



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 7 Chwefror 2007  
Wednesday, 7 February 2007**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |     |  |
|-----|--|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid<br>Questions to the Finance Minister   |
| 20  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad<br>Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside  |
| 36  | Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig<br>Revised Business Statement  |
| 38  | Pwynt o Drefn<br>Point of Order  |
| 39  | Y Rheolau Sefydlog Newydd Arfaethedig<br>The Proposed New Standing Orders  |
| 67  | Adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar Ddigartrefedd<br>Ymhlith Pobl Ifanc<br>The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's Review of Youth Homelessness   |
| 87  | Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Rhif 2) 2007-08 (Setliad<br>Terfynol—Awdurdodau Heddlu)<br>Approval of the Local Government Finance Report (No. 2) 2007-08 (Final<br>Settlement—Police Authorities)                    |
| 92  | Cynnig Trefniadol<br>Procedural Motion   |
| 93  | Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd<br>Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer  |
| 93  | Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Rhif 2) 2007-08 (Setliad<br>Terfynol—Awdurdodau Heddlu): Parhad<br>Approval of the Local Government Finance Report (No. 2) 2007-08 (Final<br>Settlement—Police Authorities): Continued |
| 102 | Dadl Fer: Hyrwyddo a Gwarchod yr Amgylchedd Trefol<br>Short Debate: Promoting and Protecting the Urban Environment   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister**

### **Y Portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol The Health and Social Services Portfolio**

**Q1 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister make a statement on the overall budget allocation to the health and social services portfolio? OAQ0788(FIN)

**C1 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrennir i'r portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ0788(FIN)

**Q4 Brynle Williams:** Has the Minister received any representations regarding the overall budget allocation to the health and social services portfolio? OAQ0784(FIN)

**C4 Brynle Williams:** A yw'r Gweinidog wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau ynglŷn â'r gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrennir i'r portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ0784(FIN)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** The budget allocation for the health and social services portfolio in 2006-07 is £5.1 billion. This allocation contains a 6 per cent increase over the 2005-06 budget.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Y gyllideb a ddyrennir i'r portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn 2006-07 yw £5.1 biliwn. Mae'r dyraniad hwn yn cynnwys cynnydd o 6 y cant o'i gymharu â chyllideb 2005-06.

**Nick Bourne:** Minister, you will know that I, and many other Members, have raised the issue of brachytherapy treatment being available in Wales—indeed, being available at all. We have secured the agreement of the First Minister in an announcement that this treatment would now be made available from Velindre Hospital. What resources are being put in place at Velindre for this treatment, and are they being made available immediately? Will that ensure that everyone who needs it in Wales can have it in their home country, rather than their having to travel to England—David Powell of Barry had to travel to Leeds for his treatment? What about patients in north Wales being able to travel to England to receive this treatment, because it is not available there?

**Nick Bourne:** Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod i, a nifer o Aelodau eraill, wedi codi mater darparu brachitherapi yng Nghymru—yn wir, ei ddarparu o gwbl. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi cytuno mewn cyhoeddiad y byddai'r driniaeth hon bellach ar gael yn Ysbyty Felindre. Pa adnoddau sy'n cael eu rhoi ar waith yn Felindre ar gyfer y driniaeth hon, ac a fyddant ar gael ar unwaith? A fydd hynny'n sicrhau y bydd pawb yng Nghymru y mae arnynt angen y driniaeth hon yn gallu ei chael yn y wlad lle maent yn byw, yn hytrach na gorfod teithio i Loegr—bu'n rhaid i David Powell o'r Barri deithio i Leeds i gael ei driniaeth ef? A fydd cleifion yn y gogledd yn gallu teithio i Loegr i gael y driniaeth hon, am nad yw ar gael yno?

**Sue Essex:** This matter is being dealt with within the health budget, so I cannot give you all the details that you want. However, I promise to write to you as soon as I am done with questions today, to ensure that you get an early response.

**Sue Essex:** Ymdrinnir â'r mater hwn o fewn y gyllideb iechyd, felly, ni allaf roi'r holl ichi yr fanylion yr ydych yn eu dymuno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn addo ysgrifennu atoch cyn gynted ag y byddaf wedi ateb y cwestiynau a ofynnir heddiw, er mwyn sicrhau eich bod yn

cael ymateb cynnar.

**Nick Bourne:** I certainly appreciate that. I realise that this is being dealt with from within the health budget, but I cannot underline enough how important this is to people. As you know, Minister, the treatment has to be made available very quickly if it is to be at all effective. Many people in Wales need this treatment, so when the First Minister made the announcement, it was an important lifeline to them. It is crucial to ensure that the money is available, and that people are aware that the treatment is available at Velindre. I would appreciate having that immediate response that you promise, which could be shared with all Assembly Members so that they can disseminate the information throughout Wales.

**Sue Essex:** We all feel for people in that situation, when we know that that kind of medical treatment can make the absolute difference to them. Velindre is such an excellent facility that we all feel reassured to learn that it has the capacity to provide this treatment. I promise you that I will immediately e-mail the answer to you and to all AMs, after I have finished answering my questions.

**Brynle Williams:** My great concern is for people in north Wales, whom Nick mentioned. As you know, for them, travelling to Velindre can mean a journey of 150 miles or more, when we have excellent facilities just over the border, though, regrettably, not in north Wales. I take on board what you say and I eagerly await your written reply as to what is happening up north.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gŵyr y Gweinidog bod croeso mawr wedi bod ar hyd a lled Cymru i'r £2 filiwn sydd wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer y gwasanaeth hosbis yn y gyllideb o fis Ebrill 2007. Hoffwn wneud dau bwynt ar y mater hwnnw. Yn gyntaf, er bod gofawr mewn hosbisau, yn y cartref ac mewn lleoliadau penodol yn croesawu'r £2 filiwn, a all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut yn union y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei ddefnyddio gan y gwasanaeth?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn sicr yn gwerthfawrogi hynny. Sylweddolaf yr ymdrinnir â hyn o fewn y gyllideb iechyd, ond ni allaf danlinellu ddigon mor bwysig yw'r mater hwn i bobl. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, rhaid darparu'r driniaeth yn gyflym iawn er mwyn iddi fod yn effeithiol. Mae angen y driniaeth hon ar nifer o bobl yng Nghymru, felly, pan wnaeth y Prif Weinidog y cyhoeddiad hwn, yr oedd yn newyddion hollbwysig iddynt. Mae'n hanfodol sicrhau bod yr arian ar gael, a bod pobl yn gwybod bod y driniaeth ar gael yn Felindre. Byddem yn gwerthfawrogi cael yr ymateb cyflym hwnnw y soniech amdano, a allai gael ei rannu gyda holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad fel y gallant ledaenu'r wybodaeth ar draws Cymru.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym i gyd yn cydymdeimlo â phobl sydd yn y sefyllfa honno, pan wyddom y gall y math hwnnw o driniaeth feddygol wneud byd o wahaniaeth iddynt. Mae Felindre yn gyfleuster mor ardderchog, ac mae'n rhoi ymdeimlad o sicrwydd i bob un ohonom glywed bod yno'r adnoddau i ddarparu'r driniaeth hon. Yr wyf yn addo anfon yr ateb yn syth dros yr e-bost atoch chi a'r holl ACau, ar ôl imi orffen ateb fy nghwestiynau.

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf yn pryderu'n fawr am bobl yn y gogledd y soniodd Nick amdanynt. Fel y gwyddoch, iddynt hwy gall teithio i Felindre olygu taith o 150 milltir neu fwy, pan fo gennym gyfleusterau ardderchog ychydig dros y ffin, er, yn anffodus, nid yn y gogledd. Derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedwch, ac edrychaf ymlaen at eich ateb ysgrifenedig am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gogledd.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I am sure the Minister knows that the £2 million earmarked for hospice services in the budget from April 2007 has been widely welcomed the length and breadth of Wales. I wish to make two points on that. Firstly, although carers in hospices, at home and in specific settings welcome that £2 million, could the Minister tell us precisely how that money will be used by the service?

Yn ail, er bod £2 filiwn yn swm i'w groesawu, a yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod y sector yn disgwyl mwy o arian mewn blynyddoedd i ddod? A yw'n gallu ein hargyhoeddi heddiw fod y Llywodraeth yn teimlo y bydd modd cynyddu'r swm hwnnw yn 2008-09?

**Sue Essex:** I was particularly concerned about the situation with the hospices, which is why I volunteered to put that £2 million in the budget, as you know. In so doing, I made one thing clear: its distribution would be a matter for the Minister for Health and Social Services. However, that will be informed by the review of hospices currently being carried out. Therefore, I cannot give you an answer on its distribution; that must come from Brian, and must be based on the review.

As for future years, as you would expect, I cannot answer for those who will be here after me, but it seems to me that, in human terms, the hospice sector provides a much needed part of that total health service to people and, in doing so, saves the NHS money. I have been informed by working with Tŷ George Thomas and the organisation that serves Cardiff and this area. It is such an important service because it not only gives the patient confidence and support, it also gives confidence and support to the families and the carers that surround the patient. I do not know what the review will say—I have not seen it—but the issue of where hospices sit within the health system will hopefully be addressed. I am sure that it will mean extra funding for the future. There is still value in this sector's being voluntary, because it is able to raise money and to involve volunteers in the way in which a state system could not. If we look at the increase in cancer, we can see that all the figures are going the wrong way in terms of the percentage of the population that will be affected by cancer. This service can make such a difference to those sufferers, and it seems that it needs to be recognised for the important role that it plays.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Social Services Inspectorate for Wales's annual report

Secondly, although that sum of £2 million is to be welcomed, does the Minister accept that the sector expects more money in years to come? Is she able to convince us today that the Government feels it will be possible to increase that sum in 2008-09?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oedd y sefyllfa gyda'r hosbisau yn bryder mawr imi, a dyna pam y gwirfoddolais i roi'r £2 filiwn yn y gyllideb, fel y gwyddoch. Wrth wneud hynny, tanlinellais un peth: mater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fyddai dosbarthu'r arian hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, bydd hynny'n cael ei lywio gan yr adolygiad o hosbisau a gynhelir ar hyn o bryd. Felly, ni allaf roi ateb ichi ynglŷn â dosbarthu'r arian hwnnw; rhaid i Brian wneud hynny, a rhaid i'w ateb fod yn seiliedig ar yr adolygiad.

O ran y blynyddoedd i ddod, fel y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl, ni allaf ateb dros y rheini a fydd yma ar fy ôl i, ond ymddengys i mi, o ran pobl, fod y sector hosbisau'n darparu rhan o'r gwasanaeth iechyd cyfan hwnnw i bobl y mae ei hangen yn ddirfawr, a thrwy wneud hynny mae'n arbed arian i'r GIG. Cefais y wybodaeth drwy weithio gyda Thŷ George Thomas a'r sefydliad sy'n gwasanaethu Caerdydd a'r ardal hon. Mae'n wasanaeth mor bwysig oherwydd mae nid yn unig yn rhoi hyder a chymorth i'r claf, ond mae hefyd yn rhoi hyder a chymorth i deulu a gofalgwyr y claf hwnnw. Ni wn beth a ddywed yr adolygiad—nid wyf wedi ei weld—ond gobeithio yr eir i'r afael â mater sefyllfa hosbisau yn y system iechyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn golygu arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'r ffaith fod y sector hwn yn un gwirfoddol yn werthfawr o hyd, oherwydd gall godi arian a chynnwys gwirfoddolwyr mewn ffordd na allai'r un o systemau'r wladwriaeth ei gwneud. Os edrychwn ar y cynnydd mewn canser, gwelwn fod yr holl ffigurau'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir o ran canran y boblogaeth y bydd canser yn effeithio arni. Gall y gwasanaeth hwn wneud cymaint o wahaniaeth i'r bobl hynny, ac ymddengys i mi fod angen ei gydnabod am y rôl bwysig sydd iddo.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn adroddiad blynyddol Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol

pointed out that social services spending, although increasing gradually in real terms, is falling as a proportion of local government spending, despite the fact that there are increased pressures because of our ageing population, which we all know about. Last time I asked you about this, you said that you were looking at changing the funding formula for the adult services budget for social services. Can you tell us whether you intend to increase the total funding to social services as a result of looking at the formula?

**Sue Essex:** I am surprised to hear that it is falling as a percentage of local government spend, but if you say that that is in the report, I am sure that it is right. Over the last couple of years, we have put a considerably increased amount into the money for social services. It is certainly in the budget for next year, both in terms of special grant and the revenue support grant. I have worked with all local authority leaders in Wales to increase the percentage that they spend on social services and it would be fair to say that most, if not all, local authorities are spending above their standard spending assessment on social care.

On changes to the formula, I am sure that you will remember that, following the committee's report on education spend, we said that we were going to look particularly at the need to spend to respond to dispersal and deprivation. We then said that we thought that social services and social care should follow that. That piece of work will go on next year and it will inform the comprehensive spending review in terms of budget allocation. However, the key element in this is the demographics. The element of the formula that relies on demographics will show that increase in population and how the allocation of the local government revenue support grant budget will be there to favour social care spend.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am pleased with what you have said. I suggest that you take a look at the inspectorate's report, as you were unaware of the issue regarding the proportion

Cymru, nodwyd bod gwariant gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, er ei fod yn cynyddu'n raddol mewn termau real, yn lleihau fel cyfran o wariant llywodraeth leol, er bod mwy o bwysau am fod ein poblogaeth yn heneiddio, a gwyddom i gyd am hynny. Pan holais chi ddiwethaf am hyn, dywedasoch eich bod yn ystyried newid y fformiwla ariannu ar gyfer y gyllideb gwasanaethau oedolion ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. A allwch ddweud wrthym a ydych yn bwriadu cynyddu cyfanswm y cyllid ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o ganlyniad i edrych ar y fformiwla?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn synnu clywed ei fod yn lleihau fel canran o wariant llywodraeth leol, ond os dywedwch fod hynny yn yr adroddiad, yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn gywir. Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn sylweddol. Yn bendant, mae yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, o ran grant arbennig a'r grant cymorth refeniw. Yr wyf wedi gweithio gyda phob arweinydd awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru i gynyddu'r ganran maent yn ei gwario ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, a byddai'n deg dweud bod y rhan fwyaf, os nad pob un, o'r awdurdodau lleol yn gwario mwy na'u hasesiad gwariant safonol ar ofal cymdeithasol.

O ran newid y fformiwla, yr wyf yn siŵr y cofiwch, yn dilyn adroddiad y pwyllgor ar wariant addysg, inni ddweud ein bod am edrych yn benodol ar yr angen am wario i ymateb i wasgariad ac amddifadedd. Yna, dywedasom ein bod yn credu y dylai gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol ddilyn hynny. Bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n parhau'r flwyddyn nesaf, a bydd yn llywio'r adolygiad gwariant cynhwysfawr o ran dyrannu cyllideb. Fodd bynnag, yr elfen allweddol yn hyn yw'r ddemograffeg. Bydd yr elfen yn y fformiwla sy'n dibynnu ar ddemograffeg yn dangos y cynnydd hwnnw yn y boblogaeth, a sut y bydd dyrannu cyllideb grant cymorth refeniw llywodraeth leol yno i ffafrio gwario ar ofal cymdeithasol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf clywed hyn. Awgrymaf y dylech edrych ar adroddiad yr arolygiaeth, gan nad oeddech yn ymwybodol o'r mater ynghylch cyfran y gwariant

of local government spending that goes on social services. When you look at the formula and the demographics, will you take into account not just the issue of an ageing population but also issues that the inspectorate drew to our attention this morning, namely the increasing numbers of adults with learning disabilities who require assessment? Some local authorities are reporting a 100 per cent increase in the number of assessments that they are having to do and you will know that increased numbers of assessments lead to an increased amount of services needed.

**Sue Essex:** Clearly you have discussed this this morning, so it is fresh in your mind. You are right to say that one of the other key pressure areas on social services is dealing with adults and young adults in terms of their requirements. We have already set out the work for the distribution group that underpins the local government formula but we can certainly send it a copy of the inspectorate's report, which might inform its work this year.

2.10 p.m.

### **Y Portffolio Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus The Local Government and Public Services Portfolio**

**C2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cyllid cyffredinol a ddyrennir i'r portffolio llywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ0758(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** The budget allocation for this portfolio is £3.8 billion in 2006-07. This is an increase of 7.6 per cent over the 2005-06 budget, and includes transfers in respect of social care and education.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr oedd cynrychiolwyr o Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, a dywedasant ei bod yn dda gweld blaenoriaeth wleidyddol yn cael ei rhoi i wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn sicr y byddech yn cydnabod bod pwysau enfawr ar y gyllideb hon mewn awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, a bod hynny yn arwain at broblemau, fel y ffaith bod pobl

llywodraeth leol sy'n mynd ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Pan edrychwch ar y fformiwla a'r ddemograffeg, a wnewch chi ystyried materion yr oedd yr arolygiaeth yn tynnu ein sylw atynt y bore yma, sef y niferoedd cynyddol o oedolion ag anabledau dysgu y mae angen eu hasesu, yn ogystal â phoblogaeth sy'n heneiddio? Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn cofnodi cynnydd o 100 y cant o ran nifer yr asesiadau y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu gwneud, a byddwch yn gwybod bod nifer uwch o asesiadau'n golygu bod angen mwy o wasanaethau.

**Sue Essex:** Yn amlwg yr ydych wedi trafod hyn y bore yma, felly, mae'n fyw yn eich cof. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud mai un o'r meysydd allweddol eraill sy'n rhoi pwysau ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol yw mynd i'r afael ag oedolion ac oedolion ifanc o ran eu gofynion. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gosod allan y gwaith ar gyfer y grŵp dosbarthu sy'n tanategu'r fformiwla llywodraeth leol, ond yn sicr gallwn anfon copi o adroddiad yr arolygiaeth ato, a allai lywio ei waith eleni.

**Q2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the overall allocation of funding to the local government and public services portfolio? OAQ0758(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** £3.8 biliwn yw'r gyllideb a ddyrennir i'r portffolio hwn yn 2006-07. Mae'r swm hwn yn gynydd o 7.6 y cant o'i gymharu â chyllideb 2005-06, ac mae'n cynnwys trosglwyddiadau ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol ac addysg.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Representatives of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales were in committee this morning, and said that it was good to see political priority being given to social services. However, I am sure you would acknowledge that social services budgets are facing huge pressures in local authorities across Wales, and that that leads to problems, such as bedblocking in hospitals when people cannot be released to more

yn gorfod aros mewn gwelyau ysbyty yn hytrach na chael eu rhyddhau i leoliad mwy priodol yn y gymuned. A ydych, fel Llywodraeth, wedi edrych ar y posibilrwydd o ddod â chyllideb y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a chyllideb y gwasanaeth iechyd at ei gilydd er mwyn osgoi problemau o'r fath, sydd yn peri cymaint o loes nid yn unig i'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt yn uniongyrchol, ond i'w teuluoedd hefyd?

**Sue Essex:** Like Jenny, you have had up-to-date information from the inspectorate. I will look at its report and see what it says. You chose to focus on delayed transfers of care, which seems to be a particular problem in certain areas, and work is going on to look at whether there is a general issue behind that, or whether the problems are specific to those localities. The interesting issue for me is how we can get both improved and sustainable provision in the care sector over the coming generations. As we have said, we know that this will be a bigger factor in Wales and that we will need to ensure that we have a range of accommodation for people. We also need to put the support in place to keep people in their own homes, and that has been one of our real priorities of the last few years: helping local government to allow people to live in their own homes as long as possible, if that is their choice.

As regards budgets for health and social care coming together, that is very much part of the Beecham agenda. That is what we said in relation to local service boards. I have been clear that I think that this is perhaps at the top of the priority list for attention and pooled budgets. We are inviting bids from local authorities for pilot local service boards, and I hope that one will include this area.

The other interesting fact was that the other day I went across the water to Bristol to see what is being done there about intermediate care and providing one service for that. Good work is being done there, from which we can learn. I met people from the intermediate care

appropriate community settings. Have you, as a Government, looked at bringing budgets for social services and health together in order to avoid such problems, which cause so much anxiety not only to those directly affected, but also to their families?

**Sue Essex:** Fel Jenny, yr ydych wedi cael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf gan yr arolygiaeth. Fe edrychaf ar ei hadroddiad a gweld beth y mae'n ei ddweud. Yr ydych wedi dewis canolbwyntio ar achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, sy'n amlwg yn broblem benodol mewn rhai ardaloedd, ac mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i ystyried a oes problem gyffredinol yn sail i hynny, neu a yw'r problemau'n benodol i'r ardaloedd hynny. Y mater sydd o ddiddordeb i mi yw sut y gallwn sicrhau darpariaeth well a chynaliadwy yn y sector gofal i'r cenedlaethau i ddod. Fel y ydym wedi dweud, gwyddom y bydd hyn yn fwy o ffactor yng Nghymru ac y bydd angen inni sicrhau bod amrywiaeth o lety ar gael i bobl. Mae angen hefyd inni sicrhau bod y cymorth ar gael i gadw pobl yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, a dyna fu un o'n blaenoriaethau gwirioneddol yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf: helpu llywodraeth leol i alluogi pobl i fyw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain cyhyd â phosibl, os dyna yw eu dewis.

O ran cyfuno'r cyllidebau ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, mae hynny'n rhan bwysig o agenda Beecham. Dyna a ddywedwyd gennym o ran byrddau gwasanaeth lleol. Yr wyf wedi gwneud yn glir fy mod yn credu bod y mater hwn, hwyrach, ar frig y rhestr flaenoriaethau o ran rhoi sylw a chyllidebau cyfunol. Yr ydym yn gwahodd ceisiadau gan awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer byrddau gwasanaeth lleol peilot, a gobeithio y bydd un yn cynnwys y maes hwn.

Y ffaith ddiddorol arall oedd imi fynd dros y dŵr i Fryste rai diwrnodau'n ôl i weld yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud yno o ran gofal canolradd a darparu un gwasanaeth ar gyfer hynny. Mae gwaith da'n cael ei wneud yno, a gallwn ddysgu ohono. Cyfarfûm â phobl o'r tîm



team, and they had different employers but were part of one team and supported one another. That was also dependent upon shared budgeting, with the trust, in its case, and the city council, coming together.

I think that the local service boards, using such examples of best practice, can crack what has seemed to be a pretty intractable problem up to now.

**David Melding:** Minister, when you next meet with the Welsh Local Government Association will you look at this issue of declining expenditure, by proportion of the budget, on social care? It is important, and it is included in the report of the chief inspector—it is towards the end of the report, in the chapter on context. The WLGA has itself identified social care as one of the main pressures, and we have to look at the overall expenditure and ask why expenditure has been declining in this sector, and yet it is then coming back and saying it is a pressure point.

**Sue Essex:** To be clear, we have produced a report on education here that tells local government that it must pay attention to education and meet the indicator based assessment for that. I think that there are many local authorities that would turn around and say that they feel that their biggest budget pressure is social care. Nevertheless, I have diligently followed what the Assembly wanted and have written to local authorities and told them that we expect those authorities that are not meeting their IBA to show that they are moving towards that.

However, social care is a huge pressure for authorities, for the reasons that we have discussed already this afternoon and in committee—I am sure that the Health and Social Services Committee discusses this too. We have a good record on trying to work on a collaborative agenda, and we have funded the Welsh Local Government Association unit, chaired by Meryl Gravelle, which is working on putting best practice in place. In terms of collaborative arrangements, we are looking at children with special needs to see

gofal canolradd, ac er bod ganddynt gyflogwyr gwahanol yr oeddent yn rhan o un tîm ac yn cefnogi ei gilydd. Yr oedd hynny hefyd yn dibynnu ar rannu cyllidebau, a'r ymddiriedolaeth, yn yr achos hwn, a chyngor y ddinas yn dod ynghyd.

Credaf y gall y byrddau gwasanaeth lleol, gan ddefnyddio enghreifftiau felly o arfer gorau, ddatrys yr hyn sydd wedi ymddangos yn broblem ddigon anodd ei datrys hyd yma.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, pan fyddwch yn cyfarfod â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru nesaf a wnewch chi edrych ar wariant gostyngol, yn ôl y gyfran o'r gyllideb, ar ofal cymdeithasol? Mae'n bwysig, ac fe'i cynhwysir yn adroddiad y prif arolygydd—mae i'w weld tua diwedd yr adroddiad, yn y bennod ar gyd-destun. Mae'r CLILC ei hun wedi nodi gofal cymdeithasol fel un o'r prif bwysau, a rhaid inni edrych ar y gwariant cyffredinol a gofyn pam y mae gwariant wedi bod yn gostwng yn y sector hwn, ac eto mae'n dod yn ôl ac yn dweud ei fod yn creu pwysau.

**Sue Essex:** I fod yn glir, yr ydym wedi llunio adroddiad ar addysg yma sy'n dweud wrth lywodraeth leol bod yn rhaid iddi roi sylw i addysg a chyflawni'r asesiad yn seiliedig ar ddangosyddion ar gyfer hynny. Credaf fod nifer o awdurdodau lleol a fyddai'n dweud mai gofal cymdeithasol sy'n rhoi'r pwysau mwyaf ar eu cyllidebau yn eu barn hwy. Serch hynny, yr wyf wedi cadw at yr hyn yr oedd y Cynulliad yn ei ddymuno, ac wedi ysgrifennu at awdurdodau lleol gan ddweud wrthynt ein bod yn disgwyl i'r awdurdodau hynny nad ydynt yn cyflawni'r asesiad yn seiliedig ar ddangosyddion ddangos eu bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Fodd bynnag, mae gofal cymdeithasol yn bwysau enfawr i awdurdodau, am y rhesymau a drafodwyd eisoes y prynhawn yma ac yn y pwyllgor—yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn trafod hyn hefyd. Mae gennym record dda o geisio gweithio ar agenda gydweithredol, ac yr ydym wedi ariannu uned Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Meryl Gravelle, sy'n gweithio ar roi arferion gorau ar waith. O ran trefniadau cydweithredol, yr ydym yn

what collaboration could go forward. There might also be scope in the future for joint public provision in certain areas, if we can get local authorities together. There is a huge amount to do, and the future is staring us in the face on this agenda. We are putting together the building blocks to make these changes, but it will take a considerable commitment, both from the Assembly and from local authorities. The voluntary sector is also an important part of this work.

I will add one more point, Llywydd, as so many Members have an interest in this issue. Last week, I had a useful discussion with the care forum, which is largely made up of the private sector and the not-for-profit sector; I know that you, David, have been keen to support the forum. It is very much up for collaboration on the Beecham agenda, which is a health sign for us in Wales.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):**

Talking about the future staring you in the face, you have what is not just an ambition, but a commitment, namely that all school buildings in Wales will be brought up to standard by 2010. We now know, from reports provided by local authorities and others, that there is no way, with the current allocation of funding and with current procedures, that that target will be reached. This was not an ambition, or something that you said that you would like to seek to achieve; it was a commitment. Have you considered reviewing the way in which you give money to local authorities? If they do not get on with this work rapidly, they will never meet the target by 2010.

**Sue Essex:** Yes, I continue to look at the way in which we give money to local authorities, and I also have to understand their position. I do not know whether you have worked on the delivery end of projects, but they are not always as easy as we think. We allocate money at the strategic level, but projects have to be delivered on the ground. The big issue is not so much the allocation, but something that we have discussed here for many moons: key decisions on the rationalisation of

edrych ar blant sydd ag anghenion arbennig i weld pa gydweithredu a allai ddigwydd. Gallai fod cyfle hefyd yn y dyfodol ar gyfer darpariaeth gyhoeddus ar y cyd mewn rhai ardaloedd, os gallwn gael awdurdodau at ei gilydd. Mae gwaith mawr i'w wneud, ac mae'r dyfodol ar yr agenda hon yn un heriol. Yr ydym yn gosod y sylfeini i wneud y newidiadau hyn, ond bydd angen ymrwymiad sylweddol gan y Cynulliad a chan awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol hefyd yn rhan bwysig o'r gwaith hwn.

Ychwanegaf un pwynt arall, Lywydd, gan fod gan gynifer o Aelodau ddiddordeb yn y mater hwn. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais drafodaeth ddefnyddiol gyda'r fforwm gofal sydd, i raddau helaeth, yn cynnwys y sector preifat a'r sector di-elw; gwn eich bod chi, David, wedi bod yn awyddus i gefnogi'r fforwm. O ran agenda Beecham, mae'n fater y mae angen cydweithredu arno, ac mae hynny'n arwydd iach inni yng Nghymru.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):**

Gan ein bod yn trafod y dyfodol heriol, mae gennych nid yn unig uchelgais, ond ymrwymiad hefyd, sef y bydd pob adeilad ysgol yng Nghymru yn cyrraedd y safon erbyn 2010. Gwyddom yn awr, o adroddiadau a ddarparwyd gan awdurdodau lleol ac eraill, nad oes gobaith, gyda'r ffordd bresennol o ddyrannu arian a chyda'r gweithdrefnau presennol, o gyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Nid oedd hyn yn uchelgais, nac yn rhywbeth yr oeddech yn dweud y byddech yn dymuno ceisio'i gyflawni; ymrwymiad ydoedd. A ydych wedi ystyried adolygu'r ffordd yr ydych yn rhoi arian i awdurdodau lleol? Os na fyddant yn bwrw ati gyda'r gwaith hwn ar fyrder, nid oes gobaith iddynt gyrraedd y targed erbyn 2010.

**Sue Essex:** Ydwyf, yr wyf yn dal i edrych ar y ffordd yr ydym yn rhoi arian i awdurdodau lleol, a rhaid imi ddeall eu sefyllfa hwy hefyd. Ni wn a ydych wedi gweithio ar bwynt cyflawni prosiectau, ond nid ydynt bob amser mor hawdd ag y credwn. Dyrannwn arian ar y lefel strategol, ond rhaid cyflawni prosiectau ar lawr gwlad. Nid y dyraniad yw'r mater pwysig, ond rhywbeth yr ydym wedi'i drafod yma droeon: penderfyniadau allweddol ar resymoli darpariaeth ac

provision and reconfiguration, or whatever you want to call it, for schools in view of the sometimes rapidly dropping school population. For local authorities facing these difficult decisions—I have always said that I understand the difficulties—it is really pointless to invest in buildings that, in a few years' time, will not be needed. Auditors would not be happy with such an investment. That has been the major block, and I have talked to local authorities about it, in terms of achieving that standard. However, some local authorities are getting on with the job and making good progress.

We have tried to be flexible in the way that we allocate money; there is a general capital grant, a school capital grant and an improvement grant. Most local authorities would want the money coming across to be as unfettered as possible, so that they can make progress. The last thing that I will say is that we want all school buildings to be of good quality and to be environmentally friendly and of use to the community in terms of meeting up-to-date, sustainable aspirations. Therefore, we have talked about making requirements around that agenda in order to secure good-quality buildings that are as environmentally sustainable as possible.

ailgyflunio, neu beth bynnag yr ydych am ei alw, ar gyfer ysgolion yn sgîl y boblogaeth ysgol sy'n lleihau'n gyflym weithiau. Ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol sy'n wynebu'r penderfyniadau anodd hyn—yr wyf bob amser wedi dweud fy mod yn deall yr anawsterau—nid oes fawr o ddiben buddsoddi mewn adeiladau na fydd eu hangen ymhen rhai blynyddoedd. Ni fyddai archwilwyr yn fodlon ar fuddsoddiad o'r fath. Dyna fu'r rhwystr mawr, ac yr wyf wedi siarad ag awdurdodau lleol amdano, o ran cyrraedd y safon honno. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith ac yn gwneud cynnydd da.

Yr ydym wedi ceisio bod yn hyblyg yn y ffordd yr ydym yn dyrannu arian; mae yna grant cyfalaf cyffredinol, grant cyfalaf ysgolion a grant gwella. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol yn dymuno i'r arian a gânt fod mor ddilyffethair â phosibl, er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud cynnydd. Y peth olaf a ddywedaf yw ein bod i gyd am i adeiladau ysgolion fod o safon dda a bod yn garedig i'r amgylchedd ac o ddefnydd i'r gymuned o ran cyflawni'r dyheadau diweddaraf, cynaliadwy. Felly, yr ydym wedi siarad am wneud gofynion o ran yr agenda honno er mwyn sicrhau adeiladau o safon dda sydd mor gynaliadwy â phosibl o ran yr amgylchedd.

### **Arian Wrth Gefn Financial Reserves**

**Q3 Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government financial reserves? OAQ0753(FIN)

**C3 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr arian wrth gefn sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ0753(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** The Assembly reserves are maintained as part of our prudent approach to financial management. These reserves are used to manage any unforeseen pressures that arise during the year.

**Sue Essex:** Caiff arian y Cynulliad wrth gefn ei gynnal fel rhan o'n dull darbodus o reoli arian. Defnyddir yr arian wrth gefn hwn i reoli unrhyw bwysau annisgwyl sy'n codi yn ystod y flwyddyn.

2.20 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** In the lead-up to the budget vote, the Minister rightly took a strong line that reserves in the region of 1 per cent needed to be kept. Does she share my concern that there is no standard formula for local government in relation to its reserves

**Alun Cairns:** Yn y cyfnod cyn y bleidlais ar y gyllideb, yr oedd y Gweinidog, yn gywir ddigon, yn credu bod angen cadw cronfeydd wrth gefn oddeutu 1 y cant. A yw hi fel finnau yn pryderu nad oes fformiwla safonol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol mewn perthynas â'i

and that council tax payments can fluctuate quite considerably, depending on the levels of reserves that they choose to hold in any particular year? Coincidentally, the reserves tend to drop in an election year and tend to rise after the election. Do you not accept that it would be useful to have a standard, broad formula for local government in relation to the reserves that it should hold?

**Sue Essex:** There is strong guidance from the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy that it should come up to 5 per cent. In fairness, most local authorities try to keep to that level; however, they may accumulate reserves at times because they have a particular project in mind, such as a major building project. I think that the Vale of Glamorgan Council has money that it has put together in order to meet school building projects. It is a bit difficult to be exact because there are sometimes good reasons why local authorities hold onto money year after year. Our worry is more about where the reserves dip down and whether authorities have a prudent level of reserves. I have not seen that as a major concern yet; however, we keep an eye on it because, as I said, the CIPFA guidance is pretty strong. It is a useful point and we can keep an eye on it; I will tell my local government finance officials to do so.

**David Lloyd:** What consideration have you given to using some of the Welsh Assembly Government's reserves to fund equalised pay grades for public sector workers?

**Sue Essex:** We are looking to achieve equal pay through a whole range of organisations. In terms of local authorities, where the attention has been up until now, it is for them to meet any backpay requirements out of their resources or borrowing, when that needs to come into play. We have had discussions on that. In terms of many other areas of the public sector, the issue has been largely about

chronfeydd wrth gefn ac y gall taliadau'r dreth gyngor newid yn eithaf sylweddol, yn ôl lefel y cronfeydd wrth gefn y maent yn dewis eu cadw mewn unrhyw flwyddyn benodol? Drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad, mae'r cronfeydd wrth gefn yn tueddu i leihau mewn blwyddyn etholiad a chodi ar ôl yr etholiad. Oni dderbyniwch y byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael fformiwla safonol, gyffredinol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol mewn perthynas â'r cronfeydd wrth gefn y dylai eu cadw?

**Sue Essex:** Mae yna ganllawiau cadarn gan y Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth y dylai gyrraedd 5 y cant. A bod yn deg, mae'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol yn ceisio cadw at y lefel honno; fodd bynnag, gallant grynhoi cronfeydd wrth gefn weithiau oherwydd bod ganddynt brosiect penodol mewn golwg, megis prosiect adeiladu mawr. Credaf fod gan Gyngor Bro Morgannwg arian wedi ei neilltuo i dalu am brosiectau adeiladau ysgolion. Mae'n eithaf anodd bod yn fanwl gywir oherwydd weithiau bydd rhesymau da pam mae awdurdodau lleol yn cadw gafael ar arian flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Yr ydym yn pryderu mwy ynglŷn ag achosion lle mae'r cronfeydd wrth gefn yn lleihau ac a oes gan awdurdodau lefel ddarbodus o gronfeydd wrth gefn. Nid wyf wedi ystyried bod hynny'n peri pryder mawr hyd yma; fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn cadw llygad arno oherwydd, fel y dywedais, mae canllawiau'r Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth yn weddol gryf. Mae'n bwynt defnyddiol a gallwn gadw llygad arno; dywedaf wrth fy swyddogion cyllid llywodraeth leol am wneud hynny.

**David Lloyd:** Pa ystyriaeth a roesoch i ddefnyddio rhai o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ariannu graddfeydd cyflog cyfartal i weithwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus?

**Sue Essex:** Ein nod yw sicrhau cyflog cyfartal mewn ystod fawr o sefydliadau. O ran awdurdodau lleol, lle y canolbwyntiwyd y sylw hyd yma, eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw talu unrhyw ofynion ôl-gyflog o'u hadnoddau neu'r arian y maent yn ei fenthyg, pan fydd angen gwneud hynny. Cawsom drafodaethau am hynny. Mewn llawer maes arall yn y sector cyhoeddus, i raddau helaeth yr oedd a

implementing equal pay obligations. I want to reinforce the fact that we have put money into local government for that implementation, as a revenue payment from April 2008.

**David Lloyd:** Further to that, what is the latest assessment of the looming amount payable by local government in Wales as backpay?

**Sue Essex:** As we have always said, this is a difficult figure to quote because local authorities will not know the figure until they have worked their way through this. They are also quite reluctant to put anything in the public domain, and you and I would both understand why that is so. The figure that has been used in the past is £300 million, but I have always thought that that is at the top level. It is my informed guess, although I may be wrong, that that figure will come down over time. My discussions with local authorities have revealed that they have seen the worst and that, as they work through it, that figure is more likely to come down than go up. In fairness, no-one will know the exact figure until the end of the process.

wnelo hyn â gweithredu rhwymedigaethau cyflog cyfartal. Yr wyf am atgyfnerthu'r ffaith inni roi arian i lywodraeth leol ar gyfer y broses weithredu honno, fel taliad refeniw o fis Ebrill 2008.

**David Lloyd:** Yn ychwanegol ar y pwynt hwnnw, beth yw'r asesiad diweddaraf o'r swm sy'n daladwy gan lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru fel ôl-gyflogau?

**Sue Essex:** Fel yr ydym bob amser wedi ei ddweud, mae hwn yn ffigur anodd i'w roi oherwydd ni fydd awdurdodau lleol yn gwybod y ffigur tan iddynt weithio drwy hyn. Maent hefyd yn ddigon amharod i gyhoeddi unrhyw wybodaeth, a byddem ni ein dau yn deall pam. Y ffigur a ddefnyddiwyd yn y gorffennol yw £300 miliwn, ond yr wyf wedi credu erioed mai'r lefel uchaf yw hynny. Mi dybiaf, er y gallwn fod yn anghywir, y bydd y ffigur hwnnw'n lleihau gydag amser. Mae fy nhrafodaethau gydag awdurdodau lleol wedi dangos eu bod wedi bod drwy'r gwaethaf, ac wrth iddynt weithio drwyddo fod y ffigur hwnnw'n fwy tebygol o ostwng nag o gynyddu. A bod yn deg, ni fydd neb yn gwybod yr union ffigur tan ddiwedd y broses.

### **Y Portffolio Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau The Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Portfolio**

**Q5 Alun Cairns:** What plans does the Minister have to provide one-off additional funding to the budget allocation for enterprise, innovation and networks portfolio to meet match-funding requirements? OAQ0771(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** I have no immediate plans to do that, Alun.

**Alun Cairns:** I am quite staggered to hear that she has no plans to increase the budget allocation. She will be well aware that there are enormous lessons to be learned from the existing Objective 1 programme, which is now coming to an end. One of the lessons has concerned the debate over match funding. We need to be clear that not a penny of match funding was received last time in addition to the standard Barnett block grant, and the Minister needs to recognise that that is the reason why this current programme has failed so badly. I am extremely disappointed that

**C5 Alun Cairns:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i ddarparu cyllid ychwanegol untro i'r gyllideb a ddyrennir ar gyfer y portffolio menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau er mwyn bodloni gofynion arian cyfatebol? OAQ0771(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Nid oes gennyf gynlluniau i wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd, Alun.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu nad oes ganddi gynlluniau i gynyddu'r gyllideb a ddyrennir. Bydd yn gwybod bod gwersi mawr i'w dysgu o'r rhaglen Amcan 1 bresennol, sy'n dod i ben yn awr. Yr oedd a wnelo un o'r gwersi â'r ddadl ynglŷn ag arian cyfatebol. Rhaid inni fod yn glir na chafwyd yr un geiniog o arian cyfatebol y tro diwethaf yn ychwanegol at y grant bloc Barnett safonol, ac mae angen i'r Gweinidog gydnabod mai dyna pam y mae'r rhaglen gyfredol hon wedi methu mor wael. Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn nad yw'n bwriadu dyrannu

she is not planning to allocate any additional funding to the portfolio. What representations has she made to the Chancellor of the Exchequer to press the case for Wales? At least her predecessor tried her best, although she failed.

**Sue Essex:** I do not really recognise most of what you say. This has been your debate for as many years as I care to remember. It has been a pretty sterile debate from your point of view, because it has always been full of doom and gloom, saying that we would fail in terms of structural funds and, of course, the reverse has been true. Quite honestly, I think that the general view is that we delivered incredibly well on that first area, and I have every confidence that we will deliver incredibly well on convergence funds. We put some money aside for match funding, but the important point is that we tried to use other funding and spending programmes that we have. That has proved extremely valuable and it may be one of the reasons why I took a different view—although, I certainly do not remember Edwina asking Gordon Brown for match funding. However, one of the things that I did was to look at spending programmes to see how they could be used as match funding. That has been incredibly successful; it has proved an incredibly good use of resources. I therefore reject the basic content of your remarks, Alun, as it just does not stand up to scrutiny.

**Janet Davies:** Minister, you have just said that you put some money aside and looked at other spending programmes—I think that I have got that down correctly. In that case, can you give us a guarantee that budgets for other priorities, such as education and health, have not been affected by your looking at other spending programmes?

**Sue Essex:** We have an absolutely huge budget, thanks to Gordon Brown's increases. We are talking about a sum approaching £14 billion. The amount put in as a back-up in the Pathways to Prosperity budget line was exceedingly small compared with the budget. The other thing worth remembering about this matter is that we are in an unknown area, as we do not know what the intervention rates will be, and we will not know that by

dim cyllid ychwanegol i'r portffolio. Pa sylwadau y mae wedi eu cyflwyno i Ganghellor y Trysorlys i hyrwyddo achos Cymru? O leiaf fe wnaeth ei rhagflaenydd ei gorau, er iddi fethu.

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn adnabod y rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedwch. Dyma yw eich dadl ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Mae wedi bod yn ddadl digon di-fudd o'ch safbwynt chi, oherwydd mae wedi bod yn negyddol iawn, yn dweud y byddem yn methu gyda chronfeydd strwythurol ac, wrth gwrs, y gwrthwyneb oedd yn wir. A bod yn onest, credaf mai'r farn gyffredinol yw inni wneud yn eithriadol o dda yn y maes cyntaf hwnnw, a hyderaf y byddwn yn gwneud yn eithriadol o dda gyda chronfeydd cydgyfeirio. Neilltuwyd rhywfaint o arian ar gyfer arian cyfatebol, ond y pwynt pwysig yw inni geisio defnyddio'r rhaglenni cyllido a gwario eraill sydd gennym. Mae hynny wedi bod yn werthfawr iawn, ac efallai mai dyma un o'r rhesymau pam yr oeddwn yn credu'n wahanol-er nad wyf, yn sicr, yn cofio bod Edwina wedi gofyn i Gordon Brown am arian cyfatebol. Fodd bynnag, un o'r pethau a wneuthum oedd edrych ar raglenni gwario i weld sut y gellid eu defnyddio fel arian cyfatebol. Mae hynny wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn; yr oedd yn defnyddio adnoddau'n dda iawn. Felly gwrthodaf gynnwys sylfaenol eich sylwadau, Alun, gan nad yw'n dal dŵr.

**Janet Davies:** Weinidog, yr ydych newydd ddweud ichi neilltuo rhywfaint o arian ac edrych ar raglenni gwario eraill—credaf imi nodi hynny'n gywir. Os felly, a allwch ein sicrhau nad effeithiwyd ar gyllidebau ar gyfer blaenoriaethau eraill, megis addysg ac iechyd, drwy ichi edrych ar raglenni gwario eraill?

**Sue Essex:** Mae gennym gyllideb enfawr, diolch i gynnydd Gordon Brown. Yr ydym yn siarad am swm agos i £14 billion. Yr oedd y swm a neilltuwyd fel arian wrth gefn yn y llinell gyllideb Ffordd i Ffyniant yn eithriadol o fach o'i gymharu â'r gyllideb. Y peth arall y mae'n werth ei gofio am y mater hwn yw ein bod mewn tir newydd, ac ni wyddom beth fydd y cyfraddau ymyriad, ac ni fyddwn yn gwybod hynny erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad

the end of this Assembly, as that information may come long after that. Again, this is the kind of sterile debate that you wind up having every so often, perhaps because you cannot think of anything else to say—that is probably true in Alun’s case—and you may be worrying about something unnecessarily. Let us wait and see what the intervention rate is, and let us wait and see what we will need anyway. I wholly reject the idea that this should cause us fear and foreboding about delivery on convergence funds, because we know that we have managed this incredibly well over the last four to five years, and I am sure that we will do the same next time.

hwn, oherwydd gall y wybodaeth honno gyrraedd gryn amser wedyn. Unwaith eto, dyma’r math o ddadl ddiffrwyth a gewch bob hyn a hyn, efallai am eich bod yn methu meddwl am ddim byd arall i’w ddweud—mae hynny’n debygol o fod yn wir yn achos Alun—ac efallai eich bod yn poeni am rywbeth yn ddiangen. Gadewch inni aros i weld beth fydd y gyfradd ymyrryd, a gadewch inni aros i weld beth fydd arnom ei angen beth bynnag. Gwrthodaf yn llwyr y syniad y dylai hyn beri ofn a phryder inni gyda gweithredu cronfeydd cydgyfeirio, oherwydd gwyddom inni reoli hyn yn eithriadol o dda dros y pedair neu’r pum mlynedd diwethaf, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnawn yr un peth y tro nesaf.

### Dyraniadau’r Gyllideb Gyffredinol Overall Budget Allocations

**Q6 John Griffiths:** What factors did the Minister consider in determining the overall budget allocations within the Assembly’s budget? OAQ0781(FIN)

**C6 John Griffiths:** Pa ffactorau a ystyriwyd gan y Gweinidog wrth bennu dyraniadau’r gyllideb gyffredinol o fewn cyllideb y Cynulliad? OAQ0781(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Our priorities for funding are set out in the final budget. This budget will enable us to achieve the implementation of our top 10 ‘Wales: A Better Country’ commitments, to meet pay and price pressures, to provide more capital investment, to meet the concerns of Assembly committees, and to reflect the discussions held with the opposition parties.

**Sue Essex:** Mae ein blaenoriaethau cyllido wedi eu gosod allan yn y gyllideb derfynol. Bydd y gyllideb hon yn ein galluogi i gyflawni ein 10 prif ymrwymiad yn ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’, i fodloni pwysau cyflog a phrisiau, i ddarparu mwy o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf, i leddfu pryderon pwyllgorau’r Cynulliad, ac i adlewyrchu’r trafodaethau a gafwyd gyda’r gwrthbleidiau.

**John Griffiths:** Central to the Welsh Assembly Government’s budget is social justice, and rightly so. I strongly believe that although equality of opportunity is a large part of achieving greater equality, we must increasingly move beyond that to greater equality of outcome. Is there anything at a strategic level in the budgeting process that would reflect the importance of social justice and greater equality of outcome as we move forward?

**John Griffiths:** Cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, yn hollol gywir, sydd wrth wraidd cyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Er bod cyfle cyfartal yn rhan fawr o sicrhau mwy o gydraddoldeb, credaf yn gryf ei bod yn rhaid inni symud y tu hwnt i hynny i sicrhau mwy o gydraddoldeb o ran canlyniad. A oes unrhyw beth ar lefel strategol yn y broses gyllidebu a fyddai’n adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a mwy o gydraddoldeb canlyniad wrth inni symud ymlaen?

**Sue Essex:** It is an interesting point, John, because we always focus, certainly in debates, on inputs. There is less of an emphasis on and examination of what the outcomes are. We are trying, certainly in preparation for the comprehensive spending

**Sue Essex:** Mae’n bwynt diddorol, John, oherwydd yr ydym bob amser yn canolbwyntio, mewn dadleuon yn sicr, ar fewnbynau. Mae llai o bwyslais ar y canlyniadau a’u harchwilio. Yr ydym yn ceisio ystyried, yn sicr wrth baratoi ar gyfer

review, to look at how we can evaluate our budgets and our spending to ensure that they deliver, particularly on the issues of equality. We were discussing this morning how we might be able to do that. Over the years, there have been many efforts, and I remember local government trying to evaluate programmes according to outcomes. That is a notoriously difficult thing to do but we need to do it on equality because it is absolutely fundamental to us, and we are looking at issues around children's budgeting and gender budgeting, to give two examples of where we might make a start on that.

yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, sut y gallwn werthuso ein cyllidebau a'n gwariant i sicrhau eu bod yn darparu, yn arbennig mewn materion cydraddoldeb. Yr oeddem yn trafod y bore yma sut y gallem wneud hynny. Cafwyd llawer ymgais dros y blynyddoedd, a chofiaf lywodraeth leol yn ceisio gwerthuso rhaglenni yn ôl canlyniadau. Mae hynny'n beth eithriadol o anodd ei wneud, ond mae angen ei wneud ym maes cydraddoldeb gan ei fod yn gwbl sylfaenol inni, ac yr ydym yn edrych ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â chyllidebu plant a chyllidebu ar sail rhyw, i roi dwy enghraifft lle y gallem ddechrau gwneud hynny.

### **Y Portffolio Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Portfolio**

**Q7 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on the overall budget allocation to the education, lifelong learning and skills portfolio? OAQ0762(FIN)

**C7 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrennir i'r portffolio addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau? OAQ0762(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** The budget provision for that portfolio was £1.548 billion in 2006-07. That represents an increase of 13 per cent over the 2005-06 provision. In 2007-08, the budget for education, lifelong learning and skills will rise to £1.9 billion.

**Sue Essex:** Y gyllideb a ddarparwyd ar gyfer y portffolio hwnnw oedd £1.548 biliwn yn 2006-07. Mae hynny'n gynydd o 13 y cant o'i gymharu â'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer 2005-06. Yn 2007-08, bydd y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau yn cynyddu i £1.9 biliwn.

2.30 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you are aware that one of the most contentious areas of the education budget is skill provision. It has been difficult to scrutinise such provision as it falls between the remit of two committees. Your Government's establishment of school budget fora was one way of making the workings and mechanisms of skill budgets accessible to people. If a school budget forum decided that it could not accept the settlement that its county authority was putting to it, and decided perhaps to support a motion opposing that budget, what status would that decision have, and how could it impact upon a local government settlement?

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol mai un o feysydd mwyaf cynhennus y gyllideb addysg yw darpariaeth sgiliau. Mae wedi bod yn anodd craffu ar ddarpariaeth felly am ei bod yn dod o dan gylch gorchwyl dau bwyllgor. Yr oedd penderfyniad eich Llywodraeth i sefydlu fforymau cyllideb ysgolion yn un ffordd o sicrhau bod prosesau a mecanweithiau cyllidebau sgiliau ar gael i bobl. Pe bai fforwm cyllideb ysgolion yn penderfynu na allai dderbyn y setliad yr oedd ei awdurdod sir yn ei gynnig iddo, ac yn penderfynu cefnogi cynnig a oedd yn gwrthwynebu'r gyllideb honno efallai, pa statws a fyddai gan y penderfyniad hwnnw, a sut y gallai effeithio ar setliad llywodraeth leol?

**Sue Essex:** In law, the people responsible for the determination of budgets in local authorities are clearly the duly elected

**Sue Essex:** Yn ôl y gyfraith, y bobl sy'n gyfrifol am benderfynu cyllidebau awdurdodau lleol yw'r cynghorwyr a etholir



councillors; nothing around the school budget forum could change that. There is a duty to consult and listen, and it has been quite an effective programme, but you must agree that, legally, any such decision must be for the councillors. I am sure that they would be informed that they have to take responsibility for such decisions.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Minister, I recently attended the laying of a time capsule at the site of the new building for Ysgol Ifor Bach in Senghennydd in my constituency. Do you agree with me that that is an excellent example of how we are spending money well for the future of children, and that new schools like that will provide a meaningful future for the children of the Aber valley?

**Sue Essex:** It must have been quite an exciting moment laying the time capsule at the school. I am sure that you also put something into the time capsule, Jeff, to make your contribution. However, what excites people is the fact that putting money into a public building, whether it is the Senedd, a school, or a hospital, means doing something for future generations. The idea is that our public buildings, particularly schools, should be as good as we can possibly get them to be, because we know that they will be used so much, and they will form the day-to-day experience of youngsters. I do not know when that time capsule will be dug up, but if it is a sustainable building, I would guess that it will be many years after it was laid.

**William Graham:** Minister, what representations have you received regarding funding for a new school for mathematical and computational science?

**Sue Essex:** I do not think that I have had any such representations, but if you want to write to me about that matter, I will look into it.

**Peter Black:** Let us move on from Jeff Cuthbert's time capsules to a time machine for a moment, and go back to the agreement that was reached among all parties on higher education student funding. You will recall

yn briodol yn amlwg; ni allai dim yn y fforwm cyllideb ysgolion newid hynny. Mae yna ddyletswydd i ymgynghori a gwranddo, ac mae wedi bod yn rhaglen ddigon effeithiol, ond rhaid ichi gytuno mai mater i'r cynghorwyr yw unrhyw benderfyniad o'r fath, yn ôl y gyfraith. Yr wyf yn siŵr y caent wybod ei bod yn rhaid iddynt gymryd cyfrifoldeb am benderfyniadau o'r fath.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Weinidog, yr oeddwn yn bresennol mewn digwyddiad yn ddiweddar i gladdu capsiwl amser ar safle'r adeilad newydd ar gyfer Ysgol Ifor Bach yn Senghennydd yn fy etholaeth. A gytunwch â mi fod hynny'n enghraifft wych o'r ffordd yr ydym yn gwario arian yn dda ar gyfer dyfodol ein plant, ac y bydd ysgolion newydd fel honno yn darparu dyfodol ystyrlon i blant cwm Aber?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n siŵr fod y profiad o gladdu capsiwl amser yn yr ysgol wedi bod un un cyffrous. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi hefyd wedi rhoi rhywbeth yn y capsiwl amser, Jeff, i wneud eich cyfraniad. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n cyffroi pobl yw'r ffaith fod buddsoddi arian mewn adeilad cyhoeddus, boed yn Senedd, yn ysgol, neu'n ysbyty, yn golygu gwneud rhywbeth ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Y syniad yw y dylai ein hadeiladau cyhoeddus, yn enwedig ysgolion, fod o'r safon uchaf posibl, oherwydd gwyddom y cânt eu defnyddio cymaint, ac y byddant yn llywio profiadau pobl ifanc o ddydd i ddydd. Ni wn pryd y caiff y capsiwl amser ei ddatgladdu, ond os yw'r adeilad yn un cynaliadwy, byddwn yn tybio y byddai hynny flynyddoedd lawer ar ôl ei gladdu.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, pa sylwadau a gawsoch am arian ar gyfer ysgol newydd ar gyfer gwyddor fathemategol a chyfrifiannu?

**Sue Essex:** Ni chredaf imi gael dim sylwadau felly, ond os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf am y mater hwnnw, mi af ar ei drywydd.

**Peter Black:** Gadewch inni symud ymlaen o gapsiwlau amser Jeff Cuthbert i beiriant amser am eiliad, a mynd yn ôl at yr hyn y cytunodd pob plaid arno ar ariannu myfyrwyr addysg uwch. Byddwch yn cofio mai un o'r

that one of the outstanding issues was the resolution of the funding gap between England and Wales. I appreciate that the Minister is still undertaking work on that, but could she give an indication of how much money is available in the next three years' budgets to try to bridge that gap?

**Sue Essex:** We put a little more money into the final version of the last budget, and, as you know, Peter, the next financial year will see a three-year settlement under the comprehensive spending review. That is the time for all the bids to come in, whether for higher education, health, or whatever.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 8, OAQ0787(FIN), is withdrawn.

materion na phenderfynwyd oedd cau'r bwlch ariannu rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r ffaith fod y Gweinidog yn parhau i weithio ar hynny, ond a all roi rhyw syniad faint o arian sydd ar gael yng nghyllidebau'r tair blynedd nesaf i geisio cau'r bwlch hwnnw?

**Sue Essex:** Rhoesom ychydig arian ychwanegol yn fersiwn terfynol y gyllideb ddiwethaf, ac fel y gwyddoch, Peter, bydd setliad tair blynedd yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf o dan yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Dyna'r amser i'r holl gynigion ddod i mewn, boed ar gyfer addysg uwch, iechyd, neu beth bynnag.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 8, OAQ0787(FIN), yn ôl.

### **Effeithiolrwydd Ariannol Financial Efficiency**

**Q9 David Melding:** What measures are being taken by the Welsh Assembly Government to improve the efficiency of Welsh Assembly Government finance procedures? OAQ0773(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Finance procedures are always under review to identify efficiencies while meeting changes in both internal and external reporting requirements. Current examples include new processes for purchases and for grants administration, and spreading the use of purchasing cards.

**David Melding:** Minister, do you agree that it is essential that we get the maximum for the Welsh pound in public spending, and that any fraud has to be rooted out of the system to send a positive message to taxpayers that their funds are being used effectively?

**Sue Essex:** Value for money is the holy grail, and we spend a lot of time trying to get value for money, because, if we can make the Welsh pound work to its maximum, people will understand that it is worth paying their taxes. We take a strong view on fraud, and I am pleased to say that such incidents rarely come to my attention; however, when they do occur, action is taken. I know that this is a

**C9 David Melding:** Pa gamau a gymerir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud gweithdrefnau ariannol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn fwy effeithiol? OAQ0773(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Mae gweithdrefnau ariannol yn cael eu hadolygu'n barhaus er mwyn nodi effeithlonrwydd gan fodloni newidiadau mewn gofynion adrodd mewnol ac allanol. Ymhlith yr enghreifftiau presennol mae prosesau newydd ar gyfer pryniadau a gweinyddu grantiau, ac defnyddio cardiau prynu yn ehangach.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, a gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol inni sicrhau'r gwerth mwyaf am y bunt yng Nghymru mewn gwariant cyhoeddus, a bod yn rhaid dileu unrhyw achosion o dwyll o'r system er mwyn rhoi neges gadarnhaol i drethdalwyr fod eu harian yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n effeithiol?

**Sue Essex:** Gwerth yr arian yw'r greal sanctaidd, ac yr ydym yn treulio llawer o amser yn ceisio sicrhau gwerth yr arian, oherwydd os gallwn sicrhau bod punt Cymru'n gweithio i'r eithaf, bydd pobl yn deall bod talu eu trethi yn werth chweil. Yr ydym yn ystyried achosion o dwyll o ddifrif, ac yr wyf yn falch dweud mai anaml iawn y daw digwyddiadau o'r fath i'm sylw; fodd

key issue for local authorities, too.

bynag, pan fyddant yn digwydd, cymerir camau gweithredu. Gwn fod hwn yn fater allweddol i awdurdodau lleol, hefyd.

### **Y Portffolio Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Portfolio**

**C10 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw drafodaethau diweddar a fu rhyngddi a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ynghylch y cyllid a ddyrennir i'w phortffolio? OAQ0766(FIN)

**Q10 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on any recent discussions that she has had with the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills with regard to the allocation of funding to her portfolio? OAQ0766(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** I meet regularly with the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, and we have regular discussions on budgetary issues.

**Sue Essex:** Byddaf yn cyfarfod â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn rheolaidd, a chawn drafodaethau rheolaidd am faterion cyllidebol.

**David Lloyd:** Mae mwyafrif yr ysgolion yn Abertawe mewn dyled ac mae'r fforwm cyllideb ysgolion lleol yn gwrthod derbyn cyllideb addysg ddrafft y sir am fod yr arian sydd ar gael yn annigonol, yn ôl penaethiaid yr ysgolion. A ydych yn trafod problemau unigol siroedd fel hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol a Sgiliau, ac a oes grym o gwbl gan fforymau cyllideb ysgolion ynteu siopau siarad yn unig ydynt?

**David Lloyd:** The majority of schools in Swansea are in debt, and the local school budget forum refuses to accept the county's draft education budget, because the money available is insufficient according to heads of schools. Do you discuss the individual problems of counties like that with the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, and do the school budget fora have any power at all, or are they just talking shops?

**Sue Essex:** This follows on from Janet's question. I think that the fora do have some power. Local authority members—and many of us have been there—have responsibility across the piece, so you just cannot just say 'yes' to one particular group, however valid its concerns. Earlier, we discussed social care needs and how important those are, so I do understand that there are pressures from various areas.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ategu cwestiwn Janet. Credaf fod gan y fforymau rywfaint o bŵer. Mae gan aelodau awdurdodau lleol—ac mae nifer ohonom wedi bod yn aelodau—gyfrifoldeb cyffredinol, felly ni allwch ddweud 'ie' wrth un grŵp yn benodol, waeth pa mor ddilys yw ei bryderon. Yn gynharach buom yn trafod anghenion gofal cymdeithasol a pha mor bwysig ydynt, felly, yr wyf yn deall bod pwysau o feysydd amrywiol.

On the issue in Swansea, Jane Davidson, as the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills would take the lead on that, but I think that it is a serious issue for the council. I am sure that it is taking its education provision seriously. It is an issue of making sure that its revenue stream is strong enough to support the budgets of the schools. I know that the local authority has a real issue about the modernisation and reconfiguration of the buildings, and that brings us back to the first question. I know that these are not

O ran y mater yn Abertawe, Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, a fyddai'n bennaf cyfrifol am hynny, ond credaf ei fod yn fater difrifol i'r cyngor. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn cymryd ei ddarpariaeth addysg o ddifrif. Mae'n fater o sicrhau bod ei ffrwd refeniw yn ddigon cryf i gefnogi cyllidebau'r ysgolion. Gwn fod gan yr awdurdod lleol broblem wirioneddol o ran moderneiddio ac ail-gyflunio'r adeiladau, a daw hynny â ni yn ôl at y cwestiwn cyntaf. Gwn nad yw'r rhain yn benderfyniadau

easy, but they are decisions that have to be made; otherwise, children will continue to be in sub-standard buildings, which cannot be good.

hawdd, ond rhaid inni eu gwneud; fel arall, bydd plant yn parhau mewn adeiladau nad ydynt yn cyrraedd y safon, ac ni all hynny fod yn beth da.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside**

### **Llosgi Gwastraff Waste Incineration**

**Q1 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the levels of waste incineration in Wales? OAQ1069(EPC)

**C1 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefelau llosgi gwastraff yng Nghymru? OAQ1069(EPC)

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** The latest figures for 2005-06 show that only 0.1 per cent of all municipal solid waste was incinerated in Wales.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf am 2005-06 mai 0.1 y cant yn unig o'r holl wastraff solet trefol a losgwyd yng Nghymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** It is my understanding that each north Wales local authority is working towards the 25 per cent target, but none has any specific plans other than landfill, which, as we know, is unsustainable. We know that incineration gets a bad press, but energy from waste can help to reduce landfill. Do you believe that energy from waste has an important part to play in reducing the use of landfill?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae pob awdurdod lleol yn y gogledd yn gweithio tuag at darged o 25 y cant, ond nid oes gan yr un ohonynt ddim cynlluniau penodol ar wahân i tirlenwi, ac fel y gwyddom, nid yw hynny'n gynaliadwy. Gwyddom fod llosgi'n cael sylw negyddol yn y wasg, ond gall ynni o wastraff helpu lleihau tirlenwi. A ydych yn credu bod ynni o wastraff yn bwysig wrth geisio defnyddio llai o safleoedd tirlenwi?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes, energy from waste is preferred to incineration and landfill.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ydwyf. Mae ynni o wastraff yn well na llosgi a safleoedd tirlenwi.

**Glyn Davies:** I think that that is right, Minister. It is a matter for local authorities to decide whether they bring forward incineration proposals. However, we know perfectly well that we are running out of landfill space. We would all want to extend the availability of landfill by slowing down as quickly as possible the volume of waste that is sent to landfill, and the only way to achieve that is through proposals for combined heat and power, or incineration facilities, for example. We also know that that will not happen without a clear direction from you and strong guidance to local authorities to bring proposals forward. Do you see a role for yourself in speeding up what is happening as a way of extending landfill, so that it can be used only for waste

**Glyn Davies:** Credaf fod hynny'n gywir, Weinidog. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu a ydynt am gyflwyno cynigion llosgi. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom yn iawn ein bod yn rhedeg allan o safleoedd tirlenwi. Byddem i gyd am sicrhau bod safleoedd tirlenwi ar dal ar gael drwy arafu faint o wastraff sy'n cael ei anfon i safleoedd tirlenwi cyn gynted â phosibl, a'r unig ffordd i gyflawni hynny yw drwy gynigion ar gyfer cyfleusterau gwres a phŵer cyfunol, neu gyfleusterau llosgi, er enghraifft. Gwyddom hefyd na fydd hynny'n digwydd heb gyfarwyddyd clir gennych chi a chanllawiau cryf i awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno cynigion. A ydych yn ystyried bod gennych rôl yn y gwaith o gyflymu'r hyn sy'n digwydd fel ffordd i ymestyn safleoedd tirlenwi, fel y

that has to be disposed of in that way in the future?

**Carwyn Jones:** From 2010, local authorities will be fined £200 per tonne of waste that they take to landfill over and above their landfill allowance. It is a financial incentive for them to develop alternative facilities. We have said quite clearly to local authorities in Wales that they must work together to create regional waste plants that will deal with waste. It is unrealistic to expect every local authority to deal with all waste arisings entirely within the boundaries of the local authority area. Work is now progressing at an all-Wales level to ensure that there are regional waste plants across the entire country.

**Janet Ryder:** Regardless of whether it is purely a waste incineration facility or a waste-for-heating facility, there will still be an emission of some form. Many questions have been raised as to what such emissions contain and the effect that they may have not just on near neighbourhoods but on other areas that may fall within the plume coming out of the facility. One of the objections to the development of the kiln in Padeswood was that the plume would cover a distance extending beyond Ruthin into the Vale of Clwyd. Are you satisfied that, if or when applications for such facilities come in, the guidance is in place to ensure that a wide enough area will be consulted, and that due account will be taken of any health implications that could ensue from airborne emissions from such facilities?

2.40 a.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes. The Environment Agency has the responsibility of monitoring what comes out of the chimneys of energy from waste plants, and it will do that. The present guidelines suggest that the levels of emissions from an energy-from-waste plant are substantially lower than those from bonfires or other forms of fires, which we must bear in mind. Energy-from-waste plants do not of themselves overpollute. One thing must be made crystal clear, and that is that people want their rubbish taken away, but

gallant gael eu defnyddio ar gyfer gwastraff y mae'n rhaid ei waredu fel hynny'n unig yn y dyfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** O 2010, caiff awdurdodau lleol ddirwy o £200 am bob tonnell o wastraff a anfonant i safleoedd tirlenwi sy'n fwy na'u lwfans tirlenwi. Mae'n gymhelliant ariannol iddynt ddatblygu cyfleusterau amgen. Yr ydym wedi dweud yn eithaf clir wrth awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ei bod yn rhaid iddynt gydweithio i greu gweithfeydd gwastraff rhanbarthol a fydd yn delio â gwastraff. Mae'n afrealistig disgwyl i bob awdurdod lleol ddelio â'r holl wastraff o fewn ffiniau ardal yr awdurdod lleol. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo bellach ledled Cymru gyfan i sicrhau bod gweithfeydd gwastraff rhanbarthol ar gael ar draws y wlad.

**Janet Ryder:** P'un a yw'n gyfleuster llosgi gwastraff yn unig neu'n gyfleuster gwastraff ar gyfer gwres, bydd rhyw fath o ollyngiad o hyd. Codwyd nifer o gwestiynau am yr hyn sydd mewn gollyngiadau o'r fath a'r effaith y gallent ei chael nid yn unig ar gymdogaethau cyfagos ond ar ardaloedd eraill a allai ddioddef yn sgîl y mwg a ddaw allan o'r cyfleuster. Un o'r gwrthwynebiadau i ddatblygu'r odyd yn Padeswood oedd y byddai'r mwg yn cwmpasu pellter y tu hwnt i Ruthun i Ddyffryn Clwyd. A ydych yn fodlon fod y canllawiau ar waith i sicrhau y bydd ardal ddigon eang yn rhan o'r ymgynghori os cyflwynir ceisiadau ar gyfer cyfleusterau o'r fath neu pan wneir hynny, ac yr ystyrir yn briodol unrhyw oblygiadau iechyd a allai ddeillio o ollyngiadau awyr o gyfleusterau o'r fath?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ydwyf. Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd sy'n gyfrifol am fonitro'r hyn a ddaw allan o simneiau ynni o weithfeydd gwastraff, a bydd yn gwneud hynny. Mae'r canllawiau cyfredol yn awgrymu bod lefelau'r ollyngiadau o waith ynni-o-wastraff lawer yn is na'r gollyngiadau o danau gwyllt neu fathau eraill o danau, a rhaid inni gofio hynny. Nid yw gweithfeydd ynni-o-wastraff yn gor-lygru ynddynt eu hunain. Rhaid gwneud un peth yn gwbl glir, sef bod pobl am i'w gwastraff gael ei gymryd i ffrwd,

they do not want it to be disposed of next to them. That said, it is essential that we have energy-from-waste plants to deal with the waste residue that cannot be recycled or reused. There is no getting away from that simple fact.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Can you say something about your recent announcement of £10,000 funding to enable the collection and recycling of mercury products, which, I presume, cannot be incinerated? I think that the main culprit is strip lighting, but how can mercury products be recycled, if they cannot be incinerated?

**Carwyn Jones:** There are ways of recycling mercury products; for example, a plant exists in the Cynon valley that deals with strip lighting. Some forms of lighting are now classified as hazardous waste, and must be dealt with in that way; nevertheless, much more can be done to encourage recycling. We have gone from a recycling rate of 4 per cent to 25 per cent in Wales over the past five or six years, and we aim to reach 40 per cent by 2010, which means that there is still much more scope to recycle and reuse what we produce.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2, OAQ1060(EPC), is transferred for written answer.

ond nid ydynt am iddo gael ei waredu wrth eu hymyl. Er hynny, mae'n hanfodol inni gael gweithfeydd ynni-o-wastraff i ddelio â'r gwastraff na ellir ei ailgylchu neu ei aildddefnyddio. Ni ellir dianc rhag y ffaith syml honno.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A allwch ddweud rhywbeth am eich cyhoeddiad yn ddiweddar ynghylch dyrannu £10,000 i alluogi casg;u ac ailgylchu cynnyrch mercwri, na all gael ei losgi, mi dybiaf? Credaf mai'r brif broblem yw goleuadau stribed, ond sut y gellir ailgylchu cynnyrch mercwri os na ellir ei losgi?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae yna ffyrdd i ailgylchu cynnyrch mercwri; er enghraifft, mae gwaith yng nghwm Cynon sy'n ymdrin â goleuadau stribed. Caiff rhai mathau o oleuadau eu dosbarthu bellach fel gwastraff peryglus, a rhaid delio â'r rheini fel hynny; er hynny, gellir gwneud llawer mwy i annog ailgylchu. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r gyfradd ailgylchu o 4 y cant i 25 y cant yng Nghymru yn ystod y pum neu'r chwe blynedd diwethaf, a'r nod yw cyrraedd 40 y cant erbyn 2010, sy'n golygu bod llawer mwy o le i ailgylchu ac aildddefnyddio'r hyn a gynhyrchwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 2, OAQ1060(EPC), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

### Lefelau Gollyngiadau Carbon Carbon-emission Levels

**Q3 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on levels of carbon emission in Wales? OAQ1017(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The most recent figures for Wales produced by the former National Environmental Technology Centre show that in 2004 emissions of carbon dioxide were 11.4 megatonnes of carbon.

**Mick Bates:** The figures that I have received from Friends of the Earth for 2003-04 show that carbon emissions in Wales rose from 38.1 million tonnes to 41.8 million tonnes, an increase of 9.7 per cent. In Scotland, there was a decrease of 5.7 per cent. Do you agree that we need to set annual targets to reduce

**C3 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefelau gollyngiadau carbon yng Nghymru? OAQ1017(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf ar gyfer Cymru a baratowyd gan yr hen Ganolfan Technoleg Amgylcheddol Genedlaethol fod gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yn cynnwys 11.4 megatunnell o garbon yn 2004.

**Mick Bates:** Dengys y ffigurau a gefais gan Gyfeillion y Ddaear am 2003-04 fod gollyngiadau carbon yng Nghymru wedi codi o 38.1 miliwn o dunelli i 41.8 miliwn o dunelli, sef cynnydd o 9.7 y cant. Yn yr Alban, cafwyd gostyngiad o 5.7 y cant. A gytunwch fod angen inni bennu targedau

carbon emissions? Will you support the setting of targets in the new climate Bill and ensure that there is an annual decrease in carbon emissions so that can we ameliorate the impact of climate change?

**Carwyn Jones:** To put that into context, there has been an increase of 2.3 per cent carbon dioxide emissions compared with the figures from 1990; nevertheless, there was a decrease of 3.5 per cent from 1990 to 2004 in emissions of the six greenhouse gases. I do not agree with the idea that Wales should have its own targets, for the reason that so many of the levers that can be pulled to reduce greenhouse gases are at a UK level, such as financial incentives or disincentives, and energy policy. It is important that we look at a UK level at what more we can do to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

**Mick Bates:** While I understand your point about figures and their various sources, I think that your answer betrays a lack of commitment on behalf of your Government to reduce carbon emissions in Wales in conjunction with the rest of the UK. Further to that end, the Department of Trade and Industry has a low-carbon building programme for which the last tranche of money ran out within hours of its release. I have now learned that WEBS, the wood energy business scheme, much hailed by you and others as a great scheme to reduce carbon by installing biomass plants, has also run out of money. Given the commitment that you have expressed on many occasions to reducing carbon, will you put money back into the scheme so that people in Wales can still take advantage of this unique and very good scheme?

**Carwyn Jones:** I cannot answer for the workings of the Department of Trade and Industry, because, as far as I am aware, it is not a Welsh Assembly Government department. As for how we see climate change, you will be aware of the announcements that were made before Christmas in that regard, and there will be further announcements in terms of adaptation and mitigation in due course.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you agree that there

blynyddol i leihau gollyngiadau carbon? A fyddwch yn cefnogi'r gwaith o bennu targedau yn y Mesur hinsawdd newydd, a sicrhau y bydd gostyngiad blynyddol mewn gollyngiadau carbon fel y gallwn leddfu effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd?

**Carwyn Jones:** I roi hynny yn ei gyd-destun, bu cynnydd o 2.3 y cant mewn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid o'u cymharu â'r ffigurau am 1990; er hynny, cafwyd gostyngiad o 3.5 y cant rhwng 1990 a 2004 mewn gollyngiadau o'r chwe nwy tŷ gwydr. Ni chytunaf â'r syniad y dylai Cymru bennu ei thargedau ei hun, oherwydd bod cynifer o'r pethau y gellir eu gwneud i leihau nwyon tŷ gwydr ar lefel y DU, fel cymhellion neu anghymhellion ariannol, a pholisïau ynni. Mae'n bwysig inni edrych ar yr hyn y gellir ei wneud eto i leihau gollyngiadau nwy tŷ gwydr ar lefel y DU.

**Mick Bates:** Er fy mod yn deall eich pwynt am ffigurau a'u hamrywiol ffynonellau, credaf fod eich ateb yn dangos diffyg ymrwymiad ar ran eich Llywodraeth i leihau gollyngiadau carbon yng Nghymru ac yng ngweddill y DU. Yn ogystal, mae gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant raglen adeiladu carbon isel, ond daeth y gyfran olaf o arian ar ei chyfer i ben cyn pen oriau ar ôl ei chyhoeddi. Bellach, yr wyf wedi clywed bod WEBS, sef y cynllun busnes ynni pren, a gaiff ei ganmol gennych chi ac eraill fel cynllun ardderchog i leihau carbon drwy greu gweithfeydd biomas, hefyd wedi rhedeg allan o arian. O gofio'r ymrwymiad a fynegwyd gennych droeon i leihau carbon, a wnewch chi roi arian yn ôl yn y cynllun fel y gall pobl Cymru fanteisio ar y cynllun da iawn ac unigryw hwn o hyd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni allaf ateb ar ran yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, oherwydd hyd y gwn i nid yw'n un o adrannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. O ran ein barn ni a newid yn yr hinsawdd, byddwch yn gwybod am y cyhoeddiadau a wnaed cyn y Nadolig am y mater, a bydd rhagor o gyhoeddiadau o ran addasu a lliniaru maes o law.

**Leighton Andrews:** A gytunwch fod y

is a desire among the public and many local community groups to get involved in projects to reduce carbon emissions? Can you tell us a bit about what support you might be willing to give to those groups?

**Carwyn Jones:** It depends on whether the support comes from my departmental budget or from that of my colleague, Andrew Davies, who is, of course, the Minister responsible for energy. If there are specific projects that can demonstrate an environmental gain, then we would be grateful to know of them.

cyhoedd a nifer o grwpiau cymunedol lleol yn awyddus i gymryd rhan mewn prosiectau i leihau gollyngiadau carbon? A allwch sôn rywfaint wrthym am y cymorth y gallech ei roi i'r grwpiau hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n dibynnu a fydd y cymorth yn dod o'm cyllideb adrannol i neu o gyllideb adrannol fy nghyd-Aelod, Andrew Davies, sef y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ynni, wrth gwrs. Os oes prosiectau penodol a all ddangos budd amgylcheddol, yna byddai'n dda gennym wybod amdanynt.

### **Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Energy Efficiency**

**Q4 Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister make a statement on how he intends to utilise the planning process to promote energy efficiency across all sectors in Wales? OAQ1034(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** On 14 December 2006, I issued a written statement on planning and climate change and released a consultation package that proposes amendments to national planning policy to deal with climate change. This introduces stronger policy and guidance to promote the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions through the planning process and includes energy efficiency targets.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for the Minister's answer. On his statement in response to a previous question, I question why he is not prepared to have a target for Wales—he said that that is because so many of the levers are at the UK level—when planning policy has a significant influence on greenhouse gas emissions. Will he look closely at that, recognising that the target for Wales may well be different from the target for England because Wales has more manufacturing industries than many parts of England? It may not necessarily be the same target, but at least there would be a target. Furthermore, that could be extended down to local authorities so that they could play their part and everyone could have ownership of tackling greenhouse gas emissions.

**C4 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae'n bwriadu defnyddio'r broses gynllunio i hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni ar draws pob sector yng Nghymru? OAQ1034(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Ar 14 Rhagfyr 2006, gwneuthum ddatganiad ysgrifenedig ar gynllunio a newydd yn yr hinsawdd, a chyhoeddais becyn ymgynghori sy'n cynnig gwelliannau yn y polisi cynllunio cenedlaethol i fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae'n cyflwyno polisi a chanllawiau cryfach i hyrwyddo lleihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr drwy'r broses gynllunio, ac mae'n cynnwys targedau effeithlonrwydd ynni.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. O ran ei ddatganiad mewn ymateb i gwestiwn blaenorol, hoffwn gwestiynu pam nad yw'n fodlon cael targed i Gymru-dywedodd mai'r rheswm am hynny yw bod cynifer o'r ffactorau ar lefel y Dua pholisi cynllunio'n cael dylanwad sylweddol ar ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr. A wnaiff ystyried hynny'n ofalus, gan dderbyn y gallai'r targed ar gyfer Cymru fod yn wahanol i'r targed ar gyfer Lloegr, am fod mwy o ddiwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru nag mewn llawer rhan o Loegr? Efallai nad yr un targed fyddai hwnnw o reidrwydd, ond o leiaf byddai targed ar gael. At hynny, gallai'r targed hwn gael ei ymestyn i lawr i awdurdodau lleol fel y gallent wneud eu rhan, a gallai pawb gael rhan yn y gwaith o fynd i'r afael â



gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwyr.

**Carwyn Jones:** It is quite appropriate to have targets in areas where there are devolved powers, which is why we have planning targets. Members may have noticed that, before Christmas, I decided to issue a ministerial interim planning policy statement, which detailed our intention to ensure that certain future developments of a certain size should aim at being 10 per cent more energy efficient than building regulations currently allow for. That means that there will be 10 per cent greater efficiency in Wales than in England.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae pennu targedau yn gwbl briodol mewn meysydd lle mae pwerau wedi eu datganoli, a dyma pam mae gennym dargedau cynllunio. Efallai fod yr Aelodau wedi sylwi, cyn y Nadolig, imi benderfynu cyhoeddi datganiad gweinidogol ar bolisi cynllunio interim, a oedd yn rhoi manylion am ein bwriad i sicrhau, yn y dyfodol, y dylai datblygiadau penodol o faint penodol anelu at fod 10 y cant yn fwy effeithlon o ran ynni nag a ganiateir gan reoliadau adeiladu ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd 10 y cant yn fwy o effeithlonrwydd yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr.

**Elin Jones:** Mae Gordon Brown wedi gosod targed yn ddiweddar ei fod eisiau sicrhau nad oes un adeilad newydd yn gollwng carbon. A ydych yn rhannu'r weledigaeth hon ac, os ydych, a gredwch ei bod yn bosibl i gyflawni'r weledigaeth hon drwy reoliadau cynllunio'n unig?

**Elin Jones:** Gordon Brown has recently set a target to ensure that every new building is carbon-neutral. Do you share that vision and, if so, do you believe it is possible to achieve that vision through planning regulations alone?

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhannaf y weledigaeth honno, ond ni chredaf ei bod yn bosibl i'r rheoliadau cynllunio wneud popeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bosibl i'r rheoliadau cynllunio sicrhau bod Cymru yn gwneud yn well na Lloegr o ran rheoliadau adeiladu nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli.

**Carwyn Jones:** I share that vision but I do not believe it is possible for planning regulations to do everything. However, it is possible for planning regulations to ensure that Wales does better than England in terms of building regulations that are not devolved.

**Elin Jones:** Mae'r rhan fwyaf o garbon yn dod o adeiladau sydd yn bodoli eisoes. Mae llawer o adeiladau sector gyhoeddus—ysbytai, ysgolion ac yn y blaen—gyda'r mwyaf euog. A gytunwch y dylai fod yn haws, o ran canllawiau cynllunio, ystyried roi caniatâd i gynlluniau ynni adnewyddol ar gyfer adeiladau sydd yn bodoli eisoes, fel ysbytai ac ysgolion, fel eu bod yn gallu dod yn fwy hunan-gynaliadwy o ran ynni?

**Elin Jones:** Most carbon comes from buildings that already exist. Many public sector buildings—hospitals, schools and so on—are among the most guilty. Do you agree that it should be easier, in terms of planning guidelines, to consider giving permission for renewable energy schemes for buildings that are already in existence, such as hospitals and schools, so that they can become more self-sufficient in terms of energy?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ar hyn o bryd, mae llawer o ddatblygiadau yn gallu mynd yn eu blaenau heb ganiatâd cynllunio. Yr oedd dadl yn y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar ar meicrogynhyrchu ac ydym yn symud ymlaen ar hynny mewn modd trawsbleidiol.

**Carwyn Jones:** At present, many developments can go ahead without planning permission. There was a recent Assembly debate on microgeneration, and we are moving ahead on that in a cross-party manner.

**Kirsty Williams:** The energy efficiency commitment requires suppliers of gas and electricity to meet targets for the promotion and improvement of household energy

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r ymrwymiad ar effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gyflenwyr nwy a thrydan fodloni targedau ar gyfer hyrwyddo a gwella

efficiency. The current rules work against areas such as Brecon and Radnorshire because it has a disproportionately high number of solid-wall houses and houses with small loft spaces, which makes it difficult to heat and treat them. The Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs is currently out to consultation on the rules for the third phase of the energy efficiency commitment. Have you responded to that consultation and, in your response, what argument have you made for Wales to get a better deal out of energy efficiency commitment money in future?

**Carwyn Jones:** I have not seen the consultation that you mention, but I take on board the original and novel point that you make, which will need to be investigated when it comes to dealing with the consultation, should it come to my department.

effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref. Mae'r rheolau presennol yn gweithio yn erbyn ardaloedd fel Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed gan fod yno nifer uwch o dai sydd â waliau solet a thai â lloffttydd bach, sy'n ei gwneud yn anodd eu gwresogi a'u trin. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn ymgynghori ar y rheolau ar gyfer trydydd cam yr ymrwymiad effeithlonrwydd ynni. A ydych wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw, ac yn eich ymateb sut yr ydych wedi dadlau y dylai Cymru gael gwell bargaen o'r arian sydd wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer yr ymrwymiad effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y dyfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf wedi gweld yr ymgynghoriad y soniwyd amdano, ond ystyriaif y pwynt gwreiddiol a wnewch. Bydd angen ymchwilio iddo pan ddaw'r amser i ddelio â'r ymgynghoriad, os daw i'm hadran i.

#### **Safonau mewn Bywyd Cyhoeddus Standards in Public Life**

**Q5 Jonathan Morgan:** How many of the recommendations relating to planning authorities, contained in the third report of the Committee on Standards in Public Life, 'Standards of Conduct of Local Government in England, Scotland and Wales', have not been implemented in Wales? OAQ1032(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** All the planning recommendations have been taken forward.

2.50 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I welcome that assurance. From recent exchanges the Minister knows that I have been particularly concerned about the lack of implementation of recommendation 38, which suggested that when a planning authority, that is, a local authority, had an interest in a piece of land that it was being asked to give planning consent for, it should refer the matter to the Assembly. The assurance that he has given this afternoon will go some way towards giving confidence to my constituents in Cardiff who feel that on many occasions the local authority does not display that

**C5 Jonathan Morgan:** Faint o'r argymhellion yn ymwneud ag awdurdodau cynllunio, a gynhwyswyd yn nhrydydd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Safonau mewn Bywyd Cyhoeddus, 'Safonau Ymddygiad Llywodraeth Leol yng Nghymru, Lloegr a'r Alban', sydd heb eu gweithredu yng Nghymru? OAQ1032(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae pob un o'r argymhellion cynllunio wedi'u gweithredu.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Croesawaf y sicrwydd hwnnw. O'n cysylltiadau'n ddiweddar, gŵyr y Gweinidog fy mod yn pryderu'n arbennig am y diffyg gweithredu ar argymhelliad 38, a oedd yn awgrymu pan fyddai gan awdurdod cynllunio, hynny yw, awdurdod lleol, fuddiant mewn darn o dir y gofynnir iddo roi caniatâd cynllunio ar ei gyfer, y dylai gyfeirio'r mater i'r Cynulliad. Bydd y sicrwydd a roddwyd ganddo y prynhawn yma yn helpu rhoi hyder i'm hetholwyr yng Nghaerdydd sy'n teimlo, ar lawer achlysur, nad yw'r awdurdod lleol yn dangos y parodrwydd hwnnw i ddatgan ei fuddiant

willingness to make known its interest in a piece of land, when it is clear that it would benefit from that land's being developed. When I visit a campaign group this evening, I am sure that they will be pleased that those recommendations have been implemented.

**Carwyn Jones:** I can assist Jonathan further by saying that local planning authorities are already required to defer planning applications in which they have an interest to the National Assembly. That is to be found under the direction given in Welsh Office Circular 39/92.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, I am sure that you agree that one important standard relates to applications being dealt with in as timely a manner as possible. I press you to let us know whether you can give us any more details on planning for a final decision after the call-in of the development at Stradey Park. I understand that the time to discuss it might be short, but I press you again as to whether there is any way that it could be determined by a planning committee in the lifetime of this Assembly.

**Carwyn Jones:** I cannot give that guarantee. The procedure followed is that the planning inspector has to produce a report on the inquiry, the report is then looked at by officials, and appropriate advice is given to the planning decision committee or, after May, to a Minister. That can take some time, depending on the complexity of the issues raised, but, nevertheless, I can give an assurance that a decision will be taken as quickly as possible, although I cannot give an assurance that that will be before May.

mewn darn o dir, pan yw'n amlwg y byddai'n cael budd o ddatblygu'r tir hwnnw. Pan ymwelaf â grŵp ymgyrchu heno, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn falch gwybod bod yr argymhellion hynny wedi'u gweithredu.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallaf gynorthwyo Jonathan ymhellach drwy ddweud ei bod eisoes yn ofynnol i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol gyfeirio ceisiadau cynllunio y mae ganddynt fudd ynddynt i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae hyn i'w weld dan y cyfarwyddyd a roddwyd yng Nghylchlythyr 39/92 y Swyddfa Gymreig.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod un safon bwysig yn ymwneud ag ymdrin â cheisiadau mewn modd mor amserol â phosibl. Pwysaf arnoch i ddweud wrthym a allwch roi mwy o fanylion inni ar gynllunio ar gyfer penderfyniad terfynol ar ôl i'r datblygiad ym Mharc y Strade gael ei alw i mewn. Deallaf fod amser yn brin, ond pwysaf arnoch eto i ddweud a oes unrhyw ffordd y gallai gael ei benderfynu gan bwyllgor cynllunio yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni allaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw. Y drefn yw bod yn rhaid i'r arolygydd cynllunio gynhyrchu adroddiad ar yr ymchwiliad, yna bydd swyddogion yn edrych ar yr adroddiad, a chaiff cyngor priodol ei roi i'r pwyllgor sy'n gwneud y penderfyniad cynllunio neu, ar ôl mis Mai, i Weinidog. Gall hynny gymryd cryn amser, yn dibynnu ar gymhlethdod y materion a gaiff eu codi. Er hynny, gallaf roi sicrwydd y caiff penderfyniad ei wneud cyn gynted â phosibl, er na allaf roi sicrwydd y bydd hynny'n digwydd cyn mis Mai.

### Pris Llaeth The Price of Milk

**C6 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal ynghylch pris llaeth wrth gât y fferm? OAQ1041(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn ddiweddar cyfarfûm â chadeirydd a phrif weithredwr Dairy UK i drafod cyflwr y diwydiant godro, nid yn unig yng Nghymru ond ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Fel rhan o'r drafodaeth honno, cyfeiriais at

**Q6 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What recent discussions has the Minister held regarding the price of milk at the farm gate? OAQ1041(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** I recently met with the chairman and chief executive of Dairy UK to discuss the state of the milk industry, not just in Wales but throughout the United Kingdom. As part of those discussions, I

brisiau wrth gât y fferm a chawsom drafodaeth fanwl.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Nid oes rhaid i mi atgoffa'r Gweinidog am sefyllfa'r diwydiant llaeth, a bod prisiau llaeth mor isel erbyn hyn bod nifer cynyddol o ffermwyr yng Nghymru yn gadael y sector. Yr oeddent yn hynod siomedig ynglŷn â chanlyniad yr adroddiad diweddar ar gystadleuaeth gyda'r archfarchnadoedd, a oedd ar fater eithaf cul yn unig. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried y dylid ailedrych ar rym yr archfarchnadoedd mewn adroddiad a fyddai'n llawer ehangach mewn sgôp? Yn atodol at hynny, yng ngoleuni'r drafodaeth ynglŷn â dyfodol cwotâu llaeth yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, beth yw polisi ei Lywodraeth o safbwynt cwotâu? A yw'r Llywodraeth o blaid eu parhau neu a yw am eu diddymu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Y mae'r cwotâu yn mynd i fynd beth bynnag. Mae'n rhaid derbyn hynny—2014 yw'r dyddiad ar gyfer hynny. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod cwotâu wastad wedi bod mewn cyflwr eithaf sigledig, ac mae sôn wedi bod am eu diddymu ers blynyddoedd.

O ran prisiau, mae Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn edrych ar hyn ar hyn o bryd, a bu sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth ar y sector llaeth y bore yma. Wedi dweud hynny, deallaf bydd mwy o ymchwil yn cael ei wneud gan yr awdurdodau yn Llundain o ran archfarchnadoedd, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld canlyniadau hynny.

**Brynle Williams:** The new dairy strategy outlines the growth of markets for niche products, such as organic, premium and added-value products, and that is undoubtedly a good direction in which to be headed. However, do you recognise, Minister, that improvements to the market for dairy produce may be too slow for many producers who are already on the brink of closing down their milk operations, and that the continued loss of dairy farmers will have a serious knock-on effect on the agricultural industry in Wales as a whole? It also risks distorting the market for beef and lamb in Wales.

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not agree that it is distorting the market for beef and lamb. We

referred to farm-gate prices and we had a detailed discussion.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I do not need to remind the Minister of the situation in the milk industry and that milk prices are so low now that an increasing number of farmers in Wales is leaving the sector. They were extremely disappointed with the outcome of the recent report on competition with supermarkets, which was on a very narrow issue alone. Does the Minister consider that the power of the supermarkets should be revisited in a report that would be much wider in scope? In addition to that, in the light of the discussion on the future of milk quotas in the European Union, what is his Government's policy on quotas? Is the Government in favour of their continuation, or does it want them to be abolished?

**Carwyn Jones:** The quotas will go in any case. We have to accept that—2014 is the date for that. It is important to remember that quotas have always been in a very an unstable state, and there has been talk of abolishing them for years.

On prices, the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee is currently considering this, and there was a session of evidence-taking on the milk sector this morning. Having said that, I understand the authorities in London will be conducting more research into supermarkets, and I look forward to seeing the results of that.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'r strategaeth laeth newydd yn amlinellu twf marchnadoedd ar gyfer cynnyrch arbenigol, fel cynnyrch organig, premiwm a gwerth ychwanegol, ac mae hynny'n gam yn y cyfeiriad cywir yn ddiau. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cydnabod, Weinidog, y gallai gwelliannau yn y farchnad ar gyfer cynnyrch llaeth fod yn rhy araf i nifer o gynhyrchwyr sydd eisoes ar fin dod â'u gweithrediadau llaeth i ben, ac y bydd dal i gollu ffermwyr llaeth yn cael sgil-ffaith ddifrifol ar y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth ledled Cymru? Mae yna berygl hefyd y bydd yn gwyrdroi'r farchnad ar gyfer cig eidion a chig oen yng Nghymru.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chytunaf ei bod yn gwyrdroi'r farchnad ar gyfer cig eidion a chig

must understand that the dairy sector has been shrinking in terms of the number of farmers involved for many years, if not close to a century. That process is undoubtedly continuing. There is a difference of 12p per litre in production costs between the least efficient and the most efficient farmers in Wales. In itself, that represents a severe problem. It is very difficult to understand why a particular business might not be doing so well without looking carefully at the way that it does business. We want to ensure a vibrant future for the dairy sector, and we hope that the dairy strategy—drawn up with representation from dairy farmers—is the way to do that.

oen. Rhaid inni ddeall fod y sector llaeth wedi bod yn lleihau o ran nifer y ffermwyr sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef ers nifer o flynyddoedd, os nad canrif. Mae'r broses honno yn sicr yn parhau. Mae gwahaniaeth o 12c y litr mewn costau cynhyrchu rhwng y ffermwyr lleiaf effeithlon a'r ffermwyr mwyaf effeithlon yng Nghymru. Ynddo'i hun, mae hynny'n broblem ddifrifol. Mae'n anodd iawn deall pam nad yw busnes penodol efallai yn gwneud cystal heb edrych yn ofalus ar y ffordd y mae'n cynnal ei fusnes. Yr ydym am sicrhau dyfodol llewyrchus i'r sector llaeth, a gobeithiwn mai'r strategaeth laetha luniwyd gyda chynrychiolaeth gan ffermwyr llaeth-yw'r ffordd i wneud hynny.

### **TB mewn Gwartheg Bovine TB**

**Q7 William Graham:** Will the Minister outline how the badger found dead survey will be incorporated into the strategy to eradicate bovine TB in Wales? OAQ1070(EPC)

**C7 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut y bydd yr arolwg o foch daear marw yn cael ei ymgorffori yn y strategaeth ar ddileu TB mewn gwartheg yng Nghymru? OAQ1070(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The final report of the badger found dead survey and, indeed, other information will be provided to the TB action group for its consideration. The TB action group will then use all the evidence to decide what recommendations it wishes to make to me on the way forward.

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd adroddiad terfynol yr arolwg o foch daear marw ac, yn wir, wybodaeth arall, yn cael eu cyflwyno i'r grŵp gweithredu ar TB i'w hystyried. Yna, bydd y grŵp gweithredu ar TB yn defnyddio'r holl dystiolaeth i benderfynu pa argymhellion y dymuna eu cyflwyno imi ar y ffordd ymlaen.

**William Graham:** You will understand that the results of last year's badger found dead survey caused particular concern in parts of Monmouthshire, where 28 per cent of badgers checked in the county tested positive for bovine TB, compared with 12 per cent in all other parts of Wales. Now that the Veterinary Laboratories Agency has been able to evaluate results and conduct a comparison of the disease genotypes in badgers and cattle, will you undertake to swiftly implement its recommendations and those of the TB action group before the end of this Assembly?

**William Graham:** Byddwch yn deall bod canlyniadau'r arolwg o foch daear marw a wnaed y llynedd wedi achosi pryder arbennig mewn rhannau o Sir Fynwy, lle cafodd 28 y cant o'r moch daear brawf positif am TB, o'u cymharu â 12 y cant ym mhob rhan arall o Gymru. Gan fod yr Asiantaeth Labordai Milfeddygol bellach wedi gallu gwerthuso'r canlyniadau a chymharu genoteipiau'r clefyd mewn moch daear a gwartheg, a wnewch chi weithredu ei hargymhellion ac argymhellion y grŵp gweithredu ar TB yn gyflym cyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn?

**Carwyn Jones:** The VLA is not making any recommendations; it is simply producing the survey and evaluating it. The survey itself has to go to the TB action group, along with

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw'r Asiantaeth Labordai Milfeddygol yn gwneud dim argymhellion; yn syml, mae'n cynhyrchu'r arolwg ac yn ei werthuso. Rhaid i'r arolwg ei

other items of evidence, and the group will make its recommendations in due course.

hun gael ei gyflwyno i'r grŵp gweithredu ar TB, ynghyd ag eitemau eraill o dystiolaeth, a bydd y grŵp yn gwneud ei argymhellion maes o law.

### **Cynhesu Byd-eang Global Warming**

**Q8 Jenny Randerson:** What assessment has the Minister made of how global warming will affect Cardiff? OAQ1044(EPC)

**C8 Jenny Randerson:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o'r ffordd y bydd cynhesu byd-eang yn effeithio ar Gaerdydd? OAQ1044(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** I have not made a particular assessment of Cardiff. However, in Wales in general we can expect to see higher sea levels, increased storminess, hotter and drier summers, and wetter, milder winters.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf wedi gwneud asesiad penodol o Gaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol gallwn ddisgwyl gweld lefel y môr yn codi, mwy o stormydd, hafau poethach a sychach, a gaeafau gwlypach a mwynach.

**Jenny Randerson:** You may be aware that Cardiff will be one of the first places under water. I am sure that you will have seen the thought-provoking picture produced by the World Wildlife Fund of the Millennium Stadium with a boat floating in the middle of it because it is under water. The Stern report said that expenditure of 1 per cent of GDP now could secure our future, avoiding the need to spend a much higher percentage later. Are you aware that the February tranche of the low-carbon building programme grant, funded by the Department of Trade and Industry and administered by the Energy Saving Trust was totally allocated by 11.30 a.m. on 1 February, the first day that it was available? Clearly, there needs to be an increase in the allocation for such grants, and since the DTI is clearly not providing enough money to meet the demand, will you please fill the gap?

**Jenny Randerson:** Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol mai Caerdydd fydd un o'r lleoedd cyntaf o dan ddŵr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi gweld y llun gan Gronfa Bywyd Gwyllt y Byd o Stadiwm y Mileniwm a chwch yn arnofio arno yn y canol am ei fod o dan ddŵr. Dywedodd yr adroddiad Stern y gallai gwariant o 1 y cant o CMC nawr ddiogelu ein dyfodol, gan osgoi'r angen am wario canran uwch o lawer yn ddiweddarach. A ydych yn ymwybodol fod cyfran mis Chwefror o'r grant ar gyfer y rhaglen adeiladu carbon isel, sy'n cael ei hariannu gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'i gweinyddu gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni, wedi'i rhoi i gyd erbyn 11.30a.m. ar 1 Chwefror, y diwrnod cyntaf iddi fod ar gael? Mae'n amlwg fod angen cynnydd yn y dyraniad ar gyfer grantiau felly, a chan nad yw'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn amlwg yn rhoi digon o arian i ateb y galw, a wnewch chi lenwi'r bwloch?

**Carwyn Jones:** Again, these are all matters that will need to be looked at when we produce the plans to deal with climate change adaptation and mitigation, and on how we can do our bit in reducing greenhouse gas emissions in Wales. We must also bear in mind that we need to mitigate the situation with regard to climate change because we know that, whatever we do now, climate change will happen in the next 50 years. That, of course, means not building on floodplains, although it appears that we are

**Carwyn Jones:** Unwaith eto, mae'r rhain yn faterion y bydd angen edrych arnynt pan fyddwn yn cynhyrchu'r cynlluniau ar gyfer addasu i'r newid yn yr hinsawdd a'i leddfu, a'r cynlluniau ar gyfer gwneud ein rhan i leihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd fod angen inni leddfu'r sefyllfa o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd oherwydd gwyddom, beth bynnag a wnawn yn awr, y bydd newid yn yr hinsawdd yn digwydd yn y 50 mlynedd nesaf. Mae hynny, wrth gwrs, yn golygu

now sitting in the middle of one. I do not think that proposals for another building here would find favour with the people of Wales. Also, we cannot run away from difficult decisions about renewable energy, types of renewable energy, and where they are sited. We cannot hope to deal with the whole issue of climate change if we feel that certain types of renewable energy should not be used.

**David Melding:** Before we all reach for our flippers, we have about 50 years or so before we will see some of the more alarming and measurable increases in sea levels. We must ensure that, in all sorts of infrastructure projects and work, measures to address the expectation of a pressure on our defences are built in. Thereafter, we must ensure that we start to recover the situation, and that we do not add to the climate problems that are now locked in, so that future generations will go on to enjoy our wonderful capital city.

3.00 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** David Melding has put it absolutely right, although I note his admission that he feels that he will not be here in 50 years—that is something for him to consider. It is important that we realise that the first step involves dealing with the changes that will occur, and that the second, but parallel step—if I can put it that way—is to look at ways of ensuring that climate change does not get to a position where it is irrecoverable. That is where the next 20 or 30 years are of particular importance.

**Owen John Thomas:** Carbon emissions could be greatly reduced with the setting up of more integrated transport systems. What steps are you taking to co-operate with your Cabinet colleagues to encourage the setting up of such a system, serving the greater Cardiff area, involving more park-and-ride facilities, better links with public transport, and a safer Taff trail for cyclists?

**Carwyn Jones:** Cardiff is well served by public transport. There is a good bus network and a good train network, particularly in the

peidio ag adeiladu ar orlifdir, er ymddengys ein bod yn eistedd yng nghanol un ar hyn o bryd. Ni chredaf y byddai pobl Cymru o blaid cynigion ar gyfer adeilad arall yma. Hefyd, ni allwn anwybyddu penderfyniadau anodd ynghylch ynni adnewyddadwy, mathau o ynni adnewyddadwy, a ble y cânt eu gosod. Nid oes gobaith inni ddelio â newid yn yr hinsawdd os teimlwn na ddylid defnyddio mathau arbennig o ynni adnewyddadwy.

**David Melding:** Cyn inni estyn am ein hesgyll nofio, mae gennym tua 50 mlynedd cyn inni weld rhai o'r codiadau mwyaf brawychus a mesuradwy yn lefel y môr. Rhaid inni sicrhau, o ran pob math o brosiectau a gwaith seilwaith, fod mesurau ar waith i fynd i'r afael â'r pwysau a ddisgwylir ar ein hamddiffynfeydd. Wedyn, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn dechrau adfer y sefyllfa, ac na fyddwn yn ychwanegu at y problemau sy'n ein hwynebu yn awr o ran yr hinsawdd, er mwyn i genedlaethau'r dyfodol allu mwynhau ein prifddinas wych.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae David Melding yn hollol gywir, er fy mod yn sylwi ar ei addefiad nad yw'n credu y bydd yma ymhen 50 mlynedd—rhywbeth iddo ef ei ystyried yw hynny. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli mai'r cam cyntaf yw mynd i'r afael â'r newidiadau a fydd yn digwydd, a'r ail gam, ond cam yn cydreddeg—os gallaf ei eirio felly—yw ystyried ffyrdd i sicrhau na fydd y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle nad oes modd ei hadfer. Dyna pam mae'r 20 neu 30 mlynedd nesaf yn bwysig iawn.

**Owen John Thomas:** Gellid lleihau gollyngiadau carbon yn sylweddol pe sefydlid systemau cludiant mwy integredig. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i gydweithredu â'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet i annog sefydlu system o'r fath, a fyddai'n gwasanaethu ardal ehangach Caerdydd, gan gynnwys mwy o gyfleusterau parcio a theithio, gwell cysylltiadau â chludiant cyhoeddus, a Thaith Taf fwy diogel i feicwyr?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae cludiant cyhoeddus yn dda yng Nghaerdydd. Mae yma rwydwaith bysiau a rhwydwaith rheilffordd da, yn

west and the south of the city, and it also has a fair number of car parks. The Taff trail is probably one of the most widely used, if not the most widely used, cycle path in Wales. The Government's commitment to sustainable transport has been demonstrated by the reopening of the Vale of Glamorgan line, as well as the Ebbw valley railway, and the First Minister's announcement on developing an all-Wales coastal path.

enwedig yn rhannau gorllewinol a deheuol y ddinas, ac mae yma nifer o feysydd parcio hefyd. Mae'n debyg mai Taith Taf yw un o'r llwybrau beicio mwyaf poblogaidd, os nad y mwyaf poblogaidd, yng Nghymru. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dangos ei hymrwymiad i gludiant cynaliadwy drwy ailagor llinell Bro Morgannwg, yn ogystal â rheilffordd Glynabwy, ynghyd â chyhoeddiad y Prif Weinidog ar ddatblygu llwybr ar hyd arfordir Cymru.

### **Cadwyn Cyflenwi Llaeth The Dairy Supply Chain**

**C9 Elin Jones:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'r gadwyn cyflenwi llaeth? OAQ1039(EPC)

**Q9 Elin Jones:** What recent discussions has the Minister had with UK Government Ministers regarding the dairy supply chain? OAQ1039(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae swyddogion yn rhan o fforwm y gadwyn cyflenwi llaeth, lle y gallwn ni fel Llywodraeth fynegi barn.

**Carwyn Jones:** Officials are part of the dairy supply chain forum, and that is where we as a Government can express an opinion.

**Elin Jones:** Cawsom dystiolaeth ddiddorol oddi wrth gynrychiolwyr Sainsbury's y bore yma yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ynglŷn â'r gadwyn cyflenwi llaeth. Dywedasant eu bod yn methu â chael cyflenwyr o Brydain i gyflenwi rhai o'r cynhyrchion llaeth y maent yn eu gwerthu, ac y maent yn gweld twf yn y farchnad ar eu cyfer, megis iogwrt, *smoothies*, ac yn y blaen.

**Elin Jones:** We heard some interesting evidence from Sainsbury's representatives this morning in the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee meeting regarding the dairy supply chain. They said they could not find British suppliers for some of the dairy products which they sell and for which they see market growth, such as yoghurt, smoothies, and so on.

Sut allwch chi fel Gweinidog fynd ati yn rhagweithiol i ddatblygu'r sector hwn, ac i roi arweiniad i'r sector llaeth yng Nghymru i gynhyrchu mwy o'r cynhyrchion twf hyn y mae'r archfarchnadoedd yn gofyn amdanynt? Mae rhai eithriadau, megis Rachel's Dairy yn Aberystwyth, ond mae'n amlwg bod diffyg yng Nghymru o ran ein gallu i gynhyrchu rhai o'r cynhyrchion twf hyn.

How can you, as Minister, be proactive in developing this sector, giving a lead to the dairy sector to produce more of these growth products which supermarkets require? There are some exceptions, of course, such as Rachel's Dairy in Aberystwyth, but there is obviously a deficiency in Wales regarding our ability to produce some of these growth products.

**Carwyn Jones:** Y strategaeth llaeth yw'r ffordd ymlaen o ran edrych ar y cyfleon fydd ar gael inni dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn sylweddoli bod yn rhaid inni gynhyrchu'r hyn mae'r farchnad eisiau ei brynu, ac nid yr hyn y credwn y mae'r farchnad eisiau ei brynu. Bydd y strategaeth llaeth yn bwysig o ran sicrhau ein bod yn edrych ar yr hyn y mae pobl eisiau ei brynu; mae gennym grantiau prosesu a marchnata

**Carwyn Jones:** The dairy strategy is the way forward regarding opportunities available to us over the next few years. It is important that people realise that we must produce what the market requires, and not what we believe is required. The dairy strategy will be important to ensure that we look at what people want to buy; we already have processing and marketing grants, but we must see how we can promote that process.



eisoes ond mae'n rhaid inni weld sut y gallwn hybu'r broses honno.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I understand that over 100 cross-party MPs are calling on the Government to create an independent watchdog, with the power to tackle the crisis in our dairy industry. This will include a regulatory body to ensure that retailers do not abuse their dominant position. With milk producers' share of the retail price of milk falling from 59 per cent in 1995 to 35 per cent today—while the supermarket share has risen from 3 per cent to 30 per cent—I am sure that you will agree that this would be a welcome step. Would you consider introducing this in Wales?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Deallaf fod dros 100 o ASau o bob plaid yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i greu corff gwarchod annibynnol, gyda'r pŵer i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng yn ein diwydiant llaeth. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys corff rheoleiddio i sicrhau na fydd manwerthwyr yn manteisio ar eu sefyllfa gref yn y diwydiant. Gyda chyfran cynhyrchwyr llaeth o bris manwerthu llaeth yn gostwng o 59 y cant yn 1995 i 35 y cant heddiw—tra mae cyfran yr archfarchnadoedd wedi cynyddu o 3 y cant i 30 y cant—fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, y byddai hyn yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu. A fydddech yn ystyried cyflwyno hyn yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not believe that an independent watchdog would have any teeth, frankly; it would appear to be something that it is not. Why there should be an independent watchdog for milk prices, as opposed to any other product, would be difficult to justify. Laura Anne and other Conservative Members talk about this, but I do not remember this being suggested when it came to schools buying coal in the 1980s—that was all to do with the fact that it had to be bought from the cheapest source, and to do with the free market. I welcome their sudden conversion.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chredaf y byddai corff gwarchod annibynnol yn ddigon pwerus, a dweud y gwir; byddai'n rhoi'r argraff ei fod yn rhywbeth na all fod. Byddai'n anodd cyfiawnhau sefydlu corff gwarchod annibynnol ar gyfer prisiau llaeth, yn hytrach nag unrhyw gynnyrch arall. Mae Laura Anne ac Aelodau Ceidwadol eraill yn codi hyn, ond ni chofiaf i hyn gael ei awgrymu pan oedd ysgolion yn prynu glo yn yr 1980au—bryd hynny yr oedd yn rhaid ei brynu o'r ffynhonnell rataf, a rhaid wrth y farchnad rydd. Yr wyf yn croesawu eu tröedigaeth sydyn.

### Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Climate Change

**Q10 Rosemary Butler:** Will the Minister give an update on action taken by the Welsh Assembly Government to tackle climate change? OAQ1033(EPC)

**C10 Rosemary Butler:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r newyddion diweddaraf am y camau a gymerir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd? OAQ1033(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Tackling climate change is a central theme in the environment strategy for Wales and its supporting action plan, and action is being taken forward in each ministerial portfolio.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn thema ganolog yn strategaeth amgylcheddol Cymru a'i chynllun gweithredu ategol, a chymerir camau ym portffolio pob gweinidog.

**Rosemary Butler:** As you know, Minister, I am concerned about the effect of climate change on flooding, particularly in the Gwent levels around Newport. I welcome your written statement earlier today about the conclusions of the task and finish group, led

**Rosemary Butler:** Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, yr wyf yn pryderu am effaith y newid yn yr hinsawdd ar lifogydd, yn enwedig ar wastadeddau Gwent yn ardal Casnewydd. Croesawaf eich datganiad ysgrifenedig yn gynharach heddiw ynglŷn â

by Tamsin Dunwoody, on future flood prevention actions. I am pleased that future scheme selection will have a strong focus on the impact of flooding on people. In your discussions and representations as part of the UK energy review on the possibility of the creation of a Severn barrage, will you highlight the huge importance of the inclusion of flood prevention in that scheme, as well as the benefits that will be gained from the production of renewable energy?

**Carwyn Jones:** If there are flood prevention advantages to be gained from the Severn barrage, then these should be considered and implemented if the barrage goes ahead. In terms of changes in determining who gets flood defences built for them, I am grateful for the work done by Huw Lewis and Tamsin Dunwoody. We inherited a system where flood defences were allocated according to the price of houses, so five very large houses would have a flood defence, but 15 terraced houses in the Valleys would not. We all took the view that that was wrong and would be changed; flood defences, in future, will be provided for the benefit of people and not for the benefit of buildings.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cafwyd llawer o gyfeiriadau at allyriant carbon mewn cwestiynau heddiw, a'r angen i fynd i'r afael â hynny. A gytunwch y byddai mabwysiadu'r cod cartrefi cynaliadwy yn ffordd effeithiol o fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno? Os felly, pa gamau mae'r Llywodraeth wedi eu cymryd i wneud hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hynny'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd gan Edwina Hart, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros dai. Yr ydym hefyd am sicrhau ein bod yn mynd ymhellach, os yw hynny'n bosibl.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that, if climate change is not effectively tackled, the risk of flooding will become even worse? There is great concern on the Gwent levels, as Rosemary Butler mentioned, and people think about the events of 400 years ago, when there may have been a tsunami and, if not,

chasgliadau'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, dan arweiniad Tamsin Dunwoody, ar gamau i atal llifogydd yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y cynlluniau a ddewisir yn y dyfodol yn canolbwyntio'n gryf ar effaith llifogydd ar bobl. Pan fyddwch yn trafod ac yn gwneud sylwadau fel rhan o adolygiad y DU o ynni am bosibilrwydd codi morglawdd ar draws afon Hafren, a wnewch chi bwysleisio ei bod yn hanfodol bwysig cynnwys atal llifogydd yn y cynllun hwnnw, yn ogystal â'r manteision a ddaw o gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy?

**Carwyn Jones:** Os bydd manteision o ran atal llifogydd o godi morglawdd ar afon Hafren, yna dylid ystyried y rhain a'u gweithredu os aiff y morglawdd yn ei flaen. O ran newidiadau wrth benderfynu ble y dylid codi amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gwaith a wnaed gan Huw Lewis a Tamsin Dunwoody. Etifeddwyd system gennym lle y byddai systemau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd yn cael eu dyrannu yn ôl prisiau tai. Felly, byddai pum tŷ mawr iawn yn cael eu hamddiffyn rhag llifogydd, ond nid felly 15 o dai teras yn y Cymoedd. Daethom i'r casgliad fod hynny'n annheg ac y byddem yn ei newid; caiff systemau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd yn y dyfodol eu darparu er mwyn pobl, ac nid er mwyn adeiladau.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Many references have been made during today's questions to carbon emissions, and to the need to tackle that issue. Do you agree that adopting the sustainable homes code would be an effective way of tackling that problem? If so, what steps has the Government taken to do so?

**Carwyn Jones:** This is being considered at present by Edwina Hart, as the Minister with responsibility for housing. We also want to ensure that we take this further, if that is possible.

**John Griffiths:** A gytunwch, os nad eir i'r afael o ddifrif â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, y bydd mwy a mwy o berygl o lifogydd? Mae llawer iawn o bryder ar wastadeddau Gwent, fel y soniodd Rosemary Butler, ac mae pobl yn meddwl am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd 400 mlynedd yn ôl, pan fu tsunami efallai, ac os

there was storm surge, which did a tremendous amount of damage. People are wondering whether the Welsh Assembly Government and the Environment Agency are taking sufficient note of climate change and whether they will ensure that proper defences are put in place.

**Carwyn Jones:** It is right to say that there are many places that need flood defences. We have allocated a great deal more money over the years than was the case in the past, particularly in the last decade. We also have to accept that, as well as engineering flood defences, we have to ensure that we do not build in those areas that are most at risk of flooding. This is what technical advice note 15 tries to do.

nad tsunami, ymchwydd oherwydd storm a wnaeth ddifrod mawr. Mae pobl yn meddwl tybed a yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn rhoi digon o sylw i'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac a fyddant yn sicrhau bod amddiffynfeydd priodol yn cael eu codi.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n iawn dweud bod angen codi amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd mewn llawer man. Yr ydym wedi neilltuo llawer mwy o arian dros y blynyddoedd nag yn y gorffennol, yn enwedig yn y degawd diwethaf. Rhaid inni dderbyn hefyd, yn ogystal â chodi systemau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, ei bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau na fyddwn yn adeiladu yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae'r perygl mwyaf o lifogydd. Dyna y mae nodyn cyngor technegol 15 yn ceisio'i wneud.

### Cynnyrch Amaethyddol Lleol Local Agricultural Produce

**C11 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal ynghylch hwyluso caffael cyhoeddus o gynnyrch amaethyddol lleol? OAQ1038(EPC)

**Q11 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What recent discussions has the Minister had on facilitating the public procurement of local agricultural produce? OAQ1038(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae swyddogion ar hyn o bryd yn cynnal ymarfer mapio i nodi pob tindr cyhoeddus posibl er mwyn denu mwy o gwmnïau i wneud hyn. Y broblem yn y gorffennol oedd prinder cwmnïau a oedd yn gallu darparu bwyd ar gyfer y sector cyhoeddus. Mae hynny bellach wedi newid. Ar hyn o bryd, mae pob ymddiriedolaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, ac eithrio un, yn prynu cig eidion o Gymru. Mae hynny wedi digwydd o ganlyniad i'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud gyda chynhyrchwyr i sicrhau eu bod yn gallu gwerthu cig i ysbytai ddydd ar ôl dydd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Officials are currently carrying out a mapping exercise to identify all possible public tenders in order to attract more companies to do this. The problem in the past was one of a lack of companies able to provide food to the public sector. That has now changed. At the moment, all health trusts in Wales, with one exception, buys Welsh beef. That has happened as a result of the work done with producers to ensure that they are able to supply hospitals with meat on a daily basis.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gwerthfawrogaf y ffaith bod gwaith yn cael ei wneud yn y maes hwn, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod tipyn o ffordd i fynd. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn ymateb i gwestiynau ynglŷn â newid hinsawdd y prynhawn yma ac mae'n ymwybodol mai un o'r problemau mawr gyda bwyd lleol, neu ddiffyg bwyd lleol, yw bod nifer fawr o archfarchnadoedd yn dod â bwyd o bell. Gallem gyflenwi

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I appreciate the fact that work is being done in this area, but I am sure the Minister would acknowledge that there is some way to go. The Minister has been responding this afternoon to questions on climate change, and he is aware that one of the big problems with local food, or the lack of local food, is that a very many supermarkets bring food in from a great distance. We could supply much of this food

llawer o'r bwyd hwn yn lleol. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn fod yn rhaid i'r broses hon weithio ddwy ffordd? Ar y naill law, mae'n rhaid inni ddatblygu system o gwmnïau sydd mewn sefyllfa i ddiwallu'r angen, ond hefyd mae'n rhaid i'r sector cyhoeddus cyfan—nid yn unig y sector iechyd, ond, er enghraifft, y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yng Nghymru, sy'n prynu llawer o fwyd—brynu i mewn i'r symudiad hwn.

3.10 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cytunaf â hynny. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfod llynedd yn Llandrindod a ddaeth â'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru at ei gilydd er mwyn edrych ar y pwnc hwn, ac yr oedd dros 200 o bobl yno. Y broblem ar un adeg—yn ystod cyfnod tendro cystadleuol gorfodol—oedd nad oedd modd prynu dim byd lleol; yr oedd yn rhaid prynu beth bynnag oedd yn rhad. Mae hynny wedi newid yn awr. Nid y ffaith nad yw'r sector cyhoeddus am brynu bwyd lleol yw'r broblem fwyaf; y broblem yw dod o hyd i gwmnïau sydd mewn sefyllfa i allu gwerthu cig oen, yn arbennig, a chig eidion ddydd ar ôl dydd, wythnos ar ôl wythnos. Mae hynny'n newid yn awr ac mae fy adran i'n gweithio ar hyn drwy siarad gyda chwmnïau i'w helpu i wneud cais am gytundebau.

locally. Does the Minister accept that this process must work in both directions? On the one hand, we must develop a system of companies able to meet demand, but the whole public sector—not only the health sector, but, for example, the Ministry of Defence in Wales, which buys a great deal of food—must also buy into this idea.

**Carwyn Jones:** I agree. A meeting was held last year in Llandrindod Wells to bring ales's dairy sector together to discuss this subject; there were over 200 people present. The problem at one time—during the time of compulsory competitive tendering—was that it was not possible to buy local produce; you had to buy whatever was cheap. That has now changed. The main problem is not that the public sector does not want to buy local food; the problem is finding companies able to sell lamb, especially, and beef—day in, day out, week in, week out. That is now changing, and my department is working on this issue by talking to companies in order to help them bid for contracts.

### **Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I come forward with a revised business statement in accordance with Standing Orders No. 5.4 and 5.5. The revised statement should be available to Members on the agenda.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am grateful to the Minister for bringing forward a revised business statement and, having been defeated yesterday, for recognising reality and understanding that there is a strong demand within and without the Assembly for a proper debate on the loss of civil service jobs in Wales as a result of the consultation programme undertaken by the Treasury. Will

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cyflwynaf ddatganiad busnes diwygiedig yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 a 5.5. Dylai'r datganiad diwygiedig fod ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Trefnydd am gyflwyno datganiad busnes diwygiedig ac, ar ôl colli pleidlais ddoe, am gydnabod yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd a deall bod galw mawr yn y Cynulliad a'r tu allan am ddatl wirioneddol ar golli swyddi yn y gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'r rhaglen ymgynghori gan y Trysorlys. Fodd bynnag, a wnaiff y Gweinidog

the Minister confirm, however, that the debate will be on an amendable motion, so that all shades of opinion can be reflected?

**Lisa Francis:** We are grateful, Minister, that you are minded to reschedule forthcoming business, so that we may have a debate on the proposed loss of civil service jobs. Thank you for that. I would appreciate it if you could, at this stage, give us some indication as to when the debate might be held.

**Kirsty Williams:** We too are glad that the Business Minister has seen fit to bring forward a revised business statement that includes a debate on public service employment in Wales on 7 March. However, I note that the debate is on public service employment in Wales; as the leader of the opposition has just said, we expect that debate to offer an opportunity not just to discuss public service employment, but also the threat to public service employment by the Westminster Government. That is not just about potential redundancies, but also the reorganisation of public service jobs, for instance, in various tax offices across the length and breadth of Wales, that will probably mean redundancies for many of the people employed in those offices. I trust that the motion will reflect the desire of the Assembly to have that wide-ranging debate.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** The Government looks forward to such a debate—[*Interruption.*] As I said yesterday, we look forward to a full and open debate. It has to be a debate on the wide agenda of civil service employment in Wales, including, as I said yesterday, the impact of the Lyons review, the opportunities of our relocation strategy, and the discussions that are taking place. It will, therefore, be an important debate that we will be pleased to promote. It will, of course, be an amendable motion, because it will be a Government debate in Government time.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

gadarnhau y bydd y ddadl yn cynnwys cynnig y gellir ei newid, fel y gellir adlewyrchu barn pawb?

**Lisa Francis:** Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar, Weinidog, eich bod yn fodlon aildrefnu'r busnes arfaethedig, fel y gallwn gael dadl ar y cynnig i ddileu swyddi yn y gwasanaeth sifil. Diolch ichi am hynny. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech, yn awr, roi arwydd inni pryd y gellid cynnal y ddadl.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr ydym ni hefyd yn falch fod y Trefnydd wedi cytuno i gyflwyno datganiad busnes diwygiedig sy'n cynnwys dadl ar gyflogaeth yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar 7 Mawrth. Fodd bynnag, sylwaf mai cyflogaeth yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yw pwnc y ddadl; fel y mae arweinydd y wrthblaid newydd ei ddweud, disgwyliwn i'r ddadl honno fod yn gyfle i drafod y bygythiad i gyflogaeth yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, yn ogystal â chyflogaeth yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n ymwneud nid yn unig â cholli swyddi o bosibl, ond hefyd ag ad-drefnu swyddi yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, er enghraifft, mewn amrywiol swyddfeydd treth ledled Cymru, a fydd yn golygu, fwy na thebyg, y bydd nifer o'r bobl a gyflogir yn y swyddfeydd hynny yn colli eu swyddi. Gobeithio y bydd y cynnig yn adlewyrchu dymuniad y Cynulliad i gael dadl eang ei chwmpas.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r Llywodraeth yn edrych ymlaen at y ddadl hon—[*Torri ar draws.*] Fel y dywedais ddoe, edrychwn ymlaen at gael dadl lawn ac agored. Rhaid iddi fod yn ddadl ar agenda eang cyflogaeth yn y gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys, fel y dywedais ddoe, effaith adolygiad Lyons, cyfleoedd yn ein strategaeth adleoli, a'r trafodaethau sy'n mynd rhagddynt. Felly, bydd yn ddadl bwysig y bydd yn bleser gennym ei chynnal. Bydd yn gynnig y gellir ei newid, wrth gwrs, gan mai dadl y Llywodraeth yn amser y Llywodraeth fydd hon.

## Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Leighton Andrews:** Point of order. This relates to an episode during yesterday's health debate, when I asked the Plaid Cymru health spokesperson to condemn a leaflet circulated by Plaid Cymru in my constituency suggesting that Labour is threatening to close the new Royal Glamorgan Hospital, which is of course untrue. I was asked by the Plaid Cymru health spokesperson to make that leaflet available—I will certainly do that—and she then went on to say,

'but we have made this request before and he has failed to respond'.

This is completely untrue, Llywydd. In the equivalent debate on 3 October, I raised the question of the leaflet and the health spokesperson refused to condemn it; she certainly did not ask for it. What I ask today is whether it is in order, not only to have Plaid Cymru misleading constituents about the future of a hospital, but to have the Plaid Cymru health spokesperson misleading the Chamber about my conduct. Should she not now apologise and withdraw that assertion?

3.15 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It was my understanding that a copy of that leaflet had been requested from Leighton Andrews—I did not mean to imply that I had requested it, because I knew that I had not. If we have not requested a copy, I apologise if I have in any way inadvertently misled the Chamber and I request a copy of that leaflet from Leighton Andrews as soon as possible. I point out that what he is alleging is in the leaflet today is slightly different to what he was alleging was in the leaflet yesterday, but I am not in the habit of casting aspersions on other Members and I would be happy, as health spokesperson, to investigate this. If any part of Plaid Cymru is giving inaccurate information, for whatever reason, that will be dealt with.

**The Presiding Officer:** I heard the word 'apologise', which is music to the ears of

**Leighton Andrews:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â rhywbeth a ddigwyddodd yn ystod y ddadl ar iechyd ddoe, pan ofynnais i lefarydd Plaid Cymru dros iechyd gondemnio taflen a ddosbarthwyd gan Plaid Cymru yn fy etholaeth yn awgrymu bod Llafur yn bygwth cau Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, nad yw'n wir, wrth gwrs. Gofynnodd lefarydd Plaid Cymru dros iechyd imi ddarparu copi o'r daflen—gwnaf hynny yn sicr—ac yna dywedodd,

'ond gwnaethom y cais hwn o'r blaen ac nid ymatebodd.'

Nid yw hyn yn wir o gwbl, Lywydd. Yn y ddadl gyfatebol ar 3 Hydref, soniais am y daflen a gwrthododd y lefarydd dros iechyd ei chondemnio; yn sicr ni ofynnodd am gopi. Yr hyn a ofynnaf heddiw yw hyn: a ydyw mewn trefn nid yn unig bod Plaid Cymru yn camarwain etholwyr ynglŷn â dyfodol ysbyty, ond bod lefarydd Plaid Cymru dros iechyd yn camarwain y Siambr am fy hymddygiad. Oni ddylai ymddiheuro yn awr a thynnu'r honiad hwnnw'n ôl?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Deallais fod cais wedi'i wneud am gopi o'r daflen honno gan Leighton Andrews—nid oedd yn fwriad gennyf awgrymu imi wneud cais amdano, oherwydd gwyddwn na wneuthum hynny. Os nad ydym wedi gwneud cais am gopi, ymddiheuraf os wyf wedi camarwain y Siambr yn anfwriadol mewn unrhyw ffordd, ac yr wyf yn gwneud cais am gopi o'r daflen honno gan Leighton Andrews cyn gynted â phosibl. Nodaf fod yr hyn y mae'n ei honni heddiw sydd yn y daflen ychydig yn wahanol i'r hyn a honnai oedd yn y daflen ddoe. Ond nid yw'n arfer gennyf amau Aelodau eraill, a byddem yn fodlon, fel lefarydd iechyd, ymchwilio i hyn. Os yw unrhyw ran o Plaid Cymru yn rhoi gwybodaeth anghywir, am ba reswm bynnag, eir i'r afael â hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Clywais y gair 'ymddiheuraf', sy'n fiwsig i glust unrhyw un yn fy sefyllfa i,

anyone in my position, and I therefore assume that honour is satisfied. I am also grateful to my colleague, the Deputy Presiding Officer, for the way in which he maintained order yesterday. I have the text of the Record in front of me and I notice his effective use of the priority button—long may that facility continue to bless this seat. I am pleased that I have no responsibility for any electoral publications by Plaid Cymru, or any other party, except when they carry my photograph.

ac felly tybiaf fod anrhydedd wedi ei fodloni. Yr wyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelod, y Dirprwy Lywydd, am y ffordd y cadwodd drefn ddoe. Mae testun y Cofnod gennyf o'm blaen, a sylwaf ei fod wedi defnyddio'r botwm blaenoriaeth yn effeithiol—bydded i'r cyfleuster hwnnw barhau'n fendith yn y swydd hon. Yr wyf yn falch nad oes gennyf gyfrifoldeb dros gyhoeddiadau etholiadol Plaid Cymru nac unrhyw blaid arall, heblaw pan fydd fy llun yn ymddangos ynddynt.

### **Y Rheolau Sefydlog Newydd Arfaethedig The Proposed New Standing Orders**

Motion (NDM3451): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3451): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*approves, for the purposes of paragraph 20(4) of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 2006, the Assembly's proposals for the Standing Orders which are to have effect in relation to the proceedings of the Assembly following the 2007 election, as set out in the report of the Committee on Standing Orders laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 30 January.*

*yn cymeradwyo, at ddibenion paragraff 20(4) o Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, cynigion y Cynulliad ar gyfer y Rheolau Sefydlog sydd i ddod i rym yng nghyswllt trafodion y Cynulliad yn dilyn etholiad 2007, fel y'u nodir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 30 Ionawr.*

Amendment 1 in the name of John Marek. Delete all and replace with:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw John Marek. Dileu'r cyfan a rhoi yn ei le:

*1. notes the Assembly's draft proposals for the Standing Orders which are to have effect in relation to the proceedings of the Assembly following the 2007 election, as set out in the report of the Committee on Standing Orders laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 30 January; and*

*1. yn nodi cynigion drafft y Cynulliad ar gyfer y Rheolau Sefydlog sydd i ddod i rym yng nghyswllt trafodion y Cynulliad yn dilyn etholiad 2007, fel y nodir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 30 Ionawr; a*

*2. calls on the Committee on Standing Orders to meet again to consider any comments and opinions made in relation to the draft proposals, and to re-submit draft Standing Orders for submission to the Secretary of State for Wales, amended or otherwise, that take particular account of following points:*

*2. yn galw ar y Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog i gyfarfod eto i ystyried unrhyw sylwadau a safbwyntiau a wnaed yng nghyswllt y cynigion drafft, ac i ailgyflwyno Rheolau Sefydlog drafft i'w cyflwyno i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, wedi'u newid neu fel arall, sy'n ystyried y pwyntiau canlynol yn benodol:*

*a) Standing Order No. 1.13 (v) to be deleted;*

*a) dileu Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.13(v);*

*b) Standing Order No. 6.1 (iii): at beginning insert 'times available for';*

*b) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.1 (iii): ar y dechrau cynnwys 'yr amserau a fydd ar gael ar gyfer';*

- c) *Standing Order No. 7.11 (iv): add at end 'other than proposed by the Commission';* c) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.11 (iv): ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'ar wahân i rai a gynigir gan y Comisiwn';*
- d) *Standing Order No. 8.7: replace 'for the purposes of clarification before resuming a speech' with 'briefly';* d) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.7: disodli 'er mwyn egluro cyn ailddechrau ar ei araith' gyda 'yn gryno';*
- e) *Standing Order No. 8.8 to be deleted;* e) *dileu Rheol Sefydlog Rhif No. 8.8;*
- f) *Standing Order No. 9.9: add at end 'Amendments may be tabled to any statement of opinion provided they comply with Standing Orders and are no more than 50 words in length.';* f) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.9: ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'Gellir cyflwyno gwelliannau i unrhyw ddatganiad barn gyhyd â'u bod yn cydymffurfio â Rheolau Sefydlog ac nad dynt yn fwy na 50 gair o hyd.';*
- g) *Standing Order 9.10: (a) delete 'if'; and (b) replace 'is deemed by the Presiding Officer to be in order it' with 'or any amendments compliant with Standing Orders';* g) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.10: dileu 'Os yw'r Llywydd o'r farn bod Datganiad Barn yn ddilys, rhaid iddo gael ei gyhoeddi,' a chynnwys yn ei le 'Rhaid cyhoeddi Datganiad Barn neu unrhyw welliannau sy'n cydymffurfio â'r Rheolau Sefydlog,';*
- h) *Standing Order No. 14.1: replace 'to' with 'that may';* h) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 14.1: disodli 'i' gyda 'a all';*
- i) *Standing Order No. 16.1(i): add at end '(f) any ministerial code of conduct issued by the First Minister or Minister in his absence.';* i) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16.1(i): ychwanegu ar y diwedd '(dd) unrhyw god ymddygiad gweinidogion a gyhoeddir gan y Prif Weinidog neu Weinidog yn ei absenoldeb.';*
- j) *Standing Order No. 23.47: add at end 'Amendments made by a Minister must be selected.';* j) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23.47: ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'Rhaid dewis gwelliannau a wneir gan Weinidog.';*
- k) *Standing Order No. 24.3: insert '24.3(a) No statutory instrument can be made under the provision of Standing Order 24.2 until it has been laid for 5 days and 10 Members have not signed a motion of dissatisfaction.';* k) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.3: cynnwys '24.3(a) Ni ellir gwneud unrhyw offeryn statudol o dan ddarpariaeth Rheol Sefydlog 24.2 hyd nes ei fod wedi cael ei osod am bum niwrnod a bod 10 Aelod heb lofnodi cynnig o anfonlonrwydd.';*
- l) *Standing Order No. 25.1: insert '25.1(a) The Counsel General, if not a member of the Assembly, may only make or confirm subordinate legislation if no Minister is available to do so.';* l) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.1: cynnwys '25.1(a) Ni all y Cwnsler Cyffredinol, os nad yw'n aelod o'r Cynulliad, ond gwneud neu gadarnhau is-ddeddfwriaeth os nad oes Gweinidog ar gael i wneud hynny.';*
- m) *Standing Order No. 25.15: Insert at end ' , but only if 10 Members have not tabled a motion of dissatisfaction';* m) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.15: cynnwys ar y diwedd ' , ond dim ond os nad oes 10 Aelod wedi cyflwyno cynnig o anfonlonrwydd';*
- n) *Standing Order No. 27.6: Delete 'or decrease';* n) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.6: dileu 'neu'n gostwng';*



o) *Standing Order No. 27.7: Insert 'at least' before 'the subsequent two years' and delete the remainder;*

p) *Standing Order No. 27.27: insert at end of first sentence 'or a member of the Commission' and insert at end 'or a member of the Commission';*

q) *add new Standing Order No. 36:*

*'Standing Order No. 36—Publication in Welsh and English.*

*36.1 All legislative Assembly measures and documents laid before the Assembly must be in Welsh and English unless they are of such complexity that it is impractical to do so, or that the measure is considered an emergency.*

*36.2 Any measure or statutory instrument (whether under negative or affirmative provisions) or other document that is laid and is not in both languages must be accompanied by a statement giving reasons as to why it is not so.'*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw John Marek.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*approves, for the purposes of paragraph 20(4) of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 2006, the Assembly's proposals for the Standing Orders which are to have effect in relation to the proceedings of the Assembly following the 2007 election, as set out in the report of the Committee on Standing Orders laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 30 January. (NDM3451)*

I propose the motion relating to the report of the Committee on Standing Orders. I preface my remarks by offering my profound thanks to committee members, particularly the business managers and the Business Minister, the clerks to the committee, all Assembly Parliamentary Service staff who advised the

o) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.7: cynnwys 'o leiaf' cyn 'y ddwy flynedd wedyn' a dileu'r gweddill;*

p) *Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.27: ychwanegu ar ôl 'Cymru' yn y frawddeg gyntaf 'neu aelod o'r Comisiwn' a chynnwys ar y diwedd 'neu aelod o'r Comisiwn';*

q) *ychwanegu Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 36 newydd:*

*'Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 36—Cyhoeddi yn Gymraeg a Saesneg.*

*36.1 Rhaid i holl fesurau deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad a dogfennau a gyflwynir gerbron y Cynulliad fod yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg onid ydynt mor gymhleth fel ei bod yn anymarferol gwneud hynny, neu fod y mesur yn cael ei ystyried yn un brys.*

*36.2 Ar gyfer pob mesur neu offeryn statudol (boed o dan ddarpariaethau negyddol neu gadarnhaol) neu ddogfen arall a osodir ac nad yw yn y ddwy iaith, rhaid cael datganiad yn rhoi rhesymau paham nad yw yn y ddwy iaith.'*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of John Marek.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn cymeradwyo, at ddibenion paragraff 20(4) o Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, cynigion y Cynulliad ar gyfer y Rheolau Sefydlog sydd i ddod i rym yng nghyswllt trafodion y Cynulliad yn dilyn etholiad 2007, fel y'u nodir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 30 Ionawr. (NDM3451)*

Cynigiaf y cynnig sy'n ymwneud ag adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog. Cyn dechrau, hoffwn ddiolch o galon i aelodau'r pwyllgor, yn enwedig y rheolwyr busnes, a'r Trefnydd, clerod y pwyllgor a holl staff Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a fu'n cynghori'r pwyllgor a chyfreithwyr

committee and to the Welsh Assembly Government lawyers who provided invaluable advice.

I commend these Standing Orders to you. They represent nearly nine months of hard work by all concerned and they represent mature politics and a sensible, consensual approach on the part of committee members. They are not, of course, perfect; nothing of this length and complexity could possibly be so. They represent considerable compromise on all sides. There were times when I had concerns about the completion of our task, but we have managed to do it. The committee met on 30 occasions and that figure includes seven formal meetings. The full draft Standing Orders were published on 22 January.

When preparing the Standing Orders we tried to keep to several basic principles, while being aware that we were undertaking a unique task—unique in the UK at least. I am not aware of any other UK parliamentary institution that has totally and democratically rewritten its Standing Orders as we have done. We are also unique, almost certainly worldwide, in terms of the Orders in Council procedure. We have to adopt that procedure in order to achieve our Measure-making powers and, in effect, we will have to go through all the legislative hurdles twice for each piece of legislation that we enact. As a result of that, we also had to devise a system that is truly parliamentary, while allowing for the fact that we will take time to grow into a full parliament.

The committee started from a principle of wanting to build on the open, accessible and transparent way in which we currently do business. The National Assembly advisory group devised our current Standing Orders and we used those as the basis for developing the new ones. Where an existing Standing Order needed no amendment, we made no amendment. Throughout the process, we have tried to leave what we called ‘white space between the lines’, as recommended by the Committee on the Better Governance for Wales White Paper and in line with good parliamentary practice. In doing so, we are

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a roddodd gyngor amhrisiadwy.

Cymeradwyaf y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn ichi. Cynrychiolant bron i naw mis o waith caled gan bawb dan sylw, ac yn maent yn cynrychioli gwleidyddiaeth aeddfed a dull synhwyrol, cytûn o weithredu ar ran aelodau'r pwyllgor. Wrth reswm, nid ydynt yn berffaith; ni allai dim mor hir a chymhleth â hwn fod yn berffaith. Cyfaddawd sylweddol ydynt ar bob ochr. Yr oedd adegau pan oeddwn yn pryderu ynghylch cwblhau ein tasg, ond yr ydym wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny. Cyfarfu'r pwyllgor 30 gwaith, ac mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n cynnwys saith cyfarfod ffurfiol. Cyhoeddwyd drafft llawn o'r Rheolau Sefydlog ar 22 Ionawr.

Wrth baratoi'r Rheolau Sefydlog, ceisiwyd cadw at nifer o egwyddorion sylfaenol, gan gadw mewn cof ein bod yn ymgymryd â thasg unigryw—unigryw yn y DU o leiaf. Ni wn am yr un sefydliad seneddol arall yn y DU sydd wedi ailysgrifennu ei Reolau Sefydlog yn llwyr ac mewn modd democrataidd fel y gwnaed gennym ni. Yr ydym hefyd yn unigryw, bron yn sicr ar lefel fyd-eang, o ran y weithdrefn Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor. Rhaid inni fabwysiadu'r weithdrefn honno er mwyn sicrhau ein pwerau i lunio Mesurau, ac i bob pwrpas bydd yn rhaid inni wynebu pob rhwystr deddfwriaethol ddwywaith ar gyfer pob darn o ddeddfwriaeth y byddwn yn ei ddeddfu. O ganlyniad i hynny, bu'n rhaid inni hefyd ddyfeisio system sy'n wirioneddol seneddol, gan ganiatáu am y ffaith y byddwn yn cymryd amser i dyfu'n senedd lawn.

Dechreuodd y pwyllgor gydag egwyddor o fod eisiau adeiladu ar ein ffordd agored, hygyrch a thryloyw o gynnal ein busnes ar hyn o bryd. Dyfeisiwyd ein Rheolau Sefydlog presennol gan grŵp cynghori'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a defnyddiwyd y rheini gennym fel sail i ddatblygu'r rhai newydd. Pan nad oedd angen gwella Rheol Sefydlog, ni wnaed dim gwelliant. Drwy gydol y broses, ein nod oedd gadael ‘bwllch gwyrn rhwng y llinellau’, fel yr argymhellwyd gan y Pwyllgor ar Bapur Gwyn Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru ac yn unol ag arfer seneddol da. Wrth wneud hynny, yr

aware that the new Assembly will inevitably want to amend these Standing Orders to fill in the gaps as practice develops. The style and language used have been kept as simple as possible although, inevitably, some areas have required a detailed legalistic approach.

Nine months might sound like a long time. However, in practice, we faced a tight timetable. We took into account the wide body of evidence received by the Assembly's Committee on the Better Governance for Wales White Paper. We visited the Scottish Parliament and gained a vital insight, which we relied on greatly. We took oral evidence from the Power commission, our Legislation Committee and the law schools in Wales. We also consulted relevant committees here, the Presiding Officer, the Deputy Presiding Officer, the Shadow Commission, the Permanent Secretary, the Clerk to the Assembly, the Auditor General for Wales and the ombudsman. In addition, other organisations and individual AMs made representations to us.

3.20 p.m.

I now draw attention to some of the significant changes that we have included, taking them in order. In Standing Order No. 1, we have included provision for a code or protocol to deal with the different roles and responsibilities of constituency and regional Members. The Government of Wales Act 2006 requires us to do this, and we have left it for the new Committee on Standards of Conduct to provide the detailed protocol, although we have outlined the principles on which it should be based.

In a departure from the current situation, in Standing Order No. 2, we have specified that the Presiding Officer and the Deputy Presiding Officer should come from different sides of the Chamber and that neither should have a vote, other than a casting vote.

We have recognised throughout the reality of the new settlement, which requires separation of the legislature from the executive. For example, in future, we will only nominate a First Minister who will be appointed by the Queen. We also deal with the new role of

ydym yn ymwybodol y bydd y Cynulliad newydd, yn anochel, yn dymuno diwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog hyn i lenwi'r bylchau wrth i arfer ddatblygu. Mae'r arddull a'r iaith a ddefnyddiwyd wedi'i chadw mor syml â phosibl, er bod rhai meysydd, yn anochel, wedi galw am ddull cyfreithiol manwl.

Hwyrach bod naw mis yn ymddangos yn gyfnod hir. Fodd bynnag, mewn gwirionedd yr oedd amserlen dynn yn ein hwynebu. Ystyriwyd y corff helaeth o dystiolaeth a gafodd Pwyllgor y Cynulliad ar Bapur Gwyn Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru. Buom yn ymweld â Senedd yr Alban gan ddysgu llawer, a dibynnwyd yn helaeth ar hynny. Cymerwyd tystiolaeth lafar gan gomisiwn Power, ein Pwyllgor Deddfau ac ysgolion y gyfraith yng Nghymru. Buom hefyd yn ymgynghori â phwyllgorau perthnasol yma, y Llywydd, y Dirprwy Lywydd, y Comisiwn Cysgodol, yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol, Clerc y Cynulliad, Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru a'r ombwdsmon. Cyflwynwyd sylwadau inni hefyd gan sefydliadau ac ACau unigol.

Yn awr, tynnaf eich sylw at rai o'r newidiadau sylweddol a gynhwyswyd gennym, yn eu trefn. Yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1, yr ydym wedi cynnwys darpariaeth am god neu brotocol i ymdrin â gwahanol rolau a chyfrifoldebau Aelodau etholaethol a rhanbarthol. Mae'n ofynnol inni wneud hyn yn ôl Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, ac yr ydym wedi gadael i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad newydd ddarparu'r protocol manwl, er ein bod wedi amlinellu'r egwyddorion y dylai fod yn seiliedig arnynt.

Yn wahanol i'r sefyllfa bresennol, yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2 yr ydym wedi pennu y dylai'r Llywydd a'r Dirprwy Lywydd ddod o wahanol ochrau o'r Siambr, ac na ddylai'r naill na'r llall gael pleidlais, heblaw am bleidlais fwrw.

Yr ydym wedi cydnabod, drwy gydol y broses, realaeth y setliad newydd, sy'n gofyn am wahanu'r ddeddfwrfa a'r weithrediaeth. Er enghraifft, yn y dyfodol byddwn yn enwebu Prif Weinidog yn unig, a gaiff ei benodi gan y Frenhines. Yr ydym hefyd yn

counsel general; that person will participate as if she or he were a Member, but will not be able to vote unless an elected Member.

A significant change is the strict allocation of time for three categories of business: Government business, non-Government business and Assembly business. In future, there will be no vote on the business statement; instead, there will be questions to the Business Minister every week. I believe that that will give opposition and backbench AMs a much greater chance to air issues of concern than our current procedures do, while enabling the Government to get its business through.

One issue that we had to keep permanently in mind was the constraints of trying to operate a full parliamentary system with only 60 Members and with Ministers no longer being members of committees. We have therefore tried to minimise the requirements for additional committees. However, we decided that a Finance Committee would provide the budget process with additional rigour, for Government and the opposition alike. We have adopted a twin-track approach to the types of committees to be established. There will be scrutiny committees as a regular feature, but we have not specified the number, as we are aware of constraints in terms of personnel. In addition, ad hoc committees will be set up as and when required, to scrutinise draft Orders in Council and Assembly Measures.

We have devised a system that we hope will enable us to avoid using the complexities of the d'Hondt formula but, to do so, we will need a two-thirds majority of the Assembly to agree committee membership. There will still be a Business Committee, whose membership will be designed to represent all shades of opinion here. Also, the Subordinate Legislation Committee will have a stronger remit to consider the merits, as well as the technical accuracy, of legislation.

We have retained our commitment to a Committee on Equality of Opportunity, and it

ymdrin â rôl newydd y cwnsler cyffredinol; bydd yr unigolyn hwnnw'n cymryd rhan fel pe bai ef neu hi'n Aelod, ond ni all bleidleisio oni fydd yn Aelod etholedig.

Un newid sylweddol yw dyraniadau caeth o ran amser ar gyfer tri chategori busnes: busnes y Llywodraeth, busnes nad yw'n ymwneud â'r Llywodraeth, a busnes y Cynulliad. Yn y dyfodol, ni fydd pleidlais ar y datganiad busnes; yn hytrach, bydd cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd bob wythnos. Credaf y bydd hynny'n rhoi cyfle llawer gwell i ACau'r gwrthbleidiau a'r meinciau cefn leisio pryderon nag sydd ar hyn o bryd dan ein gweithdrefnau presennol, gan alluogi'r Llywodraeth i basio'i busnes.

Un mater yr oedd yn rhaid inni ei gadw mewn cof yn barhaus oedd y cyfyngiadau o geisio gweithredu system seneddol lawn gyda dim ond 60 o Aelodau, a chyda Gweinidogion nad oeddent bellach yn aelodau o bwyllgorau. Yr ydym felly wedi ceisio sicrhau cyn lleied â phosibl o ofynion ar bwyllgorau ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, penderfynwyd y byddai Pwyllgor Cyllid yn rhoi trylwyredd ychwanegol i'r broses gyllideb, ar gyfer y Llywodraeth a'r gwrthbleidiau fel ei gilydd. Yr ydym wedi mabwysiadu dull gweithredu deublyg o ran y mathau o bwyllgorau i'w sefydlu. Bydd yna bwyllgorau craffu rheolaidd, ond nid ydym wedi pennu faint yn benodol, gan ein bod yn ymwybodol o'r cyfyngiadau o ran personél. Yn ogystal, caiff pwyllgorau ad hoc eu sefydlu pan yn ôl yr angen, i graffu ar Orchmynion drafft yn y Cyfrin Gyngor a Mesurau'r Cynulliad.

Yr ydym wedi dyfeisio system a fydd, gobeithio, yn ein galluogi i osgoi defnyddio cymhlethdodau fformiwla d'Hondt. Ond i wneud hynny bydd arnom angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o'r Cynulliad i gytuno ar aelodaeth pwyllgor. Bydd Pwyllgor Busnes yn parhau, a bydd aelodaeth y pwyllgor hwnnw wedi'i llunio i gynrychioli barn pob plaid yma. Hefyd, caiff y Pwyllgor Is-ddeddfwriaeth gylch gwaith cryfach i ystyried rhinweddau deddfwriaeth yn ogystal â'i chywirdeb technegol.

Yr ydym wedi cadw ein hymrwymiad i Bwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, ac mae'n werth

is worth noting that it will now be up to the Members of each individual region to decide whether they want to establish a regional committee.

I have already touched on the legislative process, most of which will be entirely new to us. We have modelled our proposals on existing good parliamentary practice in Westminster and Scotland. We have emphasised the importance of pre-legislative scrutiny. We have made provision for joint pre-legislative scrutiny with Westminster. We have tried to improve the process for private Members' ballots, as we were aware of the need for Members to be more strongly supported when putting forward proposals. Now, you will only be able to put your name in the ballot if you also provide an outlined proposed Order. It is worth noting that committees will also be able to put forward proposals for Orders in Council and Measures.

Another new feature relates to cases where the UK Government plans to legislate within areas for which the Assembly has legislative competence. When this occurs, the Assembly Government will have to lay a memorandum, explaining the proposals and seeking the Assembly's agreement. Those will be called legislative consent motions.

Another new feature, which I believe is very significant, is a greatly enhanced system for considering public petitions. We have based that on the hugely successful Scottish system. At present, we get only a handful of petitions each year whereas, in Scotland, they have just considered their thousandth petition, some of which have led to changes in policy and legislation. In future, all petitions that meet the criteria that we have set will be directed to the appropriate scrutiny committee for consideration.

It is important to note that we have maintained our commitment to bilingualism, and I refer you to Standing Orders Nos. 23.17 and 29.4 for this important aspect.

On the amendment, some of the points made in it are useful and may well be considered

sylwi mai Aelodau pob rhanbarth unigol bellach fydd yn penderfynu a ydynt am sefydlu pwyllgor rhanbarthol.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at y broses deddfwriaethol, a bydd y rhan fwyaf ohoni'n hollol newydd inni. Yr ydym wedi modelu'n cynigion ar arfer seneddol da sydd eisoes yn bodoli yn San Steffan a'r Alban. Yr ydym wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd craffu cyn deddfwriaeth. Yr ydym wedi darparu ar gyfer craffu cyn deddfwriaeth ar y cyd â San Steffan. Yr ydym wedi ceisio gwella'r broses ar gyfer pleidleisiau preifat gan Aelodau, oherwydd yr oeddem yn ymwybodol bod angen i Aelodau gael cefnogaeth gryfach wrth gyflwyno cynigion. Bellach, gallwch roi eich enw yn y bleidlais dim ond os byddwch hefyd yn cyflwyno amlinelliad o Orchymyn a gynigir. Mae'n werth sylwi y bydd pwyllgorau hefyd yn gallu cyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor a Mesurau.

Mae nodwedd newydd arall yn ymwneud ag achosion pan fydd Llywodraeth y DU yn bwriadu deddfu mewn meysydd lle mae gan y Cynulliad gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol. Pan ddigwydd hyn, bydd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyflwyno memorandwm i egluro'r cynigion ac i geisio cytundeb y Cynulliad. Gelwir y rheini'n gynigion caniatâd deddfwriaethol.

Nodwedd newydd arall, sy'n arwyddocaol iawn yn fy marn i, yw system well o lawer ar gyfer ystyried deisebau cyhoeddus. Yr ydym wedi seilio hynny ar y system hynod lwyddiannus yn yr Alban. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond llond dwrn o ddeisebau a gawn bob blwyddyn. Ond yn yr Alban maent newydd ystyried eu milfed deiseb, ac mae rhai o'r rhain wedi arwain at newidiadau mewn polisi a deddfwriaeth. Yn y dyfodol, caiff pob deiseb sy'n bodloni'r meini prawf a bennir gennym eu cyfeirio at y pwyllgor craffu priodol i'w hystyried.

Mae'n bwysig sylwi ein bod wedi cadw'n hymrwymiad i ddwyieithrwydd, ac fe'ch cyfeiriau at Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 23.17 a 29.4 ar gyfer yr agwedd bwysig hon.

O ran y gwelliant, mae rhai o'r pwyntiau a wneir ynddo yn ddefnyddiol, ac efallai y

by the future Business Committee when it reviews these Standing Orders, as custom and practice develop. As I said at the start, we are bound to review the Standing Orders from time to time and to revise them.

The committee considered some issues referred to in the amendment, such as bilingualism and the ministerial code, at great length and came to a different conclusion on them. Other points in the amendment refer to current Standing Orders that we have carried over and, hence, are issues that we have never had a problem with in the past and which we did not feel needed to be changed.

For those reasons, I strongly urge Members to reject this amendment and, by doing so, send a strong message to the Secretary of State that we are united in support of these Standing Orders and that they represent the settled will of the Assembly.

I chaired this committee as the Welsh Liberal Democrat representative on that committee, and I want to finish by making a more political statement. I believe that we have devised Standing Orders that will enable us to grow rapidly into a fuller parliament for Wales and that they can be used as a jumping-off point for the next stage of our development, when I profoundly hope and confidently expect that we will be allowed the same powers as Scotland.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw John Marek.

**John Marek:** I propose amendment 1 in my name. Delete all and replace with:

*1. notes the Assembly's draft proposals for the Standing Orders which are to have effect in relation to the proceedings of the Assembly following the 2007 election, as set out in the report of the Committee on Standing Orders laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 30 January; and*

*2. calls on the Committee on Standing Orders to meet again to consider any comments and opinions made in relation to the draft proposals, and to re-submit draft Standing*

bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes newydd yn eu hystyried wrth iddo adolygu'r Rheolau Sefydlog hyn wrth i arferion ddatblygu. Fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, yr ydym yn rhwym o adolygu'r Rheolau Sefydlog o bryd i'w gilydd a'u diwygio.

Ystyriodd y pwyllgor yn helaeth rai materion y cyfeirir atynt yn y gwelliant, fel dwyieithrwydd a'r cod i weinidogion, a daethpwyd i gasgliad gwahanol arnynt. Mae pwyntiau eraill yn y gwelliant yn cyfeirio at Reolau Sefydlog presennol yr ydym wedi'u cario drosodd, ac felly maent yn faterion nad ydym erioed wedi cael problem gyda hwy yn y gorffennol ac nad oeddem yn credu bod angen eu newid.

Am y rhesymau hynny, anogaf Aelodau yn gryf i wrthod y gwelliant hwn, a thrwy wneud hynny anfon neges gref at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ein bod fel un yn cefnogi'r Rheolau Sefydlog hyn a'u bod yn cynrychioli ewyllys cytûn y Cynulliad.

Cadeiriais y pwyllgor hwn fel cynrychiolydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ar y pwyllgor hwnnw, ac yr wyf am orffen drwy wneud datganiad mwy gwleidyddol. Credaf ein bod wedi llunio Rheolau Sefydlog a fydd yn ein galluogi i dyfu'n gyflym yn senedd lawnach i Gymru, Rheolau y gellir eu defnyddio fel carreg gamu i gyfnod nesaf ein datblygiad pan fyddwn, yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr ac yn disgwyl yn hyderus, yn cael yr un pwerau â'r Alban.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of John Marek.

**John Marek:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn fy enw i. Dileu'r cyfan a rhoi yn ei le:

*1. yn nodi cynigion drafft y Cynulliad ar gyfer y Rheolau Sefydlog sydd i ddod i rym yng nghyswllt trafodion y Cynulliad yn dilyn etholiad 2007, fel y nodir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 30 Ionawr; a*

*2. yn galw ar y Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog i gyfarfod eto i ystyried unrhyw sylwadau a safbwyntiau a wnaed yng nghyswllt y cynigion drafft, ac i ailgyflwyno Rheolau*

*Orders for submission to the Secretary of State for Wales, amended or otherwise, that take particular account of following points:*

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| <p>a) <i>Standing Order No. 1.13(v) to be deleted;</i></p>  | <p>a) <i>dileu Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.13(v);</i></p>   |
| <p>b) <i>Standing Order No. 6.1(iii): at beginning insert 'times available for';</i></p>  | <p>b) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.1(iii): ar y dechrau cynnwys 'yr amserau a fydd ar gael ar gyfer';</i></p>   |
| <p>c) <i>Standing Order No. 7.11(iv): add at end 'other than proposed by the Commission';</i></p>   | <p>c) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.11(iv): ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'ar wahân i rai a gynigir gan y Comisiwn';</i></p>   |
| <p>d) <i>Standing Order No. 8.7: replace 'for the purposes of clarification before resuming a speech' with 'briefly';</i></p>   | <p>d) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.7: disodli 'er mwyn egluro cyn ailddechrau ar ei araith' gyda 'yn gryno';</i></p>  |
| <p>e) <i>Standing Order No. 8.8 to be deleted;</i></p>  | <p>e) <i>dileu Rheol Sefydlog Rhif No. 8.8;</i></p>   |
| <p>f) <i>Standing Order No. 9.9: add at end 'Amendments may be tabled to any statement of opinion provided they comply with Standing Orders and are no more than 50 words in length.';</i></p>  | <p>f) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.9: ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'Gellir cyflwyno gwelliannau i unrhyw ddatganiad barn cyhyd â'u bod yn cydymffurfio â Rheolau Sefydlog ac nad ydynt yn fwy na 50 gair o hyd.';</i></p>  |
| <p>g) <i>Standing Order 9.10: (a) delete 'if'; and (b) replace 'is deemed by the Presiding Officer to be in order it' with 'or any amendments compliant with Standing Orders';</i></p>  | <p>g) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.10: dileu 'Os yw'r Llywydd o'r farn bod Datganiad Barn yn ddilys, rhaid iddo gael ei gyhoeddi,' a chynnwys yn ei le 'Rhaid cyhoeddi Datganiad Barn neu unrhyw welliannau sy'n cydymffurfio â'r Rheolau Sefydlog,';</i></p> |
| <p>h) <i>Standing Order No. 14.1: replace 'to' with 'that may';</i></p>   | <p>h) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 14.1: disodli 'i' gydag 'a all';</i></p>   |
| <p>i) <i>Standing Order No. 16.1(i): add at end '(f) any ministerial code of conduct issued by the First Minister or Minister in his absence.';</i></p>   | <p>i) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16.1(i): ychwanegu ar y diwedd '(dd) unrhyw god ymddygiad gweinidogion a gyhoeddir gan y Prif Weinidog neu Weinidog yn ei absenoldeb.';</i></p>  |
| <p>j) <i>Standing Order No. 23.47: add at end 'Amendments made by a Minister must be selected.';</i></p>  | <p>j) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23.47: ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'Rhaid dewis gwelliannau a wneir gan Weinidog.';</i></p>  |
| <p>k) <i>Standing Order No. 24.3: insert '24.3(a) No statutory instrument can be made under the provision of Standing Order 24.2 until it has been laid for five days and 10 Members have not signed a motion of dissatisfaction.';</i></p> | <p>k) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.3: cynnwys '24.3(a) Ni ellir gwneud unrhyw offeryn statudol o dan ddarpariaeth Rheol Sefydlog 24.2 hyd nes ei fod wedi cael ei osod am bum niwrnod a bod 10 Aelod heb lofnodi cynnig o anfonlonrwydd.';</i></p>           |
| <p>l) <i>Standing Order No. 25.1: insert '25.1(a) The Counsel General, if not a member of the Assembly, may only make or confirm</i></p>  | <p>l) <i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.1: cynnwys '25.1(a) Ni all y Cwnsler Cyffredinol, os nad yw'n aelod o'r Cynulliad, ond gwneud neu</i></p>   |

*subordinate legislation if no Minister is available to do so.*’; *gadarnhau is-ddeddfwriaeth os nad oes Gweinidog ar gael i wneud hynny.*’;

*m) Standing Order No. 25.15: Insert at end ‘, but only if 10 Members have not tabled a motion of dissatisfaction’;* *m) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.15: cynnwys ar y diwedd ‘, ond dim ond os nad oes 10 Aelod wedi cyflwyno cynnig o anffodlonrwydd’;*

*n) Standing Order No. 27.6: delete ‘or decrease’;* *n) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.6: dileu ‘neu’n gostwng’;*

*o) Standing Order No. 27.7: Insert ‘at least’ before ‘the subsequent two years’ and delete the remainder;* *o) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.7: cynnwys ‘o leiaf’ cyn ‘y ddwy flynedd wedyn’ a dileu’r gweddill;*

*p) Standing Order No. 27.27: insert at end of first sentence ‘or a member of the Commission’ and insert at end ‘or a member of the Commission’;* *p) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.27: ychwanegu ar ôl ‘Cymru’ yn y frawddeg gyntaf ‘neu aelod o’r Comisiwn’ a chynnwys ar y diwedd ‘neu aelod o’r Comisiwn’;*

*q) add new Standing Order No. 36:* *q) ychwanegu Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 36 newydd:*

*‘Standing Order No. 36–Publication in Welsh and English.* *‘Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 36–Cyhoeddi yn Gymraeg a Saesneg.*

*36.1 All legislative Assembly measures and documents laid before the Assembly must be in Welsh and English unless they are of such complexity that it is impractical to do so, or that the measure is considered an emergency.* *36.1 Rhaid i holl fesurau deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad a dogfennau a gyflwynir gerbron y Cynulliad fod yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg onid ydynt mor gymhleth fel ei bod yn anymarferol gwneud hynny, neu fod y mesur yn cael ei ystyried yn un brys.*

*36.2 Any measure or statutory instrument (whether under negative or affirmative provisions) or other document that is laid and is not in both languages must be accompanied by a statement giving reasons as to why it is not so.’* *36.2 Ar gyfer pob mesur neu offeryn statudol (boed o dan ddarpariaethau negyddol neu gadarnhaol) neu ddogfen arall a osodir ac nad yw yn y ddwy iaith, rhaid cael datganiad yn rhoi rhesymau paham nad yw yn y ddwy iaith.’*

I wish to start by complimenting the committee, which has done a useful job of work. I am not against these Standing Orders being the operational Standing Orders of the Assembly after May. However, they could be better, and the amendment provides for certain instances, which, if the committee was able to meet to consider them, could improve the Standing Orders and safeguard the prerogative of Government to get its business to the point of a vote, while, on the other hand, safeguarding the powers of scrutiny that backbench Members should have.

Hoffwn ddechrau drwy roi teyrnged i’r pwyllgor sydd wedi gwneud gwaith defnyddiol. Nid wyf yn erbyn gweld y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn yn Rheolau Sefydlog gweithredol y Cynulliad ar ôl mis Mai. Fodd bynnag, gallent fod yn well, ac mae’r gwelliant yn darparu ar gyfer rhai amgylchiadau a allai wella’r Rheolau Sefydlog pe gallai’r pwyllgor gyfarfod i’w hystyried, gan ddiogelu hawl y Llywodraeth i gynnal pleidlais ar ei busnes, ac ar y llaw arall yn diogelu’r pwerau craffu a ddylai fod gan Aelodau’r meinciau cefn.

Jenny mentioned that there will not be a vote *Soniodd Jenny na fydd pleidlais ar y*



on the business statement. If there is no vote on the business statement, it will give Government the power to define the business of the day without backbench Members having a chance to alter it. Proceedings earlier this afternoon and yesterday demonstrated that easily; the Minister has now granted a debate as a result of yesterday's vote on the business statement.

On Jenny's point about committee membership and the d'Hondt formula, agreeing that by a two-thirds majority—if the d'Hondt formula is not to be used—gives the Labour Party total control over it. If the Labour Party did not want a certain system—and it would no doubt look at the system that would benefit it best—its Members would vote accordingly, and the opposition parties would have given up any form of control over agreeing on a proper and fair committee representation. It is not just the Labour Party in the Assembly that is responsible—it was the Secretary of State for Wales who put matters into the Act that should have been left to the Assembly.

I wish to run quickly through some of the aspects of the amendment. On point 2(a) of my amendment, Standing Order No. 1.13(v) states 'unless by prior agreement.' With whom would that prior agreement be? Would it be the Presiding Officer, the other parties or the constituent? I am against that because there should be an unwritten rule or protocol—we follow it now—that we do not take up other constituencies' matters. It makes no sense at the moment. There is time for the Committee on Standing Orders to accept the amendment, take it away, have a look at it, tidy up those bits of Standing Orders that need to be tidied up, and then come back with a final version. Whatever it decided, I would be happy to vote for it. However, Standing Order No. 1.13(v) could be tidied up.

3.30 p.m.

Turning to point 2(b) of my amendment, 'times available for' needs to be included in draft Standing Order No. 6.1(iii), because we cannot tell political groups when to meet, although we can make time available for them to meet. It is not our business to tell

datganiad busnes. Os na fydd pleidlais ar y datganiad busnes, bydd yn rhoi'r pŵer i'r Llywodraeth ddiffinio busnes y dydd heb roi cyfle i Aelodau'r meinciau cefn ei newid. Gwelwyd hynny'n glir yn y gweithdrefnau'n gynharach brynhawn heddiw a ddoe; mae'r Gweinidog yn awr wedi caniatáu dadl o ganlyniad i'r bleidlais ddoe ar y datganiad busnes.

O ran pwynt Jenny ynghylch aelodaeth pwyllgorau a fformiwla d'Hondt, mae cytuno ar hynny gyda mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair—os na ddefnyddir fformiwla d'Hondt—yn rhoi rheolaeth lwyr drosti i'r Blaid Lafur. Os na fyddai'r Blaid Lafur am gael system benodol—ac yn sicr byddai'n edrych ar y system a fyddai o'r budd mwyaf iddi—byddai ei Haelodau'n pleidleisio'n unol â hynny, a byddai'r gwrthbleidiau wedi ildio unrhyw fath o reolaeth dros gytuno ar gynrychiolaeth pwyllgor priodol a theg. Nid y Blaid Lafur yn y Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol—Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a gynhwysodd bethau yn y Ddeddf y dylid bod wedi'u gadael i'r Cynulliad.

Hoffwn fynd yn gyflym drwy rai agweddau ar y gwelliant. Ar bwynt 2(a) yn fy ngwelliant, dywed Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.13(v) 'oni wneir hynny drwy gytundeb ymlaen llaw'. Cytundeb ymlaen llaw â phwy fyddai hynny? Ai'r Llywydd, y pleidiau eraill, ynteu'r etholwr? Yr wyf yn erbyn hynny oherwydd dylai fod rheol neu brotocol anysgrifenedig-yr ydym yn ei dilyn ar hyn o bryd-na fyddwn yn ymhél â materion etholaethau eraill. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr ar hyn o bryd. Mae yna amser i'r Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog dderbyn y gwelliant, ei ystyried, mireinio'r rhannau hynny o Reolau Sefydlog y mae angen eu mireinio, ac yna ddod yn ôl gyda fersiwn terfynol. Beth bynnag fyddai'n ei benderfynu, byddwn yn fodlon pleidleisio drosto. Fodd bynnag, gellid tacluso Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.13(v).

I droi at bwynt 2(b) yn fy ngwelliant, mae angen cynnwys 'yr amseroedd sydd ar gael ar gyfer' yn Rheol Sefydlog drafft Rhif 6.1(iii), gan na allwn ddweud wrth grwpiau gwleidyddol pryd i gyfarfod, er y gallwn sicrhau bod amser ar gael iddynt gyfarfod.

them when to meet.

Point 2(c) of my amendment should refer to Standing Order No. 7.10(iv) as opposed to Standing Order No. 7.11(iv). I was trying to do this by telephone, having had only 48 hours to look at it. This is on the question of a budget motion. At the moment, a supplementary budget motion must be proposed by a Minister, even though it is done on behalf of the commission. I am not sure whether that is right. I would have thought that a member of the commission should be able to do that.

Point 2(d) relates to interventions. Members here intervene for purposes other than for clarification only, and so, if I, as Deputy Presiding Officer—though I have said that I will not be Deputy Presiding Officer in the next Assembly—or my successor had to rule on interventions, I think that most of them would be disallowed. Members would not be trying to clarify; they would be trying to make political points allied to what the speaker is saying. Therefore, Standing Order No. 8.7 could surely be tidied up.

I turn to point 2(f), which is on statements of opinion. The practice with statements of opinion is that you can make amendments, but if the statement of opinion goes to 98 words, any amendment can be only two words. This is not right; amendments ought to be allowed to be 50 words.

On point 2(h), the Finance Committee cannot possibly look at every document and Measure placed before it. Therefore, my suggested wording will remedy that.

Point 2(i), on the ministerial code of conduct, is important. The First Minister has left the Chamber, and so he cannot speak for himself, but, knowing him as I do, from our time at the House of Commons, I do not think that he believes in this. It cannot be right for someone to be judge and jury in their own court at the same time. The right thing to do—and I suspect that Members know this—is to place the ministerial code under the aegis of the Commissioner for Standards,

Nid ein busnes ni yw dweud wrthynt pryd i gyfarfod.

Dylai pwynt 2(c) yn fy ngwelliant gyfeirio at Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.10(iv) yn hytrach na Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.11 (iv). Yr oeddwn yn ceisio gwneud hyn dros y ffôn, a dim ond 48 awr a gefais i edrych ar y mater. Mae a wnelo hwn â chynnig cyllidebol. Ar hyn o bryd, rhaid i Weinidog gynnig cynnig cyllidebol atodol, er y gwneir hynny ar ran y comisiwn. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n iawn. Byddwn wedi meddwl y dylai aelod o'r comisiwn allu gwneud hynny.

Mae a wnelo pwynt 2(d) ag ymyriadau. Mae Aelodau yma yn ymyrryd at ddibenion heblaw cael esboniad yn unig, ac felly, pe byddai'n rhaid i mi fel Dirprwy Lywydd—er fy mod wedi dweud na fyddaf yn Ddirprwy Lywydd yn y Cynulliad nesaf—neu fy olynydd wneud dyfarniad ar ymyriadau, credaf na fyddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn cael eu caniatáu. Ni fyddai Aelodau'n ceisio cael esboniad; byddent yn ceisio gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol yn gysylltiedig â'r hyn y mae'r llefarydd yn ei ddweud. Felly, does bosibl na ellid tacluso Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.7?

Trof at bwynt 2(f), sy'n ymwneud â datganiadau barn. Yr arfer gyda datganiadau barn yw y gallwch wneud gwelliannau, ond os bydd y datganiad barn yn 98 o eiriau, gall unrhyw welliant fod yn ddau air yn unig. Nid yw hyn yn iawn; dylid caniatáu gwelliannau hyd at 50 o eiriau.

Ar bwynt 2(h), ni all y Pwyllgor Cyllid edrych ar bob dogfen a Mesur a gyflwynir ger ei fron. Felly, bydd y geiriad a awgrymaf yn unioni'r sefyllfa honno.

Mae pwynt 2(i), ar y cod ymddygiad i weinidogion, yn bwysig. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi gadael y Siambr, ac felly ni all siarad drosto'i hun, ond o'i adnabod fel yr wyf o'n cyfnod yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, ni chredaf ei fod o'i blaid. Ni all fod yn iawn i rywun fod yn farnwr ac yn rheithgor yn ei lys ei hun ar yr un pryd. Y peth iawn i'w wneud—ac yr wyf yn amau bod Aelodau yn gwybod hyn—yw gosod y cod i weinidogion o dan adain y Comisiynydd Safonau, yn

rather than that of the First Minister. Otherwise, you will have, as happens in a place not too far away at the other end of the M4, Ministers constantly resigning and being reappointed, and, before you know where you are, you will have the police investigating the First Minister. We do not want that. One way of avoiding that is to support this point.

Point 2(j) is obvious; the Government must have its amendments selected.

Points 2(k) and (m) try to safeguard the position of Members who want to object to negative resolution statutory instruments, as they cannot do so currently. Ministers will be able to make them, and the only course of action left would be a motion of revocation, which is not as good as getting in there first to make a resolution go through the normal procedures.

Standing Order No. 27.6, referred to in point 2(n), is stricter than the relevant provision in the House Commons. It will be very difficult to table amendments to budget motions if you cannot increase or decrease. In the House of Commons, you cannot increase but you can decrease. Therefore, I urge the Committee on Standing Orders to reconsider.

Finally, on the supplementary budget, as I have said, the commission must be able to table its own budget. Standing Order No. 36 on the Welsh language is important. Too many people in this place are sniping at having to get documents translated into Welsh already. It is not there without exception; as Jenny said, it is there for Measures and some other documents, but there is no substitute for having a comprehensive Standing Order that states that, unless there are defined circumstances, everything has to be laid bilingually.

I urge Members to support my amendment in the knowledge that there is time for the Committee on Standing Orders to meet and produce a slightly better set of Standing Orders, good though these amendments are before us now.

hytrach nag adain y Prif Weinidog. Fel arall, bydd gennych sefyllfa, fel y gwelwn mewn man nid nepell i ffwrdd ar ben arall yr M4, lle mae Gweinidogion yn ymddiswyddo byth a beunydd ac yn cael eu hailbenodi, a chyn pen dim bydd yr heddlu'n ymchwilio i fusnes y Prif Weinidog. Nid ydym am weld y sefyllfa honno. Un ffordd i osgoi hynny yw drwy gefnogi'r pwynt hwn.

Mae pwynt 2(j) yn amlwg; rhaid i welliannau'r Llywodraeth gael eu dethol.

Mae pwyntiau 2(k) ac (m) yn ceisio diogelu sefyllfa Aelodau sydd am wrthwynebu offerynnau statudol a wnaethpwyd ar sail penderfyniad negyddol, gan na allant wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Bydd Gweinidogion yn gallu eu gwneud, a'r unig lwybr gweithredu a fyddai ar ôl iddynt fyddai cynnig dirymu, nad yw cystal â gweithredu yn y lle cyntaf i benderfynu mynd drwy'r gweithdrefnau arferol.

Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.6, y cyfeirir ati ym mhwynt 2(n), yn fwy caeth na'r ddarpariaeth berthnasol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Bydd yn anodd iawn cyflwyno gwelliannau mewn cynigion cyllidebol os na allwch ehangu neu leihau. Yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, ni allwch ehangu, ond gallwch leihau. Felly, erfyniaf ar y Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog i ailstyried.

Yn olaf, o ran y gyllideb atodol, fel y dywedais rhaid i'r comisiwn allu cyflwyno'i gyllideb ei hun. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 36 ar y Gymraeg yn bwysig. Mae gormod o bobl yma yn cecru eisoes ein bod yn gorfod trefnu cyfieithu dogfennau i'r Gymraeg. Mae yna eithriadau; fel y dywedodd Jenny, mae'r Rheol yn berthnasol i Fesurau a rhai dogfennau eraill, ond nid oes dim yn well na Rheol Sefydlog gynhwysfawr sy'n dweud, oni fydd yna amgylchiadau sydd wedi eu diffinio, ei bod yn rhaid cyflwyno popeth yn ddwyieithog.

Erfyniaf ar Aelodau i gefnogi fy ngwelliant gan wybod bod amser i'r Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog gyfarfod a chynhyrchu cyfres ychydig yn well o Reolau Sefydlog, er bod y gwelliannau sydd ger ein bron yn awr yn rhai da.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I also thank the officials who supported the committee for their hard work and patience—a virtue that, I am afraid, I do not always possess. I also pay tribute to Jenny Randerson for her wise chairing of our meetings, and to those outside organisations that offered their views.

Sitting on this committee was not an easy task; sometimes, it was not all that enjoyable. I can safely say that the Standing Orders that you have before you today will not satisfy anyone 100 per cent. We all made compromises, and we tried to reach consensus where we could. Although the result is not perfect, I think that it is acceptable and workable, and future Assemblies can amend and revise them, if it suits them to do so.

We have included some innovations, and Jenny mentioned some of them earlier. I hope that having questions on business rather than a vote on the business statement will be more satisfactory. I know that John Marek disagrees with that, but this is one of those compromises on which we managed to reach an accommodation. More time is allocated for non-Government and Assembly business, which includes opposition debates and time for backbenchers. In return, we have given up the weekly business statement. I felt that, under the new regime, where there is a clear separation, Government parties must be confident that they can at least present their programme for government to the legislature. Minority Governments will still run the risk of having their measures voted down, but at least they will be able to present them.

Obviously, we did not reach agreement on the protocol, but, again, there was a compromise. The Committee on Standards of Conduct will have the task of producing the protocol after serious consideration and evidence-taking, and that committee, chaired by Kirsty Williams, has already developed a good track record of dealing effectively with matters like this. I am confident that the protocol will be no exception.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Hoffwn i hefyd ddiolch i'r swyddogion a gynorthwyodd y pwyllgor am eu gwaith caled a'u hamynedd—rhinwedd nad wyf bob amser yn meddu arni, yn anffodus. Hoffwn roi teyrnged hefyd i Jenny Randerson am ei chadeiryddiaeth ddoeth yn ein cyfarfodydd, ac i'r sefydliadau allanol hynny a gynigiodd eu safbwyntiau.

Nid oedd eistedd ar y pwyllgor hwn yn dasg hawdd; weithiau nid oedd mor bleserus â hynny. Gallaf ddweud yn ddiogel na fydd y Rheolau Sefydlog sydd ger eich bron heddiw yn bodloni pawb yn llwyr. Yr ydym i gyd wedi cyfaddawdu, a cheisiwyd dod i gytundeb lle y gallem. Er nad yw'r canlyniad yn berffaith, credaf ei fod yn dderbyniol ac y gall weithio, a gall Cynulladau'r dyfodol eu gwella a'u diwygio os byddant am wneud hynny.

Yr ydym wedi cynnwys rhai cynigion arloesol, a soniodd Jenny am rai ohonynt yn gynharach. Gobeithio y bydd cael cwestiynau ar fusnes yn hytrach na phleidlais ar y datganiad busnes yn fwy boddhaol. Gwn fod John Marek yn anghytuno â hynny, ond mae hyn yn un o'r pwyntiau cyfaddawdu hynny lle llwyddwyd i lunio ateb. Rhoir mwy o amser i fusnes nad yw'n ymwneud â'r Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad, sy'n cynnwys dadleuon y gwrthbleidiau ac amser i'r meincwyr cefn. Yn gyfnewid am hynny, yr ydym wedi ildio'r datganiad busnes wythnosol. Teimlwn, o dan y gyfundrefn newydd, lle mae yna raniad clir rhaid i bleidiau'r Llywodraeth deimlo'n hyderus y gallant o leiaf gyflwyno'u rhaglen ar gyfer llywodraethu i'r corff deddfu. Bydd Llywodraethau lleiafrifol yn dal i fod mewn perygl y caiff eu mesurau eu gwrthod drwy bleidlais, ond o leiaf byddant yn gallu eu cyflwyno.

Yn amlwg, ni ddaethom i gytundeb ar y protocol, ond eto, llwyddwyd i gyfaddawdu. Bydd y Pwyllgor ar Safonau Ymddygiad yn gyfrifol am gynhyrchu'r protocol ar ôl ystyriaeth ofalus a sesiynau cymryd tystiolaeth, ac mae'r pwyllgor hwnnw, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Kirsty Williams, eisoes wedi datblygu record dda o ymdrin yn effeithiol â materion o'r fath. Yr wyf yn hyderus na fydd y protocol yn eithriad.

Some committee members were determined that the new Standing Orders would not regulate anything that future Ministers or Deputy Ministers would do, so the ministerial code, already mentioned by John, caused a bit of a flashpoint. Although I am reassured that there will be a ministerial code, I feel that there is a lack of transparency that could have been corrected.

There is a major problem in that the Government of Wales Act 2006 creates a mini Westminster at a time when that system is coming under increasing criticism, with an Executive that can actually ignore the legislature. We must guard against that, and I feel that we missed the opportunity to do so in the new Standing Orders, but that is that. I would also have liked to see the inclusion of a concordat between the Executive and the legislature along the lines suggested by the POWER Commission, which would indicate where key powers lie and would provide significant scrutiny powers, including a monthly list, published by all Ministers, of their meetings with outside bodies, lobbyists and individuals. However, that was considered to be too radical. I know that many in this Chamber welcomed the POWER report, and they will be disappointed that so few of its recommendations were taken up. However, I am pleased, like Jenny, that petitions will get a fairer hearing in the future, and the Assembly will benefit from welcoming ideas from outside.

Turning to John's amendment 1, I must say that I agree with some of his suggestions. We debated some of them in committee, and John can be forgiven for not knowing that, because the majority of our meetings were held behind closed doors. Even though I agree with some of his suggestions, I cannot support his amendment because I feel that our committee ran its course, and I would agree to revisit these Standing Orders only if they are rejected in a vote this afternoon. They probably do need tweaking, but I am content to leave that to future Assemblies. Therefore, I ask you to endorse them as they stand.

Yr oedd rhai o aelodau'r pwyllgor yn benderfynol na fyddai'r Rheolau Sefydlog newydd yn rheoleiddio dim y byddai Gweinidogion neu Ddirprwy Weinidogion yn y dyfodol yn ei wneud. Felly, achosodd y cod i weinidogion, y soniodd John amdano eisoes, rywfaint o broblem. Er imi gael sicrwydd y bydd yna god i weinidogion, teimlaf fod diffyg tryloywder y gellid bod wedi'i gywiro.

Mae'r ffaith fod Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn creu San Steffan bach ar adeg pan yw'r system honno'n cael ei beirniadu fwyfwy, gyda Gweithrediaeth a all anwybyddu'r corff deddfu, yn broblem sylweddol. Rhaid inni ochel rhag hynny, a theimlaf ein bod wedi colli'r cyfle i wneud hynny yn y Rheolau Sefydlog newydd. Ond dyna ni. Hoffwn hefyd pe byddem wedi llwyddo i gynnwys concordat rhwng y Weithrediaeth a'r corff deddfu ar hyd y llinellau a awgrymwyd gan Gomisiwn POWER, a fyddai'n nodi pwy sydd â phwerau allweddol ac a fyddai'n darparu pwerau craffu sylweddol, gan gynnwys rhestr fisol, yn cael ei chyhoeddi gan bob Gweinidog, o'u cyfarfodydd gyda chyrrff allanol, lobiwyr ac unigolion. Fodd bynnag, ystyriwyd bod hynny'n rhy radical. Gwn fod nifer yn y Siambr hon wedi croesawu adroddiad POWER, a byddant wedi'u siomi bod cyn lleied o'i argymhellion wedi'u gweithredu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fi, fel Jenny, yn falch fod deisebau i gael gwrandawriad tecach yn y dyfodol, a bydd y Cynulliad yn elwa o groesawu syniadau o'r tu allan.

I droi at welliant 1 gan John, rhaid imi ddweud fy mod yn cytuno â rhai o'i awgrymiadau. Yr ydym wedi trafod rhai ohonynt yn y pwyllgor, a gellir maddau i John am beidio â gwybod hynny, gan fod y mwyafrif o'n cyfarfodydd wedi'u cynnal y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig. Er fy mod yn cytuno â rhai o'i awgrymiadau, ni allaf gefnogi ei welliant oherwydd teimlaf fod ein pwyllgor wedi dod i ddiwedd ei daith, a byddwn yn cytuno i ailystyried y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn dim ond pe caent eu gwrthod drwy bleidlais y prynhawn yma. Mae angen eu mireinio, mae'n debyg, ond yr wyf yn fodlon gadael hynny i Gynullidiadau'r dyfodol. Felly, gofynnaf ichi eu cymeradwyo fel y maent.

**Lisa Francis:** I extend my thanks, too, for the sensible and able chairing of this committee by Jenny Randerson, and I thank all of the committee, particularly the secretariat, who worked incredibly hard throughout what I imagine were some frustrating times to enable us to produce this set of Standing Orders. I also want to acknowledge the many pieces of evidence and expertise, particularly legal, which were offered to the committee.

As has been said, the committee first met some nine months ago, and the work to produce Standing Orders for the next Assembly has been a daunting task involving much background reading and reference to other documents: the Government of Wales Acts, current Standing Orders of the Assembly and the Scottish Parliament, the Beecham report, and the report of the POWER Commission, to name just a few.

As the Assembly might expect, some of our meetings were passionate and stormy, and opinions expressed, forthright and strong to say the least. There were issues on which Members were prepared to die in a ditch, and would not budge an inch on, but there were also compromises and give and take. In essence, this committee has been about negotiation and brokering a deal.

3.40 p.m.

We will not pretend that these Standing Orders will suit every Member of the Assembly. Undoubtedly, this is a fact that will stick in the craw of many. Therefore, will these Standing Orders work? The proof of the pudding will be in the eating and it will be for the next Assembly to decide whether our efforts have borne fruit and, if necessary, to decide to change or alter Standing Orders accordingly, as Jocelyn said.

Some fine things have come out of this committee and I am proud that there will be a finance committee that will ensure full budgetary scrutiny. When we witnessed that working during our visit to Scotland, we found it most impressive. There, it was clear that the finance committee represented the

**Lisa Francis:** Hoffwn i hefyd ddiolch i Jenny Randerson am gadeirio'r pwyllgor hwn mor synhwyrol a medrus, a diolchaf i'r pwyllgor cyfan, yn arbennig yr ysgrifenyddiaeth, a weithiodd yn galed iawn drwy gydol yr hyn a oedd, mae'n siŵr, yn gyfnod rhwystredig, i'n galluogi i gynhyrchu'r gyfres hon o Reolau Sefydlog. Hoffwn hefyd gydnabod y darnau niferus o dystiolaeth ac arbenigedd, yn enwedig y rhai cyfreithiol, a gynigiwyd i'r pwyllgor.

Fel y dywedwyd, cyfarfu'r pwyllgor gyntaf ryw naw mis yn ôl, a bu'r gwaith o gynhyrchu Rheolau Sefydlog ar gyfer y Cynulliad nesaf yn dasg aruthrol a oedd yn gofyn am lawer o waith darllen cefndir a chyfeirio at ddogfennau eraill: Deddfau Llywodraeth Cymru, Rheolau Sefydlog presennol y Cynulliad a Senedd yr Alban, adroddiad Beecham, ac adroddiad Comisiwn POWER, i enwi rhai'n unig.

Fel y gallai'r Cynulliad ei ddisgwyl, yr oedd rhai o'n cyfarfodydd yn danbaid ac yn stormus, a rhai o'r safbwyntiau a fynegwyd yn blaen ac yn gadarn, a dweud y lleiaf. Yr oedd Aelodau'n barod i frwydro hyd y pen ar rai materion, ac yn gwbl amharod i ildio, ond gwelwyd enghreifftiau o gyfaddawdu a thrin a thrafod hefyd. Yn y bôn, negodi a broceru cytundebau fu swyddogaeth y pwyllgor hwn.

Ni fyddwn yn honni y bydd y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn yn addas i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Mae'n sicr y bydd y ffaith hon yn ddraenen yn ystlys llawer un. Felly, a fydd y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn yn gweithio? Bydd yn rhaid aros i'w gweld ar waith, a chyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad nesaf fydd penderfynu a fydd ein hymdrechion wedi dwyn ffrwyth a phenderfynu newid neu ddiwygio Rheolau Sefydlog yn unol â hynny, os bydd angen, fel y dywedodd Jocelyn.

Daeth rhai pethau da allan o'r pwyllgor hwn ac yr wyf yn falch y bydd yna bwyllgor cyllid a fydd yn sicrhau proses graffu lawn ar y gyllideb. Pan welsom hynny'n gweithio yn ystod ein hymweliad â'r Alban, creodd argraff dda iawn arnom. Yno, yr oedd yn amlwg mai'r pwyllgor cyllid oedd y

mechanism for certain criteria being put into effect and informing difficult decisions. Interestingly, although the committee had a majority of Executive Members, scrutiny was extremely robust.

The petitions committee will give the public another avenue through which to raise issues of importance, when other kinds of lobbying have failed. The very act of lodging a petition highlights issues and creates media interest. This committee provides a vehicle that will provide hearings to minority and campaign issues. For example, I can think of many issues affecting my region of Mid and West Wales, and the reconfiguration of NHS services would be one in particular where such a committee would have been well used over the past year. Importantly, petitioners must be informed of the admissibility of petitions, and all decisions recorded.

In drawing up these new Standing Orders, we have had to work within the confines and parameters of the Government of Wales Act 2006 and, in relation to that, the separation of the Executive and the legislature has been desirable and has had cross-party agreement. However, perhaps many Assembly Members have been unaware of the burden that this would place on the Assembly. The fact is that the role of backbench Members will be to scrutinise and approve legislation, yet the Act gives more power to those in Government compared with those who hold them to account. That is why I am pleased that we concluded that independent Members should have appropriate representation on the Business Committee, as well as a right to vote.

The Government of Wales Act has provided us with parameters within which to work. In my opinion—and it is only my opinion—it is a weak piece of legislation that has also acted as a constraint, and that is disappointing. An example is that it is ironic that, since the Government of Wales Act came into being, the Secretary of State for Scotland has fully responded to the Arbuthnot commission on voting arrangements for the Scottish Parliament. That response says that

mecanwaith ar gyfer gweithredu rhai meini prawf penodol ac i lywio penderfyniadau anodd. Yn ddiddorol, er mai Aelodau Gweithredol oedd mwyafrif y pwyllgor, yr oedd y broses graffu yn eithriadol o gadarn.

Bydd y pwyllgor deisebau yn darparu llwybr arall i'r cyhoedd godi materion o bwys, pan fydd mathau eraill o lobïo wedi methu. Mae'r weithred o gyflwyno deiseb ynddi'i hun yn tynnu sylw at faterion ac yn creu diddordeb ymysg y cyfryngau. Mae'r pwyllgor hwn yn cynnig cyfrwng i wrando ar faterion lleiafrifol ac ymgyrchol. Er enghraifft, gallaf feddwl am lawer mater sy'n effeithio ar fy rhanbarth i, sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, a byddai ail-gyflunio gwasanaethau'r GIG yn fater penodol lle y byddai pwyllgor o'r fath wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol iawn yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yn bwysig iawn, rhaid hysbysu deisebwyr am dderbynioldeb deisebau, a chofnodi pob penderfyniad.

Wrth lunio'r Rheolau Sefydlog newydd hyn, bu'n rhaid inni weithio o fewn cyfyngiadau a therfynau Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, ac mewn perthynas â hynny yr oedd yn ddymunol gwahanu'r Weithrediaeth a'r corff deddfu, a chafwyd cytundeb trawsbleidiol i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, efallai nad oedd nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymwybodol o'r baich y byddai hyn yn ei roi ar y Cynulliad. Y gwir amdani yw mai rôl Aelodau'r meinciau cefn fydd craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth a'i chymeradwyo, ond mae'r Ddeddf yn rhoi mwy o bŵer i'r rheini yn y Llywodraeth o'u cymharu â'r rheini sy'n eu dal i gyfrif. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch inni ddod i'r casgliad y dylai Aelodau annibynnol gael eu cynrychioli'n briodol ar y Pwyllgor Busnes, yn ogystal â chael yr hawl i bleidleisio.

Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru wedi darparu terfynau inni weithio o'u mewn. Yn fy marn i—a dim ond fy marn i ydyw—mae'n ddarn gwan o ddeddfwriaeth sydd hefyd wedi gweithredu fel cyfyngiad, ac mae hynny'n siomedig. Enghraifft o hyn yw'r ffaith ei bod yn eironig, ers cyflwyno Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru, fod Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yr Alban wedi ymateb yn llawn i gomisiwn Arbuthnot ar drefniadau pleidleisio i Senedd yr Alban. Mae'r ymateb hwnnw'n

candidates should not be prohibited from standing in a constituency seat and on a regional list at the same election. *[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I see no point in rehearsing old arguments.

**Lisa Francis:** Remarkably, there are no plans to introduce any changes in this area to the Scottish Parliament. Compare that with the situation in Wales. The Arbuthnot commission concludes, in its report, that dual candidacy is a common and accepted feature of mixed-Member proportional systems throughout the world; indeed, some candidates are expressly required to stand in both contests. It is sad to note that this would, therefore, seem to indicate that the parameters within which we have had to draw up our Standing Orders were fundamentally flawed from the outset.

Finally, negotiating means working around difficulties and blockages, and this committee has done that. I hope that we have drawn up Standing Orders that will be simple and accessible to the public. I am, of course, unable to predict how effective they will be in the future.

**Michael German:** Given that Jenny was Chair of this committee, she is not able to give a political response, so I would like to add something to what she said. I listened to the end of her contribution, but there is a fuller point that this party wants to make on these Standing Orders. I hope that, when we come to review these procedures, Members will realise that there are certain elements of this whole process that will need to be looked at, simply because of the obvious compromises that have had to be made.

When we started this process, more than a year ago, there was general outrage among Members that, at that stage, we were not regarded as capable of writing our own Standing Orders. Today stands testament to the fact that we can do it, and have done it. Those issues that we have come across have been dealt with most appropriately. Of course, there will be the rough and the

dweud na ddylid gwahardd ymgeiswyr rhag sefyll mewn sedd etholaethol ac ar restr ranbarthol yn yr un etholiad. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni welaf ddim diben ailadrodd hen ddadleuon.

**Lisa Francis:** Yn rhyfeddol, nid oes cynlluniau o gwbl i gyflwyno unrhyw newidiadau yn y maes hwn i Senedd yr Alban. Cymharwch hynny â'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Daw comisiwn Arbuthnot i'r casgliad, yn ei adroddiad, fod ymgeisyddiaeth ddeuol yn nodwedd gyffredin a dderbynnir o systemau cyfrannol Aelodau-cymysg ledled y byd; yn wir, mae'n ofynnol yn benodol i rai ymgeiswyr sefyll yn y ddwy gystadleuaeth. Mae'n drueni dweud y byddai hyn, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn dynodi bod diffygion sylfaenol yn y terfynau y bu'n rhaid inni weithio o'u mewn wrth lunio ein Rheolau Sefydlog o'r cychwyn cyntaf.

Yn olaf, mae negodi yn golygu datrys anawsterau a rhwystrau, ac mae'r pwyllgor hwn wedi gwneud hynny. Gobeithio ein bod wedi llunio Rheolau Sefydlog a fydd yn syml ac yn hwylus i'r cyhoedd. Wrth gwrs, ni allaf ragweld pa mor effeithiol a fyddant yn y dyfodol.

**Michael German:** O gofio mai Jenny oedd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor hwn, ni all roi ymateb gwleidyddol, felly, fe hoffwn ychwanegu rhywbeth at yr hyn a ddywedodd. Gwrandewais ar ddiwedd ei chyfraniad, ond mae pwynt manylach yr hoffai'r blaidd hon ei gyflwyno am y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn. Gobeithio, pan fyddwn yn adolygu'r gweithdrefnau hyn, y bydd Aelodau'n sylweddoli y bydd angen ystyried rhai elfennau penodol yn yr holl broses hon, o ganlyniad i'r enghreifftiau amlwg o gyfaddawd y bu'n rhaid eu gwneud.

Pan ddechreuwyd ar y broses hon, dros flwyddyn yn ôl, yr oedd dicter cyffredinol ymhlith Aelodau na chredid bod gennym y gallu, ar y pryd, i ysgrifennu ein Rheolau Sefydlog ein hunain. Mae heddiw yn profi'r ffaith y gallwn wneud hynny, a'n bod wedi gwneud hynny. Aethpwyd i'r afael â'r materion hynny yr ydym wedi dod ar eu traws yn y ffordd fwyaf priodol. Wrth gwrs,



smooth and this will be difficult for some people in some areas. However, in the end, after walking this political tightrope, whereby people have had to make compromises and judgments, we have an outcome that has the support of all political parties here. That is a tribute to the work of the committee and to those who served on it—and I will talk about the Chair's role in a moment.

The crucial issue here is that one compromise that has had to be made—and the Members of the next Assembly will have to reflect on this—relates to pressures on Members' time. There are some restrictions in the template that we have been given today, and in trying to restrict the amount of committee work that will be undertaken to avoid restrictions on the number of Members. Scrutiny committees are mentioned, but their number will depend upon the amount of time that Members can give to that work. Therefore, those who think that we can have the same range of subject committees that we have at present may find that that will not be possible after this coming election. Of course, there will be what I call the Order and Measure committees—the Bill committees, as it were—which will come in and out of existence as the Measures come before us.

However, what this lays before us is a template for a 60-Member Assembly that can grow as demand grows, and as the parliamentary profile of this institution, through the work that we do, grows with it. Those who say that the Richard commission was incorrect in saying that we should have 80 Members will be proved wrong as the time goes on. What we have is a gold-plated system; we have a dual process. We have to go through both the Orders in Council and the Measure-making process, and so we have a dual process, which, again, means increased pressure on Members.

I pay tribute to committee members for the way in which they managed the issue of the role of the Deputy Presiding Officer and the Presiding Officer. The fact that neither will vote and that they will not be on the same side of the Chamber after the next election is important. That means that the role of the Deputy Presiding Officer and the Presiding

ni fydd pethau'n hawdd bob amser, a bydd hyn yn anodd i rai pobl mewn rhai ardaloedd. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, ar ôl ymdrin â'r sefyllfa wleidyddol anodd hon, lle y bu'n rhaid i bobl gyfaddawdu a llunio barn, mae gennym ganlyniad sy'n cael ei gefnogi gan yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol. Mae hynny'n deyrnged i waith y pwyllgor ac i'r rhai a wasanaethodd arno—a soniaf am rôl y Cadeirydd maes o law.

Y mater allweddol yma yw bod un cyfaddawd y bu'n rhaid ei wneud—a bydd yn rhaid i Aelodau'r Cynulliad nesaf fyfyrion ar hyn—yn ymwneud â phwysau ar amser Aelodau. Mae rhai cyfyngiadau yn y templed a roddwyd inni heddiw, ac wrth geisio cyfyngu ar faint o waith pwyllgor a wneir i osgoi cyfyngiadau ar nifer yr Aelodau. Sonnir am bwyllgorau craffu, ond bydd eu nifer yn dibynnu ar faint o amser y gall Aelodau ei roi i'r gwaith hwnnw. Felly, efallai y bydd y bobl hynny sy'n meddwl y gallwn gael yr un amrywiaeth o bwyllgorau pwnc ag sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yn gweld na fydd hynny'n bosibl ar ôl yr etholiad nesaf hwn. Wrth gwrs, bydd yr hyn a alwaf yn bwyllgorau Gorchymyn a Mesur—y pwyllgorau Mesur, fel petai—a fydd yn cael eu sefydlu a'u dirwyn i ben wrth i'r Mesurau ddod ger ein bron.

Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn rhoi inni dempled ar gyfer Cynulliad o 60 o Aelodau a all dyfu wrth i'r galw gynyddu, ac wrth i broffil seneddol y sefydliad hwn, drwy'r gwaith a wnawn, gynyddu gydag ef. Caiff y rhai sy'n dweud bod comisiwn Richard yn anghywir i ddweud y dylem gael 80 o Aelodau eu profi'n anghywir gydag amser. Yr hyn sydd gennym yw system fanwl; mae gennym broses ddeublyg. Rhaid inni fynd trwy broses y Gorchymynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor a'r broses gwneud Mesurau, ac felly mae gennym broses ddeublyg, sydd unwaith eto, yn golygu rhoi mwy o bwysau ar Aelodau.

Rhof deyrnged i aelodau'r pwyllgor am y ffordd y maent wedi ymdrin â rôl y Dirprwy Lywydd a'r Llywydd. Mae'r ffaith na fydd y naill na'r llall yn pleidleisio ac na fyddant ar yr un ochr o'r Siambr ar ôl yr etholiad nesaf yn bwysig. Golyga hynny y gall rôl y Dirprwy Lywydd a'r Llywydd barhau heb beryglu cael eu gweld yn diystyru

Officer can be maintained without the danger of them being seen to override the political wishes of the Welsh people, which is a problem that we have had during this second Assembly.

It is a bold and important measure that we are to have a finance committee so that we can properly scrutinise the new finance Orders that will come forward. I would ask Jenny, in her response, to elaborate on Standing Order No. 23.78. What, precisely, must the Assembly do to get the Duke of Cornwall's consent for something? Perhaps she could advise us when the Duke of Cornwall's consent would kick in, and perhaps give an example; I would be interested to know that. I understand the role of the Queen in this, but I do not understand the role of the Duke of Cornwall, and why he is not called the Prince of Wales—perhaps you can help me with that later on, Jenny.

I pay tribute to the committee for the protocol about regional and constituency Members, because it has put in place an annex to Standing Orders that prescribes the sorts of issues that have to be dealt with. I believe that these will provide sufficient protection to the Labour regional list Members who will undoubtedly be sitting in some of these chairs after the May elections, and I hope that those Labour Members will give due thanks to this committee for having looked after their interests.

Finally, this committee has worked hard for nine months, and has met many times. Beyond all else—beyond thanking committee members and officials—I wish to thank Jenny Randerson, on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, for a job well done.

3.50 p.m.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Today's debate is the culmination of cross-party effort and co-operation to provide the new Assembly with a set of robust Standing Orders that reflect the new constitutional settlement and our experience over the last eight years. Any cross-party co-operation requires some degree of negotiation and compromise, and this work has been no

dymuniadau gwleidyddol pobl Cymru, sy'n broblem a gawsom yn ystod yr ail Gynulliad hwn.

Mae'r ffaith ein bod i gael pwyllgor cyllid er mwyn inni allu craffu'n briodol ar y Gorchmynion cyllid newydd a ddaw ger ein bron yn fesur beiddgar a phwysig. Byddwn yn gofyn i Jenny, yn ei hymateb, ymhelaethu ar Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.78. Beth yn union y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad ei wneud i gael caniatâd Dug Cernyw ar gyfer rhywbeth? Efallai y gallai ddweud wrthym pryd y byddai caniatâd Dug Cernyw yn dod i rym, ac efallai roi enghraifft inni; hoffwn wybod hynny. Deallaf rôl y Frenhines yn hyn o beth, ond ni allaf ddeall rôl Dug Cernyw, a pham na chaiff ei alw'n Dywysog Cymru—efallai y gallwch fy helpu gyda hynny yn ddiweddarach, Jenny.

Rhof deyrnged i'r pwyllgor am y protocol ynghylch Aelodau rhanbarthol ac etholaethol, gan ei fod wedi ychwanegu atodiad at y Rheolau Sefydlog sy'n rhagnodi'r mathau o faterion y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy. Credaf y bydd y rhain yn rhoi digon o ddiogelwch i Aelodau o restr ranbarthol y blaid Lafur a fydd, yn ddiamau, yn eistedd yn rhai o'r cadeiriau hyn ar ôl yr etholiadau ym mis Mai, a gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau Llafur hynny'n diolch i'r pwyllgor hwn am ofalu am eu buddiannau.

Yn olaf, mae'r pwyllgor hwn wedi gweithio'n galed am naw mis ac cwrdd droeon. Y tu hwnt i bopeth arall—y tu hwnt i ddiolch i aelodau a swyddogion y pwyllgor—hoffwn ddiolch i Jenny Randerson, ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, am ei gwaith da.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r ddadl heddiw yn tarddu o ymdrech a chydweithrediad ar draws y pleidiau i ddarparu cyfres o Reolau Sefydlog cadarn i'r Cynulliad newydd, sy'n adlewyrchu'r setliad cyfansoddiadol newydd a'n profiad dros yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf. Mae unrhyw gydweithrediad ar draws y pleidiau'n gofyn am rywffaint o gyd-drafod a chyfaddawdu, ac

exception. These draft Standing Orders are the result of compromise, as has been said, on all sides, as well as of a great deal of hard work to reach that agreement. Lisa, you used the words ‘passionate’ and ‘stormy’, but we were also responsible and committed. It was a team that clearly took on board the importance of the task. I thank the Chair, Jenny Randerson, and all the committee members for their part in producing the Standing Orders before us today. I would also like to place on record my thanks to the committee clerks and my officials, who have worked constructively together. It has taken nine months and 30 meetings—it was a formidable and daunting task, both practically and politically.

Since its establishment in 1999, the Assembly has grown in influence and responsibility, and we must learn from that experience, and that came through in all of the meetings. The Government of Wales Act 2006 enables the Assembly to continue its development into a more mature political institution. It is an institution that is ready and waiting to deliver on the new powers of the Act, which we are all now planning for. If we look at the work of the committee, we had to address those issues. As Jenny described, from May, the Assembly and the Assembly Government will be separate, and a system that is more similar to that in Scotland and in Westminster will be established. Ministers will carry out executive functions, the Assembly will scrutinise Ministers in the exercise of those functions, and we will see a step change in scrutiny.

I want to place on record, again, my support for, commitment to, and understanding of the changes that that will bring about. We had debates in the committee to understand that, because these changes require a new set of rules to govern the way in which the Assembly operates. It strengthens the ability of the Assembly to scrutinise the Government and to hold Ministers to account.

Those developments and changes in roles and

ni fu'r gwaith hwn yn eithriad. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog hyn yn deillio o gyfaddawd, fel y dywedwyd, ar bob ochr, yn ogystal â llawer iawn o waith caled i gyrraedd y cytundeb hwnnw. Lisa, defnyddiwyd y geiriau ‘tanbaid’ a ‘stormus’ gennych, ond yr oeddem hefyd yn gyfrifol ac yn ymrwymedig. Yr oedd yn dîm a aeth i'r afael â phwysigrwydd y dasg, a hynny'n amlwg. Diolch i'r Cadeirydd, Jenny Randerson, a holl aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu rhan yn y gwaith wrth gynhyrchu'r Rheolau Sefydlog sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch hefyd i glercod y pwyllgor a'm swyddogion, sydd wedi gweithio'n adeiladol gyda'i gilydd. Mae wedi cymryd naw mis a 30 o gyfarfodydd—yr oedd yn dasg aruthrol ac anodd, yn ymarferol ac yn wleidyddol.

Ers ei sefydlu yn 1999, mae dylanwad a chyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad wedi tyfu, a rhaid inni ddysgu o'r profiad hwnnw, ac yr oedd hynny'n amlwg ym mhob un o'r cyfarfodydd. Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i barhau i ddatblygu'n sefydliad gwleidyddol aeddfetach. Mae'n sefydliad sy'n barod ac yn awyddus i ddarparu pwerau newydd y Ddeddf yr ydym i gyd yn cynllunio ar eu cyfer yn awr. Os edrychwn ar waith y pwyllgor, yr oedd yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Fel y disgrifiodd Jenny, o fis Mai ymlaen bydd y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwahanu, a chaiff system sy'n debycach i'r hyn a geir yn yr Alban ac yn San Steffan ei sefydlu. Bydd Gweinidogion yn cyflawni swyddogaethau gweithredol, bydd y Cynulliad yn craffu ar Weinidogion wrth iddynt arfer y swyddogaethau hynny, a byddwn yn gweld newid sylweddol yn y broses graffu.

Hoffwn gofnodi, unwaith eto, fy nghefnogaeth i'r newidiadau a ddaw yn sgil hynny, fy ymrwymiad iddynt a'm dealltwriaeth ohonynt. Cawsom drafodaethau yn y pwyllgor i ddeall hynny, gan fod y newidiadau hyn yn gofyn am gyfres newydd o reolau i lywodraethu'r ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad yn gweithredu. Mae'n atgyfnerthu gallu'r Cynulliad i graffu ar y Llywodraeth a dwyn Gweinidogion i gyfrif.

Caiff y datblygiadau a'r newidiadau hynny

responsibilities are now reflected in these Standing Orders. One of the most obvious changes is the absence of some of the provisions in the current Standing Orders, largely because of the separation between the Executive and the legislature—a move that was supported by all parties in the Chamber. Arrangements for Assembly business will also be different, but if you look at every Westminster-type Government and system of government, they operate on the principle—and Jocelyn made this point in her contribution—that the Government has the right to have its business considered and needs to have confidence that that will happen, but that the legislature also has a right and a responsibility to hold the Government to account. Therefore, in future, the scheduling of Government business will be determined and controlled by the Government, but there will be protected time for both Government and non-Government business.

The role of the Business Committee will be to schedule backbench and opposition business. The Assembly will be able to question the Business Minister and make representations to him or her, but, ultimately, decisions on Government business will be for the Government to determine. Also, as Jocelyn indicated in her contribution, 40 per cent of the Assembly's time will be set aside for opposition party debates, backbench proposals on legislation, and reports and proposals from the Assembly's committees. That is a large increase—this is important information—on what is available under the current arrangements, and is more generous than is the case in many similar parliamentary systems. The scheduling of non-Government business will be in the hands of non-Government Members. In future, opposition and backbench Members will decide when to hold their debates, and these Members will not be dependent upon the Government's finding time for opposition and backbench business. This is a new and unique set of Standing Orders. There are also changes to the Assembly's committee structure, and the Act and the proposed Standing Orders give the Assembly the freedom to establish committees to reflect its own arrangements.

mewn rolau a chyfrifoldebau eu hadlewyrchu bellach yn y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn. Un o'r heriau mwyaf amlwg yw absenoldeb rhai o'r darpariaethau yn y Rheolau Sefydlog presennol, yn bennaf oherwydd y broses o wahanu'r Weithrediaeth a'r ddeddfwrfa—cam a gefnogwyd gan yr holl bleidiau yn y Siambr. Bydd trefniadau ar gyfer busnes y Cynulliad yn wahanol hefyd, ond os edrychwch ar bob Llywodraeth a system lywodraethu sy'n debyg i'r hyn a geir yn San Steffan, maent yn gweithredu ar yr egwyddor—a gwnaeth Jocelyn y pwynt hwn yn ei chyfraniad—fod gan y Llywodraeth yr hawl i gael ei busnes wedi'i ystyried, a bod angen iddi fod yn hyderus y bydd hynny'n digwydd, ond bod gan y ddeddfwrfa hefyd hawl a chyfrifoldeb i ddwyn y Llywodraeth i gyfrif. Felly, yn y dyfodol, caiff trefnu busnes y Llywodraeth ei bennu a'i reoli gan y Llywodraeth, ond bydd amser wedi'i ddiogelu ar gyfer busnes y Llywodraeth a busnes anllywodraethol.

Rôl y Pwyllgor Busnes fydd trefnu busnes y meinciau cefn a'r gwrthbleidiau. Bydd y Cynulliad yn gallu holi'r Trefnydd a gwneud sylwadau iddo ef neu hi, ond yn y pen draw y Llywodraeth fydd yn penderfynu busnes y Llywodraeth. Hefyd, fel y dywedodd Jocelyn yn ei chyfraniad, caiff 40 y cant o amser y Cynulliad ei neilltuo ar gyfer dadleuon y gwrthbleidiau, cynigion y meinciau cefn ar ddeddfwriaeth ac adroddiadau a chynigion gan bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n gynydd mawr—mae hyn yn wybodaeth bwysig—o'i gymharu â'r hyn sydd ar gael o dan y trefniadau presennol, ac mae'n fwy hael nag yn achos nifer o systemau seneddol tebyg. Aelodau anllywodraethol fydd yn trefnu busnes anllywodraethol. Yn y dyfodol, Aelodau o'r gwrthbleidiau a'r meinciau cefn fydd yn penderfynu pryd i gynnal eu dadleuon, ac ni fydd yr Aelodau hyn yn dibynnu ar ddod o hyd i amser gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer busnes y gwrthbleidiau a'r meinciau cefn. Mae hon yn gyfres newydd ac unigryw o Reolau Sefydlog. Mae newidiadau hefyd yn strwythur pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, ac mae'r Ddeddf a'r Rheolau Sefydlog arfaethedig yn rhoi'r rhyddid i'r Cynulliad sefydlu pwyllgorau i adlewyrchu ei threfniadau ei hun.

**John Marek:** I have been listening carefully, Jane, to what you have been saying. What can you say to assure the Assembly that, since powers will be conferred upon Ministers under the new arrangements, rather than delegated to Ministers through the Assembly, as is the case under present arrangements, Ministers will pay any attention to what this Assembly does? There is nothing in the Standing Orders that will constrain Ministers to do any particular thing.

**Jane Hutt:** You raised this issue in relation to your amendment, and I want to put on record an important point in relation to Ministers: there will be a ministerial code. The code is being revised in line with the Act, and the draft code will be presented for approval to the First Minister appointed by the Queen after the elections. These issues are important with regard to separation and the unique way in which we are developing the new framework for the Assembly. It is important that we look at the changes to the Assembly's committee structure, because the Standing Orders, through the Act, allow the Assembly the freedom to establish committees to reflect its arrangements.

That flexibility has been welcomed, and the new Assembly will use that opportunity after May. There will be scrutiny committees, examining Government policy, and the Legislation Committee will, as Jenny said, have an enhanced role as the Subordinate Legislation Committee in considering the merits and the technical aspects of subordinate legislation made by the Welsh Ministers. There will be a new Finance Committee, which will have the opportunity to monitor the Government's budget as well as the financial implications of non-Government proposals. So, it is coming together in terms of understanding the separation, and understanding the opportunity to scrutinise and to hold Ministers to account.

The completely new provisions on legislative competence Orders and Assembly Measures, importantly, reflect the enhanced powers that the Assembly will have. There are robust processes to enable the Assembly to scrutinise Government proposals, together, as I said, with increased time for non-

**John Marek:** Yr wyf wedi bod yn gwrando'n astud, Jane, ar yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud. Beth y gallwch ei ddweud i sicrhau'r Cynulliad y bydd Gweinidogion yn rhoi unrhyw sylw i'r hyn a wnaiff y Cynulliad, o gofio y bydd Gweinidogion yn cael pwerau dan y trefniadau newydd, yn hytrach na'u dirprwyo i Weiniogion drwy'r Cynulliad, fel sy'n digwydd o dan y trefniadau presennol? Nid oes dim yn y Rheolau Sefydlog a fydd yn gorfodi Gweinidogion i wneud dim byd penodol.

**Jane Hutt:** Codwyd y mater hwn gennyh mewn perthynas â'ch gwelliant, a hoffwn gofnodi pwynt pwysig mewn perthynas â Gweinidogion: fe fydd cod i weiniogion. Caiff y cod ei ddiwygio'n unol â'r Ddeddf, a chyflwynir y cod drafft i'r Prif Weiniog, a benodir gan y Frenhines ar ôl yr etholiadau, ei gymeradwyo. Mae'r materion hyn yn bwysig o ran y broses wahanu a'r ffordd unigryw yr ydym yn datblygu'r fframwaith newydd ar gyfer y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried y newidiadau yn strwythur pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, gan fod y Rheolau Sefydlog, drwy'r Ddeddf, yn rhoi'r rhyddid i'r Cynulliad sefydlu pwyllgorau i adlewyrchu ei drefniadau.

Croesawyd yr hyblygrwydd hwnnw, a bydd y Cynulliad newydd yn defnyddio'r cyfle hwnnw ar ôl mis Mai. Fe fydd pwyllgorau craffu yn archwilio polisiau'r Llywodraeth, a bydd gan y Pwyllgor Deddfau, fel y dywedodd Jenny, fwy o rôl fel y Pwyllgor Is-Ddeddfwriaeth wrth ystyried rhinweddau a'r agweddau technegol ar is-deddfwriaeth a wneir gan Weiniogion yng Nghymru. Bydd Pwyllgor Cyllid newydd, a gaiff y cyfle i fonitro cyllideb y Llywodraeth yn ogystal â goblygiadau ariannol cynigion anllywodraethol. Felly, mae pethau'n dechrau dod i fwcwl o ran deall y broses wahanu, a deall y cyfle i graffu a dwyn Gweinidogion i gyfrif.

Mae'r darpariaethau cwbl newydd ar Orchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol a Mesurau'r Cynulliad, yn bwysig, yn adlewyrchu'r pwerau ychwanegol a fydd gan y Cynulliad. Mae prosesau cadarn i alluogi'r Cynulliad i graffu ar gynigion y Llywodraeth, ynghyd â mwy o amser, fel y dywedais, ar

Government business, providing opportunities for backbenchers to propose Measures, as Jenny said.

Turning to John's amendment, the committee produced the draft Standing Orders within a tight timescale, and, if we approve them today, they can be with the Secretary of State by the end of the month. That is what we want; that is what this Assembly can achieve. These Standing Orders are the result of cross-party consensus and co-operation. I believe that they reflect the will of the overwhelming majority of the Assembly. It will not come as any surprise to John that we will not be supporting his amendment. However, as has been said, what we approve today will not be set in stone. The new Assembly will have the opportunity to revise and amend its Standing Orders in light of experience.

I wish to finish with a ministerial, not political, comment. I am proud to be a Labour Minister in a Labour Welsh Assembly Government, working with a Labour Government in Westminster that has delivered the Government of Wales Act 1999, and the Government of Wales Act 2006. We would not be here, and we would not have these Standing Orders without that. I do not want to deviate from our shared political goal today; that is how I wish to finish this debate. What we are being asked to do today is to show our support for a new, exciting framework from May 2007. It is a framework for the people of Wales, for our partners in local government, our partners in civic society, businesses, and the voluntary sector. It is a new framework for them to understand and to enable them to contribute and to influence us in this new opportunity in the political institution that we are developing. It demonstrates a confident and mature Wales in the governmental and parliamentary context.

I believe, and hope, that, as Jenny said, this is the settled will of the Assembly, and that, as a result of this debate, consensus will be achieved and proven.

**The Presiding Officer:** As chair of the Shadow Commission and the current Presiding Officer, I wish to thank Jenny Randerson for the work that she has done,

gyfer busnes anllywodraethol, gan roi cyfleoedd i aelodau'r meinciau cefn gynnis Mesurau, fel y dywedodd Jenny.

I droi at welliant John, cynhyrchodd y pwyllgor y Rheolau Sefydlog drafft o fewn amserlen dynn, ac os byddwn yn eu cymeradwyo heddiw, gallant fod gerbron yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol erbyn diwedd y mis. Dyna a ddymunwn; dyna y gall y Cynulliad ei gyflawni. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog hyn yn deillio o gonsensws a chydweithrediad ar draws y pleidiau. Credaf eu bod yn adlewyrchu ewyllys y mwyafrif llethol o'r Cynulliad. Ni fydd yn synnu John na fyddwn yn cefnogi ei welliant. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedwyd, ni fydd yr hyn a gymeradwywn heddiw yn bendant a therfynol. Bydd gan y Cynulliad newydd y cyfle i ddiwygio a gwella ei Reolau Sefydlog yn sgil profiad.

Hoffwn orffen gyda sylw gweinidogol, nid gwleidyddol. Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn Weinidog Llafur yn Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithio gyda Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan sydd wedi cyflwyno Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1999, a Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. Ni fyddem yma ac ni fyddai gennym y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn heb hynny. Nid wyf am wyro oddi wrth ein nod gwleidyddol cyffredin heddiw; fel hyn yr wyf am orffen y ddatl hon. Yr hyn y gofynnir inni ei wneud heddiw yw dangos ein cefnogaeth i fframwaith cyffrous, newydd o fis Mai 2007 ymlaen. Mae'n fframwaith i bobl Cymru, i'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol, i'n partneriaid mewn cymdeithas ddinesig, i fusnesau ac i'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'n fframwaith newydd iddynt ei ddeall, ac mae'n eu galluogi i gyfrannu at ein gwaith a dylanwadu arnom yn y cyfle newydd hwn yn y sefydliad gwleidyddol yr ydym yn ei ddatblygu. Mae'n dangos Cymru hyderus ac aeddfed mewn cyd-destun llywodraethol a seneddol.

Yr wyf yn credu, ac yn gobeithio, fel y dywedodd Jenny, mai dyma yw ewyllys cyson y Cynulliad, ac o ganlyniad i'r ddatl hon y cawn gytundeb a hynny'n amlwg.

**Y Llywydd:** Fel cadeirydd y Comisiwn Cysgodol ac fel y Llywydd presennol, hoffwn ddiolch i Jenny Randerson am y gwaith a wnaed ganddi, ac yn arbennig am y

and especially for the close co-operation between her committee and officials and ours in the commission in undertaking preparatory work to ensure that everything will be in place when we return here after May.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. I thank everyone for their comments. I shall go through the responses in order. I have addressed some of the issues that John Marek has raised. However, he has raised some further issues to which I need to respond. These Standing Orders were available in draft form from 22 January, so Assembly Members have not been rushed in having to deal with them.

On the vote on the business statement, the vote will now be taken in the Business Committee. The current Business Committee is not party balanced, and there can be no votes.

4.00 p.m.

The new Business Committee will have weighted voting with Independent Members also having the right to attend and to vote. Since it accurately reflects the make-up of the Assembly as a whole, any vote held there would produce the same result as a vote held here. If there were to be a quirk in the system, it would be foolish for any Assembly Government to try to take, for example, legislation or a budget through for which it knew it had no support in the Business Committee.

In relation to the protocol, the Government of Wales Act 2006 requires us to have it and it will be up to the Committee on Standards of Conduct to put the principles into practice. All we have done is to put in a set of basic principles that it will have to interpret. Reference to interventions is exactly the same as in current Standing Orders, and it is virtually the same in the case of statements of opinion.

The d'Hondt formula, once again, is in the Act. We have tried to produce a system that enables us to avoid having to use it and which makes things as flexible as possible. I am afraid, John, that your amendment on the

cydweithrediad agos rhwng ei phwyllgor a'i swyddogion hi a'n swyddogion ni yn y comisiwn wrth ymgymryd â gwaith paratoadol i sicrhau y bydd popeth ar waith pan fyddwn ddychwelwn yma ar ôl mis Mai.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch, Lywydd. Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb am eu sylwadau. Trafodaf yr ymatebion yn eu trefn. Yr wyf wedi mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion a godwyd gan John Marek. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi codi rhai materion pellach y mae angen imi ymateb iddynt. Yr oedd y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn ar gael ar ffurf ddrafft o 22 Ionawr ymlaen, felly, ni fu'n rhaid i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ruthro i ymdrin â hwy.

O ran y bleidlais ar y datganiad busnes, cynhelir y bleidlais yn awr yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Nid yw'r Pwyllgor Busnes presennol yn gytbwys o ran pleidiau, ac ni ellir cael unrhyw bleidlais.

Bydd gan y Pwyllgor Busnes newydd ddull o bleidleisio wedi ei bwysoli a bydd gan Aelodau Annibynnol yr hawl i fynychu a phleidleisio hefyd. Gan ei bod yn adlewyrchu'n gywir gyfansoddiad y Cynulliad yn gyffredinol, byddai unrhyw bleidlais yno'n rhoi'r un canlyniad â phleidlais a fwir yma. Pe bai rhyw dro yn y system, byddai'n wirion i unrhyw Lywodraeth y Cynulliad geisio pasio deddfwriaeth neu gyllideb, er enghraifft, gan wybod nad oedd ganddi gefnogaeth yn y Pwyllgor Busnes.

Mewn perthynas â'r protocol, mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni ei gael, a gwaith y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad fydd rhoi'r egwyddorion ar waith. Y cyfan a wnaethom ni yw rhoi cyfres o egwyddorion sylfaenol ar waith y bydd yn rhaid iddo'u dehongli. Mae'r cyfeiriad at ymyriadau yn union yr un fath â'r cyfeiriad yn y Rheolau Sefydlog presennol a bron yr un fath yn achos datganiadau barn.

Mae fformiwla d'Hondt, unwaith eto, yn y Ddeddf. Yr ydym wedi ceisio cynhyrchu system sy'n ein galluogi i osgoi gorfod ei defnyddio ac sy'n gwneud pethau mor hyblyg â phosibl. Ofnaf, John, y byddai eich

Finance Committee would weaken a committee that we, on all sides, believe should be a strong committee. Having said that, there are other issues that we may well wish to look at in the future and I am grateful for your close attention to the Standing Orders.

Jocelyn and Lisa have emphasised that this is a compromise. However, that does not mean that these Standing Orders are not good. In some cases, they are innovative and I believe that they will work in practice. It is worth noting that the Government of Wales Act 2006 has placed some constraints on what we could do, which we might not necessarily have welcomed; ironically, some of those are constraints or quirks of legislation that were clearly not foreseen by Parliament or by the Secretary of State.

Mike referred to the Duke of Cornwall; that was a requirement of section 98(4) of the Government of Wales Act 2006, and concerns the private rights of Her Majesty and the Duke of Cornwall. I think that you can relax as we will not be using it often.

The Business Minister has emphasised the need for good and strong scrutiny. I think that we have all had some difficulty in getting our minds around the implications of separation. It will have a profound impact on the way that we work here and it is all the more important, therefore, that we create a strong, robust Assembly with strong, robust scrutiny. Having more time for opposition scrutiny was an important Government concession to enable that scrutiny to take place—that is, of course, the Government at the time; it might not be the Government of the future.

It is important that we have been able to do this work to a tight timescale. I urge you, once again, to reject the amendment and to support the Standing Orders, so that they can be delivered to the Secretary of State within the timescale that he set us, with a completely clean bill of health.

gwelliant ar y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn gwanhau pwyllgor a ddylai, ym marn pob plaid, fod yn bwyllgor cryf. Ar ôl dweud hynny, mae materion eraill y byddwn am eu hystyried efallai yn y dyfodol, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am eich sylw manwl i'r Rheolau Sefydlog.

Mae Jocelyn a Lisa wedi pwysleisio bod hyn yn gyfaddawd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu nad yw'r Rheolau Sefydlog hyn yn dda. Mewn rhai achosion, maent yn arloesol a chredaf y byddant yn gweithio'n ymarferol. Mae'n werth sylwi bod Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 wedi gosod rhai cyfyngiadau ar yr hyn y gallem ei wneud ac na fyddem, o reidrwydd, wedi eu croesawu; yn eironig, mae rhai ohonynt yn gyfyngiadau neu'n droeon deddfwriaeth na ragwelwyd yn amlwg gan y Senedd na chan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol.

Cyfeiriodd Mike at Ddug Cernyw; yr oedd hynny yn un o ofynion adran 98(4) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, ac yn ymwneud â hawliau preifat Ei Mawrhydi a Dug Cernyw. Credaf y gallwch ymlacio oherwydd ni fyddwn yn ei ddefnyddio'n aml.

Mae'r Trefnydd wedi pwysleisio'r angen am system graffu sy'n gryf ac yn dda. Credaf fod pob un ohonom wedi cael ychydig anhawster i ddeall goblygiadau gwahanu. Caiff effaith ddofn ar y ffordd y gweithiwn yma, ac felly mae hyd yn oed yn bwysicach inni greu Cynulliad cryf, cadarn gyda system graffu sy'n gryf a chadarn. Yr oedd sicrhau mwy o amser craffu i'r gwrthbleidiau yn gonsesiwn pwysig gan y Llywodraeth er mwyn i'r system graffu honno ddigwydd—hynny yw, wrth gwrs, y Llywodraeth ar y pryd; efallai nad Llywodraeth y dyfodol fydd honno.

Mae'n bwysig inni fod wedi gallu gwneud y gwaith hwn yn ôl amserlen dynn. Fe'ch anogaf, unwaith eto, i wrthod y gwelliant ac i gefnogi'r Rheolau Sefydlog, fel y gellir eu cyflwyno i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol o fewn yr amserlen a bennodd inni, yn hollol gywir.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 48.  
Amendment 1: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 48.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:



The following Members voted for:

Law, Trish  
Marek, John  
Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3451): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*approves, for the purposes of paragraph 20(4) of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 2006, the Assembly's proposals for the Standing Orders which are to have effect in relation to the proceedings of the Assembly following the 2007 election, as set out in the*

Cynnig (NDM3451): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn cymeradwyo, at ddibenion paragraff 20(4) o Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, cynigion y Cynulliad ar gyfer y Rheolau Sefydlog sydd i ddod i rym yng nghyswllt trafodion y Cynulliad yn dilyn etholiad 2007, fel y'u nodir yn adroddiad y*

*report of the Committee on Standing Orders laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 30 January.*      *Pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 30 Ionawr.*

*Cynnig (NDM3451): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3451): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.05 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.05 p.m.*

**Adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar Ddigartrefedd  
Ymhlith Pobl Ifanc  
The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's Review of Youth  
Homelessness**

**Janice Gregory:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 6.6 and 9.9, notes the report of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee entitled, 'Report on Youth Homelessness: "Everyone's Business—No-one's Responsibility"' laid in the Table Office on 30 January 2007. (NDM3453)*

In 2003, the committee conducted its first review on housing for older people. It is only fitting that this, our final review of the second Assembly, looks at the needs of some of the younger members of our society. Youth homelessness in Wales is a problem that must not be ignored. It affects many of our most vulnerable young people every year. The duty of care that we owe to these young people is great, and I believe that they deserve the very best services that we in Wales can provide for them.

When we started taking evidence for this review in November 2006, we knew that we did not have a lot of time to explore all of the issues surrounding youth homelessness. We quickly realised, however, that the timescale of the review was not going to be a problem—all the witnesses that we heard from were in agreement about the issues; indeed, it soon became clear that many of the issues have been discussed for a long time. Our report focuses on making recommendations based on the evidence that we received, rather than revisiting the issues that have been widely discussed. We have made 29 recommendations to the Welsh Assembly Government, suggesting a way forward for local authorities and the voluntary sector in the areas of prevention, housing, chaotic lifestyles, rural homelessness and benefits.

**Janice Gregory:** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.6 a 9.9 yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio sy'n dwyn y teitl 'Adolygiad ar Ddigartrefedd Ymhlith Pobl Ifanc: "Busnes Pawb, Cyfrifoldeb Neb"' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ionawr 2007. (NDM3453)*

Yn 2003, gwnaeth y pwyllgor ei adolygiad cyntaf o dai i bobl hŷn. Nid yw ond yn briodol, felly, fod hwn, ein hadolygiad terfynol o'r ail Gynulliad, yn edrych ar anghenion rhai o aelodau ifancach ein cymdeithas. Mae digartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn broblem na ellir ei hanwybyddu. Mae'n effeithio bob blwyddyn ar nifer o'n pobl ifanc sydd fwyaf agored i niwed. Mae'r ddyletswydd gofal sy'n ddyledus i'r bobl ifanc hyn yn fawr, a chredaf eu bod yn haeddu'r gwasanaethau gorau posibl y gallwn ni yng Nghymru eu darparu iddynt.

Pan ddechreusom gymryd tystiolaeth ar gyfer yr adolygiad hwn ym mis Tachwedd 2006, gwyddem nad oedd gennym lawer o amser i ystyried pob un o'r materion am ddigartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, sylweddolwyd yn fuan nad oedd amserlen yr adolygiad yn mynd i fod yn broblem—yr oedd yr holl dystion y clywsom ganddynt yn cytuno ar y materion; yn wir, daeth yn amlwg yn fuan fod nifer o'r materion wedi bod yn cael eu trafod ers amser maith. Mae ein hadroddiad yn canolbwyntio ar wneud argymhellion yn seiliedig ar y dystiolaeth a gawsom, yn hytrach nag ailystyried y materion sydd wedi eu trafod yn helaeth. Gwnaethom 29 o argymhellion i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gan awgrymu ffordd ymlaen i awdurdodau lleol a'r sector gwirfoddol ym meysydd atal, tai, ffordd anhrefnus o fyw,

digartrefedd gwledig a budd-daliadau.

Underpinning all of our recommendations is the belief that there should be a joined-up approach to delivering services for homeless young people. Much of the evidence that we received highlighted the fact that, while there are many examples of good practice on service delivery, these are often isolated and fragmented, and lack strategic direction. We make a series of recommendations about how all relevant local authorities and the voluntary sector should work together to provide a strategic framework for delivering services to homeless young people. We believe that homelessness is not just a housing issue and that local authority departments should have a co-ordinated, outcomes-based approach, centred on the often complicated needs of the individual young person.

We feel strongly that one of the most effective ways of dealing with youth homelessness is by tackling the problems at an early stage and focusing on prevention. We welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's focus on prevention in the national homelessness strategy. We feel that the use of the housing options approach, decisions on intentional homelessness and the use of the private rented sector when dealing with people under the age of 25 should be reviewed, and that a more holistic, cross-sectoral approach should be taken. We also feel strongly that potential homelessness needs to be identified at an even earlier stage than indicated in the homelessness strategy. We recommend that a pathways approach is adopted to help young people who are identified at an early age as being potentially vulnerable. This will help to ensure that local authority departments and other agencies help those young people to avoid crisis situations, which may result in their homelessness. This will also give them the best possible chance of leading a fulfilling life in mainstream society.

We received a great deal of evidence regarding the accessibility of suitable housing stock for young people. We also heard about the lack of accommodation for young people when they become homeless. We feel strongly that these needs must be addressed,

Yn sail i'n holl argymhellion mae'r gred y dylid cael dull cydgysylltiedig o ddarparu gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc ddigartref. Yr oedd llawer o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith, er bod nifer o enghreifftiau o arfer da o ran darparu gwasanaethau, eu bod yn enghreifftiau unigol a thameidiog yn aml, heb gyfeiriad strategol. Gwnaethom gyfres o argymhellion ar y ffordd y dylai pob awdurdod lleol a'r sector gwirfoddol gydweithio i gyflwyno fframwaith strategol ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc ddigartref. Yn ein barn ni, nid problem tai yn unig yw digartrefedd, a dylai adrannau awdurdodau lleol fabwysiadu ymagwedd gyd-drefnus ar sail canlyniadau, yn canolbwyntio ar anghenion y person ifanc unigol sy'n aml yn rhai cymhleth.

Teimlwn yn gryf mai un o'r ffyrdd mwyaf effeithiol i ddelio â digartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc yw mynd i'r afael â'r problemau'n gynnar a chanolbwyntio ar eu hatal. Croesawn ffocws Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar atal yn y strategaeth genedlaethol ar ddigartrefedd. Teimlwn y dylai defnyddio'r dull opsiynau tai, penderfyniadau ar ddigartrefedd bwriadol a defnyddio'r sector rhentu preifat wrth ddelio â phobl o dan 25 oed gael ei adolygu, ac y dylid mabwysiadu dull mwy cyfannol ar draws y sectorau. Teimlwn yn gryf hefyd fod angen nodi digartrefedd posibl hyd yn oed yn gynharach nag a awgrymir yn y strategaeth ar ddigartrefedd. Argymhellwn fabwysiadu dull llwybrau i helpu pobl ifanc a nodir yn gynnar fel pobl a all fod yn agored i niwed. Bydd hyn yn helpu sicrhau bod adrannau awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau eraill yn helpu'r bobl ifanc hynny i osgoi sefyllfaoedd argyfyngus, a all arwain at ddigartrefedd. Bydd hyn hefyd yn rhoi'r cyfle gorau posibl iddynt fyw bywyd llawn mewn cymdeithas brif-ffrwd.

Cawsom lawer iawn o dystiolaeth am hygyrchedd stoc tai addas i bobl ifanc. Clywsom hefyd am y prinder llety i bobl ifanc pan gollant eu cartref. Teimlwn yn gryf fod angen mynd i'r afael â'r anghenion hyn, ond sylweddolwn na chaiff y problemau

but realise that the problems will not be solved quickly. We make a series of recommendations aimed not only at ensuring that the existing housing stock available to local authorities is fully utilised and preserved but also that the more immediate needs for short-term accommodation, supported accommodation and move-on accommodation are met.

A theme that seems to run through Assembly committee policy reviews is the effects of the benefits system on vulnerable groups. Our review is no different. We heard disturbing evidence about the inequalities and barriers to homeless young people caused by the benefits system. Not only are they discriminated against for housing benefit because of their age, but they are often prevented from taking on employment and education because of the inequalities in the benefits system. We strongly feel that these discriminatory issues must be addressed and we wholeheartedly support the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration in her representations to the UK Government. We would urge her to continue to work with her colleagues in Westminster to find solutions to the discriminatory elements of the benefits system.

4.10 p.m.

The most disturbing evidence that we received during the review was about the young people themselves. We heard that a large proportion of young homeless people in Wales have been in care, in prison, or, in some cases, both. We were told that young people leaving care are 60 per cent more likely to become homeless than those who have not been in care. We consider it to be completely unacceptable that such vulnerable young people are not fully supported. We also heard many stories of the chaotic lifestyles led by many of these homeless young people, often associated with substance misuse and sexual and financial exploitation, and the patchiness of the support and help available to them. We were impressed by those who work hard to help these most vulnerable young people, but recommend that more facilities, help and support are made available throughout

hynny eu datrys yn gyflym. Gwnawn gyfres o argymhellion wedi eu hanelu at sicrhau nid yn unig bod y stoc tai presennol sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n llawn ac yn cael ei gadw, ond bod anghenion mwy uniongyrchol yn cael eu diwallu ar gyfer llety byrdymor, llety gyda chymorth a llety symud ymlaen.

Un thema sydd i'w gweld yn rhedeg drwy adolygiadau polisi pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad yw effeithiau'r system budd-daliadau ar grwpiau sy'n agored i niwed. Nid yw ein hadolygiad ni yn wahanol. Clywsom dystiolaeth sy'n peri pryder am anghydraddoldebau a rhwystrau i bobl ifanc ddigartref a achosir gan y system fudd-daliadau. Gwahaniaethir yn eu herbyn o ran budd-dal tai oherwydd eu hoedran, a chânt eu hatal yn aml hefyd rhag cymryd swyddi ac addysg oherwydd yr anghydraddoldebau yn y system fudd-daliadau. Teimlwn yn gryf fod yn rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r materion gwahaniaethol hyn, a chefnogwn yn frwd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ei sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU. Byddem yn ei hannog i barhau i weithio gyda'i chyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan i ddod o hyd i atebion i'r elfennau gwahaniaethol y system fudd-daliadau.

Y dystiolaeth a barodd fwyaf o bryder o'r hyn a gafwyd yn ystod yr adolygiad oedd dystiolaeth am y bobl ifanc eu hunain. Clywsom fod cyfran fawr o bobl ifanc ddigartref yng Nghymru wedi bod mewn gofal, yn y carchar, neu, mewn rhai achosion, yn y ddau. Dywedwyd wrthym fod pobl ifanc sy'n gadael gofal 60 y cant yn fwy tebygol o fod yn ddigartref na'r rheini nad ydynt wedi bod mewn gofal. Yn ein barn ni, mae'r ffaith nad yw pobl ifanc felly sy'n agored i niwed yn cael eu cefnogi'n llawn yn hollol annerbyniol. Clywsom lawer o hanesion hefyd am y bywyd anhrefnus y mae llawer o'r bobl ifanc ddigartref hyn yn ei fyw, sy'n aml yn gysylltiedig â chamddefnyddio sylweddau a chamfanteisio'n rhywiol ac yn ariannol arnynt, ac anghysondeb y gefnogaeth a'r cymorth sydd ar gael iddynt. Crëwyd argraff arnom gan y rheini sy'n gweithio'n galed i helpu'r bobl ifanc hyn

Wales.

The conclusions and recommendations in this report were not influenced by party policy, but by belief in the importance of achieving the right outcomes on behalf of the young people of Wales. There was agreement that one of our recommendations should be put forward as the majority, rather than the unanimous, view of the committee, but we were in full agreement on the issues and all other recommendations in the report.

I will conclude by saying that I believe that the committee has again produced a good report. In doing so, it has been greatly assisted by the various organisations and individuals that have made such high-quality and comprehensive presentations; I thank them all most sincerely for that. I very much want to acknowledge the excellent work of the committee clerk, Virginia Hawkins, who was ably assisted by the deputy clerk, Claire Griffiths, and the clerking team, who did sterling work in arranging our meetings, liaising with presenters and generally enabling everything to run smoothly to allow the committee to produce its report. I am grateful to the members of the Assembly's regional committees who took evidence on youth homelessness and whose input into this report has been invaluable. Last, but by no means least, I pay tribute to the work of my fellow Social Justice and Regeneration Committee members, who engaged willingly and wholeheartedly with the review.

We took the title of our review, 'Everyone's Business—No-one's Responsibility', from one of our witnesses, who was describing a particularly harrowing case to us. I am extremely hopeful that, as a result of this review, homeless young people in Wales will become everyone's responsibility as well as everyone's business and that this report will act as a catalyst for action. I am delighted to present this report to Plenary.

**Leanne Wood:** I will start my contribution to this debate by paying tribute to the young homeless people who gave evidence to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's

sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, ond argymhellwn fod mwy o gyfleusterau, help a chefnogaeth ar gael ledled Cymru.

Ni ddylanwadwyd ar y casgliadau na'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn gan bolisi plaid, ond gan gred ym mhwysigrwydd sicrhau'r canlyniadau cywir ar ran pobl ifanc Cymru. Yr oedd cytundeb y dylai un o'n hargymhellion gael ei gyflwyno fel barn y mwyaf, yn hytrach na barn unfrydol y pwyllgor, ond yr oeddem i gyd yn gytûn am y materion a'r holl argymhellion eraill yn yr adroddiad.

Deuaf i ben drwy ddweud fy mod yn credu bod y pwyllgor unwaith eto wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad da. Wrth wneud hynny, mae wedi cael cymorth amryw sefydliadau ac unigolion sydd wedi gwneud cyflwyniadau cynhwysfawr o safon uchel; diolchaf iddynt i gyd yn ddiffuant iawn am hynny. Yr wyf am gydnabod gwaith ardderchog clerc y pwyllgor, Virginia Hawkins, a gafodd ei chynorthwyo'n fedrus gan y dirprwy glerc, Claire Griffiths, a'r tîm clerod a weithiodd yn galed i drefnu ein cyfarfodydd, cysylltu â chyflwynwyr a sicrhau, yn gyffredinol, fod popeth yn rhedeg yn llyfn fel y gallai'r pwyllgor gynhyrchu ei adroddiad. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i aelodau pwyllgorau rhanbarthol y Cynulliad a gymerodd dystiolaeth ar ddiartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc. Yr oedd eu cyfraniad i'r adroddiad hwn yn werthfawr iawn. Yn olaf, ac yn bwysicaf oll, rhof deyrnged i waith fy nghyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, a oedd mor barod a brwdfrydig i ymgymryd â'r adolygiad.

Cawsom deitl ein hadolygiad, 'Busnes Pawb—Cyfrifoldeb Neb', gan un o'n tystion a oedd yn disgrifio achos arbennig o ddirdynnol i ni. Yr wyf yn obeithiol iawn, o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad hwn, y daw pobl ifanc ddiartref yng Nghymru yn gyfrifoldeb i bawb yn ogystal â busnes i bawb, ac y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn sbarduno pobl i weithredu. Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Leanne Wood:** Dechreuaf fy nghyfraniad i'r ddadl hon drwy roi teyrnged i'r bobl ifanc ddiartref a roddodd dystiolaeth i adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac

review. There is no doubt that their evidence has helped to strengthen the recommendations and it also helped members of the committee to understand fully the consequences of homelessness for young people. I have, in the past, been critical of committee reviews that do not involve service users—after all, they are the real experts. The evidence that the service users gave to this review shows the real value of hearing about first-hand experiences.

The report contains a wide range of recommendations, covering good practice, legal issues, benefits issues, funding and housing provision. One of the biggest problems is the lack of affordable housing. We may have hostels and supported youth homeless projects in some areas, but the problem is often the lack of move-on accommodation. Therefore, big investment is needed in social housing, particularly in supported housing, because, without that, homelessness services will always face the problem of being oversubscribed. Vital recommendations, as far as I am concerned, include recommendations 15 and 16, which address the question of intentionality. It is relatively easy for housing departments to find that a young person has made himself or herself intentionally homeless; that means, of course, that the local authority has no obligation to provide housing or support for that young person. If a young person moves into accommodation and it does not work out, they often do not get second chances. We could argue, and I would argue, that because they are children, intentionality should not apply—children should always be given more than one chance.

The Assembly would need legislative powers to change the definition of intentionality. In Scotland, the definition has been changed so that intentionality cannot be applied to people who are under 25. If we could introduce a similar Measure here, it would make a big difference to reducing youth homelessness levels. Obviously, such a Measure would have to come with funding, because we would have to provide homes for these young people to live in. I specifically look forward to hearing the Minister's response to those recommendations in particular next month.

Adfywio. Yn sicr mae eu tystiolaeth wedi helpu cryfhau'r argymhellion a hefyd wedi helpu aelodau'r pwyllgor i ddeall yn llawn ganlyniadau digartrefedd i bobl ifanc. Yn y gorffennol, yr wyf wedi bod yn feirniadol o adolygiadau pwyllgorau nad ydynt yn cynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau—wedi'r cyfan, hwy yw'r arbenigwyr go iawn. Mae'r dystiolaeth a roddodd y defnyddwyr gwasanaethau i'r adolygiad hwn yn dangos mor werthfawr, mewn gwirionedd, yw clywed am brofiadau o lygad y ffynnon.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys ystod eang o argymhellion, yn cwmpasu arfer da, materion cyfreithiol, materion budd-daliadau, cyllid a darpariaeth tai. Un o'r problemau mwyaf yw'r prinder tai fforddiadwy. Gall fod gennym hosteli a phrosiectau tai gyda chymorth i bobl ifanc ddigartref mewn rhai ardaloedd, ond y broblem yn aml yw'r prinder llety symud-ymlaen. Felly, mae angen llawer o fuddsoddi mewn tai cymdeithasol, yn arbennig tai gyda chymorth, oherwydd heb hynny bydd gwasanaethau digartrefedd bob amser yn wynebu'r broblem o gael gormod o bobl yn chwilio am lety. Ymhlith yr argymhellion hollbwysig, o'm rhan i, mae argymhellion 15 ac 16, sy'n mynd i'r afael â mater bwriadoldeb. Mae'n gymharol hawdd i adrannau tai weld bod person ifanc wedi gwneud ei hun yn ddigartref yn fwriadol; mae hynny'n golygu, wrth gwrs, nad yw'n rhaid i'r awdurdod lleol ddarparu cartref neu gymorth i'r person ifanc hwnnw. Os bydd person ifanc yn symud i lety a hynny'n methu, ni chaiff ail gyfle yn aml. Gallem ddadlau, a byddwn yn dadlau, oherwydd mai plant ydynt, na ddylid defnyddio bwriadoldeb—dylid plant bob amser gael mwy nag un cyfle.

Byddai angen pwerau deddfwriaethol ar y Cynulliad i newid diffiniad bwriadoldeb. Yn yr Alban, newidiwyd y diffiniad fel na all bwriadoldeb fod yn berthnasol i bobl dan 25 oed. Pe gallem gyflwyno Mesur tebyg yma, byddai'n gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr wrth ostwng lefelau digartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid. Yn amlwg, byddai'n rhaid cael arian i ategu Mesur o'r fath, oherwydd byddai'n rhaid inni ddarparu cartrefi i'r bobl ifanc hyn fyw ynddynt. Edrychaf ymlaen yn arbennig at glywed ymateb y Gweinidog i'r argymhellion hynny yn benodol fis nesaf.

The Assembly lacks the powers that it needs to transform young homeless people's experience. Specifically, radical changes need to be made to the benefits system and, in particular, the single room rent should be abolished. The single room rent is a discriminatory policy, as it discriminates directly against young people. It is disappointing to note that the Department for Work and Pensions has no plans to change the rules on this at the moment. I hope that the Minister will do all that she can to press for reform on this issue. We heard how difficult it is for young people to avoid homelessness while this rule is in place—it has to go, or, at the very least, its effects must be reduced.

The recommendations outline in this report will make a real difference if they are implemented and funded in full. That is the challenge for the Assembly. There is no doubt that young homeless people in Wales deserve better help and support than they get at the moment. Most importantly, strategies need to be in place to prevent homelessness among young people. That is the challenge, and I sincerely hope that this Assembly and the next Assembly rise to it.

**Trish Law:** As the committee's newest member, I can hardly take credit for this review; but credit it deserves. I give due credit to Janice Gregory and other colleagues who serve on the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee for their diligence and commitment to this review. It is a thorough review that fully acknowledges the wide range and scale of homelessness problems encountered by young people and support agencies. The overriding message that struck me when I read this report was that there is a need to identify young homeless people and to provide the help that is so essential to them—without it, they face a most uncertain future. One of the most disturbing features of the review is that the true extent of the problem of youth homelessness is unknown. Many voluntary organisations suggested that the real figure could be at least twice the official figure due to what is termed as the 'hidden homeless'—that is, young people who, for one reason or another, do not appear in the official

Nid oes gan y Cynulliad y pŵer angenrheidiol i drawsnewid profiad pobl ifanc ddigartref. Yn benodol, mae angen newidiadau radical yn y system fudd-daliadau, ac yn arbennig dylid diddymu'r rhent ystafell sengl. Mae'r rhent ystafell sengl yn bolisi gwahaniaethol, ac mae'n gwahaniaethu'n uniongyrchol yn erbyn pobl ifanc. Mae'n siomedig sylwi nad oes gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau gynlluniau i newid y rheolau o ran hyn ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithio y gwnaiff y Gweinidog bopeth posibl i bwysu am ddiwygiadau yn hyn. Clywsom mor anodd ydyw i bobl ifanc osgoi digartrefedd tra mae'r rheol hon ar waith—rheid iddi fynd, neu o leiaf rhaid lleihau ei heffeithiau.

Bydd yr argymhellion a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol os cânt eu gweithredu a'u hariannu'n llawn. Dyna'r her i'r Cynulliad. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw pobl ifanc ddigartref yng Nghymru yn haeddu help a chefnogaeth well nag a gânt ar hyn o bryd. Yn anad dim, mae angen rhoi strategaethau ar waith i atal digartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc. Dyna'r her, a gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad hwn a'r Cynulliad nesaf yn ymateb iddi.

**Trish Law:** Fel aelod mwyaf newydd y pwyllgor, prin y gallaf hawlio clod am yr adolygiad hwn; ond mae'n haeddu clod. Hoffwn ganmol Janice Gregory a chyd-Aelodau eraill sy'n gwasanaethu ar y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am eu diwydrwydd a'u hymrwymiad i'r adolygiad hwn. Mae'n adolygiad trylwyr sy'n llwyr gydnabod yr amrywiaeth eang o broblemau digartrefedd sy'n wynebu pobl ifanc ac asiantaethau cymorth, a graddau'r problemau hynny. Y neges bwysicaf a'm tarodd pan ddarllenais yr adroddiad hwn oedd bod angen nodi pobl ifanc ddigartref a rhoi'r help hanfodol hwnnw iddynt-hebdo, maent yn wynebu dyfodol ansicr iawn. Un o nodweddion mwyaf ysgytwol yr adolygiad yw nad yw maint gwirioneddol y broblem ddigartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid yn hysbys. Awgryma nifer o sefydliadau gwirfoddol y gallai'r ffigur gwirioneddol fod o leiaf ddwywaith y ffigur swyddogol oherwydd yr hyn a elwir yn 'ddigartrefedd cudd'-hynny yw, pobl ifanc



statistics.

According to the 2006 'Statistical Focus on Social Justice in Wales', the local authority area with the smallest homelessness problem is Blaenau Gwent. I must confess that, when Blaenau Gwent comes out at or near the top of almost every index of deprivation, it was a joy to see Blaenau Gwent at the bottom of the table with just 3.3 per 1,000 households deemed to be unintentionally homeless. However, in talking to officials of Cardiff Action for Single Homeless during a sleep-out that I took part in on the streets of Cardiff in December, it became evident that a good many homeless people from Blaenau Gwent and other Valleys communities resort to Cardiff and Newport in the belief that they will have a better chance of getting food and shelter there. Often, there is no contact with the local council, so these people never appear in official statistics.

It is evident from the review that many young people either do not know what to do when they become homeless or they have little faith in their local council. The committee heard evidence of young people having to wait up to four hours before they were even seen at council offices. Committee members were shocked to learn that only one of a group of homeless young people in south Wales knew to go to the council on becoming homeless. Many voluntary sector organisations gave evidence that the level and quality of service provided by councils across Wales varied widely and was patchy and inconsistent.

Several of the review's two dozen or so recommendations are positive in that they strive to ensure that young homeless people do not slip through the net, and that there is adequate provision for them in terms of accommodation, financial resources and other practical help. I found it disturbing to hear of one witness who researched some literature on youth homelessness to try to find something new to say to the committee. She was shocked to find that all the issues that she recognised today had been raised more

nad ydynt yn ymddangos yn yr ystadegau swyddogol, am ba reswm bynnag.

Yn ôl 'Ffocws Ystadegol ar Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru' 2006, yr ardal awdurdod lleol sydd â'r broblem digartrefedd leiaf yw Blaenau Gwent. Rhaid imi gyfaddef, gan fod Blaenau Gwent yn ymddangos ar frig neu yn agos at frig bron pob mynegai amddifadedd, yr oedd yn bleser gweld Blaenau Gwent ar waelod y tabl sy'n dweud mai dim ond 3.3 am bob 1,000 o deuluoedd sy'n ddigartref yn anfwriadol. Fodd bynnag, wrth siarad â swyddogion Gweithredu Caerdydd dros y Sengl Digartref yn ystod noson o gysgu ar y stryd y cymerais ran ynddi yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Rhagfyr, daeth yn amlwg bod nifer o bobl ddigartref o Flaenau Gwent a chymunedau eraill yn y Cymoedd yn mynd i Gaerdydd a Chasnewydd gan gredu y bydd ganddynt siawns well o gael bwyd a lloches yno. Yn aml nid oes cysylltiad â'r cyngor lleol, felly, nid yw'r bobl hyn byth yn ymddangos mewn ystadegau swyddogol.

Mae'n amlwg o'r adolygiad nad yw nifer o bobl ifanc yn gwybod beth i'w wneud pan gânt eu hunain yn ddigartref, neu nad oes ganddynt lawer o ffydd yn eu cyngor lleol. Clywodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth fod pobl ifanc yn gorfod aros hyd at bedair awr cyn cael eu gweld hyd yn oed mewn swyddfeydd cyngor. Synnwyd aelodau'r pwyllgor o glywed mai un o grŵp yn unig o bobl ifanc ddigartref yn y de a wyddai y dylent fynd at y cyngor ar ôl colli eu cartref. Rhoddodd nifer o sefydliadau'r sector gwirfoddol dystiolaeth bod lefel ac ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir gan gynghorau ledled Cymru yn amrywio'n sylweddol a'i fod yn fratiog ac anghyson.

Mae nifer un pedwar ar hugain fwy neu lai o argymhellion yn gadarnhaol gan eu bod yn ceisio sicrhau na fydd pobl ifanc ddigartref yn llithro drwy'r rhwyd, a bod darpariaeth ddigonol iddynt o ran llety, adnoddau ariannol a help ymarferol arall. Yr oedd yn boenus clywed hanes un tyst a ymchwiliodd i lenyddiaeth ar ddigartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid i geisio dod o hyd i rywbeth newydd i'w ddweud wrth y pwyllgor. Fe'i synnwyd o ddeall bod yr holl faterion a nododd heddiw wedi'u codi fwy na 10

than 10 years ago. I echo the words of Janice Gregory who, in the introduction to the report, expresses the hope that,

4.20 p.m.

‘10 years from now, homeless young people in Wales will have the level and quality of help and support that they deserve.’

**Mark Isherwood:** I thank the Chair, and the committee staff, for their hard work in producing this report. Youth homelessness in Wales is a serious social problem. Voluntary organisations state that hidden homelessness could double the Assembly Government’s homelessness figures. When we met a group of homeless young people in Old Colwyn, they told us that there was a massive shortage of affordable accommodation, and that must be the key message from this report. They asked, ‘Where are we to go?’.

The report is right to state that,

‘There appears to be no co-ordinated approach to identifying these young people as potentially vulnerable before they present as homeless’.

As the young people in north Wales told us, mediation and early intervention are needed at an earlier stage; we need to go into schools and work with families before people become homeless at 16 plus.

Several voluntary organisations, including Shelter Cymru, expressed concern that many homeless or potentially homeless people were,

‘not being included in the homeless statistics and are being dealt with outside the formal homelessness structures.’

The Welsh Assembly Government should therefore revise its homelessness strategy accordingly. As the report states, it should also,

‘work closely with private landlords’.

mlynedd yn ôl. Ategaf eiriau Janice Gregory, sydd, wrth gyflwyno’r adroddiad, yn mynegi’r gobaith,

‘ymhen 10 mlynedd, y bydd y cymorth a’r gefnogaeth y mae pobl ifanc ddigartref yng Nghymru yn ei gael, o’r lefel a’r ansawdd y maent yn eu haeddu.’

**Mark Isherwood:** Hoffwn ddiolch i’r Cadeirydd, a staff y pwyllgor, am eu gwaith caled yn llunio’r adroddiad hwn. Mae digartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid yn broblem gymdeithasol ddirifol yng Nghymru. Dywed sefydliadau gwirfoddol y gallai digartrefedd cudd ddyblu ffigur digartrefedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Pan gawsom gyfarfod gyda grŵp o bobl ifanc ddigartref yn Hen Golwyn, dywedwyd wrthym fod prinder dirifol o lety fforddiadwy, a rhaid i hynny fod yn un o brif negeseuon yr adroddiad hwn. Gofynnent inni, ‘I ble yr ydym i fynd?’

Mae’r adroddiad yn dweud yn gywir ddigon,

‘Ymddengys nad oes unrhyw dulliau cydgysylltiedig yn cael eu defnyddio i nodi’r bobl hyn fel pobl a allai fod yn agored i niwed, cyn iddynt eu cyflwyno’u hunain yn ddigartref.’

Fel y dywedodd y bobl ifanc yn y gogledd wrthym, mae angen cyfryngu ac ymyrryd yn gynharach; mae angen inni fynd i ysgolion a gweithio gyda theuluoedd cyn i bobl fynd yn ddigartref yn 16 oed a hŷn.

Mynegwyd pryder gan nifer o sefydliadau gwirfoddol, gan gynnwys Shelter Cymru, nad yw nifer o bobl ddigartref neu bobl a allai fynd yn ddigartref,

‘yn cael eu cynnwys yn yr ystadegau digartrefedd ac na ddefnyddir y strwythurau ffurfiol ar gyfer y digartref i ddelio â nhw.’

Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, felly, adolygu ei strategaeth ar ddigartrefedd yn unol â hynny. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, dylai hefyd,

‘weithio’n agos gyda landlordiaid preifat’.

Organisations such as GISDA in north Wales offer supported housing and support for young people in private rented housing and, by acting as the middleman, they remove the risk for private landlords.

The committee learned of increasing numbers of homeless applicants being deemed intentionally homeless, and as Barnardo's Cymru suggested,

'the term intentionality should not be used for young and vulnerable people who were often not aware of the consequences of their actions.'

The Assembly Government must therefore seek powers that will enable local authorities to help intentionally homeless people, as happens in Scotland, and introduce an equivalent of the Scottish secure tenancy.

The committee heard about the lack of provision of night shelters, hostels, supported housing, and move-on accommodation, with hostels and supported housing becoming jammed with people who wish to move into suitable move-on accommodation, but cannot.

The young people in north Wales highlighted for us one example of good supported housing, but when I had visited it the previous month, I had been told that it would not survive without more money being put into the pot for Supporting People. However, last month the Assembly Government cut the Supporting People revenue grant in real terms.

We cannot support the wording of recommendation 17, concerning the suspension of the right-to-buy scheme in Wales. We know that the committee has good intentions, but independent academic research confirms that simply stopping the right to buy in high-demand areas will have little or no immediate effect on re-let levels in those areas. Ending the right to buy would provide, on average, a new letting 10 or more years hence. By contrast, investment in new dwellings provides lettings from the day that they are completed, and the need is immediate. As figures from the Members' research service confirm, the number of new

Mae sefydliadau fel GISDA yn y gogledd yn cynnig cefnogaeth a thai gyda chymorth i bobl ifanc mewn tai rhent preifat, a thrwy fod yn gyfryngwr maent yn dileu'r risg i landlordiaid preifat.

Clywodd y pwyllgor am nifer cynyddol o ymgeiswyr digartref y credir eu bod yn ddigartref yn fwriadol, ac awgrymodd Barnardo's Cymru,

'na ddylid defnyddio'r term 'bwriadol' ar gyfer pobl ifanc sy'n agored i niwed ac nad ydynt bob amser yn sylweddoli beth fydd canlyniadau'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud.'

Felly, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad geisio pwerau a fydd yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i helpu pobl sy'n ddigartref yn fwriadol, fel sy'n digwydd yn yr Alban, a chyflwyno cynllun tebyg i denantiaeth ddiogel yr Alban.

Clywodd y pwyllgor am ddiffyg darpariaeth llochesi nos, hosteli, tai gyda chymorth, a llety symud ymlaen, gyda hosteli a thai gyda chymorth yn llawn bobl sy'n dymuno symud i lety symud-ymlaen addas, ond na allant wneud hynny.

Tynnodd pobl ifanc yn y gogledd ein sylw at un enghraifft o dai da gyda chymorth, ond pan euthum yno fis cyn hynny, dywedwyd wrthyf na fyddai'n parhau oni bai bod mwy o arian yn cael ei roi yn y gronfa Cefnogi Pobl. Fodd bynnag, y mis diwethaf torrodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y grant refeniw Cefnogi Pobl mewn termau real.

Ni allwn gefnogi geiriad argymhelliad 17, sy'n ymwneud ag atal y cynllun hawl i brynu yng Nghymru. Gwyddom fod gan y pwyllgor fwriadau da, ond mae ymchwil academiaidd annibynnol yn cadarnhau na fydd dod â'r hawl i brynu i ben mewn ardaloedd lle mae llawer o alw yn cael llawer o effaith, os o gwbl, ar lefelau ailosod yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Byddai dod â'r hawl i brynu i ben yn darparu tŷ i'w osod ar gyfartaledd ymhen 10 mlynedd neu fwy. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae buddsoddi mewn anheddau newydd yn darparu tai i'w gosod o'r diwrnod y cânt eu cwblhau, ac mae'r angen yn uniongyrchol. Fel y mae ffigurau gan y gwasanaeth

dwellings built by councils and housing associations fell from 17,400 between 1993 and 1997 to just 4,400 during the first six years of devolution. According to Welsh Assembly Government housing statistics, 500 completions by housing associations in 2004 contrasts with an annual average of 2,600 between 1990 and 1997.

As recommendation 18 states, local authorities should ensure that any stock transfer agreements include a contractual obligation to provide housing for vulnerable groups. As a member of a Merseyside housing association, I attended its board dinner last Friday, and I refer you to the choice-based letting system administered by the local authority there.

The Assembly Government must review its policy for care leavers; adopt the model designed by the National Association for the Care and Resettlement of Offenders; tackle Nimbyism; address the problems of homelessness in rural areas; and above all, work with the Department for Work and Pensions to address the anomalies in the benefits system that penalise homeless people under 25 and force them to give up the prospect of employment or a place in college.

**Peter Black:** I welcome this report from the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. It is a valuable contribution to the debate. A number of Members have commented that the issues and the evidence seem familiar, because the issues have been around for a long time. I certainly remember that, when I chaired the homelessness commission as a Deputy Minister, a lot of the issues in this report came before us. One of those issues in particular was around the single room rent restriction. I remember that the commission got a civil servant from Whitehall to give evidence to us on that issue. When we asked him why the Government was discriminating against people under 25 years of age in terms of the benefits that they were entitled to, he replied, 'We do that to encourage them to stay with their families'.

ymchwil i Aelodau yn ei gadarnhau, gostyngodd nifer yr anheddau newydd a adeiladwyd gan gynghorau a chymdeithasau tai o 17,400 rhwng 1993 ac 1997 i ddim ond 4,400 yn ystod y chwe blynedd cyntaf ers datganoli. Yn ôl ystadegau tai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gellir cymharu 500 o dai a gwblhawyd gan gymdeithasau tai yn 2004 â'r cyfartaledd blynyddol o 2,600 rhwng 1990 a 1997.

Fel y dywed argymhelliad 18, dylai awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod unrhyw gytundebau trosglwyddo stoc yn cynnwys rhwymedigaeth gytundebol i ddarparu tai i grwpiau sy'n agored i niwed. Fel aelod o gymdeithas tai ar Lannau Mersi, bûm yn ei chinio bwrdd ddydd Gwener diwethaf, a hoffwn eich cyfeirio at y system gosod tai ar sail dewis a weinyddir gan yr awdurdod lleol yno.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad adolygu ei pholisi ar gyfer pobl sy'n gadael gofal; mabwysiadu'r model a gynlluniwyd gan y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Gofal ac Adsefydlu Troseddwyr; mynd i'r afael â'r ymagwedd 'nid ar garreg ein drws ni'; mynd i'r afael â phroblemau digartrefedd mewn ardaloedd gweledig; ac yn bwysicaf oll, gweithio gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i fynd i'r afael ag anghysondebau yn y system fudd-daliadau sy'n cosbi pobl ddigartref o dan 25 oed ac yn eu gorfodi i roi'r gorau i'r cyfle i gael swydd neu le mewn coleg.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Mae'n gyfraniad gwerthfawr i'r ddatl. Mae nifer o Aelodau wedi dweud bod y problemau a'r dystiolaeth yn ymddangos yn gyfarwydd, gan fod y problemau wedi bodoli ers cryn amser. Yr wyf yn sicr yn cofio, pan oeddwn yn cadeirio'r comisiwn digartrefedd fel Dirprwy Weinidog, fod nifer o'r problemau yn yr adroddiad hwn wedi codi. Yr oedd un o'r problemau hynny'n benodol yn ymwneud â'r cyfyngiad rhent ystafell sengl. Cofiaf i'r comisiwn gael gwas sifil o Whitehall i roi tystiolaeth inni ar y mater hwnnw. Pan ofynnwyd iddo pam y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn pobl o dan 25 oed o ran y budd-daliadau yr oedd ganddynt hawl i'w cael, atebodd, 'Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny i'w hannog i aros gyda'u

teuluoedd’.

The manifestation of that statement is that it does not take account of the fact that families sometimes break down; that young people often leave home because they are fleeing from domestic violence or abuse; and that young people also have other problems in terms of drug, alcohol or other substance misuse, and as a result, end up on the streets, without a home. Clearly, the Government is living in some sort of cocooned environment, where it does not recognise the reality of what it is like to be a young person in today’s society, and what it is like to be a young person who is estranged from the family, suffering major problems—not just physical health problems, but sometimes mental health problems too—and as a result, is on the street. This has to be driven home to the Government. If it means that the Assembly Government has to pick up the cudgels and provide some form of subsidy until the Government gets its act together, as is recommended in this report, then that is what should be done.

In terms of the need for specialist accommodation, in Swansea, we have a good example of that sort of specialist accommodation in Drws Agored, which is a hostel or accommodation for young people who find themselves without a home. The problem that we found in Swansea is that that is now full; therefore we are looking to build a second facility. That reflects the growth in youth homelessness over the last few years. A number of young people have found themselves needing this sort of help and support. There is a need for more resources to be put into that sort of accommodation. Also, local homelessness strategies need to recognise that fact and factor it into their financial planning so that that accommodation can be provided.

We need to phase out bed-and-breakfast accommodation altogether for this age group. In my view, it is a particular danger to young people to be in bed-and-breakfast accommodation. Not only because of the access to alcohol and other substances, but also because you never know who else is in that accommodation with you.

Nid yw’r datganiad hwnnw’n ystyried y ffaith bod teuluoedd yn chwalu weithiau; bod pobl ifanc yn aml yn gadael cartref am eu bod yn dianc rhag trais neu gam-drin yn y cartref; a bod gan bobl ifanc hefyd broblemau eraill o ran camddefnyddio cyffuriau, alcohol neu sylweddau eraill, ac o ganlyniad, eu bod yn eu cael eu hunain ar y stryd, heb gartref. Mae’n amlwg bod y Llywodraeth yn byw mewn rhyw fath o amgylchedd cocŵn, lle nad yw’n cydnabod realiti beth yw bod yn berson ifanc yn y gymdeithas sydd ohoni, a beth yw bod yn berson ifanc sydd wedi’i ddieithrio oddi wrth y teulu, sydd â phroblemau mawr—problemau iechyd meddwl weithiau yn ogystal â phroblemau iechyd corfforol—ac sydd ar y stryd o ganlyniad i hynny. Rhaid tynnu sylw’r Llywodraeth at hyn. Os yw’n golygu bod rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd yr awenau a darparu rhyw fath o gymhorthdal nes i’r Llywodraeth benderfynu beth i’w wneud, fel yr argymhellir yn yr adroddiad hwn, yna dyna y dylid ei wneud.

O ran yr angen am lety arbenigol, yn Abertawe mae gennym enghraifft dda o’r math hwnnw o lety arbenigol yn Drws Agored, sef hostel neu lety i bobl ifanc ddigartref. Y broblem a welsom yn Abertawe yw bod y cyfleuster hwn bellach yn llawn; felly, mae angen adeiladu ail gyfleuster. Mae hynny’n adlewyrchu’r chynnydd mewn digartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae angen y math hwn o help a chymorth ar nifer o bobl ifanc. Mae angen buddsoddi adnoddau yn y math hwn o lety. Hefyd, mae angen i strategaethau digartrefedd lleol gydnabod hynny a’i gynnwys yn eu cynlluniau ariannol fel y gellir darparu’r llety hwnnw.

Mae angen inni roi’r gorau i’r arfer o osod y grŵp oedran hwn mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Yn fy marn i, mae’n arbennig o beryglus i bobl ifanc fod mewn llety gwely a brecwast, oherwydd na wyddoch pwy arall sydd yn y llety hwnnw gyda chi ac oherwydd bod alcohol a sylweddau eraill ar gael yn hawdd.

Finally, many local authorities are concerned by the cuts that the Treasury is imposing on the Supporting People revenue grant. There will be problems in implementing the recommendations of this review unless the money from that grant is adequate to enable the support to be provided to help young people.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I also thank the chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee and all those who have given evidence to this report. Contributions, such as that made by Peter Black, have added to this debate and highlight the serious need for us to do something now.

Homelessness affects all groups and ages. Worryingly, we have seen increasing levels of homelessness in Wales during recent years. In 2004, official homelessness reached its highest level since records began in 1978. Since devolution, the Assembly Government has, to a large extent, failed to tackle homelessness. I hope that this report will highlight the need for this Government to take action now.

I concur with all that has already been said by the Chair of the committee and other Members. I am sure that Members will agree that youth homelessness is a problem that must not be ignored. We must look to work with Westminster and to the Scottish model to ensure that we solve this problem.

Affordable housing is the biggest cause of homelessness. House prices have become ridiculously high. It cannot be doubted that high ratios of house and accommodation costs to wages play a big part in this problem. In certain areas of my constituency, such as Caerphilly, Ebbw Vale, Merthyr Tydfil, Newport and Pontypool, average house prices have risen by a massive 20 per cent. That is why we need, as a priority, to create more affordable housing.

In the meantime, we should look to address the complete lack of short and long-term accommodation that is available to young homeless people, which is more acutely felt

Yn olaf, mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn pryderu am y toriadau y mae'r Trysorlys yn eu gwneud yn y grant refeniw Cefnogi Pobl. Bydd problemau gyda'r broses o weithredu argymhellion yr adolygiad hwn oni fydd yr arian o'r grant hwnnw'n ddigonol i alluogi darparu'r cymorth i helpu pobl ifanc.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio a phob un sydd wedi rhoi tystiolaeth ar gyfer yr adroddiad hwn. Mae cyfraniadau, fel y rhai a wnaed gan Peter Black, wedi ychwanegu at y ddadl hon ac maent yn tynnu sylw at yr angen difrifol inni wneud rhywbeth yn awr.

Mae digartrefedd yn effeithio ar bob grŵp a phob oed. Yn anffodus, gwelwyd cynnydd yn lefel y digartrefedd yng Nghymru yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yn 2004, cyrhaeddodd digartrefedd swyddogol ei lefel uchaf ers dechrau'r cofnodion yn 1978. Ers datganoli, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, i raddau helaeth, wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd. Gobeithio y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod angen i'r Llywodraeth hon weithredu'n awr.

Cytunaf â phopeth a ddywedwyd gan Gadeirydd y pwyllgor ac Aelodau eraill. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau'n cytuno bod digartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid yn broblem y mae'n rhaid peidio â'i hanwybyddu. Rhaid inni geisio gweithio gyda San Steffan a dilyn model yr Alban i sicrhau ein bod yn datrys y broblem hon.

Diffyg tai fforddiadwy yw un o brif achosion digartrefedd. Mae prisiau tai wedi codi'n chwerthinllyd o uchel. Ni ellir amau nad yw cymarebau uchel rhwng prisiau tai a llety a chyflogau yn rhan fawr o'r broblem hon. Mewn rhai ardaloedd yn fy etholaeth i fel Caerffili, Glynebwy, Merthyr Tudful, Casnewydd a Phont-y-pŵl, mae prisiau tai wedi codi 20 y cant ar gyfartaledd. Dyna pam mae angen inni greu mwy o dai fforddiadwy fel blaenoriaeth.

Yn y cyfamser, dylem geisio mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg llety tymor byr a thymor hir sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc ddigartref, sy'n broblem fwy difrifol mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'n

in rural areas. It is completely unacceptable that people who find themselves without a roof over their heads these days have nowhere to go. This lack of sheltered accommodation needs to be focused on. We need to ensure that young homeless people have adequate services available to them. The fact that young people do not have homes often means that they cannot be registered with a GP, for example.

4.30 p.m.

The report recommends that the Welsh Assembly Government work with rural local authorities and the voluntary sector to address the problems of homelessness in rural areas. I very much welcome that recommendation, and I hope that the proposals to tackle the issue are swiftly implemented.

We also need to look into why people become homeless in the first place: is it a lack of affordable housing, drug and alcohol problems, or family issues with sexual orientation? Peter Black was quite right when he picked up on this issue, and he recognised the ignorance that surrounds the reasons why people become homeless in the first place. We need to tackle these problems and ensure that there is enough information out there to try to prevent homelessness in the first place. We need to ensure that local authorities can offer the best advice and solutions for young people who have become homeless. We need to look into the barrier of intentional homelessness, and review the need for it.

Education also has a big role to play. In schools, it would be useful if children and young people were taught about finance, getting on the housing ladder, and debt management. Information on what to do if someone becomes homeless also needs to be widely available.

Tackling youth homelessness calls for us all to work together. Joined-up thinking and working is the only way forward. There are examples of best practice out there in some local authority areas, which we recognised in committee. Let us use those, and, hand in hand with the Westminster Government, do

hollol annerbyniol nad oes gan bobl ddigartref unman i fynd y dyddiau hyn. Mae angen canolbwyntio ar y diffyg llety lloches hwn. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod digon o wasanaethau ar gael i bobl ifanc ddigartref. Mae'r ffaith nad oes gan bobl ifanc gartrefi yn aml yn golygu na allant gofrestru gyda meddyg teulu, er enghraifft.

Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol gwledig a'r sector gwirfoddol i ymdrin â phroblemau sy'n ymwneud â digartrefedd mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Croesawaf yr argymhelliad hwnnw yn fawr, gan obeithio y caiff y cynigion i fynd i'r afael â'r mater eu rhoi ar waith yn fuan.

Mae angen inni hefyd ystyried pam mae pobl yn mynd yn ddigartref yn y lle cyntaf: ai diffyg tai fforddiadwy, problemau gyda chyffuriau ac alcohol, neu broblemau teuluol gyda thueddfryd rhywiol? Yr oedd Peter Black yn llygad ei le wrth nodi'r mater hwn, a chydabu'r anwybodaeth am y rhesymau pam y mae pobl yn ddigartref yn y lle cyntaf. Mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn a sicrhau bod digon o wybodaeth ar gael i geisio atal digartrefedd yn y lle cyntaf. Mae angen inni sicrhau y gall awdurdodau lleol gynnig y cyngor a'r atebion gorau i bobl ifanc sy'n ddigartref. Mae angen inni ymchwilio i rwystr digartrefedd bwriadol, a thynnu sylw at yr angen amdano.

Mae gan addysg ran fawr i'w chwarae hefyd. Mewn ysgolion, byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bae plant a phobl ifanc yn cael eu dysgu am gyllid, cael troed ar yr ysgol dai, a rheoli dyledion. Yn ogystal, mae angen sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael am yr hyn y dylid ei wneud os bydd rhywun yn colli ei gartref.

Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd, mae angen i bob un ohonom gydweithio. Ffordd o feddwl a gweithio cydgysylltiedig yw'r unig ffordd ymlaen. Mae enghreifftiau o arfer gorau yn ardaloedd rhai awdurdodau lleol, a gydnabuwyd gennym yn y pwyllgor. Gadewch inni eu defnyddio a gweithredu,

something about this serious issue that young people face.

**Mick Bates:** I congratulate all those concerned in running the committee's review on youth homelessness, including the staff and those who gave evidence, including people who had found themselves homeless and those agencies and voluntary organisations who work so tirelessly to resolve issues of homelessness. It was one of the most frustrating reviews I have ever sat through, because gathering the evidence was confirmation only of the inability of successive Governments to solve the problem. One of the clear facts that came through was the need for still closer and more effective joint working between all agencies and voluntary organisations. I am aware that part of the Beecham report emphasises that aspect, but the process of gathering the evidence exposed our inability as politicians to direct agencies to be in the same premises as homeless people, so that they can quickly establish the needs of an individual. Throughout the process of gathering evidence, the homeless people we met were often young care leavers; they were known to social services departments, but not to housing or education departments. We must ensure that the data are available to all.

Interdisciplinary working is the key to this, because one of the key issues is ensuring early intervention and mediation. Time and again, it has been shown that the staff of our agencies have the skills to prevent problems from occurring later. Within that, providing early support to individuals to allow personal development, so that they can be almost at ease in their family environment, would stop them from wanting to escape, and that is the key to this. Individuals can often have limited skills. Their chances of employment are often limited by their life experiences, and we need to ensure that their support plans are integrated to ensure that they can become independent.

The lack of affordable accommodation is also

law yn llaw â Llywodraeth San Steffan, ar y mater difrifol hwn sy'n wynebu pobl ifanc.

**Mick Bates:** Hoffwn longyfarch pawb a fu'n ymwneud â chynnal adolygiad y pwyllgor ar ddigartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid, gan gynnwys y staff a'r rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth, gan gynnwys pobl a oedd wedi cael eu hunain yn ddigartref, a'r asiantaethau a'r sefydliadau gwirfoddol hynny sy'n gweithio mor ddiwyd i ddatrys problemau digartrefedd. Yr oedd yn un o'r adolygiadau mwyaf rhwystredig y bûm yn rhan ohono erioed, gan mai'r cyfan a wnaeth y broses o gasglu dystiolaeth oedd cadarnhau anallu Llywodraethau dilynol i ddatrys y broblem. Un o'r ffeithiau clir a ddaeth i'r amlwg oedd yr angen am gydweithio agosach, mwy effeithiol rhwng yr holl asiantaethau a'r sefydliadau gwirfoddol. Gwn fod rhan o adroddiad Beecham yn pwysleisio'r agwedd honno, ond yr oedd y broses o gasglu dystiolaeth yn tynnu sylw at ein hanallu fel gwleidyddion i roi cyfarwyddyd i asiantaethau fod yn yr un adeiladau â phobl ddigartref, er mwyn iddynt allu nodi anghenion unigolyn yn gyflym. Drwy gydol y broses o gasglu dystiolaeth, pobl ifanc a oedd wedi gadael gofal oedd y bobl ddigartref y cyfarfuom â hwy; yr oeddent yn hysbys i adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond nid oeddent yn hysbys i adrannau tai nac addysg. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y data ar gael i bawb.

Mae gwaith rhyngddisgyblaethol yn allweddol yn hyn, gan mai un o'r materion allweddol yw sicrhau ymyriad a chyfyngu cynnar. Dro ar ôl tro, dangoswyd bod staff ein hasiantaethau yn meddu ar y sgiliau i atal problemau rhag digwydd yn ddiweddarach. O fewn hynny, byddai rhoi cymorth cynnar i unigolion i'w galluogi i ddatblygu'n bersonol, er mwyn iddynt deimlo'n gyfforddus yn eu hamgylchedd teuluol, yn atal eu dymuniad i ddiac, ac mae hynny'n allweddol yn hyn. Yn aml, ychydig sgiliau sydd gan unigolion. Mae eu cyfle i gael gwaith yn aml wedi'i gyfyngu gan eu profiadau bywyd, ac mae angen inni sicrhau y caiff eu cynlluniau cymorth eu hintegreiddio er mwyn sicrhau y gallant fod yn annibynnol.

Mae diffyg llety fforddiadwy hefyd yn ffactor



a massive factor, whether it is rented in the private sector or provided by councils. While two committee members did not vote in favour of the recommendation on relieving the right to buy, I believe that it is an essential part of any strategy to reduce youth homelessness. I hope that the Minister reiterates her position that there must be a suspension of the right to buy, where necessary. New accommodation must also be built. Single apartments are needed, and, if they could be under the control of community land trusts or communities, that would be an added benefit.

Following this report, I hope that the next Assembly will move forward to ensure that this is no longer an issue to be discussed by the successor to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in the next Assembly, or the one after that, but rather the beginning of the end of youth homelessness in Wales.

**Sandy Mewies:** Much of what I was going to say has already been said, which shows the degree of consensus in committee on this issue. We need to note many important points, and the recommendations represent those, but there are also themes that must be recognised. Trish Law raised a point in committee that I made when I was chair of social services, some years ago now. Young people shared with us the very same problems in committee, during the evidence-taking session, and it is shocking to realise that that is still going on. I could not agree more with Mick. We need to do something about this, and I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government takes these recommendations on board, so that these young people, who gave us our evidence, can see that the effort of doing so—and it was an effort for some people—was worth while.

I was concerned to hear the young people whom Mark Isherwood and I met in north Wales say that although they had often attended such meetings over the years, they had never received any feedback. Mark and I were concerned that they should get that feedback, so we both copied our responses to

sylweddol, boed ar rent yn y sector preifat neu wedi'i ddarparu gan gynghorau. Er na phleidleisiodd dau aelod o'r pwyllgor o blaid yr argymhelliad ar atal yr hawl i brynu, credaf ei fod yn rhan bwysig o unrhyw strategaeth i leihau digartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid. Gobeithio bod y Gweinidog yn ailadrodd ei safbwynt bod yn rhaid atal yr hawl i brynu, lle mae angen. Rhaid darparu llety byw newydd hefyd. Mae angen fflatiau unigol, a phe gellid sicrhau eu bod o dan reolaeth ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol neu gymunedau, byddai hynny'n fantais ychwanegol.

Yn dilyn yr adroddiad hwn, gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad nesaf yn symud ymlaen i sicrhau na fydd y mater hwn bellach yn fater i'w drafod gan olynydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn y Cynulliad nesaf, na'r Cynulliad wedi hynny, ond yn hytrach mai dyma fydd dechrau diwedd digartrefedd ymhlith ieuenctid yng Nghymru.

**Sandy Mewies:** Mae llawer o'r hyn yr oeddwn wedi bwriadu ei ddweud wedi'i ddweud eisoes, sy'n dangos graddau'r cytundeb a fu yn y pwyllgor ar y mater hwn. Mae angen inni sylwi ar nifer o bwyntiau pwysig, ac mae'r argymhellion yn eu cynrychioli, ond mae yna themâu hefyd y mae'n rhaid eu cydnabod. Cododd Trish Law bwynt yn y pwyllgor a wneuthum i pan oeddwn yn gadeirydd gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, rai blynyddoedd yn ôl bellach. Yr oedd pobl ifanc yn sôn am yr union broblemau wrthym ni yn y pwyllgor, yn ystod sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth, ac mae'n syfrdanol sylweddoli bod y problemau'n parhau. Yr wyf yn cytuno i'r carn â Mick. Mae angen inni wneud rhywbeth am y mater hwn, a gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystyried yr argymhellion hyn, fel y gall y bobl ifanc hyn, a roddodd ein tystiolaeth inni, weld bod yr ymdrech o wneud hynny—ac yr oedd yn ymdrech i rai—yn werth chweil.

Yr oeddwn yn pryderu o glywed y bobl ifanc y cyfarfu Mark Isherwood a minnau â hwy yn y gogledd yn dweud er eu bod yn aml wedi bod mewn cyfarfodydd o'r fath dros y blynyddoedd a heb erioed gael unrhyw adborth. Yr oedd Mark a minnau'n awyddus iddynt gael yr adborth hwnnw, felly,

their evidence to the clerk, who sent it off to the appropriate person in north Wales. I was talking to one of those young people today. I asked him whether he was looking forward to being at the Assembly, and he said, 'I came to get some feedback'. When I asked him what he meant, because we had sent him some feedback—and I told him that I knew that that had happened through the Assembly—it transpired that the feedback went to the offices of various organisations and was not shared with the young people. That says it all, does it not? I am extremely disappointed about that.

One point that was raised repeatedly was the benefits system, and the difficulties that its anomalies cause young people. For example, if they are students and they go into education, their benefits are altered, which means that, sometimes, they have to leave education. We know that many people who are homeless are those who have left care. Unfortunately, people who leave care do not always benefit from the sort of education that they need and deserve. Therefore, we are seeing a cyclical programme of devastation in the lives of these young people.

Peter Black raised safety for young people, and the use of bed-and-breakfast accommodation for young people should be abolished. It is as simple as that, and I totally agree with him. However, those places where young people are accommodated need to be safe. One young man told us that he had been abducted from a hostel, which is appalling. As Mick said, let us put these recommendations in place, and let us stop this devastation now and for the future.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I intend to make only a brief contribution today, as I will respond formally in accordance with the timetable. I welcome the committee's excellent report, and I am delighted that there has been such consensus on the majority of its recommendations. That shows the genuine way in which the committee engaged with all stakeholders to discuss this important issue. I

anfonwyd copi o'n hymatebion i'w tystiolaeth at y clerc, a anfonodd yntau'r copi hwnnw at y person priodol yn y gogledd. Yr oeddwn yn siarad ag un o'r bobl ifanc hynny heddiw. Gofynnais iddo a oedd yn edrych ymlaen at fod yn y Cynulliad, a dywedodd, 'Deuthum i gael adborth'. Pan ofynnais iddo beth a olygai, gan ein bod wedi anfon rhywfaint o adborth ato—a dywedais wrtho fy mod yn gwybod fod hynny wedi digwydd drwy'r Cynulliad—daeth yn amlwg mai at swyddfeydd amrywiol sefydliadau yr aeth yr adborth ac na chafodd ei rannu gyda'r bobl ifanc. Onid yw hynny'n dweud y cyfan? Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn am hynny.

Un pwynt a godwyd dro ar ôl tro oedd y system fudd-daliadau, a'r anawsterau y mae'r anghysondebau o'i mewn yn eu hachosi i bobl ifanc. Er enghraifft, os ydynt yn fyfyrwyr ac yn penderfynu astudio, caiff eu budd-daliadau eu newid, sy'n golygu, weithiau, ei bod yn rhaid iddynt adael byd addysg. Gwyddom mai pobl sydd wedi gadael gofal yw nifer o'r bobl sy'n ddiartref. Yn anffodus, nid yw pobl sy'n gadael gofal bob amser yn cael budd o'r math o addysg y mae arnynt ei hangen ac y maent yn ei haeddu. Felly, yr ydym yn gweld rhaglen gylch o ddinistr ym mywydau'r bobl ifanc hyn.

Cododd Peter Black fater diogelwch i bobl ifanc, ac y dylai defnyddio llety gwely a brecwast i bobl ifanc ddod i ben. Mae mor syml â hynny, ac yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr ag ef. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i'r manau hynny lle y caiff pobl ifanc eu lletya fod yn ddiogel. Dywedodd un dyn ifanc wrthym ei fod wedi cael ei gipio o hostel, sy'n ofnadwy. Fel y dywedodd Mick, gadewch inni roi'r argymhellion hyn ar waith, a gadewch inni roi diwedd ar y dinistr hwn yn awr ac yn y dyfodol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Dim ond cyfraniad sydd gennyf heddiw, gan y byddaf yn ymateb yn ffurfiol yn unol â'r amserlen. Croesawaf adroddiad ardderchog y pwyllgor, ac yr wyf yn falch bod cystal cytundeb barn ar y mwyafrif o'i argymhellion. Mae hynny'n dangos y modd diffuant yr aeth y pwyllgor ati i ymgysylltu â'r holl randdeiliaid i drafod y mater pwysig

was also delighted with how the committee engaged with the young people, following the excellent example set by Gwenda Thomas in another committee of involving service users and the people affected by these real problems. However, I am sad to hear what Sandy said about the feedback. Other organisations in Wales do not seem to be taking the Assembly's lead on fully engaging with the people whose views we need to know if we are to make better policies in Wales.

I was also struck by Leanne's comments that, in some cases, we are talking about children. We are not talking about adults, but about very young people who, for various reasons, are homeless. It is not because they cannot afford a deposit for a house; it is because of difficult circumstances at home and in their private lives. For those reasons or for wider issues, they are often forced into poor bed-and-breakfast accommodation and so, at the end of the day, are homeless, effectively. They have nowhere to go and no support, and we need to help such young people.

On hidden homelessness, we are aware of young people who sleep on floors, who lodge with relatives, or who are invited to other people's houses with the offer of a bed for the night, but you never know what dangers they are led into. It is very important that we recognise that problem. We must also recognise that we are trying to get good statistics on these issues, but more can be done.

4.40 p.m.

I refute the allegation that we have failed to tackle homelessness. When the Assembly first came into existence in 1999, during the first four years, Peter Black, as my Deputy Minister, led the Homelessness Commission and carried out all that work. All the work on these issues was done at that time under what I still think is a very effective strategy, which has been updated. At that time, the necessary resources were also put in place. There have been more and more resources, and, every year, the allocation in the budget for tackling

hwn. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn hefyd o'r ffordd yr ymgysylltodd y pwyllgor â'r bobl ifanc, gan ddilyn esiampl ardderchog Gwenda Thomas mewn pwyllgor arall o gynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y problemau gwirioneddol hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siomedig o glywed yr hyn a ddywedodd Sandy am yr adborth. Nid yw'n ymddangos bod sefydliadau eraill yng Nghymru yn dilyn arweiniad y Cynulliad o ran ymgysylltu'n llawn â'r bobl hynny y mae arnom angen eu barn os ydym i greu gwell polisiau yng Nghymru.

Trawyd fi hefyd gan sylwadau Leanne ein bod, mewn rhai achosion, yn sôn am blant. Nid ydym yn sôn am oedolion, ond am bobl ifanc iawn sydd, am amrywiol resymau, yn ddigartref. Nid am na allant fforddio talu blaendal ar dŷ y maent yn ddigartref; maent yn ddigartref oherwydd amgylchiadau anodd gartref ac yn eu bywydau personol. Am y rhesymau hynny neu faterion ehangach, cânt eu gorfodi i lety gwely-a-brecwast gwael yn aml iawn, felly maent, mewn gwirionedd, yn ddigartref. Nid oes ganddynt unman i fynd a dim cefnogaeth, ac mae angen inni helpu'r bobl ifanc hynny.

O ran digartrefedd cudd, gwyddom am bobl ifanc sy'n cysgu ar lorïau, sy'n lletya gyda pherthnasau, neu sy'n cael eu gwahodd i dai pobl eraill a chael cynnig gwely am noson, ond ni wyddoch pa beryglon y maent yn eu hwynebu. Mae'n bwysig iawn inni gydnabod y broblem honno. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd ein bod yn ceisio cael ystadegau da ar y materion hyn, ond gellir gwneud mwy.

Yr wyf yn gwerthod yr honiad ein bod wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd. Pan ddaeth y Cynulliad i fodolaeth yn 1999, yn ystod y pedair blynedd cyntaf arweiniodd Peter Black, fel fy Nirprwy Weinidog, y Comisiwn Digartrefedd a gwnaed yr holl waith hwnnw. Cafodd yr holl waith ar y materion hyn ei wneud ar y pryd o dan yr hyn a oedd, yn fy marn i, yn strategaeth effeithiol iawn, ac sydd yn strategaeth effeithiol iawn o hyd ac wedi'i diweddarau erbyn hyn. Ar y pryd cafodd yr holl adnoddau angenrheidiol

homelessness increases. Therefore, I refute any allegation that we have failed to tackle homelessness, though I acknowledge that we are failing to solve the problem to the degree that we would wish to, and that there is a lot more to do. I hope very much that the committee's report will facilitate better policy in this area, and that we will be able to look at what we can do in future.

Specific points have been made, and I must say that I echo the comments about the single-room rent restriction. I have lobbied the UK Government quite hard on that matter, and it is essential that we continue to lobby. Many issues that cross different portfolios have arisen from the committee's report, and I note the specific concerns about homelessness and access to GPs and medical services, to which I shall certainly respond in detail.

I warmly welcome this report. Once again, it shows excellent working in the Assembly at committee level, where we try to develop consensus. Committee reports help to form Government policy. I hope that when some of us, perhaps, are back in May, the excellent work of committees will continue in this area.

**Janice Gregory:** I am conscious of the time, so I shall not address each point. However, I shall try to provide an overall response. I shall start with the last speaker and go backwards.

I thank the Minister for her encouraging words when she warmly welcomed the report. I know that members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee as well as service providers and service users look forward very much to the Minister's formal response, which she will bring to Plenary. I also thank her for her efforts on the single-room rent restriction and for all her other efforts with the UK Government. I know that the committee shares those sentiments.

eu rhoi ar waith. Mae mwy a mwy o adnoddau wedi eu hychwanegu, a bob blwyddyn bydd y dyraniad yn y gyllideb ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd yn cynyddu. Felly, gwrthodaf unrhyw honiad ein bod wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd, er fy mod yn cydnabod ein bod yn methu datrys y broblem i'r graddau y byddem yn dymuno, a bod llawer mwy i'w wneud. Gobeithio'n fawr y bydd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn hwyluso gwell polisi yn y maes hwn, ac y gallwn edrych ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yn y dyfodol.

Cafodd pwyntiau penodol eu gwneud, a rhaid imi ddweud fy mod yn ategu'r sylwadau am y cyfyngiad rhent ystafell-sengl. Yr wyf wedi llobio Llywodraeth y DU yn eithaf caled ar y mater hwnnw, ac mae'n hanfodol inni barhau i llobio. Mae nifer o faterion sy'n croesi portffolios gwahanol wedi codi o adroddiad y pwyllgor, a sylwaf ar y pryderon arbennig am ddigartrefedd a gallu mynd at feddygon teulu a gwasanaethau meddygol, a byddaf yn bendant yn ymateb yn fanwl i hynny.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn yn gynnes. Unwaith eto, mae'n dangos gwaith ardderchog yn y Cynulliad ar lefel pwyllgor, lle y ceisiwn gael cytundeb barn. Mae adroddiadau pwyllgorau'n helpu llunio polisiau'r Llywodraeth. Gobeithio y bydd gwaith ardderchog y pwyllgorau, pan fydd rhai ohonom, efallai, yn dychwelyd ym mis Mai, yn parhau yn y maes hwn.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser, felly, ni chyfeiriai at bob pwynt. Fodd bynnag, ceisiaf gynnig ymateb cyffredinol. Fe ddechreuaf gyda'r siaradwr olaf a gweithio fy ffordd yn ôl.

Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei geiriau calonogol wrth groesawu'r adroddiad yn gynnes. Gwn fod aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ogystal â darparwyr gwasanaethau a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau yn edrych ymlaen yn fawr at ymateb ffurfiol y Gweinidog, a gyflwynir ganddi yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Diolch iddi hefyd am ei hymdrechion gyda'r cyfyngiad rhent ystafell-sengl a'i holl ymdrechion eraill gyda Llywodraeth y DU. Gwn fod y pwyllgor yn rhannu'r teimladau hynny.

Sandy is quite right in what she said; we met the young people who came to the committee at the launch today and they had not received the feedback. If feedback of such importance is not given to these young people, it is little wonder that they fall between the gaps in service provision. Sandy is quite right to be as angry as she is about that. I know that I would feel the same, and I know that she felt better after she said it.

Sandy also mentioned the consensus in the committee; indeed, there was all-party consensus. We did not have a vote; we do not usually have a vote, and never have done in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. However, there were two Members who wanted to note their unhappiness, if you like. We know that it is a Conservative Party stance that it would be wrong to abolish or suspend the right-to-buy scheme. However, I must say that the evidence that was presented to the committee suggested otherwise. What we are told by some is not what the evidence revealed to us. That is in the report for anyone to read, and it is an issue with social housing.

I must say to Mark that I sometimes wonder whether he is in a parallel universe to mine and that of the rest of the committee, because, as Peter and the Minister have mentioned, the cut in the Supporting People revenue grant is a Treasury issue.

Trish, who is not here now, came in at the end of the review, which can be quite difficult. I am grateful to her for her comments. She highlighted the issue of hidden homelessness, which we knew about.

**Mark Isherwood:** On that point about the Supporting People revenue grant being a Treasury issue, it is my understanding that it was initially a Treasury issue, but that it has now been devolved and is within the Barnett block for allocation according to the Assembly Government's priorities.

**Janice Gregory:** He is in his parallel universe again.

Let me just move on to the important issues.

Mae Sandy yn gywir yn yr hyn a ddywedodd; cawsom gyfarfod â'r bobl ifanc a ddaeth i'r pwyllgor yn y lansiad heddiw ac nid oeddynt wedi cael yr adborth. Os na chaiff adborth mor bwysig â hyn ei roi i'r bobl ifanc hyn, nid oes ryfedd eu bod yn disgyn rhwng y bylchau yn y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau. Mae Sandy yn hollol iawn i deimlo'n ddirgwr am hynny. Gwn mai felly y byddwn i'n teimlo hefyd, a gwn ei bod yn teimlo'n well ar ôl ei ddweud.

Soniodd Sandy hefyd am y cytundeb barn yn y pwyllgor; yn wir, cafwyd cytundeb ar draws y pleidiau. Ni chawsom bleidlais; ni fyddwn yn pleidleisio fel rheol, ac nid ydym erioed wedi pleidleisio yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd dau Aelod am nodi eu hanfodlonrwydd, efallai. Gwyddom fod y Blaid Geidwadol yn credun y byddai'n anghywir diddymu neu atal y cynllun hawl-i-brynu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddweud fod y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor yn awgrymu fel arall. Mae'r hyn a ddywedir wrthym gan rai yn groes i'r hyn a welsom yn y dystiolaeth. Mae hynny yn yr adroddiad i unrhyw un ei ddarllen, ac mae'n broblem gyda thai cymdeithasol.

Rhaid imi ddweud wrth Mark fy mod yn dyfalu weithiau a yw mewn bydysawd paralel i fy myd i a gweddill y pwyllgor, oherwydd, fel y soniodd Peter a'r Gweinidog, mater i'r Trysorlys yw torri'r grant refeniw Cefnogi Pobl.

Ymunodd Trish, nad yw yma ar hyn o bryd, ar ddiwedd yr adolygiad, a all fod yn ddigon anodd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am ei sylwadau. Tynnodd sylw at fater digartrefedd cudd, a oedd yn hysbys inni.

**Mark Isherwood:** Ar y pwynt mai mater i'r Trysorlys yw'r grant refeniw Cefnogi Pobl, yr wyf ar ddeall mai mater i'r Trysorlys oedd i ddechrau, ond ei fod bellach wedi ei ddatganoli a'i fod o fewn bloc Barnett i gael ei ddyrannu yn ôl blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Janice Gregory:** Mae yn ei fydsawd paralel eto.

Gadewch imi symud at y materion pwysig.

Thank you, Laura, for your comments. You referred to the issue of sexual orientation. We have discovered through this review that when people become homeless it is not just an issue of bricks and mortar. No-one becomes homeless as a result of a single issue, even sexual orientation. There is a whole host of issues surrounding these young people when they look for alternative accommodation of their own. They desperately need joined-up support from local authorities and all of the other service providers. Recommendations 1 to 5 talk about this joined-up service provision that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee would ideally like to see.

I will leave it there, Deputy Presiding Officer, because of time constraints. I again thank everyone who contributed. Every report that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee has undertaken in the last four years has been harrowing, but this was a particularly harrowing report because, as Leanne and the Minister pointed out, we are talking about children who, for whatever reasons, do not have the luxury that we have of a warm, comfortable and safe roof over their heads—those are usually reasons beyond their control. As responsible politicians and as a responsible Government, we need to address these issues.

Diolch, Laura, am eich sylwadau. Cyfeiriecch at fater tueddffryd rhywiol. Yr ydym wedi darganfod drwy'r adolygiad hwn nad mater o frics a mortar yn unig ydyw pan fydd pobl yn colli eu cartref. Ni fydd neb yn ddirgartref o ganlyniad i un broblem, dim hyd yn oed tueddffryd rhywiol. Mae llw o broblemau'n wynebu'r bobl ifanc hyn pan fyddant yn chwilio am lety amgen eu hunain. Mae arnynt angen cymorth cydgysylltiedig gan awdurdodau lleol a'r holl ddarparwyr gwasanaethau eraill. Mae argymhellion 1 i 5 yn sôn am y ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gydgysylltiedig hwn yr hoffai'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ei gweld yn ddelfrydol.

Byddaf yn gorffen yn awr, Ddirprwy Lywydd, oherwydd cyfyngiadau amser. Diolch unwaith eto i bawb a gyfrannodd. Mae pob adroddiad a wnaed gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf wedi bod yn ddirdynnol, ond yr oedd hwn yn adroddiad arbennig o ddirdynnol oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Leanne a'r Gweinidog, yr ydym yn sôn am blant nad oes ganddynt, am ba resymau bynnag, y fraint sydd gennym ni o gartref clyd, cyfforddus a diogel—mae'r rheini fel rheol yn rhesymau y tu hwnt i'w rheolaeth. Fel gwleidyddion cyfrifol ac fel Llywodraeth gyfrifol, mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

*Cynnig (NDM3453): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3453): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Rhif 2) 2007-08 (Setliad Terfynol—Awdurdodau Heddlu)  
 Approval of the Local Government Finance Report (No. 2) 2007-08 (Final Settlement—Police Authorities)**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.11, approves the Local Government Finance Report (No. 2) 2007-08 (Final Settlement—Police Authorities), which was laid in the Table Office on Tuesday 30 January by the Finance Minister. (NDM3454)*

I am pleased to announce that each of the four police authorities in Wales will receive an increase of 3.6 per cent on last year's revenue settlement. This is a higher increase than that provided last year, and let me say at the outset that this increase, coupled with a reasonable council tax increase, is more than enough to cover essential pay and price inflation set out by the forces themselves in the Welsh forces budget outlook 2007-08.

Budget decisions are matters for police forces and authorities, and this settlement ensures continued investment in front-line policing

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiai fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.11, yn cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Rhif 2) 2007-08 (Setliad Terfynol—Awdurdodau Heddlu), a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Mawrth 30 Ionawr gan y Gweinidog Cyllid. (NDM3454)*

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi y bydd pob un o'r pedwar awdurdod heddlu yng Nghymru yn cael cynnydd o 3.6 y cant o'i gymharu â setliad refeniw y llynedd, sef cynnydd uwch nag a ddarparwyd y llynedd, ac os caf ddweud ar y dechrau bod y cynnydd hwn, ynghyd â chynnydd rhesymol yn y dreth gyngor, yn fwy na digon i gwmpasu chwyddiant sylfaenol mewn tâl a phrisiau a osodwyd gan yr heddluoedd eu hunain yn rhagolwg cyllideb heddluoedd Cymru ar gyfer 2007-08.

Mae materion cyllideb yn faterion i heddluoedd ac awdurdodau, ac mae'r setliad hwn yn sicrhau buddsoddiad parhaus mewn

services. This increase of 3.6 per cent covers all core funding provided by the Assembly Government and by the Home Office through the police grant. It is worth repeating what I have said in previous years: funding arrangements for police authorities are complex. The Assembly Government provides the revenue support grant and non-domestic rates, and Assembly Government direct support to police authorities amounts to £154 million, which is an increase of just under £5.3 million on the amount provided for the current financial year. The Home Office is providing £225 million through the police grant to police authorities in Wales.

The Assembly will transfer £21 million to the Home Office as its contribution to the funding of specific grants and centralised police services from which all in Wales will benefit. The distribution of Assembly support and the police grant will follow the needs-based formula agreed between the Home Office and police authorities in England and Wales. The formula continues to ensure that demographic and other cost pressures, such as the additional costs of policing in rural areas, are fairly reflected. However, within the police grant figure that I mentioned the Home Office has made £13 million available to police authorities in Wales to ensure that no police authority receives an overall settlement of less than a 3.6 per cent increase. This ensures parity with English police authorities. This above-inflation increase builds on the substantial investment made in the police service over recent years.

Since devolution in 1999-2000 police funding has increased by more than 65 per cent, which is 38 per cent in real terms. Police authorities in Wales have received their fair share of this. In addition to funding received through the settlement, police authorities in Wales will also benefit from a range of specific grants available to police authorities in England and Wales.

gwasanaethau plismona rheng flaen. Mae'r cynnydd hwn o 3.6 y cant yn cwmpasu'r holl arian craidd a ddarperir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a chan y Swyddfa Gartref drwy'r grant heddlu. Mae'n werth ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol: mae trefniadau ariannu ar gyfer awdurdodau'r heddlu yn gymhleth. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu'r grant cymorth refeniw ac ardrethi annomestig, ac mae cymorth uniongyrchol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud cyfanswm £154 miliwn i gyd, sy'n gynnydd o ychydig llai na £5.3 miliwn o'i gymharu â'r swm a ddarparwyd am y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol. Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn rhoi £225 miliwn drwy'r grant heddlu i awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru.

Bydd y Cynulliad yn trosglwyddo £21 miliwn i'r Swyddfa Gartref fel ei gyfraniad i ariannu grantiau penodol a gwasanaethau heddlu canolog y bydd Cymru gyfan yn cael budd ohonynt. Bydd dosbarthu cymorth y Cynulliad a'r grant heddlu yn dilyn fformiwla'n seiliedig ar anghenion a gytunwyd rhwng y Swyddfa Gartref ac awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae'r fformiwla'n dal i sicrhau adlewyrchu'n deg y pwysau demograffig a chostau eraill mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, o fewn ffigur y grant heddlu y soniais amdano mae'r Swyddfa Gartref wedi neilltuo £13 miliwn i awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau na fydd yr un awdurdod heddlu'n cael setliad cyffredinol o gynnydd o lai na 3.6 y cant. Mae hyn yn sicrhau cydraddoldeb gydag awdurdodau heddlu Lloegr. Mae'r cynnydd hwn, sy'n uwch na chwyddiant, yn adeiladu ar y buddsoddiad sylweddol a wnaed yn y gwasanaeth heddlu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diweddar.

Ers datganoli yn 1999-2000 mae arian i'r heddlu wedi cynyddu dros 65 y cant, sef 38 y cant mewn termau real. Mae awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru wedi cael cyfran deg o hyn. Yn ogystal â'r arian a geir drwy'r setliad, bydd awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru hefyd yn cael nifer o grantiau penodol sydd ar gael i awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru a Lloegr.



4.50 p.m.

I will finish by returning to a theme that I mentioned at the outset. The approval of the National Assembly allows police authorities to set their council tax precepts for next year. Police authorities, in common with the rest of the public sector, have a duty to manage their budgets efficiently and effectively. Forces should continue to find ways to work with each other, a point recently reiterated by the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration.

As is the case for unitary authorities in Wales, I expect police authorities to act reasonably in setting their budgets and associated council tax precepts for next year. Most police and unitary authorities have already indicated that they will act responsibly. Members will be aware that I have no desire to use the reserve powers available to me to limit authorities' budgetary increases. However, I will seriously consider the exercise of those powers in the light of any unreasonable action by any police or unitary authority in Wales.

I invite the Assembly to support the motion.

**David Lloyd:** Police funding is a complex matter, as we have heard; I will not rehearse the arguments again, as we have just heard them from the Minister. Plaid Cymru continues to call on the UK Labour Government to reimburse police authorities for the costs incurred by the Home Office's abandoned proposals to merge police forces in Wales. The cost for the police authorities in Wales has exceeded £1 million, but only about £400,000 has been paid back. It is high time that the UK Government paid the bill in full.

Funding increases next year for the police authorities in Wales will be at a minimum. This, and the continued failure of the Home Office to pay police authorities the cost of restructuring plans, means that police forces

Gorffennaf drwy ddychwelyd at thema y soniais amdani ar y dechrau. Mae cymeradwyaeth Cynulliad Cymru yn galluogi awdurdodau'r heddlu i osod eu praeceptau treth gyngor am y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae gan awdurdodau'r heddlu, yn debyg i weddill y sector cyhoeddus, ddyletswydd i reoli eu cyllidebau'n effeithlon ac yn effeithiol. Dylai heddluoedd barhau i ddod o hyd i ffyrdd i gydweithio â'i gilydd, pwynt a ailadroddwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

Fel gydag awdurdodau unedol yng Nghymru, disgwyliaf i awdurdodau'r heddlu weithredu'n gyfrifol wrth osod eu cyllidebau a'r praeceptau treth gyngor cysylltiedig am y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau'r heddlu ac awdurdodau unedol wedi dweud eisoes y byddant yn gweithredu'n gyfrifol. Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol nad oes awydd gennyf i ddefnyddio'r pwerau a gadwyd yn ôl sydd ar gael imi i gyfyngu ar gynnydd cyllidebol awdurdodau. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ystyried defnyddio'r pwerau hynny'n o ddifrif yng ngoleuni unrhyw weithred afresymol gan unrhyw awdurdod heddlu neu unedol yng Nghymru.

Gwahoddaf y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r cynnig.

**David Lloyd:** Mae arian yr heddlu'n fater cymhleth, fel y clywsom; ni fyddaf yn ymhelaethu ar y dadleuon eto, gan ein bod newydd eu clywed gan y Gweinidog. Mae Plaid Cymru yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y DU o hyd i ad-dalu'r costau yr aeth awdurdodau'r heddlu iddynt oherwydd cynigion y Swyddfa Gartref i uno'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru, cynigion na weithredwyd. Mae'r gost i awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru yn fwy nag £1 filiwn, ond dim ond tua £400,000 a ad-dalwyd. Mae'n hen bryd i Lywodraeth y DU dalu'r bil yn llawn.

Bydd y cynnydd yn yr arian y flwyddyn nesaf ar gyfer awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru yn fach iawn. Golyga hyn, a methiant parhaus y Swyddfa Gartref i dalu costau'r cynlluniau ailstrwythuro i'r awdurdodau

in Wales face tight budgets. The lowly contribution from central funds will probably lead to another year of inflation-busting increases in council tax for council tax payers in Wales. The share of the North Wales Police budget coming from council tax, for example, has gone up from 13 per cent to 38 per cent in the last 11 years.

As we have heard, this settlement offers a 3.6 per cent increase in funding for the police, which is well below police inflation of 5.11 per cent in north Wales, for instance. Therefore, the situation will be tight as regards essential police services. Finally, in view of the UK Government's continued failure to provide the full funding for the costs of the abandoned police merger, Plaid Cymru will vote against this police funding settlement.

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome these provisions. What we have witnessed in the media in Wales—particularly in north Wales—are difficulties with some organisations, particularly the police board, presenting mixed messages about funding. I thought that it would be useful to put some of the issues, or myths, to bed. I will list some of these issues.

In 1996, there were 533 civilian staff in north Wales; in October 2006, there were 997 such staff, including administrators, telephonists and scientific support personnel. Interestingly, nine front-line officers have been taken off working in the streets of Flintshire and Wrexham, to be put into back-room jobs with North Wales Police. That is difficult to understand, and it is disappointing for the public, because police should be policing on the streets.

It is clear that there has been an increase in staff. On 31 March 1997, there were 1,367 police officers; in 2006, there were 1,640. That is an 18 per cent increase, compared with an 11 per cent increase in England and Wales as a whole over the same period. Therefore, clearly, there are more police officers in north Wales.

In 1996, the police precept charged on a Band D property was £46.21. It is now

heddlu, y bydd heddluoedd yng Nghymru yn wynebu cyllidebau cyfyng. Mae'r cyfraniad isel o gronfeydd canolog yn debygol o arwain at flwyddyn arall o gynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yn uwch na chwyddiant i dalwyr treth gyngor yng Nghymru. Mae cyfran cyllideb heddlu Gogledd Cymru a ddaw o'r dreth gyngor, er enghraifft, wedi codi o 13 y cant i 38 y cant yn ystod yr 11 mlynedd diwethaf.

Fel y clywsom, mae'r setliad hwn yn cynnig cynnydd o 3.6 y cant yn yr arian ar gyfer yr heddlu, sydd ymhell islaw chwyddiant yr heddlu o 5.11 y cant yn y gogledd, er enghraifft. Felly, bydd yr arian yn brin ar gyfer gwasanaethau hanfodol yr heddlu. Yn olaf, mewn cysylltiad â methiant parhaus Llywodraeth y DU i roi'r arian llawn am gostau'r cynnig ofer i uno heddluoedd, bydd Plaid Cymru yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y setliad ariannu hwn i'r heddlu.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf y darpariaethau hyn. Yr hyn a welsom yn y cyfryngau yng Nghymru—yn arbennig yn y gogledd—yw anawsterau gyda rhai sefydliadau, yn arbennig bwrdd yr heddlu, yn cyfleu negeseuon cymysg am ariannu. Credwn y byddai'n ddefnyddiol egluro rhai o'r problemau, neu'r mythau. Rhestraf rai o'r materion hyn.

Yn 1996, yr oedd 533 o staff sifil yn y gogledd; ym mis Hydref 2006 yr oedd 997 ohonynt, gan gynnwys gweinyddwyr, teleffonyddion a phersonél cymorth gwyddonol. Yn ddiddorol ddigon, tynnwyd naw o swyddogion rheng flaen oddi ar y stryd yn sir y Fflint a Wrecsam i'w rhoi mewn swyddi swyddfa gefn gyda Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Mae hynny'n anodd ei ddeall gan y dylai heddlu fod yn plismona ar y strydoedd.

Mae'n amlwg bod yna gynnydd yn nifer y staff. Ar 31 Mawrth 1997 yr oedd 1,367 o swyddogion heddlu; yn 2006 yr oedd 1,640. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o 18 y cant, o'i gymharu â chynnydd 11 y cant yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn gyffredinol am yr un cyfnod. Felly, yn amlwg, mae mwy o swyddogion heddlu yn y gogledd.

Yn 1996, praesept yr heddlu ar eiddo Band D oedd £46.21. Bellach mae'n £166—mae

£166—that is a massive increase in the police share of council tax of over 273 per cent, the third highest increase among the 43 police authorities in the UK. In 2003-04, the North Wales Police Authority set its budgets, expecting to raise the precept by up to 25 per cent in 2005, 16 per cent in 2006, and 12.1 per cent in 2007. That is a 53 per cent increase in the precept in three years.

This would have been on top of a 17 per cent increase in 2003 and a 31 per cent increase in 2004. The biggest myth is that the police budget has been cut. Over the last three years the police budget rose from approximately £120 million to £125 million and then £130 million. There has been no cut in police funding. This is about managing the budget and living within your means. You have to remember that we should be asking our police forces to achieve a sustainable projected budget.

I am sure that my colleagues across north Wales have concerns about some North Wales Police projects. Last year, around £173,000 was spent on a glossy magazine called *Y Glas*, which was sent to every household in Flintshire. So it says that it has no money, but it spends what it has on magazines. Another interesting example is the £192,000 that it proposes spending on police horses, with an annual running cost of around £93,000. I know that they do not use much petrol, but if it has no money, yet is thinking of new projects, that is astonishing.

I was pleased to read in the local paper that one of my north Wales colleagues, the AM for Wrexham, John Marek, recognises that there are problems, but gives the Labour Government credit for the increased investment from the Home Office. I welcome the comments of my Wrexham colleague.

It is interesting that the Conservatives have made observations about this, and I hope that they will make some more today. However, in the debate in Westminster last week no Welsh Tory MP made a contribution—David Davies popped in for five minutes at the end and then walked straight back out. Therefore, despite their crocodile tears about supporting

hynny'n gynnydd enfawr o dros 273 y cant yng nghyfran yr heddlu o'r dreth gyngor, sef y cynnydd uchaf ond dau ymhlith y 43 o awdurdodau heddlu'r DU. Yn 2003-04, gosododd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru ei gyllidebau, gan ddisgwyl codi'r praesept hyd at 25 y cant yn 2005, 16 y cant yn 2006 a 12.1 y cant yn 2007. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o 53 y cant yn y praesept mewn tair blynedd.

Byddai hyn wedi bod yn ychwanegol at y cynnydd o 17 y cant yn 2003 a chynnydd o 31 y cant yn 2004. Y myth mwyaf yw fod cyllideb yr heddlu wedi ei thorri. Dros y tair blynedd diwethaf cododd cyllideb yr heddlu o tua £120 miliwn i £125 miliwn ac yna i £130 miliwn. Ni fu toriad yn arian yr heddlu. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â rheoli'r gyllideb a gwario oddi mewn iddi. Mae'n rhaid ichi gofio y dylem fod yn gofyn i'n heddluoedd gadw at cyllideb amcanol gynaliadwy.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod fy nghyd-aelodau ledled y gogledd yn pryderu ynghylch rhai o brosiectau Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Y llynedd, gwariwyd tua £173,000 ar gylchgrawn sglein o'r enw *Y Glas*, a anfonwyd i bob cartref yn sir y Fflint. Felly mae'n dweud nad oes ganddo arian, ond mae'n gwario'r hyn sydd ganddo ar gylchgronau. Enghraifft ddiddorol arall yw'r £192,000 y mae'n bwriadu ei wario ar geffylau heddlu, gyda chostau rhedeg blynyddol o tua £93,000. Gwn nad ydynt yn defnyddio llawer o betrol, ond os nad oes arian ganddo ond os yw eto'n meddwl am brosiectau newydd, mae hynny'n rhyfeddol.

Yr oeddwn yn falch darllen yn y papur lleol bod un o'm cyd-aelodau yn y gogledd, yr AC dros Wrecsam, John Marek, yn cydnabod bod problemau, ond mae'n rhoi'r clod i'r Llywodraeth Lafur am y buddsoddiad uwch gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Croesawaf y sylwadau gan fy nghyd-Aelod o Wrecsam.

Mae'n ddiddorol bod y Ceidwadwyr wedi gwneud sylwadau ynglŷn â hyn, a gobeithio y byddant yn gwneud rhagor heddiw. Fodd bynnag, yn y ddadl yn San Steffan yr wythnos diwethaf ni wnaeth dim un o'r ASau Toriaid o Gymru gyfraniad—tarodd David Davies i mewn am bum munud ar y diwedd ac yna cerddodd allan yn syth. Felly, er eu

a low precept, they did not bother to make any observations in Westminster.

Finally, the fire service can manage within its means, so why are the police unable to do so? After the investigation into Flintshire County Council by the police at a cost of £757,000—and I know that Mark Isherwood was keen to ensure that there was an investigation—nothing was proved, as was the case with the two auditors' reports prior to that. Therefore, I welcome this report and its provisions and I hope that we can have a fair share for all in Wales. I am sure that you will deliver that, Minister.

honiad eu bod yn cefnogi praesept isel, ni wnaethant drafferthu i wneud dim sylwadau yn San Steffan.

Yn olaf, gall y gwasanaeth tân ymdopi o fewn ei gyllideb, felly, pam na all yr heddlu wneud hynny? Ar ôl yr archwiliad i Gyngor Sir y Fflint gan yr heddlu ar gost o £757,000—a gwn fod Mark Isherwood yn awyddus i sicrhau cynnal archwiliad—ni phrofwyd dim byd, fel yn achos adroddiad y ddau archwilydd blaenorol. Felly, croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a'i ddarpariaethau a gobeithio y gallwn gael gyfran deg i Gymru gyfan. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn sicrhau hynny, Weinidog.

### Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I now invite the Business Minister to propose an extension of 20 minutes.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwahoddaf yn awr y Trefnydd i gynnig estyniad o 20 munud.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting until 5.50 p.m..*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 5.50 p.m.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Are there 10 Members in support of this proposal? I see that there are. Therefore, I call a vote.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn? Gwelaf fod. Galwaf am bleidlais felly.

*Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 4.  
Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 4.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Janet  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw

Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** As we have some time, I would like to make a comment from the Chair about the alteration of business this afternoon. I have had complaints from Members that business was changed quite late. I know that Members have commitments and draw up their own timetables, and change cannot be right unless there is a good reason for it. I do not know the reason; I can only speculate as to why business has been changed. I will refer this to the clerk, so that he can refer it to the Business Committee for consideration to ensure that it happens only on those occasions when it is an absolute necessity.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gan fod rhywfaint o amser gennym, hoffwn wneud sylwadau o'r Gadair ynglŷn â newid busnes y siambr y prynhawn yma. Cefais gwynion gan Aelodau fod busnes wedi newid llawer yn ddiweddar. Gwn fod gan Aelodau ymrwymadau a'u bod yn llunio'u hamserlenni eu hunain ac na all newid fod yn iawn heblaw bod rheswm da drosto. Ni wn beth yw'r rheswm, ni allaf ond ddyfalu pam y newidiwyd busnes. Byddaf yn cyfeirio hyn at y clerwr fel y gall ei gyfeirio at y Pwyllgor Busnes i'w ystyried er mwyn sicrhau y bydd yn digwydd diom ond ar yr achlysuron hynny pan fydd yn hollol angenrheidiol.

### **Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Rhif 2) 2007-08 (Setliad Terfynol—Awdurdodau Heddlu): Parhad Approval of the Local Government Finance Report (No. 2) 2007-08 (Final Settlement—Police Authorities): Continued**

**Mark Isherwood:** I will start by referring to a few of the comments made by Carl. You may be aware that the magazine has been cancelled because of action by North Wales Police Authority. The Welsh Conservative member of the North Wales Police Authority has publicly opposed police horses, as I do, but that is not part of the current expenditure. With regard to Flintshire County Council, I recall PricewaterhouseCoopers saying that scores of documents had gone missing before North Wales Police stated that there was insufficient evidence to prosecute. I also know of a large number of witnesses were interviewed privately by two officers with no written record taken, no tape recording and completely opposite interpretations of what

**Mark Isherwood:** Dechreuaf drwy gyfeirio at rai o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan Carl. Efallai y byddwch yn gwybod bod y cylchgrawn wedi ei ganslo oherwydd camau gweithredu gan Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Mae'r aelod o Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru sy'n cynrychioli Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi gwrthwynebu ceffylau heddlu'n gyhoeddus, fel yr wyf fi, ond nid yw hynny'n rhan o'r gwariant presennol. O ran Cyngor Sir y Fflint, cofiaf fod PricewaterhouseCoopers wedi dweud bod lluo o ddogfennau wedi diflannu cyn i Heddlu Gogledd Cymru ddweud nad oedd digon o dystiolaeth i erlyn. Gwn hefyd fod nifer fawr o dystion wedi'u cyfweld yn breifat gan ddau swyddog heb gymryd unrhyw gofnod

they stated being produced by the police after the event. I have written to the chief constable about it but—guess what?—I did not get a reply for six months; when I did get a reply, it was in support of the officer. I wrote back again but, to this day, I still have not had a reply.

5.00 p.m.

However, I will move on with the issue at hand—

**Carl Sargeant:** Have you reported that to the police complaints authority?

**Mark Isherwood:** I did contact the police complaints authority, and I had a visit here from one of its representatives. The first thing that the gentleman said to me when he came through the door was, ‘I used to work for Flintshire County Council’. So, there we are. That is true; I have two witnesses. [*Interruption.*] I will get on with the issue in hand.

This report and the application of the formula are largely decided by the Home Secretary. The Welsh Assembly Government supports police authorities by adopting the rules as set out in England. I have personally contacted the director of finance and resources of North Wales Police, and he said—this is not propaganda from the chief constable—that the formula as it is being used is considered flawed, because it favours urban areas, and most of those are in England. If the formula was applied as designed, forces in Wales would receive £12.87 million less than current funding, which is protected by a floor mechanism. The formula needs to be reviewed, or there will be a significant, continuous outflow of funds from Wales over time. The relative funding being applied because of historic changes under the formula means that police funding per head of population in south Wales is 24 per cent more than in north Wales. This unfairness needs to be addressed at some point in the future.

Essentially, this is the old formula, lifted by

ysgrifenedig, heb recordiad tâp gan olygu bod dehongliadau cwbl groes i'r hyn a ddywedwyd ganddynt wedi eu rhoi gan yr heddlu wedyn. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y prif gwnstabl ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa, ond—wyddoch chi beth?—ni chefais ateb am chwe mis; pan gefais ateb, yr oedd yn cefnogi'r swyddog. Ysgrifennais unwaith eto, ond hyd y dydd heddiw nid wyf wedi cael ateb.

Fodd bynnag, ymdriniaf â'r mater dan sylw—

**Carl Sargeant:** A ydych wedi rhoi gwybod i awdurdod cwynion yr heddlu o hynny?

**Mark Isherwood:** Cysylltais ag awdurdod cwynion yr heddlu, a daeth un o'i gynrychiolwyr i'm gweld yma. Y peth cyntaf a ddywedodd y gŵr bonheddig wrthyf pan ddaeth drwy'r drws oedd, ‘Yr oeddwn yn arfer gweithio i Gyngor Sir y Fflint’. Felly, dyna ni. Mae hynny'n wir; mae gennyf ddau dyst. [*Torri ar draws.*] Ymdriniaf â'r mater dan sylw.

Yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am benderfynu ar yr adroddiad hwn a defnyddio'r fformiwla. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cefnogi awdurdodau'r heddlu drwy fabwysiadu rheolau fel y rhai a bennir yn Lloegr. Yr wyf wedi cysylltu â chyfarwyddwr cyllid ac adnoddau Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn bersonol, a dywedodd—nid propaganda yw hyn gan y prif gwnstabl—yr ystyrir bod y fformiwla, fel y caiff ei defnyddio, yn ddiffygiol, am ei bod yn ffafrio ardaloedd trefol, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r rheini yn Lloegr. Pe cymhwysid y fformiwla fel y'i cynlluniwyd, byddai heddluoedd yng Nghymru yn cael £12.87 miliwn yn llai na'r arian cyfredol, a ddiogelir gan derfyn ariannu isaf. Mae angen adolygu'r fformiwla, neu bydd all-lif sylweddol a pharhaus o arian o Gymru dros amser. Mae'r arian cymharol a gymhwysir oherwydd newidiadau hanesyddol o dan y fformiwla yn golygu bod arian yr heddlu y pen o'r boblogaeth yn y de 24 y cant yn fwy na'r arian yn y gogledd. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r annhegwch hwn rywbryd yn y dyfodol.

Yn ei hanfod, yr hen fformiwla yw hon, gyda

inflation and subject to floors and ceilings. A new formula has been developed, which, because of the massive amounts of money that it would redistribute, has never been implemented. The fact that the standard spending assessment per head has been identified as £81.43, and that only one out of the 43 police authorities was below that level in 2006-07, illustrates how decayed this system has become. There is little point in making detailed comments on what is, in effect, a redundant system. It does not, for example, reflect tourism, it deliberately undervalues the cost of rurality and overvalues density and so on.

Inflation has been pegged at 3.6 per cent, but, real inflation, on a detailed calculation of expenditure patterns, is 5.11 per cent. In part, this is caused by the Home Office refusing to put any inflation on specific grants, or even reducing them, while demanding that the same resources are employed. Apparently, the Home Office is naive enough to think that a 3 per cent settlement puts 3 per cent on the payroll costs, thus ignoring increments, performance-related pay, and National Insurance and pension increases. In short, the settlement is underfunded.

While north Wales benefits hugely from funding floors, it is of extreme concern to note that the withdrawal of this sum in the future would destroy the community police service into which so much effort has been put over the last few years. This figure has been growing substantially from year to year, which illustrates the fundamental incorrectness of the system. The new system has been designed to move money into the urban conurbations of England and will see a sustained and substantial drop in the totality of resources for Wales over the coming years. Within that system, clearly, north Wales and Dyfed-Powys will be hardest hit, but it is worth noting that even the best funded force in Wales—South Wales Police—will receive less per head of population than the average for England and Wales.

chynnydd oherwydd chwyddiant a therfynau ariannu isaf ac uchaf. Datblygwyd fformiwla newydd, na chafodd erioed ei gweithredu, oherwydd y symiau mawr y byddai'n eu hailddosbarthu. Mae'r ffaith mai £81.43 yw'r asesiad o wariant safonol y pen a nodwyd, ac mai un yn unig o'r 43 awdurdod heddlu a oedd islaw'r lefel honno yn 2006-07, yn dangos cymaint y mae'r system hon wedi dirywio. Nid oes llawer o ddiben gwneud sylwadau manwl am yr hyn sydd, yn ei hanfod, yn system ddiwerth. Er enghraifft, nid yw'n ystyried twristiaeth, mae'n rhoi gwerth annigonol ar wledigrwydd ac yn rhoi gwerth gormodol ar ddwysedd ac ati, a hynny'n fwriadol.

Mae chwyddiant wedi'i bennu'n 3.6 y cant, ond, mae'r chwyddiant gwirioneddol, yn ôl cyfrifiad manwl o batrymau gwariant, yn 5.11 y cant. Yn rhannol, caiff hyn ei achosi gan y ffaith bod y Swyddfa Gartref yn gwrthod ychwanegu unrhyw swm oherwydd chwyddiant at grantiau penodol, neu hyd yn oed eu lleihau, ac ar yr un pryd yn mynnu y defnyddir yr un adnoddau. Mae'n debyg bod y Swyddfa Gartref yn ddigon diniwed i feddwl bod setliad o 3 y cant yn rhoi 3 y cant ar gostau'r gyflogres, gan anwybyddu cynyddrannau, tâl ar sail perfformiad, a chynnydd mewn taliadau Yswiriant Gwladol a phensiwn. Yn fyr, nid yw'r setliad wedi'i ariannu'n ddigonol.

Er bod y gogledd yn cael budd enfawr o derfynau ariannu, mae'n destun pryder mawr nodi y byddai tynnu'r swm hwn yn ôl yn y dyfodol yn dinistrio gwasanaeth yr heddlu cymunedol, y rhoddwyd cymaint o ymdrech iddo yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'r ffigur hwn wedi bod yn tyfu'n sylweddol o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, sy'n dangos anghywirdeb sylfaenol y system. Cynlluniwyd y system newydd i symud arian i gytreffi trefol Lloegr, a gwelir gostyngiad parhaus a sylweddol yng nghyfanswm yr adnoddau i Gymru dros y blynyddoedd i ddod. O fewn y system honno, mae'n amlwg mai'r gogledd a Dyfed-Powys fydd yn dioddef fwyaf, ond mae'n werth sylwi y bydd hyd yn oed yr heddlu â'r arian mwyaf yng Nghymru—Heddlu De Cymru—yn cael llai y pen o'r boblogaeth na'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr.

In its now redundant magazine, North Wales Police referred to an independent survey that it commissioned that showed that 75 per cent of the population would be happy to pay an increase of 39p a week in council tax to fill the gap in police funding. It stated,

‘If we don’t have the resources, the people of North Wales will not get more bobbies on the beat—they will get fewer’.

In fact, the number of community beat managers is now forecast to fall by 35, and because community support officer funding has been cut by 30 per cent by the Home Office, Wrexham has had to lose its wardens. Community support officers are now going out on the beat instead of community beat managers, when we were always told that they would be an addition rather than an alternative. That is a disgrace.

Overall, we cannot support this report, but, equally, we recognise that most of the police forces and authorities in Wales need to move ahead with their budget plans. We will be voting with that in mind.

**Michael German:** There are several reasons why we cannot support this precept finance report today. The point that there is a problem with the formula, in the way that it reflects Wales, has been well made. The Home Office formula that is used here—we pay the Home Office, and it then distributes the money according to its formula—is such that the top slicing that occurs of the global Home Office amount is not useable by Welsh authorities. That is a general complaint that I have heard from all police authorities in Wales: the Home Office formula does not suit our needs. It is largely related to urban and extra-urban policing, not to the needs of police forces in Wales. I do not want to interfere with the private grief of Labour Members regarding the North Wales Policy Authority, and I do not want to know whether they appoint anyone to the police authority, as that is a matter for them to discuss, but there are two key facts to consider.

Yn ei gylchgrawn, na chaiff ei gyhoeddi mwyach, cyfeiriodd Heddlu Gogledd Cymru fod arolwg annibynnol a gomisiynwyd ganddo yn dangos y byddai 75 y cant o’r boblogaeth yn fodlon talu cynnydd o 39c yr wythnos yn y dreth gyngor i lenwi’r bwlch yn arian yr heddlu. Meddai,

Os na chawn yr adnoddau, ni fydd pobl yn y gogledd yn cael mwy o heddweision ar rawd—byddant yn cael llai.

Mewn gwirionedd, rhagwelir y bydd lleihad o 35 yn nifer y rheolwyr rhawd cymunedol, ac oherwydd gostyngiad o 30 y cant yn yr arian ar gyfer swyddogion cymorth cymunedol gan y Swyddfa Gartref, bu’n rhaid i Wrecsam golli ei wardeiniaid. Mae swyddogion cymorth cymunedol bellach yn mynd ar rawd yn hytrach na rheolwyr rhawd cymunedol, pan ddywedwyd wrthym bob amser mai ychwanegiad fyddent yn hytrach na dewis amgen. Mae hynny’n warthus.

Ar y cyfan, ni allwn gefnogi’r adroddiad hwn, ond ar yr un pryd cydnabyddwn fod angen i’r rhan fwyaf o heddluoedd ac awdurdodau’r heddlu yng Nghymru fwrw ymlaen â’u cynlluniau cyllidebol. Byddwn yn pleidleisio gan gadw hynny mewn golwg.

**Michael German:** Mae nifer o resymau pam na allwn gefnogi’r adroddiad cyllid hwn ar braeseptau heddiw. Cafodd y ffaith bod problem gyda’r fformiwla, o ran y ffordd y mae’n ystyried Cymru, ei chyfleu’n dda. Mae fformiwla’r Swyddfa Gartref a ddefnyddir yma—yr ydym yn talu’r Swyddfa Gartref, ac yna mae’n dosbarthu’r arian yn ôl ei fformiwla—yn golygu nad yw’r symiau a frigidorrir o gyfanswm y Swyddfa Gartref ar gael i awdurdodau yng Nghymru eu defnyddio. Mae honno’n gŵyn gyffredinol yr wyf wedi’i chlywed gan bob awdurdod heddlu yng Nghymru: nid yw fformiwla’r Swyddfa Gartref yn diwallu ein hanghenion. Mae’n ymwneud yn bennaf â phlisma trefol a phlisma trefol ychwanegol, nid ag anghenion heddluoedd yng Nghymru. Nid wyf am ymyrryd yn helyntion Aelodau Llafur gydag Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, ac nid wyf am wybod a ydynt yn penodi neb i awdurdod yr heddlu, oherwydd mater iddynt hwy ei drafod yw hwnnw, ond mae dwy ffaith allweddol i’w hystyried.



The first of those is that, for the first time since 2006, we are seeing a fall in the number of police officers in England and Wales. The biggest fall is in north Wales, where there is to be a fall of 2.8 per cent in the number of officers. You might say that that is north Wales's problem, but it is actually reflected across the whole of England and Wales.

On the second issue—I will refer to what chief constable Brunstrom said, but I think that this is generally reflected in the way that people feel—local people are directly paying a far bigger share of policing costs, but, at the same time, policing has become much more centrally directed by the Home Secretary. Therefore, council tax payers are paying more, but have less influence on policing. In some ways, I repeat the view expressed by Rosemary Butler yesterday, when she said that policing should be devolved to the National Assembly for Wales. I agree with that, because at least parts of the funding would come together and we would be able to see, with some transparency, where that funding was going. Brunstrom says that a 5 per cent council tax rise in north Wales will mean a cut of £3 million in the North Wales Police budget. I am not going to enter into a discussion on where that £3 million will come from, but I would suggest to Carl Sargeant that, since most local authorities send out newsletters to their communities, it is rather strange that the police authority should not do so.

**Carl Sargeant:** Not many local authorities are asking for a 15 per cent precept. There is a huge difference in what the local authorities are precepting for and what the north Wales police authority is asking for. The others are coming into line; so, it is rather odd that that one stands out, asking not for 5 per cent but possibly for 15 per cent.

**Michael German:** As I understand it, all communication done by the police authority with the people of north Wales has resulted in a request for regular communication. I can remember times when it was a hot political

Y cyntaf o'r rheini yw ein bod, am y tro cyntaf ers 2006, yn gweld lleihad yn nifer swyddogion yr heddlu yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Ceir y lleihad mwyaf yn y gogledd, lle y bydd lleihad o 2.8 y cant yn nifer y swyddogion. Fe allech ddweud mai problem y gogledd yw hon, ond mae'n codi mewn gwirionedd ledled Cymru a Lloegr.

Ar yr ail fater—cyfeiriaf at yr hyn a ddywedodd y prif gwnstabl Brunstrom, ond credaf y caiff hyn ei adlewyrchu'n gyffredinol yn y ffordd y mae pobl yn teimlo—mae pobl leol yn talu'n uniongyrchol gyfran lawer fwy o gostau plismona, ond, ar yr un pryd, caiff plismona ei gyfarwyddo yn llawer mwy o'r canol bellach gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Felly, mae talwyr y dreth gyngor yn talu llawer mwy, ond mae ganddynt lai o ddylanwad ar blismona. Mewn rhai ffyrdd, ailadroddaf y farn a fynegwyd gan Rosemary Butler ddoe, pan ddywedodd y dylid datganoli plismona i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Cytunaf â hynny, oherwydd o leiaf byddai rhannau o'r arian yn dod at ei gilydd a byddem yn gallu gweld, gyda rhywfaint o dryloywder, i ble yr âi'r arian hwnnw. Dywed Brunstrom y bydd cynnydd o 5 y cant yn y dreth gyngor yn y gogledd yn golygu gostyngiad o £3 miliwn yng nghyllideb Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Nid wyf am ddechrau trafodaeth ynghylch o ble y daw'r £3 miliwn hynny, ond byddwn yn awgrymu i Carl Sargeant, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol yn anfon cylchlythyron i'w cymunedau, mae hi braidd yn rhyfedd na ddylai awdurdod yr heddlu wneud hynny.

**Carl Sargeant:** Nid yw llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn gofyn am braesept o 15 y cant. Mae gwahaniaeth enfawr yn yr hyn y mae awdurdodau lleol yn praeseptio amdano a'r hyn y mae awdurdod heddlu'r gogledd yn gofyn amdano. Mae'r lleill yn dechrau cyfaddawdu; felly, mae hi braidd yn rhyfedd fod un, yn wahanol i'r lleill, yn gofyn nid am 5 y cant ond am 15 y cant o bosibl.

**Michael German:** Fel y deallaf, mae'r holl gyfathrebu rhwng awdurdod yr heddlu a phobl y gogledd wedi arwain at gais am gyfathrebu rheolaidd. Cofiaf adeg pan oedd yn bwnc gwleidyddol llosg a ddylai

issue as to whether or not politicians and those elected to posts—or those who are selected in the case of police authorities—should communicate with people. It is a practice that has evolved over the last 10 to 15 years, and one that has become more and more accepted as a means of communication. However, that is a matter for the police authority and for north Wales Members—I am not making suggestions as to where that £3 million cut should be found. The Minister has indicated that 5 per cent is the level at which she would want to place a cap. Let us trace that back; she wants a 5 per cent cap because an increase of more than that would hurt council tax payers. However, if council tax payers and the National Assembly are being asked to pay more as a percentage of the total amount of money that goes into policing in Wales, that is clearly a shift of policy. That is why I reflect on the issue that Rosemary Butler raised yesterday.

We have already seen Home Office restrictions lead to a reduction in the promised number of police support officers. We have also seen that the 101 telephone service, trialled in Cardiff, is no longer to be rolled out across Wales—it has more or less been kicked into the long grass. I reflect on the fact that this was a pressure-taking-off service, when it was used in Cardiff, and I hope that that will be reflected—

**Jenny Randerson:** I wanted to clarify for you that, in Cardiff, the 101 service has been successful and has led to a 37 per cent reduction in the number of urgent calls to the emergency services.

**Michael German:** Hence the need for it to be rolled out more quickly across Wales, to save everyone's time.

5.10 p.m.

The final point that I want to make, Minister, is that this does not give us any transparency about the crime fund. The Assembly Government has put into a crime fund over £100 million—maybe as much as £120 million. However, in her remarks to me yesterday, the Minister said that she was

gwleidyddion a'r rhai a etholwyd i swyddi—neu'r rhai a ddeholir yn achos awdurdodau'r heddlu—gyfathrebu â phobl. Mae'n arfer sydd wedi datblygu dros y 10 i 15 mlynedd diwethaf, ac yn un a ddaeth yn llawer mwy derbyniol fel dull o gyfathrebu. Fodd bynnag, mater i awdurdod yr heddlu ac Aelodau'r gogledd yw hynny—nid wyf am wneud awgrymiadau o ble y dylai'r gostyngiad hwnnw o £3 miliwn ddod. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi nodi mai 5 y cant yw'r lefel lle y byddai am osod terfyn. Gadewch inni olrhain hynny; mae am gael terfyn o 5 y cant oherwydd byddai cynnydd o fwy na hynny yn effeithio'n niweidiol ar dalwyr y dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, os gofynnir i dalwyr y dreth gyngor a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol dalu mwy fel canran o gyfanswm yr arian a glustnodir i blismona yng Nghymru, mae hynny'n amlwg yn newid mewn polisi. Dyna'r rheswm yr ystyriaf y mater a gododd Rosemary Butler ddoe.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld bod cyfyngiadau'r Swyddfa Gartref yn arwain at leihad yn nifer swyddogion cymorth yr heddlu a addawyd. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld na fydd y gwasanaeth ffôn 101, a dreialwyd yng Nghaerdydd, yn cael ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru bellach—mae wedi mynd i'r gwellt yn fwy neu lai. Ystyriaf y ffaith fod hwn yn wasanaeth a oedd yn lleihau pwysau, pan gafodd ei ddefnyddio yng Nghaerdydd, a gobeithio y caiff hynny ei adlewyrchu—

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr oeddwn am egluro wrthyfch fod y gwasanaeth 101 yng Nghaerdydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus ac wedi arwain at leihad o 37 y cant yn nifer y galwadau brys i'r gwasanaethau brys.

**Michael German:** Dyna pam mae angen ei gyflwyno'n gyflymach ledled Cymru, i arbed amser i bawb.

Y pwynt olaf yr wyf am ei wneud, Weinidog, yw nad yw hyn yn rhoi unrhyw eglurder inni ynglŷn â'r gronfa troseddau. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi neilltuo dros £100 miliwn—efallai cymaint â £120 miliwn ar gyfer cronfa troseddau. Fodd bynnag, yn ei sylwadau imi ddoe, dywedodd y Gweinidog

satisfied with spend on the crime-fighting fund, but that she would want to look at more evidence to support where the money was going. I think that we would all support that, and I hope that the Minister will tell us in her response whether any of the crime fund money is included in this precept.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** This has been an interesting discussion, because there were some points on which I can agree with all colleagues. I have frequently said that the funding mechanisms are extremely complex; it is difficult to draw lines through and around them and, if memory serves me right, that was one of the elements that I put in the Lyons report. I think that there is a need to look at this to try to make things simpler and clearer for people, and I think that that picks up my point.

Much of today's debate has been about arguments with the Home Office. I am really at a loss as to why anyone should vote against this decision by the Assembly Government on our funding to local authorities. Those of you who will vote against it have proposed no amendments about how you might change this for next week. Consequently, if this does not go through today, South Wales Police Authority, for example, which is making its decision on Monday on precept-setting and its budget, would not have a settlement on which to base its judgment. Now, that is not clever from the Assembly's point of view. If you have arguments with the Home Office, take them up there—I understand it and you have a right to do that, but do not deny this motion going through and do not deny police authorities in Wales from setting their precepts and budgets. That needs to be done so that those precepts can go to the unitary authorities so that bills can go out through the computers. I am at a particular loss, Dai, to understand why Plaid Members, who abstained on the budget that contained this issue, now feel that they will vote against it. I understand that you have objections to certain areas, but to stop this from going through is irresponsible; it needs to go through.

ei bod yn fodlon ar y gwariant ar y gronfa ymladd troseddau, ond y byddai am edrych ar fwy o dystiolaeth i ategu ble y mae'r arian yn cael ei wario. Credaf y byddem oll yn cefnogi hynny, a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym yn ei hymateb a gaiff unrhyw arian o'r gronfa troseddau ei gynnwys yn y praesept hwn.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Mae hon wedi bod yn drafodaeth ddiddorol, oherwydd yr oedd rhai pwyntiau lle y gallaf gytuno â'm holl gyd-aelodau. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn aml fod y dulliau ariannu yn gymhleth iawn; mae'n anodd cael eglurder yn eu cylch ac, os gallaf gofio'n iawn, dyna un o'r elfennau a nodais yn adroddiad Lyons. Credaf fod angen edrych ar hyn a cheisio gwneud pethau'n symlach ac yn gliriach i bobl, a chredaf fod hynny'n ategu fy mhwynt.

Yr oedd llawer o'r drafodaeth heddiw ynghylch dadleuon â'r Swyddfa Gartref. Ni allaf ddeall pam y dylai neb bleidleisio yn erbyn y penderfyniad hwn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ein harian i awdurdodau lleol. Nid yw'r rhai ohonoch a fydd yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn wedi cynnig unrhyw welliannau o ran sut y gallech newid hyn ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf. O ganlyniad, os na chaiff hyn ei dderbyn heddiw, ni fyddai gan Awdurdod Heddlu De Cymru, er enghraifft, sy'n gwneud ei benderfyniad ddydd Llun ynglŷn â phennu praesept a'i gyllideb, setliad a fyddai'n sail i'w benderfyniad. Nid yw hynny'n ddoeth o safbwynt y Cynulliad. Os oes gennych unrhyw faterion cynhennus i'w codi gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref, codwch hwy yn uniongyrchol gyda'r Swyddfa—gallaf ddeall hynny ac mae gennych hawl i wneud hynny, ond peidiwch ag atal y cynnig hwn rhag cael ei dderbyn a pheidiwch ag atal awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru rhag pennu eu praeseptau a'u cyllidebau. Rhaid gwneud hynny fel y gall praeseptau gael eu rhoi i'r awdurdodau unedol fel y gellir cyflwyno biliau drwy'r cyfrifiaduron. Ni allaf ddeall yn benodol, Dai, pam mae Aelodau Plaid Cymru, a wnaeth ymatal rhag pleidleisio ar y gyllideb a oedd yn cynnwys y mater hwn, yn teimlo bellach y byddant yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn. Deallaf eich bod yn gwrthwynebu rhai agweddau, ond mae rhwystro hyn rhag cael ei dderbyn yn anghyfrifol; mae angen iddo gael

ei dderbyn.

With regard to the arguments about the formula, whenever you put a formula in place, there are arguments. Mark, it does contain an element for rural authorities—we have checked that out. It is the same with the local government formula; every year, there are arguments that, as soon as you amend it, it is not right in a certain area. However, we do have the floor, and I was at a loss, again, to understand your view that police authorities need to increase their money through the precept in case the floor was removed this year. They are setting the precepts for this year, when the floor is in and Welsh authorities have done quite well out of it, including north Wales. Precepts have to be set in relation to the settlement that is before us.

Carl is right to refer to a continued increase in police budgets. Inflation is at 3.6 per cent, so a 5 per cent precept is, in simple mathematics, an increase and not a cut. I do not know how on earth you can translate an increase into a cut. You may not think that it is enough, but it is a de facto increase.

As to where we are on precept levels, I had a reasonable response from three authorities, and we are still in dialogue with the north Wales authority. I have put in a lot of time going through the north Wales figures, trying to understand its position. However, I see no difference between north Wales and the other three police authorities. It is fair to say that there has been a culture of high-precept-setting in north Wales, and while I can understand the aspirations, it is my job as Minister to be fair and reasonable. Those are the two overriding considerations.

**Ann Jones:** On the point that north Wales has a high precept, do you agree with me that, when Mr Brunstrom first floated this idea, it was to provide a community beat officer for every community ward and that it was a one-off payment? The police authority has set, over the last three years, precept increases ranging from 19 to 25 per cent, knowing that local authorities were having to settle for roughly what you were asking for;

O ran y dadleuon am y fformiwla, pryd bynnag y rhowch fformiwla ar waith, bydd dadleuon. Mark, mae'n cynnwys elfen ar gyfer awdurdodau gwledig—yr ydym wedi cadarnhau hynny. Mae'r un peth yn wir am fformiwla llywodraeth leol; bob blwyddyn, ceir dadleuon, cyn gynted ag y byddwch yn ei ddiwygio, na fydd yn iawn mewn ardal benodol. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym derfyn isaf, ac ni allwn ddeall, unwaith eto, eich barn bod angen i awdurdodau'r heddlu gynyddu eu harian drwy'r praesept rhag ofn y câr'r terfyn isaf ei ddileu eleni. Maent yn pennu'r praeseptau ar gyfer eleni, pan fo'r terfyn isaf wedi'i osod a phan fo awdurdodau yng Nghymru wedi bod ar eu hennill i ryw raddau, yn cynnwys y gogledd. Rhaid pennu praeseptau mewn perthynas â'r setliad sydd ger ein bron.

Mae Carl yn iawn i gyfeirio at gynnydd parhaus yng nghyllidebau'r heddlu. Mae chwyddiant yn 3.6 y cant, felly mae praesept o 5 y cant, yn nhermau mathemategol syml, yn gynnydd ac nid yn ostyngiad. Ni wn sut yn y byd y gallwch droi cynnydd yn ostyngiad. Efallai na chredwch ei fod yn ddigon, ond mae'n gynnydd mewn ffaith.

O ran ein sefyllfa ar lefelau praeseptau, cefais ymateb rhesymol gan dri awdurdod, ac yr ydym yn parhau i drafod ag awdurdod y gogledd. Yr wyf wedi treulio llawer o amser yn edrych ar ffigurau'r gogledd, yn ceisio deall ei sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, ni welaf ddim gwahaniaeth rhwng y gogledd a'r tri awdurdod heddlu arall. Mae'n deg dweud bod hanes o bennu praeseptau uchel yn y gogledd, ac er y gallaf ddeall y dyheadau hynny, fy swyddogaeth i fel Gweinidog yw bod yn deg a rhesymol. Dyna'r ddwy ystyriaeth bwysicaf.

**Ann Jones:** O ran y pwynt bod praesept uchel yn y gogledd, a gytunwch â mi, pan gyflwynodd Mr Brunstrom y syniad hwn gyntaf, mai'r diben oedd darparu swyddog rhawd cymunedol i bob ward gymunedol ac mai un taliad fyddai? Mae awdurdod yr heddlu wedi pennu, dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, gynnydd mewn praeseptau sy'n amrywio o 19 i 25 y cant, gan wybod bod awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod derbyn yn fras yr

that is, about 5 per cent.

Do you think that the police authorities should now look at the policing priorities of North Wales Police, and that community policing should be its priority?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is certainly not a clarification.

**Sue Essex:** Ann knows the history of North Wales Police better than I, but my understanding is that there was an increase in one year in the precept in north Wales on the basis of securing community officers. I am sure that North Wales Police Authority will take that into account in its commitments.

My duty is to be fair and reasonable. We feel that the 3.6 per cent, plus the requested increase in the precept of no more than 5 per cent, is fair to the council tax payers, who, whatever their financial situation, have to respond to this.

I hope that this motion is carried because it is vital for those police authorities who are on the point of setting their budgets that they have certainty from the Assembly. They deserve to have certainty from the Assembly in terms of our grant, and I ask people to support that today.

hyn yr oeddech yn gofyn amdano; sef tua 5 y cant.

A ydych yn credu y dylai awdurdodau'r heddlu bellach ystyried blaenoriaethau plismona Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, ac y dylai roi blaenoriaeth i blismona cymunedol?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yn sicr nid yw hyn yn esboniad.

**Sue Essex:** Mae Ann yn fwy cyfarwydd â hanes Heddlu Gogledd Cymru na mi, ond deallaf fod cynnydd mewn un flwyddyn ym mhraesept y gogledd ar sail sicrhau swyddogion cymunedol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn ystyried hynny yn ei ymrwymadau.

Fy nyletswydd i yw bod yn deg a rhesymol. Teimlwn fod 3.6 y cant, yn ogystal â'r cynnydd y gofynnwyd amdano yn y praesept o ddim mwy na 5 y cant, yn deg i dalwyr y dreth gyngor, sy'n gorfod ymateb i hyn, beth bynnag fo'u sefyllfa ariannol.

Gobeithio y caiff y cynnig hwn ei dderbyn gan ei fod yn hanfodol i'r awdurdodau heddlu hynny sydd ar fin pennu eu cyllidebau gael sicrwydd gan y Cynulliad. Maent yn haeddu cael sicrwydd gan y Cynulliad am ein grant, a gofynnaf i bobl gefnogi hynny heddiw.

*Cynnig (NDM3454): O blaid 27, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 13.*

*Motion (NDM3454): For 27, Abstain 4, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Hyrwyddo a Gwarchod yr Amgylchedd Trefol Promoting and Protecting the Urban Environment**

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf wedi caniatáu munud i Mick Bates siarad. Nad oes neb arall am siarad, felly, dylem allu cwblhau'r ddadl yn gyflym.

Having been born and bred in Cardiff, I feel the instinct to protect and to promote all that is attractive and interesting about our capital city. The city is bestowed with fine surroundings and it has a built environment that is interspersed with parklands, streams, lakes, rivers, reservoirs and railways, all of which help to mark out and define the various communities within the city, and to create in each a sense of belonging.

Few Cardiffians, whether by birth or adoption, will not feel a sense of loss when an appealing aspect of the city is erased, usually to be replaced by an uninspiring concrete block. Such developments, or should I say such regressions, are not, of course, confined to Cardiff. They are usually the outcome of an unholy alliance between town planners, council cabinets and so-called development companies. The citizens' views are rarely sought and even more rarely taken heed of.

**Owen John Thomas:** I have allowed Mick Bates a minute to speak. No-one else wishes to speak and, therefore, we should therefore complete the debate quickly.

Wedi fy ngeni a'm magu yng Nghaerdydd, teimlaf y reddf i ddiogelu ac i hyrwyddo popeth sy'n ddeniadol ac yn ddiddorol am ein prifddinas. Mae mannau hyfryd i'w cael ledled y ddinas ac mae ganddi amgylchedd adeiledig wedi'i fritho â pharcddiroedd, nentydd, llynnoedd, afonydd, cronfeydd dŵr a rheilffyrdd, sydd i gyd yn helpu gosod allan a diffinio'r amrywiol gymunedau yn y ddinas, a chreu ymdeimlad o berthyn ym mhob un ohonynt.

Bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl sy'n hanu o Gaerdydd neu sydd wedi dod i fyw yma yn wynebu ymdeimlad o golled pan fydd agwedd ddeniadol ar y ddinas yn cael ei dileu, fel rheol i adeiladu bloc concrid hyll. Nid dim ond yng Nghaerdydd, wrth gwrs, y ceir datblygiadau o'r fath, neu dylwn ddweud atchweliadau o'r fath. Fel arfer, maent yn deillio o gynghrair anfad rhwng cynllunwyr tref, cabinetau cynghorau a chwmnïau datblygu fel y'u gelwir. Anaml y gofynnir barn dinasyddion ac anamlach byth y caiff ei hystyried.

Not all changes in urban areas involve demolition or building. For many years, local authorities have been struggling with the problem of controlling road and rail transport and the congestion and pollution caused by the increasing use of motor vehicles. Experts advise that designing and implementing an integrated transport system is a prerequisite for solving this intricate problem.

More often than not, the first step in implementing such a plan involves creating sufficient park-and-ride centres to adequately reduce the number of vehicles entering a specific area. Park-and-ride centres need to be safe and accessible and served by frequent bus or train links to make the change from one mode of travel to another as swift and comfortable as possible. To that end, it is necessary to provide new, dedicated bus lanes and to improve and increase train services. However, some authorities, anxious to ring the changes, struggle with this problem, cut corners and put the cart before the horse. They punish car users with unpopular solutions such as having parking zones without implementing the initial steps of an integrated transport system.

5.20 p.m.

It is only after the integrated transport system is in place that any remaining need to tackle car parking can be properly assessed and dealt with. Thank goodness for the people of Canton, who struck a blow for their community when over 3,000 of them—92.5 per cent of those who voted in a local referendum—rejected the council's impetuous parking plan, which would have devastated the shopping centre, undermined local places of worship, and charged people to park outside their own homes. The fight to kill off this short-sighted plan will surely continue in those other inner-city wards where it has yet to be withdrawn.

The interests of individuals, small businesses and whole communities are frequently dismissed by their elected representatives, while big businesses are often given licence

Nid yw pob newid mewn ardaloedd trefol yn golygu dymchwel neu adeiladu. Ers blynyddoedd, mae awdurdodau lleol wedi cael anhawster i reoli trafnidiaeth ar y ffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd a'r tagfeydd a'r llygredd a achosir gan y defnydd cynyddol o gerbydau modur. Mae arbenigwyr yn dweud bod angen dylunio a gweithredu system gludiant integredig er mwyn datrys y broblem gymhleth hon.

Yn amlach na pheidio, mae'r cam cyntaf wrth weithredu cynllun o'r fath yn golygu creu digon o ganolfannau parcio a theithio i leihau nifer y cerbydau sy'n mynd i ardal benodol yn ddigonol. Mae angen i ganolfannau parcio a theithio fod yn ddiogel ac yn hwylus ac wedi'u gwasanaethu gan gysylltiadau bysiau neu drenau rheolaidd i newid o un dull teithio i ddull teithio arall mor gyflym a didrafferth â phosibl. I'r perwyl hwnnw, mae angen darparu lonydd bysiau penodedig newydd a gwella a chynyddu gwasanaethau trên. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai awdurdodau, sy'n awyddus i newid y ffordd y maent yn gweithredu, yn cael anhawster i ddatrys y broblem hon, yn torri corneli ac yn rhoi'r cert o flaen y ceffyl. Maent yn cosbi'r rheini sy'n defnyddio ceir drwy ddarparu atebion amhoblogaidd megis cael parthau parcio heb weithredu camau cychwynnol system gludiant integredig.

Dim ond ar ôl cyflwyno'r system gludiant integredig y gellir asesu unrhyw angen sy'n weddill i fynd i'r afael â pharcio ceir yn briodol ac ymdrin â'r angen hwnnw. Diolch byth am bobl Treganna, a gefnogodd eu cymuned pan wrthododd dros 3,000 ohonynt—92.5 y cant o'r rhai a bleidleisiodd mewn refferendwm lleol—gynllun parcio byrbwyll y cyngor, a fyddai wedi dinistrio'r ganolfan siopa, tanselilio manau addoli lleol, a chodi tâl ar bobl i barcio y tu allan i'w cartrefi eu hunain. Bydd y frwydr i roi'r gorau i'r cynllun annoeth hwn yn sicr yn parhau yn y wardiau eraill hynny yng nghanol y ddinas lle nad yw wedi'i dynnu'n ôl eto.

Caiff buddiannau unigolion, busnesau bach a chymunedau cyfan eu diystyru'n rheolaidd gan eu cynrychiolwyr etholedig, ond yn aml caiff busnesau mawr rwydd hynt i godi

to erect inferior buildings and to develop in ways not conducive to the local environment. I remember some years ago the owner of a mobile hot dog and coffee stand wishing to carry out his trade on a grass verge at Culverhouse Cross; he was duly told to move on because of the effect his presence at this busy junction would have on the smooth flow of traffic. A few years later, Marks and Spencer and several other giant chain stores achieved on a mammoth scale what the little hot dog man had failed to do. George Orwell was quite right in this case: all pigs are equal, but some pigs are more equal than others. Since then, chain stores have been encouraged to open their doors on the outskirts of towns large and small. The effect of this has been catastrophic on the trade of many ancient town centres, such as Carmarthen. One must ask, 'Do the powers that be really care?'

Whenever I visit other cities such as Edinburgh and Dublin, I am impressed by the strides that they have taken to protect and promote their built environment and open spaces. They seem to operate planning laws that do not allow architecture and signage—even of powerful international chain stores—to detract from the proud and dignified ethos of their city centres.

On the other hand, when walking along the main roads of Cardiff's busy shopping centre, one is often struck by the stark contrast between the impressive architecture of the upper part of the facades of the shop buildings, and the cheap plastic shop signs below. Furthermore, on passing McDonald's, you may note that the pavement has been discoloured by the daily dropping of chip cartons. Surely, employing someone to pick up the cartons and their contents would hardly make a dent in McDonald's millions. When will the capital have a council with a vision that seeks to emulate Dublin and Edinburgh by demanding that stores and other businesses wishing to set up here conform to certain standards?

The closing of David Morgan's store after 150 years was a great loss to the city, but it is

adeiladau israddol a datblygu mewn ffyrdd nad ydynt yn ffafriol i'r amgylchedd lleol. Rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, cofiaf berchennog stonidin symudol cŵn poeth a choffi a oedd am roi ei stonidin ar lain glaswellt yng Nghroes Cwrlwys; dywedwyd wrtho'n ddigon buan am symud ymlaen oherwydd effaith ei stonidin ar y gyffordd brysur hon ar lif y traffig. Ychydig flynyddoedd yn ddiweddarach, llwyddodd Marks and Spencer a sawl siop gadwyn enfawr arall i wneud ar raddfa enfawr yr hyn nad oedd y dyn cŵn poeth wedi llwyddo i'w wneud. Yr oedd George Orwell yn llygad ei le yn yr achos hwn: mae pob mochyn yn gyfartal, ond mae rhai moch yn fwy cyfartal nag eraill. Ers hynny, mae siopau cadwyn wedi'u hannog i agor ar gyrion trefi mawr a bach. Mae hyn wedi cael effaith drychinebus ar fasnach sawl canol tref hynafol, megis Caerfyrddin. Rhaid gofyn, 'A oes gwahaniaeth gan y rhai sydd mewn grym mewn gwirionedd?'

Pryd bynnag y byddaf yn ymweld â dinasoedd eraill megis Caeredin a Dulyn, mae eu hymdrechion i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo eu hamgylchedd adeiledig a'u manau agored yn creu argraff arnaf. Ymddengys eu bod yn gweithredu deddfau cynllunio nad ydynt yn caniatáu i bensaernïaeth ac arwyddion—hyd yn oed pensaernïaeth ac arwyddion siopau cadwyn rhyngwladol pwerus—dynnu oddi ar ethos balch ac urddasol canol eu dinasoedd.

Ar y llaw arall, wrth gerdded ar hyd prif ffyrdd canolfan siopa brysur Caerdydd, mae'r gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr rhwng pensaernïaeth drawiadol rhan uchaf yr wynebâu adeiladau siopau a'r arwyddion siopau plastig rhad oddi tanynt yn eich taro. Yn ogystal, wrth fynd heibio i McDonald's, efallai y sylwch fod y palmant wedi newid lliw am fod cynifer o becynnau sglodion yn cael eu gollwng bob dydd. Yn sicr, ni fyddai cyflogi rhywun i gasglu'r pecynnau a'u cynnwys yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i filiynau McDonald's. Pryd y bydd gan y brifddinas gyngor sydd â'r weledigaeth i geisio efelychu Dulyn a Chaeredin drwy fynnu bod siopau a busnesau eraill sydd am sefydlu yma yn cydymffurfio â safonau penodol?

Yr oedd cau siop David Morgan ar ôl 150 o flynyddoedd yn golled fawr i'r ddinas, ond



pleasing to see that its striking facades have been retained, and indeed, restored to their original splendour. The Morgan arcades are another example of Cardiff's distinctive and attractive features. However, it is widely understood that these premises, which offer a myriad of goods and services, face a considerable rent increase, demanded by the new owners of the David Morgan site. Their demise would detract considerably from the city's character.

Near the entrance to the Morgan arcade is Spiller's record shop. These premises, founded in 1898, house the world's oldest record shop. If the new owners of the freehold carry out their plans to impose a vastly increased rent, Wales will lose a world record and the plans to place a blue plaque on the store will have to be abandoned. Only two doors along the Hayes from Spiller's stands the Tabernacl, a Welsh Baptist chapel established in 1813. If the local authority is able to enforce its proposed punitive restrictions on the use of the chapel's sizeable car park, then another distinctive feature of Cardiff could become merely a memory.

Local authorities have a moral duty, while considering development plans, to protect important landmarks of historic interest. The city's canal was filled in many years ago, leaving only its sea-lock entrance in the bay, which was opened in 1798. The canal lock was a fine edifice, and a reminder of the of the coal and iron trade that triggered Cardiff's stupendous growth. Unfortunately, almost two hundred years after its opening, without warning, it was buried in concrete. Much besides of our built environment with historic and aesthetic value has met the same fate.

I will move on from the built environment to consider briefly another aspect of the urban environment. Cardiff is rightly proud of its parklands and green, open spaces, and yet even some of those are under threat. In spite the density of the city's population, there are two points along the A48 axis, which runs from east to west through the city, where one can step off the main road and walk through parkland and other green open spaces to the capital's northern boundaries. One of these

mae'n dda gweld bod wyneb trawiadol yr adeilad wedi'u cadw, ac, yn wir wedi eu hadfer i'w gogoniant gwreiddiol. Mae arcedau Morgan yn enghraifft arall o nodweddion arbennig a deniadol Caerdydd. Fodd bynnag, deëllir yn gyffredinol fod y safleoedd hyn, sy'n cynnig llu o nwyddau a gwasanaethau, yn wynebu cynnydd sylweddol yn y rhent, a fynir gan berchenogion newydd safle David Morgan. Yn sicr, byddai'n tynnu'n sylweddol oddi ar gymeriad y ddinas pe byddent yn diflannu.

Ger y fynedfa i arcêd Morgan mae siop recordiau Spiller. Yn yr adeilad hwn, a godwyd yn 1898, mae'r siop recordiau hynaf yn y byd. Os bydd perchnogion newydd y rhydd-ddaliad yn gweithredu eu cynlluniau i osod rhent llawer uwch, bydd Cymru'n colli record y byd a bydd yn rhaid rhoi'r gorau i'r cynlluniau i roi plac glas ar y siop. Dim ond ddau ddrws i lawr ar hyd yr Ais o siop Spiller mae'r Tabernacl, capel Bedyddwyr Cymraeg a sefydlwyd yn 1813. Os gall yr awdurdod lleol orfodi ei gyfyngiadau cosb arfaethedig ar ddefnyddio maes parcio helaeth y capel, yna gallai nodwedd arbennig arall o Gaerdydd droi'n atgof pell.

Mae gan awdurdodau lleol ddyletswydd foesol, wrth ystyried cynlluniau datblygu, i ddiogelu tirnodau pwysig o ddiddordeb hanesyddol. Llenwyd camlas y ddinas sawl blwyddyn yn ôl, gan adael dim ond mynedfa loc y môr yn y bae, a agorwyd yn 1798. Yr oedd loc y gamlas yn adeiladwaith trawiadol, ac yn atgoffa rhywun o'r fasnach glo a haearn a ysgogodd dwf aruthrol Caerdydd. Yn anffodus, bron 200 mlynedd ar ôl ei hagog, heb rybudd, cafodd ei chladdu mewn concrit. Mae llawer peth arall yn ein hamgylchedd adeiledig sydd o werth hanesyddol ac esthetig wedi wynebu'r un dynged.

Symudaf ymlaen o'r amgylchedd adeiledig i ystyried agwedd arall ar yr amgylchedd trefol yn fyr. Mae Caerdydd yn falch o'i pharcdiroedd a'i manau agored gwyrdd, yn gywir ddigon, ac eto mae hyd yn oed rhai o'r rhain o dan fygythiad. Er gwaethaf dwysedd poblogaeth y ddinas, mae dau bwynt ar hyd echel yr A48, sy'n mynd o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin drwy'r ddinas, lle y gellir gadael y brif ffordd a cherdded drwy baredir a manau agored gwyrdd eraill i ffiniau gogleddol y

green lungs straddles the River Taff and stretches from the castle, in the heart of the capital, through Pontcanna fields, Llandaf and Radyr, to the foothills of the Garth. The other green swathe begins in Roath, at the Harlequins ground off Newport Road, and follows Nant Lleucu through Roath's many parks and along Coed Nant Fawr, through Rhydypennau and Cyncoed, and past the Llanishen and Lisvane reservoirs to Rhydri mountain. How many cities of Cardiff's size can boast such natural amenities?

The Llanisien and Llys-faen reservoirs and their surroundings were once public property and part of the Cardiff city water works, whose assets passed to Dŵr Cymru, but they were taken from public ownership when Welsh Water was privatised. Today, they are owned by Western Power Distribution, which has been trying for several years to sever this green lung by building a large housing development. It seems doubly undesirable that a natural asset, such as water, could be owned by anyone but the people of the country upon which it falls, and that the environmental asset of this green lung could be spoiled by a company from the other side of the Atlantic.

I acknowledge that my observations do not contain many—if any—firm, detailed proposals for change. I have used Cardiff as an example because it is the place that I know best, but the theme that is common to all urban areas—in Wales at least—is the need for local authorities to take greater account of the views of the general public when considering matters that pose changes to the local environment.

Hopefully, after 3 May 2007, the National Assembly may, through its new powers, seek to make changes that will lead to more respect being paid to the views of the public and to the protection and promotion of the urban environment.

**Mick Bates:** I will enter into the more strategic issues that have been raised in terms of promoting and protecting the urban environment. At the heart of this debate is the issue of planning. One of the fundamental issues raised in this debate is that of engaging

brifddinas. Mae un o'r manau gwyrdd hyn ar hyd afon Taf ac yn ymestyn o'r castell, yng nghanol y ddinas, drwy gaeau Pontcanna, Llandaf a Radur, i odre mynydd y Garth. Mae'r man gwyrdd arall yn dechrau yn y Rhath, wrth faes yr Harlequins oddi ar Newport Road, ac yn dilyn Nant Lleucu drwy barciau niferus y Rhath ac ar hyd Coed Nant Fawr, drwy Rydypennau a Chyncoed, a heibio i gronfeydd dŵr Llanisien a Llys-faen at fynydd Rhydri. Sawl dinas o faint Caerdydd sydd ag amwynderau naturiol o'r fath?

Eiddo cyhoeddus oedd cronfeydd dŵr Llanisien a Llys-faen a'u cyffiniau ar un adeg ac yr oeddent yn rhan o waith dŵr dinas Caerdydd, y trosglwyddwyd ei asedau i Dŵr Cymru, ond fe'u cymerwyd o ddwylo'r cyhoedd pan gafodd Dŵr Cymru ei breifateiddio. Heddiw, Western Power Distribution sy'n berchen arnynt, ac mae wedi bod yn ceisio dileu'r man gwyrdd hwn am sawl blwyddyn drwy adeiladu datblygiad tai mawr. Ymddengys ddwywaith mor annymunol y gallai ased naturiol, megis dŵr, fod ym meddiant unrhyw un heblaw trigolion y wlad lle y mae'n disgyn, ac y gallai ased amgylcheddol y man gwyrdd hwn gael ei ddiinstrio gan gwmni o ochr draw'r Iwerydd.

Cydnabyddaf nad yw fy sylwadau'n cynnwys fawr ddim cynigion manwl cadarn, os o gwbl, ar gyfer newid. Defnyddiais Gaerdydd fel enghraifft oherwydd dyma'r lle yr wyf fwyaf cyfarwydd ag ef, ond y thema sy'n gyffredin i bob ardal drefol—yng Nghymru o leiaf—yw'r angen i awdurdodau lleol ystyried barn y cyhoedd yn fwy wrth ystyried materion sy'n peri newidiadau i'r amgylchedd lleol.

Gobeithiaf, ar ôl 3 Mai 2007, y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, drwy ei bwerau newydd, geisio gwneud newidiadau a fydd yn golygu y caiff barn y cyhoedd ei pharchu'n fwy yn ogystal â gwaith i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo'r amgylchedd trefol.

**Mick Bates:** Trafodaf y materion mwy strategol a godwyd am hyrwyddo a diogelu'r amgylchedd trefol. Mae cynllunio wrth wraidd y ddadl hon. Un o'r materion sylfaenol a godwyd yn y ddadl hon yw ymgysylltu â'r gymuned leol. Mae hynny

with the local community. That is at the root of all good planning today. That goes back to the days of Local Agenda 21, which, as I am sure some Members will recall, was about how to engage communities in all aspects of promoting the strength of local production, engagement and planning. Some of the issues raised in the debate are extremely important. Taking up opportunities, as individual politicians and through our political parties, to engage through consultation, under the principles of Local Agenda 21, can only be beneficial.

Some of the words that I have just heard were about protection—and I often wish to protect buildings, a culture, and a way of life—but changes do occur. Your reference to large retailers, Owen John, focuses the debate in a big way. We have to engage with everyone in communities, because many people's lifestyles demand that they have one-stop shops, such as large supermarkets, while, on the other hand, we wish to support our local economy. We have to find a balance rather than stand as dictators and say, 'This is how it will be'.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I am in somewhat of a quandary because most of what Owen John talked about was about Cardiff and Cardiff City Council rather than about the Assembly and what it can do. However, I will make some observations.

Many of our town centres and city centres in Britain were either destroyed by the Luftwaffe's bombers or destroyed far more comprehensively by 1960s planners. I will compare our two main cities of Swansea and Cardiff. Swansea was bombed flat in the war. People know that it was re-built in the 1950s, when aesthetic considerations were not really uppermost in planners' minds. As a result, the architecture of much of the city is unexciting, if I can put it that way, although there are many initiatives now in Swansea to enhance the city and it has come a long way. I worked in Swansea for 10 years. Not a great deal happened in Swansea during that time but a lot has happened since then, which is a credit to the people of Swansea.

wrth wraidd pob gwaith cynllunio da heddiw. Mae hynny'n deillio o ddyddiau Agenda Leol 21, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd rhai Aelodau yn ei gofio. Yr oedd yn ymwneud â sut i gynnwys cymunedau ym mhob agwedd ar y gwaith o hyrwyddo cryfder cynhyrchu, ymgysylltu a chynllunio lleol. Mae rhai o'r materion a godwyd yn y ddadl yn hynod bwysig. Ni all ond fod o fudd manteisio ar gyfleoedd, fel gwleidyddion unigol a thrwy ein pleidiau, i ymgysylltu drwy ymgynghori, o dan egwyddorion Agenda Leol 21.

Yr oedd rhai o'r geiriau yr wyf newydd eu clywed yn gysylltiedig â diogelu—ac yr wyf am ddiogelu adeiladau, diwylliant a ffordd o fyw yn aml—ond mae newidiadau'n digwydd. Mae eich cyfeiriad at fanwerthwyr mawr, Owen John, yn canolbwyntio'r ddadl i raddau helaeth. Rhaid inni ymgysylltu â phawb mewn cymunedau, am fod ffordd o fyw llawer o bobl yn mynnu bod ganddynt siopau un stop, megis archfarchnadoedd mawr, ond, ar y llaw arall, yr ydym am gefnogi ein heconomi leol. Rhaid inni sicrhau cydbwysedd yn hytrach na dweud fel unbeniaid, 'Dyma sut y bydd hi'.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Yr wyf mewn penbleth i ryw raddau oherwydd yr oedd a wnelo'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn y soniodd Owen John amdano â Chaerdydd a Chyngor Dinas Caerdydd, yn hytrach na'r Cynulliad a'r hyn y gall ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, cynigiau rai sylwadau.

Cafodd llawer o ganol trefi a chanol dinasoedd ym Mhrydain naill ai eu dinistrio gan awyrennau bomio'r Luftwaffe neu eu dinistrio'n llawer mwy cynhwysfawr gan gynllunwyr yn y 1960au. Byddaf yn cymharu ein dwy ddinas fawr, sef Abertawe a Chaerdydd. Cafodd Abertawe ei gwastatáu gan fomiau yn y rhyfel. Gwyddys iddi gael ei hailadeiladu yn y 1950au, pan nad ystyriaethau esthetig oedd bwysicaf ym meddwl cynllunwyr. O ganlyniad, mae pensaernïaeth llawer o'r ddinas yn ddiflas, os gallaf ddweud hynny, er bod llawer o fentrau bellach yn Abertawe i wella'r ddinas ac mae wedi gwneud llawer o gynnydd. Gweithiais yn Abertawe am 10 mlynedd. Ni ddigwyddodd llawer yn Abertawe yn ystod y

cyfnod hwnnw ond mae llawer wedi digwydd ers hynny, sy'n glod i drigolion Abertawe.

It is a known fact among some Members that there was a plan in the 1960s to demolish St Mary's street and the arcades in Cardiff because they were too old-fashioned. It almost happened, I am told. The First Minister has a good knowledge of that, and has told me many times of the disaster that that would have created in Cardiff. Had we ended up with a 1960s-designed town centre—particularly given the contribution that the 1960s made to architecture—I do not think that it would have been particularly wonderful for the city.

5.30 p.m.

In the 1980s and 1990s, we also saw a proliferation of large shops at the expense, in my view, of town centres. In North America, there is a name for the phenomenon: 'doughnutting'. That is when you see a town or city centre that is empty, derelict, with nothing in it, and all the development and shops outside in suburbia, so there is a hole in the middle with everything surrounding it. We have not yet reached that stage in Wales, not even in the 1980s and 1990s. However, many towns in Wales, and I include my home town of Bridgend as one, saw a significant hammering of their town centres because of an overproliferation of out-of-town stores. That has now come to an end. It is right to say that, particularly in the early 1990s, planning guidance on out-of-town shopping centres was particularly weak—nothing was done to discourage them and nothing was done to encourage town centres.

However, we must bear in mind that you cannot keep shops open, and you cannot use the planning system to ensure that a shop stays open; however, you can use it to ensure that town centres are enhanced. That has been done, because, in our planning guidance and the technical advice note that deals with shopping, there is a sequential test that has to be followed before an out-of-town shopping centre can be granted planning permission. The TAN requires developers to look at town centres, and there has to be an analysis of the effect of a proposed development on a town centre, all of which is quite new in planning

Mae rhai Aelodau'n gwybod bod cynllun yn y 1960au i ddymchwel Heol Eglwys Fair ac arcedau Caerdydd am eu bod yn rhy henffasiwn. Bu bron i hynny â digwydd, mae'n debyg. Mae gan y Prif Weinidog wybodaeth dda am hynny, ac mae wedi sôn wrthyf droeon am y trychineb y byddai hynny wedi ei achosi yng Nghaerdydd. Pe baem wedi cael canol tref a gynlluniwyd yn y 1960au—yn arbennig o gofio cyfraniad y 1960au i bensaerniaeth—ni chredaf y byddai wedi bod yn arbennig o wych i'r ddinas.

Yn yr 1980au a'r 1990au, datblygwyd toreth o siopau mawr ar draul canol trefi, yn fy marn i. Yng Ngogledd America, mae enw ar y fath ffenomen, sef 'doughnutting'. Mae'n disgrifio sefyllfa pan fydd canol tref neu ddinas yn wag, yn mynd ar ei gwaeth, a dim yno, a'r holl ddatblygiadau a'r siopau y tu allan yn y maestrefi, gan greu twll yn y canol a phopeth yn ei amgylchynu. Nid ydym wedi cyrraedd y cam hwnnw yng Nghymru eto, hyd yn oed yn yr 1980au a'r 1990au. Fodd bynnag, cafodd canol llawer tref yng Nghymru ergyd ddiffrifol, gan gynnwys Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, fy nghartref i, oherwydd y toreth siopau y tu allan i drefi. Daeth hynny i ben bellach. Mae'n briodol dweud bod canllawiau cynllunio ar gyfer siopau y tu allan i drefi, yn arbennig ar ddechrau'r 1990au, yn arbennig o wan—nid oedd dim yn cael ei wneud i'w hatal na dim yn cael ei wneud i hyrwyddo canol trefi.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio na allwch gadw siopau ar agor, ac na allwch ddefnyddio'r system gynllunio i sicrhau bod siop yn aros ar agor; fodd bynnag, gallwch ei defnyddio i sicrhau y caiff canol trefi eu gwella. Mae hynny wedi ei wneud, am fod y canllawiau cynllunio a'r nodyn cyngor technegol sy'n ymdrin â siopa yn cynnwys prawf dilyniannol y mae'n rhaid ei ddilyn cyn y gellir rhoi caniatâd cynllunio i ganolfan siopa y tu allan i dref. Mae'r nodyn cyngor technegol yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ddatblygwyr edrych ar ganol trefi, a rhaid gwneud dadansoddiad o effaith y datblygiad

terms.

I think that I am right in saying that the number of out-of-town supermarkets in Wales has dropped in the past eight or nine years. Thinking about many of the towns around south Wales, that is probably correct. Supermarkets have opened in town centres, but a supermarket in a town centre brings people in for the potential benefit of the town, while an out-of-town supermarket does nothing for the benefit of the town centre. That much has changed, which is all for the good. As Minister for planning, I have been criticised before now for not allowing out-of-town stores to be built. Sometimes, of course, you cannot win in this job, but that is just how things are.

One perceived difficulty with the planning system is that people often feel outside the loop—they do not have the opportunity to put forward their point of view. The main reason for that is that, quite often, a planning application comes forward that creates a great deal of controversy locally but is, nevertheless, already a part of the development plan. As a constituency AM, when people come to me for advice, I tell them that it is the development plan that is the important stage if they want to make an objection. If a particular area of land is allocated for retail, for example, and a retail application is made on that land, it stands to reason that it is likely—though it is not always the case—that that application will be approved in the teeth, perhaps with local opposition to the development plan. Of course, it may have been stipulated many years ago in the plan that the development should go there.

A major change in the development plan process in Wales is the introduction of local development plans. They are different for many reasons, but one reason in particular is the fact that, before a local development plan can be approved by a council, there has to be a demonstration that a community involvement scheme has been set up and carried through. That has never happened before in the history of planning in Wales. A local authority has to demonstrate how it involved the local community, particularly

arfaethedig ar ganol tref, ac mae hyn i gyd yn gymharol newydd o ran cynllunio.

Credaf fy mod yn iawn i ddweud bod nifer yr archfarchnadoedd y tu allan i drefi wedi gostwng yng Nghymru yn yr wyth neu'r naw mlynedd diwethaf. Gan feddwl am lawer o'r trefi yn y de, mae'n debyg bod hynny'n gywir. Mae archfarchnadoedd wedi agor yng nghanol trefi, ond mae archfarchnad yng nghanol tref yn denu pobl i mewn er budd posibl y dref, ond nid yw archfarchnad y tu allan i dref o unrhyw fudd i ganol y dref. Mae hynny wedi newid, er gwell. Fel y Gweinidog dros gynllunio, cefais fy meirniadu cyn hyn am beidio â chaniatáu i siopau gael eu hadeiladu y tu allan i drefi. Weithiau, wrth gwrs, mae'n amhosibl ennill yn y swydd hon, ond dyna sut y mae pethau.

Un anhawster canfyddedig gyda'r system gynllunio yw bod pobl yn aml yn teimlo y tu allan i'r ddolen—ni chânt y cyfle i gyflwyno eu barn. Y prif reswm am hynny, yn aml iawn, yw y caiff cais cynllunio ei gyflwyno sy'n destun dadleuon tanbaid yn lleol ond sydd, er hynny, eisoes yn rhan o'r cynllun datblygu. Fel AC etholaethol, pan ddaw pobl ataf am gyngor, byddaf yn eu hysbysu mai'r cynllun datblygu yw'r cam pwysig os ydynt am wrthwynebu. Os oes ardal arbennig o dir wedi ei dynodi ar gyfer manwerthu, er enghraifft, ac y gwneir cais i fanwerthu ar y tir hwnnw, mae'n rhesymol bosibl—er nad dyna'r achos bob amser—y caiff y cais ei gymeradwyo mewn egwyddor, efallai gyda gwrthwynebiad lleol i'r cynllun datblygu. Wrth gwrs, gall fod wedi ei bennu flynyddoedd yn ôl yn y cynllun mai dyna lle y dylid lleoli'r datblygiad.

Un newid mawr ynn y broses cynlluniau datblygu yng Nghymru yw cyflwyno cynlluniau datblygu lleol. Maent yn wahanol am nifer o resymau, ond un rheswm yn benodol yw'r ffaith bod angen dangos yn glir bod cynllun cynhwysiant cymunedol wedi ei sefydlu a'i gyflwyno cyn y gall cynllun datblygu lleol gael ei gymeradwyo gan gyngor. Nid yw hynny erioed wedi digwydd o'r blaen yn hanes cynllunio yng Nghymru. Rhaid i awdurdod lleol ddangos sut y bu iddo gynnwys y gymuned leol, yn arbennig

local groups, in the creation of the local development plan. The crucial stage when it comes to planning is what is in the development plan, rather than what planning applications are made after the plan has been approved.

Owen John mentioned Dublin, which is a city that I know quite well. I first went there in 1988 and—there is no getting away from it—it was really quite run down, but you could still drive around it. The city has changed a great deal now, though I would not offer it up as a model transport solution for Cardiff. For a long time, the city was gridlocked—in fact, it still is—but the introduction of the new Luas tram system has made a difference, even though the roads are still heavily used by traffic, which continues to be a great problem in the city itself.

I am not sure whether I would agree that steps have been taken in Dublin to protect the character of shopping streets, any more than is the case in Cardiff. If we look at St Mary's street, for example, we see that the buildings are still intact although the shop fronts have changed. The same is true of Dublin. If you walked up Grafton street in Dublin—which was, until quite recently, the only pedestrianised street in the city, but O'Connell street is also pedestrianised now—you would see much the same shops as you would see in the UK or in other big cities in Ireland. McDonald's there is the same as it is in Cardiff—the shop front is much the same. Therefore, I am not sure whether they have managed, in that sense, to protect the character of the city. There are some cities in Britain where that has been done; in Chester, for example, the architecture has meant that controls were imposed on shop fronts. However, I am not so sure about Dublin.

Talking of Dublin, there was a proposal not so long ago, in the 1980s, to knock down Temple Bar and turn it into a bus station. If you know Dublin at all, you will know that that shows that the Republic of Ireland does not have a monopoly on wisdom—although, at the end of the day, it did not happen.

grwpiau lleol, wrth greu'r cynllun datblygu lleol. Y cam pwysig o ran cynllunio yw'r hyn sydd yn y cynllun datblygu, yn hytrach na pha geisiadau cynllunio a gaiff eu cyflwyno ar ôl i'r cynllun gael ei gymeradwyo.

Soniodd Owen John am Ddilyn, sy'n ddinas yr wyf yn eithaf cyfarwydd â hi. Ymwelais â hi gyntaf yn 1988—ac a dweud yn blwmp ac yn blaen—yr oedd wedi dirywio'n sylweddol, er eich bod yn gallu gyrru o'i hamgylch. Mae'r ddinas wedi newid yn sylweddol erbyn hyn, er na fyddwn yn ei chynnig fel model o system drafndiaeth ar gyfer Caerdydd. Bu'r ddinas, am gyfnod hir, yn ddi-symud—ac mae felly o hyd, a dweud y gwir—ond mae cyflwyno'r system tram Luas newydd wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth, er bod y ffyrdd yn parhau i fod yn llawn traffig, sy'n parhau i fod yn broblem fawr yn y ddinas ei hun.

Nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddwn yn cytuno bod camau wedi cael eu cymryd yn Nulyn i ddiogelu cymeriad y strydoedd siopa, fwy nag yng Nghaerdydd. Gan ystyried stryd y Santes Fair, er enghraifft, fe welwn fod yr adeiladau yn parhau'n gadarn er bod blaen y siopau wedi newid. Mae hyn yn wir hefyd yn Nulyn. Pe baech yn cerdded i fyny stryd Grafton yn Nulyn—sef yr unig stryd yn y ddinas i gerddwyr yn unig tan yn ddiweddar iawn, er bod stryd O'Connell bellach i gerddwyr hefyd—byddech yn gweld fwy neu lai yr un siopau ag mewn unrhyw ddinasoedd mawr eraill yn y DU neu Iwerddon. Mae McDonald's yno yr un fath â'r un yng Nghaerdydd—mae blaen y siop yn debyg iawn. Felly, nid wyf yn siŵr a ydynt, yn hynny o beth, wedi llwyddo i ddiogelu cymeriad y ddinas. Ceir rhai dinasoedd ym Mhrydain, lle mae hynny wedi digwydd: yng Nghaer, er enghraifft, mae'r bensaerniaeth yn golygu bod rheoliadau wedi eu gosod ar flaenau siopau. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf mor siŵr ynglŷn â Dilyn.

Wrth sôn am Ddilyn, nid oes fawr o dro ers y cynnig, yn y 1980au, i ddymchwel Temple Bar a'i droi'n orsaf fysiau. Os ydych yn gyfarwydd â Dilyn o gwbl, fe wyddoch fod hynny'n dangos nad oes gan Weriniaeth Iwerddon fonopoli ar ddoethineb—er na ddigwyddodd hynny yn y diwedd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Churchill had plans for it, too.

**Carwyn Jones:** There are many examples of planning proposals that have gladly fallen by the wayside. Unfortunately, as you rightly say, many planning proposals in Wales have been carried through, to the detriment of the urban and rural environment.

To conclude, we have a design technical advice note—TAN 12—which seeks to deal with questions of design, and what is appropriate in particular settings. We have Cadw, which is able to give advice to local authorities and to the Assembly Government when it comes to call-in decisions, and it has a view on historic buildings as well as historic landscapes. Quite often, Cadw will recommend a call-in to a Minister responsible for planning, and, as a result of that recommendation, an application would be called in. Therefore, there is that fallback, which then leads to a public inquiry. However, we also have the sequential test in planning guidance, as I mentioned earlier, which means that it is a requirement that an out-of-town supermarket opening should not have an arduous effect on a town centre. That has had a real effect in the past few years.

We should celebrate Cardiff. As someone from Bridgend, which is halfway between Swansea and Cardiff, I think that we can be proud of our capital city—although I was born in Swansea, so I am honour-bound to defend my native city. Cardiff has kept its character, and it has a lot in it for a city that is really quite small, if you compare it with cities such as Belfast or Sheffield. There is a lot going on, and I think that the city will continue to prosper for many years to come—unless, as Jenny Randerson mentioned, we are all under water by that time.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That closes business for this afternoon.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr oedd gan Churchill gynlluniau ar ei gyfer hefyd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae nifer o enghreifftiau o gynigion cynllunio nad ydynt, yn ffodus, wedi dwyn ffrwyth. Yn anffodus, fel yr ydych yn gywir i'w nodi, mae nifer o gynigion cynllunio yng Nghymru wedi cael eu gwireddu, er anfantais i'r amgylchedd trefol a gwledig.

I gloi, mae gennym nodyn cyngor technegol cynllunio—TAN 12—sy'n ceisio ymdrin â materion cynllunio, a'r hyn sy'n briodol mewn sefyllfaoedd penodol. Mae Cadw gennym, sy'n gallu cyngori awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar alw penderfyniadau i mewn, ac mae ganddo safbwynt ar adeiladau hanesyddol yn ogystal â thirwedd hanesyddol. Yn aml iawn, bydd Cadw yn argymhell Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio i alw cais i mewn ac, o ganlyniad i'r argymhelliad hwnnw, byddai cais yn cael ei alw i mewn. Felly, mae'r broses honno wrth gefn, sy'n arwain wedyn at ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, mae'r prawf dilyniannol ar gael o fewn y canllawiau cynllunio, fel y soniais yn gynharach, sy'n golygu ei bod yn ofynnol i archfarchnad sy'n agor y tu allan i dref beidio â chael effaith andwyol ar ganol y dref honno. Mae hynny wedi cael effaith wirioneddol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Dylem ddathlu Caerdydd. Fel rhywun o Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr, sydd hanner y ffordd rhwng Abertawe a Chaerdydd, credaf y gallwn fod yn falch o'n prifddinas—er mai yn Abertawe y cefais fy ngeni, felly mae'n ddyletswydd arnaf amddiffyn fy ninas enedigol. Mae Caerdydd wedi cadw ei chymeriad, ac mae llawer ynddi o ystyried mai dinas fach ydyw mewn gwirionedd, o'i chymharu â dinasoedd megis Belfast neu Sheffield. Mae llawer yn digwydd, a chredaf y bydd y ddinas yn parhau i ffynnu am flynyddoedd i ddod—oni fyddwn i gyd, fel y soniodd Jenny Randerson, o dan ddŵr erbyn hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â busnes heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.37 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.37 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)