



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 7 Tachwedd 2006  
Tuesday, 7 November 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| 3  | Penodiad i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol<br>Appointment to the Local Government Partnership Council   |
| 4  | Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio<br>Election to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee   |
| 5  | Datganiad gan y Llywydd<br>Statement by the Presiding Officer  |
| 5  | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog<br>Questions to the First Minister  |
| 36 | Datganiad Busnes<br>Business Statement   |
| 41 | Cymeradwyo Deddwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25<br>Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25  |
| 42 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tatws Hadyd (Cymru) 2006<br>Approval of the Seed Potatoes (Wales) Regulations 2006   |
| 46 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwaith Stryd (Adfer) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, a<br>Chymeradwyo'r Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways<br>Second Edition 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29<br>Approval of the Street Works (Reinstatement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations<br>2006, and Approval of the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in<br>Highways Second Edition 2006 under Standing Order No. 29 |
| 52 | Cymeradwyo'r Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales)<br>(No. 2) Order 2006 a Rheoliadau Fflw Adar (Brechu) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006 o dan<br>Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27(iv)<br>Approval of the Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales)<br>(No. 2) Order 2006 and the Avian Influenza (Vaccination) (Wales) (No. 2)<br>Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv)           |
| 61 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Oedi wrth Drosglwyddo Gofal<br>Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): Delayed Transfers Of Care  |
| 91 | Adroddiad Blynyddol Pwyllgor y Tŷ<br>The Annual Report of the House Committee  |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Penodiad i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol  
Appointment to the Local Government Partnership Council**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with paragraphs 1(1) and (3) of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints Councillor Simon Hancock (Chair Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) as representative of the national park authorities in Wales to the Local Government Partnership Council for Wales. (NDM3281)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â pharagraffau 1(1) a (3) Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penodi'r Cynghorydd Simon Hancock (Cadeirydd Parc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Penfro) i gynrychioli awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol yng Nghymru ar y Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol i Gymru. (NDM3281)*

*Cynnig (NDM3281): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3281): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl

Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Election to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects Trish Law (Independent) to its Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol Trish Law (Annibynnol) i'w Bwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. (NDM3282)*

*Cynnig (NDM3282): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3282): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi wahodd y Prif Weinidog i ateb cwestiynau, mae'n bleser arbennig gennyf groesawu llefarydd a dirprwy lefarydd Tŷ Cynrychiolwyr Somaliland: y Gwir Anrhydeddus Abdirahman Mohamed Abdillahi, y llefarydd, a'r Gwir Anrhydeddus Abdi-Aziz Mohamed Samaleh, y prif ddirprwy lefarydd. Croeso mawr i chi. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I invite the First Minister to answer questions, it gives me great pleasure to welcome the speaker and deputy speaker of the Somaliland House of Representatives: the Right Honourable Abdirahman Mohamed Abdillahi, the speaker, and the Right Honourable Abdi-Aziz Mohamed Samaleh, the first deputy speaker. You are most welcome. [*Applause.*]

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Blaenoriaethau Cyllido Funding Priorities**

**Q1 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's funding priorities? OAQ2010(FM)

**C1 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth o ran cyllido? OAQ2010(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Our priorities for funding were set out in the draft budget. We continue to receive suggestions from subject committees and hold discussions with finance spokespersons. Yesterday, I took the initiative by inviting party leaders to a further meeting next week on the budget for 2007-08.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Amlinellwyd ein blaenoriaethau cyllido yn y gyllideb ddrafft. Yr ydym yn cael awgrymiadau gan bwyllgorau pwnc o hyd, ac yn dal i drafod gyda llefarwyr ym maes cyllid. Ddoe, cymerais yr awenau drwy wahodd arweinwyr y pleidiau i gyfarfod arall sydd i'w gynnal yr wythnos nesaf ar gyllideb 2007-08.

**Janet Ryder:** When Labour was elected, it was very much on a ticket of education, education, education, making it the top priority. However, figures show clearly that the overall amount in the education budget in Wales is not keeping pace with the comparable amount in the UK. It is not that the priorities within that budget need to be the same, but the overall amount should be. Those figures show clearly that, had we kept pace with the UK, there would be an additional £173 million in the education budget. That would make an enormous impact on schools, colleges and universities—the whole sector. Why have

**Janet Ryder:** Pan etholwyd Llafur, fe wnaed hynny i raddau helaeth ar sail ei haddewid addysg, addysg, addysg. Fodd bynnag, dengys ffigurau'n glir nad yw'r cyfanswm cyffredinol yn y gyllideb addysg yng Nghymru yn cyd-fynd â'r swm cyfatebol yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Er nad oes angen i'r blaenoriaethau yn y gyllideb honno fod yr un fath, dylai hynny fod yn wir am y cyfanswm cyffredinol. Dengys y ffigurau hynny'n glir y byddai £173 miliwn yn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb addysg, pe byddem wedi aros ar yr un lefel â'r Deyrnas Unedig. Byddai hynny'n cael effaith anferth ar ysgolion, ar golegau ac ar brifysgolion—y sector cyfan. Pam nad ydych wedi gwneud addysg yn

you not prioritised education?

**The First Minister:** We have, but we are also reliant on our delivery partners prioritising education. If you compare the figures for England—which is Plaid Cymru’s obsession, making me wonder why it has that name when a better title might be ‘Plaid obsession with England’; that obsession is evident yet again from this question—you will see that, if local authorities in Wales choose not to prioritise education, and some do, unfortunately, you will get these lower outcomes. It is sad, but that is the case. However, those authorities must also face up to their responsibilities.

**Irene James:** Rhodri, would you agree that our funding priorities in education must be to target children from nursery level, ensuring that they all have the best opportunities and an equal opportunity to get the most out of our education system? Would you agree that, foremost, that means removing the barriers caused by deprivation, which hinder achievement and disempower young people, in order to deliver for everyone in Wales the skills, confidence and opportunities to fulfil their career aspirations?

**The First Minister:** Everyone who is serious about education would realise that some form of social exclusion tends to start across the board in the British educational system at a very early age. We are targeting that through a shift from 100 years of failed early years education in Britain to the much more successful Scandinavian pattern through our early years initiative. We expect that to bear fruit in remedying those inequalities that become evident in access to high-quality further and higher education 10 to 15 years down the line.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I ddod yn ôl at yr ateb y bu i chi ei roi i Janet Ryder, mae’n gwestiwn sylfaenol. Yn 1997 a 1999, addewid Llafur oedd mai ‘addysg, addysg, addysg’ fyddai’r flaenoriaeth. Onid yw hynny yr un mor wir

flaenoriaeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi gwneud addysg yn flaenoriaeth, ond yr ydym yn dibynnu hefyd ar roi blaenoriaeth i addysg gan ein partneriaid sy’n darparu’r gwasanaethau. Os cymharwch y ffigurau ar gyfer Lloegr—sy’n obsesiwn gan Blaid Cymru, gan wneud imi amau pam mae’r enw hwnnw ganddi pan fyddai ‘Plaid sydd ag obsesiwn â Lloegr’, o bosibl, yn enw gwell; unwaith eto, mae’r obsesiwn hwnnw’n amlwg wrth edrych ar y cwestiwn hwn—gwelwch mai canlyniadau gwaeth fel hyn a gewch os yw awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn dewis peidio â rhoi blaenoriaeth i addysg. Yn anffodus, mae rhai’n gwneud hynny. Mae’n drist, ond dyna sut y mae hi. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i’r awdurdodau hynny hefyd wynebu eu cyfrifoldebau.

**Irene James:** Rhodri, a gytunwch fod yn rhaid i’n blaenoriaethau ym myd addysg, o safbwynt arian, dargedu plant o lefel meithrin, gan sicrhau bod pob un ohonynt yn cael y cyfleoedd gorau ac yn cael cyfle cyfartal i fanteisio i’r eithaf ar ein system addysg? A gytunwch, yn anad dim, fod hynny’n golygu cael gwared â’r rhwystrau a achosir gan amddifadedd, sy’n llesteirio’r gallu i gyflawni ac yn dadrymuso pobl ifanc, er mwyn rhoi’r sgiliau, yr hyder a’r cyfleoedd i bawb yng Nghymru wireddu eu dyheadau o ran gyrfa?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai unrhyw un sy’n cymryd addysg o ddifrif yn sylweddoli bod rhyw fath o allgáu cymdeithasol yn tueddu i ddechrau drwyddi draw o oedran cynnar iawn yn y system addysg Brydeinig. Yr ydym yn targedu hynny drwy symud oddi wrth 100 mlynedd o addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar na fu’n llwyddiannus ym Mhrydain, at y patrwm Scandinafaidd llawer mwy llwyddiannus, drwy ein menter blynyddoedd cynnar. Disgwylwch i’r fenter honno ddwyn ffrwyth o ran unioni’r anghydraddoldebau sy’n dod yn amlwg wrth geisio cael mynediad at addysg bellach ac addysg uwch o safon uchel 10 i 15 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** To return to the answer that you gave to Janet Ryder, this is a fundamental question. In 1997 and 1999, Labour pledged that ‘education, education, education’ would be its priority. Is that not just as true in 2006?

yn 2006?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r un flaenoriaeth gennym yn awr: mae addysg yn hollbwysig i'n dyfodol. O dan y system bresennol, yr ydym yn dibynnu ar ein partneriaid i roi'r un flaenoriaeth i addysg. Nid oes gorfodaeth arnynt, ond yr ydym yn gobeithio y bydd pwysau ar lywodraeth leol i roi'r un flaenoriaeth ag sydd gennym ni i addysg.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n flin gennyf, Brif Weinidog, ond ochrgamu oedd hynny. Yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei ofyn oedd a ydych chi, fel Llywodraeth, wedi rhoi llai o arian i addysg ers 1999 na Llywodraethau Llafur Llundain a'r Alban? Mae'r ffigurau wedi mynd i lawr. Er enghraifft, yn 1999, yr oedd Cymru yn rhoi £60 y pen yn fwy at addysg; y llynedd, yr oedd y ffigur £23 y pen yn uwch, sydd yn dangos bod llai o gynnydd mewn arian ar gyfer addysg o dan eich Llywodraeth chi nag a welwyd yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Yr ydym yn sôn am fwy nag am un wlad—nid ydym yn gwneud cymhariaeth â Lloegr yn unig.

Yn ogystal â'r ffaith eich bod yn rhoi llai i addysg, mae'r bwlch cyllido rhwng prifysgolion Cymru a phrifysgolion yn Lloegr a'r Alban wedi tyfu. A yw hynny yn dangos blaenoriaeth eich Llywodraeth, ac nid eich partneriaid?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn dweud bod y ffigurau wedi mynd i lawr, ond yr ydych yn anghywir: maent wedi mynd i fyny. Yr ydych hefyd yn dweud ein bod wedi rhoi llai i addysg, ond yr ydym wedi rhoi mwy. Mae'n rhaid i chi wella ansawdd yr ymchwil y tu ôl i'ch cwestiynau: mae'n hollol anghywir.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Headteachers are telling us as Assembly Members that next year, because of the pressures on school budgets, they will have to sack teachers and increase class sizes—your Government is not giving them the money that they need. Every vice-chancellor of every higher education institution in Wales is telling us that researchers are being lost because you are not prioritising higher education. It is nonsense to say that the increase in education spend since 1999 has been higher in Wales than it has been in England and Scotland: it has been

**The First Minister:** We have the same priority now: education is essential to our future. Under the current system, we must rely on our partners to give the same priority to education. There is no compulsion on them, but we hope that there will be pressure on local authorities to give education the same priority as we have given it.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sorry, First Minister, but that was just sidestepping the issue. I was asking whether you, as a Government, have invested less money in education since 1999 than the Labour Government in London and Scotland. The figures have gone down. For instance, in 1999, Wales was allocating £60 per head more on education; last year, the figure was only £23 per head more, which shows that there is less of an increase in funding for education under your Government than that seen in England and Scotland. We are talking about more than one country here—we are not making a comparison with England only.

In addition to the fact that you have given less to education, the funding gap between universities in Wales and universities in England and Scotland has grown. Does that then reveal your Government's priority, and not that of your partners?

**The First Minister:** You are saying that the figures have gone down, but you are wrong: they have gone up. You also say that we have given less money to education, but we have given more. You must work on the quality of the research behind your questions: it is totally incorrect.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae penaethiaid yn dweud wrthym, fel Aelodau Cynulliad, y bydd rhaid iddynt ddiswyddo athrawon a chynyddu maint eu dosbarthiadau y flwyddyn nesaf, oherwydd y pwysau ar gyllidebau ysgolion—nid yw eich Llywodraeth yn rhoi iddynt yr arian y mae arnynt ei angen. Mae pob is-ganghellor ym mhob sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn dweud wrthym fod ymchwilwyr yn cael eu colli gan nad ydych yn gwneud addysg uwch yn flaenoriaeth. Lol yw dweud bod y cynnydd yn y gwariant ar addysg wedi bod yn uwch yng Nghymru nag y mae wedi bod yn Lloegr ac yn

lower, and you know that. Expenditure per head on education has gone down in Wales compared with in the other countries of Britain. We are entitled to know whether this is your idea of giving an issue priority, or whether, in fact, you have turned your back on education in Wales.

**The First Minister:** You say that the figures have gone down, but they have not: they have gone up, and have gone up sharply. On your comments about headteachers and vice-chancellors, I meet many vice-chancellors and not one has said this to me. We continue to study the situation closely to find an accurate, like-for-like comparison between Welsh higher education institutions and their nearest English counterparts.

At budget time, there will be lobbying from every sector for more money. Somehow or other the Assembly has to ensure that the figures add up to the money available, and not have an overspill. If we were to listen to all the lobbyists, we would spend far more money than we have, which would be illegal. We have to come to agreement on the budget. However, education is the future of Wales, and we intend to ensure that it remains a component that builds the future of Wales, and we know that there are many problems to be solved with regard to surplus school places in Wales. Some local authorities are quite irresponsible in failing to grapple with the problem, but we hope that they will soon step up to the play.

2.10 p.m.

**Christine Gwyther:** As it was the half-term holiday in south-east Wales last week, but not in south-west Wales, I was able to make many school visits in my constituency. I asked all the headteachers whether the local education authority was passing on the 1 per cent efficiency savings to schools. In Carmarthenshire, the answer was 'no', but in Pembrokeshire, the answer was 'yes'. Is direction being provided by the Welsh Assembly Government that local education authorities should not automatically pass on efficiency savings to schools?

**The First Minister:** No. Cutting an

yr Alban: mae wedi bod yn is, ac yr ydych yn gwybod hynny. Mae'r gwariant ar addysg y pen wedi gostwng yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â gwledydd eraill Prydain. Mae gennym hawl i wybod ai dyma'ch syniad chi o roi blaenoriaeth i fater, ynteu a ydych wedi troi eich cefn ar addysg yng Nghymru.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn dweud bod y ffigurau wedi gostwng, ond nid ydynt: maent wedi codi, ac wedi codi'n sylweddol. O ran eich sylwadau am benaethiaid ac is-gangellorion, byddaf yn cyfarfod â llawer o is-gangellorion ac nid oes dim un wedi dweud hyn wrthyf. Yr ydym yn dal i astudio'r sefyllfa'n ofalus er mwyn canfod cymhariaeth fanwl gywir rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru, a'u cymheiriaid agosaf yn Lloegr.

Pan ddaw amser y gyllideb, bydd pob sector yn llobio am ychwaneg o arian. Rywsut neu'i gilydd mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad sicrhau bod y ffigurau'n cyfateb i'r arian sydd ar gael, ac nad oes mwy o arian yn cael ei addo na'r hyn sydd yn y coffrau. Pe baem yn gwrandao ar bob lobiwr, byddem yn gwario llawer mwy o arian nag sydd gennym, a byddai hynny'n anghyfreithlon. Rhaid i ni gytuno ar y gyllideb. Fodd bynnag, addysg yw dyfodol Cymru, a bwriadwn sicrhau y bydd yn parhau'n elfen sy'n adeiladu dyfodol Cymru, a gwyddom fod llawer o broblemau i'w datrys o ran faint o leoedd gwag sydd mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn anghyfrifol iawn wrth fetu â mynd i'r afael â'r broblem, ond gobeithiwn y byddant yn mynd ati i gael trefn ar bethau'n fuan.

**Christine Gwyther:** Gan ei bod yn wyliau hanner tymor yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, ond nid felly yn y de-orllewin, llwyddais i ymweld â llawer o ysgolion yn fy etholaeth. Gofynnais i'r penaeithiaid i gyd a oedd yr awdurdod addysg lleol yn trosglwyddo'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant i'r ysgolion. Yn sir Gaerfyrddin, 'na' oedd yr ateb, ond yn sir Benfro, yr ateb oedd 'ydyw'. A yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi arweiniad na ddylai awdurdodau addysg lleol drosglwyddo arbedion effeithlonrwydd i ysgolion yn awtomatig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nac ydyw. Yn amlwg, nid



education budget at school level is plainly not an efficiency saving, but getting on with the job of getting rid of surplus school places clearly is. Therefore, we want to try to direct local education authorities, as much as we possibly can—and we have no powers of compulsion in this area—to step up to the play and grasp the responsibility that they have for eliminating surplus school places. To give you an example, my understanding is that 40,000 pupils in Wales are reaching the end of compulsory education, aged 16, this year, but only 30,000 pupils are entering the school system, 11 years younger than that. Therefore, if you have 40,000 pupils leaving school and 30,000 pupils entering the school system, it is plain that the problem of surplus school places will not go away.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** To stay with education budget issues, it is clear—and I am not obsessed with England; I am obsessed with Wales—that comparisons have to be made. The funding gap between higher education in Wales and in England, and even more so in Scotland, is growing. That is a real concern among the heads of higher education institutions, and we must address it in this budget round. You might want to comment on that.

Another significant issue in this budget round is the ambulance service. To the Government's credit, it has put some money in—£16 million over two years. However, that is clearly not sufficient to meet the sort of challenge talked about by Alan Murray; he talked about the need for £140 million over 10 years. There needs to be a continuing commitment in order to save the lives undoubtedly being lost at present. If you make a comparison with every part of England, you will see that Wales is underperforming.

**The First Minister:** I do not want to make this answer too long. On your first point, on higher education, it is fair to say that the figures continue to be worked on. Jane Davidson, Sue Essex and I remain to be convinced that we have an accurate, like-for-like comparison of Cardiff, Swansea, Aberystwyth and Bangor with comparable HE institutions in England, and likewise for

yw torri cyllideb addysg ar lefel ysgolion yn arbediad effeithlonrwydd, ond mae mynd ati i gael gwared â lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion yn amlwg yn ffordd o wneud hyn. Oherwydd hyn, mae arnom eisiau rhoi cymaint o arweiniad ag y gallwn i awdurdodau addysg lleol—ac nid oes gennym bwerau gorfodi yn y maes hwn—i fwrw iddi a derbyn y cyfrifoldeb sydd ganddynt i gael gwared â lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion. A rhoi enghraifft ichi, yn ôl a ddeallaf, bydd 40,000 o ddisgyblion yng Nghymru sy'n 16 oed yn gorffen eu haddysg orfodol eleni, ond dim ond 30,000 o ddisgyblion sy'n dod yn rhan o'r system addysg, felly mae'n amlwg na fydd problem lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion yn diflannu.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ac aros gydag addysg, mae'n amlwg—ac nid oes gennyf obsesiwn â Lloegr; obsesiwn â Chymru sydd gennyf—fod angen cymharu. Mae'r bwloch cyllido rhwng addysg uwch yng Nghymru ac addysg uwch yn Lloegr yn cynyddu, ac yn cynyddu mwy fyth yn yr Alban. Mae hynny'n bryder go iawn ymhlith penaethiaid sefydliadau addysg uwch, ac mae'n rhaid inni roi sylw iddo yng nghylch presennol y gyllideb. Efallai y byddwch yn dymuno cyflwyno sylwadau ynghylch hynny.

Mater arwyddocaol arall yng nghylch y gyllideb yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Pob clod i'r Llywodraeth, mae wedi rhoi rhywfaint o arian i'r gwasanaeth—£16 miliwn dros ddwy flynedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n ddigon i ymateb i'r math o her y soniodd Alan Murray amdani; soniodd ef am yr angen i gael £140 miliwn dros 10 mlynedd. Mae ymrwymiad parhaus yn ofynnol er mwyn achub y bywydau, sydd, yn ddiarnheul, yn cael eu colli ar hyn o bryd. Os cymharwch hyn gyda phob rhan o Loegr, gwelwch fod Cymru yn tangyflawni.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf am wneud yr ateb hwn yn rhy hir. O ran eich pwynt cyntaf ynghylch addysg uwch, mae'n deg dweud bod gwaith yn cael ei wneud ar y ffigurau o hyd. Nid yw Jane Davidson, Sue Essex na minnau wedi ein hargyhoeddi bod gennym gymhariaeth fanwl gywir o sefydliadau tebyg, er mwyn cymharu Caerdydd, Abertawe, Aberystwyth a Bangor â sefydliadau addysg uwch tebyg yn Lloegr.

Wales's post-1992 institutions. When we have those figures, I am sure that everybody will want to act on them.

As regards the ambulance service, you have asked me this question many times before. I do not have much to add to previous answers. I am pleased that you have welcomed the £16 million put in, which means that the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust is able to get more than 100 new vehicles quickly. More than two thirds of those vehicles will be full emergency blue-light ambulances, and the remainder will be patient transport vehicles. We expect to see those vehicles digested within the ambulance trust, and, when it has demonstrated that it can use those additional vehicles efficiently—some reform of practices will be needed to ensure that they are—I am sure that Alan Murray will come back for the next tranche. Such a request would be considered sympathetically.

**Nick Bourne:** To take the First Minister up on those points, I do not accept that there is not an easy comparator in relation to higher education. The easy way to do this is to compare the average institution in Wales with the average institution in England and Scotland. We do not want to cherry-pick different institutions; we cannot buy them off in that way. This has to be dealt with across the board. I understand why you want to deal with this in another way, but, to be fair to the institutions, this has to be done across the board.

On the second issue of ambulances, I agree that I have raised it before, but I have not been satisfied with your long-term commitment that there will be money in the budget when the ambulance trust asks for the money that is clearly needed. That is why opposition parties put this down. Will you accept that there will be money in the budget to meet this demand, so that we can save the lives currently being lost?

**The First Minister:** On cherry-picking, it is you who may be choosing a comparison that

Mae'r un peth yn wir am y sefydliadau a sefydlwyd yng Nghymru ar ôl 1992. Pan fyddwn wedi cael y ffigurau hynny, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd pawb yn awyddus i weithredu arnynt.

Ac edrych ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, gofynasoch y cwestiwn hwn imi lawer gwaith o'r blaen. Nid oes gennyf lawer i'w ychwanegu at atebion blaenorol. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi croesawu'r £16 miliwn a roddwyd i'r gwasanaeth, sy'n golygu y bydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru yn gallu cael mwy na 100 o gerbydau newydd yn fuan. Bydd mwy na dwy ran o dair o'r cerbydau hynny yn ambiwlansys golau glas llawn ar gyfer argyfyngau, a bydd y gweddill yn gerbydau cludo cleifion. Disgwyliwn weld y cerbydau hynny'n ennill eu plwyf yn yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Pan fydd wedi dangos y gall ddefnyddio'r cerbydau ychwanegol hynny mewn modd effeithiol—bydd angen diwygio rhai arferion er mwyn sicrhau y gwneir hynny—yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Alan Murray yn dod yn ôl atom ar gyfer y gyfran nesaf. Byddai cais o'r fath yn cael ei ystyried â chydymdeimlad.

**Nick Bourne:** Ac ymateb i'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, nid wyf yn derbyn nad oes cymharydd rhwydd o ran addysg uwch. Y ffordd hawdd o wneud hyn yw cymharu'r sefydliad cyffredin yng Nghymru â'r sefydliad cyffredin yn Lloegr ac yn yr Alban. Nid oes arnom eisiau dewis a dethol gwahanol sefydliadau; ni allwn brynu ffafrau yn y ffordd honno. Rhaid delio â hyn drwyddi draw. Deallaf pam yr ydych yn dymuno mynd i'r afael â'r mater mewn ffordd arall, ond, a bod yn deg â'r sefydliadau, rhaid i hyn gael ei wneud o ben bwygilydd.

O ran yr ail fater, sef ambiwlansys, cytunaf fy mod wedi ei godi o'r blaen, ond nid wyf wedi cael fy modloni â'ch ymrwymiad hirdymor y bydd arian yn y gyllideb pan fydd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn gofyn amdano—arian sydd, yn amlwg, yn angenrheidiol. Dyna pam y cyflwynodd y gwrthbleidiau hyn. A dderbyniwch y bydd arian yn y gyllideb i ddiwallu'r angen hwn, er mwyn inni allu achub y bywydau sy'n cael eu colli ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O ran dewis a dethol, efallai mai chi sy'n dewis cymhariaeth y gwyddoch ei

you know to be far more likely to be more adverse than a proper, like-for-like comparison. Everyone who takes a serious interest in the comparisons between Welsh higher education funding and the funding levels in England wants to do it on a fair, like-for-like, comparative basis. It is evident from the English figures that there are high-cost areas in England: the eastern region, London and the south-east. There are also low-cost regions, namely the south-west, the midlands, and the north. You could not possibly justify giving additional funds to Welsh higher education institutions on the basis that they have the same costs as universities in eastern England, south-eastern England, and the London region. That would be madness. It would be going to hell in a handcart, when that gap is so clear within the English interregional comparisons.

To return to the ambulance case, capital moneys for additional ambulance provision have been given promptly, on the request of the incoming chief executive. I am sure that there will be further requests once the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust has digested the first tranche of 100 additional vehicles—and 100 additional ambulances is a lot of ambulances to digest and to use in the ways that go along with reformed practices in the ambulance trust, which everyone agrees are necessary.

**Nick Bourne:** On higher education, the First Minister touched on why I object to taking individual institutions as comparators. There are some high-spending institutions, and there are some low-spending ones—that is why you take the average. You are not then cherry-picking; you are taking the average of the three different nations of Scotland, England and Wales. That is the fair way to do it. Ask higher education institutions in Wales and their students. I am keen to get a good deal for the people of Wales, and that is how we do it—by averaging it.

On the second point, I still have not heard this commitment of money being in the budget. There is much ground to be made up by the ambulance service so that we can raise to the standard of even the least well performing authority in England—and I see that you are getting a crib from the Finance

bod yn llawer mwy tebygol o fod yn fwy niweidiol na chymhariaeth briodol, rhwng dau beth tebyg. Mae pawb sydd â diddordeb o ddifrif yn y cymariaethau rhwng cyllid addysg uwch yng Nghymru a lefelau cyllid yn Lloegr yn dymuno gwneud hynny ar sail deg, gan gymharu pethau sy'n cyfateb i'w gilydd. Mae'n amlwg o edrych ar ffigurau Lloegr fod ardaloedd lle y mae costau uchel yn Lloegr: y dwyrain, Llundain a'r de-ddwyrain. Mae rhanbarthau sydd â chostau isel hefyd, sef y de-orllewin, y canolbarth, a'r gogledd. Ni allech yn eich byw gyfiawnhau rhoi cyllid ychwanegol i sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru oherwydd bod eu costau yr un fath â phrifysgolion dwyrain Lloegr, de-ddwyrain Lloegr, a rhanbarth Llundain. Gwallgofrwydd fyddai hynny. Mynd ar eich pen i drwbl fyddai hynny, pan fo'r bwlch hwnnw mor amlwg wrth gymharu rhanbarthau Lloegr.

A dychwelyd at achos yr ambiwlansys, mae arian cyfalaf ar gyfer darpariaeth ambiwlans ychwanegol wedi'i roi'n brydlon, ar gais y prif weithredwr newydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd rhagor o geisiadau wedi i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru dreulio'r haen gyntaf o 100 cerbyd ychwanegol—ac mae 100 ambiwlans ychwanegol yn llawer o ambiwlansys i'w treulio a'u defnyddio yn y ffyrdd sy'n cyd-fynd â'r arferion diwygiedig yn yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, y mae pawb yn cytuno bod eu hangen.

**Nick Bourne:** O ran addysg uwch, soniodd y Prif Weinidog am y rheswm pam yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu cymharu sefydliadau unigol. Mae rhai sefydliadau sy'n gwario llawer, a rhai sy'n gwario llai—dyna pam y dylid defnyddio'r cyfartaledd. Yna, nid ydych yn dewis a dethol; yr ydych yn cymryd cyfartaledd y tair cenedl wahanol, sef yr Alban, Lloegr a Chymru. Hynny yw'r dull teg o fynd ati. Gofynnwch i sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru a'u myfyrwyr. Yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau bargaen dda ar gyfer pobl Cymru, a dyna sut yr ydym yn gwneud hynny—drwy ddefnyddio'r cyfartaledd.

O ran yr ail bwynt, nid wyf byth wedi clywed ymrwymiad y bydd arian yn y gyllideb. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans fel y gallwn godi hyd at safon hyd yn oed yr awdurdod gwaethaf yn Lloegr—a gwelaf eich bod yn derbyn cymorth gan y Gweinidog Cyllid. Yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau

Minister. I am keen to ensure that we make the necessary headway. You have taken one small step in that direction, but there is much more to do, and we need a commitment, not just orally, but with money in the budget.

**The First Minister:** You have not addressed my point on the education comparison between Wales and the different regions of England, with their sharply different costs. It is clear from the English figures that there is a sharp divide between the cost of providing higher education in the south, south-east, and eastern regions, and the midlands, north and south-west. There is no reason to suppose that the costs of providing higher education in Wales are anything like those in eastern, southern and south-eastern England; you have to get an accurate, like-for-like comparison. The like-for-like comparators are far more likely to be found in the regions—which are the majority of England—where you can see from the common pattern that costs are close to each other in all those other regions of England. There is no reason to suppose that the costs that higher education institutions in Wales face are anything like those in London, the south-east, or the east. You would therefore be giving money to Welsh higher education institutions on the basis of costs that they do not face. That is the problem.

On the ambulance trust, in awarding it the £16 million to get access to 100 additional vehicles, we expect to see those digested with the reform that should go along with them to make best use of those 100 vehicles. I am sure that the trust will come back and seek access to the generous health capital budget line that Brian Gibbons has available to him. It is up to the trust to prove the case, and, when the case is made, I am sure that it will be considered sympathetically. However, I do not believe that we are setting a 10-year budget today, although the health capital budget is extensive. The trust has access to that, it must bid against it, and the proof of the pudding will be how well it uses the first lot of 100 vehicles.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** To continue the education theme, in June this

ein bod yn gwneud y cynnydd sydd ei angen. Yr ydych wedi cymryd un cam bach i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, ond mae llawer mwy i'w wneud, ac mae arnom angen ymrwymiad; nid ar lafar yn unig, ond gydag arian yn y gyllideb.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydych wedi rhoi sylw i'm pwynt ynghylch y gymhariaeth o ran addysg rhwng Cymru a gwahanol ranbarthau Lloegr, gyda'u costau sy'n dra gwahanol. Mae'n amlwg yn ôl ffigurau Lloegr fod cryn wahaniaeth rhwng cost darparu addysg uwch yn rhanbarthau'r de, y de-ddwyrain a'r dwyrain, a'r canolbarth, y gogledd a'r de-orllewin. Nid oes rheswm dros dybio bod costau darparu addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn debyg o gwbl i'r rhai yn nwyrain, de a de-ddwyrain Lloegr; rhaid ichi gael cymhariaeth gywir rhwng dwy sefyllfa gyffelyb. Mae'r cymaryddion rhwng dau beth tebyg yn llawer mwy tebygol o ddod o'r rhanbarthau—sy'n fwyafrif yn Lloegr—lle y gallwch weld oddi wrth y patrwm cyffredin fod y costau'n agos at ei gilydd yn yr holl ranbarthau eraill hynny yn Lloegr. Nid oes dim rheswm dros gymryd bod y costau a wynebwr gan sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn debyg o gwbl i rai Llundain, y de-ddwyrain, na'r dwyrain. Felly, byddech yn rhoi arian i sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru ar sail costau nad ydynt yn eu hwynebu. Dyna'r problem.

O ran yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, wrth roi'r £16 miliwn iddi gael 100 cerbyd ychwanegol, yr ydym yn disgwyl gweld y rhain yn ennill eu plwyf ochr yn ochr â'r diwygiadau a ddylai ddigwydd yr un pryd er mwyn sicrhau'r defnydd gorau o'r 100 cerbyd hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y daw'r ymddiriedolaeth yn ôl a cheisio cael mynediad at y llinell hael o ran cyllideb cyfalaf iechyd sydd ar gael i Brian Gibbons. Lle'r ymddiriedolaeth yw profi'r ddadl, a phan wneir hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr yr ystyrir ef gyda chydymdeimlad. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf ein bod yn pennu cyllideb 10 mlynedd heddiw, er bod y gyllideb cyfalaf iechyd yn helaeth. Mae honno ar gael i'r ymddiriedolaeth, rhaid iddi wneud cais am arian o'r gyllideb, a'r prawf fydd y ffordd y bydd yn defnyddio'r 100 cerbyd cyntaf.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Gan barhau â thema addysg, ym mis Mehefin eleni, addawodd

year, your Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills promised £10.6 million of additional money to fund the outcome of the Graham review, which is the review into funding part-time students in Wales. Can you confirm that your current draft budget proposals contain additional funding of £10.6 million for part-time students? Given that there is already £4.1 million in the line, do you agree that it is not £10.6 million, but £6.5 million that is genuinely new money?

2.20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I will ask Sue Essex to write to you on the detail of the £4.1 million, the £6.8 million and the £10.4 million, because that is not my field. However, it is important to note that we are committed to providing additional sums to take account of the recommendations of the Graham review. It was an undertaking that we gave in the middle of our budget discussions last year, and I know of no reason for questioning the outcome of the Graham review on the funding of part-time students. As far as I am aware, we intend to make provision for it in the budget, which I hope we can agree before many weeks have gone by.

**Michael German:** The reason for my asking is because I would like to know whether this is additional or existing funding. That is the simple question. We know already that, sometimes, money gets announced more than once and gets spun around. I will quote to you the words of your Minister from the verbatim report of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee:

‘we are confident that we have £10.6 million to fund the outcomes of the review...I will respond...in the autumn on how we are going to utilise that additional expenditure’.

If you found that that £10.6 million ‘additional’ expenditure was not additional, and that we were actually sweeping up money and taking it from elsewhere, I wonder whether you would not be satisfied with those remarks.

**The First Minister:** Mike, you slipped a new little Mickey Finn in there—if I may put it that way—by saying, ‘and taking it from

eich Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau £10.6 miliwn o arian ychwanegol i ariannu canlyniad adolygiad Graham, sef yr adolygiad i ariannu myfyrwyr rhan-amser yng Nghymru. A allwch gadarnhau bod eich cynigion presennol ar gyfer y gyllideb ddrafft yn cynnwys cyllid ychwanegol o £10.6 miliwn ar gyfer myfyrwyr rhan-amser? O ystyried bod £4.1 miliwn yn y llinell eisoes, a gytunwch nad £10.6 miliwn, ond £6.5 miliwn, sy’n arian newydd mewn gwirionedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gofynnaf i Sue Essex ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch manylion y £4.1 miliwn, y £6.8 miliwn a’r £10.4 miliwn, oherwydd nid fy maes i yw hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae’n bwysig nodi ein bod yn ymrwymedig i ddarparu symiau ychwanegol er mwyn ymateb i argymhellion adolygiad Graham. Yr oedd yn ymrwymiad a roesom yng nghanol ein trafodaethau ar y gyllideb y llynedd, ac ni wn am ddim rheswm dros gwestiynu canlyniad adolygiad Graham ar ariannu myfyrwyr rhan-amser. Hyd y gwn i, yr ydym yn bwriadu darparu ar ei gyfer yn y gyllideb, a gobeithiaf y gallwn gytuno ar honno cyn i lawer o wythnosau fynd heibio.

**Michael German:** Y rheswm pam y gofynnais yw oherwydd yr hoffwn wybod a yw hwn yn gyllid ychwanegol ynteu’n gyllid sy’n bodoli eisoes. Dyna’r cwestiwn syml. Gwyddom eisoes fod arian yn cael ei gyhoeddi fwy nag unwaith weithiau ac yn cael ei ymestyn. Dyfynnaf eiriau eich Gweinidog o adroddiad gair am air y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau:

yr ydym yn hyderus bod gennym £10.6 miliwn i ariannu canlyniadau’r adolygiad...fe ymatebaf...yn yr hydref ynghylch sut yr ydym am ddefnyddio’r gwariant ychwanegol hwnnw.

Pe baech yn gweld nad oedd y £10.6 miliwn hwnnw o wariant ‘ychwanegol’ yn ychwanegol, a’n bod mewn gwirionedd yn mynd ag arian o rywle arall, tybed a fydddech yn anfodlon ar y sylwadau hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mike, ychwanegasoch Mickey Finn bach newydd—os caf ei gyfleu felly—drwy ddweud ‘mynd ag arian o rywle

elsewhere'. I will ask Sue to include a consideration of your allegation in her reply to you on the details of additional money, new money and so forth.

**Michael German:** I return to this whole issue of higher education funding, because it is crucial. We have already heard your answer about comparators. Is it not the case, First Minister, that we were promised in last year's budget round that we would start to close the funding gap, and we were given three or four like-for-like comparators between English and Welsh universities? We had four different comparators, all of which came from your officials, and on each of those, either we are falling back or the gap is getting wider. I understand why you are now fishing around for a new comparator: it is because the four that you had the last time do not give you the answer that you want, so you want to look for something different. Will you reassure me that you will not discard those four comparators that were so important to us last year? Now that we have measured ourselves against those four comparators, we see that we are actually getting worse and not better. Further, can you reassure me that the funding gap between our Welsh universities—which deserve to be well funded to meet our country's future needs, to ensure that we have properly skilled and trained people—will be funded properly by us? Those four comparators were well researched and well thought out, but they showed that we were not making the improvement that you thought that we would make.

**The First Minister:** We certainly intended, and continue to intend, to close any funding gap that shows up in any fair comparison between our higher education institutions and those in England. You used the expression 'fishing around', and you like to deprecate anything that the Government does, which is fair enough, but nothing could be further from the truth. I can give you an absolute assurance that all we are seeking to do is get accurate and fair like-for-like comparisons. That seems to be the right way of doing it. You cannot possibly seek to close a gap between institutions that do not have to bear the same costs as universities in the south, south-east and eastern regions of England. If

arall'. Gofynnaf i Sue ystyried eich honiad wrth ymateb ichi ynghylch manylion yr arian ychwanegol, yr arian newydd ac yn y blaen.

**Michael German:** Dychwelaf at holl fater cyllid addysg uwch, oherwydd y mae'n hollbwysig. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed eich ateb am gymaryddion. Onid yw'n wir, Brif Weinidog, ein bod wedi cael addewid yng nghylch cyllideb y llynedd y byddem yn dechrau cau'r bwlch cyllido, a'n bod wedi cael tri neu bedwar cymharydd rhwng pethau tebyg rhwng prifysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr? Cawsom bedwar cymharydd gwahanol, oll gan eich swyddogion, ac o ran pob un o'r rheini, yr ydym naill ai'n mynd ar ei hôl hi neu mae'r bwlch yn ehangu. Deallaf pam yr ydych bellach yn chwilota am gymharydd newydd: oherwydd nad yw'r pedwar a oedd gennych y tro diwethaf yn rhoi'r ateb sydd arnoch ei eisiau, felly yr ydych am edrych am rywbeth gwahanol. A wnewch fy sicrhau na wnewch fwrw heibio'r pedwar cymharydd hynny a oedd mor bwysig inni y llynedd? Gan ein bod bellach wedi'n mesur ein hunain yn erbyn y pedwar cymharydd hynny, gwelwn ein bod yn gwaethygu mewn gwirionedd, yn hytrach na gwella. Yn ogystal, a allwch fy sicrhau y caiff y bwlch cyllido rhwng ein prifysgolion yng Nghymru—sy'n haeddu cael eu hariannu'n dda er mwyn diwallu anghenion dyfodol ein gwlad, i sicrhau bod gennym bobl sydd â'r sgiliau a'r hyfforddiant priodol—ei ariannu'n briodol gennym? Yr oedd y pedwar cymharydd hynny'n ffrwyth ymchwil dda ac ystyried gofalus, ond yr oeddent yn dangos nad oeddem yn cyflawni'r gwelliant yr oeddech yn meddwl y byddem yn ei gyflawni.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn sicr, yr oeddem yn bwriadu cau unrhyw fwlch cyllido sydd i'w weld mewn unrhyw gymhariaeth deg rhwng ein sefydliadau addysg uwch a rhai Lloegr—ac yr ydym yn dal i fwriadu gwneud hynny. Defnyddiasoch yr ymadrodd 'chwilota', ac yr ydych yn hoff o fychanu unrhyw beth a wna'r Llywodraeth, sy'n ddigon teg, ond nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Gallaf roi sicrwydd llwyr ichi mai'r unig beth yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud yw cael cymariaethau cywir, teg, rhwng sefydliadau cyffelyb. Ymddengys mai dyna'r ffordd iawn o wneud hyn. Mae'n amhosibl ceisio cau bwlch rhwng sefydliadau nad ydynt yn gorfod wynebu'r un costau â phrifysgolion rhanbarthau de, de-ddwyrain a dwyrain Lloegr.

you did that, all the universities in northern England, the midlands and south-west England, such as those at Bristol, Exeter and the University of the West of England, would be seeking to close the gap with the universities in the eastern region or London and the south-east of England. England would then have to increase vastly the amount of money given to midlands and northern universities, or hugely cut back the amount of money given to the universities with these high costs in the south-east of England. We know that our universities do not face the costs of those in the south-east of England, so all that we are trying to do is get an accurate, like-for-like comparison between our universities and those that face the same cost base across the border.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** While the opposition parties seem to concentrate on the issue of higher education—and, of course, I agree that it must be properly funded—do you agree that it is just as important that we give equal consideration to the other areas of education, such as schools, the foundation phase and the further education sector?

**The First Minister:** That is important. The further education sector provides a very high level of contribution in terms of qualifications and in how those qualified emerge into the economy in Wales. In the higher education sector, we are pleased to see the public announcements not only of big capital expenditure programmes, such as the University of Glamorgan's £30 million-worth new campus in Cardiff, or Bangor's £55 million-worth expenditure on halls of residence, its environmental science building and others and so forth, but also the PET scanner in Cardiff, and the first ever Nobel prize winner to be hired by our higher education sector, with Cardiff University's announcement that Dr Robert Huber from the Max Planck Institute of Biochemistry in Germany is joining its staff. That is the first time that a Nobel prize winner has joined the staff of a university in Wales. We have a lot to celebrate in the higher education sector in Wales and perhaps we should try to ensure that people lift their eyes a bit and celebrate, along with everyone else in higher education.

Pe byddech yn gwneud hynny, byddai holl brifysgolion gogledd Lloegr, canolbarth a de-orllewin Lloegr, megis rhai Bryste, Caerwysg a Phrifysgol Gorllewin Lloegr, yn ceisio cau'r bwllch gyda phrifysgolion rhanbarth y dwyrain neu Lundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr. Yna, byddai'n rhaid i Loegr roi cynnydd aruthrol yn yr arian a roddir i brifysgolion canolbarth a gogledd Lloegr, neu gwtogi'n fawr yr arian a roddir i'r prifysgolion â'r costau uchel hyn yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr. Gwyddom nad yw ein prifysgolion yn wynebu'r un costau â'r rhai yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, felly y cyfan yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud yw cael cymhariaeth gywir rhwng ein prifysgolion a rhai cyffelyb sydd â'r un math o gostau dros y ffin.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Tra bo'r gwrthbleidiau i'w gweld yn canolbwyntio ar fater addysg uwch—ac, wrth gwrs, cytunaf fod rhaid ariannu hynny'n briodol—a gytunwch ei bod yr un mor bwysig inni roi'r un ystyriaeth i feysydd eraill mewn addysg, megis ysgolion, y cyfnod sylfaen a'r sector addysg bellach?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'r sector addysg bellach yn cyfrannu llawer iawn o ran cymwysterau a sut y mae'r rhai sy'n cymhwyso'n dod yn rhan o economi Cymru. Yn y sector addysg uwch, yr ydym yn falch o weld cyhoeddiadau nid yn unig ynghylch rhaglenni gwariant cyfalaf mawr, megis campws newydd gwerth £30 miliwn Prifysgol Morgannwg yng Nghaerdydd, neu wariant gwerth £55 miliwn Bangor ar neuaddau preswyl, ei adeilad gwyddor amgylchedd ac eraill ac yn y blaen, ond yr ydym hefyd yn falch o'r sganiwr PET yng Nghaerdydd, a'r enillydd gwobr Nobel cyntaf i gael swydd yn ein sector addysg uwch, wrth i Brifysgol Caerdydd gyhoeddi bod Dr Robert Huber o Sefydliad Biocemeg Max Planck yn yr Almaen yn ymuno â'i staff. Dyna'r tro cyntaf i enillydd gwobr Nobel ymuno â staff prifysgol yng Nghymru. Mae gennym lawer i'w ddatlu yn y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ac efallai y dylem geisio sicrhau bod pobl yn codi eu golygon rywfaint ac yn dathlu, ynghyd â phawb arall mewn addysg uwch.

### Targedau heb eu Cyflawni

## Unmet Targets

**Q2 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on any Welsh Assembly Government targets not met? OAQ2007(FM)

**The First Minister:** Targets can be overshot and, sometimes, they are undershot. You will be pleased to know, Jocelyn, that our original proposal to invest £560 million to improve school buildings will be overshot by £70 million. Our targets for flu immunisation in 2004 were not reached; they were undershot, but, fortunately, they were overshot in 2005. This winter, we have a target of immunising 70 per cent of people aged over 65—we have raised the target. I urge all those eligible—and I declare an interest—to ensure that they take up the help that is on offer.

**Jocelyn Davies:** We know that some of your targets on the economy may turn out to be aspirations rather than targets. Do you accept that the proposed expansion of the Quinn Group on the LG site in Newport, with up to 1,000 new jobs, is an opportunity that we should not miss? Are you as concerned as I am that these jobs may go to Derby unless your Government pulls its finger out?

**The First Minister:** I am pleased that you mentioned the issue of jobs in Wales, because 131,000 more people are in work now than when the Assembly came into existence. That is an increase of 11 per cent, and we have shown England a clean pair of heels there—I say that to help Plaid Cymru to get its usual compass focus, across the border, in order. I think that there has been an increase of 7 per cent in the UK as a whole and 11 per cent in Wales. That is a major achievement for all Welsh businesses, voluntary bodies, and the private and public sector bodies that are employing those people. As regards the question about Newport and Derby, you need to write to Andrew Davies or to me with the details of that.

**Jonathan Morgan:** One of the big challenges facing the ambulance service is being able to meet the Government's target turnaround time. You may be aware that the Minister for Health and Social Services

**C2 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw rai o dargedau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru nad ydynt wedi'u cyflawni? OAQ2007(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Weithiau, gellir rhagori ar darged, dro arall, methu â'i gyrraedd. Byddwch yn falch o glywed, Jocelyn, ein bod am ragori o £70 miliwn ar ein cynnig gwreiddiol i fuddsoddi £560 miliwn i wella adeiladau ysgolion. Ni chyrrhaeddwyd ein targedau ar gyfer brechu rhag ffliw yn 2004, ond yn ffodus, yn 2005, rhagorwyd ar y targedau. Y gaeaf hwn, mae gennym darged o frechu 70 y cant o bobl dros 65 mlwydd oed—yr ydym wedi codi'r targed. Anogaf bawb sy'n gymwys—ac yr wyf yn datgan buddiant—i sicrhau eu bod yn manteisio ar y cymorth sy'n cael ei gynnig.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Gwyddom fod posibilrwydd mai dyheadau, ac nid targedau, fydd rhai o'ch targedau o ran yr economi. A dderbyniwch fod yr ehangu arfaethedig gan Grŵp Quinn ar safle LG yng Nghasnewydd, gyda hyd at 1,000 o swyddi newydd, yn gyfle na ddylem ei gollu? A ydych mor bryderus â minnau y gallai'r swyddi hyn fynd i Derby oni fydd eich Llywodraeth yn tynnu ei hewinedd o'r blew?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi sôn am swyddi yng Nghymru, oherwydd y mae 131,000 yn fwy o bobl mewn swyddi heddiw na phan ddaeth y Cynulliad i fodolaeth. Mae hynny'n gynydd o 11 y cant, ac yr ydym wedi rhagori ar Loegr yn hynny o beth—dywedaf hynny i helpu Plaid Cymru i ffocysu eu cwmpawd fel y byddant fel arfer, dros y ffin. Credaf fod cynnydd o 7 y cant wedi bod yn gyffredinol yn y DU ac 11 y cant yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n llwyddiant sylweddol i holl fusnesau, cyrff gwirfoddol, a chyrff sector preifat a chyhoeddus Cymru, sy'n cyflogi'r bobl hynny. O ran y cwestiwn am Gasnewydd a Derby, bydd angen ichi ysgrifennu at Andrew Davies neu ataf fi gyda'r manylion ynghylch hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Un o'r heriau mawr sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yw gallu cyrraedd targed y Llywodraeth o ran yr amser i ddychwelyd ar y ffordd. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol ei bod yn ofynnol gan y Gweinidog



requires that ambulances are able to leave accident-and-emergency departments within 15 minutes—that is the target. In fact, the average turnaround time is somewhere in the region of 24 minutes. In your experience, where does the problem lie? Is it a lack of available beds in the acute sector to transfer patients to, or is it a lack of consultant support in accident-and-emergency departments to make the appropriate arrangements?

**The First Minister:** Many of our hospitals have started to give a great deal more attention to this matter in the past two years. Given the crisis that occurred two years ago, after the introduction of the new out-of-hours GP service, there were chaotic conditions, for about six or seven months, in some of the busiest accident-and-emergency departments, particularly at the University Hospital of Wales and the Royal Gwent Hospital. There have been major reorganisations, including the setting up of medical assessment units so that people are accepted and triaged much more quickly by a nurse and then a doctor. They can then be moved to a more appropriate place, away from blocking the accident-and-emergency department and preventing ambulances from achieving their turnaround times. For family reasons, I had to sit in an accident-and-emergency department for about three hours on Thursday night last week, and I was interested to see that things were far superior than they were in the winter of 2004-05 after the new out-of-hours service came in.

**Kirsty Williams:** To achieve your targets on the improvement of people's health, you have to ensure that citizens have access to health services. It is widely reported in my constituency that the consultation on the local health board proposals to close in-patient beds at Builth, Bronllys, Knighton and Llanidloes hospitals has been postponed until after next May's elections, following the intervention of the Minister for health and his officials. Will you ensure that they intervene to ensure that the local health board does not close any of those hospitals by stealth in the intervening period, that the number of beds is maintained at those facilities, and that all out-patient clinics remain operational?

dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ambiwlansys allu gadael adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys o fewn 15 munud—dyna'r targed. Mewn gwirionedd, tua 24 munud yw'r amser ar gyfartaledd. Yn eich profiad chi, ym mhle y mae'r broblem? A oes diffyg gwelyau ar gael yn y sector aciwt i drosglwyddo cleifion iddynt, ynteu a oes diffyg cefnogaeth gan ymgynghorwyr mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys i wneud y trefniadau priodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llawer o'n hysbytai wedi dechrau rhoi llawer mwy o sylw i'r mater hwn yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. O ystyried yr argyfwng a ddigwyddodd ddwy flynedd yn ôl, ar ôl cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth meddygon teulu newydd y tu allan i oriau, bu'n draed moch, am tua chwe neu saith mis, mewn rhai o'r adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys prysuraf, yn enwedig yn Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru ac Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent. Mae ad-drefnu sylweddol wedi bod, gan gynnwys sefydlu unedau asesu meddygol fel y caiff pobl eu derbyn a'u brysbennu'n llawer cyflymach gan nyrs ac yna gan feddyg. Yna, gellir eu symud i fan mwy priodol, fel nad ydynt yn achosi tagfa yn yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac yn atal ambiwlansys rhag cyflawni eu nod o ran yr amser i ddychwelyd ar y ffordd. Am resymau teuluol, bu'n rhaid imi eistedd mewn adran damweiniau ac achosion brys am tua tair awr nos Iau yr wythnos diwethaf, ac yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol gweld bod pethau'n llawer gwell nag a oeddent yng ngeaef 2004-05 ar ôl cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth newydd y tu allan i oriau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Er mwyn cyflawni eich targedau o ran gwella iechyd pobl, rhaid ichi sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd ar gael i ddinasyddion. Dywedir gan lawer yn fy etholaeth fod yr ymgynghori ar gynigion y bwrdd iechyd lleol i gau gwelyau cleifion preswyl yn ysbytai Llanfair-ym-Muallt, Bronllys, Trefyclo a Llanidloes, wedi'i ohirio tan ar ôl yr etholiadau fis Mai nesaf, yn sgîl ymyriad y Gweinidog dros iechyd a'i swyddogion. A wnewch sicrhau eu bod yn ymyrryd i sicrhau nad yw'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yn cau dim un o'r ysbytai hyn yn llechwraidd cyn hynny, y cedwir nifer y gwelyau yn y cyfleusterau hynny, a bod pob clinig cleifion allanol yn parhau'n weithredol?

**The First Minister:** You are chucking allegations around like Mike German was doing five minutes ago, but he then withdrew his allegation about two seconds later when he asked his follow-up question. I do not know of any possible intervention by a health Minister in relation to proposals that have not yet gone firm from the local health community level. The Minister for health has a particular appellate role in determining any disputes over proposals for changes in health services that are not agreed at the local level.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wrthi'n gwneud honiadau fel yr oedd Mike German yn gwneud bum munud yn ôl, ond yna fe dynnodd ei honiad yn ôl tua dwy eiliad yn ddiweddarach wrth ofyn ei ail gwestiwn. Ni wn am ddim ymyriad posibl gan Weinidog dros iechyd ynghylch cynigion sydd heb eu cadarnhau o du'r gymuned iechyd leol. Mae gan y Gweinidog dros iechyd swyddogaeth apeliadol benodol wrth benderfynu ynghylch unrhyw anghydfodau ynglŷn â chynigion ar gyfer newidiadau mewn gwasanaethau iechyd sydd heb eu cytuno ar y lefel leol.

2.30 p.m.

If the community health council does not approve a particular proposal for significant changes in health services, such as the closure of a ward or of a hospital, then the Minister has to determine that as the appeal body. He must therefore stay out of that process. I do not know where this allegation comes from, but you ought to think more seriously before throwing these allegations around. They are easy to throw around—you hope that mud will stick in the last four to five months before the election, but it is unworthy of you.

Os nad yw'r cyngor iechyd cymuned yn cymeradwyo cynnig penodol ar gyfer newidiadau o bwys mewn gwasanaethau iechyd, megis cau ward neu ysbyty, yna rhaid i'r Gweinidog benderfynu ar hynny fel y corff apêl. Rhaid iddo gadw allan o'r broses honno felly. Ni wn o ble y daw'r honiad hwn, ond dylech feddwl yn fwy difrifol cyn mynd ati i wneud yr honiadau hyn. Maent yn hawdd eu gwneud—eich gobaith yw y bydd y pardduo'n tycio yn y pedwar i bum mis olaf cyn yr etholiad, ond mae hynny'n annheilwng ar eich rhan.

### **Gweithgareddau Chwaraeon a Hamdden Sport and Leisure Activities**

**Q3 Eleanor Burnham:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to improve access rights to water in Wales for sport and leisure activities? OAQ1985(FM)

**C3 Eleanor Burnham:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i wella hawliau mynediad i ddŵr yng Nghymru ar gyfer gweithgareddau chwaraeon a hamdden? OAQ1985(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have a new strategic plan for improving public access to inland and coastal waters in Wales being developed by Environment Agency Wales at our request. The plan will help to identify opportunities for new access to water and how those opportunities can be progressed.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cynllun strategol newydd ar gyfer gwella mynediad i'r cyhoedd at ddyfroedd mewndirol ac arfordirol yng Nghymru yn cael ei ddatblygu gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru wedi i ni ofyn iddi wneud hynny. Bydd y cynllun yn helpu i ganfod cyfleoedd ar gyfer mynediad newydd at ddŵr a sut y gellir hyrwyddo'r cyfleoedd hynny.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Carwyn Jones announced that on 25 May—it is now November and in a letter I have had from him, dated 6 November, he tells me that it will not be available until next year. Will you undertake to use the powers that, I understand, the Welsh Assembly

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cyhoeddodd Carwyn Jones hynny ar 25 Mai—erbyn hyn mae'n fis Tachwedd ac mewn llythyr a gefais oddi wrtho, dyddiedig 6 Tachwedd, dywed wrthyf na fydd ar gael tan y flwyddyn nesaf. A wnewch addo defnyddio'r pwerau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn barod, yn ôl a ddeallaf, yn

Government already has, rather than wait until next year, because many associations, including the Welsh Canoeing Association, are desperate not just to canoe as they can in Llangollen—which is absolutely wonderful—but to take advantage of an arrangement such as in Scotland, where all waterways can be accessed for canoeing?

**The First Minister:** My canoeing days are long over; I took it up during my mid-life crisis about 20 years ago. It was much cheaper than buying a BMW or an expensive motorbike. Although those days are long gone, sadly, I understand and have nostalgic memories of just how much fun it is to canoe down waterways such as the River Wye—as far as I know, it is legal to canoe there. We are delighted that competitive canoeing has returned to the river Dee at Llangollen after a two-year break.

On your point about the Scottish situation—the Lib Dems are almost as obsessed with Scotland as Plaid Cymru is with England—it is important that we remember that local agreements brokered between canoeists and anglers and so on with the Environment Agency and with certain businesses that supply the equipment are, in general, successful. We know there was a two-year break on the River Dee, which was regrettable, but we can all celebrate the fact that that problem has now been solved, and local agreements are being brokered all over Wales to try to solve this long-standing area of dispute between anglers and canoeists.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ym mis Mehefin, gwnaethoch gynnal trafodaethau ag Awdurdod Porthladd Caerdydd a Chymdeithas Canwio Cymru ynghylch creu cyfleuster canwio o safon Olympaidd ym mae Caerdydd ar gyfer Gemau Olympaidd 2012. Pa gamau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd ers hynny i hyrwyddo'r prosiect?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cadw golwg ar y prosiect hwn, a fydd yn dod â chlod mawr i Gymru ac yn darparu cyfleoedd hyfforddi a chystadlu canwio dŵr garw nad ydynt ar gael ym Mhrydain Fawr ar hyn o bryd. Gallwch ei wneud yn Nhryweryn, ond nid yw hi yr un mor rhwydd i sefydlu cwrs slalom yno ag ydyw mewn cyfleuster pwrpasol. Felly, yr

hytrach nag aros tan y flwyddyn nesaf, oherwydd y mae llawer o gyrff, gan gynnwys Cymdeithas Ganwa Cymru, yn awyddus iawn nid yn unig i ganwio fel y gallant yn Llangollen—sydd yn hollol wych—ond i fanteisio ar drefniant fel a geir yn yr Alban, lle y gellir mynd i ganwio ar bob dyfrffordd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae fy nyddiau canwio i ar ben ers talwm; ymgymerais â'r gamp yn ystod fy argyfwng canol oed ryw 20 mlynedd yn ôl. Yr oedd yn llawer rhatach na phrynu BMW neu feic modur drud. Er bod y dyddiau hynny wedi hen fynd, ysywaeth, yr wyf yn deall ac mae gennyf atgofion melys am gymaint o hwyl ydyw canwio i lawr dyfrffyrdd fel Afon Gwy—hyd y gwn, gellir canwio yno'n gyfreithlon. Yr ydym ar ben ein digon bod canwio cystadleuol wedi dychwelyd i afon Dyfrdwy yn Llangollen ar ôl bwllch o ddwy flynedd.

O ran eich pwynt am sefyllfa'r Alban—mae gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol bron cymaint o obsesiwn â'r Alban ag sydd gan Blaid Cymru â Lloegr—mae'n bwysig inni gofio bod cytundebau lleol a wneir rhwng canw-wyr a physgotwyr ac ati ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a rhai busnesau sydd yn cyflenwi'r cyfarpar, ar y cyfan, yn llwyddo. Gwyddom fod bwllch o ddwy flynedd wedi bod ar Afon Dyfrdwy, a oedd yn bechod, ond gallwn i gyd ddathlu'r ffaith bod y broblem honno bellach wedi'i datrys, a bod cytundebau lleol yn digwydd ledled Cymru i geisio datrys yr hen destun ffrae hwn rhwng pysgotwyr a chanw-wyr.

**Owen John Thomas:** In June, you held talks with the Cardiff Harbour Authority and the Welsh Canoeing Association about creating an Olympic-standard canoeing facility in Cardiff bay for the Olympic Games in 2012. What steps have you taken since then to promote the project?

**The First Minister:** I keep a close eye on this project, which will bring great plaudits to Wales and will provide training and competing opportunities in white-water canoeing that are not currently available in Great Britain. You can do it at Tryweryn, but it is not as easy to set up a slalom course there as it would be in a custom-built facility. We hope that this scheme will go

ydyd yn gobeithio yr aiff y cynllun hwn yn ei flaen, ond mae'n anffodus bod y costau yn debygol o godi o £4 miliwn i £7 miliwn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** First Minister, I, too, hope that that scheme goes ahead. However, although canoeists should be allowed more access to our waterways, we must also ensure that parts of the river are protected for fishing, and for environmental reasons. Hand in hand with improving access, we need to ensure that our rivers are clean and pollution free. How are you and your Government working with the relevant bodies to ensure that our rivers and waterways are regularly monitored and supervised in this regard?

**The First Minister:** You raise the point that Eleanor perhaps ignored, which is that there is a genuine conflict between anglers and canoeists. That has been resolved on the River Wye, as far as I know, because navigation rights on that river go back a few hundred years, but that is not the case elsewhere. Disputes do occur and, occasionally, real hostility breaks out. We have to resolve that by having local agreements, and we have been successful in promoting those through the Sports Council for Wales, Environment Agency Wales and the hirers of equipment, as well as the two sports bodies. The more access people have to enjoy sports that take place in the river or on the riverbank, such as angling, the better, as far as I am concerned. It is a very healthy form of recreation.

ahead, but it is unfortunate that the costs are likely to rise from £4 million to £7 million.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf finnau'n gobeithio yr aiff y cynllun yn ei flaen. Fodd bynnag, er y dylid caniatáu mwy o fynediad i ganŵ-wyr at ein dyfrffyrdd, rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd fod rhannau o'r afon yn cael eu gwarchod ar gyfer pysgota, ac am resymau amgylcheddol. Yn ogystal â gwella mynediad, mae angen inni sicrhau bod ein hafonydd yn lân ac nad oes llygredd ynddynt. Sut yr ydych chi a'ch Llywodraeth yn gweithio gyda'r cyrff perthnasol i sicrhau bod ein hafonydd a'n dyfrffyrdd yn cael eu monitro a'u goruchwyllo'n rheolaidd yn hyn o beth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn codi'r pwynt a anwybyddwyd gan Eleanor efallai, sef bod gwrthdaro gwirioneddol rhwng pysgotwyr a chanŵ-wyr. Mae hynny wedi'i ddatrys ar Afon Gwy, hyd y gwn, oherwydd y mae hawliau mordwyo'n bodoli ar yr afon honno ers rhai cannoedd o flynyddoedd, ond nid felly y mae mewn mannau eraill. Fe geir anghydfodau ac, yn achlysurol, ceir gwir elyniaeth. Rhaid inni ddatrys hynny drwy gael cytundebau lleol, ac yr ydym wedi hyrwyddo'r rhain yn llwyddiannus drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru a rhai sy'n llogi cyfarpar, yn ogystal â'r ddau gorff chwaraeon. O'm safbwynt i, gorau po fwyaf o fynediad a gaiff pobl i fwynhau chwaraeon sy'n digwydd yn yr afon, neu ar lan yr afon, fel pysgota. Mae'n ffurf iach iawn ar adloniant.

#### **Datblygu Polisiâu ar gyfer Gogledd Cymru Developing Policies for North Wales**

**Q4 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement about the development of Welsh Assembly Government policies for north Wales? OAQ1982(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have been outstandingly successful, with Conwy County Borough Council, especially in its earlier guise, in getting a new Ysgol John Bright, a new Ysgol Dyffryn Conwy and getting Ysgol Aberconwy reconstructed at a cost of £58.5 million. A further £9 million has now been allocated to be spent on Ysgol

**C4 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygu polisiâu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y gogledd? OAQ1982(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi bod yn eithriadol o lwyddiannus, gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy, yn enwedig yn ei ffurf gynharach, wrth gael Ysgol John Bright newydd, Ysgol Dyffryn Conwy newydd a sicrhau ailadeiladu Ysgol Aberconwy ar gost o £58.5 miliwn. Mae £9 miliwn arall wedi'i ddyrannu'n awr i'w wario ar Ysgol Emrys ap

Emrys ap Iwan and Ysgol Eirias and Ysgol Bryn Elian. Those are outstanding examples of heavy expenditure on modernising schools, where the council knew exactly where it wanted to spend the money and why.

**Denise Idris Jones:** It was a pleasure for us both to be at the opening of the refurbished Ysgol Aberconwy. Do you agree that supporting the voluntary sector is a key policy of this administration that is helping to strengthen communities across Wales? Will you join me in commending the credit union in Llandudno Junction, and particularly David Williams, the staff, volunteers and local people, on their hard work in making the venture such a local success, empowering many local residents to start an account and make savings—some for the first time—and even assisting small local businesses? It has been so successful that it has now moved to new premises in the HSBC bank. I am sure that you are looking forward to the official opening soon.

**The First Minister:** Yes. The credit union movement has been much slower to take off in Wales than in Ireland, the USA and other countries where the banking sector has not been as healthy and universal in its provision. The credit unions are now catching up in Wales and are doing well. With the crisis over the Farepak hamper savings scheme having gone phut, sadly for all of the families involved, people will be thinking much more about using credit unions rather than these private hamper and Christmas clubs in the future, and I think that credit unions will provide a far safer home for people's savings for Christmas or other purposes.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Fel ymateb i'r sefyllfa economaidd ac fel paratoad ar gyfer y rhaglen gydgyfeirio, mae dwy ardal wedi'u hadnabod yng Nghymru gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer sylw arbennig. Un yw ardal strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd a'r llall yw ardal cynllun Môn a Menai. Mae £150 miliwn wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd ond nid oes arian wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer cynllun Môn a Menai. Pam mae gwahaniaeth?

Iwan ac Ysgol Eirias ac Ysgol Bryn Elian. Mae'r rheini'n enghreifftiau eithriadol o wariant mawr ar foderneiddio ysgolion, lle y gwyddai'r cyngor yn union ble yr oedd arno eisiau gwario'r arian a pham.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr oedd yn bleser i ni'n dau fod yn agoriad Ysgol Aberconwy ar ei newydd wedd. A gytunwch fod cefnogi'r sector gwirfoddol yn bolisi allweddol gan y weinyddiaeth hon, sy'n helpu i gryfhau cymunedau ledled Cymru? A ymunwch â mi i gymeradwyo'r undeb credyd yng Nghyffordd Llandudno, ac yn enwedig David Williams, y staff, y gwirfoddolwyr a'r bobl leol, am eu gwaith caled wrth sicrhau bod y fenter yn gymaint o lwyddiant lleol, gan alluogi llawer o drigolion lleol i agor cyfrif a dechrau cynilo—rhaf am y tro cyntaf—a hyd yn oed cynorthwyo busnesau bach lleol? Mae wedi bod mor llwyddiannus nes ei fod bellach wedi symud i safle newydd ym manc yr HSBC. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn edrych ymlaen at yr agoriad swyddogol cyn bo hir.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf. Mae'r mudiad undebau credyd wedi bod yn llawer arafach yn magu stêm yng Nghymru nag yn Iwerddon, yr Unol Daleithiau a gwledydd eraill lle nad yw'r sector bancio wedi bod mor iach nac mor gyffredinol o ran ei ddarpariaeth. Mae'r undebau credyd erbyn hyn yn dal i fyny yng Nghymru ac yn gwneud yn dda. Yn sgîl argyfwng methiant cynllun cynilo basgedi Nadolig Farepak, gwaetha'r modd i'r holl deuluoedd yr effeithir arnynt, bydd pobl yn meddwl llawer mwy am ddefnyddio undebau credyd yn hytrach na'r clybiau basgedi bwyd a Nadolig preifat hyn yn y dyfodol, a chredaf y bydd undebau credyd yn lle llawer mwy diogel i gynilion pobl ar gyfer y Nadolig neu ddibenion eraill.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** In response to the economic situation, and in preparation for the convergence programme, two areas in Wales have been earmarked by the Government for special attention. One is the area of the Heads of the Valleys strategy and the other is the area covered by the Môn a Menai programme. A sum of £150 million has been allocated to the Heads of the Valleys strategy, but nothing has been allocated to Môn a Menai. Why the difference?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Eto, mae hynny'n gwneud cymariaethau er mwyn ceisio gwneud pwynt gwleidyddol. Gallai pobl yn y Cymoedd ddweud, 'Pam yr ydych wedi dechrau gweithio ym Môn a Menai bedair blynedd cyn i'r argyfwng dorri?'. Felly, nid yw'r cymariaethau hyn yn eich cymryd chi ymlaen. Dylech groesawu'r ffaith inni sefydlu'r bwrdd a'r strategaeth, a'n bod yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid yn yr ardal, a hynny bedair blynedd cyn i'r argyfwng ddechrau. Mae pedair blynedd cyn i Wylfa gau, ac, yn anffodus, efallai y caiff hynny effaith ar Anglesey Aluminium Cyf., felly yr ydym yn gweithredu o flaen llaw yn hytrach nag ar ôl digwyddiad. Yr ydych yn gwneud cymhariaeth â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y de, ond credaf ein bod yn gwneud rhywbeth newydd sbon. Ni chredaf y gallai neb gymharu'r hyn a wnaed gennym ym Môn a Menai yn anffafriol â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn awr ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd.

**Karen Sinclair:** The Labour Assembly Government's multimillion-pound regeneration programme has had huge benefits for the community of Brymbo in my constituency. When the steelworks closed some 15 years ago, 6,000 people were out of work and the future looked bleak for a village that suddenly found that its heartbeat had stopped. The community went into a downward spiral. Do you agree that, thanks to the huge investment by the Labour Assembly Government, together with the benefits coming from the URBAN II programme, new hope exists in the community of Brymbo, and the village now has a future that it can look forward to?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I agree. It is an area where the Assembly, as a body, by virtue of its existence, was able to get stuck into the issue. Rather than leave it in the too-difficult-to-do tray, we got on with what to do about Brymbo, and, working with partners, brought about the scheme, which has been largely finished since last September, at a cost of some £20 million. It will still be some time before the business premises proceed, for reasons of geological testing, although I understand that the houses are proceeding very quickly and are selling like hotcakes off

**The First Minister:** Again, you are making comparisons to try to score political points. People in the Valleys could ask, 'Why have you started working in Môn and Menai four years before the outbreak of any crisis?'. Therefore, you are not gaining any ground with these comparisons. You should welcome the fact that we have set up the project board and the strategy, and that we are collaborating with partners in the area four years before the emergency has even begun. Wylfa power station will not close for another four years, and, unfortunately, that closure could have an impact on Anglesey Aluminium Ltd, so we are being proactive rather than reactive. You are making comparisons with what is going on in south Wales, but I think that we are doing something brand new here. I do not think that anyone could compare what we have done with Môn a Menai unfavourably with what is now under way in the Heads of the Valleys.

**Karen Sinclair:** Mae rhaglen adfywio Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, ar gost o filiynau lawer o bunnoedd, wedi dod â manteision anferth i gymuned Brymbo yn fy etholaeth. Pan gaeodd y gwaith dur ryw 15 mlynedd yn ôl, yr oedd 6,000 o bobl yn ddi-waith ac edrychai'r dyfodol yn llwm i bentref a ganfu yn sydyn fod ei galon wedi peidio â churo. Dechreuodd y gymuned fynd ar i lawr. A gytunwch, diolch i'r buddsoddiad enfawr gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, ynghyd â'r manteision a ddaw yn sgîl y rhaglen URBAN II, fod gobaith newydd yn bodoli yng nghymuned Brymbo, a bod gan y pentref bellach ddyfodol y gall edrych ymlaen ato?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf. Mae'n ardal lle y llwyddodd y Cynulliad, fel corff, yn rhinwedd ei fodolaeth, i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Yn hytrach na'i gadael yn y blwch ar gyfer pethau sy'n rhy anodd i'w gwneud, aethom ati i benderfynu beth i'w wneud ynghylch Brymbo, a, chan gydweithio â phartneriaid, llwyddasom i wireddu'r cynllun, sydd fwy neu lai wedi'i orffen ers mis Medi diwethaf, ar gost o ryw £20 miliwn. Bydd sbel eto cyn i'r adeiladau busnes fynd rhagddynt, oherwydd profion daearegol, er fy mod yn deall bod y tai'n dod yn eu blaenau'n gyflym iawn ac yn gwerthu fel slecs oddi ar y

plan.

**Brynle Williams:** Do you agree that north Wales is as important as the Valleys, and that this should be reflected in your Government's policies? We have just heard about investment in the Wrexham area, but given the multimillion-pound investment in improving rail infrastructure around Cardiff and the Valleys, will you support the establishment of an operating base in Wrexham at a fraction of the cost, so that north Wales can finally have a direct rail line to London?

**The First Minister:** We are continuing to look at that. It would be unlawful to use regional selective assistance for it, because Wrexham is not an assisted area. No-one has yet come up with a suitable alternative vehicle by which we could consider having Wrexham as the headquarters and the base. We continue to search for a similar scheme under which Wrexham could be assisted that would not fall foul of regional selective assistance and state aid regulations and so on. There seems to be a battle between Shrewsbury and Wrexham to be the headquarters, and we are on Wrexham's side in that battle and will continue to pursue all options to make sure that it happens.

cynllun.

**Brynle Williams:** A gytunwch fod y gogledd cyn bwysiced â'r Cymoedd, ac y dylid adlewyrchu hyn ym mholisiau eich Llywodraeth? Yr ydym newydd glywed am fuddsoddiad yn ardal Wrecsam, ond o gofio'r buddsoddiad o filiynau ar filiynau o bunnoedd mewn gwella seilwaith y rheilffyrdd o amgylch Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd, a wnewch gefnogi sefydlu canolfan weithredol yn Wrecsam am ffracsiwn o'r gost, fel y gall y gogledd o'r diwedd gael lein reilffordd uniongyrchol i Lundain?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn dal i edrych ar hynny. Byddai'n anghyfreithlon defnyddio cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol ar ei gyfer, gan nad yw Wrecsam yn ardal a gynorthwyir. Nid oes neb eto wedi cynnig cyfrwng arall addas inni allu ystyried gwneud Wrecsam yn bencadlys ac yn ganolfan. Yr ydym yn dal i chwilio am gynllun tebyg lle y gellid cynorthwyo Wrecsam heb dorri rheoliadau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a rheoliadau cymorth gwladwriaethol ac yn y blaen. Mae'n ymddangos bod brwydr rhwng Amwythig a Wrecsam i gael bod yn bencadlys, ac yr ydym ni ar ochr Wrecsam yn y frwydr honno a byddwn yn parhau i ddilyn pob trywydd i wneud yn siŵr y bydd yn digwydd.

### **Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Canol De Cymru) Public Services (South Wales Central)**

**Q5 David Melding:** What plans does the First Minister have to improve the delivery of public services throughout South Wales Central? OAQ1989(FM)

**The First Minister:** We provide a set of incentives and arrangements to underpin improved service delivery, such as 'Making the Connections' and the Beecham report. As can be demonstrated from the difficulties over delayed transfers of care and surplus school places, these outcomes are only achieved when our delivery partners measure up to their responsibilities.

**David Melding:** You referred to Sir Jeremy Beecham's excellent report, for which you deserve credit for commissioning. Of the citizen model which you greatly favour, he said:

**C5 David Melding:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i wella'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ1989(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn darparu set o gymhellion a threfniadau i fod yn sail i well darpariaeth gwasanaethau, megis 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac adroddiad Beecham. Fel y gwelir o'r anawsterau gydag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal a lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion, dim ond pan fydd ein partneriaid darparu'n cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau hwy y sicrhewir y canlyniadau hyn.

**David Melding:** Cyfeiriasoch at adroddiad ardderchog Syr Jeremy Beecham, yr ydych yn haeddu clod am ei gomisiynu. Ynghylch model y dinesydd, yr ydych chi'n frwd o'i blaid, dyma a ddywedodd:

‘The first requirement is to recognise the dangers inherent in the model—the interests of the citizen may be secondary to those of service providers, in a cosy and inert delivery system’.

The report also states that:

‘In developing the citizen model, it is essential to learn from both the merits and the deficiencies of the consumer model.’

I think that that is a very balanced approach, and I am prepared to give you a chance to test the citizen model, because it seems that it is a coherent option when you do not have many competing providers, or the likelihood of that. However, ultimately, if you have choice there is more power with the user of services.

**The First Minister:** We could have a long philosophical discussion about that, which would take up the rest of the time for questions, but I do not wish to go down that road. I agree with the strong strictures in the Jeremy Beecham report that with any non-compulsory set of outcomes that we are trying to achieve without, for instance, reorganising local government or the health service and throwing all the bits in the air again, we must be certain that it is not a cosy opt-out for the providers to do nothing and just produce a lot of warm words every so often to baffle the frustrated consumer, customer or citizen. A citizen-based formula is slightly different from a customer-based formula. A customer may well exercise choice in shopping at Sainsbury’s, Tesco, Asda or the Co-op, but we are talking about a citizen-based choice, that is, ‘I want more services, and I want them to be as local and as excellent as possible—how do I get them?’, which is slightly different. I do not know whether there is disagreement on that between us, but I do not think that there is a disagreement between that definition and the definition used in the Beecham report.

**Jenny Randerson:** The funding crisis affecting adult social services, and the significant increase in the number of delayed transfers of care, are two of the problems

Y gofyniad cyntaf yw cydnabod y peryglon sy’n perthyn i’r model—y gallai buddiannau’r dinesydd fod yn eilradd o’u cymharu â buddiannau’r darparwyr gwasanaethau, mewn system ddarparu gysurus ac anweithredol.

Dywed yr adroddiad hefyd:

Wrth ddatblygu model y dinesydd, mae’n hanfodol dysgu oddi wrth ragoriaethau a diffygion model y defnyddiwr.

Credaf fod hynny’n agwedd gytbwys iawn, ac yr wyf yn barod i roi cyfle ichi roi prawf ar fodel y dinesydd, oherwydd y mae’n ymddangos ei fod yn fodel cydlynol pan nad oes gennych lawer o ddarparwyr yn cystadlu â’i gilydd, na thebygrwydd y bydd hynny’n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, os oes dewis, bydd mwy o rym gan ddefnyddiwr gwasanaethau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallem gael trafodaeth athronyddol hirfaith am hynny, a fyddai’n mynd â gweddill yr amser ar gyfer cwestiynau, ond nid wyf yn awyddus i fynd ar hyd y llwybr hwnnw. Cytunaf â’r rhybuddion cryf yn adroddiad Jeremy Beecham fod yn rhaid inni fod yn sicr, gydag unrhyw set anorfodol o ganlyniadau yr ydym yn ceisio’i sicrhau, heb ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol neu’r gwasanaeth iechyd, er enghraifft, a mynd ati i ail-wneud popeth eto, nad yw’n ffordd hawdd i’r darparwyr osgoi gwneud dim, dim ond cynhyrchu llawer o eiriau hynaws bob yn hyn a hyn i ddallu’r cwsmer, y defnyddiwr neu’r dinesydd rhwystredig. Mae fformiwla seiliedig ar y dinesydd fymryn yn wahanol i fformiwla seiliedig ar y cwsmer. Gall cwsmer yn wir arfer dewis drwy siopa yn Sainsbury’s, Tesco, Asda neu’r Co-op, ond yr ydym ni’n sôn am ddewis seiliedig ar y dinesydd, hynny yw, ‘Mae arnaf eisiau rhagor o wasanaethau, ac mae arnaf eisiau iddynt fod mor lleol ac mor rhagorol ag sydd yn bosibl—sut y gallaf gael y rhain?’, sydd fymryn yn wahanol. Ni wn a oes anghytundeb rhyngom ynglŷn â hynny, ond ni chredaf fod anghytundeb rhwng y diffiniad hwnnw a’r diffiniad a ddefnyddir yn adroddiad Beecham.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr argyfwng ariannu sydd yn effeithio ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion, a’r cynnydd arwyddocaol yn nifer yr achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, yw



facing public services in Wales that are of particular concern in South Wales Central, although those problems exist throughout Wales. The Welsh NHS Confederation, which is hardly an organisation prone to unreliable exaggeration, claimed this week in its document 'Prescription for Health', that NHS funding for next year falls £100 million short of requirements. Do you agree, First Minister, with its judgment that this funding shortfall is 'putting vital changes at risk'?

**The First Minister:** This is the season of shortfall claims by different bodies, because they know that we are in the middle of a budget negotiation; they think that if other bodies lobby the Assembly and they do not, then the other bodies will somehow grab resources that might otherwise come to them. It is almost an annual ritual. I will be addressing the NHS confederation—or will be involved in a question and answer session with Sue Essex, Brian Gibbons and Alun Pugh—this Thursday and I am sure that we will hear some of its claims; we will listen to those very carefully.

Your point about adult social services is the reason why I mentioned this question of delayed transfers of care in my answer to David Melding. It is an important area, from which we cannot have local authorities opting out of their responsibilities.

**Leanne Wood:** Health is one of the key public services about which people in South Wales Central express concern to me. There have been recent reports about a plan to downgrade accident and emergency services either at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital or at Prince Charles Hospital in Merthyr Tydfil. I understand your refusal to rule out a general downgrading of health services, but will you at least agree with me that the downgrading of accident and emergency services in these two hospitals would be a detrimental step and will you agree to condemn such plans? If you refuse to condemn those plans, how do you justify how those services could be cut?

dwy o'r problemau sydd yn wynebu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru sy'n destun pryder arbennig yng Nghanol De Cymru, er bod y problemau hyn yn bodoli drwy Gymru benbaladr. Haerodd Conffederasiwn GIG Cymru, a phrin bod hwnnw'n gorff sy'n dueddol o or-ddweud mewn modd annibynadwy, yr wythnos hon yn ei ddogfen 'Prescription for Health', y bydd arian y GIG ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf £100 miliwn yn llai na'r hyn y mae ei angen. Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn derbyn y farn a geir ynddo fod y diffyg cyllid hwn yn 'peryglu'r gallu i wneud newidiadau hollbwysig'?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyma'r adeg pan geir honiadau am ddiffygion gan wahanol gyrff, gan eu bod yn gwybod ein bod ar ganol negodi'r gyllideb; maent yn credu, os bydd cyrff eraill yn llobio'r Cynulliad ac nad ydynt hwy'n gwneud hynny, y bydd y cyrff eraill rywsut yn cipio adnoddau a allai fynd iddynt hwy fel arall. Mae bron â bod yn ddefod flynyddol. Byddaf yn annerch cydffederasiwn y GIG—neu byddaf yn cymryd rhan mewn sesiwn holi ac ateb gyda Sue Essex, Brian Gibbons ac Alun Pugh—ddydd Iau nesaf ac yr wyf yn siŵr y clywn rai o'i honiadau; gwrandawn arnynt yn astud iawn.

Y pwynt a wnaethoch am wasanaethau cymdeithasol oedolion yw'r rheswm imi grybwyll mater yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn fy ateb i David Melding. Mae'n faes pwysig, lle na allwn oddef i awdurdodau lleol ymwrthod â'u dyletswyddau.

**Leanne Wood:** Iechyd yw un o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol y bydd pobl yng Nghanol De Cymru'n mynegi pryder imi yn eu cylch. Bu adroddiadau'n ddiweddar am fwriad i israddio gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys un ai yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg neu yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ym Merthyr Tudful. Yr wyf yn deall pam yr ydych yn gwrthod diystyru'r posibilrwydd o israddio gwasanaethau iechyd yn gyffredinol, ond a wnewch dderbyn o leiaf y byddai israddio gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn y ddau ysbyty hynny'n gam niweidiol ac a wnewch gytuno i gollfarnu cynlluniau o'r fath? Os gwrthodwch gollfarnu'r cynlluniau hynny, sut yr ydych yn cyfiawnhau'r modd y gellid torri'r gwasanaethau hynny?

**The First Minister:** This is another example of Plaid Cymru's vulture attitude to politics. You read or hear of an allegation and, therefore, you want to trail it as much as possible in order to try to create a doom-and-gloom environment. The performance of the health service in Wales is improving enormously, as we can see from the huge fall in long waiting lists. That includes the area that you are referring to in the northern half of the South Wales Central constituency. You believe that all proposed changes in order to meet the Wanless report, which you agreed with in principle, must be bad news. You may think that you can grub up a few votes from it; if that is your politics, then you can keep it.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn enghraifft arall o agwedd fwlturaidd Plaid Cymru at wleidyddiaeth. Byddwch yn darllen neu'n clywed am honiad ac, felly, byddwch am dynnu cymaint o sylw ato ag y bo modd er mwyn ceisio creu ymdeimlad o anobaith. Mae perfformiad y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru'n gwella'n aruthrol, fel y gallwn weld oddi wrth y gostyngiad anferth mewn rhestrau aros hir. Mae hynny'n cynnwys yr ardal yr ydych yn cyfeirio ati yn hanner gogleddol etholaeth Canol De Cymru. Yr ydych yn credu bod yr holl newidiadau a gynigir i ymateb i adroddiad Wanless, y gwnaethoch ei dderbyn mewn egwyddor, yn sicr o fod yn beth drwg. Efallai eich bod yn credu y gallwch gribinio ychydig o bleidleisiau drwy wneud hynny; os mai gwleidyddiaeth felly sydd gennych, naw wfft iddi.

#### **Ailsefydlu Cronfa Datblygu Swyddfa'r Post Re-establishing the Post Office Development Fund**

**Q6 Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the re-establishment of the post office development fund? OAQ1996(FM)

**C6 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ailsefydlu cronfa datblygu swyddfa'r post? OAQ1996(FM)

**The First Minister:** The fund is not currently open to new applications for reasons that we have discussed on many occasions. Edwina Hart will make a decision about the fund's future when there is greater clarity from the UK Government regarding the future of the network.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'r gronfa'n agored i geisiadau newydd ar hyn o bryd am resymau yr ydym wedi'u trafod ar lawer achlysur. Bydd Edwina Hart yn penderfynu ar ddyfodol y gronfa pan geir mwy o eglurhad gan Lywodraeth y DU am ddyfodol y rhwydwaith.

**Mick Bates:** I find all of this puzzling. I refer to the evidence contained in the evaluation of the post office development fund. It stated clearly that this fund had a positive impact on the commercial viability of post offices at risk in rural and deprived areas. It reported a high level of satisfaction with the fund and the effects on post offices among customers. Your own Minister, to whom you just referred, said that it has created new jobs while assuring the survival of others. In Westminster, Kate Hoey launched a campaign to save post offices. What better endorsements could you have than these from post offices, customers, and colleagues in Westminster? Why do you continue to ignore their views and fail to re-establish this superb fund?

**Mick Bates:** Mae hyn i gyd yn peri penbleth imi. Cyfeiriaf at y dystiolaeth a geir yn y gwerthusiad o'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post. Nododd yn glir fod y gronfa hon yn cael effaith lesol ar ddichonadwyedd masnachol swyddfeydd post sydd mewn perygl mewn ardaloedd gwledig a difreintiedig. Rhoddodd wybod bod bodlonrwydd mawr ynghylch y gronfa a'r effeithiau ar swyddfeydd post ymysg cwsmeriaid. Dywedodd eich Gweinidog eich hun, yr ydych newydd gyfeirio ati, ei bod wedi creu swyddi newydd gan sicrhau parhad rhai eraill. Yn San Steffan, lansiodd Kate Hoey ymgyrch i achub swyddfeydd post. Pa gymeradwyaeth well y gallech ei chael na hynny gan swyddfeydd post, cwsmeriaid, a chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan? Pam yr ydych yn dal i anwybyddu eu barn ac yn methu ag ailsefydlu'r gronfa wych hon?

**The First Minister:** You seem to be ignoring—although I know that you know about it—the small business rate relief scheme and the way that that also covers post offices. Indeed, the smallest businesses and post offices will receive the highest percentage of relief under Sue Essex's new small business rate relief scheme. If you want to compare the two, I am sure that we can write to you if you would like to write to me on that side. I think that you will find confirmation of what you know already: that the small business rate relief scheme has been universally welcomed throughout Wales by small businesses, including a high proportion of post offices.

**Elin Jones:** Efallai yr hoffech gymryd y cyfle hwn i longyfarch swyddfa bost Pontrhydfendigaid, sydd wedi ei lleoli yn nhafarn y Llew Du ac sydd wedi ei henwi yn swyddfa bost wledig y flwyddyn gan y Post Brenhinol. A gytunwch fod swyddfeydd post blaengar i'w cael yng Nghymru, ac yng Nghymru wledig yn benodol? Mae'r rhain yn awyddus i weld eu busnes yn datblygu, ond mae'r ffaith fod y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post ar gau iddynt yn eu dal yn ôl o'r cynlluniau cyffrous sydd ganddynt i gymryd cyfleoedd newydd a allai fod ar gael iddynt.

2.50 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gall unrhyw fenyw fusnes, neu ddyn busnes, neu deulu busnes, wneud llwyddiant o swyddfa bost mewn lleoedd fel Pontrhydfendigaid ac mewn mannau eraill, ond maent yn gorfod bod yn dalentog wrth redeg y busnes. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno gwobr i'r swyddfa bost honno fel busnes blaenllaw a thalentog â chynlluniau at y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn falch iawn o glywed ei bod wedi ennill y wobwr ddiweddar hon hefyd. Pan fo pobl sydd wedi bod yn rhedeg swyddfeydd post yn ymddeol, yn aml nid oes gan yr unigolyn sy'n cymryd drosodd yr un dyfalbarhad a syniadau ynghylch sut i greu busnes newydd. Dyna'r broblem gyda swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd nad ydynt yn llewyrchus a lle nad oes llawer o bobl. Mae'n rhaid cael syniadau da ar gyfer adeiladu busnes ar gefn busnes y swyddfa bost. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr enghraifft y

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn diystyru'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach—er fy mod yn gwybod eich bod yn gwybod amdano—a'r ffaith ei fod hefyd yn cynnwys swyddfeydd post. Yn wir, y busnesau lleiaf a'r swyddfeydd post lleiaf a gaiff y ganran uchaf o ryddhad dan gynllun rhyddhad ardrethi newydd Sue Essex ar gyfer busnesau bach. Os ydych yn dymuno cymharu'r ddau, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn ysgrifennu atoch pe hoffech ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch hynny. Yr wyf yn credu y cewch gadarnhad o'r hyn a wyddoch eisoes: bod y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach wedi'i groesawu'n gyffredinol ledled Cymru gan fusnesau bach, gan gynnwys cyfran fawr o'r swyddfeydd post.

**Elin Jones:** Perhaps you would like to take this opportunity to congratulate the Pontrhydfendigaid post office, which is located in the Llew Du pub and has been named rural post office of the year by the Royal Mail. Do you agree that there are innovative post offices in Wales, and in rural Wales in particular? These post offices are eager to see their businesses develop, but the fact that the post office development fund is not available to them holds them back from the exciting plans that they have to take up new opportunities that could be available to them.

**The First Minister:** Any business woman, or business man, or business family, can make a success of a post office in places such as Pontrhydfendigaid and in other areas, but they have to be talented in running the business. I have presented an award to that post office as an innovative and talented business with plans for the future. I am very pleased to hear that it has also won this recent award. When people who have been running post offices retire, often the individual taking over does not have the same determination and ideas about how to generate new business. That is the problem with post offices in areas that are not prosperous and where there are not many people. You have to have good ideas about building business on the back of the post office business itself. I am sure that the example you referred to in Pontrhydfendigaid is a very good one.

cyfeiriasoch ati ym Mhontrhydfendigaid yn un dda iawn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Given your initial answer, I hope you confirm that the rural rate relief scheme is not seen as an alternative to this. When the post office development fund was closed in July 2004, we were told that it would only remain closed until there was greater clarity from the UK Government on funding for the post office network. We have seen almost a quarter of the UK's post offices close because of UK Government decisions. How do you respond to the letter that we received in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee last month, through the Minister, from the Parliamentary Under-Secretary for Work and Pensions, James Plaskett, dismissing the Assembly's call for retention of the post office card account? What alternative do you now propose to support our post offices through the provision of Assembly Government and local government services via post office counters?

**The First Minister:** I did not say that it was an alternative. Your point is well made, but it is not an attack on anything that I have said, because I did not say that it was an alternative. I told Mick Bates that he should not think that we have been sitting around doing nothing, because we have made a major new initiative that will help and has been strongly welcomed by post offices, particularly small ones.

On James Plaskett's response, Edwina Hart has written to him and there is ongoing correspondence.

**Mark Isherwood:** O ystyried eich ateb cyntaf, yr wyf yn gobeithio y cadarnhewch nad ydys yn barnu bod y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi gwledig yn ddewis yn lle hyn. Pan gaewyd y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post ym Mehefin 2004, dywedwyd wrthym na fyddai ond yn aros ar gau hyd nes y ceid mwy o eglurhad gan Lywodraeth y DU am gyllid ar gyfer rhwydwaith y swyddfeydd post. Gwelsom bron chwarter y swyddfeydd post yn y DU yn cau oherwydd penderfyniadau gan Lywodraeth y DU. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i lythyr a gawsom yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio y mis diwethaf, drwy law'r Gweinidog, oddi wrth yr Is-ysgrifennydd Seneddol dros Waith a Phensiynau, James Plaskett, yn wfftio galwad y Cynulliad am gadw cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post? Pa ddewis arall yr ydych yn ei gynnig yn awr i helpu ein swyddfeydd post drwy ddarparu gwasanaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol drwy gyfrwng cownteri swyddfeydd post?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni ddywedais fod hynny'n ddewis arall. Mae eich pwynt yn un da, ond nid yw'n feirniadaeth ar ddim a ddywedais, gan na ddywedais ei fod yn ddewis arall. Dywedais wrth Mick Bates na ddylai gredu ein bod wedi llaesu dwylo, gan ein bod wedi sefydlu menter newydd o bwys a fydd o gymorth ac sydd wedi'i chrosawu'n fawr gan swyddfeydd post, yn enwedig rhai bach.

Ynghylch ymateb James Plaskett, mae Edwina Hart wedi ysgrifennu ato ac mae'r ohebiaeth yn parhau.

### **Gwella Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Improving Public Services**

**C7 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ2002(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y cyfeiriais ato eisoes, mae'r egwyddor y tu ôl i'n syniadau i wella safon gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi ei ddisgrifio yn ein dogfen, 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac yn adroddiad Syr Jeremy Beecham. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi ein hymateb, fel Llywodraeth, i adroddiad Syr

**Q7 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What plans does the First Minister have to improve public services in Wales? OAQ2002(FM)

**The First Minister:** As I have already mentioned, the principle underpinning our ideas to improve the quality of public services in Wales has been described in 'Making the Connections', our document, and in Sir Jeremy Beecham's report. We will be publishing our response, as a Government, to Sir Jeremy's

Jeremy o fewn rhai wythnosau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ar eich atebion yn gynt y prynhawn yma ar gyllido prifysgolion, synnais eich clywed yn ein beirniadu ni am wneud cymariaethau rhwng Cymru a Lloegr; eto, yr oeddech chi eisiau gwneud cymariaethau rhwng Cymru a rhanbarthau o Loegr. Yr ydych yn ffodus o ran y gymhariaeth a wnaethom rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Pe baem yn gwneud cymhariaeth yn seiliedig ar y cyfartaledd yng Nghymru a'r cyfartaledd yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol, byddai'r bwlch yn fwy a phe baem yn gwneud y gymhariaeth rhwng Cymru a'r Alban, byddai'r bwlch yn anferth. Onid yw'n deg i gymharu Cymru a Lloegr neu Gymru a'r Alban, gan ein bod yn genhedloedd? Nid yw'n deg cymharu Cymru ag unrhyw ranbarth o Loegr, gan nad oes rhaid, o fewn y rhanbarth hwnnw, gael sefydliadau cenedlaethol sy'n mynd gyda sefydliadau addysg uwch. Oni dderbyniwch fod y gymhariaeth a wnaethoch yn gwbl annheg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dim o gwbl. Mae gan Blaid Cymru obsesiwn o ran gwneud cymariaethau er mwyn ceisio profi pwynt ar bob pwnc. O ran y bwlch—os oes bwlch—yn y sector addysg uwch rhyngom ni a Lloegr, yr ydym eisiau gweld yr ymchwil. Yr ydym am fod mor gywir ag y gallwn fod—nid yw cywirdeb 100 y cant wastad yn rhwydd—er mwyn gweld a yw'r honiad fod bwlch rhyngom ni, o ran ein prifysgolion yn cael llai o arian y pen na phrifysgolion Lloegr, yn wir.

A yw'r un gymhariaeth yn bodoli rhwng Lloegr a'r Alban, er enghraifft, gan fod bwlch bras yn bodoli yno? Nid oes neb yn Lloegr yn gwneud y gymhariaeth honno gyda'r Alban. Felly, mae'n bwysig inni ddeall bod gwledydd bach weithiau yn gwneud y gymhariaeth hon gyda gwlad fawr gyfagos, ond nad yw gwledydd mawr yn gwneud y gymhariaeth gyda gwlad fach. Mae rhywbeth yn od ynglŷn â'r seicoleg honno. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ceisio bod mor gywir ac mor deg â phosibl, a dod o hyd i'r wialen fesur sy'n rhoi ichi gymhariaeth sy'n gwbl deg cyn i unrhyw un dderbyn honiadau ynglŷn â chostau. Os yw costau'n uwch yn ne a de-ddwyrain Lloegr, nid ydych yn talu arian i'n prifysgolion ni ar gyfer costau nad

report in a few weeks' time.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** On your answers earlier this afternoon on funding universities, I was surprised to hear you criticise us for making a comparison between Wales and England; yet, you wanted to make comparisons between Wales and English regions. You are fortunate that we compared Wales with England. If we were to make a comparison based on the average in Wales, and that in the UK, the gap would be greater, and were we to compare Wales and Scotland, the gap would be huge. Is it not fair to compare Wales with England or Wales with Scotland, as we are nations? It is not fair to compare Wales with a region of England, because, within that region, there is no need to have national institutions that accompany higher education institutions. Do you not accept that the comparison that you made is completely unfair?

**The First Minister:** Not at all. Plaid Cymru has an obsession with making comparisons in order to try to prove a point on all subjects. In terms of the gap—if there is one—in the higher education sector between us and England, we want to do the research. We want to be as accurate as we can be—100 per cent accuracy is not always easy—in order to see whether the allegation that there is a gap between us, in terms of our universities getting less money per head than English universities, is true.

Does the same comparison exist between Wales and Scotland, for example, as, roughly, a gap exists there? No-one in England is making that comparison with Scotland. Therefore, it is important that we understand that small countries sometimes make this comparison with a neighbouring large country, but larger countries never make the comparison with a small country. There is something odd about this psychology. It is important that we try to be as accurate and fair as possible, and discover a yardstick that gives a fair comparison before anyone accepts allegations about costs. If costs are higher in south and south-east England, you are not going to pay our universities for costs that they do not face.

oes ganddynt i'w hwynebu.

**Lisa Francis:** Going back to the earlier question about adult services, which is to do with public services, the news this morning was that two-thirds of councils are facing an overspend in adult care services, with a quarter facing deficits of over £1 million, according to research by Eye on Wales. The Welsh Local Government Association has, worryingly, stated that the current care system is unsustainable. You mentioned that you are doing a public question-and-answer session of some kind later this week, but what else will you do to address this situation, particularly with regard to what the Welsh Local Government Association has stated?

**The First Minister:** In the budget period, all sorts of allegations are made about crises in local government shortfalls in the big spending areas, of which social services and education are the biggest two. It always happens—it happens every year; things never turn out to be as bad as they say that they will be. However, under Beecham and ‘Making the Connections’, can we have a better system? We all understand the problem that, if patients remain in an NHS bed when their care, in NHS terms, is over, you are wasting £2,000—leaving aside the consequences of the bed-blocking on the next patient, who cannot get in because the bed is blocked—to provide a worse standard of care than the £1,000 that it would cost in a nursing home. That is clearly bonkers. We have to find a way of breaking this cost shunting between local government and the NHS. When a patient is ready to leave hospital, he or she should leave hospital. Not only is it cheaper but it is better for the patients, because they get their independence back much quicker. We have to find a way of tracking the bonkers system that we have inherited.

**Lisa Francis:** Gan fynd yn ôl at y cwestiwn cynharach ynghylch gwasanaethau oedolion, sydd yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, y newydd a gafwyd y bore yma oedd bod dwy ran o dair o'r cynghorau'n wynebu gorwariant ar wasanaethau gofal i oedolion, a bod eu chwarter yn wynebu diffyg o fwy nag £1 filiwn, yn ôl ymchwil gan Eye on Wales. Mae'n destun pryder bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi datgan bod y system gofal bresennol yn anghynaliadwy. Dywedasoeh byddwch yn cymryd rhan mewn sesiwn holi ac ateb gyhoeddus o ryw fath yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon, ond beth arall a wnewch i ddelio â'r sefyllfa hon, yn enwedig gyda golwg ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yng nghyfnod y gyllideb, gwneir pob math o honiadau am argyfyngau mewn cysylltiad â diffygion mewn llywodraeth leol yn y meysydd gwariant mawr, gan gynnwys y ddau faes mwyaf sef gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg. Mae'n digwydd bob tro—mae'n digwydd bob blwyddyn; ni fydd pethau byth cynddrwg â'r darogan. Fodd bynnag, dan Beecham a ‘Creu'r Cysylltiadau’, a oes modd inni gael system well? Yr ydym oll yn deall y broblem sydd yn peri, os bydd cleifion yn aros mewn gwely GIG wedi i'w gofal ddod i ben, o ran y GIG, fod £2,000 yn cael ei wastraffu—heb ystyried yr effaith ar y claf nesaf nad yw'n gallu cael lle am fod y gwely wedi'i flocio—ar ddarparu gofal o safon waeth na'r hyn a geid am £1,000 mewn cartref nyrsio. Mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n hurt. Rhaid inni ddarganfod dull o roi pen ar y symud costau rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r GIG. Pan fo claf yn barod i adael yr ysbyty, dylai wneud hynny. Mae'n rhatach felly ac mae hefyd yn well i'r cleifion, gan eu bod yn adennill eu hannibyniaeth yn gynt o lawer. Rhaid inni ddarganfod dull o ddilyn hynt y system wallgof yr ydym wedi'i hetifeddu.

### **Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol Anti-social Behaviour**

**Q8 Janice Gregory:** Will the First Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government initiatives designed to tackle anti-social behaviour? OAQ2000(FM)

**C8 Janice Gregory:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol? OAQ2000(FM)

**The First Minister:** I am sure that you would want to join me in commending the success of the On-track system, which we took over from the Home Office some three or four years ago, which is still at its pilot stage. One of the pilot schemes is in Maesteg, and another is in Tylorstown. We have to evaluate these for 10 years, because they are early interventions in order to achieve much better outcomes in the teenage years, 10 or 12 years later. However, everyone says that they are showing signs of being a great success.

**Janice Gregory:** I endorse your comments about the success of On-track. I am pleased that I have it in my constituency, and I pay tribute to everyone who works there.

I recently had the honour of launching the Bridgend community safety partnership's school anti-social behaviour protocol. It is aimed at tackling anti-social behaviour at its earliest stages and gives guidance for sharing relevant information between schools, the community safety partnership, and other key partners. A pilot project found that schools were enthusiastic about the scheme and the benefits that it brought. Every secondary school in the Bridgend county has now signed the protocol and, in the future, it is planned to roll it out to all primary schools; I am looking forward to that. Do you agree that this early, concerted, multi-agency approach is crucial if we are to tackle such anti-social behaviour, thereby giving our schoolchildren the opportunity to learn in an environment where there is respect for all and to grow up in a society that is safe for all?

**The First Minister:** I do agree, because the pilot schemes that were carried out earlier revealed a significant gap in service provision, because there was no route for schools to refer incidents of anti-social behaviour unless it was reported directly to the police, which was sometimes not the best way forward. The multi-agency approach with partners co-located in the community safety partnership office now enables schools to play a full part in the partnership.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y dymunech ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo llwyddiant system On-track, y gwnaethom ei chymryd drosodd oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gartref tua thair neu bedair blynedd yn ôl, sydd yn dal i gael ei threialu. Mae un o'r cynlluniau peilot ym Maesteg, ac mae un arall yn Tylorstown. Rhaid inni werthuso'r rhain am 10 mlynedd, am mai ymyriadau cynnar ydynt i sicrhau canlyniadau gwell o lawer ym mlynedd yr ardegau, 10 neu 12 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach. Fodd bynnag, mae pawb yn dweud eu bod am fod yn llwyddiant mawr yn ôl pob golwg.

**Janice Gregory:** Atefag y sylwadau a wnaethoch am lwyddiant On-track. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn fy etholaeth, a thalaf deyrnged i bawb sydd yn gweithio yno.

Cefais y ffrainc yn ddiweddar o lansio protocol partneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol mewn ysgolion. Ei amcan yw delio ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn ei gamau cynharaf ac mae'n cynnig canllawiau ar rannu gwybodaeth berthnasol rhwng ysgolion, y bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol, a phartneriaid allweddol eraill. Mewn prosiect peilot, cafwyd bod ysgolion yn frwd dros y cynllun a'r buddion a ddaeth i'w ganlyn. Erbyn hyn mae pob ysgol uwchradd yn sir Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi llofnodi'r protocol a bwriedir ei roi ar waith yn yr holl ysgolion cynradd yn y dyfodol; yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at hynny. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn hollbwysig cymryd camau cynnar o'r fath ar y cyd rhwng nifer o asiantaethau os ydym i ddelio ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol o'r fath, gan roi cyfle drwy hynny i blant ysgol ddysgu mewn amgylchedd lle y ceir parch at bawb a thyfu mewn cymdeithas sy'n ddiogel i bawb?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno, oherwydd dangosodd y cynlluniau peilot a gynhaliwyd yn gynharach fod bwlb mawr yn y gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu, gan nad oedd modd i ysgolion roi gwybod am ddigwyddiadau a oedd yn ymwneud ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol heblaw drwy hysbysu'r heddlu'n uniongyrchol, ac weithiau nid hynny oedd y dull gorau o weithredu. Mae'r dull amlasiantaeth lle y mae'r partneriaid wedi'u cydleoli yn swyddfa'r bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol yn galluogi ysgolion i chwarae rhan lawn yn y bartneriaeth yn awr.

3.00 p.m.

I understand that the headteacher steering group and all schools in the Bridgend area have signed up to it. That shows that everyone accepts that this is the right way forward. It fills a gap that had existed in previous practice.

**Alun Cairns:** Her Majesty's Courts Service is considering the reorganisation of magistrates' courts in south Wales. Barry Magistrates' Court is potentially under threat in the reorganisation process. It has one of the best performance records in the UK, from the arrest to sentencing of young offenders. Do you not think that that should be a significant factor in the consideration? If the proposed merger with Cardiff Magistrates' Court goes ahead, do you not think that the principle of local justice will be lost?

**The First Minister:** I agree. Jane Hutt has discussed this with me on many occasions, as she has with Harriet Harman, one of the Ministers involved in the process. We would all accept the principle: having a magistrates' court for the Vale of Glamorgan in Barry is very important. It is not a devolved subject, but it is one on which we can all express a strong view, as I know Jane has.

Yr wyf yn deall bod grŵp llywio'r penaethiaid a phob ysgol yn ardal Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi ymrwymo iddo. Mae hynny'n dangos bod pawb yn derbyn mai dyma'r ffordd iawn o fwrw ymlaen â hyn. Mae'n llenwi bwlch a fodolai yn yr arfer blaenorol.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae Gwasanaeth Llysoedd Ei Mawrhydi yn ystyried ad-drefnu'r llysoedd ynadon yn y de. Gallai Llys Ynadon y Barri fod o dan fygythiad yn y broses ad-drefnu. Mae ei berfformiad gyda'r gorau yn y DU, o arestio hyd at ddedfrydu troseddwy'r ifanc. Onid ydych yn meddwl y dylai hynny fod yn ffactor o bwys wrth ystyried hyn? Os aiff yr uniad arfaethedig â Llys Ynadon Caerdydd rhagddo, onid ydych yn meddwl y caiff egwyddor cyfiawnder lleol ei cholli?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Mae Jane Hutt wedi trafod hyn gyda mi droeon, fel y mae wedi gwneud gyda Harriet Harman, un o'r Gweinidogion sy'n ymwneud â'r broses. Byddem i gyd yn derbyn yr egwyddor: mae cael llys ynadon ym Mro Morgannwg yn y Barri yn bwysig iawn. Nid yw'n fater sydd wedi cael ei ddatganoli, ond mae'n un y gallwn i gyd fynegi barn gref arno, fel y gwn fod Jane wedi gwneud.

### **Dyfodol Tai Cymdeithasol The Future of Social Housing**

**Q9 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of social housing in Wales? OAQ1986(FM)

**The First Minister:** We are committed to improving social housing in Wales by bringing it up to the Welsh housing quality standard by 2012. People's homes are critical to their quality of life, and the achievement of the standard will ensure that homes are safe, secure, wind and watertight, well insulated, energy efficient, and have suitable amenities and regenerated neighbourhoods.

**Peter Black:** Several councils in Wales are pursuing a stock transfer option for their council housing stock to bring the houses up to the Welsh housing quality standard. They are doing so in the face of opposition from a

**C9 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru? OAQ1986(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i wella tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru drwy eu codi hyd at safon ansawdd tai Cymru erbyn 2012. Mae cartrefi pobl yn allweddol i ansawdd eu bywydau, a bydd cyrraedd y safon yn sicrhau bod cartrefi'n saff, yn ddiogel, yn dal gwynt a dŵr, wedi'u hinswleiddio'n dda, yn effeithlon o ran ynni, a bod iddynt fwynderau addas a chymdogaethau sydd wedi cael eu hadfywio.

**Peter Black:** Mae amryw o gynghorau yng Nghymru yn mynd ar drywydd opsiwn trosglwyddo stoc i'w stoc tai cyngor er mwyn eu gwella hyd at safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Maent yn gwneud hynny er gwaethaf



number of people and bodies who are arguing that there is a fourth option, involving the Government providing the money for local councils to bring houses up to scratch. Will you state categorically today whether there is such a fourth option, and, if not, whether there is likely to be such an option in the near future?

**The First Minister:** My understanding is that there is no fourth option. It has been talked about a great deal, but, unfortunately, in entering the current debate, it is providing false hope. Our understanding is that the Treasury is totally committed to not having a fourth option, despite entreaties from many quarters.

**Janet Davies:** First Minister, you will be pleased to know that this is a short question, and I just want a 'yes' or 'no' answer. It relates to what Peter Black has just said about the fourth option. Do you agree with the UK Treasury rules that control expenditure by local authorities on social housing?

**The First Minister:** We have always tried to persuade the Treasury to change its view, but we have been quite unsuccessful. The unfortunate way in which you put that question could again give false hope to people, which I think Peter Black deprecates, as do we. If the option exists, it should be considered; if the Treasury will not listen to it, all that this talk does is give people false hope that there might be something else around the corner if they just wrote another letter. The Treasury has slammed the door shut on the fourth option, and it is therefore wrong to inject it into the debate as though it might be available next month; it will not be.

**William Graham:** What measures have you taken to ensure that landlords and tenants are aware of the Welsh housing quality standard, and what are you doing to promote them?

**The First Minister:** I believe that the Welsh housing quality standard for 2012 is one of the better promoted initiatives. There is a wider degree of understanding among council tenants of their right to expect the Welsh housing quality standard and to probe their

gwrthwynebiad gan nifer o bobl a chyrrff sy'n dadlau bod pedwerydd opsiwn, lle y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn darparu'r arian er mwyn i gynghorau lleol wella'r tai hyd at y safon ofynnol. A wnewch ddatgan yn bendant heddiw a oes pedwerydd opsiwn o'r fath, ac, os nad oes, a yw'n debygol y bydd opsiwn o'r fath yn y dyfodol agos?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ôl a ddeallaf, nid oes pedwerydd opsiwn. Bu llawer iawn o siarad am hynny, ond, yn anffodus, wrth ddechrau ar y ddadl gyfredol, mae'n cynnig gobaith ffug. Yn ôl a ddeallwn, mae'r Trysorlys wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i beidio â chael pedwerydd opsiwn, er gwaethaf ymbil o lawer man.

**Janet Davies:** Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn falch o wybod mai cwestiwn byr yw hwn, ac mai dim ond ateb 'ydwyf' neu 'nac ydwyf' sydd arnaf ei eisiau. Mae a wnelo â'r hyn y mae Peter Black newydd ei ddweud am y pedwerydd opsiwn. A ydych yn cytuno â rheolau Trysorlys y DU sy'n rheoli'r gwariant gan awdurdodau lleol ar dai cymdeithasol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi ceisio perswadio'r Trysorlys, drwy'r amser, i newid ei farn, ond yr ydym wedi bod yn bur aflwyddiannus. Gallai'r ffordd anffodus y cafodd y cwestiwn ei ofyn gennych roi gobaith ffug i bobl unwaith yn rhagor, a chredaf fod Peter Black yn anghymeradwyo hynny, fel y gwnawn ninnau. Os yw'r opsiwn yn bodoli, dylai gael ei ystyried; os na wnaiff y Trysorlys wrando arno, y cwbl a wna'r siarad hwn yw rhoi gobaith ffug i bobl y gallai fod rhywbeth ar ddod pe na baent ond yn ysgrifennu llythyr arall. Mae'r Trysorlys wedi cau'r drws yn glep ar y pedwerydd opsiwn, ac ni ddylid felly ei dynnu i mewn i'r ddadl fel pe bai'n bosibl y bydd ar gael y mis nesaf; ni fydd.

**William Graham:** Pa fesurau yr ydych wedi eu cymryd i sicrhau bod landlordiaid a thenantiaid yn ymwybodol o safon ansawdd tai Cymru, a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i'w hyrwyddo?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf fod safon ansawdd tai Cymru ar gyfer 2012 yn un o'r cynlluniau sy'n cael ei hyrwyddo orau. Mae dealltwriaeth ehangach ymysg tenantiaid cyngor o'u hawl i ddisgwyl safon ansawdd tai Cymru ac i brocio eu cynghorwyr lleol neu'r swyddfa dai i ganfod

local councillors or the housing office to find out when the improvements will come about. If the local authority can do it with its own resources and borrowing capability, that is fine and it will do that. If it cannot, it must think very seriously about the alternatives. Many local authorities are going through that process now.

pryd y caiff y gwelliannau eu gwneud. Os gall yr awdurdod lleol wneud hynny gyda'i adnoddau a'i allu benthyca ei hun, mae hynny'n iawn a bydd yn gwneud hynny. Os na all, rhaid iddo feddwl yn ddwys iawn am y posibiladau eraill. Mae llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn mynd drwy'r broses honno ar hyn o bryd.

### **Datblygu Pêl-droed The Development of Football**

**Q10 Glyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement about the development of football in Wales? OAQ1979(FM)

**C10 Glyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygu pêl-droed yng Nghymru? OAQ1979(FM)

**The First Minister:** We continue to provide financial support to the Football Association of Wales Trust via the Sports Council for Wales to develop football in Wales. The emphasis is on increasing youth participation, improving the professionalism of the training of volunteers and coaches, and identifying talented junior players.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn parhau i ddarparu cymorth ariannol i Ymddiriedolaeth Cymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i ddatblygu pêl-droed yng Nghymru. Mae'r pwyslais ar gynyddu cyfranogiad ieuenctid, gwella proffesiynoldeb yr hyfforddiant i wirfoddolwyr a hyfforddwyr, a chanfod chwaraewyr iau dawnus.

**Glyn Davies:** The Welsh Premier League is important in developing football, but I am told that the very existence of many clubs is under threat because of UEFA's demands that they improve their grounds quickly. Some sort of intervention at a high level is needed, either in providing the clubs with financial support or in interceding with UEFA to ensure that it gives a timescale for introducing these improvements or changes the demands altogether. It would require a very high level of intercession, so is there a chance that you as the First Minister of Wales would do that?

**Glyn Davies:** Mae Uwchgynghrair Cymru yn bwysig er mwyn datblygu pêl-droed, ond dywedir wrthyf fod bodolaeth llawer o glybiau mewn perygl am fod UEFA yn mynnu eu bod yn gwella'u safleoedd yn gyflym. Mae angen rhyw fath o ymyrryd ar lefel uchel, un ai i roi cymorth ariannol i'r clybiau neu i eiriol ar UEFA i sicrhau ei fod yn rhoi amser i gyflwyno'r gwelliannau hyn neu ei fod yn newid y gofynion yn gyfan gwbl. Byddai gofyn eiriol ar lefel uchel iawn, felly a oes posibilrwydd y byddech chi fel Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gwneud hynny?

**The First Minister:** We provide money to the Sports Council for Wales to provide money for football in a way that meets our priorities. Ground improvement is important, but it is not half as important as developing talented footballers, improving the professional standards of coaching for young players, and developing the broad base of the pyramid. We do not want to see those priorities switched into ground improvement, as that is a matter for the clubs and for other financial sources.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn rhoi arian i Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i roi arian i bêl-droed mewn ffordd sy'n cyd-fynd â'n blaenoriaethau. Mae gwella safleoedd yn bwysig, ond nid yw hanner cyn bwysiced â datblygu pêl-droedwyr dawnus, gwella safonau proffesiynol yr hyfforddiant i chwaraewyr ifanc, a datblygu sylfaen eang y pyramid. Nid ydym am weld y blaenoriaethau hynny yn newid a'r pwyslais yn cael ei roi ar wella safleoedd, gan mai mater i'r clybiau a ffynonellau ariannol eraill yw hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** You will not need

**Leighton Andrews:** Ni fydd angen eich atgoffa

reminding of who is at the top of the championship at the present time, as I know that you have been to Ninian park this season. However, I will follow Glyn Davies's line in respect of non-league football in Wales—particularly following Tonpentre's victory over the Welsh Cup holders, Rhyl, on Saturday. The issues raised by Glyn Davies in respect of Welsh Premier League clubs are also true of other Welsh league clubs with regard to the need for ground development and support. I welcome what you said about the need to develop young players; however, facilities are key in providing an arena for those young players to perform.

**The First Minister:** I saw the result of the Tonpentre and Rhyl game, and I thought, 'Oh, my God, we are going back to the days of Labour splits; it was bound to happen'. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This referee is not pleased with you shouting from the terraces. [*Laughter.*]

**The First Minister:** I agree that suitable changing rooms, good-quality pitches, floodlights and training facilities—sometimes indoors—are important. Professional clubs will sometimes see that as their role; other times, it may be a role for community and government support. Broadening the base of the pyramid to ensure that footballers can enjoy football—and not only boys' football, but also girls' and women's football—is important, to ensure that as many people as possible can participate in what I know is the No. 1 world game—despite my preference for rugby. It is important that we maximise the chance for everyone in Wales to participate in the game, boys and girls.

pwysydd ar frig y bencampwriaeth ar hyn o bryd, gan fy mod yn gwybod eich bod wedi bod ym mharc Ninian y tymor hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am ddilyn trywydd Glyn Davies ynglŷn â pêl-droed y tu allan i'r gynghrair yng Nghymru—yn enwedig wedi buddugoliaeth Tonpentre dros ddeiliaid Cwpan Cymru, y Rhyl, ddydd Sadwrn. Mae'r materion a godwyd gan Glyn Davies ynghylch clybiau Uwchgynghrair Cymru yn wir hefyd am glybiau cynghreiriaid eraill Cymru o ran yr angen i ddatblygu safleoedd a'r angen am gymorth. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedasoch am yr angen i ddatblygu chwaraewyr ifanc; fodd bynnag, mae cyfleusterau'n allweddol er mwyn darparu arena i'r chwaraewyr ifanc hynny berfformio ynddi.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwelais ganlyniad gêm Tonpentre a'r Rhyl, a meddyliais, 'O'r nefoedd, yr ydym yn mynd yn ôl i ddyddiau rhaniadau Llafur; yr oedd yn sicr o ddigwydd'. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r canolwr hwn yn hapus eich bod yn gweiddi o'r terasau. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno bod ystafelloedd newid addas, caeau o ansawdd da, llifoleuadau a chyfleusterau hyfforddi—dan do weithiau—yn bwysig. Weithiau bydd clybiau proffesiynol yn gweld hynny fel rôl iddynt hwy; dro arall, efallai y bydd yn cael cymorth gan y gymuned neu'r llywodraeth. Mae lledu sylfaen y pyramid i sicrhau bod pêl-droedwyr yn gallu mwynhau pêl-droed—ac nid pêl-droed bechgyn yn unig, ond pêl-droed merched a menywod hefyd—yn bwysig, i sicrhau bod cynifer â phosibl o bobl yn gallu cymryd rhan yn yr hyn sy'n brif gêm y byd, fe wn—er bod yn well gennyf fi rygbi. Mae'n bwysig inni gynyddu i'r eithaf y cyfleoedd i bawb yng Nghymru gymryd rhan yn y gêm, yn fechgyn a merched.

### Gofal i'r Henoed Care for the Elderly

**C11 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth gofal i'r henoed? OAQ2006(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd gan gomisiynydd pobl hŷn Cymru rôl allweddol wrth sicrhau bod llais y defnyddiwr neu'r cwsmer yn cael ei glywed a'i hyrwyddo yn fwy effeithiol o

**Q11 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of care for the elderly? OAQ2006(FM)

**The First Minister:** The commissioner for older people in Wales will have a key role in ensuring that the voice of the user or customer is heard and promoted more effectively with

ran gwasanaethau gofal nag erioed o'r blaen. Cyn bo hir, byddwn yn dod â rheoliadau gerbron y Cynulliad, ac os cânt gefnogaeth y Cynulliad, bydd popeth yn ei le er mwyn apwyntio comisiynydd. Bydd y broses wedi cymryd pedair blynedd, sef holl fywyd y Cynulliad hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod yn gweld rôl benodol i'r comisiynydd wrth ddiogelu hawliau'r henoed a sicrhau eu bod yn cael y ddarpariaeth y maent yn ei haeddu ac sydd ei hangen arnynt. Yn y cyfamser, gan nad oes gennym gomisiynydd ar hyn o bryd, sut y gallwch chi helpu fy etholwyr, sef henoed sir Gaerfyrddin, sy'n gweld y gwasanaeth gofal yn cael ei breifateiddio gan yr awdurdod lleol a chan aelod o'r bwrdd gweithredol sy'n aelod o'ch plaid chi? Sut y gellir diogelu eu hawliau fel eu bod yn cael y gwasanaeth gan yr awdurdod lleol ac yn peidio â gweld cytundebau sydd ar hyn o bryd gan y cyngor lleol yn cael eu trosglwyddo i'r sector preifat, a hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith fod gan yr awdurdod lleol weithwyr profiadol i gynnig y ddarpariaeth honno y mae'r henoed wedi arfer â hi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O ran apwyntio'r comisiynydd, mae gwaith paratoadol eisoes yn mynd rhagddo gan swyddogion, John Griffiths, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros bobl hŷn, a chan Brian Gibbons, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

3.10 p.m.

Yr oeddech yn dweud bod aelod y pwyllgor gwaith o'r un blaid â mi, ac efallai ei fod, ond gall aelodau o'r wrthblaid sydd o'r un blaid â chi ofyn y cwestiwn hwn lle y dylai gael ei ofyn, sef yn siambr Cyngor Sir Gâr.

regard to care services than ever before. Soon, we will be bringing regulations before the Assembly, and if they have the support of the Assembly, everything will be in place for the appointment of the commissioner. The process has taken four years, which is the entire life of this Assembly.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I welcome the fact that you see a specific role for the commissioner in safeguarding the rights of older people and ensuring that they have the provision of care that they need and deserve. In the meantime, as we do not have a commissioner at present, how can you assist my constituents, the older people in Carmarthenshire, who see care services being privatised by the local authority and by a member of the executive board who is a member of your party? How can their rights be safeguarded so that they can get the service from the local authority and do not see contracts that are currently held by the council being transferred to the private sector, despite the fact that the local authority has experienced workers to provide that service to whom older people are accustomed?

**The First Minister:** In terms of the appointment of the commissioner, preparatory work is already being done by officials, by John Griffiths, the Deputy Minister for older people, and by Brian Gibbons, the Minister for Health and Social Services.

You said that the member of the working group is of the same party as me, and perhaps he is, but opposition members of the same party as you should ask this question in the appropriate place: the chamber of Carmarthenshire County Council.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

*The Deputy Presiding Officer has determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration:*

*Mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i bwyllgor pwnc am ystyriaeth estynedig:*

<i>The Cereal Seed (Wales) and Fodder Plant Seed (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006</i>	<i>Rheoliadau Hadau Grawnfwyd (Cymru) a Phlanhigion Porthiant (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006</i>
<i>The Diseases of Animals (Approved Disinfectants) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2006</i>	<i>Gorchymyn Clefydau Anifeiliaid (Diheintyddion a Gymeradwywyd) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006</i>
<i>The Education (Assisted Places) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006</i>	<i>Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006</i>
<i>The Education (Assisted Places) (Incidental Expenses) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006</i>	<i>Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Mân Dreuliau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006</i>
<i>The Healthy Start Scheme (Description of Healthy Start Food) (Wales) Regulations 2006</i>	<i>Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Cychwyn Iach (Disgrifio Bwydydd Cychwyn Iach) (Cymru) 2006</i>
<i>The National Assembly for Wales (Returning Officers' Charges) Order 2006.</i>	<i>Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau Swyddogion Canlyniadau) 2006.</i>

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have no changes to report to this week's business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which is available to Members on the agenda.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Nid oes gennyf ddim newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10, so I ask the Minister to propose the business statement formally.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Janet Ryder:** I am pleased that we will, at last, get to debate the Graham review. However, it is now five months since Heather Graham published her report. I am sure that we all remember how the Rees report on funding full-time students was received, and the amount of publicity and debate time in the Chamber that was given to that. Part-time students constitute a far larger section of the student body, and can perhaps be argued to have a greater impact on Wales's economic development, as they need to retrain and want to improve their qualifications for career progression. They are often at home because of family commitments, and cannot afford to do a full-time course. It would have been nice to hold that debate slightly before

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn falch y byddwn, o'r diwedd, yn cael cyfle i drafod adolygiad Graham. Fodd bynnag, mae pum mis erbyn hyn ers i Heather Graham gyhoeddi ei hadroddiad. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cofio'r derbyniad a gafodd adroddiad Rees am gyllido myfyrwyr llawnamser, a faint o gyhoeddusrwydd ac amser trafod yn y Siambr a roddwyd i hynny. Mae myfyrwyr rhan-amser yn gyfran lawer mwy o'r holl fyfyrwyr, a gellid dadlau efallai eu bod yn cael llawer mwy o effaith ar ddatblygiad economaidd Cymru, gan fod angen iddynt ailhyfforddi a'u bod am wella eu cymwysterau er mwyn hyrwyddo'u gyrfa. Yn aml maent gartref oherwydd ymrwymadau teuluol, ac ni allant fforddio gwneud cwrs llawnamser. Byddai wedi bod yn braf cynnal y

the new year, which is when it now seems to be timetabled. However, I am pleased that that is listed.

I am also pleased that you will publish a written statement in response to revelations this morning by a senior health director who resigned his post in Wales because he was frustrated by how health services are governed centrally. He claimed, especially, that cancer services in Swansea had been left underresourced. I understand that we will have a written statement on that later this week. However, it would have been nice to have an oral statement on that—and it seems as though there is plenty of slack in our timetable today.

My main concern relates to the written statement to be issued on the Wales Screen Commission, which definitely should have been for oral response in the Chamber. That seems to go against the Government's policies of spreading jobs out of Cardiff into the regions, because what you are doing is bringing jobs from north, mid and west Wales into Cardiff—you are centralising. That displays the Government's reaction to the rest of Wales, and shows a Cardiff-centric Government mentality in this. That should have been given air on the floor of the Chamber. Because of that, we will object to this statement.

**Lisa Francis:** We acknowledge what you have agreed to today, Business Minister, but, like Janet Ryder we are extremely disappointed that we cannot have an oral statement on the Wales Screen Commission. That issue has not just been flagged up by the press today; it has been brewing for a long time, and has been raised by many other Assembly Members besides me. Your Government needs to be held properly to account for any changes or restructuring plans that it has in mind for the Wales Screen Commission. There has apparently been a review and a consultation, yet the Wales Screen Commission staff do not know the outcomes. Gwynedd Council, which is a funding partner of the Wales Screen Commission, claims not to have been

ddadl honno ychydig cyn y flwyddyn newydd, sef yr adeg y mae'n cael ei hamserlennu erbyn hyn yn ôl pob golwg. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch ei bod ar y rhestr.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch y byddwch yn cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig mewn ymateb i'r hyn a ddatgelwyd y bore yma gan uwch gyfarwyddwr iechyd sydd wedi ymddiswyddo o'i swydd yng Nghymru oherwydd ei rwystredigaeth â'r ffordd y mae'r gwasanaethau iechyd yn cael eu llywodraethu'n ganolog. Honnodd, yn arbennig, fod y gwasanaethau canser yn Abertawe wedi cael eu gadael heb adnoddau digonol. Deallaf y byddwn yn cael datganiad ysgrifenedig am hynny yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon. Fodd bynnag, byddai wedi bod yn braf cael datganiad llafar am hynny—ac mae'n ymddangos bod digonedd o le yn ein hamserlen heddiw.

Mae a wnelo fy mhryder pennaf â'r datganiad ysgrifenedig sydd i gael ei gyhoeddi am Gomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru, a ddylai yn bendant fod wedi bod yn destun ymateb llafar yn y Siambr. Mae'n ymddangos ei fod yn mynd yn groes i bolisiâu'r Llywodraeth o ledaenu swyddi allan o Gaerdydd i'r rhanbarthau, oherwydd yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud yw dod â swyddi o ogledd, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru i Gaerdydd—yr ydych yn canoli. Mae hynny'n dangos ymateb y Llywodraeth i weddill Cymru, ac yn dangos meddylfryd Caerdydd-ganolog y Llywodraeth yn hyn o beth. Dylai hynny fod wedi cael ei wyntyllu ar lawr y Siambr. Oherwydd hynny, byddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad hwn.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr ydym yn cydnabod yr hyn yr ydych wedi cydsynio ag ef heddiw, Drefnydd, ond, fel Janet Ryder yr ydym yn eithriadol o siomedig na allwn gael datganiad llafar am Gomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru. Nid rhyw fater y tynnwyd sylw ato yn y wasg heddiw ydyw; mae wedi bod yn cyniwair ers tro byd, ac mae wedi cael ei godi gan lawer o Aelodau Cynulliad eraill ar wahân i mi. Mae angen i'ch Llywodraeth gael ei galw i gyfrif yn briodol am unrhyw newidiadau neu gynlluniau ailstrwythuro sydd ganddi mewn golwg ar gyfer Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru. Mae'n debyg bod adolygiad ac ymgynghoriad wedi cael eu cynnal, ond ni w'yr staff Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru beth yw'r canlyniadau. Mae Cyngor Gwynedd, sy'n un o bartneriaid cyllido Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru, yn honni nad ymgynghorwyd ag ef o

consulted at all.

Over the years since 2002, the Wales Screen Commission has developed expertise and contacts to deal with 310 major productions. Your unwillingness to give an oral statement on this issue perpetuates the lack of credible proof that moving or restructuring this important organisation provides any economic benefits to Wales. What will happen to jobs in Caernarfon, Aberystwyth and Llandeilo? The Minister needs to be properly held to account on this issue. A written statement sweeps the issue under the carpet, and that is just not on.

**Kirsty Williams:** I, too, am disappointed that the Minister is unable to give an oral statement on the relocation of the Wales Screen Commission, despite what is a seemingly slack timetable this afternoon; there is certainly not a lack of time. The written statement, as we have just heard, is not appropriate, and does not give Members who have concerns about this particular issue the opportunity to question the Minister on the content of that statement. Therefore, the Welsh Liberal Democrats will not be able to support the business statement until an oral statement is brought to the Chamber on this important commission, which is working in an important and growing sector in Wales, both in terms of economic development and in promoting the culture of Wales.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I know that you were taken aback at our last meeting when you lost a vote that you thought that you were going to win. Let us see how it goes today. As always, this goes back to the issue of why you are opposing a business statement that gives so much. As you said, Janet, we are agreeing to a debate on the Graham report and you will have an opportunity to discuss it on 22 November, when it goes to committee and the Minister will be taking recommendations on the Graham report. Therefore, not only will there be a debate, but an opportunity to discuss this in committee. You have united in trying to find some reason why you have to oppose the business statement, as you are all here: come on.

gwbl.

Dros y blynyddoedd ers 2002, mae Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru wedi datblygu arbenigedd a chysylltiadau i ddelio â 310 o gynrychiadau mawr. Mae eich amharodrwydd i roi datganiad llafar ar y mater yn golygu nad oes prawf credadwy o hyd y bydd symud neu ailstrwythuro'r sefydliad pwysig hwn yn dod ag unrhyw fudd economaidd i Gymru. Beth fydd yn digwydd i swyddi yng Nghaernarfon, Aberystwyth a Llandeilo? Mae angen i'r Gweinidog gael ei alw i gyfrif yn briodol ar y mater hwn. Mae datganiad ysgrifenedig yn ysgubo'r mater o dan y carped, ac nid yw hynny'n ddigon da.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf finnau, hefyd, yn siomedig na all y Gweinidog roi datganiad llafar am adleoli Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru, er gwaethaf yr hyn sy'n ymddangos yn amserlen ddigon ysgafn y prynhawn yma; yn sicr, nid oes prinder amser. Nid yw'r datganiad ysgrifenedig, fel yr ydym newydd glywed, yn briodol, ac nid yw'n rhoi cyfle i Aelodau sydd â phryderon yn ymwneud â'r mater penodol hwn ofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â chynnwys y datganiad hwn. O ganlyniad, ni fydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n gallu cefnogi'r datganiad busnes hyd nes y ceir datganiad llafar yn y Siambr ar y comisiwn pwysig hwn, sy'n gweithio mewn sector pwysig sydd ar gynnydd yng Nghymru, o safbwynt datblygu economaidd ac o safbwynt hybu diwylliant Cymru.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Gwn eich bod wedi cael sioc yn ein cyfarfod diwethaf pan gollasoch bleidlais yr oeddech yn meddwl y byddech yn ei hennill. Cawn weld sut y bydd pethau'n mynd heddiw. Yr un fath ag arfer, mae hyn yn mynd yn ôl at y cwestiwn pam yr ydych yn gwrthwynebu datganiad busnes sy'n rhoi cymaint. Fel y dywedasoch, Janet, yr ydym yn cytuno i gynnal dadl ar adroddiad Graham a byddwch yn cael cyfle i'w drafod ar 22 Tachwedd, pan fydd yn mynd gerbron y pwyllgor a phan fydd y Gweinidog yn cael argymhellion ar adroddiad Graham. Felly, yn ogystal â dadl, bydd cyfle i drafod y mater yn y pwyllgor. Yr ydych wedi dod at eich gilydd i geisio dod o hyd i ryw reswm pam mae'n rhaid ichi wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes, gan eich bod i gyd yma: dewch ymlaen.

Let us look at this: there is a question to Andrew Davies tomorrow afternoon on the Wales Screen Commission from one of our Liberal Democrat colleagues. It is quite high up on the agenda, so I am sure that the Presiding Officer will ensure that it is reached tomorrow afternoon. There is also a written statement. What more can you want in openness and transparency? This goes back to the vulture politics—the First Minister has coined that phrase for us—that we, unfortunately, see in response to the goodwill that I as Business Minister have, as usual, demonstrated to you today. It would be nice, before Christmas, if you are all here, for you all to back us. We will see.

Gadewch inni edrych ar hyn: ceir cwestiwn i Andrew Davies brynhawn yfory ar Gomisiwn Sgrîn Cymru gan un o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae'n bur uchel ar yr agenda, felly yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Llywydd yn sicrhau ein bod yn ei gyrraedd brynhawn yfory. Ceir datganiad ysgrifenedig hefyd. Faint rhagor y gallwch ddymuno'i gael o ran bod yn agored a thryloywder? Mae hyn yn mynd yn ôl at y wleidyddiaeth fwlturaidd—ymadrodd a fathwyd gan y Prif Weinidog—a welwn, yn anffodus, mewn ymateb i'r ewyllys da yr wyf fi fel Trefnydd, fel arfer, wedi ei ddangos tuag atoch heddiw. Byddai'n braf, cyn y Nadolig, os byddwch i gyd yma, pe baech i gyd yn ein cefnogi. Cawn weld.

*Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.*

*Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion defeated.*



**Cymeradwyo Deddwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25**  
**Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tatws Hadyd (Ffioedd) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006; a*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006 on the draft the Seed Potatoes (Fees) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tatws Hadyd (Ffioedd) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*2. approves that the Seed Potatoes (Fees) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:*

*a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006; a*

*a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006; and*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006. (NDM3283)*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006. (NDM3283)*

*Cynnig (NDM3283): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NDM3283): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William

Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tatws Hadyd (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Seed Potatoes (Wales) Regulations 2006**

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** **The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that  
 Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Tatws Hadyd (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006. (NDM3284)*

*considers the principle of the Seed Potatoes (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006. (NDM3284)*

Cynigiaf fod

I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tatws Hadyd (Cymru) 2006; a*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006 in relation to the draft the Seed Potatoes (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tatws Hadyd (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006. (NDM3285)

**Kirsty Williams:** The Minister will be aware that three years ago to tomorrow saw the outbreak of potato ring rot at Middlewood Farm in my constituency. He will also be aware that some of the Orders before us today relate to the labelling of seed potatoes that are imported into this country. He will be aware that the seed potatoes in this particular case were imported from a Dutch company. While many people will have forgotten about the outbreak at Middlewood, the proprietors of that business have not, and are still dealing with its financial consequences. Could you outline what progress you have been able to make with your colleagues at the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs in London with regard to pursuing the case for compensation for Middlewood Farm? Also, what discussions have you had with your counterparts in the Dutch Government and with the Dutch ambassador with regard to the importation of these infected seed potatoes?

3.20 p.m.

You will be aware that there is ministerial discretion with regards to compensation for plant diseases; therefore it is in your gift, or in the gift of your counterpart in London, to compensate the family for their losses. You will be aware that the family followed every rule and regulation as soon as this outbreak was found: they informed plant health officials and co-operated fully with the clean-up operation at the farm. You met the family and generously ensured that the clean-up costs were covered by the Welsh Assembly Government, for which the family and I are grateful. At that meeting, you stated that once all legal avenues had been exhausted, you would be prepared to look again at the case. I am aware that there are ongoing cases that are due to be looked at again in December.

2. approves that the draft the Seed Potatoes (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006. (NDM3285)

**Kirsty Williams:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol mai dair blynedd yn ôl i yfory y canfuwyd yr achos o bydredd cylch mewn tatws ar Fferm Middlewood yn fy etholaeth. Bydd yn ymwybodol hefyd fod rhai o'r Gorchmynion sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn ymwneud â labelu tatws hadyd sy'n cael eu mewnfario i'r wlad hon. Bydd yn ymwybodol bod y tatws hadyd yn yr achos penodol hwn wedi eu mewnfario o'r Iseldiroedd. Bydd llawer o bobl wedi anghofio am yr achos yn Middlewood, ond nid yw perchnogion y busnes wedi ei anghofio, ac maent yn dal i ddelio â'i ganlyniadau ariannol. A wnewch amlinellu pa gynnydd yr ydych wedi llwyddo i'w wneud gyda'ch cyd-aelodau yn Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn Llundain o ran ceisio cael iawndal i Fferm Middlewood? Yn ychwanegol at hyn, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cynnal gyda'ch swyddogion cyfatebol yn Llywodraeth yr Iseldiroedd a chyda llysgennad yr Iseldiroedd ynglŷn â mewnfario'r tatws hadyd heintiedig hyn?

Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gan Weinidogion ddisgresiwn ynglŷn ag iawndal am glefydau planhigion; felly chi, neu'r swyddog cyfatebol yn Llundain, sydd â'r hawl i benderfynu ynglŷn ag iawndal i'r teulu. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y teulu wedi dilyn pob rheol a rheoliad cyn gynted ag y canfuwyd yr achos hwn: rhoesant wybod i swyddogion iechyd planhigion a chydweithredu'n llwyr â'r gwaith glanhau ar y fferm. Yr ydych wedi cyfarfod y teulu ac wedi cytuno'n garedig iawn y byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n talu am y gwaith glanhau, ac mae'r teulu a minnau'n ddiolchgar am hynny. Yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, dywedasoeh y byddech yn barod i ailedrych ar yr achos pan fyddai'r materion cyfreithiol wedi eu cwblhau. Gwn fod achosion cyfredol sydd i fod i gael eu hailystyried ym mis Rhagfyr. Ar ôl canlyniad yr

Following the outcome of those cases, if the family is still suffering financial loss, I would be grateful if you were to agree to meet again with my constituents and look again at the case for compensation, either from the Welsh Assembly Government or, if it is more appropriate, from the Westminster Government, for the losses endured by Middlewood Farm during the potato ring rot outbreak three years ago.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I am, of course, aware of the difficulties caused by the ring rot outbreak. You are right to say that we met and that we waived certain costs at the time. The matter is still being pursued through the courts—we understand that the matter is in the hands of the National Farmers' Union. In terms of what we have done, the matter has been raised with the Dutch embassy in London and in the Netherlands via the British ambassador. It is primarily a commercial matter between Mr Morgan and the suppliers, therefore, at this stage, I would not want to make any kind of commitment, other than to say that I will keep an eye on what happens with the legal processes. We shall have to wait and see what is the result of those processes. As you know, we have met on this matter before and if there is any possibility of progress for Mr Morgan, I will look at having another meeting, but that is a big 'if'—it is only fair to say that at this time. We will wait to see what happens with the legal processes that are going through at the moment.

achosion hynny, os bydd y teulu'n dal i ddioddef colled ariannol, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn cytuno i gyfarfod fy etholwyr eto ac edrych unwaith yn rhagor ar yr achos dros iawndal, naill ai gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru neu, os yw'n fwy priodol, gan y Llywodraeth yn Llundain, am y colledion a gafwyd yn Fferm Middlewood yn ystod yr achos o bydredd cylch mewn tatws dair blynedd yn ôl.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Yr wyf, wrth gwrs, yn ymwybodol o'r anawsterau y mae'r achos o bydredd cylch wedi eu hachosi. Mae'n wir ein bod wedi cyfarfod a'n bod wedi rhoi rhai costau o'r neilltu ar y pryd. Mae'r mater yn dal i fynd drwy'r llysoedd—deallwn fod y mater yn nwylo Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr. O ran yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei wneud, mae'r mater wedi ei godi gyda llysgenhadaeth yr Iseldiroedd yn Llundain ac yn yr Iseldiroedd drwy lysgennad Prydain. Mater masnachol ydyw yn bennaf rhwng Mr Morgan a'r cyflenwyr, felly, ar hyn o bryd, ni fyddwn am wneud dim math o ymrwymiad, ar wahân i ddweud y byddaf yn cadw golwg ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'r prosesau cyfreithiol. Bydd yn rhaid inni aros i weld beth yw canlyniad y prosesau hyn. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym eisoes wedi cyfarfod i drafod y mater hwn ac os oes unrhyw bosibilrwydd bod pethau'n symud yn eu blaenau i Mr Morgan, byddaf yn ystyried cynnal cyfarfod arall, ond mae hwnnw'n 'os' mawr—mae'n rhaid imi ddweud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Byddwn yn aros i weld beth sy'n digwydd gyda'r prosesau cyfreithiol yr ydym yn eu canol ar hyn o bryd.

*Cynnig (NDM3284): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3284): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David

Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3285): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3285): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwaith Stryd (Adfer) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, a  
Chymeradwyo'r Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways  
Second Edition 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29  
Approval of the Street Works (Reinstatement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations  
2006, and Approval of the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in  
Highways Second Edition 2006 under Standing Order No. 29**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Street Works (Reinstatement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 3 October 2006. (NDM3286)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006 in relation to the draft the Street Works (Reinstatement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Street Works (Reinstatement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 3 October 2006;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 3 October 2006; and*

*c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006. (NDM3287)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii):*

*considers the principle of the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways Second Edition 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office on 3 October 2006. (NDM3288)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee in relation to the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways Second Edition 2006 laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2006; and*

*2. acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwaith Stryd (Adfer) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Hydref 2006. (NDM3286)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Gwaith Stryd (Adfer) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Gwaith Stryd (Adfer) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Hydref 2006;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Hydref 2006; ac*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006. (NDM3287)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii):*

*yn ystyried egwyddor the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways Second Edition 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Hydref 2006. (NDM3288)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ynghylch the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways Second Edition 2006 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2006; a*

*2. gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif*

*approves the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways Second Edition 2006 made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 3 October 2006. (NDM3289)*

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes neb am siarad ar yr eitemau hyn, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

*29.3 (iii) yn cymeradwyo bod the Specification for the Reinstatement of Openings in Highways Second Edition 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Hydref 2006. (NDM3289)*

**The Presiding Officer:** No-one wishes to speak on these items, therefore, we move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3286): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3286): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet



Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3287): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3287): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3288): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3288): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3289): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3289): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo'r Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals  
 (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006 a Rheoliadau Ffliw Adar (Brechu) (Cymru) (Rhif 2)  
 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27(iv)**

**Approval of the Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals  
 (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006 and the Avian Influenza (Vaccination) (Wales) (No. 2)  
 Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv)**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006. (NDM3290)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor the Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006. (NDM3290)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*approves that the Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006. (NDM3291)*

*yn cymeradwyo bod the Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006. (NDM3291)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Avian Influenza (Vaccination) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006. (NDM3292)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Ffliw Adar (Brechu) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006. (NDM3292)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*approves that the Avian Influenza (Vaccination) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006. (NDM3293)*

The Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006 implements in part community decisions that have already been taken. This piece of legislation contains important measures to control avian influenza. The Avian Influenza (Vaccination) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 contains measures for the delivery of vaccination, should it become necessary.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Minister, I have a few questions. Will you clarify whether the decision to vaccinate requires UK Ministers to be in agreement on that course of action?

There are no rendering or incineration providers for the disposal of birds listed in Wales. Have you considered what alternatives we will have in the event of an outbreak? Are you considering landfill sites, and, if so, which ones? How will you mitigate against the obvious risk of moving infected carcasses long distances?

I understand that vaccine has been delivered to the UK, but that none is specifically for Wales. How will Welsh flocks gain access to the vaccine, and what mechanism will be in place to ensure that vaccine will be available to us if needed?

Finally, what guidance is available to flock keepers about the measures that they can take if housing their birds is impractical, and what steps are you taking to locate flocks of fewer than 50 birds? Plaid Cymru will support these regulations, but we would appreciate clarification of those points.

**Brynle Williams:** Avian influenza is a deeply serious threat, and it is now more a matter of when, rather than if, it will affect Britain. That is why it is important for the Government to have the powers to monitor for the disease and to react as quickly as

*yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Ffliw Adar (Brechu) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006. (NDM3293)*

Mae'r Avian Influenza and Influenza of Avian Origin in Mammals (Wales) (No. 2) Order 2006 yn gweithredu'n rhannol benderfyniadau gan y gymuned sydd wedi eu gwneud yn barod. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn cynnwys mesurau pwysig er mwyn rheoli ffliw adar. Mae Rheoliadau Ffliw Adar (Brechu) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006 yn cynnwys mesurau ar gyfer darparu brechiad, pe bai angen.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Weinidog, mae gennyf ychydig o gwestiynau. A wnewch egluro a yw'r penderfyniad i frechu yn golygu bod yn rhaid i Weinidogion y DU fod yn gytûn mai dyna sydd angen ei wneud?

Nid oes darparwyr rendro a llosgi ar gyfer cael gwared ag adar wedi eu rhestru yng Nghymru. A ydych wedi ystyried pa ddewisiadau eraill a fydd gennym os ceir achos o ffliw adar? A ydych yn ystyried safleoedd tirlenwi, ac, os ydych, pa rai? Sut y byddwch yn lleihau'r perygl amlwg wrth gludo cyrff heintiedig yn bell?

Deallaf fod brechlyn wedi ei ddanfôn i'r DU, ond nad oes dim ar gyfer Cymru'n benodol. Sut y bydd pobl sy'n cadw adar yng Nghymru'n gallu cael gafael ar y brechlyn, a pha fecanwaith a fydd yn bodoli er mwyn sicrhau y bydd brechlyn ar gael inni os bydd angen?

Yn olaf, pa ganllawiau sydd ar gael i bobl sy'n cadw adar ynglŷn â'r camau y gallant eu cymryd os nad yw'n ymarferol iddynt gadw'u hadar dan do, a pha gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd er mwyn dod o hyd i bobl sydd â llai na 50 o adar? Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, ond byddem yn gwerthfawrogi eglurhad ar y pwyntiau hynny.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae ffliw adar yn fygythiad difrifol iawn, ac erbyn hyn mae'n fwy o gwestiwn pryd y bydd yn effeithio ar Brydain, yn hytrach nag os gwnaiff hynny. Dyna pam mae'n bwysig bod gan y Llywodraeth y pwerau i fonitro ar gyfer y clwy ac i ymateb cyn gynted

possible to contain it. That is why I will support these measures today.

At the same time, the poultry industry needs to be vigilant. Veterinary workers must inform the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs of any suspicious cases as soon as possible. Public health is everyone's first priority. However, people also need reassurance and to be informed about the risks and any practical steps that they can take, for example, should they come across a dead bird in the garden, or if pets come into contact with wild birds. We have to avoid a situation whereby, because of a lack of understanding, vigilante action is taken against wild birds and their nests, or there is an unjustified boycott of safe eggs and chicken meat, as was, unfortunately, seen elsewhere in the UK last year.

I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will take a lead on this matter, while preparing to deal with the disease, so that the public is reassured and can have faith in the Government's biosecurity measures.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support both pieces of legislation. We have raised many issues regarding vaccination and the processes required to have preventative vaccination and vaccination in zones. The matter of vaccine stocks is important, Minister. Will you give us some indication as to how many doses will be available to producers in Wales?

Can you clarify when you will have the power to declare a preventative zone, and what will be the process by which you and Ministers in England will ensure that cross-border flocks are well catered for and that there will be no breakdown in biosecurity should an outbreak occur on the border?

3.30 p.m.

The Government has argued that vaccination is costly and labour-intensive. A great many of those who keep smaller flocks, particular of rare breeds, have always considered the Government's attitude towards preventative

ag y bo modd er mwyn ei reoli. Dyna pam y byddaf yn cefnogi'r mesurau hyn heddiw.

Yr un pryd, mae angen i'r diwydiant dofednod fod yn wylidwrus. Rhaid i weithwyr milfeddygol hysbysu Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig cyn gynted ag y bo modd os ydynt yn amau eu bod wedi canfod achos o ffliw adar. Iechyd y cyhoedd yw'r brif flaenoriaeth i bawb. Fodd bynnag, mae angen tawelu ofnau pobl hefyd a'u hysbysu ynglŷn â'r peryglon ac unrhyw gamau ymarferol y gallant eu cymryd, er enghraifft, pe baent yn dod o hyd i aderyn wedi marw yn yr ardd, neu os bydd anifeiliaid anwes yn dod i gysylltiad ag adar gwyllt. Rhaid inni osgoi sefyllfa lle y cymerir camau answyddogol, oherwydd diffyg dealltwriaeth, yn erbyn adar gwyllt a'u nythod, neu pan fo pobl yn boicotio wyau a chig cywion ieir diogel, heb ddim cyfiawnhad, fel y gwelwyd, yn anffodus, mewn lleoedd eraill yn y DU y llynedd.

Hyderaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dangos arweiniad ar y mater hwn, wrth baratoi i ddelio â'r clefyd, fel bod y cyhoedd yn dawelach eu meddwl ac fel bod ganddynt ffydd ym mesurau bioddiogelwch y Llywodraeth.

**Mick Bates:** Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r ddwy ddeddfwriaeth. Yr ydym wedi codi llawer o faterion yn ymwneud â brechu a'r prosesau sydd eu hangen er mwyn cael brechu ataliol a brechu mewn parthau. Mae'r cwestiwn ynglŷn â chyflenwadau o'r brechlyn yn bwysig, Weinidog. A wnewch roi rhyw syniad inni faint o ddosau a fydd ar gael i gynhyrchwyr yng Nghymru?

A allwch egluro pa bryd y bydd gennych yr hawl i gyhoeddi parth ataliol, a beth fydd y broses a ddilynir gennych chi a Gweinidogion yn Lloegr er mwyn sicrhau bod darpariaeth dda ar gyfer heidiau trawsffiniol ac na fydd bioddiogelwch yn mynd i'r gwellt pe bai achos yn digwydd ar y ffin?

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dadlau bod brechu'n gostus a llafurddwys. Mae llawer iawn o'r rhai sy'n cadw heidiau llai, yn enwedig heidiau o fridiau prin, wedi teimlo erioed fod agwedd y Llywodraeth tuag at frechu ataliol yn cael ei

vaccination as being governed by the larger companies rather than the smaller flock owners. Can you put their minds at rest and assure them that, should an outbreak occur, you will take their situation into account when you decide where preventative vaccine zones would be used?

Can you give us an indication—and this is a bit of a gory question, really—of what the process would be were these massive flocks, of perhaps 100,000 birds, to be slaughtered? How would that take place and what would the logistics be? On the point that Jocelyn raised, where would the slaughtered poultry carcasses end up?

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** There were several detailed questions there. We in the National Assembly would take the decision to vaccinate, upon the recommendation of the State Veterinary Service. In terms of rendering and disposal facilities, we have to consider this on a GB basis, not a Wales-only basis. We could not dispose of the carcasses that were produced as a result of the foot and mouth disease outbreak and were reliant on landfill sites in England to take carcasses from Wales. Across GB, there is sufficient capacity to deal with an outbreak of avian influenza on the sort of scale that we would expect, but we cannot look at that simply at a Welsh level. Therefore, I have not considered any particular landfill sites in Wales, nor have any particular designations been given to landfill sites in terms of dealing with that.

On vaccine stocks, we have to remember that the State Veterinary Service is a GB-wide body. The State Veterinary Service would hold the stocks and would distribute them according to where they are needed. It means that no specific stock is allocated to Wales; a stock is allocated for the whole of GB and, therefore, vaccine will be made available as and when it is required, even though the decision to vaccinate is a matter for the National Assembly.

In terms of bird flocks under 50 in size, we have encouraged people—

rheoli gan y cwmnïau mawr yn hytrach na chan berchenogion yr heidiau bach. A allwch dawelu eu pryderon a'u sicrhau, pe ceid achos o'r fflw, y byddwch yn ystyried eu sefyllfa hwy pan fyddwch yn penderfynu ym mhle y byddid yn defnyddio parthau brechu ataliol?

A allwch roi rhyw syniad inni—ac mae hwn yn gwestiwn braidd yn waedlyd, a dweud y gwir—ynghylch y broses a ddilynid pe bai'r heidiau anferth hyn, gyda chynifer â 100,000 o adar, efallai, yn gorfod cael eu lladd? Sut yr eid ati i wneud hynny, a beth fyddai'r logisteg? Ynglŷn â'r pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan Jocelyn, ym mhle y byddai carcasai'r dofednod a leddir yn y diwedd?

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Mae sawl cwestiwn manwl yma. Byddem ni yma yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu a ddylid brechu, ar sail argymhelliad y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol. O ran cyfleusterau rendro a gwaredu, rhaid inni edrych ar hyn ar lefel Prydain Fawr, yn hytrach na Chymru'n unig. Nid oeddem yn gallu cael gwared â'r carcasai a gynhyrchwyd o ganlyniad i'r achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau ac yr oeddem yn ddibynnol ar safleoedd tirlenwi yn Lloegr i dderbyn carcasai o Gymru. Ar draws Prydain Fawr, bydd cyfleusterau ar gael i ymdopi ag achos o fflw adar ar y raddfa y byddem yn ei disgwyl, ond ni allwn edrych ar hyn ar lefel Cymru'n unig. Felly, nid wyf wedi ystyried dim safleoedd tirlenwi penodol yng Nghymru, ac nid oes dim dynodiadau wedi eu rhoi i safleoedd tirlenwi o ran delio â hynny.

O ran y stoc o frechiadau, rhaid inni gofio bod y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol yn gorff sy'n gweithredu ar lefel Prydain gyfan. Byddai'r Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol yn cadw'r stoc ac yn ei dosbarthu i ble bynnag y bydd ei hangen. Mae hynny'n golygu nad oes stoc benodol wedi'i neilltuo i Gymru; mae'r stoc yn cael ei neilltuo i Brydain gyfan ac, felly, bydd y brechiadau ar gael os bydd eu hangen a phan fydd eu hangen, er mai mater i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw'r penderfyniad i frechu.

O ran heidiau sy'n cynnwys llai na 50 o adar, yr ydym wedi annog pobl—

**Mick Bates:** Will you give way?

**Carwyn Jones:** I will in a second.

Since the beginning of this year and the original discovery of the bird at Cellardyke in Scotland, we have encouraged people to voluntarily register flocks of under 50 with us. We continue to make that point and there is a phone number that people can call to register their flocks. We have also made it clear that if there were a serious outbreak of avian influenza, people might be expected to house their flocks relatively quickly. That is not as easy as it sounds, as many flocks are free range and cannot easily be kept indoors for any great length of time without some notice being given to their owners. We have made that clear since the beginning of the year.

**Mick Bates:** Returning to vaccine stocks, I accept what you say about the GB basis, but have you had any contact with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs to discuss the potential need in Wales? Therefore, can you give us an indication of how many doses you would need in Wales were you to establish a vaccination zone?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is impossible to give such a figure in the same way that it is impossible to give a figure as to how many doses would be needed until you see what the scale of the outbreak is. Our chief veterinary officer, working with the other two chief veterinary officers in GB, have ensured that enough stocks are available to deal with an outbreak on the level that we would expect, but it is impossible to predict how much vaccine you would need, given that it is impossible to know how many birds would need to be vaccinated.

**Brynle Williams:** Will you give way?

**Carwyn Jones:** I will just finish this point and then I will come back to you.

It is also worth emphasising that vaccination is not a panacea for avian influenza. The concern of the veterinarians is that, if you over-vaccinate, it is possible that you might hide the disease in certain flocks. Vaccination

**Mick Bates:** A ildiwch?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwnaf, mewn eiliad.

Ers dechrau'r flwyddyn pan ddarganfuwyd yr aderyn am y tro cyntaf yn Cellardyke yn yr Alban, yr ydym wedi annog pobl i gofrestru eu heidiau o lai na 50 o adar gyda ni'n wirfoddol. Yr ydym yn parhau i bwysleisio hynny ac mae rhif ffôn ar gael i bobl ei ddefnyddio i gofrestru eu heidiau. Yr ydym wedi ei gwneud yn amlwg hefyd pe ceid achos difrifol o ffliw adar, y byddai disgwyl i bobl gadw eu heidiau o dan do yn weddol gyflym. Nid yw hynny mor rhwydd ag y mae'n swnio, gan fod llawer o'r heidiau'n adar maes ac ni ellir eu cadw'n hawdd o dan do am amser hir heb i'w perchenogion gael rhywfaint o rybudd. Yr ydym wedi pwysleisio hynny ers dechrau'r flwyddyn.

**Mick Bates:** Gan ddychwelyd at y stoc o frechiadau, derbynïaf yr hyn a ddywedasoich am weithredu ar lefel Prydain gyfan, ond a ydych wedi cael unrhyw gysylltiad ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i drafod yr angen posibl yng Nghymru? Felly, a allwch roi awgrym inni ynghylch sawl dos y byddai ei angen yng Nghymru pe baech yn pennu parth brechu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n amhosibl rhoi ffigur o'r fath yn yr un modd ag y mae'n amhosibl rhoi ffigur ar gyfer faint o ddoesau y byddai eu hangen hyd nes ein bod yn gwybod beth yw maint yr haint. Mae ein prif swyddog milfeddygol, mewn cydweithrediad â'r ddau brif swyddog milfeddygol arall ym Mhrydain, wedi ein sicrhau bod stoc ddigonol ar gael i ddelio ag achos ar y lefel y byddem yn ei disgwyl, ond mae'n amhosibl rhagweld faint o frechlyn y byddai ei angen, gan nad oes modd gwybod faint o adar y byddai angen eu brechu.

**Brynle Williams:** A ildiwch?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf am orffen y pwynt hwn ac yna dof yn ôl atoch.

Mae'n werth pwysleisio hefyd nad yw brechu'n ateb llwyr ar gyfer ffliw adar. Pryder y milfeddygon yw, pe baem yn brechu'n ormodol, fod perygl y byddai'r clefyd yn cael ei guddio mewn rhai heidiau. Mae brechu'n gallu bod yn



has a role but we cannot use vaccination as a preventative measure for all bird flocks. Rather, it would be used as a way of creating a boundary, a firebreak, around infected flocks in order to buy time. However, there is a risk that, if vaccination is used, it could mask the symptoms of the disease.

**Brynle Williams:** We would look after the major commercial flocks, as far as vaccination to safeguard food to the nation is concerned, but it concerns me that we also have many rare and small, hobby flocks. The bloodlines of some of those breeds could disappear forever. Can we have some assurance that some of the minority breeds will also be looked at, because they need to be preserved?

**Carwyn Jones:** That is something that would be looked at by us and the veterinarians, in the same way as birds in zoos will be looked at, possibly as a special case. For those who remember the foot and mouth disease outbreak in 2001, there was a proposal at one stage to vaccinate rare breeds if the disease went beyond a certain level—thankfully, that did not happen. That factor would be considered before a decision was taken as to how many birds should be vaccinated, and where they should be vaccinated.

Preventative vaccination is probably impossible, as the disease is airborne and can be carried by birds. Foot and mouth disease, outside of the episodes that involved pigs, could only be carried over very short distances, and was mainly carried by physical movement or contact between animals. We cannot regulate the migration patterns of wild birds. People should still be vigilant and, where they find a bird that has died in suspicious circumstances or appears to be very ill, they should report it to the appropriate authorities, and leave it to the appropriate authorities to deal with the situation rather than trying to do it themselves. There are great risks involved with handling a bird without the appropriate protection where the bird has H5N1 avian influenza.

ddefnyddiol ond ni allwn ddefnyddio brechu fel mesur ataliol ar gyfer pob haid o adar. Byddai'n cael ei ddefnyddio yn hytrach fel ffordd o greu terfyn, rhwystr tân, o amgylch heidiau heintiedig er mwyn prynu amser. Fodd bynnag, mae perygl, pe bai adar yn cael eu brechu, y gallai guddio symptomau'r clwy.

**Brynle Williams:** Byddem yn edrych ar ôl yr heidiau masnachol mawr, lle y mae brechu i ddiogelu cyflenwad bwyd y genedl yn y cwestiwn, ond yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni yw bod gennym hefyd lawer o heidiau prin a bach, sy'n cael eu cadw o ran diddordeb yn fwy na dim gan eu perchenogion. Gallai pedigri rhai o'r bridiau hynny ddiflannu am byth. A gawn ryw sicrwydd y byddwch yn edrych ar rai o'r bridiau bach hefyd, oherwydd y mae angen eu diogelu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y byddwn ni a'r milfeddygon yn edrych arno, yn yr un ffordd ag yr edrychir ar adar mewn swâu, a hynny o bosibl fel achos arbennig. I'r rhai sy'n cofio clwy'r traed a'r genau yn 2001, yr oedd bwriad ryw dro i fridiau prin gael eu brechu pe bai'r clefyd yn mynd y tu hwnt i lefel benodol—ond, diolch byth, ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Byddem yn edrych ar y ffactor hwnnw cyn penderfynu faint o adar a ddylai gael eu brechu, a lle y dylent gael eu brechu.

Mae'n debyg bod brechu ataliol yn amhosibl, gan fod y clefyd yn cael ei ledaenu drwy'r awyr a gall gael ei ledaenu gan adar. Yn achos clwy'r traed a'r genau, heblaw'r achosion a oedd yn ymwneud â moch, dim ond dros bellteroedd byr iawn y gellid ei ledaenu, ac yr oedd yn cael ei gludo'n bennaf drwy symudiadau corfforol neu gysylltiad rhwng anifeiliaid. Ni allwn reoli patrymau mudo adar gwyllt. Ond dylai pobl fod yn wylidwrus er hynny ac, os ydynt yn darganfod aderyn sydd wedi marw mewn amgylchiadau amheus neu sy'n ymddangos yn wael iawn, dylent hysbysu'r awdurdodau priodol, a gadael i'r awdurdodau priodol ddelio â'r sefyllfa yn hytrach na cheisio gwneud hynny eu hunain. Mae llawer o beryglon ynghlwm â thrafod aderyn heb gymryd camau diogelwch priodol os oes fflw adar H5N1 ar yr aderyn.

*Cynnig (NDM3290): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3290): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3291): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3291): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3292): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3292): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3293): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3293): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)  
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Oedi wrth Drosglwyddo Gofal  
Delayed Transfers Of Care**

Motion (NDM3295): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3295): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to commission an independent review of delayed transfers of care which will bring forward recommendations for both health service and social care settings to examine:*

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gomisiynu adolygiad annibynnol o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal a fydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion bod lleoliadau gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, y naill a'r llall, yn archwilio:*

*(a) the ways in which acute hospital beds may be used more effectively; and*

*(b) how the wellbeing of patients ready for discharge can be promoted.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new subpoint at the end of the motion:

*the development of joint or pooled budgets for healthcare and social services to improve co-ordination between local health boards and local authorities.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new subpoint at the end of the motion:

*whether there are sufficient social care places and appropriately trained staff available.*

Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the review should consider whether it is necessary for the Assembly Government to compel local authorities and local health boards to pool budgets.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to commission an independent review of delayed transfers of care which will bring forward recommendations for both health service and social care settings to examine:*

*(a) the ways in which acute hospital beds may be used more effectively; and*

*(b) how the well-being of patients ready for discharge can be promoted. (NDM3295)*

I am delighted that we have the opportunity to debate the issue of bedblocking. We

*(a) ffyrdd y gellid defnyddio gwelyau aciwt ysbytai yn fwy effeithiol; a*

*(b) sut y gellir hyrwyddo lles cleifion sy'n barod i gael eu rhyddhau.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*datblygu cyd-gyllidebau neu gyllidebau cyfunol ar gyfer gofal iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol er mwyn gwella'r cydlynad rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*a oes digon o leoedd gofal cymdeithasol a staff wedi'u hyfforddi'n briodol ar gael.*

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylai'r adolygiad ystyried a oes rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad orfodi awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd lleol i gyfuno eu cyllidebau.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gomisiynu adolygiad annibynnol o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal a fydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion bod lleoliadau gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, y naill a'r llall, yn archwilio:*

*(a) ffyrdd y gellid defnyddio gwelyau aciwt ysbytai yn fwy effeithiol; a*

*(b) sut y gellir hyrwyddo lles cleifion sy'n barod i gael eu rhyddhau. (NDM3295)*

Yr wyf yn falch bod gennym gyfle i drafod blocio gwelyau. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r

welcome the amendments tabled by colleagues from other parties, and we are happy to support them.

Before I outline my concerns and the reasons why we have tabled the motion, there is a vicious rumour that the Assembly Government will support the motion, or, at best, it might not vote against it. If that is the case, I welcome that road-to-Damascus conversion from the Assembly Government, which has been telling us for the past few months that there is no need for a debate on bedblocking; as a result, it would not concede to a debate. So, once again, we have opposition parties—

**Ann Jones:** Will you take an intervention?

**Jonathan Morgan:** I will give way in a moment.

So, once again, it is left to opposition parties to lead the agenda in the Chamber by bringing forward issues that people are concerned about.

3.40 p.m.

**Ann Jones:** This is probably not an intervention, but more of a point of clarity or information. Would you refrain from saying 'bedblocking'? Many people find it upsetting. You should say 'delayed transfers of care'. For many people and their families, it is disparaging to suggest that older people are bedblocking. Can we keep to the term 'delayed transfers of care'?

**Jonathan Morgan:** I fully accept that the technical term is 'delayed transfers of care', but when people look at this subject, they see a bed which is blocked by a patient who does not need to be there, where that patient's care, wellbeing and recovery are not assisted by their being in that bed. If that is the best contribution that we can expect from a Labour Assembly Member this afternoon, then Labour Assembly Members have lost the plot. You are missing the point about the necessity of this debate and the damage that bedblocking is doing to our hospital system and the challenges and threats that it poses for both our hospital and social-care sectors.

gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan gyd-Aelodau o bleidiau eraill, ac yr ydym yn fodlon eu cefnogi.

Cyn imi amlinellu fy mhryderon a'r rhesymau pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliant, mae sibrydion cas ar led y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r cynnig, neu, o leiaf, na fydd yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn. Os yw hyn yn wir, croesawaf y dröedigaeth honno ar y ffordd i Ddamascus o du Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sydd wedi bod yn dweud wrthym yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf nad oes angen dadl ar flocio gwelyau; o ganlyniad i hynny, nid oedd yn fodlon cael dadl ar y mater. Felly, unwaith eto, y gwrthbleidiau—

**Ann Jones:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ildiaf mewn munud.

Felly, unwaith eto, y gwrthbleidiau sy'n gorfod arwain yr agenda yn y Siambr drwy gyflwyno materion sy'n achosi pryder i bobl.

**Ann Jones:** Mae'n debyg nad ymyriad yw hyn, yn hytrach na hynny mae'n fwy o bwynt o eglurder neu wybodaeth. A wnewch roi'r gorau i ddweud 'blocio gwelyau'? Mae'n derm sy'n achosi gofid i lawer o bobl. Dylech ddweud 'oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal'. I lawer o bobl a'u teuluoedd, mae'n sarhaus awgrymu bod pobl hŷn yn blocio gwelyau. A allwn ddefnyddio'r term 'oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal'?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr mai 'oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal' yw'r term technegol, ond pan fydd pobl yn edrych ar y pwnc, maent yn gweld gwely sy'n cael ei flocio gan glaf nad oes angen iddo fod yno, lle nad yw gofal, lles ac adferiad y claf yn cael eu cynorthwyo drwy fod yn y gwely hwnnw. Os mai dyna'r cyfraniad gorau y gallwn ei ddisgwyl gan Aelod Llafur o'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma, yna mae Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn colli arni. Yr ydych yn methu â deall holl bwrpas y ddadl hon a'r difrod y mae blocio gwelyau yn ei achosi i'n system ysbytai a'r heriau a'r bygythiadau y mae'n ei achosi i'n sector ysbytai a'n sector gofal cymdeithasol.

That is why we are having this debate this afternoon.

Bedblocking is an undisputed barrier to progress, to improvement and to efficient hospital working and patient treatment and management. It is as simple as that. It is an issue that has a substantial impact on other areas of health and social-care delivery. At the sharp end, bedblocking will prevent an acute hospital ward from functioning correctly. Life threatening delays to treatment are caused because acute beds simply are not available. This adds massive pressure to accident and emergency departments. At the other end, elective care is dreadfully affected, because patients cannot get into the hospitals as the beds do not become available quickly enough. The blockage is not only one of beds, but of services throughout the system, which are deeply affected because of poor management. That is why we are having this debate today. Regardless of whether you call it delayed discharge or bedblocking, the simple fact is that there are problems in the system that need to be resolved. That is why we are calling for an inquiry today.

Looking at the broader perspective, the delay in transferring a patient from a hospital bed to an appropriate care setting can present an enormous financial burden for the health service, especially when that delay spans six months, as is the case with one patient currently at the University Hospital of Wales. I understand that this case will be highlighted later on today.

In September 2006, there were 731 blocked beds within our hospital sector. This is the highest figure since February last year. I am willing to accept that this figure is far lower than it was a couple of years ago, but a substantial cost is incurred as a result of these numbers of beds blocked. A conservative estimate will put the cost of those beds blocked in September at somewhere in the region of £6 million. With a cumulative NHS debt of somewhere in the region of £100 million, we can ill afford to blow £70 million plus on blocked beds. There is a substantial financial cost that is draining the NHS of resources; resources that, were they not being used by blocked beds, would be used on

Dyna pam yr ydym yn cynnal y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma.

Yn ddi-os, mae blocio gwelyau yn rhwystro cynnydd, yn rhwystro gwelliant ac yn rhwystro gweithio'n effeithlon mewn ysbytai a thrin a rheoli cleifion yn effeithlon. Mae mor syml â hynny. Mae'n fater sy'n cael effaith sylweddol ar agweddau eraill ar y ddarpariaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yn y pen draw, bydd blocio gwelyau yn atal ward aciwt mewn ysbyty rhag gweithredu fel y dylai. Mae oedi rhag trin cleifion yn peryglu bywydau oherwydd nad oes gwelyau aciwt ar gael. Mae hyn yn rhoi pwysau enfawr ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Yn y pegwn arall, mae'n cael effaith ofnadwy ar ofal dewisol, oherwydd nid yw ysbytai'n gallu derbyn cleifion gan nad oes gwelyau ar gael yn ddigon cyflym ar eu cyfer. Nid gwelyau yn unig sy'n cael eu blocio, ond gwasanaethau ym mhob rhan o'r system, yr effeithir yn ddifrifol arnynt gan reoli gwael. Dyna pam yr ydym yn cynnal y ddadl hon heddiw. Pa un a ydych yn ei alw'n oedi wrth ryddhau neu flocio gwelyau, y gwir syml yw bod problemau yn y system sy'n rhaid eu datrys. Dyna pam yr ydym yn galw am ymchwiliad heddiw.

Gan edrych ar y sefyllfa ehangach, mae'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo claf o wely ysbyty i leoliad gofal priodol yn rhoi baich ariannol enfawr ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, yn enwedig os yw'r oedi hwnnw'n para am chwe mis, fel yn achos un claf sydd yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ar hyn o bryd. Deallaf y rhoddir sylw i'r achos hwn yn ddiweddarach heddiw.

Ym mis Medi 2006, yr oedd 731 o welyau'n cael eu blocio yn ein sector ysbytai. Dyma'r nifer uchaf ers Chwefror y llynedd. Yr wyf yn barod i dderbyn bod y ffigur hwn yn llawer is nag a oedd ddwy flynedd yn ôl, ond mae'r gwelyau hyn sy'n cael eu blocio'n arwain at gostau sylweddol. Yn ôl amcangyfrif ceidwadol, mae cost y gwelyau hynny sy'n cael eu blocio ym mis Medi tua £6 miliwn. Pan fo dyled gronol y GIG tua £100 miliwn, ni allwn fforddio colli £70 miliwn a mwy i dalu am welyau sy'n cael eu blocio. Mae hyn yn gost sylweddol sy'n faich ar adnoddau'r GIG; adnoddau a fyddai, pe na baent yn cael eu gwario ar welyau sy'n cael eu blocio, yn cael eu defnyddio ar ofal cleifion, yn helpu cleifion i



patient care, helping patients to recover, bringing down waiting lists, and on getting care and treatment to those people who need it urgently.

While I accept that accurately calculating the global cost of bedblocking is not that easy, and I know that the Minister has accepted this in a series of answers to written questions, there is no doubt that the figure is substantial and represents a constant shackle around the neck of the Welsh NHS. In June 2003, in the report which has informed the direction of the Assembly Government and which has informed the way in which hospital services need to be reconfigured, Derek Wanless said:

‘In the short term, immediate steps are needed to relieve pressure on the acute sector by making bed equivalents available and addressing, as a priority, delayed transfers of care.’

Which bit of ‘immediate steps’ and ‘priority’ did the Assembly Government not understand? Wanless also called for an urgent implementation plan identifying short, medium and long-term priorities to reduce bedblocking. I accept that it is possible that hospital reconfiguration and the review of secondary care will look at this in the long term, but there are immediate short-term pressures that need to be examined. Therefore, which bit of ‘urgent implementation plan’ did the Assembly Government not understand when reading the Wanless review?

In short, the Welsh Conservatives do not believe that these recommendations have been taken to heart, and Wales still lacks a long-term nationally standardised policy to deal with the problem. Many of the issues surrounding whether a patient can be discharged affect south Wales as much as they affect mid and north Wales.

The bottom line is that the human story is just as substantial as the financial story. Many people who are stuck in acute beds do not want to be there. They want to leave, but they are unable to for whatever reason, whether it is a lack of assessment, domiciliary care—which is the usual reason—capacity, or

wella, i leihau rhestrau aros, ac ar gyfer gofal a thriniaethau i bobl sydd eu hangen ar frys.

Er fy mod yn derbyn nad yw’n hawdd cyfrifo’n fanwl faint yn union yw cost blocio gwelyau, a gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn hyn mewn cyfres o atebion i gwestiynau ysgrifenedig, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw’r ffigur yn un sylweddol a’i fod yn faen tramgwydd parhaus i’r GIG yng Nghymru. Ym Mehefin 2003, yn yr adroddiad sydd wedi bod yn sail i gyfeiriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac sydd wedi bod yn sail i’r ffordd y mae angen ailgyflunio gwasanaethau ysbytai, dywedodd Derek Wanless:

Yn y tymor byr mae angen gweithredu’n syth i leihau’r pwysau ar y sector aciwt drwy sicrhau bod darpariaeth sy’n cyfateb i welyau ar gael, a rhoi sylw, fel blaenoriaeth, i oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal.

Pa ran o ‘gweithredu’n syth’ a ‘blaenoriaeth’ nad oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei deall? Galwodd Wanless hefyd am gynllun gweithredu brys i bennu’r blaenoriaethau tymor byr, tymor canolig a hirdymor i leihau blocio gwelyau. Yr wyf yn derbyn ei bod yn bosibl y bydd ailgyflunio ysbytai a’r adolygiad o ofal eilaidd yn edrych ar hyn yn y tymor hir, ond mae pwysau tymor byr sy’n cael effaith ar y gwasanaeth yn awr ac sy’n rhaid edrych arnynt. Felly, pa ran o’r ‘cynllun gweithredu brys’ nad oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei deall wrth ddarllen adolygiad Wanless?

Yn gryno, nid yw Ceidwadwyr Cymru’n credu bod yr argymhellion hyn wedi cael eu cymryd o ddifrif, ac nid oes gan Gymru byth bolisi safonedig yn genedlaethol, yn y tymor hir, i ddelio â’r broblem. Mae llawer o’r ystyriaethau ynghylch a ellir rhyddhau claf yn effeithio ar y de llawn cymaint ag y maent yn effeithio ar y canolbarth a’r gogledd.

Diwedd y gân yw bod y stori ddynol yr un mor sylweddol â’r stori ariannol. Nid oes ar lawer o’r bobl sy’n gaeth i welyau aciwt eisiau bod ynddynt. Mae arnynt eisiau gadael, ond ni allant wneud hynny am ba reswm bynnag y bo, boed hynny oherwydd diffyg asesiad, gofal cartref—sef y rheswm arferol—lle, neu gymorth ariannol

financial support from local authorities. It does not help their recovery.

The Royal College of Nursing has outlined its concerns and has stated clearly that patients who are victims of delayed transfers of care—and that is how it sees them—get depressed, become dependent on hospital staff, and can get ill again because they are not moved on after receiving proper treatment and healing in the first instance. Therefore, it is bad financially and it is bad for patients who have been treated once and who want to have further treatment elsewhere to aid their recovery, but cannot do that, and so they end up staying in the acute sector where their situation can actually get worse. Therefore, there is a double-whammy effect. It is not just financial; it also has a negative health impact following the positive impact that the acute sector supposedly had after treating them and, hopefully, supporting their illness when they were admitted to the acute sector. Therefore, there is a financial and human double whammy that we need to get to grips with. The Royal College of Nursing is right in outlining those concerns.

We would like to see a strategic, long-term, all-Wales approach taken to reducing the financial and operational burden of bedblocking in Wales, with the challenges and threats posed to the health service and social care sector in Wales. We need to get to grips with the fact that patients who are discharged into the community are often in a vulnerable position. When they are discharged, it is often the case that the support services are not there. Often, the domiciliary care packages are not sufficient, and we often do not see the numbers of care and allied health professionals in the appropriate places in Wales to look after those people. There is a lack of infrastructure in the community when we do manage to get those people moved out of the acute sector. It is difficult for the national health service and the social care sector to deal with chronic disease management, and to deliver care packages when we have a lack of trained therapists.

If we ignore this problem, we run this particular risk: the breakdown in

gan awdurdodau lleol. Nid yw'n helpu iddynt wella.

Mae Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys wedi amlinellu ei bryderon ac wedi dweud yn bendant fod cleifion sy'n dioddef oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal—a dyna sut y mae'n eu hystyried—yn mynd yn isel, yn mynd yn ddibynnol ar staff ysbytai, ac yn mynd yn wael drachefn oherwydd nad ydynt yn cael eu symud ymlaen ar ôl cael triniaeth ac iachâd priodol yn y lle cyntaf. O'r herwydd, mae'n beth drwg yn ariannol ac yn beth drwg i gleifion sydd wedi cael eu trin unwaith ac sydd eisiau triniaeth bellach mewn man arall i'w helpu i wella, ond na allant wneud hynny, ac o'r herwydd, maent, yn y pen draw, yn gorfod aros yn y sector aciwt lle y gall eu sefyllfa waethygu mewn gwirionedd. O'r herwydd, ceir ergyd ddwbl. Nid effaith ariannol ydyw yn unig; mae hefyd yn cael effaith negyddol ar iechyd ar ôl yr effaith gadarnhaol y mae'r sector aciwt i fod wedi ei chael ar ôl eu trin a, gobeithio, wedi bod yn gefn iddynt yn eu salwch pan dderbyniwyd hwy i'r sector aciwt. O'r herwydd, ceir ergyd ddwbl, yn ariannol a dynol, y mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hi. Mae Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yn iawn wrth amlinellu'r pryderon hyn.

Hoffem weld dull Cymru gyfan, hirdymor, strategol yn cael ei weithredu i ysgafnu baich ariannol a gweithredol blocio gwelyau yng Nghymru, gyda'r sialensiau a'r bygythiadau a berir i'r gwasanaeth iechyd a'r sector gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r ffaith bod cleifion a ryddheir i'r gymuned yn aml mewn sefyllfa fregus. Pan ryddheir hwy, nid yw'r gwasanaethau cymorth yno yn aml. Yn aml, nid yw'r pecynnau gofal cartref yn ddigonol, ac yn aml nid oes digon o weithwyr proffesiynol ym maes gofal a'r maes iechyd cysylltiedig yn y manau priodol yng Nghymru i ofalu am y bobl hyn. Ceir diffyg seilwaith yn y gymuned pan lwyddwn i sicrhau bod y bobl hyn yn symud allan o'r sector aciwt. Mae'n anodd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a'r sector gofal cymdeithasol ddelio â rheoli clefydau cronig, a chyflwyno pecynnau gofal pan fo gennym brinder therapyddion hyfforddedig.

Os anwybyddwn y broblem hon, mae perygl y gwelwn y berthynas rhwng y sector gofal

relationships between the health and social care sectors will continue. We have seen it in Cardiff with the local hospital in the Heath having a dig at the local authority for failing to live up to its promises on delivering appropriate funds for social services. If we do not get to grips with this, it will start to happen elsewhere, and there will be a further breakdown of those relationships that we rely on to solve these problems.

We must do all that we can to ensure that the wellbeing of patients is ensured and that their experience throughout their hospital stay and beyond is improved. If the patient is placed in an appropriate care setting that matches his or her need, that experience will improve. These key strands must form the basis of a review that is independent of politics and the Assembly Government, and which will bring forward recommendations to inform how we need to proceed from where we are now.

It is high time that we had a review of bedblocking. It needs to build on best practice, recommend what should be tackled, and examine the experience that we have in terms of personnel in the social care sector and the health sector, who can give the advice and expertise that they are so willing to provide.

Our goal in tabling this motion is simply that. It is a goal of forcing progress on an issue that we feel has been neglected for too long and one which, if not tackled soon, will add to the spiralling financial concerns of the national health service and will be to the detriment of patients. That is why we have got to get this right.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new subpoint at the end of the motion:

*the development of joint or pooled budgets for healthcare and social services to improve co-ordination between local health boards and local authorities.*

I express the support of the Welsh Liberal Democrats for this important motion and for the other amendments tabled by Plaid Cymru.

cymdeithasol a'r sector iechyd yn parhau i ddirywio. Fe'i gwelsom yng Nghaerdydd wrth i'r ysbty lleol yn y Rhath edliw i'r awdurdod lleol am fethu â chadw at ei addewid i gyflwyno'r arian priodol ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Onid awn i'r afael â hyn, bydd yn dechrau digwydd mewn mannau eraill, a bydd dirywiad pellach yn y mathau o berthynas yr ydym yn dibynnu arnynt i ddatrys y problemau hyn.

Rhaid inni wneud popeth yn ein gallu i sicrhau bod lles cleifion yn cael ei sicrhau a bod eu profiad gydol eu harhosiad yn yr ysbty ac ar ôl hynny yn cael ei wella. Os lleolir y claf mewn sefydliad gofal priodol sy'n cyd-fynd â'i anghenion ef neu hi, bydd y profiad hwnnw'n gwella. Rhaid i'r elfennau allweddol hyn fod yn sail i adolygiad sy'n annibynnol ar wleidyddiaeth a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac a fydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion i ddylanwadu ar sut y mae angen inni fwrw ymlaen o'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi yn awr.

Mae'n hen bryd inni gael adolygiad o flocio gwelyau. Rhaid iddo ychwanegu at yr arferion gorau, argymhell beth y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef, a phwyso a mesur y profiad sydd gennym o safbwynt personél yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol a'r sector iechyd, a all roi'r cyngor a'r arbenigedd y maent mor barod i'w darparu.

Hynny yw ein nod wrth gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Y nod yw sicrhau bod cynnydd yn digwydd gyda mater sydd, yn ein barn ni, wedi cael ei esgeuluso ers gormod o amser ac, os nad eir i'r afael ag ef yn fuan, bydd yn ychwanegu at bryderon ariannol cynyddol y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac yn andwyol i'r cleifion. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid inni wneud hyn yn iawn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*datblygu cyd-gyllidebau neu gyllidebau cyfunol ar gyfer gofal iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol er mwyn gwella'r cydlynad rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol.*

Mynegaf gefnogaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru i'r cynnig pwysig hwn ac i'r gwelliannau eraill a gyflwynodd Plaid Cymru.

This is an extremely important debate and one which, as Jonathan has said, is long overdue. Make no mistake: this is a Wales-wide problem. The recent figures show an increase of 85 people in delayed transfers of care in one month alone. That is an increase of 13.6 per cent in one month, which is an extremely worrying trend after a series of months when it looked as though the Labour Assembly Government had finally got this problem under some kind of control. However, for several months now, it has been drifting up again.

3.50 p.m.

The breakdown of the figures shows how widespread the problem is. There are 229 people in mid and west Wales and 423 people in south-east Wales trapped in this situation. Jonathan mentioned Cardiff, but the situation is very bad in many other parts of Wales. It is leading to a breakdown in relationships between the NHS and social services departments. In some trusts, more than 10 per cent of beds are blocked. It is important to remember three key factors: it is not good for patients who want to go home and who would best be able to recover at home; it is far more expensive to care for patients in hospital than it is in the community; and it has a serious knock-on effect, because beds being blocked leads to delays in admissions for people coming in to accident-and-emergency departments or for elective care. Delays in accident-and-emergency departments lead to delays in the ambulance service.

Earlier, the First Minister called the situation 'bonkers'. If the situation is bonkers, why has the Government not done anything about it? He said that we have to find a way to deal with it. Why has it apparently not even looked for a way to deal with it?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you not agree that it is rather sad that the secondary care review so trumpeted by the Government has left yawning gaps in that most local authorities were not even properly consulted on how they will continue with the issue, which is part and parcel of what we are discussing

Mae hon yn ddadl eithriadol o bwysig ac yn un a ddylai fod wedi digwydd ers tro byd., fel y dywedodd Jonathan. Peidied neb â chamgymryd: mae hon yn broblem i Gymru gyfan. Mae'r ffigurau diweddar yn dangos cynnydd o 85 y cant mewn oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal mewn un mis yn unig. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o 13.6 y cant mewn mis; mae hyn yn dueddiad sy'n peri pryder eithriadol ar ôl cyfres o fisoedd pan oedd yn ymddangos fel petai Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi cael rhyw fath o reolaeth ar y broblem hon o'r diwedd. Serch hynny, ers amryw o fisoedd bellach, bu'n cynyddu unwaith eto.

Dengys y dadansoddiad o'r ffigurau pa mor gyffredin yw'r broblem. Mae 220 o bobl yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin a 423 o bobl yn y de-ddwyrain wedi eu dal yn y sefyllfa hon. Crybwyllodd Jonathan Gaerdydd, ond mae'r sefyllfa'n wael iawn mewn sawl man arall yng Nghymru. Mae'n arwain at chwalfa yn y berthynas rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac adrannau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mewn rhai ymddiriedolaethau, mae dros 10 y cant o'r gwelyau wedi eu blocio. Mae'n bwysig cofio'r tri ffactor allweddol: nid yw'n beth da i'r cleifion sydd am fynd adref ac a fyddai'n gallu gwella orau gartref; mae'n llawer iawn drutach gofalu am gleifion yn yr ysbyty nag ydyw yn y gymuned; ac mae'n cael effaith ganlyniadol ddifrifol, oherwydd bod gwelyau sy'n cael eu blocio yn arwain at oedi o safbwynt derbyn pobl sy'n dod i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys neu i gael gofal dewisol. Mae oedi mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn arwain at oedi yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

Yn gynharach, galwodd y Prif Weinidog y sefyllfa'n 'hurt', os yw'r sefyllfa'n hurt, pam nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud dim yn ei chylch? Dywedodd fod yn rhaid inni ganfod ffordd o ddelio â hi. Pam nad yw'r Llywodraeth, yn ôl pob golwg, hyd yn oed wedi edrych am ffordd o ddelio â hi?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Oni chytunwch ei bod yn drist braidd bod yr adolygiad ar ofal eilaidd y bu'r Llywodraeth mor uchel ei chloch yn ei gylch wedi gadael bylchau mawr o ran nad ymgynghorwyd yn briodol hyd yn oed gyda'r rhan fwyaf o'r awdurdodau lleol ynghylch sut y byddant yn parhau â'r mater, rhywbeth sy'n

today?

**Jenny Randerson:** I think that the Government has failed to act on several fronts on what is a complex issue. You have pinpointed one of those. The Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendment 1 suggests a way forward, which has been put to me time and again by people working in the field, both for social services and for the health service. Indeed, there seems to be an overwhelming consensus that there must be greater collaboration between social services and NHS trusts. We can talk about partnership working from here to the Beecham review, but the simple truth is that money talks. There is a need to ensure that budgets are pooled. We should not suggest to local authorities and the health service that the money should be pooled; we should ensure that it is pooled. Pooled budgets could be created relatively easily by auditing past expenditure, establishing a joint budget, and getting joint control and management of that budget. Once it is established, neither side will have any reason to act in any way other than in the very best interests of the patients, because they will have no individual financial status to defend.

Therefore, a single budget would tackle one of the key issues. However, the breakdown of the figures shows that there are other important issues. In his written statement on delayed transfers of care last month, the Minister admitted that,

'These delays reflect a variety of issues including shortage of appropriate provision in some places, particularly for the Elderly Mentally Ill'.

I recently visited the EMI wards at St David's Hospital in Cardiff, and I asked how many people were there who should no longer have been there. I was told that about half the patients were in that position. That situation is because of the acute shortage of appropriate placements for people requiring considerable support in a nursing home. It is a chronic problem that has been going on

rhan hanfodol o'r hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn credu bod y Llywodraeth wedi methu â gweithredu ar sawl agwedd ynghylch rhywbeth sy'n fater dyrys. Yr ydych wedi tynnu sylw penodol at un o'r rheini. Mae gwelliant 1 Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn awgrymu un ffordd ymlaen sydd wedi cael ei hawgrymu wrthyf dro ar ôl tro gan bobl sy'n gweithio yn y maes, i'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd fel ei gilydd. Yn wir, ymddengys fod consensws llethol bod yn rhaid sicrhau mwy o gydweithredu rhwng y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Gallwn drafod gweithio mewn partneriaeth o hyn hyd adolygiad Beecham, ond y gwir syml ydyw mai arian sy'n bwysig. Mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod cyllidebau'n cael eu cyfuno. Nid awgrymu wrth awdurdodau lleol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd y dylai'r arian gael ei gyfuno a ddylem; dylem sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei gyfuno. Gellid creu cyllidebau cyfun yn gymharol hawdd drwy archwilio gwariant y gorffennol, sefydlu cydgyllideb, a chael rheolaeth ac awdurdod ar y cyd dros y gyllideb honno. Wedi iddi gael ei sefydlu, ni fydd gan y naill ochr na'r llall ddim rheswm dros weithredu mewn modd yn y byd heblaw er lles y cleifion hyd yr eithaf, oherwydd na fydd ganddynt ddim statws ariannol unigol i'w amddiffyn.

O'r herwydd, byddai cyllideb sengl yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion allweddol. Fodd bynnag, dengys y dadansoddiad o'r ffigurau fod materion eraill pwysig. Yn ei ddatganiad ysgrifenedig am oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal y mis diwethaf, cyfaddefodd y Gweinidog fod

Yr oedi hwn yn adlewyrchu amrywiaeth o broblemau, gan gynnwys prinder darpariaeth briodol mewn rhai lleoedd, yn enwedig ar gyfer yr Henoed Eiddil eu Meddwl.

Yn ddiweddar ymwelais â wardiau henoed eiddil eu meddwl yn Ysbyty Dewi Sant yng Nghaerdydd, a gofynnais faint o bobl a oedd yno na ddylent fod yno o hyd. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod tua hanner y cleifion yn y sefyllfa honno. Y rheswm am y sefyllfa hon yw'r prinder dybryd o leoliadau priodol i bobl y mae arnynt angen cymorth sylweddol mewn cartref nyrsio. Mae'n broblem gronig sydd wedi bod yn

throughout the existence of the Assembly. The Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales's figures show a dramatic fall in the number of nursing homes throughout Wales. I see that the Minister is shaking his head at me, but he needs to look at the figures; I looked at them very carefully.

The Government needs to look rapidly at the amount of funding per patient, because the simple truth is that, in areas such as Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan, it is far more profitable for the owners of private residential nursing care homes to get out of the business and to sell their properties for housing. That is the profitable way forward for them. Therefore, it is difficult to make the provision that is necessary. The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support the motion and the amendments.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add a new subpoint at the end of the motion:

*whether there are sufficient social care places and appropriately trained staff available.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the review should consider whether it is necessary for the Assembly Government to compel local authorities and local health boards to pool budgets.*

I, too, begin my contribution by thanking the Conservative Party for choosing this very important topic, and I join them and Jenny Randerson in regretting that, again, it has taken an opposition party to bring forward a serious debate in the Assembly on health and social care issues. I am grateful to Jonathan Morgan for his support for our amendments, and we will also support the Liberal Democrats' amendment 1.

I will not reiterate the powerful case that has already been made on the seriousness of this issue and the scale of the problem, but I feel the need to lend my voice to those expressing concern about Labour's failure to deal with

digwydd drwy gydol oes y Cynulliad. Dengys ffigurau Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ostyngiad aruthrol yn nifer y cartrefi nyrsio ledled Cymru. Gwelaf fod y Gweinidog yn ysgwyd ei ben arnaf, ond rhaid iddo edrych ar y ffigurau; edrychais arnynt yn ofalus iawn.

Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar fyrder ar y cyllid ar gyfer pob claf, oherwydd y gwir amdani yw ei bod yn llawer mwy proffidiol, mewn ardaloedd megis Caerdydd a Bro Morgannwg, i berchenogion cartrefi gofal nyrsio preswyl preifat roi'r gorau i'w busnes a gwerthu eu hadeiladau ar gyfer tai. Dyna'r ffordd broffidiol ymlaen iddynt hwy. O'r herwydd, mae'n anodd gwneud y ddarpariaeth sy'n ofynnol. Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r cynnig a'r gwelliannau.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*a oes digon o leoedd gofal cymdeithasol a staff wedi'u hyfforddi'n briodol ar gael.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylai'r adolygiad ystyried a oes rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad orfodi awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd lleol i gyfuno eu cyllidebau.*

Yr wyf finnau, hefyd, yn dechrau fy nghyfraniad drwy ddiolch i'r Blaid Geidwadol am ddewis y testun pwysig iawn hwn, ac yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â hwy a Jenny Randerson wrth resynu mai gwrthblaid, unwaith eto, sydd wedi gorfod cyflwyno dadl ddifrifol yn y Cynulliad am faterion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jonathan Morgan am ei gefnogaeth i'n gwelliannau, a byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 1 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Nid ailadroddaf y dadl rymus a gyflwynwyd eisoes am ddifrifoldeb y mater hwn a maint y broblem, ond teimlaf fod rhaid imi godi fy llais dros y rhai sy'n mynegi pryder am fethiant Llafur i ddelio â'r broblem hon dros y saith

this problem over the past seven years and the apparent complacency about it. No-one here is saying that there are magic wands that can be waved easily and simply. However, it has taken an opposition party to make the Government take the situation seriously, and I hope that the Minister will acknowledge that it is serious and is, again, getting worse.

We will all have seen in our constituency caseloads the awful suffering that delayed transfers of care can cause. It is true that there is a major resource problem, which has a major impact on the system, but, for me, there is a far greater impact on the individual, which we have all seen. For example, families must go backwards and forwards twice and three times daily to visit elderly relatives in hospital, who simply cannot be cared for properly on medical wards. I have witnessed the deterioration in the health of the person affected in the hospital, as well as that of their family, often, and of elderly neighbours who take on that responsibility, trying to support the patient while they are in a completely inappropriate setting. At present, we have 50 people in that situation in Carmarthenshire. For me, that is 50 too many. I think that there are around 724 throughout Wales. That is 724 too many.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given the situation in Carmarthenshire, do you share my concern that Carmarthenshire County Council is now undertaking a systematic closure of residential homes and day centres, and is reducing the numbers who can attend day centres? It is also privatising the homecare service in Carmarthenshire, which will clearly create more problems with delayed transfers of care.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Indeed. The approach of the Labour and Independent-led administration in Carmarthenshire County Council beggars belief, but I would say—not exactly in their defence—that they are responding to what they have been told they must do by the Government's inspectorate.

**Trish Law:** In Blaenau Gwent, the Labour-controlled council is in the process of closing four of its council-run residential care homes, leaving only one open.

mlynedd diwethaf a'r dihidrwydd, i bob golwg, yn ei chylch. Nid oes neb yma yn dweud bod gennym ffyn hud y gellir eu chwifio yn rhwydd ac yn syml. Serch hynny, gwrthblaid sydd wedi gwneud i'r Llywodraeth gymryd y sefyllfa o ddifrif, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod ei bod yn ddifrifol a'i bod, unwaith eto, yn gwaethygu.

Byddwn oll wedi gweld yn llwyth achosion ein hetholaethau y dioddefaint difrifol y gall oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal ei achosi. Mae'n wir bod problem ddifrifol gydag adnoddau, problem a gaiff effaith fawr ar y system, ond, i mi, mae effaith lawer mwy ar yr unigolyn, effaith yr ydym oll wedi ei gweld. Er enghraifft, rhaid i deuluoedd fynd yn ôl ac ymlaen ddwy a thair gwaith y dydd i ymweld â pherthnasau hŷn yn yr ysbyty na ellir gofalu amdanynt yn briodol ar wardiau meddygol. Yr wyf wedi tystio i ddirywiad iechyd y sawl yr effeithir arno yn yr ysbyty, yn ogystal ag iechyd eu teulu, yn aml, ac iechyd cymdogion hŷn sy'n ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw, gan geisio cynorthwyo'r claf a hwythau mewn lleoliad cwbl amhriodol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym 50 o bobl yn y sefyllfa honno yn sir Gaerfyrddin. I mi, mae hynny'n 50 yn ormod. Credaf fod tua 724 ledled Cymru. Mae hynny'n 724 yn ormod.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O gofio'r sefyllfa yn sir Gaerfyrddin, a ydych yn pryderu fel yr wyf fi fod Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yn awr yn cynnal proses systematig o gau cartrefi preswyl a chanolfannau dydd, ac yn gostwng y niferoedd a all fynychu'r canolfannau hyn? Mae hefyd yn preifateiddio'r gwasanaeth gofal cartref yn sir Gaerfyrddin; bydd hyn yn amlwg yn creu rhagor o broblemau gydag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn wir. Mae dull gweithredu'r weinyddiaeth yng Nghyngor Sir Caerfyrddin sydd dan arweiniad aelodau Llafur ac Annibynnol yn anghredadwy, ond byddwn yn dweud—nid i'w hamddiffyn yn hollol—mai ymateb y maent i'r hyn y dywedodd arolygiaeth y Llywodraeth wrthynt am ei wneud.

**Trish Law:** Ym Mlaenau Gwent, mae'r cyngor, sydd dan reolaeth Llafur, wrthi'n cau pedwar o'r cartrefi gofal preswyl sydd dan ei ofal, gan adael un yn unig ar agor.

**Helen Mary Jones:** We can only imagine what that will do to the problem of delayed transfers of care in Blaenau Gwent and in south-east Wales generally. I am sure that that is not what people thought that they were voting for when they voted Labour.

That brings me neatly to our amendment 2 and to our concern about the lack of care home places. The care standards figures, as I read them—and the Minister may put us right if we are wrong—state that we lost 47 homes last year, equating to 424 places. I would argue that that is proof of the failure of the market to provide adequate care. We must remember that care was privatised, and it clearly does not work. However, in that context, it is ironic that Labour central Government policy appears to encourage local authorities to close some of the homes that they control. I must say that in this, as in so many other things, one feels as though the left hand does not know what the right hand is doing in the Labour Party—though whether the left hand is still there may be a matter for debate.

We clearly need more adequately trained and adequately supported staff. We have acknowledged, across parties in the Assembly, since 1999, that many people who work in the care sector are underpaid and under-skilled for the work that they do, and that we ask a great deal of them. Although some steps have been taken, and it would be churlish not to acknowledge those, the situation has not fundamentally improved. Caring is still work undertaken predominantly by underpaid women, and we have to change that if people are to receive the care that they need.

4.00 p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwynedd has less of a problem with delayed transfers of care in Ysbyty Gwynedd because it still retains 10 or 11 care homes, but that comes at a cost to the local authority. Therefore, there must be a balance between helping areas that have problems because they have sold or done away with their care homes, and helping

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ni allwn ond dychmygu beth a wna hynny i broblem oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal ym Mlaenau Gwent ac yn y de-ddwyrain yn gyffredinol. Yr wyf yn sicr nad oedd pobl yn meddwl mai dyma'r hyn yr oeddent yn pleidleisio drosto wrth bleidleisio dros Lafur.

Daw hyn â mi yn daclus at ein gwelliant 2 ac at ein pryder am y diffyg lleoedd mewn cartrefi gofal. Dywed y ffigurau safonau gofal, yn ôl fel y gwelaf fi hwy—a chaiff y Gweinidog ein cywiro os ydym yn anghywir—ein bod wedi colli 47 o gartrefi y llynedd; mae hyn yn cyfateb i 424 o leoedd. Byddwn yn dadlau bod hynny'n brawf o fethiant y farchnad i ddarparu gofal digonol. Rhaid inni gofio bod gofal wedi cael ei breifateiddio, ac mae'n amlwg nad yw'n gweithio. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, mae'n eironig bod polisi Llywodraeth ganolog y Blaid Lafur, i bob golwg, yn annog awdurdodau lleol i gau rhai o'r cartrefi a reolant. Rhaid imi ddweud yn y sefyllfa hon, fel gyda chynifer o sefyllfaoedd eraill, fod rhywun yn teimlo nad yw'r llaw chwith yn gwybod beth y mae'r llaw dde yn ei wneud yn y Blaid Lafur—er y gellid dadlau nad yw'r llaw chwith yno o gwbl rhagor.

Mae'n amlwg bod arnom angen staff sydd wedi'u hyfforddi'n briodol ac sy'n cael y cymorth priodol. Yr ydym wedi cydnabod, ar draws y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad, ers 1999, fod llawer o bobl sy'n gweithio yn y sector gofal nad ydynt yn cael cyflogau teg ac nad ydynt yn meddu ar sgiliau digonol ar gyfer y gwaith a wnânt, a'n bod yn gofyn llawer ganddynt. Er bod rhai camau wedi cael eu cymryd, a byddai'n ddigywilydd peidio â chydabod y rheini, nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi gwella yn y bôn. Mae gofalu'n dal i fod yn waith a wneir yn bennaf gan ferched am dâl annigonol, ac mae'n rhaid inni newid hynny os yw pobl am gael y gofal sydd ei angen arnynt.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae gan Wynedd lai o broblem o ran oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn Ysbyty Gwynedd am fod ganddi 10 neu 11 o gartrefi gofal o hyd, ond mae hynny'n costio arian i'r awdurdod lleol. Felly, mae'n rhaid sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng helpu ardaloedd lle y mae problemau am eu bod wedi gwerthu neu waredu eu cartrefi gofal, a helpu'r ardaloedd



those areas that are still retaining them at a cost.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I agree with that, and I repeat that it is a great pity that Labour Government policy seems to be encouraging local authorities to get rid of their remaining care homes and making it difficult to fund them, because the money is not available.

That brings me on to our amendment 3, on pooled budgets. That has to be part of the answer. I am still at a loss to work out the cost that is incurred when you have a highly-qualified social worker and highly-qualified nursing officer sitting down and arguing whether Mrs Jones's care needs are medical care needs or social care needs. The fact is that she is a fragile lady and she needs to be looked after, and we do not need highly-skilled professionals wasting their time arguing the toss about who should pay for her care.

In relation to local health boards, one reason for having coterminosity—it is a hideous word, but a worthy concept—was to enable delayed transfers of care to be dealt with. The idea was that having LHBs and local authorities of the same size, covering the same boundaries, would enable the sharing of resources. I hope that the Minister will acknowledge that, despite some good practice, that has not worked on the whole, and it is time for the Government to step in.

The Labour Government has failed these vulnerable people who need care and we need an independent review. We have to agree a sustainable way forward and, hopefully, a way forward that we can all support. The current situation is a shocking waste of resources, and, more importantly, leads to a shocking level of human suffering.

**Mark Isherwood:** The issue of delayed transfers of care or bed blocking is key, now and for the future, as the health landscape of Wales changes. The Welsh Assembly Government claims to support care closer to home, recognising that the burden of disease is changing as people live longer. However, we have instead seen a pattern of bed losses,

sy'n dal i'w cadw am gost.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cytunaf â hynny, a dywedaf unwaith yn rhagor ei bod yn resyn ei bod yn ymddangos bod polisi'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn annog awdurdodau lleol i waredu'r cartrefi gofal sydd ar ôl ganddynt ac yn ei gwneud yn anodd eu hariannu, am nad yw'r arian ar gael.

Daw hyn â mi at ein gwelliant 3, ynghylch cyllidebau cyfun. Mae'n rhaid i hynny fod yn rhan o'r ateb. Ni allaf yn fy myw gyfrifo'r gost a achosir pan fo gweithiwr cymdeithasol sydd â chymwysterau uchel a swyddog nyrsio sydd â chymwysterau uchel yn eistedd ac yn dadlau ai anghenion gofal meddygol ynteu anghenion gofal cymdeithasol sydd gan Mrs Jones. Y gwir amdani yw ei bod yn fenyw eiddil a bod angen gofal arni, ac nid oes angen i staff proffesiynol hyfedr wastraffu eu hamser yn trafod pwy ddylai dalu am ei gofal.

Ynglŷn â'r byrddau iechyd lleol, un rheswm dros gael cydffiniau—mae'n air hyll, ond mae'n syniad gwerth chweil—oedd ei gwneud yn bosibl delio ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Y syniad oedd petai'r byrddau iechyd lleol a'r awdurdodau lleol yn rhannu'r un ffiniau, y byddai hynny'n fodd o rannu adnoddau. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod, er bod rhai arferion da, nad yw hynny wedi gweithio ar y cyfan, a'i bod yn bryd i'r Llywodraeth gamu i'r adwy.

Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi siomi'r bobl hyn sy'n agored i niwed y mae angen gofal arnynt ac mae angen inni gael adolygiad annibynnol. Mae'n rhaid inni gytuno ar ffordd gynaliadwy ymlaen, a ffordd ymlaen, yr wyf yn mawr obeithio, y gall pawb ei chefnogi. Mae'r sefyllfa gyfredol yn wastraff gwarthus ar adnoddau, ac yn bwysicaf oll, mae'n arwain at ddiodefaint gwarthus ymhlith bodau dynol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae mater yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal neu flocio gwelyau yn allweddol, yn awr ac at y dyfodol, wrth i'r sefyllfa o ran iechyd Cymru newid. Honna Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei bod yn cefnogi gofal yn agosach at y cartref, gan gydnabod bod baich afiechyd yn newid wrth i bobl fyw'n hwy. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn yr ydym

cuts, closures and centralisation.

Research tells us that, with appropriate care, a larger proportion of older people will be able to live in their own homes. It also tells us that the number of older people requiring residential care will increase. The Welsh Assembly Government is overseeing separate primary and secondary care reviews that do not fill the gaps in the middle. It is pursuing a national programme of community hospital closures on the grounds that primary care treatment centres without beds, extra care housing, telecare and a ghost army of district nurses and home carers will somehow bridge the gap in the future.

Care Forum Wales states that NHS underfunding has contributed to the reduction of nursing care capacity in nursing homes and, although 80 per cent of people state that they want to die at home, up to 60 per cent die in hospital. Hospices' representatives tell me that it is folly to cut beds for an ageing population. They also face cuts, and I urge all Assembly Members to meet them when they visit the Assembly on 28 November.

People with Alzheimer's and their carers tell me of their concern about the shortage of residential care for people living alone, who deteriorate quickly without social stimulation, and for people who cannot do anything for themselves. In its consultation response to 'Designed for North Wales', and to equivalent reports in mid and west Wales and south-east Wales, the Royal College of Nursing Cymru stated that it was extremely disturbing to find no specific discussion of the district nursing service or on community public health nurses. It said that recruitment into these fields is a key issue, because the age profile of nurses in the community is higher than in other sectors. It stated that there has not been a significant growth in the number of community public health visitors for several years, and that there has been a decline in the number of district nurses.

It also expressed a concern about a lack of adequate social care services available in the community, including a sufficient number of

wedi'i weld yn hytrach na hynny yw patrwm o golli gwelyau, toriadau, cau a chanoli.

Yn ôl yr ymchwil, o gael gofal priodol, bydd cyfran helaethach o bobl hŷn yn gallu byw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Dywedir hefyd y bydd nifer y bobl hŷn y bydd angen gofal preswyl arnynt yn cynyddu. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n cynnal adolygiadau ar wahân ar ofal sylfaenol a gofal eilaidd nad ydynt yn llanw'r bylchau yn y canol. Mae'n dilyn rhaglen genedlaethol o gau ysbytai cymuned gan gredu y bydd canolfannau triniaeth gofal sylfaenol heb welyau, tai â gofal ychwanegol, teleofal a llurhithiol o nyrsys ardal a gofawyr cartref yn llanw'r bwch rywfodd yn y dyfodol.

Dywed Fforwm Gofal Cymru fod rhy ychydig o arian gan y GIG wedi cyfrannu at leihau'r capasiti gofal nyrsio mewn cartrefi nyrsio ac, er y dywed 80% o bobl eu bod am farw gartref, mae hyd at 60% yn marw mewn ysbyty. Dywed cynrychiolwyr yr hosbisau wrthyf mai ffolineb yw tocio gwelyau a'r boblogaeth yn heneiddio. Maent hwythau'n wynebu toriadau hefyd, ac anogaf holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad i gwrdd â hwy pan fyddant yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd.

Mae pobl sydd ag afiechyd Alzheimer arnynt a'u gofawyr yn sôn wrthyf am y pryderon sydd ganddynt ynghylch y diffyg gofal preswyl ar gyfer pobl sy'n byw ar eu pennau eu hunain, sy'n dirywio'n gyflym heb symbyliad cymdeithasol, ac ar gyfer pobl na allant wneud dim drostynt eu hunain. Yn ei ymateb i'r ymgynghori ynghylch 'Designed for North Wales', ac i adroddiadau cyffelyb yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin a'r de-ddwyrain, dywedodd Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol Cymru ei bod yn destun pryder mawr gweld nad oedd dim trafod penodol ar wasanaeth y nyrsys ardal nac ar nyrsys iechyd cyhoeddus cymunedol. Dywedir bod recriwtio yn y meysydd hynny'n fater allweddol, oherwydd bod proffil oedran nyrsys yn y gymuned yn uwch nag ydyw mewn sectorau eraill. Dywedodd na fu twf sylweddol yn nifer yr ymwelwyr iechyd cyhoeddus cymunedol ers rhai blynnyddoedd, a bod dirywiad wedi bod yn nifer y nyrsys ardal.

Mynegodd bryder hefyd fod diffyg gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol digonol ar gael yn y gymuned, gan gynnwys digon o

nursing care beds. It adds that this is a known pressure on acute services across Wales, which causes delayed transfers of care or bed blocking, and it states that if these services are unavailable it would be counterproductive in the extreme to remove the hospital bed. Meanwhile, a local health board has described the new primary care resource centres to me as being like community hospitals without beds. Despite an increase in the older population, the number of people receiving council-funded homecare has fallen, and with just 15-minute slots, homecarers are too rushed and have too little time to build trust.

Two thirds of Welsh councils face an overspend in adult care services, and the Welsh Local Government Association states that the current care system is unsustainable. Planned extra care housing for older people, although welcome, is a drop in the ocean given the approaching tidal wave of demand. Even with funding for this added, the social housing grant is still less than it was 10 years ago.

Telecare can support vulnerable people when they return from hospital. However, grants for telecare have been targeted at social services departments despite the bulk of the existing infrastructure being provided by housing providers in the state voluntary sector. Meanwhile, Cymorth Cymru has expressed its concern about the squeeze on funding for Supporting People, stating, among other things, that it will lead to more bedblocking, and more older people leading isolated, unhealthy, lonely lives. For all these reasons, an independent review is not an option, but essential.

**Christine Gwyther:** From the contributions so far, it is clear that delayed transfers of care are not an issue for the whole of Wales, but they are an issue for parts of Wales, including my constituency of Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire.

During the past few years, Carmarthenshire's fortunes have fluctuated rather a lot in respect of delayed transfers of care. At the peak of the problem, over 130 beds were unavailable for patients. It took massive investment from

welyau gofal nyrsio. Mae'n ychwanegu bod hyn yn bwysau y gwyddys amdano ar wasanaethau aciwt ar draws Cymru, sy'n peri oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal neu flocio gwelyau, a dywed pe na bai'r gwasanaethau hyn ar gael y byddai'n wrthgynhyrchiol iawn gwaredu gwelyau'r ysbytai. Yn y cyfamser, mae bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi dweud wrthyf fod y canolfannau adnoddau gofal sylfaenol newydd yn debyg i ysbytai cymuned heb welyau. Er bod cynnydd yn y boblogaeth hŷn, mae nifer y bobl sy'n cael gofal cartref gan y cynghorau wedi gostwng, a chan mai slotiau 15 munud yn unig sydd ganddynt, nid oes gan ofalwyr cartref ddigon o amser i feithrin ymddiriedaeth.

Mae dau o bob tri o gynghorau Cymru'n wynebu gorwario ar wasanaethau gofal oedolion, a dywed Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru fod y system ofal gyfredol yn anghynaliadwy. Er bod y tai sydd â gofal ychwanegol sy'n cael eu cynllunio ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn beth da, dim ond piso dryw bach yn y môr ydyw o ystyried y galw anferthol sydd ar ddod. Hyd yn oed o ychwanegu'r arian ar gyfer hyn, mae'r grant tai cymdeithasol yn dal yn llai nag a oedd 10 mlynedd yn ôl.

Gall teleofal gynnal pobl sy'n agored i niwed pan ddychwelant o'r ysbyty. Fodd bynnag, mae grantiau teleofal wedi eu targedu at adrannau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol er bod y rhan fwyaf o'r ddarpariaeth bresennol yn cael ei darparu gan ddarparwyr tai yn y sector gwirfoddol gwladol. Yn y cyfamser mae Cymorth Cymru wedi mynegi pryder ynglŷn â'r wasgfa ar gyllid ar gyfer Cefnogi Pobl, gan ddweud, ymhlith pethau eraill, y bydd yn arwain at ragor o flocio gwelyau, a mwy o bobl hŷn yn byw bywydau ynysig, afiach, unig. Am y rhesymau hyn oll, nid mater o ddewis yw adolygiad annibynnol, ond rhywbeth hanfodol.

**Christine Gwyther:** O ystyried yr hyn a ddywedwyd hyd yma, mae'n amlwg nad yw oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn broblem i Cymru gyfan, ond yn hytrach yn broblem i rannau o Gymru, gan gynnwys fy etholaeth i sef Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Penfro.

Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, cafodd sir Gaerfyrddin brofiadau cymysg o ran oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Pan oedd y broblem yn ei hanterth, yr oedd mwy na 130 o welyau heb fod ar gael ar gyfer cleifion. Bu'n rhaid i

the Welsh Assembly Government to bring this figure down to the 20s; it is creeping back up again now, which is a huge cause of concern. The problem was not helped by the historic turf warfare between the county council, the local health board and the NHS trust. Again, Minister, I recognise the Welsh Assembly Government's contribution, which stepped in to broker agreements, and the agencies working within the county now do so more collaboratively, which I wish to recognise this afternoon.

However, there is room for improvement. In the joint review of Carmarthenshire County Council's social services, which came out this September, there are several priorities for action, including reassessing the current distribution of resources between different service groups, and setting a clear direction for adult services, which emphasises independence and choice, which we all want for our constituents, as well as for our loved ones. The review states that the council must mend and develop key strategic partnerships; again, that is important. The council is committed to those directives, and is working hard to improve its service. However, the current emphasis on increasingly using the private sector to deliver homecare services may be a mistake.

Last week, I attended a meeting in Carmarthen of homecare staff and their unions. They are concerned about the future of the service, and believe that the balance of public and private sector provision needs to be critically re-examined. My case work leads me to believe the same. As part of the Welsh Assembly Government's aftercare to a service that was under-delivering, will you help Carmarthenshire County Council, Minister, to re-examine its current dash to privatise its homecare service, to see whether that is appropriate, represents best value, and will give my constituents a world-class service?

Looking to the west of my constituency, rumours now abound that Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS Trust wishes to close the existing bed provision at the old Tenby Cottage Hospital, and move the patients out. I

Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fuddsoddi arian sylweddol i ddod â'r ffigur hwn i lawr i'r 20au; mae'n cynyddu eto yn awr, ac mae hynny'n peri pryder mawr. Nid oedd y cecru a arferai ddigwydd rhwng y cyngor sir, y bwrdd iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaeth y GIG yn llesol iawn i'r broblem. Eto, Weinidog, yr wyf yn cydnabod cyfraniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a gamodd i'r adwy i drefnu cytundebau, a bellach mae'r asiantaethau sy'n gweithio yn y sir yn cydweithio mwy, a hoffwn gydnabod hyn y prynhawn yma.

Fodd bynnag, mae lle i wella. Yn y cydadolygiad ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Medi, mae amryw o flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweithredu, gan gynnwys ailasesu dosbarthiad cyfredol yr adnoddau rhwng gwahanol grwpiau gwasanaeth, a gosod cyfeiriad clir ar gyfer gwasanaethau oedolion, sy'n pwysleisio annibyniaeth a dewis, rhywbeth yr ydym oll yn awyddus i'w gael ar gyfer ein hetholwyr, yn ogystal â'n hanwyliaid. Dywedir yn yr adolygiad fod yn rhaid i'r cyngor unioni a datblygu partneriaethau strategol allweddol; eto, mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'r cyngor wedi ymrwymo i'r cyfarwydddebau hynny, ac mae'n gweithio'n galed i wella ei wasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, gallai'r pwyslais cyfredol ar wneud defnydd cynyddol ar y sector preifat i ddarparu gwasanaethau gofal cartref fod yn gamgymeriad.

Yr wythnos diwethaf euthum i gyfarfod staff gofal cartref a'u hundebau yng Nghaerfyrddin. Maent yn pryderu ynghylch dyfodol y gwasanaeth, a chredaf fod angen ailedrych o ddifrif ar gydbwysedd darpariaeth y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat. Mae fy ngwaith achosion yn peri imi gredu'r un peth. Fel rhan o ôl-ofal Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wasanaeth a oedd yn tangyflawni, a wnewch helpu Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, Weinidog, i ailedrych ar ei fwiad ar hyn o bryd i fynd ati i breifateiddio ei wasanaeth gofal cartref, i weld a yw hynny'n briodol, a yw'n mynd i olygu'r gwerth gorau, ac a fydd yn rhoi gwasanaeth gyda'r gorau yn y byd i'm hetholwyr?

O edrych tua'r gorllewin i'm hetholaeth, mae sibrydion yn awr fod Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol Sir Benfro a Derwen am gau'r ddarpariaeth gwelyau bresennol yn hen Ysbyty bach Dinbych y

have reminded the trust of its promise to keep the beds open until the new facility in Park House, Tenby is finished next summer. These recuperative beds make an important contribution to freeing up beds in the acute wards at Withybush General Hospital, and they give Tenby residents the chance to visit their relatives frequently to get them better, and to get them home where they belong.

The trust's chief executive told me only last week that bed occupancy rates at Withybush are still in the 90s, when they should be 82 to 84 per cent. Decommissioning beds in a climate of that kind is pure folly, and I want you, Minister, to direct the trust to keep its promise, and to keep the beds open where they are needed—in Tenby Cottage Hospital—and when they are needed, as we approach the season of inevitable bed pressures. Stand-down, recuperative beds are not a luxury, as some health chiefs seem to think. They get patients better, and they get them home where they belong. Please act urgently, Minister, to stop this silly plan to close beds at Tenby.

4.10 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** This is an important debate and, like other speakers, I would be the first to say that it does not invite easy solutions. The term 'bedblocking' is used because people understand it. I accept that it is an unfortunate term in some ways, but 'delayed transfer of care' is a phrase that gets people reaching for the dictionary. Let us be clear that 'bedblocking' is a term that people understand, and that it is certainly not the fault of the patients or of people working in the NHS, hard-pressed as they are.

The Government has had many warning signs about bedblocking. It is not just an economic issue, although it is probably costing the NHS £70 million a year, which is a significant amount: it is almost the deficit that the NHS is currently running. However, as Christine and others have indicated, there is also a human side to this, because it is about patient care and about visitors going to

Pysgod, a symud y cleifion allan. Yr wyf wedi atgoffa'r ymddiriedolaeth am yr addewid a wnaeth i gadw'r gwelyau nes bydd y cyfleusterau newydd yn Nhŷ'r Parc, Dinbych y Pysgod yn barod yr haf nesaf. Mae'r gwelyau adferol hyn yn gwneud cyfraniad helaeth at ryddhau gwelyau yn wardiau aciwt Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwynhelyg, ac maent yn rhoi cyfle i drigolion Dinbych y Pysgod ymweld â'u perthnasau'n aml er mwyn iddynt wella, a'u cael adref lle y dylent fod.

Dywedodd prif weithredwr yr ymddiriedolaeth wrthyf yr wythnos diwethaf fod 90 y cant o welyau Llwynhelyg yn llawn o hyd, pan ddylai'r gyfradd fod rhwng 82 ac 84 y cant. Ffolineb llwyr yw datgomisiynu gwelyau mewn hinsawdd o'r fath, ac yr wyf am i chi, Weinidog, gyfarwyddo'r ymddiriedolaeth i gadw ei haddewid, a chadw'r gwelyau lle y mae eu hangen—yn Ysbyty bach Dinbych y Pysgod—a phan fo'u hangen, wrth i'r tymor pan fo pob math o bwysau anochel ar welyau ddod ar ein gwarthaf. Nid moethau yw gwelyau ymadfer dros dro, fel y mae rhai penaethiaid iechyd fel petaent yn meddwl. Maent yn helpu cleifion i wella, ac yn eu helpu i fynd adref lle y dylent fod. Gweithredwch ar fyrder da chi, Weinidog, i roi terfyn ar y cynllun gwirion hwn i gau gwelyau yn Ninbych y Pysgod.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig ac, fel siaradwyr eraill, fi fyddai'r cyntaf i ddweud nad oes atebion hawdd. Defnyddir y term 'blocio gwelyau' am fod pobl yn ei ddeall. Yr wyf yn derbyn ei fod yn derm anffodus mewn rhai ffyrdd, ond mae 'oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal' yn ymadrodd sy'n peri i bobl estyn am y geiriadur. Gadewch inni fod yn glir mai 'blocio gwelyau' yw'r term y mae pobl yn ei ddeall, ac yn sicr nid ar y cleifion na'r bobl sydd yn gweithio yn y GIG, a hwythau dan gymaint o bwysau, y mae'r bai am hynny.

Cafodd y Llywodraeth ddigon o rybuddion ynghylch blocio gwelyau. Nid mater economaidd yn unig ydyw, er ei fod yn ôl pob tebyg yn costio £70 miliwn y flwyddyn i'r GIG, sydd yn swm sylweddol: bron cymaint â diffyg presennol y GIG. Fodd bynnag, fel y nododd Christine ac eraill, mae ochr ddynol i hyn hefyd, oherwydd ei fod yn ymwneud â gofal i gleifion ac ag ymwelwyr yn mynd i weld eu hanwyliaid

see their loved ones and so on. Therefore, it is a problem that is much more of social and human concern than it is of economic concern.

I also agree with what Christine Gwyther said about this being patchy. Not every area of Wales is underdelivering on this. Some authorities are delivering, such as Monmouthshire, which is under Conservative control. I have spoken to Brian Hood, who is in charge of social services, and if one looks at the authority, one sees that it is delivering on this agenda.

**Glyn Davies:** The point about the effect in different parts of Wales is important. We must also not forget how it affects English hospitals that serve Wales. There is no doubt at all, given the relationship between mid Wales and the hospital in Shrewsbury, that its difficulties with delayed transfers of care causes a huge problem with regard to services for the people of mid Wales provided outside of Wales. That should also be factored into the equation.

**Nick Bourne:** That point is well made, and I know that you speak with authority on the Royal Shrewsbury Hospital, as you live close to that hospital. That is certainly true. This is a patchy problem. It is certainly a problem in Carmarthenshire, although whatever is done there is done because of the independents and Labour, who control the authority.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** To add to the point that Glyn Davies was making, although this is not a problem with delayed transfers of care, a similar problem exists with the blocking of patients who need to go to Manchester or Liverpool for cardiac surgery. It meant that, a year ago, 18 people were occupying beds in Bangor who should have already been transferred to Manchester and Liverpool.

**Nick Bourne:** That is certainly true; bedblocking also operates in that way. It is a concern and it is not a simple issue, I accept that, but that is why we have proposed this review; it is to see whether we can find a way forward. As I said, there have been warning signs for the Government, first of all in the

ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae'n broblem sy'n peri mwy o bryder o ran pobl ac yn gymdeithasol nag yn economaidd.

Cytunaf hefyd â'r hyn a ddywedodd Christine Gwyther, sef bod hyn yn dameidiog. Nid yw pob ardal o Gymru yn tangyflawni o ran hyn. Mae rhai awdurdodau yn llwyddo, megis sir Fynwy, sydd dan reolaeth Geidwadol. Yr wyf wedi siarad â Brian Hood, sydd yn gofalu am wasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac wrth edrych ar yr awdurdod, mae rhywun yn gweld ei fod yn llwyddo o ran yr agenda hon.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r pwynt am yr effaith mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru yn un pwysig. Ni ddylem anghofio chwaith sut y mae'n effeithio ar ysbytai yn Lloegr sydd yn gwasanaethu Cymru. Nid oes amheuaeth o gwbl, o gofio'r berthynas rhwng canolbarth Cymru a'r ysbyty yn Amwythig, nad yw ei anawsterau gydag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn peri problem enfawr o ran gwasanaethau i bobl y canolbarth a ddarperir y tu allan i Gymru. Dylid cynnwys hynny hefyd yn rhan o'r hyn sy'n cael ei ystyried.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hynny'n bwynt teg, a gwn eich bod yn siarad gydag awdurdod am Ysbyty Brenhinol Amwythig, am eich bod yn byw yn agos at yr ysbyty hwnnw. Mae hynny'n wir yn sicr. Problem dameidiog yw hon. Yn sicr, mae'n broblem yn sir Gaerfyrddin, er bod beth bynnag a wneir yno yn cael ei wneud oherwydd y cynghorwyr annibynnol a Llafur, sydd yn rheoli'r awdurdod.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I ychwanegu at bwynt Glyn Davies, er nad yw hyn yn broblem gydag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, mae problem debyg yn bodoli gyda blocio cleifion sydd yn gorfod mynd i Fanceinion neu Lerpwl am lawdriniaeth ar y galon. Golygai, flwyddyn yn ôl, fod 18 o bobl mewn gwelyau ym Mangor a ddylai fod wedi cael eu trosglwyddo eisoes i Fanceinion a Lerpwl.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hynny yn sicr yn wir; mae blocio gwelyau yn digwydd felly hefyd. Mae'n peri pryder ac nid yw'n fater syml, derbynaf hynny, ond dyna pam yr ydym wedi cynnig yr adolygiad hwn; er mwyn gweld a oes modd dod o hyd i ffordd ymlaen. Fel y dywedais, cafodd y Llywodraeth rybuddion, yn gyntaf oll yn

Wanless review of health and social care in June 2003 and then, more recently, the report from the Assembly's Audit Committee on NHS waiting times also highlighted this problem.

As I said, there are authorities that are delivering; Monmouthshire is certainly one of them, and I have had an opportunity to speak to and correspond with the council, and I know that it is doing good work, as are other authorities.

**Lorraine Barrett:** You mentioned Monmouthshire and said that it is a Conservative council, and then you mentioned Carmarthenshire and Labour and the independents. I did not want to bring party politics into this, but I cannot help but mention the Vale of Glamorgan County Borough Council, which is Conservative controlled and which, in September, had 47 delayed transfers of care, and yet had 54 empty nursing home places.

**Nick Bourne:** It is an area that you represent, and I am far from saying that this is a matter of 'Labour bad, Conservatives good'. It is not that simple and I appreciate that. This motion proposes a review for the whole of Wales. As I said, there are authorities that are good, and some that are not so good, on this issue. There is no doubt that that is the case, but that is why we have proposed this motion today and why I hope that it attracts support from around the Chamber—it would be good to see this motion unanimously carried, because we need to move forward on the issue, in order to tackle what is both a serious human and economic problem, but principally a human problem.

**Alun Cairns:** I want to build on the comments that have been made about delayed transfers of care, particularly as we approach the winter bed crisis. To highlight the issue, I will refer to Fairwood Hospital in Swansea. The Swansea NHS Trust and the local health board have made proposals and recommendations to close the hospital and, in due course, the Minister will be considering that. Fairwood Hospital relieves bedblocking and delayed transfers of care by offering intermediate care. It offers care to patients

adolygiad Wanless ar ofal iechyd a chymdeithasol ym Mehefin 2003, ac yna yn fwy diweddar, tynnwyd sylw at y broblem hon hefyd yn adroddiad Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad ar amseroedd aros y GIG.

Fel y dywedais, mae rhai awdurdodau yn cyflawni; yn sicr, mae sir Fynwy'n un ohonynt a chefais gyfle i siarad a gohebu â'r cyngor, a gwn ei fod yn gwneud gwaith da, fel y mae awdurdodau eraill.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Soniasoch am sir Fynwy a dweud ei fod yn gyngor Ceidwadol, ac yna soniasoch am sir Gaerfyrddin a Llafur a'r annibynwyr. Nid oeddwn am wneud gwleidyddiaeth plaid yn rhan o hyn, ond ni allaf ddim llai na sôn am Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Bro Morgannwg, sydd dan reolaeth Geidwadol, yr oedd ganddo 47 achos o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal ym mis Medi, ac eto yr oedd ganddo 54 o leoedd gwag mewn cartrefi nyrsio.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n ardal yr ydych yn ei chynrychioli, ac nid wyf yn dweud o gwbl fod 'Llafur yn ddrwg, a'r Ceidwadwyr yn dda' yn hyn o beth. Nid yw mor syml â hynny, ac yr wyf yn sylweddoli hynny. Cynnig adolygiad i Gymru gyfan y mae'r cynnig hwn. Fel y dywedais, mae rhai awdurdodau da, ac eraill heb fod cystal, ar y pwnc hwn. Mae hynny'n sicr yn wir, ond dyna pam yr ydym wedi cynnig y cynnig hwn heddiw a pham yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yn denu cefnogaeth gan y Siambr hon i gyd—byddai'n dda o beth gweld y cynnig hwn yn cael ei dderbyn yn unfrydol, am fod angen i ni symud ymlaen ar y pwnc, i fynd i'r afael â'r hyn sydd yn broblem ddifrifol yn ddynol ac yn economaidd, ond problem ddynol yn bennaf.

**Alun Cairns:** Carwn adeiladu ar y sylwadau a gyflwynwyd am oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, yn enwedig wrth i ni nesáu at argyfwng gwelyau'r gaeaf. Er mwyn pwysleisio'r broblem, cyfeiriaf at Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg yn Abertawe. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi gwneud cynigion ac argymhellion i gau'r ysbyty ac, yn y man, bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried hynny. Mae Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg yn lleddfu blocio gwelyau ac oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal drwy gynnig gofal canolraddol. Mae'n cynnig gofal i

who will eventually be able to go home following a serious operation, but who are not yet able to do so, because of family circumstances or their medical condition.

However, quite clearly, they do not need to occupy an acute bed in a hospital following an operation. The trust, supported by the local health board, has made a proposal to close it. Yet, only last week, having been open for many years, but having not been open over Christmas for many years, a request came in to the nurses at Fairwood Hospital for it to stay open this Christmas, because of the expected winter beds crisis and delayed transfers of care. That demonstrates the need for a much wider review of this case and a lack of planning and foresight: on the one hand closure is recommended, and, on the other, having been closed over Christmas for many years, there is now a need for Fairwood Hospital to stay open. That demonstrates the lack of logical thinking and the lack of a coherent approach.

In widening the debate, the local health board and local trusts have made claims that many of the services provided at Fairwood Hospital can be provided in the community. Yet, the director of Swansea social services department, who sits on the local health board and who would be responsible for picking up many of the services, voted against the proposal and the recommendation when it came before the local health board. What confidence does it inspire in the services that are being provided, particularly if Fairwood Hospital is to be closed, if the person who would accept responsibility clearly does not see the logic and does not support the proposals for closing the hospital?

Furthermore, this underlines a lack of understanding, because the acting nursing director, who is leading the recommendation for the closure of Fairwood Hospital, is making the case without having even visited the hospital. Within that wider context, I ask that Members support the call for a much wider review into these circumstances, using Fairwood Hospital as one dreadful example where social services cannot accept closure, but would have to accept the responsibility if

gleifion a fydd yn y pen draw yn gallu mynd adref wedi llawdriniaeth ddifrifol, ond na allant wneud hynny hyd yma, oherwydd amgylchiadau teuluol neu eu cyflwr meddygol.

Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddigon amlwg nad oes angen iddynt gael gwely aciwt mewn ysbyty ar ôl llawdriniaeth. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth, gyda chefnogaeth y bwrdd iechyd lleol, wedi cynnig ei gau. Ond eto, mor ddiweddar â'r wythnos diwethaf, ar ôl bod ar agor ers sawl blwyddyn, ond ar gau dros y Nadolig ers sawl blwyddyn, cafwyd cais i'r nyrsys yn Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg iddo aros ar agor yn ystod y Nadolig eleni, oherwydd yr argyfwng gwelyau gaeaf a ddisgwylir a'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Mae hynny'n dangos bod angen adolygiad llawer ehangach o'r achos hwn a bod diffyg cynllunio a rhagweld: ar y naill llaw, argymhellir cau ac, ar y llaw arall, ar ôl cau dros y Nadolig ers sawl blwyddyn, bellach mae angen i Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg aros ar agor. Mae hynny'n dangos y diffyg meddwl rhesymegol a diffyg dull gweithredu cydlynol.

Wrth ehangu'r ddadl, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaethau lleol wedi honni y gellir darparu llawer o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg yn y gymuned. Ond eto, pleidleisiodd cyfarwyddwr adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Abertawe, sy'n eistedd ar y bwrdd iechyd lleol ac a fyddai'n gyfrifol am gymryd llawer o'r gwasanaethau drosodd, yn erbyn y cynnig a'r argymhelliad pan ddaeth gerbron y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Pa ffydd y mae'n ei hennyn yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir, yn enwedig os yw Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg am gau, os yw'n amlwg nad yw'r sawl a fyddai'n derbyn cyfrifoldeb yn gweld y rhesymeg nac yn cefnogi'r cynigion ar gyfer cau'r ysbyty?

Yn ogystal, mae hyn yn tanlinellu diffyg dealltwriaeth, gan fod y cyfarwyddwr nyrsio dros dro, sy'n arwain yr argymhelliad i gau Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg, yn cyflwyno'r ddadl heb ymweld â'r ysbyty hyd yn oed. Yn y cyd-destun ehangach hwnnw, gofynnaf i'r Aelodau gefnogi'r cais am adolygiad llawer ehangach o'r amgylchiadau hyn, gan ddefnyddio Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg yn un enghraifft ofnadwy lle nad yw'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gallu derbyn



the closure went ahead. The NHS trust and the local health board are calling for closure on the one hand, but are saying on the other that the hospital has to open over Christmas for the first time in many years. That demonstrates the need for a wider review.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** From September 2003 to July 2006, we saw significant progress in tackling delayed transfers of care in Wales—it is right that we should refer to these as delayed transfers of care; Ann Jones is right to say that to slip into the loose terminology of calling people who are caught in this difficult situation ‘bed blockers’, as Helen Mary outlined, is to start to target the wrong people. During the period that I mentioned, delayed transfers of care went down from a peak of 1,116 patients in September 2003 to just 574 in July 2006—a 49 per cent drop—with a similar, or even greater, decline in the numbers of days lost. Over that period, there was clear evidence of progress in addressing the Wanless agenda, contrary to what we have already heard.

It is, therefore, regrettable that the consistent progress seems to have failed to continue over the last two months. However, it is also a pity that this issue was ignored by the Assembly between September 2003 and July 2006, when good progress was being made. We did not have a single motion before the Assembly on this or a word of recognition from the opposition of the good progress that was being made. Of course, that is not surprising, because whenever health and social-care staff succeed in delivering good services, opposition parties choose to ignore it.

**Jonathan Morgan** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is replying to the debate.

**Brian Gibbons:** It is true that, since July 2006, there has been a significant

cau’r ysbyty, ond lle y byddai’n rhaid iddynt dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb pe byddai’n cau. Mae’r ymddiriedolaeth GIG a’r bwrdd iechyd lleol yn galw am gau ar y naill law, ond yn dweud ar y llaw arall fod rhaid i’r ysbyty agor dros y Nadolig am y tro cyntaf ers blynyddoedd. Mae hynny’n dangos bod angen adolygiad ehangach.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Rhwng mis Medi 2003 a mis Gorffennaf 2006, gwelsom gynnydd sylweddol o ran mynd i’r afael ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yng Nghymru—mae’n wir y dylem gyfeirio at y rhain yn achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal; mae Ann Jones yn llygad ei lle pan ddywed fod dechrau defnyddio’r derminoleg lac ‘blocio gwelyau’ wrth gyfeirio at bobl sydd wedi’u dal yn y sefyllfa anodd hon, fel yr amlinellodd Helen Mary, yn dechrau targedu’r bobl anghywir. Yn ystod y cyfnod y soniais amdano, bu lleihad yn yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal o’i anterth pan oedd 1,116 o gleifion ym mis Medi 2003 i 574 yn unig ym mis Gorffennaf 2006—sef gostyngiad o 49 y cant—gyda gostyngiad tebyg, neu fwy hyd yn oed, yn nifer y dyddiau a gollwyd. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, yr oedd tystiolaeth gref bod cynnydd o ran mynd i’r afael ag agenda Wanless, yn groes i’r hyn a glywsom eisoes.

Mae’n destun gofid felly nad yw’r cynnydd cyson wedi parhau yn ystod y ddeufis diwethaf, mae’n debyg. Fodd bynnag, mae’n drueni hefyd fod y Cynulliad wedi anwybyddu’r mater hwn rhwng mis Medi 2003 a mis Gorffennaf 2006, pan gafwyd cynnydd da. Ni chawsom ddim un cynnig o gwbl am hyn gerbron y Cynulliad na gair o gydnabyddiaeth gan yr wrthblaid am yr cynnydd da a wnaed. Wrth reswm, nid yw hynny’n syndod, oherwydd pryd bynnag y mae staff iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn llwyddo i ddarparu gwasanaethau da, mae’r gwrthbleidiau’n dewis ei anwybyddu.

**Jonathan Morgan** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae’r Gweinidog yn ateb y ddadl.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ers mis Gorffennaf 2006, mae’n wir bod y perfformiad wedi

deterioration in performance and much of the progress that had been made over the previous 18 months has not been sustained. It is important, as Nick Bourne said, that we carefully study the situation as a first step towards analysing what we need to do to regain the ground that has been lost.

4.20 p.m.

However, even accepting that, and accepting this deterioration, the levels of delayed transfer still remain a third lower than they were in September 2003, with over 98 per cent of all hospital discharges taking place on time. It is important to study this particular issue carefully because, as the deterioration has taken place, as Nick Bourne said, it has not happened consistently across Wales. The bulk of the deterioration has been confined to six or seven local authority or local health board areas, with the other 15 or 16 local health boards or local authorities maintaining the progress that has been made. Before we apply a too-wide global brush of remedies, we need to ensure that specific local issues are not being ignored; indeed, we have had a highly constructive contribution from Christine Gwyther, dealing with the specific circumstances in Carmarthen, which need to be addressed as specific local circumstances. We need that specific level of analysis. As part of this general approach, therefore, we need to look at the points that have been raised in the motion and in the amendments. It is fair to say that we need to take all of these points on board as part of a wider investigation into, and analysis of, why performance has gone down in some areas while being maintained consistently in the majority of areas.

Clearly, the remedies to improve delayed transfers of care need to be specific and local. I therefore feel that the motion asks reasonable questions, and is very much in line with the options that we in the Assembly Government are pursuing. Equally, it is important that we continue to build on the good progress that has been achieved to date. Record levels of investment have gone to social care, with an increase of 53 per cent in expenditure between 1999-2000 and 2004-

gwaethygu'n sylweddol ac nad yw llawer o'r cynnydd a wnaed yn ystod y 18 mis blaenorol wedi'i gynnal. Fel y dywedodd Nick Bourne, mae'n bwysig inni astudio'r sefyllfa'n ofalus er mwyn dechrau dadansoddi'r hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud i wella'r sefyllfa.

Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed os derbynnir hynny, ac os derbynnir y dirywiad hwn, mae lefelau'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofâl yn parhau draean yn is nag a oeddent ym mis Medi 2003, gyda mwy na 98 y cant o gleifion yn cael eu rhyddhau o'r ysbyty mewn pryd. Mae'n bwysig astudio'r mater penodol hwn yn ofalus oherwydd, wrth i'r dirywiad ddigwydd, fel y dywedodd Nick Bourne, nid yw wedi digwydd yn gyson ledled Cymru. Cyfyngwyd y rhan fwyaf o'r dirywiad i chwech neu saith ardal awdurdod lleol neu fwrdd iechyd lleol, gyda'r 15 neu 16 bwrdd iechyd lleol neu awdurdod lleol arall yn cynnal y cynnydd a wnaed. Cyn inni gyflwyno atebion cyffredinol yn rhy eang, mae angen inni sicrhau nad yw materion lleol penodol yn cael eu hanwybyddu; yn wir, yr ydym wedi cael cyfraniad adeiladol y tu hwnt gan Christine Gwyther, yn ymdrin â'r amgylchiadau penodol yng Nghaerfyrddin, y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy fel amgylchiadau lleol penodol. Mae angen y lefel benodol honno o ddadansoddi arnom. Yn rhan o'r dull gweithredu cyffredinol hwn, felly, mae angen inni edych ar y pwyntiau a godwyd yn y cynnig ac yn y gwelliannau. Mae'n deg dweud bod angen inni ystyried yr holl bwyntiau hyn wrth wneud ymchwil a dadansoddiad ehangach ynghylch pam mae'r perfformiad wedi gwaethygu mewn rhai ardaloedd ac wedi parhau'n gyson yn y rhan fwyaf o'r ardaloedd.

Yn amlwg, mae angen cael atebion penodol a lleol i wella oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofâl. Teimlaf felly fod y cynnig yn gofyn cwestiynau rhesymol, a'i fod yn cyd-fynd yn dda â'r opsiynau a ddilynwn yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yn ogystal, mae'n bwysig inni barhau i feithrin y cynnydd da a gyflawnwyd hyd yma. Buddsoddwyd mwy nag erioed o'r blaen mewn gofâl cymdeithasol, gyda chynnydd o 53 y cant mewn gwariant rhwng 1999-2000 a 2004-05. Yn wir, yn y flwyddyn

05. Indeed, this financial year alone, an additional £45 million has been added to the adult social care budget on top of the general uplift in the revenue support grant. Earlier this year, I added a further £20 million capital programme to extent the use of telecare and to improve our community equipment facilities. Extra money has also gone to the Care and Repair Cymru network and the rapid response adaptation programmes, which are key programmes in developing support for people in their own homes.

When we look at the uneven performance across Wales, we see that it is not simply a matter of level of spend by individual local authorities, as some of the best performing local authorities have the lowest per capita spend on social services. As Lorraine Barrett said, in the specific situation of the Vale of Glamorgan, which Jenny Randerson raised, there is not a shortage of beds—over 50 beds are available. So, this is clearly not always a matter of capacity. Indeed, the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales report told us that the number of available beds has gone down by just 2 per cent in the last year, and CSIW specifically said in its annual report that the number of applications that it is considering is considerably higher than that 2 per cent.

**David Melding** *rose—*

**Brian Gibbons:** I will let you come in later on, David, if I may.

Therefore, we can see that it is not simply a matter of resources. In recognising this fact, we in the Assembly Government have provided extra support to the Welsh Local Government Association to establish a service improvement agency and, working through the National Leadership and Innovations Healthcare Agency, we have established change agency teams that provide intensive local support to individual health and social care communities that are experiencing specific problems in responding to delayed transfers of care. Equally, delayed transfers of care are being monitored closely weekly, and, where there are individual long delays, individual profiles are developed for the patients.

ariannol hon yn unig, ychwanegwyd £45 miliwn arall at y gyllideb gofal cymdeithasol i oedolion ar ben y codiad cyffredinol yn y grant cynnal refeniw. Yn gynharach eleni, ychwanegais raglen gyfalaf bellach o £20 miliwn er mwyn ymestyn y defnydd o deleofal a gwella ein cyfleusterau offer cymunedol. Aeth arian ychwanegol hefyd at rwydwaith Gofal a Thrwsio Cymru a'r rhaglenni addasiadau brys, sy'n rhaglenni allweddol wrth ddatblygu cymorth i bobl yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

Pan edrychwn ar y perfformiad anghyson ledled Cymru, gwelwn nad mater syml o lefel y gwariant gan awdurdodau lleol unigol ydyw, gan mai gan rai o'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n perfformio orau y mae'r gwariant lleiaf y pen ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Fel y dywedodd Lorraine Barrett, yn y sefyllfa benodol ym Mro Morgannwg, a gododd Jenny Randerson, nid oes prinder gwelyau—mae mwy na 50 o welyau ar gael. Mae'n amlwg felly nad problem o ran capasiti yw hon bob amser. Yn wir, dywedodd adroddiad Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru wrthym fod nifer y gwelyau sydd ar gael wedi gostwng 2 y cant yn unig yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a dywedodd ASGC yn benodol yn ei hadroddiad blynyddol fod nifer y ceisiadau y mae'n eu hystyried yn llawer uwch na'r 2 y cant hwnnw.

**David Melding** *a gododd—*

**Brian Gibbons:** Gadawaf ichi ymyrryd yn nes ymlaen, David, os caf.

Gallwn weld felly nad problem adnoddau yn unig ydyw. Wrth gydnabod y ffaith hon, yr ydym ni yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi cymorth ychwanegol i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru sefydlu asiantaeth gwella gwasanaeth a, chan weithio drwy'r Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd, yr ydym wedi sefydlu timau newid asiantaeth sy'n rhoi cymorth lleol dwys i gymunedau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol unigol sy'n cael problemau penodol wrth ymateb i oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Yn ogystal, mae oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn cael ei fonitro'n ofalus yn wythnosol ac, os oes achosion unigol o oedi hir, caiff proffiliau unigol eu datblygu i'r cleifion.

It is well recognised that the origins of many delays in transfer of care lie in the process that has led to hospital admission in the first place. That is precisely why we have issued new guidance on the discharge process, so that that process can begin at an earlier stage. In supporting the motion and the amendments, we need to recognise that the Welsh Assembly Government already provides local government with an £11 million grant every year to facilitate the type of joint working that we all wish to see. Equally, and in line with the motion and the amendments, we need to assess whether we have the right balance of carrots and sticks at our disposal. In the wake of 'Making the Connections' and the Beecham review, we need to do more to promote joint working and I am in discussions with the Finance Minister on this issue.

In conclusion, this is a timely debate. Having made substantial progress over several years, during which the levels of delayed transfers of care have dropped dramatically, there has been a deterioration over the last two months. We need to stop and take stock of why that deterioration has taken place. Are the problems specific to those areas where the deterioration has taken place or is there a wider set of systemic problems? The review proposed in the main motion and complemented by the amendments will help us to do that. I urge support for the motion and the amendments.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful to the Minister for Health and Social Services for his contribution to the debate. As he knows, it would have been easy for me, as a shadow health spokesman, to have tabled a motion purely criticising the Assembly Government and raising the concerns that we have about the way in which blockages in the system affect patient care and how money is distributed in the system. However, I wanted to see something positive come from this debate, that recognised that there is still a problem of delayed transfers in the health and social care system that needs to be grappled with. I welcome the fact Members from around the Chamber have welcomed this and recognised that there is a problem that needs to be sorted out.

Mae'n dra hysbys bod llawer o'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn deillio o'r broses a arweiniodd at dderbyn y claf i'r ysbyty yn y lle cyntaf. Dyna'n union pam yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau newydd ar y broses ryddhau, er mwyn i'r broses ddechrau'n gynharach. Wrth gefnogi'r cynnig a'r gwelliannau, mae angen inni gydnabod bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eisoes yn darparu grant o £11 miliwn i lywodraeth leol bob blwyddyn i hwyluso'r math o gydweithio yr hoffem oll ei weld. Yn ogystal, ac yn unol â'r cynnig a'r gwelliannau, mae angen inni asesu a yw'r cydbwysedd cywir o gymell a chosbi ar gael inni. Yn sgîl 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac adolygiad Beecham, mae angen inni wneud mwy i hyrwyddo cydweithio ac yr wyf wrthi'n trafod y mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog Cyllid.

I gloi, mae hon yn ddadl amserol. Ar ôl gwneud cynnydd sylweddol dros sawl blwyddyn, ac yn y cyfnod hwnnw mae lefelau'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal wedi gostwng yn sylweddol, cafwyd dirywiad yn ystod y ddeufis diwethaf. Mae angen inni aros a phwyso a mesur pam y cafwyd y dirywiad hwnnw. A yw'r problemau'n rhai penodol yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle y cafwyd dirywiad neu a oes set ehangach o broblemau cyfundrefnol? Bydd yr adolygiad a gynigir yn y prif gynnis ac a ategir gan y gwelliannau yn ein helpu i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn eich annog i gefnogi'r cynnig a'r gwelliannau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am ei gyfraniad at y ddadl. Fel y gŵyr, byddai wedi bod yn hawdd i mi, a minnau'n llefarydd iechyd dros wrthblaid, gyflwyno cynnig sy'n beirniadu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn llwyr ac yn codi'r pryderon sydd gennym am y ffordd y mae blocio yn y system yn effeithio ar ofal cleifion a sut y caiff arian ei ddosbarthu yn y system. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn am weld rhywbeth cadarnhaol yn deillio o'r ddadl hon, a oedd yn cydnabod bod angen datrys y broblem o ran oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn y system iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol o hyd. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod Aelodau o bob rhan o'r Siambr wedi croesawu hyn ac wedi cydnabod bod problem y mae angen ei datrys.

I said at the outset that I saw the problem as a double whammy. On the one hand, the blockages in the system reduce the opportunities for people who have been successfully treated in the acute sector to recover. It is rather perverse—it almost has a reverse effect: you have a patient who is ill and he or she goes to hospital for treatment, is successfully treated and becomes well, but then, because they are stuck in hospital and cannot leave, their condition deteriorates. It reverses the good work that is done by the acute sector.

The second part of the double whammy is the gigantic financial cost. If we could sort this problem out—I accept that it may be difficult to completely eradicate all beds that are blocked—we might be able to save a significant amount of money, which we could put back into healthcare delivery. It may help you to reach your waiting-list targets, help people to get the treatment that they need early and quickly enough and it may help in terms of capacity within the social care sector, where we know that there are issues that need to be resolved. This inquiry could be undertaken quickly. It does not need to take more than a few months and it could be advised by all of the professionals in the field who feel that they have a contribution to make in helping us to solve this problem.

**David Melding:** The Minister, in fairness, is usually courteous and gives way during his contributions; he did not do so this afternoon, reflecting the sensitivity of this subject. Do you think that a review would allow us to examine how much more domiciliary care we need? We know that the packages have got much larger, but the number receiving them has become fewer. That has been a dramatic policy under this Government.

I thought that it was strange that the Minister decided to amplify the comments of his colleague, Lorraine Barrett, that, if there were enough nursing care home places in a particular authority, that would provide the answer to any bedblocking problem. It is probably the case that there is a lack of domiciliary care.

Dywedais ar y dechrau fy mod yn gweld y broblem fel ergyd ddwbl. Ar y naill law, mae'r blocio yn y system yn lleihau'r cyfleoedd i bobl a gafodd driniaeth lwyddiannus yn y sector aciwt wella. Mae hyn braidd yn wrthnysig—mae'n cael effaith i'r gwrthwyneb bron: mae gennyh glaf sy'n sâl ac aiff i'r ysbyty i gael triniaeth, caiff ei drin yn llwyddiannus ac mae'n gwella, ond yna, gan ei fod yn dal yn yr ysbyty ac yn methu â gadael, mae ei gyflwr yn gwaethygu. Mae'n dad-wneud y gwaith da a wneir gan y sector aciwt.

Ail ran yr ergyd ddwbl yw'r gost ariannol anferthol. Pe gallem ddatrys y broblem hon—derbyniaf y gall fod yn anodd dileu pob gwely sydd wedi'i flocio yn gyfan gwbl—efallai y gallem arbed swm sylweddol o arian, y gallem ei roi yn ôl i ddarparu gofal iechyd. Gallai eich helpu i gyrraedd eich targedau o ran rhestrau aros, helpu pobl i gael y driniaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt yn ddigon cynnar ac yn ddigon cyflym ac fe allai helpu o ran capasiti yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol, lle y gwyddom fod problemau y mae angen eu datrys. Gellid cynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn yn gyflym. Nid oes angen iddo gymryd mwy nag ychydig fisoedd a gellid cael cyngor gan yr holl weithwyr proffesiynol yn y maes sy'n teimlo yr hoffent gyfrannu at ein helpu i ddatrys y broblem hon.

**David Melding:** A bod yn deg, mae'r Gweinidog fel arfer yn gwrtais ac yn ildio yn ystod ei gyfraniadau; ni wnaeth hynny y prynhawn yma, gan adlewyrchu sensitifrwydd y pwnc hwn. A ydych yn credu y byddai adolygiad yn ein galluogi i archwilio faint mwy o ofal cartref sydd ei angen arnom? Gwyddom fod y pecynnau yn llawer mwy erbyn hyn, ond bod llai yn eu cael bellach. Mae hynny wedi bod yn bolisi dramatig o dan y Llywodraeth hon.

Yr oeddwn yn tybio ei bod yn rhyfedd bod y Gweinidog wedi penderfynu ymhelaethu ar sylwadau ei gyd-Aelod, Lorraine Barrett, sef, pe byddai digon o leoedd mewn cartrefi gofal nysio mewn awdurdod penodol, y byddai hynny'n rhoi'r ateb i unrhyw broblem o ran blocio gwelyau. Mae'n ddigon tebyg bod diffyg gofal cartref.

**Jonathan Morgan:** My colleague is right that it would be a mistake if this review focused entirely on care homes and care beds. We know that many people recover more quickly, if they are able to do so, with appropriate support in their own home. The delivery of domiciliary care—whether or not enough hours or packages are being delivered, whether there is enough financial support and whether there are appropriate numbers of trained therapists and other allied health professionals working in the community to support those people—is a matter of debate, which this review could examine.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae fy nghyd-Aelod yn llygad ei le pan ddywed y byddai'n gamgymeriad pe byddai'r adolygiad hwn yn canolbwyntio'n gyfan gwbl ar gartrefi gofal a gwelyau gofal. Yr ydym yn gwybod bod llawer o bobl yn gwella'n llawer cynt, os gallant wneud hynny, gyda chefnogaeth briodol yn eu cartref eu hunain. Mae cyflwyno gofal cartref—a oes digon o oriau neu becynnau yn cael eu darparu neu beidio, a oes digon o gymorth ariannol a niferoedd priodol o therapyddion hyfforddedig a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill perthynol i iechyd yn gweithio yn y gymuned i gefnogi'r bobl hynny—yn fater y gellid dadlau yn ei gylch, ac yn rhywbeth y gallai'r adolygiad hwn ei archwilio.

4.30 p.m.

I welcome the support of all Members and the road-to-Damascus conversion of the Labour benches. After almost eight years in the Chamber, I am delighted that I appear to have achieved a degree of unanimity on a particular matter.

Croesawaf gefnogaeth yr holl Aelodau a thröedigaeth ar y ffordd i Ddamascus y meinciau Llafur. Wedi wyth mlynedd bron yn y Siambr, yr wyf wrth fy modd fy mod fel petawn wedi llwyddo i sicrhau rhywfaint o unfrydedd ar bwnc penodol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 59, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 59, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 58, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 58, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice



Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3295 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to commission an independent review of delayed transfers of care which will bring forward recommendations for both health service and social care settings to examine:*

*(a) the ways in which acute hospital beds may be used more effectively;*

*(b) how the wellbeing of patients ready for discharge can be promoted;*

*(c) the development of joint or pooled budgets for healthcare and social services to improve co-ordination between local health boards and local authorities; and*

Cynnig NDM3295 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gomisiynu adolygiad annibynnol o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal a fydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion bod lleoliadau gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, y naill a'r llall, yn archwilio:*

*(a) ffyrdd y gellid defnyddio gwelyau aciwt ysbytai yn fwy effeithiol;*

*(b) sut y gellir hyrwyddo lles cleifion sy'n barod i gael eu rhyddhau;*

*(c) datblygu cyd-gyllidebau neu gyllidebau cyfunol ar gyfer gofal iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol er mwyn gwella'r cydlynad rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol; a*

*(d) whether there are sufficient social care places and appropriately trained staff available.*      *(ch) a oes digon o leoedd gofal cymdeithasol a staff wedi'u hyfforddi'n briodol ar gael.*

*2. believes that the review should consider whether it is necessary for the Assembly Government to compel local authorities and local health boards to pool budgets.*      *2. yn credu y dylai'r adolygiad ystyried a oes rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad orfodi awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd lleol i gyfuno eu cyllidebau.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 58, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 58, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol Pwyllgor y Tŷ The Annual Report of the House Committee**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** I propose that  
**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 18.12, notes the annual report of the House Committee for 2005-06, which was laid in the Table Office on 30 October 2006. (NDM3294)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 18.12, yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol Pwyllgor y Tŷ ar gyfer 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Hydref 2006. (NDM3294)*

I thank the staff of the Assembly Parliamentary Service who have worked to make it possible for us to have our debates in the House Committee, and to reach conclusions on legislative matters brought before us by Members and the Welsh Assembly Government. By saying 'staff', I mean all staff, from the Clerk to the Assembly down to the contracted staff, the caterers and the cleaners. Everyone has a contribution to make, and, without any one of them, we would not have had such a successful session in 2005-06. I also thank members of the House Committee and members of the sub-groups for providing help and support in the work of the House Committee that produced the report.

Diolchaf i staff Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad sydd wedi gweithio i beri bod modd i ni gael ein dadleuon ym Mhwyllgor y Tŷ, a dod i gasgliadau ar faterion deddfwriaethol a ddygwyd ger ein bron gan yr Aelodau a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Pan soniaf am 'staff', golygaf yr holl staff, o Glerc y Cynulliad hyd at y staff sydd wedi'u contractio, yr arlwywyr a'r glanhawyr. Mae gan bawb gyfraniad i'w wneud, a heb bob un ohonynt, ni fyddem wedi cael sesiwn mor llwyddiannus yn 2005-06. Diolchaf hefyd i aelodau Pwyllgor y Tŷ ac aelodau'r is-grwpiau am roi cymorth a chefnogaeth i waith Pwyllgor y Tŷ a gynhyrchodd yr adroddiad.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr oeddwn wedi paratoi araith hirach, ond mae'n amlwg mai eitem fer fydd hon. Felly, cefnogaf y cynnig yn ffurfiol.

**Owen John Thomas:** I had prepared a longer speech, but it is clear that this was intended to be a short item. Therefore, I formally support the motion.

*Cynnig (NDM3294): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NDM3294): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am **The Presiding Officer:** That brings our  
heddiw. proceedings today to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.33 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 4.33 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)