



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 8 Tachwedd 2006
Wednesday, 8 November 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio
Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration
- 23 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau
Questions to the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks
- 47 Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd ar ei Chyfrifoldebau heblaw am Fusnes
Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business
- 63 Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig
Revised Business Statement
- 68 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Defaid a Geifr (Cofnodion, Adnabod a Symud) (Cymru)
(Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Sheep and Goats (Records, Identification and Movement) (Wales)
(Amendment) Order 2006
- 73 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bwydydd Anifeiliaid (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Feeding Stuffs (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006
- 77 Cymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau, the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No. 2)
Regulations 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 adran 3, Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.14 a
Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25
Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006
under Standing Order No. 25 section 3, Standing Order No. 25.14 and Standing Order
No. 24.25
- 78 Adroddiad Gwerthuso Cyntaf Cymunedau yn Gyntaf
The First Communities First Evaluation Report
- 97 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 98 Adroddiad Gwerthuso Cyntaf Cymunedau yn Gyntaf: Parhad
The First Communities First Evaluation Report: Continued
- 118 Dadl Fer: Diwydiant Llaeth Cymru: Argyfwng a Mwy
Short Debate: The Welsh Dairy Industry: Crisis and Beyond

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration

Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref Home Energy Efficiency Scheme

Q1 Rosemary Butler: Will the Minister give an update on the home energy efficiency scheme? OAQ0947(SJR)

C1 Rosemary Butler: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref? OAQ0947(SJR)

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I have recently announced that the levels of grant available to clients applying to the scheme will increase significantly. This will allow households to receive the full range of heating and energy efficiency measures that are their due, at little or no cost to them.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Yn ddiweddar cyhoeddais y bydd y lefelau grant sydd ar gael i gleientiaid sy'n gwneud cais i'r cynllun yn cynyddu'n sylweddol. Bydd hyn yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i gartrefi gael yr holl fesurau effeithlonrwydd gwres ac ynni sy'n ddyledus iddynt, am gost isel iawn neu am ddim.

Rosemary Butler: You announced earlier this year that HEES would be extended so that people aged over 80 would be eligible for help without a means test. This is welcome, especially in my constituency. When are you planning to put legislation before the Assembly to allow this change to take place?

Rosemary Butler: Cyhoeddasoch yn gynharach eleni y byddai'r Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref (HEES) yn cael ei ymestyn fel y byddai pobl dros 80 oed yn gymwys i gael cymorth heb gael prawf modd. Croesewir hyn, yn arbennig yn fy etholaeth i. Pryd yr ydych yn bwriadu cyflwyno deddfwriaeth gerbron y Cynulliad i'w gwneud yn bosibl i'r newid hwn ddigwydd?

Edwina Hart: I hope that legislation governing the scheme will be amended in time to come into force in early 2007.

Edwina Hart: Gobeithio y caiff deddfwriaeth sy'n rheoli'r cynllun ei diwygio mewn pryd i ddod i rym ddechrau 2007.

Elin Jones: Un gŵyn yr wyf wedi'i derbyn am y cynllun hwn gan rai o fy etholwyr yw fod y pris a roddir am wneud rhywfaint o'r gwaith yn aml yn agos at uchafswm y grant, a bod cwmnïau lleol yn gallu cynnig gwneud y gwaith am bris llawer is. A ydych yn monitro'r prisiau a roddir am waith dan y cynllun hwn, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gystadleuol, yn enwedig o ystyried y bydd y grant yn cynyddu?

Elin Jones: One complaint I have received from some of my constituents about this scheme is that the price quoted for some of the work is often close to the highest sum available under the grant, and that local companies can undertake the work for a much lower price. Do you monitor the prices quoted for work under this scheme, to ensure that they are competitive, especially bearing in mind that the grant is to increase?

Edwina Hart: I have received similar comments from other Members as well as in correspondence. This is a matter of concern. We have reviewed the scheme's success, but

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau tebyg gan Aelodau eraill ac mewn gohebiaeth. Mae hwn yn fater o bryder. Yr ydym wedi adolygu llwyddiant y cynllun,

I will ask officials to look at the monitoring of quotes, to ensure that they are competitive and that people are not taking advantage of the full amounts. More people will then be able to be part of the scheme. I will take up that point, and report back to committee.

Mick Bates: We all share a positive view of HEES, but your own Government's website states that 130,000 households in Wales have difficulties in heating their homes properly. The target that you set for HEES—which was ambitious at the time—was that 90,000 homes would receive support. When will you ensure that the other 40,000 homes that you admit are facing difficulties receive support to heat their homes properly?

Edwina Hart: These are challenging targets, which some people think I should start reviewing; I do not agree with that. These targets must be challenging, as that must be our aim. There are additional funds now available under HEES, which will help additional households. When we look at the Assembly budget for next year, I hope that we give further priority to that budget line.

Mick Bates: I am certain that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee will have heard that, and that you will be reminded of it. I congratulate you on the letter that you sent, and the support for renewable pilot schemes that you have announced. Given that there are an additional 40,000 households in need of assistance, that is to be commended, and I congratulate you on that move.

One of the best things that we could do to combat climate change is encourage the use of renewable systems. It is rather like you are becoming the new B&Q site, which I hope you have looked at. When the evaluation is done, will you undertake to record the carbon saving via the work of your officials? That is the kind of target that the Government and the Assembly as a whole needs to drive forward.

ond gofynnaf i swyddogion edrych ar y broses o fonitro dyfynbrisiau, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gystadleuol ac nad yw pobl yn manteisio ar y symiau llawn. Yna bydd mwy o bobl yn gallu bod yn rhan o'r cynllun. BYddaf yn ystyried y pwynt hwnnw ac yn adrodd yn ôl i'r pwyllgor.

Mick Bates: Mae gennym i gyd farn gadarnhaol am HEES, ond mae gwefan eich Llywodraeth eich hun yn dweud bod 130,000 o gartrefi yng Nghymru yn cael anhawster i wresogi eu cartrefi'n iawn. Y targed a bennwyd gennych ar gyfer HEES—a oedd yn uchelgeisiol ar y pryd—oedd y byddai 90,000 o gartrefi yn cael cymorth. Pryd fyddwch yn sicrhau bod y 40,000 eraill o gartrefi yr ydych yn cyfaddef eu bod yn wynebu anawsterau yn cael cymorth i wresogi eu cartrefi'n iawn?

Edwina Hart: Mae'r rhain yn dargedau heriol, ac mae rhai pobl yn credu y dylwn ddechrau eu hadolygu; nid wyf yn cytuno â hynny. Rhaid i'r targedau hyn fod yn heriol, a rhaid i hynny fod yn nod inni. Mae arian ychwanegol ar gael bellach o dan HEES a fydd yn helpu cartrefi ychwanegol. Pan fyddwn yn edrych ar gyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, gobeithio y byddwn yn rhoi blaenoriaeth bellach i'r llinell wariant honno.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi clywed hynny, ac y cewch eich atgoffa o hynny. Yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch am y llythyr a anfonwyd gennych, a'r cymorth ar gyfer cynlluniau peilot adnewyddadwy a gyhoeddwyd gennych. O gofio bod 40,000 o gartrefi ychwanegol sydd ag angen cymorth arnynt, dylid canmol hynny, ac yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch am y penderfyniad hwnnw.

Un o'r pethau gorau y gallem ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd yw annog defnyddio systemau adnewyddadwy. Mae'n ymddangos fel pe baech yn dod yn safle B&Q newydd, a gobeithio eich bod wedi edrych ar hynny. Pan fydd y gwerthusiad wedi'i gwblhau, a wnewch chi addo cofnodi'r arbediad carbon drwy waith eich swyddogion? Dyna'r math o darged y mae ei angen ar y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad cyfan

er mwyn hybu hyn.

Edwina Hart: I will be happy to look at the point that you raise on carbon saving. Like you, I look forward to hearing the feedback from the pilot schemes, what people felt about this when different technologies and so on have been involved. It is good news that we are prepared to give money for ground source and air source heat pumps, because that is important in the development of a viable scheme.

Edwina Hart: Byddaf yn ddigon parod edrych ar y pwynt ar arbed carbon a godwyd gennych. Fel chi, yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at glywed yr adborth o'r cynlluniau peilot, beth oedd barn pobl am hyn pan oedd gwahanol dechnolegau ac ati yn rhan o'r broses. Mae'n newyddion da ein bod yn barod i roi arian ar gyfer pypiau gwres o ffynonellau'r ddaear a ffynonellau'r awyr, oherwydd mae hynny'n bwysig wrth ddatblygu cynllun dichonadwy.

Undebau Credyd Credit Unions

Q2 Karen Sinclair: Will the Minister make a statement on credit unions in Wales? OAQ0953(SJR)

C2 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am undebau credyd yng Nghymru? OAQ0953(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Credit unions continue to make an invaluable contribution to financial inclusion in Wales. We all need access to affordable credit on occasion and credit unions ensure that it is available to some of the most vulnerable people in our communities, who may otherwise have to resort to predatory lenders.

Edwina Hart: Mae undebau credyd yn parhau i wneud cyfraniad amhrisiadwy i gynhwysiant ariannol yng Nghymru. Mae arnom i gyd angen gallu cael credyd fforddiadwy ar brydiau, ac mae undebau credyd yn sicrhau ei fod ar gael i rai o'r bobl fwyaf difreintiedig yn ein cymunedau, a fyddai, fel arall, yn gorfod troi at fenthycwyr sy'n manteisio arnynt.

Karen Sinclair: The recent problems suffered by families in my constituency and across Wales as a result of the collapse of Farepak have been devastating, and at the very time of year when these families thought that they would be celebrating. One of the many issues to come out of this is the important role that credit unions can play in helping to ease the financial burdens and stresses being placed upon families at this time. In the wake of the problems with Farepak, what actions are you taking to review the role of credit unions in Wales to see how they can help at difficult times such as this?

Karen Sinclair: Mae'r problemau'n ddiweddar a ddiodeffwyd gan deuluoedd yn fy etholaeth i oherwydd i Farepak fynd i'r wal wedi bod yn drychinebus, ac ar yr union adeg o'r flwyddyn pan oedd y teuluoedd hyn yn disgwyl dathlu. Un o'r materion niferus a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn sgîl hyn oedd y rôl bwysig y gall undebau credyd ei chwarae wrth helpu lleihau'r beichiau ariannol a'r straen sydd ar deuluoedd ar yr adeg hon. Yn sgîl y problemau gyda Farepak, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i adolygu rôl undebau credyd yng Nghymru i weld sut y gallant helpu ar adegau anodd fel hyn?

Edwina Hart: We contacted credit unions when these problems arose with Farepak, and, in my regular meeting with the voluntary sector this morning, I spoke to the chief executive of the Wales Co-operative Centre, which frequently deals with credit unions for us. We talked about this very issue and about what more we could do in publicising the work of credit unions. This is

Edwina Hart: Buom yn siarad ag undebau credyd pan gododd y problemau hyn gyda Farepak, ac yn fy nghyfarfod rheolaidd gyda'r sector gwirfoddol y bore yma, bûm yn siarad â phrif weithredwr Canolfan Cydweithredol Cymru, sy'n aml yn ymdrin ag undebau credyd ar ein rhan. Buom yn trafod yr union fater hwn a beth yn rhagor y gallem ei wneud i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i

an ongoing issue for me, and I would be delighted to report back on it to the National Assembly in due course, via committee.

Mark Isherwood: The credit union roundtable summary report, issued by the Welsh Consumer Council earlier this year, identified other third-sector lenders, funding issues, and policy and regulation changes as the key challenges facing credit unions. Meanwhile, consumer debt has continued to grow and mortgage and landlord possession orders increased by 36 per cent in the year ending in June. The greatest share of court activity related to non-status lenders, which specialise in lending to those with adverse, poor or no credit records. What action can you propose to support credit unions so that they can expand service provision perhaps in this area?

Edwina Hart: Credit unions can now offer loans to members considered to be high-risk borrowers, which is down to an increase in the interest rates that they can charge from 1 per cent to 2 per cent a month. That is positive. Some credit unions in Wales now offer instant loans, so members do not have to build up savings first. I also know that credit unions are counselling people properly about financial issues, which is to be encouraged and is the way forward. I am proud of what the credit union movement is doing in Wales, and I hope that more people will continue to join credit unions. The movement will certainly enjoy support from us as a Government.

Jocelyn Davies: As a long-standing member of Plaid Cymru's credit union, I am delighted that my savings are guaranteed and protected by law. As you know, Minister, that is not the case with savings clubs such as Farepak, and 150,000 people have now lost their Christmas savings. Do you agree that those clubs need to be regulated as credit unions are, and would you press your UK colleagues on this matter? Also, do you agree that the victims of the collapse of Farepak would be very

waith undebau credyd. Mae hwn yn fater parhaus i mi, a byddwn yn falch iawn adrodd yn ôl arno i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol maes o law, drwy'r pwyllgor.

Mark Isherwood: Yr oedd yr adroddiad byr bwrdd crwn gan yr undebau credyd, a gyhoeddwyd gan Gyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru yn gynharach eleni, yn nodi benthycwyr trydydd sector eraill, materion ariannu, a newidiadau mewn polisi a rheoleiddio fel y prif heriau sy'n wynebu undebau credyd. Yn y cyfamser, mae dyled defnyddwyr wedi dal i dyfu, ac mae morgeisi a gorchmynion meddiannu landlordiaid wedi cynyddu 36 y cant yn y flwyddyn a ddaeth i ben ym mis Mehefin. Roedd y rhan fwyaf o weithgarwch llys yn ymwneud â benthycwyr heb statws, sy'n arbenigo mewn benthycwyr i bobl sydd â chofnodion credyd anffafriol, gwael neu heb gofnod credyd o gwbl. Pa gamau gweithredu a gynigiwch i gynorthwyo undebau credyd er mwyn iddynt efallai allu ehangu'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn y maes hwn.

Edwina Hart: Gall undebau credyd bellach gynnig benthyciadau i aelodau a ystyrir yn fenthycwyr risg uchel, yn sgîl cynnydd o 1 y cant i 2 y cant y mis yn y cyfraddau llog y gallant eu codi. Mae hynny'n gadarnhaol. Mae rhai undebau credyd yng Nghymru bellach yn cynnig benthyciadau ar unwaith, felly nid oes angen i aelodau gynilo yn gyntaf. Gwn hefyd fod undebau credyd yn cynghori pobl yn briodol am faterion ariannol, a dylid annog hyn. Dyma'r ffordd ymlaen. Yr wyf yn falch o'r hyn y mae'r mudiad undebau credyd yn ei wneud yng Nghymru, a gobeithio y bydd rhagor o bobl yn parhau i ymuno ag undebau credyd. Yn sicr, bydd y mudiad yn cael cefnogaeth gennym ni fel Llywodraeth.

Jocelyn Davies: Fel aelod o undeb credyd Plaid Cymru ers amser maith, yr wyf yn falch iawn fod fy nghynilion wedi'u sicrhau a'u diogelu drwy gyfraith. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, nid yw hynny'n wir gyda chlybiau cynilo megis Farepak, ac mae 150,000 o bobl bellach wedi colli eu cynilion Nadolig. A gytunwch fod yn rhaid i'r clybiau hynny gael eu rheoleiddio yn yr un modd ag undebau credyd, ac a fydddech yn pwysu ar eich cyd-aelodau DU ar y mater hwn? Yn ogystal, a

pleased if the UK Treasury were to agree to forgo any money owed in taxes by the company, so that individual savers would be much better placed to get some of their money back?

Edwina Hart: We all feel for those involved who have lost out as a result of the collapse of Farepak, and I will take the spirit of your concerns forward with my colleagues in the UK Government. I have already written to Ian McCartney about the work going on in London, and we will keep the pressure up on other issues. I also understand that MPs are to donate a day's pay to the Farepak response fund. Perhaps we should also consider that as Assembly Members.

gytunwch y byddai'r rhai sydd wedi dioddef oherwydd i Farepak fynd i'r wal yn falch iawn pe bai Trysorlys y DU yn cytuno i hepgor unrhyw arian sy'n ddyledus mewn trethi gan y cwmni, er mwyn i gynilwyr unigol fod mewn sefyllfa well i gael rhywfaint o'u harian yn ôl?

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym i gyd yn cydymdeimlo â'r rheini sydd ar eu colled am fod Farepak wedi mynd i'r wal, a byddaf yn cyfleu eich pryderon i'm cyd-aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ysgrifennu at Ian McCartney ynglŷn â'r gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen yn Llundain, a byddaf yn parhau i bwysu mewn materion eraill. Deallaf hefyd y bydd ASau yn rhoi cyflog diwrnod i gronfa ymateb Farepak. Efallai y dylem ni fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad ystyried gwneud hynny hefyd.

2.10 p.m.

Tai heb eu Meddiannu Unoccupied Houses

Q3 Rosemary Butler: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to tackle the problems associated with unoccupied houses in Wales? OAQ0948(SJR)

C3 Rosemary Butler: Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â thai gwag yng Nghymru? OAQ0948(SJR)

Edwina Hart: As you know, we recently introduced and debated the empty dwelling management Orders, which allow local authorities to manage unoccupied properties in the private sector that have been empty for more than six months without good reason. This supplements existing powers that local authorities have to tackle the problem of empty homes, including those relating to improvement notices, executing works and compulsory purchase.

Edwina Hart: Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym yn ddiweddar wedi cyflwyno a thrafod y Gorchmynion rheoli eiddo gwag, sy'n caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol reoli eiddo gwag yn y sector preifat sydd wedi bod yn wag am dros chwe mis, a hynny heb reswm da. Mae hyn yn ategu pwerau cyfredol sydd gan awdurdodau lleol i fynd i'r afael â phroblem cartrefi gwag, gan gynnwys y rheini sy'n ymwneud â rhybuddion gwella, gwneud gwaith a phrynu gorfodol.

Rosemary Butler: As you are probably aware, in Newport, it is not the empty council houses that are a problem; the problem is the 2,056 empty private properties, 400 of which are long-term derelict. Newport City Council is putting in £0.5 million over the next two years to manage those empty properties. Would you care to visit Newport in a few months' time to view the progress of this scheme?

Rosemary Butler: Fel y gwyddoch, o bosibl, nid y tai cyngor gwag yw'r broblem yng Nghasnewydd; y 2,056 o eiddo preifat gwag yw'r broblem, 400 ohonynt wedi bod yn segur am gyfnod hir. Bydd Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd yn cyfrannu £0.5 miliwn dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf i reoli'r adeialdau gwag hynny. A hoffech ymweld â Chasnewydd ymhen ychydig fisoedd i weld cynnydd y cynllun hwn?

Edwina Hart: I would be delighted to visit

Edwina Hart: Byddwn yn falch iawn

Newport with you. It is important that local authorities get to grips with the empty properties in their areas and that they look at their own empty properties within their areas to ensure that they are maximising the lettings that are available.

Alun Ffred Jones: Nid oes dwywaith bod anheddau gwag yn cyfrannu at y broblem bod diffyg cartrefi addas ar gyfer pobl. O ran y Gorchmynion rheoli anheddau gwag a basiwyd yma, a oes gennych unrhyw darged i awdurdodau lleol ei gyrraedd er mwyn gwneud defnydd o rai o'r anheddau hyn?

Edwina Hart: I need to consider the issue of targets, now that you have raised it with me, Alun Ffred. We hope that the legislation is there and that authorities will use it; we have indicated that we expect them to use it properly. When we have the figures to hand, I will discuss with the Welsh Local Government Association how much work should be done and what it should be considering in order to maximise this. There is no doubt in my mind, particularly when you consider the desperate situation regarding letting property in rural areas, that we need to maximise the use of this legislation.

Jonathan Morgan: Given that there are so many families in Cardiff that are waiting to be rehoused, it is disgraceful that we have 190 unoccupied council properties in the city. Do you share my concern about the fact that there are so many unoccupied council properties, many of which have been unoccupied for several months? Will you do all that you can, with your colleagues in the Assembly Government, to persuade the county council that it is its priority to get these houses and flats up to scratch and let out to families who need them?

Edwina Hart: The figures for 2005 show that more than 1,800 local authority properties were vacant for more than six months—that is effectively 1,800 homes for people. I would be more than pleased to take up any of these issues with local government, because it is important that these properties are repaired immediately and put back into use, so that families can have proper homes.

ymweld â Chasnewydd gyda chi. Mae'n bwysig i awdurdodau lleol fynd i'r afael â'r eiddo gwag yn eu hardaloedd ac edrych ar eu heiddo gwag eu hunain yn eu hardaloedd i sicrhau bod y nifer mwyaf posibl yn cael eu gosod.

Alun Ffred Jones: There is no doubt that empty dwellings contribute to the problem of a lack of suitable housing for people. In terms of the empty dwelling management Orders that were passed here, do you have a target for local authorities to meet in order to bring some of these dwellings back into use?

Edwina Hart: Mae angen imi ystyried targedau, gan eich bod yn awr wedi codi hyn, Alun Ffred. Gobeithiwn fod y ddeddfwriaeth yno ac y bydd awdurdodau'n ei defnyddio; yr ydym wedi nodi ein bod yn disgwyl iddynt ei defnyddio'n gywir. Pan fydd y ffigurau gennym, byddaf yn trafod gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru faint o waith y dylid ei wneud, a'r hyn y dylai fod yn ei ystyried i sicrhau'r budd mwyaf posibl. Yr wyf yn hollol sicr fy meddwl, yn arbennig pan ystyriwch y sefyllfa ddybryd wrth osod eiddo mewn ardaloedd gwledig, fod angen inni sicrhau defnyddio ddeddfwriaeth hon i'r eithaf.

Jonathan Morgan: O ystyried bod cynifer o deuluoedd yng Nghaerdydd yn aros i gael eu hailgartrefu, mae'n warth bod gennym 190 o dai cyngor gwag yn y ddinas. A ydych chi fel finnau yn pryderu bod cymaint o eiddo'r cyngor yn wag, a nifer o'r rheini wedi bod yn wag am fisoedd? A wnewch bopeth a allwch, gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, i ddwyn perswâd ar y cyngor sir mai ei flaenoriaeth yw sicrhau bod y tai a'r fflatiau hyn yn addas ac yn cael eu gosod i deuluoedd y mae arnynt eu hangen?

Edwina Hart: Dengys y ffigurau ar gyfer 2005 fod dros 1,800 o eiddo awdurdodau lleol yn wag am dros chwe mis—mae hynny i bob pwrpas yn 1,800 o gartrefi i bobl. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i godi unrhyw rai o'r materion hyn gyda llywodraeth leol, oherwydd mae'n bwysig i'r adeiladau hyn gael eu hatgyweirio ar unwaith a'u defnyddio unwaith eto, er mwyn i deuluoedd allu cael cartrefi priodol.

Cyflwr Stoc Tai Cymdeithasol
The Condition of Social Housing Stock

C4 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyflwr stoc tai cymdeithasol Cymru? OAQ0935(SJR)

Edwina Hart: The Welsh housing quality standard was issued in 2002 as a target standard for the physical and environmental condition of existing social housing. All social landlords must submit business plans that demonstrate the achievement of the standard by 2012 and its continuing maintenance during the 30-year planning period.

David Lloyd: Os yw tenantiaid yn pleidleisio yn erbyn trosglwyddo'r stoc tai cyngor, beth yw'r 'plan B'.

Edwina Hart: The ultimate responsibility for housing lies with local authorities. They make the decisions regarding how they want to get up to the standard by 2012. Some local authorities are asking their tenants for a stock transfer. If there is a 'no' vote, they will be in the same position, and some authorities, such as Wrexham County Borough Council, will have to consider their position.

Leighton Andrews: Do you agree with me that, in the conduct of the stock transfer debate, particularly the ballots that are about to take place, it is important that decent and proper-quality information is given to tenants rather than the misinformation that has been circulated by some, including Plaid Cymru in the Rhondda?

Edwina Hart: It is important that everyone clearly understands what the issues are regarding stock transfer, and that there is honesty and integrity in the answers that people receive. To this end, following a discussion in Plenary, which Leanne, I think, introduced, I have agreed to produce a series of questions and answers about the Assembly Government's position on such issues as rental incomes. I intend to issue that to local authorities this week, and to tenant organisations, should they wish to use it.

Q4 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on the condition of social housing stock in Wales? OAQ0935(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Cyhoeddwyd safon ansawdd tai Cymru yn 2002 fel safon targed ar gyfer cyflwr ffisegol ac amgylcheddol y tai cymdeithasol presennol. Rhaid i bob landlord cymdeithasol gyflwyno cynlluniau busnes sy'n dangos cyrraedd y safon erbyn 2012, a'i chynnal yn barhaus yn ystod y cyfnod cynllunio o 30 mlynedd.

David Lloyd: If tenants vote against transferring council housing stock, what is plan B?

Edwina Hart: Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am dai yn y pen draw. Nhw fydd yn gwneud y penderfyniadau am y ffordd y maent yn bwriadu cyrraedd y safon erbyn 2012. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn gofyn i'w tenantiaid am gael trosglwyddo stoc. Os bydd pleidlais 'na', byddant yn yr un sefyllfa, a bydd yn rhaid i rai awdurdodau, megis Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam, ystyried eu sefyllfa.

Leighton Andrews: A gytunwch â mi ei bod yn bwysig, wrth gynnal y ddadl ar drosglwyddo stoc, yn arbennig y pleidleisio sydd ar fin digwydd, fod gwybodaeth gywir o safon yn cael ei rhoi i denantiaid, yn hytrach na'r wybodaeth anghywir sydd wedi'i chylchredeg gan rai, gan gynnwys Plaid Cymru yn Rhondda?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig i bawb ddeall yn glir beth yw'r problemau o ran trosglwyddo stoc, a bod gonestrwydd a chywirdeb yn yr atebion y bydd pobl yn eu cael. I'r perwyl hwn, ar ôl trafodaeth yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a gyflwynwyd, mi gredaf, gan Leanne, yr wyf wedi cytuno i gynhyrchu cyfres o gwestiynau ac atebion am safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar faterion megis incwm rhent. Bwriadaf gyflwyno hynny i awdurdodau lleol yr wythnos hon, ac i sefydliadau tenantiaid, os byddant yn dymuno'i ddefnyddio.

Laura Anne Jones: We need to reduce the amount of time that people spend in temporary accommodation, yet increases in social housing demand in some parts of Scotland have meant that more people spend more time in temporary accommodation. Will you assure the Assembly that any future social housing strategy will have learned lessons from England and Scotland in that regard, and that any guidance for local authorities will be stronger than it is presently?

Edwina Hart: I appreciate your concern about the number of people who spend time in temporary accommodation, and we are dealing with issues surrounding bed-and-breakfast accommodation. I am open to any helpful suggestions as to how we can alleviate the problem. I have stressed to local government the importance of dealing with these issues promptly, and of giving them the necessary priority, which can sometimes include financial priority when local government looks at its budgets.

Laura Anne Jones: Mae angen i ni leihau'r amser y bydd pobl yn ei dreulio mewn llety dros dro, ond eto mae cynnydd yn y galw am dai cymdeithasol mewn rhai rhannau o'r Alban wedi golygu bod mwy o bobl yn treulio mwy o amser mewn llety dros dro. A rowch sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad y bydd unrhyw strategaeth ar dai cymdeithasol yn y dyfodol wedi dysgu gwersi gan Loegr a'r Alban am hynny, ac y bydd unrhyw ganllawiau i awdurdodau lleol yn gryfach nag y maent ar hyn o bryd?

Edwina Hart: Gwerthfawrogaf eich pryder ynglŷn â nifer y bobl sy'n treulio amser mewn llety dros dro, ac yr ydym yn ymdrin â materion ynglŷn â llety gwely a brecwast. Yr wyf yn fodlon ystyried unrhyw awgrymiadau defnyddiol sut y gallwn leddfu'r broblem. Yr wyf wedi pwysleisio wrth lywodraeth leol mor bwysig yw ymdrin â'r materion hyn yn brydlon, a rhoi'r flaenoriaeth angenrheidiol iddynt. Gall hyn weithiau gynnwys blaenoriaeth ariannol pan fydd llywodraeth leol yn edrych ar ei chyllidebau.

Effaith Cau Swyddfeydd Budd-daliadau The Impact of Benefit Office Closures

Q5 Leanne Wood: What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government regarding the impact of benefit office closures on Objective 1 and Communities First areas? OAQ0939(SJR)

Edwina Hart: The closure of benefit offices across the UK is a non-devolved matter, as you know, and responsibility rests with the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions. I understand that my colleague, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, has raised the implications for Wales of the Jobcentre Plus modernisation programme with the Department for Work and Pensions, and is in regular communication with UK Government Ministers on the matter.

Leanne Wood: There is plenty of evidence to suggest that benefit claims are taking longer to process as a result of these closures; people are spending ages trying to get through on the telephone to make a claim. We also have welfare reforms coming in, and

C5 Leanne Wood: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch effaith cau swyddfeydd budd-daliadau ar ardaloedd Amcan 1 a Chymunedau yn Gyntaf? OAQ0939(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Mae cau swyddfeydd budd-daliadau ledled y DU yn fater sydd heb ei ddatganoli, fel y gwyddoch, a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau sy'n gyfrifol amdano. Deallaf fod fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, wedi codi gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau y goblygiadau i Gymru yn y rhaglen i foderneiddio'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith. Mae'n cysylltu'n rheolaidd â Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ar y mater hwn.

Leanne Wood: Mae digon o dystiolaeth yn awgrymu bod ceisiadau am fudd-daliadau yn cymryd mwy o amser i'w prosesu oherwydd cau swyddfeydd; mae pobl yn treulio hydoedd yn ceisio siarad â rhywun ar y ffôn i wneud cais. Mae'r diwygiadau lles ar y

the majority of incapacity benefit claimants are living in deprived areas. Therefore, those reforms will have an impact on the ability to process claims, as well as the fact that many civil service jobs have been lost in deprived areas. The Assembly is powerless really as regards having any impact on those Westminster policies that go against your stated anti-poverty aims. I welcome the fact that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has had some discussion with the DWP, but do you think that you and your colleagues could do any more to argue against such policies applying in Wales?

Edwina Hart: There were a number of questions there. I have written to the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions previously about the welfare reforms, stressing the need to ensure that adequate safeguards are in place to protect our most vulnerable citizens while providing positive assistance to help people to achieve the often difficult transition into work. We also need to look at improving awareness of, and accessibility to, existing benefits, which Huw Lewis highlighted in his report and his implementation plan. I am concerned about the impact that benefit office closures will have across Wales, particularly in our most deprived Communities First areas. I am more than happy to raise this matter at my next meeting with the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Wales, to convey the concerns of the National Assembly.

Lisa Francis: Minister, I appreciate your answer that you will talk to the Secretary of State. Following what Leanne said, it appears that lots of calls from jobless people seeking their first benefit payment went unanswered because of information technology and computer problems particularly. Would you take that into account when you speak to him, and highlight that issue, as it is now having an impact on people, who are getting in touch with us, with MPs and citizens advice bureaux?

Edwina Hart: I suggest that the party

gorwel hefyd, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl sy'n hawlio budd-dal analluogrwydd yn byw mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Felly, bydd y diwygiadau hynny'n cael effaith ar y gallu i brosesu ceisiadau, yn ogystal â'r ffaith fod nifer o swyddi yn y gwasanaeth sifil wedi eu colli mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Mae'r Cynulliad yn ddi-rym mewn gwirionedd o ran cael unrhyw effaith ar y polisiau hynny gan San Steffan, sy'n mynd yn groes i'r nodau gwrth-dlodi yr ydych wedi eu mynegi. Croesawaf y ffaith fod y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, ond a ydych yn credu y gallech chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion wneud rhagor i ddadlau yn erbyn polisiau o'r fath yng Nghymru.

Edwina Hart: Yr ydych wedi gofyn nifer o gwestiynau. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ysgrifennu at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau ynglŷn â'r diwygiadau lles, gan bwysleisio'r angen am sicrhau cymryd digon o gamau i ddiogelu ein dinasyddion sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, ac yr un pryd roi cymorth cadarnhaol i helpu pobl drwy'r cyfnod dechrau gweithio, sy'n aml yn anodd. Mae angen hefyd inni edrych ar wella ymwybyddiaeth o'r budd-daliadau sydd ar gael a'i gwneud yn haws i'w hawlio, fel y dywedodd Huw Lewis yn ei adroddiad a'i gynllun gweithredu. Yr wyf yn pryderu am effaith y penderfyniad i gau swyddfeydd budd-daliadau ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn ein hardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf mwyaf difreintiedig. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i godi'r mater hwn yn fy nghyfarfod nesaf gydag Is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, i gyfleu pryderon y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Lisa Francis: Weinidog, yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'ch ateb y byddwch yn siarad â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Yn dilyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Leanne, ymddengys fod llawer o alwadau gan bobl ddi-waith yn mynd heb eu hateb oherwydd problemau gyda chyfrifiaduron a thechnoleg gwybodaeth yn benodol. A wnewch ystyried hynny pan fyddwch yn siarad ag ef, a thynnu sylw at y mater hwnnw, gan ei fod bellach yn cael effaith ar bobl, sy'n cysylltu â ni, ASau a chanolfannau cyngor ar bopeth?

Edwina Hart: Awgrymaf fod llefarwyr y

spokespersons that are my opposite numbers write to me with any concerns that they have on this matter. I will then pass those on appropriately in my discussions. We know of the concerns, as they are raised with us in our offices.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I will probe you a bit on the relationship between the London Government and you on this issue. You clearly have the priority in the Communities First programme, by which you are seeking to put resources, energy and funding into the poorest communities in Wales, and yet we have a contrary policy with regard to both benefit offices and post offices, which seeks to take away some of those crucial services in areas where our poorest people live. Do you think that you can take a robust line with your ministerial colleagues in London on this matter? Do you think that they really understand what the Communities First programme is in Wales? If they did, perhaps they would take an alternative line.

Edwina Hart: I can assure Members that I take a robust line with opposite numbers in Westminster, whether in written or verbal communications. I have the interests of Wales and our poorest communities at heart as regards those programmes for which I am responsible. It is important that they understand the issues in Wales, and I can assure you, Mike, that we articulate these very well, in terms of post offices and the needs of our poorest communities.

2.20 p.m.

Digartrefedd Homelessness

Q6 Peter Black: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to tackle homelessness in Wales? OAQ0943(SJR)

Edwina Hart: We set out our agenda to tackle this problem in our revised national homelessness strategy. We are supporting this strategy with increased investment, with legislation to ensure that people are housed in appropriate temporary accommodation,

gwrthbleidiau dros fy mhortffolio yn ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn ag unrhyw bryderon sydd ganddynt am y mater hwn. Yna byddaf yn eu trosglwyddo'n briodol yn fy nhrefnadaethau. Gwyddom am y pryderon, oherwydd cânt eu codi yn ein swyddfeydd.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Hoffwn eich holi yn fyr am y berthynas rhyngoch chi a'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain ar y mater hwn. Mae'n amlwg fod gennych y flaenoriaeth yn y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, lle yr ydych yn ceisio rhoi adnoddau, egni a chyllid i'r cymunedau tlotaf yng Nghymru. Ac eto mae yna bolisi croes o ran swyddfeydd budd-daliadau a swyddfeydd post, sy'n ceisio dileu rhai o'r gwasanaethau hollbwysig hynny mewn ardaloedd lle mae'r bobl dlotaf yn byw. A ydych yn credu y gallwch gyflwyno dadl gref gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn Llundain ar y mater hwn? A ydych yn credu eu bod yn deall y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yng Nghymru mewn gwirionedd? Pe baent yn ei deall, efallai y byddent yn gweithredu fel arall?

Edwina Hart: Gallaf sicrhau Aelodau fy mod yn dadlau'n gryf gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan, boed yn ysgrifenedig neu ar lafar. Mae buddiannau Cymru a'n cymunedau tlotaf yn bwysig imi o ran y rhaglenni hynny yr wyf yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Mae'n bwysig iddynt ddeall y problemau yng Nghymru, a gallaf eich sicrhau, Mike, ein bod yn dadlau'n huawdl iawn, o ran swyddfeydd post ac anghenion ein cymunedau tlotaf.

C6 Peter Black: Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd yng Nghymru? OAQ0943(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym yn amlinellu ein hagenda i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon yn ein strategaeth genedlaethol ddiwygiedig ar ddigartrefedd. Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r strategaeth hon, drwy fuddsoddiad ychwanegol, drwy ddeddfwriaeth i sicrhau

guidance on the implementation of statutory homelessness responsibilities, and, of course, the promotion of good practice.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, Minister. In the last Assembly, the Government did important work in establishing the homebuy scheme to help people to get into the housing market in rural areas. Since then, the issue has arisen in urban areas, where affordability has become a particular problem for many people. What plans do you have to try to extend the homebuy scheme for rural areas, as it currently stands, to cover urban areas such as Swansea, Cardiff and Newport, where demand is often high and issues relating to the availability and affordability of housing causes difficulties for people?

Edwina Hart: Peter must have been listening to a conversation that I had earlier this week about looking at these issues, because there are a lot of pressing concerns about what is happening in urban areas and the difficulties people have in purchasing homes. I am currently considering these issues and I very much hope to share some new areas that I am looking into with the Assembly, probably in December in committee.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn edrych ar bob math o opsiynau newydd i gynorthwyo pobl sy'n ceisio cael troedle yn y farchnad dai. Credaf y byddwch yn cytuno ei bod yn mynd yn gynyddol anoddach i hynny ddigwydd oherwydd bod gwerth a phrisiau tai yn codi. A ydych yn barod i edrych ar gynllun a fyddai'n cynorthwyo pobl sy'n prynu tŷ am y tro cyntaf i sicrhau bod ganddynt flaendal i'w gynnig, oherwydd, yn aml, er eu bod yn gallu cael morgais, nid oes ganddynt flaendal? A yw hynny'n opsiwn yr ydych chi fel Llywodraeth yn barod i'w ystyried?

Edwina Hart: I look at all relevant issues. I am not certain that that would help in any shape or form with regard to alleviating the problems of people who cannot access housing.

William Graham: What progress has been

bod pobl yn cael eu gosod mewn llety dros dro sy'n briodol, drwy ganllawiau ar weithredu cyfrifoldebau digartrefedd statudol ac, wrth gwrs, drwy hyrwyddo arfer da.

Peter Black: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yn y Cynulliad diwethaf, gwnaeth y Llywodraeth waith pwysig wrth sefydlu'r cynllun cymorth prynu i helpu pobl i brynu tai mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ers hynny, mae'r broblem wedi codi mewn ardaloedd trefol, lle y mae prisiau wedi dod yn broblem arbennig i nifer o bobl. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i geisio estyn y cynllun cymorth prynu mewn ardaloedd gwledig, fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, i gwmpasu ardaloedd trefol, megis Abertawe, Caerdydd a Chasnewydd, lle mae galw mawr yn aml a lle y mae problemau i allu cael tai a'u fforddio yn achosi anawsterau i bobl?

Edwina Hart: Rhaid bod Peter yn gwranddo ar sgwrs a gefais yn gynharach yr wythnos hon am y materion hyn, oherwydd mae cryn bryder am yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn ardaloedd trefol a'r anawsterau sy'n wynebu pobl wrth brynu cartrefi. Yr wyf yn ystyried y materion hyn ar hyn o bryd, a mawr obeithiaf y byddaf yn sôn am rai o'r meysydd newydd yr wyf yn eu hystyried wrth y Cynulliad, mae'n debyg yn y pwyllgor ym mis Rhagfyr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am pleased to hear that you are considering various new options to assist people trying to get a foothold on the housing ladder. I think you will agree that this is getting increasingly difficult because of the increase in house prices and values. Would you be prepared to consider a scheme that would assist first-time buyers to ensure that they have a deposit to offer, because, very often, although they can have a mortgage, they do not have a deposit? Is that an option that you as a Government would be prepared to consider?

Edwina Hart: Byddaf yn ystyried pob mater perthnasol. Nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddai hynny o unrhyw gymorth i leddfu problemau pobl sy'n methu cael tai.

William Graham: Pa gynnydd a wnaed i

made in ensuring that appropriate guidance is given by local authorities with regard to those homeless people in Wales who are also disabled?

Edwina Hart: There are big issues about accommodation, not only with regard to homeless people, but around what sort of housing they need to go into if they also have a disability. The primary responsibility lies with local authorities, and I will consider whether it is necessary to do anything further in that particular area.

sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn rhoi canllawiau priodol ar gyfer pobl ddigartref yng Nghymru sydd hefyd yn anabl?

Edwina Hart: Mae yna broblemau mawr ynglŷn â llety, nid yn unig ar gyfer pobl ddigartref, ond hefyd o ran y math o lety y mae arnynt ei angen os ydynt hefyd yn anabl. Yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n bennaf gyfrifol, a byddaf yn ystyried a oes angen gwneud rhagor yn y maes penodol hwnnw?

Safon Ansawdd Tai Cymru Welsh Housing Quality Standard

Q7 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh housing quality standard? OAQ0901(SJR)

C7 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am safon ansawdd tai Cymru? OAQ0901(SJR)

Edwina Hart: The standard was issued in 2002 as the target standard for the physical and environmental condition of existing social housing. All social landlords must submit business plans that demonstrate the achievement of the standard by 2012 and its continuing maintenance during the 30-year planning period.

Edwina Hart: Cyhoeddwyd y safon yn 2002 fel y safon darged ar gyfer cyflwr ffisegol ac amgylcheddol y tai cymdeithasol presennol. Rhaid i bob landlord cymdeithasol gyflwyno cynllun busnes sy'n dangos cyrraedd y safon erbyn 2012 a pharhau i'w chyrraedd yn ystod y cyfnod cynllunio o 30 mlynedd.

Mark Isherwood: Professor Kevin Morgan of Cardiff University stated last month that the cost of bringing all the council homes in Wales up to the Welsh housing quality standard is now estimated as up to £4 billion. He further stated that tenants in Wales are likely to be saddled with poor-quality homes indefinitely, unless council houses are transferred to the voluntary sector and accused local authorities of 'burying their heads in the sand'. I know that, as you reiterated earlier, you are planning a leaflet for tenants showing the true costs and benefits of transfer, so that we may, hopefully, collectively neutralise some of the misinformation being given out. However, how do you propose to tackle the poor understanding in many county councils? There is a failure to understand that keeping council ownership through prudential borrowing, for example, will saddle council tax payers with long-term debt, while failing to deliver the wider social and economic regeneration gains that stock transfer can deliver.

Mark Isherwood: Dywedodd yr Athro Kevin Morgan o Brifysgol Caerdydd fis diwethaf yr amcangyfrifir ei bod erbyn hyn yn costio hyd at £4 biliwn i sicrhau bod pob tŷ cyngor yng Nghymru yn cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Dywedodd hefyd mai'r tebyg yw y bydd tenantiaid yng Nghymru yn gorfod derbyn cartrefi o safon isel am gyfnod amhenodol, oni bai bod tai cyngor yn cael eu trosglwyddo i'r sector gwirfoddol, a chyhuddodd awdurdodau lleol o gladdu eu pennau yn y tywod. Gwn eich bod, fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud yn gynharach, yn paratoi taflen i denantiaid yn dangos gwir gost a budd trosglwyddo stoc, fel y gallwn ar y cyd, gobeithio, dymherhu rywfaint ar y wybodaeth anghywir sy'n cael ei rhoi. Fodd bynnag, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r ddealltwriaeth wael mewn sawl cyngor sir? Maent yn methu deall y bydd cadw tai cyngor ym meddiant y cyngor drwy fenthyca darbodus, er enghraifft, yn arwain at ddyled hirdymor i bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor, ond yn methu sicrhau'r manteision adfywio cymdeithasol ac economaidd mwy

cyffredinol a all ddeillio o drosglwyddo stoc.

Edwina Hart: You referred to a leaflet about the benefits of transfer; I think that I indicated that I would provide a question-and-answer notice that would explain to people the factual issues to do with rents and address various other questions that get asked with regard to issues of prudential borrowing and so on, which you helpfully suggested in committee. To turn to your other point, local authorities are well enough informed about the issues surrounding housing. I have spoken to Welsh local government on a number of occasions and I am due to speak to other local government leaders about the issues surrounding economic regeneration around the housing agenda and so on. Local authorities are well placed to understand the issues on this.

Mark Isherwood: To give an example, I have been approached by opposition councillors in a particular council who, through no fault of their own, failed to understand, or misunderstood, that the allocation of priority needs housing, if stock is transferred to housing associations, will, effectively, disappear and the council will lose the mechanisms to facilitate meeting the priority housing need. We heard evidence this morning in committee, provided by Shelter and Cymorth, among others, that there are some good practice models in England and Scotland, provided that local authorities, housing associations and stock transfer associations enter into agreements at the outset. What action can you take to ensure that that applies in Wales and that we can neutralise what appears to be misinformation among a sector of county councillors?

Edwina Hart: It is incumbent upon all elected representatives to read all of the available literature, and the guidance that we send up from here, so that they fully understand what they are doing when they vote in the council chamber, just as we avail ourselves of the opportunity to get all the information that we require to make decisions. It is important that we give out general guidance from the Assembly and that I am able to give out advice; however, ultimately, it is up to individual elected

Edwina Hart: Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at daflen ar fanteision trosglwyddo stoc; credaf imi nodi y byddwn yn paratoi hysbysiad holi ac ateb a fyddai'n esbonio'r ffeithiau ynglŷn â rhenti wrth bobl ac yn mynd i'r afael ag amrywiol gwestiynau eraill a ofynnir am faterion ynglŷn â bentyca darbodus ac ati, yn unol â'ch awgrym defnyddiol yn y pwyllgor. I droi at eich pwynt arall, mae awdurdodau lleol yn cael gwybodaeth ddigonol am y materion yn ymwneud â thai. Yr wyf wedi siarad â llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru droeon, a byddaf yn siarad ag arweinwyr llywodraeth leol eraill ynglŷn â materion adfywio economaidd a'r agenda tai, ac ati. Mae awdurdodau lleol mewn sefyllfa dda i ddeall y problemau yn hyn.

Mark Isherwood: I roi enghraifft, mae cynghorwyr o'r gwrthbleidiau mewn cyngor penodol wedi cysylltu â mi. Yr oeddent wedi methu deall, neu wedi camddeall, er nad oedd bai arnynt hwy, y bydd dyrannu tai anghenion blaenoriaeth, os trosglwyddir stoc i gymdeithasau tai, yn diflannu i bob diben, ac y bydd y cyngor yn colli'r mecanweithiau ar gyfer hwyluso bodloni'r angen am dai blaenoriaeth. Clywsom dystiolaeth y bore yma yn y pwyllgor, gan Shelter a Cymorth, ymhlith eraill, fod yna rai patrymau arfer da yn Lloegr a'r Alban, ar yr amod bod awdurdodau lleol, cymdeithasau tai a chymdeithasau trosglwyddo stoc yn llunio cytundebau ar y cychwyn cyntaf. Pa gamau y gallwch eu cymryd i sicrhau bod hynny'n gymwys yng Nghymru ac y gallwn dymheru'r hyn sy'n ymddangos yn wybodaeth anghywir ymhlith rhai cynghorwyr sir?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n ddyletswydd ar bob cynrychiolydd etholedig i ddarllen yr holl ddeunydd ysgrifenedig sydd ar gael, a'r canllawiau a ddsberthir gennym ni, fel y bydd yn deall yn union beth y mae'n ei wneud wrth bleidleisio yn siambr y cyngor, yn yr un modd ag y byddwn ninnau'n ceisio pob darn o wybodaeth y mae arnom ei hangen i wneud penderfyniadau. Mae'n bwysig inni roi canllawiau cyffredinol gan y Cynulliad ac y gallaf fi roi cyngor; fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, yr aelodau etholedig

members to understand the issues that are before them in terms of how they deal with their duties as members of local authorities.

Leanne Wood: Minister, I understand that many local authorities have said that they could meet the Welsh housing quality standard within their budgets, if they were given more time to achieve it. When a council is able to make such a case, would you be prepared to consider giving it more time?

Edwina Hart: My difficulty with this is that I issued the standard in 2002. From then until 2012 is a 10-year period, which I think was adequate for them to get this in place. There was a resistance to this among local authorities because they all believed that tens of millions of pounds would appear somewhere out of the ether or that there would be a change of heart in central Government policy. I think that a lot of them thought, 'If we hang on long enough, we won't have to do this', and now that we have got to 2006-07, they realise that they are on the cusp of 2012 and are saying, 'We can do it, if we have longer'. I think that if a lot of them had been made to do it in 2002 they would have still said, 'If we have a bit longer, we can do it'. I think that we have to stick to the 2012 date and see what comes in from the local authorities.

Leanne Wood: Minister, what we are dealing with here is a completely uneven playing field. The debt will be written off if councils are prepared to transfer their stock to new housing companies and the new housing companies are able to borrow, but local authorities are prevented from doing either of those things. The Government has an ideological obsession with taking services out of the public sector; it is Thatcherism gone mad. The trade unions and Plaid Cymru oppose stock transfer and ordinary Labour Party members have opposed stock transfer in two Labour Party conferences on the run. Are we all wrong? Giving councils extra time to achieve the housing quality standard would greatly help campaigners in Wales who want to keep council housing public, as would being a bit more flexible about the criteria. As a purely anti-Thatcherite move,

unigol sy'n gorfod sicrhau eu bod deall y materion ger eu bron o ran sut y maent yn ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau fel aelodau o awdurdodau lleol.

Leanne Wood: Weinidog, deallaf fod nifer o awdurdodau lleol wedi dweud y gallent gyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru o fewn eu cyllidebau, pe baent yn cael mwy o amser i'w chyrraedd. Pan fydd cyngor yn gallu dadlau felly, a fyddech yn barod i ystyried rhoi mwy o amser?

Edwina Hart: Yr anhawster o'm rhan i yw fy mod wedi cyhoeddi'r safon yn 2002. Mae'n 10 mlynedd o'r pryd hwnnw tan 2012, ac yr oedd hynny, mi gredaf, yn ddigon iddynt roi hyn ar waith. Yr oedd awdurdodau lleol yn amharod i weithredu ar hyn am eu bod yn credu y byddai degau o filiynau o bunnau yn ymddangos o rywle, neu y byddai polisi Llywodraeth ganolog yn newid. Credaf fod llawer wedi meddwl, 'Os arhoswn yn ddigon hir, ni fydd yn rhaid inni wneud hyn'. Gan ein bod wedi cyrraedd 2006-07 maent yn sylweddoli bod 2012 yn dod yn nes ac yn dweud, 'Gallwn wneud hyn os cawn ragor o amser'. Pe bai llawer ohonynt wedi cael eu gorfodi i wneud hyn yn 2002 byddent yn dal i ddweud, mi gredaf, 'Os cawn ragor o amser, gallwn wneud hyn'. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni gadw at y dyddiad 2012 a gweld beth a ddaw gan yr awdurdodau lleol.

Leanne Wood: Weinidog, yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wynebu yw annhegwch llwyr. Caiff y ddyled ei dileu os bydd cynghorau'n barod i drosglwyddo eu stoc i gwmnïau tai newydd a'r cwmnïau tai newydd yn gallu cael benthyg arian. Ond mae awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu hatal rhag gwneud y naill beth a'r llall. Mae gan y Llywodraeth obsesiwn ideolegol am dynnu gwasanaethau oddi wrth y sector cyhoeddus; dyna Thatcheriaeth ar ei fwyaf eithafol. Mae'r undebau llafur a Phlaid Cymru yn gwrthwynebu trosglwyddo stoc, ac mae aelodau cyffredin o'r Blaid Lafur wedi gwrthwynebu trosglwyddo stoc mewn dwy gynhadledd gan y Blaid Lafur o'r bron. A ydym i gyd yn camsynied? Byddai rhoi mwy o amser i gynghorau gyrraedd y safon ansawdd tai o gymorth mawr i ymgyrchwyr yng Nghymru sydd am gadw tai cyngor mewn dwylo cyhoeddus. Byddai bod yn fwy

would you be prepared to consider that?

hyblyg o ran y meini prawf hefyd o gymorth. Fel cam cwbl wrth-Thatcheraidd, a fydddech yn barod i ystyried hynny.

Edwina Hart: The only thing that I am interested in about housing is the welfare of the tenant who will be in that house in 2012. We have a duty to those individuals to ensure that the properties in question are of a standard that we expect to live in. That is our duty as an Assembly and it is a duty of local government. We can argue the toss about the UK Treasury and the public sector borrowing requirement, but that will give false hope to people that things are going to change. The reality is that houses have to be up to standard by 2012; there are difficulties over the politics, I appreciate that, but my only interest is the individual citizen and the family that live in that house and what is best for them. I want them to have decent conditions to live in and that is the end of the matter. I went into politics to help people and helping people to get housing that is up to standard is the right thing for us to do.

Edwina Hart: Yr unig beth sydd o ddiddordeb imi ynglŷn â thai yw lles y tenant a fydd yn y cartref hwnnw yn 2012. Mae gennym ddyletswydd i'r unigolion hynny i sicrhau bod yr eiddo dan sylw o safon y byddwn yn ei disgwyl. Dyna ein dyletswydd fel Cynulliad ac mae'n ddyletswydd ar lywodraeth leol. Gallwn drin a thrafod Trysorlys y DU a gofyniad benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus, ond bydd hynny'n codi gobeithion pobl fod pethau'n mynd i newid. Ond gobaith gwag fyddai hynny. Y gwir amdani yw bod tai yn gorfod cyrraedd y safon erbyn 2012; mae yna anawsterau o ran gwleidyddiaeth - yr wyf yn sylweddoli hynny - ond yr unig beth sydd o ddiddordeb imi yw'r dinesydd unigol a'i deulu sy'n byw yn y cartref a'r hyn sydd orau iddynt hwy. Yr wyf am iddynt gael amodau byw da, a dyna ddiwedd ar y mater. Euthum i mewn i wleidyddiaeth er mwyn helpu pobl, a helpu pobl i gael tai o safon yw'r peth iawn inni ei wneud.

Compactau'r Sector Gwirfoddol Voluntary Sector Compacts

Q8 Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on progress with voluntary sector compacts? OAQ0929(SJR)

C8 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd a wnaed gyda chompectau'r sector gwirfoddol? OAQ0929(SJR)

Edwina Hart: As you know, Helen, we encourage the development of voluntary sector compacts with local authorities, health bodies and beyond. We are currently compiling, in partnership with the voluntary sector, a strategic action plan for taking forward the Assembly's voluntary sector scheme. Support for compacts will be a fundamental part of this.

Edwina Hart: Fel y gwyddoch, Helen, yr ydym yn annog datblygu compactau rhwng y sector gwirfoddol ac awdurdodau lleol, cyrff ieched ac eraill. Yr ydym wrthi, mewn partneriaeth â'r sector gwirfoddol, yn llunio cynllun gweithredu strategol ar gyfer symud ymlaen gynllun sector gwirfoddol y Cynulliad. Bydd cefnogaeth i gompactau yn rhan hanfodol o hyn.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you agree that where you have a voluntary organisation that is dealing with more than one public authority—I give you the example of the homewatch scheme in Llanelli, which is supported by the town council, the county council and the police—there is a risk that that voluntary organisations can fall through the gaps? In that case, the public bodies are

Helen Mary Jones: A gytunwch fod perygl, lle mae mudiad gwirfoddol yn ymdrin â mwy nag un awdurdod cyhoeddus—dyna ichi enghraifft y cynllun gwarchod cartrefi yn Llanelli, a gefnogir gan gyngor y dref, y cyngor sir a'r heddlu—fod mudiadau gwirfoddol yn gallu mynd drwy'r rhwyd? Os felly, mae'r cyrff cyhoeddus yn dadlau ynglŷn â phwy ddylai ddarparu sylfaen ar

arguing about who should provide a base for the homework scheme. Do you agree that it would be helpful if compacts in local areas were compatible? In driving forward the Government scheme, will you look to work with local authorities, police authorities and so on to ensure that how they operate their compacts impacts positively on the voluntary organisations, on which we depend so much to deliver many public services?

gyfer y cynllun gwarchod cartrefi. A gytunwch y byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai compactau mewn ardaloedd lleol yn cydweddu? Wrth ichi ddatblygu cynllun y Llywodraeth, a geisiwch weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol, awdurdodau'r heddlu ac ati er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gweithredu eu compactau mewn ffordd sy'n cael effaith gadarnhaol ar y mudiadau gwirfoddol, yr ydym yn dibynnu cymaint arnynt i ddarparu nifer o wasanaethau cyhoeddus?

2.30 p.m.

Edwina Hart: I thank you for that, Helen, because there are difficulties in this area. I will ask the people who are working on the strategic action plan to take that into account. That is one of the issues that can be developed in conjunction with the voluntary sector.

Edwina Hart: Diolch ichi am hynny, Helen, oherwydd mae yna anawsterau yn y maes hwn. Byddaf yn gofyn i bobl sy'n gweithio ar y cynllun gweithredu strategol ystyried hynny. Dyna un o'r materion y gellir eu datblygu mewn cysylltiad â'r sector gwirfoddol.

David Melding: The Finance Minister is pursuing an excellent policy to implement three-year settlements. Do you agree that passing on three-year funding will be an important part of voluntary-sector compacts in future, so that the voluntary sector can develop services in a rational, long-term fashion?

David Melding: Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid yn mynd ar drywydd polisi gwych i weithredu setliadau tair blynedd. A gytunwch y byddai trosglwyddo arian tair blynedd yn rhan bwysig o gytundebau'r sector gwirfoddol yn y dyfodol, fel y gall y sector gwirfoddol ddatblygu gwasanaethau mewn ffordd synhwyrol dros gyfnod hir?

Edwina Hart: I concur with your comments, David. That is something that we have been urging our partners out there to do, to follow our example. It is essential, if we are to allow the voluntary sector to provide its excellent services, that it has certainty of funding.

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau, David. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydym wedi bod yn annog ein partneriaid yno i'w wneud, i ddilyn ein hesiampl ni. Os ydym i ganiatáu i'r sector gwirfoddol ddarparu ei wasanaethau ardderchog, mae'n hanfodol iddo gael sicrwydd ariannu.

Etholaeth Conwy The Conwy Constituency

Q9 Denise Idris Jones: Will the Minister outline Welsh Assembly Government social justice achievements for the Conwy constituency? OAQ0918(SJR)

C9 Denise Idris Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu llwyddiannau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer etholaeth Conwy? OAQ0918(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Conwy benefits from a number of schemes that deliver our social justice and regeneration agenda, for example, through the work of the community safety partnership, the delivery of Communities First across two areas, and regeneration programmes such as the physical

Edwina Hart: Mae Conwy yn elwa o nifer o gynlluniau sy'n cyflawni ein hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio, er enghraifft, drwy waith y bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol, darparu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar draws dwy ardal, a'r rhaglenni adfywio, fel y gronfa adfywio ffisegol a'r

regeneration fund and the two housing renewal areas in your constituency.

Denise Idris Jones: I also welcome the significant difference that projects such as Communities First and the community facilities and activities programme can make, as can measures to promote safer communities, and not just in my Conwy constituency, but throughout Wales. Do you agree that programmes such as Tŷ Llywelyn, the Communities First centre in the Tudno ward of Llandudno that is providing all kinds of help to all from the very young to the very old, the refurbishment of local community buildings, the regeneration of Penmaenmawr and greater action in partnership with the local community to curb anti-social behaviour, as we recently saw in Llandudno Junction, are excellent examples of on-the-ground projects funded through the Assembly that are improving the lives of people in Conwy?

Edwina Hart: You have had excellent partnership arrangements in your constituency with the particular projects that you outlined. It is important to recognise that it was the citizens who decided which projects they wanted to drive through in those areas. Tŷ Llywelyn community centre was established in 2004, and its programmes are so well developed that it provides many training opportunities to the community, and it deals with people almost from cradle to grave in its activities in the constituency. It is important to note that this was led from the base level of the constituents, taking through what they wanted, facilitated by Welsh Assembly Government money.

Brynle Williams: As I am sure you are aware, there is a significant problem in Conwy with regard to social housing for the elderly and the mentally ill. Given that north Wales as a region has less than half the number of elderly psychiatric beds available in other regions, how do you plan to increase sheltered housing provision to meet the needs of the Conwy area's ageing population?

Edwina Hart: This is, primarily, a housing matter for the local authority. I appreciate that you do have particular concerns about

ddwy ardal adnewyddu tai yn eich etholaeth.

Denise Idris Jones: Croesawaf hefyd y gwahaniaeth sylweddol y gall prosiectau fel Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a'r rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol ei wneud, fel y gall mesurau i hyrwyddo cymunedau diogelach, ac nid yn fy etholaeth i yng Nghonwy yn unig, ond ledled Cymru. A gytunwch fod rhaglenni fel Tŷ Llywelyn, y ganolfan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ward Tudno yn Llandudno sy'n rhoi pob math o gymorth i bawb o blant ifanc iawn i bobl hen iawn, adnewyddu adeiladau cymunedau lleol, adfywio Penmaen-mawr a mwy o weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r gymuned leol i reoli ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, fel y gwelsom yng Nghyffordd Llandudno yn ddiweddar, yn enghreifftiau ardderchog o'r prosiectau ar lawr gwlad sy'n cael eu hariannu gan y Cynulliad ac sy'n gwella bywydau pobl yng Nghonwy?

Edwina Hart: Yr ydych wedi cael trefniadau partneriaeth ardderchog yn eich etholaeth gyda'r prosiectau penodol a amlinellwyd gennych. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod mai'r dinasyddion a benderfynodd pa brosiectau yr oeddent am eu rhoi ar waith yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Sefydlwyd canolfan gymunedol Tŷ Llywelyn yn 2004, ac mae ei rhaglenni wedi'u datblygu cystal fel ei bod yn darparu nifer o gyfleoedd hyfforddi i'r gymuned, ac yn delio â phobl o'r crud i'r bedd, bron, yn ei gweithgareddau yn yr etholaeth. Mae'n bwysig sylwi mai'r etholwyr a fu'n gyfrifol am hyn, gan wireddu'r hyn yr oeddent am ei gael, wedi'i hwyluso gan arian Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Brynle Williams: Fel y gwyddoch mae'n siŵr, mae problem sylweddol yng Nghonwy o ran tai cymdeithasol i'r henoed a phobl sydd â salwch meddwl. Gan fod yn y gogledd fel rhanbarth lai na hanner nifer y gwelyau seiciatrig i'r henoed sydd ar gael mewn rhanbarthau eraill, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu cynyddu darpariaeth tai gwarchod er mwyn diwallu anghenion y boblogaeth yn ardal Conwy sy'n heneiddio?

Edwina Hart: Mater tai i'r awdurdod lleol yw hyn, yn bennaf. Sylweddolaf eich bod yn pryderu'n benodol am bobl sydd â salwch

people with a mental illness and how they are looked after. I am happy to take the matter up and find out the exact position for you with regard to what the local authority is currently undertaking and what its proposals are for the future.

Janet Ryder: In Conwy, one organisation that has achieved a great deal in social justice is CAIS, based in Llandudno. One of its projects, the Dawn centre in Colwyn Bay, deals with substance misuse, for which the funding ceases at the end of the year—much of that funding comes from Europe. Unfortunately, impending redundancy notices are due to be sent out. What can you do to support projects, and Dawn specifically, so that those workers are not given notice of redundancy, but are bridged across to the next round of European funding to ensure that we do not lose the work of Dawn in Colwyn Bay?

Edwina Hart: We all appreciate the excellent work that CAIS has done across the piece in several key areas. Obviously, it has to discuss its funding requirements with its other partners in that area. I am mindful of your point, and will discuss it with my officials, but, of course, with regard to funding arrangements, it is a matter of local decisions.

meddwl a sut y gofelir amdanynt. Yr wyf yn fodlon mynd i'r afael â'r mater a cheisio gweld beth yn union yw'r sefyllfa i chi o ran yr hyn y mae'r awdurdod lleol yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, a beth yw ei gynigion ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Janet Ryder: Yng Nghonwy, un sefydliad sydd wedi cyflawni llawer mewn cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yw CAIS, yn Llandudno. Mae un o'i brosiectau, canolfan Dawn ym Mae Colwyn, yn ymdrin â chamddefnyddio sylweddau. Mae'r arian ar ei gyfer yn dod i ben ddiwedd y flwyddyn—daw llawer o'r arian hwnnw o Ewrop. Yn anffodus, mae hysbysiadau diswyddo ar fin cael eu dosbarthu. Beth y gallwch ei wneud i gefnogi prosiectau, a Dawn yn benodol, fel na chaiff y gweithwyr hynny eu diswyddo, ond y cânt eu pontio i'r cylch nesaf o arian Ewropeaidd er mwyn sicrhau na fyddwn yn colli gwaith Dawn ym Mae Colwyn?

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym i gyd yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwaith ardderchog y mae CAIS wedi ei wneud yn gyffredinol mewn llawer ardal allweddol. Yn amlwg, rhaid iddo drafod ei ofynion ariannu gyda'i bartneriaid eraill yn yr ardal honno. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwynt a wnaethoch, a byddaf yn ei drafod gyda'm swyddogion. Ond wrth gwrs, penderfyniadau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am y trefniadau ariannu.

Llwyddiannau yn Abertawe Achievements in Swansea

Q10 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister outline the Welsh Assembly Government's main achievements in the field of social justice and regeneration in Swansea? OAQ0903(SJR)

Edwina Hart: There are so many schemes across the piece, in my portfolio and in others. Of course, you have the community safety partnership, and Communities First across eight areas, and regeneration programmes such as the physical regeneration fund and the housing renewal area, which is particularly successful in Hafod.

Val Lloyd: I will concentrate on Penlan Communities First partnership, which has

C10 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu prif lwyddiannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yn Abertawe? OAQ0903(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Mae yna gynifer o gynlluniau yn gyffredinol, yn fy mhorthffolio i a rhai eraill. Wrth gwrs, dyna i chi'r bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol, a Chymunedau yn Gyntaf mewn wyth ardal, a rhaglenni adfywio fel y gronfa adfywio ffisegol a'r ardal adnewyddu tai, sy'n arbennig o llwyddiannus yn Hafod.

Val Lloyd: Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar bartneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Mhen-

recently organised a Pride in Penlan week, in which residents were encouraged to come together to take part in a clean-up of the area, paying particular attention to the problem of fly-tipping. I took a minor part in the project but was really impressed by the enthusiasm of everyone involved. The coming together of the residents in that project has kindled enthusiasm for further projects in the community. Do you agree that this renewed sense of solidarity and community in what had become a somewhat disaffected locality is to be applauded and that it will allow further positive steps to be taken there?

Edwina Hart: Since the inception of the Communities First plan in Penlan, there has been good progress on the key task to gather baseline information about the community in a good mapping exercise carried out by local people about what they want. The work in the area has taken a totally bottom-up approach, which has given the community confidence to do some of the work that it is now undertaking, which you have outlined. It is important that we allow communities to develop at their own pace and to get some solidarity and pride back in their community. It is amazing what they can all then do.

Janet Davies: Several wards in Swansea have a significant number of children still living in relative poverty. What progress are you making in reducing child poverty in those wards?

Edwina Hart: My Deputy Minister has produced a radical plan, which we have adopted, in terms of how we are going to deal with the child poverty agenda. With those targets, we hope to see improvements. I will see what data are available on the question that you have asked and I will respond to you.

lan, a drefnodd wythnos Pride in Pen-lan yn ddiweddar, pan anogwyd trigolion i ddod at ei gilydd i lanhau'r ardal, gan roi sylw arbennig i broblem tipio anghyfreithlon. Cymerais ran fach yn y prosiect, ond gwnaed argraff arnaf gan frwdfrydedd pawb a gymerodd ran. Mae'r ffaith fod y trigolion wedi cydweithio ar y prosiect hwnnw wedi ennyn brwdfrydedd ar gyfer prosiectau eraill yn yr ardal. A gytunwch y dylid cymeradwyo'r ymdeimlad newydd hwn o undod a chymuned mewn ardal lle yr oedd y trigolion wedi eu dadrithio i ryw raddau, ac y bydd yn caniatáu cymryd camau cadarnhaol pellach yno?

Edwina Hart: Ers dechrau cynllun Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ym Mhen-lan, gwnaed cynnydd da gyda'r dasg allweddol o gasglu gwybodaeth sylfaenol am y gymuned, mewn ymarfer mapio da gan bobl leol am yr hyn yr oeddent am ei gael. Mae'r ardal wedi mabwysiadu dull o'r gwaelod i fyny yn ei gwaith, sydd wedi rhoi hyder i'r gymuned wneud rhywfaint o'r gwaith y mae'n awr yn ymgymryd ag ef, fel yr oeddech yn amlinellu. Mae'n bwysig inni adael i gymunedau ddatblygu yn eu pwysau ac i adfer undod a balchder yn eu cymuned. Mae'n rhyfeddol yr hyn y gallant i gyd ei wneud wedyn.

Janet Davies: Mae gan lawer ward yn Abertawe nifer sylweddol o blant sy'n byw mewn tloidi cymharol o hyd. Pa gynnydd yr ydych yn ei wneud i leihau tloidi plant yn y wardiau hynny?

Edwina Hart: Mae fy Nirprwy Weinidog wedi cynhyrchu cynllun radical yr ydym wedi'i fabwysiadu ynglŷn â sut y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â'r agenda tloidi plant. Gyda'r targedau hynny, gobeithiwn weld gwelliannau. Byddaf yn edrych i weld pa ddata sydd ar gael am y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd gennych, a byddaf yn eich ateb.

Cyffuriau Drugs

Q11 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on post drug rehabilitation services? OAQ0915(SJR)

C11 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau ar gyfer ailsefydlu ar ôl yn gaeth i gyffuriau? OAQ0915(SJR)

Edwina Hart: We are providing funding for

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym yn darparu arian ar

various forms of post drug rehabilitation service, including after-care services, such as relapse prevention, and housing support. We are also working with Progress2work to help ex-substance misusers back into employment, which is an important task.

Jenny Randerson: These services are available to people who self-refer, but only those who have a demonstrable link with the criminal justice system or are leaving structured daycare or residential programmes. In addition, the services provide short interventions only. People needing longer-term or clinical interventions, such as residential rehabilitation or detoxification, are referred on to the community drug and alcohol teams, often with long periods to wait. Do you not think that it is time that we had a more co-ordinated, seamless approach to this serious social problem?

Edwina Hart: We are developing a seamless and co-ordinated approach to this. The substance misuse action fund has increased from £3.3 million in 2002-03, to £22 million in 2009-10, which is an increase of 600-odd per cent. Over 5,500 additional places have been created with the support of SMAF since 2003-04. We now have a drug intervention programme that works well, counselling, assessment, referral, advice and throughcare teams and transitional support schemes. It is even starting to look positive in the area of waiting times. Therefore the work is being done. It is important to recognise that we had a low starting base and that we are now gradually working forward. A lot more work is to be done there and I appreciate that. We have discussions about it in committee. However, that is not to denigrate what has been done, the resource that has been put in and the improvements that have been made.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): I know that the Minister takes this issue seriously, as do I, and I am grateful for the extra money that was found for Rhoserchan, outside Aberystwyth, for drug rehabilitation purposes. Has the

gyfer amrywiol fathau o wasanaethau adsefydlu o'r fath, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau ôl-ofal, fel atal pobl rhag ailddechrau defnyddio cyffuriau, a chymorth tai. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda Chynnydd at Waith i helpu pobl a arferai gamddefnyddio sylweddau i ddychwelyd i waith, sy'n dasg bwysig.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r gwasanaethau hyn ar gael i bobl sy'n hunangyfeirio, ond dim ond i'r rhai sydd â chyswllt amlwg â'r system cyfiawnder troseddol, neu sy'n gadael rhaglenni gofal dydd neu breswyl strwythuredig. Yn ogystal, mae'r gwasanaethau'n darparu ymyriadau byr yn unig. Caiff pobl y mae arnynt angen ymyriadau tymor hwy neu ymyriadau clinigol, fel adsefydlu preswyl neu ddadwenwyno, eu hatgyfeirio i'r timau cyffuriau ac alcohol cymunedol, ac yn aml rhaid iddynt aros am gyfnodau hir. Onid ydych yn credu ei bod yn bryd inni gael dull mwy cydlynol a di-dor ar gyfer y broblem gymdeithasol ddifrifol hon?

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym yn datblygu dull di-dor a chydlynol ar gyfer hyn. Mae'r gronfa gweithredu ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau wedi cynyddu o £3.3 miliwn yn 2002-03, i £22 miliwn yn 2009-10, sy'n gynydd o ryw 600 y cant. Crëwyd dros 5,500 o leoedd ychwanegol gyda chymorth SMAF ers 2003-04. Bellach, mae gennym raglen ymyriadau cyffuriau sy'n gweithio'n dda, timau cynghori, asesu, atgyfeirio, cyngor a gofal drwy'r broses a chynlluniau cymorth trosiannol. Mae hyd yn oed yn dechrau edrych yn gadarnhaol o ran amseroedd aros. Felly, mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo. Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli mai man cychwyn araf oedd gennym a'n bod yn datblygu'n raddol. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud eto ac yr wyf yn sylweddoli hynny. Byddwn yn trafod hynny yn y pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai hynny dynnu oddi ar yr hyn sydd wedi ei wneud, yr adnoddau a fuddsoddiwyd a'r gwelliannau a wnaed.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif, fel yr wyf fi, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr arian ychwanegol a gafwyd ar gyfer Rhoserchan, y tu allan i Aberystwyth, at ddibenion adsefydlu pobl

Minister taken the trouble or made the effort to find out what exactly the problem is and what the pan-Wales position is? There are more people out there who need help who we are perhaps not accessing. Are any figures available? Could the Minister make them available—perhaps not now—to Plenary or committee so that we can be aware of what the problem is in our own areas, because it seems difficult to get those figures?

Edwina Hart: I will see what I can do in terms of the breakdown of figures if that would be helpful. We should be able to do some sort of regional breakdown. I am more than happy to take up the points that you have raised, because it is important that we have a clear picture when we are making policy in this area and to make improvements in policy. I would be happy to report back to committee on that if it would be helpful.

2.40 p.m.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau Questions to the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks

Hyrwyddo Twristiaeth Promoting Tourism

Q1 Sandy Mewies: Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion of tourism in Wales? OAQ1135(EIN)

Q9 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on measures taken to attract tourists to Wales? OAQ1118(EIN)

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): Wales's UK and international marketing campaigns are on course to meet response targets. Further to this, our innovative and world-class marketing campaigns won several awards at the Chartered Institute of Marketing's industry group awards earlier this year.

Sandy Mewies: You will be aware that work has been undertaken to regenerate Holywell, in my Delyn constituency, not least through

sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi trafferthu neu ymdrechu i weld beth yn union yw'r broblem a beth yw'r sefyllfa ledled Cymru? Mae yna ragor o bobl y mae arnynt angen help ac nad ydym o reidrwydd yn eu cyrraedd. A oes unrhyw ffigurau ar gael? A allai'r Gweinidog sicrhau eu bod ar gael—nid yn awr o reidrwydd—ar gyfer y Cyfarfod Llawn neu'r pwyllgor fel y gallwn fod yn ymwybodol o faint y broblem yn ein hardaloedd ein hunain, oherwydd mae'n ymddangos ei bod yn anodd cael hyd i'r ffigurau hynny?

Edwina Hart: Fe wnaif fy ngorau i gael dadansoddiad o'r ffigurau, pe bai hynny o gymorth. Dylai fod yn bosibl inni wneud rhyw fath o ddadansoddiad yn ôl rhanbarth. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i drafod y materion a godwyd gennych, oherwydd mae'n bwysig inni gael darlun clir wrth lunio polisi yn y maes hwn ac wrth wella polisiâu. Byddwn yn fodlon adrodd yn ôl i'r pwyllgor ar hynny pe bai o gymorth.

C1 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo twristiaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ1135(EIN)

C9 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y camau a gymerir i ddenu twristiaid i Gymru? OAQ1118(EIN)

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Mae ymgyrchoedd marchnata Cymru yn y DU ac yn rhyngwladol ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni'r targedau ymateb. At hynny, enillodd ein hymgyrchoedd marchnata arloesol o safon fyd-eang nifer o wobrau yng ngwobrau grŵp diwydiant y Sefydliad Marchnata Siartredig yn gynharach eleni.

Sandy Mewies: Fe wyddoch fod gwaith wedi ei wneud i adfywio Treffynnon, yn fy etholaeth i yn Nelyn, yn and dim drwy'r

the heritage initiative scheme promoted by Flintshire County Council. A part of this is the St Winifred's pilgrims rest project, which is being developed in conjunction with the adjoining development of the Ave Maria hall, which are vital to Holywell as a place of pilgrimage. As I have discussed with you, the project is running into difficulty because work was started before the application was made, which has compromised the availability of a Visit Wales grant. Will you look into this issue as a matter of urgency to see if it can be speedily resolved?

Andrew Davies: Thank you for raising this with me before. I am delighted to say that Holywell is my father's birthplace, but I will look at the issue. As you pointed out, there is a difficulty that, if a project has already started, it compromises the grant application process. However, I will look into the matter.

David Melding: As someone who for many years thought that Ant and Dec was one person, I am not brilliant on popular culture, but *Torchwood* has made Cardiff into a great star—we already had *Dr Who*—and it is attracting many tourists. Cardiff, in general, is appearing in the popularity charts of UK and European cities. It is important that we market Cardiff aggressively to attract more tourists, and, on the back of that, see the links to promoting tourism in Wales in general.

Andrew Davies: Yes, very much so. I was delighted to open BBC Wales's new drama complex in Treforest earlier this year, where much of the *Dr Who* series and the new *Torchwood* series were filmed; I was delighted that I was able to open the Tardis set, and meet Dr Who in person. [Interruption.] I had a sonic screwdriver, which did not actually do anything. I am delighted that *Dr Who* is written by Swansea-born Russell T Davies. The programme has done a great job in terms of promoting Wales, particularly Swansea and Cardiff and the beautiful surrounding countryside, and *Torchwood* is doing the same. The creative industries are important to us, not only in terms of developing Welsh talent, but also as

cynllun menter treftadaeth a hyrwyddir gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint. Mae rhan o hyn yn cynnwys prosiect gorffwysfan y pererinion yn Ffynnon Wenfrewi, sy'n cael ei ddatblygu ar y cyd â datblygu neuadd Ave Maria gerllaw, sy'n hanfodol i Dreffynnon fel man pererindod. Fel yr wyf wedi ei drafod gyda chi eisoes, mae'r prosiect yn wynebu anawsterau oherwydd dechrau'r gwaith cyn gwneud y cais, sydd wedi peryglu'r cyfle o gael grant Croeso Cymru. A allwch ymchwilio i'r mater hwn ar frys i weld a ellir ei ddatrys yn gyflym?

Andrew Davies: Diolch am dynnu fy sylw at hyn yn gynharach. Yr wyf yn falch dweud mai Treffynnon yw pentref genedigol fy nhad, ond byddaf yn ystyried y mater. Fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud, mae'r broses o wneud cais am grant yn cael ei beryglu os bydd prosiect eisoes wedi cychwyn. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn edrych ar y mater.

David Melding: Fel rhywun a oedd yn meddwl mai un person oedd Ant a Dec am flynyddoedd, nid wyf yn arbenigwr ar ddiwylliant poblogaidd, ond mae *Torchwood* wedi rhoi delwedd ardderchog i Gaerdydd—yr oedd gennym *Dr Who* eisoes—ac mae'n denu llawer o dwristiaid. Yn gyffredinol, mae Caerdydd yn ymddangos yn siartiau poblogeiddrwydd dinasoedd y DU ac Ewrop. Mae'n bwysig inni farchnata Caerdydd yn angerddol er mwyn denu mwy o dwristiaid, ac yn sgîl hynny weld y cysylltiadau i hyrwyddo twristiaeth yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol.

Andrew Davies: Yn wir. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o agor adeilad drama newydd BBC Cymru yn Nhrefforest yn gynharach eleni, lle y ffilmwyd llawer o'r gyfres *Dr Who* a'r gyfres newydd *Torchwood*; yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o gael agor y set Tardis, a chyfarfod â Dr Who ei hun. [Torri ar draws.] Yr oedd gennyf dynsgriw sonig, nad oedd yn gwneud dim mewn gwirionedd. Yr wyf yn falch iawn fod Dr Who wedi'i ysgrifennu gan Russell T Davies a aned yn Abertawe. Mae'r rhaglen wedi gwneud gwaith gwyach yn hyrwyddo Cymru, yn enwedig Abertawe a Chaerdydd a'r wlad hyfryd o amgylch, ac mae *Torchwood* yn gwneud yr un peth. Mae'r diwydiannau creadigol yn bwysig inni, nid yn unig o ran datblygu talent Cymru, ond hefyd

a way of promoting all that is best about Wales. I have been in discussions with all the broadcasters in Wales, as well as the independent television producers, to get as much of the filming of Welsh products as possible done in Wales.

Elin Jones: Dosbarthwyd y daflen dwristiaeth hon mewn ambell bapur Sul yn ddiweddar. Mae'n daflen yn eich enw chi, ac mae'n daflen ddigon effeithiol gyda llun hyfryd o fadarch ar ei blaen. Y broblem gyda'r daflen yw mai dim ond cyfeiriadau a safleoedd gwe ar gyfer pum ardal yng Nghymru sydd ynddi. Mae busnesau yn fy ardal i, yng Ngheredigion, yn siomedig tu hwnt nad oes cyfeiriad a modd i gysylltu â Cheredigion ynddi, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod busnesau yn sir Gaerfyrddin a Chaerdydd, nad ydynt chwaith yn rhan o'r daflen, yn llawn mor siomedig. A gytunwch na ddylai taflen genedlaethol fel hon i hyrwyddo twristiaeth yng Nghymru ymddangos os yw'n dangos ffafriaeth at bum ardal yn unig ar draul ardaloedd eraill?

Andrew Davies: I will look at that particular leaflet and the issue. In terms of marketing Wales, no part of Wales is left unconsidered in terms of our support for local businesses. We fund local marketing campaigns through the four regional tourism partnerships, and we promote all parts of Wales globally. In our promotion of the Ryder Cup in 2010, we are ensuring that we promote Wales as a destination for golf, for example. In terms of ensuring that all golf courses in Wales that wish to take part in a Team Wales approach can do so, in terms of promoting golf tourism, we are promoting all parts of Wales and I think that we have been successful in doing so. However, on that particular issue, I will ask officials to look at the leaflet.

Lisa Francis: Given that the Wales Tourism Alliance conference is being held this weekend, I am sure that you will have gummied up on hospitality matters—that is the voice of the British Hospitality Association—in readiness for the conference. You may well have read Bob Cotton's article about the damage that he feels a UK bed tax would do to the industry. Can you give your

fel ffordd i hyrwyddo popeth sy'n dda am Gymru. Yr wyf wedi bod yn trafod gyda'r holl ddarlledwyr yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'r cynhyrchwyr teledu annibynnol, i sicrhau y caiff cymaint â phosibl o waith ffilmio cynnyrch Cymru ei wneud yng Nghymru.

Elin Jones: This tourism leaflet was distributed recently in a number of Sunday newspapers. It appears in your name, and it is quite an effective leaflet, with a wonderful picture of a mushroom on the front. The problem with the leaflet is that it provides addresses and website details for only five areas in Wales. Businesses in my constituency, in Ceredigion, are extremely disappointed that no contact addresses for Ceredigion are included, and I am sure that businesses in Carmarthenshire and Cardiff, which are also absent, are equally disappointed. Do you agree that a national leaflet such as this, with the aim of promoting tourism in Wales, should not appear if it promotes only five areas in Wales, at the expense of other areas?

Andrew Davies: Byddaf yn edrych ar y daflen benodol honno ac ar y rhifyn. O ran marchnata Cymru, ni chaiff unrhyw ran o Gymru ei diystyru yn ein cymorth i fusnesau lleol. Yr ydym yn ariannu ymgyrchoedd marchnata lleol drwy'r pedair partneriaeth dwristiaeth ranbarthol, ac yn hyrwyddo pob rhan o Gymru'n fyd-eang. Wrth hyrwyddo Cwpan Ryder yn 2010, yr ydym yn sicrhau ein bod yn hyrwyddo Cymru fel man i chwarae golff, er enghraifft. O ran sicrhau bod pob cwrs golff yng Nghymru sydd am fod yn rhan o Dîm Cymru yn gallu gwneud hynny, o ran hyrwyddo twristiaeth golff, yr ydym yn hyrwyddo pob rhan o Gymru a chredaf ein bod wedi llwyddo wrth wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, ar y mater penodol hwnnw, byddaf yn gofyn i swyddogion edrych ar y daflen.

Lisa Francis: O gofio bod cynhadledd Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru yn cael ei chynnal y penwythnos yma, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn hyddysg iawn mewn materion lletygarwch—hynny yw, llais Cymdeithas Lletygarwch Prydain—yn barod ar gyfer y gynhadledd. Efallai eich bod wedi darllen erthygl Bob Cotton am y niwed y mae'n credu y byddai treth gwely yn ei wneud i'r

unequivocal assurance today to the Assembly and to the delegates who will be attending the conference that there will be no such bed tax in Wales?

Andrew Davies: I am delighted to welcome the Wales Tourism Alliance conference to one of the iconic destinations in Wales, namely the new National Waterfront Museum, on Sunday. I will be speaking to the conference on Sunday night. I recently had a meeting with the British Hospitality Association, which Bob Cotton attended. I do not know when he wrote the article to which you refer, but I made it clear in my meeting with him and his representatives, which included representatives of the BHA and WTA from north Wales, that there are no plans to introduce a bed tax in Wales. It has come about as part of the review of local government commissioned by the UK Government. My understanding is that it does not form part of the final proposals to the UK Government, and it is certainly not relevant in Wales where we make our own decisions. The Finance Minister and I have made it clear that we have no plans to introduce such a tax.

diwydiant yn y DU. A allwch roi sicrwydd clir heddiw i'r Cynulliad a'r cynrychiolwyr a fydd yn mynychu'r gynhadledd na chaiff treth gwely o'r fath ei chyflwyno yng Nghymru?

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf yn falch o groesawu cynhadledd Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru i un o leoliadau eiconig Cymru, sef Amgueddfa Genedlaethol newydd y Glannau, ddydd Sul. Byddaf yn siarad yn y gynhadledd nos Sul. Cefais gyfarfod â Chymdeithas Lletygarwch Prydain yn ddiweddar, ac yr oedd Bob Cotton hefyd yn bresennol. Ni wn pryd yr ysgrifennodd yr erthygl yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ati, ond gwnaeth yn glir yn fy nghyfarfod gydag ef a'i gynrychiolwyr, a oedd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o BHA a WTA o'r gogledd, nad oes cynlluniau o gwbl i gyflwyno treth gwely yng Nghymru. Daeth hyn i fodolaeth fel rhan o'r adolygiad o lywodraeth leol a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, nid yw'n rhan o'r cynigion terfynol a gaiff eu cyflwyno i Lywodraeth y DU, ac yn sicr, nid yw'n berthnasol i Gymru lle'r ydym yn gwneud ein penderfyniadau ein hunain. Mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid a minnau wedi gwneud yn glir nad oes gennym gynlluniau o gwbl i gyflwyno treth o'r fath.

Rhoi Cyllid yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar Waith The Implementation of European Union Funding

C2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am roi cyllid yr UE ar waith yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr? OAQ1104(EIN)

Andrew Davies: My department collects information at local partnership level. As of 31 July 2006, £49 million of Objective 1 funding had been committed to 89 local Carmarthenshire projects. This represents a total project investment of £151 million. Additionally, over 50 per cent of funding is delivered through non-local partnerships that cover the Objective 1 area.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolch am nodi'r prosiectau hynny, Weinidog. Hoffwn longyfarch y bobl leol sydd wedi sicrhau buddsoddiad sylweddol o arian strwythurol yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr ac yng

Q2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on the implementation of EU funding in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr? OAQ1104(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Mae fy adran yn casglu gwybodaeth ar lefel partneriaethau lleol. Ar 31 Gorffennaf 2006, yr oedd £49 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 wedi'i ymrwymo i 89 o brosiectau lleol yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae hyn yn cynrychioli cyfanswm buddsoddi o £151 miliwn mewn prosiectau. Yn ogystal, darperir dros 50 y cant o'r arian drwy bartneriaethau nad ydynt yn bartneriaethau lleol ac sy'n cwmpasu'r ardal Amcan 1.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you for noting those projects, Minister. I wish to congratulate the local people who have obtained substantial investment of structural funds in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr and

ngweddill sir Caerfyrddin, a'r cyngor sir, sy'n rhan o'r bartneriaeth leol. O gofio'r newidiadau fydd yn dod i law o ran yr arian fydd ar gael yn fuan a'r ffaith y bydd cyfle i fuddsoddi mewn is-strwythurau, a fydd prosiectau megis y prosiect ffordd osgoi ger Llandeilo y mae'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol ohono, neu'r prosiect i ymdrin â'r broblem gyda'r bont yn Abergorlech ac ati, yn rhai y gellid cael cyllid strwythurol ar eu cyfer?

Andrew Davies: We made it very clear that, in terms of the convergence programme, there will be a shift, which is a European Commission requirement in line with EU policies, and an increasing move towards the Lisbon agenda. There will, therefore, be an increasing emphasis on innovation, research and development skills, and developing people's skills. It is clear that less money will be available for infrastructure. Nevertheless, there will be an element in the priorities regarding improving infrastructure. It will also be a matter for local partnerships to make those decisions or to come forward with proposals. However, they have to be in line with the emerging Wales transport strategy and the emerging regional transport plans. In this case, the South West Wales Integrated Transport Consortium would work with the local authorities in that area and other stakeholders to decide what are the transport infrastructure priorities that they wish to see funded. Therefore, it will be a mixture of deciding what the national and the regional priorities are, but there is scope for Carmarthenshire County Council, or any other local authority, in conjunction with us, to come forward with proposals for their local areas.

Glyn Davies: The rural development plan, which is due to come into force promptly on 1 January, is hugely important to the economy of Carmarthen East and Dinefwr. I have been reading about difficulties between the European Commission and the European Parliament that may delay the start. What discussions are you having, particularly with your Cabinet colleagues—and I know that the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside will be closely involved with this—to ensure that this agreement is sorted out in Europe and that the rural development plan can come into force promptly, on 1

throughout Carmarthenshire, and the county council, which is part of the local partnership. Given the changes that will take place in terms of the money available soon and the fact that there will be an opportunity to invest in infrastructures, will structural funding be available for projects such as the bypass for Llandeilo, which the Minister is aware of, or the project to deal with the problem at Abergorlech bridge, and so on?

Andrew Davies: Gwnaethom yn glir iawn, o ran y rhaglen gydgyfeirio, y bydd symudiad, sy'n un o ofynion y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn unol â pholisïau'r UE, a symudiad cynyddol tuag at agenda Lisbon. Felly, bydd pwyslais cynyddol yn cael ei roi ar arloesedd, ymchwil a sgiliau datblygu, ac ar ddatblygu sgiliau pobl. Mae'n amlwg y bydd llai o arian ar gael ar gyfer seilwaith. Er hynny, bydd gwella seilwaith yn elfen yn y blaenoriaethau. Partneriaethau lleol hefyd fydd yn gyfrifol am wneud y penderfyniadau hynny neu am gyflwyno cynigion. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddynt gyd-fynd â strategaeth drafndiaeth Cymru sy'n cael ei datblygu a'r cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol sy'n cael eu datblygu. Yn yr achos hwn, byddai Consortiwm Trafnidiaeth Integredig De Orllewin Cymru yn cydweithio ag awdurdodau lleol yn yr ardal honno a rhanddeiliaid eraill i benderfynu ar y blaenoriaethau y byddent am weld eu hariannu o ran seilwaith trafndiaeth. Felly, bydd yn gymysgedd o benderfynu beth yw'r blaenoriaethau cenedlaethol a'r rhai rhanbarthol, ond bydd cyfle i Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, neu unrhyw awdurdod lleol arall, mewn cydweithrediad â ni, gyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer eu hardaloedd lleol.

Glyn Davies: Mae'r cynllun datblygu gwledig y disgwylir iddo ddod i rym yn ddiwed ar 1 Ionawr yn eithriadol o bwysig i economi Dwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr. Yr wyf wedi bod yn darllen am yr anawsterau rhwng y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a Senedd Ewrop a allai arwain at oedi cyn dechrau'r cynllun. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael, gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet yn arbennig—a gwn y bydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn ymwneud yn agos â hyn—i sicrhau bod y cytundeb hwn yn cael ei ddatrys yn Ewrop ac y gall y cynllun datblygu gwledig ddod i rym

January?

yn brydlon, ar 1 Ionawr?

2.50 p.m.

Andrew Davies: I had a meeting on Monday with one of the leading commission officials, Graham Meadows, who is head of DG Regio. This is one of the issues that he raised, and I was able to assure him that, certainly from our end, irrespective of what happens at a European level—in terms of the delivery of the convergence programme, for example, and the rural development plan on the other hand—we are as one on that and that the programmes will be integrated. We have had several discussions at Cabinet level about how to do that. This does not concern only my portfolio; it involves all my Cabinet colleagues. For example, it involves Edwina Hart, with regard to regeneration, and Jane Davidson, with regard to skills and education. That work has been ongoing for some time, so once we are given the green light at a European level, I am sure that the delivery of the respective programmes will be far more integrated than they are under the current programmes.

Andrew Davies: Cefais gyfarfod ddydd Llun gydag un o brif swyddogion y comisiwn, Graham Meadows, sy'n bennaeth DG Regio. Yr oedd hwn yn un o'r materion a gododd, ac yr oeddwn yn gallu rhoi sicrwydd iddo, yn sicr o'n hochr ni, waeth beth fydd yn digwydd ar lefel Ewropeaidd—o ran darparu'r rhaglen gydgyfeirio, er enghraifft, a'r cynllun datblygu gwledig ar y llaw arall—ein bod yn gytûn ar hynny ac y bydd y rhaglenni'n cael eu hintegreiddio. Yr ydym wedi cael llawer trafodaeth ar lefel y Cabinet ynglŷn â sut i wneud hynny. Mae hyn yn ymwneud nid yn unig â'm portffolio i; mae pob un o'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet yn ymwneud ag ef. Er enghraifft, mae'n ymwneud ag Edwina Hart, o ran adfywio, a Jane Davidson, o ran sgiliau ac addysg. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo ers cryn amser, felly, pan gawn ganiatâd i fwrw ati ar lefel Ewropeaidd, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y broses o ddarparu'r rhaglenni priodol lawer yn fwy integredig nag o dan y rhaglenni cyfredol.

Canolfan Gynadledda Ryngwladol International Conference Centre

Q3 Owen John Thomas: What recent discussions has the Minister had with relevant stakeholders regarding the establishment of an international conference centre in Cardiff? OAQ1121(EIN)

C3 Owen John Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda rhanddeiliaid perthnasol ynghylch sefydlu canolfan gynadledda ryngwladol yng Nghaerdydd? OAQ1121(EIN)

Andrew Davies: This project is led by Cardiff council, and my department continues to support and work with the local authority to explore options for potential sites and funding for an international conference centre in Cardiff.

Andrew Davies: Arweinir y prosiect hwn gan gyngor Caerdydd, ac mae fy adran yn dal i gynorthwyo a gweithio gyda'r awdurdod lleol i archwilio dewisiadau o ran safleoedd a chyllid posibl ar gyfer canolfan gynadledda ryngwladol yng Nghaerdydd.

Owen John Thomas: Cardiff has a reputation for successfully hosting big sporting and musical events, but the city needs to increase the facilities to attract a wider range of events. By seeking to establish an international conference centre, the city would generate a more constant flow of business to boost its economy. What are you doing to create extra incentives to help the city do that?

Owen John Thomas: Mae gan Gaerdydd enw da am lwyfannu digwyddiadau chwaraeon a cherddorol mawr yn llwyddiannus, ond mae angen i'r ddinas gynyddu'r cyfleusterau sydd ar gael i ddenu amrywiaeth ehangach o ddigwyddiadau. Drwy geisio sefydlu canolfan gynadledda ryngwladol, byddai'r ddinas yn creu llif busnes mwy cyson a fyddai'n hwb i'w heconomi. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i greu

cymhellion ychwanegol i helpu'r ddinas i wneud hynny?

Andrew Davies: As I said, it is a local authority matter in the first instance, but it is also a matter for the private sector. If such a conference centre were to be built, it would have to be economically and financially sustainable. I have said on many occasions that such projects cannot be funded purely from the public purse, and, in this case, it must be private-sector led. I have discussed it with the British Hospitality Association and the Wales Tourism Alliance, as well as with the local authority. It is a local-authority-led project, and my department is supporting it in taking the proposal forward. However, we need to see the business case for the longer term.

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais, mater i'r awdurdod lleol yw hynny yn y lle cyntaf, ond mae'n fater hefyd i'r sector preifat. Pe bai canolfan gynadledda o'r fath yn cael ei hadeiladu, byddai'n rhaid iddi fod yn gynaliadwy yn economaidd ac yn ariannol. Yr wyf wedi dweud droeon na ellir ariannu prosiectau o'r fath drwy arian cyhoeddus yn unig, ac yn yr achos hwn rhaid i'r prosiect gael ei arwain gan y sector preifat. Yr wyf wedi trafod y mater gyda Chymdeithas Lletygarwch Prydain a Chynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru, yn ogystal â'r awdurdod lleol. Prosiect a arweinir gan yr awdurdod lleol ydyw, ac y mae fy adran yn ei gefnogi wrth ddatblygu'r cynnig. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni weld yr achos busnes ar gyfer y tymor hwy.

Jenny Randerson: All the possible sites for such a conference centre are in my constituency, and it is true that only larger cities, such as Cardiff, could sustain an international conference centre because of the hotel bed requirements. However, it is the case that we are a whole nation without an international conference centre, and this is therefore of importance well beyond Cardiff. The example of Birmingham shows that, although it is very important for the whole region's prosperity, it has revenue implications. I am pleased to hear about your conversations with the council in Cardiff, but will you give a commitment that the Welsh Assembly Government will take a long-term and whole-nation view of the importance of such a centre for Wales as a whole?

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r holl safleoedd posibl ar gyfer canolfan gynadledda o'r fath yn fy etholaeth i, ac mae'n wir mai dim ond dinasoedd mwy o faint, fel Caerdydd, a allai gynnal canolfan gynadledda ryngwladol oherwydd y gofynion o ran gwelyau gwesty. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn genedl gyfan heb ganolfan gynadledda ryngwladol, ac felly mae'r mater hwn yn bwysig ymhell y tu hwnt i Gaerdydd. Er bod y datblygiad yn bwysig iawn i ffyniant y rhanbarth cyfan, dengys enghraifft Birmingham bod goblygiadau hefyd o ran cyllid. Yr wyf yn falch clywed am eich trafodaethau gyda'r cyngor yng Nghaerdydd, ond a wnewch chi addo y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystyried pwysigrwydd canolfan o'r fath i Gymru gyfan dros gyfnod hir ac i'r genedl gyfan?

Andrew Davies: Yes. As I indicated in my response to Owen John Thomas, we are engaged with the local authority and others in taking this work forward. However, I stand by what I said earlier: any proposal must wash its face commercially and cannot be dependent on public funding for its long-term sustainability. As a Government, we would need reassurance before we even looked at any issue to do with funding from us, and certainly from my department.

Andrew Davies: Gwnaf. Fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i Owen John Thomas, yr ydym yn ymgysylltu â'r awdurdod lleol ac eraill i fynd â'r gwaith hwn yn ei flaen. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn cadw at yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach: rhaid i unrhyw gynig fod yn gadarn yn fasnachol ac ni all ddibynnu ar arian cyhoeddus i fod yn gynaliadwy dros gyfnod hir. Fel Llywodraeth, byddai angen inni gael sicrwydd cyn inni hyd yn oed ystyried unrhyw fater yn ymwneud ag ariannu gennym ni, ac yn sicr gan fy adran i.

David Melding: I commend your attitude,

David Melding: Hoffwn ganmol eich

because the concept must be coherent. The local authority, with the private sector, must come forward with a robust business plan. However, it is true that our ambition should know no bounds now, given the great success of the Millennium Stadium and the growth of premier hotels in Cardiff. It is certainly an idea that the Welsh Assembly Government can encourage, but it is one on which it perhaps cannot lead, if it is to be successful in the long term in providing a facility that would really be used and that would be a credit to Wales and to Cardiff.

Andrew Davies: I welcome the support for the approach being taken, because it is a point that needs to be reinforced. We have many examples of projects that, on the face of it, looked very attractive, but which were not financially and economically sustainable in the long term. Clearly, that is what we must consider in making a serious examination of such a proposal. I am not prepared for my department—and I am sure that I also speak for the Government—to fund a project that is not financially sustainable in the long term.

agwedd, oherwydd rhaid i'r cysyniad fod yn rhesymegol. Rhaid i'r awdurdod lleol, gyda'r sector preifat, gyflwyno cynllun busnes cadarn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir na ddylem roi unrhyw gyfyngiadau ar ein huchelgais yn awr, o gofio llwyddiant mawr Stadiwm y Mileniwm a thwf gwestai o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n bendant yn syniad y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei annog. Ond efallai nad yw'n syniad y gallwn ei arwain, os ydym am iddo lwyddo yn yr hirdymor i ddarparu cyfleuster a fyddai'n cael ei ddefnyddio'n wirioneddol ac yn glod i Gymru ac i Gaerdydd.

Andrew Davies: Croesawaf y gefnogaeth i'r ymagwedd sy'n cael ei chymryd, oherwydd mae'n bwynt y mae angen ei atgyfnerthu. Mae gennym nifer o enghreifftiau o brosiectau a oedd yn edrych yn atyniadol ar y cychwyn ond nad oeddent yn gynaliadwy yn y pen draw, yn ariannol nac yn economaidd. Yn amlwg, dyna y mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried wrth archwilio cynnig o'r fath o ddifrif. Nid wyf yn fodlon i'm hadran i—ac yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod hefyd yn siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth—ariannu prosiect nad yw'n gynaliadwy yn ariannol yn y pen draw.

Datblygiad Economaidd Economic Development

Q4 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's plans for economic development in Torfaen? OAQ1072(EIN)

Andrew Davies: 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' sets out the Assembly Government's agenda for economic development across Wales. The Assembly Government will continue to work with the local borough council to take forward the regeneration strategy for Torfaen. Examples of projects include the Springboard Innovation Centre at Llantarnam Park and the revitalisation of Pontypool town centre.

William Graham: You will be aware of today's announcement of job losses at TRW Automotive in Pontypool and Arvin Meritor in Cwmbran. What assistance will you provide to these employees, particularly TRW staff who have been made compulsory redundant? These job losses can be traced

C4 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yn Nhor-faen? OAQ1072(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Mae 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffyfnu' yn gosod allan agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer datblygu economaidd ledled Cymru. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i weithio gyda'r cyngor bwrdeistref lleol i ddatblygu'r strategaeth adfywio ar gyfer Tor-faen. Ymhlith yr enghreifftiau o brosiectau mae'r Ganolfan Arloesedd ym Mharc Llantarnam a'r gwaith i adfywio canolfan tref Pont-y-pŵl.

William Graham: Fe fyddwch yn ymwybodol o'r cyhoeddiad heddiw ynglŷn â'r colledion swyddi yn TRW Automotive ym Mhont-y-pŵl ac Arvin Meritor yng Nghwmbrân. Pa gymorth fyddwch yn ei roi i'r gweithwyr hyn, yn enwedig i staff TRW sydd wedi'u diswyddo'n orfodol? Gellir

directly to your employment policies.

Andrew Davies: I met with the local Assembly Member, Lynne Neagle, yesterday and earlier today to talk about this issue. Clearly, I am disappointed by the news of the TRW Automotive redundancies. However, as I told Lynne, we will stand ready to help those affected if the employees and the company wish that we do so.

When companies announce redundancies, in some cases they will wish to make their own arrangements in handling those redundancies, while in others they ask for Team Wales to be involved. As I said to Lynne earlier today, we will give every assistance to those employees who are affected, in terms of finding alternative work, seeking training, or maybe assisting a change in career direction. However, the resources are there. As the company is situated within an Objective 1 area, the employees will also be eligible for support through the ReACT programme, through which additional resources can be offered to new employers to take on those affected by the redundancy.

Therefore, I hope that I can give assurance to those affected that, disappointing though this news is, the Government stands ready to help them in any way that it can.

Lynne Neagle: As you know, TRW Automotive has a proud record as a local manufacturer in Pontypool and the plant is vital for the future of the local economy. I have been in regular contact with union representatives since learning of the job losses yesterday, and I spoke to the plant manager this morning. There is, naturally, a deep sense of dismay at this news. I know that your officials have been in weekly contact with TRW Automotive over recent months and that much valuable support has already been provided to keep the company in Pontypool, but can you give a commitment today that every possible support will be offered to the local workforce in finding alternative employment and supporting them at this difficult time, and also, importantly, to consolidate the long-term future of TRW

olrhain y colledion swyddi hyn yn uniongyrchol i'ch polisiau cyflogaeth.

Andrew Davies: Cefais gyfarfod gydag Aelod lleol y Cynulliad, Lynne Neagle, ddoe ac yn gynharach heddiw i drafod y mater hwn. Yn amlwg, yr wyf yn siomedig iawn gyda'r newyddion am y colli swyddi yn TRW Automotive. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrth Lynne, byddwn yn barod i helpu'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt os bydd y gweithwyr a'r cwmni yn dymuno i ni wneud hynny.

Pan fydd cwmnïau'n cyhoeddi diswyddiadau, byddant am wneud eu trefniadau eu hunain i ddelio â'r diswyddiadau hynny mewn rhai achosion, a bydd eraill yn gofyn i Dîm Cymru ddod i mewn. Fel y dywedais wrth Lynne yn gynharach heddiw, byddwn yn rhoi pob cymorth posibl i'r gweithwyr hynny yr effeithir arnynt, o ran cael gwaith arall, chwilio am hyfforddiant neu eu cynorthwyo i newid gyrfa. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adnoddau ar gael. Gan fod y cwmni mewn ardal Amcan 1, bydd y gweithwyr hefyd yn gymwys i gael cymorth drwy'r rhaglen ReACT. Gellir cynnig adnoddau ychwanegol drwyddi er mwyn i gyflogwyr newydd allu cyflogi'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt gan y diswyddiadau.

Felly, er bod y newyddion hyn yn siomedig iawn, gobeithio y gallaf roi sicrwydd i'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt fod y Llywodraeth yn barod i'w helpu mewn unrhyw ffordd sy'n bosibl.

Lynne Neagle: Fel y gwyddoch, mae gan TRW Automotive record dda fel gweithgynhyrchwr lleol ym Mhont-y-pŵl ac mae'r gwaith yn hanfodol i ddyfodol yr economi leol. Yr wyf wedi bod yn cysylltu'n gyson â chynrychiolwyr yr undeb ers imi glywed am y colledion ddoe, a siaradais â rheolwr y gwaith y bore yma. Yn naturiol, mae yna siom anferth am y newyddion hyn. Gwn fod eich swyddogion wedi bod mewn cysylltiad bob wythnos â TRW Automotive dros y misoedd diwethaf a bod llawer o gymorth gwerthfawr eisoes wedi'i roi i gadw'r cwmni ym Mhont-y-pŵl. Ond a allwch roi ymrwymiad heddiw y bydd pob cymorth posibl yn cael ei roi i'r gweithlu lleol i gael gwaith arall ac i'w cefnogi yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn, a hefyd, yn bwysig iawn, i atgyfnerthu dyfodol hirdymor

Automotive in Pontypool?

Andrew Davies: As I have just said, I am more than happy to give that assurance. We have had a long-term relationship with TRW Automotive; we have supported the company financially through regional selective assistance. As you remember, you, Paul Murphy, the local Member of Parliament, and I met company representatives, together with Amicus representatives, in September 2005 to consider what we could do, as a Government, to help the company. Obviously, I am disappointed to hear of the news of the redundancies, but it is my understanding that the American parent company has said that, for the short to medium term, there is a sustainable future for the plant in Torfaen. We will do everything that we can to help existing employees as well as those affected by this disappointing news, as I said to William Graham.

Michael German: You will know now that the automotive sector in Wales is suffering badly. Unfortunately, job losses in the order of 100 are now quite commonplace. A total of 125 job losses at TRW Automotive were announced yesterday, which are on top of the 156 job losses there that were announced in August 2005. Also, 420 jobs are going at Continental Teves UK Ltd, situated between Tredegar and Ebbw Vale, and 256 jobs are going at Cooper Standard Automotive Ltd in Maesteg. That means that over 1,000 automotive jobs will have been lost in the best part of a year and a half. We are rightly proud of the whole sector that supports the automotive industry in Wales. Will you, through your Accelerate Wales programme, undertake a full audit of the manufacturing sector in relation to the automotive industry so that we can understand and know the direction that this is now taking and not just wait and be reactive, but make some decisions and movements in terms of the difficulties that this particular sector is now facing?

3.00 p.m.

Andrew Davies: You are quite right, Mike; the automotive sector is of huge importance to Wales. Around 26,000 people work in the

TRW Automotive ym Mhont-y-pŵl?

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw. Mae gennym berthynas faith â TRW Automotive; yr ydym wedi cynorthwyo'r cwmni yn ariannol drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Fel y cofiwch, cawsoch chi, Paul Murphy, yr Aelod Seneddol lleol a minnau gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y cwmni, ynghyd â chynrychiolwyr Amicus, ym mis Medi 2005 i ystyried beth y gallem ei wneud, fel Llywodraeth, i helpu'r cwmni. Wrth gwrs, yr wyf yn siomedig i glywed y newyddion am y diswyddiadau, ond yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae'r rhiant-gwmni yn America wedi dweud bod dyfodol cynaliadwy i'r gwaith yn Nhor-faen dros gyfnod byr i ganolig. Byddwn yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i helpu'r gweithwyr presennol ynghyd â'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt gan y newyddion siomedig hyn, fel y dywedais wrth William Graham.

Michael German: Fe wyddoch yn awr fod y sector cerbydau modur yng Nghymru yn dioddef yn wael. Yn anffodus, mae achosion o golli tua 100 o swyddi yn ddigon cyffredin. Cyhoeddwyd ddoe fod cyfanswm o 125 o swyddi i gael eu colli yn TRW Automotive, y ychwanegol at y 156 o golli swyddi a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Awst 2005. Hefyd, mae 420 o swyddi i gael eu colli yn Continental Teves UK Ltd, rhwng Tredegar a Glynebwy, a 256 o swyddi yn Cooper Standard Automotive Ltd ym Maesteg. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd dros 1,000 o swyddi wedi eu colli yn y sector moduro mewn blwyddyn a hanner. Yr ydym yn iawn i ymfalchio yn yr holl sector sy'n ategu'r diwydiant moduro yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi, drwy eich rhaglen Accelerate Cymru, gynnal archwiliad llawn o'r sector gweithgynhyrchu mewn perthynas â'r diwydiant moduro fel y gallwn ddeall a bod yn ymwybodol o'r cyfeiriad y mae hwn yn symud, a pheidio ag aros ac ymateb yn unig, ond gwneud rhai penderfyniadau a symudiadau ynglŷn â'r anawsterau sy'n wynebu'r sector penodol hwn yn awr?

Andrew Davies: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, Mike; mae'r sector moduro yn bwysig iawn i Gymru. Mae tua 26,000 o bobl yn gweithio

sector and this issue was raised this morning when I met with the Engineering Employers' Federation at a seminar that it was holding at the Waterton technology centre next to the Ford plant in Bridgend. I was talking with them and the Welsh Automotive Forum about this issue. Through the forum, we have a good relationship with the sector in identifying the challenges faced. You mentioned one of the programmes that we fund, Accelerate Wales, which has been successful in helping companies. For example, faced with the MG Rover closure, it helped it to diversify its customer base. So, whether in terms of supply chain management or skills training, we are working closely with the sector in identifying ways not only to help it to survive, but also to thrive.

Through the work of International Business Wales, I am also aware that many companies in the automotive sector are actively seeking to invest in Wales. Should those deals come to fruition, we will be able to build on the current strength in the sector here in Wales.

yn y sector, a chodwyd y mater hwn y bore yma pan gyfarfûm â Ffederasiwn y Cyflogwyr Peirianeg mewn seminar ganddo yng nghanolfan dechnoleg Waterton ger safle Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Siaradais â'r Ffederasiwn a chyda Fforwm Modurol Cymru am y mater hwn. Drwy gyfrwng y fforwm, mae gennym berthynas dda â'r sector wrth nodi'r heriau a wynebir. Soniech am un o'r rhaglenni a ariannwn, sef Accelerate Cymru, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus i helpu cwmnïau. Er enghraifft, yn wyneb cau safle MG Rover, bu'n gymorth i amrywio ei sylfaen cwsmeriaid. Felly, boed o ran rheoli'r gadwyn gyflenwi neu ddarparu hyfforddiant sgiliau, yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r sector i nodi ffyrdd nid yn unig i'w helpu i gadw i fynd, ond hefyd i ffynnu.

Drwy waith Busnes Rhyngwladol Cymru, gwn hefyd fod nifer o gwmnïau yn y sector modurol yn chwilio am gyfleoedd i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru. Os bydd hyn yn dwyn ffrwyth, byddwn yn gallu adeiladu ar gryfder presennol y sector yma yng Nghymru.

Cludo Nwyddau ar Reilffyrdd yn Hytrach nag ar Ffyrdd Shifting Freight from Road to Rail

C5 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynigion i gludo nwyddau ar reilffyrdd yn hytrach nag ar ffyrdd yng Nghymru? OAQ1097(EIN)

Andrew Davies: The Assembly Government is supportive of achieving a shift from road to rail, where environmental benefits can be achieved. The Assembly Government's freight facilities grant scheme helps to meet the extra costs that may be associated with moving freight by rail.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn falch fod gwaith yn cael ei wneud i hyrwyddo symud o gario nwyddau ar y ffyrdd i'w cario ar y rheilffyrdd. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol mai'r tro diwethaf i ni gael gwasanaeth cynhwysfawr i gario nwyddau o Gaerdybi oedd yn yr 1980au ac nid oes fawr ddim wedi digwydd i ailgyflwyno'r gwasanaeth ers hynny. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r angen am fuddsoddiad

Q5 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Will the Minister make a statement on proposals to shift freight from road to rail in Wales? OAQ1097(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi cludo nwyddau ar reilffyrdd yn hytrach nag ar ffyrdd, lle y gellir sicrhau manteision amgylcheddol. Mae'r cynllun grant cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn helpu talu'r costau ychwanegol a all fod yn gysylltiedig â chludo nwyddau ar reilffyrdd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am pleased that work is being done to promote the shift from carrying freight by road, to carrying it by rail. I am sure the Minister is aware that the last time we had a comprehensive service to carry freight from Holyhead was in the 1980s, and not much has happened since then as regards reintroducing the service. The Minister will be aware of the need for enormous investment in the track across north Wales if

enfawr yn y trac ar hyd y gogledd er mwyn ailgyflwyno cludo nwyddau. Mae hefyd yn ymwybodol bod rheilffordd y gogledd yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith Ewropeaidd, TERN, sef y Trans-European Rail Network. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi gwybodaeth i ni am faint o waith y mae ef a'i swyddogion wedi ei wneud gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol i weld a oes arian Ewropeaidd ar gael i wella'r trac hwnnw, yn ogystal ag arian preifat ac arian gan Network Rail? Pe gallem ailgyflwyno nwyddau ar y llinell honno, byddai'n gymorth mawr i'r broses o leihau nwyon gwenwynig.

Andrew Davies: We see that as a big opportunity, and I raised this issue with Noel Dempsey, the Minister for Communications, Marine and Natural Resources in the Irish Government, when I was in Dublin recently for the Ryder Cup. We discussed what we could do to help the movement of goods and people from what is the most dynamic economy in the EU to many of the markets in the rest of Europe. Holyhead is of crucial importance, which is one reason why I agreed to support the Objective 1 bid for the new Stena berth at Holyhead, for the new superferry, the Stena Adventurer. We have worked with Stena, Network Rail and with the North Wales Transport Consortium, TAITH, to consider ways of enhancing capacity in the Holyhead and the north Wales corridor. That work is ongoing, and is part of the work that I have initiated in developing the Wales freight strategy—which will be out for consultation early next year—and the work done through the Wales transport strategy on the development of regional transport plans, in this case, with the TAITH consortium.

Janice Gregory: As well as the obvious environmental and congestion-reducing benefits of shifting freight from road to rail, there is arguably another important benefit, namely road safety. You may be aware that a recent article in the north Wales *Daily Post* reported that up to a startling 80 per cent of lorries spot-checked on their way to Holyhead had defects, 91 of which were deemed to be such a serious threat to road safety that they were immediately taken off the road. While we need further action to

we are to reintroduce rail freight. He is also aware that the railway in north Wales forms part of the Trans-European Rail Network. Will the Minister give us information on how much work he and his officials have done with the United Kingdom Government to see whether European money is available to make those track improvements, in addition to private money and money from Network Rail? If we could reintroduce freight on that line, it would be of great benefit in reducing noxious gases.

Andrew Davies: Ystyriwn fod hyn yn gyfle mawr, a chodais y mater hwn gyda Noel Dempsey, y Gweinidog dros Gyfathrebu, Adnoddau Morol ac Adnoddau Naturiol Llywodraeth Iwerddon, pan oeddwn yn Nulyn yn ddiweddar ar gyfer y Cwpan Ryder. Buom yn trafod yr hyn y gallem ei wneud i helpu symud nwyddau a phobl o'r economi fwyaf ddeinamig yn yr UE i lawer o'r marchnadoedd yng ngweddill Ewrop. Mae Caerdybi yn hollbwysig, sy'n un o'r rhesymau pam y cytunais i gefnogi'r cynnig Amcan 1 ar gyfer angorfa newydd i Stena yng Nghaerdybi, ar gyfer y llong fferi fawr newydd, Stena Adventurer. Yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda Stena, Network Rail a chyda Chonsortium Trafnidiaeth Gogledd Cymru, TAITH, i ystyried ffyrdd i gynyddu'r gallu yng nghoridor Caerdybi a'r gogledd. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn mynd rhagddo, ac mae'n rhan o'r gwaith yr wyf wedi ei gychwyn wrth ddatblygu'r strategaeth cludo nwyddau ar gyfer Cymru—a fydd yn destun ymgynghori ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf—a'r gwaith a wnaed drwy strategaeth trafndiaeth Cymru ar ddatblygu cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol, gyda chonsortium TAITH.

Janice Gregory: Yn ogystal â'r manteision amlwg i'r amgylchedd a lleihau tagfeydd a fyddai'n deillio o gludo nwyddau ar reilffyrdd yn hytrach nag ar ffyrdd, gellir dadlau bod mantais bwysig arall, sef diogelwch ar y ffyrdd. Efallai eich bod yn gwybod am yr erthygl yn ddiweddar yn rhifyn y gogledd o'r *Daily Post* a ddywedodd fod gan hyd at 80 y cant o'r lorïau a archwiliwyd ar hap ar eu ffordd i Gaerdybi yn ddiffygiol, sy'n ffigur rhyfeddol. Roedd 91 ohonynt yn achosi bygythiad mor ddiffrifol

tackle this problem, I urge you to keep road-safety issues in mind when examining the advantages of switching freight from road to rail.

Andrew Davies: We are trying to get a modal shift from road to rail not only for environmental reasons but also because of the pressure that it takes off our roads and the implications of that for road safety. The figures that you have read out illustrate how important it is that we have a high standard in the road-safety performance of freight road haulage companies. The best companies are committed to that, and they do not want cowboy operators undercutting what they regard to be safe operations. We are also committed to that, and, as I said earlier, the freight facilities grant is one tool that we can use to do that. We use it in a range of projects in Wales, most notably with the Sims Group's metal-recycling plant in Newport docks, which has taken a significant number of lorries off the road, by carrying freight by rail. These issues are crucial to environmental and road-safety issues, and so we are committed to them.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): I am in agreement with Janice Gregory's point on road safety. That is a significant factor, certainly in mid Wales, where there has been a successful trial of transporting timber on the Cambrian main line, taking traffic off the notoriously dangerous A44. What efforts are being made to get more freight on that line, recognising the environmental benefits as well as the important health and safety issue? Put simply, rail is far safer than road.

Andrew Davies: We are one of the only parts of the UK—if not the only part—that is still able to provide the freight facilities grant, which has been significant in helping to make that modal shift from road to rail. We have some 2 per cent of the UK's rail network in Wales but we already carry, I

fel y bu'n rhaid eu cymryd oddi ar y ffordd yn syth. Er bod angen cymryd camau pellach i ymdrin â'r broblem hon, fe'ch anogaf i gadw materion yn ymwneud â diogelwch ar y ffyrdd mewn cof wrth archwilio'r manteision o gludo nwyddau ar reilffyrdd yn hytrach nag ar ffyrdd.

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau newid dull o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd, nid yn unig am resymau amgylcheddol ond hefyd oherwydd bod hynny'n lleihau'r pwysau ar ein ffyrdd a goblygiadau hynny o ran diogelwch ar y ffyrdd. Mae'r ffigurau a gyflwynwyd gennych yn dangos mor bwysig yw sicrhau bod gennym safon uchel o ran perfformiad cwmnïau cludo nwyddau mewn perthynas â diogelwch ar y ffyrdd. Mae'r cwmnïau gorau wedi ymrwymo i hynny, ac nid ydynt am weld cwmnïau sydd heb eu cofrestru yn tanseilio'r hyn a ystyriant yn weithrediadau diogel. Yr ydym ni hefyd wedi ymrwymo i hynny, ac fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae'r grant cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau yn un ffordd i wneud hynny. Fe'i defnyddiwn mewn amrywiaeth o brosiectau yng Nghymru, yn fwyaf penodol gyda safle ailgylchu metel Grŵp Sims yn nociau Casnewydd, sydd wedi cymryd nifer sylweddol o lorïau oddi ar y ffyrdd drwy gludo nwyddau ar reilffyrdd. Mae'r materion hyn yn hanfodol o ran yr amgylchedd a diogelwch ar y ffyrdd, ac felly yr ydym wedi ymrwymo iddynt.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Cytunaf â Janice Gregory ynghylch diogelwch ar y ffyrdd. Mae hynny'n ffactor sylweddol, yn enwedig yn y canolbarth, lle cafwyd prawf llwyddiannus i gludo pren ar hyd prif linell Cambria, gan gymryd traffig oddi ar yr A44 sy'n enwog o beryglus. Pa ymdrechion a wneir i gludo mwy o nwyddau ar y llinell honno, gan gydnabod y manteision amgylcheddol yn ogystal â mater pwysig iechyd a diogelwch? Yn syml, mae'r rheilffordd lawer yn fwy diogel na'r ffordd.

Andrew Davies: Ni yw un o'r unig rannau o'r DU—os nad yr unig ran—a all ddarparu'r grant cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau o hyd, sydd wedi bod yn arwyddocaol i helpu sicrhau'r newid dull hwnnw o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Tua 2 y cant o rwydwaith rheilffyrdd y DU sydd yng Nghymru, ond yr

believe, some 10 per cent of the total freight on the UK network. Therefore, you could say that we are already performing above our network and population contribution. There is still scope to improve, and the point that you raised about mid Wales was well made. We raised the matter with the train operating companies, particularly EWS, to see what we could do to help to significantly increase that modal shift.

John Griffiths: Would you agree that if we are to make this key shift from road to rail to further sustainable transport, we will rely in part on our key partners to help in those endeavours? One key partner that certainly is not helping at the moment is First Great Western. Its proposed cuts to commuter services from Severn tunnel junction to Bristol Temple Meads will probably have the effect of forcing commuters into their cars when they want to remain travelling by rail. Do you agree that these cuts are against our sustainable transport policies, and that First Great Western is not listening to its customers, who have formed an action group to campaign against those cuts?

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is about freight, although I do have an interest in hearing the answer.

Andrew Davies: What First Great Western is proposing is, frankly, unacceptable. It has unacceptable implications for commuters from south-east Wales to Bristol, with the cut from a half hourly to an hourly service at peak periods. It is unacceptable that the 3.15 p.m. service from London Paddington will terminate at Cardiff and will not go on to Swansea and west Wales. It is also unacceptable that restaurant cars will be taken off some of the services between London Paddington and south Wales, purely to reduce the weight of the trains so that they are lighter and can accelerate quicker, which is to avoid First Great Western being penalised on its performance.

I have said as much to First Great Western when it was consulting on the timetable

ydyd eisoes, mi gredaf, yn cludo tua 10 y cant o gyfanswm y nwyddau ar rwydwaith y DU. Felly, gallech ddweud ein bod eisoes yn perfformio'n well na cyfraniad o ran y rhwydwaith a'r boblogaeth. Mae lle i wella o hyd, ac yr oedd gennyhych bwynt da ynghylch y canolbarth. Codwyd y mater gyda'r cwmnïau gweithredu trenau, yn enwedig EWS, i weld beth y gallem ei wneud i helpu cynyddu'r newid dull hwnnw'n sylweddol.

John Griffiths: A fydddech yn cytuno, os ydym i sicrhau'r newid dull hwn o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd i ddatblygu cludiant cynaliadwy, y byddwn yn dibynnu'n rhannol ar ein partneriaid allweddol i helpu gyda'r ymdrechion hynny? Un partner allweddol nad yw yn sicr yn helpu ar hyn o bryd yw First Great Western. Bydd y toriadau a arfaethir ganddo yn y gwasanaethau i gymudwyr o gyffordd twnnel Hafren i Bristol Temple Meads fwy na thebyg yn gorfodi cymudwyr i ddefnyddio'u ceir pan fyddant am barhau i deithio ar y trê. A gytunwch fod y toriadau hyn yn mynd yn groes i'n polisiau cludiant cynaliadwy, ac nad yw First Great Western yn gwrandao ar ei gwsmeriaid, sydd wedi sefydlu grŵp gweithredu i ymgyrchu yn erbyn y toriadau hynny?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â chludo nwyddau, er bod gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed yr ateb.

Andrew Davies: Mae'r hyn y mae First Great Western yn ei gynnig yn gwbl annerbyniol. Mae iddo oblygiadau annerbyniol i gymudwyr o dde-ddwyrain Cymru i Fryste, drwy newid o wasanaeth bob hanner awr i wasanaeth bob awr yn ystod oriau brig. Mae'n annerbyniol y bydd y gwasanaeth 3.15 p.m. o orsaf Paddington Llundain yn gorffen yng Nghaerdydd ac na fydd yn mynd ymlaen i Abertawe a'r gorllewin. Mae hefyd yn annerbyniol y bydd rhai cerbydau bwyty yn diflannu ar rai o'r gwasanaethau rhwng gorsaf Paddington Llundain a de Cymru, dim ond er mwyn lleihau pwysau'r trenau i'w gwneud yn ysgafnach ac yn abl i gyflymu ynghynt. Diben hynny yw atal First Great Western rhag cael ei gosbi am ei berfformiad.

Yr wyf wedi dweud hynny wrth First Great Western pan oedd yn ymgynghori ar yr

earlier this year. I made the strongest possible representations to the company in my meeting: to Moir Lockhead, the managing director of FirstGroup plc, Alison Forster, the managing director of First Great Western, and to the chair of the company, Chay Blyth. Unfortunately, my representations and protests were not taken on board by First Great Western. I have also made strong representations to the Secretary of State for Transport at the Department for Transport. I remind you that First Great Western operates a UK franchise, not an English franchise.

3.10 p.m.

Brynle Williams: It is pleasing to hear the Minister speak of looking to reinforce the line in north Wales, as we are all well aware that 85 per cent, I believe, of all the heavy goods in north Wales go straight through to mainland Europe.

Another major concern, as Janet and several others have mentioned, is safety. One thing that we badly need in north Wales—though this is possibly outside the remit of your portfolio—is a sensible truck stop, where many of these trucks can park up when they are expected to run out of time. However, we also need some sort of cabotage on lorries coming in off the continent, because most of the heavy goods offenders are continental or Irish trucks that have no insurance. What is happening is endless, but they pay nothing and contribute nothing to the upkeep of the road. Therefore, the sooner we get them on the line, the better. I hope that you will pursue the reinforcing of this line vigorously.

Andrew Davies: I will take that issue up, and write to you with a response.

amserlen yn gynharach eleni. Cyflwynais y sylwadau cryfaf posibl i'r cwmni yn fy nghyfarfod: i Moir Lockhead, rheolwr-gyfarwyddwr FirstGroup plc, Alison Forster, rheolwr-gyfarwyddwr First Great Western, a chadeirydd y cwmni, Chay Blyth. Yn anffodus, nid ystyriwyd fy sylwadau na'm protestiadau gan First Great Western. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyflwyno sylwadau cryf i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth yn yr Adran Drafnidiaeth. Fe'ch atgoffaf mai masnachfrait ar gyfer y DU y mae First Great Western yn ei gweithredu, nid masnachfrait ar gyfer Lloegr.

Brynle Williams: Mae'n galonogol clywed y Gweinidog yn sôn am atgyfnerthu'r llinell yn y gogledd, oherwydd fel y gwyddom bob un, mi gredaf, mae 85 y cant o'r holl nwyddau trwm yn y gogledd yn mynd yn syth i dir mawr Ewrop.

Pryder mawr arall, fel y mae Janet a llawer Aelod arall wedi'i grybwyll, yw diogelwch. Un peth y mae ei angen yn ddifffwr yn y gogledd—er bod hyn y tu allan i gyloch gwaith eich portffolio, hwyrach—yw man synhwyrol i'r lorïau hyn barcio pan ddisgwylir y byddant yn rhedeg allan o amser. Fodd bynnag, mae angen gweithredu rhyw fath o fasnach arforol hefyd ar gyfer lorïau o'r cyfandir, oherwydd mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r troseddwy'r yn gerbydau nwyddau trwm o'r cyfandir neu Iwerddon sydd heb yswiriant. Mae'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn ddi-ddiwedd. Nid ydynt yn talu dim nac yn cyfrannu dim at gynnal a chadw'r ffyrdd. Felly, gorau oll po gynharaf y cludir nwyddau ar y rheilffyrdd. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ceisio atgyfnerthu'r llinell hon yn rymus.

Andrew Davies: Byddaf yn ystyried y mater hwnnw, ac ysgrifennaf atoch gydag ymateb.

Lleihau Gollyngiadau Carbon Reducing Carbon Emissions

Q6 Christine Gwyther: What action is the Minister taking to encourage businesses across Wales to reduce carbon emissions? OAQ1132(EIN)

C6 Christine Gwyther: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i annog busnesau ledled Cymru i ollwng llai o garbon? OAQ1132(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Effectively managing carbon should be a primary issue for businesses. We work closely with a variety of partners to implement energy efficiency measures and environmental best practices. The Carbon Trust, for example, which I fund from my department, helped to identify annual savings of 263,000 tonnes in carbon emissions during 2005-06.

Christine Gwyther: The activities that businesses undertake hugely affect their carbon footprint, as do the activities that they do not undertake. On Monday, I launched an initiative in Carmarthen to do with waste management and how businesses could affect their bottom line by better waste management. It was called GRP, and it looked at waste as an opportunity rather than as a threat. Therefore, will you join me in commending the good work that it is doing?

Andrew Davies: Yes, very much so. The Stern report, which came out last week, clearly said that there are huge economic costs as well as environmental costs to bear in not addressing global warming. We are committed to that agenda in Wales. It is also the case that there are economic opportunities for companies to reduce their energy consumption. Only a year or so ago, when I was awarding the level 5 Green Dragon awards to Sony and Transco, I made the point that a green business is a good business. Any business that can reduce its costs through reducing energy or its raw materials not only affects its bottom line in reducing costs, but also reduces its environmental impact. Therefore, the more we can get that message out, the more we can get companies to sign up to that agenda, and then Wales will be a greener and more prosperous country.

Alun Cairns: The Stern report sent a strong message to business and Governments on the need for policy change. What early conclusions have you drawn from such a report, and what actions do you propose to take in investigating how the Welsh Assembly Government can play a role in helping to deliver some of the recommendations?

Andrew Davies: Dylai rheoli carbon mewn ffordd effeithiol fod yn brif fater i fusnesau. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gydag amrywiaeth o bartneriaid i weithredu mesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni ac arferion amgylcheddol da. Mae'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon, er enghraifft, sy'n cael ei hariannu gan fy adran, wedi helpu nodi arbedion blynyddol o 263,000 tonnell o ollyngiadau carbon yn ystod 2005-06.

Christine Gwyther: Mae'r gweithgareddau gan fusnesau yn cael effaith enfawr ar eu hól-troed carbon, fel y mae'r gweithgareddau nad ydynt yn eu gwneud. Ddydd Llun, lansiais fenter yng Nghaerfyrddin yn ymwneud â rheoli gwastraff a sut y gallai busnesau effeithio ar eu gwaelodlin drwy reoli gwastraff yn well. Fe'i galwyd yn GRP, ac yr oedd yn edrych ar wastraff fel cyfle yn hytrach na bygythiad. Felly, a wnewch ymuno â mi i ganmol y gwaith da y mae'n ei wneud?

Andrew Davies: Gwnaf, yn bendant. Dywedai adroddiad Stern, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, yn glir fod costau economaidd enfawr yn ogystal â chostau amgylcheddol yn gysylltiedig â pheidio â mynd i'r afael â chynhesu byd-eang. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i'r agenda honno yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd yn wir fod cyfleoedd economaidd i gwmnïau ddefnyddio llai o ynni. Cwta flwyddyn yn ôl, pan oeddwn yn cyflwyno gwobrau lefel pump y Ddraig Werdd i Sony a Transco, tanlinellais fod busnes gwyrdd yn fusnes da. Mae unrhyw fusnes a all leihau ei gostau drwy leihau ynni neu ei ddeunyddiau crai nid yn unig yn effeithio ar ei waelodlin, ond mae hefyd yn lleihau ei effaith amgylcheddol. Felly, drwy gyfleu'r neges honno'n gryfach, gallwn gael mwy o gwmnïau i ddilyn yr agenda honno, ac yna bydd Cymru'n wlad fwy gwyrdd a mwy ffyniannus.

Alun Cairns: Yr oedd adroddiad Stern yn cyfleu neges gref i fusnesau a Llywodraethau am yr angen am newid polisi. Pa gasgliadau cynnar a wnaed gennych o adroddiad felly, a pha gamau gweithredu a gynigiwch i ymchwilio i'r ffordd y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru chwarae rhan yn y gwaith o helpu cyflawni rhai o'r argymhellion?

Andrew Davies: You are right that the Stern report, to which I just referred, is a groundbreaking piece of work. It shows clearly the costs of the current unsustainable course of action, both environmentally and economically. I have argued for a long time that there are real opportunities for us in Wales given our commitment to sustainable development, because we want to ensure that companies are more energy efficient, and that we reduce our environmental and carbon footprints. There are opportunities in terms of energy efficiency, and I was delighted to announce the investment by G24i recently in Cardiff, with its new generation of solar cells. There are also waste management companies, such as TyreGenics in Baglan, which recycles tyres using liquid nitrogen. That is helping to recycle a product that, again, has been notoriously difficult to recycle in the past, and then that by-product can be used for a range of applications. There are real economic opportunities for us in Wales to reduce our carbon footprint and also to open up new opportunities in technology and processes.

Alun Cairns: I accept that there are opportunities, but it seems as if we are talking the talk, but not walking the walk. Do you accept that, under Labour, carbon dioxide emissions have risen in five of the last eight years and, furthermore, do you accept that Wales is the only country in the United Kingdom where carbon dioxide emissions are currently rising? Is this not confirmation that the policies that you have introduced are failing, despite the sustainability duty in the Government of Wales Act 1998?

Andrew Davies: You have to take into account our economic and industrial history. Compared with other parts of the UK, heavy industry, such as Corus and the metal industries, makes up a much higher proportion of our economy. That is one reason perhaps why our carbon dioxide emissions have not reduced by as much as we may have planned. However, if we look, for example, at the investment that is now being undertaken by RWE npower at the Aberthaw power station, with the installation of flue gas

Andrew Davies: Yr ydych yn hollol iawn fod adroddiad Stern yr wyf newydd gyfeirio ato yn waith arloesol. Dengys yn glir gostau'r camau gweithredu anghynaliadwy presennol, yn amgylcheddol ac yn economaidd. Yr wyf wedi dadlau ers amser maith fod cyfleoedd gwirioneddol inni yng Nghymru o gofio'n hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, oherwydd yr ydym am sicrhau bod cwmnïau'n fwy effeithlon o ran ynni, a'n bod yn lleihau ein hól-troed amgylcheddol a charbon. Mae yna gyfleoedd o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni, ac yr oedd yn bleser gennyf gyhoeddi'r buddsoddiad gan G24i yn ddiweddar yng Nghaerdydd, gyda'i genhedlaeth newydd o gelloedd solar. Mae yna hefyd gwmnïau rheoli gwastraff, megis TyreGenics ym Maglan, sy'n ailgylchu teiers gan ddefnyddio nitrogen hylif. Mae hyn yn helpu ailgylchu cynnyrch sydd, unwaith eto, wedi bod yn anodd ei ailgylchu yn y gorffennol. Yna gellir defnyddio'r isgynnyrch hwnnw at amrywiol ddibenion. Mae cyfleoedd economaidd gwirioneddol inni yng Nghymru i leihau ein hól-troed carbon ac i greu cyfleoedd newydd hefyd ym meysydd technoleg a phrosesau.

Alun Cairns: Derbyniaf fod yna gyfleoedd, ond mae'n ymddangos ein bod yn siarad heb weithredu. A dderbyniwch, o dan Lafur, fod swm y carbon deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau wedi codi mewn pump o'r wyth mlynedd diwethaf, ac at hynny, a dderbyniwch mai Cymru yw'r unig wlad yn y Deyrnas Unedig lle mae swm y carbon deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau yn codi ar hyn o bryd? Onid cadarnhad yw hyn fod y polisiau yr ydych wedi eu cyflwyno yn methu, er y ddyletswydd cynaliadwyedd sydd yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998?

Andrew Davies: Rhaid ichi ystyried ein hanes economaidd a diwydiannol. O'n cymharu â rhannau eraill o'r DU, mae diwydiant trwm, megis Corus a'r diwydiannau metel, yn gyfrifol am gyfran lawer uwch o'n heconomi. Dyna un rheswm efallai pam nad yw'r carbon deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau wedi gostwng cymaint ag y byddem wedi ei fwriadu, hwyrach. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwn, er enghraifft, ar y buddsoddiad ar hyn o bryd gan RWE npower yng ngorsaf bŵer Aberddawan, drwy osod

desulphurisation, that will have a significant effect on reducing sulphur dioxide emissions. We are aware of our statutory duty, and, given our commitment to renewable energy and the roll-out of green energy technologies, over the next decades, Wales will be at the forefront in reducing our carbon footprint.

Lorraine Barrett: Will you join me in congratulating Paramount Office Interiors Ltd in St Mellons, which has just opened its new, green and virtually carbon-neutral offices and headquarters on a rundown estate? Do you agree that this is surely the way forward for new buildings in Wales, whether in the private or public sector?

Andrew Davies: I commend Paramount on that development. As a Government, we are committed, in developing our estate, to buildings that reduce our carbon footprint. With our new Assembly Government estate in Merthyr, north Wales and mid Wales, we are trying to achieve, wherever possible, a Building Research Establishment environmental assessment method excellent standard in relation to environmental sustainability.

Kirsty Williams: To return to the issue of carbon dioxide emissions, Alun Cairns is right to say that they are rising across the sectors, whether you look at the energy industry, the manufacturing industry, construction, or at other industrial processes. It is a worrying trend. Given the nature of the economy in Wales, we have many small businesses that may find it difficult to access help, advice and resources to address the problems that they may have in adopting policies to enable them to cut down on their emissions. Can you outline what you are doing to help small businesses to take on this agenda?

Andrew Davies: We are able to offer support to companies through a wide range of support programmes, primarily through the Carbon Trust, which, as I said earlier, I partly fund through my department. That has helped a significant number of companies to identify energy savings. For example, in 2005-06, the Carbon Trust helped Welsh both private and public sector organisations to identify

offer dad-sylffyrn nwy fflw, bydd hynny'n cael effaith sylweddol ar ostwng y sylffwr deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'n dyletswydd statudol, ac o gofio ein hymrwymiad i ynni adnewyddadwy a chyflwyno technolegau ynni gwyrdd, bydd Cymru, dros y degawdau nesaf, ar y blaen wrth leihau ein hól-troed carbon.

Lorraine Barrett: A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Paramount Office Interiors Ltd yn Llaneirwg, sydd newydd agor ei swyddfeydd a'i bencadlys newydd gwyrdd sydd bron yn garbon-niwtral ar ystad ddiffffaith? A gytnwch mai dyma'r ffordd ymlaen yn sicr ar gyfer adeiladau newydd yng Nghymru, boed yn y sector preifat neu gyhoeddus?

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo Paramount am y datblygiad hwnnw. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo, wrth ddatblygu ein hystad, i godi adeiladau sy'n lleihau ein hól-troed carbon. Gydag adeiladau newydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ym Merthyr, y gogledd a'r canolbarth, yr ydym lle mae'n bosibl, yn ceisio sicrhau safon ragorol yn null asesu amgylcheddol y Sefydliad Ymchwil Adeiladau ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol.

Kirsty Williams: I ddychwelyd at faint o garbon deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau, mae Alun Cairns yn iawn i ddweud ei fod yn codi ar draws y sectorau, boed yn y diwydiant ynni, y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, adeiladu, neu brosesau diwydiannol eraill. Mae'n duedd sy'n peri gofid. O gofio natur yr economi yng Nghymru, mae gennym nifer o fusnesau bach sy'n ei chael yn anodd cael cymorth, cyngor ac adnoddau i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a all fod ganddynt wrth fabwysiadu polisïau i'w galluogi i ryddhau llai o garbon deuocsid. A allwch amlinellu'r hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud i helpu busnesau bach i fabwysiadu'r agenda hon?

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn gallu cynnig cymorth i gwmnïau drwy ystod eang o raglenni cymorth, yn bennaf drwy'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon, sydd, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yn cael ei hariannu'n rhannol drwy fy adran i. Mae hynny wedi helpu nifer sylweddol o gwmnïau i nodi arbedion ynni. Er enghraifft, yn 2005-06, helpodd yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon

potential annual cost savings in the order of £21 million, equating to 263,000 tonnes of carbon dioxide emissions. Therefore, there has been significant achievement in that regard. I have been in discussions with a subsidiary of the Carbon Trust to develop a future programme that will be primarily focused on the private sector and the small and medium-sized enterprises sector, helping them to reduce their carbon footprints.

Kirsty Williams: How does that square with the views of the Federation of Small Businesses, which, in responding to a consultation exercise over the summer, identified the lack of opportunities for them? With the exception of the low-carbon buildings programme capital grant, it could identify little help for the businesses that it represents to get to grips with this. It knows that small businesses would like to do it, but they often need additional help, expertise and advice, because the main job of small companies is to survive rather than to look at complex grant systems and try to find the right type of advice.

3.20 p.m.

Andrew Davies: It may be that we need to look at our communication systems to ensure that companies represented by the Federation of Small Businesses, or any other small and medium-sized enterprises, are able to access the advice that they require. There are programmes, such as the business and environment support programme, which are a part of my department. There are also Carbon Trust and Energy Saving Trust activities, and a whole range of programmes that are available to help small companies. However, given the point that you made about the Federation of Small Businesses, I will certainly ask my officials to follow that up and identify where the problems may lie.

sefydliadau yn y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus yng Nghymru i nodi arbedion cost blynyddol posibl o rwy £21 miliwn, sy'n cyfateb i ryddhau 263,000 o dunelli o garbon deuocsid. Felly, mae llawer wedi ei wneud yn hynny o beth. Yr wyf wedi bod yn trafod gydag un o is-gwmnïau'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon i ddatblygu rhaglen yn y dyfodol a fydd yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar y sector preifat a'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig, i'w helpu i leihau eu hól-troed carbon.

Kirsty Williams: Sut mae hynny'n cyd-fynd â safbwyntiau'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, a soniodd, wrth ymateb i ymarfer ymgynghori dros yr haf, am y prinder cyfleoedd iddynt? Ac eithrio grant cyfalaf y rhaglen adeiladau carbon isel, prin oedd y cymorth y gallai ei nodi i helpu'r busnesau bach y mae'n eu cynrychioli i fynd i'r afael â hyn. Gŵyr y byddai busnesau yn hoffi gwneud hyn, ond mae angen help, arbenigedd a chymorth ychwanegol arnynt yn aml gan mai prif swydd cwmnïau bach yw dal i fynd yn hytrach nag edrych ar systemau grant cymhleth a cheisio cael y math cywir o gyngor.

Andrew Davies: Efallai fod angen inni edrych ar ein systemau cyfathrebu i sicrhau y gall cwmnïau a gynrychiolir gan y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, neu unrhyw fusnesau bach a chanolig eraill, gael ar y cyngor y mae arnynt ei angen. Mae rhaglenni ar gael, megis rhaglen cymorth busnes a'r amgylchedd, sy'n rhan o'm hadran. Mae yna weithgareddau gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni hefyd, ac amrywiaeth helaeth o raglenni sydd ar gael i helpu cwmnïau bach. Fodd bynnag, o gofio'r pwynt a wnaed gennych ynghylch y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, byddaf yn sicrhau yn gofyn i'm swyddogion ymchwilio i hynny a nodi ble all y problemau fod.

Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru The Wales Screen Commission

Q7 Eleanor Burnham: What representations has the Minister made concerning the future of the Wales Screen Commission? OAQ1130(EIN)

C7 Eleanor Burnham: Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u gwneud ar ddyfodol Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru? OAQ1130(EIN)

Andrew Davies: I have restructured the Wales Screen Commission based on sound business needs to deliver enhanced business efficiency and the best possible outputs for Wales. This, together with the re-appointment of the creative industries advisory panel—renamed the creative business panel—and a focused Creative Business Wales team, provides a solid platform for good progress.

Eleanor Burnham: That is interesting, Minister; however, that is not the news that I have heard from concerned people in my region, north Wales, who have been involved with some innovative ideas, such as the Welsh film trail, and who will lose their jobs. I have had much correspondence from all kinds of people who are dismayed at the underhanded way in which they are being dealt with. It does not seem to me that there are sound business reasons for this decision and I am concerned that you are throwing out the baby with the bath water. I have even received a letter from someone who has a bed-and-breakfast business that is thriving on the back of what the Welsh film trail can offer. I do not believe that you are doing your best on this, Minister, and I would like you to reconsider, particularly given that existing staff have been treated shabbily and will lose their jobs in north-west Wales.

Andrew Davies: We have restructured business support through a wide range of approaches. The previous Economic Development and Transport Committee and the current Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee, as well as the Welsh Affairs Select Committee, have identified that there is too much public sector business support in Wales and that it needs to be rationalised. I felt strongly that that was the case with what we are doing in supporting the film industry. You say how important the north Wales office of the commission has been, but I would like to point out that the work of the commission is to identify film locations and add value to the film industry and the Welsh economy. Of the £8 million that came to the Welsh economy this year as a result of filming, only £16,000 was generated in north Wales. If you have fewer film crews on the ground, you require fewer Government resources to support them. The

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf wedi ailstrwythuro Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru ar sail anghenion busnes cadarn i sicrhau gwell effeithlonrwydd busnes a'r canlyniadau gorau posibl i Gymru. Mae hyn, ynghyd ag ailbenodi'r panel cyngori diwydiannau creadigol—sydd wedi ei ailenwi'n banel busnes creadigol—a thîm ymroddedig Busnes Creadigol Cymru, yn darparu llwyfan gadarn ar gyfer cynnydd da.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae hynny'n ddiddorol, Weinidog. Ond nid dyna'r newyddion a glywais gan bobl sy'n gofidio yn fy ardal i, sef y gogledd, sydd wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â rhai syniadau arloesol, megis llwybr ffilmiau Cymru, ac a fydd yn colli eu swyddi. Cefais lawer o ohebiaeth gan bob math o bobl sy'n gresynu at y ffordd lechwraidd y maent yn cael eu trin. Hyd y gwelaf, nid oes rhesymau busnes cadarn dros y penderfyniad hwn, ac yr wyf yn pryderu eich bod yn cadw'r brych ac yn lluchio'r babi. Yr wyf hyd yn oed wedi cael llythyr gan rywun sydd â busnes gwely a brecwast sy'n ffynnu ar gefn yr hyn y gall llwybr ffilmiau Cymru ei gynnig. Ni chredaf eich bod yn gwneud eich gorau yn hyn, Weinidog, a hoffwn i chi ailystyried, yn arbennig o gofio bod staff presennol wedi cael eu trin yn wael ac y byddant yn colli eu swyddi yn y gogledd-orllewin.

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym wedi ailstrwythuro cymorth busnes drwy ystod eang o ddulliau. Mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth blaenorol a'r Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau presennol, yn ogystal â'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig, wedi nodi bod gormod o gymorth busnes yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a bod angen iddo gael ei symleiddio. Yr oeddwn yn teimlo'n gryf fod hynny'n wir am yr hyn a wnawn i gefnogi'r diwydiant ffilm. Yr ydych yn dweud bod swyddfa'r comisiwn yn y gogledd wedi bod yn bwysig, ond hoffwn egluro mai gwaith y comisiwn yw nodi lleoliadau ffilm ac ychwanegu gwerth i'r diwydiant ffilm ac economi Cymru. O'r £8 miliwn a ddaeth i economi Cymru eleni o ganlyniad i ffilmio, dim ond £16,000 a oedd wedi ei gynhyrchu yn y gogledd. Os oes gennych lai o griwiau ffilm ar waith, mae angen llai o adnoddau'r Llywodraeth arnoch i'w cefnogi. Gally mater

matter is open to review, but I think that we need to look at how the new system beds down, to ensure that taxpayers' money goes to where it can add most value.

Alun Ffred Jones: Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydych bob amser yn dweud eich bod yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar sail tystiolaeth, ond un peth a fu'n absennol o'r broses hon yw ymgynghori. Ni fu unrhyw ymgynghori gyda'r staff presennol na chyda'r bobl a fu'n gyfrifol am weinyddu'r comisiwn fel y mae ar hyn o bryd. Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at ryw ffigur isel o fudd a ddaeth i'r economi yng ngogledd Cymru. Yr oedd peth o'r ffigur hwnnw yn ymwneud â rhaglen Laurence Llewelyn-Bowen, a beth bynnag y mae rhywun yn ei feddwl amdano ef, canlyniad hynny oedd buddsoddiad uniongyrchol bychan iawn, ond cafwyd rhaglen naw munud ar deledu Prydeinig a oedd yn hysbyseb gwyh i ogledd Cymru. A ydych yn credu y bydd gwanhau'r presenoldeb yng ngogledd Cymru yn gwella'r sefyllfa ac ar sail ba dystiolaeth yr ydych yn credu hynny?

Andrew Davies: As I said in response to Eleanor Burnham, Government support should focus on where it will have the greatest effect and add the greatest value. The commission, in terms of its outputs in north Wales, has not added a great deal of value. There are other ways in which Government intervention can add value. We were discussing earlier how important television and film have been with regard to some of BBC Wales's work, particularly *Dr Who* and *Torchwood*. I visited a dynamic company in Caernarfon only last week, Griffilms, which is a young, enterprising and innovative company in that sector that is looking to grow its business. In terms of adding value, taxpayers' money and business support should be focused on helping such companies to grow, and not necessarily on employing staff to promote specific parts of Wales as locations. That work can be done by the Creative Business Wales team on an all-Wales basis; you do not necessarily have to have staff located in each part of the country to do that.

Alun Ffred Jones: Deuaf yn ôl at y pwynt

gael ei adolygu, ond credaf fod angen inni edrych ar y ffordd y bydd y system newydd yn ymsefydlu er mwyn sicrhau bod arian trethdalwyr yn mynd i'r manau lle y gall ychwanegu'r gwerth mwyaf.

Alun Ffred Jones: As a Government, you are always saying that you make decisions on the basis of evidence, but one thing that has been absent in this process is consultation. There was no consultation with current staff members or with those who have been responsible for administering the commission as it currently stands. You referred to a very low figure that was of benefit to the economy in north Wales. Part of that figure involved a programme by Laurence Llewelyn-Bowen, and whatever one may think of him, the result of that was a very small direct investment. But there was a nine minute programme on British television which was an excellent advertisement for north Wales. Do you believe that weakening the representation in north Wales will improve the situation, and what is your evidence for believing that?

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i Eleanor Burnham, dylai cymorth y Llywodraeth ganolbwyntio ar y manau lle y caiff yr effaith fwyaf a lle y bydd yn ychwanegu'r gwerth mwyaf. Nid yw'r comisiwn, o ran ei gynnyrch yn y gogledd, wedi ychwanegu llawer iawn o werth. Mae ffyrdd eraill y gall ymyriad y Llywodraeth ychwanegu gwerth. Yr oeddem yn trafod yn gynharach mor bwysig y mae teledu a ffilm wedi bod o ran gwaith BBC Cymru, yn enwedig *Dr Who* a *Torchwood*. Ymwelais â chwmni deinamig Griffilms yng Nghaernarfon yr wythnos diwethaf, sy'n gwmni ifanc, mentrus ac arloesol yn y sector hwnnw sy'n anelu at gynyddu ei fusnes. O ran ychwanegu gwerth, dylai arian trethdalwyr a chymorth busnes ganolbwyntio ar helpu cwmnïau felly i dyfu, ac nid o reidrwydd ganolbwyntio ar gyflogi staff i hyrwyddo rhannau penodol o Gymru fel lleoliadau. Gall y gwaith hwnnw gael ei wneud gan dîm Busnes Creadigol Cymru ar sail Cymru gyfan; nid oes angen i chi gael staff ym mhob rhan o'r wlad i wneud hynny o reidrwydd.

Alun Ffred Jones: I come back to the point

bod angen tystiolaeth, ac nid oes tystiolaeth o werth wedi'i chyflwyno i gyfiawnhau'r penderfyniad. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â Griffilms, wrth gwrs, drwy un o'm cydweithwyr mewn byd arall. Gyda phwysigrwydd datblygiadau ym Manceinion o ran drama'r BBC yn y blynyddoedd nesaf, o ran y dystiolaeth bresennol, mae'r penderfyniad hwn yn un gwael i ogledd Cymru. A wnewch roi adroddiad i'r pwyllgor i gyfiawnhau ac esbonio eich penderfyniad?

Andrew Davies: This decision has been some time in the making in terms of bringing together what was the creative industries hub and is now Creative Business Wales, and it is about what we in Government can do to grow the sector. I reiterate my point about the international conference centre. The appropriate role for the Government and the public sector is helping companies such as Griffilms, Tinopolis, Boomerang and others in the independent sector to grow their businesses—that is what will add value to the Welsh economy, not, necessarily, employing, at a cost to the public purse, people to promote specific parts of Wales as film locations. I do not think that is the most effective approach in this case. If you want a business case, I have quoted to you already the fact that, of the £8 million that has come to the Welsh economy from filming this year, only £16,000 was generated in north Wales. Last year, filming contributed £18 million to the Welsh economy, and my understanding is that £17 million of that was generated in south Wales. [*Interruption.*] That is not just *Dr Who*; it is dynamic companies such as Boomerang, Green Bay Media Ltd, Tinopolis and Griffilms, which do not necessarily need a separate organisation within Government to help them find locations for their filming on a regional basis. We have refocused support for the industry.

We are trying to develop a dynamic economy based on dynamic companies, such as Griffilms, which are not dependent on public subsidy, whether they are in the film, television, animation or music sectors, and which do not rest on their laurels and base their annual income on subsidy or royalty payments.

that evidence is needed, and no evidence of value has been presented to justify this decision. I am very aware of Griffilms, of course, through one of my colleagues in another sphere. With the importance of developments in Manchester in terms of BBC drama over the next few years, given the current evidence, this decision is a poor one for north Wales. Will you bring a report to committee to justify and explain your decision?

Andrew Davies: Mae'r penderfyniad hwn wedi cymryd cryn amser i'w wneud ynglŷn â'r hyn a oedd yn ganolbwynt y diwydiannau creadigol ac sydd bellach yn Fusnes Creadigol Cymru, ac y mae a wnelo â'r hyn y gallwn ni fel Llywodraeth ei wneud i gynyddu'r sector. Ategap fy mhwynt am y ganolfan gynadledda ryngwladol. Y rôl briodol i'r Llywodraeth a'r sector cyhoeddus yw helpu cwmnïau megis Griffilms, Tinopolis, Boomerang ac eraill yn y sector annibynnol i gynyddu eu busnes—dyna a fydd yn ychwanegu gwerth at economi Cymru, nid, o reidrwydd, cyflogi, ar gost i bwrs y wlad, bobl i hyrwyddo rhannau penodol o Gymru fel lleoliadau ffilm. Ni chredaf mai dyna'r dull mwyaf effeithiol yn yr achos hwn. Os ydych am gael achos busnes, yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi mai £16,000 yn unig a gynhyrchwyd yn y gogledd o'r £8 miliwn a ddaeth i economi Cymru o ganlyniad i ffilmio eleni. Y llynedd, cyfrannodd ffilmio £18 miliwn i economi Cymru, a deallaf fod £17 miliwn o'r swm hwnnw wedi ei gynhyrchu yn y de. [*Torri ar draws.*] Nid *Dr Who* yn unig yw hynny; mae'n cynnwys cwmnïau deinamig megis Boomerang, Green Bay Media Ltd, Tinopolis a Griffilms, nad oes angen sefydliad ar wahân arnynt o reidrwydd o fewn Llywodraeth i'w helpu i ddod o hyd i leoliadau ar gyfer eu ffilmiau yn rhanbarthol. Yr ydym wedi ail-ganolbwyntio cymorth ar gyfer y diwydiant.

Yr ydym yn ceisio datblygu economi ddeinamig yn seiliedig ar gwmnïau deinamig, megis Griffilms, nad ydynt yn ddibynnol ar gymorthdaliadau cyhoeddus, boed yn y sector ffilm, teledu, animeiddio neu gerddoriaeth, ac nad ydynt yn llaesu dwylo ac yn seilio'u hincwm blynyddol ar gymorthdaliadau neu freindaliadau.

Gwasanaethau Rheilffordd Rail Services

Q8 Leanne Wood: Will the Minister make a statement on rail services in South Wales Central? OAQ1103(EIN)

C8 Leanne Wood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau rheilffordd yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ1103(EIN)

Andrew Davies: I have provided additional rolling stock for the Cardiff Valleys network to reduce overcrowding. Capacity is being increased by some 27 per cent. The public performance measure for the last full period—17 September to 14 October—was a record 90 per cent, and it was 94.1 per cent on the Valleys line alone.

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf wedi darparu cerbydau ychwanegol ar gyfer rhwydwaith Cardiff Valleys i leihau gorlenwi. Mae'r capasiti yn cael ei gynyddu tua 27 y cant. Y mesur perfformiad cyhoeddus am y cyfnod llawn diwethaf—17 Medi hyd at 14 Hydref—oedd yr uchaf erioed, sef 90 y cant, ac yr oedd yn 94.1 y cant ar linell y Cymoedd yn unig.

Leanne Wood: I recently met representatives of Network Rail who told me that it is not possible to increase the frequency of services on the Treherbert line, because of the lack of a double line to the town. People say that they would use rail services more if they were more frequent and more reliable. Do you therefore have any long-term plans to double the Treherbert line?

Leanne Wood: Cyfarfûm yn ddiweddar â chynrychiolwyr Network Rail, a ddywedodd wrthyf nad yw'n bosibl cynyddu amllder y gwasanaethau ar reilffordd Treherbert, gan nad oes llinell ddwbl i'r dref. Dywed pobl y byddent yn defnyddio gwasanaethau rheilffordd yn ehangach pe bae'r rheini'n amlach ac yn fwy dibynadwy. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau hirdymor felly i ddyblu reilffordd Treherbert?

Andrew Davies: We have been discussing with the South East Wales Transport Alliance what we can do to enhance capacity on all Valleys lines. We have a £18 million programme for increasing capacity on the Merthyr line, for example, on which work will start early next year, and also on the Rhymney line. We have also discussed with SEWTA how we can increase capacity on the Treherbert line. An investment of £3.3 million is being made to extend platforms on the Treherbert line, which could help to increase capacity, not in terms of frequency, but in terms of, in this case, those trains taking six cars, which they are not currently able to do.

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod gyda Chynghrair Trafnidiaeth De-ddwyrain Cymru yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i wella capasiti ar holl reilffyrdd y Cymoedd. Mae gennym raglen £18 miliwn i gynyddu capasiti ar reilffordd Merthyr, er enghraifft, a bydd gwaith yn dechrau arno yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn nesaf. Bydd y capasiti'n cynyddu hefyd ar reilffordd Rhymni. Yr ydym hefyd wedi trafod gyda SEWTA sut y gallwn gynyddu capasiti ar reilffordd Treherbert. Mae £3.3 miliwn yn cael ei fuddsoddi i ymestyn platfformau ar reilffordd Treherbert, a allai helpu cynyddu capasiti, nid o ran amllder ond, yn yr achos hwn, o ran y trenau hynny sy'n tynnu chwe cherbyd ac sy'n methu gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd.

3.30 p.m.

Christine Chapman: The public performance measure of the percentage of trains that Arriva runs with five minutes of being on time, is the basis of Arriva receiving additional subsidies from the Assembly Government. We know that public subsidies account for a significant proportion of

Christine Chapman: Caiff Arriva gymorthdaliadau ychwanegol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar sail y mesur perfformiad cyhoeddus sy'n gysylltiedig â chanran trenau Arriva sy'n rhedeg o fewn pum munud i fod yn brydlon. Gwyddom fod cymorthdaliadau cyhoeddus yn cyfrif am

Arriva's income. How we scrutinise the return on that money is therefore extremely important. Under the franchise agreement, the benchmark at which the Assembly Government starts making payments is 85 per cent during 2006-07, although the target set is 87.8 per cent. What public performance measure has Arriva been achieving in recent months and how does the Assembly Government monitor that? I understand that the payments are made every four weeks. Are those publicised and, if so, where?

Andrew Davies: Yes we do monitor the PPM regularly. As a result of the Wales and borders franchise being devolved from the Department for Transport to the Assembly Government, and to me, we now have an enhanced rail team, which has the capacity to monitor and work much more closely, not just with Arriva but with all the stakeholders, such as Network Rail, on a much more engaged and strategic basis. I publicly commend Arriva for its significant improvement in performance. We all know the difficulties that were experienced, particularly on the Cardiff-Valleys lines early this year, following the introduction of the standard-pattern timetable last December, but Arriva has increased its performance significantly and is performing above its benchmark figure of 85.5 per cent. It has achieved its best ever performance, with a PPM of 90 per cent. That is a significant performance and, in view of the question that was asked earlier about First Great Western, I point out that First Great Western is at 82.6 per cent PPM, below the benchmark figures. Therefore, the relationship that we have developed with Arriva and the additional investment that we have put in is paying dividends. Arriva and I know that there is still a long way to go, particularly in terms of the condition of the rolling stock and the cleanliness of the carriage interiors and the toilets. We are looking, with Arriva, at what we can do to invest in Eurolink stock over the coming period of the franchise.

Leighton Andrews: I welcome what you said about the plans in place to look at

gyfran sylweddol o incwm Arriva. Felly, mae ein ffordd o graffu ar yr hyn a gawn yn gyfnewid am yr arian hwnnw yn bwysig iawn. O dan y cytundeb masnachfaint, y meincnod ar gyfer taliadau gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yw 85 y cant yn ystod 2006-07, er mai'r targed a bennwyd yw 87.8 y cant. Pa fesur perfformiad cyhoeddus y mae Arriva wedi ei gyflawni yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf a sut y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn monitro hynny? Deallaf bod y taliadau'n cael eu gwneud bob pedair wythnos. A yw'r rheini'n cael eu cyhoeddi ac, os felly, ble?

Andrew Davies: Ydym, yr ydym yn monitro'r mesurau perfformiad cyhoeddus yn rheolaidd. Yn dilyn datganoli masnachfaint Cymru a'r gororau o'r Adran Drafnidiaeth i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac i mi, y mae bellach gennym dîm rheilffyrdd estynedig, gyda'r gallu i fonitro a chydweithio lawer yn agosach, nid yn unig ag Arriva ond gyda'r holl randdeiliaid, megis Network Rail, ar sail lawer mwy cydlynol a strategol. Hoffwn gymeradwyo Arriva yn gyhoeddus am wella'i berfformiad yn sylweddol. Gwyddom i gyd am yr anawsterau a gafwyd, yn arbennig ar y llinellau rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd ddechrau'r flwyddyn, ar ôl cyflwyno'r amserlen patrwm safonol fis Rhagfyr diwethaf. Ond mae Arriva wedi gwella'i berfformiad yn sylweddol ac mae'n rhagori ar ei ffigur meincnod o 85.5 y cant. Mae wedi sicrhau ei berfformiad gorau erioed, gyda mesur perfformiad cyhoeddus o 90 y cant. Mae hynny'n berfformiad sylweddol, ac o ystyried y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd yn gynharach am First Great Western, sylwaf fod First Great Western ar fesur perfformiad cyhoeddus o 82.6 y cant, sy'n is na'r ffigurau meincnod. Felly, mae'r berthynas a ddatblygwyd gennym ag Arriva a'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol yr ydym wedi'i wneud yn dwyn ffrwyth. Y mae Arriva a minnau'n gwybod bod llawer i'w wneud o hyd, yn arbennig o ran cyflwr y cerbydau a glendid y tu mewn i'r cerbydau a'r toiledau. Mewn cydweithrediad ag Arriva, yr ydym yn ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud i fuddsoddi mewn stoc Eurolink yn ystod cyfnod nesaf y fasnachfaint.

Leighton Andrews: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r hyn a ddywedwch am y cynlluniau sydd ar

lengthening the platforms to allow six-coach trains to operate on the Treherbert line. Do you agree that it is important that we ensure that the public transport system is in a strong position before any proposal is made by any council in south Wales for congestion charging?

Andrew Davies: You cannot apply the stick of congestion charging if you do not have the carrot of improved public transport as part of the package. We need to put other things in place, for example, park and ride schemes, and we need to ensure that bus lanes are policed so that there is an incentive for people to use public transport in terms of speed and reliability. Congestion charging remains an option but it is part of a wider package. The mayor of London has shown what can be done with the successful introduction of congestion charging; the introduction of the charge in London was matched by a significant investment in public transport, particularly buses. That is our policy too.

waith i ystyried ymestyn hyd y platfformau er mwyn galluogi trenau chwe cherbyd i redeg ar linell Treherbert. A gytunwch ei fod yn bwysig inni sicrhau bod y system cludiant cyhoeddus mewn sefyllfa gadarn cyn gwneud unrhyw gynnig gan unrhyw gyngor yn y De i godi tâl am dagfeydd?

Andrew Davies: Ni allwch figwth codi tâl am dagfeydd heb gynnig gwella cludiant cyhoeddus fel rhan o'r pecyn. Mae angen inni roi pethau eraill ar waith, er enghraifft, cynlluniau parcio a theithio, ac mae angen inni sicrhau y caiff lonydd bysiau eu plismona fel bod cymhelliant i bobl ddefnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus o ran cyflymder a bod yn ddibynadwy. Mae codi tâl am dagfeydd yn dal yn ddewis, ond mae'n rhan o becyn ehangach. Mae maer Llundain wedi dangos beth y gellir ei wneud drwy gyflwyno system lwyddiannus o godi tâl am dagfeydd; adeg cyflwyno'r tâl yn Llundain, gwnaed buddsoddiad sylweddol hefyd mewn cludiant cyhoeddus, yn arbennig mewn bysiau. Dyna yw ein polisi ni hefyd.

Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd ar ei Chyfrifoldebau heblaw am Fusnes Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business

Y Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 2005 The Disability Discrimination Act 2005

Q1 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on the implementation of the Disability Discrimination Act 2005 in Wales? OAQ0300(BM)

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): On 23 October, I had a useful meeting with the UK Government Minister for Disabled People, Anne McGuire, to discuss a range of disability equality issues, including the enforcement of the Act and the role of the Disability Rights Commission in ensuring compliance with it.

Peter Black: You will recall that I raised with you previously the issue of enforcing the Act against private businesses where disabled people were having difficulty accessing premises. Did you raise this issue with the Minister and, if so, what was her response in terms of how these issues can be enforced?

C1 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am weithredu'r Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 2005 yng Nghymru? OAQ0300(BM)

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Ar 23 Hydref, cefais gyfarfod defnyddiol gydag Anne McGuire, Gweinidog Llywodraeth y DU dros Bobl Anabl, i drafod amrywiaeth o faterion yn ymwneud â chydaddoldeb i bobl anabl, gan gynnwys gweithredu'r Ddeddf a rôl y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd wrth sicrhau cydymffurfio â hi.

Peter Black: Fe gofiwch imi godi'r mater gyda chi yn flaenorol o orfodi'r Ddeddf ar fusnesau preifat lle yr oedd pobl anabl yn ei chael yn anodd mynd i mewn i adeiladau. A fu ichi godi'r mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog, ac os felly, beth oedd ei hymateb am y ffordd y gellir gorfodi'r materion hyn?

Jane Hutt: The Minister restated the commitment of her department to addressing this issue, particularly discrimination in relation to private facilities, and I was able to refer to representations. She also assured me that Equality 2025, which is a national forum for organisation representing disabled people, will be closely monitoring the implementation of the Act, and we have Welsh representation on that forum.

Jane Hutt: Ailbwysleisiodd y Gweinidog ymrwymiad ei hadran i ymdrin â'r mater hwn, yn arbennig gwahaniaethu mewn perthynas â chyfleusterau preifat, a chyfeiriais at sylwadau. Rhoddodd sicrwydd imi hefyd y bydd Equality 2025, sef fforwm cenedlaethol ar gyfer sefydliadau sy'n cynrychioli pobl anabl, yn monitro'n ofalus y broses o weithredu'r Ddeddf, a chaiff Cymru ei chynrychioli ar y fforwm hwnnw.

Cyfle Cyfartal i Fenywod Equality of Opportunity for Women

Q2 Ann Jones: What discussions has the Minister had with members of the National Assembly faith communities forum regarding equality of opportunity for women in Wales? OAQ0288(BM)

C2 Ann Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gydag aelodau o fforwm cymunedau ffydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ynghylch cyfle cyfartal i fenywod yng Nghymru? OAQ0288(BM)

Q13 Ann Jones: What discussions has the Minister had with members of the National Assembly faith communities forum regarding safeguarding the human rights of young women in Wales? OAQ0287(BM)

C13 Ann Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gydag aelodau o fforwm cymunedau ffydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ynghylch diogelu hawliau dynol merched ifanc yng Nghymru? OAQ0287(BM)

Jane Hutt: I meet regularly with members of the faith communities forum and discuss with them many issues that relate to women. Those discussions are all conducted on the principle that no-one should be denied opportunities because of race, ethnicity, disability, gender, age, sexual orientation or religion.

Jane Hutt: Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd ag aelodau o'r fforwm cymunedau ffydd, ac yn trafod llawer o faterion gyda nhw sy'n ymwneud â menywod. Caiff yr holl drafodaethau hynny eu cynnal yn unol â'r egwyddor na ddylid gwadu cyfleoedd i neb ar sail hil, ethnigrwydd, anabledd, rhyw, oed, tueddfryd rhywiol na chrefydd.

Ann Jones: While we aim to close the pay gap for all women, it is not always about women reaching glass ceilings and breaking through them; it is often about engaging with women to participate in the labour market in the first instance. Will you consider this issue as a regular item for discussion within the faith communities forum, to encourage women to play their full part in Welsh society, and also to assist in promoting women's independence to improve their life chances and those of their children?

Ann Jones: Er mai ein nod yw cau'r bwlch cyflogau i bob menyw, nid yw bob amser yn golygu bod menywod yn cyrraedd nenfydau gwydr ac yn eu chwalu; mae a wnelo'n aml ag annog menywod i ymuno â'r farchnad lafur yn y lle cyntaf. A ystyriwch y mater hwn fel eitem reolaidd i'w thrafod gyda'r fforwm cymunedau ffydd, er mwyn annog menywod i chwarae eu rhan lawn mewn cymdeithas yng Nghymru, a hefyd i gynorthwyo wrth hyrwyddo annibyniaeth menywod i wella'u cyfleoedd bywyd a chyfleoedd bywyd eu plant?

Jane Hutt: I will undertake to raise that issue in the faith communities forum, but I will also raise it with MEWN Cymru. I met today with the black and minority ethnic women's voices forum, which raised this very issue,

Jane Hutt: Addawaf godi'r mater hwnnw yn y fforwm cymunedau ffydd, ond byddaf yn ei godi hefyd gyda MEWN Cymru. Cyfarfûm heddiw â'r fforwm lleisiau menywod duon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, a gododd yr union fater

and I am also aware of the recent research undertaken by the Equal Opportunities Commission, which shows that there is a substantial gap in the full-time pay per hour for all ethnic groups, compared with that for white men. We must also address that in terms of the Close the Pay Gap campaign.

Ann Jones: If we move on from that and recognise that we need to respect all cultures and beliefs, we must also accept that we cannot be blind to the unpleasant reality of certain cultural practices, which may have a faith basis incompatible with basic human rights for young people. The End Violence Against Women coalition estimates that upwards of 700 girls are currently at risk of female genital mutilation, and that some 1,000 British Asian girls are forced into marriage each year. The End Violence Against Women coalition has produced an important report, tracking the performance of each UK Government department in discharging its responsibilities in these areas, in relation to the prevention of violence against women. Will you commission a similar analysis to benchmark the way in which the Assembly Government engages on these issues?

Jane Hutt: I am aware of the report, 'Making the Grade'. End Violence Against Women is a coalition of more than 50 organisations, including Amnesty, Women's Aid, the Women's National Commission, the Trades Union Congress and others. It is widely accepted that female genital mutilation violates a number of human rights of women and girls, and our all-Wales national domestic abuse strategy, which was launched in March 2005, provides an important framework for addressing this in terms of local action and national issues. In terms of the violence against women definition, this includes female genital mutilation as well as sexual harassment and trafficking, which is an issue that you brought before the Assembly recently, Ann. I will take the issue back to look at it with the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration.

Mark Isherwood: This issue deserves vital

hwn, a gwn hefyd am y gwaith ymchwil a wnaed yn ddiweddar gan y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, sy'n dangos bod bwlch sylweddol yn y cyflog llawn amser fesul awr i bob grŵp ethnig, o'u cymharu â chyflogau cyfatebol dynion gwyn. Rhaid inni hefyd ymdrin â hynny mewn perthynas â'r ymgyrch Cau'r Bwlch Cyflog.

Ann Jones: Os symudwn ymlaen o hynny a chydabod bod angen inni barchu pob diwylliant a chred, rhaid inni hefyd dderbyn na allwn anwybyddu realiti annifyr rhai arferion diwylliannol, a all fod â sail ffydd sy'n anghydnaws â hawliau dynol sylfaenol i bobl ifanc. Mae'r glymblaid End Violence Against Women yn amcangyfrif bod dros 700 o ferched ar hyn o bryd mewn perygl oherwydd anffurfio eu horganau rhywiol, a bod tua 1,000 o ferched Asiaidd Prydeinig yn cael eu gorfodi i briodi bob blwyddyn. Mae'r glymblaid End Violence Against Women wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad pwysig sy'n olrhain perfformiad pob un o adrannau Llywodraeth y DU wrth gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau yn y meysydd hyn, mewn perthynas ag atal trais yn erbyn menywod. A fyddwch yn comisiynu dadansoddiad tebyg i feincnodi'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymwneud â'r materion hyn?

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad 'Making the Grade'. Mae End Violence Against Women yn glymblaid o fwy na 50 o sefydliadau, gan gynnwys Amnesty, Cymorth i Fenywod, Comisiwn Cenedlaethol y Menywod, y Gynghrair Undebau Llafur ac eraill. Derbynnir yn gyffredinol bod arferion anffurfio organau rhywiol yn torri nifer o hawliau dynol menywod a merched, ac mae ein strategaeth genedlaethol ar gam-drin yn y cartref i Gymru gyfan, a lanswyd ym mis Mawrth 2005, yn darparu fframwaith pwysig ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â hyn wrth weithredu'n lleol a materion cenedlaethol. O ran y diffiniad o drais yn erbyn menywod, mae hyn yn cynnwys anffurfio organau rhywiol yn ogystal ag aflonyddu rhywiol a masnachu, sy'n fater a ddygwyd ger bron y Cynulliad gennyh yn ddiweddar, Ann. Byddaf yn edrych ar y mater gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'r mater hwn yn

attention. It seems more of a cultural issue than a faith issue, and it should not be confused on that basis. However, to develop the point, the document on the incorporation of faith communities in England recommended that enough time should be allowed for faith communities to take the initiative and make positive suggestions in response to policy proposals, and that recognition should be given for the differences within and between faith groups, and that women—as well as young and older people—should be represented. What approach have you taken to this issue in Wales, and what action has resulted?

Jane Hutt: It has been reflected in the faith communities forum. The inter-faith forum, which has cross-party leadership involvement, recently received representations and information from the Racial Attacks and Harassment Monitoring Association Wales, which is a voluntary advocacy group. It brought issues to us for discussion in relation to cultural issues and the consequences for young people in terms of racial attacks and harassment, but also enabled us to broaden that to discussions about the position of women in particular in society with regard to these issues.

3.40 p.m.

Blaenoriaethau Portffolio Portfolio Priorities

Q3 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister make a statement on her achievements in implementing her portfolio priorities? OAQ0292(BM)

Jane Hutt: My achievements include the development of the disability equality scheme and co-ordinating cross-cutting policy for children and young people, including the Wales report on the UN convention on the rights of the child.

Lisa Francis: The Children Act 1989 stipulates that local authorities have a duty to ensure that children who are looked after by them are not disadvantaged in terms of their educational progress. I have a constituent who is an academically gifted 15-year-old who entered the sixth form in Aberystwyth

haeddu sylw hanfodol. Ymddengys ei fod yn ymwneud mwy â diwylliant na ffydd, ac ni ddylid drysu ar y sail honno. Fodd bynnag, i ymhelaethu, argymhellodd y ddogfen ar ymgorffori cymunedau ffydd yn Lloegr y dylid rhoi digon o amser i gymunedau ffydd weithredu eu hunain a gwneud awgrymiadau cadarnhaol mewn ymateb i gynigion polisi, ac y dylid cydnabod y gwahaniaethau mewn grwpiau ffydd a rhwng grwpiau ffydd, ac y dylai menywod—yn ogystal â phobl ifanc a phobl hŷn—gael eu cynrychioli. Pa ddull a ddefnyddiwyd gennych yn y mater hwn yng Nghymru, a pha gamau sydd wedi deillio o hynny?

Jane Hutt: Mae wedi ei adlewyrchu yn y fforwm cymunedau ffydd. Cafodd y fforwm aml-ffydd, lle mmae cyfranogiad gan arweinwyr trawsbleidiol, sylwadau a gwybodaeth yn ddiweddar gan Gymdeithas Monitro Ymosodiadau ac Aflonyddu Hiliol Cymru, sy'n grŵp eiriolaeth gwirfoddol. Cyflwynodd faterion inni i'w trafod mewn perthynas â materion diwylliannol a'r canlyniadau i bobl ifanc o ran ymosodiadau ac aflonyddu hiliol. Ond yr oedd hefyd yn ein galluogi ehangu hynny i drafodaethau am sefyllfa menywod yn arbennig mewn cymdeithas o ran y materion hyn.

C3 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei llwyddiannau wrth weithredu blaenoriaethau ei phortffolio? OAQ0292(BM)

Jane Hutt: Mae fy llwyddiannau'n cynnwys datblygu'r cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl a chydlynu polisi trawsbynciol i blant a phobl ifanc, gan gynnwys adroddiad Cymru ar gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn.

Lisa Francis: Mae'r Ddeddf Plant 1989 yn pennu bod dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau na fydd plant sy'n cael gofal ganddynt dan anfantais o ran eu cynnydd addysgol. Mae gennyf etholwr 15 oed sy'n academiaidd alluogm ac a ddechreuodd yn y chweched dosbarth yn Aberystwyth fis Medi

last September, a year ahead of his peers. He is a looked-after child. As he is not 16, he does not qualify for an education maintenance allowance grant. The raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales money, which has been given to Ceredigion County Council, which I thought would be used for looked-after children, will not go far enough for other purposes, including his needs. In the interest of equal opportunities, what other avenues can your Government suggest or offer to a child like this so that he will not be socially or financially disadvantaged?

Jane Hutt: That is a very good example of how looked-after children are achieving in Wales with the appropriate input. Indeed, that goes back to stability in terms of placements, which enable them to have continuity in their education. We are seeing some improvement in the indicators for children's social services in relation to continuity and stability. However, your issue relating to education is important. It is central to our aspirations and expectations for looked-after children. We are putting £1 million into the very age group that you talked about. RAISE went to special schools and to those schools which qualified, but the £1 million is about ensuring that every looked-after child in Wales who would qualify under that age group will benefit in order that they can take up those further and higher education opportunities. I will certainly be reporting on the outcomes of that £1 million investment, as will the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills.

Jenny Randerson: I have a question about your role in terms of strategic responsibility for communication. Yesterday, my colleague, Kirsty Williams, asked the First Minister about the intervention of the Minister for Health and Social Services in Powys in order to postpone the consultation on hospital reorganisation until after the election. The First Minister replied:

'You are chucking allegations around...I do not know of any possible intervention by a health Minister in relation to proposals that have not yet gone firm from the local health

diwethaf, flwyddyn cyn ei gyfoedion. Mae'n blentyn sy'n cael gofal. Gan nad yw'n 16 oed, nid yw'n gymwys i gael grant lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg. Ni fydd yr arian i godi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion yng Nghymru sydd wedi ei roi i Gyngor Sir Ceredigion ac yn credwn y byddai'n cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal, yn mynd yn ddigon pell at ddibenion eraill, gan gynnwys ei anghenion ef. Er lles cyfle cyfartal, pa lwybrau eraill y gall eich Llywodraeth eu hawgrymu neu eu cynnig i blentyn o'r fath fel na fydd o dan anfantais gymdeithasol nac ariannol?

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n enghraifft dda iawn o'r ffordd y mae plant sy'n cael gofal yn cyflawni yng Nghymru o gael y cymorth priodol. Yn wir, mae'n deillio o sefydlogrwydd lleoliadau, sy'n galluogi parhad yn eu haddysg. Yr ydym yn gweld rhywfaint o welliant yn y dangosyddion ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol plant mewn parhad a sefydlogrwydd. Fodd bynnag, mae eich mater yn ymwneud ag addysg yn bwysig. Mae'n greiddiol i'n dyheadau a'n disgwyliadau ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal. Yr ydym yn rhoi £1 filiwn i'r union grŵp oedran yr oeddech yn sôn amdano. Rhoddwyd Rhagori i ysgolion arbennig ac i'r ysgolion hynny a oedd yn gymwys, ond nod yr £1 filiwn yw sicrhau y bydd pob plentyn sy'n cael gofal yng Nghymru ac a fyddai'n gymwys dan y grŵp oedran hwnnw yn elwa er mwyn iddynt allu manteisio ar y cyfleoedd addysg bellach ac uwch hynny. Yn sicr, byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar ganlyniadau'r buddsoddiad hwnnw o £1 filiwn, fel y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau.

Jenny Randerson: Mae gennyf gwestiwn am eich rôl o ran cyfrifoldeb strategol dros gyfathrebu. Ddoe gofynnodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Kirsty Williams, i'r Prif Weinidog am ymyriad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym Mhowys er mwyn gohirio'r ymgynghori ar ad-drefnu ysbytai tan ar ôl yr etholiad. Dyma oedd ateb y Prif Weinidog:

'Yr ydych yn taflu honiadau o gwmpas...ni wn am unrhyw ymyriad posibl gan Weinidog dros iechyd ynghylch cynigion sydd heb eu cadarnhau o lefel y gymuned iechyd leol.'

community level.’

The chair of Powys Local Health Board, wrote that his chief executive has recently met with Ann Lloyd, chief executive of NHS Wales, to discuss the timing of possible public consultation in Powys, who advised him that the Assembly Government would be issuing guidance on the future of community services and community hospitals in December. She also advised that the Welsh Assembly Government would be reluctant to see public consultation exercises run in the lead-up to the Assembly election.

Ysgrifennodd cadeirydd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys fod ei brif weithredwr wedi cyfarfod yn ddiweddar ag Ann Lloyd, prif weithredwr GIG Cymru, i drafod amseru ymgynghori cyhoeddus posibl ym Mhowys. Yr oedd hi wedi dweud wrtho y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi canllawiau ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau cymunedol ac ysbytai cymuned ym mis Rhagfyr. Dywedodd hefyd na fyddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awyddus cael ymgynghori cyhoeddus yn ystod y cyfnod cyn etholiad y Cynulliad.

Minister, can you explain how it is good consultation and communication for a Minister to decide halfway through a round of consultations on hospital reconfiguration to produce basic guidance on community hospitals? How is it that he has effectively decided to halt the consultation procedure without making an announcement to the public or to Assembly Members? How is it that he has not told the First Minister about his change of plan? Did he tell you, Minister?

Weinidog, a allwch egluro sut y mae'n arfer da o ran ymgynghori a chyfathrebu i Weinidog benderfynu, hanner ffordd drwy gylch o ymgynghoriadau ar ad-drefnu ysbytai, i gynhyrchu canllawiau sylfaenol ar ysbytai cymuned? Sut y mae, mewn gwirionedd, wedi penderfynu rhoi'r gorau i'r weithdrefn ymgynghori heb wneud datganiad cyhoeddus nac i Aelodau'r Cynulliad? Pam nad yw wedi rhoi gwybod i'r Prif Weinidog am y newid hwn yn ei gynlluniau? A ddywedodd wrthy, Weinidog?

Jane Hutt: This is a very specific matter for the Minister for Health and Social Services to respond to. There may be issues in terms of discussions at an operational chief executive level with regard to the forthcoming election. We know that purdah has an impact across the board in terms of the timing of consultations and decisions; that is the key thing, Jenny, is it not? However, you should write to the Minister for Health and Social Services for clarification on this matter. It is certainly not something that he is saying that he is aware of today and I hope that it will be clarified.

Jane Hutt: Mae hwn yn fater penodol iawn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ymateb iddo. Efallai fod yna broblemau gyda thrafodaethau ar lefel prif weithredwyr gweithredol am yr etholiad sydd ar ddod. Gwyddom fod purdah yn cael dylanwad cyffredinol ar amseru ymgynghoriadau a phenderfyniadau; onid dyna'r mater allweddol, Jenny? Fodd bynnag, dylech ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gael esboniad ar y mater hwn. Yn sicr nid yw'n rhywbeth y mae'n dweud ei fod ymwybodol ohono heddiw, a gobeithio y ceir esboniad yn ei gylch.

Jenny Randerson: With respect, I understand that the decision might be that of the health Minister, but in relation to your responsibility it is very much your business if the Assembly Government is launching a Wales-wide major series of consultations—the biggest consultations that have been held for some years on the public perception of the Assembly—and has decided to change the system half-way through. Is there truth in

Jenny Randerson: Gyda phob parch, deallaf efallai mai penderfyniad y Gweinidog iechyd ydyw, ond o ran eich cyfrifoldeb chi, mae'r ffaith fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn lansio cyfres fawr o ymgynghoriadau ledled Cymru—yr ymgynghoriadau mwyaf ers rhai blynedd ar ganfyddiad y cyhoedd o'r Cynulliad—a'i bod wedi penderfynu newid y system hanner ffordd drwy'r broses, yn berthnasol iawn i chi. A oes gwirionedd yn

that? Have you been informed about this change? If not, will you assure me that, given your responsibilities for strategic communication across Government, you will seek clarification and, I hope, come here to give us more information?

Jane Hutt: I said that I was seeking that clarification, and not a decision, on the point that you and Kirsty have raised, namely the arrangements of the particular policy context, which are crucial in terms of health services in that area. I, along with the health Minister, am happy to clarify this for you and the Assembly.

hynny? A ydych wedi cael gwybod am y newid hwn? Os nad ydych, a wnewch chi fy sicrhau, o gofio'ch cyfrifoldebau am gyfathrebu strategol ar draws y Llywodraeth, y byddwch yn ceisio eglurhad a yn dod yma, gobeithio, i roi rhagor o wybodaeth inni?

Jane Hutt: Dywedais fy mod yn ceisio'r eglurhad hwnnw, yn hytrach na phenderfyniad, am y pwynt yr ydych chi a Kirsty wedi'i godi, sef trefniadau'r cyddestun polisi penodol, sy'n hanfodol o ran gwasanaethau iechyd yn yr ardal honno. Yr wyf fi, ynghyd â'r Gweinidog iechyd, yn fwy na pharod i egluro hyn i chi a'r Cynulliad.

Cyflog Cyfartal Equal Pay

Q4 Jenny Randerson: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to achieve equal pay for women?
OAO0297(BM)

Jane Hutt: Through our Close the Pay Gap campaign, I have been meeting local authority leaders to identify ways of progressing the equal pay agenda. I chaired an equal pay conference on 1 November to review progress and to highlight the urgency of addressing this issue. That was attended by 100 public sector representatives.

Jenny Randerson: I am sure that you are aware of the impact on local authorities of Cumbria County Council's judgment and I am sure that that must have been a topic of discussion when you met local authority leaders. I am also sure that, like me, you welcome the fact that many women who have historically been underpaid will, at last, get their just desserts. However, there is great concern in local government, not least from the chief executive of the Welsh Local Government Association, about the financial implications, which could lead to serious service cuts, according to the chief executive. What discussions have you and your colleagues had with Gordon Brown, the Treasury and the UK Government as a whole to persuade that Government that it must break with its golden rule and allow councils to borrow the money to avoid service cuts?

C4 Jenny Randerson: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i sicrhau cyflog cyfartal i fenywod?
OAO0297(BM)

Jane Hutt: Drwy ein hymgyrch Cau'r Bwlch Cyflog, yr wyf wedi bod yn cwrdd ag arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol i nodi ffyrdd i ddatblygu'r agenda cyflog cyfartal. Cadeiriais gynhadledd cyflog cyfartal ar 1 Tachwedd i adolygu'r cynnydd ac i dynny sylw at bwysigrwydd mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn ar fyrder. Yr oedd 100 o gynrychiolwyr o'r sector cyhoeddus yn bresennol.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o effaith dyfarniad Cyngor Sir Cumbria ar awdurdodau lleol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bu hynny'n destun trafod yn ystod eich cyfarfodydd gydag arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf hefyd yn siŵr eich bod chi, fel finnau, yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd nifer o fenywod sy'n hanesyddol wedi cel cyflog rhy isel, o'r diwedd yn cael yr hyn y maent yn ei haeddu. Fodd bynnag, mae pryder mawr mewn llywodraeth leol, yn arbennig gan brif weithredwr Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, ynglŷn â'r goblygiadau ariannol, a allai arwain at doriadau difrifol mewn gwasanaethau, yn ôl y prif weithredwr. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch chi a'ch cyd-Aelodau gyda Gordon Brown, y Trysorlys a Llywodraeth y DU yn gyffredinol i ddarbwylllo'r Llywodraeth honno ei bod yn rhaid iddi dorri ei rheol

They have to find a solution because this causes a problem that affects the UK as a whole as well as Wales.

Jane Hutt: I am pleased to report that last Wednesday's conference was successful. Sue Essex sat on a panel with the chief executive of the WLGA and trade union representatives. We addressed the issue using a partnership approach. As I said, I met at least a third of the local authority cabinet leaders to address this important issue because they have that target date, as you will know, Jenny, of implementing their new pay and grading systems by April 2007. We are working on a way forward, and discussing these issues, not only in the Welsh Assembly Government, but with Treasury officials using a partnership approach. I believe that Wales, through the Close the Pay Gap campaign, can lead the way in this regard.

euraid a chaniatáu i gynghorau fenthyg yr arian er mwyn osgoi toriadau mewn gwasanaethau? Mae'n rhaid iddynt gael ateb oherwydd mae hyn yn broblem sy'n effeithio ar y DU gyfan yn ogystal â Chymru.

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn falch dweud bod y gynhadledd ddydd Mercher diwethaf wedi bod yn llwyddiant. Yr oedd Sue Essex ar banel gyda phrif weithredwr CLILC a chynrychiolwyr undebau llafur. Aethom i'r afael â'r mater gan ddefnyddio dull partneriaeth. Fel y dywedais, cyfarfûm ag o leiaf un rhan o dair o arweinwyr cabinet awdurdodau lleol, i fynd i'r afael â'r mater pwysig hwn, oherwydd bod ganddynt y dyddiad targed hwnnw, fel y gwyddoch, Jenny, o weithredu eu systemau cyflog a graddio newydd erbyn mis Ebrill 2007. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar ffordd ymlaen, ac yn trafod y materion hyn, nid gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn unig, ond gyda swyddogion y Trysorlys drwy ddefnyddio dull partneriaeth. Credaf y gall Cymru, drwy'r ymgyrch Cau'r Bwlch Cyflog, arwain y ffordd yn hyn.

Polisïau Trawsbynciol Cross-cutting Policies

Q5 Janet Ryder: Will the Minister make a statement on the Government's cross-cutting policies with regard to children's services? OAQ0294(BM)

C5 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisïau trawsbynciol y Llywodraeth o ran gwasanaethau plant? OAQ0294(BM)

Q9 William Graham: Will the Minister outline her priorities for promoting the cross-cutting issues relating to children in Wales? OAQ0289(BM)

C9 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer hyrwyddo'r materion trawsbynciol sy'n ymwneud â phlant yng Nghymru? OAQ0289(BM)

Q10 Janet Ryder: Will the Minister make a statement on the Government's cross-cutting policies in relation to children and young people? OAQ0291(BM)

C10 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisïau trawsbynciol y Llywodraeth mewn perthynas â phlant a phobl ifanc? OAQ0291(BM)

Jane Hutt: Our policies are underpinned by the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. Current work includes the implementation of the provisions of the Children Act 2004 for local partners to co-operate in the integrated planning and delivery of all services for children and young people.

Jane Hutt: Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn yw sail ein polisïau. Mae'r gwaith cyfredol yn cynnwys gweithredu darpariaethau'r Ddeddf Plant 2004 i bartneriaid lleol gydweithio i gynllunio a darparu'r holl wasanaethau i blant a phobl ifanc mewn ffordd integredig.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that, given your responsibility for this cross-cutting agenda for children, you are aware of the 'Don't Touch—Tell!' project delivered by CAIS Ltd. That project delivers a powerful, effective and independently proven anti-drugs message to young children. I would very much like to see that being rolled out across Wales into many areas, but the funding for 'Don't Touch—Tell!' and the strategies underpinning such projects have to come from many different sources. For example, CAIS has to go to the Home Office, which has its strategies and funding mechanisms, the Welsh Assembly Government, the Wales European Funding Office, community safety partnerships, and North Wales Police. What can you do to better co-ordinate all of the various ports of call for projects such as 'Don't Touch—Tell!' to ensure that they do not have the added worry of filling in multiple grant applications?

3.50 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I pay tribute to the work of CAIS. The 'Don't Touch—Tell!' campaign is a viable and evidence-based programme that has been tested, which is important. In terms of the co-ordination, the children and young people's committee is so important in that regard, because the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and I, as the Minister for children, are regularly addressing those co-ordinating points at a national level and ensuring that they can also be coherent at a local level.

Janet Ryder: I understand that earlier this week the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration was due to meet the four chief constables to discuss the all-Wales school programme, which is funded by yet another Welsh Assembly Government grant that will run out soon. The aim of the all-Wales school programme is to place police officers in schools to promote an anti-drugs message. However, as I understand it, it has not yet been independently evaluated, while 'Don't Touch—Tell!', as you have just said, has been independently and successfully evaluated.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siŵr, o gofio'ch cyfrifoldeb dros yr agenda drawsbynciol hon i blant, eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r prosiect 'Peidiwch â Chyffwrdd—Dywedwch!' a weithredir gan CAIS Cyf. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw'n cyflwyno neges wrth-gyffuriau bwerus, effeithiol i blant ifanc sydd wedi ei phrofi. Byddwn yn hoffi gweld ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru i lawer o ardaloedd, ond mae'n rhaid i'r cyllid ar gyfer 'Peidiwch â Chyffwrdd—Dywedwch!' a'r strategaethau sy'n sail i brosiectau o'r fath ddod o nifer o wahanol ffynonellau. Er enghraifft, mae'n rhaid i CAIS fynd at y Swyddfa Gartref, sydd â'i strategaethau a'i phrosesau ariannu ei hun, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol a Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Beth allwch chi ei wneud i gydlynu'r holl fannau cyswllt ar gyfer prosiectau megis 'Peidiwch â Chyffwrdd—Dywedwch!' yn well, i sicrhau nad oes ganddynt y gofid pellach o lenwi ceisiadau grant niferus?

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i waith CAIS. Mae'r ymgyrch 'Peidiwch â Chyffwrdd-Dywedwch!' yn rhaglen ymarferol yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth ac sydd wedi'i phrofi, sy'n bwysig. O ran y cydlynu, mae'r pwyllgor plant a phobl ifanc mor bwysig yn y cyswllt hwnnw, gan fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau a minnau, fel y Gweinidog dros blant, yn mynd i'r afael â'r pwyntiau cydlynu hynny'n rheolaidd ar lefel genedlaethol ac yn sicrhau y gallant hefyd fod yn gydlynol ar lefel leol.

Janet Ryder: Deallaf fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i fod i gyfarfod â'r pedwar prif gwnstabl yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, i drafod rhaglen ysgolion Cymru gyfan, sy'n cael ei hariannu gan grant arall gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a fydd yn dod i ben yn fuan. Nod rhaglen ysgolion Cymru gyfan yw anfon swyddogion yr heddlu i ysgolion i hyrwyddo neges gwrth-gyffuriau. Fodd bynnag, fel y deallaf, nid yw wedi'i gwerthuso'n annibynnol eto, ond mae 'Peidiwch â Chyffwrdd—Dywedwch!', fel yr ydych newydd ddweud, wedi ei werthuso'n

annibynnol ac yn llwyddiannus.

The all-Wales school programme will be competing with 'Don't Touch—Tell!' for the community safety partnerships' moneys. How will you co-ordinate the Government's approach to these two programmes, one of which has been independently evaluated and has proven to have a good success rate?

Jane Hutt: There are a number of anti-drugs message education programmes across Wales, some of which have been developed locally and are appropriate for local circumstances. I will ask the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration to report back on her discussions with the chief constables in terms of the all-Wales schools programme. However, we must recognise the interface and the important role that the police forces have already been playing in terms of effectively promoting the anti-drugs message in schools throughout Wales, particularly in the Gwent area in relation to the use of drama.

William Graham: You will know that many children living in the poorer, less-densely-populated areas of Wales feel somewhat insulated from Welsh Assembly Government policies, particularly those regarding arts venues and sports facilities. How do these priorities fit into your current discussions?

Jane Hutt: As the Minister for sport and leisure is on our Cabinet committee, it is crucial that those issues come before us in terms of tackling social inclusion and promoting the objectives of 'Climbing Higher'. I was pleased to attend the south-east Wales regional aquatic competition last week, in which children from across south-east Wales were taking part. Those children had taken advantage of the Welsh Assembly Government free swimming scheme in the summer and were now competing during their half-term holidays. There were many children there from the Communities First areas that are particularly targeted in terms of the free swimming scheme.

Bydd rhaglen ysgolion Cymru gyfan yn cystadlu â 'Peidiwch â Chyffwrdd—Dywedwch!' am arian y partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. Sut y byddwch yn cydlynu dull y Llywodraeth o weithredu'r ddwy raglen hyn, gan fod un wedi ei gwerthuso'n annibynnol ac wedi profi bod ganddi gyfradd lwyddo dda?

Jane Hutt: Mae yna nifer o raglenni addysg gyda negeseuon gwrth-gyffuriau ledled Cymru, rai ohonynt wedi'u datblygu'n lleol ac yn addas ar gyfer amgylchiadau lleol. Byddaf yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio adrodd yn ôl ar ei thrafodaethau gyda'r prif gwnstabiliaid ar raglen ysgolion Cymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod rhyngwyneb a rôl bwysig yr heddluoedd eisoes wrth hyrwyddo'r neges gwrth-gyffuriau'n effeithiol mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn ardal Gwent mewn perthynas a defnyddio drama.

William Graham: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod llawer o blant sy'n byw yn yr ardaloedd tlotach gyda llai o boblogaeth yng Nghymru, yn teimlo'u bod wedi eu hynysu o bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn arbennig y rheini sy'n ymwneud â chanolfannau celfyddydau a chyfleusterau chwaraeon. Sut y mae'r blaenoriaethau hyn yn rhan o'ch trafodaethau presennol?

Jane Hutt: Gan fod y Gweinidog dros chwaraeon a hamdden yn aelod o'n pwyllgor Cabinet, mae'n hanfodol i'r materion hynny ddod ger ein bron i fynd i'r afael â chynhwysiant cymdeithasol a hyrwyddo amcanion 'Dringo'n Uwch'. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf fod yng nghystadleuaeth ddyfrol ranbarthol y de-ddwyrain yr wythnos diwethaf, lle yr oedd plant o bob cwr o'r de-ddwyrain yn cymryd rhan. Yr oedd y plant hynny wedi manteisio ar y cynllun nofio am ddim gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystod yr haf, ac yn awr yr oeddent yn cystadlu yn ystod eu gwyliau hanner tymor. Yr oedd nifer o blant yno o ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf lle mae'r cynllun nofio am ddim yn targedu'n arbennig.

Gwella Mynediad Pobl Anabl Improving Disabled Access

Q6 Peter Black: How is the Welsh Assembly Government improving disabled access to public buildings in Wales? OAQ0293(BM)

Jane Hutt: In July, I launched our accessible venues guidance. I jointly announced with the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside the taking forward of secondary legislation that will require that access statements accompany planning applications in Wales.

Peter Black: I am pleased that the Assembly Government has a clear commitment to achieving access to public buildings. However, the reality on the ground is that achieving that requires resources, particularly in relation to schools. What is the Assembly Government doing to make resources available to local authorities to achieve compliance with the Disability Discrimination Act in terms of their public buildings, and schools in particular?

Jane Hutt: As you know, the schools buildings improvement grant scheme is key to this. There are currently two schemes under which authorities can obtain grants: the £9 million school buildings improvement grant scheme, which is given to each local authority to be used between 2005 and 2010; and the formula scheme under which authorities are given a percentage grant. In that regard, the opportunities to progressively improve the accessibility of schools for disabled pupils are key, and this is a duty that we have had since 2003.

C6 Peter Black: Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwella mynediad pobl anabl i adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ0293(BM)

Jane Hutt: Ym mis Gorffennaf, lansiais ein canllawiau lleoliadau hwylus. Cyhoeddais ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad y byddai is-ddeddfwriaeth yn cael ei chyflwyno a fydd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol cyflwyno datganiadau hwylustod gyda cheisiadau cynllunio yng Nghymru.

Peter Black: Yr wyf yn falch fod gan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ymrwymiad clir i sicrhau mynediad i adeiladau cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, y gwirionedd ar lawr gwlad yw bod angen adnoddau i wneud hynny, yn arbennig mewn perthynas ag ysgolion. Beth mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod adnoddau ar gael i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod eu hadeiladau cyhoeddus, ac ysgolion yn arbennig, yn cydymffurfio â'r Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd?

Jane Hutt: Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r cynllun grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion yn allweddol i hyn. Ar hyn o bryd mae dau gynllun lle y gall awdurdodau lleol gael grantiau: y cynllun grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion gwerth £9 miliwn, a roddir i bob awdurdod lleol i'w ddefnyddio rhwng 2005 a 2010; a'r cynllun fformiwla lle y caiff awdurdodau grant canran. Yn y cyswllt hwnnw, mae'r cyfleoedd i wella hwylustod ysgolion yn gynyddol i blant anabl yn allweddol, ac mae hynny'n ddyletswydd arnom ers 2003.

Hygyrchedd Gwasanaethau Accessibility of Services

Q7 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the accessibility of services for disabled people in Wales? OAQ0290(BM)

Jane Hutt: I recently launched the National AIDS Trust guide, 'HIV and your Disability Equality Scheme', aimed at public sector employers. The booklet gives practical

C7 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog wneud datganiad am hwylustod gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl anabl yng Nghymru? OAQ0290 (BM)

Jane Hutt: Yn ddiweddar lansiais ganllaw'r Ymddiriedolaeth AIDS Genedlaethol, 'HIV and your Disability Equality Scheme', sy'n anelu at gyflogwyr y sector cyhoeddus.

advice on how to meet effectively the needs of people living with HIV when preparing and finalising disability equality schemes.

William Graham: Thank you for your answer, Minister. You will recall that I questioned you previously on the report, 'Mind the Gap', from the Leonard Cheshire Foundation. It stated that 23 per cent of respondents had had to turn down a job because transport was inaccessible. Have you been able to make any progress on giving advice to people or on providing grants to enable people to attend interviews and take up employment, even when they are disabled?

Jane Hutt: We are making great progress as far as that is concerned. The transport grant is available to fund integrated transport packages, which must address accessibility issues, such as improving bus stop infrastructure to allow travellers to board low-floored buses, for example. We also have the Public Service Vehicle Accessibility Regulations 2000 and the community transport projects, which provide £9.4 million to local authorities through the local transport services grant to subsidise bus and community transport services. The free and concessionary travel for elderly and disabled people is crucial. On the subject of access, we can also talk about stations and railways, but the key point is that the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 ensures that we look at access to transport, and I believe that 'Mind the Gap' has been very influential in that respect.

Catherine Thomas: I have recently launched a petition against increases in car parking charges at Prince Philip Hospital in Llanelli, along with members of the committee for the improvement of hospital services. Do you share my concern and theirs that such increases have an impact on the most vulnerable people in society? Among them are many of my disabled constituents, some of whom visit Prince Philip Hospital several times a week, either to receive treatment or to visit friends and family who are in-patients. Many of them are forced to pay for car

Mae'r llyfryn yn rhoi cyngor ymarferol ar ddiwallu'n effeithiol anghenion pobl sy'n byw gydag HIV wrth baratoi a chwblau cynlluniau cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl.

William Graham: Diolch ichi am eich ateb, Weinidog. Byddwch yn cofio imi eich holi o'r blaen am adroddiad 'Mind the Gap' gan Sefydliad Leonard Cheshire. Dywedai fod 23 y cant o ymatebwyr wedi gorfod gwrthod swydd am nad oedd dulliau cludiant hwylus ar gael iddynt. A ydych wedi gallu gwneud unrhyw gynnydd i roi cyngor i bobl neu roi grantiau i alluogi pobl i fynd i gyfweliadau a derbyn gwaith, hyd yn oed os ydynt yn anabl?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd gwych o ran hynny. Mae'r grant cludiant ar gael i ariannu pecynnau trafniadaeth integredig, sy'n gorfod mynd i'r afael â materion hwylustod, megis gwella seilwaith arosfannau bysiau i alluogi teithwyr i fynd i mewn i fysiau llawr isel, er enghraifft. Mae Rheoliadau Hygyrchedd Cerbydau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus 2000 gennym hefyd yn ogystal â'r prosiectau cludiant cymunedol, sy'n rhoi £9.4 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol drwy'r grant gwasanaethau cludiant lleol i ddarparu cymhorthdal ar gyfer gwasanaethau bysiau a chludiant cymunedol. Mae teithio am ddim a thocynnau mantais i'r henoed a'r anabl yn hanfodol. O ran gallu cael cludiant, gallwn hefyd sôn am orsafoedd a rheilffyrdd, ond y pwynt allweddol yw bod y Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 1995 yn sicrhau ein bod yn edrych ar allu cael cludiant, a chredaf fod 'Mind the Gap' wedi bod yn ddylanwadol iawn yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

Catherine Thomas: Yn ddiweddar lansiais ddeiseb yn erbyn cynyddu costau parcio yn Ysbyty Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli, ynghyd ag aelodau o'r pwyllgor ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau ysbyty. A ydych chi, fel finnau a'r aelodau, yn pryderu bod codiadau felly yn cael effaith ar y bobl mewn cymdeithas sydd fwyaf agored i niwed? Yn eu plith mae nifer o'm hetholwyr anabl, rai ohonynt yn ymweld ag Ysbyty Tywysog Philip lawer gwaith yr wythnos, naill ai i gael triniaeth neu i ymweld â ffrindiau neu deulu sy'n gleifion mewnol. Mae nifer yn cael eu gorfodi i dalu

parking because there are not sufficient disabled parking bays in the hospital. Indeed, there are nowhere near enough bays. Do you agree with me that this is unacceptable and that it affects their access to key services?

Jane Hutt: These decisions are made by local health bodies, but it is an issue across Wales. I am sure that, in all of our surgeries, the matter has been raised. Some car parking arrangements involve PFI contracts. That is the case locally. Those bodies must look at the Disability Discrimination Act 1995. I hope that, with regard to their disability equality schemes, they are looking at those very issues for disabled people accessing local health services.

Christine Chapman: To pursue the issue of transport, we know that the visually impaired in Wales are often confronted with a lack of safe pedestrian crossing facilities, despite legislation that requires them to be in place. Without safe and reliable pedestrian crossings, visually impaired people are unable to travel independently in order to access employment, healthcare and other basic services. What can the Welsh Assembly Government do to ensure that legislation requiring safe pedestrian crossings is implemented by local authorities? Secondly—and I know that the responsibility for this lies in Westminster—I would like to know whether the Minister supports the Royal National Institute for the Blind's campaign to change the disability living allowance for the visually impaired.

Jane Hutt: With regard to the opportunities that we have with the disability equality schemes and the duties that we now have in every public sector body, I am sure that this now has to come to the forefront with regard to accessibility in our streets as well as in relation to transport. The RNIB campaign needs to be acknowledged and welcomed. This is not a devolved matter, but I am sure that the evidence can be presented to the UK Government, and I am sure that it will have an impact.

am barcio car gan nad oes digon o gilfannau parcio i bobl anabl yn yr ysbyty. Yn wir, nid oes hanner digon o gilfannau. A ydych yn cytuno â mi fod hyn yn annerbyniol ac yn effeithio ar eu gallu i gael gwasanaethau allweddol?

Jane Hutt: Gwneir y penderfyniadau hyn gan gyrff iechyd lleol, ond mae'n broblem ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y mater wedi ei godi yng nghymorthfeydd pob un ohonom. Mae rhai trefniadau parcio ceir yn cynnwys contractau o dan y Fenter Cyllid Preifat. Dyna yw'r achos yn lleol. Rhaid i'r cyrff hynny edrych ar y Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 1995. Gobeithio, o ran eu cynlluniau cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl, eu bod yn edrych ar yr union faterion hynny ar gyfer pobl anabl sydd am allu cael gwasanaethau iechyd lleol.

Christine Chapman: I barhau gyda mater cludiant, gwyddom fod pobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg yng Nghymru yn aml yn wynebu diffyg cyfleusterau croesi diogel i gerddwyr, er gwaethaf deddfwriaeth sy'n eu gwneud yn ofynnol. Heb groesfannau diogel a dibynadwy i gerddwyr, ni all pobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg deithio'n annibynnol i gael cyflogaeth, gofal iechyd a gwasanaethau sylfaenol eraill. Beth all Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud i sicrhau bod deddfwriaeth, sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol darparu croesfannau diogel i gerddwyr, yn cael ei gweithredu gan awdurdodau lleol? Yn ail—a gwn mai San Steffan sy'n gyfrifol am hyn—hoffwn wybod a yw'r Gweinidog yn cefnogi ymgyrch Cymdeithas Frenhinol Genedlaethol y Deillion i newid y lwfans byw i'r anabl ar gyfer pobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg.

Jane Hutt: O ran y cyfleoedd sydd gennym gyda'r cynlluniau cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl a'r dyletswyddau sydd arnom yn awr ym mhob corff yn y sector cyhoeddus, yr wyf yn siŵr fod yn rhaid i'r mater hwn yn awr gael blaenoriaeth o ran hwylustod ar ein strydoedd yn ogystal ag o ran cludiant. Mae angen cydnabod a chroesawu ymgyrch RNIB. Nid yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gellir cyflwyno'r dystiolaeth i Lywodraeth y DU, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff effaith.

Yr Ail Gynulliad
The Second Assembly

Q8 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister provide an assessment of the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to achieving openness and transparency in Government during the second Assembly? OAQ0295(BM)

Jane Hutt: Since implementing the third edition of our code of practice, the Assembly Government has responded to more than 1,400 requests for information, including information on complex requests. I am pleased that we have been able to respond to these.

4.00 p.m.

Lisa Francis: The last time I asked you a question on open government, Minister, you told me that there were many avenues open to Assembly Members to retrieve information, including access to Ministers through work on committees, written and oral questions, correspondence, and the Members' research service. However, a particular difficulty for me at that time was that the Members' research service had been instructed not to pass on any information without the sanction of the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks. That was the second time that it had happened in less than four months. You said that I had every opportunity to raise issues with the Minister, which was testament to open Government, but if he will not sanction the release of information, where does that leave us?

Jane Hutt: As I said last time, officials can answer the vast majority of inquiries to the Members' research service without informing Ministers. However, where Members have sought to obtain copies of documents via the research service, it has then been necessary to make appropriate decisions about releasing them. Ministers will be provided with the opportunity to note the release of information to the Members' research service before disclosure, which is as it should be.

Janet Davies: Minister, I recently heard a

C8 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddarparu asesiad o ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod yn agored ac yn eglur yn ystod yr ail Gynulliad? OAQ0295(BM)

Jane Hutt: Ers gweithredu trydydd rhifyn ein cod ymarfer, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymateb i fwy na 1,400 o geisiadau am wybodaeth, gan gynnwys gwybodaeth am geisiadau cymhleth. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gallu ymateb i'r rhain.

Lisa Francis: Y tro diwethaf pan ofynnais gwestiwn i chi ynglŷn â llywodraeth agored, Weinidog, dywedasoch wrthyf fod nifer o ffynonellau ar gael i Aelodau'r Cynulliad allu cael gafael ar wybodaeth, gan gynnwys cysylltu â Gweinidogion drwy waith ar bwyllgorau, cwestiynau ysgrifenedig a llafar, gohebiaeth a gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau. Fodd bynnag, anhawster arbennig imi ar y pryd oedd y ffaith fod gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau wedi cael cyfarwyddyd i beidio â throsglwyddo unrhyw wybodaeth heb gydsyniad y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau. Dyma'r eildro i hyn ddigwydd mewn llai na phedwar mis. Dywedasoch fod gennyf bob cyfle i godi materion gyda'r Gweinidog, a oedd yn dystiolaeth glir o Lywodraeth agored. Ond os nad yw'n cydsynio i ryddhau gwybodaeth, beth yw ein sefyllfa wedyn?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais y tro diwethaf, gall swyddogion ateb y mwyafrif helaeth o ymholiadau i wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau heb roi gwybod i Weinidogion. Fodd bynnag, lle mae Aelodau wedi ceisio cael gafael ar gopiau o ddogfennau drwy gyfrwng y gwasanaeth ymchwil, mae wedi bod yn ofynnol wedyn i wneud penderfyniadau priodol ynghylch eu rhyddhau. Rhoddir cyfle i Weinidogion nodi rhyddhau gwybodaeth i wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau cyn ei datgelu, a dyna a ddylai ddigwydd.

Janet Davies: Weinidog, clywais ddatganiad

statement by Peter Hain, the Secretary of State for Wales, that the work of our civil servants here is affected by parochialism. I presume that he included those front-line civil servants who are unacceptably threatened by job losses. Do you agree with Peter Hain that our civil servants are parochial, and do you think that such statements contribute to open and transparent government?

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister has no responsibility for the Secretary of State. The Secretary of State will be here soon, and he may have an opportunity to answer for himself, if he catches my eye.

Michael German: Minister, in the interests of transparency and openness, will you give the Assembly a commitment that when new money is announced for any project whatsoever, we will hear about it only once, and not at subsequent times clothed in other projects?

Jane Hutt: We are moving into political mischief-making time. I will not be going back to chucking allegations around. What is important is that the public hears these announcements and that there is clarity about them, because it is public money being spent as a result of Welsh Assembly Government decisions. That is what the people of Wales want to know.

yn ddiweddar gan Peter Hain, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, fod plwyfoldeb yn effeithio ar waith ein gweision sifil yma. Cymeraf ei fod yn cynnwys y gweision sifil hynny yn y rheng flaen sy'n wynebu bygythiad annerbyniol o golli eu swyddi. A ydych yn cytuno â Peter Hain fod ein gweision sifil yn blwyfol, ac a ydych yn credu bod datganiadau felly'n cyfrannu at lywodraeth agored ac eglur?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yma'n fuan, ac efallai y caiff gyfle i ateb drosto'i hun, os llwydda i dynnu fy sylw.

Michael German: Weinidog, er mwyn bod yn eglur ac agored, a roddwch ymrwymiad i'r Cynulliad mai unwaith yn unig y cawn glywed cyhoeddiad am arian newydd ar gyfer unrhyw fath o brosiect, ac nid ar adegau wedyn dan gochl prosiectau eraill?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn mentro i dir creu cynnen wleidyddol. Nid wyf am glywed honiadau di-sail eto. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod y cyhoedd yn clywed y cyhoeddiadau hyn a bod eglurder amdanynt, oherwydd arian cyhoeddus sy'n cael ei wario o ganlyniad i benderfyniadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Dyna y mae pobl Cymru am ei wybod.

Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Hil Racial Discrimination

Q11 Jenny Randerson: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to tackle racial discrimination? OAQ0296(BM)

Jane Hutt: Our race equality scheme commits us to promoting race equality. Our annual report demonstrates how we are working to deliver a better Wales, where people of all races have equality of opportunity in all spheres of their lives.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, the press stories this week about a former Conservative candidate in Swansea and the passing of racist e-mails brought to mind the issue that we have on—

C11 Jenny Randerson: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â gwahaniaethu ar sail hil? OAQ0296(BM)

Jane Hutt: Mae ein cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol yn ein hymrwymo i hybu cydraddoldeb hiliol. Mae ein hadroddiad blynyddol yn dangos sut yr ydym yn gweithio tuag at Gymru well, lle caiff pobl o bob hil gyfle cyfartal ym mhob agwedd ar eu bywydau.

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, mae'r straeon yn y wasg yr wythnos hon ynghylch cyn ymgeisydd Ceidwadol yn Abertawe a throsglwyddo e-byst hiliol wedi dwyn i gof yr hyn sydd gennym dan sylw ynghylch—

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Jenny Randerson: There is a point to this, Presiding Officer.

Jenny Randerson: Mae diben i hyn, Lywydd.

The Presiding Officer: Yes, but the Minister—

Y Llywydd: Ie, ond mae'r Gweinidog—

Jenny Randerson: I will start again.

Jenny Randerson: Dechreuaf eto.

The Presiding Officer: Yes, that might be a good idea, because I do not want to enter into the great Michael Martin trap.

Y Llywydd: Byddai hynny'n syniad da, oherwydd nid wyf am syrthio i fagl Michael Martin.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, at the time of the last election, there was a cross-party agreement signed by the leaders of all the mainstream parties—I believe, with great willingness—that candidates would not participate in any kind of campaigning that had racist overtones—or, indeed, undertones. Will you facilitate a similar agreement again, which I hope will include our independent colleagues, so that we can have an election campaign for the new Assembly next April and May that is free from any kind of racism?

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, adeg yr etholiad diwethaf, cafwyd cytundeb trawsbleidiol a lofnodwyd gan arweinwyr y prif bleidiau—gyda pharodrwydd mawr, mi gredaf—na fyddai unrhyw ymgeiswyr yn ymgymryd ag unrhyw ymgyrchu ag iddo arlliw hiliol o unrhyw fath. A wnewch chi hwyluso cytundeb tebyg unwaith eto, a fydd, gobeithio, yn cynnwys ein cyd-Aelodau annibynnol, fel y cawn ymgyrch etholiadol ar gyfer y Cynulliad newydd fis Ebrill a Mai nesaf sy'n rhydd o unrhyw fath o hiliaeth?

Jane Hutt: Thank you for that positive question, Jenny. It reflects what we were discussing earlier about the importance of cross-party agreement, with all the leaders involved in our faith communities forum, chaired by the First Minister. I am sure that this will be an issue that the forum will want to address and take forward to show that, as far as Wales is concerned, we believe strongly that the election should be an opportunity to promote inclusion, the diversity and the opportunities that we have across Wales, from people of all races and backgrounds. We will certainly take that forward.

Jane Hutt: Diolch am y cwestiwn cadarnhaol hwnnw, Jenny. Mae'n adlewyrchu'r hyn yr oeddem yn ei drafod yn gynharach ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd cytundeb trawsbleidiol, gyda'r holl arweinwyr sy'n ymwneud â'n fforwm cymunedau ffydd o dan gadeiryddiaeth y Prif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hwn yn fater yr hoffai'r fforwm fynd i'r afael ag ef a'i ddatblygu er mwyn dangos, o safbwynt Cymru, ein bod yn credu'n gryf y dylai'r etholiad fod yn gyfle i hyrwyddo cynhwysiant, amrywiaeth a'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael ledled Cymru, gan bobl o bob hil a chefnidir. Byddwn yn sicr yn datblygu hynny.

Cydraddoldeb i Bobl Anabl Equality for Disabled People

Q12 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make a statement on her policies for promoting equality for disabled people in Wales? OAQ0299(BM)

C12 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei pholisïau i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yng Nghymru? OAQ0299(BM)

Jane Hutt: The new statutory disability equality scheme has been developed working with disabled people, and a practical example

Jane Hutt: Datblygwyd y cynllun cydraddoldeb anabledd statudol newydd drwy weithio gyda phobl anabl, ac enghraifft

is the £2.7 million-worth funding provided by the Assembly Government and the European social fund for the BSL Futures interpreter apprentice scheme in Wales.

ymarferol yw'r £2.7 miliwn a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd ar gyfer y cynllun prentisiaeth dehonglydd BSL Futures yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: Has the Minister made any efforts regarding access to polling stations? At the time of the last Assembly elections, three quarters of them were inaccessible to disabled people. That is a startling statistic—worrying on democratic grounds, but particularly on the grounds of helping disabled people. What efforts have you made to ensure that we reduce that figure to zero?

Nick Bourne: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud unrhyw ymdrechion o ran mynediad i orsafoedd pleidleisio? Adeg etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad, nid oedd tri chwarter ohonynt yn hwylus i bobl anabl. Mae hynny'n ystadegyn syfrdanol—mae'n peri pryder ar sail ddemocrataidd, ond yn enwedig o safbwynt helpu pobl anabl. Pa ymdrechion a wnaed gennych i sicrhau ein bod yn dod â'r ffigur hwnnw i lawr i ddim?

Jane Hutt: The Local Government and Public Services Committee has addressed this issue, and Scope Cymru has launched and run an important, vigorous and successful campaign. This is the responsibility of local authorities and the returning officers, but, again, we will be looking at this in the run-up to the forthcoming election.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus wedi mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, ac mae Scope Cymru wedi lansio a rhedeg ymgyrch bwysig, grymus a llwyddiannus. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol a'r swyddogion canlyniadau yw hyn, ond unwaith eto, byddwn yn edrych ar hyn yn y cyfnod cyn yr etholiad sydd i ddod.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister.

Are you ready for the business statement? I see that you are.

A ydych yn barod am y datganiad busnes? Gwelaf eich bod.

Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I come forward with the revised business statement in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 5.4 and 5.5. The draft statement can be found on the Chamberweb under 'supporting documents'.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cyflwynaf y datganiad busnes diwygiedig yn unol â Gorchmynion Sefydlog Rhifau 5.4 a 5.5. Gwelir y datganiad drafft ar we'r Siambr o dan 'dogfennau ategol'.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10, so I ask the Minister to propose the business statement formally.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the revised business statement.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes diwygiedig.

Lisa Francis: We have seen the revised

Lisa Francis: Yr ydym wedi gweld y

business statement, Minister, but we cannot support it, because you have not come forward with an oral statement on the Wales Screen Commission. If your Government dissolves the Wales Screen Commission in its present form, it will be playing with a house of cards. That is our belief; the Minister for economic development has a different belief. He says that, apparently, there are economically justifiable reasons for these plans. If that is the case, he will not mind coming to the Assembly to be accountable, open and transparent about what those plans are. We are asking today for an oral statement on the Wales Screen Commission for a second time. What has the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks got to hide? Why can he not come here and tell us how he feels the Wales Screen Commission has failed? Why can he not tell us what he thinks that it has done wrong? We will not be supporting the business statement today.

Kirsty Williams: As Lisa has just said, the basis on which we voted against the business statement yesterday, and the reason why it failed, was because of the absence of an oral statement on the Wales Screen Commission. Therefore, the Minister can hardly be surprised today that not including it in her business statement has not somehow elicited the support of Assembly Members. I do not know what Plaid Cymru is doing. It did not support the business statement yesterday because of the absence of that statement, so I do not know why it feels that it can support the revised business statement today, but then that is a matter for—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Business Minister has no responsibility for Plaid Cymru.

Kirsty Williams: Not yet. I accept that, at this precise instance, the Business Minister does not have any say-so over the goings-on in Plaid Cymru—and you would know more than most what that is like, Presiding Officer.

The Presiding Officer: Order. As Assembly Members know well, I play very little part in the affairs of Plaid Cymru, and certainly none when I am sitting here.

datganiad busnes diwygiedig, Weinidog, ond ni allwn ei gefnogi oherwydd nid ydych wedi rhoi datganiad llafar ar Gomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru. Os bydd eich Llywodraeth yn diddymu Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru yn ei ffurf bresennol, bydd yn adeiladu tŷ ar dywod. Dyna a gredwn ni; mae'r Gweinidog dros ddatblygiad economaidd yn credu'n wahanol. Mae'n dweud, mae'n debyg, fod rhesymau gyda chyfiawnhad economaidd dros y cynlluniau hyn. Os felly, ni fydd gwahaniaeth ganddo ddod i'r Cynulliad i fod yn atebol, yn agored ac yn eglur ynghylch y cynlluniau hynny. Gofynnwn heddiw am ddatganiad llafar ar Gomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru am yr eildro. Beth sydd gan y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau i'w guddio? Pam na all ddod yma a dweud wrthym sut y mae'n teimlo mae Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru wedi methu? Pam na all ddweud wrthym beth y mae'n credu ei fod wedi'i wneud o'i le? Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r datganiad busnes heddiw.

Kirsty Williams: Fel y dywedodd Lisa, sail ein gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes ddoe, a'r rheswm y bu iddo fethu, oedd diffyg datganiad llafar ar Gomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru. Felly, ni ddylai'r Gweinidog synnu heddiw nad yw'r ffaith iddi fethu â'i gynnwys yn ei datganiad busnes rywsut wedi ennyn cefnogaeth Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Ni wn beth y mae Plaid Cymru yn ei wneud. Ni chefnogodd y datganiad busnes ddoe oherwydd absenoldeb y datganiad hwnnw, felly, ni wn pam y mae'n teimlo y gall gefnogi'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig heddiw, ond mae hynny'n fater i—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r Trefnydd yn gyfrifol am Blaid Cymru.

Kirsty Williams: Ddim eto. Derbyniaf, ar yr union adeg hon, nad oes gan y Trefnydd ddylanwad dros yr hyn sy'n digwydd ym Mhlaid Cymru—a gwyddoch chi yn well na'r mwyafrif am hynny, Lywydd.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Fel y gŵyr Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dda, ni chwaraeaf fawr o ran ym materion Plaid Cymru, ac yn sicr ddim tra byddaf yn eistedd yma.

Kirsty Williams: I could not agree more, Presiding Officer.

The Business Minister, therefore, cannot be surprised that we are not supporting the revised business statement today. The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks answered some questions this afternoon, but that is no substitute for an opportunity to clearly examine the issues involved. In fact, his performance this afternoon raised more questions than were answered. Therefore, we are not able to support this statement.

Helen Mary Jones: I have no idea what we have done to make Kirsty Williams so grumpy; I am sorry that she is in such a bad mood. I reiterate your point, Presiding Officer, that there are three opposition parties, as well as independent Members, in the Chamber, and we are under no obligation always to act in accord, particularly when we happen not to agree.

4.10 p.m.

We share the regret that there is no statement on the Wales Screen Commission and I further feel—

Kirsty Williams *rose*—

Helen Mary Jones: As far as I am aware, Presiding Officer, it is not possible to make interventions in these situations.

The Presiding Officer: Was someone trying to make one?

Helen Mary Jones: Yes, the Liberal Democrats' slightly grumpy business manager. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Then she should sit down forthwith.

Helen Mary Jones: I would happily give way to her, but, as I understand it, I am not allowed to do that. We regret the fact that there is no statement, and we regret it even more after the Minister's unsatisfactory replies to the questions of Alun Ffred Jones, Eleanor Burnham and others. I ask the Minister to reconsider the moderate request

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr, Lywydd.

Felly, ni ddylai'r Trefnydd synnu nad ydym yn cefnogi'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig heddiw. Atebodd y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau rai cwestiynau y prynhawn yma, ond nid yw hynny cystal â chyfle i edrych yn fanwl ar y materion dan sylw. Yn wir, yr oedd ei berfformiad y prynhawn yma yn codi mwy o gwestiynau nag a atebwyd, Felly, ni allwn gefnogi'r datganiad hwn.

Helen Mary Jones: Nid oes gennyf syniad beth yr ydym wedi ei wneud i Kirsty Williams fod mor bigog; mae'n flin gennyf ei bod mewn tymer mor ddrwg. Ategaf eich pwynt, Lywydd, fod yna dair gwrthblaid, yn ogystal ag Aelodau annibynnol, yn y Siambr, ac nid oes rheidrwydd arnom i weithredu'n gyfûn, yn enwedig pan nad ydym yn cytuno.

Yr ydym ni hefyd yn gresynu nad oes datganiad ar Gomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru a theimlaf hefyd—

Kirsty Williams *a gododd*—

Helen Mary Jones: Cyhyd ag y gwn i, Lywydd, nid yw'n bosibl ymyrryd yn y sefyllfaoedd hyn.

Y Llywydd: A oedd rhywun yn ceisio ymyrryd?

Helen Mary Jones: Oedd, trefnydd pigog y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Yna dylai eistedd ar ei hunion.

Helen Mary Jones: Byddwn yn hollol fodlon ildio iddi, ond yn ôl a ddeallaf, ni chaniateir imi wneud hynny. Gresynwn nad oes datganiad, a gresynwn yn fwy byth at hynny ar ôl clywed ymatebion anfoddhaol y Gweinidog i gwestiynau Alun Ffred Jones, Eleanor Burnham, ac eraill. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried y cais rhesymol a

that Alun Ffred Jones made for him to bring his evidence for this action to the committee, which might be the most appropriate forum for that discussion. We regret that he has not agreed to that.

I have one further request to make to the Business Minister, who will be aware that there has been some misunderstanding about whether the debate on hospital reconfiguration next week is to be a debate on 'Designed to Deliver', which is the reconfiguration for Mid and West Wales alone, or on the national reconfiguration programme, which falls out of 'Designed for Life'. We would submit that an hour's debate would have been adequate for 'Designed to Deliver' on Mid and West Wales, but it is not adequate time to debate the whole national programme. I ask the Business Minister to consider extending the time allocated for that debate, as many Members from all parties will want to raise issues of concern to them.

We have some concerns about this business statement, and we will not be able to support it. We are anxious that the Assembly should spend time debating business, rather than debating what that business might be, so, on this occasion, we will neither support nor oppose it, in the hope that the Business Minister will take it as a token of good faith and will show a little more willingness than she does sometimes when we make such requests.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I never expected this to be such an entertaining event, from the goings-on in Plaid Cymru to the comment that opposition parties are not always required to work together. This has been a significant business statement, and I am grateful to my colleagues in Plaid Cymru for recognising that I have responded to the issues, and that the Minister did stand up and answer questions from Eleanor Burnham. He answered them fully, as he always does, does he not, Llywydd? He always answers his questions very fully—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I want to hear the Minister's reply.

Jane Hutt: He answered the questions fully.

wnaeth Alun Ffred Jones iddo ddod â'i dystiolaeth dros y weithred hon i'r pwyllgor. Efallai mai hwnnw fyddai'r fforwm mwyaf priodol ar gyfer y drafodaeth honno. Gresyn nad yw wedi cytuno i wneud hynny.

Mae gennyf un cais pellach i'w wneud i'r Trefnydd, a fydd yn ymwybodol o ychydig gamddealltwriaeth ynghylch ai dadl ar 'Cynlluniwyd i'w Gyflawni' fydd y ddadl ar ailgyflunio ysbytai yr wythnos nesaf, sef ailgyfluniad ar gyfer y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin yn unig, neu'r rhaglen ailgyflunio genedlaethol a deillio o 'Cynllun Oes'. Cynigiwn y byddai dadl awr yn ddigon ar gyfer 'Cynlluniwyd i'w Gyflawni' ar y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, ond nid yw'n ddigon i drafod y rhaglen genedlaethol i gyd. Gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd ystyried ymestyn yr amser a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y ddadl honno, oherwydd bydd nifer o Aelodau o bob plaid yn dymuno codi materion sy'n peri pryder iddynt hwy.

Yr ydym ychydig yn bryderus am y datganiad busnes hwn, ac ni fyddwn yn gallu ei gefnogi. Credwn y dylai'r Cynulliad dreulio amser yn trafod busnes yn hytrach na thrafod beth y gallai'r busnes hwnnw fod. Felly, y tro hwn, ni fyddwn yn ei gefnogi nac yn ei wrthwynebu yn y gobaith y bydd y Trefnydd yn derbyn hynny fel arwydd o ewyllys da, ac yn dangos ychydig mwy o barodrwydd nag a welwn weithiau pan wnawn geisiadau o'r fath.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Nid oeddwn wedi disgwyl i hyn fod yn gymaint o hwyl, o'r digwyddiadau ym Mhlaid Cymru i'r sylw nad oes disgwyl i'r gwrthbleidiau gydweithio bob amser. Mae hwn wedi bod yn ddatganiad busnes arwyddocaol, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelodau ym Mhlaid Cymru am gydnabod fy mod wedi ymateb i'r materion, a bod y Gweinidog wedi codi i ateb cwestiynau gan Eleanor Burnham. Fe'u hatebodd yn llawn, fel y gwnaiff bob amser, oni chytunwch, Lywydd? Mae'n ateb ei gwestiynau'n llawn iawn bob amser—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf am glywed ateb y Gweinidog.

Jane Hutt: Atebodd y cwestiynau'n llawn.

I take on board the issues that have been raised and the request about the Wales Screen Commission. It is not an urgent issue requiring an oral statement, but I realise that the point made by Alun Ffred was a request to the Minister in relation to the evidence. I am sure that that will be provided. We have the Minister's assurance that that will come through—even though he cannot intervene to give it.

In terms of the important debate next week, it would disenfranchise parts of Wales if we focused on just one part, with 'Designed to Deliver'. I think that we originally thought that that was on the whole of the reconfiguration. I give my commitment to extending the debate as necessary if requested, given the importance of having a full debate on these key issues.

Yr wyf yn derbyn y materion a godwyd a'r cais ynglŷn â Chomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru. Nid yw'n fater brys sy'n gofyn am ddatganiad llafar, ond sylweddolaf mai cais i'r Gweinidog oedd y pwynt a wnaed gan Alun Ffred mewn perthynas â'r dystiolaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr y darperir hynny. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi sicrwydd inni y daw hynny—er na all ymyrryd i'w roi.

O ran y ddadl bwysig yr wythnos nesaf, byddai'n difreinio rhannau o Gymru pe baem yn canolbwyntio ar un rhan yn unig, gyda 'Cynlluniwyd i'w Gyflawni'. Credaf ein bod yn meddwl yn wreiddiol mai ymwneud â'r ailgyfluniad i gyd yr oedd hynny. Rhoddaf fy ymrwymiad i ymestyn y ddadl yn ôl yr angen os gwneir cais, o gofio pwysigrwydd cael dadl lawn ar y materion allweddol hyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 16.
Motion: For 29, Abstain 8, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Elin
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Defaid a Geifr (Cofnodion, Adnabod a Symud)
 (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
 Approval of the Sheep and Goats (Records, Identification and Movement)
 (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Sheep and Goats (Records, Identification and Movement) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2006. (NDM3297)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006 in relation to the draft the Sheep and Goats (Records, Identification and Movement) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Sheep and Goats (Records, Identification and Movement) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2006;

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006; and

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 23 October 2006. (NDM3298)

This Order amends the original Sheep and Goats (Records, Identification and Movement) (Wales) (Amendment) Order

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Defaid a Geifr (Cofnodion, Adnabod a Symud) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2006. (NDM3297)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Defaid a Geifr (Cofnodion, Adnabod a Symud) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Defaid a Geifr (Cofnodion, Adnabod a Symud) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2006;

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006, ac

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Hydref 2006. (NDM3298)

Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn diwygio'r Gorchymyn Defaid a Geifr (Cofnodion, Adnabod a Symud) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006

2006, which was approved in Plenary last year, and introduces three technical changes to that legislation.

Jocelyn Davies: Plaid Cymru will support the regulations, but I take this opportunity to make one or two points, because Plaid Cymru is aware of the problems that lie ahead for the industry if double tagging is enforced. We are concerned about the obvious animal welfare issues, and would therefore urge the Minister to ensure that there is an extension to the current derogation from EU rules. We know, from the Minister, that the introduction of electronic identification is inevitable, and we therefore ask him to provide regular updates on progress and to give clarification of the introduction dates.

Brynle Williams: We also agree with Plaid and support this. The extension of the derogation for double tagging is to be welcomed and I hope that the Minister will do everything in his power to ensure that this is secured on a permanent basis—well, I know that it will not be permanent.

It is also worth considering future identification methods for Wales. Not too far away is electronic tagging, which Jocelyn mentioned. A serious question needs to be asked about when it will be practicable. On paper, there is a reasonable argument for electronic tagging, but this is not borne out in the real world. Apart from the extra cost that it will mean for the industry, electronic tagging is still several years away from being able to work under anything other than controlled test conditions. When the technology has been tried and tested in upland farming conditions, it has failed to work anywhere near well enough to justify its roll-out. I ask the Minister to provide assurance that electronic tagging will not be used in Wales before the technology is fit for purpose and can deliver tangible benefits for its cost.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support this legislation. I would like to reinforce the issue of welfare that was raised by Jocelyn Davies, as I have raised this issue with you before, Minister, to no avail. I have asked you previously to provide us with

gwreiddiol a gymeradwywyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn y llynedd, ac y mae'n cyflwyno tri newid technegol yn y ddeddfwriaeth honno.

Jocelyn Davies: Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau, ond achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i wneud un neu ddau o bwyntiau oherwydd bod Plaid Cymru yn ymwybodol o'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant os caiff tagio dwbl ei orfodi. Yr ydym yn bryderus ynghylch y materion lles anifeiliaid amlwg, ac felly byddem yn pwysu ar y Gweinidog i sicrhau y bydd estyniad i'r rhanddirymiad presennol o reolau'r UE. Gwyddom, gan y Gweinidog, fod cyflwyno tagiau electronig yn anochel, ac felly gofynnwn iddo roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni yn rheolaidd am y cynnydd ac egluro'r dyddiadau cyflwyno.

Brynle Williams: Yr ydym ni hefyd yn cytuno â Phlaid Cymru ac yn cefnogi hyn. Mae ymestyn rhanddirymiad tagio dwbl i'w groesawu, a gobeithio y gwnaiff y Gweinidog bopeth o fewn ei allu i sicrhau y caiff hyn ei sicrhau'n barhaol—wel, gwn na fydd yn barhaol.

Mae hefyd yn werth ystyried dulliau adnabod ar gyfer y dyfodol yng Nghymru. Nid yw tagio electronig, y cyfeiriodd Jocelyn ato, mor bell i ffwrdd â hynny. Mae'n rhaid gofyn cwestiwn difrifol pryd y bydd yn ymarferol. Ar bapur, mae dadl resymol o blaid tagio electronig, ond nid yw hyn yn dal dŵr yn y byd go iawn. Ar wahân i'r costau ychwanegol a olygir i'r diwydiant, mae tagio electronig yn dal flynyddoedd i ffwrdd o allu gweithio o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau ac eithrio amodau prawf rheoledig. O'i phrofi o dan amodau ffermio mynydd, mae'r dechnoleg wedi methu â gweithio'n ddigon da o'r hanner i gyfiawnhau ei chyflwyno. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog sicrhau na chaiff tagio electronig ei ddefnyddio yng Nghymru cyn y bydd y dechnoleg yn addas i'r diben, ac y gall sicrhau manteision pendant am y gost.

Mick Bates: Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Hoffwn atgyfnerthu'r mater lles a gododd Jocelyn Davies, ac yr wyf wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda chi eisoes, Weinidog, ond yn ofer. Yr wyf wedi gofyn

information about the welfare of animals that are subject to double tagging and, under this legislation, to replacement tags as well. There are cases where animals are suffering because of the tagging regime, and that applies more pressure for the introduction of an electronic identification system. As my good friend, Brynle Williams, has just said, we are led to believe that the system is not yet robust enough to work in the field. It would be helpful to the industry were you to make a statement about the electronic identification systems and how the field trials are working out, so that the industry can see the end of double tagging, which has welfare implications.

The other issue that I would like to raise is that we obviously want to support the export trade and while the cost-benefit analysis shows that the industry will bear an extra cost burden, I am concerned that the people who put together consignments of lambs seem to be in a strange position. Could you explain whether they have to re-tag an animal that is brought out of a live market and put on a particular holding? Does that animal have to be tagged on the holding before it receives another tag for export? It could be that, in the process of movement for export, the animal receives a tag on the holding where the consignment is put together and then a further tag for export. Would you confirm, or otherwise, that that is the necessary procedure to be followed by people who buy from live markets and want to export the animals?

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): On the point that Mick Bates raised, I will ensure that the Chief Veterinary Officer for Wales writes to him. It is not an issue that is relevant to the legislation, although clearly it is relevant to the principle. It is a technical question and the answer that he requires would best come from the chief veterinary officer.

The proposal at the moment is that electronic identification is to be introduced on 1 January 2008 across Europe. However, a report is to be submitted to the Council of Ministers before the final decision is taken. Our view, and the view of the entire UK, is that

ichi eisoes roi gwybodaeth inni am les anifeiliaid sy'n destun tagio dwbl ac, o dan y ddeddfwriaeth hon, tagiau newydd hefyd. Mae yna achosion lle mae anifeiliaid yn dioddef oherwydd y gyfundrefn dagio, ac mae hyn yn rhoi mwy o bwysau am gyflwyno system adnabod electronig. Fel y dywedodd fy nghyfaill, Brynle Williams, cawn ein harwain i gredu nad yw'r system yn ddigon cadarn ar hyn o bryd i weithio yn y maes. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol i'r diwydiant pe baech yn gwneud datganiad am systemau adnabod electronig a sut mae'r treialon maes yn datblygu, fel y gall y diwydiant weld diwedd i dagio dwbl, sydd â goblygiadau lles.

Y mater arall yr hoffwn ei godi yw ein bod yn amlwg am gefnogi'r fasnach allforio, ac er bod y dadansoddiad o'r fantais ariannol yn dangos y bydd baich costau ychwanegol ar y diwydiant, fy mhryder yw ei bod yn ymddangos y bydd pobl sy'n cyfuno llwythi o ŵyn mewn sefyllfa ryfedd. A allwch egluro a oes angen iddynt ail-dagio anifail sy'n cael ei dynnu o farchnad fyw a'i roi ar daliad arbennig? A oes angen tagio'r anifail hwnnw yn y daliad cyn cael ei dagio eto i'w allforio? Mae'n bosibl, o fewn y broses symud ar gyfer allforio, y caiff yr anifail ei dagio ar y daliad lle caiff y llwyth ei gasglu, a'i dagio eto i'w allforio. A wnewch chi gadarnhau, neu wadu, mai dyma'r weithdrefn angenrheidiol i'w dilyn gan bobl sy'n prynu o farchnadoedd byw ac sydd am allforio'r anifeiliaid?

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Ar y pwynt a gododd Mick Bates, byddaf yn sicrhau bod Prif Swyddog Milfeddygol Cymru yn ysgrifennu ato. Nid yw'n fater sy'n berthnasol i'r ddeddfwriaeth, er ei fod yn amlwg yn berthnasol i'r egwyddor. Cwestiwn technegol ydyw, a byddai'n well iddo gael yr ateb angenrheidiol gan y prif swyddog milfeddygol.

Y cynnig ar hyn o bryd yw bod dulliau tagio electronig i gael eu cyflwyno ledled Ewrop ar 1 Ionawr 2008. Fodd bynnag, caiff adroddiad ei gyflwyno i Gyngor y Gweinidogion cyn gwneud y penderfyniad terfynol. Ein barn ni, a barn y DU gyfan, yw na all tagio electronig

electronic identification is not yet able to work practically in Wales, the rest of the UK, the Republic of Ireland, or indeed in any other major sheep-meat producing member state. We continue to make that point to the European Union. There may well come a time when electronic identification is practicable; however, that that time is not now and it is difficult to see that happening between now and 2008. We have made that point carefully and strongly to the European Commission.

It is important to remember that the whole point of tagging is to ensure food safety and traceability for the consumer. We know that, in the aftermath of foot and mouth disease, it was impossible to track sheep; it was possible to track them through the livestock marts, but once they had left there, there was no way of knowing where they had gone. With cattle it was different, because of the cattle movement controls that have been in place since BSE. I emphasise to Members that it is important that we have robust traceability to be able to guarantee food safety and in selling what we produce on the world market. Traceability is worth money and the more traceable the product is, the better the price will be when it comes to selling the product.

4.20 p.m.

This legislation is also important because we need to ensure that we do what we can avoid losing the derogation that we already have, and I welcome the support that the other parties have promised.

weithio'n ymarferol yng Nghymru, gweddill y DU, Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, nac yn wir mewn unrhyw aelod wladwriaeth fawr arall sy'n cynhyrchu cig defaid. Yr ydym yn dal i gyfleu'r pwynt hwnnw i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Efallai y daw amser pan fydd tagio electronig yn ymarferol; fodd bynnag, nid nawr yw'r amser, ac mae'n anodd gweld hynny'n digwydd rhwng hyn a 2008. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r pwynt hwnnw'n ofalus ac yn gadarn i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

Mae'n bwysig cofio mai holl ddiben tagio yw sicrhau diogelwch bwyd i'r cwsmer ac y gellir ei olrhain. Gwyddom, yn dilyn clwy'r traed a'r genau, ei bod yn amhosibl cadw llygad ar ddefaid; yr oedd yn bosibl eu dilyn drwy'r marchnadoedd da byw, ond ar ôl gadael y marchnadoedd hynny nid oedd unrhyw fodd o wybod i ble yr oeddent wedi mynd. Yr oedd yn wahanol gyda gwartheg, oherwydd y rheolau symud gwartheg a fu mewn grym ers BSE. Pwysleisiaf wrth yr Aelodau ei bod yn bwysig inni gael dulliau olrhain cadarn er mwyn gallu sicrhau diogelwch bwyd, ac wrth werthu'r hyn a gynhyrchwn ar y farchnad fyd-eang. Mae gallu olrhain yn werthfawr, a'r pellaf y gellir olrhain unrhyw gynnyrch, gorau fydd y pris wrth ei werthu.

Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn bwysig hefyd am fod angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud popeth sy'n bosibl i osgoi colli'r rhanddirymiad sydd gennym eisoes, a chroesawaf y gefnogaeth a addawodd y pleidiau eraill.

*Cynnig (NDM3297): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3297): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3298): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3298): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bwydydd Anifeiliaid (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 Approval of the Feeding Stuffs (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the Feeding Stuffs (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 28 September 2006. (NDM3299)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 10 October 2006 in relation to the draft the Feeding Stuffs (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Feeding Stuffs (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Bwydydd Anifeiliaid (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Medi 2006. (NDM3299)

Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 10 Hydref 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Bwydydd Anifeiliaid (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Bwydydd Anifeiliaid (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 28 September 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 28 September 2006. (NDM3300)

The main objective of these regulations is to reintroduce in Wales an EC measure that requires compound animal feedstuffs to be labelled with a list of ingredients in descending order of their percentage weight of inclusion within a tolerance of plus or minus 15 per cent.

Brynle Williams: Safeguarding the food chain has to be a major priority, and my party welcomes these regulations. The disclosure of ingredients is a necessary step for the compound feed industry to take. However, the intellectual property of recipes must be respected, and the plus or minus 15 per cent tolerance should not mean companies having to give up trade secrets. Farmers have suffered as a result of the faith that they put in processed feed manufacturers, when, in the past, unsuitable ingredients found their way into the animal food chain, which is why these regulations are so important. Providing a breakdown of ingredients should give the whole process transparency and ensure that livestock owners and the public can be confident and reassured about exactly what is being fed to animals.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome these regulations in the name of transparency, and the ability of producers to ask the manufacturer for the exact details. I understand that, while there is a plus or minus 15 per cent tolerance in the declaration, an individual producer can ask the manufacturer for the full, detailed analysis of the feedstuff that has been purchased. I hope that the Minister can confirm that. It is important that there is scrutiny and the ability to do that. The tolerances, as Brynle Williams said, protect intellectual property rights, but the agriculture industry's previous experience is that a lack of transparency and of the ability to scrutinise what was being put into feedstuffs gave rise to that most awful

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Medi 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Medi 2006. (NDM3300)

Prif nod y rheoliadau hyn yw ailgyflwyno un o fesurau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol labelu bwydydd anifeiliaid cyfansawdd â rhestr o'r cynhwysion yn eu trefn o'r uchafswm i'r isafswm, yn ôl pwysau'r cynnwys o fewn goddefiad o plws neu finws 15 y cant.

Brynle Williams: Mae'n rhaid i ddiogelu'r gadwyn fwyd fod yn brif flaenoriaeth, ac mae fy mhlaid yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae datgelu cynhwysion yn gam angenrheidiol i'r diwydiant bwyd cyfansawdd ei gymryd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid parchu eiddo deallusol ryseitiau, ac ni ddylai'r goddefiad o plws neu finws 15 y cant olygu bod yn rhaid i gwmnïau ddatgelu eu cyfrinachau masnachol. Mae ffermwyr wedi dioddef oherwydd rhoi eu ffydd mewn gweithgynhyrchwyr bwyd wedi'i brosesu, pan gafodd cynhwysion anaddas, yn y gorffennol, eu cynnwys yn y gadwyn fwyd anifeiliaid, a dyna pam mae'r rheoliadau hyn mor bwysig. Dylai darparu dadansoddiad o'r cynhwysion roi eglurder i'r holl broses a sicrhau y gall perchnogion anifeiliaid a'r cyhoedd fod yn hyderus ac yn sicr eu meddwl beth yn union sy'n cael ei fyddo i anifeiliaid.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn yn enw eglurder, a gallu cynhyrchwyr i ofyn i'r gweithgynhyrchydd am yr union fanylion. Er bod goddefiad o plws neu finws 15 y cant yn y datganiad, deallaf y gall cynhyrchydd unigol ofyn i'r gweithgynhyrchydd am y dadansoddiad llawn a manwl o'r bwydydd sydd wedi eu prynu. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog gadarnhau hynny. Mae'n bwysig bod craffu yn digwydd a'r gallu i wneud hynny. Mae'r goddefiadau, fel y dywedodd Brynle Williams, yn diogelu hawliau eiddo deallusol, ond profiad blaenorol y diwydiant amaeth yw bod diffyg eglurder a'r gallu i graffu ar yr hyn a oedd yn cael ei roi mewn bwydydd wedi achosi'r clefyd dychrynlyd hwnnw yr ydym ni yn y diwydiant yn dal i

disease, which we in the industry still suffer from. It is important that every producer has the right to ask for the exact and precise compounds in his or her purchases. If the Minister cannot confirm it today, I hope that he will write to me to say that such scrutiny is available under this legislation.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I am not sure that Mick Bates is correct in that regard, because this was the very issue over which the major producers went to the High Court and got a judicial review in their favour. It was precisely because there was a requirement for specific detail that it was felt that this might be a disproportionate demand to make of the producers in the way in which you suggested. The plus or minus 15 per cent tolerance was felt to be a proportionate means of giving the type of information that, as Brynle correctly said, is so important. I will write to Mick to confirm that point, but my understanding is that for that detail to be made routinely available would go against the spirit of the court case. I will get back to Mick on this matter and give him chapter and verse.

ddioddef o'i herwydd. Mae'n bwysig bod gan bob cynhyrchydd yr hawl i holi am yr union gynhwysion y mae'n eu prynu. Os na all y Gweinidog gadarnhau hynny heddiw, gobeithio y bydd yn ysgrifennu ataf i gadarnhau bod craffu fel hyn ar gael o dan y ddeddfwriaeth hon.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw Mick Bates yn gywir o ran hynny, oherwydd dyna'r union reswm pam yr aeth y prif gynhyrchwyr i'r Uchel Lys a chael adolygiad barnwrol o'u plaid. Oherwydd bod gofyniad i nodi'n fanwl y teimlid y gallai hyn fod yn ofyniad anghymesur i'w roi ar gynhyrchwyr yn y modd yr ydych yn ei awgrymu. Y farn oedd fod y goddefiad o fewn 15 y cant yn fodd priodol i roi'r math o wybodaeth sydd, fel y dywedodd Brynle, mor bwysig. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at Mick i gadarnhau hynny, ond fy nealltwriaeth yw y byddai sicrhau bod y manylion hynny ar gael yn arferol yn mynd yn groes i ysbryd yr achos llys. Byddaf yn cysylltu â Mick ar y mater hwn ac yn rhoi'r holl fanylion iddo.

*Cynnig (NDM3299): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3299): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3300): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3300): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny

Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau, the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 adran 3, Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.14 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25

Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 25 section 3, Standing Order No. 25.14 and Standing Order No. 24.25

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate. **Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 25.14 and Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.14 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

approves the draft the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006, and notes the explanatory memorandum for this Order laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006. (NDM3301)

yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau drafft, the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006 ac yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y Gorchymyn hwn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006. (NDM3301)

*Cynnig (NDM3301): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3301): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.26 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.26 p.m.*

Adroddiad Gwerthuso Cyntaf Cymunedau yn Gyntaf The First Communities First Evaluation Report

Motion (NDM3302): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3302): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. notes the findings of the interim evaluation of the Communities First programme;

1. yn nodi canfyddiadau gwerthusiad dros dro y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf;

2. endorses the programme's focus on capacity building as a necessary pre-requisite to regeneration;

2. yn cymeradwyo ffocws y rhaglen ar feithrin gallu fel rhywbeth sy'n hanfodol cyn sicrhau adfywio;

3. congratulates those involved in Communities First activity throughout Wales on their contribution to the regeneration of local areas.

3. yn llongyfarch pawb sy'n ymwneud â gweithgarwch Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru ar eu cyfraniad tuag at adfywio ardaloedd lleol.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Delete all after 'congratulates' and replace with:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'yn llongyfarch' ac yn ei le, rhoi:

<i>all the staff involved in delivering the Communities First programme on their excellent work, notwithstanding the woeful lack of leadership and support from the Welsh Assembly Government.</i>	<i>yr holl staff sy'n ymwneud â chyflwyno'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar eu gwaith ardderchog, er gwaethaf diffyg arweiniad a chefnogaeth ddybryd gan Lywodraeth Cynlluniad Cymru.</i>
Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>recognises that housing is key to sustainable community regeneration.</i>	<i>yn cydnabod bod tai yn allweddol ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol cynaliadwy.</i>
Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>expresses concern about the weaknesses of Communities First in respect of target measures, audit controls and political interference.</i>	<i>yn mynegi pryder ynghylch gwendidau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o ran mesurau targed, rheolau archwilio ac ymyrraeth wleidyddol.</i>
Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>regrets that five years after this programme was announced, Communities First is still a long way from producing the regeneration outcomes that are its main aim and that projects are not reaching the most disadvantaged groups in the communities.</i>	<i>yn gresynu bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, bum mlynedd ar ôl i'r rhaglen gael ei chyflwyno, yn dal i fod ymhell iawn o gyrraedd ei phrif nod, sef cynhyrchu'r canlyniadau adfywio, a bod prosiectau yn methu â chyrraedd y grwpiau mwyaf difreintiedig yn y cymunedau.</i>
Amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>welcomes the work of Communities First and the central tenet that local people are best placed to understand their needs but regrets the rushed manner in which the programme was originally rolled out.</i>	<i>yn croesawu gwaith Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a'r egwyddor ganolog mai pobl leol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ddeall eu hanghenion ond yn gresynu wrth y ffordd frysiog y cyflwynwyd y rhaglen yn wreiddiol.</i>
Amendment 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>notes with concern the lack of progress of the Communities First programme in working with partners who provide local services.</i>	<i>yn nodi â phryder diffyg cynnydd y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o ran gweithio gyda phartneriaid sy'n darparu gwasanaethau lleol.</i>
Amendment 7 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 7 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>regrets that the Communities First</i>	<i>yn gresynu bod y rhaglen Cymunedau yn</i>

programme has taken a simple, purely geographical approach to the task of regeneration in Wales. Gyntaf wedi cymryd agwedd syml, cwbl ddaearyddol tuag at y dasg o adfywio yng Nghymru.

Amendment 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

regrets the lack of baseline data to measure the economic impact of the Communities First programme. yn gresynu wrth y diffyg data sylfaenol i fesur effaith economaidd y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Amendment 9 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 9 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

regrets that the Communities First programme has failed to produce sufficient regeneration outcomes. yn gresynu bod y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi methu â chynhyrchu canlyniadau adfywio digonol.

Amendment 10 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion: Gwelliant 10 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

regrets that some Westminster policies have been in conflict with the aims of the Communities First programme. yn gresynu bod rhai polisiau San Steffan wedi gwrthdaro ag amcanion y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Amendment 11 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add new point at the end of the motion: Gwelliant 11 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Minister to make a statement detailing: yn galw ar y Gweinidog i wneud datganiad yn nodi:

a) by how much the incomes of local people have been increased by Communities First; and a) faint o gynnydd a fu yn incwm pobl leol yn sgil Cymunedau yn Gyntaf; a

b) how many jobs have been created by Communities First, including those not directly employed to administer the programme. b) faint o swyddi a grëwyd gan y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan gynnwys y rheini nas cyflogir yn uniongyrchol i weinyddu'r rhaglen.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 8, 9, 10 and 11 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Lisa Francis and amendments 5, 6 and 7 in the name of Kirsty Williams. **Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 8, 9, 10 ac 11 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Lisa Francis, a gwelliannau 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Deputy Minister (Huw Lewis): I propose that **Y Dirprwy Weinidog (Huw Lewis):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales: Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. notes the findings of the interim evaluation of the Communities First Programme;

2. endorses the programme's focus on capacity building as a necessary pre-requisite to regeneration;

3. congratulates those involved in Communities First activity throughout Wales on their contribution to the regeneration of local areas. (NDM3302)

I thank everyone involved in producing this valuable report, from the evaluation team to those involved in Communities First on the ground, all of whom have given honest and valuable assessments of the programme to date. In addition to this evaluation, we also have detailed baseline reports to work from and the information and recommendations contained in those two documents will prove to be invaluable in taking Communities First forward—and, make no mistake, we will be taking this programme forward. We will improve the way in which it is run, but we will not return to the failed policies of telling communities what they should want and shrugging our shoulders when it goes wrong.

I am proud that Welsh Labour has developed this original, brave and empowering programme for the most deprived communities in Wales and that is why I ask support for this motion from all parties. I ask support for a motion that includes a determination for this Government to take forward the report's recommendations. To my mind, those recommendations address many of the opposition amendments that are tabled today. We will listen carefully to what the opposition will add to the debate and the Minister will respond in her summing up.

Communities First is a learning process. You will see mentioned again and again in this report—if you did not already know—that this is an innovative programme and, because of that, we are all learning as we progress. If the opposition has sensible suggestions to add to this learning process, we will happily take them on board. If, however, opposition Members want to cherry-pick negative comments out of the report to make political

1. yn nodi canfyddiadau gwerthusiad dros dro y Rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf;

2. yn cymeradwyo ffocws y rhaglen ar feithrin gallu fel rhywbeth sy'n hanfodol cyn sicrhau adfywio;

3. yn llongyfarch pawb sy'n ymwneud â gweithgarwch Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru ar eu cyfraniad tuag at adfywio ardaloedd lleol. (NDM3302)

Diolchaf i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â llunio'r adroddiad gwerthfawr hwn, o'r tîm gwerthuso i'r rhai sy'n gysylltiedig â Chymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y maes. Mae pob un ohonynt wedi rhoi asesiad gonest a gwerthfawr o'r rhaglen hyd yn hyn. Yn ogystal â'r gwerthusiad hwn, mae gennym hefyd adroddiadau sylfaen manwl i'w defnyddio, a bydd y wybodaeth a'r argymhellion yn y ddwy ddogfen hynny yn amhrisiadwy wrth ddatblygu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—a byddwn yn datblygu'r rhaglen hon, doed a ddelo. Byddwn yn gwella'r modd y caiff ei chynnal, ond ni fyddwn yn dychwelyd at y polisiau sydd wedi methu o ddweud wrth gymunedau beth y dylent ei ddymuno ac anobeithio pan fo'n methu.

Yr wyf yn falch fod Llafur Cymru wedi datblygu'r rhaglen wreiddiol, ddewr ac ymrymusol hon ar gyfer cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru, a dyna'r rheswm pam yr wyf yn gofyn i bob plaid gefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Gofynnaf i chi gefnogi cynnig sy'n cynnwys penderfyniad i'r Llywodraeth hon roi argymhellion yr adroddiad ar waith. Yn fy marn i, mae'r argymhellion hynny'n mynd i'r afael â nifer o welliannau'r gwrthbleidiau sy'n cael eu cynnig heddiw. Byddwn yn gwrando'n astud ar yr hyn fydd gan y gwrthbleidiau i'w ychwanegu at y dadl, ac yna bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb wrth gloi.

Proses o ddysgu yw Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Sonia'r adroddiad hwn drosodd a thro—os nad oeddech yn ymwybodol eisoes—fod hon yn rhaglen arloesol, ac oherwydd hynny yr ydym yn dysgu wrth ddatblygu. Os oes gan y gwrthbleidiau awgrymiadau synhwyrol i'w hychwanegu at y broses ddysgu hon, byddwn yn fwy na bodlon eu derbyn. Fodd bynnag, os bwriad Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau yw canolbwyntio ar fân sylwadau negyddol yn yr

capital, they will be not only wasting everyone's time, but denigrating the work of Communities First partnerships across Wales. I hope that it will be a better informed opposition today than that which claimed that child poverty is increasing during a recent exchange in the Chamber.

I welcome the evaluation team's recognition of the political courage required to stick to the course on Communities First. It would be easy to scrap this programme and return to regeneration by numbers—top-down, prescriptive programmes—but it would be wrong. We, as a Labour Government, are happy to take the flack and the brickbats for the inevitable difficulties encountered by such a new programme, because this is the right direction for the future of Wales. If you doubt that, read the evaluation report, because it is there in black and white.

The opposition, in its amendments, calls for hard outcomes: figures on jobs, for example. Let me tell you, as someone who represents several communities brought to their knees in the 1980s, their confidence near destroyed, that community involvement is a hard outcome in itself. Seventy-seven per cent of partnerships—and it says this in the report—say that they live in stronger communities because of Communities First. We have made over three quarters of the most disadvantaged communities in Wales stronger, by their own perception, and we will now go after the rest.

4.30 p.m.

I recently attracted a little criticism for bringing the dirty word 'politics' into the debate on poverty in Wales. However, as that well-known partisan organisation, the United Nations, has stated, poverty is political. It is about contests over resources. We must give the poor a voice in this context. Communities First is one of our response to that call, and political opposition to that goal will not be easily forgiven by the people of Wales.

adroddiad, yn ogystal â gwastraffu amser pawb byddant yn difenwi gwaith partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru. Gobeithio y bydd dadl y gwrthbleidiau heddiw yn fwy deallus na honno a oedd yn mynnu bod tloedi plant yn cynyddu yn ystod dadl yn ddiweddar yn y Siambr.

Croesawaf gydnabyddiaeth y tîm gwerthuso fod angen dewrder gwleidyddol i gadw at y llwybr o ran Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mor hawdd fyddai rhoi'r gorau i'r rhaglen hon a dychwelyd at adfywio fesul rhifau—rhaglenni rhagnodiadol o'r brig i'r bôn—ond byddai hynny'n anghywir. Yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth Lafur, yn fodlon cymryd y bai a'r sylwadau cas am yr anawsterau anochel a gafwyd mewn rhaglen mor newydd, oherwydd dyma'r llwybr cywir ar gyfer dyfodol Cymru. Os ydych yn amau hynny, darllenwch yr adroddiad gwerthuso, oherwydd mae yno mewn du a gwyn.

Mae'r gwrthbleidiau, yn eu gwelliannau, yn galw am ganlyniadau pendant: ffigurau am swyddi, er enghraifft. Gadewch imi ddweud wrthyhych, fel rhywun sy'n cynrychioli nifer o gymunedau a gafodd eu llorio yn y 1980au, a'u hyder wedi chwalu, fod cyfranogiad cymunedau yn ganlyniad anodd ynddo'i hun. Dywed 77 y cant o bartneriaethau—a dywedir hyn yn yr adroddiad—eu bod yn byw mewn cymunedau cryfach oherwydd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod dros dri chwarter y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru, yn ôl eu canfyddiad eu hunain, yn gryfach, a byddwn bellach yn canolbwyntio ar y gweddill.

Cefais ychydig feirmiadaeth yn ddiweddar am ddefnyddio'r gair 'gwleidyddiaeth' yn y ddadl ar dlodi yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae'r sefydliad pleidiol enwog hwnnw, y Cenhedloedd Unedig, wedi dweud, mae tloedi yn wleidyddol. Mae'n ymwneud â chystadlu am adnoddau. Rhaid inni roi llais i'r tlawd yn y cyd-destun hwn. Mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn un o'n hymatebion i'r alwad honno, ac ni fydd pobl Cymru yn anghofio'n hawdd am y gwrthwynebiad gwleidyddol i'r nod hwnnw.

In conclusion, we welcome the report and its recommendations, some of which we are already acting upon. We recognise where the programme can be improved, and we appreciate the support given by the evaluation team to Labour's vision for a community-led programme. I look forward to meaningful engagement with this evaluation. I leave you with this quotation from the report, taken from a Communities First partnership member, which I think was intended as a criticism:

'Sometimes I had the impression that we were teaching the Assembly Government rather than the other way around'.

I read that as a compliment. That is what this programme is all about—grass roots, bottom-up regenerative work, unique in Europe, across the nation of Wales. Long may we continue as a Welsh Assembly Government to learn those lessons.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I thank the Deputy Minister for making a succinct speech. If Members are succinct where possible, we will avoid running over by too much.

Leanne Wood: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: Delete all after 'congratulates' and replace with:

all the staff involved in delivering the Communities First programme on their excellent work, notwithstanding the woeful lack of leadership and support from the Welsh Assembly Government.

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the lack of baseline data to measure the economic impact of the Communities First programme.

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that the Communities First programme has failed to produce sufficient regeneration outcomes.

I gloi, croesawn yr adroddiad a'i argymhellion, rai ohonynt eisoes wedi eu gweithredu. Gwyddom lle y gellir gwella'r rhaglen, a gwerthfawrogwn y gefnogaeth a roddwyd gan y tîm gwerthuso i weledigaeth Llafur am raglen yn cael ei harwain gan y gymuned. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymgysylltu'n ystyrllon â'r gwerthusiad hwn. Fe'ch gadawaf gyda'r dyfyniad hwn o'r adroddiad, gan aelod o bartneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Credaf mai fel beirniadaeth yr oedd wedi ei fwriadu:

Cawn yr argraff weithiau ein bod yn addysgu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hytrach nag i'r gwrthwyneb.

Derbyniais hynny fel canmoliaeth. Dyna yw diben y rhaglen hon—gwaith adfywio ar lawr gwlad, o'r bôn i'r brig, sy'n unigryw yn Ewrop, yn cael ei gyflawni ledled Cymru. Bydded inni barhau fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddysgu'r gwersi hynny yn y dyfodol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Diolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am roi araith gryno. Os bydd Aelodau'n gryno lle mae hynny'n bosibl, byddwn yn osgoi mynd dros amser yn ormodol.

Leanne Wood: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: Dileu popeth ar ôl 'yn llongyfarch' ac yn ei le, rhoi:

yr holl staff sy'n ymwneud â chyflwyno'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar eu gwaith ardderchog, er gwaethaf diffyg arweiniad a chefnogaeth ddybryd gan Lywodraeth Cynulluniad Cymru.

Cynigiau welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu wrth y diffyg data sylfaenol i fesur effaith economaidd y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Cynigiau welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu bod y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi methu â chynhyrchu canlyniadau adfywio digonol.

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that some Westminster policies have been in conflict with the aims of the Communities First programme.

I propose amendment 11. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Minister to make a statement detailing:

a) by how much the incomes of local people have been increased by Communities First; and

b) how many jobs have been created by Communities First, including those not directly employed to administer the programme.

In my capacity as Plaid Cymru's social justice spokesperson, I have visited a number of Communities First projects throughout Wales, and I live in a Communities First ward. So, I contribute to this debate with a small level of understanding. Some of the projects that I have seen, and I include my own ward of Penygraig in this, have been fantastic. I know that Communities First officers are working flat out to make things happen and to ensure that local people are involved.

But how many of these co-ordinators are working with their backs up against the wall? A huge amount of their time is spent on filling in paperwork, which Welsh Assembly Government officials have no time to process, or filling in funding applications. They spend a huge amount of time trying to engage with partners who are sometimes unwilling to engage, particularly local councillors who see the participatory democracy model as a threat to their power base.

Communities First partnerships are caught between a rock and a hard place. The Government launched the programme with grand aims to increase employment levels and the incomes of local people, but

Cynigiaf welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu bod rhai polisiau San Steffan wedi gwrthdaro ag amcanion y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Cynigiaf welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog i wneud datganiad yn nodi:

a) faint o gynnydd a fu yn incwm pobl leol yn sgil Cymunedau yn Gyntaf; a

b) faint o swyddi a grëwyd gan y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan gynnwys y rheini nas cyflogir yn uniongyrchol i weinyddu'r rhaglen.

Yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, yr wyf wedi ymweld â nifer o brosiectau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru, ac yr wyf yn byw mewn ward Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Felly, cyfrannaf at y ddadl hon gydag ychydig ddealltwriaeth. Mae rhai o'r prosiectau yr wyf wedi'u gweld, ac yr wyf yn cynnwys fy ward fy hun ym Mhen-y-graig yn hyn, wedi bod yn ardderchog. Gwn fod swyddogion Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gweithio'n galed i gyflawni pethau ac i sicrhau bod pobl leol yn cael eu cynnwys.

Ond faint o'r cydgysylltwyr hyn sy'n gweithio mewn cyfyngder? Treuliant lawer iawn o'u hamser yn gwneud gwaith papur nad oes gan swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru amser i'w brosesu, neu'n llenwi ceisiadau am arian. Treuliant lawer iawn o amser yn ceisio ymgysylltu â phartneriaid sydd weithiau'n amharod i ymgysylltu, yn enwedig cynghorwyr lleol sy'n ystyried bod y model democratiaeth gyfranogol yn fygythiad i'w sylfaen grym.

Mae partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf mewn sefyllfa anodd. Lansiodd y Llywodraeth y rhaglen gyda amcanion uchel i gynyddu lefelau cyflogaeth ac incwm pobl leol, ond ni ddywedwyd wrth bartneriaethau

Communities First partnerships have not been told how to achieve those aims. They have no baseline data to work to, so they have no idea whether or not they are impacting upon poverty levels. The Welsh Assembly Government could issue guidance to partnerships—not prescriptive guidance telling them that they must do it, but advice to inform them about the way in which they can contribute to the local economy. For example, partnerships could be told how to knock on doors to check benefit entitlements and promoting credit unions, and how to set up childcare places and literacy and numeracy classes.

Leighton Andrews: Are you aware that the Communities First group in Treherbert, for example, has been helping members of the community in taking up benefits? Those schemes are in place in many areas.

Leanne Wood: As I have said, some local partnerships are doing fantastic work, but it is not being rolled-out to all partnerships, and not all partnerships are able to engage in a way that can improve the local community. Local partnerships could create facilities for young people to prevent criminal justice intervention. Counselling facilities could be provided by Communities First partnerships, because, after all, more poor people die as a result of depression than from poor nutrition.

Similar guidance could be issued to local authorities, whose policies often go against the regeneration of communities. Real partnership working should mean that there is Government intervention when the council or any other organisation is planning to remove a vital community resource, such as a post office or school. In Blaenclydach, up the road from where I live, which is part of a Communities First ward, the local authority closed the local school, which offered breakfast clubs, after-school clubs and a youth club, thereby enabling parents to work. That provision has now been lost; there was no Government intervention, and some people lost their jobs. What is worse is that the Communities First partnership drew down £50,000 to renovate the school yard and now that school will be bulldozed. That

Cymunedau yn Gyntaf sut i gyflawni'r amcanion hynny. Nid oes ganddynt ddata sylfaenol i gyfeirio atynt, felly nid oes ganddynt syniad a ydynt yn effeithio ar lefelau tlodi ai peidio. Gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi canllawiau i bartneriaethau—nid canllawiau rhagnodi i ddweud wrthynt fod yn rhaid iddynt ei wneud, ond cyngor i ddweud wrthynt sut y gallant gyfrannu at yr economi leol. Er enghraifft, gellid dweud wrth bartneriaethau sut i guro ar ddrysau i wirio hawliadau budd-dal a hyrwyddo undebau credyd, a sut i sefydlu lleoedd gofal plant a dosbarthiadau llythrennedd a rhifedd.

Leighton Andrews: A ydych yn ymwybodol bod y grŵp Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Nhreherbert, er enghraifft, wedi bod yn helpu aelodau o'r gymuned i hawlio budd-daliadau? Mae'r cynlluniau hynny ar waith mewn llawer ardal.

Leanne Wood: Fel y dywedais, mae rhai partneriaethau lleol yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog, ond nid yw'n cyrraedd pob partneriaeth, ac ni all pob partneriaeth ymgysylltu mewn ffordd sy'n gallu gwella'r gymuned leol. Gallai partneriaethau lleol greu cyfleusterau ar gyfer pobl ifanc i atal ymyriad cyfiawnder troseddol. Gellid darparu cyfleusterau cwnsela gan bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf oherwydd, wedi'r cyfan, mae mwy o bobl yn marw o ganlyniad i iselder na maeth gwael.

Gellid rhoi canllawiau tebyg i awdurdodau lleol, sydd â'u polisïau'n aml yn mynd yn groes i adfywio cymunedau. Dylai gwaith partneriaeth gwirioneddol olygu bod y Llywodraeth yn ymyrryd pan fydd y cyngor neu unrhyw sefydliad arall yn bwriadu cael gwared ag adnodd cymunedol hanfodol, fel swyddfa bost neu ysgol. Ym Mlaenclydach, i fyny'r ffordd o'm cartref i, sy'n rhan o ward Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, caewyd yr ysgol leol gan yr awdurdod lleol a oedd yn cynnig clybiau brechwast, clybiau ar ôl ysgol a chlwb ieuenctid, gan alluogi rhieni i weithio. Mae'r ddarpariaeth honno wedi'i cholli'n awr; ni chafwyd ymyriad gan y Llywodraeth, a cholodd rhai pobl eu swyddi. Yr hyn sy'n waeth yw bod y bartneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi clustnodi £50,000 i adnewyddu iard yr ysgol, a chaiff yr ysgol honno ei

is not partnership in action.

The ward in which I live provides another example. There are two parks within walking distance of my home in Penygraig; neither of these has play equipment. The local authority says that there is no money available to replace the play equipment. At the same time, the ward has recently lost a youth club and people are now complaining about kids hanging around in the streets. If there was real joined-up Government, this situation would never be allowed to happen.

I have already mentioned in questions this afternoon the impact that the Department for Work and Pensions cuts will have on our most deprived areas. Westminster policies to close post offices are also going against the regeneration of our most deprived communities. If we have no chance to influence other decision-makers to programme bend, then Communities First has little chance of tackling structural inequalities.

Communities First wards are, by definition, the ones with high numbers of children in care, higher numbers involved in the criminal justice system, mental health problems, substance dependency issues, higher levels of ill health, lower employment rates, lower quality housing, lower quality public services and lower levels of literacy and numeracy. Basic needs are not being met in these areas. Therefore, Communities First has no chance of addressing these structural problems when other Government departments do not have buy-in. In addition, when you compare the peanuts being spent in Wales with what is being spent on regeneration in England, you can see what a difficult problem we have. The new deal for communities in England will result in £47.2 million for east Brighton and £48.7 million for Thornhill in Southampton—two areas alone getting £95.9 million over 10 years compared with £131 million for our 100 most deprived wards. The regeneration budget in England has £5.7 billion allocated to it, a third of which was targeted to the 20 most deprived areas.

dymchwel yn awr. Nid gwaith partneriaeth yw hynny.

Mae'r ward yr wyf yn byw ynddi yn enghraifft arall. Mae dau barc o fewn pellter cerdded i'm cartref ym Mhen-y-graig; nid oes offer chwarae yn y naill na'r llall. Dywed yr awdurdod lleol nad oes arian ar gael i ddarparu offer chwarae newydd. Ar yr un pryd, mae'r ward wedi colli clwb ieuenticid yn ddiweddar ac mae pobl yn awr yn cwyno am blant yn loetran ar y strydoedd. Pe bae gennym Lywodraeth gydgyssylltiedig wirioneddol, ni fyddai'r sefyllfa hon erioed wedi ei chaniatau.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi crybwyll mewn cwestiynau y prynhawn yma yr effaith a gaiff toriadau'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ar ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Mae polisïau San Steffan i gau swyddfydd post hefyd yn mynd yn erbyn y gwaith o adfywio ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig. Os nad oes gennym gyfle i ddylanwadu ar eraill sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau i addasu rhaglenni, yna prin yw'r cyfle i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau strwythurol.

Wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yn ôl eu diffiniad, yw'r rhai sydd â niferoedd uchel o blant mewn gofal, niferoedd uwch sy'n gysylltiedig â'r system cyfiawnder troseddol, problemau iechyd meddwl, materion dibyniaeth ar sylweddau, lefelau uwch o salwch, cyfraddau cyflogaeth is, tai o safon is, gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o safon is, a lefelau is o lythrennedd a rhifedd. Nid yw anghenion sylfaenol yn cael eu diwallu yn yr ardaloedd hyn. Felly, nid oes gan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf unrhyw obaith o fynd i'r afael â'r problemau strwythurol hyn pan nad oes cyfraniad gan adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth. Yn ogystal, pan gymharwch yr arian prin sy'n cael ei wario yng Nghymru â'r hyn sy'n cael ei wario ar adfywio yn Lloegr, gallwch weld y broblem anodd sydd gennym. Bydd y fargen newydd i gymunedau yn Lloegr yn arwain at £47.2 miliwn i ddwyrain Brighton a £48.7 miliwn i Thornhill yn Southampton—dwy ardal yn unig sy'n cael £95.9 miliwn dros 10 mlynedd o'i gymharu â £131 miliwn ar gyfer ein 100 o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig ni. Dyrannwyd £5.7 miliwn i'r gyllideb adfywio yn Lloegr, ac yr oedd traean

ohono'n anelu at yr 20 ardal fwyaf difreintiedig.

In conclusion, Communities First was a great idea, but it was overambitious. With such small levels of funding, it could never hope to be an anti-poverty programme or a regeneration programme. There are examples of excellent community development work taking place despite the lack of community development expertise within the Government's departments. Some honesty on this issue is overdue—either we accept that those regeneration outcomes are no more than nice words, or we put things in place to enable partnerships to achieve them. In that way, partnerships at least have a chance of being sustainable after the 10-year funding is over.

Mark Isherwood: I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 2: Add a new point at the end of the motion:

recognises that housing is key to sustainable community regeneration.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses concern about the weaknesses of Communities First in respect of target measures, audit controls and political interference.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that five years after this programme was announced, Communities First is still a long way from producing the regeneration outcomes that are its main aim and that projects are not reaching the most disadvantaged groups in the communities.

As this report states:

'The Assembly Government has taken the right direction by prioritising an investment in capacity building of local community organisations and groups, including disadvantaged groups, and individual residents to participate actively in the process of change as a necessary pre-condition for

I gloi, yr oedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn syniad gwych, ond yr oedd yn rhy uchelgeisiol. Gyda chyn lleied o arian, ni fyddai gobaith byth iddi fod yn rhaglen i atal todi neu'n rhaglen adfywio. Mae yna enghreifftiau o waith datblygu cymunedol ardderchog er y diffyg arbenigedd datblygu cymunedol yn adrannau'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n hen bryd cael ychydig onestrydd ar y mater hwn—naill ai yr ydym yn derbyn nad yw'r canlyniadau adfywio hynny yn ddim mwy na geiriau caredig, neu yr ydym yn rhoi pethau ar waith i alluogi partneriaethau i'w cyflawni. Fel hynny mae gan bartneriaethau o leiaf gyfle i fod yn gynaliadwy ar ôl i'r cyllid 10 mlynedd ddod i ben.

Mark Isherwood: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 2: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cydnabod bod tai yn allweddol ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol cynaliadwy.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch gwendidau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o ran mesurau targed, rheolau archwilio ac ymyrraeth wleidyddol.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, bum mlynedd ar ôl i'r rhaglen gael ei chyflwyno, yn dal i fod ymhell iawn o gyrraedd ei phrif nod, sef cynhyrchu'r canlyniadau adfywio, a bod prosiectau yn methu â chyrraedd y grwpiau mwyaf difreintiedig yn y cymunedau.

Fel y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ei ddweud:

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dilyn y trywydd iawn drwy flaenoriaethu buddsoddiad mewn meithrin gallu ac adnoddau sefydliadau a grwpiau cymunedau lleol, gan gynnwys grwpiau o dan anfantais, a thrigolion unigol i gymryd rhan weithgar yn y broses o newid fel rhag-amod angenrheidiol

regeneration.’

We must tackle social isolation. We must tackle poor health and wellbeing. We must tackle economic inactivity. We must tackle cross-generational breakdown. We must restore self-esteem and self-belief by empowering the disempowered, building a commitment to both rights and social responsibilities. However, none of this will take root unless we deliver sustainable economic and social regeneration.

Cardiff University states that good housing should be at the heart of neighbourhood or community regeneration, as it is linked to the revival of local economies, the delivery of improved services and the development of sustainable local communities.

However, as Housing Forum Cymru states:

‘Housing is creating a more divided Wales... the consequences for social cohesion, reduced life chances and poor health are enormous...[but] putting housing back in the political centre stage again, making sure it gets the investment it needs will...improve health...drive community development... [and] improve life chances’.

By contrast, however, homelessness is up, housing waiting lists are up, housing repossessions are up, and the number of people living in unfit accommodation is up. However, the supply of new social and affordable housing has been cut dramatically. As amendment 2 states, we must grasp the nettle and recognise that housing is key to sustainable community regeneration.

4.40 p.m.

Amendment 3 expresses concern about the weaknesses of Communities First in respect of target measures, audit controls and political interference. When we debated Communities First in February, I stated that

ar gyfer adfywio.

Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag ynysu cymdeithasol. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag iechyd a lles gwael. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag anweithgarwch economaidd. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â methiant rhwng y cenedlaethau. Rhaid inni adfer hunanhyder a hunan-gred drwy alluogi pobl sydd heb rym, gan greu ymrwymiad i hawliau a chyfrifoldebau cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd dim o hyn yn cael effaith oni fyddwn yn sicrhau adfywio economaidd a chymdeithasol cynaliadwy.

Mae Prifysgol Caerdydd yn dweud y dylai tai da fod wrth wraidd y gwaith o adfywio cymdogaethau neu gymunedau, gan fod hynny'n gysylltiedig ag adfywio economïau lleol, darparu gwell gwasanaethau a datblygu cymunedau lleol cynaliadwy.

Fodd bynnag, fel y mae Fforwm Tai Cymru yn ei ddweud:

Mae tai yn creu Cymru fwy rhanedig...mae'r canlyniadau ar gyfer cydlyniant cymdeithasol, llai o gyfleoedd bywyd ac iechyd gwael yn enfawr...[ond] bydd rhoi sylw gwleidyddol canolog i'r maes tai unwaith eto, gan sicrhau ei fod yn cael y buddsoddiad angenrheidiol...yn gwella iechyd...yn ysgogi datblygiad cymunedol....[ac] yn gwella cyfleoedd bywyd.

I'r gwrthwyneb, fodd bynnag, mae cynnydd mewn digartrefedd, mae cynnydd mewn rhestrau aros am dai, mae cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o adfeddiannu tai, ac mae cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n byw mewn llety anaddas. Fodd bynnag, bu gostyngiad sylweddol yn y cyflenwad o dai cymdeithasol a fforddiadwy newydd. Fel y mae gwelliant 2 yn ei ddweud, rhaid inni wynebu'r her a chydabod bod tai yn allweddol i adfywio cymunedol cynaliadwy.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn mynegi pryder am wendidau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o ran mesurau targed, rheolaethau archwilio ac ymyrraeth wleidyddol. Pan fuom yn trafod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ym mis Chwefror,

dywedais

‘money is being thrown at a problem without measurable targets being in place, with the inevitable consequence that there will be few regeneration outcomes.’

I added that this was not to criticise the staff involved. We need target measures that are quantitative and qualitative, and that are agreed, realistic and reviewable. In the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in June, we discussed measurable targets and the need for data to provide hard evidence that Communities First is an effective use of resources. An Assembly Government official stated that an analysis of areas such as employment and education would be published at the same time as this evaluation. We need this analysis so that we may synthesise a proper action plan to take this strategy forward.

On audit control and political interference, I referred to serious allegations relating to a county council’s submissions to the Welsh Assembly Government in respect of the Communities First programme—submissions that favoured wards represented by councillors in the governing group. At a meeting with Assembly Government officials and the leader of the opposition of this council in September, representations were made about the concern that a Communities First partnership had become a front organisation for the governing political party. In fact, my first meeting with residents in a Communities First area in this county resulted from their concern that only members of the governing political party had been invited to a meeting called by the ward councillor to set up a residents’ committee.

Today’s report refers to significant police engagement with Communities First at a local level, and I have attended meetings in Communities First areas that were very well facilitated by police officers. However, the priorities agreed by local people have been overridden by the county council concerned, and concerns were expressed to me by a Communities First co-ordinator that the

mae arian yn cael ei daflu at broblem heb fod targedau mesuradwy ar waith, a’r canlyniad anochel yw mai prin fydd y canlyniadau adfywio.

Ychwanegais nad oeddwn yn beirniadu’r staff dan sylw. Mae angen inni gael mesurau targed ar gyfer maint ac ansawdd, sydd wedi eu cytuno, yn realistig ac y gellir eu hadolygu. Yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ym mis Mehefin, trafodwyd targedau mesuradwy a’r angen am ddata i roi tystiolaeth gadarn bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn defnyddio adnoddau’n effeithiol. Dywedodd un o swyddog Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y câi dadansoddiad o feysydd fel cyflogaeth ac addysg ei gyhoeddi ar yr un pryd â’r gwerthusiad hwn. Mae angen inni gael y dadansoddiad hwn fel y gallwn lunio cynllun gweithredu priodol i ddatblygu’r strategaeth hon.

O ran rheolaeth archwilio ac ymyrraeth wleidyddol, cyfeiriais at honiadau difrifol yn ymwneud â chyflwyniadau cyngor sir i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn cysylltiad â’r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—cyflwyniadau a oedd yn ffafrio wardiau a gynrychiolid gan gynghorwyr yn y grŵp llywodraethu. Mewn cyfarfod gyda swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn y cyngor hwn ym mis Medi, gwnaed sylwadau am y pryder bod partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi dod yn sefydliad blaen ar gyfer y blaid wleidyddol a oedd yn llywodraethu. Mewn gwirionedd, cefais fy nghyfarfod cyntaf gyda thrigolion mewn ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y sir hon o ganlyniad i’w pryder mai dim ond aelodau o’r blaid wleidyddol a oedd yn llywodraethu a wahoddwyd i gyfarfod a oedd wedi ei gynnull gan gynghorydd y ward er mwyn sefydlu pwyllgor trigolion.

Mae adroddiad heddiw yn cyfeirio at ymgysylltiad sylweddol yr heddlu â Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar lefel leol, ac yr wyf wedi bod mewn cyfarfodydd mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a oedd yn cynnwys nifer o swyddogion heddlu. Fodd bynnag, cafodd y blaenoriaethau y cytunwyd arnynt gan bobl leol eu trechu gan y cyngor sir dan sylw, a mynegwyd pryderon wrthyf gan

current system allows funding decisions to be taken politically at local authority level. That co-ordinator subsequently resigned.

As the report states, some politicians perceive Communities First to be in conflict with the principles of traditional representative democracy. This emphasises strongly the need for training programmes for local authority officers and members. As the report states, there is strong evidence of partnerships where conflict has impeded progress. We must find a way of working around this. We also need active change management that includes the communities themselves in real partnership with public and voluntary agencies.

As the Anti-poverty Network Cymru has found, the theory of community participation as the key plank of the Communities First Strategy is not being matched by practice on the ground. It adds that appropriate and understandable information is not being shared and that Communities First does not have the mechanism to ensure accountability to the local community. The reality is that income support claims have reduced more quickly in areas that are not covered by Communities First; that almost 30 per cent of the Welsh working-age population is now not in work; that the proportion of those living in income poverty in households with at least one person in work has risen; and that the proportion of school leavers not going into education, training or employment has risen.

For all these reasons I propose amendment 4, regretting that five years after the programme was announced, Communities First is still a long way from producing the regeneration outcomes that are its main aim, and that projects are not reaching the most disadvantaged groups in the communities. I trust that every Member will support this because it is quoted directly from this report.

Mick Bates: I propose the following

gydgysylltydd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fod y system gyfredol yn caniatáu i benderfyniadau am gyllid gael eu gwneud yn wleidyddol ar lefel awdurdod lleol. Ymddeolodd y cydgysylltydd hwnnw yn dilyn hynny.

Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn ei ddweud, mae rhai gwleidyddion yn gweld bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn mynd yn groes i egwyddorion democratiaeth gynrychioliadol draddodiadol. Mae hyn yn pwysleisio'n gadarn yr angen am raglenni hyfforddi ar gyfer swyddogion ac aelodau awdurdodau lleol. Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn ei ddweud, mae yna dystiolaeth gadarn am bartneriaethau lle y mae gwrthdaro wedi rhwystro cynnydd. Rhaid inni gael ffordd o ddatrys hyn. Mae arnom hefyd angen rheolwyr newid gweithgar sy'n cynnwys y cymunedau eu hunain mewn partneriaeth wirioneddol ag asiantaethau cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol.

Fel y mae Rhwydwaith Gwrthdlodi Cymru wedi ei ddarganfod, nid yw damcaniaeth cyfranogiad cymunedol fel yr elfen allweddol yn y Strategaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cyfateb i'r arfer ar lawr gwlad. Mae'n ychwanegu nad yw gwybodaeth briodol a dealladwy yn cael ei rhannu, ac nad oes gan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf y gallu i sicrhau atebolrwydd i'r gymuned leol. Y gwir amdani yw bod ceisiadau am gymhorthdal incwm wedi lleihau'n gyflymach mewn ardaloedd nad ydynt yn cael eu cwmpasu gan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf; bod bron i 30 y cant o'r boblogaeth o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru belalch yn ddi-waith; bod cyfran y bobl sy'n byw mewn tlodi incwm mewn cartrefi lle mae o leiaf un person mewn gwaith wedi codi; a bod cyfran y rheini sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb fynd i addysg, hyfforddiant neu gyflogaeth wedi codi.

Am yr holl resymau hyn, cynigiau welliant 4, gan resynu bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, bum mlynedd ar ôl cyhoeddi'r rhaglen, yn dal ymhell o allu cynhyrchu'r canlyniadau adfywio sydd wrth wraidd ei phrif nod, ac nad yw prosiectau'n cyrraedd y grwpiau sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf yn y cymunedau. Hyderaf y bydd pob Aelod yn cefnogi hyn, oherwydd mae'n dyfyngu'r adroddiad hwn yn uniongyrchol.

Mick Bates: Cynigiau y gwelliannau

amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 5: Add a new point at the end of the motion:

welcomes the work of Communities First and the central tenet that local people are best placed to understand their needs but regrets the rushed manner in which the programme was originally rolled out.

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with concern the lack of progress of the Communities First programme in working with partners who provide local services.

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that the Communities First programme has taken a simple, purely geographical approach to the task of regeneration in Wales.

Some of Huw's assertions in his opening remarks were particularly out of place, given the nature of, and general support for, the principle of Communities First. Huw, often, learning is an uncomfortable process for us all. We are here to scrutinise, to ensure that there is effective spending and that there are benchmarks and measurements, because monitoring and evaluation are some of the most important features of all of our work as Members, and particularly for you as the Government. I was taken aback, because I am the greatest supporter of the sort of empowerment provided by Communities First. I say that as someone who has worked within communities. I have started regeneration companies, some of which failed because of the nature of the process of changing culture. The whole point about Communities First, of which I am so proud, is that it empowers people, and our amendments were in no way intended to be a slight against your Government. In fact, I would always stand up and say that I am trying to be practical and supportive. I hope that you will take the criticism as being constructive.

Huw Lewis: Of course I will do so, and I am

canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 5: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn croesawu gwaith Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a'r egwyddor ganolog mai pobl leol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ddeall eu hanghenion ond yn gresynu wrth y ffordd frysïog y cyflwynwyd y rhaglen yn wreiddiol.

Cynigiad welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi â phryder diffyg cynnydd y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o ran gweithio gyda phartneriaid sy'n darparu gwasanaethau lleol.

Cynigiad welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu bod y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi cymryd agwedd syml, cwbl ddaearyddol tuag at y dasg o adfywio yng Nghymru.

Yr oedd rhai o honiadau Huw yn ei sylwadau agoriadol yn arbennig o ddiangen, o ystyried natur egwyddor Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a'r gefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r egwyddor honno. Huw, mae dysgu, yn aml, yn broses anghyfforddus inni bob un. Yr ydym yma i graffu, i sicrhau bod gwariant effeithiol a bod yna feincnodau a mesuriadau, oherwydd monitro a gwerthuso yw rhai o nodweddion pwysicaf ein holl waith fel Aelodau, ac yn enwedig i chi fel y Llywodraeth. Fe'm synnwyd, oherwydd yr wyf yn fawr fy nghefnogaeth i'r math o rymuso a ddarperir gan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Dywedaf hynny fel rhywun sydd wedi gweithio mewn cymunedau. Yr wyf wedi dechrau cwmnïau adfywio, rai ohonynt wedi methu oherwydd natur y broses o newid diwylliant. Holl ddiben Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yr wyf yn falch iawn ohoni, yw ei bod yn galluogi pobl, ac ni fwriadwyd i'n gwelliannau fod yn sarhad ar eich Llywodraeth mewn unrhyw ffordd. Yn wir, byddwn bob amser yn barod i sefyll a dweud fy mod yn ceisio bod yn ymarferol ac yn gefnogol. Gobeithio y derbyniwch y feirniadaeth fel beirniadaeth adeiladol.

Huw Lewis: Gwnaf, wrth gwrs, ac yr wyf yn

sure that the Minister will also do so, Mick. I welcome your remarks. However, there are two other political parties participating in this debate. One seems to think that Communities First is a no-hope programme, and the other seems to think that it only operates in one county in Wales. I am afraid that your constructive input to this debate, Mick, does not extend across the parties—I wish that it did.

Mick Bates: Yet again, Huw, you have gone for the conflict scenario, which I think is blocking the progress. None of us are perfect. There are times when we all take a conflict point of view.

However, to return to the substance of this debate, it may be worth reminding Huw that Communities First was originally developed in response to the general disillusionment with the way in which regeneration grants were dished out previously, prior to this innovative scheme. I also share that view. I would never really move away from the whole concept that it is better to deliver any programme locally, which is why, in our first amendment, we say what a great programme this is, Huw. I have no doubt that you would also understand—and I have commented on this in committee—that there were high expectations, let us say, in the early days, which could not be met. Although I accept that hindsight is a perfect science, it says in the report that it was rushed. We have to learn about building capacity. I mentioned many times in those early days that we had to ensure that there were a sufficient number of people with skills in the community to implement the programme. In terms of this type of community regeneration, capacity building is enormously important. You then move to a developmental stage following the completion of the consultative process. Finally, you end up with a regenerative product. I have looked at the table of expenditure and, at first, I accept that the project spend is considerably smaller than the spend required to build capacity and the structures in communities. However, the whole point is that we have to see a trend, Huw, which moves to outcome expenditure on projects increasing. If you look down the table of figures provided in the report, you

siŵr y gwnaiff y Gweinidog hynny hefyd, Mick. Croesawaf eich sylwadau. Fodd bynnag, mae dwy blaid wleidyddol arall yn rhan o'r ddadl hon. Mae'r naill fel pe bae'n credu bod y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn anobeithiol, ac ymddengys fod y llall yn credu mai mewn un sir yn unig yng Nghymru y mae'r rhaglen ar waith. Yn anffodus, nid yw eich esiampl o gyfraniad adeiladol i'r ddadl hon, Mick, yn ymestyn i bob plaid—mae hynny'n drueni.

Mick Bates: Unwaith eto, Huw, yr ydych wedi dewis creu gwrthdaro, ac mae hynny'n rhwystro'r cynnydd. Nid oes yr un ohonom yn berffaith. Mae yna adegau pan fyddwn i gyd yn arddel safbwynt o wrthdaro.

Fodd bynnag, i ddychwelyd at sylwedd y ddadl hon, efallai y byddai'n werth atgoffa Huw mai mewn ymateb i'r dadrithiad cyffredinol â'r ffordd y câi grantiau adfywio eu dosbarthu gynt, cyn y cynllun arloesol hwn, y datblygwyd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn wreiddiol. Dyna fy marn i hefyd. Ni fyddwn byth mewn gwirionedd yn symud o'r cysyniad cyffredinol ei bod yn well cyflwyno unrhyw raglen yn lleol, a dyna pam, yn ein gwelliant cyntaf, yr ydym yn canmol y rhaglen hon, Huw. Mae'n siŵr gennyf y byddech hefyd yn deall—ac yr wyf wedi cyflwyno sylwadau cyffelyb yn y pwyllgor—fod y disgwyliadau'n uchel, dywedwn, yn y dyddiau cynnar, ac na ellid eu bodloni. Er fy mod yn derbyn bod ôl-ddoethineb yn wyddor berffaith, dywed yr adroddiad ein bod wedi brysio. Rhaid inni ddysgu am feithrin gallu. Soniais droeon yn ystod y dyddiau cynnar hynny fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod digon o bobl â sgiliau yn y gymuned i weithredu'r rhaglen. O ran y math hwn o adfywio cymunedol, mae meithrin gallu yn bwysig iawn. Wedyn, gallwch symud at gam datblygiadol ar ôl cwblhau'r broses ymgynghori. Yn y diwedd bydd gennyh gynnyrch adfywiol. Yr wyf wedi bwrw golwg dros y tabl gwariant, ac ar yr olwg gyntaf derbynaf fod gwariant y prosiect yn sylweddol is na'r gwariant y mae ei angen i feithrin gallu a'r strwythurau mewn cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, yn anad dim, mae'n rhaid inni weld tuedd, Huw, sy'n symud tuag at sefyllfa lle y bydd gwariant canlyniadau ar brosiectau yn cynyddu. Os edrychwch ar hyd y tabl ffigurau a ddarperir

will see that my aspiration—and yours, perhaps, if you share it—is that we should see an increase in the outcome expenditure on projects in communities. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee travelled to see the outcome of a fantastic project in your constituency. We all want to see more of that; that is what we are saying.

In terms of our second amendment, there is a recommendation that states that the Government should oil the wheels of partnership and so forth—I cannot remember the exact wording at present. The strange term ‘programme bending’ is used. I always thought that it sounded slightly corrupt but, as the report states, we need more clarity on what that means. These identifiable areas of deprivation have more input and no-one would disagree with that. However, there is a way to go before we get the full integration necessary to achieve that.

Finally, in terms of amendment 7, we are looking towards the future. One of the things that I think is generally lacking in the whole process, Huw, is engagement with private business. Although that is not mentioned specifically in this report, when you confine yourselves—and you have to start somewhere, with geographical areas such as the 100 most deprived wards—you tend to rule out the fact that there is a whole network that you need to tap into to create a new enterprise culture in many of these areas. Private business could make that happen. In terms of this evaluation and the mid-term evaluation, there are things that can be improved. The whole tenet of the Welsh Liberal Democrats is to ensure that it works. Our criticism is constructive and I hope that all of the projects will be successful. However, you have a 10-year strategy and I think that we need to look closely—and I hope that the Minister will respond to this—at the exit strategies that the Government is helping people to create.

Val Lloyd: Looking at the amendments tabled by the opposition parties, I think that I could be forgiven, initially, for thinking that Communities First had been a complete and utter failure. They seem to be giving us the

yn yr adroddiad, fe welwch mai fy nyhead i—a’ch dyhead chi, efallai, os ydych yn ei rannu—yw y dylem weld cynnydd yn y gwariant canlyniadau ar brosiectau mewn cymunedau. Aeth y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i weld canlyniad prosiect ardderchog yn eich etholaeth chi. Yr ydym i gyd am weld mwy o hynny; dyna yr ydym yn ei ddweud.

O ran ein hail welliant, mae yna argymhelliad sy’n dweud y dylai’r Llywodraeth hwyluso gwaith y bartneriaeth ac ati—ni allaf gofio’r union eiriau ar hyn o bryd. Defnyddir y term rhyfedd ‘addasu rhaglenni’. Yr oeddwn wedi credu erioed ei fod yn swnio braidd yn llygredig, ond fel y dywed yr adroddiad, mae angen mwy o eglurder arnom o ran ystyr y term hwnnw. Caiff yr ardaloedd hynny o amddifadedd a nodwyd fwy o gyfle i gyfrannu, ac ni fyddai neb yn anghytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer i’w wneud cyn y cawn yr integreiddio llawn y mae ei angen i gyflawni hynny.

Yn olaf, o ran gwelliant 7, yr ydym yn edrych i’r dyfodol. Un o ddiffygion cyffredinol yn y broses gyfan, Huw, yw ymgysylltu â busnesau preifat. Er na sonnir yn benodol am hynny yn yr adroddiad hwn, pan fyddwch yn cyfyngu eich hun—a rhaid ichi ddechrau rywle, gydag ardaloedd daearyddol fel y 100 o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig—y duedd yw diystyru’r ffaith fod yna rwydwaith cyfan y mae angen ichi ymgysylltu ag ef er mwyn creu diwylliant mentro newydd mewn nifer o’r ardaloedd hyn. Gallai busnesau preifat wneud i hynny ddigwydd. O ran y gwerthusiad hwn a’r gwerthusiad canol tymor, mae yna bethau y gellir eu gwella. Prif ddiben Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yw sicrhau ei fod yn gweithio. Mae ein beirniadaeth yn adeiladol, a gobeithio y bydd pob un o’r prosiectau’n llwyddiannus. Fodd bynnag, mae gennych strategaeth 10 mlynedd, a chredaf fod angen inni edrych yn ofalus—a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb i hyn—ar y strategaethau ymadael y mae’r Llywodraeth yn helpu pobl i’w creu.

Val Lloyd: I edrych ar y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau, credaf y gellid maddau imi, i ddechrau, am feddwl bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi bod yn fethiant llwyr. Ymddengys eu bod yn rhoi’r

usual doom and gloom picture that does not recognise the many benefits that the programme has brought to local communities across Wales.

4.50 p.m.

I accept that not everything is perfect, but an evaluation is meant to point at the good and the not so good so that the latter can be acted upon and the former diversified to other areas. I see the Communities First programme, with its innovative approach to regeneration and its aims to build local capacity, as an aid to achieving longer-lasting results rather than headline-grabbing quick fixes. It is something that will last instead of being a seven-day shooting star. Capacity building takes time and I am sure that we can all point to issues in our constituencies that are taking time—much longer than we would wish—but they will be stronger for it. Progress can be slower in some areas because of local circumstances.

The programme is unique in creating a renewed sense of solidarity and community, which was so badly needed in communities. The interim report recognises that and states that Communities First has been successful in strengthening and restoring a sense of community and hope in local communities. Huw already referred to the 77 per cent of partnerships and their impression of a stronger community. That is nearly three-quarters of all the partnerships.

I will take an example from my own constituency to highlight how effective Communities First can be in transforming local communities. I touched on one example in my earlier question to the Minister and this is based in a similar area, but is a different project. It is called the Rugbywise project and is in a different part of the Penlan area in my constituency of Swansea East. It has been a huge success and I am told, although I have not been able to verify this, that it is the first of its kind in the whole of Wales. It aims to encourage participation in rugby and to ensure fair and equal opportunities for all children to participate in the game regardless of their age, gender or social background.

darlun negyddol arferol inni gan fethu â chydabod y llu o fuddiannau y mae'r rhaglen wedi'u creu i gymunedau lleol ledled Cymru.

Derbyniad nad yw popeth yn berffaith, ond diben gwerthusiad yw nodi elfennau da ac elfennau nad ydynt cystal, er mwyn gallu gweithredu ar yr ail ac arallgyfeirio'r cyntaf i ardaloedd eraill. Mae'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, â'i dull arloesol o adfywio a'i nodau i feithrin gallu lleol, yn fy marn i yn gyfrwng i sicrhau canlyniadau a fydd yn para'n hirach, yn hytrach nag atebion cyflym sy'n denu sylw'r cyfryngau. Mae'n rhywbeth a fydd yn para yn hytrach na seren wib saith diwrnod. Mae'n cymryd amser i feithrin gallu, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gall pob un ohonom nodi materion yn ein hetholaethau sy'n cymryd amser—lawer yn hwy nag y byddem yn ei ddymuno—ond byddant yn gryfach o ganlyniad i hynny. Gall cynnydd fod yn arafach mewn rhai ardaloedd oherwydd amgylchiadau lleol.

Mae'r rhaglen yn unigryw am ei bod yn creu ymdeimlad newydd o undod a chymuned, yr oedd ei angen yn ddirfawr mewn cymunedau. Mae'r adroddiad interim yn cydnabod hynny ac yn dweud bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn wedi bod yn llwyddiannus yn atgyfnerthu ac adfer ymdeimlad o gymuned a gobaith mewn cymunedau lleol. Cyfeiriodd Huw eisoes at y 77 y cant o bartneriaethau a'u hargraff o gymuned gryfach. Mae hynny bron yn dri chwarter o'r holl bartneriaethau.

Defnyddiaf enghraifft o'm hetholaeth i dynny sylw at y graddau y gall Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fod yn effeithiol wrth drawsnewid cymunedau lleol. Soniais am un enghraifft yn fy nghwestiwn cynharach i'r Gweinidog, ac mae'r enghraifft hon mewn ardal debyg, ond mae'n brosiect gwahanol. Ei enw yw prosiect Rugbywise ac mae mewn rhan wahanol o ardal Pen-lan yn fy etholaeth, sef Dwyrain Abertawe. Bu'n llwyddiant ysgubol, ac yr wyf ar ddeall, er nad wyf wedi gallu cadarnhau hyn, mai dyma'r prosiect cyntaf o'i fath yng Nghymru gyfan. Ei nod yw annog plant i gymryd rhan mewn rygbi a sicrhau cyfleoedd teg a chyfartal i bob plentyn gymryd rhan yn y gêm waeth beth

fo'i oed, ei ryw neu ei gefndir cymdeithasol.

It also offers an opportunity to get people back into work and training through the provision of sport and coach education facilities and it really is working. For the first time in 30 years in this area of Penlan, youth groups have been set up. That has to be a measure of success. There are currently four active groups going from strength to strength. The project has secured a paid coach and has also trained dads, predominantly—there are also a few mothers—from the area to get involved in coaching. That, again, is another strand that is bringing the community together. My proud boast is that the team has, so far, won every match this season. There are other unanticipated benefits, the main one being that the project has had a very positive impact on youth crime, which has significantly reduced. Those are not my figures or those of the project, but those of the local Communities First police team. Inevitably, with all those strands, it has brought the community together.

Mae hefyd yn gyfle i gael pobl yn ôl i mewn i waith a hyfforddiant drwy ddarparu cyfleusterau addysg chwaraeon a hyfforddiant, ac mae hynny i'w weld yn llwyddo. Am y tro cyntaf ers 30 mlynedd yn yr ardal hon ym Mhen-lan, mae grwpiau ieuencid wedi eu sefydlu. Rhaid bod hynny'n fesur o lwyddiant. Ar hyn o bryd, mae pedwar grŵp gweithgar yn mynd o nerth i nerth. Mae'r prosiect wedi cyflogi hyfforddwr ac mae hefyd wedi hyfforddi tadau, yn bennaf—mae yna rai mamau hefyd—o'r ardal i gymryd rhan yn y gwaith hyfforddi. Mae hynny, eto, yn elfen arall sy'n dod â'r gymuned ynghyd. Yr wyf yn falch o ymffrostio bod y tîm, hyd yma, wedi ennill pob gêm y tymor hwn. Mae yna fuddiannau eraill na ragwelwyd, yn arbennig yr effaith gadarnhaol iawn a gafodd y prosiect ar lefelau troseddu ymhlith ieuencid, sydd wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. Nid fy ffigurau i na ffigurau'r prosiect yw'r rheini, ond ffigurau tîm Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yr heddlu lleol. Yn anochel, gyda'r holl elfennau hynny, mae wedi dod â'r gymuned ynghyd.

Nevertheless, it would be foolish to deny that the report raises important issues. I accept that some aspects of the programme need to be retuned to maximise benefits for local communities. I particularly welcome the new Communities First guidance. However, we should also be proud of a programme that has introduced an innovative community-focused approach to regeneration in Wales and we should utilise the findings of this report to make it even better and more progressive than to date.

Serch hynny, byddai'n wirion gwadu bod yr adroddiad yn codi materion pwysig. Derbynïaf fod angen aildiwnio rhai agweddau ar y rhaglen er mwyn sicrhau'r buddiannau gorau posibl i gymunedau lleol. Croesawaf yn arbennig y canllawiau newydd ar gyfer Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, dylem hefyd ymfalchïo mewn rhaglen sydd wedi dod â dull cymunedol arloesol o adfywio yng Nghymru, a dylem ddefnyddio darganfyddiadau'r adroddiad hwn i'w gwella ymhellach a'i gwneud yn fwy blaengar nag ar hyn o bryd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Dylwn ddatgan buddiant fel un a fu'n cadeirio corff sy'n atebol i bartneriaeth rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—gwelais rai o lwyddiannau a gwendidau'r rhaglen. Mae'n rhyfedd bod y Llywodraeth heddiw'n mabwysiadu'r agwedd o edrych ar asesiad sy'n cynnwys cryn dipyn o feirniadaeth neu sy'n nodi gwendidau gan ddisgwyl i ni beidio â chyfeirio atynt. Nid dyna yw ein gwaith ni yma.

Alun Ffred Jones: I should declare an interest as a former chair of a body which is accountable to a Communities First partnership programme—I have seen some of the successes and weaknesses of the programme. It is strange that the Government today is adopting the attitude of looking at an assessment which includes considerable criticism and points out weaknesses while expecting us not to make any reference to them. That is not our job here.

Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at ddau fater lleol sy'n

I wish to refer specifically to two local issues

ategu'r sylwadau yn yr asesiad ynglŷn â diffyg cydgordio rhwng y strategaethau mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sy'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar yr ardaloedd. Gwendid sylfaenol cyffredinol yn y rhaglen yw na wnaed archwiliad cychwynnol er mwyn mesur llwyddiant y cynlluniau lleol a'r newid sydd wedi digwydd i'r ffiniau cyn i'r rhaglen gael ei thraed oddi tani.

Mae un mater yn ymwneud â chanolfan Plas Pawb, sef canolfan integredig yn Ysgol Maesincla, Caernarfon. Mae'r ysgol yn gwasanaethu ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ward Peblig, ond mae hefyd yn gwasanaethu ardal mwy llewyrchus, ond oherwydd bod dalgylch yr ysgol yn rhannu ward Peblig, amddifadur plant a rhieni o fewn yr ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o'r cynllun a'r cyfleoedd cyffrous a gynigir ym Mhlas Pawb.

Gofynnodd y tîm sy'n arwain y ganolfan integredig hon am hyblygrwydd i geisio ehangu'r ardal ac i roi cyfleoedd i ragor o blant a'u teuluoedd o fewn yr ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, 'na' oedd ateb y Llywodraeth. Mae'n debyg bod swyddogion a Gweinidogion yng Nghaerdydd yn gwybod yn well na phobl leol—egwyddor sy'n hollol groes i'r hyn a ddadleuwyd heddiw ynglŷn â Chymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Mae swyddogion Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ward Peblig wedi protestio ynghylch y sefyllfa, ond heb lwyddiant. Os na all dwy adran gydweithio ar fater fel hwn, beth a ddywed hynny am y gweithio trawsadrannol yr ydym yn clywed cymaint yn ei gylch?

Daw'r enghraifft arall o ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ym Mhwlheli, Penrhyn Llŷn. Dyma ardal a adnabyddir gan arolwg y mynegai amddifadedd lluosog fel un o ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru o ran mynediad i wasanaethau. Cydnabyddir hynny yn yr adroddiad hwnnw, ac eto dyma ardal sydd wedi ei heithrio o'r cynllun Cymunedau @Ei Gilydd, sy'n helpu pobl i feithrin sgiliau technoleg newydd. Unwaith eto, pa fath o resymeg sydd i hynny?

Methodd yr ardal hon â denu grant ar gyfer y

that support the comments in the assessment regarding the lack of concordance between the strategies in Communities First areas, which directly affects those areas. A general fundamental weakness in the programme is that an initial audit was not held to measure the success of local schemes and the change in the boundaries that took place before the programme was properly established.

One issue involves Plas Pawb centre, an integrated centre at Ysgol Maesincla, Caernarfon. The school serves a Communities First area in the Peblig ward. But it also serves a more prosperous area, but because the school's catchment area shares the Peblig ward, the children and parents within the Communities First area are deprived of the scheme and the exciting opportunities provided at Plas Pawb.

The team leading this integrated centre asked for flexibility to try to expand the area and to give more children and their families opportunities within the Communities First area. However, the Government's response was 'no'. It appears that officials and Ministers in Cardiff know better than the local people—a principle that is entirely contrary to what has been debated here today regarding Communities First.

The Communities First officers in the Peblig ward protested about the situation, but to no avail. If two departments cannot co-operate on such matters, what does that say about cross-departmental working, about which we hear so much?

The other example comes from a Communities First area in Pwllheli in the Llŷn Peninsula. This is an area which is recognised by a review of the multiple index of deprivation as one of the most deprived areas in Wales in terms of access to services. That is acknowledged in that report. But, again, this area has been excluded from the Communities @One scheme, which helps people to gain skills in new technology. Again, what kind of reasoning lies behind that?

This area failed to get a grant for the

cynllun ardderchog O Ddrws i Ddrws yn Nefyn, sy'n helpu pobl sy'n cael anhawster cyrraedd gwasanaethau hanfodol. Dyma enghraifft arall o weithredu cwbl ddigyswllt ar ran y Llywodraeth. Gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth ailedrych ar yr agweddau hyn, ac nid yn unig ar yr enghreifftiau penodol y soniais amdanynt, i sicrhau bod adrannau yn sylweddoli bod angen i'w polisiau fwydo i mewn i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Mae llawer iawn i'w ganmol yn y rhaglen ac yn sicr, o ran egwyddor, yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogol iddi, ond mae diffyg cyllid ar lefel genedlaethol yng Nghymru yn golygu bod plant a theuluoedd difreintiedig y tu allan i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cael eu heithrio hefyd. Mae'r diffyg arian hwn yn llesteirio'r rhaglen yn gyffredinol.

excellent O Ddrws i Ddrws scheme in Nefyn, which helps people who have difficulty in accessing essential services. This is another example of completely disjointed action by the Government. I ask the Government to revisit these aspects, and not only the specific examples that I have mentioned, to ensure that departments realise that their policies need to feed into Communities First areas.

There is much to applaud in the programme and certainly, in principle, I am entirely supportive of it, but the lack of funding on a national level in Wales means that deprived children and families outside Communities First areas are also excluded. This lack of funding also hinders the programme generally.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I invite the Business Minister to propose a procedural motion to extend this Plenary meeting.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting by 30 minutes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Are there 10 Members in favour? I see that there are. Therefore, I call for a vote to extend the session by 30 minutes.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol i ymestyn y cyfarfod Llawn hwn.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ychwanegu 30 munud at hyd y Cyfarfod Llawn hwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes 10 Aelod o blaid gwneud hynny? Oes. Felly, galwaf am bleidlais i ychwanegu 30 munud at y sesiwn.

*Cynnig trefniadol: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 4.
Procedural motion: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 4.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
James, Irene
Wood, Leanne

Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Gwerthuso Cyntaf Cymunedau yn Gyntaf: Parhad The First Communities First Evaluation Report: Continued

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call on Christine Gwyther.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Christine Gwyther.

Christine Gwyther: There are only two Communities First wards in my constituency; I wish there were more, not because I wish to see more deprivation, but because I have seen at first hand how well the Communities First wards in my constituency work and I value the work being done in those wards. Because of this, I have been saddened over recent weeks by the repeated attempts by some opposition Members, seemingly led on this occasion by Plaid Cymru, to undermine the work being done by Communities First partnerships across Wales. During First Minister's questions over the last month or so, we have seen Plaid Cymru call into question the professional qualifications of Communities First workers, implying that they are sub-standard. We have seen it in the Chamber, and we have seen Plaid Cymru trailing around television studios rubbishing the work being done by local people in our most disadvantaged areas. I have asked my local Communities First teams how well qualified they are. You may think that that is an impertinent question, but, because they know that I have not been elected to this place to undermine the work that they do for my constituents, their answer was unequivocal, and they were happy for me to share it with the Assembly this afternoon.

Christine Gwyther: Dim ond dwy ward Cymunedau yn Gyntaf sydd yn fy etholaeth i; byddai'n dda gennyf petai mwy ohonynt, nid am fy mod yn awyddus i weld mwy o amddifadedd, ond am fy mod wedi gweld yn uniongyrchol lwyddiant y wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn fy etholaeth ac am fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen yn y wardiau hynny. O ganlyniad, yr wyf wedi fy siomi yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf gan ymdrechion niferus rai o Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, yn cael eu harwain, mae'n ymddangos, yn yr achos hwn gan Blaid Cymru, i danseilio'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud gan bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru. Yn ystod cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog yn ystod y mis neu ddau ddiwethaf, gwelsom Plaid Cymru yn amau cymwysterau proffesiynol gweithwyr Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan awgrymu nad ydynt yn cyrraedd y safon. Fe'i gwelsom yn y Siambr, ac fe welsom Plaid Cymru mewn amrywiol stiwdios teledu yn bychanu'r gwaith a wneir gan bobl leol yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Yr wyf wedi holi fy nhimau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf lleol am eu cymwysterau. Efallai fod hwnnw'n gwestiwn haerllug yn eich barn chi, ond, oherwydd eu bod yn gwybod na chefais fy ethol i'r man hwn i danseilio'r gwaith a wnânt dros fy etholwyr, yr oedd eu hateb yn glir, ac yr oeddent yn fodlon imi ei rannu gyda'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma.

5.00 p.m.

The qualifications cover the sorts of skills that will particularly benefit the communities that the teams serve. Between the two wards, we have the holder of a masters in business administration, a millennium fellow—the award was given for a capacity-building project for adults—a holder of a postgraduate certificate in development management, a registered consultant and trainer with the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, a holder of the certificate in grantsmanship, a holder of the further and adult education teachers certificate, a bachelor of science, and three bachelors of arts. All are qualified to appropriate national vocational qualification standard in community development. All these qualifications are held by a surprisingly small team of about half a dozen people. They are multiskilled, keen, proactive, and they are delivering for my constituents.

Leanne Wood *rose*—

Christine Gwyther: I will let you in later, Leanne.

Plaid Cymru attacks workers in Communities First partnerships in the Chamber and through the media. It then indulges in some jaw-dropping doublespeak, by tabling an amendment congratulating all the staff involved in the Communities First programme. How utterly nauseating. Communities First projects across Wales will be saying today, ‘With friends like Plaid Cymru, who needs enemies?’.

Leanne Wood: On community development qualifications, the evaluation report criticises the Government for not having a number of civil servants in the department with community development qualifications. That is the issue that I have been raising; I have not said anything about those people working on the ground having a lack of community development qualifications. In fact, the work on the ground is excellent community development work. If you had listened to my contribution earlier, you would have picked that up. It is the political incompetence of the Government that is letting these people down

Mae'r cymwysterau'n cynnwys y mathau o sgiliau a fydd yn arbennig o fuddiol i'r cymunedau a wasanaethir gan y timau. Rhwng y ddwy ward, mae gennym rywun sydd â gradd meistr ym maes gweinyddu busnes, cymrawd y mileniwm—dyfarwyd y wobr am brosiect meithrin gallu i oedolion—rhywun sydd â thystysgrif ôl-radd ym maes rheoli datblygu, hyfforddwr ac ymgynghorydd cofrestredig gyda Chyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, rhywun sydd â thystysgrif dyfarnu grantiau, rhywun sydd â thystysgrif athrawon addysg bellach ac addysg oedolion, baglor yn y gwyddorau a thri baglor yn y celfyddydau. Maent ganddynt i gyd gymwysterau ar safon cymhwyster galwedigaethol cenedlaethol briodol ym maes datblygu cymunedol. Delir yr holl gymwysterau hyn gan dîm rhyfeddol o fach o ryw hanner dwsin o bobl. Mae ganddynt sgiliau lluosog, maent yn frwdfrydig, yn rhagweithiol ac yn darparu ar gyfer fy etholwyr.

Leanne Wood *a gododd*—

Christine Gwyther: Cewch gyfle i siarad yn nes ymlaen, Leanne.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn lladd ar weithwyr mewn partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y Siambr a thrwy'r cyfryngau. Yna, ânt ati i wrthddweud eu hunain yn ryfeddol, drwy gyflwyno gwelliant yn llongyfarch yr holl staff sy'n gysylltiedig â'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae'n ddigon i godi cyfog. Bydd prosiectau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru yn dweud heddiw, ‘Gyda ffrindiau fel Plaid Cymru, pam mae angen gelynyon?’.

Leanne Wood: O ran cymwysterau datblygu cymunedol, mae'r adroddiad gwerthuso yn beirniadu'r Llywodraeth am beidio â chael nifer o weision sifil yn yr adran sy'n meddu ar gymwysterau datblygu cymunedol. Dyna'r mater yr wyf wedi bod yn ei godi; nid wyf wedi dweud dim byd ynglŷn â chymwysterau datblygu cymunedol y bobl hynny sy'n gweithio ar lawr gwlad. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r gwaith ar lawr gwlad yn waith datblygu cymunedol ardderchog. Pe baech wedi gwrando ar fy nghyfraniad yn gynharach, byddech wedi sylwi ar hynny. Anallu gwleidyddol y Llywodraeth sy'n

on the ground.

Christine Gwyther: Have you finished? You did not actually ask me a question, which I would have expected from an intervention. When you have spoken in the Chamber, and in the media, you have never made that clear. You need to think carefully about what you say about the work being done in my communities, as well as in yours—where you live, and where I live.

Even more interesting, is Plaid Cymru's amendment 1, which seeks to remove the part of the Government motion that congratulates those involved in Communities First activity throughout Wales on their contribution to the regeneration of local areas. I would have thought that that was a fairly benign motion, and so I was surprised to see the amendment. What on earth could be the motivation for that snub? Why does Plaid Cymru seek to insult the unpaid partnership members, who are working so hard for all of our constituents? Does community empowerment threaten Plaid Cymru? These unsung heroes organise activities throughout their wards—social, training and clean-up activities, fun days and charity fundraisers. They work with the paid staff in a cohesive, collaborative, imaginative and proactive way. They deserve the recognition that the Government motion gives them. I will be voting for that recognition in the Chamber this afternoon.

Finally, on the number of jobs created, I have some raw data from my constituency. In the Dockleaf capacity-building project in Pembroke Dock, the community school situated in the Llanion Communities First ward has enrolled 16 adults on training, to NVQ level-2 childcare, of which four have completed so far. An additional four trainees are undergoing training to NVQ level 3. They will soon be job-ready, and there is a need for qualified childcare practitioners in my area. Four of the trainees have found full-time employment as classroom assistants, and a further four have gained part-time employment as meal supervisors. This is real

siomi'r bobl hyn ar lawr gwlad.

Christine Gwyther: A ydych wedi gorffen? Ni wnaethoch ofyn cwestiwn imi, fel y byddwn wedi ei ddisgwyl mewn ymyriad. Pan ydych wedi siarad yn y Siambr, ac yn y cyfryngau, nid ydych erioed wedi egluro hynny. Mae angen ichi feddwl yn ofalus am yr hyn a ddywedwch am y gwaith a wneir yn fy nghymunedau i, yn ogystal â'ch cymunedau chi—lle yr ydych chi'n byw, a lle yr wyf fi'n byw.

Mae gwelliant 1 gan Blaid Cymru, sy'n ceisio dileu'r rhan yng nghynnig y Llywodraeth sy'n llongyfarch y rheini sy'n gysylltiedig â gweithgarwch Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru am eu cyfraniad i'r broses o adfywio ardaloedd lleol, hyd yn oed yn fwy diddorol. Byddwn wedi meddwl bod y cynnig hwnnw'n un cymharol ddiniwed, ac felly yr oedd yn syndod gweld y gwelliant. Beth ar wyneb y ddaear a allai ysgogi'r dirmyg hwnnw? Pam mae Plaid Cymru yn ceisio sarhau aelodau di-dâl o bartneriaethau, sy'n gweithio mor galed ar ran pob un o'n hetholwyr? A yw grymuso cymunedau yn fygythiad i Blaid Cymru? Mae'r arwyr diglod hyn yn trefnu gweithgareddau drwy eu wardiau cyfan—gweithgareddau cymdeithasol, hyfforddi a glanhau, diwrnodau o hwyl a digwyddiadau codi arian i elusennau. Maent yn gweithio gyda'r staff cyflogedig mewn modd cydlynol, cydweithredol, dychmygol a rhagweithiol. Maent yn haeddu'r gydnabyddiaeth y mae cynnig y Llywodraeth yn ei rhoi iddynt. Byddaf yn pleidleisio dros y gydnabyddiaeth honno yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma.

Yn olaf, o ran nifer y swyddi a grëwyd, mae gennyf rywfaint o ddata craidd o'm hetholaeth. Ym mhrosiect meithrin gallu Dockleaf yn Noc Penfro, mae'r ysgol gymunedol yn ward Cymunedau yn Gyntaf Llanion wedi cofrestru 16 o oedolion ar gwrs hyfforddi ym maes gofal plant ar lefel 2 NVQ, ac mae pedwar o blith y rhain wedi cwblhau'r cwrs hyd yn hyn. Mae pedwar arall yn cael eu hyfforddi i ymgymryd â hyfforddiant at lefel 3 NVQ. Byddant yn barod i weithio mewn swydd yn fuan, ac mae angen ymarferwyr gofal plant cymwys yn fy ardal i. Mae pedwar o'r rhain sy'n cael eu hyfforddi wedi cael gwaith llawn amser fel

training, real jobs, real capacity building, and real life chances for my constituents. That would not have happened without Communities First.

Plaid Cymru, and some other Members, may not appreciate the changes that Communities First is making to our most disadvantaged communities, but I do. I see those changes every day, and I reject utterly the opposition threat to my communities, which has been posed in the Chamber today.

David Melding: I am sure that I am not the only Member who has found much of this debate depressing, and the truculent tone of some of the contributions is regrettable. It is regrettable, because this is an excellent report; it is a first-class evaluation and it says that the general direction that the Government has chosen is innovative, proper and can set standards that might be emulated all over Europe if it is a successful programme in the longer term. Who knows? That is where we should start, because it is a confident Government that produces evaluation of that quality. It fits in with the Beecham review, which is another excellent evaluation, if you like. Of course, Members can quote selectively and try to show the Government up in a particularly poor light, but these documents must be read as a whole and you then see the profound value of effective evaluation and scrutiny. It is confident Governments that do that, and so I have been keen to congratulate the Minister for local government—who has just come in—and the Minister for social justice on having the guts to have a proper evaluation done independently. It is of exceptionally good quality, and it can be read and lessons can be learned from it and taken up very effectively.

The joint meeting of the Local Government and Public Services Committee and the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee had a much better session, in which we really drilled down to the important issues. There was none of the rather petulant political grandstanding that can go on. That was a

cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth, ac mae pedwar arall wedi cael gwaith rhan amser fel goruchwylwyr prydau bwyd. Mae hwn yn hyfforddiant go iawn, swyddi go iawn, meithrin gallu go iawn a chyfleodd bywyd go iawn i'm hetholwyr. Ni fyddai hynny wedi digwydd heb Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Efallai nad yw Plaid Cymru, a rhai Aelodau eraill, yn gwerthfawrogi'r newidiadau y mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn eu gwneud yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, ond yr wyf fi. Gwelaf y newidiadau hynny bob dydd, a gwrthodaf yn llwyr y bygythiad gan y gwrthbleidiau i'm cymunedau, fel sydd wedi ei ddangos yn y Siambr heddiw.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn siŵr nad fi yw'r unig Aelod sy'n meddwl bod rhan helaeth o'r ddadl hon yn ddiflas, ac mae naws ffyrnig rhai o'r cyfraniadau yn anffodus. Mae'n anffodus oherwydd bod hwn yn adroddiad ardderchog; mae'n werthusiad o'r radd flaenaf a dywed fod y cyfeiriad cyffredinol y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i ddewis yn arloesol, yn briodol ac yn gallu gosod safonau a all gael eu hefelychu ledled Ewrop os bydd yn rhaglen lwyddiannus yn y tymor hwy. Pwy a ŵyr? Dyna ble y dylem ddechrau, oherwydd Llywodraeth hyderus sy'n cynhyrchu gwerthusiadau o'r safon hon. Mae'n cyd-fynd ag adolygiad Beecham, sy'n werthusiad ardderchog arall, os mynnwch. Wrth gwrs, gall Aelodau ddyfynnu'n ddetholus a cheisio codi cywilydd ar y Llywodraeth, ond rhaid darllen y dogfennau hyn yn eu cyfanrwydd i weld gwerth mawr proses werthuso a chraffu effeithiol. Llywodraethau hyderus sy'n gwneud hynny, ac felly yr wyf wedi bod yn awyddus i longyfarch y Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol—sydd newydd ymuno â ni—a'r Gweinidog dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol am fod yn ddigon dewr i drefnu gwerthusiad priodol yn annibynnol. Mae o safon eithriadol o uchel, a gellir ei ddarllen a gellir dysgu gwersi ohono yn effeithiol iawn.

Cafodd cyd-gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio sesiwn well o lawer, lle yr aethom i wraidd y materion pwysig. Ni chafwyd dim ymdrechion gwleidyddol cynhenllyd i greu argraff, fel

better service to the people of Wales and particularly to the people who live in Communities First areas.

I want to focus on some of the issues that have been raised, and which must be taken head on and resolved, because we now need to move this strategy forward so that we can reap the benefits of its scope and ambition. There is some reluctance on the part of councillors to let go and this must be a concern for us. They are still focusing on concepts of some form of geographical sovereignty, where they must have control in a particular area, and they are not taking a more spatial approach to the whole business of public service delivery.

The report says that there is relatively little sign of change. I am prepared to accept that this has been about giving communities confidence, developing their capacities, and so it is in the next phase that we will start to see some of that work bearing fruit. That is what we expect, but we have to put on record that we are still awaiting the obvious and vigorous signs of change that we had all hoped for. There is little evidence of effective monitoring and evaluation, which was a concern. There is a careful balance between giving people the confidence to take on responsibilities and, occasionally, to fail—and without some risk-taking, you will not have much innovation—while also needing to identify good practice and spread it about. Communities need support, and an evidence base to inspire some of their thinking, so that is an important area to look at.

I will look at some of the things that the report says about the National Assembly, which we need to take on board. They include the lack of strategic connection at Government level to some of the opportunities that Communities First is generating. It is still early days, and this is not to say that the Government has failed; it just means that those connections now need to be made so that full advantage is taken. There is still, the report says, a silo-based nature in some of the Welsh Assembly Government's structures. How could it be otherwise? That is how government has been

sy'n gallu digwydd. Yr oedd hwnnw'n wasanaeth gwell i bobl Cymru, ac yn arbennig i'r bobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar rai o'r materion a godwyd ac sy'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy a'u datrys yn uniongyrchol, gan fod angen inni symud y strategaeth hon yn ei blaen bellach er mwyn inni weld manteision ei chwmpas a'i huchelgais. Mae ychydig amharodrwydd ar ran cynghorwyr i ollwng gafael, a rhaid bod hynny'n fater o ofid inni. Maent yn canolbwyntio o hyd ar gysyniadau o ryw fath o sofraniaeth ddaearyddol, lle mae'n rhaid iddynt gael rheolaeth mewn ardal benodol, ac nid ydynt yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd fwy gofodol tuag at yr holl fusnes o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Yn ôl yr adroddiad, nid oes llawer o arwyddion o newid. Yr wyf yn barod i dderbyn bod hyn wedi ymwneud â rhoi hyder i gymunedau gan feithrin eu gallu, ac felly mai yn y cam nesaf y byddwn yn dechrau gweld rhywfaint o'r gwaith hwnnw'n dwyn ffrwyth. Dyna a ddisgwyliwn, ond rhaid inni gofnodi ein bod yn aros o hyd am yr arwyddion amlwg a grymus o newid yr oeddem wedi gobeithio amdanynt. Nid oes llawer o dystiolaeth o fonitro a gwerthuso effeithiol, a oedd yn peri pryder. Mae yna gydbwysedd gofalus rhwng rhoi hyder i bobl ymgymryd â chyfrifoldebau, a methu o bryd i'w gilydd—a heb gymryd rhai risgiau, ni fyddwch yn arloesol iawn—gan gynnal hefyd yr angen i nodi arfer da a'i rannu. Mae angen cymorth ar gymunedau, a sail dystiolaeth i ysbrydoli rhywfaint o'u meddylfryd, felly, mae hwnnw'n faes pwysig i'w ystyried.

Edrychaf ar rai o'r pethau a ddywed yr adroddiad am y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy. Ymhlith y pethau hyn mae diffyg cysylltiad strategol ar lefel Llywodraeth â rhai o'r cyfleoedd y mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn eu creu. Megis dechrau y mae, ac nid yw hyn yn golygu bod y Llywodraeth wedi methu; y cyfan y mae'n ei olygu yw bod angen gwneud y cysylltiadau hynny bellach er mwyn manteisio arnynt yn llawn. Yn ôl yr adroddiad, mae natur sy'n seiliedig ar seilo yn rhai o strwythurau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o hyd. Sut y gallai fod fel arall? Dyna

structured for time immemorial. However, if we want a new approach, these issues will have to be tackled.

There was inadequate staffing initially of the Communities First secretariat in the Assembly, and I would be interested if the Minister could assure us that that was no longer the case. That led to some initial difficulties, such as the lack of connection with other departments to spread good practice, and to see public service delivery as a whole within as well as without the Assembly. Those are the things that this excellent evaluation report point to.

I will finish on an optimistic note. The evaluation is that this is an excellent initiative; we want to work hard to ensure that the people of Wales living in Communities First areas benefit from its full development, which probably entails a 10 or 20-year programme. That is where we are at, realistically. However, it is a worthy programme, and I wish the Government well with it. I hope that it will take some of these remarks in the non-partisan spirit in which they were intended.

5.10 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: I reassert that the Welsh Liberal Democrats are calling for more openness, transparency and accountability, which should continue to underpin the Communities First programme. It is laudable in terms of local empowerment. We know that there are local difficulties in certain projects, between the project members and some locally elected council members, which have already been alluded to. Those kinds of issues stain the good record and work of the Communities First projects.

Some of the concerns that I have are to do with spending. Over the past five years, my understanding is that a number of questions have been raised about core spending being consistently so much more than that spent on actual projects. I understand that the core spend was £83.2 million and, in comparison, £15.8 million was spent on projects. I am sure that the Minister can address these

sut y mae llywodraeth wedi'i hadeiladu ers cyn cof. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn sicrhau dulliau gweithredu newydd, bydd yn rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

Yr oedd darpariaeth staffio ysgrifenyddiaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y Cynulliad yn annigonol ar y cychwyn, a byddai'n ddiddorol pe gallai'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd inni nad oedd hynny'n wir mwyach. Arweiniodd hynny at rai anawsterau cychwynnol, megis diffyg cysylltiad ag adrannau eraill i rannu arfer da, ac i weld darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ei gyfanrwydd yn y Cynulliad a'r tu allan. Dyna'r pethau y mae'r adroddiad gwerthuso ardderchog hwn yn cyfeirio atynt.

Dof i ben ar nodyn gobeithiol. Yn ôl y gwerthusiad mae hon yn fenter ardderchog; yr ydym am weithio'n galed i sicrhau bod pobl Cymru sy'n byw yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cael budd o'i datblygu'n llawn, sy'n golygu rhaglen 10 neu 20 mlynedd, fwy na thebyg. Dyna yw ein sefyllfa bresennol, yn realistig. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaglen deilwng, a dymunaf yn dda i'r Llywodraeth wrth ei gweithredu. Gobeithio y bydd yn derbyn rhai o'r sylwadau hyn yn yr ysbryd amhleidiol fel y'u bwriadwyd.

Eleanor Burnham: Ategfaf fod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn galw am ddull mwy agored, eglur ac atebol, a ddylai barhau i ategu'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae'n ganmoladwy o ran grymuso lleol. Gwyddom fod anawsterau lleol mewn prosiectau penodol, rhwng aelodau o'r prosiect a rhai aelodau cyngor sydd wedi eu hethol yn lleol, fel y cyfeiriwyd eisoes. Mae'r mathau hynny o faterion yn pardduo gwaith a record dda prosiectau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Mae a wnelo rhai o'r pryderon sydd gennyf â gwariant. Dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, deallaf fod nifer o gwestiynau wedi'u codi ynglŷn â'r ffaith fod gwariant craidd yn gyson wedi cymaint yn uwch nag a wariwyd ar brosiectau gwirioneddol. Deallaf mai £83.2 miliwn oedd y gwariant craidd, ac o'i gymharu gwariwyd £15.8 miliwn ar brosiectau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gall y

issues, because they are worrying a lot of the people who look at the effectiveness of the projects. I have some local examples, but I do not believe that I will have enough time to go through them all. One example is that the Rhyl West ward in Denbighshire was awarded £99,380 for its core spend but nothing for its projects. There are other examples, but we do not have enough time.

As others have said, the evaluation has praised the Welsh Assembly Government by stating clearly that it has taken the right direction. I wonder whether the Minister and the Labour Assembly Government could give us assurances about the training courses, staff and facilities that are being double-funded, in some people's view, all over Wales. For instance, on Monday, the Flying Start targeted areas were announced. That is a £46 million-worth programme of investment, aimed at giving children in disadvantaged areas a better start in life, in preparation for school and the long term, which we laud. The Government press release stated that the partnerships were asked to identify their most deprived communities with reference to the Welsh index of multiple deprivation and other recognised poverty indicators, to match these identified areas as closely as possible. While we of course welcome investment for Flying Start, if the same indicators as those for Communities First are used, will that not muddy the waters and create an overlap?

My concluding point is that the Liberal Democrats would like to see the Communities First programmes having a community enterprise element that includes more sustainability. In other words, there should be a community enterprise that can sustain itself as opposed to one that is sustained through public intervention only. I hope that the Minister and the Labour Assembly Government can address those concerns.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I will turn first to the amendments. Leanne,

Gweinidog fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn, oherwydd maent yn peri pryder i lawer o'r bobl sy'n edrych ar effeithiolrwydd y prosiectau. Mae gennyf rai enghreifftiau lleol, ond nid wyf yn credu y bydd gennyf ddigon o amser i sôn amdanynt i gyd. Un enghraifft yw bod £99,380 wedi'i roi ar gyfer ward Gorllewin y Rhyl yn sir Ddinbych ar gyfer ei gwariant craidd, ond ni roddwyd dim iddi ar gyfer ei phrosiectau. Mae yna enghreifftiau eraill, ond nid oes gennym ddigon o amser.

Fel y mae eraill wedi ei ddweud, mae'r gwerthusiad wedi canmol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru drwy ddweud yn glir ei bod wedi dilyn y trywydd iawn. Tybed a allai'r Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad roi sicrwydd inni ynghylch y cyrsiau hyfforddiant, y staff a'r cyfleusterau sy'n cael eu hariannu ddwywaith, ym marn rhai pobl, ledled Cymru gyfan. Er enghraifft, ddydd Llun, cyhoeddwyd yr ardaloedd a dargedir gan Dechrau'n Deg. Mae honno'n rhaglen fuddsoddi gwerth £46 miliwn, sydd â'r nod o roi dechrau gwell mewn bywyd i blant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, er mwyn eu paratoi ar gyfer yr ysgol a'r hirdymor, ac yr ydym yn canmol hynny. Dywedodd y datganiad i'r wasg gan y Llywodraeth fod partneriaethau wedi cael cais am nodi eu cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig gan gyfeirio at fynegai amddifadedd lluosog Cymru a dangosyddion tloidi cydnabyddedig eraill, i gyd-fynd â'r ardaloedd hynny a nodwyd mor agos â phosibl. Er ein bod ni wrth gwrs yn croesawu buddsoddiad ar gyfer Dechrau'n Deg, os defnyddir yr un dangosyddion ag ar gyfer Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, oni fydd hynny'n drysu pethau ac yn achosi gorgyffwrdd?

Fy mhwynt olaf yw y byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn awyddus i weld y rhaglenni Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cynnwys elfen o fentro cymunedol sy'n cynnwys mwy o gynaliadwyedd. Hynny yw, dylid cael menter gymunedol hunangynhaliol yn hytrach na menter a gynhelir drwy ymyriad cyhoeddus yn unig. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Trof yn gyntaf at y gwelliannau. Leanne, mae

Communities First workers are at the coalface; most of them relish the challenge and they love the bottom-up approach. You talk about what is not going on, but there are childcare conferences, benefit take-up schemes, and everything imaginable going on in Communities First partnerships, if that is what people want. Partnerships have the facility to learn from each other and to achieve best practice. What Leanne said was all about wish-list politics; she did not talk about the practical approach that we, as an Assembly Government, have taken, with the bottom-up approach, which was illustrated so eloquently by Val Lloyd and Christine Gwyther with examples of how communities have really benefited.

On the one hand, Leanne, you tell me that my Communities First workers spend too much time on bureaucracy and then, on the other, you ask me for more guidance. What do you want? At the end of the day, we have to strike the right balance. I think that it is strange that a nationalist who does not want anything to do with England or the UK most of the time— unless it is to do with Treasury money, of course—then finds convenient examples to use from England. You went there to find a statistic to knock this programme in Wales, which was produced in Wales, works well in Wales and is acknowledged at a European level as being excellent, as David Melding indicated. This is a good, innovative project.

When you talk about honesty, Leanne, do you seriously think that if I was not honest about these issues, I would have commissioned such research? I wanted this research to take the project forward because, as your colleague, Alun Ffred, said, we know that there are difficulties in some areas, and things do not always join up properly, which was the issue that David Melding alluded to. We have to work through these issues. This evaluation is the starting point for taking matters forward. We are talking about a project that will probably run another 10, 15 or 20 years, and we have to give our commitment to that if we are genuine about some of these issues.

gweithwyr Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y rheng flaen; mae'r rhan fwyaf yn mwynhau'r her ac wrth eu bodd gyda'r dull o'r bôn i'r brig. Soniwch am yr hyn nad yw'n digwydd, ond mae cynadleddau gofal plant, cynlluniau derbyn budd-daliadau a phopeth y gellir ei ddychmygu eu digwydd mewn partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, os dyna y mae pobl am ei gael. Mae gan bartneriaethau y cyfleuster i ddysgu gan ei gilydd a sicrhau arfer gorau. Gwleidyddiaeth rhestr ddymuniadau oedd y cyfan a soniodd Leanne amdano; ni soniodd am y dull ymarferol yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, wedi ei fabwysiadu, sef y dull o'r bôn i'r brig a fynegwyd mor huawdl gan Val Lloyd a Christine Gwyther gydag enghreifftiau o'r modd y mae cymunedau wedi elwa'n wirioneddol.

Ar y naill law, Leanne, dywedwch wrthyf fod fy ngweithwyr Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn treulio gormod o amser ar fiwrocratiaeth, ac yna, ar y llaw arall, gofynnwch imi am ragor o arweiniad. Beth sydd arnoch ei eisiau? Rhaid inni gael y cydbwysedd iawn yn y pen draw. Rhyfedd fod cenedlaetholwraig nad yw am wneud dim â Lloegr na'r DU ran amlaf— oni bai bod a wnelo hynny ag arian y Trysorlys, wrth gwrs—wedyn yn dod o hyd i enghreifftiau cyfleus i'w defnyddio o Loegr. Aethoch yno i gael ystadegyn i feirniadu'r rhaglen hon yng Nghymru, a gynhyrchwyd yng Nghymru, sy'n gweithio'n dda yng Nghymru ac a gydnabyddir ar lefel Ewropeaidd fel rhaglen ardderchog, fel y dywedodd David Melding. Mae hwn yn brosiect arloesol, da.

Pan fyddwch yn sôn am onestrwydd, Leanne, a ydych yn credu o ddifrif, os nad oeddwn yn onest ynglŷn â'r materion hyn, y byddwn wedi comisiynu gwaith ymchwil o'r fath? Yr oeddwn am i'r gwaith ymchwil hwn lywio'r prosiect oherwydd, fel y dywedodd eich cyd-Aelod, Alun Ffred, gwyddom fod anawsterau mewn rhai meysydd ac nad yw pethau'n cydgyssylltu'n iawn bob amser, fel y cyfeiriodd David Melding ato. Rhaid inni ddelio â'r materion hyn. Y gwerthusiad hwn yw'r man cychwyn ar gyfer symud pethau ymlaen. Yr ydym yn siarad am brosiect a fydd yn rhedeg am 10, 15 neu 20 mlynedd eto, mae'n debyg, a rhaid inni ymrwymo i hynny os ydym yn ddiffuant ynglŷn â rhai o'r

materion hyn.

On Mark Isherwood's contribution, I accept that housing is a big issue, and it is centre stage for us in what we do. We have our housing strategy, our homelessness strategy and more and more money going into that agenda, when you consider the increases. We understand how housing links into some Communities First issues, because communities tell us that they want better housing and a better environment and they want us to do more, and our spending priorities are following that. The fact that we have had such good results in people getting back into work is also helping this agenda.

I thank Mick for his contribution, but I regret the wording of his amendment. I understand, Mick, the passion that you have shared with us in committee and that you do think this is an innovative programme. With regard to programme-bending, there are issues there about what we need to do more of, and Huw, as my Deputy Minister, is always referring to how we have to get those other programmes into the issue of Communities First development and ensure that all the strands go through. That is particularly important for us as the project develops.

David, like you, I think that the report is a good one and a good starting point. It is like the Beecham report; you have to be open and honest if you are to progress politics and Government and make a difference to people's lives, and reports such as this focus on taking matters forward. You talk about monitoring and evaluation—that is an absolute balancing act. You do not want to stop people wanting to do things, but you have to monitor and evaluate, and sometimes they will not achieve. We have to think about what good practice should exist to get that right in the next 10 years of the programme.

I take on board what you said about the connections that we need to make in the Assembly and elsewhere. I also take on board the fact that, sometimes, there is reluctance on the part of councillors, and the next phase is about how you break down barriers, so that people understand that this bottom-up

O ran cyfraniad Mark Isherwood, derbyniaf fod tai yn fater pwysig, ac mae'n ganolog i'r hyn a wnawn. Mae gennym ein strategaeth tai, ein strategaeth ar ddigartrefedd ac mae mwy a mwy o arian yn cael ei neilltuo i'r agenda honno, pan ystyriwch y codiadau. Deallwn y cysylltiad rhwng materion tai a rhai materion Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan fod cymunedau'n dweud wrthym eu bod am gael gwell tai a gwell amgylchedd a'u bod am inni wneud mwy, ac mae ein blaenoriaethau gwariant yn dilyn hynny. Mae'r ffaith ein bod wedi cael canlyniadau mor dda wrth gael pobl yn ôl i'r gwaith hefyd yn helpu'r agenda hon.

Hoffwn ddiolch i Mick am ei gyfraniad, ond yr wyf yn gofidio am eiriad ei welliant. Gallaf ddeall, Mick, eich angerdd yn y pwyllgor a'ch bod yn credu bod hon yn rhaglen arloesol. O ran addasu rhaglenni, mae yna broblemau o ran yr hyn y mae angen inni wneud mwy ohono, ac mae Huw, fy Nirprwy Weinidog, yn cyfeirio'n gyson at y ffaith ei bod yn rhaid inni gynnwys y rhaglenni eraill hyn wrth ddatblygu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a sicrhau bod yr holl haenau'n symud ymlaen. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig inni wrth i'r prosiect ddatblygu.

David, fel chi, credaf fod yr adroddiad yn un da ac yn bwynt cychwyn da. Mae'n debyg i adroddiad Beecham; rhaid ichi fod yn agored ac yn ddiwyll os ydych am wneud cynnydd mewn gwleidyddiaeth a Llywodraeth a gwneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau pobl, ac mae adroddiadau fel hyn yn canolbwyntio ar fynd â materion yn eu blaen. Yr ydych yn sôn am fonitro a gwerthuso—mae angen sicrhau cydbwysedd llwyr. Nid ydych am atal pobl rhag eisiau gwneud pethau, ond rhaid ichi fonitro a gwerthuso, ac weithiau ni fyddant yn cyflawni. Rhaid inni feddwl am yr arferion da a ddylai fodoli er mwyn gwneud hynny'n iawn yn 10 mlynedd nesaf y rhaglen.

Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedech am y cysylltiadau y mae angen inni eu gwneud yn y Cynulliad ac mewn mannau eraill. Derbyniaf hefyd y ffaith bod amharodrwydd, weithiau, ar ran cynghorwyr, ac mae'r cam nesaf yn ymwneud â sut yr ydych yn dymchwel rhwystrau, er mwyn i bobl ddeall

approach is also of value to them. That approach is good for democracy in terms of engaging people in the system and them thinking that they have a voice. You are right about staffing. Hopefully, we are now at full strength in the department, and that will make a difference in the advice that the department can give to staff on the ground.

I say to Eleanor Burnham that ‘transparent and open’ is my middle name when it comes to how we deal with the Communities First programme. It is one of those programmes that the world and his wife watches so eagerly that everything is plain for all to see. If you look at the way in which the partnerships operate, and at how we operate, you can see the figures within it. You made a specific point about some £90 million being spent on initiatives to date, and only around £15 million on projects. Communities First funding is provided to support staffing infrastructures and small-scale capacity building. That is why it is there. I have made that clear several times. Communities First is not a pot of gold for the first project that communities want to run—communities need to look at other areas for some of the project funding. However, I take an interest in the balance of resources, and I am mindful of the points that you made in that context.

Turning to amendment 1, we have provided leadership and support; but the most important leadership and support has come from the communities themselves in wanting to do what they want to do. The evaluation has found that how I and my officials have acted and have engaged in the evaluation and took up findings was exemplary, and it says so. For example, the revised Communities First guidance, to be published in the new year, is based on feedback received from the evaluation. I do not think that you can ask for more in terms of leadership and direction than that.

With regard to amendment 2, we will support it, because we accept that housing is key to sustainable community regeneration, and that is very much a focus in our discussions.

bod y dull hwn o'r gwaelod i fyny o werth iddynt hwy hefyd. Mae'r dull hwn yn bwysig i ddemocratiaeth o ran cynnwys pobl yn y system a gwneud iddynt deimlo bod ganddynt lais. Yr ydych yn gywir ynglŷn â staffio. Gobeithio bod yr adran yn gyflawn erbyn hyn, a bydd hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth i'r cyngor y gall ei roi i staff ar lawr gwlad.

Dywedaf wrth Eleanor Burnham mai ‘eglw ac agored’ yw fy enw canol pan ddaw mater sut yr ydym yn delio â'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae'n un o'r rhaglenni hynny y mae pawb yn ei gwyllo gyda chymaint o awch nes bod popeth yn amlwg i bawb ei weld. Os edrychwch ar y ffordd y mae'r partneriaethau'n gweithredu, a sut yr ydym yn gweithredu, gallwch weld y ffigurau ynddi. Gwnaethoch bwynt penodol fod tua £90 miliwn wedi ei wario ar fentrau hyd yma, a dim ond tua £15 miliwn ar brosiectau. Darperir arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i ategu seilweithiau staffio a gwaith meithrin gallu ar raddfa fach. Dyna'r rheswm amdano. Nid yw'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gronfa ddiderfyn ar gyfer y prosiect cyntaf y bydd cymunedau'n dymuno'i gynnal—mae angen i gymunedau edrych ar feysydd eraill i ariannu rhywfaint o'r prosiect. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf ddiddordeb yng nghydbwysedd adnoddau, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

I droi at welliant 1, yr ydym wedi darparu arweiniad a chymorth, ond mae'r arweiniad a'r cymorth pwysicaf wedi dod o'r cymunedau eu hunain sydd am wneud yr hyn y dymunant ei wneud. Mae'r gwerthusiad wedi dangos bod y ffordd yr wyf fi a'm swyddogion wedi gweithredu a chymryd rhan yn y gwerthusiad a gweithredu ar y darganfyddiadau yn rhagorol, ac mae'n dweud hynny. Er enghraifft, mae canllawiau diwygiedig Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sydd i'w cyhoeddi yn y flwyddyn newydd, yn seiliedig ar adborth a gafwyd o'r gwerthusiad. Ni chredaf y gallwch ofyn am fwy na hynny mewn arweiniad a chyfarwyddyd.

O ran gwelliant 2, byddwn yn ei gefnogi, oherwydd derbyniwn fod tai yn allweddol i waith adfywio cymunedol cynaliadwy, ac mae hynny'n ganolbwynt i'n trafodaethau.

However, as for weakness in respect of target measures, Communities First is not the standard regeneration programme: through its capacity-building nature it brings about a change. Therefore, we will oppose amendment 3. Also, you talked at one point about other things going on, and political interference. It is not political interference—I am not sure what that means. If you mean that a local councillor sometimes likes to have his own way, well, local councillors are like that; if an AM is involved, councillors want to say their piece and have their own way, and you can understand that. I can tell you, however, that these communities are fit enough to stand up to anything like that and make their voices heard: that is my experience when I travel Wales.

I have to oppose amendment 4. The interim evaluation states that Assembly has taken the right direction in prioritising investment in capacity building. It has always been made clear that this is a long-term programme, not a standard regeneration programme.

On amendment 5, I agree with the first point, Kirsty, but not the second point about the roll-out. The evidence is that deprivation manifests itself in different ways in Wales, and Communities First was perceived from the outset as a bottom-up approach. You might consider this to be rushed, but this had to be done, and it was integral to what we had to do as a Government to get this going, so I cannot accept the comment in the final part of that amendment.

5.20 p.m.

I also oppose amendment 6. Partnership working is vital. This amendment is unnecessary. Partnership working, in the majority of cases, is working across Wales. There have been good examples of programme bending, which were picked up in the evaluation, particularly when you look at the police engagement in projects.

On amendment 7, the Communities First programme has not taken a simple

Fodd bynnag, o ran gwendidau mewn perthynas â mesurau targed, nid y rhaglen adfywio safonol yw Cymunedau yn Gyntaf: mae'n dod â newid drwy feithrin gallu. Felly, byddwn yn gwrthwynebu gwelliant 3. Hefyd, soniech ar un adeg am bethau eraill sy'n mynd ymlaen, ac ymyrraeth wleidyddol. Nid yw'n ymyrraeth wleidyddol—nid wyf yn siŵr beth mae hynny'n ei olygu. Os ydych yn golygu bod cynghorydd lleol yn hoffi cael ei ffordd ei hun weithiau, wel, rhai felly yw cynghorwyr lleol; os yw'n cynnwys AC, mae cynghorwyr am leisio'u barn a chael eu ffordd eu hunain, a gallwch ddeall hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud wrthy ch fod y cymunedau hyn yn ddigon abl i wrthsefyll unrhyw beth felly a lleisio'u barn: dyna fy mhrofiad i wrth deithio ledled Cymru.

Rhaid imi wrthwynebu gwelliant 4. Dywed y gwerthusiad interim fod y Cynulliad wedi symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir wrth sicrhau bod meithrin gallu yn flaenoriaeth mewn buddsoddi. Gwnaethpwyd yn glir o'r cychwyn mai rhaglen hirdymor yw hon, ac nid rhaglen adfywio safonol.

O ran gwelliant 5, cytunaf â'r pwynt cyntaf, Kirsty, ond ni chytunaf â'r ail bwynt am y broses gyflwyno. Mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos bod amddifadedd yn amlygu ei hun mewn gwahanol ffyrdd yng Nghymru, a deallwyd mai dull o'r gwaelod i fyny oedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o'r cychwyn. Efallai eich bod yn meddwl i hyn gael ei ruthro, ond yr oedd yn rhaid gwneud hyn, ac yr oedd yn rhan annatod o'r hyn yr oedd yn rhaid inni ei wneud fel Llywodraeth i gychwyn arni. Felly, ni allaf dderbyn y sylw yn rhan olaf y gwelliant hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu gwelliant 6 hefyd. Mae gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn hanfodol. Nid oes angen y gwelliant hwn. Mae'r broses o weithio mewn partneriaeth, yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, yn gweithio ledled Cymru. Cafwyd enghreifftiau da o addasu rhaglenni, a nodwyd yn y gwerthusiad, yn enwedig pan edrychwch ar gyfraniad yr heddlu yn y prosiectau.

O ran gwelliant 7, nid yw'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi defnyddio dull

geographical approach. If you look at the work that Communities First has done, you will see that that is clear. It is important that you recognise that it is such a broad programme that we have taken all issues on board.

I am happy to support amendment 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, because that is true, although we have now rectified the issue.

On amendment 9, this is not a standard regeneration programme and the people out there, working on the programme, understand that. It is clear from your proposing this amendment that you do not understand it.

On amendment 10, I deal with the reality of policies here. We work closely with the Westminster Government, which has done a lot of good stuff that has helped us in Communities First areas.

On amendment 11, what can I say? [*Interruption.*] Well, I cannot resist the temptation to say something. There are a number of issues that would make it difficult to attribute changes in income between 2001 to the present day. We all know that, so there is no point in tabling this amendment.

I thank you for what, in the main, has been an exceptionally constructive debate. I am proud that we have tabled this motion and have had this evaluation, which is the starting point to do good, and better, work. I am not afraid to be judged on the work that we are doing in this regard, and we as a Government are not afraid of that. It is important that communities out there understand that we are behind them in what is a generational approach to communities.

daearyddol syml. Mae hynny'n amlwg os edrychwch ar y gwaith y mae'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi'i wneud. Mae'n bwysig ichi gydnabod ei bod yn rhaglen mor eang fel yr ydym wedi ystyried pob mater.

Yr wyf yn falch cefnogi gwelliant 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gan fod hynny'n wir, er ein bod wedi unioni'r sefyllfa bellach.

O ran gwelliant 9, nid rhaglen adfywio safonol mohoni ac mae'r bobl sy'n gweithio ar y rhaglen yn deall hynny. Mae'r ffaith eich bod yn cynnig y gwelliant hwn yn dangos nad ydych yn ei ddeall.

O ran gwelliant 10, yr wyf yn ymdrin â realiti polisïau yma. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, sydd wedi gwneud llawer o waith da sydd wedi'n helpu mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

O ran gwelliant 11, beth y gallaf ei ddweud? [*Torri ar draws.*] Wel, ni allaf wrthsefyll y temtasiwn i ddweud rhywbeth. Mae nifer o faterion a fyddai'n ei gwneud yn anodd priodoli newidiadau mewn incwm rhwng 2001 a heddiw. Mae pob un ohonom yn gwybod hynny, felly, nid oes diben cyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn.

Diolch ichi am yr hyn a fu'n ddadl hynod adeiladol ar y cyfan. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn ac wedi gwneud y gwerthusiad hwn, sy'n bwynt cychwyn i wneud gwaith da a gwell. Nid wyf yn ofni cael fy meirniadu am y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud yn hyn, ac nid ydym ni fel Llywodraeth yn ofni hynny ychwaith. Mae'n bwysig i gymunedau ddeall ein bod yn eu cefnogi drwy ymagwedd dros genedlaethau at gymunedau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 13, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 3: For 13, Abstain 7, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 4: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 5: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn

Wood, Leanne

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 14, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 6: For 14, Abstain 6, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Elin
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Helen Mary
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 13, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 7: For 13, Abstain 7, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 8: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 9: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann

Wood, Leanne

Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 10: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 11: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3302) as amended

Cynnig (NDM3302) fel y'i diwygiwyd

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. notes the findings of the interim evaluation of the Communities First programme;

1. yn nodi canfyddiadau gwerthusiad dros dro y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf;

2. endorses the programme's focus on capacity building as a necessary pre-requisite to regeneration;

2. yn cymeradwyo ffocws y rhaglen ar feithrin gallu fel rhywbeth sy'n hanfodol cyn sicrhau adfywio;

3. congratulates those involved in Communities First activity throughout Wales on their contribution to the regeneration of local areas;

3. yn llongyfarch pawb sy'n ymwneud â gweithgarwch Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru ar eu cyfraniad tuag at adfywio ardaloedd lleol;

4. recognises that housing is key to sustainable community regeneration; and

4. yn cydnabod bod tai yn allweddol ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol cynaliadwy; a

5. regrets the lack of baseline data to measure the economic impact of the Communities First programme.

5. yn gresynu wrth y diffyg data sylfaenol i fesur effaith economaidd y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
 Amended motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Diwydiant Llaeth Cymru: Argyfwng a Mwy The Welsh Dairy Industry: Crisis and Beyond

Brynle Williams: I have allowed Eleanor Burnham and Rhodri Glyn Thomas a minute each to contribute to the debate.

I believe that now is a relevant time to have this debate, and I wish to lay out exactly why the dairy industry has found itself in such dire straits over the last few years, and how it can, hopefully, work its way out to a

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf wedi caniatáu munud yr un i Eleanor Burnham a Rhodri Glyn Thomas gyfrannu at y ddadl.

Credaf mai dyma'r amser priodol i gynnal y ddadl hon, a hoffwn osod allan yn union pam mae'r diwydiant llaeth wedi wynebu cynifer o anawsterau dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, a sut y gall, gobeithio, oresgyn yr

profitable future. The Minister will be unveiling a new dairy strategy, which will be put out to consultation in the new year, and it is my hope that it will take on board what I will discuss today.

The Welsh dairy industry has great advantages. Our climate is just about ideal for grassland growing, the quality of the stockmanship and the skill base is particularly strong, and Wales has a large processing sector to take advantage of surplus in the liquid milk market. However, the current situation is simply unsustainable. Average production costs are currently 21p per litre, while the average farm-gate price is just over 17p per litre. The bottom line is that, for many producers, it is a business without profit. The average age of the dairy farmer is now 58, and this will only increase as the younger generation are turned away from the industry. It has often been pointed out that bottled water—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. A person whom I do not know has just come into the Chamber and picked up a bag. Will the ushers ensure that nothing has been taken improperly from the Chamber? Sorry about that, Brynle.

Brynle Williams: It has often been pointed out that bottled water costs more than milk. While the Minister has no doubt heard this before, I think that it encapsulates the dairy industry's problems all too well.

Dairy farmers across Wales manage the health and welfare of thousands of dairy cattle. They must meet demanding and exacting European regulations, and their land must be well managed to a high environmental standard, and water courses must be protected. All of this takes considerable effort and commitment, yet, at the point of sale, liquid milk can be purchased for less than you would pay for water.

5.30 p.m.

There are plenty of reasons for this. The most prominent has been the pressure put on producers by the supermarkets. Obviously,

anawsterau hyn a sicrhau dyfodol proffidiol. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cyflwyno strategaeth laeth newydd, a fydd yn destun ymgynghori yn y flwyddyn newydd, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yn ystyried yr hyn y byddaf yn ei drafod heddiw.

Mae gan ddiwydiant llaeth Cymru fanteision mawr. Mae ein hinsawdd bron â bod yn ddelfrydol ar gyfer tyfu glaswellt, mae ansawdd y stocmonaeth a'r sylfaen sgiliau yn arbennig o gryf, ac mae gan Gymru sector prosesu mawr i fanteisio ar ormodedd yn y farchnad llaeth hylif. Fodd bynnag, yn syml, ni all y sefyllfa gyfredol barhau. Y costau cynhyrchu ar gyfartaledd ar hyn o bryd yw 21c y litr, a'r pris wrth gât y fferm ar gyfartaledd ychydig dros 17c y litr. Y gwir yw hyn: i nifer o gynhyrchwyr mae'n fusnes heb elw. Oed y ffermwr llaeth erbyn hyn ar gyfartaledd yw 58, a bydd hyn yn codi wrth i'r genhedlaeth iau droi ei chefn ar y diwydiant. Nodwyd droeon fod dŵr potel—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae person nad wyf yn ei adnabod wedi dod i mewn i'r Siambr ac wedi codi bag. A wnaiff y tywyswyr sicrhau nad oes unrhyw beth wedi'i gymryd yn amhriodol o'r Siambr? Ymddiheuriadau, Brynle.

Brynle Williams: Nodwyd droeon fod dŵr potel yn costio mwy na llaeth. Er bod y Gweinidog yn ddiau wedi clywed hyn o'r blaen, credaf ei fod yn crynhoi problemau'r diwydiant llaeth i'r dim.

Mae ffermwyr llaeth ledled Cymru yn rheoli iechyd a lles miloedd o wartheg llaeth. Rhaid iddynt fodloni rheoliadau Ewropeaidd heriol a manwl, a rhaid iddynt reoli eu tir yn dda i safon amgylcheddol uchel, a rhaid i ddyfrffyrdd gael eu diogelu. Mae hyn i gyd yn gofyn am ymdrech ac ymroddiad sylweddol, ond eto, yn y man gwerthu gellir prynu llaeth hylif am lai nag y byddech yn ei dalu am ddŵr.

Mae digon o resymau dros hyn. Y nodwedd amlycaf yw'r pwysau a roddir ar gynhyrchwyr gan yr archfarchnadoedd. Wrth

the major retailers will always be fiercely competitive in a market worth around £100 billion. Supermarkets want to attract regular customers and competition on price for the basic essentials in a shopping basket, like milk, bread, and potatoes, has been somewhat inevitable. This is where most milk producers are at a disadvantage; the milk that they produce is a commodity and buyers have been able to chop and change their suppliers with short-term contracts to get the very lowest price. The result has been that nearly all producers have ended up suffering as the farm-gate price has been pushed lower and lower. On the back of this, energy, fuel, and fertiliser costs have been spiralling upwards, as have feed costs, thanks partially to the summer drought.

The threat of bovine TB has also been lingering in the background, along with movement restrictions and the cost of pre-movement testing. The Government's badger-found-dead survey found significant levels of wildlife infection in TB hotspots, but the current measures being adopted in Wales are not providing any degree of incentive for dairy farmers to remain in the industry.

The high efficiency of dairying has also been part of its undoing. By its nature, dairying is very intensive, and the majority of farmers have found themselves at a disadvantage when it comes to getting their modulated funding back through agri-environment schemes.

Tir Gofal, as we have said many times, is an excellent scheme, but its point-scoring system means that dairy farms are often last in the queue to enter it—they will rarely have sites of special scientific interest or other types of habitat that Tir Gofal rewards, as the industry occupies the most productive land. This is not to say that dairy farmers do not or cannot improve the environment that they manage. A lot of effort is already going into preventing water pollution and safeguarding the biodiversity of water courses, but this is not currently being recognised or rewarded by the agri-environment schemes.

gwrs, bydd y manwerthwyr mawr bob amser yn cystadlu'n gryf mewn marchnad sy'n werth tua £100 biliwn. Mae archfarchnadoedd am ddenu cwsmeriaid rheolaidd, ac mae cystadlu am bris y nwyddau sylfaenol mewn basged siopa, fel llaeth, bara, a thatws, wedi bod yn anochel bron. Dyna lle y mae'r rhan fwyaf o gynhyrchwyr llaeth o dan anfantais; mae'r llaeth a gynhyrchir ganddynt yn nwydd ac mae prynwyr wedi gallu newid eu cyflenwyr yn aml gyda chontractau tymor byr er mwyn cael y pris isaf. O ganlyniad, mae pob cynhyrchwr bron wedi dioddef wrth i'r pris wrth gât y fferm fynd yn is ac yn is. Yn ychwanegol at hyn, mae costau ynni, tanwydd a gwrtiaith wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol, ynghyd â chostau porthiant, yn rhannol oherwydd y sychdwr yn ystod yr haf.

Mae bygythiad TB mewn gwartheg hefyd wedi bod yn y cefndir, ynghyd â chyfyngiadau ar symud a chostau profion cyn symud. Mae arolwg y Llywodraeth o foch daer y daethpwyd o hyd iddynt yn farw wedi gweld lefelau sylweddol o haint mewn bywyd gwyllt mewn mannau lle mae nifer o achosion o TB. Ond nid yw'r mesurau presennol sydd ar waith yng Nghymru yn rhoi unrhyw gymhelliant i ffermwyr llaeth aros yn y diwydiant.

Mae effeithlonrwydd mawr ffermydd godro hefyd wedi bod yn rhan o'u dirywiad. Oherwydd eu natur, mae ffermydd godro yn ddwys iawn, ac mae'r mwyafrif o ffermwyr wedi gweld eu bod dan anfantais pan ddaw'n fater o adennill eu harian wedi'i fodiwleiddio drwy gynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd.

Fel yr ydym wedi ei ddweud droeon, mae Tir Gofal yn gynllun ardderchog, ond mae ei system o sgorio pwyntiau yn golygu mai ffermydd godro yn aml yw'r olaf i fod yn rhan ohono—anaml y bydd ganddynt safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig neu'r mathau eraill o gynefinoedd sy'n cael eu gwobrwyo gan Tir Gofal, gan fod y diwydiant yn defnyddio'r tir mwyaf cynhyrchiol. Nid yw hyn yn golygu nad yw ac na all ffermwyr godro'n gwella'r amgylchedd y maent yn ei reoli. Gwneir cryn ymdrech eisoes i atal llygredd dŵr ac i ddiogelu bioamrywiaeth cyrsiau dŵr, ond ni chaiff hyn ei gydnabod na'i wobrwyo gan y

The consequence of all these pressures has been a sustained flight from the dairy industry. Nationally, three and a half farms leave the industry every day. In Wales, nearly 1,000 dairy businesses have closed in the last 10 years.

The Minister previously made the point that the least efficient dairy producers should be improving their profitability by emulating the most efficient. I fully support the idea of farmers sharing best practices and helping Welsh producers to become profitable. However, over the last 10 years, the smaller and less efficient producers have already left the industry. Those producers who are now considering selling up—and a great many are now finding themselves in this position—are productive and efficient businesses. In the farming press, we regularly see herds of 250 and 300 cows being dispersed. Does the Government really want to see this process reach a state where there are herds of 1,000 cows, with all the environmental and welfare problems that that will bring with it? In order to be an efficient and cost-effective unit, large numbers have to be concentrated on one site. This will cause many environmental problems.

The Minister has also made the point that dairy producers are competing in a global and unregulated environment. However, this raises a very important question as to who will supply the country with milk if the domestic dairy industry collapses. There are a few points that I want to make here. The first is on welfare standards. With production in Wales, there is direct oversight with regard to the milk production process and the way in which animals are cared for. Does the Government want to see Wales having to rely on produce from the southern hemisphere where strict block calving patterns are used? I will not be explicit about what that means, but if anyone wants to know, I will be happy to inform them. Tail docking and chronic feet problems are also the norm in the southern hemisphere. We are importing produce from herds subjected to these practices.

Welsh dairy produce is quite rightly subjected to stringent health standards to

cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd.

Canlyniad yr holl bwysau hyn yw bod nifer o ffermwyr yn gadael y diwydiant godro. Yn genedlaethol, mae tair fferm a hanner yn gadael y diwydiant bob dydd. Yng Nghymru, mae bron 1,000 o fusnesau godro wedi cau yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf.

Gwnaeth y Gweinidog y pwynt yn flaenorol y dylai'r cynhyrchwyr llaeth lleiaf effeithlon wella'u proffidioldeb drwy efelychu'r rhai mwyaf effeithlon. Yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi'r syniad y dylai ffermwyr rannu arfer gorau a helpu cynhyrchwyr yng Nghymru i fod yn fwy proffidiol. Fodd bynnag, dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, mae'r cynhyrchwyr llai a'r rhai llai effeithlon eisoes wedi gadael y diwydiant. Mae'r cynhyrchwyr hynny sydd bellach yn ystyried gwerthu—ac mae nifer fawr yn y sefyllfa hon erbyn hyn—yn fusnesau cynhyrchiol ac effeithlon. Yn y wasg ffermio, darllenwn yn rheolaidd am fuchesi o 250 a 300 yn cael eu gwasgaru. A yw'r Llywodraeth am weld y broses hon yn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle bydd buchesi o 1,000 o anifeiliaid, a'r holl broblemau amgylcheddol a lles a ddaw yn sgîl hynny? Er mwyn bod yn uned effeithlon a chost-effeithiol, rhaid wrth niferoedd mawr ar un safle. Bydd hyn yn peri llawer o broblemau amgylcheddol.

Mae'r Gweinidog hefyd wedi gwneud y pwynt bod cynhyrchwyr llaeth yn cystadlu mewn amgylchedd byd-eang nad yw'n cael ei reoleiddio. Fodd bynnag, cyfyd hyn gwestiwn pwysig iawn o ran pwy fydd yn cyflenwi llaeth os bydd diwydiant godro y wlad yn mynd i'r wal. Hoffwn wneud ychydig bwyntiau yma. Mae'r cyntaf ar safonau lles. O ran cynhyrchu yng Nghymru, arolygir y broses o gynhyrchu llaeth a'r ffordd y gofelir am anifeiliaid yn uniongyrchol. A yw'r Llywodraeth am weld Cymru'n gorfod dibynnu ar gynnyrch o hemisffer y de, lle defnyddir patrymau bwrw llo bloc llym? Nid wyf am egluro ystyr hyn, ond os hoffai unrhyw un wybod, byddaf yn barod i ddweud wrthynt. Mae tocio cynffonnau a phroblemau traed cronig hefyd yn gyffredin yn hemisffer y de. Yr ydym yn mewnfario cynnyrch o fuchesi sy'n gorfod dioddef yr arferion hyn.

Mae cynnyrch llaeth o Gymru yn gorfod cyrraedd safonau iechyd llym, a hynny'n

ensure that it is fit for human consumption. If production moves elsewhere in the EU or outside, that direct oversight is lost; the Government and consumers would soon regret that. Another issue is that of security. Production outside of the UK is out of our control, and that is precisely the problem.

New Zealand, a major international exporter, is currently suffering a drought, as is Australia. That is the worst drought on record, and it is causing serious problems. As the effects of climate change become more apparent globally, these periods of drought will become more frequent and more sustained. If the domestic dairy industry is allowed to decline, there may come a point in the not-too-distant future when foreign supplies dry up, but the skills will no longer be there to kick-start our own industry.

Production in Wales is already falling. Wales has failed to meet its quota allocation for the last two years, and the UK is just 84 per cent self-sufficient in milk. I managed to get these figures this morning. If production continues to decline, processing plants will shut, and hundreds more jobs across Wales will be lost. We have already seen the closure this year, in the Carmarthenshire milk fields, of the Dairygold cheese packing plant in Felinfach, as well as operations at Mochdre and Llangadog.

A collapse in the dairy industry would also seriously distort the agricultural industry. Fifty per cent of the beef market is supplied from dairy herds, and we are already seeing the export of Friesian and continental calves to the EU, but they are not satisfied—they now want our better quality beef calves. The suckler herd, which is needed for management purposes on the hills, is in decline. Those cows are not only needed for producing meat, but for environmental reasons. If the beef industry is undermined, it will be the end of upland farming and the management of that landscape.

gwbl gywir er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn addas i'w fwyta neu'i yfed gan bobl. Os bydd y broses gynhyrchu yn symud rywle arall yn yr UE neu'r tu hwnt, caiff yr arolygiaeth uniongyrchol honno ei cholli; byddai'r Llywodraeth a defnyddwyr yn gresynu at hynny'n fuan. Mae diogelwch yn fater arall. Mae'r cynnyrch llaeth a ddaw o'r tu allan i'r DU y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth, a dyna'n union yw'r broblem.

Mae Seland Newydd, un o'r prif allforwyr rhyngwladol, yn dioddef sychdwr ar hyn o bryd, ynghyd ag Awstralia. Hwn yw'r sychdwr gwaethaf erioed, ac mae'n peri problemau difrifol. Wrth i effeithiau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd ddod yn fwy amlwg ar draws y byd, bydd y cyfnodau hyn o sychdwr yn dod yn amlach ac yn hirach. Os caniateir i'r diwydiant godro yn y wlad hon ddirywio, efallai y bydd cyfnod yn y dyfodol agos pan fydd cyflenwadau tramor yn dod i ben, ond ni fydd gennym y sgiliau erbyn hynny i ailgychwyn ein diwydiant ein hunain.

Mae cynhyrchiant yng Nghymru eisoes yn gostwng. Mae Cymru wedi methu â chyrraedd ei dyraniad cwota am y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, a dim ond 84 y cant o'r llaeth y mae ar y DU ei angen sy'n cael ei gynhyrchu gan y DU. Cefais y ffigurau hyn y bore yma. Os bydd cynhyrchiant yn parhau i ddirywio, bydd gweithfeydd prosesu'n cau, a chaiff cannoedd yn fwy o swyddi eu colli ledled Cymru. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld ardaloedd llaeth yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, gwaith pacio caws Dairygold yn Felin-fach, yn ogystal â'r gweithrediadau ym Mochdre a Llangadog, yn cau eleni.

Pe bai'r diwydiant godro yn mynd i'r wal, byddai effaith sylweddol hefyd ar y diwydiant amaethyddol. Cyflenwir 50 y cant o'r farchnad cig eidion o fuchesi godro, ac yr ydym eisoes yn gweld lloi Friesian a lloi cyfandirol yn cael eu hallforio i'r UE, ond nid yw hynny'n ddigon—maent bellach am gael ein lloi cig eidion gorau. Prinhau mae'r buchesi sugno y mae eu hangen er mwyn rheoli ar y mynyddoedd. Mae angen y gwartheg hyn nid yn unig i gynhyrchu cig, ond am resymau amgylcheddol. Os caiff y diwydiant cig eidion ei danseilio, dyna fydd diwedd ffermio mynydd a rheoli'r dirwedd honno.

Dairy farms also support a host of rural businesses: from feed suppliers to equipment retailers, which provide much-needed employment in the countryside. We even keep the post offices and the schools going. Clearly, the current situation is unsustainable, and frankly, the line of thought that says that the dairy sector should be left alone to sink or swim in a global market is not one that is worth considering.

I will lay out where I believe the future of the dairy industry lies, and what the Government's coming strategic action plan should address. First, there will be no silver bullet to solve the current situation. It will take action from producers, processors, retailers and the Government. We need such a partnership. Looking at the fundamentals of low milk commodity prices, there is much potential for farmers working co-operatively with their neighbours to brand their product and differentiate it in the market.

The Dairy Farmers of Britain group, which produces bilingual Cadog products, and Llaeth y Llan, from north Wales, are examples of the potential here, as is Rachel's Dairy organic products in the Aberystwyth area. Consumer demand for organic produce is strong and is growing, with good returns for producers, in the range of 28p per litre. However, going organic is not for every business and there is a limited window for new farmers to start the conversion process until production meets national demand. The whole supply chain needs to be transparent. Too often, it has been the case that we know the price at the farm gate—what the farmer gets—and we know what the consumer pays in the supermarket, but the processor's cut has been hidden away. The industry cannot move forward without this openness. I believe that ex-factory prices are printed in mainland Europe.

5.40 p.m.

In recent weeks, prices for processed products such as cream, butter, skimmed milk and whey have been increasing, but

Mae ffermydd godro hefyd yn cynnal nifer o fusnesau gwledig: o gyflenwyr porthiant i fanwerthwyr offer, sy'n darparu cyflogaeth y mae ei hangen yn ddirfawr yng nghefn gwlad. Yr ydym hyd yn oed yn cadw'r swyddfeydd post a'r ysgolion i fynd. Yn amlwg, ni all y sefyllfa bresennol barhau, ac i fod yn onest, ffwlbri yw'r syniad y dylid gadael y sector godro i'w dynged mewn marchnad fyd-eang.

Gosodaf allan ble mae dyfodol y diwydiant godro, yn fy marn i, a'r hyn y dylai cynllun gweithredu strategol arfaethedig y Llywodraeth fynd i'r afael ag ef. I ddechrau, ni fydd un ateb llwyddiannus i ddatrys y sefyllfa bresennol. Bydd angen i gynhyrchwyr, proseswyr, manwerthwyr a'r Llywodraeth weithredu. Mae arnom angen partneriaeth felly. I edrych ar nodweddion sylfaenol y prisiau isel am nwyddau llaeth, mae nifer o gyfleoedd i ffermwyr gydweithio â'u cymdogion i frandio eu cynnyrch a'i wahaniaethu yn y farchnad.

Mae grŵp Ffermwyr Godro Prydain o'r gogledd, sy'n cynhyrchu'r cynnyrch dwyieithog Cadog, a Llaeth y Llan, yn enghreifftiau o'r potensial sydd yna, ynghyd â chynnyrch organig Rachel's Dairy yn ardal Aberystwyth. Mae'r galw ymhlith defnyddwyr am gynnyrch organig yn fawr ac yn cynyddu, a chaiff cynhyrchwyr bris da o ryw 28c y litr. Fodd bynnag, nid yw troi'n organig yn addas ar gyfer pob busnes, ac mae'r cyfleoedd i ffermwyr newydd ddechrau ar y broses o gyfnewid yn brin nes bydd cynhyrchiant yn ateb y galw yn y wlad. Mae angen i'r holl gadwyn gyflenwi fod yn eglur. Yn rhy aml, gwyddom beth yw'r pris wrth gât y fferm—gwyddom faint y mae'r ffermwr yn ei gael—a gwyddom faint y mae'r defnyddiwr yn ei dalu yn yr archfarchnad, ond mae cyfran y proseswr yn cael ei chuddio. Ni all y diwydiant symud ymlaen oni weithredir yn agored fel hyn. Credaf fod prisiau o'r ffatri yn cael eu hargraffu ar y tir mawr yn Ewrop.

Yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, mae'r prisiau am gynnyrch wedi'i brosesu, fel hufen, menyn, llaeth sgim a maidd, wedi bod

farm-gate prices are still firmly stuck below the cost of production. Processors also need to put some stability back into the market by ending short-term contracts with producers; this is important. At present, they are, on average, on just a six-month contract, and it is artificially depressing milk prices and making investment virtually impossible. We need longer contracts to give confidence to the industry to invest.

I have already mentioned the pressure that supermarkets have been putting on producers, but it is only fair to point out the exceptions. Waitrose and Marks and Spencer have made an effort to pay farmers a fair price for their produce, that is above the cost of production. If these two leading retailers can do this and still remain profitable, the big four supermarkets can surely afford to follow suit. Paying a fair price for milk should be the norm, not the exception.

It is encouraging to hear that the Dairy Crest and Robert Wiseman dairies are increasing their milk prices, albeit by a fraction of a penny. However, we are at least beginning to move in the right direction.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I should have stopped you after 15 minutes, Brynle, but—exceptionally, and against all principles—since I interrupted you, I will allow another minute. Therefore, I will give 30 seconds to each speaker.

Eleanor Burnham: Thirty seconds is not long but I thank you, Brynle. As a farmer's daughter, I believe that the plight of the farmer is entwined in so many issues that have already been articulated by Brynle. However, we also have to think about greening. Food miles is a big issue. With globalisation and global warming, we should be reconsidering this issue and bringing back local production of food. For goodness' sake, we need the Minister's assurance that he will try to get a fair price for farmers, as the Liberal Democrats and others in Westminster have done. Local food should be encouraged by this Labour Government.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolch yn fawr i Brynle am godi'r pwnc eithriadol o bwysig

yn codi, ond mae'r prisiau wrth gât y fferm yn dal i fod yn is na chost cynhyrchu. Mae angen i broseswyr hefyd sefydlogi'r farchnad drwy roi'r gorau i gontractau tymor byr gyda chynhyrchwyr; mae hyn yn bwysig. Ar hyn o bryd, maent ar gontract chwe mis yn unig ar gyfartaledd, ac mae'n gostwng prisiau llaeth yn artiffisial ac yn gwneud buddsoddi bron yn amhosibl. Mae arnom angen contractau hwy i roi hyder i'r diwydiant fuddsoddi.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am y pwysau y mae archfarchnadoedd wedi bod yn eu rhoi ar gynhyrchwyr, ond mae angen nodi'r eithriadau. Mae Waitrose a Marks and Spencer wedi gwneud ymdrech i dalu pris teg i ffermwyr am eu cynnyrch, pris sy'n uwch na chost cynhyrchu. Os gall dau o'r prif fanwerthwyr wneud hyn a pharhau i wneud elw, mae'n siŵr y gall y pedair prif archfarchnad wneud yr un peth. Dylai talu pris teg am laeth fod yn beth arferol, yn hytrach nag yn eithriad.

Mae'n galonogol clywed bod llaethdai Dairy Crest a Robert Wiseman yn cynyddu eu prisiau llaeth, er mai ffracsiwn o geiniog yw'r cynnydd. Ond o leiaf yr ydym yn dechrau symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dylwn fod wedi eich atal ar ôl 15 munud, Brynle, ond—yn eithriadol, ac yn groes i bob egwyddor—gan i mi dorri ar eich traws, cewch funud arall. Felly, rhoddaf 30 eiliad i bob siaradwr.

Eleanor Burnham: Nid yw 30 eiliad yn amser hir, ond diolch, Brynle. Fel merch fferm, credaf fod tynged y ffermwr ynghlwm mewn cynifer o faterion a grybwyllwyd eisoes gan Brynle. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd feddwl am fod yn fwy gwyrd. Mae milltiroedd bwyd yn broblem fawr. Gyda globaleiddio a chynhesu byd-eang, dylem ailystyried y mater hwn ac ailddechrau cynhyrchu bwyd yn lleol. Er mwyn popeth, mae angen inni gael sicrwydd y Gweinidog y bydd yn ceisio cael pris teg i ffermwyr, fel y gwnaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac eraill yn San Steffan. Dylai'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon hyrwyddo bwyd lleol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you, Brynle, for raising this extremely important subject

hwn ac am amlinellu'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant llaeth. Cyfeiriaf at un enghraifft benodol yn fy etholaeth, sydd hefyd yn effeithio ar etholaeth Elin Jones: a wnewch chi, Weinidog, gynnal trafodaethau brys gyda pherchnogion Dansco er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r sefyllfa honno'n ansefydlogi ymhellach?

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn gwlad (Carwyn Jones): O safbwynt Dansco, gwyddom fod sôn am broblemau yn y cwmni hwnnw. Mae swyddogion mewn cysylltiad â'r cwmni, ac wedi bod mewn cysylltiad dros yr wythnosau diwethaf hyn. Y gobaith yw y bydd Dansco yn parhau i sicrhau gwasanaeth i ffermwyr yng Ngheredigion ac yn sir Gâr. Os oes newid yn y sefyllfa, byddaf yn cymryd rhan mewn unrhyw broses angenrheidiol.

The dairy industry has been in some turmoil for some time. The abolition of Milk Marque—as I have said many times—was, in many ways, a retrograde step as far as the industry was concerned. One of the reasons is that its abolition instilled in farmers a reluctance to co-operate, because there was a feeling, which still remains to some extent, that any kind of successful co-operation would somehow end up being destroyed by being broken up by the Monopolies and Mergers Commission. I have fought against that attitude many times, because I have always believed that co-operation has to be the way forward for the majority of farmers.

The industry itself is quite enigmatic, in some ways, in terms of trying to get to grips with the production costs of the industry and what people are actually receiving. Brynle is right to say, and I detected this last week in the National Farmers Union conference, that there is a hint of optimism—let us not go further than that—that prices are now going in the right direction.

We know that we have lost dairy producers over time, but that has been happening for the past 70 years. If you speak to organisations such as South Caernarfon Creameries, it will tell you that it has about one tenth of the number of producers that it had in the 1930s,

and for outlining the problems facing the dairy industry. I will refer to one specific example that affects my constituency as well as Elin Jones's constituency: will you, Minister, hold urgent discussions with Dansco to ensure that the situation there does not deteriorate further?

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): In respect of Dansco, we know there has been talk of problems within the company. Officials are in contact with the company, as they have been over the past few weeks. The hope is that Dansco continues to provide services for farmers in Ceredigion and Carmarthenshire. If the situation changes, I will take part in any process that is required.

Mae'r diwydiant godro wedi bod mewn trafferthion ers cryn amser. Yr oedd diddymu Milk Marque—fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud droeon—ar lawer cyfrif yn gam gwag o ran y diwydiant. Un o'r rhesymau yw bod y penderfyniad i'w ddiddymu wedi arwain at sefyllfa lle mae ffermwyr yn gyndyn i gydweithredu, oherwydd bod ymdeimlad, sy'n parhau i ryw raddau, y byddai unrhyw fath o gydweithredu llwyddiannus yn cael ei ddinistrio trwy gael ei chwalu gan y Comisiwn Monopolïau ac Uno. Yr wyf wedi brwydro yn erbyn yr agwedd honno droeon, oherwydd yr wyf wedi credu erioed mai drwy gydweithredu y mae'r ffordd ymlaen i'r mwyafrif o ffermwyr.

Mae'r diwydiant ei hun yn gymharol enigmatig, mewn rhai ffyrdd, o ran ceisio mynd i'r afael â chostau cynhyrchu'r diwydiant a'r hyn y mae pobl yn ei gael mewn gwirionedd. Mae Brynle yn gywir wrth ddweud, a sylweddolais hyn yr wythnos diwethaf yng nghynhadledd Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr, fod llygedyn o obaith—ni ddylid dweud mwy na hynny—fod prisiau'n symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

Gwyddom ein bod wedi colli cynhyrchwyr llaeth dros amser, ond mae hynny wedi bod yn digwydd ers 70 mlynedd. Os siaradwch â sefydliadau fel Hufenfa De Arfon, bydd yn dweud wrthy ch fod ganddo tuag un rhan o ddeg o'r cynhyrchwyr a oedd ganddo yn y

but that it still has the same amount of milk. There has been a tendency, for a capital intensive industry, to see farms get bigger and bigger.

Not long ago, I spoke to a number of agricultural bankers, who are well used to dealing with the industry. I asked them whether it was the case with the dairy industry that, because it is capital intensive, the bigger the herd that you have the more you can put through the milking parlour and therefore the more money you are going to make. The answer I got was 'no'; I was told that it is down to management. There are many farmers who might be good at producing quality milk but are not so good at managing.

Looking at the structure of the industry, we can see that the production costs of the bottom 25 per cent of the industry are 12p per litre lower than the production costs of those at the top end. That shows that there are enormous variations in efficiency. We know that there are farmers who are still making money. They are not making as much as they would like; I know that. However, I know that there are dairy farmers who are making money; I am told this time and again. We also know that there are farmers who are losing money.

You mentioned that there needs to be a constant exchange of knowledge, and I hope that this is what the action plan will focus on. The production costs and methods of the best must be communicated to those who produce at the highest costs. That is the only way in which people will make a profit in future. In New Zealand, the production cost is 6p per litre. They have advantages that we do not have. It is true that they do not get subsidies, but it is a far more forgiving country with regard to farming. The grass grows well all year round, and land is cheap—far cheaper than it is here. We are never going to match their production costs. In many ways, it is a saving grace that liquid milk is not exported from New Zealand, because it cannot travel all the way here. If it could, our industry would have faced enormous problems in trying to match those production costs.

1930au, ond ei fod yn dal i gael yr un faint o laeth. Bu tueddiad wedi bod i ddiwydiant sy'n ddwys o ran cyfalaf weld ffermydd yn mynd yn fwy ac yn fwy.

Ychydig yn ôl, siaradais â nifer o fancwyr amaethyddol, sydd wedi hen arfer â delio â'r diwydiant. O ystyried bod y diwydiant yn ddwys o ran cyfalaf, gofynnais ai'r tueddiad oedd po fwyaf y fuches, y mwyaf y gallwch eu godro yn y parlwr godro ac felly y mwyaf o arian y gallwch ei wneud. Yr ateb a gefais oedd 'nage'; dywedwyd wrthyf mai mater o reolaeth ydyw. Mae yna nifer o ffermwyr a all fod yn dda yn cynhyrchu llaeth o safon ond nad ydynt cystal wrth reoli.

I edrych ar strwythur y diwydiant, gallwn weld bod costau cynhyrchu'r 25 y cant sydd ar waelod y diwydiant 12c y litr yn is na chostau cynhyrchu'r rhai yn y pen uchaf. Mae hynny'n dangos bod amrywiaeth sylweddol mewn effeithlonrwydd. Gwyddom fod yna ffermwyr sy'n dal i wneud arian. Nid ydynt yn gwneud cymaint ag y byddent yn ei hoffi ei wneud; gwn hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod yna ffermwyr llaeth sy'n gwneud arian; dywedir hyn wrthyf dro ar ôl tro. Gwyddom hefyd fod yna ffermwyr sy'n colli arian.

Soniecch fod angen cyfnewid gwybodaeth yn gyson, a gobeithio mai ar hynny y bydd y cynllun gweithredu yn canolbwyntio. Rhaid cyfleu costau a dulliau cynhyrchu'r goreuon i'r rheini sydd â'r costau cynhyrchu uchaf. Dyna'r unig ffordd y bydd pobl yn gwneud elw yn y dyfodol. Yn Seland Newydd, 6c y litr yw'r gost o gynhyrchu. Mae ganddynt fanteision nad oes gennym ni. Mae'n wir na chânt gymhorthdal, ond mae'n wlad sydd ag amodau llawer gwell o ran ffermio. Mae'r glaswellt yn tyfu'n dda drwy'r flwyddyn, ac mae'r tir yn rhad—rhatach o lawer nag yn y wlad hon. Ni fyddwn byth yn cyrraedd lefelau eu costau cynhyrchu hwy. Mewn llawer ffordd, mae'n dda nad yw llaeth hylif yn cael ei allforio o Seland Newydd, am na all deithio'r holl ffordd yma. Pe gallai deithio, byddai ein diwydiant wedi wynebu problemau enbyd wrth geisio cynhyrchu am yr un costau hynny.

The problems that you talk about, Brynle, are European-wide problems; they are not confined to the UK. I hear about this from farmers in the Republic of Ireland. I spoke at a dairy conference in Carmarthen about a year and a half ago, and the same point was being made to me. We are not in a position where we will see a massive decrease in capacity in the UK that would be picked up by producers elsewhere; I think that this is a Europe-wide problem.

Some sectors of the dairy industry, such as the organic sector, as you rightly said, are booming again. We know that, five years ago, the price of organic milk was roughly 20p or 30p a litre, and everyone piled in. The demand did not follow and the price dropped. We know that people then came out of organic farming, the demand has crept up again, and we now see a price equilibrium that is far higher than was the case four years ago. Organic farmers are now doing pretty well.

On input costs, we know that the price of fuel has gone down. I also think that it has been a major advantage to dairy farmers that they can now export their calves. Those calves were worth nothing, and, in fact, had a negative emotional cost. I know that the worst thing for a dairy farmer is having to shoot a healthy animal. I fully understand people's emotional negativity about having to do that. Those calves are now worth roughly £50 each, so that has helped to increase the income of dairy farmers.

As you know, we are fond of using the phrase 'silver bullet' for some reason in agriculture. We do not farm werewolves in Wales, but we use the phrase 'silver bullet' quite often as a way of trying to communicate an easy solution to a problem. The answer is to build the industry up again. We do need processing capacity in Wales, and with regard to that, sometimes I think that we take three steps forward and two steps back. We get some good-news stories; others are not so good. I hope that if we build the processing capacity more farmers will get a better price for their products because they

Mae'r problemau yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt, Brynle, yn broblemau ledled Ewrop; nid ydynt yn gyfyngedig i'r DU. Clywaf am hyn gan ffermwyr yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon. Bûm yn annerch mewn cynhadledd laeth yng Nghaerfyrddin tua blwyddyn a hanner yn ôl, a gwnaed yr un pwynt imi bryd hynny. Nid ydym mewn sefyllfa lle y byddwn yn gweld gostyngiad anferth mewn cynhyrchiant yn y DU a chynhyrchwyr mewn mannau eraill yn manteisio arno; credaf fod y broblem hon yn broblem ledled Ewrop.

Mae rhai rhannau o'r diwydiant laeth, fel y sector organig, fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud yn gwbl gywir, yn ffynnu eto. Gwyddom fod pris laeth organig tuag 20c neu 30c y litr bum mlynedd yn ôl, ac aeth pawb ar y trywydd hwn. Ni chafwyd y galw disgwylidig amdano a gostyngodd y pris. Gwyddom fod pobl wedi rhoi'r gorau i ffermio organig bryd hynny, mae'r galw wedi cynyddu'n raddol eto, ac yr ydym bellach yn gweld cydbwysedd pris sydd lawer yn uwch nag yr oedd bedair blynedd yn ôl. Bellach, mae ffermwyr organig yn gwneud yn gymharol dda.

O ran costau mewnbwn, gwyddom fod pris tanwydd wedi gostwng. Credaf hefyd ei bod o fantais fawr i ffermwyr laeth eu bod yn awr yn gallu allforio'u lloi. Yr oedd y lloi hynny'n dda i ddim, ac mewn gwirionedd yr oedd iddynt gost emosiynol negyddol. Gwn mai'r peth gwaethaf i ffermwr laeth yw gorfod saethu anifail iach. Yr wyf yn deall yn iawn pam mae pobl yn gyndyn o wneud hynny. Bellach, mae'r lloi hynny'n werth tua £50 yr un. Felly, mae hynny wedi helpu cynyddu incwm ffermwyr laeth.

Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym yn hoff o ddefnyddio'r ymadrodd 'bwled arian' am ryw reswm ym maes amaethyddiaeth. Nid ydym yn ffermio blaidd-ddynion yng Nghymru, ond yr ydym yn defnyddio'r term hwnnw yn eithaf aml fel ffordd i geisio cyfleu ateb hawdd i broblem. Yr ateb yw ailadeiladu'r diwydiant eto. Mae arnom angen y gallu i brosesu yng Nghymru, ac o ran hynny, credaf weithiau ein bod yn cymryd tri cham ymlaen a dau gam yn ôl. Cawn rai hanesion am newyddion da; ac eraill heb fod cystal. Os byddwn yn meithrin y gallu i brosesu, gobeithio y caiff mwy o ffermwyr bris gwell

will not have to travel so far to the processing plants. We want to encourage processing plants, such as Rachel's Dairy, to pick out one among many, where there is a high mark-up when milk is transformed into yoghurt. We need to ensure that those processing plants are kept and encouraged in Wales.

It is going to take some time. The action plan is designed to build the industry up for the future. There is now a hint of optimism. I do not think that we will see the dairy industry collapse, and, fundamentally, the difficulty here is that because some people are making money, they will always be able to supply. If the price in the market were so low that everyone was losing money, the tap would soon be shut off. Therefore, the trick again, as part of the plans that I mentioned earlier, is to ensure that those with the highest production costs see those production costs brought down.

5.50 p.m.

Brynle Williams: I will admit that the top 5 to 10 per cent are making a profit, albeit a very small one. However, we have moved from Europe's farm and horticulture development scheme to upgrading plants, and a lot of buildings are getting tired and major investment is needed. Even these farms that are in the top 5 or 10 per cent are looking seriously at the need to invest up to £400,000, and if we lose them, we are in a serious position.

Carwyn Jones: The judgment on whether or not to invest is a matter for individual businesses; some will do it, some will not. It is difficult to have a one-size-fits-all approach. We still have reluctance among farmers—not all, to be fair—but I think that the attitude is changing towards co-operation. I know that co-operation has been stronger in the dairy industry than anywhere else, but when Milk Marque came to an end, and when the new structure was put in place, a lot of farmers were only too willing to sell outside the co-operatives in order to get more money in the short term. It is important that we stick with co-operatives when we have them, as they do in other countries, and that is why

am eu cynnyrch am na fydd yn rhaid iddynt deithio mor bell i'r ffatrioedd prosesu. Yr ydym am annog ffatrioedd prosesu, fel Hufenfa Rachel, i enwi dim ond un, lle mae pris uwch o lawer pan droir llaeth yn iogwrt. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y ffatrioedd prosesu hynny'n cael eu cadw a'u hannog yng Nghymru.

Mae'n mynd i gymryd cryn amser. Lluniwyd y cynllun gweithredu i adeiladu'r diwydiant ar gyfer y dyfodol. Erbyn hyn, mae llygedyn o obaith. Ni chredaf y byddwn yn gweld y diwydiant llaeth yn mynd i'r wal, ac yn y bôn yr anhawster yma yw bod rhai pobl, am eu bod yn gallu gwneud arian, bob amser yn gallu cyflenwi. Pe bai'r pris ar y farchnad mor isel nes byddai pawb yn colli arian, byddai'r llif yn dod i ben ar unwaith. Felly, y gyfrinach eto, fel rhan o'r cynlluniau y soniais amdanynt yn gynharach, yw sicrhau bod y rheini sydd â'r costau cynhyrchu uchaf yn llwyddo i ostwng y costau cynhyrchu hynny.

Brynle Williams: Cyfaddefaf fod y 5 i 10 y cant uchaf yn gwneud elw, er bod yr elw hwnnw'n fach iawn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi symud o gynllun datblygu ffermydd a garddwriaeth Ewrop i wella ffatrioedd, ac mae llawer o adeiladau yn hen bellach ac angen buddsoddi sylweddol. Mae hyd yn oed y ffermydd hyn sydd yn y 5 neu'r 10 y cant uchaf yn edrych o ddifrif ar yr angen am fuddsoddi hyd at £400,000, ac os collwn y rhain, byddwn mewn sefyllfa ddifrifol.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r penderfyniad i fuddsoddi neu beidio yn fater i fusnesau unigol; bydd rhai'n gwneud hynny, erall ddim. Mae'n anodd cael un dull ar gyfer pawb. Mae rhai ffermwyr yn dal yn amharod—nid pob un, a bod yn deg—ond credaf fod yr agwedd yn newid o blaid cydweithredu. Gwn fod cydweithredu wedi bod yn gryfach yn y diwydiant llaeth nag yn unman arall, ond pan ddaeth Milk Marque i ben, a phan roddwyd y strwythur newydd ar waith, yr oedd nifer o ffermwyr yn rhy barod i werthu y tu allan i'r cwmnïau cydweithredol er mwyn cael mwy o arian yn y tymor byr. Mae'n bwysig inni gefnogi cwmni cydweithredol, fel sy'n digwydd mewn

prices, quite often—not so much with dairy, but particularly with meat—tend to be higher for producers in other countries, and they will not sell outside their co-operatives.

I will leave you with one thought regarding an article that was shown to me some years ago that referred to the dairy industry in Wales. It referred to the difficulties faced by small farmers, and dairy farmers in general, in terms of making a profit, the difficulties in terms of producing a product that was seen as healthy, and the difficulties regarding tuberculosis. It also referred to the way in which the Irish had big co-operatives, which were able to offer Irish farmers a better deal in terms of the milk that they produced. The article had been written in 1935, but it could have been written in this decade. The challenge now is to ensure over the next five or 10 years that that is no longer the case, and that we—

Eleanor Burnham: You still have not told us how you will challenge the huge global dominance of the supermarkets. That is the biggest threat, particularly as we know that, because of the age of farmers, they are perhaps against changing. The average age of a farmer is 58; would you, at the age of 58, want to change your methods of working? It would be very hard. That aside, you must do something to fight global dominance, and I am talking about Wall Mart, for instance, which owns Asda—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Eleanor, this is not a speech, but an intervention.

Carwyn Jones: This is the free market, Eleanor; we are not going to suddenly nationalise all the supermarkets and control the contracts. I agree with Brynle about transparency, and I think that there is more work to do in terms of ensuring greater transparency in the way that all products are produced. I do not accept for a second this idea that at the age of 58 you should not be asked to change your methods, because if you are a business, you have to change your methods. You cannot go on producing the

gwledydd eraill, a dyna pam mae prisiau, yn ddigon aml—nid o ran llaeth o reidrwydd, ond yn enwedig gyda chig—yn tueddu i fod yn uwch i gynhyrchwyr mewn gwledydd eraill, ac ni fyddant yn gwerthu y tu allan i'w cwmnïau cydweithredol.

Fe'ch gadawaf gydag un syniad ynglŷn ag erthygl a ddangoswyd imi flynyddoedd yn ôl yn cyfeirio at y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yn cyfeirio at yr anawsterau yr oedd ffermwyr bach, a ffermwyr llaeth yn gyffredinol, yn eu hwynebu, o ran gwneud elw, yr anawsterau o ran cynhyrchu cynnyrch a ystyrir yn iachus, a'r anawsterau o ran twbercwlosis. Yr oedd hefyd yn cyfeirio at y ffordd yr oedd gan y Gwyddelod gwmnïau cydweithredol mawr, a allai gynnig bargaen well i ffermwyr Iwerddon am y llaeth yr oeddent yn ei gynhyrchu. Ysgrifennwyd yr erthygl yn 1935, ond gellid bod wedi ei hysgrifennu yn y degawd hwn. Yr her yn awr yn ystod y pum neu 10 mlynedd nesaf yw sicrhau nad yw hynny'n wir mwyach, a'n bod—

Eleanor Burnham: Nid ydych eto wedi dweud wrthym sut y byddwch yn herio arglwyddiaeth fyd-eang yr archfarchnadoedd. Dyna'r bygythiad mwyaf, yn enwedig gan ein bod yn gwybod, oherwydd oed ffermwyr, eu bod efallai'n gwrthwynebu newid. Oed ffermwr ar gyfartaledd yw 58 oed; a fydddech chi, yn 58 oed, am newid eich ffordd o weithio? Byddai'n anodd iawn. Ar wahân i hynny, rhaid ichi wneud rhywbeth i wrthsefyll arglwyddiaeth fyd-eang, ac yr wyf yn sôn am Wall Mart, er enghraifft, sy'n berchen ar Asda—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Eleanor, nid araith yw hon, ond ymyriad.

Carwyn Jones: Dyma'r farchnad rydd, Eleanor; nid ydym am wladoli'r holl archfarchnadoedd a rheoli eu contractau. Cytunaf â Brynle ynglŷn ag eglurder, a chredaf fod mwy o waith i'w wneud i sicrhau mwy o eglurder yn y ffordd y cynhyrchir pob cynnyrch. Nid wyf yn derbyn am eiliad y syniad hwn na ddylid gofyn i bobl 58 oed newid eu dulliau, oherwydd os ydych mewn busnes rhaid ichi newid eich dulliau. Ni allwch barhau i gynhyrchu'r un hen bethau am eich bod wedi gwneud hynny ers

same old things because you have done it time and again for many years. Businesses always have to change and that is part of how the economy works. No-one would suggest producing, for example, sheep meat in the way that it was produced 20 years ago, because the market is different now. Therefore, saying that someone should not have to change is unacceptable, because all businesses have to change.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You started your presentation by referring to the problems that arose because of Milk Marque and the monopolies commission's decision, which led to that situation. However, in a sense, when you consider the retail element and the selling of milk, Tesco is by far the most important player. Almost a third of the amount sold is sold through Tesco. Does that not mean that Tesco, in that sense, also has a monopoly in the market?

Carwyn Jones: I have some sympathy with that view because more could be done in terms of investigating how the market operates, and I know that there are plans in Westminster to do that. However, it is difficult to get people to give evidence against the very company that they are supplying. It becomes difficult then for a true picture to be presented to parliamentary inquiries, and to Assembly inquiries, so that we have a better understanding of how the market operates. There are many stories out there, and many of them will no doubt be correct. However, to get someone to say, 'Look, this is what is happening', and for them to jeopardise their future ability to supply a particular organisation is difficult.

To conclude, things are slowly moving in the right direction. Much more can be done to develop the dairy strategy action plan. We cannot nationalise the supermarkets—we have to put that to one side—but, more than anything else, there is more of an appreciation now among dairy farmers of what they need to do to become more efficient. We see that big gulf between the two sets that are producing at the top end and the lower end, and, in the next five or 10 years—if not sooner, hopefully—we will

blynyddoedd. Rhaid i fusnesau newid drwy'r amser, ac mae hynny'n rhan o'r ffordd y mae'r economi'n gweithio. Er enghraifft, ni fyddai neb yn awgrymu cynhyrchu cig oen yn yr un ffordd ag y câi ei gynhyrchu 20 mlynedd yn ôl, oherwydd bod y farchnad yn wahanol erbyn hyn. Felly, mae dweud na ddylai rhywun orfod newid yn annerbyniol, oherwydd rhaid i bob busnes newid.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dechreusoch eich cyflwyniad drwy gyfeirio at y problemau a gododd yn sgil Milk Marque a phenderfyniad y comisiwn monopolïau, a arweiniodd at y sefyllfa honno. Fodd bynnag, mewn ffordd, pan fyddwch yn ystyried yr elfen adwerthu a gwerthu llaeth, Tesco yw'r chwaraewr pwysicaf o bell ffordd. Mae bron i draean y llaeth a werthir yn cael ei werthu drwy Tesco. Onid yw hynny'n golygu bod gan Tesco hefyd, yn y ystyr hwnnw, fonopoli yn y farchnad?

Carwyn Jones: Mae gennyf ryw faint o gydymdeimlad â'r safbwynt hwnnw oherwydd gellid gwneud mwy i archwilio'r ffordd y mae'r farchnad yn gweithio, a gwn fod cynlluniau ar droed yn San Steffan i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd perswadio pobl i roi tystiolaeth yn erbyn yr union gwmni y maent yn ei gyflenwi. Mae'n mynd yn anodd wedyn cael darlun teg i'w gyflwyno i ymchwiliadau seneddol, ac i ymchwiliadau'r Cynulliad, er mwyn inni gael dealltwriaeth well o'r modd y mae'r farchnad yn gweithredu. Mae yna lawer o straeon, ac mae'n siŵr bod nifer ohonynt yn wir. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dasg anodd perswadio rhywun i ddweud, 'Edrychwch, dyma sy'n digwydd', ac iddynt beryglu eu gallu i gyflenwi i sefydliad penodol yn y dyfodol.

I gloi, mae pethau'n symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn yn raddol. Erbyn hyn, gellir gwneud mwy i ddatblygu'r cynllun gweithredu strategol llaeth. Ni allwn wladoli'r archfarchnadoedd—rhaid inni roi hynny o'r neilltu—ond, yn anad dim, mae ffermwyr llaeth bellach yn sylweddoli'n fwy yr hyn y mae angen iddynt ei wneud i ddod yn fwy effeithlon. Yr ydym yn gweld y gagendor mawr hwnnw rhwng y ddwy set sy'n cynhyrchu yn y pen uchaf a'r pen isaf, ac yn ystod y pum neu'r 10 mlynedd nesaf—os nad

have a better story to tell about the vibrancy of our dairy industry. cyn hynny, gobeithio—bydd gennym stori well i'w hadrodd am fywiogrwydd ein diwydiant llaeth.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes this afternoon's session. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.54 p.m.

The meeting ended at 5.54 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau

Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)

Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)