.

On several occasions, when I have spoken on this issue, I have verged on the intemperate, because I feel strongly about it. I have put my reputation for reasonableness at risk, but I do not think that there is a need for that kind of approach today because the facts speak for themselves. All one has to do today is to allow the Labour Government's record on this issue to be exposed, and allow the people to understand exactly where we are, and why we are in that situation.

When council tax was introduced in 1993-94, the average band D property payment was £328. A tax is never popular, but it was much more acceptable than the community charge that preceded it, and in many quarters it was welcomed. By the time that the Labour Government came to office in 1997-98, that figure had risen to £498. It was much criticised by Labour at the time—as I am sure that many of you will remember—because of the impact that it had on people on low fixed incomes. This year, the figure is almost £900, which is a 79 per cent increase. There is also every reason to suspect that there will be record increases this year.

It is too soon to judge the impact of yesterday's settlement, but we have heard local government leaders say how disappointed they are with it. In my local authority, all committees have been asked to make a 5 per cent cut across the board, and, even if they make those cuts, there is talk of a 19 per cent increase in tax. The advertisements are already out for extra bailiffs to ensure that this policy works. I am certain that the average band D property across Wales will go through the £1,000 barrier in the next year—some councils have already gone through the barrier, but, next year, the average property will cross that barrier. Labour AMs will speak today, and I hope that they will be able to justify these sorts of figures, but how can you possibly justify to pensioners and young people with families what you have done to council tax during Labour's time in office? Will you try to blame the local councils, as has been attempted in England, and as the First Minister increasingly does when he is asked

Ar sawl achlysur, pan siaredais am y pwnc hwn, bu bron imi wylltio, gan fy mod yn teimlo'n gryf yn ei gylch. Yr wyf wedi peryglu'r enw da sydd gennyf o fod yn rhywun rhesymol, ond ni chredaf fod galw am ymagwedd o'r fath heddiw gan fod y ffeithiau'n siarad drostynt eu hunain. Y cyfan sy'n rhaid ei wneud heddiw yw gadael i record y Llywodraeth Lafur ar y mater hwn gael ei datgelu, a chaniatáu i'r bobl ddeall yn union lle yr ydym, a pham yr ydym yn y sefyllfa hon.

Pan gyflwynwyd y dreth gyngor yn 1993-94, y tâl cyfartalog am eiddo ym mand D oedd £328. Nid oes yr un dreth sy'n boblogaidd, ond yr oedd yn llawer mwy derbyniol na'r tâl cymunedol a'i rhagflaenodd, ac fe'i croesawyd mewn llawer cylch. Erbyn i'r Llywodraeth Lafur ddod i rym yn 1997-98, yr oedd y ffigur hwnnw wedi codi i £498. Bu llawer o feirniadu arni gan Lafur ar y pryd—fel y bydd llawer ohonoch yn cofio, yr wyf yn siŵr—oherwydd ei heffaith ar rai ar incwm sefydlog isel. Eleni, mae'r ffigur bron â chyrraedd £900, sef cynnydd o 79 y cant. Mae pob lle i amau hefyd y ceir codiadau uwch nag erioed eleni.

Mae'n rhy fuan i farnu ynghylch effaith y setliad ddoe, ond clywsom arweinwyr llywodraeth leol yn dweud cymaint y maent wedi siomi ynddo. Yn fy awdurdod lleol i, gofynnwyd i'r holl bwyllgorau wneud toriad cyffredinol o 5 y cant, a hyd yn oed os gwnânt y toriadau hynny, mae sôn am godiad o 19 y cant yn y dreth. Mae'r hysbysebion wedi'u cyhoeddi eisoes am feiliaid ychwanegol i sicrhau y bydd y polisi hwn yn llwyddo. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y tâl cyfartalog am eiddo ym mand D ledled Cymru yn codi'n uwch na £1,000 y flwyddyn nesaf—mae rhai cynghorau eisoes wedi mynd y tu hwnt i hynny, ond, y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd eiddo cyfartalog yn croesi'r terfyn hwnnw. Bydd ACau Llafur yn siarad heddiw, a gobeithiaf y byddant yn gallu cyfiawnhau ffigurau o'r fath, ond sut y gallwch gyfiawnhau i bensynwyr a phobl ifanc â phlant yr hyn a wnaethoch i'r dreth gyngor yn ystod y cyfnod y bu Llafur mewn grym? A wnewch geisio rhoi'r bai ar y cynghorau lleol, fel y ceisiwyd gwneud yn

questions about council tax levels?

Lloegr, ac fel y gwnaiff y Prif Weinidog fwyfwy pan ofynnir cwestiynau iddo am lefelau'r dreth gyngor?

**Carl Sargeant:** Let us dispel the myth that it is Labour Party policy to increase taxes. Between 1993 and 1997 council tax increased at an average rate of 13 per cent per year under the Tories; it increased at an average of 8.1 per cent between 2000 and 2004 under Labour. How is that us increasing taxes, not you? Take the halo off, Glyn.

**Carl Sargeant:** Gadewch inni ladd yr hen goel mai polisi'r Blaid Lafur yw cynyddu trethi. Rhwng 1993 a 1997 bu cynnydd o 13 y cant y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd o dan y Torïaid; bu cynnydd o 8.1 y cant ar gyfartaledd rhwng 2000 a 2004 o dan Lafur. Sut y gellir dweud mai ni sy'n cynyddu trethi, nid chi? Tynnwch y corongylch, Glyn.

**Glyn Davies:** Thank you for recognising the halo that is upon me. You are playing the same game as the First Minister; I am putting the facts before the Assembly. Since Labour has been in power, average council tax has increased from less than £500 to almost £900. *[Interruption.]* Stand up when you are speaking and justify that increase. The important point is that responsibility for this matter lies with the Minister and the Labour Government. The people of Wales must know that.

**Glyn Davies:** Diolch i chi am weld y corongylch sydd am fy mhen. Yr ydych yn chwarae'r un gêm â'r Prif Weinidog; yr wyf fi'n rhoi'r ffeithiau gerbron y Cynulliad. Ers i Lafur ddod i rym, mae'r dreth gyngor gyfartalog wedi codi o lai na £500 i bron £900. *[Torri ar draws.]* Sefwch ar eich traed wrth siarad a chyfiawnhau'r cynnydd hwnnw. Y pwynt pwysig yw bod y cyfrifoldeb dros y mater hwn yn nwylo'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth Lafur. Rhaid i bobl Cymru gael gwybod hynny.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.39 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.39 p.m.*

Whenever we start talking about council tax the two parties here that do not stand any chance of being in power in Westminster raise the issue of local income tax, even though we do not have any powers to introduce it. I have some sympathy with both parties in the sense that almost every contribution that they make in the Chamber calls for more spending, and there is no doubt that if the members of either of those parties had their hands on the levers of power, council tax would be a good bit higher than it is now. Indeed, that was the record of the Government here when the Liberals had some role in it. We must understand that while local income tax would perhaps be superficially populist and attractive, it contains many serious problems. I once described it in a debate as a Del Boy strategy that offers a shiny new bargain, but which will cost much more in the long run. That is the absolute truth. It will be a huge disincentive—

Pryd bynnag y dechreuwn sôn am y dreth gyngor, mae'r ddwy blaid sydd yma nad oes ganddynt obaith bod mewn grym yn San Steffan yn codi mater treth incwm leol, er nad oes gennym unrhyw bwerau i'w chyflwyno. Mae gennyf beth cydymdeimlad â'r ddwy blaid i'r graddau bod bron bob cyfraniad ganddynt yn y Siambr yn galw am fwy o wario, ac nid oes amheuaeth, pe byddai Aelodau'r naill neu'r llall o'r pleidiau hynny yn gafael yn yr awenau, na fyddai'r dreth gyngor yn uwch o gryn dipyn nag y mae'n awr. Yn wir, dyna fu hanes y Llywodraeth yma pan oedd gan y Rhyddfrydwyr ryw ran ynddi. Rhaid inni ddeall, er y gallai treth incwm leol fod yn ddeniadol ac yn boblogaidd ar y wyneb, fod llawer o broblemau mawr ynglŷn â hi. Fe'i gelwais unwaith mewn dadl yn strategaeth Del Boy sy'n cynnig bargaen newydd sgleiniog, ond a fydd yn costio mwy o lawer yn y tymor hir. Dyna'r gwir plaen. Bydd yn wrthanogaeth fawr—

3.40 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** Will you give way?

**Glyn Davies:** I am sorry, Brian, but time is against me.

It will be a huge disincentive to enterprise—we all know that. It will not be as easy to collect as council tax, which we also know. Currently, the average rate of tax collection by the Inland Revenue is about 86 per cent, while the collection of council tax is around 96 per cent. That is fact. Local income tax would quickly become a national tax, and the element of local authority control would rapidly disappear. I heard you claim the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy as one of your witnesses to support this tax as it described it as a realistic option. It might be a realistic option, but CIPFA also said that it was a technically complex and challenging tax to introduce. It is potentially controversial, and it is at the complex end of the range of available options. I do not think that you can quote CIPFA as being a supporter of local income tax. That is apart from the fact that it is not relevant to the council tax debate in the Assembly. The main point, to which I will return when I finish, is that council tax has increased to a totally unsustainable level. It will rise much higher this year, and the blame for that lies with the Minister, her predecessor, and the Labour Assembly Government. The people of Wales—every council tax payer—should fully understand that.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: delete all the words after 'Wales' and insert:

*believes that council tax is an unfair and regressive tax, hitting hardest those who are least able to pay and believes that it should be replaced by a local income tax.*

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*welcomes the acknowledgement by the Conservative Party that council tax is unfair.*

**Brian Gibbons:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Brian, ond mae amser yn fy erbyn.

Bydd yn anghymhelliad anferth i fenter—gŵyr pawb ohonom hynny. Ni fydd mor hawdd ei chasglu â'r dreth gyngor; gwyddom hynny hefyd. Ar hyn o bryd, llwydda Cyllid y Wlad i gasglu rhyw 86 y cant o'r dreth ddyledus ar gyfartaledd, tra llwyddir i gasglu rhyw 96 y cant o dreth y cyngor. Dyna ffaith. Byddai treth incwm leol yn fuan yn troi'n dreth genedlaethol, a byddai elfen reolaeth yr awdurdod lleol yn diflannu'n gyflym. Clywais chi'n hawlio Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth (CIPFA) yn un o'ch tystion i gefnogi'r dreth hon, gan iddo ei disgrifio fel dewis realistig. Efallai ei bod yn ddewis realistig, ond dywedodd CIPFA hefyd ei bod yn dreth dechnegol gymhleth ac anodd i'w chyflwyno. Gall fod yn ddadleuol, ac mae ar begwn cymhleth yr ystod o ddewisiadau sydd ar gael. Nid wyf yn meddwl y gallwch ddyfynnu CIPFA fel corff sydd o blaid treth incwm leol. Mae hynny ar wahân i'r ffaith nad ydyw'n berthnasol i'r ddadl ar dreth gyngor yn y Cynulliad. Y prif bwynt, y deuf yn ôl ato pan orffennaf, yw bod y dreth gyngor wedi codi i lefel gwbl anghynaliadwy. Bydd yn codi'n llawer uwch eleni, ac mae'r bai am hynny ar y Gweinidog, ei rhagflaenydd, a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad. Dylai pobl Cymru—pob trethdalwr—ddeall hynny'n llawn.

**Michael German:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: dileu popeth ar ôl 'Cymru' ac yn ei le rhoi:

*o'r farn bod y Dreth Gyngor yn dreth annheg ac atchweliadol, sy'n effeithio waethaf ar y rheini nad ydynt yn y sefyllfa orau i allu talu'r dreth, ac mae o'r farn y dylid cyflwyno treth incwm leol yn ei lle.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Blaid Geidwadol yn cydnabod bod y dreth gyngor yn annheg.*

I am grateful to the Conservative Party for giving us the opportunity today to examine this issue, and particularly to examine, not so much its record—I will leave that to Peter Law—but its proposals for council tax in Wales and across the United Kingdom. As Glyn said in his opening speech, the facts speak for themselves. This week, Oliver Letwin admitted that council tax is an unfair tax. Of course, last December he said that,

‘the Tories may propose that the share of council budgets raised locally is increased from 25 per cent’—

remember, 25 per cent is the England and Wales average—

‘to more than 50 per cent and that council tax is likely to remain...’.

In other words, we will have an unfair tax because they are going to keep council tax. I would like, therefore, for some Conservative speaker to tell me how council tax can be fair. Either way, whether it will be this 50:50 split that he talks about, or, as Oliver Letwin says, you increase that proportion—and of course the Welsh average is 20 per cent as 80 per cent comes from the National Assembly—to 50 per cent, in which case, logic tells me, council tax will not just double, but it will increase by double and a half, because that is the way—

**Glyn Davies:** Do you want the answer?

**Michael German:** Yes, I would love to have the answer to that.

**Glyn Davies:** There is the possibility of removing a service from an authority’s responsibility. The point is that, if you are going to consider all of these options, you should consider them all in the package before making your conclusions, which seem to be frankly ridiculous.

**Michael German:** If you are trying to give more power back to local government, I would like the Conservatives to tell me which local authority services should not be provided by local authorities but by the

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i’r Blaid Geidwadol am roi’r cyfle inni heddiw i edrych ar y mater hwn, ac yn enwedig i edrych, nid yn gymaint ar ei record—gadawaf hynny i Peter Law—ond ar ei gynigion ar gyfer y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru a ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Fel y dywedodd Glyn yn ei araith agoriadol, mae’r ffeithiau’n siarad drostynt eu hunain. Yr wythnos hon, cyfaddefodd Oliver Letwin mai treth annheg yw’r dreth gyngor. Wrth gwrs, fis Rhagfyr diwethaf dywedodd,

‘y gall y Toriaid gynnig y dylid cynyddu’r gyfran o gyllidebau cynghorau a godir yn lleol o 25 y cant’—

cofiwch, 25 y cant yw’r cyfartaledd i Gymru a Lloegr—

‘i dros 50 y cant a bod treth gyngor yn debygol o aros...’.

Mewn geiriau eraill, bydd gennym dreth annheg oherwydd maent yn mynd i gadw’r dreth gyngor. Hoffwn, felly, i ryw lefarydd Ceidwadol ddweud wrthyf sut y gall y dreth gyngor fod yn deg. Y naill ffordd neu’r llall, boed yn rhaniad hanner-a-hanner fel y sonia amdano, neu, fel y dywed Oliver Letwin, y cynyddir y gyfran honno—ac wrth gwrs, 20 y cant yw cyfartaledd Cymru gan fod 80 y cant yn dod oddi wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—i 50 y cant, cam a fyddai, yn ôl fy rhesymeg i, nid yn unig yn dyblu y dreth gyngor, ond yn ei chynyddu o ddwbl a hanner, gan mai dyna’r ffordd—

**Glyn Davies:** Oes arnoch chi eisiau’r ateb?

**Michael German:** Oes, byddai’n dda iawn gennyf gael yr ateb i hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae modd tynnu gwasanaeth allan o gyfrifoldebau awdurdod. Y pwynt yw, os ydych chi am ystyried y dewisiadau hyn i gyd, y dylech eu hystyried i gyd yn y pecyn cyn ffurfio’ch casgliadau, sydd yn ymddangos yn chwerthinllyd, â dweud y gwir.

**Michael German:** Os ydych chi’n ceisio rhoi mwy o rym yn ôl i lywodraeth leol, hoffwn i’r Ceidwadwyr ddweud wrthyf pa rai o wasanaethau awdurdod lleol na ddylid eu darparu gan awdurdodau lleol ond gan y

National Assembly. That would be a perfectly reasonable debate on shifting the balance from local government to the National Assembly. I, however, as a devolutionist, said clearly during the campaign that we need to take devolution beyond Cardiff and the river Taff to the people of Wales and out to town and community councils through the local authorities. I believe in that and I do not want to see us pulling back the powers of local government to the National Assembly. Is that what you mean?

**David Davies:** Oliver Letwin was clearly talking about local government funding in England, and was not referring to Wales.

**Michael German:** I regret to tell you that he was, because I just quoted the figures. I quoted from his speech, which said 25 per cent. Twenty-five per cent, which is raised locally, is the England and Wales average. It is roughly 70 per cent in England—

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Michael German:** No I will not. I am sorry if you do not like the facts as Oliver Letwin presents them; you will have to talk to him—I am sure that you can. He was talking about England and Wales figures. If you believe that local government services should be pulled in to the National Assembly and that we should pay more, that is a reasonable debate to have, but it does not square with your 50:50 proposal.

Oliver Letwin agrees that council tax is an unfair tax, so what will you do about it? There is no point saying, as I suspect that you are saying, that the National Assembly should put in even more, that the amount raised by council tax in Wales should be even smaller and that the amount put in by the National Assembly should be greater. That is grossly unfair. Council tax is an unfair tax. It should be replaced by a local income tax, based upon people's ability to pay and allowing those who find it most difficult to pay, particularly pensioners, to survive. I suspect that your party will ultimately have to answer the fundamental question of what it

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Byddai hynny'n ddadl berffaith resymol ar droi'r fantol oddi wrth lywodraeth leol at y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, fel datganolwr, dywedais yn glir yn ystod yr ymgyrch fod angen mynd â datganoli y tu hwnt i Gaerdydd ac afon Taf at bobl Cymru ac allan i gynghorau tref a chymuned drwy'r awdurdodau lleol. Credaf yn hynny ac nid oes arnaf eisiau gweld ein bod yn tynnu pwerau llywodraeth leol yn ôl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ai dyna a olygwch?

**David Davies:** Yr oedd Oliver Letwin yn amlwg yn siarad am gyllid llywodraeth leol yn Lloegr, ac nid oedd yn cyfeirio at Gymru.

**Michael German:** Mae'n flin gennyf ddweud wrthyf ei fod, oherwydd yr wyf newydd ddyfynnu'r ffigurau. Dyfynnais o'i araith, a ddywedodd 25 y cant. Dau ddeg pump y cant, a godir yn lleol, yw cyfartaledd Cymru a Lloegr. Oddeutu 70 y cant yw'r ffigur yn Lloegr—

**David Davies:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Michael German:** Na wna. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os nad ydych yn hoffi'r ffeithiau fel y'u cyflwynir gan Oliver Letwin; bydd yn rhaid ichi siarad ag ef—yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwch. Siarad am ffigurau Cymru a Lloegr yr oedd ef. Os credwch y dylid tynnu gwasanaethau llywodraeth leol i mewn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac y dylem dalu mwy, mae hynny'n ddadl resymol i'w chael, ond nid yw'n gyson â'ch cynnig hanner-a-hanner.

Mae Oliver Letwin yn cytuno bod y dreth gyngor yn dreth annheg, felly beth wnewch chi amdani? Nid oes pwynt dweud, fel yr ydych yn dweud, dybiaf fi, y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol roi mwy fyth i mewn, y dylai'r swm a godir gan dreth gyngor yng Nghymru fod yn llai fyth ac y dylai'r swm a roddir i mewn gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod yn fwy. Mae hynny'n hynod o annheg. Treth annheg yw'r dreth gyngor. Dylid cael treth incwm leol yn ei lle, yn seiliedig ar allu pobl i dalu, gan ganiatáu i'r rhai sydd yn cael yr anhawster mwyaf i'w thalu, pensïynwyr yn arbennig, fyw. Yr wyf yn amau y bydd yn rhaid i'ch plaid chi yn y

would do about such an unfair tax. I agree with what you have just said and with what Oliver Letwin has said, but the facts speak for themselves: council tax is unjust and unfair.

Neither can you look to council tax benefit. The Rowntree Commission has carried out the only study of council tax benefit in the United Kingdom and has found that pensioners, in particular, do not like to pick up council tax benefit. A decreasing amount of council tax benefit is being picked up by people who need to alleviate this problem.

Council tax is an inefficient tax: it costs £60 million a year to collect and £60 million is owed in council tax in any one year in Wales. A huge amount of money is being wasted, in addition to the fact that people are not picking up their council tax benefit. Therefore, I plead with the Conservative Party: it is all very well saying that we need to pull more services back into the National Assembly, pay more, and give the local authorities less to do and give them an opportunity to raise a small amount of money to deal with small amounts of matters, but if you really believe in devolution, you have to find a system that alters the balance.

I agree with Oliver Letwin: it should be 50:50, but you cannot do that with council tax, because it is regressive. You have to move to a position where you have a fair taxation system. Come up with the answers and I might vote for it.

**David Lloyd:** I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Delete all after 'authorities' and replace with

*and calls on the Labour Assembly Government to demand that the Westminster Government replaces council tax with a local income tax, as part of a fairer progressive taxation system founded on the principle that the more you earn, the more you pay.*

Plaid Cymru believes in revamping the taxation system to make it fairer and more progressive, which would include abolishing

pen draw ateb cwestiwn sylfaenol am yr hyn y byddai'n ei wneud am dreth mor annheg. Cytunaf gyda'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud ac â'r hyn a ddywedodd Oliver Letwin, ond mae'r ffeithiau'n siarad drostynt eu hunain: mae'r dreth gyngor yn anghyfiawn ac yn annheg.

Ni allwch ychwaith droi at fudd-dal y dreth gyngor. Gwnaeth Comisiwn Rowntree yr unig astudiaeth o fudd-dal y dreth gyngor yn y Deyrnas Unedig a chanfu nad yw pensiynwyr, yn arbennig, yn hoff o dderbyn budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Mae llai a llai o fudd-dal y dreth gyngor yn cael ei dderbyn gan bobl sydd ag angen lliniaru'r broblem hon.

Treth aneffeithlon yw'r dreth gyngor: mae'n costio £60 miliwn y flwyddyn i'w chasglu ac mae £60 miliwn yn ddyledus mewn treth gyngor mewn unrhyw un flwyddyn yng Nghymru. Mae arian mawr yn cael ei wastraffu, ar ben y ffaith nad yw pobl yn penderfynu derbyn budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Felly, erfyniaf ar y Blaid Geidwadol: hawdd dweud bod angen tynnu mwy o wasanaethau yn ôl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, talu mwy, a rhoi llai i'w wneud i'r awdurdodau lleol a rhoi cyfle iddynt godi swm bychan o arian i ddelio ag ychydig bach o faterion, ond os ydych yn credu go iawn mewn datganoli, rhaid ichi ganfod system sydd yn troi'r fantol.

Cytunaf gydag Oliver Letwin: dylai fod yn hanner-a-hanner, ond ni allwch wneud hynny gyda'r dreth gyngor, gan mai ôl-dreth ydyw. Rhaid ichi symud i sefyllfa lle bo gennych system drethu deg. Rhowch yr atebion inni ac efallai y pleidleisiaf drosto.

**David Lloyd:** Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'awdurdodau lleol' a rhoi yn ei le:

*ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i fynnu bod Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cyflwyno treth incwm leol yn lle'r dreth gyngor, a hynny'n rhan o system decach o drethu graddol, wedi'i seilio ar yr egwyddor bod y sawl sy'n ennill mwy yn talu mwy.*

Cred Plaid Cymru mewn ailwampio'r system drethu i'w gwneud yn decach ac yn fwy blaengar, a fyddai'n cynnwys diddymu'r

council tax. The Assembly needs the powers to achieve that. In the meantime, we continue to campaign for a fairer funding formula now, by making the block grant for Wales needs-based. That would generate an extra £800 million a year, which could be reviewed regularly.

That is the backdrop to this Conservative debate on local government funding and the Conservative Party's attack on council tax. However, it is a bit rich of the Conservatives to attack council tax, as the Conservative Party invented it, in 1993, after it had got rid of the hated poll tax. Annual council tax increases were larger—

**Alun Cairns:** Do you not recognise that this motion does not attack council tax; it merely attacks the levels to which this Labour administration has increased it?

**David Lloyd:** Glyn's speech was a variation on what you are trying to say. It is a bit rich of you to attack council tax, as it was wholly your invention. Granted, you were in a sticky situation with the hated poll tax, but this was a poor compromise, and annual council tax increases were larger under the Conservatives than they are under New Labour.

However, Labour could have scrapped council tax by now, but it has chosen to run with it. We now have rebanding and the new challenges that that has brought. Rebanding is merely tinkering with a manifestly unjust system of taxation, as council tax is a property tax and, as such, is a crude proxy for personal wealth. As Mike German said, it does not reflect people's ability to pay, which is why Plaid Cymru has, since the 1970s, favoured a system of local income tax, which would be fair and based on the ability to pay. People on low and fixed incomes, such as pensioners, have been hit particularly hard by the rise in council tax in recent years, with the tax rising as a percentage of the state pension from 16 per cent in 1999, under Labour, to nearly 20 per cent now, under Labour. How can Labour describe itself as progressive? The recent rebanding has not helped,

dreth gyngor. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad gael y grym i wneud hynny. Yn y cyfamser, parhawn i ymgyrchu dros fformiwla ariannu decach yn awr, drwy drefnu fod y grant bloc i Gymru'n seiliedig ar anghenion. Byddai hynny'n cynhyrchu £800 miliwn yn ychwanegol y flwyddyn, y gellid ei adolygu'n rheolaidd.

Dyna gefndir y ddadl hon gan y Ceidwadwyr ar gyllid llywodraeth leol ac ymosodiad y Blaid Geidwadol ar y dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, mae ychydig yn hyf i'r Ceidwadwyr ymosod ar y dreth gyngor, gan mai'r Blaid Geidwadol a'i dyfeisiodd, yn 1993, wedi iddi gael gwared â'r atgas dreth y pen. Bu'r codiadau blynyddol yn y dreth gyngor yn fwy—

**Alun Cairns:** Oni sylweddolwch nad yw'r cynnig hwn yn ymosod ar y dreth gyngor; dim ond yn ymosod ar y lefelau y mae'r weinyddiaeth Lafur hon wedi'i chodi iddynt?

**David Lloyd:** Yr oedd araith Glyn yn amrywiad ar yr hyn yr ydych chi'n ceisio'i ddweud. Y mae ychydig yn hyf i chi ymosod ar y dreth gyngor, gan mai eich creadigaeth chi yn llwyr ydoedd. Digon teg, yr oeddech mewn sefyllfa annifyr gyda'r atgas dreth y pen, ond cyfaddawd gwael oedd hwn, a bu codiadau blynyddol y dreth gyngor yn fwy dan y Ceidwadwyr nag y maent dan Lafur Newydd.

Fodd bynnag, gallasai Llafur ddiddymu'r dreth gyngor erbyn hyn, ond dewisodd ei chadw. Erbyn hyn mae gennym y newid bandiau a'r sialensiau newydd a ddaeth yn sgîl hynny. Nid yw newid bandiau'n ddim ond potsian gyda system drethu sydd yn amlwg anghyfiawn, gan mai treth ar eiddo yw'r dreth gyngor ac, yn hynny o beth, mae'n ffordd amrwd o ddynodi cyfoeth personol. Fel y dywedodd Mike German, nid yw'n adlewyrchu gallu pobl i dalu, a dyna pam y mae Plaid Cymru, er y 1970au, wedi ffafrio system o dreth incwm leol, a fyddai'n deg ac yn seiliedig ar y gallu i dalu. Cafodd pobl ar incwm isel a sefydlog, fel pensiynwyr, gryn ergyd yn sgîl y codiad yn y dreth gyngor mewn blynyddoedd diweddar, pryd y cododd y dreth fel canran o'r pensiwn gwladol o 16 y cant yn 1999, dan Lafur, i bron 20 y cant yn awr, dan Lafur. Sut all Llafur ei disgrifio'i

certainly in those areas such as Gwynedd and Cardiff, where property prices have gone through the roof.

3.50 p.m.

The intention to improve the take-up of council tax benefit, which is low, especially among pensioners, recognises that there is a problem for pensioners to find the money to pay their council tax upfront. However, council tax benefit does not address the fundamental issue that council tax hits those on a low or fixed income hardest in the first place. Rebanding will see several households jump up more than one band, potentially causing further financial problems for pensioners who, thus far, have received only a commitment of a 2.5 per cent increase in pensions from New Labour.

I will read from a letter that I received from a pensioner recently:

‘Most of my fellow pensioners will have received revaluation notices by now, and will be dismayed that their council tax will probably double or triple in 2005. Like me they will be wondering where to find the money for this unfair tax, which takes no account of people’s ability to pay, and hits pensioners on their fixed low incomes particularly hard. The council tax demand is now well above the state pension, so unless pensioners have private income they are forced to use up their savings to pay the council, and are being driven into poverty. The so-called council tax benefit is of no help, since it is means tested, and not until nearly all of a pensioner’s savings are used up will the council offer any help with payments to itself. This is the stuff of despair and suicide—’.

**Peter Law:** I am interested to hear about this fantasy world of yours in Plaid Cymru, Dai. However, when you realise this fantasy of leading us into independence, which we hear about all the time, where will the money come from to be able to revamp council tax? Where will you replace the funding that

hun fel plaid flaengar? Nid yw’r newid bandiau diweddar wedi helpu, yn sicr yn yr ardaloedd hynny fel Gwynedd a Chaerdydd lle’r aeth prisiau eiddo drwy’r to.

Mae’r bwriad i sicrhau cynnydd yn y niferoedd sydd yn cymryd budd-dal y dreth gyngor, sydd yn isel, yn enwedig ymhlith pensïynwyr, yn cydnabod bod problem i bensiynwyr ganfod yr arian i dalu eu treth gyngor ymlaen llaw. Fodd bynnag, nid yw budd-dal y dreth gyngor yn mynd i’r afael â’r broblem sylfaenol fod y dreth gyngor yn bwrw’r rhai sydd ar incwm isel neu sefydlog galetaf yn y lle cyntaf. Bydd newid bandiau’n gweld llawer o aelwydydd yn neidio i fyny fwy nag un band, a allai achosi problemau ariannol pellach i bensiynwyr sydd, hyd yma, heb dderbyn dim ond ymrwymiad i gynnydd o 2.5 y cant yn eu pensiynau gan Lafur Newydd.

Darllenaf o lythyr a gefais oddi wrth bensiynwr yn ddiweddar:

‘Bydd y rhan fwyaf o’r cyd-bensiynwyr wedi cael rhybuddion ailbrisio erbyn hyn, ac yn siomedig y bydd eu treth gyngor yn ôl pob tebyg yn dyblu neu’n treblu yn 2005. Fel fi, byddant yn pendroni ym mhle i ddod o hyd i’r arian ar gyfer y dreth annheg hon, nad yw’n rhoi dim ystyriaeth i allu pobl i dalu, ac sydd yn ergyd arbennig o drom i bensiynwyr ar eu hincwm isel sefydlog. Mae’r bil treth cyngor bellach ymhell uwchlaw’r pensiwn gwladol, felly oni bai fod gan bensiynwyr incwm preifat fe’u gorfodir i ddefnyddio’u cynilion i dalu i’r cyngor, a chânt eu gyrru i mewn i dlodi. Nid yw’r budd-dal y dreth gyngor bondigrybwyll o ddim cymorth, gan fod prawf modd arno, ac nid hyd nes bydd y cyfan bron o gynilion pensiynwr wedi’u dihsbyddu y gwnaiff y cyngor gynnig unrhyw gymorth gyda thaliadau iddo’i hun. Dyma ddeunydd anobaith a hunanladdiad—’.

**Peter Law:** Diddorol i mi yw clywed am eich byd ffantasi chi ym Mhlaid Cymru, Dai. Fodd bynnag, pan wireddwch y ffantasi hon o’n harwain i annibyniaeth, y clywn amdani o hyd, o ble y daw’r arian i allu ailwampio’r dreth gyngor? O ble y cewch chi gyllid i gymryd lle’r arian a ddaw oddi wrth



comes from the UK Government when we become a laverbread republic, when we have the begging bowls out on the corner and we have frontier posts? How will we do that? You have a £236 million spending gap in your plans now, from what we can see, without talking about the cost of implementing independence. Is this not just absolute fantasy?

**David Lloyd:** Thank you for that short intervention, Peter. The budget deficit for Wales in a new Wales would be £1.5 billion. However, do not forget that the budget deficit at a UK level today is £27 billion, so we are running at a loss now. Do you want to join Luxembourg and Finland—the only countries that are currently in positive budget surplus? What is there to do? Listen to what the pensioners are telling you:

‘very many old people are literally worried sick at the prospect of huge council tax bills, which demean their quality of life in what should be a stress-free retirement.’

That is what people are telling us. This is what this debate is about, I would have thought. Let us think about what people are telling us. Therefore, what is there to do and what can we do?

The other week, I was standing in a centuries-old house, which had minute windows, in St Fagan’s. That was as a result of the window tax, which was another property-based tax that was a crude proxy for wealth. We are now in the twenty-first century and are still adhering to property taxes. Council tax, with all its faults, is at least a tax that local authorities can raise locally—they have tax varying powers, which is what we want in the new Wales, as opposed to this National Assembly.

Finally, with the local government settlement being only 5 per cent this year, and with ever-increasing pressures in education and social services, what price more council tax hikes next year, just prior to the general election?

Lywodraeth y DU pan ddown yn weriniaeth fara lawr, pan fydd y powlenni begera allan gennym ar y gornel ac y bydd gennym byst ar y ffin? Sut wnawn ni hynny? Mae gennych fwch gwariant o £236 miliwn yn eich cynlluniau’n awr, o’r hyn a welwn ni, heb sôn am gost gweithredu annibyniaeth. Onid ffantasi lwyr yw hon?

**David Lloyd:** Diolch am yr ymyriad byr hwnnw, Peter. Byddai’r diffyg yn y gyllideb i Gymru mewn Cymru newydd yn £1.5 biliwn. Fodd bynnag, nac anghofier fod y diffyg cyllideb ar lefel y DU heddiw yn £27 biliwn, felly yr ydym yn rhedeg ar golled yn awr. Oes arnoch chi eisiau ymuno â Lwcsembwrg a’r Ffindir—sef yr unig wledydd â gwarged cyllideb positif ar hyn o bryd? Beth sydd i’w wneud? Gwrandewch ar yr hyn a ddywed y pensynwyr wrthych:

‘mae llawer iawn o hen bobl yn poeni nes mynd yn llythrennol sâl wrth feddwl am dalu biliau y dreth gyngor anferth, sydd yn andwyo ansawdd eu bywyd, a hwythau i fod yn mwynhau eu hymddeoliad.’

Dyna beth mae pobl yn ei ddweud wrthym. Dyma amcan y ddadl hon, debygwn i. Meddylw’n am yr hyn y mae pobl yn ei ddweud wrthym. Felly, beth sydd i’w wneud a beth allwn ni ei wneud?

Yr wythnos o’r blaen, yr oeddwn yn sefyll mewn tŷ ganrifoedd o oed, ac iddo ffenestri bychain bach, yn Sain Ffagan. Canlyniad y dreth ffenestri oedd hynny, sef treth arall seiliedig ar eiddo a oedd yn ffordd amrwd o ddynodi cyfoeth. Bellach yr ydym yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain ac yn dal i lynu at drethi eiddo. Mae’r dreth gyngor, gyda’i holl feiau, o leiaf yn dreth y gall awdurdodau lleol ei chodi’n lleol—mae ganddynt bwerau i amrywio’r dreth, sef yr hyn yr ydym ni’n ei ddeisyfu yn y Gymru newydd, yn wahanol i’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn.

Yn olaf, gyda’r setliad llywodraeth leol ddim ond yn 5 y cant eleni, a chyda phwysau cynyddol ym meysydd addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, pa bris mwy o godiadau y dreth gyngor y flwyddyn nesaf, yn union cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I appeal for brief speeches. Quite a few Members wish to speak and not everyone will be able to get in. It would be helpful, therefore, if Members could make succinct speeches.

**David Davies:** In my opinion, and that of many of my constituents, the endless rises in council taxes that we have seen since the establishment of the National Assembly have shown the total contempt that the Labour Party and the Labour Welsh Assembly Government have for the people of Wales. I could hardly believe my ears earlier when a Labour Member talked about an average rise, or even a total rise, of 8 per cent. What planet is he on? We had a rise of 24 per cent in the first year of the National Assembly alone. We would be grateful if we only received 8 per cent rises in our council tax, because more years than not they are in double figures. It may interest that Member to note that, over the last six years in Monmouthshire, council taxes on a band D property have gone up by something like 135 per cent—that is the price that we are paying for your policies.

**Jenny Randerson:** Given the current policy on council tax and the fact that we are currently living with it, whatever the merits of future proposals, and in order to reduce the increases that you mentioned, the Assembly Government must give more money to local government. When has your party tabled an amendment to the draft budget suggesting that more money should be given to local government?

**David Davies:** I am grateful to Jenny Randerson for giving me the opportunity to point out that figures from the Assembly Library will show that in every year bar one the amount of money given to Wales in the form of the block grant increased significantly over and above the rate of inflation. While I am on that point, Mike German has clearly not understood that the issue of council tax is devolved. Oliver Letwin could not possibly have been referring to Wales when he made his comments.

**Michael German** *rose*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Apeliaf am areithiau byr. Mae cryn nifer o Aelodau'n dymuno siarad ac nid pawb fydd yn gallu dod i mewn. Byddai o gymorth, felly, pe gallai Aelodau wneud areithiau cryno.

**David Davies:** Yn fy marn i, a barn llawer o'm hetholwyr, mae'r codiadau diddiwedd yn y trethi cyngor a welsom ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi dangos y dirmyg llwyr sydd gan y Blaid Lafur a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad tuag at bobl Cymru. Prin y gallwn gredu fy nghlustiau yn gynharach pan siaradodd Aelod Llafur am gyfartaledd codiad, neu hyd yn oed gyfanswm codiad, o 8 y cant. Ar ba blaned y mae'n byw? Cawsom godiad o 24 y cant ym mlwyddyn gyntaf y Cynulliad yn unig. Byddem yn ddiolchgar pe caem godiadau o 8 y cant yn unig yn ein treth gyngor, oherwydd y rhan fwyaf o flynyddoedd maent yn ffigurau dwbl. Efallai y bydd o ddiddordeb i'r Aelod hwnnw nodi bod, dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf yn Sir Fynwy, trethi cyngor ar eiddo band D wedi codi rywbeth tebyg i 135 y cant—dyna'r pris yr ydym yn ei dalu am eich polisiau chi.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn wyneb y polisi cyfredol ar dreth gyngor a'r ffaith ein bod yn byw gyda hi ar hyn o bryd, beth bynnag fo rhinweddau cynigion yn y dyfodol, ac er mwyn lleihau'r codiadau a grybwyllwyd gennych, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi mwy o arian i lywodraeth leol. Pa bryd y cyflwynodd eich plaid chi welliant i'r gyllideb ddrafft yn awgrymu y dylid rhoi mwy o arian i lywodraeth leol?

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jenny Randerson am roi'r cyfle imi nodi y dengys ffigurau o Lyfrgell y Cynulliad am bob blwyddyn namyn un fod y swm o arian a roddwyd i Gymru ar ffurf y grant bloc wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol uwchlaw cyfradd chwyddiant. Tra fy mod i ar y pwynt hwnnw, mae'n amlwg nad yw Mike German wedi deall fod cwestiwn y dreth gyngor wedi'i ddatganoli. Ni allai Oliver Letwin fod wedi bod yn cyfeirio at Gymru pan wnaeth ei sylwadau.

**Michael German** *a gododd*—

**David Davies:** Let me finish; you have made your point.

If he was talking about Wales, he would have been mistaken, and you would have been better off pointing out that he could not possibly have control in that regard. Council tax is set as a result of how much a local authority receives from the Assembly. If the Assembly gives a local authority more money, council tax will decrease; if the Assembly holds money back from a local authority, council tax will increase. I suspect that Oliver Letwin was referring to reducing the percentages by taking funding away from local authorities in England and allowing areas such as education to be funded directly by Government or allowing Government to fund parents directly. That is what I believe he was talking about, but I do not know and I do not intend to respond to that.

**Michael German:** Will you be writing to Oliver Letwin to tell him that he is mistaken?

**David Davies:** No, because I do not think that he was and I did not say that he was. You obviously were not listening and that is why you misunderstood his speech. I said that I thought that you were mistaken in what you heard.

Let me turn to council tax, which is the actual subject of this debate. The reason that it has increased and the solution to that problem relates to the formula used to allocate money to each of the 22 local authorities in Wales. It has been deliberately rigged to take money out of rural areas, such as Monmouthshire, and to give it to some of the authorities that have, I am afraid to say, been run and failed by old Labour for many decades. Instead of considering the amount of income a household receives, the formula considers how many people in a given area are claiming benefits. That might work well in some areas, such as Peter Law's constituency, but in the constituency of Monmouthshire, while not many people in percentage terms claim Government benefits, many people work in agriculture or tourism and receive the minimum wage. They may be as badly, or worse, off than some people who claim benefits, but, for the purpose of the

**David Davies:** Gadewch imi orffen; yr ydych wedi gwneud eich pwynt.

Pe buasai'n sôn am Gymru, buasai'n anghywir, a buasech chithau'n well arnoch pe baech wedi nodi na allasai gael rheolaeth yn hynny o beth o gwbl. Gosodir y dreth gyngor o ganlyniad i faint o arian gaiff awdurdod lleol oddi wrth y Cynulliad. Os rhydd y Cynulliad fwy o arian i awdurdod lleol, aiff y dreth gyngor i lawr; os ceidw'r Cynulliad arian oddi wrth awdurdod lleol, aiff y dreth gyngor i fyny. Amheufaf mai cyfeirio yr oedd Oliver Letwin at leihau'r canrannau drwy gymryd arian i ffwrdd oddi wrth awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr a chaniatáu i feysydd fel addysg gael eu hariannu'n uniongyrchol gan y Llywodraeth neu ganiatáu i'r Llywodraeth ariannu rhieni'n uniongyrchol. Dyna beth y credaf yr oedd yn siarad amdano, ond ni wn ac ni fwriadaf ymateb i hynny.

**Michael German:** A fyddwch yn ysgrifennu at Oliver Letwin i ddweud wrtho ei fod yn cyfeiliorni?

**David Davies:** Na, oherwydd nid wyf yn meddwl ei fod, ac ni ddywedais ei fod. Yn amlwg, nid oeddech yn gwrando, a dyna pam y bu ichi gamddeall ei araith. Dywedais fy mod yn meddwl eich bod chi wedi camgymryd yn yr hyn a glywsoch.

Gadewch imi droi at dreth gyngor, sef pwnc gwirioneddol y ddadl hon. Mae a wnelo'r rheswm y mae wedi cynyddu a'r ateb i'r broblem honno â'r fformiwla a ddefnyddir i ddyrannu arian i bob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Mae wedi'i ystumio'n fwriadol i gymryd arian allan o ardaloedd gwledig, fel Sir Fynwy, a'i roi i rai o'r awdurdodau sydd, mae'n flin gennyf ddweud, wedi'u rhedeg a'u methu gan hen Lafur ers degawdau lawer. Yn lle ystyried faint o incwm a ddaw i mewn i aelwyd, ystyria'r fformiwla faint o bobl mewn ardal benodol sydd yn hawlio budd-daliadau. Hwyrach fod hynny'n gweithio'n dda mewn rhai ardaloedd, fel etholaeth Peter Law, ond yn etholaeth Sir Fynwy, er nad oes canran fawr o bobl yn hawlio budd-daliadau'r Llywodraeth, mae llawer o bobl yn gweithio mewn amaethyddiaeth neu dwristiaeth ac yn cael yr isafswm cyflog. Gallant fod cyn waethed eu byd, neu waeth, na rhai pobl sydd

formula, they are not counted in any way as being poor. The formula is also fiddled in terms of the emphasis given to rurality—it used to be 8 per cent; it is now 6 per cent. As anyone could work out, the cost of providing services in a rural area is far greater than it is in an urban area. However, the formula does not take that into account. It is taking money out of areas such as Monmouthshire and holding money back. It does not matter who is in control—we have had Labour and Conservative councils over the past five years—council tax has and always will increase because they are not receiving enough money. Revaluation will mean a double whammy because I believe that local authorities will not be allowed to keep the additional money that comes in as a result of the increasing number of houses that have moved to a higher council tax band. They will be held back. What message does Peter Law have for constituents who will be hit by high council taxes and fewer services?

**Peter Law:** It is complete hypocrisy that this debate has been tabled by the Conservative Party, which introduced the poll tax—farmer poll tax in particular, who is sitting in front of you, will remember that—and created the foundation for council tax. We have worked with that and secured lower increases since then. Is it not the case that people have lost so much faith in you that you do not have one Member of Parliament in Wales? That is the result of what you did.

**David Davies:** The real hypocrisy comes from those who deliberately misuse council tax. It was not a perfect tax and it is not a perfectly fair tax; I would agree with that. I have my own views as to how it could be changed, but I will not digress on those now. Council tax would not have been so iniquitous had it not been abused and had the Assembly not decided to use it as backdoor means of raising taxation in order to pay for things such as that £55 million white elephant behind us. Your Government is responsible for the misery of pensioners like the one who wrote to me saying that she will have to sell her house because she does not have enough money to pay the tax.

yn hawlio budd-daliadau, ond, i bwrpas y fformiwla, ni chânt eu cyfrif yn bobl dlawd mewn unrhyw fodd. Mae'r fformiwla wedi'i chafflo hefyd yn nhermau'r pwyslais a roddir ar sefyllfa cefn gwlad—arferai fod yn 8 y cant; 6 y cant ydyw erbyn hyn. Fel y gallai unrhyw un weithio allan, mae cost darparu gwasanaethau mewn ardal wledig yn llawer mwy nag ydyw mewn ardal drefol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r fformiwla'n cymryd hynny i ystyriaeth. Mae'n cymryd arian allan o ardaloedd fel Sir Fynwy ac yn dal arian yn ôl. Nid oes ots pwy sydd yn rheoli—cawsom gynghorau Llafur a Cheidwadol yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf—cynyddu a wnaeth ac a wna'r dreth gyngor bob amser am nad ydynt yn cael digon o arian. Bydd ailbriso'n golygu ergyd ddwbl oherwydd credaf na chaniateir i awdurdodau lleol gadw'r arian ychwanegol a ddaw i mewn o ganlyniad i'r nifer gynyddol o dai fydd wedi symud i fand y dreth gyngor uwch. Cânt eu dal yn ôl. Pa neges sydd gan Peter Law i etholwyr a gaiff eu taro gan drethi cyngor uchel a llai o wasanaethau?

**Peter Law:** Rhagrith llwyr yw bod y ddadl hon wedi'i chyflwyno gan y Blaid Geidwadol, a gyflwynodd dreth y pen—bydd ffarmwr treth y pen yn arbennig, sydd yn eistedd o'ch blaen chi, yn cofio hynny—a chreu'r sylfaen ar gyfer y dreth gyngor. Yr ydym ni wedi gweithio gyda hynny ac wedi sicrhau codiadau is ers hynny. Onid yw'n wir fod pobl wedi colli cymaint o ffydd ynoch chi fel nad oes gennych un Aelod Seneddol yng Nghymru? Dyna ganlyniad yr hyn a wnaethoch chi.

**David Davies:** Ceir y gwir ragrith gan y rheiny sydd yn fwriadol gamddefnyddio'r dreth gyngor. Nid oedd yn dreth berffaith ac nid yw'n dreth berffaith deg; cytunaf â hynny. Mae gennyf fy syniadau fy hun ynghylch sut y gellid ei newid, ond nid ymhelaethaf ar y rheiny yn awr. Ni fuasai'r dreth gyngor mor anghyfiawn pe na bai wedi'i cham-drin a phe na bai'r Cynulliad wedi penderfynu ei defnyddio fel ffordd drws cefn o gynyddu trethiant er mwyn talu am bethau fel yr eliffant gwyn £55 miliwn acw y tu ôl inni. Eich Llywodraeth chi sydd yn gyfrifol am drueni pensïynwyr fel honno a ysgrifennodd ataf yn dweud y bydd raid iddi werthu ei thŷ am nad oes ganddi ddigon o

arian i dalu'r dreth.

4.00 p.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**David Davies:** You must reverse the policy, change the formula and start funding local government properly. If you do not, you will find many Conservative MPs representing Wales after the next general election.

**Ann Jones:** David leaves me speechless sometimes, and the word 'amnesia' comes to mind. There are lessons to be learned from the Tories' time in government. Council tax provides approximately 19 per cent of local government funding in Wales, and the Assembly provides approximately 79 per cent via the budget and rate support grant. We ask local councils to provide services, and this requires them to levy council tax. A wide range of services are provided. Glyn's reference to £1,000 for band D is scaremongering.

**Jonathan Morgan:** No it is not.

**Ann Jones:** Hang on a minute—no-one knows what the council tax bills will be until they are set. The Conservatives are merely scaremongering. As someone who will move up a band and who is grateful to the Minister that this will happen one band at a time, I believe that we should consider the services provided. Take a bill of £1,000 in band D, which equates to roughly £20 a week, and consider the services we expect for that.

**Alun Cairns:** It is a bargain.

**Ann Jones:** Consider rubbish collection, and if you have the unfortunate habit—

**David Davies:** Are you saying that a council tax bill of £1,000 is some sort of bargain for which we should be grateful?

**Ann Jones:** No, I am not, and you should always wait until I finish my sentences. We expect councils to provide various services. These services would not be provided by anyone else for £20 a week. I am not saying—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**David Davies:** Rhaid ichi wrth-droi'r polisi, newid y fformiwla a dechrau ariannu llywodraeth leol yn iawn. Os na wnewch, fe welwch sawl AS Ceidwadol yn cynrychioli Cymru wedi'r etholiad cyffredinol nesaf.

**Ann Jones:** Bydd David yn fy ngadael yn fud weithiau, a daw'r gair 'amnesia' i'r meddwl. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu oddi wrth gyfnod y Torïaid mewn llywodraeth. Mae'r dreth gyngor yn darparu oddeutu 19 y cant o gyllid llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, a darpara'r Cynulliad oddeutu 79 y cant drwy'r gyllideb a grant cynnal y dreth. Gofynnwn i gynghorau lleol ddarparu gwasanaethau, a golyga hyn fod angen iddynt godi y dreth gyngor. Darperir ystod eang o wasanaethau. Codi bwganod y mae Glyn wrth gyfeirio at £1,000 am fand D.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nage ddim.

**Ann Jones:** Am funud—ni wŷr neb beth fydd biliau'r dreth gyngor nes cânt eu gosod. Codi bwganod y mae'r Ceidwadwyr. Fel un a fydd yn symud i fyny fand ac sydd yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog mai fesul un band y bydd hyn yn digwydd, credaf y dylem ystyried y gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Cymwch fil o £1,000 ym mand D, sydd yn gyfystyr â rhyw £20 yr wythnos, ac ystyriwch y gwasanaethau a ddisgwyliwn am hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n fargen.

**Ann Jones:** Ystyriwch gasglu'r sbwriel, ac os oes gennych yr arfer anffodus—

**David Davies:** A ydych yn dweud bod bil y dreth gyngor o £1,000 yn rhyw fath o fargen y dylem fod yn ddiolchgar amdano?

**Ann Jones:** Nac ydwyf, a dylech bob amser aros nes gorffennaf fy mrawddegau. Disgwyliwn i gynghorau ddarparu amryfal wasanaethau. Ni fyddai neb arall yn darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny am £20 yr wythnos. Nid wyf yn dweud—

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will you give way?

**Ann Jones:** No, I am sorry, Nick. I may give way later if I have time.

The list of services is not exhaustive, but it is one that we must be acutely aware of. We are working in partnership with public services workers and local government colleagues. This issue may not always be given the priority that we expect, but we must consider what council tax is there to provide. Since 1999, local government expenditure has been increased by £1 billion, which is a 5 per cent increase in real terms. Building on this, grant support for specific initiatives has been increased by 4 per cent in real terms. This has resulted in an average council tax increase of 8.1 per cent during Labour's time in government.

**David Davies:** Not in Monmouthshire.

**Ann Jones:** You must sort out Monmouthshire.

Contrast this increase with the average council tax increase of 13 per cent during the Tories' time in government.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Will you give way?

**Ann Jones:** No, I will not give way.

Contrast it also with Michael Howard's commitment to Wales: to slash £1 billion from the budget for public services. How many street cleaners will you sack, how many teachers will you sack, how many firefighters will have to go, and how many neighbourhood and community wardens will you refuse to fund in order to make the £1 billion cut to which Michael Howard is committed? We all know Michael Howard as the man who introduced the poll tax. Do we trust Michael Howard? The people of Wales would say that they do not.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Ann Jones:** Na, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Nick. Efallai yr ildiaf yn ddiweddarach os bydd amser gennyf.

Nid yw'r rhestr o wasanaethau'n hollgynhwysol, ond mae'n un y mae'n rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol iawn ohoni. Yr ydym yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth gyda gweithwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a chydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol. Efallai na chaiff y mater hwn y flaenoriaeth a ddisgwyliwn bob amser, ond rhaid inni ystyried beth y mae'r dreth gyngor yno i'w ddarparu. Ers 1999, bu cynnydd o £1 biliwn yng ngwariant llywodraeth leol, sef cynnydd o 5 y cant mewn termau real. Gan adeiladu ar hyn, cynyddwyd cymorth grant ar gyfer mentrau penodol 4 y cant mewn termau real. Canlyniad hyn fu cynnydd ar gyfartaledd o 8 y cant yn y dreth gyngor yn ystod cyfnod Llafur mewn llywodraeth.

**David Davies:** Nid yn Sir Fynwy.

**Ann Jones:** Rhaid i chi roi trefn ar Sir Fynwy.

Cymharwch y cynnydd hwn â'r cyfartaledd cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor o 13 y cant yn ystod cyfnod y Torïaid mewn llywodraeth.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Ann Jones:** Na, ni wnaif ildio.

Cymharwch ef hefyd ag ymrwymiad Michael Howard i Gymru: cwtogi £1 biliwn ar y gyllideb ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Sawl glanhawr stryd wnewch chi eu diswyddo, sawl athro wnewch chi eu diswyddo, sawl diffoddwr tân fydd yn gorfod mynd, a sawl warden cymdogaeth a chymuned fyddwch chi'n gwrthod talu amdanynt er mwyn gwneud y toriad o £1 biliwn y mae Michael Howard wedi ymrwymo iddo? Yr ydym i gyd yn adnabod Michael Howard fel y dyn a gyflwynodd dreth y pen. A ydym yn ymddiried yn Michael Howard? Byddai pobl Cymru'n dweud nad ydynt.

We know that there are problems with council tax, which is why the Welsh Assembly Government and Welsh Labour argued for council tax to be reviewed as part of the balance of funding review.

Again—

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Are you giving way to Mark Isherwood?

**Ann Jones:** No, I am not giving way.

We have asked for council tax benefit to be reviewed so that people can take it up without feeling that it is a slight on how they handle their budgets. We are trying to make it a little easier for the people of Wales. No-one knows how much the council tax bills will be next year. No-one has the right to frighten any individual into thinking that they will pay well above the average. We must all wait, work together, and be responsible about how we work with our partners in local government to move forward so that we can have the services that we require.

**Alun Cairns:** Having listened to Ann Jones's performance, I had thought that it would be better for me to sit down and let her carry on digging and represent her views, and support the Conservative Party cause in the process. I notice that Ann Jones repeated, on several occasions, that no-one knows how much council tax levels will increase. I am sure that if past performance is an indication of future projection, there is no doubt that council tax levels will increase. The figures are stark, and need to be repeated.

When Labour came to power, the average band D council tax in Wales was £496; the current average council tax in band D is £887. If anyone wishes to question me on the figures, or if Ann Jones wishes to intervene on that point, I will happily sit down and take interventions.

**Ann Jones:** We missed your contributions last week while you were somewhere else. I would not dream of taking your time—we need to catch up with what you were going to

Gwyddom fod problemau gyda'r dreth gyngor, a dyna pam y dadleuodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Llafur Cymru dros adolygu'r dreth gyngor fel rhan o'r adolygiad ar y fantol ariannu.

Eto—

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A ydych chi'n ildio i Mark Isherwood?

**Ann Jones:** Nac ydwyf, nid wyf yn ildio.

Yr ydym wedi gofyn am adolygu budd-dal y dreth gyngor fel y gall pobl ei gymryd heb deimlo ei fod yn sarhad ar y modd y maent yn trin eu cyllidebau. Yr ydym yn ceisio'i gwneud ychydig yn haws i bobl Cymru. Ni wŷr neb faint fydd biliau'r dreth gyngor y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid oes gan neb yr hawl i ddychryn unrhyw unigolyn i feddwl y bydd yn talu ymhell dros y cyfartaledd. Rhaid inni i gyd aros, gweithio gyda'n gilydd, a bod yn gyfrifol ynghylch y modd y cydweithiwn â'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol i symud ymlaen er mwyn gallu cael y gwasanaethau a ddymunwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Wedi gwrandao ar berfformiad Ann Jones, tybiais y byddai'n well imi eistedd i lawr a gadael iddi hi ddal i balu a mynegi ei barn, a chefnogi achos y Blaid Geidwadol yn y broses. Sylwaf i Ann Jones ailadrodd, sawl gwaith, na wŷr neb faint y bydd lefelau'r dreth gyngor yn codi. Yr wyf yn siŵr os yw perfformiad y gorffennol yn arwydd o ragamcan y dyfodol, nad oes unrhyw amheuaeth y bydd lefelau'r dreth gyngor yn codi. Mae'r ffigurau'n llwm, ac mae angen eu hailadrodd.

Pan ddaeth Llafur i rym, £496 oedd y dreth gyngor band D ar gyfartaledd yng Nghymru; mae cyfartaledd cyfredol y dreth gyngor ym mand D yn £887. Os dymuna unrhyw un fy holi ar y ffigurau, neu os dymuna Ann Jones ymyrryd ar y pwynt hwnnw, eisteddaf â phleser a chymryd ymyriadau.

**Ann Jones:** Gwelsom gollu'ch cyfraniadau yr wythnos ddiwethaf tra'r oeddech chi yn rhywle arall. Ni fyddwn yn breuddwydio cymryd eich amser—mae angen inni ddal i

say.

**Alun Cairns:** I may need to repeat the figures after all. It was £496 when Labour came to power, and it is now £887. This is an increase of more than 78 per cent, bearing in mind that inflation has been relatively low during that period. Ann Jones is right that no-one knows exactly what council tax levels will be next April, but they will certainly be much higher; we do not know yet how much higher.

**Carl Sargeant:** Given that we are accepting facts and figures from both sides of the Chamber, do you agree that between 1993 and 1997, council tax grew at an average of 13 per cent per year, which is higher than under Labour in the latter years? Also, if we are making comparisons, in England, Conservative-run councils feature in the majority of the top 10 in terms of council tax levels. Answer that, Alun.

**Alun Cairns:** I notice that the Member talks in percentage terms, when I focused on the sums of £496 and £887. When you talk in percentage terms, anything can be made to look plausible, even by Carl Sargeant.

What gave the game away with regard to recent statements made by the Finance Minister was that the letter that she issued to each Assembly Member highlighted the fact that this would be difficult to present. For example, in the Vale of Glamorgan, 44 per cent of properties move up at least one band; 3 per cent of properties move down; and almost 1 per cent of properties move up three bands.

**Carl Sargeant:** On your point about this being difficult to present, why did no Tory Members attend the budget announcement yesterday? Not one Tory Member turned up to even try to understand the figures.

**Alun Cairns:** Our finance spokesman did not attend the meeting yesterday as he was so busy with his regional duties as an Assembly Member, in your constituency. It seems that there is a deficiency in the constituency

fyny gyda'r hyn yr oeddech yn mynd i'w ddweud.

**Alun Cairns:** Efallai y bydd angen imi ailadrodd y ffigurau wedi'r cwbl. Yr oedd yn £496 pan ddaeth Llafur i rym, a bellach mae'n £887. Dyna gynnydd o fwy na 78 y cant, o gofio y bu chwyddiant yn gymharol isel yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Mae Ann Jones yn iawn na wŷr neb yn union beth fydd lefelau'r dreth gyngor fis Ebrill nesaf, ond byddant yn sicr yn llawer uwch; ni wyddom eto faint yn uwch.

**Carl Sargeant:** A derbyn ein bod yn derbyn ffeithiau a ffigurau o'r naill ochr a'r llall i'r Siambr, a gytunwch fod y dreth gyngor rhwng 1993 a 1997 wedi tyfu ar gyfartaledd 13 y cant y flwyddyn, sydd yn uwch na Llafur yn y blynyddoedd wedi hynny? Hefyd, os ydym yn cymharu, yn Lloegr, mae cynghorau a reolir gan y Ceidwadwyr yn ffurfio mwyafrif y 10 uchaf o ran lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Atebwch hynny, Alun.

**Alun Cairns:** Sylwaf fod yr Aelod yn siarad yn nhermau canrannau, tra bu i mi ganolbwyntio ar y symiau, £496 ac £887. Pan siaradwch yn nhermau canrannol, gellir gwneud i unrhyw beth swnio'n gredadwy, hyd yn oed gan Carl Sargeant.

Yr hyn a ollyngodd y gath o'r cwd yng nghyswllt datganiadau diweddar a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog Cyllid oedd fod y llythyr a anfonodd at bob Aelod Cynulliad yn pwysleisio'r ffaith y byddai hyn yn anodd i'w gyflwyno. Er enghraifft, ym Mro Morgannwg, mae 44 y cant o eiddo'n symud i fyny o leiaf un band; mae 3 y cant o eiddo'n symud i lawr; ac mae bron 1 y cant o eiddo'n symud i fyny dri band.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ar eich pwynt ynghylch bod hyn yn anodd i'w gyflwyno, pam na fynychodd yr un Aelod Torïaidd gyhoeddiad y gyllideb ddoe? Ni ddaeth gymaint ag un Aelod Torïaidd i hyd yn oed geisio deall y ffigurau.

**Alun Cairns:** Ni fynychodd ein llefarydd cyllid y cyfarfod ddoe am ei fod mor brysur gyda'i ddyletswyddau rhanbarthol fel Aelod Cynulliad, yn eich etholaeth chi. Mae'n debyg fod diffyg o ran Aelod Cynulliad yr



Assembly Member conducting his responsibilities. The Conservative finance spokesman arranged to meet the Minister first thing this morning to have a one-to-one briefing to try to scrutinise and judge the figures that were presented.

4.10 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** We were given extremely short notice that this announcement would be made before the Assembly returned. I give more than one day a week to my constituents, and my diary on Mondays is blocked weeks ahead. I thank Sue Essex, who understood this and agreed to meet me at 9 a.m. today, for her time and patience. I also stress that yesterday afternoon, after my constituency engagements, beginning in north-west Wales in Bangor, I went to my constituency office, switched on the PC, and read through the budget before I went to press. I will thank you to focus more on our mutual constituents, Carl, and less on pathetic party-political point scoring.

**Alun Cairns:** It is obvious that Mark Isherwood has enormous constituency responsibilities, due to the deficiencies of some north Wales constituency Assembly Members. To conclude, because I appreciate that time is limited, I will turn to the Liberal Democrats' and Plaid Cymru's local income tax. Is it not the case that two people on average earnings in the Vale of Glamorgan, according to figures presented by the Liberal Democrats, for example, will be £508 worse off? They have not even started talking about the costs of collecting this tax.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You are out of time.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** There is a small part of me that feels sorry for the Welsh Conservative Party today. They tabled this motion in the belief that the Welsh Local Government Association would have been outraged by the budget, and that there would be popular rebellion over the revaluation; that has not happened. Instead, there is a recognition that the Assembly Government is working with the people of Wales to provide local services for long-term success. Record

etholaeth yn cyflawni'i gyfrifoldebau. Trefnodd llefarydd cyllid y Ceidwadwyr i gyfarfod â'r Gweinidog y peth cyntaf y bore yma i gael cyfarfod un-i-un i geisio archwilio a barnu'r ffigurau a gyflwynwyd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Rhybudd eithriadol o fyr a roddwyd inni y gwneid y cyhoeddiad hwn cyn i'r Cynulliad ddychwelyd. Rhoddaf fi fwy nag un diwrnod yr wythnos i'm hetholwyr, ac mae fy nyddiadur ar ddyddiau Llun yn llawn am wythnosau i ddod. Diolchaf i Sue Essex, a ddeallodd hyn ac a gytunodd i gyfarfod â mi am 9 a.m. heddiw, am ei hamser a'i hamynedd. Pwysleisiaf hefyd yr euthum brynhawn ddoe, ar ôl fy apwyntiadau etholaethol, gan ddechrau yn y gogledd-orllewin ym Mangor, i'm swyddfa yn fy etholaeth, troi'r cyfrifiadur ymlaen, a darllen drwy'r gyllideb cyn imi fynd at y wasg. Diolchwn i chi pe canolbwyntiech fwy ar ein hetholwyr ni'n dau, Carl, a llai ar sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol tila.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n amlwg fod gan Mark Isherwood gyfrifoldebau aruthrol yn yr etholaeth, o ganlyniad i ddiffygion Aelodau Cynulliad rhai etholaethau yn y Gogledd. I gloi, canys sylweddolaf fod amser yn brin, trof at dreth incwm leol y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaid Cymru. Onid yw'n wir y bydd dau berson ar gyflog cyfartalog ym Mro Morgannwg, yn ôl ffigurau a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er enghraifft, £508 yn waeth eu byd? Nid ydynt hyd yn oed wedi dechrau sôn am gostau casglu'r dreth hon.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Y mae rhan fach ohonof sydd yn teimlo trueni dros y Blaid Geidwadol Gymreig heddiw. Cyflwynasant y cynnig hwn yn y gred y byddai Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi'u cynddeiriogi gan y gyllideb, ac y byddai chwyldro poblogaidd ar fater yr ailbriso; nid yw hynny wedi digwydd. Yn lle hynny, cydnabyddir fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydweithio gyda phobl Cymru i ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol er mwyn

capital investment has been made in schools, hospitals and local transport. There has been investment in children and young people, in developing children in their early years and in developing the skills that are needed for a successful Welsh economy.

**Nick Bourne:** The Finance Minister spoke, and presumably she was aware of this when she did so, as if the WLGA approved of the budget. Alex Aldridge, a Labour Party councillor—he is certainly no Conservative—said that the outcome is disappointing. Those were his words.

**Sue Essex:** I announced yesterday an average increase of 5 per cent for local government for 2005-06. That is well above the rate of inflation. Regarding Nick's point, local government has responded by saying that it would have wished for more, but, equally, it recognises that this is a settlement developed in partnership. I am honest about that. If you were a local government leader, what would you say? I was a local government leader once, and you always expect more. If you read what local government has said, it welcomed the opportunity to work in partnership. It recognises that we have made provision for pay, prices and pensions and that we have added to capacity in the areas of education and social services. Full details of next year's local government settlement will be made available next week. Last year, we were told by the jeremiahs in the Chamber that there would be a huge rise in council tax. They were wrong. This year, the jeremiahs are already making the same predictions, overlooking the work that local government is doing across Wales, and looking to see how local authority budgets can be managed.

**Jonathan Morgan:** In the last financial year, council tax in Cardiff rose by some 12 per cent. Your colleague Russell Goodway, who was then leader of the council, maintained that the reason for the increase was that Gordon Brown did not sufficiently fund the increase in national insurance contributions,

llwyddiant yn y tymor hir. Buddsodwyd mwy o gyfalaf nag erioed o'r blaen mewn ysgolion, ysbytai a chludiant lleol. Buddsodwyd mewn plant a phobl ifanc, mewn datblygu plant yn eu blynyddoedd cynnar ac mewn datblygu'r sgiliau y mae eu hangen ar gyfer economi Gymreig lwyddiannus.

**Nick Bourne:** Siaradodd y Gweinidog Cyllid, ac mae'n debyg ei bod yn ymwybodol o hyn pan wnaeth hynny, fel pe bai Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi cymeradwyo'r gyllideb. Dywedodd Alex Aldridge, cynghorydd Llafur—yn sicr, nid Ceidwadwr mohono—fod y canlyniad yn siomedig. Dyna'i eiriau ef.

**Sue Essex:** Cyhoeddais ddoe gynnydd ar gyfartaledd o 5 y cant i lywodraeth leol am 2005-06. Mae hynny'n llawer uwch na chyfradd chwyddiant. O ran pwynt Nick, mae llywodraeth leol wedi ymateb drwy ddweud y byddai wedi dymuno cael mwy, ond, ar yr un pryd, mae'n cydnabod bod hwn yn setliad a ddatblygwyd mewn partneriaeth. Yr wyf yn onest ynglŷn â hynny. Pe baech yn arweinydd llywodraeth leol, beth ddywedech chi? Bûm innau'n arweinydd llywodraeth leol unwaith, ac yr ydych bob amser yn disgwyl mwy. Os darllenwch yr hyn a ddywedodd llywodraeth leol, croesawyd y cyfle i gydweithio mewn partneriaeth. Mae'n cydnabod ein bod wedi darparu ar gyfer cyflogau, prisiau a phensiynau a'n bod wedi ychwanegu at y gallu i ddarparu ym meysydd addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Bydd manylion llawn setliad llywodraeth leol ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf ar gael yr wythnos nesaf. Y llynedd, dywedwyd wrthym gan y jeremeias yn y Siambr y ceid cynnydd aruthrol yn y dreth gyngor. Yr oeddent yn anghywir. Eleni, mae'r jeremeias eisoes yn proffwydo'r un pethau, yn anghofio'r gwaith y mae llywodraeth leol yn ei wneud ledled Cymru, ac yn edrych i weld sut y gellir rheoli cyllidebau awdurdodau lleol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, cododd y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd ryw 12 y cant. Haerodd eich cyd-aelod Russell Goodway, a oedd yn arweinydd y cyngor ar y pryd, mai'r rheswm am y cynnydd oedd nad oedd Gordon Brown wedi rhoi cyllid digonol ar gyfer y cynnydd

and that the Assembly Government did not sufficiently fund the increases needed for teachers' performance-related pay. Do you accept that as a valid criticism and as one of the fundamental reasons why council taxes, in the last financial year, rocketed quite considerably in Cardiff?

**Sue Essex:** No. Since the first financial settlement for local government set by the Assembly Government for 1999-2000, the level of funding for local government will have risen by some 46 per cent in the period up to 2007-08. Do you remember William Hague? He was the man who was sent from Richmond in Yorkshire to look after us. During his last year in Wales, he implemented a 5 per cent decrease in the revenue support grant. We can remember exactly our position under Tory rule—cut in a revenue support grant for local government. This motion is a Tory own-goal, because when we look at the historical pattern of council tax increases, the two highest rises on the average band D tax, occurred during the Tory years. One was a massive 17.95 per cent. It is no accident that the Tories presided over the highest council tax increases in Welsh history because they are a unionist party and it was their declared intention that council tax in Wales should be the same as in England. If the Tories were still running Wales, council tax would be 30 per cent higher. Strangely, I have not seen this Tory policy in their leaflets.

Council tax is a property tax and it was introduced by the Tories after the debacle of the poll tax, alluded to by my colleague and friend, Peter Law, but such was the irresponsibility of the Tories in Government that they created a property tax with no provision for the revaluation of properties. I am told that that is unique in world history. Academics have been unable to find any other property tax without a built-in revaluation mechanism. That is a first for the British Conservative Party, of which it does not get many these days—in fact, it came fourth in Hartlepool. However, Labour in Government has recognised that no property tax is viable without periodic revaluation. We

mewn cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol, ac na ddarparodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyllid digonol ar gyfer y codiadau angenrheidiol i roi tâl ar sail perfformiad i athrawon. A dderbyniwch hynny fel beirniadaeth ddilys ac fel un o'r rhesymau sylfaenol pam y saethodd trethi cyngor i fyny yn dra sylweddol yng Nghaerdydd yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf?

**Sue Essex:** Na. Ers y setliad ariannol cyntaf i lywodraeth leol a bennwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am 1999-2000, bydd lefel gyllido llywodraeth leol wedi codi ryw 46 y cant yn y cyfnod hyd at 2007-08. A ydych yn cofio William Hague? Dyna'r dyn a anfonwyd o Richmond yn swydd Efrog i edrych ar ein holau. Yn ystod ei flwyddyn olaf yng Nghymru, cwtogodd 5 y cant ar y grant cynnal refeniw. Gallwn gofio'n union beth oedd ein sefyllfa dan reolaeth y Torïaid—cwtogi grant cynnal refeniw i lywodraeth leol. Gôl yn eu rhwyd eu hunain gan y Torïaid yw'r cynnig hwn, oherwydd pan edrychwn ar batrwm hanesyddol codiadau yn y dreth gyngor, digwyddodd y ddau godiad uchaf yn nhreth gyfartalog band D yn ystod blynyddoedd y Torïaid. Yr oedd un yn godiad anferthol o 17.95 y cant. Nid damwain ydyw i'r Torïaid lywodraethu dros y codiadau uchaf yn y dreth gyngor yn hanes Cymru gan ei bod yn blaid unoliaethol a'i bwriad datganedig oedd y dylai'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru fod yr un fath ag yn Lloegr. Pe bai'r Torïaid yn dal i redeg Cymru, byddai'r dreth gyngor 30 y cant yn uwch. Yn rhyfedd, nid wyf wedi gweld y polisi hwn o eiddo'r Torïaid yn eu taflenni.

Treth eiddo yw'r dreth gyngor ac fe'i cyflwynwyd gan y Torïaid ar ôl llanastr treth y pen, y cyfeiriwyd ato gan fy nghyd-aelod a'm cyfaill, Peter Law, ond cymaint oedd anghyfrifoldeb y Torïaid mewn Llywodraeth nes iddynt greu treth eiddo heb ddarpariaeth ar gyfer ailbrisiu eiddo. Dywedir wrthyf fod hyn yn unigryw yn hanes y byd. Mae academyddion wedi methu dod o hyd i unrhyw dreth eiddo arall heb fecanwaith ailbrisiu wedi'i adeiladu i mewn iddi. Dyna'r Blaid Geidwadol Brydeinig ar y blaen, rhywbeth nad yw'n digwydd yn aml y dyddiau hyn—yn wir, daeth yn bedwerydd yn Hartlepool. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi sylweddoli nad yw

have taken the difficult, but responsible, steps to achieve that.

**Mark Isherwood:** You referred to Hartlepool, so you will not mind me referring to the fact that the results of the local government election across the UK earlier this year signalled the first time that a governing party had come third in such elections. You referred to council tax being at record levels under the Conservatives, but in 1993, band D council tax rises in Wales averaged 3.28 per cent. When we left office, it was 4.64 per cent, and it is now 8.87 per cent. Finally, the WLGA, in its half-yearly report, stated that the cost of the teachers' workload agreement in future years means that it has a huge hurdle to overcome to raise the necessary resources to properly fund local services. It also said that local authorities cannot be expected to take on additional burdens without the necessary resources. When you take your 5 per cent apart, we are looking at massive council taxes, so at least be honest about it.

**Sue Essex:** If you look at the budget, Mark, you will see that the teachers' workload agreement for the next three years is included in it—£25 million, £37 million and a further £37 million. That has been agreed with local government. You also know that I signed the agreement, with Sir Harry Jones, on additional burdens and that they would be funded. You also know that this year, as well as setting the revenue support grant at 5 per cent, a huge number of grants and expenditure will be going from the Assembly to local government, so let us compare like with like. I reject your comment that that will give rise to massive council tax—none of us know, and you must get your wording right.

Let us return to the issue of revaluation. As I said, you did not include anything on that in your legislation, but we have. If you have a property tax—and in fairness, Glyn Davies has acknowledged this, and I pay tribute to him—you must have revaluation. We have done that and I have included the moderation

unrhyw dreth eiddo'n hyfyw heb ailbriso o bryd i'w gilydd. Yr ydym wedi cymryd y camau anodd, ond cyfrifol, i gyflawni hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Bu i chi gyfeirio at Hartlepool, felly ni fydd ots gennych fy mod i'n cyfeirio at y ffaith i ganlyniadau'r etholiadau llywodraeth leol ledled y DU yn gynharach eleni ddangos am y tro cyntaf fod plaid lywodraethol wedi dod yn drydydd mewn etholiadau o'r fath. Sonioch fod y dreth gyngor ar y lefelau uchaf erioed dan y Ceidwadwyr, ond yn 1993, yr oedd codiadau yn y dreth gyngor band D yng Nghymru ar gyfartaledd yn 3.28 y cant. Pan adawsom ni lywodraeth, 4.64 y cant oedd y ffigur, ac erbyn hyn mae'n 8.87 y cant. Yn olaf, dywedodd CLILC yn ei adroddiad chwemisol fod cost cytundeb baich gwaith yr athrawon yn y blynyddoedd i ddod yn golygu fod ganddi fynydd enfawr i'w ddringo i godi'r adnoddau angenrheidiol i dalu'n iawn am wasanaethau lleol. Dywedodd hefyd na ellir disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol ymgymryd â beichiau ychwanegol heb yr adnoddau angenrheidiol. Pan ddadansoddwch eich 5 y cant, yr ydym yn edrych ar drethi cyngor anferth, felly o leiaf byddwch yn onest ynglŷn â'r mater.

**Sue Essex:** Os edrychwch ar y gyllideb, Mark, fe welwch fod cytundeb baich gwaith yr athrawon am y tair blynedd nesaf wedi'i gynnwys ynddi—£25 miliwn, £37 miliwn a £37 miliwn ar ben hynny. Mae hynny wedi ei gytuno gyda llywodraeth leol. Gwyddoch hefyd i mi lofnodi'r cytundeb, gyda Syr Harry Jones, ar feichiau ychwanegol ac y caent hwythau eu hariannu. Gwyddoch hefyd y bydd nifer aruthrol o grantiau a gwariant yn mynd oddi wrth y Cynulliad i lywodraeth leol eleni, yn ogystal â gosod y grant cynnal refeniw yn 5 y cant, felly gadewch inni gymharu tebyg wrth ei debyg. Gwadaf eich sylw y bydd hynny'n achosi treth gyngor enfawr—nid oes neb ohonom yn gwybod, a rhaid ichi eirio eich dadl yn iawn.

Awn yn ôl at gwestiwn ailbriso. Fel y dywedais, ni wnaethoch chi gynnwys dim am hynny yn eich deddfwriaeth, ond yr ydym ni wedi gwneud. Os oes gennych dreth eiddo—ac i fod yn deg, mae Glyn Davies wedi cydnabod hyn, a thalaf deyrnged iddo—rhaid cael ailbriso. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny

scheme of limiting band movement to a single band. That has been extremely welcome. My colleagues in Plaid Cymru and the Liberal Democrats obviously champion local income tax, but Glyn successfully demolished that idea. They are living in never-never land—we live in the real world where choices must be made. We must make choices, and so must local government. I respect the political leadership of local authorities in Wales, whatever their political parties, because I know that it is difficult to look at budgets and prioritise, in exactly the same way as the Government must do. There is no free ride when you are in control, whether it is in local government or in the Assembly. We must make choices. This year, we are working in strong partnership with local government to ensure that the settlement adequately reflects the pressures on local services.

I will end by saying that no-one knows, as Ann Jones said, what the council tax levels will be this year. It is for local councils to set. I deplore this scaremongering, as Ann said, and the plucking of figures from the air for political purposes. That does not do you any credit, and it does not do government any credit either. You must reconsider your language.

4.20 p.m.

**William Graham:** I will quote from Sir Harry Jones, who was the well-known leader of the WLGA until June of this year. In March he said,

‘The Welsh Assembly Government did provide additional support for local government in its finance settlement, but this did not go as far as local government had argued was necessary. Councils therefore have to face the difficult choice between keeping council tax bills low and maintaining services. In reality, neither came off.’

Yesterday, Alex Aldridge, in response to the Minister’s comments, spoke of a

ac yr wyf wedi cynnwys cynllun cymedroli, sef cyfyngu symudiad rhwng bandiau i un band. Bu croeso mawr i hynny. Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau ym Mhlaid Cymru a’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn amlwg yn dadlau dros dreth incwm leol, ond chwalodd Glyn y syniad hwnnw’n llwyddiannus. Maent hwy’n byw yng ngwlad byth bythoedd—yr ydym ni’n byw yn y byd go iawn lle mae’n rhaid gwneud dewisiadau. Rhaid i ni wneud dewisiadau, a rhaid i lywodraeth leol wneud hefyd. Parchaf arweinwyr gwleidyddol awdurdodau lleol Cymru, beth bynnag fo’u pleidiau gwleidyddol, oherwydd gwn ei bod yn anodd edrych ar gyllidebau a gosod blaenoriaethau, yn yr un modd yn union ag y mae’n rhaid i’r Llywodraeth ei wneud. Nid oes dim am ddim pan ydych chi’n rheoli, boed mewn llywodraeth leol neu yn y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni wneud dewisiadau. Eleni, yr ydym yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth gref gyda llywodraeth leol i sicrhau bod y setliad yn adlewyrchu’n ddigonol y pwysau sydd ar wasanaethau lleol.

Diweddaf drwy ddweud na wŷr neb, fel y dywedodd Ann Jones, beth fydd lefelau’r dreth gyngor eleni. Mater i gynghorau lleol ei bennu ydyw. Ffieiddiaf at y codi bwganod hyn, fel y dywedodd Ann, a’r tynnu ffigurau o’r awyr i ddibenion gwleidyddol. Nid yw hynny’n glod i chi o gwbl, nac yn glod i lywodraeth ychwaith. Rhaid ichi ailystyried eich iaith.

**William Graham:** Dyfynnaf eiriau Syr Harry Jones, sef arweinydd adnabyddus CLILC tan fis Mehefin eleni. Ym mis Mawrth, dywedodd,

Fe ddarparodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gefnogaeth ychwanegol i lywodraeth leol yn ei setliad cyllid, ond nid aeth hyn mor bell ag yr oedd llywodraeth leol wedi dadlau oedd yn angenrheidiol. Felly rhaid i gynghorau wynebu’r dewis anodd rhwng cadw biliau’r dreth gyngor yn isel a chynnal gwasanaethau. Mewn gwirionedd, ni lwyddwyd i wneud y naill na’r llall.

Ddoe, soniodd Alex Aldridge, mewn ymateb i sylwadau’r Gweinidog, am ganlyniad

disappointing outcome, despite working closely with the Assembly Government over past months to ensure that the areas of growth concentrated on key services. He also talked about the challenges to maintaining services and the impact on council tax. For Ann's information, in Denbighshire in 1996-97, council tax at band D was £459; by 2004-05, it had risen to £1,007 under the Labour Government. If we consider the percentage of bands, 58 per cent will remain the same, and 33 per cent will rise. The mathematics of that means that there will be far more tax to pay. The Minister feels sorry for the Conservatives, but we feel sorry for council tax payers.

Although I am no longer a councillor, I served with many distinguished people in local government, and I pay tribute to them. However, local government continues to be loaded with Government requirements, targets and performance indicators and comprehensive performance assessments. Surely the inspection should be proportionate to the risk and the focus should be maintained on what customers want and rate payers demand? Additional funding will be required, and depreciation accounting is being introduced to all local authorities. Previously, council assets management was largely funded by Westminster, with little consideration of the precise cost to individual authorities. That was previously borne in the rate assessment grant. Where is the additional money coming from for the next few years?

Local government is also being threatened with a £6.5 billion reduction in savings to be identified by Gershon. Sue Essex explained that council tax rebanding is not a euphemism for increasing council tax. She said that its aim was not to lead to an overall increase or decrease in the council tax yield across Wales. The latest figures indicate that only in council tax bands A and B will there be a decrease in the number of dwellings. The mathematics is relatively simple. With more taxpayers being reclassified into higher tax bands, the only way to prevent an increase in council tax yield will be to reduce the current levels of council tax.

To reply to Mike German's comments about

siomedig, er gwaethaf cydweithio'n agos gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros y misoedd diwethaf i sicrhau bod y meysydd twf yn canolbwyntio ar wasanaethau allweddol. Soniodd hefyd am y bygythiadau i gynnal gwasanaethau a'r effaith ar y dreth gyngor. Er gwybodaeth i Ann, yn sir Ddinbych yn 1996-97, £459 oedd y dreth gyngor ar gyfer band D; erbyn 2004-05, yr oedd wedi codi i £1,007 dan y Llywodraeth Lafur. Os ystyriwn ganran y bandiau, bydd 58 y cant yn aros yr un fath, a 33 y cant yn codi. Golyga mathemateg hynny y bydd llawer mwy o dreth i'w thalu. Teimla'r Gweinidog drueni dros y Ceidwadwyr, ond teimlwn ni drueni dros y trethdalwyr.

Er nad wyf yn gynghorydd mwyach, gwasanaethais gyda llawer o bobl neilltuol mewn llywodraeth leol, a thalaf deyrnged iddynt. Fodd bynnag, mae llywodraeth leol yn dal i fod dan faich gofynion, targedau a dangosyddion perfformiad y Llywodraeth, ac asesiadau perfformiad cynhwysfawr. Siawns na ddylai'r arolygaeth fod yn gymesur â'r risg ac y dylid canolbwyntio ar yr hyn y mae ar gwsmeriaid ei eisiau ac y mae trethdalwyr yn galw amdano? Bydd angen cyllid ychwanegol, a chyflwynir cyfrifyddiaeth dibrisiant i bob awdurdod lleol. Gynt, câi rheolaeth asedau cynghorau ei ariannu'n helaeth gan San Steffan, heb fawr o ystyriaeth i'r union gost i awdurdodau unigol. Cariwyd hynny gynt yn y grant asesu'r dreth. O ble y daw'r arian ychwanegol am yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf?

Mae llywodraeth leol yn cael ei bygwth hefyd â chwtogiad o £6.5 biliwn mewn cynilion i'w canfod gan Gershon. Eglurodd Sue Essex nad gair teg am gynyddu'r dreth gyngor yw newid bandiau'r dreth gyngor. Dywedodd nad ei nod oedd arwain at gynnydd neu gwmp cyffredinol yn yr hyn a ildia'r dreth gyngor ledled Cymru. Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf mai dim ond ym mandiau'r dreth gyngor A a B y ceir cwmp yn nifer yr anheddau. Mae'r fathemateg yn gymharol syml. Gyda mwy o drethdalwyr yn cael eu hailddosbarthu i fandiau trethiant uwch, yr unig ffordd i atal cynnydd yn yr hyn a ildia'r dreth gyngor fydd gostwng lefelau cyffredol y dreth gyngor.

I ateb sylwadau Mike German ynghylch

the history of council tax, it was only a revamping of the old system of rateable values. A progressive tax means that if you own a cheap house you pay less tax, and that if you own an expensive house, you pay more. All the parties of the United Kingdom are signed up to progressive tax.

Average bills have risen by 79 per cent in Wales, compared to 69 per cent in England, since Labour came to power. One in four households pays more in council tax than in income tax. Pensioners and those on low incomes are most likely to find their local taxation bill outstripping the central levy on their income. Rhodri Morgan told the Chamber that as many as half the people who are entitled to reduced council tax may be missing out, and Government figures indicate that £1 billion in council tax benefits—over 40 per cent—is unclaimed across the United Kingdom. In November 2003, Sue Essex claimed that there would be as many winners as losers as a result of rebanding. However, less than one in 10 households will benefit from going down a band and a third will go up at least one band. Labour has altered the formula away from meeting service provision, particularly in rural and sparsely populated areas. The people of Wales are beginning to realise that Conservative councils throughout the United Kingdom deliver better public services, at a lower rate of council tax. Conservative policies for local government will ensure greater accountability and efficiency, giving local people the power to ensure that their councillors provide services of value that reflect public need.

Looking at the assembled Assembly Government, I cannot help but reflect on Edward Lear's description of the jumbies: though the sky be dark and the voyage long, yet you never can think you were rash or wrong, while round in a sieve you spin.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** If amendment 1 is carried, amendment 2 will fall.

hanes y dreth gyngor, nid oedd yn ddim mwy nag ailwampio'r hen system gwerthoedd trethiannol. Mae treth gynyddol yn golygu os ydych yn berchen ar dŷ rhad y talwch lai o dreth, ac os ydych yn berchen ar dŷ drud, y talwch fwy. Mae pob plaid yn y Deyrnas Unedig y tu cefn i dreth gynyddol.

Mae'r cyfartaledd biliau wedi codi 79 y cant yng Nghymru, o gymharu â 69 y cant yn Lloegr, ers i Lafur ddod i rym. Mae un ym mhob pedair aelwyd yn talu mwy mewn treth gyngor nag mewn treth incwm. Mae pensïynwyr a phobl ar incwm isel yn fwy tebygol o weld bod eu bil treth leol yn fwy na'r dreth ganolog ar eu hincwm. Dywedodd Rhodri Morgan wrth y Siambr ei bod yn bosibl fod cymaint â hanner y bobl sydd â hawl i ostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor yn colli allan, a dengys ffigurau'r Llywodraeth fod £1 biliwn mewn budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor—dros 40 y cant—heb eu hawlio ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Ym mis Tachwedd 2003, haerodd Sue Essex y byddai cymaint o enillwyr ag o gollwyr o ganlyniad i'r newid bandiau. Fodd bynnag, bydd llai nag un mewn 10 aelwyd yn elwa o fynd i lawr fand a bydd traean yn mynd i fyny o leiaf un band. Mae Llafur wedi newid y fformiwla oddi wrth gyfateb â'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig a thenau eu poblogaeth. Mae pobl Cymru'n dechrau sylweddoli bod cynghorau Ceidwadol ledled y Deyrnas Unedig yn rhoi gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ar gyfradd is o dreth gyngor. Bydd polisïau'r Ceidwadwyr ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yn sicrhau mwy o atebolrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd, gan roi'r grym i bobl leol sicrhau bod eu cynghorwyr yn darparu gwasanaethau o werth sydd yn adlewyrchu anghenion y cyhoedd.

O edrych ar y criw sydd yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ni allaf beidio meddwl am ddisgrifiad Edward Lear o'r *jumbies*: er bod yr awyr yn dywyll a'r fordaith yn hir, ni allwch byth feddwl y buoch yn fyrbwyll nac anghywir, wrth ichi sbinio mewn gogor.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Os caiff gwelliant 1 ei basio, bydd gwelliant 2 yn methu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41.  
Amendment 1: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41.  
Amendment 2: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn



Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 6, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 52.  
 Amendment 3: For 6, Abstain 0, Against 52.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 German, Michael  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2118): O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41.  
 Motion (NDM2118): For 17, Abstain 0, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion defeated.*

**Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31: Diwygio Arfaethedig i Reoliadau'r  
 Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol)  
 (Cymru) 2004**

**Debate under Standing Order No. 31: Proposed Amendment of the National  
 Health Service (General Medical Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2004**

**David Melding:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 31.2, resolves to instruct the Assembly Minister for Health and Social Services to bring forward draft subordinate legislation made under sections 28R, 28S, 28V, 28W and 126(4) of the National Health Service Act 1977, and section 4(5) of the National Health Service and Community Care Act 1990, to amend regulation 2 (Interpretation) of and Schedule 2 (Additional Services) to the National Health Service (General Medical Services Contracts) (Wales) Regulations 2004 so as to include in the additional services which may be provided under a general medical services contract an annual health review for persons with learning disabilities. (NDM2083)*

This motion would modify the general medical services contract, the GP contract, to allow for an annual health review for people with learning disabilities. I will start with some of the evidence that can be used to back up this motion, the volume of which has increased dramatically over the last five or six years. That indicates that this is a strong option for consideration by those who want to see an improvement in health outcomes for people with learning disabilities. Some of the best work has been done in Wales, and we ought to be proud of that. I refer you to the snappily titled primary care, evaluation audit

**David Melding:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31.2, yn penderfynu cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gyflwyno is-ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft a wnaed o dan adrannau 28R, 28S, 28V, 28W a 126(4) o Ddeddf Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol 1977, ac adran 4(5) o Ddeddf Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol a Gofal Cymunedol 1990, i ddiwygio rheoliad 2 (Dehongli) ac Atodlen 2 (Gwasanaethau Ychwanegol) o Reoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Cymru) 2004 er mwyn cynnwys adolygiad iechyd blynyddol i bobl ag anableddau dysgu yn y gwasanaethau ychwanegol y gellir eu darparu o dan gontract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol. (NDM2083)*

Byddai'r cynnig hwn yn addasu'r contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol, y contract meddygon teulu, i ganiatáu adolygiad iechyd blynyddol i bobl ag anableddau dysgu. Dechreuaf gyda rhywfaint o'r dystiolaeth y gellir ei defnyddio i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Mae'r dystiolaeth wedi cynyddu'n ddramatig dros y pum neu chwe blynedd diwethaf. Mae hynny'n dangos bod hwn yn ddewis cryf i'w ystyried gan rai sydd am weld gwella canlyniadau iechyd i bobl ag anableddau dysgu. Mae peth o'r gwaith gorau wedi'i wneud yng Nghymru, a dylem fod yn falch o hynny. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr astudiaeth

and research in learning disabilities study—fortunately it has a pretty and short acronym, PEARL—which found that of the 181 people with learning disabilities that it tracked who received a health review, 93 had a new health need identified and 88 did not. New health needs were identified in over half the sample. The conditions identified included diabetes, hypertension, high cholesterol, thyroid disorders—which are particularly common among those with learning disabilities—dental problems, cardiac difficulties, asthma and mental health difficulties. That is a broad range of conditions, and it was also found that health promotion can be increased by annual health reviews.

4.30 p.m.

The PEARL study then audited the outcome for those people for whom a health need was identified. The researchers returned after nine months, examined the 93 people who had had a health problem identified and found that the health needs of 45 per cent of them had been addressed. The new health difficulties of 20 per cent of them had been addressed partially, and 35 per cent had either not had the problem addressed at all, or it had not been addressed by treatment. Therefore, even if we have annual health reviews, it does not necessarily transform the system into a perfect one, but it does start the process by which we can improve health gains for people with learning disabilities.

The study also emphasises how much training is needed among primary healthcare teams to ensure that they provide a service that people with learning disabilities can expect as of right. They are part of the general population and on the lists of various practitioners, and they should receive the same standard of care that you and I expect as of right. The Disability Rights Commission has also looked at this matter, and it has identified clear evidence of early death among people with learning disabilities. Different studies have come up with different rates, but there is some consensus that the rate of preventable early death is around four times higher for people

â'r teitl bachog gofal sylfaenol, archwiliad gwerthuso ac ymchwil i anableddau dysgu—yn ffodus mae ganddi fyrfodd Saesneg del a byr, PEARL—a ganfu, wrth ddilyn hynt 181 o bobl ag anableddau dysgu a gafodd adolygiad iechyd, fod angen iechyd newydd wedi'i nodi yn achos 93 ohonynt, ac nid yn achos yr 88 arall. Nodwyd anghenion iechyd newydd ym mwy na hanner y sampl. Yr oedd y cyflyrau a nodwyd yn cynnwys diabetes, gorbwysedd, colestrol uchel, anhwylderau ar y thyroid—sydd yn arbennig o gyffredin ymysg pobl ag anableddau dysgu—problemau deintiol, problemau'n ymwneud â'r galon, asthma ac anawsterau iechyd meddwl. Dyna amrediad eang o gyflyrau, a chafwyd hefyd y gellir hybu iechyd yn well drwy adolygiadau iechyd blynyddol.

Wedyn archwiliodd astudiaeth PEARL y canlyniad i'r bobl hynny y canfuwyd bod ganddynt anghenion iechyd. Aeth yr ymchwilyr yn ôl ymhen naw mis, archwilio'r 93 o bobl a nodwyd fel rhai â phroblem iechyd, a chanfod fod anghenion iechyd 45 y cant ohonynt wedi'u diwallu. Yr oedd anawsterau iechyd newydd 20 y cant ohonynt wedi'u diwallu'n rhannol, ac yr oedd 35 y cant un ai heb gael sylw i'r broblem o gwbl neu wedi cael triniaeth oedd heb ei gwella. Felly, hyd yn oed os cawn ni adolygiadau iechyd blynyddol, nid yw o reidrydd yn trawsnewid y system i fod yn un berffaith, ond mae'n cychwyn y broses lle gallwn wella datblygiadau iechyd i bobl ag anableddau dysgu.

Mae'r astudiaeth yn pwysleisio hefyd gymaint o hyfforddiant sydd ei angen ymysg timau iechyd sylfaenol i sicrhau y darparant wasanaeth y gall pobl ag anableddau dysgu ei ddisgwyl fel hawl. Maent yn rhan o'r boblogaeth gyffredinol ac ar restr gwahanol ymarferwyr, a dylent gael yr un safon o ofal ag y disgwyliwch chi a fi fel hawl. Mae'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd wedi edrych ar y mater hwn hefyd, ac wedi nodi tystiolaeth glir o farwolaeth gynnar ymhlith pobl ag anableddau dysgu. Nodwyd gwahanol gyfraddau gan wahanol astudiaethau, ond mae lled gonsensws fod cyfradd marwolaethau cynnar y galleid eu hatal oddeutu bedair gwaith yn uwch ymhlith pobl

with a learning disability than for the general population. That is a colossal figure and should cause us great concern. The health evidence bulletins for Wales list a range of illnesses that have a higher incidence among people with a learning disability. There is extensive clinical literature to demonstrate the effectiveness of regular health reviews. I cannot put it better than the Disability Rights Commission, which stated that the research evidence is compelling.

So much for the hard clinical evidence: what about the human side? I feel strongly about this issue because, for nearly 10 years, I shared a house with a lady who had learning disabilities. She was the daughter of my landlady. I became close friends with this lady, who died in early middle age. She was only 40 years old when she suffered a fatal heart attack. I do not know whether her health would have been improved by more effective control in the primary healthcare sector. All I do know is that she received special services. If she had health problems, she would usually go to the Heath hospital, and her dental treatment had to be done in the dental hospital rather than at a local dentist's surgery. That raises issues.

**Brian Gibbons:** You have made a compelling case that there is unidentified illness among people with learning disabilities. However, I do not think that you have made the case for an annual check-up. Clearly, many conditions, once diagnosed, will only need to be picked up once. A single examination at a particular time in an individual's life could be equally efficacious, and probably more efficient, as long as one has a good follow-up system to ensure that the 30 per cent who were not treated properly were given follow-up care.

**David Melding:** I will come to the issue of whether a regular review, as opposed to an annual one, is acceptable. A rational case can be made for that, and I am quite happy to discuss that. However, at present, the fact that 35 per cent of those for whom health needs were identified had not received effective treatment nine months later indicates that an annual system would perhaps be best. That is an arguable point, but it would be

ag anabledd dysgu nag ymhlith y boblogaeth gyffredinol. Dyna ffigur aruthrol, a dylai beri pryder mawr inni. Mae bwletinau tystiolaeth iechyd Cymru'n rhestru amrediad o afiechydon sydd yn fwy cyffredin ymhlith pobl ag anabledd dysgu. Mae toreth o lenyddiaeth glinigol yn cadarnhau effeithiolrwydd adolygiadau iechyd rheolaidd. Ni allaf ei ddweud yn well na'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, a ddywedodd fod tystiolaeth yr ymchwil yn ddiymwad.

Dyna'r dystiolaeth glinigol galed felly: beth am yr ochr ddynol? Teimlaf yn gryf ynghylch y mater hwn oherwydd, am 10 mlynedd bron, rhennais dŷ gyda merch ag anableddau dysgu. Merch fy llandedi oedd hi. Deuthum yn ffrindiau agos gyda'r fenyw hon, a fu farw'n gynnar yng nghanol oed. Dim ond 40 mlwydd oed oedd hi pan ddiodeffodd drawiad anghuol ar y galon. Ni wn a fuasai ei hiechyd wedi'i wella gan reolaeth fwy effeithiol yn y sector gofal iechyd sylfaenol. Y cyfan a wn i yw iddi dderbyn gwasanaethau arbennig. Pe bai ganddi broblemau iechyd, âi fel arfer i ysbyty'r Waun, ac yr oedd rhaid i'w thriniaeth ddeintyddol ddigwydd yn yr ysbyty deintyddol yn hytrach na mewn deintyddfa leol. Mae hynny'n codi cwestiynau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydych wedi cyflwyno achos grymus fod afiechyd heb ei ganfod ymhlith pobl ag anableddau dysgu. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn meddwl eich bod wedi dadlau'r achos dros archwiliad blynyddol. Yn amlwg, dim ond un waith y bydd angen canfod sawl cyflwr, unwaith y caiff ei ddiagnosisio. Gallai un archwiliad ar adeg benodol yn oes unigolyn fod yr un mor effeithiol, ac yn fwy effeithlon, mae'n debyg, cyhyd â bod system ddilyniant dda ar gael i sicrhau bod y 30 y cant na chafodd driniaeth briodol yn cael gofal dilynol.

**David Melding:** Deuaf at y cwestiwn a yw adolygiad rheolaidd, yn hytrach nag un blynyddol, yn dderbyniol. Gellir dadlau'n rhesymol dros hynny, ac yr wyf yn ddigon hapus i'w drafod. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ffaith bod 35 y cant o'r rhai y canfuwyd fod ganddynt anghenion iechyd heb gael triniaeth effeithiol naw mis yn ddiweddarach yn awgrymu efallai mai system flynyddol fyddai orau. Gellir dadlau

inappropriate to implement infrequent checks of every five years or so. You may want to argue for regular checks every two to three years, but that would be a much better service than is being received at the moment.

In another case, a woman called Mary became tired and less active, so much so that she had to give up much of her voluntary work, which she found uplifting and meaningful, to sleep most afternoons. Her general practitioner told her that, as she was getting older—she was in her 50s—she should expect to have less energy. Blood tests were taken and did not identify a problem, but her symptoms grew considerably worse, and she lost considerable weight and lost her appetite. Mary then had an unexpected period—she was well past the menopause—and her GP became concerned and referred her to a gynaecologist. These tests indicated advanced cancer, which had already spread to the liver. Mary had extensive treatment, including a hysterectomy, but, unfortunately, died 18 months later. I do not know if this case would have been prevented by a regular check-up; that is another matter, but it is more likely to have been if the primary healthcare service was attuned to meeting the needs of people with a learning disability.

To give another example, Simon was distressed, and his parents knew that he was in pain, but, because of his condition, he was unable to communicate that effectively. They took him to the GP who said, ‘That is just the way they are sometimes, just take him home.’ Luckily, Simon’s dentist found the problem.

After returning home from hospital after an operation, David’s mother, who is a single parent, contacted her GP to ask for some follow-up support and was shocked to hear her GP say that he did not work with ‘these people’. That is the type of problem that must be rooted out.

Fortunately there is much excellent practice in Wales, and, more positively, we can turn to our strong tradition in this regard, perhaps going back to 1983 and the all-Wales mental handicap strategy, which has been updated. That has set a benchmark for best practice in

am y pwynt hwnnw, ond amhriodol fyddai cael archwiliadau anfynych bob rhyw bum mlynedd. Efallai y byddwch chi eisiau dadlau dros archwiliadau rheolaidd bob dwy i dair blynedd, ond byddai hynny’n wasanaeth llawer gwell na’r hyn a gynnigir ar hyn o bryd.

Mewn achos arall, aeth menyw o’r enw Mary yn flinedig a llai egniol, yn gymaint felly nes yr oedd rhaid iddi roi’r gorau i lawer o’i gwaith gwirfoddol, rhywbeth a oedd yn fodd i godi’i chalon ac a ystyrodd yn werthfawr, i gysgu bron bob prynhawn. Dywedodd ei meddyg teulu wrthi y dylai ddisgwyl bod yn llai egniol, a hithau’n heneiddio—yr oedd hi yn ei 50au. Cymerwyd profion gwaed ac ni chanfuwyd problem, ond gwaethygodd ei symptomau’n ddifrifol, a cholodd bwysau sylweddol a’i chwant bwyd. Wedyn cafodd Mary fislif annisgwyl—yr oedd wedi hen basio’r newid bywyd—ac aeth ei meddyg teulu i bryderu ac fe’i cyfeiriodd at gynecolegydd. Dangosodd y profion hyn fod ganddi ganser datblygedig, a oedd eisoes wedi ymledu i’r afu. Cafodd Mary driniaeth helaeth, gan gynnwys hysterectomi, ond, yn anffodus, bu farw 18 mis yn ddiweddarach. Ni wn a fuasid wedi atal hyn drwy archwiliad rheolaidd; mater arall yw hynny, ond buasai hynny’n fwy tebygol pe bai’r gwasanaeth gofal iechyd sylfaenol wedi’i drefnu i gwrdd ag anghenion pobl ag anableddau dysgu.

A rhoi enghraifft arall, yr oedd Simon yn dioddef, a gwyddai ei rieni ei fod mewn poen, ond, oherwydd ei gyflwr, nid oedd yn gallu cyfleu hynny’n effeithiol. Aethant ag ef at y meddyg teulu a ddywedodd, ‘Fel yna y maent weithiau, ewch ag ef adref.’ Yn ffodus, daeth deintydd Simon o hyd i’r problem.

Ar ôl dychwelyd adref o’r ysbyty wedi llawdriniaeth, cysylltodd mam David, sydd yn rhiant sengl, â’i meddyg teulu i ofyn am gefnogaeth ddilynol a chafodd ei dychryn o glywed ei meddyg teulu’n dweud na fyddai’n gweithio gyda’r ‘bobl hyn’. Dyna’r math o broblem y mae’n rhaid ei gwaredu.

Yn ffodus, gwneir llawer o waith rhagorol yng Nghymru, ac, yn fwy cadarnhaol, gallwn droi at ein traddodiad cryf yn hyn o beth, gan fynd yn ôl efallai i 1983 at y strategaeth anfantais feddyliol i Gymru gyfan, sydd wedi’i diweddarau. Gosododd hynny feincnod

Europe. We have much to build on, and this has been adopted by all parties as a priority. The all-Wales strategy's three principal themes, namely the right of people with a learning disability to have an ordinary pattern of life within the community, to be treated as an individual, and to have additional help and support in developing their maximum potential, still inform our policy today, which shows an excellent consensus approach. Those are appropriate aims.

'Fulfilling the Promises' is trying to take this thinking into the twenty-first century. It is a good document, and the Government has been solid in its response so far. It sets ambitious targets, however, and we will not get there by magic; we will only get there by sustained commitment. One of these targets is to improve the health of people with learning disabilities and to reduce any differences between the rates of illness and mortality that they experience and the overall national rates by 2010. The report states that:

'Each individual should have regular health checks'—

it says 'regular', Brian—

'carried out by their Primary Healthcare Team.'

Therefore, I believe that the evidence is clear that we should have a system of regular health checks. The British Medical Association accepts that, which is why it tried to get regular health reviews into the new general medical services contract via enhanced services, but the UK Government did not commit to that—which is not a reflection on the Assembly Government. The best route would be to include this as an additional service, to make it comprehensive. Enhanced services can mean people with a learning disability being sent to another practice, specialising in care for people with learning disabilities, to receive that service. We want every GP practice across Wales to have this expertise so that they can treat members of their population properly.

ar gyfer yr arfer gorau yn Ewrop. Mae gennym lawer i adeiladu arno, ac mae hyn wedi'i fabwysiadu gan bob plaid fel blaenoriaeth. Mae tair prif thema'r strategaeth i Gymru gyfan, sef hawl pobl ag anabledd dysgu i gael patrwm bywyd cyffredin yn y gymuned, i gael eu trin fel unigolion, ac i gael cymorth a chefnogaeth ychwanegol i ddatblygu eu potensial i'r eithaf, yn dal i hysbysu ein polisi heddiw, sy'n dangos consensws rhagorol. Mae'r rhain yn amcanion priodol.

Mae 'Gwireddu'r Addewidion' yn ceisio dod â'r meddylfryd hwn i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae'n ddogfen dda, a bu'r Llywodraeth yn gadarn yn ei hymateb hyd yma. Mae'n gosod targedau uchelgeisiol, fodd bynnag, ac ni chânt eu cyflawni ar amrantiad; dim ond drwy ymroddiad parhaus y cyrhaeddwn y nod. Un o'r targedau hyn yw gwella iechyd pobl ag anableddau dysgu a lleihau unrhyw wahaniaethau rhwng eu cyfraddau salwch a marwolaeth hwy a'r cyfraddau cenedlaethol cyffredinol erbyn 2010. Dywed yr adroddiad:

'Dylai pob unigolyn gael archwiliadau iechyd rheolaidd'—

mae'n dweud 'rheolaidd', Brian—

'wedi'u cyflawni gan eu Tîm Gofal Iechyd Sylfaenol.'

Felly, credaf fod y dystiolaeth yn glir o blaid cael system o archwiliadau iechyd rheolaidd. Mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yn derbyn hynny, a dyna pam y ceisiodd gynnwys adolygiadau iechyd rheolaidd yn y contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol newydd drwy broses gwella gwasanaethau, ond nid ymrwymodd Llywodraeth y DU i hynny—ffaith nad yw'n feirniadaeth ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Y ffordd orau fyddai cynnwys hyn fel gwasanaeth ychwanegol, i'w wneud yn gynhwysfawr. Gall gwell gwasanaethau olygu anfon pobl ag anabledd dysgu at bractis arall, sydd yn arbenigo mewn gofal i bobl ag anableddau dysgu, i gael y gwasanaeth hwnnw. Yr ydym am i bractis pob meddyg teulu ledled Cymru gael yr arbenigedd hwn fel y gall roi triniaeth briodol i'w gleifion.

I realise that the BMA does not favour a change in the UK contract at this stage, but now that we have devolution and these powers have been devolved to us, why are we not prepared to use them? We may not want to rush and say, 'We will do it from April'; we may want to set a target of making them effective from 2006 or 2007, but the principle is that we should have the right to amend the GMS contract if there is an overwhelming case and if we want to demonstrate best practice in a particular area to the rest of Britain. However, I emphasise that it is the outcome that is important and that the process is secondary to that. I am prepared to listen with an open mind to what the Minister has to say, and I hope that she will respond effectively.

Finally, I commend the work of Mencap. If Members have not yet read its 'Treat me right!' report, it covers all the issues. We should now follow up and do something constructive for these people.

4.40 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I support this motion and am grateful to David Melding for proposing it.

It was my privilege to attend a conference in September organised by All Wales People First, which, as Members will be aware, is an organisation of, and led by, people with learning disabilities. The theme of this year's conference was health and healthcare, building into the Mencap campaign that David Melding mentioned. I was shocked by some of the experiences of the healthcare system that some of those people related to me. There was a huge issue about lack of information and information not being available in a way that people with learning disabilities could understand. There was also a range of communication issues—some related to people's individual conditions and impairments, but some simply related to staff not understanding their needs. I am sorry to say that some, and, fortunately, this was a minority, had experienced the kind of dismissive attitudes to health needs that David Melding outlined. I am afraid that some people reported downright

Sylweddolaf nad yw'r BMA o blaid newid yng nghontract y DU ar hyn o bryd, ond gan fod gennym ddatganoli a'r pwerau datganoledig hyn, pam nad ydym yn barod i'w defnyddio? Hwyrach nad oes arnom eisiau rhuthro a dweud, 'Gwnawn hyn o fis Ebrill'; efallai y dymunwn osod targed i ddod â hwy i rym o 2006 neu 2007, ond yr egwyddor yw y dylem gael yr hawl i ddiwygio contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol pe bai achos anorchfygol a phe baem am ddangos yr arfer gorau mewn maes arbennig i weddill Prydain. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf mai'r canlyniad sydd yn bwysig a bod y broses yn eilradd i hynny. Yr wyf yn barod i wrando â meddwl agored ar yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud, a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff hi ymateb yn effeithiol.

Yn olaf, cymeradwyaf waith Mencap. Os nad yw Aelodau eto wedi darllen ei adroddiad 'Gofalwch amdanaf!', mae hwnnw'n ymdrin â'r pynciau i gyd. Dylem weithredu ar hynny a gwneud rhywbeth adeiladol dros y bobl hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cefnogaf y cynnig hwn ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David Melding am ei gynnig.

Braint i mi oedd mynychu cynhadledd ym Medi a drefnwyd gan Bobl yn Gyntaf Cymru Gyfan, sydd, fel y gwyr Aelodau, yn gorff o bobl ag anableddau dysgu dan arweiniad pobl ag anableddau dysgu. Thema cynhadledd eleni oedd iechyd a gofal iechyd, sy'n cydfynd â'r ymgyrch gan Mencap a grybwyllodd David Melding. Cefais fy syfrdanu gan rai o'r profiadau o'r system gofal iechyd y soniodd rhai o'r bobl hynny amdanynt. Yr oedd problem enfawr gyda diffyg gwybodaeth a gwybodaeth heb fod ar gael mewn ffordd y gallai pobl ag anableddau dysgu ei deall. Yr oedd amrediad o faterion cyfathrebu hefyd—rhai yn gysylltiedig â chyflwr a namau pobl unigol, ac eraill yn ymwneud yn syml â methiant staff i ddeall eu hanghenion. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud bod rhai, ac, yn ffodus, lleiafrif oedd hyn, wedi profi'r math o agweddau wfftiol at anghenion iechyd a amlinellodd David Melding. Mae arnaf ofn i rai pobl sôn am gamwahaniaethu noeth gan weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol na welai eu



discrimination from healthcare professionals who did not see their needs as valid, partly because they could not express them easily or as effectively as others of us may be able to do so.

A range of actions were identified in that conference, all of which I believe the Welsh Assembly Government should, and will, act on. There was an issue of training staff in communications skills. From my experience as a special educational needs teacher, if you can improve your communication with people with learning disabilities, you usually improve your overall communication. Therefore, there will be benefits for others in the community if the health professions can learn to communicate more effectively with people with learning disabilities, particularly when it comes to listening skills and understanding what people are trying to get across.

Therefore, there are staff training issues. There is a need for better health information and for information to be available in more varied formats. There is a need to support people with learning disabilities, training and coaching them to help them express their own needs; some people will need health advocates to go with them to help them communicate with professionals.

A legal right to an annual health check could provide a useful spur to get some of that change in place. It may be possible, for example, for some general practitioner practices to specialise in this area of work, if that is what they chose to do. That may be a cost-effective way of ensuring that the needs of people in a large community were met. In more isolated rural areas all GP practices would, hopefully, need to be prepared to participate in providing these annual healthcare checks.

It was clear at this conference that people have a right to a healthier lifestyle. It is not just about addressing your ill-health—all sorts of wider issues were raised. However, this motion would at least ensure that the kinds of conditions that David Melding mentioned were picked up before they became chronic. I hope that the Government will be prepared to consider giving people

hanghenion fel rhai dilys, yn rhannol am nad oeddent yn gallu eu mynegi mor rhwydd neu mor effeithiol ag y gall eraill ohonom.

Nodwyd amrediad o gamau gweithredu yn y gynhadledd honno, pob un ohonynt yn rhai y credaf y dylai, ac y gwnaiff, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithredu arnynt. Soniwyd bod angen hyfforddi staff er mwyn gwella sgiliau cyfathrebu. O'm profiad i fel athrawes anghenion addysgol arbennig, os gallwch wella'r modd y cyfathrebwch gyda phobl ag anableddau dysgu, byddwch fel arfer yn gwella eich cyfathrebu cyffredinol. Felly, daw manteision i eraill yn y gymuned os gall y proffesiynau iechyd ddysgu cyfathrebu'n fwy effeithiol gyda phobl ag anableddau dysgu, yn enwedig o safbwynt sgiliau gwranddo a deall beth y mae pobl yn ceisio'i gyfleu.

Felly, mae'n amlwg bod angen hyfforddi staff. Mae angen gwell gwybodaeth iechyd ac i wybodaeth fod ar gael mewn amrywiaeth ehangach o fformatiau. Mae angen cefnogi pobl ag anableddau dysgu, a'u hyfforddi a'u hannog i'w helpu i fynegi eu hanghenion eu hunain; bydd ar rai pobl angen eiriolwyr iechyd i fynd gyda hwy i'w helpu i gyfathrebu â gweithwyr proffesiynol.

Gallai hawl cyfreithiol i gael archwiliad iechyd blynyddol roi hwb buddiol i ysgogi rhywfaint o'r newid hwnnw. Gall fod yn bosibl, er enghraifft, i ambell bractis arbenigo yn y maes gwaith hwn, os mai dyna y dymunant ei wneud. Gall hynny fod yn ffordd gost-effeithiol o sicrhau y diwellir anghenion pobl mewn cymuned fawr. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig mwy diarffordd byddai angen paratoi pob practis, gobeithio, i gyfranogi yn y gwaith o ddarparu'r archwiliadau iechyd blynyddol hyn.

Fe'i gwnaed yn glir yn y gynhadledd hon fod gan bobl hawl i fywyd iachach. Nid mater o drin eich afiechyd yn unig mohono—codwyd pob math o gwestiynau ehangach. Fodd bynnag, byddai'r cynnig hwn o leiaf yn sicrhau y câi'r math o gyflyrau y soniodd David Melding amdanynt eu trin cyn iddynt fynd yn gronig. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn barod i ystyried rhoi hawl

with learning disabilities a statutory right. It should be a statutory right because we need to take a rights-based approach to the needs of people with learning disabilities in all kinds of areas of access to public services. I too, like David Melding, will listen to what the Minister has to say. I do not believe that anyone would doubt her personal commitment but, again as David Melding said, we need serious action. People with serious health needs cannot wait to have rights.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Welsh Conservative Party will, of course, support David's legislation. On a personal note, I thank him for bringing such a worthwhile piece of legislation before the Assembly. Yet again, it demonstrates the value of Assembly Members being able to bring forward this sort of backbench legislation, which can allow the Assembly to instruct the Minister to bring forward something of such tremendous benefit. There is no doubt in my mind and, I suspect, in the minds of most Members, that there would be a tremendous benefit if this were passed this afternoon, and if the Minister brought forward subordinate legislation to achieve the type of annual check-ups that David referred to in his opening remarks. People with learning disabilities are often left on the margins of society and sidelined, perhaps deliberately in some cases but not in others. They are easily forgotten.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I have no difficulties with the principles of this motion. However, one of the practical difficulties that I have is that the motion refers only to persons with learning disabilities. I assume that you are referring to those with a certain degree of disability. I am dyslexic, for example, and I would be grateful if you could clarify that point. There are many people such as myself who have no difficulty in accessing healthcare.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am sure that David Melding, in his closing speech, will be able to outline exactly who this legislation would affect.

**David Melding:** I refer Jeff Cuthbert to the cost-benefit analysis, which takes the

statudol i bobl ag anableddau dysgu. Dylai fod yn hawl statudol oherwydd mae angen inni edrych ar anghenion pobl ag anableddau dysgu o safbwynt hawliau mewn nifer o gyd-destunau yn ymwneud â mynediad at wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Gwrandawaf finau, fel David Melding, ar yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud. Ni chredaf y byddai neb yn amau ei hymroddiad personol ond, eto fel y dywedodd David Melding, mae angen gweithredu o ddifrif. Ni all pobl ag anghenion iechyd difrifol aros i gael hawliau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Bydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, wrth gwrs, yn cefnogi deddfwriaeth David. Ar nodyn personol, diolchaf iddo am ddod â darn o ddeddfwriaeth mor werthfawr gerbron y Cynulliad. Dengys y cynnig hwn mor werthfawr yw caniatáu i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddwyn y math hwn o ddeddfwriaeth mainc gefn gerbron, a, thrwy hynny, ganiatáu i'r Cynulliad gyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog i gyflwyno rhywbeth fydd yn hynod o fuddiol. Nid oes amheuaeth yn fy meddwl i nac, dybiaf fi, ym meddyliau'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau, y deuai budd aruthrol pe câi hyn ei basio y prynhawn yma, a phe bai'r Gweinidog yn cyflwyno is-ddeddfwriaeth i sicrhau'r math o archwiliadau blynyddol y cyfeiriodd David atynt yn ei sylwadau agoriadol. Yn aml, caiff pobl ag anableddau dysgu eu gadael ar ymylon cymdeithas a'u gwthio o'r neilltu, efallai'n fwiadol mewn rhai achosion ond nid felly mewn eraill. Mae'n hawdd anghofio amdanant.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw anawsterau gydag egwyddorion y cynnig hwn. Fodd bynnag, un o'r anawsterau ymarferol sydd gennyf yw bod y cynnig ddim ond yn cyfeirio at bobl ag anableddau dysgu. Tybiaf eich bod yn cyfeirio at rai gyda rhyw radd arbennig o anabledd. Yr wyf fi'n ddyslecsig, er enghraifft, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech egluro'r pwynt hwnnw. Mae llawer o bobl fel fi na chaiff unrhyw anhawster wrth geisio gofal iechyd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd David Melding, yn ei araith gloi, yn gallu amlinellu pwy yn union y byddai'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn effeithio arnynt.

**David Melding:** Cyfeiriaf Jeff Cuthbert at y dadansoddiad o gost a budd, sy'n defnyddio'r

definition as the accepted definition of people with extensive learning disabilities, of which there are currently 12,800 in Wales.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful to my colleague for helping me, and I hope that it provides the clarification that the Member sought.

There is no doubt that people with learning disabilities face huge challenges and particular health problems, which include not only physical problems, as David alluded to, but mental health problems. The annual check-ups, treating people with dignity and respect and promoting equality in this way would demonstrate that work is being carried out in the Assembly to achieve a laudable aim, and it would demonstrate some of the more positive aspects of devolution to the people of Wales. David referred to anecdotal evidence in terms of the early deaths of those with learning disabilities—that must spur us on to at least find a solution to some of these problems. The case for this legislation is overwhelming. I hope that the Labour Government, which clearly has a majority in the Chamber, will find it in its heart to support this legislation. This is something on which all Members can agree. It is not difficult or tricky. It could be added to the additional services that GPs provide. We can all agree on this, and I hope that we can all set aside our party-political differences on this occasion in order to support a worthwhile piece of legislation.

**Peter Law:** This is an important debate that should not be politicised. I cannot vote for the motion, but I sympathise with it and I thank David Melding for tabling it for us to discuss. It is important because our friends with learning disabilities are our fellow human beings. They deserve a quality of life, and we should be striving to make it as equal to what we as able-bodied people enjoy as soon as possible. As David Melding highlighted, the current situation has gone on for far too long. We can argue about these issues, but I hope that the Minister will be able to accommodate this eventually, because I believe that that has been in her mind during the discussions that she has had with David Melding. I pay tribute to Mencap,

diffiniad safonol o bobl ag anableddau dysgu helaeth, y mae 12,800 ohonynt ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelod am fy helpu, a gobeithiaf fod hynny'n rhoi'r eglurhad y gofynnodd yr Aelod amdano.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw pobl ag anableddau dysgu'n wynebu her enfawr a phroblemau iechyd arbennig, sydd yn cynnwys nid yn unig broblemau corfforol, fel y crybwyllodd David, ond problemau iechyd blynyddol, trin pobl ag urddas a pharch a hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb yn y modd hwn yn dangos bod ymdrech yn cael ei wneud yn y Cynulliad i gyflawni nod clodwiw, a byddai'n dangos rhai o agweddau mwy cadarnhaol datganoli i bobl Cymru. Cyfeiriodd David at dystiolaeth anecdotaidd yn ymwneud â marwolaethau cynnar pobl ag anableddau dysgu—rhaid i hynny ein symbylu ni i ganfod ateb o leiaf i rai o'r problemau hyn. Mae'r achos dros y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn llethol. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth Lafur, sydd yn amlwg â mwyafrif yn y Siambr, yn teimlo yn ei chalon y gall gefnogi'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Dyma rywbeth y gall pob Aelod gytuno arno. Gellid ei ychwanegu at y gwasanaethau ychwanegol a ddarpara meddygon teulu. Gallwn i gyd gytuno ar hyn, a gobeithiaf y gallwn i gyd roi ein gwahaniaethau pleidiol o'r neilltu am y tro er mwyn cefnogi darn gwerthfawr o ddeddfwriaeth.

**Peter Law:** Dadl bwysig yw hon ac ni ddylid dod â gwleidyddiaeth plaid i mewn iddi. Ni allaf bleidleisio dros y cynnig, ond yr wyf yn deall pam y'i cyflwynwyd a diolchaf i David Melding am ei gyflwyno i ni ei drafod. Mae'n bwysig oherwydd mai cyd-fodau dynol i ni yw ein cyfeillion ag anableddau dysgu. Maent yn haeddu ansawdd bywyd, a dylem ymdrechu i'w wneud yn gydradd â'r hyn a fwynhawn ni bobl abl o gorff cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Fel yr amlygodd David Melding, mae'r sefyllfa bresennol wedi parhau am lawer rhy hir. Gallwn ddadlau am y materion hyn, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu gwneud lle i hyn maes o law, oherwydd credaf fod hynny wedi bod ar ei meddwl yn ystod y trafodaethau a gafodd

which is a fine organisation, other support organisations and the Gateway clubs throughout Wales. A Gateway club in my constituency celebrated its sixteenth anniversary two weeks ago, and a wonderful party was held.

Those with profound learning disabilities are special people. The Mencap report is a service to them that I warmly welcome. It tells it as it is. No matter how much we like to think that everything is perfect—

**David Lloyd:** You used glowing terms to describe the report. Why, therefore, can you not vote for David Melding's motion?

**Peter Law:** That is what I meant when I referred to politicising this issue. It is unfortunate that you had to bring that into the situation. I understand that there are difficulties with the GP contract, which you should know better than anyone. It has just been signed, and it could be difficult to get the annual examinations in place. We must work on that and see whether there are ways around it. I believe that my friend, the Minister, is sympathetic in terms looking towards that, from what I have heard.

When you look at the Mencap document, you will see the difficulties that learning disability patients face daily. This has gone on for too long, which is why I agree with conducting a regular review. Regardless of whether the review is conducted annually or otherwise, the situation must be better than it is now. The 'Fulfilling the Promises' strategy with its target of 2010 would be a wonderful step forward. However, we must move faster if learning disability patients are to have the quality of life that we all believe they should have.

4.50 p.m.

Page 17 of Mencap's report highlights patients' experience of healthcare. Some felt that doctors were polite, but, apart from 'Hello' and 'Have a seat', they did not understand another word. After being in intensive care for a few weeks, another patient was lonely and was glad to go home. Another patient had wanted to ask the doctor more questions but was not given enough

gyda David Melding. Talaf deyrnged i Mencap, sydd yn gorff clodwiw, cyrff cefnogi eraill a'r clybiau Gateway ledled Cymru. Dathlodd clwb Gateway yn f'etholaeth i ei unfed pen-blwydd ar bymtheg bythefnos yn ôl, a chafwyd parti bendigedig.

Pobl arbennig yw'r rheini ag anableddau dysgu dwys. Mae adroddiad Mencap yn wasanaeth iddynt a groesawaf yn wresog. Mae'n ei dweud hi fel y mae. Dim ots faint yr hoffwn feddwl bod popeth yn berffaith—

**David Lloyd:** Yr ydych wedi canmol yr adroddiad i'r cymylau. Pam, felly, na allwch chi bleidleisio dros gynnig David Melding?

**Peter Law:** Dyna beth a olygwn pan soniais am ddod â gwleidyddiaeth i mewn i'r mater. Mae'n anffodus fod yn rhaid ichi ddod â hynny i mewn i'r sefyllfa. Deallaf fod anawsterau gyda'r contract meddygon teulu, fel y dylech chi wybod yn well na neb. Mae newydd ei lofnodi, a gallai fod yn anodd sefydlu'r archwiliadau blynyddol. Rhaid inni weithio ar hynny a gweld a oes ffyrdd eraill o'i chwmpas. Credaf fod fy nghyfaill, y Gweinidog, yn gefnogol o ran edrych tuag at hynny, o'r hyn a glywais.

Pan edrychwch ar ddogfen Mencap, fe welwch yr anawsterau sy'n wynebu cleifion ag anableddau dysgu bob dydd. Mae hyn wedi mynd ymlaen yn rhy hir, a dyna pam y cytunaf fod angen cynnal adolygiad rheolaidd. Boed yr adolygiad yn digwydd yn flynyddol neu beidio, rhaid i'r sefyllfa fod yn well nag ydyw ar hyn o bryd. Byddai strategaeth 'Gwireddu'r Addewidion' a'i tharged o 2010 yn gam bendigedig ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni symud yn gynt os yw cleifion ag anableddau dysgu i gael yr ansawdd bywyd yr ydym i gyd yn credu y dylent ei gael.

Mae tudalen 17 yn adroddiad Mencap yn amlygu profiad cleifion o ofal iechyd. Teimlai rhai fod meddygon yn gwrtais, ond, ar wahân i 'Helo' ac 'Eisteddwch', ni wnaethant ddeall gair arall. Ar ôl bod mewn gofal dwys am ychydig wythnosau, yr oedd claf arall yn unig ac yn falch o fynd adref. Yr oedd claf arall wedi bod eisiau holi ychwaneg ar y meddyg ond heb gael digon o amser.

time. There are many difficulties to be tackled.

Helen Mary referred to the need for specialist training to deal with patients with learning disabilities. The report also makes this point. I acknowledge that this has resource implications. I do not blame NHS staff, because they are overworked. We need to increase resources where possible to enable staff to ensure that learning disability patients are valued.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you agree that accepting this proposition of approximately one review per three or four months would only add to the burden on GPs?

**Peter Law:** You are probably right, but I do not consider that to be a great burden because it is outweighed by the needs of these good people, who are our fellow human beings and who are important. We should all view them as important people. I hope that the Minister eventually finds an accommodation. She has demonstrated on many occasions that she is committed to giving the best quality of life to learning disability patients.

David referred to the short life expectancy of learning disability patients and to the fact that they are three times more likely to die from respiratory disease and are more likely to die before the age of 50. The Assembly needs to take account of these severe statistics. We cannot brush the subject to one side simply because we have had a debate on it today and say that we will debate it again in a year's time. It is too important a subject to do that.

I support the principle, in the hope that we can get an accommodation in order to improve the quality of life of people with learning disabilities. These people are valued members of our communities, and we must continue to focus on their needs so that they eventually have the improved quality of life to which they should now be able to look forward.

**William Graham:** I endorse this important motion that my colleague has brought forward. My first point follows on from Dr

Mae llawer o anawsterau i'w datrys.

Cyfeiriodd Helen Mary at yr angen am hyfforddiant arbenigol i ddelio â chleifion ag anableddau dysgu. Mae'r adroddiad yn gwneud y pwynt hwn hefyd. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod goblygiadau adnoddau i hyn. Nid wyf yn beio staff y GIG, gan fod ganddynt hwy ormod o waith. Mae angen inni gynyddu adnoddau lle bo modd i alluogi staff i sicrhau y rhoddir gwerth ar gleifion ag anableddau dysgu.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych yn cytuno mai dim ond ychwanegu at y baich ar feddygon teulu y byddai derbyn y cynnig hwn o gael oddeutu un adolygiad bob tri i bedwar mis?

**Peter Law:** Mae'n debyg eich bod yn iawn, ond nid wyf o'r farn fod hwnnw'n faich mawr oherwydd fe'i gwrthbwsysir gan anghenion y bobl dda hyn, sydd yn gyd-fodau dynol i ni ac sydd yn bwysig. Dylem i gyd edrych arnynt fel pobl bwysig. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ganfod ateb maes o law. Mae wedi dangos ar sawl achlysur fod ganddi ymroddiad i roi'r ansawdd bywyd gorau i gleifion ag anableddau dysgu.

Cyfeiriodd David at ddisgwyliad oes byr cleifion ag anableddau dysgu ac at y ffaith eu bod dair gwaith yn fwy tebygol o farw o glefyd anadlol ac yn fwy tebygol o farw cyn cyrraedd 50 mlwydd oed. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad ystyried yr ystadegau difrifol hyn. Ni allwn ysgubo'r pwnc o'r neilltu dim ond am ein bod wedi cael dadl arno heddiw gan ddweud y cawn ddadl arall arno ymhen blwyddyn. Mae'n bwnc rhy bwysig i wneud hynny.

Cefnogaf yr egwyddor, yn y gobaiht y gallwn gael hyd i ateb er mwyn gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl ag anableddau dysgu. Mae'r bobl hyn yn aelodau gwerthfawr o'n cymunedau, a rhaid inni ddal i ganolbwyntio ar eu hanghenion fel y cânt, maes o law, y gwell ansawdd bywyd y dylent yn awr allu edrych ymlaen ato.

**William Graham:** Ategef y cynnig pwysig hwn a gyflwynwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod. Mae fy mhwynt cyntaf yn dilyn oddi ar gyfraniad

Gibbons's contribution. I would argue in favour of the annual health review. We are dealing with people who are probably insufficiently articulate to be able to communicate on one occasion, or occasions, from time to time. However, an annual review would mean that serious diseases that may well form part of their background could be identified and treated.

In terms of the hope that reviews would lead to better health, this, in turn, should promote better education. We are dealing with a sector of society that used to be dismissed as remedial. That is like saying that people without legs or arms could have some form of remedy. Good health promotes attendance and assists concentration. It is important to view this subject in the round. I commend the actions of Monmouthshire local education authority, under the control of successive political parties. It has recognised headteachers' contributions, particularly the headteacher of Monmouth Comprehensive School. The school has been outstanding in its sympathy towards, and treatment of, people with Asperger's syndrome. To reiterate one of David's previous remarks, we must ensure that good practice remains commonplace.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Liberal Democrat group is pleased to support the measures proposed by David Melding. As a leading campaigner in this field, he has often said in the Chamber that the measure of a civilised society is the way in which it treats its most vulnerable citizens. Too often, as a society, we have been found wanting. We have an opportunity today not to be found wanting. Having a learning disability does not mean that people should have poorer health or poorer healthcare services. As Mencap's work has shown, the experience of many people in Wales with a learning disability is that this is too often the case. Members should be aware that all parties undertook a promise for the people of Wales who have a learning disability, and our 'Fulfilling the Promises' document referred to the need to improve services in this way. David is correct to point to a better-than-average track record in this field. The all-Wales strategy was groundbreaking and is a model that many other countries have followed. That was a

Dr Gibbons. Dadleuwn o blaid yr adolygiad iechyd blynyddol. Yr ydym yn delio â phobl nad ydynt, mae'n debyg, yn ddigon llafar i allu cyfathrebu ar un achlysur, neu achlysuron, o dro i dro. Fodd bynnag, byddai adolygiad blynyddol yn golygu y byddai modd canfod a thrin afiechydon difrifol a allai ffurfio rhan o'u cefndir.

O ran y gobaith y byddai adolygiadau'n arwain at well iechyd, dylai hyn, yn ei dro, hyrwyddo gwell addysg. Yr ydym yn delio â sector yn y gymdeithas a arferai gael eu diystyru fel pobl adfer. Mae hynny fel dweud y gallai pobl heb goesau neu freichiau gael rhyw ffurf ar adferiad. Mae iechyd da'n hyrwyddo presenoldeb ac yn cynorthwyo canolbwyntio. Mae'n bwysig gweld y pwnc hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Cymeradwyaf yr hyn a wnaeth awdurdod addysg lleol sir Fynwy, dan reolaeth un blaid wleidyddol ar ôl y llall. Mae wedi cydnabod cyfraniadau prifathrawon, yn enwedig prifathro Ysgol Gyfun Trefynwy. Bu'r ysgol yn eithriadol yn ei chefnogaeth i bobl â syndrom Asperger a'r modd y mae'n eu trin. I ailadrodd un o sylwadau blaenorol David, rhaid inni sicrhau bod arferion da'n parhau'n gyffredin.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn falch o gefnogi'r camau a gynigir gan David Melding. Fel ymgyrchydd blaenllaw yn y maes hwn, mae wedi dweud sawl gwaith yn y Siambr hon mai mesur cymdeithas wâr yw'r modd y trinia ei dinasyddion gwannaf. Yn rhy aml, fel cymdeithas, fe'n cafwyd yn brin. Mae gennym gyfle heddiw i beidio â chael ein cael yn brin. Nid yw bod ag anabledd dysgu yn golygu y dylai pobl gael iechyd gwaeth neu wasanaethau gofal iechyd o safon is. Fel y dangosodd gwaith Mencap, ym mhrofiad llawer o bobl yng Nghymru ag anabledd dysgu, felly y mae yn rhy aml. Dylai Aelodau fod yn ymwybodol bod pob plaid wedi gwneud addewid ar ran pobl Cymru sydd ag anabledd dysgu, a chyfeiriodd ein dogfen 'Gwireddu'r Addewidion' at yr angen i wella gwasanaethau fel hyn. Mae David yn gywir i bwyntio at record well na'r cyffredin yn y maes hwn. Torrodd strategaeth Cymru gyfan dir newydd ac mae'n fodel a ddilynwyd gan sawl gwlad arall. Yr oedd hynny amser maith

long time ago. The 'Fulfilling the Promises' document has a long way to go to develop the situation. As another Member has already said, the Minister's personal commitment in this field is not in doubt. One only has to look at the steps that the Minister has taken to end the longest waiting list, which is the issue of long-stay hospitals for patients with a learning disability.

The measure before us today is eminently sensible. It is one for which we have the power to develop in the National Assembly for Wales, and one for which we have had the support of patients with a learning disability and their carers, throughout Wales. I received a fax message from a constituent yesterday that said:

'I believe that there will be a debate this week on this measure. My son has a heart condition, as well as a learning disability. Therefore, an annual check would be most beneficial to him. Inevitably, at some point, he will have to try to look after himself after I have gone. The idea of a structured plan to see him regularly is ideal.'

The issue facing many patients with a learning disability is the lack of understanding of their needs by professionals, and the failure to understand that medical and health problems are independent of a learning disability. As Helen Mary pointed out, there is a lack of appropriate training and skills to enable individual practitioners to treat patients and communicate with them. David also referred to the Mencap document 'Treat me right!'. Of all the case-studies in this document, the most deserving one—in my view—is Andrew's case. Andrew lives in one of Wales's largest cities, has a severe and profound learning disability and is also autistic with little speech. Andrew's parents took him to a large hospital for a check-up. They had telephoned the hospital first to explain that their son did not like small spaces. On arrival, they were asked to wait in a small room, and Andrew became upset at having to stay in this room. Therefore, doctors injected him to calm him in preparation for further examination. Andrew fell asleep and was sent home. It cannot be right, as we have said, for any patient in a

yn ôl. Mae ffordd bell i fynd gan y ddogfen 'Gwireddu'r Addewidion' i ddatblygu'r sefyllfa. Fel y dywedodd Aelod arall eisoes, nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn ag ymroddiad personol y Gweinidog yn y maes hwn. Nid oes ond rhaid edrych ar y camau a gymerwyd gan y Gweinidog i roi terfyn ar y rhestr aros hwyaf, sef cwestiwn ysbytai arhosiad hir i gleifion ag anabledd dysgu.

Mae'r mesur ger ein bron heddiw'n amlwg yn un call. Mae'n un y mae gennym y grym i'w ddatblygu yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ac yn un lle cawsom gefnogaeth cleifion ag anabledd dysgu a'u gofawyr, ledled Cymru. Cefais neges ffacs ddod oddi wrth etholwr, a ddywedodd:

Credaf y bydd dadl yr wythnos hon ar y mesur hwn. Mae gan fy mab gyflwr ar y galon, yn ogystal ag anabledd dysgu. Felly, byddai archwiliad blynyddol yn fuddiol dros ben iddo. Yn anochel, ar ryw bwynt, bydd yn rhaid iddo geisio gofalu amdano'i hun wedi i mi fynd. Mae'r syniad o gynllun strwythuredig i'w weld yn rheolaidd yn ddefnyddol.

Yr anhawster sy'n wynebu llawer o gleifion ag anabledd dysgu yw'r diffyg dealltwriaeth o'u hanghenion gan y bobl broffesiynol, a'r methiant i ddeall bod problemau meddygol a iechyd yn annibynnol ar anabledd dysgu. Fel y nododd Helen Mary, mae diffyg hyfforddiant a sgiliau priodol a fyddai'n galluogi ymarferwyr unigol i drin cleifion a chyfathrebu gyda hwy. Cyfeiriodd David hefyd at ddogfen Mencap 'Gofalwch amdanaf!'. O'r holl astudiaethau achos yn y ddogfen hon, y fwyaf haeddiannol—yn fy ngolwg i—yw achos Andrew. Mae Andrew'n byw yn un o ddinasoedd mwyaf Cymru, mae ganddo anabledd dysgu difrifol a dwys ac mae hefyd yn awtistig heb fawr o leferydd. Aeth rhieni Andrew ag ef i ysbyty mawr am archwiliad. Yr oeddent wedi ffonio'r ysbyty yn gyntaf i egluro nad oedd eu mab yn hoffi llefydd bychain. Ar ôl cyrraedd, gofynnwyd iddynt aros mewn ystafell fach, a chynhyrfodd Andrew o orfod aros yn yr ystafell hon. Felly, rhoddodd meddygon bigiad iddo i'w dawelu cyn yr archwiliad pellach. Aeth Andrew i gysgu a chafodd ei anfon adref. Ni all fod yn iawn, fel yr ydym

civilized society to be treated in this way. We all have an opportunity today, despite some of the difficulties and practicalities of timing, to make a difference. We often have esoteric debates in this Chamber about what we can and cannot do, and about the need for more or fewer powers. Here is a power that we have, and can use to overturn the many years of neglect in this area.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** We have heard of the difficulty with changing the GP contract, so I will not go into that in any detail. I have concerns about the use of the term ‘annual’, not because it is the ability to check someone regularly, but because it is also the ability to lose someone. Anyone with a learning disability could, and probably does, require more than one check per year. Therefore, I am loath to proscribe a checking regime.

5.00 p.m.

My other concerns centre—in many ways like David Melding’s—on personal experience. I am not an expert in this field but I spent five years working for a company which works with adults with severe learning disabilities, and I learnt a lot. We can become too arrogant and assume that we know what is best for other people. We can sometimes assume, because we are experts in our fields or particularly good at what we do, that the rest of the world should fit in with us. Sometimes, that is completely wrong. The lessons I learnt were that looking, listening and allowing time were probably the most key of the skills that we sadly lack in our professional lives. Anyone with a learning disability, whether it is mild or severe—and I understand Jeff’s point that it is difficult to try to categorise everyone within one group, because the degrees of difficulty can be so extremely different—is entitled to be treated with dignity and respect. As Peter said, we are talking about individuals who deserve to be treated decently. That involves additional training and time. My concern is that that should not only happen in healthcare.

wedi dweud, i unrhyw glaf mewn cymdeithas wâr gael ei drin fel hyn. Mae gennym i gyd gyfle heddiw, er gwaethaf rhai o’r anawsterau a materion ymarferol yr amseriad, i wneud gwahaniaeth. Yn aml, cawn drafodaethau esoterig yn y Siambr hon am yr hyn y gallwn ac na allwn ei wneud, ac am yr angen am fwy neu lai o bwerau. Dyma bŵer sydd gennym, ac y gallwn ei ddefnyddio i wrth-droi’r blynyddoedd lawer o esgeulustod yn y maes hwn.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Yr ydym wedi clywed am yr anhawster gyda newid contract y meddygon teulu, felly nid af i drafod hynny’n fanwl. Mae gennyf bryderon ynghylch defnyddio’r term ‘blynyddol’, nid oherwydd y gallu i archwilio rhywun yn rheolaidd, ond hefyd oherwydd y gallu i golli rhywun. Gallai unrhyw un ag anabledd dysgu fod angen mwy nag un archwiliad y flwyddyn, ac mae’n debyg fod angen. Felly, yr wyf yn anfodlon i wrthod y syniad o drefn archwilio.

Mae fy mhryderon eraill yn seiliedig—fel rhai David Melding mewn sawl ffordd—ar brofiad personol. Nid wyf yn arbenigwraig yn y maes hwn ond treuliais bum mlynedd yn gweithio i gwmni sydd yn gweithio gydag oedolion ag anableddau dysgu difrifol, a dysgais lawer. Gallwn fynd yn rhy drahaus a thybio ein bod ni’n gwybod beth sydd orau i bobl eraill. Weithiau gallwn dybio, am ein bod yn arbenigwyr yn ein meysydd neu’n arbennig o dda yn yr hyn a wnawn, y dylai gweddill y byd ffitio i mewn gyda ni. Weithiau, mae hynny’n gwbl anghywir. Y gwersi a ddysgais i oedd mai gwylio, gwrando a chaniatáu amser oedd y mwyaf allweddol, mae’n debyg, o’r sgiliau sydd yn absennol yn ein bywydau proffesiynol. Mae gan unrhyw un ag anabledd dysgu, boed ysgafn neu ddifrifol—a deallaf bwynt Jeff ei bod yn anodd ceisio categoreiddio pobl o fewn un grŵp, gan y gall y graddau o anhawster fod mor gwbl wahanol—yr hawl i gael ei drin ag urddas a pharch. Fel y dywedodd Peter, yr ydym yn sôn am unigolion sydd yn haeddu cael triniaeth deg. Mae hynny’n golygu mwy o hyfforddiant ac amser. Fy mhryder i yw nad dim ond mewn gofal iechyd y dylai hynny ddigwydd.



In a primary care setting, GPs must be allowed more time to spend with their patients, to review drug regimes and discuss those with their patient, and they must be allowed to review the impacts of the health intervention on their patient. In secondary care, in hospital trusts, the individual needs of people with learning disabilities must be taken into account. Mencap referred to the case of a young man who did not want to be in an enclosed space, found it traumatic and needed treatment to calm him down. We have heard examples of people requiring access to specialist services, such as regular reviews and dental check-ups. My concern is that access does not only involve primary or secondary medical care, but that it is part of a whole-life care plan. People with a learning disability, whether severe or mild, can be affected in other areas of their lives, such as in housing and social inclusion, and that will also have an impact on them.

Whenever they are accompanied, it is frequently assumed that the patient or client wants their parent or family with them. It may be that they want to be accompanied by someone completely independent. They may not want to discuss personal issues in front of their immediate family, but they may not be given that option. Why are we not giving them a choice?

My other concern is that, on occasion, where people are vulnerable, they need protecting from the outside world. Many of the adults that I worked with had gone through unfortunate circumstances in their early lives. Their cases manifested in perhaps a different way, not just pure physical illness. I ask that we look at the whole care plan, and not prescribe simply to one-year assessments. It is a question of looking, being careful and spending a considerable amount of time listening.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn llongyfarch David Melding am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn—sydd yn fath o Fesur Aelod preifat. Mae'n ymwneud â phwnc eithriadol o bwysig. Mae David, a nifer o gyfranwyr eraill, wedi dadlau'r achos o'i blaid—nid oes rhaid mynd yn ôl dros y dystiolaeth; mae'n

Mewn sefyllfa gofal sylfaenol, rhaid caniatáu mwy o amser i feddygon teulu ei dreulio gyda'u cleifion, i adolygu trefniadau cyffuriau a'u trafod gyda'u claf, a rhaid caniatáu iddynt adolygu effaith yr ymyriad iechyd ar eu claf. Mewn gofal eilaidd, mewn ymddiriedolaethau ysbytai, rhaid ystyried anghenion unigol pobl ag anableddau dysgu. Cyfeiriodd Mencap at achos dyn ifanc nad oedd eisiau bod mewn lle cyfyng, a gafodd fod hynny'n drawmatig ac a fu angen triniaeth i'w dawelu. Yr ydym wedi clywed enghreifftiau o bobl ag angen mynediad at wasanaethau arbenigol, fel adolygiadau rheolaidd ac archwiliadau deintyddol. Fy mhryder i yw mai nid dim ond mater i ofal meddygol sylfaenol ac eilaidd yw hyn, ond ei fod yn rhan o gynllun gofal bywyd cyfan. Gall pobl ag anabledd dysgu, boed ddifrifol neu ysgafn, gael anawsterau mewn rhannau eraill o'u bywydau, fel tai a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol, a bydd hynny'n effeithio arnynt hefyd.

Pryd bynnag y bydd ganddynt gwmni wrth weld meddyg, tybir yn aml y bydd ar y claf neu'r cleient eisiau eu rhiant neu deulu gyda hwy. Efallai yr hoffent gael rhywun cwbl annibynnol yn gwmni iddynt. Efallai na fyddai arnynt eisiau trafod materion personol gerbron y teulu agos, ond efallai na roddir y dewis hwnnw iddynt. Pam nad ydym yn rhoi dewis iddynt?

Fy mhryder arall yw bod angen weithiau, lle bo pobl yn fregus, eu gwarchod rhag y byd y tu allan. Yr oedd llawer o'r oedolion y gweithiwn i gyda hwy wedi byw drwy amgylchiadau anffodus yn eu bywydau cynnar. Yr oedd eu hachosion wedi dod i'r amlwg mewn ffordd wahanol efallai na salwch corfforol yn unig. Gofynnaf ar inni edrych ar y cynllun gofal cyfan, ac nid argymell asesiad blynyddol yn unig. Mater ydyw o edrych, bod yn ofalus a threulio cryn dipyn o amser yn gwrando.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I congratulate David Melding on tabling this motion—which is a kind of private Member's Bill. It focuses on a highly important subject. David has argued the case for it, as have a number of other contributors—there is no need to review the evidence; it is simple enough. Unfortunately,

ddigon syml. Yn anffodus, mae pobl sydd ag anabledd ac anghenion arbennig yn fwy tebygol o ddirodded afiechyd a marw yn ifanc oherwydd nad ydynt yn cael y math o wasanaeth sydd ei angen arnynt gan y gwasanaeth iechyd. Byddai awgrym David yn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny i raddau helaeth. Byddai'n sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu gweld yn gyson gan feddyg teulu—bob blwyddyn neu ddwy flynedd. Golyga hynny y byddai'r meddyg teulu yn gallu rhagweld rhai o'r problemau hyn cyn iddynt ddatblygu.

Atgoffaf y Cynulliad, a rhai o aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, y daeth grŵp o bobl a oedd wedi colli aelodau o'u teuluoedd o ganlyniad i epilepsi i'r pwyllgor beth amser yn ôl i sôn am eu problemau. Yr oedd y bobl hynny yn dweud wrthym fod gan bobl ag anghenion arbennig lai o obaith i gael eu trin am epilepsi ac i gael diagnosis am y cyflwr. Mae hynny'n dweud y cyfan am yr angen.

Nid ydym yn sôn am wasanaeth ychwanegol, dymunol y gallem ei gynnig. Yr ydym yn sôn am wasanaeth sylfaenol ac am hawl sylfaenol y bobl hyn i dderbyn y gwasanaeth hwnnw. Mae'n drist, felly, ein bod yn trafod manion yn ymwneud â sut y gellid gweithredu. Yn anffodus, mae'n ymddangos i mi, o wrando ar rai cyfraniadau, ein bod yn chwilio am esgusodion dros beidio â gweithredu yn y mater hwn. Mae hwn yn hawl sylfaenol, a dylem fanteisio ar y cyfle i'w gynnig.

Gwnaed cyfeiriad at y ffaith bod y ddadl hon yn dod o ryw gyfeiriad gwleidyddol penodol—nid wyf yn deall pam. A yw'r ffaith mai David Melding sydd wedi cyflwyno'r mater hwn ger ein bron, a'i fod yn digwydd bod yn Aelod Ceidwadol—yr wyf yn cael trafferth credu hynny weithiau; mae'n ddyn o gydwbybod gymdeithasol, ac ar adegau nid wyf yn siŵr pam ei fod yn aelod o'r Blaid Geidwadol—o reidrwydd yn gwneud y mater hwn yn fater gwleidyddol? Ni fu gwleidyddiaeth yn rhan o'r ddadl hon. Mae'r hyn y mae David yn ei gynnig yn gyson â phopeth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio'i gyflawni ym maes iechyd. Felly, byddwn yn gobeithio y gallai pawb gytuno ar y mesurau hyn.

people who have disabilities and special needs are more likely to suffer diseases and die prematurely because they do not receive the kind of service that they require from the health service. David's suggestion would, to a great extent, tackle those problems. It would ensure that patients are seen frequently by a GP—annually or every two years. That would mean that the GP would be able to foresee some of the problems before they developed.

I remind the Assembly, and some members of the Health and Social Services Committee, that a group of people who had lost family members as a result of epilepsy came to committee some time ago to talk about their problems. They told us that people with special needs had less chance of being treated for epilepsy and of being diagnosed with the condition. That says it all about the need in this area.

We are not talking about providing an additional, desirable service. We are talking about a fundamental service and about the fundamental right of these people to receive that service. It is sad, therefore, that we are discussing minor points about how action could be taken. Unfortunately, having listened to some contributions, it seems to me as if we are looking for excuses not to take action on this issue. This is a fundamental right, and we should take advantage of this opportunity to provide it.

Reference has been made to the fact that this debate derived a particular political direction—I do not understand why. Does the fact that this has been raised by David Melding, who happens to be a Conservative Member—I find that difficult to believe at times; he has a social conscience, and sometimes I am not sure why he is a member of the Conservative Party—mean that it necessarily has to be a political issue? Politics has not played any part in this debate. What David is proposing is consistent with all that the Government is trying to achieve in terms of health. Therefore, I would hope that we could all agree on these measures.

Y peth olaf yr wyf am ei ddweud yw bod y gallu gennym. Nid oes problemau cytundebol yn bodoli. Mae'n gwbl bosibl cyflwyno hyn yn rhan o gytundebau meddygon teulu. Os ydych yn dweud bod problemau cytundebol yn bodoli, yr ydych yn chwilio am esgusodion. Mae'n gwbl bosibl ac ymarferol i weithredu ar y mater hwn.

Os ydym yn credu bod hwn yn hawl sylfaenol, sy'n gyson â'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ceisio'i gyflawni ym maes iechyd a darpariaeth iechyd, ac os ydym yn credu y bydd yn cynnig gwasanaeth sylfaenol, hanfodol i'r bobl hyn, sy'n ymwneud â'u hawliau sylfaenol, ac os yw'r pwerau gennym, sut y gallwn beidio â gweithredu? Sut y gallwn ni gyfiawnhau peidio â gweithredu? Mae gennym gyfle i wneud rhywbeth a fydd yn rhoi hawl sylfaenol i bobl. Mae rhai Aelodau wedi cyfeirio at rai achosion a geir yn nogfen Mencap, 'Gofalwch amdanaf!'. Y mae merch o'r enw Angela yn dweud yn y ddogfen honno ei bod yn cofio'r profiad o fynd at y meddyg teulu, lle'r oedd y meddyg yn dweud 'Helo' wrthi, ac yn dweud wrthi eistedd, ac yna'n ei thrafod gyda'i chwaer. Nid oedd yn trafod gyda hi; nid oedd yn bodoli yn y sefyllfa honno. Mae hawliau sylfaenol yn rhan o'r mater hwn, a dylem ymateb i hynny.

Mae hwn yn gyfle i ymateb. Fel David Melding, nid oes gennyf fawr o ddiddordeb yn y broses; pa ffordd bynnag yr ewch ati i weithredu, Weinidog, os ydych yn gweithredu, cewch gefnogaeth unfrydol y Siambr.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am grateful for the opportunity to respond to the debate on this important issue, which David has brought forward under Standing Order No. 31. I fully support the principle which lies behind the motion. This issue needs to be tackled, as David and colleagues from across the Assembly have identified.

5.10 p.m.

The proposal in the motion is to introduce a new, additional service via an amendment to the GMS contract regulations. As Members

The last point that I would make is that we have the ability to do this. There are no contractual problems. It is entirely possible to introduce this as part of the general practitioner contract. If you claim that contractual problems exist, you are looking for excuses. It is entirely possible and practical to act on this matter.

If we believe that this is a fundamental right, which is in line with the Government of Wales's targets in relation to health and health provision, and if we believe that it will offer a crucial, fundamental service to these people, which relates to their fundamental rights, and if we have the power, how can we not take action? How can we justify not taking action? We have the opportunity to do something which will give people a fundamental right. Some Members have referred to cases highlighted in Mencap's 'Treat me right!' document. In that document, a girl called Angela recalls the experience of going to see her GP, who said 'Hello' and asked her to take a seat, before discussing her case with her sister. He did not discuss the case with her; she did not exist in that situation. Fundamental rights—to which we should respond—form part of this issue.

This is an opportunity to respond. Like David Melding, I am not interested in the process; whichever way you go about this, Minister, if you take action, you will have the unanimous support of the Chamber.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i ymateb i'r ddadl ar y mater pwysig hwn, y mae David wedi'i gyflwyno dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31. Cefnogaf yn llwyr yr egwyddor sydd y tu cefn i'r cynnig. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â hyn, fel y mae David a chyd-Aelodau ar draws y Cynulliad wedi nodi.

Yr hyn a gynigia'r cynnig yw y dylid cyflwyno gwasanaeth newydd, ychwanegol drwy welliant i reoliadau'r contractau

will be aware, we are required to consult with the British Medical Association on any amendments to these regulations. Unfortunately, informal discussion with the BMA suggests that the motion, as drafted, would not be acceptable to GPs. However, I have been looking at a number of mechanisms that I believe would achieve a similar end. I have been able to share some of these in outline with David, for which I am grateful. I believe that we will need to work with Mencap, the BMA and others to take this forward, taking full account of today's debate.

People with learning disabilities are entitled to access the same level and quality of services as anyone else. The Mencap report, 'Treat me right!' clearly illustrates how people with learning disabilities can be failed by the system. The report calls for people with learning disabilities to be provided with a health check every year, if they so wish. It is also much broader than that and calls for better training for health staff, longer appointments for people with learning disabilities, more accessible and appropriately produced information, health records to identify people with learning disabilities, doctors looking out for people with learning disabilities and inviting people with learning disabilities for special tests, for example, cancer screening. In order to provide a coherent response to these important recommendations in the Mencap report, we must also consider the report in the context of what the Assembly is already doing, as David acknowledged. As part of our responses to 'Fulfilling the Promises', the Assembly has issued guidance to authorities setting out the service principles and responses that should be adopted for people with a learning disability. That guidance was issued in August, and local action plans are due to be returned to the Assembly by the end of this month.

The guidance sets out service principles and responses for a whole range of life issues, including community living, employment, further education and day activities, as Tamsin described, that are beyond health and social care. It also contains three specific

gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol. Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, mae'n ofynnol ar inni ymgynghori â Chymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ar unrhyw welliannau i'r rheoliadau hyn. Ysywaeth, awgryma trafodaeth anffurfiol gyda'r BMA na fyddai'r cynnig, fel y'i drafftwyd, yn dderbyniol gan feddygon teulu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi bod yn edrych ar nifer o fecanweithiau y credaf y byddent yn cyflawni amcan tebyg. Yr wyf wedi gallu rhannu rhai o'r rhain yn fras gyda David, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Credaf y bydd angen inni weithio gyda Mencap, y BMA ac eraill i fynd â hyn yn ei flaen, gan roi sylw llawn i ddadl heddiw.

Mae gan bobl ag anableddau dysgu hawl i'r un lefel ac ansawdd o wasanaethau â phawb arall. Mae adroddiad Mencap, 'Gofalwch amdanaf!' yn dangos yn glir sut y gall pobl ag anableddau dysgu gael eu siomi gan y system. Geilw'r adroddiad am ddarparu archwiliad iechyd i bobl ag anableddau dysgu bob blwyddyn, os dymunant hynny. Mae'n llawer mwy na hynny hefyd ac yn galw am well hyfforddiant i staff iechyd, apwyntiadau hirach i bobl ag anableddau dysgu, gwybodaeth haws ei chael a mwy priodol, cofnodion iechyd i nodi pobl ag anableddau dysgu, meddygon i gadw llygad am bobl ag anableddau dysgu a gwahodd pobl ag anableddau dysgu am brofion arbennig, er enghraifft, sgrinio am ganser. Er mwyn rhoi ymateb gydlynol i'r argymhellion hyn yn adroddiad Mencap, rhaid inni hefyd ystyried yr adroddiad yng nghyd-destun yr hyn y mae'r Cynulliad eisoes yn ei wneud, fel y cydnabu David. Fel rhan o'n hymatebion i 'Gwireddu'r Addewidion', mae'r Cynulliad wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau i awdurdodau yn amlinellu'r egwyddorion a'r ymatebion o ran gwasanaeth y dylid eu mabwysiadu ar gyfer pobl ag anabledd dysgu. Cyhoeddwyd y canllawiau hynny ym mis Awst, a disgwylir i gynlluniau gweithredu lleol gael eu dychwelyd i'r Cynulliad erbyn diwedd y mis hwn.

Mae'r canllawiau'n amlinellu egwyddorion ac ymatebion gwasanaeth ar gyfer amrediad cyfan o faterion bywyd, yn cynnwys byw yn y gymuned, cyflogaeth, addysg bellach a gweithgareddau dydd, fel a ddisgrifiodd Tamsin, sydd y tu hwnt i iechyd a gofal

sections on general health needs, individuals with complex health needs and people who present challenging behaviour. Our general health needs guidance states that people with a learning disability have an equal right of access to primary and secondary healthcare services and specialist health provision. It calls for a multi-disciplinary assessment, in accordance with the unified assessment process, to identify and plan for health and social care needs. The guidance also encourages local health boards to consider using GMS local enhanced services, and it suggests that an enhanced service would normally include a practice-based register and regular, audited formalised health checks. At present, authorities are in consultation with the voluntary sector and users and carers, they are undertaking local audits of their current arrangements against that guidance, and they will produce costed change action plans.

The learning disability implementation advisory group will provide me with advice on these local action plans before I make final decisions to award grant funding. We have already made available £7.4 million over three years to assist with the implementation of these plans, and I will report further on that when the plans have been received and considered.

**David Lloyd:** I do not know why we cannot work up a local enhanced service or an additional service. Under the new GP contract, there are dozens of different, additional services and local enhanced services that vary in different local health board areas. I cannot see the difficulty with adding one more to the raft that we already have. As Peter Law said, there are resource implications in conducting the annual health check properly, with regard to staff, training and so on. However, people with thyroid disease and so on are entitled to annual health checks and they have a local enhanced service. Why not the same for people with learning disabilities?

**Jane Hutt:** That is why the guidance has encouraged local health boards to look at the

cymdeithasol. Maent hefyd yn cynnwys tair adran benodol ar anghenion iechyd cyffredinol, unigolion ag anghenion iechyd cymhleth a phobl sydd yn ymddwyn yn heriol. Dywed ein canllawiau ar iechyd cyffredinol fod gan bobl ag anabledd dysgu hawl cydradd i gael gwasanaethau gofal iechyd sylfaenol ac eilaidd a darpariaeth iechyd arbenigol. Galwant am asesu aml-ddisgyblaeth, yn unol â'r broses asesu unedig, i ganfod a chynllunio ar gyfer anghenion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'r canllawiau hefyd yn annog byrddau iechyd lleol i ystyried defnyddio gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol gwell lleol, ac awgrymant y byddai gwasanaeth gwell fel rheol yn cynnwys cofrestr ar sail practis ac archwiliadau iechyd ffurfiol dan arolygaeth. Ar hyn o bryd, mae awdurdodau'n ymgynghori â'r sector gwirfoddol a defnyddwyr a gofalwyr, maent yn gwneud archwiliadau lleol o'u trefniadau cyfredol yn erbyn y canllawiau hynny, a byddant yn llunio cynlluniau gweithredu wedi'u costio ar gyfer newid.

Bydd y grŵp ymgynghorol ar weithredu ym maes anabledd dysgu'n rhoi cyngor imi ar y cynlluniau gweithredu lleol hyn cyn imi wneud penderfyniadau terfynol i roi grantiau. Yr ydym eisoes wedi darparu £7.4 miliwn dros dair blynedd i helpu gyda gweithredu'r cynlluniau hyn, a rhoddaf adroddiad pellach ar hynny pan fydd y cynlluniau wedi dod i law ac wedi cael eu hystyried.

**David Lloyd:** Ni wn pam na allwn ni drefnu rhoi gwasanaeth gwell yn lleol neu wasanaeth ychwanegol. Dan y contract meddygon teulu newydd, mae dwsinau o wahanol wasanaethau ychwanegol a gwasanaethau gwell lleol sy'n amrywio ymhlith y byrddau iechyd lleol. Ni allaf weld anhawster ychwanegu un yn rhagor at y pentwr sydd gennym yn barod. Fel y dywedodd Peter Law, mae goblygiadau adnoddau i wneud yr archwiliad iechyd blynyddol yn iawn, o ran staff, hyfforddi ac ati. Fodd bynnag, mae gan bobl â chlefyd ar y thyroid ac ati hawl i archwiliadau iechyd blynyddol a chânt hwy wasanaeth gwell lleol. Pam na roddir yr un peth i bobl ag anableddau dysgu?

**Jane Hutt:** Dyna pam y mae'r canllawiau wedi annog byrddau iechyd lleol i edrych ar y

opportunities for using local enhanced services, and we are awaiting the reports as a result of consultation and consideration of that guidance. To answer your points about the way forward to achieve these objectives, a great deal of work is ongoing to improve the services already provided to people with learning disabilities in Wales. David mentioned the PEARL project, and there is also the Assembly-funded Hearts and Minds health inequalities project in Wrexham. We must learn from the good practice that is developing across Wales. In Wrexham, the statutory and voluntary services work together to improve the provision of health screening in primary care. Helen Mary also mentioned the important point of health promotion. This is not just about illness screening—it is about access to health promotion, with regard to smoking cessation, physical activity promotion and dental care. Usefully, the PEARL project is now being funded by the Wales Office of Research and Development to look at the preferred frequency of health checks at two and three-yearly intervals for people with chronic conditions or severe communication difficulties.

As David said, a lot of good work is going on, exploring the best ways of providing health screening and checks, and this work has featured in the discussion this afternoon. As we pointed out, Mencap's 'Treat me right!' report concerns a lot more than health checks. The report focuses on the quality of routine medical services that patients with learning disabilities receive on a daily basis.

On the point that Dai raised, exploring the options to take this forward, this is the crucial point for the whole Assembly today. The best way to drive up the overall standard of primary care is to insert indicators in the GP quality framework. That framework concerns the delivery of all services by GPs, and it includes incentives for practices to provide quality care for patients with learning disabilities.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The motion that is

cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio gwasanaethau gwell lleol, ac yr ydym yn aros am yr adroddiadau yn sgîl yr ymgynghori a'r myfyrio ar y canllawiau hynny. I ateb eich pwyntiau ynghylch y ffordd ymlaen i gyflawni'r amcanion hyn, mae llawer iawn o waith ar y gweill i wella'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir eisoes i bobl ag anableddau dysgu yng Nghymru. Soniodd David am brosiect PEARL, a hefyd ceir y prosiect Calonnau a Meddyliau, a ariennir gan y Cynulliad, i ymdrin ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn Wrecsam. Rhaid inni ddysgu oddi wrth yr arferion da sydd yn datblygu ledled Cymru. Yn Wrecsam, mae'r gwasanaethau statudol a gwirfoddol yn cydweithio i wella darpariaeth sgrinio iechyd mewn gofal sylfaenol. Soniodd Helen Mary hefyd am bwynt pwysig hybu iechyd. Nid mater o sgrinio am salwch yn unig yw hyn—mae a wnelo â derbyn negeseuon hybu iechyd, o safbwynt atal ysmegu, hyrwyddo gweithgaredd corfforol a gofal deintyddol. Peth buddiol yw bod prosiect PEARL bellach yn cael ei ariannu gan Swyddfa Cymru ar gyfer Ymchwil a Datblygu i edrych ar y dewis amledd ar gyfer archwiliadau iechyd bob dwy a thair blynedd i bobl â chyflyrau cronig neu anawsterau cyfathrebu difrifol.

Fel y dywedodd David, mae llawer o waith da'n digwydd, gan ymchwilio i'r ffyrdd gorau o ddarparu archwiliadau a sgrinio iechyd, a rhoddwyd sylw i'r gwaith hwn yn y drafodaeth y prynhawn yma. Fel y dywedasom, mae adroddiad Mencap 'Gofalwch amdanaf!' yn ymwneud â llawer mwy nag archwiliadau iechyd. Mae'r adroddiad yn canolbwyntio ar ansawdd y gwasanaethau meddygol rheolaidd a gaiff cleifion ag anableddau dysgu yn ddyddiol.

Ar y pwynt a gododd Dai, ymchwilio i'r dewisiadau ar gyfer mynd â hyn ymlaen, dyma'r pwynt allweddol i'r Cynulliad cyfan heddiw. Y ffordd orau i wella safon gyffredinol gofal sylfaenol yw gosod dangosyddion yn fframwaith ansawdd meddygon teulu. Mae'r fframwaith hwnnw'n ymwneud â darpariaeth pob gwasanaeth gan feddygon teulu, ac mae'n cynnwys cymhellion i bractisiau ddarparu gofal o ansawdd da i gleifion ag anableddau dysgu.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r cynnig sydd

before us directs you to bring forward legislation, but that legislation would be a matter for you. This motion only directs you to bring legislation forward; it does not tie your hands in any way. I cannot understand why you are not prepared to accept David's motion and move forward on that basis. We will support you if you need to negotiate or bring people on board, but there is no reason for you to reject this motion.

**Jane Hutt:** Do we want to achieve what is best for people with learning disabilities after considering the evidence, what has come through from 'Treat me right!' and 'Fulfilling the Promises', and the service guidance and principles? Any changes to the contract must be agreed with the BMA. I do not want to kick this into touch and enter negotiations that I know will not be successful. I want to achieve something as a result of the motion that David has put forward.

**Nick Bourne:** Will you give way?

**Jane Hutt:** I will continue, and explain how I want to achieve it. I propose that this should be considered as part of the forthcoming UK review of the quality and outcomes framework. We have already taken this up with the NHS confederation, which negotiates with the BMA on behalf of the four UK health departments. I have secured agreement in principle for this to happen, and that would mean that Wales would take the lead in securing this important review for people with learning disabilities. That is us taking the lead in Wales, thanks to David's initiative in putting this motion forward. It is more fundamental to have a UK review of the needs of people with learning disabilities of the quality and outcomes framework than to try to negotiate around the contract, which we know we will not deliver.

I cannot support the motion as drafted, but I believe that we can move forward as a result of this debate, with a more comprehensive approach to promoting and safeguarding the health of people with learning disabilities. I intend to ask the learning disability implementation advisory group for advice on whether we should give higher priority to health checks on an annual or on a regular

ger ein bron yn eich cyfarwyddo i ddod â deddfwriaeth ymlaen, ond mater i chi fyddai'r deddfwriaeth. Dim ond eich cyfarwyddo i ddod â deddfwriaeth ymlaen a wna'r cynnig hwn; nid yw'n clymu eich dwylo mewn unrhyw fodd. Ni allaf ddeall pam nad ydych yn barod i dderbyn cynnig David a symud ymlaen ar y sail honno. Fe'ch cefnogwn os bydd arnoch angen negodi neu ddod â phobl gyda ni, ond nid oes dim rheswm ichi wrthod y cynnig hwn.

**Jane Hutt:** A ydym am gyflawni'r hyn sydd orau i bobl ag anableddau dysgu ar ôl ystyried y dystiolaeth, yr hyn a ddaeth allan o 'Gofalwch amdanaf!' a 'Gwireddu'r Addewidion', a'r canllawiau a'r egwyddorion gwasanaeth? Rhaid i unrhyw newidiadau i'r contract gael eu cytuno gyda'r BMA. Nid oes arnaf eisiau cicio hyn dros yr ystlys a chychwyn trafodaethau y gwn na wnânt lwyddo. Yr wyf am gyflawni rhywbeth yn sgîl y cynnig y mae David wedi'i gyflwyno.

**Nick Bourne:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Jane Hutt:** Af yn fy mlaen, ac egluro sut yr hoffwn ei gyflawni. Cynigiau y dylid ystyried hyn fel rhan o'r adolygiad sydd i ddod ledled y DU ar y fframwaith ansawdd a chanlyniadau. Yr ydym eisoes wedi codi hyn gyda chydffederasiwn y GIG, a fydd yn negodi gyda'r BMA ar ran pedair adran iechyd y DU. Yr wyf wedi sicrhau cytundeb mewn egwyddor i hyn ddigwydd, a byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai Cymru'n arwain y ffordd o ran sicrhau'r adolygiad pwysig hwn i bobl ag anableddau dysgu. Dyna ni'n arwain yng Nghymru, diolch i weledigaeth David yn rhoi'r cynnig hwn gerbron. Mae'n fwy sylfaenol cael adolygiad yn y DU o anghenion pobl ag anableddau dysgu dan y fframwaith ansawdd a chanlyniadau na cheisio negodi o amgylch y contract, rhywbeth y gwn na wnawn ei sicrhau.

Ni allaf gefnogi'r cynnig fel y'i lluniwyd, ond credaf y gallwn symud ymlaen o ganlyniad i'r ddadl hon, gydag agwedd fwy cynhwysfawr at hybu a diogelu iechyd pobl ag anableddau dysgu. Bwriadaf ofyn i'r grŵp ymgynghorol ar weithredu ym maes anabledd dysgu am gyngor ynghylch a ddylem roi blaenoriaeth uwch i archwiliadau iechyd blynyddol neu reolaidd. Gwn fod David yn

basis. I know that David felt that we needed to look at that. This group includes Mencap, SCOVO and the All Wales Forum of Parents and Carers, and I propose to ask the UK quality and outcomes review group to consider the inclusion of new indicators in the framework to improve the quality of services.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Minister, you need to wind up.

**Jane Hutt:** This is my commitment to bring about a change to support people with learning disabilities, and I hope that this accommodation will give you that assurance. I will bring this back for a full Government debate in nine months time to report on my action.

**David Melding:** I thank everyone who has taken part in the debate. I only have three minutes to wind up, therefore I will not be able to respond to people individually. The general principle has been accepted. I accept that some elements need further work and definition, but people realise that we can take the lead and improve the situation comprehensively. That is what we should take away from this debate.

I accept what the Minister said about the need to negotiate with the BMA. I want to put my thanks to members of the BMA on record, because I discussed my initiative with them extensively. While they do not support the mechanism that I proposed, they are committed to this area of work and seeing some form of annual or regular review. It is important that they have put that on record in an exchange of correspondence with me.

5.20 p.m.

The fact that the BMA currently opposes this avenue is not an insuperable barrier, but it is a considerable factor, and we must take that into account as an Assembly. I have also listened carefully to what the Minister said, and I have been in discussions, as was intimated earlier. I do not want to dismiss the range of the Minister's suggestions; she has a track record in this area. For me, it is key and significant that, as well as the initiatives in terms of the framework and taking a lead on

teimlo bod angen inni edrych ar hynny. Mae'r grŵp hwn yn cynnwys Mencap, SCOVO a Fforwm Rhieni a Gofalwyr Cymru Gyfan, a bwriadaf ofyn i grŵp adolygu ansawdd a chanlyniadau'r DU ystyried cynnwys dangosyddion newydd yn y fframwaith i wella ansawdd gwasanaethau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Weinidog, mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Jane Hutt:** Dyma fy ymrwymiad i sicrhau newid i gefnogi pobl ag anableddau dysgu, a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y cytundeb hwn roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw ichi. Dof â hwn yn ôl i ddadl lawn yn amser y Llywodraeth ymhen naw mis i roi adroddiad ar yr hyn y byddaf wedi'i wneud.

**David Melding:** Diolch i bawb a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl. Dim ond tri munud sydd gennyf i ddirwyn i ben, felly ni fyddaf yn gallu ymateb i bobl yn unigol. Mae'r egwyddor gyffredinol wedi'i derbyn. Derbyniaf fod rhai elfennau'n galw am ragor o waith a diffinio, ond mae pobl yn sylweddoli y gallwn arwain y maes a gwella'r sefyllfa drwyddi draw. Dyna beth y dylem ei gymryd gyda ni o'r ddadl hon.

Derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am yr angen i negodi gyda'r BMA. Mae arnaf eisiau cael cofnodi fy niolch i aelodau'r BMA, oherwydd trafodais fy nghynllun gyda hwy'n helaeth. Er nad ydynt yn cefnogi'r mecanwaith a gynigiais, mae ganddynt ymroddiad i'r maes gwaith hwn ac i weld rhyw ffurf ar adolygiad blynyddol neu reolaidd. Mae'n bwysig eu bod wedi datgan hynny mewn gohebiaeth rhyngddynt â mi.

Nid yw'r ffaith bod y BMA yn gwrthwynebu'r cam hwn ar hyn o bryd yn rhwystr na ellir ei oresgyn, ond y mae'n ffactor sylweddol, a rhaid inni gymryd hynny i ystyriaeth fel Cynulliad. Yr wyf hefyd wedi gwrando'n ofalus ar yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog, a bùm mewn trafodaethau, fel a awgrymwyd yn gynharach. Nid oes arnaf eisiau wfftio amrediad awgrymiadau'r Gweinidog; mae ganddi record o waith ymarferol yn y maes hwn. I mi, mae'n



reviewing the needs of people with learning disabilities, the Government is prepared to bring back, within nine months, an amendable motion on these initiatives. To those Members who have loyally and forcefully supported me this afternoon, we have put down a stake in the ground, and if matters do not improve robustly—we are supposed to achieve equality by 2010, which is not too far away given that we are about to enter 2005—and we do not get a level of co-operation, we will still have this mechanism available to us. Most parties here would probably come back and say, ‘Well, if the avenue proposed by the Minister is not accepted, we would need to amend the GMS contract’. That is certainly a live issue, but given the package that the Minister has brought before us, I am prepared to give her a chance to see it work. I have tabled the motion, and it could go to a vote. I urge Members not to push it to a vote if they are so minded and to have another debate in nine months when, if the Government has not responded effectively, we can hold it to account. However, a united approach at this stage is the best way forward, and there is a good level of consensus on this, even if there is some disagreement on this particular mechanism. I seek, therefore, permission not to move to a vote, Deputy Presiding Officer.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Are you seeking permission to withdraw the motion?

**David Melding:** That is the consequence of what I have just said, I agree.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I want to be clear on the matter. Members will be aware that there is no clear provision in Standing Orders for Members to withdraw motions once they have been proposed. The Presiding Officer and I have previously had regard to the principle that, once a motion has been proposed, it is in the possession of the Assembly in Plenary as a whole, and must be disposed of in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.17. However, where there is universal consent that a motion should be withdrawn, we have been prepared to allow

allweddol ac yn arwyddocaol, ar ben y mentrau o ran y fframwaith a rhoi arweiniad ar adolygu anghenion pobl ag anableddau dysgu, fod y Llywodraeth yn barod i ddod yn ôl, o fewn naw mis, â chynnig diwygiadwy ar y mentrau hyn. I’r Aelodau hynny sydd wedi fy nghefnogi’n driw ac yn gadarn y prynhawn yma, yr ydym wedi gosod stanc yn y ddaear, ac os na fydd pethau’n gwella o ddifrif—yr ydym i fod i sicrhau cydraddoldeb erbyn 2010, nad yw’n rhy bell i ffwrdd o feddwl ein bod ar fin cyrraedd 2005—ac os na chawn lefel o gydweithrediad, bydd y mecanwaith hwn yn dal ar gael inni. Mae’n debyg y byddai’r rhan fwyaf o bleidiau yma’n dod yn ôl a dweud, ‘Wel, os na dderbynnir y camau a gynigir gan y Gweinidog, byddai angen inni ddiwygio’r contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol’. Mae hynny’n sicr yn fater byw, ond yn wyneb y pecyn a roddodd y Gweinidog ger ein bron, yr wyf yn barod i roi cyfle iddi ei weld yn gweithio. Yr wyf wedi rhoi’r cynnig gerbron, a gallai fynd i bleidlais. Anogaf Aelodau i beidio â’i wthio i bleidlais os teimlant felly, a chael dadl arall ymhen naw mis pryd y gallwn ddal y Llywodraeth i gyfrif os na fydd wedi ymateb yn effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, mynd ati’n unedig ar hyn o bryd yw’r ffordd orau ymlaen, ac mae lefel dda o gonsensws ar hyn, hyd yn oed os oes rhywfaint o anghytuno ynghylch y mecanwaith arbennig hwn. Felly, ceisiaf ganiatâd i beidio â symud i bleidlais, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A ydych chi’n ceisio caniatâd i dynnu’r cynnig yn ôl?

**David Melding:** Dyna ganlyniad yr hyn yr wyf newydd ei ddweud, cytunaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae arnaf eisiau bod yn glir ar y mater. Bydd Aelodau’n ymwybodol nad oes darpariaeth glir yn y Rheolau Sefydlog i Aelodau dynnu cynigion yn ôl unwaith y bônt wedi’u cynnig. Mae’r Llywydd a mi wedi glynu yn y gorffennol at yr egwyddor fod cynnig, unwaith y bydd wedi’i gynnig, yn eiddo i’r Cynulliad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn ei gyfarwydd, a rhaid ymdrin ag ef yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.17. Fodd bynnag, lle ceir cydsyniad cyffredinol y dylid tynnu cynnig yn ôl, yr ydym wedi bod yn fodlon caniatáu i hynny

that to happen. Therefore, does any Member object to the motion being withdrawn? I see that there are objections, and therefore call for a vote on NDM2083.

ddigwydd. Felly, a oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu tynnu'r cynnig yn ôl? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiadau, ac felly galwaf am bleidlais ar NDM2083.

*Cynnig (NDM2083): O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Motion (NDM2083): For 28, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion defeated.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â concludes business for this afternoon. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.23 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.23 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)

Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)