



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Iau 9 Tachwedd 2000

Thursday 9 November 2000

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 4 Ethol y Panel Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau ac Aelodau'r Pwyllgorau
Election of Members to the Panel of Committee Chairs and Assembly Committees
- 10 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sports and the Welsh Language
- 20 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig
Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs
- 28 Datganiad ar Adolygiad Carlile
Statement on the Carlile Review
- 32 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 38 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 39 Parhad o Astudiaeth Nantygwyddon
Continuation of the Nantygwyddon Investigation
- 40 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Cymru) 2000
Approval of the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Wales) Regulations 2000
- 50 Dadl ar Ddogfen Rhaglennu Sengl Amcan 2
Debate on the Objective 2 Single Programming Document
- 89 Dadl Fer: Cyfrifiad a Hunaniaeth
Short Debate: Census and Identity

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi caniatáu cynnig trefniadol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16 i ddod â chynigion heb ddyddiad trafod ger bron inni allu cynnal yr etholiadau i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc heddiw. Cyflwynwyd y cynigion fore ddoe a chawsant eu postio'n electronig o'r Uned Fusnes brynhawn ddoe. Yn dilyn ymgynghori â'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno a'm Hymgyngorwr Cyfreithiol, yr oeddwn yn fodlon fod y trefniadau hyn yn rhoi digon o amser i Aelodau ystyried y cynigion yn llawn.

Mae hyn wedi golygu bod staff Swyddfa'r Llywydd wedi gorfod gweithio oriau afresymol neithiwr i osod y cynigion ar y fewnrwyd ac ar we'r Siambr. Pwysleisiaf fod angen digon o amser ar Aelodau i ystyried cynigion fel hyn, ac anogaf eu bod yn cael eu cyflwyno mewn da bryd at y dyfodol.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

under Standing Order No. 6.16, the Assembly considers today a motion to elect Members to the panel of Chairs, a motion to elect Members to each of the seven Subject Committees, a motion to elect Members to each of the two other Committees, a motion to elect Members to the three Scrutiny Committees and a motion to elect Members to the House Committee.

The motions are set out on the Chamberweb, although it has been pointed out to me that there are two names missing from the list for the Local Government and Housing Committee. Those names will be added at the next Plenary. I apologise to Members for that omission and for any problems that have arisen over the election of committees and chairs. It has been a difficult logistical exercise, and I hope that in future it can be handled more smoothly.

Y Llywydd: A gaf arwydd bod cefnogaeth

The Presiding Officer: I have allowed a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.16 to bring forward no-named day motions to allow the elections to the Subject Committees to take place today. The motions were tabled yesterday morning and were electronically mailed from the Business Unit yesterday afternoon. Following consultation with the Table Office and my Legal Adviser, I was content that these arrangements gave Members adequate time to fully consider the motions.

This has meant that staff of the Office of the Presiding Officer had to work unreasonable hours last night to post motions to the intranet and the Chamberweb. I emphasise that Members need plenty of time to consider such motions, and I ask that they be laid in plenty of time for the future.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn ystyried heddiw gynnig i ethol Aelodau i'r panel Cadeiryddion, cynnig i ethol Aelodau i bob un o'r saith Pwyllgor Pwnc, cynnig i ethol Aelodau i bob un o'r ddau Bwyllgor arall, cynnig i ethol Aelodau i'r tri Pwyllgor Craffu a chynnig i ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgor Tŷ.

Gosodir y cynigion ar we'r Siambr, er y tynnwyd fy sylw at ddau enw sydd ar goll o'r rhestr ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Ychwanegir yr enwau hynny yn y Cyfarfod Llawn nesaf. Ymddiheuraf i'r Aelodau am yr hegoriad hwnnw ac am unrhyw broblemau sydd wedi codi ynglŷn ag ethol pwyllgorau a chadeiryddion. Bu'n ymarfer logistaidd anodd, a gobeithio yn y dyfodol y gellir ymdrin ag ef yn haws.

The Presiding Officer: Can I have an

inni symud ymlaen â'r cynnig trefniadol? Mae angen i 10 Aelod ddangos cefnogaeth. Gwelaf fod cefnogaeth, felly awn ymlaen â'r bleidlais.

indication that there is support for us to move forward with the procedural motion? Ten Members must show support. I see that that is so, therefore we will proceed to the vote.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0*

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

*[Oherwydd anawsterau technegol, ni ellir cynnwys enwau'r Aelodau a bleidleisiodd.]
[Owing to technical difficulties, the names of Members who voted cannot be included.]*

Ethol y Panel Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau ac Aelodau'r Pwyllgorau Election of Members to the Panel of Committee Chairs and Assembly Committees

Y Llywydd: Gan ein bod yn cael anawsterau gyda'r system bleidleisio electronig, awgrymaf ein bod yn cynnal un bleidlais ar gyfer yr holl etholiadau sydd ar yr agenda drwy alw enwau.

The Presiding Officer: As we are having difficulties with the electronic voting system, I suggest that we hold one vote for all the elections on the agenda through a roll call.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf

in accordance with section 57(5) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, the National Assembly resolves that the following Assembly Members shall be elected to the panel of Subject Committee Chairs: Val Feld, Richard Edwards, Gwenda Thomas, Cynog Dafis, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Glyn Davies and Kirsty Williams.

fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol ag adran 57(5) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu ethol yr Aelodau Cynulliad canlynol i banel Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau Pwnc: Val Feld, Richard Edwards, Gwenda Thomas, Cynog Dafis, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Glyn Davies a Kirsty Williams.

In accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves that the following members of the panel of Subject Committee Chairs shall be selected to chair the following Subject Committees: Val Feld to chair the Economic Development Committee; Richard Edwards to chair the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee; Gwenda Thomas to chair the Local Government and Housing Committee; Cynog Dafis to chair the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee; Rhodri Glyn Thomas to chair the Culture Committee; Glyn Davies to chair the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee; Kirsty Williams to chair the Health and Social Services Committee.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu dethol aelodau canlynol panel Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau Pwnc i gadeirio'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc canlynol: Val Feld i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd; Richard Edwards i gadeirio Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth; Gwenda Thomas i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai; Cynog Dafis i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes; Rhodri Glyn Thomas i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant; Glyn Davies i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig; Kirsty Williams i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Following the allocation of accountability to the Minister for Economic Development in accordance with sections 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the selection of the Chair of the Subject Committee in accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Act and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves to elect the other members of the Economic Development Committee in accordance with sections 57(7) and (8) of the Act as follows: Christine Chapman, Alison Halford, Ron Davies, Christine Gwyther, Brian Hancock, Dafydd Wigley, Phil Williams, Glyn Davies, Alun Cairns.

The National Assembly notes that

the First Minister, acting under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 2.4, has conferred on the Minister for Economic Development accountability in the fields of economic development, industry and tourism and in accordance with section 57(4) of the Act, the remit of the Economic Development Committee shall be construed accordingly.

Following the allocation of accountability to the Minister for Environment in accordance with sections 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the selection of the Chair of the Subject Committee in accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Act and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves to elect the other members of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee in accordance with sections 57(7) and (8) of the Act as follows: John Griffiths, Tom Middlehurst, Karen Sinclair, Geraint Davies, Helen Mary Jones, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, David Davies, Mick Bates.

The National Assembly notes that

the First Minister, acting under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 2.4, has conferred on the Minister for Environment accountability in the fields of the environment, countryside and conservation, town and country planning, ancient monuments and historic buildings, transport and highways, water and

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn dilyn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a dethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) y Ddeddf a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu ethol aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn unol ag adrannau 57(7) ac (8) y Ddeddf, fel a ganlyn: Christine Chapman, Alison Halford, Ron Davies, Christine Gwyther, Brian Hancock, Dafydd Wigley, Phil Williams, Glyn Davies, Alun Cairns.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod

y Prif Weinidog, gan weithredu yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, wedi rhoi cyfrifoldebau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ym meysydd datblygu economaidd, diwydiant a thwristiaeth, ac yn unol ag adran 57(4) y Ddeddf, bydd cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn cael ei lunio i gyfateb i hynny.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn dilyn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a dethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) y Ddeddf a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu ethol aelodau eraill Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn unol ag adrannau 57(7) ac (8) y Ddeddf, fel a ganlyn: John Griffiths, Tom Middlehurst, Karen Sinclair, Geraint Davies, Helen Mary Jones, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, David Davies, Mick Bates.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod

y Prif Weinidog, gan weithredu yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, wedi rhoi cyfrifoldebau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ym meysydd yr amgylchedd, cefn gwlad a chadwraeth, cynllunio gwlad a thref, henebion ac adeiladau hanesyddol, trafndiaeth a phriffyrdd, dŵr a'r diwydiant

the water industry and in accordance with section 57(4) of the Act, the remit of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee shall be construed accordingly.

Following the allocation of accountability to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities in accordance with sections 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the selection of the Chair of the Subject Committee in accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Act and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves to elect the other members of the Local Government and Housing Committee in accordance with sections 57(7) and (8) of the Act as follows: Peter Law, Tom Middlehurst, Janet Davies, David Lloyd, Janet Ryder, William Graham, Peter Black.

The National Assembly notes that

the First Minister, acting under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 2.4, has conferred on the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities accountability in the fields of local government and housing and in accordance with section 57(4) of the Act, the remit of the Local Government and Housing Committee shall be construed accordingly.

Following the allocation of accountability to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning in accordance with sections 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the selection of the Chair of the Subject Committee in accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Act and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves to elect the other members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in accordance with sections 57(7) and (8) of the Act as follows: Huw Lewis, Alun Pugh, Lorraine Barrett, Janice Gregory, Gareth Jones, Pauline Jarman, Jonathan Morgan, Christine Humphreys.

The National Assembly notes that

the First Minister, acting under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 2.4, has conferred on the Minister for Education and Lifelong

dŵr, ac yn unol ag adran 57(4) y Ddeddf, bydd cylch gwaith Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn cael ei lunio i gyfateb i hynny.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn dilyn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a dethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) y Ddeddf a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu ethol aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn unol ag adrannau 57(7) ac (8) y Ddeddf, fel a ganlyn: Peter Law, Tom Middlehurst, Janet Davies, David Lloyd, Janet Ryder, William Graham, Peter Black.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod

y Prif Weinidog, gan weithredu yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, wedi rhoi cyfrifoldebau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ym meysydd llywodraeth leol a thai, ac yn unol ag adran 57(4) y Ddeddf, bydd cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn cael ei lunio i gyfateb i hynny.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn dilyn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a dethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) y Ddeddf a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu ethol aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn unol ag adrannau 57(7) ac (8) y Ddeddf, fel a ganlyn: Huw Lewis, Alun Pugh, Lorraine Barrett, Janice Gregory, Gareth Jones, Pauline Jarman, Jonathan Morgan, Christine Humphreys.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod

y Prif Weinidog, gan weithredu yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, wedi rhoi cyfrifoldebau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a

Learning accountability in the fields of education, careers services and work-related training and in accordance with section 57(4) of the Act, the remit of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee shall be construed accordingly.

Following the allocation of accountability to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language in accordance with sections 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the selection of the Chair of the Subject Committee in accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Act and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves to elect the other members of the Culture Committee in accordance with sections 57(7) and (8) of the Act as follows: Delyth Evans, Lorraine Barrett, Rosemary Butler, Alison Halford, Owen John Thomas, Gareth Jones, Jonathan Morgan.

The National Assembly notes that

the First Minister, acting under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 2.4, has conferred on the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language accountability in the fields of the arts, libraries and museums, sport and recreation and the languages of Wales and in accordance with section 57(4) of the Act, the remit of the Culture Committee shall be construed accordingly.

Following the allocation of accountability to the Minister for Rural Affairs in accordance with sections 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the selection of the Chair of the Subject Committee in accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Act and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves to elect the other members of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee in accordance with sections 57(7) and (8) of the Act as follows: Delyth Evans, John Griffiths, Huw Lewis, Elin Jones, Jocelyn Davies, Janet Ryder, Peter Rogers, Mick Bates.

The National Assembly notes that

the First Minister, acting under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 2.4, has conferred on the

Dysgu Gydol Oes ym meysydd addysg, y gwasanaeth gyrfaeodd a hyfforddiant yn ymwneud â gwaith, ac yn unol ag adran 57(4) y Ddeddf, bydd cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn cael ei lunio i gyfateb i hynny.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn dilyn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a dethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) y Ddeddf a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu ethol aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn unol ag adrannau 57(7) ac (8) y Ddeddf, fel a ganlyn: Delyth Evans, Lorraine Barrett, Rosemary Butler, Alison Halford, Owen John Thomas, Gareth Jones, Jonathan Morgan.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod

y Prif Weinidog, gan weithredu yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif Rhif 2.4, wedi rhoi cyfrifoldebau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant a Chwaraeon ym meysydd y celfyddydau, llyfrgelloedd ac amgueddfeydd, chwaraeon a hamdden ac ieithoedd Cymru, ac yn unol ag adran 57(4) y Ddeddf, bydd cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn cael ei lunio i gyfateb i hynny.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn dilyn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a dethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) y Ddeddf a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu ethol aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn unol ag adrannau 57(7) ac (8) y Ddeddf, fel a ganlyn: Delyth Evans, John Griffiths, Huw Lewis, Elin Jones, Jocelyn Davies, Janet Ryder, Peter Rogers, Mick Bates.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod

y Prif Weinidog, gan weithredu yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, wedi rhoi

Minister for Rural Affairs accountability in the fields of agriculture and fisheries, forestry and food production and in accordance with section 57(4) of the Act, the remit of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee shall be construed accordingly.

Following the allocation of accountability to the Minister for Health and Social Services in accordance with sections 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the selection of the Chair of the Subject Committee in accordance with sections 57(5) and (6) of the Act and Standing Order No. 9.3, the National Assembly resolves to elect the other members of the Health and Social Services Committee in accordance with sections 57(7) and (8) of the Act as follows: Brian Gibbons, Ann Jones, Lynn Neagle, David Lloyd, Brian Hancock, Geraint Davies, David Melding,

The National Assembly notes that

the First Minister, acting under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 2.4, has conferred on the Minister for Health and Social Services accountability in the fields of health and health services, social services and social care and food safety and in accordance with section 57(4) of the Act, the remit of the Health and Social Services Committee shall be construed accordingly.

In accordance with Standing Order No. 28.2, the National Assembly resolves that the following Assembly Members shall be elected to the House Committee: Janice Gregory, Elin Jones, Glyn Davies and Peter Black, and that Dafydd Elis-Thomas, Presiding Officer, be elected Chair of the Committee.

In accordance with Standing Order No. 16.2, the National Assembly resolves that the following Assembly Members shall be elected to the Committee on Standards of Conduct: Janice Gregory, Christine Gwyther, Karen Sinclair, Gwenda Thomas, Cynog Dafis, Brian Hancock, Gareth Jones and Christine Humphreys, and that David Melding be elected Chair of the Committee.

cyfrifoldebau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig ym meysydd amaethyddiaeth a physgodfeydd, coedwigaeth a chynhyrchu bwyd, ac yn unol ag adran 57(4) y Ddeddf, bydd cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn cael ei lunio i gyfateb i hynny.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn dilyn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a dethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol ag adrannau 57(5) a (6) y Ddeddf a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn penderfynu ethol aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn unol ag adrannau 57(7) ac (8) y Ddeddf, fel a ganlyn: Brian Gibbons, Ann Jones, Lynn Neagle, David Lloyd, Brian Hancock, Geraint Davies, David Melding.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod

y Prif Weinidog, gan weithredu yn unol ag adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, wedi rhoi cyfrifoldebau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym meysydd iechyd a gwasanaethau iechyd, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol a diogelwch bwyd, ac yn unol ag adran 57(4) y Ddeddf, bydd cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cael ei lunio i gyfateb i hynny.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 28.2, yn penderfynu ethol yr Aelodau Cynulliad canlynol i'r Pwyllgor Tŷ: Janice Gregory, Elin Jones, Glyn Davies a Peter Black, ac yn ethol Dafydd Elis-Thomas, y Llywydd, i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16.2, yn penderfynu ethol yr Aelodau Cynulliad canlynol i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad: Janice Gregory, Christine Gwyther, Karen Sinclair, Gwenda Thomas, Cynog Dafis, Brian Hancock, Gareth Jones a Christine Humphreys, ac yn ethol David Melding i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor.

In accordance with sections 60(3) and (5) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, the National Assembly resolves that the following Assembly Members shall be elected to the Audit Committee: Ann Jones, Alison Halford, Peter Law, Lynne Neagle, Jocelyn Davies, Dafydd Wigley, Alun Cairns and Kirsty Williams, and that Janet Davies be elected Chair of the Committee.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol ag adrannau 60(3) a (5) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu ethol yr Aelodau Cynulliad canlynol i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio: Ann Jones, Alison Halford, Peter Law, Lynne Neagle, Jocelyn Davies, Dafydd Wigley, Alun Cairns a Kirsty Williams, ac yn ethol Janet Davies i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor.

In accordance with Standing Order No. 14.3, the National Assembly resolves that the following Assembly Members shall be elected to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity: Lorraine Barrett, Richard Edwards, Christine Gwyther, Ann Jones, Helen Mary Jones, Janet Ryder, Owen John Thomas, Jonathan Morgan, David Melding and Christine Humphreys, and that Edwina Hart be elected Chair of the Committee.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 14.3, yn penderfynu ethol yr Aelodau Cynulliad canlynol i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal: Lorraine Barrett, Richard Edwards, Christine Gwyther, Ann Jones, Helen Mary Jones, Janet Ryder, Owen John Thomas, Jonathan Morgan, David Melding a Christine Humphreys, ac yn ethol Edwina Hart i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor.

In accordance with Standing Order No. 15.4, the National Assembly resolves that the following Assembly Members shall be elected to the Committee on European Affairs: Rosemary Butler, Val Feld, Christine Chapman, John Griffiths, Ieuan Wyn Jones, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Phil Williams, Nick Bourne, Jonathan Morgan and Mick Bates, and that Rhodri Morgan be elected Chair of the Committee.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 15.4, yn penderfynu ethol yr Aelodau Cynulliad canlynol i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd: Rosemary Butler, Val Feld, Christine Chapman, John Griffiths, Ieuan Wyn Jones, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Phil Williams, Nick Bourne, Jonathan Morgan a Mick Bates, ac yn ethol Rhodri Morgan i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor.

In accordance with sections 59(2) and (4) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, the National Assembly resolves that the following Assembly Members shall be elected to the Legislation Committee: Rosemary Butler, Ron Davies, Val Feld, John Griffiths, David Lloyd, Pauline Jarman, Owen John Thomas and Glyn Davies, and that Mick Bates be elected Chair of the Committee.

Fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol ag adrannau 59(2) a (4) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu ethol yr Aelodau Cynulliad canlynol i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau: Rosemary Butler, Ron Davies, Val Feld, John Griffiths, David Lloyd, Pauline Jarman, Owen John Thomas a Glyn Davies, ac yn ethol Mick Bates i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor.

*Cynnig: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog

Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language**

**Hyrwyddo Polisi'r Celfyddydau a Chwaraeon
Promoting Arts and Sports Policy**

Q1 Peter Black: How will the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language promote arts and sports policy outside of Cardiff? (OAQ7641)

C1 Peter Black: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg yn bwriadu hyrwyddo polisi'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon y tu allan i Gaerdydd? (OAQ7641)

The Minister for Culture, Sports and the Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant,

Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): I will ensure that the Assembly's policies offer help and encouragement to enable people in all parts of Wales to enjoy arts and sports activities. The Arts Council of Wales and the Sports Council for Wales are national bodies, through which grants are channelled, and I will work with them to continue to develop policies which bring benefits to all parts of the country.

Peter Black: I hope that you recognise that there is concern throughout Wales about the huge amount of money which is being ploughed into the capital city, particularly into the Millennium Centre. We should also be investing in similar capital projects throughout Wales. I know that money is being spent on the National Museums and Galleries of Wales in Swansea. However, could you ensure that we get an even spread of money around Wales, not only on capital projects, but also on small arts and theatre projects, to counter that concern?

Jenny Randerson: I understand that concern. Earlier this week, I had a meeting with lottery distributors including the Sports Council for Wales and the Arts Council of Wales. We discussed, as one of our major items, the issue of spreading funding throughout Wales and dealing with what are probably known as 'cold spots'. However, the record of spending is not quite what people might think. The breakdown of lottery funding for the arts shows that the leading authorities with regard to spending per head are Ceredigion, Newport and Powys. Those are not perceived to be the areas where people benefit most. We get this sort of spread because of the concentration of population. I assure you that I will consider that issue closely.

Peter Rogers: Ynys Môn has the highest rate of heart disease. The local health group is tackling that by highlighting healthy eating and regular exercise such as cycling. How will you assist Ynys Môn to achieve that aim?

Jenny Randerson: I recently read about the cycling issues in Ynys Môn. I gather that, regretfully, Ynys Môn has withdrawn its bid

Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Sicrhaf y bydd polisiau'r Cynulliad yn cynnig help ac anogaeth i alluogi pobl ym mhob rhan o Gymru i fwynhau gweithgareddau'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon. Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yn gyrrff cenedlaethol, y caiff grantiau eu sianelu drwyddynt, a byddaf yn gweithio gyda hwy i barhau i ddatblygu polisiau a ddaw â buddiannau i bob rhan o'r wlad.

Peter Black: Gobeithio y cydnabyddwch bod pryder drwy Gymru am y swm mawr o arian a fuddsoddir yn y brif ddinas, yn enwedig yng Nghanolfan y Mileniwm. Dylem hefyd fod yn buddsoddi mewn prosiectau cyfalaf tebyg ledled Cymru. Gwn fod arian yn cael ei wario ar Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, allech chi sicrhau y caiff yr arian ei rannu'n gyfartal o amgylch Cymru, nid ar brosiectau cyfalaf yn unig, ond hefyd ar brosiectau bach y celfyddydau a theatr, i leddfu'r pryder hwnnw?

Jenny Randerson: Deallaf y pryder hwnnw. Yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, cefais gyfarfod â dosbathwyr loteri yn cynnwys Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Trafodwyd, fel un o'n prif eitemau, y mater o rannu'r arian drwy Gymru gyfan ac ymdrin â'r hyn a elwir yn 'fannau oer'. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cofnod o wariant yn union fel y byddai pobl yn ei ddychmygu. Dengys y dadansoddiad o arian y loteri ar gyfer y celfyddydau mai'r awdurdodau sydd yn gwario fwyaf y pen yw Ceredigion, Casnewydd a Phowys. Nid ystyrir mai'r rheini yw'r ardaloedd lle y mae pobl yn elwa fwyaf. Cawn y math hwn o rannu oherwydd dwysedd y boblogaeth. Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddaf yn ystyried y mater hwnnw'n fanwl.

Peter Rogers: Ynys Môn sydd â'r gyfradd uchaf o afiechyd y galon. Mae'r grŵp iechyd lleol yn ymdrin â hynny drwy amlygu bwyta'n iach ac ymarfer corff rheolaidd megis seiclo. Sut y byddwch yn cynorthwyo Ynys Môn i gyflawni'r nod hwnnw?

Jenny Randerson: Yn ddiweddar darllenais am y materion seiclo yn Ynys Môn. Deallaf, yn anffodus, bod Ynys Môn wedi tynnu ei

for a velodrome. There is a possibility of putting money in for cycleways, but that is not within the remit of my department. However, there are issues that can be addressed via the Sports Council for Wales. I will draw your concerns, Peter, to the attention of the Sports Council for Wales.

chais am felodrom yn ôl. Mae posibilrwydd o roi arian ar gyfer lonydd seiclo, ond nid yw hynny o fewn cylch gwaith fy adran. Fodd bynnag, ceir materion y gellir ymdrin â hwy drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Byddaf yn tynnu sylw Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru at eich pryderon, Peter.

Trefniadau Trosiannol ar gyfer Prosiectau (Arian y Loteri) **Transitional Arrangements for Projects (Lottery Funding)**

Q2 Christine Gwyther: Does Jenny Randerson have any plans to introduce transitional arrangements for projects that have benefited from lottery funding? (OAQ7602)

C2 Christine Gwyther: A oes gan Jenny Randerson unrhyw gynlluniau i gyflwyno trefniadau trosiannol ar gyfer prosiectau sydd wedi elwa ar arian y loteri? (OAQ7602)

Congratulations on your new job, Jenny. I hope that you enjoy it and make the most of it.

Llongyfarchiadau ar eich swydd newydd, Jenny. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ei mwynhau ac yn gwneud y mwyaf ohoni.

Jenny Randerson: I have no plans to introduce transitional arrangements for lottery-funded projects. However, I am aware of concerns about this issue. The lottery distributors are keenly aware of sustainability and it was also discussed at the meeting that I had earlier this week. In assessing bids, the distributors must be satisfied—and this is one of the requirements of lottery money—that projects have a reasonable prospect of viability before funds are awarded. However, I am aware that some distributors, including the Arts Council of Wales, occasionally allow a second bid where there is a need for repeat funding.

Jenny Randerson: Nid oes gennyf unrhyw gynlluniau i gyflwyno trefniadau trosiannol ar gyfer prosiectau a ariennir gan y loteri. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bryderon ynghylch y mater hwn. Mae dosbarthwyr y loteri yn hynod ymwybodol o gynaliadwyedd a thrafodwyd hyn hefyd yn y cyfarfod a gefais yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Wrth asesu ceisiadau, rhaid i'r dosbarthwyr fod yn fodlon—a dyma un o ofynion arian y loteri—bod gan brosiectau siawns rhesymol o fod yn ymarferol cyn y dyfernir yr arian. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod rhai dosbarthwyr, gan gynnwys Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, ar adegau yn caniatáu ail gais lle y mae angen arian drachefn.

Christine Gwyther: Art takes many forms, such as the attractive Greenham woman statuette in the milling area, which we have all made a pledge to kiss as we come in every morning.

Christine Gwyther: Mae sawl ffurf ar gelf, megis y cerflun bach deniadol o wraig Greenham yn y man ymgynnull, y mae pawb wedi addo ei gusanu pan fyddwn yn dod i mewn bob bore.

Projects that deal with going out to work with the community are labour intensive. Therefore, people who work on those projects need to be in the community, not their offices looking for where the next penny will come from, post lottery funding. I am heartened by your answer that this will be considered and I hope that, as our Minister, you will press hard for that.

Mae prosiectau sydd yn ymdrin â mynd allan i weithio gyda'r gymuned yn llafurddwys. Felly, mae angen i'r bobl sydd yn gweithio ar y prosiectau hynny fod yn y gymuned, nid yn eu swyddfeydd yn ceisio gweld o ble y daw y geiniog nesaf, ar ôl arian y loteri. Fe'm calonogir gan eich ateb y caiff hyn ei ystyried a gobeithio y byddwch, fel ein Gweinidog, yn pwysu'n galed am hynny.

Jenny Randerson: I assure you that I will press for the issue of repeat funding to be considered. However, it must be emphasised that there are national rules—UK rules as opposed to the Welsh rules that we are allowed to apply in some situations—in the case of some of the lottery funds. Some lottery funders are justifiably concerned that if we allow too many repeat bids there will be, to use the jargon, ‘silting up’: the money will be taken by repeat projects and revenue funding. That will mean less cash for new bidders. We must bear in mind that lottery money is supposed to be additional and should not replace regular Government funding.

Jocelyn Davies: I welcome Jenny to her first question session. Many groups are still struggling to obtain lottery funding status in the first place. Will you join me in calling on the Sports Council for Wales to officially recognise pigeon racing as a sport and make thousands of people across Wales happy?

9:15 a.m.

Jenny Randerson: That has not been drawn to my attention before. Will you write to me and give me further information on the issues involved?

The Sports Council for Wales is one of the lottery distributors that goes out most into the community and makes the greatest effort to encourage applications. It even has a system whereby applicants do not have to complete the forms themselves, which makes life as easy as possible for them. It has outreach workers and they are enthusiastic about getting as many bids as possible, particularly small ones, from the community.

Annog Pobl Ifanc i Gymryd Rhan yn y Celfyddydau Encouraging Young People to Participate in the Arts

Q3 Richards Edwards: How does Jenny Randerson plan to encourage young people in Wales to become more involved in the arts? (OAQ7603)

I also welcome Jenny to her first question time.

Jenny Randerson: Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddaf yn gwthio'r achos dros ystyried ariannu drachefn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid pwysleisio bod rheolau cenedlaethol i'w dilyn—rheolau'r DU yn hytrach na rheolau Cymru y caniateir inni eu cymhwyso mewn rhai sefyllfaoedd—wrth ymdrin â rhai o gronfeydd y loteri. Mae gan rai o arianwyr y loteri bryder dilys y byddai caniatáu gormod o ail geisiadau y arwain at yr hyn a elwir yn ‘siltio’: defnyddir yr arian gan brosiectau cyson ac arian refeniw. Golyga hynny lai o arian ar gyfer ymgeiswyr newydd. Rhaid inni gofio mai arian ychwanegol y dylai arian y loteri fod ac ni ddylai gymryd lle arian arferol y Llywodraeth.

Jocelyn Davies: Croesawaf Jenny i'w sesiwn gwestiynau gyntaf. Mae sawl grŵp yn dal i ymdrechu i gael statws arian y loteri yn y lle cyntaf. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi wrth alw ar Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i gydnabod rasio colomenod yn swyddogol fel chwaraeon a gwneud miloedd o bobl ledled Cymru yn hapus?

Jenny Randerson: Ni thynnwyd fy sylw at hynny o'r blaen. A ysgrifennwch ataf a rhoi gwybodaeth bellach ar y materion dan sylw?

Mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yn un o ddosbarthwyr y loteri sydd yn gweithio fwyaf i'r gymuned ac sydd yn gwneud yr ymdrech fwyaf i annog ceisiadau. Mae ganddo system, hyd yn oed, lle nad oes rhaid i ymgeiswyr gwblhau'r ffurflenni eu hunain, sydd yn gwneud bywyd mor hawdd â phosibl iddynt. Mae ganddo weithwyr allgymorth ac maent yn frwdfrydig dros gael cynifer o gynigion â phosibl, yn enwedig rhai bach, o'r gymuned.

C3 Richard Edwards: Sut y mae Jenny Randerson yn bwriadu annog pobl ifanc yng Nghymru i gymryd mwy o ran yn y celfyddydau? (OAQ7603)

Croesawaf innau hefyd Jenny i'w sesiwn gwestiynau gyntaf.

Jenny Randerson: I am a firm believer in the benefits of the arts for young people and will do all that I can to promote and support initiatives that encourage them to become involved in the arts. The Arts Council for Wales has established the arts and young people taskforce to ensure that all young people in Wales can take part in arts activities. The council has also given a major lottery award to the Welsh Joint Education Committee and the Welsh Amateur Music Federation to develop National Youth Arts Wales. The Assembly will provide £8 million from the music development fund to extend and strengthen the opportunities for young people to make and enjoy the benefits of music of all kinds.

Richard Edwards: Do you agree that the reality in Wales is that facilities and opportunities for young people to become involved in the arts vary widely in different parts of the country, particularly for young musicians? There are far more outlets for them to develop their talents in the Cardiff area rather than Pembrokeshire, for example. How can you ensure equity of access to opportunity regardless of geography and parental income?

Jenny Randerson: The music development fund provides a tremendous opportunity. A small amount of money was made available during the current year, but there is a bigger tranche coming on stream. It is important to remember that the local authorities are our partners on such issues. Over the years, when the local government settlement has been tough, they have tended to draw back from spending on things that were not considered essential. Unfortunately, they have drawn back from funding provision for music in particular, but also for the arts. I hope that this year's settlement, which will be more generous to local authorities, will enable them to work more towards the aims that so many did so well to achieve. In addition, the previous Post-16 Education and Training Committee's report included important policy pointers for us, which I hope that we will take forward to encourage the involvement of young people in the arts.

Jenny Randerson: Credaf yn gryf fod y celfyddydau o fudd i bobl ifanc a gwnaf bopeth o fewn fy ngallu i annog a chynorthwyo mentrau sydd yn eu hannog i gymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau. Sefydlodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru y tasglu celfyddydau a phobl ifanc i sicrhau y gall holl bobl ifanc Cymru gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau celfyddydol. Hefyd rhoddodd y cyngor swm mawr o arian y loteri i Gyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru a Ffederasiwn Cerddoriaeth Amatur Cymru i ddatblygu Celfyddydau Cenedlaethol Ieuenctid Cymru. Bydd y Cynulliad yn darparu £8 miliwn o'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth i ehangu a chryfhau'r cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc greu cerddoriaeth o bob math a mwynhau'r buddiannau.

Richard Edwards: A gytunwch mai'r realiti yng Nghymru yw bod cyfleusterau a chyfleoedd ar gyfer pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau yn amrywio'n eang mewn gwahanol rannau o'r wlad, yn arbennig ar gyfer cerddorion ifanc? Mae llawer mwy o gyfleoedd iddynt ddatblygu eu doniau yn ardal Caerdydd yn hytrach nag yn Sir Benfro, er enghraifft. Sut y gallwch sicrhau tegwch mynediad i gyfle heb ystyried daearyddiaeth ac incwm rhieni?

Jenny Randerson: Darpara'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth gyfle enfawr. Yr oedd swm bach o arian ar gael yn ystod y flwyddyn gyfredol, ond bydd cyfran fwy yn cael ei gyflenwi. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai'r awdurdodau lleol yw ein partneriaid mewn materion o'r fath. Dros y blynyddoedd, pan fu'r setliad llywodraeth leol yn anodd, maent wedi tueddu i osgoi gwario ar bethau nad ystyriwyd eu bod yn hanfodol. Yn anffodus, maent wedi osgoi darparu cyllid ar gyfer cerddoriaeth yn enwedig, ond hefyd ar gyfer y celfyddydau. Gobeithio y bydd setliad eleni, a fydd yn fwy hael i awdurdodau lleol, yn eu galluogi i weithio mwy tuag at yr amcanion y gwnaeth llawer ohonynt mor dda i'w cyflawni. Yn ogystal, yr oedd adroddiad blaenorol y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yn cynnwys canllawiau polisi pwysig inni, a gobeithio y byddwn yn gweithredu arnynt i annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau.

David Davies: Do you agree that young people are less likely to want to get involved in the arts when they are used by administrations to further naked political goals, particularly when the arts are used to support organisations that have been involved in illegal protest?

David Davies: A gytunwech fod pobl ifanc yn llai tebygol o fod eisiau cymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau pan gânt eu defnyddio gan weinyddiaethau i hyrwyddo amcanion gwleidyddol moel, yn arbennig pan ddefnyddir y celfyddydau i gefnogi sefydliadau sydd wedi cymryd rhan mewn protestiadau anghyfreithlon?

Jenny Randerson: Are you referring to the timid little statue of the lady outside?

Jenny Randerson: A ydych yn cyfeirio at y cerflun bach diniwed o'r wraig y tu allan?

David Davies: Will we be—

David Davies: A fyddwn yn—

The Presiding Officer: Order. David, you have had one supplementary.

Llywydd: Trefn. David, yr ydych wedi cael un cwestiwn atodol.

Jenny Randerson: I do not agree with David.

Jenny Randerson: Ni chytunaf â David.

Datblygu Polisi'r Celfyddydau Developing Arts Policy

Q4 Peter Black: How will Jenny Randerson develop arts policy in line with the report of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee on arts and culture in Wales? (OAQ7637)

C4 Peter Black: Sut y bydd Jenny Randerson yn datblygu polisi'r celfyddydau yn unol ag adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ar gelfyddydau a diwylliant yng Nghymru? (OAQ7637)

Jenny Randerson: The Committee provided us with the definitive work on the arts and culture policies that need to be developed in Wales. It contains a wealth of good ideas for the development of arts and culture and I will use it as a springboard for my work and ideas as Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language. I will be working energetically with the Arts Council of Wales, local government, the British Council and cultural organisations to set broad policy and to agree priorities for funding to raise the profile of Welsh arts and culture at home and abroad.

Jenny Randerson: Darparodd y Pwyllgor y gwaith diamodol ar y polisiau celfyddydol a diwylliannol sydd angen eu datblygu yng Nghymru. Mae'n cynnwys cyfoeth o syniadau da ar gyfer datblygu'r celfyddydau a diwylliant a byddaf yn ei ddefnyddio fel ysgogiad ar gyfer fy ngwaith a'm syniadau fel Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg. Byddaf yn gweithio'n ddiwyd gyda Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, llywodraeth leol, y Cyngor Prydeinig a sefydliadau diwylliannol i sefydlu polisi cyffredinol a chytuno ar flaenoriaethau ar gyfer ariannu i godi proffil celfyddydau a diwylliant Cymru yma a thramor.

Peter Black: Wales has enjoyed moderate success as a venue for film-making. What can you do as the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language to try to promote Wales as a venue for making films, which is a valuable way of selling Wales to the outside world?

Peter Black: Cafodd Cymru beth llwyddiant fel lleoliad ar gyfer gwneud ffilmiau. Beth allwch chi ei wneud fel y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg i geisio hyrwyddo Cymru fel lleoliad ar gyfer gwneud ffilmiau, sydd yn ffordd werthfawr o werthu Cymru i'r byd mawr?

Jenny Randerson: As I hope everyone here is aware, the partnership agreement commits

Jenny Randerson: Fel y gŵyr pawb yma, gobeithiaf, mae'r cytundeb partneriaeth yn

us to investigating the possibility of a Welsh film fund. Sgrîn, which is the media agency for Wales, hopes to harness Objective 1 money to help build up our film industry. It hopes that that investment will be used to match expenditure by film-makers.

The project specification is being discussed with Finance Wales, which is the new development bank. I will inform the Culture Committee of developments and I will meet Sgrîn in the near future to discuss progress.

Dafydd Wigley: Croesawaf finnau Jenny i'w swydd newydd a dymunaf yn dda iddi. Un o argymhellion adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 oedd creu consortiwm cymunedol, sef Creu Cymru, a fyddai'n gweithredu fel fforwm ac yn dwyn at ei gilydd wahanol garfanau sef artistiaid, ymarferwyr, Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a'r Cynulliad. Sut y mae Jenny yn bwriadu gweithredu'r argymhelliad hwnnw a beth yw'r dyddiad targed i'w gael yn ei le?

Jenny Randerson: I have begun discussing with officials the 100 recommendations contained in that splendid report. It is impossible for all of them to go ahead at the same time. The report acknowledges a timescale up to 2010. However, Creu Cymru is one of the most important recommendations. It will enable the arts organisations in Wales to work together positively and I have flagged that up as an issue that can be tackled in the coming months. I will consult with the Culture Committee on priorities for policy issues and take advice from my officials.

Rosemary Butler: I am pleased that Jenny intends to help develop the film industry. However, I am disturbed that you seem to be concentrating on Objective 1 areas. One of the finest film stores in Britain, if not in Europe and the world, is the Newport College of Art, which is now part of the University of Wales College, Newport. It does not qualify for Objective 1 funding, but I hope that you will include south-east Wales in your development plans. There are Ordnance Survey people in the foyer. I suggest that you get a map of south-east Wales and give it to the Arts Council so that it can see where it is

ein hymrwymo i ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o gronfa ffilmiau yng Nghymru. Gobaith Sgrîn, sef asiantaeth cyfryngau Cymru, yw cael gafael ar arian Amcan 1 i helpu wrth adeiladu ein diwydiant ffilmiau. Gobeithia y defnyddir y buddsoddiad hwnnw i gyfateb â gwariant gan wneuthurwyr ffilmiau.

Trafodir manylion y prosiect gyda Cyllid Cymru, sef y banc datblygu newydd. Hysbysaf y Pwyllgor Diwylliant o'r datblygiadau a byddaf yn cwrdd â Sgrîn yn y dyfodol agos i drafod cynnydd.

Dafydd Wigley: I also welcome Jenny to her new post and wish her well. One of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee report's recommendations was to create a community consortium, namely Creu Cymru, which would act as a forum and bring together different sectors such as artists, practitioners, the Arts Council of Wales and the Assembly. How does Jenny intend to implement that recommendation and what is the target date for putting it in place?

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf wedi dechrau trafod y 100 o argymhellion sydd yn yr adroddiad ardderchog hwnnw â swyddogion. Mae'n amhosibl iddynt oll gael eu gweithredu ar yr un pryd. Mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod terfyn amser hyd at 2010. Fodd bynnag, Creu Cymru yw un o'r argymhellion pwysicaf. Bydd yn galluogi sefydliadau'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru i gydweithio'n gadarnhaol a nodais hynny fel mater y gellir ymdrin ag ef yn y misoedd nesaf. Ymgynghoraf â'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar flaenoriaethau ar gyfer materion polisi a byddaf yn derbyn cyngor gan fy swyddogion.

Rosemary Butler: Yr wyf yn falch bod Jenny yn bwriadu helpu wrth ddatblygu'r diwydiant ffilmiau. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf yr ymddengys eich bod yn canolbwyntio ar ardaloedd Amcan 1. Mae Coleg Celf Casnewydd, sydd bellach yn rhan o Goleg Prifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd, yn un o'r storfeydd ffilmiau gorau ym Mhrydain, os nad yn Ewrop a'r byd. Nid yw'n gymwys ar gyfer arian Amcan 1, ond gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cynnwys de-ddwyrain Cymru yn eich cynlluniau datblygu. Mae pobl o'r arolwg ordnans yn y cyntedd. Awgrymaf eich bod yn cael map o dde-ddwyrain Cymru ac

and give us money.

yn ei roi i Gyngor y Celfyddydau fel y gall weld ble y mae a rhoi arian inni.

Jenny Randerson: I am aware of the importance of Newport to the film industry. I am also aware that there are three film commissions in Wales, one of which covers south Wales. There is scope for further development in that film commission. However, that is largely funded by local authorities and, therefore, it is necessary to work in partnership with local authorities on that issue.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd Casnewydd i'r diwydiant ffilmiau. Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol bod tri chomisiwn ffilmiau yng Nghymru, a bod un ohonynt yn cwmpasu de Cymru. Mae cyfle i ddatblygu ymhellach yn y comisiwn ffilmiau hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ariennir hynny'n bennaf gan awdurdodau lleol ac, felly, mae angen gweithio mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol ar y mater hwnnw.

I regard the use of Objective 1 money as a pragmatic way of extending arts funding. It is important that I find as many ways of possible of using art funding as effectively as possible. I will, however, bear in mind that one third of Wales is not covered by Objective 1.

Ystyriaif y defnydd o arian Amcan 1 fel modd ymarferol o ymestyn arian ar gyfer y celfyddydau. Mae'n bwysig imi ganfod cymaint o ffyrdd â phosibl o ddefnyddio arian y celfyddydau mor effeithiol â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn cadw mewn cof nad yw Amcan 1 yn cwmpasu traean o Gymru.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 5 wedi ei drosglwyddo i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

The Presiding Officer: Question 5 has been transferred for written answer.

Dyfodol Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru The Future of the Arts Council of Wales

Q6 Jonathan Morgan: Will Jenny Randerson make a statement on the future of the Arts Council of Wales? (OAQ7596)

C6 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff Jenny Randerson ddatganiad ynghylch dyfodol Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru? (OAQ7596)

Jenny Randerson: I will be working closely with the chairman of the Arts Council of Wales to analyse and implement the findings of the Wallace report and the Pricewaterhouse Coopers report as appropriate. I will also work with the council to follow up the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's recommendations on arts and culture policy, which were published last week.

Jenny Randerson: Byddaf yn gweithio'n agos â chadeirydd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i ddadansoddi a gweithredu casgliadau adroddiad Wallace ac adroddiad Pricewaterhouse Coopers fel y bo'n briodol. Hefyd byddaf yn gweithio gyda'r cyngor i ddilyn trywydd argymhellion y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ar bolisi'r celfyddydau a diwydiant, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf.

Jonathan Morgan: Will you confirm when you will be taking the necessary steps, as recommended in the report, to strip the Arts Council of Wales of its Royal Charter?

Jonathan Morgan: A gadarnhewch pryd y byddwch yn cymryd y camau angenrheidiol, fel yr argymhellir yn yr adroddiad, i dynnu Siarter Frenhinol Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru oddi arno?

9:25 a.m.

Jenny Randerson: The report refers to the possibility that a Royal Charter is the way ahead for the Arts Council of Wales. I have

Jenny Randerson: Cyfeiria'r adroddiad at y posibilrwydd mai Siarter Frenhinol yw'r ffordd ymlaen i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru.

already had two meetings about this issue. I am not satisfied that it is necessary to deal with the issue by stripping the Royal Charter. You can change charters—the charter has been changed in Scotland. In Wales, all the Royal Charters were changed, as with the Sports Council for Wales's charter when we became an Assembly, taking over from the Welsh Office. I hope that we can change the charter to take account of our needs. I have asked my officials, I have investigated the situation and I have not come across one example of problems with the Arts Council of Wales and its relationship with the Assembly due to the Royal Charter. There are other more important issues. We can change a Royal Charter quickly, but we cannot strip a Royal Charter quickly.

Cynog Dafis: Pwysaf ar Jenny Randerson ymhellach ar hyn. Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn argymhell y newid hwnnw am ei fod yn credu nad yw statws Siarter Frenhinol yn berthnasol bellach ac am ei fod yn ystyried Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru fel corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad sydd yn cyd-weithredu fel asiantaeth ar gyfer y celfyddydau. A gytuna Jenny Randerson mai un fantais o gael gwared â'r Siarter Frenhinol fyddai ei gwneud yn bosibl i dalu aelodau cyngor cenedlaethol Cyngor y Celfyddydau a, thrwy hynny, denu'r math o bobl a fydd yn gwasanaethu ar gyrrff cyhoeddus eraill i waith y cyngor?

Jenny Randerson: My initial investigations have revealed that you can pay members by changing the charter and not by removing it. That led me to the answer that I gave to Jonathan. If I have not received the full information yet, and it is necessary to remove the charter, that will have to be the next step. We must put ourselves in the position of paying the members of the Arts Council's board. That needs to be discussed with the new Culture Committee and considered in more detail. At present, it would be better to go ahead quickly with the change to the charter rather than embarking on something that could prove controversial in the House of Commons by trying to remove the charter.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi cael dau gyfarfod ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Nid wyf yn fodlon bod angen ymdrin â'r mater drwy gael gwared ar y Siarter Frenhinol. Gallwch newid siarteri—newidiwyd y siarter yn yr Alban. Yng Nghymru, newidiwyd pob Siarter Frenhinol, fel y gwnaethpwyd i siarter Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru pan ddaethom yn Gynulliad, gan gymryd drosodd gan y Swyddfa Gymreig. Gobeithiaf y gallwn newid y siarter i gwrdd â'n hanghenion. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion, yr wyf wedi ymchwilio i'r sefyllfa ac ni chanfyddais un enghraifft o broblemau gyda Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a'i berthynas â'r Cynulliad oherwydd y Siarter Frenhinol. Mae materion pwysicach eraill. Gallwn newid Siarter Frenhinol yn gyflym, ond ni allwn gael gwared ar Siarter Frenhinol yn gyflym.

Cynog Dafis: I press Jenny Randerson further on this. The Committee's report recommends that change because it believes that Royal Charter status is no longer relevant and because it considers the Arts Council of Wales as a body sponsored by the Assembly to co-operate as an agency for the arts. Does Jenny Randerson agree that one advantage of getting rid of the Royal Charter would be to make it possible to pay members of the Arts Council's national council and, by so doing, attract the kind of people who will serve on other public bodies to the council's work?

Jenny Randerson: Dangosodd fy ymchwiliadau cychwynnol y gallwch dalu aelodau drwy newid y siarter ac nid drwy gael gwared arni. Dyna a'm harweiniodd at yr ateb a roddais i Jonathan. Os nad wyf wedi derbyn y wybodaeth lawn eto, a bod angen cael gwared ar y siarter, dyna fydd yn rhaid i'r cam nesaf fod. Rhaid inni roi ein hunain yn y sefyllfa o dalu aelodau bwrdd Cyngor y Celfyddydau. Mae angen trafod hynny â'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant newydd a'i ystyried yn fanylach. Ar hyn o bryd, byddai'n well gweithredu'n gyflym â'r newid i'r siarter yn hytrach na chael rhywbeth a allai fod yn ddadleuol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin drwy geisio cael gwared ar y siarter.

Gweithredu Strategaeth Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg Implementing the Welsh Language Board's Strategy

C7 Elin Jones: Pa gynnydd a wnaethpwyd gan y weinyddiaeth tuag at weithredu strategaeth Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg 'Gweledigaeth a Chenhadaeth 2000-2005'? (OAQ7652)

Jenny Randerson: Our draft budget would provide the Welsh Language Board with increased resources of over £2 million over the next three years. That funding will help the board achieve some of the objectives identified in its strategy document. Additional resources will be targeted at two of the board's main priorities—the project to encourage language transmission within the family and an increase in *Mentrau Iaith* activities.

Elin Jones: Cred Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg y dylai'r iaith Gymraeg fod yn fater o gyfle cyfartal gyda chyfrifoldeb dros y Gymraeg yn perthyn i bob Gweinidog Cabinet a phob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno?

Jenny Randerson: I was interested to read about the Welsh Language Board's views, but unfortunately I only read about them in the newspapers. I have not read about them first-hand yet and have not discussed them with the chair of the Welsh Language Board. I will pursue the issues that were raised last week on this issue, because there are important objectives that we must consider and that I need to discuss with Cabinet colleagues.

Alun Cairns: Mae'r ddogfen 'Gweledigaeth a Chenhadaeth 2000-2005' yn gofyn cwestiynau amlwg ynglŷn â chyllid. Pryd y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu rhoi rhyw fath o arwydd o'r bwriadau gwariant?

Jenny Randerson: I will discuss those with my officials and the budget issues will be raised in the Culture Committee, which I hope will meet for the first time next week.

I clarify that, in my reply to David Davies, I disagreed with him on the statue, not on his question.

Q7 Elin Jones: What progress is the administration making towards implementing the Welsh Language Board's strategy 'A Vision and a Mission for 2000-2005'? (OAQ7652)

Jenny Randerson: Byddai ein cyllideb ddrafft yn darparu cynnydd mewn adnoddau o dros £2 filiwn i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd yr arian hwnnw yn helpu'r bwrdd wrth gyflawni rhai o'r amcanion a nodir yn ei ddogfen strategaeth. Targedir adnoddau ychwanegol at ddau o brif flaenoriaethau'r bwrdd—y prosiect i annog trosglwyddo'r iaith o fewn y teulu a chynnydd yng ngweithgareddau Mentrau Iaith.

Elin Jones: The Welsh Language Board believes that the Welsh language should be a matter of equal opportunity with every Cabinet Minister and every Assembly Member taking responsibility for the Welsh language. Does the Minister agree?

Jenny Randerson: Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb mewn darllen am farn Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, ond yn anffodus dim ond mewn papurau newydd y darllenis amdanynt. Nid wyf wedi darllen amdanynt yn uniongyrchol eto ac nid wyf wedi eu trafod â chadeirydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Dilynaf drywydd y materion a godwyd yr wythnos diwethaf ar y mater hwn, oherwydd mae amcanion pwysig y mae'n rhaid inni eu hystyried ac y mae angen imi eu trafod â chyd-aelodau o'r Cabinet.

Alun Cairns: The 'A Vision and a Mission for 2000-2005' document asks obvious questions about finance. When will the Minister be able to give some sort of indication of the spending plans?

Jenny Randerson: Trafodaf y rheini gyda'm swyddogion a chodir materion y gyllideb yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, a fydd yn cwrdd am y tro cyntaf yr wythnos nesaf, gobeithiaf.

Egluraf, yn fy ateb i David Davies, imi anghytuno ag ef ar y cerflun, nid ar ei gwestiwn.

The Presiding Officer: Although I allowed that clarification, I will not do so in future.

Y Llywydd: Er imi ganiatáu'r eglurhad hwnnw, ni wnaaf hynny yn y dyfodol.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs

Datblygiad Technoleg Addasu'n Genetig The Development of GM Technology

Q1 Janet Ryder: What is the National Assembly for Wales doing to implement its decision to resist the development of genetic modification technology in Wales? (OAQ7690)

C1 Janet Ryder: Beth y mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ei wneud i weithredu ei benderfyniad o wrthsefyll y broses o ddatblygu technoleg addasu genetig yng Nghymru? (OAQ7690)

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I have taken forward the terms of the motion adopted by the National Assembly on 24 May and its agreed policy in correspondence with the UK Government and Aventis. I will meet the Minister for the Environment, Michael Meacher, shortly and will re-emphasise to him the National Assembly's commitment to resist the planting of genetically modified crops, given the current state of knowledge.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Gweithredais ar dermau'r cynnig a dderbyniwyd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar 24 Mai a'i bolisi cytûn mewn gohebiaeth â Llywodraeth y DU ac Aventis. Byddaf yn cwrdd â'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Michael Meacher, yn fuan a byddaf yn ailbwysleisio ymrwymiad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i wrthsefyll plannu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig, o ystyried y wybodaeth bresennol.

Janet Ryder: The Chardon LL seed has not undergone the required three-year testing although it is on the approved list. How do you intend to carry out the decision taken in Plenary on 24 May as regards Chardon LL?

Janet Ryder: Nid yw'r hedyn Chardon LL wedi bod drwy'r profion tair blynedd angenrheidiol er ei fod ar y rhestr gymeradwyedig. Sut ydych chi'n bwriadu gweithredu'r penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd ar 24 Mai ynghylch Chardon LL?

Carwyn Jones: It appears that, when Chardon LL was first tested in France, the tests were not carried out in accordance with the rules. The Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food in London has written to the European Commission asking for its view on the status of those tests. I support MAFF's stance on that.

Carwyn Jones: Ymddengys, pan brofwyd Chardon LL gyntaf yn Ffrainc, na chynhaliwyd y profion yn unol â'r rheolau. Ysgrifennodd y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn Llundain at y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gofyn am ei farn ar statws y profion hynny. Cefnogaf farn y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd ar hynny.

Mick Bates: In light of the Phillips report and its demand for greater openness and the acceptance of the precautionary principle—and as Welsh advice was not accepted during the BSE crisis—what Welsh advice has been given to Nick Brown in respect of GM development?

Mick Bates: Yng ngoleuni adroddiad Phillips a'i alwad i fod yn fwy agored a derbyn yr egwyddor ragofalus—a chan na dderbyniwyd cyngor Cymreig yn ystod yr argyfwng BSE—pa gyngor Cymreig a roddwyd i Nick Brown ynghylch datblygu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig?

Carwyn Jones: If you are talking about the genetically modified crop trials, MAFF and the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions are aware of the National Assembly's strong stance on this. We have explained why we took that stance. We do not have separate scientific evidence in Wales that is different from that which is available in the rest of the UK.

Peter Rogers: What assessment have you made of the quality of the scientific advice that you have received on Chardon LL, and will you ensure that all that advice is made available to the public?

Carwyn Jones: Advice is given either with the intention that it should be made public or that it is confidential. If we receive advice confidentially, it would not normally be made available, although I would look into reasons for making it available. I have no reason to doubt the scientific advice that I have received. However, I am now aware that the tests that were carried out on Chardon LL in France do not appear to have conformed with the rules. I will investigate that further.

Carwyn Jones: Os ydych yn siarad am dreialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig, mae'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd ac Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau yn ymwybodol o farn gref y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar hyn. Yr ydym wedi esbonio pam y cymerasom y farn honno. Nid oes gennym dystiolaeth wyddonol ar wahân yng Nghymru sydd yn wahanol i'r hyn sydd ar gael yng ngweddill y DU.

Peter Rogers: Pa asesiad a wnaethoch o ansawdd y cyngor gwyddonol a dderbyniasoch ar Chardon LL, ac a fyddwch yn sicrhau y bydd yr holl gyngor hwnnw ar gael i'r cyhoedd?

Carwyn Jones: Rhoddir cyngor naill ai â'r bwriad y dylid ei wneud yn gyhoeddus neu ei fod yn gyfrinachol. Os byddwn yn cael cyngor cyfrinachol, ni fyddai ar gael fel arfer, er y byddwn yn edrych am resymau dros sicrhau ei fod ar gael. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw reswm i amau'r cyngor gwyddonol a dderbyniais. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf bellach yn ymwybodol nad ymddengys bod y profion a wnaethpwyd ar Chardon LL yn Ffrainc wedi cydymffurfio â'r rheolau. Byddaf yn ymchwilio i hynny ymhellach.

Trochi Defaid a'i Effaith ar Ffermwyr Sheep Dip and its Effect on Farmers

Q2 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Following the announcement on Friday, 20 October 2000 that a test case into sheep dip and its effect on farmers has been abandoned, what discussions has Carwyn Jones had with colleagues in the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food concerning its implications for Welsh farmers? (OAQ7623)

Carwyn Jones: I am advised, with regard to that case, that the potential for litigation remains. Without prejudice negotiations are still taking place between the parties, and the matter is therefore still sub judice. It would be inappropriate for me to comment on an individual case.

However, I support the efforts to ensure

C2 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad ddydd Gwener, 20 Hydref 2000 fod achos prawf ar drochi defaid a'i effaith ar ffermwyr wedi cael ei adael a'i roi heibio, pa drafodaethau y mae Carwyn Jones wedi'u cynnal â'i gydweithwyr yn y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd mewn cysylltiad â goblygiadau hynny i ffermwyr Cymru? (OAQ7623)

Carwyn Jones: Fe'm cynghorir, mewn perthynas â'r achos hwnnw, fod y posibilrwydd o ymglyfreitha yn parhau. Mae negodiadau diragfarn yn parhau rhwng y pleidiau, ac felly mae'r mater yn parhau i fod yn sub judice. Byddai'n amhriodol imi roi sylwadau ar achos unigol.

Fodd bynnag, cefnogaf yr ymdrechion i

protection for human health. I also support any moves that can be made to ensure that dipping is beneficial to animal health and to the economic wellbeing of farming in Wales, although not at the expense of human health.

Nick Bourne: Although I recognise Carwyn's point on that particular case, does he agree that there is an issue of political expediency here? There is widespread concern among many people who appear to have been disabled by this sheep dip that the Government is giving way to political expediency because of the danger of being sued if the licences are withdrawn. Will Carwyn therefore support efforts for a thorough investigation into the effect of these sheep dips or mass support for a test case?

Carwyn Jones: This is an extremely contentious area. There is a large amount of anecdotal evidence about the link between organophosphate dips and illnesses such as dipper's flu. The Committee on Toxicity of Chemicals in Food, Consumer Products and the Environment cannot find a direct connection between the two. However, the committee has asked for further research that must continue thoroughly.

Anybody who believes that they might have had an adverse reaction to OP dips, or to any other veterinary medicine, should contact either the Suspected Adverse Reaction Surveillance Scheme at the Veterinary Medicines Directorate, or go through an Assembly Member, or Member of Parliament, to register those concerns. The door is open for people to register their concerns and further research is ongoing.

9:35 a.m.

Methiant y Premiwm Blynnyddol Defaid Presennol y tu allan i'r Ardaloedd Llai Ffafriol The Failure of the Sheep Annual Premium Outside the Less Favoured Areas

Q3 Alison Halford: Will Carwyn Jones make a statement on the affects of the European Commission's evaluation of the common organisation of the markets in the sheep and goatmeat sector on the Welsh sheep industry, particularly its statement on the failure of the existing sheep annual

sicrhau diogelwch ar gyfer iechyd dynol. Cefnogaf hefyd unrhyw gamau y gellir eu cymryd i sicrhau bod trochi o fudd i iechyd anifeiliaid a lles economaidd ffermio yng Nghymru, ond nid ar draul iechyd dynol.

Nick Bourne: Er fy mod yn cydnabod pwynt Carwyn ar yr achos arbennig hwnnw, a gytuna fod mater o hwylustod gwleidyddol yma? Ceir pryder eang ymysg llawer o bobl yr ymddengys iddynt ddioddef anabledd oherwydd y dip defaid hwn fod y Llywodraeth yn ildio i hwylustod gwleidyddol oherwydd y perygl o gael ei herlyn os caiff y trwyddedau eu tynnu'n ôl. Felly a fydd Carwyn yn cefnogi ymdrechion i gael ymchwiliad trylwyr i effaith y dipiau defaid hyn neu'n casglu cefnogaeth ar gyfer achos prawf?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hwn yn faes dadleuol iawn. Ceir llawer o dystiolaeth anecdotaidd ynglŷn â'r cyswllt rhwng trochfeydd organoffosffad a salwch megis fflw y trochydd. Ni all y Pwyllgor ar Wenwyndra Cemegion mewn Bwyd, Nwyddau Defnyddwyr a'r Amgylchedd ganfod cysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng y ddau. Fodd bynnag, gofynnodd y Pwyllgor am ymchwil pellach sydd yn gorfod parhau yn drylwyr.

Dylai unrhyw un sydd yn credu y gallant fod wedi adweithio'n ddrwg i drochfeydd organoffosffad, neu i unrhyw foddion milfeddygol arall, gysylltu naill ai â'r Cynllun Gwylidwraeth Amheuaeth o Adwaith Drwg yn y Gyfarwyddiaeth Moddion Milfeddygol, neu fynd drwy Aelod o'r Cynulliad, neu Aelod Seneddol, i gofrestru'r pryderon hynny. Mae'r drws ar agor i bobl gofrestru eu pryderon ac mae ymchwil pellach yn parhau.

C3 Alison Halford: A wnaiff Carwyn Jones ddatganiad ar effeithiau gwerthusiad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd o drefniadaeth gyffredinol y marchnadoedd yn y sector defaid a chig gafr ar ddiwydiant defaid Cymru, yn enwedig ei ddatganiad am fethiant y premiwm blynnyddol defaid presennol y tu

premium outside the less favoured areas? (OAQ7631)
 allan i'r ardaloedd llai ffafriol? (OAQ7631)

Carwyn Jones: The recently published evaluation report will inform the Commission's proposals, which are expected in the new year, for reform of the sheepmeat regime. The report contains a number of proposals but does not come out with a recommended approach to reform the regime.

Carwyn Jones: Bydd yr adroddiad gwerthuso a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar yn llywio cynigion y Comisiwn, a ddisgwylir yn y flwyddyn newydd, ar gyfer ad-drefnu'r system gig oen. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys nifer o gynigion ond nid yw'n cynnig ymagwedd a argymhellir i ad-drefnu'r system.

Alison Halford: I congratulate you on commencing your review to determine the vision of farming in Wales, but will it also embrace the fact that, as sheep get older—like human beings—they lose their teeth? Unlike human beings, they cannot replace them with dentures, and these old sheep with no teeth raise serious welfare implications. This worries me, as I represent a farming area. Will this be considered in your excellent review?

Alison Halford: Fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar ddechrau eich adolygiad i bennu'r weledigaeth ffermio yng Nghymru, ond a fydd hefyd yn ystyried y ffaith, wrth i ddefaid heneiddio—fel bodau dynol—eu bod yn colli eu dannedd? Yn wahanol i fodau dynol, ni allant ddefnyddio dannedd gosod i gymryd eu lle, ac mae'r hen ddefaid hyn heb ddannedd yn codi oblygiadau lles difrifol. Pryderaf am hyn, gan fy mod yn cynrychioli ardal ffermio. A ystyrir hyn o fewn eich adolygiad gwych?

Carwyn Jones: You raise two issues. One is properly in the purview of my colleague Jane Hutt, that of human tooth loss. The other is the welfare matter that you raised. The purpose of this group is to look at a vision of farming in the future; it will look at a broad vision, not at specific proposals at this stage. Once the broad vision is in place, any welfare concerns can be raised and we can move towards their solution. However, the idea behind the new group is not to look in great detail at this stage.

Carwyn Jones: Codasoch ddau fater. Daw un ohonynt o fewn maes fy nghyd-Aelod Jane Hutt, sef colli dannedd dynol. Y llall yw'r mater o les a godasoch. Pwrpas y grŵp hwn yw edrych ar weledigaeth o ffermio yn y dyfodol; bydd yn edrych ar weledigaeth eang, nid ar gynigion penodol ar hyn o bryd. Unwaith y bydd y weledigaeth eang yn ei lle, gellir codi unrhyw bryderon am les a gallwn symud tuag at eu datrys. Fodd bynnag, nid edrych yn fanwl iawn yw'r syniad y tu ôl i'r grŵp newydd ar hyn o bryd.

Glyn Davies: I declare an interest as an owner of a sheep. [*Laughter.*] Last weekend I checked that all my sheep had teeth; it is a serious point.

Glyn Davies: Datganaf fuddiant fel perchennog dafad. [*Chwerthin.*] Y penwythnos diwethaf sicrheais fod gan pob un o'm defaid ddannedd; mae'n fater difrifol.

Does Carwyn agree that any change to the sheep annual premium to an area basis should happen over a long time because of the unacceptable disruption a sudden change would make to an industry that is in such a financial crisis?

A gytuna Carwyn y dylai unrhyw newid i'r premiwm defaid blynyddol i sail ardal ddigwydd dros gyfnod hir o amser oherwydd yr amhariad annerbyniol a ddeuai yn sgîl newid sydyn i ddiwydiant sydd mewn cymaint o argyfwng ariannol?

Carwyn Jones: There are no pressures within the European Commission to change the sheep regime. In my view this is not the right time to look at a substantial review, given the fact that we have gone through a change with the Tir Mynydd scheme. Now is

Carwyn Jones: Ni cheir pwysau o fewn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i newid y system ddefaid. Yn fy marn i nid dyma'r amser cywir i edrych ar adolygiad sylweddol, o ystyried ein bod wedi cael newid gyda chynllun Tir Mynydd. Nid yn awr yw'r amser

not the time to do anything substantial. Having said that, I will attend the agriculture council in Brussels on November 21 and 22, where this matter will be discussed, and I will follow the matter closely and make representations on behalf of Welsh farmers to ensure that there is no radical change.

Elin Jones: O gofio pwysigrwydd y sector defaid yng Nghymru—defaid o bob oedran—a yw'r Gweinidog yn barod i gadarnhau mai ef fydd yn arwain dirprwyaeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol i gyfarfod â'r Gweinidogion ym Mrwsel ym mis Tachwedd, neu ai dim ond mynychu'r cyfarfod wrth gefn Nick Bourne—Nick Brown hynny yw?

Carwyn Jones: Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol bod Nick Bourne wedi'i ethol yn Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn sicr yr hoffai gymryd yr awenau pe câi'r cyfle. Ni chaiff, wrth gwrs.

Siaradaf am hyn â'm cymheiriaid yn y DU. Mae hyn yn bwysig hefyd i gynhyrchwyr a ffermwyr yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae'n bwysig bod gan Gymru, Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban lais cryf er mwyn sicrhau bod buddiannau Cymru yn cael eu cynrychioli'n gryf. Byddaf yn siarad am hyn â Nick Brown, Ross Finnie, Gweinidog yr Alban dros Ddatblygu Gwledig, a Brid Rogers, Gweinidog Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig Gogledd Iwerddon.

i wneud unrhyw beth sylweddol. Wedi dweud hynny, byddaf yn mynychu'r cyngor amaethyddiaeth ym Mrwsel ar Dachwedd 21 a 22, lle y trafodir y mater hwn, a byddaf yn dilyn y mater yn agos ac yn rhoi sylwadau ar ran ffermwyr Cymru i sicrhau na cheir unrhyw newid radical.

Elin Jones: Considering the importance of the sheep sector in Wales—sheep of all ages—is the Minister ready to confirm that he will lead the United Kingdom delegation to meet Ministers in Brussels in November, or will he just be attending the meeting hanging on Nick Bourne's coat-tails—I mean Nick Brown?

Carwyn Jones: I was not aware that Nick Bourne had been elected as Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food in England. I am sure that he would love to take up that post if it arose. It will not, of course.

I will talk about this with my counterparts in the UK. This is also important to the producers and farmers of Scotland and Northern Ireland. It is important that Wales, Northern Ireland and Scotland have a strong voice to ensure that the interests of Wales are strongly represented. I will discuss this with Nick Brown, Ross Finnie, the Scottish Minister for Rural Development, and Brid Rogers, the Northern Ireland Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development.

Y Rheoliadau Hadau (Rhestr Genedlaethol o Amrywiadau) 2000 The Seeds (National List of Varieties) Regulations 2000

Q4 Peter Black: What response has Carwyn Jones received from the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food to the Assembly's decision of 19 October to reject the Seeds (National List of Varieties) Regulations 2000? (OAQ7617)

Carwyn Jones: There has been no formal response from MAFF.

Peter Black: In setting up an all-party committee to consider and take forward the issue of genetic modification, will you consider involving the UK's other nations to try to establish a Welsh lead on this and a

C4 Peter Black: Pa ymateb y mae Carwyn Jones wedi ei gael gan y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd i benderfyniad y Cynulliad ar 19 Hydref i wrthod y Rheoliadau Hadau (Rhestr Genedlaethol o Amrywiadau) 2000? (OAQ7617)

Carwyn Jones: Ni chafwyd unrhyw ymateb ffurfiol gan y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd.

Peter Black: Wrth sefydlu pwyllgor o'r holl bleidiau i ystyried a gweithredu ar y mater o addasu yn enetig, a ystyriwch gynnwys cenhedloedd eraill y DU i geisio sefydlu arweiniad Cymreig ar hyn ac ymagwedd

common approach to GM crops throughout the United Kingdom.

Carwyn Jones: That is an interesting idea, Peter. The opposition to GM crop trials is not as strong in other UK territories. It is, therefore, a matter on which Wales can take a lead. Letters have been sent to the agricultural spokespeople of leading political parties asking for their nominations to the strategy group. The GM issue has particular resonance in Wales and we can provide a lead. If others wish to follow, we will be happy to work with them. It is fair to say that the issue has a higher profile in Wales than in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland at the moment.

William Graham: Will the Minister resist emphatically all measures that will allow the introduction of GM seeds in Wales? Will he reassure farmers, particularly those engaged in organic farming, that he will fervently seek to protect the value of their crops and their livelihoods?

Carwyn Jones: It is important that we protect and enhance the organic sector. About three weeks ago, I announced that the organic sector will benefit from a 120 per cent rise in grant availability to encourage what is an environmentally friendly and profitable sector. It must be preserved and developed. It is the established policy of the National Assembly to resist the planting and growing of GM seeds and crops as much as possible. The Assembly does not have complete control over this, as it is subject to European legislation. Nevertheless, I am aware of the Assembly's firm policy, which will be conveyed to people in appropriate terms if the growing of GM crops is proposed in Wales in the future.

gyffredin tuag at gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig drwy'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n syniad diddorol, Peter. Nid yw'r gwrthwynebiad i dreialon cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig mor gryf mewn tiriogaethau eraill yn y DU. Felly, mae'n fater y gall Cymru arwain arno. Anfonwyd llythyrau at lefarwyr amaethyddol pleidiau gwleidyddol arweiniol yn gofyn am eu henwebiadau i'r grŵp strategaeth. Mae pwysigrwydd arbennig i'r mater cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru a gallwn ddarparu arweiniad. Os bydd eraill am ddilyn, byddwn yn hapus i weithio â hwy. Mae'n deg dweud bod gan y mater broffil uwch yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon ar hyn o bryd.

William Graham: A wrthoda'r Gweinidog yn bendant bob mesur fydd yn galluogi cyflwyno hadau cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yng Nghymru? A wnaiff sicrhau ffermwyr, yn enwedig y rhai sydd yn gysylltiedig â ffermio organig, y bydd yn gweithio'n frwd i ddiogelu gwerth eu cnydau a'u bywoliaeth?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn diogelu ac yn gwella'r sector organig. Tua thair wythnos yn ôl, datganais y bydd y sector organig yn elwa ar godiad o 120 y cant mewn argaeledd grant i annog yr hyn sydd yn sector cyfeillgar i'r amgylchedd a phroffidiol. Rhaid ei gadw a'i ddatblygu. Polisi sefydlog y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw gwrthod plannu a thyfu hadau a chnydau a addaswyd yn enetig gymaint â phosibl. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad reolaeth lawn dros hyn, gan ei fod yn amodol ar ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bolisi cadarn y Cynulliad, a gaiff ei gyfleu i bobl mewn termau priodol os cynigir tyfu cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol.

Cymorth i'r rheini sydd o dan Bwysau yn yr Ardaloedd Gwledig Support for those with Stress in Rural Areas

Q5 Kirsty Williams: How much money is being spent from the Assembly's agriculture budget to provide support for those with stress in rural areas? (OAQ7622)

C5 Kirsty Williams: Faint o arian o gyllideb amaethyddiaeth y Cynulliad sydd yn cael ei wario ar roi cymorth i'r rheini sydd o dan bwysau yn yr ardaloedd gwledig? (OAQ7622)

Carwyn Jones: That is an important question. To help relieve stress in rural areas, the farmers' helpline was launched on 1 July to provide free agricultural business advice. Its cost of around £150,000 a year is provided from the Assembly's agriculture budget. In addition, the Assembly is developing a package of measures under Objective 1 and the rural development plan for Wales, which will help to alleviate the practical business-related problems that cause stress for farmers and their families. Those measures will include the Farming Connect initiative, which has been strongly promoted by your colleague, Mick Bates. It will provide training, information and advisory services, along with free one-to-one business advice. That includes a farm business review service to consider all aspects of the farm's business and help farmers to decide how to develop their businesses. Farming Connect represents about £12 million of European and match funding resources for 2000-06.

As regards health, Jane Hutt has made £125,000 a year available for three years to expand the all-Wales CALL helpline, and special arrangements will be made to address the needs of rural communities. It is our intention, therefore, to provide business advice to relieve stress, and also provide means to relieve stress that affects health.

Kirsty Williams: Those measures, especially the Farming Connect initiative, are very welcome. Since the completion of the MacFarland report on rural stress last spring, what discussions have you had with the Minister for Health and Social Services about making the report public and acting on its recommendations?

Carwyn Jones: I have not had discussions about that report with the Minister for Health and Social Services yet. It relates to health and is squarely within the purview of the Minister for Health and Social Services, who will take matters forward very strongly. I recognise the problems facing farmers and others in rural communities. The plans for the expansion of the CALL helpline are well advanced and are due to be completed in April next year. Importantly, to ensure that

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n gwestiwn pwysig. I helpu wrth leddfu pwysau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lansiodd llinell gymorth i ffermwyr ar 1 Gorffennaf i ddarparu cyngor busnes amaethyddol am ddim. Telir ei gost o tua £150,000 y flwyddyn o gyllideb amaethyddiaeth y Cynulliad. Yn ogystal, mae'r Cynulliad yn datblygu pecyn o fesurau o dan Amcan 1 a'r cynllun datblygu gwledig i Gymru, a fydd yn helpu wrth ddatrys y problemau ymarferol sydd yn gysylltiedig â busnes sydd yn achosi pwysau i ffermwyr a'u teuluoedd. Bydd y mesurau hynny'n cynnwys y fenter Cyswllt Ffermio, a hyrwyddwyd yn gryf gan eich cyd-aelod, Mick Bates. Darpara hyfforddiant, gwybodaeth a gwasanaethau cynghori, ynghyd â chyngor busnes wyneb yn wyneb am ddim. Mae hynny'n cynnwys gwasanaeth adolygu busnes fferm i ystyried pob agwedd ar fusnes y fferm a helpu ffermwyr wrth benderfynu sut i ddatblygu eu busnesau. Mae Cyswllt Ffermio yn cynrychioli tua £12 miliwn o arian Ewropeaidd ac adnoddau arian cyfatebol ar gyfer 2000-06.

Ynglŷn ag iechyd, mae Jane Hutt wedi sicrhau bod £125,000 y flwyddyn ar gael am dair blynedd i ehangu llinell gymorth CALL Cymru gyfan, a gwneir trefniadau arbennig i ymdrin ag anghenion cymunedau gwledig. Felly, ein bwriad yw darparu cyngor busnes i leddfu pwysau, a hefyd i ddarparu modd i leddfu pwysau sydd yn effeithio ar iechyd.

Kirsty Williams: Croesewir y mesurau hynny yn fawr, yn enwedig y fenter Cyswllt Ffermio. Ers cwblhau adroddiad MacFarland ar bwysau gwledig y gwanwyn diwethaf, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynglŷn â rhyddhau'r adroddiad i'r cyhoedd a gweithredu ar ei argymhellion?

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi trafod yr adroddiad hwnnw gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol eto. Mae'n ymwneud ag iechyd ac mae yn bendant o fewn maes y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, fydd yn symud y materion hyn yn eu blaenau yn gryf iawn. Cydnabyddaf y problemau sydd yn wynebu ffermwyr ac eraill mewn cymunedau gwledig. Mae'r cynlluniau ar gyfer ehangu llinell gymorth CALL yn

the service is properly promoted to rural areas, a separate number and separate publicity material will be used for rural stress issues.

ddatblygedig iawn a disgwylir iddynt gael eu cwblhau ym mis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Yn bwysig, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y gwasanaeth ei hyrwyddo'n gywir i ardaloedd gwledig, defnyddir rhif a deunydd cyhoeddusrwydd ar wahân ar gyfer materion pwysau gwledig.

9:45 a.m.

David Lloyd: Yr ydych wedi crybwyll eisoes fod llawer o'r pwysau hwn yn ymwneud â'r ffaith bod ein cymunedau gwledig yn dadfeilio ac yn colli gwasanaethau. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod arian Amcan 1 yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n llawn ar gyfer prosiectau i adfer ein cymunedau gwledig?

David Lloyd: You have already suggested that much of this stress relates to the fact that our rural communities are in decline and losing services. Will you ensure that Objective 1 funding is used fully for projects to restore our rural communities?

Carwyn Jones: Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru sydd yn gyfrifol am ystyried ceisiadau am arian Amcan 1 ac am sicrhau bod y ceisiadau'n gryf ac yn effeithiol, felly mater i'r swyddfa honno yw hynny. Byddwn yn croesawu unrhyw gefnogaeth a roddir i'r rhai sydd yn byw yng nghefn gwlad i gynorthwyo â'r broblem hon.

Carwyn Jones: The Welsh European Funding Office is responsible for considering applications for Objective 1 funding and for ensuring that the applications are strong and effective, so that is a matter for it. I would welcome any support given to those living in rural areas to assist with this problem.

Rhestru Hadau a Addaswyd yn Enetig The Listing of Genetically Modified Seeds

Q6 Jocelyn Davies: Will Carwyn Jones make a statement to explain the Government of Wales's position on the listing of genetically modified seeds? (OAQ7693)

C6 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff Carwyn Jones ddatganiad i esbonio safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru ar restru hadau a addaswyd yn enetig? (OAQ7693)

Carwyn Jones: The UK's national list system implements EU directives. It is a consumer protection measure ensuring that only seed meeting certain minimum quality standards is sold to farmers. All varieties of the main agriculture and vegetable species, including GM varieties, must be either on the UK national list or on the EU common catalogue before they may be marketed in the UK. The power to accept the seed variety onto the national list is a joint function of the National Assembly, the Ministry for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food and other devolved administrations. There must be unanimity to effect a decision to accept or reject a variety. Varieties will only be added to the UK national list if all the EU requirements have been met.

Carwyn Jones: Gweithreda system rhestr genedlaethol y DU gyfarwyddiadau'r UE. Mae'n fesur gwarchod defnyddwyr sydd yn sicrhau mai dim ond hadau sydd yn cynnwys isafswm safonau ansawdd penodol a werthir i ffermwyr. Rhaid i bob math o'r y prif rywogaethau amaethyddol a llysiau, gan gynnwys mathau cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, fod naill ai ar restr genedlaethol y DU neu yng nghatalog cyffredin yr UE cyn y gellir eu marchnata yn y DU. Mae'r pŵer i dderbyn y math o hedyn i'r rhestr genedlaethol yn gydsyddogaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd a gweinyddiaethau eraill a ddatganolwyd. Rhaid cael unfrydedd er mwyn gweithredu penderfyniad i dderbyn neu wrthod math o hedyn. Dim ond i restr genedlaethol y DU y caiff y mathau eu hychwanegu os bydd holl

ofynion yr UE wedi'u cwrdd.

Jocelyn Davies: Following on from your earlier answers, Carwyn, will you clarify if it is your intention to list Chardon LL despite the inadequate field trials and the opposition of the Assembly to that listing?

Jocelyn Davies: Yn dilyn eich atebion cynharach, Carwyn, a eglurwch os bwriadwch restru Chardon LL er gwaethaf y treialon maes annigonol a gwrthwynebiad y Cynulliad i'r rhestru hwnnw?

Carwyn Jones: I am concerned about the trial that was carried out on Chardon LL. That concern has been expressed to MAFF in London. At present, I have no plans to do anything until further information is available.

Carwyn Jones: Pryderaf am y treial a gynhaliwyd ar Chardon LL. Mynegwyd y pryder hwnnw i'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn Llundain. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gennyf unrhyw gynlluniau i wneud unrhyw beth tan y bydd gwybodaeth bellach ar gael.

Alun Cairns: In the spirit of open Government and transparency, does the Minister condemn the Labour Government's secrecy on the GM maize trials in Shropshire, just across the border?

Alun Cairns: Yn ysbryd Llywodraeth agored a thryloywder, a feirmiada'r Gweinidog gyfrinachedd y Llywodraeth Lafur ynglŷn â'r treialon india-corn a addaswyd yn enetig yn Swydd Amwythig, yn union dros y ffin?

Carwyn Jones: Shropshire is not in Wales and, therefore, this is not a matter that concerns me.

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw Swydd Amwythig yng Nghymru ac, felly, nid yw'n fater sydd yn ymwneud â mi.

Datganiad ar Adolygiad Carlile Statement on the Carlile Review

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): This statement is on the review of safeguards for children and young people treated and cared for by the NHS in Wales, which begins today.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Mae'r datganiad hwn yn adolygiad o gamau diogelu ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc a gafodd eu trin ac y gofalwyd amdanynt gan yr NHS yng Nghymru, sydd yn dechrau heddiw.

We all consider the safety of children as being of paramount importance. It is important that parents and carers have confidence that their children are properly safeguarded whenever and wherever they leave them in the care of our public services. The NHS provides services to all children and provides more extensive care for some of our most vulnerable young people. It was, therefore, of particular concern that during the course of the north Wales child abuse inquiry, the tribunal heard allegations of abuse from former patients of a NHS facility. The tribunal concluded that it was unable to consider these allegations as they fell outside its terms of reference, since the children were not in care. In response, the Welsh Office gave an undertaking to ensure that each

Yr ydym oll yn ystyried bod diogelwch plant yn eithriadol o bwysig. Mae'n bwysig bod rhieni a chynhalwyr yn ffyddiog y caiff eu plant eu diogelu yn iawn pa bryd bynnag a lle bynnag y'u gadewir yng ngofal ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Darpara'r NHS wasanaethau ar gyfer pob plentyn a darpara ofal ehangach dros rai o'n pobl ifanc mwyaf diamddiffyn. Felly, yr oedd yn destun pryder arbennig yn ystod yr ymchwiliad i gam-drin plant yng ngogledd Cymru, bod y tribiwnlys wedi clywed honiadau o gamdriniaeth gan gyn gleifion un o gyfleusterau'r NHS. Daeth y tribiwnlys i'r casgliad na allai ystyried yr honiadau hyn am iddynt syrthio y tu allan i'w gylch gorchwyl, gan nad oedd y plant mewn gofal. Mewn ymateb i hyn, ymgymerodd y Swyddfa Gymreig i sicrhau yr ymchwilir i

allegation would be properly investigated. It also gave an undertaking to ensure that children and young people receiving in-patient psychiatric care receive proper standards of care and that appropriate safeguards are in place for their protection.

In June 1998, Ron Davies, the Secretary of State for Wales, invited the Health Advisory Service 2000 to undertake an independent inspection of the two child and adolescent mental health units in Wales and two associated adult wards that occasionally admit adolescents. The report highlighted several areas that required immediate attention and others that required longer-term attention. Having received assurances that the matters of immediate concern had been addressed, the health bodies concerned were advised that it was intended to ask the Health Advisory Service 2000 to undertake a follow-up inspection to check the progress that had been made on implementing the other recommendations. That inspection took place in December of last year.

On 7 September, I published the inspection team's findings, which concluded that there was considerable evidence to demonstrate that all the relevant agencies and units had worked hard since 1998 to respond positively to the findings and recommendations contained in the first report. I am pleased to say that I am now satisfied that adequate safeguards are in place to protect young psychiatric patients in the units that were inspected. However, there can never be absolute guarantees and it is important that all individuals and organisations maintain their vigilance.

Earlier this year, we received Sir Ronald Waterhouse's report, 'Lost in Care'. As I said earlier, the tribunal did not feel able to make specific recommendations regarding the national health service. However, I feel that many of the report's recommendations are equally applicable to children cared for by local authorities and those being treated by the NHS. I am keen to ensure that the same standards of protection are offered to children wherever they are, away from their homes.

bob honiad yn iawn. Ymgymrodd hefyd i sicrhau y derbynia plant a phobl ifanc sydd yn derbyn gofal seiciatrig fel cleifion mewnol safonau gofal cywir ac y bydd camau diogelu priodol yn eu lle i'w diogelu.

Ym Mehefin 1998, gwahoddodd Ron Davies, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Wasanaeth Ymgynghorol Iechyd 2000 i gynnal arolygiad annibynnol o'r ddwy uned iechyd y meddwl yng Nghymru i blant a phobl ifanc yn eu harddegau a dwy ward gysylltiedig i oedolion sydd weithiau yn derbyn pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau. Amlygodd yr adroddiad nifer o feysydd a fynnai sylw ar unwaith ac eraill a fynnai sylw yn y tymor hwy. Ar ôl cael sicrwydd y rhoddwyd sylw i'r materion a oedd yn destun pryder uniongyrchol, cynghorwyd y cyrff iechyd dan sylw y bwriedid gofyn i Wasanaeth Ymgynghorol Iechyd 2000 i gynnal ymchwiliad dilynol i wirio'r cynnydd a wnaethpwyd wrth weithredu'r argymhellion eraill. Cynhaliwyd yr arolygiad hwnnw yn Rhagfyr y llynedd.

Ar 7 Medi, cyhoeddais ganfyddiadau'r tîm arolygu, a ddaeth i'r casgliad bod tystiolaeth sylweddol i ddangos bod yr holl asiantaethau ac unedau perthnasol wedi gweithio'n galed ers 1998 i ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r canfyddiadau a'r argymhellion a gynhwyswyd yn yr adroddiad cyntaf. Yr wyf yn falch i ddweud fy mod bellach yn fodlon bod camau diogelu digonol yn eu lle i ddiogelu cleifion seiciatrig ifanc yn yr unedau a arolygwyd. Fodd bynnag, ni all byth fod sicrwydd llwyr ac mae'n bwysig bod gwyliadwriaeth pob unigolyn a sefydliadau yn parhau.

Yn gynharach eleni, derbyniasom adroddiad Syr Ronald Waterhouse, 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal'. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, ni themlai'r tribiwnlys y gallai wneud argymhellion penodol o safbwynt y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf fod llawer o argymhellion yr adroddiad yr un mor berthnasol i blant y gofelig amdanynt gan awdurdodau lleol a'r rheini y mae'r NHS yn eu trin. Yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau y cynnigir yr un safonau diogelwch i blant, lle bynnag y bôn i ffrwrdd o'u cartrefi.

I have been considering how best to extend the lessons learnt from the Health Advisory Service inspections and the north Wales child abuse inquiry to the whole of the NHS. I have, therefore, decided to establish a multi-disciplinary panel of experts, under the chairmanship of Lord Carlile of Berriew QC—the former MP for Montgomery—to undertake a review of the arrangements for the care and safety of children and young people who are treated and cared for by the NHS in Wales, regardless of speciality.

The panel includes medical, nursing, social services, legal and police experts as well as, most importantly, children's and user group representatives. The first meeting will take place later today. I have asked it to take account of the work undertaken by the Health Advisory Service and Sir Ronald Waterhouse, as well as other relevant guidance, best practice and other developments when making its recommendations. I anticipate receiving the panel's report in late 2001. I have not restricted this review to children being treated in hospital or residential settings, but have asked the panel to consider the safety of children across the range of NHS provision, from primary care provided by GPs, dentists and opticians, through to specialist children's units. I am determined that children being treated by the NHS should be safe, feel safe, be treated as individuals and have their needs met by appropriately skilled, trained and sympathetic staff.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu ac fel cynghorydd sir.

Croesawn y datganiad hwn. Mae'n gwbl angenrheidiol bod ein plant a phobl ifanc yn teimlo'n ddiogel a'u bod yn ddiogel pan gânt eu trin gan y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod pawb yn dal i ddysgu gwersi adroddiad Waterhouse. Cytunaf y dylem ledu'r canllawiau hynny, sydd yn bodoli ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yn sylfaenol, i'r gwasanaeth iechyd.

A ehangwch ar yr union drefniadau sydd yn eu lle i ddiogelu ein plant yn y gwasanaeth

Bûm yn ystyried y ffordd orau i ledu i'r NHS cyfan y gwersi a ddysgwyd gan arolygiadau'r Gwasanaeth Ymgynghorol Iechyd a'r ymchwiliad i gam-drin plant yng ngogledd Cymru. Penderfynais, felly, sefydlu panel aml-ddisgyblaethol o arbenigwyr, o dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd Carlile o Aberriw CF—cyn AS Trefaldwyn—i ymgymryd ag adolygiad o drefniadau gofal a diogelwch plant a phobl ifanc a drinnir ac y gofelir amdanynt gan yr NHS yng Nghymru, waeth beth fo'r arbenigedd.

Mae'r panel yn cynnwys arbenigwyr o'r byd meddygol, nyrsio, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, cyfreithiol a'r heddlu yn ogystal â, yn fwyaf pwysig, cynrychiolwyr plant a grŵp defnyddwyr. Cynhelir y cyfarfod cyntaf yn ddiweddarach heddiw. Gofynnais iddo ystyried y gwaith yr ymgymeryd ag ef gan y Gwasanaeth Ymgynghorol Iechyd a Syr Ronald Waterhouse, yn ogystal ag arweiniad perthnasol arall, arfer gorau a datblygiadau eraill wrth wneud argymhellion. Rhagwelaf y derbyniwn adroddiad y panel ddiwedd 2001. Ni chyfyngais yr adolygiad hwn i blant a gaiff eu trin mewn ysbyty neu sefydliadau preswyl, ond gofynnais i'r panel ystyried diogelwch plant ar draws ystod y ddarpariaeth NHS, o ofal sylfaenol a ddarperir gan feddygon teulu, deintyddion ac optegwyr, i unedau plant arbenigol. Yr wyf yn benderfynol y dylai plant a gaiff eu trin gan yr NHS fod yn ddiogel, y teimlant yn ddiogel, y cânt eu trin fel unigolion ac y diwellir eu hanghenion gan staff medrus, hyfforddedig a chydymdeimladol cymwys.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a general practitioner and as a county councillor.

We welcome this statement. It is essential that our children and young people feel safe and are safe while being treated by the health service. It is also important that everyone continues to learn the lessons of the Waterhouse report. I agree that we should extend those guidelines, which basically exist for local government, to the health service.

Will you expand upon the exact arrangements that are in place to safeguard our children in

iechyd, a nodi pa rai sydd wedi datblygu o'r adroddiad hwnnw? A wnewch hefyd sylwadau ar ddarpariaeth y gwasanaeth hwn i ddiogelu ein plant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

Gwenda Thomas: Do all NHS staff who have contact with children, in whatever way, have to be checked by the police?

Jane Hutt: I thank Dai for welcoming this statement. As a result of the Health Advisory Service inspection reports carried out on the two child and adolescent mental health units and the associated adult wards, we have strengthened the multi-agency working together arrangements that provide safeguards for children. The review will look across the board at all the safeguards that we need to introduce for children in the NHS, if we need to do so. I strongly affirm that that should be about the vulnerabilities of children in whatever context, including understanding their needs through the medium of Welsh.

On Gwenda's point about screening by the police, as far as I understand, any professional who works with a young person or child must be screened by police. I am not sure whether that is the case in terms of the medical profession. It probably is not. I would rather write to you, Gwenda, on that point.

9:55 a.m.

Nick Bourne: In David Melding's absence, I also welcome Jane's statement. We give it unqualified support. We welcome the establishment of the multidisciplinary panel of experts. Lord Carlile is a rare bird of a Liberal Democrat who knows what he is talking about, and we welcome his chairmanship. I see that heads are shaking. You obviously disagree. I will be in touch with David Melding to lend whatever support is necessary.

Kirsty Williams: I welcome your statement this morning. This issue has been of great concern to the Liberal Democrats and myself.

the health service, and note which ones have developed from that report? Will you also comment on the provision of this service to protect our children through the medium of Welsh?

Gwenda Thomas: A oes rhaid i holl staff yr NHS sydd â chysylltiad â phlant, ym mha ffordd bynnag, gael eu harchwilio gan yr heddlu?

Jane Hutt: Diolchaf i Dai am groesawu'r datganiad hwn. O ganlyniad i adroddiadau arolygiad y Gwasanaeth Ymgynghorol Iechyd a gynhaliwyd ar y ddwy uned iechyd meddwl i blant a phobl ifanc yn eu harddegau a wardiau oedolion cysylltiedig, cryfhawyd y trefniadau cydweithio amlasiantaethol sydd yn darparu camau diogelu ar gyfer plant. Bydd yr adolygiad yn edrych yn gyffredinol ar yr holl gamau diogelu y bydd angen inni eu cyflwyno ar gyfer plant yn yr NHS, os oes angen inni wneud hynny. Datganaf yn gadarn y dylai hynny ymwneud â natur ddiameddifyn plant ym mha gyd-destun bynnag, gan gynnwys deall eu hanghenion drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Ar bwynt Gwenda ynghylch sgrinio gan yr heddlu, fel y deallaf, rhaid i'r heddlu sgrinio unrhyw berson proffesiynol sydd yn gweithio gyda pherson ifanc neu blentyn. Nid wyf yn siwr a yw hynny yn wir o ran y proffesiwn meddygol. Nid ydyw, fwy na thebyg. Byddai'n well gennyf ysgrifennu atoch chi, Gwenda, ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Nick Bourne: Yn absenoldeb David Melding, croesawaf innau hefyd ddatganiad Jane. Fe'i cefnogwn yn bendant. Croesawn sefydlu panel amlddisgyblaethol o arbenigwyr. Mae'r Arglwydd Carlile yn aderyn prin ymhlith y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a wŷr am beth y siarada, a chroesawn ei gadeiryddiaeth. Gwelaf bennau'n ysgwyd. Mae'n amlwg na chytunwch. Byddaf mewn cysylltiad â David Melding i estyn pa gymorth bynnag sydd ei angen.

Kirsty Williams: Croesawaf eich datganiad y bore yma. Bu'r mater hwn yn destun cryn byrder i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac i mi

We are pleased that you have responded to these concerns in such a robust manner by instigating this report under the chairmanship of Lord Carlile and by the wide-ranging nature of the remit of the expert panel. We have been in correspondence about that and I am pleased that we have undertaken this review in the broadest possible sense. Can you confirm that this review will examine services that are not just delivered, but also commissioned, in Wales for Welsh children, and what plans do you have to include the Children's Commissioner in this panel once the post has been filled?

Jane Hutt: The commissioning of services outside Wales is a cross-border issue so the review team will have to investigate that. When the commissioning of services starts in Wales, the commissioning body will have a responsibility to ensure that the review team examines what that means for the service outside Wales. This will be complementary to the work of the Children's Commissioner who, we hope, will be in post in the new year. We will have to demonstrate that the Assembly is committed to safeguarding children and young people in this area of work. We anticipate that the Children's Commissioner will want to give evidence or liaise closely with the review team. The stature of Lord Carlile in leading this review is significant for us and I am delighted that a Liberal Democrat peer has agreed to do this.

fy hunan. Yr ydym yn falch eich bod wedi ymateb i'r pryderon hyn mor gadarn drwy ysgogi'r adroddiad hwn o dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd Carlile a thrwy natur eang cylch gwaith y panel arbenigol. Yr ydym wedi gohebu ynghylch hynny ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi ymgymryd â'r adolygiad hwn yn yr ystyr ehangaf posibl. A allwch gadarnhau y bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn archwilio gwasanaethau a gaiff, nid yn unig eu cyflwyno, ond hefyd eu comisiynu yng Nghymru ar gyfer plant Cymru, a pha gynlluniau sydd gennych i gynnwys y Comisiynydd Plant yn y panel hwn unwaith y llenwir y swydd?

Jane Hutt: Mae comisiynu gwasanaethau y tu allan i Gymru yn fater trawsffiniol, felly bydd yn rhaid i'r tîm adolygu ymchwilio i hynny. Pan fydd comisiynu gwasanaethau yn dechrau yng Nghymru, bydd gan y corff comisiynu gyfrifoldeb dros sicrhau y bydd y tîm adolygu yn archwilio beth fydd hynny'n ei olygu i'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i Gymru. Bydd hyn yn ategol i waith y Comisiynydd Plant a fydd, gobeithiwn, yn ei swydd yn y flwyddyn newydd. Rhaid inni ddangos bod y Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i ddiogelu plant a phobl ifanc yn y maes gwaith hwn. Rhagwelwn y bydd y Comisiynydd Plant yn dymuno rhoi tystiolaeth neu drafod yn fanwl â'r tîm adolygu. Mae statws yr Arglwydd Carlile wrth arwain yr adolygiad hwn yn arwyddocaol inni ac yr wyf wrth fy modd bod arglwydd sydd yn Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol wedi cytuno i wneud hyn.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Nick Bourne: My point of order relates to Standing Order No. 1.9 regarding the Presiding Officer's functions and their discharge, and the statue outside. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

Many people seem to be in favour of that statue. I thought that the Labour Party had given up its policy of unilateral—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have asked me to consider a point of order under Standing Order No. 1.9.

Nick Bourne: Mae fy nhwynt o drefn yn ymwneud â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.9 o safbwynt swyddogaethau'r Llywydd a'i ddull o'u cyflawni, a'r cerflun y tu allan. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.]

Ymddengys bod llawer o bobl o blaid y cerflun hwnnw. Credais fod y Blaid Lafur wedi ildio ei bolisi o unochredd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnasoch imi ystyried pwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.9.

Nick Bourne: I have not got to it yet.

Nick Bourne: Nid wyf wedi dod ato eto.

The Presiding Officer: You have referred to an attempt yesterday to raise a point of order on this matter.

Y Llywydd: Cyfeiriasoch at ymgais ddoe i godi pwynt o drefn ar y mater hwn.

Nick Bourne: I have not.

Nick Bourne: Naddo.

The Presiding Officer: Yes, you referred to a statue, a matter that was raised yesterday.

Y Llywydd: Do, cyfeiriasoch at gerflun, mater a godwyd ddoe.

Nick Bourne: It was the day before.

Nick Bourne: Y diwrnod cyn hynny.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This matter was disposed of yesterday. Standing Order No. 1.9 refers to my duties of presiding at Plenary meetings. As far as I am aware, there is no statue in front of me as I preside today. However, if you wish to raise the matter under Standing Order No. 28, you may do so.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Terfynwyd y mater hwn ddoe. Cyfeiria Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.9 at fy nyletswyddau wrth lywyddu mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn. Cyn belled ag y gwn i, nid oes cerflun ger fy mron wrth imi lywyddu heddiw. Fodd bynnag, os dymunwch godi'r mater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 28, cewch wneud hynny.

Nick Bourne: I am obliged, but Standing Order No. 1.9 refers to functions that are 'specified in the Act and standing orders'. We have had assurances that exhibitions and so on in the milling area will be of a non-political nature. On that basis, Business for Sterling, for example, was refused permission to exhibit there. You will be aware that the Greenham women are deeply offensive to many people in the country who do not share—

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar, ond cyfeiria Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.9 at swyddogaethau 'a bennir yn y Ddeddf a'r rheolau sefydlog'. Cawsom sicrwydd y bydd arddangosfeydd ac ati yn y neuadd o natur amhleidiol. Ar y sail honno, gwrthodwyd caniatâd i Business for Sterling, er enghraifft, arddangos yno. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod merched Comin Greenham yn hynod sarhaus i lawer o bobl yn y wlad nad ydynt yn rhannu—

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Nick Bourne: They undermined the defence of this country in the 1980s.

Nick Bourne: Tanseiliasant amddiffynfa y wlad hon yn yr 1980au.

The Presiding Officer: It is not appropriate for the leader of the Welsh Conservative Party to use the word 'offensive'. I ask him to withdraw it.

Y Llywydd: Nid yw'n briodol i arweinydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru ddefnyddio'r gair 'sarhaus'. Gofynnaf iddo ei dynnu'n ôl.

Nick Bourne: I was using it in the context of deeply held feelings by many people in Wales, which is undoubtedly the case.

Nick Bourne: Fe'i defnyddiais yng nghydestun teimladau angerddol llawer o bobl yng Nghymru, yr hyn sydd yn ddiamau yn wir.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The question of deeply held feelings does not arise when we are discussing the language that we use in this Chamber and the courtesy that I demand towards all Members, be they Greenham women, former Greenham women or not.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r cwestiwn o deimladau angerddol yn codi wrth drafod yr iaith a ddefnyddiwn yn y Siambr hon a'r cwrtseisi a fynnaf tuag at yr holl Aelodau, pa un a ydynt yn ferched Greenham, cyn ferched Greenham neu beidio.

Nick Bourne: I was not referring to anybody in this Chamber. If it was taken in such a way—

The Presiding Officer: I have asked the leader of the Welsh Conservative Party to reconsider the adjective ‘offensive’.

Nick Bourne: I am sorry. I regard it as deeply offensive to many people in this country.

The Presiding Officer: That is not what the leader of the Welsh Conservative Party said and I will check the record.

Nick Bourne: I beg to differ. It is exactly what I said. Please do check the record. To continue the point, in this week before Remembrance Sunday—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not relevant to Standing Order No. 1.9. I have indicated that if you wish to raise the point of order under Standing Order No. 28 on the function of the House Committee, you may do so, but I ask you to do so quickly.

Nick Bourne: I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 28.

The Presiding Officer: On Standing Order No. 28, I advise the leader of the Welsh Conservative Party that the House Committee has not yet met. When it meets, it will advise the Presiding Officer, the Assembly and the Clerk on all matters relating to services, facilities and accommodation for Members, support staff and the general public under Standing Order No. 28(b).

Nick Bourne: Further to that point of order—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I have replied to that point of order. Under Standing Order No. 28.7 a member of the Committee will be appointed to answer questions for oral answer in Plenary in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.3. I look forward to those answers.

Nick Bourne: Further to that point of order.

Nick Bourne: Nid oeddwn yn cyfeirio at unrhyw un yn y Siambr hon. Os y’i cymerwyd yn y fath fodd—

Y Llywydd: Gofynnais i arweinydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru ailystyried yr ansoddair ‘sarhaus’.

Nick Bourne: Mae’n ddrwg gennyf. Ystyriaf ei fod yn hynod sarhaus i lawer o bobl yn y wlad hon.

Y Llywydd: Nid dyna a ddywedodd arweinydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru a byddaf yn gwirio’r cofnod.

Nick Bourne: Rhaid imi anghytuno. Dyna’n union a ddywedais. Gwiriwch y cofnod â chroeso. I barhau â’r pwynt, yn yr wythnos hon cyn Sul y Cofio—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hyn yn berthnasol i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.9. Nodais os hoffech godi’r pwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 28 ar swyddogaeth y Pwyllgor Tŷ, y cewch wneud hynny, ond gofynnaf ichi wneud hynny’n gyflym.

Nick Bourne: Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 28.

Y Llywydd: Ar Reol Sefydlog Rhif 28, hysbysaf arweinydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru nad yw’r Pwyllgor Tŷ wedi cyfarfod eto. Pan fydd yn cyfarfod, bydd yn hysbysu’r Llywydd, y Cynulliad a’r Clerc am bob mater sydd yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau, cyfleusterau a llety ar gyfer Aelodau, staff cynhaliol a’r cyhoedd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 28(b).

Nick Bourne: Ymhellach i’r pwynt hwnnw o drefn—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Atebais y pwynt hwnnw o drefn. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 28.7 penodir aelod o’r Pwyllgor i ateb cwestiynau ar gyfer cwestiwn llafar yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3. Edrychaf ymlaen at yr atebion hynny.

Nick Bourne: Ymhellach i’r pwynt hwnnw

Who determines what goes on in the milling area in the interim?

The Presiding Officer: I determine such matters before the House Committee comes into existence. All those determinations will be referred to the new House Committee and will be reviewed.

David Lloyd: Further to that point of order. As the person to whom the maquette that is in the milling area was presented, and as a man who has not been to Greenham Common, I think that statues that commemorate the varied political thought and history of Wales should be displayed in this, our national amphitheatre. We have a valid tradition of pacifism and opposition to the cruelty of war in Wales. Some people feel strongly about that. We are unusual, and it is right to commemorate that fact by commemorating women's rule. I support the action of having the maquette in the milling area.

Lorraine Barrett: Further to that point of order. I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 1.9. As a daughter of a World War Two veteran and as a former Greenham Common woman—I am proud of both—I will attend remembrance services on Sunday morning. What do you intend to do, Presiding Officer, about the comments made by the leader of the Welsh Conservative Party? He refused to withdraw the word 'offensive' and I find that offensive.

The Presiding Officer: I have asked him to withdraw it and to reconsider. I will review the record and will return to this matter on Tuesday.

Richard Edwards: Further to that point of order, I suggest to Professor Bourne that he should be less exercised about exhibitions in the milling area and more about exhibitions among the boys' club that he leads in this Chamber.

The Presiding Officer: That is not a matter for me.

Cynog Dafis: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Apeliar ar y grŵp Torïaidd, drwyddoch chi, Lywydd, i beidio â gwneud ffyliaid o'u

o drefn. Pwy sydd yn penderfynu beth sydd yn digwydd yn y neuadd yn y cyfamser?

Y Llywydd: Gwnaf benderfyniadau ar faterion o'r fath cyn y daw'r Pwyllgor Tŷ i fodolaeth. Cyfeirir yr holl benderfyniadau hynny at y Pwyllgor Tŷ newydd a chânt eu hadolygu.

David Lloyd: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Fel y person y cyflwynwyd y model sydd yn y neuadd iddo, ac fel dyn na fu yng Nghomin Greenham, credaf y dylid arddangos cerfluniau sydd yn coffâu meddylfryd a hanes gwleidyddol Cymru yma yn ein amffitheatr genedlaethol. Mae gennym draddodiad dilys o heddychiaeth a gwrthwynebiad i greulondeb rhyfeloedd yng Nghymru. Mae gan rai pobl deimladau cryf am hynny. Yr ydym yn anarferol, ac mae'n iawn i goffâu'r ffaith drwy goffâu rheolaeth merched. Cefnogaf y weithred o gael y model yn y neuadd.

Lorraine Barrett: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.9. Fel merch i un o gyn filwyr yr Ail Ryfel Byd ac fel un o gyn ferched Comin Greenham—yr wyf yn falch o'r ddau—byddaf yn mynychu gwasanaethau cofio fore Sul. Beth y bwriadwch ei wneud, Lywydd, ynghylch y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan arweinydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru? Gwrthododd dynnu'r gair 'sarhaus' yn ôl ac ystyriaf hynny yn sarhaus.

Y Llywydd: Gofynnais iddo ei dynnu yn ôl ac ailystyried. Adolygaf y cofnod a dychwelaf at y mater hwn ddydd Mawrth.

Richard Edwards: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, awgrymaf i'r Athro Bourne y dylai boeni llai am arddangosfeydd yn y neuadd a mwy ynghylch arddangosiadau ymhlith clwb y bechgyn o dan ei arweiniad yn y Siambr hon.

Y Llywydd: Nid yw hwnnw'n fater i mi.

Cynog Dafis: Further to that point of order. I appeal to the Tory group, through you Llywydd, not to make fools of themselves on

hunain yn y mater hwn. Maent yn edrych yn hurt eithriadol. Mae'n amlwg nad ydynt yn deall celfyddyd. Mae'n anodd dychmygu unrhyw waith o gelfyddyd a arddangosir yn y neuadd nad oes rhyw fath o ystyr gwleidyddol iddo. Mae bron pob celfyddyd yn wleidyddol. Mae gan bob celfyddyd neges ac y mae'n rhaid i bobl ddysgu edrych ar ddarn o gelfyddyd a phenderfynu a ydynt yn cytuno â'r neges ai peidio a gwerthfawrogi ei bod yn bwysig dathlu amrywiaeth barn drwy gelfyddyd.

Rosemary Butler: Further to that point of order. When you check the record of proceedings I am sure that you will agree that Nick Bourne did not say what he claims to have said. He said something that is incredibly offensive to me. This may not be a point of order, but I want information. When the House Committee meets, will people be allowed to give evidence to that Committee or do we have to wait until we have a full debate in this Chamber?

The Presiding Officer: The House Committee is a normal Assembly Committee. As far as I am aware, it has not decided to take evidence in its first meeting, but it can do so, if it wishes.

10:05 a.m.

David Davies: Point of order.

The Presiding Officer: On this point of order?

David Davies: Yes, on this point of order. I clarify that this point of order has been raised by the Welsh Conservatives because we were under the impression that the milling area was not to be used for any political purpose. I went to see you, Llywydd, after Business for Sterling was refused permission to place a stand in the milling area. We discussed the matter and you told me that you were not prepared to allow the milling area to be used politically. I respected your judgment on that, but it is inconsistent for that statue to be there commemorating an organisation that performed illegal acts. It is no good criticising the leader of the Welsh Conservatives for what he said, because what

this matter. They look extremely foolish. It is obvious that they do not understand art. It is difficult to imagine any work of art exhibited in the milling area that does not have some kind of political meaning. Almost all art is political. All art forms have a message and people must learn to look at a piece of art and decide whether or not they agree with that message and appreciate that it is important to celebrate differing opinions through art.

Rosemary Butler: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Pan edrychwch yn y cofnod yr wyf yn siwr y cytunwch na ddywedodd Nick Bourne yr hyn yr honna iddo ei ddweud. Dywedodd rywbeth a oedd yn anghredadwy o sarhaus i mi. Efallai nad yw hyn yn bwynt o drefn, ond dymunaf gael gwybodaeth. Pan gyferfydd y Pwyllgor Tŷ, a gaiff pobl ganiatâd i roi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw neu a fydd yn rhaid inni aros hyd nes y cawn ddatlawn yn y Siambr hon?

Y Llywydd: Mae'r Pwyllgor Tŷ yn un o Bwyllgorau cyffredin y Cynulliad. Cyhyd ag y gwn i, ni phenderfynodd gymryd tystiolaeth yn ei gyfarfod cyntaf, ond gall wneud hynny, os dymuna.

David Davies: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Llywydd: Ar y pwynt hwn o drefn?

David Davies: Ie, ar y pwynt hwn o drefn. Egluraf y codwyd y pwynt hwn o drefn gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig gan ein bod o dan yr argraff nad oedd y neuadd i'w defnyddio at unrhyw ddiben gwleidyddol. Euthum i'ch gweld chi, Lywydd, ar ôl i ganiatâd Business for Sterling i osod stonin yn y neuadd gael ei wrthod. Trafodasom y mater a dywedasoch wrthyf nad oeddech yn barod i ganiatáu i'r neuadd gael ei defnyddio'n wleidyddol. Perchais eich barn ar hynny, ond mae'n anghyson i'r cerflun hwnnw fod yno yn coffáu mudiad a gyflawnodd weithredoedd anghyfreithlon. Nid oes pwynt beirniadu arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig am ddweud yr hyn a wnaeth, oherwydd mae'r

he said is true—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I did not criticise anything that the leader of the Welsh Conservatives said—

David Davies: May I finish my point of order?

The Presiding Officer: Order. No, you may not, because what you are saying is not in order. I was calling the leader of the Welsh Conservatives to order because of the language that he used, which I regard as contrary to our order in Plenary, but I will review the record. The word ‘offensive’ is an offensive one that we should not use here. I will not allow any Members of this Assembly to be described as offensive either by implication or by statement.

David Davies: May I finish my point of order?

The Presiding Officer: No, you may not.

Peter Law: I ask the leader of the old sheep with no teeth, sorry, the Welsh Conservatives—who may be appropriate for future sheep dip trials if no-one else can be found—what he intends to do about apologising for the monuments left throughout Wales after almost 20 years of Tory rule, when they despoiled and devastated many communities, particularly steel and coal communities?

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is not relevant. Your remarks about animals in reference to the Welsh Conservatives are out of order. I would be grateful if you would reconsider them.

Peter Law: It was complementary to them, but I will withdraw—

The Presiding Officer: Order. When I ask Members to reconsider remarks, I expect them to do so carefully and politely, and when I ask Members to withdraw remarks, I expect them to do so. I regret that a matter that should be discussed properly in the House Committee, which was constituted by

hyn a ddywedodd yn wir—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni feirniadais unrhyw beth a ddywedodd arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig—

David Davies: A gaf i orffen fy mhwynt o drefn?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Na chewch, oherwydd nid yw'r hyn a ddywedwch mewn trefn. Galwais arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig i drefn oherwydd yr iaith a ddefnyddiodd, yr hyn a ystyriaf yn groes i'n trefn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, ond adolygaf y cofnod. Mae ‘sarhaus’ yn air sarhaus na ddylem ei ddefnyddio yma. Ni chaniatâf i unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad hwn gael ei ddisgrifio fel sarhaus naill ai drwy ensyniad neu drwy ddatganiad.

David Davies: A gaf i orffen fy nhwynt o drefn?

Y Llywydd: Na chewch.

Peter Law: Gofynnaf i arweinydd yr hen ddefaid diddannedd, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig—a all fod yn addas i'w ddefnyddio ar gyfer treialon dipio defaid yn y dyfodol os na ellir dod o hyd i neb arall—beth y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud ynghylch ymddiheuro am y cofebau a adawyd ledled Cymru ar ôl bron i 20 mlynedd o lywodraeth Doriâidd, pan ddifrodwyd a dinistriwyd llawer o gymunedau, yn arbennig cymunedau dur a glo?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hynny'n berthnasol. Mae eich sylwadau am anifeiliaid wrth gyfeirio at y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig allan o drefn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn eu hailystyried.

Peter Law: Yr oedd yn ganmoliaeth iddynt, ond fe'u tynnaf yn ôl—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Pan ofynnaf i Aelodau ailystyried sylwadau, disgwyliaf iddynt wneud hynny yn ofalus ac yn gwrtais, a phan ofynnaf i Aelodau dynnu sylwadau yn ôl, disgwyliaf iddynt wneud hynny. Gresynaf fod mater y dylid ei drafod yn gywir yn y Pwyllgor Tŷ, a ffurfiwyd drwy etholiad y

election this morning, has become one of time wasting in this Chamber.

bore yma, wedi dod yn fater o wastraffu amser yn y Siambr hon.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Presiding Officer: I call on the Minister for Assembly Business to propose a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.16 to allow a motion to be proposed on the continuation of the independent Nantygwyddon investigation by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar y Trefnydd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16 i ganiatáu i gynnig gael ei gynnig ar barhau astudiaeth annibynnol Nantygwyddon gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, allows the proposal of a motion on the continuation of the independent Nantygwyddon investigation.

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn caniatáu i gynnig gael ei gynnig ar barhau astudiaeth annibynnol Nantygwyddon.

*Cynnig: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

**Parhad o Astudiaeth Nantygwyddon
 Continuation of the Nantygwyddon Investigation**

The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf fod
(Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

resolves that the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee shall continue with the independent investigation into the Nantygwyddon landfill site referred to the former Environment, Planning and Transport Committee on 4 July 2000, and that anything carried out by that Committee is to be regarded as having been carried out by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee for the purposes of the investigation.

yn penderfynu y bydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn parhau â'r astudiaeth annibynnol i safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon a gyfeiriwyd i gyn Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar 4 Gorffennaf 2000, ac y bydd gweithredoedd y Pwyllgor hwnnw i'w hystyried fel gweithredoedd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth i ddibenion yr astudiaeth.

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina

Humphreys, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

Geraint Davies: A gaf ddatgan buddiant?

Geraint Davies: May I declare an interest?

Y Llywydd: Yr ydym yng nghanol pleidlais.

The Presiding Officer: We are in the middle of a vote.

Y mae Geraint Davies a Pauline Jarman yn datgan buddiant.

Geraint Davies and Pauline Jarman declare an interest.

We move rather quickly through these votes but I would be grateful if Members could declare interests before we vote.

Symudwn braidd yn frysioeg drwy'r pleidleisiau hyn ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai Aelodau ddatgan buddiant cyn inni bleidleisio.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Cymru) 2000
 Approval of the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Wales)
 Regulations 2000**

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

considers the principle of The School Government (Terms of Reference) (Wales) Regulations 2000 laid in the Table Office on 11 October 2000.

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Hydref 2000.

I also propose that

Cynigiau hefyd fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

(a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee relating to the draft Order, The School Government (Terms of Reference)

(a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ar y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith)

(Wales) Regulations 2000 laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2000;

(b) approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 11 October 2000.

These regulations relate only to Wales. Similar regulations came into force in England on 1 September. They are made in accordance with powers contained in sections 38 and 138 of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998. These apply to the governing bodies and headteachers of maintained schools. They lay down a number of principles that provide service terms of reference for governing bodies. They also deal with the respective roles and responsibilities of governing bodies and headteachers. The governing body asked to carry out their functions with a view to fulfilling a broadly strategic role. As part of this, they are to establish a strategic framework by setting aims, objectives, policies and targets. The headteacher has responsibility for the day-to-day organisation, management and control of the school, for advising the governing body on the strategic framework and for implementing the policies adopted by the governing body. These regulations impose the duty on the governing body and the headteacher to promote equal opportunities and good relations between persons of different racial groups and between males and females.

The regulations confer particular functions on the governing body and the headteacher in respect of the preparation of a school curriculum policy. Local education authorities, teacher unions, Governors Wales, local governor associations and many others have been consulted and they welcome these regulations and associated guidance, which the Assembly will issue. Some revisions to the details have been made in light of this consultation. The aim of the regulations is to clarify responsibilities and to move governing bodies towards a more strategic approach, greater delegation, and less detailed involvement in matters better dealt with by the headteacher.

10:15 a.m.

(Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2000;

(b) yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Hydref 2000.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn berthnasol i Gymru yn unig. Daeth rheoliadau tebyg i rym yn Lloegr ar 1 Medi. Fe'u gwneir yn unol â phwerau a gynhwysir yn adrannau 38 a 138 Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998. Mae'r rhain yn berthnasol i gyrff llywodraethu a phenaethiaid ysgolion a gynhelir. Gosodant nifer o egwyddorion sydd yn darparu cylch gorchwyl gwasanaethau i gyrff llywodraethu. Ymdriniant hefyd â rolau a chyfrifoldebau priodol cyrff llywodraethu a phenaethiaid. Gofynnodd y corff llywodraethu am gael cyflawni eu swyddogaethau gyda golwg ar gyflawni rôl strategol yn fras. Fel rhan o hyn, maent i sefydlu fframwaith strategol drwy osod nodau, amcanion, polisiau a thargedau. Mae gan y pennaeth gyfrifoldeb dros drefniadaeth a rheolaeth yr ysgol o ddydd i ddydd, am gynghori'r corff llywodraethu ar y fframwaith strategol ac am weithredu'r polisiau a fabwysiadwyd gan y corff llywodraethu. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn gosod dyletswydd ar y corff llywodraethu a'r pennaeth i hyrwyddo cyfleoedd cyfartal a pherthynas dda rhwng personau o grwpiau hiliol gwahanol a rhwng gwrywod a benywod.

Mae'r rheoliadau yn rhoi swyddogaethau penodol i'r corff llywodraethu a'r pennaeth mewn perthynas â pharatoi polisi cwricwlwm yr ysgol. Ymgynghorwyd ag awdurdodau addysg lleol, undebau athrawon, Llywodraethwyr Cymru, cymdeithasau llywodraethwyr lleol a llawer o rai eraill a chroesawant y rheoliadau hyn a'r arweiniad cysylltiedig a gyhoeddir gan y Cynulliad. Gwnaethpwyd rhai diwygiadau i'r manylion yng ngoleuni'r ymgynghoriad hwn. Nod y rheoliadau yw egluro cyfrifoldebau a symud cyrff llywodraethu tuag at ymagwedd fwy strategol, dirprwyo ehangach, ac ymwneud llai manwl mewn materion yr ymdrinnir â hwy yn well gan y pennaeth.

Gareth Jones: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o gyngor sir, llywodraethwr ysgol ac athro cofrestredig.

Ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, mae'n bleser croesawu'r rheoliadau, a'u bwriad o greu perthynas dda rhwng personau o wahanol grwpiau hiliol, drwy hyrwyddo egwyddorion pwysig megis cyfleoedd cyfartal, drwy ddileu gwahaniaethu anghyfreithlon ar sail hil neu ryw.

Yn y byd sydd o'n cwmpas, dengys nifer o ffactorau a thueddiadau bwysigrwydd ac angenrheidrwydd y rheoliadau hyn i'n galluogi i newid rhai agweddau ar ddiwylliant ein hysgolion a'n cymunedau. Y pethau a ddaw yn sgîl materion megis yr argymhellion sydd yn adroddiad ymchwiliad Stephen Lawrence; hefyd, y ffaith fod ystadegau diweddar yn dangos bod disgyblion du yn tanberfformio yn addysgiadol o'u cymharu â disgyblion gwyn; hefyd, bod adroddiad diweddaraf y Comisiwn dros Gydraddoldeb Hiliol, *'Racial Equality in Schools'*, yn datgan bod gormod o ddisgyblion o gefndir Affro-Caribiaidd yn cael eu gwahardd yn barhaol o ysgolion Cymru a Lloegr. Hefyd, ceir adroddiadau cyson am fwlio homoffobig a hiliol, ac am y diffyg darpariaeth gyson a dibynadwy i blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig a disgyblion ag anabledau.

Mae materion sydd yn ymddangos yn llai pwysig ond sydd o bwys mawr i'r unigolyn ac sydd yn seiliedig ar hawliau cyfartal, sef materion gwisg ysgol: hawl bechgyn i wisgo clustdlysau a hawl merched i wisgo trywsus. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn faterion o bwys ac yn ymwneud â'r hyn sydd ymhlyg yn y rheoliadau.

Mae'r materion hyn ac eraill yn golygu bod y pwyslais yn y rheoliadau ar hybu cyfle cyfartal yn amserol ac yn angenrheidiol os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch creu gwell hinsawdd cymdeithasol yn ein hysgolion a'n cymunedau.

Mae angen newid sawl agwedd ar y sefyllfa bresennol. Mae'r egwyddorion sydd ymhlyg yn y rheoliadau yn fodd i wireddu'r newid hwn. Maent yn bwysig ac yn angenrheidiol,

Gareth Jones: I declare an interest as a member of a county council, a school governor and a registered teacher.

On behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, it is a pleasure to welcome the regulations and their aim of creating sound relationships between persons of different racial groups, by promoting important principles such as equal opportunities, by eliminating illegal, racial or sexual discrimination.

In the current climate, several factors and tendencies highlight the importance and the need for these regulations to enable us to change some aspects of the culture in our schools and communities. The things that come in the wake of matters such as the recommendations in the Stephen Lawrence inquiry report; also, the fact that recent statistics show that black pupils underachieve educationally in comparison with white pupils; also, the recent Commission for Racial Equality report, 'Racial Equality in Schools' states that too many pupils from Afro-Caribbean backgrounds are permanently excluded from schools in Wales and England. Also, there are consistent reports of racists and homophobic bullying, and of a lack of consistent and reliable provision for children with special educational needs and pupils with disabilities.

There are matters that appear less important but are of great importance to individuals and are based on equal opportunities, namely matters of school uniform: the right of boys to wear earrings and the right of girls to wear trousers. These are all important issues and are relevant to what is implicit in the regulations.

These and other matters mean that the emphasis in the guidelines on promoting equal opportunities is timely and necessary if we are serious about creating a better social climate in our schools and communities.

There is a need to change several aspects of the current situation. The principles implicit in these regulations are a means of achieving this change. They are important and

ond mae cwestiynau yr hoffwn eu gofyn i'r Gweinidog.

Yn gyntaf, nid oes cyfeiriad yn y rheoliadau hyn at rôl neu wasanaeth yr awdurdodau addysg lleol. Onid oes ganddynt gyfraniad holl bwysig mewn unrhyw gynllun neu weledigaeth strategol fel hyn yng Nghymru? Onid yw'r awdurdod lleol yn ddolen gyswllt allweddol rhwng yr ysgol a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac o bosibl yn ysgafnhau baich gwaith llywodraethwyr o bryd i'w gilydd?

Yn ail, mae'r rheoliadau yn fwriadol yn cyfeirio at y 'polisi cwricwlwm' yn hytrach na'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Beth yw arwyddocâd hyn?

Yn drydydd, mae'n amlwg y bydd angen canllawiau newydd anstatudol, fel y soniodd y Gweinidog, i gynorthwyo ysgolion yn y dasg o weithredu'r rheoliadau. Yn wir, mae galw eisoes ar y Cynulliad i adolygu cynnwys y cylchlythyrau sydd yn darparu canllawiau ar gynnwys adroddiadau blynyddol llywodraethwyr a llawlyfrau ysgolion. Yn bennaf, maent yn ymwneud â chyfle cyfartal a threfniadau ysgolion ar gyfer disgyblion anabl. Mae'r ddau beth—y rheoliadau hyn a'r papur ymgynghorol ar gynnwys cylchlythyrau—yn cyd-berthyn, ac mae'n bosibl bod rhywfaint o ddyblygu. Fe'ch atgoffaf am yr elfen o fiwrocraetaeth o'n cwmpas. Nid yw o gymorth pan fo dyblygu fel hyn yn digwydd.

A fydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau y bydd ymgynghori llawn yn y Cynulliad ar gynnwys y canllawiau a fydd yn cyd-fynd â'r rheoliadau hyn? Trwy ymgynghori'n llawn â'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, er enghraifft, y medrwn sicrhau y bydd y materion a drafodwyd ac a argymhellwyd gan y Pwyllgor yn cael eu hymgorffori yn y canllawiau ac felly yn cael eu gweithredu yn ein hysgolion yn llawer cynt na phe baem yn disgwyl i eraill wneud y gwaith drosom. A fydd ymgynghori llawn ar y canllawiau hyn?

Christine Chapman: I declare an interest as a registered teacher. I speak in support of the motion and I will concentrate on equal opportunities. I welcome the fact that we are highlighting the need for school governors and headteachers to address this issue fully.

necessary, but there are questions that I would like to ask the Minister.

First, there is no reference in these regulations to the role or service of local education authorities. Do they not have a vital contribution to make to any scheme or strategic vision such as this in Wales? Is not the local authority a key link between the school and the National Assembly, and possibly, lightens the workload of governors from time to time?

Secondly, the regulations deliberately refer to the 'curriculum policy' rather than the national curriculum. What is the significance of this?

Thirdly, it is evident that new, non-statutory guidelines are required, as the Minister mentioned, to assist schools in the task of implementing the regulations. Indeed, the Assembly is already being called upon to review the contents of the circulars that provide guidelines on the contents of governors' annual reports and school handbooks. They are mainly concerned with equal opportunities and schools' arrangements for disabled pupils. Those two things—these regulations and the consultation paper on the content of circulars—are interrelated, and, possibly there is some duplication. I remind you of the of the bureaucracy surrounding us. It does not help when duplication such as this occurs.

Will the Minister ensure that there will be full consultation in the Assembly on the content of the guidelines that will accompany these regulations? It is through full consultation with the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, for example, that we can ensure that the matters discussed and recommended by the Committee are incorporated in the guidelines and are therefore implemented in our schools far sooner than if we wait for others to do the work on our behalf. Will there be full consultation on these guidelines?

Christine Chapman: Datganaf fuddiant fel athrawes gofrestredig. Siaradaf i gefnogi'r cynnig a chanolbwyntiaf ar gyfleoedd cyfartal. Croesawaf y ffaith ein bod yn amlygu'r angen i lywodraethwyr a phenaethiaid ysgol roi sylw llawn i'r mater

As we have said many times in this Chamber, ignorance can breed discrimination. The governors and heads of schools are in a vital position to tackle this problem head on. Some authorities already have guidance on such matters, and where best practice exists we must ensure that it is shared. My concern is that equal opportunities—I speak as someone who has served as a governor and a Chair of governors in a couple of schools—is often treated as simply an exercise in ticking boxes, and not necessarily as winning the hearts and minds of people. The issues are clear. There is much evidence of gender inequality in society. We definitely still have problems with racism. I remind you of the Macpherson report and the Runnymede Trust's recent report on multi-ethnic Britain. These reports highlighted several problems in this area.

As Gareth said, we are aware of black and asian boys' underachievement. It is clear that governors and headteachers need to conclude that these issues need to be addressed and not simply to pay lip service to the notion of equal opportunities. This legislation presents us with several challenges. To address equal opportunities properly can be highly controversial. There are occasions when people's hackles rise when we talk about equal opportunities. We have witnessed that in this Chamber when we had a debate recently on political correctness. Sometimes people can get hot under the collar when we address equal opportunities.

Training is essential. Where good practice exists, we should use it. However, as volunteers, governors cannot always find the time for training. In extreme cases, some are unwilling to train. Sometimes those who take the lead lack an understanding of the issues. For example, in areas with a low percentage of non-white residents, governing bodies may perceive, wrongly, that racism is not a concern and not a problem. However, racism in those areas may in some cases be an even more acute problem.

hwn. Fel y dywedasom lawer gwaith yn y Siambr hon, anwybodaeth a fag anffafiaeth. Mae'r llywodraethwyr a phenaethiaid ysgolion mewn sefyllfa hanfodol i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon yn benben. Mae gan rai awdurdodau eisoes arweiniad ar faterion o'r fath, a lle bodola arfer gorau rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff ei rannu. Fy mhryder yw y caiff cyfleoedd cyfartal—siaradaf fel un sydd wedi gwasanaethu fel llywodraethwr a Chadeirydd y llywodraethwyr mewn cwpl o ysgolion—eu trin yn aml fel ymarfer ticio blychau, ac nid o anghenraid fel rhywbeth sydd yn ennill calonnau a meddyliau pobl. Mae'r materion yn glir. Mae llawer o dystiolaeth o anghydraddoldeb rhyw mewn cymdeithas. Mae gennym broblemau o hyd gyda hiliaeth yn sicr. Fe'ch atgoffaf chi o adroddiad Macpherson ac adroddiad diweddar Ymddiriedolaeth Runnymede ar Brydain aml-ethnig. Amlyga'r adroddiadau hyn nifer o broblemau yn y maes hwn.

Fel y dywedodd Gareth, yr ydym yn ymwybodol o dangyflawni gan fechgyn du ac asiaidd. Mae'n glir bod angen i lywodraethwyr a phenaethiaid ddod i'r casgliad bod angen rhoi sylw i'r materion hyn ac nid dim ond esgus cefnogi'r syniad o gyfleoedd cyfartal. Cyflwyna'r ddeddfwriaeth hon nifer o heriau inni. Gall rhoi sylw i gyfleoedd cyfartal yn gywir fod yn ddadleuol iawn. Ceir adegau pan godir gwrychyn pobl pan siaradwn am gyfleoedd cyfartal. Buom yn dyst i hynny yn y Siambr hon pan gafwyd dadl yn ddiweddar ar gywirdeb gwleidyddol. Weithiau gall pobl gynhyrfu pan roddwn sylw i gyfleoedd cyfartal.

Mae hyfforddiant yn hanfodol. Lle bodola arfer da, dylem ei ddefnyddio. Fodd bynnag, fel gwirfoddolwyr, ni all llywodraethwyr bob amser ddod o hyd i'r amser ar gyfer hyfforddiant. Mewn achosion eithriadol, mae rhai yn anfodlon hyfforddi. Weithiau nid yw'r rheini sydd yn cymryd yr awenau yn deall y materion. Er enghraifft, mewn ardaloedd lle bydd canran isel o'r preswylwyr nad ydynt yn wyn, gall cyrff llywodraethu ddirnad, yn anghywir, nad yw hiliaeth yn fater o bryder ac nad yw'n broblem. Fodd bynnag, gall hiliaeth yn yr ardaloedd hynny mewn rhai achosion fod yn broblem hyd yn oed yn fwy difrifol.

Another challenge is that governing bodies need to be more representative. They tend to be dominated by men. That is truer for secondary than primary schools. I have discovered statistics this week from Governors Wales that show that in Wales, two out of three governors are men. We need to encourage more women, more people from ethnic minorities and more disabled people to become governors. Hopefully, this legislation will bring such issues to the fore. I am pleased at the Assembly's lead and refer you to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, which is working hard to address this. A working party has been set up to develop better practice among teachers, but we also highlighted the need for governors to be involved, and I know that that will be addressed.

We can make a good start by considering how we can attract a wider cross-section of people to become school governors. We also need to encourage much better inter-agency working, so that governors can work with experts such as the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Commission for Racial Equality in tackling these issues. Many governors are excellent and committed and willingly give of their time. However, we still do not have the situation wholly right at the moment, although this legislation takes us a step in the right direction. There is much at stake here. If we are to encourage a greater level of awareness and lower levels of discrimination, we must not be complacent.

Christine Humphreys: I welcome these new regulations and the new duty that they impose on headteachers and governing bodies, which was not included in previous regulations. A concern I have, which Gareth Jones has already raised, is that these regulations do not mention the need to tackle discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation. That could be taken as stating that such discrimination is not seen as important, and that governing bodies and headteachers do not have to have regard to avoiding it. By this omission, we could be seen as discriminating in determining which forms of discrimination we should guard

Her arall yw bod angen i gyrff llywodraethu fod yn fwy cynrychioliadol. Tueddant i gael eu domineiddio gan ddynion. Mae hynny yn fwy gwir am ysgolion uwchradd nag ysgolion cynradd. Darganfyddais ystadegau yr wythnos hon oddi wrth Lywodraethwyr Cymru sydd yn dangos bod dau allan o bob tri llywodraethwr yng Nghymru yn ddynion. Mae angen inni annog rhagor o fenywod, rhagor o bobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig a rhagor o bobl anabl i fod yn llywodraethwyr. Gyda lwc, daw'r ddeddfwriaeth hon â materion o'r fath i'r amlwg. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar arweiniad y Cynulliad ac fe'ch cyfeiraf at y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, sydd yn gweithio'n galed i roi sylw i hyn. Sefydlwyd gweithgor i ddatblygu arfer gwell ymysg athrawon, ond amlygwyd hefyd yr angen i lywodraethwyr fod yn gysylltiedig â hyn, a gwn y rhoddir sylw i hynny.

Gallwn ddechrau yn dda drwy ystyried sut y gallwn ddenu trawsdoriad ehangach o bobl i fod yn llywodraethwyr ysgol. Mae angen inni hefyd annog gwell gweithio rhyngasiantaethol, fel y gall llywodraethwyr weithio gydag arbenigwyr megis y Comisiwn Cyfleoedd Cyfartal a'r Comisiwn Cyfartaledd Hiliol wrth fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Mae llawer o lywodraethwyr yn rhagorol ac yn ymrwymedig ac yn barod i roi o'u hamser. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r sefyllfa yn hollol iawn o hyd ar hyn o bryd, er bod y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn mynd â ni gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Mae llawer yn y fantol yma. Os ydym i annog lefel uwch o ymwybyddiaeth a lefelau is o wahaniaethu, rhaid inni beidio â bod yn hunanfodlon.

Christine Humphreys: Croesawaf y rheoliadau newydd hyn a'r ddyletswydd newydd a osodant ar benaethiaid a chyrrff llywodraethu, na chynhwyswyd mewn rheoliadau blaenorol. Un pryder sydd gennyf, a godwyd gan Gareth Jones eisoes, yw nad yw'r rheoliadau hyn yn crybwyll yr angen i fynd i'r afael â gwahaniaethu ar sail tueddiadau rhywiol. Gellid cymryd hynny fel datgan na welir gwahaniaethu o'r fath yn bwysig, ac nad oes yn rhaid i gyrff llywodraethu a phenaethiaid ystyried osgoi hynny. Drwy esgeuluso hyn, gellid ystyried ein bod ni yn gwahaniaethu wrth bennu pa ddulliau o wahaniaethu y dylem ddiogelu

against, and which we do not have to worry about. What message are we sending to young people who may be trying to come to terms with their sexuality and are being bullied as a result?

Another concern that arises from these regulations is that there is no duty to promote good relations between people of different religious beliefs, although it is mentioned that they will not prevent the use of proper measures to preserve the religious character of the school. We should try to strike a balance between preserving the religious character of a school and promoting good relations between people of different religious beliefs. That needs to be considered more in the future so that we can be clearer about what is intended. Finally, I welcome the regulations as far as they go, but I acknowledge, as I hope does the Assembly, that there are flaws that must be dealt with in the future.

10:25 a.m.

Alun Pugh: I will vote in favour of these regulations. I am sure that they will add to good governance of schools in Wales, and they are a model of equality of opportunity. The best way to gain access to governors' minutes and papers is by publishing them on the web. That is an easy process these days and many schools have websites. Where school staff lack the expertise, I am confident that a pupil could teach them how to do it. It is reasonable for parents and the press to be able to take away a copy of the governors' minutes and papers. We do not need a legislative hammer to crack this nut, but I ask Jane Davidson to ask schools to ensure that parents can take away a copy of the minutes and papers, providing that they cover the cost.

Lorraine Barrett: I welcome the regulations wholeheartedly and support everything that has been said. However, you may think that I am being petty and pedantic, and I would not want to delay the regulations from going through, but in future can we check the grammar that is used in these statutory instruments, because poor grammar irritates me. If we consider the terms of reference, point 3(2) states:

rhagddynt, a pha rai nad oes angen inni bryderu amdanynt. Pa neges a anfonwn i bobl ifanc a all fod yn ceisio dod i delerau â'u rhywioldeb ac yn cael eu bwlio o ganlyniad i hynny?

Pryder arall sydd yn codi o'r rheoliadau hyn yw nad oes dyletswydd i hyrwyddo perthynas dda rhwng pobl o gredoau crefyddol gwahanol, er y sonnir na rwystrant y defnydd o fesurau cywir i gadw cymeriad crefyddol yr ysgol. Dylem geisio cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng cadw cymeriad crefyddol ysgol a hyrwyddo perthynas dda rhwng pobl o gredoau crefyddol gwahanol. Rhaid rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth i hynny yn y dyfodol fel y gallwn fod yn gliriach am yr hyn a fwriedir. Yn olaf, croesawaf y rheoliadau cyn belled ag yr ânt, ond cydnabyddaf, fel y Cynulliad gobeithio, fod diffygion y bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â hwy yn y dyfodol.

Alun Pugh: Pleidleisiaf o blaid y rheoliadau hyn. Yr wyf yn siwr yr ychwanegant at lywodraethu da mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru, ac maent yn fodel o gyfle cyfartal. Y ffordd orau i gael mynediad i gofnodion a phapurau'r llywodraethwyr yw eu cyhoeddi ar y we. Mae honno yn broses hawdd y dyddiau hyn ac mae gan lawer o ysgolion wefannau. Pan nad yw'r arbenigedd gan staff ysgolion, yr wyf yn hyderus y gallai disgybl eu dysgu sut i wneud hynny. Mae'n rhesymol i rieni a'r wasg allu cael copi o gofnodion a phapurau'r llywodraethwyr. Nid oes angen morthwyl cyfreithiol i dorri'r gneuen hon, ond gofynnaf i Jane Davidson ofyn i ysgolion sicrhau y gall rhieni gymryd copi o'r cofnodion a phapurau, ar yr amod eu bod yn talu'r gost.

Lorraine Barrett: Croesawaf y rheoliadau yn galonnog a chefnogaf bopeth a ddywedwyd. Fodd bynnag, efallai eich bod yn meddwl fy mod yn bitw ac yn bedantig, ac ni fyddwn am oedi'r rheoliadau rhag cael eu derbyn, ond yn y dyfodol a allwn wirio'r gramadeg a ddefnyddir yn yr offerynnau statudol hyn, gan fod gramadeg gwael yn fy mlino. Os ystyriwn y cylch gorchwyl, noda pwynt 3(2):

‘In exercising their functions, the governing body shall have. . .’

It should state:

‘In exercising its functions, the governing body shall have. . .’

or:

‘In exercising their functions, the governing bodies shall have. . .’

That type of error is creeping into the English language more and more in the Record of Proceedings and in Hansard in another place. That is a small point, but we should look at it.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I thank all the colleagues who responded to the regulations, particularly Gareth Jones, who made some good points. I apologise for not having declared an interest as a registered, albeit non-practising teacher, but, more importantly, as a school governor of a comprehensive with a high proportion of pupils from a wide range of ethnic minority communities—probably the highest in Wales—and a high proportion of pupils with special needs. Therefore, from a personal point of view, I also welcome these regulations.

I will ask my colleague, Jane Davidson, to reply in detail to Gareth Jones’s points on the guidelines. We recognise that the role and functions of the local education authorities are important and, in terms of issuing the guidelines, we will take on board Gareth’s points as well as those of others. Christine Chapman made important points about our commitment to equality of opportunity. All my Cabinet colleagues—Edwina Hart, in particular, who is chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity—have been considering how we can mainstream the issue of equality of opportunity into everything that we do. We do not want the matter to become part of a tick box mentality, but a mainstream one.

Governor training is important. My local authority has a good governor training

‘In exercising their functions, the governing body shall have. . .’

Dylai ddarllen:

‘In exercising its functions, the governing body shall have...’

neu:

‘In exercising their functions, the governing bodies shall have. . .’

Mae’r math hwnnw o gamgymeriad yn treiddio i mewn i’r iaith Saesneg yn gynyddol yng Nghofnod y Trafodion ac yn Hansard mewn man arall. Mae hynny’n bwynt bach, ond dylem edrych arno.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Diolchaf i’r holl gyd-Aelodau a ymatebodd i’r rheoliadau, yn arbennig Gareth Jones, a wnaeth rai pwyntiau da. Ymddiheuraf na ddatgenais fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig, er nad wyf yn gweithio fel athro, ond, yn bwysicach, fel llywodraethwr ysgol gyfun sydd â chyfran uchel o ddisgyblion o ystod eang o gymunedau lleiafrifoedd ethnig—yr uchaf yng Nghymru fwy na thebyg—a chyfran uchel o ddisgyblion ag anghenion arbennig. Felly, o safbwynt personol, croesawaf innau hefyd y rheoliadau hyn.

Gofynnaf i’r cyd-Aelod, Jane Davidson, i ymateb yn fanwl i bwyntiau Gareth Jones ar y canllawiau. Cydnabyddwn fod rôl a swyddogaethau’r awdurdodau addysg lleol yn bwysig, ac o ran cyflwyno’r canllawiau, byddwn yn ystyried pwyntiau Gareth yn ogystal â phwyntiau pobl eraill. Gwnaeth Christine Chapman bwyntiau pwysig am ein hymrwymiad i gyfle cyfartal. Ystyriodd fy holl gyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet—Edwina Hart, yn benodol, sydd yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal—sut y gallwn roi mater cyfle cyfartal ym mhrif ffrwd popeth a wnawn. Nid ydym am i’r mater fynd yn rhan o feddylfryd bocs ticiau, ond yn feddylfryd prif ffrwd.

Mae hyfforddi llywodraethwyr yn bwysig. Mae gan fy awdurdod lleol raglen hyfforddi

programme and I am sure that Jane Davidson would agree wholeheartedly that there needs to be consistently good practice across Wales. However, we must ensure that more women and representatives from the wide range of ethnic communities in Wales become school governors. We must improve that and cannot be complacent on this issue.

On Christine Humphreys's point about legislation, we are always reviewing all our activities and legislation, and we will amend and improve them if appropriate, on consideration. I will ask Jane Davidson to consider the issue that Alun raised, and to consider how the regulations are framed and the use of the English and Welsh languages. That is a matter not only for the administration but, more importantly in this issue, for the Legislation Committee. I have no doubt that it will consider the points that we have made.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw un arall am ddatgan buddiant fel llywodraethwr ysgol neu athro?

William Graham, Christine Chapman, Andrew Davies, Mick Bates, Huw Lewis, Peter Black, Jenny Randerson, Lorraine Barrett, Gwenda Thomas, Christine Humphreys, Michael German, Val Feld, Jocelyn Davies, Brian Hancock, Elin Jones, Owen John Thomas, Pauline Jarman, David Lloyd, Geraint Davies and Janet Ryder *rose—*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Cymru) 2000.

dda ar gyfer llywodraethwyr ac yr wyf yn sicr y cytunai Jane Davidson yn llwyr fod angen arfer da yn gyson ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau bod rhagor o wragedd a chynrychiolwyr o blith yr ystod eang o gymunedau ethnig yng Nghymru yn dod yn llywodraethwyr. Rhaid inni wella hynny ac ni allwn fod yn hunanfodlon ar y mater hwn.

Ynglŷn â phwynt Christine Humphreys ar ddeddfwriaeth, adolygwn bob amser ein holl weithgareddau a deddfwriaeth, ac fe'u diwygiwn a'u gwella os yw'n briodol, o'u hystyried. Gofynnaf i Jane Davidson ystyried y mater a gododd Alun, ac ystyried sut y caiff y rheoliadau eu llunio a'r defnydd o'r Saesneg a'r Gymraeg. Nid mater ar gyfer y weinyddiaeth yn unig yw hwnnw ond, yn bwysicach yn y mater hwn, ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Deddfau. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth yr ystyria'r pwyntiau a wnaethom.

The Presiding Officer: Does anybody else wish to declare an interest as a school governor or a teacher?

William Graham, Christine Chapman, Andrew Davies, Mick Bates, Huw Lewis, Peter Black, Jenny Randerson, Lorraine Barrett, Gwenda Thomas, Christine Humphreys, Michael German, Val Feld, Jocelyn Davies, Brian Hancock, Elin Jones, Owen John Thomas, Pauline Jarman, David Lloyd, Geraint Davies and Janet Ryder *a gododd—*

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the principle of Approval of the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Wales) Regulations 2000.

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar **The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on
gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. the approval of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn

Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Humphreys, Christine
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

Dogfen Rhaglennu Sengl Amcan 2 Objective 2 Single Programming Document

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.30 a.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10.30 a.m.*

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German): I propose that **Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

notes with approval the single programming document, agreed between the East Wales Partnership and the European Commission, for the Objective 2 and transitional programme areas in east Wales, laid in the Table Office on 2 November 2000; *yn nodi gyda chymeradwyaeth y ddogfen rhaglennu sengl, y cytunodd Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd arni, ar gyfer ardaloedd Amcan 2 a'r rhaglen drosiannol yn nwyrain Cymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2000;*

calls upon the Minister for Economic Development with the agreement of the partnership, to insert any additional text or make any textual amendments as may be necessary, to meet the technical requirements necessary to secure formal approval of the document by the European Commission as *yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, gyda chytundeb y bartneriaeth, i ychwanegu unrhyw destun ychwanegol neu wneud unrhyw newidiadau testunol yn ôl yr angen, i fodloni'r gofynion technegol sydd eu hangen i sicrhau bod y ddogfen yn cael cymeradwyaeth ffurfiol y Comisiwn*

soon as possible.

The single programming document before you is the product of considerable effort by the East Wales Partnership. It is the culmination of a year's work, including three months of negotiation with the European Commission, and it builds on the document approved by the Assembly in its Plenary debate on 26 May.

Objective 2 may be the smallest of the mainstream structural fund programmes benefiting Wales over the next seven years, but that does not diminish its importance to the parts of east Wales that will benefit from it.

Brian Hancock: The document was approved in the Plenary debate on 23 May.

Michael German: If so, I apologise.

The programme has been well received in many quarters, including the European Commission. It provides a clear, strategic approach to the needs of the Objective 2 areas and suggests sustainable and appropriate use of the limited resources on offer.

The programme is designed for the new Objective 2 areas of east Wales, and there are also transitional programmes designed to support the economic and social conversion of areas facing structural difficulties. In Wales, this programme has two distinct themes: declining rural areas and urban areas in difficulty, although there are some common problems. The programme's strategy has been developed bearing that in mind, with a clear focus on the needs of the two areas where appropriate. Having distinct urban and rural priorities shows that policy-making in Wales can address coherently the different needs of urban and rural areas in a common framework to mutual satisfaction. The headline objectives of the single programming document are to increase employment growth, promote economic diversification and develop sustainable communities. The first priority of developing sustainable and competitive small and medium-sized enterprises is generic, while

Ewropeaidd cyn gynted â phosibl.

Mae'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl sydd ger eich bron yn gynnwys ymdrech sylweddol gan Bartneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru. Pen llanw blwyddyn o waith ydyw, gan gynnwys tri mis o negodi â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, ac mae'n adeiladu ar y ddogfen a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad yn ei ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 26 Mai.

Efallai mai Amcan 2 yw'r lleiaf o'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol prif ffrwd y bydd Cymru yn elwa arni dros y saith mlynedd nesaf, ond nid yw hynny'n lleihau ei phwysigrwydd i rannau o ddwyrain Cymru a fydd yn elwa arni.

Brian Hancock: Cymeradwywyd y ddogfen yn nabl y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 23 Mai.

Michael German: Os felly, ymddiheuraf.

Cafodd y rhaglen groeso brwd gan sawl carfan, gan gynnwys y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Darpara ymagwedd glir, strategol tuag at anghenion ardaloedd Amcan 2 gan awgrymu defnydd cynaliadwy a phriodol o'r adnoddau cyfyngedig sydd ar gael.

Lluniwyd y rhaglen ar gyfer ardaloedd newydd Amcan 2 yn nwyrain Cymru, ac mae rhaglenni trosiannol hefyd a luniwyd i gefnogi newid economaidd a chymdeithasol yr ardaloedd sydd yn wynebu anawsterau strwythurol. Yng Nghymru, mae gan y rhaglen hon ddwy thema benodol: ardaloedd gwledig sydd yn dirywio ac ardaloedd trefol mewn anhawster, er bod rhai problemau cyffredin. Datblygwyd strategaeth y rhaglen gan gadw hynny mewn cof, gyda ffocws clir ar anghenion y ddwy ardal lle bo hynny'n briodol. Mae cael blaenoriaethau trefol a gwledig penodedig yn dangos y gall y broses o wneud polisiau yng Nghymru ymdrin yn gydynus ag anghenion gwahanol ardaloedd trefol a gwledig mewn fframwaith cyffredin sydd yn bodloni'r ddwy ochr. Prif amcanion y ddogfen rhaglennu sengl yw cynyddu twf cyflogaeth, hyrwyddo arallgyfeirio economaidd a datblygu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Mae'r flaenoriaeth gyntaf sef datblygu mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint

the other two priorities, sustainable rural development and urban community regeneration, are clearly targeted decisions for the affected areas, taken by the local partners.

10:35 a.m.

With the limited funds available, the draft has been written by focusing on specific interventions to maximise the benefits to the Objective 2 area. With a programme of this size, there is little point of spreading the money widely because actions would then become ineffectual. A key element of the programme is the strategy for transitional areas, which sets out how the limited funding that is available to them will be used in a sustainable and effective way. Transitional areas are the previous Objective 2 and 5b areas in east Wales that no longer benefit from the new Objective 2 status. A map is provided inside the SPD document that indicates which areas those are.

Therefore, what are the next steps? We aim to submit the final document to the European Commission in the next weeks. It will then go through its formal approval system. During this month, a shadow programme monitoring committee will be formed and work will begin on the programme complement. This is the expansion of the document in terms of its actions, against which applications can be invited and without which no applications can be approved. Ultimately, implementation arrangements will be for the Objective 2 monitoring committee. The fact that Objectives 1 and 3 monitoring committees are up and running and that money is flowing before the start of this programme will be used to strongly inform the thinking on adopting best practice.

A key area across the programme is that of developing a strong SME base. That lies behind the logic of devoting an entire priority to this goal, while addressing issues in the other two priorities. Funding is based on euros per capita, and I notice that David Davies is not in the Chamber, but as you know, the euro is a stable currency against

sydd yn gynaliadwy ac yn gystadleuol yn generig, tra bod y ddwy flaenoriaeth arall, datblygiad gwledig cynaliadwy ac adfywio cymunedau trefol, yn benderfyniadau wedi eu targedu'n glir ar gyfer yr ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt, a wnaethpwyd gan y partneriaid lleol.

Gyda'r arian prin sydd ar gael, ysgrifennwyd y drafft gan ganolbwyntio ar ymyriadau penodol i wneud y gorau o'r buddiannau i ardal Amcan 2. Gyda rhaglen o'r maint hwn, ni fyddai llawer o ddiben gwasgaru'r arian yn eang gan y byddai'r gweithrediadau wedyn yn aneffeithiol. Un elfen allweddol o'r rhaglen yw'r strategaeth ar gyfer ardaloedd trosiannol, sydd yn nodi sut y caiff yr arian cyfyngedig sydd ar gael iddynt ei ddefnyddio mewn ffordd gynaliadwy ac effeithiol. Yr ardaloedd trosiannol yw'r ardaloedd Amcan 2 a 5b blaenorol yn nwyrain Cymru nad ydynt bellach yn elwa ar statws newydd Amcan 2. Darperir map y tu mewn i'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl sydd yn dangos pa ardaloedd ydynt.

Felly, beth yw'r camau nesaf? Ein nod yw cyflwyno'r ddogfen derfynol i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn yr wythnosau nesaf. Yna aiff drwy ei system gymeradwyo ffurfiol. Yn ystod y mis hwn, ffurfir pwyllgor monitro rhaglenni cysgodol a bydd y gwaith yn dechrau ar ddogfen ategol y rhaglen. Mae hyn yn golygu ehangu'r ddogfen o ran ei gweithrediadau, y gellir gwahodd ceisiadau yn ei herbyn ac na ellir cymeradwyo unrhyw geisiadau hebddi. Yn y pen draw, bydd y trefniadau gweithredu yng ngofal pwyllgor monitro Amcan 2. Caiff y ffaith fod pwyllgorau monitro Amcanion 1 a 3 bellach yn weithredol a bod arian yn llifo cyn i'r rhaglen ddechrau ei defnyddio i lywio'r farn yn gryf ar fabwysiadu arfer gorau.

Un maes allweddol ar draws y rhaglen yw datblygu sylfaen gref ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Dyna sydd y tu ôl i resymeg neilltuo blaenoriaeth gyfan i'r nod hwn, tra'n ymdrin â materion yn y ddwy flaenoriaeth arall. Seilir yr ariannu ar ewros y pen, a sylwaf nad yw David Davies yn y Siambr, ond fel y gwyddoch, mae'r ewro yn

which the pound is currently moving. The allocation of euros to Wales is 1.39 million for the main programme to the end of 2006 and 39.73 million for the transitional areas to the end of 2005.

Glyn Davies: For the last 15 seconds, I have been trying to understand what you meant by saying that the euro was a stable currency, because it seems to be the opposite.

Michael German: I was referring to David Davies's comment, in a previous intervention, when he stated that when Britain joined the euro, the pound would still move up and down against the euro. I am sure that you recall his statement.

Glyn Davies: You misheard him.

Michael German: No I did not. I was trying to point out that the euro is the stable currency used inside the euro zone, against which all these things are measured. The costs and the amount of money that Wales will receive will vary because we are not in the euro zone.

Under the 2000 settlement that was based on the euro at a rate of 63p, we would have received £51.3 million and £25 million respectively for the two strands, but at the current exchange rate, the figures are around £48 million and £23 million.

Alun Cairns: Do you expect that figure to fall further, bearing in mind the current state of the euro?

Michael German: That matter is for the markets and is one that this Assembly cannot influence. However, I am sure that we could have a rational debate on whether or not we want to join a stable currency.

I record my thanks to the many organisations that made up the partnership. Through a great deal of hard work and effort, it has put together a good document. Its important features are co-operation and ownership.

arian cyfredol sefydlog y mae'r bunt yn symud yn ei erbyn ar hyn o bryd. Dyrennir 1.39 miliwn o ewros i Gymru ar gyfer y brif raglen hyd at ddiwedd 2006 a 39.73 miliwn ar gyfer yr ardaloedd trosiannol hyd at ddiwedd 2005.

Glyn Davies: Am y 15 eiliad diwethaf, bùm yn ceisio deall yr hyn a olygasoch drwy ddweud bod yr ewro yn arian cyfredol sefydlog, oherwydd ymddengys mai'r gwrthwyneb ydyw.

Michael German: Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at sylw David Davies, mewn ymyriad blaenorol, pan nododd y byddai'r bunt, ar ôl i Brydain ymuno â'r ewro, yn parhau i symud i fyny ac i lawr yn erbyn yr ewro. Yr wyf yn siwr eich bod yn cofio ei ddatganiad.

Glyn Davies: Yr oeddech wedi ei gamglywed.

Michael German: Nac oeddwn. Yr oeddwn yn ceisio dangos mai'r ewro yw'r arian cyfredol sefydlog a ddefnyddir y tu mewn i ardal yr ewro, y caiff yr holl bethau hyn eu mesur yn ei erbyn. Bydd y costau a swm yr arian a gaiff Cymru yn amrywio gan nad ydym yn ardal yr ewro.

O dan setliad 2000 a oedd yn seiliedig ar yr ewro ar gyfradd o 63c, byddem wedi cael £51.3 miliwn a £25 miliwn yn eu tro am y ddau liny, ond ar y gyfradd gyfnewid gyfredol, mae'r ffigurau tua £48 miliwn a £23 miliwn.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn disgwyl i'r ffigur hwnnw ostwng ymhellach, o gofio cyflwr presennol yr ewro?

Michael German: Mater i'r marchnadoedd yw hynny ac nid yw'n un y gall y Cynulliad hwn ddylanwadu arno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siwr y gallem gael trafodaeth resymegol ar pa un a ydym am ymuno ag arian cyfredol sefydlog ai peidio.

Cofnodaf fy niolch i'r sefydliadau niferus a fu'n rhan o'r bartneriaeth. O ganlyniad i lawer iawn o waith ac ymdrech caled, lluniodd ddogfen dda. Ei nodweddion pwysig yw cydweithrediad a pherchenogaeth. Mae'r

Those key elements have brought this programme together. I am sure that they will continue to do so in the writing of the programme complement and in the implementation of Objective 2 and the transitional programme which is to follow.

Before the debate begins, I would like to suggest how the Assembly should respond to the amendments laid before it. I recommend that the Assembly reject Alun Cairns's amendment 1. There is no logical reason at all to suppose that the implementation of Objective 2 will be undermined by the other structural programmes. It is that use of the word 'undermining' which leads me to ask you to reject it. On the contrary, those preparing the implementation of this programme's proposals have been able to build on the lessons of Objectives 1 and 3, and to work closely with the Welsh European Funding Office. Members of all the sectors involved in the east Wales partnership are working closely together to develop these arrangements, which will be transparent and accessible to all potential applicants.

I recommend that the Assembly accepts amendment 2, in the name of Phil Williams. As regards his amendment 3, the information and communications technology targets are a late addition to this document and are currently being added. Therefore I am happy to accept this amendment.

I have no problem with the spirit of amendment 4: co-ordination of rural policies across all the programmes is essential. However, an inclusive rural partnership exists and it would be illogical to replace it with a new partnership. The Assembly may wish to note our intention to create a single monitoring committee for the rural development plan and for the LEADER+ community initiative. We also intend to ensure that links with other programmes are made by ensuring that there are regular meetings of the different monitoring committees, and through the work of the rural partnership that already exists. On that basis I hope that Phil will think it sensible to withdraw that amendment, and unless he

elfennau allweddol hynny wedi dod â'r rhaglen hon ynghyd. Yr wyf yn siwr y byddant yn parhau i wneud hynny wrth ysgrifennu dogfen ategol y rhaglen ac wrth weithredu Amcan 2 a'r rhaglen drosiannol sydd i ddilyn.

Cyn i'r ddadl ddechrau, hoffwn awgrymu sut y dylai'r Cynulliad ymateb i'r gwelliannau a osodwyd ger ei fron. Argymhellaf fod y Cynulliad yn gwrthod gwelliant 1 Alun Cairns. Nid oes unrhyw reswm rhesymegol o gwbl i feddwl y caiff y broses o weithredu Amcan 2 ei thanseilio gan y rhaglenni strwythurol eraill. Y defnydd o'r gair 'tanseilio' sydd yn fy arwain i ofyn ichi ei wrthod. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae'r rheini sydd yn paratoi ar gyfer gweithredu cynigion y rhaglen hon wedi gallu adeiladu ar wersi Amcanion 1 a 3, a gweithio'n agos gyda Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Mae aelodau pob sector sydd yn gysylltiedig â phartneriaeth dwyrain Cymru yn cydweithio'n agos i ddatblygu'r trefniadau hyn, a fydd yn amlwg ac yn hygyrch i bob darpar ymgeisydd.

Argymhellaf fod y Cynulliad yn derbyn gwelliant 2, yn enw Phil Williams. O ran ei welliant 3, mae'r targedau technoleg gwybodaeth a thechnoleg cyfathrebu yn ychwanegiad hwyr i'r ddogfen hon ac maent wrthi'n cael eu hychwanegu ar hyn o bryd. Felly yr wyf yn hapus i dderbyn y gwelliant hwn.

Nid yw ysbryd gwelliant 4 yn fy mhoeni: mae cydlynu polisiau gwledig ar draws yr holl raglenni yn hanfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae partneriaeth wledig gynhwysol yn bodoli a byddai'n afresymol ei disodli â phartneriaeth newydd. Efallai y bydd y Cynulliad am nodi ein bwriad i greu un pwyllgor monitro sengl ar gyfer y cynllun datblygu gwledig ac ar gyfer y fenter gymunedol LEADER+. Yr ydym hefyd yn bwriadu sicrhau y gwneir cysylltiadau â rhaglenni eraill drwy sicrhau bod cyfarfodydd rheolaidd o'r pwyllgorau monitro gwahanol a thrwy waith y bartneriaeth wledig sydd eisoes yn bodoli. Ar y sail honno gobeithiaf y bydd Phil yn credu y byddai'n ddoeth tynnu'r gwelliant hwnnw yn ôl, ac oni fydd yn dymuno ei ddiwygio,

would care to amend it, I am afraid I must reject it.

As regards amendment 5, in the name of Phil Williams, I am glad that he approves of the proposals for implementing Objective 2. However, allocating the splits between the local and regional plans in this programme is comparatively easy. It is a relatively small programme and two of its three priorities are already spatially targeted, one at rural areas and one at deprived urban communities. This makes the allocation to the local plans logical. The nature of the Objective 1 and Objective 3 programmes is much more generic, and the division implementation arrangements are more complex. I note, therefore, that this will work easily for Objective 2. However, I do not think that we can draw easy lessons from the programmes and I think that the monitoring committee must still grapple with that aspect, as I am sure that it will do at its next meeting for Objective 1. Therefore, although the amendment's spirit is right, I ask you to reject it on the grounds that there is good work already in progress to regularise the arrangements of all structural funds in Wales.

I ask Phil to withdraw amendment 6 because I am sure that he has in mind paragraph 16 of the 'Enterprise and Economic Development' section of the partnership agreement:

'We will also seek provision from the UK Government for the appropriate additional resources that may, from time to time, be necessary to ensure that we are able to draw down the full available amount of EU structural funding.'

Given that statement—and I will add an additional guarantee—I will strengthen those words by guaranteeing that we will seek provision from the UK Government. I hope, with that guarantee, that you will find your amendment redundant and withdraw it.

In conclusion, to move the final part of the motion, the process of this single programming document has shown the value of true partnership work. It has brought together local authorities, the voluntary sector, and representatives from the private

mae arnaf ofn y bydd yn rhaid imi ei wrthod.

O ran gwelliant 5, yn enw Phil Williams, yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn cymeradwyo'r cynigion ar gyfer gweithredu Amcan 2. Fodd bynnag, mae dyrannu'r rhaniadau rhwng y cynlluniau lleol a rhanbarthol yn y rhaglen hon yn gymharol hawdd. Mae'n rhaglen gymharol fechan ac mae dwy o'i thair blaenoriaeth eisoes wedi eu targedu'n ofodol, un mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac un mewn cymunedau trefol dan anfantais. Gwna hyn y dyraniad i'r cynlluniau lleol yn rhesymegol. Mae natur rhaglenni Amcan 1 ac Amcan 3 yn llawer mwy cyffredinol, ac mae'r trefniadau ar gyfer gweithredu rhaniadau yn fwy cymhleth. Nodaf, felly, y bydd y gwaith hwn yn gweithio'n hawdd ar gyfer Amcan 2. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf y gallwn ddysgu gwersi yn hawdd o'r rhaglenni a chredaf fod yn rhaid i'r pwyllgor monitro fynd i'r afael â'r agwedd honno o hyd, fel yr wyf yn siwr y gwna yn ei gyfarfod nesaf ar gyfer Amcan 1. Felly, er bod ysbryd y gwelliant yn iawn, gofynnaf ichi ei wrthod am y rheswm fod gwaith da eisoes yn mynd rhagddo i reoleiddio trefniadau'r holl gronfeydd strwythurol yng Nghymru.

Gofynnaf i Phil dynnu gwelliant 6 yn ôl oherwydd yr wyf yn siwr ei fod yn cofio paragraff 16 o adran 'Menter a Datblygu Economaidd' y cytundeb partneriaeth.

'Byddwn hefyd yn ceisio darpariaeth gan Lywodraeth y DU ar gyfer yr adnoddau ychwanegol priodol a allai fod yn ofynnol, o bryd i'w gilydd, i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu tynnu i lawr y swm llawn o gyllid strwythurol sydd ar gael o'r UE.'

O gofio'r datganiad hwnnw—ac ychwanegaf warant ychwanegol—cryfhaf y geiriau hynny drwy warantu y byddwn yn ceisio darpariaeth gan Lywodraeth y DU. Gobeithiaf, gyda'r warant honno, y byddwch yn gweld bod eich gwelliant yn ddiangen ac yn ei dynnu yn ôl.

Wrth gloi, i symud at ran derfynol y cynnig, mae proses y ddogfen rhaglennu sengl hon wedi dangos gwerth gwaith partneriaeth gwirioneddol. Mae wedi dwyn ynghyd awdurdodau lleol, y sector gwirfoddol, a chynrychiolwyr o'r sector preifat, yn ogystal

sector, as well as the Assembly and national agencies into an open and inclusive process. The process has pooled expertise effectively and operated in a strategic manner, focused on the needs of east Wales, rather than on vested interests. This is a clear demonstration that the partnership approach can work effectively.

Alun Cairns: I propose amendment 1. Add at the end of the motion:

expresses concern that the implementation of the Objective 2 programme will be undermined by the other structural fund programmes and calls for the necessary facilitation between all partners, with particular support for the private sector

On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, it gives me great pleasure to support the Objective 2 and transitional programme for southeast Wales and the motion tabled today. The document is well written and the common themes draw directly from the issues highlighted in the description of the current situation and the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats, or SWOT, analysis.

Although this is a much smaller programme in financial terms than that for the Objective 1 region, it is equally important to the people of east Wales. It is often suggested that east Wales is a prosperous area, but that depends on the context. Inactivity rates in the whole region are higher across the board than the UK average. There is also a high proportion of income support claimants in some areas. The document states that 47 per cent of households in Tredegar Park claim income support, according to the latest figures.

10:45 a.m.

William Graham: We know that the Tredegar Park ward is particularly deprived as a large local authority housing estate built on the outskirts of the town. Although it was built in the 1970s, it was the worst aspect of the 1960s practice of decanting people from town centres to the outskirts. Could you assure us that you will press strongly in the

â'r Cynulliad, ac asiantaethau cenedlaethol yn un broses agored a chynhwysol. Mae'r broses wedi casglu arbenigedd yn effeithiol ac wedi gweithredu mewn modd strategol, gan ganolbwyntio ar anghenion dwyrain Cymru, yn hytrach nag ar fuddiannau breintiedig. Dengys hyn yn glir y gall yr ymagwedd bartneriaeth weithio'n effeithiol.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder y bydd gweithredu'r rhaglen Amcan 2 yn cael ei danseilio gan raglenni cronfeydd strwythurol eraill ac yn galw am i'r holl bartneriaid roi'r cymorth angenrheidiol, yn enwedig ar gyfer y sector preifat.

Ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, pleser mawr imi yw cefnogi Amcan 2 a'r rhaglen drosiannol ar gyfer de-ddwyrain Cymru a'r cynnig a gyflwynwyd heddiw. Ysgrifennwyd y ddogfen yn dda ac mae'r themâu cyffredin yn tynnu'n uniongyrchol ar y materion a amlygwyd yn nisgrifiad y sefyllfa gyfredol a'r dadansoddiad o'r cryfderau, gwendidau, cyfleoedd a bygythiadau, neu SWOT.

Er bod hon yn rhaglen llai o lawer yn nhermau ariannol na'r un ar gyfer rhanbarth Amcan 1, mae yr un mor bwysig i bobl dwyrain Cymru. Yn aml, awgrymir bod dwyrain Cymru yn ardal ffyniannus, ond dibynna hynny ar y cyd-destun. Mae cyfraddau anweithgarwch yn y rhanbarth cyfan yn uwch yn gyffredinol na chyfartaledd y DU. Mae cyfran uchel o bobl yn gwneud cais am gymhorthdal incwm mewn rhai ardaloedd hefyd. Noda'r ddogfen fod 47 y cant o gartrefi ym Mharc Tredegar yn gwneud cais am gymhorthdal incwm, yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf.

William Graham: Gwyddom fod ward Parc Tredegar dan anfantais fawr fel ystad dai awdurdod lleol mawr a adeiladwyd ar gyrion y dref. Er iddi gael ei hadeiladu yn y 1970au, hon oedd yr agwedd waethaf ar arfer y 1960au o symud pobl o ganol trefi i'r cyrion. A allwch ein sicrhau y byddwch yn cyflwyno achos cryf yn y Pwyllgor ar roi blaenoriaeth

Committee that that ward and similar ones in other parts of Wales be given particular priority?

Alun Cairns: Thank you for those comments. The document reflects those difficult wards. It highlights Tredegar Park and other areas in the Newport unitary authority, such as Pillgwenlly.

When we talk about the so-called prosperous part of Wales, we must recognise that this region has deprived areas and that it is not necessarily even on a par with the UK average. Furthermore, we must always be aware of potential problems that could arise from the closure of troubled industries. Llanwern is regularly reported in the news for the wrong reasons. Its closure would have a devastating effect on the region's economy. Who could have predicted the announcement a few weeks ago of 2,000 job losses in the electronics industry? The document offers a structured way to overcome some of the difficulties, but flexibility is critical in the implementation from here onwards and after agreement by the Commission.

Evaluation of previous industrial south Wales programmes and rural Objective 5b schemes shows that only 95 per cent of European regional development fund money was committed and, without doubt, not all will be drawn down. This sends a strong message to the implementing organisation, the Welsh European Funding Office, that all forms of support need to be offered to applicants and potential applicants.

I have always sought to highlight the need to support the private sector in maximising the use of available schemes. Paragraph 2.60 highlights the low take-up of resources for supporting small and medium-sized enterprises in the past. The Economic Development Committee is currently reviewing the business support structure. It is essential that implementation and the technical assistance priority be tied in to dovetail with the Committee's recommendations. For too long we have seen the dominance of public sector organisations in seeking structural fund support. The reason

arbennig i'r ward honno a wardiau tebyg mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru?

Alun Cairns: Diolch ichi am y sylwadau hynny. Adlewyrcha'r ddogfen y wardiau anodd hynny. Amlyga Barc Tredegar ac ardaloedd eraill yn awdurdod unedol Casnewydd, fel Pillgwenlly.

Pan soniwn am ardal ffyniannus honedig Cymru, rhaid inni gydnabod bod gan y rhanbarth hwn ardaloedd o dan anfantais ac nid yw o reidrwydd cystal â chyfartaledd y DU. Yn ogystal, rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol bob amser o'r problemau posibl a allai godi wrth gau diwydiannau sydd mewn trafferthion. Sonnir yn rheolaidd am Lanwern yn y newyddion am y rhesymau anghywir. Byddai ei gau yn cael effaith ddinistriol ar economi'r rhanbarth. Pwy allai fod wedi rhagweld y cyhoeddiad ychydig wythnosau yn ôl am 2,000 o swyddi yn cael eu colli yn y diwydiant electroneg? Cynigia'r ddogfen ffordd strwythuredig o oresgyn rhai o'r anawsterau, ond mae hyblygrwydd yn holl bwysig yn y broses weithredu o'r fan hon ymlaen ac ar ôl cytundeb gan y Comisiwn.

Dengys gwerthusiad o raglenni diwydiannol blaenorol de Cymru a chynlluniau gwledig Amcan 5b mai dim ond 95 y cant o arian cronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd a neilltuwyd ac, yn ddiau, ni chaiff y cyfan ei dynnu i lawr. Mae hyn yn anfon neges gref i'r sefydliad sydd yn gweithredu'r cynllun, sef Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, bod angen cynnig pob math o gefnogaeth i ymgeiswyr a darpar ymgeiswyr.

Yr wyf bob amser wedi ceisio amlygu'r angen i gefnogi'r sector preifat wrth wneud y defnydd gorau o'r cynlluniau sydd ar gael. Dengys paragraff 2.60 y gyfradd dderbyn isel o adnoddau ar gyfer cefnogi mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yn y gorffennol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn adolygu'r strwythur cymorth busnes. Mae'n hanfodol bod y gweithrediad a'r flaenoriaeth o ran cymorth technegol yn gysylltiedig â hyn er mwyn plethu ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor. Ers gormod o amser bellach gwelsom sefydliadau'r sector cyhoeddus yn arglwyddiaethu wrth geisio

behind my amendment 1 is to ensure adequate support for the SME sector as well as the priority it rightly deserves in the document.

However, in the case of Objective 2 and this programme, there is a potential for the larger Objective 1 scheme to dominate the implementation arrangements. No one would deny the political sensitivity around the Objective 1 scheme. There is a danger that the priority placed on Objective 1, because of the attention that it gains, will undermine the implementation of Objective 2. I will clarify the use of the word 'undermine' in my amendment, as the Minister raised that point. The currently perceived lack of resources and effective management in WEFO will limit the capacity to deliver on the Objective 2 programme. However, even with the political sensitivity and so-called priority that Objective 1 has gained, few people would deny that the implementation is something of a shambles at present. I look forward to that improving as the organisation gains experience of handling applications and dealing with prospective applicants. At the moment, the private sector feels excluded, the public sector does not know how the regional schemes will fit with local projects and the voluntary organisations are being held back by the technical and complex method of submitting applications. Furthermore, timescales are unclear and match funding will also relate to this scheme.

We accept this document positively. We will support the motion that proposes the technical changes to gain approval by the Commission. I congratulate the people who have been involved in drafting the scheme and the partnership that they have developed in proposing a positive document. We will support all the amendments.

Phil Williams: I propose amendment 2. Add at the end of the motion as a new clause:

applauds the recognition in the single programming document that unplanned economic growth may have negative

cymorth gan gronfeydd strwythurol. Y rheswm y tu ôl i'm gwelliant 1 yw sicrhau digon o gefnogaeth i'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn ogystal â'r flaenoriaeth y mae'n ei haeddu yn y ddogfen.

Fodd bynnag, yn achos Amcan 2 a'r rhaglen hon, mae potensial i'r cynllun Amcan 1 mwy o faint dra-arglwyddiaethu ar y trefniadau gweithredu. Ni fyddai neb yn gwadu'r sensitifrwydd gwleidyddol sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r cynllun Amcan 1. Mae perygl i'r flaenoriaeth a osodir ar Amcan 1, oherwydd y sylw a gaiff, danseilio gweithrediad Amcan 2. Egluraf y defnydd o'r gair 'tanseilio' yn fy ngwelliant, gan fod y Gweinidog wedi codi'r pwynt hwnnw. Bydd y diffyg adnoddau a rheolaeth effeithiol a ganfyddir ar hyn o bryd yn Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn cyfyngu ar y gallu i gyflawni rhaglen Amcan 2. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed gyda'r sensitifrwydd gwleidyddol a'r flaenoriaeth honedig a roddwyd i Amcan 1, ychydig o bobl a fyddai'n gwadu bod y gweithrediad yn llanast llwyr ar hyn o bryd. Edrychaf ymlaen at hynny'n gwella wrth i'r sefydliad fagu profiad o ymdrin â cheisiadau a delio â darpar ymgeiswyr. Ar hyn o bryd, teimla'r sector preifat fel pe bai wedi ei allgáu, ni wŷr y sector cyhoeddus sut y bydd y cynlluniau rhanbarthol yn cydweddu â phrosiectau lleol a chaiff y sefydliadau gwirfoddol eu dal yn ôl gan y dull technegol a chymhleth o gyflwyno ceisiadau. Yn ogystal, mae'r terfynau amser hefyd yn aneglur a bydd arian cyfatebol hefyd yn ymwneud â'r cynllun hwn.

Derbyniwn y ddogfen hon yn gadarnhaol. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig sydd yn cynnig y newidiadau technegol i ennill cymeradwyaeth gan y Comisiwn. Hoffwn longyfarch y bobl a fu'n gysylltiedig â drafftio'r cynllun a'r bartneriaeth y maent wedi ei datblygu wrth gynnig dogfen gadarnhaol. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r holl welliannau.

Phil Williams: Cynigaf welliant 2. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

yn cymeradwyo'r gydnabyddiaeth yn y ddogfen rhaglennu sengl y gallai twf economaidd heb ei gynllunio gael effaith

environmental impact and urges sufficient commitment to development such as: local sustainable renewable energy schemes; broadband communication; waste recycling and improved access to public transport to ensure the combination of sustained economic growth with positive environmental impact;

I propose amendment 3. Add at end of motion as new clause:

calls on the Minister for Economic Development to act upon the request of the European Commission, as included in its response to the draft single programming documents, to adopt specific targets for information and communications technology.

I propose amendment 4. Add at end of motion as new clause:

urges the Coalition Government of Wales to establish a national partnership to co-ordinate the rural policies contained in priority 5 of the Objective 1 programme, priority 2 of the Objective 2 programme; the rural development plan and the LEADER+ community initiative.

I propose amendment 5. Add at end of motion as new clause:

approves the proposed division of responsibility between regional and local action plans in the Objective 2 programme and regrets the failure to ensure such a clear division across the whole range of European structural fund programmes in Wales.

I propose amendment 6. Add at end of motion as new clause:

recognises that the extra funds allocated in the comprehensive spending review to cover European grants for the structural funds and the community initiatives assumes a gradual build-up of actual spending and urges the Coalition Government of Wales to press the Treasury for a guarantee that if the spending on worthwhile projects increases more rapidly than assumed in the CSR the extra funds will be allocated.

amgylcheddol negyddol, ac yn annog ymrwymiad digonol i ddatblygiadau fel: cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy cynaliadwy lleol; cyfathrebu band eang; ailgylchu gwastraff a hwyluso gallu'r cyhoedd i fanteisio ar drafndiaeth gyhoeddus, i sicrhau cyfuniad o dwf economaidd cynaliadwy ac effaith amgylcheddol gadarnhaol.

Cynigiad welliant 3. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i weithredu ar gais y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, fel a gynhwysir yn ei ymateb i'r dogfennau rhaglennu sengl drafft, i fabwysiadu targedau penodol ar gyfer technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu.

Cynigiad welliant 4. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

yn annog Llywodraeth Glymblaid Cymru i sefydlu partneriaeth genedlaethol i gyd-drefnu'r polisiau gwledig a gynhwysir yn mlaenoriaeth 5 o'r rhaglen Amcan 1, blaenoriaeth 2 o'r rhaglen Amcan 2; yn cynllun datblygu gwledig a menter gymunedol LEADER+.

Cynigiad welliant 5. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

yn cymeradwyo'r bwriad i rannu cyfrifoldeb rhwng cynlluniau gweithredu rhanbarthol a lleol yn y rhaglen Amcan 2 ac yn gresynu'r methiant i sicrhau'r cyfryw raniad clir ar draws yr ystod gyfan o'r rhaglenni cronfa strwythurol Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru.

Cynigiad welliant 6. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

yn cydnabod bod y cyllid ychwanegol a neilltuwyd yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant i gwmpasu grantiau Ewropeaidd ar gyfer y cronfeydd strwythurol a'r mentrau cymunedol yn golygu cynnydd graddol yn y gwir wariant ac yn annog Llywodraeth Glymblaid Cymru i bwysu ar y Trysorlys i gadarnhau petai'r gwariant ar brosiectau gwerth chweil yn cynyddu'n gynt na'r hyn a ragwelwyd yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, y bydd cyllid ychwanegol yn cael ei neilltuo.

When I praised the draft version of the Objective 2 single programming document, the authors were admirably modest and explained that in writing it they had the advantage of learning from the problems with Objective 1. They were too modest; this is a well-conceived and well-delivered policy document. I particularly welcome the way that a coherent strategy leads to a well-considered exit strategy. The main message from Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales is that in reality, Objective 1 can now learn from Objective 2 and that is the purpose of some of our amendments, which are all carefully worded to be positive and constructive.

When the first draft was debated, we proposed three amendments that were adopted. The first was one to ensure that ethnic minorities living in the Objective 2 region play a full part in the implementation of the programme. Economic Development Committee members were pleased to hear of the positive response to the wording of that amendment and how 14 different ethnic organisations are now involved in the partnership. Owen John Thomas will explain why this is an important step, but needs to be consolidated in the implementation.

Our second amendment in May and our amendment 2 today—and I am glad to learn that it will be supported—starts with a genuine appreciation of the honesty of the SPD in facing up to a major challenge in implementing sustainable development. There can be conflict between undirected economic growth and the environment. However, at the same time, there are many opportunities to combine geographically distributed economic prosperity with positive environmental gain. Cynog Dafis will mention some of the ways in which that can be done. However, we need more than a reassuring form of words. We must ensure that there are clear environmental targets in the programme complement and that there is a proper emphasis on environmental targets in the scoring criteria adopted by the Welsh European Funding Office. The record of Objective 1 is mixed, with only eight of the 32 measures giving environmental factors a high weighting. It is particularly

Pan ganmolais y fersiwn drafft o ddogfen rhaglennu sengl Amcan 2, yr oedd yr awduron yn rhyfeddol o ddiymhongar ac eglurasant eu bod, wrth ei hysgrifennu, wedi cael y fantais o ddysgu o broblemau Amcan 1. Yr oeddent yn rhy ddiymhongar; mae hon yn ddogfen bolisi a luniwyd ac a gyflwynwyd yn dda. Croesawaf yn arbennig y ffordd y mae strategaeth gydlynus yn arwain at strategaeth gadael dra ystyriol. Y brif neges gan Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yw y gall Amcan 1, mewn gwirionedd, ddysgu o Amcan 2 a dyna yw pwrpas rhai o'n gwelliannau, a gafodd eu geirio'n ofalus er mwyn bod yn gadarnhaol ac yn adeiladol.

Pan drafodwyd y drafft cyntaf, cynigiwyd tri gweliant a fabwysiadwyd. Y cyntaf oedd sicrhau bod lleiafrifoedd ethnig sydd yn byw yn rhanbarth Amcan 2 yn chwarae rhan lawn yng ngweithrediad y rhaglen. Yr oedd aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn falch o glywed yr ymateb cadarnhaol i eiriau'r gweliant hwnnw a sut y mae'r 14 o'r sefydliadau ethnig gwahanol bellach yn gysylltiedig â'r bartneriaeth. Bydd Owen John Thomas yn egluro pam bod hwn yn gam pwysig, ond bod angen ei atgyfnerthu yn y gweithrediad.

Dechreuau ein hail welliant ym Mai a'n gweliant 2 heddiw—ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed y caiff ei gefnogi—gyda gwerthfawrogiad gwirioneddol o onestrwydd y ddogfen rhaglennu sengl o ran wynebu her fawr wrth weithredu datblygiad cynaliadwy. Gall gwrthdaro ddigwydd rhwng twf economaidd digyfeiriad a'r amgylchedd. Fodd bynnag, ar yr un pryd, mae llawer o gyfleoedd i gyfuno ffyniant economaidd wedi'i ddsbarthu'n ddaearyddol â mantais amgylcheddol gadarnhaol. Bydd Cynog Dafis yn sôn am rai o'r ffyrdd y gellir gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen mwy na geiriau calonogol arnom. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod targedau amgylcheddol clir yn nogfen ategol y rhaglen a bod pwyslais cywir ar dargedau amgylcheddol yn y meini prawf sgorio a fabwysiadwyd gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Mae record Amcan 1 yn gymysglyd, gyda dim ond wyth o'r 32 o fesurau yn rhoi pwys mawr ar ffactorau amgylcheddol. Mae'n arbennig o siomedig,

disappointing that in scoring priority 2, measure 5 in Objective 1, renewable energy is assessed not according to environmental criteria but according to whether it is cost-effective. We need a more convincing commitment to environmental protection.

It will not come as a complete surprise that I want to ensure that sufficient emphasis is given to information and communications technology, with clear targets. That is a recommendation in the European Commission's response. It is fully justified, and I welcome that amendment 3 will be supported. Pious words are not enough where the development of ICT is concerned. All over Europe, and in the poorest and least dynamic regions in particular, is a conviction that ICT offers salvation and that it will enable those regions to lead the world. The full and rapid development of broadband communication is essential if we are to encourage value-added jobs to be embedded in Wales. However, we must establish ambitious and achievable targets to ensure that we do not fall too far behind in this rapidly changing, state-of-the-art technology.

One other theme that I pick up from the response from Europe—which was positive—is the need for better co-ordination of our programmes, particularly in rural areas. At the moment, we have four European programmes with a rural component: priority 5 of Objective 1, priority 2 of Objective 2, the rural development plan, and the LEADER+ community initiative. If we do not co-ordinate carefully, anomalies will arise. The definition of a rural area is different in the different programmes. In Objective 1, it is proposed that a rural area is a ward where the population density falls below 1.5 per hectare. In LEADER+, the limit is 1.2 per hectare. There may be a good reason for that. There is not a consistent definition in the four programmes. That is just one anomaly. Perhaps the most serious anomaly is that unlike the clear division between the deprived communities of the Valleys and the prosperous urban regions, there is no such clear division in rural areas, which are more continuous throughout Wales. According to official figures for example, the average gross domestic product per capita in Powys is

wrth sgorio blaenoriaeth 2, mesur 5 yn Amcan 1, nad asesir ynni adnewyddadwy yn ôl meini prawf amgylcheddol ond yn ôl a yw'n gost effeithiol. Mae angen ymrwymiad mwy argyhoeddiadol arnom i ddiogelu'r amgylchedd.

Ni fydd yn syndod llwyr fy mod am sicrhau y rhoddir digon o bwyslais ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, gyda thargedau clir. Mae hynny'n argymhelliad yn ymateb y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Mae cyfiawnhad llwyr iddo, ac yr wyf yn falch y caiff gwelliant 3 ei gefnogi. Nid yw geiriau daionus yn ddigon wrth sôn am ddatblyg technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Dros Ewrop gyfan, ac yn yr ardaloedd tlotaf a lleiaf deinamig yn arbennig, credir bod TGCh yn cynnig achubiaeth ac y bydd yn galluogi'r ardaloedd hynny i arwain y byd. Mae datblygiad llawn a chyflym cyfathrebu band eang yn hanfodol os ydym i greu swyddi â gwerth ychwanegol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sefydlu targedau uchelgeisiol a chyflawnadwy er mwyn sicrhau na chawn ein gadael ar ôl yn ormodol yn y dechnoleg fodern hon sydd yn newid yn gyflym.

Un thema arall a nodais o'r ymateb gan Ewrop—a oedd yn gadarnhaol—yw'r angen i gydlynu ein rhaglenni yn well, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym bedair rhaglen Ewropeaidd gydag elfen wledig: blaenoriaeth 5 o Amcan 1, blaenoriaeth 2 o Amcan 2, y cynllun datblygu gwledig, a menter gymunedol LEADER+. Os na chydlynwn yn ofalus, bydd anghysondebau yn codi. Mae'r diffiniad o ardal wledig yn wahanol yn y rhaglenni gwahanol. Yn Amcan 1, cynigir mai ardal wledig yw ward lle mae dwysedd y boblogaeth yn syrthio yn is na 1.5 yr hectar. Yn LEADER+ y terfyn yw 1.2 yr hectar. Efallai bod rheswm da dros hynny. Nid oes diffiniad cyson yn y pedair rhaglen. Un anghysondeb yn unig yw hynny. Efallai'r mai'r anghysondeb mwyaf difrifol yw nad oes y fath beth â rhaniad clir mewn ardaloedd gwledig, sydd yn fwy cyson ledled Cymru, yn wahanol i'r rhaniad clir rhwng cymunedau difreintiedig y Cymoedd a'r rhanbarthau trefol ffyniannus. Yn ôl ffigurau swyddogol er enghraifft, mae'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen ar gyfartaledd ym Mhowys

lower than in much of the Objective 1 area.

yn llai nag y mae mewn cyfran helaeth o'r ardal Amcan 1.

10:55 a.m.

As far as possible, within the rules of the EU funding and knowing that the levels of support must vary according to the agreed boundaries, we should seek a coherent policy for regeneration in all rural areas. That requires much more co-ordination than we have had in the past. I am aware that in developing the Objective 1 rural component, we were doing so in the room next to where the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee was developing the rural development plan. I welcome Mike's assurance that steps will now be taken to ensure co-ordination, but we should have taken them before. I want amendment 4 to be put to this Assembly.

Hyd y gellir, o fewn rheolau ariannu'r UE a chan wybod bod yn rhaid i lefelau'r gefnogaeth amrywio yn ôl y ffiniau cytûn, dylem geisio polisi cydlynus ar gyfer adfywio ym mhob ardal wledig. Mae hynny'n galw am lawer mwy o gydlyniaeth nag a gawsom yn y gorffennol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y buom, wrth ddatblygu elfen wledig Amcan 1, yn gwneud hynny yn yr ystafell drws nesaf i ble yr oedd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn datblygu'r cynllun datblygu gwledig. Croesawaf sicrwydd Mike y caiff camau eu cymryd yn awr i sicrhau cydlyniaeth, ond dylem fod wedi eu cymryd o'r blaen. Yr wyf am i welliant 4 gael ei osod gerbron y Cynulliad hwn.

Amendment 5 also heaps praise on Objective 2. I agree that it was a simpler programme, but the clarity of the division between regional and local partnerships in Objective 2 highlights what remains a serious weakness in Objective 1. We need that clear distinction. The Objective 1 programme has not resolved the problem, and I must put on record that it was a year last July that Plaid Cymru first pointed to that as a serious problem that needed tackling. Last month, Labour Members and Liberal Members voted against solving the problem by allocating indicative budgets. Okay, you rejected the method used effectively in many other European countries, but what is the answer? We must find one soon because in the implementation of Objective 1 and particularly in priority 1, measure 1 and priority 4, measure 4, this must be faced quickly. We need a lead, and if we do not take it, there will be confusion and anger. You can vote against the amendment, but it is a problem that must be tackled. If it is not tackled soon, the full value of our structural programmes, particularly Objective 1, will be damaged.

Mae gwelliant hefyd 5 yn clodfori Amcan 2. Cytunaf ei bod yn rhaglen symlach, ond amlyga eglurder y rhaniad rhwng partneriaethau rhanbarthol a lleol yn Amcan 2 yr hyn sydd yn wendid difrifol yn Amcan 1 o hyd. Mae angen y gwahaniaeth clir hwnnw arnom. Nid yw rhaglen Amcan 1 wedi datrys y broblem, a rhaid imi gofnodi mai flwyddyn i Orffennaf diwethaf y cyfeiriodd Plaid Cymru am y tro cyntaf at hynny fel problem ddifrifol yr oedd angen mynd i'r afael â hi. Fis diwethaf, pleidleisiodd Aelodau Llafur ac Aelodau Rhyddfrydol yn erbyn datrys y broblem drwy ddyrannu cyllidebau dangosol. O'r gorau, gwrthodasoch y dull a ddefnyddiwyd yn effeithiol mewn llawer o wledydd Ewropeaidd eraill, ond beth yw'r ateb? Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i un yn fuan oherwydd wrth weithredu Amcan 1 ac yn arbennig ym mlaenoriaeth 1, mesur 1 a blaenoriaeth 4, mesur 4, rhaid wynebu hyn yn gyflym. Mae angen arweiniad arnom, ac os na chymerwn yr awenau, bydd dryswch a dicter. Gallwch bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant, ond mae'n broblem y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hi. Os nad eir i'r afael â hi yn fuan, fe niweidir gwerth llawn ein rhaglenni strwythurol, yn arbennig Amcan 1.

I now come to my final amendment, amendment 6. Its wording was chosen carefully. Only a dishonest or indifferent person reading that amendment carefully

Deuaf yn awr at fy ngwelliant olaf, gwelliant 6. Dewiswyd y geiriau ynddo yn ofalus. Dim ond person anonest neu ddifater a fyddai'n darllen y gwelliant hwnnw'n ofalus a allai

could possibly vote against it. It starts by recognising that there are extra funds on top of the Barnett block. It then points out that the comprehensive spending review assumed that actual spending on the whole raft of new European programmes would increase gradually. That is beyond dispute. It is in the public domain and the figures are Government figures. It will be £49 million this year, £91 million next year, £131 million the year after, £145 million the year after that and an average of £191 million for the last five years of the programme. Judging by the large number of high quality proposals that WEFO has already received, with some of the measures already oversubscribed, there is a likelihood that we will approve over £200 million of European grants this year under Objective 1 alone. It is certain that actual spending will reach the full average level in two years. I included the word 'if' in the amendment. If I am correct on that—and you can look at the figures and the applications that WEFO has received and if you think that there is even a chance that I am correct—actual spending will reach the full average level much quicker than assumed in the CSR. We want to know that the Government, with the Assembly's full support, will press for the extra funds. Otherwise, there will be a shortfall.

Finally, I read the coalition's partnership agreement carefully. There are many things in it that I found reassuring. I recognised the clause which states that on a year by year basis, the spending of European grants in Wales, and hence the level of European grants drawn down from Brussels to London, may be greater than the spending assumed in the CSR. If that is the case, we support that negotiation. However, that is an agreement that represents the views of two parties. What I wanted in this amendment—and I urge you not to vote against it because it is carefully worded—was for the whole Assembly to press not for an allocation from UK revenue—

The First Minister: That is not in the wording.

bleidleisio yn ei erbyn. Dechreuwa drwy gydnabod bod arian ychwanegol ar gael ar ben bloc Barnett. Yna noda fod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant wedi tybio y byddai'r gwariant ychwanegol ar y pentwr cyfan o raglenni newydd Ewropeaidd yn cynyddu'n raddol. Mae hynny y tu hwnt i amheuaeth. Mae'n gyhoeddus a ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yw'r ffigurau. Bydd yn £49 miliwn eleni, £91 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf, £131 miliwn y flwyddyn wedyn, £145 y flwyddyn wedi honno a chyfartaledd o £191 miliwn am bum mlynedd olaf y rhaglen. A barnu yn ôl nifer fawr y cynigion o ansawdd uchel y mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru eisoes wedi eu derbyn, gyda rhai o'r mesurau eisoes wedi eu gordanysgrifio, mae tebygolrwydd y byddwn yn cymeradwyo dros £200 miliwn o grantiau Ewropeaidd eleni o dan Amcan 1 yn unig. Mae'n sicr y bydd gwariant gwirioneddol yn cyrraedd y lefel lawn ar gyfartaledd mewn dwy flynedd. Cynhwysais y gair 'os' yn y gwelliant. Os wyf yn gywir ynghylch hynny—a gallwch edrych ar y ffigurau a'r ceisiadau y mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru wedi eu derbyn ac os credwch fod hyd yn oed cyfle fy mod yn gywir—bydd gwariant gwirioneddol yn cyrraedd y lefel lawn ar gyfartaledd yn llawer cynt nag y tybir yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Yr ydym am wybod y bydd y Llywodraeth, gyda chefnogaeth lawn y Cynulliad yn pwysu am arian ychwanegol. Fel arall, bydd prinder.

Yn olaf, darllenais gytundeb partneriaeth y glymblaid yn ofalus. Mae llawer o bethau calonogol ynddo. Cydnabyddais y cymal sydd yn nodi, fesul blwyddyn, y gall gwariant grantiau Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru, ac felly lefel y grantiau Ewropeaidd a ddaw o Frwsel i Lundain, fod yn fwy na'r gwariant a dybir yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Os felly, cefnogwn y negodi hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae hwnnw'n gytundeb sydd yn cynrychioli barn y ddwy blaid. Yr hyn yr oeddwn ei eisiau yn y gwelliant hwn—ac fe'ch anogaf i beidio â phleidleisio yn ei erbyn gan ei fod wedi ei eirio'n ofalus—oedd i'r Cynulliad cyfan bwysu nid am ddyraniad o refeniw y DU—

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw hynny yn y geiriad.

Phil Williams: As I said, it is difficult, if you look carefully at the wording, to see how you could deny the opportunity to say that Wales as a whole, represented by all parties in this Assembly, not just two, has a right to money that is drawn down from Brussels for specific projects in Wales. It should have been an annually managed expenditure, not a departmental expenditure limit, but that is a technicality. The fact is that it would surely be of strength if the coalition could press for this with the full support of the Assembly. The wording of the amendment was carefully chosen to include the word 'if' Rhodri. I urge you to reconsider that—[*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. If Members want to intervene, they should stand up so that they can be caught on the record, Rhodri. We all want to hear what people have to say. I believe that we have enough time for everybody to speak. If people can keep to five minutes, I will allow time for anybody who wishes to intervene—limited of course—but with a bit of luck, everybody who has asked will be able to make a contribution.

Val Feld: Thank you, in your new role as Deputy Presiding Officer, for allowing me to speak. This is an important part of the end of the first stage of the development of our structural funds programmes. It is important that we see this in the context of the three structural funds programmes and our range of community initiatives. I will speak particularly about the issue of co-ordination and monitoring and evaluation and how these programmes fit into our role as an Assembly and our need to develop an economic development strategy. As many of you know, the Economic Development Committee, having started to develop a national economic development strategy last year, put that to one side to work on the structural funds programme. We have now returned to it. We are clear about the importance of locating these programmes in the context of the strategic objectives of our overall economic strategy. How do we ensure that? Alun Cairns made some points earlier—and I agree with Alun and Mike—that the Objective 2 programme is important. It is particularly important because we build directly on the experience of the old industrial south Wales

Phil Williams: Fel y dywedais, mae'n anodd, os edrychwch yn ofalus ar y geiriad, gweld sut y gallech wadu'r cyfle i ddweud bod gan Gymru yn gyffredinol, a gynrychiolir gan bob blaid yn y Cynulliad hwn, nid dwy yn unig, yr hawl i arian a ddaw o Frwsel ar gyfer prosiectau penodol yng Nghymru. Dylai fod wedi bod yn wariant a reolir yn flynyddol, nid yn derfyn gwariant adrannol, ond pwynt technegol yw hynny. Y gwir yw y byddai'n sicr o fantais pe bai'r glymblaid yn gallu pwyso am hyn gyda chefnogaeth lawn y Cynulliad. Dewiswyd geiriad y gwelliant yn ofalus Rhodri, i gynnwys y gair 'os'. Fe'ch anogaf i ailystyried hynny—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Os yw Aelodau am ymyrryd, dylent sefyll, Rhodri, fel y gellir cofnodi eu geiriau. Mae pob un ohonom am glywed beth sydd gan bobl i'w ddweud. Credaf fod gennym ddigon o amser i bawb siarad. Os gall pobl gadw at bum munud, caniatâf amser i unrhyw un sydd yn dymuno ymyrryd—wedi ei gyfyngu wrth gws—ond gydag ychydig o lwc, bydd pawb sydd wedi gofyn yn gallu gwneud cyfraniad.

Val Feld: Diolch ichi, yn eich rôl newydd fel Dirprwy Lywydd, am ganiatáu imi siarad. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o ddiwedd cam cyntaf datblygiad ein rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun y tair rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol a'n hystod o fentrau cymunedol. Soniaf yn arbennig am fater cydlynu a monitro a gwerthuso a sut y mae'r rhaglenni hyn yn cydweddu â'n rôl fel Cynulliad a'n hangen i ddatblygu strategaeth datblygu economaidd. Fel y gŵyr llawer ohonoch, rhoddodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, ar ôl dechrau datblygu strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol y llynedd, hwnnw o'r neilltu i weithio ar y rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol. Yr ydym yn awr wedi dychwelyd ato. Yr ydym yn glir ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd lleoli'r rhaglenni hyn yng nghyd-destun amcanion strategol ein strategaeth economaidd gyffredinol. Sut y sicrhawn hynny? Gwnaeth Alun Cairns rai pwyntiau yn gynharach—a chytunaf ag Alun a Mike—fod rhaglen Amcan 2 yn bwysig. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig gan ein bod yn adeiladu'n uniongyrchol ar brofiad rhaglenni yr hen dde

programmes, which have been in existence for six years. Half of these are transitional programmes from the old programme and some are new Objective 2, but a great deal of it is built directly on our experience.

We have a great deal to learn from this for the Objective 1 programme. We have done six years of this before. We now know much more about what works and what does not. We know about the problems that can arise if there is not a clear strategic framework in terms of the likelihood of money going to projects that duplicate services on the ground. We also know of last minute applications because of money that must be spent by a certain end-year, and of partnerships that are partnerships in name but not in daily practice. We can learn a great deal from this and build it into our Objective 1 programme. I know that Mike is keen on monitoring and evaluation, as am I, and I refer you to a couple of paragraphs from the single programming document. Paragraph 2.1, which refers to the evaluation of the previous programme, states that,

‘despite the positive results in the programmes, there has been little evidence of any real relative improvements in the economic performance of the area’.

That is of real concern to us and we must consider the reason why. It is partly because there are many macro-economic factors and changes in the industrial base. Things happen that can impact on the actual changes that can be delivered by these programmes. They were not huge programmes compared to Objective 2.

11:05 a.m.

The other very important element for us is that on these old industrial south Wales programmes—I declare an interest because I was a member of the monitoring committee for the industrial south Wales programmes—we did not have proper baseline data when we started to develop the project. We did not have the information on which to judge what would demonstrate progress and, because we did not have that data, many of the targets that were set were not easily measurable or

Cymru ddiwydiannol, a fu mewn bodolaeth ers chwe mlynedd. Mae hanner y rhain yn rhai trosiannol o'r hen raglen a rhai yn rhaglenni Amcan 2 newydd, ond caiff llawer ohono ei seilio'n uniongyrchol ar ein profiad.

Mae gennym lawer iawn i'w ddysgu o hyn ar gyfer y rhaglen Amcan 1. Yr ydym wedi gwneud chwe mlynedd o hyn o'r blaen. Bellach, gwyddom lawer mwy am yr hyn sydd yn gweithio a'r hyn nad yw'n gweithio. Gwyddom am y problemau a all godi os nad oes fframwaith strategol clir yn nhermau'r tebygolrwydd y defnyddir yr arian ar gyfer prosiectau sydd yn dyblygu gwasanaethau ar lawr gwlad. Gwyddom hefyd am geisiadau munud olaf oherwydd arian y mae'n rhaid ei wario erbyn diwedd blwyddyn benodol, ac oherwydd partneriaethau sydd yn bartneriaethau mewn enw ond nad arferir yn ddyddiol. Gallwn ddysgu llawer iawn o hyn a'i gynnwys yn ein rhaglen Amcan 1. Gwn fod Mike yn awyddus i fonitro a gwerthuso, fel yr wyf innau, ac fe'ch cyfeiriaf at ychydig o baragraffau o'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl. Noda paragraff 2.1, sydd yn cyfeirio at werthuso'r rhaglen flaenorol,

‘er gwaethaf y canlyniadau cadarnhaol yn y rhaglenni, ychydig o dystiolaeth a gafwyd o wir welliannau cymharol ym mherfformiad economaidd yr ardal’.

Mae hynny'n bryder gwirioneddol inni a rhaid inni ystyried y rheswm pam. Mae'n rhannol am fod cymaint o ffactorau macro-economaidd a newidiadau yn y sylfaen ddiwydiannol. Gall pethau ddigwydd sydd yn effeithio ar y newidiadau gwirioneddol y gall y rhaglenni hyn eu cyflawni. Nid oeddent yn rhaglenni enfawr o'u cymharu ag Amcan 2.

Yr elfen bwysig iawn arall inni yw nad oedd gennym, ar hen raglenni de Cymru ddiwydiannol—datganaf fuddiant oherwydd yr oeddwn yn aelod o'r pwyllgor monitro ar gyfer rhaglenni de Cymru ddiwydiannol—ddata gwaelodlin cywir pan ddechreuasom ddatblygu'r prosiect. Nid oedd yr wybodaeth gennym i farnu'r hyn a fyddai'n arddangos cynnydd a, chan nad oedd y data hwnnw gennym, nid oedd llawer o'r targedau a bennwyd yn hawdd eu mesur neu nid oeddent

did not judge performance. I quote from paragraph 2.18 of the document:

‘The targets set for the programmes were quite modest and in some cases of limited use in assessing performance against the programmes’ objectives. The overall approach to establishing project targets and monitoring subsequent performance was often unsatisfactory.’

Clearly we must do it much better now, and we must do so across the three programmes, and across the community initiatives also, if we are going to make this money work for us. The report goes on to state:

‘A major weakness in the approach to monitoring the performance of the programme relates to the lack of integration between the various monitoring systems employed ... and the lack of consistency and low level of commitment to the value of monitoring and evaluation amongst project sponsors.’

I know that we will do it differently, but we must ensure that this happens effectively. Integration across the programmes will be fundamental to this. Here I come to Phil’s proposal on rural areas. I strongly believe that we must have a regular mechanism for bringing together the monitoring committees of all these programmes. Some of you know that I have pushed hard on this issue in committee—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am sorry to cut you off in full flow, but you will have to come to the point fairly quickly, as you are already one minute over time.

Val Feld: I am just concluding. We must discuss a great deal more how we will do this, whether we separate rural and urban areas, whether we separate different issues. That means a great deal more debate, but it needs to happen. Also the Assembly must not be frightened of taking a clear strategic direction over this, in the context of our national economic development strategy when it is finished. We must be willing to say to the monitoring committees, if required,

yn barnu perfformiad. Dyfynnaf o baragraff 2.18 y ddogfen:

‘Yr oedd y targedau a osodwyd ar gyfer y rhaglenni yn rhai eithaf cymedrol ac, mewn rhai achosion, nid oedd fawr o werth iddynt o ran asesu perfformiad yn erbyn amcanion y rhaglenni. Yr oedd yr agwedd gyffredinol at sefydlu targedau prosiectau a monitro’r perfformiad dilynol yn anfodddhaol yn aml.’

Yn amlwg rhaid inni wneud hynny’n llawer gwell yn awr, a rhaid inni wneud hynny ar draws y tair rhaglen, ac ar draws y mentrau cymunedol hefyd, os ydym am wneud i’r arian weithio inni. Â’r adroddiad yn ei flaen i nodi:

‘Gwendid mawr yr agwedd at fonitro perfformiad y rhaglen oedd y diffyg integreiddio rhwng y gwahanol systemau monitro a ddefnyddiwyd ... a’r diffyg cysondeb a’r ymrwymiad gwan i werth monitro a gwerthuso ymysg noddwyr prosiectau.’

Gwn y byddwn yn ei wneud mewn ffordd wahanol, ond rhaid inni sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd yn effeithiol. Bydd integreiddio ar draws y rhaglenni yn sylfaenol i hyn. Deuaf yn awr at gynig Phil ar ardaloedd gwledig. Credaf yn gryf fod yn rhaid inni gael mecanwaith rheolaidd ar gyfer dwyn ynghyd bwyllgorau monitro’r holl rhaglenni hyn. Gŵyr rhai ohonoch fy mod wedi gwthio’n galed ar y mater hwn yn y pwyllgor—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae’n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar eich traws a chithau’n mynd i hwyl, ond bydd yn rhaid ichi ddod i’r pwynt yn eithaf cyflym, gan eich bod eisoes funud dros yr amser.

Val Feld: Yr wyf ar fin dod i ben. Rhaid inni drafod yn llawer helaethach sut y byddwn yn gwneud hyn, pa un a fyddwn yn gwahanu ardaloedd gwledig a threfol neu’n gwahanu materion gwahanol. Golyga hynny lawer rhagor o ddadlau, ond mae angen iddo ddigwydd. Hefyd ni ddylai fod ar y Cynulliad ofn cymryd arweiniad strategol clir ar hyn, yng nghyd-destun ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol pan gaiff ei chwblhau. Rhaid inni fod yn barod, os oes

that they should adjust their priorities and the allocation of resources, and ensure that we watch the impact of all of these programmes on the ground.

Cynog Dafis: Yr wyf am ddweud gair yn arbennig am yr adran yn y ddogfen ar gynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol, o baragraff 7.45 ymlaen. Hoffwn siarad hefyd o blaid gwelliant 2 yn enw Phil Williams. Croesawaf y gydnabyddiaeth onest yn y ddogfen hon y gallai cyrraedd amcanion economaidd y rhaglen wrthdaro â lles yr amgylchedd.

Yr wyf yn pwysleisio mai'r ffordd o ymdrin â'r gwrthdaro dichonol hwn yw sicrhau twf sylweddol mewn sectorau sydd yn seiliedig ar egwyddorion cynaliadwyedd. Er enghraifft, gellid pwysleisio trafniadaeth gyhoeddus a defnyddio cerbydau sydd yn defnyddio hydrogen, tanwydd y dyfodol—sydd yn cael ei ddatblygu eisoes—strategaethau gwastraff cynaliadwy, ac yn y blaen.

Hoffwn yn arbennig groesawu paragraff 7.51 a'r adran am gynnal a gwella asedau amgylchedd y rhanbarth, sydd yn cyfeirio at yr angen am wrthweithio newid yr hinsawdd fel ystyriaeth ganolog, ac yn dweud

'Bydd hyn yn golygu camau i hyrwyddo arbediadau ynni ... ac i hyrwyddo defnydd ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy cynaliadwy.'

Yr wyf yn hynod o falch nad yw'r ddogfen hon yn rhoi effeithlonrwydd ynni ac ynni adnewyddadwy mewn cystadleuaeth â'i gilydd fel y clywais rai bobl yn ei wneud, gan gynnwys rhai o swyddogion Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Mae'n rhaid gwneud y ddau beth, wrth gwrs, hyd eithaf ein gallu. Mae arbed ynni yn bwysig eithriadol; mae potensial mawr iddo. Fodd bynnag, ar yr un pryd, mae'r galw am ynni ar gynnydd carlamus. Er enghraifft, bydd datblygu teledu digidol yn cynyddu defnyddio trydan yn sylweddol ac, felly, allyriadau carbon. Mae'n rhaid gwneud rhywbeth am effeithlonrwydd ond, ar yr un pryd, rhaid cynhyrchu ynni mewn ffordd fwy cynaliadwy.

angen, i ddweud wrth y pwyllgorau monitro y dylent addasu eu blaenoriaethau a'r modd y dyrennir adnoddau, a sicrhau ein bod yn gwylio effaith yr holl raglenni hyn ar lawr gwlad.

Cynog Dafis: I want to pay particular attention to the section in the document on environmental sustainability, from paragraph 7.45 onwards. I would also like to speak in favour of amendment 2 in the name of Phil Williams. I welcome the honest recognition in this document that achieving the programme's economic aims could clash with the environmental concerns.

I emphasise that the way of tackling this potential clash is to ensure significant growth in sectors that are based on the principles of sustainability. For example, one could emphasise public transport and the use of vehicles that use hydrogen, the fuel of the future—which is already being developed—sustainable waste strategies, and so on.

I would especially like to welcome paragraph 7.51 and the section on maintaining and improving the region's environmental assets, which refers to the need to counteract climate change as a central consideration, and says

'This will entail steps to promote energy savings ... and promote the use of sustainable renewable energy sources.'

I am extremely pleased that this document does not place energy efficiency and renewable energy in competition with each other as I have heard some people doing, including some officials of the Countryside Council for Wales. Both of these things must be done, of course, to the best of our ability. Saving energy is exceptionally important; it has great potential. However, at the same time, the demand for energy is accelerating rapidly. For example, the development of digital television will substantially increase the use of electricity and, therefore, carbon emissions. Something must be done about efficiency but, at the same time, energy must be produced in a more sustainable way.

Ynglŷn ag ynni, mae'r ddogfen yn dweud, wrth gyfeirio at ddatblygu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ym mharagraff 7.65, fod effaith gyfan y rhaglen yn debyg o fod ychydig yn negyddol o ran yr amcan hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, os cymerir pob cyfle i sicrhau effeithlonrwydd ynni ac ynni adnewyddadwy, gall y rhaglen gyflawni effeithiau cadarnhaol.

Mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, o bawb, yn sicrhau ein bod yn colli pob cyfle yn y maes allweddol hwn. Derbynna gymorth parod gan fudiadau sydd yn honni eu bod yn caru'r amgylchedd, a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn arbennig. Eu gwir agenda, hyd y gwelaf fi, yw gwarchod Cymru fel gwlad brydferth. Nid yw hynny yr un peth â chynaliadwydd amgylcheddol. Mae hynny'n creu trafferthion i gwmnïau Cymreig.

Ddoe, cawsom gyfarfod gyda chwmmi o'r enw DJ Construction/Windjen o Gonwy, fe gredaf. Mae hwnnw'n gwmni Cymreig sydd wedi arallgyfeirio i ynni gwynt. Caiff ei gosbi'n ariannol am wneud hynny, er bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol wedi gwahodd pobl i fynd i mewn i'r maes allweddol hwnnw. Mae'r hyn sydd yn digwydd i DJ Construction drwy weithredoedd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn groes i'r hyn sydd yn y ddogfen hon ac yn groes i'r hyn y dylem fod yn ei wneud o ran sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy.

Rhaid inni warchod yr amgylchedd a datblygu'r economi fel eu bod yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Daw cyfle pwysig i ddechrau gwneud hynny gyda'r ddogfen ar strategaeth ynni adnewyddadwy, sydd yn cael ei pharatoi gan Sustainable Energy Cyfyngedig.

Glyn Davies: Do you agree that calling in applications and extending the process for dealing with proposals over a period of perhaps two or three years is an almost equally effective way of destroying those proposals as is working openly against them? The Assembly has been guilty of that on several applications.

Cynog Dafis: Cytunaf. Mae lle i amau bod y rhai sydd yn gweithio yn erbyn y cynigion yn agored yn gweithio i sicrhau bod ceisiadau yn

On energy, the document states, in referring to the development of small and medium-sized enterprises in paragraph 7.65, that the programme's overall effect is likely to be somewhat negative in terms of that objective. However, if every opportunity is taken to ensure energy efficiency and sustainable energy, the programme can achieve positive effects.

The Minister for Environment, of all people, is ensuring that we are missing out on every opportunity in this key area. She is readily assisted by organisations that claim to love the environment, and the Countryside Council for Wales in particular. Their true agenda, as far as I see, is safeguarding Wales as a picturesque country. That is not the same as environmental sustainability. That creates problems for Welsh companies.

Yesterday, we had a meeting with a company called DJ Construction/Windjen from Conwy, I believe. It is a Welsh company that has diversified into wind energy. It is being penalised financially for doing so, although the United Kingdom Government has invited people to go into that key area. What is happening to DJ Construction through the actions of the Minister for Environment is contrary to what is contained in this document and contrary to what we should be doing in terms of ensuring sustainable development.

We must safeguard the environment and develop the economy so that they work together. This document on a renewable energy strategy, which is being prepared by Sustainable Energy Limited, brings with it an important opportunity to begin to do that.

Glyn Davies: A ydych yn cytuno bod galw ceisiadau i mewn ac ymestyn y broses ar gyfer delio â chynigion dros gyfnod o ddwy neu dair blynedd, efallai, yn ffordd yr un mor mor effeithiol o ddiinstrio'r cynigion hynny ag yw gweithio'n agored yn eu herbyn? Bu'r Cynulliad yn euog o hynny ar sawl cais.

Cynog Dafis: I agree. There is room to suspect that those who are working openly against the proposals are working to ensure

cael eu galw i mewn. Mae'r ddau beth hynny gyda'i gilydd yn ffordd o ddinistrio diwydiant sydd yn tyfu ac sydd â photensial pwysig yn y maes hwn.

Dychwelaf at y cyfle cadarnhaol sydd gennym. Mae dogfen ar strategaeth ynni adnewyddadwy yn cael ei pharatoi gan Sustainable Energy ym Mae Caerdydd, ar gais y Prif Weinidog. Bydd y ddogfen honno yn barod cyn bo hir. Bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau fframwaith cynllunio ffafriol ar frys i sicrhau bod y strategaeth honno yn cael ei gweithredu'n rymus, er mwyn inni achub ar y cyfle i roi Cymru ar y blaen. Yr ydym yn cwmpo yn ôl, y tu ôl i Iwerddon a'r Alban, sydd yn symud ymlaen yn gyflym yn y maes hwn. Byddai hynny yn rhoi sylwedd i'r holl rethreg sydd gennym ynglŷn â datblygu cynaliadwy. Nid rhethreg sydd ei heisiau arnom, ond gweithredu effeithiol. Rhaid inni symud ymlaen, datblygu'r diwydiant, creu swyddi a chreu ffyniant.

11:15 a.m.

Mick Bates: It appears that this debate has turned into one about renewable energy. The higher the profile, the better, of course.

Returning to the document in hand, I agree that we must congratulate its authors. It is a reflection of the process that has taken place through the East Wales Partnership, which includes diverse groups such as Powys, Newport and Cardiff. The whole process has been handled and run well and the document clearly identifies needs that will be met by this programme.

Without raking over too much history, there was always tremendous disappointment in east Wales that rural Powys was not included in the Objective 1 programme. We are sandwiched between the English counties, which have received extra assistance from their Government, and west Wales, where there will be substantial investment through Objective 1.

Although the funds—£50 million, or whatever the sum will be when it is drawn down—are welcome, the Minister must make efforts to ensure that east Wales receives

that applications are called in. Those two things together are a means of destroying an industry which is growing and which has important potential in this area.

I return to the positive opportunity that we have. A document on a sustainable energy strategy is being prepared by Sustainable Energy in Cardiff Bay, at the request of the First Minister. That document will be ready before long. We will have to ensure a favourable planning framework urgently to ensure that that strategy is implemented thoroughly, so that we take advantage of the opportunity to put Wales at the forefront. We are falling behind Ireland and Scotland, who are moving forward quickly in this area. That would give substance to all our rhetoric about sustainable development. We do not need rhetoric, but effective implementation. We must move forward, develop the industry, create jobs and create prosperity.

Mick Bates: Ymddengys bod y ddadl hon wedi troi yn un am ynni adnewyddadwy. Po uchaf y proffil, gorau oll, wrth gwrs.

Gan ddychwelyd at y ddogfen dan sylw, cytunaf fod yn rhaid inni longyfarch ei hawduron. Mae'n adlewyrchiad o'r broses a ddigwyddodd drwy Bartneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru, sydd yn cynnwys grwpiau amrywiol fel Powys, Casnewydd a Chaerdydd. Ymdriniwyd â'r broses gyfan yn dda ac mae'n mynd rhagddi'n dda ac mae'r ddogfen yn nodi'n glir yr anghenion a gaiff eu bodloni gan y rhaglen hon.

Heb fynd yn ôl dros hanes yn ormodol, yr oedd siomedigaeth fawr bob amser yn nwyrain Cymru nad oedd Powys wedi ei chynnwys yn rhaglen Amcan 1. Yr ydym yn y canol rhwng siroedd Lloegr, a gafodd gymorth ychwanegol gan eu Llywodraeth, a gorllewin Cymru, lle bydd buddsoddiad sylweddol drwy Amcan 1.

Er y croesewir y cronfeydd—£50 miliwn, neu beth bynnag fydd y swm pan gaiff ei dynnu i lawr—rhaid i'r Gweinidog wneud ymdrech i sicrhau y caiff dwyrain Cymru

regional assistance in the form of tier 3. Other property grants must also be extended to ensure that we can retain and develop our small and medium-sized business base in east Wales, which is one of the primary objectives. The competition from Objective 1 may well attract more and more businesses to Wales or, indeed, as I mentioned before, to the English borders.

We are particularly concerned about the decline in the economy of rural areas. I know that the needs could be met with greater co-ordination. I agree with many speakers who insisted that all the raw elements of the documents before us must be well co-ordinated. To this end, we need to establish a body in this Assembly to oversee that. It is important that it meets the Programme Monitoring Committee to ensure that time is not wasted. There could be considerable duplication of effort.

The voluntary sector, with which many of us are familiar as members of the Programme Monitoring Committee, often gives its time freely. We must consider how people's time will be affected by so many rural elements. Within that process, the lead body needs to be appointed urgently. The lead body will require considerable technical assistance to be able to provide the secretariat to prioritise all the bids. I want to know how soon this will occur and what technical assistance will be available to ensure that the process keeps moving. One of the great things about Objective 2 is that, through the east Wales partnership, the people have kept the process moving.

Cynog raised the issue of renewable energy. There lies the greatest challenge for us in Wales. Cynog mentioned the need for good planning guidelines to allow this to happen. I want to introduce another dimension, which I consider equally important. Without this overall strategy and the planning guidelines to enable this development to take place, the companies will not look at Wales. They will turn to other countries where there is a positive and proactive attitude to the development of renewable energy—

gymorth rhanbarthol ar ffurf haen 3. Rhaid ymestyn grantiau eiddo eraill hefyd er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn gadw a datblygu ein sylfaen busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn nwyrain Cymru, sydd yn un o'r prif amcanion. Efallai y bydd y gystadleuaeth gan Amcan 1 yn denu mwy a mwy o fusnesau i Gymru neu, yn wir, fel y soniais o'r blaen, i'r gororau.

Yr ydym yn pryderu'n arbennig am y dirywiad yn economi'r ardaloedd gwledig. Gwn y gellid diwallu'r anghenion drwy gydlynw'n well. Cytunaf â nifer o siaradwyr a fynnai fod yn rhaid i holl elfennau crai y dogfennau ger ein bron gael eu cydlynw'n dda. I'r perwyl hwn, mae angen inni sefydlu corff yn y Cynulliad hwn i oruchwylio hynny. Mae'n bwysig ei fod yn cyfarfod â'r Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni er mwyn sicrhau na wastreffir amser. Gallai cryn ddyblygu ymdrech ddigwydd.

Mae'r sector gwirfoddol, y mae llawer ohonom yn gyfarwydd ag ef fel aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni, yn aml yn rhoi o'i amser yn rhydd. Rhaid inni ystyried sut y bydd cymaint o elfennau gwledig yn effeithio ar amser pobl. O fewn y broses honno, mae angen penodi'r corff arweiniol ar fyrder. Bydd angen cryn gymorth technegol ar y corff blaen i'w alluogi i ddarparu'r ysgrifenyddiaeth i flaenoriaethu'r holl gynigion. Yr wyf am wybod pa mor fuan y digwydd hyn a pha gymorth technegol fydd ar gael i sicrhau bod y broses yn parhau i symud. Un o'r pethau gwyach am Amcan 2 yw bod y bobl, drwy bartneriaeth dwyrain Cymru, wedi sicrhau bod y broses yn parhau i symud.

Cododd Cynog fater ynni adnewyddadwy. Dyna'r her fwyaf inni yng Nghymru. Soniodd Cynog am yr angen am ganllawiau cynllunio da er mwyn caniatáu i hyn ddigwydd. Yr wyf am gyflwyno dimensiwn arall, sydd yr un mor bwysig yn fy marn i. Heb y strategaeth gyffredinol hon a'r canllawiau cynllunio i alluogi'r datblygiad hwn i ddigwydd, ni fydd y cwmnïau yn edrych ar Gymru. Byddant yn troi at wledydd eraill lle mae ymagwedd gadarnhaol a rhagweithiol tuag at ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy—

Helen Mary Jones: In the light of what you have said about renewable energy, how content are you with the approach of your coalition partners to renewable energy projects?

Mick Bates: Thank you, Helen, for the opportunity to expand on the coalition's attitude to renewable energy. You will be aware, of course, that, through the creation of the National Assembly sustainable energy group, we have lobbied extremely effectively to get this Assembly to produce a renewable energy strategy. In the document, there is also a commitment to the development of biomass. We have the potential to meet the demands, as Cynog and others have said. We provide a framework that will enable Wales to become a world leader in the development of renewable energy, rather than being a country with ideas that are never developed. At this stage, I am content, but, like you, I await the published version of the strategies. I hope that they will be productive and that we will attract other industries to Wales on the back of them.

I return to the theme of co-ordination and coherence in the measures. Lessons have been learnt because of the 5b process, which was a scatter-gun approach. I am hopeful that east Wales will provide a climate to achieve the priorities in the document. It is important that we monitor developments. We must not duplicate and waste time and we must ensure that there are no hold-ups in the process of providing technical assistance.

Owen John Thomas: I welcome this document and I am particularly pleased to see that Plaid Cymru's amendment, which it proposed in Plenary in May concerning the inclusion of ethnic minorities, has now been embodied in the current paper. Two of the local authorities that are partially covered by Objective 2 funding account for a large proportion of Welsh ethnic minorities. I refer, of course, to Cardiff and Newport. In fact, the table for wards that are recorded as having high levels of ethnic minority populations shows that Butetown is ranked number 1 and Pilgwenlly in Newport is ranked number 2.

Helen Mary Jones: Yng ngoleuni'r hyn a ddywedasoch am ynni adnewyddadwy, pa mor fodlon ydych ar ymagwedd eichartneriaid yn y glymblaid tuag at brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy?

Mick Bates: Diolch ichi, Helen, am y cyfle i ymhelaethu ar ymagwedd y glymblaid tuag at ynni adnewyddadwy. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, wrth gwrs, ein bod drwy greu grŵp ynni cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, wedi lobïo'n hynod o effeithiol i gael y Cynulliad hwn i gynhyrchu strategaeth ynni adnewyddadwy. Yn y ddogfen, mae ymrwymiad hefyd i ddatblygu bio-màs. Mae'r potensial gennym i ateb y galwadau, fel y dywedodd Cynog ac eraill. Darparwn fframwaith a fydd yn galluogi Cymru i ddod yn arweinydd byd yn natblygiad ynni adnewyddadwy, yn hytrach na bod yn wlad gyda syniadau na ddatblygir byth. Yn y cyfnod hwn o'r broses, yr wyf yn fodlon, ond fel chi, arhosaf am fersiwn gyhoeddedig y strategaethau. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn gynhyrchiol ac y byddwn yn denu diwydiannau eraill i Gymru yn eu sgîl.

Dychwelaf at y thema cydgysylltu a chydlynu yn y mesurau. Dysgwyd gwersi oherwydd y broses 5b, a oedd yn ymagwedd wasgaredig. Yr wyf yn obeithiol y bydd dwyrain Cymru yn darparu hinsawdd i gyflawni'r blaenoriaethau yn y ddogfen. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn monitro'r datblygiadau. Rhaid inni beidio â dyblygu a gwastraffu amser a rhaid inni sicrhau nad oes unrhyw rwystrau yn y broses o ddarparu cymorth technegol.

Owen John Thomas: Croesawaf y ddogfen hon ac yr wyf yn hynod o falch o weld bod gwelliant Plaid Cymru, a gynigiodd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym Mai o ran cynnwys lleiafrifoedd ethnig, bellach wedi ei ymgorffori yn y papur cyfredol. Mae dau o'r awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi eu cwmpasu'n rhannol gan arian Amcan 2 yn cyfrif am gyfran fawr o leiafrifoedd ethnig Cymru. Cyfeiriaf, wrth gwrs, at Gaerdydd a Chasnewydd. Yn wir, dengys y tabl ar gyfer wardiau a gofnodir fel rhai sydd â lefelau uchel o boblogaethau lleiafrifol ethnig fod Butetown yn safle rhif 1 a Pilgwenlly yng Nghasnewydd yn safle rhif 2.

It is no coincidence that, among Objective 2 areas, these same two wards are ranked second and first, respectively, in the table of districts exhibiting high levels of deprivation. Therefore, I am pleased to learn that Cardiff City and County Council has acted to engage ethnic minority groups in the local partnership process. It is important that this involvement of ethnic minorities should also be encouraged in Newport, and beyond the partnership process into the membership of the Programme Monitoring Committee. Representation of ethnic minorities on that Committee would consolidate the moves taken in Cardiff, and hopefully elsewhere, to involve them in the local partnership.

Representation on the Programme Monitoring Committee should be handled with great sensitivity, as it is important that no one ethnic minority should be represented to the exclusion of all others. As the Committee will meet over a period of at least six years, it is possible that different representatives from the main ethnic groups could serve on it in annual rotation. The close correlation between the preponderance of ethnic groups and deprivation makes this matter of involvement one of crucial importance.

Ethnic minorities must also be targeted to ensure that technical assistance in obtaining and completing the forms for aid is available to encourage their fullest possible involvement in the Objective 2 programme. In the Butetown area in particular, on our doorstep, this is an opportunity for the National Assembly to show its worth and embrace Wales's longest standing ethnic minority group and help improve the quality of life of its members.

It is certain that when future statistics are printed for this ward after next year's well advertised census—and Helen Mary will say more about that later—the new figures will show an unprecedented improvement in Butetown. However, this unfortunately, will not be as a result of improvements in the cosmopolitan heart of the area, but through the new developments on this side of the

Nid yw'n gyd-ddigwyddiad bod yr un ddwy ward hon, ymhlith ardaloedd Amcan 2, wedi eu rhestru'n ail a chyntaf, yn eu tro, yn nhabl yr ardaloedd sydd yn arddangos lefelau uchel o amddifadedd. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd wedi gweithredu i gynnwys grwpiau lleiafrifol ethnig yn y broses partneriaeth leol. Mae'n bwysig y dylid annog y cyfranogiad hwn gan leiafrifoedd ethnig yng Nghasnewydd hefyd, a thu hwnt i'r broses bartneriaeth i'w cynnwys fel aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni. Byddai cynrychiolaeth o leiafrifoedd ethnig ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw yn atgyfnerthu'r datblygiadau a wnaethpwyd yng Nghaerdydd, ac mewn mannau eraill gobeithio, i'w cynnwys yn y bartneriaeth leol.

Dylid ymdrin â chynrychiolaeth ar y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni gyda chryn sensitifrwydd, gan ei bod yn bwysig na ddylai un lleiafrif ethnig gael ei gynrychioli ar draul pob un arall. Gan y bydd y Pwyllgor yn cyfarfod dros gyfnod o chwe mlynedd o leiaf, mae'n bosibl y gallai cynrychiolwyr gwahanol o'r prif grwpiau ethnig wasanaethu arno yn eu tro am flwyddyn. Mae'r gydberthynas agos rhwng y nifer o grwpiau ethnig ac amddifadedd yn gwneud y mater hwn o'u cynnwys yn holl bwysig.

Rhaid targedu lleiafrifoedd ethnig hefyd er mwyn sicrhau bod cymorth technegol ar gael wrth gael a chwblhau'r ffurflenni am gymorth i'w hannog i gymryd y rhan lawnaf bosibl yn rhaglen Amcan 2. Yn ardal Butetown yn arbennig, ar garreg ein drws, mae hwn yn gyfle i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddangos ei werth ac ymgorffori grŵp lleiafrif ethnig mwyaf hirsefydlog Cymru a helpu i wella ansawdd bywyd ei aelodau.

Mae'n sicr pan argreffir ystadegau yn y dyfodol ar gyfer y ward hon ar ôl cyfrifiad y flwyddyn nesaf, y rhoddyd cryn hysbysrwydd iddo—a bydd Helen Mary yn dweud rhagor am hynny yn ddiweddarach—y bydd y ffigurau newydd yn dangos gwelliant digyffelyb yn Butetown. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, ni fydd hyn o ganlyniad i welliannau yng nghalon gosmopolitaidd yr

railtracks.

A challenge for the local authority, its partners from the voluntary sector community, trade unions, the business sector and the National Assembly is to make Objective 2 funding work also for those on the other side of the tracks.

Glyn Davies: I have read the report, although in not as much detail as I would have liked, and have discussed it with others. I would like to associate myself with all the previous comments. It has been a well-received report outside of the area and we should congratulate those who have prepared the single programming document for Objective 2. It greatly adds to the stature of the Assembly when a report is as well-received outside as it is within.

The reality is that there is not much money in the Objective 2 programme. Without being able to pinpoint the exact detail because of the points that Mike German made earlier, it will be about £70 million: £50 million for the Objective 2 programme and £20 million for the transitional programme. That is not much money. In Powys, where I have had some discussion about this, it is about £3 million a year for the length of the programme. One of the schemes that I was involved with many years ago, and was hoping that it would benefit, would in itself take the whole sum.

Kirsty Williams: Given the points that you have just raised, do you not acknowledge that if we were members of the euro zone the amount of money would be greatly increased? Therefore, are you advocating a swift entry of the UK into the euro?

Glyn Davies: That was a very silly intervention that took unnecessary time. I am not criticising the programme in any way. I raised the point because of a silly point made by the Minister for Economic Development when he introduced his speech. I am not criticising the balance of expenditure: that is right. I accept that you must have this balance between investing in opportunity and investing in need.

ardal, ond o ganlyniad i'r datblygiadau newydd ar yr ochr hon i'r rheilffordd.

Un her i'r awdurdod lleol, ei bartneriaid o gymuned y sector gwirfoddol, yr undebau llafur, y sector busnes a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw gwneud i arian Amcan 2 weithio hefyd i'r rheini ar ochr arall y cledrau.

Glyn Davies: Darllenais yr adroddiad, er nad mor fanwl ag y byddwn wedi ei hoffi, a thrafodais ef ag eraill. Hoffwn gysylltu fy hun â'r holl sylwadau blaenorol. Bu'n adroddiad a gafodd ei groesawu y tu allan i'r ardal a dylem longyfarch y rheini sydd wedi paratoi'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl ar gyfer Amcan 2. Ychwanega'n fawr at statws y Cynulliad pan gaiff adroddiad groeso yr un mor dda y tu allan ag y caiff y tu mewn.

Y realiti yw nad oes llawer o arian yn rhaglen Amcan 2. Heb allu nodi'r union fanylyn oherwydd y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Mike German yn gynharach, bydd y swm tua £70 miliwn: £50 miliwn ar gyfer rhaglen Amcan 2 ac £20 miliwn ar gyfer y rhaglen drosiannol. Nid yw hynny'n llawer o arian. Ym Mhowys, lle yr wyf wedi cael rhywfaint o drafodaeth ar hyn, mae tua £3 miliwn y flwyddyn am gyfnod y rhaglen. Byddai un o'r cynlluniau yr oeddwn yn gysylltiedig ag ef sawl blwyddyn yn ôl, ac yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y byddai'n elwa ar hyn, yn cymryd y swm cyfan ynddo'i hun.

Kirsty Williams: O gofio'r pwyntiau yr ydych newydd eu codi, onid ydych yn cydnabod pe baem yn aelodau o ardal yr ewro y byddai swm yr arian yn cael ei gynyddu'n sylweddol? Felly, a ydych yn argymhell bod y DU yn cael mynediad cyflym i'r ewro?

Glyn Davies: Yr oedd hwnnw'n ymyriad gwirion iawn a gymerodd amser diangen. Nid wyf yn beirniadu'r rhaglen mewn unrhyw ffordd. Codais y pwynt oherwydd pwynt gwirion a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd pan gyflwynodd ei araith. Nid wyf yn beirniadu cydbwysedd y gwariant: mae hwnnw'n iawn. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid ichi gael y cydbwysedd hwn rhwng buddsoddi mewn cyfle a buddsoddi mewn

angen.

Considering our current position in Wales, it is sensible that we should concentrate our investment in need, which is clearly in west Wales and the Valleys. Therefore, I am not criticising the size of the programme. However, for a number of reasons, I am concerned about the position of Powys, the whole of which falls within mid and west Wales. Phil Williams has already talked about Powys having a lower level of gross domestic product per capita than many parts of the Objective 1 area. I have already spoken about the limited funds that are available.

O gofio'n sefyllfa bresennol yng Nghymru, mae'n synhwyrol y dylem ganolbwyntio ein buddsoddiad ar angen, sydd yn amlwg yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Felly, nid wyf yn beirniadu maint y rhaglen. Fodd bynnag, am nifer o resymau, yr wyf yn pryderu am sefyllfa Powys, y mae'r ardal gyfan yn syrthio o fewn canolbarth Cymru a gorllewin Cymru. Eisoed mae Phil Williams wedi sôn fod gan Bowys lefel is o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen na llawer o rannau ardal Amcan 1. Yr wyf eisoes wedi siarad am y cyllid cyfyngedig sydd ar gael.

11:25 a.m.

There is a possibility of some negative impact arising from the Objective 1 programme. There is a need for the Assembly to find match funding for projects in Objective 1. It is a huge programme that could have negative effect on Objective 2 areas. There is also the position of competition for the extra spending power that has been allocated to Wales. That could also have a negative impact.

Mae posibilrwydd y bydd rhywfaint o effaith negyddol yn deillio o raglen Amcan 1. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad ddod o hyd i arian cyfatebol ar gyfer prosiectau yn Amcan 1. Mae'n rhaglen enfawr a allai gael effaith negyddol ar ardaloedd Amcan 2. Mae mater cystadleuaeth ar gyfer y pŵer gwario ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd i Gymru hefyd. Gallai hynny gael effaith negyddol hefyd.

Mick Bates mentioned the tier 3 funding that is available over the border in England. The difficulty for any person considering investment is that, when looking at a map of Britain, they see a big wide space, which is the section in-between. That could also have a negative effect. As I said, I am not criticising the size of the programme or the single programming document. However, I would welcome a reassurance on two issues from the Minister for Economic Development in his response.

Soniodd Mick Bates am yr arian haen 3 sydd ar gael dros y ffin yn Lloegr. Yr anhawster i unrhyw berson sydd yn ystyried buddsoddi yw eu bod, wrth edrych ar fap o Brydain, yn gweld gwagle mawr eang, sef yr ardal yn y canol. Gallai hynny gael effaith negyddol hefyd. Fel y dywedais, nid wyf yn beirniadu maint y rhaglen na'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn croesawu sicrwydd ar ddau fater gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn ei ymateb.

First, pressure and quick decisions are needed on tier 3 funding. I agree with the points made by Mick Bates earlier and at previous meetings that it would be beneficial, even if there was not a great deal of money involved, to take away that big wide space that could be negative. Secondly, it is important that we have some form of continuing evaluation. The impact on east Wales during the seven-year programme could be such that we must ensure that we evaluate it throughout that period. We cannot wait until the very end before addressing a situation where Powys

Yn gyntaf, mae angen pwysu a gwneud penderfyniadau cyflym ar arian haen 3. Cytunaf â'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Mick Bates yn gynharach ac mewn cyfarfodydd blaenorol y byddai'n fuddiol, hyd yn oed os nad oedd llawer iawn o arian yn gysylltiedig â hyn, dileu'r gwagle mawr eang hwnnw a allai fod yn negyddol. Yn ail, mae'n bwysig bod gennym rhyw fath o werthuso parhaus. Gallai'r rhaglen saith mlynedd effeithio ar ddwyrain Cymru i'r fath raddau fel y bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau y gallwn ei gwerthuso drwy gydol y cyfnod

could be going backwards while we concentrate our investment in west Wales and the Valleys.

Delyth Evans: Croesawaf y gydnabyddiaeth yn y ddogfen i bwysigrwydd y dechnoleg newydd yn y cynllun hwn. Cytunaf â'r siaradwyr eraill nad oes llawer o arian ar gael yn y cynllun. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn targedu'r gwariant hwn mewn ffordd benodol. Dywedais yn y Siambr hon yn y gorffennol fod y dechnoleg newydd yn rhan hanfodol o'r ffordd yr ydym yn edrych ar ddatblygu economaidd ledled Cymru, yn arbennig yn ein hardaloedd gwledig. Mae technoleg gwybodaeth yn delio'n glir â'r tair blaenoriaeth a amlinellir yn y rhaglen hon.

Dylem ganolbwyntio ar bedwar cam mewn perthynas â'r rhaglen. Yn gyntaf, rhaid codi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith busnesau a chymunedau ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd technoleg gwybodaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yn ail, rhaid ateb y galw am dechnoleg gwybodaeth ymhlith busnesau. Yn drydydd, mae'n rhaid inni ddarparu'r cyngor a'r gefnogaeth anghenrheidiol i bobl. Yn olaf, rhaid sicrhau bod y strwythur telathrebu priodol ar gael iddynt. Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig ar hyn o bryd fod y strwythur yno. Rhaid cymryd camau pendant i wella'r ddarpariaeth bresennol.

Cymeradwyaf y datblygiadau a enwir yng ngwelliant 2. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ychwanegu twristiaeth. Ni chlywsom lawer am dwristiaeth y bore yma. Mae twristiaeth yn bwysig i ddatblygiad yr ardaloedd gwledig. Rhaid inni gefnogi cynlluniau i ddatblygu twristiaeth yn yr ardaloedd hyn.

Soniodd Cynog a Glyn am ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae rhesymau da pam y gelwir y cynlluniau hyn i mewn: mae iddynt oblygiadau y tu hwnt i'r ardaloedd lleol. Rhaid inni ddelio â hwy mewn ffordd strategol oherwydd y goblygiadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf fod yn rhaid inni anfon negeseuon positif at gwmnïau sydd eisiau datblygu yn y sectorau hyn. Rhaid inni gefnogi ac annog hyn ar gyfer dyfodol ein hardaloedd gwledig.

hwnnw. Ni allwn aros tan y diwedd cyn ymdrin â sefyllfa lle y gallai Powys fod yn mynd tuag yn ôl tra ein bod yn canolbwyntio ein buddsoddiad ar orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd.

Delyth Evans: I welcome the recognition in the document of the importance of the new technology in this scheme. I agree with the other speakers that not much money is available in the scheme. Therefore, it is important that we target this expenditure in a specific way. I have said in this Chamber in the past that new technology is an essential part of how we consider economic development throughout Wales, especially in our rural areas. Information technology clearly deals with the three priorities outlined in this programme

We should concentrate on four steps in relation to the programme. First, we must raise awareness among businesses and communities of the importance of information technology for the future. Secondly, we must meet the demand for information technology among businesses. Thirdly, we need to provide people with the necessary advice and support. Finally, we must ensure that the appropriate telecommunications structure is available to them. I am not convinced at the moment that the structure is in place. Firm steps must be taken to improve the present provision.

I commend the developments noted in amendment 2. However, I would like to add tourism. We have not heard much about tourism this morning. Tourism is important to the development of rural areas. We must support schemes to develop tourism in these areas.

Cynog and Glyn mentioned sustainable development. There are good reasons why these schemes are called in: they have implications outside the local areas. We must deal with them in a strategic manner because of these implications. However, I agree that we must send positive messages to companies who want to develop in these sectors. We must support and encourage this for the future of our rural areas.

Michael German: Many interesting points were made during this debate encompassing the whole of the economic development policy for Wales. I will try to address those, but I would prefer to concentrate on some of the specifics of this document. Alun Cairns's contribution and William Graham's intervention showed that this document proves that there are pockets of deprivation in Wales that are not in the Objective 1 area. It is crucial that we recognise that and that the document takes those matters forward. Tredegar Park has the highest rate of households without a wage earner in the whole of Wales. It is essential that we target resources to the areas with the most difficulties.

Technical assistance was raised by many speakers today. The total technical assistance budget is 3.6 million euros, which is only just over half a million euros per annum to be dispersed among the partnership across Wales. That is not a great deal of money. We must therefore ensure that we get the best value from our euros. I ask colleagues not to expect too much in terms of amounts of money. It is essential that the money goes to those who deliver and help to deliver these programmes across Wales.

Alun Cairns: Much has been said about co-ordination between the European structural fund programmes. Do you not agree that implementation, which I mentioned in my amendment, is an extension of co-ordination? When you couple that with your comments about the relatively small sums that are available for technical assistance, will you not reconsider and support the amendment?

Michael German: I cannot support the amendment because it states that Objective 2 is being undermined by Objectives 1 and 3. I cannot accept that the ESF programmes cannot work together properly.

Co-ordination is an important issue that was raised in this debate. There is a danger that we could go in for overkill on that. However, we must ensure that the lessons that we learn from each other are well-versed and well-presented. That does not only relate to the

Michael German: Gwnaethpwyd sawl pwynt diddorol yn ystod y ddadl hon a oedd yn ymgorffori polisi datblygu economaidd cyfan Cymru. Ceisiaf ymdrin â'r rheini, ond byddai'n well gennyf ganolbwyntio ar rai o fanylion y ddogfen hon. Dangosodd cyfraniad Alun Cairns ac ymyriad William Graham fod y ddogfen hon yn profi bod pocedi o amddifadedd yng Nghymru nad ydynt o fewn ardal Amcan 1. Mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod hynny a bod y ddogfen yn datblygu'r materion hynny. Mae gan Barc Tredegar y gyfradd uchaf o gartrefi heb weithiwr cyflogedig yng Nghymru gyfan. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn targedu'r adnoddau ar yr ardaloedd sydd â'r anawsterau mwyaf.

Codwyd cymorth technegol gan lawer o siaradwyr heddiw. Cyfanswm y gyllideb cymorth technegol yw 3.6 miliwn ewro, sydd ond ychydig dros hanner miliwn ewro y flwyddyn i'w gwasgaru ymhlith y bartneriaeth ledled Cymru. Nid yw hynny'n llawer iawn o arian. Felly rhaid inni sicrhau y cawn y gwerth gorau o'n ewros. Gofynnaf i gyd-Aelodau beidio â disgwyl gormod yn nhermau symiau o arian. Mae'n hanfodol bod yr arian yn mynd i'r rheini sydd yn cyflawni ac yn helpu i gyflawni'r rhaglenni hyn ledled Cymru.

Alun Cairns: Dywedwyd llawer am gydlynw'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Oni chytunwch fod gweithredu, y soniais amdano yn fy ngwelliant, yn estyniad o gydlynw? Pan gysylltwch hynny â'ch sylwadau am y symiau cymharol fach sydd ar gael ar gyfer cymorth technegol, onid ailystyriwch a chefnogi'r gwelliant?

Michael German: Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant gan ei fod yn nodi y tansailir Amcan 2 gan Amcanion 1 a 3. Ni allaf dderbyn na all y rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd weithio gyda'i gilydd yn gywir.

Mae cydlynw yn fater pwysig a godwyd yn y ddadl hon. Mae perygl y gallem drafod y mater hwnnw'n ormodol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y gwersi a ddysgw'n oddi wrth ein gilydd wedi eu paratoi a'u cyflwyno'n dda. Nid yw hynny'n ymwneud

monitoring committees. I agree that we need to bring together representatives from those committees so that lessons can be learnt across the board. We must also bring together those who are managing and developing projects and ensure that we roll out good programmes and ideas from Objective 1 into Objective 2 and 3 areas and vice versa.

Pauline Jarman: Does the Welsh European Funding Office have the capacity to deal promptly with Objective 1 and 2 bid submissions? Will all guidance notes, either in draft or final form, have any political steer or will they be issued by WEFO without reference to yourself?

Michael German: You must understand WEFO's role. There is a contract between the monitoring committees and WEFO; it works for them, and is the responsible agent to them. However, it also works for the Assembly.

Many of the themes in this debate need to be brought together into clear thought. What is the Assembly's role in working within the structural programmes? I am glad that people are accepting the notion of evaluation and monitoring in a way that will enable us to see whether the Assembly is in the vanguard of strategic thinking. I am glad that the Welsh Conservatives are coming on board. I thought that Val Feld and I were ploughing a lonely furrow on this.

I am sure that the forthcoming debate in the Economic Development Committee resulting from the small business support review will raise these issues as key ones. We must recognise that the Assembly's role is ensuring that the programmes deliver strategically what we have set out in the single programming documents. To do that, we need powerful evaluation processes that allow us to track our progress at any particular moment, and monitor whether we are meeting the objectives that we have set ourselves. That is a strategic role. The Assembly is not in a position to overtake the monitoring committees' views. We should set a strategic vision and the monitoring

â'r pwyllgorau monitro yn unig. Cytunaf fod angen inni ddod â chynrychiolwyr o'r pwyllgorau hynny ynghyd fel y gellir dysgu gwersi cyffredinol. Rhaid inni hefyd ddod â'r rheini sydd yn rheoli a datblygu prosiectau ynghyd gan sicrhau ein bod yn cyflwyno rhaglenni a syniadau da o Amcan 1 yn ardaloedd Amcan 2 a 3 ac i'r gwrthwyneb.

Pauline Jarman: A oes gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru y gallu i ymdrin yn brydlon â'r ceisiadau a gyflwynir ar gyfer Amcan 1 a 2? A fydd gan yr holl nodiadau arweiniad, naill ai ar ffurf drafft neu ffurf derfynol, unrhyw ddylanwad gwleidyddol neu a gânt eu cyhoeddi gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru heb eu cyfeirio atoch chi?

Michael German: Rhaid ichi ddeall rôl Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Mae contract rhwng y pwyllgorau monitro a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru; mae'n gweithio iddynt hwy, ac yn gweithredu fel eu hasiant cyfrifol. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn gweithio i'r Cynulliad.

Mae angen i lawer o'r themâu yn y ddadl hon gael eu dwyn ynghyd a'u hegluro. Beth yw rôl y Cynulliad wrth weithio o fewn y rhaglenni strwythurol? Yr wyf yn falch bod pobl yn derbyn y syniad o werthuso a monitro mewn ffordd a fydd yn ein galluogi i weld a yw'r Cynulliad ar flaen y gad o ran meddwl strategol. Yr wyf yn falch bod Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn ymuno â ni. Yr oeddwn yn credu bod Val Feld a minnau yn torri cwys unig ar y mater hwn.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y ddadl a gynhelir yn fuan yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd sydd yn deillio o'r adolygiad o gymorth i fusnesau bach yn codi'r materion hyn fel rhai allweddol. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod rôl y Cynulliad yn sicrhau bod y rhaglenni yn cyflawni'n strategol yr hyn a nodwyd gennym yn y dogfennau rhaglennu sengl. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, mae angen prosesau gwerthuso pwerus arnom sydd yn caniatáu inni gadw llygad ar ein cynnydd ar unrhyw adeg benodol, a monitro a ydym yn cyflawni'r amcanion a osodasom ar gyfer ein hunain. Mae honno'n rôl strategol. Nid yw'r Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa i anwybyddu barn y pwyllgorau monitro. Dylem bennu

committees should carry out and execute those processes. It has to be a partnership between all levels of Wales, in which everyone feels they have an ownership. Cohesion across the programmes, technical assistance and ensuring that the Assembly has a role, are all tied up closely with evaluation.

I will not discuss the planning application process except to say that this is a matter for the Minister for Environment. However, I am mindful of my role in ensuring that economic development is sustainable. It is an issue that we must take on board over the coming months. We must ensure that the good guidance contained in this document underpins our thinking.

11:35 a.m.

Glyn Davies: Do you agree that, when the Government takes decisions about calling in planning applications, it should be on the basis of the guidance and the need to call them in, and not because they are pressurised by a local pressure group?

Michael German: Planning guidance and how planning regulations are approached in this Assembly is a matter for the Minister for Environment. As I have said, I do not intend to intervene in that matter, but I am mindful of the role that I play in ensuring that economic development in Wales is sustainable. This single programming document contains some good guidance as to how that should happen and I am mindful of ensuring that that is continued.

Tier 3 is an important issue. Decisions and discussions on this matter are ongoing, but I warn colleagues not to consider the English scheme as necessarily the best one for Wales. It may be in our interest to develop our own scheme to suit east Wales. I encourage you to encourage me to continue those discussions.

Owen John Thomas raised the issue of representation on the Programme Monitoring Committee. We still await a full set of nominations. We asked the partnerships to

gweledigaeth strategol a dylai'r pwyllgorau monitro gyflawni a gweithredu'r prosesau hynny. Rhaid i hyn fod yn bartneriaeth rhwng pob lefel yng Nghymru, lle mae pawb yn teimlo bod ganddynt berchenogaeth. Mae cydlynu ar draws y rhaglenni, cymorth technegol a sicrhau bod gan y Cynulliad rôl, i gyd yn gysylltiedig iawn â gwerthuso.

Ni thrafodaf y broses cyflwyno ceisiadau cynllunio, gan mai mater i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ydyw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'm rôl wrth sicrhau bod datblygiad economaidd yn gynaliadwy. Mae'n fater y mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried dros y misoedd i ddod. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr arweiniad da a gynhwysir yn y ddogfen hon yn sail i'n ffordd o feddwl.

Glyn Davies: A ydych yn cytuno, pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar alw ceisiadau cynllunio i mewn, y dylai fod ar sail yr arweiniad a'r angen i'w galw i mewn, ac nid am fod grŵp dwyn pwysau lleol wedi pwysu arnynt i wneud hynny?

Michael German: Mae arweiniad cynllunio a sut mae'r Cynulliad yn ymdrin â rheoliadau cynllunio yn fater i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd. Fel y dywedais, nid wyf yn bwriadu ymyrryd yn y mater hwnnw, ond yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r rôl yr wyf yn ei chwarae wrth sicrhau bod datblygiad economaidd yng Nghymru yn gynaliadwy. Mae'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl hon yn cynnwys peth arweiniad da ar sut y dylai hynny ddigwydd a byddaf yn sicrhau bod hynny'n parhau.

Mae haen 3 yn fater pwysig. Mae penderfyniadau a thrafodaethau ar y mater hwn yn parhau, ond rhybuddiaf gyd-Aelodau i beidio ag ystyried y cynllun yn Lloegr fel yr un gorau o reidrwydd i Gymru. Efallai y byddai o fudd inni ddatblygu ein cynllun ein hunain a fyddai'n gweddu i ddwyrain Cymru. Fe'ch anogaf i'm hannog i barhau'r trafodaethau hynny.

Cododd Owen John Thomas fater cynrychiolaeth ar y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni. Yr ydym yn dal i aros am set lawn o enwebiadau. Gofynasom i'r partneriaethau

submit their nominations several months ago and we are still waiting for some of them to be submitted. You will be aware, Owen John, that we work on a proportional basis of a third each from the public, private and voluntary sectors. We asked for nominations from all those sectors and we await them with interest. I encourage all the organisations that are involved and interested in the development of these structural programmes in east Wales to ensure that they have submitted their nominations so that we can take those decisions.

Regarding the size of the budget that is available to Objective 2 areas, as mentioned in the document, Members who represent east Wales must remember that this is only the European regional development fund component. The European social fund component, which is available to Objective 3 areas, is also available to those areas. There is scope within that programme for good, high-quality bids to be made in the next few months.

Tourism, Delyth, is a subset strand that appears throughout the document and is mentioned in various pockets. We could give it a separate identification, but it is a key component of economic development. It sits well and it is a key generator of economic development in east Wales. That should be taken on board and I will bring that to the attention of the Programme Monitoring Committee.

Phil Williams: Can you explain why amendment 6 contradicts the partnership agreement in any way?

Michael German: Amendment 6 duplicates the commitment in the partnership agreement. It is, therefore, redundant, because those matters have already been agreed and will be implemented by this Government.

Alun Cairns: Before you conclude the debate, I refer you to Pauline Jarman's intervention. She asked whether you believe WFO has sufficient resources for effective implementation of Objectives 1 and 2 and the

gyflwyno eu henwebiadau sawl mis yn ôl ac yr ydym yn dal i aros i rai ohonynt gael eu cyflwyno. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Owen John, ein bod yn gweithio ar sail gyfrannol o draean yr un gan y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol. Gofynasom am enwebiadau gan yr holl sectorau hynny ac edrychwn ymlaen â diddordeb i'w derbyn. Anogaf bob sefydliad sydd yn gysylltiedig â hyn ac sydd â diddordeb yn natblygiad y rhaglenni strwythurol hyn yn nwyrain Cymru i sicrhau eu bod wedi cyflwyno eu henwebiadau fel y gallwn gymryd y penderfyniadau hynny.

O ran maint y gyllideb sydd ar gael ar gyfer ardaloedd Amcan 2, fel y soniwyd yn y ddogfen, rhaid i'r Aelodau sydd yn cynrychioli dwyrain Cymru gofio mai dim ond cydran y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd yw hon. Mae cydran y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd, sydd ar gael ar gyfer ardaloedd Amcan 3, ar gael hefyd ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae posibilïadau o fewn y rhaglen honno i gynigion da, o ansawdd uchel, gael eu gwneud yn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf.

Mae twristiaeth, Delyth, yn is-linyn sydd yn ymddangos drwy gydol y ddogfen a sonnir amdano mewn pocedi amrywiol. Gallem roi enw gwahanol iddo, ond mae'n rhan allweddol o ddatblygu economaidd. Mae wedi sefydlu ei hun yn dda ac mae'n un o symbylwyr datblygiad economaidd yn nwyrain Cymru. Dylid ystyried hyn a deuaif â hynny at sylw'r Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni.

Phil Williams: A allwch egluro pam bod gwelliant 6 yn gwrthddweud y cytundeb partneriaeth mewn unrhyw ffordd?

Michael German: Dyblyga gwelliant 6 yn ymrwymiad yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Felly, mae'n ddiangen oherwydd cytunwyd eisoes ar y materion hynny ac fe'u gweithredir gan y Llywodraeth hon.

Alun Cairns: Cyn ichi ddod â'r ddadl i ben, fe'ch cyfeiriaf at ymyriad Pauline Jarman. Gofynnodd a ydych yn credu bod gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ddigon o adnoddau i weithredu Amcanion 1 a 2 a'r

other schemes? If it does not currently have sufficient resources, when do you expect that it will have?

Michael German: I know that you are a fine and avid reader of the partnership document. You will be familiar with the section that refers to this matter. Therefore, you are asking how I am progressing with the implementation of the partnership document, which you so clearly support.

The issue of how that review is taking place is ongoing. It is being put in train. I must ensure that WEFO has the resources to carry out this task. The review process has begun. It will be carried out as fast as possible. It is crucial that WEFO has the resources to carry out the work. You know that those resources are available, because it says so in the partnership agreement.

Ron Davies: I ask Mike to reconsider the reply that he gave to Phil Williams in respect of amendment 6. I am a warm supporter of much of the content of the partnership agreement, especially the commitment to press the Treasury. However, the partnership agreement is, essentially, an agreement between two political parties. No-one in the Assembly has had the chance to vote on it. As this commitment has been included in the partnership agreement, that seems to me a strong argument for supporting amendment 6, rather than rejecting it.

Secondly, if Mike could cast his mind back to the time when we sat in an Economic Development Committee meeting discussing the outcome of the comprehensive spending review, he will recall that we pressed the then Economic Development Secretary to give such a guarantee in respect of Objective 1 funding. Rhodri was forthcoming and made it clear that he would press the Treasury for that money in respect of Objective 1 funding. Can Mike tell us the logic of refusing to give the same undertaking in respect of Objective 2 as that which has already been given in respect of Objective 1?

Michael German: It is not the same. There

cynlluniau eraill yn effeithiol? Os nad oes digon o adnoddau ganddi ar hyn o bryd, pryd y disgwylwch y byddant ganddi?

Michael German: Gwn eich bod yn ddarllenrydd da a brwd o'r ddogfen bartneriaeth. Byddwch yn gyfarwydd â'r adran sydd yn cyfeirio at y mater hwn. Felly, gofynnwch sut yr wyf yn dod ymlaen gyda'r gwaith o weithredu'r ddogfen bartneriaeth, yr ydych mor amlwg yn ei chefnogi.

Mae'r mater ynglŷn â'r modd y cynhelir yr adolygiad hwnnw yn parhau. Mae wrthi'n cael ei weithredu. Rhaid imi sicrhau bod gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yr adnoddau i gyflawni'r dasg hon. Mae'r broses adolygu wedi dechrau. Caiff ei chyflawni cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae'n holl bwysig bod gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yr adnoddau i gyflawni'r gwaith. Gwyddoch fod yr adnoddau hynny ar gael, oherwydd dywed hynny yn y cytundeb partneriaeth.

Ron Davies: Gofynnaf i Mike ailystyried yr ateb a roddodd i Phil Williams mewn perthynas â gwelliant 6. Yr wyf yn cefnogi llawer o gynnwys y cytundeb partneriaeth yn frwd, yn enwedig yr ymrwymiad i bwysu ar y Trysorlys. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cytundeb partneriaeth, yn y bôn, yn gytundeb rhwng dwy blaid wleidyddol. Ni chafodd unrhyw un yn y Cynulliad gyfle i bleidleisio arno. Gan fod yr ymrwymiad hwn wedi ei gynnwys yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, ymddengys imi yn ddadl gref dros gefnogi gwelliant 6, yn hytrach na'i wrthod.

Yn ail, pe gallai Mike ddwyn i gof yr adeg pan eisteddasom mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i drafod canlyniad yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, fe gofiai inni bwysu ar yr Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd ar y pryd i roi sicrwydd mewn perthynas ag arian Amcan 1. Yr oedd Rhodri yn barod â'i ateb ac eglurodd y byddai'n pwysu ar y Trysorlys am yr arian hwnnw mewn perthynas ag arian Amcan 1. A all Mike ddweud wrthym beth yw rhesymeg gwrthod rhoi'r un ymrwymiad mewn perthynas ag Amcan 2 â'r un a roddwyd eisoes mewn perthynas ag Amcan 1?

Michael German: Nid yw yr un peth. Mae

is a distinction here between what is in the partnership agreement, which the Government of Wales is keen to put into place, and what was said earlier. There is a difference between the wording of the amendment and the document. I clearly laid out this Government's commitment earlier, and I quote from the partnership agreement:

'We will also seek provision from the UK Government for the appropriate additional resources that may, from time to time, be necessary to ensure that we are able to draw down the full available amount of EU structural funding.'

That guarantee is in place. It is different from the guarantee that was sought earlier.

I conclude as I have gone over my time.

Ron Davies *rose*—

Michael German: I am not taking any more interventions.

Ron Davies: Point of order.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I hope that it is a point of order.

Ron Davies: It is, as I am sure that you will rule, Deputy Presiding Officer. As I cannot pursue the matter directly with Mike, perhaps you could tell us what provision is made in Standing Orders for referring to documents that are not Assembly documents and which are, essentially, party political documents. Do party political documents have any authority or status in the National Assembly?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Subject to taking advice on this, Members may quote from anything that they like and they take responsibility for doing so. It is not for me to dictate whether Members can or cannot quote from any particular document. You knew that I would say that.

Michael German: The inclusive partnership

gwahaniaeth yma rhwng yr hyn sydd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn awyddus i'w roi ar waith, a'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn gynharach. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng geiriad y gwelliant a'r ddogfen. Nodais ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon yn glir yn gynharach, a dyfynnaf o'r cytundeb partneriaeth:

'Byddwn hefyd yn ceisio darpariaeth gan Lywodraeth y DU ar gyfer yr adnoddau ychwanegol priodol a allai fod yn ofynnol, o bryd i'w gilydd, i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu tynnu i lawr y swm llawn o gyllid strwythurol sydd ar gael o'r UE.'

Mae'r sicrwydd hwnnw yn ei le. Mae'n wahanol i'r sicrwydd a geisiwyd yn gynharach.

Deuaf i ben gan fy mod wedi mynd dros fy amser.

Ron Davies *a gododd*—

Michael German: Ni chymeraf ragor o ymyriadau.

Ron Davies: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gobeithiaf mai pwynt o drefn ydyw.

Ron Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn dyfarnu mai dyna'r ydyw, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Gan na allaf fwrw ymlaen â'r mater yn uniongyrchol gyda Mike, efallai y gallech ddweud wrthym pa ddarpariaeth a wneir yn y Rheolau Sefydlog ar gyfer cyfeirio at ddogfennau nad ydynt yn ddogfennau'r Cynulliad ac sydd, yn y bôn, yn ddogfennau gwleidyddiaeth plaid. A oes gan ddogfennau gwleidyddiaeth plaid unrhyw awdurdod neu statws yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yn amodol ar gymryd cyngor ar hyn, gall Aelodau ddyfynnu o unrhyw beth yr hoffent a chymerant y cyfrifoldeb dros wneud hynny. Nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw dweud a all Aelodau ddyfynnu o unrhyw ddogfen benodol ai peidio. Yr oeddech yn gwybod y byddwn yn dweud hynny.

Michael German: Mae'r ymagwedd

approach taken in developing the SPD is not only exemplary but can be built upon during the implementation process. The single programming document is a coherent, strategic document. It makes the best possible use of limited resources and makes clear links to Objective 1 and 3 and the rural development plan. It has not been developed in isolation, but in full recognition of its role as part of the bigger picture of resources available to east Wales. Although the resources are relatively limited, they provide a real opportunity to create sustainable growth in the area. I have no doubt that the partnership will aim to achieve the maximum benefit possible with a view to life beyond structural funds. I recommend support of this document, which is widely recognised as providing a good quality programme. It is now the Assembly's role to send a clear message to the European Commission that the programme is supported in Wales. I ask Members to follow their negotiated acceptance of its contents with swift formal ratification.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before we move to a vote, I am advised that Members who quote from documents owe it, as a courtesy to the Assembly, to ensure that the reference is placed on record or that a copy of the document is placed in the Library so that Members can consult it.

Michael German: Point of order. This document has been on the intranet since 14 October, as the top item on its homepage. If any Members have not seen it, perhaps they could take some advice on how to find it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am grateful for that information.

Elin Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, nid yw'r ddogfen bartneriaeth ar gael yn llawn ar y fewnwyd oherwydd nid yw ar gael yn Gymraeg hyd yn hyn.

11:45 a.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The Minister will have heard that comment. We will now move to a vote.

bartneriaeth gynhwysol a gymerwyd wrth ddatblygu'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl nid yn unig yn rhagorol ond gellir adeiladu arni yn ystod y broses weithredu. Mae'r ddogfen rhaglennu sengl yn ddogfen gydlynol, strategol. Gwna'r defnydd gorau posibl o adnoddau cyfyngedig a gwna gysylltiadau eglur ag Amcan 1 a 3 a'r cynllun datblygu gwledig. Ni chafodd ei datblygu ar ei phen ei hun, ond drwy gydnabod yn llawn ei rôl fel rhan o'r darlun mwy o'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i ddwyrain Cymru. Er bod yr adnoddau yn gymharol gyfyngedig, darparant wir gyfle i greu twf cynaliadwy yn yr ardal. Nid wyf yn amau na fydd y bartneriaeth yn anelu at gyflawni'r budd gorau posibl gyda golwg ar fywyd y tu hwnt i'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Argymhellaf ein bod yn cefnogi'r ddogfen hon, a gydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fel un sydd yn darparu rhaglen o ansawdd da. Rôl y Cynulliad yn awr yw anfon neges glir i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd y cefnogir y rhaglen yng Nghymru. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau, yn dilyn y negodiadau i dderbyn ei chynnwys, i'w chadarnhau yn ffurfiol ar fyrder.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn inni bleidleisio, fe'm cynghorir bod gan Aelodau sydd yn dyfynnu o ddogfennau, ddyletswydd, fel mater o gwrteisi i'r Cynulliad i sicrhau y cofnodir y cyfeiriad neu y caiff copi o'r ddogfen ei rhoi yn y Llyfrgell fel y gall Aelodau gael gafael arni.

Michael German: Pwynt o drefn. Bu'r ddogfen hon ar y fewnwyd ers 14 Hydref, fel prif eitem ar y dudalen gartref. Os oes unrhyw Aelodau heb ei gweld, efallai y dylent ofyn am gyngor ar sut i ddod o hyd iddi.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y wybodaeth honno.

Elin Jones: Further to that point of order, the partnership document is not available in full on the intranet as it is not yet available in Welsh.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Bydd y Gweinidog wedi clywed y sylw hwnnw. Symudwn ymlaen i bleidlais yn awr.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 13, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 3: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog

Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Humphreys, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd ygwlliant.
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 4: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine

Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Humphreys, Christine
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 5: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Humphreys, Christine
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 21, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 6: For 21, Abstain 1, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine

Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lloyd, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davies, Andrew
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Humphreys, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Ron

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

Amended motion:

the National Assembly

notes with approval the single programming document, agreed between the East Wales Partnership and the European Commission, for the Objective 2 and transitional programme areas in east Wales, laid in the Table Office on 2 November 2000;

calls upon the Minister for Economic Development, with the agreement of the partnership, to insert any additional text or make any textual amendments as may be necessary, to meet the technical requirements necessary to secure formal approval of the document by the European Commission as soon as possible;

applauds the recognition in the single programming document that unplanned economic growth may have negative environmental impact and urges sufficient

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

yn nodi gyda chymeradwyaeth y ddogfen rhaglennu sengl, y cytunodd Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd arni, ar gyfer ardaloedd Amcan 2 a'r rhaglen drosiannol yn y Dwyrain, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2000;

yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, gyda chytundeb y bartneriaeth, i ychwanegu unrhyw destun ychwanegol neu wneud unrhyw newidiadau testunol yn ôl yr angen, i fodloni'r gofynion technegol sydd eu hangen i sicrhau bod y ddogfen yn cael cymeradwyaeth ffurfiol y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd cyn gynted â phosibl;

yn cymeradwyo'r gydnabyddiaeth yn y ddogfen rhaglennu sengl y gallai twf economaidd heb ei gynllunio gael effaith amgylcheddol negyddol, ac yn annog

commitment to development such as: local sustainable renewable energy schemes; broadband communication; waste recycling and improved access to public transport to ensure the combination of sustained economic growth with positive environmental impact; and

calls on the Minister for Economic Development to act upon the request of the European Commission, as included in its response to the draft single programming documents, to adopt specific targets for information and communications technology.

ymrwymiad digonol i ddatblygiadau fel: cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy cynaliadwy lleol; cyfathrebu band eang; ailgylchu gwastraff a hwyluso gallu'r cyhoedd i fanteisio ar drafndiaeth gyhoeddus, i sicrhau cyfuniad o dwf economaidd cynaliadwy ac effaith amgylcheddol gadarnhaol; ac

yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i weithredu ar gais y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, fel a gynhwysir yn ei ymateb i'r dogfennau rhaglennu sengl drafft, i fabwysiadu targedau penodol ar gyfer technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny

Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
 Amended motion adopted.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Cyfrifiad a Hunaniaeth Census and Identity

Helen Mary Jones: I will allow a minute for William Graham to make a contribution at the end of my speech. I do not wish to take interventions in the course of my speech but if some of my allotted time remains at the end of my speech and Members wish to make comments, I will be happy to take them then, with your permission, Deputy Presiding Officer.

I chose this topic for my short debate to give the National Assembly an opportunity to discuss an issue that has become a subject of deep national anger, an anger that I share. We are all aware of the background: a proposed census in Wales that gives people the option to define themselves, if they do not belong to a visible ethnic minority, as 'British', 'Irish' or 'White Other', not as 'Welsh' nor indeed 'English'. If people belong to a visible ethnic minority and wish to register that fact, they cannot register themselves as Welsh at all. This is in sharp contrast to the situation in Scotland where everyone is given an opportunity to define themselves as Scottish if they so choose.

First, I ask the question 'does this matter'? At one level, it self-evidently matters. Over 10,000 Welsh people have signed petitions demanding a Welsh tick box on the census form. The democratic demand is overwhelming. The issue needs to be clarified. It is not a question of ethnic origin, but of national identity. It is not a question of where we, our parents or grandparents were born or came from, but of where we all feel

Helen Mary Jones: Caniataf funud er mwyn i William Graham gyfrannu ar ddiwedd fy araith. Nid wyf am i bobl dorri ar draws fy araith ond os bydd rhywfaint o amser a ddyrannwyd imi yn weddill ar ddiwedd fy araith ac os bydd Aelodau am wneud sylwadau, bydd yn bleser gennyf eu cymryd bryd hynny, gyda'ch caniatâd, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Dewisais y pwnc hwn ar gyfer fy nabl fer er mwyn rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol drafod mater a ddaeth yn destun llid cenedlaethol dwfn, ac yn destun llid i minnau. Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol o'r cefndir: cyfrifiad arfaethedig yng Nghymru sydd yn rhoi'r dewis i bobl ddiffinio eu hunain, oni pherthynant i leiafrif ethnig gweladwy, fel 'Prydeinwyr', 'Gwyddelod' neu 'Gwyn Arall', nid fel 'Cymry' neu'n wir fel 'Saeson'. Os yw pobl yn perthyn i leiafrif ethnig gweladwy ac y dymunant gofrestru'r ffaith honno, ni allant gofrestru eu hunain fel Cymry o gwbl. Y mae hyn mewn gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr â'r sefyllfa yn yr Alban lle y rhoddir y cyfle i bawb ddiffinio eu hunain fel Albanwyr os dymunant.

Yn gyntaf, gofynnaf y cwestiwn 'a oes ots am hyn'? Ar un lefel, y mae'n amlwg bod ots. Mae dros 10,000 o bobl Cymru wedi llofnodi deisebau yn mynnu blwch ticio 'Cymry' ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Mae'r galw democrataidd yn aruthrol. Mae angen egluro'r mater. Nid cwestiwn o dras ethnig mohono, ond hunaniaeth genedlaethol. Nid cwestiwn o ble y cawsom ni, ein rhieni neu ein neiniau a'n teidiau eu geni neu o ble y

we belong.

The right to define ourselves as Welsh has had to be fought for throughout our history, and the significance of that definition is, for many of us, huge. That significance is sometimes greater for those whose Welsh identity is perhaps less self-evident, or perhaps less recognised. Let me give an example. In the early 1990s I was managing a youth justice project in Cardiff. Many of our services' users were young black men, and we were sure from anecdotal evidence that there was systematic discrimination against them. We needed an effective ethnic monitoring system to prove this but we hit a serious problem. These young men would not accept any definition of themselves but 'Welsh'. The available probation service definitions, including 'Black', 'Black British' and 'Black Other' would not do. We worked with that group of young people over a period of time, explaining to them that the issue was not how they saw themselves, so much as how others—judges, police officers, social workers and so on—saw them. They eventually accepted the definition 'Black Welsh' and the forms were changed. As far as they were concerned, 'British' was not on and 'Other' was worse and more insulting.

How does the Office for National Statistics and the Ministers responsible expect these young men and their families to define themselves on our census forms? Do politicians at Westminster and mandarins at Whitehall have any idea how important it is to many Welsh citizens to have the right to express their Welsh identity clearly, particularly when dealing with officialdom? It does not seem so. For those of us who are not Welsh born, the issue also raises deep feelings. I was born in England and am quarter Irish, quarter Scots and half Welsh in terms of my ethnic heritage. What am I supposed to do? Do I put a quarter in the Irish box and three quarters in the 'White Other' box?

daethant mohono, ond i ble y teimlwn ein bod yn perthyn.

Bu'n rhaid brwydro dros yr hawl i ddiffinio ein hunain fel Cymry drwy gydol ein hanes, ac mae arwyddocâd y diffiniad hwnnw, i lawer ohonom, yn enfawr. Mae'r arwyddocâd hwnnw weithiau yn fwy i'r rheini y mae eu hunaniaeth fel Cymry yn llai amlwg efallai, neu a gaiff lai o gydnabyddiaeth. Gadewch i mi roi enghraifft. Yr oeddwn yn rheoli prosiect cyfiawnder ieuenctid yng Nghaerdydd ar ddechrau'r 1990au. Yr oedd llawer o ddefnyddwyr ein gwasanaethau yn ddynion du ifanc, ac yr oeddem yn sicr o dystiolaeth anecdotaidd y gwahaniaethwyd yn eu herbyn yn systemataidd. Yr oedd angen system fonitro ethnig effeithiol arnom er mwyn profi hyn ond cawsom broblem ddifrifol. Ni dderbynai'r dynion ifanc hyn unrhyw ddiffiniad ohonynt eu hunain heblaw 'Cymry'. Nid oedd y diffiniadau a oedd ar gael gan y gwasanaeth prawf, gan gynnwys 'Du', 'Prydeinwyr Du' a 'Du Arall' yn ddigonol. Gweithiasom gyda'r grŵp hwnnw o bobl ifanc dros gyfnod o amser, gan esbonio iddynt nad sut y gwelsent eu hunain oedd yn bwysig, yn gymaint â sut y gwelai eraill—barnwyr, swyddogion heddlu, gweithwyr cymdeithasol ac yn y blaen—hwy. Yn y pen draw derbyniasant y diffiniad 'Cymry Du' a newidiwyd y ffurflenni. Cyn belled ag yr oeddent hwy yn y cwestiwn, ni wnâi 'Prydeinwyr' mo'r tro ac yr oedd 'Arall' yn waeth ac yn fwy o sarhad.

Sut y disgwylia'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol a'r Gweinidogion sydd yn gyfrifol i'r dynion ifanc hyn a'u teuluoedd ddiffinio eu hunain ar ein ffurflenni cyfrifiad? A oes gan wleidyddion yn San Steffan a mandarinaid yn Whitehall unrhyw syniad pa mor bwysig ydyw i lawer o ddinasyddion Cymru feddu ar yr hawl i fynegi eu hunaniaeth fel Cymry yn glir, yn arbennig pan fyddant yn delio â'r byd swyddogol? Nid ymddengys felly. I'r rheini ohonom na anwyd yng Nghymru, cwyd y mater deimladau cryf hefyd. Fe'm ganwyd i yn Lloegr ac yr wyf yn chwarter Gwyddeles, yn chwarter Albanes ac yn hanner Cymraes yn nhermau fy etifeddiaeth ethnig. Beth ddylwn i ei wneud? A roddaf chwarter yn y blwch 'Gwyddelod' a thri chwarter yn y blwch 'Gwyn Arall'?

Mick Bates: Ask Graham Henry.

Helen Mary Jones: Indeed, why not? There is also a serious human rights issue here. The census is an intrusive exercise—it has to be. It asks us for detailed information about our private lives and our circumstances. That information is needed to enable effective planning of public services. Surely we have the right to expect that if we are to be asked these intrusive questions, they will be appropriate, relevant and necessary. Otherwise, the whole exercise could be seen as oppressive.

Communities across Wales have expressed their anger about this—interestingly, just as strongly in the south and east as in the west and north. Welsh speakers and non-Welsh speakers alike feel the same. The Government's response has, frankly, been pitiful. We are offered a survey, and finally we are to have a £1 million advertising campaign—I think that it is £1 million; it is a huge budget anyway—inviting us to define ourselves as Welsh in the 'Other' box. I do not accept that overprinting is impossible. Rhodri Morgan told us earlier this week that the problem with overprinting is not the cost, although there would be a cost, but the software that has been designed to read the forms. For goodness sake, I am no information technology expert, but even I know that software can be redesigned. Yes, there would be a cost, but what about the cost if we face a campaign of mass non-compliance? It is a question of where there is a will there is a way, and there is no will, or not sufficient will. The London New Labour Government does not seem to understand the strength of feeling in Wales, and I do not see much evidence that it cares. However, that should not surprise us. If the matter of the census had been devolved, as it was to Scotland and to Northern Ireland, all of this would have been avoided. It is yet another example of the current constitutional settlement letting the people of Wales down and of the urgent need for further devolution.

11:55 a.m.

Mick Bates: Gofynnwch i Graham Henry.

Helen Mary Jones: Yn wir, pam lai? Hefyd mae mater difrifol o hawliau dynol yma. Mae'r cyfrifiad yn ymarfer ymwithiol—mae'n rhaid iddo fod. Gofynna inni am wybodaeth fanwl am ein bywydau preifat a'n hamgylchiadau. Mae angen y wybodaeth honno er mwyn cynllunio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn effeithiol. Siawns bod gennym yr hawl i ddisgwyl y bydd y cwestiynau ymwithiol hyn, os y'u gofynnir inni, yn briodol, yn berthnasol ac yn angenrheidiol. Fel arall, gellid gweld yr ymarfer cyfan yn ormesol.

Y mae cymunedau ledled Cymru wedi mynegi eu llid ynglŷn â hyn—yn ddi-ddorol, yr un mor gryf yn y de a'r dwyrain ag yn y gorllewin a'r gogledd. Teimla'r Cymry Cymraeg a di-Gymraeg fel ei gilydd yr un fath. Bu ymateb y Llywodraeth, a bod yn onest, yn druenus. Cynigir arolwg inni, ac yn y pen draw yr ydym i gael ymgyrch hysbysebu gwerth £1 miliwn—credaf mai £1 miliwn ydyw; y mae'n gyllideb enfawr beth bynnag—yn ein gwahodd i ddiffinio ein hunain fel Cymry yn y blwch 'Arall'. Ni dderbyniaf fod trosargraffu yn amhosibl. Dywedodd Rhodri Morgan wrthym yn gynharach yr wythnos hon nad y gost yw'r broblem gyda throsargraffu, er y byddai cost, ond yn hytrach y feddalwedd a gynlluniwyd i ddarllen y ffurflenni. Er mwyn popeth, nid wyf yn arbenigwraig ym maes technoleg gwybodaeth, ond gwn i hyd yn oed y gellir ailgynllunio meddalwedd. Yn wir, byddai cost, ond beth am y gost os wynebwn sefyllfa o anghydymffurfio torfol? Ceffyl da yw ewyllys, ac nid oes ewyllys, neu nid oes digon o ewyllys. Nid ymddengys fod Llywodraeth Llafur Newydd Llundain yn deall pa mor gryf yw'r teimlad yng Nghymru, ac ni welaf lawer o dystiolaeth bod ots ganddi. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai hynny ein synnu. Pe byddai'r cyfrifiad wedi'i ddatganoli, fel y gwnaethpwyd yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, byddai hyn i gyd wedi cael ei osgoi. Mae'n enghraifft arall eto o'r setliad cyfansoddiadol presennol sydd yn siomi pobl Cymru ac o'r angen dirfawr am ddatganoli pellach.

Where do we go from here? We must keep up the campaign to get the Government to take action. Gordon Brown made substantial and welcome concessions yesterday to hauliers and to pensioners, proving that this Government can be made to listen and react. But if the worst comes to the worst and we are left with no choice, or the choice of 'other' or nothing, I will not advocate refusing to complete the census forms. That is not because I am afraid of breaking the law on principle. Colleagues will know that I am a bit of a sucker for direct action. I did not pay my poll tax until I was taken to court—I do not mind breaking the law on principle, and I have sat down in the middle of many a road in the causes of peace and the Welsh language. We should complete our census forms, not because the Government says that we should, not because we face criminal prosecution if we do not—although that is a factor—but because Wales needs us to complete our census forms. The funding formula for Wales is calculated on a population basis. For each person not counted by the census, Wales could lose thousands of pounds. Census information is also vital for planning services. In the end we will have to comply, however insensitive and inappropriate the form.

The whole sorry business exposes the deep schism at the heart of the Labour Party's relationship with Wales. Labour colleagues here have expressed their concern. Some have called for action, which I believe is genuine. Yet in this vital central Government exercise the needs of Wales and its identity were missed, ignored and forgotten. Two Welsh Labour Members of Parliament, Allan Rogers and Denzil Davies—I am not usually a fan of naming and shaming, but I will make an exception for those two—passed these forms, and seem so far to have shown no understanding that they have even made a mistake. The New Labour Government at first ignored the situation, then blustered, then offered a half-hearted compromise: fill yourselves in under 'other' and we will count you. Gee, thanks. No apologies, no 'we got it wrong', just a half-hearted and weak promise that we will get it right in ten years' time. That is not good enough. We have part of a party telling us that they will put Wales first,

I ble yr awn o'r fan hyn? Rhaid inni barhau â'r ymgyrch i wneud i'r Llywodraeth weithredu. Croesawn y ffaith y bu i Gordon Brown ildio'n sylweddol ddoe i gludwyr a phensiynwyr, gan brofi y gellir gwneud i'r Llywodraeth hon wrando ac ymateb. Ond os daw hi i'r pen ac ni fydd gennym unrhyw ddewis, neu'r dewis o 'arall' neu ddim, nid argymhellaf wrthod cwblhau ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad. Nid yw hynny am fod arnaf ofn torri'r gyfraith mewn egwyddor. Gŵyr fy nghyd-aelodau fy mod yn hoff o ychydig o weithredu uniongyrchol. Ni thelais fy nhreth y pen tan imi gael fy nwyn gerbron llys—nid oes ots gennyf dorri'r gyfraith ar egwyddor, ac yr wyf wedi eistedd ar ganol llawer ffordd dros achosion heddwch a'r iaith Gymraeg. Dylem gwblhau ein ffurflenni cyfrifiad, nid am fod y Llywodraeth yn dweud y dylem, nid am ein bod yn wynebu cael ein herlyn yn droseddol os na wnawn hynny—er bod hynny yn ffactor—ond am fod angen inni gwblhau ein ffurflenni cyfrifiad er mwyn Cymru. Cyfrifir y fformwla ariannu ar gyfer Cymru ar sail y boblogaeth. Am bob person nas cyfrifir gan y cyfrifiad, gallai Cymru golli miloedd o bunnoedd. Y mae gwybodaeth y cyfrifiad yn hanfodol hefyd ar gyfer cynllunio gwasanaethau. Yn y pen draw bydd yn rhaid inni gydymffurfio, pa mor ansensitif ac amhriodol bynnag y bo'r ffurflen.

Y mae'r holl helynt yn amlygu'r rhwyg wrth galon perthynas y Blaid Lafur â Chymru. Y mae cyd-aelodau Llafur yma wedi mynegi eu pryder. Y mae rhai wedi galw am gamau gweithredu, sydd mi gredaf yn ddidwyll. Eto i gyd, yn yr ymarfer canolog hanfodol hwn gan y Llywodraeth, methwyd, anwybyddwyd ac anghofwyd anghenion Cymru a'i hunaniaeth. Pasiwyd y ffurflenni hyn gan ddau Aelod Seneddol o Blaid Lafur Cymru, Allan Rogers a Denzil Davies—nid wyf fel arfer yn un i gefnogi enwi a chywilyddio, ond gwnaf eithriad ar gyfer y ddau yna—a hyd yn hyn ymddengys na ddangosasant unrhyw ddealltwriaeth eu bod wedi gwneud camgymeriad hyd yn oed. I ddechrau anwybyddwyd y sefyllfa gan Lywodraeth Llafur Newydd, yna cafwyd bygythiadau, yna cynigiwyd cyfaddawd llugoer: llenwch eich hunain o dan 'arall' ac fe wnawn eich cyfrif. Ew, diolch. Dim ymddiheuriad, dim 'gwnaethom gamgymeriad', dim ond addewid llugoer, gwan y gwnawn bethau'n

and I am prepared to believe that they will, or that they want to, and another part ignoring Wales's existence. If the Government of Wales wants to heal that schism, or at least paper over it, the First Minister and his Cabinet colleagues had better join me in demanding a full and frank apology from Tony Blair, Allan Rogers and Denzil Davies for the insult that Wales has suffered at their hands. It is the least that the people of Wales deserve.

Finally, there is one positive aspect to this whole sorry mess. The sight of people across Wales demanding in their thousands the right to define themselves as Welsh, and of one of our national papers *The Western Mail*, formerly known to many of us as 'Llais y Sais'—The English Voice', taking a leading role in that campaign, should warm and cheer us all. This is a sign of a nation that is well and truly off its knees, and turning stropy. Tony Blair, you had better look out.

William Graham: The First Minister referred on Tuesday to the expensive census software, and as you rightly say, I cannot see why that cannot be redesigned. If we are to be encouraged to write on the census form, surely the information software ought also to be able to take account of that. Is it really necessary to have this expensive raising awareness advertising campaign? No amount of advertising will change a person's perception of their own national identity. As you say, there is a wider issue. There must be a right to declare a national identity; 'other' is not good enough. If the purpose of the census forms is to assist forward planning, then all the more reason for there to be accurate information. The 1841 census was the first to insist that you stated where you were born. Britain is now a multiracial society. If our National Assembly stands for anything, it must allow people to declare their national identity. It is not necessary to be born in a country nor to speak a significant minority language, if you feel that you are part of that particular cultural identity you have a right to declare it. Adoption by choice is an inalienable right. We recognise the rich

iawn ymhen deng mlynedd. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da. Mae gennym ran o blaid yn dweud wrthym y rhoddant Gymru yn gyntaf, ac yr wyf yn barod i gredu y gwnânt hynny, neu eu bod am wneud hynny, a rhan arall yn anwybyddu bodolaeth Cymru. Os yw Llywodraeth Cymru am iachau'r rhwyg honno, neu o leiaf ei chuddio, byddai'n well i'r Prif Weinidog a chyd-Aelodau ei Gabinet ymuno â mi wrth fynnu ymddiheuriad llawn a gonest gan Tony Blair, Allan Rogers a Denzil Davies am y sarhad a ddiodefodd Cymru yn eu dwylo hwy. Dyma'r lleiaf a haedda pobl Cymru.

Yn olaf, mae un agwedd gadarnhaol i'r holl lanastr blin hwn. Dylai gweld pobl ledled Cymru yn mynnu yn eu miloedd yr hawl i ddiffinio eu hunain fel Cymry, ac un o'n papurau cenedlaethol *The Western Mail*, a arferai gael ei alw'n 'Llais y Sais'—*The English Voice*', gan lawer ohonom, yn cymryd rôl flaenllaw yn yr ymgyrch honno, ein cynhesu a chodi ein calonnau i gyd. Dyma arwydd o genedl sydd wedi codi oddi ar ei gliniau yn wirioneddol, ac sydd yn ystyfnigo. Tony Blair, gwylwch eich cefn.

William Graham: Ddydd Mawrth, cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at feddalwedd drud y cyfrifiad, ac fel y dywedwch yn gywir, ni allaf weld pam na ellir ailgynllunio hwnnw. Os ydym i gael ein hannog i ysgrifennu ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad, siawns y dylai'r meddalwedd gwybodaeth hefyd allu ystyried hynny. A oes gwir angen yr ymgyrch hysbysebu ddrud hon er mwyn codi ymwybyddiaeth? Ni newidia pa faint bynnag o hysbysebu ganfyddiad person o'i hunaniaeth genedlaethol ei hun. Fel y dywedwch, mae yma fater ehangach. Mae'n rhaid wrth yr hawl i ddatgan hunaniaeth genedlaethol; nid yw 'arall' yn ddigon da. Os mai diben ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad yw cynorthwyo gyda rhag-gynllunio, mae mwy o reswm dros gael gwybodaeth gywir. Cyfrifiad 1841 oedd y cyntaf i fynnu eich bod yn datgan ym mhle y'ch ganwyd. Bellach y mae Prydain yn gymdeithas amlhiliol. Os saif ein Cynulliad Cenedlaethol dros unrhyw beth, rhaid iddo ganiatáu i bobl ddatgan eu hunaniaeth genedlaethol. Nid oes rhaid ichi gael eich geni mewn gwlad neu siarad iaith leiafrifol arwyddocaol, os teimlwch eich bod yn rhan o'r hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol

diversity of our multicultural identity and we ask that we be given the right to declare that on the census form.

Helen Mary Jones: Will I have time, Deputy Presiding Officer, to take comments from those who were not able to intervene?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We must get this right under Standing Orders. If anybody wishes to comment, they may do so with your permission.

Helen Mary Jones: I will allow it, therefore, if I have time.

David Davies: In the interests of consistency and fairness, will you accept that people in England who wish to be registered as English, rather than British, should also have that right?

Helen Mary Jones: I accept that. An interesting element of devolution is what it may or may not do to English people's personal identity. There has been a tendency, because the English were such a numerical majority in Britain, to assume that English and British were somehow synonymous. Devolution has meant that the nature of Britishness has changed and people may wish to define themselves as English and British or Welsh and British, or maybe as only English, and, therefore, should have the right to do so.

Huw Lewis: You mentioned that you once worked with people who were offended at being described as British. If I were to describe you, as a spokesperson for your party, as British, would you be offended?

Helen Mary Jones: I would be surprised, not offended, because you would be inaccurate to do so. In terms of my personal history it would be accurate because I was born in England, am a quarter Scottish, a quarter Irish and half Welsh which means that I am a cross-breed. However, in terms of my self identification, even as a child living in England, I considered myself to be Welsh. I will clarify what those men to whom Huw

arbennig honno, mae gennych hawl i ddatgan hynny. Mae mabwysiadu drwy ddewis yn hawl ddiymwad. Cydnabyddwn amrywiaeth gyfoethog ein hunaniaeth amlddiwylliannol a gofynnwn am yr hawl i ddatgan hynny ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad.

Helen Mary Jones: A fydd gennyf amser, Ddirprwy Lywydd, i gymryd sylwadau gan y rheini na allasant ymyrryd?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rhaid inni wneud hyn yn iawn o dan Reolau Sefydlog. Os oes rhywun am wneud sylw, gallant wneud hynny gyda'ch caniatâd.

Helen Mary Jones: Caniatâf hynny, felly, os bydd gennyf amser.

David Davies: Er cysondeb a thegwch, a dderbyniwch y dylai pobl yn Lloegr a ddymunant gael eu cofrestru fel Saeson, yn hytrach na Phrydeinwyr, hefyd gael yr hawl honno?

Helen Mary Jones: Derbyniat hynny. Elfen ddiddorol o ddatganoli yw'r hyn y gallai ei wneud neu y gallai beidio â'i wneud i hunaniaeth bersonol pobl Lloegr. Bu tueddiad, gan fod y Saeson yn gymaint o fwyafrif rhifiadol ym Mhrydain, i dybio bod Seisnig a Phrydeinig yn gyfystyr rhywfodd. Golygodd datganoli fod natur Prydeindod wedi newid ac y bydd pobl efallai am ddiffinio eu hunain fel Saeson a Phrydeinwyr neu fel Cymry a Phrydeinwyr, neu efallai fel Saeson yn unig, ac, felly, y dylai fod ganddynt yr hawl i wneud hynny.

Huw Lewis: Soniasoch ichi weithio unwaith gyda phobl a deimlai bod cael eu disgrifio fel Prydeinwyr yn sarhad. Pe byddwn i'n eich disgrifio chi, fel llefarydd eich plaid, fel Prydeinwraig, a fyddech chi'n teimlo sarhad?

Helen Mary Jones: Byddem wedi'm synnu, nid fy sarhau, gan y byddech yn anghywir wrth wneud hynny. Yn nhermau fy hanes personol byddai'n gywir gan imi gael fy ngeni yn Lloegr, fy mod yn chwarter Albanes, yn chwarter Gwyddeles ac yn hanner Cymraes a olyga fy mod yn groesfrid. Fodd bynnag, yn nhermau'r ffordd yr arddelaf fy hun, hyd yn oed fel plentyn yn byw yn Lloegr, ystyriwn mai Cymraes

referred said. They were not offended at being called British, they were angry about not being allowed to call themselves Welsh. We were dealing with a centrally designed British Probation Service form that did not recognise that you could be Welsh, let alone be black and Welsh. They felt strongly about having it recognised. They were not offended at being called British, they considered it to be inappropriate and not applicable to them. They then became angry when the powers that be tried to make them define themselves as British, which is what has happened to the whole nation.

Christine Humphreys: I agree with many of your comments. However, I am sure that you would agree that overwriting parts of the form would be unacceptable. Perhaps one solution would be to have an extra piece of paper in the envelopes, which is still an insult to Welsh people, but it may be manageable. David referred to English people living in England who might wish to note on the census form that they are English. I have two sons who, unfortunately, could not find jobs in Wales, and have therefore migrated to England. They would like to be able, even though that they live in England, to note that they are of Welsh descent. I am sure they represent the feelings of a large number of people. Could we, by the next census in 10 years' time, make the case for a Welsh tick box on forms in England, even if it is only to provide information on the migration of able young people from Wales?

Helen Mary Jones: I agree with you. People living in England should also be able to define themselves as Welsh and Scottish, just as they can define themselves as Irish. If they wish to do so, people in Wales should also be able to define themselves as English, or as English and Welsh; English in terms of their ethnic origin, and Welsh in terms of their identity. This shows that the issue of national identity and ethnic identity is increasingly complex in a new devolved Britain. It is shocking that the Office of National Statistics in England and Wales took no account of that.

ydwyd. Egluraf yr hyn a ddywedwyd gan y dynion hynny y cyfeiriodd Huw atynt. Ni chawsant eu sarhau o gael eu galw'n Brydeinwyr, yr oeddent yn ddog oherwydd na allent alw eu hunain yn Gymry. Yr oeddem yn delio â ffurflen gan Wasanaeth Prawf Prydain a gynlluniwyd yn ganolog na chydabyddai y gallech fod yn Gymro, heb sôn am fod yn ddu ac yn Gymro. Teimlent yn gryf y dylid cydnabod hynny. Ni chawsant eu sarhau o gael eu galw'n Brydeinwyr, ystyriasant hynny'n amhriodol ac yn amherthnasol iddynt hwy. Yna digiasant pan geisiodd y pwerau eu gorfodi i ddiffinio eu hunain fel Prydeinwyr, sef yr hyn a ddigwyddodd i'r genedl gyfan.

Christine Humphreys: Cytunaf â llawer o'ch sylwadau. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech y byddai trosysgrifennu rhannau o'r ffurflen yn annerbyniol. Efallai mai un ateb fyddai rhoi darn ychwanegol o bapur yn yr amlenni, sydd yn sarhad i bobl Cymru o hyd, ond efallai y gellid ymdopi â hyn. Cyfeiriodd David at Saeson yn byw yn Lloegr a fyddai o bosibl am nodi ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad eu bod yn Saeson. Mae gennyf ddau fab na allent, yn anffodus, ddod o hyd i swyddi yng Nghymru, ac a fudodd felly i Loegr. Hoffent allu nodi, er eu bod yn byw yn Lloegr, eu bod o dras Gymreig. Yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod yn cynrychioli teimladau nifer fawr o bobl. A allem, erbyn y cyfrifiad nesaf ymhen 10 mlynedd, gyflwyno achos dros flwch ticio 'Cymry' ar ffurflenni yn Lloegr, hyd yn oed os mai dim ond i roi gwybodaeth ar y bobl ifanc galluog sydd yn mudo o Gymru fyddai hynny?

Helen Mary Jones: Cytunaf â chi. Dylai pobl sydd yn byw yn Lloegr hefyd allu diffinio eu hunain fel Cymry ac Albanwyr, yn union fel y gallant ddiffinio eu hunain fel Gwyddelod. Os dymunant hynny, dylai pobl yng Nghymru hefyd allu diffinio eu hunain fel Saeson, neu fel Saeson a Chymry; Saeson yn nhermau eu tarddiad ethnig, a Chymry yn nhermau eu hunaniaeth. Dengys hyn fod mater hunaniaeth genedlaethol a hunaniaeth ethnig yn gynyddol gymhleth yn y Brydain ddatganoledig newydd. Mae'n warthus nad ystyriwyd hynny gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yng Nghymru a Lloegr.

In terms of your practical suggestion about what could be done, I would not presume to know the technicalities; I am not part of the Government yet and in a position to dictate what should be done. Hopefully, by 2003 and by the next census in 2010, we will be in a position to make these decisions ourselves in Wales. An extra form with a Welsh tick box might be a better way to proceed, rather than spending lots of money on asking people to take the time and trouble to note that they are Welsh by writing in the 'Other' box. I find it offensive and upsetting to be asked to define myself as an 'Other' in my home country. I am not an 'Other' in Wales. I am, by choice, like many colleagues in this Chamber, a Welsh person.

Richard Edwards: How can you be so fervently nationalist that you will stand to the last for a tick box, yet, at the same time, be such a timid patriot that you cannot bring yourself to write the word 'Welsh' on the census form?

12:05 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: I will not take being called a timid patriot by Richard Edwards or anybody else in this room, so you can back down from that, sunshine, when you like. There are many words that people in this room might use to describe me, but I do not think that 'timid' would be one of them, although I am happy to accept 'patriot'. I am not timid about needing to write 'Welsh' on the form. I am offended about being expected to write it in a box that states 'other'. If I were in France, I would be perfectly happy to describe myself as 'other' on the form. I do not know whether Richard Edwards and his colleagues are aware of this, but in the United States of America, people have a tick box on the national census form so that they can identify themselves as Welsh. If you can have it in the United States of America, it is surely not beyond the wit of humankind to sort it out so that by next year we can have that tick box on our form.

Yn nhermau eich awgrym ymarferol am yr hyn y gellid ei wneud, ni honaf fy mod yn gwybod y manylion technegol; nid wyf yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth eto ac mewn sefyllfa i orchymyn yr hyn y dylid ei wneud. Gobeithio, erbyn 2003 ac erbyn y cyfrifiad nesaf yn 2010, byddwn mewn sefyllfa i wneud y penderfyniadau hyn ein hunain yng Nghymru. Efallai y byddai ffurflen ychwanegol gyda blwch ticio 'Cymry' yn ffordd well o fynd yn ein blaenau, yn hytrach na gwario llawer o arian ar ofyn i bobl gymryd yr amser a'r drafferth i nodi eu bod yn Gymry drwy ysgrifennu yn y blwch 'Arall'. Mae'r ffaith bod disgwyl imi ddiffinio fy hun fel 'Arall' yn fy ngwlad fy hun yn sarhaus ac yn fy nhrangwyddo. Nid 'Arall' mohonof yng Nghymru. Yr wyf, drwy ddewis, fel llawer o gyd-Aelodau yn y Siambr hon, yn Gymraes.

Richard Edwards: Sut y gallwch fod yn genedlaetholwraig mor danbaid fel eich bod yn sefyll hyd y diwedd dros flwch ticio, ac eto, ar yr un pryd, fod yn wladgarwraig mor ddihyder fel na allwch ysgrifennu'r gair 'Cymraes' ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad?

Helen Mary Jones: Ni dderbyniaf gael fy ngalw'n wladgarwraig ddihyder gan Richard Edwards na neb arall yn yr ystafell hon, felly galli dynnu'r geiriau hynny yn ôl pryd y gweli'n dda, fy ngwas i. Mae llawer o eiriau a gâi eu defnyddio gan bobl yn yr ystafell hon i'm disgrifio, ond ni chredaf y byddai 'dihyder' yn un ohonynt, er fy mod yn hapus i dderbyn 'gwladgarwraig'. Nid wyf yn ddihyder ynglŷn â'r angen i ysgrifennu 'Cymraes' ar y ffurflen. Mae'r ffaith bod disgwyl imi ei ysgrifennu mewn blwch sydd yn nodi 'arall' yn fy sarhau. Petawn yn Ffrainc, byddwn yn berffaith hapus i ddisgrifio fy hun fel 'arall' ar y ffurflen. Ni wn a yw Richard Edwards a'i gyd-Aelodau yn ymwybodol o hyn, ond yn Unol Daleithiau America mae gan bobl flwch ticio ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad cenedlaethol er mwyn iddynt allu nodi eu bod yn Gymry. Os gallwch ei gael yn Unol Daleithiau America, siawns nad yw y tu hwnt i allu dynolryw i gael trefn ar hyn fel y gallwn gael y blwch ticio yna ar ein ffurflen erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf.

Gwenda Thomas: In the hope that I am not your sunshine, I agree that there should be a 'Welsh' tick box. I have made that view widely known. Have you not been partisan in selecting Denzil Davies and Allan Rogers for criticism and not, as Richard has said, voicing your concern about the role of the Welsh Language Board?

Helen Mary Jones: The Welsh Language Board has an advisory role in relation to what questions should be asked about the Welsh language. It is my understanding that it made informal representations about other matters, but that is not its role, and it would be going beyond its statutory remit, if it had given any formal advice on that matter. What is more interesting, although this is denied by the Office for National Statistics, is that the Commission for Racial Equality in Wales, when they were consulted, asked for a 'Welsh' tick box to enable black people to define themselves partly as black and Welsh, and because they are sensitive to the issue. That informal request was made, Gwenda, and the Office for National Statistics chose to ignore it. I thank you for your support. It feeds into what I said about the schizophrenia—no, I will not use that word because it is offensive—the schism in the Labour Party about Wales. There are people such as yourself who know that it was wrong, yet central Government will not have the decency to apologise. I hope that you will join me today in demanding that they do so.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I thought that you were going to call the timid Finance Secretary, Deputy Presiding Officer. I am not sure that I could be described as that, in any shape or form.

The failure to include a Welsh tick box in the census form is regrettable and I believe that I speak for the National Assembly as a whole when I say that this must not happen again. I share with Helen Mary and the tens of thousands of people across Wales anger about it and a recognition that this is an impassioned issue that has upset the people of Wales. Within Britain we have people

Gwenda Thomas: Yn y gobaith na chaf fy ngalw'n 'fy ngwas i', cytunaf y dylid cael blwch ticio 'Cymry'. Yr wyf wedi gwneud y farn honno yn hysbys yn gyffredinol. Oni fuoch yn bleidiol wrth ddewis Denzil Davies ac Allan Rogers i gael eu beirniadu yn hytrach na, fel y dywedodd Richard, lleisio eich pryder am rôl Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg?

Helen Mary Jones: Mae gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg rôl ymgynghorol mewn perthynas â pha gwestiynau y dylid eu gofyn am yr iaith Gymraeg. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, gwnaeth sylwadau anffurfiol am faterion eraill, ond nid dyna ei rôl, a byddai wedi mynd y tu hwnt i'w gylch gwaith statudol, petai wedi rhoi unrhyw gyngor ffurfiol ar y mater hwnnw. Yr hyn sydd yn fwy diddorol, er y gwedir hyn gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, yw i'r Comisiwn dros Gydraddoldeb Hiliol yng Nghymru, pan ymgynghorwyd â hwy, ofyn am flwch ticio 'Cymry' er mwyn galluogi pobl ddu i ddiffinio eu hunain yn rhannol fel pobl ddu ac fel Cymry, ac oherwydd eu bod yn sensitif i'r mater. Gwnaethpwyd y cais anffurfiol hwnnw, Gwenda, a dewisodd y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol ei anwybyddu. Diolch am eich cefnogaeth. Bwyda i mewn i'r hyn a ddywedais am y sgitsoffrenia—na, ni ddefnyddiaf y gair hwnnw gan ei fod yn sarhaus—y rhwyg yn y Blaid Lafur ynglŷn â Chymru. Mae yna bobl megis chithau a wŷr ei fod yn anghywir, ac eto nid oes gan y Llywodraeth ganolog y cwrteisi i ymddiheuro. Gobeithio yr ymunwch â mi heddiw wrth fynnu eu bod yn gwneud hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Credais eich bod am alw'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid dihyder, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Nid wyf yn siŵr a ellid fy nisgrifio felly, mewn unrhyw fodd.

Mae methu â chynnwys blwch ticio 'Cymry' yn ffurflen y cyfrifiad yn anffodus a chredaf fy mod yn siarad ar ran y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fel cyfangorff pan ddywedaf na ddylai hyn ddigwydd eto. Rhannaf ddieter yn ei gylch gyda Helen Mary a'r degau o filoedd o bobl ledled Cymru a chydnabyddiaeth fod hwn yn fater angerddol a gynhyrfodd bobl Cymru. Mae gennym ym Mhrydain bobl o

from a diverse range of ethnic and cultural backgrounds whose diversity enhances and enriches Wales, Scotland and England. Diverse cultures should be respected and celebrated and if we are to respond to the needs of people from different cultural backgrounds we must have the necessary statistical information. This is why I am so disappointed that those of us who are Welsh are unable to indicate our cultural identity on the census form.

It is not true, however, to say there will be no opportunity to recognise Welsh identity on the census form. I understand the comments that have been made about the Office for National Statistics in this regard, but it will be actively encouraging the use of a write-in option, and will also be doing additional survey work at a later date to obtain additional information. There is also room for discussion about a separate survey in Wales in the next few years to look at some more detailed statistical questions within Wales that would help us to make better decisions in certain areas.

It is all too easy to say that that is not enough, but consider the census's importance to Wales. Helen has made that point. It is a key exercise in the collection of socio-economic data used to determine the needs of our communities. The implementation of a change to include a Welsh tick box may sound a simple amendment, but the statisticians have made it clear that without proper trial and evaluation it could affect the integrity of census data. Given the risk involved, as well as the cost, it makes little sense to make such a change at this stage.

We Welsh are a nation bound together by several common cultural threads from which stem our national identity and pride, as in any other nation. We must be careful, however, not to confuse nationality with our ethnic origins. It is, I hope, fundamental to the beliefs of all in this Assembly that Welshness does not depend on your ethnic origin. For the most part, Welsh people are not discriminated against on an individual basis for being Welsh, whereas people who are Welsh and black are all too often

amrywiaeth eang o gefndiroedd ethnig a diwylliannol y mae eu hamrywiaeth yn gwella ac yn cyfoethogi Cymru, yr Alban a Lloegr. Dylid parchu a dathlu diwylliannau amrywiol ac os ydym i ymateb i anghenion pobl o gefndiroedd diwylliannol gwahanol mae'n rhaid inni feddu ar yr wybodaeth ystadegol angenrheidiol. Dyma pam yr wyf mor siomedig na all y rheini ohonom sydd yn Gymry nodi ein hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n wir dweud na fydd cyfle i gydnabod hunaniaeth Gymreig ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Deallaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd am y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yn hyn o beth, ond bydd yn annog y defnydd o opsiwn ysgrifennu i mewn, a bydd hefyd yn cynnal gwaith adolygu ychwanegol ar ddyddiad diweddarach er mwyn cael gwybodaeth ychwanegol. Mae lle hefyd am drafodaeth ar adolygiad ar wahân yng Nghymru yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf i edrych ar rai cwestiynau ystadegol manylach o fewn Cymru a fyddai yn ein helpu i wneud penderfyniadau gwell mewn meysydd penodol.

Hawdd yw dweud nad yw hynny'n ddigon, ond ystyriwch bwysigrwydd y cyfrifiad i Gymru. Gwnaeth Helen y pwynt hwnnw. Mae'n ymarfer allweddol yn y gwaith o gasglu data cymdeithasol economaidd a ddefnyddir i bennu anghenion ein cymunedau. Efallai fod gweithredu newid er mwyn cynnwys blwch ticio 'Cymry' yn ymddangos yn newidiad syml, ond mae'r ystadegwyr wedi egluro y gallai, heb ei brofi a'i werthuso'n gywir, effeithio ar integreidd data'r cyfrifiad. O gofio'r risg a olyga hyn, yn ogystal â'r gost, nid yw'n synhwyrol iawn gwneud newid o'r fath ar hyn o bryd.

Clymir ni Gymry ynghyd gan sawl edau ddiwylliannol gyffredin y deillia ein hunaniaeth a'n balchder cenedlaethol ohonynt, fel unrhyw genedl arall. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus i beidio â drysu cenedligrwydd â'n tarddiad ethnig. Gobeithiaf ei bod yn sylfaenol i gredoau pawb yn y Cynulliad hwn na ddibynna Cymreictod ar eich tarddiad ethnig. Yn gyffredinol, ni wahaniaethir yn erbyn y Cymry yn unigol am fod yn Gymry, ond yn rhy aml o lawer gwahaniaethir yn erbyn pobl

discriminated against for being black. Sadly, that is often by other Welsh people. It is important, therefore, that the data on ethnic origin is clearly and accurately gathered by the census. That is a priority. The census will also identify vital facts about the socio-economic conditions that our people experience, which is also vital. We must be wary of any proposal that may serve to jeopardise this.

Despite our pride in being Welsh, we must always remember the limits of nationhood. When I worked as a humble bank employee in a previous existence, I felt a great deal more affinity with humble English, Scottish or Irish bank workers than I ever did with bank directors who happened to be Welsh. I have more concern for the black and Asian Welsh people who are regularly harassed and assaulted than I have for those who do not receive the due amount of respect from across the Severn bridge.

We must recognise that there have been some elements of consultation on these issues. To put this into historical perspective, the planning process for the 2001 census started in 1992. Consultation with users started in 1994, and during that period there was a rehearsal in 1999, which did not include a 'Welsh' or even, at that stage, a 'Scottish' tick box. The Secretary of State for Wales was not one of the signatories—the Secretary of State for Scotland was, as was the Economic Secretary to the Treasury and the Secretary of State for Northern Ireland—regarding what we were going to do about the census. The Secretary of State for Wales was consulted in 1998 about the question for Irish inclusion on the census. We must recognise—and I say this strongly—that as soon as the First Minister was involved in this issue in July 2000 he immediately raised the issue of the 'Welsh' tick box, resulting from the Scottish Parliament's decisions to include a 'Scottish' tick box. We must also recognise that there was widespread consultation across Wales, with users, local government, health authorities, and so on, and nothing was raised until the Scots took the decision in the Scottish Parliament to include a 'Scottish' tick box. I am not saying that that is right or wrong, but that is the

sydd yn Gymry ac yn ddu am eu bod yn ddu. Mae'n drist mai Cymry eraill a wnaiff hynny'n aml. Mae'n bwysig, felly, y cesglir y data ar darddiad ethnig yn glir ac yn gywir gan y cyfrifiad. Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth. Noda'r cyfrifiad hefyd ffeithiau hanfodol am yr amodau cymdeithasol economaidd a brofir gan ein pobl, sydd hefyd yn hanfodol. Rhaid inni fod ar ein gwylidwriaeth am unrhyw gynnig a allai roi hyn mewn perygl.

Er gwaethaf ein balchder yn ein Cymreictod, rhaid inni gofio cyfyngiadau cenedligrwydd bob amser. Pan weithiais fel cyflogai banc cyffredin mewn bodolaeth flaenorol, teimlwn lawer yn agosach at weithwyr banc cyffredin Lloegr, yr Alban ac Iwerddon nag a wneuthum erioed â chyfarwyddwyr banc a ddigwyddai fod yn Gymry. Mae gennyf fwy o bryder dros y Cymry du ac Asiaidd yr aflonyddir arnynt ac yr ymosodir arnynt yn rheolaidd nag sydd gennyf dros y rheini na chânt y parch dyledus o'r ochr arall i bont Hafren.

Rhaid inni gydnabod y bu rhyw elfen o ymgynghori ar y mater hyn. I osod hyn mewn persbectif hanesyddol, dechreuodd y broses gynllunio ar gyfer cyfrifiad 2001 yn 1992. Dechreuwyd ymgynghori â defnyddwyr yn 1994, ac yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw bu ymarfer yn 1999, na chynhwysodd flwch ticio 'Cymry' na hyd yn oed, bryd hynny, flwch ticio 'Albanwyr'. Nid oedd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn un o'r arwyddwyr—yr oedd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yr Alban, fel ag yr oedd Ysgrifennydd Economi'r Trysorlys ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Gogledd Iwerddon—ynghlŷn â'r hyn yr oeddem am ei wneud am y cyfrifiad. Ymgynghorwyd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn 1998 ynghlŷn â'r cwestiwn am gynnwys Gwyddelod ar y cyfrifiad. Rhaid inni gydnabod—a phwysleisiaf hyn—i Brif Weinidog Cymru, cyn gynted ag y'i cynhwyswyd yn y mater hwn yng Ngorffennaf 2000, godi mater blwch ticio 'Cymry' yn syth, yn sgîl penderfyniadau Senedd yr Alban i gynnwys blwch ticio 'Albanwyr'. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd y bu ymgynghori eang ledled Cymru, gyda defnyddwyr, llywodraethau lleol, awdurdodau ieched, ac ati, ac ni chodwyd unrhyw beth nes i'r Albanwyr benderfynu yn Senedd yr Alban gynnwys blwch ticio

reality of the situation.

We must accept what has happened. The points were not picked up by those charged with looking after Welsh interests elsewhere. That is a matter of concern, and perhaps it is a frequent problem. People must look after our interests in another place sometimes. It is our responsibility to rebuild that confidence. We do so by accepting that we need to put this behind us, with a clear commitment to ensuring that the next time around Welsh cultural identity is given the respect that we deserve. We must determine to use the census data to guide us in creating a Wales of which we can all be proud. In future, I believe that such issues will not arise, but we must always be mindful that devolution has ensured that we have a voice, which we must exercise. On behalf of the administration, we will be pleased to continue to exercise a voice on this important issue, to give the people of Wales the ability to identify themselves on the census form. If we cannot do it by the preferred method, I give a commitment that we will consider other means of looking at data over the next two years to enable us to work from the available data to ensure that Welsh needs are analysed correctly.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

'Albanwyr'. Ni ddywedaf fod hynny'n gywir neu'n anghywir, ond dyna realiti'r sefyllfa.

Rhaid inni dderbyn yr hyn a ddigwyddodd. Ni chodwyd y pwyntiau gan y rhai a oedd yn gyfrifol am edrych ar ôl buddiannau Cymru mewn mannau eraill. Mae hynny'n peri pryder, ac efallai ei fod yn broblem gyson. Rhaid i bobl edrych ar ôl ein buddiannau mewn man arall weithiau. Ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw ailadeiladu'r hyder hwnnw. Gwnawn hynny drwy dderbyn bod angen inni roi hyn y tu ôl inni, gydag ymrwymiad clir i sicrhau y rhoddir y parch a haeddwn i hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru y tro nesaf. Rhaid inni benderfynu defnyddio data'r cyfrifiad i'n harwain wrth greu Cymru y gallwn oll fod yn falch ohoni. Yn y dyfodol, credaf na chyfyd materion o'r fath, ond rhaid inni gadw mewn cof bob amser bod datganoli wedi sicrhau bod gennym lais, y mae'n rhaid inni ei ddefnyddio. Ar ran y weinyddiaeth, bydd yn bleser gennym barhau i ddefnyddio ein llais ar y mater pwysig hwn, er mwyn galluogi pobl Cymru i nodi pwy ydynt ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Os na allwn wneud hynny drwy ddefnyddio'r dewis ddull, ymrwymaf i ystyried ffyrdd eraill o edrych ar ddata yn ystod y ddwy flynedd nesaf i'n galluogi i weithio o'r data sydd ar gael er mwyn sicrhau y caiff anghenion Cymru eu dadansoddi'n gywir.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.15 p.m.
The session ended at 12.15 p.m.*