



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 7 Mawrth 2007  
Wednesday, 7 March 2007**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio  
Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration
- 23 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau  
Questions to the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks
- 43 Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd ar ei Chyfrifoldebau heblaw am Fusnes  
Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business
- 58 Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig  
Revised Business Statement
- 63 Cymeradwyo'r Penderfyniad ynghylch Cynlluniau Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref  
(Categoriâu Gwaith ac Uchafsymiau Grant) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2007 o dan Reol  
Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii)  
Approval of the Home Energy Efficiency Schemes (Categories of Works And  
Maximum Amounts Of Grant) (Wales) (Amendment) Determination 2007 under  
Standing Order No. 29.3(iii)
- 66 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Pwerau  
Fframwaith) (Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol) 2007 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 26  
Approval of the National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence) (Conversion  
of Framework Powers) Order 2007 under Standing Order No. 26
- 69 Cymeradwyo Egwyddorion a Bennwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn  
Penderfynu, yn unol ag Adran 52B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 (fel y'i  
Diwygiwyd), a yw Anghenion Cyllideb Awdurdodau Lleol ar gyfer 2007/08 yn  
Ormodol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29  
Approval under Standing Order No. 29 of the Principles Determined by the National  
Assembly for Wales for Deciding, in accordance with section 52B of the Local  
Government Finance Act 1992 (as amended) whether Local Authorities' Budget  
Requirements for 2007/08 are Excessive
- 91 Cyflogaeth gan y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru  
Public Services Employment in Wales
- 101 Cynnig Gweithdrefnol  
Procedural Motion
- 102 Cyflogaeth gan y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru: Parhad  
Public Services Employment in Wales: Continued
- 138 Dadl Fer: 'O Geiniog i Geiniog'—Pam bod Llythrennedd Ariannol yn Bwysig  
Short Debate: 'Looking After the Pennies'—Why Financial Literacy Matters
- 149 Dadl Fer: Cymunedau Mwy Diogel  
Short Debate: Safer Communities

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration**

### **Tai Amlfeddiannaeth Houses of Multiple Occupation**

**Q1 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the enforcement of regulations for houses in multiple occupation in Mid and West Wales? OAQ1100(SJR)

**C1 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am orfodi rheoliadau ar gyfer tai amlfeddiannaeth yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ1100(SJR)

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** Local authorities are currently introducing the new licensing arrangements for houses in multiple occupation and will be responsible for enforcing the new regulations.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Mae awdurdodau lleol yn cyflwyno'r trefniadau trwyddedu newydd ar gyfer tai amlfeddiannaeth ar hyn o bryd, a byddant yn gyfrifol am orfodi'r rheoliadau newydd.

**Lisa Francis:** In seaside towns, there are many houses in multiple occupation, and problems associated with those houses often arise because no landlord can be found on the spot. The problems include drug and alcohol abuse and high noise levels. Last summer, you told us that you would talk to your colleagues in local government about the advisability of displaying signs in the windows of HMOs providing local residents with the contact details of landlords or property managers accountable for such problems. It seems to me that this would be a good idea, because, after all, licensees of public houses must have their names above the door. Could you update us on how your talks with local government to that end have progressed?

**Lisa Francis:** Mae yna nifer o dai feddiannaeth mewn trefi glan môr, a chyfyd problemau'n aml yn gysylltiedig â'r tai hynny am nad oes landlord ar gael yn y fan a'r lle. Mae'r problemau'n cynnwys camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol a lefelau sŵn uchel. Yr haf diwethaf, dywedasoeh wrthym y byddech yn siarad â'ch cydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol ynglŷn â doethineb dangos arwyddion yn ffenestri tai amlfeddiannaeth sy'n rhoi manylion cyswllt i drigolion lleol am landlordiaid neu reolwyr eiddo sy'n atebol am broblemau o'r fath. Ymddengys i mi y byddai hwn yn syniad da, oherwydd, wedi'r cyfan, rhaid i drwyddedigion tafarnau gael eu henwau uwchben y drws. A wnewch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y cynnydd yn eich trafodaethau gyda llywodraeth leol i'r perwyl hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** I understand that my officials have discussed this with local authorities and that the option did not find favour. I will check to see whether further discussions have taken place. I seem to recall that you and Elin Jones have raised this issue with me previously, as has Ann Jones in relation to Rhyl in her constituency. As Members want me to look at this matter further, I would be happy to do so.

**Edwina Hart:** Deallaf fod fy swyddogion wedi trafod hyn gydag awdurdodau lleol ac nad oedd y dewis yn plesio. Byddaf yn cadarnhau a fu trafodaethau pellach. Tybiaf i chi ac Elin Jones godi'r mater hwn gyda mi eisoes, fel y gwnaeth Ann Jones mewn perthynas â'r Rhyl yn ei hetholaeth hi. Gan fod Aelodau am i mi ystyried y mater hwn ymhellach, gwnaf hynny'n llawen.

**Elin Jones:** Mae hyn yn gysylltiedig â'r gwelliant a gyflwynais y llynedd i'r rheoliadau perthnasol. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae twf tai amlfeddiannaeth mewn tref fel Aberystwyth yn golygu bod llai o deuluoedd yn byw yng nghanol y dref, a dywed teuluoedd sy'n byw yn y fan honno wrthyf eu bod yn teimlo fel pe baent yn cael eu mygu wrth gael eu hamgylchynu gan y tai hyn. Dylid pennu mwyafswm o dai amlfeddiannaeth y gellir rhoi caniatâd cynllunio iddynt ym mhob stryd mewn tref fel Aberystwyth. I wneud hynny'n llwydiannus, dylid gostwng y trothwy a diffinio tŷ o'r fath fel un sydd â thri pherson yn byw yn annibynnol ynddo. A ydych yn cytuno â hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** I am happy with the arrangements that we have in place, although I appreciate fully the concerns you expressed, Elin. I would be happy to discuss the feasibility of these issues with officials and report back to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee on any outcomes.

**Elin Jones:** This relates to my amendment to the relevant regulations last year. As you will know, Minister, the increasing number of HMOs in towns such as Aberystwyth mean that fewer families live in the town centre, and those that do live there tell me that being surrounded by these houses creates a feeling of claustrophobia. We need to limit the number of HMOs given planning permission in any one street in towns such as Aberystwyth. To do this successfully, the threshold needs to be lowered and an HMO should be defined as a house where there are three people living independently. Do you agree?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y trefniadau sydd ar waith gennym, er fy mod yn sylweddoli eich pryderon, Elin. Byddwn yn falch trafod ymarferoldeb y materion hyn gyda swyddogion, a chyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am unrhyw ganlyniadau.

### **Tai Fforddiadwy Affordable Housing**

**Q2 David Melding:** Will the Minister outline her policies to increase the availability of affordable housing in Wales? OAQ1096(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** We have progressively increased the budget for the social housing grant programme over 2005-06 to 2007-08 and introduced a comprehensive package of policy measures and guidance aimed at increasing supply. These include revised technical advice notes 1 and 2, a local housing market assessment guide, and the affordable housing toolkit.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that we need to build more houses and that the lack of availability of family homes for young people is one of the major challenges that Wales faces and should be one of the top priorities for the next Assembly?

**Edwina Hart:** It is one of the top priorities for us in terms of the development of affordable housing, and this can be affordable

**C2 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei pholisïau i gynyddu nifer y tai fforddiadwy sydd ar gael yng Nghymru? OAQ1096(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Cynyddwyd y gyllideb yn raddol gennym ar gyfer y rhaglen grant tai cymdeithasol yn ystod 2005-06 hyd at 2007-, a chyflwynwyd pecyn cynhwysfawr o fesurau polisi a chanllawiau yn anelu at gynyddu'r cyflenwad. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys nodiadau cyngor technegol diwygiedig 1 a 2, canllaw asesu'r farchnad dai leol, a'r pecyn cymorth ar dai fforddiadwy.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch fod angen i ni adeiladu mwy o dai, ac mai diffyg cartrefi teuluol ar gyfer pobl ifanc yw un o'r prif heriau sy'n wynebu Cymru, ac y dylai fod yn un o brif flaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad nesaf?

**Edwina Hart:** Y mae'n un o'n prif flaenoriaethau o ran datblygu tai fforddiadwy, a gall hynny fod yn dai

housing available for purchase or rent. Ensuring that people have decent homes is a priority across Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ynghylch pwynt David Melding ar sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy ar gael, a gytunwch fod nodyn cyngor technegol 15 yn cynrychioli problem oherwydd, wrth gyfyngu ar y tir sydd ar gael i godi tai arno, bydd llai o dai ar gael, a golyga hyn y bydd yn sir Gaerfyrddin, er enghraifft, lai o dai fforddiadwy ar gyfer pobl ifanc?

**Edwina Hart:** I note your point and I will certainly raise it with my colleague, Carwyn Jones.

**Mick Bates:** I congratulate you on your efforts to provide more affordable housing, and on the preparation of the affordable housing toolkit. However, for me, a crucial issue in this regard is affordable land, as, often, that is the part that means that young people are priced out of the market. What discussions have you had with the Minister responsible for planning to ensure that more land is released at an affordable price, particularly using a planning rule known as 'rural exemptions'?

**Edwina Hart:** We have developed a protocol for the disposal of land owned by the Assembly Government and the former Assembly-sponsored public bodies to aid the development of affordable housing. Hopefully, that protocol will be finalised shortly, which is good news. We have also given local authorities the freedom to sell land at a discount to stimulate the provision of affordable housing. I think that these two measures will assist the situation, but I agree that the price of land is the issue.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for that comprehensive reply. I am very pleased to hear that you have a policy to dispose of Government-owned land. Further to that, when such land is disposed of, will you make it a condition that community land trusts be given the first option on its disposal? One issue is with retaining affordable housing within a community, as, often, it is lost. If a community land trust were to have the first

fforddiadwy i'w prynu neu eu rhentu. Mae sicrhau bod gan bobl dai gweddus yn flaenoriaeth ar draws Cymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** On David Melding's point about ensuring the provision of affordable housing, do you agree that technical advice note 15 represents a problem, in that placing restrictions on the land available for housing developments means that fewer houses will be built, and this will mean in Carmarthenshire, for example, that fewer affordable houses will be available for young people?

**Edwina Hart:** Nodaf eich pwynt, ac yn sicr fe'i codaf gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Carwyn Jones.

**Mick Bates:** Hoffwn eich llongyfarch ar eich ymdrechion i ddarparu mwy o dai fforddiadwy, ac am baratoi'r pecyn cymorth ar dai fforddiadwy. Fodd bynnag, i mi mae tir fforddiadwy yn fater hanfodol yn hyn, gan mai'r rhan honno, yn aml, sy'n golygu nad yw pobl ifanc yn gallu fforddio prisiau'r farchnad. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio i sicrhau bod mwy o dir fforddiadwy ar gael, yn enwedig drwy ddefnyddio rheol gynllunio a elwir yn 'eithriadau gwledig'?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym wedi datblygu protocol ar gyfer gwerthu tir sy'n eiddo i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r hen gyrff cyhoeddus a noddid gan y Cynulliad i gynorthwyo'r gwaith o ddablygu tai fforddiadwy. Y gobaith yw cwblhau'r protocol cyn hir, sy'n newyddion da. Yr ydym hefyd wedi rhoi rhyddid i awdurdodau lleol werthu tir am bris llai er mwyn sbarduno'r darpariaeth o dai fforddiadwy. Credaf y bydd y ddau fesur hyn yn helpu'r sefyllfa, ond cytunaf mai pris tir yw'r broblem.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch am yr ymateb cynhwysfawr hwnnw. Yr wyf yn falch iawn clywed bod gennych bolisi i werthu tir sy'n eiddo i'r Llywodraeth. At hynny, pan werthir tir o'r fath, a fyddwch yn gosod amod bod ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol yn cael y cynnig cyntaf i'w brynu? Un broblem yw cadw tai fforddiadwy o fewn cymuned, gan eu bod yn cael eu colli'n aml. Pe bai ymddiriedolaeth tir cymunedol yn cael y

option on the disposal of Government-owned land, it could then draw up criteria that would always enable local people to have affordable property available.

**Edwina Hart:** I am happy to take on board Mick Bates's points on this issue, and I will raise the matter for further discussion with my officials and other Government Ministers.

cyfle cyntaf i brynu tir sy'n eiddo i'r Llywodraeth, gallai wedyn lunio meini prawf a fyddai'n sicrhau bod eiddo fforddiadwy ar gael i bobl leol bob amser.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn falch ystyried pwyntiau Mick Bates ar y mater hwn, a chodaf y mater i'w drafod ymhellach gyda fy swyddogion a Gweinidogion eraill y Llywodraeth.

### **Tlodi Ymhlith Plant Child Poverty**

**Q3 Carl Sargeant:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's progress towards its aim of eradicating child poverty by 2020? OAQ1095(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The percentage of children living in poverty in Wales has fallen from 35 per cent at the time of the devolution settlement to 28 per cent in the most recent period. Progress has been made, and the reduction in Wales has happened further and faster than it has in many other parts of the UK.

**Carl Sargeant:** End Child Poverty Network Cymru warns us that parents living on low incomes are struggling to meet the increasingly diverse hidden costs of sending their children to school, including paying for school uniforms, school equipment, branded sports kit, field trips, and, of course, specialist computer software, all of which places a huge financial strain on parents. I agree that we have made some significant strides to help, including providing free entry to museums, which has allowed children to go on inexpensive school trips, as well as introducing school uniform allowances and free school breakfasts. However, schools should primarily be a place in which to learn. What does the Minister think we should be doing to ensure that the first lesson that children from poorer backgrounds learn is that they are just as important and as valued as children from more affluent backgrounds?

**Edwina Hart:** I trust that we, in Wales, value children from all backgrounds. The policy of the Government is certainly to

**C3 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynnydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru tuag at ei nod o ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020? OAQ1095(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae canran y plant sy'n byw mewn tlodi yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o 35 y cant adeg y setliad datganoli i 28 y cant yn y cyfnod diweddaraf. Gwnaed cynnydd, ac mae'r lleihad yng Nghymru wedi digwydd ymhellach ac ynghynt nag mewn nifer o rannau eraill o'r DU.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae Rhwydwaith Dileu Tlodi Plant Cymru yn ein rhybuddio bod rhieni sy'n byw ar incwm isel yn ei chael yn anodd talu'r amrywiol gostau cudd cynyddol o anfon eu plant i'r ysgol, gan gynnwys talu am wisg ysgol, offer ysgol, dillad chwaraeon arbennig, teithiau natur, ac, wrth gwrs, meddalwedd cyfrifiadurol arbenigol, bob un yn rhoi straen ariannol anferthol ar rieni. Cytunaf ein bod wedi cymryd rhai camau sylweddol i helpu, gan gynnwys darparu mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd, sydd wedi caniatáu i blant fynd ar deithiau ysgol rhad, yn ogystal â chyflwyno lwfansau gwisg ysgol a brecwast ysgol am ddim. Fodd bynnag, dylai ysgol fod yn lle i ddysgu yn bennaf. Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn credu y dylem ei wneud i sicrhau mai'r wers gyntaf y mae plant o gefndiroedd tlotach yn ei dysgu yw eu bod hwy lawn mor bwysig a gwerthfawr â phlant o gefndiroedd mwy cefnog?

**Edwina Hart:** Hyderaf ein bod ni, yng Nghymru, yn gwerthfawrogi plant o bob cefndir. Polisi'r Llywodraeth yn bendant yw

enhance opportunities for all children, irrespective of their background. Some of your points—relating to the cost of uniforms and trips, for example—are well made. Middle-class parents can put more money into the pot to assist their children. That is why we, as a Government, have a duty in this regard. My colleague, Jane Hutt, has taken the lead on children's issues. We have also taken the lead on the anti-poverty agenda with regard to children, and it is important that we integrate the approach across all Government departments.

**Leanne Wood:** According to Save the Children, 56,000 children are living in persistent and severe poverty in Wales. These children are living well below the poverty line. What does your Government intend to do to eradicate poverty for that group?

**Edwina Hart:** We are trying to eradicate child poverty across the piece. We have a plethora of measures in place across all portfolios aimed at dealing with the issues. If you look at my Deputy Minister's proposals for how we will implement those measures, you will see quite clearly that the matter is taken seriously across all portfolios, by virtue of the resources that have been made available, whether in education or in other areas. Focusing on health in some deprived areas is also important for those children.

**Leanne Wood:** Do you accept that a large proportion of those children live in single-parent households, and do you accept that, by introducing conditionality and benefit sanctions for single parents, there is a risk that more children will live in severe and persistent poverty? Bearing in mind the finding of the recent report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity that women with children are the group most discriminated against in the workplace, and considering that half of children who live in poverty live in households in which an adult is in work, so will you join me in condemning UK Ministers for these blatant attacks on single parents?

2.10 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I support all parents, whatever

gwella cyfleoedd i bob plentyn, waeth beth fo'i gefndir. Mae rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch—o ran cost gwisg ysgol a theithiau, er enghraifft—yn dda. Gall rhieni dosbarth canol roi mwy o arian yn y gronfa i gynorthwyo'u plant. Dyna pam mae gennym ni, fel Llywodraeth, ddyletswydd yn hyn. Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, wedi arwain y ffordd ar faterion plant. Yr ydym hefyd wedi arwain y ffordd ar yr agenda atal tlodi ymysg plant, ac mae'n bwysig inni yn integreiddio'r dull yn holl adrannau'r Llywodraeth.

**Leanne Wood:** Yn ôl Achub y Plant, mae 56,000 o blant yn byw mewn tlodi cyson a difrifol yng Nghymru. Mae'r plant hyn yn byw mewn tlodi enbyd. Beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ei wneud i ddileu tlodi ar gyfer y grŵp hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym yn ceisio dileu tlodi ymhlith plant yn gyffredinol. Mae gennym nifer helaeth o fesurau ar waith ar draws pob portffolio sy'n anelu at ymdrin â'r problemau. Os edrychwch ar gynigion fy Nirprwy Weinidog ar gyfer y ffordd y byddwn yn gweithredu'r mesurau hyn, fe welwch yn eithaf clir bod y mater yn cael ei gymryd o ddifrif ar draws pob portffolio, oherwydd yr adnoddau sydd ar gael, boed ym maes addysg neu mewn meysydd eraill. Mae canolbwyntio ar iechyd mewn rhai ardaloedd difreintiedig hefyd yn bwysig i'r plant hynny.

**Leanne Wood:** A ydych yn derbyn bod cyfran fawr o'r plant hynny'n byw mewn teuluoedd un rhiant, ac a ydych yn derbyn, drwy osod cosbau amodoldeb a budd-daliadau ar rieni sengl, y bydd perygl y bydd mwy o blant yn byw mewn tlodi difrifol a chyson? Gan gadw darganfyddiadau'r adroddiad yn ddiweddar gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal mewn cof mai menywod â phlant yw'r grŵp y gwahaniaethir yn eu herbyn fwyaf yn y gweithle, a chan ystyried bod hanner y plant sy'n byw mewn tlodi yn byw mewn cartrefi lle mae oedolyn yn gweithio, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i gondemnio Gweinidogion y DU am yr ymosodiadau haerllug hyn ar rieni sengl?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn cefnogi pob rhiant,



their circumstances, who do the best for their children. There is a choice in terms of whether people wish to take up employment, especially when children are young. It is important that we have a balanced discussion on these issues, as the focus should always be on what is of maximum benefit to the child. I will not comment on any UK Government proposals in this respect other than to say that, as the Welsh Assembly Government, we are committed to helping everybody, especially children, in poverty.

**Mark Isherwood:** The child poverty rate is now the same as in the UK as a whole, but the UK has one of the worst child poverty rates in Europe. As you know, independent research by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation found that, under present UK Government policies, barriers to work mean that Labour will fall substantially short of its target of eliminating child poverty by 2020. In fact, since 1997, the number of people in severe poverty across the UK has risen by 410,000, including, as we heard, 50,000 children living in severe poverty in Wales. What clear, measurable targets within a clear, measurable action plan do you propose in order to move Wales towards the goal of eradicating child poverty by 2020? This must be done in partnership with the UK Government, without which, no matter how good our collective intention, this cannot be achieved.

**Edwina Hart:** I refer you to our implementation plan, worked through by my Deputy Minister. We continue to liaise closely with the UK Government on issues that will help to bring about the achievement of that target.

**Mark Isherwood:** I note that the UK Government is this week proposing measures to tackle barriers to work with a big stick rather than addressing the need to remove those barriers with incentives to tackle the barriers that people face when trying to access full-time education or work. What representations are you and your Deputy Minister making to the UK Government on this basis?

**Edwina Hart:** I will have to consider any proposals from the UK Government. I will

beth bynnag fo'i amgylchiadau, sy'n gwneud y gorau i'w blant. Mae yna ddewis a yw pobl yn dymuno gweithio, yn enwedig pan fydd plant yn ifanc. Mae'n bwysig inni gael trafodaeth gytbwys ar y materion hyn, a dylid canolbwyntio bob amser ar yr hyn sydd o'r budd mwyaf i'r plentyn. Nid wyf am wneud sylw am unrhyw gynigion gan Lywodraeth y DU yn hyn, heblaw dweud, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ein bod wedi ymrwmo i helpu pawb, yn enwedig plant, mewn tldi.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'r gyfradd tldi ymhlith plant bellach yr un fath â chyfradd y DU gyfan, ond mae gan y DU un o'r cyfraddau tldi gwaethaf yn Ewrop ymhlith plant. Fel y gwyddoch, dangosodd ymchwil annibynnol gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, o dan bolisiâu presennol Llywodraeth y DU, fod rhwystrau rhag gweithio yn golygu y bydd Llafur ymhell o gyrraedd ei tharged i ddileu tldi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020. Yn wir, er 1997 mae nifer y bobl mewn tldi gan gynnwys, fel y clywsom, 50,000 o blant sy'n byw mewn tldi difrifol yng Nghymru. Pa dargedau clir, mesuradwy mewn cynllun gweithredu clir, mesuradwy yr ydych yn eu cynnig er mwyn symud Cymru ymlaen tuag at y nod o ddileu tldi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020? Rhaid gwneud hyn mewn partneriaeth â Llywodraeth y DU, oherwydd hebddi, waeth pa mor dda yw ein bwriad gyda'n gilydd, ni ellir cyflawni hyn.

**Edwina Hart:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at ein cynllun gweithredu, a gyflawnwyd gan fy Nirprwy Weinidog. Yr ydym yn parhau i gydgyssylltu'n agos â Llywodraeth y DU ar faterion a fydd yn helpu cyrraedd y targed hwnnw.

**Mark Isherwood:** Sylwaf fod Llywodraeth y DU yr wythnos hon yn cynnig mesurau i fynd i'r afael â rhwystrau rhag gweithio mewn ffordd fygythiol, yn hytrach na mynd i'r afael â'r angen am ddileu'r rhwystrau hynny gyda chymhellion i fynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau sy'n wynebu pobl wrth geisio manteisio ar addysg neu waith llawn amser. Pa sylwadau yr ydych chi a'ch Dirprwy Weinidog yn eu gwneud i Lywodraeth y DU ar y sail hon?

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ystyried unrhyw gynigion gan Lywodraeth y DU. Nid

not rush into saying anything at this stage, but I assure you that we will be making the appropriate representations, in line with our policy of helping people in that position.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Minister, there has been some debate as to whether you use absolute child poverty or a measure of child poverty that relates to the median. How do you measure your success? If you do not include absolute poverty, you will find at the end that huge numbers of people still fall outside your measure.

**Edwina Hart:** I am concerned that we look at those actually living in poverty, and that is an issue for us to consider in terms of how statistics stack up. Ongoing work is being done on this issue, Mike, because we must ensure that we correctly assess the problem of child poverty.

wyf am ruthro i ddweud dim ar hyn o bryd, ond gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn yn gwneud y sylwadau priodol, yn unol â'n polisi o helpu pobl yn y sefyllfa honno.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Weinidog, bu rhywfaint o ddadlau a ydych yn defnyddio tlogi absoliwt ymhlith plant ynteu'n mesur tlogi ymhlith plant yn ymwneud â'r ganolrif. Sut ydych yn mesur eich llwyddiant? Os nad ydych yn cynnwys tlogi absoliwt, fe welwch ar y diwedd y bydd niferoedd mawr o bobl yn dal y tu allan i'ch mesur.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr hyn sydd o bwys i mi yw ein bod yn edrych ar y rhai sy'n byw mewn tlogi mewn gwirionedd, ac mae hynny'n fater inni ei ystyried o ran sut y cymherir ystadegau. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar y mater hwn, Mike, oherwydd rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud asesiad cywir o broblem tlogi ymhlith plant.

#### **Undebau Credyd Cymru Welsh Credit Unions**

**Q4 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of Welsh credit unions? OAQ1107(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to developing strong credit unions in Wales, as we believe that they aid social and financial inclusion. Our current funding programme ends in March and we are working with key partners at the Wales Co-operative Centre to ensure that development funding continues to be available.

**Eleanor Burnham:** We all know of the invaluable role played by credit unions, particularly for poor members of Welsh society, especially given the rapaciousness of some of the large banks, against which hard-pressed customers are now railing. I know that the UK Government will probably look into this matter soon, but do you agree that we need to improve the financial literacy of many in society, especially young people? Are you able to assure us that you can provide funding to allow the wonderful credit

**C4 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol undebau credyd Cymru?? OAQ1107(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i ddatblygu undebau credyd cryf yng Nghymru, oherwydd credwn eu bod yn helpu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac ariannol. Bydd ein rhaglen ariannu bresennol yn dod i ben ym mis Mawrth, ac yr ydym yn gweithio gyda phartneriaethau allweddol yng Nghanolfan Cydweithredol Cymru i sicrhau bod arian datblygu'n dal i fod ar gael.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gwyddom i gyd am rôl werthfawr undebau credyd, yn enwedig i aelodau tlotaf cymdeithas yng Nghymru, ac yn arbennig o ystyried trachwant rhai o'r banciau mawr, sy'n wynebu gwrthwynebiad gan gwsmeriaid sy'n dioddef. Gwn y bydd Llywodraeth y DU fwy na thebyg yn ymchwilio i'r mater hwn yn fuan, ond a gytunwch fod angen inni wella sgiliau ariannol llawer o bobl mewn cymdeithas, yn enwedig pobl ifanc? A allwch ein sicrhau y gallwch ddarparu arian i ganiatáu i'r undebau

unions to discuss the vital issue of financial literacy, which is so difficult for schools and colleges to deal with in today's complex society?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not agree that credit unions are for the poorest in society—credit unions are excellent for all. It is important that we support our local credit unions. We must recognise the importance of every one of us getting into the good habit of saving and so on. It would do us no harm, when considering loans, to consider taking them out with credit unions, in light of your comments about major high-street lenders.

The issue of financial literacy came up in Huw's report on debt, as you will know, and some excellent work is being done in schools in Wales on this issue. We have been particularly impressed with that work. Also, individually, many credit unions try to forge links with schools.

Also, individually, many credit unions try to forge links with schools, whereby they do the school banking, and try to teach children. I am always happy to support any initiatives in that regard, and I know that credit unions are at the forefront, within their localities, of trying to do that with schools on an individual basis.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I just had my Caerphilly and District Credit Union statement a few days ago, so I am pleased by your comment that credit unions are for all of us, and that we should encourage the maximum level of support for them. Do you agree, Minister, that the Farepak debacle a few months ago emphasises that credit unions are a safe way of saving and that their use should be encouraged among all those who want to save up for expensive events such as Christmas?

**Edwina Hart:** I concur absolutely. Farepak illustrated that had people saved through a credit union they would have been far better off. There is a wider issue here, in that we must do more to encourage people to save and to be more financially literate. That must start in schools, because children will not

credyd rhagorol drafod mater hollbwysig sgiliau ariannol, sydd mor anodd i ysgolion a cholegau ymdrin ag ef yn y gymdeithas gymhleth sydd ohoni?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf yn cytuno bod undebau credyd ar gyfer y bobl dlotaf mewn cymdeithas—mae undebau credyd yn wych i bawb. Mae'n bwysig inni gefnogi ein hundebau credyd lleol. Rhaid inni gydnabod mor bwysig ydyw i bob un ohonom ddechrau'r arfer da o gynilo ac ati. Ni fyddai'n gwneud dim drwg inni, wrth ystyried benthyciadau, ystyried eu trefnu gydag undebau credyd, o gofio'ch sylwadau am brif fenthycwyr y stryd fawr.

Cyfeiriwyd at fater sgiliau ariannol yn adroddiad Huw ar ddyled, fel y gwyddoch, a gwneir gwaith gwych mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru ar y mater hwn. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw wedi creu argraff dda arnom. Yn unigol hefyd mae nifer o undebau credyd yn ceisio ffurfio cysylltiadau ag ysgolion.

Yn unigol hefyd mae nifer o undebau credyd yn ceisio meithrin cysylltiadau ag ysgolion, lle maent yn gwneud gwaith bancio'r ysgol ac yn ceisio dysgu plant. Yr wyf bob amser yn fwy na pharod i gefnogi unrhyw fentrau yn y cyswllt hwnnw, a gwn fod undebau credyd yn chwarae rhan flaenllaw, yn eu hardaloedd lleol, i geisio gwneud hynny gydag ysgolion yn unigol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Cefais fy adroddiad gan Undeb Credyd Caerffili a'r Cylch rai dyddiau'n ôl, felly, yr wyf yn falch clywed eich sylw bod undebau credyd yn addas i bawb, ac y dylem geisio annog cymaint o gefnogaeth â phosibl iddynt. A gytunwch, Weinidog, fod helynt Farepak rai misoedd yn ôl yn pwysleisio bod undebau credyd yn ffordd ddiogel i gynilo arian, ac y dylid annog eu defnyddio ymhlith pawb sy'n dymuno cynilo arian ar gyfer digwyddiadau costus fel y Nadolig?

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf yn llwyr. Dangosodd helynt Farepak, pe bai pobl wedi cynilo drwy undeb credyd, y byddent lawer yn well eu byd. Cyfyd mater ehangach, yn yr ystyr bod yn rhaid inni gwneud mwy i annog pobl i gynilo a bod yn fwy gwybodus am eu harian. Rhaid i hynny ddechrau mewn ysgolion,

necessarily get good habits from their parents.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I am encouraged by what the Minister has said about the importance of credit unions. I concur; I visited one recently in Rhyl, and I think that they do a first-class job. There is a particular problem in rural Wales, because of an inability to access credit unions. Does the Minister have any specific proposals, given that the current funding round ends in March, to tackle the problem of getting access to a credit union in Mid and West Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** The initiatives that have happened elsewhere, with credit unions linking into post offices, have been very useful. That has happened in Llanelli, for example. Linking credit unions into the rural post office network, and its collection points, might help in future. I am happy to do further work with the Wales Co-operative Centre to discuss these issues.

oherwydd nid yw plant o reidrwydd yn dysgu arferion da gan eu rhieni.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Caf fy nghalonogi gan yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am bwysigrwydd undebau credyd. Yr wyf yn cytuno; ymwelais ag un yn ddiweddar yn y Rhyl, a chredaf eu bod yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol. Cyfyd problem benodol yng Nghymru wledig, am nad oes modd cyrraedd undebau credyd. A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gynigion penodol, o gofio bod y cylch cyllido presennol yn dod i ben ym mis Mawrth, i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem o allu defnyddio undeb credyd yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r mentrau mewn manau eraill, lle mae undebau credyd yn cysylltu â swyddfeydd post, wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol iawn. Er enghraifft, digwyddodd hynny yn Llanelli. Gallai cysylltu undebau credyd â'r rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post gwledig, a'u manau casglu, helpu yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i wneud gwaith pellach gyda Chanolfan Cydweithredol Cymru i drafod y materion hyn.

### **Atal yr Hawl i Brynu Suspending the Right to Buy**

**Q5 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on suspending the right to buy in Wales? OAQ1087(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** We have a longstanding manifesto commitment to pursue suspension of the right to buy. The implementation of this policy requires legislation and, due to pressures on parliamentary time, it has not been possible to achieve this in the Westminster programme over the last four years.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am aware of your commitment, and I am sure that you are aware that Cardiff has lost over half its council housing stock. I have constituents who are living in appalling circumstances while waiting for council or social housing anywhere in Cardiff. In Scotland, the right to buy has been suspended in certain areas—councils can apply for pressured area status, and seven councils have so far taken up that opportunity. I was concerned recently to hear

**C5 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am atal yr hawl i brynu yng Nghymru? OAQ1087(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gennym hen ymrwymiad maniffesto i fynd ar drywydd atal yr hawl i brynu. Mae gweithredu'r polisi hwn yn gofyn am ddeddfwriaeth, ac oherwydd pwysau ar amser seneddol, ni fu'n bosibl gwneud hyn yn rhaglen San Steffan yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gwn am eich ymrwymiad, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol fod Caerdydd wedi colli dros hanner ei stoc tai cyngor. Mae gennyf etholwyr sy'n byw mewn amgylchiadau ofnadwy tra maent yn aros am dai cyngor neu dai cymdeithasol mewn unrhyw ran o Gaerdydd. Yn yr Alban, ataliwyd yr hawl i brynu mewn rhai ardaloedd—gall cynghorau wneud cais am statws ardal lle mae pwysau, a hyd yma mae saith cyngor wedi manteisio ar

Ruth Kelly talk about extending the right to buy to all social housing. Have you, in light of your views, had conversations with her or Government representatives about this suggestion, to make sure that Wales can have legislative control over this area after May, when we will have our enhanced powers? While I can see the electoral attraction of talking about extending the right to buy, I am sure that you would agree, Minister, that it will undermine our housing stock further.

**Edwina Hart:** I do not believe that I have had any correspondence on this matter as a Minister, but I will check. We attempted to add the provision on right to buy to the 2004 Housing Bill, but were not successful. The UK Government stated publicly that it was committed to right to buy at that time, and did not intend to make any significant changes to the scheme. Given our enhanced powers, I am sure that we will be able to right those particular wrongs, especially for areas where there is a high degree of pressure, as has been done in Scotland.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan eich bod wedi datgan llawer gwaith eich bod o blaid dod â'r hawl i brynu i ben mewn ardaloedd lle mae pwysau arbennig, beth sydd yn digwydd yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae tenantiaid tai cyngor yn dewis optio allan o ofal y cyngor sir a mynd o dan drefn wahanol? Beth sydd yn digwydd i'r hawl i brynu wedyn? Hefyd, beth fydd cyfrifoldeb y cynghorau lleol o ran dod o hyd i dai i bobl sydd yn ddigartref, gan na fydd gan y cynghorau eu tai eu hunain?

**Edwina Hart:** In Bridgend, the local authority is successfully working through those issues with the new housing association that has been established. There are issues on the transfer agenda and regarding what will happen in future that are of particular concern to people. However, the Bridgend example shows that it works well in respect of all the issues that you have raised today.

2.20 p.m.

y cyfle hwnnw. Pryder imi oedd clywed Ruth Kelly yn siarad yn ddiweddar am ymestyn yr hawl i brynu i'r holl dai cymdeithasol. A ydych chi, yng ngoleuni eich safbwyntiau, wedi cael trafodaethau gyda hi neu gynrychiolwyr y Llywodraeth am yr awgrym hwn, er mwyn sicrhau y gall Cymru gael rheolaeth ddeddfwriaethol dros y maes hwn ar ôl mis Mai, pan fydd gennym bwerau ychwanegol? Er y gallaf weld yr atyniad etholiadol o siarad am ymestyn yr hawl i brynu, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno, Weinidog, y bydd yn tanseilio ein stoc tai ymhellach.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chredaf imi gael dim gohebiaeth ar y mater hwn fel Gweinidog, ond fe ymchwiliad i hynny. Ceisiwyd ychwanegu'r ddarpariaeth hawl i brynu at Fesur Tai 2004, ond ni lwyddwyd. Dywedodd Llywodraeth y DU yn gyhoeddus ei bod wedi ymrwymo i'r hawl i brynu bryd hynny, ac nad oedd yn bwriadu gwneud dim newidiadau sylweddol yn y cynllun. O gofio'n pwerau ychwanegol, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn unioni'r camau hynny, yn arbennig ar gyfer ardaloedd lle mae llawer o bwysau, fel y gwnaed yn yr Alban.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Since you have stated many times that you are in favour of ending the right to buy in areas where there is particular pressure, what is happening in those areas where council tenants choose to opt out of county council care and come under a different system? What happens to the right to buy then? And what responsibility will the local councils have of finding housing for homeless people, as the councils will then have no housing of their own?

**Edwina Hart:** Ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, mae'r awdurdod lleol yn ymdrin â'r materion hynny yn llwyddiannus gyda'r gymdeithas tai newydd sydd wedi'i sefydlu. Mae yna broblemau gyda'r agenda drosglwyddo a'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol sy'n pery pryder arbennig i bobl. Fodd bynnag, dengys enghraifft Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ei fod yn gweithio'n dda ar gyfer yr holl faterion a godwyd gennych heddiw.

**Brynle Williams:** I am sorry to return to this once again, but there is an acute shortage of affordable housing stock, particularly in rural parts of north Wales, where houses cost seven times the average income. That is alarming. What work are you doing with local authorities to see more developments, such as the one proposed on Anglesey, at Pentraeth, where affordable homes would be built for local people?

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddychwelyd at hyn unwaith eto, ond mae prinder mawr o stoc tai fforddiadwy, yn arbennig mewn rhannau gwledig o'r gogledd, lle mae tai'n costio saith gwaith yr incwm cyfartalog. Mae hynny'n arswydus. Pa waith yr ydych yn ei wneud gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau mwy o ddatblygiadau, megis y datblygiad a gynigiwyd ar Ynys Môn, ym Mhentraeth, lle byddai tai fforddiadwy'n cael eu hadeiladu ar gyfer pobl leol?

**Edwina Hart:** My colleague Carwyn Jones has had many discussions regarding the use of planning powers to ensure more affordable housing is built. The successful use of section 106 and discussion with developers are both key factors. I continue to have these discussions with local authorities, so that they can do what they need to do, which is to discuss at the first stage of a development what type of affordable housing can be included.

**Edwina Hart:** Cafodd fy nghyd-Weinidog Carwyn Jones lawer o drafodaethau ar ddefnyddio pwerau cynllunio i sicrhau bod mwy o dai fforddiadwy'n cael eu hadeiladu. Mae defnyddio adran 106 yn llwyddiannus a thrafod gyda datblygwyr yn ffactorau allweddol. Yr wyf yn dal i gael y trafodaethau hyn gydag awdurdodau lleol, er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud yr hyn y mae angen iddynt ei wneud, sef trafod, wrth gychwyn datblygiad, pa fath o dai fforddiadwy y gellir eu cynnwys.

### Trwyddedau Teledu Television Licences

**C6 Owen John Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael ynglŷn â chynigion i roi trwyddedau teledu am ddim i deuluoedd ar incwm isel? OAQ1098(SJR)

**Q6 Owen John Thomas:** What discussions has the Minister had regarding proposals to provide free television licences for low-income families? OAQ1098(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The First Minister raised the matter of affordability in his meeting with Mark Thompson, Director-General of the BBC, last November. The Assembly Government also commented on the issue in its consultation response to the BBC charter review.

**Edwina Hart:** Codwyd mater fforddiadwyedd gan y Prif Weinidog yn ei gyfarfod gyda Mark Thompson, Cyfarwyddwr Cyffredinol y BBC, fis Tachwedd diwethaf. Gwnaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sylwadau ar y mater hefyd yn ei hymateb i'r ymgynghori ar yr adolygiad o siarter y BBC.

**Owen John Thomas:** Two weeks ago, Peter Hain, rather condescendingly, tried to secure the support of voters in Merthyr by suggesting that free television licences would help tackle inequality in such areas. Three days later, a report was published by the psychologist Dr Aric Sigman warning of the health dangers to children of watching too much television, which include obesity, shortsightedness and autism. He also said that allowing children to watch too much television is an abdication of parental responsibility. Obesity is a serious problem in

**Owen John Thomas:** Bythefnos yn ôl, ceisiodd Peter Hain, braidd yn nawddoglyd, sicrhau cefnogaeth pleidleiswyr Merthyr drwy awgrymu y byddai trwyddedau teledu am ddim yn helpu mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb mewn ardaloedd o'r fath. Dridiau'n ddiweddarach, cyhoeddwyd adroddiad gan y seicolegydd Dr Aric Sigman yn rhybuddio am y peryglon i iechyd plant oherwydd gwylio gormod o deledu, sy'n cynnwys gordewdra, golygon byr ac awtistiaeth. Dywedodd hefyd fod gadael i blant wyllo gormod o deledu yn golygu bod

Wales, so will you distance yourself from Peter Hain's comments, which do little to encourage a healthy lifestyle and will certainly not address issues of social exclusion in Merthyr or anywhere else?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not believe that it would be appropriate for me to comment on the report to which you refer, because I am not an expert in this area. It is a matter for parents to decide what they want to do about their children watching television and issues related to that. I do not think that it would be helpful for me to enter into this debate from an uneducated point of view.

**Glyn Davies:** Access to television services is hugely important, but it is sometimes more difficult for low-income families and pensioners. We often discuss the issue of free television licences, which is part of this question. However, with digitisation, there are many extra costs associated with equipment and the new system. Are you leading on discussions to ensure that the Government addresses access to television for those who are least able to afford it?

**Edwina Hart:** Interestingly, Wales has the highest take-up of digital television in the UK, with 83 per cent of households having converted, compared with the UK average of 79 per cent. The level of take-up does not appear to vary a great deal between the different socio-economic groups. However, in light of your comments, I will take the matter up with Cabinet colleagues to see whether we can pursue a discussion. As far as I am aware, I have not been lobbied on this issue.

rhieni'n ymwrthod â'u cyfrifoldeb. Mae gordewdra'n broblem ddifrifol yng Nghymru, felly a wnewch chi ymbellhau oddi wrth sylwadau Peter Hain, nad ydynt yn gwneud fawr ddim i annog ffordd iach o fyw. Yn sicr, ni fyddant yn mynd i'r afael â materion allgáu cymdeithasol ym Merthyr nac mewn unrhyw le arall?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chredaf y byddai'n briodol imi roi sylw ar yr adroddiad yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ato, gan nad wyf yn arbenigwr yn y maes hwn. Mater i rieni yw penderfynu'r hyn y maent am ei wneud am adael eu plant i wylïo'r teledu, a materion sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny. Ni chredaf y byddai'n ddefnyddiol imi ymuno â'r ddadl hon a minnau heb yr arbenigedd.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae gallu cael gwasanaethau teledu yn eithriadol o bwysig, ond weithiau gall fod yn anos i deuluoedd incwm isel a phensiynwyr. Byddwn yn aml yn trafod mater trwyddedau teledu am ddim, sy'n rhan o'r cwestiwn hwn. Fodd bynnag, yn sgîl digideiddio, mae yna lawer o gostau ychwanegol yn gysylltiedig â chyfarpar a'r system newydd. A ydych yn arwain trafodaethau i sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn mynd i'r afael â gallu cael gwasanaeth teledu i'r rheini sydd leiaf tebygol o allu ei fforddio?

**Edwina Hart:** Yn ddi-ddorol ddigon, Cymru sydd â'r defnydd uchaf o deledu digidol yn y DU, gydag 83 y cant o gartrefi wedi trosglwyddo, o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd o 79 y cant yn y DU. Nid yw'n ymddangos bod lefel y defnydd yn amrywio ryw lawer rhwng y gwahanol grwpiau economaidd-gymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, yng ngoleuni eich sylwadau codaf y mater gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet i weld a allwn drefnu trafodaeth. Hyd y gwn i, nid wyf wedi cael fy lobïo ar y mater hwn.

### **Digartrefedd Homelessness**

**Q7 Christine Chapman:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to address homelessness among young people in the Cynon Valley? OAQ1116(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** We are addressing youth homelessness by providing guidance, grant

**C7 Christine Chapma:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd ymysg pobl ifanc yng Nghwm Cynon? OAQ1116(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc drwy roi

funding and good practice advice. We fund the Old Bakery project and the YMCA in Cynon Valley, which provide temporary accommodation and support to young homeless people. We also fund the community mediation service to help prevent youth homelessness.

**Christine Chapman:** Recently, several young homeless people in my constituency have contacted me regarding the lack of support that they are receiving, although I appreciate that there are some initiatives in the area. These people, predominantly, are aged 19 and 20. The main difficulty is that there is little support for people who do not fit into a priority group, such as teenage mothers, drug users or young offenders. Will you give your assurance that the Welsh Assembly Government will ensure that young homeless people generally receive the help and support that they need in order to prevent them from becoming vulnerable and, ultimately, another statistic in a priority group?

**Edwina Hart:** It is important to recognise that there are diverse groups of young people, and young people have expressed to me the fact that it is sometimes easier to receive help and assistance if you are part of one of those groups. However, we aim to ensure that services are provided for all young people to help them out of homelessness. Some of the accommodation that they have to stay in also makes them extremely vulnerable in terms of sharing with other people and what they do. These are important issues that we are addressing, slowly but surely, through our strategy.

**Jonathan Morgan:** How many young homeless people are there currently in Cynon Valley and how many were there in 1999? Furthermore, what proportion of council property remains empty in that constituency?

**Edwina Hart:** I have some official statistics that show the number of households that have been accepted as homeless in Rhondda Cynon Taf because the applicants were aged between 16 and 21. The number fell by 47 per cent between the July-to-September quarter of 2004 and the same quarter in 2006. This compares with a fall of 27 per cent

canllawiau, arian grant a chyngor am arfer da. Yr ydym yn ariannu prosiect yr Hen Bopty a'r YMCA yng Nghwm Cynon, sy'n rhoi llety dros dro a chymorth i bobl ifanc ddigartref. Yr ydym hefyd yn ariannu'r gwasanaeth cyfryngu cymunedol i helpu atal digartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae nifer o unigolion ifanc digartref yn fy etholaeth wedi cysylltu â mi'n ddiweddar am y diffyg cymorth iddynt, er fy mod yn sylweddoli bod yna rai mentrau yn yr ardal. Pobl 19 ac 20 oed ydynt gan mwyaf. Y prif anhawster yw nad oes fawr ddim cymorth i bobl nad ydynt yn rhan o grŵp blaenoriaeth, megis mamau yn eu harddegau, defnyddwyr cyffuriau neu droseddwyr ifanc. A roddwch sicrwydd y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn sicrhau bod pobl ifanc ddigartref yn gyffredinol yn cael y cymorth a'r gefnogaeth y mae arnynt eu hangen i'w hatal rhag bod yn agored i niwed ac, yn y pen draw, yn ystadegyn arall mewn grŵp blaenoriaeth?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod amrywiol grwpiau o bobl ifanc, ac mae pobl ifanc wedi dweud wrthyf ei bod weithiau'n haws cael cymorth os ydych yn rhan o un o'r grwpiau hynny. Fodd bynnag, ein nod yw sicrhau y darperir gwasanaethau i'r holl bobl ifanc i'w helpu i droi cefn ar ddigartrefedd. Mae rhai o'r adeiladau y mae'n rhaid iddynt aros ynddynt hefyd yn eu gwneud yn agored iawn i niwed wrth orfod rhannu gyda phobl eraill a'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud. Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â hwy, yn araf ond yn sicr, drwy ein strategaeth.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Faint o bobl ifanc ddigartref sydd yng Nghwm Cynon ar hyn o bryd a faint a oedd yno yn 1999? At hynny, pa gyfran o dai cyngor sy'n dal yn wag yn yr etholaeth honno?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gennyf rai ystadegau swyddogol sy'n dangos nifer y teuluoedd a dderbyniwyd yn ddigartref yn Rhondda Cynon Taf am fod yr ymgeiswyr rhwng 16 ac 21 oed. Cafwyd gostyngiad o 47 y cant rhwng y chwarter o fis Gorffennaf i fis Medi yn 2004 a'r un chwarter yn 2006. Mae hyn yn cymharu â gostyngiad o 27 y cant ledled



across Wales as a whole. If you want further detailed figures, I would be happy to supply them.

**Leanne Wood:** One issue that came out of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's recent review of youth homelessness was the position of care leavers—a large proportion of the homelessness statistics features that group. Do you think that social services departments should maintain responsibility for care leavers until they reach the age of 21, or perhaps beyond that, and, if so, what discussions have you had with the Minister for Health and Social Services to that effect?

**Edwina Hart:** I am currently going through the committee's report on youth homelessness in order to respond to it. This is one of the issues that I am picking up. I will be able to respond to you more fully when I have prepared my response to the report.

Cymru. Os hoffech gael ffigurau manwl pellach, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i'w darparu.

**Leanne Wood:** Un mater a ddeilliodd o adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio o ddigartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc oedd sefyllfa pobl sy'n gadael gofal—mae cyfran fawr o'r ystadegau digartrefedd yn cynnwys y grŵp hwnnw. A ydych yn credu y dylai adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gadw'r cyfrifoldeb am bobl sy'n gadael gofal tan iddynt gyrraedd 21 oed, neu ar ôl hynny o bosibl, ac os felly, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i'r perwyl hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn darllen adroddiad y pwyllgor ar ddigartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc ar hyn o bryd er mwyn ymateb iddo. Mae hwn yn un o'r materion yr wyf yn sylwi arnynt. Gallaf roi ymateb llawnach ichi ar ôl imi baratoi fy ymateb i'r adroddiad.

#### **Tlodi Tanwydd Fuel Poverty**

**Q8 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's strategy for combating fuel poverty? OAQ1126(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** 'Warm Homes and Energy Conservation Act 2000: A Fuel Poverty Commitment for Wales' recognises the importance of partnerships in the public and private sectors, and the role played by the Energy Saving Trust, the Welsh Local Government Association and others in helping us to reduce fuel poverty. Our main vehicle for tackling fuel poverty is the home energy efficiency scheme.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you are aware that a number of the larger power firms, namely ScottishPower, Manweb, Powergen and RWE npower, failed to recalibrate their prepayment meters swiftly enough following the rise in fuel costs. They have back-charged customers, which automatically throws a number of people into debt, which is considerable in some cases. You could

**C8 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd? OAQ1126(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae 'Deddf Cartrefi Cynnes ac Arbed Ynni 2000: Ymrwymiad Tlodi Tanwydd i Gymru' yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd partneriaethau yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, a rôl yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a sefydliadau eraill wrth ein helpu i leihau tlodi tanwydd. Ein prif gyfrwng i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd yw'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref.

**Janet Ryder:** Fe wyddoch, mae'n siŵr, fod nifer o'r cwmnïau ynni mwyaf, megis ScottishPower, Manweb, Powergen ac RWE npower, wedi methu ag ailgalibradu eu mesuryddion rhagdalau yn ddigon cyflym yn dilyn y cynnydd yng nghostau tanwydd. Maent wedi codi ar gwsmeriaid yn ôl-weithredol, sy'n golygu bod nifer o bobl yn mynd i ddyled, a hynny'n ddyled fawr mewn

speculate whether those companies would act as swiftly if they were recalibrating following a drop in fuel costs. Whether or not that is the case, do you not think that they should be made to not implement any price rises for customers until they have recalibrated those machines? They are throwing people into debt, and people are getting into debt through no fault of their own. What discussions have you had with the power companies and your colleagues in Westminster to address this issue?

**Edwina Hart:** I know that we all take fuel poverty very seriously, and we have been particularly worried about the hikes in costs over the last few years, which have a more adverse effect on low-income groups. I am happy to discuss with my officials what measures exist and what discussions are taking place and to report back to the Assembly.

**Alun Cairns:** Deregulation of the energy market has provided great opportunities for competition within the sector, and I hope that every Assembly Member supports that. As a result, different providers offer different prices. The traditional providers, which have now evolved, often have the highest prices in the marketplace. The possibility of switching is available, and the internet is an extremely useful tool with which to search the market, because there are so many providers and agencies available. Do you recognise that some sectors of society do not have access to the internet and will find it difficult to find the relevant information in order to switch providers? What thoughts do you have about undertaking a review of this issue to see what additional support we can provide?

**Edwina Hart:** I am not sure that I concur with all the sentiments that you expressed, but I will deal with the issue, which is to ensure that individual households have the opportunity to find the best deals that are available in the market. We are putting resources into many more communities in terms of internet access, but I will probably take up this issue with some parts of the voluntary sector to see whether they can be more proactive in helping individuals to switch suppliers, if that is for their benefit.

rhai achosion. Gallwch ddyfalu a fyddai'r cwmnïau hynny'n gweithredu mor gyflym pe baent yn ailgalibradu yn dilyn gostyngiad yng nghostau tanwydd. Beth bynnag am hynny, oni chredwch y dylid eu gorfodi i beidio â chodi prisiau i gwsmeriaid tan iddynt ailgalibradu'r mesuryddion hynny? Maent yn gorfodi pobl i fynd i ddyled, ac mae pobl yn mynd i ddyled er nad ydynt hwy ar fai. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'r cwmnïau ynni a'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwn ein bod bob un yn cymryd tlodi tanwydd o ddifrif, ac rydym wedi bod yn pryderu'n fawr am y cynnydd mewn costau dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, sy'n cael effaith mwy andwyol ar grwpiau incwm isel. Yr wyf yn barod i drafod gyda'm swyddogion ynglŷn â pha fesurau sydd ar waith a pha drafodaethau sy'n mynd ymlaen ac i adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae dadreoleiddio'r farchnad ynni wedi darparu cyfleoedd gwych ar gyfer cystadleuaeth yn y sector, a gobeithio bod pob aelod o'r Cynulliad o blaid hynny. O ganlyniad, mae gwahanol ddarparwyr yn cynnig prisiau gwahanol. Y darparwyr traddodiadol yn aml, sydd bellach wedi datblygu, sy'n cynnig y prisiau uchaf yn y farchnad. Mae'n bosibl newid darparwr, ac mae'r rhyngwyd yn dull defnyddiol iawn i chwilio'r farchnad am fod cynifer o ddarparwyr ac asiantaethau ar gael. A ydych yn cydnabod bod rhai rhannau o gymdeithas hyn methu defnyddio'r rhyngwyd, ac y byddant yn ei chael yn anodd cael y wybodaeth berthnasol i newid darparwyr? Beth yw eich barn am wneud adolygiad o'r mater hwn i weld pa gymorth ychwanegol y gallwn ei gynnig?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a wyf yn cytuno â phob un o'ch sylwadau, ond byddaf yn ymdrin â'r mater, sef sicrhau y caiff cartrefi unigol y cyfle i gael y cynigion gorau yn y farchnad. Yr ydym yn rhoi adnoddau i lawer mwy o gymunedau o ran mynediad i'r rhyngwyd, ond mae'n siŵr y byddaf yn codi'r mater hwn gyda rhannau o'r sector gwirfoddol i weld a allant fod yn fwy rhagweithiol wrth helpu unigolion i newid cyflenwyr, os bydd hynny o fudd iddynt.

2.30 p.m.

### **Tlodi Ymhlith Plant Child Poverty**

**Q9 Leanne Wood:** What representations has the Minister made to the UK Government on policies impacting on child poverty levels in Wales? OAQ1125(SJR)

**C9 Leanne Wood:** Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cyflwyno i Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch polisiau sy'n effeithio ar lefelau tlodi ymhlith plant yng Nghymru? OAQ1125(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** We have regular contact at political and official level about the implications of UK Government policy on child poverty levels in Wales. Specific representations have been made on various aspects of the welfare reform proposals, child support reform, and legal services provision.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn yn cysylltu'n rheolaidd ar lefel wleidyddol a swyddogol ynghylch goblygiadau polisi Llywodraeth y DU ar lefelau tlodi ymhlith plant yng Nghymru. Mae sylwadau penodol wedi'u cyflwyno ar amrywiol agweddau ar y cynigion diwygio lles, diwygio cynnal plant a darparu gwasanaethau cyfreithiol.

**Leanne Wood:** Thank you for that, Minister, because you said earlier that you did not want to comment on the UK Government's proposals with regard to benefit reform for single parents, yet this policy risks going against your Government's stated aim, which we in Plaid Cymru support, of eradicating child poverty by 2020. We need a strong response to these attacks on single parents. Will you therefore agree to write to UK Ministers to express the Assembly's concerns about benefit reform, particularly the potential of the reforms to plunge more children into poverty?

**Leanne Wood:** Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog, oherwydd dywedech yn gynharach nad oeddech am roi sylwadau ar gynigion Llywodraeth y DU i ddiwygio budd-daliadau ar gyfer rhieni sengl. Ond eto mae'r polisi hwn mewn perygl o fynd yn groes i nod penodol eich Llywodraeth, sy'n cael ei gefnogi gennym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru, sef dileu tlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020. Mae angen ymateb cryf i'r ymosodiadau hyn ar rieni sengl. Felly, a gytunwch i ysgrifennu at Weinidogion y DU i fynegi pryderon y Cynulliad ynghylch diwygio budd-daliadau, yn enwedig y potensial y gallai mwy o blant wynebu tlodi yn sgîl y diwygiadau?

**Edwina Hart:** I preface my comments by indicating that I have not responded to the current proposals, as you need time to reflect on what comes from the Westminster Government before giving a considered response. I have previously written to the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions about welfare reform, stressing the need to ensure that adequate safeguards are in place to protect the most vulnerable citizens, while providing positive assistance to help people to achieve the often difficult transition into work. I also acknowledge that there is a clear relationship between the level of state benefits and the rate of child poverty. Hardship resulting from benefits that are too low goes against our stated and shared aim of eradicating child poverty. I can assure

**Edwina Hart:** Cyn rhoi fy sylwadau, hoffwn ddweud nad wyf wedi ymateb i'r cynigion cyfredol, gan fod angen amser i ystyried yr hyn a ddaw oddi wrth Lywodraeth San Steffan cyn rhoi ymateb ystyriol. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau eisoes ynglŷn â diwygio lles, gan bwysleisio'r angen am sicrhau bod dulliau diogelu digonol ar waith i ddiogelu'r dinasyddion mwyaf diamddiffyn, gan ddarparu cymorth cadarnhaol i helpu pobl i symud i mewn i waith, sy'n aml yn gam anodd. Cydnabyddaf hefyd fod perthynas glir rhwng lefel budd-daliadau'r wladwriaeth a chyfradd tlodi plant. Mae caledi sy'n deillio o fudd-daliadau sy'n rhy isel yn mynd yn groes i'n nod penodol a rennir o ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant. Gallaf

Leanne that I will be looking with interest at the UK Government's proposals, and will respond to the Government, if necessary, with regard to pursuing our aim of eradicating child poverty here.

**Laura Anne Jones:** The Assembly Government has acknowledged how children from poor families are often left out of activities that others enjoy, as recently highlighted by the Save the Children report, because they are from low-income families, which Carl Sargeant rightly pointed out. That situation can be even more acute in the case of those who are disabled or from ethnic minority backgrounds. I believe that all children from all backgrounds should be able to play and engage in sporting activities. What initiatives do you have in place to ensure that all children from all families, particularly those from low-income families and those who are disabled or from ethnic minority backgrounds, are able to enjoy the same pleasures as everyone else?

**Edwina Hart:** I think that this is a cross-portfolio issue. I know that my colleague, Alun Pugh, is particularly interested in children being able to engage in cultural and sporting events, and he certainly likes to ensure that there is equal accessibility for individuals. As a Government, we have taken the issue of children seriously. With a Minister for children and a Cabinet sub-committee for children and young people, we are looking at all these issues across portfolios and we are developing, I hope, the correct policies to ensure proper engagement.

eich sicrhau, Leanne, y byddaf yn ystyried cynigion Llywodraeth y DU yn ofalus, ac yn ymateb i'r Llywodraeth, os bydd angen, o ran mynd i'r afael â'n nod o ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant yma.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cydnabod bod plant o deuluoedd tlawd yn aml yn cael eu heithrio o weithgareddau sy'n cael eu mwynhau gan eraill, fel yr oedd yr adroddiad gan y sefydliad Achub y Plant yn tynnu sylw ato'n ddiweddar, oherwydd eu bod yn dod o deuluoedd incwm isel, fel yr eglurodd Carl Sargeant yn gywir ddigon. Gall y sefyllfa honno fod hyd yn oed yn fwy anodd i bobl sy'n anabl neu'n dod o gefndiroedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Credaf y dylai pob plentyn, waeth beth fo'i gefndir, allu chwarae a chymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau chwaraeon. Pa fentrau sydd gennych ar waith i sicrhau bod pob plentyn o bob teulu, yn enwedig y rheini o deuluoedd incwm isel a'r rheini sy'n anabl neu'n dod o gefndiroedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig, yn gallu mwynhau'r un pleserau â phawb arall?

**Edwina Hart:** Credaf fod hwn yn fater ar draws portffolios. Gwn fod gan fy nghyd-Weinidog, Alun Pugh, ddiddordeb arbennig mewn sicrhau bod plant yn gallu cymryd rhan mewn digwyddiadau diwylliannol a chwaraeon, ac yn sicr, mae sicrhau bod unigolion yn cael hygyrchedd cyfartal yn flaenoriaeth ganddo. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud â phlant o ddifrif. Gyda Gweinidog dros blant ac is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc, yr ydym yn ystyried pob un o'r materion hyn ar draws portffolios ac yr ydym, gobeithio, yn datblygu'r polisiau cywir i sicrhau ymgysylltu'n briodol.

### **Trosglwyddo'r Stoc Tai Housing Stock Transfer**

**C10 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ganllawiau a roddwyd i awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â'r broses trosglwyddo stoc? OAQ1128(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Stock transfer guidelines were issued originally to local authorities in 2002. Additional guidance has been issued in the form of supplements to the main guidance,

**Q10 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on guidelines issued to local authorities on the stock transfer process? OAQ1128(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Rhoddwyd canllawiau ar drosglwyddo stoc i awdurdodau lleol yn wreiddiol yn 2002. Mae canllawiau ychwanegol wedi'u rhoi ar ffurf atodiadau i'r

and these are available on the Assembly Government's website, if Members wish to view them.

**David Lloyd:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai'r wybodaeth a rennir gan gynghorau lleol am y broses o drosglwyddo'r stoc tai fod yn hollol ddiduedd?

**Edwina Hart:** I hope that local authorities that are using guidance provided by the National Assembly for Wales are issuing unbiased guidance. I can assure you that the guidance that I have made available for the use of local authorities is purely factual.

**William Graham:** Minister, you will know that the Welsh Conservatives are clear that housing stock transfer represents the most practical way of bringing homes up to the Welsh housing quality standard. You will also know that, in Monmouthshire, tenants have recently voted in favour of stock transfer. What proposals will you put in place to ensure that as many tenants as possible are represented on the new bodies?

**Edwina Hart:** The point that you make is exceptionally important, William, because we want to see tenants having a large say in what happens if there is a transfer. It is important that we look at the models that we have, in which there is a balance of a third for tenants, a third for the community, and that we do our best to encourage that. It is important that tenants are empowered in the new process because, ironically, some tenants do not feel empowered by the existing arrangements, even though we have some successful tenants' groups. The Assembly has invested quite a lot of money in helping tenants to form organisations so that they can engage with local government.

prif ganllawiau, ac mae'r rhain ar gael ar wefan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, os dymuna'r Aelodau eu gweld.

**David Lloyd:** Do you agree that the information shared by local councils on the housing stock transfer process should be completely impartial?

**Edwina Hart:** Gobeithio fod awdurdodau lleol sy'n defnyddio canllawiau a roddwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cyhoeddi canllawiau diduedd. Gallaf eich sicrhau bod y canllawiau sydd ar gael at ddefnydd awdurdodau lleol yn hollol ffethiol.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, fe wyddoch fod Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn glir o'r farn mai trosglwyddo'r stoc tai yw'r ffordd fwyaf ymarferol i sicrhau bod cartrefi'n cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Fe wyddoch hefyd, yn Sir Fynwy, fod tenantiaid wedi pleidleisio'n ddiweddar o blaid trosglwyddo'r stoc tai. Pa gynigion a gyflwynwch i sicrhau bod cynifer â phosibl o denantiaid yn cael eu cynrychioli ar y cyrff newydd?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r pwynt a wnewch yn bwysig tu hwnt, William, gan ein bod am weld tenantiaid yn mynegi eu barn am yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd os caiff y stoc tai ei drosglwyddo. Mae'n bwysig inni edrych ar y modelau sydd gennym, lle mae cydbwysedd o draean i denantiaid a thraean i'r gymuned, a'n bod yn gwneud ein gorau i annog hynny. Mae'n bwysig i denantiaid gael eu grymuso yn y broses newydd oherwydd, yn eironig, nid yw rhai tenantiaid yn teimlo'u bod yn cael eu grymuso gan y trefniadau presennol, er bod gennym rai grwpiau tenantiaid llwyddiannus. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi cryn dipyn o arian i helpu tenantiaid i ffurfio sefydliadau fel y gallant ymgysylltu â llywodraeth leol.

### **Y Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni The Home Energy Efficiency Scheme**

**Q11 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement about progress with the home energy efficiency scheme? OAQ1104(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The scheme will have assisted

**C11 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd a wnaed gyda'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref? OAQ1104(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd y cynllun wedi

some 72,000 households by the end of 2006-07, at a cost of some £74 million. I recently extended the scheme regulation to ensure that householders aged 80 or over are now able to access the scheme without the need for any qualifying benefit.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Measures such as the winter fuel allowance and the home energy efficiency scheme, alongside schemes that reduce the cost of living, such as free bus travel, are helping to reduce pensioner poverty significantly in Wales. Do you agree, Minister, that HEES is helping many of the poorest pensioners across Wales to heat their homes efficiently? The assistance is very much welcomed by my older constituents in Conwy. I have held several informative workshops for older people, which have helped many of them.

**Edwina Hart:** I commend you, Denise, and other Assembly Members who have held workshops across their constituencies to advocate the benefits of looking at whether people are eligible for HEES. I hope that that work will continue, because it is nice for our constituents to see us out and about, selling something that is good news about what we are doing in Wales. Your point is well made, because the rate of pensioner poverty in Wales is lower than it is in Great Britain as a whole, so many measures have helped in combating pensioner poverty. However, the important point is that we have a scheme that enables people to have a good system placed in their home, and we want to encourage as many people as possible to take it up.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to Denise Idris Jones and the Minister for recognising the importance of the HEES scheme, which the opposition parties really squeezed during the budget negotiations. This was one of the concessions that the opposition parties were able to get—not only on this budget, but also on the previous budget. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’] It is interesting to hear the heckling, but—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Alun Cairns

cynorthwyo tua 72,000 o gartrefi erbyn diwedd 2006-07, am gost o tua £74 miliwn. Yn ddiweddar, ehangais reoliad y cynllun i sicrhau bod deiliaid cartrefi 80 oed a hŷn bellach yn gallu manteisio ar y cynllun heb angen unrhyw fudd-dal cymhwyso.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Mae mesurau fel y lwfans tanwydd gaeaf a'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, ynghyd â chynlluniau sy'n lleihau costau byw, fel teithiau bws am ddim, yn helpu gostwng tlodi ymhlith pensïynwyr yng Nghymru yn sylweddol. A gytunwch, Weinidog, fod HEES yn helpu nifer o'r pensïynwyr tlotaf ledled Cymru i wresogi eu cartrefi'n effeithlon? Mae'r cymorth yn cael ei groesawu'n fawr gan etholwyr hŷn yn fy etholaeth yng Nghonwy. Yr wyf wedi cynnal sawl gweithdy addysgiadol i bobl hŷn sydd wedi bod o gymorth i nifer ohonynt.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn eich canmol, Denise, ac Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad sydd wedi cynnal gweithdai yn eu hetholaethau i hyrwyddo'r manteision o weld a yw pobl yn gymwys ar gyfer HEES. Gobeithio y bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n parhau, oherwydd mae'n beth da ein bod yn cael ein gweld gan ein hetholwyr yn hyrwyddo rhywbeth sy'n newyddion da am yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yng Nghymru. Yr oedd gennych bwynt dilys, gan fod y gyfradd tlodi ymhlith pensïynwyr yng Nghymru yn is nag ar gyfer Prydain Fawr yn ei chyfanrwydd, felly mae nifer o fesurau wedi helpu mynd i'r afael â thlodi ymhlith pensïynwyr. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt pwysig yw bod gennym gynllun ar waith sy'n galluogi pobl i gael system dda wedi'i gosod yn eu cartref, ac yr ydym am annog cynifer â phosibl o bobl i fanteisio ar hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Denise Idris Jones a'r Gweinidog am gydnabod pwysigrwydd y cynllun HEES, y bu'r gwrthbleidiau'n pwyso'n galed am gael arian ar ei gyfer yn ystod y trafodaethau ar y gyllideb. Yr oedd hwn yn un o'r consesiynau y llwyddodd y gwrthbleidiau i'w cael—nid yn unig yn y gyllideb hon, ond hefyd yn y gyllideb flaenorol. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Mae'n ddiddorol clywed yr heclo, ond—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae Alun Cairns ar fin

is about to ask an interesting question.

gofyn cwestiwn diddorol.

**Alun Cairns:** Therefore, in recognition of opposition parties' efforts to grow this budget—and I have spoken to you about this before, Minister—do you recognise that we should be looking at every new innovation to use renewable products with HEES, and what instruction have you given to your officials to extend and review this further, as new technologies develop?

**Alun Cairns:** Felly, i gydnabod ymdrechion y gwrthbleidiau i gynyddu'r gyllideb hon—ac yr wyf wedi siarad â chi am hyn o'r blaen, Weinidog—a ydych yn cydnabod y dylem fod yn ystyried pob datblygiad arloesol newydd i ddefnyddio cynnyrch adnewyddadwy gyda HEES, a pha gyfarwyddyd yr ydych wedi'i roi i'ch swyddogion i ehangu ac adolygu hyn ymhellach, wrth i dechnolegau newydd gael eu datblygu?

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that we keep abreast of new technology in this area, and I have indicated to officials that we must be forward-looking in what we can put into the scheme. As the scheme is always under review, we have the opportunity to look at it innovatively. If anyone approaches Members with any innovative schemes, they should put them into the system here, so that officials can consider them.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig inni fod yn ymwybodol o dechnoleg newydd yn y maes hwn, ac yr wyf wedi sôn wrth swyddogion ei bod yn rhaid inni fod yn flaengar am yr hyn y gallwn ei gynnwys yn y cynllun. Gan fod y cynllun yn cael ei adolygu'n barhaus, mae gennym y cyfle i'w ystyried mewn ffordd arloesol. Os bydd unrhyw un yn sôn wrth Aelodau am unrhyw gynlluniau arloesol, dylent eu gosod yn y system yma, fel y gall swyddogion eu hystyried.

May I remind you that it is the Welsh Assembly Government that has total commitment to the home energy efficiency scheme, and the budget lines? As you recall, it was the Sue Essex budget that finally went through.

A allaf eich atgoffa mai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd ag ymrwymiad llwyr i'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, a'r llinellau yn y gyllideb? Fel y cofiwch, cyllideb Sue Essex a gymeradwywyd yn y pen draw.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau Questions to the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks**

### **Ffordd Osgoi y lli a Threorci Gelli and Treorchy Bypass**

**Q1 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on the proposed Gelli-Treorchy bypass? OAQ1299(EIN)

**C1 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ffordd osgoi arfaethedig y Gelli-Treorci? OAQ1299(EIN)

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council is promoting this scheme, as it forms part of the local highway network. The Welsh Assembly Government has received no recent application for funding support for this scheme, largely because I have not invited new projects in the last few years.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn hyrwyddo'r cynllun hwn, gan ei fod yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith priffyrdd lleol. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cael unrhyw geisiadau am gymorth ariannol ar gyfer y cynllun hwn yn ddiweddar, yn bennaf am nad wyf wedi gwahodd prosiectau newydd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

**Leanne Wood:** I have raised with you before, Minister, the need for a bypass for Gelli and Treorchy. We are all aware of the 300 job losses at Burberry and of the fact that companies wishing to relocate to the area will consider the transport links, which are pretty poor. The upper Rhondda Fawr is in economic decline. As Minister, could you be more proactive in deciding strategic priorities? The upper Rhondda Fawr needs special attention, which has been acknowledged by virtue of its inclusion in the Heads of the Valleys strategy at the eleventh hour. Therefore, as Minister, what do you intend to do to progress the proposed Gelli and Treorchy bypass?

**Leanne Wood:** Yr wyf wedi codi'r angen am ffordd osgoi ar gyfer y Gelli a Threorci gyda chi o'r blaen, Weinidog. Gwyddom i gyd am y 300 o swyddi a gaiff eu colli yn Burberry a'r ffaith y bydd cwmnïau sy'n dymuno symud i'r ardal yn ystyried y cysylltiadau trafndiaeth, sy'n ddigon gwael. Mae rhan uchaf Rhondda Fawr yn wynebu dirywiad economaidd. Fel Gweinidog, a allech fod yn fwy rhagweithiol yn eich penderfyniadau ar flaenoriaethau strategol? Mae angen sylw arbennig ar ran uchaf Rhondda Fawr, sydd wedi'i chydabod yn rhinwedd ei chynnwys yn strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd ar y funud olaf. Felly, fel Gweinidog, beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i hyrwyddo ffordd osgoi arfaethedig y Gelli a Threorci?

**Andrew Davies:** I find it rather ironic that Leanne Wood is now calling for this. When her party was in control at Rhondda Cynon Taf council, it did not put forward this road scheme for prioritisation. It is now the Labour-controlled Rhondda Cynon Taf council—supported by the local Assembly Member, and local councillors—that has asked for this proposal to be worked up. When it has been worked up and put forward, it will be considered in due course, as part of the normal process.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae braidd yn eironig i Leanne Wood fod yn galw am hyn yn awr. Pan oedd ei phlaid hi'n arwain cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf, ni chyflwynwyd y cynllun ffordd hwn fel blaenoriaeth. Yn awr, cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf o dan arweiniad Llafur—gyda chefnogaeth Aelod Lleol y Cynulliad, a chynghorwyr lleol—sydd wedi gofyn am i'r cynnig hwn gael ei ddatblygu. Pan fydd y cynllun wedi'i ddatblygu a'i gyflwyno, caiff ei ystyried maes o law, fel rhan o'r broses arferol.

2.40 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** You are right to remind the Chamber, Minister, that, when Rhondda Cynon Taf council drew up its transport plan in 2000, the Treorchy-Gelli bypass was not one of the prioritised routes. However, will you look at approaches from Rhondda Cynon Taf council about ways of managing the traffic situation better, particularly in the Treorchy area, as it is looking at ways of alleviating the current traffic problems, which may be one step towards having an effective bypass in the future?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr ydych yn gywir i atgoffa'r Siambr, Weinidog, nad oedd ffordd osgoi Treorci-Y Gelli yn un o'r blaenoriaethau pan luniodd cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf ei gynllun trafndiaeth yn 2000. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch chi ystyried sylwadau gan gyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf am dulliau i reoli'r sefyllfa draffig yn well, yn enwedig yn ardal Treorci, gan ei fod yn ystyried dulliau i leddfu'r problemau traffig presennol, a allai fod yn un cam tuag at gael ffordd osgoi effeithiol yn y dyfodol?

**Andrew Davies:** I have met with you and local councillors in the Rhondda Cynon Taf area to consider a range of proposals to deal with not only the Burberry position, but also the transport needs in the Valleys. We have been working with Rhondda Cynon Taf council and the South East Wales Transport Alliance, the regional transport consortium, to look at the transport priorities for the

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â chi a chynghorwyr lleol yn ardal Rhondda Cynon Taf i ystyried amrywiaeth o gynigion i fynd i'r afael nid yn unig â'r sefyllfa gyda chwmmi Burberry, ond hefyd yr anghenion cludiant yn y Cymoedd. Yr ydym wedi cydweithio â chynghor Rhondda Cynon Taf a Chynghrair Trafnidiaeth De-ddwyrain Cymru, y consortiwm trafndiaeth rhanbarthol, i



coming years. It will be for RCT to come forward with this, or any other, proposal, which will be considered in due course.

ystyried y blaenoriaethau trafndiaeth ar gyfer y blynyddoedd i ddod. Cyfrifoldeb cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf fydd cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn, neu unrhyw gynnig arall, a chaiff ei ystyried maes o law.

### **Gwasanaethau Rheilffordd (Canol De Cymru) Rail Services (South Wales Central)**

**C2 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am welliannau i wasanaethau rheilffordd i deithwyr yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ1286(EIN)

**Q2 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on improvements to passenger rail services in South Wales Central? OAQ1286(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Demand on Valleys lines has increased substantially, due partly to road congestion but also to rail service improvements. I have funded additional rolling stock to relieve peak overcrowding, and platform lengthening to accommodate longer trains. I also recently launched an £18.8 million-worth Assembly Government investment project to increase the frequency of the service between Pontypridd and Merthyr from hourly to half hourly. This week, I launched the work on Llanharan station.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r galw ar linellau'r Cymoedd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol, yn rhannol oherwydd tagfeydd ar y ffyrdd, ond hefyd oherwydd welliannau mewn gwasanaethau rheilffordd. Yr wyf wedi ariannu cerbydau ychwanegol i leddfu gorlenwi yn ystod oriau brig, ac i estyn platfformau ar gyfer trenau hwy. Hefyd, yn ddiweddar lansiais brosiect buddsoddi gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gwerth £18.8 miliwn i gynyddu nifer y gwasanaethau rhwng Pontypridd a Merthyr i redeg bob hanner awr yn hytrach na bob awr. Yr wythnos hon, lansiais y gwaith ar orsaf Llanharan.

**Owen John Thomas:** Croesawaf bob gwelliant ar y rheilffyrdd yng Nghanol De Cymru. Fodd bynnag, chwe blynedd yn ôl, Weinidog, bu ichi ddatgan eich bod am ddechrau cynlluniau i wella gorsaf Heol y Frenhines yn sylweddol. Beth yw eich targed presennol ar gyfer cynyddu potensial yr orsaf honno?

**Owen John Thomas:** I welcome any improvement to the railway network in South Wales Central. However, six years ago, Minister, you said you would commence a scheme to make significant improvements to Queen Street station. What is your current target for increasing the potential of that station?

**Andrew Davies:** We have been working with Network Rail and Arriva Trains Wales to identify ways of increasing capacity into both Queen Street and Cardiff Central stations. There are issues to be addressed, particularly the bridge near Queen Street station. We have been working with Network Rail on a feasibility study to look at the investment that is needed to release the bottleneck on that location.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio gyda Network Rail a Threnau Arriva Cymru i nodi ffyrdd i gynyddu nifer y trenau i orsaf Heol y Frenhines a gorsaf Caerdydd Canolog. Mae'r rhain yn broblemau y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy, yn enwedig y bont ger gorsaf Heol y Frenhines. Yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio gyda Network Rail ar astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i edrych ar y buddsoddiad y mae ei angen i ryddhau'r dagfa sydd yno.

The Cardiff Valley lines have been a real success story. We are now seeing growth on the Cardiff Valley lines of 10 per cent a year. It is one of the fastest growing rail services in the UK and, as a Government, we are

Mae llinellau Cymoedd Caerdydd wedi bod yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Yr ydym bellach yn gweld twf o 10 y cant y flwyddyn ar linellau Cymoedd Caerdydd. Hwn yw un o'r gwasanaethau rheilffordd sy'n tyfu gyflymaf

investing in increasing capacity. We have done so on the Aberdare line, where we have lengthened stations, the Merthyr line, and we will also shortly start work on the Rhymney Valley line. We are working with our partners, both the train operating companies and Network Rail, to look at the full costings of releasing the bottleneck at Queen Street station.

**Christine Chapman:** Good rail services are essential in enabling people to get to work within and beyond South Wales Central. On that point, will you join me in welcoming the rise in the national minimum wage, which will benefit 50,000 people in Wales, obviously including South Wales Central? As it is International Women's Day tomorrow, do you agree that women, traditionally some of the lowest paid in our society, will benefit a great deal from that rise?

**Andrew Davies:** Very much so. The minimum wage has been one of the most significant factors in helping those on low pay to achieve a dignified and reasonable rate of pay. I am delighted that, only yesterday, it went up from £5.35 to £5.52. This is very much a Labour Government achievement, which was opposed by the Conservatives. The Liberal Democrats, as ever, could not wholeheartedly commend anything and equivocated on that, and Plaid Cymru MPs could not even get out of bed to vote on the issue when it came before the House of Commons.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I believe that this question is about railways. I am sure that the minimum wage enables people to pay their rail fares.

**Leighton Andrews:** I welcome the announcement that you made earlier this week of the funding for platform extensions on the Cardiff to Treherbert line. Many of my constituents still have to put up with commuting at peak times in overcrowded trains that do not have enough carriages. This investment will make a significant difference to their lives as commuters.

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in my reply to

yn y DU, ac fel Llywodraeth yr ydym yn buddsoddi i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny eisoes ar linell Aberdâr, lle yr ydym wedi estyn hyd y gorsafodd, llinell Merthyr, a byddwn yn dechrau gweithio'n fuan hefyd ar linell Cwm Rhymni. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'n partneriaid, y cwmnïau gweithredu trenau a Network Rail i edrych ar yr holl gostau o leddfu'r dagfa yng ngorsaf Heol y Frenhines.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae gwasanaethau rheilffordd da yn hanfodol i alluogi pobl i fynd i'r gwaith yng Nghanol De Cymru a thu hwnt. Ar y pwynt hwnnw, a ymunwch â mi i groesawu'r cynnydd yn yr isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol, a fydd o fudd i 50,000 o bobl yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys Canol De Cymru yn amlwg? Gan eki bod yn Ddiwrnod Rhyngwladol y Merched yfory, a gytunwch y bydd merched, aelodau'r gymdeithas sy'n cael y cyflog isaf yn draddodiadol, yn cael llawer o fudd o'r cynnydd?

**Andrew Davies:** Yn bendant. Mae'r isafswm cyflog wedi bod yn un o'r ffactorau pwysicaf i helpu pobl ar gyflog isel i gael cyflog rhesymol ac urddasol. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud mai ddoe ddiwethaf y cododd yr isafswm o £5.35 i £5.52. Llwyddiant gan Lywodraeth Lafur yn sicr yw hyn, a wrthwynebwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr. Ni allai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, fel bob amser, gymeradwyo dim byd o ddifrif, ac yr oeddent yn amwys ynghylch hynny. Ac ni allai ASau Plaid Cymru godi o'u gwelyau i bleidleisio ar y mater hyd yn oed pan ddaeth gerbron Tŷ'r Cyffredin.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Credaf fod a wnelo'r cwestiwn hwn â rheilffyrdd. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr isafswm cyflog yn galluogi pobl i dalu am eu tocynnau trên.

**Leighton Andrews:** Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad a wnaethoch yn gynharach yr wythnos hon am ariannu estyn platfformau ar linell Caerdydd i Dreherbert. Rhaid i nifer o'm hetholwyr i deithio o hyd yn ystod oriau brig mewn trenau gorlawn heb ddigon o gerbydau. Bydd y buddsoddiad hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr iddynt fel cymudwyr.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i

Owen John Thomas, we are investing considerable amounts of money in increasing capacity on the Valley lines, particularly the Treherbert line, in something like 11 platforms at eight stations, and in signage work at 12 platforms, and this will obviously improve the facilities for local people. In many cases, those stations will accommodate six carriages, thereby increasing capacity, and we are working with Arriva Trains Wales on investing in new and additional rolling stock to ensure that we can satisfy the remarkable growth in demand for rail services on the Cardiff-Valleys line.

Owen John Thomas, yr ydym yn buddsoddi symiau sylweddol o arian i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth ar linellau'r Cymoedd, yn enwedig llinell Treherbert, mewn tuag 11 o blatfformau mewn wyth gorsaf, a gwaith ar arwyddion ar 12 platfform, a fydd yn amlwg yn gwella'r cyfleusterau i bobl leol. Mewn llawer achos, bydd y gorsafoedd hynny'n darparu ar gyfer chwe cherbyd, a thrwy hynny'n cynyddu'r ddarpariaeth. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda Trenau Arriva Cymru i fuddsoddi mewn cerbydau newydd ac ychwanegol er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn fodloni'r twf rhyfeddol yn y galw am wasanaethau rheilffordd ar y llinell rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 3, OAQ1262(EIN), has been transferred for written answer by the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 3, OAQ1262(EIN), wedi'i drosglwyddo i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

### **Cyflogaeth Sector Preifat Private Sector Employment**

**Q4 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on public sector employment in Torfaen? OAQ1260(EIN)

**C4 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus yn Nhor-faen? OAQ1260(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** The question tabled is on private sector employment.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd yn ymwneud â chyflogaeth yn y sector preifat.

**William Graham:** I apologise, I should have said 'private sector employment'. My supplementary question will be on public sector employment.

**William Graham:** Ymddiheuraf, dylwn fod wedi dweud 'cyflogaeth yn y sector preifat'. Bydd fy nghwestiwn atodol ar gyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus.

**Andrew Davies:** The economy remains buoyant in Torfaen, with companies looking to expand, such as Doncasters Castings in Blaenavon, which is creating 125 jobs with assistance from the Assembly Government. In addition, the area has attracted new inward investment projects such as Quative, which has recently made a substantial investment, creating 35 highly paid jobs.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r economi yn dal i ffynnu yn Nhor-faen, a chwmnïau'n ystyried ehangu yno, megis Doncasters Castings ym Mlaenafon, sy'n creu 125 o swyddi gyda chymorth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yn ogystal, mae'r ardal wedi denu prosiectau mewnffuddsoddi newydd megis Quative, sydd wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol yn ddiweddar, gan greu 35 o swyddi cyflog uchel.

**William Graham:** Thank you for your reply, Minister, and for anticipating my supplementary question. Having regard to public sector employment in Torfaen, you will be well aware of the representations made by workers in HM Revenue and Customs and their marked reluctance to

**William Graham:** Diolch am eich ateb, Weinidog, ac am ragweld fy nghwestiwn atodol. O ran cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus yn Nhor-faen, byddwch yn hollol ymwybodol o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan weithwyr Cyllid a Thollau EM a'u hamharodrwydd amlwg i symud i

transfer to offices in Cardiff, for reasons of which you are also well aware. Are you able to bring any particular pressure to bear so that this will not come about?

**Andrew Davies:** We have worked with UK Government Ministers and the Wales Office, at looking at this issue of public sector employment. As a Government, we have been extremely successful in working with the UK Government to attract civil service jobs to Wales, particularly in the greater Newport area with National Statistics, the prison service and a range of others, and in areas further afield. Therefore, as a Government, we are committed to creating employment opportunities, whether in the private or public sectors, and we will continue to do so.

**Lynne Neagle:** Do you agree that, despite the recent manufacturing job losses in Torfaen, the overall economic picture is extremely positive, with the unemployment rate at 3.4 per cent, with successful businesses such as Doncasters, to which you have just referred, expanding its operations, and with the knowledge economy being boosted by the excellent Springboard Innovation Centre? Do you agree that private enterprise has a really bright future in Torfaen?

**Andrew Davies:** From the enquiries that we are receiving from Wales-based companies and inward investors, it is clear that they see Torfaen as a prime location for investment. You mentioned Doncasters, but we have supported a whole range of companies, both inward investors and locally based companies. As a Government, we have invested over £40 million in support in the Torfaen area since 1999, and that has created or safeguarded nearly 5,000 jobs. This is a real success story and a success for Team Wales.

swyddfeydd yng Nghaerdydd, am resymau yr ydych hefyd yn hollol ymwybodol ohonynt. A allwch roi unrhyw bwysau penodol fel na fydd hyn yn digwydd?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU a Swyddfa Cymru i edrych ar gyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi bod yn llwyddiannus tu hwnt wrth weithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU i ddenu swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil i Gymru, yn enwedig yn ardal Casnewydd Fwyaf gyda'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, y gwasanaeth carchardai ac amrywiaeth o sefydliadau eraill, ac mewn ardaloedd sydd ymhellach i ffwrdd. Felly, fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i greu cyfleoedd gwaith, boed yn y sector preifat neu'r sector cyhoeddus, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

**Lynne Neagle:** A gytunwch, er bod swyddi gweithgynhyrchu wedi eu colli'n ddiweddar yn Nhor-faen, fod y darlun economaidd cyffredinol yn un cadarnhaol iawn, a'r gyfradd ddiweithdra yn 3.4 y cant, busnesau llwyddiannus megis Doncasters, yr ydych newydd gyfeirio ato, yn ehangu, a'r economi wybodaeth yn cael hwb gan Ganolfan Arloesedd ardderchog Sbardun Cymru? A ydych yn cytuno bod gan fentrau preifat ddyfodol llewyrchus iawn yn Nhor-faen?

**Andrew Davies:** O'r ymholiadau a gawn gan gwmmniau yng Nghymru a mewnffuddsoddwyr, mae'n amlwg eu bod yn gweld Tor-faen fel lleoliad pwysig i fuddsoddi ynddo. Soniech am Doncasters, ond yr ydym wedi cefnogi ystod eang o gwmmniau, yn fewnffuddsoddwyr ac yn gwmmniau lleol. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi dros £40 miliwn i gefnogi ardal Tor-faen er 1999, ac mae hynny wedi creu neu ddiogelu bron 5,000 o swyddi. Mae hon yn stori o lwyddiant gwirioneddol ac yn llwyddiant i Dim Cymru.

### Ffigurau GYC GVA Figures

**C5 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth a ryddhawyd yn ddiweddar? OAQ1281(EIN)

**Q5 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the recently released gross value added figures? OAQ1281(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** GVA in Wales exceeded £40 billion for the first time in 2005, reaching a level of £40.9 billion. GVA per head increased by 3.7 per cent in Wales in 2005, compared with 3.3 per cent for the UK as a whole.

**David Lloyd:** Despite the massive investment that was Objective 1, Wales's wealth, relative to the rest of the United Kingdom, is falling. Do you not agree that, with the additional help of Objective 1 that other parts of the UK did not have, and with all your efforts, Wales's relative wealth should have risen in comparison with that of the rest of the United Kingdom, not fallen?

**Andrew Davies:** It has risen. You talk about a decline in relative GVA, and that was the case, but the bulk of the fall in GVA happened when the Conservative Party was in power from 1979 to 1997. Opposition members may smile, but this issue was discussed fully at the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee only a couple of weeks ago. An extensive discussion took place at that time and I do not recall anyone at that meeting arguing against the analysis put forward in my paper, which showed that the substantial fall in relative GVA took place in the early 1980s and the mid 1990s.

2.50 p.m.

In fact, under Labour, that decline has been halted for the first time in the past 20 years. You make the point about wealth, and, according to the latest Eurostat estimates, average gross domestic product per head in west Wales and the Valleys between 2002 and 2004 was 79.6 per cent of the average of the 27 member states of the European Union, and that is up 2 percentage points on the previous three years. In terms of gross domestic household income, average weekly earnings and the growth in employment, growth in west Wales and the Valleys has exceeded that in the rest of the UK. That is a record of success, not of failure.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** At a lunchtime meeting today of the Halifax Bank of Scotland on the

**Andrew Davies:** Llwyddodd y GYC yng Nghymru i fynd dros £40 biliwn am y tro cyntaf yn 2005, gan gyrraedd £40.9 biliwn. Bu cynnydd o 3.7 yn cant y pen o'r boblogaeth yn y GYC yng Nghymru yn 2005, o'i gymharu â 3.3 y cant ar gyfer y DU gyfan.

**David Lloyd:** Er y buddsoddi anferth Amcan 1, mae cyfoeth Cymru, o'i chymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, yn lleihau. Onid ydych yn cytuno, gyda help ychwanegol Amcan 1 na chafodd rhannau eraill o'r DU, a chyda'ch holl ymdrechion, y dylai cyfoeth perthynol Cymru fod wedi cynyddu o'i chymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, nid lleihau?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae wedi cynyddu. Yr ydych yn siarad am ostyngiad mewn GYC perthynol, a dyna a ddigwyddodd. Ond gwelwyd y rhan fwyaf o'r gostyngiad yn y GYC pan oedd y Blaid Geidwadol mewn grym rhwng 1979 a 1997. Gall aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau wenu, ond trafodwyd y mater hwn yn llawn yn y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ychydig wythnosau'n ôl. Bu trafod helaeth ar y pryd, ac ni chofiaf fod neb yn y cyfarfod hwnnw wedi dadlau yn erbyn y dadansoddiad a roddwyd yn fy mhapur, a ddangosodd fod y gostyngiad sylweddol yn y GYC perthynol wedi digwydd ar ddechrau'r 1980au a chanol y 1990au.

Yn wir, o dan y Blaid Lafur, mae'r dirywiad hwnnw wedi ei atal am y tro cyntaf yn yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Yr ydych yn sôn am gyfoeth, ac yn ôl amcangyfrifon diweddaraf Eurostat yr oedd cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth cyfartalog y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd y pen o'r boblogaeth rhwng 2002 a 2004 yn 79.6 y cant o gyfartaledd y 27 o aelod-wladwriaethau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, sydd 2 bwynt canran yn uwch na'r tair blynedd blaenorol. O ran incwm mewnwladol crynswth cartrefi, mae enillion wythnosol cyfartalog a'r twf mewn cyflogaeth yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd wedi rhagori ar weddill y DU. Mae hynny'n record o lwyddiant, nid o fethiant.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mewn cyfarfod gyda Halifax Bank of Scotland amser cinio heddiw, lle y

subject of the Welsh housing market, it was stated that, in terms of the fundamentals, the Welsh economy is growing and that there are record high levels of employment. It was also said that there is little likelihood of steeply rising unemployment and/or a significant interest rates hike. That is the view of independent, commercial analysts. Do you agree that that gives the lie to the doom and gloom merchants who are always trying to run Wales down?

**Andrew Davies:** You only have to look at the level of private sector interests in all parts of Wales to see that. They can see that Wales is a vibrant and dynamic economy and that it is a good place to invest. That is reflected in figures such as those for employment growth, investment, gross domestic household income, our employment and our average weekly earnings growth. Under Labour, Wales is prospering and we are recovering from the devastation that was wreaked on so many of communities between 1979 and 1997.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I suggest that describing the Welsh economy in general as 'vibrant' is a slight exaggeration.

Between 1996 and 2004, the growth in gross value added per head in Wales was lower than that in any other country or region in Britain. What is to account for that?

**Andrew Davies:** I have already indicated that if you look at the recent figures—you have taken the period from 1995, when relative GVA was declining under the previous Conservative Government—and at the period since devolution, particularly since 2001-02, you will see that we have levelled off the decline that occurred under the Conservative Government and Wales is now prospering.

On the technical point about GVA, as you know, Alun Ffred, as you were at the committee meeting when we discussed this, the calculation of GVA is made up of several components. If you look at the most important issue, the issue that affects most people in Wales—this also comprises issues such as profits of companies and we know

trafodwyd marchnad dai Cymru, dywedwyd, o ran yr hanfodion, fod economi Cymru yn ffynnu a bod lefelau cyflogaeth ar eu uchaf erioed. Dywedwyd hefyd nad oedd yn debygol iawn y byddai lefelau diweithdra'n cynyddu'n sylweddol a/neu y byddai cyfraddau llog yn cynyddu. Dyna farn dadansoddwyr masnachol, annibynnol. A gytunwch fod hynny'n rhoi taw ar y rheini sydd bob amser yn ceisio creu darlun tywyll o Gymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Dim ond edrych ar lefel y mentrau sector preifat ym mhob rhan o Gymru y mae angen ei wneud i weld hynny. Gallant weld bod Cymru yn economi ffyniannus a deinamig a'i bod yn wlad dda i fuddsoddi ynddi. Adlewyrchir hynny mewn ffigurau megis y rheini ar gyfer twf cyflogaeth, buddsoddi, incwm mewnwladol crynswth cartrefi, ein cyflogaeth a'n twf cyfartalog mewn enillion wythnosol. O dan y Blaid Lafur mae Cymru yn ffynnu, ac yr ydym yn gwella ar ôl y dinistr a wnaed mewn cynifer o gymunedau rhwng 1979 ac 1997.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Awgrymaf fod disgrifio economi Cymru fel un 'ffyniannus' yn gyffredinol yn ei gor-ddweud hi fymryn.

Rhwng 1996 a 2004, yr oedd y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru yn is nag mewn unrhyw wlad neu ranbarth arall ym Mhrydain. Beth sydd i'w gyfrif am hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud os edrychwch ar y ffigurau diweddar—you ydych wedi cymryd y cyfnod o 1995, pan oedd y GYC perthynol yn gostwng o dan Lywodraeth flaenorol y Ceidwadwyr—a'r cyfnod ers datganoli, yn enwedig er 2001-02, y gwelwch ein bod wedi atal y gostyngiad hwnnw a ddigwyddodd o dan y Lywodraeth Geidwadol, ac mae Cymru bellach yn ffynnu.

Ar y pwynt technegol ynghylch GYC, fel y gwyddoch, Alun Ffred, gan eich bod yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor pan drafodwyd hyn gennym, mae'r broses o gyfrifo GYC yn cynnwys nifer o elfennau. Os edrychwch ar y mater pwysicaf, y mater sy'n effeithio ar fwyaf pobol Cymru—mae hefyd yn cynnwys materion megis elw cwmnïau.

that, given that many companies in Wales have their headquarters elsewhere, the figures for profits of companies do not truly reflect the real position in Wales—namely the compensation of employees per head, you will find growth. That is the issue that affects most Welsh inhabitants and Wales's figures for this have outstripped the UK average since 1999. It is at nearly 36 per cent compared with just under 35 per cent across the UK as a whole. Again, those are hard facts and that is hard delivery. It shows that Labour is delivering for the people of Wales.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Wales is in receipt of EU money because it has low relative GVA. That is a fact. GVA is about wealth creation and, therefore, the figures that we should be looking at in this case are those for GVA.

Compared with other areas that are in receipt of European money, such as Cornwall and South Yorkshire, Wales has again done relatively worse. What is the explanation for that?

**Andrew Davies:** I have just explained that in terms of the components that make up the calculation of GVA, the major element, and the element that is the most important for people in Wales, is the compensation of employees per head. Wales has outperformed the rest of the UK on that. You also have to take into account the occupational and demographic mix in Wales. In many parts of Wales, particularly north-west Wales and rural west Wales, high proportions of people are retired and transfer payments, such as pensions, are not included in the calculation of GVA.

With issues such as that or people commuting out of Objective 1 areas, such as the Valleys or north-west Wales, to other areas, because GVA at NUTS 2 and 3 levels is calculated using the workplace numbers, those figures are not picked up in the local GVA figures. If you look at the real issues, such as compensation for employees, Wales has grown faster than the rest of the UK, and that is a record of success, not of failure.

Gwyddom, o gofio bod pencadlysoedd nifer o gwmnïau yng Nghymru rywle arall, nad yw'r ffigurau ar gyfer elw cwmnïau yn adlewyrchiad gwirioneddol o'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru—sef iawndal cyflogaeth y pen o'r boblogaeth, y gwelwch dwf. Dyna sy'n effeithio ar y rhan fwyaf o drigolion yng Nghymru, ac mae ffigurau Cymru am hyn wedi bod yn uwch na chyfartaledd y DU er 1999. Mae bron â bod yn 36 y cant o'i gymharu ag ychydig o dan 35 y cant ledled y DU gyfan. Unwaith eto, mae'r ffeithiau hynny'n rhai moel fel y mae'r dull o'u darparu. Mae'n dangos bod y Blaid Lafur yn cyflawni er lles pobl Cymru.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae Cymru yn cael arian o'r UE am fod ganddi GYC cymharol isel. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Mae a wnelo GYC â chreu cyfoeth, ac felly dylem fod yn edrych ar y ffigurau ar gyfer GYC yn yr achos hwn.

O'i chymharu ag ardaloedd eraill sy'n cael arian Ewropeaidd, megis Cernyw a De Swydd Efrog, mae Cymru wedi gwneud yn waeth na hwy unwaith eto. Beth yw'r esboniad am hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf newydd egluro, o ran yr hanfodion sy'n rhan o'r broses o gyfrifo GYC, y brif elfen, a'r elfen sydd bwysicaf i bobl Cymru, yw iawndal cyflogaeth y pen o'r boblogaeth. Mae Cymru wedi perfformio'n well na gweddill y DU o ran hynny. Hefyd, rhaid ichi ystyried cymysgedd galwedigaethol a demograffig Cymru. Mewn sawl rhan o Gymru, yn enwedig y gogledd-orllewin ac ardal wledig y gorllewin, mae cyfran uchel o'r boblogaeth wedi ymddeol ac ni chynhwysir taliadau trosglwyddedig, megis pensiynau, wrth gyfrifo GYC.

Gyda materion fel yr uchod neu bobl yn cymudo o ardaloedd Amcan 1, megis y Cymoedd neu'r gogledd-orllewin, i ardaloedd eraill, am fod GYC ar lefelau 2 a 3 NUTS yn cael ei gyfrifo gan ddefnyddio niferoedd y gweithle, ni chynhwysir y ffigurau hynny yn y ffigurau GYC lleol. Os edrychwch ar y materion gwirioneddol, megis iawndal i gyflogaeth, mae Cymru wedi tyfu'n gyflymach na gweddill y DU, ac mae hynny'n dynodi llwyddiant, nid methiant.

**Alun Cairns:** Minister, do you accept the principle that managers or chief executives that do not perform should go? If that principle applies, given the target of 90 per cent of GVA set out in 'A Winning Wales', which states that success would mean that we will take the Welsh economy to 90 per cent of GVA by 2010,

and given the fact that no respectable economist would now recognise or say that there is any possibility of achieving 90 per cent by 2010, do you not accept that, as the Minister responsible, you should be sacked in the same way?

**Andrew Davies:** Listening to Alun Cairns is like listening to someone I used to know who was known as 'Johnny One Note', because that was the only thing he could play. Over and over, Alun Cairns plays the same tired record. I have to keep repeating to the Conservatives that the reason why we qualified for Objective 1 status, and now for convergence programme status, is due to the havoc and devastation that their party wreaked on communities across Wales. We lost 360,000 manufacturing jobs at a rate of 20,000 a year—I am delighted to see the Tories laughing at these figures, for which their party was responsible. Some 360,000 manufacturing jobs were lost between 1979 and 1997; that is 20,000 a year. Whole industries were closed down when their party controlled the Welsh economy, so it is rather rich that they accuse Labour of creating the mess that their party, on leaving Government, left it to deal with.

**Alun Cairns:** 'A Winning Wales' was written in 1999 and agreed in 2000 by the Assembly. That information, whatever the rights and wrongs of it, was known; so it was your target, set by the First Minister, who was Secretary for Economic Development at the time, and he said, quite plainly in Plenary, that it was a target. You will not achieve the target, so, in other words, you have failed, and we are now the poorest part of the United Kingdom. You also go on about gross domestic household income, but the reality in the figures, if we want to look at income, show that UK average salaries between 1997 and now have increased 44 per cent. Even in

**Alun Cairns:** Weinidog, a dderbyniwch yr egwyddor y dylai rheolwyr neu brif weithredwyr sy'n tangyflawni fynd? Os yw'r egwyddor honno'n gymwys, o gofio'r targed o 90 y cant o GYC a amlinellwyd yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', lle nodwyd y byddai llwyddiant yn golygu bod economi Cymru'n cyrraedd 90 y cant o werth ychwanegol crynswth erbyn 2010,

ac o gofio'r ffaith na fyddai unrhyw economegydd parchus bellach yn cydnabod nac yn dweud bod unrhyw bosibilrwydd cyflawni 90 y cant erbyn 2010, a gytunwch, fel y Gweinidog cyfrifol, y dylech golli eich swydd yn yr un ffordd?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae gwrando ar Alun Cairns fel gwrando ar rywun yr oeddwn yn arfer ei adnabod, 'Johnny Tôn Gron', am mai dyna'r unig beth y gallai ei chwarae. Drosodd a thro, clywn yr un hen beth gan Alun Cairns. Mae'n rhaid imi ddal i ddweud wrth y Ceidwadwyr mai'r rheswm pam y cawsom statws Amcan 1, a statws rhaglen gydgyfeirio bellach, yw oherwydd y difrod a achoswyd gan eu plaid hwy mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru. Collwyd 360,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ar gyfradd o 20,000 y flwyddyn—yr wyf yn falch o weld y Torïaid yn chwerthin am y ffigurau hyn: eu plaid hwy oedd yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Collwyd tua 360,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu rhwng 1979 ac 1997; sef 20,000 y flwyddyn. Caewyd diwydiannau cyfan pan oedd eu plaid yn rheoli economi Cymru, felly, mae'n haerllug braidd iddynt gyhuddo'r Blaid Lafur o greu'r llanastr a adawodd eu plaid hwy, wrth adael y Llywodraeth, iddi ddelio ag ef.

**Alun Cairns:** Lluniwyd 'Cymru'n Ennill' yn 1999 a chytunwyd arno yn 2000 gan y Cynulliad. Yr oedd y wybodaeth honno, pa un a oedd yn gywir ai peidio, yn hysbys; felly dyna oedd eich targed chi a bennwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, a oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd ar y pryd, ac fel y dywedodd, yn eithaf clir yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, yr oedd yn darged. Ni fyddwch yn cyrraedd y targed, felly, mewn geiriau eraill, yr ydych wedi methu, ac erbyn hyn ni yw'r rhan dlotaf o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Soniwch hefyd am incwm mewnwladol crynswth cartrefi, ond dengys y realiti yn y ffigurau, os ydym am edrych ar incwm, fod cyflogau



Northern Ireland they have increased 43 per cent, but in Wales, again, we are bottom of the pile, with an increase of only 39 per cent. You can go on about this dismal litany of whatever happened in the past, but whether you are right or wrong, 90 per cent was your target. You have failed to achieve that strategy, so do you not think that you should at least apologise? I think that you should be sacked.

**Andrew Davies:** I note that the needle is stuck in the same groove. There was never a target of 90 per cent in 'A Winning Wales'. There were specific targets in 'A Winning Wales', and, in fact, we reached or exceeded most of them. As Jeff Cuthbert just said, if you talk to real people in real business, Alun, you will discover that they recognise the remarkable transformation of the economy that has occurred under Labour. We are now experiencing record levels of investment that were certainly not seen when your party was in power.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, given the mess in which the Tories left the Welsh economy when Labour came to power in 1997, it was surely incumbent on you to get the opportunities for Objective 1 right. The fact is that, despite the billions of pounds put into west Wales and the Valleys, when you compare the success of the programme in Wales with that in Merseyside and Cornwall, we have not done as well with that opportunity as those regions, and this has been confirmed by independent reports by Cardiff University. It was incumbent on you to get us out of the mess that the Tories left us in, and you have failed with the opportunity that Objective 1 gave you.

3.00 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** Oh dear—I must say that, if you look at the hard facts on employment, gross domestic household income, average weekly earnings, and economic inactivity, west Wales and the Valleys has outperformed the rest of Wales and, in fact, has seen a faster fall in unemployment and economic

cyfartalog y DU rhwng 1997 a heddiu wedi cynyddu 44 y cant. Hyd yn oed yng Ngogledd Iwerddon maent wedi cynyddu 43 y cant. Ond yng Nghymru, unwaith eto, yr ydym ar waelod y pentwr, gyda chynnydd o ddim ond 39 y cant. Gallwch fynd ymlaen ac ymlaen am y stori drist hon am beth bynnag a ddigwyddodd yn y gorffennol, ond pa un a ydych yn gywir ai peidio, 90 y cant oedd eich targed. Yr ydych wedi methu â chyflawni'r strategaeth honno, felly, oni chredwch y dylech ymddiheuro o leiaf? Credaf y dylech golli eich swydd.

**Andrew Davies:** Sylwaf mai'r un yw'r gân. Nid oedd targed o 90 y cant yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Yr oedd targedau penodol yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', ac yn wir, cyrhaeddwyd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt neu rhagorwyd arnynt. Fel y mae Jeff Cuthbert newydd ei ddweud, os siaradwch â phobl fusnes go iawn, Alun, fe welwch eu bod yn cydnabod y trawsnewid rhyfeddol yn yr economi o dan y Blaid Lafur. Yr ydym bellach yn gweld y lefelau uchaf erioed o fuddsoddiad, na welwyd yn sicr pan oedd eich plaid chi mewn grym.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, o gofio'r llanestr a adawyd ar ôl gan y Torïaid yn economi Cymru pan ddaeth y Blaid Lafur i rym yn 1997, onid oedd yn angenrheidiol ichi gael y cyfleoedd ar gyfer Amcan 1 yn gywir. Y ffaith yw, er y biliynau o bunnoedd a fuddsoddiwyd yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, pan gymharwch lwyddiant y rhaglen yng Nghymru â'r rhaglen ar Lannau Mersi ac yng Nghernyw, nid ydym wedi gwneud cystal gyda'r cyfle hwnnw â'r rhanbarthau hynny, a chadarnhawyd hyn gan adroddiadau annibynnol gan Brifysgol Caerdydd. Yr oedd yn angenrheidiol ichi roi trefn ar y llanestr a adawyd inni gan y Torïaid, ac yr ydych wedi methu gyda'r cyfle a roddwyd ichi gan Amcan 1.

**Andrew Davies:** O diar—rhaid imi ddweud, os edrychwch ar y ffeithiau caled am gyflogaeth, incwm mewnwladol crynswth cartrefi, enillion wythnosol cyfartalog ac anweithgarwch economaidd, mae'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd wedi perfformio'n well na gweddill Cymru, ac mewn gwirionedd

inactivity than the UK as a whole. That is a real record of success. If you compare Wales with other parts of the UK that have had Objective 1 funding you will find that those areas received the funding before we did. I put on record, Presiding Officer, that when the Conservatives—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have already asked a number of supplementary questions, Alun. As you know, I deprecate the way in which Members seek to have additional supplementaries by shouting when they are sitting down, and I have on a number of occasions warned that I will not call Members who persist in this habit. I am not looking at any Member in particular. *[Laughter.]*

**Andrew Davies:** I welcome Kirsty's recognition of the devastation that the Tories wreaked on the Welsh economy, but when the Conservatives were in power and had the opportunity to negotiate Objective 1 status for Wales, John Redwood, the then Secretary of State for Wales, refused point blank to do so. A Labour Government negotiated Objective 1 status for Wales and delivered the resources to make it a success. Labour has done that; the Tories did not do it when they were in power, and, of course, Plaid Cymru will never do it because it will never be in power.

**Kirsty Williams:** Just because the Tories made a mess of it does not let you off the hook. I am happy to look at other measures of your performance. In 2000, earnings in west Wales and the Valleys were £64 per week less than the UK average. That had increased to £80 per week less by 2006. Whatever measure you look at, under your stewardship people are becoming worse off relative to the rest of the UK, in terms of the money in their pockets.

**Andrew Davies:** I am sorry, but you are just plain wrong, Kirsty. People in west Wales and the Valleys are not becoming worse off compared with the rest of the United Kingdom. As I said, if you look at gross

gwelodd yr ardaloedd hynny ostyngiad cyflymach mewn diweithdra ac anweithgarwch economaidd na'r DU yn gyffredinol. Mae hynny'n llwyddiant gwirioneddol. Os cymharwch Gymru â rhannau eraill o'r DU a gafodd arian Amcan 1, fe welwch fod yr ardaloedd hynny wedi cael yr arian cyn i ni ei gael. Hoffwn gofnodi, Lywydd, pan ddaeth y Ceidwadwyr—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych eisoes wedi gofyn nifer o gwestiynau atodol, Alun. Fel y gwyddoch, nid wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r ffordd y mae Aelodau'n ceisio gofyn cwestiynau atodol ychwanegol drwy weiddi ar eu heistedd, ac yr wyf wedi rhybuddio droeon na fyddaf yn galw ar Aelodau sy'n parhau'r arfer hwn. Nid wyf yn edrych ar unrhyw Aelod yn benodol. *[Chwerthin.]*

**Andrew Davies:** Croesawaf y ffaith bod Kirsty yn cydnabod y dinistr a wnaed gan y Toriaid yn economi Cymru. Ond pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym ac wedi cael y cyfle i negodi statws Amcan 1 i Gymru, gwrthododd John Redwood, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, yn llwyr â gwneud hynny. Llywodraeth Lafur a negododd statws Amcan 1 i Gymru ac a ddarparodd yr adnoddau i sicrhau ei lwyddiant. Llafur a wnaeth hynny; ni wnaeth y Toriaid hynny pan oeddent mewn grym, ac, wrth gwrs, ni wnaiff Plaid Cymru hynny fyth gan na fydd byth mewn grym.

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid yw'r ffaith fod y Toriaid wedi gwneud llanastr o'r peth yn eich esgusodi chi. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ystyried mesuriadau eraill o'ch perfformiad. Yn 2000, yr oedd enillion yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd £64 yr wythnos yn llai na chyfartaledd y DU. Yr oedd hynny wedi cynyddu i £80 yr wythnos yn llai erbyn 2006. Waeth pa fesur a ystyrir, o dan eich stiwardiaeth chi mae pobl yn mynd yn waeth eu byd o'u cymharu â phobl gweddill y DU, o ran yr arian sydd yn eu pocedi.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n flin gennyf, ond yr ydych yn gwbl anghywir, Kirsty. Nid yw pobl yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn mynd yn waeth eu byd o'u cymharu â phobl gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Fel y dywedais, os

domestic household income per head in west Wales and the Valleys—and this also applies to east Wales—since 1999 it has outstripped the UK average, so you are just plain wrong to say that people in Wales, especially in the Objective 1 area, have become poorer relative to the rest of the UK. It is not true.

edrychwch ar incwm mewnwladol crynswth cartrefi y pen o'r boblogaeth yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd—ac mae'r un peth yn wir yn y dwyrain—er 1999 mae wedi bod yn uwch na chyfartaledd y DU, felly, yr ydych yn gwbl anghywir i ddweud bod pobl Cymru, yn arbennig yn ardal Amcan 1, wedi mynd yn dlotach o'u cymharu â phobl gweddill y DU. Nid yw'n wir.

### **Gwella Perfformiad Amgylcheddol Busnesau Improving Environmental Performance of Business**

**Q6 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on improving the environmental performance of businesses within the tourism sector in north Wales? OAQ1272(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Visit Wales has developed a sustainable tourism action plan, which includes a number of current and planned initiatives to assist tourism businesses to improve their environmental performance. These include the Green Dragon environmental standard for tourism and the production of a 'Greening Your Business' toolkit, a practical environmental guide for tourism businesses.

**Eleanor Burnham:** That is interesting. I think that contradicts what has been raised in casework and at the recent North Wales Regional Committee meeting by a certain Dr Emma Edwards-Jones, who is the sustainable energy and tourism project officer of the Snowdonia Society. My understanding is that her concerns are about the difficulty of Visit Wales succeeding without adequate infrastructure, and I wonder what strategy you have for making better links and connections with green-snowdonia, which is taking steps to promote and support sustainable businesses. In view of the low gross value added figures, the low wages, and perhaps the low expectations of certain people about the Welsh economy, surely you should be doing something about tourism, because in north Wales, for instance, it is an extremely important part of the economy.

**Andrew Davies:** I am not sure where you got your information from, but we are helping to promote initiatives such as the sustainable

**C6 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wella perfformiad amgylcheddol busnesau yn y sector twristiaeth yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ1272(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae Croeso Cymru wedi datblygu cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer twristiaeth gynaliadwy, sy'n cynnwys nifer o fentrau presennol a rhai arfaethedig i helpu busnesau twristiaeth i wella'u perfformiad amgylcheddol. Yn eu plith mae safon amgylcheddol y Ddraig Werdd i dwristiaeth, a chynhyrchu pecyn offer 'Gwneud Eich Busnes yn Fwy Gwyrdd', sef canllaw amgylcheddol ymarferol i fusnesau twristiaeth.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae hynny'n ddiddorol. Credaf fod hynny'n gwrth-ddweud yr hyn a godwyd mewn gwaith achos ac yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd yn ddiweddar gan Dr Emma Edwards-Jones, sy'n swyddog prosiect ynni a thwristiaeth gynaliadwy gyda Chymdeithas Eryri. Yr wyf ar ddeall ei bod yn pryderu am yr anhawster i Croeso Cymru lwyddo heb seilwaith digonol, a thybed pa strategaeth sydd ar waith gennych i sicrhau gwell cysylltiadau ag eryri-gwyrdd, sy'n cymryd camau i hyrwyddo a chefnogi busnesau cynaliadwy. O gofio'r ffigurau isel ar gyfer gwerth ychwanegol crynswth, y cyflogau isel, ac efallai ddisgwyliadau isel rhai pobl am economi Cymru, oni ddylech fod yn gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â thwristiaeth, oherwydd yn y gogledd, er enghraifft, mae'n rhan bwysig iawn o'r economi.

**Andrew Davies:** Nid wyf yn siŵr o ble y cawsoch eich gwybodaeth, ond yr ydym yn helpu hyrwyddo mentrau fel y prosiect ynni a

energy and tourism project, which has recently launched the green-snowdonia website that you referred to, so, on the face of it, it would seem that you have been misinformed. However, if you want to write to me about this I will certainly follow it up.

**Janet Ryder:** As has been pointed out, tourism plays a large part in the north Wales economy. Many businesses depend on tourism. For their businesses to grow, they need to get the tourists in. Many tourism businesses in north Wales do not feel that there are enough brown signs to tell people about the attractions that exist, particularly inland from the north Wales coast, down from the A55 into the valleys that run off from that and into the hinterland around Cerrigydrudion, Pentrefoelas and Corwen. There could also be signposting on the borders of Wales so that people can be drawn into the heart of north Wales. How are you supporting the local authorities in that respect, and what is your department doing to ensure that we have enough signposts to bring people from the coast and from the periphery of north Wales into the heartlands of north Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** A proposal to put up a brown sign is the responsibility of the particular visitor attraction, as the ultimate destination, working with the local authority to make that a priority. The visitor attraction would then have to pay for that signage. In the first instance, it is the responsibility of the visitor attraction to come forward with a proposal; it is not a matter for Government. We would consider that in due course but in the first instance the visitor attraction itself needs to make that decision.

**Lisa Francis:** The Forestry Commission is keen to promote green tourism. The Minister and I attended the opening of the new visitor centre at Bwlch Nant yr Arian in my region several months ago. Were you aware that there was a plan for the Forestry Commission to link that centre and another local attraction, the Llywernog Silver-Lead Mine, with a pathway for walkers and cyclists? The Llywernog Silver-Lead Mine supported that plan and gave a promotional video to the centre. The pathway would have been mutually beneficial, and would have added

thwristiaeth gynaliadwy, a lansiodd y wefan eryri-gwyrdd yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ati. Felly, ar yr wyneb mae'n ymddangos ichi gael gwybodaeth gamarweiniol. Fodd bynnag, os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf am hyn, byddaf yn siŵr o fynd ar ôl y mater.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel yr eglurwyd, mae twristiaeth yn rhan fawr o economi'r gogledd. Mae nifer o fusnesau'n dibynnu ar dwristiaeth. Er mwyn i'w busnesau dyfu, mae angen iddynt ddenu'r twristiaid. Nid yw nifer o fusnesau twristiaeth yn y gogledd yn teimlo bod digon o arwyddion brown i ddweud wrth bobl am yr atyniadau sydd ar gael, yn arbennig wrth deithio i mewn i'r tir o arfordir y gogledd, o'r A55 i'r dyffrynnoedd oddi arni ac i'r wlad o amgylch Cerrigydrudion, Pentrefoelas a Chorwen. Gellid gosod arwyddbyst hefyd ar ffin Cymru er mwyn denu pobl i galon ardal y gogledd. Sut yr ydych yn helpu'r awdurdodau lleol yn hynny o beth, a beth y mae eich adran yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod digon o arwyddbyst gennym i ddenu pobl o'r arfordir ac o gyrion y gogledd i fröydd y gogledd?

**Andrew Davies:** Cyfrifoldeb yr atyniad penodol hwnnw i ymwelwyr, fel y grchfan yn y pen draw, yw cyflwyno cynnig i godi arwydd brown, gan weithio gyda'r awdurdod lleol i'w wneud yn flaenoriaeth. Wedyn byddai'n rhaid i'r atyniad ymwelwyr dalu am yr arwydd hwnnw. Cyfrifoldeb yr atyniad ymwelwyr yw cyflwyno cynnig yn y lle cyntaf; nid mater i'r Llywodraeth mohono. Byddem yn ystyried hynny maes o law, ond yr atyniad ymwelwyr ddylai wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw i ddechrau.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth yn awyddus i hyrwyddo twristiaeth werdd. Bu'r Prif Weinidog a minnau yn agoriad canolfan newydd i ymwelwyr ym Mwlch Nant yr Arian yn fy rhanbarth i ai misoedd yn ôl. A oeddech yn ymwybodol fod yna gynllun i'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth gysylltu'r ganolfan honno ag atyniad lleol arall, sef Gwaith Arian-Plwm Llywernog, drwy lwybr i gerddwyr a beicwyr? Cefnogodd Gwaith Arian-Plwm Llywernog y cynllun hwnnw a rhoesant fideo hyrwyddo i'r ganolfan. Byddai'r llwybr wedi bod o fudd i'r ddwy

value to the complete tourism and visitor package for the area. Sadly, it has not come to fruition. The idea has been dropped by the Forestry Commission, which is disappointing, as I understand that it had made a commitment to undertake the project. Can you give me your assurance that, as the holiday season is swiftly approaching, you will look into this particular issue?

**Andrew Davies:** I am not aware of why that decision was made. I was aware that there had been a proposal but I was not aware of the latest position. I will follow that up and find out why the project did not go ahead.

ochr, a byddai wedi ychwanegu gwerth at yr holl becyn twristiaeth ac ymwelwyr ar gyfer yr ardal. Yn anffodus, ni chafodd ei wireddu. Rhoddodd y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth y gorau i'r syniad, sy'n siomedig, gan fy mod ar ddeall ei fod wedi ymrwymo i gynnal y prosiect. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi, a'r tymor gwyliau yn prysur agosáu, y byddwch yn ymchwilio i'r mater penodol hwn?

**Andrew Davies:** Ni wn pam y gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw. Gwyddwn fod cynnig wedi ei wneud, ond nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf. Ymchwiliaf i hynny i weld pam nad aeth y prosiect yn ei flaen.

### **Cronfa Gydyfeirio Convergence Fund**

**Q7 Janet Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on progress of the allocation of funding to the various priorities for the convergence fund? OAQ1293(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Negotiations between the Assembly Government and the European Commission to finalise the convergence programmes are under way. The allocation of funding for each convergence priority will be included as part of these discussions.

**Janet Davies:** I accept that negotiations are ongoing and that it is impossible for you to talk about them at present. However, I expect that you have a vision for what you hope will be achieved by 2012, say, using these funding allocations. Will you lay your vision out before us so that we can judge whether it is a richly patterned Axminster of joined-up thinking or, at the other end of the scale, just a moth-eaten rag rug?

**Andrew Davies:** You will see clearly what our vision for an economically prosperous and dynamic Wales is if you look at 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. Our proposals to the European Commission for the allocation and prioritisation of convergence programme funding are in line with our strategic priorities as outlined in 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. So, if you want to see the vision,

**C7 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd a wnaed i ddyrannu cyllid i amrywiol flaenoriaethau'r gronfa gydyfeirio? OAQ1293(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae negodiadau rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i gwblhau fersiynau terfynol y rhaglenni cydyfeirio yn mynd rhagddynt. Caiff y cyllid a ddyrennir ar gyfer pob un o flaenoriaethau'r gronfa gydyfeirio ei gynnwys fel rhan o'r trafodaethau hyn.

**Janet Davies:** Derbyniaf fod trafodaethau ar y gweill a'i bod yn amhosibl ichi sôn amdanynt ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, disgwyliaf fod gennych weledigaeth am yr hyn a gaiff ei gyflawni erbyn 2012, er enghraifft, gan ddefnyddio'r dyraniadau cyllid hyn. A fyddwch yn cyflwyno'ch gweledigaeth ger ein bron er mwyn inni allu penderfynu a yw'n enghraifft odidog o feddwl cydgysylltiedig, tebyg i garped Axminster, neu, ar ben arall y raddfa, yn hen gerpyn tila?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru sy'n economaidd ffyniannus a deinamig i'w gweld yn glir yn 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Mae ein cynigion i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar gyfer dyrannu a blaenoriaethu cyllid y rhaglen gydyfeirio yn cyd-fynd â'n blaenoriaethau strategol fel y'u hamlinellwyd yn 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Felly, os ydych am weld y

Janet, I refer you to 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'.

**Glyn Davies:** Can you give us an idea of the amount of match funding that you might want from the Treasury in order to take advantage of the period of access to the convergence fund? All of us would like to see that. We know that a previous First Minister lost his job because he did not get the match funding. We have read in the papers that you might fancy taking over as First Minister after the next election. Do you not think that it would be a good idea to give us a fair figure today as to what you have in mind? It might even help your chances.

**Andrew Davies:** You should not always believe everything that you read in the newspapers, Glyn. I am surprised that you raised that, as someone who is an avid contributor to the newspapers.

3.10 p.m.

We will look at match funding once we have the final agreement with the European Commission, and when we know what the final intervention rates will be. If you look at the previous round of Objective 1 funding, we were extremely successful. We said at the time that no project would fail because of a lack of match funding, and we have delivered on that promise. If you look at the overall allocations of match funding, 42 per cent of Objective 1 match funding came from the Assembly Government and the private sector contributed 26 per cent, which, I believe, is one of the highest proportions coming from the private sector anywhere in Europe. Higher education contributed nearly 11 per cent and local government contributed 8 per cent. As we have said on numerous occasions, match funding can come from a wide variety of sources—from the private, public and voluntary sectors—and I am confident that that will again be the case under the convergence and competitiveness programmes.

weledigaeth, Janet, hoffwn eich cyfeirio at 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'.

**Glyn Davies:** A allwch roi syniad inni faint o arian cyfatebol y gallech fod am ei gael gan y Trysorlys i fanteisio ar y cyfnod mynediad i'r gronfa gydgyfeirio? Byddai pob un ohonom yn awyddus i weld hynny. Gwyddom i gyn Brif Weinidog golli ei swydd am na chafodd yr arian cyfatebol. Yr ydym wedi darllen yn y papurau eich bod efallai'n awyddus i ymgymryd â swydd y Prif Weinidog ar ôl yr etholiad nesaf. Oni fyddai'n syniad da rhoi ffigur teg inni heddiw am yr hyn sydd gennych mewn golwg? Fe allai hyd yn oed wella eich siawns o lwyddo.

**Andrew Davies:** Ni ddylech bob amser gredu'r hyn a ddarllenwch yn y papurau newydd, Glyn. Yr wyf yn synnu'ch clywed yn codi'r mater hwnnw, fel rhywun sy'n cyfrannu'n frwd i'r papurau newydd.

Byddwn yn edrych ar arian cyfatebol wedi inni gael cytundeb terfynol gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, a phan fyddwn yn gwybod beth fydd lefel y cyfraddau ymyrryd terfynol. Os edrychwch ar y cylch cyllido Amcan 1 blaenorol, buom yn llwyddiannus iawn. Dywedwyd ar y pryd na fyddai'r un prosiect yn methu oherwydd diffyg arian cyfatebol, a gwiredwyd yr addewid honno gennym. Os edrychwch ar y dyraniadau arian cyfatebol cyffredinol, daeth 42 y cant o arian cyfatebol Amcan 1 oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a chyfrannodd y sector preifat 26 y cant, sydd, mi gredaf, yn un o'r cyfrannau uchaf gan y sector preifat yn unrhyw ran o Ewrop. Cyfrannodd addysg uwch bron i 11 y cant a chyfrannodd llywodraeth leol 8 y cant. Fel y dywedwyd gennym droeon, gall arian cyfatebol ddod o amrywiaeth eang o ffynonellau—o'r sectorau preifat, cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol—ac yr wyf yn hyderus mai dyna a welwn eto o dan y rhaglenni cydgyfeirio a chystadleurwydd.

### **Ynni Adnewyddadwy Renewable Energy**

**Q8 Brynle Williams:** What discussions has the Minister had with UK Government

**C8 Brynle Williams:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda

Ministers concerning the growth of the renewable energy sector in Wales? OAQ1307(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** I regularly have discussions with UK Ministers on a range of energy issues, including the development of renewable energy in Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** A company is being set up in Wales to crush oilseed rape. Regrettably, the company cannot turn its product into fuel because there is too much tax duty on it—28.5 per cent—so it will be exporting to Ireland. Can you look at this situation to see whether anything can be done? We are trying to encourage businesses, but in this instance we are exporting jobs and products over the border.

**Andrew Davies:** If you write to me giving the name and the circumstances of the company, I will follow that up.

Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch twf y sector ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru? OAQ1307(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Byddaf yn trafod yn rheolaidd gyda Gweinidogion y DU amrywiaeth o faterion sy'n ymwneud ag ynni, gan gynnwys datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae cwmni'n cael ei sefydlu yng Nghymru i wasgu rēp had olew. Yn anffodus, ni all y cwmni droi ei gynnyrch yn danwydd am fod gormod o doll treth arno—28.5 y cant. Felly, bydd yn allforio i Iwerddon. A allwch edrych ar y sefyllfa hon i weld a ellir gwneud rhywbeth? Yr ydym yn ceisio annog busnesau, ond yn yr enghraifft hon, yr ydym yn allforio swyddi a chynnyrch dros y ffin.

**Andrew Davies:** Os ysgrifennwch ataf i roi enw ac amgylchiadau'r cwmni, fe ymchwiliat i hynny.

### **Cwpan Ryder 2010 The Ryder Cup 2010**

**Q9 Rosemary Butler:** What assistance is being given by the Welsh Assembly Government to Newport City Council to help with the hosting of the Ryder Cup in 2010? OAQ1278(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** In addition to providing Ryder Cup Wales Ltd with £3.5 million annually to fulfil public sector commitments in the Ryder Cup bid, we are providing significant funds to the city of Newport for the necessary infrastructure improvements in and around the city.

**Rosemary Butler:** Thank you, Minister. I know that you will agree that the Ryder Cup is one of the biggest sporting events in the world, and certainly the biggest sporting event that Wales will ever see. It will not only be good for Newport and south-east Wales, but for the whole of Wales and Welsh tourism in particular. I would particularly like to mention that the benefits to the Royal Porthcawl Golf Club, the North Wales Golf Club at Llandudno and the Tenby Golf Club will be enormous, and should not be

**C9 Rosemary Butler:** Pa gymorth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei roi i Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd i'w helpu i gynnal y Cwpan Ryder yn 2010? OAQ1278(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Yn ogystal â rhoi £3.5 miliwn bob blwyddyn i gwmni Cwpan Ryder Cymru Cyf er mwyn iddo gyflawni ymrwymadau'r sector cyhoeddus fel rhan o gais y Cwpan Ryder, yr ydym yn rhoi symiau sylweddol o arian i ddinas Casnewydd ar gyfer gwelliannau seilwaith angenrheidiol yn y ddinas a'r cyffiniau.

**Rosemary Butler:** Diolch, Weinidog. Gwn y byddwch yn cytuno mai'r Cwpan Ryder yw un o'r digwyddiadau chwaraeon mwyaf yn y byd, ac yn sicr, y digwyddiad chwaraeon mwyaf a wêl Cymru erioed. Yn ogystal â'r budd i Gasnewydd a'r de-ddwyrain, bydd o fudd i Gymru gyfan ac i dwristiaeth yng Nghymru yn arbennig. Hoffwn nodi'n benodol y bydd y buddiannau i Glwb Golff Brenhinol Porthcawl, Cwlb Golff Gogledd Cymru yn Llandudno a Chlwb Golff Dinbych-y-pysgod yn aruthrol, ac na ddylid

overlooked. Do you share my dismay at the blinkered approach of Plaid Cymru, which has criticised the Welsh Assembly Government for wanting to improve road access to the Celtic Manor Resort for the Ryder Cup?

**Andrew Davies:** Like you, I was dismayed when I heard the comments of Alun Ffred Jones. Had we not supported Newport City Council in improving road infrastructure, Plaid Cymru would no doubt be attacking us for not doing so. The Ryder Cup is a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity; this is our equivalent of the Olympic Games, and as a Government we are determined that we will maximise the opportunities, not just for Newport and the Celtic Manor Resort, but for the whole of Wales, including, as you rightly said, parts of north-east and north-west Wales. This is a heaven-sent opportunity to promote Wales on a global stage. There are very few global sporting events that will give us this profile, and we are determined to make the most of it. I am not surprised at Plaid Cymru's attitude on this, however. Alun Ffred Jones and Dafydd Wigley wrote a letter to businesses in the Arfon constituency on 26 January that stated that in our policies as a Government, aligning with us the Conservative Government, we had been seeking over the years to bribe—that was the word that was used—companies outside Wales to locate in Wales. As I pointed out, if Plaid had any say in government there would be barriers put up around Wales; we are saying that Wales is open for business. If it were left to Plaid, Wales would be closed to business.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I will take this opportunity to ask a question. The implied criticism about Miskin Manor was in terms of the contribution of local business. On the planning gain, is it not reasonable to expect big businesses, which get planning permission to facilitate their business, to contribute to such schemes?

**Andrew Davies:** It shows your awareness of the issues when you say Miskin Manor instead of Celtic Manor, where the Ryder

eu diystyru. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn siomedig am agwedd gul Plaid Cymru, sydd wedi beirniadu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am fod eisiau gwella mynediad ffyrdd i Ganolfan Celtic Manor ar gyfer Cwpan Ryder?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr oeddwn i hefyd yn siomedig o glywed sylwadau Alun Ffred Jones. Pe na fyddem wedi rhoi cymorth i Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd i wella seilwaith y ffyrdd, mae'n siŵr y byddai Plaid Cymru yn ein beirniadu am beidio â gwneud hynny. Mae'r Cwpan Ryder yn gyfle unigryw; mae'n ddigwyddiad sy'n cyfateb i'r Gemau Olympaidd inni, ac fel Llywodraeth yr ydym yn benderfynol o fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd, nid yn unig i Gasnewydd a Chanolfan Celtic Manor, ond i Gymru gyfan, gan gynnwys, fel y dywedech, rannau o'r gogledd-ddwyrain a'r gogledd-orllewin. Mae'n gyfle euraid i hyrwyddo Cymru i'r byd cyfan. Prin iawn yw'r digwyddiadau chwaraeon byd-eang a fydd yn rhoi proffil o'r fath inni, ac yr ydym yn benderfynol o fanteisio i'r eithaf arno. Fodd bynnag, nid yw agwedd Plaid Cymru yn peri syndod imi. Ysgrifennodd Alun Ffred Jones a Dafydd Wigley lythyr at fusnesau yn etholaeth Arfon ar 26 Ionawr yn dweud ein bod yn ein polisiau fel Llywodraeth, gan ein halinio â Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr, dros y blynyddoedd wedi ceisio llwgrwobrwyo—dyna'r gair a ddefnyddiwyd—cwmnïau y tu allan i Gymru i symud i Gymru. Fel yr eglurais, pe bai gan Plaid unrhyw lais o fewn y llywodraeth, byddai rhwystrau'n cael eu codi o gwmpas Cymru; yr ydym yn dweud bod Cymru ar agor i fusnes. Pe byddai'r Plaid yn cael ei ffordd, byddai Cymru ar gau i fusnes.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i ofyn cwestiwn. Yr oedd y feirniadaeth a awgrymwyd am Faenordy Meisgyn yn ymwneud â chyfraniad busnesau lleol. O ran y lles cynllunio, onid yw'n rhesymol disgwyl i fusnesau mawr, sy'n llwyddo i gael caniatâd cynllunio i hyrwyddo'u busnesau, gyfrannu at gynlluniau o'r fath?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n dangos eich ymwybyddiaeth o'r materion pan ddywedwch Maenordy Meisgyn yn hytrach



Cup is taking place. We will support the bid to ensure that we maximise the opportunities that the Ryder Cup provides. We take the position of supporting Sir Terry Matthews, which is why we supported the bid to win the Ryder Cup. Infrastructure issues need to be addressed, and that is why we are working with Celtic Manor and Newport City Council to ensure that those constraints are removed before the Ryder Cup starts. Are you seriously saying that we should not do that?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Minister, you are now asking the questions.

**Andrew Davies:** It was a rhetorical question.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You should be answering them, not asking them.

**Laura Anne Jones:** It is disappointing that, because of this Government's lack of vision and forward thinking, the much-needed M4 relief road will not be in place in time for the Ryder Cup. In fact, work will not start on it until 2010, which is the year of the Ryder Cup. What are you doing to ensure that mass traffic problems will not be an issue surrounding this event? Will you also give Newport City Council significant amounts of money to ensure that all roads are ready to hold and host such an event, because the eyes of the world will be on Newport at this point and that will impact significantly on whether Wales will be seen as being good enough to host future events?

**Andrew Davies:** I know that you represent South Wales East, but I am not sure about your grasp of geography. If you look at the new M4 south of Newport, it will not have a significant impact on traffic to and from Celtic Manor, which happens to be on the east side of Newport.

Having visited the K Club outside Dublin where the Ryder Cup was held last September, the road infrastructure there, even after the improvements that the Irish

na Celtic Manor, lle cynhelir y Cwpan Ryder. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r cais i sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd y bydd y Cwpan Ryder yn eu cynnig. Yr ydym yn cefnogi Syr Terry Matthews, a dyna'r rheswm inni gefnogi'r cais i gynnal y Cwpan Ryder. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â materion seilwaith, a dyna pam yr ydym yn gweithio gyda Celtic Manor a Chyngor Dinas Casnewydd i sicrhau dileu'r cyfyngiadau hynny cyn i'r Cwpan Ryder ddechrau. A ydych yn dweud o ddifrif na ddylem wneud hynny?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Weinidog, nawr chi sy'n gofyn y cwestiynau.

**Andrew Davies:** Cwestiwn rhethregol ydoedd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dylech fod yn ateb cwestiynau, nid eu gofyn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae'n siomedig na fydd y ffordd liniaru y mae gwir ei hangen ar yr M4 yn barod ar gyfer y Cwpan Ryder, oherwydd diffyg gweledigaeth a blaengynllunio'r Llywodraeth hon. Mewn gwirionedd, ni fydd y gwaith yn cychwyn tan 2010, sef blwyddyn y Cwpan Ryder. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau na fydd problemau traffig difrifol yn broblem yn ystod y digwyddiad hwn? A fyddwch hefyd yn rhoi symiau sylweddol o arian i Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd i sicrhau bod pob ffordd yn barod i gynnal digwyddiad o'r fath, oherwydd bydd llygaid y byd ar Gasnewydd bryd hynny, a bydd hynny'n effeithio'n sylweddol ar y cwestiwn a ystyrir bod Cymru yn ddigon da i gynnal digwyddiadau yn y dyfodol?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwn eich bod yn cynrychioli Dwyrain De Cymru, ond nid wyf yn siŵr am eich gwybodaeth ddaearyddol. Os edrychwch ar yr M4 newydd i'r de o Gasnewydd, ni fydd yn cael effaith sylweddol ar draffig i Celtic Manor ac ohono, sy'n digwydd bod ar ochr ddwyreiniol Casnewydd.

Ar ôl ymweld â'r K Club y tu allan i Ddilyn lle y cynhaliwyd y Cwpan Ryder fis Medi diwethaf, yr oedd y seilwaith ffyrdd yno o safon is o lawer nag sydd gennym ar hyn o

Government made, were significantly below the standard that we currently have with both the M4 and the A449. However, this is not only about road infrastructure; we have been working with Newport City Council and Newport Unlimited so that, by 2009-10—certainly by the time the Ryder Cup event takes place—there will be a brand new railway station at Newport. It is fitting that as the Ryder Cup event opens, we will have the new railway station as a gateway to Wales.

We are actively working with Celtic Manor and with Ryder Cup Ltd, as well as with the police and a range of other bodies, to ensure that the transport and traffic arrangements for the Ryder Cup are in place, including park and ride schemes and a range of other traffic management programmes. The European Tour, which organises the Ryder Cup, is happy with our management and arrangements; by 2010, those arrangements will be even better.

bryd gyda'r M4 a'r A449, hyd yn oed ar ôl y gwelliannau a wnaed gan Lywodraeth Iwerddon. Fodd bynnag, nid oes a wnelo hyn â seilwaith ffyrdd yn unig; buom yn gweithio gyda Chyngor Dinas a Casnewydd Newport Unlimited fel y bydd gorsaf reilffordd newydd sbon yng Nghasnewydd erbyn 2009-10—yn sicr erbyn y cynhelir digwyddiad y Cwpan Ryder. Mae'n addas y bydd gennym orsaf reilffordd newydd fel porth i Gymru wrth i'r Cwpan Ryder agor.

Yr ydym wrthi'n gweithio gyda Celtic Manor a Chwpan Ryder Cyf, yn ogystal â'r heddlu ac amrywiaeth o gyrff eraill, i sicrhau bod y trefniadau cludaint a thraffig ar waith ar gyfer y Cwpan Ryder, gan gynnwys cynlluniau parcio a theithio ac amrywiaeth o raglenni eraill i reoli traffig. Mae'r Daith Ewropeaidd, sy'n trefnu'r Cwpan Ryder, yn hapus am ein dull rheoli a'n trefniadau; erbyn 2010, bydd y trefniadau hynny'n well fyth.

### **Cysylltiadau Trafnidiaeth Transport Links**

**Q10 Christine Chapman:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to improve transport links in Cynon Valley? OAQ1268(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Abercynon is part of an £18.8 million project to improve rail services between Pontypridd and Merthyr, which will be followed by the development of a major strategic park-and-ride facility. Cynon Valley has also been allocated funding for 10 Safe Routes to Schools schemes and a community transport demonstration project.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome those developments, because they will make a huge difference to my constituents. However, you will be aware that there have been complaints in my constituency about the lights on Abercynon roundabout, which is leading to congestion and the diversion of traffic to nearby residential streets, Greenfield Terrace and Glancynon Terrace.

I welcomed the presence of your officials at a public meeting last week, and I know that they are working to solve the problem alongside Rhondda Cynon Taf County

**C10 Christine Chapman:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i wella cysylltiadau cludiant yng Nghwm Cynon? OAQ1268(EIN)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae Abercynon yn rhan o brosiect £18.8 miliwn i wella gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd rhwng Pontypridd a Merthyr, a dilynir hynny gan ddatblygu cyfleuster parcio a theithio strategol mawr. Dyrannwyd arian i Gwm Cynon hefyd i ariannu 10 cynllun Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol a phrosiect arddangos cludiant cymunedol.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf y datblygiadau hynny, oherwydd fe wnânt wahaniaeth mawr i'm hetholwyr. Fodd bynnag, gwyddoch fod cwynion yn fy etholaeth am y goleuadau ar gylchfan Abercynon, sy'n achosi tagfeydd a gwyro traffig i strydoedd preswyl gerllaw, sef Greenfield Terrace a Glancynon Terrace.

Yr oeddwn yn croesawu presenoldeb eich swyddogion mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus yr wythnos diwethaf, a gwn eu bod yn gweithio i ddatrys y broblem gyda Chyngor

Borough Council. However, will you assure me that you will monitor the situation carefully so that residents in Cynon Valley do not have to put up with their travel to work being disrupted, and also that the residents of Greenfield Terrace and Glancynon Terrace have safer streets?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes, I am happy to give that assurance. I will write to you as soon as possible updating you on the latest position.

Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn monitro'r sefyllfa'n ofalus fel na fydd tarfu ar daith trigolion Cwm Cynon i'r gwaith, a sicrhau hefyd bod gan drigolion Greenfield Terrace a Glancynon Terrace strydoedd mwy diogel?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnaf, yr wyf yn fodlon rhoi'r sicrwydd hwnnw. Ysgrifennaf atoch cyn gynted â phosibl i roi'r datblygiadau diweddaraf ichi.

3.20 p.m.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd ar ei Chyfrifoldebau heblaw am Fusnes Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business**

#### **Hyrwyddo Cydraddoldeb i Bobl Anabl Promoting Equality for Disabled People**

**Q1 David Melding:** What action is the Minister taking to achieve equality for disabled people in Wales? OAQ0380(BM)

**C1 David Melding:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yng Nghymru? OAQ0380(BM)

**Q12 Eleanor Burnham:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote equal opportunities for disabled people? OAQ0387(BM)

**C12 Eleanor Burnham:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bobl anabl? OAQ0387(BM)

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** The Assembly Government's commitment to achieving equality for disabled people is underpinned by the disability equality scheme, which I launched on 14 December 2006.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Ategir ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl gan y cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl, a lansiwyd gennyf ar 14 Rhagfyr 2006.

**David Melding:** Minister, you may be aware that a significant event will take place on Thursday 3 May, and that disabled people all over Wales would like to be able to access their local polling stations to cast their vote in the same way as everyone else—that is what we in this Chamber certainly want. Unfortunately, I am sure that we will find that too many polling stations are still not accessible, even though we hope that some progress has been made since 2003. Have you had time to consider the excellent report of the Local Government and Public Services Committee into electoral arrangements, which identifies good practice in the Netherlands, where those in charge of polling stations have to issue a report on issues such

**David Melding:** Weinidog, hwyrach eich bod yn gwybod y bydd digwyddiad pwysig ddydd Iau 3 Mai, ac yr hoffai pobl anabl ledled Cymru allu cael mynediad i'w gorsafoddedd pleidleisio lleol i fwrw'u pleidlais yn yr un ffordd â phawb arall—dyna'n sicr yr ydym ni yn y Siambr hon am ei weld. Yn anffodus, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwelwn fod gormod o orsafoddedd nad ydynt yn gyfleus o hyd, er y byddwn yn gobeithio gweld rhywfaint o gynnydd er 2003. A ydych wedi cael amser i ystyried adroddiad ardderchog y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar drefniadau etholiadol, sy'n nodi arfer da yn yr Iseldiroedd, lle mae'n rhaid i'r rheini sy'n gyfrifol am orsafoddedd pleidleisio gyhoeddi adroddiad ar faterion fel

as accessibility?

**Jane Hutt:** It was appropriate that we had a debate yesterday on the excellent report of the Local Government and Public Services Committee on electoral arrangements. Indeed, since 2003, we have had the Electoral Administration Act 2006, the whole purpose of which is to improve access and engagement; that relates to polling station access on polling day. That supports the report that was debated yesterday, particularly recommendation 12, which advises that the electoral planning group takes steps to ensure that guidelines on access to polling stations are consistent and that obligations under the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 are made explicit in all guidance. Of course, funding is available to electoral registration officers to ensure that they can install temporary ramps.

**Eleanor Burnham:** You are probably aware that, in a recent meeting of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, the issue of availability and disabled access to travel on public transport was highlighted. I am sure that you know that, as an Assembly Member, I am constantly trying to promote best practice on trains. [*Laughter.*] What will you do about it? There is a tale of a gentleman who cannot alight in Wrexham from the north-bound north-south train; he has to go to Chester in order to come back to Wrexham, where he is able to alight at the right side of the platform to exit the station. That is an appalling state of affairs for people with a disability, or for those with heavy luggage and a bad back, which many of us suffer from occasionally. Are you able to put pressure on Arriva Trains Wales, which does not seem to be doing an awful lot to help? Even notifying staff of the need to be sensitive towards people would be helpful, as would be increasing the hours that staff are on duty, because, when they are not on duty, it is impossible to access lifts and so on.

**Jane Hutt:** We know that you have great experience of the railway system, but so do many other people who benefit from our integrated railway system. I was delighted that a £100 million announcement was made on Monday by the Minister. That is about

hwylustod?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr oedd yn briodol inni gael trafodaeth ddoe am adroddiad ardderchog y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar drefniadau etholiadol. Yn wir, er 2003, yr ydym wedi cael Deddf Gweinyddu Etholiadau 2006, a'i diben yw gwella mynediad ac ymgysylltu; mae hynny'n cynnwys mynediad i orsafoedd pleidleisio ar ddiwrnod y pleidleisio. Mae hynny'n ategu'r adroddiad a drafodwyd ddoe, yn enwedig argymhellid 12 sy'n cynghori y dylai'r grŵp cynllunio etholiadol gymryd camau i sicrhau bod canllawiau ar fynediad i orsafoedd pleidleisio yn gyson, a bod rhwymedigaethau o dan Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995 yn eglur ym mhob canllaw. Wrth gwrs, mae arian ar gael i swyddogion cofrestru etholiadol i sicrhau y gallant osod rampiau dros dro.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'n debyg eich bod yn gwybod, yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn ddiweddar, fod mater argaeledd a mynediad i'r anabl deithio ar gludiant cyhoeddus wedi cael sylw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch fy mod, fel Aelod Cynulliad, yn ceisio hyrwyddo arfer gorau ar drenau'n gyson. [*Chwerthin.*] Beth fyddwch yn ei wneud ynglŷn â'r peth? Mae hanes am ddyn ar y trê'n i'r gogledd o'r de na all ddod oddi ar y trê'n yn Wrecsam; rhaid iddo fynd i Gaer er mwyn dychwelyd i Wrecsam, lle y gall ddod oddi ar y trê'n ar ochr gywir y plattform i fynd allan o'r orsaf. Mae hynny'n sefyllfa warthus i bobl anabl, neu i bobl sydd â bagiau trwm a chefn tost, fel y bydd nifer ohonom yn dioddef ohono o bryd i'w gilydd. A allwch bwysio ar Drenau Arriva Cymru, nad ydynt i'w gweld yn gwneud llawer iawn i helpu? Byddai o gymorth hyd yn oed pe bae'n dweud wrth yn staff fod angen bod yn sensitif i bobl, yn ogystal ag ymestyn yr oriau pan fydd staff ar ddyletswydd, oherwydd pan nad ydynt ar ddyletswydd, mae'n amhosibl defnyddio'r lifftiau ac ati.

**Jane Hutt:** Gwyddom fod gennych brofiad helaeth o'r system rheilffydd, ond mae gan lawer o bobl eraill sy'n cael budd o'n system rheilffyrdd integredig brofiad herfyd o'r system. Yr oeddwn wrth fy modd fod y Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi £100 miliwn

integrated public transport, such as reopening the Llanharan line, which is crucial in terms of access. It is also true in terms of duties, which are now strengthened in terms of rail providers. I know that Arriva Trains will be listening to you as we speak, and that it will listen to me, as the Minister with responsibility for equality, to ensure that it delivers on this, because this is about access for the people of Wales, particularly for disabled people.

**Brynle Williams:** It is sad to bring this to your, and the public's, attention, but, for some considerable time, Cadw has obstructed practical measures to provide interim wheelchair access to Ruthin library before work on a permanent adaptation to the building begins. What are you doing to ensure that all publicly funded bodies stop dragging their feet on providing disabled access to public services located in historic buildings? It is not your fault, but I ask you to please intervene in this as it has been ongoing for three or four years now. I am sure that my colleagues Eleanor Burnham and Janet Ryder will back me up on this.

**Jane Hutt:** It is important that you have brought this to our attention today, because there are new regulations going through in relation to access statements, which must now accompany all planning applications and which also relate to listed buildings, which is where Cadw comes in. However, Cadw has responsibilities, and I will take up that point about Ruthin library.

ddydd Llun. Mae hynny'n ymwneud â chludiant cyhoeddus integredig, fel ailagor llinell Llanharan, sy'n hanfodol o ran hygrychedd. Mae hefyd yn wir o ran dyletswyddau, sydd wedi'u cryfhau bellach o ran darparwyr rheilffyrdd. Gwn y bydd Trenau Arriva yn gwrando arnoch wrth inni drafod, ac y bydd yn gwrando arnaf fi, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb am gydraddoldeb, i sicrhau ei fod yn gweithredu ar hyn, oherwydd mae a wnelo hyn â mynediad i bobl Cymru, yn enwedig i bobl anabl.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'n drist tynnu'ch sylw chi a sylw'r cyhoedd at hyn, ond ers cryn amser mae Cadw wedi rhwystro camau ymarferol i ddarparu mynediad dros dro i gadeiriau olwyn i lyfrgell Rhuthun cyn dechrau ar y gwaith o wneud addasiadau parhaol i'r adeilad. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod pob corff sy'n cael arian cyhoeddus yn peidio â llusgo'u traed wrth ddarparu mynediad i'r anabl i wasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn adeiladau hanesyddol? Nid eich bai chi yw hyn, ond gofynnaf ichi ymyrryd oherwydd mae wedi parhau ers tair neu bedair blynedd bellach. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau Eleanor Burnham a Janet Ryder yn cytuno â mi ar hyn.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'n bwysig ichi fod wedi tynnu ein sylw at hyn heddiw, oherwydd mae rheoliadau newydd ar droed mewn perthynas â datganiadau mynediad, a mae'n rhaid eu cynnwys bellach gyda phob cais cynllunio. Mae'n berthnasol hefyd i adeiladau rhestredig, lle mae Cadw yn dod i mewn i'r darlun. Fodd bynnag, mae gan Cadw gyfrifoldebau, a byddaf yn codi'r mater hwnnw am lyfrgell Rhuthun.

### Hyfforddiant Cydraddoldeb Equality Training

**Q2 Michael German:** Will the Minister make a statement on equality training for professionals dealing with disabled people? OAQ0384(BM)

**Q6 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on equality training for professionals dealing with disabled people? OAQ0392(BM)

**C2 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb ar gyfer gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n gweithio gyda phobl anabl? OAQ0384(BM)

**C6 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb ar gyfer gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n gweithio gyda phobl anabl? OAQ0392(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Our core training provider, Eliesha, has worked closely with the Assembly Government to design and deliver a wide range of programmes, including training on the social model of disability and British Sign Language. We are currently undertaking a review to ensure that this provision is fit for purpose.

**Michael German:** You will be aware that the European structural funds are one of the key devices for assisting with training, and that Disability Wales has written to your Government to establish the fact that equality principles are not simply bolt-ons to the European programmes, but cross-cutting themes. You will also know that it asked you to increase the amount of money available for this particular area in the European social fund priorities within the new convergence funding. Has that happened?

**Jane Hutt:** It is crucial that equality is mainstreamed into the structural funds. Indeed, that was a core principle with regard to the success of Objective 1. It will be taken through and strengthened in the convergence programme. There are discussions ongoing with the voluntary sector, which includes Disability Wales, in relation to these issues and funding.

**Peter Black:** A recent report by the Committee on Equality of Opportunity identified a need for an audit of housing in local authorities. There is clearly a need to train housing professionals who have been carrying out that audit. The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee has also identified a need to train careers advisers in the way that they deal with people with disabilities and special educational needs when advising them on the best employment for their skills. How is the Welsh Assembly Government going to mainstream equality across the whole range of responsibilities to deal with such issues, and to ensure that that action is carried out?

**Jane Hutt:** Training is crucial if we are going to deliver not only on the social model of disability, but deliver it in partnership with the public sector—and local government in

**Jane Hutt:** Mae ein darparwr hyfforddiant craidd, Eliesha, wedi gweithio'n agos gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddylunio a darparu amrywiaeth eang o raglenni, gan gynnwys hyfforddiant ar y model cymdeithasol o anabledd ac Iaith Arwyddion Prydain. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn cynnal adolygiad i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth hon yn addas at y diben.

**Michael German:** Fe wyddoch fod cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yn un o'r dulliau allweddol ar gyfer cynorthwyo gyda hyfforddiant, a bod Anabledd Cymru wedi ysgrifennu at eich Llywodraeth i sicrhau nad rhywbeth wedi ei ychwanegu at y rhaglenni Ewropeaidd yw egwyddorion anabledd, ond themâu trawsbynciol. Gwyddoch hefyd iddo ofyn ichi gynyddu'r arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer y maes penodol hwn ym mlaenoriaethau cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop o fewn yr arian cydgyfeirio newydd. A yw hynny wedi digwydd?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'n hanfodol i gydraddoldeb gael ei brif-ffrydio i'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Yn wir, yr oedd hynny'n egwyddor graidd o ran llwyddiant Amcan 1. Caiff ei ystyried a'i gryfhau yn y rhaglen gydgyfeirio. Mae trafodaethau'n mynd ymlaen gyda'r sector gwirfoddol, sy'n cynnwys Anabledd Cymru, mewn perthynas â'r materion hyn ac ariannu.

**Peter Black:** Yr oedd adroddiad yn ddiweddar gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn nodi bod angen gwneud archwiliad o dai mewn awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n amlwg bod angen hyfforddi gweithwyr proffesiynol tai sydd wedi bod yn cynnal yr archwiliad hwnnw. Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau hefyd wedi nodi bod angen hyfforddi cynghorwyr gyrfaedd yn y ffordd y maent yn ymdrin â phobl ag anableddau ac anghenion addysgol arbennig, wrth eu cynghori am y gyflogaeth orau ar gyfer eu sgiliau. Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn mynd i brif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb ar draws yr holl amrywiaeth o gyfrifoldebau i ymdrin â materion o'r fath, ac i sicrhau cymryd camau gweithredu?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hyfforddiant yn hanfodol os ydym i gyflawni nid yn unig y model cymdeithasol o anabledd, ond ei gyflawni mewn partneriaeth â'r sector cyhoeddus—a

relation to housing, as you mentioned—and deliver on careers advice. Local authorities have to develop and deliver their disability equality schemes, and I would expect them to address equality training as part of that.

**Mark Isherwood:** The point raised by my colleague Brynle Williams a few moments ago is one that he and I have raised in the Chamber before. I am sure that this indicates no ill intention on anyone's part, but perhaps it does indicate the need for equality training for professionals, if we are to truly mainstream equality in the Assembly Government, the Assembly and all public services. One of the main barriers to mainstreaming equality in public services and local government is that lack of equality awareness. How will you ensure that equality awareness training is not simply provided, but provided by disabled representative groups, which are the only ones able to truly understand what the real barriers are?

**Jane Hutt:** We discussed this when I launched the disability equality scheme in December in Wrexham. We are undertaking a review of our disability equality training to address those issues, including the question of whether we can engage more disabled people in the training.

llywodraeth leol mewn partneriaeth â thai, fel y soniech—a darparu cyngor ar yrfaeodd. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ddatblygu a chyflwyno'u cynlluniau ar gydraddoldeb i bobl anabl, a byddwn yn disgwyl iddynt fynd i'r afael â hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb fel rhan o hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'r pwynt a gododd fy nghyd-Aelod Brynle Williams funudau'n ôl yn bwynt y mae ef a minnau wedi'i godi yn y Siambr o'r blaen. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad yw hyn yn dangos unrhyw fwriad drwg gan neb, ond efallai ei fod yn dangos bod angen darparu hyfforddiant ar gydraddoldeb i weithwyr proffesiynol, os ydym i brif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y Cynulliad a phob un o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ddifrif. Un o'r prif rwystrau rhag prif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a llywodraeth leol yw'r diffyg ymwybyddiaeth o gydraddoldeb. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau nad yw hyfforddiant mewn ymwybyddiaeth o gydraddoldeb yn cael ei ddarparu'n unig, ond yn cael ei ddarparu gan grwpiau sy'n cynrychioli pobl anabl, sef yr unig bobl sy'n deall beth yw'r rhwystrau mewn gwirionedd?

**Jane Hutt:** Trafodwyd hyn pan lansiais y cynllun ar gydraddoldeb i bobl anabl ym mis Rhagfyr yn Wrecsam. Yr ydym yn gwneud adolygiad o'n hyfforddiant ar gydraddoldeb i bobl anabl er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny, gan gynnwys y cwestiwn a allwn gynnwys mwy o bobl anabl yn yr hyfforddiant.

### **Blaenoriaethau Polisi Policy Priorities**

**Q3 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on her policy priorities for equal opportunities? OAQ0381(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to mainstreaming equality throughout its business functions. We already have disability and race equality schemes in place. On 26 March 2007, I will be launching the first Welsh Assembly Government gender equality scheme.

**C3 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei blaenoriaethau polisi ar gyfer cyfle cyfartal? OAQ0381(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i brif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb ar draws ei swyddogaethau busnes. Mae gennym gynlluniau ar gydraddoldeb i bobl anabl a chydraddoldeb hiliol ar waith eisoes. Ar 26 Mawrth 2007, byddaf yn lansio cynllun cyntaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gydraddoldeb rhyw.

3.30 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** In respect of patients in Mid and West Wales who are suffering from eating disorders, the Minister for Health and Social Services tells me that work is ongoing to develop specialist outreach teams to support patients at home. However, the parents of one of my constituents, who is 15 years old, who have been corresponding with me for the past three years, have seen none of this. A total of 50,000 people in Wales suffer from eating disorders. The Eating Disorders Association, which I believe is now called Beat, states that provision for people with eating disorders is almost non-existent in Wales, and that many people are forced to travel over the border to England for treatment. Why are the wards that were proposed for Bridgend, which include one dedicated to those suffering from eating disorders, being cut back when there is clearly such a pressing need for them? I understand that they were due to be opened this year.

**Jane Hutt:** I appreciate the fact that this issue has an equality perspective—particularly in relation to young women, though not exclusively so. I have been assured that the development of the eating disorder service in Wales, which includes primary, secondary and tertiary care, is going forward. The statement made by Brian Gibbons referred to the timescales.

**Kirsty Williams:** A group has recently been established in my constituency to raise funds to pay for children from underprivileged backgrounds to take music lessons at school. The cost of music lessons has increased greatly in Powys, which means that many children from less advantaged backgrounds do not have the opportunity to learn to play a musical instrument. What support is your Government giving to ensure that children from all backgrounds have the opportunity to learn to play a musical instrument at school if they wish to do so?

**Jane Hutt:** I will take up this issue with my colleague, Alun Pugh, the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.

**Lisa Francis:** O ran cleifion yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin sy'n dioddef gan anhwylderau bwyta, dywed y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wrthyf fod gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i ddatblygu timau allgymorth arbenigol i gynorthwyo cleifion yn eu cartrefi. Fodd bynnag, nid yw rhieni un o'm hetholwyr, sy'n 15 mlwydd oed, sydd wedi bod yn gohebu â mi am y tair blynedd diwethaf, wedi gweld dim o hyn. Mae cyfanswm o 50,000 o bobl yng Nghymru yn dioddef gan anhwylderau bwyta. Mae'r Gymdeithas Anhwylderau Bwyta, a elwir yn Beat bellach, mi gredaf, yn dweud nad oes fawr ddim darpariaeth ar gyfer pobl ag anhwylderau bwyta yng Nghymru, a bod nifer o bobl yn gorfod mynd dros y ffin i Loegr er mwyn cael triniaeth. Pam y cwtogir ar y wardiau a gynigiwyd ar gyfer Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sy'n cynnwys ward yn benodol i'r rhai sy'n dioddef gan anhwylderau bwyta, a ninnau'n gweld cymaint yw'r angen amdanynt? Deallaf y dylent fod wedi agor eleni.

**Jane Hutt:** Cydnabyddaf fod agwedd cydraddoldeb yn perthyn i'r mater hwn—yn enwedig o ran merched ifanc, ond o ran eraill hefyd. Rhoddwyd sicrwydd imi fod y gwasanaeth anhwylderau bwyta yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnwys gofal sylfaenol, eilaidd a thrydyddol, yn cael ei ddatblygu. Yr oedd y datganiad gan Brian Gibbons yn cyfeirio at yr amserlen.

**Kirsty Williams:** Sefydlwyd grŵp yn fy etholaeth yn ddiweddar i godi arian i dalu am wersi cerdd yn yr ysgol i blant difreintiedig. Mae cost gwersi cerdd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ym Mhowys, sy'n golygu bod nifer o blant o gefndir llai breintiedig yn methu â chael cyfle i ddysgu chwarae offeryn cerdd. Pa gymorth a roddir gan eich Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod plant o bob cefndir yn cael cyfle i ddysgu chwarae offeryn cerdd yn yr ysgol os ydynt yn dymuno?

**Jane Hutt:** Cbyddaf yn codi'r mater hwn gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Alun Pugh, y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.



**Prif-ffrydio Cydraddoldeb  
Mainstreaming Equality**

**Q4 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the progress of mainstreaming equality? OAQ0391(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** We have published our 'Mainstreaming Equality' strategy and completed an independent equality audit of our policies. We are currently developing an appraisal tool to enable staff to assess the impact of new policies on equality and diversity.

**Peter Black:** One of the biggest challenges facing the public sector in particular in mainstreaming equality is pay. Many local councils are faced with massive bills as a result of that particular agenda. What assistance will the Welsh Assembly Government be able to give to local councils in that regard?

**Jane Hutt:** A very good local government revenue settlement was delivered by our Finance Minister, and she has also put in £54 million to help authorities to address the pay gap. I am delighted that three authorities—Neath Port Talbot, Torfaen and, I hope, Denbighshire—are moving forward on addressing the issue of equal pay, and I hope that other authorities will follow suit.

**Mark Isherwood:** Sir Bert Massie, chairman of the Disability Rights Commission, recently stated that,

'The positive developments of the last decade have undoubtedly helped to create a more open road for disabled people to...do the things they want to in life'.

However, he says that the unhappy irony is that, because of rationing,

'at the same time the public services, resources and support many require to take up these new opportunities have either not materialised...or have gone into decline'.

What action do you propose to address that?

**C4 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd a wnaed i brif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb? OAQ0391(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi ein strategaeth, 'Prif-ffrydio Cydraddoldeb', ac wedi cwblhau archwiliad cydraddoldeb annibynnol o'n polisiau. Yr ydym wrthi'n datblygu dull arfarnu i alluogi staff i asesu effaith polisiau newydd ar gydraddoldeb ac amrywiaeth.

**Peter Black:** Un o'r heriau mwyaf a wynebhir gan y sector cyhoeddus yn enwedig o ran prif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb yw cyflogau. Mae llawer o gynghorau lleol yn wynebu biliau enfawr o ganlyniad i'r agenda benodol honno. Pa gymorth y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei roi i gynghorau lleol yn hynny o beth?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae ein Gweinidog Cyllid wedi rhoi setliad refeniw da iawn i lywodraeth leol, ac mae hefyd wedi neilltuo £54 miliwn i helpu awdurdodau i gau'r bwlch cyflogau. Yr wyf yn falch bod tri awdurdod—Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Tor-faen a sir Ddinbych, gobeithio—yn mynd ati i ymdrin â chyflog cyfartal, a gobeithio y bydd awdurdodau eraill yn gwneud yr un fath.

**Mark Isherwood:** Dywedodd Syr Bert Massie, cadeirydd y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, yn ddiweddar fod

y datblygiadau cadarnhaol yn ystod y degawd diwethaf yn ddi-os wedi helpu creu ffordd fwy agored i bobl anabl...i wneud y pethau y maent am eu gwneud mewn bywyd.

Fodd bynnag, dywed mai'r peth eironig, oherwydd dogni,

ar yr un pryd nad yw'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yr adnoddau na'r cymorth y mae eu hangen ar nifer i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd newydd hyn wedi eu darparu...neu maent wedi eu cwtogi.

Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â hynny?

**Jane Hutt:** I have great respect for Sir Bert Massie and the work that he has done with the Disability Rights Commission. Extra funding has been provided by the Assembly Government and the UK Government to develop and to improve public services. The block grant has been doubled in the last eight years under Labour in the Assembly and at Westminster. It is crucial to ensure that disabled people and all the people in our other equality strands benefit from those public services. Next Tuesday, we will be launching our guidance on British Sign Language for public services as a result of the large investment that we have made in BSL services in Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** I welcome the guidance on BSL, as I am also committed to that. However, the concerns raised by Sir Bert Massie echo those raised by the Welsh Local Government Association not so long ago about the fact that the current care system is 'unsustainable', with two thirds of councils facing an overspend on adult care services, and a quarter facing deficits of over £1 million. You can talk purely in terms of financial figures, but this is what the front-line organisations are telling us. How are you going to address this?

**Jane Hutt:** I am not the Finance Minister, but I am pleased to defend our budget, which went through in December. That put more money not only into health and social care, but also into those very services. For example, we have put £100 million into Children First, which addresses the needs of the most disadvantaged and vulnerable children in Wales, and we are ensuring that looked-after children get £1 million to improve their attainment, through the raising attainment and individual standards in education funding.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gennyf barch mawr at Syr Bert Massie a'r gwaith a wnaeth gyda'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd. Rhoddwyd arian ychwanegol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y DU i ddatblygu a gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'r grant bloc wedi dyblu yn yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf o dan Lafur yn y Cynulliad ac yn San Steffan. Mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau bod pobl anabl a'r holl bobl yn ein haenau cydraddoldeb eraill yn elwa o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hynny. Ddydd Mawrth nesaf, byddwn yn lansio ein canllawiau ar Iaith Arwyddion Prydain ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ganlyniad i'r buddsoddiad mawr a wnaethom mewn gwasanaethau BSL yng Nghymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Croesawaf y canllawiau ar BSL, gan fy mod i hefyd wedi ymrwymo i hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pryderon a godwyd gan Syr Bert Massie yn adleisio'r pryderon a godwyd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ychydig amser yn ôl ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod y system gofal gyfredol yn 'anghynaliadwy', a dau o bob tri chyngor yn wynebu gorwariant ar wasanaethau gofal i oedolion, a chwarter yn wynebu diffygion o fwy nag £1 filiwn. Gallwch sôn am y ffigurau ariannol faint a fynnoch, ond dyna y mae sefydliadau yn y rheng flaen yn ei ddweud wrthym. Sut y bwriadwch fynd i'r afael â hyn?

**Jane Hutt:** Nid fi yw'r Gweinidog Cyllid, ond yr wyf yn falch o amddiffyn ein cyllideb, a dderbyniwyd ym mis Rhagfyr. Mae honno'n neilltuo mwy o arian, nid yn unig ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ond hefyd ar gyfer yr union wasanaethau hynny. Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi neilltuo £100 miliwn ar gyfer Plant yn Gyntaf, sy'n mynd i'r afael ag anghenion y plant mwyaf difreintiedig a mwyaf diamddiffyn yng Nghymru. Ac yr ydym yn sicrhau y bydd plant sy'n cael gofal yn cael £1 filiwn i wella'u cyrhaeddiad, drwy'r arian i godi cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg.

### **Cydlynu Gwasanaethau Plant Co-ordinating Children's Services**

**Q5 Helen Mary Jones:** What recent discussions has the Minister held regarding the co-ordination of children's services in

**C5 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael yn ddiweddar am gydlynu gwasanaethau plant yng

Wales? OAQ0377(BM)

**Q11 Helen Mary Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on her budgetary priorities for co-ordinating children's services in Wales? OAQ0376(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Most recently, the cabinet sub-committee, which I chair, has considered children's budgeting, the national youth services strategy, consultation on the Children Act planning guidance, and children's social care workforce development.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You referred in an earlier answer to the budget, so you will remember that providing additional money for fostering was one of Plaid Cymru's preconditions for not voting against the budget. Your Government made a decision not to ring-fence that money as it went down to the local authorities, which would have been our preference, but to pass it down through the revenue support grant. Sue Essex certainly gave me an assurance at the time that there would be monitoring in place to ensure that the extra funding went to fostering allowances. Could you tell me what steps you, as the Minister with responsibility for children, are taking with the Finance Minister to ensure that that money gets into the right local authority budgets?

**Jane Hutt:** That question is timely, because the consultation on our guidance on national minimum fostering allowances ended on 2 March. We have carried out the consultation to ensure that we get the minimum level right. Additional funding was announced and local authorities have had an uplift of £6.1 million to meet pressures in the areas of foster care and placements, which includes £0.5 million to support care allowances. As Minister for children, I am making sure that I carefully monitor how that is being delivered in relation to the consultation on minimum allowance levels.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Social services departments across Wales are under pressure with their budgets—more particularly in the provision of adult services. Concerns have

Nghymru? OAQ0377(BM)

**C11 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau ei chyllideb ar gyfer cydlynu gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru? OAQ0376(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae is-bwyllgor y cabinet yn ddiweddar, dan fy nghadeiryddiaeth i, wedi ystyried cyllideb plant, y strategaeth genedlaethol gwasanaethau ieuencid, yr ymgynghori ar ganllawiau cynllunio'r Ddeddf Plant, a datblygu'r gweithlu ym maes gofal cymdeithasol i blant.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio mewn ateb cynharach at y gyllideb, felly, fe gofiwch mai un o amodau Plaid Cymru i beidio â phleidleisio yn erbyn eich cyllideb oedd darparu arian ychwanegol ar gyfer maethu. Penderfynodd eich Llywodraeth beidio â chlustnodi'r arian hwnnw wrth iddo gael ei roi i'r awdurdodau lleol, sef yr hyn y byddem ni wedi'i ddymuno, ond i'w drosglwyddo drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw. Yn bendant, rhoddodd Sue Essex sicrwydd imi ar y pryd y byddai monitro'n digwydd er mwyn sicrhau bod yr arian ychwanegol yn cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer lwfansau maethu. A allech ddweud wrthyf pa gamau yr ydych chi, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros blant, yn eu cymryd ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog Cyllid i sicrhau bod yr arian hwnnw'n mynd i mewn i gyllidebau cywir awdurdodau lleol?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n un amserol, oherwydd daeth yr ymgynghori ar ein canllawiau ar isafswm lwfansau maethu cenedlaethol i ben ar 2 Mawrth. Yr ydym wedi cynnal yr ymgynghori i sicrhau ein bod yn gosod y lefel isafswm yn gywir. Cyhoeddwyd arian ychwanegol, ac mae awdurdodau lleol wedi cael £6.1 miliwn yn ychwanegol i ddelio â'r pwysau ym meysydd gofal maeth a lleoliadau, sy'n cynnwys £0.5 miliwn ar gyfer lwfansau gofal. Fel y Gweinidog dros blant, yr wyf yn sicrhau fy mod yn cadw llygad barcud ar y ffordd y mae hynny'n cael ei gyflawni o ran yr ymgynghori ar iaafswm y lefelau lwfans.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ledled Cymru o dan bwysau o ran eu cyllidebau—yn enwedig wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau i oedolion.

been raised with me that the funds to which you just referred may be diverted because of the pressures on other parts of social services departments. Will you give an assurance that you, as Minister for children, and the Finance Minister will continue to be clear with local authorities that this money is to be spent on the children in their care and on fostering, and that it is not to be diverted, whatever pressures arise in other parts of their budgets?

**Jane Hutt:** When I met the Welsh Local Government Association recently, I was impressed by how local authorities are prioritising and focusing on children, particularly in relation to their budgets and policies. That is partly because of the Children Act 2004 and the fact that every authority must now have an elected member to act as a champion for children, as well as an officer. That has galvanised local government to look at children's issues as a priority. With the Welsh Local Government Association, we are jointly funding a children's commissioning unit at the WLGA, using the guidance from Beecham and 'Making the Connections' to enable local authorities to work together to deliver better services for children. Of course, this is about prevention, and we know that fostering is crucial to the prevention agenda and to delivering better services for children. Ultimately, it also helps to save money because this is where we enable children to stay at home and not to end up in expensive out-of-county or out-of-Wales placements.

**William Graham:** May I raise with you once again what you are doing with regard to improving mental health services for children who live in Wales, particularly the inappropriate nature of child and adult mental health units for under-18s and how they are being accommodated on adult wards?

**Jane Hutt:** Child and adolescent mental health services are being reviewed at all levels. It will take place over the next 12 months, and it includes health and social services at a local authority level. It is about delivering on our CAMHS strategy and setting up regional commissioning networks and additional targeted funds for in-patient

Codwyd pryderon gyda mi y gallai'r arian yr ydych newydd gyfeirio ato gael ei wario ar bethau eraill oherwydd y pwysau ar rannau eraill mewn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd y byddwch chi, fel y Gweinidog dros blant, a'r Gweinidog Cyllid yn parhau i'w gwneud yn glir i awdurdodau lleol fod yr arian hwn i gael ei wario ar y plant yn eu gofal ac ar faethu, ac na ddylai gael ei wario ar bethau eraill, waeth beth yw'r pwysau sy'n codi mewn rhannu eraill o'u cyllidebau?

**Jane Hutt:** Pan gyfarfûm â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn ddiweddar, yr oedd yn dda gennyf weld y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn blaenoriaethu ac yn canolbwyntio ar blant, yn enwedig o ran eu cyllidebau a'u polisiau. Mae hynny'n rhannol oherwydd Deddf Plant 2004 a'r ffaith ei bod yn rhaid i bob awdurdod bellach benodi aelod etholedig i weithredu fel eiriolwr dros blant, yn ogystal â phenodi swyddog. Mae hyn wedi ysbarduno llywodraeth leol i ystyried materion plant fel mater o flaenoriaeth. Ar y cyd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yr ydym yn ariannu uned gomisiynu i blant yn CLILC, gan ddefnyddio canllawiau gan Beecham a 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' i alluogi awdurdodau lleol i gydweithio i ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau i blant. Wrth gwrs, mae a wnelo hyn ag atal, a gwyddom fod maethu'n hollbwysig yn yr agenda atal ac i ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau i blant. Yn y pen draw, mae hefyd yn helpu arbed arian, oherwydd fel hyn yr ydym yn galluogi plant i aros gartref, yn hytrach na mynd i leoliadau costus y tu allan i'r sir neu'r tu allan i Gymru.

**William Graham:** A gaf fi ofyn unwaith eto beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant sy'n byw yng Nghymru, yn enwedig natur amhriodol yr unedau iechyd meddwl plant ac oedolion i bobl dan 18 oed a'r ddarpariaeth ar eu cyfer ar wardiau i oedolion?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod yn cael eu hadolygu ar bob lefel. Bydd yn digwydd dros y 12 mis nesaf, ac mae'n cynnwys iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar lefel awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n ymwneud â chyflawni ein strategaeth iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasod, a sefydlu rhwydweithiau

services, which, as you say, is quite right. We must ensure that we get this right, and the £2 million to reduce waiting times is making a difference.

comisiynu rhanbarthol ac arian ychwanegol wedi'i dargedu ar gyfer gwasanaethau i gleifion mewnol, sydd, fel y dywedwch, yn hollol briodol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei wneud yn iawn, ac mae'r £2 filiwn i leihau amseroedd aros yn gwneud gwahaniaeth.

3.40 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Cafodd cwestiwn 6 ei grwpio gyda chwestiwn 2.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6 was grouped with question 2.

### **Gwella Mynediad at Wasanaethau (Pobl Fyddar) Improving Access to Services (Deaf People)**

**Q7 Ann Jones:** What action is being taken to improve access to services in Wales for deaf or hearing-impaired people? OAQ0383(BM)

**C7 Ann Jones:** Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i wella gallu pobl fyddar neu bobl sydd â nam ar eu clyw i gael gwasanaethau yng Nghymru? OAQ0383(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The BSL Futures scheme, the newborn hearing screening programme, and the national framework for children, young people and maternity services all demonstrate the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to access services for deaf and hearing-impaired people.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Cynllun BSL Futures, sef rhaglen sgrinio clyw babanod newydd-anedig, a'r fframwaith cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth i gyd yn dangos ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod pobl fyddar a phobl sydd â nam ar eu clyw yn gallu cael gwasanaethau.

**Ann Jones:** That is to be congratulated. Profound deafness can often lead to near-complete social isolation. When people lose their hearing, it is vital that they are provided with every possible assistance to adjust and learn techniques such as lip-speaking. The all-party group on deaf issues has been pushing for a comprehensive approach to lip-speak training, but has found that both the Minister for Health and Social Services and the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills feel that it falls within the other's portfolio. Can you ensure that the officials of both those Ministers work together to come up with a positive approach to lip-speak training, as part of an overall package to assist people, to minimise that social exclusion that they often experience once they become hard of hearing or deaf?

**Ann Jones:** Rhaid eich llongyfarch am hynny. Gall byddardod llwyr yn aml arwain at ynysu cymdeithasol llwyr bron. Pan fydd pobl yn colli eu clyw, mae'n hollbwysig iddynt gael pob cymorth posibl i ymaddasu a dysgu technegau megis darllen gwefusau. Mae'r grŵp hollbleidiol ar faterion pobl fyddar wedi bod yn pwysu am ddull cynhwysfawr at hyfforddiant darllen gwefusau, ond daeth i'r casgliad fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ill dwy yn teimlo'i fod yn dod o dan bortffolio'r llall. A allwch sicrhau bod swyddogion y ddau Weinidog hynny'n cydweithio i sicrhau dull cadarnhaol at hyfforddiant darllen gwefusau, fel rhan o becyn cyffredinol i gynorthwyo pobl, er mwyn lleihau'r allgáu cymdeithasol sy'n digwydd iddynt mor aml ar ôl mynd yn drwm eu clyw neu'n fyddar?

**Jane Hutt:** I would like to take this matter up as Minister with responsibility for equalities. I will hold a meeting to address this issue,

**Jane Hutt:** Hoffwn ymdrin â'r mater hwn fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros gydraddoldebau. Byddaf yn cael cyfarfod i

perhaps with representatives of the all-party group.

ymdrin â'r mater hwn, efallai gyda chynrychiolydd o'r grŵp hollbleidiol.

### **Cyfle Cyfartal i Blant Equal Opportunities for Children**

**Q8 William Graham:** Will the Minister outline how she ensures equality of opportunity for children in Wales? OAQ0390(BM)

**C8 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut mae'n sicrhau cyfle cyfartal i blant yng Nghymru? OAQ0390(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The 'Children and Young People: Rights to Action' strategy for improving the lives of all children and young people is underpinned by the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services, the Children First programme, and 'The Learning Country: Vision into Action'.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r strategaeth, 'Plant a Phobl Ifanc: Gweithredu'r Hawliau', ar gyfer gwella bywydau plant a phobl ifanc yn cael ei hategu gan y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth, rhaglen Plant yn Gyntaf, a 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu: Gweledigaeth ar Waith'.

**William Graham:** Have you seen the reports on children in nurseries, which tend to suggest that boys are at a disadvantage? Could you look into this to see whether that is really true?

**William Graham:** A ydych wedi gweld yr adroddiadau ar blant mewn meithrinfeydd, sy'n tueddu i awgrymu bod bechgyn o dan anfantais? A allech ymchwilio i hyn i weld a yw hynny'n wir?

**Jane Hutt:** I believe that our foundation phase will solve that. This is key to ensuring an equality perspective in the earliest years. I will discuss that issue with Jane Davidson, the Minister for education.

**Jane Hutt:** Credaf y bydd ein cyfnod sylfaen yn datrys hynny. Mae hwn yn allweddol i sicrhau agwedd cydraddoldeb yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. Byddaf yn trafod y mater hwnnw gyda Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg.

### **Rhoi Llais i Bobl Ifanc Giving Young People a Voice**

**Q9 Mark Isherwood:** How is the Minister co-ordinating the Welsh Assembly Government's actions in order to give young people in Wales a voice? OAQ0374(BM)

**C9 Mark Isherwood:** Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn cydlynu gweithrediadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn rhoi llais i bobl ifanc yng Nghymru? OAQ0374(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The active participation of children and young people in decision-making in Wales is being promoted and developed by a number of structures and models. A set of national standards of participation has been developed, and was recently adopted by the Assembly Government.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r gwaith o gael plant a phobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn prosesau penderfynu yng Nghymru yn cael ei hyrwyddo a'i ddatblygu gan nifer o strwythurau a modelau allweddol. Mae set o safonau cenedlaethol ar gyfraniad wedi ei datblygu, ac fe'i mabwysiadwyd yn ddiweddar gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Mark Isherwood:** I hope that you agree that it is a matter of grave concern that the Children's Commissioner for Wales believed that a vital opportunity to improve children's advocacy had been missed. He was giving

**Mark Isherwood:** Gobeithio y byddwch yn cytuno ei bod yn achos pryder mawr fod Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn credu bod cyfle hollbwysig i wella eiriolaeth i blant wedi ei golli. Yr oedd yn rhoi ystyriaeth

careful consideration to the use of the legal powers available to him to review how the Assembly Government makes decisions affecting children. As he stated,

‘It is sad that I am in a position where I feel that the exercise of these powers is necessary’.

That is a sad indictment of an Assembly Government that has perhaps not understood the importance of independence in advocacy applying to this and to other areas of local government. Tragically, that great man is no longer with us, so what actions will you take now to address the concerns that were his legacy to the Assembly?

**Jane Hutt:** I am pleased to report that I have had several discussions in the last few weeks on the children’s advocacy consultation, which is about to be launched. It is important that a wide range of partners has been involved in developing that consultation document on how we can deliver true independent advocacy, as the late Peter Clarke so rightly put in his report. Indeed, I had a good meeting with the all-party group for looked-after children last week. I also had a meeting with Voices from Care Cymru, and I am addressing this matter with my colleagues, the Minister for Health and Social Services and the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills. We need integrated as well as independent advocacy, and I am sure that these issues will be discussed in committee tomorrow, when the children’s commissioner’s report will be raised.

ofalus i ddefnyddio’r pwerau cyfreithiol a oedd ar gael iddo i adolygu’r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud penderfyniadau sy’n effeithio ar blant. Fel y dywedodd,

‘Mae’n drist fy mod mewn sefyllfa lle rwy’n teimlo bod angen defnyddio’r pwerau hyn’.

Mae hynny’n gondemniad o Lywodraeth yn y Cynulliad nad yw, efallai, wedi deall pwysigrwydd annibyniaeth mewn eiriolaeth yn y maes hwn a meysydd eraill mewn llywodraeth leol. Yn anffodus, ni allwn droi at y dyn mawr hwnnw mwyach, felly, pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd yn awr i fynd i’r afael â’r pryderon a adawodd i’r Cynulliad?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae’n bleser gennyf ddweud fy mod wedi cael llawer trafodaeth yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf ynglŷn â’r ymgynghori ar eiriolaeth i blant, sydd ar fin cael ei lansio. Mae’n bwysig bod amrywiaeth mawr o bartneriaid wedi eu cynnwys yn y gwaith o ddatblygu’r ddogfen ymgynghori ar y ffordd y gallwn ddarparu gwasanaeth eiriolaeth sy’n wir annibynnol, fel y dywedodd y diweddar Peter Clarke yn gwbl gywir yn ei adroddiad. Yn wir, cefais gyfarfod buddiol gyda’r grŵp hollbleidiol ar gyfer plant sy’n cael gofal yr wythnos diwethaf. Cyfarfŵm hefyd â Voices from Care Cymru, ac yr wyf yn ymdrin â’r mater hwn ar y cyd â’r cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a’r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau. Mae angen gwasanaeth eiriolaeth sy’n integredig yn ogystal ag annibynnol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff y materion hyn eu trafod yn y pwyllgor yfory, pan gaiff adroddiad y comisiynydd plant ei godi.

### Hyrwyddo Llywodraeth Agored Promoting Open Government

**Q10 Jenny Randerson:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote open government? OAQ0379(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information provides a framework

**C10 Jenny Randerson:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo llywodraeth agored? OAQ0379(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae ein Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i’r Cyhoedd Wedd Gwybodaeth yn

for maximising openness. We continue to publish a considerable amount of information through our publications scheme, including Cabinet meeting papers, ministerial decision reports, internal staff guidance, and information disclosed in response to requests for information.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Freedom of Information Act 2000 has been, in the words of the UK Government, ‘a significant success’. In fact, it has clearly been too successful for the UK Government, because it is considering limitations. I am pleased that when I asked you a similar question previously, Minister, you said that your Government did not intend to apply any of the new draconian restrictions suggested by the Westminster Government. However, are you aware that if the Welsh Assembly Government voluntarily or unilaterally applies a less restrictive approach than the Westminster Government—if it restricts applications under the Freedom of Information Act 2000—people making freedom of information requests, including Assembly Members, will not have the right of appeal to the Information Commissioner, as the request will not be lodged officially under the terms of the Act. Were you aware of this, Minister, and have you made any representations to the Government? Will you undertake to continue to press the UK Government not to restrict the Freedom of Information Act 2000?

**Jane Hutt:** I gave you my assurance when I last answered questions that we have gone further than our commitment on our code of practice, which commits us only to charging for dealing with freedom of information requests in exceptional circumstances. We have gone further than that commitment by not charging; I am not charging for dealing with any requests for information, despite some of them being large and complex. The UK Government said that it would review the current fees regime, but charges have remained. We will continue to operate our own charging policy, which is much more generous. However, I am certainly not aware that that should result in the difficulties that you have outlined. I will come back to you on that.

darparu fframwaith inni fod mor agored â phosibl. Parhawn i gyhoeddi llawer iawn o wybodaeth drwy ein cynllun cyhoeddiadau, gan gynnwys papurau cyfarfodydd Cabinet, adroddiadau ar benderfyniadau gweinidogion, canllawiau mewnol i staff, a gwybodaeth a ddatgelir i ymateb i geisiadau am wybodaeth.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, yng ngeiriau Llywodraeth y DU, wedi bod yn ‘llwyddiant sylweddol’. Yn wir, mae’n amlwg iddi fod yn rhy lwyddiannus i Lywodraeth y DU, oherwydd mae’n ystyried cyfyngiadau. Yr wyf yn falch, pan ofynnais gwestiwn tebyg ichi o’r blaen, Weinidog, ichi ddweud nad oedd bwriad gan eich Llywodraeth i ddefnyddio dim o’r cyfyngiadau llym newydd a awgrymwyd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn ymwybodol, os bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn llai cyfyngus na Llywodraeth San Steffan, boed yn wirfoddol neu gan bawb—os bydd yn cyfyngu ar geisiadau o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000—na fydd gan bobl sy’n gwneud ceisiadau rhyddid gwybodaeth, gan gynnwys Aelodau’r Cynulliad, hawl i apelio i’r Comisiynydd Gwybodaeth, gan na fydd y cais wedi’i gyflwyno’n swyddogol o dan delerau’r Ddeddf. A oeddech yn ymwybodol o hyn, Weinidog, ac a ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw sylwadau i’r Llywodraeth? A wnewch chi ymrwmo i barhau i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i beidio â chyfyngu ar Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000?

**Jane Hutt:** Rhoddais sicrwydd ichi pan atebais gwestiynau diwethaf ein bod wedi mynd y tu hwnt i’n hymrwymiad yn ein cod ymarfer, lle’r ydym yn ymrwmo i godi tâl am ymdrin â cheisiadau rhyddid gwybodaeth o dan amgylchiadau eithriadol yn unig. Yr ydym wedi mynd ymhellach na’r ymrwymiad hwnnw drwy beidio â chodi tâl; nid wyf yn codi tâl am ymdrin ag unrhyw geisiadau am wybodaeth, er bod rhai ohonynt yn fawr ac yn gymhleth. Dywedodd Llywodraeth y DU y byddai’n adolygu’r drefn ffioedd bresennol, ond parhawyd i godi taliadau. Byddwn yn parhau i weithredu ein polisi ein hunain ar godi tâl, sydd lawer yn fwy hael. Fodd bynnag, yn bendant nid wyf yn ymwybodol y dylai hynny arwain at yr anawsterau yr ydych wedi’u hamlinellu. Byddaf yn rhoi gwybod



ichi am hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Cafodd cwestiwn 11 ei grwpio gyda chwestiwn 5, a chafodd cwestiwn 12 ei grwpio gyda chwestiwn 1.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11 was grouped with question 5, and question 12 was grouped with question 1.

### **Taro Plant Hitting Children**

**Q13 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on how she has co-ordinated any discussions that Assembly Ministers have had with UK Government Ministers regarding outlawing the hitting of children? OAQ0386(BM)

**C13 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae wedi cydlynu unrhyw drafodaethau a gafodd Gweinidogion y Cynulliad gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'i gwneud yn anghyfreithlon taro plant? OAQ0386(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The Cabinet has a unanimous stance on physical punishment. Children have a right not to be hit. I hosted a meeting recently as part of the Children are Unbeatable campaign, and will continue to press the case for legal change where opportunities arise.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r Cabinet yn unfrydol o ran cosb gorfforol. Mae gan blant hawl i beidio â chael eu taro. Cefais gyfarfod yn ddiweddar fel rhan o'r ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo Plant, a byddaf yn parhau i ddadlau dros newid y gyfraith pan fydd cyfleoedd yn codi.

**Jenny Randerson:** One of the key issues is that some of our most vulnerable children—in terms of physical violence—are in the care of social services. Can you give us information on the discussions that you have had with the Minister responsible for local government and public services about improving the funding of social services departments, many of which spend far more than is officially allocated by the Government with regard to their children's services departments?

**Jenny Randerson:** Un o'r materion allweddol yw bod rhai o'n plant mwyaf diamddiffyn—o ran trais corfforol—yng ngofal y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. A allwch roi gwybodaeth inni am y trafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus am roi mwy o arian i adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, gan fod nifer ohonynt yn gwario llawer mwy na'r hyn a ddyrennir yn swyddogol gan y Llywodraeth o ran eu hadrannau gwasanaethau plant?

**Jane Hutt:** As I said in response to an earlier question, I believe that local government is prioritising the need for children's services, particularly in relation to the most vulnerable children. They are doing that as a result of the Children Act 2004, of our children's national service framework, of Children First, of the ring-fenced money that we have put into children's services and our positive response to the Waterhouse report. It is on that basis that the Minister with responsibility for local government and I are working positively with local government to deliver, not just in budgetary terms, but in terms of the priority of policy for children.

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y dywedais wrth ateb cwestiwn blaenorol, credaf fod llywodraeth leol yn blaenoriaethu'r angen am wasanaethau plant, yn enwedig y plant mwyaf diamddiffyn. Gwnânt hynny o ganlyniad i Ddeddf Plant 2004, ein fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf, yr arian wedi'i glustnodi yr ydym wedi'i roi i wasanaethau plant, a'n hymateb cadarnhaol i adroddiad Waterhouse. Ar y sail honno yr wyf fi a'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros lywodraeth leol yn gweithio'n gadarnhaol gyda llywodraeth leol i ddarparu, nid o ran cyllideb yn unig, ond o ran blaenoriaeth polisi i blant.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Many parents need support when it comes to managing their children's behaviour. However, it is often the case that parents in rural areas feel isolated in this regard. A recent report stated that parental support services either need to be very local, or free transport needs to be provided. Will you state what services the Welsh Assembly Government has put in place in the more rural areas of my South Wales East constituency?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae angen cymorth ar nifer o rieni i reoli ymddygiad eu plant. Fodd bynnag, mae rhieni mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn aml yn teimlo'u bod ar eu pen eu hunain yn hyn. Dywedodd adroddiad yn ddiweddar fod angen i wasanaethau cymorth i rieni naill ai fod yn lleol iawn, neu fod angen darparu cludiant am ddim. A wnewch chi ddweud pa wasanaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u rhoi ar waith yn ardaloedd mwyaf gwledig fy etholaeth i yn Nwyrain De Cymru?

**Jane Hutt:** The parenting strategy is very important in this regard. I have already mentioned the national service framework for children and young people, which is geared towards children's needs as well as those of their families and communities. That is a national service framework; all 22 authorities and the health service have to deliver the core standards in the national service framework. The parenting strategy is important. We are reaching out to families. Every new parent now receives a guidance booklet from us on how to approach the challenging and exciting role of being a parent and how they can link in with health visitors. Flying Start will make a huge difference in every part of Wales, because there will be a whole new array of professionals to help the most disadvantaged children in particular.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r strategaeth rianta yn bwysig iawn yn hyn. Soniais eisoes am y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant a phobl ifanc, sydd wedi'i hanelu at anghenion plant yn ogystal â'u teuluoedd a'u cymunedau. Mae hwn yn fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol; rhaid i'r 22 awdurdod a'r gwasanaeth iechyd gyrraedd y safonau craidd yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Mae'r strategaeth rianta yn bwysig. Yr ydym yn estyn llaw i deuluoedd. Mae pob rhiant newydd bellach yn cael llyfryn cyfarwyddyd gennym ar sut i ymgymryd â'r rôl heriol a chyffrous o fod yn rhiant a sut y gallant gysylltu ag ymwelwyr iechyd. Bydd Dechrau'n Deg yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr ym mhob rhan o Gymru, oherwydd bydd trefn gwbl newydd o weithwyr proffesiynol i helpu'r plant mwyaf difreintiedig yn arbennig.

### **Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I come forward with a revised business statement in accordance with Standing Orders 5.4 and 5.5. The revised draft business statement is available to Members on the agenda.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cyflwynaf ddatganiad busnes diwygiedig yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog 5.4 a 5.5. Mae'r datganiad busnes drafft ar gael i Aelodau ar yr agenda.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there at least 10 objections, therefore I ask that the Minister formally propose the business statement.

**Jane Hutt:** I propose that

**Jane Hutt:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Helen Mary Jones:** In the first instance, we oppose this business statement because, although we see on the agenda the scheduling of a statement on NHS waiting times, we are not convinced that that will enable Members to raise the issues about pressures, which all the opposition parties asked the Government to enable us to address. If the Minister, in her response to this discussion, can reassure us that that statement will enable us to address those issues—which are simple issues about ambulances backed up outside accident and emergency departments carrying sick patients who cannot be treated; let us remember the issues, which are simple and basic, and which lead to highly unpleasant and dangerous situation for the people in those ambulances—we will not oppose the business statement. However, we will need very clear assurances from the Minister, given the Government's frequent changes of position, as to whether or not it will give us a statement on this matter.

On another matter, I briefly ask the Minister to consider for the next week or the week after the commitment of the economic development Minister to come back with a further statement on Dansco. We very much look forward to hearing from him again on developments in that regard.

**Lisa Francis:** We acknowledge the revised business statement, but are still forced to object to it, because it does not clarify what we asked for in our meeting with you yesterday. As Helen Mary said, all opposition parties asked for a statement on NHS pressures, but what you are offering us is a statement next Wednesday, 14 March on NHS waiting times, which is a completely different matter. We ask—and perhaps you can assure us—for this statement to be about the pressures experienced by our major hospitals recently, which included ambulances being backed up outside, and bedblocking. That is what we asked for yesterday. We cannot write these incidents off as merely exceptional circumstances that are unlikely to be repeated. For emergency systems to be robust, they must be able to survive in times of stress. Over the past three weeks, we have seen that these systems cannot cope in times of stress, and this is an

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn y lle cyntaf, gwrthwynebwn y datganiad busnes hwn, oherwydd er ein bod yn gweld datganiad am amseroedd aros y GIG ar yr agenda, nid ydym wedi'n hargyhoeddi y bydd hynny'n galluogi Aelodau i godi'r materion ynglŷn â phwysau y gofynnodd yr holl wrthbleidiau i'r Llywodraeth ein galluogi i fynd i'r afael â hwy. Os gall y Gweinidog, yn ei hymateb i'r drafodaeth hon, ein sicrhau y bydd y datganiad hwnnw'n ein galluogi i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny—sef materion syml ynglŷn â cherbydau ambiwlans wedi'u parcio mewn rhes y tu allan i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys sy'n cludo cleifion na ellir eu trin; gadewch inni gofio'r problemau, sy'n syml ac yn sylfaenol, ac sy'n arwain at sefyllfa annifyr a pheryglus tu hwnt i'r bobl yn y cerbydau ambiwlans hynny—ni fyddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes. Fodd bynnag, byddwn am gael sicrwydd clir iawn gan y Gweinidog, o gofio'r newidiadau aml yn safbwynt y Llywodraeth, a fydd yn rhoi datganiad inni ar y mater hwn.

Ar fater arall, gofynnaf yn gyflym i'r Gweinidog ystyried ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf neu'r wythnos ganlynol ymrwymiad y Gweinidog datblygu economaidd i ddod yn ôl i roi datganiad pellach ar Dansco. Edrychwn ymlaen yn fawr at glywed ganddo am ddatblygiadau yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

**Lisa Francis:** Cydnabyddwn y datganiad busnes diwygiedig, ond rhaid inni ei wrthwynebu o hyd, gan nad yw'n egluro'r hyn y gofynnwyd amdano yn ein cyfarfod gyda chi ddoe. Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary, gofynnodd pob gwrthblaid am ddatganiad am y pwysau ar y GIG, ond yr hyn a gynigiwch inni yw datganiad ddydd Mercher nesaf, 14 Mawrth ar amseroedd aros y GIG, sy'n fater cwbl wahanol. Yr ydym yn gofyn—ac efallai y gallwch roi sicrwydd inni—am ddatganiad am y pwysau ar ein prif ysbytai'n ddiweddar, a oedd yn golygu bod cerbydau ambiwlans wedi'u parcio y tu allan mewn rhes, a blocio gwelyau. Dyna y gofynnwyd amdano ddoe. Ni allwn ddiystyru'r digwyddiadau hyn fel amgylchiadau eithriadol nad ydynt yn debygol o ddigwydd eto. Er mwyn i systemau brys fod yn gadarn, rhaid iddynt allu dygymod â chyfnodau o straen. Dros y tair wythnos diwethaf, gwelwyd na all y systemau hyn ymdopi â chyfnodau o straen,

indication that things are very wrong. Next week's statement, I hope, will give the Minister for Health and Social Services the opportunity to outline the emergency plans that come into operation when such pressures occur.

**Kirsty Williams:** We could have got through this much more quickly today if the revised business statement had contained what the opposition parties had called for yesterday, namely that we wished to have an opportunity to hear from the Minister for health with regard to NHS pressures. If that is what the statement is to be about, why is it not on the business statement as 'NHS pressures'? What is on the business statement on the agenda in front of us is a statement on waiting times. It may be some time since I sat on the Health and Social Services Committee, but I still remember the difference between a statement on NHS pressures and a statement on NHS waiting times. They are not the same. Yesterday, we clearly wanted and requested a statement on the pressures that have been experienced at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital, the University Hospital of Wales and at hospitals right across south Wales. It is not just south Wales that is experiencing problems, it may not hit the headlines, but there are severe pressures on other parts of the NHS throughout Wales. I have a letter in front of me from my community health council talking about ambulances being called from Llanidloes to respond to calls in Ystradgynlais, and an ambulance being called from Machynlleth to respond to a call in Clyro. We need an opportunity to discuss the pressures that the ambulance service and the NHS are facing at the moment, but that is not what is on your revised business statement.

**Carl Sargeant:** We welcome this business statement. They have wheeled him back from London—two jobs Davies is back to vote down the business statement again. However, that does not faze us. We want to produce business for the people of Wales.

Minister, there are a few weeks before the next election—perhaps people in the public gallery have not guessed—and I would like a discussion in the Chamber about free bus

ac mae hyn yn arwydd bod rhywbeth mawr o'i le. Gobeithio y bydd datganiad yr wythnos nesaf yn rhoi'r cyfle i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol amlinellu'r cynlluniau brys a ddaw i rym pan fydd pwysau o'r fath yn codi.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gallem fod wedi ymdrin â hyn lawer yn gyflymach heddiw pe bai'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig wedi cynnwys yr hyn y gofynnodd y gwrthbleidiau amdano ddoe, sef ein bod yn dymuno cael cyfle i glywed gan y Gweinidog dros iechyd am y phwysau ar y GIG. Os dyna fydd testun y datganiad, pam nad yw wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes fel 'pwysau ar y GIG'? Yr hyn sydd ar y datganiad busnes yn yr agenda ger ein bron yw datganiad am amseroedd amser. Mae cryn amser wedi mynd heibio ers imi fod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ond gallaf gofio o hyd y gwahaniaeth rhwng datganiad am bwysau ar y GIG a datganiad am amseroedd aros y GIG. Nid yr un peth ydynt. Ddoe, yr oedd yn glir ein bod yn dymuno cael datganiad am y pwysau a fu yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ac mewn ysbytai ledled y de, a gofynnwyd am hynny. Nid yn y de yn unig y mae problemau. Efallai nad yw'n cael sylw yn y cyfryngau, ond mae pwysau mawr ar rannau eraill o'r GIG ledled Cymru. Mae gennyf lythyr gan fy nghyngor iechyd cymuned ynglŷn â cherbydau ambiwlans yn cael eu galw o Lanidloes i ymateb i alwadau yn Ystradgynlais, ac ambiwlans yn cael ei alw o Fachynlleth i ymateb i alwad yng Nghleirwy. Mae angen inni gael cyfle i drafod y pwysau sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'r GIG ar hyn o bryd. Ond nid dyna sydd yn eich datganiad busnes diwygiedig.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr ydym yn croesawu'r datganiad busnes hwn. Maent wedi'i lusgo yn ôl o Lundain—mae Davies dwy-swydd wedi dychwelyd i bleidleisio yn erbyn y datganiad busnes eto. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n mennu dim arnom. Yr ydym am gynhyrchu busnes i bobl Cymru.

Weinidog, ychydig wythnosau sydd cyn yr etholiad nesaf—efallai nad yw pobl yn yr oriel gyhoeddus wedi dyfalu hynny—a hoffwn drafodaeth yn y Siambr am deithio ar

passes, free swimming and free school breakfasts, which Welsh Labour is delivering—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’] That is in addition to the money for hospices in Wales that the Welsh Conservatives and the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group voted against.

I would also like time, during the short period that we have, for a discussion on the implications of service job cuts in North Wales Police because of the financial management difficulty that it finds itself in.

I also put on record the fact that Welsh Labour celebrates the great work that the emergency services do. The personnel of the ambulance service, the fire service and the police across Wales do an absolutely fantastic job and are consistently talked down by opposition members. I am sure that you will agree, Minister, that we should congratulate the police force, particularly that in south Wales, which is quick to catch car-tax dodgers.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I wonder whether the opposition parties want to do business here in the important last few weeks of this Assembly. Do they want to show the people of Wales that they are responsible, that they do not just want, as Kirsty says, to hit the headlines? Do they want to show that they want to do business and hear from the Minister for Health and Social Services, as they will next week when he comes with a statement on waiting times, and hear about what the health service is delivering and what the doctors, the nurses, the cleaners, the porters and the administrators are delivering as a result of the doubling of the funding into the health service. Of course they will have their opportunity—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is replying to this debate of sorts on the business statement.

**Jane Hutt:** Members will have the opportunity—and they will always take it, as they should—next Wednesday to raise the issue of ambulance waiting times during that statement and to raise issues around the delivery of the health service. You know

fysiau am ddim, nofio am ddim a brecwast ysgol am ddim, sydd wedi eu darparu gan Lafur Cymru—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O’.] Mae hynny’n ogystal â’r arian i hosbisau yng Nghymru y pleidleisiodd Ceidwadwyr Cymru a Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ei erbyn.

Hoffwn hefyd gael amser, yn ystod y cyfnod byr sydd gennym, am drafodaeth ar oblygiadau cwtogi swyddi yn Heddlu Gogledd Cymru oherwydd ei anawsterau rheoli ariannol.

Hefyd hoffwn gofnodi’r fod Llafur Cymru yn dathlu’r gwaith gwyh a wneir gan y gwasanaethau brys. Mae personél y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y gwasanaeth tân a’r heddlu ledled Cymru yn gwneud gwaith arbennig iawn, ac mae aelodau’r gwrthbleidiau yn lladd arnynt drwy’r amser. Fe gytunwch, mae’n siŵr, Weinidog, y dylem longyfarch yr heddlu, yn enwedig yn y de, sy’n lew iawn yn dal pobl sy’n osgoi talu treth gerbyd.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Tybed a yw’r gwrthbleidiau am gynnal busnes yma yn wythnosau olaf pwysig y Cynulliad hwn? A ydynt am ddangos i bobl Cymru eu bod yn gyfrifol, ac nad cael sylw yn y cyfryngau, fel y dywed Kirsty, yw’r nod? A ydynt am ddangos eu bod am gynnal busnes a chlywed gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, fel y byddant yr wythnos nesaf pan ddaw yma gyda datganiad am amseroedd aros, a chlywed am yr hyn a gyflawnir gan y gwasanaeth iechyd, a’r hyn a gyflawnir gan y meddygon, y nyrsys, y glanhawyr, y porthorion a’r gweinyddwyr, oherwydd dyblu cyllid y gwasanaeth iechyd? Wrth gwrs, cânt eu cyfle—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae’r Gweinidog yn ymateb i’r ddadl hon o rwy fath ar y datganiad busnes.

**Jane Hutt:** Caiff aelodau gyfle—a byddant yn manteisio arno bob amser, fel y dylent—ddydd Mercher nesaf i godi mater amseroedd aros cebydau ambiwlans yn ystod y datganiad hwnnw, a chodi materion sy’n ymwneud â darparu’r gwasanaeth iechyd. Gwyddoch yn

perfectly well that you will have that opportunity. All that you want to do is disrupt business. That is what this is about this afternoon.

I repeat what I said yesterday: 80 per cent of responses to all emergency calls arrive within target times, we have put 3,000 extra nurses and 400 extra doctors in place, and 97 per cent of GP practices are achieving the target of providing access to an appropriate member of the primary care team within 24 hours. That is doing business and it is a Labour Government delivering here but you do not want that; you want to move from being synthetic to being irresponsible. My colleague, Carl Sargeant, rightly wants to give the good news, which is about pensioners and disabled people getting their free bus passes and those who are going to get their free prescriptions—and who did not support free prescriptions in the Chamber? That will go through on 1 April. I have no sympathy with this challenge.

iawn y cewch y cyfle hwnnw. Y cyfan yr ydych am ei wneud yw tarfu ar fusnes. Dyna yw eich bwriad y prynhawn yma.

Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais ddoe: mae 80 y cant o ymatebion i alwadau brys yn cyrraedd o fewn yr amseroedd targed. Yr ydym wedi rhoi 3,000 o nyrsys ychwanegol a 400 o feddygon ychwanegol ar waith, ac mae 97 y cant o bractisiau meddygon teulu yn cyrraedd y targed o sicrhau bod aelod priodol o'r tîm gofal sylfaenol ar gael cyn pen 24 awr. Dyna yw cynnal busnes, a Llywodraeth Lafur sy'n gwneud hynny yma, ond nid ydych am glywed hynny; yr ydych am droi o fod yn synthetig i fod yn anghyfrifol. Mae fy nghydaelod Carl Sargeant, yn hollol gywir, am roi'r newyddion da, sef pensiynwyr a phobl anabl yn cael teithio ar fysiau am ddim, a'r rheini a fydd yn cael eu presgripsiynau am ddim—a phwy yn y Siambr nad oedd yn cefnogi presgripsiynau am ddim? Bydd hynny'n digwydd ar 1 Ebrill. Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ddweud am yr her hon.

*Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Thomas, Gwenda

Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion defeated.*

4.00 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo'r Penderfyniad ynghylch Cynlluniau Effeithlonrwydd Ynni  
Cartref (Categoriâu Gwaith ac Uchafsymiau Grant) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2007 o  
dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii)**

**Approval of the Home Energy Efficiency Schemes (Categories of Works And  
Maximum Amounts Of Grant) (Wales) (Amendment) Determination 2007 under  
Standing Order No. 29.3(iii)**

**The Minister for Social Justice and  
Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder  
Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):**  
Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting  
under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan  
weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif  
29.3(iii):*

*considers the principle of the Home Energy  
Efficiency Schemes (Categories of Works and  
Maximum Amounts of Grant) (Wales)  
(Amendment) Determination 2007, a draft of  
which was laid in the Table Office on 13  
February 2007. (NDM3518)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Penderfyniad ynghylch  
Cynlluniau Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref  
(Categoriâu Gwaith ac Uchafsymiau Grant)  
(Cymru) (Diwygio) 2007, y gosodwyd drafft  
ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13  
Chwefror 2007. (NDM3518)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation  
Committee in relation to the Home Energy  
Efficiency Schemes (Categories of Works and  
Maximum Amounts of Grant) (Wales)  
(Amendment) Determination 2007 laid in the  
Table Office on 27 February 2007; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau  
parthed Penderfyniad ynghylch Cynlluniau  
Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref (Categoriâu  
Gwaith ac Uchafsymiau Grant) (Cymru)  
(Diwygio) 2007 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa  
Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2007; a*

*2. acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii)  
approves the Home Energy Efficiency  
Schemes (Categories of Works and Maximum  
Amounts of Grant) (Wales) (Amendment)  
Determination 2007 made in accordance  
with:*

*2. gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog  
Rhif 29.3(iii) yn cymeradwyo bod  
Penderfyniad ynghylch Cynlluniau  
Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref (Categoriâu  
Gwaith ac Uchafsymiau Grant) (Cymru)  
(Diwygio) 2007 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 13  
February 2007. (NDM3519)*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno  
ar 13 Chwefror 2007. (NDM3519)*

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this change by which solid fuel and, we hope, many renewable fuels can come under the scheme. I congratulate the Minister

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r newid hwn lle y gall tanwydd solet, a llawer math o danwydd adnewyddadwy, gobeithio, ddod o dan y

on introducing it.

cynllun. Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog ar ei gyflwyno.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw'r Gweinidog am ymateb, felly symudwn at y bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Minister does not wish to respond, therefore we move to the vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3518): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3518): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John



Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3519): O blaid 58, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3519): For 58, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Pwerau Fframwaith) (Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol) 2007 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 26  
 Approval of the National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence)  
 (Conversion of Framework Powers) Order 2007 under Standing Order No. 26**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I have told unitary and police authorities that I expected them to set budgets that require council tax increases of no more than 5 per cent for the next financial year.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth yr awdurdodau unedol ac awdurdodau'r heddlu fy mod wedi disgwyl iddynt bennu cyllidebau a fyddai'n golygu cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor o ddim mwy na 5 y cant am y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is item 6, on framework legislative powers. I will call you to speak on the next item of business soon enough. [*Laughter.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Eitem 6 yw hon, ar bwerau deddfwriaethol fframwaith. Fe'ch galwaf i siarad ar yr eitem fusnes nesaf yn ddigon buan. [*Chwerthin.*]

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 26:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 26:*

*gives consent that the Secretary of State makes National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence) (Conversion of Framework Powers) Order 2007, which was laid in the Table Office on 27 February 2007. (NDM3520)*

*yn cytuno bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gwneud Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Pwerau Fframwaith) (Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol) 2007, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2007. (NDM3520)*

**Janet Ryder:** These framework powers are to be welcomed, as they deal with many aspects of education. Perhaps if people realised the power that will be vested in the new Assembly Government with regard to education through these powers, more of them would take an interest in May's elections, and certainly in the Government that may have to use such powers. These powers touch on many aspects of education, such as categories of schools, schools admissions, food in schools, the curriculum, attendance and, most importantly, entitlement to education and training, and services to encourage, support and assist young people

**Janet Ryder:** Rhaid croesawu'r pwerau fframwaith hyn, gan eu bod yn ymdrin â llawer agwedd ar addysg. Efallai, pe bai pobl yn sylweddoli'r pŵer a roir i Lywodraeth newydd y Cynulliad o ran addysg drwy'r pwerau hyn, y byddai mwy ohonynt yn cymryd diddordeb yn etholiadau mis Mai, ac yn sicr yn y Llywodraeth a fydd efallai'n gorfod defnyddio'r pwerau hynny. Mae'r pwerau hyn yn cyffwrdd â llawer agwedd ar addysg, megis categorïau o ysgolion, derbyniadau i ysgolion, bwyd mewn ysgolion, y cwricwlwm, presenoldeb, ac yn bwysicaf oll, hawl i addysg a hyfforddiant, a gwasanaethau i annog, cefnogi a helpu pobl

with education and training. I highlight those aspects in particular because I would like to raise again the fact that some councils are still debating introducing charges for young people aged 16 and over to access education and training. Surely, it is in Wales's best interests to encourage as many young people as possible, post 16, to stay in education and training, and not to put financial barriers in their way.

I, like other north Wales representatives, have been involved in discussions with Denbighshire, Conwy and Flintshire, and those three county councils each have a slightly different perspective on this matter. Flintshire's view is that once these powers are vested in the Assembly, the Minister will take up those powers and use them to introduce a national policy for 16-plus travel to support and help those young people. That council is, therefore, prepared to wait before introducing a policy. Denbighshire and Conwy, to some extent, are taking a different route; Denbighshire is proposing a £200-a-year charge for these young people, thereby putting a financial barrier in their way.

I would like some clarification on this matter, because rumours are going around north Wales as to whether the Minister will use these powers and what work has been done on any policy. Different councils employ different policies, and surely all Members would agree that we should not be placing financial barriers in the way of young people accessing training and further education. I hope that whoever forms the Government after May uses these powers to effect a timely change for the better to help and support young people aged 16 and over by putting provisions in place that would enable them to engage in full-time or part-time education and training without encountering a financial barrier.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** That is very interesting, Janet, but does not relate to the Order in any way, shape or form. I am sure that there will be a time and place for this, and you have made your point, but it is not related to this Order—[*Interruption.*]

ifanc gydag addysg a hyfforddiant. Yr wyf yn tynnu sylw at yr agweddau hynny'n benodol oherwydd hoffwn godi'r ffaith unwaith eto bod rhai cynghorau yn parhau i drafod codi tâl ar bobl ifanc 16 oed a hŷn sydd am gael addysg a hyfforddiant. Onid yw o les i Gymru annog gynifer â phosibl o bobl ifanc, ar ôl 16 oed, i aros mewn addysg a hyfforddiant, a pheidio â rhoi rhwystrau ariannol o'u blaenau.

Yr wyf fi, fel cynrychiolwyr eraill y gogledd, wedi bod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau gyda siroedd Dinbych, Conwy a'r Fflint, ac mae gan bob un o'r tri chyngor sir hynny safbwynt ychydig yn wahanol ar y mater hwn. Barn sir y Fflint yw y bydd y Gweinidog, pan fydd y pwerau hyn wedi eu rhoi i'r Cynulliad, yn cymryd y pwerau hynny ac yn eu defnyddio i gyflwyno polisi cenedlaethol ar deithio ar ôl 16 oed i gefnogi a helpu'r bobl ifanc hynny. Mae'r cyngor hwnnw, felly, yn barod i aros cyn cyflwyno polisi. Mae gan sir Ddinbych a Chonwy, i ryw raddau, ddull gwahanol; mae sir Ddinbych yn cynnig codi tâl o £200 y flwyddyn ar y bobl ifanc hyn, gan osod rhwystr ariannol o'u blaenau.

Hoffwn gael ychydig glurhad ar y mater hwn, oherwydd mae sibrydion ar led yn y gogledd a fydd y Gweinidog yn defnyddio'r pwerau hyn, a pha waith a wnaed ar unrhyw bolisi. Mae gwahanol gynghorau'n defnyddio gwahanol bolisiau, ac oni fyddai pob Aelod yn cytuno na ddylem fod yn gosod rhwystrau ariannol o flaen pobl ifanc a fydd yn eu hatal rhag manteisio ar hyfforddiant ac addysg bellach? Gobeithio y bydd pwy bynnag fydd y Llywodraeth ar ôl mis Mai yn defnyddio'r pwerau hyn i wneud newid amserol er gwell i helpu a chefnogi pobl ifanc 16 oed a hŷn drwy roi darpariaethau ar waith a fyddai'n eu galluogi i ymgymryd ag addysg neu hyfforddiant llawn amser neu ran amser heb wnebu rhwystr ariannol.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae hynny'n ddiddorol iawn, Janet, ond nid yw'n ymwneud â'r Gorchymyn mewn unrhyw ffordd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd amser a lle i hyn, ac yr ydych wedi gwneud eich pwynt, ond nid yw'n ymwneud â'r Gorchymyn hwn—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** What is this tetchiness today? It is only Wednesday. [*Laughter.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Pam mae pawb mor groendenau heddiw? Dim ond dydd Mercher ydyw. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Jane Hutt:** Just to clarify, Llywydd, because certain points have been made, this draft Order is another step towards preparing for the separation of the Assembly and the Assembly Government and for the Assembly's new role as a legislature. The effect of this draft Order will be to convert those wide powers to make subordinate legislation that are known as framework powers, which the Assembly currently has, into powers for the new Assembly to pass Assembly Measures. This Order is needed because otherwise all current Assembly powers to make subordinate legislation would pass to the Welsh Ministers under the transitional provisions in Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 2006. That is what we are discussing today; that is what is before us.

**Jane Hutt:** I egluro, Lywydd, oherwydd gwnaed rhai pwyntiau penodol, mae'r Gorchymyn drafft hwn yn gam arall tuag at baratoi ar gyfer gwahanu'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac ar gyfer rôl newydd y Cynulliad fel deddfwrfa. Effaith y Gorchymyn drafft hwn fydd troi'r pwerau eang hynny i wneud is-ddeddfwriaeth a elwir yn bwerau fframwaith, sydd gan y Cynulliad eisoes, yn bwerau i'r Cynulliad newydd basio Mesurau'r Cynulliad. Mae angen y Gorchymyn hwn, oherwydd fel arall byddai pob un o bwerau presennol y Cynulliad i wneud is-ddeddfwriaeth yn trosglwyddo i Weinidogion Cymru o dan y darpariaethau trosiannol yn Atodlen 11 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. Dyna yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw; dyna sydd ger ein bron.

*Cynnig (NDM3520): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3520): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Egwyddorion a Bennwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn Penderfynu, yn unol ag Adran 52B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 (fel y'i Diwygiwyd), a yw Anghenion Cyllideb Awdurdodau Lleol ar gyfer 2007/08 yn Ormodol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29**

**Approval under Standing Order No. 29 of the Principles Determined by the National Assembly for Wales for Deciding, in accordance with section 52B of the Local Government Finance Act 1992 (as amended) whether Local Authorities' Budget Requirements for 2007/08 are Excessive**

Motion (NDM3523): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3523): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*considers the principle of the Principles Determined by the National Assembly for Wales for deciding, in accordance with section 52B of the Local Government Finance Act 1992 (as amended), whether local authorities' budget requirements for 2007/08 are excessive, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 February 2007.*

*yn ystyried Egwyddorion a bennwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn penderfynu, yn unol ag Adran 52B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 (fel y'i diwygiwyd), a yw anghenion cyllideb awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2007/08 yn ormodol, y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau Cynulliad ar 28 Chwefror 2007.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*expresses concern that the failure of the Home Office to fund protective services,*

*yn mynegi pryder bod methiant y Swyddfa Gartref i ariannu gwasanaethau gwarchod,*

*community policing and inflation in police budgets is imposing a further burden on council tax payers.*

Motion (NDM3524): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*approves the Principles Determined by the National Assembly for Wales for deciding, in accordance with section 52B of the Local Government Finance Act 1992 (as amended), whether local authorities' budget requirements for 2007/08 are excessive, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 February 2007.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM3523 in the name of Lisa Francis.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*considers the principle of the Principles Determined by the National Assembly for Wales for deciding, in accordance with section 52B of the Local Government Finance Act 1992 (as amended), whether local authorities' budget requirements for 2007/08 are excessive, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 February 2007. (NDM3523)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*approves the Principles Determined by the National Assembly for Wales for deciding, in accordance with section 52B of the Local Government Finance Act 1992 (as amended), whether local authorities' budget requirements for 2007/08 are excessive, which was laid in the Table Office and e-*

*plismona cymunedol a chwyddiant yng nghyllidebau'r heddlu'n rhoi mwy o faich eto ar y sawl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor.*

Cynnig (NDM3524): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn cymeradwyo Egwyddorion a bennwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn penderfynu, yn unol ag Adran 52B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 (fel y'i diwygiwyd), a yw anghenion cyllideb awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2007/08 yn ormodol, y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau Cynulliad ar 28 Chwefror 2007.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM3523 yn enw Lisa Francis.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn ystyried Egwyddorion a bennwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn penderfynu, yn unol ag Adran 52B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 (fel y'i diwygiwyd), a yw anghenion cyllideb awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2007/08 yn ormodol, y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau Cynulliad ar 28 Chwefror 2007. (NDM3523)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn cymeradwyo Egwyddorion a bennwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn penderfynu, yn unol ag Adran 52B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 (fel y'i diwygiwyd), a yw anghenion cyllideb awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2007/08 yn ormodol, y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y*

*mailed to Assembly members on 28 February 2007. (NDM3524)*

As I said earlier, I have told unitary and police authorities that I expect them to set budgets that require council tax increases of no more than 5 per cent for the next financial year. Although a few unitary authorities have yet to set their budgets, I am confident that none will seek council tax increases above 5 per cent. I expect police authorities to do likewise with regard to the precept, and three have done so: namely the Gwent, South Wales and Dyfed Powys police authorities. Unfortunately, that is not the case for north Wales, where the police authority has set a budget requiring a 6.75 per cent growth in precept.

While policing policy is not a devolved matter, the Assembly Government has a responsibility to protect council tax payers from excessive increases. You will know that I am reluctant to use the reserve powers available to me to limit authorities' budget increases. However, I made it clear to this Assembly at the time of the police settlement that I would consider the exercise of those powers if, in my opinion, the amount calculated by any police authority in Wales as its proposed budget requirement for a financial year was excessive. That would be a last resort, but I am keen to ensure that all council tax payers in Wales are treated fairly.

On 7 February, the Assembly agreed the local government finance report for police authorities in Wales, which along with Home Office funding, provides an increase of 3.6 per cent above this year's revenue settlement. In fact, due to the floor mechanism, North Wales Police Authority will benefit from an extra £8.6 million this year. I said on 7 February that this 3.6 per cent increase, together with a reasonable council tax increase, was more than enough to cover essential pay and price inflation as set out by the forces themselves in the Welsh forces budget outlook for 2007-08.

*Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau Cynulliad ar 28 Chwefror 2007. (NDM3524)*

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr wyf wedi dweud wrth awdurdodau unedol ac awdurdodau'r heddlu fy mod yn disgwyl iddynt bennu cyllidebau a fyddai'n golygu cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor o ddim mwy na 5 y cant ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Er bod rhai awdurdodau unedol heb bennu eu cyllidebau eto, yr wyf yn hyderus na fydd yr un ohonynt yn ceisio codi'r dreth gyngor fwy na 5 y cant. Disgwyliaf i awdurdodau'r heddlu wneud yr un modd o ran y praesept, ac mae tri wedi gwneud hynny: sef awdurdodau heddlu Gwent, De Cymru a Dyfed Powys. Yn anffodus, nid yw hynny'n wir am y gogledd, lle mae awdurdod yr heddlu wedi pennu cyllideb sy'n galw am dwf o 6.75 y cant yn y praesept.

Er nad yw polisi plismona yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli, mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddiogelu pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor rhag cynnydd gormodol. Fe wyddoch fy mod yn amharod i ddefnyddio'r pwerau wrth gefn sydd gennyf i gyfyngu cynnydd yng nghyllidebau awdurdodau. Fodd bynnag, eglurais wrth y Cynulliad hwn adeg setliad yr heddlu y byddwn yn ystyried arfer y pwerau hynny os byddai'r swm a gyfrifid gan unrhyw awdurdod heddlu yng Nghymru fel y gofyniad cyllidebol arfaethedig am flwyddyn ariannol yn ormodol yn fy marn i. Byddai hynny'n digwydd pan fethai popeth arall, ond yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau bod pawb sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru yn cael eu trin yn deg.

Ar 7 Chwefror, cytunodd y Cynulliad ar adroddiad cyllid llywodraeth leol i awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru sydd, ynghyd â chyllid y Swyddfa Gartref, yn darparu cynnydd o 3.6 y cant yn fwy na setliad refeniw eleni. Yn wir, oherwydd y terfyn isaf bydd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn cael £8.6 miliwn yn ychwanegol eleni. Dywedais ar 7 Chwefror y byddai'r cynnydd hwn o 3.6 y cant, ynghyd â chynnydd rhesymol yn y dreth gyngor, yn fwy na digon ar gyfer chwyddiant hanfodol mewn cyflogau a phrisiau fel y nodwyd gan yr heddluoedd eu hunain yn rhagolwg

cyllideb heddluoedd Cymru ar gyfer 2007-08.

In setting the draft principles I carefully considered the pay and price pressures as analysed by the Welsh forces. I compared them to the settlement and to my officials' assessment of the amount of money that could be raised through an increase in council tax of 5 per cent charged on a band D property. This showed that an average increase in the budget requirement of 4.4 per cent would provide sufficient funds to meet the pay and price pressures, as well as allowing for some growth funding. Such budget requirement increases at this level would mean a council tax precept increase of no more than 5 per cent.

It was with some regret therefore that, despite my and my officials' discussions with the North Wales Police Authority, it has set a budget requirement and council tax precept that has breached these draft principles. This is an authority that has a culture and history of high council tax charges, and has the third highest council tax charge at band D in England and Wales outside metropolitan London. In 2006-07, the police authority element of council tax is £167, whereas in Cheshire, just across the border, the equivalent figure is £108.

4.10 p.m.

In terms of protected services—and I know that this issue has been raised—Edwina Hart and I have repeatedly made it clear that the cost of funding level 2 protected services should not be borne by council tax payers in Wales. The Minister responsible for policing at the Home Office has written to all police authorities to say that there should be a two-year time frame, up to 2009, for significantly reducing risk in high-need areas and a longer time frame, where needed, which is up to 2011, for other areas to build up to acceptable standards. Therefore, in these circumstances, I would be surprised if police authority budgets increases for 2007-08 included significant sums for protected services.

I hope that I have demonstrated that the

Wrth bennu'r egwyddorion drafft, ystyriais yn ofalus y pwysau cyflogau a phrisiau fel y'u dadansoddwyd gan heddluoedd Cymru. Cymharais y rheini â'r setliad ac ag asesiad fy swyddogion o'r swm y gellid ei godi drwy gynydd o 5 y cant arall yn y dreth gyngor ar eiddo band D. Dangosodd hyn y byddai cynnydd ar gyfartaledd yn y gofyniad cyllidebol o 4.4 y cant yn rhoi digon o arian i gwrdd â'r pwysau mewn cyflogau a phrisiau, yn ogystal â chaniatáu ar gyfer rhywfaint o dwf mewn cyllid. Byddai cynnydd felly yn y gofyniad cyllidebol ar y lefel hon yn golygu cynnydd ym mhraesept y dreth gyngor o ddim mwy na 5 y cant.

Yr oedd yn drueni, felly, er gwaethaf trafodaethau gennyf fi a'm swyddogion gydag Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, ei fod wedi gosod gofyniad cyllideb a phraesept treth gyngor sydd wedi torri'r egwyddorion drafft hyn. Mae hwn yn awdurdod sydd â diwylliant a hanes o osod taliadau treth gyngor uchel, a hwn yw'r ail awdurdod gwaethaf ond un o ran y dreth gyngor a godir ym mand D yng Nghymru a Lloegr, y tu allan i Lundain fetropolitan. Yn 2006-07, elfen awdurdod yr heddlu o'r dreth gyngor yw £167, ond yn swydd Gaer, dros y ffin, y ffigur cyfatebol yw £108.

O ran gwasanaethau a ddiogelir—a gwn i'r mater hwn gael ei godi—mae Edwina Hart a minnau wedi gwneud yn glir dro ar ôl tro na ddylai cost ariannu gwasanaethau lefel 2 a ddiogelir ddisgyn ar ysgwyddau pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru. Mae'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am blismona yn y Swyddfa Gartref wedi ysgrifennu at bob un o'r awdurdodau heddlu i ddweud y dylid cael amserlen o ddwy flynedd, hyd at 2009, i leihau'n sylweddol y risg mewn ardaloedd lle mae angen mawr a chael amserlen hwy, lle mae angen, hyd at 2011, er mwyn i ardaloedd eraill godi i safonau derbynol. Felly, yn yr amgylchiadau hyn, byddwn yn synnu pe bai cynnydd yng nghyllideb awdurdodau heddlu ar gyfer 2007-08 yn cynnwys symiau mawr ar gyfer gwasanaethau a ddiogelir.

Gobeithio fy mod wedi dangos y byddai



police settlement, coupled with a reasonable council tax increase, would address pay and price pressures, and provide for some growth. Therefore, I ask you to vote against amendment 1. This is about establishing the principles against which police authority budgets in Wales can be judged. While there may be issues for police authorities that will have to be addressed by the Home Office, that would apply to all police authorities across England and Wales, and is for discussion at another time.

I am a strong advocate of local accountability and for unitary and police authorities being allowed to set their own budgets to meet local circumstances, but, as the Minister responsible for council tax policy in Wales, I must strive to ensure that all council tax payers are treated fairly. I ask you to support this motion and approve the draft principles as laid before the Assembly. If the draft principles are approved, I will have to consider whether to designate or nominate the North Wales Police Authority.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM3523 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*expresses concern that the failure of the Home Office to fund protective services, community policing and inflation in police budgets is imposing a further burden on council tax payers.*

While the Labour Welsh Assembly Government is supporting capping the precept increase at 5 per cent, we should note that the two Labour council members of the North Wales Police Authority propose an inflation-busting 15 per cent increase in the budget. We have concerns about some of the decisions made by the chief constable in terms of funding priorities, which should be far more in line with public priorities—bobbies on the beat—than with the priorities of Whitehall. However, we accept that his hands have been tied by the Labour UK Government and that community policing remains the No. 1 public policing priority. As the chair of the North Wales Police Authority has stated in a letter,

setliad yr heddlu, ynghyd â chynnydd rhesymol yn y dreth gyngor, yn delio â'r pwysau cyflogau a phrisiau, ac yn darparu ar gyfer rhywfaint o dwf. Felly, gofynnaf i chi bleidleisio yn erbyn gwelliant 1. Mae a wnelo hyn â sefydlu'r egwyddorion ar gyfer gallu barnu cyllidebau awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru. Er bod rhai materion i awdurdodau heddlu y bydd yn rhaid i'r Swyddfa Gartref fynd i'r afael â hwy, byddai hynny'n gymwys i bob awdurdod heddlu ledled Cymru a Lloegr, a chaiff ei drafod rywbryd arall.

Yr wyf yn credu'n gryf mewn atebolrwydd lleol ac i awdurdodau unedol ac awdurdodau heddlu gael pennu eu cyllidebau eu hunain i ateb amgylchiadau lleol, ond fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y bolisi treth gyngor yng Nghymru, rhaid imi sicrhau y caiff pawb sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor eu trin yn deg. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig hwn a chymeradwyo'r egwyddorion drafft fel y'u gosodwyd ger bron y Cynulliad. Os cymeradwyr yr egwyddorion drafft, bydd yn rhaid imi ystyried a ddylid dynodi neu enwebu Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM3523 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn mynegi pryder bod methiant y Swyddfa Gartref i ariannu gwasanaethau gwarchod, plismona cymunedol a chwyddiant yng nghyllidebau'r heddlu'n rhoi mwy o faich eto ar y sawl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor.*

Er bod Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru yn cefnogi'r bwriad i gapio'r cynnydd yn y praesept ar 5 y cant, dylem sylwi bod y ddau aelod o gyngor Llafur sydd ar Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn cynnig cynnydd enfawr o 15 y cant yn y gyllideb. Yr ydym yn pryderu am rai o'r penderfyniadau a wnaed gan y prif gwnstabl o ran blaenoriaethau ariannu, a ddylai gyd-fynd lawer yn nes â blaenoriaethau cyhoeddus—plismyn rhawd—nag â blaenoriaethau Whitehall. Fodd bynnag, derbyniwn fod Llywodraeth Lafur y DU wedi ei rwystro, ac mai plismona cymunedol o hyd yw'r brif flaenoriaeth plismona cyhoeddus. Fel y mae cadeirydd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi ei ddweud mewn llythyr,

'it is deeply unsatisfactory that you are issuing capping criteria in respect of a service for which you have—with respect—no detailed knowledge of funding issues'.

The UK Government is demanding that the cashable efficiency gains are invested in an expansion of neighbourhood policing and protective services. You appear to have based your capping criteria on the assumption that the same money can be spent a second time on reducing the council tax burden.

**Ann Jones:** In 2004, the people of north Wales saw a 31.5 per cent increase in their council tax to fund community beat police officers in every electoral ward in north Wales. Do you not think that the people of north Wales have paid for their community policing, and should Mr Brunstrom not now apologise for withdrawing community beat police officers? He never reached the target of having one in every electoral ward, yet you want to support someone that will put council tax up higher.

**Mark Isherwood:** I am saying that even your colleagues on the North Wales Police Authority disagree strongly with you.

**Ann Jones:** I am not interested in them. What will you do?

**Mark Isherwood:** I have spoken to one of them, and I know that. I am also saying that we have to recognise that it is the Home Office that has scuppered the plans that the police authority put forward at that time.

As I said, the UK Government is demanding that the cashable efficiency gains are invested in an expansion of neighbourhood policing and protective services. The figure for an increase in expenditure of 4.4 per cent appears to be precise. However, the authority says that it is not identifiable or understandable within the context of policing. You have been supplied, Minister, with a detailed calculation of inflation in north Wales's case resulting in a figure of 5.11 per cent, which you have not contested.

mae'n anfoddhaol iawn eich bod yn gosod meini prawf capio mewn cysylltiad â gwasanaeth nad oes gennyh—gyda phob parch—ddim dealltwriaeth fanwl ohono o ran materion ariannu.

Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn mynnu bod yr enillion effeithlonrwydd y gellir eu troi'n arian parod yn cael eu buddsoddi i ehangu gwasanaethau plismona cymdogaeth a gwasanaethau diogelu. Mae'n ymddangos eich bod wedi seilio'ch meini prawf capio ar yr honiad y gall yr un arian gael ei wario yr ail waith ar leihau'r baich treth gyngor.

**Ann Jones:** Yn 2004, cafodd pobl y gogledd gynnydd o 31.5 y cant yn y dreth gyngor i ariannu swyddogion rhawd yn y gymuned ym mhob ward etholiadol yn y gogledd. Oni chredwch fod pobl y gogledd wedi talu am eu plismona cymunedol, ac oni ddylai Mr Brunstrom yn awr ymddiheuro am gael gwared ar swyddogion rhawd y gymuned? Ni chyraeddodd erioed y targed o gael un ym mhob ward etholiadol, ac eto yr ydych am gefnogi rhywun a fydd yn codi'r dreth gyngor yn uwch.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf yn dweud bod hyd yn oed eich cydweithwyr ar Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn anghytuno'n chwyrn â chi.

**Ann Jones:** Nid oes gennyf ddiddordeb ynddynt hwy. Beth fyddwch chi'n ei wneud?

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf wedi siarad ag un ohonynt, a gwn hynny. Yr wyf hefyd yn dweud bod yn rhaid inni gydnabod mai'r Swyddfa Gartref sydd wedi difetha'r cynlluniau a gyflwynodd awdurdod yr heddlu bryd hynny.

Fel y dywedais, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn mynnu bod yr enillion effeithlonrwydd y gellir eu troi'n arian parod yn cael eu buddsoddi i ehangu gwasanaethau plismona cymdogaeth a gwasanaethau diogelu. Ymddengys fod cynnydd mewn gwariant o 4.4 y cant yn fanwl gywir. Fodd bynnag, dywed yr awdurdod na ellir ei adnabod na'i ddeall yng nghyd-destun plismona. Weinidog, yr ydych wedi cael cyfrifiad manwl o chwyddiant yn achos y gogledd sy'n rhoi ffigur o 5.11 y cant, ac nid ydych wedi ei

In addition to that 5.11 per cent, there is the impact of the need to respond to Her Majesty's Inspectorate baseline assessment, which, in respect of protective services, clearly indicated that investment is needed for the authority to begin to fulfil its statutory duty. That is estimated at 1.25 per cent. According to the police authority, a further amount is also required to enable the service to respond to the torrent of legislation and unfunded initiatives emanating from the Home Office. That is what the police authority said. This leaves a minimum requirement of 6.36 per cent to stand still, and the imposition of 4.4 per cent clearly indicates that you are assuming use of resources already used by the Home Office.

In my region of north Wales, we have seen community beat managers taken off the beat to fill civilian jobs because of underfunding from the Home Office. My surgeries are being attended by people who are threatened with the loss of their community beat managers. As I said last week, I recently spent time in Wrexham police station and met community beat managers and police community support officers, who, during their first month of probation as police community support officers, were going out on the beat with community beat managers. However, I was told that by the end of the month they were going out alone. As I said last week, that is not what the Home Office and the Prime Minister originally told us—we were told that such officers would be additional to, and not alternative to, police officers being taken out of the community into civilian jobs.

The Home Office has cut funding for police community support officers by 30 per cent this year, which, in turn, has had a further impact on the number of community beat managers and warden schemes in places such as Wrexham. When I met Tony McNulty, the Minister of State for policing, security and community safety, last July, along with a cross-party group of Assembly Members, he told us that, although the four Welsh police

herio.

Yn ogystal â'r 5.11 y cant hwnnw, mae effaith yr angen am ymateb i asesiad sylfaenol Arolygiaeth Ei Mawrhydi a oedd, o ran gwasanaethau diogelu, yn dangos yn glir bod angen buddsoddi er mwyn i'r awdurdod ddechrau cyflawni ei ddyletswydd statudol. Amcangyfrifir mai 1.25 y cant yw hynny. Yn ôl awdurdod yr heddlu, mae angen swm pellach i alluogi'r gwasanaeth i ymateb i'r llif o ddeddfwriaeth a mentrau heb eu hariannu a ddaw o'r Swyddfa Gartref. Dyna a ddywedodd awdurdod yr heddlu. Mae hyn yn gadael gofyniad sylfaenol o 6.36 y cant er mwyn aros yn ei unfan, ac mae gosod 4.4 y cant yn amlwg yn dangos eich bod yn tybio defnyddio adnoddau a ddefnyddir eisoes gan y Swyddfa Gartref.

Yn fy rhanbarth i yn y gogledd, yr ydym wedi gweld rheolwyr rhawd cymunedol yn cael eu symud o'r rhawd i lenwi swyddi sifil oherwydd diffyg ariannu gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Mae fy nghymorthfeydd yn llawn pobl sydd o dan fygythiad o golli eu rheolwyr rhawd cymunedol. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, treuliais amser yn ddiweddar yng ngorsaf heddlu Wrecsam a chyfarfûm â rheolwyr rhawd cymunedol a swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu, a oedd, yn ystod eu mis cyntaf o'u cyfnod prawf fel swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu, yn mynd allan ar rawd gyda rheolwyr rhawd cymunedol. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd wrthyf erbyn diwedd y mis hwnnw eu bod yn mynd allan ar eu pen eu hunain. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, nid dyna a ddywedodd y Swyddfa Gartref a Phrif Weinidog Prydain wrthym yn wreiddiol—dywedwyd wrthym y byddai swyddogion felly yn ychwanegol at swyddogion heddlu, a fyddai'n cael eu symud o'r gymuned i swyddi sifil, nid yn ddewis gwahanol.

Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref wedi gostwng y swm a roddir i swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu 30 y cant eleni, a hynny yn ei dro wedi cael effaith ychwanegol ar nifer y rheolwyr rhawd cymunedol a chynlluniau wardeiniaid sydd ar waith mewn mannau fel Wrecsam. Pan gyfarfûm â Tony McNulty, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros blismona, diogelwch a diogelwch cymunedol, fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, ynghyd â grŵp

forces will not be merged in the foreseeable future, the destination remains the same. He added that he still thinks that a strategic, all-Wales police force is the answer to filling the protective services gap. Each police force was then asked by him to submit its proposals for filling that protective services gap in its area, hence the additional cuts in community policing since, especially in north Wales.

Forces are having to cut back on core community policing in order to fund the cost of protective services as directed, but not as funded, by the Home Office. This sets them up to fall at the last hurdle over the merger proposals, but virtually every credible piece of research from the last 10 years shows that mergers and acquisitions fail.

In its now redundant magazine, North Wales Police referred to an independent survey that it commissioned showing that 75 per cent of the population would be happy to pay 39p a week extra in council tax just to fill the gap in police funding. It stated:

'If we do not get the resources, the people of north Wales will not get more bobbies on the beat—they will get fewer'.

Home Office pressure to fill and fund the so-called protective services gap to tackle terrorism, organised crime and drug smuggling is, as detailed earlier, leading to cuts in front-line community policing. The UK Government must not be allowed to get away with this cynical sleight of hand. We cannot support this motion.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yet again, I am pleased to have the opportunity to dispel some of the myths that have appeared in the local media relating to the settlement for North Wales Police. There have been suggestions that the Home Office has taken money from North Wales Police, but this is not the case. Year on year, the force has received an increase in

trawsbleidiol o Aelodau'r Cynulliad, dywedodd wrthym, er na fydd y pedwar heddlu yng Nghymru yn uno yn y dyfodol agos, fod y bwriad yn dal yr un fath. Ychwanegodd ei fod yn dal i gredu mai heddlu strategol i Gymru gyfan yw'r ateb i lenwi'r bwlch mewn gwasanaethau diogelu. Yna, gofynnodd i bob heddlu gyflwyno'i gynigion ar gyfer llenwi'r bwlch hwnnw ym maes gwasanaethau diogelwch yn ei ardal, a hynny sy'n esbonio'r toriadau ychwanegol ym maes plismona cymunedol ers hynny, yn arbennig yn y gogledd.

Mae heddluoedd yn gorfod cwtdogi'r gwaith plismona cymunedol craidd a wneir er mwyn ariannu cost gwasanaethau diogelu fel yr mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn ei gyfarwyddo ond nid yn ei ariannu. Mae hyn yn eu paratoi i fethu ar y funud olaf yn y cynigion uno, ond dengys bron bob darn credadwy o waith ymchwil o'r 10 mlynedd diwethaf fod achosion uno a chaffael yn methu.

Yn ei gylchgrawn diangen bellach, cyfeiriodd Heddlu Gogledd Cymru at arolwg annibynnol a gomisiynwyd ganddo, a oedd yn dangos y byddai 75 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn fodlon talu 39c yr wythnos yn ychwanegol o dreth gyngor i lenwi'r bwlch yn arian heddluoedd. Dywedai:

Os na chawn yr adnoddau, ni fydd pobl yn y gogledd yn cael mwy o swyddogion heddlu ar y rhawd—byddant yn cael llai.

Mae pwysau gan y Swyddfa Gartref i lenwi ac ariannu'r bwlch honedig mewn gwasanaethau diogelu i fynd i'r afael â therfysgaeth, troseddu cyfundrefinol a smyglo cyffuriau yn arwain at gwtogi ym maes plismona cymunedol rheng flaen, fel y dywedwyd yn gynharach. Rhaid sicrhau na chaniateir i Lywodraeth y DU gyflawni'r twyllo sinigaidd hwn. Ni allwn gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

**Carl Sargeant:** Unwaith eto, yr wyf yn falch cael y cyfle i roi taw ar rai o'r chwedlau sydd wedi ymddangos yn y cyfryngau lleol am y setliad ar gyfer Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Awgrymwyd bod y Swyddfa Gartref wedi mynd â rhagor o arian oddi wrth Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, ond nid yw hyn yn wir. O flwyddyn i flwyddyn, mae'r heddlu wedi cael

funding; from 2007-08, North Wales Police will receive an extra 3.6 per cent. Fears that money is going to south Wales are also unfounded. In fact, the Home Office generates and operates a weighting system that benefits north Wales at the expense of south Wales. For 2007-08, a total of £1.3 million will be redistributed from south Wales to north Wales, and you do not hear me say that very often.

Between 2001 and 2008, Government grants and central spending for police has risen by a massive 62 per cent. The Home Office police grant for authorities in Wales amounts to £225 million, and the Welsh Assembly Government will provide another £154 million in 2007-08. Therefore, police funding is not in crisis.

Council precepts have recently been a bone of contention, with North Wales Police claiming that taxpayers would have to pay an extra 14 per cent or more for policing. However, north Wales has seen the third sharpest rise in police precepts since 1997-98—an increase of 244 per cent. North Wales Police Authority now enjoys the highest precept in Wales, at £166.90.

Sandy Mewies will later present a short debate on financial literacy. Some good financial literacy advice would be to live within your means, and I am sure that when Alun Cairns or William Graham consider buying their next Jaguar, they will look at how much money is in their pocket. If they cannot afford it, they will not buy it. That is what North Wales Police should be doing. Given the facts, I do not think that my constituents—

**Brynle Williams:** Did you say that when you bought your Mercedes? [*Laughter.*]

4.20 p.m.

**Carl Sargeant:** You are slightly mistaken—are you talking about your new tractor, Brynle? [*Laughter.*] Given these facts, I do not think that my constituents would be happy to pay an extra 14 per cent on their

cynnydd yn yr arian a gaiff; o 2007-08, bydd Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn cael 3.6 y cant yn ychwanegol. Mae'r ofnau fod arian yn mynd i'r de hefyd yn ddi-sail. Yn wir, mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn cynhyrchu ac yn gweithredu system bwysoli sydd o fantais i'r gogledd ar draul y de. Ar gyfer 2007-08, caiff cyfanswm o £1.3 miliwn ei ailddyrannu o'r de i'r gogledd, ac ni fyddwch yn fy nghlywed yn dweud hynny'n aml iawn.

Rhwng 2001 a 2008, mae grantiau'r Llywodraeth a gwariant canolog ar gyfer yr heddlu wedi cynyddu'n enfawr, 62 y cant. Mae grant heddlu y Swyddfa Gartref i awdurdodau yng Nghymru yn dod i £225 miliwn, a bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu £154 miliwn arall yn 2007-08. Felly, nid yw sefyllfa ariannu'r heddlu mewn argyfwng.

Mae praeseptau Cyngor wedi bod yn asgwrn cynnen yn ddiweddar, a Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn honni y byddai'n rhaid i drethdalwyr dalu 14 y cant neu fwy yn ychwanegol am blismona. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gogledd wedi gweld y trydydd cynnydd mwyaf ym mhraeseptau'r heddlu er 1997-98—cynnydd o 244 y cant. Mae Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru bellach yn mwynhau'r praeseptau uchaf yng Nghymru, sef £166.90.

Bydd Sandy Mewies yn cyflwyno dadl fer ar lythrennedd ariannol yn ddiweddarach. Un darn o gyngor da ar lythrennedd ariannol fyddai peidio â gwario yn fwy na'ch incwm. Ac yr wyf yn siŵr, pan fydd Alun Cairns neu William Graham yn ystyried prynu eu Jaguar nesaf, y byddant yn edrych ar faint o arian sydd yn eu poced. Os na allant ei fforddio, ni fyddant yn ei brynu. Dyna y dylai Heddlu Gogledd Cymru fod yn ei wneud. O ystyried y ffeithiau, ni chredaf y byddai fy etholwyr—

**Brynle Williams:** A ddywedoch chi hynny wrth brynu'ch Mercedes? [*Chwerthin.*]

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr ydych wedi camddeall fymryn—a ydych yn sôn am eich tractor newydd, Brynle? [*Chwerthin.*] O gofio'r ffeithiau hyn, ni chredaf y byddai fy etholwyr yn fodlon talu 14 y cant yn ychwanegol o

council tax. Taxing hard-working families will be music to the ears of Eleanor Burnham and the Liberal Democrats, although the Liberal Democrats would replace council tax with an income tax, leading to another £40 per month tax hike for the average working family.

The position of the Tories is equally confounding. Mark Isherwood, whose colleagues supported the Assembly Government's rebanding proposal, is now flip-flopping, like all the other Tories before him, and is attacking the very thing that they voted for.

I will take this opportunity to quote from a letter on council tax, the Tories and the hike:

'the council tax rebanding proposal that the Welsh Assembly Government put forward received Conservative Assembly Member support. That fact is recorded. I am also amazed about the Tories and that they are trying to make political capital out of such a policy decision, which has had huge implications for the households in Wales. The Conservative Party is trying to be all things to all men. We have seen the flip-flop policy decisions of Cameron and Bourne. Conservative supporters throughout Wales cannot believe what Bourne and co have descended to. A Tory Party that wanted the Assembly abolished now favours extending its powers and are quite happy to work alongside Plaid Cymru, which, honestly, beggars belief. I call on the Tory AMs in the Assembly to come clean on the disastrous way in which they voted on issues like council tax rebanding.'

Those are the words of the chairman of the UK Independence Party, not mine. Let it be put on the record that today's issue is about the council tax precept for people in north Wales. Let it be made known that the Conservatives, Plaid Cymru and Liberal Democrats are asking for a hike on council tax for the people of north Wales. I do not think that that is right and I will certainly not support it.

**David Lloyd:** Last month, Plaid Cymru

dreth gyngor. Bydd trethu teuluoedd sy'n gweithio'n galed yn fêl ar fysedd Eleanor Burnham a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er y byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn disodli treth gyngor gan dreth incwm, gan olygu cynnydd treth pellach o £40 y mis i'r teulu cyffredin sy'n gweithio.

Mae sefyllfa'r Torïaid yr un mor ddryslyd. Mae Mark Isherwood, yr oedd ei gyd-Aelodau'n cefnogi cynnig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ailfandio, bellach yn newid ei feddwl, fel yr holl Doriïaid eraill o'i flaen, ac yn ymosod ar yr union beth yr oeddent wedi pleidleisio drosto.

Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddyfynnu o lythyr ar y dreth gyngor, y Torïaid a'r cynnydd:

Cafodd cynnig Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ailfandio'r dreth gyngor gefnogaeth Aelodau Ceidwadol y Cynulliad. Mae'r ffaith honno wedi ei chofnodi. Yr wyf hefyd yn rhyfeddu bod y Torïaid yn ceisio cael mantais wleidyddol o benderfyniad polisi o'r fath, sydd wedi cael goblygiadau enfawr i'r cartrefi yng Nghymru. Mae'r Plaid Geidwadol yn ceisio plesio pawb. Yr ydym wedi gweld penderfyniadau polisi cyfnewidiol Cameron a Bourne. Ni all cefnogwyr Ceidwadol ledled Cymru gredu bod Bourne a'i gyd-Aelodau wedi ymostwng i'r fath lefel. Mae Plaid Doriïaid a oedd am ddiddymu'r Cynulliad bellach o blaid ymestyn ei bwerau, ac mae'n ddigon bodlon gweithio ochr yn ochr â Phlaid Cymru sydd, a bod yn onest, yn anghredadwy. Galwaf ar Aelodau Torïaidd y Cynulliad i syrthio ar eu bai am y ffordd drychinebus y gwnaethant bleidleisio dros faterion fel ailfandio'r dreth gyngor.

Geiriau cadeirydd Plaid Annibynnol y DU yw'r rheini, nid fy ngeiriau i. Gadewch inni gofnodi bod a wnelo'r mater heddiw â phraeseptau'r dreth gyngor i bobl yn y gogledd. Sicrhewch ei bod yn hysbys bod y Ceidwadwyr, Plaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gofyn am gynnydd yn y dreth gyngor i bobl yn y gogledd. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n iawn, ac yn sicr ni fyddaf yn ei gefnogi.

**David Lloyd:** Fis diwethaf, rhagwelodd Plaid

predicted that the lowly floor increase of 3.6 per cent in police grants from the Home Office in London would lead to another above-inflation increase in the police precept and, therefore, council tax, bills, or the prospect of services being hit. The Minister today seeks to cap council tax bills at 5 per cent. In true bully-boy fashion, the Assembly Government has decided to flex its muscles over police authorities, but has been reluctant to challenge its big boss at Westminster to ensure that the Home Office reimburses police in Wales the cost of the failed merger plans—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Dai Lloyd is not giving way.

**David Lloyd:** I am carrying on; we have heard enough drivel.

This undermines the apparent partnership approach with the authorities taken by this Government. North Wales Police has announced that limiting an increase to 5 per cent will lead to job losses, which is why they have set an increase of 6.75 per cent. The Minister will be aware that police budgets have been hit by the merger fiasco. To date, despite police authorities in Wales submitting cost claims that total over £1 million to the Home Office, the Home Office has only paid around £100,000 to each authority. Given that this was a Home Office initiative in the first place, does the Minister not believe that, rather than giving up meekly, as seems to have happened, she should ensure that authorities' costs are reimbursed in full by the Home Office?

There has been a historical problem whereby central grants from the Home Office have not increased at the same rate as the police precept. The Government is shifting the burden on to council tax payers and will not take up its appropriate share of costs. However, the police service is not devolved; police authorities are not answerable to the National Assembly for Wales. I would rather it were otherwise—I favour the police service being devolved. We look forward to the

Cymru y byddai terfyn isaf y cynnydd o 3.6 y cant mewn grantiau heddlu gan y Swyddfa Gartref yn Llundain yn arwain at gynnydd arall yn uwch na chwyddiant ym mhraeseptau'r heddlu, ac felly at y posibilrwydd y bydd hyn yn effeithio ar y dreth gyngor, biliau neu wasanaethau. Heddiw, mae'r Gweinidog yn ceisio capio biliau'r dreth gyngor ar 5 y cant. Fel bwli go-iawn, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi penderfynu dangos ei hawdurdod dros awdurdodau heddlu, ond nid yw'n barod i herio'i meistr yn San Steffan i sicrhau bod y Swyddfa Gartref yn ad-dalu i'r heddlu yng Nghymru gost y cynlluniau uno a fethodd—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Dai Lloyd yn ildio.

**David Lloyd:** Yr wyf am barhau; yr ydym wedi clywed digon o lol.

Mae hyn yn tanseilio'r dull partneriaeth ymddangosiadol gyda'r awdurdodau a fabwysiadwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon. Mae Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi cyhoeddi y bydd cyfyngu cynnydd i 5 y cant yn arwain at golli swyddi, a dyna pam y gosododd gynnydd o 6.75 y cant. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod bod methiant y broses uno wedi effeithio ar gyllidebau'r heddlu. Hyd yma, er bod awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru wedi cyflwyno ceisiadau am gostau i'r Swyddfa Gartref o fwy na £1 filiwn, dim ond tua £100,000 y mae'r Swyddfa Gartref wedi'i dalu i bob awdurdod. O gofio mai menter y Swyddfa Gartref oedd hon yn y lle cyntaf, onid yw'r Gweinidog yn credu y dylai sicrhau bod costau awdurdodau'n cael eu had-dalu'n llawn gan y Swyddfa Gartref, yn hytrach na rhoi'r ffidil yn y to, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn ôl pob tebyg?

Mae'r ffaith nad yw grantiau canolog gan y Swyddfa Gartref wedi cynyddu ar yr un raddfa â phraeseptau'r heddlu yn broblem hanesyddol. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn symud y baich ar bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor, ac nid yw'n fodlon cymryd cyfrifoldeb am ei chyfran briodol o gostau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'rgwasanaeth heddlu wedi'i ddatganoli; nid yw'r awdurdodau heddlu yn atebol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Byddai'n well gennyf pe na bai hynny'n wir—yr wyf o

Assembly having increased powers, and being able to tell police authorities what to do. Until then, the Minister has no locus. Plaid Cymru will support the amendment and vote against the motion.

**Ann Jones:** I thank Carl for putting on record the facts about the Home Office grant, because neither the Home Office nor the Welsh Assembly Government is deliberately discriminating against north Wales. According to North Wales Police's own figures, they have received a higher Home Office grant in the past few years than they expected. However, even with that higher grant, North Wales Police always planned to levy a large council tax precept. They have had huge increases in their three-year budget round. Last year, they wanted an increase of 15 per cent, before the Welsh Assembly Government stepped in and limited it to 4.86 per cent. North Wales Police already charges council tax payers the highest police precept in Wales, and the third highest of the 43 forces in England and Wales. We have all heard the figures: back in 1996, the police precept for a band D property in north Wales was £46, whereas, last year, it was £166.89. Council tax payers willingly pay that extra money—

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you agree that one of the problems is that the grant received by the North Wales Police Authority is much lower than, for example, that received by South Wales Police—it is £25 per head lower. Would you agree that that is iniquitous?

**Ann Jones:** I think that the consequence of the floor that the Minister, Sue Essex, put in was to protect north Wales, and I think that north Wales, having received a higher grant than expected from the Home Office, has to look at its contribution. Council tax payers will willingly pay for police officers on the beat, but they will not be duped; this time, I think that they have been duped. They have seen community beat police officers withdrawn, and they have seen community beat police officers promised in their areas and never achieved. Some members of the

blaid datganoli'r gwasanaeth heddlu. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld y Cynulliad yn cael mwy o bwerau, ac at allu dweud wrth awdurdodau heddlu beth i'w wneud. Tan hynny, nid oes gan y Gweinidog ddim locus. Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r gwelliant ac yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig.

**Ann Jones:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Carl am roi'r ffeithiau ynghylch grant y Swyddfa Gartref ar gofnod, oherwydd nid yw'r Swyddfa Gartref na Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwahaniaethu'n fwriadol yn erbyn y gogledd. Yn ôl ffigurau Heddlu Gogledd Cymru ei hun, cafodd grant uwch na'r disgwyl gan y Swyddfa Gartref yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed gyda'r grant uwch hwnnw, yr oedd Heddlu Gogledd Cymru bob amser wedi bwriadu codi praesept treth gyngor mawr. Cafodd gynnydd enfawr yn ei gylch cyllidebu tair blynedd. Y llynedd, yr oedd am gael cynnydd o 15 y cant, cyn i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymyrryd a'i gyfyngu i 4.86 y cant. Mae Heddlu Gogledd Cymru eisoes yn codi'r praesept heddlu uchaf yng Nghymru ar bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor, a'r trydydd uchaf o blith y 43 o heddluoedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Clywsom i gyd am y ffigurau: yn ôl yn 1996, yr oedd praesept yr heddlu ar gyfer eiddo band D yn y gogledd yn £46, a'r llynedd yr oedd yn £166.89. Mae pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yn fodlon talu'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw —

**Alun Ffred Jones:** A ydych yn cytuno mai un o'r problemau yw bod y grant a gaiff Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn is o lawer na'r grant a gaiff Heddlu De Cymru, er enghraifft—mae'n £25 y pen yn is. A fyddech yn cytuno bod hynny'n anghyfiawn?

**Ann Jones:** Credaf mai canlyniad y terfyn isaf a bennwyd gan y Gweinidog, Sue Essex, oedd diogelu'r gogledd, a chredaf fod yn rhaid i'r gogledd, ar ôl cael grant uwch na'r disgwyl gan y Swyddfa Gartref, edrych ar ei gyfraniad. Bydd pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yn fodlon talu am swyddogion rhawd yr heddlu, ond ni chânt eu twyllo; y tro hwn, credaf iddynt gael eu twyllo. Maent wedi gweld swyddogion heddlu rhawd cymunedol yn cael eu tynnu'n ôl, ac maent wedi clywed addewidion am swyddogion heddlu rhawd cymunedol yn eu hardaloedd na chawsant eu



police authority have said that they nearly got there, but, I am sorry, that is not good enough. I cannot 'nearly' pay my council tax: I have to pay my council tax in full.

Those increases were for uniform officers, but we also have to think about the civilian support staff, who have had a torrid time through all this. They have been seen as the weak element, and could have forced redundancies put upon them. We have seen redundancies in those jobs, but they were highly inflated redundancies. Of the 120 jobs talked about, 70 posts had yet to be filled in the North Wales Police Authority. Those were 70 jobs that it was hoping to put forward had it received its 15 per cent increase last year, and, no doubt, its 15 per cent this year, its 19 per cent next year, and its 24 per cent the year after that—that is what it was looking for. Those are the sorts of council tax levies that the chief constable was forcing the North Wales Police Authority to consider.

Richard Brunstrom is a highly charismatic and controversial chief constable, and you either like him or you do not, but that is not the debate for today. I have a lot of sympathy with what he tends to do and the way in which he supports his officers in carrying out their duties, but it is not his role to decide whether a double-digit increase is in the interest of the elderly widow struggling to maintain her family home. That is, and should be, the job of elected local councillors on the police authority, who are there to hold the chief constable to account and not to blindly follow on behind him. I know from my own constituency that, despite what the police authority tells me, many of my constituents are worried about their council tax levels, and many are worried that this increase will be the breaking point. I am surprised that the Tories supported an increase of 6.75 per cent. Only last week, we heard Nick Bourne promising £100 to every household to help to pay for this council tax increase. You would not have to promise things like that if you were not being irresponsible in today's debate.

gwireddu erioed. Mae rhai o aelodau awdurdod yr heddlu wedi dweud eu bod bron â gwireddu'r addewidion hynny, ond mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid yw hynny'n ddigon da. Ni allaf 'bron' â thalu fy nhreth gyngor: rhaid imi dalu fy nhreth gyngor yn llawn.

Yr oedd y cynnydd hwnnw ar gyfer swyddogion mewn lifrai, ond rhaid inni hefyd feddwl am y staff cymorth sifil, sydd wedi cael amser caled drwy hyn oll. Ystyriwyd mai hwy oedd y man gwan, a gellid bod wedi dileu eu swyddi'n orfodol. Yr ydym wedi gweld colli swyddi yn y maes hwnnw, ond yr oeddent yn golledion hollol anghywir. O'r 120 o swyddi y soniwyd amdanynt, yr oedd 70 yn dal heb eu llenwi yn Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Yr oedd y 70 hynny o swyddi yn rhai yr oedd yr heddlu'n gobeithio'u cyflwyno pe bai wedi cael ei gynnydd o 15 y cant y llynedd, ac mae'n sicr ei 15 y cant eleni, ei 19 y cant y flwyddyn nesaf, a'i 24 y cant y flwyddyn wedyn—dyna yr oedd yn edrych amdano. Dyna'r mathau o ardollau treth gyngor yr oedd y prif gwnstabl yn gorfodi Awdurdod Heddlu De Cymru i'w hystyried.

Mae Richard Brunstrom yn brif gwnstabl hynod garismataidd a dadleuol, ac yr ydych naill ai'n ei hoffi ynteu ddim, ond nid dyna'r ddadl heddiw. Yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo'n fawr â'r hyn y mae'n tueddu i'w wneud a'r ffordd y mae'n cynorthwyo'i swyddogion wrth gyflawni eu dyletswyddau. Ond nid ei rôl ef yw penderfynu a yw cynnydd dau ddigid o fudd i wraig weddw oeddrannus sy'n cael anhawster i gynnal ei chartref teuluol. Gwaith cyngorwyr lleol etholedig ar yr awdurdod heddlu yw hynny, sydd yno i ddwyn y prif gwnstabl i gyfrif ac nid i ddilyn fel deillion y tu ôl iddo, ac felly y dylai fod. Gwn o'm hetholaeth i, er yr hyn y mae'r awdurdod heddlu yn ei ddweud wrthyf, fod nifer o'm hetholwyr yn bryderus ynghylch lefelau eu treth gyngor, ac mae nifer yn pryderu mai'r cynnydd hwn fydd ei diwedd. Yr wyf yn synnu bod y Torïaid wedi cefnogi cynnydd o 6.75 y cant. Dim ond yr wythnos diwethaf clywsom Nick Bourne yn addo rhoi £100 i bob cartref i helpu talu am y cynnydd hwn yn y dreth gyngor. Ni fyddai'n rhaid ichi addo pethau felly pe na baech yn anghyfrifol yn y ddadl heddiw.

The police, like everyone else, has to learn to live within its means.

**Karen Sinclair:** Were you as surprised as I was to read in the *Daily Post*, last week or the week before, that Brunstrom was talking about rolling out tasers in the countryside as a new initiative? That was quite surprising, considering that he was telling everyone who would listen that he was having to contract his service.

**Ann Jones:** Yes, I find it quite amazing that he should even be looking at new initiatives.

**David Davies:** Will you take an intervention?

**Ann Jones:** Yes, seeing that you speak very little here, as you are not here very often.

**David Davies:** I am grateful. I declare an interest as a warranted special constable, and as someone who is trained to use an extendable baton— [*Laughter.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I cannot hear what the special constable is saying. [*Laughter.*]

**David Davies:** There is a serious point here; it is not a double entendre, tempting though it is to go down that path. A taser gun is actually far less dangerous for the police officer and the person on whom it is used than the extendable iron baton that all police officers carry.

**Ann Jones:** Thank you for that, David. I could tell you where to put your extendable baton, but I will not. [*Laughter.*]

4.30 p.m.

Policing is an important issue, and, Karen, so is policing in rural areas. However, for Mr Brunstrom to be looking at the initiative of issuing new taser guns in rural areas is yet another example of his trying to eat caviar and drink champagne when he should be having a pint of beer and a bag of chips, just like the rest of us who have to cope with

Rhaid i'r heddlu, fel pawb arall, ddysgu peidio â gwario mwy na'i incwm.

**Karen Sinclair:** A oeddech yn synnu cymaint â mi o ddarllen yn y *Dail Post*, yr wythnos diwethaf neu'r wythnos flaenorol, fod Brunstrom yn siarad am gyflwyno drylliau taser yng nghefn gwlad fel menter newydd? Yr oedd hynny'n dipyn o syndod, o gofio'i fod yn dweud wrth bawb a fyddai'n gwrando ei fod yn gorfod cwtoigi ei wasanaeth.

**Ann Jones:** Oedd, yr oedd yn gryn syndod ei fod hyd yn oed yn ystyried mentrau newydd.

**David Davies:** A gymerwch ymyriad?

**Ann Jones:** Gwnaf, o gofio nad ydych yn siarad fawr ddim yma, gan nad ydych yma'n aml iawn.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar. Datganaf fuddiant fel cwnstabl cynorthwyol gwarantedig, ac fel rhywun sydd wedi'i hyfforddi i ddefnyddio baton estyn— [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni allaf glywed beth mae'r cwnstabl cynorthwyol yn ei ddweud. [*Chwerthin.*]

**David Davies:** Mae yma bwynt difrifol; nid oes iddo ystyr ddwbl, waeth pa mor ddymunol yw hynny. Mae dryll taser mewn gwirionedd lawer yn llai peryglus i swyddog heddlu a'r sawl y'i defnyddir yn ei erbyn na'r baton estyn haearn sydd gan bob swyddog heddlu.

**Ann Jones:** Diolch ichi am hynny, David. Gallwn ddweud wrthyich ble i roi eich baton estyn, ond ni wnaf hynny. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae plismona'n fater pwysig, ac felly hefyd, Karen, blismona mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith bod Mr Brunstrom yn ystyried y fenter i gyflwyno gyniau taser newydd mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn enghraifft arall ohono'n ceisio bwyta cafiar ac yfed siampên pan ddylai fod yn cael peint o gwrw a phecyn o sglodion, yn union fel y

those issues.

I pay tribute to the work that Councillor Ian Roberts has done as chair of the North Wales Police Authority. He has brought the precept down to 6.75 per cent; he has come a long way since the 15 per cent, and it is a pity that he could not make that last step to be in harmony with us in the Assembly. However, I am confident that the people of north Wales will know that it is only the Labour Party here that is saving them from huge increases, and preventing Mr Brunstrom from doing ridiculous things. We have to get this in check, and we must listen to what the people of north Wales are clearly saying, which is that they are not prepared to pay any more than they have paid in the past.

**Michael German:** I understand the Minister's problem. She has a difficulty in balancing the way in which the grant has worked from London with what she does in Wales. There are two tests for the motion, the first of which is whether the capping regime that the Minister wants to place on North Wales Police will result in fewer officers on the beat. The second test is whether the North Wales Police Authority is behaving financially irresponsibly or responsibly. I shall take the first test, and I can answer only based on what the police authority and the chief constable have said. It is their view that a capping regime of this sort will lead to fewer police officers on the beat. They also believe that people will be prepared to pay a small amount—some £8 more a year for a band D household—to achieve that level of policing.

The second test is about the efficiency of this police authority. Members will know that the efficiency savings that are placed on police forces are greater than the efficiency savings that the Assembly places upon local government in Wales. The Home Office efficiency targets for 2006-07 for North Wales Police were £1.78 million cashable and £1.78 million non-cashable. In the first three quarters of this financial year, its cashable savings came to £3.976 million, and its non-cashable savings came to £1.956 million. In other words, it has well exceeded

gweddill ohonom sy'n gorfod ymdopi â'r materion hynny.

Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i waith y Cynghorydd Ian Roberts fel cadeirydd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Llwyddodd i ostwng y praesept i 6.75 y cant; mae wedi gwneud cryn gynnydd ers y 15 y cant, ac mae'n drueni na allai gymryd y cam olaf hwnnw i gyd-fynd â ni yn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd pobl y gogledd yn gwybod mai'r Blaid Lafur yn unig yma sy'n eu hachub rhag cynnydd enfawr, ac sy'n atal Mr Brunstrom rhag gwneud pethau gwirion. Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r sefyllfa hon, a rhaid inni wrando ar yr hyn y mae pobl y gogledd yn ei ddweud yn glir, sef nad ydynt yn barod i dalu mwy nag y maent wedi'i dalu yn y gorffennol.

**Michael German:** Deallaf broblem y Gweinidog. Mae'n ei chael hi'n anodd cydbwysu'r ffordd y mae'r grant wedi gweithio o Lundain â'r hyn y mae hi'n ei wneud yng Nghymru. Mae dau brawf i'r cynnig, a'r cyntaf yw a fydd y system gapio y mae'r Gweinidog am ei rhoi ar waith o fewn Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn golygu y bydd llai o swyddogion rhawd. Yr ail brawf yw a yw Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn ymddwyn mewn ffordd anghyfrifol neu gyfrifol yn ariannol. Ymdriniaf â'r prawf cyntaf, ac ni allaf ond ateb yn seiliedig ar yr hyn y mae'r awdurdod heddlu a'r prif gwnstabl wedi'i ddweud. Maent o'r farn y bydd system gapio o'r fath yn golygu y bydd gan yr heddlu lai o swyddogion rhawd. Maent hefyd o'r farn y bydd pobl yn barod i dalu swm bach—tuag £8 y flwyddyn yn fwy ar gyfer cartref band D—i sicrhau'r lefel honno o blismona.

Mae a wnelo'r ail brawf ag effeithlonrwydd yr awdurdod heddlu hwn. Bydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod bod yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd sy'n cael eu gosod ar heddluoedd yn fwy na'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd y mae'r Cynulliad yn eu gosod ar lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Yr oedd targedau effeithlonrwydd y Swyddfa Gartref am 2006-07 ar gyfer Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn £1.78 miliwn o arbedion y gellid eu troi'n arian parod a £1.78 miliwn o arbedion na ellid eu troi'n arian parod. Yn ystod tri chwarter cyntaf y flwyddyn ariannol hon, gwnaeth arbedion

the targets that it was set for making savings and efficiencies. Furthermore, North Wales Police is intending to reinvest that money into the programme that the Government has asked of it, particularly in the area of improving protective services.

Therefore, why do we have this problem today? It seems quite clear to me that this issue is about how the Home Office funding works. Despite the fact that the Minister has recycled the floor grant within Wales, north Wales still receives a quarter less grant money per head of population than South Wales Police. That means that North Wales Police have to live within tighter means. Members will know, because they have also received correspondence from South Wales Police, that South Wales Police is saying that this problem will happen to it next year. The only reason it is not happening this year is because it has a savings regime and some money in the bank that it can use to protect itself during the coming financial year.

Therefore, it seems quite obvious that, on those two tests, with the evidence that has been put before us, it would be wrong to take police officers off the beat in north Wales, and to try to accuse the police authority and the chief constable of behaving financially irresponsibly. I know that the Labour Party has trouble with the police in north Wales, because it has raised the matter so often. It has continually made its complaints known. However, this should be a much simpler test. I have given the Labour Party two tests today, so let us see if it is able to vote to reassure the people of north Wales that their police on the beat will be retained.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I think that people have bandied around enough figures for this afternoon, so I will not go into the details of all the disputed figures; I am more concerned about the political football that this tricky area has been turned into. Let us remind

gwerth £3.976 miliwn y gellid eu troi'n arian parod, ac arbedion gwerth £1.956 miliwn na ellid eu troi'n arian parod. Hynny yw, mae wedi rhagori'n sylweddol ar y targedau a osodwyd ar gyfer arbedion ac effeithlonrwydd. At hynny, mae Heddlu Gogledd Cymru'n bwriadu ailfuddsoddi'r arian hwnnw yn y rhaglen y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gofyn iddo'i gweithredu, yn arbennig wrth wella gwasanaethau diogelu.

Felly, pam yr ydym yn wynebu'r broblem hon heddiw? Ymddengys yn gymharol glir imi fod a wnelo'r mater hwn â'r ffordd y mae cyllid y Swyddfa Gartref yn gweithio. Er bod y Gweinidog wedi ailgylchu'r grant terfyn yng Nghymru, mae'r gogledd yn dal i gael chwarter yn llai o arian grant fesul y pen o'r boblogaeth na Heddlu De Cymru. Mae hynny'n golygu ei bod yn rhaid i Heddlu Gogledd Cymru weithredu o fewn terfynau caethach. Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol, gan eu bod hefyd wedi cael gohebiaeth gan Heddlu De Cymru, fod Heddlu De Cymru'n dweud y bydd y broblem hon yn digwydd iddo'r flwyddyn nesaf. Yr unig reswm pam nad yw'n digwydd eleni yw fod ganddo system arbedion a rhywfaint o arian yn y banc y gall ei ddefnyddio i'w ddiogelu ei hun yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

Felly, mae'n ymddangos yn lled amlwg, o ran y ddau brawf hynny, gyda'r dystiolaeth sydd wedi ei rhoi ger ein bron, y byddai'n anghywir lleihau nifer y swyddogion rhawd yn y gogledd, a cheisio cyhuddo'r awdurdod heddlu a'r prif gwnstabl o ymddwyn yn anghyfrifol yn ariannol. Gwn fod y Blaid Lafur yn cael ffwdan gyda'r heddlu yn y gogledd, gan ei bod wedi codi'r mater mor aml. Gwnaeth ei chwynion yn hysbys droeon. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r prawf hwn fod lawer yn symlach. Yr wyf wedi rhoi dau brawf i'r Blaid Lafur heddiw, felly, gadewch inni weld a all bleidleisio i sicrhau pobl y gogledd y bydd nifer eu swyddogion rhawd yn dal ar yr un lefel.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Credaf fod pobl wedi cyfeirio at ddigon o ffigurau y prynhawn yma, felly nid wyf am drafod manylion yr holl ffigurau yr anghytunir yn eu cylch; yr wyf yn pryderu mwy fod y maes cymhleth hwn wedi'i droi'n gêm wleidyddol. Gadewch

ourselves that a lot of the Labour politicians are being extremely disingenuous, not only because of what Mike German has said, that North Wales Police receives a grant that is a quarter less per capita than that received by South Wales Police, but also because of the debacle over the underfunding and the top-slicing by the Home Office, which goes to urban English police authorities, and, let us be frank, the fundamental flaw in the Barnett formula that does not allow us to give sufficient funds to local authorities. Why has Welsh Labour wasted the last years and not succeeded in getting sufficient revision of the Barnett formula for Wales? The formula is fundamentally flawed and this is the time when Welsh Labour will have to face the electorate—

**Sandy Mewies:** Will you take an intervention?

**Carl Sargeant** *rose*—

**Eleanor Burnham:** No, I do not have enough time, for either of you; however, when I get into my stride, I might.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This has gone on long enough already.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Council tax precepts are a tricky issue, and we will be answering the misinformation given by Labour on the doorsteps; I can assure you of that. What of the profligate Labour Government in Westminster and all this nonsense over identity cards? They are a huge waste of money and no-one has even mentioned them. You dare to question North Wales Police, but you have not questioned what the Home Office and the Labour Party in Westminster are doing with all our money, when we know that ID cards will be an enormous waste of money as well as a blot on our civil liberties. The failed merger meant that several million pounds were lost to the North Wales Police Authority. No-one is saying that the authority has got it right every time, but, for goodness' sake, give it a little credit; after all, the North Wales Police Authority does have experts looking at its figures.

inni gofio bod nifer o wleidyddion Llafur yn bod yn hynod ddichellgar, nid yn unig oherwydd yr hyn a ddywedodd Mike German, fod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn cael grant sydd chwarter yn llai y pen na'r grant a gaiff Heddlu De Cymru, ond hefyd oherwydd y llanastr tanariannu a'r brigdorri gan y Swyddfa Gartref, sy'n cael ei roi i awdurdodau heddlu trefol yn Lloegr. Ac i siarad yn blwmp ac yn blaen, diffyg sylfaenol fformiwla Barnett yw'r ffaith nad yw'n ein galluogi i roi digon o arian i awdurdodau lleol. Pam mae Llafur Cymru wedi gwastraffu'r blynyddoedd diwethaf heb lwyddo i ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett yn ddigonol i Gymru? Mae i'r fformiwla ddiffygion sylfaenol, a dyma'r adeg y bydd yn rhaid i Lafur Cymru wynebu'r etholwyr—

**Sandy Mewies:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Carl Sargeant** *a gododd*—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Na wnaif, nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser i'r naill na'r llall ohonoch; fodd bynnag, ar ôl imi ddechrau arni o ddifrif, efallai y gwnaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hyn eisoes wedi mynd ymlaen yn ddigon hir.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae praeseptau'r dreth gyngor yn fater cymhleth, a byddwn yn ymateb i'r wybodaeth gamarweiniol a roddodd Llafur i bobl wrth y drws; gallaf eich sicrhau o hynny. Beth am y Llywodraeth Lafur afradlon yn San Steffan a'r holl lol am gardiau adnabod? Maent yn wastraff arian aruthrol ac nid oes neb wedi sôn amdanynt hyd yn oed. Yr ydych yn meiddio amau Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, ond nid ydych wedi gofyn beth y mae'r Swyddfa Gartref a'r Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan yn ei wneud â'n harian i gyd, pan wyddom y bydd cardiau adnabod yn wastraff arian aruthrol, yn ogystal ag amharu ar ein rhyddid sifil. O ganlyniad i fethiant y cynnig i uno, collodd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru filiynau o bunnoedd. Nid oes neb yn dweud bod yr awdurdod wedi llwyddo bob tro, ond er mwyn popeth, rhowch ryw faint o glod iddo; wedi'r cyfan, mae gan Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru arbenigwyr sy'n edrych ar ei ffigurau.

You cannot get away from the fact that it has questioned the Minister as best as it could, and sent us the detailed analysis of its questioning. I went with the police recently to watch the policing of an expensive day, that is, the Wrexham versus Chester football match. I saw for myself the amount of money that has to go into policing a whole day like that, to keep the people of Wrexham free from any misdemeanours. Policing in a democracy is costly. It is important that we are not seen to be having a go at the chief constable or North Wales Police, but that we support them. For God's sake, what are they doing? They are helping to keep the peace for everybody and keeping a lot of anti-social behaviour off the streets. You are keen, Labour, to look to anti-social behaviour orders to put a lot of youngsters in prison, but if you were to give more money to the police, and put your money where your mouth is, perhaps North Wales Police would not be in the problematic position that it is in at the moment.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I will do my best with that, Llywydd. The key thing that I want to start with was Mark Isherwood's contribution on the figures. He said that, according to North Wales Police, there is a 5.4 per cent growth and he asked how the police can make that match up. I answered that point in my speech. I do not think that his briefing from North Wales Police advised him of Tony McNulty's letter, which says that there is no need to provide the level 2 protective services. His figures were 1.25 per cent and, actually, that is how North Wales Police can come into line with the three other authorities—not with any of that cacophony of other statistics, it can do it with just that one.

On Dai's point, the problem is that there has been a history and culture of high precepts in north Wales. This is not just about this year; I have looked back and seen what Mr Brunstrom's estimates have been over a period of time. This is not a special case this year. In his view—and he is entitled to his view, as police authority members are entitled to theirs—council tax could be hiked up through the precept and that would be acceptable

Ni allwch wadu'r ffaith ei fod wedi holi'r Gweinidog cystal ag y gallai, ac wedi anfon dadansoddiad manwl atom o'r cwestiynau hynny. Euthum gyda'r heddlu yn ddiweddar i wyllo plismona diwrnod drud, sef y gêm bêldroed rhwng Wrecsam a Chaer. Gwelais drosof fy hun faint o arian sydd ynghlwm wrth blismona diwrnod cyfan o'r fath, er mwyn sicrhau na fydd pobl Wrecsam yn dioddef unrhyw achosion o gamymddwyn yn eu herbyn. Mae plismona mewn democratiaeth yn gostus. Mae'n bwysig inni beidio â chael ein gweld yn beirniadu'r prif gwnstabl na Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, ond yn hytrach yn eu cefnogi. Er mwyn Duw, beth maent yn ei wneud? Maent yn helpu cadw'r heddwch i bawb ac yn cadw llawer o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol oddi ar y strydoedd. Yr ydych yn awyddus, Lafur, i ddefnyddio gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol i roi nifer o bobl ifanc yn y carchar, ond pe baech yn rhoi mwy o arian i'r heddlu, a chyflawni'ch geiriau, efallai na fyddai Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn y sefyllfa broblematig sy'n ei wynebu ar hyn o bryd.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Gwnaf fy ngorau â hynny, Lywydd. Y prif beth yr wyf am gyfeirio ato'n gyntaf oedd cyfraniad Mark Isherwood at y ffigurau. Dywedodd, yn ôl Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, fod twf o 5.4 y cant a gofynnodd sut y gall yr heddlu gysoni hynny. Atebais hynny yn fy araith. Nid wyf yn credu bod ei nodyn briffio gan Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn dweud wrtho am lythyr Tony McNulty, sy'n dweud nad oes angen darparu gwasanaethau diogelu lefel 2. Yr oedd ei ffigurau yn 1.25 y cant, ac mewn gwirionedd dyna sut y gall Heddlu Gogledd Cymru gyd-fynd â'r tri awdurdod arall—nid gyda dim o blith y cacaffoni o ystadegau eraill: gall wneud hynny gyda'r ystadegyn hwnnw'n unig.

Ar bwynt Dai, y broblem yw bod hanes a diwylliant o braeseptau uchel yn y gogledd. Nid yw'r sefyllfa'n ymwneud ag eleni'n unig; yr wyf wedi edrych yn ôl a gweld amcangyfrifon Mr Brunstrom dros gyfnod o amser. Nid yw hwn yn achos arbennig eleni. Yn ei farn ef—ac mae ganddo hawl i'w farn, fel y mae gan aelodau awdurdod heddlu hawl i'w barn hwy—gellid cynyddu'r dreth gyngor drwy'r praesept a byddai hynny'n dderbyniol.

4.40 p.m.

That was the way a few years ago, but we know that that is not acceptable these days. I am proud to say that local authorities across the piece in Wales, whatever their political persuasion, have adapted to that.

Some useful points have been made. As Ann stated, the people of north Wales think that they have already paid for these constables. I did not quite understand special constable three-jobs Davies's intervention. [Laughter.] He would not be, with due respect, the person to whom I would turn for information on this.

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you for referring to three-jobs Davies, Minister. Do you believe that it would have been worthwhile had David Davies appeared in Westminster to discuss the police issues when they were debated there?

**Sue Essex:** It certainly would have been. I would be surprised to learn that he was not there, but, from the intimation of your voice, I am guessing that he was not.

To be absolutely clear, because we must get to the crux of this—

**David Davies** *rose*—

**Sue Essex:** If you were there, David, you can put that straight in the Record.

To be clear to everyone before you vote, the decision today is whether to approve the principles for capping police authorities. The inference is that, if this is approved, these will be applied to just one authority out of 26, namely North Wales Police Authority, because it has infringed these principles. We can have many discussion on the Home Office, and so on, but the core vote today is whether or not you support the principle of taking action against the unreasonable levels of precept set by the North Wales Police Authority, which will have to be included in the council tax demands for all north Wales local authorities. This is a straightforward decision—are you prepared to take action to protect council tax payers in north Wales, or

Dyna'r drefn ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, ond gwyddom nad yw hynny'n dderbyniol mwyach. Yr wyf yn falch dweud bod awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, waeth beth fo'u lliw gwleidyddol, wedi addasu i hynny.

Gwnaed rhai pwyntiau defnyddiol. Fel y dywedodd Ann, mae pobl y gogledd yn credu eu bod eisoes wedi talu am y cwnstabiliaid hyn. Nid oeddwn yn wir yn deall ymyriad y cwnstabl cynorthwyol tair-swydd Davies. [Chwerthin.] Nid ato ef, gyda phob parch, y byddwn yn troi i gael gwybodaeth am y mater hwn.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch am gyfeirio at Davies tair-swydd, Weinidog. A fyddai wedi bod yn werth chweil, yn eich barn chi, petai David Davies wedi ymddangos yn San Steffan i drafod materion yr heddlu pan gawsant eu trafod yno?

**Sue Essex:** Yn sicr, byddai. Byddai'n syndod imi glywed nad oedd yno, ond o'r awgrym yn eich llais, yr wyf yn dyfalu nad oedd yno.

I fod yn gwbl glir, oherwydd rhaid inni ddod at wraidd y mater—

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**Sue Essex:** Os oeddech yno, David, gallwch gadarnhau hynny yn y Cofnod.

I fod yn glir i bawb cyn ichi bleidleisio, mae a wnelo'r penderfyniad heddiw â'r cwestiwn a ddylid cymeradwyo'r egwyddorion ar gyfer capio awdurdodau heddlu. Yr awgrym yw, os caiff hwn ei gymeradwyo, mai i un awdurdod yn unig allan o 26, sef Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, y cânt eu cymhwyso, am ei fod wedi mynd yn groes i'r egwyddorion hyn. Gallwn gael llawer trafodaeth am y Swyddfa Gartref, ac yn y blaen, ond mae'r bleidlais graidd heddiw yn ymwneud â'r cwestiwn a ydych yn cefnogi'r egwyddor o weithredu yn erbyn y lefelau praesept afresymol a bennwyd gan Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, y bydd yn rhaid eu cynnwys yng ngofynion treth gyngor pob awdurdod lleol yn y gogledd. Mae'n benderfyniad

not? On the basis of fairness, I decided that it was my duty as Minister to put this decision to Plenary.

I have no hesitation in supporting this motion, or in recommending that anyone else support it. Not to do so would be unfair to the three other police authorities that have kept their precept levels to the required figure, and it would be unfair to your local government colleagues, who have made every effort to keep their council tax at 5 per cent below. One such north Wales council is the Isle of Anglesey County Council, which faces extra pressures this year on waste costs, but it has kept its council tax to 4.9 per cent. However, the North Wales Police precept will now take it over that 5 per cent. Above all, to vote against this motion would be unfair to the council tax payers of north Wales, who have no vote—or at least not today. As opposition Members, you will have to explain your course of action to them on the streets over the next few weeks and months.

I will end with an e-mail that I received today from someone from Abergele. Unknown to me, but typical—

**Alun Cairns:** Oh.

**Sue Essex:** You may want to listen to this, Alun.

This is typical of some of the comments that I have received on the many occasions that I have been in north Wales over the last few weeks. I will read it out, because I believe that you all need to listen to and reflect on it.

‘I am writing regarding the article in the Daily Post on 7/3/07 in which it states that you are considering capping the North Wales Police Authority budget which is above the limit set by the government. You have my full support in this matter as it is about time the overspending by the Chief Constable was brought to a halt. There are other ways to save money—’

syml—a ydych yn barod i weithredu i ddiogelu pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yn y gogledd ai peidio? Ar sail tegwch, penderfynais ei bod yn ddyletswydd arnaf fel Gweinidog i ofyn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn wneud y penderfyniad hwn.

Nid wyf yn petruso o gwbl cyn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, nac argymell y dylai unrhyw un arall ei gefnogi. Byddai peidio â gwneud hynny'n annheg i'r tri awdurdod heddlu arall sydd wedi cadw lefelau eu praesept i'r ffigur gofynnol, a byddai'n annheg i'ch cyd-aelodau ym maes llywodraeth leol, sydd wedi gwneud pob ymdrech i gadw eu treth gyngor yn 5 y cant yn is. Mae Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn yn un cyngor felly yn y gogledd ac sy'n wynebu pwysau ychwanegol eleni o ran costau gwastraff, ond sydd wedi cadw lefel ei dreth gyngor i 4.9 y cant. Fodd bynnag, bydd praesept Heddlu Gogledd Cymru bellach yn golygu y bydd dros 5 y cant. Yn anad dim, byddai pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig hwn yn annheg i bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yn y gogledd ac sydd heb bleidlais—neu o leiaf nid heddiw. Fel Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, bydd yn rhaid ichi egluro eich penderfyniad iddynt ar y strydoedd yn ystod yr wythnosau a'r misoedd nesaf.

Gorffennaf drwy gyfeirio at neges e-bost a gefais heddiw gan rywun yn Abergele. Yn ddjarwybod imi, ond yn nodweddiadol—

**Alun Cairns:** O.

**Sue Essex:** Efallai y byddwch am wrando ar hyn, Alun.

Mae hwn yn nodweddiadol o rai o'r sylwadau a gefais droeon wrth ymweld â'r gogledd yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Fe'i darllenaf ar goedd, gan fy mod yn credu bod angen ichi bob un wrando arno a'i ystyried.

Ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â'r erthygl yn y Daily Post dyddiedig 7/3/07 sy'n dweud eich bod yn ystyried capio cyllideb Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, sy'n uwch na'r terfyn a bennwyd gan y llywodraeth. Yr wyf yn eich cefnogi'n llwyr yn hyn gan ei bod yn hen bryd rhoi terfyn ar orwario'r Prif Gwnstabl. Mae yna ffyrdd eraill i arbed arian—



**Eleanor Burnham:** Oh.

**Sue Essex:** Listen, Eleanor, instead of just speaking.

‘There are other ways to save money before increasing taxes and removing Police Officers from the beat, which I regard as a publicity stunt to frighten the people of North Wales. Is there a need for a mounted Police section in North Wales, I don’t think so. Just another empire building scheme by the Chief Constable. I wish you the best of luck in obtaining this capping and perhaps it will be the beginning of much needed look into how the funding is spent.’

I say no more, Llywydd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** O.

**Sue Essex:** Gwrandewch, Eleanor, yn lle siarad.

Mae yna ffyrdd eraill i arbed arian cyn cynyddu trethi a lleihau nifer Swyddogion Rhawd yr Heddlu sydd, yn fy marn i, yn enghraifft o ddefnyddio cyhoeddusrwydd i godi ofn ar bobl yn y gogledd. Ni chredaf fod angen cangen Heddlu ar gefn geffylau yn y gogledd. Cynllun arall gan y Prif Gwnstabl ydyw i greu ei ymerodraeth ei hun. Dymuniadau gorau ichi wrth gael cymeradwyaeth i’r system gapio hon, ac efallai mai dyma fydd dechrau proses y mae dirfawr ei hangen o edrych sut y caiff yr arian ei wario.

Dyna’r cyfan, Lywydd.

*Gwelliant: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3523 as amended: to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*1. considers the principle of the Principles Determined by the National Assembly for Wales for deciding, in accordance with section 52B of the Local Government Finance Act 1992 (as amended), whether local authorities' budget requirements for 2007/08 are excessive, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 February 2007.*

*2. expresses concern that the failure of the Home Office to fund protective services, community policing and inflation in police budgets is imposing a further burden on council tax payers.*

Cynnig NDM3523 fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*1. yn ystyried Egwyddorion a bennwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er mwyn penderfynu, yn unol ag Adran 52B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992 (fel y'i diwygiwyd), a yw anghenion cyllideb awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2007/08 yn ormodol, y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau Cynulliad ar 28 Chwefror 2007.*

*2. yn mynegi pryder bod methiant y Swyddfa Gartref i ariannu gwasanaethau gwarchod, plismona cymunedol a chwyddiant yng nghyllidebau'r heddlu'n rhoi mwy o faich eto ar y sawl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amended motion: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3524): O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Motion (NDM3524): For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion defeated.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.46 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.46p.m.*

### **Cyflogaeth gan y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru Public Services Employment in Wales**

Motion (NDM3521): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the progress that is being made to achieve a more effective and co-ordinated management of public services in Wales.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.  
Delete all and replace with:

Cynnig (NDM3521): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi'r cynnydd sydd ar droed i sicrhau rheolaeth fwy effeithiol a chydlynol dros wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Dileu'r cyfan a rhoi yn ei le:

1. notes that the UK Government centralisation proposals for public sector jobs in Wales are contrary to, and therefore undermine, the Assembly's relocation strategy; and
1. yn nodi bod cynigion Llywodraeth y DU i ganoli swyddi sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn groes i strategaeth adleoli'r Cynulliad a, thrwy hynny, yn ei thanseilio; a
2. calls on the UK Government to re-consider its centralisation proposals in light of their adverse economic, social and environmental impact."
2. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y DU i ailystyried ei chynigion canoli yn wyneb eu heffaith andwyol ar yr economi, y gymdeithas a'r amgylchedd.
- Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Delete 'notes the progress that is being made' and replace with:
- Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Dileu 'yn nodi'r cynnydd sydd ar droed' ac yn lle hynny rhoi:
- calls on the Assembly Government to comprehensively implement the recommendations of the Beecham review, 'Beyond Boundaries'.*
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi argymhellion adolygiad Beecham, 'Ar Draws Ffiniau', ar waith mewn modd cynhwysfawr.*
- Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- notes the call in the Beecham review, 'Beyond Boundaries', for a mixed economy in the delivery of public services.*
- yn nodi'r galw yn adolygiad Beecham, 'Ar Draws Ffiniau', am economi gymysg wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.*
- Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- notes that more public services need to be commissioned on a regional basis.*
- yn nodi bod angen comisiynu mwy o wasanaethau cyhoeddus ar sail ranbarthol.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- Gwelliant 5 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- notes the need for more joint working between agencies delivering public services.*
- yn nodi bod angen mwy o gydweithio rhwng asiantaethau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- Gwelliant 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- deplores the job losses in HM Revenue and Customs offices in communities across Wales, which are the result of the Treasury's cost-cutting targets.*
- yn gresynu at y colli swyddi yn swyddfeydd Cyllid a Thollau EM mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru, o ganlyniad i dargedau torri costau'r Trysorlys.*
- Amendment 7 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- Gwelliant 7 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- regrets the lack of joined-up thinking and action between the UK Government and the*
- yn gresynu at y diffyg meddwl a gweithredu cydgysylltiedig rhwng Llywodraeth y DU a*

*Assembly Government in regard to the location of public sector jobs in Wales.*

Amendment 8 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*welcomes the Assembly Government's actions to spread public sector jobs throughout Wales.*

Amendment 9 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for the creation of a single independent Welsh civil service to encourage high-level skills and their retention in the public sector in Wales.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 2, 6, 7, 8 and 9 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendments 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Lisa Francis.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the progress that is being made to achieve a more effective and co-ordinated management of public services in Wales. (NDM3521)*

I know that there are many people in the public gallery who have been waiting patiently for this debate, and I thank them for their patience. I hope that they have found it an exciting afternoon.

In introducing this debate, I repeat the wording of the motion for the benefit of everyone here: notes the progress that is being made to achieve a more effective and co-ordinated management of public services in Wales. This is what the debate is essentially about. What do we need to do to get a more effective and co-ordinated management of public services in Wales, bearing in mind that people's jobs and people's services lie at the core? The criterion that we set ourselves is very important, because that is what we will use

*Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran lleoli swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.*

Gwelliant 8 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn croesawu camau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ledaenu swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru.*

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am greu gwasanaeth sifil annibynnol i Gymru i annog sgiliau lefel uchel a'u cadw yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 2, 6, 7, 8 a 9 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliannau 3, 4, a 5 yn enw Lisa Francis.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi'r cynnydd sydd ar droed i sicrhau rheolaeth fwy effeithiol a chydlynol dros wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. (NDM3521)*

Gwn fod nifer o bobl yn yr oriel gyhoeddus wedi bod yn aros yn amyneddgar am y drafodaeth hon. Diolch ichi am eich amynedd. Gobeithio ichi gael prynhawn cyffrous.

Wrth gyflwyno'r drafodaeth hon, ailadroddaf eiriad y cynnig er lles pawb sydd yma. Mae'r cynnig yn nodi'r cynnydd sydd ar droed i sicrhau rheolaeth fwy effeithiol a chydlynol dros wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Dyna yw hanfod y drafodaeth. Beth y mae angen inni ei wneud i reoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn fwy effeithiol a chydlynol, o gofio bod swyddi pobl a gwasanaethau pobl wrth wraidd y cyfan? Mae'r meini prawf a osodwn i ni ein hunain yn bwysig iawn, oherwydd dyna a ddefnyddiwn wrth ystyried y cynigion a

when we consider the proposals coming forward with regard to public sector jobs.

I think that we would all agree that the primary issue with regard to public services is the citizen who receives them. If it was not for that, we would not be here as politicians and people would not be in their jobs. It is about serving people, and that is the rationale on which we need to make our judgment. Our public service reforms in Wales have been set out in 'Making the Connections' and have been based on the premise that our public services reflect citizens' needs.

On one hand, the citizen will often value a more localised service, which offers personal interaction, convenient local access and the contribution that a locally provided service can make to the strength and cohesion of local communities. In Wales, we traditionally have valued that. On the other hand, the citizen will often place equal value on specialisation, expertise and the diverse range of services that can often only be achieved efficiently by working on a relatively large geographical scale.

This need for balance is recognised in several of the amendments tabled, namely those recommending more regional commissioning, more joined-up working, and a mixed economy. I hope that the Assembly will accept those amendments, because we certainly do. There is a second objective for our public services: a spatial objective—an objective that we distribute our public service jobs in a fair and reasonable manner. It is worth remembering how important this is to the economy in Wales. About a quarter of our economic activity lies in public services. Therefore, public services are important for the people that we serve, but they are also important as public sector jobs and they are important to the economy. Therefore, we do not underestimate how important this debate is.

4.50 p.m.

We have to ensure that this important activity is dispersed in a way that supports communities in all parts of Wales. The Wales

gyflwynir ynglŷn â swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Credaf y byddem oll yn cytuno mai'r mater sylfaenol o ran gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw'r dinesydd sy'n eu cael. Oni bai am hynny, ni fyddem yma fel gwleidyddion ac ni fyddai gan bobl swyddi. Mae a wnelo â gwasanaethu pobl, a dyna'r rhesymeg y mae angen inni seilio'n penderfyniad arni. Mae ein diwygiadau i wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac wedi eu seilio ar y cynsail bod ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn adlewyrchu anghenion dinasyddion.

Ar y naill law bydd y dinesydd yn aml yn gwerthfawrogi gwasanaeth mwy lleol, sy'n cynnig rhyngweithio personol, mynediad lleol cyfleus, a'r cyfraniad y gall gwasanaeth lleol ei wneud i gryfhau a chydlyn cymunedau lleol. Yr ydym ni yng Nghymru yn draddodiadol wedi gwerthfawrogi hynny. Ar y llaw arall, bydd y dinesydd yn aml yn rhoi'r un gwerth ar arbenigaeth, ynghyd ag arbenigedd a'r amrywiaeth eang o wasanaethau na ellir eu cyflawni'n effeithlon yn aml ond drwy weithio ar raddfa ddaearyddol gymharol fawr.

Cydnabyddir yr angen hwn am gydbwysedd yn nifer o'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd: sef y rheini sy'n argymhell mwy o gomisiynu rhanbarthol, mwy o weithio cydgysylltiedig, ac economi gymysg. Gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn derbyn y gwelliannau hynny. Yr ydym ni, yn sicr, yn eu derbyn. Mae ail amcan i'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus: amcan gofodol—amcan ein bod yn dosbarthu ein swyddi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn ffordd deg a rhesymol. Mae'n werth cofio mor bwysig yw hyn i economi Cymru. Mae tua chwarter ein gweithgarwch economaidd yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Felly, mae gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn bwysig i'r bobl a wasanaethwn, ond maent hefyd yn bwysig fel swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus, ac maent yn bwysig i'r economi. Felly, nid ydym yn tanbriso pwysigrwydd y ddadl hon.

Rhaid inni sicrhau gwasgaru'r gweithgarwch pwysig hwn mewn ffordd sy'n cefnogi cymunedau ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Nod

spatial plan has the aim of doing that via balanced development throughout Wales, and we are taking steps to achieve that. Given the objectives of our spatial plan, when services are undertaken on a regional or national basis, we take care to disperse that activity in all parts of Wales. Our location strategy is an ambitious and widely welcomed intervention by the Government to that end. The new Assembly office in Merthyr Tydfil, and the soon-to-be new offices in Llandudno and Aberystwyth, will be undertaking all-Wales functions, but doing so in dispersed locations, employing local people. The location strategy is a significant step, and having seen the improved facilities in the new offices and the difference that that has made to Merthyr Tydfil, I think that our work in opening our new offices across Wales is all-important.

Working with the workforce is an important part of how we have approached this. Throughout the development of the location strategy, we have made a great effort to sit down with the trade unions and staff who might be affected or interested in a move, to ensure that their interests are taken into account. I will come back to that—because this is a Welsh way of working—which I ask you to consider in the light of the main issues of the public sector jobs that many of the people who have come along today care about.

There are amendments, which I ask the Assembly to reject, that argue that the UK Government has a programme of centralising public services while the Assembly Government has a policy of decentralising public services. The reality, if we are honest, is that both Governments are managing the balance between centralisation and decentralisation, and we must acknowledge that Wales has been a major beneficiary of the decentralisation policy of central Government. The UK Government has been acting on the Lyons independent review of public sector relocation. This has been a major initiative to move jobs, particularly out of the south-east of England into areas that need jobs. Overall, the Lyons programme has

cynllun gofodol Cymru yw gwneud hynny drwy ddatblygiad cytbwys ledled Cymru, ac yr ydym yn cymryd camau i gyflawni hynny. O ystyried amcanion ein cynllun gofodol, pan ymgymerir â gwasanaethau ar sail ranbarthol neu genedlaethol, byddwn yn gofalu gwasgaru'r gweithgarwch hwnnw mewn amrywiol rannau o Gymru. Mae ein strategaeth lleoliad yn uchelgeisiol ac yn ymyriad gan y Llywodraeth i'r diben hwnnw sy'n cael ei groesawu. Bydd swyddfeydd newydd y Cynulliad ym Merthyr Tudful, a'r swyddfeydd newydd sydd i ddod yn Llandudno ac Aberystwyth, yn ymgymryd â swyddogaethau Cymru gyfan, ond gan wneud hynny mewn lleoliadau gwasgaredig gan gyflogi pobl leol. Mae'r strategaeth lleoliad yn gam arwyddocaol, ac ar ôl gweld y cyfleusterau gwell yn y swyddfeydd newydd a'r gwahaniaeth y mae hynny wedi ei wneud i Ferthyr Tudful, credaf fod ein gwaith o agor ein swyddfeydd newydd ledled Cymru yn hollbwysig.

Mae gweithio gyda'r gweithlu yn rhan bwysig o'r ffordd yr ydym wedi mynd ati i wneud hyn. Drwy gydol y gwaith o ddatblygu'r strategaeth lleoliad, gwnaethom ymdrech fawr i drafod gyda'r undebau llafur a'r staff y gallai'r symud effeithio arnynt, neu a allai fod â diddordeb mewn symud, er mwyn sicrhau ystyried eu buddiannau hwy. Dof yn ôl at hynny, am fod hon yn ffordd Gymreig o weithio, a gofynnaf ichi ystyried hynny yng ngoleuni prif faterion swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus y mae nifer o'r bobl a ddaeth yma heddiw yn poeni amdanynt.

Mae yna welliannau, y gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad eu gwrthod, sy'n dadlau bod gan Lywodraeth y DU raglen o ganoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond bod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad bolisi o ddatganoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Os ydym yn onest, y gwirionedd yw bod y ddwy Lywodraeth yn rheoli'r cydbwysedd rhwng canoli a datganoli; rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod bod Cymru wedi elwa'n fawr o'r polisi datganoli gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi bod yn gweithredu ar adolygiad annibynnol Lyons o symud swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae wedi bod yn fenter fawr i symud swyddi, yn enwedig allan o dde-ddwyrain Lloegr i fannau lle y mae angen swyddi. At ei gilydd, mae rhaglen Lyons wedi bod yn dda

been very good for Wales, with 2,500 civil service posts coming here. We are benefiting more than any other region of the UK. That is important because, 10 years ago we had less than our fair share of civil servants, but we now have 10 per cent more.

Some examples of public sector jobs that have come to us are the centralised services for prisons in Newport and the relocation of National Statistics there, and the Department of Trade and Industry is concentrating more of its activities in the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency in Swansea. We very much welcome the jobs coming to Wales.

However, we have considerable concerns about where it is proposed that jobs will be taken away, and we are taking this seriously. Later this year, HM Revenue and Customs will be consulting on its proposals for the reorganisation of its services. I stress the point that there have been no decisions on the future of this service and that the consultation has yet to commence. While that consultation has yet to commence, I know that people are in the process of discussing it, and we will have a full consultation programme in Wales. In the meantime, I can reassure people that the First Minister is talking to UK Government Ministers, and I know that he has a meeting planned next week.

The proposals include the centralisation of a significant number of local offices in centres in Swansea, Cardiff and Wrexham. We do not accept that that is the right approach for Wales, given its geographic and social character. We know that many smaller public offices are important to their communities, where they provide much-needed services and jobs. I pay tribute to the work that Christine Gwyther, Tamsin Dunwoody and Catherine Thomas have done in their areas in the south-west and the strong cases that they have made in this regard. The case in the north-west of Wales is just as strong, with its particular linguistic needs.

When we have the opportunity, in due course, to respond to the consultation, I

iawn i Gymru, ac mae 2,500 o swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil yn dod i Gymru. Yr ydym ni yng Nghymru yn cael mwy o fudd nag unrhyw ranbarth arall o'r DU. Mae hynny'n bwysig, oherwydd 10 mlynedd yn ôl yr oedd gennym lai na'n cyfran deg o weision sifil. Ond bellach, mae gennym 10 y cant yn fwy.

Ymhlith rhai enghreifftiau o swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus a ddaeth inni mae'r gwasanaethau carchardai canolog yng Nghasnewydd, symudwyd y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yno, ac mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn symud ei gweithgareddau fwyfwy i'r Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau yn Abertawe. Mae croeso mawr i'r swyddi i Gymru.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ddigon pryderus lle bwriedir symud swyddi oddi yma, ac yr ydym yn edrych o ddifrif ar hyn. Yn ddiweddarach eleni, bydd Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi yn ymgynghori am ei gynigion ar gyfer ad-drefnu ei wasanaethau. Pwysleisiaf na wnaed penderfyniadau ar ddyfodol y gwasanaeth hwn ac nad yw'r ymgynghori eto wedi cychwyn. Er nad yw'r ymgynghori hwnnw eto wedi cychwyn, gwn fod pobl yn ei drafod ar hyn o bryd, a bydd gennym raglen ymgynghori lawn yng Nghymru. Yn y cyfamser, gallaf sicrhau pobl fod y Prif Weinidog yn siarad â Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU. Yn wir, gwn fod ganddo gyfarfod wedi'i drefnu ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf.

Mae'r cynigion yn cynnwys canoli nifer sylweddol o swyddfeydd lleol mewn canolfannau yn Abertawe, Caerdydd a Wrecsam. Nid ydym yn derbyn mai dyna'r dull cywir i Gymru, o gofio cymeriad daearyddol a chymdeithasol y wlad. Gwyddom mor bwysig yw nifer o swyddfeydd cyhoeddus bach i'w cymunedau, lle maent yn darparu gwasanaethau a swyddi y mae eu hangen yn ddirfawr. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r gwaith a wnaeth Christine Gwyther, Tamsin Dunwoody a Catherine Thomas yn eu hardaloedd yn y de orllewin a'r achosion grymus a gyflwynwyd ganddynt. Mae'r achos yn y gogledd-orllewin lawn mor gryf, gyda'i anghenion ieithyddol penodol.

Pan gawn gyfle, maes o law, i ymateb i'r ymgynghori, awgrymaf y dylem wneud



suggest that we do so—

hynny—

**Jocelyn Davies:** Will you take an intervention?

**Jocelyn Davies:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Sue Essex:** I shall finish my opening speech, Jocelyn, and perhaps you could come back in at the end.

**Sue Essex:** Gorffennaf fy araith agoriadol, Jocelyn, ac efallai y gallech ddod yn ôl ar y diwedd.

Do the proposals support public services, do they support the spatial objectives of Wales, and do they adequately reflect the geography and linguistic requirements of Wales? These are the key questions that we must ask ourselves. Neither the Assembly Government, nor public service unions in Wales—with which I frequently talk and work—oppose change in principle.

A ydynt yn cefnogi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a ydynt yn cefnogi amcanion gofodol Cymru, ac a ydynt yn adlewyrchu gofynion daearyddol ac ieithyddol Cymru yn ddigonol? Dyna'r cwestiynau allweddol y mae'n rhaid inni eu gofyn. Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, nac undebau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru—yr wyf yn gohebu â hwy ac yn gweithio gyda hwy'n aml—yn gwrthwynebu egwyddor newid.

We know that there has to be change but we recognise that there are developing techniques for working with citizens. Outreach workers, contact centres and the internet and so on all have an increasing role. However, I do not think that the proposed number and distribution of offices will be right for Wales, for reasons of linguistics and access. A physical presence is needed in locations outside the south and north-east of Wales.

Gwyddom fod yn rhaid newid, ond cydnabyddwn fod technegau datblygol ar gael ar gyfer gweithio gyda dinasyddion. Mae gan weithwyr allgymorth, canolfannau cyswllt a'r rhyngwyd i gyd rôl gynyddol. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf y bydd nifer a dosbarthiad y swyddfeydd a gynigir a awgrymir yn iawn i Gymru, am resymau iaith a mynediad. Mae angen sicrhau presenoldeb corfforol mewn mannau y tu allan i'r de a'r gogledd-ddwyrain.

I do not agree with the proposals of HM Revenue and Customs but I recognise that they will be subject to consultation. I, the First Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government are all determined and prepared to stand up for the interests of Wales in that consultation. As the consultation has yet to take place, I do not believe that it is time to support the amendments that condemn the UK Government.

Nid wyf yn cytuno â chynigion Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi, ond cydnabyddaf y byddant yn destun ymgynghori. Yr wyf fi, y Prif Weinidog, a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn benderfynol ac yn barod i gefnogi buddiannau Cymru yn yr ymgynghori hwnnw. Gan nad yw'r ymgynghori wedi digwydd eto, ni chredaf ei bod yn bryd cefnogi'r gwelliannau sy'n condemnio Llywodraeth y DU.

In conclusion, I believe—and I say this sincerely, and I said this at the rally a few weeks ago—that the way in which we are approaching things in Wales, as a Welsh Assembly Government, is a model. We are working with the public sector workforce and the trade unions. Public Service Management Wales—

I gloi, yr wyf yn credu—a dywedaf hyn yn ddidwyll, a dywedais hyn yn y rali rai wythnosau'n ôl—fod y ffordd yr ydym yn gwneud pethau yng Nghymru, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn esiampl dda. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda gweithlu'r sector cyhoeddus a'r undebau llafur. Mae Rheoli Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you give way?

**Sue Essex:** No, let me finish this, Rhodri, as

**Sue Essex:** Na wna, gadewch imi orffen

there is going to be a long debate, I am sure.

Public Service Management Wales is an excellent example of how we are trying to do this. We are also supporting public service workers in career development and career change. The recent careers exhibition that we had with over 1,000 public sector workers coming through was a good example of how we do things differently.

I chair the public service workforce forum, which includes all the Wales public sector unions. There is no resistance to change and we are working together to get a shared understanding that change must be in the interests of citizens and must be managed with the active involvement of the workforce. I feel strongly about that. That is what we have done on the location strategy and through the public sector workers forum. We are trying to work with the workforce to see that the change that takes place is to the benefit of the workforce, and to see that training takes place and that it is centred on what the public needs. I am pleased to say that we will soon publish, with the trade unions, a partnership agreement that sets out how we do that. That is a first for Wales and, I believe, a first for the UK.

We will continue to work with the UK Government to achieve good co-ordination between devolved and non-devolved services. We certainly understand the real concerns—everyone understands them. Anyone who has had a job under threat will understand those concerns and how this matters to individuals and families. We understand how it matters to places in Wales where small offices are the community's lifeblood. The Welsh Assembly Government has demonstrated through its way of working that we will work with the workforce, not against it, and we will do our utmost to influence the UK Government to take the same approach to change.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will apply a strict three-minute time limit after those

hwn, Rhodri, oherwydd yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd trafodaeth faith arno.

Mae Rheoli Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru yn enghraifft wych o'r ffordd yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud hyn. Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi gweithwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn datblygiad cyrfa a newid gyrfa. Yr oedd yr arddangosfa gyrfaedd yn ddiweddar gyda dros 1,000 o weithwyr y sector cyhoeddus yn enghraifft dda o'r ffordd yr ydym yn gwneud pethau'n wahanol.

Yr wyf yn cadeirio fforwm gweithlu'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, sy'n cynnwys holl undebau sector cyhoeddus Cymru. Nid oes gwrthwynebiad i newid, ac yr ydym yn cydweithio i gael dealltwriaeth gyffredin ei bod yn rhaid i'r newid fod er budd dinasyddion, a bod yn rhaid ei reoli gyda chyfraniad y gweithlu. Yr wyf yn teimlo'n gryf ynghylch hynny. Dyna a wnaethom yn y strategaeth lleoliad a thrwy fforwm gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus. Yr ydym yn ceisio gweithio gyda'r gweithlu i sicrhau y bydd y newid er budd y gweithlu ac y rhoddir hyfforddiant, a hynny'n seiliedig ar angen y cyhoedd. Yr wyf yn falch dweud y byddwn yn cyhoeddi cytundeb partneriaeth gyda'r undebau llafur cyn hir i osod allan sut y byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Dyna'r tro cyntaf i hynny ddigwydd yng Nghymru, ac yn y DU hefyd, mi gredaf.

Byddwn yn parhau i weithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau gwaith cydlynol da rhwng gwasanaethau sydd wedi eu datganoli a rhai sydd heb eu datganoli. Yr ydym yn sicr yn deall y pryderon gwirioneddol—mae pawb yn eu deall. Bydd unrhyw un sydd wedi dioddef am fod ei swydd yn y fantol yn deall y pryderon hynny a sut mae hyn o bwys i unigolion a theuluoedd. Yr ydym yn deall sut mae hyn o bwys i ardaloedd yng Nghymru lle mae swyddfeydd bach yn hollbwysig i lwyddiant y gymuned. Drwy ei ffordd o weithio, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dangos y byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r gweithlu, nid yn ei erbyn, a byddwn yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i ddylanwadu ar Lywodraeth y DU i fabwysiadu'r un ymagwedd at newid.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Byddaf yn pennu terfyn amser llym o dair munud wedi i'r

proposing the amendments have spoken.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Delete all and replace with:

*1. notes that the UK Government centralisation proposals for public sector jobs in Wales are contrary to, and therefore undermine, the Assembly's relocation strategy; and*

*2. calls on the UK Government to re-consider its centralisation proposals in light of their adverse economic, social and environmental impact.*

Cytunaf gyda'r rhan fwyaf o'r sylwadau a wnaeth y Gweinidog. Byddaf yn canolbwyntio'n benodol ar fater ad-drefnu gwasanaeth Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi.

Cytunaf fod newid patrymau gwaith bob tro yn anodd ac yn boenus, ond yr hyn sy'n fy nharo i am yr argymhellion ynglŷn â'r swyddi penodol hyn yw eu bod wedi'u gwneud yn Llundain gan Gordon Brown, heb unrhyw ystyriaeth o'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru, fel pe na bai datganoli wedi digwydd erioed. Pwysleisiaf y ffaith bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymateb i'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd yn y dull traddodiadol o 'Not me, guv'. Dadl Llafur yng Nghymru, sydd fel arfer yn brolio mor wych yw'r cydweithio gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan, fwy neu lai, yw nad oes a wnelo â'r peth. Mae'r diwn wedi newid cryn dipyn ers hynny o dan bwysau oddi wrth yr undeb a'r wrthblaid, fel y gwelsom y prynhawn yma. Yr ydym yn chwilio am ymrwymiad gan y Prif Weinidog y bydd yn ymladd yn galed ar ran y gweithwyr y mae eu swyddi o dan fygythiad. Dyma'r amser i sefyll i fyny i Gordon Brown ar ran cymunedau Cymru.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r broses eisoes ar droed. Nid rhywbeth a fydd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol yw hwn; mae'r gwasanaeth wedi dirywio. Rhoddaf enghraifft o'm profiad i. Yn Nhŷ Glyn ym Mangor, yr oedd pobl yn arfer trefnu cyfweiliadau wyneb yn wyneb gyda swyddogion i setlo problemau'n ymwneud â threthi. Mae bron yn amhosibl gwneud hynny bellach.

5.00 p.m.

rheini sy'n cynnig y gwelliannau siarad.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Dileu'r cyfan a rhoi yn ei le:

*1. yn nodi bod cynigion Llywodraeth y DU i ganoli swyddi sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn groes i strategaeth adleoli'r Cynulliad a, thrwy hynny, yn ei thanseilio; a*

*2. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y DU i ailystyried ei chynigion canoli yn wyneb eu heffaith andwyol ar yr economi, y gymdeithas a'r amgylchedd.*

I agree with most of the comments made by the Minister. I will focus my comments on the issue of reorganising of Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs.

I accept that changes in working practices are always difficult and painful, but what strikes me about these recommendations on specific jobs is that they were made in London by Gordon Brown, with no consideration of the situation in Wales. It is as though devolution never happened. I stress the fact that the Assembly Government responded to what was happening in its traditional way: by saying, 'Not me, guv'. Welsh Labour, which usually boasts how superbly it works with the Westminster Government, now says, to all intents and purposes, that it has nothing to do with it. It has changed its tune quite a bit since then, following pressure from the union and the opposition, as we have seen today. We seek a commitment from the First Minister that he will fight hard on behalf of those workers whose jobs are under threat. Now is the time to stand up to Gordon Brown on behalf of Welsh communities.

However, this process is already under way. It is not something which is to happen in the future; the service has deteriorated. I will give you an example from my own experience. At Tŷ Glyn in Bangor, people used to arrange face-to-face interviews with officers to discuss problems relating to taxes, but it is nigh impossible to do that now.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae hi bron yn amhosibl gwneud hynny bellach.

Nid y cyfoethog gyda'u cyfrifyddion crand sy'n dioddef, ond y rhai sy'n cael trafferth deall ffurflenni a chymhlethdod y drefn. Dyna'r bobl sydd, ac a fydd, yn dioddef o dan yr ad-drefnu hwn.

A throi at wasanaeth lleol arall, Porthmadog yw'r brif ganolfan sy'n delio ag ymholiadau yn Gymraeg, gyda pheth o'r gwaith yn mynd i Fangor a, diau, swyddfydd eraill. Er hynny, ni welsoch chi erioed rif cyswllt y gwasanaeth Cymraeg ar unrhyw hysbyseb. Wedi cau swyddfa Porthmadog—a dyna'r bwriad—bwriedir symud y gwasanaeth hwnnw i Wrecsam neu Gaerdydd, lle mae dewis eang o swyddi yn barod, a lle mae prinder gweithwyr dwyieithog. Eisoes gwelwyd nifer staff Tŷ Moelwyn yn gostwng o 50 i 34, ac, ar hyn o bryd, ni hysbysebir am bobl i'w llanw swyddi gwag. Mae'r cau yn digwydd, ac mae'r Llywodraethau Llafur yma ac yn San Steffan sy'n gyfrifol.

Os oes un wers i'w dysgu ynglŷn â datblygu'r economi, manteisio ar unrhyw gryfder sydd gan ardal ydyw. Un o gryfderau Porthmadog, a Bangor i raddau, yw bod yno weithlu dwyieithog eisoës.

This leads me to the madness of moving jobs from towns in Objective 1 areas to centres such as Wrexham and Cardiff, and, indeed, such areas as Swansea, which generally have a much wider choice of jobs already. As we heard, the relocation strategy means that jobs have come to Newport already, as they have come, or are coming, to the DVLA and to Swansea, but not to most parts of Wales. Why spend millions moving civil service jobs to Merthyr, Aberystwyth and Llandudno and at the same time take jobs away from Porthmadog, Pontypool, Bangor and Haverford West? I have raised this point time and again—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. If there is further noise from the public gallery,

**Alun Ffred Jones:** It is nigh impossible to do that now.

It is not the rich with their fancy accountants who suffer, but those who have difficulty understanding the forms and the complexities of the system. They are the people who are suffering, and who will suffer, as a result of this reorganisation.

To turn to another local service, Porthmadog is the main centre to deal with inquires in Welsh, and some of the work goes to Bangor, and, doubtless to other offices. Despite that, the Welsh-language helpline number has never been advertised. When the Porthmadog office has been closed—and that is the intention—it is planned to move that service to Wrexham or Cardiff, where there is already a wide choice of jobs, and where there is a shortage of Welsh-speaking workers. We have already seen the number of staff at Tŷ Moelwyn drop from 50 to 34, and at the moment vacant posts are not being advertised. The closure is going to happen, and the Labour Governments here and in Westminster are responsible for that.

If there is one lesson that we have learned about developing the economy, it is to take advantage of the strengths of an area. One of the strengths of Porthmadog, and of Bangor, to a certain extent, is that it already has a bilingual workforce in place.

Mae hyn yn fy arwain at wallgofrwydd symud swyddi o ardaloedd Ardal 1 i ganolfannau megis Wrecsam a Chaerdydd, ac yn wir i ardaloedd megis Abertawe sydd, ar y cyfan, â dewis ehangach o swyddi eisoës. Fel y clywsom, mae'r strategaeth adleoli'n golygu bod swyddi eisoës wedi dod i Gasnewydd, fel y maent wedi dod, neu ar fin dod, i'r DVLA ac i Abertawe, ond nid i'r rhan fwyaf o Gymru. Pam gwario miliynau yn symud swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil i Ferthyr, Aberystwyth a Llandudno ac ar yr un pryd symud swyddi o Borthmadog, Pont-y-pŵl, Bangor a Hwlfordd? Yr wyf wedi codi'r pwynt hwn dro ar ôl tro—[*Torri ar draws*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Os bydd mwy o sŵn o'r oriel gyhoeddus, byddaf yn trefnu

I will have it cleared.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you for respecting my sensibilities. Where was I? I was going well up to then.

This Government claims credit for job creation in one part of Wales in advance of the Assembly elections, and leaves a decision on the future of the HH Revenue and Customs jobs until after those elections.

On the location of the offices, it is interesting to note that Dawn Primarolo has already halted the proposed closure of offices at Hastings in east Sussex on the grounds that the area was in receipt of regeneration grants. If that is the case in east Sussex, then it should be easy for the First Minister to persuade Mrs Primarolo of the problems facing workers who may have to commute long distances to new centres of work from towns in the west, north and the south Wales Valleys. This is a crucial test of the independence of the Welsh Government and we need to change this strategy for the benefit of all Welsh communities.

iddi gael ei chlrrio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch ichi am barchu fy nheimpladau. Ble yr oeddwn i? Yr oeddwn yn cael hwyl arni tan hynny.

Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn hawlio'r clod am greu swyddi mewn un rhan o Gymru cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad, ac yn gadael y penderfyniad ar ddyfodol swyddi Cyllid a Thollau EM tan ar ôl yr etholiadau hynny.

O ran lleoliadau'r swyddfeydd hynny, mae'n ddi-ddorol sylwi bod Dawn Primarolo eisoes wedi atal y cynnig i gau swyddfeydd yn Hastings yn nwyrain Sussex ar y sail bod yr ardal yn cael grantiau adfywio. Os felly y mae yn nwyrain Sussex, yna dylai fod yn rhwydd i Brif Weinidog Cymru ddarbwyllio Mrs Primarolo am y problemau sy'n wynebu gweithwyr a allai orfod teithio pellteroedd maith i ganolfannau gwaith newydd o drefi yn y gorllewin, y gogledd a Chymoedd y de. Mae hyn yn brawf hanfodol o annibyniaeth Llywodraeth Cymru, ac mae angen inni newid y strategaeth hon er budd holl gymunedau Cymru.

### Cynnig Gweithdrefnol Procedural Motion

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I apologise to Members, as I have not abided by Standing Orders—we should have held a vote at 5 p.m. to extend the meeting, if Assembly so wishes. To accommodate the two short debates, we will need to extend the meeting until 7 p.m.. I invite the Business Minister to propose a motion.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting until 7 p.m..*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Are there 10 Members in support of the motion? I see that there are. Therefore, I call for a vote.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ymddiheuraf i'r Aelodau, gan nad wyf wedi cadw at y Rheolau Sefydlog—dylem fod wedi cynnal pleidlais am 5 p.m. i ymestyn y cyfarfod, os yw'r Cynulliad yn dymuno hynny. Er mwyn cynnal y ddwy ddadl fer, bydd angen inni ymestyn y cyfarfod tan 7 p.m.. Gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig y cynnig.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 7 p.m..*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig? Gwelaf fod. Felly, galwaf am bleidlais.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 1, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Lloyd, Val

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cyflogaeth gan y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru: Parhad Public Services Employment in Wales: Continued**

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: Delete 'notes the progress that is being made' and replace with:

*calls on the Assembly Government to comprehensively implement the recommendations of the Beecham review, 'Beyond Boundaries'.*

I propose amendment 6. Add as new point at end of the motion:

*deplores the job losses in HM Revenue and Customs offices in communities across Wales, which are the result of the Treasury's cost-cutting targets.*

The following Member voted against:

Black, Peter

**Michael German:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: Dileu 'yn nodi'r cynnydd sydd ar droed' ac yn lle hynny rhoi:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi argymhellion adolygiad Beecham, 'Ar Draws Ffiniau', ar waith mewn modd cynhwysfawr.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at y colli swyddi yn swyddfeydd Cyllid a Thollau EM mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru, o ganlyniad i dargedau torri costau'r Trysorlys.*

I propose amendment 7. Add as new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the lack of joined-up thinking and action between the UK Government and the Assembly Government in regard to the location of public sector jobs in Wales.*

I propose amendment 8. Add as new point at end of the motion:

*welcomes the Assembly Government's actions to spread public sector jobs throughout Wales.*

I propose amendment 9. Add as new point at end of the motion:

*calls for the creation of a single independent Welsh civil service to encourage high-level skills and their retention in the public sector in Wales.*

The point that the Minister made in her speech was that we do not approve of the way in which these proposals affect the HMRC offices in Wales and the way in which those jobs are being distributed. That is precisely the point of our amendment 6. I hope that the Minister will consider it important enough that we make that point today that she supports that amendment.

The issue of whether we have jobs locally and whether we have jobs distributed out of Cardiff and the principal centres is what we are debating today. It is crucial that we have a policy for Wales that is joined up with a policy for public service jobs around Wales. It is clear that the National Assembly supports the notion of moving jobs out of Cardiff—there has been a great move in that direction, and the Assembly has supported that. However, this is a proposal that could be characterised as ‘jobs into Merthyr, jobs out of Merthyr’. As fast as the Assembly is spending money on putting good jobs into Merthyr, the Government in London seems intent on moving them back to Cardiff. We are not just talking about jobs coming from Merthyr to Cardiff, of course, but from other parts of Wales.

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at y diffyg meddwl a gweithredu cydgysylltiedig rhwng Llywodraeth y DU a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran lleoli swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn croesawu camau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ledaenu swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am greu gwasanaeth sifil annibynnol i Gymru i annog sgiliau lefel uchel a'u cadw yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.*

Y pwynt a wnaeth y Gweinidog yn ei haraith oedd nad ydym yn cymeradwyo'r modd y mae'r cynigion hyn yn effeithio ar swyddfeydd Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi yma yng Nghymru a'r ffordd y caiff y swyddi hynny eu dosbarthu. Dyna union bwynt ein gwelliant rhif 6. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried ei bod yn ddigon pwysig inni wneud y pwynt hwnnw heddiw iddi gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Mater cael swyddi'n lleol ac a ydym yn dosbarthu swyddi y tu allan i Gaerdydd a'r prif ganolfannau yw'r hyn a drafodir gennym heddiw. Mae'n hanfodol inni gael polisi yng Nghymru sy'n gysylltiedig â'r polisi ar gyfer swyddi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru. Mae'n amlwg bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cefnogi'r syniad o symud swyddi allan o Gaerdydd—cafwyd symudiad pendant i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, ac mae'r Cynulliad wedi cefnogi hynny. Fodd bynnag, gellid disgrifio'r cynnig hwn fel 'swyddi i Ferthyr, swyddi o Ferthyr'. Cyn gynted ag y mae'r Cynulliad yn gwario arian ar sicrhau swyddi da ym Merthyr, ymddengys fod y Llywodraeth yn Llundain yn benderfynol o'u symud yn ôl i Gaerdydd. Nid cyfeirio'n unig at swyddi yn symud o Ferthyr i Gaerdydd yr ydym, wrth gwrs, ond o rannau eraill o Gymru.

It is also important to recognise the economic impact that that will have on communities around Wales.

**Mick Bates:** I noted with great interest that the Minister said that everyone accepts that there has to be change and that the Government is very understanding about the local communities and the impact on these small communities, particularly in rural areas. However, in Montgomeryshire, I have seen the loss of jobs in the Department for Work and Pensions, and Government tourism jobs go from Machynlleth. I have seen the loss of the Welsh European Funding Office from Machynlleth, and we are now faced with a further 47 jobs going from the tax office in Welshpool. Does this reflect the understanding attitude that the Government talks about, or is it simply that Labour is being vindictive against areas that do not vote for it?

**Michael German:** What is true is that the London Government's agenda will impact badly on rural areas, the Objective 1 areas and the worst-hit areas of Wales; there is no doubt about that. Having two jobs in the public sector creates one in the private sector. Therefore, this will not only take money out of these areas, but lead to the loss of private sector jobs.

I will concentrate on the economic impact for a moment. If you have good and well-paid jobs in area, which was the rationale behind the Welsh Assembly Government's job relocation strategy, that drives up educational opportunity and means that people will be prepared to stay in an area, which helps to revitalise that area. That is why we supported the Welsh Assembly Government's proposal to migrate jobs out of Cardiff, because it creates a more stable economy in the parts of Wales that need it most—our rural and most deprived areas. However, what we have now is the London Government is saying, 'You can do what you like in Wales, but we are going to move in the opposite direction'.

Let us look at that direction; I will take the

Mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod yr effaith economaidd a gaiff hyn ar gymunedau ledled Cymru.

**Mick Bates:** Sylwais gyda chryn ddiddordeb fod y Gweinidog wedi dweud bod pawb yn disgwyl bod angen newid a bod y Llywodraeth yn gydymdeimladol iawn am y cymunedau lleol a'r effaith ar y cymunedau bach hyn, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, yn sir Drefaldwyn yr wyf wedi gweld swyddi'n cael eu colli o'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a swyddi twristiaeth y Llywodraeth o Fachynlleth. Yr wyf wedi gweld colli Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru o Fachynlleth, a bellach yr ydym yn wynebu colli 47 o swyddi eraill o'r swyddfa dreth yn y Trallwng. A yw hyn yn adlewyrchiad o'r agwedd gydymdeimladol y cyfeiria'r Llywodraeth ati, ynteu a yw'r Blaid Lafur yn dial ar ardaloedd nad ydynt yn pleidleisio drosti?

**Michael German:** Y gwirionedd yw y bydd agenda Llywodraeth Llundain yn effeithio'n ddybryd ar ardaloedd gwledig, ardaloedd Amcan 1 a'r ardaloedd yng Nghymru sydd wedi dioddef fwyaf; nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Mae cael dwy swydd yn y sector cyhoeddus yn creu un swydd yn y sector preifat. Felly, yn ogystal â mynd ag arian o'r ardaloedd hynny, bydd hefyd yn arwain at golli swyddi yn y sector preifat.

Byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar yr effaith economaidd am funud. Os oes gennych ardal gyda swyddi da sydd hefyd yn talu'n dda, sef y rhesymeg dros y strategaeth adleoli swyddi gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mae hynny'n hwb i gyfle addysgol ac yn golygu y bydd pobl yn fodlon aros mewn ardal, gan helpu adfywio'r ardal honno. Dyna pam yr oeddem yn cefnogi cynnig Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i symud swyddi allan o Gaerdydd, am ei fod yn creu economi fwy sefydlog yn y rhannau o Gymru lle mae'r angen fwyaf—ein hardaloedd gwledig a mwyaf difreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn awr yw bod Llywodraeth Llundain yn dweud, 'Gallwch wneud fel y mynnoch yng Nghymru, ond yr ydym ni am fynd i'r cyfeiriad arall'.

Gadewch inni edrych ar y cyfeiriad hwnnw;



example of the HM Revenue and Customs office in Pontypool. That office is in a modern building, and it is there to provide a local service to customers across the Heads of the Valleys area. That service is crucial to businesses in the area. When I visited the office at the beginning of March, I saw that people come in to use it regularly. Not only will closing the office mean that you will deprive those people of a local service, but it also means that you are expecting the staff there to consider moving from there to work in Cardiff.

To mention the green agenda, I do not know whether many people here have driven from Pontypool to Llanishen in the morning. From what I have observed, there are very few parking spaces at the office in Llanishen. It is so difficult to park there that unless you get there by 8 a.m. in the morning, you will not find a space. These people will have to commute, using the already congested M4. We heard today that the Minister is not thinking of improving the M4 until 2010 at the earliest, so this will increase the congestion into north Cardiff, and there are already sufficient pressures there, as the Minister knows.

Turning to the public transport system, making all the bus connections and then walking the final distance to the Llanishen office is an issue in itself.

In conclusion, is the Minister prepared—

**Jocelyn Davies:** Will you take an intervention?

**Michael German:** I would love to, but I am told that I do not have time. Is the Minister prepared, given her statement earlier this afternoon, to say that she does not believe that the Government's proposals for the HMRC offices are right, and will she now support amendment 6, which puts on record the view of this National Assembly?

5.10 p.m.

**David Melding:** I propose the following

yr wyf am ddefnyddio swyddfa Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi ym Mhont-y-pŵl fel enghraifft. Mae'r swyddfa honno mewn adeilad modern, a'i diben yw cynnig gwasanaeth lleol i gwsmeriaid ar draws Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae'r gwasanaeth hwnnw'n hanfodol i fusnesau yn yr ardal. Pan ymwelais â'r swyddfa ddechrau mis Mawrth, gwelais fod pobl yn dod i mewn yn rheolaidd i'w defnyddio. Bydd cau'r swyddfa nid yn unig yn golygu eich bod yn amddifadu'r bobl hyn o wasanaeth lleol, ond mae hefyd yn golygu eich bod yn disgwyl i'r staff yno ystyried symud oddi yno i weithio yng Nghaerdydd.

A sôn am yr agenda werdd, ni wn a oes llawer o bobl yma wedi gyrru o Bont-y-pŵl i Lanisien yn y bore. O'r hyn a welais i, ychydig iawn o leoedd parcio sydd yn y swyddfa yn Lanisien. Mae mor anodd parcio yno, oni chyrhaedddech erbyn 8 a.m., ni fydd lle ichi. Bydd angen i'r bobl hyn gymudo, gan ddefnyddio'r M4, sydd eisoes yn rhy brysur. Clywsom heddiw nad yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried gwella'r M4 tan 2010 o leiaf, felly, bydd hyn yn cynyddu'r tagfeydd i ogledd Caerdydd, ac mae digon o bwysau yno eisoes, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog.

I droi at y system cludiant cyhoeddus, mae gwneud yr holl gysylltiadau bws ac yna cerdded y cam olaf i Lanisien yn ystyriaeth ynddi'i hun.

I gloi, a yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon—

**Jocelyn Davies:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Michael German:** Byddwn wrth fy modd, ond deallaf nad oes gennyf amser. A yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon dweud, o gofio'i datganiad yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, nad yw'n credu bod cynigion y Llywodraeth ar gyfer swyddfeydd Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi yn briodol, ac y bydd bellach yn cefnogi gwelliant 6, sy'n cofnodi barn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn?

**David Melding:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau

amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 3. Add as new point at end of the motion:

*notes the call in the Beecham review, 'Beyond Boundaries', for a mixed economy in the delivery of public services.*

I propose amendment 4. Add as new point at end of the motion:

*notes that more public services need to be commissioned on a regional basis.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as new point at end of the motion:

*notes the need for more joint working between agencies delivering public services.*

I found the Minister's opening speech quite reassuring with regard to Welsh Assembly Government policy, but there are wider issues that I will return to towards the end of my speech. However, I was pleased to hear that the Minister will support the Conservative Party's amendments.

I will start by looking at what this debate is about, which is the more effective delivery of public services and their management. The Beecham review offers us many good indications of the direction in which we should travel, and it is important that we get maximum value for the Welsh pound. The public sector is vital to our economy—I am not one to talk it down, it is very important—and all Western societies with flourishing economies have excellent public sectors. However, the concept of a more mixed economy in the delivery of public services is valuable, and, incidentally, it can work both ways: it means that the public sector can take advantage, sometimes, of opportunities in the private sector. Certainly there should be more movement in people's careers between the private and public sectors, and the voluntary and independent sectors should also not be overlooked.

We are far too rigid; there is sometimes something of a Berlin wall, frankly, between

canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi'r galw yn adolygiad Beecham, 'Ar Draws Ffiniau', am economi gymysg wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.*

Cynigiad welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi bod angen comisiynu mwy o wasanaethau cyhoeddus ar sail ranbarthol.*

Cynigiad welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi bod angen mwy o gydweithio rhwng asiantaethau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.*

Yr oedd araith agoriadol y Gweinidog yn eithaf calonogol yn fy marn i, o ran polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond cyfyd materion ehangach y byddaf yn dychwelyd atynt tua diwedd fy araith. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn yn falch clywed y bydd y Gweinidog yn cefnogi gwelliannau'r Blaid Geidwadol.

Dechreuaf drwy edrych ar yr hyn y mae'r ddadl hon yn ei gwmpasu, sef darparu a rheoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae adolygiad Beecham yn cynnig llawer dangosydd da inni o ran y cyfeiriad y dylem fynd, ac mae'n bwysig inni gael y gwerth gorau am arian Cymru. Mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn hanfodol i'n heconomi—nid wyf yn un i'w ddilorni, mae'n bwysig iawn—ac mae gan bob cymdeithas yn y byd gorllewinol sydd ag economïau ffyniannus sectorau cyhoeddus ardderchog. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cysyniad o economi fwy cymysg wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn werthfawr, a hefyd gall weithio'r ddwy ffordd: mae'n golygu y gall y sector cyhoeddus, weithiau, fanteisio ar gyfleoedd yn y sector cyhoeddus. Yn bendant, dylid cael mwy o symud yng ngyrfaedd pobl rhwng y sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus, ac ni ddylid diystyru'r sector gwirfoddol na'r sector annibynnol ychwaith.

Yr ydym lawer yn rhy gaeth; y gwir yw bod rhywbeth sy'n ymdebygu i wal Berlin,

the public and the private sector, as if they were two massively distinct parts of the economy that never intermingle or inspire each other to greater efficiencies and more modern ways of working. Jeremy Beecham was courageous and right in emphasising the need for a more mixed economy in the delivery of public services. It is quite clear that many services need to be delivered on a regional basis; many services are delivered by local government, and while local government is starting to take up this agenda, it still needs further encouragement. We must remember that there are some barriers, for example, in the greater flexibility in working arrangements, and the accountability of senior staff—for example, if there is a lead commissioner, which authority is that person responsible to? There are issues about scrutiny and effectiveness when public services are shared or pooled and delivered by more than one agency. However, it is vital, if we are to have the most efficient public services possible, that we overcome these problems. It is the same with joint working, which may take place in a single locality but involve different agencies—the classic example is the national health service and local authorities, particularly with regard to the delivery of care. In terms of having flexible services and employment practices, and the use of budgets and so on, these things are important.

Finally, I have a few words on the concept of using public service spend to meet wider economic and social goals. This is a classic policy, which was perhaps first introduced with great vigour in the 1930s, but it remains an important way of looking at public service expenditure. It is not good enough to give all citizens an entitlement to access public services; their communities also need to benefit from the jobs that are implicit in the delivery of those services. We must take great care to ensure that we do not go in one direction, which we welcome, while the UK Government pursues a centralised agenda. We may need to examine using local government as a hub for all public services, including those that answer to Westminster, in the development and shaping of public services in the future. The Minister, in

weithiau, rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, fel pe baent yn ddwy ran hollol wahanol o'r economi nad ydynt byth yn ymwneud â'i gilydd nac yn ysgogi ei gilydd i well effeithlonrwydd a dulliau gweithio mwy modern. Yr oedd Jeremy Beecham yn ddewr ac yn gywir pan bwysleisiodd bod angen economi fwy cymysg wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'n amlwg bod angen darparu nifer o wasanaethau'n rhanbarthol; caiff nifer o wasanaethau eu darparu gan lywodraeth leol, ac er bod llywodraeth leol yn dechrau ystyried yr agenda hon, mae angen annog hyn ymhellach. Rhaid inni gofio bod yna rai rhwystrau, er enghraifft, trefniadau gweithio mwy hyblyg, ac atebolrwydd staff uwch—er enghraifft, os oes comisiynydd arweiniol, i ba awdurdod y mae'r person hwnnw neu honno'n atebol? Cyfyd materion hefyd yn ymwneud â chraffu ac effeithiolrwydd, pan gaiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eu rhannu neu eu cyfuno a'u darparu gan fwy nag un asiantaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hanfodol, os ydym am sicrhau'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mwyaf effeithlon posibl, inni ddatrys y problemau hyn. Mae hyn yn wir hefyd am gydweithio, a allai ddigwydd mewn un lleoliad, ond sy'n cynnwys asiantaethau gwahanol—a'r enghraifft glasurol yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac awdurdodau lleol, yn arbennig o ran darparu gofal. O ran cael gwasanaethau hyblyg ac arferion cyflogi, a defnyddio cyllidebau ac ati, mae'r pethau hyn yn bwysig.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddweud ychydig am y cysyniad o ddefnyddio gwariant gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i gyflawni amcanion economaidd a chymdeithasol ehangach. Mae hyn yn hen bolisi, a gyflwynwyd yn gyntaf efallai gyda llawer o egni yn y 1930au, ond mae'n dal yn ffordd bwysig o edrych ar wariant gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid yw'n ddigon da rhoi hawl i bob dinesydd asllu cael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus; mae angen i'w cymunedau hefyd gael budd o'r swyddi sy'n rhan o ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny. Rhaid inni ochel rhag mynd i un cyfeiriad, sy'n cael ei groesawu gennym ni, tra mae Llywodraeth y DU yn dilyn agenda ganolog. Efallai y bydd angen inni archwilio posibilrwydd defnyddio llywodraeth leol fel canolbwynt i bob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys y rheini

fairness, is aware of the penultimate point that I will make, which is that if we are moving jobs to Merthyr, we want more local people to have those jobs. Not all of the jobs will be available to local people, obviously, because, certainly initially, we will be moving some existing personnel to work in the new location, but over time one would hope that more recruitment would occur locally. I think that that is a worthy objective, and we need to be aware of it.

Finally, I will say something more positive about the UK Government, and that is in relation to the defence academy at RAF St Athan. It is an excellent example of a mixed-economy model because it involves the private sector, and all levels of the public sector and Government, as well as, I am pleased to say, all political parties here in the Assembly. We should remember that we are seeing more gains in terms defence industry jobs, for example, coming into Wales. We need to pursue that, because, in the past, we have not always had our fair share of the cake.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have over a dozen speakers who will have three minutes each to speak, with an extra minute for any interventions. Everyone should have an opportunity to speak, if all goes well. We have to start the first short debate at around 6 p.m. and I have an absolute priority to start the second short debate by 6.30 p.m..

**Rosemary Butler:** I had not expected to be called so early. However, I speak on behalf of the workers in Newport, who, at present, work in the middle of the city, where there are good public transport links. There is a train station and a bus station within a five-minute walk, local buses stop outside the building and many of the workers walk to work. There are also good car parking facilities and on-street car parking. If these workers are moved to Llanishen, as is proposed, none of this will be the case. It will be extremely difficult for them to get to Llanishen, and, as has already been said, it will have implications for the environment, with even more traffic on the M4.

sy'n atebol i San Steffan, wrth ddatblygu a llunio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol. Mae'r Gweinidog, a bod yn deg, yn ymwybodol o'm pwynt olaf ond un, sef os ydym yn symud swyddi i Ferthyr, ein bod am i fwy o bobl leol gael y swyddi hynny. Ni fydd yr holl swyddi ar gael i bobl leol, yn amlwg, oherwydd i ddechrau yn sicr byddwn yn symud rhai pobl i weithio yn y lleoliad newydd. Ond ymhen amser y gobaith yw y byddai mwy'n cael eu recriwtio'n lleol. Teimlaf fod hynny'n amcan teilwng, a rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol ohono.

Yn olaf, dywedaf rywbeth mwy cadarnhaol am Lywodraeth y DU, a hynny mewn cysylltiad â'r academi amddiffyn yn RAF Sain Tathan. Mae'n enghraifft wych o fodel o economi gymysg, gan ei bod yn cynnwys y sector preifat, a phob lefel yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r Llywodraeth, yn ogystal â phob plaid yma yn y Cynulliad, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud. Rhaid inni gofio ein bod yn gweld mwy o fudd o ran swyddi wrth i'r diwydiant amddiffyn, er enghraifft, ddod i Gymru. Mae angen inni fynd ar drywydd hynny, oherwydd yn y gorffennol nid ydym bob amser wedi cael cyfran deg o'r swyddi.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennyf dros ddwsin o siaradwyr a fydd yn cael tair munud yr un i siarad, gyda munud ychwanegol ar gyfer unrhyw ymyriadau. Dylai pawb gael cyfle i siarad, os aiff popeth yn iawn Rhaid inni ddechrau'r ddadl fer gyntaf tua 6 p.m. ac mae gennyf flaenoriaeth bendant i ddechrau'r ail ddadl fer erbyn 6.30p.m..

**Rosemary Butler:** Nid oeddwn wedi disgwyl cael fy ngalw mor gynnar. Fodd bynnag, siaradaf ar ran y gweithwyr yng Nghasnewydd sydd, ar hyn o bryd, yn gweithio yng nghanol y ddinas, lle mae cysylltiadau cludiant cyhoeddus da. Mae gorsaf drenau a gorsaf fysiau o fewn pum munud o gerdded, mae bysiau lleol yn aros y tu allan i'r adeilad, ac mae nifer o'r gweithwyr yn cerdded i'r gwaith. Mae cyfleusterau da ar gyfer parcio ceir a lleoedd parcio ceir ar y stryd hefyd. Os caiff y gweithwyr hyn eu symud i Lanisien, fel y cynigir, ni fydd hyn yn wir. Bydd yn anodd dros ben iddynt gyrraedd Lanisien, ac fel y dywedwyd eisoes, bydd goblygiadau i'r amgylchedd gyda mwy fyth o draffig ar yr

M4.

The people of Newport are used to having a tax office in the middle of the city, and it is much appreciated. As was said earlier, the people who use it are not the people who can afford accountants; it is used for advice by the average Joe in the street. The office is much appreciated, particularly by the local ethnic communities; the Cardiff office is not used as much by ethnic communities, although those communities are bigger in Cardiff. The reason for that is that the Newport office is accessible, as it is right in the middle of the city.

As has already been said, hundreds—possibly thousands—of public service jobs are coming to Newport, to the Office for National Statistics, the Patent Office, and the Prison Service, and there is also the possibility of a campus of government jobs being created in Newport. It seems rather perverse that, on one hand, we have jobs coming out of London into Newport, and on the other hand jobs are leaving Newport and going elsewhere. Therefore, I am pleased that the Minister has said that the First Minister is making strong recommendations to the Government. It is important that we have a whole range of jobs within all of our cities.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I know that the Newport and Pontypool offices offer an excellent service locally to their clients, but are you aware that a significant number of workers in both those offices have been transferred there from Llanishen due to medical reasons or because of caring responsibilities? How are those people supposed to cope with moving back to Llanishen?

**Rosemary Butler:** That is a good point, Jocelyn; a number of part-time workers there have caring responsibilities. However, we need a mixed economy. We need all sorts of job opportunities in Newport so that young people in school, particularly from ethnic minorities, can see that there are good, well-paid jobs available in the middle of Newport. I support the First Minister in his discussions with the Westminster Government and I hope that he makes the strongest possible case to

Mae pobl Casnewydd wedi arfer â chael swyddfa dreth yng nghanol y ddinas, a chaiff ei gwerthfawrogi'n fawr. Fel y dywedwyd yn gynharach, nid y bobl sy'n gallu fforddio cyfrifyddion yw'r bobl sy'n ei defnyddio; fe'i defnyddir gan bobl gyffredin i gael cyngor. Gwerthfawrogir y swyddfa'n fawr, yn arbennig gan y cymunedau ethnig lleol; ni ddefnyddir swyddfa Caerdydd gymaint gan gymunedau ethnig er bod y cymunedau hynny'n fwy yng Nghaerdydd. Y rheswm dros hynny yw bod swyddfa Casnewydd yn gyfleus, gan ei bod yng nghanol y ddinas.

Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae cannoedd—miloedd o bosibl—o swyddi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn dod i Gasnewydd, i'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, y Swyddfa Batent a'r Gwasanaeth Carchardai, ac mae posibilrwydd hefyd creu campws o swyddi'r llywodraeth yng Nghasnewydd. Ymddengys braidd yn wrthnysig, ar y naill law, fod gennym swyddi'n gadael Llundain i ddod i Gasnewydd, ac ar y llaw arall fod gennym swyddi'n gadael Casnewydd i fynd i leoedd eraill. Felly, yr wyf yn falch i'r Gweinidog ddweud bod y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud argymhellion cryf i'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n bwysig inni gael ystod gyfan o swyddi yn ein holl ddinasoedd.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Gwn fod swyddfeydd Casnewydd a Phont-y-pŵl yn cynnig gwasanaeth gwych yn lleol i'w cleientiaid, ond a ydych yn ymwybodol bod nifer sylweddol o weithwyr yn y ddwy swyddfa hynny wedi eu trosglwyddo yno o Lanisien am resymau meddygol neu oherwydd dyletswyddau gofalu? Sut y mae'r bobl hynny i fod i ymdopi â symud yn ôl i Lanisien?

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae hynny'n bwynt da, Jocelyn; mae gan nifer o weithwyr rhan-amser yno ddyletswyddau gofalu. Fodd bynnag, mae angen economi gymysg arnom. Mae angen pob math o gyfleoedd gwaith yng Nghasnewydd fel y gall pobl ifanc yn yr ysgol, yn arbennig y rheini o leiafrifoedd ethnig, weld bod swyddi da gyda chyflog da ar gael yng nghanol Casnewydd. Cefnogaf y Prif Weinidog yn ei drafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan, a gobeithio y bydd

ensure that jobs stay where they are, particularly in Newport.

**Elin Jones:** Wrth feddwl am y ddatl hon a thoriadau Gordon Brown o safbwynt gweithwyr cyhoeddus, ni allaf ond meddwl am y rhaglen gomedi, *Yes, Minister*. Yr wyf bron yn gallu gweld Syr Humphrey yn mynd i banig llwyr o glywed y Canghellor yn cyhoeddi'n ddirybudd ei fod am dorri 100,000 o swyddi gweision sifil. Yn ei banig, mae Syr Humphrey yn pryderu am swyddi yn Whitehall ac yn edrych ar fap i weld lle mae'r holl swyddfeydd bach lle mae gweithwyr sector cyhoeddus yn gweithio ar hyd a lled Cymru. Bron fy mod yn gallu gweld y wên ar wyneb Syr Humphrey wrth iddo weld lle bydd y fwyell yn cwmpo.

Dyna yr ydym wedi'i weld: y fwyell swyddi yn cwmpo a thoriadau mewn lleoedd fel Porthmadog a Phont-y-pŵl yn hytrach nag yn y canol. Yr ardaloedd tlotaf yng ngwledydd Prydain sy'n wynebu'r toriadau mwyaf, yn gymharol, o doriadau Gordon Brown. Mae'r fwyell wedi cwmpo yn Aberystwyth, ar swyddfa'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, yn gyntaf, ac yn awr mae perygl i'r Swyddfa Dreth yn Aberystwyth. Yr wyf yn siarad ar ran gweithwyr yn y ddwy swyddfa honno, gan eu bod yn darparu gwasanaeth gwerthfawr i unigolion a busnesau yn y dref a'r ardal. Mae'r un peth yn wir am swyddfa'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau. Mae tynnu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw o Aberystwyth yn golygu y bydd y bobl fwyaf anghenus yn colli'r gwasanaeth a fu mor werthfawr iddynt.

5.20 p.m.

Mae colli'r swyddfeydd a'r swyddi hyn yn golled i'r economi leol, fel y dywedodd pawb eisoes. Yn Aberystwyth, yr ydym wedi croesawu'n fawr gyhoeddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei bod am adeiladu swyddfa newydd yn y dref ar gyfer dros 500 o staff, gyda dros 100 ohonynt yn staff a fyddai'n adleoli o Gaerdydd. Yr oedd hynny'n mynd i fod yn gyfraniad pwysig i'r economi leol. Fodd bynnag, realiti'r sefyllfa, erbyn hyn, yw bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn creu dros 100 o swyddi cyhoeddus yn Aberystwyth tra bo Llywodraeth San Steffan yn torri'r un nifer o swyddi cyhoeddus yn y

yn cyflwyno'r achos cryfaf posibl er mwyn sicrhau bod swyddi'n aros lle y maent, yn arbennig yng Nghasnewydd.

**Elin Jones:** In thinking about this debate and Gordon Brown's cuts in public service workers, I cannot help but think of the comedy programme, *Yes, Minister*. I can almost see Sir Humphrey going into complete panic when he hears that the Chancellor is going to announce, without warning, his plan to cut 100,000 jobs in the civil service. Sir Humphrey is worried about jobs in Whitehall and, in his panic, he takes out a map of all the small offices where public sector workers work throughout Wales. I can almost see the smile on Sir Humphrey's face as he sees where the axe will fall.

That is what we have seen: the axe falling on places such as Porthmadog and Pontypool, rather than on the centre. It is the poorest areas of the countries of Britain that are facing, comparatively speaking, the greatest of Gordon Brown's cuts. The axe has fallen on Aberystwyth, firstly on the Department for Work and Pensions office, and now the tax office in Aberystwyth is under threat. I speak on behalf of the workers in both those offices, as they provide a valuable service to individuals and businesses in the town and surrounding area. The same is true of the Department for Work and Pensions office. Withdrawing that service from Aberystwyth means that the most needy will lose a service which was so valuable to them.

The loss of these offices and jobs is a loss to the local economy, as everyone has said. In Aberystwyth, we had very much welcomed the Welsh Assembly Government's announcement to build a new office in the town for over 500 staff, with 100 of those jobs being relocated from Cardiff. That was going to be an important contribution to the local economy. However, the reality of the situation now is that the Assembly Government will increase the number of public service jobs in the town by about 100, while the Westminster Government will cut the same number of public service jobs in the

dref. Sawl gwaith mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi brolio pa mor bwysig yw cael Llywodraeth o'r un lliw ar y ddwy ochr yr Hafren er mwyn sicrhau cydweithio? Gwrthweithio, nid cydweithio, sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Mae cynnig y Llywodraeth heddiw, yn dweud bod angen rheolaeth fwy effeithiol a chydlynol o wasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn hollol groes i realiti beth sy'n digwydd yn Aberystwyth. Credaf—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You are out of time.

**Lynne Neagle:** I am a little disturbed by the shape of today's debate for many reasons. First, we are discussing issues on which we will not be the ones making decisions. So, let us be open and honest about that and let us be clear about our role here. Of course, we can press for the right decisions for our constituents, but it is neither helpful nor mature to use a serious issue like the restructuring of the civil service to score political points. I notice that no-one is arguing for the status quo in the civil service.

Secondly, the nature of contributions from the opposition parties assumes a great deal. Thanks to this Government, workers in all sectors are afforded a consultation period on significant changes in their working practice. The Tories oppose that and would do away with it if they ever got back into Government. In my dealings with the UK Government alongside the local MP, Paul Murphy, it has been made clear that decisions about the HMRC have not yet been made. The consultation period matters and representation can have an effect. That is why those on the Labour benches will not support many of the opposition amendments today. As Assembly Members, we will continue to make the case for a sensible solution to restructuring in Wales rather than use difficult negotiations for political advantage.

I make no secret of my support for workers in

town. How many times has the Assembly Government boasted about the importance of having a Government of the same colour on both sides of the Severn to ensure collaboration? It is the opposite of collaboration which is happening at the moment.

The Government motion today says we need more effective and cohesive management of public services, which is completely contrary to the reality of what is happening in Aberystwyth. I believe—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser wedi dod i ben.

**Lynne Neagle:** Yr wyf yn pryderu fymryn am ffurf y ddadl heddiw am lawer rheswm. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn trafod materion na fyddwn yn gwneud penderfyniadau arnynt. Felly, gadewch inni fod yn agored ac yn onest ynglŷn â hynny, a gadewch inni fod yn glir ynghylch ein rôl yma. Wrth gwrs, gallwn bwysio am y penderfyniadau cywir ar ran ein hetholwyr, ond nid yw'n ddefnyddiol nac yn aeddfed defnyddio mater difrifol megis ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth sifil i ennill pwyntiau gwleidyddol. Sylwaf nad oes neb yn dadlau o blaid y drefn bresennol yn y gwasanaeth sifil.

Yn ail, mae natur y cyfraniadau gan y gwrthbleidiau yn tybio llawer iawn. Diolch i'r Llywodraeth hon, rhoddir cyfnod ymgynghori i weithwyr ym mhob sector am newidiadau sylweddol yn eu harferion gwaith. Mae'r Torïaid yn gwrthwynebu hynny a byddent yn cael gwared ohono pe byddent mewn grym eto. Yn ystod fy nhrafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU ar y cyd â'r AS lleol, Paul Murphy, yr oedd yn glir na wnaed penderfyniadau ynglŷn â Chyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi eto. Mae'r cyfnod ymgynghori'n bwysig a gall cynrychiolaeth gael effaith. Dyna pam na fydd y rhai ar y meinciau Llafur yn cefnogi nifer o welliannau'r gwrthbleidiau heddiw. Fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, byddwn yn parhau i bledio achos dros ateb synhwyrol i ailstrwythuro yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na defnyddio trafodaethau anodd er budd gwleidyddol.

Mae fy nghefnogaeth i weithwyr yn swyddfa

the Pontypool HMRC office, which gives quality employment to local people in an Objective 1 area. I backed their claim regarding the validity of that office, which has the capacity to take in another 100 employees in the future. Those workers are right to say that, for many of them, relocation to Cardiff would equal redundancy due to travel times and their responsibilities as parents and carers. I also back their assertion that, in this age of IT and connectivity, centralisation is not always the right answer. Let us be clear: Labour policy in Wales, which is suddenly finding support from the opposition benches, is to boost employment in our most disadvantaged areas. We have made a success of that—we have record employment levels in Wales; civil service jobs have come to Wales from London and Assembly jobs are moving out of Cardiff.

Commenting on reorganisation, Nick Ainger, the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Wales, said that it was work in progress and that no decisions had been made on any particular office. Let us then work responsibly with our partners in Westminster, make the case for those offices with a viable future, like Pontypool, and find the right Welsh solution for this UK issue.

**William Graham:** The Welsh Conservatives have welcomed previous announcements of employment relocated from London to Wales, recognising that advances in communication and information systems no longer require staff to be located in one central office. They can be quite efficiently employed in offices sited throughout the UK, and more significantly throughout Wales.

I am sure that the Minister is aware of the escalating costs of the contract for the HMRC IT system, and I hope that she shares my alarm at the Public Accounts Committee report that indicates that those costs have soared from £4.5 billion to £8 billion.

The Inland Revenue developed and promoted

Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi ym Mhont-y-pŵl, sy'n cynnig cyflogaeth o safon i bobl leol mewn ardal Amcan 1, yn amlwg. Cefnogais eu honiad am ddilysrwydd y swyddfa honno, a all dderbyn 100 o gyflogeion eraill yn y dyfodol. Mae'r gweithwyr hynny'n gywir i ddweud y byddai adleoli i Gaerdydd, i nifer ohonynt, yn gyfystyr â dileu swydd oherwydd amseroedd teithio a'u dyletswyddau fel rhieni a gofalwyr. Cefnogaf hefyd eu honiad, yn yr oes hon o TG a chysylltedd, nad canoli yw'r ateb cywir bob amser. Gadewch inni fod yn glir: polisi Llafur yng Nghymru, sy'n cael cefnogaeth yn sydyn gan feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau, yw hybu cyflogaeth yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo yn hyn—mae gennym y lefelau cyflogaeth uchaf erioed yng Nghymru, mae swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil wedi dod i Gymru o Lundain ac mae swyddi'r Cynulliad yn symud allan o Gaerdydd.

Wrth roi sylwadau ar ad-drefnu, dywedodd Nick Ainger, Is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Seneddol Cymru, mai gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen ydoedd ac nad oedd penderfyniadau wedi eu gwneud am unrhyw swyddfa benodol. Felly, gadewch inni weithio'n gyfrifol gyda'n partneriaid yn San Steffan, cefnogi achos y swyddfeydd hynny sydd â dyfodol dichonadwy, megis Pont-y-pŵl, a dod o hyd i'r ateb cywir i Gymru yn y mater hwn sy'n ymwneud â'r DU gyfan.

**William Graham:** Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi croesawu'r cyhoeddiadau blaenorol am adleoli cyflogaeth o Lundain i Gymru, gan gydnabod bod datblygiadau mewn systemau cyfathrebu a gwybodaeth yn golygu nad yw'n ofynnol i staff gael eu symud i un swyddfa ganolog mwyach. Gellir eu cyflogi'n ddigon effeithiol mewn swyddfeydd ledled y DU, ac yn fwy arwyddocaol, ledled Cymru.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o gostau cynyddol y contract ar gyfer system TG Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi, a gobeithio i bod hi, fel finnau, yn arswydo o weld bod adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn dweud bod y costau hynny wedi chwyddo o £4.5 biliwn i £8 biliwn.

Datblygodd Cyllid y Wlad system a oedd yn



a system that moved away from local office database to a south-east Wales area database accessible to staff in all relevant area offices.

Furthermore, will the Minister confirm that the HMRC estate is much greater than is needed, draining a further £100 million from service provision? I hope that the Minister will be able to give an absolute assurance that the centralisation programme in the HMRC service in Wales does not arise as a result of the increasing cost of the IT contract and that staff are not being penalised for poor management performance. I also hope that the Minister clearly demonstrates a condemnation of the Westminster Government's failure to efficiently monitor the spending of public money.

As the Minister said, personal interaction at local office level is the desired effect. We promote this Assembly by referring to our family friendly and environmentally friendly attributes, but the proposed centralisation of HMCR staff from Pontypool to Llanishen, for example, goes against the very ideals that we seek to promote. Working mothers, carers and part-time staff who currently work at the local office have working patterns that fit in with school runs or care responsibilities. They work locally because of family commitments. If they are required to move to Llanishen, those working arrangements would cease, and, because of additional travel, together with unpredictable travel times, their only option would be to resign. That would be a major disadvantage, not only because they are dedicated staff, but also because of the cost of retraining and the delay involved in doing that.

If staff are required to relocate from Pontypool, and from other areas in south-east Wales, to Llanishen, it will result in increased carbon emissions as they travel along already heavily congested roads, which are potentially earmarked for congestion charges. Arriving at Llanishen, as previously said, they are unlikely to find a parking space in

newid o gronfa ddata swyddfa leol i gronfa ddata ardal yn y de-ddwyrain a oedd yn hwylus i staff ym mhob swyddfa ardal berthnasol, a hyrwyddwyd y system honno ganddi.

Yn ogystal, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau bod ystâd Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi lawer yn fwy na'r angen, gan dynnu £100 miliwn pellach o ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau? Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu rhoi sicrwydd llwyr na fydd rhaglen ganoli gwasanaeth Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi yng Nghymru yn codi o ganlyniad i gost gynyddol y contract TG, ac na chaiff staff eu cosbi am berfformiad rheoli gwael. Gobeithio hefyd y bydd y Gweinidog yn condemnio methiant Llywodraeth San Steffan i fonitro gwariant arian cyhoeddus yn effeithlon.

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, yr effaith a ddymunir yw rhyngweithio personol mewn swyddfeydd lleol. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo'r Cynulliad hwn drwy gyfeirio at ein nodweddion sy'n ystyriol o deuluoedd ac sy'n ecogyfeillgar. Ond mae'r broses arfaethedig o ganoli staff Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi o Bont-y-pŵl i Lanisien, er enghraifft, yn gwrth-ddweud yr union ddelfrydau y ceisiwn eu hyrwyddo. Mae gan famau sy'n gweithio, gofawyr a staff rhan-amser sy'n gweithio ar hyn o bryd yn y swyddfa leol batrymau gweithio sy'n cydfynd â dyletswyddau gofal neu gludo plant i'r ysgol. Maent yn gweithio'n lleol oherwydd ymrwymadau teuluol. Os bydd gofyn iddynt symud i Lanisien, bydd y trefniadau gweithio hynny'n dod i ben, ac oherwydd teithio ychwanegol, ynghyd ag amseroedd teithio na ellid eu rhag-weld, yr unig ddewis iddynt fyddai ymddiswyddo. Byddai hynny o anfantais fawr, nid yn unig am eu bod yn staff ymroddgar, ond hefyd oherwydd y gost o ailhyfforddi a'r oedi a fyddai'n gysylltiedig â hynny.

Os bydd gofyn i staff symud o Bont-y-pŵl, ac o ardaloedd eraill yn y de-ddwyrain, i Lanisien, y canlyniad fydd mwy o ollyngiadau carbon wrth iddynt deithio ar hyd ffyrdd lle mae tagfeydd mawr eisoes ac sydd wedi'u clustnodi ar gyfer taliadau atal tagfeydd posibl. Wrth gyrraedd Lanisien, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, maent yn annhebygol o

the already oversubscribed office car park, and, without an alternative, they would be forced to park in the surrounding streets of Cardiff north, which is already causing friction with local residents. They also want an explanation as to why 42 quality jobs are to be taken from an Objective 1 area, when the Pontypool office still has 10 years to run on its present lease. Retaining these jobs in Pontypool would fall in line with National Assembly policy of moving employment into our Valley communities. I trust that the Minister can answer these questions.

**Christine Gwyther:** As other Members, I welcome the public sector jobs that have come to Wales, but I will concentrate today on the services that are being streamlined and that are under threat. Local services are important, and I will concentrate on how important they are to people in their areas.

I attended two public meetings in January, in Carmarthen and Haverfordwest, at which members of staff from those two towns and from Pembroke Dock were present; importantly, there were also members of the public there, who were vocal in their support of local services for individuals and local businesses. Alongside those meetings, the Public and Commercial Services union carried out a public survey by way of a questionnaire, from which it is clear that people want face-to-face local advice facilities; they do not want to see those go. I was not at all surprised by those results, because the appetite in central Government for remote telephone or internet services does not chime with what people in my constituency tell me and what they are telling staff in those local offices.

I think that they are right in those offices to start campaigning now rather than wait for an axe to fall. Like other west Wales Labour AMs, I have been working with Nick Ainger, who happens to be my local MP as well as the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Wales, on keeping Government services local and using co-location between Government departments where appropriate,

allu cael lle parcio ym maes parcio'r swyddfa sydd eisoes yn orlawn, a heb ddewis arall byddai'n rhaid iddynt barcio ar strydoedd cyfagos gogledd Caerdydd, sydd eisoes yn achosi drwgdeimlad ymhlith trigolion lleol. Maent hefyd yn gofyn am esboniad pam tynnu 42 o swyddi o safon o ardal Amcan 1 pan fo gan swyddfa Pont-y-pŵl 10 mlynedd ar ôl ar ei phrydles bresennol. Byddai cadw'r swyddi hyn ym Mhont-y-pŵl yn cyd-fynd â pholisi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o symud cyflogaeth i'n cymunedau yn y Cymoedd. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog ateb y cwestiynau hyn.

**Christine Gwyther:** Fel Aelodau eraill, yr wyf yn croesawu'r swyddi sector cyhoeddus a ddaeth i Gymru, ond byddaf yn canolbwyntio heddiw ar y gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu symleiddio ac sydd o dan fygythiad. Mae gwasanaethau lleol yn bwysig, a byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar eu pwysigrwydd i bobl yn eu hardaloedd.

Euthum i ddau gyfarfod cyhoeddus ym mis Ionawr, yng Nghaerfyrddin a Hwlfordd, lle yr oedd aelodau staff o'r ddwy dref hynny ac o Ddoc Penfro yn bresennol; yn bwysig, yr oedd aelodau o'r cyhoedd yno hefyd, a oedd yn llafar iawn eu cefnogaeth i wasanaethau lleol ar gyfer unigolion a busnesau lleol. Ynghyd â'r cyfarfodydd hynny, cynhaliodd undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol arolwg cyhoeddus ar ffurf holiadur, ac mae'n amlwg o hwnnw fod pobl am gael cyfleusterau cynghori lleol wyneb yn wyneb; nid ydynt am eu gweld yn diflannu. Nid oeddwn yn synnu o gwbl at y canlyniadau hynny, oherwydd nid yw brwdfrydedd Llywodraeth ganolog dros wasanaethau o bell dros y ffôn neu'r rhyngwyd yn cyd-fynd â'r hyn y mae pobl yn fy etholaeth yn ei ddweud wrthyf, a'r hyn y maent yn ei ddweud wrth staff yn y swyddfeydd lleol hynny.

Credaf eu bod yn llygad eu lle yn y swyddfeydd hynny i ddechrau ymgyrchu'n awr, yn hytrach nag aros am y toriadau. Fel ACau Llafur eraill y gorllewin, yr wyf wedi bod yn gweithio gyda Nick Ainger, sy'n digwydd bod yn AS lleol imi yn ogystal ag Is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Seneddol Cymru, ar gadw gwasanaethau lleol y Llywodraeth a defnyddio cydleoili rhwng adrannau'r

so that money can be saved on rent and on other overheads rather than on front-line staff. It makes economic sense, we have been told that it makes environmental sense, and it makes sense as part of Labour's social justice agenda. It is those arguments that will win the day when Rhodri Morgan speaks to Dawn Primarolo.

The UK Government needs to be told straight that the Welsh people value local services, and I expect our First Minister to be robust when he meets with Treasury Ministers. I expect him to argue a coherent case for Wales keeping and strengthening its local services, and I am seeking an assurance from the First Minister today that he will be fighting for our local services in west Wales, as well as for the rest of Wales.

**Kirsty Williams:** I will address my comments to amendment 6, and the reason why we need to support that amendment today and not at some later date. The situation in my constituency in the tax office in Brecon mirrors the experience of many Members who have already contributed to this afternoon's debate.

5.30 p.m.

Although 27 is not a large number of staff, they are a very important part of the local economy, quite apart from the services that they provide to local business people and individuals. These are relatively well paid jobs with good terms and conditions in an area that does not have the benefit of large-scale redeployment of civil service jobs from London. We will not see the large number of jobs coming to my constituency that has been seen in Newport, Swansea and parts of north Wales. Everyone knows that the wages earned in a small community are spent in that community, so it is vital that we keep these well paid jobs in Brecon.

As we have already heard, for most of those 27 workers—the majority of whom are

Llywodraeth lle mae'n briodol, fel y gellir arbed arian ar rent ac gorbenion eraill yn hytrach nag ar staff rheng flaen. Mae'n gwneud synnwyr yn economaidd, dywedwyd wrthym ei fod yn gwneud synnwyr yn amgylcheddol, ac mae'n gwneud synnwyr fel rhan o agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol Llafur. Dyna'r dadleuon a fydd yn ennill y dydd pan fydd Rhodri Morgan yn siarad â Dawn Primarolo.

Mae angen dweud yn blaen wrth Lywodraeth y DU bod pobl Cymru yn gwerthfawrogi gwasanaethau lleol, a disgwyliaf i'n Prif Weinidog fod yn gadarn pan fydd yn cyfarfod â Gweinidogion y Trysorlys. Disgwyliaf iddo ddadlau achos ystyrion pam y dylai Cymru gadw a chryfhau ei gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a gofynnaf am sicrwydd gan y Prif Weinidog heddiw y bydd yn brwydro dros ein gwasanaethau lleol yn y gorllewin, yn ogystal ag yng ngweddill Cymru.

**Kirsty Williams:** Byddaf yn cyfeirio fy sylwadau at welliant 6, a'r rheswm pam y mae'n rhaid inni gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw heddiw, nid rywbryd yn y dyfodol. Mae'r sefyllfa yn fy etholaeth i yn y swyddfa dreth yn Aberhonddu yn adlewyrchu profiad nifer o Aelodau sydd eisoes wedi cyfrannu at y drafodaeth y prynhawn yma.

Er nad yw 27 yn nifer fawr o staff, maent yn rhan bwysig iawn o'r economi leol, ar wahân i'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ganddynt i bobl fusnes leol ac unigolion. Mae'r rhain yn swyddi sy'n talu'n gymharol dda, gyda thelerau ac amodau da mewn ardal na fydd yn elwa o swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil a fydd yn symud o Lundain ar raddfa fawr. Ni fyddwn yn gweld nifer fawr o swyddi'n dod i'm hetholaeth i, fel y gwelwyd yng Nghasnewydd, Abertawe a rhannau o'r gogledd. Gŵyr pawb fod y cyflogau mewn cymuned fach yn cael eu gwario yn y gymuned honno, felly, mae'n hanfodol inni gadw'r swyddi hyn sy'n talu'n dda yn Aberhonddu.

Fel y clywyd eisoes, i'r rhan fwyaf o'r 27 hynny o weithwyr—merched gan mwyaf—ni

female—the proposal to move the jobs to Cardiff simply will not work. It will mean redundancies for those workers, first because of their caring responsibilities and, secondly, because of the commute to work. Anyone who has to do the schlep down the A470, as I do regularly, knows that it is impossible to get from Brecon to Cardiff within an hour, and that assumes that these workers would be leaving from Brecon in the first place. The Brecon office offers these well paid jobs to the rural hinterland of south Powys. Many workers already travel up to half an hour to get to Brecon in the first place, and will simply not be able to travel to Cardiff—not to mention all the environmental damage that such a journey would cause, as we have heard.

The Minister says that it is okay because this is only a consultation, and that we do not need to carry amendment 6 today because there is plenty of time. The Minister needs to know that, already, the Government is moving work out of the Brecon office. Therefore, when the consultation begins in 2008, it will already be too late. The Government will have set up that office to fail, because it is doing it now. That is why we need amendment 6 to be carried today. We need to take a resolute stance today to ensure that the Government knows, from an early stage, that we do not tolerate these proposals as they are.

The Minister was very careful to mention the offices in the constituencies occupied by her party colleagues. She also mentioned the need to safeguard offices in north-east Wales. However, she made no mention of the need to safeguard these jobs in rural Wales. These are very precious jobs, which will not be easily replaced. At the same time as these jobs are going, Powys County Council and Powys Local Health Board are also cutting back on jobs. We need the Government to take a robust stance, not just for south-west and north-east Wales; we need the Minister and the First Minister to do that for the whole of Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The

fydd y cynnig i symud y swyddi i Gaerdydd yn gweithio. Bydd yn golygu y bydd y gweithwyr hynny'n colli eu swyddi, i ddechrau oherwydd eu cyfrifoldebau gofalu, ac yn ail oherwydd y pellter y byddai'n rhaid iddynt ei deithio i'r gwaith. Gŵyr pawb sy'n gorfod teithio i lawr yr A470, fel y mae'n rhaid i mi ei wneud yn rheolaidd, ei bod yn amhosibl teithio o Aberhonddu i Gaerdydd mewn awr, ac mae hynny'n cymryd y byddai'r gweithwyr hynny'n gadael o Aberhonddu yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'r swyddfa yn Aberhonddu yn cynnig swyddi sy'n talu'n dda yng nghefnwlad de Powys. Mae nifer o weithwyr eisoes yn teithio hyd at hanner awr i gyrraedd Aberhonddu yn y lle cyntaf, ac ni fyddai'n bosibl iddynt deithio i Gaerdydd—heb sôn am yr holl niwed amgylcheddol y byddai taith o'r fath yn ei achosi, fel y clywyd eisoes.

Dywed y Gweinidog fod hyn yn iawn gan mai dim ond ymgynghoriad ydyw, ac nad oes angen inni dderbyn gwelliant 6 heddiw gan fod digon o amser. Mae angen i'r Gweinidog wybod bod y Llywodraeth eisoes yn symud gwaith allan o swyddfa Aberhonddu. Felly, pan fydd yr ymgynghori'n dechrau yn 2008, bydd eisoes yn rhy hwyr. Bydd y Llywodraeth wedi trefnu bod y swyddfa honno'n methu, oherwydd dyna sy'n digwydd yn awr. Dyna pam mae angen inni dderbyn gwelliant 6 heddiw. Mae angen inni wneud safiad penderfynol heddiw i sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn gwybod yn ddigon cynnar nad ydym yn fodlon derbyn y cynigion hyn fel y maent.

Yr oedd y Gweinidog yn ofalus iawn i sôn am y swyddfeydd yn etholaethau ei chyd-aelodau. Soniodd hefyd fod angen diogelu swyddfeydd yn y gogledd-ddwyrain. Fodd bynnag, ni soniodd fod angen diogelu'r swyddi hyn yng Nghymru wledig. Mae'r rhain yn swyddi gwerthfawr iawn, ac ni ellir llenwi eu lle yn hawdd. Ar yr un pryd ag y mae'r swyddi hyn yn mynd, mae Cyngor Sir Powys a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys hefyd yn cwtogi swyddi. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth wneud safiad cadarn, nid dros y de-orllewin a'r gogledd-ddwyrain yn unig; mae angen i'r Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog wneud hynny ar gyfer Cymru gyfan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae amser yr

Member's time is up.

**Catherine Thomas:** I shall confine my contribution on the impact of potential job losses to my own constituency of Llanelli, and to how it will affect my constituents who are public servants and also those who are customers reliant on these crucial public services.

First however, I must make reference to the Ministry of Defence depot in Llangennech. The MOD is very important to the local community. However, recently we have received the devastating news that the depot, known to many local people as 'the RN' is to close, with the loss of nearly 200 jobs. This will involve work remaining in-house but moving to south-east England. Since the summer of 2005, the local MP, Nia Griffith, and I have been very proud to work with the trade union representatives at the depot and with the action committee. After a great deal of campaigning and the development of a strong business plan, a number of options were on the table that could have kept the depot at Llangennech open. The recent announcement that it was to close next year was met with disbelief and disdain. The feeling is that the business case was not really considered, and that the move to south-east England makes no sense, especially from an economic perspective.

Next, I would like to consider the jobs at Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs office in Llanelli that are under threat of being moved to Swansea. The Public and Commercial Services Union, highlighting the impact that this will have on the lives of these workers in Llanelli, has made it clear that it would be devastating for the workers and their families if these jobs were to go. The economic impact on the town is deeply worrying. Quite simply, these are jobs that we must not lose, and cannot afford to lose.

**Tamsin Dunwoody:** Do you agree that we have an added disadvantage in west Wales when trying to attract jobs to the area, and that losing such highly skilled, well paid, long-term jobs is devastating for us both?

**Catherine Thomas:** I completely concur

Aelod ar ben.

**Catherine Thomas:** Cyfyngaf fy nghyfraniad i effaith y posibilrwydd o gollu swyddi ar fy etholaeth fy hun yn Llanelli, a sut y bydd yn effeithio ar fy etholwyr sy'n weision sifil a hefyd y cwsmeriaid hynny sy'n dibynnu ar y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hanfodol hyn.

I ddechrau, fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gyfeirio at ddepo'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn Llangennech. Mae'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn bwysig iawn i'r gymuned leol. Fodd bynnag, yn ddiweddar cawsom newyddion torcalonnus y bydd y depo, a elwir yn 'RN' yn lleol, yn cau ac y bydd bron i 200 o swyddi'n cael eu colli. Bydd hyn yn golygu y bydd gwaith yn cael ei wneud yn fewnol ond y bydd yn symud i dde-ddwyrain Lloegr. Ers yr haf 2005, cafodd yr AS lleol, Nia Griffith, a minnau y fraint o weithio gyda chynrychiolwyr yr undeb llafur yn y depo a chyda'r pwyllgor gweithredu. Ar ôl llawer o ymgyrchu a datblygu cynllun busnes cadarn, cyflwynwyd nifer o ddewisiadau posibl ar gyfer cadw'r depo yn Llangennech ar agor. Mae'r cyhoeddiad y byddai'n cau y flwyddyn nesaf wedi achosi anghrediniaeth a siomedigaeth. Y teimlad yw nad ystyriwyd yr achos busnes mewn gwirionedd, ac nad yw symud i dde-ddwyrain Lloegr yn gwneud synnwyr, yn enwedig o safbwynt economaidd.

Yn nesaf, hoffwn ystyried y swyddi yn swyddfa Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi yn Llanelli, sydd mewn perygl o gael eu symud i Abertawe. Eglurodd Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, gan dynnu sylw at yr effaith a gaiff hyn ar fywydau'r gweithwyr hynny yn Llanelli, y byddai'n drychinebus i'r gweithwyr a'u teuluoedd pe byddent yn colli eu swyddi. Mae'r effaith economaidd ar y dref yn peri cryn bryder. Yn syml, mae'r rhain yn swyddi na allwn eu colli, ac na allwn fforddio eu colli.

**Tamsin Dunwoody:** A gytunwch ein bod dan anfantais ychwanegol yn y gorllewin wrth geisio denu swyddi i'r ardal, a bod colli swyddi mor fedrus, hirdymor sy'n talu'n dda yn drychinebus inni ein dwy?

**Catherine Thomas:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r

with what you said, Tamsin. These are jobs that we cannot afford to lose—they are highly skilled, well paid jobs, and, for that reason, we must keep them in west Wales. I hope that, during this consultation period, the Ministers in Westminster who have responsibility for this issue will listen to the arguments and see sense. As Christine Gwyther has already said, First Minister, we hope that you will convey to Dawn Primarolo and her team the strength of feeling expressed here that we keep these jobs in west Wales.

Furthermore, let us consider the impact on those who use the services in places such as Llanelli. They are currently enjoying a high-quality service, but removing the link between customers and the local office will not be a good step for anyone. It will not meet the customers' needs. The tax office in Llanelli has a proud history; it is used by those who are most vulnerable and we need to keep that service there and have that face-to-face contact. Our public servants, and those whom they serve, have our support as a Labour Assembly Government. Central Government must now respond to that support and listen.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will not repeat the points that have already been made about the impact that these proposed changes will have on local economies and environments across Wales. I do, however, want to say a few words about the impact on service users, and to echo what others have said. I would remind Lynne Neagle that cuts have already been made. As a direct consequence of the withdrawal of the Department for Work and Pensions services from Tumble, for example, I am now dealing with a young couple who have got into serious difficulties over their benefits, and may be in serious trouble, simply because they had no-one to ask.

Reference has been made to the important tax office in Llanelli, and I commend all those who participated in the successful lobby by the PCS union there a few weeks ago, when hundreds signed a petition against the cuts. While we were collecting those signatures, an elderly gentleman who had had serious tax issues relating to his retirement said to me, 'I

hyn a ddywedwch, Tamsin. Mae'r rhain yn swyddi na allwn fforddio'u colli—maent yn swyddi medrus sy'n talu'n dda, ac oherwydd hynny rhaid inni eu cadw yma yn y gorllewin. Gobeithio, yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori, y bydd y Gweinidogion yn San Steffan sy'n gyfrifol am y mater hwn yn gwrando ar y dadleuon ac yn gwneud y penderfyniad cywir. Fel y dywedodd Christine Gwyther eisoes, Brif Weinidog, gobeithio y byddwch yn cyfleu wrth Dawn Primarolo a'i thîm gryfder y teimlad yma y dylid cadw'r swyddi hyn yn y gorllewin.

Yn ychwanegol, gadewch inni ystyried yr effaith ar y rheini yn ein plith sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau mewn llefydd fel Llanelli. Maent yn mwynhau gwasanaeth o safon ar hyn o bryd, ond ni fydd dileu'r cyswllt rhwng cwsmeriaid a'r swyddfa leol yn gam da i neb. Ni fydd yn diwallu anghenion y cwsmeriaid. Mae gan y swyddfa dreth yn Llanelli hanes balch; fe'i defnyddir gan y rhai sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, ac mae angen inni gadw'r gwasanaeth yno a sicrhau'r cyswllt personol hwnnw. Fel Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, cefnogwn ein gweision sifil, a'r rheini a wasanaethir ganddynt. Rhaid i Lywodraeth ganolog ymateb i'r gefnogaeth honno a gwrando.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ni fyddaf yn ailadrodd y pwyntiau a wnaed eisoes am yr effaith a gaiff y newidiadau arfaethedig hyn ar economïau lleol ac amgylcheddau ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn sôn ychydig am yr effaith ar ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau, ac ategu'r hyn a ddywedodd eraill. Hoffwn atgoffa Lynne Neagle bod toriadau eisoes wedi digwydd. O ganlyniad uniongyrchol i ddileu gwasanaethau'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn y Tymbl, er enghraifft, yr wyf bellach yn delio â phâr ifanc sydd mewn trafferthion difrifol gyda'u budd-daliadau, a gallent fod mewn trwbwl mawr, gan nad oedd ganddynt neb i'w holi.

Cyfeiriwyd at y swyddfa dreth bwysig yn Llanelli, a hoffwn ganmol pob un a gymerodd ran yn y lobi lwyddiannus gan undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, pan lofnodwyd deiseb yn erbyn y toriadau gan gannoedd o bobl. Pan oeddem yn casglu'r llofnodion hynny, dywedodd hen ŵr a oedd

do not know what I would have done without them; what will I do if I have problems again?'. As Christine Gwyther has rightly said, people like that do not want to talk to people on the telephone, they do not want to use e-mail, and they certainly cannot travel to remote centres; they want to talk to a real person in their community.

I submit that, at a central political level, this has been a bit of a con. When we hear a politician saying that he is going to cut civil service jobs—and Elin Jones has already mentioned the person who comes to mind—we think that he is going to sack Sir Humphrey. We think that the mandarins in Whitehall are going to get their cards, and many of those could probably go without incurring much damage; however, we certainly do not think that services for local people will be slashed and local jobs withdrawn. As I understand it, not a single mandarin is going to lose his job—and they mostly are 'his' not 'her' jobs in Whitehall; it is local people in our communities who will lose their jobs.

I commend the extent to which we have agreed over much of this, but I must remind Members, and those in the public gallery and beyond, that this is a political matter. I have been with Labour Members campaigning in communities, and I know that they are campaigning in good faith against cuts, as they have spoken against them here today. However, I must remind them and others that this is Labour Government policy. I must question their stance on this. Is this part of an honourable tradition of backbench independence, or is it a dishonest refusal to accept joint party responsibility? On a personal note, if my party were conducting itself like that on a range of issues, whether it is Iraq, a tax on single mothers, or public service job cuts, I would be tearing up my membership card, not standing for re-election in the party's name.

Be that as it may, Labour Members have an opportunity today to demonstrate that there is more to their concern than words, and I ask the Minister to reconsider her position on our

yn cael problemau treth difrifol gyda'i ymddeoliad wrthyf, 'Wn i ddim beth fyddwn i wedi'i wneud hebddynt; beth wnaif fi os bydd problemau eto?'. Fel y dywedodd Christine Gwyther, a hynny'n gywir ddiagon, nid yw pobl fel hyn am siarad â phobl ar y ffôn, nid ydynt am ddefnyddio e-bost, ac yn sicr ni allant deithio i ganolfannau pell; maent am siarad â pherson go iawn yn eu cymuned.

Awgrymaf mai twyll yw hyn i raddau, ar lefel gwleidyddiaeth ganolog. Pan glywn wleidydd yn dweud ei fod am gwtogi swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil—ac mae Elin Jones eisoes wedi enwi'r person hwn—tybiwn ei fod am ddiswyddo Syr Humphrey. Tybiwn y bydd y mandariniaid yn Whitehall yn colli eu swyddi, a gallai hynny ddigwydd i nifer ohonynt heb achosi llawer o ddifrod. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr ni fyddwn yn credu y caiff gwasanaethau i bobl leol a swyddi lleol eu cwtogi. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, ni fydd unrhyw fandarin yn colli ei swydd—a swyddi i ddynion yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r rhain yn Whitehall; pobl leol yn ein cymunedau fydd yn colli eu swyddi.

Yr wyf yn canmol y graddau yr ydym wedi cytuno ar lawer o hyn, ond hoffwn atgoffa Aelodau, a'r rheini yn yr oriel gyhoeddus a'r tu hwnt, mai mater gwleidyddol yw hwn. Yr wyf wedi bod gydag Aelodau Llafur yn ymgyrchu mewn cymunedau, a gwn eu bod yn ymgyrchu'n ddidwyll yn erbyn toriadau, fel y clywyd ganddynt yma heddiw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi eu hatgoffa hwy ac eraill mai polisi Llywodraeth Lafur yw hwn. Rhaid imi gwestiynu eu safiad ar hyn. A yw hyn yn rhan o draddodiad anrhydeddus o annibyniaeth y meinciau cefn, neu a yw'n wrthodiad anonest i dderbyn cyfrifoldeb pleidiau ar y cyd? Ar nodyn personol, pe byddai fy mhlaid yn ymddwyn fel hyn ar amrywiaeth o faterion, boed hynny ar Irac, treth i famau sengl, neu gwtogi swyddi'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, byddwn yn rhwygo fy ngherdyn aelodaeth, nid sefyll i gael fy ail-ethol yn enw'r blaid.

Er hynny, mae gan Aelodau Llafur gyfle heddiw i ddangos bod eu pryder yn fwy na geiriau gwag, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried ei sefyllfa ar ein gwelliant 1. Nawr

amendment 1. Now is the time to ask the Westminster Government to reconsider, which is all that our amendment seeks to do. I have sympathy with the Liberal Democrats' going further and wishing to deplore the job cuts, but we have deliberately worded our amendment to ask you to reconsider—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up and the red button is on.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I thank the Minister for her excellent introduction to this debate. Like others, I have been lobbied today by members of the PCS union who work at HM Revenue and Customs department. The phrase, 'The tax man cometh'—or 'the tax woman cometh'—comes to mind when I see our colleagues in the gallery today.

5.40 p.m.

I met two of my constituents who are members of PCS, and they explained their concerns to me regarding the possibility of the outlying offices being closed, with staff relocating to the main offices in Llanishen. As has already been said, particularly by Lynne Neagle, these matters are not the responsibility of the Welsh Assembly Government. However, I promise to pass them on to my MP, and to the First Minister, who, I understand, is due to meet the Paymaster General soon to discuss these issues.

One issue raised with me today concerns part-time workers, many of whom are mothers currently working in Brecon, Merthyr, Pontypridd, Bridgend, Pontypool and Newport. Those were the areas that they raised with me today. If these jobs were to move to Llanishen, it would add at least an hour's travel each way to their journeys, and could cause problems for those who have to get their children to school in the morning, but pick them up in the afternoon, or even at lunchtime. There will also be an added impact on traffic and parking if those staff members have to drive to Cardiff.

One idea put forward by PCS today is to

yw'r amser i ofyn i Lywodraeth San Steffan ailystyried, a dyna yw unig fwriad ein gwelliant. Gallaf ddeall bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am fynd gam ymhellach ac wfftio'r toriadau swyddi, ond yr ydym wedi geirio ein gwelliant yn fwriadol i ofyn ichi ailystyried—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben ac mae'r golau coch ymlaen.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei chyflwyniad rhagorol i'r ddatl hon. Fel eraill, cefais fy lobio heddiw gan aelodau o undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol sy'n gweithio yn adran Cyllid a Thollau EM. Yr wyf yn meddwl am yr ymadrodd 'the tax man cometh'—neu 'the tax woman cometh'—wrth weld ein cyd-aelodau yn yr oriel heddiw.

Cyfarfûm â dau o'm hetholwyr sy'n aelodau o Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, ac eglurwyd eu pryderon am y posibilrwydd y bydd y swyddfeydd anghysbell yn cael eu cau, a'r staff yn cael eu symud i'r prif swyddfeydd yn Llanisien. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, yn arbennig gan Lynne Neagle, nid cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw'r materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn addo eu trosglwyddo i'm AS ac i'r Prif Weinidog a fydd, yn ôl y sôn, yn cwrdd â'r Tâl-feistr Cyffredinol yn fuan i drafod y materion hyn.

Mae un o'r materion a godwyd gyda mi heddiw yn ymwneud â gweithwyr rhan amser, nifer ohonynt yn famau sy'n gweithio yn Aberhonddu, Merthyr, Pontypridd, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Pont-y-pŵl a Chasnewydd ar hyn o bryd. Dyna'r ardaloedd a godwyd gyda mi heddiw. Pe byddai'r swyddi hyn yn symud i Lanisien, byddent yn gorfod teithio o leiaf awr yn hwy bob ffordd, a gallai hynny beri problemau i'r rheini sy'n gorfod mynd â'u plant i'r ysgol yn y bore a'u nôl yn y prynhawn, neu hyd yn oed amser cinio. Bydd effaith ychwanegol ar draffig a pharcio hefyd os bydd yr aelodau staff hynny'n gorfod gyrru i Gaerdydd.

Un syniad a gyflwynwyd gan Undeb y



move staff from Llanishen to the outlying offices, particularly trying to match up those who live nearby. The remaining staff at Llanishen could move into one block of offices, freeing up the second block, which could then be let separately at market rent and rates. I am told that a third of the staff at Llanishen lives outside Cardiff and that many of them would like to move nearer home. That suggestion would also benefit the local economy of all the other areas that I have just mentioned.

As I said at the beginning, this is not a devolved matter. However, I urge the First Minister to raise these issues with the Paymaster General, and to show our strength of feeling here. These jobs are important to these areas, and to the communities around the offices that they serve.

**Mark Isherwood:** The big public spending increases of this decade are coming to an end, and Gordon Brown's heavy borrowing leaves little room for manoeuvre. This leaves Wales particularly vulnerable, as public sector employment has risen by 16.1 per cent since 2001, compared with a rise of just 0.2 per cent in the private sector. The Treasury states that the Welsh Assembly Government is engaged in spending review exercises as ambitious as those in England in reducing back-office jobs and related areas. However, in reality, it is front-office services that are being cut.

The Public and Commercial Services Union has said that,

'It is foolhardy in the extreme to think that cutting more jobs and closing more offices will improve service levels in HMRC... Time is running out for the government'.

HMRC office closures in Wales amount less to reorganisation than to a fundamental and dramatic cut in presence in Wales, and to the near-total decimation of the network of tax offices in rural west, mid and north Wales.

Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol heddiw yw y dylid symud staff o Lanisien i'r swyddfeydd anghysbell, gan geisio cyfateb y niferoedd i'r bobl sy'n byw gerllaw. Gallai'r staff sy'n weddill yn Lanisien symud i un bloc o swyddfeydd, gan ryddhau'r ail bloc, a gellid gosod hwnnw ar wahân am rent a chyfraddau'r farchnad. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod un rhan o dair o'r staff yn Lanisien yn byw y tu allan i Gaerdydd ac y byddai nifer ohonynt yn hoffi symud yn agosach adref. Byddai'r awgrym hwnnw hefyd o fudd i economi leol yr holl ardaloedd eraill a nodais.

Fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, nid yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli. Fodd bynnag, anogaf y Prif Weinidog i godi'r materion hyn gyda'r Tâl-feistr Cyffredinol, a dangos cryfder ein teimladau ni yma. Mae'r swyddi hyn yn bwysig i'r ardaloedd hyn, ac i'r cymunedau o amgylch y swyddfeydd a wasanaethir ganddynt.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'r cynnydd mawr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn ystod y degawd hwn yn dod i ben, ac mae benthyciadau sylweddol Gordon Brown wedi ein cyfyngu'n helaeth. Mae hyn yn gadael Cymru'n arbennig o ddiameddiffyn, gan fod cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus wedi cynyddu 16.1 y cant er 2001, o'i gymharu â chynnydd o ryw 0.2 y cant yn y sector preifat. Dywed y Trysorlys fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n cymryd rhan mewn ymarferion adolygiadau o wariant mor uchelgeisiol â'r rheini yn Lloegr wrth leihau nifer y swyddi clericio a meysydd cysylltiedig. Fodd bynnag, mewn gwirionedd, y gwasanaethau rheng flaen sy'n cael eu cwtdogi.

Dywedodd Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol,

Mae'n wirion iawn meddwl y bydd cwtdogi mwy o swyddi a chau mwy o swyddfeydd yn gwella lefelau gwasanaethau Tollau a Chyllid Ei Mawrhydi... Mae amser y llywodraeth yn dod i ben.

Mae swyddfeydd Tollau a Chyllid Ei Mawrhydi sy'n cau yng Nghymru yn fwy o adlewyrchiad o'r toriad sylfaenol a dramatig mewn presenoldeb yng Nghymru, a'r ffaith bod y rhwydwaith o swyddfeydd treth yn

An enormous swathe of offices, from Pembroke Dock, to Holyhead, Porthmadog, Rhyl, Colwyn Bay and Bangor is being lined up for closure.

I believe that most Members would agree wholeheartedly that an efficient public sector is a good thing, and that Government has a duty to maximise value to taxpayers. Ministers should positively seek out opportunities for streamlining operations.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Bearing in mind the attitude of the former Conservative Government to public sector jobs, and the fact that, whenever we talk about Objective 1 jobs, your economic development spokesman always seeks to undermine and ridicule public service jobs, would you seriously have us believe that, should you ever be back in Government, you would look after the public service?

**Mark Isherwood:** My colleague, Alun Cairns, has never said anything of the kind; I am afraid that you misrepresent him once again. You know that our leader in London has made an absolute commitment to the value of public sector jobs.

What we are talking about here is not streamlining back-office functions, but deep and severe cuts in the front line of a vital public service. It is hard to square the proposals that were outlined in the 'Transforming HMRC' document with the stated aim of the review to ensure that the standards of services are improved. As one civil servant stated to me,

'I and my colleagues in the Rhyl office were devastated to hear the announcement. Rhyl is an extremely—'

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Whose phone is playing *Jingle Bells*? Can the Member please turn it off? You really ought to know by now.

**Mark Isherwood:** I will continue the quotation from the correspondence from my constituent.

ardaloedd gwledig y gorllewin, y canolbarth a'r gogledd wedi'u dileu'n llwyr bron nag yw o ad-drefnu. Mae nifer fawr iawn o swyddfeydd, o Ddoc Penfro, i Gaergybi, Porthmadog, y Rhyl, Bae Colwyn a Bangor mewn perygl o gau.

Credaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'n cytuno'n llwyr bod sicrhau sector cyhoeddus effeithlon yn beth da, a bod gan y Llywodraeth ddyletswydd i sicrhau'r gwerth gorau i drethdalwyr. Dylai Gweinidogion geisio sicrhau cyfleoedd i symleiddio gweithrediadau.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Gan ystyried agwedd hen Lywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr at swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus, a'r ffaith bod eich llefarydd ar ddatblygu economaidd bob amser yn ceisio tanseilio a gwatwar swyddi'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus pan fyddwn yn siarad am swyddi Amcan 1, a ydych yn wir am inni gredu y byddech yn gofalu'n well am y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus pe byddech byth yn ôl mewn grym?

**Mark Isherwood:** Ni ddywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Alun Cairns, ddim byd tebyg i hynny; mae arnaf ofn eich bod wedi camddeall unwaith eto. Gwyddoch fod ein harweinydd yn Llundain wedi gwneud ymrwymiad llwyr i ddiogelu swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus.

Nid sôn am symleiddio swyddogaethau clericio yr ydym yma, ond am doriadau sylweddol a difrifol yn rheng flaen gwasanaeth cyhoeddus hanfodol. Mae'n anodd cysoni'r cynigion a amlinellwyd yn y ddogfen 'Transforming HMRC' â'r nod a gyhoeddwyd yn yr adolygiad i sicrhau bod safonau gwasanaethau'n cael eu gwella. Fel y dywedodd un gwas sifil wrthyf,

Yr oeddwn i a'm cyd-aelodau yn swyddfa'r Rhyl yn siomedig iawn o glywed y cyhoeddiad. Mae'r Rhyl yn arbennig—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ffôn pwy sy'n chwarae *Jingle Bells*? A wnaiff yr Aelod ei droi i ffwrdd? Dylech wybod hynny erbyn hyn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Parhaf â'r dyfyniad gan fy etholwr.

'Rhyl is an extremely deprived area, and HMRC is one of the largest employers. Rhyl has already witnessed the closure of the Department for Work and Pensions office. Our customers need us in the area. How much more can a small town take?'

Meanwhile, HMRC has spent more than £336 million on outside consultancy between 2003 and 2006. Newly qualified teachers and nurses tell us that they cannot find jobs.

The Royal College of Nursing has recently told me that staffing ratios are about the number of staff that you can get away with rather than being related to clinical need. The number of police community support officers is being reduced. A junior doctor has contacted me to say that he has not been shortlisted for a job. He is one of thousands of junior doctors who have been similarly affected. A friend of mine is one of 10 teachers who were sacked by a further education college three days before Christmas because of Assembly Government cuts. Rocketing sickness rates in my home county—in Flintshire County Council—have been blamed on job uncertainty and redundancies. Labour always boasts about how much money it has spent, but what matters is how well it spends that money. In this respect, as in many others, it has failed.

**Huw Lewis:** Redirecting resources to the front line of public services has always been a Labour aim. It is supposedly the aim of the Liberal Democrats and Plaid Cymru, but they seem to believe that money trees will be growing in Wales before they ever have to make a tough decision in Government. As for the Tories, how we can square their comments this afternoon with their commitment to cut billions of pounds on top of the Gershon savings and to oppose consultation rights for the workforce? It beggars belief. My advice for public sector workers in light of the Tory comments in the Chamber this afternoon would be very simple: never smile at a crocodile.

Mae'r Rhyl yn ardal hynod o ddfreintiedig, a Chyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi yw un o'r cyflogwyr mwyaf. Mae swyddfa'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau eisoes wedi cau yn y Rhyl. Mae angen swyddfa ar ein cwsmeriaid yn yr ardal hon. Faint yn rhagor y gellir disgwyl i dref fechan ei ddioddef?

Yn y cyfamser, mae Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi wedi gwario dros £336 miliwn ar ymgynghori'n allanol rhwng 2003 a 2006. Mae athrawon a nyrsys newydd gymhwys yn dweud wrthym na allant gael swyddi.

Dywedodd Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys wrthyf yn ddiweddar bod a wnelo cymarebau staffio â nifer y staff y gellir dygymod â hwy yn hytrach nag angen clinigol. Caiff nifer swyddogion cymunedol yr heddlu ei lleihau. Cysylltodd meddyg iau â mi i ddweud nad oedd wedi cael ei roi ar restr fer am swydd. Mae'n un o filoedd o feddygon iau yr effeithiwyd arnynt yn yr un modd. Mae cyfaill imi yn un o'r 10 o athrawon a ddiswyddwyd gan goleg addysg bellach dri diwrnod cyn y Nadolig oherwydd toriadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Rhoddwyd y bai am y cyfraddau salwch sy'n cynyddu'n gyflym yn y sir lle yr wyf yn byw—yng Nghyngor Sir y Fflint—ar ansicrwydd gwaith a dileu swyddi. Mae Llafur bob amser yn brolio faint o arian y mae wedi'i wario, ond yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw pa mor dda y mae'n gwario'r arian hwnnw. Yn hyn o beth, fel mewn nifer o faterion eraill, mae wedi methu.

**Huw Lewis:** Un o nodau Llafur erioed fu ailgyfeirio adnoddau i reng flaen gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaid Cymru ydyw hefyd, yn ôl pob sôn, ond ymddengys eu bod yn credu y bydd coed arian yn tyfu yng Nghymru cyn y bydd yn rhaid iddynt wneud penderfyniad anodd fel Llywodraeth. O ran y Torïaid, sut y gallwn gysoni eu sylwadau y prynhawn yma â'u hymrwymiad i gwtogi biliynau o bunnoedd yn ychwanegol at arbedion Gershon a gwrthwynebu hawliau ymgynghori i'r gweithlu? Mae hyn y tu hwnt i'm cred. Byddai fy nghyngor i weithwyr y sector cyhoeddus yng ngoleuni sylwadau'r Torïaid yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma yn syml iawn: peidiwch byth â gwenu ar grocodeil.

On the issue of front-line services, and further to the points made today about the revenue offices in Wales, it should be acknowledged that HMRC has committed itself to keeping face-to-face services within our communities. Let us hold it to that. Reorganisation and restructuring in the search for greater efficiency can be painful processes. However, we all accept that they are necessary processes if we live in the real world.

**Kirsty Williams:** Huw, I take your point that a commitment has been given to retain face-to-face services, but how is that of any consolation to my constituents, who will see a workforce of 30 being cut to a workforce of two? What do you suggest that those 28 people do with their time?

**Huw Lewis:** Will they lose their jobs? We are in a period of consultation. Your counsel to your constituents is one of despair: the game is already up and it is all over; the Liberal Democrats cannot help you, except to try to agitate you towards the nearest ballot box, whereas the Labour Party will be engaged in some proper graft in trying to save these jobs.

Greater efficiency will equal more available resources for front-line public services. Let us remember that the electorate has made its choice on it; it voted in favour of it at the last general election and we have that democratic mandate to deliver on that agenda. The electorate voted for a party that pledged to increase front-line public spending. Given that our role as an Assembly is to work for common sense in Westminster in the most literal sense possible, it is right to say that common sense dictates that you do not take jobs away from disadvantaged communities. Having relocated 400 staff to the new Rhydycar Assembly offices in Merthyr Tydfil, it does not make sense to me or to the public that another branch of Government moves 100 jobs away from Merthyr to Cardiff. That is the essence of the commonsense argument. A Wales and Westminster partnership worthy of the name demands a consistent approach to job

O ran gwasanaethau rheng flaen, ac yn ychwanegol at y pwyntiau a wnaed heddiw ynghylch y swyddfeydd refeniw yng Nghymru, dylid cydnabod bod Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi wedi ymrwymo i gadw gwasanaethau wyneb yn wyneb yn ein cymunedau. Gadewch inni ei ddal at hynny. Mae aildrefnu ac ailstrwythuro er mwyn sicrhau gwell effeithlonrwydd yn gallu bod yn brosesau anodd. Fodd bynnag, mae pob un ohonom yn derbyn eu bod yn brosesau angenrheidiol os ydym yn byw yn y byd go iawn.

**Kirsty Williams:** Huw, derbynïaf eich pwynt bod ymrwymiad wedi'i roi i gadw gwasanaethau wyneb yn wyneb, ond pa gysur yw hynny i'm hetholwyr i, o weld gweithlu o 30 yn cael ei dorri i weithlu o ddau? Beth yr awgrymwch y dylai'r 28 hynny ei wneud â'u hamser?

**Huw Lewis:** A fyddant yn colli eu swyddi? Cynhelir ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydych yn rhoi cyngor anobeithiol i'ch etholwyr: mae popeth wedi'i benderfynu eisoes; ni all y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol eich helpu, ac eithrio ceisio eich annog i fynd i'r blwch pleidleisio agosaf, ond bydd y Blaid Lafur yn gweithio'n galed i geisio achub y swyddi hyn.

Bydd gwell effeithlonrwydd yn golygu bod mwy o adnoddau ar gael i wasanaethau cyhoeddus rheng flaen. Gadewch inni gofio bod yr etholwyr wedi gwneud eu dewis yn hyn; pleidleisiwyd o'i blaid yn yr etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf ac mae gennym fandad democratiaidd i gyflwyno'r agenda honno. Pleidleisiodd yr etholwyr dros blaid a addawodd gynyddu gwariant cyhoeddus rheng flaen. O gofio mai ein rôl ni fel Cynulliad yw gweithio dros synnwyr cyffredin yn San Steffan yn yr ystyr mwyaf llythrennol posibl, mae'n iawn dweud bod synnwyr cyffredin yn mynnu na fyddwch yn dileu swyddi mewn cymunedau difreintiedig. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr i mi nac i'r cyhoedd, ar ôl symud 400 o staff i swyddfeydd newydd y Cynulliad yn Rhydycar ym Merthyr Tudful, fod cangen arall o'r Llywodraeth wedyn yn trosglwyddo 100 o swyddi o Ferthyr i Gaerdydd. Dyna hanfod y ddadl o ran synnwyr cyffredin. Mae

location. That is the point to be made, not the opposition claptrap that we have heard here this afternoon. There is no justification for moving jobs away from towns like Merthyr Tydfil; we should be seeking efficiency by doing precisely the opposite.

**John Griffiths:** I will speak about the Newport tax office and the proposals to transfer jobs from that office to Llanishen in Cardiff, and I echo many of the points that have already been made. Such a proposal would, of course, add greatly to the environmental problems, because people would have to travel to Llanishen. The roads are congested and there is no on-site parking. It makes absolutely no sense at all. That would impact greatly on the people involved, because they have caring responsibilities and it would grossly undermine the quality of life that those people have. It would also undermine the delivery of important local services. Many of those points have already been made. As I said, I would like to echo those points.

I would also like to say that we have a challenge here, as the Welsh Assembly Government, to align Welsh Assembly Government policies more closely with those of the UK Government and with local government policies in Wales. We have a very good policy of transferring public service jobs throughout Wales, to spread the socioeconomic benefits across our country. Local government is also very much signed up to that agenda. The UK Government is doing some important and useful things, not least in Newport, in terms of the dispersal of UK jobs from London and the south-east of England. We welcome that. We need to tie all this together in some sort of coherent policy, and that is the challenge, namely to ensure that the UK Government understands the policies that we have in Wales and ensures that its policies and initiatives fit with them.

5.50 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am grateful to you for giving way. Do you believe, given what is on

partneriaeth rhwng Cymru a San Steffan sy'n haeddu'r enw hwnnw yn mynnu ymagwedd gyson at leoli swyddi. Dyna'r pwynt i'w wneud, nid y nonsens gan y gwrthbleidiau a glywsom yma y prynhawn yma. Nid oes cyfiawnhad dros symud swyddi allan o drefi fel Merthyr Tydfil; dylem fod yn ceisio sicrhau effeithlonrwydd drwy wneud y gwrthwyneb yn llwyr.

**John Griffiths:** Hoffwn siarad am swyddfa dreth Casnewydd a'r cynigion i drosglwyddo swyddi o'r swyddfa honno i Lanisien yng Nghaerdydd, ac adleisio llawer o'r pwyntiau a wnaed eisoes. Wrth gwrs, byddai'n gwaethgu'r problemau amgylcheddol yn sylweddol, oherwydd byddai'n rhaid i bobl deithio i Lanisien. Mae tagfeydd ar y ffyrdd ac nid oes parcio ar y safle. Nid yw'n gwneud unrhyw synnwyr o gwbl. Byddai'n effeithio'n fawr ar y bobl dan sylw gan fod ganddynt gyfrifoldebau gofalu, a byddai'n tansilio ansawdd bywyd y bobl hynny'n sylweddol. Byddai hefyd yn tansilio'r gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol pwysig. Mae llawer o'r pwyntiau hynny wedi'u gwneud eisoes. Fel y dywedais, hoffwn adleisio'r pwyntiau hynny.

Hoffwn ddweud hefyd fod yma her inni, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, i gysoni polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn well â pholisiau Llywodraeth y DU a pholisiau llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Mae gennym bolisi da iawn o drosglwyddo swyddi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru, er mwyn lledaenu'r manteision economaidd-gymdeithasol ledled y wlad. Mae llywodraeth leol hefyd yn cymeradwyo'r agenda honno i raddau helaeth. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gwneud rhai pethau pwysig a defnyddiol, yn bennaf yng Nghasnewydd, o ran gwasgaru swyddi'r DU allan o Lundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr. Croesawn hynny. Mae angen inni gysylltu hyn i gyd mewn rhyw fath o bolisi cydlynol, a dyna'r her, sef sicrhau bod Llywodraeth y DU yn deall y polisiau sydd gennym yng Nghymru ac yn sicrhau bod ei pholisiau a'i mentrau hi'n cyd-fynd â'r rheini.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolch ichi am ildio. A ydych yn credu, o ystyried yr hyn a gynigir ar

the table at the moment, that the UK Government should reconsider its position?

**John Griffiths:** I do believe that the UK Government needs to reconsider its position, and we have seen Sue Essex, Rhodri Morgan and Andrew Davies, as Welsh Assembly Government Ministers, strongly make the necessary points. I am extremely confident that Rhodri will, in a robust manner, reinforce those points when he meets with the UK Government next week.

It would be very sad if we saw the progress that we have made in Newport in local regeneration following the redundancies in the steel industry, for example, undermined by the movement of these jobs from the tax office in Newport to Llanishen. It has been a positive story; regeneration in Newport is strong. The partnership between the Welsh Assembly Government and local government in Newport—Newport City Council and the urban regeneration company, Newport Unlimited—has brought great benefits. We are making a lot of progress, but we know that, if these jobs are transferred to Llanishen—and there are 140 plus jobs in the tax office in Newport—it will undermine those efforts. Newport City Council has said that it is keen to look at a one-stop-shop approach, with the jobs in the tax office in Newport combined with benefits advice or other public services. I know that it has met with the staff, and that the trade union, the Public and Commercial Services Union, is supportive of such initiatives. Could Sue say something about the support and help that the Welsh Assembly Government may be able to give Newport City Council to take those proposals forward in conjunction with the workforce and the trade unions? We must support local communities, the trade unions and the people working in the tax office in Newport.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I realise that this has been a long debate, and I will not respond to every single point, but AMs made strong points about the offices and locations close to them and how they felt about them. When Kirsty was in the Chamber—and she is

hyn o bryd, y dylai Llywodraeth y DU ailystyried ei safbwynt?

**John Griffiths:** Credaf fod angen i Lywodraeth y DU ailystyried ei safbwynt, ac yr ydym wedi gweld Sue Essex, Rhodri Morgan ac Andrew Davies, fel Gweinidogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn gwneud y pwyntiau angenrheidiol yn gryf. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog iawn y bydd Rhodri, mewn ffordd gadarn, yn atgyfnerthu'r pwyntiau hynny pan fydd yn cyfarfod â Llywodraeth y DU yr wythnos nesaf.

Byddai'n drist iawn pe byddai'r broses o drosglwyddo'r swyddi hyn o'r swyddfa dreth yng Nghasnewydd i Lanisien yn tanseilio'r cynnydd yr ydym wedi'i wneud yng Nghasnewydd o ran adfywio lleol, er enghraifft, ar ôl dileu swyddi yn y diwydiant dur, oherwydd bu'n stori gadarnhaol—mae adfywio yng Nghasnewydd yn gryf. Mae'r bartneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a llywodraeth leol yng Nghasnewydd—Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd a'r cwmni adfywio trefol, Newport Unlimited—wedi dod â manteision mawr yn ei sgîl. Gwnawn lawer o gynnydd, ond gwyddom, os caiff y swyddi hyn eu trosglwyddo—ac mae mwy na 140 o swyddi yn y swyddfa dreth yng Nghasnewydd—i Lanisien y bydd yn tanseilio'r ymdrechion hynny. Mae Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd wedi dweud ei fod yn awyddus i ystyried dull siop un stop, lle y gellid cyfuno'r swyddi yn y swyddfa dreth yng Nghasnewydd â chyngor am fudd-daliadau a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill. Gwn ei fod wedi cyfarfod â'r staff, a bod yr undeb llafur, Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, yn cefnogi mentrau o'r fath. A allai Sue ddweud rhywbeth am y cymorth y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei roi i Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd i ddatblygu'r cynigion hynny ar y cyd â'r gweithlu a'r undebau llafur? Rhaid inni gefnogi cymunedau lleol, yr undebau llafur a'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y swyddfa dreth yng Nghasnewydd.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Sylweddolaf fod hon wedi bod yn ddadl hir, ac ni fyddaf yn ymateb i bob un pwynt, ond gwnaeth ACau bwyntiau cryf am y swyddfeydd a'r lleoliadau sy'n agos iddynt a'u barn amdanant. Pan oedd Kirsty yn y

no longer—she made the point about Brecon and rural employment. Alun Ffred made points about Porthmadog and Bangor, and the availability of Welsh-speaking staff there, which is very important. Lynne made a point about the Pontypool office, and she wrote to me outlining her concerns for Pontypool a long while ago, when she first heard about this, and said what a good office it is there and how well it works. Similar points were made about Newport and so on. I will just make a point on behalf of my constituency, which includes Llanishen: Llanishen is a very nice place and I defend it, but I accept that many people would not necessarily want to move there and would far rather work in their local environment. I also accept the point that there are real issues with congestion there.

Today's award for being crass has to go to Mick Bates. You did well there, Mick, by accusing us of being vindictive by moving jobs out of Montgomery and looking after only our voters. That is why we have invested a huge sum in the town of Aberystwyth, which is not exactly known for its high Labour vote. That was a big own goal, Mick, but we have got used to you over the years, and we kind of love that idiotic style of yours. [*Interruption.*] I am going, so I do not mind. It depends on whether you prefer 'crass' or 'idiotic'.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am grateful that you have accepted this intervention. You referred to Mick Bates and insinuated that perhaps he had not got his facts completely right. You will recall the public meeting that we attended in the Temple of Peace, where you, Jenny Randerson and I spoke to members of the PCS union. Are you of the same opinion now as you were at that meeting, that is, do you support its campaign to retain these jobs in various areas of Wales, and would you campaign on that basis?

**Sue Essex:** You have either deliberately or cynically misunderstood what I said. I was referring to Mick Bates's comment that we have particular vindictiveness with regard to

siambr, gwnaeth y pwynt am Aberhonddu a chyflogaeth wledig. Gwnaeth Alun Ffred bwyntiau am Borthmadog a Bangor, ac argaeledd staff sy'n siarad Cymraeg yno, sy'n bwysig iawn. Gwnaeth Lynne bwynt am y swyddfa ym Mhont-y-pŵl, a gwn i chi ysgrifennu ataf gryn dipyn yn ôl, pan glywsoch am hyn gyntaf, am eich pryderon ynghylch Pont-y-pŵl, y swyddfa dda yno a sut y mae'n gweithio. Gwnaed pwyntiau tebyg am Gasnewydd ac ati. Gwnaf un pwynt ar ran fy etholaeth, sy'n cwmpasu Llanisien: mae Llanisien yn lle braf iawn ac fe'i hamddiffynnaf, ond derbynaf na fyddai llawer o bobl am symud yno o reidrwydd ac y byddai'n well o lawer ganddynt weithio yn eu hardal leol. Derbynaf hefyd y pwynt a wnaed bob problemau gwirioneddol o ran tagfeydd yno.

Rhaid i'r wobwr am fod yn ansensitif fynd i Mick Bates heddiw. Gwnaethoch yn dda, Mick, drwy ein cyhuddo o fod yn fileinig wrth symud swyddi o Drefaldwyn a gofalu am ein pleidleiswyr ein hunain yn unig. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi buddsoddi swm enfawr yn Aberystwyth, er ei bod yn hysbys nad oes llawer o bobl yn pleidleisio dros Lafur yno. Yr oedd honno'n gôl fawr yn eich rhwyd eich hun, Mick, ond yr ydym wedi dod yn gyfarwydd â chi dros y blynyddoedd ac yr ydym yn eithaf hoff o'ch dull gwirion. [*Torri ar draws.*] Yr wyf ar fynd, felly peidiwch â phoeni. Mae'n dibynnu a oes yn well gennyh y gair 'ansensitif' neu 'wirion'.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am dderbyn yr ymyriad hwn. Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at Mick Bates gan awgrymu nad yw wedi cael ei holl ffeithiau yn gwbl gywir o bosibl. Byddwch yn cofio'r cyfarfod cyhoeddus y buom ynddo yn y Deml Heddwch, lle y buoch chi a Jenny Randerson a minnau yn siarad ag aelodau Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol. A ydych o'r un farn yn awr ag yr oeddech yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, sef eich bod yn cefnogi ei ymgyrch i gadw'r swyddi hyn mewn ardaloedd gwahanol o Gymru, ac y byddech yn ymgyrchu ar y sail honno?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych wedi camddeall yr hyn a ddywedais naill ai'n fwriadol neu'n sinigaidd. Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at sylw Mick Bates ein bod yn arbennig o fileinig

those areas that do not vote Labour. That is what he was suggesting. My point was that that was hardly the case, given that we have invested a lot of money in the delightful town of Aberystwyth, which is not, as you will know, the heartland of the Labour Party.

We have had many comments and, as far as taking this matter forward is concerned, we have had a constructive debate. I hope that the people who have come along—

**Mick Bates:** Will you give way?

**Sue Essex:** No, because time is ticking on, Mick.

I hope that the people who have come along are heartened to see that, although there has been some knockabout at various stages, there is a fair degree of agreement.

I pick up the words that Lynne Neagle used about the Welsh solution, and that was echoed in John Griffiths's and David Melding's points. If we work together to try to get co-ordination and integration—as we have in Aberystwyth, as we know that our offices there can support some of the people who have lost their jobs there—it will not be beyond our wit to provide proper solutions to the issues around delivering public services locally, and around supporting some of those smaller offices, particularly those in deprived areas. As Huw says, it does not make a lot of sense to move jobs away from areas that need work. I think that we can do this. The problem with the proposals as they stand is that they smack of a kind of big-bang approach, of something that was worked out on a planned basis, perhaps. They might have made sense on paper, but they do not make sense in the light of day; these are real people in real communities and in real places.

As I said at the beginning, the kind of approach that we have taken here in Wales is one of working with the workforce as it goes through change, and trying to make sense of that change. The kinds of solutions that we have found, such as those that Lorraine said

wrth yr ardaloedd hynny nad ydynt yn pleidleisio dros Lafur. Dyna ei awgrym. Fy mhwynt i oedd nad oedd hynny'n wir o gwbl, o gofio ein bod wedi buddsoddi llawer o arian yn nhref hardd Aberystwyth, er nad yw'n gadarnle i'r Blaid Lafur, fel y gwyddoch.

Yr ydym wedi cael nifer o sylwadau, a chyn belled ag y mae gweithredu hyn yn y cwestiwn, yr ydym wedi cael dadl adeiladol a gobeithio y bydd y bobl a fu'n bresennol yma—

**Mick Bates:** A ildiwch?

**Sue Essex:** Na wna, am fod yr amser yn mynd yn ei flaen, Mick.

Gobeithio y bydd y bobl a fu'n bresennol yma wedi'u calonogi o weld, er bod tipyn o sgarmes wedi bod ar adegau, fod yma gryn lawer o gytundeb.

Cyfeiriaf at y geiriau a ddefnyddiodd Lynne Neagle am yr ateb i Gymru. Adleisiwyd hynny ym mhwyntiau John Griffiths a David Melding, sef os byddwn yn cydweithio ac yn ceisio sicrhau cydgysylltu ac integreiddio—fel y gwnaethom yn Aberystwyth, oherwydd gwyddom y bydd ein swyddfeydd yno yn gallu cefnogi rhai o'r bobl hynny sydd wedi colli eu swyddi yno—ni fydd y tu hwnt i'n gallu i ddarparu atebion priodol i'r problemau o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn lleol a chefnogi rhai o'r swyddfeydd llai hynny, yn enwedig y rhai mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Huw, nid yw'n gwneud llawer o synnwyr symud swyddi allan o ardaloedd lle y mae angen gwaith. Credaf y gallwn wneud hyn. Y broblem o ran y cynigion fel y maent yw eu bod yn debyg i ddull clec fawr, rhywbeth a luniwyd, efallai, ar sail cynllun Hwyrach y byddent wedi gwneud synnwyr ar bapur, ond nid ydynt yn gwneud synnwyr yng ngolau dydd; pobl go iawn yw'r rhain mewn cymunedau go iawn a lleoedd go iawn.

Fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, mae'r mae'r math o ddull yr ydym wedi'i fabwysiadu yma yng Nghymru, sef gweithio gyda'r gweithlu i sicrhau newid a cheisio gwneud synnwyr o'r newid hwnnw, a'r math o atebion a gafwyd, megis y rhai y dywedodd Lorraine ei bod



that she had from her constituents, give us a more sensitive approach on a way forward. I know that the First Minister will take up these and many other points from this useful discussion.

This will last for a good amount of time here. There will be considerable discussions and feedback, and organisations such as the Public Sector Workforce Forum can be useful in taking through some of these key issues in Wales.

wedi'u cael gan ei hetholwyr sy'n aelodau o Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, yn rhoi inni ddull mwy sensitif at y ffordd ymlaen. Gwn y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ystyried y rhain a nifer o'r pwyntiau eraill sydd wedi deillio o'r drafodaeth ddefnyddiol hon.

Bydd hyn yn para cryn amser yma. Bydd llawer o drafodaeth ac adborth, a gall sefydliadau megis Fforwm Gweithlu'r Sector Cyhoeddus fod yn ddefnyddiol wrth weithredu rhai o'r materion allweddol hyn yng Nghymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 11, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 7, Ymatal 22, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2: For 7, Abstain 22, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Law, Trish  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.  
Amendment 3: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 58, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 58, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 58, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amendment 5: For 58, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

6.00 p.m.

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 6: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 7: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice

Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amendment 8: For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40.  
 Amendment 9: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy



Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM3521 as amended:

Cynnig NDM3521 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes the progress that is being made to achieve a more effective and co-ordinated management of public services in Wales;*

*1. yn nodi'r cynnydd sydd ar droed i sicrhau rheolaeth fwy effeithiol a chydlynol dros wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru;*

*2. notes the call in the Beecham review, 'Beyond Boundaries', for a mixed economy in the delivery of public services;*

*2. yn nodi'r galw yn adolygiad Beecham, 'Ar Draws Ffiniau', am economi gymysg wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus;*

*3. notes that more public services need to be commissioned on a regional basis;*

*3. yn nodi bod angen comisiynu mwy o wasanaethau cyhoeddus ar sail ranbarthol;*

*4. notes the need for more joint working between agencies delivering public services; and*

*4. yn nodi bod angen mwy o gydweithio rhwng asiantaethau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus; a*

*5. welcomes the Assembly Government's actions to spread public sector jobs throughout Wales.*

*5. yn croesawu camau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ledaenu swyddi'r sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 17.*

*Amended motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 17.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **‘O Geiniog i Geiniog’—Pam bod Llythrennedd Ariannol yn Bwysig ‘Looking After the Pennies’—Why Financial Literacy Matters**

**Sandy Mewies:** Catherine Thomas was to have spoken in this debate, but she has had to leave, as we are sitting late. Carl Sargeant and Mick Bates have said that they will contribute.

I suppose that most of will recognise the saying that tells you to count the pennies. Those of us of a certain age will remember that if you do so, the pounds will look after themselves. Unfortunately, we live in a society in which, despite an increase in many people’s incomes, more and more people are getting into debt. Debt is reaching staggering levels, especially in Wales. Every post brings an invitation to take out another credit card or a bigger loan to get the car, home or holiday that you dream of, and to get it now. That applies right across the age range, with teenagers being offered platinum cards, and across all levels of society. In fact, we know that loan sharks target the disadvantaged areas that we are trying to support, such as Communities First areas.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr oedd Catherine Thomas i fod i siarad yn y ddadl hon, ond bu’n rhaid iddi adael, gan ein bod yn eistedd yn hwyr. Mae Carl Sargeant a Mick Bates wedi dweud y byddant yn cyfrannu.

Tybiaf y bydd y rhan fwyaf ohonoch yn gyfarwydd â’r ymadrodd sy’n dweud wrthych am gyfrif y ceiniogau. Bydd y rheini ohonom sydd ychydig yn hŷn yn cofio, os gwnewch hynny, y bydd y punnoedd yn gofalu amdanynt eu hunain. Yn anffodus, yr ydym yn byw mewn cymdeithas lle mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn mynd i ddyled er gwaethaf cynnydd yn incwm nifer o bobl. Mae dyled yn cyrraedd lefelau aruthrol, yn enwedig yng Nghymru. Mae’r post bob dydd yn eich gwahodd i gymryd cerdyn credyd arall neu fenthyciad mwy i gael y car, y cartref neu’r gwyliau rydych wedi breuddwydio amdanynt, a’u cael yn awr. Mae hynny’n wir ar draws yr holl ystod oedran, gyda phobl ifanc yn eu harddegau yn cael cynnig cardiau platinwm, ac ar draws pob lefel o gymdeithas. Yn wir, gwyddom fod benthycwyr arian didrwydded yn targedu’r ardaloedd difreintiedig yr ydym yn ceisio’u

cynorthwyo, fel ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Balance that against the fact that citizens' advice bureaux in Wales and England have seen an increase of nearly 50 per cent in new inquiries about debt in relation to consumer credit in the five years up to 2002. There was a 25 per cent increase in debt-related inquiries last year, spiralling to 1.4 million, and from new year's day to March, 30,000 people in Wales became bankrupt, 10,000 of them probably as the result of Christmas overspend.

Some £1.2 trillion-worth of credit is currently circulating in the UK. Some people might be able to imagine how much £1.2 trillion is, but I cannot. It is equal to the external debt of Africa and South America combined. Household debts in Britain amount to more than 100 per cent of our gross domestic product. Those are some of the frightening statistics that feature in the debate about debt and financial exclusion. What we need to think about is how we got here, and what can we do about it. In Wales, Citizens Advice Cymru reports that debt inquiries are increasing at a rate faster than anywhere else in Britain. Research shows that 57 per cent of households in Wales had active credit commitments in 2003, compared with 46 per cent of households in Britain as a whole, and citizens' advice bureaux clients in Wales owed more than 16 times their monthly income, compared with a UK average of 14 times the monthly income.

In Wales, debt problems are commonly viewed as a symptom of financial exclusion and poor basic skills, and the basic skills strategy indicates that 780,000 children, young people and adults have problems with literacy and numeracy. Given that, it is not hard to understand why a lack of financial literacy is endemic and needs to be tackled. The outcomes can be tragic. Someone asked me why I feel so passionately about this, and it is because debt can break up relationships and families and prove a burden that is difficult to overcome in a lifetime.

Ystyriwch hynny ochr yn ochr â'r ffaith bod canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yng Nghymru a Lloegr wedi gweld cynnydd o bron i 50 y cant mewn ymholiadau newydd ynglŷn â dyled mewn perthynas â chredyd defnyddwyr yn y pum mlynedd hyd at 2002. Cafwyd cynnydd o 25 y cant mewn ymholiadau'n ymwneud â dyled y llynedd, gan godi i 1.4 miliwn, a rhwng Dydd Calan a mis Mawrth aeth 30,000 o bobl yng Nghymru yn fethdalwyr, 10,000 ohonynt o ganlyniad i orwario dros y Nadolig, fwy na thebyg.

Mae gwerth tua £1.2 triliwn o gredyd yn cylchredeg yn y DU ar hyn o bryd. Efallai y gall rhai pobl ddychmygu faint yw £1.2 triliwn, ond ni allaf fi. Mae'n cyfateb i ddyled allanol Affrica a De America ar y cyd. Mae dyledion cartrefi ym Mhrydain yn cyfateb i fwy na 100 y cant o'n cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Dyna rai o'r ystadegau arswydus sy'n codi yn y ddadl am ddyled ac allgáu ariannol. Yr hyn y mae angen inni ei ystyried yw sut y crëwyd y sefyllfa hon, a beth y gallwn ei wneud yn ei chylch. Yng Nghymru, mae Cyngor ar Bopeth Cymru yn dweud bod ymholiadau ynghylch dyled yn cynyddu ar gyfradd gyflymach nag yn unrhyw le arall ym Mhrydain. Dengys gwaith ymchwil fod gan 57 y cant o gartrefi yng Nghymru ymrwymadau credyd gweithredol yn 2003, o'u cymharu â 46 y cant o gartrefi ym Mhrydain gyfan, a bod ar gleientiaid canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yng Nghymru fwy na 16 gwaith eu hincwm misol, o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd o 14 gwaith yr incwm misol yn y DU.

Yng Nghymru, ystyrir problemau ynglŷn â dyled fel arfer yn symptom o allgáu ariannol a sgiliau sylfaenol isel, a dywed y strategaeth sgiliau sylfaenol fod gan 780,000 o blant, pobl ifanc ac oedolion broblemau gyda llythrennedd a rhifedd. O ystyried hynny, nid yw'n anodd deall pam mae diffyg llythrennedd ariannol yn endemig a bod angen mynd i'r afael ag ef. Gall y canlyniadau fod yn drasig. Gofynnodd rhywun imi pam yr wyf yn teimlo mor gryf ynglŷn â hyn, a'r rheswm yw oherwydd gall dyled chwalu cysylltiadau a theuluoedd a gall fod yn faich sy'n anodd ei oresgyn mewn

oes.

I am proud that the Welsh Assembly Government has recognised this problem and the burden that it places upon on individuals. Huw Lewis, the Deputy Minister, did wonderful work on the review of over-indebtedness in Wales, which was commissioned by the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, Edwina Hart. She indicated that investment in money advice services and preventative consumer education will be the key issue for the future.

Citizens Advice Cymru and the Welsh Consumer Council have reinforced the key message that we need a strategy for personal financial education both inside and outside the classroom. In other words, this needs to be embedded into the lives of young people to enable them to become financially literate adults. Those organisations have underlined the need for a cross-cutting review of funding for financial advice and financial literacy work in Wales that will result in properly funded solutions. The Welsh Assembly Government itself has recognised that increasing financial literacy will have a positive impact on child poverty, and has produced proposals that, among other things, will support benefit take-up. We have, of course, introduced financial literacy into the school curriculum, which is extremely important. Schemes have been run by Citizens Advice and others throughout Wales, and, needless to say, I remain proud of the Flintshire citizens' advice bureau course on managing money, which involved workers from various agencies improving the financial literacy of year 10 pupils at Flint High School. Huw Lewis went to see those pupils at the end of that course and they were very financially literate, much more than I would be—they were confident in what they said and knew what they were talking about, and I have met them again since. As a result of that course, the redoubtable Les Cooper of the bureau produced a booklet, 'Drowning in a Sea of Debt', which is well worth looking at. It is a debt advice booklet that is right, is easy to understand, and, most importantly, which covers the whole range of problems that children, young people and their families are likely to face—sometimes, of course, it is young people who advise their parents on

Yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cydnabod y broblem hon a'r baich ar unigolion. Gwnaeth Huw Lewis, y Dirprwy Weinidog, waith ardderchog ar yr adolygiad o orddyled yng Nghymru, a gomisiynwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, Edwina Hart. Dywedodd mai buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cynghori ar arian ac addysg ataliol i ddefnyddwyr fydd y mater allweddol ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Mae Cyngor ar Bopeth Cymru a Chyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru wedi atgyfnerthu'r neges allweddol fod angen strategaeth arnom ar gyfer addysg ariannol bersonol y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r ystafell ddosbarth. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae angen i hyn gael ei ymgorffori ym mywydau pobl ifanc i'w galluogi i ddod yn oedolion sy'n ariannol llythrennog. Mae'r sefydliadau hynny wedi tanlinellu'r angen am adolygiad trawsbynciol o arian ar gyfer cyngor ariannol a gwaith llythrennedd ariannol yng Nghymru a fydd yn arwain at atebion a ariennir yn ddigonol. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei hun wedi cydnabod y bydd cynyddu llythrennedd ariannol yn cael effaith gadarnhaol ar dlodi ymhlith plant, ac mae wedi cynhyrchu cynigion a fydd, ymhlith pethau eraill, yn cefnogi'r broses o gael budd-daliadau. Yr ydym, wrth gwrs, wedi cynnwys llythrennedd ariannol yng nghwricwlwm yr ysgol, sy'n hynod o bwysig. Mae cynlluniau wedi cael eu rhedeg gan Gyngor ar Bopeth a chan eraill ledled Cymru, ac yn naturiol yr wyf yn dal yn falch o'r cwrs gan gyngor ar bopeth yn sir y Fflint ar reoli arian, a oedd yn cynnwys gweithwyr o asiantaethau amrywiol yn gwella llythrennedd ariannol disgyblion blwyddyn 10 yn Ysgol Uwchradd y Fflint. Aeth Huw Lewis i weld y disgyblion hynny ar ddiwedd y cwrs hwnnw ac yr oeddent yn sicr yn ariannol llythrennog, yn llawer mwy nag y byddwn i—yr oeddent yn hyderus ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedasant ac yn sicr o'u ffeithiau, ac yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â hwy eto ers hynny. Yn sgil y cwrs hwnnw, cynhyrchwyd llyfryn gan y grymus Les Cooper o'r ganolfan, 'Drowning in a Sea of Debt', sy'n werth ei ddarllen. Llyfryn cyngor ar ddyled ydyw sy'n gywir, yn hawdd ei ddeall, ac yn bwysicaf oll, yn cwmpasu ystod

such matters; it is not always a one-way street. This booklet does not demonise debt—it states that if you take out credit, you should do so sensibly, and tells you how to manage it.

I know that, like me, Huw was keen to have something similar rolled out across Wales; that is still my ambition, and, I am sure that it is also Huw's. The course was supported by Cymorth funding. I was privileged to launch it, and I have first-hand knowledge of how well it was received by the year 10 students and by the agencies that went along to the launch. It has been a great success with its target audience, but it has also been a great success with others whom I have met, because I am still talking about this issue with professionals—those involved in financial services and in voluntary organisations—who all agree that is a jolly good idea. You do not need one focusing on each of the 22 local authorities, you need one for the whole of Wales, because the debt problems in different areas are very similar indeed.

Les and his colleagues have gone on to work with excluded students and, with the support of the Prudential, they have delivered training courses in the community through agencies such as Sure Start, Home Start, Cymdeithas Tai Hafan, and the Flintshire mental health advocacy service. The next stage has been the setting-up of financial capability fora, and, again, I am glad to say that this has been supported by the Prudential. It is good to see these partners coming on board and recognising their responsibility. The north Wales forum serves stakeholders in north Wales, covering Flintshire, Denbighshire, Wrexham, Ynys Môn, Conwy and Gwynedd. A similar forum for south Wales is being set up by Citizens Advice in Powys. I spoke at the first meeting of the north Wales forum, which was held in January, and there were people there from the voluntary sector, local government, the banking and credit industries, Communities First—which I think is vital—trading standards, welfare rights

gyfan o broblemau y mae plant, pobl ifanc a'u teuluoedd yn debygol o'u hwynebu—weithiau, wrth gwrs, pobl ifanc yw'r rhai sy'n cynghori eu rhieni ar faterion o'r fath; nid yw'n stryd unffordd bob amser. Nid yw'r llyfryn hwn yn cythreulio dyled—mae'n dweud, os byddwch yn trefnu credyd, y dylech wneud hynny'n synhwyrol, ac mae'n dweud wrthyh sut i'w reoli.

Gwn fod Huw, fel finnau, yn awyddus i gyflwyno rhywbeth tebyg ledled Cymru; dyna fy uchelgais i o hyd, ac yr wyf mai dyna yw uchelgais Huw hefyd. Cafodd y cwrs gymorth ariannol gan Cymorth. Yr oedd yn fraint imi ei lansio, ac mae gennyf wybodaeth uniongyrchol o'r croeso cynnes a gafodd gan fyfyrwyr blwyddyn 10 a chan yr asiantaethau ac aeth i'r lansiad. Bu'n llwyddiant ysgubol gyda'i gynulleidfa darged, ond bu hefyd yn llwyddiant ysgubol gydag eraill y cyfarfûm â hwy, oherwydd yr wyf yn parhau i siarad am y mater hwn gyda gweithwyr proffesiynol—y rhai sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau ariannol a sefydliadau gwirfoddol—sydd i gyd yn gyfûn bod hwn yn syniad arbennig o dda. Nid oes angen un i ganolbwyntio ar bob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol, mae angen un ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, oherwydd bod y problemau dyled mewn gwahanol ardaloedd yn debyg iawn.

Mae Les a'i gydweithwyr wedi mynd ymlaen i weithio gyda myfyrwyr sydd wedi'u hallgáu, a chyda chymorth y Prudential maent wedi cyflwyno cyrsiau hyfforddi yn y gymuned drwy asiantaethau megis Cychwyn Cadarn, Home-Start, Cymdeithas Tai Hafan, a gwasanaeth eiriolaeth iechyd meddwl sir y Fflint. Y cam nesaf oedd sefydlu ffora gallu ariannol, ac unwaith eto yr wyf yn falch o ddweud iddo gael ei gefnogi gan y Prudential. Mae'n dda gweld y partneriaid hyn yn ymuno â ni ac yn cydnabod eu cyfrifoldeb. Mae fforwm y gogledd yn gwasanaethu rhanddeiliaid yn y gogledd, sy'n cwmpasu sir y Fflint, sir Ddinbych, Wrecsam, Ynys Môn, Conwy a Gwynedd. Mae fforwm tebyg ar gyfer y de yn cael ei sefydlu gan Cyngor ar Bopeth ym Mhowys. Siaradais yng nghyfarfod cyntaf fforwm y gogledd, a gynhaliwyd fis Ionawr diwethaf, ac yr oedd pobl yno o'r sector gwirfoddol, llywodraeth leol, y diwydiannau bancio a chredyd, Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—sy'n

organisations and many more. We have to face up to the fact that this is an ongoing problem, which requires ongoing solutions. It is wonderful that voluntary organisations, schools, the financial industries and so on are all involved, but we must present financial literacy at every opportunity. I can see that happening in integrated children's centres, within Sure Start, and at any point where people gather, particularly people in Communities First areas, who may need this sort of help.

6.10 p.m.

Children must be encouraged and supported in their understanding of financial arrangements and this support must be continued throughout the education provision. However, although I focus on education, this is an issue throughout our lives, because financial markets are extraordinarily complicated, and I do not think that anyone understands them easily, even experts.

Everyone can play their part. It was good to see representatives from many agencies attending the forum meeting that I mentioned earlier, and, most importantly, it was good to see representatives from the financial services industry there. Some of them—the big players—probably behave with great probity, but I am afraid that there are some who do not. The financial services industry has a responsibility to support initiatives in this way.

I am happy to say that the Institute of Chartered Accountants is committed to a programme of financial literacy in schools. It is mentoring teachers so that they can pass on expertise not just to one year's group of students, which is what would probably happen with direct mentoring, but year after year. That organisation is looking for volunteers from the industry to do that work and to deliver a national programme. Thus far, the focus has been on doing this work in England, but I hope that it will expand in future.

hanfodol yn fy marn i—safonau masnach, sefydliadau hawliau lles a llawer mwy. Rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith fod hon yn broblem barhaus sy'n gofyn am atebion parhaus. Mae'n wych fod sefydliadau gwirfoddol, ysgolion, y diwydiannau ariannol ac ati yn cymryd rhan, ond rhaid inni gyflwyno llythrennedd ariannol ar bob cyfle. Gallaf weld hynny'n digwydd mewn canolfannau integredig i blant, o fewn Cychwyn Cadarn, ac mewn unrhyw fan lle bydd pobl yn ymgynnull, yn enwedig pobl mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, y gallai fod angen y math hwn o gymorth arnynt.

Rhaid i blant gael eu hannog a'u cefnogi yn eu dealltwriaeth o drefniadau ariannol, a rhaid parhau'r gefnogaeth hon drwy gydol y ddarpariaeth addysg. Fodd bynnag, er fy mod yn canolbwyntio ar addysg, mae hwn yn fater drwy gydol ein bywydau, oherwydd bod marchnadoedd ariannol yn gymhleth tu hwnt, ac ni chredaf fod neb yn eu deall yn hawdd, hyd yn oed yr arbenigwyr.

Gall pawb wneud eu rhan. Yr oedd yn dda gweld cynrychiolwyr nifer o asiantaethau yn mynychu cyfarfod y fforwm a grybwyllais yn gynharach, ac yn bwysicaf oll, yr oedd yn dda gweld cynrychiolwyr y diwydiant gwasanaethau ariannol yno. Mae rhai ohonynt—y cwmnïau mawr—mae'n debyg yn ymddwyn yn onest iawn, ond mae arnaf ofn fod rhai nad ydynt yn ymddwyn felly. Mae gan y diwydiant gwasanaethau ariannol gyfrifoldeb i gefnogi mentrau fel hyn.

Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud bod Sefydliad y Cyfrifwyr Siartredig wedi ymrwymo i raglen o lythrennedd ariannol mewn ysgolion. Mae'n mentora athrawon fel y gallant drosglwyddo arbenigedd nid yn unig i grŵp myfyrwyr o un flwyddyn, sef yr hyn a fyddai'n digwydd, mae'n debyg, gyda dull mentora uniongyrchol, ond flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Mae'r sefydliad hwnnw'n edrych am wirfoddolwyr o'r diwydiant i wneud y gwaith hwnnw ac i ddarparu rhaglen genedlaethol. Hyd yma, bu'r ffocws ar wneud y gwaith hwn yn Lloegr, ond gobeithio y bydd hynny'n ehangu yn y dyfodol.

The Assembly must also play its part. In the next Assembly, I hope that every ministerial department will look at the part that it can play in ending financial illiteracy among people of all ages, so that when we look out at the sea of Wales and see hands waving, we know that our citizens are not drowning in a sea of debt, but enjoying the pleasures that life can bring.

**Carl Sargeant:** Sandy Mewies has raised an important issue in the Chamber today. The importance of financial literacy is widely recognised by citizens' advice services and others. There have been some local initiatives and targeted groups. A successful initiative was delivered in Higher Shotton Communities First area, which was not just for young people but also for older people. I hope that the Assembly and the Minister will agree that there is a growing need to tackle issues of financial exclusion among the most disadvantaged, and that there is an opportunity in Wales to provide a co-ordinated and systematic solution, which we must grasp in the near future.

**Mick Bates:** I thank Sandy for bringing forward a debate on what I believe to be an issue vital to ensuring that we remove a great deal of misery from society. All too often we see that a lack of financial literacy causes a great deal of debt and misery within families and in individuals' lives. Therefore, I am pleased to see this topic raised. I will speak about the role that credit unions can play in this regard, because they encompass the whole issue. Credit unions take people away from using banks and loan sharks. As we know loan sharks go around estates and knock on doors in search of those who are desperate to get hold of cash. In taking out loans with loan sharks, those people commit themselves, in many cases, to many years of total misery and high interest rates.

I refer, in particular, to the work of my own credit union in Montgomeryshire—Robert Owen Montgomeryshire Credit Union Limited—and I praise the work of the woman who formed it and now leads it, Rina Clarke.

Rhaid i'r Cynulliad wneud ei ran hefyd. Yn y Cynulliad nesaf, gobeithio y bydd pob adran weinidogol yn edrych ar ei rhan bosibl i roi terfyn ar anllythrennedd ariannol ymhlith pobl o bob oed. Felly, pan fyddwn yn edrych allan ar fôr Cymru ac yn gweld pobl yn chwifio'u dwylo, gwyddom nad yw ein dinasyddion yn boddï mewn môr o ddyled, ond yn mwynhau pleserau bywyd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae Sandy Mewies wedi codi mater pwysig yn y Siambr heddiw. Cydnabyddir pwysigrwydd llythrennedd ariannol yn gyffredinol gan wasanaethau cyngor ar bopeth ac eraill. Cafwyd rhai mentrau lleol a grwpiau wedi'u targedu. Cyflawnwyd menter lwyddiannus yn ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf Higher Shotton, nad oedd ar gyfer pobl ifanc yn unig ond ar gyfer pobl hŷn hefyd. Gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad a'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen cynyddol am fynd i'r afael â materion allgáu ariannol ymhlith y rhai mwyaf difreintiedig, a bod cyfle yng Nghymru i ddarparu ateb cydgysylltiedig a systematig inni fanteisio arno yn y dyfodol agos.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i Sandy am gyflwyno dadl ar yr hyn sy'n fater hanfodol, mi gredaf, i sicrhau ein bod yn dileu llawer iawn o ddiflastod o'n cymdeithas. Yn amlach na pheidio, gwelwn fod diffyg llythrennedd ariannol yn achosi llawer iawn o ddyled a diflastod mewn teuluoedd ac ym mywydau unigolion. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o weld y pwnc hwn yn cael ei drafod. Siaradaf am y rhan y gall undebau credyd ei chwarae yn hyn, am eu bod yn cwmpasu'r mater cyfan. Mae undebau credyd yn atal pobl rhag defnyddio banciau a benthycwyr arian didrwydded. Fel y gwyddom, aiff benthycwyr arian didrwydded o amgylch ystadau gan guro ar ddrysau i chwilio am bobl y mae angen arian arnynt yn ddybryd. Wrth drefnu benthyciadau gyda benthycwyr arian didrwydded, mae'r bobl hynny'n ymrwymo, mewn llawer achos, i flynyddoedd lawer o ddiflastod llwyr a chyfraddau llog uchel.

Cyfeiriaf yn arbennig at waith fy undeb credyd fy hun yn sir Drefaldwyn—Undeb Credyd Cyfyngedig sir Drefaldwyn Robert Owen—a chanmolaf waith y ferch a'i ffurfiodd ac sydd bellach yn ei arwain, Rina

The credit union only charges 2 per cent on loans. We need to encourage people to use credit unions and ensure that they understand the benefits of doing so. It is encouraging that the credit union goes into schools, and now has 400 savers under the age of 16. We need to change the culture. Furthermore, we need to ensure that our credit unions encourage children to start up their own businesses and to become entrepreneurs, because, ultimately, financial literacy is only the first step: changing the culture is the big one.

**The Deputy Minister with Responsibility for Communities (Huw Lewis):** I thank Sandy for bringing this important topic to the Assembly in your short debate. If you forgive the expression, your commitment to this issue and its importance does you great credit.

Over-indebtedness and financial exclusion are issues that can affect any of us, wherever we live and whatever our circumstances. Financial inclusion is a key element in bringing the more disadvantaged communities to the levels of the better-off. The Assembly Government is working on three main elements in order to achieve this: increasing income, encouraging better financial management and stimulating wealth creation.

Over-indebtedness can and does haunt all strata of society, from those with quite enviable incomes tempted by low-cost loans to the most disadvantaged and vulnerable who have little option other than to use doorstep lenders and loan sharks charging exorbitant interest rates, which previous speakers have mentioned.

Tackling financial exclusion and over-indebtedness involves co-operation and partnership between Government at all levels, expert bodies, key practitioners and communities themselves. Individuals must also accept their responsibilities, and our role is to help them to do so. What remains unchanged is the necessity for a concerted, cohesive and strategic approach.

Clarke. Dim ond 2 y cant y mae'r undeb credyd yn ei godi ar fenthyciadau. Mae angen inni annog pobl i ddefnyddio undebau credyd a sicrhau eu bod yn deall manteision gwneud hynny. Mae'n galonogol bod yr undeb credyd yn mynd i ysgolion, a bod ganddo 400 o gynilwyr o dan 16 oed bellach. Mae angen inni newid y diwylliant. At hynny, mae angen inni sicrhau bod ein hundebau credyd yn annog plant i ddechrau eu busnesau eu hunain a dod yn entrepreneuriaid, oherwydd yn y pen draw dim ond y cam cyntaf yw llythrennedd ariannol: newid y diwylliant yw'r cam mwyaf.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog â Chyfrifoldebau am Gymuendau (Huw Lewis):** Diolch i Sandy am godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn yn y Cynulliad yn eich dadl fer. Mae eich ymrwymiad i'r mater hwn a'i bwysigrwydd yn glod mawr ichi.

Mae gorddyled ac allgáu ariannol yn faterion a all effeithio ar unrhyw un ohonom, ble bynnag yr ydym yn byw a beth bynnag yw ein hamgylchiadau. Mae cynhwysiant ariannol yn elfen allweddol o gau'r bwlch rhwng y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig a'r cymunedau cyfoethog. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio ar dair elfen allweddol i wneud hyn: cynyddu incwm, annog gwell rheolaeth ariannol ac ysgogi'r broses o greu cyfoeth.

Gall gorddyled effeithio ar bob rhan o gymdeithas, ac mae'n gwneud hynny, o'r bobl ar incwm cymharol uchel sy'n cael eu temtio gan fenthyciadau cost isel, i'r rhai mwyaf difreintiedig a diamddiffyn nad oes ganddynt fawr o ddewis ond defnyddio benthyccwyr ar garreg y drws, a benthyccwyr arian didrwydded sy'n codi cyfraddau llog afresymol, fel y mae siaradwyr blaenorol wedi cyfeirio atynt.

Mae mynd i'r afael ag allgáu ariannol a gorddyled yn cynnwys cydweithredu a phartneriaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth ar bob lefel, cyrff arbenigol, ymarferwyr allweddol a chymunedau eu hunain. Rhaid i unigolion hefyd dderbyn eu cyfrifoldebau, a'n swyddogaeth ni yw eu helpu i wneud hynny. Yr hyn sy'n parhau'n ddigyfnewid yw'r angen am ddull cydunol, cydlynol a strategol.



In my review of over-indebtedness published in 2005, which Sandy was kind enough to mention, I hope that we were successful in identifying the impact of debt on individuals, families and Welsh communities. The review contained 10 recommendations for action, and I continue to believe that, if delivered properly, they will make a real and lasting difference to the people of Wales. The recommendations reflected a holistic, multi-faceted approach to benefit the whole country, combining immediate and remedial change with ongoing, generation-long development, designed to make an impact not just now but in the medium and very long term.

With that in mind, the review encapsulated actions as diverse as supplementing child trust fund contributions for children raised in local authority care, which has now been done, referrals to money advice agencies for those affected by divorce, redundancy and other life-changing events, and co-operation between Communities First and credit unions—thank you for raising that issue, Mick—which is an ongoing and difficult piece of work that will need time to roll out. There was also an action point to increase debt advice services and income maximisation initiatives, which are still under development as we speak.

That generational impetus enshrined in the review is perhaps best exemplified by the emphasis on financial literacy education, which should specifically be included in the secondary school curriculum. I agree with Sandy that the only way that future generations will understand and avoid the dangers of over-extending themselves financially, or simply understanding the multitude of financial decisions that all of us will be required to make as adults, is through education and practical learning. With that in mind, officials co-operated with the Treasury's long-term approach to financial capability that was launched on Monday, which gives us a better picture of the work that is going on throughout the UK and which will encourage information sharing and best practice.

Yn fy adolygiad o orddyled a gyhoeddwyd yn 2005 yr oedd Sandy yn ddigon caredig i'w grybwyll, gobeithio inni lwyddo i nodi effaith dyled ar unigolion, teuluoedd a chymunedau yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yr adolygiad yn cynnwys 10 argymhelliad i'w rhoi ar waith, a pharhaf i gredu, os cânt eu cyflawni'n briodol, y byddant yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol a pharhaol i bobl Cymru. Yr oedd yr argymhellion yn adlewyrchu dull cyfannol, amlochrog i fod o fudd i'r wlad gyfan, gan gyfuno newid uniongyrchol ac adferol â datblygiad parhaus, ar hyd cenedlaethau, wedi'i gynllunio i gael effaith, nid yn unig yn awr, ond yn y tymor canolig a hir iawn.

O ystyried hynny, yr oedd yr adolygiad yn cwmpasu camau gweithredu mor amrywiol ag ychwanegu at gyfraniadau cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant ar gyfer plant sy'n cael eu magu yng ngofal awdurdod lleol, a gwnaed hynny erbyn hyn, cyfeirio pobl y mae ysgariad, diswyddo a digwyddiadau eraill sy'n newid bywyd wedi effeithio arnynt at asiantaethau cyngor am arian, a chydweithredu rhwng Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac undebau credyd—diolch ichi am godi'r mater hwnnw, Mick—sy'n ddarn o waith parhaus ac anodd y bydd angen amser i'w gyflwyno. Cafwyd cam gweithredu hefyd i gynyddu gwasanaethau cynghori ar ddyled a mentrau cynyddu incwm, sy'n cael eu datblygu ar hyn o bryd.

Caiff y symbyliad cenedlaeth hwnnw sy'n rhan sylfaenol o'r adolygiad ei adlewyrchu yn y ffordd orau o bosibl gan y pwyslais ar addysg llythrennedd ariannol, y dylid ei chynnwys yn benodol yn y cwricwlwm addysg uwchradd. Cytunaf â Sandy mai dim ond drwy addysg a dysgu ymarferol y gall cenedlaethau'r dyfodol ddeall ac osgoi'r peryglon o ymestyn eu hunain yn ormodol o'r safbwynt ariannol, neu, yn syml, deall y penderfyniadau ariannol niferus y bydd yn ofynnol i bob un ohonom eu gwneud fel oedolion. Gan ystyried hynny, bu i swyddogion gydweithredu â dull hirdymor y Trysorlys o ddelio â gallu ariannol a lansiwyd ddydd Llun, sy'n rhoi darlun gwell inni o'r gwaith a wneir ledled y DU ac a fydd yn annog y broses o rannu gwybodaeth ac arfer gorau.

In doing so, the UK Government announced plans to work with financial education bodies and provide new curriculum guidance for schools on this subject. That work will serve to complement what we are doing in Wales. For example, the snappily titled Welsh financial literacy consultative group meets frequently and brings together the key players involved.

I agree that financial literacy education in schools is crucial and is a priority, and I continue to believe, Sandy, that the Flint High School model, as I think of it, is undoubtedly the best that I have seen to date. Therefore, I am pleased to report to Plenary, as I did to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee last October, that my recommendation to boost the curriculum formally and to devise appropriate guidance has been acknowledged in the consultation on the revised schools curriculum. I understand that the existing elements of financial literacy in the personal and social education curriculum are to be strengthened, and it is hoped that this form of learning will also be extended to the mathematics curriculum. The consultation on a revised curriculum has yet to conclude, but it is hoped that a much improved programme of financial literacy education will be delivered in the classroom within as little as 20 months, at the start of the school year in September 2008.

6.20 p.m.

I hope and envisage that this revised curriculum will pay close attention to many of the fantastic initiatives that are being developed across Wales—all eyes are on Flint. Many of those are highlighted in the Financial Services Authority's benchmark study on personal financial education in schools, published in June last year. It testifies to the importance, not being lost on our schools, that we, in Wales, are significantly more committed than other parts of the UK to making financial education a formal part of the curriculum, as opposed to merely an element of enterprise education, as it currently exists. However, we must also

Wrth wneud hynny, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU gynlluniau i weithio gyda chyrff addysg ariannol a rhoi canllawiau cwricwlwm newydd i ysgolion ar y pwnc hwn. Bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n ategu'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, mae'r grŵp ymgynghorol ar llythrennedd ariannol yng Nghymru sydd â theitl mor fachog yn cyfarfod yn aml ac yn dod â'r grwpiau allweddol sy'n cymryd rhan at ei gilydd.

Cytunaf fod addysg llythrennedd ariannol mewn ysgolion yn hanfodol a'i bod yn flaenoriaeth, ac yr wyf yn dal i gredu, Sandy, mai model Ysgol Uwchradd y Fflint, fel yr wyf yn meddwl amdano, yw'r un gorau a welais hyd yma, heb amheuaeth. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud wrth y Cyfarfod Llawn, fel y gwneuthum wrth y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio fis Hydref y llynedd, fod fy argymhelliad i hybu'r cwricwlwm yn ffurfiol ac i lunio canllawiau priodol wedi'i gydnabod yn yr ymgynghori ar y cwricwlwm diwygiedig i ysgolion. Deallaf y bwriedir atgyfnerthu elfennau presennol llythrennedd ariannol yn y cwricwlwm addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol, a gobeithio y caiff y dull hwn o ddysgu hefyd ei ehangu i'r cwricwlwm mathemateg. Nid yw'r ymgynghori ar gwricwlwm diwygiedig wedi'i gwblhau eto, ond gobeithio y caiff rhaglen lawer gwell o addysg llythrennedd ariannol ei chyflwyno yn yr ystafell ddosbarth o fewn cyn lleied ag 20 mis, ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn ysgol ym mis Medi 2008.

Yr wyf yn gobeithio ac yn rhagweld y bydd y cwricwlwm diwygiedig hwn yn rhoi sylw manwl i nifer o'r mentrau arbennig sy'n cael eu datblygu ledled Cymru—mae llygaid pawb ar y Fflint. Caiff llawer o'r rheini eu hamlygu yn astudiaeth feincnod yr Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol ar addysg ariannol bersonol mewn ysgolion, a gyhoeddwyd fis Mehefin y llynedd. Mae'n tystio i bwysigrwydd ffaith na ddylai ein hysgolion eu hanwybyddu ein bod ni, yng Nghymru, wedi ymrwymo lawer yn fwy na rhannau eraill o'r DU i wneud addysg ariannol yn rhan ffurfiol o'r cwricwlwm, yn hytrach nag yn elfen o addysg menter yn

acknowledge the burden of the present curriculum on our schools and our teachers, who cannot be expected to assume the responsibility for undertaking this form of instruction without additional help and support. The recent FSA benchmark study of personal financial education revealed that only 30 per cent of our secondary schools received support to deliver this form of education, yet the majority of 11 to 18-year-olds want this type of education to be taught in schools.

Therefore, to ensure that these curriculum changes are delivered in a co-ordinated, effective and cohesive fashion, we also intend to establish a new institution: the Welsh centre for financial education. Expert advisers in this centre will provide teachers and schools with access to the guidance, resources, advice and tools that they need to properly deliver the financial literacy element of a revised curriculum. Discussions on its establishment have already generated cross-working and the Assembly Government's Department for Social Justice and Regeneration and Department for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills have collaborated to devise the proposal and to elicit the necessary logistical, financial and expert support. By the same token, the FSA has agreed to work with us to get this body up and running, as there is some commonality between our ambitions and the requirements imposed on the FSA under its national financial capability strategy. I am grateful for that, and I take this opportunity to thank the FSA for its continued support; it has proved to be a key ally in this work.

Similarly, the credit union movement in Wales, its personal financial education group and our network of citizens advice bureaux have expressed a willingness to become involved; we will take them at their word. The proposed centre will be holistic in its approach and will have a number of specific functions. It will ascertain the state of

unig, sef y sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod baich y cwricwlwm presennol ar ein hysgolion a'n hathrawon, na ellir disgwyl iddynt gymryd y cyfrifoldeb o ddarparu'r math hwn o hyfforddiant heb help a chefnogaeth ychwanegol. Datgelodd astudiaeth feincnod yn ddiweddar gan yr Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol o addysg ariannol bersonol mai 30 y cant yn unig o'n hysgolion uwchradd a gafodd gefnogaeth i ddarparu'r math hwn o addysg, ac eto mae'r mwyafrif o blant 11 i 18 mlwydd oed am weld y math hwn o addysg yn cael ei addysgu mewn ysgolion.

Felly, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y newidiadau hyn yn y cwricwlwm eu darparu mewn modd cydgysylltiedig, effeithiol a chydlynol, yr ydym hefyd yn bwriadu creu sefydliad newydd: canolfan addysg ariannol Cymru. Bydd ymgynghorwyr arbenigol yn y ganolfan hon yn rhoi'r cyfle i athrawon ac ysgolion gael y canllawiau, yr adnoddau, y cyngor a'r offer y mae eu hangen arnynt i ddarparu elfen llythrennedd ariannol y cwricwlwm diwygiedig yn briodol. Mae trafodaethau ynghylch ei sefydlu eisoes wedi ysgogi cydweithio ar draws adrannau, ac mae Adran dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ac adran Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cydweithio i lunio'r cynnig ac i sicrhau'r cymorth logistaidd, ariannol ac arbenigol angenrheidiol. Yn yr un modd, mae'r Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol wedi cytuno i weithio gyda ni i roi'r corff hwn ar waith, gan fod nodweddion cyffredin rhwng ein huchelgeisiau ni a'r gofynion a roddwyd ar yr Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol o dan ei strategaeth genedlaethol ar allu ariannol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny, ac achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i'r Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol am ei gefnogaeth barhaus; bu'n gyd-weithiwr allweddol yn y gwaith hwn.

Yn yr un modd, mae'r mudiad undebau credyd yng Nghymru, ei grŵp addysg ariannol bersonol a'n rhwydwaith ni o ganolfannau cyngor ar bopeth wedi mynegi parodrwydd i gymryd rhan; byddwn yn cymryd eu gair. Bydd y ganolfan arfaethedig yn gyfannol o ran ei hymagwedd a bydd iddi nifer o swyddogaethau penodol. Bydd yn

financial education in Welsh schools and will provide the objectivity and impartiality that a comprehensive assessment of the status quo demands.

Teachers, schools, colleges and education authorities will be helped to provide a high standard of financial capability suited to the needs of all learners. The centre's employees will catalogue and evaluate existing resources and develop new ones to meet needs. There is, as we have noted today, a wealth of superb work going on across the country and we need to map and tap that work. Officials in the research and innovation department are already considering how best to survey and plot the activity. You could look to examples like the launch by Ysgol Gyfun Emlyn, Newcastle Emlyn, of a bank for sixth formers and the delivery of certificated financial studies, or to the example of credit unions and their superb work with local schools, such as Managing Money in Flint High School—we keep coming back to that, Sandy—or to the dealing with debt CD-Rom resource that is not exclusively designed for school-based delivery but could be tailored for that kind of environment. Those are all of undisputed value.

Most importantly, I hope that the centre will prove self-sustaining and will be able to secure sponsorship, which is important, from the private sector, so that its remit and capacity may grow. If successful, it is possible that the role of the centre might be extended to deliver educational awareness to young people in innovative settings, not just in schools, and to extend its remit to develop and deliver awareness, raising opportunities for adults as well.

To conclude, the establishment of this centre and the application of a new curriculum represents a sea change in our approach to debt issues—one that sees the individual as more than a mere consumer, which is part of the problem with the culture of debt that we are in. It will also bring together all partners and agencies, establishing the importance of support and education. It is crucial that we

cadarnhau cyflwr addysg ariannol mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru a bydd yn rhoi'r gwrthrychedd a'r amhleidioldeb sy'n ofynnol gan asesiad cynhwysfawr o'r sefyllfa bresennol.

Caiff athrawon, ysgolion, colegau ac awdurdodau addysg eu helpu i ddarparu safon uchel o allu ariannol sy'n addas i anghenion pob dysgwr. Bydd cyflogeion y ganolfan yn cofnodi ac yn gwerthuso'r adnoddau presennol ac yn datblygu rhai newydd i ddiwallu anghenion. Fel y dywedwyd heddiw, mae cyfoeth o waith ardderchog yn mynd ymlaen ledled y wlad, ac mae angen inni fapio a manteisio ar y gwaith hwnnw. Mae swyddogion yn yr adran ymchwil ac arloesedd eisoes yn ystyried sut i arolygu ac olrhain y gweithgaredd hwnnw yn y ffordd orau. Gallech edrych ar enghreifftiau megis lansio banc ar gyfer myfyrwyr chweched dosbarth gan Ysgol Gyfun Emlyn, Castellnewydd Emlyn a darparu astudiaethau ariannol ardystiedig, neu enghraifft yr undebau credyd a'u gwaith arbennig gydag ysgolion lleol, megis Rheoli Arian yn Ysgol Uwchradd y Fflint—yr ydym yn dal i gyfeirio at hwnnw, Sandy—neu'r adnodd CD-Rom ar ddelio â dyled nad yw wedi ei fwriadu'n unig i'w ddarparu mewn ysgolion ond y gellir ei addasu ar gyfer y math hwnnw o amgylchedd. Mae'r rheini oll yn werthfawr iawn.

Yn bwysicaf oll, gobeithio y bydd y ganolfan yn hunangynhaliol ac y bydd yn gallu sicrhau nawdd, sy'n bwysig, gan y sector preifat, fel y gall ei chylch gwaith a'i gallu gynyddu. Os bydd yn llwyddiannus, mae'n bosibl y gellir ehangu rôl y ganolfan i ddarparu ymwybyddiaeth addysgol i bobl ifanc mewn mannau arloesol, nid mewn ysgolion yn unig, ac i ehangu ei chylch gwaith i ddatblygu a darparu ymwybyddiaeth, gan sicrhau cyfleoedd i oedolion hefyd.

I gloi, mae sefydlu'r ganolfan hon a defnyddio cwricwlwm newydd yn newid sylfaenol yn ein hymagwedd at faterion yn ymwneud â dyled—mae'n un sy'n ystyried yr unigolyn fel rhywun sy'n fwy na defnyddiwr yn unig, sef rhan o'r broblem ynglŷn â diwylliant dyled sy'n ein hwynebu. Bydd hefyd yn dod â'r holl bartneriaid a'r asiantaethau at ei gilydd, gan sefydlu

challenge, and endeavour to eradicate, as Mick said, the culture of debt and exclusion that proves such an impediment to the wealth and health of the economy, and, more importantly, to society and to the individual. I believe that we are moving in the right direction and we have enormous cross-party will in the Assembly to continue to do so. I thank those who have contributed to the debate.

pwysigrwydd cefnogaeth ac addysg. Mae'n hanfodol inni herio a cheisio dileu, fel y dywedodd Mick, y diwylliant o ddyled ac allgáu sy'n gymaint o rwystr i gyfoeth ac iechyd yr economi, ac yn bwysicach, i gymdeithas ac i'r unigolyn. Credaf ein bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir, ac mae gennym lawer o ewyllys ar draws y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad i barhau i wneud hynny. Diolch i'r rhai a gyfrannodd at y ddadl.

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Cymunedau Mwy Diogel Safer Communities

**Leanne Wood:** I have received requests from Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Mark Isherwood and Mick Bates to contribute to this debate, if time allows.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr wyf wedi cael ceisiadau gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Mark Isherwood a Mick Bates i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon, os bydd amser yn caniatáu.

We cannot have safe communities unless we have active communities, and, for communities to be active they need facilities—shops, pubs, post offices, schools, health services and jobs—to act as a hub for the community. They also need to be places where young people want to stay, or where people with a contribution to make want to move. Many of our communities in Wales are losing their young people, especially the highly skilled, and as long as this brain drain continues, these areas will become more deprived. Safer communities can mean many things, but for the purposes of this debate, safe communities are ones in which people can move around freely in public spaces and in their own homes, without fear for their personal safety, or for the safety of those in their care; this means being safe from crime.

Ni allwn gael cymunedau diogel oni fydd gennym gymunedau gweithredol, ac er mwyn i gymunedau fod yn weithredol mae angen cyfleusterau arnynt—siopau, tafarndai, swyddfeydd post, ysgolion, gwasanaethau iechyd a swyddi—i fod yn ganolfan i'r gymuned. Yn ogystal, mae angen iddynt fod yn fannau lle bydd pobl ifanc am aros, neu lle bydd pobl sydd â chyfraniad i'w wneud am symud iddynt. Mae llawer o'n cymunedau yng Nghymru yn colli eu pobl ifanc, yn enwedig y rhai sydd â sgiliau uchel, a chyhyd ag y bydd yr all-lif hwn yn parhau, aiff yr ardaloedd hyn yn fwy difreintiedig. Gall cymunedau mwy diogel olygu llawer o bethau, ond at ddibenion y ddadl hon, cymunedau diogel yw'r rhai y gall pobl symud yn rhydd ynddynt, mewn mannau cyhoeddus ac yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, heb ofni am eu diogelwch personol, neu ddiogelwch y rhai yn eu gofal; mae hyn yn golygu bod yn ddiogel rhag trosedd.

Fear of crime is disproportionate to actual crime—I will not go over this point again, because Alun Ffred covered it in his short debate a few weeks ago. Crime levels are falling and have been doing so throughout Europe since 1995. Having said that, an estimated three quarters of property crime is heroin related. The war on drugs has failed, and failed miserably. Not only are more drugs available on our streets than ever

Mae ofn trosedd lawer iawn yn fwy na'r troseddu gwirioneddol—nid wyf am ailadrodd y pwynt hwn eto, oherwydd bu Alun Ffred yn ei drafod yn ei ddadl fer ychydig wythnosau'n ôl. Mae lefelau troseddau'n gostwng ac wedi bod yn gostwng ledled Ewrop er 1995. Ar ôl dweud hynny, amcangyfrifir bod tri chwarter y troseddau sy'n ymwneud ag eiddo yn gysylltiedig â heroin. Mae'r rhyfel yn erbyn cyffuriau wedi

before, but the UK has the highest rate of drug deaths in Europe, and our death toll continues to rise.

I worked for the probation service in the Rhondda in the mid 1990s when our office lost 10 young people due to a batch of over-pure heroin. I will never forget the story of a four-year old clinging to its mother's body for three days before she was found. They may have been addicts, but they were also sons, daughters, sisters, brothers, mothers and fathers. Let us make no mistake about it: while the risks are higher in deprived areas, anyone's kids can find themselves involved. Heroin is a drug of rebellion and a way out for unhappy teenagers. It is a drug of escape for people with memories that they want to forget, and, worryingly, it is becoming the alternative to cannabis in scarce times.

Three year ago, Richard Brunstrom, the chief constable of North Wales Police, who has been mentioned quite a few times in the Chamber this afternoon, caused a media storm by calling for diamorphine or medical-grade heroin to be prescribed to drug dependents in order to reduce crime. More recently, back in November, Howard Roberts, the deputy chief constable of Nottinghamshire Police, argued the same point, saying that addicts committed an average of 432 offences a year, and that three quarters of street robbers test positive for heroin. He also argued that the move would be cost effective, as it would cost around £12,000 a year for each person to be treated this way under close supervision, saving £45,000 per patient, per year, in property crime. The Association of Chief Police Officers adopted support for diamorphine prescription back in 2002, and, in the same year, David Cameron also supported the position. Pilot schemes have seen heroin prescribed under strict medical conditions in Holland, Germany, Switzerland and Spain, and trials are currently under way in London, Brighton and north-east England to test the efficacy of prescribing heroin rather than

methu, ac wedi methu'n ofnadwy. Nid yn unig y mae mwy o gyffuriau ar gael ar ein strydoedd nag erioed o'r blaen, ond mae gan y DU y gyfradd uchaf yn Ewrop o farwolaethau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau, ac mae ein cyfradd marwolaethau yn parhau i godi.

Yr oeddwn hyn gweithio i'r gwasanaeth prawf yn Rhondda yng nghanol y 1990au pan gollodd ein swyddfa 10 o bobl ifanc oherwydd llwyth o heroin gor-bur. Nid anghofiaf byth y stori am blentyn pedair oed yn gafael yng nghorff ei fam am dri diwrnod cyn iddi gael ei darganfod. Hwyrach eu bod yn gaeth i gyffuriau, ond roeddent hefyd yn feibion, yn ferched, yn chwiorydd, yn frodyr, yn famau a thadau. Peidied neb â chamgymryd: er bod y risgiau'n uwch mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, gall plant unrhyw un fod yn gysylltiedig â hyn. Cyffur gwrthryfela hyw heroin a ffordd allan i blant anhapus yn eu harddegau. Mae'n gyffur dianc i blant sydd ag atgofion y maent am eu hanghofio, ac yn bryderus mae'n dod yn gyffur yn lle cannabis pan fydd hwnnw'n brin.

Dair blynedd yn ôl, achosodd Richard Brunstrom, prif gwnstabl Heddlu Gogledd Cymru a grybwyllwyd droeon yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma, helynt yn y cyfryngau pan ofynnodd am ragnodi diamorffin neu heroin gradd feddygol i bobl a oedd yn gaeth i gyffuriau er mwyn lleihau troseddau. Yn fwy diweddar, ym mis Tachwedd, dadleuodd Howard Roberts, diprwy brif gwnstabl Heddlu Swydd Nottingham, yr un pwynt gan ddweud bod pobl sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau yn cyflawni 432 o droseddau y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd, a bod tri chwarter y lladron stryd yn cael canlyniad cadarnhaol i brawf heroin. Dadleuodd hefyd y byddai'r cam hwn yn gost effeithiol, oherwydd byddai'n costio tua £12,000 y flwyddyn i bob un gael ei drin fel hyn dan oruchwyliaeth agos, gan arbed £45,000 y flwyddyn am bob claf mewn troseddau'n ymwneud ag eiddo. Cafodd Cymdeithas Prif Swyddogion yr Heddlu gefnogaeth i ragnodi diamorffin yn 2002, ac yn yr un flwyddyn cafwyd cefnogaeth gan David Cameron hefyd. Mae heroin wedi cael ei ragnodi mewn cynlluniau peilot o dan amodau meddygol llym yn yr Iseldiroedd, yr Almaen, y Swistir a Sbaen, ac mae treialon yn mynd ymlaen yn Llundain, Brighton a

methodone to the most chaotic and dependent users. The trials end this summer and it is believed that, by next year, the Home Secretary, John Reid, will have approved a scheme for heroin dependents who have failed to respond to other forms of treatment, to be offered injectable heroin on prescription.

The European pilot schemes have shown an improvement in physical and mental health, and an increased ability to function in society. The German study, which had 500 people on methodone and 500 people on diamorphine, found that people do better on diamorphine on all counts, and that an average of £8,500 was saved per patient in reduced crime, and police and court costs.

6.30 p.m.

It also found that treatment drop-out rates were far lower, that the use of illicit drugs was far less, and that people on the programme were able to function, work and contribute to society. The pilot schemes have proved that this is a treatment that works for people who have tried and relapsed with everything else, including rehabilitation, detoxification, counselling and prison. Drop-out rates for current programmes are very high, and those programmes are not cheap.

Medicalising the image of heroin has also had benefits. In Zurich, where they have been prescribing diamorphine for 10 years, there has been an 82 per cent drop in new users. There, heroin is now seen as a loser's drug; it has been transformed from an image of rebellion to one of illness. There have been attempts to start a serious debate on drugs policy in Wales before, but they have been thwarted by backbench accusations and inaccurate hype. I sincerely hope that we have moved on, and that we can now think about developing some sort of cross-party consensus on the future of a Welsh drugs policy.

gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr ar hyn o bryd i brofi effeithlonrwydd rhagnodi heroin yn hytrach na methodon i'r defnyddwyr mwyaf mynych a chaeth. Daw'r treialon i ben yn ystod yr haf eleni, a chredir erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf y bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, John Reid, wedi cymeradwyo cynllun ar gyfer pobl sy'n gaeth i heroin ac sydd wedi methu ag ymateb i fathau eraill o driniaeth, i gael cynnig heroin y gellir ei chwistrellu ar bresgripsiwn.

Mae'r cynlluniau peilot Ewropeaidd wedi dangos gwelliant mewn iechyd corfforol a meddwl, a gallu cynyddol i weithredu mewn cymdeithas. Dangosodd astudiaeth yr Almaen, a oedd yn cynnwys 500 o bobl ar fethodon a 500 o bobl ar ddiamorffin, fod pobl yn gwneud yn well ar ddiamorffin ar bob cyfrif, a bod £8,500 ar gyfartaledd wedi ei arbed am bob claf drwy lai o droseddau, a chostau'r heddlu a'r llysoedd.

Cafodd hefyd fod y cyfraddau o roi'r gorau i driniaeth lawer yn is, bod defnyddio cyffuriau anghyfreithlon lawer yn is, a bod pobl ar y rhaglen yn gallu gweithredu, gweithio a chyfrannu at gymdeithas. Mae'r cynlluniau peilot wedi profi bod y driniaeth hon yn gweithio i bobl sydd wedi rhoi cynnig ar bopeth arall ac wedi dychwelyd i'w hen arferion, gan gynnwys rhaglenni ailsefydlu, rhaglenni dadwenwyno, gwasanaethau cynghori a'r carchar. Mae'r cyfraddau ar gyfer rhoi'r gorau i raglenni presennol yn uchel iawn, ac nid yw'r rhaglenni hynny'n rhad.

Mae meddygiaethu'r ddelwedd o heroin wedi bod o fudd hefyd. Yn Zurich, lle maent wedi bod yn rhagnodi diamorffin ers 10 mlynedd, bu gostyngiad o 82 y cant yn nifer y defnyddwyr newydd. Yno caiff heroin ei ystyried bellach fel cyffur pobl sy'n methu; mae wedi ei drawsnewid o ddelwedd o wrthryfela i ddelwedd o salwch. Ceisiwyd cychwyn trafodaeth ddifrifol ar bolisi cyffuriau yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol, ond fe'i rhwystrwyd gan gyhuddiadau o'r meinciau cefn a chyhoeddusrwydd anghywir. Yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr ein bod wedi symud ymlaen, ac y gallwn bellach feddwl am ddatblygu rhyw fath o gonsensws

trawsbleidiol ar ddyfodol polisi cyffuriau Cymru.

Plaid Cymru has taken seriously the problems caused in our communities by heroin addiction. It is time to make a difference. Our manifesto will contain a section pledging to work to devolve all aspects of criminal justice policy to Cardiff, so that we can implement a crime-reduction strategy that focuses on the causes of crime and the causes of substance misuse. We will pledge to roll out diamorphine on prescription, under strict medical supervision, if the pilots in England prove to be a success. The manifesto will also include a commitment to provide a harm-reduction strategy, which includes counselling services, support for needle-exchange schemes and safer injecting facilities as well as a harm-reduction education programme.

We hope to build cross-party consensus in favour of an alternative substance misuse policy. There can be a Welsh way for criminal justice, and that is why we need Home Office powers. I hope that Members are keen to be involved in some form of cross-party committee to conduct a comprehensive review of Welsh drugs policy, should we be returned to the Assembly in May.

The current system is not working. The number of people using heroin problematically continues to grow. People are continuing to die. These problems are everywhere, but they are causing untold damage in the Valleys in particular. Plaid Cymru is offering an alternative. Stale, tabloid headline-grabbing policies have failed; they have failed those addicted to heroin, their families and all of our communities. If we are serious about making a difference, we cannot allow the status quo to continue.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I commend Leanne for raising this issue, and for calling for a mature and serious public debate on the matter. Quite a bit of the cynicism that has developed around politics, and the apathy of

Mae Plaid Cymru wedi ystyried y problemau a achosir yn ein cymunedau gan gaethiwed i heroin o ddifrif. Mae'n bryd gwneud gwahaniaeth. Bydd ein maniffesto yn cynnwys adran sy'n addo gweithio i ddatganoli pob agwedd ar bolisi cyfiawnder troseddol i Gaerdydd, fel y gallwn weithredu strategaeth i leihau troseddau sy'n canolbwyntio ar yr hyn sy'n achosi troseddau a chamddefnyddio sylweddau. Byddwn yn addo cyflwyno presgripsiynau diamorffin, o dan oruchwyliaeth feddygol lym, os bydd y cynlluniau peilot yn Lloegr yn llwyddiannus. Bydd y maniffesto hefyd yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i gyflwyno strategaeth i leihau niwed, sy'n cynnwys darparu gwasanaethau cynghori, cefnogi cynlluniau cyfnewid nodwyddau a chyfleusterau mwy diogel ar gyfer rhoi pigladau yn ogystal â rhaglen addysgu am leihau niwed.

Yr ydym yn gobeithio cael consensws trawsbleidiol o blaid polisi ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau amgen. Gallwn gael ffordd Gymreig i ymdrin â chyfiawnder troseddol, a dyna pam mae arnom angen pwerau gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Gobeithio fod yr Aelodau yn awyddus i fod yn rhan o ryw fath o bwyllgor trawsbleidiol i gynnal adolygiad cynhwysfawr o bolisi cyffuriau i Gymru, os cawn ein hethol eto i'r Cynulliad ym mis Mai.

Nid yw'r system bresennol yn gweithio. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio heroin mewn ffordd broblematic yn parhau i dyfu. Mae pobl yn parhau i farw. Mae'r problemau hyn i'w gweld ym mhobman, ond maent yn peri niwed mawr yn y Cymoedd yn arbennig. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cynnig dewis amgen. Mae hen bolisiau sy'n cael sylw yn y papurau tabloid wedi methu; maent wedi methu'r rheini sy'n gaeth i heroin, eu teuluoedd a'n holl gymunedau. Os ydym o ddifrif am wneud gwahaniaeth, ni allwn adael i'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni barhau.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Hoffwn ganmol Leanne am godi'r mater hwn, ac am alw am drafodaeth gyhoeddus aeddfed a difrifol ar y mater. Mae tipyn o'r sinigiaeth sydd wedi datblygu o amgylch gwleidyddiaeth, ac



electors, comes from the fact that people feel that politicians sometimes avoid controversial subjects and duck the important decisions. As Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, I have been approached by clinicians and health professionals generally who are concerned about the way in which methadone is prescribed to all heroin addicts. They have real concerns as to whether it is the best way forward, and about the kind of addiction that can develop as a result.

I believe that we need to have this debate; it must be a cross-party debate, and we must move forward. As Leanne said, more importantly, we must remember that addicts are people, that they are human beings, that they have problems, and that it is our responsibility as politicians to try to respond as positively as we can to them and to offer them the best possible support and provision. I commend Leanne's argument, and I hope that it will receive cross-party support.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you, Leanne, for this short debate on safer communities, and for your emphasis on the impact of drugs, especially heroin, on our communities, and the damage that they cause. I fully support your call for a cross-party group to be established to look into this. As we are all aware—or at least the few of us who are left in the Chamber—the political point-scoring that is associated with anyone trying to rationalise how we treat drugs and addiction and educate people about it has been accompanied by moves to the extremes, arousing great statements about how people are soft on drugs and so on. However, the evidence suggests that every £1 spent on treating addiction and education saves £3 in expenditure on criminal cases by the police and the courts. That is a genuine economic saving.

Finally, I would just like to point out that, in the 1960s, heroin was prescribed by general practitioners; it was outlawed by the Misuse of Drugs Act 1971, and, since then, the number of people using heroin has increased by more than 1,000 per cent. If you want more evidence to put on the record, there is a

apathi etholwyr, yn deillio o'r ffaith bod pobl yn credu bod gwleidyddion weithiau'n osgoi pynciau dadleuol ac yn gochel rhag gwneud penderfyniadau pwysig. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae clinigwyr a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn gyffredinol wedi dod ataf i leisio'u pryderon am y ffordd y caiff methadon ei ragnodi i bobl sy'n gaeth i heroin. Maent yn pryderu'n wirioneddol ai dyma'r ffordd orau ymlaen, ac am y math o gaethiwed a all ddatblygu o ganlyniad i hynny.

Credaf fod angen y ddadl hon arnom; rhaid iddi fod yn ddadl drawsbleidiol, a rhaid inni symud ymlaen. Fel y dywedodd Leanne, yn bwysicach, rhaid inni gofio mai pobl, bodau dynol, yw'r rheini sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau, bod ganddynt broblemau, a'i fod yn gyfrifoldeb arnom ni fel gwleidyddion i geisio ymateb iddynt mewn ffordd mor gadarnhaol â phosibl a chynnig y cymorth a'r ddarpariaeth orau posibl iddynt. Yr wyf yn canmol dadl Leanne, a gobeithio y caiff gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch, Leanne, am y ddadl fer hon ar gymunedau mwy diogel, ac am eich pwyslais ar effaith cyffuriau, yn enwedig heroin, ar ein cymunedau, a'r niwed y maent hyn ei achosi. Cefnogaf eich cais i sefydlu grŵp trawsbleidiol i edrych ar hyn yn llawn. Fel y gwyddom i gyd—neu o leiaf y rhai hynny ohonom sydd ar ôl yn y Siambr—mae'r ymgais i ennill pwyntiau gwleidyddol sy'n gysylltiedig ag unrhyw un sy'n ceisio rhesymoli sut i drin cyffuriau a chaethiwed ac addysgu pobl amdano wedi digwydd ar yr un pryd â chymau i'r eithafion, gan arwain at osodiadau mawr am y ffordd y mae pobl yn rhy oddefgar o gyffuriau ac ati. Fodd bynnag, mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu bod pob £1 a gaiff ei gwario ar addysg ac ar drin caethiwed yn arbed £3 mewn gwariant ar achosion troseddol gan yr heddlu a'r llysoedd. Mae hynny'n arbediad economaidd gwirioneddol.

Yn olaf, hoffwn dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod meddygon teulu, yn y 1960au, yn rhagnodi heroin; fe'i gwnaed yn anghyfreithlon gan Ddeddf Camddefnyddio Cyffuriau 1971, ac ers hynny mae nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio heroin wedi cynyddu dros 1,000 y cant. Os hoffech gael mwy o dystiolaeth i'w rhoi yn y

case in Liverpool. A Dr John Marks used special Home Office licences to prescribe heroin to addicts and, during that period, police reported a 96 per cent reduction in crime among that group of addicts. Deaths from locally acquired HIV infections and drug-related overdoses fell to zero, but, under intense political pressure—of the *Daily Mail* type that we see all too often—the project was forced to close. In its 10 years of work, not one of its patients had died; in the first two years after it closed, 41 people died.

**The Deputy Minister with Responsibility for Communities (Huw Lewis):** Thank you, Leanne, for bringing this important topic to Plenary today. I should acknowledge at the beginning of my response—and you will not be surprised by this—that we disagree fundamentally on most aspects of this subject, except one, namely that people in Wales deserve to live in safer communities. There is a problem with the central thesis of your contribution and that of Plaid Cymru, which rests on two things. The first is that the devolution of Home Office powers to Wales is somehow the key to answering the challenges that face the criminal justice system and, therefore, our communities. Secondly, you have given today—quite remarkably and, as far as I am aware, completely out of the blue—a Plaid Cymru manifesto pledge to provide heroin on prescription.

Okay, let us have a serious debate. You asked for it. I am heartened by your belief that a Labour Assembly Government would be successful in its approach to criminal justice issues, given that you are anxious to devolve those matters. However, your supposition flies in the face, and consists of a hasty dismissal, of all the recent crime trends in Wales. According to the British Crime Survey, you are less likely to be a victim of crime in Wales today than at any time since the survey began in 1981. Let us have recognition of that fact, and feed that into our thinking in terms of safer communities, which goes much further than the criminal justice system and drugs. I will address safer communities issues in the round, I hope.

cofnod, mae yna achos yn Lerpwl. Defnyddiodd Dr John Marks drwyddedau arbennig gan y Swyddfa Gartref i ragnodi heroin i'r rheini a oedd yn gaeth iddo, ac yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw dywedodd yr heddlu bod gostyngiad o 96 y cant mewn troseddau ymhlith y grŵp hwnnw o bobl. Ni fu unrhyw achosion o farwolaeth o'r haint HIV yn lleol na gorddosau cyffuriau, ond dan bwysau gwleidyddol aruthrol—fel math y *Daily Mail* a welwn yn rhy aml—bu'n rhaid i'r prosiect roi'r gorau iddi. Yn ystod 10 mlynedd o weithio, ni fu farw'r un o'r cleifion; yn y ddwy flynedd cyntaf ar ôl iddo orffen, bu farw 41 o bobl.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog â Chyfrifoldeb am Gymunedau (Huw Lewis):** Diolch, Leanne, am gyflwyno'r pwnc pwysig hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Dylwn gydnabod ar ddechrau fy ymateb—ac ni fydd hyn yn eich synnu—ein bod yn anghytuno'n llwyr â'r rhan fwyaf o'r agweddau ar y pwnc hwn, namyn un, sef bod pobl yng Nghymru yn haeddu byw mewn cymunedau mwy diogel. Mae yna broblem gyda thesis canolog eich cyfraniad chi a chyfraniad Plaid Cymru, sy'n seiliedig ar ddau beth. Y cyntaf yw mai datganoli pwerau'r Swyddfa Gartref i Gymru yw'r allwedd rywffordd i ymateb i'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r system cyfiawnder troseddol ac, felly, ein cymunedau. Yn ail, yr ydych heddiw—yn ddigon rhyfedd a, hyd y gwn i, yn gwbl annisgwyl—wedi rhoi addewid manifesto gan Blaid Cymru i ddarparu heroin ar bresgripsiwn.

Iawn, gadewch inni gael dadl ddifrifol. Yr oeddech yn gofyn amdani. Mae'ch cred y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o dan y Blaid Lafur yn llwyddo wrth ymdrin â materion cyfiawnder troseddol, gan eich bod yn awyddus i ddatganoli'r materion hynny, yn fy nghalonogi. Fodd bynnag, mae eich tybiaeth yn mynd yn groes i'r holl dueddiadau diweddar yng Nghymru o ran troseddau, ac yn cynnwys ymwrthodiad brysiog ohonynt. Yn ôl Arolwg Troseddau Prydain, yr ydych yn llai tebygol o ddiodeff trosedd yng Nghymru heddiw nag ar unrhyw adeg ers i'r arolwg ddechrau yn 1981. Gadewch inni gydnabod y ffaith honno, a'i hystyried wrth drafod cymunedau mwy diogel, sy'n mynd lawer ymhellach na'r

system cyfiawnder troseddol a chyffuriau. Byddaf yn ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â chymunedau mwy diogel yn eu cyfanrwydd, gobeithio.

I know, because I read it on Plaid Cymru's website, that Plaid Cymru's anti-social behaviour policy is based on one word: tolerance. I am confused by what that means. Is that not an extraordinarily one-sided approach to these issues? It reflects the one-sided approach that Leanne has reiterated today in terms of drugs policy. She tells us that the war on drugs has failed, but what does that mean? The Welsh Assembly Government has embraced the importance of rehabilitation and anti-drugs policy in the round, looking at the community and the individual in a respectful way. I hope that your statement does not mean that you would solely embrace those issues plus the medicalisation of drugs policy, and that you would drop issues of enforcement. That cannot be realistic. That kind of one-sided approach would serve only to fuel the criminal empires that are built on the drugs economy.

Gwn, oherwydd imi ei ddarllen ar wefan Plaid Cymru, fod polisi ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol Plaid Cymru yn seiliedig ar un gair: goddefgarwch. Nid wyf yn siŵr o'i ystyr. Onid yw hynny'n ffordd unochrog ryfeddol o ymdrin â'r materion hyn? Mae'n adlewyrchu'r ymagwedd unochrog a ailadroddwyd gan Leanne heddiw o ran polisi cyffuriau. Mae'n dweud wrthym fod y frwydr yn erbyn cyffuriau wedi methu, ond beth mae hynny'n ei olygu? Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cydnabod pwysigrwydd polisi ailsefydlu a gwrthgyffuriau yn ei gyfanrwydd, gan edrych ar y gymuned a'r unigolyn mewn modd parchus. Gobeithio nad yw eich datganiad yn golygu mai dim ond y materion hynny ynghyd â pholisi meddygiaethu cyffuriau y byddech yn ymdrin â hwy, gan roi materion gorfodi o'r neilltu. Ni all hynny fod yn realistig. Dim ond hwb i'r ymerodraethau troseddol sy'n seiliedig ar yr economi gyffuriau fyddai'r math hwnnw o ymagwedd unochrog.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you take an intervention?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A dderbyniwch myriad?

**Huw Lewis:** I will, if it is in order to do so.

**Huw Lewis:** Gwnaf, os yw hynny mewn trefn.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Yes, it is in order.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ydy, mae hynny mewn trefn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am afraid, Deputy Minister, that you heard a different speech from that which that I heard: Leanne Wood recognised that the crime figures are decreasing and she made that point clearly. Are you stating, on behalf of the Labour Government and the Labour Party, that you do not want to take part in a mature, serious debate about how heroin addicts are provided for?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn anffodus, Ddirprwy Weinidog, clywsoch araith wahanol i'r hyn a glywais i: cydnabu Leanne Wood fod y ffigurau troseddu yn gostwng a gwnaeth y pwynt hwnnw'n glir. A ydych yn dweud, ar ran y Llywodraeth Lafur a'r Blaid Lafur, nad ydych am gymryd rhan mewn dadl aeddfed a difrifol am y ffordd y darperir ar gyfer pobl sy'n gaeth i heroin?

6.40 p.m.

A range of clinicians and health professionals from every part of the system tell me that they are concerned about the situation; they

Mae amrywiaeth o glinigwyr a gweithwyr iechedd proffesiynol o bob rhan o'r system yn dweud wrthyf eu bod yn pryderu am y

tell me that the system as it is now does not work. Are you telling me that the Labour Government and the Labour Party want to opt out of a serious discussion about that?

**Huw Lewis:** There is no opt-out here. There would never be any abandonment of those damaged individuals, their families and communities, or of the serious problems that they face and can pose to the community. Of course there is no abandonment of these people, and no walking away from having a serious debate.

However, we have to understand that it ain't no good. It will not work if we have some kind of approach—and I am wondering what the opposite of zero tolerance is—that abandons law enforcement, and abandons the recognition of criminality and of the occasional need to address anti-social behaviour and crime, including drug-related crime, by the revolutionary concept of arresting criminals and putting them in prison. It is not good enough to abandon the enforcement of drug legislation and to entirely embrace medicalisation and rehabilitation only. We need a two-pronged approach. We have had this debate many times in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, as Leanne will remember.

It is an unpalatable truth, it seems, for Plaid Cymru and for some others, but you do not get safer communities without arresting criminals. I am not talking simply about those who are caught up in drug addiction. The most serious criminals of all are not actually those who are caught up in addiction, but those who feed off it financially. Those are the real criminals, and we cannot hope to approach tracking those people down and getting them where they should be—in prison—if our approach consists solely of the medicalisation of drugs issues plus providing heroin on prescription. We might as well give up and go home, and accept the damage—

**Leanne Wood:** Will you take an intervention?

**Huw Lewis:** I have given way once already.

sefyllfa; maent yn dweud wrthyf nad yw'r system bresennol yn gweithio. A ydych yn dweud wrthyf nad yw'r Llywodraeth Lafur a'r Blaid Lafur am gymryd rhan mewn trafodaeth ddifrifol am hynny?

**Huw Lewis:** Nid ydym yn dweud hynny. Ni fyddem byth yn troi ein cefnau ar yr unigolion hynny sydd wedi cael eu niweidio, eu teuluoedd a'u cymunedau, nac ar y problemau difrifol a wynebwr ganddynt ac y gallant eu peri i'r gymuned. Wrth gwrs nad ydym yn troi ein cefnau ar y bobl hyn, ac nid ydym yn osgoi dadl ddifrifol.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ddeall nad oes gwerth iddi. Ni fydd yn gweithio os byddwn yn gweithredu mewn modd—ac yr wyf yn ceisio meddwl beth yw'r gwrthwyneb i ddim goddefgarwch—sy'n rhoi'r gorau i orfodi'r gyfraith, ac yn rhoi'r gorau i gydnabod troseddoldeb a'r angen achlysurol i ymdrin ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a throseddau, gan gynnwys troseddau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau, drwy'r cysyniad chwyldroadol o arestio troseddwr a'u rhoi yn y carchar. Nid yw'n ddigon da rhoi'r gorau i orfodi deddfwriaeth cyffuriau a rhoi proses feddygiaethu ac ailsefydlu ar waith yn unig. Mae angen gweithredu mewn modd deublyg. Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn droeon yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, fel y bydd Leanne yn cofio.

Mae'n ymddangos yn wrthun i Blaid Cymru ac i rai eraill, yn ôl pob tebyg, ond ni allwch greu cymunedau mwy diogel heb arestio troseddwr. Nid siarad yn unig yr wyf am bobl sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau. Y troseddwr mwyaf difrifol yw'r rheini sy'n ymelwa'n ariannol ar gaethiwed, nid y rheini sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau. Nhw yw'r troseddwr gwirioneddol, ac ni allwn obeithio mynd ati i ddod o hyd i'r bobl hynny a'u rhoi yn y man priodol—yn y carchar—os meddygiaethu materion sy'n ymwneud â chyffuriau a darparu heroin ar bresgripsiwn yn unig a wnawn. Man a man inni roi'r gorau iddi a mynd adref, a derbyn y niwed—

**Leanne Wood:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi ildio

unwaith.

**Leanne Wood:** So that is a ‘no’ then, is it?

**Leanne Wood:** Felly ai ‘na’ yw’r ateb?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have 15 minutes, Minister.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennych 15 munud, Weinidog.

**Huw Lewis:** Very well.

**Huw Lewis:** Iawn.

**Leanne Wood:** It is your Home Secretary, John Reid, who is running these pilot schemes in England, and is likely to roll them out if they prove to be a success—and all indications are that they will prove to be a success. Are you saying that you disagree with John Reid on this?

**Leanne Wood:** Eich Ysgrifennydd Cartref chi, John Reid, sy’n rhedeg y cynlluniau peilot hyn yn Lloegr, ac mae’n debygol o’u cyflwyno’n gyffredinol os byddant yn llwyddiannus—ac mae’n ymddangos y byddant yn llwyddiannus. A ydych yn dweud eich bod yn anghytuno â John Reid ar hyn?

**Huw Lewis:** You asked for a mature debate, and yet you continually sidestep the issues. It is a simple point, and it is this: you cannot have a debate that kicks off, as Plaid Cymru would like, with tolerance coming first and community safety, second. It has to be the other way around; otherwise, in the world of reality, you immediately abandon any hope of gaining the confidence of those communities that have suffered tremendous damage from the illegal drugs trade, and from the effects that it has had on individuals and families. We have to recognise the need for preventative programmes first, which build on the success of projects such as On Track, which I know Leanne has been to see. That is a positive project, and at least we can agree on that. You will know that it is a pilot project, partially funded by the UK Government; it is a superb example of partnership working to tackle the causes of crime.

**Huw Lewis:** Yr oeddech yn gofyn am ddadl aeddfed, ac eto yr ydych yn osgoi’r problemau o hyd. Mae’n bwynt syml, sef hyn: ni allwch gael dadl sy’n cychwyn, fel yr hoffai Plaid Cymru, gyda goddefgarwch yn dod yn gyntaf a diogelwch cymunedol yn dod yn ail. Rhaid newid y drefn; neu, mewn byd real, yr ydych yn rhoi’r gorau ar unwaith i unrhyw obaith o ennyn hyder y cymunedau hynny sydd wedi dioddef niwed aruthrol yn sgil y fasnach cyffuriau anghyfreithlon, ac effeithiau hynny ar unigolion a theuluoedd. Mae’n rhaid inni gydnabod yr angen am raglenni ataliol yn gyntaf, sy’n adeiladu ar lwyddiant prosiectau megis ‘On Track’, yr wyf yn gwybod bod Leanne wedi bod i’w weld. Mae hwnnw’n brosiect cadarnhaol, ac o leiaf gallwn gytuno ar hynny. Byddwch yn gwybod mai prosiect peilot ydyw, a ariennir yn rhannol gan Lywodraeth y DU; mae’n enghraifft wych o weithio mewn partneriaeth i ymdrin ag achosion troseddu.

We must also recognise—and it is time that the opposition parties did—that we have made tremendous progress in the time that we have been in Government. Police officer numbers are at an all-time high—since the 1830s. The number of police officers in Wales has increased by 9.2 per cent, up to 7,500 back in September 2006. We now have 625 police community support officers on the streets of Wales, and crime rates continue to fall. During 2005-06, recorded crime in Wales fell by 3 per cent, compared with a 1 per cent decrease for England and Wales as a whole.

Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod—ac mae’n bryd i’r gwrthbleidiau wneud hynny—ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd aruthrol yn ystod ein cyfnod mewn grym. Mae niferoedd y swyddogion heddlu ar eu uchaf erioed—ers yr 1830au. Mae nifer y swyddogion heddlu yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 9.2 y cant, hyd at 7,500 yn ôl ym mis Medi 2006. Erbyn hyn mae gennym 625 o swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu ar strydoedd Cymru, ac mae cyfraddau troseddu’n dal i ostwng. Yn ystod 2005-06, gostyngodd nifer y troseddau a gofnodwyd yng Nghymru 3 y cant, o’i gymharu â gostyngiad o 1 y cant yng Nghymru a Lloegr at ei gilydd.

The Assembly's crime-fighting fund provides more than £132 million a year to support a range of Assembly initiatives, which impact on community safety. The crime-fighting fund enables focused, joined-up action on community safety issues. The link between drug use and crime is clearly established and recognised. I know that you are particularly concerned with this issue, Leanne; that much is obvious. Around three quarters of crack cocaine and heroin users claim that they commit crimes to feed their habits. The Assembly's priority is to break that chain, but it is perfectly legitimate to state that you cannot break it by simply taking one direction of attack.

The drug intervention programme is a key element of the Assembly's substance misuse strategy to tackle drug-related crime. It offers offenders whose crimes are drug-related the support that they need to kick the habit, and there is clear evidence that it works. This is not the status quo; this is progress. For every £1 spent on treatment, at least £9.50 is saved in the criminal justice system and on health costs. You cannot say, as Leanne did, that this is not a serious attempt to engage with the drug problem. The Assembly Government has increased the substance misuse action fund by 660 per cent since 2002—from £3.3 million to £22 million. Is that not a serious attempt to engage with the issue of drugs? Let us compare that with Plaid Cymru's stated commitment to set up a Welsh Home Office. How much would that cost? It would put £22 million in the shade. Let us get our priorities straight; it is not enough just to make something Welsh to solve it as an issue.

The £22 million that I mentioned is providing an extra 5,500 treatment places delivered by Welsh Labour since 2002. It also includes a capital allocation of £4.1 million per year to improve and enhance the range of substance misuse treatment facilities, including residential rehab facilities.

Mae cronfa'r Cynullaid i atal troseddu yn dyrannu dros £132 miliwn y flwyddyn i gefnogi amrywiaeth o fentrau gan y Cynulliad sy'n effeithio ar ddiogelwch cymunedol. Mae'r gronfa atal troseddu'n ein galluogi i gymryd camau gweithredu unedig sy'n canolbwyntio ar faterion diogelwch cymunedol. Mae'r cysylltiad rhwng defnyddio cyffuriau a throseddau wedi'i sefydlu a'i gydnabod yn glir. Gwn eich bod yn pryderu'n arbennig am y mater hwn, Leanne; mae hynny'n amlwg. Mae tua thri chwarter y defnyddwyr cocên crac a heroin yn honni eu bod yn cyflawni troseddau i ariannu eu harferion. Blaenoriaeth y Cynulliad yw torri'r gadwyn honno, ond mae'n hollol deg i ddweud na allwch ei thorri drwy edrych ar un ffordd yn unig o fynd o'i chwmpas hi.

Mae'r rhaglen ymyriadau cyffuriau yn elfen allweddol yn strategaeth y Cynulliad ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau i fynd i'r afael â throseddau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau. Mae'n cynnig i droseddwyr sydd â'u troseddau'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau y gefnogaeth angenrheidiol i roi'r gorau i'r arfer, a cheir tystiolaeth glir ei bod yn gweithio. Nid y sefyllfa sydd ohoni yw hyn, ond cynnydd. Am bob £1 a gaiff ei gwario ar driniaeth, arbedir o leiaf £9.50 ar gostau cyfiawnder troseddol ac iechyd. Ni allwch ddweud, fel y dywedodd Leanne, nad yw hyn yn ymgais ddifrifol i ymdrin â'r broblem gyffuriau. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cynyddu'r gronfa weithredu ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau 660 y cant er 2002—o £3.3 miliwn i £22 miliwn. Onid yw hynny'n ymgais ddifrifol i ymdrin â mater cyffuriau? Gadewch inni gymharu hynny â'r ymrwymiad y mae Plaid Cymru wedi'i ddatgan i sefydlu Swyddfa Gartref i Gymru. Faint fyddai cost hynny? Byddai'n llawer mwy na £22 miliwn. Gadewch inni gael ein blaenoriaethau'n gywir; nid yw'n ddigon i Gymreigio rhywbeth er mwyn datrys y mater.

Mae'r £22 miliwn y soniais amdano yn darparu 5,500 yn fwy o leoedd triniaeth sydd wedi eu darparu gan Lafur Cymru er 2002. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys dyraniad cyfalaf o £4.1 miliwn y flwyddyn i wella'r ystod o gyfleusterau trin camddefnyddio sylweddau, gan gynnwys cyfleusterau ailsefydlu preswyl.

The Assembly Government's strategy for tackling substance misuse in Wales also recognises the clear link between substance misuse and homelessness. This is complex, and you know this. Plaid Cymru knows this, as does Leanne as its spokesperson. The complexity of the issue requires us to get much deeper, as you are willing to do at committee level. However, when it comes to a public platform for policy presentation, Plaid Cymru falls back into these black-and-white simplicities. This is the problem.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We are asking for a serious debate on this.

**Huw Lewis:** You are getting the serious answer.

Between 2004 and 2008, we are allocating £16.3 million to provide accommodation projects linked to the provision of treatment for substance misuse. I hope that Plaid Cymru and opposition candidates across Wales will not be jumping on Nimbyist bandwagons in their areas when those rehabilitation centres are being debated and being delivered to the communities that may need them the most. I hope that they will not, because that is the forward progress that Leanne has been demanding.

The programmes are paying dividends. There was a 19 per cent reduction in acquisitive crime in 2005-06; that exceeded the Assembly Government's target by 4 per cent. We know that the larger proportion of acquisitive crime is connected to those drugs problems. That is a reduction of 20 per cent. This is forward progress; it is not the status quo.

We are also providing funding to address the availability of illegal substances. This is another issue that has been abandoned by Plaid Cymru. The Assembly Government provided more than £600,000 in funding in 2006-07 for operation Tarian. Tarian is having a significant impact in disrupting the supply of class-A drugs.

If I have time, I would like to refer back to

Mae strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru hefyd yn cydnabod y cysylltiad clir rhwng camddefnyddio sylweddau a digartrefedd. Mae hyn yn gymhleth, a gwyddoch hyn. Gŵyr Plaid Cymru hyn, fel y gŵyr Leanne, ei llefarydd. Mae cymhlethdod y mater hwn yn golygu bod angen mynd yn ddyfnach o lawer, fel yr ydych yn fodlon ei wneud ar lefel pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd galw am lwyfan cyhoeddus i gyflwyno polisi, mae Plaid Cymru yn mynnu defnyddio'r ddadl ddu a gwyn syml hon. Dyma'r broblem.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydym yn galw am ddadl ddifrifol ar hyn.

**Huw Lewis:** Yr ydych yn cael yr ateb difrifol.

Rhwng 2004 a 2008, yr ydym yn dyrannu £16.3 miliwn i ddarparu prosiectau llety sy'n gysylltiedig â darparu triniaeth am gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Gobeithio na fydd Plaid Cymru ac ymgeiswyr y gwrthbleidiau ar draws Cymru yn gwrthod y prosiectau hyn yn eu hardaloedd, pan gaiff y canolfannau ailsefydlu hynny eu trafod a'u darparu yn y cymunedau lle bydd eu hangen fwyaf efallai. Gobeithio na fyddant, gan mai dyna'r cynnydd y mae Leanne wedi bod yn galw amdano.

Mae'r rhaglenni yn talu ar eu canfed. Yr oedd gostyngiad o 19 y cant mewn troseddau caffaelgar yn 2005-06; yr oedd hynny 4 y cant yn uwch na tharged Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Gwyddom fod y gyfran uchaf o droseddau caffaelgar yn gysylltiedig â'r problemau cyffuriau hynny. Mae hynny'n ostyngiad o 20 y cant. Mae hyn yn gynnydd; nid y sefyllfa sydd ohoni.

Yr ydym hefyd yn darparu cyllid i fynd i'r afael ag argaeledd sylweddau anghyfreithlon. Mae hwn yn fater arall y mae Plaid Cymru wedi rhoi'r gorau iddo. Rhoddodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros £600,00 yn 2006-07 i ariannu ymgyrch Tarian. Mae Tarian yn cael effaith sylweddol ar atal y cyflenwad o gyffuriau dosbarth A.

Os oes gennyf amser, hoffwn gyfeirio'n ôl at

the importance of preventative programmes for a moment. Since 2003, the Assembly Government has provided more than £3.6 million in funding for the two On Track projects in Wales. On Track was set up as a pilot to develop areas of excellence in early prevention, and models that keep vulnerable children out of crime and help to develop policy. It is invaluable.

The Assembly Government is presently making some £13.4 million available to community safety partnerships between 2006 and 2009 to assist them with the implementation of the all-Wales youth offending strategy. This funding is for a wide range of schemes aimed at the reduction and prevention of crime by young people. The number of schemes funded is relevant to the restorative justice agenda, such as restorative justice in schools and the removal of graffiti from public places. As we all know, anti-social behaviour can blight our neighbourhoods and destroy communities. A selfish minority of vandals and others can make life a real misery for the honest majority. Only an approach that balances—and this is the key point for Welsh Labour in this debate—punitive measures with increased investment in boosting the life chances of those at risk of being involved in crime, including drug misusers, will succeed.

6.50 p.m.

We recognise that, and that is why, since 2003, there is an anti-social behaviour co-ordinator in every local authority in Wales, for instance, and why there is extensive legislation to tackle anti-social behaviour, which provides the police, local authorities, registered social landlords and so on with a wider, more flexible range of powers to meet their existing responsibilities and to respond to the needs of the community. We believe that nuisance behaviour, vandalism, dereliction, and so on can drag a community down and that it should be looked at as a whole. Holistic solutions should be sought. That is why the Assembly Government committed £200,000 in 2006-07 to fund four anti-social behaviour action area pilot schemes, which will address a range of

bwysigrwydd rhaglenni ataliol am ennyd. Er 2003, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi dros £3.6 miliwn i ariannu'r ddau brosiect On-Track yng Nghymru. Sefydlwyd On Track fel rhaglen beilot i ddatblygu meysydd rhagoriaeth mewn atal cynnar, a modelau sy'n atal plant diamddiffyn rhag troseddu ac sy'n helpu datblygu polisi. Mae'n amhrisiadwy.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrthi'n neilltuo £13.4 miliwn ar hyn o bryd i bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol rhwng 2006 a 2009 i'w cynorthwyo i weithredu'r strategaeth troseddau ieuencid i Gymru gyfan. Mae'r arian hwn ar gyfer ystod eang o gynlluniau sy'n anelu at leihau ac atal troseddu gan bobl ifanc. Mae nifer y cynlluniau a gaiff eu hariannu yn berthnasol i'r agenda cyfiawnder adferol, er enghraifft, cyfiawnder adferol mewn ysgolion a glanhau graffiti mewn mannau cyhoeddus. Fel y gwyddom i gyd, gall ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithsol fod yn bla ar ein cymdogaethau a difetha cymunedau. Gall lleiafrif hunanol o fandaliaid ac eraill wneud bywyd yn anodd iawn i'r mwyafrif gonest. Dim ond dull sy'n cydbwysu mesurau cosbol—a dyma'r pwynt allweddol i Lafur Cymru yn y ddadl hon—gyda mwy o fuddsoddi mewn hybu cyfleoedd bywyd i'r rheini sy'n wynebu perygl troseddu, gan gynnwys pobl sy'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau, a fydd yn llwyddo.

Yr ydym yn cydnabod hynny, a dyna pam, er 2003, y mae cydgysylltydd ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ym mhob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, er enghraifft, a pham y mae deddfwriaeth eang i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, sy'n rhoi pwerau ehangach a mwy hyblyg i'r heddlu, awdurdodau lleol, landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ac ati i gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau presennol ac ymateb i anghenion y gymuned. Credwn y gall ymddygiad sy'n achosi niwsans, fandaliaeth, dirywiaeth ac ati lethu cymuned, ac y dylid ei ystyried yn ei gyfanrwydd a chwilio am atebion cyfannol. Dyna pam y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo £200,000 yn 2006-07 i ariannu pedwar cynllun peilot mewn ardaloedd gweithredu ar ymddygiad



factors, such as low-level nuisance issues that cause such misery to people's lives, and preventing properties from being damaged by graffiti, vandalism and so on. A restoration of civic pride is the motivation behind that kind of work.

To summarise, I say simply this: it is not enough, on the issue of drugs in particular, which is the issue that Leanne concentrated upon in her comments, to ignore the necessity for punitive measures to combat a drugs economy. That is a living thing in our society and will not lie down and die. We know this—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Deputy Minister has 10 seconds left.

**Huw Lewis:** We also have to understand that devolving these measures is not enough. Simply saying that we will make it Welsh is not enough. We have to tell people how we will make it work.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Time has run out and I apologise, but rules are rules. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

gwrthgymdeithasol, a fydd yn mynd i'r afael ag ystod o ffactorau, megis problemau niwsans lefel isel sy'n gwneud bywyd mor anodd i bobl, ac osgoi difrodi eiddo gan graffiti, fandaliaeth ac ati. Adfer balchder dinesig yw'r ysgogiad y tu ôl i'r math hwnnw o waith.

I grynhoi, dywedaf yn syml: nid yw'n ddigon, o ran mater cyffuriau'n arbennig, sef y mater y canolbwyntiodd Leanne arno yn ei sylwadau, i anwybyddu'r angen am fesurau cosbol i drechu economi gyffuriau sy'n fyw yn ein cymdeithas ac sy'n gwrthod diflannu. Gwyddom hyn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae gan y Dirprwy Weinidog 10 eiliad yn weddill.

**Huw Lewis:** Rhaid inni ddeall hefyd nad yw'n ddigon datganoli'r mesurau hyn yn unig—nid yw dweud y byddwn yn ei wneud yn fater i Gymru yn ddigon. Rhaid inni ddweud wrth bobl sut y byddwn yn gwneud iddo weithio—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Daeth yr amser i ben ac ymddiheuraf, ond dyna'r rheolau. Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.51 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 6.51 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)