



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 5 Rhagfyr 2000**  
**Tuesday 5 December 2000**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 12 Cwestiwn Brys: Streic Gweithwyr y Post  
*Urgent Question: The Postal Workers' Strike*
- 16 Datganiad ar Golli Swyddi yn Alcan, Rogerstone  
*Statement on Job Losses at Alcan, Rogerstone*
- 22 Datganiad ar Galedi ac Ariannu Myfyrwyr  
*Statement on Student Hardship and Funding*
- 27 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 28 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 28 Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio  
*Planning Decision Committee*
- 30 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Dysgu a Medrau (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2000  
*Approval of the Learning and Skills Act 2000 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) 2000*
- 31 Polisi'r Cynulliad ar y Bartneriaeth Cyhoeddus-Preifat/Y Fenter Cyllid Preifat  
*The Assembly's Public-Private Partnership/Private Finance Initiative Policy*
- 52 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales): Ffurflen Cyfrifiad 2001  
*Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales): 2001 Census Form*
- 69 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22  
*Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 22*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.*

*The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

### **Cysylltiadau Fferi rhwng Cymru a Thir Mawr Sbaen Ferry Links between Wales and Mainland Spain**

**Q1 Christine Gwyther:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales about increasing ferry links between Wales and mainland Spain? (OAQ8221)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I have not had any discussions on this subject with the Secretary of State for Wales. The provision of ferry services is a commercial matter for shipping companies. There are currently no ferry services operating between Wales and Spain. If a service was proposed that required expanding port facilities, transport grant and, possibly, regional selective assistance would be available. However, that would be for dockside facilities, not for the ships or the ferry services.

**Christine Gwyther:** This idea was on the stocks for some years in the days of the former Dyfed County Council, although it was never carried through to its conclusion. As the Assembly works ever closer with Europe, do you think that we should consider more physical links with Europe and perhaps encourage companies to consider Wales in a similar way?

**The First Minister:** I take it that Christine refers to mainland Europe when she mentions Europe. Ireland is also a part of Europe and, through the INTERREG programme, we are trying to encourage improved dockside facilities at Holyhead, Pembroke Dock or Fishguard. Swansea is not within the INTERREG area. However, the other three ferry ports would be eligible candidates for grants. Irish ferry links are obvious. However, ferry links to mainland Spain or other European countries are a great problem. The length of the journey on ship would be about 24 hours. Ferry links must compete with much faster journey times,

**C1 Christine Gwyther:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch cynyddu'r cysylltiadau fferi rhwng Cymru a thir mawr Sbaen? (OAQ8221)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau ar y mater hwn gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Mater masnachol i gwmnïau llongau yw darparu gwasanaethau fferi. Ar hyn o bryd nid oes gwasanaethau fferi yn gweithredu rhwng Cymru a Sbaen. Os caiff gwasanaeth ei gynnig fyddai'n gofyn am ehangu cyfleusterau porthladdoedd, byddai grant trafndiaeth ac, o bosibl, cymorth dethol rhanbarthol ar gael. Fodd bynnag, ar gyfer cyfleusterau yn y doc fyddai hynny, nid ar gyfer y llongau na'r gwasanaethau fferi.

**Christine Gwyther:** Bu'r syniad hwn ar y gweill am rai blynyddoedd yn nyddiau Cyngor Sir Dyfed gynt, er na chafodd ei weithredu i'r diwedd. Wrth i'r Cynulliad weithio'n agosach nag erioed ag Ewrop, a gredwch y dylem ystyried cysylltiadau mwy ffisegol ag Ewrop ac efallai annog cwmnïau i ystyried Cymru mewn ffordd debyg?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cymeraf fod Christine yn cyfeirio at dir mawr Ewrop pan gyfeiria at Ewrop. Mae Iwerddon hefyd yn rhan o Ewrop a, thrwy raglen INTERREG, ceisiwn annog gwell cyfleusterau dociau yng Nghaerdybi, Doc Penfro neu Abergwaun. Nid yw Abertawe o fewn ardal INTERREG. Fodd bynnag, byddai'r tri phorthladd fferi arall yn ymgeiswyr cymwys i gael grantiau. Mae cysylltiadau fferi ag Iwerddon yn amlwg. Fodd bynnag, mae cysylltiadau fferi i dir mawr Sbaen neu wledydd Ewropeaidd eraill yn broblem fawr. Byddai hyd y daith ar long tua 24 awr. Rhaid i gysylltiadau fferi gystadlu ag amseroedd teithio llawer

such as those provided by the channel tunnel fixed link. In general, the amount of traffic travelling by ferry to mainland Europe is declining because of increasing competition by the channel tunnel.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Given Christine's comments about the importance of links to mainland Europe, with which I am sure we would all agree in principle, do you agree that it would be beneficial for the Assembly to join the Assembly of European Regions, as discussed in last week's meeting of the Committee on European Affairs? That could provide training opportunities to assist our civil service to raise its game in dealing with European issues.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question relates to ferries, not to the Assembly of European Regions. Although that was an ingenious supplementary, the First Minister need not answer it.

**The First Minister:** I cannot see the link either, Presiding Officer. I agree with your ruling.

cyflymach, fel y rhai a ddarperir gan gysylltiad sefydlog twnnel y sianel. Yn gyffredinol, mae'r traffig sydd yn teithio ar fferi i dir mawr Ewrop yn lleihau oherwydd cystadleuaeth gynyddol gan dwnnel y sianel.

**Helen Mary Jones:** O ystyried sylwadau Christine ar bwysigrwydd cysylltiadau â thir mawr Ewrop, y byddem oll yn cytuno â hwy o ran egwyddor yr wyf yn siŵr, a gytunwch y byddai o fantais i'r Cynulliad ymuno â Chynulliad Rhanbarthau Ewrop, fel y trafodwyd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd yr wythnos diwethaf? Gallai hynny ddarparu cyfleoedd hyfforddi i gynorthwyo ein gwasanaeth sifil i wella ei ymdriniaeth â materion Ewropeaidd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â llongau fferi, nid â Chynulliad y Rhanbarthau Ewropeaidd. Er bod hynny'n atodiad celfydd, nid oes raid i'r Prif Weinidog ei ateb.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni welaf innau'r cysylltiad chwaith, Lywydd. Cytunaf â'ch dyfarniad.

### **Datblygu Polisi o Gwmpas Materion Trawsbynciol Developing Policy around Cross-cutting Issues**

**Q2 Pauline Jarman:** Will the First Minister make a brief statement on what resources are being used to develop policy around cross-cutting issues? (OAQ8246)

**The First Minister:** Approximately £100,000 is available for promoting sustainable development and for consultancy work. A total of £90,000 has been allocated as promoting opportunity grants, and £55,000 on the right to vote project. People in Communities schemes are forecasted to receive £1.7 million by the year-end. However, I am sure that Pauline agrees that cross-cutting themes are themes, and therefore, funding over the whole spectrum of Assembly responsibility contributes to developing those themes, as do some initiatives that are run from Westminster Government departments.

**C2 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ar ba adnoddau sydd yn cael eu defnyddio i ddatblygu polisi o gwmpas materion trawsbynciol? (OAQ8246)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae tua £100,000 ar gael i hybu datblygiad cynaliadwy ac ar gyfer gwaith ymgynghorol. Dyrannwyd cyfanswm o £90,000 fel grantiau hybu cyfleoedd, a £55,000 ar y prosiect hawl i bleidleisio. Rhagwelir y bydd cynlluniau Pobl mewn Cymunedau yn derbyn £1.7 miliwn erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr bod Pauline yn cytuno bod themâu trawsbynciol yn themâu, ac felly, mae ariannu ar draws sbectrwm cyfan cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad yn cyfrannu tuag at ddatblygu'r themâu hynny, fel y mae rhai mentrau a gaiff eu rheoli o adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan.

**Pauline Jarman:** The Human Rights Act 1998, which came into force on 2 October 2000, is one of the most important cross-cutting issues. In a recent judgment, a Scottish court found the actions of a Scottish Minister who had sought to call in a planning application and appointed an inspector to conduct the public local inquiry to be in breach of article 6 of the European Convention on Human Rights. As planning procedures are the same in Wales, how can we be certain that everyone's human rights are properly provided for?

**The First Minister:** I am sure that Pauline is aware that the UK has two parallel yet different legal systems—one for Scotland and another for the rest of the UK. There is some play-off between the two, and one will sometimes follow the other. These are fairly fundamental issues, as the European Convention on Human Rights has been incorporated into domestic law. However, the legal systems will not necessarily act at the same time. Although the same issue could arise, I will not predict what could happen in the courts under the England and Wales system, based on a precedent from a different legal system in Scotland.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 3 has been withdrawn.

**Pauline Jarman:** Mae Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998, a ddaeth i rym ar 2 Hydref 2000, yn un o'r materion trawsbynciol pwysicaf. Mewn dyfarniad ddiweddar, dyfarnodd llys yn yr Alban fod gweithredoedd Gweinidog o'r Alban a ymdrechodd i alw cais cynllunio i mewn a phenodi arolygydd i gynnal yr archwiliad lleol cyhoeddus yn mynd yn groes i erthygl 6 y Confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol. Gan fod yr un gweithdrefnau cynllunio yng Nghymru, sut y gallwn fod yn bendant y darperir yn gywir ar gyfer hawliau dynol pawb?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Pauline yn ymwybodol bod gan y DU ddwy system gyfreithiol baralel ond gwahanol—un ar gyfer yr Alban ac un arall ar gyfer gweddill y DU. Ceir rhywfaint o wrthgyferbyniad rhwng y ddau, ac weithiau bydd un yn dilyn y llall. Mae'r rhain yn faterion gweddol sylfaenol, gan bod y Confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol wedi'i ymgorffori i gyfraith ddomestig. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd y systemau cyfreithiol o reidrwydd yn gweithredu ar yr un pryd. Er y gallai'r un mater godi, ni ragwelaf beth allai ddigwydd yn y llysoedd o dan system Cymru a Lloegr, yn seiliedig ar gysail o system gyfreithiol wahanol yn yr Alban.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3 yn ôl.

### **Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn Wyl Gyhoeddus St David's Day as a Public Holiday**

**C4 Owen John Thomas:** Pryd y bydd Prif Weinidog Cymru mewn sefyllfa i gyhoeddi bod Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn wyl gyhoeddus yn unol â'r cynnig a basiwyd yn y Siambr hon ar 1 Mawrth 2000? (OAQ8218)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mater yw hwn i Paul Murphy, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ac i'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan. Nid yw'r mater o greu gwyliau banc newydd wedi'i ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch bod y cytundeb Lib-Lab bondigrybwyll wedi mabwysiadu'r amcan a dderbyniwyd yn

**Q4 Owen John Thomas:** When will the First Minister be in a position to announce that St David's Day is a public holiday in accordance with the motion passed in this Chamber on 1 March 2000? (OAQ8218)

**The First Minister:** This is a matter for Paul Murphy, the Secretary of State for Wales, and for the Government in Westminster. The matter of creating new bank holidays has not been devolved to the Assembly.

**Owen John Thomas:** I am pleased that the Lib-Lab agreement has adopted the objective that was accepted unanimously by the

unfrydol gan y Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth eleni. Dyma gyfle inni ddangos mewn ffordd syml ond symbolaidd bod y corff hwn yn gallu gwireddu ein penderfyniadau. Fel un a bleidleisiodd o blaid y cynnig hwnnw, a wnewch chi ysgrifennu at y Prif Weinidog arall a rhoi gwybod iddo bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru am iddo, heb oedi dim, drefnu i 1 Mawrth ddod yn ŵyl banc genedlaethol yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yr un mor awyddus ag Owen John Thomas ac eraill i sefydlu Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl banc yng Nghymru. Dengys y cytundeb partneriaeth mai un o'n hymrwymiaidau yw pwysu ar y Llywodraeth yn Llundain i wneud 1 Mawrth yn ŵyl banc newydd yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i ofyn iddo ymgynghori â'i gyfeillion yn y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan. Ni fu llwyddiant hyd yn hyn o ran unrhyw gyhoeddiadau gan y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan.

**Peter Black:** I also welcome the commitment in the partnership agreement to declare St David's Day as a public holiday. Given that there are a number of commitments in the partnership agreement that rely on the UK Government to deliver them, what discussions have taken place with the UK Government about how that partnership agreement can be taken forward using UK legislation or Orders in Council as appropriate?

**The First Minister:** Starting with the St David's Day bank holiday issue, which is not a devolved matter, those discussions would normally take place via the Secretary of State for Wales because that is what he is there for. Sometimes, these discussions take place with the Government more collectively. The Government is fully aware of the partnership agreement's content. It did not dance in the street about one or two aspects of it—as one would expect—but thought that it was, in general, a good way forward for delivering for the people of Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn

Assembly on 1 March this year. This is an opportunity for us to show in a simple yet symbolic way that this body can carry out our resolutions. As one who voted in favour of that motion, will you write to the Prime Minister and inform him that the National Assembly for Wales wishes him to arrange, without delay, for 1 March to become a national bank holiday in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I am as eager as Owen John Thomas and others to establish St David's Day as a bank holiday in Wales. The partnership agreement shows that one of our commitments is to urge the Government in London to make 1 March a new bank holiday in Wales. I have written to the Secretary of State for Wales to ask him to consult with his colleagues in the Westminster Government. There has been no success to date as far as any announcement by the Government in Westminster is concerned.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf hefyd yr ymrwymiad yn y cytundeb partneriaeth i ddatgan Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl gyhoeddus. O ystyried bod nifer o ymrwymiaidau yn y cytundeb partneriaeth sydd yn dibynnu ar Lywodraeth y DU i'w cyflwyno, pa drafodaethau a gynhaliwyd gyda Llywodraeth y DU ar sut y gellid mynd i'r afael â'r cytundeb partneriaeth hwnnw gan ddefnyddio deddfwriaeth y DU neu Orchmynion y Cyfrin Gyngor fel y bo'n briodol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gan ddechrau gyda mater gŵyl y banc Dydd Gŵyl Dewi, nad yw'n fater a ddatganolwyd, cynhelir y trafodaethau hynny fel arfer drwy Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru oherwydd dyna yw ei bwrpas. Weithiau, cynhelir y trafodaethau hyn gyda'r Llywodraeth yn fwy cyfunol. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn llawn ymwybodol o gynnwys y cytundeb partneriaeth. Nid oedd yn gorfoddelu am un neu ddau agwedd arno—fel y disgwylir—ond credodd ei fod, yn gyffredinol, yn ffordd dda ymlaen i ddarparu ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

**Alun Cairns:** Does the Minister accept that

bod Plaid Geidwadol Cymru wedi chwarae rôl flaenllaw wrth alw am ŵyl y banc ar Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi? Fodd bynnag, yn y datganiad barn gwreiddiol, cydnabuasom na allem gael diwrnod gŵyl y banc ychwanegol. A ydych yn derbyn, felly, fod gan Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi fwy o arwyddocâd i hanes Cymru na gŵyl y banc 1 Mai?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oedd yr hyn y mae Alun newydd ei ddisgrifio yn gyfraniad unigryw gan y Blaid Geidwadol. Ni chredaf fod y pleidiau eraill yn y Cynulliad am wneud y math hwnnw o amod ar yr alwad am ŵyl banc ychwanegol ar 1 Mawrth. Mae gan y Blaid Doriadaidd bob hawl i fod ar wahân i'r pleidiau eraill yn y Cynulliad, fel y mae yn aml. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn cael ei ystyried fel rhan o'r drafodaeth ynghylch cael gŵyl banc ychwanegol i San Siôr yn Lloegr a San Andreas yn yr Alban. Dethlir Dydd San Padrig fel gŵyl y banc yng Ngogledd Iwerddon yn barod. Fodd bynnag, dim ond hanner y bobl yng Ngogledd Iwerddon sydd yn dathlu'r diwrnod hwnnw.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 5 has been withdrawn.

the Welsh Conservative Party has taken a leading role in calling for a bank holiday on St David's Day? However, in the original statement, we recognised that we could not have an additional bank holiday. Do you accept, therefore, that St David's Day has greater significance to the history of Wales than the 1 May bank holiday?

**The First Minister:** What Alun has just described was a unique contribution from the Conservative Party. I do not believe that the other parties in this Assembly wanted to impose that kind of a condition on the call for an additional bank holiday on 1 March. The Tory Party has every right to set itself apart from the other parties in the Assembly, as it often does. This question is being considered as part of the discussion on having an additional bank holiday for St George's Day in England and St Andrew's Day in Scotland. St Patrick's Day is already celebrated as a bank holiday in Northern Ireland. However, only half the people in Northern Ireland celebrate that day.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 5 yn ôl.

### Briffio'r Wasg Briefing the Press

**C6 David Davies:** A yw'n bolisi gan y Cabinet i friffio'r wasg cyn Aelodau'r Cynulliad? (OAQ8219)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nac ydyw—nid ar yr un pynciau na'r un cynnwys beth bynnag. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn, David, am ei fod yn rhoi'r cyfle imi ailadrodd ein polisi. Mae gennym brotocol i sicrhau nad yw cynnwys datganiadau a wneir yn y Siambwr yn cael ei ddatgelu i'r wasg nac i unrhyw un arall—ac eithrio Gweinidogion a rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau—nes eu bod yn cael eu gwneud ger bron y corff hwn.

2:10 p.m.

**David Davies:** A gytunwch fod y wasg fel arfer yn gwybod am y datganiadau cyn Aelodau'r Cynulliad? A wnewch chi sicrhau y bydd yr Aelodau yn gwybod am y

**Q6 David Davies:** Is it Cabinet policy to brief the press before Members of the Assembly? (OAQ8219)

**The First Minister:** No, it is not—at least not on the same subjects or contents. However, I am grateful for your question, David, because it gives me the opportunity to reiterate our policy. We have a protocol to ensure that the content of statements made in the Chamber is not released to the press or anyone else—with the exception of Ministers and party business managers—until they are made before this body.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that the press usually knows about the statements before Assembly Members? Will you ensure that in future Members know about the statements

datganiadau cyn y wasg yn y dyfodol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni all David roi enghraifft. Sylwais na roddodd enghraifft wrth wneud y sylw hwnnw, er mwyn imi ymateb iddo. Efallai ei fod yn derbyn bod unrhyw honiad ein bod yn rhoi gwybodaeth i'r wasg cyn ei rhoi yn gyflawn i'r Cynulliad yn ddi-sail.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Do you read the *Daily Mirror* on Saturday?

**The First Minister:** No, I do not.

**Jocelyn Davies:** So there you are then. [*Laughter.*]

**The First Minister:** Is that a parliamentary expression?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I request that Members only ask one supplementary. Question 7 from Kirsty Williams has been withdrawn. Members will note that I am reading 'withdrawn questions' slowly and carefully.

### **Monitro a yw'r Polisiâu yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' yn cael eu Gweithredu Monitoring the Achievement of Policies contained in 'Putting Wales First'**

**Q8 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the First Minister make a statement on how he will monitor whether the policies contained in 'Putting Wales First' are being met? (OAQ8228)

**The First Minister:** When I made the statement in Plenary on 21 November on 'Putting Wales First' I indicated that the programme will run until July 2001—the beginning of the next summer recess—and it was the annual government business programme. On this occasion, because it is the first one, it is not annual but eight months long. Normally, it would be expected to cover a full legislative and executive work programme for a 12-month period. The monitoring of that programme is a matter for the Executive and the opposition parties because we are accountable to the Assembly for whether we have done what we set out to

before the press?

**The First Minister:** David is not able to give an example. I noted that he did not provide an example while making that comment, so that I could respond to him. Perhaps he accepts that any allegation that we give information to the press before giving it in full to the Assembly is without foundation.

**Jocelyn Davies:** A ydych yn darllen y *Daily Mirror* ar ddydd Sadwrn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nac ydw.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Dyna chi felly. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** A yw hynny'n ddywediad seneddol?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dymunaf mai dim ond un cwestiwn atodol y dylai'r Aelodau ei ofyn. Tynnwyd cwestiwn 7 gan Kirsty Williams yn ôl. Noda'r Aelodau fy mod yn darllen y 'cwestiynau a dynnwyd yn ôl' yn araf ac yn ofalus.

**C8 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar sut y bydd yn monitro a yw'r polisiâu yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' yn cael eu gweithredu? (OAQ8228)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Pan wneuthum y datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 21 Tachwedd ar 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' nodais y cynhelir y rhaglen tan fis Gorffennaf 2001—dechrau'r toriad haf nesaf—ac mai hon oedd rhaglen fusnes flynyddol y llywodraeth. Y tro hwn, oherwydd am mai hon yw'r un gyntaf, nid yw'n flynyddol ond yn wyth mis o hyd. Fel arfer, disgwylir iddo gwmpasu rhaglen waith ddeddfwriaethol a gweithredol lawn am gyfnod o 12 mis. Mater i'r Weithrediaeth a'r gwrth bleidiau fydd monitro'r rhaglen honno oherwydd ein bod yn atebol i'r Cynulliad ar gyfer pa un a wnaethom yr hyn yr oeddem yn bwriadu ei



do in the annual government business programme, not only this year but in future. We are also accountable to the people of Wales, who are the ultimate accountable body, at the next Assembly elections in May 2003.

**Nick Bourne:** Does the First Minister accept that some of the statements and policy outlines in 'Putting Wales First' go far beyond July 2001. For example, the piloting of the Welsh baccalaureate will be much later than that. How does the First Minister propose to pilot these matters which are outside that period? Indeed, some of them are outside of this Assembly's lifetime.

**The First Minister:** They will commence during that period. The fact that they are a programme of work for the first seven or eight months does not mean that they have to be terminated during that period. They may, by the nature of the work or the task that you are setting out to accomplish, take two to three years. In the case of the Welsh baccalaureate, we have always made it clear—because the people who invented the Welsh baccalaureate have made it clear to us—that two or three years' work needs to go into the Welsh baccalaureate before you can say that it is of full industrial strength.

**Nick Bourne:** Given that the policies contained in 'Putting Wales First' are to last this Assembly's lifetime, is it the First Minister's intention to enter the next Assembly elections in partnership with the Liberal Democrats, if they will have him?

**The First Minister:** It does not work like that. The partnership programme notes a termination date of the first Wednesday of April 2003, if I remember rightly. We are free agents during the election. What happens after the election is a matter for the voters of Wales.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Mae dogfen y glymblaid yn sôn am ddau adolygiad: adolygiad o weithdrefnau'r

wneud yn rhaglen fusnes flynyddol y llywodraeth ai peidio, nid eleni yn unig ond yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym hefyd yn atebol i bobl Cymru, sef y corff atebol sylfaenol, adeg etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad ym mis Mai 2003.

**Nick Bourne:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn bod rhai o'r datganiadau a fframweithiau polisi yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i fis Gorffennaf 2001. Er enghraifft, bydd peilot bagloriaeth Cymru yn llawer hwyrach na hynny. Sut y bwriada'r Prif Weinidog beilota'r materion hynny sydd y tu allan i'r cyfnod hwnnw? Yn wir, mae rhai ohonynt y tu allan i oes y Cynulliad hwn.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddant yn dechrau yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Nid yw'r ffaith eu bod yn rhaglen waith ar gyfer y saith neu wyth mis cyntaf yn golygu bod yn rhaid eu terfynu yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Gallent, oherwydd natur y gwaith neu'r dasg yr ydych yn bwriadu ei chyflawni, gymryd dwy i dair blynedd i'w cwblhau. Yn achos y fagloriaeth Gymreig, yr ydym bob amser wedi egluro—oherwydd bod y bobl a ddyfeisiodd bagloriaeth Cymru wedi egluro inni—bod angen rhoi dwy neu dair blynedd o waith i fagloriaeth Cymru cyn y gellir dweud ei fod o gryfder diwydiannol llawn.

**Nick Bourne:** O ystyried bod y polisiau a gaiff eu cynnwys yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' i fod i barhau am oes y Cynulliad hwn, ai bwriad y Prif Weinidog yw mynd i mewn i etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad mewn partneriaeth â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, os byddant yn fodlon ei dderbyn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid dyna'r ffordd y mae'n gweithio. Mae'r rhaglen bartneriaeth yn nodi dyddiad cwblhau, sef dydd Mercher cyntaf mis Ebrill 2003, os yw fy ngof yn iawn. Yr ydym yn rhydd i wneud yr hyn a fynnom yn ystod yr etholiad. Mater i bleidleiswyr Cymru fydd yr hyn a ddigwydd wedi'r etholiad.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** The coalition document refers to two reviews: the review of Assembly procedures

Cynulliad a'r comisiwn annibynnol y dywedwch y byddwch yn ei sefydlu, a fydd yn adrodd ar ôl 2003. A ydych wedi darllen beirniadeth lem Ron Davies o'r hyn a elwir ganddo yn fethiant y Cabinet i roi cynlluniau deddfu ger bron San Steffan pan mae'r Cynulliad hwn wedi gwneud penderfyniadau o blaid hynny? Mae hynny'n feirniadaeth lem, sef nad ydych yn gwranddo ar benderfyniadau'r Cynulliad. A dderbyniwch feirniadaeth Ron Davies?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf wedi darllen y papur. Darllenis rai sylwadau ar bapur Ron Davies ond nid oeddwn yn adnabod y sefyllfa yr oedd Ron yn ei disgrifio. Mae'n anodd inni drafod y mater heddiw, ddiwrnod cyn Araith y Frenhines yn San Steffan. Yr ydym yn parhau'n obeithiol y ceir y Mesur annibynnol cyntaf, sydd wedi ei wreiddio yn y Cynulliad, ar alwad holl bleidiau'r Cynulliad, ar gyfer Comisiynydd Plant annibynnol ac i ymestyn pwerau'r comisiynydd fel eu bod yn debycach i'r hyn a geir yn Sgandinafia a thu allan i'r system ofal.

Bydd yn rhaid inni aros tan yfory i glywed a fydd Mesurau eraill yr ydym wedi chwarae rhan ynddynt wedi eu cynnwys yn Araith y Frenhines. Mae'n anodd i mi ateb heddiw, lai na 24 awr cyn i'r Frenhines wneud ei haraith flynyddol yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Onid pwynt Ron Davies yn ei bapur yw y dylech ddweud wrthym pa geisiadau yr ydych wedi eu gwneud am ddeddfwriaeth? A allwch ddweud hynny wrthym? Noda Ron Davies yn glir fod y diffyg cysylltiad amlwg rhwng San Steffan a'r Cynulliad yn gadael Cymru i lawr. A dderbyniwch fod Ron Davies wedi gwneud dadansoddiad deifiol o'r modd y gweithredwch fel Cabinet? A fyddwch yn ymateb yn bositif i hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni dderbyniaf fod y Cynulliad na Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gadael Cymru i lawr. Ffolineb yw honni hynny ddiwrnod cyn y prawf, sef a fydd y Mesur yr ydym wedi bod yn gofyn amdano wedi ei dderbyn ac wedi ei gynnwys yn Araith y Frenhines.

and the independent commission that you say you will establish, which will report back after 2003. Have you read Ron Davies's severe criticism of what he calls the Cabinet's failure to put legislative plans before Westminster when this Assembly has decided to do so? That is severe criticism, namely that you do not listen to the Assembly's decisions. Do you accept Ron Davies's criticism?

**The First Minister:** I have not read the paper. I have read some comments on Ron Davies's paper but I did not recognise the situation described by Ron. It is difficult for us to discuss the matter today, a day before the Queen's Speech in Westminster. We remain optimistic about the inclusion of the first independent Bill, rooted in the Assembly, at the behest of all parties in the Assembly, for an independent Children's Commissioner and to extend the commissioner's powers so that they are closer to the Scandinavian model and outside the care system.

We will have to wait until tomorrow to hear whether other Bills in which we have played a part are included in the Queen's Speech. It is difficult for me to reply today, less than 24 hours before the Queen makes her annual speech in the House of Lords.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Is it not Ron Davies's point in his paper that you should tell us what requests you have made for legislation? Can you tell us that? Ron Davies states clearly that the lack of a clear link between Westminster and the Assembly is letting Wales down. Do you accept that Ron Davies has made a scathing analysis of how you work as a Cabinet? Will you respond positively to that?

**The First Minister:** I do not accept that the Assembly or the Assembly's Government is letting Wales down. It is foolish to claim that the day before the test, namely whether the Bill that we have been requesting has been accepted and included in the Queen's Speech.

Yr ydym wedi bod yn pwysu am i rannau o rai o'r Mesurau eraill a ystyriwyd gael eu cynnwys. Y broblem yw, heblaw am y Mesurau annibynnol, megis y Mesur i ymestyn pwerau'r Comisiynydd Plant annibynnol, nid yw Aelodau Seneddol yn gwybod beth sydd yn Araith y Frenhines ychwaith. Ni allwn ddisgwyl i Aelodau meinciau cefn y Cynulliad wybod mwy am yr hyn sydd yn Araith y Frenhines nag Aelodau meinciau cefn San Steffan. Dyna'r broblwm.

We have been pressing for aspects of some of the other Bills that have been considered to be included. The problem is, apart from the independent Bills, such as the Bill to extend the powers of the independent Children's Commissioner, Members of Parliament do not know what will be in the Queen's Speech either. We cannot expect Assembly back benchers to know more about the content of the Queen's Speech than Westminster back benchers. That is the problem.

Yr wyf yn parhau'n hyderus ein bod wedi gallu ymestyn ein cyfraniad i Araith y Frenhines a gobeithiaf y caf fy mhrofi'n iawn yfory. Yfory yw'r diwrnod priodol inni drafod y mater hwn, yn hytrach na heddiw gyda'r holl *guesstimates* y mae Ieuan ac eraill wedi bod yn eu gwneud.

I remain confident that we have been able to enhance our contribution to the Queen's Speech and I hope to be proved right tomorrow. Tomorrow is the appropriate day to discuss this matter, rather than today with all the *guesstimates* that Ieuan and others have been making.

### **Y Datblygiadau Diweddaraf ym Mholisi Ewrop The Latest Developments in European Policy**

**Q9 Alun Cairns:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the latest developments of European policy that directly relates to Wales? (OAQ8231)

**C9 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y datblygiadau diweddaraf ym mholisi Ewrop sydd yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â Chymru? (OAQ8231)

**The First Minister:** There are many recent policy developments that relate to Wales. Alun will be aware of one such development because he attended the same meeting as myself on this issue. It relates to the fact that we have slightly less than 13 months to prepare for the arrival of the euro as legal tender in Ireland and 10 other countries. That will have a major impact not only on the ferry ports of Swansea, Holyhead, Fishguard and Pembroke Dock but on those who run businesses that serve tourists or truckers going to and from Ireland along the M4 and the A55. Three of the nations that take part in the six nations rugby tournament will be euro legal tender countries following the tournament, which starts in February 2001. Their citizens may expect to be served in euros when they come to places such as Cardiff for international matches in 2001 and beyond.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae llawer o ddatblygiadau polisi diweddar sydd yn ymwneud â Chymru. Bydd Alun yn ymwybodol o un datblygiad o'r fath gan iddo fynychu'r un cyfarfod â minnau ar y mater hwn. Mae'n ymwneud â'r ffaith mai ychydig yn llai na 13 mis sydd gennym i baratoi ar gyfer dyfodiad yr ewro fel arian cyfreithiol yn Iwerddon a 10 o wledydd eraill. Caiff hynny effaith fawr nid yn unig ar borthladdoedd fferi Abertawe, Caergybi, Abergwaun a Doc Penfro ond hefyd ar y rhai hynny sydd yn rhedeg busnesau sydd yn gwasanaethu twristiaid neu yrwyr lori sydd yn mynd yn ôl ac ymlaen i Iwerddon ar hyd yr M4 a'r A55. Bydd tair o'r gwledydd sydd yn cymryd rhan yn nhwrnament rygbi'r chwe gwlad yn wledydd a fydd â'r ewro fel arian cyfreithiol yn dilyn y twrnament, sydd yn dechrau ym mis Chwefror 2001. Disgwylia eu dinasyddion gael eu gwasanaethu mewn ewros pan ddônt i leoedd megis Caerdydd ar gyfer gemau rhyngwladol yn 2001 ac wedi

hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the First Minister give us details on the latest negotiations with the Treasury on operating aids? Is the Chancellor of the Exchequer now aware of the Economic Development Committee's demands? He was unaware of them six or eight weeks ago. What operating aids does he expect the Chancellor to accept and does he accept that the operating aids submission should have been made at the same time as the programme complement two months ago?

**Alun Cairns:** A rydd y Prif Weinidog fanylion inni ar y trafodaethau diweddaraf â'r Trysorlys ar gymhorthion gweithredu? A yw Canghellor y Trysorlys yn ymwybodol erbyn hyn o ofynion y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd? Nid oedd yn ymwybodol ohonynt chwech neu wyth wythnos yn ôl. Pa gymhorthion gweithredu y bydd yn disgwyl i'r Canghellor eu derbyn ac a yw'n derbyn y dylid bod wedi cyflwyno'r cymhorthion gweithredu yr un pryd â dogfen ategol y rhaglen ddau fis yn ôl?

**The First Minister:** Alun asked a complicated series of questions, which bear a close similarity to the questions that he raised a week, a fortnight and three weeks ago. If you could get repetitive strain injury from talking rubbish all the time, Alun Cairns would probably have a doctor's sick note for it by now.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gofynnodd Alun gyfres o gwestiynau cymhleth, sydd yn debyg iawn i'r cwestiynau a gododd wythnos, bythefnos a thair wythnos yn ôl. Os ydych yn gallu cael anaf straen ailadroddllyd o siarad lol drwy'r adeg, mae'n debyg y byddai gan Alun Cairns nodyn meddyg ar gyfer hynny erbyn hyn.

If Alun wants to discuss Gordon Brown's response when he commenced his pre-budget consultation at Bridgend, where Alun and I were present and where Alun raised the matter of operating aids, I will do so. To a modest degree, there is reference to a sort of operating aid in the budget White Paper as regards what happens in specific brownfield sites and so on. Mike German is going to Brussels this afternoon to discuss that issue with the Competition Commissioner. These subjects are always under review. However, you must remember how difficult it is to demonstrate to the Treasury and the competition directorate of Europe how your operating aids will provide value for money, and will not represent some of the mistakes that were made when his Government brought in enterprise zones 20 years ago, and all that happened was a lot of out-of-town retail parks were built.

Os yw Alun am drafod ymateb Gordon Brown pan ddechreuodd ei ymgynghoriad cyn y gyllideb ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, ble yr oedd Alun a minnau yn bresennol a lle cododd Alun y mater o gymhorthion gweithredu, gwnaf hynny. I raddau rhesymol, ceir cyfeiriad at fath o gymorth gweithredu ym Mhapur Gwyn y gyllideb yn ymwneud â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd mewn safleoedd meysydd llwyd penodol ac ati. Mae Mike German yn mynd i Frwsel brynhawn heddiw i drafod y mater hwnnw gyda'r Comisiynydd Cystadleuaeth. Caiff y pynciau hyn eu hadolygu drwy'r amser. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cofio pa mor anodd oedd arddangos i'r Trysorlys a chyfarwyddiaeth cystadleuaeth Ewrop sut y bydd eich cymhorthion gweithredu yn sicrhau gwerth am arian, ac na fyddant yn cynrychioli rhai o'r camgymeriadau a wnaethpwyd pan gyflwynodd ei Lywodraeth ardaloedd menter 20 mlynedd yn ôl, a'r cwbl a welwyd o ganlyniad i hynny oedd llawer o barciau manwerthu yn cael eu hadeiladu y tu allan i drefi.

2:20 p.m.

**Val Feld:** Does Rhodri agree that it would be helpful if Alun Cairns, in his role as Welsh Conservative Party economic spokesman, would understand that there are two kinds of operating aids. There are those that are tools used as part of structural funds programmes to assist businesses to grow and develop. Those are already contained within the single programming document for Objective 1 and Objective 2. There are also operating aids that operate within your country where there is a negative cost to the Treasury. They take time to negotiate and it is helpful to people outside if those are separate. My question is—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is question time. I enjoy sharp, brief questions and reasonably brief answers.

**Val Feld:** My question is whether you feel that it is helpful to businesses in Wales that we should make that distinction at all times?

**The First Minister:** Yes, I agree entirely. *[Laughter.]* There are European operating aids that should come under the programme complement. In addition, there are general operating aids that are distinct from the issue of the content of the programme complement. Val is correct about that and Alun persistently refuses to recognise that key distinction.

**Val Feld:** A gytuna Rhodri y byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai Alun Cairns, yn ei swyddogaeth fel llefarydd economaidd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, yn deall bod dau fath o gymhorthion gweithredu. Ceir y rheini sydd yn offer a ddefnyddir fel rhan o raglenni cronfeydd strwythurol i gynorthwyo busnesau i dyfu a datblygu. Cynhwysir y rheini yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl ar gyfer Amcan 1 ac Amcan 2 eisoes. Hefyd, ceir cymhorthion gweithredu sydd yn gweithredu o fewn eich gwlad yn y manau lle ceir cost negyddol i'r Trysorlys. Cymerir cryn amser i'w trafod a byddai'n ddefnyddiol i bobl y tu allan os byddai'r rhai hynny ar wahân. Fy nghwestiwn yw—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Amser cwestiynau yw hwn. Gwerthfawrogaf gwestiynau bachog, byr ac atebion gweddol fyr.

**Val Feld:** Fy nghwestiwn yw a ydych o'r farn ei bod yn ddefnyddiol i fusnesau yng Nghymru inni wneud y gwahaniaethiad hwnnw bob amser?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ydwyf, cytunaf yn llwyr. *[Chwerthin.]* Ceir cymhorthion gweithredu Ewropeaidd a ddylai ddod o dan ddogfen ategol y rhaglen. Yn ogystal, ceir cymhorthion gweithredu cyffredinol sydd yn wahanol i'r mater o gynnwys dogfen ategol y rhaglen. Mae Val yn gywir ynghylch hynny ac mae Alun yn gwrthod cydnabod y gwahaniaeth allweddol hwnnw yn gyson.

### **Cynnwys Araith y Frenhines ar Dai The Contents of the Queen's Speech on Housing**

**Q10 Peter Black:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the contents of the Queen's Speech on housing? (OAQ8220)

**The First Minister:** The Queen will open Parliament at 11.30 a.m. in the House of Lords in the usual way and will deliver her speech. The contents of the speech, and the legislative programme that it outlines, are a matter for the UK Government and are confidential until that time. I have discussed, with the Secretary of State for Wales and

**C10 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch cynnwys Araith y Frenhines ar dai? (OAQ8220)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd y Frenhines yn agor y Senedd am 11.30 a.m. yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi yn y ffordd arferol a bydd yn cyflwyno ei haraith. Mater i lywodraeth y DU yw cynnwys yr araith, a'r rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol a amlinella, a bydd yn gyfrinachol tan hynny. Trafodais, gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a

other Government Ministers, the matters on which we have pressed for Bills. Those matters may require separate Bills for Wales, such as the independent Children's Commissioner Bill, or clauses or parts of those Bills that are of a general England and Wales, or sometimes UK, import.

**Peter Black:** Welcome as the fact is that the Government is following Wales's lead on legislation on homelessness is, will you make representations to the UK Government on the urgent need to introduce a licensing Bill for houses in multiple occupation and for the National Assembly for Wales to have the maximum amount of secondary legislation to devise its own scheme?

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for those observations. We all realise that the Queen's Speech that will be made tomorrow may be of a slightly unusual character. The last Queen's Speech had to cover a 13-month legislative year, from November to December. Therefore, it was able to accommodate much longer Bills; the classic England-Wales measure, if you like, which has 100 clauses, 10 of which apply to Wales. However, because a general election may be imminent in the late spring we may not have any 100 clause Bills, with or without 10 clauses for Wales. There will not be sufficient time to pass any Bill with 100 clauses, because the legislative year will be less than half the length of that which ended last week. Nevertheless, I am aware that there is a Government Green Paper on housing. I doubt whether you can go straight to legislation from a Green Paper without having a White Paper. However, it could happen and then the questions that Peter has asked would become material.

**Janet Davies:** Action to implement the wider categories of homelessness that was agreed in a Plenary session in this Chamber has not yet been taken. When do you propose to do that, Rhodri?

Gweinidogion eraill yn y Llywodraeth, y materion lle y buom yn pwysu i gael Mesurau. Gallai'r materion hynny ofyn am Fesurau penodol i Gymru, megis y Mesur Comisiynydd Plant annibynnol, neu am gymalau neu rannau o'r Mesurau sydd o bwys cyffredinol i Loegr a Chymru, neu weithiau o bwys i'r DU.

**Peter Black:** Er fy mod yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn dilyn arweiniad Cymru ar ddeddfwriaeth ar y digartref, a gyflwynwch sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU ar yr angen brys i gyflwyno Mesur trwyddedu ar gyfer tai mewn amlbreswyliaeth ac i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael yr holl is-ddeddfwriaeth sydd yn bosibl i lunio ei gynllun ei hun?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau hynny. Deallwn oll y gallai Araith y Frenhines a gaiff ei thraddodi yfory fod o natur ychydig yn anarferol. Rhaid oedd i Araith ddiwethaf y Frenhines gwmpasu blwyddyn ddeddfwriaethol 13 mis o hyd, o fis Tachwedd i fis Rhagfyr. Felly, llwyddodd i gynnwys Mesurau llawer hwy, megis yr hyn y gellid ei alw'n fesur clasurol Cymru-Lloegr, sydd â 100 o gymalau, 10 ohonynt yn berthnasol i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd y gallai etholiad cyffredinol ddigwydd ddiwedd y gwanwyn efallai na chawn unrhyw Fesurau â 100 cymal, gyda 10 cymal i Gymru ai peidio. Ni fydd digon o amser i basio unrhyw Fesur gyda 100 cymal, oherwydd bydd y flwyddyn ddeddfwriaethol yn llai na hanner hyd y flwyddyn a ddaeth i ben yr wythnos diwethaf. Er hynny, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y Llywodraeth wedi cyhoeddi Papur Gwyrdd ar dai. Yr wyf yn amau a ellir mynd yn syth i lunio deddfwriaeth o Bapur Gwyrdd heb gael Papur Gwyn. Fodd bynnag, gallai hynny ddigwydd ac yna byddai'r cwestiynau a ofynnodd Peter yn berthnasol.

**Janet Davies:** Ni chymerwyd camau hyd yma i weithredu'r categorïau ehangach ar y digartref y cytunwyd arnynt mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn y Siambr. Pryd y bwriadwch wneud hynny, Rhodri?

**The First Minister:** I will write to Janet on that. I would have liked notice of a question that is as precise as that about forthcoming actions. However, I will write to her after consultation with Edwina and Peter.

**William Graham:** In Her Majesty's gracious speech from the throne, do you suppose, First Minister, that there will be a measure to implement an audit of housing stock in Wales, to include, in particular, those properties that have been specially adapted for disabled people? If not, will you press accordingly for such measures?

**The First Minister:** It may not be in tomorrow's Queen's Speech, because tomorrow's speech is, in a way, the first proper post-devolution Queen's Speech. When powers were transferred to us in July 1999, discussion about the legislation to be included in the last Queen's Speech was already underway. Therefore, we were not able to have a full input into that, although we were lucky enough to have many partial measures included in Bills that were part of that speech. On this occasion, because of the special circumstances of a short Queen's Speech with a premium on short Bills and because of the danger of a general election—certainly a danger to the Tory party—

**Several Conservative Members** *rose—*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**The First Minister:** If that was to be included in an umbrella Bill relating to housing, of the kind that Peter Black and William Graham mentioned, it may not be right for this year. However, depending on which party wins the next general election, there may be an opportunity in April, May, June, July or October next year for a bigger Bill, which would encompass the kind of measures that William has in mind regarding the modernisation of housing legislation in Wales.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ysgrifennaf at Janet ar hynny. Hoffwn fod wedi cael rhybudd o gwestiwn sydd mor fanwl â hynny am weithredoedd yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, ysgrifennaf ati ar ôl ymgynghori ag Edwina a Peter.

**William Graham:** Yn araith rhadlon Ei Mawrhydi o'r orsedd, a dybiwch, Brif Weinidog, y ceir mesur i gynnal archwiliad o'r stoc tai yng Nghymru, i gynnwys, yn arbennig, yr eiddo hynny a addaswyd yn arbennig ar gyfer pobl anabl? Os na cheir hynny, a fyddwch yn pwysu'n briodol i gael mesurau o'r fath?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Efallai na chaiff ei gynnwys yn Araith y Frenhines yfory, oherwydd araith yfory fydd, mewn gwirionedd, Araith gyntaf y Frenhines yn dilyn datganoli. Pan drosglwyddwyd pwerau inni ym mis Gorffennaf 1999, yr oedd trafodaethau ar y ddeddfwriaeth i'w chynnwys yn Araith ddiwethaf y Frenhines wedi cychwyn eisoes. Felly, nid oeddem yn gallu cynnig mewnbyn llawn i hynny, er inni fod yn ddigon lwcus i gynnwys llawer o fesurau rhannol mewn Mesurau a oedd yn rhan o'r Araith honno. Ar yr adeg hon, oherwydd amgylchiadau arbennig Araith fer gydag ond ychydig o Fesurau byr ac oherwydd y perygl o etholiad cyffredinol—sydd yn bendant yn berygl i'r blaid Doriaidd—

**Sawl Aelod Ceidwadol** *a gododd—*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Os oedd hynny i gael ei gynnwys mewn Mesur ymbarél yn ymwneud â thai, o'r math y nododd Peter Black a William Graham, efallai na fydd yn gymwys ar gyfer eleni. Fodd bynnag, gan ddibynnu ar ba blaid fydd yn ennill yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf, efallai y bydd cyfle ym mis Ebrill, Mai, Mehefin, Gorffennaf neu Hydref y flwyddyn nesaf am Fesur ehangach, a fyddai'n cwmpasu'r math o fesurau sydd gan William mewn golwg ynghylch moderneiddio deddfwriaeth tai yng Nghymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11 has been withdrawn. **Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 11 yn ôl.

### **Penderfyniadau am Gymru Decisions made about Wales**

**Q12 Janet Ryder:** How does the First Minister plan to ensure that decisions made about Wales directly represent the views of the people affected by those decisions? (OAQ8243)

**The First Minister:** I intend to do so as best I can in a democracy where there might be different views. I suppose that a good example is the appointment of the independent Children's Commissioner, which took place over the weekend and on Monday. Children were directly involved in that. Some 18 or 19 children took part in the interviews and role-playing exercises with the six candidates on the shortlist on Sunday, and they elected two of their number to take part alongside the adults in interviewing on Monday. I hope to be able to announce further developments on this front shortly. However, that is a good example of trying to involve people as much as possible, because they are the consumers of those services.

**Janet Ryder:** Given that the interests of Wales are represented in the Westminster Cabinet by the Secretary of State for Wales and that he is not accountable to this body, what are your plans to request that he becomes more accountable to this body for his decisions?

**The First Minister:** The Secretary of State will be here next week to take part in the Queen's Speech debate. The Government of Wales Act 1998 states that that should be part of the procedure. The Junior Minister, David Hanson, will close the debate, as I understand. I am not responsible for business matters, but I understand that that is the procedure. Therefore, I am sure that there will be a full opportunity to make the Secretary of State for Wales as accountable as possible, given that he is a Member of one legislature and we are here in the Assembly.

**C12 Janet Ryder:** Sut y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn bwriadu sicrhau bod penderfyniadau am Gymru yn cynrychioli'n uniongyrchol farn y bobl yr effeithir arnynt gan y penderfyniadau hynny? (OAQ8243)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bwriadaf wneud hynny cystal ag y gallaf mewn democratiaeth lle y gallai fod barn wahanol. Tybiaf bod penodi Comisiynydd Plant annibynnol, a ddigwyddodd dros y penwythnos a dydd Llun, yn enghraifft dda. Cafodd plant eu cynnwys yn uniongyrchol yn hynny. Cymerodd tua 18 neu 19 o blant ran yn y cyfweiliadau a'r ymarferion chwarae rôl gyda'r chwe ymgeisydd ar y rhestr fer ddydd Sul, ac etholwyd dau ohonynt i gymryd rhan gyda'r oedolion wrth gyfweled ddydd Llun. Gobeithiaf y gallaf ddatgan datblygiadau pellach yn y maes hwn cyn bo hir. Fodd bynnag, mae honno'n enghraifft dda o geisio cynnwys pobl gymaint â phosibl, gan mai hwythau yw defnyddwyr y gwasanaethau hynny.

**Janet Ryder:** O ystyried y cynrychiolir buddiannau Cymru yng Nghabinet San Steffan gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ac nad yw yntau'n atebol i'r corff hwn, pa gynlluniau sydd gennych ar gyfer gwneud cais iddo ddod yn fwy atebol i'r corff hwn am ei benderfyniadau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yma yr wythnos nesaf i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl ar Araith y Frenhines. Noda Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 1998 y dylai hynny fod yn rhan o'r weithdrefn. Bydd yr Is-Weinidog, David Hanson, yn cau'r ddadl, fel y deallaf. Nid yfi sydd yn gyfrifol am faterion busnes, ond deallaf mai dyna yw'r drefn. Felly, yr wyf yn siŵr y ceir cyfle llawn i wneud Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru mor atebol â phosibl, o ystyried ei fod ef yn Aelod o un corff deddfwriaethol a'n bod ni yma yn y



The Secretary of State can be questioned in the Queen's Speech debate. There are also other occasions when he may be questioned by Members of all parties and independent Members in the Assembly.

**David Melding:** The First Minister referred to the use of children and young people in the process of appointing the Children's Commissioner. I warmly commend that principle. It made national headlines, and quite rightly so, because Wales is leading the way. Does he agree that the principle of involving users in public appointment is an excellent one? For instance, patients could be involved in appointments to national health service bodies.

**The First Minister:** I could not agree more. Nobody knows more about diabetes than people who suffer from it. Nobody knows more about cancer and the stresses and strains of that than a cancer patient. Cancer used to be a terminal disease and interest was relatively shortlived, but these days it is far more treatable and you can be a cancer patient for 30 years. The NHS has much to learn from that principle, and it is learning from it. We in Wales should give as much attention as possible to the views of long-term surviving patients who have chronic diseases or diseases that can be held in remission for decades.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae cwestiynau 13, 14 a 15 wedi'u tynnu'n ôl.

Cynulliad. Gellir cwestiynu'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn nadl Araith y Frenhines. Hefyd ceir adegau eraill pan y gall Aelodau pob plaid ac Aelodau annibynnol yn y Cynulliad ei holi.

**David Melding:** Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at y defnydd o blant a phobl ifanc yn y broses o benodi'r Comisiynydd Plant. Cymeradwyaf yr egwyddor honno'n gynnes. Cyrhaeddodd y penawdau cenedlaethol, a hynny'n haeddiannol, oherwydd bod Cymru'n arwain y ffordd. A gytuna bod yr egwyddor o gynnwys defnyddwyr mewn penodiad cyhoeddus yn un ardderchog? Er enghraifft, gellid cynnwys cleifion mewn penodiadau i gyrrff o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf yn llwyr. Ni wŷr neb fwy am glefyd siwgr na'r bobl sydd yn dioddef ohono. Ni wŷr neb fwy am ganser a'r pwysau a'r straen a ddaw gydag ef na pherson sydd yn dioddef o ganser. Arferai canser fod yn afiechyd terfynol ac yr oedd y diddordeb am gyfnod gweddol fyr, ond erbyn hyn mae'n llawer haws ei drin a gallwch fod yn dioddef o ganser am 30 mlynedd. Mae gan yr NHS lawer i'w ddysgu o'r egwyddor honno, ac mae'n dysgu ohoni. Dylem ni yng Nghymru roi cymaint o sylw â phosibl i farn cleifion ag afiechydon cronig neu afiechydon a all ysgafnhau am ddegawdau ac sydd yn goroesi am amser hir.

**The Presiding Officer:** Questions 13, 14 and 15 have been withdrawn.

### **Atal Llifogydd yng Nghymru (Trafodaethau) Flood Prevention in Wales (Discussions)**

**Q16 Jocelyn Davies:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding flood prevention in Wales? (OAQ8235)

**The First Minister:** I have frequent discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on a range of issues, but frequently on flood alleviation during the period of major difficulties in north-east Wales regarding this issue.

**Jocelyn Davies:** As our link to the UK

**C16 Jocelyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch atal llifogydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ8235)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Caf drafodaethau cyson gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar amrywiaeth o faterion, ond yn aml ar liniaru llifogydd yn ystod y cyfnod o anawsterau mawr yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru ynghylch y mater hwn.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Fel ein cyswllt â

Government, your discussions with the Secretary of State are as important to us on floods as on any other matter. Therefore, will you tell us how often and for how long you meet with him, and will you publish your diary commitments?

2:30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** That may be an onerous burden because many of the discussions could have been over the telephone. I should also refer to Sue Essex attending a ministerial meeting chaired by the Deputy Prime Minister on 4 November to discuss the flood situation, and officials have attended the regular meetings of the flood working group of officials of all relevant departments, which is chaired by my old colleague and room-mate Elliot Morley, the Parliamentary Secretary to the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food.

**Alun Pugh:** Will you meet with Edwina Hart if the review of flood defences in north Wales recommend work that is not currently provided for in budgets?

**The First Minister:** Yes. There will be a three-way meeting involving Sue Essex, Edwina Hart and myself, after we have had the relevant information from the three most affected local authorities in north-east Wales, along with the Environment Agency, which has a major frontline responsibility in this area.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have accepted a request for a question for the First Minister on a matter of urgent public importance, under Standing Order No. 6.31.

Llywodraeth y DU, mae eich trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol cyn bwysiced inni ar lifogydd ag ar unrhyw fater arall. Felly, a ddywedwch wrthym pa mor aml ac am ba mor hir y byddwch yn cyfarfod ag ef, ac a fyddwch yn cyhoeddi ymrwymadau eich dyddiadur?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gallai hynny fod yn faich drom oherwydd gallai llawer o'r trafodaethau fod wedi eu cynnal dros y ffôn. Hefyd dylwn gyfeirio at Sue Essex yn mynychu cyfarfod gweinidogol a gadeiriwyd gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar 4 Tachwedd i drafod sefyllfa'r llifogydd, ac mae swyddogion wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd rheolaidd y gweithgor sydd yn cynnwys llifogydd swyddogion o'r holl adrannau perthnasol, a gaiff eu cadeirio gan fy nghyn gydweithiwr a chydletywr Elliot Morley, yr Ysgrifennydd Seneddol i'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd.

**Alun Pugh:** A fyddwch yn cwrdd ag Edwina Hart os bydd yr adolygiad o'r amddiffynfeydd llifogydd yng ngogledd Cymru yn argymhell gwaith na ddarperir ar ei gyfer mewn cyllidebau cyfredol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddaf. Bydd cyfarfod dair ffordd yn cynnwys Sue Essex, Edwina Hart a minnau, wedi inni gael y wybodaeth berthnasol gan y tri awdurdod lleol yr effeithir arnynt fwyaf yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, yn ogystal ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, sydd â chyfrifoldeb rheng flaen amlwg yn y maes hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Derbyniais gais am gwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog ar fater o bwysigrwydd cyhoeddus brys, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.31.

### Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

#### Streic Gweithwyr y Post The Postal Workers' Strike

**Nick Bourne:** In view of the postal strike in **Nick Bourne:** Yn wyneb y streic bost yng

Cardiff, which is damaging Welsh business and affecting postal deliveries to and from Cardiff and other parts of Wales, will the Welsh Executive make a statement on how it proposes, as a matter of urgency, to help bring this dispute to an end? (EAQ8582)

**The First Minister:** I have not had any discussions with colleagues in Westminster on this issue. This concerns the Post Office, responsibility for which is not devolved to the Assembly. I recognise that the postal strike has consequences for all who use the postal services in the Cardiff area. The dispute between management and certain sections of the workforce is a local operational matter for the Post Office. As I know Ninian Le Blanc, the area manager, and Steve Bell, the convenor of the shop stewards, extremely well personally, I do not think that I ought to add anything to that.

**Nick Bourne:** I am extremely concerned, as people throughout this Chamber will be, that we have had many constituents and people throughout Wales contacting us about cash-flow problems occasioned by this illegal strike. It is illegal because there has been no ballot of members. It is having a serious effect on small and medium-sized businesses throughout Wales, and particularly in the Cardiff area, quite apart from the running of public organisations. I have had difficulty in contacting hospitals about waiting lists. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Use the phone.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The leader of the Welsh Conservatives is entitled to be heard in relative silence.

**Nick Bourne:** I have telephoned but it is not always the appropriate way of conveying medical records and so on. This is a serious point, not just for users of public services, but for businesses, and—in the run-up to Christmas—for members of the public. Will the First Minister, along with others, take urgent action? Will he convey the message to the Secretary of State for Wales, if appropriate, that he acts? This is important.

Nghaerdydd, sydd yn niweidio busnes yng Nghymru ac yn effeithio ar ddsbarthu post i mewn ac allan o Gaerdydd ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, a wnaiff y Weithrediaeth Gymreig ddatganiad ynglŷn â sut y bwriada, fel mater o frys, helpu i ddod â'r anghydfod hwn i ben? (EAQ8582)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau â'm cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan ar y mater hwn. Mae'n fater i Swyddfa'r Post, na ddatganolwyd y cyfrifoldeb drosto i'r Cynulliad. Cydnabyddaf fod i streic y post oblygiadau i bawb sydd yn defnyddio gwasanaethau'r post yn ardal Caerdydd. Mater gweithredu lleol i Swyddfa'r Post yw'r anghydfod rhwng y rheolwyr ac adrannau penodol o'r gweithlu. Gan fy mod yn adnabod Ninian Le Blanc, y rheolwr ardal, a Steve Bell, cynullydd y stiwardiaid gwaith, yn dda iawn yn bersonol, ni chredaf y dylwn ychwanegu unrhyw beth arall at hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn pryderu'n fawr iawn, fel y bydd pobl eraill yn y Siambr hon, fod llawer o'n hetholwyr a phobl ledled Cymru wedi cysylltu â ni ynglŷn â phroblemau llif arian oherwydd y streic anghyfreithlon hon. Mae'n anghyfreithlon am na chynhaliwyd unrhyw bleidlais. Mae'n cael effaith ddifrifol ar fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ledled Cymru, ac yn arbennig yn ardal Caerdydd, heb sôn am weinyddu sefydliadau cyhoeddus. Cefais anhawster wrth geisio cysylltu ag ysbytai ynglŷn â rhestrau aros. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Defnyddiwch y ffôn.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hawl gan arweinydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru i gael gwrandawriad mewn tawelwch cymharol.

**Nick Bourne:** Ffoniais ond nid yw bob amser yn ffordd briodol o gyfleu cofnodion meddygol ac ati. Mae hwn yn bwynt difrifol, nid yn unig o safbwynt defnyddwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond i fusnesau, ac—wrth i'r Nadolig agosáu—i aelodau'r cyhoedd. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog, ynghyd ag eraill, gymryd camau brys? A wnaiff gyfleu'r neges i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru y dylai weithredu, lle y bo hynny'n

We have reason to believe that it is a politically-motivated dispute, but there is no doubt that it is an illegal dispute. Will he take action?

**The First Minister:** If there were any action that I could take, I would consider it. However, as I am neither responsible for the Post Office, nor for industrial relations in that organisation, the best thing to do is to leave it to those people who are responsible. Nick's points are not matters for the Assembly. He might wish for the Assembly's powers to be expanded to include the Post Office, but I am not aware of any such proposal. Even if I were a minister in the Department of Trade and Industry, and he were the shadow spokesman for DTI matters in Parliament, it would still be worth considering whether ministerial involvement by somebody who is not an expert in arbitration in industrial disputes would help or hinder the solution of this dispute.

The strike is affecting parts of Cardiff, not the whole of the city, I understand. In one or two high-profile cases it is affecting issues related to benefit payments. However, we are not responsible for benefit payments either; these are all matters for the Westminster Government and for such experts as there are in solving industrial disputes. I know Ninian Le Blanc and Steve Bell, and I am sure that they will eventually come to a solution.

**Peter Law:** Would the First Minister agree with me that a conciliatory approach is now needed from postal management, working together with the postal unions who represent respected postal workers? They have given so much service to this city for so long and they are understandably worried about their jobs and the current labour situation. Does he agree that making draconian threats of intimidatory sanctions on people returning to work, and taking action against them, is not the way forward? Hopefully there will be a breakthrough on conciliatory measures.

briodol? Mae hyn yn bwysig. Mae gennym le i gredu ei fod yn anghydfod ac iddo gymhellion gwleidyddol, ond nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth ei fod yn anghydfod anghyfreithiol. A wnaiff weithredu?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Pe bai unrhyw gamau y gallwn eu cymryd, fe'u hystyriwn. Fodd bynnag, gan nad wyf yn gyfrifol am Swyddfa'r Post na'r cysylltiadau diwydiannol o fewn y sefydliad hwnnw, y peth gorau i'w wneud yw gadael y mater i'r bobl hynny sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb. Nid materion i'r Cynulliad yw pwyntiau Nick. Efallai ei fod am i bwerau'r Cynulliad gael eu hehangu i gwmpasu Swyddfa'r Post, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw gynnig o'r fath. Hyd yn oed pe bawn yn weinidog yn yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac yntau'n llefarydd yr wrthblaid dros faterion yr adran yn y Senedd, byddai'n werth ystyried o hyd ai helpu neu rwystro datrys yr anghydfod hwn fyddai ymyrraeth gan weinidogion nad ydynt yn arbenigo ar gymrodeddu mewn anghydfodau diwydiannol.

Ar rannau o Gaerdydd, nid y ddinas gyfan yr effeithia'r streic, fe ddeallaf. Mewn un neu ddau o achosion proffil uchel, mae'n effeithio ar faterion sydd yn ymwneud â thalu budd-daliadau. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn gyfrifol am fudd-daliadau ychwaith; mae'r materion hyn oll yn perthyn i Lywodraeth San Steffan a'r cyfryw arbenigwyr ar ddatrys anghydfodau diwydiannol. Yr wyf yn adnabod Ninian Le Blanc a Steve Bell, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnânt ddatrys yr anghydfod yn y pen draw.

**Peter Law:** A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog â mi mai ymagwedd gymodlon sydd ei hangen ar reolwyr swyddfa'r post erbyn hyn, gan gydweithio ag undebau'r post sydd yn cynrychioli gweithwyr post uchel eu parch? Maent wedi rhoi cymaint o wasanaeth i'r ddinas hon ers cymaint o amser ac maent yn poeni ynglŷn â'u swyddi a'r farchnad lafur bresennol a hynny'n gwbl deg. A gytuna nad y ffordd ymlaen yw bygwth pobl sydd yn dychwelyd i'r gwaith â sancsiynau llym, a chymryd camau yn eu herbyn? Gobeithiaf y gwelwn fesurau cymodlon.

**The First Minister:** I note your comments, Peter, but I will not take sides in an industrial dispute.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Gofynnaf i Rhodri roi ystyriaeth bellach i'w ateb i'r cwestiwn hwn. Fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, mae angen iddo ofyn rhai cwestiynau gan fod y streic yn effeithio ar ein gallu yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i wneud ein gwaith. Er enghraifft, mae'n bosibl bod gohebiaeth ar ei ffordd i mi gan rai sydd ag apeliadau budd-daliadau yn y fantol a'i bod wedi'i dal yn y post. Os yw hyn yn effeithio ar ein hetholwyr, awgrymaf iddo ei bod yn gyfrifoldeb arnom ni i wneud yr hyn a allwn i ddod â'r anghydfod i ben. Deallaf nad yw eisiau cymryd proffil uchel, ond a wnaiff ofyn un neu ddau gwestiwn y tu ôl i'r llenni i geisio hwyluso ateb sydd yn dderbyniol i bawb?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Wrth gwrs. Gwerthfawrogwn pe byddai Dafydd yn fy hysbysu i neu'r Llywydd o enghreifftiau lle nad ydym yn medru gwneud ein gwaith fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad oherwydd nad yw apeliadau yn cyrraedd o fewn y terfyniadau amser ac yn y blaen. Byddwn yn hapus i ystyried y mater, efallai ar y cyd gyda'r Llywydd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I apologise for being late. I have been speaking on the phone to Ninian Le Blanc and Steve Bell, and to John Ceggie in the union's headquarters in London. The sorting office is situated in my constituency of Cardiff South and Penarth and I, like others, have had phone calls from concerned businesses and so on. They admit that there are problems on both sides. I understand that the union has offered to take part in an independent review or a review chaired by an independent person. I wonder whether there is an opportunity here for whoever may be listening to this debate to intervene. The union has offered to take part but the management side has been reluctant. If they came together with an independent chair—however that may be arranged—it may be a way forward. A meeting is underway at the union's London headquarters. We should know by 3.00 p.m. or 4.00 p.m. whether it

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nodaf eich sylwadau, Peter, ond nid ochraf â'r naill ochr na'r llall mewn anghydfod diwydiannol.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I ask Rhodri to give further consideration to his response to this question. As First Minister, he needs to ask some questions as the strike affects our ability in the National Assembly to carry out our duties. For example, it is possible that there is correspondence on its way to me from people with benefit appeals pending and that it has been held up in the post. If this affects our constituents, I suggest to him that it is our responsibility to do all we can to resolve this dispute. I understand that he does not want to take a high profile, but will he ask a question or two behind the scenes to try to facilitate an outcome that is acceptable to all?

**The First Minister:** Of course. I would appreciate if Dafydd would inform me or the Presiding Officer of examples of where we are unable to carry out our duties as Assembly Members because appeals do not arrive within the deadlines and so on. I would be happy to consider the matter, perhaps in conjunction with the Presiding Officer.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Ymddiheuraf am fod yn hwyr. Bùm yn siarad â Ninian Le Blanc a Steve Bell dros y ffôn, ac â John Ceggie ym mhencadlys yr undeb yn Llundain. Mae'r swyddfa ddioli yn fy etholaeth i sef De Caerdydd a Phenarth a chefais i, fel eraill, alwadau ffôn gan fusnesau ac yn y blaen sydd yn pryderu. Maent yn cyfaddef bod problemau ar y ddwy ochr. Deallaf fod yr undeb wedi cynnig cymryd rhan mewn adolygiad annibynnol neu adolygiad o dan gadeiryddiaeth person annibynnol. A oes cyfle yma tybed i bwy bynnag sydd yn gwrando ar y ddadl hon ymyrryd? Cynigiodd yr undeb gymryd rhan ond bu ochr y rheolwyr yn amharod i wneud hynny. Pe baent yn dod ynghyd o dan gadeirydd annibynnol—sut bynnag y gellir trefnu hynny—efallai y bydd yn ffordd ymlaen. Cynhelir cyfarfod ar hyn o bryd ym mhencadlys yr undeb yn Llundain. Dylem

has been able to broker a deal. Union members are unhappy with this position and both sides have agreed that there have been difficulties. We need someone to intervene to try to broker some sort of deal if they do not succeed this afternoon.

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for that because the head post office for the Cardiff area is situated on Penarth Road in your constituency. Many of us have the pleasure of visiting it at Christmas time but normally in much happier circumstances. If you are suggesting that I should look into this matter after 4.00 p.m. if the meeting does not produce results, I am happy to make discreet enquiries to ACAS about its progress. Although we are not ministerially responsible, and this is not a devolved matter, I am happy to do that if Lorraine thinks it would be useful.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The lives of thousands of individuals throughout Cardiff and the many businesses that operate here are affected once again by illegal action and disruption by the loony left minority such as Steve Bell, who is well known throughout the sector for this sort of dispute. Cardiff is being brought to a standstill and it is your responsibility as First Minister—it may not be a devolved matter but it is of huge relevance to the people of Cardiff—that you speak to your colleagues in London to bring this to a speedy conclusion. It is not about being conciliatory but about firm action and decisive leadership.

**The First Minister:** I often praise you for your attempts at a statesmanlike approach but your contribution was the reverse of your recent record in this Chamber. If anything can impede the resolution of the industrial dispute or worsen the image outside Wales of Cardiff or Wales, it is a contribution like that, which is now on record. How will saying that Cardiff has been brought to a standstill on this or describing the union officials as of the ‘loony left’ solve the dispute? That is the original unilateral sin

wybod erbyn 3.00 p.m. neu 4.00 p.m. a lwyddodd i daro bargaen. Mae aelodau'r Undeb yn anfodlon ar y sefyllfa hon a chytunodd y naill ochr a'r llall fod anawsterau. Mae angen i rywun ymyrryd a cheisio taro bargaen o ryw fath os na lwyddant y prynhawn yma.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny am fod prif swyddfa'r post ar gyfer ardal Caerdydd ar Ffordd Penarth yn eich etholaeth chi. Caiff llawer ohonom y pleser o ymweld â hi ar adeg y Nadolig ond fel arfer o dan amgylchiadau hapusach. Os ydych yn awgrymu y dylwn ystyried y mater hwn ar ôl 4.00 o'r gloch, os na fydd y cyfarfod yn llwyddiannus, byddaf yn fodlon gwneud ymholiadau gofalus i'r Gwasanaeth Ymgynghorol Cymodi a Chymrodeddu ynglŷn â'i gynnydd. Er nad oes cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol arnom, ac nad yw hyn yn fater datganoledig, yr wyf yn fodlon gwneud hynny os cred Lorraine y byddai o fudd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Unwaith eto effeithir ar fywydau miloedd o bobl yng Nghaerdydd a'r llu o fusnesau sydd yn gweithredu yma oherwydd camau ac ymyrraeth anghyfreithlon y chwith lloerig lleiafrifol fel Steve Bell, sydd yn adnabyddus iawn ar draws y sector am y math hwn o anghydfod. Mae Caerdydd ar stop o'r herwydd ac mae cyfrifoldeb arnoch chi fel Prif Weinidog—efallai nad yw'n fater datganoledig ond mae o bwys mawr i bobl Caerdydd—i siarad â'ch cyd-aelodau yn Llundain i ddod â'r mater i ben yn fuan. Mae angen camau cadarn ac arweinyddiaeth benderfynol yn hytrach na chymodi.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn aml yn eich canmol am eich ymgais i weithredu fel gwladweinydd ond bu eich cyfraniad i'r gwrthwyneb i'ch ymddygiad diweddar yn y Siambr hon. Os gall unrhyw beth atal yr anghydfod diwydiannol rhag cael ei ddatrys neu amharu ar ddelwedd Caerdydd neu Gymru y tu allan i Gymru, cyfraniad o'r fath sydd bellach wedi ei gofnodi a wna hynny. Sut y bydd dweud bod Caerdydd ar stop oherwydd yr anghydfod neu fod swyddogion yr undeb ar y 'chwith lloerig' yn datrys yr

when it comes to industrial dispute. I avoid taking sides because ACAS may need to bring the two sides together if they cannot be brought together independently to solve the situation, as it always is in the end. A solution is often delayed by inflammatory comments of a unilateral kind that favour one side over the other, such as those you have just made.

2:40 p.m.

**Tom Middlehurst:** What we have just heard is classic ignorance from the Conservatives. You cannot resolve an industrial dispute by intervening politically. We should learn the lessons of the past. This dispute will only be settled by both sides sitting around the table to discuss it, hopefully with the assistance of those who can provide conciliation services. I am sure, First Minister, that you will agree that we need to reflect on the current situation. Hopefully, both sides will see that the only way to solve this is for them to sit around the table, hammer out their differences and come to solutions. If ACAS is prepared to intervene and assist in that process, so be it. However, we, as politicians, should tread carefully and refrain from making the inflammatory, unnecessary comments that Jonathan Morgan made today.

**The First Minister:** I am not a shy, retiring violet. If I had expertise in industrial conciliation, I would be happy to offer my services. I have never been trained in that skill. I do not propose to assert or arrogate to myself skills that I do not have. Therefore, I welcome Tom Middlehurst's comment.

**Alun Cairns:** The First Minister is seeking to abdicate responsibility for such issues completely. Is he the political leader in Wales or not? Does he accept that in these challenging economic times, the last thing that Wales needs is militant action such as this, which will deter investment in Wales?

anghydfod? Dyna'r pechod gwreiddiol untu o ran anghydfodau diwydiannol. Osgoaf gymryd ochr gan ei bod yn bosibl y bydd angen i ACAS, ddod â'r ddwy ochr ynghyd os na allant ddod ynghyd yn annibynnol i ddatrys y sefyllfa, fel sydd yn digwydd bob amser yn y pendraw. Caiff datrysiaid yn aml ei ohirio oherwydd y math o sylwadau ymfflamychol untu yn cefnogi'r naill ochr yn erbyn y llall, fel y sylwadau hynny yr ydych newydd eu gwneud.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Mae'r hyn yr ydym newydd ei glywed yn enghraifft glasurrol o anwybodaeth gan y Ceidwadwyr. Ni ellir datrys anghydfod diwydiannol drwy ymyrraeth wleidyddol. Dylem ddysgu o wersi'r gorffennol. Dim ond ar ôl i'r ddwy ochr eistedd o gwmpas bwrdd i drafod y caiff yr anghydfod hwn ei ddatrys, gyda chymorth y rhai a all ddarparu gwasanaethau cymodi, gobeithio. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Brif Weinidog, y cytunwch fod angen inni ystyried y sefyllfa bresennol yn ddwys. Gobeithiaf y bydd y naill ochr a'r llall yn gweld mai'r unig ffordd o'i datrys yw iddynt eistedd o gwmpas bwrdd, datrys y gwahaniaeth barn a dod i delerau. Os yw ACAS yn fodlon ymyrryd a chynorthwyo yn y broses, gorau oll. Fodd bynnag, dylem ni, fel gwleidyddion, droedio'n ofalus a pheidio â gwneud sylwadau diangen, ymfflamychol fel y gwnaeth Jonathan Morgan heddiw.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn un swil o bell ffordd. Pe bawn yn arbenigwr ar gymodi diwydiannol, byddwn yn falch o gynnig fy ngwasanaethau. Gan na chefais hyfforddiant erioed yn y sgil hwn, ni fwriadaf honni neu hawlio ar gam fy mod yn meddu ar sgiliau nad oes gennyf. Felly, croesawaf sylw Tom Middlehurst.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ceisio gwrthod bod yn gyfrifol am faterion o'r fath yn gyfan gwbl. Onid ef yw arweinydd gwleidyddol Cymru? A yw'n derbyn mai'r peth olaf sydd ei angen ar Gymru yn y cyfnod hwn o sialensau economaidd yw camau ymosodol megis y rhain, a fydd yn darbwyllo pobl rhag buddsoddi yng

Nghymru?

**The First Minister:** It is the use of words such as 'Cardiff has been brought to a standstill', when nothing could be further from the truth, that discourages investment in Wales. I am the leader of the partnership Government of this Assembly, but that does not make me responsible for matters that have not been devolved to the Assembly. It only confuses matters if we pretend that we are responsible for matters when we are not. If I can play a helpful and useful role, on advice from ACAS or anyone else, then I will do so. If the discussions that Lorraine Barrett, as the constituency Assembly Member for the Penarth Road area of Cardiff, where the head post office is located, reported to us are taking place this afternoon, indicate that I can contribute, then I will do so. However, I have no skills in this area, nor are we responsible for this matter, much as some of us might or might not like us to be.

You cannot have à la carte Assembly powers whenever it suits. This is an opportunity for you to play to the gallery and say 'we wish we were running the Post Office'. Next, you will say, 'we wish we were running the army'. We know what our settlement is, and it does not include responsibility for post office matters, let alone industrial disputes in the post office.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Credaf ei fod yn briodol imi ddatgan buddiant yn y mater hwn.

**Karen Sinclair:** Does Rhodri remember, as I do, the Tories' position on the hauliers, only a few weeks ago?

**The First Minister:** Yes. Their views are on the record, and no doubt would prove interesting reading. However, it would be wrong to give copies of the record for that period to people involved in this dispute, because it would not help them to reach a solution.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Defnyddio geiriau megis 'mae Caerdydd ar stop', er nad yw hynny'n wir o gwbl, sydd yn perswadio pobl rhag buddsoddi yng Nghymru. Arweinydd Llywodraeth bartneriaeth y Cynulliad hwn ydwyf fi, ond ni olyga hynny fy mod yn gyfrifol am faterion nas datganolwyd i'r Cynulliad. Ni fyddem ond yn drysu pethau pe baem yn cymryd arnom ein bod yn gyfrifol am faterion lle nad oes cyfrifoldeb arnom. Os gallaf chwarae rôl ddefnyddiol, fuddiol ar gyngor ACAS neu unrhyw un arall, gwnaf hynny. Os dengys y trafodaethau y mae Lorraine Barrett, fel Aelod etholaethol y Cynulliad dros ardal Ffordd Penarth yng Nghaerdydd, lle y mae prif swyddfa'r post, wedi ein hysbysu ohonynt, sydd yn digwydd y prynhawn yma, y gallaf gyfrannu, yna gwnaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn meddu ar unrhyw sgiliau yn y maes hwn, ac nid ydym yn gyfrifol am y mater hwn ychwaith, er cymaint y byddai rhai ohonom yn dymuno neu ddim yn dymuno felly.

Ni ellir cael pwerau à la carte i'r Cynulliad pryd bynnag y bo'n addas. Mae hwn yn gyfle ichi chwarae i'r galeri a dweud 'byddai'n dda gennym pe baem yn rhedeg Swyddfa'r Post'. Y tro nesaf, byddwch yn dweud, 'byddai'n dda gennym pe baem yn rhedeg y fyddin'. Gwyddom beth yw ein setliad, ac nid yw'n cynnwys cyfrifoldeb dros faterion swyddfa'r post, heb sôn am anghydfodau diwydiannol o fewn swyddfa'r post.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I think that it is appropriate for me to declare an interest in this matter.

**Karen Sinclair:** A yw Rhodri yn cofio, fel myfi, safbwynt y Torïaid ar y cludwyr nwyddau, dim ond ychydig wythnosau yn ôl?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ydwyf, cofnodwyd eu safbwyntiau, ac yn ddiâu byddent yn ddiddorol i'w darllen. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai'n briodol rhoi copïau o'r cofnod am y cyfnod hwnnw i bobl sydd yn ymwneud â'r anghydfod hwn, am na fyddai'n eu helpu i ddatrys y sefyllfa.



**Brian Hancock:** Bearing in mind your concern for the post office services, do you share my concern for the sub-post offices throughout Wales that are closing at twice the rate at which they were closing previously?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This emergency question is not about sub-post offices.

**Alun Pugh:** I was concerned by Nick Bourne's response. Will you organise staff development for Conservative party Members on how to use a fax machine and e-mail? As well as being unfamiliar with the technology of the 1980s, it seems that they also want to return to those employee-bashing times.

**The First Minister:** I cannot improve on that comment.

**Brian Hancock:** O ystyried eich pryder ynglŷn â gwasanaethau swyddfa'r post, a ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder am yr is-swyddfeydd post ledled Cymru sydd yn cau ar gyfradd ddwywaith gymaint ag y buont yn y gorffennol?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r cwestiwn brys hwn yn ymwneud ag is-swyddfeydd post.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr oeddwn yn pryderu ynglŷn ag ymateb Nick Bourne. A wnewch drefnu hyfforddiant staff ar gyfer Aelodau'r Blaid Geidwadol ar sut i ddefnyddio peiriant ffacs ac e-bost? Yn ogystal â bod yn anghyfarwydd â thechnoleg yr 1980au, ymddengys eu bod hefyd am ddychwelyd at y cyfnod hwnnw o ddwrddio'r gweithwyr.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni allaf ragori ar y sylw hwnnw.

### **Datganiad ar Golli Swyddi yn Alcan, Rogerstone Statement on Job Losses at Alcan, Rogerstone**

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German):** I make this statement in response to an urgent question that the Presiding Officer accepted this morning. Both the First Minister and I were saddened by yesterday's announcement that 220 jobs will be lost at the Alcan facility in Rogerstone, when the foil part of the facility is closed next year. Alcan was one of the first inward investors into Wales after the second world war, and has had a presence here for over half a century.

I have already been in contact with the company, as have our officials, to offer the Assembly's and its sponsored public bodies' full support for the staff affected by this announcement. The company is grateful for all the offers and messages of support it has received. The company has indicated that it is looking for assistance with training.

The position is that, due to a combination of factors, the company has had to make the regrettable decision to close the foil business

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German):** Gwnaf y datganiad hwn mewn ymateb i gwestiwn brys a dderbyniodd y Llywydd y bore yma. Yr oedd y Prif Weinidog a minnau'n drist o glywed y cyhoeddiad ddoe bod 220 o swyddi yn cael eu colli yng ngweithfan Alcan yn Rogerstone, pan fydd y rhan o'r weithfan sydd yn gwneud ffoil yn cau y flwyddyn nesaf. Alcan oedd un o'r mewnfuddsoddwyr cyntaf yng Nghymru ar ôl yr ail ryfel byd, a bu yma ers dros hanner canrif.

Yr wyf eisoes, ynghyd â'n swyddogion, wedi cysylltu â'r cwmni i gynnig cefnogaeth lawn y Cynulliad a'i gyrff cyhoeddus nodedig i'r staff yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn. Mae'r cwmni'n ddiolchgar am yr holl gynigion a negeseuon o gefnogaeth a dderbyniodd. Mae'r cwmni wedi nodi ei fod yn chwilio am gymorth o ran hyfforddiant.

Y sefyllfa yw, oherwydd cyfuniad o ffactorau, bod yn rhaid i'r cwmni wneud y penderfyniad anffodus i gau'r busnes ffoil yn

at Rogerstone, which currently employs some 220 staff, on 30 June 2001. These factors are severe market conditions, including strong competition from continental Europe, particularly Russia and China; a product mix dependent largely on unprofitable household foil, and the continued strength of the pound against European currencies.

Assembly officials, including representatives from the local training and enterprise council and the Welsh Development Agency, met with the company in October to discuss possible future assistance. However, as the company is not located in an assisted area, provision of substantive assistance, mainly in the form of regional selective assistance, is not possible. Alcan will continue to provide over 500 jobs at the sheet facility, which are valuable and important to the Welsh economy. We must foster our indigenous firms as well as support good quality inward investment. It is not an 'either or' situation; we have to do both and do them well.

On the immediate situation, TEC South East Wales will shortly submit an application for the redundancies to be treated as significant, which is likely to be approved by the Assembly. The TEC is also considering, in conjunction with the employment service, implementing additional rapid response measures to assist the affected staff. The decision is dependent on the redundancy situation becoming clearer, for example, knowing how many redundancies are compulsory and how many are voluntary. However, I understand that the company has proposed voluntary redundancy in compensation terms to staff at the foil and sheet operations on the Rogerstone site. It is possible that some staff on the foil site may be able to transfer to the sheet operation, which is when the local TEC can step in and help with any necessary retraining. Employee representatives, including local unions, are being fully consulted by the company and will be meeting senior managers at Alcan tomorrow to discuss the emerging situation.

Rogerstone, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn cyflogi tua 220 o staff, ar 30 Mehefin 2001. Ymhlith y ffactorau hyn mae amodau llym y farchnad, gan gynnwys cystadleuaeth gref o gyfandir Ewrop, yn arbennig Rwsia a Tsieina; ystod o gynnyrch sydd yn dibynnu'n fawr ar ffoil i'r cartref nad yw'n gwneud elw, a chryfder y bunt o hyd yn erbyn arian cyfred gwledydd Ewrop.

Cyfarfu swyddogion y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys cynrychiolwyr o'r cyngor hyfforddiant a menter lleol ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru â'r cwmni ym mis Hydref er mwyn trafod cymorth posibl yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, gan nad yw'r cwmni mewn ardal a gynorthwyir, nid oes modd rhoi cymorth sylweddol, yn bennaf ar ffurf cymorth rhanbarthol dethol. Bydd Alcan yn parhau i gyflogi dros 500 o bobl yn y weithfan dalenni, sydd yn werthfawr ac yn bwysig i economi Cymru. Rhaid inni feithrin ein cwmnïau cynhenid yn ogystal â chefnogi mewnffuddsoddi o safon dda. Nid sefyllfa 'naill ai neu' ydyw; rhaid inni wneud y ddau a hynny'n dda.

O ran y sefyllfa sydd ohoni, bydd Cyngor Hyfforddiant a Menter De-Ddwyrain Cymru yn cyflwyno cais yn fuan i'r swyddi a gollwyd gael eu trin fel rhai arwyddocaol, sydd yn debygol o gael ei gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r Cyngor hefyd yn ystyried, mewn cydweithrediad â'r gwasanaeth cyflogi, roi mesurau ymateb buan ychwanegol ar waith er mwyn cynorthwyo'r staff yr effeithir arnynt. Dibynna'r penderfyniad ar sefyllfa gliriach ynglŷn â'r diswyddiadau, er enghraifft, gwybod faint o ddiswyddiadau gorfodol a faint o ddiswyddiadau gwirfoddol fydd. Fodd bynnag, deallaf fod y cwmni wedi cynnig diswyddo gwirfoddol mewn telerau iawndal i'r staff yn y gweithredleoedd ffoil a dalenni ar safle Rogerstone. Mae'n bosibl y gall rhai aelodau o'r staff gael eu trosglwyddo i'r gweithle dalenni, a gall y Cyngor Hyfforddiant a Menter lleol gynnig help o ran unrhyw ailhyfforddi sydd ei angen. Mae'r cwmni'n ymgynghori'n llawn â chynrychiolwyr y cyflogeion, gan gynnwys yr undebau lleol, a fydd yn cyfarfod ag uwch reolwyr Alcan yfory er mwyn trafod y

sefyllfa sydd yn datblygu.

As soon as the redundancies have been formally identified as significant, any of the affected staff will be able to gain immediate access to work-based learning for adults, if they so desire. They will receive immediate access to a wide range of assistance that they would not normally receive before six months of unemployment. This programme is funded by the National Assembly and delivered through the training and enterprise councils. It is designed to help people aged 25 and over, who are unemployed and at risk of exclusion from the job market to secure and sustain employment through a range of training and other assistance to enhance skills. Job losses in Wales, particularly in manufacturing, have been more than replaced by new jobs, not only in services, but also in highly skilled manufacturing operations. That is why the requirement to enhance people's skills is such an important element of our response to these redundancies and of our general strategy for the Welsh economy. It is early days yet, but the Assembly is ready to provide all possible assistance to affected staff. That promise has already been made to the company, and it is one that we will keep.

The irony of industrial good and bad news in Wales is that this morning Wireless Systems International announced that it would be investing over £17 million in south Wales, establishing a large-scale manufacturing facility for the production of a range of high-efficiency power amplifiers for the mobile telecommunications industry. This announcement demonstrates that Wales can still meet the needs of such modern, high technology companies. It is excellent news for south Wales and a vote of confidence in the skills of the people of Cwmbran, Newport and the surrounding area. This superb project will bring 264 new leading edge technology mobile telephony jobs into Wales. Wireless Systems considered alternative locations in the UK and abroad. This announcement acknowledges the fact that local agencies and the Assembly, which has provided the company with regional selective assistance grant, can compete and

Cyn gynted ag y dynodir y diswyddiadau yn ffurfiol fel rhai arwyddocaol, gall unrhyw aelodau o'r staff yr effeithir arnynt gael mynediad ar unwaith i ddysgu yn gysylltiedig â gwaith i oedolion, os dymunant. Cânt fynediad ar unwaith i ystod eang o gymorth na fyddant fel arfer yn ei gael cyn bod yn ddi-waith am chwe mis. Ariennir y rhaglen hon gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac fe'i cyflwynir drwy'r cynghorau hyfforddiant a menter. Ei nod yw helpu pobl 25 oed a hŷn, sydd yn ddi-waith ac mewn perygl o gael eu hallgau o'r farchnad waith i sicrhau a chynnal cyflogaeth drwy ystod o hyfforddiant a chymorth arall sydd yn gwella eu sgiliau. Cafwyd mwy o swyddi newydd nid yn unig yn y sector gwasanaethau, ond hefyd yn y gweithrediadau gweithgynhyrchu â sgiliau uchel na nifer y swyddi a gollwyd yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu. Dyma pam bod y gofyniad i wella sgiliau pobl yn elfen mor bwysig o'n hymateb i golli'r swyddi hyn a'n strategaeth gyffredinol ar gyfer economi Cymru. Mae'n gynnar eto, ond mae'r Cynulliad yn barod i roi pob cymorth posibl i'r staff yr effeithir arnynt. Gwnaethpwyd yr addewid hwnnw eisoes i'r cwmni, ac mae'n addewid a gadwn.

Y peth eironig ynglŷn â'r newyddion da a'r newyddion drwg oddi wrth ddiwydiant yng Nghymru yw bod Wireless Systems International wedi cyhoeddi y bore yma y byddai'n buddsoddi dros £17 miliwn yn ne Cymru, gan sefydlu gweithfan weithgynhyrchu ar raddfa fawr a fydd yn cynhyrchu ystod o fwyhawyr pŵer o effeithlonrwydd uchel ar gyfer y diwydiant telathrebu symudol. Dengys y cyhoeddiad hwn y gall Cymru fodloni anghenion cwmnïau cyfoes, uwch dechnoleg o'r fath o hyd. Mae'n newyddion ardderchog i dde Cymru ac yn arwydd o ffydd yn sgiliau pobl Cwmbrân, Casnewydd a'r cylch. Daw'r prosiect gwych hwn â 264 o swyddi technoleg arloesol ym maes teleffoni symudol i Gymru. Ystyriodd Wireless Systems leoliadau eraill yn y DU a thramor. Mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn cydnabod y ffaith y gall asiantaethau lleol a'r Cynulliad, a roddodd gymorth rhanbarthol dethol i'r

work together to secure such high-calibre jobs. This is a superb project, bringing leading edge technology and mobile phone telephony into Wales, and I wish Wireless Systems every success for the future. A skilled and adaptable workforce will be essential to the success of this project and is the reason why the Assembly is placing such a high priority in Wales on developing people's skills to help us to adapt to the ever-changing technologies of the future.

**Phil Williams:** I respect the fact that it saddens you to make this statement, but it saddens me to return, yet again, to the problems of the manufacturing industry in Wales. The Assembly has discussed the effect of an overvalued pound on agriculture, tourism, the clothing industry, car components, steel, electronics, and now the aluminium industry. We should remember that Rogerstone lies between Ebbw Vale and Llanwern. Two hundred and twenty jobs will be lost in a region where there have already been serious cuts in the steel industry and where the threats of much more serious cuts still hang over the region. It is not only a threat to primary industries, but to ancillary industries. These job losses, which perhaps total 4,000 by now, have been offset by new employment. However, when comparing the balance of employment in Wales with that of the UK as a whole, there is no doubt that, with the serious losses in the bedrock of our industry, the gap in gross domestic product per capita and in the employment potential will widen.

2:50 p.m.

I have asked you the following question twice and I warned that it would not be long before it rose again. So far, I have not received the answer that I require. Do you agree that the blame should not be solely directed at the overvalued pound, as if that was outside the Government's control? It should also be directed at the Labour Government, which has encouraged a high parity for the pound. It set guidelines in the Bank of England Act 1998 that only referred to inflation, and made no mention of employment or the general health of the

cwmni, gystadlu a chydweithio i sicrhau swyddi o safon mor uchel. Mae hwn yn brosiect gwych, gan ddod â thechnoleg arloesol a theleffoni symudol i Gymru, a dymunaf bob llwyddiant i Wireless Systems yn y dyfodol. Bydd gweithlu medrus a hyblyg yn hanfodol i lwyddiant y prosiect hwn a dyma'r rheswm pam bod y Cynulliad yn rhoi blaenoriaeth mor uchel yng Nghymru ar ddatblygu sgiliau pobl i'n helpu i addasu i dechnoleg fythol gyfnewidiol yn y dyfodol.

**Phil Williams:** Yr wyf yn parchu'r ffaith ei bod yn fater o dristwch ichi wneud y datganiad hwn ond mae'n tristwch i minnau fy mod yn gorfod dychwelyd unwaith eto at broblemau'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Trafododd y Cynulliad effaith y bunt rhy uchel ar amaethyddiaeth, twristiaeth, y diwydiant dillad, cydrannau ceir, dur, electroneg, ac yn awr y diwydiant alwminiwm. Dylem gofio bod Rogerstone rhwng Glynebwy a Llanwern. Collir 220 o swyddi mewn rhanbarth lle y bu toriadau difrifol eisoes yn y diwydiant dur a lle y mae bygythiad o doriadau llawer mwy difrifol yn y rhanbarth o hyd. Nid yn unig yw'n fygythiad i ddiwydiannau cynradd, ond i'r diwydiannu eilaidd. Mae'r gwaith newydd wedi cymryd lle'r swyddi hyn a gollwyd, sef hyd at gyfanswm o 4,000 erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, pan gymherir cydbwysedd cyflogaeth yng Nghymru â chyflogaeth yn y DU yn ei chyfanrwydd, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth y bydd y gagendor o ran cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen a phosibiliadau cyflogaeth yn lledu yn sgîl y colledion difrifol yn sylfaen ein diwydiant.

Yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn canlynol ichi ddwywaith a rhybuddiais y byddai'n codi eto cyn bo hir. Hyd yn hyn, ni chefais yr ateb y gofynnais amdano. A gytunwch na ddylid beio'r bunt rhy uchel yn unig, fel pe bai hynny y tu hwnt i reolaeth y Llywodraeth? Dylid hefyd feio'r Llywodraeth Lafur sydd wedi annog paredd uchel ar gyfer y bunt. Pennodd ganllawiau yn Neddf Banc Lloegr 1998 a gyfeiriodd at chwyddiant yn unig, heb sôn o gwbl am gyflogaeth na iechyd cyffredinol yr economi. Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar gyfraddau llog

economy. The Labour Government relies entirely on high interest rates to control inflation in the south of England. It refuses to consider the alternative of higher taxes for the wealthy, especially in the south of England, who largely fuel part of the inflation. It should be blamed, above all, for creating total uncertainty about the intention or timing of UK entry into the euro. Do you share my anger at its indifference to the economic problems of large areas of Wales? Will you ensure that this message reaches Gordon Brown and Tony Blair, who do not seem to have been listening carefully in the past?

**Michael German:** It is your job to bring gloom and doom where light sometimes exists. The fact that new jobs in high-tech manufacturing have been announced today just down the road from the Alcan plant, exceeding the number of jobs lost, seems to have been lost upon you, according to your statement. I have made my views known about the euro and will continue to do so, as will your party in the coming general election. I hope that the people of this country will respond to our criticisms.

However, the low value of the euro is not at fault in this case. These losses were largely due to the low value of the Chinese currency and the rouble. The National Assembly cannot directly influence the People's Republic of China. Although we tried our best, it pointed out to us that there are only 3 million of us, and that that may cause difficulties. The conditions of the domestic market were largely dominated by conditions in China and Russia, where the principal changes are occurring. That is important.

We must recognise that the economy is changing. We must match skills to new technologies. If we do not do that, we cannot change our economy and cannot match the gap in GDP and find higher value jobs. A myth is circulating that everything is disappearing in the manufacturing sector in Wales and that nothing survives. Nothing could be further from the truth. The Welsh Electronics Forum, which met recently as a taskforce to impress that fact upon the people

uchel er mwyn rheoli chwyddiant yn ne Lloegr. Mae'n gwrthod ystyried y dewis arall sef trethi uwch i'r cyfoethog, yn arbennig yn ne Lloegr, sydd yn bwydo'r chwyddiant i raddau helaeth. Dylid ei beio, uwchlaw popeth, am greu ansicrwydd llwyr ynglŷn â bwriad neu amseriad y DU o ran ymuno â'r ewro. A ydych yn rhannu fy nictier ynglŷn â'i difaterwch tuag at y problemau economaidd mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru? A wnewch chi sicrhau bod y neges hon yn cyrraedd Gordon Brown a Tony Blair, nad yw'n ymddangos eu bod wedi bod yn gwrando'n ofalus yn y gorffennol?

**Michael German:** Eich gwaith chi yw dod â diflastod lle y mae goleuni yn bodoli weithiau. Ymddengys, yn ôl eich datganiad, nad ydych wedi gwerthfawrogi'r ffaith bod mwy o swyddi newydd wedi eu cyhoeddi yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu uwch dechnoleg nid nepell o ffatri Alcan, na'r swyddi a gollwyd. Yr wyf wedi nodi fy marn ar yr ewro a byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny, fel eich plaid chithau yn yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl y wlad hon yn ymateb i'n beirniadaeth.

Fodd bynnag, nid gwerth isel yr ewro sydd ar fai yn yr achos hwn. Cafwyd y colledion hyn yn bennaf oherwydd gwerth isel arian Tsieina a'r rwbl. Ni all y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddylanwadu'n uniongyrchol ar Weriniaeth Tsieina. Er inni wneud ein gorau glas, nodwyd mai dim ond 3 miliwn ohonom sydd, ac y bydd hynny o bosibl yn achosi anawsterau. Yr oedd yr amodau yn Tsieina a Rwsia, lle y mae'r prif newidiadau yn digwydd, yn tra-arglwyddiaethu ar amodau y farchnad fewnwladol i raddau helaeth. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Rhaid inni gydnabod bod yr economi'n newid. Rhaid inni gyfateb sgiliau â'r technolegau newydd. Os na wnawn hynny, ni allwn newid ein heconomi na llenwi'r bwlch o ran cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a dod o hyd i swyddi o werth uwch. Mae si ar led bod popeth yn diflannu yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ac nad oes unrhyw beth yn goroesi. Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Mae Fforwm Electroneg Cymru, a gyfarfu yn ddiweddar fel tasglu i ddarbwylllo

of Wales, is at pains to observe that only small parts of the electronics industry are moving from Wales. There is a substantial industry in Wales that is here to stay. It will be an industry in transition because, as Phil knows, the products that it seeks to create and those that will survive in future depend on the higher technologies. That is why I am pleased to welcome today's announcement regarding Cwmbran.

**Rosemary Butler:** As the Assembly Member for Newport West, I must inform the Assembly that there is great concern about these job losses in Newport. It is particularly devastating for the workers, especially because of the insensitive timing of the announcement in the month running up to Christmas. It is also disappointing to the local economy. These are high quality, high paid jobs that provide good pensions. Alcan has always been considered to be a blue-chip industry. It is worrying that its workforce has been reduced by almost a third.

The Minister for Economic Development announced new jobs this morning, but these jobs should be in addition to and not replacing the jobs lost in Alcan. I would like your assurance that these jobs are the kind of quality jobs that are being lost in Alcan. In your statement you said that TEC South East Wales will shortly be submitting an application for their redundancies to be treated as significant, which is likely to be approved immediately by the Assembly. When will this application arrive? The workers need to see action now from the National Assembly for Wales.

**Michael German:** There is clearly a need for reskilling. I will address the first issue. The type of jobs that we are losing are 160 operatives in multi-skilled teams, along with some craftsmen, production control, scheduling and maintenance engineers. The 160 operation staff form the bulk of the 220 whose jobs have been lost. The new skills that will be required by Wireless Systems in Cwmbran will be more highly skilled.

pobl Cymru o'r ffaith honno, yn awyddus iawn i nodi mai dim ond rhannau bach o'r diwydiant electronig sydd yn symud o Gymru. Mae diwydiant sylweddol yng Nghymru sydd yma i aros. Bydd yn ddiwydiant mewn cyfnod trosiannol, am fod y cynhyrchion, fel y gŵyr Phil, y mae'n ceisio eu creu a'r cynhyrchion a fydd yn parhau yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu ar yr uwch dechnolegau. Dyna pam fy mod yn falch o groesawu'r cyhoeddiad heddiw ynglŷn â Chwmbrân.

**Rosemary Butler:** Fel yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Orllewin Casnewydd, rhaid imi hysbysu'r Cynulliad fod pryder mawr ynglŷn â'r swyddi hyn a gollwyd yng Nghasnewydd. Mae'n arbennig o drychinebus i'r gweithwyr, yn enwedig o safbwynt amseriad ansensitif y cyhoeddiad yn y mis cyn y Nadolig. Mae'n siomedig hefyd o ran yr economi leol. Mae'r rhain yn swyddi o safon uchel â thâl uchel sydd yn rhoi pensiynau da. Ystyriwyd Alcan erioed fel cwmni cadarn. Mae'n achos pryder bod bron traean y gweithlu wedi ei golli.

Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd y swyddi newydd y bore yma, ond dylai'r swyddi hyn fod yn ychwanegol at y swyddi a gollwyd yn Alcan nid yn eu lle. Ceisiwn eich sicrwydd mai swyddi o safon uchel fel y rhai a gollir yn Alcan yw'r swyddi hyn. Yn eich datganiad, dywedasoeh y bydd Cyngor Hyfforddiant a Menter De-Ddwyrain Cymru yn cyflwyno cais cyn bo hir i'w diswyddiadau gael eu trin fel rhai arwyddocaol, sydd yn debygol o gael ei gymeradwyo ar unwaith gan y Cynulliad. Pryd y bydd y cais hwn yn cyrraedd? Mae angen i'r gweithwyr weld bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymryd camau yn awr.

**Michael German:** Mae'n amlwg bod angen ailsgilio. Ymdriniaf â'r mater cyntaf. Y math o swyddi yr ydym yn eu colli yw 160 o weithwyr mewn timau aml-fedrus, ynghyd â rhai chrefftwyr, peirianwyr rheoli a threfnu cynhyrchu a pheirianwyr cynnal a chadw. Y 160 o'r staff gweithredu fydd y mwyafrif llethol o'r 220 o swyddi a gollwyd. Bydd y sgiliau newydd y bydd Wireless Systems yn gofyn amdanynt yng Nghwmbrân yn llawer

However, that is where we urgently need to bridge the gap. We need to ensure that skilled people work in teams. Anybody who visits a modern production enterprise will see that team working is essential. There are people who are used to team working in production. We can build upon their skills so that they will be suitable for these higher level jobs. That is the kind of shift that we want to see.

As far as the TEC submission is concerned, the technical submission as to whether these jobs are significant or not depends on when the voluntary redundancy situation is resolved. That will be offered to all employees at Alcan. There could be an adjustment between workers and those who wish to take voluntary redundancy. However, the TEC will provide immediate training opportunities to people who want to be reskilled. The question of the technical way in which this arises depends on when the negotiations with the union and the workforce are completed. My understanding is that this will not happen until next June. I understand that Wireless Systems will recruit now for opening in April. There is some time for you, as a local Member, to talk to the unions and the workforce about bridging that gap.

**Alun Cairns:** The Welsh Conservative Party regrets the news that 220 jobs will be lost from Alcan in Rogerstone. I am concerned about the way that these 220 jobs are being dismissed because it coincides with an inward investment project in the same area. I remind the Minister that every manufacturing job provides an additional two service sector jobs. It is not only 220 jobs. There is a multiplier effect that should be taken into consideration. Is it not the case that the failing euro and the increased costs that are being introduced by this administration and the Westminster Government are biting and hurting manufacturing jobs—on which we have a disproportionate dependence in Wales—and hitting the Welsh economy hard? Furthermore, this kind of job will be hit even harder by the climate change tax, which will be introduced from April

mwy medrus. Fodd bynnag, dyma'r lle y mae angen inni lanw'r bwlch fel mater o frys. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod pobl fedrus yn gweithio mewn timau. Bydd unrhyw un sydd yn ymweld â menter cynhyrchu gyfoes yn gweld bod gweithio mewn timau yn hanfodol. Ceir pobl sydd yn gyfarwydd â gweithio mewn timau cynhyrchu. Gallwn adeiladu ar eu sgiliau fel y byddant yn gymwys ar gyfer y swyddi lefel uchel hyn. Dyna'r math o newid yr ydym am ei weld.

O ran cyflwyniad y Cyngor Hyfforddiant a Menter, mae'r cyflwyniad technegol a yw'r swyddi hyn yn arwyddocaol yn dibynnu ar y sefyllfa ynglŷn â diswyddo gwirfoddol a phryd y caiff ei ddatrys. Caiff hynny ei gynnig i bob un o gyflogeion Alcan. Gellid bod addasu rhwng gweithwyr a'r rhai sydd yn dymuno diswyddo'n wirfoddol. Fodd bynnag, bydd y cyngor yn rhoi cyfleoedd hyfforddi ar unwaith i bobl sydd am feithrin sgiliau newydd. Mae'r cwstiwn ynglŷn â'r ffordd dechnegol y mae hyn yn codi yn dibynnu ar pryd y caiff y negodiadau â'r undeb a'r gweithlu eu cwblhau. Deallaf na fydd hyn yn digwydd tan fis Mehefin nesaf. Deallaf y bydd Wireless Systems yn recriwtio'n awr erbyn yr agoriad yn Ebrill. Mae rhywfaint o amser ichi, fel Aelod Lleol, siarad â'r undebau a'r gweithlu ynglŷn â llanw'r bwlch hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n edifar gan Blaid Geidwadol Cymru glywed y newyddion y collir 220 o swyddi yn Alcan yn Rogerstone. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r ffordd y diystyri'r y 220 o swyddi hyn am ei fod yn cyd-daro â phrosiect mewnfuddsoddi yn yr un ardal. Atgoffaf y Gweinidog fod pob swydd weithgynhyrchu yn darparu dwy swydd arall yn y sector gwasanaethau. Nid 220 o swyddi yn unig ydynt. Ceir effaith luosogi y dylid ei hystyried. Onid yw'n wir bod yr ewro wan a'r costau cynyddol a gyflwynir gan y weinyddiaeth hon a Llywodraeth San Steffan yn niweidiol i swyddi gweithgynhyrchu—y mae gennym ddibyniaeth anghymesur arnynt yng Nghymru—ac yn ergyd drom i economi Cymru? At hynny, bydd y math hwn o swydd yn cael ergyd galetach oherwydd y dreth newid hinsawdd, a gyflwynir o fis Ebrill

onwards. That will have a more exaggerated effect in Wales than in other parts of the United Kingdom.

In your statement, you mentioned that only low-skilled jobs can be followed through in Eastern Europe. I returned from the Czech Republic yesterday and they have plans to upskill their workforce and appear to be much more dynamic than the Assembly's administration. We met a deputy minister in the Czech Republic yesterday who could almost be called a Thatcherite. He seizes the opportunity in developing skills and has plans to attract the higher-skilled jobs to Eastern Europe. This could well be the thin end of the wedge of a mass exodus of jobs from the south Wales economy to Eastern Europe.

We are also placing a great deal of faith in the TECs. I appreciate that they are being wound up and that successor bodies will accept the role and the tasks of the TECs, but they will not be as skilled or experienced in these circumstances. What plans will be given to the WDA and the National Council for Education and Training for Wales, who will inherit these responsibilities?

3:00 p.m.

**Michael German:** I will have to make my statement all over again because you clearly did not listen to it. Anybody who wishes Margaret Thatcher upon the Czech Republic will probably be saddened by the end result, considering the devastation that she caused to Wales's economy.

On the facts that you did not hear: first, you said that I dismissed these job losses. You clearly did not listen, so I will tell you again that I said that the First Minister and I were saddened by yesterday's announcement that 220 jobs will be lost at the Alcan facility. I then went on to describe the facility. Clearly, you were not listening and I hope that you will listen now when I tell you that this is not good news. I spent much time telling you how we will deal with and manage this issue.

ymlaen. Caiff hynny fwy o effaith yng Nghymru nag mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Yn eich datganiad, soniasoch mai dim ond swyddi â sgiliau isel y gellir eu cyflwyno yn Nwyrain Ewrop. Dychwelais o'r Weriniaeth Tsiec ddoe ac mae ganddynt gynlluniau i uwchraddio sgiliau eu gweithlu ac ymddengys ei bod yn llawer mwy dynamig na gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad. Cyfarfuom â dirprwy weinidog y Weriniaeth Tsiec ddoe y gellid dweud ei fod yn Thatcheriaid bron. Mae'n bachu ar y cyfle i ddatblygu sgiliau ac mae'n bwriadu denu'r swyddi â sgiliau uwch i Ddwyrain Ewrop. Mae'n bosibl y gallai hyn fod yn flaen y gyllell i lu o swyddi economi de Cymru i Ddwyrain Ewrop.

Yr ydym hefyd yn ymddiried gryn dipyn yn y Cynghorau Hyfforddiant a Menter. Gwerthfawrogaf y ffaith eu bod yn cael eu diddymu ac y bydd y cyrff olynol yn ymgymryd â rôl a thasgau'r cynghorau, ond ni fydd angen iddynt fod mor fedrus a phrofiadol o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn. Pa gynlluniau a roddir i'r WDA a Chyngor Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant, a fydd yn etifeddu'r cyfrifoldebau hyn?

**Michael German:** Bydd yn rhaid imi wneud fy natganiad o'r newydd am nad oeddech yn gwrando arno mae'n amlwg. Bydd unrhyw un sydd yn dymuno gweld polisïau Margaret Thatcher yn y Weriniaeth Tseic yn debygol o edifarhau wrth weld y canlyniad terfynol, o ystyried y difrod a barodd hithau i economi Cymru.

O ran y ffeithiau nas clywsoch: yn gyntaf, dywedasoich imi ddiystyru'r swyddi hyn a gollwyd. Mae'n amlwg nad oeddech yn gwrando, felly nodaf ichi eto imi ddweud bod y Prif Weinidog a minnau'n drist o glywed y cyhoeddiad ddoe y collir 220 o swyddi yng ngweithfan Alcan. Euthum ymlaen wedyn i ddisgrifio'r weithfan. Yn amlwg, nid oeddech yn gwrando, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn gwrando'n awr pan ddywedaf wrthyhch nad yw hyn yn newyddion da.



I did not dismiss the job losses in any way.

Treuliais gryn amser yn dweud wrthyhych sut y byddwn yn rheoli ac yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Ni ddiystyriaais y swyddi a gollwyd o gwbl.

Secondly, I did not say that the people affected are low skilled and that low skills are being transferred. Those affected are 160 operatives in multi-skilled teams, which is what the production environment has been working towards. These are skilled workers, who will, with relevant upskilling into the new technologies, be very acceptable to the job market. If they are successful, they could well find themselves in better paid employment at the end of it all.

Yn ail, ni ddywedais mai pobl â sgiliau isel yw'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt ac mai sgiliau isel a drosglwyddir. Y bobl yr effeithiwyd arnynt yw'r 160 o weithwyr mewn timau amlfedrus, sef yr hyn y mae'r amgylchedd cynhyrchu wedi bod yn ceisio ei gyflawni. Gweithwyr medrus ydynt, a byddant yn dderbyniol iawn yn y farchnad waith pan gaiff eu sgiliau eu huwchraddio yn unol â'r dechnoleg newydd. Os ydynt yn llwyddiannus, gallent fod mewn gwaith â mwy o dâl yn y pen draw.

You keep referring to the damage that the currency does. Currencies are damaging, but the principle damage—and I repeat this to you—is that done by the Chinese currency and the rouble. If you think that the competition from Russia and China could have been beaten off by the National Assembly through some policy on the pound to deal with currency issues, you are mistaken. There are wider issues relating to our economy and the crucial issue is that we must invest in skills, which is what this Government intends to do.

Yr ydych yn parhau i gyfeirio at y niwed a wna'r arian cyfredol. Gwna arian cyfredol niwed, ond y prif niwed—a dywedaf hynny wrthyhych drachefn—yw'r niwed a wna arian Tsieina a'r rwbl. Os credwch y gallai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod wedi gwrthsefyll y gystadleuaeth gan Rwsia a Tsieina drwy ryw bolisi ar y bunt er mwyn mynd i'r afael â materion arian cyfredol, yr ydych yn gwneud camsyniad. Mae materion ehangach sydd yn ymwneud â'n heconomi a'r mater holl bwysig yw bod yn rhaid inni fuddsoddi mewn sgiliau, sef yr hyn y bwriada'r Llywodraeth hon ei wneud.

**Val Feld:** Before I make my substantive point, I cannot resist expressing great surprise at the notion that being dynamic and being Thatcherite are synonymous. Once again, I am gobsmacked at the Conservatives' convenient amnesia. It is as if thousands of jobs were not lost in Wales during the years of Tory Government. However, I am glad to say that we have come a long way since then.

**Val Feld:** Cyn imi wneud fy mhrif bwynt, ni allaf beidio â mynegi fy syndod mawr wrth y cysyniad bod bod yn Thatcheriaid yn gyfystyr â bod yn ddynamig. Unwaith eto, fe'm synnwyd gan amnesia cyfleus y Ceidwadwyr. Maent yn ymddwyn fel na phetai miloedd o swyddi wedi eu colli yng Nghymru yn ystod blynyddoedd y Llywodraeth Doriaidd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dda gennyf ddweud ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd da ers hynny.

What do we consider to be long-term jobs and how do we adapt to this kind of change in the economy? This morning, I heard on the radio a spokesman for Wireless Systems, who was billed as offering long-term jobs and said that the company has a commitment to the Welsh economy. However, he also said that the company expects to be here for five

Beth yw swyddi tymor hir yn ein tyb ni a sut yr ydym yn addasu i'r math hwn o newid yn yr economi? Clywais lefarydd Wireless Systems ar y radio y bore yma yr adroddwyd ei fod yn cynnig swyddi tymor hir. Dywedodd fod y cwmni yn ymrwymedig i economi Cymru. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd hefyd fod y cwmni yn disgwyl aros yma am

years. That is a very different interpretation of long-term investment.

Do you agree, and what are your current views on how we can enable the Welsh economy to become sufficiently robust so that we can weather this kind of bad news, and pick up the people and the skills quickly? Do you think that what has happened on this occasion is fortuitous or does it indicate that we are beginning to get better at doing that? Can we do more to get earlier intelligence of problems among foreign companies located in Wales? We should consider how we can work with them to get advance warning and to find ways to keep them in Wales, perhaps by providing them with not only financial help but other kinds of support.

**Michael German:** On your last point, it is crucial that we find a way of getting earlier intelligence. One way that we can do that is by working with the cluster groupings. The work that I have done in the last two months in establishing the electronics taskforce is a way of ensuring that we are knowledgeable and ahead of the game in terms of the problems and the exciting developments that that industry has ahead of it.

In terms of investment, we have significant opportunities in west Wales and the Valleys to invest more in companies that are footloose and fancy free, which represent the future for our country. There is no doubt that, as the pace of technologies change—I hope that everybody recognises that the pace of change is not slackening but is becoming faster—we will need to adapt to skills much more rapidly, in order to be ahead of the game. Lifelong learning is not just a statement in inverted commas in an old, dusty education and training manual. It is a reality, and we must invest in the reskilling and continual skilling of our workforce. Only by being at the cutting edge of change will we be able to keep apace with new technologies. This is a great opportunity. We have discussed a sustainable and renewable energy industry, and our burgeoning cultural industry is also an opportunity to develop. Electronics, aerospace and motor vehicle component manufacture are also crucial and

bum mlynedd. Mae hynny'n ddehongliad tra gwahanol o fuddsoddi tymor hir.

A gytunwch, a beth yw eich barn ar hyn o bryd ar sut y gallwn alluogi economi Cymru i fod yn ddigon cadarn fel y gallwn wrthsefyll newyddion drwg o'r fath, a meithrin y bobl a'r sgiliau yn gyflym? A gredwch mai lwc oedd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd y tro hwn neu a yw'n dangos ein bod yn gwella yn hynny o beth? A allwn wneud mwy er mwyn cael gwybodaeth gynnar am broblemau ymhlith cwmnïau tramor a leolir yng Nghymru? Dylem ystyried sut y gallwn gydweithio â hwy er mwyn cael rhybudd ymlaen llaw a chanfod ffyrdd o'u cadw yng Nghymru, efallai drwy roi mathau eraill o gymorth yn ogystal â chymorth ariannol.

**Michael German:** Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt olaf, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn dod o hyd i ffordd o gael gwybodaeth yn gynharach. Un ffordd y gallwn wneud hynny yw drwy weithio gyda grwpiau clwstwr. Mae'r gwaith a wneuthum yn ystod y deufis diwethaf wrth sefydlu'r tasglu electroneg yn ffordd o sicrhau ein bod yn wybodus ac ar flaen y gad o ran y problemau a'r datblygiadau cyffrous y bydd y diwydiant yn eu hwynebu.

O ran buddsoddi, mae gennym gyfle da yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd i fuddsoddi rhagor mewn cwmnïau dilyffethair, a gynrychiola ddyfodol ein gwlad. Nid oes amheuaeth y bydd angen inni addasu i sgiliau yn llawer cyflymach er mwyn arwain y gad wrth i'r newidiadau technolegol gyflymu—gobeithiaf fod pawb yn cydnabod bod y newidiadau'n cyflymu yn hytrach nag arafu. Nid datganiad mewn dyfynodau mewn hen lawlyfr addysg a hyfforddiant llychlyd yw dysgu gydol oes. Mae'n realiti, a rhaid inni fuddsoddi i roi hyfforddiant parhaus i'n gweithlu a rhoi sgiliau newydd iddynt. Dim ond drwy fod ar flaen y gad o ran newidiadau y gallwn ymdopi â'r technolegau newydd. Mae hwn yn gyfle gwych. Yr ydym wedi trafod diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy a chynaliadwy, ac mae ein diwydiant diwylliannol cynyddol hefyd yn gyfle i ddatblygu. Mae electroneg, awyrofod a gweithgynhyrchu cydrannau cerbydau modur hefyd yn hanfodol bwysig ac yn feysydd

are fields that are developing and strengthening as we speak. Change, of course, will happen. We live in a globalised, economically-changing world. However, if we are prepared, we can not only sustain current jobs, we can also enhance them and ensure a better quality of life for our people.

**William Graham:** Members will know that, for many years, there were two aluminium plants in Newport. However, only one is left. I agree with Rosemary Butler that this was an insensitive time to announce these job losses. In terms of warnings, it would be advisable for people to read the financial press, where analysts have warned for some months that household foil production has become increasingly unprofitable. I refer to the high volume of this product produced in emerging nations.

Will you look closely at maintaining our country's key manufacturing products and sheet manufacturing system? Their future is by no means assured. We have yet to hear the agreement of the main board to place further capital at the disposal of the Rogerstone plant. Will you take this into account and ensure that you present a persuasive argument for appropriate finance to be made available?

**Michael German:** I have already made it clear to the company that we were seeking a guarantee from it that the sheet metal manufacturing facility would continue. The company's response has been to continue to treat this as a high-level capital investment, and it wishes to continue to do so. The company's loss of £10 million over the last two years in the foil sector is an indication that it has succumbed to the problems of the market. However, the company has given an assurance that targeted capital investment will continue. I will monitor that. The company is not in a regional selective assistance area, but we will do whatever we can within the bounds of the rules before us to ensure that the jobs are retained.

sydd yn datblygu ac yn cryfhau fwyfwy. Bydd newidiadau'n digwydd, wrth reswm. Yr ydym yn byw mewn byd sydd yn newid yn economaidd ac sydd o dan ddylanwadau byd-eang. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn barod, gallwn nid yn unig gadw'r swyddi presennol, ond eu gwella a sicrhau bywyd o ansawdd gwell i'n pobl.

**William Graham:** Gŵyr yr Aelodau y bu dwy weithfan alwminiwm yng Nghasnewydd am flynyddoedd lawer. Fodd bynnag, dim ond un sydd ar ôl. Cytunaf â Rosemary Butler fod hon yn adeg ansensitif i gyhoeddi bod y swyddi hyn yn cael eu colli. O ran cael rhybudd, byddai'n dda pe bai pobl yn darllen y wasg ariannol, lle y bu'r dadansoddwyr yn rhybuddio ers rhai misoedd bod cynhyrchu ffoil i'r cartref wedi mynd yn fwyfwy amhroffidiol. Cyfeiriaf at y swm mawr o'r cynnyrch hwn a gynhyrchir yn y gwledydd sydd yn datblygu.

A wnewch chi edrych yn fanwl ar gadw cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu allweddol a system gweithgynhyrchu dalenni ein gwlad? Nid yw eu dyfodol yn sicr o bell ffordd. Nid ydym wedi clywed hyd yn hyn bod y prif fwrdd yn cytuno i sicrhau bod mwy o gyfalaf ar gael i weithfan Rogerstone. A wnewch chi ystyried hyn a sicrhau eich bod yn cyflwyno dadl gref dros sicrhau bod cyllid priodol ar gael?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi egluro i'r cwmni ein bod yn ceisio sicrwydd ganddo y byddai'r weithfan gweithgynhyrchu dalenni metel yn parhau. Bu'r cwmni'n ymateb drwy barhau i drin hyn fel buddsoddiad cyfalaf lefel uchel, ac mae am barhau i wneud hynny. Dengys y ffaith i'r cwmni golli £10 miliwn yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf yn y sector ffoil ei fod wedi dioddef oherwydd y problemau yn y farchnad. Fodd bynnag, rhoddodd y cwmni sicrwydd y bydd buddsoddi cyfalaf wedi ei dargedu yn parhau. Byddaf yn monitro hynny. Nid yw'r cwmni mewn ardal cymorth dethol rhanbarthol, ond gwnawn beth bynnag y gallwn o fewn y rheolau sydd ger ein bron i sicrhau y cedwir y swyddi.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you agree that the descriptions of the Welsh economy given by Alun Cairns and Phil Williams bordered on a virtual caricature of the situation? While there are many areas of concern, such as the strength of the pound—although we heard the good news last week that the euro is strengthening vis-à-vis the pound—it was rich to hear Alun Cairns talk about job creation and job destruction in Wales, when his Government presided over a level of unemployment three times the current level in Wales. Phil Williams's description did not recognise that unemployment in Wales is at its lowest level for the best part of 20 years, and that, even in my constituency, youth unemployment is only 20 per cent of what it was three or four years ago. It does not help that you undermine the credibility of Wales as an economic investment location by continuing to portray a doomsday, catastrophic and cataclysmic picture.

**Michael German:** I could not agree with you more. What the Members from other parties who have contributed today are really saying is that the doors should be closed, the gates locked and the people thrown out of work. That is not how the Assembly should portray Wales. We have a rich future in a diverse economy. Those who say that we have eggs in only one basket are very much mistaken. If they were to count the figures and look at the facts, they will see an economy in transition, which is, however, a secure economy with potential for growth. The key to growth must be the skills of our people. We must invest in those skills. I look forward to working with the National Council for Education and Training to ensure that we continually upskill our workers, recognise the demands placed upon them and meet the challenge of the new technologies. We have a brave and sharp new economy. There is no purpose in talking it down.

3:10 p.m.

**Brian Hancock:** I was saddened and shocked yesterday when I heard the news. The factory is less than half a mile from the boundary of the Islwyn constituency, and

**Brian Gibbons:** A gytunwch fod y disgrifiadau o economi Cymru a roddwyd gan Alun Cairns a Phil Williams yn garicatur bron o'r sefyllfa? Er bod llawer o feysydd sydd yn achosi pryder, fel cryfder y bunt—er inni glywed y newyddion da yr wythnos diwethaf bod yr ewro'n cryfhau o'i chymharu â'r bunt—yr oedd yn syndod i Alun Cairns siarad am greu a dinistrio swyddi yng Nghymru, pan lywyddodd ei Lywodraeth yntau dros lefel ddiweithdra a oedd deirgwaith cymaint â'r lefel bresennol yng Nghymru. Nid oedd disgrifiad Phil Williams yn cydnabod y ffaith bod diweithdra yng Nghymru ar ei lefel isaf ers 20 mlynedd bron, a hyd yn oed yn fy etholaeth i, bod y diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc ond 20 y cant o'r hyn a fu dair neu bedair blynedd yn ôl. Nid yw o fudd ichi danseilio hygredd Cymru fel lleoliad buddsoddi economaidd drwy barhau i roi darlun trychinebus, adfyddus dydd y farn.

**Michael German:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi. Yr hyn mae'r Aelodau o bleidiau eraill a gyfrannodd heddiw yn dweud mewn gwirionedd yw y dylid cau'r drysau, cloi'r giataiu a diswyddo pobl. Nid dyna'r darlun y dylai'r Cynulliad ei roi o Gymru. Bydd dyfodol cyfoethog mewn economi amrywiol gennym. Mae'r rhai sydd yn dweud ein bod wedi rhoi ein hwyau mewn un fasedged yn gwneud camsyniad mawr. Pe baent yn edrych ar y ffigurau a'r ffeithiau, byddent yn gweld economi sydd mewn cyfnod trosiannol, ond sydd, fodd bynnag, yn economi sicr a chanddi le i dyfu. Rhaid i sgiliau ein pobl fod yn allwedd i dwf. Rhaid inni fuddsoddi yn y sgiliau hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda'r Cyngor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Cenedlaethol er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gwella sgiliau ein gweithwyr o hyd, yn cydnabod y gofynion a roddir arnynt ac yn cwrdd â her y technolegau newydd. Mae gennym economi newydd hyderus a disglair. Nid oes diben lladd arni.

**Brian Hancock:** Yr oedd yn fater o dristwch a sioc imi pan glywais y newyddion ddoe. Mae'r ffatri lai na hanner milltir o ffin etholaeth Islwyn, ac o ganlyniad mae llawer

consequently many constituents, friends and neighbours work there and in the steel plants, so I am doubly concerned. I am concerned that in this factory, which is long established—as William said, there were two factories there in the past—the average age of the workforce is the age when people tend not to think about furthering their career or changing career because they have accumulated years of service and it may be conducive at their time of life to take what is on offer. I am concerned about the 220 job losses and also about the creation of 260 jobs in the next valley: we should mesh these jobs.

Members have already made points about the training and enterprise councils coming and going and the creation of the National Council for Education and Training. It is important that we realise that we will want those jobs over and above what we are losing. We need to address the training that should be in place now, not next year. We want the jobs now and we must identify them.

I return to the subordinate legislation that I proposed to ensure that a programme of careers education is provided for all post-16 students. We need to address that in the future. I have great concerns for the people of Islwyn. I am anxious for long-term jobs. That point was made on the radio this morning. Like Val Feld, I was concerned. I am worried about the quality of the jobs. We are not interested in footloose and fancy-free jobs. There is a long recurring record where companies come to the Valleys and disappear, and this happens often at Christmas time, which is a bad time. Gross domestic product is going down, and the gap is getting bigger. That is our problem. We must do something about it, mesh the jobs and pull them together. Let us get on with it.

**Michael German:** The task before us is to reduce the gap in the GDP. We have the advantage of Objective 1 money to do that. We also know that, while jobs will be lost in the economy, we must work towards the

o'm hetholwyr, fy nghyfeillion a'm cymdogion yn gweithio yno ac yn y gwaith dur, felly mae dau achos pryder gennyf. Yr wyf yn pryderu mai oedran cyfartalog y gweithlu yn y ffatri, sydd wedi hen sefydlu—bu dwy ffatri yno yn y gorffennol, fel y dywedodd William—yw'r oedran pan fydd pobl yn tueddu i beidio â meddwl am ddatblygu eu gyrfa ymhellach neu newid gyrfa am fod blynyddoedd o wasanaeth ganddynt ac efallai ei bod yn hwylus iddynt dderbyn yr hyn a gynigir ar yr adeg honno yn eu bywydau. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch y 220 o swyddi a gollwyd a hefyd ynghylch creu'r 260 o swyddi yn y cwm cyfagos: dylem gyplysu'r swyddi hyn.

Mae'r Aelodau eisoes wedi sôn am ddiddymu'r cynghorau hyfforddiant a menter a chreu'r Cyngor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Cenedlaethol. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli y byddwn am gael y swyddi hyn yn ychwanegol at y rhai a gollwn. Mae angen inni roi sylw i'r hyfforddiant a ddylai fod ar waith yn awr, nid y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae angen y swyddi arnom yn awr a rhaid inni eu nodi.

Dychwelaf at yr is-ddeddfwriaeth a gynigiais er mwyn sicrhau y darperir rhaglen o addysg gyrfaoedd i bob myfyriwr dros 16 oed. Mae angen inni roi sylw i hynny yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn pryderu'n fawr ynghylch pobl Islwyn. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch swyddi tymor hir. Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt hwnnw ar y radio y bore yma. Fel Val Feld, yr oeddwn innau'n pryderu. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch ansawdd y swyddi. Nid ydym am gael swyddi dilyffethair. Ers tro bu cwmnïau'n dod i'r Cymoedd ac yn diflannu, ac mae hyn yn digwydd yn aml ar adeg y Nadolig, sydd yn amser gwael. Mae cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth yn gostwng, ac mae'r gagendor yn cynyddu. Dyna'r broblem sydd gennym. Rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynghylch hynny, cyplysu'r swyddi a'u tynnu ynghyd. Gadewch inni fwrw iddi.

**Michael German:** Y dasg sydd o'n blaenau yw lleihau'r gagendor o ran cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Gallwn fanteisio ar arian Amcan 1 i wneud hynny. Gwyddom hefyd, er y caiff swyddi eu colli yn yr

future and the new economy. That is why the national economic development strategy, which you are a part of preparing, will be so crucial to helping us picture the sort of Wales in which we want to live in 10 or 15 years. I repeat that investing in the skills of your workforce—existing workers as well as those who are coming into work—is the crucial element which will make that difference, along with the proper investment that we can make to be selectively helpful in Wales in a way that cannot be done elsewhere. We are not trying to prop up the economy. We are investing for the future. We must expect the economy to move much more rapidly in the future. If you think that our economy can be sustained by standing still, you are mistaken. The clue is skills and retraining.

economi, fod yn rhaid inni weithio tuag at y dyfodol a'r economi newydd. Dyma pam y bydd y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, yr ydych yn cymryd rhan wrth ei pharatoi, yn holl bwysig i'n helpu i ddychmygu'r Gymru yr ydym am fyw ynddi ymhen 10 neu 15 mlynedd. Dywedaf eto fod buddsoddi yn sgiliau eich gweithlu—gweithwyr presennol yn ogystal â'r rhai a ddaw i mewn i'r gwaith—yn elfen holl bwysig a fydd yn gwneud y gwahaniaeth hwnnw, ynghyd â'r buddsoddiad priodol y gallwn ei wneud o ran cymorth dethol yng Nghymru mewn ffordd na ellir ei wneud mewn mannau eraill. Nid ydym yn ceisio cynnal yr economi. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi ar gyfer y dyfodol. Rhaid inni ddisgwyl i'r economi symud yn llawer cyflymach yn y dyfodol. Yr ydych yn gwneud camsyniad os credwch y gellir cynnal ein heconomi drwy sefyll yn yr unfan. Sgiliau ac ailhyfforddi yw'r allwedd.

### **Datganiad ar Galedi ac Ariannu Myfyrwyr Statement on Student Hardship and Funding**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I wish to make a statement about the terms of reference for the inquiry I intend to set up, to take forward the commitment in 'Putting Wales First: A Partnership Agreement for the People of Wales' to conduct an independent investigation into student hardship and funding in Wales, dealing with the issues covered by the Cubie report of the independent committee of inquiry in Scotland that fall within the Assembly's remit. I am pleased to do this, from a personal viewpoint and because it shows that the first partnership agreement of the National Assembly for Wales is already bearing fruit.

At oral Assembly questions on 2 November I told Dafydd Wigley that I would ensure that the investigation is commissioned in such a way that it plays into the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's proposed higher education policy review. I also told Jonathan Morgan that I would consider an investigation into hardship and that I am committed to ensuring that the greatest

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Dymunaf wneud datganiad am gylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad y bwriadaf ei sefydlu, er mwyn mynd ag ymrwymiad 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf: Cytundeb Partneriaeth ar gyfer Pobl Cymru' ymlaen er mwyn cynnal ymchwiliad annibynnol i galedi ac ariannu myfyrwyr yng Nghymru, gan ddelio â'r materion a gwmpaswyd gan adroddiad Cubie o bwyllgor ymchwilio annibynnol yn yr Alban a gwmpesir o fewn cylch gwaith y Cynulliad. Mae'n bleser gennyf wneud hyn, o safbwynt personol ac am ei fod yn dangos bod cytundeb partneriaeth cyntaf Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn dwyn ffrwyth yn barod.

Yn y cwestiynau llafar a ofynnwyd yn y Cynulliad ar 2 Tachwedd dywedais wrth Dafydd Wigley y byddwn yn sicrhau y comisynir yr ymchwiliad mewn modd sydd yn sicrhau y bydd yn berthnasol i adolygiad polisi addysg uwch arfaethedig y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Dywedais wrth Jonathan Morgan hefyd y byddwn yn ystyried ymchwiliad i galedi ac fy mod yn

number of young people, in particular, have access to the widest possible opportunities of higher education. I also invited the members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, on 15 November, to nominate people to take part in the investigation.

One major theme in the Assembly's vision for the nation is that the development of an inclusive society where everyone has the chance to fulfil his or her potential. In the programme for Government laid out in the partnership agreement, we have defined our principles for education and lifelong learning in these terms:

'High quality, lifelong education, available to all of the people of Wales, is our highest priority. Education liberates talents, extends opportunity and helps create wealth.

We will put in place policies to achieve long-term and sustained improvement in the quality of education in Wales, with the aim of building one of the best education systems in the world.'

We wish to upskill. We want to be able to grow the knowledge economy for the benefit of our communities and the individuals in them, and we wish to extend opportunity and widen participation in education beyond compulsory school age in all parts of our communities. In further and higher education, that means that we shall seek to remove barriers to participation so that all those who want to and can meet the challenges, can further their education.

I have prepared draft terms of reference, which I have posted on the Assembly intranet. The investigation's terms of reference and biographies of its members are also available on the Chamberweb. As I said on 2 November, the issue is not whether we should have tuition fees or not. Tuition fees exist. I want this investigation to help the Assembly to make the best use of its powers and budgets and to make an impact sooner rather than later in this policy area.

ymrwymedig i sicrhau y gall y nifer uchaf posibl o bobl ifanc, yn arbennig, gael mynediad at y dewis ehangach posibl o gyfleoedd addysg uwch. Hefyd, estynnais wahoddiad i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ar 15 Tachwedd, i enwebu pobl i gymryd rhan yn yr ymchwiliad.

Un o brif themâu'r weledigaeth sydd gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer y genedl yw datblygu cymdeithas gynhwysol lle caiff pawb y cyfle i gyflawni ei botensial. Yn y rhaglen a nodwyd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth ar gyfer y Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi diffinio ein hegwyddorion ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes fel a ganlyn:

'Addysg gydol oes o ansawdd uchel, ar gael i holl bobl Cymru, yw ein blaenoriaeth uchaf. Mae addysg yn rhyddhau doniau, yn ymestyn cyfle ac yn help i greu cyfoeth.

Byddwn yn sefydlu polisiau i sicrhau gwelliant hirdymor a chynaliadwy yn ansawdd addysg yng Nghymru, gyda'r nod o lunio un o'r cyfundrefnau addysg gorau yn y byd.'

Yr ydym am loywi sgiliau pobl. Yr ydym am ddatblygu'r economi gwybodaeth er budd ein cymunedau a'r unigolion ynddynt, ac yr ydym yn dymuno ehangu cyfleoedd a chynyddu nifer y bobl sydd yn cymryd rhan mewn addysg y tu hwnt i oedran ysgol gorfodol ym mhob rhan o'n cymunedau. Ym maes addysg bellach ac uwch, golyga hynny y byddwn yn ceisio diddymu'r rhwystrau at gyfranogi er mwyn i bawb sydd am ac sydd yn gallu cwrdd â'r sialensiau allu datblygu eu haddysg ymhellach.

Yr wyf wedi paratoi cylch gorchwyl drafft, a roddais ar fewnrwyd y Cynulliad. Mae cylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad a bywgraffiadau ei aelodau hefyd ar gael ar we'r Siambr. Fel y dywedais ar 2 Tachwedd, nid a ddylem gael ffioedd hyfforddi ai peidio yw'r mater dan sylw. Mae ffioedd hyfforddi yn bodoli. Yr wyf am i'r ymchwiliad hwn helpu'r Cynulliad i wneud y defnydd gorau o'i bwerau a'i gyllidebau ac i sicrhau y bydd hyn yn cael effaith cyn gynted â phosibl ar y maes polisi hwn.

That is a challenging agenda but I am confident that a well-based study on these lines will be invaluable for the Assembly and for the future of students in Wales. I will discuss the draft terms of reference with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on 13 December, as previously agreed. I will be happy to consider comments and suggestions from other Members. That is why the terms of reference are in draft form.

I will place the report's recommendations before the Assembly when it is published. The Cabinet will give serious consideration to the recommendations, and we shall then, as agreed, consult the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on our response in terms of implementation.

In the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee meeting, I invited Members to nominate people who could be considered for membership of the investigation group. I have also approached the National Union of Students. I am grateful to those who put forward names for consideration. I stress that I am not establishing another public body. Rather, this is a group of people, acting in an unpaid capacity, brought together to use their experience and expertise for the benefit of the community of Wales and to undertake a specific task within a time limit.

I am pleased to announce that Professor Teresa Rees has agreed to chair the investigation task group. She is a professor in the School of Social Sciences, Cardiff University, and her expertise is in equal opportunities, labour market policies and the European Union. Prior to her current appointment she was Professor of Labour Market Studies at the University of Bristol. She is a member of the Equal Opportunities Commission and represents Wales on the Commission. The following have also agreed to sit on the group: Rob Humphreys, an academic in the Department of Continuing Education at the University of Wales, Swansea; David Jenkins, General Secretary of the Trades Union Congress Wales; Dr Sonia Reynolds, a member of the Further Education Funding Council for Wales;

Mae hon yn agenda heriol ond yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd astudiaeth gynhwysfawr i'r perwyl hwn yn werthfawr iawn i'r Cynulliad ac i ddyfodol myfyrwyr yng Nghymru. Byddaf yn trafod y cylch gorchwyl drafft gyda'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 13 Rhagfyr, fel y cytunwyd yn flaenorol. Byddaf yn barod i ystyried sylwadau ac awgrymiadau gan Aelodau eraill. Dyna pam mai ar ffurf drafft y mae'r cylch gorchwyl.

Byddaf yn cyflwyno argymhellion yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi. Bydd yn rhaid i'r Cabinet roi ystriaeth ddifrifol i'r argymhellion, ac yna byddwn yn ymgynghori â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, fel y cytunwyd, ar ein hymateb o ran gweithredu.

Yn ystod cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, estynnais wahoddiad i'r Aelodau enwebu pobl y gellid eu hystyried i fod yn aelodau o'r grŵp ymchwilio. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cysylltu ag Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r rhai a awgrymodd enwau i'w hystyried. Pwysleisiaf nad wyf yn sefydlu corff cyhoeddus arall. Yn hytrach, grŵp o bobl yw'r rhain, na chânt eu talu, a ddygwyd ynghyd i ddefnyddio eu profiad a'u harbenigedd er budd cymuned Cymru ac er mwyn ymgymryd â thasgau penodol o fewn cyfnod penodol o amser.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi bod yr Athro Teresa Rees wedi cytuno i gadeirio'r grŵp gorchwyl ymchwilio. Mae'n athro yn Ysgol y Gwyddorau Cymdeithasol, Prifysgol Caerdydd, ac mae'n arbenigo ym meysydd cyfle cyfartal, polisiau'r farchnad lafur a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Cyn ei phenodiad presennol yr oedd yn Athro Astudiaethau'r Farchnad Lafur ym Mhrifysgol Bryste. Mae'n aelod o'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a chynrychiola Cymru ar y Comisiwn. Mae'r canlynol hefyd wedi cytuno i fod yn rhan o'r grŵp: Rob Humphreys, academydd yn Adran Addysg Barhaus Prifysgol Cymru, Abertawe; David Jenkins, Ysgrifennydd Cyffredinol Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur, Cymru; Dr Sonia Reynolds, aelod o Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru; Kenneth Richards, economydd academiaidd ym Mhrifysgol



Kenneth Richards, an academic economist at the University of Wales, Aberystwyth, now retired; Ray Singh, a barrister at law and a member of the Commission for Racial Equality, who represents Wales's interests on the Commission and who was a member of the National Assembly Advisory Group; and Eleri Wynne Jones, a member of the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, Director of Channel Four Television between 1986 and 1990 and a member of the Sianel Pedwar Cymru Authority between 1983 and 1990. Last, but not least, is Matt Whiting, President of the University of Glamorgan Students' Union, who was nominated by the National Union of Students, Wales.

In conclusion, I hope that you agree that the group of people that we have assembled will do a valuable job for the people of Wales. I place on record my thanks to them for their willingness to undertake this important task. The group that will be known as the investigation group on student hardship and funding will hold its first meeting to discuss how to take forward this initiative on Friday 8 December. I will expect the group to report to me by Easter 2001

3:20 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I thank the Minister for bringing forward this review, for which many of us in this Chamber have been calling since July of last year. The road to Damascus is clearly a long one, but I am glad that the Government has reached the final destination. Will you confirm that the review—I know that you mentioned this in your statement—in no way undermines the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's ability to examine this crucial issue as part of its higher education review? It should not replace the Committee's review of student hardship and the funding of higher education. That is a crucial part of the review and I hope that you will support the Committee in that work.

In terms of the work of your group, when does it intend to meet and how often? I assume that its meetings will be held in

Cymru, Aberystwyth, sydd wedi ymddeol erbyn hyn; Ray Singh, bargyfreithiwr ac aelod o'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, sydd yn cynrychioli buddiannau Cymru ar y Comisiwn ac a oedd yn aelod o Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol; ac Eleri Wynne Jones, aelod o Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, Cyfarwyddwraig Channel Four Television rhwng 1986 a 1990 ac aelod o Awdurdod Sianel Pedwar Cymru rhwng 1983 a 1990. Heb anghofio Matt Whiting, Llywydd Undeb Myfyrwyr Prifysgol Morgannwg, a enwebwyd gan Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr, Cymru.

I gloi, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cytuno y bydd y grŵp o bobl a gasglwyd ynghyd yn cyflawni tasg werthfawr i bobl Cymru. Cofnodaf fy niolch iddynt am eu parodrwydd i ymgymryd â'r dasg bwysig hon. Bydd y grŵp a elwir yn grŵp ymchwilio ar galedi ac ariannu myfyrwyr yn cynnal ei gyfarfod cyntaf i drafod sut i fynd â'r fenter hon ymlaen ddydd Gwener 8 Rhagfyr. Disgwyliaf i'r grŵp adrodd yn ôl imi erbyn Pasg 2001.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ddod â'r adolygiad hwn ymlaen rhywbeth, y mae nifer ohonom yn y Siambr hon wedi ei ddymuno ers mis Gorffennaf y llynedd. Mae'r ffordd i Ddamascus yn amlwg yn un faith, ond yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi cyrraedd pen y daith. A wnewch chi gadarnhau na fydd yr adolygiad—gwn eich bod wedi crybwyll hyn yn eich datganiad—yn tanseilio gallu'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes mewn unrhyw ffordd i archwilio'r mater holl bwysig hwn fel rhan o'i adolygiad addysg uwch? Ni ddylai ddisodli adolygiad y Pwyllgor ar galedi myfyrwyr ac ariannu addysg uwch. Mae hynny'n rhan hanfodol o'r adolygiad a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cefnogi'r Pwyllgor gyda'r gwaith hwnnw.

Yn nhermau gwaith eich grŵp, pryd y mae'n bwriadu cwrdd a pha mor aml? Tybiaf y cynhelir ei gyfarfodydd yn gyhoeddus er

public so that when the group takes evidence from interest groups, particularly the National Union of Students, which I hope will offer a considerable amount of evidence on student hardship, the public will be able to attend and to listen to the broad range of evidence being presented. We do not want higher education to become a preserve of the middle classes only. We welcome any steps by the Government to widen access to the many thousands of young people in and outside Wales, who have the academic ability to go to university.

**Jane Davidson:** I reaffirm that this review will play into the higher education review. I made that commitment to the Committee in its meeting last week. As I said in the statement, the group's first meeting will be at the end of this week. It is an independent investigation and I look to it to confirm its terms of reference in its first meeting. I will then be able to report on them to the Committee at its meeting on 13 December. If Members have concerns about the terms of reference, I would be grateful if they could convey them to me by Friday lunchtime so that I can put proposed changes to that group at its meeting on Friday afternoon.

I can confirm that this group will take evidence in public. It will be crucial for it to do so. I also need to respond to your important point on university not just being for the middle classes. It is important for us in this Assembly to recognise that at present our record on this is better than that of anywhere else in Britain. We have far wider participation in higher education. When you consider socio-economic groupings and access to universities, we have the best record in Britain. However, we must ensure that we better our own best. The work of this review, which will feed into the higher education review, will be crucial in doing that.

**Peter Black:** I welcome this announcement and congratulate you on bringing forward this commitment to the Assembly so soon

mwyn i'r cyhoedd allu bod yn bresennol a gwranddo ar yr amrywiaeth eang o dystiolaeth a gyflwynir, pan fo'r grŵp yn derbyn tystiolaeth gan grwpiau sydd â diddordeb, yn arbennig Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr, a fydd, gobeithiaf, yn cyflwyno swm sylweddol o dystiolaeth ar galedi myfyrwyr. Nid ydym am i addysg uwch ddod yn rhywbeth sydd yn unigryw i'r dosbarth canol yn unig. Croesawn unrhyw gamau a gynigir gan y Llywodraeth er mwyn ehangu'r cyfle i'r miloedd o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru a thu allan i Gymru, sydd â'r gallu academiaidd i fynd i brifysgol.

**Jane Davidson:** Ailddatganaf y bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn rhan o'r adolygiad addysg uwch. Gwneuthum yr ymrwymiad hwnnw i'r Pwyllgor yn ei gyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf. Fel y dywedais yn y datganiad, cynhelir cyfarfod cyntaf y grŵp ar ddiwedd yr wythnos hon. Mae'n ymchwiliad annibynnol a byddaf yn disgwyl iddo gadarnhau ei gylch gorchwyl yn ei gyfarfod cyntaf. Yna, gallaf gyflwyno adroddiad arno i'r Pwyllgor yn ei gyfarfod ar 13 Rhagfyr. Os bydd gan yr Aelodau bryderon am y cylch gorchwyl, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baent yn eu cyfleu imi erbyn amser cinio dydd Gwener er mwyn imi allu gynnig newidiadau i'r grŵp hwnnw yn ei gyfarfod brynhawn dydd Gwener.

Gallaf gadarnhau y bydd y grŵp hwn yn cymryd tystiolaeth yn gyhoeddus. Bydd yn hanfodol iddo wneud hynny. Mae angen imi ymateb hefyd i'ch pwynt pwysig na ddylai prifysgolion fod yn rhywbeth ar gyfer y dosbarth canol yn unig. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod yn y Cynulliad hwn bod ein henw da yn hyn o beth yn well nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o Brydain. Mae gennym fwy o bobl yn cymryd rhan mewn addysg uwch. Wrth ystyried grwpiau economaidd-gymdeithasol a mynediad i brifysgolion, mae gennym y record orau ym Mhrydain. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwella ar hyn. Bydd gwaith yr adolygiad hwn, a fydd yn bwydo i mewn i'r adolygiad addysg uwch, yn hanfodol er mwyn gwneud hynny.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad hwn a hoffwn eich llongyfarch ar ddod â'r ymrwymiad hwn ger bron y Cynulliad mor

after the partnership agreement, which is now starting to deliver for education in Wales. I raise the issue of the problems facing mature students in higher and further education. There is evidence of higher dropout rates among mature students and a reduced number of mature applicants, particularly in previous years. Those people have family responsibilities and mortgages and therefore do not find student loans attractive. Can we ask the group to consider this as part of its work?

**Jane Davidson:** The group will have to consider this. In recognition of this problem, we have put in place different financial arrangements this year. However, I appreciate that, because they are new, they have not yet been fully taken up by mature students. It would be a good idea for a transcript of our proceedings today to be given to the hardship group so that it can utilise Members' suggestions.

**Pauline Jarman:** A thorough review of student hardship in Wales is long overdue, not least because of the widespread dissatisfaction within the higher education sector because the current arrangements are so flawed. The National Assembly has the power to alter only one element of the student support arrangement at the moment, which is the access fund. However, historically these have not been used to benefit those in greatest need of financial assistance. This was reaffirmed by a DfEE report in June this year, and there were recent changes to the guidelines on distributing these funds with the aim of targeting resources at, for example, students in receipt of benefits, mature students, and single parent students. This was welcome. However, we would hope that this review would give careful consideration to when these funds are made available during the academic year. At the moment, students can only access these funds after applying for, and receiving, a full student grant. This effectively means that debt is a precondition to receiving these funds.

Statistics show that many students, who are not prepared to risk such debt, are leaving

fuan ar ôl y cytundeb partneriaeth, sydd yn dechrau gweithredu ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru. Hoffwn godi mater y problemau y mae myfyrwyr hŷn yn eu hwynebu mewn addysg bellach ac uwch. Mae tystiolaeth o gyfraddau uwch o bobl yn gadael yn gynnar a nifer is o ymgeiswyr hŷn, yn arbennig yn ystod y blynyddoedd blaenorol. Mae gan y bobl hyn gyfrifoldebau teuluol a morgeisi ac felly nid yw benthyciadau myfyrwyr yn ddeniadol iddynt. A allwn ofyn i'r grŵp ystyried hyn fel rhan o'i waith?

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd rhaid i'r grŵp ystyried hyn. I gydnabod y broblem hon, yr ydym wedi llunio trefniadau ariannol gwahanol eleni. Fodd bynnag, am eu bod yn newydd, gwerthfawrogaf nad yw myfyrwyr hŷn wedi manteisio arnynt hyd yma. Byddai'n syniad da rhoi trawsgrifiad o'n gweithrediadau heddiw i'r grŵp caledi er mwyn iddo ddefnyddio awgrymiadau'r Aelodau.

**Pauline Jarman:** Mae angen dybryd am adolygiad trylwyr o galedi myfyrwyr yng Nghymru, a hynny oherwydd yr anfodlonrwydd cyffredinol o fewn y sector addysg uwch am fod y trefniadau presennol mor ddiffygiol. Dim ond y pŵer I newid un elfen o'r trefniadau cynnal myfyrwyr sydd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar hyn o bryd, sef y gronfa mynediad. Fodd bynnag, yn hanesyddol, ni ddefnyddiwyd y rhain ar gyfer y rhai sydd angen y cymorth ariannol mwyaf. Atgyfnerthwyd hyn gan adroddiad gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth ym mis Mehefin eleni, a gwnaethpwyd newidiadau'n ddiweddar i'r canllawiau ar ddsbarthu'r arian hwn gyda'r nod o dargedu adnoddau, er enghraifft, at fyfyrwyr sydd yn rhieni sengl. Yr ydym yn croesawu hyn. Fodd bynnag, byddem yn gobeithio y byddai'r adolygiad hwn yn rhoi ystyriaeth ofalus i pryd y dylai'r arian hwn fod ar gael yn ystod y flwyddyn academaidd. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond ar ôl gwneud cais am, a derbyn grant myfyriwr llawn y gall myfyrwyr gael gafael ar yr arian hwn. Golyga hyn bod dyled yn un o ragamodau derbyn yr arian hwn.

Dengys ystadegau bod nifer o fyfyrwyr, nad ydynt yn barod i gael dyled o'r fath, yn

courses because of financial pressures. Will the investigation consider making this money available to students earlier in the academic year, so that the benefits of the funds can be maximized? Also, does the Minister believe, as most of us do, that the current arrangements are absurd in that we are able to influence only one aspect of the student support system? Does she agree that the National Assembly needs the powers to change other aspects of the system, to be able to devise a comprehensive and effective support system?

Finally, we hear many references to the need to improve skill levels in Wales. We also hear about the need to give parity of esteem to the vocational and the academic. This investigation will need to consider carefully support for students in further education as well as higher education, and the particular problems facing those in vocational education, who have often been overlooked.

**Jane Davidson:** Thank you for some helpful points. I agree that we have problems with the access funds in terms of timing. Your helpful suggestions will be looked at by the group, which will consider how much earlier we can deliver them. Part of the reason why we have included an academic with an interest in continuing education, plus a representative of the Further Education Funding Council in the group is exactly to look at further education and higher education together. This review needs to look at student issues. A point for Members' information: I am aware that a DfEE-commissioned student income and expenditure survey will be published shortly. That will be extremely useful for our colleagues who will debate this important issue.

Finally, this review will look at those powers which fall within the Assembly's remit. We have been clear on that. There is an important message. It is not just about access funds but about the widening participation

gadael eu cyrsiau oherwydd y pwysau ariannol sydd arnynt. A wnaiff yr ymchwiliad ystyried gwneud yr arian hwn ar gael I fyfyrwyr yn gynharach yn y flwyddyn academiaidd, er mwyn gallu defnyddio manteision yr arian I'r eithaf? Yn ogystal, a yw'r Gweinidog o'r farn, fel y mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom, bod y trefniadau presennol yn afresymol am na allwn ond dylanwadu ar un agwedd yn unig o'r system cynnal myfyrwyr? A yw'n cytuno bod angen y pwerau ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol I newid agweddau eraill ar y system, er mwyn gallu llunio system gynnal gynhwysfawr ac effeithiol?

I gloi, clywn lawer o gyfeiriadau at yr angen I wella lefelau sgiliau yng Nghymru. Clywn hefyd am yr angen I sicrhau cydraddoldeb parch I sgiliau galwedigaethol a sgiliau academiaidd. Bydd angen I'r ymchwiliad hwn ystyried yn ofalus y cymorth a gynigir I fyfyrwyr addysg bellach yn ogystal â myfyrwyr addysg uwch, a'r problemau arbennig a wynebir gan y rhai hynny mewn addysg alwedigaethol, sydd yn cael eu hanwybyddu'n aml.

**Jane Davidson:** Diolch ichi am rai pwyntiau defnyddiol. Cytunaf bod gennym broblemau o ran amseru'r arian mynediad. Bydd y grŵp yn edrych ar eich awgrymiadau defnyddiol, ac yn ystyried faint yn gynharach y gallwn eu dosbarthu. Rhan o'r rheswm ein bod wedi cynnwys academydd sydd â diddordeb mewn addysg barhaus, a chynrychiolydd o'r Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach yn y grŵp yw er mwyn gallu edrych ar addysg bellach ac addysg uwch gyda'i gilydd. Mae angen i'r adolygiad hwn edrych ar faterion sydd yn ymwneud â myfyrwyr. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y caiff arolwg a gomisiynwyd gan yr Adran Addsg a Chyflogaeth ar incwm a gwariant myfyrwyr ei gyhoeddi yn y man. Bydd hynny yn ddefnyddiol iawn i'n cydweithwyr a fydd yn trafod y mater pwysig hwn.

I gloi, bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn edrych ar y pwerau hynny sydd o fewn cylch gwaith y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi bod yn sicr ar hynny. Mae yna neges bwysig. Nid dim ond mater o gael gafaél ar arian ydyw, ond yr

agenda, and that is why it is so important that this review feeds in to the strategic higher education review that is being undertaken by the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

**Cynog Dafis:** Yr oeddwn yn cymryd y byddai'n bosibl i addasu'r cylch gorchwyl ar ôl cyfarfod y Pwyllgor ar 13 Rhagfyr. Efallai y gwnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau hynny.

Hoffwn nodi rhai pethau ynglŷn â'r cylch gorchwyl a ddaeth ger ein bron. Cyfeirir at gael gwybod am hyd a lled y cyni ymysg myfyrwyr. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod astudiaeth hefyd o achosion y cyni? Mae'n ymwneud â ffioedd, a hefyd y ffaith bod grantiau wedi'u diddymu ac mae agweddau ar reoliadau nawdd cymdeithasol sydd yn berthnasol hefyd. Mae'n allweddol bod yr ymchwiliad hwn yn mynd at wreiddiau'r holl achosion yn eglur a chyflawn.

Yn ogystal ag effaith cyni myfyrwyr ar gyfranogiad mewn addysg uwch, onid yw'n briodol ein bod yn edrych hefyd ar yr effaith ar sefydliadau addysg uwch? A bod yn fanwl gywir, nid yw'n rhan o gwestiwn cyni myfyrwyr ond byddai'r un math o wybodaeth ac ymchwiliad yn gallu adnabod i ba raddau y mae'r sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn dioddef o achos y newidiadau hyn. Mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu bod yr effaith yn negyddol ac yn wir yn ddifrifol yn achos rhai sefydliadau.

A fydd hi'n fodlon cynnwys hefyd ystyried pa gyflwyniadau a pha geisiadau y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Cynulliad eu gwneud i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ynglŷn â newidiadau posibl mewn meysydd eraill megis nawdd cymdeithasol ac yn y blaen, o gofio am ein swyddogaeth yma yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fel llais i Gymru?

3:30 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** I agree that we will need to look at reasons behind hardship. I hope that you consider the draft terms of reference sufficiently broad for people who will give evidence to this review to say what they

agenda o sicrhau cyfranogiad ehangach, a dyna pam ei bod hi mor bwysig i'r adolygiad hwn fwydo i mewn i'r adolygiad addysg uwch strategol a gynhelir gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

**Cynog Dafis:** I presumed that it would be possible to adapt the terms of reference after the Committee's meeting on 13 December. Perhaps the Minister will confirm that.

I would like to note some factors concerning the terms of reference that have been presented to us. There is mention here of ascertaining the extent of hardship among students. Will you ensure that there is also a study into the causes of hardship? It relates to fees, and also the fact that grants have been abolished and there are also aspects of social security regulations that are relevant. It is vital that this inquiry gets to the bottom of all the causes in a clear and comprehensive manner.

In addition to the effect of student hardship on participation in higher education, is it not appropriate that we also examine the effect on higher education establishments? Strictly speaking, this is not part of the question of student hardship, however the same sort of intelligence and inquiry could identify to what extent the higher education institutions in Wales are suffering because of these changes. The evidence suggests that the effect is negative and indeed critical in the case of some institutions.

Will she be willing also to include a consideration of what representations and requests the Government of Wales and the Assembly should make to the United Kingdom Government concerning possible changes in other sectors such as social security and so on, given our role here in the National Assembly as a voice for Wales?

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf y bydd angen edrych ar y rhesymau y tu ôl i galedi. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn ystyried bod y cylch gorchwyl drafft yn ddigon eang er mwyn i'r bobl a fydd yn rhoi tystiolaeth i'r

want. It is important that they can do so, and that we focus on what powers the Assembly has to act on hardship. That is also why it is important for anything that comes out of this review to be reported to the Assembly and to come before the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee for further discussion on the implementation of any issues arising from the report.

We are faced with the challenge of wanting to do something quickly that would be extremely helpful and focused on student hardship—which I have undertaken by putting this investigation together—and dealing with the long-term agenda of the effects on higher education establishments, which I hope will come forward in the higher education review. The danger is that if we ask the review to do too much, and to report by spring, it will not be effective enough, in terms of the information that it will provide. It is important that we keep the review focused, if we can, so that we get information by spring and then feed into further work that will be undertaken in the higher education review. The Committee's recommendations will then come forward to Assembly Ministers and subsequently to the UK Government.

I thought that I had made it clear that we had posted draft terms of reference onto the internet today. At the end of the day, subject to the powers of the Assembly, the terms of reference need to be agreed by the independent investigation. I reaffirm what I said earlier, that if Members want to change those terms of reference substantially or feel that they do not address certain areas, I would be grateful if they contacted me before Friday lunchtime. I will put their points to the group and then bring a further report to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee meeting next week.

adolygiad hwn ddweud beth sydd ei angen arnynt. Mae'n bwysig y gallant wneud hynny, a'n bod yn canolbwyntio ar y pwerau hynny y mae'r Cynulliad eu hangen i weithredu ar galedi. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig y caiff unrhyw beth a ddaw yn sgîl yr adolygiad hwn ei gyfleu i'r Cynulliad a'i gyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes er mwyn cynnal trafodaeth bellach ar roi unrhyw faterion a gyfyd o'r adroddiad ar waith.

Mae sialens yn ein hwynebu sef ein dyhead i wneud rhywbeth yn gyflym a fyddai'n ddefnyddiol iawn ac a fyddai'n canolbwyntio ar galedi myfyrwyr—a gyflawnwyd eisoes drwy lunio'r ymchwiliad hwn—a delio gydag agenda tymor hir yr effeithiau ar sefydliadau addysg uwch, a fydd, gobeithiaf, yn dod i'r amlwg yn yr adolygiad addysg uwch. Y perygl yw, os gofynnwn i'r adolygiad wneud gormod, a chyflwyno adroddiad erbyn y gwanwyn, ni fydd yn ddigon effeithiol, yn nhermau'r wybodaeth a ddarpara. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau ffocws yr adolygiad, os y gallwn, er mwyn i'r wybodaeth a ddarperir erbyn y gwanwyn gael ei bwydo i waith pellach a gynhelir gan yr adolygiad addysg uwch. Yna cyflwynir argymhellion y Pwyllgor i Weinidogion y Cynulliad ac yna i Lywodraeth y DU.

Credais fy mod wedi esbonio'n ddigon clir ein bod wedi dosbarthu'r cylch gorchwyl drafft ar y fewnwyd heddiw. Yn y pen draw, yn amodol ar bwerau'r Cynulliad, mae angen i ymchwiliad annibynnol gytuno ar y cylch gorchwyl. Ailddatganaf yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach, os yw'r Aelodau am newid y cylch gorchwyl hwn yn sylweddol neu os ydynt o'r farn nad yw'n mynd i'r afael â rhai pynciau, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baent yn cysylltu â mi cyn amser cinio dydd Gwener. Byddaf yn cyflwyno eu pwyntiau i'r grŵp ac yna'n cyflwyno adroddiad pellach yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr wythnos nesaf.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**William Graham:** I raise a point of order **William Graham:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o

under Standing Order No. 17.2 (vii). I am somewhat saddened, but also astounded by the paper issued by Ron Davies entitled 'In search of attitude'. It contains provocative and gratuitously insulting language. It is unnecessary to refer to John Redwood as a 'gauleiter'. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. William Graham is raising a point of order.

**William Graham:** Members will know that that is not a true German word, but was invented by the German National Socialist Party to designate an area commander. When one uses the term 'national socialist', one evokes terrible and bitter memories for many millions of people, and it is astounding that the term 'gauleiter' was used. It makes a nonsense of any claim to inclusiveness in the paper that is presented. I call on the Member, through you Llywydd, for an unreserved apology, which I am sure that he will wish to issue to a fellow member of Her Majesty's Privy Council.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have not read this paper, but I will certainly do so. William Graham asks me to consider whether this is an appropriate use of the Assembly intranet to provide for public documents. I will study this. It is not a matter for me directly because the word was not used in the Chamber. However, I will visit this matter and, if necessary, I will respond.

**Ron Davies:** I am grateful for your ruling on that point of order, Llywydd. If, on reflection, you wish to draw anything to my attention, if I have contravened the Standing Orders of the Assembly, I will consider the matter.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Further to that point of order, if the Welsh Conservative group find it offensive, can we ask Ron Davies not to place it in the milling area? [*Laughter.*]

**Val Feld:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 7.8 (iv) and (v), relating

dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.2 (vii). Mae'r papur a gyflwynwyd gan Ron Davies, 'In search of attitude', wedi peri rhywfaint o dristwch a syndod i mi. Mae'n cynnwys iaith heriol a sarhaus iawn. Nid oes angen cyfeirio at John Redwood fel 'gauleiter'. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae William Graham yn codi pwynt o drefn.

**William Graham:** Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol nad yw hyn yn air sydd yn wirioneddol Almaeneg, ond fe'i crëwyd gan Blaid Sosialaidd Genedlaethol yr Almaen er mwyn dynodi cadlywydd ardal. Mae defnyddio'r term 'sosialydd cenedlaethol' yn dwyn atogfion erchyll a chwerw i filoedd o bobl, ac fe'm synnwyd y defnyddiwyd y term 'gauleiter'. Mae'n sarhaus unrhyw gais ar gyfer cynwysoldeb yn y papur a gyflwynir. Galwaf ar yr Aelod, drwoch chi Lywydd, i ymddiheuro'n llwyr, a hyderaf y bydd yn awyddus i wneud hynny i gyd-aelod o Gyfrin Gyngor Ei Mawrhydi.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid wyf wedi darllen y papur hwn, ond fe wnaaf hynny'n sicr. Gofynnodd William Graham imi ystyried pa un a yw hyn yn ddefnydd priodol o fewnwyd y Cynulliad er mwyn darparu dogfennau cyhoeddus. Byddaf yn astudio hyn. Nid yw'n fater imi yn uniongyrchol am na ddefnyddiwyd y gair yn y Siambr. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf ymholiadau i'r mater hwn ac, os bydd angen, fe ymatebaf.

**Ron Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich penderfyniad ar y pwynt hwnnw o drefn, Lywydd. Os hoffech dynnu unrhyw beth i'm sylw ar ôl ystyried y mater, os wyf wedi torri Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad, byddaf yn ystyried y mater.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, os bydd grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru o'r farn bod hyn yn sarhaus, a allwn ofyn i Ron Davies beidio â'i osod yn y neuadd? [*Chwerthin.*]

**Val Feld:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.8 (iv) a (v), yn ymwneud ag

to discourteous or unbecoming conduct, and disorderly, discriminatory or offensive language. Earlier this afternoon, I asked the First Minister a question and I, perhaps, nattered on a little longer than I should have. However, I am willing to prescribe my comments at your request, Llywydd, but it is inappropriate for other Members of the Chamber to shout me down. I also prefaced a question to Mike German with some political remarks about Margaret Thatcher and the Conservative years—we are, after all, a political institution—but, once again, I was shouted down, particularly by Members from the Conservative side of the Chamber. My colleague, Brian Gibbons, subsequently made some highly political remarks about Margaret Thatcher and was not shouted down. I raised with you two weeks ago—*[Interruption.]* It is happening again.

I have no objection to debates in this Chamber on issues and differences between us, but I take strong exception to being shouted down in this fashion by Assembly Members no matter which party they are from. I asked you two weeks ago whether this kind of conduct was conducive with our responsibilities to give due regard to equality of opportunity. You have not yet replied. I am not best placed to judge whether I am shouted down more than male members of my party who make similar remarks. I ask you to judge that, if you would.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to you for raising that point of order. I will make two points. I have noticed a substantial increase in remarks from sedentary positions in this Chamber. Such remarks cannot be in order because the Members making them have not been called to speak. Furthermore unless remarks are made on mike, they cannot be recorded by the Record of Proceedings and, if made in the Welsh language, they cannot be translated. Such remarks are clearly out of order and I deprecate them.

If barracking is taking place, then I draw the attention of Members, yet again, to the clear

ymddygiad anghwrtais neu amhriodol, ac iaith sydd yn groes i'r drefn, yn camwahaniaethu neu'n peri tramgwydd. Yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, gofynnais gwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog ac, efallai fy mod wedi siarad ychydig yn rhy faith. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn barod i gyflwyno fy sylwadau ar eich cais, Lywydd, ond nid yw'n briodol i Aelodau eraill o'r Siambr weiddi ar fy nhraws. Cyfeiriais gwestiwn at Mike German hefyd gyda rhai sylwadau gwleidyddol am Margaret Thatcher a'r blynyddoedd Ceidwadol—yr ydym, wedi'r cyfan, yn sefydliad gwleidyddol—ond, unwaith eto, torrwyd ar fy nhraws, yn arbennig gan Aelodau o ochr Geidwadol y Siambr. Yna, gwnaeth fy nghyd-Aelod, Brian Gibbons, sylwadau gwleidyddol iawn am Margaret Thatcher ac ni thorrodd ar ei draws ef. Codais gyda chi bythefnos yn ôl—*[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n digwydd eto.

Nid oes gennyf unrhyw wrthwynebiad i drafodaethau yn y Siambr hon ar faterion a gwahaniaethau rhyngom, ond yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu'n gryf pan fo Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gweiddi ar fy nhraws, waeth pa blaid y maent yn perthyn iddi. Gofynnais ichi bythefnos yn ôl pa un a oedd ymddygiad o'r fath yn cyd-fynd â'n cyfrifoldebau i ystyried cydraddoldeb cyfle. Nid ydych wedi ateb eto. Nid fi yw'r person gorau i farnu a yw Aelodau'n torri ar fy nhraws i yn amlach nac ar draws aelodau gwrywaidd fy mhlaidd sydd wedi gwneud sylwadau tebyg. A wnewch chi gynnig eich barn ar hyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am godi'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Yr wyf am wneud dau bwynt. Yr wyf wedi sylwi ar gynnydd sylweddol yn nifer y sylwadau a wneir gan Aelodau ar eu heistedd yn y Siambr hon. Nid yw sylwadau o'r fath yn dderbyniol am na chafodd yr Aelodau a'u gwnaeth eu galw i siarad. Yn ogystal, oni wneir sylwadau o'r fath ar y meic, ni all Cofnod y Trafodion eu cofnodi ac, os cânt eu gwneud yn Gymraeg, ni ellir eu cyfieithu. Mae sylwadau o'r fath yn amlwg allan o drefn ac nid wyf yn eu cymeradwyo.

Os bydd Aelodau'n gweiddi ar draws Aelodau eraill, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r



Chamber guidance that is on the Chamberweb. Point 13 clearly indicates that Members who are not speaking are expected to listen courteously to the debate and should not interrupt the Members speaking or carry on private conversations. This guidance was adopted by the Assembly early in our proceedings. In this chair, I have often relied on self-control and self-discipline in ensuring that our business is conducted properly. I prefer to do that. However, if this conduct continues I will ensure that I will personally interrupt, using my priority button, to prevent that from happening.

Aelodau, unwaith eto, at yr arweiniad clir ar weithgareddau'r Siambr sydd ar we'r Siambr. Noda pwynt 13 yn amlwg bod disgwyl i Aelodau nad ydynt yn siarad wrando'n gwrtais ar y ddadl ac ni ddylent dorri ar draws yr Aelodau sydd yn siarad na chynnal sgysiau preifat. Mabwysiadwyd yr arweiniad hwn yn gynnar yn nhrefodion y Cynulliad. Yn y gadair hon, yr wyf wedi gorfod dibynnu'n aml ar hunan-reolaeth a hunan-ddisgyblaeth er mwyn sicrhau y cynhelir ein busnes yn briodol. Mae'n well gennyf wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, os bydd yr ymddygiad hwn yn parhau, byddaf yn sicrhau y byddaf yn torri ar draws yn bersonol, gan ddefnyddio fy motwm blaenoriaeth, er mwyn atal hynny rhag digwydd.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** As I reported to the Business Committee this morning, the motion to approve the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulation 2000 that was scheduled for debate this Thursday has had to be withdrawn and rescheduled for next week. I hope to approve that on Thursday, 14 December, not on Tuesday, 12 December, as I reported to the Business Committee. Apologies to Members for that. I will also make arrangements later today to table a no-named day motion to elect Members to the Local Government Partnership Council and I will seek the Presiding Officer's and the Members' agreement to move the motion under Standing Order No. 6.16 on Thursday. That will be in time for the next meeting of the partnership council to be held on Monday, 11 December.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Fel y nodais i'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, bu'n rhaid i'r cais i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000 a drefnwyd i'w thrafod ddydd Iau yr wythnos hon gael ei dynnu yn ôl a'i ail-drefnu ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf. Gobeithiaf sicrhau cymeradwyaeth ar hynny ddydd Iau, 14 Rhagfyr, nid ddydd Mawrth, 12 Rhagfyr, fel y dywedais wrth y Pwyllgor Busnes. Hoffwn ymddiheuro i'r Aelodau am hynny. Byddaf hefyd yn gwneud trefniadau yn nes ymlaen heddiw i gyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad penodol i ethol Aelodau i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol a cheisiaf gael cymeradwyaeth y Llywydd a'r Aelodau i gynnig y cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16 ddydd Iau. Gwneir hynny mewn da bryd cyn cyfarfod nesaf y cyngor partneriaeth a gynhelir ddydd Llun, 11 Rhagfyr.

3:40 p.m.

If you look at the three-week period covered by the business statement on your Chamberweb, you will see that it has not changed since my last report apart from the inclusion of the motion to approve the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations

Os edrychwch ar y cyfnod tair wythnos a gwmpesir gan y datganiad busnes ar we'r Siambr, fe welwch nad yw wedi newid ers fy adroddiad diwethaf ar wahân i'r cais a nodwyd i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000.

2000. The rest of the statement is as recorded last week. The Assembly will be in recess between 20 December and 10 January and I will ensure that a copy of this statement is made available on the intranet and the internet.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio Planning Decision Committee**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly resolves*

*1. That a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee 2000/03 be established, in accordance with Standing Order No. 27 to discharge the functions of the Assembly in determining two applications under Section 77 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and one application to determine whether an Order should be made under Section 1 of the Transport and Works Act 1992 in accordance with the draft submitted in respect of the matters identified in the Schedule to this motion and that the Assembly's functions in that respect be delegated to that Committee.*

*2. That the members of that Committee be: Sue Essex (Chair), Tom Middlehurst, Rhodri Glyn Thomas and David Davies.*

*3. That the Committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the Committee signs the decision letters in accordance with Standing Order No. 27.16 or on 18 December 2000 whichever is the earlier.*

*4. That if the Committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed decision letters in respect of the matters identified in the Schedule to this motion then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Minister.*

**Schedule**

Mae gweddill y datganiad fel y'i cofnodwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd y Cynulliad ar gau rhwng 20 Rhagfyr a 10 Ionawr a byddaf yn sicrhau y bydd copi o'r datganiad hwn ar gael ar y fewnwyd ac ar y rhyngwyd.

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu:*

*1. Y dylid sefydlu pwyllgor, a elwir yn Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio 2000/03, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27 i arfer swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad wrth bennu dau gais o dan Adran 77 o Ddeddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 ac un cais i bennu a ddylid llunio Gorchymyn o dan Adran 1 o Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth a Gwaith 1992 yn unol â'r drafft a gyflwynwyd mewn perthynas â materion a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn ac y dylid dirprwyo swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yn hyn o beth i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw.*

*2. Mai aelodau'r Pwyllgor fydd: Sue Essex (Cadeirydd), Tom Middlehurst, Rhodri Glyn Thomas a David Davies.*

*3. Y bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn arwyddo llythyrau'r penderfyniadau yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.16 neu ar 18 Rhagfyr 2000 pa un bynnag fydd yn digwydd gyntaf.*

*4. Os bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd arwyddo llythyrau'r penderfyniadau mewn perthynas â'r materion a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, y bydd y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, mewn perthynas â materion o'r fath, yn cael eu dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog Cymru.*

**Atodlen**

*Application by Mr N.C. Hulme for the proposed development of a new dwelling on land at Coed-y-Cae, Abertillery, Blaenau Gwent.*      *Cais gan Mr N.C. Hulme i ddatblygu annedd newydd ar dir yng Nghoed-y-Cae, Abertylleri, Blaenau Gwent.*

*Application by Mrs S.G. James for the proposed erection of a bungalow at Ffynnon Las, Goginan, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion.*      *Cais gan Mrs S.G. James i godi byngalo yn Ffynnon Las, Goginan, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion.*

*Application by Bridgend Valleys Railway Company Ltd for an order providing for the transfer from Railtrack plc to the applicants of the statutory powers to maintain and operate a portion of the existing Garw Valley Branch Railway in the communities of Ynysawdre and Garw Valley, Bridgend.*      *Cais gan Bridgend Valleys Railway Company Cyf am orchymyn i drosglwyddo gan Railtrack ccc i'r ceiswyr y pwerau statudol i gynnal a chadw a rhedeg rhan o Reilffordd Cangen Cwm Garw yng nghymunedau Ynysawdre a Chwm Garw, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod

Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Dysgu a Medrau (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru)  
2000  
Approval of the Learning and Skills Act 2000 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales)  
Order 2000**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*a. approves under Standing Order No. 22.23A the following draft Order:*

*a. yn cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn drafft a ganlyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.23A:*

*The Learning and Skills Act 2000 (Commencement No.2) (Wales) Order 2000 laid in the Table Office on 9 November 2000; and*

*Gorchymyn Deddf Dysgu a Medrau 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Tachwedd 2000; ac*

*b. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft order, The Learning and Skills Act 2000 (Commencement No.2) (Wales) Order 2000, laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2000.*

*b. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sydd yn peri pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Dysgu a Medrau 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2000, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2000.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I call an immediate vote on this motion under Standing Order No. 22.23A.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf bleidlais ar unwaith ar y cynnig hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.23A.

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron

Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion adopted.*

### **Polisi'r Cynulliad ar y Bartneriaeth Cyhoeddus-Preifat/Y Fenter Cyllid Preifat The Assembly's Public-Private Partnership/Private Finance Initiative Policy**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 6, 7, 8, 9 a 10 yn enw Alun Cairns.

**Alun Cairns:** Point of order. This relates to the document to which the debate refers. It has been circulated to Members via e-mail, but it is not available on the intranet or the internet. Therefore, neither members of the public nor the press have had the option of analysing the document to which one amendment specifically relates.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I was only made aware of this 10 minutes ago and I have asked my officials to investigate the matter. I assure you that it was accidental. I am sure that the Chamber will accept my apology. I know that copies were

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 6, 7, 8, 9, and 10 in the name of Alun Cairns.

**Alun Cairns:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r ddogfen y mae'r ddadl yn cyfeirio ati. Fe'i dosbarthwyd i'r Aelodau drwy e-bost, ond nid yw ar gael ar y fewnwyd na'r rhyngwyd. Felly, nid yw'r cyhoedd na'r wasg wedi cael dewis dadansoddi'r ddogfen y mae un gwelliant yn cyfeirio ati yn benodol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Dim ond deng munud yn ôl y'm hysbyswyd o hyn a gofynnais i'm swyddogion ymchwilio i'r mater. Fe'ch sicrhaf mai ar ddamwain ydoedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y derbynïa'r Siambur fy ymddiheuriadau. Gwn y dosbarthwyd

circulated to all Assembly Members. I spoke to Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales's business manager to confirm that its Members had received a copy.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful for that apology and the point is duly noted. Thank you for raising it, Alun.

**Edwina Hart:** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*notes the proposals set out in the paper 'Public Private Partnerships and the Private Finance Initiative in Wales' which was circulated to Members by e-mail on 28 November 2000;*

*agrees to refer relevant issues in the paper to the Local Government and Housing Committee and the Health and Social Services Committees for further discussion; and*

*agrees that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities should bring a further progress report to the National Assembly.*

The first part of the motion asks that the Assembly notes the proposals set out in the paper. The Assembly has not been asked to come to any conclusions on this, simply to note and discuss its contents.

The second part of the motion proposes that the Assembly refers the issues to the Local Government and Housing Committee and the Health and Social Services Committee so that they can be subject to further, detailed scrutiny and deliberation. The last part of the motion requires that I bring back a progress report to the Assembly once I have considered today's discussion and the Committee's work.

In Wales, there is large-scale investment in public assets, by various forms of private funding. It is essential that we take time to review our experience. I ask the Assembly to reject all the amendments that have been tabled to this motion. This is not because

copïau i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Siaradais â rheolwr busnes Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales i gadarnhau bod ei Haelodau wedi derbyn copi.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ymddiheuro a nodir y pwynt fel sydd yn briodol. Diolch am ei godi, Alun.

**Edwina Hart:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn nodi'r cynigion yn y papur 'Public Private Partnerships and the Private Finance Initiative in Wales' a ddosbarthwyd i Aelodau drwy e-bost ar 28 Tachwedd 2000;*

*yn cytuno i gyfeirio materion perthnasol yn y papur at y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i'w trafod ymhellach; ac*

*yn cytuno y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau roi adroddiad pellach ar gynnydd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

Gofynna rhan gyntaf y cynnig y nodi'r Cynulliad y cynigion a nodir yn y papur. Ni ofynnwyd i'r Cynulliad ddod i unrhyw gasgliadau ynglŷn â hyn, dim ond i nodi a thrafod ei gynnwys.

Cynigia ail ran y cynnig fod y Cynulliad yn cyfeirio'r materion at y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fel y gallant fod yn destun gwaith archwilio a phenderfynu manwl pellach. Gofynna rhan olaf y cynnig imi gyflwyno adroddiad ar gynnydd i'r Cynulliad ar ôl imi ystyried y drafodaeth heddiw a gwaith y Pwyllgorau.

Yng Nghymru, ceir buddsoddi ar raddfa fawr o fathau gwahanol ar arian preifat mewn asedau cyhoeddus. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cymryd amser i adolygu ein profiad. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod pob un o'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd i'r cynnig hwn.

there is no merit in them, it is simply because we should continue this important review process. We should consider the views expressed today and consider the Committees' work before we reach any conclusion. The problem with the amendments is that they seek to finalise a review that is still in progress.

Last summer, public and private sector organisations involved in the partnerships and PFIs in Wales were invited to participate in a consultation exercise. The purpose of the exercise was to identify strengths, weaknesses and areas for development. Responses were received from 45 per cent of those approached and the following areas were highlighted for further development. First, the need to formulate a distinctive policy to tackle any possible transfer of responsibility for activities indirectly associated with the facility in so-called soft facilities management. Secondly, to evaluate the merit of the bidding rounds in local government where they already exist, as well as in the health service. Finally, to consider the procedures associated with PFI, eliminating bureaucracy wherever possible and investing in an Assembly support system where appropriate.

First, let me update you on the progress of some current PFI projects in Wales, affecting all sectors of society. PFI partnership has resulted in the development of many schemes in the health sector. These projects include the Chepstow neighbourhood hospital, Nevill Hall hospital, the Baglan general hospital, St David's community hospital and the staff residences at the Royal Glamorgan hospital. In addition to progress in the health sector, the Assembly is currently committed to providing PFI credit support to 10 local authorities in a total of 13 schemes. These include primary and secondary schools, a waste management system, two strategically significant roads and civic facilities in Ruthin. These developments would not have gone ahead as quickly, if at all, without the use of private finance and partnership agreement.

Ni ofynnaf am hyn am nad oes rhinweddau ganddynt, dim ond oherwydd y dylem barhau â'r broses adolygu bwysig hon. Dylem ystyried y sylwadau a fynegir heddiw a dylem ystyried gwaith y Pwyllgorau cyn inni ddod i gasgliad. Problem y gwelliannau yw eu bod yn ceisio cwblhau adolygiad sydd ar y gweill o hyd.

Yn ystod yr haf diwethaf, gwahoddwyd y sefydliadau yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat sydd yn ymwneud â phartneriaethau a'r mentrau cyllid preifat yng Nghymru i gymryd rhan mewn ymarfer ymgynghori. Diben yr ymarfer oedd nodi cryfderau, gwendidau a meysydd i'w datblygu. Cafwyd atebion gan 45 y cant o'r rheini a ofynnwyd ac amlygwyd y meysydd canlynol fel rhai i'w datblygu ymhellach. Yn gyntaf, yr angen i lunio polisi arbennig i fynd i'r afael ag unrhyw gyfrifoldeb am weithgareddau sydd yn anuniongyrchol gysylltiedig â'r cyfleuster ym maes rheolaeth cyfleusterau meddal, fel y'i gelwir, yn cael ei drosglwyddo. Yn ail, gwerthuso rhinweddau'r rowndiau cynnig mewn llywodraeth leol lle maent yn bodoli eisoes, ynghyd ag yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yn olaf, ystyried y gweithdrefnau sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r fenter cyllid preifat, gan ddileu biwrocratiaeth lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl a chan fuddsoddi mewn system gymorth i'r Cynulliad lle y bo'n briodol.

Yn gyntaf, gadewch imi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ichi am gynnydd rhai o brosiectau presennol y fenter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru, sydd yn effeithio ar bob sector o'r gymdeithas. Arweiniodd partneriaeth y fenter cyllid preifat at ddatblygu llawer o gynlluniau yn y sector iechyd. Ymhlith y prosiectau hyn mae ysbyty cymdogaeth Casgwent, ysbyty Nevill Hall, ysbyty cyffredinol Baglan, ysbyty cymunedol Dewi Sant ac anheddau'r staff yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg. Yn ogystal â'r cynnydd yn y sector iechyd, mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig ar hyn o bryd i ddarparu cymorth credyd o'r fenter cyllid preifat i 10 awdurdod lleol mewn cyfanswm o 13 o gynlluniau. Ymhlith y rhain mae ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, system rheoli gwastraff, dwy ffordd bwysig strategol a chyfleusterau dinesig yn Rhuthun. Ni

fyddai'r datblygiadau hyn wedi mynd yn eu blaen mor gyflym, os o gwbl, heb ddefnyddio cytundeb cyllid a phartneriaeth preifat.

There will be occasions in the future when we should use our experience in Wales to conduct a dialogue with the Treasury on its policies on capital finance. However, at present, we must recognise that without private finance we would not be able to put in place the essential forms of infrastructure that I have catalogued. With the assistance of the Assembly's Committees, I shall consider how the Assembly can improve the quality of its administrative procedures and assistance for private finance in Wales, providing better and more acceptable advice and guidance.

Bydd achlysuron yn y dyfodol pan ddylem ddefnyddio ein profiad yng Nghymru i drafod ei bolisiau ar gyllid cyfalaf â'r Trysorlys. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, rhaid inni gydnabod na allem sefydlu'r mathau hanfodol o isadeiledd a restrwyd gennyf heb arian preifat. Gyda chymorth Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, ystyriaf sut y gall y Cynulliad wella ansawdd ei weithdrefnau gweinyddol a'i gymorth i arian preifat yng Nghymru, gan ddarparu cyngor ar arweiniad gwell a mwy derbyniol.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Will you confirm that it is not your intention for the Local Government and Housing Committee to undertake a policy review, but that the Committee will be asked to consider a paper on the various proposals prepared by you, and that your department will undertake the consultation exercise mentioned in today's paper?

**Gwenda Thomas:** A gadarnhewch na fwriadwch i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ymgymryd ag adolygiad polisi, ond y gofynnir i'r Pwyllgor ystyried papur ar y cynigion gwahanol a ddarperir gennych, ac y bydd eich adran yn ymgymryd â'r ymarfer ymgynghori a grybwyllwyd yn y papur heddiw?

**Edwina Hart:** That is right, Gwenda. The report that I have already undertaken will come to the Committee for consideration and it will be up to the Committee whether it wishes to take further views from organisations, such as trade unions and the Welsh Local Government Association, to impact input into further work. With the assistance of the Assembly's Committees—

**Edwina Hart:** Mae hynny'n gywir, Gwenda. Daw'r adroddiad yr ymgymerais ag ef eisoes i'r Pwyllgor i'w ystyried a'r Pwyllgor fydd i benderfynu a ddymuna gael sylwadau pellach gan sefydliadau, megis undebau llafur a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, er mwyn dylanwadu ar y mewnbwn i waith pellach. Gyda chymorth Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad—

**Cynog Dafis:** Soniwch nad oes dewis ar hyn o bryd ond defnyddio cynlluniau PFI ar gyfer datblygiadau pwysig, a chydabyddaf fod hynny'n wir. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn resyn o beth fod y fframwaith polisi y mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol yn ei roi arnom yn ein gorfodi i mewn i'r sianel hon? Gallai hynny fod yn wahanol pe bai agwedd Trysorlys y Deyrnas Gyfunol at ofyniad benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus a'r diffinad ohono yn wahanol, a phe bai'r Llywodraeth yn ganolog yn cymryd agwedd wahanol at wariant cyhoeddus ac yn caniatáu inni ddefnyddio arian a godir drwy drethiant ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn pob math o ddatblygiadau cyfalaf?

**Cynog Dafis:** You mention that there is no choice at present but to use PFI schemes for important developments, and I acknowledge that that is true. Do you agree that it is regrettable that the policy framework imposed upon us by the United Kingdom Government forces us into this channel? That could be different if the attitude of the United Kingdom Treasury towards the public sector borrowing requirement and its definition of it were different, and if central Government took a different attitude to public expenditure and allowed us to use the money raised by taxation for investment in all kinds of capital developments?



**Edwina Hart:** The trouble is, Cynog, that I have to deal with the reality of the Treasury's policy in my discussions on PFI and public-private partnerships. It would be nice to be able to comment on what I regard as the economic management of the country, but that would be inappropriate. I must look at what we can do in Wales now in the context of national Government policy.

With the assistance of the Assembly's Committees, I shall consider how the Assembly can improve the quality of its administrative procedures and assistance for private finance in Wales, hopefully providing better and more accessible advice and guidance. As part of this initiative, officials will design and maintain a website dedicated to public-private partnership issues. In the medium term we need a clear statement about future PFI credit bidding rounds. The existing uncertainty hinders the progress of possible schemes, and clear guidance from the Assembly is essential. At present, PFI credits are only available to local authorities. I would like to investigate whether a similar arrangement should be extended to the health sector. The Assembly will work with the health sector to investigate the potential benefit of taking this forward within the developing capital planning framework. It is an entirely appropriate matter for the Health and Social Services Committee to discuss.

3:50 p.m.

Clear guidance is needed to deal with the transfer of soft facilities management, employed in some PFI contracts. That tends to affect staff such as cleaners, porters and ancillary staff. There have been schemes where such indirectly-associated responsibilities, and the staff involved, have been transferred to the financier. We will work with our partners to clarify the issues involved in such transfers. Within the value for money framework, I am keen to look favourably on bids that exclude the inappropriate transfer of staff. I am also aware that it has caused great consternation in some projects in Caerphilly, Rhondda

**Edwina Hart:** Y drafferth yw, Cynog, bod yn rhaid imi ddelio â realiti polisi'r Trysorlys wrth drafod y fenter cyllid preifat a phartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat. Byddai'n braf gallu rhoi sylwadau ar reolaeth economaidd y wlad yn fy marn, ond ni fyddai hynny'n briodol. Rhaid imi ystyried yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yng Nghymru yn awr yng nghyd-destun polisi'r Llywodraeth genedlaethol.

Gyda chymorth Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, ystyriaf sut y gall y Cynulliad wella ansawdd ei weithdrefnau gweinyddol a'i gymorth i arian preifat yng Nghymru, gan ddarparu cyngor ac arweiniad gwell a mwy hygyrch, gobeithio. Fel rhan o'r fenter hon, bydd swyddogion yn dylunio a chynnal gwefan ar gyfer materion partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat yn benodol. Yn y tymor canolig, mae angen datganiad clir am rowndiau cynigion credyd y fenter cyllid preifat yn y dyfodol. Mae'r ansicrwydd presennol yn rhwystro cynnydd cynlluniau posibl, ac mae arweiniad clir gan y Cynulliad yn hanfodol. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond awdurdodau lleol a all gael credydau'r fenter cyllid preifat. Hoffwn ymchwilio i weld a ddylid ehangu trefniant tebyg i'r sector iechyd. Gweithia'r Cynulliad gyda'r sector iechyd i ymchwilio i'r manteision posibl a geir wrth ddatblygu hyn o fewn y fframwaith cynllunio cyfalaf sydd yn datblygu. Mae'n fater cwbl briodol i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei drafod.

Mae angen arweiniad clir i ddelio â throsglwyddo rheolaeth cyfleusterau meddal, a ddefnyddir mewn rhai o gontractau'r fenter cyllid preifat. Tuedda hynny i effeithio ar staff megis glanhawyr, porthorion a staff atodol. Bu cynlluniau lle trosglwyddwyd cyfrifoldebau o'r fath sydd yn anuniongyrchol gysylltiedig, a'r staff sydd ynghlwm â'r cynlluniau, i'r ariannwr. Gweithiwn gyda'n partneriaid i esbonio'r materion sydd ynghlwm â throsglwyddiadau o'r fath. O fewn y fframwaith gwerth am arian, yr wyf yn awyddus i edrych yn ffafriol ar gynigion nad ydynt yn cynnwys trosglwyddo staff yn amhriodol. Yr wyf yn

Cynon Taff and other local authority areas, where staff may have been involved in the transfer. There have been concerns about staff being involved in the transfer of these assets.

The Local Government and Housing Committee is continuing its review of the capital financing of council housing. As well as evaluating stock transfers and options, the Committee will consider the benefits or otherwise of PFI in financing capital investment in council housing stock. There are currently eight authorities in England with housing pathfinder projects supported by the Department for the Environment, Transport and the Regions. We will review the evidence from these projects and consider the merits of any pilot schemes in Wales.

We need to streamline the bureaucracy associated with these projects. The time, cost and effort of developing these projects is significant. Through reducing bureaucracy and improving access to information, the Assembly can assist in cutting down on cost. The public sector in Wales is keen to develop the principle of joint working, although at the moment there are legal, stakeholder, and, of course, political issues that complicate schemes. The Assembly will consider several areas where there is potential for cross-sector co-operation and will see where we can adapt existing guidance and legislation to reduce bureaucracy.

We need to develop a strategic framework for public-private partnership and PFI projects in Wales. At present, the majority of capital projects are undertaken at a local level, based on local priorities. The Assembly is sometimes in a position to see possible links across sectors and to encourage cross-authority co-operation. If the Assembly supports the motion, the review into private finance will be continued by the two identified Committees. In addition, I wish to continue the dialogue with our

ymwybodol hefyd yr achosodd hyn lawer o gythrwfl mewn rhai prosiectau yng Nghaerffili, Rhondda Cynon Taf ac ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol eraill, lle gallai staff fod wedi bod yn rhan o'r trosglwyddiad. Bu pryderon y byddai staff yn rhan o'r gwaith o drosglwyddo'r asedau hyn.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn parhau â'i arolygiad o ariannu cyfalaf tai cyngor. Yn ogystal â gwerthuso trosglwyddiadau ac opsiynau stoc, ystyria'r Pwyllgor fanteision neu anfanteision y fenter cyllid preifat i ariannu buddsoddi cyfalaf yn y stoc tai cyngor. Ar hyn o bryd, mae wyth awdurdod yn Lloegr yn cynnal prosiectau tai arloesol a gefnogir gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau. Adolygwn y dystiolaeth a geir gan y prosiectau hyn ac ystyriwn rinweddau unrhyw gynlluniau peilot yng Nghymru.

Mae angen inni resymoli'r fiwrocratiaeth sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r prosiectau hyn. Mae'r amser, y gost a'r ymdrech sydd eu hangen i ddatblygu'r prosiectau hyn yn arwyddocaol. Drwy leihau biwrocratiaeth a gwella mynediad i wybodaeth, gall y Cynulliad gynorthwyo i gwtogi'r gost. Mae'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn awyddus i ddatblygu'r egwyddor o gydweithio, er bod materion cyfreithiol a materion o ran budd-ddeiliaid ac, wrth gwrs, materion gwleidyddol ar hyn o bryd sydd yn cymhlethu cynlluniau. Ystyria'r Cynulliad nifer o feysydd lle mae potensial i gydweithio ar draws y sectorau a ble y gallwn addasu arweiniad a deddfwriaeth bresennol er mwyn lleihau'r fiwrocratiaeth.

Mae angen inni ddatblygu fframwaith strategol ar gyfer y bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a phrosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, ymgymerir â'r rhan fwyaf o brosiectau cyfalaf ar lefel leol, yn seiliedig ar flaenoriaethau lleol. Weithiau, mae'r Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa i weld cysylltiadau posibl ar draws sectorau ac i annog cydweithredu ar draws awdurdodau. Os cefnoga'r Cynulliad y cynnig, parha'r ddau Bwyllgor a nodir â'i arolygiad i arian preifat. Yn ogystal, dymunaf barhau â'r

partners on this issue. I will, therefore, establish a working group of partner organisations to advise on the means whereby the Assembly can provide co-ordination and assistance.

Private finance is providing Wales with capital assets that it desperately needs. The systems associated with such financing need to be organised efficiently and effectively. The quality of service needs to be guaranteed in all such finance schemes. The motion asks the Assembly to note the point we have reached and to consider what is happening in terms of the ongoing review. It also asks that the review should continue and for your assistance in Committee to help to establish a public-private partnership and PFI policy for Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the Minister for keeping well within her allotted 10 minutes. To protect time for this and the subsequent debate, I will limit speeches by those proposing amendments to five minutes, and by other Members to three minutes. I call Janet Ryder to propose the amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Janet Ryder:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. I propose amendment 1. After clause 1 add as new clause:

*regrets the fact that the UK's policies on public expenditure and the definition of the public sector borrowing requirements inhibit capital development in the public sector through traditional methods.*

I propose amendment 2. After clause 1 add as new clause:

*regrets the Government of Wales's failure to provide an objective analysis of the costs and benefits of PFI.*

I propose amendment 3. After clause 1 add as new clause:

drafodaeth â'n partneriaid ar y mater hwn. Felly, sefydlaf weithgor o sefydliadau partner i roi cyngor ar y ffyrdd y gall y Cynulliad gydlynw'r gwaith a darparu cymorth.

Mae arian preifat yn rhoi'r asedau cyfalaf i Gymru y mae angen enbyd arni. Mae angen trefnu'r systemau sydd yn gysylltiedig ag angen ariannu o'r fath yn effeithlon ac yn effeithiol. Mae angen sicrhau ansawdd y gwasanaeth ym mhob cynllun ariannu o'r fath. Gofynna'r cynnig i'r Cynulliad nodi'r pwynt y cyraeddassom ac ystyried yr hyn a ddigwydd o ran yr adolygiad parhaus. Gofynna hefyd y dylai'r adolygiad barhau a gofynna am eich cyngor yn y Pwyllgorau i helpu i sefydlu partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a pholisi menter cyllid preifat i Gymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gadw'n dda o fewn y deng munud a ddyrannwyd iddi. Er mwyn sicrhau amser i hyn a'r ddadl ddilynol, cyfyngaf areithiau gan y rheini sydd yn cynnig gwelliannau i bum munud, ac areithiau gan Aelodau eraill i dair munud. Galwaf ar Janet Ryder i gynnig y gwelliannau yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Janet Ryder:** Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Cynigïaf welliant 1. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd ar ôl cymal 1:

*yn gresynu'r ffaith bod polisiau'r DU ar wariant cyhoeddus a'r diffiniad o ofynion benthyca y sector cyhoeddus yn llesteirio datblygiadau cyfalaf yn y sector cyhoeddus. drwy ddulliau traddodiadol.*

Cynigïaf welliant 2. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd ar ôl cymal 1:

*yn gresynu bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi methu â darparu dadansoddiad gwrthrychol o anfanteision a manteision menter cyllid preifat.*

Cynigïaf welliant 3. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd ar ôl cymal 1:

*notes that contrary to paragraph 2.3 of the report, Plaid Cymru's submission to the consultation expressed serious reservations about following the PFI route.*

I propose amendment 4. After clause 1 add as new clause:

*registers its profound scepticism's about PFI as a means of providing a cost-effective solution to the need for public capital development.*

I propose amendment 5. In the third clause delete 'further progress' and add after 'report',

*on a range of options for funding public capital development projects.*

I appreciate what Edwina said about this being an ongoing process. The document as it stands shows a complete failure to listen. The motion before us today, if allowed to stand unamended, completely fails to put the interests of Wales first. One reason for the Assembly's existence is to tackle the democratic deficit in Wales. The total commitment to the use of private finance initiatives and public-private partnerships expressed in this document, and the way in which the so-called consultation process totally ruled out any other options, undermines that important principle by giving away control of many public sector projects. It is an abject capitulation to the dictats of Westminster.

The private finance initiative is a perfect example of New Labour taking on the tattered old clothes of the Tory party. Introduced by the Conservatives in 1992, this policy was embraced enthusiastically by the Blair Government in spite of the serious concerns expressed by a wide range of public bodies and many Labour Party members. The amendments proposed by Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales today, express our dismay that no alternative method of financing public sector projects has been, nor ever will be, considered by this Labour-Liberal coalition. I appeal to those Members of the

*yn nodi bod Plaid Cymru, yn groes i baragraff 2.3 yr adroddiad, wedi mynegi yn ei chyflwyniad i'r ymgynghoriad bryderon dybryd ynghylch dilyn y trywydd menter cyllid preifat.*

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd ar ôl cymal 1:

*yn cofrestru ei amheuan difrifol ynghylch menter cyllid preifat fel ffordd o ddarparu ateb cost-ffeithiol i'r angen am ddatblygiadau cyfalaf cyhoeddus.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Dileer 'ar gynnydd' yn y trydydd cymal ac ar ôl 'adrodd' ychwaneger,

*ar amrywiaeth o opsiynau ar gyfer ariannu prosiectau datblygu cyfalaf cyhoeddus.*

Gwerthfawrogaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Edwina fod hon yn broses barhaus. Dengys y ddogfen fel ag y mae fethiant llwyr i wrando. Mae'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron heddiw, os caiff ei dderbyn heb ei ddiwygio, yn methu'n llwyr â rhoi buddiannau Cymru yn gyntaf. Un o'r rhesymau dros fodolaeth y Cynulliad yw mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg democratiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'r ymrwymiad llwyr i ddefnyddio mentrau cyllid preifat a phartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat a fynegir yn y ddogfen hon, a'r ffordd y dileodd y broses ymgynghori fel y'i gelwir unrhyw opsiynau eraill, yn tansilio'r egwyddor bwysig honno drwy ddosrannu rheolaeth llawer o brosiectau yn y sector cyhoeddus. Ildiwn yn llwyr i orchmynion San Steffan.

Mae'r fenter cyllid preifat yn enghraifft berffaith o Lafur Newydd yn gwisgo hen ddillad bratiog y blaid Doriaidd. Wedi'i gyflwyno gan y Ceidwadwyr yn 1992, croesawyd y polisi hwn yn llawn brwdfrydedd gan Lywodraeth Blair er gwaethaf y pryderon difrifol a fynegwyd gan amrywiaeth eang o gyrff cyhoeddus a llawer o aelodau'r Blaid Lafur. Mynega'r gwelliannau a gynigir heddiw gan Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, ein siom na fydd y glymblaid Lafur-Rhyddfrydol hon yn ystyried yn awr neu yn y dyfodol dulliau eraill o ariannu prosiectau yn y sector

Labour Party who have previously either abstained or voted against PFI to join us today to prevent this headlong dash by the Cabinet to commit the Assembly to a path that will lead to a corporate takeover of the public sector: privatisation by the not so back door.

Our regret that the coalition has failed to even provide an objective analysis of the costs and benefits of PFI is encompassed in amendment 2. Research has shown that, at a conservative estimate, the Scottish PFI programme for the health service will cost £2 billion more than if the Treasury had acquired the assets directly. Under PFI, the public sector buys now and pays very dearly later. PFI projects are expensive for many reasons. They include high set-up costs, lengthy negotiations involving expensive lawyers and consultants employed by both sides and, of course, the extra cost of private sector borrowing.

The Audit Commission has already warned of the excessive profits that consortia can make from PFI. For example, the private sector achieved a return of 19.4 per cent a year on Parc Prison, Bridgend and returns of 20 per cent from the Skye Bridge project. The Public Accounts Committee has also voiced concerns. It has pointed out that, in the short-term, a PFI deal may be more affordable than a conventional procurement, because public sector does not have to find the money up-front to meet the initial capital costs. However, the buy now pay later financing of projects means that the costs are higher than in a conventionally financed, equivalent project.

**David Melding** *rose*—

**Janet Ryder:** I am sorry. I would like to take the intervention but if we are sticking to five minutes, there is no time.

cyhoeddus. Apeliaf ar yr Aelodau hynny o'r Blaid Lafur a ymataliodd yn y gorffennol neu a bleidleisiodd yn erbyn y fenter cyllid preifat i ymuno â ni heddiw i rwystro'r Cabinet rhag rhuthro ar ei ben i ymrwymo'r Cynulliad i lwybr lle meddiannir ar y sector cyhoeddus yn gorfforaethol, sef preifateiddio lled-agored.

Cwmpesir y ffaith ein bod yn gresynu bod y glymblaid hon wedi methu hyd yn oed â darparu dadansoddiad gwrthrychol o anfanteision a manteision y fenter cyllid preifat yng ngwelliant 2. Dangosodd ymchwil y bydd rhaglen y fenter cyllid preifat yn yr Alban ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yn costio £2 biliwn yn fwy, yn ôl amcangyfrif ceidwadol, na phe byddai'r Trysorlys wedi cael yr asedau yn uniongyrchol. O dan y fenter cyllid preifat, mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn prynu yn awr ac yn talu'n ddrud iawn wedyn. Mae prosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat yn ddrud iawn am lawer o resymau. Maent yn cynnwys costau sefydlu uchel, negodiadau hirfaith gan gynnwys cyfreithwyr ac ymgynghorwyr drud a gyflogir gan y ddwy ochr ac, wrth gwrs, cost ychwanegol benthyca o'r sector preifat.

Rhybuddiodd y Comisiwn Archwilio eisoes am yr elw mawr y gall consortia ei wneud o'r fenter cyllid preifat. Er enghraifft, cyflawnodd y sector preifat elw o 19.4 y cant y flwyddyn ar Garchar y Parc, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ac elw o 20 y cant o brosiect Pont Skye. Lleisiwyd pryderon gan y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus hefyd. Nododd y gellir fforddio bargaen y fenter cyllid preifat yn fwy yn y tymor byr na chaffaeliad confensiynol, gan nad oes rhaid i'r sector cyhoeddus gael yr arian ar y dechrau i gwrdd â'r costau cyfalaf cychwynnol. Fodd bynnag, golyga'r ffordd o ariannu prosiectau lle prynir yn awr ond telir amdanynt wedyn fod y costau'n uwch nag mewn prosiect cyfateb a ariennir mewn ffordd gonfensiynol.

**David Melding** *a gododd*—

**Janet Ryder:** Mae'n flin gennyf. Hoffwn dderbyn yr ymyriad ond os cadwn at bum munud, nid oes amser.

The length of PFI contracts, sometimes up to 60 years, means that public bodies are tied into a service provision that may not be necessary or appropriate. The body of the document states that:

Golyga hyd contractau menter cyllid preifat, sydd weithiau yn parhau am hyd at 60 o flynyddoedd, fod cyrff cyhoeddus yn gaeth i ddarparu gwasanaeth nad yw'n angenrheidiol neu'n briodol, o bosibl. Mae corff y ddogfen yn datgan:

'it is often important that relevant staff transfer from the public to the private sector operator in order to secure value for money'.

It goes on to state that:

Â ymlaen i nodi:

'staff such as canteen personnel, receptionists and porters do not contribute directly to the up-keep of an asset and may therefore not be crucial to the operations of the private sector partner. These employees are often included within the PFI contract to improve further the potential cost savings achievable by the private sector'.

The Labour Party is ready to throw away workers to make bids more attractive and maximise the cost savings for their new friend, private finance. Their only offer is to clarify the position of such workers.

Mae'r Blaid Lafur yn barod i gael gwared ar weithwyr er mwyn i'r cynigion fod yn fwy deniadol ac er mwyn i'w ffrind newydd, cyllid preifat, arbed cymaint o arian â phosibl. Eu hunig gynnig yw esbonio sefyllfa gweithwyr o'r fath.

In addition, the economic benefits to local communities are dubious, as there is no control over those massive profits made by the private sector or how they will be used. They will more than likely be directed away from local communities to form the profits for shareholders. There are alternatives to PFI. The Chancellor could relax the borrowing restrictions on public authorities. Relaxing the restrictions imposed by the public sector net cash requirements that are almost unique to the UK would allow authorities to borrow at attractive rates from the European investment—[*Interruption.*]

Yn ogystal, mae'r manteision ariannol i gymunedau lleol yn amheus, gan nad oes rheolaeth dros yr elw mawr hwnnw a wneir gan y sector preifat neu sut y'i defnyddir. Yn fwy na thebyg, fe'u cyfeirir oddi wrth y cymunedau er mwyn llunio'r elw ar gyfer y cyfranddeiliaid. Mae dewisiadau eraill ar wahân i'r fenter cyllid preifat. Gallai'r Canghellor lacio'r cyfyngiadau benthyca ar awdurdodau cyhoeddus. Byddai llacio'r cyfyngiadau a osodir gan ofynion arian clir y sector cyhoeddus sydd bron yn unigryw i'r DU yn caniatáu awdurdodau i fenthyca ar gyfraddau deniadol gan yr arian Ewropeaidd a fuddsoddir—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your five minutes are up.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich pum munud wedi dod i ben.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose amendment 6. Add at the end of motion as new clause:

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiad welliant 6. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

*welcomes PFI as a form of funding and congratulates the last Government on introducing it as an innovative method of procurement.*

*yn croesawu menter cyllid preifat fel dull o ariannu ac yn llongyfarch y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf ar ei chyflwyno fel dull caffael arloesol.*

I propose amendment 7. Add at the end of motion as new clause: Cynigiad welliant 7. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

*calls for PFI to be used to maximise investment and to build and renovate schools, hospitals and publicly owned housing.* yn galw ar i'r fenter cyllid preifat gael ei defnyddio i sicrhau'r buddsoddiad mwyaf posibl ac i adeiladu ac adnewyddu ysgolion, ysbytai a thai sydd mewn perchnogaeth gyhoeddus.

I propose amendment 8. Add at the end of motion as new clause: Cynigiad welliant 8. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

*calls for PFI to be used wherever possible to relieve the burdens of capital expenditure on the taxpayer and to maximise investment.* yn galw ar i'r fenter cyllid preifat gael ei defnyddio lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl i ysgafnhau beichiau gwariant cyfalaf y trethdalwr ac i sicrhau'r buddsoddiad mwyaf posibl.

I propose amendment 9. Add at the end of the motion as new clause: Cynigiad welliant 9. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

*calls for PFI to be used in any future social housing project.* yn galw ar i'r fenter cyllid preifat gael ei defnyddio mewn unrhyw brosiect tai cymdeithasol yn y dyfodol.

I propose amendment 10. Add at the end of the motion as new clause: Cynigiad welliant 10. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig fel cymal newydd:

*calls for PFI to be used to maximise investment to build and maintain trunk roads and motorways.* yn galw ar i'r fenter cyllid preifat gael ei defnyddio i sicrhau'r buddsoddiad mwyaf posibl i adeiladu a chynnal cefnffyrdd a thraffyrdd.

It is a great pleasure to propose these amendments and to lead the debate for the Welsh Conservative Party. Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf gynnig y gwelliannau hyn ac arwain y ddatl ar gyfer Plaid Geidwadol Cymru.

It is by now agreed that the use of private money in the procurement of public services delivers value for money for the taxpayer and releases the burden of large capital expenditure from public sector organisations. Erbyn hyn, cytunir bod defnyddio arian preifat i gaffael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn cyflwyno gwerth am arian ar gyfer y trethdalwr ac yn rhyddhau sefydliadau'r sector cyhoeddus o faich gwariant cyfalaf mawr.

It was only two weeks ago that I tabled a statement of opinion remembering Baroness Thatcher's massive, positive contribution to Wales and the United Kingdom during her period in office. One of the many policies that improved our way of life was the introduction of private sector initiative and private sector funding in the procurement of goods and services. That was achieved in Dim ond pythefnos yn ôl cyflwynais ddatganiad barn yn cofio cyfraniad cadarnhaol enfawr y Farwnes Thatcher i Gymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig yn ystod ei chyfnod mewn swydd. Un o'r polisiau niferus i wella ein ffordd o fyw fu cyflwyno'r fenter sector preifat ac arian gan y sector preifat wrth gaffael nwyddau a gwasanaethau. Cyflawnwyd hynny mewn

many ways, most notably through privatisation. Later, in 1992, the policy was further developed by Norman Lamont, who was John Major's Chancellor of the Exchequer, with the introduction of private finance initiative.

4:00 p.m.

I know that the Labour Party and the Liberal Party were opposed to both measures at the outset but I welcome their conversion along the road to Damascus on this matter. That is the purpose of amendment 6. I regret that the Labour-Liberal coalition will not support my amendment 6 that recognises PFI as an innovative way of funding public services, particularly as they are currently using private finance initiatives. Therefore, I ask them to reconsider their support for amendment 6. Although the nationalists are still left in the tax and spend period of the 1970s, which devastated public sector services and the prosperity of the private sector, I still live in hope and maybe, they will move into the twenty-first century one day and accept the reality of the situation and the benefits to everyone concerned.

I do not want to spend too much time highlighting the benefits of privatisation.

**Brian Gibbons** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Are you giving way to Brian Gibbons?

**Alun Cairns:** I am not, Llywydd. I apologise because time is short.

The benefits of privatisation are known to all of us, so much so that the Labour Party is now pushing ahead with its own privatisation policy of air traffic control. However, it is fair to say that that conversion is not necessarily widespread throughout the party. Therefore, we will pay close attention to the voting habits of many Members. In spite of their initial opposition, there have been over 350 PFI deals in the UK, worth over £17 billion of private capital investment into public services as a result of the introduction of this innovative form of financing.

llawer o ffyrdd, yn enwedig drwy breifateiddio. Yn ddiweddarach, yn 1992, datblygwyd y polisi ymhellach gan Norman Lamont, sef Canghellor y Trysorlys John Major, pan gyflwynwyd y fenter cyllid preifat.

Gwn y gwrthwynebodd y Blaid Lafur a'r Blaid Ryddfrydol y ddau fesur ar y cychwyn ond croesawaf eu tröedigaeth ar y ffordd i Ddamascus ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Dyna ddiben gwelliant 6. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na fydd y glymblaid Lafur-Rhyddfrydol yn cefnogi gwelliant 6 sydd yn cydnabod y fenter cyllid preifat fel ffordd arloesol o ariannu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn enwedig gan y defnyddiant fentrau cyllid preifat ar hyn o bryd. Felly, gofynnaf iddynt ailystyried eu cefnogaeth i welliant 6. Er y gadawyd y cenedlaetholwyr yng nghyfnod trethu a gwario'r 1970au, a ddistrywiodd wasanaethau'r sector cyhoeddus a ffyniant y sector preifat, gobeithiaf o hyd y symudant efallai i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain ryw ddiwrnod ac y derbyniant realiti'r sefyllfa a'r manteision i bawb sydd ynghlwm â'r mater.

Ni ddymunaf dreulio gormod o amser yn amlygu manteision preifateiddio.

**Brian Gibbons** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** A ildiwch i Brian Gibbons?

**Alun Cairns:** Na wnaif, Lywydd. Ymddiheuraf gan fod amser yn brin.

Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol o fanteision preifateiddio, i'r fath raddau fel bod y Blaid Lafur yn awr yn gwthio ymlaen gyda'i bolisi preifateiddio ei hunan o reolaeth trafndiaeth yn yr awyr. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud nad yw'r dröedigaeth honno o reidrwydd yn eang drwy'r blaid. Felly, talaf sylw agos at arferion pleidleisio llawer o'r Aelodau. Er gwaethaf eu gwrthwynebiad cychwynnol, bu mwy na 350 o fargeinion y fenter cyllid preifat yn y DU, sydd yn werth mwy na £17 biliwn o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf preifat i



wasanaethau cyhoeddus o ganlyniad i gyflwyno'r dull arloesol hwn o ariannu.

New facilities have, or are being established, throughout Wales. Notably, the new hospital in Baglan is being built with private money. Doctors, nurses and patients do not care how such a Conservative commitment is funded, so long as they have the high quality facilities to help them offer and receive the first class treatment that they deserve. I wonder how much taxes would have risen, or which other public services would have been cut, if the Baglan hospital had to be funded from public coffers if this administration was run by the nationalists.

Mae cyfleusterau newydd wedi'u sefydlu, neu wrthi'n cael eu sefydlu, ledled Cymru. Yn bennaf, adeiladir yr ysbyty newydd ym Maglan gan ddefnyddio arian preifat. Nid oes gwahaniaeth gan feddygon, nyrsys a chleifion sut yr ariennir ymrwymiad Ceidwadol o'r fath, cyhyd ag y bo cyfleusterau o ansawdd uchel ganddynt i'w helpu i gynnig a chael y driniaeth ardderchog y maent yn ei haeddu. Tybed faint fyddai trethi wedi codi, neu pa wasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill fyddai wedi'u cwtogi, pe byddai rhaid ariannu ysbyty Baglan o goffrau cyhoeddus pe redir y weinyddiaeth hon gan y cenedlaetholwyr.

PFI gives us the best of both worlds; private sector discipline and a high level of public service. Therefore, it is incumbent upon us to facilitate the role of the private sector organisations in supporting public services. The streamlining of bureaucracy and transparency should be the theme that is drawn from today's debate. Business is frustrated by the high costs of bidding and the weak contract management in the public sector. In order to alleviate the concerns of potential bidders, the UK Government has established the Office of Government Commerce, which targets each department to save on their procurement budget.

Rhydd y fenter cyllid preifat y gorau o ddau fyd inni; disgyblaeth y sector preifat a lefel uchel o wasanaeth cyhoeddus. Felly, mae'n ddyletswydd arnom hwyluso rôl sefydliadau'r sector preifat wrth gefnogi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Rhesymoli biwrocratiaeth ac eglurder yw'r thema a geir o'r ddadl heddiw. Rhwystrir busnes gan gostau uchel cyflwyno cynigion a'r rheolaeth wan o gontractau a geir yn y sector cyhoeddus. Er mwyn lleddfu pryderon cynigwyr posibl, sefydlodd Llywodraeth y DU Swyddfa Masnach y Llywodraeth, sydd yn targedu pob adran i arbed ar eu cyllideb caffael.

The OGC's role will be to champion world class public procurement in the promotion of good practice. I will be interested in the Minister's response as to how OGC relates to Wales and what lessons have been learned in how they undertake their PFI initiative. The Westminster Government is embracing PFI and the Assembly can also exploit these opportunities. Furthermore, the former PFI Treasury taskforce has evolved into Partnerships UK, which provides hands-on support for individual deals. The lessons from these organisations need to be learnt in our activities following this debate.

Rôl Swyddfa Masnach y Llywodraeth fydd cefnogi'r caffaeliadau cyhoeddus gorau wrth hyrwyddo arfer da. Byddaf yn ymddiddori yn ymateb y Gweinidog o ran sut mae Swyddfa Masnach y Llywodraeth yn ymwneud â Chymru a pha wersi a ddysgwyd ynglŷn â sut yr ymgymmerant â'u menter cyllid preifat. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn croesawu'r fenter cyllid preifat a gall y Cynulliad fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn hefyd. Yn ogystal, datblygodd cyn dasglu menter cyllid preifat y Trysorlys yn Partnerships UK, sydd yn darparu cymorth uniongyrchol ar gyfer bargeinion unigol. Mae angen dysgu gwersi o'r sefydliadau hyn yn ein gweithgareddau yn sgîl y ddadl hon.

The paper that we are debating today

Cynigia'r papur a ddadleuwn heddiw fesurau

proposes short, medium and long-term measures. The short-term measures propose a PFI unit as a 'clearing house' for good practice. It also quotes that procuring authorities rely on external advisors and the need to mitigate costs. However, it would be ironic if such a service was established and the private sector not used as a method of delivery. The small business service in England, obviously a different organisation but the principles remain; it will be run on a franchise basis and this could be a method of delivery of this 'clearing house'.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Alun. Your time is up.

**Peter Black:** I said in a previous debate that I am agnostic about PFI. That is because I am a realist and I recognise the benefit of attracting private finance to provide added value to public expenditure. It is a matter of some regret that the present Government has not changed the public spending rules to make investment in capital projects in the public sector possible without going down the PFI route. There is a cost, and one of the fundamental questions that needs to be answered by this review is whether the benefits of enhancing the existing budgets by using private finance to get around Treasury rules can be justified in terms of the value for money that we get from such projects and the impact on people's jobs and the terms and conditions of those jobs. The assumptions that are made through the public sector comparator in comparing the cost of financing a project through traditional public sector methods and PFI are vital in ensuring value for money. The problem is that, as with all such comparisons, the assumptions can be changed to get the answer that we want.

The second consideration has to be the impact of PFI on employees. This review needs to highlight that if the financial viability of the PFI project is dependent on lowering pay and worsening employee conditions, then that should be made clear from the start. It should also consider the situation of new staff taken on after PFI

tymor byr, tymor canolig a thymor hir. Cynigia'r mesurau tymor byr uned menter cyllid preifat fel 'tŷ clirio' ar gyfer arfer da. Dyfynna hefyd fod awdurdodau caffael yn dibynnu ar gynghorwyr allanol a'r angen i liniaru costau. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n eironig pe sefydlir gwasanaeth o'r fath a phe na ddefnyddir y sector preifat fel dull cyflenwi. Mae'n amlwg bod y gwasanaeth busnesau bach yn Lloegr yn sefydliad gwahanol, ond yr un yw'r egwyddorion; fe'i rhedir ar sail masnachfrait a gallai hyn fod yn ddull cyflwyno'r 'tŷ clirio' hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Alun. Mae'ch amser ar ben.

**Peter Black:** Dywedais mewn dadl flaenorol fy mod yn agnostic am y fenter cyllid preifat. Y rheswm dros hyn yw oherwydd mai realydd ydwyf ac oherwydd y cydnabyddaf fanteision denu arian preifat i roi gwerth ychwanegol i wariant cyhoeddus. Mae'n destun gofid na newidiodd y Llywodraeth bresennol y rheolau gwario cyhoeddus er mwyn buddsoddi mewn prosiectau cyfalaf yn y sector cyhoeddus heb fynd ar drywydd y fenter cyllid preifat. Mae cost yn hyn, ac un o'r cwestiynau hanfodol mae angen i'r adolygiad hwn ei ateb yw a ellir cyfiawnhau manteision cynyddu'r cyllidebau presennol, drwy ddefnyddio arian preifat er mwyn osgoi rheolau'r Trysorlys, o ran y gwerth am arian a gawn o brosiectau o'r fath a'r dylanwad ar swyddi pobl ac ar delerau ac amodau'r swyddi hynny. Mae'r tybiaethau a wneir drwy gymharydd y sector cyhoeddus wrth gymharu cost ariannu prosiect drwy ddulliau sector cyhoeddus traddodiadol a'r fenter cyllid preifat yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau gwerth am arian. Fel gyda phob cymhariaeth o'r fath, y broblem yw y gellir newid y tybiaethau er mwyn cael yr ateb a ddymunwn.

Dylanwad y fenter cyllid preifat ar weithwyr yw'r ail ystyriaeth. Mae angen i'r adolygiad hwn amlygu y dylid ei gwneud yn glir o'r dechrau os dibynna prosiect y fenter cyllid preifat ar ostwng cyflogau a gwaethygu amodau'r gweithwyr. Dylai ystyried hefyd sefyllfa staff newydd a ddechreuodd ar ôl y fenter cyllid preifat y mae eu hamodau

whose conditions of work are worse than those of the staff who are transferred. Those are the two main points I wanted to make on PFI given the time available.

I will say a few words about the amendments. I have a great deal of sympathy with some of the Plaid Cymru amendments and would want to see some of those issues considered by the Subject Committees when they investigate PFI. However, I agree with Edwina that we should not pre-empt those discussions by passing those amendments now. On the Tory amendments, their enthusiasm for the dogma of the market and the profit motive has got the better of them. We are all aware that Alun Cairns is a banker, but that does not make him an expert on public finance. The one thing that his party needs to explain is how it will square its calls for more investment in the NHS and education with William Hague's commitment to cut £8 billion from public services during the course of the next Parliament. If, as seems likely from the amendments that they have tabled today, they propose to square that circle by using PFI, then they are living in a fantasy world. One of the key lessons of the last 10 years is that you cannot successfully replace public investment with private capital because the aims and objectives of both are different. We cannot afford to have our houses, roads, schools and hospitals subjected to the vagaries of the market. If we are to use PFI, it must be used sparingly and effectively. The blunt instrument that it would become if the Conservative amendments are passed would butcher our public services.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg. Nid oes dwywaith nad yw ariannu menter cyllid preifat yn fwy costus i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn y pen draw o'i gymharu ag ariannu cyhoeddus. Yr unig ddewis gyda chynlluniau menter preifat i adeiladu ysbytai yw defnyddio cyllid preifat i'w codi, neu beidio â'u codi o gwbl. Canlyniad costau uwch cynlluniau menter preifat uwch yw bod llai o welyau mewn ysbytai cynllun menter preifat—bron yn ddiethriad—nag yn yr ysbytai cyhoeddus y

gwaith yn waeth na'r aelodau o'r staff a drosglwyddodd. Dyna'r ddau brif bwynt y dymunais eu nodi ynglŷn â'r fenter cyllid preifat gan ystyried yr amser sydd ar gael.

Dywedaf ychydig eiriau am y gwelliannau. Cydymdeimlaf yn fawr â rhai o welliannau Plaid Cymru a hoffwn i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc ystyried rhai ohonynt pan ymchwiliant i'r fenter cyllid preifat. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf ag Edwina na ddylem achub y blaen ar y trafodaethau hynny drwy basio'r gwelliannau hynny yn awr. Ynglŷn â'r gwelliannau Torïaidd, aeth eu brwdfrydedd am ddogma'r farchnad a'r cymhelliad elw yn drech na hwy. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol mai banciwr yw Alun Cairns, ond ni olyga hynny ei fod yn arbenigwr ar arian cyhoeddus. Un peth y mae angen i'w blaidd ei egluro yw sut y bydd yn cysoni eu galwadau i fuddsoddi mwy o arian yn yr NHS ac addysg ag ymrwymiad William Hague i gwtogi £8 biliwn o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ystod y sesiwn nesaf o'r Senedd. Os cynigiant gysoni'r cylch hwnnw drwy ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat, a ymddengys i fod yn debygol gan y gwelliannau a gyflwynasant heddiw, wedyn maent yn byw mewn byd ffantasi. Un o'r gwersi allweddol a ddysgwyd o'r 10 mlynedd diwethaf yw na ellir llwyddo i roi cyfalaf preifat yn lle buddsoddiad cyhoeddus gan fod nodau ac amcanion y ddau yn wahanol. Ni allwn fforddio i'n tai, ffyrdd, ysgolion ac ysbytai ddioddef mympwyon y farchnad. Os dymunwn ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat, rhaid ei defnyddio'n anaml ac yn effeithiol. Byddai'r erfyn di-awch a ddeuai pe pasiai'r gwelliannau Ceidwadol yn difetha ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

**David Lloyd:** I declare my usual interest as a doctor. There is no doubt that PFI funding is more costly to the health service in the long-run compared to public funding. The only choice available with PFI schemes to build hospitals is to use private finance to build them or not build them at all. The consequence of the higher costs of PFI are that there are fewer beds in PFI hospitals—almost without exception—as compared to the public hospitals they replace. The provision cannot respond to the need for

maent yn eu disodli. Nid yw'r ddarpariaeth yn gallu ymateb i'r angen am newid dros y blynyddoedd oherwydd bod yr ysbytai newydd wedi'u clymu i gytundebau tymor hir.

Canlyniad arall menter cyllid preifat yw rhaniad yn staff y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yn y gorffennol, yr oedd pawb yn gweithio yn yr un tîm: y cogyddion, y glanhawyr, y porthorion, y meddygon a'r nyrsys. Nid yw hynny'n wir bellach. Mae'r sawl sydd yn glanhau a'r sawl sydd yn coginio, ac eraill, yn gweithio i gyflogwyr gwahanol yn y sector preifat. Mae hynny'n tanseilio'n gyfan gwbl undod cryf staff ein gwasanaeth iechyd.

Investment under the PFI costs more than public sector procurement. The annual charge for the use of privately financed facilities is between 9 and 18 per cent of the original construction costs, whereas governments can borrow at interest rates of only 3 to 3.5 per cent. The extra cost of private finance is disguised by the Treasury's insistence that NHS trusts discount costs at 6 per cent per annum, when comparing the cost of the private finance option with public sector investment. The amount of risk transferred to the private sector under privately-financed deals has been grossly exaggerated, leading to spurious attributions of additional value to private sector options. Public services financed by public funding? That will be the day.

4:10 p.m.

**Alison Halford:** I do not live in the dream world inherited by Plaid Cymru. I am a realist, and I know that there will never be enough money to fulfil all the expectations that we, and our constituents, want. PFI would not be my natural choice, but we do not live in a perfect world.

Holywell, in my constituency, is a lovely place, which desperately needs a community hospital. I will describe the north Wales town, a place that is a long way away. It is a traditional Welsh market town that takes its name from St Winifred's holy well, which is

change over the years because the new hospitals are tied into long-term contracts.

Another consequence of PFI is a division among health service staff. In the past, everybody worked as part of the same team: the cooks, the cleaners, the porters, the doctors and the nurses. That is no longer true. Those who clean and those who cook, and others, work for different employers in the private sector. That completely undermines the strong unity of our health service staff.

Mae buddsoddi o dan y fenter cyllid preifat yn costio mwy nag o dan gaffaeliadau'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r tâl blynyddol i ddefnyddio cyfleusterau a ariennir yn breifat rhwng 9 a 18 y cant o'r costau adeiladu gwreiddiol, tra y gall llywodraethau fenthyca arian ar gyfraddau llog o ddim ond 3 i 3.5 y cant. Cuddir cost ychwanegol arian preifat gan fod y Trysorlys yn mynnu mai 6 y cant y flwyddyn yw costau gostyngedig ymddiriedolaethau'r NHS, o gymharu cost yr opsiwn cyllid preifat â buddsoddiad y sector cyhoeddus. Gorddywedwyd yn fawr ar gyfanswm y risg a drosglwyddir i'r sector preifat o dan fargeinion a ariennir yn breifat, gan briodoli gwerth ychwanegol ffug i opsiynau'r sector preifat. Ariannu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gan arian preifat? Fe'i credaf pan y'i gwelaf.

**Alison Halford:** Nid wyf yn byw yn y byd breuddwydion a etifeddwyd gan Blaid Cymru. Realydd ydwyf, a gwn na fydd byth digon o arian i gyflawni ein holl ddisgwyliadau a holl ddisgwyliadau ein hetholwyr. Ni ddewiswn y fenter cyllid preifat fel dewis cyntaf, ond nid ydym yn byw mewn byd perffaith.

Mae Treffynnon, yn fy etholaeth, yn lle hyfryd, gydag angen enbyd am ysbyty cymunedol. Disgrifiaf y dref yng ngogledd Cymru, sydd yn bell oddi yma. Tref farchnad draddodiadol Gymreig ydyw sydd yn dwyn ei henw o ffynnon sanctaidd Gwenffrewi, sef

one of the seven wonders of Wales. The town was once a powerhouse, supplying labour for the factories and mills that sprang up in Greenfield Valley during the eighteenth century. It used to be the third largest town in Wales, and now has a population of 23,000. Some say that it is a typical small Welsh town being left behind. With Edwina's bold proposals, PFI can provide what the residents of the area so desperately want: a community hospital. They have been making do with a former workhouse, which has long outlived its usefulness. This place is an embarrassment. The health authority cannot afford its upkeep and maintenance, and yet cannot afford to close it. There is a community hospital in the area, but it does not function properly and does not serve the needs of the people. It is a favourable location and capable of expansion. However, it needs public money, and PFI is the only way that this can occur. Although it is not the best option, provided that staffing is kept separate from the way in which it is done now, provided that Edwina's excellent proposals of considering the bureaucracy and ways of improving costing measures and PFI generally, it will receive my support because I and my constituents want a community hospital.

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as leader of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council, which has submitted a PFI application to the Assembly.

The Office of Fair Trading recently launched a campaign warning people not to be pressured into borrowing too much at Christmas. The slogan of the campaign is also relevant to PFI, and is the view of most people:

'Don't let credit turn into debt'.

I will continue where Janet Ryder finished. Despite what has been said, there are alternatives to PFI. The Chancellor could relax the borrowing restrictions on public authorities. Relaxing the restrictions imposed on the public sector net cash requirement, which are almost unique to the United Kingdom, would allow authorities to borrow

un o saith rhyfeddod Cymru. Bu'r dref yn bwerdy ar un adeg, gan gyflenwi llafur ar gyfer y ffatrïoedd a'r melinau a godwyd yng Nghwm Greenfield yn ystod y ddeunawfed ganrif. Hi oedd y dref fwyaf ond tair yng Nghymru, ac mae poblogaeth o 23,000 ganddi erbyn hyn. Dywed rhai mai tref fach Gymreig nodweddiadol ydyw a gaiff ei gadael ar ôl. Gyda chynigion beiddgar Edwina, gall y fenter cyllid preifat roi i drigolion yr ardal yr hyn y mae eisiau arnynt gymaint, sef ysbyty cymunedol. Gwnaethant y tro gyda hen dloty, na fu o fudd ers amser maith. Mae'r lle hwn yn codi cywilydd. Ni all yr awdurdod iechyd fforddio ei gynnal a'i gadw, ac eto ni all fforddio ei gau. Mae ysbyty cymunedol yn yr ardal, ond ni weithia'n gywir ac ni wasanaetha anghenion y bobl. Mae'i leoliad yn addas a gellir ei ehangu. Fodd bynnag, mae angen arian cyhoeddus arno, a'r fenter cyllid preifat yw'r unig ffordd o wneud hyn. Er nad hwn yw'r opsiwn gorau, os cedwir staffio ar wahân i'r ffordd y'i gwneir ar hyn o bryd, os derbynnir cynigion ardderchog Edwina ynglŷn ag ystyried y fiwrocratiaeth a'r ffyrdd o wella mesurau costio a'r fenter cyllid preifat yn gyffredinol, derbynia fy nghefnogaeth gan fy mod i a'm hetholwyr yn dymuno gweld ysbyty cymunedol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, sydd wedi cyflwyno cais menter cyllid preifat i'r Cynulliad.

Lansiodd y Swyddfa Masnachu Teg ymgyrch yn ddiweddar i rybuddio pobl i beidio â chael eu pwysu i fentyca gormod o arian dros y Nadolig. Mae slogan yr ymgyrch yn berthnasol i'r fenter cyllid preifat hefyd, a barn y rhan fwyaf o bobl ydyw:

'Peidiwch â gadael i gredyd droi'n ddyled'.

Parhaf lle y gorffennodd Janet Ryder. Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd, mae dewisiadau eraill ar wahân i'r fenter cyllid preifat. Gallai'r Canghellor lacio'r cyfyngiadau benthyca a osodir ar awdurdodau cyhoeddus. Byddai llacio'r cyfyngiadau a osodir ar ofyniad arian clir y sector cyhoeddus, sydd bron yn unigryw i'r

at attractive rates from the European Investment Bank and the European Investment Fund to finance new schools and hospitals. The Chancellor could increase public sector capital spending, reversing the chronic underinvestment and using some of the reserves that he is holding, without even raising taxes. This motion must be amended to allow those alternatives to be considered.

**Ann Jones** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** I do not think that Pauline is giving way.

**Pauline Jarman:** Amendment 3 highlights the report's inaccuracies. Plaid Cymru's response neither supported nor encouraged the development of PFI. Councils have followed this route simply because there is no other option on offer. The Government has failed to encompass any views that do not agree with its own. The document says that the Local Government and Housing Committee will consider the use of PFI as an alternative to stock transfer. The Committee considered and rejected that idea over a year ago, when Sue Essex was the Chair. On housing, the document is wrong to say that:

'the Assembly is keen to see some trials of PPP/PFI in this area'.

The Assembly is more than a Lib/Lab Coalition Government. Let me quote from the response by UNISON:

'We believe the Assembly is seriously misguided in its reliance on the PPP/PFI approach.'

Members who will vote on this issue share our scepticism of PFIs or private public partnerships, a private finance initiative by any other name. I urge you to vote for your beliefs today by accepting our amendments.

**John Griffiths:** I congratulate Alun Cairns for making Margaret Thatcher's legacy in Wales a platform for the Conservatives' campaign in the run-up to a possible general election next year. We are content to fight on

Deyrnas Unedig, yn caniatáu i awdurdodau fenthyca arian ar gyfraddau deniadol gan Fanc Buddsoddi Ewrop a'r Gronfa Buddsoddi Ewropeaidd i ariannu ysgolion ac ysbytai newydd. Gallai'r Canghellor godi gwariant cyfalaf y sector cyhoeddus, gan wrydroi'r tanfuddsoddiad difrifol a chan ddefnyddio rhai o'r cronfeydd a ddalia, heb hyd yn oed godi trethi. Rhaid diwygio'r cynnig hwn er mwyn caniatáu inni ystyried y dewisiadau eraill hynny.

**Ann Jones** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Ni chredaf fod Pauline yn ildio.

**Pauline Jarman:** Amlyga gwelliant 3 y gwallau yn yr adroddiad. Nid oedd ymateb Plaid Cymru naill ai'n cefnogi datblygu'r fenter cyllid preifat na'i hannog. Dim ond am nad oes dewis arall ar gael y dilynodd y cynghorau y trywydd hwn. Methodd y Llywodraeth â chwmpasu unrhyw sylwadau na chytunant â'i theimladau ei hun. Dywed y ddogfen yr ystyria'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat yn lle trosglwyddo stoc. Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor y syniad hwnnw a'i wrthod dros flwyddyn yn ôl, pan fu Sue Essex yn Gadeirydd. Ynglŷn â thai, mae'r ddogfen yn anghywir pan ddywed:

Mae'r Cynulliad yn fwy na Llywodraeth Glymblaid Ryddfrydol/Llafur. Gadewch imi ddyfynnu ymateb UNISON:

Rhanna'r Aelodau fydd yn pleidleisio ar y mater hwn ein hamheuaeth am fentrau cyllid preifat neu bartneriaethau preifat cyhoeddus, sef menter cyllid preifat o dan enw arall. Fe'ch anogaf i bleidleisio dros eich credoau heddiw drwy dderbyn ein gwelliannau.

**John Griffiths:** Llongyfarchaf Alun Cairns am wneud etifeddiaeth Margaret Thatcher yn llwyfan i ymgyrch y Ceidwadwyr wrth ddynesu at etholiad cyffredinol posibl y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr ydym yn fodlon ymladd

that ground. I note that my amendment to their statement of opinion has much more support than their original statement of opinion asking the people of Wales to value Margaret Thatcher's legacy. My amendment makes it clear that the people of Wales would do no such thing and neither will the Assembly as the representative of the people of Wales.

Many of the shortcomings of the PFI system have already been highlighted by various speakers. Apart from the Conservatives, everybody in this Assembly recognises the shortcomings and difficulties of the PFI scheme. I welcome Edwina's comments about establishing a dialogue with the Treasury and I urge her to pursue that with the necessary enthusiasm when it is timely to do so. I recognise those shortcomings. There are many difficulties in terms of whether all or some staff are transferred. There are doubtful comparisons of the relative value for money of public or private initiatives and the rules that govern them. There are various inflexibilities and 30-year contracts. There are all sorts of problems.

However, as others have mentioned, I recognise that in Newport East, for example, the parents, pupils and teachers of Durham Road Infant School and Durham Road Junior School, which are housed in old, inadequate buildings, await new schools, which will be provided by a private finance initiative. They would not easily forgive the local authority or the Assembly if they took a dogmatic stance rather than recognising the current reality. The people involved want that project to move forward. I want that too. I welcome the local authority's stance on that. Similarly, I know that the residents of Corporation Road in Newport are, understandably, sick and tired of the noise, general pollution and property damage caused by traffic congestion in their area. The southern distributor road, which is being financed by a private finance initiative, will ease those problems. Again, it was a matter of recognising at the time that that project would either not have gone ahead or would have been subject to unforgivable delay if the reality of the situation had not

ar y sail honno. Nodaf fod llawer mwy o gefnogaeth i'm gwelliant i'w datganiad barn na'u datganiad barn gwreiddiol a ofynnodd i bobl Cymru werthfawrogi etifeddiaeth Margaret Thatcher. Esbonia fy ngwelliant yn glir na wnâi pobl Cymru y fath beth ac na wna'r Cynulliad y fath beth ychwaith fel cynrychiolydd pobl Cymru.

Amlygwyd llawer o ddiffygion system y fenter cyllid preifat eisoes gan amrywiol siaradwyr. Ar wahân i'r Ceidwadwyr, mae pawb yn y Cynulliad hwn yn cydnabod diffygion ac anawsterau cynllun y fenter cyllid preifat. Croesawaf sylwadau Edwina am gynnal trafodaeth â'r Trysorlys ac fe'i hanogaf i fynd ar drywydd hynny gyda'r brwdfrydedd angenrheidiol pan fo'n briodol gwneud hynny. Cydnabyddaf y diffygion hynny. Mae cymaint o anawsterau o ran a ddylid trosglwyddo pob aelod o'r staff neu rai aelodau o'r staff. Ceir cymariaethau amheus ynglŷn â gwerth cymharol am arian mentrau cyhoeddus neu breifat a'r rheolau sydd yn eu rheoli. Ceir amrywiol fathau o anhyblygrwydd a chontractau 30 mlynedd. Ceir problemau o bob math.

Fodd bynnag, fel y crybwyllwyd gan eraill, cydnabyddaf, yn Nwyrain Casnewydd, er enghraifft, bod rhieni, disgyblion ac athrawon Ysgol Babanod Durham Road ac Ysgol Iau Durham Road, lle ceir hen adeiladau annigonol, yn aros am ysgolion newydd, a ddarperir gan fenter cyllid preifat. Ni faddeuent yr awdurdod lleol na'r Cynulliad yn hawdd pe cymerent safbwynt dogmataidd yn hytrach na chydabod y realiti presennol. Mae'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt yn awyddus i'r prosiect hwnnw symud ymlaen. Yr wyf yn awyddus i hynny ddigwydd hefyd. Croesawaf safbwynt yr awdurdod lleol ar hynny. Yn yr un modd, gwn fod trigolion Corporation Road yng Nghasnewydd wedi hen flino, fel y gellir deall, ar y sŵn, y llygredd cyffredinol a'r difrod i adeiladau a achosir gan dagfeydd traffig ar y ffyrdd yn eu hardal. Bydd y ffordd ddosbarthu ddeheuol, a ariennir gan fenter cyllid preifat, yn lleddfu'r problemau hynny. Eto, bu'n rhaid cydnabod ar y pryd nad âi'r prosiect hwnnw ymlaen neu y byddai

been recognised by the local authority and the Assembly. We must view these matters in that context.

**David Melding:** It is appropriate that we review the success of PFI. It would be wrong to say that the system could not be improved, but it has brought a useful model to public services. Many of Plaid Cymru's criticisms, which have been made in a sweeping fashion, relate to the nature of a contract. It may be appropriate to consider issues such as ancillary services and ask whether there is a better way of delivering them within PFI. I am sure that the Committees will have something to say when they examine this issue, but some of the comments were not based on any factual understanding of the situation. The flexibility of PFI is, perhaps, its greatest benefit. We have heard return on capital as if these buildings did not have to be adapted or constantly maintained and the work completed to tight timescales, which is all part of the contract.

4:20 p.m.

Let us not kid ourselves. In the past, the public sector was bad at maintaining and adapting buildings and often did not provide them to any appropriate schedule. Buildings would take an inordinate amount of time to come on stream effectively. We are using the private sector to manage, adapt and deliver services in an innovative way within the public sector. It is not an alternative to the public sector. It is not the private sector taking over the public sector. It is nothing of the sort. PFI has been particularly successful for big schemes. Perhaps we should now look at some of the smaller schemes and see what is best value. It is often the best way to deliver large projects.

We have talked about hospitals but we have also heard about provision of roads and getting added value from planning and so forth. Many communities will not get a bypass unless we use such a scheme. We should be honest about this because we do

oedi anfaddeuol pa na chydabyddai'r awdurdod lleol a'r Cynulliad realiti'r sefyllfa. Rhaid inni ystyried y materion hyn yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

**David Melding:** Mae'n briodol inni adolygu llwyddiant y fenter cyllid preifat. Byddai'n anghywir dweud na ellid gwella'r system, ond rhoddodd fodel defnyddiol i wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae llawer o feirniadaethau Plaid Cymru, a fu'n ysgubol iawn, yn ymwneud â natur contract. Efallai ei bod yn briodol ystyried materion megis gwasanaethau atodol a gofyn a oes ffordd well o'u cyflwyno o fewn y fenter cyllid preifat. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd rhywbeth gan y Pwyllgorau i'w ddweud pan archwiliant y mater hwn, ond ni fu rhai o'r sylwadau yn seiliedig ar unrhyw ddealltwriaeth ffeithiol o'r sefyllfa. Efallai mai hyblygrwydd y fenter cyllid preifat yw ei mantais fwyaf. Clywsom am elw ar gyfalaf fel na fu'n rhaid addasu a chynnal a chadw'r adeiladau hyn yn gyson a chwblhau'r gwaith o fewn cyfyngiadau amser tynn, sydd oll yn rhan o'r contract.

Peidiwn â'n twyllo ein hunain. Yn y gorffennol, bu'r sector cyhoeddus yn wael wrth gynnal a chadw ac addasu adeiladau ac nis darparodd o fewn amserlen briodol yn aml. Cymerai adeiladau lawer gormod o amser i ddechrau llifo'n effeithiol. Defnyddiwn y sector preifat i reoli, addasu a chyflwyno gwasanaethau mewn ffordd arloesol o fewn y sector cyhoeddus. Nid yw'n ddewis arall i'r sector cyhoeddus. Ni chymerir y sector cyhoeddus drosodd gan y sector preifat. Nid yw'n ddim byd o'r fath. Bu'r fenter cyllid preifat yn arbennig o lwyddiannus ar gyfer cynlluniau mawr. Efallai y dylem edrych ar rai o'r cynlluniau llai yn awr i weld beth yw gwerth gorau. Y ffordd orau o gyflwyno prosiectau mawr ydy yn aml.

Siaradasom am ysbytai ond clywsom hefyd am ddarparu ffyrdd a chael gwerth ychwanegol drwy gynllunio ac ati. Ni chaiff llawer o gymunedau ffordd osgoi oni ddefnyddiwn gynllun o'r fath. Dylem fod yn onest am hyn am nad oes cronfa ddiddiwedd



not have a bottomless pit to fund public works. It is a pity, but that is how it is. If you want bypasses in rural areas such as parts of the Vale of Glamorgan you will probably need to look at some form of private finance initiative. Overall, this is bringing in the skills of the private sector to improve public services. This will not make our roads less public or our NHS less universal and free at the point of need.

**Edwina Hart:** I do not dismiss the views that have been expressed today and I understand the concern in the Chamber on many issues. However, I think that there is slight hypocrisy in this debate because, when you look across Wales you see what some PFI projects have delivered. We must realise that we are elected to improve things for people and that that is the whole point of us being in this Chamber. I would like to say, particularly to Dai, Pauline and Janet that this is grown up politics. I do not tilt at the Treasury's windmills. As I made clear in my statement, there will be occasions in the future when we should use our experiences in Wales to conduct a dialogue with the Treasury on issues such as capital finance. This is not yet the time.

In terms of PFI and public-private partnership we must look at the experience of committees and health authorities and trusts in delivering product. What are we to learn from that? We have much to learn in terms of cutting down on bureaucracy. Do we want to do the same on bargaining? Perhaps lessons will be learned in the future. We must also look at what has happened in education, local government, the pathfinders school projects and learn from it. There is no bottomless pit. In an ideal world it would all be public money but at this stage in our existence, with central Government policy as it is, we must recognise the realities of where we are in Wales and do the best with the tools that are available. I know that that is not palatable to many but for Plaid Cymru to pray in aid the trade union movement today was quite rich.

gennym i ariannu gwaith cyhoeddus. Mae'n drueni, ond dyna sut y mae. Os dymunwch ffyrdd osgoi mewn ardaloedd gwledig megis rhannau o Fro Morgannwg, mae'n debyg y bydd angen ichi ystyried rhyw fath o fenter cyllid preifat. Ar y cyfan, defnyddia hyn sgiliau'r sector preifat i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ni wna hyn ein ffyrdd yn llai cyhoeddus ac ni fydd yn atal ein NHS rhag bod ar gael i lai o bobl ac am ddim pan fo'r angen.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid anwybyddaf y teimladau a fynegwyd heddiw a deallaf y pryder yn y Siambr ynglŷn â llawer o faterion. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod rhywfaint o ragrith yn y ddadl hon oherwydd, pan edrychwn ledled Cymru, gwelwn yr hyn a gyflenwyd gan rai prosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat. Rhaid inni sylweddoli y'n hetholir i wella pethau ar gyfer pobl a dyna'r prif reswm pam yr ydym yma yn y Siambr hon. Hoffwn ddweud, yn enwedig wrth Dai, Pauline a Janet, mai gwleidyddiaeth mewn oed yw hyn. Ni fyddaf yn ymladd â melinau gwynt y Trysorlys. Fel y gwneuthum yn glir yn fy natganiad, bydd achlysuron yn y dyfodol pan ddylem ddefnyddio ein profiadau yng Nghymru i drafod materion megis arian cyfalaf â'r Trysorlys. Nid nawr yw'r amser priodol.

O ran y fenter cyllid preifat a'r bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat, rhaid inni ystyried profiad pwyllgorau ac awdurdodau iechyd ac ymddiriedolaethau wrth gyflwyno'r cynnyrch. Beth a ddysgw'n o hynny? Mae llawer gennym i'w ddysgu o ran lleihau biwrocraiaeth. A ydym yn awyddus i wneud yr un peth o ran bargeinio? Efallai y caiff gwersi eu dysgu yn y dyfodol. Rhaid inni ystyried hefyd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd mewn addysg, llywodraeth leol, prosiectau arloesol mewn ysgolion ac i ddysgu ohono. Nid oes cronfa arian ddiidwedd. Mewn byd delfrydol, defnyddiem arian cyhoeddus yn gyfan gwbl ond yn awr, gyda pholisi Llywodraeth ganolog fel y mae, rhaid inni gydnabod gwirioneddau ein sefyllfa yng Nghymru a gwneud y gorau o'r offer sydd ar gael. Gwn nad yw hynny'n dderbyniol i lawer ond bu Plaid Cymru yn eithaf digywilydd pan weddiodd heddiw am gymorth gan yr undebau llafur.

I make it clear, given my background and that of many in my party, that the trade unions are closely associated with the Labour Party. They understand, even with all the difficulties that we have with PFI, that we are trying to make progress in Wales to address the key issues. Jane Hutt and myself have met with them to discuss the issues surrounding PFI. We will continue to meet with trade unions to discuss the way forward. Further discussion on PFI and how we deal with related issues is important in this regard. We must recognise that we can all learn from this. We have links with other organisations in England, such as Partnerships UK, which assist in these projects.

There are valuable lessons to be learned, from English and Scottish experiences. Scotland has had difficulties with many of the issues that it has tackled but we have not had the same problems in Wales with the projects that we have managed. When I look at the projects that I am sometimes asked to sanction, I think that your comments are a bit rich, Pauline, when local government in Caerphilly and in Rhondda Cynon Taff is going for these projects and quite happy to tender bids and lobby for them. I do not expect hypocrisy from your side of the Chamber on these issues.

This is a difficult area for all of us. We have seen the lack of knowledge about PFI this afternoon. You can get out your textbooks and get out the academic exercises, but only in 30 years' time will you know whether it has been value for money. I do not expect an administration that has delivered so much for Wales in such a short time to be lectured. With our partnership agreement, and everything else that we have achieved, we are moving forward and will deliver projects for Wales.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am ddatganiad o fuddiant.

Would all Members who have an interest to declare, before we vote, please stand?

Esboniaf yn glir, gan ystyried fy nghefnidir a chefnidir llawer o bobl yn fy mhlaid, bod yr undebau llafur yn gysylltiedig yn agos â'r Blaid Lafur. Deallant, hyn yn oed gyda'r holl anawsterau sydd gennym o ran y fenter cyllid preifat, ein bod yn ceisio gwneud cynnydd yng Nghymru i fynd i'r afael â'r materion allweddol. Mae Jane Hutt a minnau wedi cwrdd â hwy i drafod y materion ynghylch y fenter cyllid preifat. Parhawn i gwrdd â'r undebau llafur i drafod y ffordd ymlaen. Mae trafodaeth bellach ar y fenter cyllid preifat a sut yr ymdriniwn â materion cysylltiedig yn bwysig yn hyn o beth. Rhaid inni gydnabod y gall pob un ohonom ddysgu o hyn. Mae gennym gysylltiadau â sefydliadau eraill yn Lloegr, megis Partnerships UK, a rydd gymorth i'r prosiectau hyn.

Mae gwersi gwerthfawr i'w dysgu o brofiadau Lloegr a'r Alban. Cafodd yr Alban anawsterau gyda llawer o'r materion yr aeth i'r afael â hwy ond ni chawsom yr un problemau yng Nghymru gyda'r prosiectau a reolasom. Pan ystyriaif y prosiectau y gofynnir imi eu cymeradwyo weithiau, credaf fod eich sylwadau braidd yn ddigywilydd, Pauline, pan fo llywodraeth leol yng Nghaerffili ac yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn gweithio tuag at y prosiectau hyn ac yn eithaf bodlon tendro cynigion a lobiö amdanynt. Ni ddisgwyliaf ragrith o'ch ochr chi o'r Siambr ar y materion hyn.

Mae hwn yn faes anodd i bob un ohonom. Gwelsom y diffyg gwybodaeth am y fenter cyllid preifat y prynhawn yma. Gallwch astudio eich gwर्सlyfrau a'r ymarferion academiaidd, ond dim ond mewn 30 mlynedd y gwyddoch a fu'n werth am arian. Ni ddisgwyliaf i weinyddiaeth a gyflwynodd gymaint i Gymru mewn cyfnod mor fyr gael pregeth. Gyda'n cytundeb partneriaeth, a phopeth arall a gyflawnasom, symudwn ymlaen a chyflwynwn brosiectau i Gymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call for a declaration of interest

A fyddai pob Aelod sydd â buddiant i'w ddatgan gystal â sefyll, cyn inni bleidleisio?

**Ann Jones:** Point of order. I do not have a copy of the Standing Orders in front of me, so I do not know under which Standing Order this comes. If you have submitted a PFI application, does that not mean that your constituency will benefit financially and, therefore, should you be voting in this debate?

**The Presiding Officer:** That is why I have asked Members to declare an interest.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** A wnewch chi esbonio hyn yn fanylach? Os ydym wedi gwneud cais ar gyfer prosiect o dan y fenter cyllid preifat yn ein hetholaethau, a ddylem ni ddatgan buddiant?

**Y Llywydd:** Dylech. Y rhybudd arferol yw y dylai pawb sydd yn debygol o fod â buddiant ddatgan hynny.

Trefn. A wnewch chi barhau i sefyll nes bod enwau pawb sydd yn datgan buddiant wedi eu nodi?

**Janice Gregory, William Graham, David Melding, Peter Black, Rosemary Butler, David Davies, Nick Bourne, Kirsty Williams, Jane Davidson, Jane Hutt, Andrew Davies, Rhodri Morgan, Ann Jones, Janet Davies, Helen Mary Jones, Owen John Thomas, Janet Ryder, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Geraint Davies, Peter Law, Phil Williams, Brian Hancock, Pauline Jarman, David Lloyd, Jocelyn Davies, Ieuan Wyn Jones, Cynog Dafis, Sue Essex, Edwina Hart, Carwyn Jones** *rose—*

**Ann Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Nid oes copi o'r Rheolau Sefydlog gennyf o'm blaen, felly ni wn o dan ba Reol Sefydlog y daw hyn. Os cyflwynasoch gais y fenter cyllid preifat, oni olyga hynny y bydd eich etholaeth yn dwyn elw ariannol ac, felly, na ddylech bleidleisio yn y ddadl hon?

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna pam y gofynnais i'r Aelodau ddatgan buddiant.

**The First Minister:** Will you give a clearer definition? If we have submitted an application for a PFI project in our constituencies, should we declare an interest?

**The Presiding Officer:** Yes. The usual warning is that everyone who is likely to have an interest should declare so.

Order. Will you remain standing until the names of all those declaring an interest have been noted?

**Janice Gregory, William Graham, David Melding, Peter Black, Rosemary Butler, David Davies, Nick Bourne, Kirsty Williams, Jane Davidson, Jane Hutt, Andrew Davies, Rhodri Morgan, Ann Jones, Janet Davies, Helen Mary Jones, Owen John Thomas, Janet Ryder, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Geraint Davies, Peter Law, Phil Williams, Brian Hancock, Pauline Jarman, David Lloyd, Jocelyn Davies, Ieuan Wyn Jones, Cynog Dafis, Sue Essex, Edwina Hart, Carwyn Jones** *a gododd—*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.  
Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Feld, Val  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Ron

Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 15, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 34.  
Amendment 2: For 15, Abstain 1, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Jane Davidson  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Lloyd, David

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 3: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 4: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 5: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44.  
Amendment 6: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 44.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 43.  
 Amendment 7: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 43.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil



*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44.  
Amendment 8: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 44.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44.  
Amendment 9: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 44.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44.  
Amendment 10: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 44.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.  
 Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion adopted.*

4.30 p.m.

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)**

**Ffurflen Cyfrifiad 2001  
 2001 Census Form**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham a gwelliant 2 yn enw Andrew Davies a Kirsty Williams. Caniateir 10 munud i'r Aelod sydd yn cynnig y cynnig, pum munud i Aelodau sydd yn cynnig gwelliannau a thair munud i siaradwyr eraill.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn credu y dylai ffurflen cyfrifiad 2001 gynnwys blwch ble gall pobl fynegi eu hunaniaeth Gymreig.*

Diolchaf am y cyfle i agor y drafodaeth bwysig hon ar y cyfrifiad a'r angen inni gynnwys blwch ticio i alluogi pobl Cymru i fynegi eu Cymreictod. Mae'n drueni bod yn rhaid inni gynnig cynnig o'r fath, ond gofynnaf i bob Aelod ei gefnogi. Onibai am benderfyniad y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol a'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain i wrthod caniatáu cynnwys blwch ticio ar y ffurflen, ni fyddai wedi bod yn angenrheidiol inni godi'r pwnc hwn o gwbl.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham and amendment 2 in the name of Andrew Davies and Kirsty Williams. The Member proposing the motion will be allowed 10 minutes to speak, Members proposing amendments will have five minutes and other speakers will have three minutes.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose that

*the National Assembly believes that the 2001 census form should contain a tick box for people to express their Welsh identity.*

I am grateful for the opportunity to open this important debate on the census and the need to include a tick box to enable the people of Wales to express their Welsh identity. It is a shame that we have been forced to propose such a motion, but I ask for the support of every Member. Were it not for the decision of the Office for National Statistics and the Government in London in refusing to allow the inclusion of a tick box on the form, it would not have been necessary for us to raise this subject at all.

Nid mater o hepgor cwestiwn am genedligrwydd yn unig yw hyn, er y byddai hynny'n ddigon, o gofio'r cynnydd sylweddol yn yr ymwybyddiaeth o Gymreictod yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'r sefyllfa yn waeth na hynny. Caiff y Gwyddelod a'r Albanwyr gyfle i nodi eu cenedligrwydd, a dylid canmol hynny. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn dymuno nodi eich bod yn Gymro neu'n Gymraes, yn ôl y rheolau presennol, bydd yn rhaid ichi dicio blwch yn dwyn y teitl 'Arall', neu ysgrifennu'r geiriau hynny eich hun.

Cafwyd ymgyrch nerthol yng Nghymru ac unoliaeth barn nas gwelwyd ei thebyg ers blynyddoedd lawer. Fodd bynnag, fe'n siomwyd gan ymateb y Llywodraeth yn Llundain. Cafodd Simon Thomas AS ateb annigonol gan y Prif Weinidog yn y Senedd, a chefais innau ateb tebyg gan Tony Blair yr wythnos diwethaf mewn llythyr nad oedd yn cynnig unrhyw beth newydd.

Rhaid datgan yn glir fod pobl wedi codi mater blwch ticio cyn i'r Llywodraeth wneud y penderfyniad terfynol. Honna'r Llywodraeth na fu i unrhyw un dynnu sylw at y diffyg hwn pan wnaethpwyd yr ymarferiad yng Ngwynedd a Cheredigion y llynedd. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym wybodaeth sydd yn groes i hynny. Gwyddom i berson a ddosbarthodd ffurflenni yng Ngwynedd—gŵr o Loegr gyda llaw—ddweud wrth reolwr lleol bod pobl wedi mynegi dymuniad i gael blwch ticio 'Cymreig'. Yn yr un modd, yng Ngheredigion, gwyddom i bobl gwyno nad oedd modd iddynt fynegi eu Cymreictod, er gwaethaf y dryswch a achosai'r geiriau 'cenedligrwydd' a 'cefndir ethnig' ar y ffurflen, ac er gwaethaf cyndynrwydd pobl i gwyno wrth gyrrff swyddogol. Gwyddom hefyd i ddau gyrrff fynegi pryder ynglŷn â'r blwch ticio—

**Huw Lewis:** Although all of that is interesting, Ieuan, from where do you draw any kind of moral authority to make those comments? You are a Member of Parliament who took part in the debate on the 2001 census in Westminster. You voted with the Tories on an amendment during that debate. However, you did not raise this issue. Your

This is not just a matter of omitting a question on nationality, although that would be enough, bearing in mind the substantial increase in Welsh awareness over the past years. The situation is worse than that. The Irish and Scots will have the opportunity to note their nationality, and that is to be welcomed. However, if you wish to note that you are a Welshman or a Welshwoman, according to the rules as they stand, you will have to tick a box bearing the title 'Other', or write those words yourself.

We have witnessed a powerful campaign in Wales and a consensus of opinion not seen for many years. However, we were disappointed by the response of the Government in London. Simon Thomas MP received an inadequate answer from the Prime Minister in Parliament, and I received a similar response from Tony Blair last week in a letter that offered nothing new.

It must be stated clearly that people raised the issue of a tick box before the Government made its final decision. The Government claims that no-one drew attention to this deficiency when the trials were carried out in Gwynedd and Ceredigion last year. However, we have information to the contrary. We know that a person who distributed the forms in Gwynedd—a man from England, by the way—told a local co-ordinator that people had expressed a wish to have a 'Welsh' tick box. Similarly, in Ceredigion, we know that people complained that they were unable to express their Welshness, despite the confusion caused by the words 'nationality' and 'ethnic background' on the form, and despite people's reluctance to complain to official bodies. We also know that two bodies expressed concerns regarding the tick box—

**Huw Lewis:** Er bod hynny oll yn ddiddorol, Ieuan, o ble y cewch unrhyw fath o awdurdod moesol i wneud y sylwadau hynny? Chi yw un o'r Aelodau Seneddol a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl ar gyfrifiad 2001 yn San Steffan. Fe wnaethoch bleidleisio gyda'r Torïaid ar welliant yn ystod y ddadl honno. Fodd bynnag, ni chodasoch y mater hwn. Ni

party did not raise it until the Independent Wales Party placed it on the agenda.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That is simply not the case, Huw. As an experienced Assembly Member, you know that, when secondary legislation is discussed in Westminster, not all Members are on the body that discusses it. It was not possible for all Welsh Members of Parliament to contribute to that debate. We should not try to be divisive on this issue today. Wales should speak with a united voice on this. I am surprised that you wish to raise a note of discord in a debate in which we should all agree.

Mae'n bwysig cofnodi bod dau gorff wedi dweud eu bod am weld blwch ticio ar y ffurflen, sef y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae'r ddau gorff yn cadarnhau i hynny ddigwydd cyn i'r Llywodraeth a'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol wneud y penderfyniad terfynol. Gwyddom hefyd nad oedd y ffurflenni wedi eu hargraffu pan gododd Simon Thomas y pwnc am y tro cyntaf yn y Senedd.

Gofynnwn heddiw am gefnogaeth unfrydol y Cynulliad i'r cynnig hwn er mwyn atgyfnerthu'r alwad ar ran pobl Cymru. Dyma brif gorff llywodraethol Cymru, a phe bai'r Cynulliad yn siarad gydag un llais, rhoddid pwysau ychwanegol a fyddai'n dweud wrth y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan ac yn Whitehall fod yn rhaid iddi wrando ar lais Cymru yn y mater hwn. Heb fynegiant o genedligrwydd Cymreig, ni fyddai'r Cynulliad yn bodoli. Mae'n deg inni ddisgwyl i'r corff hwn wneud safiad cryf a chroyw i fynnu'r hawl i'n pobl ddatgan eu hunaniaeth yn glir a diamwys.

All Assembly Members will accept that being classified as 'Other' on the census form has led to widespread anger in Wales. We have seen an unprecedented unity on this issue. We all agree that Welshness is not a question of ethnicity. Anyone who lives in Wales and regards themselves as belonging here should be able to mark themselves as 'Welsh', if they wish to do so. I can think of many examples of people from Asian or African ethnic origin who may want to

chodwyd y mater gan eich plaid tan i Blaid Annibynnol Cymru ei roi ar yr agenda.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl, Huw. Fel Aelod profiadol o'r Cynulliad, fe wyddoch pan drafodir deddfwriaeth eilaidd yn San Steffan nad yw pob Aelod ar y corff sydd yn ei thrafod. Ni fu'n bosibl i bob Aelod Seneddol o Gymru gyfrannu at y dadl honno. Ni ddylem geisio bod yn gynhennus ar y mater hwn heddiw. Dylai Cymru leisio barn unedig yn hyn o beth. Mae'n syndod gennyf eich bod am godi anghydfod mewn dadl lle dylem oll fod yn gytûn.

It is important to place on record that two bodies stated that they wanted a tick box on the form, namely the Commission for Racial Equality and the Welsh Language Board. Both bodies confirm that that occurred before the Government and the Office for National Statistics took the final decision. We also know that the forms had not been printed when Simon Thomas first raised the subject in Parliament.

We ask today for the Assembly's unanimous support for this motion in order to reinforce the call on behalf of the people of Wales. This is Wales's principal governmental body, and if the Assembly spoke with one voice, additional pressure would be exerted that would tell the Government in Westminster and in Whitehall that it must listen to Wales's voice on this subject. Without an expression of Welsh nationality, the Assembly would not exist. We should expect this body to take a strong and clear stance to demand the right for our people to state their identity clearly and unambiguously.

Bydd pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn derbyn bod cael ein dosbarthu fel 'Arall' ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad wedi arwain at ddieter mawr yng Nghymru. Ni welsom erioed undod o'r fath ar y mater hwn. Cytunwn oll nad yw Cymreictod yn fater o ethnigrwydd. Dylai unrhyw un sydd yn byw yng Nghymru ac sydd yn ystyried eu bod yn rhan ohoni allu nodi eu bod yn 'Gymreig', os dymunant wneud hynny. Gallaf feddwl am sawl enghraifft o bobl o darddiad ethnig Asiaidd neu Affricanaidd y byddent am

describe their cultural background as Welsh. They are entitled to do so. However, the census does not cater for them. There is also a clear implication on the form, as it stands, that to be British is to be white. The dangers of that were highlighted in the recent Runnymede Trust report, 'The Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain'.

No claims of nationality or identity should be exclusive. Many people can and do have a sense of belonging to more than one group. This should be recognised and encouraged. It is Wales's cultural diversity that gives it its energy and distinctiveness. It is a matter of fundamental human rights that people can choose how they want to express their identity.

I am also pleased that the discussion about our nationality and identity can transcend party politics. I move the motion in that spirit. It should unite all Assembly Members. The motion has been drafted in a way that gives every Member the opportunity to support it. It does not criticise anyone for past failures. It is a simple expression of fact—that the 2001 census form should contain a Welsh tick box.

Think of the added clout that adopting this motion would give us. The Assembly would have spoken with one voice and we could invite the Assembly's party leaders to write to Tony Blair together on behalf of the people of Wales to call for the inclusion of an appropriate tick box. That is a simple, clear and reasonable demand. There is no need to pulp the existing forms. All we need to do is either to ask for an additional page including a Welsh tick box or overprint the existing page. There may be a requirement to change the software to accommodate that. We might save the Treasury some cash. The cost of preparing a new page, or even overprinting, is estimated at £60,000. We could save the Treasury £940,000 on the cost of advertising, which would be unnecessary.

4:40 p.m.

I am happy to accept the spirit of amendment

ddisgrifio eu cefndir diwylliannol fel un Cymreig. Mae hawl ganddynt i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cyfrifiad yn darparu ar eu cyfer. Ceir goblygiad amlwg hefyd ar y ffurflen, fel y saif, bod Prydeinig yn gyfystyr â gwyn. Amlygwyd peryglon hynny yn yr adroddiad diweddar gan Ymddiriedolaeth Runnymede, 'The Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain'.

Ni ddylai unrhyw honiad o genedligrwydd neu hunaniaeth fod yn anghynhwysol. Gall llawer o bobl deimlo eu bod yn perthyn i fwy nag un grŵp, ac mae hyn yn digwydd. Dylid cydnabod ac annog hyn. Amrywiaeth diwylliannol Cymru a rydd iddi ei hegni a'i harbenigrwydd. Mae galluogi pobl i ddewis sut yr hoffent fynegi eu hunaniaeth yn fater o hawliau dynol sylfaenol.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch y gall y drafodaeth am ein cenedligrwydd a'n hunaniaeth oresgyn gwleidyddiaeth bleidiol. Cynigiau y cynnig yn yr ysbryd hwnnw. Dylai uno holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Drafftwyd y cynnig yn y fath fodd ag i roi'r cyfle i bob Aelod ei gefnogi. Nid yw'n beirniadu unrhyw un am fethiannau yn y gorffennol. Mynegiant syml o ffaith ydyw—y dylai ffurflen cyfrifiad 2001 gynnwys blwch ticio Cymreig.

Ystyriwch y grym ychwanegol y byddai mabwysiadu'r cynnig hwn yn ei roi inni. Byddai'r Cynulliad wedi llefaru ag un llais a gallem wahodd arweinwyr pleidiau'r Cynulliad i ysgrifennu at Tony Blair ar y cyd ar ran pobl Cymru i alw am gynnwys blwch ticio priodol. Mae hynny'n gais syml, clir a rhesymol. Nid oes angen dinistrio'r ffurflenni presennol. Y cyfan sydd angen inni ei wneud yw naill ai gofyn am dudalen ychwanegol yn gynnwys blwch ticio Cymreig neu drosargraffu'r dudalen bresennol. Efallai y bydd rhaid newid y meddalwedd er mwyn cyflawni hynny. Efallai yr arbedwn ryw faint o arian i'r Trysorlys. Amcangyfrifir y byddai'r gost o baratoi tudalen newydd, neu hyd yn oed drosargraffu, yn £60,000. Gallem arbed £940,000 i'r Trysorlys ar gost hysbysebu, na fyddai ei angen.

Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i dderbyn ysbryd

I but, given the assurances on how we propose to progress, I hope that the Welsh Conservative Party will withdraw its amendment.

We do not advocate or support a civil disobedience campaign on this issue. With that in mind, I will deal with the Lib-Lab amendment. I am not happy with how it has been drafted. It states the obvious. It is also defensive, as it seems to acknowledge that the campaign for tick box is almost doomed to failure. We must not let an imaginary threat of non-compliance deflect attention from the real issue, which is that the people of Wales should be allowed to declare their identity. Given the need for the widest possible support for this, we will accept the Lib-Lab amendment, although we are unconvinced of its relevance or value in the context of the debate. The overriding concern for the Assembly is to accept this motion and then to invite party leaders in Wales to write to Tony Blair to express the settled wish of the people of Wales. This body will then have spoken and the people of Wales will have been given a voice. Therefore, I urge all Members to support our motion. It is literally a time for us, as a nation, to stand up and be counted.

**William Graham:** I propose amendment 1. Add as new clause:

*To avoid all confusion on how to express your national identity, the census form should be overprinted with a Welsh tick box. This method of collecting the most accurate information on nationality acknowledges that the software will require upgrading to total the number of people who write they are Welsh in the 'other' space. This will allow the people of Wales to have the same opportunity to register their nationality that will be given to the people of Scotland and Ireland.*

We hope to look forward to a new era in the history of Wales and, in particular, in politics in Wales. The Assembly was elected to be the voice of Wales for this generation. The people of Wales look to us today to voice their expectations that they should be given

gwelliant I ond, o gofio'r sicrwydd a roddwyd o ran sut y bwriadwn symud ymlaen, gobeithiaf y bydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn tynnu ei gwelliant yn ôl.

Nid ydym o blaid ymgyrch anufudd-dod sifil ar y mater hwn. Gan gofio hynny, ymdriniaf â'r gwelliant Rhyddfrydol-Llafur. Nid wyf yn fodlon ar y ffordd y'i draftiwyd. Mae'n datgan yr amlwg. Mae hefyd yn amddiffynnol, gan yr ymddengys ei fod yn cydnabod bod yr ymgyrch dros flwch ticio ymron yn sicr o fethu. Ni ddylem adael i fgythiad dychmygol o anghydymffurfio dynnu sylw o'r mater gwirioneddol, sef y dylid caniatáu i bobl Cymru ddatgan eu hunaniaeth. O gofio bod angen y gefnogaeth ehangaf bosibl i hyn, derbyniwn y gwelliant Rhyddfrydol-Llafur, er nad ydym yn argyhoeddedig o'i berthnasedd na'i werth yng nghyd-destun y ddatl. Y mater holl bwysig i'r Cynulliad yw derbyn y cynnig hwn ac yna wahodd arweinwyr y pleidiau yng Nghymru i ysgrifennu at Tony Blair yn mynegi dymuniadau pendant pobl Cymru. Yna bydd y corff hwn wedi llefaru a bydd pobl Cymru wedi cael eu dweud. Felly, erfyniaf ar bob Aelod i gefnogi ein cynnig. Yn syml, mae'n bryd inni, fel gwlad, sefyll a chael ein cyfrif.

**William Graham:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

*Er mwyn osgoi unrhyw ddryswch wrth fynegi'ch hunaniaeth genedlaethol, dylid argraffu blwch ticio Cymraeg ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Trwy'r dull hwn y cesglir yr wybodaeth fwyaf cywir am genedligrwydd, ond cydnabyddir y bydd angen uwchraddio'r meddalwedd iddo allu cyfrif hefyd nifer y bobl sydd yn nodi eu bod yn Gymry yn y blwch 'arall'. Bydd hyn yn caniatáu i bobl Cymru gael yr un cyfle â phobl yr Alban ac Iwerddon i gofrestru eu cenedligrwydd.*

Gobeithiwn edrych ymlaen at oes newydd yn hanes Cymru ac, yn benodol, gwleidyddiaeth Cymru. Etholwyd y Cynulliad i fod yn llais i Gymru ar gyfer y genhedlaeth hon. Mae pobl Cymru yn disgwyl inni heddiw leisio eu disgwyliadau y dylid rhoi'r cyfle iddynt



this opportunity to register their national identity. If Wales is truly a nation, its people must have the opportunity to record their nationality.

The Welsh Conservatives have been labelled as not being Welsh at heart, for leading the campaign against establishing the Assembly. We have turned a page and that is not only untrue, but it is history. Today, we are talking about fact. We are seeking to have the census forms overprinted with a Welsh tick box that allows everyone to have the clearest and easiest opportunity to record their national identity. I am grateful to Sarah Dickins of BBC Wales for giving me a copy of the intended form. Members will note that there is a large space on the form. It would be easy to have it overprinted, hence the cost need not be what has been ridiculously claimed in the press. I endorse Ieuan Wyn Jones's comments in terms of why cannot you be white or black Caribbean, Asian or Asian British, black or black British, Chinese or from another ethnic group and still be a Welshman or a Welshwoman?

The million-pound package announced by Tony Blair in October is worth almost half the amount estimated to be required to have all the census forms reprinted. However, the package will only fund an advertising campaign that cannot guarantee that all those who wish to register as Welsh will be able to do so. If people follow the advice in that campaign and make the extra effort to write 'Welsh' within the 'Other' option, they may find that their efforts were for nothing. 'Welsh' written in on the census form may not be read by the scanning machine. Len Cook, the national statistician and registrar general, has remarked that such entries may not be included in the vitally important digest of census figures.

It is vital that everyone should complete their census forms. The census is the only detailed social survey that includes everyone in the United Kingdom. The information that it provides will be used to ensure that services that future governments provide match the needs of the people. Overprinting the census

gofrestru eu hunaniaeth genedlaethol. Os yw Cymru yn genedl, rhaid rhoi'r cyfle i'w phobl gofnodi eu cenedligrwydd.

Labelwyd Ceidwadwyr Cymru fel plaid heb Gymru yn eu calonnau, am arwain yr ymgyrch yn erbyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi troi dalen ac mae hynny nid yn unig yn anwir, ond mae'n hanes. Heddiw, yr ydym yn sôn am ffaith. Yr ydym am i flwch ticio Cymreig gael ei drosargraffu ar ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad, sydd yn sicrhau'r cyfle cliraf a hawsaf i bawb gofnodi eu hunaniaeth genedlaethol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Sarah Dickins o BBC Cymru am roi copi imi o'r ffurflen arfaethedig. Bydd yr Aelodau yn sylwi bod gofod mawr ar y ffurflen. Byddai'n hawdd ei throsargraffu, felly ni fyddai angen i'r gost fod mor fawr â'r swm afresymol a honwyd yn y wasg. Cymeradwyaf sylwadau Ieuan Wyn Jones o ran pam na allwch fod yn Garibiaidd ddu neu wyn, Asiaidd neu Asiaidd Prydeinig, yn ddu neu'n Brydeinig du, yn Dsieineaidd neu o grŵp ethnig arall ac yn Gymro neu'n Gymraes ar yr un pryd?

Mae'r pecyn miliwn o bunnau a gyhoeddwyd gan Tony Blair ym mis Hydref yn werth bron hanner y swm yr amcangyfrifwyd y byddai ei angen i ailargraffu holl ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd y pecyn ond yn ariannu ymgyrch hysbysebu na all warantu y gall pawb sydd am gofrestru fel Cymry wneud hynny. Os bydd pobl yn dilyn y cyngor yn yr ymgyrch honno ac yn gwneud yr ymdrech ychwanegol i ysgrifennu 'Cymreig' o fewn yr opsiwn 'Arall' efallai y bydd eu hymdrechion yn ofer. Efallai na fydd y peiriant sganio yn darllen 'Cymreig' wedi'i ysgrifennu ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Mae Len Cook, yr ystadegydd gwladol a'r cofrestrydd cyffredinol, wedi nodi efallai na chaiff sylwadau o'r fath eu cynnwys yn y broses holl bwysig o grynhoi ffigurau'r cyfrifiad.

Mae'n hanfodol y dylai pawb gwblhau ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad. Y cyfrifiad yw'r unig arolwg cymdeithasol manwl sydd yn cynnwys pawb yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Defnyddir y wybodaeth a ddarperir ganddo i sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan lywodraethau'r dyfodol yn cyfateb ag anghenion y bobl. Bydd

forms with a Welsh tick box will cost far less than the advertising campaign. That is the clearest and easiest option to allow all those people who wish to register their national identity as Welsh to do so. We ask the Assembly to voice the feelings of the people of Wales by supporting this amendment and allowing them to have the same opportunity as the people of Scotland to register their nationality. If this Assembly stands for anything, it must be for hope for the future, and by declaring Welsh identity on this form we hope for and look forward to a confident future.

**Andrew Davies:** I propose amendment 2. Add new paragraph:

*While recognising the strength of opinion on this matter, the Assembly urges all people in Wales to fulfil their legal duty to complete the census form, acknowledging that undercounting of the population of Wales could have serious implications for core funding received by vital services in Wales over the coming decade; and calls on all political parties in Wales and all Assembly Members to encourage its completion.*

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am glad to have the opportunity to debate this matter again in the Assembly and that this time we have an opportunity to vote and, as Ieuan Wyn Jones said, to make our views and therefore the views of the nation clear. When I raised this in the short debate, I received a strong response from members of the public all over Wales saying that they were glad that I had done so. I received a particularly strong response from my own constituency, which gives the lie to the point that some people have been attempting to make that this is a matter of interest to the chattering classes only. Llanelli is an interesting place, but none of us would call it a haunt of the chattering classes. It is not only the *cyfryngis*—the media-types—who are concerned about this.

I was particularly interested in the response that I had from members of the black and ethnic minority communities. The comments from those communities highlighted for me

trosargraffu blwch ticio Cymreig ar ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad yn costio llawer llai na'r ymgyrch hysbysebu. Dyna'r opsiwn cliraf a hawsaf i ganiatáu i bawb sydd am gofrestru eu hunaniaeth genedlaethol fel Cymreig wneud hynny. Gofynnwn i'r Cynulliad leisio teimladau pobl Cymru drwy gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn a chaniatáu iddynt gael yr un cyfle â phobl yr Alban i gofrestru eu cenedligrwydd. Os saif y Cynulliad hwn dros unrhyw beth, gobaith ar gyfer y dyfodol ddylai hynny fod, a thrwy ddatgan hunaniaeth Gymreig ar y ffurflen hon gobeithiwn am ddyfodol hyderus ac edrychwn ymlaen ato.

**Andrew Davies:** Cynigiad welliant 2. Ychwaneger paragraff newydd:

*Er ein bod yn cydnabod cryfder y farn ar y mater hwn, mae'r Cynulliad yn annog holl bobl Cymru i gyflawni eu dyletswydd gyfreithiol i gwblhau ffurflen y cyfrifiad, gan gydnabod y gallai tangyfrif poblogaeth Cymru gael goblygiadau difrifol o safbwynt y cyllid craidd a dderbynnir gan wasanaethau allweddol yng Nghymru dros y degawd nesaf; ac mae'n galw ar bob plaid wleidyddol yng Nghymru a phob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad i annog pobl i'w chwblhau.*

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i drafod y mater hwn eto yn y Cynulliad a bod gennym gyfle i bleidleisio y tro hwn ac, fel y nododd Ieuan Wyn Jones, i leisio ein safbwyntiau ac felly safbwyntiau'r genedl. Pan godais y mater hwn yn y ddadl fer, cefais ymateb cryf gan aelodau'r cyhoedd ledled Cymru yn nodi eu bod yn falch fy mod wedi gwneud hynny. Derbyniais ymateb arbennig o gryf gan fy etholaeth i, sydd yn gwrth-ddweud y pwnt y mae rhai pobl wedi ceisio ei wneud mai mater o ddiddordeb i bobl ddiwylliannol yn unig yw hwn. Mae Llanelli yn lle diddorol, ond ni ellid ei alw'n un o hoff fannau'r bobl ddiwylliannol. Nid y cyfryngis yn unig sydd yn poeni am hyn.

Yr oedd yn arbennig o ddiddorol gennyf glywed yr ymateb a gefais gan aelodau o'r cymunedau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Amlygodd y sylwadau gan y cymunedau

one further reason that perhaps I did not fully express when I last spoke on this matter, about the importance of needing to be able to register one's Welshness. It has sometimes been said that some black and ethnic minority members of our communities feel more alienated from Welsh society since the establishment of the Assembly. The comments that I received suggest that for many black and ethnic minority citizens, the reverse is true. They feel strongly about their Welsh identity and they wish to have a way of expressing it. However, for some of those citizens, it may be the case that they do not feel fully part of our nation. That must be a source of great concern to us all.

We need the census data to enable us to measure how our black and ethnic minority fellow citizens identify now. If we find out that a higher percentage of people from, for example, ethnic minority backgrounds do not wish to express themselves as Welsh than the percentage of white citizens, we have a problem. As an equal opportunities body we would need to address that problem. We need to have this information to enable us to measure how people feel about themselves and about the new nation that we are trying to build, so that we can measure the impact of many of our equality measures in 10 years time.

The same is equally true in a different way for non-Welsh born citizens of Wales. Surely we want to find out how they identify with this project and whether they feel that they are part of it. There is no way on the current form for people who were not born here and do not speak Welsh to identify themselves as citizens of Wales. I am sure that we cannot find that acceptable.

The arguments about how all this has come about have been well rehearsed. The reasons why the Office for National Statistics did not accept the warnings that we all know it was given are important. There are lessons that we must learn from this. What matters now is what happens. One of the reasons why Plaid Cymru does not support the Conservative

hynny imi un rheswm arall na fynegais yn llawn, o bosibl, pan siaradais ar y mater hwn y tro diwethaf, sef pwysigrwydd yr angen i unigolion allu cofnodi eu Cymreictod. O bryd i'w gilydd nodir bod rhai aelodau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig ein cymunedau yn teimlo eu bod wedi'u hynysu ymhellach o gymdeithas Cymru ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Mae'r sylwadau a dderbyniais yn awgrymu bod y gwrthwyneb yn wir i lawer o ddinasyddion du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Teimlant yn gryf am eu hunaniaeth Gymreig a dymunant gael rhyw ffordd o'i mynegi. Fodd bynnag, i rai o'r dinasyddion hynny, efallai nad ydynt yn teimlo'n rhan lawn o'n cenedl. Mae'n rhaid bod hynny yn fater o bryder mawr inni i gyd.

Mae angen data'r cyfrifiad arnom i'n galluogi i fesur beth yw hunaniaeth ein cyddinasyddion du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn awr. Os canfyddwn fod canran uwch o bobl o gefndiroedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig, er enghraifft, nad ydynt yn dymuno mynegi eu bod yn Gymreig na chanran y dinasyddion gwyn, mae gennym broblem. Fel corff cyfle cyfartal byddai angen inni ymdrin â'r broblem honno. Mae angen y wybodaeth hon arnom i'n galluogi i fesur sut mae pobl yn teimlo amdanynt hwy eu hunain ac am y genedl newydd yr ydym yn ceisio ei hadeiladu, er mwyn inni allu mesur effaith llawer o'n mesurau cydraddoldeb ymhen 10 mlynedd.

Mae'r un peth yr un mor wir mewn ffordd wahanol ar gyfer dinasyddion Cymru nas ganwyd yng Nghymru. Onid ydym am ganfod sut maent yn uniaethu â'r prosiect hwn ac a ydynt yn teimlo'n rhan ohono? Nid oes unrhyw ffordd ar y ffurflen gyfredol i bobl nas ganwyd yma ac nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg i nodi eu hunaniaeth fel dinasyddion Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr na all hynny fod yn dderbyniol inni.

Yr ydym yn hen gyfarwydd â'r dadleuon am yr hyn a achosodd y sefyllfa. Mae'r rhesymau pam na dderbyniodd y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol y rhybuddion yr ydym yn gwybod iddi eu cael yn bwysig. Mae gwersi y mae'n rhaid inni eu dysgu o hyn. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yn awr yw beth sydd yn digwydd. Un o'r rhesymau pam nad yw Plaid Cymru yn

Party's amendment is that we think that it ties the hands of the Government too much. I would be happy with an additional page. Overprinting is probably the simplest method, but if an additional page would be simpler and cheaper I am happy to live with that, which is why we will not support the Conservative amendment.

This surely must be something that we can all agree that it is possible to change. It is not too late to put this right. I hope that colleagues in the Chamber will support this motion to enable it to be clearly expressed to the Government.

**Val Feld:** I am pleased to be able to follow on from Helen Mary because I was sitting here wondering whether to intervene. A number of the issues that I wanted to deal with relate directly to the things she was saying. I have no doubt that the issue of our identity is of fundamental importance to us all. We should not pretend that that is not the case. For me, learning about that identity, tackling it and making it visible—not just to ourselves but to people outside Wales—was always going to be a central part of the devolution process. It was a major reason why we needed devolution, because we had lived for so long in a country called 'and Wales': 'England and Wales' or 'Scotland and Wales'; it was invisible. Devolution gave us a voice for people in Wales. That is powerful and important and we are only just beginning to come to grips with it. We have only been here for a short time.

4:50 p.m

I have made my voice heard. I have written to the chief executive of the ONS. I have raised this issue in several places. I have spoken to my local Member of Parliament, we have discussed it in the Labour Party and in the Labour group. I am satisfied that we have made our voice heard. The question is whether we can go any further.

Devolution was also about the fact that the needs of Wales were being ignored. I am

cefnogi gwelliant y Blaid Geidwadol yw ein bod yn credu ei fod yn clymu dwylo'r Llywodraeth yn ormodol. Byddwn yn fodlon ar dudalen ychwanegol. Mwy na thebyg mai trosargraffu yw'r dull symlaf, ond pe byddai tudalen ychwanegol yn symlach ac yn rhatach byddwn yn fodlon byw gyda hynny, a dyna pam na fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr.

Dylai hyn fod yn rhywbeth y gallwn oll gytuno ei bod yn bosibl ei newid. Nid yw'n rhy hwyr i unioni'r cam. Gobeithiaf y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Siambr yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn i alluogi iddo gael ei fynegi'n glir i'r Llywodraeth.

**Val Feld:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael siarad ar ôl Helen Mary gan fy mod wedi bod yn eistedd yma yn tybio a ddylwn ymyrryd. Mae nifer o'r materion yr oeddwn am ymdrin â hwy yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'r pethau a nodwyd ganddi. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf bod ein hunaniaeth yn fater o bwysigrwydd sylfaenol inni i gyd. Ni ddylem esgus nad yw hynny'n wir. Yn bersonol, yr oedd dysgu am yr hunaniaeth honno, mynd i'r afael â hi a'i hamlygu—nid yn unig i ni ein hunain ond i bobl y tu allan i Gymru—bob amser am fod yn rhan ganolog o'r broses ddatganoli. Dyna un o'r prif resymau pam yr oedd angen datganoli, gan ein bod wedi byw cyhyd mewn gwlad o'r enw 'a Chymru': 'Lloegr a Chymru' neu 'Yr Alban a Chymru'; yr oedd yn anweledig. Yn sgîl datganoli rhoddwyd llais i bobl Cymru. Mae hynny'n bwerus ac yn bwysig ac megis dechrau yr ydym wrth fynd i'r afael â hyn. Dim ond am gyfnod byr y buom yma.

Lleisiais fy marn. Ysgrifennais at brif weithredwr yr ONS. Codais y mater mewn sawl lle. Siaradais â'm Haelod Seneddol lleol, trafodwyd y mater yn y Blaid Lafur ac yn y grŵp Llafur. Yr wyf yn fodlon bod ein llais wedi'i glywed. Y cwestiwn yn awr yw a allwn fynd ymhellach.

Yr oedd datganoli hefyd yn ymwneud â'r ffaith bod anghenion Cymru'n cael eu

satisfied that the noise that we have made so far means that those needs will not be ignored in the past—

**Ron Davies:** In the future.

**Val Feld:**—in the future. Thank you, Ron. Sorry, I am getting a little carried away.

It is important to consider what is on offer to us. I return to what Helen Mary said: she is absolutely right about Welsh identity and what it means to different people who live in Wales. We do not know enough about that. We do not know how people in north Wales feel or how people in south Wales, black people, white people and people who have come to live in Wales feel. Frankly, we will not get that information from a simple tick box on the census form. We will get it from a proper study of Welsh identity that will enable us to raise a whole range of questions that can tease out some of those complexities and enable us therefore to obtain substantive information to inform our future social and economic policy.

This brings me to the question about whether we have gone far enough. The great danger in going any further than this is that a campaign of disobedience builds up and then people do not complete the form. Then we do not have the critical socio-economic data that we need to plan this Assembly's activities.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up.

**Owen John Thomas:** There are three standpoints that politicians have taken on the issue of the census form in Wales. First, there is the arrogant and offensive attitude shown by those who insist on decrying and denying the rights of Welsh citizens of various ethnic backgrounds to describe themselves as Welsh. This group seeks to impose upon all Welsh citizens, and the citizens of England, the geo-political term, 'British'. Secondly, there are those who say, 'let us put the census form right, print an insert and allow the people of Wales to

hanwybyddu. Yr wyf yn fodlon bod y sŵn a wnaethom hyd yn hyn yn golygu na chaiff yr anghenion hynny eu hanwybyddu yn y gorffennol—

**Ron Davies:** Yn y dyfodol.

**Val Feld:**—yn y dyfodol. Diolch, Ron. Ymddiheuraf, yr wyf yn mynd i hwyl braidd.

Mae'n bwysig ystyried beth a gynigir inni. Dychwelaf at yr hyn a ddywedodd Helen Mary: mae yn llygad ei lle am hunaniaeth Gymreig a'i hystyr i wahanol bobl sydd yn byw yng Nghymru. Ni wyddom ddigon am hynny. Ni wyddom deimladau pobl yng ngogledd Cymru na theimladau pobl yn ne Cymru, pobl ddu, pobl wyn a phobl sydd wedi dod i fyw i Gymru. A bod yn onest, ni chawn y wybodaeth honno o flwch ticio syml ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Bydd angen astudiaeth gywir o hunaniaeth Gymreig a fydd yn ein galluogi i godi llu o gwestiynau a all ddatgelu rhai o'r cymhlethdodau hynny a'n galluogi felly i gael gwybodaeth bendant i lywio ein polisi cymdeithasol ac economaidd yn y dyfodol.

Daw hynny â mi at y cwestiwn a ydym wedi mynd yn ddigon pell. Y perygl mawr wrth fynd ymhellach na hyn yw y bydd ymgyrch anufudd-dod yn datblygu ac na fydd pobl wedyn yn llenwi'r ffurflen. Yna ni fydd gennym y data cymdeithasol-economaidd hanfodol sydd ei angen arnom i gynllunio gweithgareddau'r Cynulliad hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae tri safbwynt a gymerwyd gan wleidyddion o ran ffurflen y cyfrifiad yng Nghymru. Yn gyntaf, mae'r agwedd ffroenuchel a sarhaus a ddangosir gan y rheini sydd yn mynnu bychanu a gwrthod hawliau dinasyddion Cymru o amrywiol gefndiroedd ethnig i ddisgrifio eu hunain fel Cymry. Mae'r grŵp hwn am orfodi'r term daearyddol-wleidyddol 'Prydeinig' ar bob dinesydd Cymreig, a dinasyddion Lloegr. Yn ail, mae'r rheini a ddywed 'gadewch inni gywiro ffurflen y cyfrifiad, argraffu nodyn ychwanegol a galluogi i bobl Cymru ateb y

answer the questions on ethnicity in line with their own instincts'. It appears that the cost of such an exercise, including printing and processing, would not exceed one tenth of the expenditure on the Welsh census. It is a reasonable and practical proposal, and I stress that it is an opportunity for the National Assembly to show that it can act successfully on behalf of Welsh interests. However, there is a third standpoint on this matter. That is where people voice their disapproval of the unfortunately-worded form, but then proceed to trot out a succession of excuses when presented with each means of correcting that mistake.

This is by no means the most important issue that this Assembly must address, but it is a litmus test to show whether, as a national institution, we have the determination to tell Westminster to put matters right. Today we heard Rhodri's reply to my question about making St David's Day a Welsh bank holiday. He wrote to Mr Murphy, but he has not replied yet. Therefore, we do not know whether he is pressing the Westminster Government—*yn pwysu ar y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan*. He tells me that he has written twice. That is fine, but it is not good enough. We have been elected to the Assembly. This national institution has been founded to serve the people of Wales and here we are writing to this chap Murphy and he is not responding and doing what we tell him to do. We should demand that he does so. If you show Westminster that you are serious, it might take notice of you. If you keep on knocking on the door with a sponge, it will not even hear you.

**Peter Black:** I have given much thought to identity recently. To a large extent, we are defined by our upbringing, by our family and by the community in which we live. That community can be defined, in the narrowest of senses, as the street in which we live or, much wider, as the country or even the continent of which we form a part.

I was born and brought up in England, as were both my parents. However, in terms of ancestry, I carry a large portion of Scottish blood, a fair smattering of Irish blood and some Welsh blood. My grandmother was

cwestiynau ar ethnigrwydd yn unol â'u greddf'. Ymddengys na fyddai cost ymarfer o'r fath, gan gynnwys argraffu a phrosesu, yn fwy na degfed o'r gwariant ar y cyfrifiad yng Nghymru. Mae'n gynnig rhesymol ac ymarferol, a phwysleisiaf ei fod yn gyfle i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddangos y gall weithredu'n llwyddiannus ar ran buddiannau Cymreig. Fodd bynnag, ceir trydydd safbwynt ar y mater, sef lle mae pobl yn lleisio eu hanfodlonrwydd ar eiriad anffodus y ffurflen, ond yn mynd ati i gyflwyno cyfres o esgusodion ar ôl clywed pob dull o unioni'r cam hwnnw.

Nid dyma'r mater pwysicaf y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad ymdrin ag ef o bell ffordd, ond mae'n brawf litmws i ddangos a yw'r penderfyniad gennym, fel sefydliad cenedlaethol, i orchymyn i San Steffan unioni'r cam. Heddiw clywsom ymateb Rhodri i'm cwestiwn am wneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl y banc yng Nghymru. Ysgrifennodd at Mr Murphy, ond nid yw wedi ateb eto. Felly, ni wyddom a yw'n pwysu ar y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan ai peidio. Dywed wrthyf ei fod wedi ysgrifennu ddwywaith. Iawn, ond nid yw'n ddigon da. Fe'n hetholwyd i'r Cynulliad. Sefydlwyd y sefydliad cenedlaethol hwn i wasanaethu pobl Cymru a dyma ni yn ysgrifennu at y dyn Murphy yma a hwnnw'n methu ag ymateb a gweithredu ar ein cais. Dylem fynnu hynny. Os dangoswch i San Steffan eich bod o ddifrif, efallai y cymer sylw ohonoch. Os parhewch i guro ar y drws â sbwng, ni fydd yn eich clywed hyd yn oed.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf wedi rhoi cryn ystyriaeth i hunaniaeth yn ddiweddar. I raddau helaeth, fe'n diffinnir gan ein magwraeth, gan ein teulu a chan y gymuned yr ydym yn byw ynddi. Gellir diffinio'r gymuned honno, yn ei hystyr gulaf, fel y stryd yr ydym yn byw ynddi neu, yn ehangach, fel y wlad neu hyd yn oed y cyfandir yr ydym yn rhan ohono.

Cefais fy ngeni a'm magu yn Lloegr, ac felly hefyd fy rhieni. Fodd bynnag, yn nhermau fy nghyndeidiau, mae cyfran fawr o'n gwaed yn dod o'r Alban, cyfran sylweddol o'r Iwerddon a rhywfaint o Gymru. Yr oedd fy mam-gu yn

from a Welsh-speaking family based in north Wales. I have lived in Wales for 22 years and I identify most closely with communities in Wales to the extent that I would place a tick in the box that defined me as Welsh, if I were to have the opportunity to do so on next year's census form. However, it is not that simple, as I also think of myself as being part of the greater community of Britain and as a European. We all belong to several communities, all of which are interrelated and interlinked. Identity lies in part of each of those communities.

I support the need for a Welsh tick box on next year's census form, as do the other Welsh Liberal Democrats, because it is right that people should be able to record their identity. Although the census is, essentially, an instrument to gather useful statistics to inform public policy, it does so by asking us to define ourselves in terms of family, employment, education and status. Such a definition cannot be complete unless we are also allowed to define ourselves in terms of our community and ethnicity.

However, we must be careful in how we conduct this campaign. The National Assembly does not have the power to raise its own finances through taxation, despite the fact that some of us believe that it should have that ability. Our money comes from the UK Government in accordance with a formula that is based entirely on population. With high levels of poverty and deprivation in many parts of Wales, with severe problems of ill-health, poor housing, educational underachievement and economic inactivity, we need every penny that we can get. We cannot put that at risk. That is why, no matter what the outcome of this campaign, we must urge people to complete the census form. That is why I hope that the Assembly will support the campaign for a Welsh tick box but also support the Labour and Liberal Democrat amendment. Without that amendment, we are in danger of adding our voices to a campaign that will undermine everything that we have tried to achieve since May 1999.

hanu o deulu Cymraeg o ogledd Cymru. Yr wyf wedi byw yng Nghymru ers 22 mlynedd ac yr wyf yn uniaethu agosaf â chymunedau yng Nghymru i'r graddau y byddwn yn rhoi tic yn y blwch a oedd yn fy niffinio fel Cymro pe rhoddid y cyfle imi wneud hynny ar ffurflen cyfrifiad y flwyddyn nesaf. Fodd bynnag, nid yw mor syml â hynny, gan fy mod hefyd yn ystyried fy mod yn rhan o gymuned ehangach Prydain ac Ewrop. Yr ydym oll yn perthyn i sawl cymuned, a phob un ohonynt yn rhyngberthnasol ac yn rhyng-gysylltiedig. Mae rhan o'n hunaniaeth ymhob un o'r cymunedau hynny.

Cefnogaf yr angen am flwch ticio Cymreig ar ffurflen cyfrifiad y flwyddyn nesaf, fel y gwna'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymreig eraill, gan ei bod yn iawn i bobl allu cofnodi eu hunaniaeth. Er bod y cyfrifiad, yn ei hanfod, yn offeryn i gasglu ystadegau defnyddiol i lywio polisi cyhoeddus, gwna hynny drwy ofyn inni ddiffinio ein hunain yn nhermau teulu, cyflogaeth, addysg a statws. Ni all diffiniad o'r fath fod yn gyflawn oni chawn hefyd ddiffinio ein hunain yn nhermau ein cymuned a'n hethnigrwydd.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus o'r ffordd y cynhaliwn yr ymgyrch hon. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol y pŵer i godi ei gyllid ei hun drwy drethiant, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod rhai ohonom o'r farn y dylai fod ganddo'r gallu hwnnw. Daw ein harian gan Lywodraeth y DU yn unol â fformwla sydd yn gyfan gwbl seiliedig ar boblogaeth. Gyda lefelau uchel o dlodi ac amddifadedd mewn sawl rhan o Gymru, gyda phroblemau difrifol o ran salwch, tai gwael, tangyflawni addysgol ac anweithgarwch economaidd, mae angen pob ceiniog y gallwn ei chael arnom. Ni allwn beryglu hynny. Dyna pam, waeth beth fydd canlyniad yr ymgyrch hon, y mae'n rhaid inni erfyn ar bobl i gwblhau ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Dyna pam y gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r ymgyrch dros flwch ticio Cymreig ond y bydd hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Heb y gwelliant hwnnw, yr ydym mewn perygl o ychwanegu ein lleisiau at ymgyrch a fydd yn tanseilio popeth y buom yn ceisio ei gyflawni ers Mai 1999.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It has been said many times that this issue was brought to the attention of politicians and the Office for National Statistics far too late. I will quote to you from a letter written by John Walter Jones, the chief executive of the Welsh Language Board, to *The Western Mail* on 7 November:

‘I would like to place on record, and not for the first time, that this is not the case:

1. The issue was raised by officials of the Welsh Language Board in a meeting with the ONS on 14 May 1998.’

Therefore, the issue was brought to their attention and a political decision was taken not to include the tick box. Let us be clear about the implications of this. We are not talking about one form. I will quote to you from a letter received by two of my constituents from the Higher Education Statistics Agency:

‘The ethnicity field in the HESA student record uses the categories specified in the 1991 census of population to allow national comparative statistics to be calculated . . . HESA is revising its ethnicity field for the academic year 2001-02 to align with the new ethnicity categories in the 2001 census of population.’

Every comparative form for the next 10 years will follow the same categories as the census for population. On every form, the people of Wales will not be allowed the opportunity to state their nationhood. We, in cool Cymru, are encouraged to wake up every morning and thank the Lord that we are Welsh, but a political decision has been taken not to allow us to register that fact on the census form and on every other comparative form that will follow for the next 10 years. That is the situation as far as we are concerned. It is a political decision and we, as the political forum of Wales, must state our case clearly. We want that change. We want them to accept that they made a mistake and to change the situation. We want to be allowed to have that right to state our nationhood on this form, and on every other form that will be used as a comparative form against it. It is a simple matter of political fact. The buck stops with the Cabinet on the fifth floor of Crickhowell House. We must have political lead from this administration to take to Westminster and to tell them that this wrong

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dywedwyd sawl gwaith ei bod yn llawer rhy hwyr pan dynnwyd sylw gwleidyddion a'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol at y mater hwn. Dyfynnaf lythyr ichi a ysgrifennwyd gan John Walter Jones, prif weithredwr Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, i *The Western Mail* ar 7 Tachwedd:

Felly, tynnwyd eu sylw at y mater a chymerwyd penderfyniad gwleidyddol i beidio â chynnwys y blwch ticio. Gadewch inni fod yn glir am oblygiadau hyn. Nid ydym yn sôn am un ffurflen. Dyfynnaf ichi o lythyr a dderbyniwyd gan ddau o'm hetholwyr o'r Asiantaeth Ystadegau Addysg Uwch:

Bydd pob ffurflen gymharol ar gyfer y 10 mlynedd nesaf yn dilyn yr un categorïau â'r cyfrifiad poblogaeth. Ar bob ffurflen, ni roddir y cyfle i bobl Cymru ddatgan eu cenedligrwydd. Cawn ein hannog, yn cŵl Cymru, i ddefro bob bore a diolch i Dduw ein bod yn Gymry, ond gwnaethpwyd penderfyniad gwleidyddol i beidio â chaniatáu inni nodi'r ffaith honno ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad a phob ffurflen gymharol a fydd yn dilyn am y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Dyna'r sefyllfa fel y'i deallwn. Penderfyniad gwleidyddol ydyw a rhaid inni, fel fforwm gwleidyddol Cymru, ddatgan ein hachos yn glir. Yr ydym am weld y newid hwnnw. Yr ydym am iddynt dderbyn eu bod wedi gwneud camgymeriad a newid y sefyllfa. Yr ydym am gael yr hawl i ddatgan ein cenedligrwydd ar y ffurflen hon, ac ar bob ffurflen arall a ddefnyddir fel ffurflen gymharol yn ei herbyn. Mae'n fater syml o ffaith wleidyddol. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb ar y Cabinet ar bumed llawr Tŷ Crughywel. Rhaid inni gael arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol gan y weinyddiaeth hon i fynd i San Steffan a gorchymyn iddynt unioni'r cam.



must be righted.

5:00 p.m.

**Christine Gwyther:** My name is Christine Gwyther, and I make my confession. On 16 August 2000, at the Pembrokeshire County Show, I signed a Plaid Cymru petition deploring the lack of a Welsh tick box on the 2001 census form. I signed it as a proud Welshwoman because I was incensed that the ONS was not listening to the people of Wales. Like my Labour colleagues in Wales, I kept a weather eye on the negotiations that Rhodri Morgan undertook throughout the summer. My good wishes went with him in his efforts to secure an amendment to the form. Ultimately, Rhodri secured a commitment to find out more about the ethnicity of people in Wales in a credible, modern and enlightened manner, which we are told the Scottish form does not include. Well done for that, Rhodri. It was an imperfect conclusion, as I am sure we would all agree. However, that was the conclusion.

It has been a funny summer. At about the same time that the census tick box campaign took off, we heard of the brilliant outcome of the comprehensive spending review, which has fed into a Welsh Labour-led policy programme for the next few years, and the first Objective 1 project commitments. A poor comprehensive spending review would have been cataclysmic for Wales. The lack of a Welsh tick box is not. Call me, like the Joneses—Ieuan Wyn and Helen Mary—a timid patriot, but I will not burn, pulp, shred or swallow my 2001 census form. I will spend my energies ensuring that my constituency benefits as it should from the Labour-led policies that we can now push forward as a result of this year's CSR. However, I have a long memory. This tick box omission was not just a cock-up, it was an insult. It should never happen again, and I will continue working within the Labour party, and within the law, for justice for Wales, because we are worth it.

**Glyn Davies:** I have watched this debate

**Christine Gwyther:** Fy enw i yw Christine Gwyther, a hoffwn gyffesu. Ar 16 Awst 2000, yn Sioe Sir Benfro, llofnodais ddeiseb gan Blaid Cymru yn gresynu nad oedd blwch ticio Cymreig ar ffurflen cyfrifiad 2001. Fe'i llofnodais fel Cymraes falch gan fy mod wedi fy nghythrudo nad oedd y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yn gwrandao ar bobl Cymru. Fel fy nghyd-Aelodau Llafur yng Nghymru, cadwais lygad barcud ar y negodiadau a gynhaliwyd gan Rhodri Morgan yn ystod yr haf. Anfonais fy nymuniadau da iddo yn ei ymdrechion i sicrhau gwelliant i'r ffurflen. Yn y pen draw, llwyddodd Rhodri i sicrhau ymrwymiad i gael mwy o wybodaeth am ethnigrwydd pobl yng Nghymru mewn modd credadwy, modern a hyddysg, na chaiff ei gynnwys ar ffurflen yr Alban mae'n debyg. Llongyfarchiadau am hynny, Rhodri. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem oll yn cytuno nad oedd yn gasgliad perffaith. Fodd bynnag, dyna oedd y casgliad.

Bu'n haf rhyfedd. Tua'r un pryd â sefydlu ymgyrch blwch ticio'r cyfrifiad, clywsom am ganlyniad ardderchog yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, a fwydodd i raglen polisi o dan arweiniad Plaid Lafur Cymru ar gyfer yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, a'r ymrwymadau prosiect Amcan 1 cyntaf. Byddai adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant gwael wedi bod yn gataclysmiaidd i Gymru. Nid felly diffyg blwch ticio Cymreig. Cewch fy ngalw i, fel y Joneses—Ieuan Wyn a Helen Mary—yn wladgarwr di-asgwrn-cefn, ond ni fyddaf yn llosgi, malu, torri neu lyncu ffurflen cyfrifiad 2001. Defnyddiaf fy egni i sicrhau bod fy etholaeth yn elwa fel y dylai o'r polisïau Llafur y gallwn bellach eu datblygu o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant eleni. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf gof fel eliffant. Nid camgymeriad yn unig oedd hepgor y blwch ticio, yr oedd yn sarhad. Ni ddylai ddigwydd byth eto, a pharhaf i weithio o fewn y blaid Lafur, ac o fewn y gyfraith, i gael cyfiawnder i Gymru, gan ein bod yn ei haeddu.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwyliais y ddadl hon am

about the absence of a Welsh tick box on next year's census form develop all summer. I have found it difficult to understand the sheer inadequacy of the administration in trying to deal with it. It is a straightforward issue on which we could have all agreed. Our First Minister could have shown some leadership, done himself some good and earned the Assembly a few brownie points. However, we have seen the usual, aimless meandering with a half-hearted acknowledgement that there should have been a Welsh tick box, but no commitment to do anything about it. We needed the First Secretary to stick up for Wales, to knock on the door of his pal at 10 Downing Street and demand that he put it right, or he, Rhodri Morgan, would consider that the Prime Minister had let Wales down, and not for the first time.

This issue is straightforward. We all think that there should be a Welsh tick box. Most Labour AMs agree with that. However, the real issue that we are debating today is the willingness of the administration in this Assembly to stand up to the Labour Government at Westminster and to fight for the interests of the Assembly and for Wales. My impression of the administration since day one, whether led by Alun Michael or Rhodri Morgan, is that it is unwilling to do that. It is almost as if the administration thinks that giving Wales an Assembly was sufficient and the job is done. The job is not done. My party was opposed to setting up the Assembly, but we accepted the referendum result. We sought election, and we are working to make this Assembly work. We need a change of attitude and a determination to stick up for Wales.

I do not know how significant this debate about the tick box is. For some people, it seems trivial. On the other hand, it is significant in that it asks each of us, not so much as politicians, but as individuals, how we see ourselves. This self-observation matters to the Welsh. My first territorial identity was as 'Glyn the Bank', not because I am rich, but because of where I was born. My first really powerful identity was with Montgomeryshire, where I became leader of

absenoldeb blwch ticio Cymreig ar ffurflen cyfrifiad y flwyddyn nesaf yn datblygu drwy'r haf. Yr wyf wedi'i chael hi'n anodd deall diffyg llwyr y weinyddiaeth wrth geisio ymdopi â hi. Mae'n fater syml y gallem oll fod wedi cytuno arno. Gallai ein Prif Weinidog fod wedi dangos rhywfaint o arweinyddiaeth, er clod iddo'i hun tra'n cynyddu poblogrwydd y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, gwelsom yr un hen ddiffyg penderfyniad di-nod gyda chydabyddiaeth ddifater y dylai fod blwch ticio Cymreig wedi'i gynnwys, ond dim ymrwymiad i weithredu. Yr oedd angen i'r Prif Weinidog gefnogi Cymru, curo ar ddrws ei gyfaill yn 10 Stryd Downing a mynnu iddo unioni'r cam, neu byddai ef, Rhodri Morgan, yn ystyried bod y Prif Weinidog wedi siomi Cymru, ac nid am y tro cyntaf.

Mae'r mater yn syml. Yr ydym oll o'r farn y dylai fod blwch ticio Cymreig. Cytuna'r rhan fwyaf o ACau Llafur â hynny. Fodd bynnag, y mater gwirioneddol a drafodwn heddiw yw parodrwydd y weinyddiaeth yn y Cynulliad hwn i wynebu'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan a brwydro dros fuddiannau'r Cynulliad a Chymru. Fy argraff i o'r weinyddiaeth o'r cychwyn cyntaf, boed o dan arweiniad Alun Michael neu Rhodri Morgan, yw nad yw'n barod i wneud hynny. Mae bron fel petai'r weinyddiaeth yn credu ei bod yn ddigonol bod gan Gymru Gynulliad a bod y gwaith felly ar ben. Nid yw'r gwaith ar ben. Yr oedd fy mhlaid yn erbyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad, ond derbyniasom ganlyniad y refferendwm. Gofynasom am etholiad, ac yr ydym yn gweithio i wneud i'r Cynulliad hwn weithio. Mae angen newid agwedd arnom a phenderfyniad i gadw ochr Cymru.

Ni wn pa mor arwyddocaol yw'r ddadl hon am y blwch ticio. I rai pobl, ymddengys yn ddibwys. Ar y llaw arall, mae'n arwyddocaol gan ei bod yn gofyn i bob un ohonom, nid cymaint fel gwleidyddion, ond fel unigolion, ein barn amdanom ni ein hunain. Mae'r hunan-arsylwi hwn yn bwysig i'r Cymry. Fy hunaniaeth diriogaethol gyntaf oedd fel 'Glyn y Banc', nid am fy mod yn gyfoethog, ond o ganlyniad i'r lle y'm ganwyd. Yr oedd fy hunaniaeth bwerus gyntaf yn Sir Drefaldwyn,

the local council. On a national level, it is, I suppose, politically correct for me to say that I see myself as both Welsh and British and want to tick two boxes. However, whenever I have to choose, I always choose Welsh. To me, there is nothing inherently un-Conservative about that. So, come on, Rhodri, for the sake of Owain Glyndwr, Lloyd George, Aneurin Bevan and Mrs Thatcher, go out and get us our tick box.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yn anarferol, ceisïaf gefnogi'r cynnig a gwelliant 2, oherwydd fy mod yn siomedig ynghylch diffyg blwch tic Cymreig. Cefnogaf hefyd yr alwad ar i bawb ystyried pwysigrwydd llenwi'r ffurflen er mwyn sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei hariannu'n deg. Pe baem yn gwrando'n awr ar y drafodaeth yr wythnos diwethaf ar benderfyniad Sefydliad Addysg, Gwyddoniaeth a Diwylliant y Cenhedloedd Unedig i roi statws treftadaeth byd i Flaenafon, credaf y byddai hynny yn cynnig esboniad o'n teimladau dwfn ynghylch hawl y Cymry i ddewis rhoi tic mewn blwch yn dwyn y disgrifiad 'Cymreig'.

Soniodd Aelod ar ôl Aelod am bwysigrwydd ein hanes a'n hetifeddiaeth ac am fywydau ein cyfamau a'n cyndadau. Yn wir, yr oedd yn drafodaeth liwgar am yr hyn y mae'n ei olygu i lawer ohonom i fod yn Gymry ac yn Brydeinwyr.

I will support the motion, but not the party political motivation that drives the party of Welsh nationalism. To me, this is an issue as much for the non-politically active as for we politicians. I share the regret on the omission of a Welsh tick box voiced by the First Minister, whose Welshness is a characteristic that has earned him the support and respect of our nation. Indeed, my membership of and belief in the Labour Party, the natural party of Wales, is synonymous with being Welsh. I was brought up within a Welsh socialist family, which is very different to a Welsh nationalist one. My mother and father first met on an unemployed workers' march. The Labour Party fought to improve our standard of living and to defend our right to a Welsh identity.

lle deuthum yn arweinydd y cyngor lleol. Ar lefel genedlaethol, tybiaf ei bod yn wleidyddol gywir imi nodi fy mod yn ystyried fy mod yn Gymreig ac yn Brydeinig ac yr hoffwn dicio dau flwch. Fodd bynnag, o orfod dewis, dewisaf Cymreig bob amser. I mi, nid yw hynny'n wrth-Geidwadol mewn unrhyw ffordd. Felly, dewch, Rhodri, er mwyn Owain Glyndŵr, Lloyd George, Aneurin Bevan a Mrs Thatcher, ewch a mynnwch ein blwch ticio.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Unusually, I will try to support both the motion and amendment 2, because I am disappointed by the lack of a Welsh tick box. I also support the call for everyone to consider the importance of filling in the form to ensure that Wales is funded fairly. If we were to listen now to last week's discussion on the United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organisation's decision to give world heritage status to Blaenavon, I believe that it would offer an explanation of our deep feelings on the right of Welsh people to choose to put a tick in a box carrying the description 'Welsh'.

Member after Member spoke about the importance of our history and heritage and about the lives of our ancestors. Indeed, it was a colourful discussion about what it means to many of us to be Welsh and British.

Cefnogaf y cynnig, ond nid cymhelliant pleidiau gwleidyddol sydd yn llywio plaid cenedlaetholdeb Cymru. I mi, mae hwn yn fater yr un mor berthnasol i bobl nad ydynt yn wleidyddol weithgar ag i ni'r gwleidyddion. Rhannaf hefyd y siom ynghylch hepgor blwch ticio Cymreig a leisiwyd gan ein Prif Weinidog, y mae ei Gymreictod yn nodwedd sydd wedi ennill cefnogaeth a pharch ein cenedl iddo. Yn wir, mae fy aelodaeth a'm cred yn y Blaid Lafur, plaid naturiol Cymru, yn gyfystyr â bod yn Gymreig. Fe'm magwyd o fewn teulu sosialaidd Cymreig, sydd yn wahanol iawn i deulu cenedlaetholgar Cymreig. Cyfarfu fy mam a'm tad am y tro cyntaf ar orymdaith i weithwyr di-waith. Brwydrodd y Blaid Lafur i wella safon ein bywydau ac i amddiffyn ein hawl i hunaniaeth

Gymreig.

Therefore, it is no wonder that I consider myself to be SWS—socialist, Welsh and selective—about what I will support today. I believe passionately that Labour is the party for Wales. However, I believe just as passionately that my constituents and the people of Wales deserve a Welsh tick box.

**Alun Pugh:** There are plenty of things to get angry about in this place. You can be angry that the UK is the fourth richest country in the world, but that we educate far too many of our children in buildings that are not fit for purpose. You can get angry about the fact that the richest live seven years longer than the poorest in our society, and you can get justifiably angry about the fact that people are harassed because of the colour of their skin. These things happen every day in Wales, and in my constituency. While our society is disfigured by inequality and injustice, I refuse to get too angry about the lack of a tick box. I will happily write 'Welsh, British and European' on my form.

The lack of a tick box is insensitive and I recognise that many will be offended by it. However anyone who thinks that this is the number one problem facing Wales needs to get out more. This is the last time that we will face this problem. I am confident that the Welsh parliament will legislate to correct this in 2011, the time of the next census, and that the next census form will be a model of equal opportunities practice. There is a long and honourable history of civil protest and disobedience in Wales, but a bonfire of census forms could seriously damage every pupil, patient and pensioner in Wales. So, fill it in, write Welsh in, and send it in.

5:10 p.m.

**Delyth Evans:** Croesawaf y drafodaeth hon heddiw. Bûm yn gweithio'n galed y tu ôl i'r llenni ynghyd ag eraill yn fy mhlaid—Rhodri yn fwy na neb—i geisio newid y sefyllfa gwbl annerbyniol hon. Mae'n dristwch mawr

Felly, nid yw'n syndod fy mod yn ystyried fy hun yn sosialydd, yn Gymreig ac yn ddetholgar ynglŷn â'r hyn a gefnogaf heddiw. Credaf yn frwd mai Llafur yw'r blaid i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, credaf yr un mor frwd fod fy etholwyr a phobl Cymru yn haeddu blwch ticio Cymreig.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae digon o bethau i'ch cythruddo yn y lle hwn. Gallwch gythruddo mai'r DU yw'r bedwaredd wlad fwyaf cyfoethog yn y byd, ond ein bod yn addysgu llawer gormod o'n plant mewn adeiladau anaddas. Gallwch gythruddo am y ffaith bod y bobl fwyaf cyfoethog yn byw saith mlynedd yn hwy na'r tlotaf yn ein cymdeithas, a gallwch gythruddo, a hynny am reswm da, am fod pobl yn dioddef aflonyddwch oherwydd lliw eu croen. Mae'r pethau hyn yn digwydd bob dydd yng Nghymru, ac o fewn fy etholaeth i. Tra bod ein cymdeithas wedi'i hanharddu gan anghydraddoldeb ac anghyfiawnder, gwrthodaf gythruddo'n ormodol am ddiffyg blwch ticio. Byddaf yn fwy na pharod i nodi 'Cymreig, Prydeinig ac Ewropeaidd' ar fy ffurflen.

Mae'r diffyg blwch ticio yn ansensitif a chydabyddaf y bydd llawer wedi'u sarhau ganddo. Fodd bynnag mae angen i unrhyw un sydd o'r farn mai dyma'r broblem fwyaf sydd yn wynebu Cymru ddeffro. Dyma'r tro olaf y byddwn yn wynebu'r broblem hon. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd senedd Cymru yn deddfu i gywiro'r camgymeriad hwn yn 2011, adeg y cyfrifiad nesaf, ac y bydd ffurflen y cyfrifiad nesaf yn fodel ar gyfer arfer cyfle cyfartal. Mae hanes hir ac anrhydeddus o brotest ac anufudd-dod sifil yng Nghymru, ond gallai coelcerth o ffurflenni cyfrifiad gael effaith andwyol ar bob disgybl, claf a phensiynwr yng Nghymru. Felly, llenwch y ffurflen, nodwch Cymreig arni, a'i dychwelyd.

**Delyth Evans:** I welcome this debate today. I have been working hard behind the scenes, along with other Members of my party—Rhodri more than anyone—to try to change this completely unacceptable situation. It

gennyf nad yw'r Prif Weinidog yn Llundain, un y mae gennyf feddwl uchel ohono, wedi gweld y ffordd yn glir i wrthdroi'r penderfyniad.

Nid oedd dirmyg bwriadol yn y ffordd y lluniwyd y ffurflen hon yn y lle cyntaf, ond unwaith y daeth y cam yn amlwg a'r niwed i nifer o bobl Cymru yn glir, dylid bod wedi darganfod ffordd i newid y sefyllfa yn gynt. Y mae'n anodd deall sut y gall biwrocraatiaeth ac anawsterau technegol gael eu rhoi o flaen dyhead naturiol pobl i allu mynegi eu cenedligrwydd ar ffurflen.

Gobeithiaf nad yw'n rhy hwyr ac y bydd llais unedig y Cynulliad yn gallu dylanwadu lle y mae lleisiau unigolion wedi methu hyd yn hyn. Nid wyf yn or-obeithiol ond mae'n bwysig bod y neges glir hon yn cyrraedd Llundain. Dylem annog pobl i gwblhau'r ffurflen, a gallwn fod yn ffyddiog, a chael rhyw fath o gysur o'r ffaith na all hyn ddigwydd eto.

**Huw Lewis:** The controversy concerning the Welsh tick box has created a frisson of excitement for at least one Welsh newspaper and for the bulk of the Plaid Cymru membership. However, I think that the rest of the Welsh population looks on fairly bemused. In the course of this so-called national debate, I have not received one letter, phone call nor have I been stopped in the street by a constituent—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'There's a postal strike'.]

There are no problems at Merthyr post office. I have not been lobbied by anyone on this issue who was not a member of Plaid Cymru or the Independent Wales Party. The much trumpeted, slow-hand-clap at the Millennium Stadium at the Wales versus South Africa rugby match turned out to be a slow, no-way from Welsh rugby fans. For those reasons, I approach this issue with a degree of scepticism as to whether we should be devoting Assembly time to discuss it.

For those reasons, I also look for an alternative motivation for those who seek to raise the profile of this issue in this Chamber. We do not need to look too far for the barely

greatly saddens me that the Prime Minister, someone of whom I have a high opinion, has not seen fit to overturn this decision.

No offence was intended in the way that this form was initially designed, but as soon as the omission became obvious and the hurt felt by many Welsh people became clear, a way should have been found to change the situation earlier. It is difficult to understand how bureaucracy and technical difficulties can be placed before people's natural wishes to be able to express their nationality on a form.

I hope that it is not too late and that the Assembly's united voice can influence where individual voices have failed so far. I am not too hopeful, but it is important that this clear message reaches London. We should encourage people to complete their forms, and we can be confident, and take some comfort from the fact that this cannot happen again.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r ddadl ynghylch y blwch ticio Cymreig wedi creu gwefr o gyffro i un papur newydd yng Nghymru o leiaf ac i'r rhan fwyaf o aelodau Plaid Cymru. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod gweddill poblogaeth Cymru yn gwyllo mewn cryn benbleth. Yn ystod y ddadl genedlaethol hon, ni dderbyniais unrhyw lythyrau, galwadau ffôn na chael fy stopio ar y stryd gan etholwr—[AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Mae streic bost'.]

Nid oes unrhyw broblemau yn swyddfa bost Merthyr. Nid oes unrhyw un wedi fy lobïo ynglŷn â'r mater hwn nad oedd yn aelod o Blaid Cymru neu Blaid Annibynnol Cymru. Gwrthododd dilynwyr rygbi Cymru gymryd rhan yn yr ymgyrch curo dwylo araf y bu sôn mawr amdani yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn y gêm rhwng Cymru a De Affrica. Am y rhesymau hynny, yr wyf yn amau i raddau a ddylem fod yn neilltuo gymaint o amser y Cynulliad i drafod y mater hwn.

Am y rhesymau hynny, edrychaf hefyd am gymhelliant gwahanol i'r rheini sydd yn ceisio codi proffil y mater hwn yn y Siambr hon. Nid oes angen inni edrych yn rhy bell cyn canfod

hidden agenda. Instead of being positive about this, what we have once again is an attempt to replace the normal run of political debate about left versus right, progressive versus conservative with the politics of identity—the politics of Plaid Cymru. That kind of politics will hijack any issue, whether of substance or confection, and replace any meaningful debate of its worth with a murder mystery whodunnit entitled ‘Who done Wales down’. This shining example of nationalist politics is just that—a confection. Part of a long series of bandwagons clambered on by Plaid Cymru that all have the same purpose: to build resentment among the people of Wales against the very idea of Britishness. They troop one by one through the television and radio studios of Wales describing the latest snub, today’s insult and the latest outrage to Wales emerging from Westminster. That is set aside from the fact that Labour in Westminster delivered devolution, Objective 1 and the platform, from which the nationalists could, if they wished, make a positive contribution to the progress of Wales.

I despair at their inability to do so and I despair at the contributions of spokespeople from other political parties who join Plaid Cymru on the rocky ground of the politics of identity rather than the politics of real people’s real lives. Listening to them, you would assume that they were some secret Whitehall department operating in the shadows of the department of anti-Welsh affairs, the apex of a great Anglo-saxon conspiracy to down the Welsh nation at every turn.

The politics of identity will make no difference to the lives of people in Wales except to promote resentment.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up. I allow Members a few seconds to wind up.

**Nick Bourne:** This may not be the most important or urgent issue facing Wales. However, that does not mean that it is not important or urgent. There are other issues that we could debate, but Plaid Cymru has

yr agenda gudd. Yn lle bod yn gadarnhaol, yr hyn sydd gennym unwaith eto yw ymdrech i ddisodli trefn arferol dadl wleidyddol ynghylch y chwith yn erbyn y dde, datblygol yn erbyn ceidwadol â gwleidyddiaeth hunaniaeth—gwleidyddiaeth Plaid Cymru. Bydd y math hwnnw o wleidyddiaeth yn herwgipio unrhyw fater, boed yn fater o sylwedd neu’n gymysgedd, a disodli gwerth unrhyw drafodaeth ystyrion ag antur dirgelwch llofruddiaeth o’r enw ‘Pwy laddodd Cymru’. A dyna yw’r enghraifft wych hon o wleidyddiaeth cenedlaetholwyr—cymysgedd. Rhan o gyfres hir o achosion y dydd a fabwysiadwyd gan Plaid Cymru yn anelu at yr un nod: datblygu drwgdeimlad ymhlith pobl Cymru tuag at y syniad o Brydeinrwydd. Ânt bob yn un drwy stiwdios teledu a radio Cymru yn disgrifio’r sarhad diwethaf a’r cythruddiad diweddaraf yn erbyn Cymru gan San Steffan. Nid ystyrir y ffaith mai’r Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan a gyflwynodd ddatganoli, Amcan 1 a’r llwyfan lle gallai cenedlaetholwyr, pe dymunant, wneud cyfraniad pwysig tuag at gynnydd Cymru.

Yr wyf yn colli amynedd â’u hanallu i wneud hynny ac â chyfraniadau llefarwyr o bleidiau gwleidyddol eraill sydd yn ymuno â Phlaid Cymru ar dir anwadal gwleidyddiaeth hunaniaeth yn hytrach na gwleidyddiaeth bywydau go iawn pobl go iawn. O wrando arnynt, fe dybiech eu bod yn aelodau o ryw adran gyfrin o Whitehall yn gweithredu yng nghysgodion adran materion gwrth-Gymreig, uchafbwynt cynllwyn Eingl-Sacsonaidd mawr i drechu’r Cymry ar bob cyfle.

Ni wnaiff gwleidyddiaeth hunaniaeth unrhyw wahaniaeth i fywydau pobl yng Nghymru heblaw am hybu drwgdeimlad.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben. Caniatâf rai eiliadau i Aelodau ddirwyn i ben.

**Nick Bourne:** Efallai nad hwn yw un o’r materion pwysicaf neu’r un sydd â’r mwyaf o frys sydd yn wynebu Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny’n golygu nad yw’n bwysig nac yn fater brys. Mae materion eraill y gallem eu

chosen this as the subject for its minority party debate. I understand that it has every right to do so.

Few issues are black and white. However, this issue seems absolutely clear to me. As we have a National Assembly, it seems patently absurd to have a census in our country where people cannot indicate that they are Welsh. It is as straightforward as that. It is extraordinary that some people are proposing excuses as to why we have not got a Welsh tick box.

We have devolution, which was delivered because we have a Labour Government. However, when we came to the National Assembly, many of us thought that it would be more than a rubber stamp for everything that comes out of Westminster. If it is to be meaningful, we must say, on occasion, that we want to do things differently here. My party had a part to play in making Rhodri Morgan First Secretary, as the post was then called, in February. I was unsure as to whether we were doing our party any good. I thought that Rhodri would be more independent and would stick up for Wales. Even at this eleventh hour, I hope that he will do so.

I agree with Owen John that this is a litmus test. It is not the most important issue facing Wales, but it is a litmus test. Are we going to make a difference? What has happened to the Westminster-Cardiff access? I suspect that there will be little for Wales in the Queen's Speech. What is happening? Why do we have no impact in Westminster? Why are we not punching in Westminster to ensure that there is a Welsh dimension to the Queen's Speech and that we have a Welsh tick box? When Rhodri became First Minister there was much goodwill and optimism throughout Wales. I hope that he will address this when he speaks.

I must tell Huw Lewis that it is not only nationalists who feel strongly about this. Before the postal dispute stopped mail getting through, I had a substantial postbag from people of all political parties and those who did not support any political party, who

trafod, ond mae Plaid Cymru wedi dewis y pwnc hwn fel pwnc ei dadl plaid leiafrifol. Deallaf fod ganddi bob hawl i wneud hynny.

Prin yw'r materion sydd yn ddu a gwyn. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys y mater hwn yn hollol glir imi. Gan fod gennym Gynulliad Cenedlaethol, ymddengys yn hollol wirion ein bod yn cynnal cyfrifiad yn ein gwlad lle na all pobl ddynodi eu bod yn Gymreig. Mae mor syml â hynny. Mae'n syndod bod ambell un yn cynnig esgusodion dros pam nad oes gennym flwch ticio Cymreig.

Cawsom ddatganoli, a gyflwynwyd am fod gennym Lywodraeth Lafur. Fodd bynnag, pan ddaethom i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yr oedd llawer ohonom o'r farn y byddai'n fwy na stamp rwber ar gyfer popeth a ddaw o San Steffan. Os yw am fod yn ystyrlon, rhaid inni ddatgan, o bryd i'w gilydd, ein bod am wneud pethau'n wahanol yng Nghymru. Chwaraeodd fy mhlaid ei rhan wrth ethol Rhodri Morgan yn Brif Ysgrifennydd, teitl y swydd ym mis Chwefror. Nid oeddwn yn siŵr a fyddai hynny o fudd i'n plaid. Yr oeddwn o'r farn y byddai Rhodri yn fwy annibynnol ac y byddai'n cadw ochr Cymru. Hyd yn oed yn yr unfed awr ar ddeg hon, gobeithiaf y gwnaiff hynny.

Cytunaf ag Owen John mai prawf litmws yw hwn. Nid dyma'r mater pwysicaf sydd yn wynebu Cymru, ond mae'n brawf litmws. A ydym yn mynd i wneud gwahaniaeth? Beth a ddigwyddodd i'r mynediad San Steffan-Caerdydd? Yr wyf yn amau na fydd llawer i Gymru yn Araith y Frenhines. Beth sydd yn digwydd? Pam na chawn unrhyw ddylanwad yn San Steffan? Pam nad ydym yn pwyso ar San Steffan i sicrhau bod dimensiwn Cymreig i Araith y Frenhines a bod gennym flwch ticio Cymreig? Pan etholwyd Rhodri yn Brif Weinidog yr oedd llawer o ewyllys da a gobaith ledled Cymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn ymdrin â hyn wrth siarad.

Rhaid imi ddweud wrth Huw Lewis nad cenedlaetholwyr yn unig sydd yn teimlo'n gryf am hyn. Cyn i'r anghydfod post atal post rhag cael ei ddsbarthu, derbyniais ohebiaeth sylweddol gan bobl o bob plaid wleidyddol a phobl nad oeddent yn cefnogi unrhyw blaid

agreed with the need for a separate Welsh tick box—

**Huw Lewis:** I believe that people are more grown up about this. I agree that there is a problem regarding the Welsh tick box. I would like to see one on the census form. However, the problem was made in Wales. We did not ask for a tick box. Let us be grown up enough to say that. We did not ask for a tick box during the consultation.

**Nick Bourne:** That may be the case. Huw may also like to acknowledge that Denzil Davies and Allan Rogers, who are Members of Parliament for the Labour Party in Westminster, played a dishonourable part in not giving us a tick box.

The Conservative group will support the motion. We will abstain on amendment 2, not because we favour civil disobedience, as we do not, but because it is dismissive. The amendment starts by saying ‘while recognising’, as if that is the end of the story and we are giving up on the battle for a Welsh tick box. We cannot agree to that. We despair at this administration’s lack of impact on Westminster. We hope that that will change and that, even at this eleventh hour, the First Minister will have something constructive to say on this.

**The First Minister:** I want to press the case for amendment 2 and indicate the Labour Party’s view on Ieuan’s motion. Had the motion been worded ‘there should have been a Welsh tick box’, we would not have amended it and it would have been adopted with united support. I have been advised that it is impractical to claim now that we can still secure changes to meet the widespread demand for a Welsh tick box. Our statisticians advise me that the idea given by many Members that a Welsh tick box can be achieved at this late hour by adding a loose insert page is not practical. This is a household census. One form will be distributed per head of household for households of up to five people. There would be hopeless confusion if there were an addendum for any number of people in a

wleidyddol, a oedd yn cytuno â’r angen i gael blwch ticio Cymreig ar wahân—

**Huw Lewis:** Credaf fod pobl yn fwy aeddfed am hyn. Cytunaf fod problem ynghylch y blwch ticio Cymreig. Hoffwn weld blwch ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Fodd bynnag, yng Nghymru y cynhyrchwyd y broblem. Ni ofynasom am flwch ticio. Gadewch inni fod yn ddigon aeddfed i ddweud hynny. Ni ofynasom am flwch ticio yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori.

**Nick Bourne:** Efallai’n wir. Efallai yr hoffai Huw hefyd gydnabod i Denzil Davies ac Allan Rogers, sydd yn Aelodau Seneddol o’r Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan, chwarae rhan waradwyddus wrth beidio â rhoi blwch ticio inni.

Bydd y grŵp Ceidwadol yn cefnogi’r cynnig. Byddwn yn ymatal ar welliant 2, nid am ein bod o blaid anufudd-dod sifil, gan nad ydym, ond am ei fod yn ddiystyriol. Dechreuau’r gwelliant drwy nodi ‘er ein bod yn cydnabod’, fel petai hynny yw diwedd y stori a’n bod yn rhoi’r gorau i frwydro dros flwch ticio Cymreig. Ni allwn gytuno â hynny. Yr ydym yn siomedig â diffyg dylanwad y weinyddiaeth hon ar San Steffan. Gobeithiwn y bydd hynny’n newid ac y bydd gan y Prif Weinidog rywbeth adeiladol i’w nodi, hyd yn oed ar yr unfed awr ar ddeg hon.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Hoffwn bwysleisio’r achos dros welliant 2 a nodi barn y Blaid Lafur ar gynnig Ieuan. Pe bai’r cynnig wedi’i eirio ‘dylai blwch ticio Cymreig fod wedi ei gynnwys’, ni fyddem wedi ei ddiwygio a byddai wedi cael ei fabwysiadu gyda chefnogaeth unfrydol. Fe’m cynghorwyd ei bod yn anymarferol honni yn awr y gallwn barhau i sicrhau newidiadau i fodloni’r galw helaeth am flwch ticio Cymreig. Fe’m cynghorwyd gan ein hystadegwyr nad yw’r syniad a gyflwynwyd gan sawl Aelod y gellir cyflawni blwch ticio Cymreig mor hwyr yn y dydd drwy ychwanegu dalen atodol rydd yn ymarferol. Cyfrifiad o gartrefi yw hwn. Dosberthir un ffurflen i bob pennaeth cartref ar gyfer cartrefi o hyd at bum person. Byddai dryswch anobeithiol pe cyflwynwyd ychwanegiad ar gyfer unrhyw nifer o bobl



household without any reference to it in the main census form. The results would be liable to a wide and unacceptable margin of error. However, I am a politician, not a statistician. Neither I nor anyone else in the Chamber has any way of testing whether that is true. However, that is the advice that I have received from the statisticians.

**David Davies** *rose*—

5:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I cannot give way, as time is short. I am told that overprinting, which the Conservatives mentioned, is incompatible with machine reading. I am a politician and not a statistician. Overprinting is a nice idea, but our statisticians say that it is not practical or compatible with machine reading.

Let us return to the issue of timing. I accept that I am one of the guilty people, because I am a Member of Parliament as well as being an Assembly Member. I could have raised these issues if I had attended frequently and if I had noticed the problem or it had been drawn to my attention. Ieuan, Dafydd Wigley, Ron Davies and John Marek are also guilty. Cynog might be in the clear, because he had left the House of Commons by then. However, the rest of us had our opportunity, but we did not avail ourselves of it. Peers of the realm also had the opportunity when these regulations were laid, but they did not avail themselves of it either. We are all equally guilty for not having spotted this. We did not spot it until the implications became clear after the debate in the Scottish Parliament, which changed their census form to include a Scottish question. That was on 15 June. Deryk Williams, census manager for Wales, raised this issue in a meeting with our officials in the middle of July, after the new national statistician, Len Cook, had started work. I raised the issue with Len Cook. I wrote to him and met him in early August to press the issue for a Welsh tick box to give us parity with Scotland. Unfortunately, production had already begun on the giant census form sheets and printing was only days away. On 29 July, work had begun on

mewn cartref heb gyfeirio ato o gwbl ym mhrif ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Byddai'r canlyniadau yn agored i gamgymeriadau eang ac annerbyniol. Fodd bynnag, gwleidydd ydwyf, nid ystadegydd. Nid oes gennyf i nag unrhyw un arall yn y Siambr unrhyw ffordd o brofi a yw hynny'n wir. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r cyngor a dderbyniais gan yr ystadegwyr.

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni allaf ildio, gan fod amser yn brin. Dywedir wrthyf nad yw trosargraffu, fel y crybwyllwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr, yn gydnaws â darllen drwy beiriant. Gwleidydd ydwyf ac nid ystadegydd. Mae trosargraffu yn syniad hwylus, ond dywed ein hystadegwyr nad yw'n ymarferol nac yn gydnaws â darllen drwy beiriant.

Gadewch inni ddychwelyd at amseru. Derbyniaf fy mod yn un o'r bobl euog, gan fy mod yn Aelod Seneddol yn ogystal ag Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Gallwn fod wedi codi'r materion hyn pe bawn wedi mynychu'n rheolaidd a phe bawn wedi sylwi ar y broblem neu petai rhywun wedi tynnu fy sylw ati. Mae Ieuan, Dafydd Wigley, Ron Davies a John Marek hefyd yn euog. Efallai bod Cynog yn ddieuog gan ei fod wedi gadael Tŷ'r Cyffredin erbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd cyfle gan y gweddill ohonom, ond ni fanteisio arno. Yr oedd cyfle hefyd gan Arglwyddi'r deyrnas pan gyflwynwyd y rheoliadau hyn, ond ni wnaethont hwythau fanteisio arno ychwaith. Yr ydym oll yr un mor euog am beidio â gweld hyn. Ni chafodd ei amlygu tan i'r goblygiadau ddod i'r amlwg ar ôl y ddadl yn Senedd yr Alban, a newidiodd ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad i gynnwys cwestiwn am yr Alban. Digwyddodd hynny ar 15 Mehefin. Cododd Deryk Williams, rheolwr y cyfrifiad yng Nghymru, y mater hwn mewn cyfarfod gyda'n swyddogion ganol mis Gorffennaf, ar ôl i'r ystadegydd gwladol newydd, Len Cook, ddechrau gweithio. Codais y mater gyda Len Cook. Ysgrifennais ato a chyfarfûm ag ef ddechrau Awst i bwysleisio bod angen blwch ticio Cymreig i roi cysondeb â sefyllfa'r Alban. Yn anffodus, yr oedd y gwaith cynhyrchu eisoes

the Welsh language version and the day after my meeting with Len Cook, work began on the English language version. That is how it happened. I do not believe that that was a conspiracy, as many people have alleged today. It was simply a failure to recognise the post-devolution reality in relation to the question about ethnic identity. The forms were designed in 1997 and 1998 when people thought they were asking questions about ethnic origins. That is the issue that we face today. We have received the advice that it is not practical to change the form. However, we can express our regrets and anger that this census, the last of its kind, was designed pre-devolution, but will be implemented post-devolution.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Given that there is overwhelming opposition to the fact that there is no Welsh tick box—and I fully understand your argument—do you agree that the way forward is for the four party leaders in Wales to write to Tony Blair expressing the fact that this Assembly has come to a decision on the issue?

**The First Minister:** You always try this tactic because you like to pretend that you are more important than you are, Ieuan. [*Laughter.*] I am sorry about that. If you want to play to the gallery, then you must learn the script. You have not had the advantage of receiving advice from our statisticians, which says that it is not practical to change the form. If you accept that and want to rephrase your motion to say that it should have included a Welsh tick box that is fine. We can all agree on that. However, it is important that we do not lose out on the Barnett formula by condoning or encouraging people not to fill in the census form. It is vital to all of us and vital to public services in Wales.

**Cynog Dafis:** Croesawaf farn unfrydol y ddadl hon. Croesawaf hefyd gryfder argyhoeddiad nifer o'r Aelodau. Mae hynny'n galonogol. Gwrandewais gyda chryngydymdeimlad ar eiriau Gwenda Thomas a'r ffordd yr uniaethodd, yn ei hanes teuluol ei

yn mynd rhagddo ar daflenni enfawr ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad a dim ond diwrnodau oedd tan iddynt gael eu hargraffu. Ar 29 Gorffennaf, dechreuodd y gwaith ar y fersiwn Cymraeg a'r diwrnod ar ôl fy nghyfarfod â Len Cook, dechreuodd y gwaith ar y fersiwn Saesneg. Dyna sut y digwyddodd. Ni chredaf y bu unrhyw gynllwyn, fel y mae llawer o bobl wedi honni heddiw. Methiant syml i gydnabod y gwirionedd ôl-ddatganoli mewn perthynas â'r cwestiwn am hunaniaeth ethnig ydoedd. Cynlluniwyd y ffurflenni ym 1997 a 1998 pan oedd pobl o'r farn eu bod yn holi cwestiynau am darddiad ethnig. Derbyniom gyngor nad yw'n ymarferol newid y ffurflen. Fodd bynnag, gallwn gyfleu ein siom a'n dichter y cynlluniwyd y cyfrifiad hwn, yr olaf o'i fath, cyn-datganoli, ond y'i gweithredir yn y cyfnod ôl-ddatganoli.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** O gofio bod gwrthwynebiad eithriadol i'r ffaith nad oes blwch ticio Cymreig—a deallaf eich dadl yn llwyr—oni chytunwch mai'r ffordd ymlaen yw i arweinwyr y pedair plaid yng Nghymru ysgrifennu at Tony Blair yn mynegi'r ffaith fod y Cynulliad hwn wedi gwneud penderfyniad ar y mater?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych bob amser yn rhoi cynnig ar y dacteg hon am eich bod yn hoffi esgus eich bod yn bwysicach nac yr ydych, Ieuan. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am hynny. Os ydych am chwarae i'r galeri, dylech ddysgu'r sgript. Ni chawsoch y fantais o gael cyngor gan ein hystadegwyr, sydd yn nodi nad yw'n ymarferol newid y ffurflen. Os derbyniwch hynny a'ch bod am aileirio eich cynnig i nodi y dylai fod wedi cynnwys blwch ticio Cymreig mae hynny'n iawn. Gallwn oll gytuno ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig na chollwn fformwla Barnett wrth ganiatáu neu annog pobl i beidio â llenwi ffurflenni'r cyfrifiad. Mae'n hanfodol inni i gyd ac yn hanfodol i wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

**Cynog Dafis:** I welcome the unanimity of this debate. I also welcome the strength of conviction of many Members. That is encouraging. I listened with great empathy to Gwenda Thomas's words and the way she identified, in her own family history,

hunan, Gymreictod â'r mudiad Llafur. Yr wyf yn rhannu'r un gwreiddiau ac yr wyf innau yr un mor falch â hithau o hanes y mudiad Llafur yng Nghymru yn yr ugeinfed ganrif. Mae gennym dreftadaeth y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddi, treftadaeth yr ydym am ei mynegi drwy arwyddo ein bod yn Gymry yn y cyfrifiad hwn.

Croesawaf yn arbennig eiriau Delyth Evans. Dangosodd Val Feld yn ogystal bwysigrwydd cwestiwn hunaniaeth Gymreig i'r antur yr ydym wedi ymgymryd â hi gyda sefydlu'r Cynulliad hwn. Gwnaeth Peter Black gyfraniad gwerthfawr drwy esbonio cefndiroedd cymhleth y rhai sydd yn eu dynodi eu hunain yn Gymry. Mae hynny'n wych. Gwnaeth Christine Gwyther yr un fath. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar eiriau William Graham hefyd.

Mae eraill wedi defnyddio'r ddadl hon i greu anghytgord. Ein bwriad oedd osgoi hynny a dyna pam fod geiriad ein cynnig yn cyfeirio at y dyfodol yn hytrach na'r gorffennol. Nid oeddem am ddannod i neb am y gorffennol, dim ond datgan bwriad clir ynglŷn â'r dyfodol. Mae'n drueni i Huw Lewis ddefnyddio'r ddadl hon i ymosod ar Plaid Cymru ac ar genedlaetholdeb Cymreig. Yr oedd yn ymosodiad ar yr egwyddor o hunaniaeth genedlaethol. Mae'n drueni bod hynny wedi sarnu'r ddadl. Trueni arall yw ei bod yn ymddangos fel pe bai Rhodri Morgan, Prif Weinidog Cymru, wedi rhoi'r ffidil yn y to. Gallem fod wedi cael blwch tic mor ddiweddar â Gorffennaf neu Awst. Mater o ewyllys wleidyddol yn unig ydoedd erioed a hynny ydyw yn awr hefyd. Gwrthodaf gredu nad oes modd goresgyn problemau technegol, biwrocraataidd a chyfrifiadurol er mwyn rhoi i bobl Cymru yr hyn y maent yn ei alw amdano. Gobeithiaf y caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn gydag arddeliad.

Yr ydym wedi esbonio pam na allwn gefnogi gwelliant 1 er bod gennyf y parch mwyaf i'r cymhelliad y tu ôl iddo. Teimlwn y byddai'n gorgymhlethu pethau ac y byddai'n anodd ar lawer ystyr i ddeall ei berwyl.

Credwn fod gwelliant 2 yn ddianghenrhaid,

Welshness with the Labour movement. I share the same roots and I am as proud as she is of the Labour movement's history in Wales in the twentieth century. We have a heritage of which to be proud, a heritage which we want to express by signifying that we are Welsh in this census.

I particularly welcome Delyth Evans's words. Val Feld also showed the importance of the question of Welsh identity to the venture we have undertaken with the establishment of this Assembly. Peter Black made a valuable contribution, by explaining the complexity of the backgrounds of those who designate themselves as Welsh. That is splendid. Christine Gwyther did the same. I also listened closely to William Graham's words.

Others have used this debate to create discord. Our intention was to avoid that and that is why the wording of our motion refers to the future rather than the past. We did not want to reproach anyone for the past, we wished only to express a clear intention for the future. It is a shame that Huw Lewis used this debate to attack Plaid Cymru and Welsh nationalism. It was an attack on the principle of Welsh identity. It is a shame that that has tarnished the debate. It is also a shame that Rhodri Morgan, the First Minister, seems to have thrown in the towel. We could have had a Welsh tick box as late in the day as July or August. It was always a matter of political will and it still is. I refuse to believe that there is no way of overcoming technical, bureaucratic and computer problems to give the people of Wales what they are calling for. I hope that this motion will be accepted with conviction.

We have explained why we cannot support amendment 1 although I have the utmost respect for its motive. We feel that it would overcomplicate matters and that it would be difficult in many respects to understand its purpose.

We believe that amendment 2 is unnecessary

gan nad oes neb yn y Cynulliad wedi argymhell gwrthod cymryd rhan yn y cyfrifiad. Er hyn, yr ydym yn derbyn eu dadleuon ar hynny a sylweddolwn y gall hyd yn oed 10,000 neu 20,000 o bobl sydd yn gwrthod llenwi ffurflen y cyfrifiad effeithio'n sylweddol ar y gyllideb Gymreig. Yr ydym yn derbyn hynny. Ni theimlwn fod y gwelliant hwn yn angenrheidiol ond fe'i cefnogwn yn ysbryd cytgord a chydweithio yn hytrach na rhoi rheswm i unrhyw un beidio â chefnogi'r cynnig.

Mae hi'n bwysig bod y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio yn cael ei dderbyn gydag arddeliad. Byddai'n werth anfon cofnod o lawer o'r hyn a lefarwyd heddiw i Lundain. Hoffwn hepgor rhai rhannau ond byddai'n rhaid cynnwys y cyfan, mae'n siŵr. Hoffwn anfon y cofnod yn ei gyfanrwydd i Lundain a'i ddehongli fel hyn: mae pobl Cymru drwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi llefaru'n gryf o blaid y cyfle i ddatgan eu cenedligrwydd yn y cyfrifiad ac mae hwn yn ddiwyddiad o'r pwys mwyaf o ran hunan-ddiffiniad a chasglu gwybodaeth; mae pobl Cymru wedi llefaru, felly a ydych yn fodlon mynd yn erbyn barn unedig pobl Cymru drwy eu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a thrwy filoedd o ddatganiadau unigol? Rhaid inni ennill y frwydr hon ac mae modd inni ei hennill drwy sefyll gyda'n gilydd a siarad gydag un llais.

as nobody in the Assembly has encouraged non-participation in the census. Despite this, we accept their arguments on that and we realise that even if 10,000 or 20,000 people refuse to fill in the census form, this could have a significant effect on the Welsh budget. We accept that. We do not feel that this amendment is necessary but we will support it in the spirit of unity and co-operation rather than give anyone a reason not to support the motion

It is important that the amended motion is adopted with conviction. It would be worth sending a record of much of what has been said today to London. I would like to omit some sections but we would probably have to include it all. I would like to send the record in its entirety to London and interpret it as follows: the people of Wales through the National Assembly have spoken strongly for the opportunity to declare their nationality in the census and this is an important event in terms of self-definition and data collection; the people of Wales have spoken, therefore are you willing to fly in the face of the united opinion of the people of Wales as expressed through their National Assembly and through thousands of individual declarations? We must and we can win this battle by standing together and speaking with one voice.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44.*

*Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 44.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison

Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 44, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 0 .  
Gwelliant 2: For 44, Abstain 7, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained.

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Motion adopted.*

Amended motion:

*The National Assembly believes that the 2001 census form should contain a tick box for people to express their Welsh identity.*

*While recognising the strength of opinion on this matter, the Assembly urges all people in Wales to fulfil their legal duty to complete the census form, acknowledging that undercounting of the population of Wales could have serious implications for core funding received by vital services in Wales over the coming decade; and calls on all political parties in Wales and all Assembly Members to encourage its completion.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn credu y dylai ffurflen cyfrifiad 2001 gynnwys blwch ble gall pobl fynegi eu hunaniaeth Gymreig.*

*Er ein bod yn cydnabod cryfder y farn ar y mater hwn, mae'r Cynulliad yn annog holl bobl Cymru i gyflawni eu dyletswydd gyfreithiol i gwblhau ffurflen y cyfrifiad, gan gydnabod y gallai tangyfrif poblogaeth Cymru gael goblygiadau difrifol o safbwynt y cyllid craidd a dderbynnir gan wasanaethau allweddol yng Nghymru dros y degawd nesaf; ac mae'n galw ar bob plaid wleidyddol yng Nghymru a phob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad i annog pobl i'w chwblhau.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amended motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine

Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
**Davies, Ron**  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion adopted.*

### **Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22 Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 22**

**The Minister for Assembly Business** **Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod  
**(Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 26:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn gweithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 26:*

*i. considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 1*

*i. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1*

*November 2000;*

*ii. approves the revisions to Standing Order No. 22 contained in the document entitled 'Proposed Changes to Standing Order 22' laid in the Table Office on 27 November 2000;*

*iii. resolves that the revisions shall take effect immediately.*

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes cyfraniad ar y cynnig, felly galwaf am bleidlais. Bydd rhaid cael mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig.

*Tachwedd 2000;*

*ii. yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22 yn y ddogfen 'Newid Arfaethedig i Reol Sefydlog 22' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Tachwedd 2000;*

*iii. yn penderfynu y dylai'r diwygiadau ddod i rym ar unwaith.*

**The Presiding Officer:** There is no contribution on the motion, therefore I call for a vote. A two-thirds majority is needed to adopt the motion.

*Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne



Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**The Presiding Officer:** Before we close proceedings, I extend the Assembly's sympathy to our colleague Peter Black, who lost his father this week. Please accept our deepest sympathy, Peter.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn inni ddod â'r trafodion i ben, estynnaf gydymdeimlad y Cynulliad i'n cyd-Aelod Peter Black, a gollodd ei dad yr wythnos hon. Derbyniwch ein cydymdeimlad dwysaf, Peter.

Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion heddiw. Diolch yn fawr.

That brings our proceedings today to a close. Thank you.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.32 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.32 p.m.*