



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 5 Tachwedd 2002**

**Tuesday 5 November 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

3	Pwynt o Drefn <i>Point of Order</i>
3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog <i>Questions to the First Minister</i>
26	Pwyntiau o Drefn <i>Points of Order</i>
27	Datganiad ar y Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles <i>Statement on the Health and Well-being Partnership Council</i>
34	Cynnig Trefniadol <i>Procedural Motion</i>
35	Datganiad Busnes <i>Business Statement</i>
38	Pwynt o Drefn <i>Point of Order</i>
40	Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog <i>Changes to Standing Orders</i>
47	Cymeradwyo Gwelliannau i Reolau Sefydlog <i>Approval of Amendments to Standing Orders</i>
51	Cynllun Gweithredu Arloesedd <i>Innovation Action Plan</i>
78	Polisiau Diogelwch rhag Tân <i>Fire Safety Policies</i>

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambra. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Point of order. I will put the record straight with regard to my answer to a supplementary question by Peter Black during Plenary last week. I stated that the crime reduction partnerships would be able to make use of an additional £2.5 million from the Home Office over the next three years to combat drug related problems. In fact, the additional resources announced by the Home Secretary on his recent visit to Wales will be given to the three police forces that cover south and mid Wales for the same purpose via Operation Tarian, rather than the crime reduction partnerships. The funding given will be £0.5 million for the current and the next two financial years. I wrote to Peter Black as soon as the mistake became apparent to me; I have placed a copy of that letter in the Library. I apologise to the Assembly for the error.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the First Minister.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf am gywiro gwall mewn perthynas â'm hateb i gwestiwn atodol gan Peter Black yn ystod y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedais y byddai'r partneriaethau gostwng troseddu'n gallu defnyddio £2.5 miliwn yn ychwanegol oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gartref dros y tair blynedd nesaf i ymladd problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau. Mewn gwirionedd, bydd yr adnoddau ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ar ei ymweliad diweddar â Chymru'n cael eu rhoi i'r tri heddlu sy'n gyfrifol am y De a'r Canolbarth i'r un diben drwy Ymgyrch Tarian, yn hytrach na'r partneriaethau gostwng troseddu. Caiff swm o £0.5 miliwn ei roi ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon a'r ddwy nesaf. Ysgrifennais at Peter Black cyn gynted ag y daeth y camgymeriad yn amlwg imi; yr wyf wedi gosod copi o'r llythyr hwnnw yn y Llyfrgell. Ymddiheuraf i'r Cynulliad am y gwall.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog.

### Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

#### Budd-dal Tai Housing Benefit

**Q1 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on whether one of the new pathfinder schemes for housing benefit will be introduced in Wales? (OAQ19890)

**The First Minister:** The Secretary of State for Work and Pensions has invited 10 local authorities to become pathfinders for the new standard rate housing benefit scheme. I am pleased to inform the Assembly that Conwy County Borough Council was one of the local authorities invited.

**C1 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad yngylch a fydd un o'r cynlluniau braenaru newydd ar gyfer budd-dal tai yn cael ei gyflwyno yng Nghymru? (OAQ19890)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau wedi gwahodd 10 awdurdod lleol i fraenaru'r tir ar gyfer y cynllun budd-dal tai newydd ar gyfradd safonol. Yr wyf yn falch o hysbysu'r Cynulliad mai Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy oedd un o'r awdurdodau lleol a gafodd wahodiad.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Reforms will initially apply to the deregulated private rental sector. However, in the event of reforms being rolled out to cover the whole country and all rented social housing, will you assure the Assembly that procedures will be in place for a partnership approach with Welsh local government, so that the policies contained within the National Assembly's housing strategy will be protected?

**The First Minister:** If the pilot scheme is successful, massive changes can be anticipated with regard to the balance between paying housing benefit to tenants and giving assistance directly to local authorities or other social landlords to build or convert houses for rental purposes. That would mean a change, going back to the origins of the Thatcher revolution 20 years ago, when there was a shift from tenants paying local authorities as landlords and other registered social landlords to paying housing benefit to tenants so that they could pay rent to private landlords. I am not saying that that shift will take place. However, if the pilot scheme is successful, it could herald enormous changes, which would have to be dealt with in partnership with local authorities.

**William Graham:** The largest element of identified fraud in Welsh local authorities continues to be housing benefit fraud, which amounted to some £5 million last year. Will you join the Department for Work and Pensions in directing all local authorities in Wales to adopt the verification framework?

**The First Minister:** I am not an expert on the individual methods used to try to reduce fraud. However, I am glad that you have drawn the issue of fraud to the attention of the Assembly. That is why the Department for Work and Pensions is considering the introduction of these massive changes. Housing benefit is difficult to control, not so much in Wales, but in certain metropolitan areas of England. That is one of the huge weaknesses of the housing benefit scheme. However well a local authority tries to administrate the scheme, it is difficult to reduce fraud. Any methods that can keep

**Gwenda Thomas:** Caiff y diwygiadau eu cymhwys o'n gyntaf at y sector rhent preifat a ddadreoleiddiwyd. Fodd bynnag, os estynnir y diwygiadau i gynnwys yr holl wlad a'r holl dai cymdeithasol sydd ar osod, a wnewch chi sicrhau'r Cynulliad y bydd mesurau ar waith i sicrhau ein bod yn gweithredu mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol Cymru, fel y bydd y polisiau a geir yn strategaeth dai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cael eu hamddiffyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os bydd y cynllun peilot yn llwyddiannus, gellir disgwl newidiadau aruthrol o ran y cydbwysedd rhwng talu budd-dal tai i denantiaid a rhoi cymorth yn uniongyrchol i'r awdurdodau lleol neu landlordiaid cymdeithasol eraill i godi neu addasu tai er mwyn eu gosod ar rent. Byddai hynny'n golygu newid, gan fynd yn ôl at ddechreuadau chwyldro Thatcher 20 mlynedd yn ôl, pan fu newid yn yr arfer o denantiaid yn talu awdurdodau lleol fel landlordiaid a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig eraill, i dalu budd-dal tai i denantiaid fel y gallent dalu rhent i landlordiaid preifat. Nid wyf yn dweud y bydd y newid hwnnw'n digwydd. Er hynny, os bydd y cynllun peilot yn llwyddiannus, gallai ragflaenu newidiadau anferth, y byddai'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol.

**William Graham:** Mae'r rhan helaethaf o'r twyll a ganfyddir gan awdurdodau lleol Cymru yw twyll yn ymneud â budd-dal tai, a oedd bron yn £5 miliwn y llynedd. A wnewch chi ymuno â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensynau i gyfarwyddo holl awdurdodau lleol Cymru i fabwysiadu'r fframwaith gwirio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn arbenigwr ar y dulliau unigol a ddefnyddir i geisio lleihau twyll. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi tynnu mater twyll i sylw'r Cynulliad. Dyna pam y mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensynau'n ystyried cyflwyno'r newidiadau anferth hyn. Mae budd-dal tai'n anodd ei reoli, nid yn gymaint yng Nghymru, ond mewn rhai ardaloedd metropolitan yn Lloegr. Dyna un o wendidau mawr y cynllun budd-dal tai. Er ymdrechion awdurdod lleol wrth geisio gweinyddu'r cynllun, mae'n anodd lleihau twyll. Mae unrhyw ddulliau sy'n gallu cadw ffigurau twyll yn isel i'w

fraud figures down are welcome. However, if the pilot scheme is successful, we may consider more radical changes.

croesawu. Fodd bynnag, os bydd y cynllun peilot yn llwyddiannus, gallem ystyried newidiadau mwy radical.

### Cronfa Ymladd Troseddu Crime Fighting Fund

**Q2 Peter Rogers:** Has the First Minister had any discussion with the Home Office regarding the crime fighting fund grant? (OAQ19872)

**The First Minister:** I have not entered into discussions with the Home Office regarding the crime fighting fund, but my officials have been in touch with their counterparts to discuss this matter and to ensure that Wales receives support for the recruitment of much-needed additional police officers. Wales is set to benefit considerably from the fund, which will mean an extra 422 police officers being recruited across Wales. That is over and above the number that forces would have recruited by 2003. Of those 422 additional officers, 266 are already in place, and we all welcome that.

**Peter Rogers:** One of the problems with the formula is the necessity for police authorities to keep up the number of additional officers, otherwise they would lose the funding. The Home Office is now considering moving funding to support urban rather than rural police forces. In north Wales, any funding cuts would mean that the first port of call would be a reduction in police officers. For example, to maintain funding at the present level, the extra charges that will be incurred from last year's increase in national insurance contributions amount to an additional £600,000, which is a massive figure. Will you ensure that the Home Office understands that rural police forces, particularly North Wales Police, must be maintained with a proper budget, so that we do not see a reduction in any officers in that area?

**The First Minister:** We should not start anticipating reductions when there are increases in the budget. However, I appreciate what you say; when an urban police force such as Merseyside Police is successful, and it installs CCTV cameras

**C2 Peter Rogers:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cael unrhyw drafodaeth gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref ynghylch grant y gronfa ymladd troseddu? (OAQ19872)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf wedi cymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau â'r Swyddfa Gartref ynghylch y gronfa ymladd troseddu, ond bu fy swyddogion mewn cysylltiad â'u cymheiriaid i drafod y mater hwn a sicrhau bod Cymru'n derbyn cymorth i reciwtio heddweision ychwanegol y mae eu mawr angen. Bydd Cymru'n elwa'n sylweddol o'r gronfa, a fydd yn golygu reciwtio 422 o heddweision ychwanegol ledled Cymru. Mae hynny'n ychwanegol at y nifer y byddai'r heddluoedd wedi'u reciwtio erbyn 2003. O blith y 422 hynny o swyddogion ychwanegol, mae 266 ar waith eisoes, ac yr ydym oll yn croesawu hynny.

**Peter Rogers:** Un o broblemau'r fformiwlâu yw'r angen i awdurdodau heddlu gynnal y nifer o swyddogion ychwanegol, neu byddent yn colli'r cyllid fel arall. Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref bellach yn ystyried symud y cyllid i gynorthwyo heddluoedd trefol yn hytrach na rhai gwledig. Yn y Gogledd, byddai unrhyw dorri ar gyllid yn golygu mai'r hyn a ystyrid gyntaf fyddai gostwng nifer yr heddweision. Er enghraifft, er mwyn cadw'r cyllid ar ei lefel bresennol, mae'r taliadau ychwanegol a geir o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd yn y cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol y llynedd yn dod i £600,000 yn ychwanegol, sy'n ffigur anferth. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod y Swyddfa Gartref yn deall bod rhaid cynnal heddluoedd gwledig, a Heddlu Gogledd Cymru'n benodol, â chyllideb ddigonol, fel na welwn ostyngiad yn nifer y swyddogion yn yr ardal honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni ddylem ddechrau rhagweld gostyngiadau pan fo cynnydd yn y gyllideb. Deallaf yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud; pan fo heddlu trefol fel Heddlu Glannau Mersi'n llwyddiannus, ac yn gosod camerâu teledu cylch caeëdig ym mhob man,

everywhere, there is an outward wave as the criminal community looks for easier targets elsewhere. However, let us be clear; North Wales Police is set to receive £1.4 million from the crime fighting fund; £3.2 million is being allocated for the new police communication system, Airwave; and police officer numbers are at an all-time high, with north Wales getting an additional 62 officers this year. That is not bad.

**Geraint Davies:** I am sure that you were as disappointed as I was with David Blunkett's announcement that he would only contribute £500,000 per year towards the anti-drug initiative, Operation Tarian. That will mean a shortfall of £3.2 million in the funding for the first year. That will have to be funded from the Welsh police forces' own resources or from the Assembly's budget. Those resources are already stretched. Do you agree that the Home Office should accept its responsibility for policing and fund Operation Tarian in full?

**The First Minister:** It has. This relates to the point of order that I raised earlier; I must be careful about quoting figures when I do not have them in front of me. However, it is clear that the additional money from the Home Office for Operation Tarian, announced by David Blunkett on his recent visit to the Valleys, was intended to be combined with efficiency savings by the police, which they would put into Operation Tarian by squeezing their own budgets. The police are obviously not happy about that, but it is a commonly set condition. Reform and additional public funding go hand in hand. You will be aware, Geraint, of other announcements, which are in the public domain, in relation to combating drug and alcohol abuse for example; more will be said about that later this week.

**Janice Gregory:** Are you aware that the UK Government's crime fighting fund has enabled Sir Anthony Burden, the chief constable of South Wales Police, to take a pioneering decision to establish seven Communities First policing teams, one of which is based in Caerau in my constituency?

ceir ton tuag at allan wrth i'r troseddwywch chwilio am dargedau haws mewn mannau eraill. Er hynny, gadewch inni ddeall hyn: bydd Heddlu Gogledd Cymru'n derbyn £1.4 miliwn oddi wrth y gronfa ymladd trosedd; dyrennir £3.2 miliwn ar gyfer system gyfathrebu newydd yr heddlu, Airwave; ac mae nifer yr heddweision ar ei huchaf erioed, a chaiff y Gogledd 62 o swyddogion ychwanegol eleni. Mae hynny'n eithaf da.

**Geraint Davies:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi wedi siomi, fel yr oeddwn i, yng nghyhoeddiad David Blunkett na fyddai ond yn cyfrannu £500,000 y flwyddyn at y fenter i ymladd yn erbyn cyffuriau, Ymgyrch Tarian. Bydd hynny'n golygu diffyg o £3.2 miliwn yn y cyllid ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyntaf. Bydd yn rhaid i adnoddau heddluoedd Cymru eu hunain neu gyllideb y Cynulliad ariannu'r diffyg hwnnw. Ond mae'r adnoddau hynny'n brin eisoes. A gytunwch y dylai'r Swyddfa Gartref dderbyn ei chyfrifoldeb dros blismona ac ariannu Ymgyrch Tarian yn llawn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae wedi gwneud hynny. Mae hyn yn gysylltiedig â'r pwynt o drefn a godais yn gynharach; rhaid imi fod yn ofalus yngylch dyfynnu ffigurau a hwythau heb fod o'm blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg bod yr arian ychwanegol gan y Swyddfa Gartref i Ymgyrch Tarian, a gyhoeddwyd gan David Blunkett ar ei ymweliad diweddar â'r Cymoedd, i'w gyfuno ag arbedion drwy effeithlonrwydd gan yr heddlu, y byddent yn eu rhoi at Ymgyrch Tarian drwy wasgu ar eu cyllidebau eu hunain. Nid yw'r heddlu'n hapus yngylch hynny, wrth gwrs, ond mae'n amod a osodir yn aml. Mae diwygio ac arian cyhoeddus ychwanegol yn mynd law yn llaw. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Geraint, o gyhoeddiadau eraill a wnaethpwyd yn gyhoeddus ar ddelio â chamdefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau, er enghraifft; dywedir rhagor am hynny yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon.

**Janice Gregory:** A ydych yn ymwybodol bod cronfa ymladd trosedd Llywodraeth y DU wedi galluogi Syr Anthony Burden, prif gwnstabl Heddlu De Cymru, i wneud penderfyniad arloesol i sefydlu saith tîm plismona Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, y caiff un ohonynt ei leoli yng Nghaerau yn fy

The sight of police officers on the beat is much welcomed by my constituents, and it is an excellent example of joined-up thinking in the Communities First programme to deliver a better deal for deprived communities.

**The First Minister:** I am more than aware of it, as one of the seven teams is in my constituency, and I have met the officers concerned. It is doing a great deal of good in terms of police presence, the speed with which arrests can be made and in reassuring the public, shopkeepers and others whose businesses are vulnerable. They are pleased about it and it is a great step forward.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Despite the Assembly Government's funding increase—which we all welcome—do you not share my concerns that North Wales Police will lose officers as a result of the year on year reduction of Home Office funding, as stated by the chief constable of North Wales Police in our recent briefing?

**The First Minister:** The figures that I have here—so I feel safe in reading them out—state that the North Wales Police authority received a Home Office police funding allocation of £82.1 million in this present financial year, which is an increase of 2 per cent on 2001-02. It is not a decrease, but I agree that it is only just ahead of inflation. In a labour-intensive service such as policing, there must be efficiency gains. However, there will never be a big increase in public funding without some pressure coming from the sponsor department, which, in turn, comes under pressure from the Treasury to examine all its procedures to see whether it can spend extra public money more efficiently.

2.10 p.m.

I raised this point earlier in response to Peter Rogers because north Wales is sometimes in the eye of the storm as a result of more successful anti-crime initiatives by the big urban police forces to the east in Cheshire, Merseyside and Manchester. The Home Office will have to reconsider its formula if

etholaeth i? Mae gweld heddweision ar y strydoedd yn beth a groesewir yn fawr gan fy etholwyr, ac mae'n enghraifft rago'r o weithio mewn dull cydgysylltiedig fel rhan o raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i roi gwell bargen i gymunedau difreintiedig.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn dra ymwybodol o hynny, gan fod un o'r saith tîm yn fy etholaeth i, a chyfarfum â'r swyddogion dan sylw. Mae'n gwneud llawer o les o ran presenoldeb yr heddlu, cyflymder restio a thawelu meddwl y cyhoedd, siopwyr ac eraill y mae eu busnesau'n agored i niwed. Maent yn falch o hynny ac mae'n gam mawr ymlaen.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Er i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gynyddu'r cyllid—yr ydym oll yn ei groesawu—onid ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder y bydd Heddlu Gogledd Cymru'n colli swyddogion o ganlyniad i'r gostyngiad yn y cyllid gan y Swyddfa Gartref o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall, fel y nododd prif gwnstabl Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn ein cyfarfod briffio diweddar?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffigurau sydd gennyf yma—felly yr wyf yn teimlo'n ddiogel wrth eu darllen ar goedd—yn dweud bod awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi derbyn dyraniad o £82.1 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol, sy'n gynydd o 2 y cant oddi ar 2001-02. Nid yw'n ostyngiad, ond cytunaf nad yw ond ychydig ar y blaen i chwyddiant. Mewn gwasanaeth llafurddwys fel plismona, rhaid cael enillion drwy effeithlonrwydd. Fodd bynnag, ni cheir fyth gynydd mawr mewn cyllid cyhoeddus heb rywfaint o bwysau gan yr adran sy'n noddi, sydd, yn ei thro, yn dod dan bwysau gan y Trysorlys i archwilio'i holl weithdrefnau i ganfod a os modd iddi wario arian cyhoeddus ychwanegol yn fwy effeithlon.

Codais y pwynt hwn yn gynharach mewn ymateb i Peter Rogers gan fod y Gogledd yn cael ei daro weithiau o ganlyniad i fentrau llwyddiannus yn erbyn troseddu gan yr heddluoedd trefol mawr tua'r dwyrain yn swydd Gaer, Glannau Mersi a Manceinion. Bydd yn rhaid i'r Swyddfa Gartref ailystyried

that phenomenon becomes well-established. However, you cannot say that a 2 per cent rise is a cut.

**Ann Jones:** I am beginning to think that I was at a different briefing the other day by North Wales Police, because, as you said, the crime fighting fund has secured a record number of police officers. Do you agree that we need to build on these Home Office initiatives to reach our aims for safer communities here? Partnership between the police, local authorities and the local communities is the way forward to rid our streets of crime.

**The First Minister:** There are an extra 62 officers in North Wales Police, which is a substantial number over and above what they would have had this year. A sum of £11.2 million has been set aside over the next three years for the new safer communities fund, which was announced by Edwina Hart to fund community safety partnerships—the former crime reduction partnerships. That money is for the whole of Wales. These partnerships will address the underlying causes of crime and, where appropriate, will work with the police to tackle criminality.

ei fformiwla os daw'r ffenomen honno'n un sefydlog. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch alw codiad o 2 y cant yn ostyngiad.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn dechrau meddwl y bûm mewn cyfarfod briffio gwahanol y diwrnod o'r blaen gyda Heddlu Gogledd Cymru oherwydd, fel y dywedasoch, mae'r gronfa ymladd trosedd wedi sicrhau'r nifer fwyaf erioed o heddweision. A ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni adeiladu ar sail y mentrau hyn gan y Swyddfa Gartref i gyrraedd ein nod o greu cymunedau diogelach? Partneriaeth rhwng yr heddlu, yr awdurdodau lleol a'r cymunedau lleol yw'r ffordd ymlaen i ddileu trosedu ar ein strydoedd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae 62 o swyddogion ychwanegol yn Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, sy'n nifer sylweddol ar ben yr hyn a fuasai ganddo eleni. Neilltuwyd swm o £11.2 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf ar gyfer y gronfa cymunedau diogelach newydd, a gyhoeddwyd gan Edwina Hart i ariannu partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol—yr hyn a elwir gynt yn bartneriaethau gostwng trosedu. Mae'r arian hwnnw ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Bydd y partneriaethau hynny'n ymdrin ag achosion sylfaenol trosedu ac, os yw'n briodol, byddant yn gweithio gyda'r heddlu i fynd i'r afael â throseddoldeb.

### Adfywio Cymunedol yn Ne Clwyd Community Regeneration in Clwyd South

**Q3 Karen Sinclair:** What financial assistance has the Assembly given for community regeneration in Clwyd South? (OAQ19881)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly has provided funding for a number of community regeneration projects that impact on Clwyd South. The sustainable communities programme has allocated over £100,000 to Denbighshire Mediation and Denbighshire neighbourhood watch to support community regeneration activities. Furthermore, £350,000 was allocated under the local regeneration fund this year to organisations for community regeneration work that will benefit Clwyd South. You will be aware of the housing renewal areas in Brymbo and Broughton, which will receive a £1.2 million

**C3 Karen Sinclair:** Pa gymorth ariannol y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i roi ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol yn Ne Clwyd? (OAQ19881)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r Cynulliad wedi darparu cyllid ar gyfer sawl prosiect adfywio cymunedol sy'n effeithio ar Dde Clwyd. Mae'r rhaglen cymunedau cynaliadwy wedi dyrannu dros £100,000 i Wasanaeth Cyfryngu Sir Ddinbych a chynllun gwarchod cymdogol Sir Ddinbych i hybu gweithgareddau adfywio cymunedol. At hynny, dyrannwyd £350,000 o'r gronfa adfywio lleol eleni i gyrrff ar gyfer gwaith adfywio cymunedol a fydd o fudd i Dde Clwyd. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ardaloedd adnewyddu tai ym Mrymbo a Brychdyn, a fydd yn cael buddsoddiad o £1.2

cash injection every year for the next 10 years to improve homes and the environment following the successful initiatives in Rhosllannerchrugog and Smithfield/Hightown.

**Karen Sinclair:** Do you share my confidence that the Labour-led Assembly is making a tangible difference to the lives of many people in my constituency, who for many years were left at the bottom of the pile and whose needs are finally being acknowledged and met?

**The First Minister:** That is correct; there are exciting projects to the west of Wrexham, which is outside your constituency, but is in the URBAN 2 area, the Committee for which you chaired. The area to the west of Wrexham is interesting because it can generate more developments and the successful—despite the present hiccup—Brymbo redevelopment scheme will be of enormous value. It will transform the old mining villages to the west of Wrexham, which have provided much of the culture and wealth generated in north-east Wales over the past 100 years and more.

**Janet Ryder:** First Minister, you just mentioned the Brymbo regeneration scheme. I am sure that you are aware of the local concerns that that scheme may now be in jeopardy. To many local people, little has happened since the steelworks closed to replace the 2,500 jobs that were lost. As Minister with responsibility for co-ordination of Government policy in north Wales, what direct discussions have you had to ensure that that scheme goes ahead and produces new jobs in that area?

**The First Minister:** That is why I mentioned the scheme. I am not trying to avoid it, as you seemed to imply. I said that there had been a hiccup. I do not know whether you heard me, but it is important to recognise that hiccups can occur. A site investigation was undertaken and more slag was found under the site than was expected. Therefore, it had to be reinvestigated via discussions between Wrexham County Borough Council and Brymbo Development Ltd. There is no

miliwn bob blwyddyn am y 10 mlynedd nesaf i wella cartrefi a'r amgylchedd ar ôl y mentrau llwyddiannus yn Rhosllannerchrugog a Smithfield/Hightown.

**Karen Sinclair:** A ydych yn ffyddio, fel minnau, fod y Cynulliad dan arweiniad Llafur yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol ym mywydau nifer o bobl yn fy etholaeth i, a adawyd ar waelod y pentwr am flynyddoedd lawer ac y mae eu hanghenion yn cael eu cydnabod a'u diwallu o'r diwedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n gywir; mae prosiectau cyffrous tua'r gorllewin o Wrecsam, sydd y tu allan i'ch etholaeth chi, ond sydd yn rhan o ardal URBAN 2, yr oeddech yn cadeirio'r Pwyllgor ar ei chyfer. Mae'r ardal tua'r gorllewin o Wrecsam yn ddiddorol gan ei bod yn gallu creu rhagor o ddatblygiadau a bydd y cynllun datblygu llwyddiannus ym Mrymbo—er gwaethaf yr anhawster presennol—yn werthfawr dros ben. Bydd yn trawsffurfio'r hen bentrefi glofaol tua'r gorllewin o Wrecsam, a gynhyrchodd lawer o'r diwylliant a'r cyfoeth a grëwyd yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain dros y 100 mlynedd a mwy diwethaf.

**Janet Ryder:** Brif Weinidog, yr ydych newydd sôn am gynllun adfywio Brymbo. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon lleol y gallai'r cynllun hwnnw fod mewn perygl yn awr. Yng ngolwg llawer o bobl leol, ychydig a wnaed ers cau'r gwaith dur i greu swyddi newydd yn lle'r 2,500 o swyddi a gollwyd. Fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gydlynu polisiau'r Llywodraeth yn y Gogledd, pa drafodaethau uniongyrchol a gawsoch i sicrhau bod y cynllun hwnnw'n mynd ymlaen ac yn creu swyddi newydd yn yr ardal honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna pam y cyfeiriais at y cynllun. Nid wyf yn ceisio'i osgoi, fel yr oeddech yn awgrymu i bob golwg. Dywedais fod anhawster wedi codi. Ni wn a glywsoch yr hyn a ddywedais, ond mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod anawsterau'n gallu codi. Cynhaliwyd ymchwiliad ar y safle a darganfuwyd mwy o sorod na'r disgwyl o dan y safle. Felly, bu'n rhaid ailymchwilio i hynny drwy drafodaethau rhwng Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam a Brymbo

reason to assume that the scheme is in jeopardy, but it is a hiccup and I will look into the matter. If there are serious problems that cannot be dealt with at a local level through local discussions, I will write to you, Janet.

**David Ian Jones:** While former industrialised areas of north Wales are benefiting from the projects that you outline, do you concede that other areas, such as Conwy, are even more deserving? Conwy has the lowest per capita income of the whole of mainland Great Britain coupled with the highest proportion of people living solely on retirement pensions. Will you think in terms of shifting the focus of economic regeneration westward towards the county of Conwy?

**The First Minister:** This is one of the difficulties with questions to the First Minister—it becomes a matter of me and my constituency against them and theirs. You can always ask for money to be taken from another area to be given to your own; everyone can make a case based on the deprivation in the whole or part of their own constituency. However, we must set sensible priorities. We are aware of the problems in Conwy, and they will be addressed. It is in the Objective 1 area and is generally regarded as successful within Objective 1. It has Objective 1 status for precisely the reasons that you gave. That does not mean that it receives no attention. It is not receiving attention for this particular programme, but receives attention under Objective 1. It deserves that attention for the reasons that you listed.

#### Ceisiadau i Godi Ffermydd Gwynt Windfarm Applications

**Q4 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** What progress has been made in transferring the function of deciding on all windfarm applications? (OAQ19902)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government has proposed the transfer of the powers of sections 36 and 37 of the Electricity Act 1989. That transfer would cover more than windfarms; it would transfer control over all forms of electricity

Development Cyf. Nid oes rheswm dros dybio bod y cynllun mewn perygl, ond mae anhawster wedi codi ac fe ymchwiliaf i'r mater. Os oes problemau difrifol na ellir delio â hwy ar lefel leol drwy drafodaethau lleol, ysgrifennaf atoch, Janet.

**David Ian Jones:** Er bod ardaloedd cynddiwydiannol y Gogledd yn cael budd o'r prosiectau a ddisgrifiwch, a ydych yn derbyn bod ardaloedd eraill, fel Conwy, yn fwy haeddiannol byth? Gan Gonwy y mae'r incwm y pen isaf o blith holl ardaloedd tir mawr Prydain Fawr, ynghyd â'r gyfran fwyaf o bobl sy'n byw ar bensiynau ymddeol yn unig. A wnewch chi ystyried symud y ffocws ar adfywio economaidd tua'r gorllewin i sir Conwy?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyma un o anawsterau'r sesiwn gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog—mae'n mynd yn fater o myfi a'm hetholaeth i yn eu herbyn hwy a'u hetholaethau. Gallwch bob amser ofyn am i arian gael ei gymryd oddi wrth ardal arall a'i roi i'ch un chi; gall pawb gyflwyno achos ar sail yr amddifadedd yn eu hetholaethau, boed yn yr etholaeth gyfan neu ran ohoni. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni osod blaenoriaethau synhwyrol. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r problemau yng Nghonwy, ac ymdrinnir â hwy. Mae'n rhan o ardal Amcan 1 ac fe'i hystyrir yn llwyddiannus at ei gilydd o fewn Amcan 1. Mae ganddi statws Amcan 1 am yr union resymau a roesoch. Ni olyga hynny nad yw'n cael sylw. Nid yw'n cael sylw dan y rhaglen benodol hon, ond mae'n cael sylw dan Amcan 1. Mae'n teilyngu'r sylw am y rhesymau a nodwyd gennych.

**C4 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Pa gynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud o ran trosglwyddo'r swyddogaeth o benderfynu ar bob cais i godi fferm wynt? (OAQ19902)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi awgrymu trosglwyddo pwerau adrannau 36 a 37 o Ddeddf Trydan 1989. Byddai'r trosglwyddiad hwnnw'n cynnwys mwy na ffermydd gwynt; byddai'n trosglwyddo'r rheolaeth dros bob math o

generation to the Assembly. The United Kingdom Government is considering this matter; the Secretary of State for Wales is leading that process. A number of options may be available, on which we have previously exchanged views. However, they must be considered because electricity is an integrated system and we would have to consider how to use those powers. You cannot announce in advance that you would use those powers, were they transferred—as I fear that you would do—to turn down all windfarm applications. It would spell death to any attempt to gain transferral of powers to the Assembly were you to announce in advance your decision on every application.

**Nick Bourne:** The process must be followed, and I would not reveal my intentions in advance. However, you have united support in the Assembly for the transfer of the powers. This has taken a long time and I suspect a certain amount of heel-dragging. Will you acknowledge that the Labour Government at Westminster—through the person of Brian Wilson, the Minister for energy, who is Scottish—has imposed large windfarms on the Welsh countryside without due consideration to local needs or to the damage that they may cause? Do you agree that a commitment to sustainable development does not commit Wales to indiscriminate siting of large windfarms across the country? Were the application for Cefn Coed proposed for the South Downs or the Cotswolds, for example, a proper inquiry would have been held rather than it being imposed, as happened in Wales.

**The First Minister:** I cannot comment on the South Downs. I agree that nothing should be indiscriminate in Wales. That would cover the matter of windfarms or any other form of power station. Such matters cannot be indiscriminate. You must have a strategy, issue guidelines, consult and then consider each case on its merits relative to those guidelines. The Government's response to our request for the transfer of functions has been delayed because the Government is drafting a White Paper on energy and is caught up in that drafting process. However, we are pursuing the matter and it will go before the Richard commission. I believe that Andrew Davies, in his memorandum and in

ddulliau cynhyrchu trydan i'r Cynulliad. Mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ystyried y mater hwn; Ysgrifennyd Gwladol Cymru sy'n arwain y broses honno. Gallai nifer o ddewisiadau fod ar gael, ac yr ydym eisoes wedi eu trafod. Rhaid eu hystyried, serch hynny, gan fod trydan yn system integredig a byddai'n rhaid inni ystyried sut i ddefnyddio'r pwerau hynny. Ni allwch gyhoeddi ymlaen llaw y byddech yn defnyddio'r pwerau hynny, pe caent eu trosglwyddo—fel yr ofnaf y byddech chi—i wrthod pob cais am fferm wynt. Byddai cyhoeddi'ch penderfyniad ar bob cais ymlaen llaw yn ergyd farwol i unrhyw ymgais i drosglwyddo pwerau i'r Cynulliad.

**Nick Bourne:** Rhaid dilyn y broses, ac ni fyddwn yn datgelu fy mwriadau ymlaen llaw. Fodd bynnag, mae gennych gefnogaeth unol yn y Cynulliad dros drosglwyddo'r pwerau. Mae hyn wedi cymryd amser hir a chryn dipyn o lusgo traed, yr wyf yn amau. A wnewch chi gydnabod bod y Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain—drwy law Brian Wilson, y Gweinidog dros ynni, sy'n Albanwr—wedi gorfodi ffermydd gwynt mawr ar gefn gwlad Cymru heb roi ystyriaeth ddyladwy i anghenion lleol na'r difrod y gallent ei achosi? A ydych yn cytuno nad yw ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy'n rhwymo Cymru i leoli ffermydd gwynt mawr ar draws y wlad yn ddiwahân? Pe bai'r cais ar gyfer Cefn Coed wedi'i gynnig ar gyfer y Twyni Deheuol neu'r Cotswolds, er enghraifft, cynhelid ymchwiliad iawn ac ni fyddai'n cael ei orfodi, fel y digwyddodd yng Nghymru.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf wneud sylw am y Twyni Deheuol. Cytunaf na ddylai dim fod yn anwahaniaethol yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n berthnasol i fater y ffermydd gwynt neu unrhyw fath arall o orsaf bŵer. Ni all materion o'r fath fod yn anwahaniaethol. Rhaid ichi gael strategaeth, cyhoeddi canllawiau, ymgynghori ac wedyn ystyried pob achos yn ôl ei rinweddau yn unol â'r canllawiau hynny. Mae ymateb y Llywodraeth i'n cais am drosglwyddo swyddogaethau wedi'i ohirio am fod y Llywodraeth yn drafftio Papur Gwyn ar ynni a'i bod wedi'i dal yn y broses ddrafftio honno. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dilyn y mater ac aiff gerbron comisiwn Richard.

his oral evidence on Friday, will cover issues of this nature.

**Peter Black:** Under the Transport and Works Act 1992, the Assembly has the power of determination over offshore windfarm applications. When such an application comes before the Assembly, ought we not ensure that any prior consultation undertaken by the applicant is genuine and not pre-empted by their actions?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure on the Transport and Works Act, to which you refer, regarding the determination of offshore windfarm applications. We ought, perhaps, to exchange correspondence on that issue. [*Interruption.*]

I am told that you are correct on that issue. The three offshore windfarm applications on which we are currently deliberating, namely one off Abergale, another off Rhyl and one off Porthcawl, are being dealt with by the Department of Trade and Industry. Permission is being given by that department. This matter has generally been regarded as an attractive extension as it reduces the pressure on areas of high landscape value. If you can locate more windfarms offshore, then there is no need to locate them onshore. However, the cost of electricity per unit generated is higher and those options are therefore not so popular with the electricity industry itself. Undoubtedly, this option represents a major resource to be examined on a case-by-case basis. So far, only one has been approved, namely the one north of Rhyl.

2.20 p.m.

**Janet Davies:** Bearing in mind the Public Works Amendment Act 2002, who will take the decision on the application to build the offshore windfarm at Porthcawl, as it involves the site at sea as well as the land-based link into the national grid? Will you pursue this matter and clarify it for Members?

**The First Minister:** I will write to you on what has been done regarding the North Hoyle windfarm, which I believe has

Credaf y bydd Andrew Davies, yn ei femorandwm ac yn ei dystiolaeth lafar ar ddydd Gwener, yn ymdrin â materion o'r natur hon.

**Peter Black:** O dan y Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth a Gweithfeydd 1992, mae gan y Cynulliad y pwér i benderfynu ar geisiadau am ffermydd gwynt ar y môr. Pan ddaw cais o'r fath gerbron y Cynulliad, oni ddylem sicrhau bod unrhyw ymgynghori a wneir ymlaen llaw gan yr ymgeisydd yn ddilys ac nad yw'n achub y blaen arno drwy ei weithredoedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr am y Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth a Gweithfeydd, y cyfeiriwch ati, yngylch penderfynu ar geisiadau am ffermydd gwynt ar y môr. Efallai y dylem ohebu â'n gilydd ar hynny. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Dywedir wrthyf eich bod yn gywir ar y mater hwnnw. Mae'r tri chais am ffermydd gwynt ar y môr yr ydym yn eu trafod ar hyn o bryd, sef un oddi ar Abergale, un arall oddi ar y Rhyl ac un oddi ar Borthcawl, yn cael eu trin gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Rhoddir caniatâd gan yr adran honno. Ystyriwyd y mater hwn yn estyniad deniadol fel arfer gan ei fod y lleihau'r pwysau ar ardaloedd sydd â thirlun gwerthfawr. Os gallwch leoli mwy o ffermydd gwynt ar y môr, nid oes angen eu lleoli ar y tir. Fodd bynnag, mae cost trydan fesul uned a gynhyrchir yn uwch ac felly nid yw'r dewisiadau hynny mor boblogaidd gan y diwydiant trydan ei hun. Yn ddi-os, mae'r dewis hwn yn cynnig adnodd pwysig y dylid ei ystyried fesul achos. Hyd yma, dim ond un a gymeradwywyd, sef yr un i'r gogledd o'r Rhyl.

**Janet Davies:** Gan ddal mewn cof y Ddeddf Gweithfeydd Cyhoeddus (Diwygio) 2002, pwy a benderfyna ar y cais i godi'r fferm wynt ar y môr ym Mhorthcawl, gan ei fod yn cynnwys y safle ar y môr yn ogystal â'r cyswllt ar y tir â'r grid cenedlaethol? A wnewch ddilyn y mater hwn a rhoi gwedd eglurach arno i'r Aelodau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf ysgrifennu atoch yngylch yr hyn a wnaed mewn cysylltiad â fferm wynt North Hoyle, sydd wedi'i

received the go-ahead, and the two remaining offshore windfarms, which have not yet been approved as they are still being drafted, including the Scarweather Sands windfarm, off Porthcawl.

**Alun Cairns:** Your lack of understanding on this issue hardly inspires confidence in the 5,000 objectors in Porthcawl who have justifiable reasons for opposing the offshore windfarm. Will you give us your view on this matter, and tell us what the process is?

**The First Minister:** We currently have no applications for onshore power stations of over 50 MW. As far as I am aware, only the North Hoyle project in north Wales has been approved so far; an approval of the second north Wales project at Rhyl Flats is likely soon. The Scarweather project has only reached exhibition stage in Porthcawl. It would be improper for me to offer a view on a planning application as the Assembly will be involved in its determination. It is insane to request my personal view, Alun. You should reconsider asking for the views of people in quasi-judicial positions on these matters. If I were to offer a view, you would not hesitate to criticise me for doing so while maintaining a quasi-judicial position. We will offer a view on it at the appropriate stage, but not at the stage where it is being exhibited for local people to have the opportunity to express their views for or against the project.

chaniatáu, yr wyf yn credu, a'r ddwy fferm wynt ar y môr sy'n weddill, sydd heb eu cymeradwyo eto gan eu bod yn cael eu drafftio o hyd, gan gynnwys fferm wynt Scarweather Sands, oddi ar Borthcawl.

**Alun Cairns:** Prin y bydd eich diffyg dealltwriaeth o'r mater hwn yn ennyn hyder yn y 5,000 o wrthwynebwyr ym Mhorthcawl sydd â rhesymau cyfiawn dros wrthwynebu'r fferm wynt ar y môr. A wnewch roi'ch barn i ni am y mater hwn, a dweud wrthym beth yw'r broses?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennym unrhyw geisiadau ar hyn o bryd am orsafoedd trydan ar y tir o fwy na 50 MW. Hyd y gwn i, dim ond prosiect North Hoyle yn y Gogledd a gymeradwywyd hyd yn hyn; mae'r ail brosiect ar Fflatiau'r Rhyl yn debygol o gael ei gymeradwyo cyn hir. Nid yw prosiect Scarweather ym Mhorthcawl ond wedi cyrraedd y cyfnod arddangos. Byddai'n amhriodol imi gynnig barn am gais cynllunio gan y byddai'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud â phenderfynu arno. Peth gwallgof yw gofyn am fy marn bersonol, Alun. Dylech ailystyried gofyn am farn pobl mewn swyddi lled-farnwrol am y materion hyn. Pe byddwn yn cynnig barn, ni fydd yn petruso cyn fy meirniadu am wneud hynny tra oeddwn mewn swydd led-farnwrol. Cynigiwn farn arno ar yr adeg briodol, ond nid ar yr adeg y mae'n cael ei arddangos er mwyn i bobl leol gael cyfle i fynegi eu barn o blaid y prosiect neu yn ei erbyn.

### **Comisiwn Richard The Richard Commission**

**C5 Cynog Dafis:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gydag aelodau chomisiwn Richard ynglŷn ag amserlenni'r ymchwiliad? (OAQ19895) [R]

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Trafodais gylch gorchwyl y comisiwn, gan gynnwys y disgwyliad y bydd yr adroddiad wedi'i gyflwyno erbyn diwedd 2003, gyda'r Arglwydd Richard. Cynhaliwyd y trafodaethau hyn cyn i aelodau'r comisiwn gael eu penodi. Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau pellach gydag ef na chydag unrhyw aelod arall o'r comisiwn ers hynny.

**Q5 Cynog Dafis:** What discussions has the First Minister had with members of the Richard commission regarding the timescale of the investigation? (OAQ19895) [R]

**The First Minister:** I discussed the commission's terms of reference, including the expectation that the report will be submitted by the end of 2003, with Lord Richard. These discussions took place before the appointment of commission members. I have had no further discussions with Lord Richard or any other member of the commission since then.

**Cynog Dafis:** Yn ôl Carwyn Jones, mae'r Blaid Lafur yn gohirio rhoi tystiolaeth i gomisiwn Richard tan yr haf am nad ydyw am gynnal ymgyrch etholiadol ar faterion cyfansoddiadol—ar wahân i fater y *nightmare of independence*. Mae comisiwn Richard wedi cytuno i gais Llafur am osod llinell derfyn o 15 Gorffennaf. A allwch ein sierhau nad oes unrhyw gais ffurfiol neu anffurfiol wedi'i wneud i gomisiwn Richard i addasu'r amserlen er mwyn cyfleustra etholiadol eich plaid?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni ddeallaf sut y mae a wnelo'r sylwadau hynny â'r Cynulliad. Byddwn wedi disgwyl cwestiwn sylwedol gennych, Cynog, ond clywsom rwtsh oherwydd nid oeddech yn gallu meddwl am unrhyw beth arall i'w ddweud. Yr ydych am i Gymru fod yn annibynnol. Dyna'r hyn mae Elfyn Llwyd eisiau hefyd, ond efallai fod Ieuan Wyn Jones—am resymau cyfleustra etholiadol—wedi dweud wrthych i beidio â sôn am hynny tan ar ôl etholiadau'r Cynulliad.

Ar gomisiwn Richard, mae Gweinidogion y Cabinet yn rhoi eu sylwadau yn ysgrifenedig ac wedyn ar lafar gerbron y Comisiwn. Mae Jane Davidson wedi gwneud hynny eisoes, a bydd tri arall wedi'i wneud erbyn diwedd yr wythnos hon. Felly, bydd bron hanner y Cabinet wedi cyflwyno sylwadau i gomisiwn Richard o fewn y tridiau nesaf.

**Mick Bates:** In terms of what the Assembly can achieve, I understand that representations have been made to Westminster on devolving powers for tuition fees so that we could abolish them. Do you agree that we should have the power to abolish tuition fees? Do you also think that our submission to the Richard commission will be successful?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether that was included in Jane Davidson's submission; I do not have it to hand. However, the Assembly's view—as we have always said—is that it would be far better if we had the same powers as the Scottish Parliament, regarding university tuition fees. However, it may turn out that we will not be given those powers. That is one reason for us engaging in issues concerning higher

**Cynog Dafis:** According to Carwyn Jones, the Labour Party will not give evidence to the Richard commission until the summer because it does not want to run an election campaign on constitutional issues—apart, that is, from the nightmare of independence. The Richard commission has agreed to Labour's request for the deadline to be set at 15 July. Can you assure us that no request, formal or otherwise, has been made to the Richard commission to revise the timetable for the electoral convenience of your party?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure what those comments have to do with the Assembly. I would have expected a question of substance from you, Cynog, but instead we heard nothing but a load of rubbish because you could not think of anything else to say. You want independence for Wales. That is also what Elfyn Llwyd wants, but perhaps Ieuan Wyn Jones—for reasons of electoral convenience—has told you not to say so until after the Assembly elections.

On the Richard commission, Cabinet Ministers are submitting written evidence, followed by oral observations to the commission. Jane Davidson has already done this, and three others will have done so by the end of this week. Therefore, almost half of the Cabinet will have made observations to the Richard commission within the next three days.

**Mick Bates:** O ran yr hyn y gall y Cynulliad ei gyflawni, deallaf fod sylwadau wedi'u cyflwyno i San Steffan ynghylch datganoli pwerau dros ffioedd dysgu fel y gallem eu dileu. A ydych yn cytuno y dylem gael y pŵer i ddileu ffioedd dysgu? A ydych hefyd yn credu y bydd ein cyflwyniad i gomisiwn Richard yn llwyddiannus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr a oedd hynny wedi'i gynnwys yng nghyflwyniad Jane Davidson; nid ydyw gennyf wrth law. Fodd bynnag, barn y Cynulliad—fel y dywedasom erioed—yw mai gwell o lawer fyddai inni gael yr un pwerau â Senedd yr Alban, o ran ffioedd dysgu prifysgolion. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bosibl na roddir y pwerau hynny i ni yn y diwedd. Dyna un rheswm pam yr ydym yn ymhel â materion

education and further education costs for students, and it is why we had the innovative idea of introducing Assembly learning grants.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First Minister, if the Richard commission recommends that this body be given primary law-making powers, do you agree that no steps should be taken in that direction unless the views of the people of Wales are ascertained by means of a referendum?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that you should anticipate anything until the Richard commission has completed its work; it is idle to speculate. We will have every opportunity to discuss its recommendations at the appropriate time. The timetable has long been set, and everybody understands that the Richard commission will make its recommendation within five or six months after the new Assembly comes into being.

### Swyddi yn y Sector Cyhoeddus Public Sector Jobs

**C6 Gareth Jones:** Pa fuddsoddiad sydd wedi bod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod swyddi cyhoeddus yn cael eu lledaenu drwy Gymru gyfan? (OAQ19899)[R]

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bu inni fuddsoddi'n sylweddol. Gwelwyd cynnydd o £2 biliwn eisoes yn ein cyllid ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Bydd hynny'n cynyddu o ryw £2 biliwn arall erbyn 2005-06. Golyga hynny y gallwn wario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, addysg a swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru.

**Gareth Jones:** Mae disgwyliadau mawr y bydd datganoli swyddi o Gaerdydd yn gwella safon byw yn y cymunedau lle y lleolir y swyddi hynny. A fydd y buddsoddiad hwn yn newid pethau o ddifrif yn fy etholaeth yng Nghonwy? Mae polisiau andwyol y Ceidwadwyr gynt—ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelod, David Ian Jones, am ategu hynny yn ei gwestiwn yn gynharach—a pholisiau Llafur newydd ers dros bum mlynedd bellach, wedi achosi i Gonwy ddioddef y cyflogau cyfartalog isaf ym Mhrydain ac eithrio rhai etholaethau yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. A fyddwch yn newid y

sy'n ymwneud â chostau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach i fyfyrwyr, a dyna pam y cawsom y syniad arloesol o gyflwyno grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brif Weinidog, os yw comisiwn Richard yn argymhell y dylid rhoi pwerau deddfu sylfaenol i'r corff hwn, a ydych yn cytuno na ddylid cymryd unrhyw gamau i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw oni cheir barn pobl Cymru drwy refferendwm?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf y dylid rhagddisgwyl dim hyd nes y bydd comisiwn Richard wedi gorffen ei waith; ofer yw dyfalu. Cawn bob cyfle i drafod ei argymhellion ar yr adeg briodol. Mae'r amserlen wedi'i hen sefydlu, ac mae pawb yn deall y bydd comisiwn Richard yn gwneud ei argymhellion o fewn pump neu chwe mis wedi i'r Cynulliad newydd ddod i fodolaeth.

**Q6 Gareth Jones:** What investment has the Assembly Government made to ensure that public sector jobs are made available across Wales? (OAQ19899)[R]

**The First Minister:** We have made a substantial investment. There has already been an increase of £2 billion in our budget since the Assembly's inception. That will increase by another £2 billion or so by 2005-06. That will enable us to invest in the health service, education and public sector jobs across Wales.

**Gareth Jones:** There are great expectations that devolving jobs from Cardiff will improve the standard of living in the communities where those jobs are located. Will that investment make any real difference in my constituency in Conwy? The ruinous policies of past Conservative governments—and I am grateful to my colleague, David Ian Jones, for corroborating that in his earlier question—and the policies of new Labour for the past five years, have caused Conwy to suffer the lowest average wage in Britain, apart from some constituencies in Northern Ireland. Will you really change that situation?

sefyllfa honno mewn gwirionedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych yn deall eich cwestiwn eich hun, Gareth. Atebais eich cwestiwn eisoes. Effaith buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw galluogi cyngorau lleol, ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, awdurdodau iechyd, prifysgolion, colegau addysg bellach, ac ati, i gyflogi mwy o bobl yn y sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru, pa le bynnag y bo'r galw, pa le bynnag y bo'r boblogaeth yn byw.

Os y cyfeiriwch at y strategaeth i adleoli swyddi'r Cynulliad a chwangos y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi datgan yn gyhoeddus ein bwriad i fwrw ymlaen gyda hynny. Byddwn yn adleoli tua 700 o swyddi ychwanegol y tu allan i Gaerdydd. Mae rhyw 1,000 o weision sifil yn gwneud hynny eisoes yn ein swyddfeydd rhanbarthol yng Nghonwy, Caernarfon, Llandrindod ac ati, a hoffwn godi'r niferoedd i 1,700 erbyn 2007.

**David Melding:** While most of us want to see public sector activity spreading across Wales, particularly to regions where it is difficult to recruit people suitable for high-quality jobs, do you agree that a mature Assembly should not adopt a policy of simply taking existing public functions from Cardiff and plonking them elsewhere in Wales—causing great disruption to those currently living in Cardiff, who may have children attending local schools?

**The First Minister:** I am unsure, David, whether you are saying that it is now Conservative policy to increase the number of civil service jobs per se, so as to never have to consider families. Are you saying that heads of families who are civil servants should be given new posts, rather than transferring them to existing posts? It would be nice if we lived in that world, but it is not that simple. That is the difficulty. We could not reverse John Redwood's famous decision to move our agriculture department from Aberystwyth to Cardiff—which I always thought was madness—and relocate everyone back to Aberystwyth, you are right. Once people have settled somewhere—and perhaps

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that you understand your own question, Gareth. I have already answered your question. The effect of investment in public services is to enable local councils, national health service trusts, health authorities, universities, further education colleges, and so on, to employ more people in the public sector across Wales, wherever the demand exists and wherever the population lives.

If you are referring to the strategy to relocate Assembly and Assembly quango jobs, we have publicly stated our intention to move forward with that. We will relocate some 700 additional jobs outside Cardiff. Some 1,000 civil servants already work outside Cardiff, in our regional offices in Conwy, Caernarfon, Llandrindod Wells and so forth, and we would like to increase that number to 1,700 by 2007.

**David Melding:** Er bod y rhan fwyaf ohonom am weld gweithgaredd y sector cyhoeddus yn ymledu ar draws Cymru, yn enwedig i ranbarthau lle y mae'n anodd reciwtio pobl sy'n addas i swyddi o ansawdd da, a ydych yn cytuno na ddylai Cynulliad aeddfed fabwysiadu polisi o ddim ond mynd â'r swyddogaethau cyhoeddus presennol o Gaerdydd a'u sodro yn rhywle arall yng Nghymru—gan amharu'n fawr ar y rhai sy'n byw yng Nghaerdydd yn awr, y gallai eu plant fod yn derbyn eu haddysg mewn ysgolion lleol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr, David, a ydych yn dweud mai polisi'r Ceidwadwyr bellach yw cynyddu nifer y swyddi yn y gwasanaeth sifil fel y cyfryw, fel na fydd byth raid ystyried teuluoedd. A ydych yn dweud y dylid rhoi swyddi newydd i bennau teuluoedd sy'n weision sifil, yn hytrach na'u trosglwyddo i'r swyddi presennol? Byddai'n braf pe byddem yn byw mewn byd felly, ond nid yw mor symlo â hynny. Dyna'r anhawster. Ni allem wrthdroi penderfyniad enwog John Redwood i symud ein hadran amaethyddiaeth o Aberystwyth i Gaerdydd—y credais erioed ei fod yn un gwallgof—ac adleoli pawb yn Aberystwyth yn ôl, yr ydych yn iawn. Wedi i bobl ymsefydlu yn rhywle—a phan yw eu

their children attend local schools— you need to negotiate such terms before relocating their jobs.

It is not as easy as that, but we cannot say that therefore we will never do it. The number of civil servants in the Assembly will always expand, but it is not as though we could only employ the additional staff outside Cardiff, because I am not sure whether that would be satisfactory either. However, you have put your finger on the major practical difficulties with relocation. It cannot be done instantly; it must be done in negotiation with the unions and families in order to get the right people into the right jobs outside Cardiff.

2.30 p.m.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that we need to see UK public sector jobs coming to Wales as part of a continuing decentralisation of public services? This would ease the problems related to transport infrastructure, congestion and housebuilding in the south-east of England, as well as being of benefit to Wales, the regions of England and Scotland.

**The First Minister:** I agree. We should not say that, because we have devolution, the UK Government ministries have no obligation to try to decongest and ease recruitment problems in London and the south-east by only transporting jobs to Newcastle, Liverpool, Birmingham, or wherever. We are very much in the field. The Department for Work and Pensions' decision two years ago to locate 500 additional jobs in Swansea and about 100 in Wrexham is now being implemented. We must ensure that this trend continues. The Assembly is not the biggest public sector employer in Wales. As far as I know, the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency is a bigger employer than the Assembly. Likewise, the Patent Office and the Office for National Statistics in Newport are enormous employers that offer high-quality jobs. We look forward to securing more jobs of such quality, from London Government ministries, for Newport, Wrexham and other potential office locations. This is good for the ministries and good for us.

plant yn derbyn eu haddysg mewn ysgolion lleol efallai—rhaid ichi negodi telerau o'r fath cyn adleoli eu swyddi.

Nid yw mor rhwydd â hynny, ond ni allwn ddweud na fyddwn byth yn ei wneud oherwydd hynny. Bydd nifer y gweision sifil yn y Cynulliad yn dal i gynyddu, ond nid ydyw fel petaem ond yn gallu cyflogi'r staff ychwanegol y tu allan i Gaerdydd, gan nad wyf yn sicr y byddai hynny'n foddaol ychwaith. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych wedi tynnu sylw at y prif anawsterau ymarferol wrth adleoli. Ni ellir ei wneud yn syth; rhaid ei wneud drwy negodi â'r undebau a'r teuluoedd er mwyn cael y bobl iawn yn y swyddi iawn y tu allan i Gaerdydd.

**John Griffiths:** A ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni weld swyddi sector cyhoeddus y DU yn dod i Gymru fel rhan o ddatganoli parhaus ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus? Byddai hynny'n lleddfu'r problemau sy'n ymwneud â'r seilwaith trafnidiaeth, tagfeydd a chodi tai yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, yn ogystal a bod o fudd i Gymru, rhanbarthau Lloegr a'r Alban.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Ni ddylem ddweud, gan fod datganoli gennym, nad oes rhaid i weinyddiaethau Llywodraeth y DU geisio dileu tagfeydd a lleddfu problemau reciwtio yn Llundain a deddwyraen Lloegr drwy ddim ond symud swyddi i Newcastle, Lerpwl, Birmingham, neu ba le bynnag. Yr ydym yn amlwg iawn yn y maes hwn. Mae penderfyniad yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ddwy flynedd yn ôl i leoli 500 o swyddi ychwanegol yn Abertawe a thua 100 yn Wrecsam yn cael ei weithredu'n awr. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y tuedd hwn yn parhau. Nid y Cynulliad yw'r cyflogwr sector cyhoeddus mwyaf yng Nghymru. Hyd y gwn i, mae'r Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau yn gyflogwr mwy na'r Cynulliad. Yn yr un modd, mae'r Swyddfa Batentau a'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yng Nghasnewydd yn gyflogwyr mawr iawn sy'n cynnig swyddi o ansawdd da. Edrychwn ymlaen at sicrhau rhagor o swyddi o'r un ansawdd, gan weinyddiaethau'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain, ar gyfer Casnewydd, Wrecsam a lleoliadau posibl eraill i swyddfeydd. Mae hyn yn beth

da i'r gweinyddiaethau ac i ninnau.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Ai rhan o'r bwriad i greu swyddi gweinyddol drwy Gymru yw'r cynllun i greu 88 o swyddi gweinyddol ychwanegol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn sgil yr ailstrwythuro y clywsom gymaint amdano yn ddiweddar? A ydych yn sylweddoli bod y gost o greu'r swyddi hynny yn £5.5 miliwn o leiaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi trafod y mater hwn ar sawl achlysur. Mae'r cynllun yn niwtral o ran cost pe ystyriem gostau gweithredu'r gwasanaeth iechyd dan y gyfundrefn newydd. Serch hynny, bydd costau dros dro, ac efallai mai at y rheini yr ydych yn cyfeirio. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn bwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun newydd, gan y bydd yn dod â'r gwaith o reoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn agosach at ein cymunedau. Credais fod pob plaid yn cefnogi'r ymgais i danlinellu pwysigrwydd cymunedau lleol, achos dyna lle y dylid penu blaenoriaethau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A ydych, felly, yn gyffyrddus â'r ffaith y byddwch yn ymgyrchu yn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad gan ddweud eich bod am greu 88 o swyddi gweinyddol parhaol ychwanegol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru ar gost o £5.5 miliwn, yn hytrach na dweud eich bod am ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i gyflogi 250 o nyrssys ychwanegol? A ydych yn sylweddoli, er gwaethaf eich ateb blaenorol, fod 130 o swyddi meddygon teulu yng Nghymru yn wag, fel ag y mae 800 o swyddi nyrssys, 60 o swyddi ffisiotherapyddion, 29 o swyddi therapyddion lleferydd a 45 o swyddi arbenigwyr seicietryddol? Pam yr ydych am wastraffu arian ac amser ar ailstrwythuro diangen pan mai'r hyn sydd ei angen arnom yw staff i ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth sylweddoli na fu ichi lwyddo i lenwi'r swyddi hynny, rhaid sicrhau, er mwyn gwneud hynny yn y pen draw, fod mwy o bobl yn derbyn yr hyfforddiant perthnasol. Nid chwant arian sydd wedi peri bod gennym 700 o swyddi gwag. Yr ydym yn barod i dalu am staff ond, yn anffodus, mae'r nifer a adawodd y gwasanaeth iechyd yn uwch na'r rhai a ymunodd. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu'r problem

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Does your aim of creating administrative jobs throughout Wales include the creation of 88 additional administrative posts in the health service as a result of the much-vaunted restructuring? Do you realise that the creation of these posts carries a price tag of at least £5.5 million?

**The First Minister:** We have discussed this matter on several occasions. In terms of the health service's operational costs under the new system, the scheme will be cost-neutral. However, there will be transitional costs, and perhaps it is to these that you refer. It is important that we take forward the new scheme because it will bring the national health service's administration closer to our communities. I thought that every party supported efforts to underline the importance of local communities, because that is where decisions on priorities should be made.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Are you, therefore, comfortable with the fact that you will go into the next Assembly elections stating that you are to create 88 additional permanent administrative posts in the health service in Wales at a cost of £5.5 million, rather than stating that you will use that money to employ 250 additional nurses? Do you realise, despite your previous response, that 130 general practitioner posts in Wales are vacant, as are 800 nursing posts, 60 physiotherapist posts, 29 speech therapist posts and 45 specialist psychiatrist posts? Why are you intent on wasting time and money on unnecessary restructuring when what we need is staff to deliver health services?

**The First Minister:** Once you realise that you have failed to fill those posts, you must ensure, in order to do so eventually, that more people are receiving the relevant training. It is not tight-fistedness on our part that has led to 700 vacancies. We are prepared to pay for staff but, unfortunately, the number of staff who have left the service exceeds the number that joined. This is a reflection of the problem caused by an increase in employment

a ddaw yn sgîl cwyp mewn diweithdra; mae gan bobl mwy o ddeuis o ran cyflogaeth ac nid yw cyflogwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus yn gallu cadw gafael ar staff yn yr un modd ag y gallant pan fo diweithdra yn uchel. Mae gennym arian i dalu am feddygon, nyrssys a therapyddion, ond nid ydym wedi llwyddo i'w reciwtio. Felly, rhaid hyfforddi mwy o bobl i lenwi'r swyddi gwag. Nid oes neb yn y byd yn gwneud mwy na ni i gynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr sy'n astudio meddygaeth—bydd y ffigur yn 1999 wedi cynyddu 89 y cant erbyn 2005. Ni allwch wneud llawer mwy na hynny.

### Tai Fforddiadwy Affordable Housing

**Q7 Kirsty Williams:** What solutions are being developed to provide affordable housing in rural areas? (OAQ19891)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government has given local authorities effective control over social housing grant investment, and has developed more flexible ways of using that investment to provide housing for rent or low-cost home ownership. This year, the Assembly is making more than £56 million available in social housing grants to assist with the provision of affordable housing in Wales. That covers urban as well as rural areas. If they wish, local authorities could spend all that money on the homebuy scheme. Understandably, many authorities consider that housing for rent is a priority need in their area. It is up to them to balance the need for housing for rent and for the homebuy scheme. We have made the money available.

**Kirsty Williams:** Development control and rising house prices in the Brecon Beacons National Park are making it increasingly difficult for young families to remain in their villages. Such factors not only cause difficulty for the families but also undermine the sustainability of communities leading, for example, to falling rolls in village schools. How can the Welsh Assembly Government work in partnership with national parks, such as the Brecon Beacons, to consider ways of providing affordable housing to ensure

opportunities; people have greater choice and public sector employers cannot retain staff in the way that they can when unemployment is high. We have the money to pay for doctors, nurses and therapists, but recruitment has proved unsuccessful. Therefore, we must train more people to fill those vacancies. No-one in the world is doing more than us to increase the number of medical students—we will see an increase of 89 per cent on the 1999 figure by 2005. You cannot do much more than that.

**C7 Kirsty Williams:** Pa atebion sy'n cael eu datblygu i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy mewn ardaloedd gwledig? (OAQ19891)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi rheolaeth effeithiol i'r awdurdodau lleol dros fuddsoddi'r grant tai cymdeithasol, ac mae wedi datblygu dulliau mwy hyblyg o ddefnyddio'r buddsoddiad hwnnw i ddarparu tai i'w gosod ar rent neu ar gyfer perchnogaeth gost isel. Eleni, mae'r Cynulliad yn darparu mwy na £56 miliwn mewn grantiau tai cymdeithasol i helpu i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n cynnwys ardaloedd trefol yn ogystal â rhai gwledig. Os dymunant, gallai'r awdurdodau lleol wario'r cwbl o'r arian hwnnw ar y cynllun prynu cartref. Mae'n ddealladwy bod llawer o awdurdodau'n credu bod tai ar gyfer rhentu'n angen blaenoriaethol yn eu hardal. Mater iddynt hwy yw pwysa a mesur yr angen am dai ar gyfer rhentu a'r angen am y cynllun prynu cartref. Yr ydym wedi darparu'r arian.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae rheoli datblygu a phrisiau tai cynyddol ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog yn peri ei bod yn fwyfwy anodd i deuluoedd ifanc aros yn eu pentrefi. Nid yn unig y mae ffactorau o'r fath yn peri anawsterau i'r teuluoedd ond maent hefyd yn tanseilio cynaliadwyedd cymunedau gan arwain, er enghraifft, at ostyngiad yn nifer y plant mewn ysgolion pentref. Sut y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r parciau cenedlaethol, fel un Bannau Brycheiniog, i ystyried dulliau

families can remain in their villages?

**The First Minister:** One way is on the stocks right now: a proposed Assembly Order seeks to increase the number of rural areas where restrictions can apply to the right to acquire and resell property under the right-to-buy scheme. I understand that secondary legislation will be put to the Business Committee fairly soon. If it is approved, it would come into effect in early February. I am not sure whether Brecon Beacons is already covered by this measure. If the Assembly approves the Order, the restrictions would apply to a more extended area, and would enable authorities to hang on to existing social housing. That could annoy people because they expect that the right-to-buy scheme automatically applies to their area. However, sometimes, you must take another view on this matter because of the problems to which you rightly referred.

o ddarparu tai fforddiadwy i sicrhau y gall teuluoedd aros yn eu pentrefi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae un dull ar y gweill y funud hon: mae Gorchymyn Cynulliad wedi'i gynnig sy'n ceisio cynyddu nifer yr ardaloedd gwledig lle y gellir cymhwysyo cyfyngiadau at yr hawl i brynu ac ailwerthu eiddo o dan y cynllun hawl i brynu. Deallaf y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd honno'n cael ei rhoi gerbron y Pwyllgor Busnes yn eithaf buan. Os caiff ei chymeradwyo, deuai i rym ddechrau Chwefror. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw'r mesur hwn ar waith ym Mannau Brycheiniog eisoes. Os bydd y Cynulliad yn cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn, cai'r cyfyngiadau eu gweithredu dros ardal ehangach, a galluogai'r awdurdodau i ddal eu gfael ar y tai cymdeithasol presennol. Gallai hynny gythrudo pobl gan eu bod yn disgwyl bod y cynllun hawl i brynu'n berthnasol i'w hardal yn awtomatig. Fodd bynnag, weithiau rhaid ichi gymryd safbwyt gwahanol ar y mater hwn oherwydd y problemau y gwnaethoch gyfeirio'n briodol atynt.

**Elin Jones:** A dderbyniwch fod angen i'ch Llywodraeth roi arweiniad er mwyn datrys problem cyflogau isel a phrisiau tai uchel yng nghefn gwlad, ac nid yn unig rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb ar lywodraeth leol? A gytunwch â Phlaid Cymru fod angen strategaeth genedlaethol i sicrhau'r polisiau a'r cyllid i alluogi pobl ifanc i brynu cartrefi fforddiadwy yn eu cymuedau brodorol?

**Elin Jones:** Do you accept that your Government should take a lead in resolving the problem of low salaries and high house prices in rural areas, rather than simply leaving it to local government? Do you agree with Plaid Cymru that a national strategy is required to ensure that the policies and funding are in place to enable young people to access affordable homes in their own communities?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid trosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb mo hynny, ond, yn hytrach, cynnig dewis i'r awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â sut i weinyddu'r gwahanol gynlluniau yn ôl y blaenoriaethau a bennir ganddynt, a rhawn £56 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfer hynny: rhawn y cyfrifoldeb iddynt i ddewis. Er enghraifft, a ydynt eisiau rhoi pwyslais ar y cynllun prynu cartref, am mai prynu tŷ neu gamu ar ris gyntaf yr ysgol berchnogaeth sy'n bwysig yn eu hardal hwy, neu ai prinder tai rhent yw'r broblem? Penderfyniad yr awdurdodau lleol yw hynny. Cyn belled â'u bod yn derbyn yr arian, nhw ddylai benderfynu am mai nhw sydd yn deall y sefyllfa yn eu hardaloedd. Mae hynny'n rhesymol. Mae'r syniad y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn gyfrifol yn afresymol.

**The First Minister:** That is not transferring responsibility, but giving local authorities the choice of how to administer different schemes according to the priorities that they set, and we give them £56 million a year to that end: we give them the responsibility for making choices. For example, do they wish to place the emphasis on homebuy because helping buying a house or helping people onto the first step of the property ladder is important in their area? On the other hand, they may decide that the problem is a shortage of rented accommodation. That is a decision for local authorities. Providing that they receive the money, they should make the decisions because they understand the situation on the ground. That is reasonable. The idea that the Assembly Government

should be responsible is unreasonable.

**David Davies:** There is a concern that, when local authorities make affordable housing available, it often goes to people from outside the area. Do you not agree that local authorities should be able to give priority to people who come from within those areas?

**The First Minister:** That would be a matter for them. It depends whether you mean housing for rent or housing to buy. If you mean housing to buy via the homebuy scheme, then local authorities tend to consider their own needs in their housing needs assessments. We encourage local authorities to undertake housing needs assessments and we provide 50 per cent of the cost of such exercises. In their assessments, local authorities do not examine the housing needs of Wales or the UK as a whole, but local housing need. On the basis of those assessments, local authorities could emphasise providing more houses to rent or more houses to buy under the homebuy scheme.

**David Davies:** Mae pryder, pan fo awdurdodau lleol yn darparu tai fforddiadwy, eu bod yn mynd yn aml i bobl o'r tu allan i'r ardal. Onid ydych yn cytuno y dylai awdurdodau lleol allu rhoi blaenoriaeth i bobl sy'n hanu o'r ardaloedd hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai hynny'n fater iddynt hwy. Mae'n dibynnu a ydych yn golygu tai ar gyfer rhentu neu dai i'w prynu. Os ydych yn golygu tai i'w prynu drwy'r cynllun prynu cartref, mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn tueddu i ystyried eu hanghenion eu hunain yn eu hasesiadau anghenion tai. Yr ydym yn annog yr awdurdodau lleol i gynnal asesiadau anghenion tai a darparwn 50 y cant o gost ymarferion o'r fath. Yn eu hasesiadau, nid anghenion tai Cymru neu'r DU gyfan y mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn eu harchwilio, ond anghenion tai lleol. Ar sail yr asesiadau hynny, gallai'r awdurdodau lleol roi pwys ar ddarparu rhagor o dai ar gyfer eu rhentu neu ragor o dai i'w prynu dan y cynllun prynu cartref.

### Contractau Teiran Tripartite Contracts

**Q8 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister give an update on Wales's application for pilot schemes for 'tripartite contracts'? (OAQ19871)

**The First Minister:** No such application has been made because it is not possible to make an application for the tripartite contract. We have expressed an interest following the reference to tripartite contracts in Romano Prodi's White Paper on European governance. We met its author at our stakeholder meeting in Llandudno last year. The European Commission has yet to turn the reference in the Prodi White Paper into formal procedure to which you can apply. Therefore, although we are engaged in informal discussions with the commission about a possible tripartite contract on waste management, we are not that much further forward, and nor is anybody else in Europe who has expressed an interest in the coastal zone management tripartite contracts.

**C8 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r manylion diweddaraf ar gais Cymru i gynnal cynlluniau peilot ar gyfer 'contractau teiran'? (OAQ19871)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wnaed cais o'r fath gan na fu modd gwneud cais am y contract teiran. Gwnaethom fynegi diddordeb ar ôl y cyfeiriad at gcontractau teiran ym Mhapur Gwyn Romano Prodi ar lywodraethu Ewropeaidd. Gwnaethom gyfarfod â'i awdur yn ein cyfarfod i randdeiliaid yn Llandudno y llynedd. Hyd yn hyn nid yw'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi troi'r cyfeiriad ym Mhapur Gwyn Prodi yn weithdrefn ffurfiol y gallwch ymgeisio drwyddi. Felly, er ein bod yn cymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau anffurfiol gyda'r comisiwn am y posibilrwydd o gcontract teiran ar reoli gwastraff, nid ydym wedi mynd fawr pellach, yn yr un modd ag nad neb arall yn Ewrop sydd wedi mynegi diddordeb yn y contractau teiran ar reoli parthau arfordirol.

2.40 p.m.

**Janet Davies:** That is a surprising answer. I had understood that our application was being considered favourably. Can you give any further information on where you would consider implementing such a scheme if it were to go ahead, and what the financial implications would be?

**The First Minister:** The problem is that the Directorate General-Environment is keen on our scheme: it likes it. However, the problem is that there is no formal procedure by which it can be progressed. If there is, eventually, a formal scheme and it turns it into a kind of window through which you can pass if it is a good enough scheme—and I am confident that it will be—then we will go ahead as quickly as we can. That is what we have done on the nearest thing to a tripartite contract, namely the innovative actions contract, where we are blazing a trail in Europe. That comes under previous legislation for being able to act innovatively in one area rather than right across the area. We are making good progress in running the regional network and in taking certain other innovative actions in a similar area of environment and sustainable development. We have been doing that since January 2001, and it is proceeding well. I am sure that we can make similar progress once the commission decides how it wants to progress these tripartite contracts. It is an exciting concept, but has not yet been turned into reality.

**Janet Davies:** Mae'r ateb hwnnw'n un annisgwyl. Yr oeddwn wedi deall bod ein cais yn cael ei ystyried yn ffafriol. A allwch roi unrhyw wybodaeth bellach yngylch pa le y byddech yn ystyried gweithredu cynllun o'r fath pe byddai'n mynd ymlaen, a beth fyddai'r goblygiadau ariannol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y broblem yw bod Cyfarwyddiaeth Gyffredinol yr Amgylchedd yn frwd dros ein cynllun: mae'n ei hoffi. Fodd bynnag, y broblem yw nad oes gweithdrefn ffurfiol i'w ddatblygu. Os bydd cynllun ffurfiol, yn y pen draw, ac os yw'n troi'n rhyw fath o ffenestr y gallwch fynd drwyddi os yw'n gynllun digon da—ac yr wyf yn ffyddio y bydd—awn ymlaen mor gyflym ag y gallwn. Dyna a wnaethom yngylch y peth agosaf i contract teiran, sef y contract camau arloesol, lle'r ydym yn torri cwys newydd yn Ewrop. Daw hynny o dan ddeddfwriaeth flaenorol sy'n hwyluso arloesi mewn un rhan o ardal yn hytrach na'r ardal gyfan. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd da ar redeg y rhwydwaith rhanbarthol a chymryd rhai camau arloesol eraill ym maes datblygu amgylcheddol a datblygu cynaliadwy tebyg. Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny ers Ionawr 2001, ac mae'n mynd ymlaen yn dda. Yr wyf yn sier y gallwn wneud cynnydd tebyg wedi i'r comisiwn benderfynu sut y mae am ddatblygu'r contractau teiran hyn. Mae'n gysyniad cyffrous, ond nid yw wedi'i wireddu eto.

### **Hybu Iechyd Health Promotion**

**C9 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar hybu iechyd yng Nghymru? (OAQ19877)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hybu iechyd yn rhan allweddol o agwedd drawsbynciol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad at wella iechyd a lleihau anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Caiff hyn ei adlewyrchu yn 'Lles yng Nghymru' a'i roi ar waith gan rwydwaith cynlluniau ysgol iach Cymru, strategaeth faeth Cymru, a'r cynllun 'Iechyd ar Waith: Cyrraedd y Nod'.

**Q9 David Lloyd:** Will the First Minister make a statement on health promotion in Wales? (OAQ19877)

**The First Minister:** Health promotion is a key element in the Assembly Government's cross-cutting approach to improving health and reducing health inequalities. This is reflected in 'Wellbeing in Wales' and is demonstrated by the Welsh network of healthy school schemes, the nutrition strategy for Wales, and the Corporate Health Standard.

**David Lloyd:** Pa gamau a gymerwch i

**David Lloyd:** What steps are you taking to

hyrwyddo gwahardd ysmgyu mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym o blaid estyn gwaharddiadau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid delio ag anfodlonrwydd lleiafrif o aelodau staff sydd yn benderfynol o ysmgyu. Rhaid ceisio cefnogi a chymeradwyo awdurdodau yn y sector cyhoeddus i fwrw ymlaen ag estyn gwaharddiadau, a defnyddio perswâd i leihau'r canran o ymwelwyr neu staff sydd yn ysmgyu.

**Nick Bourne:** What do you say to Welsh patients in English hospitals who are forced to wait over a year longer than people living in England for vital heart surgery because of the Welsh Assembly Government's failure to sign up to the UK Government's patients' choice strategy?

**The First Minister:** We have a national service framework for coronary heart disease. That strategy is admired. It has the effect of extending the right to any coronary heart disease treatment in a 12-month period. That target may not have been reached to the absolute 't' yet, but only a few people are now waiting longer than 12 months for coronary heart disease treatment.

**Nick Bourne:** That was not reached as recently as August in the case of Mr Allars, who lives in north Wales. He was forced to wait 16 months. If he had been in England, he would have been dealt with in five months. I repeat my question. Why do we not sign up to the UK Government's patients' choice strategy, so that these patients would not have to wait so long before being seen? On a scale of one to 10, how would you rate your Government's progress in dealing with waiting lists in Wales?

**The First Minister:** A scale of one to 10 is irrelevant, because it depends on external events. What do you do, for example, in the case of Wrexham Maelor Hospital, which has had to close 11 wards because of the diarrhoea and vomiting virus that has hit it this week? That virus was imported from the community into the hospital, rather than the other way round. Such external events have a

promote a smoking ban in public buildings?

**The First Minister:** We are in favour of extending bans. However, we must deal with the discontentment of a minority of staff who are determined to smoke. We must try to support and encourage authorities in the public sector to go ahead with extending bans, and use persuasion to decrease the percentage of visitors and staff who smoke.

**Nick Bourne:** Beth a ddywedwch wrth gleifion o Gymru mewn ysbtyai yn Lloegr sy'n gorfod aros dros flwyddyn yn hwy na rhai sy'n byw yn Lloegr am lawdriniaeth hanfodol ar y galon oherwydd methiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymuno â strategaeth dewisiadau cleifion Llywodraeth y DU?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennym fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon. Mae'r strategaeth honno'n destun edmygedd. Ei heffaith yw estyn yr hawl i gael unrhyw driniaeth am glefyd coronaidd y galon mewn cyfnod o 12 mis. Efallai na chyrhaeddwyd y targed hwnnw'n union eto, ond dim ond ychydig o bobl sy'n disgwyl mwy na 12 mis bellach am driniaeth am glefyd coronaidd y galon.

**Nick Bourne:** Nis cyrhaeddwyd mor ddiweddar â mis Awst yn achos Mr Allars, sy'n byw yn y Gogledd. Fe'i gorfodwyd i ddisgwyl 16 mis. Byddai wedi'i drin ymhen pum mis pe busai yn Lloegr. Gofynnaf fy nghwestiwn eto. Pam na wnawn ni ymuno â strategaeth dewisiadau cleifion Llywodraeth y DU, fel na fyddai'n rhaid i'r cleifion hyn ddisgwyl mor hir cyn cael eu gweld? Ar raddfa o un i 10, beth fyddai'ch barn chi am gynnydd eich Llywodraeth wrth ddelio â'r rhestrau aros yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae graddfa o un i 10 yn amherthnasol, gan ei bod yn dibynnu ar ddigwyddiadau allanol. Beth a wneir, er enghraift, yn achos Ysbyty Wrecsam Maelor, sydd wedi gorfod cau 11 ward oherwydd y firws dolur rhydd a chyfogi a'i trawodd yr wythnos hon? Daethpwyd â'r firws hwnnw i'r ysbty o'r gymuned, yn hytrach nag fel arall. Caiff digwyddiadau

huge impact on a hospital's ability to treat emergency and waiting list admissions, and must be taken into account. The national service framework is progress. We currently have national service frameworks for diabetes and coronary heart disease and are introducing such frameworks for renal services and, possibly, arthritis. These frameworks are the best way forward if we are to guarantee quality treatment as outpatients, in-patients and at primary care level. Please write to me about the case that you mentioned, and I will ensure that complaints about the waiting time for treatment are addressed.

allanol o'r fath effaith aruthrol ar allu ysbyty i drin rhai a dderbynir ar frys ac ar restrau aros, a rhaid ystyried hynny. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn gam ymlaen. Mae gennym fframweithiau gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer y clefyd siwgwr a chlefyd coronaidd y galon ac yr ydym yn cyflwyno fframweithiau o'r fath ar gyfer gwasanaethau arenol ac, o bosibl, ar gyfer arthritis. Y fframweithiau hyn yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen os ydym i warantu triniaeth o ansawdd da i gleifion allanol, cleifion mewnol ac ar lefel gofal sylfaenol. Ysgrifennwch ataf, os gwelwch yn dda, ynghylch yr achos y gwnaethoch gyfeirio ato, a gwnaf sicrhau y rhoddir sylw i'r cwynion am yr amser aros am driniaeth.

**Brian Gibbons:** Will you welcome the importance placed in the health and wellbeing strategy on promoting health in the workplace? The fact that a growing number of people in Wales work provides a unique opportunity to promote health.

**The First Minister:** As so many more people now work, we can convey the public health message much more effectively in the workplace than if those people were unemployed and stuck at home, as many people were for years. It is an important adjunct, not only to raise awareness of occupational health risks, but also to convey general public health messages. Your suggestion is valuable, as the workplace is an ideal place in which to convey public health messages.

**Brian Gibbons:** A wnewch groesawu'r pwys a roddir yn y strategaeth iechyd a lles ar hybu iechyd yn y gweithle? Mae'r ffaith bod nifer cynyddol o bobl yng Nghymru'n gweithio yn cynnig cyfle unigryw i hybu iechyd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gan fod cynifer o bobl yn gweithio bellach, gallwn gyfleo'r neges am iechyd cyhoeddus yn fwy effeithiol o lawer yn y gweithle na pe buasai'r bobl hynny'n ddi-waith ac yn soudn yn eu cartrefi, fel yr oedd llawer o bobl am flynyddoedd. Mae'n gymorth pwysig, nid yn unig i hybu ymwybyddiaeth o risgau iechyd galwedigaethol, ond hefyd i gyfleo negeseuon cyffredinol am iechyd cyhoeddus. Mae'ch awgrym yn un gwerthfawr, gan fod y gweithle'n fan delfrydol i gyfleo negeseuon am iechyd cyhoeddus.

### Buddsoddi yng Ngogledd Sir Benfro Investment in North Pembrokeshire

**Q10 Richard Edwards:** What plans does the First Minister have to promote investment in north Pembrokeshire and to support economic development in the area in light of recent job losses? (OAQ19884)

**C10 Richard Edwards:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i hyrwyddo buddsoddi yng ngogledd Sir Benfro ac i gefnogi datblygiad economaidd yr ardal yn dilyn y swyddi a gollwyd yn ddiweddar? (OAQ19884)

**The First Minister:** I share your concerns about the job losses recently announced by Dewhirst and other companies in north Pembrokeshire. Team Wales is making every effort to attract new investment to this tier 1 assisted area. We can offer the highest levels

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhannaf eich pryderon ynghylch y colledion swyddi a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan Dewhirst a chwmniau eraill yng ngogledd sir Benfro. Mae Tîm Cymru yn gwneud pob ymdrech i ddenu buddsoddiad newydd i'r rhanbarth cymorth

of grant assistance in the UK to companies in north Pembrokeshire, and we will do so for eligible projects.

**Richard Edwards:** On the day on which the media trumpet a 30 per cent increase in Marks and Spencer's profits, communities in north Pembrokeshire and elsewhere in west Wales are paying the price. Marks and Spencer's principal supplier, Dewhirst, has abandoned its operations in Wales and the Welsh workplace that served it so loyally in order to exploit the slave economy of north Africa. Will you join me in welcoming the Minister for Economic Development's proposed visit to Fishguard in my constituency to hear the concerns of local people and to discuss plans, including forward-looking plans advocated by local business people, to rejuvenate the area?

**The First Minister:** I understand that that visit will take place later this month. There are plenty of ideas on how we can ensure a greater diversity of employment in north Pembrokeshire in future; it is simply a case of hitting it lucky with an individual investor or a succession of investors. Your point about Marks and Spencer is interesting. It is true that, two or three years ago, Marks and Spencer was pushing hard to reduce the amount of UK sourcing for its clothing, because the company was making a loss. That was a direct cause of the Bairdwear crisis in the early days of the Assembly's existence. My recent impression is that, as Marks and Spencer's profitability improved, it was happy for Dewhirst to continue producing in west Wales, but that Dewhirst decided to move all its production to Morocco. That move was at Dewhirst's behest, not that of Marks and Spencer.

**Cynog Dafis:** Dŵr dan y bont ydyw Dewhirst a Marks and Spencer bellach. Yr ydym angen rhywbeth amgen i 'hitting it lucky' yng ngogledd Penfro. Mae Abergwaun angen sylw a buddsoddiad cyhoeddus sylweddol. A gytunwch fod angen pecyn adfywio cynhwysfawr ar gyfer Abergwaun, wedi'i gefnogi gan gyllid sylweddol? Dylai pecyn o'r fath gynnwys materion megis cludiant a gwella'r amgylchedd trefol. A

haen 1 hwn. Gallwn gynnig y lefelau uchaf o gymorth grant yn y DU i gwmniau yng ngogledd sir Benfro, a gwnawn hynny ar gyfer prosiectau cymwys.

**Richard Edwards:** Ar y diwrnod y mae'r cyfryngau'n datgan 30 y cant o gynnydd yn elw Marks and Spencer, mae cymunedau yng ngogledd sir Benfro ac mewn mannau eraill yn y Gorllewin yn talu'r pris. Mae prif gyflenwr Marks and Spencer, Dewhirst, wedi gadael ei weithrediadau yng Nghymru a'r gweithlu yng Nghymru a'i gwasanaethodd mor deyrngar er mwyn manteisio ar economi caethion gogledd Affrica. A wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu ymweliad arfaethedig y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ag Abergwaun yn fy etholaeth i i wrando pryderon y bobl leol a thrafod cynlluniau, gan gynnwys cynlluniau blaengar a argymhellir gan bobl busnes leol, i adfywio'r ardal?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Deallaf mai yn ddiweddarach yn y mis hwn y bydd yr ymweliad hwnnw. Mae digonedd o syniadau ynghylch sut y gallwn sicrhau cyflogaeth fwy amrywiol yng ngogledd sir Benfro yn y dyfodol; nid yw ond yn fater o daro ergyd lwcus a chael un buddsodwr neu ddilinyiant o fuddsoddwyr. Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch am Marks and Spencer yn un diddorol. Mae'n wir bod Marks and Spencer, ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl, yn gweithio'n galed i leihau maint y dillad yr oedd yn ei gael o'r DU, gan fod y cwmni'n gwneud colled. Hynny oedd achos uniongyrchol argyfwng Bairdwear yn nyddiau cynnar y Cynulliad. Yr argraff a gaf yn ddiweddar yw bod Marks and Spencer yn fodlon, wrth i'w broffidioldeb wella, i Dewhirst barhau i gynhyrchu yng ngorllewin Cymru, ond bod Dewhirst wedi penderfynu symud ei holl gynhyrchu i Foroco. Yr oedd y symud hwnnw ar orchymyn Dewhirst, nid Marks and Spencer.

**Cynog Dafis:** Dewhirst and Marks and Spencer are water under the bridge by now. We need an alternative to 'hitting it lucky' in north Pembrokeshire. Fishguard needs attention and substantial public investment. Do you agree that a comprehensive regeneration package for Fishguard is required, backed by substantial funding? Such a package should cover issues such as transport and enhancing the urban

gytunwch hefyd y dylid ystyried mynedfa newydd i'r ysgol uwchradd a'r ganolfan hamdden fel rhan o'r pecyn hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn faint o swyddi y byddai hynny'n ei greu. Natur creu swyddi yw mai mater o daro'n lwcus ydyw yn y pen draw. Mae pecyn buddsoddi ar gyfer yr amgylchedd ac i greu ystadau diwydiannol sy'n ddeniadol i fusnesau yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw rhaid i chi ysgwyd llaw a tharo bargin â rhywun sydd eisiau dod i'r ardal ac mae hynny'n cynnwys elfen o lwc. Nid yw'n bosib gwneud hynny heb elfen o lwc. Dyna'r wers y mae'n rhaid inni ei dysgu. Mater o lwc ydyw yn y pen draw a yw rhywun am symud i Abergwaun neu i ardal arall. Mae hynny'n anffodus, ond dyna'r gwirionedd.

environment. Do you also agree that a new entrance to the secondary school and the leisure centre should be considered as part of that package?

**The First Minister:** I do not know how many jobs that would create. At the end of the day, it is a matter of hitting it lucky; that is the nature of job creation. An investment package for the environment and the creation of industrial estates that are attractive to businesses is important. However, eventually you must shake hands and strike a bargain with someone who wants to come into the area, and there is an element of luck in that. It is not possible to do that without an element of luck. That is the lesson that we must learn. At the end of the day, it is a matter of luck whether someone wants to move to Fishguard or to any other area. It is unfortunate, but that is the reality.

2.50 p.m.

### Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Lorraine Barrett:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7. It seems a minor issue, but this afternoon, a Member asked an usher to distribute copies of notices about a meeting this evening. It was unnecessary to cause that kind of commotion in the Chamber when we have a perfectly adequate e-mail system that can deliver notices and reminders for the many all-party group and other evening meetings that take place.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7. Mae'n ymddangos yn fater bach, ond y prynhawn yma, gofynnodd Aelod i dywysydd ddosbarthu copïau o hysbysiadau am gyfarfod heno. Nid oedd angen peri cynnwrf o'r fath yn y Siambra ninnau â system e-bost gwbl ddigonol sy'n gallu anfon hysbysiadau a nodiadau atgoffa ar gyfer y nifer fawr o gyfarfodydd pob plaid a chyfarfodydd eraill sy'n digwydd gyda'r hwyr.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to you for raising that point of order because it is difficult enough to manage question time from this position, and to see all Members and call all of those who wish to contribute, without having unnecessary movement in the Chamber.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am godi'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw gan ei bod yn ddigon anodd cadw trefn ar y sesiwn cwestiynau o'r fan hon, a gweld yr holl Aelodau a galw ar bawb sy'n dymuno cyfrannu, heb gael unrhyw symud diangen yn y Siambra.

**Brian Hancock:** Further to that point of order, I apologise to everybody concerned. I wanted to bring this important issue to everybody's attention and, unfortunately, I did not get the copies to the usher quickly enough. I apologise for any inconvenience—*[Interruption.]*

**Brian Hancock:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ymddiheuraf i bawb dan sylw. Yr oeddwn am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw pawb a, gwaetha'r modd, ni roddais y copïau i'r tywysydd yn ddigon buan. Ymddiheuraf am unrhyw anhwylustod—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is not appropriate to request Assembly ushers to distribute material, particularly during sittings. I ask Members in future to use the electronic means that we have at our disposal, which is perfectly adequate to remind Members of any event that may be taking place in this Assembly.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This arises from question time and relates to Members under Standing Order No. 3. I wondered whether Plaid Cymru wished to make a statement about a change to its policy on independence. Cynog Dafis referred to the ‘nightmare of independence’, which I thought signalled an important change.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That is not a matter for me. I have no responsibility for the policy of any party in the Chamber when I sit in this Chair. However, out of this Chair it is a different matter

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n briodol gofyn i dywyswyr y Cynulliad ddosbarthu deunydd darllen, yn enwedig yn ystod sesiynau. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau ddefnyddio'r dulliau electronig sydd ar gael i ni o hyn allan, gan eu bod yn gwbl ddigonol i atgoffa'r Aelodau am unrhyw ddigwyddiad a allai fod yn y Cynulliad hwn.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn codi o'r sesiwn cwestiynau ac yn ymwneud â'r Aelodau o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 3. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl tybed a oedd Plaid Cymru'n dymuno gwneud datganiad am newid yn ei pholisi ar annibyniaeth. Cyfeiriodd Cynog Dafis at 'hunllef annibyniaeth', y credais ei fod yn arwydd o newid pwysig.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hynny'n fater i mi. Nid oes gennyl unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros bolisi unrhyw blaidd yn y Siambra pan wyf yn eistedd yn y Gadair hon. Fodd bynnag, pan na fyddaf yn y Gadair hon, mae'n fater gwahanol.

### **Datganiad ar y Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles Statement on the Health and Well-being Partnership Council**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** 'Improving Health in Wales', our plan for the NHS with its partners, set out the framework for a new pluralism in NHS policy-making in Wales. Key to this is the creation of a new national Health and Well-being Partnership Council for Wales to support the Assembly's statutory responsibilities as we seek to provide opportunities for our stakeholders to play their part in guiding the strategic direction of the NHS in Wales.

Creating the council re-emphasises this Assembly Government's commitment to listening to the communities it serves. As we know, health crosses many boundaries and touches many lives. That diversity requires the Assembly to ensure that health policy making seeks to take account of those diverse influences. The national steering group, set up to oversee the progress and implementation of the NHS plan in Wales, bore many of the hallmarks of a national council. The steering group was therefore

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru', ein cynllun i'r GIG gyda'i bartneriaid, a nododd y fframwaith ar gyfer lloosrywiaeth newydd yn y gwaith o lunio polisi GIG yng Nghymru. Un rhan allweddol o hynny yw creu Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles cenedlaethol newydd i Gymru i ategu cyfrifoldebau statudol y Cynulliad wrth inni geisio darparu cyfleoedd i'n rhanddeiliaid chwarae eu rhan wrth arwain cyfeiriad strategol y GIG yng Nghymru.

Mae creu'r cyngor yn ailbwysleisio ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon i wrando ar y cymunedau y mae'n eu gwasanaethu. Fel y gwyddom, mae iechyd yn croesi llawer o ffiniau ac yn cyffwrdd â llawer o fywydau. Mae'r amrywiaeth honno'n golygu bod rhaid i'r Cynulliad sicrhau bod y gwaith o lunio polisi iechyd yn ystyried y dylanwadau amrywiol hynny. Yr oedd y grŵp llywio cenedlaethol, a sefydlwyd i oruchwyllo cynnydd a gweithrediad y cynllun GIG yng Nghymru,

allowed to conclude its work before the council was created. The last meeting of the group took place just before the summer recess. I place on record my gratitude to everyone who willingly gave of their time and expertise to guide us through the first phase of the renewal process. However, there is much more work to be done. The renewal of NHS Wales is not just about structures—they are the means to an end. The council will have a real and important contribution to make in how we create and deliver health and wellbeing policies in Wales.

The council will give the Assembly access to a rich source of opinion and advice about all facets of improving health in Wales. The council will have the broadest possible perspective on the health and wellbeing agenda. The organisations from which members will be drawn will also have specific expertise that the council will be able to harness and rely upon, whenever appropriate, for its own purposes. The council will therefore support the Welsh Assembly Government in discharging its responsibilities for improving health and engaging a full range of stakeholders in the development of policies and plans. It will provide advice on policy and process issues and monitor progress in the implementation of the NHS plan. It will commission advice from other fora and groups on health and wellbeing issues, and advise on what further action is necessary as the implementation programme for the NHS plan progresses.

I want the council to build on the inclusive approach that has proved so effective in the renewal process through the national steering group and its working groups. I will seek representatives from the broadest possible range of interests, including patient groups, the voluntary sector, social care, local government, NHS staff and professional bodies. Senior Assembly officials will support the council and will assist members by providing detailed commentary across my portfolio. More importantly, they will listen to the views expressed by members and use them appropriately in the health and wellbeing strategy and policy development.

yn meddu ar lawer o nodweddion cyngor cenedlaethol. Gan hynny, caniatawyd i'r grŵp llywio gwblhau ei waith cyn creu'r cyngor. Bu cyfarfod olaf y grŵp ychydig cyn toriad yr haf. Rhoddaf ar gof a chadw fy niolchiadau i bawb a roddodd yn barod o'u hamser a'u harbenigedd i'n harwain drwy gyfnod cyntaf y broses adnewyddu. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer mwy o waith i'w wneud. Nid yw adnewyddu GIG Cymru yn ymwneud â strwythurau'n unig—maent yn fod i gyflawni nod. Bydd gan y cyngor gyfraniad gwirioneddol a phwysig i'r modd yr ydym yn creu ac yn cyflawni polisiau iechyd a lles yng Nghymru.

Bydd y cyngor yn cynnig ffynhonnell gyfoethog o farn a chyngor i'r Cynulliad am bob agwedd ar wella iechyd yng Nghymru. Bydd gan y cyngor y golwg ehangach posibl ar yr agenda iechyd a lles. Bydd y cyrff y tynnir yr aelodau ohonynt yn meddu hefyd ar arbenigedd penodol y bydd y cyngor y gallu ei ddefnyddio a dibynnu arno, pryd bynnag y bo'n briodol, i'w ddibenion ei hun. Gan hynny, bydd y cyngor yn gymorth i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth iddi gyflawni ei chyfrifoldebau dros wella iechyd a chysylltu ag amrediad cyflawn o randdeiliaid wrth ddatblygu polisiau a chynlluniau. Bydd yn darparu cyngor ar faterion polisi a phrosesau ac yn monitro'r cynnydd wrth weithredu'r cynllun GIG. Bydd yn comisiynu cyngor gan fforymau a grwpiau eraill ar faterion iechyd a lles, ac yn rhoi gwybod am y camau ychwanegol a fydd yn angenrheidiol wrth i'r rhaglen weithredu ar gyfer y cynllun GIG fynd yn ei blaen.

Yr wyf yn dymuno i'r cyngor adeiladu ar sail y dull cynhwysol a brofodd mor effeithiol yn y broses adnewyddu drwy'r grŵp llywio cenedlaethol a'i weithgorau. Ceisaf gynrychiolwyr o'r amrediad ehangaf posibl o fuddiannau, gan gynnwys grwpiau cleifion, y sector gwirfoddol, gofal cymdeithasol, llywodraeth leol, staff y GIG a chyrff proffesiynol. Bydd uwch swyddogion y Cynulliad yn cynorthwyo'r cyngor ac yn helpu'r aelodau drwy ddarparu sylwadau manwl am bob rhan o'm portffolio. Yn bwysicach na hynny, byddant yn gwrando ar y farn a fynegir gan yr aelodau a'i defnyddio'n briodol yn y strategaeth iechyd a lles ac wrth ddatblygu polisi.

The council will be charged with taking into account the Assembly's responsibilities to promote equality of opportunity and sustainable development and to tackle social disadvantage and health inequalities. It will meet at least twice a year and I plan to hold the first meeting early in 2003. That will allow sufficient time for member organisations to agree on who should represent their interests on the council. It is also an appropriate time to gather our key stakeholders and partners together as the structural reforms, which so many have worked hard to develop, are about to come to fruition. All meetings will be open to the public and, to this end, the meetings will be held at different venues across Wales. The Assembly internet site will also be used to ensure widespread access to details about the council and its work.

The creation of the national Health and Well-being Partnership Council is another important step forward in the renewal process. It is a further expression of the Assembly's willingness to listen. However, listening is not enough. The people of Wales rightly expect to see evidence that we have listened in the strategies and policies developed as a result.

Over the coming weeks, I will seek nominations for the council. I look forward to working with the council as we pursue the shared aim of creating a NHS in Wales that is more responsive to the needs of our population and is well equipped to meet the challenges of the twenty-first century.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a general practitioner and a member of the City and County of Swansea Council.

Establishing a Health and Well-being Partnership Council is part of the NHS restructuring process, which we have discussed at length recently and which we will no doubt discuss again. Health and wellbeing, as a policy area, is becoming crowded. It seems to be everyone's concern. That is how it should be in some respects, but I am confused about how the new council will tally with existing structures. How will the council interface with public health,

Ymddiriedir i'r cyngor y gwaith o ystyried cyfrifoldebau'r Cynulliad i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb cyfle a datblygu cynaliadwy ac i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol ac anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Bydd yn cyfarfod o leiaf ddwywaith y flwyddyn a bwriadaf gynnal y cyfarfod cyntaf ar ddechrau 2003. Bydd hynny'n caniatáu digon o amser i'r aelod gyrrf gytuno pwy a ddylai gynrychioli eu buddiannau ar y cyngor. Mae hefyd yn gyfnod priodol i ddod â'n prif randdeiliaid a phartneriaid at ei gilydd gan fod y diwygiadau strwythurol, y gweithiodd cynifer yn galed i'w datblygu, ar fin dwyn ffrwyth. Bydd yr holl gyfarfodydd yn agored i'r cyhoedd ac, i'r diben hwn, cynhelir y cyfarfodydd mewn gwahanol ganolfannau ledled Cymru. Defnyddir gwefan y Cynulliad hefyd i sicrhau bod manylion am y cyngor a'i waith ar gael yn gyffredinol.

Mae creu'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles cenedlaethol yn gam pwysig arall yn y broses adnewyddu. Mae'n fynegiant pellach o barodrwydd y Cynulliad i wrando. Fodd bynnag, nid yw gwrando'n ddigon. Mae'n iawn i bobl Cymru ddisgwyl gweld tystiolaeth ein bod wedi gwrando yn y strategaethau a'r polisiau a ddatblygir o ganlyniad.

Dros yr wythnosau i ddod, byddaf yn ceisio enwebiadau i'r cyngor. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda'r cyngor wrth inni gyrchu'r nod gyffredin o greu GIG yng Nghymru sy'n fwy ymatebol i anghenion ein poblogaeth ac yn barod i ateb heriau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel ymarferwr cyffredinol ac aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe.

Mae sefydlu Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles yn rhan o broses ailstrwythuro'r GIG, yr ydym wedi'i thrafod yn faith yn ddiweddar ac y byddwn yn sicr o'i thrafod eto. Mae iechyd a lles, fel maes polisi, yn mynd yn orlawn. Ymddengys ei fod yn fusnes i bawb. Felly y dylai fod ar rai ystyron, ond yr wyf mewn penbleth yngylch y modd y bydd y cyngor newydd yn cyd-fynd â'r strwythurau presennol. Sut y bydd y cyngor yn rhwyngwynebu â chyrff iechyd cyhoeddus,

environmental health and occupational health bodies, and with England and Wales bodies such as the National Institute for Clinical Excellence and the Food Standards Agency, which have an interest in this? What will its interface be with the Wales Centre for Health, which has a health and wellbeing remit, and the Primary Care Directorate, which is at the forefront, I would say—but then I would say that, would I not—with regard to the community contribution to health and wellbeing? That is, once the Primary Care Directorate has managed to appoint a director. How will the council co-ordinate with local health boards and local government, which are also in the process of forming health and wellbeing strategies? Also, what budget will be allocated to this new body and what will its terms of reference be? In other words, when the council meets twice a year, what will it do that is not being done at present?

**Jane Hutt:** We are looking for a national perspective and focus for our stakeholders and partners to influence matters. Local health boards will also consist of representatives of health, voluntary sector, social care and local government interests. They will be charged with developing and implementing local health and wellbeing social care strategies.

3.00 p.m.

At a national level, we need to provide the opportunity for our partners and stakeholders to help advise, guide and consider how we take forward the all-Wales aspects of ‘Improving Health in Wales’. That will sit comfortably alongside the development of our national public health service, which has recently appointed Dr Cerilan Rogers as its director. We must remember that the Wales Centre for Health is an independent body. It is an independent source of advice and guidance for the health service, local government, voluntary and community groups. I am delighted by Dr Eddie Coyle’s appointment as its director. The Primary Care Directorate will be a vital part of the renewed NHS Directorate in the Welsh Assembly Government. The Primary Care Directorate will be key to the implementation of our

iechyd amgylcheddol ac iechyd galwedigaethol, a chyda chyrff i Gymru a Lloegr fel y Sefydliad Rhagoriaeth Glinigol Genedlaethol a’r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, sydd â buddiant yn hyn? Sut y bydd yn rhngwynebu â Chanolfan Iechyd Cymru, sydd â chylch gorchwyl mewn iechyd a lles, a’r Gyfarwyddiaeth Gofal Sylfaenol, sydd yn y rheng flaen, ddywedwn i—ond dyna’n union a ddywedwn i, onid ef—o ran y cyfraniad cymunedol at iechyd a lles? Hynny yw, wedi i’r Gyfarwyddiaeth Gofal Sylfaenol lwyddo i benodi cyfarwyddwr. Sut y bydd y cyngor yn cydlynú â’r byrddau iechyd lleol a llywodraeth leol, sydd hefyd ar ganol ffurfio strategaethau iechyd a lles? Hefyd, pa gyllideb a ddyrennir i’r corff newydd hwn a beth fydd ei gylch gwaith? Mewn geiriau eraill, pan fydd y cyngor yn cwrdd ddwywaith y flwyddyn, beth a wnaiff nad yw’n cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym yn chwilio am bersbectif a ffocws cenedlaethol ar gyfer ein rhanddeiliaid a’n partneriaid i ddylanwadu ar faterion sy’n codi. Bydd y byrddau iechyd lleol hefyd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr buddiannau iechyd, y sector gwirfoddol, gofal cymdeithasol a llywodraeth leol. Rhoddir gofal iddynt am y gwaith o ddatblygu a gweithredu strategaethau gofal cymdeithasol iechyd a lles lleol.

Ar lefel genedlaethol, rhaid inni ddarparu cyfle i’n partneriaid a’n rhanddeiliaid gynorthwyo, cyngori, arwain ac ystyried sut y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â’r agweddau Cymru-gyfan ar ‘Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru’. Bydd hynny’n cyd-fynd yn rhwydd â datblygu ein gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol, sydd wedi penodi Dr Cerilan Rogers yn gyfarwyddwr iddo’n ddiweddar. Rhaid inni gofio mai corff annibynnol yw Canolfan Iechyd Cymru. Mae’n ffynhonnell cyngor ac arweiniad annibynnol i’r gwasanaeth iechyd, llywodraeth leol, a grwpiau gwirfoddol a chymunedol. Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod Dr Eddie Coyle wedi’i benodi’n gyfarwyddwr arni. Bydd y Gyfarwyddiaeth Gofal Sylfaenol yn rhan hanfodol o’r Gyfarwyddiaeth GIG adnewyddiedig yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad

primary care strategy, which the local health boards will take forward. It is important that the stakeholders, the staff and professional organisations in the NHS, local government and the social care and voluntary sectors, have access to the Minister in the public arena to influence and advise us on our all-Wales ambitions to improve health and wellbeing. It is a vital part of the renewal of the NHS and it will ensure influence at the top of the organisation that will mirror the influence on the local health boards of the multidisciplinary teams that are being established.

**David Melding:** On this day of all days, I do not want to pour water on your bonfire, and the establishment of a council could be useful in terms of the new structures and how we relate to the wider health community. However, some issues go to the core of your approach. We have a highly centralised system. As I have said before, we now have a health commissar calling the shots. People want to know how independent this new council will be. For example, who will chair it? I can only infer from the statement that you will convene the first meeting early next year, that you will chair this new body. Will you explain how that will be a productive step? Are you not just an incey-wincey bit concerned that you might spike the criticism that might otherwise arise in a free flow of ideas? To pursue that theme, if you were present as our chief representative, would other Assembly politicians, such as the opposition spokespeople, also be involved? Equally important, would the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee also serve on this council? The council must be vigorous and independent. To have a Supreme Soviet meet a few times a year to applaud you is not the way forward. I am already concerned that the council will meet only twice a year as a minimum. Does it not need to meet four to six times a year to effectively contribute to policy development? I hope that you can answer my questions because, unless this organisation is seen to be robust and independent of you as the Minister, we will miss an opportunity.

Cymru. Bydd y Gyfarwyddiaeth Gofal Sylfaenol yn hollbwysig yng ngweithrediad ein strategaeth gofal sylfaenol, y bydd y byrddau iechyd lleol yn ei hyrwyddo. Mae'n bwysig bod y rhanddeiliaid, y staff a'r cyrff proffesiynol yn y GIG, llywodraeth leol a'r sectorau gofal cymdeithasol a gwirfoddol, yn gallu cysylltu â'r Gweinidog yn y maes cyhoeddus i ddylanwadu arnom a'n cynghori yngylch ein dyheadau ar gyfer Cymru gyfan i wella iechyd a lles. Mae'n rhan hollbwysig o'r gwaith o adnewyddu'r GIG a bydd yn sicrhau dylanwad ym mhen uchaf y corff a fydd yn adlewyrchu'r dylanwad ar y byrddau iechyd lleol gan y timau amlddisgyblaethol sy'n cael eu sefydlu.

**David Melding:** O'r holl ddyddiau yn y flwyddyn, nid wyf am daflu dŵr ar ben eich coelcerth heddiw, a gallai sefydlu cyngor fod yn fuddiol yng nghyd-destun y strwythurau newydd a sut yr ydym yn cysylltu â'r gymuned iechyd ehangach. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai materion yn mynd at wraidd eich dull o weithredu. Mae gennym system dra chanoledig. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, mae gennym gomisâr iechyd yn awr i ddweud sut y mae pethau i fod. Mae pobl am wybod pa mor annibynnol y bydd y cyngor newydd hwn. Er enghraifft, pwy fydd yn ei gadeirio? Ni allaf ond casglu o'r datganiad y byddwch yn cynnull y cyfarfod cyntaf ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf, mai chi fydd yn cadeirio'r corff newydd hwn. A wnewch egluro sut y bydd hynny'n gam cynhyrchiol? Onid ydych ychydig bach yn bryderus y gallech roi pen ar y feirniadaeth a allai godi fel arall pe byddai syniadau'n llifo'n ddi-rwystr? Gan ddilyn y thema honno, os oeddech chi'n bresennol fel ein prif gynrychiolydd, a fyddai gwleidyddion Cynulliad eraill, fel llefaryddion yr wrthblaid, yn cymryd rhan hefyd? A'r un mor bwysig â hynny, a fyddai Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol hefyd yn gwasanaethu ar y cyngor hwn? Rhaid i'r cyngor fod yn egniol ac yn annibynnol. Nid cynnull Sofiet Goruchaf ychydig o weithiau y flwyddyn i'ch canmol yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Yr wyf hefyd yn bryderus mai dim ond dwywaith y flwyddyn o leiaf y bydd y cyngor yn cwrdd. Onid oes angen iddo gwrdd bedair i chwe gwaith y flwyddyn i gyfrannu'n effeithiol at ddatblygu polisi? Gobeithiaf y gallwch ateb fy nghwestiynau oherwydd, oni

welir bod y corff yn gadarn ac yn annibynnol arnoch chi fel y Gweinidog, byddwn yn colli cyfle.

**Jane Hutt:** I am glad that you acknowledge that the council could be of use. It will consist of external, independent stakeholders, who are keen to move forward with the renewal and reform of the national health service with our partners. That is why we are setting up the council: to mirror at a national level the vigorous local teams that will represent interests on the local health boards. That influence is also needed at the national level. I chaired the steering group and—as you know, given that it led through from the publication of our plan—we had a vigorous set of working groups.

Over 500 people were involved in our consultation process last summer. They were all independent people drawn from the health service, local government, the trade unions, the voluntary sector and patient groups. They all wanted to have a say about how we should move the renewal and reform of the NHS forward in Wales, and about how we can deliver joined-up health and social care and joined-up government, which we will do at a local level through our integrated local health boards. The body will be an open advisory one that will meet in public and which will have an opportunity to use its voice. It will have a role similar to that of the national steering group, which influenced me as Minister as I took us through our consultations last year. It is appropriate that the Minister of the Welsh Assembly Government be the one to listen. The Minister should chair that body so that he or she can listen to advice from that wide range of independent stakeholders. Of course, Assembly Members will have an opportunity almost daily, in the Health and Social Services Committee and in Plenary, to influence debate, question the Minister and scrutinise plans as they are being implemented. It is important that we allow stakeholders to play an independent role in the public arena and to influence, advise and guide the Welsh Assembly Government as we take forward and implement those reforms and plans.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cydnabod y gallai'r cyngor fod yn ddefnyddiol. Bydd yn cynwys rhanddeiliaid allanol, annibynnol, sy'n awyddus i fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o adnewyddu a diwygio'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol gyda'n partneriaid. Dyna pam yr ydym yn sefydlu'r cyngor: i adlewyrchu ar lefel genedlaethol y timau lleol egniol a fydd yn cynrychioli buddiannau ar y byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae angen y dylanwad hwnnw hefyd ar lefel genedlaethol. Myfi a gadeiriodd y grŵp llywio ac—fel y gwyddoch, o ystyried ei fod dilyn cyhoeddi ein cynllun—cawsom set egniol o weithgorau.

Bu i dros 500 o bobl gymryd rhan yn ein proses ymgynghori yr haf diwethaf. Yr oeddent oll yn bobl annibynnol o'r gwasanaeth iechyd, llywodraeth leol, yr undebau llafur, y sector gwirfoddol a grwpiau cleifion. Yr oeddent oll am gael dweud sut y dylem fwrw ymlaen ag adnewyddu a diwygio'r GIG yng Nghymru, a sut y gallwn ddarparu iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol cydgysylltiedig a llywodraeth gydgysylltiedig, a wnawn ar lefel leol drwy ein byrddau iechyd lleol integredig. Bydd y corff yn un ymgynghorol agored a fydd yn cwrdd yn gyhoeddus ac a gaiff gyfle i leisio barn. Caiff rôl debyg i un y grŵp llywio cenedlaethol, a ddyylanwadodd arnaf fel Gweinidog wrth imi fynd â ni drwy ein hymgyngoriadau y llynedd. Mae'n briodol mai Gweinidog Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a ddylai fod yno i wrando. Y Gweinidog a ddylai gadeirio'r corff hwnnw fel y gall wrando ar y cyngor gan yr amrediad eang hwnnw o randdeiliaid annibynnol. Wrth gwrs, caiff Aelodau'r Cynulliad gyfle bob diwrnod bron, yn y Pwyllgor lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, i ddyylanwadu ar y ddadl, i holi'r Gweinidog ac archwilio'r cynlluniau wrth iddynt gael eu gweithredu. Mae'n bwysig inni ganiatâu i'r rhanddeiliaid chwarae rôl annibynnol yn y maes cyhoeddus a dylanwadu, cynghori ac arwain Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth inni fwrw ymlaen i weithredu'r diwygiadau a'r cynlluniau hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** I welcome the establishment of the Health and Well-being Partnership Council. It is an important step forward. The body will have an important future and there will be huge scope for its development. Can the Minister give further details on the exact make-up of the council, and the balance of the representation of patient groups, the voluntary sector and health professionals? I welcome the fact that those groups will be represented, but it would be interesting to know in what numbers they will be represented.

Can the Minister also assure me that there will be the widest possible representation of NHS staff and professionals on the body so that staff from across the NHS will be represented, not just clinicians and doctors? Can the Minister outline what support might be available to patient representatives preparing to carry out their role? They often find contributing to such bodies intimidating.

**Jane Hutt:** The Health and Well-being Partnership Council for Wales will mirror the national steering group, which included representatives from the Welsh Local Government Association, the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, the Trades Union Congress, the NHS Confederation, community health councils, trade unions and allied health professionals. The group was inclusive and wide-ranging and offered many of the partners and stakeholders their first opportunity to influence the shaping and renewal of the health service in Wales. In the draft budget, and in the plans to engage with the voluntary sector in our local health boards, we have supported 'Building Strong Bridges', which will provide £3 million over the next three years to support the voluntary sector in the role that it will play in local health boards. I foresee that 'Building Strong Bridges' will also enable us to support that sector's role at a national level in the council. We must ensure that the council is wide-ranging and inclusive and that it allows all voices to be heard. The numbers must be extensive. The council will be formal and will work in the public arena. It will be supported by Assembly staff, and we may look to it to commission further support,

**Kirsty Williams:** Croesawaf sefydlu'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles. Mae'n gam pwysig ymlaen. Mae dyfodol pwysig o flaen y corff a bydd cyfle aruthrol i'w ddatblygu. A oes modd i'r Gweinidog roi manylion pellach am union wneuthuriad y cyngor, a'r cydbwysedd yng nghynrychiolaeth y grwpiau cleifion, y sector gwirfoddol a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol? Croesawaf y ffaith y bydd cynrychiolaeth i'r grwpiau hynny, ond byddai'n ddiddorol gwybod nifer eu cynrychiolwyr.

A all y Gweinidog fy sicrhau hefyd y ceir y gynrychiolaeth ehangaf posibl o staff a gweithwyr proffesiynol y GIG ar y corff fel y ceir cynrychiolaeth o'r staff ym mhob rhan o'r GIG, ac nid y clinigwyr a'r meddygon yn unig? A oes modd i'r Gweinidog ddisgrifio'r cymorth a allai fod ar gael i gynrychiolwyr cleifion wrth iddynt baratoi i gyflawni eu rôl? Yn aml maent yn cael bod cyfrannu i gyrrff o'r fath yn brofiad sy'n codi ofn.

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd y Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles i Gymru'n adlewyrchu'r grŵp llywio cenedlaethol, a oedd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur, Cydffederasiwn y GIG, cynghorau iechyd cymunedol, undebau llafur a gweithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd. Yr oedd y grŵp yn gynhwysol ac yn gynhwysfawr a chynigiodd y cyfle cyntaf i lawer o'r partneriaid a'r rhanddeiliaid gael dylanwadu ar siapio ac adnewyddu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Yn y gyllideb ddrafft, ac yn y cynlluniau i ymwneud â'r sector gwirfoddol yn ein byrddau iechyd lleol, yr ydym wedi cefnogi 'Codi Pontydd Cadarn', a fydd yn darparu £3 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i gynorthwyo'r sector gwirfoddol yn y rôl y bydd yn ei chwarae yn y byrddau iechyd lleol. Rhagwelaf y bydd 'Codi Pontydd Cadarn' yn ein galluogi hefyd i ategu rôl y sector hwnnw ar lefel genedlaethol yn y cyngor. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cyngor yn gynhwysfawr ac yn gynhwysol a'i fod yn caniatáu gwrandawiad i bob llais. Rhaid i'r niferoedd fod yn fawr. Bydd y cyngor yn un ffurfiol a bydd yn gweithio yn y maes

advice and work that will inform us in developing our terms of reference. It is important that it is seen as an open, independent body that has the opportunity to comment, influence and advise the Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government and all the partners who develop and deliver health, social care and wellbeing strategies at a local level, because the council's work will be reflected locally. Although the partnership council will monitor and comment and reflect on the Welsh Assembly Government's work, it will also monitor how we implement these plans at a local level, which is where the bulk of expenditure on the health service in Wales takes place.

cyhoeddus. Caiff ei gynnal gan staff y Cynulliad, ac efallai y byddwn yn disgwyli iddo gomisiynu cymorth, cyngor a gwaith pellach a fydd yn ein goleuo wrth inni ddatblygu ein cylch gorchwyl. Mae'n bwysig iddo gael ei weld yn gorff agored, annibynnol a gaiff gyfle i wneud sylwadau, dylanwadu a chyngori'r Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r holl bartneriaid sy'n datblygu ac yn gweithredu strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles ar lefel leol, oherwydd adlewyrchir gwaith y cyngor yn lleol. Er y bydd y cyngor partneriaeth yn monitro ac yn gwneud sylwadau ac yn ystyried gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, bydd hefyd yn monitro sut yr ydym yn gweithredu'r cynlluniau hyn ar lefel leol, lle y mae'r rhan helaethaf o'r gwario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

3.10 p.m.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Minister for Economic Development  
(Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 34.5, suspends Standing Orders Nos. 5.3 and 5.4 to allow the Minister for Economic Development to deliver the business statement today in the absence of the Business Minister.*

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd  
(Andrew Davies):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34.5, yn gohirio Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 5.3 a 5.4 i ganiataú i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd gyflwyno'r datganiad busnes heddiw, yn absenoldeb y Trefnydd.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Bates, Mick
- Black, Peter
- Bourne, Nick
- Burnham, Eleanor
- Butler, Rosemary
- Cairns, Alun
- Chapman, Christine
- Davies, Andrew
- Davies, Janet
- Essex, Sue
- Evans, Delyth
- German, Michael
- Graham, William
- Gregory, Janice
- Griffiths, John
- Gibbons, Brian

Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** There are no changes to this week's business. On the next three weeks' business, the draft statement is as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

Following the meeting of the Business Committee this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined that under Standing Order No. 22.5, the following Orders need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration: the Travel Concessions (Eligibility) Act 2002 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2002, the Commonhold and Leasehold Reform Act 2002 (Commencement No.1, Savings and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2002, the Arrangements for Placement of Children (General) and the Review of Children's Cases (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002, the Food for Particular Nutritional Uses (Addition of Substances for Specific Nutritional Purposes) (Wales) Regulations 2002 and the Quality Partnership Schemes (Existing Facilities) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

I also report the determination made by the

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Nid oes newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Ynghylch busnes y tair wythnos nesaf, mae'r datganiad drafft fel y'i dangosir ar we'r Siambrau dan ddogfennau ategol.

Ar ôl cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen atgyfeirio'r Gorchymynion a ganlyn i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Gorchymyn Deddf Consesiynau Teithio (yr Hawl i'w Cael) 2002 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2002, Gorchymyn Deddf Diwygio Deiliadaeth ar y Cyd a Lesddaliad 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 1, Arbedion a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2002, Rheoliadau Trefniadau ar gyfer Lleoli Plant (Cyffredinol) ac Adolygu Achosion Plant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, Rheoliadau Bwyd at Ddefnydd Maethol Neilltuol (Ychwanegu Sylweddau at Ddibenion Maethol Penodol) (Cymru) 2002 a Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Partneriaethau Ansawdd (Cyfleusterau sy'n Bodoli Eisoedd) (Cymru) 2002.

Rhoddaf wybod hefyd am y penderfyniad

Deputy Presiding Officer last week under Standing Order No. 22.5 that the General Teaching Council for Wales (Amendment) Order 2002 need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod. Felly, a oes 10 Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes, felly derbyniaf sylwadau ar y datganiad.

**Gareth Jones:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy. Yr oedd datganiad y Prif Weinidog yn ystod cyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd ddydd Gwener diwethaf mewn perthynas ag adeiladu ysgol ar dir halogedig yn codi nifer o gwestiynau o bwys cenedlaethol ac felly yn teilyngu dadl yn y Cynulliad. Pam nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gweithredu i rwystro datblygiad y mae'n cydnabod sydd â gwendidau a diffygion amlwg ac sydd yn fygythiad i iechyd a lles plant, fel y cadarnhawyd gan adroddiad y Comisiynydd Plant a'r adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan y rhieni? Pam y gwrtthododd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ymyrryd er ei bod yn amlwg yn anhapus â phenderfyniad y cyngor? Pad y ddylanwad a gafodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar ei phenderfyniad?

Dylem drafod sut y mae menter cyllid preifat, a'r brys i weithredu yn unol â gofynion PFI, yn gallu arwain at benderfyniadau anghyfrifol ac, o bosibl, yn rhoi buddiannau ariannol o flaen diogelwch plant.

Yn ogystal, dylem drafod y ffaith y gall gofynion newydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd arwain at gost ychwanegol arthurol a fyddai'n codi amheuon yngylch barn y Gweinidog Cyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau fod y cynllun hwn yn rhoi gwerth am arian. Dylem hefyd drafod y rheidrwydd, os o gwbl, ar y cyngor lleol i weithredu dyheadau Llywodraeth Cymru. Onid yw'r cyngor yn bwriadu symud ymlaen ar fyrdar yn ôl ei gynlluniau gwreiddiol ac felly'n tanseilio awdurdod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? Beth yw grym Llywodraeth Cymru yn hyn o beth?

gan y Dirprwy Lywydd yr wythnos diwethaf o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5 nad oes angen atgyfeirio Gorchymyn Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Diwygio) 2002 i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w ystyried yn helaethach.

**The Presiding Officer:** Is there any objection to the business statement? I see that there is. Are there 10 Members who object to the business statement? I see that there are not, therefore I will accept comments on the statement.

**Gareth Jones:** I declare an interest as a member of Conwy County Borough Council. The First Minister's statement during the meeting of the North Wales Regional Committee last Friday on building a school on contaminated land raises many questions of national importance and therefore merits a debate in the Assembly. Why has the Government of Wales not acted to prevent a development that it acknowledges has obvious deficiencies and weaknesses and which is a threat to the health and wellbeing of children, as confirmed by the Children's Commissioner's report and the report commissioned by the parents? Why did the Minister for Environment refuse to intervene even though she was clearly unhappy with the council's decision? What influence did the Welsh Local Government Association have on her decision?

We should discuss why the private finance initiative and the haste to act according to the requirements of PFI can lead to irresponsible decisions and, possibly, place financial considerations before children's safety.

Furthermore, we should discuss the fact that the Minister for Environment's new demands could lead to huge additional costs that would call into question the view of the Finance Minister that this scheme offers value for money. We should also discuss the local council's obligation, if such a thing exists, to implement the aspirations of the Government of Wales. Does not the council intend to hurriedly take this project forward in line with its original plans, thereby undermining the authority of the Welsh Assembly Government? What power does the Government of Wales have over this

issue?

**Huw Lewis:** Last Thursday, 26 children and three adults were killed in an earthquake in San Giuliano di Puglia in Italy. No-one who saw the television pictures could fail to be starkly reminded of the tragedy of Aberfan in 1966, as villagers, many of whom were parents, joined emergency services to claw at the rubble of a school where an entire generation of a small community already lay dead or injured.

Many of the people of Aberfan, and of Wales in general, felt a deep and immediate connection with that small community. Can we make room in our business for a short discussion or statement on how the Assembly might co-ordinate Welsh efforts to assist however we can in the aftermath of this disaster in both the short and, crucially, the long term? San Giuliano faces not only the immediate period of mourning, but the long years of grief and loss that lie ahead.

**Alun Cairns:** Last Thursday, the Minister for Tourism, Film and Broadcasting in the House of Commons made a statement about the restructuring of the British Tourism Authority and the English Tourism Council. This has major implications given that the British Tourism Authority is responsible for marketing Wales abroad. The Minister for Economic Development made a brief oral statement and followed it up with a written statement at the end of the Economic Development Committee, but it is important that we debate this fully. What plans does the Minister have for us to debate the full implications for Wales of this restructuring so that we can establish what consultation was made with the Minister for Economic Development, the Wales Tourist Board and our Scottish counterparts on the restructuring of these organisations, which should be important assets and resources for Wales abroad?

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** I will discuss Huw's request with Carwyn Jones. When tragedies have occurred in the past, time has been set aside to address them in Plenary. I will make

**Huw Lewis:** Ddydd Iau diwethaf, lladdwyd 26 o blant a thri oedolyn mewn daeargrym yn San Giuliano di Puglia yn yr Eidal. Byddai unrhyw un a welodd y lluniau ar y teledu yn sier o gael ei atgoffa'n gignoeth am y drychinez yn Aberfan yn 1966, wrth i'r pentrefwyr, a llawer ohonynt yn rhieni, ymuno â'r gwasanaethau brys i grafangu yn rwbwl yr ysgol lle'r oedd cenhedlaeth gyfan o gymuned fach eisoes yn gorwedd yn farw neu wedi'i hanafu.

Yr oedd llawer o bobl Aberfan, a Chymru'n gyffredinol, yn teimlo cyswllt dwfn ac uniongyrchol â'r gymuned fach honno. A allwn gael lle yn ein busnes ar gyfer trafodaeth fach neu ddatganiad ar y modd y gallai'r Cynulliad gydlyn ymdrechion yng Nghymru i gynorthwyo ym mha bynnag fod y gallwn yn sgîl y drychinez hon yn y tymor byr ac, yn hollbwysig, yn y tymor hir? Yn ogystal â'r cyfnod o alaru ar hyn o bryd, mae San Giuliano yn wynebu'r blynnyddoedd hir o drallod a hiraeth sydd o'i flaen.

**Alun Cairns:** Ddydd Iau diwethaf, gwnaed datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Dwristiaeth, Ffilm a Darlleu yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin am ailstrwythuro'r Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydeinig a Chyngor Twristiaeth Lloegr. Mae goblygiadau mawr i hyn o ystyried bod yr Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydeinig yn gyfrifol am farchnata Cymru dramor. Gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ddatganiad llafar byr a rhoi datganiad ysgrifenedig ar ôl hynny ar ddiwedd cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, ond mae'n bwysig inni drafod hyn yn llawn. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog inni drafod holl oblygiadau'r ailstrwythuro hwn i Gymru fel y gallwn ddarganfod pa ymgynghori a fu â'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a'n cymheiriaid yn yr Alban ar ailstrwythuro'r cyrff hyn, a ddylai fod yn asedau ac yn adnoddau pwysig i Gymru dramor?

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Gwnaf drafod cais Huw gyda Carwyn Jones. Pan fu trychinebau yn y gorffennol, neilltuwyd amser i'w trafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Cyflwynaf sylwadau ar

representations on your behalf.

I agree with Alun Cairns that the restructuring is an important development, which is why, with the agreement of the Chair of the Economic Development Committee, I sought to make a statement on it. Unfortunately, as you said, there was insufficient time to discuss the matter at the Committee last Thursday, which is why I also issued a written statement to all Members. I am more than happy for this matter to be discussed in Committee in the first instance. The Committee can then decide how it wishes to take it forward.

I refute absolutely the implication that we were not involved in this decision. The First Minister and I had discussions on this with our Whitehall colleagues and many representations were made to the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, which involved not just ourselves and the Scottish Executive but the respective tourism boards. There was full consultation and we feel that the outcome has been beneficial, not only for Wales, but for the tourism industry in Wales.

On Gareth's point, I refute absolutely any implication that there has been a dereliction of duty in this matter. Ministers have responsibility for their portfolios, which will include specific issues. All my colleagues have dealt with these matters conscientiously and competently. The First Minister made a statement to the North Wales Regional Committee last week because it was such a significant issue.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

3:20 p.m.

### Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 8.3 relating to Committee membership. You will be aware, because I have mentioned this to you, the First Minister and the Business Minister, that the political complexion of the Assembly is

eich rhan.

Cytunaf ag Alun Cairns fod yr ailstrwythuro'n ddatblygiad pwysig, a dyna pam, gyda chydysyniad Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, y ceisiais wneud datganiad arno. Gwaetha'r modd, fel y dywedasoch, nid oedd digon o amser i drafod y mater yn y Pwyllgor ddydd Iau diwethaf, a dyna pam y gwneuthum hefyd roi datganiad ysgrifenedig i'r holl Aelodau. Yr wyf yn fodlon iawn i'r mater hwn gael ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor yn y lle cyntaf. Wedyn gall y Pwyllgor benderfynu sut y mae'n dymuno bwrw ymlaen â hyn.

Gwrthodaf yn llwyr yr awgrym nad oeddem yn gysylltiedig â'r penderfyniad hwn. Cafodd y Prif Weinidog a minnau drafodaethau ar hyn gyda'n cymheiriaid yn Whitehall a chyflwynwyd llawer o sylwadau i'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, a oedd yn ymwneud nid yn unig â ni a Gweithrediaeth yr Alban ond y priod fyrrdau twristiaeth hefyd. Bu ymgynghori llawn a theimlwn fod y canlyniad yn llesol, nid yn unig i Gymru, ond i'r diwydiant twristiaeth yng Nghymru.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Gareth, gwrthodaf yn llwyr unrhyw awgrym bod unrhyw esgeuluso dyletswydd yn y mater hwn. Mae gan y Gweinidogion gyfrifoldeb dros eu portffolios, a fydd yn cynnwys materion penodol. Mae pob un o'm cyd-Weinidogion wedi trafod y materion hyn yn gydwybodol ac yn alluog. Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad gerbron Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd yr wythnos diwethaf am ei fod yn fater mor bwysig.

the same now as it was originally in terms of party balance. The Welsh Conservatives lost one Committee place on a mathematical formula when Rod Richards was removed from our group. Consequent on another Member joining the Welsh Conservative group, our membership should be resumed to those three Committee members.

This message was conveyed to the Business Minister during the recess when this matter became evident. He has tabled a motion to elect Jonathan Morgan to the Health and Social Services Committee, and to elect a second member to the Committee, who was not named, but our request is being blocked, and I do not know why. We are unable to achieve proper scrutiny of Government business. Mathematically there can be no question that we are entitled to that place. We lost it, but now the Conservative group membership is the same as it was previously. I am forced to conclude, after many representations, that the Labour Party fears another effective Welsh Conservative scrutinising the Minister on the Health and Social Services Committee. [Laughter.]

Some Labour Members may laugh, but if that is not the case, my request can be agreed now. If, as I strongly suspect, that that is the case, we know why my request has not been addressed. This is not a laughing matter. It means that we are unable to perfect our role. We are being democratically denied a place to which we are entitled as a political party. Our right to scrutinise the business that is being conducted by this Assembly is being blocked by a frightened Labour Party. That is the truth of the matter. It is time for our request to be agreed.

**David Davies:** Further to that point of order, I remember taking part in discussions in which it was agreed that as long as there were nine members in the Conservative Group, two Conservative Members could sit on the Health and Social Services Committee. We are entitled to that, given the number of members in our group. Now that we once again have nine Members, the Labour Party is deliberately trying to prevent us from having what is rightfully ours, because it knows full well that its Minister has been a failure. She has failed in every aspect of

yr un fath yn awr ag yr oedd yn wreiddiol o ran cydbwysedd y pleidiau. Collodd Ceidwadwyr Cymru un lle ar Bwyllgorau ar sail fformiwla fathemategol pan symudwyd Rod Richards o'n grŵp. Gan fod Aelod arall wedi ymuno â grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru, dylai ein haelodaeth fynd yn ôl at y tri aelod Pwyllgor hynny.

Cyflewyd y neges hon i'r Trefnydd yn ystod y toriad pan ddaeth y mater hwn yn amlwg. Mae wedi cyflwyno cynnig i ethol Jonathan Morgan i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac i ethol ail aelod i'r Pwyllgor, nas enwyd, ond mae ein cais yn cael ei rwystro, ac ni wn pam. Ni allwn sicrhau craffu priodol ar fusnes y Llywodraeth. Yn fathemategol, ni ellir amau bod gennym hawl i gael y lle hwnnw. Gwnaethom ei golli, ond yn awr mae aelodaeth grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yr un fath ag yr ydoedd o'r blaen. Yr wyf yn gorfod dod i'r casgliad, a minnau wedi cyflwyno llawer o sylwadau, fod ar y Blaid Lafur ofn cael Ceidwadwr Cymreig effeithiol arall i holi'r Gweinidog ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. [Chwerthin.]

Caiff rhai Aelodau Llafur chwerthin, ond os nad gwir hynny, gellir derbyn fy nghais yn awr. Os felly y mae, fel yr wyf yn amau'n gryf, gwyddom pam nad ymdriniwyd â'm cais. Nid yw'n fater chwerthin. Mae'n golygu na allwn gyflawni ein rôl. Gwrthodir lle i ni'n ddemocrataidd a ninnau â hawl iddo fel plaid wleidyddol. Mae ein hawl i graffu'r busnes a wneir gan y Cynulliad hwn yn cael ei rhwystro gan Blaid Lafur ofnus. Dyna'r gwir am y mater. Mae'n hen bryd cydsynio â'n cais.

**David Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cofiaf gymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau lle y cytunwyd, cyhyd â bo naw aelod yn y Grŵp Ceidwadol, y cai dau Aelod Ceidwadol eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae gennym hawl i hynny, yng ngolwg y nifer o aelodau yn ein grŵp. A ninnau â naw Aelod eto, mae'r Blaid Lafur yn ceisio'n fwriadol ein hatal rhag cael yr hyn y mae gennym hawl briodol iddo, gan ei bod yn gwybod y bu ei Gweinidog yn fethiant. Methodd ym mhob agwedd ar bolisi iechyd, ac mae'n

health policy, and it is determined to prevent us from representing the people of Wales and holding her properly to account.  
[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have sympathy with any party in this Assembly that feels that it does not receive a fair and balanced representation. However, I am bound, as we all are, by our constitution and the Government of Wales Act 1998, which states clearly that:

'as far as is practicable, the balance of the parties in the Assembly is reflected in the membership of the Committee.'

That is the legal position. Whether or not negotiations regarding the membership of a whole series of Committees have been successful is not a matter for me. However, I refer this to the Business Committee as the appropriate forum for dealing with this matter. It would be in the interest of the Assembly as a whole if this matter were resolved to the satisfaction of all parties. That is the best that I can do.

benderfynol o'n rhwystro rhag cynrychioli pobl Cymru a'i galw i gyfrif yn briodol.  
[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cydymdeimlaf ag unrhyw blaid yn y Cynulliad hwn sy'n teimlo nad yw'n cael cynrychiolaeth deg a chytwys. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi fy rhwymo, fel pawb ohonom, gan ein cyfansoddiad a Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, sy'n datgan yn glir:

hyd y bo'n ymarferol, adlewyrchir cydbwysedd y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad yn aelodaeth y Pwyllgor.

Dyna'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol. Nid mater i mi yw a fu'r negodiadau ynghylch aelodaeth cyfres hir o Bwyllgorau'n llwyddiannus ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, atgyfeiriaf hyn i'r Pwyllgor Busnes gan mai hwnnw yw'r fforwm priodol i ddelio â'r mater hwn. Byddai er budd i'r Cynulliad fel cyfangorff petai'r mater hwn yn cael ei ddatrys er boddhad i'r holl bleidiau. Dyna'r gorau y gallaf ei wneud.

## Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Changes to Standing Orders

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan to motion NDM1195.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 34:*

*i. considers the report of the Business Committee, arising from the Assembly review of procedure's report LD1636, laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002;*

*ii. approves the replacement in their entirety of Standing Orders Nos. 5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 6.3(iv), 6.3(v), 6.5, 6.12, 6.14, 6.16, 6.18, 9.8(i), 14.3, 15.4, 22.25(i), 22.25(ii), 25.2(iv) and 32.2, with the revised versions of these Standing Orders set out in the document laid in the*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan i gynnig NDM1195.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:*

*i. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes, sydd yn deillio o adroddiad LD1636, adolygiad y Cynulliad o'r gweithdrefnau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002;*

*ii. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 6.3(iv), 6.3(v), 6.5, 6.12, 6.14, 6.16, 6.18, 9.8(i), 14.3, 15.4, 22.25(i), 22.25(ii), 25.2(iv) a 32.2 yn cael eu disodli'n llawn gan fersiynau diwygiedig y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn fel y'u nodir yn y ddogfen a*

*Table Office on 28 October 2002.*

*iii. approves the insertion of a new Standing Order No. 11.3A, as set out in the document laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002.*

*iv. resolves that the revisions shall take effect immediately with the exception of the revisions to Standing Order Nos. 14.3 and 15.4, which will take effect on 1 May 2003.* (NDM1195)

I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 34:*

*i. considers report LD1637 of the Business Committee on Plenary timings, laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002;*

*ii. approves the replacement in their entirety of Standing Orders Nos. 5.2 and 6.2 with the revised versions of these Standing Orders set out in the document laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002.* (NDM1196)

I spoke to these motions some time ago and some Members may want to know why they are before us today. There is a simple answer to that. Many Members spoke in favour of almost all the changes in the previous substantive motion to change Standing Orders, but objected to one small section. We have separated the motions into two on this occasion. Therefore, I will not repeat what I said previously, except that they have been unanimously agreed by the Assembly Review of Procedures Committee. I commend them both to you. There is an amendment to one of the motions to which David Melding will speak.

I hope that Members will support motion NDM1195, which contains many of the points that are necessary to make the National Assembly function more effectively. Motion NDM1196 is about extension of time, and I know that Members have mixed views

*osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002.*

*iii. yn cymeradwyo ychwanegu Rheol Sefydlog newydd Rhif 11.3A fel y'i nodir yn y ddogfen a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002.*

*iv. yn penderfynu y bydd y diwygiadau yn dod i rym yn syth ac eithrio'r diwygiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 14.3 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 15.4, a fydd yn dod i rym ar 1 Mai 2003.* (NDM1195)

Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:*

*i. yn ystyried adroddiad LD1637 y Pwyllgor Busnes ar amseriadau Cyfarfodydd Llawn, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002;*

*ii. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 5.2 a 6.2 yn cael eu disodli'n llawn gan fersiynau diwygiedig y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn fel y'u nodir yn y ddogfen a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002.* (NDM1196)

Siaredais o blaid y cynigion hyn beth amser yn ôl ac efallai y bydd rhai Aelodau am wybod pam eu bod ger ein bron heddiw. Mae ateb syml i hynny. Siaradodd llawer o Aelodau o blaid bron y cyfan o'r newidiadau yn y cynnig sylweddol blaenorol i newid y Rheolau Sefydlog, ond yr oeddent yn gwrrthwynebu un adran fach. Yr ydym wedi gwahanu'r cynigion yn ddau gynnig y tro hwn. Gan hynny, nid ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais o'r blaen, heblaw dweud bod Pwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad wedi cytuno arnynt yn unfrydol. Cymeradwyaf y ddau i chi. Mae gwelliant i un o'r cynigion y bydd David Melding yn ei draffod.

Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau'n cefnogi cynnig NDM1195, sy'n cynnwys llawer o'r pwyntiau sydd eu hangen i beri i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol weithredu'n fwy effeithiol. Mae cynnig NDM1196 yn ymwneud ag estyn amser, a gwn fod gan yr Aelodau farn

about this. I am sure that the Business Committee will put whatever is decided today into practice.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae Plaid Cymru, yn gyffredinol, yn gefnogol i'r cynigion hyn. Credaf y byddant yn hwyluso gweithgaredd y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, mae gwahaniaeth barn ynglŷn â'r amser ar gyfer Cyfarfodydd Llawn, ac ni fydd rhai Aelodau yn dymuno cefnogi'r cynnig hwnnw. Byddwn, felly, yn caniatau pleidlais rydd ar y cynigion hyn.

Ni chefnogwn welliant 1 i'r cynnig cyntaf. Fel grŵp, ni chredwn fod unrhyw rheswm dros brysuro'r newidiadau hyn.

**Nick Bourne:** I propose the following amendment to NDM1195 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. In point iv, delete all after '*resolves that the revisions shall take effect immediately.*'

We are happy to support these motions as they reflect what was agreed in the Assembly Review of Procedures Committee. However, we do not accept the understanding about changing the potential pool of candidates for chairing the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the Committee on European Affairs. We understood that the proposal was to remove the requirement that a Minister should chair these Committees, not that Ministers should be ineligible to chair them, as seems to be stated in this proposal. The proposal does not state what was agreed by the Assembly Review of Procedures Committee.

We also feel that, if these motions are carried today, there is no reason for them not to come into force immediately. The Assembly review of procedure recommended that these revisions take place no later than the next Assembly elections. Therefore, there are two caveats, one of which is not mentioned in the amendment because it was not spotted until later. The motion does not reflect what was agreed in the Assembly review of procedure. I urge Members to support the amendment because it would increase the pool of candidates for chairing the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the Committee on European Affairs, and could be brought

gymysg ar hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn rhoi ar waith beth bynnag a benderfynir heddiw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Plaid Cymru is generally supportive of these proposals. I believe that they will facilitate the activities of the Assembly. However, as the Deputy Presiding Officer said, there is a difference of opinion on the time allocated for Plenary sessions, and some Members will not want to support that motion. We will, therefore, allow a free vote on these motions.

We will not support amendment 1 to the first motion. As a group we do not see any need to rush these revisions through.

**Nick Bourne:** Cynigiaf y gwelliant canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan i NDM1195. Ym mhwynt iv, dileu popeth ar ôl 'yn penderfynu bod y diwygiadau yn dod i rym ar unwaith.'

Yr ydym yn falch o gefnogi'r cynigion hyn gan eu bod yn adlewyrchu'r hyn a gytunwyd ym Mhwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad. Er hynny, nid ydym yn derbyn y ddealltwriaeth yngylch newid y gronfa bosibl o ymgeiswyr i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd. Yr oeddem ar ddeall mai'r bwriad oedd dileu'r gofyniad mai Gweinidog a ddylai gadeirio'r Pwyllgorau hyn, nid y dylai Gweinidogion fod yn anghymwys i'w cadeirio, fel y dywedir yn y cynnig hwn, yn ôl pob golwg. Nid yw'r cynnig yn datgan yr hyn a gytunwyd gan Bwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad.

Teimlwn hefyd, os derbynir y cynigion hyn, nad oes rheswm pam na ddylent ddod i rym ar unwaith. Argymhellodd yr adolygiad o weithdrefn y Cynulliad y dylai'r diwygiadau hyn ddigwydd cyn yr etholiadau nesaf i'r Cynulliad. Felly, mae dau gafeat, nad oes sôn am un ohonynt yn y gwelliant am na sylwyd arno tan wedyn. Nid yw'r cynnig yn adlewyrchu'r hyn a gytunwyd yn yr adolygiad o weithdrefn y Cynulliad. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r gwelliant gan y byddai'n cynyddu'r gronfa o ymgeiswyr i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd, a gellid ei roi mewn grym ar unwaith.

into force immediately.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Liberal Democrats are happy to support the changes to Standing Orders that are proposed today. We are also relaxed about amendment 1 on increasing the pool of candidates available to chair the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the Committee on European Affairs, and will not vote against it.

**Delyth Evans:** Atgoffaf Aelodau ein bod eisoes wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn un o'r cynigion hyn, felly, nid wyf yn deall pam ei fod ger ein bron eto. Atgoffaf Aelodau hefyd ein bod yn ceisio datblygu sefydliad modern ac effeithiol, lle y gall pobl sydd â theuluoedd a chyfrifoldebau eraill weithio. A ydym am ddatblygu sefydliad felly, neu a ydym am fynd yn ôl i ddulliau hen ffasiwn o weithio a fyddai'n ei gwneud yn fwy anodd i Aelodau a staff, yn enwedig menywod, sydd â theuluoedd, i weithio yma? Mae'n rhaid inni hefyd ystyried anghenion grwpiau a chymdeithasau sydd yn awyddus i gyflwyno'u syniadau i Aelodau, a'r amser sydd ar gael iddynt wneud hynny. Felly, am y rhesymau hynny, gofynnaf i'm cyd-Aelodau bleidleisio yn erbyn cynnig NDM1196.

3.30 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I also urge the Assembly to oppose motion NDM1196. As Delyth Evans said, we have already had a full debate on this, which I found useful. I received much support on the outcome of that debate from voluntary organisations, women's groups, and equality bodies who felt that we had done the right thing. I will briefly restate some of the points although we do not need to go into it again. Delyth made the point about groups and organisations being able to talk to us in that crucial slot between 5.30 p.m. and 7 p.m.. It is for us to decide whether we want to work longer—I am sure that few of us stop work at 5.30 p.m.—but we should consider the implications for our staff, who cannot cast votes on this matter. I am somewhat surprised to see this before us again today. If the Assembly needs more time to sit in Plenary sessions, there are alternatives.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn falch o gefnogi'r newidiadau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog sydd wedi'u cynnig heddiw. Yr ydym yn ddigon bodlon hefyd ar welliant 1 ar gynyddu'r gronfa o ymgeiswyr sydd ar gael i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Cyfartal a'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd, ac ni phleidleisiwn yn ei erbyn.

**Delyth Evans:** I remind Members that we have already voted against one of these proposals and, therefore, I do not understand why it is before us again today. I also remind Members that we are attempting to develop a modern and effective institution where people with families and other responsibilities can work. Do we want to develop that kind of establishment or do we want to return to old-fashioned ways of working which would make it more difficult for Members and staff with families, especially women, to work here? We must also consider the needs of groups and societies that wish to discuss their ideas with Members, and the time available for them to do so. For those reasons, I ask colleagues to vote against motion NDM1196.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf finnau'n annog y Cynulliad i wrthwynebu cynnig NDM1196. Fel y dywedodd Delyth Evans, yr ydym eisoes wedi cael dadl lawn ar hyn, ac fe'i cefais yn un fuddiol. Cefais lawer o gefnogaeth ar ganlyniad y ddadl honno gan gyrrff gwirfoddol, grwpiau menywod, a chyrrff cydraddoldeb a deimlai ein bod wedi gwneud y peth iawn. Ailddatganaf yn fyr rai o'r pwytiau er nad oes angen inni ymdrin â hyn eto. Gwnaeth Delyth y pwyt ynghylch y cyfle i grwpiau a chyrrff siarad â ni yn yr amser hollbwysig hwnnw rhwng 5.30 p.m. a 7 p.m. Ein lle ni yw penderfynu a ydym am weithio'n hwy—yr wyf yn siŵr mai ychydig ohonom sy'n rhoi'r gorau i weithio am 5.30 p.m.—ond dylem ystyried y goblygiadau i'n staff, nad ydynt yn gallu bwrw pleidlais ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf yn synnu braidd i weld hyn ger ein bron eto heddiw. Os oes ar y Cynulliad angen mwy o amser i eistedd mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn, mae dewisiadau

eraill.

We could, if we really needed to do so, have a full day's sitting on Wednesday, for example. We could also—at a stroke—do away with the ridiculously long summer recess. Standing Orders currently allow for Plenary to be extended when there is a real need to do so. My concern is that the change proposed today would lead to us regularly sitting until 7 p.m., whatever the wording used in the proposal. I leave the Assembly with this thought: it would be a great pity if, just as our fellow politicians in Westminster begin to take a sensible stand and follow our lead in adopting a normal working day, we took a retrograde step towards its old-fashioned practices. I urge the Assembly to reject the second motion.

**Y Llywydd:** Gan nad yw'r Dirprwy Lywydd am ymateb, symudwn ymlaen i bleidleisio.

Gallem gael sesiwn diwrnod llawn ar ddydd Mercher, er enghraifft, os oedd gwir angen. Gallem hefyd—ar un ergyd—gael gwared â'r toriad haf afresymol o hir. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn caniatâu estyn y Cyfarfod Llawn pan fo gwir angen hynny. Yr wyf yn pryderu mai canlyniad y newid a gynigir heddiw yw y byddem yn eistedd yn rheolaidd hyd 7 p.m., beth bynnag am eiriad y cynnig. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad ystyried hyn yn olaf: byddai'n drueni mawr, a'n cydwleidyddion yn San Steffan newydd ddechrau cymryd safbwyt synhwyrol a dilyn ein harweiniad ni drwy fabwysiadu diwrnod gwaith arferol, i ni gymryd cam yn ôl at ei harferion hen ffasiwn hi. Anogaf y Cynulliad i wrthod yr ail gynnig.

**The Presiding Officer:** As the Deputy Presiding Officer does not wish to respond, we will move on to voting.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.  
Amendment 1: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, David Ian  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Evans, Delyth  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 34:*

*i. considers the report of the Business Committee, arising from the Assembly review of procedure's report LD1636, laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002;*

*ii. approves the replacement in their entirety of Standing Orders Nos. 5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 6.3(iv), 6.3(v), 6.5, 6.12, 6.14, 6.16, 6.18, 9.8(i), 14.3, 15.4, 22.25(i), 22.25(ii), 25.2(iv) and 32.2, with the revised versions of these Standing Orders set out in the document laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002.*

*iii. approves the insertion of a new Standing Order No. 11.3A, as set out in the document laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002.*

*iv. resolves that the revisions shall take effect immediately.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:*

*i. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes, sydd yn deillio o adroddiad LD1636, adolygiad y Cynulliad o'r gweithdrefnau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002;*

*ii. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 6.3(iv), 6.3(v), 6.5, 6.12, 6.14, 6.16, 6.18, 9.8(i), 14.3, 15.4, 22.25(i), 22.25(ii), 25.2(iv) a 32.2 yn cael eu disodli'n llawn gan fersiynau diwygiedig y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn fel y'u nodir yn y ddogfen a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002.*

*iii. yn cymeradwyo ychwanegu Rheol Sefydlog newydd Rhif 11.3A fel y'i nodir yn y ddogfen a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002.*

*iv. yn penderfynu y bydd y diwygiadau yn dod i rym yn syth.*

*Cynnig (NDM1195): O blaidd 48, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1195): For 48, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaidd:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael

Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Halford, Alison

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1196): O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.  
Motion (NDM1196): For 14, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion rejected.*

### **Cymeradwyo Gwelliannau i Reolau Sefydlog** **Approval of Amendments to Standing Orders**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 34:*

*i. considers report LD1635 of the Business Committee on the declaration of interest in Plenary proceedings, laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002;*

*ii. approves the replacement in their entirety of Standing Orders Nos. 4.2, 4.5 and 4.7 with the revised versions of these Standing Orders set out in the document laid in the Table Office on 28 October 2002. (NDM1194)*

I apologise for getting ahead of myself in referring to David Melding earlier. I must propose this motion as I am a member of the Business Committee. I hope, Presiding Officer, that David Melding will catch your eye, as he is the Chair of the Committee on Standards of Conduct.

**David Melding:** I am glad I did catch your eye, Presiding Officer. As Chair of the Committee on Standards of Conduct, I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. The Committee on Standards of Conduct, at the request of the Business Committee, has brought forward these proposals to help clarify and simplify our

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:*

*i. yn ystyried adroddiad LD1635 y Pwyllgor Busnes ar ddatgan buddiannau mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002;*

*ii. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 4.2, 4.5 a 4.7 yn cael eu disodli'n llawn gan fersiynau diwygiedig y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn fel y'u nodir yn y ddogfen a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Hydref 2002. (NDM1194)*

Ymddiheuraf am gyfeirio at David Melding cyn pryd yn gynharach. Rhaid i mi gynnig y cynnig hwn gan fy mod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, Lywydd, y bydd David Melding yn dal eich llygad, gan mai ef yw Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn falch imi ddal eich llygad, Lywydd. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfre i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Mae'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, ar gais y Pwyllgor Busnes, wedi dwyn y cynigion hyn gerbron i helpu i egluro a symleiddio ein rheolau ar ddatgan

rules on declaring interests in Plenary, which may not have been as well understood as we would have wished in the past. As well as clarifying and simplifying those rules, the changes also re-emphasise and enhance the importance of the Register of Members' Interests. They offer greater clarity for Members on when to make oral declarations and will help to ensure the dignity of our proceedings. In other words, we want to end the 'Mexican wave' of Members rising to declare interests that we have seen over the last few months. This is a serious issue and it is important to remind the Assembly that the responsibilities placed on Members by the Government of Wales Act 1998 make the failure to declare interests appropriately a criminal offence. In coming to the view that simplification was desirable, the Committee has also agreed that any changes should maintain the integrity and rigour of current arrangements. In the Committee's view, the proposals before us today meet those twin objectives.

What are the practical implications of the proposals? First, they make it clear that an oral declaration of interest will only be required if the matter under discussion could result in a direct financial advantage to the Member, or to his or her partner or dependant children. If there ever was a need to declare non-financial matters, such as that a Member is a registered teacher when that Member is no longer employed as such, these proposals remove that need. Secondly, the proposals make it clear that even where a direct financial advantage might arise, there is no need to make a declaration unless the advantage is

'greater than that which might accrue to persons affected by the decisions generally'.

This is the test already applied under Standing Order No. 4.7, which prohibits Members from voting when they have a direct financial interest in a matter. This means that, in future, Members who consider that they should not vote on a matter because of an interest should either not speak in the debate concerned, or, if they do, declare that

buddiannau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, nas deallwyd gystal ag y dymunem yn y gorffennol o bosibl. Yn ogystal ag egluro a symleiddio'r rheolau hynny, mae'r newidiadau hefyd yn ailbwysleisio ac yn cynyddu pwysigrwydd Cofrestr Buddiannau'r Aelodau. Maent yn cynnig mwy o eglurder i'r Aelodau ynghylch pa bryd y dylid gwneud datganiadau llafar a byddant o gymorth i sicrhau urddas ein trafodion. Mewn geiriau eraill, yr ydym am roi terfyn ar y 'don Fecsicanaidd' wrth i'r Aelodau godi i ddatgan buddiannau, fel yr ydym wedi'i weld dros y misoedd diwethaf. Mae hyn yn fater difrif ac mae'n bwysig atgoffa'r Cynulliad bod y cyfrifoldebau a roddir i'r Aelodau gan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn gwneud y methiant i ddatgan buddiannau'n briodol yn drosedd troseddol. Wrth ddod i'r casgliad y dylid eu symleiddio, cytunodd y Pwyllgor hefyd y dylai unrhyw newidiadau gadw uniondeb a thrylwyredd y trefniadau presennol. Ym marn y Pwyllgor, mae'r cynigion sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn cyflawni'r ddau amcan hynny.

Beth yw goblygiadau ymarferol y cynigion? Yn gyntaf, maent yn rhoi ar ddeall na fydd datganiad o fuddiant llafar yn ofynnol oni bai fod y mater a drafodir yn un a allai arwain at fantais ariannol uniongyrchol i'r Aelod, neu i'w gymar neu ei blant dibynnol. Os oedd erioed reidrwydd i ddatgan materion anariannol, bod yr Aelod yn athro cofrestredig, er enghraifft, a'r Aelod heb fod yn cael ei gyflogi fel athro bellach, mae'r cynigion hyn yn dileu'r rheidrwydd hwnnw. Yn ail, mae'r cynigion yn rhoi ar ddeall nad oes angen gwneud datganiad, hyd yn oed pan allai mantais ariannol uniongyrchol godi, oni bai fod y fantais

'yn fwy na'r fantais a allai ddod i ran y personau y byddai'r penderfyniad yn effeithio arnynt yn gyffredinol'.

Dyma'r prawf a gymhwysir eisoes o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 4.7, sy'n gwahardd Aelodau rhag pleidleisio pan fo ganddynt fuddiant ariannol uniongyrchol yn y mater. Golyga hynny, o hyn allan, y dylai Aelodau sy'n ystyried na ddylent bleidleisio ar fater oherwydd buddiant un ai peidio â siarad yn y ddadl dan sylw, neu, os y gwnant, ddatgan y

interest.

I emphasise that these proposals do not change the basic position that the responsibility for deciding whether to make a declaration lies with each Member. I encourage anyone who has doubts about whether a declaration should be made to seek the advice of the registrar of Members' interests, Andrew George, or the Table Office.

Before I conclude, I will make some general remarks about best practice when declaring interests. First, declarations must be timely. The basic principle is that Members should declare relevant interests each time that they participate in Assembly proceedings. This means that the declaration should be made before the Member contributes for the first time during any item of business. However, there is no need for a Member to make a declaration each time that he or she speaks during the same item of business on the same day. Declaring an interest at the end of a debate, or after a vote has been taken, is not acceptable and does not meet requirements.

Secondly, declarations must be informative. It is not sufficient for a Member simply to state that he or she declares an interest. Members must state what the interest is in a way that is sufficiently informative as to enable the listener to understand the nature of the interest being declared. It has occasionally been the practice for Members simply to stand before a vote has been taken to indicate that they wish to declare an interest, without any indication of what it is that they wish to declare. I do not wish to stray into your territory, Presiding Officer, but that does not, in my view, meet the statutory obligations set out in the Government of Wales Act 1998. As I mentioned earlier—and the new arrangements make this clear—there is no need to declare as interests matters that do not need to be registered in the Register of Members' Interests.

Finally, Members do not generally need to declare being a registered teacher, a member of a local authority or a health professional simply because a debate about education,

buddiant hwnnw.

Pwysleisiaf nad yw'r cynigon hyn yn newid y sefyllfa sylfaenol mai cyfrifoldeb pob Aelod yw penderfynu a ddylai wneud datganiad. Anogaf unrhyw un sydd ag amheuon ynghylch a ddylid gwneud datganiad i geisio cyngor gan gofrestydd buddiannau'r Aelodau, Andrew George, neu'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno.

Cyn imi derfynu, gwnaf rai sylwadau cyffredinol ynghylch yr arfer gorau wrth ddatgan buddiannau. Yn gyntaf, rhaid i'r datganiadau fod yn amserol. Yr egwyddor sylfaenol yw y dylai'r Aelodau ddatgan buddiannau perthnasol bob tro y maent yn cymryd rhan yn nhrafodion y Cynulliad. Golyga hynny y dylid gwneud y datganiad cyn i'r Aelod gyfrannu am y tro cyntaf yn ystod unrhyw eitem o fusnes. Fodd bynnag, nid oes angen i Aelod wneud datganiad bob tro y mae'n siarad yn ystod yr un eitem o fusnes ar yr un diwrnod. Nid yw datgan buddiant ar ddiwedd dadl, neu ar ôl cymryd y bleidlais, yn dderbyniol ac nid yw'n bodloni'r gofynion.

Yn ail, rhaid i'r datganiadau roi gwybodaeth. Nid digon yw i Aelod ddweud yn symbl ei fod yn datgan buddiant. Rhaid i'r Aelodau ddweud beth yw'r buddiant mewn modd sy'n rhoi digon o wybodaeth i alluogi'r gwrandawr i ddeall natur y buddiant a ddatgenir. Bu'n arfer weithiau gan yr Aelodau i ddim ond sefyll cyn cymryd pleidlais i nodi eu bod yn dymuno datgan buddiant, heb unrhyw arwydd o'r hyn y maent yn dymuno ei ddatgan. Nid wyf yn dymuno crwydro i'ch tiriogaeth chi, Lywydd, ond, yn fy marn i, nid yw hynny'n cyd-fynd â'r rhwymedigaethau statudol a nodir yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach—ac mae'r trefniadau newydd yn egluro hyn—nid oes angen datgan materion yn fuddiannau os nad ydynt yn rhai y mae'n rhaid eu cofrestru yng Nghofrestr Buddiannau'r Aelodau.

Yn olaf, fel arfer nid oes angen i'r Aelodau ddatgan eu bod yn athro cofrestredig, yn aelod o awdurdod lleol neu'n weithiwr iechyd proffesiynol dim ond am fod dadl yn

local government or the health service is taking place. Those Members must first consider whether the matter being discussed will give them a direct financial advantage and, secondly, whether that advantage is greater than that which other similarly affected people might benefit from. Assuming that these proposals are agreed today, I intend to write to all Members as Chair of the Committee on Standards of Conduct to offer further guidance on the implication of the changes and on good practice in declaring interests in Plenary. I have not yet said so explicitly, but these proposals also apply to declarations of interests in Committee meetings and I will also write to Committee Chairs to offer similar guidance in that regard.

I commend these proposals to the Assembly. I emphasise that they maintain the current rigorous requirements on registering interests, but they are clearer, simpler and more consistent with our provision on the prohibition of voting.

3:40 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolchaf i David Melding am ei gyflwyniad i'r eitem hon. Pan ddarllenais y newidiadau a argymhellir, ofnwn na fyddent yn gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth, er fy mod yn gwybod y byddent yn hwyluso'r sefyllfa ac yn egluro materion. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiodd David yr angen i Aelodau fod yn gyfrifol wrth ddatgan buddiant, a bydd hynny'n sicrhau na fyddwn yn gweld y 'Mexican wave' yn rhy aml yn y Siambra yn y dyfodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn symud i bleidlais, atgoffaf Aelodau fod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid os yw'r cynnig hwn i gael ei dderbyn.

*Cynnig (NDM1194): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1194): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor

digwydd ar addysg, llywodraeth leol neu'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Rhaid i'r Aelodau hynny ystyried yn gyntaf a fydd y mater a drafodir yn rhoi mantais ariannol uniongyrchol iddynt ac, yn ail, a yw'r fantais honno'n fwy na'r hyn a allai ddod i ran pobl yr effeithir arnynt yn yr un modd. Gan gymryd y cytunir ar y cynigion hyn heddiw, bwriadaf ysgrifennu at yr holl Aelodau fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad i gynnig canllawiau pellach ar oblygiad y newidiadau ac ar arfer da wrth ddatgan buddiannau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Nid wyf wedi dweud hyn yn benodol eto, ond mae'r cynigion hyn yn berthnasol hefyd i ddatganiadau o fuddiant mewn cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor a byddaf hefyd yn ysgrifennu at Gadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau i gynnig canllawiau tebyg yn hynny o beth.

Cymeradwyaf y cynigion hyn i'r Cynulliad. Pwysleisiaf eu bod yn cadw'r gofynion caeth presennol yngylch cofrestru buddiannau, ond maent yn gliriach, yn symlach ac yn fwy cyson â'n rhagamod ar wahardd pleidleisio.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I thank David for his introduction to this item. When I read the recommended changes, I feared that they would make little difference, even though I knew that they would ease the situation and make matters clearer. However, David emphasised the need for Members to be responsible when declaring interests, and that will ensure that we will not see the 'Mexican wave' too often in the Chamber in future.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before moving to a vote, I remind Members that a two-thirds majority in favour is required if this motion is to be carried.

Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Law, Peter  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.41 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.41 p.m.*

### **Cynllun Gweithredu Arloesedd Innovation Action Plan**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly:*

- 1. notes the publication for consultation of 'Wales 4 Innovation', the Welsh Assembly Government's action plan for innovation, and*
- 2. notes the intention of the Welsh Assembly Government to publish a final version of 'Wales 4 Innovation', following completion of the consultation process. (NDM1197)*

Wales has never been short of ideas or creativity. However, too often, these ideas have not been fully exploited. For Wales's talented people, young and old, it is too often a case of getting out to get on.

'Wales 4 Innovation', the consultation paper on innovation action in Wales, lays out the Government's proposals. Over the next three months, Members, organisations and individuals in Wales are invited to respond to the consultation. I believe that this document lays the foundation for a creative, innovative dragon economy in Wales. It is a stark fact that, without sufficient innovation in all our activities, we will not achieve the Assembly's objectives, as outlined in our economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales'.

'Wales 4 Innovation' spells out how the Assembly Government will make innovation a top economic priority over the next three years. It sets out how we will work with business to achieve a wealthier, more sustainable Welsh economy. This is how we can deliver our ambitious objectives for an innovative Wales, as set out in 'A Winning Wales'. I hope that all Members recognise that, in a modern economy, innovation is at the heart of productivity growth and social gain, and that it drives competitiveness and sustainable development. This plan will ensure that all businesses in Wales are alive to the challenge of innovation.

We propose to invest £260 million over the next three years to make a difference to the

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

- 1. yn nodi cyhoeddi 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi', cynllun gweithredu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer arloesi, ar gyfer ymgynghori ac*
- 2. yn nodi bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi fersiwn terfynol o 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi' wedi i'r broses ymgynghori ddod i ben. (NDM1197)*

Ni fu Cymru erioed yn brin o syniadau neu ddawn greadigol. Er hynny, yn rhy aml, nid yw'r syniadau hyn wedi'u llawn ddefnyddio. I bobl dalentog Cymru, yn hen ac ifanc, yr hyn a ddigwydd yn rhy aml yw eu bod yn mynd oddi yma i fynd yn eu blaen.

Mae 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi', y papur ymgynghorol ar weithredu arloesedd yng Nghymru, yn cyflwyno cynigion y Llywodraeth. Dros y tri mis nesaf, gwahoddir yr Aelodau, a chyrrff ac unigolion yng Nghymru i ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad. Credaf fod y ddogfen hon yn gosod y sylfeini ar gyfer economi ddreigaidd arloesol a chreadigol yng Nghymru. Y gwir plaen amdani yw, os na cheir digon o arloesedd yn ein holl weithgareddau, na chyrhaeddwn amcanion y Cynulliad, fel y'u nodwyd yn ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd, 'Cymru'n Ennill'.

Mae 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi' yn egluro sut y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud arloesedd yn flaenoriaeth economaidd bennaf dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae'n nodi sut y byddwn yn gweithio gyda busnes i sicrhau economi Gymreig gyfoethocach a mwy cynaliadwy. Dyma sut y gallwn gyflawni ein hamcanion uchelgeisiol ar gyfer Cymru arloesol, fel y'u nodir yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Gobeithiaf fod yr holl Aelodau'n cydnabod bod arloesedd, mewn economi fodern, wrth wraidd twf mewn cynhyrchiant ac enillion cymdeithasol, a'i fod yn ysgogi cystadleuaeth a datblygu cynaliadwy. Bydd y cynllun hwn yn sicrhau bod yr holl fusnesau yng Nghymru'n effro i her arloesedd.

Bwriadwn fuddsoddi £260 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i wneud gwahaniaeth yn yr

innovation and productivity agenda in Wales. However, we are not starting from a vacuum. We are providing fresh impetus for work that is already underway across Wales, particularly that initiated by the regional technology plan.

**Dafydd Wigley:** How much of the £260 million announced today is new money, and how much is part of existing programmes?

**Andrew Davies:** Our calculation is that the additional funding for the programme in the current budget round is £26 million.

As I said, we are not starting from a vacuum, as programmes are already in place. We are providing a fresh impetus for work that is already underway across the country. Wales has an increasingly diverse economy, with many companies already high up the ladder of innovation. We have a range of first-class support activities to help all companies climb further up that ladder. Wales's gross domestic product statistics demonstrate that our businesses in aggregate need to follow in the footsteps of the world's best and devote more energy and resources to innovation.

There are examples of success across Wales, but we must gain a higher position on the UK business research and development league table. We need to scale up the best of our business innovation support services. The significant extra resources announced in the Assembly Government's draft budget make it possible to expand our innovation activities, across the board. If academia is mentioned, one often thinks of technology first; however, while technological developments are vital, innovation is about far more than technology. I regard innovation as more of a people issue than a technology issue. I believe that I speak for all members of the Economic Development Committee when I say that we must have greater interaction between our business and academic communities in the pursuit of successful innovation; this will strengthen the culture of innovation across all sectors in Wales.

agenda arloesedd a chynhyrchiant yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn cychwyn mewn gwagle. Yr ydym yn rhoi hwb newydd i waith sydd eisoes ar y gweill ledled Cymru, yn enwedig gwaith a gychwynnwyd drwy'r cynllun technoleg rhanbarthol.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Faint o'r £260 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd heddiw sy'n arian newydd, a faint ohono sy'n rhan o'r rhagleni presennol?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn cyfrif bod cyllid ychwanegol o £26 miliwn ar gyfer y rhaglen yn y cylch cyllideb presennol

Fel y dywedais, nid ydym yn cychwyn mewn gwagle, gan fod rhagleni ar waith eisoes. Yr ydym yn rhoi hwb o'r newydd i waith sydd eisoes ar y gweill ledled y wlad. Mae gan Gymru economi fwyfwy amrywiol, ac mae llawer o gwmniau eisoes yn uchel ar ysgol arloesedd. Mae gennym amrediad o weithgareddau cymorth o'r radd flaenaf i helpu'r holl gwmniau i ddringo'n uwch ar yr ysgol honno. Mae ystadegau cynnrych mewnwladol crynswth Cymru'n dangos bod angen i'n cwmniau yn eu cyfanrwydd ddilyn ôl traed y goreuon yn y byd a rhoi mwy o'u hegni a'u hadnoddau at arloesedd.

Mae engrai ffittiau o lwyddiant ledled Cymru, ond rhaid inni ennill safle uwch ar dabl cynghrair ymchwil a datblygu busnes y DU. Rhaid inni ehangu'r goreuon o blith ein gwasanaethau cymorth arloesedd busnes. Mae'r adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol a gyhoeddwyd yng nghyllideb ddrafft Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei gwneud yn bosibl ehangu ein gweithgareddau arloesedd, yn gyffredinol. Os sonnir am y byd academaidd, mae rhywun yn aml yn meddwl am dechnoleg yn gyntaf; serch hynny, er bod datblygiadau technolegol yn hollbwysig, mae arloesedd yn ymwneud â mwy o lawer na thechnoleg. Ystyraf fod a wnelo arloesedd yn fwy â phobl na thechnoleg. Credaf fy mod yn siarad ar ran holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd pan ddywedaf fod rhaid inni gael mwy o ryngweithio rhwng ein cymuned fusnes a'n cymuned academaidd wrth geisio arloesedd llwyddiannus; bydd hyn yn cryfhau'r diwylliant arloesedd ym mhob sector yng

## Nghymru.

Innovation is about finding smarter ways of operating—be that in training, management, administration, marketing or finance. We can help establish a creative environment for innovative thinking to prosper and that is why the first strand of the innovation action plan is a £4 million innovation communications campaign. This will be co-ordinated by the Welsh Development Agency and it will demonstrate to all—companies, the private sector and the public at large—what can be achieved through greater innovation. I believe that this is best and most effectively delivered locally. The focus is, therefore, on strong regional activities and on empowering local innovation champions.

The second element focuses on developing more high growth potential businesses. We are proposing a £15 million technology and research and development drive in Wales, targeted at providing better support for indigenous development and at attracting more high quality inward investment and global alliances. At a total cost of up to £150 million, these activities will be facilitated by expanding the Technium centre concept throughout Wales and by using the new technology commercialisation centre to catalyse the creation of companies with exceptional growth potential.

We also want to ensure that people in Wales are better equipped to innovate, whether this is by improving management skills, by facilitating employee engagement in a company's drive for innovation or by using the internet to help companies develop a more strategic approach to business development. Following naturally from the business support review, we are also proposing simpler, more effective, innovation support and funding. We propose that SMART Wales, and all the other innovation grant schemes, be replaced by one flexible innovation grant scheme with an allocation of £25 million for its first three years. We have spoken to businesses across Wales and the message is clear: businesses must get the support and advice that they need, at the time they need it. We are proposing to take action

Mae arloesedd yn ymwneud â darganfod dulliau gweithredu mwy clyfar—boed hynny mewn hyfforddi, rheoli, gweinyddu, marchnata neu gyllid. Gallwn helpu creu amgylchedd creadigol i feddwl arloesol gael ffynnau a dyna pam mai'r elfen gyntaf yn y cynllun gweithredu arloesedd yw ymgyrch gyfathrebu arloesedd werth £4 miliwn. Cydlynir hyn gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a bydd yn dangos i bawb—y cwmniau, y sector preifat a'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol—yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni drwy fwy o arloesedd. Credaf y gellir cyflawni hynny orau ac yn fwyaf effeithiol yn lleol. Canolbwytir, felly, ar weithgareddau rhanbarthol cryf ac ar alluogi cefnogwyr arloesedd lleol.

Mae'r ail elfen yn canolbwytio ar ddatblygu rhagor o fusnesau â photensial twf mawr. Yr ydym yn cynnig ymgyrch technoleg ac ymchwil a datblygu werth £15 miliwn yng Nghymru, a anelir at ddarparu gwell cymorth ar gyfer datblygu cynhenid a denu rhagor o fewnuddsoddi o ansawdd da a chyngreiriau byd-eang. Bydd y gweithgareddau hyn yn costio hyd at gyfanswm o £150 miliwn, ac fe'u hwylusir drwy ehangu cysyniad y ganolfan Technium ledled Cymru a thrwy ddefnyddio'r ganolfan masnacheiddio technoleg newydd yn gatalydd i greu cwmniau sydd â photensial twf eithriadol.

Yr ydym hefyd am sicrhau bod pobl yng Nghymru wedi'u paratoi'n well i arloesi, boed hynny drwy wella sgiliau rheoli, drwy hwyluso cyfraniad y gweithwyr yn ymgyrchoedd cwmniau dros arloesedd neu drwy ddefnyddio'r rhyngrwyd i helpu cwmniau i ddatblygu dull mwy strategol o ddatblygu busnes. Gan ddilyn yn naturiol o'r adolygiad o gymorth busnes, yr ydym hefyd yn cynnig cymorth a chyllid arloesedd symlach a mwy effeithiol. Cynigiwn y dylid rhoi un cynllun grant arloesedd hyblyg yn lle SMART Cymru, a'r holl gynlluniau grant arloesedd eraill, gyda dyraniad o £25 miliwn ar gyfer y tair blynedd cyntaf. Yr ydym wedi siarad â busnesau ledled Cymru ac mae'r neges yn glir: rhaid i fusnesau gael y cymorth a'r cyngor y mae arnynt eu hangen, ar yr adeg y mae arnynt eu hangen. Yr ydym

to make that possible.

**Gareth Jones:** Will that allocation of £25 million be direct funding from the Assembly or will it be a form of indirect funding still controlled by the banks, which will make it difficult for small businesses to access it?

**Andrew Davies:** This basically involves replacing the current innovation grant schemes such as SMART, SPUR and the regional innovation grant with one focused grant. The WDA will administer and pay the grant.

Our cadre of special innovative advisers will be strengthened. We want to maximise the use of Wales's best private sector management talent, as assistance for colleagues in other companies, through mentoring schemes, wherever possible. We also propose refocusing regional selective assistance to make it more attractive to projects with strong innovative credentials.

Finally, we all recognise that we must ensure better integration of our academic institutions into our regional and national economy. 'Reaching Higher,' the higher education strategy launched by the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, has set out the first steps towards achieving a globally competitive higher education sector here in Wales. We are proposing a £60 million programme to better integrate all company and academic link activities, to fund a more strategic approach to third mission activities in our higher education institutions, and to boost the long-term funding for the knowledge exploitation fund. This will ensure that there are sufficient resources available to enable as many front-line college or company activities as possible, with good commercial potential, to drive forward their plans. This innovation action plan delivers on a commitment made in 'A Winning Wales'.

3.50 p.m.

Wales is a small but clever country. We have Gwlad fach ond clyfar yw Cymru. Mae

yn bwriadu cymryd camau i hwyluso hynny.

**Gareth Jones:** A fydd y dyraniad hwnnw o £25 miliwn yn gyllid uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad ynteu a fydd ar ffurf cyllid anuniongyrchol a reolir gan y banciau o hyd, a fydd yn ei gwneud yn anodd i fusnesau bach ei gael?

**Andrew Davies:** Yn y bôn, mae hyn yn golygu rhoi un grant pwrpasol yn lle'r cynlluniau grant arloesedd presennol fel SMART, SPUR a'r grant arloesedd rhanbarthol. Y WDA fydd yn gweinyddu ac yn talu'r grant.

Atgyfnerthir ein cnewyllyn o ymgynghorwyr arloesedd arbennig. Yr ydym am wneud y defnydd gorau o ddoniau rheoli sector preifat Cymru, ar ffurf cymorth i gydweithwyr mewn cwmnïau eraill, drwy gynlluniau mentora, lle bynnag y bo modd. Yr ydym hefyd yn bwriadu newid ffocws cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i'w wneud yn fwy deniadol i brosiectau sy'n gryf o ran arloesedd.

Yn olaf, yr ydym oll yn cydnabod bod rhaid inni integreiddio ein sefydliadau academaidd yn well â'n heonomi ranbarthol a chenedlaethol. Mae 'Cyrraedd yn Uwch', y strategaeth addysg uwch a lansiwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, wedi nodi'r camau cyntaf tuag at sierhau sector addysg uwch a all gystadlu'n fyd-eang yma yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn cynnig rhaglen £60 miliwn i integreiddio'n well yr holl weithgareddau cyswllt rhwng cwmnïau a sefydliadau academaidd, i ariannu dull mwy strategol o ymdrin â gweithgareddau'r drydedd genhadaeth yn ein sefydliadau addysg uwch, ac i hybu'r cyllid tymor hir i'r gronfa defnyddio gwybodaeth. Bydd hynny'n sierhau bod digon o adnoddau ar gael i alluogi cynifer ag y bo modd o weithgareddau rheng flaen mewn colegau neu gwmnïau, ac iddynt botensial masnachol da, i fwrw ymlaen â'u cynlluniau. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu arloesedd hwn yn cyflawni ymrwymiad a wnaed yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'.

much to be proud of but we must do better and act smarter in an increasingly competitive global market. This is not just about high-tech business, but about companies that want to grow and prosper in a successful Welsh economy. I want to focus today on our plans to build the Welsh economy. Regrettably, the amendments focus on the consultation process. I sincerely hope that the contributions made today will move on from that to discuss the huge and exciting potential of this crucial innovation agenda for Wales.

I hope that the three-month consultation period, which begins today, will strengthen the plan. The plan will go to the Economic Development Committee on 14 November and I hope that the wider Welsh economic community will also take part in the consultation. It is by stimulating vigorous debate across Wales and enabling potential innovation champions to come forward that we will achieve our ambitious goals for the Welsh economy and highlight the exciting and innovative plans that are being driven forward. This is about Wales today and about the dragon economy being at the cutting edge. Together, we can make it happen.

**Elin Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: yn llinell 1, rhoi '*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*' yn lle '*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*'.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn edrych ymlaen at drafodaeth bellach yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 'Gymru o Blaid Arloesi' ar ôl i'r broses ymgynghori ddod i ben ac ar ôl iddo gael ei ystyried gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.*

Credaf i'r ddadl hon gael ei chynnal ar yr adeg anghywir am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, nid yw'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi trafod y mater hwn ac nid yw'r Gweinidog wedi chwilio am gyfle i geisio ymateb y Pwyllgor i'w gynigion ar arloesedd. Felly, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2. Yn ail, lansiwyd y cynllun heddiw ar ffurf dogfen

llawer y gallwn ymfalchöi ynddo ond rhaid inni wneud yn well a gweithredu'n fwy clyfar mewn marchnad fydeang sy'n fwyfwy cystadleuol. Nid busnes technoleg newydd yn unig sydd dan sylw, ond cwmnïau sydd am dyfu a ffynnu mewn economi Gymreig lwyddiannus. Dymunaf ganolbwytio heddiw ar ein cynlluniau i adeiladu economi Cymru. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'r gwelliannau'n canolbwytio ar y broses ymgynghori. Gwir obeithiaf y bydd cyfraniadau heddiw'n symud oddi wrth hynny ac yn trafod potensial aruthrol a chyffrous yr agenda arloesedd hollbwysig hon i Gymru.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y cyfnod ymgynghori tri mis, sy'n dechrau heddiw, yn cryfhau'r cynllun. Fe â'r cynllun gerbron y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar 14 Tachwedd a gobeithiaf y bydd cymuned economaidd ehangach Cymru hefyd yn cyfrannu i'r ymgynghoriad. Drwy symbulu dadlau bywiog ledled Cymru a galluogi cefnogwyr arloesedd possibl i ddod ymlaen y cyrhaeddwn ein nodau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer economi Cymru a thynnau sylw at y cynlluniau cyffrous ac arloesol sy'n cael eu hyrwyddo. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â Chymru heddiw a rhoi'r economi ddreigaidd yn y rheng flaen. Gyda'n gilydd, gallwn beri i hyn ddigwydd.

**Elin Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: in line 1, add '*for Wales*' after '*National Assembly*'.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point:

*looks forward to a further Plenary debate on 'Wales 4 Innovation' following the completion of the consultation process and its consideration by the Economic Development Committee.*

I believe that this debate is being held at the wrong time for two reasons. First, the Economic Development Committee has not discussed this issue at all and the Minister has not sought an opportunity to ask the Committee to respond to his proposals on innovation. Therefore, we will support amendment 2. Secondly, the scheme is being

ymgyngħorol, ac eto mae'r Llywodraeth yn cynnal dadl yn hytrach na gwneud datganiad ar hyn. Yn y gorffennol, pan fu dadl ar ddogfen ymgyngħorol, bu i rai Gweinidogion ofyn i'r gwrthbleidiau ymatal rhag cyflwyno gwelliannau neu dynnu gwelliannau'n ôl oherwydd nad oedd yr ymgyngħoriad wedi ei gynnal. Yr wyf yn chwilio am gysondeb gan Weinidogion. Mae Andrew Davies yn ein beirniadu heddiw am beidio â chynnig gwelliannau ar gynnwys y ddogfen. Yn y gorffennol, mae Sue Essex wedi ein beirniadu am gynnig gwelliannau ar gynnwys dogfen ymgyngħorol cyn i'r ymgyngħoriad ddigwydd.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn gofyn am ddadl ar y pwnc hwn pan fydd ymateb i'r ymgyngħoriad ar gael ac phan fydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi cael cyfle i drafod yr ymgyngħoriad.

Mae'r ddogfen a gyflwynir heddiw yn grynhoad defnyddiol o sawl cynllun sydd eisoes ar y gweill. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd y Gweinidog eisoes mai dim ond £26 miliwn o'r £260 miliwn a gyflwynwyd fel buddsoddiad ar gyfer y cynllun sydd yn gyllid newydd. Er bod pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad o blaid arloesi, yr wyf am ofyn ychydig o gwestiynau am y cynllun hwn. Mae £4 miliwn yn y cynllun ar gyfer ymgyrch farchnata i hyrwyddo arloesi ac mae arian pellach yn y cynllun ar gyfer marchnata a hyrwyddo. A oes unrhyw werth gwirioneddol mewn gwario arian sylweddol ar ymgyrch farchnata gyffredinol pan na fydd arloesi'n berthnasol i drwch o fusnesau? Mae ymchwil cyfredol Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach, er enghraifft, yn dangos bod traean o fusnesau heb unrhyw ddymuniad nac uchelgais i dyfu. Mae angen sicrhau bod gwariant ar farchnata a hyrwyddo yn targedu'r busnesau sydd eisai tyfu. Rhaid canolbwytio ar fusnesau twf a thargedu adnoddau prin yn hytrach na cheisio bod yn bopeth i bawb, sef yr hyn y mae strategaeth economaidd y Llywodraeth yn ceisio ei wneud.

Pobl sy'n arloesi, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod hynny. Nid grantiau cyhoeddus sy'n creu arloesedd; pobl biau'r penderfyniad, yr awydd a'r sgiliau i arloesi.

launched today as a consultation document, but the Government is holding a debate rather than making a statement on this. In the past, when a debate on a consultation document has been held, some Ministers have asked the opposition parties to refrain from tabling amendments or to withdraw amendments because the consultation had not taken place. I am looking for a consistent approach from Ministers. Andrew Davies has criticised us today for not proposing amendments to the content of the document. In the past, Sue Essex has criticised us for proposing amendments to the content of a consultation document before consultation has taken place.

Amendment 4 requests that a debate on this subject be held when a response to the consultation is available and the Economic Development Committee has had an opportunity to discuss the consultation.

The document presented today is a useful synopsis of several schemes that are under way. However, the Minister has already stated that only £26 million of the £260 million given as the investment for this scheme is new funding. Although every Assembly Member is in favour of innovation, I wish to ask a few questions about this scheme. The scheme allocates £4 million for a marketing campaign to promote innovation and there is further money for marketing and promotion. Is there any real value in spending substantial amounts of money on a general marketing campaign when innovation will not be relevant to most businesses? Current research by the Federation of Small Businesses, for example, shows that a third of businesses have no desire or ambition to expand. We need to ensure that expenditure on marketing and promotion targets the businesses that wish to expand. We must focus on growth businesses and target scarce resources rather than trying to be all things to all men, which is what the Government's economic strategy tries to do.

Innovation is driven by people, and the Minister has acknowledged that. Public grants do not stimulate innovation; it is people who have the determination, the drive

Ni ellid creu arloesydd nac entrepreneur; gellid ond eu meithrin. Eto, y mae addysg yn bwysig—addysg uwch yn enwedig—i agor llygaid myfyrwyr i botensial arloesi.

Yn bwysicach yn y cyd-destun hwn y mae sgiliau rheolwyr busnesau a'u parodrwydd i arloesi. Dylai datblygu sgiliau rheolwyr fod yn brif elfen i'r strategaeth arloesi ac i unrhyw gynllunio twf economaidd. Ni chredaf fod gwariant cyhoeddus ar yr economi yng Nghymru erioed wedi mynd i'r afael o ddifrif â datblygu rheolaeth mewn busnes.

Caf fy synnu nad oes cyfeiriad at bwysigrwydd patentau i fusnesau yn y cyllyn gweithredu hwn. Er bod yma gyfeiriadau at ymchwil a datblygu, gallai'r ymdrechion hynny fod yn ddiwerth os nad yw cwmni yn sicrhau patentau. Mae menter Eiddo Deallusol Cymru yn bodoli ond nid oes cyfeiriad ati yn y cynllun hwn.

Mae isadeiledd technoleg gwybodaeth yn hanfodol i fusnes sy'n arloesi. Mae'n eironig i'r Gweinidog gynnig ei gynllun gweithredu arloesi heddiw, ac yfory y bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn torri £800,000 o gyllideb band eang y Cynulliad. Bythefnos yn ôl, yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, clustnodwyd £10 miliwn ar gyfer band eang: yr wythnos hon, £9.2 miliwn sydd yn y gyllideb derfynol. Er yr holl sbin ar bwysigrwydd band eang i fusnesau, y mae'r Llywodraeth yn torri ei gyllideb. Stori go wahanol a geir o'r rhethreg gyhoeddus a'r realiti ariannol. Efallai ein bod yn deall yn awr pam nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud datganiad na chyflwyno dadl ar fand eang yn y Cynulliad, na chynnig papur i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd arno. Nid oes rhyfedd i'r Gweinidog guddio rhag craffu ar fand eang os mai torri'r gyllideb yw'r bwriad. Dylai'r Gweinidog gofio os na fydd buddsoddiad cyhoeddus, trefnus a sylweddol i fand eang yng Nghymru, gallwn anghofio llwyddo drwy arloesi, ac anghofio 'Cymru'n Ennill'.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan

and the skills to innovate. You cannot create an innovator or an entrepreneur; you can but nurture them. Again, education is important—higher education especially—to open students' eyes to the potential of innovation.

More important in this context are the skills of business managers and their willingness to innovate. Developing managers' skills should be the main element of the innovation strategy and any economic growth plans. I do not believe that public expenditure on the economy in Wales has ever seriously got to grips with developing management in business.

I am surprised that this action plan does not refer to the importance of patents to businesses. Although there are references to research and development, such efforts can be futile if the company does not secure patents. We have the Intellectual Property Wales initiative but there is no reference to it in this plan.

An information technology infrastructure is essential to an innovative business. It is ironic that the Minister has proposed his innovation action plan today when, tomorrow, the Finance Minister will cut funding for broadband by £800,000. A fortnight ago, in the draft budget for the next year, £10 million was allocated for broadband: this week, in the final budget, it is £9.2 million. Despite all the spin about the importance of broadband to businesses, the Government is cutting its budget. The public rhetoric tells rather a different story from the financial reality. Perhaps we now understand why the Minister has not made a statement or tabled a debate on broadband in the Assembly, nor presented a paper to the Economic Development Committee on it. It is no wonder that the Minister shies away from scrutiny on broadband if the intention is to cut funding. The Minister should bear in mind that if there is not systematic and substantial public investment in broadband in Wales, we can forget about succeeding through innovation, and forget about 'A Winning Wales'.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiaf y gwellianau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

Morgan. Amendment 2: add to the beginning of point 1, before the word 'notes':

*regrets that the opportunity has not been made available to the Economic Development Committee to input into the development of policy but*

I propose amendment 3. Insert at the end of point 2, after the word 'process':

*which will involve detailed consideration by the Economic Development Committee.*

In referring to the amendments tabled in Jonathan Morgan's name, I want to highlight the lack of involvement of the so-called policy-making Economic Development Committee in the document. That is consistent with the Minister for Economic Development's tendency to distance himself from the Committee. It is fair to say that, after almost six months in post, the Minister has chosen to have as little involvement with the Committee as possible.

The Minister knows that his knowledge and understanding of economic development is second rate. He knows that the paper would have been criticised widely, and chose to bypass the accepted normal process—so much so that it can be argued, as Elin Jones highlighted, that today's debate is virtually pointless because the consultation paper has already been printed. In his speech, the Minister asked us to refer to the content of the document, and expressed disappointment that the amendments did not do so—but the document has already been printed. Any such amendments tabled and carried today would have been ignored or, had we insisted that the document be reprinted, would have increased its cost.

Today's document demonstrates the Minister's lack of understanding of business. Innovation comes from within an organisation. It comes from its people—from the management to the shop floor—from its culture, the nature of the organisation and how it interacts. Innovation comes from communication between the various facets of an organisation and its suppliers and the users of its products and services. It is aimed at process improvements, product development

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu at ddechrau pwynt 1, cyn 'yn nodi':

*yn flin na roddwyd y cyfle i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd gael mewnbwn i'r gwaith o ddatblygu polisi ond*

Cynigiaf gwelliant 3. Ar ôl pwynt 2, rhoi:

*bydd yn rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd roi ystyriaeth fanwl iddo.*

Wrth gyfeirio at y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enw Jonathan Morgan, dymunaf dynnu sylw at y diffyg cysylltiad a fu gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd creu polisi, fel y'i gelwir, â'r ddogfen. Mae hynny'n gyson â thuedd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i ymbellhau oddi wrth y Pwyllgor. Teg dweud, ar ôl ymron i chwe mis yn ei swydd, fod y Gweinidog wedi dewis ymwneud cyn lleied â phosibl â'r Pwyllgor.

Gŵyr y Gweinidog fod ei wybodaeth a'i ddealltwriaeth o ddatblygu economaidd yn eilradd. Gŵyr y cāi'r papur ei feirniadu'n eang, a dewisodd osgoi'r broses arferol gydnabyddedig—a hynny i'r fath raddau fel y gellid dadlau, fel y nododd Elin Jones, fod y ddadl heddiw bron yn ddiwerth gan fod y papur ymgynghorol wedi'i argraffu eisoes. Yn ei araith, gofynnodd y Gweinidog inni gyfeirio at gynnwys y ddogfen, a mynegodd siom nad oedd y gwelliannau'n gwneud hynny—ond mae'r ddogfen eisoes wedi'i hargraffu. Byddai unrhyw welliannau o'r fath a gâi eu cyflwyno a'u derbyn heddiw wedi'u hanwybyddu neu, pe byddem wedi mynnu bod y ddogfen yn cael ei hargraffu, byddai hynny wedi cynyddu ei chost.

Mae'r ddogfen heddiw'n dangos diffyg dealltwriaeth y Gweinidog o fusnes. Mae arloesedd yn codi o'r tu mewn i gorff. Daw o'i bobl—o'r rheolwyr ac o'r rhai ar lawr y gwaith—o'i arferion, o natur y corff a sut y mae'n rhwngweithio. Mae arloesedd yn deillio o gyfathrebu rhwng gwahanol elfennau'r corff a'i gyflenwyr a defnyddwyr ei gynhyrchion a'i wasanaethau. Fe'i hanelir at wella prosesau, datblygu cynhyrchion neu wella'r dull o redeg y corff. Gall arloesedd

or improving the running of an organisation. Innovation can evolve. It can develop from original thinking and can sometimes lead to a paradigm shift. There have been countless studies on how innovation originates and how it can be facilitated, offering a range of conclusions. I am sure that a top-down, supply side plan from the state has never been one of them. That is what this document offers, which demonstrates the Minister's lack of understanding.

Does the Minister honestly believe that 'Wales 4 Innovation' will improve any business organisation in terms of all that I mentioned—people, culture, communication and liaising with customers? If he does, it merely demonstrates his naiveté.

4.00 p.m.

I must be honest, Mr Dirprwy Lywydd: when I first read the document, I thought that it would probably cost a great deal of money, achieve little but, in essence, do no harm. Now, however, I believe that it will damage the perception of Wales, in that any businessman or potential investor will be disturbed by the Minister for Economic Development's thinking and by the Assembly Government's approach to economic development as illustrated in the paper. Although innovation is not easy to understand, the role of the state is straightforward. Policies of deregulation and of cutting bureaucracy and red tape allow the manager to focus on running the business and to seek faster, more improved processes and innovation. The only form of innovation that this document will lead to is innovation for the manager who is determined to receive a grant and will seek ways around the rules to draw down financial support. Business needs the right environment in which to innovate and the right sort of infrastructure, communication and ICT links. Those factors allow a business to develop and to bring together all the features that I mentioned earlier.

3M is widely regarded as one of the world's most innovative organisations in terms of reinventing itself.

**Delyth Evans:** I have listened with interest to

ddatblygu. Gall ddatblygu o feddwl gwreiddiol a gall arwain weithiau at newid patrwm. Bu astudiaethau dirifedi o darddiad arloesedd a sut y gellir ei hwyluso, a gynigiodd amryw o gasgliadau. Yr wyf yn sicr na fu cynllun o'r brig i'r bôn ar yr ochr gyflenwi gan y wladwriaeth erioed yn un ohonynt. Hynny a gynigir gan y ddogfen hon, sy'n dangos diffyg dealltwriaeth y Gweinidog.

A yw'r Gweinidog yn credu o ddifrif y bydd 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi' yn gwella unrhyw gorff busnes o ran y cwbl y cyfeiriad ato—pobl, arferion, cyfathrebu a chysylltu â chwsmeriaid? Os ydyw, nid yw ond yn dangos ei naiffrwydd.

Rhaid imi fod yn onest, Mr Dirprwy Lywydd: pan ddarllenais y ddogfen yn gyntaf, credais y byddai'n debygol o gostio llawer o arian, yn cyflawni fawr ddim ond, yn y bôn, yn gwneud dim niwed. Erbyn hyn, fodd bynnag, credaf y bydd yn niweidio'r canfyddiad o Gymru, i'r graddau y bydd unrhyw ddyn busnes neu fuddsodwr posibl yn cael ei anesmwytho gan syniadau'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a chan ymagwedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad at ddatblygu economaidd fel y'i dangosir yn y papur. Er nad yw arloesedd yn hawdd i'w ddeall, mae rôl y wladwriaeth yn syml. Mae polisiau o ddadreoleiddio a chwtogi biwrocratiaeth yn caniatáu i'r rheolwr ganolbwytio ar redeg y busnes a cheisio prosesau gwell a chyflymach ac arloesedd. Yr unig fath o arloesedd y bydd y ddogfen hon yn arwain ato yw arloesedd gan y rheolwr sy'n benderfynol o dderbyn grant ac a fydd yn chwilio am fylchau yn y rheolau i gael cymorth ariannol. Mae ar fusnes angen yr amgylchedd priodol i arloesi a'r math iawn o seilwaith, cyfathrebu a chysylltiadau TGCh. Mae'r ffactorau hynny'n caniatáu i fusnes ddatblygu a dod â'r holl agweddau a grybwyllais yn gynharach at ei gilydd.

Ystyrir 3M gan lawer yn un o gyrrff mwyaf arloesol y byd o ran ei allu i'w ailddyfeisio'i hun.

**Delyth Evans:** Yr wyf wedi gwrando ar eich

your speech. It is clear that you advocate a laissez-faire approach to economics, which is very much in line with Conservative policy. It is fair enough for you to take that position. However, we in the Labour Party completely disagree with it and believe that the Government has a role to play in supporting innovation and enterprise. That is what we are trying to achieve in the Assembly, and we have achieved far better results in that regard than did the Conservative Party during its 18 years in power, during which the economy went down hill rapidly.

**Alun Cairns:** That demonstrates Delyth Evans's lack of understanding. If you look at the gross domestic product per capita figures, you can see that, after five and a half years of a Labour administration and its promises to bridge the wealth gap, the gap between England and Wales is now wider than it has been in generations. All recognised business experts say that it will get wider still. The Labour Government must accept responsibility for that.

3M is widely recognised as one of the world's most innovative organisations. Does the Minister honestly believe that it and other organisations, from the one-man band to small and medium-sized enterprises and larger organisations, will become more innovative as a result of this document? That shows naivety in policy and interaction and is nothing more than an advertising exercise. It will add confusion by adding yet more grants on top of the 84 that the Welsh Development Agency already offers. Business needs infrastructure and public sector support, but it needs broader-based public sector support and a smaller number of grants, not the confusion to which this document will lead.

**Val Lloyd:** Before I start, I must say that, much to my shame, I am not absolutely certain of my position on declaration of interest until I receive David Melding's letter. I will therefore declare an interest as a councillor for the City and County of Swansea. I am sure that the Assembly will forgive me if that declaration is incorrect.

araith gyda diddordeb. Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn dadlau dros agwedd *laissez-faire* at economeg, sy'n gyson iawn â pholisi'r Ceidwadwyr. Mae'n ddigon teg ichi gymryd y safbwyt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym ni yn y Blaid Lafur yn llwyr anghytuno ag ef ac yn credu bod rôl i'w chwarae gan y Llywodraeth wrth hybu arloesedd a menter. Dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni yn y Cynulliad, ac yr ydym wedi sicrhau canlyniadau gwell o lawer yn hynny o beth nag a wnaeth y Blaid Geidwadol yn ystod ei 18 mlynedd mewn grym, pan ddirywiodd yr economi'n gyflym.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae hynny'n amlygu diffyg dealltwriaeth Delyth Evans. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau am gynnrych mewnwladol crynswth y pen, gallwch weld, ar ôl pum mlynedd a hanner o weinyddiaeth Lafur a'i haddewidion i gau'r bwlc cyfoeth, fod y bwlc rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yn fwy'n awr nag y bu ers cenedlaethau. Mae'r holl arbenigwyr busnes cydnabyddedig yn dweud y bydd yn mynd yn fwy byth. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth Lafur dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am hynny.

Mae llawer yn cydnabod bod 3M ymysg cyrff mwyaf arloesol y byd. A yw'r Gweinidog yn credu o ddifrif y bydd ef a chyrff eraill, o'r band un dyn i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint a chyrff mwy, yn mynd yn fwy arloesol o ganlyniad i'r ddogfen hon? Mae hynny'n dangos naiffrwydd o ran polisi a ryngweithio ac nid yw'n ddim mwy nag ymarfer hysbysebu. Bydd yn peri rhagor o ddrysych drwy ychwanegu mwy o grantiau ar ben yr 84 y mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru'n eu cynnig eisoes. Mae ar fusnes angen seilwaith a chymorth sector cyhoeddus, ond mae arno angen cymorth sector cyhoeddus ar sail ehangach a nifer llai o grantiau, nid y dryswch y bydd y ddogfen hon yn arwain ato.

**Val Lloyd:** Cyn imi ddechrau, rhaid imi ddweud, er mawr gywilydd i ni, nad wyf yn gwbl sicer yngylch fy sefyllfa o ran datgan buddiant hyd nes y caf lythyr David Melding. Gan hynny, datganaf fuddiant fel cynghorydd dros Ddinas a Sir Abertawe. Yr wyf yn sicer y bydd y Cynulliad yn maddau i mi os yw'r datganiad hwnnw'n anghywir.

I do not share Mr Cairns's scepticism. In the action plan innovation is described as

'the successful, commercial exploitation of new ideas',

which can lead to sustained growth and economic prosperity. Innovation has two meanings for me. It can be taken to mean newness and also change. The plan is about both new ways of operating and harnessing change. Even better, the more I study it, the more I think it is a fusion of the two.

Among many other excellent ideas in the plan is the proposal for an integrated network of innovation centres modelled on the roll-out of the Technium concept, which is a proven success, especially in my constituency, Swansea East. Technium 2 is also under way and Swansea East, to coin a phrase, is further taking off with the new Welsh space academy—the first in the UK—and also in the pioneering Port Tawe innovation village.

The space academy, which will have educational facilities, visitor attractions and will be a home for research and development groups, exemplifies the underlying themes of the innovation plan. There is a link between the technology used to deliver billion-dollar payloads into space and the innovative work going on at Technium. Furthermore, the educational element of the proposal complements the planned encouragement of innovation and will help to ensure that young people are enthused about science and technology.

The action plan acknowledges the part that academic entrepreneurship must play. The benchmark for this is the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Its graduates have founded over 4,000 currently active companies, with 1,000 of these based in their home state. These enterprises are not only in science and technology, but in a range of diverse sectors. The local impact is tremendous, especially since many of the companies are global. To extend that analogy—it is on a smaller scale, but still

Nid wyf yn rhannu sgeftigiaeth Mr Cairns. Yn y cynllun gweithredu, y disgrifiad o arloesedd yw

'ymelwa yn llwyddiannus ac yn fasnachol ar syniadau newydd',

sy'n gallu arwain at dwf parhaus a ffyniant economaidd. Mae dwy ystyr i arloesedd yn fy ngolwg i. Gellir cymryd ei fod yn golygu newydd-deb a newid hefyd. Mae'r cynllun yn ymwneud â'r ddau ddull newydd o weithredu a harneisio newid. Yn well byth, po fwyaf y'i hastudiaf, mwyaf y credaf ei fod yn gyfuniad o'r ddau.

Ymysg y nifer fawr o syniadau rhagorol eraill yn y cynllun y mae'r cynnig ar gyfer rhwydwaith integredig o ganolfannau arloesedd sy'n dilyn patrwm yr estyniad o'r cysyniad Technium, sydd wedi profi'n llwyddiant, yn enwedig yn fy etholaeth i, Dwyrain Abertawe. Mae Technium 2 ar y gweill hefyd ac mae Dwyrain Abertawe yn codi'n uwch fyth, os goddefir yr ymadrodd, gyda'r academi gofod Gymreig newydd—y gyntaf yn y DU—a hefyd gyda phentref arloesedd blaengar Port Tawe.

Mae'r academi gofod, a fydd â chyfleusterau addysgol ac atyniadau i ymwelwyr ac a fydd yn gartref i grwpiau ymchwil a datblygu, yn amlygu themâu sylfaenol y cynllun arloesedd. Mae cysylltiad rhwng y dechnoleg a ddefnyddir i anfon llwythi gwerth biliynau o ddoleri i'r gofod a'r gwaith arloesol sy'n mynd ymlaen yn Technium. At hynny, mae elfen addysgol y cynnig yn ategu'r bwriad i hybu arloesedd a bydd yn gymorth i ennyn brwdfrydedd pobl ifanc ynghylch gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n cydnabod y rhan y bydd yn rhaid i entrepreneuriaeth ei chwarae. Y feincnod i hynny yw Sefydliad Technoleg Massachusetts. Mae ei raddedigion wedi sefydlu dros 4,000 o gwmniau sy'n weithredol ar hyn o bryd, ac mae 1,000 ohonynt â'u canolfan yn eu talaith gartref. Nid ym maes gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg yn unig y mae'r mentrau hyn, ond mewn amryw o sectorau. Mae'r effaith leol yn aruthrol, yn enwedig gan fod llawer o'r cwmniau'n fyd-eang. Gan ymestyn y

beneficial to the economy—universities in the Netherlands, Finland and Sweden have had a powerful impact in their regions. These gains are not by accident; they followed a policy decision, with strategies for implementation. The essence of the action plan's proposals is the link between companies and academia.

As comparative figures show, few of our graduates become self-employed. However, that does not mean that there is a lack of ideas. The same study showed that their technical confidence and innovation is likely to be greater than that of others. However, it means that active encouragement and positive measures—such as those before us—are necessary to redress the balance. I agree with the Minister that the ultimate resource for innovation is people and their ideas. The series of measures detailed in the plan recognise that and offer practical steps to grow, encourage, nurture and develop those ideas to ensure sustainable development and shared prosperity.

The targets will continue to benefit my constituency, Swansea East, and I am sure that once the plan is fully implemented, it will benefit the whole of Wales.

**David Melding:** It might be helpful if I say to the Member that my interpretation of her declaration of interest is that it was a voluntary declaration. It was not required under Standing Orders and does not probably comply with them in terms of the depth of the interest declared.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Members are responsible for deciding whether to declare an interest.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The innovation action plan rightly points out that we must strengthen our innovation culture in Wales and seeks to do that. Innovation is the successful exploitation of new ideas, is a key productivity driver and can give a company a competitive advantage and promote sustainable growth. Innovation is people-driven, as has been mentioned. Ultimately, it is about creativity, inventiveness and problem solving. It also carries an element of

gyfatebiaeth honno—mae ar raddfa lai, ond yn fuddiol i'r economi er hynny—mae prifysgolion yn yr Iseldiroedd, y Ffindir a Sweden wedi cael effaith gryf yn eu rhanbarthau. Nid ar hap y cafwyd yr enillion hyn; daethant yn sgil penderfyniad polisi, gyda strategaethau i'w weithredu. Hanfod cynigion y cynllun gweithredu yw'r cyswllt rhwng cwmnïau a'r byd academaidd.

Fel y dengys y ffigurau cymharol, ychydig o'n graddedigion sy'n mynd yn hunangyflogedig. Fodd bynnag, ni olyga hynny fod prinder syniadau. Dangosodd yr un astudiaeth fod eu hyder technegol a'u harloesedd yn debygol o fod yn fwy na'r hyn sydd gan eraill. Er hynny, golyga fod angen anogaeth weithredol a chamau cadarnhaol—fel y rhai ger ein bron—i unioni'r fantol. Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog mai'r adnodd pwysicaf ar gyfer arloesedd yw pobl a'u syniadau. Mae'r gyfres o fesurau a nodir yn y cynllun yn cydnabod hynny ac yn cynnig camau ymarferol i dyfu, hybu, meithrin a datblygu'r syniadau hynny i sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy a ffyniant a rennir.

Bydd y targedau'n parhau i fod o fudd i'm hetholaeth i, Dwyrain Abertawe, ac yr wyf yn sicr, ar ôl gweithredu'r cynllun yn llawn, y bydd o fudd i Gymru gyfan.

**David Melding:** Gallai fod yn fuddiol os dywedaf wrth yr Aelod mai fy nehongliad i o'i datganiad o fuddiant yw ei fod yn ddatganiad gwirfoddol. Nid oedd yn ofynnol o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog ac nid yw'n cydymffurfio â hwy yn ôl pob tebyg o ran manylder y buddiant a ddatganwyd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr Aelodau sy'n gyfrifol am benderfynu a ddylent ddatgan buddiant.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r cynllun gweithredu arloesedd yn nodi'n briodol fod rhaid inni gryfhau ein diwylliant arloesedd yng Nghymru ac mae'n ceisio gwneud hynny. Arloesedd yw'r defnydd llwyddiannus o syniadau newydd, mae'n un o brif ysgogwyr cynhyrchiant a gall roi mantais gystadleuol i gwmni a hyrwyddo twf cynaliadwy. Caiff arloesedd ei ysgogi gan bobl, fel y dywedwyd. Yn y pen draw, mae'n ymwnneud â gallu creadigol, dyfeisgarwch a

acceptance of informed risk. The role of the Government is one of assistance in creating the right environment in which innovation can flourish, and the action plan aims to do that. However, it is important to remember that the main responsibility for innovating must be borne by businesses in Wales. There is a need to encourage innovation to become second nature, as there is a huge reserve of untapped productivity in Wales and the UK. There is a persistent productivity gap between the UK and the major economies of the world.

Welsh people are inventive. We need only look towards our culture and history to realise that, and consider the word play in the poetry of Dylan Thomas and R.S. Thomas or the imagination of Phil Bennett, Jonathan Davies and J.P.R. Williams on the rugby pitch. However, we have not always been successful in translating that inventive flair into business. I am pleased therefore that the Assembly Government is investing in innovation and creating the right conditions in which innovation can flourish in businesses throughout Wales. The establishment of the single innovation grant scheme, worth £25 million over the next three years, is welcome, but we must not rest on our laurels. We must continue to strive to streamline all funding applications for all available financial support, particularly for small businesses, through a risk-taking and proactive Finance Wales.

4.10 p.m.

**Brian Hancock:** I remind everybody that 99 per cent of all firms employ fewer than 50 people, 95 per cent employ fewer than 10 employees and that self-employed people make up 60 per cent of all firms. They are the potential entrepreneurs.

Let us consider the plan. Plaid Cymru welcomes the aims of this document and the commitment of much needed funding for innovation. Our economic policy is focused on the need to encourage growth in Welsh SMEs, by helping them to develop new products and services, and enabling them to better compete in Wales and the wider market.

datrys problemau. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys derbyn rhywfaint o risg yn wybodus. Rôl y Llywodraeth yw helpu i greu'r amgylchedd iawn lle y gall arloesedd ffynnu, ac mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n ceisio gwneud hynny. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig cofio mai busnesau yng Nghymru sy'n gorfol derbyn y prif gyfrifoldeb dros arloesi. Mae angen meithrin arloesedd fel ail natur, gan fod swm aruthrol o gynhyrchiant sydd heb ei gyffwrdd yng Nghymru a'r DU. Mae bwlch cynhyrchiant parhaus rhwng y DU a phrif economiau'r byd.

Mae pobl Cymru'n ddyfeisgar. Nid oes ond rhaid inni edrych ar ein diwylliant a'n hanes i sylweddoli hynny ac ystyried y chwarae ar eiriau ym marddoniaeth Dylan Thomas ac R.S. Thomas neu ddychymyg Phil Bennett, Jonathan Davies a J.P.R. Williams ar y cae rygbi. Er hynny, nid ydym bob amser wedi llwyddo i droi'r ddawn ddyfeisgar honno'n fusnes. Yr wyf yn falch felly fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn buddsoddi mewn arloesedd ac yn creu'r amodau iawn i arloesedd gael ffynnu mewn busnesau ledled Cymru. Mae sefydlu'r cynllun grant arloesedd sengl, gwerth £25 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf, i'w groesawu, ond rhaid inni beidio â gorffwys ar ein bri. Rhaid inni barhau i ymdrechu i symleiddio'r holl geisiadau am arian ar gyfer yr holl gymorth ariannol sydd ar gael, yn enwedig i fusnesau bach, drwy Cyllid Cymru mentrus a rhagweithiol.

**Brian Hancock:** Atgoffaf bawb fod 99 y cant o'r holl fusnesau'n cyflogi llai na 50 o bobl, 95 y cant yn cyflogi llai na 10 gweithiwr ac mai pobl hunangyflogedig yw 60 y cant o'r holl fusnesau. Hwy yw'r entreprenoriaid dichonol.

Gadewch inni ystyried y cynllun. Mae Plaid Cymru'n croesawu nodau'r ddogfen hon a neilltuo arian y mae mawr angen amdano ar gyfer arloesedd. Mae ein polisi economaidd yn canolbwytio ar yr angen i hybu twf mewn busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru, drwy eu helpu i ddatblygu cynhyrchion a gwasanaethau newydd, a'u galluogi i gystadlu'n well yng Nghymru ac yn y farchnad ehangach.

I will digress for a moment. There is much timber in Wales, which was grown for the mining industry. I am holding a piece of timber here, of typical log size. How can we convert it into a new product? The answer is that we can make floor tiles. We can make the Welsh joint, which makes Welsh timber more exciting when used in furniture. We only need to develop these ideas. The Coed Cymru initiative encompasses these ideas, and there is potential for development. We do not need big companies to do it; small companies can do it.

Wales has been falling behind the rest of the UK in terms of profitability and exports, despite this Government's constant reminders of record levels of regional selective assistance. That reflects the desperate need for action, not only to support businesses in innovation and with finance, but also to change the culture of businesses in Wales to make them more competitive and ambitious.

In July of this year, Experian noted that the profitability of Welsh companies had declined by 56 per cent in the 12 months to July 2002. It has been declining for four years. The average return on capital is the lowest in the UK—2.53 per cent, down from 5.76 per cent. Exports fell by 15 per cent in 2001-02 compared with a fall of only 6 per cent in the rest of the UK. In the Federation of Small Businesses survey, 'Lifting the Barriers to Growth in UK Small Businesses', published earlier this year, over a third of businesses did not express an ambition to grow over the next five years. That reflects the difficulties that many businesses, particularly small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales, have in getting past the bureaucratic barrier that lies between them and Government support. While Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales welcomes the commitment of funds in this document, it has many concerns. Past experience has shown that, too often, public sector business support in Wales does not reach those businesses that need it the most and have the greatest potential to boost the Welsh economy.

Gwnaf grwydro am eiliad. Mae llawer o goed yng Nghymru, a dyfwyd ar gyfer y diwydiant cloddio. Yr wyf yn gafael mewn darn o bren, sy'n fonyff o faint nodwediadol. Sut y gallwn ei droi'n gynnwyrch newydd? Yr ateb yw y gallwn wneud teils llawr. Gallwn wneud yr uniad Cymreig, sy'n peri bod coed Cymru'n fwy diddorol pan gaiff ei ddefnyddio mewn dodrefn. Nid oes ond rhaid inni ddatblygu'r syniadau hyn. Mae menter Coed Cymru'n cwmpasu'r syniadau hyn, ac mae potensial i'w datblygu. Nid oes arnom angen cwmniâu mawr i wneud hynny; gall cwmniâu bach ei wneud.

Bu Cymru'n colli tir i weddill y DU o ran proffidioldeb ac allforion, er bod y Llywodraeth hon yn ein hatgoffa o hyd am y lefelau uchaf erioed o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r angen dybryd am weithredu, nid yn unig i gynorthwyo busnesau mewn arloesedd a chyda chyllid, ond hefyd i newid diwylliant busnesau yng Nghymru i'w gwneud yn fwy cystadleuol ac uchelgeisiol.

Yng Ngorffennaf y flwyddyn hon, nododd Experian fod proffidioldeb cwmniâu Cymru wedi dirywio 56 y cant yn y 12 mis hyd fis Gorffennaf 2002. Mae'n dirywio ers pedair blynedd. Yr elw cyfartalog ar gyfalaf yw'r isaf yn y DU—2.53 y cant, i lawr o 5.76 y cant. Bu gostyngiad o 15 y cant mewn allforion yn 2001-02 o'i gymharu â gostyngiad o ddim ond 6 y cant yng ngweddill y DU. Yn arolwg Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach, 'Lifting the Barriers to Growth in UK Small Businesses', a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach eleni, yr oedd traean o'r busnesau yn dweud nad oedd ganddynt uchelgais i dyfu dros y pum mlynedd nesaf. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r anawsterau y mae llawer o fusnesau, yn enwedig busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru, yn eu profi wrth geisio goresgyn y rhwystr biwrocrataidd sy'n sefyll rhyngddynt hwy a chymorth y Llywodraeth. Er bod Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales yn croesawu'r arian a neilltuwyd yn y ddogfen hon, mae ganddi lawer o bryderon. Mae profiad y gorffennol wedi dangos, yn rhy aml, nad yw cymorth busnes sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru'n cyrraedd y

busnesau hynny sydd ei angen fwyaf ac sydd â'r potensial mwyaf i hybu economi Cymru.

Businesses in Wales expressed the highest levels of dissatisfaction with Government business support in the FSB survey. If we look a little closer at the Government's record levels of RSA funding, indigenous Welsh firms have received only 27 per cent of RSA funding so far, even though they have increased employment at a lower cost per job rate than firms from outside Wales. RSA grants to Welsh firms created jobs at an average cost of £8,745 per job, while UK and foreign firms created employment at an average cost of £10,659 and £12,400 respectively. Small businesses in Wales deserve better from this Government. I have mentioned the figures on the size of businesses in Wales: we must remember that many are small businesses. Despite the Welsh Development Agency's commitment two years ago to set up a small firms division, nothing has happened. What is the Government's position on this?

Busnesau yng Nghymru a fynegodd yr anfodlonrwydd mwyaf gyda chymorth busnes y Llywodraeth yn arolwg Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach. Os edrychwn ychydig yn fanylach ar lefelau uchaf erioed y Llywodraeth o wariant ar gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, nid yw busnesau cynhenid yng Nghymru ond wedi derbyn 27 y cant o'r gwariant ar gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol hyd yn hyn, er eu bod wedi cynyddu cyflogaeth ar gyfradd cost y swydd is na busnesau o'r tu allan i Gymru. Yr oedd y grantiau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i gwmniau Cymreig wedi creu swyddi am gost gyfartalog o £8,745 y swydd, tra bod busnesau'r DU a busnesau tramor wedi creu cyflogaeth am gost gyfartalog o £10,659 a £12,400 yn y drefn honno. Mae busnesau bach yng Nghymru'n haeddu gwell gan y Llywodraeth hon. Yr wyf wedi sôn am y ffigurau am faint busnesau yng Nghymru: mae'n rhaid inni gofio bod llawer ohonynt yn fusnesau bach. Er gwaethaf ymrwymiad Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ddwy flynedd yn ôl i sefydlu is-adran busnesau bach, nid oes dim wedi digwydd. Beth yw safbwyt y Llywodraeth ar hyn?

We hope that a proactive approach in offering advice and grants, to which the document refers, will target indigenous small and medium-sized enterprises. SMEs are often unable to overcome bureaucratic barriers and are prevented from obtaining public funding due to time and staffing constraints. Larger firms, typically from outside Wales, have an advantage. They can devote people to it. Let us hope that the innovation grant will get through to our small businesses and not merely create another layer of bureaucracy. A small firms division in the WDA could help that, as has happened in England with the small business service.

Gobeithiwn y bydd y dull rhagweithiol o gynnig cyngor a grantiau, y mae'r ddogfen hon yn cyfeirio ato, yn targedu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint cynhenid. Yn aml nid yw busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn gallu goresgyn rhwystrau biwrocrataidd ac fe'u hatelir rhag cael cyllid cyhoeddus oherwydd cyfyngiadau amser a staffio. Mae mantais gan y busnesau mwy, sydd o'r tu allan i Gymru gan mwyaf. Gallant neilltu pobl i weithio ar hynny. Gadewch inni obeithio y bydd y grant arloesedd yn cyrraedd ein busnesau bach ac na fydd ond yn creu haen arall o fiwrocraciaeth. Byddai is-adran busnesau bach yn y WDA yn gallu helpu yn hynny o beth, fel y digwyddodd yn Lloegr gyda'r gwasanaeth busnesau bach.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this innovation action plan, 'Wales 4 Innovation', which develops and details the innovation elements of the Assembly Government's economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales'. As someone

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r cynllun arloesedd hwn, 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi', sy'n datblygu ac yn rhestru'r elfennau arloesedd yn strategaeth datblygu economaidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Fel un sydd

who has actually started both a private and a community business, I welcome the support embodied in this paper. The arrogance exhibited by the Welsh Conservative speakers sums up what has been going wrong with the economy in Wales. For too long, the economic heart of Wales was ripped out and sent down the road to England. Wales was nothing more than a colony of England. Now, we have an opportunity to facilitate and enable the development of technology and commercial businesses, which will bring prosperity. As mentioned many times in Plenary, the gross domestic product per capita in Wales is only 80 per cent of the UK average. That is why it is crucial that we encourage and support innovation, because the potential is there in the Welsh economy. We must develop a much better attitude to creating hot jobs and cool communities, as I have said many times. In debating innovation and considering how to achieve a Wales with hot jobs and cool communities, I draw your attention to the vision section of the document. We must develop a can-do attitude. Along with investing the millions of pounds in this plan, we have a responsibility to look to what can be achieved by encouraging a can-do attitude.

The Assembly is committed to sustainable development, and we have a statutory duty to promote sustainable development in all our activities. To sustain industry, we must exploit new technologies and processes. Today's knowledge-based economy changes quickly. To keep up with those changes, we must encourage educational establishments, particularly in higher education, to capture this technology and use it to solve many of the problems that we see around us. I would love to see more encouragement given to the development of cleaner fuels, such as the extracting of hydrogen from biomass, because that is the future of clean energy.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you accept that innovation comes from within an organisation? Whatever the administration does, whatever documents it produces, whatever confusion it introduces with a range of different business support schemes, it will not help to change an organisation's culture and make it innovative,

wedi cychwyn busnes preifat a busnes cymunedol, croesawaf y cymorth a ymgorfforir yn y papur hwn. Mae'r hyfdra a amlygwyd gan siaradwyr Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n crynhoi yr hyn sydd wedi bod yn mynd o chwith yn yr economi yng Nghymru. Am gyfnod llawer rhy hir, cai calon economaidd Cymru ei rhwygo allan a'i hanfon i lawr y ffordd i Loegr. Nid oedd Cymru'n ddim mwy na threfedigaeth i Loegr. Yn awr mae gennym gyfle i hyrwyddo a hwyluso datblygu technoleg a busnesau masnachol, a ddaw â ffyniant. Fel y soniwyd lawer gwaith yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, nid yw'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru ond yn 80 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Dyna pam y mae'n hollbwysig inni hybu a chefnogi arloesedd, am fod y potensial hwnnw yn economi Cymru. Rhaid inni feithrin ymagwedd well o lawer at greu swyddi a chymunedau gwych, fel y dywedais lawer gwaith. Wrth drafod arloesedd ac ystyried sut i gael Cymru â swyddi a chymunedau gwych, tynnaf eich sylw at adran gweledigaeth y ddogfen. Rhaid inni feithrin ymagwedd y medraf. Ochr yn ochr â buddsoddi'r miliynau o bunnoedd yn y cynllun hwn, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni drwy hybu ymagwedd y medraf.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, ac yr ydym dan ddyletswydd statudol i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy yn ein holl weithgareddau. Er mwyn cynnal diwydiant, rhaid inni ddefnyddio technolegau a phrosesau newydd. Mae'r economi sy'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth sydd ohoni'n newid yn gyflym. Er mwyn bod yn gyfysgwydd â'r newidiadau hynny, rhaid inni annog sefydliadau addysgol, yn enwedig mewn addysg uwch, i afael yn y dechnoleg hon a'i defnyddio i ddatrys llawer o'r problemau a welwn o'n cwmpas. Carwn weld mwy o anogaeth i ddatblygu tanwyddau glân, fel echdynnu hydrogen o fiomas, oherwydd dyna ddyfodol ynni glân.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn derbyn bod arloesedd yn codi y tu mewn i gorff? Beth bynnag a wnaiff y weinyddiaeth, pa bynnag ddogfennau y mae'n eu cynhyrchu, pa bynnag ddryswch y mae'n ei greu drwy gyflwyno amrediad o gynlluniau cymorth busnes gwahanol, ni fydd yn helpu i newid

ensuring the development of those new ideas. Furthermore, do you accept that it is not the developers of new ideas that are the most effective in business? Research shows that the inventors of ideas often do not make the greatest strides, but rather the people who take them forward—the second stage is as important as the first.

**Mick Bates:** There is no one answer, as I said in my opening remarks. It is a mix. In business, we all want to diversify our portfolios and assets. Commercial businesses generate profits, which enable innovation. There are also people who develop great inventions in their garages. Innovation covers a broad range of activities. In this document, we present broader opportunities to encourage people to take innovative ideas forward and ensure that, through the universities in particular, we can fund technological skills and knowledge.

**Brian Hancock:** Your can-do remarks were interesting. I believe in that attitude. However, where is that attitude in this document; where is the oomph to provide businesses with that can-do attitude and environment?

Kirsty Williams: We need a bit of oomph, Mick.

**Mick Bates:** We certainly do need some oomph, as Kirsty Williams has just reminded me. Thank you for providing some of it, Brian. The can-do attitude is in the vision section of the document. I would hope that you would have read the document and seen that. The action plan rightly highlights the need to boost spending on research and development in Wales. It is currently low, only 0.6 per cent of our GDP. The target in ‘A Winning Wales’ is to increase it to 1 per cent by 2010—this is crucial. As other Members have pointed out, the £260 million announced in this plan must be subject to rigorous evaluation and monitoring. We may be able to use some of the projects in this action plan as models for innovation and good practice and, hopefully, developments such as Technium, which have been rolled

arferion unrhyw gorff a’i wneud yn arloesol, i sicrhau datblygu’r syniadau newydd hynny. At hynny, a ydych yn derbyn nad datblygwyr syniadau newydd yw'r rhai mwyaf effeithiol mewn busnes? Mae ymchwil yn dangos nad dyfeiswyr syniadau’n aml sy’n cymryd y camau brasaf, ond yn hytrach y rhai sy’n bwrw ymlaen â hwy—mae’r ail gam gyn bwysiced â’r cyntaf.

**Mick Bates:** Mae mwy nag un ateb, fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol. Mae’n gymysgedd. Mewn busnes, yr ydym oll am amrywio ein portffolios a’n hasedau. Mae busnesau masnachol yn cynhyrchu elw, sy’n hwyluso arloesi. Ceir pobl hefyd sy’n datblygu dyfeisiadau pwysig yn eu garej. Mae arloesedd yn cwmpasu amrediad eang o weithgareddau. Yn y ddogfen hon, yr ydym yn cyflwyno cyfleoedd ehangach i gymhell pobl i fwrw ymlaen â syniadau arloesol a sicrhau, drwy’r prifysgolion yn enwedig, y gallwn ariannu sgiliau a gwybodaeth dechnolegol.

**Brian Hancock:** Yr oedd eich sylwadau am ymagwedd y medraf yn ddiddorol. Credaf yn yr ymagwedd honno. Serch hynny, ym mhle y ceir yr ymagwedd honno yn y ddogfen hon; ym mhle y mae’r symbyliad i ddarparu ymagwedd ac amgylchedd y medraf ar gyfer busnesau?

Kirsty Williams: Mae arnom angen ychydig o symbyliad, Mick.

**Mick Bates:** Mae’n sicr bod arnom angen ychydig o symbyliad, fel y mae Kirsty Williams newydd fy atgoffa. Diolch i chi am ddarparu rhywfaint ohono, Brian. Mae ymagwedd y medraf yn adran gweledigaeth y ddogfen. Gobeithiaf eich bod wedi darllen y ddogfen ac wedi gweld hynny. Mae’r cynllun gweithredu’n tynnu sylw’n briodol at yr angen i hybu’r gwariant ar ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru. Mae’n isel ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 0.6 y cant o’n cynnrych mewnwladol crynswth. Y targed yn ‘Cymru’n Ennill’ yw ei godi i 1 y cant erbyn 2010—mae hynny’n hollbwysig. Fel y mae Aelodau eraill wedi nodi, rhaid i’r £260 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd yn y cynllun hwn gael ei werthuso a’i fonitro’n drwyndl. Efallai y byddwn yn gallu defnyddio rhai o’r prosiectau yn y cynllun gweithredu hwn yn

out by the Minister for Economic Development, will prove successful and will contribute towards creating a prosperous Wales, where our innovative skills are valued.

4.20 p.m.

**Christine Chapman:** Transforming the Welsh economy is probably the most important challenge facing Wales, and it is crucial if we are to deliver real change and improve the quality of life and standard of living of the people of Wales. We must retain our talented people and enable our potential entrepreneurs to succeed in Wales. I welcome this action plan, which clearly demonstrates the progress we are making. Having seen the level of innovation that is beginning to emerge in Wales, I am sure that Members will agree with that.

I welcome the plan's emphasis on the crucial role of universities. There are many excellent examples of industry working closely with our higher education sector, but we know that we need to do much more. The plan does not refer to encouraging innovation earlier in school pupils. That should be amended; I would welcome a reference to that in the final document. Although the Economic Development Committee will address issues such as the work of the Education Business Partnership on 14 November, when it discusses the entrepreneurship action plan, this innovation plan could be more explicit with regard to encouraging innovation in education. This will require joint working with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. To encourage innovation in a variety of disciplines, we must consider where innovators come from. I believe in nurture not nature and much can be done to nurture young innovators.

I agree with Andrew that innovation is also about people skills, but the take-up of science is vital. The UK has a long tradition of scientists: Newton, Darwin, Faraday, Crick, Rosalind Franklin and Nurse, to name but a few. The strength and creativity of our science base is a key asset in the twenty-first century. Britain has produced 44 Nobel Prize winners in the last 50 years—more than any

fodelau ar gyfer arloesedd ac arfer da a gobeithio y bydd datblygiadau fel Technium, a roddwyd ar waith gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yn llwyddo ac yn cyfrannu at greu Cymru ffyniannus, lle y gwerthfawrogi'r ein sgiliau arloesol.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae'n debyg mai trawsffurfio economi Cymru yw'r her bwysicaf sy'n wynebu Cymru, ac mae'n hollbwysig os ydym i gyflawni newid gwirioneddol a gwella ansawdd bywyd a safon byw pobl Cymru. Rhaid inni gadw ein pobl dalentog a galluogi ein hentrepreneuriaid dichonol i lwyddo yng Nghymru. Croesawaf y cynllun gweithredu hwn, sy'n dangos yn eglur y cynnydd a wnawn. Wedi gweld maint yr arloesedd sy'n dechrau dod i'r golwg yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yr Aelodau'n cytuno â hynny.

Croesawaf y pwyslais yn y cynllun hwn ar rôl hanfodol y prifysgolion. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau rhagorol o ddiwydiant yn cydweithio'n agos â'n sector addysg uwch, ond gwyddom fod rhaid inni wneud mwy o lawer. Nid yw'r cynllun yn cyfeirio at hybu arloesedd yn gynharach ymysg disgyblion ysgol. Dylid newid hynny; byddwn yn falch o weld cyfeiriad at hynny yn y ddogfen derfynol. Er y bydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ymdrin â materion fel gwaith y Bartneriaeth Addysg Busnes ar 14 Tachwedd, pan fydd yn trafod y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth, gallai'r cynllun arloesedd hwn fod yn fwy pendant o ran hybu arloesedd mewn addysg. Bydd hyn yn gofyn am weithio ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Er mwyn hybu arloesedd mewn amryw o ddisgyblaethau, rhaid inni ystyried o ble y daw'r arloeswyr. Credaf mewn magwraeth yn hytrach na natur a gellir gwneud llawer i feithrin arloeswyr ifanc.

Cytunaf ag Andrew fod arloesedd yn ymwneud hefyd â sgiliau pobl, ond mae'r nifer sy'n astudio gwyddoniaeth yn hollbwysig. Mae llinach hir o wyddonwyr yn y DU: Newton, Darwin, Faraday, Crick, Rosalind Franklin a Nurse, ac enwi ond rhai. Mae cryfder a gallu creadigol ein sylfaen gwyddoniaeth yn ased allweddol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae Prydain wedi

other country except the US. However, we should acknowledge that only 8 of those have been in the last 20 years.

cynhyrchu 44 o enillwyr Gwobr Nobel yn y 50 mlynedd diwethaf—mwy na'r un wlad arall heblaw'r Unol Daleithiau. Fodd bynnag, dylem gydnabod mai dim ond 8 ohonynt a fu yn yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf.

**Phil Williams:** Will you add to your list of scientists the head of the largest scientific project that the human race has ever undertaken, who comes from Aberdare?

**Phil Williams:** A wnewch ychwanegu at eich rhestr o wyddonwyr bennaeth y prosiect gwyddonol mwyaf yr ymgymroedd y ddynol ryw ag ef erioed, sy'n hanu o Aberdâr?

**Christine Chapman:** Yes, of course. We must face this challenge and ensure that our young people share the excitement of science and innovation. We must reverse the decline in mathematics, physics and engineering and encourage more people to become science teachers. I know that we have an excellent initiative, but we must do more.

**Christine Chapman:** Gwnaf, wrth gwrs. Rhaid inni wynebu'r her hon a sicrhau bod ein pobl ifanc yn rhannu cyffro gwyddoniaeth ac arloesedd. Rhaid inni wrthdroi'r dirywiad mewn mathemateg, ffiseg a pheirianneg ac annog mwy o bobl i fod yn athrawon gwyddoniaeth. Gwn fod gennym fenter rago'r, ond rhaid inni wneud rhagor.

I ask that we resist, at all costs, any move to introduce top-up fees for so-called top universities. More investment is needed if our universities are to be competitive, but top-up fees would be a disincentive for our young people. Given that Wales does not enjoy the same level of prosperity as other areas in the UK, the top-up fees will have a disproportionate effect. Poorer students, many of whom come from Wales, are already under-represented in our most prestigious universities, and top-up fees will make this situation worse. This would have an adverse effect on encouraging our young people to go into research and development.

Gofynnaf am inni wrthsefyll, ar bob cyfrif, unrhyw symudiad i gyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol ar gyfer y prifysgolion gorau, fel y'u gelwir. Mae angen rhagor o fuddsoddi os yw ein prifysgolion i fod yn gystadleuol, ond byddai ffioedd ychwanegol yn anghymhelliaid i'n pobl ifanc. Gan nad yw Cymru mor ffyniannus â rhannau eraill o'r DU, cai ffioedd ychwanegol effaith anghymesur. Mae myfyrwyr slotach, y daw llawer ohonynt o Gymru, wedi'u tangynrychioli eisoes yn y prifysgolion mwyaf eu bri, a bydd ffioedd ychwanegol yn gwaethygwr sefyllfa hon. Byddai hynny'n cael effaith andwyol ar y gwaith o annog ein pobl ifanc i ddilyn gyrfa mewn ymchwil a datblygu.

To coin a phrase, Wales may be small but it can be clever. If we want to brand Wales as a big business as a big country, it is vital to have big ambitions to develop, encourage and exploit our potential for innovation in Wales.

Os goddefir yr ymadrodd, efallai fod Cymru'n fach ond gall fod yn glyfar. Os ydym am gyflwyno Cymru i fusnesau mawr fel gwlaid fawr, mae'n hollbwysig inni gael uchelgeisiau mawr i ddatblygu, hybu a gwneud y defnydd gorau o'n potensial i arloesi yng Nghymru.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Datganaf fuddiant fel cyfarwyddwr Gwernafalau Cyf yng Nghaernarfon—cwmni sydd yn arloesi; yr wyf yn gadeirydd bwrdd ymgyngħorol Ysgol Busnes a Datblygiad Rhanbarthol Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor; llywydd Hufenfa De Arfon a darpar gadeirydd Designate, ymddiriedolaeth hybu gwyddoniaeth. Ymhob un o'r meysydd hyn, mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn arloesi ac yn arbennig yn y modd y gellir troi cyfleoan a

**Dafydd Wigley:** I declare an interest as a director of Gwernafalau Ltd in Caernarfon—an innovative company; I am chair of the advisory board of the School for Business and Regional Development at the University of Wales, Bangor; president of South Caernarfon Creameries and prospective chair of Designate, a science promotion trust. In all these areas, I have an interest in innovation and especially in how to turn opportunities

gyfyd drwy ymchwil wyddonol yn ddatblygiadau masnachol a all greu swyddi newydd a chodi safon byw ymhob rhan o Gymru.

Yr wyf yn croesawu cyhoeddi'r ddogfen ymgynghorol hon heddiw, a bydd angen rhagor o amser arnaf i baratoi ymateb ffurfiol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid ailadrodd y pwynt bod dim ond 10 y cant o'r £260 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd heddiw—£26 miliwn—sydd yn arian newydd. Mae hynny hefyd dros dair mlynedd, tua £8 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae 90 y cant o'r cyfanswm wedi ei gyhoeddi o'r blaen, felly, mater o ailgyflwyno hen raglenni a lansiwyd eisoedd a geir yma. Yr wyf yn croesawu y £26 miliwn newydd, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fydd yn ddigon i wneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol yn y maes allweddol hwn.

Crewyd llu o ddyfeisiau gwyddonol a thechnegol yn ein prifysgolion dros gyfnod o ddegawdau. Tristwch y seyllfa yw bod y rhain yn cael eu datblygu a'u troi'n fusnesau ac yn gyfleon gwaith ymhell i ffwrdd, gan amlaf yn Lloegr. Mae'n warthus ein bod yn dal i oddef y methiant hwn. Nid yw Llywodraethau San Steffan na Chaerdydd wedi llwyddo i ddatrys y broblem hyd yn hyn. Felly, dymunaf yn dda i'r Gweinidog yn ei ymdrechion gan obeithio y daw llwyddiant.

The failure in Wales to turn scientific innovation into marketable products was highlighted in this month's *Gwynedd News* under a banner headline:

'Gwynedd inventors get cold shoulder...but get warm welcome in England'.

The director of design and technology at the University of Wales, Bangor says in this article:

'Time and time again, we have approached local companies with a prototype of a gadget or appliance, which is ripe for mass-producing. But time and time again, we seem to be hitting our heads against a brick wall...As a consequence, students go to England for support from manufacturers who are willing to nurture new inventing talent and test the marketing and job creating value

that arise from scientific research into commercial opportunities that can create new jobs and raise the standard of living throughout Wales.

I welcome the publication of this consultation document today, and I will need more time to make a formal response. However, I must reiterate the point that only 10 per cent of the £260 million that is being announced today—£26 million—is new money. That is also over three years, and will work out at about £8 million a year. Ninety per cent of the total has been previously announced, therefore, this is just a matter of repackaging old programmes that have already been launched. I welcome the new £26 million, but I am not sure whether it is sufficient to make a real difference in this crucial field.

Many scientific and technical inventions have been created in our universities over the years. The tragedy is that these are developed and turned into businesses and work opportunities far away, mostly in England. It is disgraceful that we continue to tolerate this failure. Neither the Government in Westminster nor that in Cardiff have yet succeeded in solving this problem. Therefore, I wish the Minister well in his efforts and hope that the scheme will be a success.

Tynnwyd sylw at y methiant yng Nghymru i droi arloesi gwyddonol yn gynhyrchion gwerthadwy yn rhifyn y mis hwn o *Newyddion Gwynedd* dan y pennawd mawr:

Dim croeso i ddyfeiswyr Gwynedd...ond croeso cynnes iddynt yn Lloegr.

Dywed cyfarwyddwr dylunio a thechnoleg Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor yn yr erthygl hon:

Dro ar ôl tro, yr ydym wedi mynd at gwmniau lleol gyda phrototeip o ddyfais neu declyn, a oedd yn barod i'w fasgynhyrchu. Ond dro ar ôl tro, mae'n ymddangos ein bod yn bwrw ein pennau yn erbyn y wal...O ganlyniad, fe â'r myfyrwyr i Loegr i gael cymorth gan weithgynhyrchwyr sy'n barod i feithrin doniau dyfeisio newydd a phrofi gwerth eu syniadau o ran marchnata a chreu

of their ideas'.

Last Friday, I attended a lecture given by one of the star Bangor alumni, Professor Ron Pethig. The lecture was entitled, 'A Journey from Ogwen Valley to Silicon Valley', which said it all. Professor Pethig is now president of Aura Bio-Systems Incorporated in California, which is turning into reality and jobs the opportunities that arose from his research in Bangor. He had to move to California to get the necessary venture capital to exploit his work. He wanted to do that in Bangor, but it was not possible. To be fair, Professor Pethig has a home at Menai Bridge and he welcomes the Optic Technium at St Asaph. We can only hope that this Technium, and the other Techniums that are referred to in this document—including the proposed software Technium in Parc Menai—ensures full local exploitation of our research in future.

swyddi.

Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, euthum i ddarllith gan un o gynfyfyrwyr enwocaf Bangor, yr Athro Ron Pethig. Teitl y ddarllith oedd, 'Taith o Ddyffryn Ogwen i Silicon Valley', sy'n dweud y cyfan. Mae'r Athro Pethig bellach yn llywydd ar Aura Bio-Systems Incorporated yng Nghalifornia, sy'n gwired du'r cyfleoedd a gododd o'i ymchwil ym Mangor ac yn creu swyddi yn eu sgîl. Bu'n rhaid iddo symud i Galifornia i gael y cyfalaf menter angenrheidiol i ddatblygu ei waith. Yr oedd am wneud hynny ym Mangor, ond nid oedd yn posibl. A bod yn deg, mae gan yr Athro Pethig gartref ym Mhorthaethwy ac mae'n croesawu'r Technium Opteg yn Llanelwy. Nid allwn ond gobeithio y bydd y Technium hwnnw, a'r rhai eraill y cyfeirir atynt yn y ddogfen hon—gan gynnwys y Technium meddalwedd arfaethedig ym Mharc Menai—yn sicrhau y gwneir defnydd llawn yn lleol o'n hymchwil yn y dyfodol.

However, I repeat that far too little money is being invested in research and development work in Wales. Only 2.2 per cent of UK Government funding for research and development, and only 1.7 per cent of the private sector's funding, is spent in Wales. We must increase this. There is also a danger of underfunding in priority 2, measure 3 of Objective 1, the part that deals with innovation. We must use that resource for innovation before it runs dry. It must help develop courses that are relevant to small and medium-sized businesses in Wales, particularly Master of Business Administration courses, which create much needed talent. We must nurture a culture of commercial risk-taking, of a willingness to back ideas with time and money. I will do everything possible to move this agenda forward, and I hope that the resources will be made available to ensure that it succeeds.

Fodd bynnag, dywedaf eto na fuddsoddir digon o arian o gwbl mewn gwaith ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru. Dim ond 2.2 y cant o arian Llywodraeth y DU ar gyfer gwaith ymchwil a datblygu sy'n cael ei wario yng Nghymru, a dim ond 1.7 y cant o arian y sector preifat. Rhaid inni gynyddu hynny. Mae perygl hefyd o danariannu ym mlaenoriaeth 2, mesur 3 o Amcan 1, y rhan sy'n ymwneud ag arloesedd. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r adnodd hwnnw ar gyfer arloesedd cyn iddo ddod i ben. Rhaid iddo helpu i ddatblygu cyrsiau sy'n berthnasol i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru, yn enwedig cyrsiau Meistr mewn Gweinyddiaeth Busnes, sy'n cynhyrchu llawer o ddoniau y mae mawr angen amdanynt. Rhaid inni feithrin diwylliant o fentro masnachol, ac o barodrwydd i roi amser ac arian i gefnogi syniadau. Gwnaf bob dim posibl i symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen, a gobeithiaf y darperir yr adnoddau angenrheidiol i sicrhau ei bod yn llwyddo.

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** Innovation is about ideas. Regrettably, much of what I have heard this afternoon, particularly from the Conservative group, shows that there is a bankruptcy of ideas on this subject. That shows that the

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Mae arloesedd yn ymwneud â syniadau. Gwaetha'r modd, mae llawer o'r hyn a glywsom y prynhawn yma, yn enwedig gan y grŵp Ceidwadol, yn dangos bod diffyg llwyr o ran syniadau ar y

Conservative Party is out of touch, which is why it is out of power.

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Andrew Davies:** No.

Delyth Evans quite rightly pointed out that the Conservatives' view is at least consistent. They believe in laissez faire, in the market economy and in allowing everything to be decided by the market.

4.30 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Andrew Davies:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister only has five minutes.

**Andrew Davies:** It is at least a consistent view, but we have seen the results of that all around us. The reason why there is a huge gap in gross domestic product per capita levels between Wales and the UK is that, in 1981, the Conservative Government and the Conservative Chancellor of the Exchequer, Geoffrey Howe, decimated the Welsh manufacturing sector. Conservative Governments have decimated the steel and coal industries—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Andrew Davies:** This Government believes in creating a new, knowledge-based economy. I welcome Dafydd Wigley's contribution. It was one of the few from the opposition this afternoon that actually recognised that this is a huge agenda. I have acknowledged in my speech this afternoon, and in this action plan, that we have to play catch-up with other parts of the world. We cannot leave matters to the market.

In July, I announced a £100 million investment to roll broadband out across Wales in order to address the issue of market failure. We have seen the results of market domination of the Welsh economy. This innovation action plan addresses how we can

pwnc hwn. Mae hynny'n dangos bod y Blaid Geidwadol wedi colli cysylltiad, a dyna pam nad yw mewn grym.

**David Davies:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Andrew Davies:** Na wnaf.

Nododd Delyth Evans yn gwbl briodol fod barn y Ceidwadwyr yn gyson o leiaf. Credant mewn laissez faire, yn economi'r farchnad ac mewn gadael i bob dim gael ei benderfynu gan y farchnad.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Andrew Davies:** Na wnaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond pum munud sydd gan y Gweinidog.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n farn gyson o leiaf, ond gwelsom ganlyniadau hynny o'n cwmpas ym mhob man. Y rheswm dros y bwlch anferth yn lefelau'r cynnrych mewnwladol crynswth y pen rhwng Cymru a'r DU yw bod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol a'r Canhellor y Trysorlys Ceidwadol, Geoffrey Howe, wedi gwneud niwed difrifol i sector gweithgynhyrchu Cymru yn 1981. Mae Llywodraethau Ceidwadol wedi niweidio'r diwydiannau dur a glo yn ddifrifol —[*Tori ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn credu mewn creu economi newydd sy'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth. Croesawaf gyfraniad Dafydd Wigley. Yr oedd yn un o'r ychydig gan yr wrthblaidd y prynhawn yma a oedd yn cydnabod bod hon yn agenda anferth. Yr wyf wedi cydnabod yn fy arai y prynhawn yma, ac yn y cynllun gweithredu hwn, fod rhaid inni oddiweddyyd rhannau eraill o'r byd. Ni allwn adael y materion hyn i'r farchnad.

Yng Ngorffennaf, cyhoeddais fuddsoddiad o £100 miliwn i ledaenu band eang ledled Cymru er mwyn ymdrin â methiant y farchnad. Gwelsom ganlyniadau tra-arglwyddiaeth y farchnad ar economi Cymru. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu arloesedd hwn yn

improve innovation in the Welsh economy, by building on public-private partnerships.

I have worked in industry and manufacturing. This document lays out how the public and private sectors can work together to make the Welsh economy more innovative, creative and productive. The Conservatives say that this is a top-down approach. However, David Rosser—the director of the Confederation of British Industry Wales—the Engineering and Manufacturing Strategy Group for Wales and the senior vice-president of Airbus have all welcomed this document. They are serious business people who are involved in modern manufacturing.

I agree that this is not only about research and development. It is also about technology, a point that I forcefully made in my introduction. One of the document's action points addresses the fact that innovation is about people. Alun Cairns talked about 3M. Its personnel manager is chairing the workplace partnership working party, which is part of a Department of Trade and Industry initiative. 3M has innovative production processes involving management and the workforce—

**Gareth Jones and Alun Cairns rose—**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not giving way.

**Andrew Davies:** It is not only about management, it is about developing an innovation culture within the whole company.

As I said, I welcome Dafydd Wigley's contribution. Like me, he recognises the challenges ahead of us in terms of—*[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. There is too much noise in the Chamber.

**Andrew Davies:** Dafydd Wigley, like me, recognises the challenges involved in transforming the Welsh economy. We must use the talent of our people, the talent of the public sector, the talent we have in higher

ymdrin â'r modd y gallwn hybu arloesedd yn economi Cymru, drwy adeiladu ar sail partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat.

Yr wyf wedi gweithio mewn diwydiant ac mewn gweithgynhyrchu. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn nodi sut y gall y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat gydweithio i beri i economi Cymru fod yn fwy arloesol, creadigol a chynhyrchiol. Dywed y Ceidwadwyr mai dull gweithredu o'r pen i'r gwaelod yw hwn. Er hynny, mae David Rosser—cyfarwyddwr Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain Cymru—Grŵp Strategaeth Peirianneg a Gweithgynhyrchu Cymru ac uwch is-lywydd Airbus oll wedi croesawu'r ddogfen hon. Maent yn bobl fusnes ddifrif sy'n ymwneud â gweithgynhyrchu modern.

Cytunaf fod a wnelo hyn â mwy nag ymchwil a datblygu. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â thechnoleg, pwnt a wneuthum yn rymus yn fy rhagymadrodd. Mae un o bwyntiau gweithredu'r ddogfen yn ymdrin â'r ffaith bod arloesedd yn ymwneud â phobl. Soniodd Alun Cairns am 3M. Ei reolwr personél sy'n cadeirio gweithgor y bartneriaeth gweithleoedd, sy'n rhan o fenter gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Mae gan 3M brosesau cynhyrchu arloesol sy'n cynnwys y rheolwyr a'r gweithlu—

**Gareth Jones ac Alun Cairns a gododd—**

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n ymwneud â mwy na rheoli, mae'n ymwneud â datblygu diwylliant arloesedd o fewn y cwmni cyfan.

Fel y dywedais, croesawaf gyfraniad Dafydd Wigley. Fel minnau, mae'n cydnabod yr heriau sydd o'n blaen o ran—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae gormod o sŵn yn y Siambr.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae Dafydd Wigley, fel minnau, yn cydnabod yr heriau sy'n gysylltiedig â thrawsffurfio economi Cymru. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio doniau ein pobl, doniau'r sector cyhoeddus, y doniau sydd

education, and, above all, the talent that exists in many of our companies, most of which are small. It is about a team approach and about changing the culture in companies in Wales.

gennym mewn addysg uwch ac, yn fwy na dim, y doniau a geir mewn llawer o'n cwmnïau, y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn rhai bach. Mae'n ymwneud â dull gweithredu tîm a newid y diwylliant mewn cwmnïau yng Nghymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 2: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Morgan, Jonathan	Gregory, Janice
Rogers, Peter	Griffiths, John
Ryder, Janet	Gwyther, Christine
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Halford, Alison
Wigley, Dafydd	Hart, Edwina
Williams, Phil	Hutt, Jane
	Jones, Ann
	Law, Peter
	Lewis, Huw
	Middlehurst, Tom
	Morgan, Rhodri
	Neagle, Lynne
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Gwenda
	Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 9, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 3: For 9, Abstain 11, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaidd:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Geraint  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 4: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1197): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.  
Motion (NDM1197): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Polisiau Diogelwch rhag Tân Fire Safety Policies**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. welcomes the work undertaken to date by the Assembly Government's community fire safety working group in the production of its report into domestic fire in Wales, 'Wired for Safety'.*

*1. yn croesawu'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud hyd yma gan weithgor diogelwch Tân cymunedol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi'i adroddiad ar dân mewn cartrefi yng Nghymru, 'Wired for Safety'.*

*2. supports the recommendations in the document 'Wired for Safety' to tackle the problems of domestic fire in Wales; and*

*2. yn cefnogi'r argymhellion yn y ddogfen 'Wired for Safety' i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau Tân mewn cartrefi yng Nghymru; ac*

*3. looks forward to the establishment in January 2003 of the community fire safety trust for Wales, a joint Assembly Government-fire services funded body, to drive forward a co-ordinated fire safety programme across the three Welsh fire services. (NDM1198)*

*3. yn edrych ymlaen at sefydlu ymddiriedolaeth diogelwch Tân cymunedol Cymru ym mis Ionawr 2003, corff a fydd yn cael ei ariannu ar y cyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r gwasanaethau Tân, er mwyn llywio rhaglen dioglewch rhag Tân gydlynus ar draws tri gwasanaeth Tân Cymru.*

(NDM1198)

Fire has a devastating impact on our communities. The number of people affected each year in Wales is equivalent to the population of a small community. The consequences of fire do not just touch a small area and a limited number of people; the trauma of injury or death has a ripple effect that goes far and wide. It can take years for people to recover from the loss of a home and personal effects.

Our lives are becoming increasingly safer and people quite rightly demand the highest health standards and greater protection from crime. However, when it comes to fire, there is much greater complacency, and many put their trust in luck or place their lives in the hands of a smoke detector that is often many years old and has never been touched. In terms of fire safety, the 'it'll never happen to me' syndrome often applies.

Yet fire poses a tangible risk to everyone. Our homes are packed with plastics and materials that would kill in minutes when lit. Also, arson seems to be more prevalent than ever. That is why tackling the problem of fire and fire-related injuries in Wales is a priority for the Assembly Government.

I am proud of the Assembly's record in this field. Members will be familiar with the 'Wired for Safety' report, which I presented to the Assembly in October 2001. It attempted to put the issues related to fire-related problems in Wales, and the solutions to those problems, into context and define a comprehensive set of recommendations to take fire prevention forward. The report was endorsed by the Assembly and has been warmly welcomed across the UK. We are at the vanguard on this issue within the UK.

It is over a year since 'Wired for Safety' was published, and Members will be wondering what, if any, progress has been made. We had to address some issues, and are still addressing others, particularly in relation to domestic sprinklers. However, I reiterate my commitment and that of the Assembly

Caiff tân effaith ddinistriol ar ein cymunedau. Mae'r nifer yr effeithir arnynt bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru'n gymaint â phoblogaeth cymuned fach. Nid yw canlyniadau Tân yn cyffwrdd ag ardal fach a nifer gyfyngedig o bobl yn unig; caiff trawma oherwydd anaf neu farwolaeth sgîl-effaith sy'n ymledu'n bell. Gall gymryd blynnyddoedd i bobl wella ar ôl colli cartref ac eiddo personol.

Mae ein bywydau'n mynd yn fwyfwy diogel ac mae pobl, yn gwbl briodol, yn mynnu'r safonau iechyd uchaf a mwy o amddiffyniad rhag troseddu. Fodd bynnag, wrth ystyried Tân, mae llawer mwy o ddifaterwch, ac mae llawer yn ymddiried mewn lwc neu'n rhoi eu bywydau dan ofal synhwyrnydd mwg sy'n aml yn flynyddoedd oed a neb erioed wedi cyffwrdd ynddo. O ran diogelwch rhag Tân, mae'r syndrom 'ni wnaiff byth ddigwydd i mi' ar waith yn aml.

Eto mae Tân yn risg gwirioneddol i bawb. Mae ein cartrefi'n llawn plastigau a deunyddiau a fyddai'n lladd o fewn munudau pe caent eu cynnau. Hefyd, mae'n ymddangos bod llosgi bwriadol yn fwy cyffredin nag erioed. Dyna pam y mae mynd i'r afael â phroblem Tân ac anafiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â thân yng Nghymru yn flaenoriaeth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn falch o record y Cynulliad yn y maes hwn. Bydd yr Aelodau'n gyfarwydd â'r adroddiad 'Wired for Safety', a gyflwynais i'r Cynulliad yn Hydref 2001. Ceisiai roi'r materion sy'n ymwneud â phroblemau sy'n gysylltiedig â thân yng Nghymru, a'r atebion i'r problemau hynny, yn eu cyd-destun a diffinio set gynhwysfawr o argymhellion i hyrwyddo atal Tân. Cymeradwywyd yr adroddiad gan y Cynulliad a rhoddwyd croeso cynnes iddo ledled y DU. Yr ydym ar flaen y gad ar y mater hwn yn y DU.

Mae dros flwyddyn ers cyhoeddi 'Wired for Safety', a bydd yr Aelodau'n meddwl tybed pa gynnydd a wnaed, os y gwnaed unrhyw gynnydd. Bu'n rhaid inni ymdrin â rhai materion, ac yr ydym yn dal i ymdrin ag eraill, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â thaenellwyr dŵr domestig. Fodd bynnag,

Government to ‘Wired for Safety’.

We are moving forward with many of the proposals contained in the report. While we address the technical issues regarding sprinkler systems, we are looking to establish a demonstration project—to inform best practice in the field—in Neath Port Talbot where a small cluster of properties will be fitted with sprinklers. We have awarded £1.6 million to social housing providers for a programme of hard-wired smoke detector installations—there have been installations in almost 31,000 homes so far this year—with a view to all social housing having a hard-wired detector by 2005.

We have sought bids for innovative fire prevention schemes from social housing providers and have awarded over £200,000 to 10 schemes for a variety of purposes: training for vulnerable groups; the provision of fire safety equipment in the homes of the vulnerable; and specialist fire door guards for use in homes for the elderly. We are exploring how we can influence the provision of fire safety measures and sprinklers in houses in multiple occupation, working, of course, within our statutory limitations. We have few powers to prescribe in this field. However, we are examining what can be done within our existing powers, and I am confident that we will find ways to address this important issue.

4.40 p.m.

We are looking to embark on a major national awareness-raising campaign, working with the fire services, which will have at its heart a regional focus. The campaign will be launched over Christmas and the new year. Our statisticians are in discussion with colleagues in the fire services and Welsh Local Government Association regarding the need for more comprehensive data collection to inform future community fire safety policies. Also, we have amended our home energy efficiency scheme so that all priority applicants, including the elderly,

ailadroddaf fy ymrwymiad i ac ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ‘Wired for Safety’.

Yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â llawer o'r cynigion a geir yn yr adroddiad. Tra ymdriniwn â'r materion technegol ynghylch systemau taenellwyr dŵr, yr ydym yn ystyried sefydlu prosiect arddangos—i'n goleuo ar yr arfer gorau yn y maes hwn—yna Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot lle y gosodir taenellwyr dŵr mewn clwstwr bach o dai. Yr ydym wedi rhoi £1.6 miliwn i ddarparwyr tai cymdeithasol ar gyfer rhaglen o osod synwyryddion mwg gwifredig—fe'u gosodwyd mewn ymron i 31,000 o gartrefi hyd yn hyn eleni—gyda golwg ar osod synhwyrdd gwifredig yn yr holl dai cymdeithasol erbyn 2005.

Yr ydym wedi gofyn am geisiadau am gynlluniau atal Tân arloesol gan ddarparwyr tai cymdeithasol ac wedi rhoi dros £200,000 i 10 cynllun at amryw o ddibenion: hyfforddi grwpiau sy'n agored i niwed; darparu offer diogelwch rhag Tân yng nghartrefi rhai sy'n agored i niwed; a gardiau drws Tân arbenigol i'w defnyddio mewn cartrefi i'r henoed. Yr ydym yn ymchwilio i ganfod sut y gallwn ddylanwadu ar y ddapariaeth o fesurau diogelwch rhag Tân a thaenellwyr dŵr mewn tai amlfeddiant, gan weithio, wrth gwrs, o fewn y cyfyngiadau statudol sydd arnom. Ychydig o bwerau sydd gennym yn y maes hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ymchwilio i'r hyn y gellir ei wneud o fewn ein pwerau presennol, ac yr wyf yn ffyddio y deuwn o hyd i ddulliau o ymdrin â'r mater pwysig hwn.

Yr ydym yn bwriadu cychwyn ymgyrch hybu ymwybyddiaeth genedlaethol fawr, gan weithio gyda'r gwasanaethau Tân, a ffocws rhanbarthol yn elfen hanfodol iddi. Caiff yr ymgyrch ei lansio dros y Nadolig a'r flwyddyn newydd. Mae ein hystadegwyr mewn trafodaeth â'u cydweithwyr yn y gwasanaethau Tân a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynghylch yr angen am gasglu data mwy cynhwysfawr i oleuo polisiau diogelwch rhag Tân cymunedol yn y dyfodol. Hefyd, yr ydym wedi newid ein cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref fel bod

chronically sick and disabled, and low-income families, can now obtain, free of charge, smoke detectors with a long-life 10-year battery.

In addition to the important work contained in ‘Wired for Safety’, the community fire safety working group is considering arson and its consequences. It is important that we develop a comprehensive arson strategy for Wales, in partnership with other organisations. I am confident that, once the final report is presented, we will have a clear blueprint for tackling the problems in Wales. I hope that we will debate this report in the Assembly.

Emphasising the partnership approach and the close bonds established between the fire service in Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government, I am pleased that the Assembly Government is a committed partner, along with the three fire services, in the establishment of the Wales community fire safety trust. To this end, the Assembly Government is contributing 50 per cent of the trust’s set-up and running costs for the next three years. The trust’s remit is to improve quality of life in Wales by reducing the number of preventable fire deaths and injuries, by pursuing three distinct areas of activity: promotional campaigning and public education; research to better understand the causes of fire death and injury; and grants to support local fire safety initiatives. The trust will be ideally placed to take forward several of the recommendations contained in ‘Wired for Safety’ and in the arson report, ‘Up in Flames’.

As an all-Wales body, the trust embraces the Welsh fire services, facilitating strategic and functional collaboration and providing economies of scale that could not otherwise be obtained. The trust will champion aspects of community fire safety, recognising the fire services’ regional differences and own agendas, though allowing for the many similarities that exist across the country. It will build on the foundations we laid for community fire safety policy and provide a focus for future activity in this area.

yr holl ymgeiswyr y rhoddir blaenoriaeth iddynt, gan gynnwys yr henoed, cleifion cronig a phobl anabl, a theuluoedd ar incwm isel, yn gallu cael synwyryddion mwg â batri 10 mlynedd oes hir, yn rhad ac am ddim.

Yn ogystal â'r gwaith pwysig a geir yn 'Wired for Safety', mae'r gweithgor diogelwch tân cymunedol yn ystyried llosgi bwriadol a'i ganlyniadau. Mae'n bwysig inni ddatblygu strategaeth llosgi bwriadol gynhwysfawr i Gymru, ar y cyd â chyrrff eraill. Yr wyf yn ffyddio, ar ôl cyflwyno'r adroddiad terfynol, y bydd gennym lasbrint clir ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn trafod yr adroddiad hwn yn y Cynulliad.

Gan bwysleisio'r dull partneriaeth a'r cysylltiadau clôs a grewyd rhwng y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bartner ymroddedig, gyda'r tri gwasanaeth tân, yn y gwaith o sefydlu ymddiriedolaeth diogelwch tân cymunedol Cymru. I'r diben hwnnw, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyfrannu 50 y cant o gostau sefydlu a rhedeg yr ymddiriedolaeth dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Cylch gorchwyl yr ymddiriedolaeth yw gwella ansawdd bywyd yng Nghymru drwy ostwng nifer y marwolaethau a'r anafiadau oherwydd tân y gellir eu hatal, drwy ymhel â thrï maes gweithgaredd penodol: ymgyrchu hyrwyddol ac addysg gyhoeddus; ymchwil i ddeall achosion marwolaethau ac anafiadau oherwydd tân yn well; a grantiau i hybu mentrau diogelwch rhag tân lleol. Bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth mewn sefyllfa ddelfrydol i fwrw ymlaen â nifer o'r argymhellion a geir yn 'Wired for Safety' ac yn yr adroddiad ar losgi bwriadol, 'Up in Flames'.

Gan ei fod yn gorff i Gymru gyfan, mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn cwmpasu'r gwasanaethau tân yng Nghymru, gan hwyluso cydweithio strategol a gweithredol a chynnig darbodion maint na ellid eu cael fel arall. Bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth yn cefnogi agweddu ar ddiogelwch rhag tân cymunedol, gan gydnabod gwahaniaethau rhanbarthol y gwasanaethau tân a'u hagendâu, ond yn darparu ar gyfer sawl elfen debyg a geir ledled y wlad. Bydd yn adeiladu ar y sylfeini y gwnaethom eu gosod ar gyfer polisi

diogelwch rhag tân cymunedol a bydd yn ffocws i weithgarwch yn y maes hwn yn y dyfodol.

Tackling and preventing the problems that cause fires in the first instance, before they present a danger to life, has to be the way forward. Our policies in relation to domestic fires and arson, and a close partnership between the Assembly Government, fire services and all the organisations involved at all levels, provide the impetus to take forward this important preventative work. Taken together, our work forms a comprehensive fire safety strategy for Wales and places us at the forefront of this work in the UK. It complements work taking place on the UK stage and enables us to share best practice with other areas of the UK and influence policies on matters that are not devolved but which nevertheless impact on Welsh life. I commend our work in this important field of public safety to the Assembly, and look forward to a constructive debate on work undertaken in Wales, which is a first for the UK.

**Janet Ryder:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. In line 1, add '*for Wales*' after '*National Assembly*'.

It is not often that I can say that I fully support everything that the Minister said and, indeed, welcome it. The report's proposals and the work undertaken by the Local Government and Housing Committee and by the Assembly in progressing fire safety in Wales is to be commended. Anyone who has watched television recently will be aware of the latest fire safety campaign. The sight of two frightened children huddled together shouting for a parent, while flames lap against the door and smoke fills the room, can leave very few people unaffected, and quite rightly so. The aim of the advertisement is to shock and, by doing so, spur people into action to prevent such scenes from happening. Unfortunately, scenes like that have been a reality on too many occasions. We have heard too many times about homes and lives destroyed by fire, often where a fire detector has been fitted. Those detectors are of little use if the battery has been removed or if they are not functioning properly.

Y ffordd ymlaen yw ymladd ac atal y problemau sy'n achosi tanau yn y lle cyntaf, cyn iddynt ddod yn berygl i fywyd. Ein polisiau mewn cysylltiad â thanau domestig a llosgi bwriadol, a'r bartneriaeth glös rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y gwasanaethau Tân a'r holl gyrff sy'n gysylltiedig ar bob lefel, yw'r symbyliad i fwrw ymlaen a'r gwaith ataliol pwysig hwn. Gyda'i gilydd, mae ein gwaith yn ffurfio strategaeth diogelwch rhag Tân gynhwysfawr i Gymru ac mae'n ein rhoi yn y rheng flaen yn y gwaith hwn yn y DU. Mae'n ategu'r gwaith sy'n digwydd yn y DU ac mae'n ein galluogi i rannu'r arfer gorau â rhannau eraill o'r DU ac i ddyylanwadu ar bolisiau ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli ond sy'n effeithio er hynny ar fywyd yng Nghymru. Cymeradwyaf ein gwaith yn y maes pwysig hwn o ddiogelwch cyhoeddus i'r Cynulliad, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ddadl adeiladol ar y gwaith a wnaed yng Nghymru, sy'n digwydd am y tro cyntaf yn y DU.

**Janet Ryder:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Yn llinell 1, rhoi 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru' yn lle 'y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol'.

Nid yn aml y gallaf ddweud fy mod yn llawn gefnogi pob dim a ddywedodd y Gweinidog ac, yn wir, yn ei groesawu. Dylid canmol cynigion yr adroddiad a'r gwaith a wnaed gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai a chan y Cynulliad wrth hyrwyddo diogelwch rhag Tân yng Nghymru. Bydd unrhyw un a fu'n gwylia'r teledu'n ddiweddar yn ymwybodol o'r ymgyrch diogelwch rhag Tân ddiweddaraf. Ychydig iawn o bobl na fyddent yn teimlo, a hynny'n gwbl briodol, wrth weld dau blentyn ofnus yn gwasgu at ei gilydd gan weiddi am riant, tra bo fflamau'n llyfu'r drws a mwg yn llenwi'r ystafell. Nod yr hysbyseb yw rhoi ysgytwad a, thrwy hynny, sbarduno pobl i gymryd camau i atal digwyddiadau o'r fath. Gwaetha'r modd, gwireddwyd digwyddiadau o'r fath yn rhy aml. Clywsom ormod o weithiau am ddinistrio cartrefi a bywydau gan dân, a hynny'n aml pan fo synhwyrydd Tân wedi'i osod. Nid yw'r synwyryddion hynny o fawr ddefnydd os tynnwyd y batri neu os nad

Therefore, the work being done to provide hard-wired fire safety—

ydynt yn gweithio'n iawn. Felly, mae'r gwaith a wneir i ddarparu diogelwch rhag tân gwifredig—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must relate your contribution to your amendment. You have ranged quite wide, but I remind you that you are proposing an amendment.

**Janet Ryder:** The amendment purely states that we are acting in the name of the National Assembly for Wales—I would hope that that is so.

In September—and I hope that the National Assembly for Wales takes note, as it takes note of some things that happen in the North—the North Wales Fire Authority, of which I am proud to be a former member, decided that it was time for it to act also. There have been nine recorded deaths due to fire in the region since the beginning of 2000. Six of those were women who lived alone, all of whom were over 60 years old. A hard-wired smoke detector may have given them time to escape or have alerted people to come to their aid, thereby saving their lives.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi gysylltu'ch cyfraniad â'ch gwelliant. Yr ydych wedi crwydro gryn dipyn, ond yr wyf yn eich atgoffa eich bod yn cynnig gwelliant.

**Janet Ryder:** Y cwbl a ddywed y gwelliant yw ein bod yn gweithredu yn enw Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru—yr wyf yn gobeithio mai felly y mae.

Ym mis Medi—a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru nodi hyn, gan ei fod yn nodi rhai pethau sy'n digwydd yn y Gogledd—penderfynodd Awdurdod Tân Gogledd Cymru, yr wyf yn falch o fod yn gyn-aelod ohono, ei bod hefyd yn bryd iddo yntau weithredu. Cofnodwyd naw o farwolaethau oherwydd Tân yn y rhanbarth ers dechrau 2000. Yr oedd chwech o'r rheiny'n fenywod a oedd yn byw ar eu pen eu hunain, ac yr oeddent oll dros 60 mlwydd oed. Efallai y byddai synhwyrydd mwg gwifredig wedi rhoi amser iddynt ddianc neu wedi tynnu sylw pobl i ddod i'w cynorthwyo, ac achub eu bywydau drwy hynny.

The Assembly can influence arrangements as regards social housing, council housing and homes provided by housing association. Therefore, the money being made available to progress the fitting of hard-wired smoke detectors in these properties is welcome. However, private dwellings pose a difficulty. As the figures for north Wales prove, the majority of vulnerable people are elderly people, who may have limited access to resources. I hope that the Minister will consider developing the home energy efficiency scheme to encompass the installation of fire detectors.

Other people at risk are those who live in houses in multiple occupation. I hope that, as the National Assembly for Wales, we can consider a licensing scheme for the whole of Wales, to make the installation of smoke detectors compulsory in houses in multiple occupation. As the Minister said, there is increasing proof that the use of domestic sprinkler systems can be more effective than

Gall y Cynulliad ddylanwadu ar drefniadau o ran tai cymdeithasol, tai cyngor a chartrefi a ddarperir gan gymdeithas dai. Felly, mae'r arian a ddarperir i hyrwyddo gosod synwyryddion mwg gwifredig yn y tai hyn i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, mae anheddau preifat yn peri problem. Fel y mae ffigurau y Gogledd yn profi, pobl oedrannus yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r bobl sy'n agored i niwed, a gallai eu hadnoddau fod yn brin. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried datblygu'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref i gynnwys gosod synwyryddion Tân.

Mae'r sawl sy'n byw mewn tai amlfeddiant hefyd mewn perygl. Gobeithiaf y byddwn ni, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn gallu ystyried cynllun trwyddedu i Gymru gyfan, I'w gwneud yn orfodol gosod synwyryddion mwg mewn tai amlfeddiant. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, ceir dystiolaeth gynyddol bod defnyddio systemau taenellwyr dŵr domestig yn gallu bod yn fwy effeithiol na dyfeisiadau

other fire safety devices. I hope that we do not weigh the financial consequences of fitting these systems against the cost of saving lives.

I am pleased to support the motion. This will put Wales at the forefront of fire safety practice and is to be welcomed.

**Brian Gibbons:** The highest levels of health inequality in Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom can be found among people who are involved in accidents or sustain injuries. If the Assembly is committed to tackling health inequality, this is an area in which we must be active in order to make a difference. Hundreds of people in Wales are injured by fires, and between 10 and 20 fire-related deaths are recorded every year. As the Minister implied, fires can cause a catalogue of human suffering. Even more unacceptable than the misery and injury is the fact that up to 80 per cent of injuries could be prevented if appropriate fire alarms were installed.

Over the last 15 years, the percentage of homes fitted with fire alarms has increased from under 10 per cent in 1987 to over 80 per cent at present. Issuing fire alarms per se will not be enough. ‘Wired for Safety’ refers to the Home Office finding that up to 10 per cent of alarms do not work. This week’s edition of the *British Medical Journal* reports that, in communities that are at a high risk of fire, up to 50 per cent of fire alarms do not work. Therefore, many homes provided with fire alarms in these communities are no safer than those without. Alarms do not work because the batteries may be missing or may have run out. Alarms may have been disconnected and, in many instances, they are missing. This is why it is important that we take forward the report’s recommendation to use hard-wired alarms, rather than the conventional alarms, in social housing across Wales. Until all fire alarms are hard-wired, we will not be able to deal effectively with this unnecessary legacy of misery and injury.

diogelwch rhag tân eraill. Gobeithiaf nad ydym yn cloriantu canlyniadau ariannol gosod y systemau hynny yn erbyn cost achub bywydau.

Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r cynnig. Bydd yn rhoi Cymru ar y blaen mewn arfer diogelwch rhag tân ac mae i'w groesawu.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ceir y lefelau uchaf o anghydraddoldeb iechyd yng Nghymru ac yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig ymlysg pobl sy'n profi damweiniau neu'n cael anafiadau. Os yw'r Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb iechyd, dyma faes y bydd yn rhaid inni fod yn weithgar ynddo er mwyn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Caiff cannoedd o bobl yng Nghymru eu hanafu gan dân, a chofnodir rhwng 10 a 20 o farwolaethau sy'n gysylltiedig â thân bob blwyddyn. Fel yr awgrymodd y Gweinidog, gall tanau beri llawer math o ddioddefaint i bobl. Yr hyn sy'n fwy annerbyniol na'r gofid a'r anafiadau hyd yn oed yw'r ffaith y gellid atal hyd at 80 y cant o'r anafiadau os câi larymau tân addas eu gosod.

Dros y 15 mlynedd diwethaf, bu cynydd yng nghanran y cartrefi y gosodwyd larymau tân ynddynt o lai na 10 y cant yn 1987 i dros 80 y cant ar hyn o bryd. Ni fydd rhoi larymau tân yn ddigon ynddo'i hun. Mae ‘Wired for Safety’ yn cyfeirio at ganfyddiad y Swyddfa Gartref nad yw hyd at 10 y cant o'r larymau'n gweithio. Yn rhifyn yr wythnos hon o'r *British Medical Journal*, ceir adroddiad sy'n nodi nad yw hyd at 50 y cant o'r larymau tân yn gweithio mewn cymunedau lle y mae risg mawr o dân. Felly, mae llawer o'r cartrefi y darparwyd larymau tân ynddynt yn y cymunedau hyn heb fod yn ddiogelach na'r rhai sydd hebddynt. Ceir rhai larymau nad ydynt yn gweithio am fod y batris ar goll neu wedi dod i ddiwedd eu hoes. Ceir rhai larymau sydd wedi'u datgysylltu ac mae llawer ohonynt ar goll. Dyma pam ei bod yn bwysig inni fwrw ymlaen ag argymhelliaid yr adroddiad y dylid defnyddio larymau gwifredig, yn hytrach na larymau confensiynol, mewn tai cymdeithasol ledled Cymru. Hyd nes y bydd yr holl larymau'n wifredig, ni fyddwn yn gallu delio'n effeithiol â'r dioddefaint a'r anafiadau diangen hyn.

If we accept that up to 80 per cent of injuries can be prevented by the use of proper alarms, the additional benefit offered by sprinklers is obvious. Consequently, many fire-related injuries could be prevented. As the Minister said in her contribution, my own local authority, Neath Port Talbot, is part of the pilot scheme to install sprinklers. That is appropriate, as Neath Port Talbot is one of the top six local authorities in Wales in terms of installing hard-wired devices in its properties—over 75 per cent of its properties have been given hard-wired devices. However, the housing association sector's performance with regard to installing hard-wired devices varies and ranges from an installation rate of 30 per cent to 100 per cent in the major housing associations in my constituency. This method is the way to proceed, as gross health inequality is too evident in fire injuries. Hopefully, if these policies are brought forward and the report's recommendations are implemented, those inequalities should become a thing of the past.

4.50 p.m.

**William Graham:** It is perhaps appropriate that we discuss fires on 5 November. We are elected to scrutinise and ensure that the present administration is held to account for its policy proposals. It calls for us to be pragmatic whenever a proposal addresses issues that clearly increase the safety and protects the property of those who live and work in Wales. We are expected to support such proposals.

Members may recall studying chemistry in the school laboratory. We were taught that a fire requires three elements: heat, combustible material and a supply of oxygen. Once a fire has started, it destroys property and injures or kills people, regardless of age, sex, religious convictions or political persuasion. The report recognises that fire strikes indiscriminately. Certain vulnerable groups of people may not, in the event of a fire, be able to escape or realise the danger, such as the young, the old, the physically and mentally disadvantaged and those under the influence of alcohol and drugs. It also identifies a significant section of society that does not respond to fire safety campaigns.

Os derbyniwn fod modd atal hyd at 80 y cant o'r anafiaidau drwy ddefnyddio larymau iawn, mae'r budd ychwanegol a geir o daenellwyr dŵr yn amlwg. O ganlyniad i hynny, gellid atal llawer o'r anafiaidau sy'n gysylltiedig â thân. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei chyfraniad, mae fy awdurdod lleol i, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, yn rhan o gynllun peilot i osod taenellwyr dŵr. Mae hynny'n briodol, gan fod Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn un o'r chwe awdurdod lleol gorau yng Nghymru o ran gosod dyfeisiadau gwifredig yn ei dai—gosodwyd dyfeisiadau gwifredig mewn dros 75 y cant o'i dai. Er hynny, mae perfformiad y sector cymdeithasau tai o ran gosod dyfeisiadau gwifredig yn anghyson ac mae'n amrywio o 30 y cant i 100 y cant yn y prif gymdeithasau tai yn fy etholaeth i. Dyma'r ffordd ymlaen, gan fod yr anghydraddoldeb iechyd enbyd yn amlwg iawn mewn anafiaidau oherwydd tân. Gobeithio, os cyflwynir y polisiau hyn ac os gweithredir argymhellion yr adroddiad, y bydd yr anghydraddoldebau hynny'n perthyn i'r gorffennol.

**William Graham:** Efallai ei bod yn briodol ein bod yn trafod tanau ar 5 Tachwedd. Fe'n hetholwyd i archwilio a sicrhau bod y weinyddiaeth bresennol yn cael ei galw i gyfrif am ei chynigion polisi. Mae'n ofynnol inni fod yn bragmatig pryd bynnag y mae cynnig yn ymdrin â materion sy'n amlwg yn cynyddu diogelwch ac yn gwarchod eiddo y rhai sy'n byw ac yn gweithio yng Nghymru. Disgwylir inni gefnogi cynigion o'r fath.

Efallai y bydd Aelodau'n cofio astudio cemeg yn labordy'r ysgol. Fe'n dysgywyd bod angen tair elfen ar dâm: gwres, tanwydd a chyflenwad o ocsigen. Wedi i dâm gychwyn, mae'n dinistrio eiddo ac yn anafu neu'n lladd pobl, beth bynnag fo'u hoed, eu rhyw, eu credoau crefyddol neu eu barn wleidyddol. Mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod bod tân yn taro'n ddiwahân. Mae rhai grwpiau o bobl sy'n agored i niwed na fyddant o bosibl, os digwydd tân, yn gallu dianc neu sylweddoli'r perygl, fel yr ifanc, yr hen, y sawl dan anfantais gorfforol a meddyliol a'r sawl sydd dan ddylanwad alcohol neu gyffuriau. Mae hefyd yn nodi rhan sylweddol o gymdeithas nad yw'n ymateb i ymgyrchoedd diogelwch

This group, sometimes referred to as the ‘hard to influence’, is unlikely to respond to further attempts at education. Nevertheless, we must raise awareness of the dangers of storing combustible materials in close proximity to the other two elements needed to spark a fire. The recommended systems must be installed because, each year in Wales, there is an average of 3,300 domestic fires, causing 18 deaths, 800 non-fatal casualties and £2.6 million worth of damage. The report recognises two groups as vulnerable and hard to influence. Those groups comprise perhaps 20 per cent of our population. Therefore, these systems must be installed to give those people the maximum time to escape the danger.

Those who live in houses in multiple occupation also face a significantly higher risk of death or injury from fire. These houses comprise 10 per cent of rented accommodation, but they account for 32 per cent of domestic fires, 25 per cent of fatalities and 34 per cent of non-fatal casualties. Residents of houses in multiple occupation of over three storeys are at greater risk. They account for only 16 per cent of those who live in such accommodation, but 50 per cent of all related fire deaths.

Smoke detectors save lives. This fact has been indisputably demonstrated. My local fire service explained that there has only been one fatality in a home where a smoke detector was properly fitted and maintained. Tragically, this incident befell someone who, alerted by the alarm and having made his escape, returned to the house to recover extra clothing.

The report’s recommendations go beyond the installation of battery-powered smoke alarms, and rightly cover the installation of hard-wired smoke detectors and domestic sprinkler systems together with programmes to increase public awareness of the dangers of fire and an appreciation of the systems that can protect people. The introduction of these recommendations has financial implications. However, we currently pay those costs in tackling fires and in treating those who are

rhag tân. Mae’r grŵp hwn, a elwir weithiau’n ‘rhai anodd dylanwadu arnynt’, yn annhebygol o ymateb i ymdrechion pellach i’w addysgu. Er hynny, rhaid inni hybu ymwybyddiaeth o’r perygl o storio deunyddiau llosgadwy yn agos iawn i’r ddwy elfen arall sydd eu hangen i gynnau tân. Rhaid gosod y systemau a argymhellir oherwydd, bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru, ceir 3,300 o danau domestig ar gyfartaledd, sy’n achosi 18 o farwolaethau, 800 o ddamweiniau nad ydynt yn angheuol a gwerth £2.6 miliwn o ddifrod. Mae’r adroddiad yn cydnabod dau grŵp yn rhai sy’n agored i niwed ac yn anodd eu dylanwadu. Mae’r grwpiau hynny’n gymaint â 20 y cant o’n poblogaeth o bosibl. Felly, rhaid gosod y systemau hyn i roi’r amser mwyaf posibl iddynt ddianc rhag y perygl.

Mae’r rhai sy’n byw mewn tai amlfeddiant hefyd yn wynebu risg mwy o lawer o farwolaeth neu anaf oherwydd tân. Y tai hynny yw 10 y cant o’r lletyau rhent, ond ynddynt hwy y ceir 32 y cant o danau domestig, 25 y cant o’r marwolaethau a 34 y cant o’r damweiniau nad ydynt yn angheuol. Mae preswylwyr tai amlfeddiant o fwy na thri llawr mewn mwy o berygl. Nid ydynt ond 16 y cant o’r rhai sy’n byw mewn lletyau o’r fath, ond yn eu mysg hwy y ceir 50 y cant o’r holl farwolaethau sy’n gysylltiedig â thân.

Mae synwyryddion mwg yn achub bywydau. Mae’r ffaith honno wedi’i phrofi’n ddifymwad. Eglurodd aelod o fy ngwasanaeth tân lleol na fu ond un farwolaeth mewn cartref lle yr oedd synwyrydd mwg wedi’i osod a’i gynnal a’i gadw. Trist yw bod y digwyddiad hwnnw wedi dod i ran rhywun a gafodd ei rybuddio gan y larwm ac, ar ôl dianc, a ddychwelodd i’r tŷ i gael ychwaneg o ddillad.

Mae argymhellion yr adroddiad yn mynd ymhellach na gosod larymau mwg sy’n gweithio ar fatri, ac yn ymdrin yn briodol â gosod synwyryddion mwg gwifredig a systemau taenellwyr dŵr domestig ynghyd â rhagleni i hybu ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o beryglon tân a dealltwriaeth o’r systemau sy’n gallu gwarchod pobl. Mae goblygiadau ariannol i gyflwyno’r argymhellion hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn talu’r costau hynny ar hyn o bryd wrth ymladd tanau a thrin y

injured. We should meet the costs of the recommendations. As this report concludes, we would then be at the forefront of community fire safety.

**Ann Jones:** It is timely that we discuss fire and fire safety measures on bonfire night. We must remind the public of the dangers of fireworks and bonfires in their own backyards. I urge everybody to attend a community bonfire instead. As Janet mentioned, this year alone, the north Wales fire service area has seen nine deaths. That is nine too many. Every year in the UK, about 500 people die as a result of house fires. Most fires occur in the home, are avoidable, and affect the most vulnerable members of society, as other Members have mentioned.

The UK Government has set a target to reduce house fire deaths by 20 per cent over five years, which is to be applauded. I know that my former colleagues in the fire service fully support that aim. The installation of properly maintained smoke alarms in every household must be central to that goal, as you are twice as likely to die in a fire at home if you do not have a smoke alarm. Brian Gibbons mentioned that smoke alarm ownership has risen. However, we must aim for 100 per cent ownership of smoke alarms. There should be no excuse for not having one.

The problem of people removing batteries from smoke alarms has also been mentioned. Having a non-functional smoke alarm is worse than not having one at all, because of the false sense of security that it gives. Therefore I welcome the Minister's commitment that all new or renovated social housing in Wales must include a hard-wired, tamper-proof smoke alarm as standard from 2005.

The next requirement must be that all new and renovated domestic properties be fitted with a fire sprinkler system. Evidence shows that there is no loss of life in a fire in the UK when a full sprinkler system is present. That

rhai a gaiff eu hanafu. Dylem dalu costau'r argymhellion. Fel y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn casglu, byddem wedyn ar y blaen mewn diogelwch rhag tân mewn cymunedau.

**Ann Jones:** Mae'n amserol ein bod yn trafod tân a mesurau diogelwch rhag tân ar noson tân gwylt. Rhaid inni atgoffa'r cyhoedd am beryglon tân gwylt a choelcerthi yn eu iardiau cefn. Anogaf bawb i fynd i weld coelcerth yn y gymuned yn lle hynny. Fel y dywedodd Janet, yn y flwyddyn hon yn unig, mae ardal gwasanaeth tân y Gogledd wedi gweld naw marwolaeth. Mae hynny'n naw yn ormod. Bob blwyddyn yn y DU, mae tua 500 o bobl yn marw o ganlyniad i danau mewn tai. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o danau'n digwydd yn y cartref, gellir eu hosgoi, ac maent yn effeithio ar yr aelodau hynny o gymdeithas sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed, fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill.

Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi penu targed o ostwng nifer y marwolaethau oherwydd tanau mewn tai o 20 y cant dros y pum mlynedd nesaf, ac mae hynny i'w ganmol. Gwn i fy nghyn-gydweithwyr yn y gwasanaeth tân lwyf gefnogi'r nod honno. Mae gosod larymau mwg a gaiff eu cynnal a'u cadw'n briodol ym mhob cartref yn hollbwysig i'r nod honno, gan eich bod yn ddwywaith yn fwy tebygol o farw mewn tân mewn ty os nad oes gennych larwm mwg. Nododd Brian Gibbons fod mwy o bobl yn berchen ar larwm mwg. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni anelu at gael pawb yn berchen ar larymau mwg. Ni ddylid bod ag unrhyw esgus dros beidio â chael un.

Soniwyd hefyd am y broblem o dynnu batris o larymau mwg. Mae bod â larwm mwg nad yw'n gweithio yn waeth na bod heb un o gwbl, oherwydd ffug-deimlad o ddiogelwch a geir o hynny. Gan hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu ymrwymiad y Gweinidog y bydd yn rhaid i'r holl dai cymdeithasol newydd neu adnewyddedig yng Nghymru gynnwys larwm mwg gwifredig diogel fel gofyniad sylfaenol o 2005 ymlaen.

Y gofyniad y bydd yn rhaid ei gael nesaf yw gosod system taenellwyr rhag tân ym mhob annedd newydd neu adnewyddedig. Dengys y dystiolaeth na chollir bywydau mewn tân yn y DU pan fo system taenellwyr dŵr lawn yn

surely demonstrates the benefits of sprinkler systems. I believe that installing domestic sprinklers has the same life-saving potential as the introduction of seatbelts about 30 years ago. The cost of installing sprinklers in new-build homes is minimal, and it is becoming cheaper to install sprinklers in existing properties. In the long term, installing sprinklers may well save money. The cost of not doing so is clear, given the number of homes that are gutted as a result of fires. Sprinklers can control fires and contain them within one room until the fire brigade arrives. They could, therefore, save the vast amount of money that is spent on repairing and renovating the housing stock following fires.

The same is true of schools and other public buildings that are vulnerable to arson attacks. Each year, about 2,000 schools across Britain are damaged by fires, three-quarters of which are started deliberately. The cost of school fires this year alone is expected to reach about £87 million. That money could be spent elsewhere in the public sector. However, there is not only a financial cost, as parents, pupils and staff at a special school in my constituency, Ysgol Tir Morfa, can testify. The school was unable to reopen at the start of this term because of an arson attack in August. This caused severe disruption for the pupils and parents, as well as the wider community that uses the facilities outside school hours. I am committed to a ‘sprinklers save schools’ campaign. I urge the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to insist that fire sprinklers be fitted in all new and refurbished schools in Wales. It makes economic sense and will also protect our children and communities from serious damage and, possibly, loss of life.

I am pleased that the Assembly is taking a lead on fire safety and applaud the Minister’s personal commitment to pushing forward the recommendations made in ‘Wired for Safety’ and ‘Up in Flames’. We must encourage the UK Government to go further, as that is the only way in which the National Assembly for Wales can move forward on this. Our co-

bresennol. Siawns nad yw hynny’n profi manteision systemau taenellwyr dŵr. Credaf fod yr un potensial i achub bywyd mewn gosod taenellwyr domestig ag yr oedd mewn cyflwyno gwregysau diogelwch tua 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae cost gosod taenellwyr mewn cartrefi sydd wedi’u codi o’r newydd yn fach iawn, ac mae’n mynd yn rhatach gosod taenellwyr mewn anheddu sy’n bod eisoes. Yn y tymor hir, mae’n ddigon posibl y bydd gosod taenellwyr yn arbed arian. Mae’r gost o beidio â gwneud hynny’n glir, o gofio nifer y cartrefi a gaiff eu hysu gan dân. Gall taenellwyr reoli tanau a’u cyfyngu i un ystafell hyd nes bydd y frigâd dân yn cyrraedd. Felly, gallent arbed y symiau anferthol o arian a gaiff eu gwario ar drwsio ac adnewyddu’r stoc dai ar ôl tanau.

Mae hynny’n wir hefyd am ysgolion ac adeiladau cyhoeddus eraill sy’n agored i losgi bwriadol. Bob blwyddyn, difrodir tua 2,000 o ysgolion ledled Prydain gan danau, y caiff tri chwarter ohonynt eu cynnau’n fwriadol. Disgwylir y bydd cost tanau mewn ysgolion yn y flwyddyn hon yn unig gymaint â £87 miliwn. Gallesid gwario’r arian hwnnw ar bethau eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, nid cost ariannol yn unig a geir, fel y dystia rhieni, disgylion a staff ysgol arbennig yn fy etholaeth i, Ysgol Tir Morfa. Ni allai’r ysgol ailagor ar ddechrau’r tymor hwn oherwydd Tân bwriadol ym mis Awst. Mae hynny wedi amharu’n ddifrifol ar y disgylion a’r rhieni, yn ogystal â’r gymuned ehangach sy’n defnyddio’r cyfleusterau y tu allan i oriau ysgol. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i ymgyrchu bod taenellwyr dŵr yn arbed ysgolion. Anogaf y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i fynnu y caiff taenellwyr rhag Tân eu gosod ym mhob ysgol newydd ac adnewyddedig yng Nghymru. Mae’n gwneud synnwyr economaidd a bydd hefyd yn gwarchod ein plant a’n cymunedau rhag difrod difrifol ac, o bosibl, rhag colli eu bywydau.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y Cynulliad yn arwain y ffordd ar ddiogelwch rhag Tân a chanmolaf ymrwymiad personol y Gweinidog i hybu’r argymhellion a wnaed yn ‘Wired for Safety’ ac ‘Up in Flames’. Rhaid inni annog Llywodraeth y DU i fynd ymhellach, gan mai hynny yw’r unig fodd i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru symud ymlaen ar hyn.

ordinated approach to fire safety is putting Wales ahead of the game. It is an example of the Assembly making a practical difference, and one which I am delighted to applaud.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As William and Ann have said, it is timely and relevant that we discuss this issue on bonfire night. We wish everyone an enjoyable bonfire evening. However, we hope that there will not be no accidents as a result of bonfires or fireworks.

If Guy Fawkes were living in Wales today, he would be a frustrated man. He would have to wait for the First Minister to make his mind up on whether we are to have a new building before he could register his protest against it. Perhaps it was fortunate that he lived when he did.

On this initiative, it is important that we consider the fire service's work. We sometimes forget about its important role in advising people of the precautions that they can take in their homes to prevent fires, as well as in responding to calls when there are fires. We all hope that the firefighters' pay dispute will reach a settlement because they undertake important community work in addition to their day to day responsibilities. Homeowners and local authorities should be responsible for ensuring that every precaution is taken.

5.00 p.m.

I welcome the initiative announced by the Finance Minister. I often welcome announcements made and action taken by Edwina Hart. This initiative is important. I hope that every recommendation will be taken forward, including those on the installation of hard-wired smoke detectors and sprinkler systems. If those initiatives are implemented the people of Wales will hopefully be protected to the fullest extent, and if all the safeguards are in place, we will hopefully see less unfortunate accidents occurring.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats also support this announcement, which has been made on an auspicious day.

Mae ein hymagwedd gydlynol at ddiogelwch rhag tân yn rhoi Cymru ar y blaen. Mae'n enghraifft o'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ymarferol, ac yn un yr wyf yn falch o'i chanmol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel y dywedodd William ac Ann, mae'n amserol ac yn berthnasol ein bod yn trafod y mater hwn ar noson tân gwylt. Dymunwn noson tân gwylt bleserus i bawb. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiwn na fydd damweiniau o ganlyniad i goelcerthi neu dân gwylt.

Pe byddai Guto Ffowc yn byw yng Nghymru heddiw, byddai'n ddyn rhwystredig. Byddai'n gorfod disgwyl i'r Prif Weinidog benderfynu a ydym i gael adeilad newydd cyn y gallai fynegi ei brotest yn ei erbyn. Efallai ei bod yn ffodus ei fod yn byw yn yr oes honno.

Ynghylch y fenter hon, mae'n bwysig inni ystyried gwaith y gwasanaeth Tân. Yr ydym weithiau'n anghofio'i rôl bwysig wrth hysbysu pobl am y camau gofal y gallant eu cymryd yn eu cartrefi eu hunain i atal tanau, yn ogystal â'i rôl wrth ymateb i alwadau pan fo tanau. Yr ydym oll yn gobeithio y deuir i gytundeb ar anghydfod tâl y diffoddwyr Tân gan eu bod yn gwneud gwaith pwysig yn y gymuned yn ogystal â delio â'u cyfrifoldebau o ddydd i ddydd. Dylai perchnogion tai a'r awdurdodau lleol fod yn gyfrifol am sicrhau y cymerir pob gofal.

Croesawaf y fenter a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog Cyllid. Yr wyf yn aml yn croesawu cyhoeddiadau gan Edwina Hart a'r camau y mae'n ei chymryd. Mae'r fenter hon yn un bwysig. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob argymhelliaid yn cael ei weithredu, gan gynnwys y rhai ar osod synwyryddion mwg gwifredig a systemau taenellwyr dŵr. Os rhoddir y mentrau hynny ar waith, gobeithio y caiff pobl Cymru eu gwarchod i'r graddau mwyaf posibl, ac os yw'r holl fesurau diogelwch ar waith, gobeithio y gwelwn lai o ddamweiniau anffodus.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hefyd yn cefnogi'r cyhoeddiad hwn, a wnaed ar ddiwrnod

We welcome the findings and look forward to the implementation of the schemes. We believe, as others have said, that if the initiatives are implemented, Wales will be a world leader in terms of the level of protection and support for fire prevention measures that it provides.

We also support the principle of targeting those who are most susceptible to fire injury and fatality, such as those who live in houses in multiple occupation and the disabled. Although domestic sprinkler systems are usually seen as devices of the wealthy, in reality, the most disadvantaged need them the most. This scheme is another good example of the Welsh Assembly Government adopting a cross-cutting approach. It will benefit those at risk of home fires and reduce pressure, in terms of cost and resources, on the fire service, the health service and social services.

We must continue to educate people about fire hazards, including through the school curriculum. I have visited a number of fire stations in north Wales. I recommend such visits, as they offer a stimulating and interesting experience. In my previous role as a teacher, I took groups of 14 to 16-year-olds to visit fire stations, which was wonderful, so that they could learn, for example, that they should not make hoax calls. Effective and interesting advice was given. According to the fire service, many people are often oblivious to hazards, such as chip pans catching fire late at night, which accounts for a high proportion of call-outs. Other hazards include the careless use of matches and cigarettes, and people removing batteries from smoke detectors and alarms.

**David Davies:** I also welcome the initiative announced today. Everyone should welcome it. Even my good friend the Member for Blaenau Gwent is going to have great difficulty in turning this debate into an anti-Tory tirade about what the party did during its 18 years in power. However, he might surprise us yet. I was also pleased to see Edwina Hart appropriately wearing her fireman-red outfit today.

ffafriol. Croesawn y canfyddiadau ac edrychwn ymlaen at weithredu'r cynlluniau. Os gweithredir y mentrau, credwn, fel y dywedodd eraill, y bydd Cymru'n arwain y byd o ran graddau'r amddiffyniad y mae'n ei ddarparu a'r cymorth y mae'n ei roi ar gyfer mesurau atal tân.

Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi'r egwyddor o dargedu'r rhai sy'n fwyaf agored i anafiadau a marwolaethau oherwydd tân, fel y rhai sy'n byw mewn tai amlfeddiant a phobl anabl. Er mai fel dyfeisiadau i'r cyfoethog yr ystyrir systemau taenellwyr dŵr domestig fel arfer, mewn gwirionedd, ar y rhai mwyaf difreintiedig y mae'r angen mwyaf amdanynt. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn enghraifft dda arall o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n mabwysiadu dull gweithredu trawsbynciol. Bydd o les i'r rhai sydd mewn perygl oddi wrth danau yn y cartref ac yn lleihau'r pwysau, o ran costau ac adnoddau, ar y gwasanaeth tân, y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Rhaid inni barhau i addysgu pobl ynghylch peryglon tân, gan gynnwys yr hyn a wneir drwy'r cwricwlwm ysgolion. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â sawl Gorsaf Dân yn y Gogledd. Yr wyf yn argymhell ymwelliadau o'r fath, gan eu bod yn cynnig profiad cyffrous a diddorol. Yn fy rôl flaenorol fel athrawes, awn â grwpiau o rai 14 i 16 mlwydd oed i ymweld â gorsafoedd tân, a oedd yn beth gwych, fel y gallent ddysgu, er enghraifft, na ddylent wneud galwadau ffug. Rhoddwyd cyngor effeithiol a diddorol. Yn ôl y gwasanaeth tân, mae llawer o bobl yn holol anymwybodol o'r peryglon, fel sosbenni sglodion yn mynd ar dân yn hwyr y nos, sy'n gyfrifol am lawer iawn o'r galwadau ar y gwasanaeth. Rhai o'r peryglon eraill yw defnyddio matsis a sigarennau'n ddiofal, a thynnu batris o synwyryddion mwg a larymau.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r fenter a gyhoeddwyd heddiw. Dylai pawb ei chroesawu. Bydd hyd yn oed fy nghyfaill yr Aelod dros Flaenau Gwent yn ei chael yn anodd iawn troi'r ddadl hon yn ymosodiad llym yn erbyn y Torïaid ar yr hyn a wnaeth y blaid honno yn ystod ei 18 mlynedd mewn grym. Fodd bynnag, efallai y gwnaiff ein synnu eto. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch o weld Edwina Hart wedi gwisgo'n briodol heddiw

mewn dillad coch o liw'r diffoddwyr tân.

I will make two serious points briefly. First, I share other Members' concern about the sale of fireworks. As a Conservative Party Member, I believe in liberty and I do not want to ban their sale. However, we have seen far too much irresponsible behaviour from too many people over the last few years for us to ignore that problem. One way forward would be for people to be nominated by justices of the peace or policemen, for example, as responsible people who can buy fireworks. That would mean that there would not be much red tape preventing people from buying fireworks. Such a system would also allow youth leaders and others to continue to hold firework displays in a responsible way. It would also stop irresponsible people from lighting fireworks in the street, which occasionally causes severe injuries.

Secondly, and Rhodri Glyn Thomas alluded to this earlier, is the issue of those who have to extinguish fires. It would be easy to turn this discussion into a debate on the possible forthcoming firefighters' strike. I do not wish to do that. However, I have been told that there is a great deal of surplus fire equipment currently not being used by the fire brigade in Wales. I was told, for example, that there are three fire engines in south Wales that have been put out of service and are waiting to be sold, possibly to somewhere in eastern Europe. Kosovo was mentioned because, I believe, they use much of our old fire equipment.

I do not doubt the Minister's commitment to preventing unnecessary fires and needless deaths and injuries. However, there is a large amount of surplus equipment. Fire engines and surplus cutting equipment are lying around unused, and are no longer the property of the fire service. That equipment should be put at the disposal of anyone who may need it to put out fires in the forthcoming months. If we prevent people from accessing that equipment, we could be sending people out to fight fires blindfolded and with their hands tied behind their backs, which is unacceptable. Will the Minister show how strong her commitment is to

Gwnaf ddau bwynt difrif yn fyr. Yn gyntaf, rhannaf bryder Aelodau eraill am werthu tân gwylt. A minnau'r Aelod o'r Blaid Geidwadol, yr wyf yn credu mewn rhyddid ac nid wyf am wahardd eu gwerthu. Fodd bynnag, gwelsom ormod o lawer o ymddygiad anghyfrifol gan ormod o lawer o bobl dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf inni allu anwybyddu'r broblem honno. Un ffordd ymlaen fyddai enwebu pobl gan ynaden heddwch neu hedweision, er engrraith, yn rhai cyfrifol a gaiff brynu tân gwylt. Golygai hynny na fyddai llawer o fiwrocriniaeth i atal pobl rhag prynu tân gwylt. Byddai system o'r fath hefyd yn caniatáu i arweinwyr ieuengtid ac eraill barhau i gynnal arddangosfeydd tân gwylt mewn modd cyfrifol. Byddai hefyd yn atal pobl anghyfrifol rhag cynnau tân gwylt yn y stryd, sydd weithiau'n achosi anafiadau difrifol.

Yn ail, a chyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas at hyn yn gynharach, y mae mater y rhai sy'n gorvod diffodd tanau. Hawdd fyddai troi'r drafodaeth hon yn ddadl ar y streic y gallai'r diffoddwyr tân ei chynnal cyn hir. Ni ddymunaf wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd wrthyf fod llawer iawn o offer diffodd tân dros ben nas defnyddir ar hyn o bryd gan y frigâd dân yng Nghymru. Dywedwyd wrthyf, er engrraith, fod tair injan dân yn y De sy'n segur ac yn disgwl cael eu gwerthu, i rywle yn nwyrain Ewrop o bosibl. Soniwyd am Kosovo gan ei bod yn defnyddio llawer o'n hen offer diffodd tân, yr wyf yn credu.

Nid wyf yn amau ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i atal tanau a marwolaethau ac anafiadau diangen. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer iawn o offer dros ben. Mae injans tân ac offer torri dros ben yn sefyll heb eu defnyddio, ac nid ydynt bellach yn eiddo i'r gwasanaeth tân. Dylid darparu'r offer hynny ar gyfer unrhyw un y gallai fod arno eu hangen i ddiffodd tanau yn y misoedd i ddod. Os rhwystrwn bobl rhag cael yr offer hynny, gallem anfon pobl i ddiffodd tanau â'u dwylo wedi'u clymu a mwgwd dros eu llygaid, sy'n annerbyniol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddangos mor gryf yw ei hymrwymiad i atal tanau? A yw'n barod i ymchwilio i'r injans tân a'r

preventing fires? Is she prepared to investigate surplus fire engines and cutting equipment, and put them at the disposal of the armed forces if they need them in the forthcoming months?

**Peter Law:** If we were having a bonfire here tonight, I am sure that we would have plenty of fuel on the Tory rows, and most of the people of Wales would agree that we would do a good job if we were to burn them. However, in a democracy we must listen to them daily.

Many of my lines have been taken. I was going to refer to the Minister looking resplendent in her red attire—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will help you, Peter, since you are running out of lines. You referred to a bonfire. There was going to be a bonfire of quangos. Do you accept that there will now be a big bonfire of quangos, because the Minister for Health and Social Services has just set up 22 more of them? There could be a massive bonfire of quangos.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We are debating fire policies, not quangos.

**Peter Law:** That is new opportunism from Plaid Cymru. Jane Hutt's proposals will get to the heart of the matter for people in communities. I welcome her proposals in areas such as Blaenau Gwent. However, we are talking seriously about community safety and protecting life and limb. It is not the most glamorous topic to be debated here, but it is vital to all our communities. It helps to focus on the good work that is done by those great fire service professionals throughout our communities who, as Rhodri Glyn mentioned, look after our communities and work tirelessly on our behalf. As one who supports the firefighters, I hope that they will get a fair deal in their pay and conditions, which they richly deserve and which many people believe they should have.

On the report, I am delighted that the Minister has taken up the challenge of the

offer torri dros ben a'u darparu ar gyfer y lluoedd arfog os oes arnynt eu hangen yn y misoedd i ddod?

**Peter Law:** Pe baem yn cael coelcerth yma heno, yr wyf yn siŵr y caem ddigon o danwydd ar resi'r Torfaid, a byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru'n cytuno y byddem yn gwneud gwaith da pe byddem yn eu llosgi. Fodd bynnag, mewn cyfundrefn ddemocratiaidd rhaid inni wrando arnynt bob dydd.

Mae llawer o'r pethau doniol yr oeddwn am eu dweud wedi'u dweud eisoes. Yr oeddwn am gyfeirio at y Gweinidog yn edrych yn ysblennyydd yn ei gwisg goch—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gwnaf eich helpu, Peter, gan eich bod yn mynd yn brin o bethau doniol i'w dweud. Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at goelcerth. Yr oedd coelcerth o gwangos i fod. A ydych yn derbyn y bydd coelcerth fawr o gwangos yn awr, gan fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol newydd sefydlu 22 yn rhagor ohonynt? Gellid cael coelcerth anferth o gwangos.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Polisiau tân yr ydym yn eu trafod, nid cwangos.

**Peter Law:** Mae honno'n fanteisiaeth newydd ar ran Plaid Cymru. Bydd cynigion Jane Hutt yn mynd at wreiddyn y mater ar gyfer pobl mewn cymunedau. Croesawaf ei chynigion mewn ardaloedd fel Blaenau Gwent. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn siarad o ddifrif am ddiogelwch cymunedol a diogelu bywydau. Nid hwn yw'r pwnc mwyaf cyfareddol a drafodwyd yma, ond mae'n hollbwysig i bob un o'n cymunedau. Mae'n fodd i roi sylw i'r gwaith da a wneir gan y gweithwyr proffesiynol gwych hynny yn y gwasanaeth tân ym mhob un o'n cymunedau sydd, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn, yn gofalu am ein cymunedau ac yn gweithio'n ddiflino ar ein rhan. Fel un sy'n cefnogi'r diffoddwyr tân, gobeithiaf y caint fargen deg o ran eu tâl ac amodau, y maent yn ei gwir haeddu ac y mae llawer yn credu y dylent ei chael.

Ynghylch yr adroddiad, yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn her y

community fire safety working group, followed quickly by the report, 'Up in Flames' on the arson problem, and is working positively to make Wales a safer place. The fire service is delighted, because it was in the shadows for so long. Many of the proposals would never have come about if it were not for the National Assembly, for devolution, and for a committed Government of Wales Minister who is prepared to make available the funding that is noted in this document. The budget notes that, over the next few years, £3 million, £4 million, and £5 million will go towards making Wales a safer place. I particularly commend the community fire safety trust that will be established, I believe, in January 2003. That is to be highly commended, as are the Minister and the Government for acting so quickly on this. There are too many easy ways out of these things usually. Many past Government Ministers have paid lip service to this issue, but matters have stood still. We are moving forward positively to make people's lives safer throughout Wales.

I commend what we have heard today about the work that is being undertaken in Neath Port Talbot regarding the sprinkler system. I am pleased to hear that, and I welcome it. I also welcome the £1.6 million that is being invested in considering how to move forward on smoke detectors, and the hard-wired smoke detectors that we will see in social housing by the end of 2005, I believe. These are positive developments that the Minister has assured us of. She, like all of us, wants to see a safer Wales and wants to work with the good people who represent the fire service, housing associations, and local government, who all work together for the good of the community.

It is pleasing that the report's recommendations have been acted on to some extent. However, there is much more to do. I know that the Minister will agree that we need to make houses in multiple occupation much safer for those who live in them. I know that the Minister will support that commitment. The report notes that residents of houses in multiple occupation are 15 times more likely to die from fire than people in

gweithgor diogelwch tân cymunedol, a ddilynwyd yn fuan gan yr adroddiad 'Up in Flames' ar broblem llosgi bwriadol, a'i bod yn gweithio'n gadarnhaol i wneud Cymru'n lle mwy diogel. Mae'r gwasanaeth tân wrth ei fod, gan iddo fod ar yr ymylon mor hir. Mae llawer o'n cynigion yn rhai na fyddent byth wedi codi oni bai am y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, datganoli, a Gweinidog ymroddedig yn Llywodraeth Cymru sy'n barod i ddarparu'r arian a nodir yn y ddogfen hon. Mae'r gyllideb yn nodi y bydd £3 miliwn, £4 miliwn a £5 miliwn yn mynd at wneud Cymru'n lle mwy diogel dros y blynnyddoedd nesaf. Canmolaf yn arbennig yr ymddiriedolaeth diogelwch tân cymunedol a sefydlir, yr wyf yn credu, yn Ionawr 2003. Mae hynny i'w ganmol yn fawr, fel y mae'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth am weithredu mor fuan ar hyn. Mae'n rhy hawdd dianc rhag y pethau hyn fel arfer. Mae llawer o Weinidogion Llywodraeth y gorffennol wedi esgus cefnogi'r mater hwn, ond mae pethau wedi aros yn eu hunfan. Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen yn gadarnhaol i wneud bywydau pobl yn fwy diogel ledled Cymru.

Cymeradwyaf yr hyn a glywsom heddiw am y gwaith a wneir yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot ynghylch y system taenellwyr dŵr. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny, ac fe'i croesawaf. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r £1.6 miliwn a fuddsoddir mewn ystyried sut i symud ymlaen ynghylch synwyryddion mwg, a'r synwyryddion mwg gwifredig a welwn mewn tai cymdeithasol erbyn diwedd 2005, yr wyf yn credu. Dyma ddatblygiadau cadarnhaol y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ein sicrhau ohonynt. Mae hi, fel pawb o honom, am weld Cymru ddiogelach ac am weithio gyda'r bobl dda hynny sy'n cynrychioli'r gwasanaeth tân, y cymdeithasau tai, a llywodraeth leol, sydd oll yn cydweithio er lles y gymuned.

Mae'n braff gweld bod camau wedi'u cymryd ar argymhellion yr adroddiad i ryw raddau. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer mwy i'w wneud. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni wneud tai amlfeddiant yn fwy diogel i'r rhai sy'n byw ynddynt. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn cefnogi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi bod rhai sy'n preswylio mewn tai amlfeddiant yn 15 gwaith yn fwy tebygol o farw oherwydd tân

conventional dwellings. We must all be concerned about that. I hope that the Assembly Government will consider enforcing requirements for sprinklers in new schools, student halls of residence, nursing homes, and residential homes in the future.

5.10 p.m.

The action that is taken arising from the good work of this group, and the work being undertaken in this new partnership era, is enhancing the confidence of our fire service throughout Wales, and is telling the people of Wales that the Assembly and the Government of Wales is acting to make their communities much safer.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I thank William Graham for outlining some of the harsh statistics about fire in Wales. William's contribution indicated that there are groups that we do not reach in terms of fire safety. It is important that we leave no stone unturned in trying to deal with those issues. William made that important point. He also spoke about houses in multiple occupation, as did other Members, including Peter Law. This is of great concern to us. The more that we can do, the more we will be able to achieve and get right in that regard, I hope, in future.

The community fire safety trust will address several issues that Members have raised. The trust has the full support of the three brigades of Wales's fire service. Its overall remit is to improve quality of life in Wales by reducing the numbers of preventable fire deaths in industry. It will have a promotional campaign, an educational role, and will research into fire deaths, and so on. That will give us great confidence.

I concur with Rhodri Glyn Thomas's comments about the fire service's valued role in Wales. I believe that we all agree, and have said so, that it undertakes valuable work, not just in fighting fires, but also in its commitment to communities and the work in

na rhai sy'n byw mewn anheddu confensiynol. Mae'n siŵr bod pawb ohonom yn bryderus ynghylch hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystyried gorfodi gofynion am daenellwyr dŵr mewn ysgolion newydd, neuaddau preswyl myfyrwyr, cartrefi nysio, a chartrefi preswyl yn y dyfodol.

Mae'r camau a gymerir o ganlyniad i waith da y grŵp hwn, a'r gwaith a wneir yn yr oes newydd hon o bartneriaeth, yn rhoi hwb i hyder ein gwasanaeth Tân ledled Cymru, ac yn dweud wrth bobl Cymru bod y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cymru'n cymryd camau i wneud eu cymunedau'n fwy diogel o lawer.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Diolchaf i William Graham am amlinellu rhai o'r ystadegau cignoeth ynghylch Tân yng Nghymru. Nododd William yn ei gyfraniad fod grwpiau nad ydym yn eu cyrraedd o ran diogelwch rhag Tân. Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn gadael yr un garreg heb ei throi wrth geisio delio â'r materion hynny. Gwnaeth William y pwyt pwysig hwnnw. Soniodd hefyd am dai amlfeddiant, fel y gwnaeth Aelodau eraill, gan gynnwys Peter Law. Mae hyn yn peri pryder mawr i ni. Po fwyaf y gallwn ei wneud, mwyaf y gallwn ei gyflawni a'i gael yn iawn yn hynny o beth, yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn y dyfodol.

Bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth diogelwch Tân cymunedol yn ymdrin â sawl mater a gododd yr Aelodau. Mae'r tair brigâd yng ngwasanaeth Tân Cymru'n llwyr gefnogi'r ymddiriedolaeth. Ei chylch gorchwyl cyffredinol yw gwella ansawdd bywyd yng Nghymru drwy leihau nifer y marwolaethau oherwydd Tân y gellir eu hatal mewn diwydiant. Bydd ganddi ymgyrch hyrwyddo, rôl addysgol, a bydd yn ymchwilio i farwolaethau oherwydd Tân, ac yn y blaen. Bydd hynny'n rhoi hyder mawr i ni.

Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â sylwadau Rhodri Glyn Thomas am rôl werthfawr y gwasanaeth Tân yng Nghymru. Credaf ein bod oll yn cytuno, ac wedi dweud, ei fod yn gwneud gwaith gwerthfawr, nid yn unig wrth ddiffodd tanau, ond hefyd drwy ei ymrwymiad i gymunedau

which it has been prepared to engage. I am sorry that the firefighters' dispute has been raised. I hope that silence is golden and that the dispute will be resolved. I assure David Davies that the matters that are within the UK Government's purview regarding the issues raised are being taken forward. It is for the UK Government to put these issues in place, and to ensure that the military provides fire cover, and so on. They are not matters for me over and above my understanding of operational issues, in Wales in particular.

The realisation that there is a solution to some of these issues was an important theme in today's contributions. If you are prepared to put money in the budget, and work proactively with your partners, you can change things. On the home energy efficiency scheme, which I mentioned in my opening remarks, we have amended regulations to fit smoke alarms and to give the necessary 10-year batteries, and we are taking these issues forward. I appreciate the standard of today's debate, which also prevailed in the Local Government and Housing Committee when we discussed this issue. There has been clear consensus across the political parties about the importance of dealing with this issue and ensuring that fire safety is important.

I am not sure that I agree with Eleanor Burnham that 5 November is an auspicious day. We all have different views on Guy Fawkes's role. However, what we have in common is our commitment to fire safety. If we can work together and see that the further report is implemented properly, and work with our partners in the fire service, local government and other organisations, we can take the agenda forward. On sprinklers in schools, I hope that we will have a pilot scheme to see how it works. I look forward to the outcome of the pilot scheme in Neath Port Talbot, which will be useful for us in taking this agenda forward. I thank Members for the quality of this debate. I will not support amendment 1. It was a nice try to speak first as the official opposition, but you have been caught out.

a'r gwaith y bu'n barod i ymgymryd ag ef. Mae'n flin gennyf fod mater anghydfod y diffoddwyr tân wedi'i godi. Gobeithiaf mai aur dilin yw distawrwydd ac y caiff yr anghydfod ei ddatrys. Sicrhaf David Davies fod camau'n cael eu cymryd ynghylch y materion a godwyd sydd o fewn maes Llywodraeth y DU. Mater i Lywodraeth y DU yw datrys y materion hyn, a sicrhau bod y fyddin yn gofalu am ddiffodd tanau, ac yn y blaen. Nid materion i mi yw'r rhain heblaw am fy nealltwriaeth o'r materion gweithredol, yng Nghymru'n benodol.

Yr oedd sylweddoli bod ateb i rai o'r materion hyn yn thema bwysig yn y cyfraniadau heddiw. Os ydych yn barod i roi arian yn y gyllideb, a gweithio'n rhagweithiol â'ch partneriaid, gallwch newid pethau. Ynghylch y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, a grybwylais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, yr ydym wedi newid y rheoliadau er mwyn gosod larymau mwg a rhoi'r batris 10 mlynedd sydd eu hangen, ac yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â'r materion hynny. Gwerthfawrogaf safon y ddadl heddiw, a oedd yn bresennol hefyd yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai pan draffodasom y mater hwn. Bu consensws amlwg rhwng yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol ynghylch y pwysigrwydd o ddelio â'r mater hwn a sicrhau bod diogelwch rhag tân yn bwysig.

Nid wyf yn sicr fy mod yn cytuno ag Eleanor Burnham fod 5 Tachwedd yn ddiwrnod ffafriol. Mae gan bawb ohonom farn wahanol am rôl Guto Ffowc. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd gennym yn gyffredin yw ein hymrwymiad i ddiogelwch rhag tân. Os gallwn gydweithio a sicrhau y caiff yr adroddiad pellach ei weithredu'n briodol, a gweithio gyda'n partneriaid yn y gwasanaeth tân, llywodraeth leol a chyrff eraill, gallwn fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda. Ynghylch taenellwyr dŵr mewn ysgolion, gobeithiaf y cawn gynllun peilot i weld sut y mae'n gweithio. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld canlyniad y cynllun peilot yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, a fydd yn ddefnyddiol inni wrth fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hon. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am ansawdd y ddadl hon. Ni chefnogaf welliant 1. Yr oedd yn ymgais lew i siarad yn gyntaf fel yr wrthblaid swyddogol, ond fe'ch daliwyd wrthi.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 1: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Evans, Delyth  
Graham, William  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1198): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1198): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine

Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.16 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.16 p.m.*