



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 5 Ebrill 2001**

**Thursday 5 April 2001**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau  
*Questions on Local Government to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities*
- 12 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd  
*Questions to the Minister for Environment*
- 21 Datganiad ar Glwy'r Traed a'r Genau  
*Statement on Foot and Mouth Disease*
- 37 Datganiadau ar Asesiadau Fferm Gyfan o Indrawn a Addaswyd yn Enetig  
*Statement on Farm-scale Evaluation of Genetically Modified Maize*
- 48 Datganiad ar Ddyfodol Canolfan y Mileniwm  
*Statement on the Future of the Wales Millennium Centre*
- 68 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 72 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 73 Cymeradwyo'r Amserlen Tri Mis ar gyfer Busnes y Cynulliad  
*Approval of the Three-month Timetable of Assembly Business*
- 74 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion  
*Composite Motion: Approval of Orders*
- 76 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001  
*The Approval of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2001*
- 88 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Swyddogaethau Disgybu) 2001  
*Approval of the General Teaching Councils for Wales (Disciplinary Functions) Regulations 2001*
- 95 Dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog Cymru holl Swyddogaethau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a geir yn neu o dan Reoliadau a wneir o dan Adran 2(2) o Ddeddf Cymunedau Ewrop 1972  
*Delegation to the First Minister all the Functions of the National Assembly for Wales Contained in or under Regulations made under Section 2(2) of the European Communities Act 1972*
- 97 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23, Adran 3 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34  
*Approval of Changes to Standing Orders No. 23, Section 3 and Standing Order No.34*
- 100 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*

- 101 Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 7 ) Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru)  
2001  
*Approval of the Local Government Finance ( Wales) Special Grant Report ( No 7 )  
(Wales) 2001*
- 107 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 109 Dadl Fer: Stres—Ei Effeithiau ar Blant  
*Short Debate: Stress—The Effects on the Child*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambwr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau**

### **Questions on Local Government to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities**

#### **Moderneiddo Llywodraeth Leol Modernising Local Government**

**Q1 Jonathan Morgan:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Executive's measures to modernise local government? (OAQ10883)

**C1 Jonathan Morgan:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ddatganiad ar fusurau'r Weithrediaeth i foderneiddio llywodraeth leol? (OAQ10883)

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** We discussed the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2001 on 27 March. In addition, draft guidance on community strategies has been issued. I have completed consultation on new political structures and I am now consulting on a new ethical framework.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cawsom drafodaeth ar Orchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2001 ar 27 Mawrth. Yn ychwanegol at hyn, cyhoeddwyd canllawiau drafft ar strategaethau cymunedol. Yr wyf wedi cwblhau ymgynghoriad ar strwythurau gwleidyddol newydd ac yr wyf bellach yn ymgynghori ar fframwaith egwyddorol newydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Several months ago, in fact probably a year ago, the Assembly debated at length councillors' allowances and remuneration for those who serve in local government. There has been an unacceptable delay in the work being undertaken. The Assembly needs to know what the situation is now. The people of Wales expect decisions to be taken on this matter because of the strong feelings about it in Wales, particularly in Cardiff. Can you update the Assembly on this issue?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Sawl mis yn ôl, flwyddyn yn ôl mae'n debyg, cynhaliodd y Cynulliad drafodaeth faith ar lwfansau cynhorwyr a thaliadau ar gyfer y rhai sydd yn gwasanaethu mewn llywodraeth leol. Bu oedi annerbyniol wrth wneud y gwaith hwn. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad wybod beth yw'r sefyllfa erbyn hyn. Mae pobl Cymru'n disgwyl i benderfyniadau gael eu gwneud ar y mater hwn oherwydd bod teimladau cryf am hyn yng Nghymru, yn arbennig yng Nghaerdydd. Allwch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad ar y mater hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Consultants have been appointed and are commencing their work. The timetable, which I outlined to the Assembly, for them obtaining findings by the summer is still on line to be met.

**Edwina Hart:** Penodwyd ymgynghorwyr ac maent yn dechrau ar eu gwaith. Mae'r amserlen, a amlinellais i'r Cynulliad, er mwyn iddynt sicrhau canfyddiadau erbyn yr haf ar y trywydd cywir i gael ei chyflawni.

**Eleanor Burnham:** What assurances can you give that the new legislation proposed by the Assembly on openness in Welsh local government will stop a repeat of the situation

**Eleanor Burnham:** Pa sicrwydd y gallwch chi ei roi y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth newydd a gynigiwyd gan y Cynulliad ar fod yn agored mewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yn atal

that occurred in Flintshire County Council? That council was recently criticised by the district auditor for a lack of openness, accountability and integrity.

sefyllfa debyg i'r un yng Nghyngor Sir y Fflint rhag digwydd eto? Beirniadwyd y cyngor hwnnw'n ddiweddar gan yr archwilydd dosbarth am fethu â bod yn agored, atebol a gonest.

**Edwina Hart:** I will not comment on the position of Flintshire County Council. The district auditor's report is a matter for that council.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni wnaf ymateb i sefyllfa Cyngor Sir y Fflint. Mater i'r cyngor hwnnw yw adroddiad yr archwilydd dosbarth.

### **Rhaglenni Adfywio Cymunedol Sector Gwirfoddol Voluntary Sector Community Regeneration Programmes**

**Q2 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on sources of funding for voluntary sector community regeneration programmes? (OAQ10832)

**C2 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ffynonellau cyllid ar gyfer rhaglenni adfywio cymunedol sector gwirfoddol? (OAQ10832)

**Edwina Hart:** The voluntary sector can bid for a number of National Assembly community regeneration programmes. I announced local regeneration fund top-sliced funding on 1 March for community capacity building and community regeneration initiatives, to be undertaken by 20 voluntary and community groups across Wales.

**Edwina Hart:** Gall y sector gwirfoddol wneud cais am nifer o raglenni adfywio cymdeithasol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cyhoeddais arian brigdoriad y gronfa adfywio lleol ar 1 Mawrth er mwyn meithrin gallu cymunedau a mentrau adfywio cymunedol, a gynhelir gan 20 o grwpiau gwirfoddol a chymunedol ledled Cymru.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Voluntary organisations that run projects rely on a cocktail of funding from many sources and accessing funding requires expertise that small organisations often lack. Do you agree that there is a strong case for simpler, broader funding schemes for voluntary sector projects and will you agree to review funding mechanisms?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae sefydliadau gwirfoddol sydd yn rhedeg prosiectau yn dibynnu ar gymysgedd o arian o nifer o ffynonellau ac mae cael mynediad i arian yn gofyn am arbenigedd nad yw sefydliadau bach yn meddu arno'n aml. A gytunwch fod dadl gref dros gyflwyno cynlluniau ariannu symlach ac ehangach ar gyfer prosiectau sector gwirfoddol ac a gytunwch i adolygu'r dulliau ariannu?

**Edwina Hart:** I have also been concerned—as has Jane Hutt, who has responsibility for the voluntary sector—about the problems faced by the voluntary sector, namely the plethora of organisations to which they must apply, the nature of the forms and so on. We are committed to considering streamlining structures and I hope that we will have seen improvements over the last year. This issue is very much on the voluntary sector's agenda.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf hefyd wedi bod yn bryderus—fel y bu Jane Hutt, sydd yn gyfrifol am y sector gwirfoddol—am y problemau a wynebir gan y sector gwirfoddol, sef yr amrywiaeth eang o sefydliadau y mae'n rhaid cyflwyno ceisiadau iddynt, natur y ffurflenni ac ati. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i ystyried symleiddio strwythurau a gobeithiaf inni weld gwelliannau yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae'r mater hwn yn bendant ar agenda'r sector gwirfoddol.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that successful community regeneration invariably involves the voluntary sector? Do

**David Melding:** A gytunwch fod adfywio cymunedol llwyddiannus yn dibynnu'n ddieithriad ar y sector gwirfoddol? A

you also agree that we must mainstream it in all schemes so that we have schemes that are aimed directly at the communities' purposes rather than being imposed on them?

gytunwch hefyd fod yn rhaid inni ei brif ffrydio ym mhob cynllun er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym gynlluniau sydd wedi eu hanelu'n uniongyrchol at ddibenion y cymunedau yn hytrach na chael eu gorfodi arnynt?

**Edwina Hart:** I concur about the bottom-ups approach. We must recognise that there is concern about the more formal aspects of the voluntary sector. Although we have an excellent relationship with the Welsh Council for Voluntary Action, some voluntary bodies do not feel that they are a part of that organisation. They feel that they are almost part of another structure. We must be genuine about these programmes. We must adopt a bottom-up approach, consulting with that base and ensuring the voluntary sector that we are putting the necessary mechanisms in place to empower it to become part of the discussion on this issue. That is the most difficult aspect of this and the voluntary sector has a valuable role in that.

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf â'r ymagwedd o'r bôn i'r brig. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod pryder ynglŷn ag agweddau mwy ffurfiol ar y sector gwirfoddol. Er bod gennym berthynas wych gyda Chyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, nid yw rhai cyrff gwirfoddol yn teimlo eu bod yn rhan o'r sefydliad hwnnw. Teimlant eu bod bron yn rhan o strwythur arall. Rhaid inni fod yn ddiffuant ynghylch y rhagleni hyn. Rhaid inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd o'r bôn i'r brig, gan ymgynghori â'r sylfaen a sicrhau'r sector gwirfoddol ein bod yn cyflwyno'r gweithdrefnau angenrheidiol er mwyn ei alluogi i ddod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth ar y mater hwn. Dyna yw'r agwedd anoddaf ar hyn ac mae gan y sector gwirfoddol ran werthfawr i'w chwarae yn hynny.

### Cyllidebau Awdurdodau Heddlu Police Authorities' Budgets

**Q3 David Davies:** What criteria will the Minister use to judge the excessiveness of a police authority's budget? (OAQ10880)

**C3 David Davies:** Pa feini prawf y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu eu defnyddio er mwyn barnu a yw cyllideb awdurdod heddlu'n rhy fawr? (OAQ10880)

**Edwina Hart:** I have yet to consider the principles by which police authority budgets will be judged. When I have done so, they will be put before the Assembly for approval.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf wedi ystyried eto'r egwyddorion y bernir cyllidebau awdurdodau'r heddlu yn eu herbyn. Pan fyddaf wedi gwneud hynny, fe'u cyflwynir i'r Cynulliad i'w cymeradwyo.

**David Davies:** Is it not the case that Gwent Police is losing out because 10 per cent of the formula used to allocate money to police authorities is based on historical spending rather than on need? What are you doing to fulfil the Government's commitment to reduce that 10 per cent to 0 per cent and to base the police authority funding formula on need rather than on historical spending?

**David Davies:** Onid yw Heddlu Gwent ar ei golled am fod 10 y cant o'r fformwla a ddefnyddir i ddyrannu arian i awdurdodau'r heddlu yn seiliedig ar wariant hanesyddol yn hytrach nag ar angen? Beth ydych yn ei wneud i gyflawni ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i leihau'r 10 y cant hwnnw i 0 y cant a seilio fformwla ariannu awdurdodau'r heddlu ar angen yn hytrach nag ar wariant hanesyddol?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwent Police received the most generous increase of all four police authorities in Wales in the last financial year, 2000-01. However, I am concerned about the police funding formula and I have received

**Edwina Hart:** Derbyniodd Heddlu Gwent y cynnydd haefaf o'r pedwar awdurdod heddlu yng Nghymru yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, 2000-01. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf am fformwla ariannu'r heddlu, a derbynais

several representations from chief constables and police authorities about the need for us to examine it. I have written to Charles Clarke MP at the Home Office, who is responsible for policing. I raised several concerns and the fact that we should have equity throughout Wales as regards that formula.

9:15 a.m.

**Geraint Davies:** Do you recognise the importance of community policing in the fight against crime and are you concerned that 26 police stations have closed in south Wales since Labour came to power? Will you make representations to the UK Government for the control of the police to come to this Assembly so that it can ensure that community policing receives the funds that it deserves?

**Edwina Hart:** We cannot blame a Labour Government, however attractive that might be in the build up to the general election, for what police authorities decide to do and for police management in terms of the number of police stations. I accept the point that people want police stations in their area and like to have a building locally and someone to whom they can go, and to see the police as part of the community.

This is a Home Office matter, although no doubt there will be further representations in due course about the possibility of the police coming under the National Assembly's control.

#### **Cynlluniau Adfywio Cymunedol (Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau) Community Regeneration Schemes (Foot and Mouth Disease)**

**Q4 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Does the Minister propose to introduce any community regeneration schemes for those communities affected by the foot and mouth disease crisis? (OAQ10869)

**Edwina Hart:** The Communities First programme considers long-term solutions and targets funding to regenerate the most deprived communities in Wales. The Minister for Rural Affairs has convened a task and finish group drawn from the Wales Rural

sawl sylw gan briw gwnstabliaid ac awdurdodau'r heddlu am yr angen inni ei archwilio. Ysgrifennais at Charles Clarke AS yn y Swyddfa Gartref, sydd yn gyfrifol am blismona. Codais sawl pryder a'r ffaith y dylem gael cydraddoldeb drwy Gymru gyfan mewn cysylltiad â'r fformwla honno.

**Geraint Davies:** A gydnabyddwch bwysigrwydd plismona cymunedol yn yr ymgyrch yn erbyn troseddau ac a ydych yn pryeru bod 26 o orsafoedd yr heddlu wedi cau yn ne Cymru ers i Lafur ddod i rym? A wnewch chi gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU i'r Cynulliad hwn gael rheolaeth dros yr heddlu er mwyn iddo allu sicrhau bod plismona cymunedol yn derbyn yr arian y mae'n ei haeddu?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni allwn feio Llywodraeth Lafur, waeth pa mor ddeniadol yw hynny wrth baratoi ar gyfer etholiad cyffredinol, am yr hyn y mae awdurdodau'r heddlu yn penderfynu ei wneud a rheolaeth yr heddlu yn nhermau nifer gorsafoedd heddlu. Derbyniad y pwyt fod pobl yn awyddus i gael gorsafoedd heddlu yn eu hardaloedd ac yn hoffi cael adeilad yn lleol a rhywun y gallant ymweld â hwy, a gweld yr heddlu fel rhan o'r gymuned.

Mater i'r Swyddfa Gartref yw hyn, er mae'n debyg y gwneir sylwadau pellach yn y man ynglŷn â'r posiblwydd y gallai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddod yn gyfrifol am yr heddlu.

**C4 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu cyflwyno unrhyw gynlluniau adfywio cymunedol ar gyfer y cymunedau hynny yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau? (OAQ10869)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn ystyried atebion tymor hir ac yn targedu arian i adfywio'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig wedi cynnull grŵp gorchwyl a

Partnership, which includes representatives from local authorities, the tourism and farming industries and other rural businesses. Its brief is to assess the implications of the outbreak and prepare a plan to relaunch the rural economy when the disease abates, including dealing with rural stress. I await recommendations from that group.

**Nick Bourne:** I am sure that the Minister recognises—she would have been told, for example, by the Minister for e-commerce who attended a meeting of the Powys Rural Business Trust this week in Llandrindod Wells—that many businesses built up over many years, many of them tied up with family homes, are facing ruin. They need financial assistance over and above what has been announced to avoid going to the wall. That is true in Powys and I suspect that it is true throughout all of rural Wales. What will you do to help them?

**Edwina Hart:** The Government has taken the initiative in many ways in Wales to help as much as it can. In terms of business, what happens to individuals is a tragedy at every level. I think that you will agree, Nick, that we have to consider the reality of what will happen with these businesses and focus on how we can help them to get back on their feet when the crisis is over. The administration is considering all aspects of that.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you agree that throughout Wales communities have been ravaged by the last 20 and 25 years—  
[CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Come on.’]

What is your point?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Can we have a question please?

**Brian Gibbons:** These communities must not be sacrificed again to deal with some short-term problems.

**Edwina Hart:** Much deprivation has been caused to communities across Wales, none of

gorffen o Bartneriaeth Wledig Cymru, sydd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o awdurdodau lleol, y diwydiannau twristiaeth a ffermio a busnesau gwledig eraill. Ei gylch gorchwyl yw asesu goblygiadau'r argyfwng a pharatoi cynllun i ail-lansio'r economi wledig pan fydd y clwyf yn cilio, gan gynnwys ymdopi â straen gwledig. Yr wyf yn aros i dderbyn argymhellion gan y grŵp hwnnw.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod—byddai wedi cael gwybod, er enghraift, gan y Gweinidog dros e-fasnach a fynychodd gyfarfod Ymddiriedolaeth Busnes Gwledig Powys yr wythnos hon yn Llandrindod—bod nifer o fusnesau a ddatblygwyd dros flynyddoedd lawer, nifer ohonynt yn gysylltiedig â chartrefi teuluoedd, yn wynebu'r posiblwrwydd y byddant yn mynd i'r gwellt. Mae angen cymorth ariannol arnynt y tu hwnt i'r hyn a gyhoeddwyd er mwyn osgoi mynd i'r wal. Mae hynny'n wir ym Mhowys a thybiaf fod hynny'n wir ym mhob rhan o Gymru wledig. Beth a wnewch i'w helpu?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn flaengar mewn sawl ffordd yng Nghymru i helpu cymaint ag y gallai. Yn nhermau busnes, mae'r hyn sydd yn digwydd i unigolion yn drychinebus ar bob lefel. Credaf y cytunwch, Nick, bod yn rhaid inni ystyried realiti'r hyn fydd yn digwydd gyda'r busnesau hyn a chanolbwytio ar sut y gallwn eu helpu i adsefydlu ar ôl i'r argyfwng gilio. Mae'r weinyddiaeth yn ystyried yr holl agweddau sydd yn gysylltiedig â hynny.

**Brian Gibbons:** A gytunwch fod cymunedau ledled Cymru wedi eu dinistrio gan yr 20 a'r 25 mlynedd ddiwethaf—[AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: ‘Dewch, dewch.’]

Beth yw eich pwynt?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A allwn ni gael cwestiwn os gwelwch yn dda?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni ddylid aberthu'r cymunedau hyn eto er mwyn delio â phroblemau tymor byr.

**Edwina Hart:** Achoswyd llawer o amddifadedd i gymunedau ledled Cymru, ac

which has been their fault. It is rather like what is happening to rural businesses and agriculture at present. It is not their fault either as these circumstances are outside their control. As a representative of the administration answering questions today, I think that it is essential that we recognise that we have to deal with these matters on an issue by issue basis to see what assistance we can give.

When we learn the outcome of the Corus negotiations, we will also have to consider what assistance we can give to damaged communities, such as Ebbw Vale and Llanwern, and perhaps elsewhere, for example, Shotton, which may be damaged if announcements are made on job losses there in the future.

**Elin Jones:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol fod y Comisiynydd Ewropeaidd, David Byrne, wedi cadarnhau ddoe y byddai pecyn o gymorth i'r economi wledig yn dilyn clwy'r traed a'r genau, ac y byddai hynny o fewn rheolau cystadlu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? Os felly, a yw'r Gweinidog yn barod i gadarnhau y bydd y Cabinet yn pwysio am pecyn o gymorth o'r Trysorlys i'n cymunedau gwledig ar frys?

**Edwina Hart:** I await confirmation of any details via the Minister for Rural Affairs and we will take into account officials' advice on what we can do to help rural areas in these difficult times.

nid oes bai ar yr un ohonynt am hynny. Mae'n debyg i'r hyn sydd yn digwydd i fusnesau gwledig ac amaethyddiaeth ar hyn o bryd. Nid eu bai hwy yw hynny ychwaith am fod yr amgylchiadau hyn y tu hwnt i'w rheolaeth. Fel cynrychiolydd y weinyddiaeth sydd yn ateb cwestiynau heddiw, credaf ei bod yn holl bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn fesul un i weld pa gymorth y gellir ei roi.

Pan gawn wybod beth fydd canlyniad negodiadau Corus, bydd yn rhaid inni hefyd ystyried pa gymorth y gellir ei roi i gymunedau a ddifrodwyd, fel Glynebw y a Llanwern, ac mewn mannau eraill efallai, er enghraift, Shotton, a allai ddioddef os gwneir cyhoeddiadau am golli swyddi yno yn y dyfodol.

**Elin Jones:** Is the Minister aware that the European Commissioner, David Byrne, yesterday confirmed that there would be a package of assistance for the rural economy following the foot and mouth disease outbreak, and that that would be within the European Union's competition rules? If so, is the Minister willing to confirm that the Cabinet will urgently press for the Treasury to provide a package of assistance to our rural communities?

**Edwina Hart:** Arhosaf am gadarnhad am unrhyw fanylion drwy'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a byddwn yn ystyried cyngor y swyddogion ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i helpu ardaloedd gwledig yn ystod yr amseroedd anodd hyn.

### **Papur Gwyn Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 ar gyfer Cymru Local Government Act 2000 White Paper for Wales**

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** Will the Local Government Act 2000 White Paper for Wales incorporate the principles governing conduct of members of relevant authorities? (OAQ10834)

**Edwina Hart:** An Order containing general principles of conduct for members and co-opted members of relevant authorities was issued for consultation last year. A revised version was issued in February. It will form part of the new ethical framework for local government, which I intend to bring to this

**C5 Janet Ryder:** A fydd Papur Gwyn ar gyfer Cymru Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 yn ymgorffori'r egwyddorion sydd yn rheoli ymddygiad aelodau o awdurdodau perthnasol? (OAQ10834)

**Edwina Hart:** Cyhoeddwyd Gorchymyn yn cynnwys egwyddorion ymddygiad cyffredinol ar gyfer aelodau ac aelodau cyfetholedig o awdurdodau perthnasol ar gyfer ymgynghoriad y llynedd. Cyhoeddwyd fersiwn diwygiedig ym mis Chwefror. Bydd yn llunio rhan o'r fframwaith moesegol

Assembly for approval in June.

newydd ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, y bwriadaf ei gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad hwn i'w gymeradwyo ym mis Mehefin.

**Janet Ryder:** We have discussed the need for allegations against councillors to be dealt with by external bodies so that the public can be assured that they are dealt with fairly. You have touched on the district audit report for one council this morning. Do you agree that where such a report contains serious allegations, it too should be dealt with by an external body so that the public can be reassured that the points raised in the report are being dealt with?

**Janet Ryder:** Yr ydym wedi trafod yr angen i gyrrff allanol ymdrin â honiadau yn erbyn cynghorwyr fel y gellir sicrhau'r cyhoedd eu bod yn cael eu trin yn deg. Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at adroddiad yr archwiliad dosbarth ar gyfer un cyngor y bore yma. A gytunwch, lle bo adroddiad o'r fath yn cynnwys honiadau difrifol, y dylai corff allanol ymdrin â hyn fel y gellir sicrhau'r cyhoedd yr ymdrinnir â'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn yr adroddiad?

**Edwina Hart:** The public has the necessary reassurance on those issues through the ballot box. However, as you have raised the matter I will give it consideration.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r cyhoedd yn cael y sicrwydd sydd ei angen ar y materion hynny drwy'r blwch pleidleisio. Fodd bynnag, gan eich bod wedi codi'r mater byddaf yn rhoi ystyriaeth iddo.

**William Graham:** We welcome these regulations, not in total but in spirit, as discussed in Committee. How do you propose to enact the sanctions that may be involved?

**William Graham:** Croesawn y rheoliadau hyn, nid yn gyfan gwbl ond mewn ysbryd, fel y trafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor. Sut y bwriadwch gyflwyno'r cosbau a allai fod yn gysylltedig â hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** I know that you have particular concerns regarding the ethical framework, which you have raised in Committee. It is essential that we try to progress by ensuring the agreement of Welsh Local Government Association to the scheme that is being implemented. We also have to provide the public with the necessary security blanket and ensure that if things go wrong, measures will be implemented under this ethical framework. We will have to consider carefully what sanctions could be imposed if matters do not pan out as we envisage.

**Edwina Hart:** Gwn fod gennych bryderon penodol ynghylch y fframwaith moesegol, a godwyd gennych yn y Pwyllgor. Mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn ceisio sicrhau cynnydd drwy sicrhau bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn cytuno i'r cynllun a weithredir. Yr ydym hefyd wedi rhoi'r sicrwydd angenreidiol i'r cyhoedd a sicrhau y gweithredir mesurau o dan y fframwaith moesegol hwn os aiff pethau o'u lle. Bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried yn ofalus pa gosbau y gellid eu cyflwyno os na fydd pethau'n datblygu yn ôl y disgwyl.

### **Cyllid Cyfalaf Awdurdodau Lleol Capital Finance of Local Authorities**

**Q6 Janice Gregory:** Will the Minister make a statement on the progress for simplifying the arrangements for controlling the capital finance of local authorities? (OAQ10814)

**C6 Janice Gregory:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cynnydd i symleiddio'r trefniadau ar gyfer rheoli cyllid cyfalaf awdurdodau lleol? (OAQ10814)

**Edwina Hart:** A White Paper on reforming local government finance systems, including capital finance, is expected to be published during the summer. It will provide the

**Edwina Hart:** Disgwylir y cyhoeddir Papur Gwyn ar ddiwygio systemau cyllid llywodraeth leol, yn cynnwys cyllid cyfalaf yn ystod yr haf. Bydd yn rhoi cyfle i

opportunity for primary legislation, where and as required, to enable change to the local government finance system in Wales, such as moving to a prudential borrowing system. My officials are keeping in touch with the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions about the draughting. A joint working group has been established with the WLGA to examine the detailed proposals and identify any changes to secondary legislation that the Assembly may make independently of the review and in advance of the new system that is unlikely to be in place before April 2004.

**Janice Gregory:** Thank you for that comprehensive answer. Taking it further, do you anticipate that simplification would have an influence on the option of stock transfer of council housing?

**Edwina Hart:** The issues surrounding that are primarily ones for Treasury to consider. It is an avenue that will need to be explored. It might be helpful to Members if I were to provide the Local Government and Housing Committee with some details of what might be envisaged.

**David Lloyd:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylid meddwl eto am drefniadau'r fenter cyllid preifat?

**Edwina Hart:** As you know, I am currently consulting on PFI and the nature of public and private partnership. It is essential that the Local Government and Housing Committee and the Health and Social Services Committee have an opportunity to consider my consultation documents. As I indicated, there must be further discussion. There are aspects of PFI that concern people, particularly the involvement of staff in any transfer. We all share the concerns about that aspect of PFI. However, I do not intend to abandon the opportunity of trying to ensure some capital projects in Wales. It is strange that you have chosen to raise this issue as some Plaid Cymru controlled local authorities have been actively involved in PFI projects.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you continue the precedent you set last year by ring-fencing

ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, pryd a lle y bo angen, ysgogi newid i systemau cyllid llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, fel symud tuag at system fenthyca ddarbolus. Mae fy swyddogion yn cadw mewn cysylltiad ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau ynglŷn â'r drafftio. Sefydlwyd gweithgor ar y cyd â CLILC i archwilio'r cynigion manwl a nodi unrhyw newidiadau i ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd y gall y Cynulliad ei gwneud yn annibynnol i'r adolygiad a chyn y system newydd sydd yn annhebygol o gael ei chyflwyno cyn mis Ebrill 2004.

**Janice Gregory:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb cynhwysfawr hwnnw. Gan fynd â'r mater ymhellach, a gredwch y byddai symleiddio'n dylanwadu ar yr opsiwn o drosglwyddo stoc tai cyngor?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r materion sydd yn gysylltiedig â hynny'n faterion i'r Trysorlys eu hystyried. Mae'n llwybr y bydd angen ei archwilio. Gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol i'r Aelodau pe bawn yn darparu manylion am yr hyn a ragwelir i'r Pwyllor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai.

**David Lloyd:** Do you agree that we should rethink the arrangements for the private finance initiative?

**Edwina Hart:** Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wrthi'n ymgynghori ar y fenter cyllid preifat a natur y bartneriaeth gyhoeddus a phreifat. Mae'n holl bwysig y caiff y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai a'r Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gyfle i ystyried fy nogfennau ymgynghorol. Fel y dywedais, rhaid cynnal trafodaeth bellach. Mae rhai agweddau ar y fenter cyllid preifat yn peri pryder i bobl, yn arbennig cyfranogiad staff mewn unrhyw drosglwyddiad. Yr ydym oll yn pryderu am yr agwedd honno ar y fenter cyllid preifat. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn bwriadu anwybyddu'r cyfle i geisio sicrhau rhywfaint o brosiectau cyfalaf yng Nghymru. Mae'n rhyfedd eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwn gan y bu rhai o'r awdurdodau lleol hynny a reolir gan Blaid Cymru yn weithgar iawn ar brosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi barhau â'r cysail a osodwyd gennych y llynedd drwy

funds for education so that the funding fog can be eliminated and Assembly Members be satisfied that all money going to education is spent in schools?

**Edwina Hart:** We are back to the issue of hypothecation. We will not have hypothecation. We have local democracy, we have all the necessary money going in to education and local authorities will be judged through the ballot box.

### **Codiadau yn y Dreth Gyngor yng Nghanol De Cymru Council Tax Increases in South Wales Central**

**Q7 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on the recent increases in the level of council tax in South Wales Central? (OAQ10905)

**Edwina Hart:** Council tax increases are a matter for the local authority. Cardiff has an increase of 9.3 per cent, Rhondda Cynon Taff one of 4.8 per cent, and the Vale of Glamorgan one of 9.1 per cent.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that Rhondda Cynon Taff needs more resources to respond to socio-economic needs but that it is invidious to make the council tax payers of Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan fund those schemes? The funding should come from central Government. That is a more direct method that does not penalise councils in notionally more affluent areas.

**Edwina Hart:** The local government settlement was warmly welcomed by the WLGA, on which all council leaders sit. It is an excellent settlement and a significant cash increase in support from the Assembly of about 8 per cent. I do not accept that we could have done more as an administration. We were more than generous this year in terms of the settlement.

9:25 a.m

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd Questions to the Minister for Environment**

#### **Tai Cynaliadwy (Rheoliadau Cynllunio) Sustainable Housing (Planning Regulations)**

**Q1 Janet Davies:** How will planning

neilltuo arian ar gyfer addysg er mwyn gallu diddymu'r niwl cyllido a bodloni Aelodau'r Cynulliad bod yr holl arian ar gyfer addysg yn cael ei wario mewn ysgolion?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym wedi dychwelyd i'r mater o bridiannu. Ni fydd pridiannu. Mae gennym ddemocratiaeth leol, mae'r holl arian sydd ei angen yn mynd tuag at addysg a bennir awdurdodau lleol drwy'r blwch pleidleisio.

### **Codiadau yn y Dreth Gyngor yng Nghanol De Cymru Council Tax Increases in South Wales Central**

**C7 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y codiadau diweddar yn lefel y dreth gyngor yng Nghanol De Cymru? (OAQ10905)

**Edwina Hart:** Mater i'r awdurdod lleol yw codiadau yn y dreth gyngor. Mae Caerdydd wedi cynyddu 9.3 y cant, Rhondda Cynon Taf 4.8 y cant a Bro Morgannwg 9.1 y cant.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch fod angen mwy o adnoddau ar Rhondda Cynon Taf i ymateb i anghenion cymdeithasol economaidd ond ei bod yn annheg gwneud i dalwyr treth gyngor Caerdydd a Bro Morgannwg ariannu'r cynlluniau hynny? Dylai'r arian ddod o'r Llywodraeth ganolog. Mae hynny'n ddull mwy uniongyrchol nad yw'n cosbi cynghorau mewn ardaloedd y tybir eu bod yn fwy ffyniannus.

**Edwina Hart:** Croesawyd y setliad llywodraeth leol yn frwd gan CLLC, y mae pob arweinydd cyngor yn rhan ohono. Mae'n setliad gwych ac yn gynnydd ariannol sylweddol gan y Cynulliad o tua 8 y cant. Ni dderbyniaf y gallem fod wedi gwneud mwy fel gweinyddiaeth. Yr oeddem yn hael iawn eleni yn nhermau'r setliad.

regulations support the development of sustainable housing? (OAQ10921)

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** My colleague, Edwina Hart, has responsibility for housing, but from a planning perspective, the land use planning system makes an important contribution to sustainable housing primarily through land use planning policy at national and local levels. At national level, 'Planning Guidance (Wales): Planning Policy, First Revision (April 1999)', reflects sustainable development principles. It stresses the need for sustainable communities by reference to the need to consider links between housing, employment locations and transport links, and the draft 'Planning Policy Wales', which was recently issued for consultation, develops this concept further. At a local level, local planning authorities take the lead through their unitary development plans.

**Janet Davies:** How many councils have asked you for planning dispensation to build lifetime or low-energy homes?

**Sue Essex:** No requests have come to me, but I will check with Assembly officials whether they have received any.

**Peter Black:** As you know, some councils are concerned about the threat posed by second homes to rural communities and the need to provide local homes for local people. Will you consider issuing clear guidance to local councils on what they can do under planning law to facilitate policies to protect those communities?

**Sue Essex:** The planning guidance offers help on that, particularly since revisions were made in terms of the Welsh language guidance, which is reflected in the consultation document. In addition to that, we are commissioning research that will cover many aspects of the problems raised by Dafydd Wigley in his short debate and consider housing across the board and how we can protect communities. I hope that when we receive the results of that research later this year, they will pick up many of the concerns that have been raised in this

cynllunio'n cynorthwyo datblygiad tai cynaliadwy? (OAQ10921)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Fy nghyd-Aelod, Edwina Hart, sydd yn gyfrifol am dai, ond o safbwyt cynllunio, mae'r system cynllunio defnydd tir yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig tuag at dai cynaliadwy, yn bennaf drwy bolisi cynllunio defnydd tir ar lefelau cenedlaethol a lleol. Ar lefel genedlaethol, mae 'Arweiniad Cynllunio (Cymru): Polisi Cynllunio, Diwygiad Cyntaf (Ebrill 1999)', yn adlewyrchu egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy. Pwysleisia'r angen am gymunedau cynaliadwy drwy gyfeirio at yr angen i ystyried cysylltiadau rhwng tai, lleoliadau cyflogaeth a chysylltiadau trafnidiaeth ac mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' drafft, a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar ar gyfer ymgynghoriad, yn datblygu'r cysyniad hwn ymhellach. Ar lefel leol, mae awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yn arwain y gwaith hwn drwy eu cynlluniau datblygu unedol.

**Janet Davies:** Faint o gynghorau sydd wedi gofyn ichi am ddosbarthiad cynllunio i adeiladu cartrefi am oes neu gartrefi ynni isel?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf wedi derbyn unrhyw geisiadau, ond gofynnaf i swyddogion y cynulliad pa'un a ydynt wedi derbyn rhai.

**Peter Black:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae rhai cynghorau'n poeni am fygythiad ail gartrefi i gymunedau gwledig a'r angen i ddarparu cartrefi lleol i bobl leol. A ystyriwch gyhoeddi arweiniad clir i gynghorau lleol ar yr hyn y gallant ei wneud o dan y gyfraith gynllunio i hwyluso polisiau i ddiogelu'r cymunedau hynny?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r arweiniad cynllunio'n cynnig help ar hynny, yn arbennig ers i'r diwygiadau gael eu gwneud yn nhermau arweiniad ar yr iaith Gymraeg, a adlewyrchir yn y ddogfen ymgynghorol. Yn ychwanegol at hynny, yr ydym yn comisiynu ymchwil a fydd yn cwmpasu sawl agwedd ar y problemau a godwyd gan Dafydd Wigley yn ei ddadl fer ac yn ystyried y sefyllfa dai yn gyffredinol a sut y gallwn ddiogelu cymunedau. Fy ngobaith yw, pan dderbyniwn ganlyniadau'r ymchwil honno yn ddiweddarach eleni, y byddant yn trafod nifer

Chamber and beyond. We will then have a clearer view of what we need to do and how we can respond to Members' concerns.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that one of the best ways to develop sustainable housing is to use brownfield sites? Will you join me in congratulating the Vale of Glamorgan County Council for its excellent record in this area?

**Sue Essex:** If you consider planning guidance, which we have strengthened by introducing the sequential test, there is strong encouragement for local authorities to identify and develop brownfield sites. I support and welcome any local authority taking that approach. You will know, from previous discussions here, that much brownfield land needs to be treated before it can be used.

### **Strategaeth Wastraff Ddrafft Cymru Draft Waste Strategy for Wales**

**Q2 Pauline Jarman:** Can the Minister comment on the targets set in the draft waste strategy for Wales? (OAQ10912)

**Sue Essex:** I shall consult on proposals for a new waste strategy for Wales in May, which is when I hope to publish them. The consultation will contain options for much higher levels of recycling and composting. The Assembly will consider the final strategy before it is adopted. However, before finalisation of the strategy, local authorities will be asked, through policy agreements, to achieve combined recycling and composting levels of 15 per cent by 2003-04.

**Pauline Jarman:** Will you give a categorical statement that you are not in favour of further development of incineration?

**Sue Essex:** I cannot prejudice the consultation on the waste strategy, but I do not foresee a move from the traditional use of landfill to a dependence on incineration because the clear priority in terms of waste is waste minimisation. However, where there is waste, the emphasis must be on recycling and

o'r pryderon a godwyd yn y Siambra hon a thu hwnt. Yna bydd gennym ddarlun cliriach o'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud a sut y gallwn ymateb i bryderon yr Aelodau.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch mai un o'r ffyrdd gorau o ddatblygu tai cynaliadwy yw defnyddio safleoedd tir llwyd? A ymunwch â mi a llongyfarch Cyngor Sir Bro Morgannwg am ei waith gwych yn y maes hwn?

**Sue Essex:** Pe byddech yn ystyried arweiniad cynllunio, a atgyfnerthwyd gennym drwy gyflwyno'r prawf dilyniannol, ceir anogaeth gref i awdurdodau lleol nodi a datblygu safleoedd tir llwyd. Cefnogaf a chroesawaf unrhyw awdurdod lleol sydd yn mabwysiadu'r ymagwedd honno. Gwyddoch, o ganlyniad i drafodaethau blaenorol yma, fod angen trin llawer o dir llwyd cyn y gellir ei ddefnyddio.

**C2 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog sylw ar y targedau a bennir yn strategaeth wastraff ddrafft Cymru? (OAQ10912)

**Sue Essex:** Byddaf yn ymgynghori ar gynigion ar gyfer strategaeth wastraff newydd Cymru ym mis Mai, a dyna pryd y gobeithiaf eu cyhoeddi. Bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn cynnwys opsiynau ar gyfer lefelau llawer uwch o ailgylchu a gwneud gwrtraith. Bydd y Cynulliad yn ystyried y strategaeth derfynol cyn ei mabwysiadu. Fodd bynnag, cyn penderfynu ar ffurf derfynol y strategaeth, gofynnir i awdurdodau lleol, drwy gytundebau polisi, i gyflawni lefelau ailgylchu a gwneud gwrtraith cyfun o 15 y cant erbyn 2003-04.

**Pauline Jarman:** A wnewch chi ddatganiad pendant nad ydych o blaid unrhyw waith pellach i ddatblygu cyfleusterau llosgi?

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf ddylanwadu ar yr ymgynghoriad ar y strategaeth wastraff, ond ni ragwelaf symud o'r defnydd traddodiadol o safleoedd claddu sbwriel i losgi oherwydd y flaenoriaeth amlwg yn nhermau gwastraff yw sicrhau'r isafswm o wastraff. Fodd bynnag, lle y ceir gwastraff, rhaid i'r

composting it. That is my initial feeling, although I cannot prejudice what the strategy will state after consultation.

**Mick Bates:** What action are you considering to alleviate concerns over dioxin levels in waste-to-energy plants such as those suggested for Wrexham and Neath Port Talbot?

**Sue Essex:** The Environment Agency advises us on any such major developments, so I depend on its expertise in assessing and monitoring those developments.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that it would be a good idea to start giving a larger proportion of the landfill tax back to local authorities so that they can spend it on recycling? Do you condemn the current policy of giving the majority of it back to the Treasury so that Gordon Brown can stash it away and hand it out just before a general election?

**Sue Essex:** I had not noticed Gordon Brown doing that. If you recall, I have said on many occasions, and in meetings with Michael Meacher MP—and I will meet him next week to emphasise it again—that having an element of environmental taxation that could be hypothecated to make direct links with improvements would be a welcome initiative. That is particularly true of the landfill tax, because, as we have said many times in this Chamber, we must make a rapid and dramatic move away from using landfills. Europe requires that. I cannot say any more than that. I have said this publicly, in Committee and to the Ministers involved.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Christine Gwyther to ask question 5. Sorry, that should be Nick Bourne to ask question 3.

#### **Ceisiadau Cynllunio (Effaith ar yr Amgylchedd) Planning Applications (Environmental Impact)**

**Q3 Nick Bourne:** Can the Minister outline the consideration given to the possible environmental impact of planning applications? (OAQ10875)

pwyslais fod ar ei ailgylchu a'i wneud yn wrtaith. Dyna yw fy nheimlad cychwynnol i er na allaf ddylanwadu ar yr hyn a ddywed y strategaeth yn dilyn yr ymgynghoriad.

**Mick Bates:** Pa gamau ydych chi'n eu hystyried er mwyn lleddfu pryderon ynglŷn â lefelau diocsin mewn gweithfeydd gwastraff-i-ynni fel y rhai a awgrymwyd ar gyfer Wrecsam a Chastell Nedd Port Talbot?

**Sue Essex:** Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn ein cynggori ar ddatblygiadau mawr o'r fath, felly dibynnaf ar ei harbenigedd wrth asesu a monitro'r datblygiadau hynny.

**David Davies:** A gytunwch y byddai'n syniad da dechrau rhoi cyfran uwch o'r dreth tirlenwi yn ôl i awdurdodau lleol fel y gallant ei wario ar ailgylchu? A feirniadwch y polisi presennol o roi'r mwyafrif ohono yn ôl i'r Trysorlys fel y gall Gordon Brown ei guddio ac yna ei rannu yn union cyn etholiad cyffredinol?

**Sue Essex:** Nid oeddwn wedi sylwi bod Gordon Brown yn gwneud hynny. Os cofiwch, dywedais ar sawl achlysur, ac mewn cyfarfodydd gyda Michael Meacher AS—a byddaf yn cwrdd ag ef yr wythnos nesaf i bwysleisio hynny eto—y byddai cael elfen o drethiant amgylcheddol y gellid ei phridiannu er mwyn sicrhau cysylltiadau uniongyrchol â gwelliannau yn fenter i'w chroesawu. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir am y dreth tirlenwi, oherwydd, fel y dywedasom droeon yn y Siambr hon, rhaid inni roi'r gorau i ddefnyddio safleoedd tirlenwi yn gyflym a dramatig. Mae Ewrop yn mynnu hynny. Ni allaf ddweud mwy na hynny. Yr wyf wedi dweud hyn yn gyhoeddus, yn y Pwyllgor ac wrth y Gweinidogion dan sylw.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Christine Gwyther i ofyn cwestiwn 5. Mae'n ddrwg gennyd, galwaf ar Nick Bourne i ofyn cwestiwn 3.

**Sue Essex:** Local planning authorities have a duty to consider the environmental implications of all applications. They must take the views of bodies with environmental responsibilities and the views of the public into account before reaching a decision. Certain projects that are likely to have significant environmental effects must be subject to statutory environmental impact assessments. That process involves a more systematic method of assessing environmental information. In the small percentage of applications that come before the Assembly on appeal, or are called in, the Assembly becomes the competent authority and is required to look afresh at the issues involved.

**Nick Bourne:** In relation to mobile phone masts, what planning considerations are being proposed in planning guidance? In particular, are we able to encourage the sharing of mobile phone masts through the planning guidance?

**Sue Essex:** That is an area of concern, and I receive a great deal of correspondence from Members and from the public on it. Within the next few days—it is a complicated issue—I hope to announce my suggested approach to the regulations and planning guidance.

**Alun Pugh:** Onshore windfarms offer environmental benefits, but many people find them visually unacceptable. You will be aware of Betws-yn-Rhos Community Council's opposition to a planning application in my constituency. Will you ensure that offshore windfarms suggested for off the north Wales coast do not conflict with any proposed sites for tidal power stations?

**Sue Essex:** Most people will be aware of today's announcement and it is a Crown licence decision. It does not mean that those developments will go ahead, although, as you say, we want to see offshore wind development in principle. Hopefully, that can avoid many of the disagreements involved with windfarms on land. The proposed developments will have to go through a planning regime and will be subject to

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n ddyletswydd ar awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i ystyried goblygiadau amgylcheddol pob cais. Rhaid iddynt ystyried safbwytiau cyrff sydd â chyfrifoldebau amgylcheddol a safbwytiau'r cyhoedd cyn gwneud penderfyniad. Rhaid i brosiectau penodol sydd yn debygol o gael effeithiau amgylcheddol sylweddol fod yn destun asesiadau effaith amgylcheddol statudol. Mae'r broses honno'n cynnwys dull mwy systematig o asesu gwybodaeth amgylcheddol. Yn y ganran fechan o geisiadau a ddaw gerbron y Cynulliad ar apêl, neu a elwir i mewn, gweithreda'r Cynulliad fel yr awdurdod cymwys ac mae'n ofynnol iddo edrych o'r newydd ar y materion dan sylw.

**Nick Bourne:** Mewn cysylltiad â mastiau ffonau symudol, pa ystyriaethau cynllunio a gynigir yn yr arweiniad cynllunio? Yn arbennig, a allwn annog rhannu mastiau ffonau symudol drwy'r arweiniad cynllunio?

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n fater sydd yn peri pryder, ac yr wyf yn derbyn swm sylweddol o ohebiaeth gan yr Aelodau a chan y cyhoedd ar y mater. O fewn yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf—mae'n fater cymhleth—gobeithiaf y gallaf gyhoeddi fy ymagwedd awgrymedig i'r rheoliadau a'r arweiniad cynllunio.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae ffermydd gwynt alltraeth yn cynnig manteision amgylcheddol, ond maent yn annerbyniol yn weledol i nifer o bobl. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o wrthwynebiad Cyngor Cymuned Betws-yn-Rhos i gais cynllunio yn fy etholiad. A wnewch chi sicrhau na fydd ffermydd gwynt alltraeth a awgrymir ar gyfer ardal oddi ar arfordir gogledd Cymru yn gwrthdaro ag unrhyw safleoedd arfaethedig ar gyfer gorsafoedd pŵer llanw?

**Sue Essex:** Bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ymwybodol o'r cyhoeddiad heddiw a phenderfyniad trwydded y Goron ydyw. Nid yw'n golygu y bydd y datblygiadau hynny'n cael eu rhoi ar waith, er, fel y dywedwch, yr ydym am weld datblygiadau gwynt alltraeth mewn egwyddor. Y gobaith yw y gallwn osgoi nifer o'r anghytundebau sydd yn ymwneud â ffermydd gwynt ar y tir. Bydd yn rhaid i'r datblygiadau arfaethedig fynd drwy

regulations. The most important aspect of your question is the issue of ensuring that we have an overall, comprehensive and compatible policy towards renewable energy, which brings forward locational opportunities for all types of renewable energy and ensures that those developments are compatible with each other and with locational and environmental considerations. To this end, we are organising the ongoing work on the technical advice note on renewable energy and a seminar, to be held in May, where all aspects of the renewable energy industry can find a way forward together.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Following on from that, what steps will you take to ensure that the planning system does not unduly block these potential offshore wind developments, which have been announced today by Peter Hain MP, in the way that—sadly—some onshore windfarm developments have been blocked by the current planning system?

**Sue Essex:** It is unfair to say that they have been blocked. Some have been approved and some have not. As Alun indicated in his first comment about the situation in his constituency, there are strong views held on both sides. The planning system's way of dealing with that is to look at all the arguments and hopefully arrive at a balanced judgement. From that process some people have been given permission, and some have not.

9:35 a.m.

As regards the proposed offshore developments, they will probably have to undergo environmental impact assessments, which I mentioned in my earlier answer to Nick. They will have to go through a regime of consideration. Given that the development of offshore schemes will come forward quickly, Peter Hain and I will consult with people in Wales on how they want the planning system to deal with them.

#### **Strategaeth Wastraff Ddrafft Cymru (Targedau Ailgylchu) Draft Waste Strategy For Wales (Recycling Targets)**

**Q4 Pauline Jarman:** Can the Minister make

gyfundrefn gynllunio a bod yn amodol ar reoliadau. Agwedd bwysicaf eich cwestiwn yw'r mater o sicrhau bod gennym bolisi cyffredinol, cynhwysfawr a chyson tuag at ynni adnewyddadwy, sydd yn cyflwyno cyfleoedd lleoliadol ar gyfer pob math o ynni adnewyddadwy ac sydd yn sicrhau bod y datblygiadau hynny'n gydnaws â'i gilydd a chydag ystyriaethau lleoliadol ac amgylcheddol eraill. I'r perwyl hwn, yr ydym yn trefnu'r gwaith parhaus ar y nodyn cyngor technegol ar ynni adnewyddadwy a seminar, i'w chynnal ym mis Mai, lle gall pob agwedd ar y diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy ganfod ffordd ymlaen gyda'i gilydd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn dilyn ymlaen o hynny, pa gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau nad yw'r system gynllunio'n rhwystro'r datblygiadau gwynt alltraeth arfaethedig hynny, a gyhoeddwyd heddiw gan Peter Hain AS, yn ddiangen yn yr un modd—yn anffodus—ag y caiff rhai datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt alltraeth eu hatal gan y system gynllunio bresennol?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n annheg dweud y cawsant eu hatal. Cymeradwywyd rhai ohonynt a gwrthodwyd rhai eraill. Fel y dywedodd Alun yn ei sylw cyntaf ar y sefyllfa yn ei etholaeth, mae gan y naill ochr a'r llall safbwytiau pendant. Mae'r system gynllunio'n delio â hynny drwy edrych ar yr holl ddadleuon a'r gobaith yw sicrhau barn gytbwys. O'r broses honno, mae rhai pobl wedi derbyn caniatâd ond nid yw eraill.

O ran y datblygiadau alltraeth arfaethedig, mae'n debyg y bydd yn rhaid iddynt fod yn destun asesiadau effaith amgylcheddol, y soniais amdanynt yn fy ateb cynharach i Nick. Bydd yn rhaid iddynt gael eu hystyried. O ystyried y daw'r gwaith o ddatblygu cynlluniau alltraeth i rym yn fuan, bydd Peter Hain a minnau'n ymgynghori â phobl Cymru i weld sut y maent yn dymuno i'r system gynllunio ddelio â hwy.

**C4 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog

a statement on the recycling targets set in the draft waste strategy for Wales? (OAQ10913)

ddatganiad ynghylch y targedau ailgylchu a bennir yn strategaeth wastraff ddrafft Cymru? (OAQ10913)

**Sue Essex:** I covered that in my earlier answer. It is still not finalised because the strategy has not been produced. It should be ready in May, when it will go out for consultation.

**Pauline Jarman:** You said in your answer to the earlier question that there was a need for a dramatic move away from using landfill to recycling to meet the European directive. Will you tell the Assembly how much money has been reserved in the budget to deliver a waste strategy for Wales in the current year to support the zero option of a target of 100 per cent recycling?

**Sue Essex:** Sonais am hynny yn fy ateb cynharach. Nid yw ar ei ffurf derfynol eto am nad yw'r strategaeth wedi'i chynhyrchu. Dylai fod yn barod ym mis Mai, pan gaiff ei chyflwyno ar gyfer ymgynghoriad.

**Pauline Jarman:** Dywedasoch yn eich ateb i'r cwestiwn cynharach bod angen rhoi'r gorau i ddefnyddio safleoedd tirlenwi ar fylder ac ailgylchu er mwyn bodloni'r gyfarwyddeb Ewropeidd. A ddywedwch wrth y Cynulliad faint o arian a neilltuwyd yn y gyllideb i gyflwyno strategaeth wastraff i Gymru yn ystod y flwyddyn gyfredol i gefnogi'r opsiwn sero sef targed o 100 y cant ar gyfer ailgylchu?

**Sue Essex:** There was a three-year programme in the budget, which Edwina highlighted and I subsequently went through. In the first year—I am not wonderful on figures, Pauline—there was something like £3 million, increasing to £15 million and then £22 million. I will ensure that you have the accurate figures. The aim of the first year is primarily to support local authorities and others on pilot projects because like us, local authorities must also produce a strategy. There are schemes coming forward. However, from our discussions with local authorities, we know that they will need at least a year to formalise their own strategies, in consultation with their communities, and to develop pilot projects. The extra money will come in the next two years, particularly to support local government throughout Wales, as individual authorities or groups of authorities, to make the move from landfill to recycling and composting.

**Sue Essex:** Yr oedd rhaglen tair blynedd yn y gyllideb, a amlygwyd gan Edwina ac a esboniais innau wedyn. Yn ystod y flwyddyn gyntaf—nid wyl yn wych gyda ffigurau, Pauline—yr oedd tua £3 miliwn, yn cynyddu i £15 miliwn ac yna i £22 miliwn. Byddaf yn sicrhau y cewch y ffigurau cywir. Nod y flwyddyn gyntaf yn bennaf yw cefnogi awdurdodau lleol ac eraill ar brosiectau peilot oherwydd rhaid i awdurdodau lleol hefyd, fel ninnau, gynhyrchu strategaeth. Mae cynlluniau'n cael eu cyflwyno. Fodd bynnag, yn dilyn trafodaethau gydag awdurdodau lleol, gwyddom y bydd angen blwyddyn o leiaf arnynt i ffurfioli eu strategaethau eu hunain, drwy ymgynghori â'u cymunedau, ac i ddatblygu prosiectau peilot. Cyflwynir yr arian ychwanegol yn ystod y ddwy flynedd nesaf, yn arbennig i gefnogi llywodraeth leol ledled Cymru, fel awdurdodau unigol neu grwpiau o awdurdodau, i roi'r gorau i ddefnyddio safleoedd tirlenwi a dechrau ailgylchu a gwneud gwrtraith.

**Alun Cairns:** In response to the previous question on landfill, the Minister clearly supported my colleague, David Davies, when he said that landfill tax should be hypothecated towards recycling. What action is the Minister taking on this? Will she condemn the Westminster Government for not following through any action that she called for, or is this yet another example of the Westminster Government ignoring the

**Alun Cairns:** Mewn ymateb i'r cwestiwn blaenorol ar dirlenwi, cefnogodd y Gweinidog fy nghyd-Aelod, David Davies, pan ddywedodd y dylid pridiannu'r dreth tirlenwi tuag at ailgylchu. Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd ar hynny? A wnaiff feirniadu Llywodraeth San Steffan am beidio â gweithredu'r camau y gofynnodd amdanyst, neu ai engraifft arall yw hyn o Lywodraeth San Steffan yn anwybyddu

Assembly's wishes?

**Sue Essex:** Many people make representation to the Chancellor of the Exchequer, Gordon Brown. I, like many of my colleagues, will continue to repeat that once a waste strategy is in place, and substantial proposals are made, I will be able to give chapter and verse on where this money could be directed. That will put me, and my colleagues, in a much stronger position because then we could say where any hypothecated money could be used. Returning to Pauline's point, we need financial support to help local authorities make that change.

**The Presiding Officer:** I now call Christine Gwyther to ask question 5.

**Christine Gwyther:** Thank you for that build-up, Llywydd. [Laughter.]

#### **Bysiau Llawr-Isel (Sir Gaerfyrddin) Low-Floor Buses (Carmarthenshire)**

**Q5 Christine Gwyther:** Can the Minister make a statement on the introduction of low-floor buses for use by disabled people in Carmarthenshire? (OAQ10852)

**Sue Essex:** Christine, you do not need any build-up.

We have accessibility regulations covering new buses and coaches that were introduced under the Disability Discrimination Act 1995. It is important to remember that new buses will need to meet those requirements. Regulations will be introduced so that all buses and coaches will comply by no later than 2020. The transport grant that I announced a few months ago is available to local authorities to fund integrated packages that address accessibility. That is a specific incentive for local authorities. Several transport-grant-supported packages include measures such as bus-stop infrastructure, which complement the operation of low-floor buses. Our local transport services grant scheme will promote accessibility. The combined budget next year of £6.3 million for bus subsidies and community transport is an increase of 20 per cent on this year. There is money as well as legislation.

dymuniadau'r Cynulliad?

**Sue Essex:** Mae llawer o bobl yn cyflwyno sylwadau i Ganghellor y Trysorlys, Gordon Brown. Byddaf fi, llawer o'm cyd-Aelodau, yn parhau i ailadrodd hynny ar ôl i strategaeth wastraff gael ei sefydlu, ac ar ôl i gynigion sylweddol gael eu gwneud, gallaf fanylu ar lle y gellid cyfeirio'r arian hwnnw. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau fy mod i, a'm cyd-Aelodau, mewn sefyllfa lawer cryfach oherwydd gallem ddweud bryd hynny lle y gellid defnyddio unrhyw arian a bridianwyd. Gan ddychwelyd at bwynt Pauline, mae angen cymorth ariannol arnom i helpu awdurdodau lleol i wneud y newid hwnnw.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf yn awr ar Christine Gwyther i ofyn cwestiwn 5.

**Christine Gwyther:** Diolch ichi am y rhagarweiniad, Lywydd. [Chwerthin.]

**C5 Christine Gwyther:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad yngylch cyflwyno bysiau llawr isel i'w defnyddio gan bobl anabl yn Sir Gaerfyrddin? (OAQ10852)

**Sue Essex:** Nid oes angen unrhyw ragarweiniad arnoch, Christine.

Mae gennym reoliadau mynediad sydd yn cwmpasu bysiau newydd a gyflwynwyd o dan Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995. Mae'n bwysig cadw mewn cof y bydd angen i'r bysiau newydd hynny fodloni'r gofynion hynny. Cyflwynir rheoliadau er mwyn sicrhau y bydd pob bws yn cydymffurfio erbyn 2020 y fan bellaf. Mae'r grant trafnidiaeth a gyhoeddais ychydig fisoeedd yn ôl ar gael i awdurdodau lleol ariannu pecynnau integredig sydd yn ymdrin â mynediad. Mae honno'n fenter benodol ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Mae sawl pecyn â chymorth grant trafnidiaeth yn cynnwys mesurau fel isadeilledd arosfannau bysiau, sydd yn cyd-fynd â'r drefn o weithredu bysiau llawr isel. Bydd ein cynllun grant gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth lleol yn hyrwyddo mynediad. Mae cyllideb gyfunol y flwyddyn nesaf sef £6.3 miliwn ar gyfer cymorthdaliadau bysiau a thrafnidiaeth

gymunedol yn gynnydd o 20 y cant ar eleni. Mae arian ar gael yn ogystal â deddfwriaeth.

**Christine Gwyther:** I am pleased to know that local authorities will receive extra money if they need to provide higher kerbs, and that sort of hard infrastructure. Will you comment on the strong rumour—whether it is rural myth or fact—that companies have a policy of passing buses down the line towards the end of their useful life, so that they start as new in Cardiff and other towns, and are then passed progressively to less dense areas as the vehicles become older? This would make the introduction of new low-floor buses, which we all welcome, much later in rural Wales than in urban Wales, compounding the in-built inequality.

**Christine Gwyther:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn derbyn arian ychwanegol os bydd angen iddynt ddarparu palmantau uwch, a'r math hwnnw o isadeiledd caled. A wnewch chi ymateb i'r sibrydion amlwg—p'un a yw'n fyth gwledig neu'n ffaith—fod gan gwmniau bolisi o drosglwyddo bysiau i lawr y lein tuag at ddiwedd eu hoes, er mwyn iddynt ddechrau o'r newydd yng Nghaerdydd a threfi eraill, ac yna cânt eu trosglwyddo'n raddol i ardaloedd llai poblog wrth i'r cerbydau ddod yn hŷn? Byddai hyn yn golygu y byddai bysiau llawr isel newydd, yr ydym oll yn eu croesawu, yn cael eu cyflwyno'n ddiweddarach yng Nghymru wledig nag yng Nghymru drefol, gan ddwysáu'r anghydraddoldeb cynhenid.

**Sue Essex:** I have no knowledge of that kind of unfortunate hierarchy. It would be unfortunate if that was the case and I will investigate the points you made. As Richard Edwards is the Chair of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee and Assembly Member for Preseli Pembrokeshire, I am aware of the concern in that area, which I experienced for myself last summer when I visited Pembrokeshire on holiday. Local people are concerned about the quality of some of the buses that operate in rural areas and how, without proper disabled access, they are not allowing people to take advantage of the concessionary fares and the possibility to get out and about. I had a meeting with the Confederation of Passenger Transport recently and increasing accessibility to buses was discussed. We will consider carefully what we can do to speed up the transfer so that new buses—there are some in Cardiff already and are far more user-friendly in many ways for disabled people—are available throughout the country.

We discussed rail services in the meeting of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee yesterday. However, I made it clear that I think that the time is coming when we will need to pay greater attention to buses. It is a complicated issue as there are many independent bus operators and we do

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r math anffodus hwn o hierarchaeth. Byddai'n anffodus petai hynny'n wir a byddaf yn ymchwilio i'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch. Gan mai Richard Edwards yw Cadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ac Aelod o'r Cynulliad dros Breseli Sir Benfro, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon sydd yn bodoli yn yr ardal honno, a brofais fy hun pan ymwelais â Sir Benfro ar wyliau'r haf diwethaf. Mae pobl leol yn poeni am ansawdd rhai o'r bysiau sydd yn gweithredu mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac nad ydynt, heb sicrhau mynediad priodol i bobl anabl, yn galluogi pobl i fanteisio ar gostau teithio consesiwn a'r posibilrwydd o deithio o gwmpas. Cyfarfum yn ddiweddar â Chydffederasiwn Trafnidiaeth i Deithwyr a thrafodwyd y mater o sicrhau mynediad gwell i fysiau. Byddwn yn ystyried yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yn ofalus i gyflymu'r broses o drosglwyddo er mwyn sicrhau bod bysiau newydd—ceir rhai ohonynt eisoes yng Nghaerdydd ac maent yn llawer mwy cyfeillgar i'w defnyddwyr mewn sawl ffordd o ran pobl anabl—ar gael ledled y wlad.

Trafodasom wasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ddoe. Fodd bynnag, esboniai yn glir fy mod yn credu ei bod yn bryd inni dalu mwy o sylw i fysiau. Mae'n fater cymhleth gan fod nifer o weithredwyr bysiau annibynnol ac nid oes

not have an equivalent of the Strategic Rail Authority for buses. It might encourage you to hear that I am investing in a scheme that will enable the voices of bus consumers to be heard. The work, in conjunction with the Bus Transport Users Committee—I think that that is the correct name—will start this year. We have able Assembly Members and Members of Parliament who already make views known, but we must also work with communities to ensure that their voice is heard, so that, together, we can try to prepare a package of better bus provision.

gennym yr un sydd yn gyfwerth â'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol ar gyfer bysiau. Efallai y bydd y ffaith fy mod yn buddsoddi mewn cynllun a fydd yn galluogi i leisiau defnyddwyr bysiau gael eu clywed yn eich calonogi. Bydd y gwaith, a wneir ar y cyd gyda Phwyllgor Defnyddwyr Trafnidiaeth Bysiau—credaf mai dyna yw'r enw cywir—yn dechrau eleni. Mae gennym Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac Aelodau Seneddol cymwys sydd eisoes wedi lleisio eu barn, ond rhaid inni weithio hefyd gyda phwyllgorau er mwyn sicrhau y caiff eu lleisiau eu clywed, er mwyn inni geisio paratoi, gyda'n gilydd, becyn o ddarpariaeth bysiau gwell.

## **Datganiad ar Glwy'r Traed a'r Genau** **Statement on Foot and Mouth Disease**

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** There are currently 57 confirmed cases of foot and mouth disease in Wales—13 in Anglesey, 35 in Powys and nine in Monmouthshire—and six suspect cases. The priority remains to control and eradicate the disease. In Wales, we are committed to, and achieving, the slaughter of affected animals within 24 hours of the report of the disease. In parallel, susceptible animals on adjoining premises to farms where cases have been confirmed must be culled within 48 hours. That policy has been adopted throughout Great Britain. The policy is based on sound scientific advice that slaughter on identification of the disease will make a significant impact in controlling the spread of the disease and its eventual eradication. In Anglesey, the cull of sheep continues and earlier local difficulties have been resolved and, to date, about 30,000 animals have been slaughtered. We expect that about 95 per cent of the process will be completed by the end of the week. In mid Wales, site preparations at Epynt have been completed and disposal at the site will commence shortly. I regret very much the incident last weekend at Epynt, which resulted in a serious injury to a member of the Dyfed Powys Constabulary. I know that Members will join me in wishing him a speedy recovery.

Elsewhere in Wales, the slaughter of animals with confirmed cases, and their contacts,

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Ar hyn o bryd mae 57 o achosion pendant o glwy'r traed a'r genau yng Nghymru—13 ar Ynys Môn, 35 ym Mhowys a naw yn Sir Fynwy—a chwe achos tybiedig. Y flaeoniaeth o hyd yw rheoli a dileu'r clefyd. Yng Nghymru, rydym yn ymrwymedig i ladd anifeiliaid yr effeithiwyd arnynt o fewn 24 awr i ganfod y clefyd ac rydym yn cyflawni hynny. Yn yr un ffordd, rhaid difa anifeiliaid a fydd mewn perygl o gael y clefyd ar eiddo gerllaw ffermydd lle cadarnhawyd achosion, o fewn 48 awr. Mabwysiadwyd y polisi hwnnw ledled Prydain Fawr. Mae'r polisi'n seiliedig ar gyngor penodol cadarn y bydd lladd yn union ar ôl canfod y clefyd yn cael effaith sylweddol ar reoli lledaeniad y clwyf a'i ddileu yn y pen draw. Ar Ynys Môn, mae'r gwaith o ddifa defaid yn parhau a datryswyd anawsterau lleol cynharach a, hyd yma, lladdwyd tua 30,000 o anifeiliaid. Disgwyliwn y bydd tua 95 y cant o'r broses wedi'i chwblhau erbyn diwedd yr wythnos. Yng nghanolbarth Cymru, cwblhawyd paratoadau safle ar fynydd Epynt a bydd gwaredu ar y safle yn dechrau'n fuan. Gresynnaf yn fawr at y digwyddiad ar fynydd Epynt y penwythnos diwethaf, a arweiniodd at beri anaf difrifol i aelod o Heddlu Dyfed Powys. Gwn y bydd Aelodau yn ymuno â mi i ddymuno gwellhad buan iddo.

Mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru, mae'r gwaith o ladd anifeiliaid ag achosion o'r

continues. Foot and mouth is a pernicious disease, and I make no apology for the drastic consequences of the action taken to control its spread, which has been supported by the farming unions. On Tuesday, the Prime Minister met representatives of the farming community and other interests, with whom he had frank and constructive discussions.

I recognise that the measures that have been put in place to control the disease, particularly movement restrictions, could have an adverse effect on the welfare of animals that are not linked directly to foot and mouth disease. We have introduced schemes to allow the movement of susceptible animals under strict licensed arrangements. These arrangements have eased some of the welfare difficulties that may have arisen. For various reasons there are animals whose condition leaves little option other than slaughter. In such cases the livestock welfare disposal scheme operated by the intervention board applies. The scheme has operational difficulties. The board is attempting to resolve these as a matter of urgency. The difficulties were raised with the Prime Minister in his meeting in Usk on Tuesday.

9:45 a.m.

Agriculture department staff in divisional offices and in Cardiff are making every effort to respond positively to farmers at this difficult time for the industry. It will not always be possible to provide the response that individual farmers are seeking. There is an operations control centre in Cathays Park that is responsible for co-ordinating action relating to the slaughter and disposal of foot and mouth diseased animals and their contacts. The operations director is a senior official in the agriculture department and is supported by personnel from the army, the state veterinary service, the environment agency and the police. In addition to the National Assembly's helpline the operations control centre is establishing information centres in Powys and Monmouthshire to ensure that accurate and timely information is available in these localities.

clwyf a gadarnhawyd, a'r rhai a fu mewn cysylltiad â hwy, yn parhau. Mae clwy'r traed a'r genau yn glefyd enbyd, ac nid ymddiheuraf am ganlyniadau llym y camau a gymerwyd i reoli ei ledaeniad, a gefnogwyd gan yr undebau ffermio. Ar ddydd Mawrth, cyfarfu'r Prif Weinidog â chynrychiolwyr o'r gymuned ffermio a buddiannau eraill, a chafodd drafodaethau agored ac adeiladol gyda hwy.

Cydnabyddaf y gallai'r mesurau a ddefnyddiwyd i reoli'r clwyf, yn enwedig cyfyngu ar symud, gael effaith andwyol ar les yr anifeiliaid nad ydynt yn uniongyrchol gysylltiedig â chlwy'r traed a'r genau. Cyflwynasom gynlluniau i ganiatâu symud anifeiliaid sydd yn debygol o gael y clwyf o dan drefniadau trwyddedig llym. Mae'r trefniadau hyn wedi lleddfu rhai o'r anawsterau lles a allai fod wedi codi. Am resymau amrywiol ceir anifeiliaid y mae eu cyflwr yn golygu nad oes unrhyw opsiwn arall ond eu lladd. Mewn achosion o'r fath mae'r cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu a weithredir gan y bwrdd ymyrraeth yn berthnasol. Mae gan y cynllun anawsterau gweithredol. Mae'r bwrdd yn ceisio datrys y rhain ar fylder. Codwyd yr anawsterau gyda'r Prif Weinidog yn ei gyfarfod ym Mrynbuga ddydd Mawrth.

Mae staff yr adran amaethyddiaeth mewn swyddfeydd is-adrannol yng Nghaerdydd yn gwneud pob ymdrech i ymateb yn gadarnhaol i ffermwyr ar yr adeg anodd hon i'r diwydiant. Ni fydd yn bosibl ymateb yn ôl dynuniad pob ffermwyr bob amser. Mae canolfan rheoli gweithrediadau ym Mharc Cathays sydd yn gyfrifol am gydlynw camau gweithredu yn ymwneud â lladd a gwaredu anifeiliaid sydd yn dioddef o glwy'r traed a'r genau a'r rhai a fu mewn cysylltiad â hwy. Mae'r cyfarwyddwr gweithrediadau yn uwch swyddog yn yr adran amaethyddiaeth a chaiff ei gynorthwyo gan bersonol o'r fyddin, y gwasanaeth milfeddygol gwladol, asiantaeth yr amgylchedd a'r heddlu. Yn ogystal â llinell gymorth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mae'r canolfan rheoli gweithrediadau yn sefydlu canolfannau gwybodaeth ym Mhowys a Sir Fynwy i sicrhau bod gwybodaeth amserol a chywir ar gael yn yr

ardaloedd hyn.

I do not consider that the scale of the disease in Wales justifies the use of vaccination. That is the professional advice that I have received. There are approximately 25,000 farmers in Wales and 57 confirmed cases of foot and mouth disease. I must bear those figures in mind when I consider vaccination. The livestock population in Wales of sheep, cattle and pigs is approximately 12.6 million animals. They would be at risk if our reaction does not concentrate on controlling and eradicating the disease.

**Elin Jones:** Ers inni gael y datganiad diwethaf ar glwy'r traed a'r genau, aeth nifer o gymunedau yng Nghymru drwy gyfnod cythryblus. Mae'r clwyf yn peri gwewyr i'r ffermwyr sydd yn wynebu difa eu stoc a diddymu eu bywoliaeth. Bu hefyd yn anodd ar y cymunedau hynny a fydd yn colli miloedd o anifeiliaid. Mae rhai penderfyniadau wedi cael eu gorfodi ar y cymunedau hyn. Beth bynnag am eich bwriad, Weinidog, nid yw'r penderfyniadau am ddifa anifeiliaid wedi cael eu cyfleu mewn ffordd sensitif nac effeithiol yn Ynys Môn, Epynt, nac ym Merthyr Tudful. A wnewch chi sicrhau y bydd pob cymuned yn derbyn yr wybodaeth angenrheidiol ynglŷn â difa a llosgi anifeiliaid a fydd yn digwydd o fewn eu hardal? Mae'n bwysig eu bod yn derbyn gwybodaeth am y dadleuon amgylcheddol a diogelwch mewn da bryd. Dylai pob cartref dderbyn gwybodaeth ysgrifenedig. Mae gwybodaeth o'r math hwn yn sicrhau na fydd unrhyw gamwybodaeth yn cael ei lledaenu o fewn cymunedau.

Clywsom ddoe nad yw brechu yn ystyriaeth ar gyfer y tymor byr yn Lloegr bellach. Pe bai Nick Brown yn newid ei feddwl, a chan eich bod chi a Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yr Alban yn parhau i wrthod brechu—ac yr ydych wedi cadarnhau hynny heddiw eto—a fyddai penderfyniad i frechu yn Lloegr yn dylanwadu ar statws rhydd o'r clefyd Cymru? A fyddai'r penderfyniad hwnnw yn effeithio ar allu cynhyrchwyr Cymru i allforio yn y tymor canol neu a fydd gan Gymru yr hawl i gael ei hystyried ar wahân oherwydd ei statws rhydd o'r clefyd?

Mae tymor y Pasg ar gychwyn a bydd

Nid ystyriaf fod graddfa'r clefyd yng Nghymru yn cyfiawnhau'r defnydd o frechu. Dyna'r cyngor proffesiynol a dderbyniais. Mae bron i 25,000 o ffermwyr yng Nghymru a 57 achos wedi'i gadarnhau o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Rhaid imi gofio'r ffîgurau hynny wrth imi ystyried brechu. Mae nifer y da byw yng Nghymru sydd yn cynnwys defaid, gwartheg a moch tua 12.6 miliwn. Byddent mewn perygl oni fydd ein hymateb yn canolbwytio ar reoli a dileu'r clwyf.

**Elin Jones:** Since we had the last statement on foot and mouth disease, a number of communities in Wales have experienced a turbulent period. The disease is causing anguish to those farmers who are facing the destruction of their stock and livelihood. It has also been difficult for those communities that will lose thousands of animals. Some decisions have been forced on these communities. Whatever your intention, Minister, the decisions on culling animals have not been conveyed in a sensitive nor an effective way in Anglesey, Epynt or in Merthyr Tydfil. Will you ensure that every community receives the necessary information regarding the culling and burning of animals that will happen in their area? It is important that they receive information on the environmental and safety arguments in plenty of time. Every home should receive written information. Such information ensures that no misinformation is circulated in communities.

We heard yesterday that vaccination is no longer being considered in England in the short term. If Nick Brown were to change his mind, and since you and the Scottish Rural Affairs Minister are continuing to resist vaccination—and you confirmed that again today—would a decision to vaccinate in England influence Wales's disease-free status? Would that decision effect the ability of producers in Wales to export in the medium term, or would Wales have the right to separate consideration because of the disease-free status?

Easter is upon us and hundreds of thousands

cannoedd o filoedd o wlyn yn cyrraedd y farchnad cyn bo hir a'r farchnad allforio wedi ei chau iddynt. Pa drefniadau sydd mewn llaw i gryfhau'r ymdrech marchnata cig oen a chig eidion—ond cig oen yn benodol—o fewn Cymru a gwledydd eraill Prydain dros gyfnod sydd mor allweddol bwysig i ffermwyr defaid Cymru?

Ar fater etholaethol, gwyddoch fod gogledd Ceredigion o fewn ardal heintus ers i glwy'r traed a'r genau gael ei gadarnhau yn lladd-dy Llanidloes. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, mae'r lladd-dy yn weithredol erbyn hyn, ond ni chodwyd y statws heintus ar ogledd Ceredigion. Pa bryd y codir y gwaharddiadau hyn gan nad oes synnwyr mewn parhau â hwy?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ynglŷn â'r manylion, cyhoeddodd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd frifff y bore yma er mwyn esbonio wrth bobl beth yn union a wneir i sicrhau diogelwch safle Epynt. Bydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd.

Ar y sefyllfa yn Ynys Môn, ymwelais â'r Ynys ddydd Gwener diwethaf er mwyn siarad â'r bobl sydd yn byw gyferbyn â safle Penhesgyn. Yr oeddwn yno hefyd ddydd Sul i gyfarfod â hwy gyda Phrif Weinidog Cymru ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

Ynglŷn â mynydd Epynt, yn Aberhonddu nos Wener, cyfarfum â chynrychiolwyr o'r rhai a fu'n protestio ar Fynydd Epynt a chawsom drafodaeth. Yn ogystal, ymwelais â mynydd Epynt brynhawn dydd Sadwrn diwethaf i gwrdd unwaith eto gyda rhai a fu'n protestio ac i edrych ar y safle.

Mae rhai pobl yn lledaenu manylion holol anghywir. Wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n digwydd mewn sefyllfa o'r fath. Dyna pam y gofynnais i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd gynhyrchu'r briff hwn. Cynhelir cyfarfod y bore yma rhwng swyddogion y Cynulliad, milfeddygon, swyddogion Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, yr heddlu a rhai o'r bobl leol er mwyn esbonio'r sefyllfa ar yr Epynt unwaith eto.

Ar fater brechu, pe byddai Nick Brown yn penderfynu brechu yn Lloegr, ni olyga hynny 100 y cant y byddai Cymru yn colli statws gwlad sydd yn rhydd o'r clwyf, pe byddem

of lambs will go to market shortly with the export market closed to them. What arrangements are in place to strengthen the marketing campaign for lamb and beef—but particularly lamb—within Wales and other countries in Britain over such a crucial period for sheep farmers in Wales?

On a constituency matter, as you know, north Ceredigion is within an infected area since the confirmation of foot and mouth disease at Llanidloes abattoir. I understand that the abattoir is now operating, although the infected area status has not been lifted from north Ceredigion. When will these prohibitions be lifted as there is no sense in continuing with them?

**Carwyn Jones:** As regards the details, the Environment Agency published a brief this morning to explain to people exactly what is being done to ensure the safety of the Epynt site. It will be made available to the public.

As regards the situation in Anglesey, I visited the island last Friday in order to speak to the people who live adjacent to the Penhesgyn site. I was also there on Sunday to meet them together with the First Minister and the Secretary of State for Wales.

As regards Epynt, I met with representatives of the Epynt protesters in Brecon on Friday and we discussed this issue. I also visited Epynt last Saturday afternoon, in order to meet some of the protesters again and to look at the site.

Some people are circulating totally incorrect details. That is bound to happen in such a situation. That is why I asked the Environment Agency to produce this brief. A meeting will be held this morning, between Assembly officials, vets, representatives of the Environment Agency, the police and some local people in order to explain the situation on Epynt again.

On the issue of vaccination, if Nick Brown were to decide to vaccinate in England, it would not be 100 per cent certain that Wales would lose its disease free status, if we

eisiau allforio. Mewn gwledydd eraill, mae rhai rhanbarthau yn gallu allforio ac eraill ddim. Aeth Gogledd Iwerddon ar hyd y trywydd hwn er mwyn mynd at y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a dweud wrtho y dylent allu allforio o Ogledd Iwerddon ac eithrio ardal de Armagh. Mae'r clwyf wedi lledu'n fwy yng Nghymru nag yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Nid yw hyn yn berthnasol inni ar hyn o bryd. Pe baem yn rhydd o'r clwyf yng Nghymru a bod anifeiliad wedi eu brechu yn Lloegr, golyga hynny ei bod yn bosibl inni fynd at y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i sicrhau y gallwn allforio unwaith eto. Os bydd brechu yn digwydd mewn un rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig, ni chredaf y golyga hynny fod rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn methu ag allforio.

Er mwyn hybu'r farchnad, cyfarfûm eisoes â Hybu Cig Oen a Chig Eidion Cymru Cyf sydd yn edrych yn fanwl ar yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei wneud i gefnogi'r farchnad Brydeinig, ar gyfer cig oen a phob cig o Gymru, er mwyn gwneud iawn am golli'r farchnad dramor ar hyn o bryd. Mae cynlluniau ar y gwell. Mae arian ychwanegol wedi mynd at y WDA er mwyn hybu Cymru.

Cefais sgwrs ag Elin ddoe ynglŷn â gogledd Ceredigion. Codasom y mater gyda'r milfeddygon yn Llundain sydd yn gwneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn ag ardaloedd heintus. Pwysom arnynt i ddod i benderfyniad a gobeithiwn dderbyn y penderfyniad hwnnw cyn gynted â bo modd.

**Alun Pugh:** Your visits around Wales will have informed you of the tourism industry's difficulties and you will be aware that fencing schemes are in place in north Wales to keep livestock away from climbing areas. If large areas of mountainside could be cleared of the few sheep that are there, and a stock-proof fence installed in order to open up access, would that compromise the fight against foot and mouth disease? If not, will you accompany me to the summit of Snowdon to send a clear message that Wales is open for business?

**Carwyn Jones:** The train does not reach the

wanted to export. In other countries some regions are able to export and others not. Northern Ireland went down this route in order to approach the European Commission and say that they should be able to export from Northern Ireland with the exception of the South Armagh area. The disease is more widespread in Wales than in Northern Ireland. That is not relevant to us at the moment. If Wales were disease-free, and some animals had been vaccinated in England, that would mean that it would be possible to approach the European Commission in order for us to ensure that we could export once again. If there is vaccination in one part of the United Kingdom, I do not believe that it means that other parts of the United Kingdom cannot export.

In order to promote the market, I have already met with Welsh Lamb and Beef Promotions Limited and it is looking in detail at what must be done to support the British market for lamb and all meats from Wales, in order to compensate for the current loss of overseas markets. Plans are in the pipeline. Additional funding has been given to the WDA so that it can promote Wales.

I spoke to Elin yesterday regarding north Ceredigion. We raised this matter with the vets in London who take decisions on infected areas. We have urged them to come to a decision and we hope to hear of their decision as soon as possible.

**Alun Pugh:** Gan ichi ymweld â gwahanol rannau o Gymru, bydd anawsterau'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn hysbys ichi a byddwch yn ymwybodol bod cynlluniau ffensio ar waith yng ngogledd Cymru i gadw da byw i ffwrdd o'r ardaloedd dringo. Pe gellid clirio ardaloedd mawr ar ochr y mynyddoedd o'r ychydig ddefaid sydd yno, a gosod ffens atal anifeiliad er mwyn sicrhau mynediad, a fyddai hynny yn cyfaddawdu'r frwydr yn erbyn clwy'r traed a'r genau? Os na, a ddewch gyda mi i gopa'r Wyddfa i anfon neges glir bod Cymru ar agor ar gyfer busnes?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw'r trén yn cyrraedd

summit of Snowdon. I have no intention of climbing with you to the top of Snowdon, as I know that you will take great pleasure when I flake out less than half way up. I will have to decline that invitation.

9:55 a.m.

**Alun Cairns:** You will have to take the train.

**Carwyn Jones:** I would if it went all the way to the top.

As far as fencing is concerned, we are considering a scheme that might facilitate your suggestion. Further details will be available when the scheme is finalised.

**Peter Rogers:** I listened to what you had to say, and I am pleased that you now recognise the importance of confirming the slaughtering and disposing of infected carcasses within 24 hours. This has been one of the main causes of the problems, particularly in my area. I will raise some issues that are causing problems, beginning with the intervention board, as you have already mentioned the animal welfare slaughter. It is impossible to get through to the intervention board. Yesterday, I was contacted by people who had been trying for three days to get through on its numbers. I took it upon myself to contact the intervention board, and I could not get through. Eventually I did get through to a senior member of staff, who took a hand-written message to the people on telephone lines. I have not received a response to that message.

Our problem in Wales is that welfare problems do not improve each hour. They get worse. Unless we address some of these problems, and bring in extra help, the problem will become severe across Wales. The intervention board, to date, has only handled 50,000 animals and has a backlog in excess of 1.25 million animals. This figure only includes the cases already reported to the board. With regard to pig farmers, you must remember that they have farrowing units, weaner units and fattening units. When you block up the fattening unit, you cannot

copa'r Wyddfa. Nid oes gennyl unrhyw fwriad i ddringo gyda chi i gopa'r Wyddfa, oherwydd gwn y byddech yn cael cryn fwynhad wrth fy ngweld yn llewygu llai na hanner ffordd i fyny'r mynydd. Bydd rhaid imi wrthod y gwahoddiad hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Bydd yn rhaid ichi gymryd y trê.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddwn yn gwneud hynny pe bai'n mynd yr holl ffordd i'r copa.

O ran gosod ffensys, rydym yn ystyried cynllun a allai hwyluso eich awgrym. Bydd manylion pellach ar gael pan fydd y cynllun ar ei ffurf derfynol.

**Peter Rogers:** Gwrandewais ar yr hyn yr oedd gennych i'w ddweud, ac yr wyf yn falch eich bod bellach yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cadarnhau lladd a gwaredu cyrff yr effeithiwyd arnynt o fewn 24 awr. Bu hyn yn un o brif achosion y problemau, yn enwedig yn fy ardal i. Byddaf yn codi rhai materion sydd yn achosi problemau, gan ddechrau'r gyda'r bwrdd ymyrraeth, oherwydd eich bod eisoes wedi crybwyl lladd er lles anifeiliaid. Mae'n amhosibl cysylltu â'r bwrdd ymyrraeth. Ddoe, siaradais â phobl a fu'n ceisio mynd drwodd ar ei rifau ers tri diwrnod. Euthum ati fy hunan i gysylltu â'r bwrdd ymyrraeth, ond ni chefais ateb. O'r diwedd cysylltais ag uwch aelod o'r staff, a aeth â neges ysgrifenedig at y bobl ar y llinellau ffôn. Ni dderbyniais ymateb i'r neges honno.

Ein problem yng Nghymru yw'r ffaith nad yw problemau lles yn gwella bob awr. Maent yn gwaethygu. Oni bai ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau hyn, a dod â chymorth ychwanegol i mewn, bydd y broblem yn mynd yn ddifrifol ar draws Cymru. Hyd yn hyn, dim ond 50,000 o anifeiliaid y mae'r bwrdd ymyrraeth wedi ymdrin â hwy ac mae ganddo ôl-groniad o 1.25 miliwn o anifeiliaid. Dim ond yr achosion a gofnodwyd eisoes gyda'r bwrdd a gynhwysir yn y ffigur hwn. Mewn perthynas â ffermwyr moch, rhaid ichi gofio bod

move the pigs from the farrowing unit to the weaner unit, and the whole system becomes blocked. In one case in Anglesey, there are pigs in a weaner unit too big to fit into their housing. We also have big and dangerous boars. Those farmers have already had a week's delay, but they cannot get satisfactory answers. If people could explain the delay to them, or give them a date to look forward to, it would be better. The economic devastation is getting worse because of the feed bills.

The intervention board is in disarray. I would be pleased if your staff could try those lines. I have eight numbers—which I would be happy to give to you—and I failed to get through on any of them yesterday. We must address this problem, because we have cattle that must be destroyed, and sheep with disease build-up that cannot be moved, and there are fodder shortages.

We also have the problem of movement licences. You know that Ynys Môn has no disinfectant centre, and that Anglesey farmers are expected to go all the way to Ruthin—some 80 or 90 miles away—to disinfect vehicles. After moving stock, they have to travel 80 or 90 miles to Ruthin to disinfect those vehicles again. One farmer moving animals to a particular area went to Ruthin to disinfect his vehicle between every load.

You have met our council, and you know of the disarray it is in. I have been appealing to the council for a week to set up a disinfectant centre. Finally, the army offered me some men, I found spray units and disinfectant units from MAFF, but the council could not come up with a site. I went to the RAF at 7pm on Friday, and the first vehicle to be disinfected went through on Sunday morning. That is what we call fast-tracking. That is essential in all parts of Wales. We must understand the problems and start to fast-track solutions.

We now have movement licences, but unless

ganddynt hwy unedau mocha, unedau diddyfni ac unedau tewhau. Pan fyddwch yn rhwystro'r uned dewhau, ni allwch symud y moch o'r uned focha i'r uned ddiddyfni a rhwystir yr holl system. Mewn un achos ar Ynys Môn, ceir moch mewn uned ddiddyfni sydd yn rhy fawr i'w rhoi yn eu cartrefi. Yn ogystal, mae gennym faeddod mawr a pheryglus. Cafodd y ffermwyr hynny wythnos o oedi eisoes, ond ni allant gael atebion boddhaol. Pe bai pobl yn gallu egluro'r oedi wrthynt, neu roi dyddiad iddynt edrych ymlaen ato, byddai'n well. Mae'r dinistr economaidd yn gwaethyg o ganlyniad i'r biliau porthiant.

Mae anhreftn yn y bwrdd ymyrraeth. Byddwn yn falch pe gallai eich staff geisio ffonio'r llinellau hynny. Mae gennyf wyth rhif—y byddwn yn falch i'w rhoi ichi—a methais â chysylltu ag un ohonynt ddoe. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, oherwydd mae gennym wartheg y mae'n rhaid eu difa, a defaid sydd yn dioddef o'r clwyf na ellir eu symud, a cheir prinder porthiant.

Mae gennym y broblem o drwyddedau symud hefyd. Gwyddoch nad oes gan Ynys Môn ganolfan ddiheintio, ac y disgwylir i ffermwyr Ynys Môn fynd yr holl ffordd i Rhuthun—rhyw 80 neu 90 milltir i ffwrdd—i ddiheintio eu cerbydau. Ar ôl symud stoc, rhaid iddynt deithio 80 neu 90 milltir i Rhuthun i ddiheintio'r cerbydau hynny unwaith eto. Aeth un ffermwr, a oedd yn symud anifeiliaid i ardal arbennig, i Rhuthun i ddiheintio ei gerbyd rhwng bob llwyth.

Yr ydych wedi cwrdd â'n cyngor, a gwyddoch am yr anhreftn o'i fewn. Bûm yn pwysu ar y cyngor ers wythnos i sefydlu canolfan ddiheintio. Yn y pen draw, cynigodd y fyddin ychydig o ddynion imi, darganfûm unedau chwistrellu ac unedau diheintio gan y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd, ond ni allai'r Cyngor benderfynu ar safle. Euthum i'r Llu Awyr Brenhinol am 7pm ddydd Gwener, a gadawodd y cerbyd cyntaf i gael ei ddiheintio fore Sul. Dyna'r hyn y galwn yn llwybr cyflym. Mae hynny'n hanfodol ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Rhaid inni ddeall y problemau a dechrau datrysiau llwybr cyflym.

Bellach, mae gennym drwyddedau symud,

we can process them, the animal welfare demands will become greater. You will have more animals put forward on animal welfare grounds because of the blockage with the licensing system. In Caernarfon there is a six-day backlog for long distance movement, and a two-day blockage on short journeys. This is unacceptable. The Royal Air Force offered me a 24-hour disinfecting service if it was required. The Assembly must ensure that licences can be dealt with in exactly the same way. I spoke to one of the generals in charge—General Arthur Devaro—at RAF Valley on Tuesday. He has visited the sites across Wales. He immediately offered to put extra staff into Caernarfon to help the licence situation, because he realised how dire the consequences would be. What can we do to get extra personnel to move licensing forward on this programme? We must have fast-tracking.

Ten days ago I mentioned the problems in the dairy industry of getting cows in calf, particularly the 90 cows that were due to be inseminated on the Tuesday. You told me and Tony Edwards, the vet, that you would agree that an artificial insemination inseminator could be disinfected before he went on to the farm, and after he came off the farm, as long as the semen came from a clean area. We have semen from a clean area. When we went to get the licences, we were told in Caernarfon that they did not care what the Minister for Rural Affairs, the Chief Veterinary Officer or Peter Rogers said, we could not inseminate those cows. The consequential loss to that dairy farmer, because those cows will not be calving in January next year, will be £10,000. If we do not get them inseminated in six days' time, that will be another £10,000, and those cows will have to go to the welfare scheme to be put down.

We must address the serious issues of artificial insemination, and moving bulls. You said that you had no objection to putting a bull on a farm as long as it stayed on that farm. We cannot get a movement licence to do that. We must address that. We also have

ond oni allwn eu prosesu, bydd y galwadau o ran lles anifeiliaid yn cynyddu. Bydd gennych fwy o anifeiliaid a gyflwynir ar sail lles anifeiliaid o ganlyniad i'r rhwystrau yn y system drwyddedu. Yng Nghaernarfon, ceir ôl-groniad o chwe diwrnod ar gyfer symud anifeiliaid dros bellter hir, a rhwystr dau ddiwrnod ar gyfer teithiau byr. Mae hyn yn annerbyniol. Cynigodd y Llu Awyr Brenhinol wasanaeth diheintio 24 awr imi os oedd yn ofynnol. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad sicrhau y gellir delio â thrwyddedau yn yr un modd yn union. Siaradais ag un o'r cadfridogion a oedd â gofal—Cadfridog Arthur Devaro—yn y Llu Awyr Brenhinol, Fali ddydd Mawrth. Ymwelodd â safleoedd ledled Cymru. Cynigiodd ar unwaith i roi staff ychwanegol yng Nghaernarfon i helpu gyda sefyllfa'r trwyddedau, oherwydd sylweddolodd pa mor enbyd fyddai'r canlyniadau. Beth y gallwn ni ei wneud i gael personél ychwanegol i symud y trwyddedu ymlaen ar y rhaglen hon? Rhaid inni gael dull llwybr-cyflym.

Ddeng niwrnod yn ôl, crybwylais y problemau yn y diwydiant llaeth o gael gwartheg cyflo, yn enwedig y 90 o wartheg y bwriadwyd eu semenu ar y dydd Mawrth. Dywedasoch wrthyf fi a Tony Edwards, y milfeddyg, y byddech yn cytuno y gellid diheintio'r person a oedd yn cyflawni'r semenu artiffisial cyn iddo fynd ar y fferm, ac ar ôl iddo adael y fferm, ar yr amod bod y semen yn dod o ardal lân. Mae gennym semen o ardal lân. Pan aethom i nôl y trwyddedau, dywedwyd wrthym yng Nghaernarfon nad oedd ots ganddynt beth a ddywedodd y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, y Prif Swyddog Milfeddygol, na Peter Rogers, ni allem semenu'r gwartheg hynny. Bydd y golled ganlyniadol i'r ffermwyr llaeth hwnnw, oherwydd na fydd y gwartheg hynny'n dod â lloï ym mis Ionawr y flwyddyn nesaf, yn £10,000. Os na fyddwn yn eu semenu o fewn chwe diwrnod, bydd hynny'n £10,000 ychwanegol, a bydd yn rhaid i'r gwartheg hynny fynd i'r cynllun lles i'w difa.

Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â materion difrifol semenu artiffisial, a symud teirw. Dywedasoch nad oedd gennych unrhyw wrthwynebiad i roi tarw ar fferm, ar yr amod ei fod yn aros ar y fferm honno. Ni allwn gael trwydded symud i wneud hynny. Rhaid inni

many animals across Wales—fat lambs and fat cattle—in prime condition for marketing to go into the food chain. We must address this. Another important point is sites for the disposal of slaughtered stock. I was aware of the problems created in Anglesey, and I am aware of the problems that have been involved in Brecon. For goodness' sake, let us make it a standing rule that in future all slaughtered stock in infected areas stay in those infected areas. If you are ever contemplating burial sites again, consult with local people with local knowledge who understand the problems. Using Mona airfield would be a perfect example of that.

fynd i'r afael â hynny. Yn ogystal, mae gennym nifer o anifeiliaid ledled Cymru—ŵyn tew a gwartheg tew—yn y cyflwr gorau ar gyfer eu marchnata i fynd i'r gadwyn fwyd. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hyn. Pwynt pwysig arall yw safleoedd ar gyfer gwaredu'r anifeiliaid a laddwyd. Yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r problemau a grëwyd ar Ynys Môn, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau a gafwyd ym Mrycheiniog. Er mwyn popeth, gadewch inni ei wneud yn rheol sefydlog bod yr holl anifeiliaid a leddir mewn ardaloedd heintus yn aros yn yr ardaloedd heintus hynny yn y dyfodol. Os byddwch byth yn ystyried safleoedd claddu eto, ymgynghorwch â phobl leol â gwybodaeth leol sydd yn deall y problemau. Byddai defnyddio maes awyr Mona yn enghraifft berffaith o hynny.

**Carwyn Jones:** On the slaughtered stock, the Epynt is in an infected area. That point has been made many times. It is not a question of animals being brought into a clean area. With regard to Penhesgyn, as you know, there was no other site in Anglesey. We either had the cull or we did not have the cull. If we did not have the cull, the island's situation would be disastrous, quite frankly. We have to operate on the basis of finding sites that the Environment Agency is content with. As far as Penhesgyn is concerned, the council originally did not want us to use Penhesgyn and, therefore, Mona was the only site. The council subsequently changed its mind and Penhesgyn became available. It was always the first choice site as far as the Environment Agency was concerned. Having been to Anglesey and sat in on what was almost a full council meeting on Sunday, I have no desire whatsoever to get involved with the politics of that island. On Sunday neither the First Minister nor I were prepared to take sides on what is clearly a lively situation on Anglesey council.

On the intervention board, there have been difficulties. The board is installing a new telephone system to ease the difficulties of farmers who are lodging applications. The difficulties that have arisen are being resolved urgently. As of yesterday, the board has received some 740 applications from

**Carwyn Jones:** O ran yr anifeiliaid a laddwyd, mae'r Epynt yn ardal heintus. Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt hwnnw sawl gwaith. Nid yw'n ymwneud â dod ag anifeiliaid i mewn i ardal lân. Mewn perthynas â Phenhesgyn, fel y gwyddoch, nid oedd unrhyw safle arall ar Ynys Môn. Naill ai cyflawnwyd y difa, neu ni chyflawnwyd y difa. Pe na chyflawnwyd y difa, byddai'r sefyllfa ar yr ynys yn drychinebus, mewn gwirionedd. Rhaid inni weithredu ar y sail o ddarganfod safleoedd y mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn fodlon arnynt. O ran Penhesgyn, nid oedd y cyngor am inni ddefnyddio Penhesgyn yn wreiddiol ac, felly, Mona oedd yr unig safle. Yn dilyn hynny, newidiodd y cyngor ei feddwl ac yr oedd Penhesgyn ar gael. Y safle hwn oedd dewis cyntaf Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd o'r cychwyn. Ar ôl bod ar Ynys Môn ac eistedd yn yr hyn a oedd bron yn gyfarfod llawn y cyngor ar ddydd Sul, nid oes gennyf unrhyw ddymuniad o gwbl i ymhel â gwleidyddiaeth yr ynys honno. Ar ddydd Sul, nid oedd y Prif Weinidog na minnau yn barod i gefnogi unrhyw du ar yr hyn sydd yn amlwg yn sefyllfa fywiog ar gyngor Ynys Môn.

O ran y bwrdd ymyrraeth, cafwyd anawsterau. Mae'r bwrdd yn gosod system ffôn newydd i leddfu anawsterau ffermwyr sydd yn gwneud ceisiadau. Caiff yr anawsterau a gododd eu datrys ar frys. Erbyn ddoe, yr oedd y bwrdd wedi derbyn rhyw 740 o geisiadau o Gymru. Cydnabuwyd y

Wales. The problems have been recognised, as I have said. They were raised with the Prime Minister and the board is now installing a new telephone system. A meeting will be held at Caernarfon on Saturday to deal with welfare issues and you will be invited to it, Peter. On movement licences, a disinfectant centre in Anglesey is to be welcomed. It is a matter for the Meat and Livestock Commission to license disinfecting centres and we have appealed many times for people to propose sites for disinfecting centres. The licensing of any new disinfecting centre is to be welcomed. If such centres can be set up, that is work well done by those involved. However, it is a matter for the council to find a site. I hope that one can be found and confirmed, but it would be unwise for anyone who is not a native of the island to get involved in its politics.

10:05 a.m.

The Caernarfon office is working flat out to get the welfare licences and all matters resolved. When I visited Caernarfon a week last Saturday, as you also did, Peter, it was clear that the office was working as if it were a weekday. If the work being done in Caernarfon needs to be speeded up, we will see what we can do. I have spoken to the Brigadier commanding the army in Wales and he wanted to make clear that the army cannot do everything. It has to be deployed and asked to undertake an action. Simply bringing in the army does not necessarily help unless it can be deployed properly and has an action to undertake. Giving operational control to the army has already been mooted elsewhere. The army has made clear that it does not want that. Others here will know who suggested that.

Finally, on insemination, I do not remember saying what you claim I said. However, you raise an important point about what needs to be done in this situation. I will take that up again this afternoon with the veterinary officers and we will see what can be done to progress matters.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for your statement.

problemau, fel y dywedais. Fe'u codwyd gyda'r Prif Weinidog a bellach mae'r bwrdd yn gosod system ffôn newydd. Cynhelir cyfarfod yng Nghaernarfon ddydd Sadwrn i ymdrin â materion lles ac fe'ch gwahoddir chi, Peter, i fod yn bresennol. O ran trwyddedau symud, croesewir canolfan ddiheintio ar Ynys Môn. Cyfrifoldeb y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw yw trwyddedu canolfannau diheintio ac apeliasom sawl gwaith i bobl gynnig safleoedd ar gyfer canolfannau diheintio. Croesewir trwyddedu unrhyw ganolfan ddiheintio newydd. Pe gellid sefydlu canolfannau o'r fath, byddai hynny'n waith da gan y bobl a fydd yn gysylltiedig. Fodd bynnag, cyfrifoldeb y cyngor yw dod o hyd i safle. Gobeithio y gellir canfod a chadarnhau safle, ond byddai'n annoeth i unrhyw un nad yw'n frodor o'r ynys i ymhel â'i gwleidyddiaeth.

Mae swyddfa Caernarfon yn gweithio'n ddi-baid i ddatrys y materion yn ymwneud â thrwyddedau lles a'r materion eraill. Pan ymwelais â Chaernarfon wythnos i ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf, fel y gwnaethoch chi hefyd, Peter, yr oedd yn amlwg bod y swyddfa'n gweithio fel pe bai'n ddiwrnod gwaith. Os bydd angen cyflymu'r gwaith yng Nghaernarfon, ystyriwn yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud. Siaradais â'r Brigadydd sydd yn rheoli'r fyddin yng Nghymru ac yr oedd am bwysleisio na all y fyddin wneud popeth. Rhaid ei threfnu a gofyn iddi ymgymryd â gweithrediad. Nid yw dod â'r fyddin i mewn ynddo'i hun yn helpu o reidrwydd oni ellir ei threfnu'n briodol a bod ganddo weithrediad i'w gyflawni. Crybwylwyd eisoes mewn mannau eraill y dylid rhoi rheolaeth weithrediadol i'r fyddin. Pwysleisiodd y fyddin nad oedd yn dymuno hynny. Bydd eraill yma yn gwybod pwy awgrymodd hynny.

Yn olaf, o ran semenu, ni chofiaf ddweud yr hyn a honnwyd gennych. Fodd bynnag, codwch bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud yn y sefyllfa hon. Trafodaf hynny unwaith eto y prynhawn yma gyda'r swyddogion milfeddygol a gwelwn beth y gellid ei wneud i ddatblygu'r materion.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch am eich datganiad. Yn

First, I pay tribute again to the efforts of everyone concerned: the veterinary service, the army and all those in the unions who have provided so much advice to people. I commend those who have established helplines so that a network of support exists for everyone who has suffered during this terrible crisis. Your primary aim is to defeat the disease and much effort has gone into that. However, other speakers have mentioned the terrible welfare situation that now exists on many farms because of the restrictions imposed to control the disease. Of those, the infected area has been mentioned. I was pleased to hear you talk of a re-examination of infected areas. I would like to hear more about the reduction of infected areas, because that would alleviate the massive problem of the inability of many farmers to sell livestock that is ready for sale.

That leads me to the issue of consequential loss. As you are aware, many of those producers have fed stock throughout this time. Those cattle have now exceeded 30 months and the lambs now have two teeth, which halves their value. What have you to say about providing consequential loss for those producers?

A greater and more urgent problem mentioned by other speakers, is that the intervention board cannot deal with the immense suffering that is taking place. I received a letter this morning from a producer in my constituency describing the heart-breaking circumstances that now exist on many farms. Having heard other speakers comment on this, you should now realise the urgency of it. Please answer these producers' pleas by arranging for the welfare disposal scheme to take place with the urgency applied to the removal of livestock for reasons of foot and mouth disease. The producer on the welfare disposal scheme also has a particular problem that I want you to solve. There is a flat-rate valuation scheme. As you are aware, on many of these farms, farmers have pedigree animals. Is it possible for those producers to have flat-rate valuation applied to most of their stock, but a separate valuation for stock that is worth far in excess of the agreed rates? If the Minister can answer these questions, he would alleviate

gyntaf, talaf deyrnged unwaith eto i ymdrechion pawb dan sylw: y gwasanaeth milfeddygol, y fyddin a'r holl bobl hynny yn yr undebau a ddarparodd gymaint o wybodaeth i bobl. Cymeradwyaf y rhai hynny a sefydloedd linellau cymorth er mwyn sicrhau rhwydwaith o gymorth i bawb a fu'n dioddef yn ystod yr argyfwng ofnadwy hwn. Eich prif nod yw gorchfgyu'r clwyf a rhoddwyd llawer o ymdrech i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, crybwylloedd siaradwyr eraill y sefyllfa les ofnadwy sydd bellach yn bodoli ar lawer o ffermydd o ganlyniad i'r cyfyngiadau a gyflwynwyd i reoli'r clwyf. O'r rhai hynny, crybwyllywyd yr ardal heintus. Yr oeddwn yn falch i'ch clywed yn cyfeirio at ailarchwilio ardaloedd heintus. Hoffwn glywed mwy am leihau ardaloedd heintus, oherwydd byddai hynny'n lleddfu'r broblem enfawr o anallu llawer o ffermwyr i werthu da byw sydd yn barod i'w gwerthu.

Mae hwn yn fy arwain at fater colled ganlyniadol. Fel y gwyddoch, mae nifer o'r cynhyrchwyr hynny wedi bwydo stoc drwy gydol yr amser hwn. Bellach mae'r gwartheg hynny yn hŷn na 30 mis a bellach mae gan yr wyn ddaud ddant, sydd yn haneru eu gwerth. Beth sydd gennych i'w ddweud am ddarparu colled ganlyniadol i'r cynhyrchwyr hynny?

Problem fwy ac un bwysicach a grybwyllywyd gan siaradwyr eraill, yw'r ffaith na all y bwrdd ymyrraeth ymdrin â'r dioddefaint anhygoel a geir. Derbyniais lythyr y bore yma gan gynhyrchydd yn fy etholaeth yn disgrifio'r amgylchiadau torcalonnus a geir bellach ar lawer o ffermydd. Ar ôl clywed siaradwyr eraill yn rhoi eu safbwytiau ar hyn, dylech, erbyn hyn, sylweddoli ei bwysigrywyd. A wnewch chi ateb ymbiliau'r cynhyrchwyr hyn drwy drefnu y cynhelir y cynllun lles-gwaredu gyda'r un brys â gwaredu anifeiliaid yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau. Yn ogystal, mae gan y cynhyrchydd ar y cynllun lles-gwaredu broblem arbennig yr wyf am ichi ei datrys. Ceir cynllun prisiad cyfradd unffurf. Fel y gwyddoch, ar nifer o'r ffermydd hyn, mae gan ffermwyr anifeiliaid pedigri. A yw'n bosibl i'r cynhyrchwyr hynny sicrhau y cymhwysir prisiad cyfradd unffurf i'r rhan fwyaf o'u hanifeiliaid, ond prisiad ar wahân ar gyfer anifeiliaid sydd werth mwy o lawer na'r cyfraddau cytûn? Os gall y Gweinidog ateb y cwestiynau hyn,

many of the problems that are driving producers to despair.

I will end on a positive note. In every one of my statements or questions on this issue I have asked for information, which you have stubbornly refused to provide to producers. I put on record my congratulations to the people in Montgomeryshire who worked together to produce a question and answer sheet to help producers in the area overcome many of their anxieties.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mick showed me that question and answer sheet yesterday, which he produced. The Assembly has set up an office in Montgomery town, which acts as a liaison point between the Assembly and the farming unions on the ground. We are providing information, including question and answer briefings, as I indicated to you yesterday.

I will take up your point about the flat-rate valuation scheme and the possibility of having a split valuation. The flat-rate valuation scheme applies in this matter but I will take up your point about pedigree animals and give you an answer. You reiterate the welfare situation, and I recognise, as I told Peter Rogers, that the situation is extremely difficult for many farmers.

Consequential loss is properly decided on an UK basis, as the Prime Minister stated strongly when he visited Usk.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Diolchaf i chi, Carwyn, am eich ymwelliadau â Chaernarfon ac Ynys Môn i drafod effeithiau clwy'r traed a'r genau. Yr ydych yn ymwybodol o'i effaith ddifrifol ar yr ynys, nid yn unig ar y ffermwyr sydd wedi colli anifeiliaid a'r ffermwyr sydd o fewn yr ardal lle y mae cyfyngu ar symud, ond hefyd ar y diwydiant twristiaeth. Clywsoch hynny dros y penwythnos.

Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r siaradwyr a ddywedodd fod lles anifeiliaid yn un o'r materion sydd angen ei ddatrys yn fuan. Mae'r cynllun difa yn mynd rhagddo yn Ynys Môn a chaiff ei gwblhau yn fuan, ond mae problemau gwirioneddol o ran lles anifeiliaid i'r

byddai'n lleddfu nifer o'r problemau sydd yn llethu cynhyrchwyr ag anobaith.

Gorffennaf ar nodyn cadarnhaol. Ym mhob un o'm datganiadau neu gwestiynau ar y mater hwn gofynnais am wybodaeth, y gwrthodasoch yn ystyfnig ei darparu i gynhyrchwyr. Cofnodaf fy llonyfarchiadau i'r bobl yn Sir Drefaldwyn a weithiodd gyda'i gilydd i gynhyrchu taflen cwestiwn ac ateb i helpu cynhyrchwyr yn yr ardal i oresgyn nifer o'u pryderon.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dangosodd Mick y daflen cwestiwn ac ateb honno a gynhyrchwyd ganddo imi ddoe. Sefydlodd y Cynulliad swyddfa yn nhref Trefaldwyn, sydd yn gweithredu fel pwynt cyswilt rhwng y Cynulliad ac undebau ffermio ar lawr gwlad. Yr ydym yn darparu gwybodaeth, yn cynnwys briffiau cwestiwn ac ateb, fel y nodais ddoe.

Trafodaf eich pwynt am y cynllun prisiad cyfradd unffurf a'r posiblwydd o gael prisiad rhanedig. Mae'r cynllun prisiad cyfradd unffurf yn berthnasol i'r mater hwn ond trafodaf eich pwynt am anifeiliaid pedigree a rhoi ateb ichi. Ailadroddwch y sefyllfa les, a chydubyddaf, fel y dywedais wrth Peter Rogers, bod y sefyllfa yn ofnadwy o anodd i nifer o ffermwyr.

Penderfynir yn gywir ar golled ganlyniadol ar sail y DU, fel y datganodd y Prif Weinidog yn gryf pan ymwebdd â Brynbuga.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I thank you, Carwyn, for your visits to Caernarfon and Anglesey to discuss the effects of foot and mouth disease. You are aware of its grave effect on the island, not only on farmers who have lost stock and the farmers within the area of restricted movement, but also on the tourism industry. You heard that over the weekend.

I agree totally with the speakers who have said that animal welfare is one of the issues that need to be resolved soon. The cull is proceeding in Anglesey and will be completed soon, but there are real problems with animal welfare for farmers who are not

ffermwyr nad ydynt yn rhan o'r cynllun difa. Gobeithiaf y gallwch ymateb i bryder gwirioneddol ynghylch hynny.

Gwn y byddwch yn dysgu o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd o ran ystyried lleoliadau megis Penhesgyn, Mona ac Epynt. Mae'n hanfodol y rhoddir gwybodaeth gynnari'r gymuned leol ynghylch safleoedd posibl, yn hytrach na bod y penderfyniad yn taro'r gymuned fel boltt, sydd yn ei harwain i ymateb yn y ffordd a wnaed yn y dyddiau diwethaf, nid yn unig yn Epynt ond hefyd yn Ynys Môn.

Fe'ch atgoffaf, at bwrrpas y cofnod, nad Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn sydd yn berchen ar safle Penhesgyn, ond cwmni ar y cyd rhwng Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn a Chyngor Gwynedd. Penderfyniad y cwmni ydoedd yn wreiddiol i beidio â chaniatáu defnyddio Penhesgyn, nid penderfyniad y Cyngor ei hun. Mae'n bwysig cofnodi hynny. Mae'n bwysig i barhau â'r dialog gyda'r cymunedau lleol ac i sicrhau pan ofynnir cwestiynau diliys y rhoddir yr wybodaeth angenrheidiol cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ynghylch eich pwyt am roi gwybodaeth gynnari'r gymuned leol ynghylch safleoedd posibl i gladdu anifeiliaid, mewn byd perffaith hoffem gysylltu ac ymgynghori, ond nid oes gennym lawer o amser. Yr ydym yn gwneud ein gorau er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn deall y ffeithiau. Nid yw ymgynghoriad llawn yn ymarferol ar hyn o bryd. Derbyniaf ei bod yn bwysig fod pobl yn cael gwybodaeth tra bo'r sefyllfa'n parhau. Dywedais wrth y bobl ym Mhenhesgyn a'r bobl sydd yn agos i'r Epynt y byddwn yn croesawu sefydlu pwylgor cyswllt â hwy ac â'r awdurdodau er mwyn i bobl wybod beth sydd yn digwydd. Mae'n holol naturiol bod pobl eisiau gwybod beth sydd yn digwydd—nid yw'r broses yn un gyfrinachol. Os oes gan bobl gwestiynau, felly, yr wyf yn ddigon hapus iddynt ddewis cynrychiolwyr a all ofyn cwestiynau i'r milfeddygon ac i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd er mwyn iddynt gael atebion. Mae'r drws ar agor ar gyfer hynny.

10:15 a.m.

Cwmni preifat sydd biau safle Penhesgyn. A private company owns the Penhesgyn site.

part of that cull. I hope that you can respond to the real concern about that.

I know that you will learn lessons from what has happened regarding considering locations such as Penhesgyn, Mona and Epynt. It is crucial that information regarding possible locations is disseminated early on within the local community, rather than the decision hitting the community like a bolt out of the blue, which leads them to respond in the way that they have done over the past few days, not only in Epynt but also in Anglesey.

I remind you, for the purpose of the record, that it is not the Isle of Anglesey County Council that owns the Penhesgyn site, but a joint company of Isle of Anglesey County Council and Gwynedd Council. It was the company's decision originally not to permit the use of Penhesgyn, not the decision of the Council itself. It is important to record that. It is important to continue the dialogue with the local communities and to ensure that when valid questions are asked, the necessary information is provided as soon as possible.

**Carwyn Jones:** With regard to your point that early information is disseminated within the local community regarding possible animal burial sites, in a perfect world we would want to contact and consult, but we do not have much time. We are doing our best to ensure that people understand the facts. Full consultation is not practical at the moment. I accept the importance of people being informed while the situation continues. I told people at Penhesgyn and people close to the Epynt that I would welcome establishing a liaison committee with them and with the authorities so that people know what is going on. It is quite natural that people want to know what is going on—it is not a confidential process. If people have questions, therefore, I am more than happy for them to choose representatives who can ask questions of the vets and the Environment Agency so that they can have answers. The door is open for that.

Nid oedd problem gan y cwmni ynglŷn â defnyddio'r safle. Nid oedd y cyngor eisiau inni ddefnyddio'r safle ar y dechrau, wedyn newidiodd ei feddwl. Nid wyf yn beirniadau'r cyngor am wneud hynny. Yr ydym eisiau cydweithio'n agos â'r cyngor. Dyna'r sefyllfa, ac yr ydym yn awr yn defnyddio'r safle, sef prif ddewis Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd.

**Delyth Evans:** Oherwydd prinder amser, gofynnaf un cwestiwn penodol ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa ar fynydd Epynt. Mae pryderon y gallai'r haint ddianc o'r lorïau wrth iddynt ddringo'r rhiw serth at y safle. Pa sierwydd allwch chi ei roi na fydd hyn yn digwydd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni fydd unrhyw beth yn dianc o'r lorïau. Gallwn fod 100 y cant yn sier o hynny. Clywyd yr un ddadl pan oeddem yn symud cyrff o'r Gaerwen i Widnes. Yr oedd pobl yn dweud bryd hynny y byddai'r clwyf yn lledu ar hyd yr A55. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Ni all y lorïau adael y ffermydd nes bod y milfeddygon yn dweud bod y lori'n ddiogel. Caiff y lorïau eu profi er mwyn sicrhau nad oes unrhyw bosiblwrwydd i ddim byd ddianc ohonynt. Mae'r milfeddygon ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, felly, yn hapus bod y lorïau yn holol ddiogel.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gofynnais gyfres o gwestiynau i chi ddoe, a chyflwynnais yr wybodaeth honno i Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin ac i bobl yng Nghaerfyrddin. Mae gennys un cwestiwn penodol ynglŷn â'r Epynt. A allwch roi gwarant inni nad oes unrhyw fgythiad i'r ardal sydd yn glir yn Sir Gaerfyrddin oddi wrth y safle llosgi sydd o fewn 50 llath i'r ffin—sydd yn benderfyniad cwbl anghyfrifol—a'r safle claddu? Dylai bwletin gwybodaeth Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd fod wedi ei gyhoeddi yr wythnos diwethaf, a dylid fod wedi ymgynghori. Mae'n warthus nad oes ymgynghori. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni gladdu a llosgi yn rhywle, ond a allwch roi gwarant o hynny i bobl Sir Gaerfyrddin sydd yn poeni'n ddybryd am y sefyllfa?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n holol naturiol bod pobl yn poeni pan fo hyn yn digwydd. Ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddywedodd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r milfeddygon, yr wyf yn

The company did not have a problem with us using the site. The council did not want us to use the site at first, then it changed its mind. I do not criticise the council for doing that. We want to co-operate closely with the council. That is the situation, and we are now using the site, which was the Environment Agency's first choice.

**Delyth Evans:** Due to lack of time, I will ask one specific question about the situation on Epynt mountain. There are concerns that the disease could escape from the lorries as they climb the steep hill to the site. What assurance can you give that this will not happen?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nothing will escape from the lorries. We can be 100 per cent sure of that. The same argument was heard when we were moving carcasses from Gaerwen to Widnes. People said then that the disease would spread along the A55. That did not happen. The lorries cannot leave the farms until the vets say that they are safe. The lorries are tested to ensure that there is no possibility of anything escaping from them. The vets and the Environment Agency are happy, therefore, that the lorries are totally safe.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I asked you a series of questions yesterday, and I presented that information to Carmarthenshire County Council and to people in Carmarthen. I have one specific question about the Epynt. Can you give us an assurance that there is no threat to the clear area in Carmarthenshire from the incineration site, which is within 50 yards of the border—which is a totally irresponsible decision—and the burial site? The Environment Agency information bulletin should have been issued last week, and there should have been consultation. It is appalling that there is no consultation. I accept that we must bury and burn somewhere, but can you give the people of Carmarthenshire, who are deeply worried about the situation, that assurance?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is totally natural that people worry when this happens. Regarding what the Environment Agency and the vets have said, I am happy that there is no

hapus nad oes perygl sylweddol i'r clwyf ledu i Sir Gâr, nac i ardaloedd eraill. Nod y difa yw sicrhau bod y clwyf yn cael ei ladd. Pe baem yn lledu'r clwyf wrth fynd â chyrrff i lawr i'r Epynt, byddem yn ymladd yn ein herbyn ein hunain. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r milfeddygon wedi edrych ar y safle, ac maent yn hapus nad oes perygl sylweddol o gwbl.

**Kirsty Williams:** In expressing your regret, which we all share, of the injury to the police officer that occurred in the early hours of Sunday morning on Epynt, do you also regret the deplorable lack of consultation with the wider communities of Llywel, Senny Bridge, Crai and Trecastell? Do you also regret the failure to find a site for the disposal of carcasses from the Montgomeryshire area in Montgomeryshire itself? Do you also regret the deplorable lack of information that the Environment Agency has been able to supply to date? You mention early information—I was contacted by a farmer whose land is approximately 20 meters from a burning site. He has received no information about the consequences that this may or may not have for his stock. When I asked the Environment Agency to provide scientific information regarding the geology and the hydrology of the Epynt site, it was unable to do so. It had not conducted any scientific testing—

substantial risk of the disease spreading into Carmarthenshire, or into other areas. The aim of the cull is to ensure that the disease is eradicated. If we were to spread the disease as we take carcasses down to the Epynt, we would be fighting against ourselves. The Environment Agency and the vets have looked at the site, and they are happy that there is no substantial risk at all.

**Kirsty Williams:** Wrth fynegi eich bod yn gresynu, yr ydym oll yn rhannu hynny, ynglŷn â'r anaf i swyddog yr heddlu a ddigwyddodd yn ystod oriau cynnar fore Sul ar yr Epynt, a ydych hefyd yn gresynnu at y diffyg gwarthus mewn ymgynghori gyda chymunedau ehangach Llywel, Pont Senni, Crai a Threcastell? A ydych hefyd yn gresynnu'r methiant i ddod o hyd i safle ar gyfer gwaredu carcasau o ardal Sir Drefaldwyn yn Sir Drefaldwyn ei hun? A ydych hefyd yn gresynnu at y diffyg gwarthus mewn gwybodaeth a ddarparwyd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd hyd yn hyn? Crybwyllwch wybodaeth gynnar—cysylltodd ffermwyr â mi yr oedd ei dir tua 20 metr o safle llosgi. Ni dderbyniodd unrhyw wybodaeth ar yr effaith y gallai neu na allai ei gael ar ei anifeiliaid. Pan ofynnais i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ddarparu gwybodaeth wyddonol yn ymneud â daeareg a hydroleg safle'r Epynt, ni allai wneud hynny. Ni chynhaliodd unrhyw brofion gwyddonol—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are not the main speaker for the Liberal Democrats. I have called Mick Bates, and the other main speakers. Please confine yourself to one question.

**Kirsty Williams:** It was basing its information on having looked in the ground and dug a few holes.

**Carwyn Jones:** The Environment Agency has prepared a full brief. It is not true that it simply looked in the ground and dug a few holes. A full geological survey has been conducted in the area. Therefore, it is fully aware of the geology of the area. The Environment Agency's brief will be made available. As I have said many times, we have looked, and continue to look, at other areas of Powys. There is a full-time army

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid chi yw'r prif siaradwr ar gyfer y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Galwais ar Mick Bates, a'r prif siaradwyr eraill. A wnewch chi gyfyngu eich hun i un cwestiwn.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr oedd ei gwybodaeth yn seiliedig ar edrych yn y ddaear a phalu ambell i dwll.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi paratoi briff llawn. Nid yw'n wir eu bod ond wedi edrych yn y ddaear a phalu ambell i dwll. Cynhalwyd arolwg daearegol llawn yn yr ardal. Felly, mae'n llwyr ymwybodol o ddaeareg yr ardal. Bydd briff Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar gael. Fel y dywedais sawl gwaith, rydym wedi edrych, ac yn parhau i edrych, ar ardaloedd eraill ym Mhowys. Mae swyddog

officer who assesses other possible burial areas. He has not yet found an other area. I met Kirsty at the site on Saturday. She has conducted herself properly in representing her constituents and has a perfect right to do that. However, it is extremely unhelpful for the local Member of Parliament to tell residents at the site at Epynt that he and Powys County Council will find an alternative site by Monday. We have not heard anything since. That is not helpful.

**Nick Bourne:** Like Kirsty Williams and Rhodri Glyn Thomas, I am concerned about the lack of consultation on the Epynt site. I know that it is an infected area in the sense that Powys is an infected area. However, I hope that the Minister will clarify that there are no cases in the immediate vicinity of Epynt. That is what has caused the greatest concern. Although the site is less than a mile from the Carmarthenshire border, there was no consultation with officers or anyone else in that county. This is an object lesson in how not to identify a site. Will the Minister also comment on the fact that Southerndown golf club, in his constituency, is re-opening, against the wishes of many people who suspect it to be a danger?

**Carwyn Jones:** I declare an interest as my father is a member of Southerndown golf club. I have held discussions with the golf club. I firmly believe that, in the face of veterinary advice, while there is livestock on the course, it should not be opened. I have said that all along. If veterinary advice is that the course should remain closed, so be it. I say that with full expectation of domestic strife when I return home tonight.

It is not helpful that people such as Nick tell protesters at the Epynt site that this is a Lib Lab conspiracy.

**Nick Bourne:** I did not say that.

**Carwyn Jones:** I am only quoting what local people have told me. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Answer the question.’]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister

llawn amser o'r fyddin sydd yn asesu ardaloedd claddu posibl eraill. Nid yw wedi canfod ardal arall eto. Cyfarfum â Kirsty ar y safle ar ddydd Sadwrn. Bu'n ymddwyn yn briodol wrth gynrychioli ei hetholwyr ac mae ganddi berffaith hawl i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n holol ddi-fudd i'r Aelod Seneddol lleol ddweud wrth drigolion ar y safle ar fynydd Epynt y bydd ef a Chyngor Sir Powys yn darganfod safle arall erbyn dydd Llun. Ni chlywsom unrhyw beth ers hynny. Nid yw hynny'n ddefnyddiol.

**Nick Bourne:** Fel Kirsty Williams a Rhodri Glyn Thomas, yr wyf yn bryderus ynglŷn â diffyg ymgynghori a fu ar safle'r Epynt. Gwn ei bod yn ardal heintus yn yr ystyr bod Powys yn ardal heintus. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn egluro na cheir unrhyw achosion yng nghyffiniau'r Epynt. Dyma'r hyn a achosodd y pryder mwyaf. Er bod y safle yn llai na milltir o ffin Sir Gaerfyrddin, nid ymgynghorwyd â swyddogion neu ag unrhyw un arall yn y sir honno. Mae hon yn engraifft dda o sut i beidio â nodi safle. A wnaiff y Gweinidog wneud sylwadau hefyd ar y ffaith bod clwb golff Southerndown, yn ei etholaeth, yn ailagor, yn erbyn dymuniadau llawer o bobl sydd yn amau ei fod yn beryglus?

**Carwyn Jones:** Datganaf ddiddordeb gan fod fy nhad yn aelod o glwb golff Southerndown. Cynhaliais drafodaethau gyda'r clwb golff. Credaf yn gryf, yn wyneb cyngor milfeddygol, tra bod da byw ar y cwrs, na ddylid ei agor. Dywedais hynny o'r cychwyn. Os dywed cyngor milfeddygol na ddylid agor y cwrs, bydded felly. Dywedaf hynny gan lawn ddisgwyl anghyd fod teuluol pan ddychwelaf adref heno.

Nid yw'n ddefnyddiol bod pobl fel Nick yn dweud wrth y protestwyr ar safle'r Epynt bod hwn yn gynllwyn rhwng y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Blaid Lafur.

**Nick Bourne:** Ni ddywedais hynny.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dim ond dyfynnu'r hyn a ddywedodd y bobl leol wrthyf yr wyf. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: ‘Atebwch y cwestiwn.’]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ateb

is answering the question asked by the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives.

**Carwyn Jones:** I know that there is a general election pending, but it is important that all Members are responsible.

### **Datganiad ar Asesiadau Fferm Gyfan o Indrawn a Addaswyd yn Enetig Statement on Farm-scale Evaluation of Genetically Modified Maize**

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** Late on Tuesday, 3 April, the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions published the locations of the sites in England and Wales where genetically modified maize is set to be planted this spring as part of the programme of farm-scale evaluations of genetically modified crops. In light of the Assembly's stated policy of opposition to GM trialling in Wales, I was disappointed to note that three of the proposed sites are in Wales; one in Sealand in Flintshire and the other two in Mathry in Pembrokeshire. Details of these, together with six-figure grid references for all 28 sites, are available on the DETR's website. The crop to be grown has marketing consent from the European Union under part C of European Directive 90/220. The United Kingdom Government, via DETR, will now write to parish and community councils in whose areas the sites are located to explain the nature and the purpose of the farm-scale evaluations.

DETR is the lead UK department for the programme of farm-scale evaluations. It is responsible for implementing the provisions of the relevant European directives in the UK. That being the case, and knowing that the part C trial announcement was imminent, I wrote to Michael Meacher MP on 23 March setting out my concerns about the potential impact of the GM trials on non-GM production—on organic production in particular—in Wales. I stated that, should trial sites in Wales be announced, I would ask the Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment to conduct a full scientific assessment before planting went ahead. I also stated that, if my concerns were not satisfied,

y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd gan Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwn fod etholiad cyffredinol ar y gorwel, ond mae'n bwysig bod yr holl Aelodau'n ymddwyn yn gyfrifol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Yn hwyr ddydd Mawrth, 3 Ebrill, cyhoeddodd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau leoliadau'r safleoedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr lle y bwriedir plannu indrawn a addaswyd yn enetig y gwanwyn hwn fel rhan o raglen asesiadau fferm gyfan o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. O ystyried y polisi gwrthwynebu a nodwyd gan y Cynulliad i dreialu cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yng Nghymru, yr oeddwn yn siomedig i nodi bod tri o'r safleoedd arfaethedig yng Nghymru; un yn Sealand yn Sir y Fflint a'r ddau arall ym Mathry yn Sir Benfro. Mae manylion y rhain, a chyfeiriadau grid chwe ffigur ar gyfer pob un o'r 28 safle, ar gael ar wefan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau. Mae gan y cnwd y bwriedir ei dyfu ganiatâd marchnata yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o dan ran C Cyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd 90/220. Bydd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, drwy Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau, yn awr yn ysgrifennu at gynghorau plwyf a chynghorau cymuned yn yr ardaloedd lle lleolir y safleoedd i esbonio natur a phwrpas asesiadau fferm gyfan.

Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau yw prif adran y DU ar gyfer y rhaglen asesiadau fferm gyfan. Mae'n gyfrifol am weithredu darpariaethau'r cyfarwyddebau Ewropeaidd perthnasol yn y DU. O ystyried hynny, a chan wybod fod y datganiad treial rhan C yn yr arfaeth, ysgrifennais at Michael Meacher AS ar 23 Mawrth yn nodi fy mhryderon am effaith bosibl y treialon cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig ar gynhyrchu cnydau heb eu haddasu'n enetig—ar gynhyrchu organig yn arbennig—yng Nghymru. Nodais, pe cyhoeddir safleoedd treialon yng Nghymru, y byddwn yn gofyn i'r Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd gynnal asesiad

I would consider whether it would be appropriate to exercise my powers under Section 110 of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 to issue an environmental prohibition notice. I have also expressed these concerns to the industry body, SCIMAC—the Supply Chain Initiative on Modified Agricultural Crops. In response to the announcement of the trial sites, my officials have asked ACRE—the Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment—to undertake a full scientific assessment of these sites prior to planting going ahead.

10:25 a.m.

**Richard Edwards:** Your statement has preempted my urgent question on the matter as the local Assembly Member for Mathry. I also welcome the actions that you propose. Do you agree that there are two crucial broad issues in this sorry mess? The first is the environmental and health issue, and I speak as chair of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee as well as the local Assembly Member. These trials are due to start before the end of the month for goodness sake. What possible time is there for a proper environmental impact assessment? I welcome your commitment to ensure that that will happen. The sites are on the doorstep of the Pembrokeshire National Park, which is a precious haven for wildlife and biodiversity. The sites are also in close proximity to organic farms. You mentioned your concern about the dangers of cross-pollination. I hear the UK Environment Minister talking about a green, clean organic future, except in north Pembrokeshire it seems. These trials will blight organic farming in Pembrokeshire. Given the crisis in agriculture, organic farming may be the only viable future for many people. Do you not think that there is something obscene about Government scientists, in the middle of a foot and mouth disease epidemic, parading about north Pembrokeshire for the benefit of a greedy, multi-national corporation to the detriment of the local people, the local economy and the local environment?

Do you agree that the second broad issue is a

gwyddonol llawn cyn i'r plannu fynd rhagddo. Nodais hefyd, oni fodlonir fy mhryderon, y byddwn yn ystyried pa un a fyddai'n briodol defnyddio fy mhwerau o dan Adran 110 Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 i gyhoeddi hysbysiad gwaharddiad amgylcheddol. Yr wyf hefyd wedi lleisia'r pryderon hyn i gorff y diwydiant, SCIMAC—sef Menter y Gadwyn Gyflenwi ar Gnydau Amaethyddol wedi'u Haddasu. Mewn ymateb i'r cyhoeddiad am y safleoedd treialu, gofynnodd fy swyddogion i'r Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd gynnal asesiad gwyddonol llawn o'r safleoedd hyn cyn i'r plannu fynd rhagddo.

**Richard Edwards:** Mae eich datganiad wedi rhagflaenu fy nghwestiwn brys ar y mater fel Aelod lleol o'r Cynulliad dros Mathry. Croesawaf innau hefyd y camau a gynigiwch. A gytunwch fod dau fater cyffredinol holl bwysig yn perthyn i'r achos truenus hwn? Y cyntaf yw'r mater amgylcheddol ac iechyd, a siaradaf fel cadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn ogystal ag Aelod lleol o'r Cynulliad. Bwriedir i'r treialon hyn ddechrau cyn diwedd y mis er mwyn dyn. O ble y daw'r amser ar gyfer asesiad priodol o effaith amgylcheddol? Croesawaf eich ymrwymiad i sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Mae'r safleoedd ar garreg drws Parc Cenedlaethol Sir Benfro, sydd yn noddfa werthfawr i fywyd gwylt a bioamrywiaeth. Mae'r safleoedd hefyd yn agos at ffermydd organig. Soniasoch am eich pryder ynghylch peryglon traws-beillio. Clywaf Weinidog dros yr Amgylchedd y DU yn sôn am ddyfodol gwyrdd, glân, organig ac eithrio gogledd Sir Benfro yn ôl pob golwg. Bydd y treialon hyn yn difetha ffermio organig yn Sir Benfro. O ystyried yr argyfwng mewn amaeth, efallai mai ffermio organig fydd yr unig ddyfodol dilys i lawer o bobl. Oni chredwch bod rhywbeth anweddus am wyddonwyr y Llywodraeth sydd, yng nghanol epidemig clwy'r traed a'r genau, yn gorymdeithio drwy ogledd Sir Benfro er budd corfforaeth farus, aml-wladol ar draul y bobl leol, yr economi leol a'r amgylchedd lleol?

A gytunwch fod yr ail fater cyffredinol yn

constitutional issue? Who does the DETR think it is acting in such an arrogant and contemptuous way? Has it forgotten that the Assembly has a GM free policy? Does it even care? Or is it just sticking two fingers up at us? Is the concordat we have with it worth the paper on which it is written? I am not surprised that the Tories are silent at present, because the landowner in question is the ex-loony right Tory MP, Tony Marlow. The DETR is behaving insensitively, irresponsibly and contemptuously. My office has been deluged with protests from constituents, and I fully sympathise with them. The Assembly's credibility is on the line. I ask you and the First Minister to get a grip. In addition to the proposals that you indicated, perhaps the Joint Ministerial Committee could be an appropriate avenue for resolving disputes between the UK Government and the devolved administrations. This is just not on. We must sort the DETR out, and we need to do so urgently.

**Carwyn Jones:** You are right to point out, Richard, that the scheduled start of the trials—as I understand it—is at the end of the month. However, it is important—in my view, and in the Assembly's view—that the full scientific evaluation has priority. If that is the case and if the planting time has to be put back, then so be it. We understand that we have legal powers in this matter, and we are investigating whether they should be used. At present, we are asking for a full scientific assessment. If the answer is no, we will take matters further.

With regard to your point about organic production, around 8,000 hectares of land is in organic production in Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire. Since learning that these sites had been identified—which was the beginning of the week—we have considered the situation. We have detailed site locations and we have identified 10 holdings in conversion or in full organic production within six miles of the trial sites. That is significant because six miles is the distance within which the Soil Association will make random checks to ensure organic production

fater cyfansoddiadol? Pwy yw Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau i weithredu mewn modd mor drahaus a dirmygus? A yw wedi anghofio bod gan y Cynulliad bolisi o sicrhau bod Cymru'n rhydd o gnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig? A oes ots ganddo hyd yn oed? Neu ai dim ond codi dau fys arnom y mae? A oes unrhyw werth i'r concordat sydd gennym ag ef? Ni synnaf fod y Toriaid yn dawel ar hyn o bryd, gan mai'r tirfeddiannwr dan sylw yw'r cyn AS Toriaidd ar y dde eithafol, Tony Marlow. Mae Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau yn ymddwyn yn ansensitif, yn anghyfrifol ac yn ddirmygus. Derbyniodd fy swyddfa lif o brotestiadau gan etholwyr, a chydymdeimlaf yn llawn â hwy. Mae hygrededd y Cynulliad yn y fantol. Gofynnaf ichi a Phrif Weinidog Cymru fynd i'r afael â'r mater. Yn ogystal â'r cynigion a nodwyd gennych, efallai y byddai Cydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion yn gyfrwng priodol i ddatrys anghydfodau rhwng Llywodraeth y DU a'r gweinyddiaethau a ddatganolwyd. Nid yw hyn yn dderbyniol. Rhaid inni roi Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau yn ei lle, a rhaid inni wneud hynny ar frys.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydych yn iawn, Richard, i nodi mai ar ddiwedd y mis—fel y deallaf i—y bwriedir cychwyn y treialon. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig—yn fy marn i, ac ym marn y Cynulliad—y rhoddir blaenoriaeth i'r asesiad gwyddonol llawn. Os mai dyna'r achos ac os oes rhaid gohirio'r amser plannu, dyna fydd rhaid ei wneud. Deallwn fod gennym bwerau cyfreithiol yn y mater hwn, ac yr ydym yn archwilio a ddylid eu defnyddio. Ar hyn o bryd, gofynnwn am asesiad gwyddonol llawn. Os mai na yw'r ateb, byddwn yn mynd â materion ymhellach.

O ran eich pwynt am gynhyrchu organig, defnyddir tua 8,000 hectar o dir ar gyfer cynhyrchu'n organig yn Sir Benfro a Sir Gaerfyrddin. Ers dysgu bod y safleoedd hyn wedi'u nodi—ar ddechrau'r wythnos—yr ydym wedi ystyried y sefyllfa. Mae gennym leoliadau safle manwl ac yr ydym wedi nodi 10 o ddaliadau sydd yn cael eu trawsnewid neu sydd â chynhyrchiant organig llawn o fewn chwe milltir o safleoedd y treialon. Mae hynny'n arwyddocaol oherwydd o fewn pellter o chwe milltir y bydd y Gymdeithas Bridd yn gwneud archwiliadau ar hap i

is not contaminated with GM organisms, which would be of concern.

**Nick Bourne:** Richard Edwards covered the policy side well. It was a cogent argument, but he unfortunately spoilt it with a wild rhetorical, pre-election flourish. The regrettable element here is the framework. It is a framework that is allowing two farmers—not just one, in any event—to go in for these GM trials. I will concentrate on the constitutional aspect. The Assembly has expressed its view on the policy issue. In fact, it was a Welsh Conservative motion that initially proposed a GM free Wales, and I am proud of that. However, on the constitutional issue, Minister, in a letter to the chairman of the Agriculture and Rural Affairs Committee, Glyn Davies, you stated that you were concerned about aspects of the farm scale evaluations and that you had intended to raise them at a meeting scheduled for 22 March. What did you know on 22 March? Did you know of the likelihood of trials in Wales and why was that information not shared at an earlier stage? We know that the First Minister only learned of this on Tuesday afternoon because he raised it at the European Affairs Committee yesterday. We know that the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development—although, presumably, he did know about it yesterday—did not raise the issue with Michael Meacher MP, although he met him yesterday. That is staggering. I know that the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development is an important man, but you would have thought that it would have registered on his radar that it was an important issue to raise with Michael Meacher yesterday. It is regrettable that that did not happen.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is just jealousy.

**Nick Bourne:** I would have raised it with Michael Meacher had I been there.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives is asking an intelligent question in an intelligent way, and

sicrhau na chaiff cynhyrchu organig ei ddifwyno ag organebau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig, a fyddai o bryder.

**Nick Bourne:** Cwmpasodd Richard Edwards yr ochr bolisi yn dda. Yr oedd yn ddadl argyhoeddiadol, ond yn anffodus cafodd ei ddifetha ganddo gyda thro rhethregol, cynetholiad. Yr elfen anffodus yma yw'r fframwaith. Mae'n fframwaith sydd yn caniatáu i ddau ffermwyr—nid dim ond un, mewn unrhyw achos—i wifoddoli ar gyfer y treialon cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig hyn. Byddaf yn canolbwytio ar yr agwedd gyfansoddiadol. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi lleisiai ei farn ar y mater polisi. Yn wir, cynnig gan Geidwadwyr Cymru a gynigiodd Cymru sydd yn rhydd o gnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yn y lle cyntaf, ac yr wyf yn falch o hynny. Fodd bynnag, ar y mater cyfansoddiadol, Weinidog, mewn llythyr i gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Materion Gwledig, Glyn Davies, nodasoch eich bod yn pryderu am agweddau ar yr asesiadau fferm gyfan a'ch bod wedi bwriadu eu codi mewn cyfarfod a drefnwyd ar gyfer 22 Mawrth. Beth oeddech chi'n ei wybod ar 22 Mawrth? A wyddech am debygolrwydd cynnal treialon yng Nghymru a pham na rannwyd yr wybodaeth honno yn gynharach? Gwyddom mai dim ond brynhawn ddydd Mawrth y daeth Prif Weinidog Cymru i wybod am hyn oherwydd cododd y mater yn y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ddoe. Gwyddom na chododd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd y mater—er, yn ôl pob tebyg, na wyddai amdano ddoe—gyda Michael Meacher AS, er iddo gwrdd ag ef ddoe. Mae hynny'n anhygoel. Gwn fod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn wr pwysig, ond byddech wedi meddwl y byddai ei radar wedi nodi ei fod yn fater pwysig i'w godi â Michael Meacher ddoe. Mae'n drueni na ddigwyddodd hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Dim ond cenfigen yw hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Byddwn i wedi ei godi â Michael Meacher pe byddwn wedi bod yno.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae Arweinwyr Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n gofyn cwestiwn deallus mewn ffordd ddeallus, a dylid

he should be allowed to continue.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for the Presiding Officer's impartiality. I will move on to the concordats, which concern many people. Perhaps they do not concern the administration, but they obviously, and quite rightly, concern ordinary Labour Members, even if they do not concern ordinary Liberal Democrat Members. The concordats are not worth the paper on which they are written. Some of them have not even been written on paper yet. However, what does the concordat with the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food say about this? We have been here before when Christine Gwyther was the Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development and we were ignored then. What is the process for involving us and why are we not involved now? It raises serious issues. When did you know about the likelihood of these trials, Minister, and why did you not raise these issues on 22 March? You clearly knew something then. What are you doing to ensure that this sorry state of affairs does not happen again?

**Carwyn Jones:** First, let us get one issue clear and deal with this leaked letter that has caused a great deal of amusement. It was addressed to all members of the GM strategy group. A number of people received that letter and if people had wanted a copy, all they had to do was ring my office. Glyn Davies was a recipient because he is part of the GM strategy group. The letter stated that I was concerned about some aspects of the farm-scale evaluations, which I wanted to mention to the group. The exact location of the sites was communicated to us on Monday evening on an embargoed basis.  
[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives has had an opportunity to ask his intelligent question. He cannot ask another from a sedentary position.

**Carwyn Jones:** If you are asking when did we know that sites in Wales would be considered, it was 1998. The three-year farm-

cariatáu iddo barhau.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am amhleidioldeb y Llywydd. Symudaf ymlaen i'r concordatau, sydd o bryder i lawer o bobl. Efallai nad ydynt o bryder i'r weinyddiaeth, ond mae'n amlwg, a hynny'n ddigon teg, eu bod o bryder i'r Aelodau Llafur cyffredin, hyd yn oed os nad ydynt o bryder i'r Aelodau Democrataidd Rhyddfrydol cyffredin. Nid oes unrhyw werth i'r concordatau hyn. Nid yw rhai ohonynt hyd yn oed wedi'u hysgrifennu ar bapur eto. Fodd bynnag, beth mae'r concordat gyda'r Weinyyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn ei ddweud am hyn? Buom yma o'r blaen pan oedd Christine Gwyther yn Ysgrifennydd dros Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a chawsom ein hanwybyddu bryd hynny. Beth yw'r broses ar gyfer ein cynnwys ni a pham na chawn ein cynnwys yn awr? Mae'n codi materion difrifol. Pa bryd oeddech yn gwybod am debygolrwydd y treialon hyn, Weinidog, a pham na chodasoch y materion hyn ar 22 Mawrth? Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn gwybod rhywbeth bryd hynny. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i sicrhau na fydd y llanastr hyn yn digwydd eto?

**Carwyn Jones:** I ddechrau, gadewch inni egluro un mater a mynd i'r afael â'r llythyr hwn a ddatgelwyd sydd wedi creu llawer o ddifyrrwch. Fe'i cyfeiriwyd at holl aelodau'r grŵp strategaeth cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig. Derbyniodd nifer o bobl y llythyr hwnnw ac os oedd pobl am gael copi, yr unig beth yr oedd yn rhaid iddynt ei wneud oedd ffonio fy swyddfa. Derbyniodd Glyn Davies gopi oherwydd ei fod yn rhan o'r grŵp strategaeth cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig. Nododd y llythyr fy mod yn poeni am rai agweddu ar yr asesiadau fferm gyfan, yr oeddwn am sôn amdanyst wrth y grŵp. Cyfathrebwyd union leoliad y safleoedd wrthym nos Lun dan embargo. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cafodd Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru gyfle i ofyn ei gwestiwn deallus. Ni all ofyn cwestiwn arall ar ei eistedd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Os oeddech yn gofyn pa bryd yr oeddem yn gwybod y byddai'r safleoedd yng Nghymru yn cael eu hystyried,

scale evaluation timetable was announced in 1998. Legally, all sites in the UK can be considered. Let me tell you what was done. On 18 January, I met with Michael Meacher and explained to him the National Assembly's concerns. On 22 January, I attended, together with Paul Murphy, the joint cabinet committee to consider the issue of GM crops. We strongly put forward the views of the National Assembly. On 1 February, I met with SCIMAC, which is the industry body responsible for proposing sites. It did not want to meet with us if the meeting was made public. In view of that fact, I met with SCIMAC. The meeting must have lasted for three hours. We put forward the Assembly's political position, and also, importantly, the scientific argument that no site in Wales should be used. SCIMAC would not give an undertaking that sites in Wales would not be used. It does not take a genius to work out that if somebody fails to promise not to do something, it is likely that they will do it, even though we had no confirmation at that stage that sites in Wales were to be considered.

10:35 a.m.

When it became known to us that the announcement was imminent, I sent two letters on 23 March, one to SCIMAC and the other to Michael Meacher at the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions. I made it clear in those letters what actions I would take if sites were announced in Wales. The decision to locate sites in Wales was taken at the beginning of this week. If I had known on 22 March where the sites were to be, I would obviously have had an effective crystal ball.

That action taken, we were informed on Monday on an embargoed basis that there were three sites selected in Wales. We were informed that the information would be made public on Wednesday but, nevertheless, it went out on Tuesday evening. As we now know that there are three sites in Wales, we have taken the action that I said we would, namely, I have written to ACRE, calling on it to conduct a full scientific evaluation of the sites and to look at the robustness of the

yn 1998 oedd hynny. Cyhoeddwyd yr asesiad fferm gyfan tair blynedd yn 1998. Yn gyfreithiol, gellir ystyried pob safle yn y DU. Gadewch imi ddweud wrthych beth a wnaethpwyd. Ar 18 Ionawr, cyfarfum â Michael Meacher ac esboniais bryderon y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol iddo. Ar 22 Ionawr, ynghyd â Paul Murphy, mynchais gydbwylgor y cabinet i ystyried cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Lleisiwyd barn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gennym yn gryf. Ar 1 Chwefror, cyfarfum â SCIMAC, sef y corff diwydiannol sydd yn gyfrifol am gynnig safleoedd. Nid oedd am gwrdd â ni pe rhyddhawyd gwybodaeth am y cyfarfod i'r cyhoedd. O ystyried yffaith honno, cyfarfum â SCIMAC. Rhaid bod y cyfarfod wedi para am dair awr. Cyflwynasom sefyllfa wleidyddol y Cynulliad, a hefyd, yn bwysicach, y trefniant gwydonol na ddylid defnyddio unrhyw safle yng Nghymru. Nid oedd SCIMAC yn fodlon addo na fyddai safleoedd yng Nghymru'n cael eu defnyddio. Nid oes angen bod yn athrylith i dybio os na all rhywun addo peidio â gwneud rhywbeth, mae'n debygol y byddant yn ei wneud, er nad oedd gennym unrhyw gadarnhad bryd hynny y cai safleoedd yng Nghymru eu hystyried.

Pan ddaeth yn hysbys inni fod y cyhoeddiad yn yr arfaeth, anfonais ddu lythyr ar 23 Mawrth, un at SCIMAC a'r llall at Michael Meacher yn Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau. Eglurais yn y llythyrau hynny pa gamau y byddwn yn eu cymryd pe bai safleoedd yn cael eu cyhoeddi yng Nghymru. Gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad i leoli safleoedd yng Nghymru ddechrau'r wythnos hon. Pe bawn yn gwybod ar 22 Mawrth ble byddai'r safleoedd, byddwn yn broffwyd.

Wedi cymryd y cam hwnnw, cawsom ein hysbysu ddydd Llun o dan embargo bod tri safle wedi'u dewis yng Nghymru. Cawsom ein hysbysu y cai'r wybodaeth ei rhyddhau i'r cyhoedd ddydd Mercher ond, serch hynny, fe'i rhyddhawyd nos Fawrth. Gan y gwyddom bellach fod tri safle yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi cymryd y camau y dywedais y byddem yn eu cymryd, sef, ysgrifennu at y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd, gan alw arno i gynnal asesiad

separation distances and the potential for contamination of neighbouring crops. That scientific assessment must take place before planting is allowed. I await ACRE's reply and, depending on what that reply is, I will further consider using the powers available to the Assembly.

gwyddonol llawn o'r safleoedd ac edrych ar gryfder y pellteroedd gwahanu a'r potensial ar gyfer difwyna cnydau cyfagos. Rhaid cynnal yr asesiad gwyddonol hwnnw cyn y caniateir plannu. Arhosaf am ateb gan y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd a, chan ddibynnau ar yr ateb hwnnw, byddaf yn ystyried ymhellach ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd ar gael i'r Cynulliad.

**Christine Gwyther:** I will concentrate on the local angle. All in all, Pembrokeshire has had a funny old decade. Restructuring of the oil industry has meant massive job losses. We all welcomed the peace dividend, but it also meant massive job losses at Ministry of Defence establishments across Pembrokeshire. None of us will ever forget the environmental and economic consequences of the Sea Empress disaster, and I am sure that I need not tell you anything about the foot and mouth disease crisis. Throughout these events in Pembrokeshire, tourism has dragged the local economy through and bailed out the county time and again. Tourism and the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park have now had another serious kick in the guts as a result of the threat of GM crops.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are the second person from the Labour group to question the Minister. Please limit yourself to one question.

**Christine Gwyther:** Will you join me, Minister, in my utter condemnation of this proposal, and will you do your utmost to stop it from going ahead? Will you make the findings of the scientific assessment public and totally transparent, because that is the only way that we will restore public confidence? Will you ensure that a business assessment is carried out, in conjunction with your colleague, Mike German, of what this threat might mean to a future tourism renaissance in west Wales?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not know at present what the legal status of the scientific assessment will be. If there is no reason for it not to be made public, then it will be made

**Christine Gwyther:** Canolbwytiaf ar yr ongl leol. At ei gilydd, mae Sir Benfro wedi cael degawd od iawn. Arweiniodd ailstrwythuro'r diwydiant olew at golli llawer o swyddi. Croesawodd pawb y difidend heddwch, ond yr oedd hefyd yn golygu y byddai llawer o swyddi'n cael eu colli yn sefydliadau'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ledled Sir Benfro. Nid anghofia'r un ohonom oblygiadau amgylcheddol ac economaidd trychineb y Sea Empress, ac yr wyf yn siŵr nad oes angen imi ddweud unrhyw beth wrthych am yr argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Drwy gydol y digwyddiadau hyn yn Sir Benfro, mae twristiaeth wedi llusgo'r economi leol trwyddyd ac wedi achub y sir dro ar ôl tro. Mae twristiaeth a Pharc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Sir Benfro wedi cael ergyd drom arall o ganlyniad i fygythiad cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Chi yw'r ail berson o'r grŵp Llafur i holi'r Gweinidog. Dylech gyfyngu eich hun i un cwestiwn.

**Christine Gwyther:** A ymunwch â mi, Weinidog, wrth gondemnio'r gynnig hwn yn llwyr, ac a wnewch eich gorau i'w atal rhag mynd yn ei flaen? A wnewch ryddhau canfyddiadau'r asesiad gwyddonol i'r cyhoedd a sicrhau eu bod yn hollol dryloyw, oherwydd dyna'r unig ffordd inni adfer hyder y cyhoedd? A fyddwch yn sicrhau y cynhelir asesiad busnes, ar y cyd â'ch cyd-Aelod, Mike German, o'r hyn y gallai'r bygythiad hwn ei olygu i adfywiad twristiaeth yng ngorllewin Cymru yn y dyfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ar hyn o bryd ni wn beth fydd statws cyfreithiol yr asesiad gwyddonol. Os nad oes rheswm iddo beidio â chael ei ryddhau i'r cyhoedd, yna gwneir hynny.

public. I will have to ensure that the legal position is checked thoroughly. The National Assembly made its view clear during last year's debate on this issue. It is my duty to push the National Assembly's policy to its limits, which I believe I have done. In doing so, I have met with Ministers from DETR and industry bodies and, on 23 March, I informed DETR and SCIMAC what our position would be if sites were selected in Wales. Now that we know that sites have been selected in Wales, we are pursuing the policy that we said we would and are awaiting ACRE's response.

Bydd rhaid imi sicrhau yr archwilar y sefyllfa gyfreithiol yn drylwyr. Lleisiodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei farn yn glir yn ystod trafodaeth y llynedd ar y mater hwn. Fy nyletswydd i yw gwthio polisi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'r eithaf, a chredaf imi wneud hynny. Wrth wneud hynny, cyfarfum â Gweinidogion o Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau a chyrff diwydiannol ac, ar 23 Mawrth, hysbysais Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau a SCIMAC o beth fyddai ein sefyllfa os dewiswyd safleoedd yng Nghymru. Gan y gwyddom bellach fod safleoedd wedi'u dewis yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn dilyn y polisi y dywedasom y byddem yn ei ddilyn ac yn aros am ymateb y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Christine and Richard have outlined the issue clearly and, therefore, nothing further needs to be said on that. As regard the process and implications of this, I am still not clear about when your officials knew that sites in Wales were being considered. We know when they knew that they were selected, but we do not know when they knew that they were being considered for selection. When did you know that? Did you know about it as soon as your officials did? Why, when you knew that this was under consideration, did you not call an emergency meeting of the GM strategy group? We have tried to maintain a cross-party position on this, but the current situation has now brought that into question. Do you agree that this decision shows a complete contempt for Welsh democracy on the part of the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions? Will you join me and Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales in demanding an apology from John Prescott for that disgraceful contempt?

Do you further agree that this mess illustrates the weakness of the current devolution settlement, in that the unanimous view of the National Assembly on such a vital issue can constitutionally and legally be ridden roughshod over by Westminster and Whitehall? I would like your views, Minister, on what effect you think that this situation

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae Christine a Richard wedi amlinellu'r mater yn glir ac, felly, nid oes angen dweud unrhyw beth pellach ynghylch hynny. O ran y broses a goblygiadau hyn, nid wyf yn glir o hyd pa bryd y gwyddai eich swyddogion fod safleoedd yng Nghymru'n cael eu hystyried. Gwyddom pa bryd y gwyddant iddynt gael eu dewis, ond ni wyddom pa bryd y gwyddant eu bod yn cael eu hystyried ar gyfer eu dethol. Pa bryd y gwydddech hynny? A wyddech cyn gynted ag yr oedd eich swyddogion yn gwybod hynny? Pan wyddoch fod hyn yn cael ei ystyried, pam na wnaethoch alw cyfarfod brys o'r grŵp strategaeth cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig? Yr ydym wedi ceisio cynnal sefyllfa drawsbleidiol ar hyn, ond mae'r sefyllfa bresennol wedi codi amheuon ynghylch hynny. A gytunwch bod y penderfyniad hwn yn dangos dirmyg llwyr tuag at ddemocratiaeth ar ran Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau? A ymunwch â mi a Phlaid Cymru—The Party of Wales wrth fynnu cael ymddiheuriad gan John Prescott am y dirmyg gwarthus hwnnw?

A gytunwch ymhellach bod y llanastr hwn yn dangos gwendid y setliad datganoli presennol, yn yr ystyr y gall San Steffan a Whitehall sathru yn gyfansoddiadol ac yn gyfreithiol ar farn unfryd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar fater mor hanfodol? Hoffwn gael eich barn, Weinidog, ar ba effaith y credwch y caiff y sefyllfa hon ar y cytundeb

will have on the partnership agreement, given the strength of the views of your Liberal Democrat colleagues on this issue. Do you agree that their credibility is called into question if they continue to stay in a Government that has presided over this kind of mess?

On a practical level, I would like a little more detail on the steps you can take, in addition to the ones outlined, to lawfully prevent these trials. The strength of feeling locally on that is clear. Finally, since your eye has, understandably, been off the ball on this issue, will you ask the First Minister to transfer responsibility for GM matters temporarily to the Minister for Environment, who may be better placed to give them her full attention?

**Carwyn Jones:** Who said that there was a general election in June? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'No-one.']}

Well, there may well be one. That is on a without prejudice basis.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There is no election in the Assembly in June.

**Carwyn Jones:** As far as taking my eye off the ball is concerned, that is clearly not so, as I wrote two letters on 23 March, which was right in the middle of this foot and mouth disease crisis. There is clearly no question of my eye being taken off the ball. Throughout this process, in the absence of an undertaking by SCIMAC that a Welsh site would not be proposed, we had to assume that sites in Wales were still under active consideration. If someone had asked me whether we would have sites in Wales, all that I could have said at the time was that we might or might not. The policy of the National Assembly is clear on this. I intend to follow and have followed that policy. It was clear that we did not know that these three sites were selected in Wales until Monday. There is no question of us knowing of these three sites on 22 March because the decision had not been taken at that stage.

partneriaeth, o ystyried cryfder barn eich cyd-Aelodau Democraidaid Rhyddfrydol ar y mater hwn. A gytunwch bod amheuaeth ynghylch eu hygrededd os byddant yn parhau i aros mewn Llywodraeth sydd wedi llywyddu dros y math hwn o lanastr?

Ar lefel ymarferol, hoffwn gael ychydig mwy o fanylion ar y camau y gallwch eu cymryd, yn ogystal â'r camau a amlinellwyd, i atal y treialon hyn yn gyfreithiol. Mae cryfder y teimlad lleol ar hynny'n glir. Yn olaf, gan ei bod yn amlwg na fuoch yn canolbwytio ar y mater hwn, a ofynnwch i Brif Weinidog Cymru drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros faterion cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig dros dro i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, sydd o bosibl mewn gwell sefyllfa i roi ei sylw llawn iddynt?

**Carwyn Jones:** Pwy ddywedodd bod etholiad cyffredinol ym mis Mehefin? [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Neb. ']

Wel, efallai y bydd un. Mae hynny ar sail dimyrwymiad.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni fydd etholiad yn y Cynulliad ym mis Mehefin.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cyn belled ag y mae peidio â chanolbwytio yn y cwestiwn, yn amlwg nid yw hynny'n wir, oherwydd imi ysgrifennu dau lythyr ar 23 Mawrth, a oedd yn union yng nghanol yr argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau hwn. Mae'n amlwg nad oes unrhyw gwestiwn i mi fethu â chanolbwytio. Drwy gydol y broses hon, yn absenoldeb addewid gan SCIMAC na chaiff safle yng Nghymru ei chynnig, yr oedd rhaid inni gymryd yn ganiataol bod safleoedd yng Nghymru'n cael eu hystyried. Pe bai rhywun wedi gofyn imi a fyddai gennym safleoedd yng Nghymru, yr unig beth y gallwn fod wedi'i ddweud ar y pryd oedd efallai neu efallai ddim. Mae polisi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn glir ar hyn. Bwriadaf ddilyn ac yr wyf wedi dilyn y polisi hwnnw. Yr oedd yn glir na wyddom y dewiswyd y tri safle hwn yng Nghymru tan ddydd Llun. Nid oes unrhyw gwestiwn ein bod yn gwybod am y tri safle hyn ar 22 Mawrth oherwydd nad oedd y penderfyniad wedi'i wneud ar y pryd.

You quite sensibly asked where we go next and what we can lawfully do. I have written to ACRE asking it to undertake a full re-evaluation along the lines that I have already mentioned. If the answer is not to my satisfaction, I will consider issuing a prohibition notice, under the provisions of the Environmental Protection Act 1990, to ensure that a full scientific assessment is carried out. That is the proper and lawful line to take.

**Mick Bates:** I thank Helen Mary for recognising that the source of this policy is the Liberal Democratic Party.

We all regret the actions of the DETR in commissioning trials of genetically modified crops in Flintshire and Pembrokeshire, particularly given the Assembly's clearly stated policy. These actions are insensitive and potentially irresponsible at a time of agricultural crisis and restrictions on movement in the countryside. The DETR and the farmers concerned should pull out of these experiments before the crops are planted.

I will raise three issues. First, you referred, Minister, to issuing a prohibition notice under the Environmental Protection Act 1990. Why wait? Why not do that now? Secondly, on the question of organic farms, what happens if the Soil Association finds GM contamination on neighbouring farms? Who would be liable for the economic loss to an organic farmer whose livelihood is lost through GM contamination? Finally, is the DETR likely to announce further trials without consultation?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not expect the DETR to announce further trials, because the timetable set out in 1998 was a public timetable. We do not have any Part B consent crops being grown in Wales, so that I would not expect that. As far as prohibition notices are concerned, the legal advice is that we write first and then consider prohibition notices.

Gofynasoch yn ddigon synhwyrol beth yw'r cam nesaf a beth y gallwn ei wneud yn gyfreithiol. Ysgrifennais at y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd yn gofyn iddo gynnal ailasesiad llawn i'r perwyl y soniais amdano eisoes. Os na fyddaf yn fodlon â'r ateb, byddaf yn ystyried cyhoeddi hysbysiad gwahardd, o dan ddarpariaethau Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990, i sicrhau y cynhelir asesiad gwyddonol llawn. Dyna'r cam cywir a chyfreithlon i'w gymryd.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i Helen Mary am nodi mai Plaid y Democraidaid Rhyddfrydol yw ffynhonnell y polisi hwn.

Mae pawb ohonom yn gresynu at weithredoedd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau wrth gomisiynu treialon cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn Sir y Fflint a Sir Benfro, yn enwedig o ystyried polisi clir y Cynulliad. Mae'r gweithredoedd hyn yn ansensitif gyda'r potensial o fod yn anghyfrifol ar amser o argyfwng amaethyddol a chyfyngiadau ar symud yng nghefn gwlad. Dylai Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau a'r ffermwyr dan sylw dynnu'n ôl o'r arbrofion hyn cyn i'r cnydau gael eu plannu.

Codaf dri mater. Yn gyntaf, cyfeiriasoch, Weinidog, at gyhoeddi hysbysiad gwahardd o dan Ddeddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990. Pam aros? Pam na ellir gwneud hynny yn awr? Yn ail, ar y cwestiwn o ffermydd organig, beth fydd yn digwydd os bydd y Gymdeithas Bridd yn canfod difwyniad o gnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig ar ffermydd cyfagos? Pwy fyddai'n atebol am y golled economaidd i ffermwyr organig sydd yn colli ei fywoliaeth drwy ddifwyniad o gnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig? Yn olaf, a yw Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau yn debygol o gyhoeddi treialon pellach heb ymgynggori?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni ddisgwyliaf i Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau gyhoeddi treialon pellach, oherwydd yr oedd yr amserlen a sefydlwyd yn 1998 yn un gyhoeddus. Ni chaiff unrhyw gnydau caniatâd Rhan B eu tyfu yng Nghymru, felly ni fyddwn yn disgwyl hynny. O ran hysbysiadau gwahardd, y cyngor cyfreithiol

There is no question of these crops being planted in the meantime. We are guarding against that eventuality. The first action is to write to ACRE and take it from there. There has been a preliminary legal opinion on this, and that is the way that we intend to play it. With regard to GM contamination, the initial legal advice suggests that liability for contamination of other premises by GM crops would rest with the farmer planting the GM crop.

yw y dylem ysgrifennu'n gyntaf ac yna ystyried hysbysiadau gwahardd. Nid oes cwestiwn i'r cnydau hyn gael eu plannu yn y cyfamser. Yr ydym yn gwarchod rhag y posibilrwydd hwnnw. Y cam cyntaf yw ysgrifennu at y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd a datblygu o hynny. Cafwyd barn gyfreithiol ragarweiniol ar hyn, a dyna sut y bwriadwn weithredu. O ran difwyniad o gnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig, awgryma'r cyngor cyfreithiol cychwynnol mai'r ffermwyr sydd yn plannu'r cnwd a addaswyd yn enetig fyddai'n atebol am ddifwyno eiddo arall gan gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

**Peter Rogers:** You should never have allowed this issue to get so far. You have taken your eye off the ball, and it shows an unacceptable lack of judgment. It leaves you with no option other than to have a showdown. You have already threatened your colleagues in London with the Environmental Protection Act 1990. The burden of proof is on you to demonstrate a calculable risk to the environment if these trials proceed. What will happen if ACRE does not save you?

**Peter Rogers:** Ni ddylech fod wedi caniatáu i'r mater hwn fynd mor bell. Yr ydych wedi methu â chanolbwytio, ac mae'n dangos diffyg crebwyll annerbyniol. Nid oes gennych ddewis ond gwrtihdaro benben. Yr ydych eisoes wedi bygwth eich cyd-Aelodau yn Llundain â Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990. Mae baich y prawf arnoch chi i arddangos risg fesuradwy i'r amgylchedd os bydd y treialon hyn yn parhau. Beth fydd yn digwydd os na fydd y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd yn eich achub?

10:45 a.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** We have had several discussions with DETR and SCIMAC on this issue. Our points have not been accepted. The National Assembly's views have been put forward as forcefully as possible to those making the decisions. We must ensure that we take all possible steps to protect our position. I am concerned about the possible effects on organic farming within the areas where GM crops will be planted. A full scientific assessment is needed to assess the situation. You are correct to say that we must show that there would be an unacceptable risk to the environment. We are therefore demanding that a full scientific assessment be carried out.

**Ron Davies:** I reassure you that Peter Rogers's views are not widely held in the Assembly. I think that you have handled the matter correctly. Procedures must be followed and I think that you have followed them in the way that is most likely to

**Carwyn Jones:** Cawsom sawl trafodaeth ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau a SCIMAC ar y mater hwn. Ni dderbyniwyd ein pwyntiau. Cyflwynwyd barn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mor rymus â phosibl i'r rheini sydd yn gwneud y penderfyniadau. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cymryd pob cam possibl i ddiogelu ein sefyllfa. Yr wyf yn poeni am yr effeithiau possibl ar ffermio organig o fewn yr ardaloedd lle caiff cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig eu plannu. Mae angen asesiad gwyddonol llawn i asesu'r sefyllfa. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod rhaid inni ddangos y byddai risg annerbyniol i'r amgylchedd. Felly mynnwn y cynhelir asesiad gwyddonol llawn.

**Ron Davies:** Gallaf eich sicrhau na chytunir â barn Peter Rogers yn gyffredinol yn y Cynulliad. Credaf eich bod wedi ymdrin â'r mater yn gywir. Rhaid dilyn gweithdrefnau a chredaf eich bod wedi eu dilyn yn y ffordd fwyaf tebygol o sicrhau'r canlyniad y mae'r

guarantee the outcome the National Assembly wants. If you find yourself in a position where you have to serve a prohibition notice, the National Assembly will support you and expect you to do that. During the recess, will you bear in mind that if you have to serve a prohibition notice, it may be necessary to recall the Assembly in order for you to have our support before you take action?

**Carwyn Jones:** Recalling the Assembly is a matter for the Llywydd. If ACRE's reply were unsatisfactory the GM strategy group would be reconvened.

**Jocelyn Davies:** How do you account for the DETR's stance on crop trials in Wales? We were told last May that the Flintshire trial was an error because officials thought that Sealand was in England and that they would make every effort to move it. This year they have proceeded with a further three trials. Do you think that there is a connection between their change of attitude and the Assembly flexing its muscles last October in refusing to approve the UK list regulations?

**Carwyn Jones:** I was not responsible for this portfolio last May. There was confusion over whether the farm was in England or Wales. That is regrettable but that was the position. I cannot answer for the actions of the DETR. All of the National Assembly's concerns on this matter have been expressed to the relevant authorities in writing and orally.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am ei gael. Os byddwch yn canfod eich hun mewn sefyllfa lle mae'n rhaid ichi gyflwyno hysbysiad gwahardd, bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn eich cefnogi ac yn disgwyl ichi wneud hynny. Yn ystod y toriad, a gofiwch os bydd rhaid ichi gyflwyno hysbysiad gwahardd, gallai fod yn angenrheidiol galw'r Cynulliad yn ôl er mwyn ichi gael ein cefnogaeth cyn ichi weithredu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mater i'r Llywydd yw ailalw'r Cynulliad. Pe bai ateb y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd yn annerbyniol byddai'r grŵp strategaeth cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yn cael ei ailgynnnull.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Sut ydych yn esbonio safbwyt Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnididaeth a'r Rhanbarthau ar dreialon cnydau yng Nghymru? Dywedwyd wrthym fis Mai diwethaf bod treial Sir y Fflint yn gamgymeriad oherwydd bod swyddogion yn credu bod Sealand yn Lloegr ac y byddant yn gwneud pob ymdrech i'w symud. Eleni maent wedi mynd ymlaen â thri threial arall. A gredwch fod cysylltiad rhwng y newid yn eu hagwedd a'r Cynulliad yn dangos ei rym fis Hydref diwethaf drwy wrthod cymeradwyo rheoliadau rhestr y DU?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid fi oedd yn gyfrifol am y portffolio hwn fis Mai diwethaf. Yr oedd dryswch yngylch a oedd y fferm yng Nghymru neu yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n resyn ond dyna oedd y sefyllfa. Ni allaf ateb dros weithredoedd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnididaeth a'r Rhanbarthau. Lleisiwyd holl bryderon y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar y mater hwn i'r awdurdodau perthnasol yn ysgrifenedig ac ar lafar.

## **Datganiad ar Ddyfodol Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru Statement on the Future of the Wales Millennium Centre**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** On behalf of the First Minister and the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language, I am making a statement today on the Wales Millennium Centre in view of the significant financial implications for the Assembly if it agrees to support this project.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Ar ran prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, gwnaf ddatganiad heddiw ar Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru yng ngoleuni'r goblygiadau ariannol arwyddocaol i'r Cynulliad os cytuna i gefnogi'r prosiect hwn. Byddwch wedi gweld

You will have seen the supporting paper that I circulated earlier this morning. I apologise that this was issued later than I had hoped, but Members will understand that important technical issues needed to be resolved. The statement sets out the project's position in detail, the legitimate concerns that have arisen and our proposals to enable it to proceed on a sound footing. Once the financial issues have been resolved, the future of the project will be the Minister for Culture's responsibility.

As a result of my previous involvement with the Wales Millennium Centre, as Minister for Finance I have only become officially engaged with the project after the First Minister's statement last October. In accordance with the principles of financial accountability, propriety and regularity that the Assembly upholds, I made a full declaration of interest on 23 January 2001.

If it were not for the National Assembly's existence, this issue could not be considered so openly and democratically. The fact that full details of this project have been put before you, and before the public, and that they can be debated, is evidence that the Assembly has made a difference through introducing more open decision-making and better accountability.

Since the First Minister's previous statement last October, much has been done and good progress has been made. Officials have worked closely with the Wales Millennium Centre to bring the project to a point where we have a much clearer, but still not fully definitive, view of the risks and benefits involved.

The key issue that we must face is clear. We must decide whether the project is of such importance to the cultural life of Wales, to its creative industry, and to its international profile, that the price—£92 million, or £100 million including land and car park costs—is worth paying. We must do so at a time when pressures on the Assembly's resources are intense and growing.

y papur ategol a ddosbarthais yn gynharach y bore yma. Ymddiheuraf fod hwn wedi ei gyhoeddi'n ddiweddarach nag yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio, ond bydd yr Aelodau'n deall bod angen datrys materion technegol pwysig. Noda'r datganiad sefyllfa'r prosiect yn fanwl, y pryderon cyfreithlon sydd wedi codi a'n cynigion i'w alluogi i barhau ar sail gadarn. Unwaith y bydd y materion ariannol wedi eu datrys, cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant fydd y prosiect.

O ganlyniad i'm hymwneud blaenorol â Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, dim ond ar ôl datganiad Prif Weinidog Cymru fis Hydref diwethaf y deuthum i ymwneud yn swyddogol â'r prosiect. Yn unol ag egwyddorion atebolrwydd ariannol, priodoldeb a rheoleidd-dra y mae'r Cynulliad yn eu cynnal, gwneuthum ddatganiad llawn o fuddiant ar 23 Ionawr 2001.

Oni bai am fodolaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ni allai'r mater hwn gael ei ystyried mewn ffordd mor agored a democritaidd. Mae'r ffaitbod manylion llawn y prosiect hwn wedi eu rhoi ger eich bron, a ger bron y cyhoedd ac y gellir cynnal dadl arnynt, yn dystiolaeth bod y Cynulliad wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth drwy gyflwyno proses gwneud penderfyniadau fwy agored a gwell atebolrwydd.

Ers datganiad blaenorol Prif Weinidog Cymru fis Hydref diwethaf, gwnaethpwyd llawer o waith a llawer o gynnydd. Mae swyddogion wedi gweithio'n agos â Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru i ddod â'r prosiect i bwynt lle mae gennym farn llawer cliriach, ond nid holol bendant o hyd, am y risgau a'r manteision dan sylw.

Mae'r mater allweddol y mae'n rhaid inni ei wynebu yn un amlwg. Rhaid inni benderfynu a yw'r prosiect mor bwysig i fywyd diwylliannol Cymru, ei diwydiant creadigol a'i phrofffil rhyngwladol, fel bod y pris—£92 miliwn, neu £100 miliwn gan gynnwys costau tir a maes parcio—yn werth ei dalu. Rhaid inni wneud hynny ar adeg pan fo'r pwysau ar adnoddau'r Cynulliad yn dwysáu ac yn cynyddu.

I welcome the news that Sir David Rowe-Beddoe has taken over as chair of the Wales Millennium Centre. On behalf of the First Minister and the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language, it is appropriate that I pay tribute to his predecessor, Sir Alan Cox. Without Alan's initial vision, drive, determination, and unfailing commitment to the project since its inception some five years ago, it would not have reached this point. We wish him well. It is a tribute to Alan's legacy that someone of David's standing is willing to take the chair. The board and the Assembly can have the greatest confidence in David Rowe-Beddoe.

I confirm that the work commissioned to bring the project design to the serviceable stage D is complete. This detailed design represents a critical step in the process of nailing down the parameters of cost and risk. A summary of the technical appraisal of this work carried out by Francis Graves Limited—our project monitor throughout the period—will be made available as soon as the commercially-sensitive issues have been dealt with and any other matters resolved. That process extends to deciding on the type of procurement method to be used. The Wales Millennium Centre has lately favoured construction management. Under that approach there can be no certainty about the cost of the project. All risk of overspend, for whatever reason, would remain with the project. As Sir Alan made clear at a recent Subject Committee meeting, it would fall to the Assembly to underwrite those risks.

In October, the First Minister made clear that we should look for 80 per cent cost certainty at the beginning of the scheme. I cannot give Members a firm assurance today that we have cost certainty for the bulk of the project. The risks of proceeding without the necessary controls are too great. The project cannot go forward on the basis of an Assembly blank cheque. Were this project to begin under construction management terms, it would be extremely difficult to resist demands for further funding. We would be signing up to a level of capital support amounting to at least £37 million, but with no limit to our financial

Croesawaf y newyddion fod Syr David Rowe-Beddoe wedi ymgymryd â swydd cadeirydd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Ar ran y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, mae'n briodol fy mod yn talu teyrnged i'w ragflaenydd, Syr Alan Cox. Heb weledigaeth gychwynnol Alan, ei egni, penderfyniad a'i ymrwymiad di-flino i'r prosiect ers ei ddechrau tua phum mlynedd yn ôl, ni fyddai wedi cyrraedd y pwynt hwn. Dymunwn yn dda iddo. Mae'n deyrnged i waith caled Alan fod rhywun uchel ei barch fel David yn barod i fod yn gadeirydd. Gall y bwrdd a'r Cynulliad fod â'r hyder mwyaf yn David Rowe-Beddoe.

Cadarnhaf fod y gwaith a gomisiynwyd i ddod â chynllun y prosiect i gam pwrpasol D wedi ei gwblhau. Mae'r cynllun manwl hwn yn gam holl bwysig yn y broses o gadarnhau ffiniau cost a risg. Bydd crynodeb o werthusiad technegol y gwaith hwn a gynhaliwyd gan Francis Graves Cyfyngedig—ein monitor ar gyfer y prosiect drwy gydol y cyfnod—ar gael cyn gynted ag yr ymdrinnir â'r materion sydd yn fasnachol sensitif a chyn gynted ag y caiff unrhyw faterion eraill eu datrys. Mae'r broses honno'n ymestyn i wneud penderfyniad ar y math o ddull caffael i'w ddefnyddio. Yn ddiweddar, mae Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru wedi ffafrio rheolaeth dros waith adeiladu. O dan yr ymagwedd honno ni ellir bod yn sicr ynglŷn â chost y prosiect. Byddai pob risg gorwario, am ba reswm bynnag, yn aros gyda'r prosiect. Fel yr eglurodd Syr Alan mewn cyfarfod diweddar o'r Pwyllgor Pwnc, cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad fyddai gwarantu'r risgiau hynny.

Ym mis Hydref, eglurodd Prif Weinidog Cymru y dylem edrych am sicrwydd o 80 y cant ar ddechrau'r cynllun. Ni allaf ddweud yn bendant wrth yr Aelodau heddiw fod sicrwydd cost gennym ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o'r prosiect. Mae'r risgiau o fynd ymlaen heb y rheolaethau angenrheidiol yn rhy fawr. Ni all y prosiect barhau ar sail siec wag gan y Cynulliad. Pe bai'r prosiect hwn yn dechrau o dan delerau rheolaeth dros waith adeiladu, byddai'n eithriadol o anodd ymwrthod â'r galw am ragor o arian. Byddem yn ymrwymo i gefnogaeth cyfalaf o £37 miliwn o leiaf, ond heb unrhyw derfyn i'n hamlygiad ariannol.

exposure. Against that background, I am pleased to confirm that the Wales Millennium Centre board has concluded that it should apply a fixed-price contract approach to procurement forthwith. We all welcome that.

Against the core £92 million cost estimate for the project, which our advisers consider to be a realistic and achievable price, the Wales Millennium Centre has secured £55 million, in commitments or cash. I believe that the European funding of £4 million that was available is all but lost. Time expired because of work needed on redesign and to complete preparatory stages properly. Taking all that into account, the aggregate funding shortfall amounts to £25 million.

The Wales Millennium Centre's hopes of raising funds from other sources are ambitious. It might be more realistic to think in terms of a target for private sector sponsorship of £4 million rather than £8 million, and a target for capital allowances of £5 million rather than £7 million. Even then there is a risk that the funds will not materialise. We must also discuss with the Millennium Commission whether it can release further funds for the project. We have assumed £3 million and we must test it further on that figure.

Like my colleagues, I believe the project promises tremendous benefits for the cultural future of Wales, for the generation of creative industry and for the promotion of cultural tourism from the rest of Europe and beyond. It brings with it substantial funding from the Millennium Commission, the arts lottery fund and from other public and private sources. That money will help to tackle the resource problems confronting the Welsh National Opera and Diversions Dance Company, for example, which might otherwise call on us. Ending the project would mean that Wales would lose the benefits of these lottery funds and some £11 million of funds already expended would have been expended to no purpose.

10:55 a.m.

The centre offers a blend of artistic

Yn erbyn y cefndir hwnnw, mae'n bleser gennyf gadarnhau bod Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru wedi dod i'r casgliad y dylai gymhwys o ymagwedd contract pris sefydlog tuag at gaffael ar unwaith. Croesewir hynny gan bob un ohonom.

Yn erbyn yr amcangyfrif cost craidd o £92 miliwn ar gyfer y prosiect, sydd yn bris realistig a chyraeddadwy yn ôl ein hymgyngorwyr, mae Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru wedi sicrhau £55 miliwn, mewn ymrwymiadau neu arian parod. Credaf fod y £4 miliwn o arian Ewrop a oedd ar gael fwy neu lai wedi ei golli. Daeth yr amser i ben oherwydd y gwaith yr oedd angen ei wneud ar ailgynllunio ac ar gwblhau'r camau rhagbaratoi yn gywir. O gofio hynny i gyd, crynswth y diffyg arian yw £25 miliwn.

Mae gobeithion Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru o godi arian o ffynonellau eraill yn uchelgeisiol. Efallai y byddai'n fwy realistig meddwl yn nhermau targed ar gyfer nawdd gan y sector preifat o £4 miliwn yn hytrach nag £8 miliwn, a tharged ar gyfer lwfansau cyfalaf o £5 miliwn yn hytrach na £7 miliwn. Hyd yn oed wedyn, mae risg na fydd yr arian ar gael. Rhaid inni drafod gyda Chomisiwn y Mileniwm hefyd i weld a all ryddhau rhagor o arian ar gyfer y prosiect. Yr ydym wedi cymryd bod £3 miliwn ar gael a rhaid inni ei brofi ymhellach ar y ffigur hwnnw.

Fel fy nghyd-Aelodau, credaf fod y prosiect yn addo buddiannau enfawr i ddyfodol diwylliannol Cymru, i'r broses o greu diwydiant creadigol ac er mwyn hyrwyddo twristiaeth ddiwylliannol o weddill Ewrop a thu hwnt. Daw arian sylweddol yn ei sgil o Gomisiwn y Mileniwm, cronfa loteri'r celfyddydau ac o ffynonellau cyhoeddus a phreifat eraill. Bydd yr arian hwnnw yn helpu i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau o ran adnoddau sydd yn wynebu Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru a Chwmni Dawns Diversions, er enghraift, a allai ddod ar ein gofyn fel arall. Byddai dod â'r prosiect i ben yn golygu y byddai Cymru yn colli manteision yr arian loteri hwn a byddai tua £11 miliwn wedi ei wario hyd yma.

Mae'r Ganolfan yn cynnig cymysgedd o

ingredients that has no counterpart anywhere else in the world, together with worthwhile economic employment benefits that would not be confined to Cardiff Bay. There is a strong case that the increased price is worth paying as long as it is subject to a genuinely disciplined control regime to contain risks and to manage costs. Thus, from a financial point of view, I am content to commend the project to you in principle, subject to certain conditions.

First, it is essential that the Wales Millennium Centre adopts a procurement method based on a fixed-price contract, and that has now been done. However, there will inevitably be a modest delay to test the market, which itself could be used productively to finalise project planning. The associated support cost to keep the centre in business in the run-up to construction would be £2 million. That is not an insignificant sum and when bridging arrangements for the AMEC settlement are taken into account, the total bill would be almost £3 million.

Secondly, the board and the executive need to be reshaped and augmented to handle the capital development phase. I know that David Rowe-Beddoe, in particular, wants to work with the board to achieve this. There must also be practised support at staff level to manage the project in a way that complements the chief executive's talents culturally and operationally.

We must face the fact that the result of testing the market under a fixed-price contract could result in unaffordable tenders. If the project price exceeded £92 million—if the implied Assembly contribution fell outside the assessed range—it would not be affordable and could not proceed. If cost certainty consequent on a fixed-price test showed a project cost of over £92 million this would automatically mean that the Wales Millennium Centre project would not proceed. We should not be prepared to enter into any arrangement where our commitment is not fixed. Today I set a limit clearly for everyone to see: you, the industry and the Millennium Centre itself. You must all take note of it.

gynhwysion artistig nad oes eu tebyg yn unman arall yn y byd, ynghyd â buddiannau cyflogaeth economaidd gwerthfawr na fyddai'n gyfyngedig i Fae Caerdydd. Mae achos cryf dros ddadlau bod y pris cynyddol yn werth ei dalu cyhyd â'i fod yn agored i gyfundrefn reoli ddisgybledig wirioneddol er mwyn cynnal y risgiau a rheoli'r costau. Felly, o safbwyt ariannol, yr wyf yn fodlon cymeradwyo'r prosiect ichi mewn egwyddor, yn dibynnu ar rai amodau.

Yn gyntaf, mae'n hanfodol bod Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn mabwysiadu dull caffaer yn seiliedig ar gcontract pris sefydlog, a gwnaethpwyd hynny erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, bydd rhywfaint o oedi yn anochel er mwyn profi'r farchnad. Gellid defnyddio'r cyfnod hwn yn gynhyrchiol i gwblhau'r gwaith o gynllunio'r prosiect. Byddai'r gost gefnogol gysylltiedig i gadw'r ganolfan mewn busnes yn y cyfnod cyn y gwaith adeiladu yn £2 filiwn. Nid yw hynny'n swm ansylweddol a phan ystyfir trefniadau pontio ar gyfer setliad AMEC, byddai'r bil terfynol bron yn £3 miliwn.

Yn ail, mae angen ailffurfio ac ymestyn y bwrdd a'r gweithgor er mwyn ymdopi â'r cam datblygu cyfalaf. Gwn fod David Rowe-Beddoe, yn arbennig, yn dymuno gweithio gyda'r bwrdd i gyflawni hyn. Rhaid cael cefnogaeth brofiadol ar lefel y staff i reoli'r prosiect mewn ffordd sydd yn ategu talentau'r prif weithredwr yn ddiwylliannol ac yn weithredol.

Rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith y gallai canlyniad profi'r farchnad o dan gcontract pris sefydlog arwain at dendrau na ellir eu fforddio. Pe bai pris y prosiect yn fwy na £92 miliwn—pe bai'r cyfraniad y byddai disgwyli i'r Cynulliad ei dalu'n syrthio y tu allan i'r ystod a aseswyd—ni fyddai'n fforddiadwy ac ni allai fynd yn ei flaen. Pe bai sicrydd cost yn dilyn prawf pris sefydlog yn dangos cost prosiect o dros £92 miliwn byddai hyn yn awtomatig yn golygu na fyddai prosiect Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn mynd yn ei flaen. Ni ddylem fod yn barod i lunio unrhyw drefniant lle nad yw ein hymrwymiad yn sefydlog. Heddiw, gosodaf derfyn clir i bawb ei weld: chi, y diwydiant a Chanolfan y Mileniwm ei hun. Rhaid i bob un ohonoch gymryd sylw ohono.

The paper draws attention to one technical issue, namely the adjudication between the Wales Millennium Centre and AMEC. Assuming that the project proceeded on the basis outlined today then the outstanding claim—some £900,000 with a short-term demand of £180,000—must be met. My view is that the costs should be borne by the Wales Millennium Centre, but not from the public funds invested in it, even though there could well be a requirement for some bridging arrangements in the short term.

I turn to the post-construction operational phase. The Wales Millennium Centre is not only about delivering a landmark building to time and within budget, it must also operate successfully, both culturally and financially. Delivering the plan will be challenging. In the past, the board has taken the view that the centre will operate without public subsidy. However, we cannot take that assessment at face value. We commissioned PriceWaterhouseCoopers to review the plan and a summary will be made available once the commercially sensitive issues have been dealt with and any other matters resolved. You will be aware of the recent Culture Committee debate when the Wales Millennium Centre was questioned on the business case. The Committee was robust and tenacious in its approach and helped to highlight just how challenging achieving the business plan is, as well as several operational issues that still do not appear to have been fully resolved.

Therefore, there remain real concerns. Can the centre sustain over 400,000 theatre attendances annually? Are the occupancy rates of 70 per cent for 300 performances every year achievable? Will a further 350,000 people visit the centre as projected? If audience numbers fail to match expectations, the centre will immediately run into a deficit. The Wales Millennium Centre has acknowledged this indirectly by indicating that a programme of national and international quality would require public subsidy of £750,000 annually.

The Arts Council of Wales suggests that

Mae'r papur yn tynnu sylw at un mater technegol, sef y dyfarniad rhwng Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru ac AMEC. O gymryd y byddai'r prosiect yn parhau ar y sail a amlinellir heddiw yna rhaid i'r cais dyledus—tua £900,000 gyda galw tymor byr o £180,000—gael ei dalu. Yn fy marn i Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru ddylai ysgwyddo'r gost, ond nid o'r arian cyhoeddus a fuddsoddwyd ynddi, er y gellid cael gofyniad ar gyfer rhai trefniadau pontio yn y tymor byr.

Trof at y cyfnod gweithredol ôl-adeiladu. Nid cyflwyno adeilad tirnod ar amser ac o fewn cyllideb yw unig nod Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Rhaid iddi weithredu'n llwyddiannus hefyd, yn ddiwylliannol ac yn ariannol. Bydd cyflwyno'r cynllun yn her. Yn y gorffennol, coleddodd y bwrdd y farn y bydd y ganolfan yn gweithredu heb gymhorthdal cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn dderbyn yr asesiad hwnnw heb ei gwestiynu. Comisiynwyd PriceWaterhouseCoopers gennym i adolygu'r cynllun a bydd crynodeb ar gael unwaith yr ymdrinnir â'r materion sydd yn fasnachol sensitif ac unwaith y caiff unrhyw faterion eraill eu datrys. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o ddadl ddiweddar y Pwyllgor Diwylliant pan holwyd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru am yr achos busnes. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn gadarn a dygn yn ei ymagwedd a helpodd i bwysleisio pa mor anodd yw cyflawni'r cynllun busnes, yn ogystal â sawl mater gweithredol nad ydynt, yn ôl pob tebyg, wedi eu datrys eto.

Felly, erys pryderon gwirioneddol. A all y ganolfan gynnal mwy na 400,000 o bobl yn dod i'r theatr bob blwyddyn? A yw'r cyfraddau presenoldeb o 70 y cant ar gyfer 300 o berfformiadau bob blwyddyn yn gyraeddadwy? A fydd 350,000 arall o bobl yn ymweld â'r ganolfan fel y rhagwelwyd? Os na fydd nifer y cynulleidfa oedd yn cyfateb â disgwyliadau, bydd y ganolfan yn wynebu diffyg ar unwaith. Mae Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru wedi cydnabod hyn yn anuniongyrchol drwy nodi y byddai rhaglen o ansawdd cenedlaethol a rhyngwladol yn galw am gymhorthdal cyhoeddus o £750,000 y flwyddyn.

Awgryma Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru y

support amounting to some £800,000 will be needed. The council does not have the resources to provide for this, therefore, the Assembly would have to find the additional funds. In addition, provision for the ongoing maintenance appears low and to establish a realistic fund could cost a further £0.5 million per year. It is also worth noting that if audience numbers fell below expectations the centre would lose income. If corrective action was not successful that could become a recurrent problem.

We must take account of the reasonable desires of artists across Wales to contribute to the success of the centre and to grow and flourish where they are, which means that we must consider increased provision for the arts elsewhere in Wales. The Wales Millennium Centre cannot be allowed to operate at their expense—it will need their product.

We must give the centre a genuine chance to succeed. Therefore, we must also be realistic about the potential call on us for revenue funding over the years ahead. Taking all these issues together, we must be prepared to contemplate a revenue cost of around £3 million to go directly to the Wales Millennium Centre and a broadly equivalent sum to cover the complementary implications elsewhere. To enable the project to go ahead, and to consider the impact of the Wales Millennium Centre more widely, the Subject Committee will be invited to consider the assessment of the level of risk on revenue subsidy and to be reassured that it makes reasonable sense. David Rowe-Beddoe will want to keep the Subject Committee informed about the steps that he will be taking to re-base the project.

In summary, and in principle, we can give the green light to the project provided that it meets the following tests: the procurement method must, and now will, rest on a fixed-priced contract. The project may proceed provided that the price, post tender, does not take us beyond the £92 million cost envelope. The Assembly must have David Rowe-Beddoe's assurance that the board and executive will be well equipped to tackle the next phase of the project, and that the

bydd angen tua £800,000. Nid oes gan y cyngor yr adnoddau i ddarparu ar gyfer hyn, felly, byddai'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad ddod o hyd i'r arian ychwanegol. Yn ogystal, ymddengys mai prin yw'r ddarpariaeth, ar gyfer y gwaith cynnal a chadw parhaus a gallai sefydlu cronfa realistig gostio £0.5 miliwn arall y flwyddyn. Mae hefyd yn werth nodi y byddai'r ganolfan yn colli incwm pe bai nifer y cynulleidfaedd yn is na'r disgwyl. Os na fyddai'r camau a gymerir i unioni hyn yn llwyddiannus gallai hynny fynd yn broblem reolaidd.

Rhaid inni ystyried dymuniadau rhesymol artistiaid ledled Cymru i gyfrannu at lwyddiant y ganolfan ac i dyfu a ffynnu lle bynnag y bônt, sydd yn golygu bod yn rhaid inni ystyried darpariaeth gynyddol ar gyfer y celfyddydau mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Ni ellir caniatáu i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru weithredu ar eu traul hwy—bydd angen eu cynrych arni.

Rhaid inni roi cyfle gwirioneddol i'r ganolfan lwyddo. Felly, rhaid inni fod yn realistig hefyd ynglŷn â'r galw posibl arnom am arian refeniw yn y blynnyddoedd i ddod. Wrth ystyried yr holl faterion hyn gyda'i gilydd, rhaid inni fod yn barod i ystyried cost refeniw o tua £3 miliwn i fynd yn uniongyrchol i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru a swm cyfatebol fwy neu lai i dalu'r goblygiadau ategol mewn mannau eraill. Er mwyn galluogi'r prosiect i fynd yn ei flaen, ac i ystyried effaith Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru mewn cyddestun ehangach, gwahoddir y Pwyllgor Pwnc i ystyried asesu lefel y risg ar arian refeniw ac i'w sicrhau ei fod yn gwneud synnwyr rhesymol. Bydd David Rowe-Beddoe eisiau hysbysu'r Pwyllgor Pwnc yn rheolaidd o'r camau y bydd yn eu cymryd i roi sail newydd i'r prosiect.

Wrth grynhau, ac mewn egwyddor, gallwn roi rhwydd hynt i'r prosiect ar yr amod ei fod yn bodloni'r amodau canlynol: rhaid i'r dull caffael, ac fe fydd yn awr, ddibynnu ar gontact pris sefydlog. Gall y prosiect fynd yn ei flaen ar yr amod nad yw'r pris, ar ôl tendro, yn mynd â ni tu hwnt i'r trothwy o £92 miliwn. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad gael sicrwydd gan David Rowe-Beddoe y bydd y bwrdd a'r gweithgor mewn sefyllfa dda i fynd i'r afael â cham nesaf y prosiect, ac y

building sub-committee is given the capacity to tackle the task fully. That is important. The Subject Committee must take stock of and be reassured by the business plan and by the extent to which it can be reasonably expected that the operational phase can be accommodated within the annual amount of £2 million should the centre fail to deliver on its ambition to operate without public subsidy. The Committee must also be reassured that support of a broadly similar order for associated artistic activity elsewhere in Wales is realistic.

Given the necessary continuation funding for the project through the summer, it will be ready to go ahead provided that these conditions are met. There is every reason to think that they will be. However, if any of those conditions are not met, the project must inevitably fall. They will have to be met simultaneously before the autumn. There is no case for incurring substantial extra preparatory support costs for the Wales Millennium Centre once the result of the fixed price invitation is known. The Government of the Assembly will not support this project unless the financial tests that I have identified are passed. The tests must be passed for us to fulfil our obligations as a Government. However, there are also political tests. This project seeks to benefit all interests—cultural, economic and social—and all parts of Wales. It will only go ahead if there is support in all political parties and in all parts of Wales. Ultimately, it is right that Members vote on a motion to support this project. When that happens, the Government of the Assembly will not be looking for a bare majority, but for support in every party and from all parts of Wales.

The approach that we commend to you rests on a candid assessment of the realities facing us. It is also based on a determination to be clear-sighted about the overall project costs and about the remaining tests that the project should meet if we are to be confident about it going ahead. Those same tests rest on a farsighted appreciation of the project's potential for Wales, which could be part of Wales's definition of itself—confident of our cultural identity, by not only investing in a building, but in our people's ability to express

rhoddir yr awdurdod i'r is-bwyllgor adeiladu fynd i'r afael â'r dasg yn llwyr. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Pwnc roi ystyriaeth i'r cynllun busnes a rhaid i'r cynllun busnes a'r graddau y gellir yn rhesymol ddisgwyl i'r cam gweithredol gael ei gynnwys o fewn y swm blynnyddol o £2 filiwn pe bai'r ganolfan yn methu â chyflawni ei huchelgais i weithredu heb nawdd cyhoeddus roi tawelwch meddwl i'r Pwyllgor hefyd. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor hefyd gael ei sicrhau bod cefnogi gorchymyn eithaf tebyg am weithgaredd artistig cysylltiedig mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru yn realistig.

O gofio'r arian parhad angenheidiol ar gyfer y prosiect drwy gydol yr haf, bydd yn barod i fynd ymlaen ar yr amod y bodlonir yr amodau hyn. Mae pob rheswm i gredu y cânt eu bodloni. Fodd bynnag, os na fodlonir unrhyw un o'r amodau hyn, bydd y prosiect yn anochel yn methu. Bydd yn rhaid eu bodloni ar yr un pryd cyn yr Hydref. Nid oes unrhyw ddadl dros fynd i gostau cynnal rhagbaratoi ychwanegol sylweddol ar gyfer Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru unwaith y bydd canlyniad y gwahoddiad pris sefydlog yn hysbys. Ni fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r prosiect hwn oni fodlonir yr amodau ariannol a nodais. Rhaid i'r amodau gael eu bodloni er mwyn inni gyflawni ein rhwymedigaethau fel Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae amodau gwleidyddol hefyd. Mae'r prosiect hwn yn ceisio bod o fudd i bawb sydd â diddordeb—diwylliannol, economaidd a chymdeithasol—ac i bob rhan o Gymru. Yn y pen draw, mae'n iawn bod yr Aelodau yn pleidleisio ar gynnig i gefnogi'r prosiect hwn. Pan ddigwydd hynny, ni fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn edrych am y lleiafrif lleiaf, ond am gefnogaeth ym mhob plaid ac i bob rhan o Gymru.

Mae'r ymagwedd a gymeradwywn ichi yn dibynnu ar asesiad diduedd o'r gwirioneddau sydd yn ein hwynebu. Mae hefyd yn seiliedig ar benderfyniad i fod yn graff ynglŷn â chostau cyffredinol y prosiect ac ynglŷn â'r amodau sydd yn weddill y dylai'r prosiect eu bodloni os ydym i fod yn hyderus ynglŷn â mynd ymlaen â'r prosiect. Mae'r un amodau hynny yn dibynnu ar werthfawrogiad pellgyrhaeddol o botensial y prosiect i Gymru, a allai fod yn rhan o ddiffiniad Cymru ei hun—hyder yn ein hunaniaeth

themselves on a world stage. The benefits of this project are substantial. However, this Assembly has a responsible Government that is determined to control the costs. This statement has established the financial and political tests that this project must meet if it is to go ahead. The project deserves the chance to pass these tests.

ddiwyliau, drwy fuddsoddi nid yn unig mewn adeilad, ond yng ngallu pobl i fynegi eu hunain ar lwyfan y byd. Mae buddiannau'r prosiect hwn yn sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y Cynulliad hwn Lywodraeth gyfrifol sydd yn benderfynol o reoli'r costau. Mae'r datganiad hwn wedi sefydlu'r amodau ariannol a gwleidyddol y mae'n rhaid i'r prosiect hwn eu bodloni os yw i fynd yn ei flaen. Mae'r prosiect yn haeddu'r cyfle i fodloni'r amodau hyn.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf wedi cefnogi prosiect Canolfan y Mileniwm o'r dechrau, ond gwerthfawrogaf gymhlethdod menter sydd yn disgwyl denu 0.75 miliwn o bobl y flwyddyn i'w gwahanol weithgareddau. Sylweddolaf hefyd mor anodd yw bod yn sicr am gost datblygiad mor fawr, yn enwedig mewn oes lle y mae etifeddiaeth Thatcher yn parhau i wneud gwariant cyhoeddus yn bechod yn hytrach na rhinwedd. Fodd bynnag, o glywed datganiad y Gweinidog, mae wedi llwyddo i gadw'r prosiect ar y cledrau trwy ystyried ei agweddau pendant ac ansicr yn ogystal â'r senarios gorau a gwaethaf o ran cost.

11:05 a.m.

Am iddi fod yn agored, mae'r Gweinidog wedi datgelu amrediad o bosibiliadau cyllidol, sydd yn cynnwys dychymyg yr optimist a'r pesimist heb gladdu harddwch y freuddwyd.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn iawn i dynnu ein sylw at y golled fawr i gyrrff megis Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru petaem yn colli'r arian sylweddol gan Gomisiwn y Mileniwm a ffynonellau eraill. Mae'n iawn hefyd i fynnau bod y gwaith adeiladu ar y prosiect yn cael ei reoli gan Ganolfan y Mileniwm dan gytundeb cost sefydlog er mwyn rhwystro costau adeiladu ychwanegol rhag syrthio ar ysgwyddau'r Cynulliad. Mae'n iawn i bwysleisio'r tebygrwydd y bydd eisiau cefnogaeth gyhoeddus i'r cynllun busnes i gadw'r glorian yn gytbwys. Wrth gynnig uchafswm o £2 filiwn y flwyddyn i wneud hyn, mae'n rhoi sicrwydd i'r prosiect. Wrth gynnig £2 filiwn arall ar gyfer gweithgaredd diwylliannol ar draws Cymru, mae'n cynnig moddion i leddfu'r boen a achoswyd gan 'Cardiffobia'.

**Owen John Thomas:** I have supported the Wales Millennium Centre project from the beginning, but I appreciate the complexity of an initiative that expects to attract 0.75 million people a year to its various activities. I also realise how difficult it is to be certain of the cost of such a large development, particularly in an age where the inheritance of Thatcher continues to make public spending a sin rather than a virtue. However, from listening to the Minister's statement, she has succeeded in keeping the project on track by considering its definite and uncertain aspects as well as the best and worst case scenarios in terms of cost.

As she has been open, the Minister has disclosed a range of financial possibilities, including the imagination of the optimist and the pessimist without burying the beauty of the project.

The Minister is right to draw our attention to the great loss that organisations such as Welsh National Opera would incur if we were to lose the substantial funding from the Millennium Commission and other sources. She is also right to insist that the construction work on the project be managed by the Wales Millennium Centre under a fixed price contract in order to prevent the Assembly having to shoulder additional building costs. She is right to emphasise the likelihood that the business plan will need public support to keep the scales balanced. In proposing a maximum of £2 million a year to do this, she gives the project security. In proposing a further £2 million for cultural activity across Wales, she offers relief for the pain caused by 'Cardiffobia'.

I ask the Minister to consider two crucial points. First, to recognise the importance of large numbers of people being able to travel easily to and from the bay. By maximising the accessibility of the capital city for all the people of Wales, we would move further from the worst case scenario for the Wales Millennium Centre and closer to the ideal of a unified nation. Fortunately, the time is right to capitalise on Objective 1 funding in the Valleys. That, together with a single rail franchise for Wales, can help to make the capital city and our national institutions and centres accessible to all the people of Wales.

I now turn to the ownership of the site of the Wales Millennium Centre. As this prestigious project would contribute so much to Cardiff's endeavour to be the European Capital of Culture in 2008, it would seem reasonable and symbiotic for Cardiff City and County Council to grant the Wales Millennium Centre a lease on the land at a peppercorn rent. That would further reduce a possible charge on the remainder of Wales and raise the capital's standing beyond the M4 and points east and west.

**Edwina Hart:** I do not doubt Owen John's passion for the project. I have heard him speak about it many times. I am afraid that, as Minister for Finance, I cannot have much passion; I must outline the worst case scenarios. I have tried to do that today. Transport issues have been discussed. I know that Sue Essex is particularly concerned about transport into the bay and the local authority is concerned about access to the Wales Millennium Centre. That is important.

I stated in the note that I circulated to Members this morning that I have discussed the position of Cardiff City and County Council with its leader. It supports this project and wants to move ahead with its bid to be the European Capital of Culture in 2008. We must understand that this is a matter for the local authority. It will be accountable to the electorate for its actions on land and car park issues. It would be helpful at this stage to acknowledge that it has been

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried dau bwynt holl bwysig. Yn gyntaf, i gydnabod pa mor bwysig yw hi y gall nifer fawr o bobl deithio'n hawdd yn ôl ac ymlaen i'r bae. Drwy wneud y gorau o hygyrchedd y brifddinas i holl bobl Cymru, byddem yn symud ymhellach yn awr o'r senario gwaethaf i'r Ganolfan ac yn agosach at ddelfryd cenedl unedig. Yn ffodus, mae'r amser yn iawn i fanteisio ar arian Amcan 1 yn y Cymoedd. Gall hynny, ynghyd â masnachfaint rheilffyrdd sengl i Gymru, helpu i wneud y brifddinas a'n sefydliadau a'n canolfannau cenedlaethol yn hygrych i holl bobl Cymru.

Trof yn awr at berchenogaeth safle Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Gan y byddai'r prosiect mawreddog hwn yn cyfrannu gymaint at ymdrech Caerdydd i fod yn Ganolfan Diwylliant Ewrop yn 2008, byddai'n ymddangos yn rhesymol ac yn symbiotig i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd ganiatáu prydles i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru ar y tir am rent rhad. Byddai hynny'n lleihau'r posiblwydd o godi tâl ar weddill Cymru a byddai'n ymestyn statws y brifddinas y tu hwnt i'r M4 a mannau i'r dwyrain a'r gorllewin.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf yn amau brwdrydedd Owen John dros y prosiect. Fe'i clywais yn sôn amdano droeon. Ofnaf, fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, na allaf fod yr un mor frwd; rhaid imi amlinellu'r senarios gwaethaf. Ceisiais wneud hynny heddiw. Trafodwyd materion trafnidiaeth. Gwn fod Sue Essex yn gofidio'n arbennig am drafnidiaeth i mewn i'r bae ac mae'r awdurdod lleol yn gofidio am fynediad i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Dywedsais yn y nodyn a anfonais at yr Aelodau y bore yma fy mod wedi trafod sefyllfa Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd gyda'i arweinydd. Mae'r cyngor yn cefnogi'r prosiect hwn ac am symud ymlaen gyda'i gynnig i fod yn Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop yn 2008. Rhaid inni ddeall mai mater i'r awdurdod lleol yw hyn. Bydd yn atebol i'r etholwyr am ei weithredoedd o ran materion tir a maes parcio. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol ar yr adeg hon i gydnabod y bu'n gefnogol i'm

supportive of my statement today.

**Val Feld:** The Minister stated that there are still considerable hurdles ahead for this project. Does she share my concern that, for the last several days, the Welsh media has been running stories that this project is home and dry? Does the Minister agree that we need to explain that considerable tests must be met before that will be the case? The Minister referred, properly, to the need to ensure that the whole of Wales benefits from this project. Will she consider adding to the tests an assessment of how the rest of Wales will benefit from this new centre? She also referred to further approval by the Assembly. When will the Assembly have an opportunity to vote on this matter, so that Members can make their views clearly known? I have great reservations about going ahead with a project of this scale without the Assembly having a strategy for the location of both public institutions in the arts, culture and sports, and public bodies. I know that this is not all within the Minister's remit. However, she stated that she was speaking on behalf of the First Minister and the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language. Will the Minister assure us that work will be undertaken to develop such a strategy, so that future decisions are made within a policy framework that examines how we should spread our resources across Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** As far as I am concerned, all decisions about our use of resources across Wales are made within a policy framework. I know that the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language has that at the forefront of her mind, from the discussions that we have had, including those about the Wales Millennium Centre. I am aware that the chair and members of the Culture Committee are also concerned about the strategic approach.

As regards the debate that will be held in Plenary, that will be a matter for the Minister for Culture, but I have indicated that discussion must take place in the Culture Committee. The Committee will want to take its time to deliberate the Wales Millennium Centre around the beginning of June to the

datganiad heddiw.

**Val Feld:** Dywedodd y Gweinidog fod rhwystrau sylweddol yn wynebu'r prosiect hwn o hyd. A yw'n rhannu fy mhryder y bu'r cyfryngau yng Nghymru, dros y dyddiau diwethaf, yn datgan bod y prosiect hwn wedi llwyddo? A gytuna'r Gweinidog fod angen inni egluro bod yn rhaid bodloni amodau sylweddol cyn y bydd hynny'n wir? Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog, yn briodol, at yr angen i sicrhau bod Cymru gyfan yn elwa ar y prosiect hwn. A wnaiff hi ystyried ychwanegu asesiad at yr amodau hyn o sut y bydd gweddill Cymru yn elwa ar y ganolfan newydd hon? Cyfeiriodd hefyd am gymeradwyaeth bellach gan y Cynulliad. Pryd y caiff y Cynulliad gyfle i bleidleisio ar y mater hwn, fel y gall yr Aelodau wneud eu barn yn hysbys? Mae gennyf amheuon mawr ynglŷn â mynd ymlaen â phrosiect o'r maint hwn heb fod gan y Cynulliad strategaeth ar gyfer lleoliad sefydliadau cyhoeddus yn y celfyddydau, diwylliant a chwaraeon, a chyrff cyhoeddus. Gwn nad yw hyn i gyd o fewn cylch gwaith y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, nododd ei bod yn siarad ar ran y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau yr ymgymrerir â'r gwaith i ddatblygu strategaeth o'r fath, fel y gwneir penderfyniadau yn y dyfodol o fewn fframwaith polisi sydd yn ymchwilio i'r ffordd y dylem ddosbarthu ein hadnoddau ledled Cymru?

**Edwina Hart:** O'm rhan i, gwneir pob penderfyniad ynglŷn â'n defnydd o adnoddau ledled Cymru o fewn fframwaith polisi. Gwn fod hynny'n flaenoriaeth i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, o'r trafodaethau a gawsom, gan gynnwys y trafodaethau hynny ynglŷn â Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod cadeirydd ac aelodau'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn goficio hefyd ynglŷn â'r ymagwedd strategol.

O ran y ddadl a gynhelir yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, bydd hynny'n fater i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, ond nodais fod yn rhaid i'r drafodaeth honno ddigwydd yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Bydd y Pwyllgor am gymryd ei amser i drafod Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru rhwng dechrau Mehefin a diwedd

end of July.

On the issue of the press, I do not generally comment about what goes on in the fourth estate. Obviously there will always be speculation. My statement makes the Government's position clear.

I must say that I am not interested in your tests, Val. Sometimes we must recognise that these projects are not within our control. The Wales Millennium Centre project started long before the Assembly was established. The Wales Millennium Centre is responsible for that project and it had sufficient motivation to start the project and attract money from the Millennium Commission. Let us be under no illusions in this Chamber: if this project does not go ahead, that Millennium Commission money will not go towards a new centre in Swansea or north Wales. The nature of the project meant that it would be in Cardiff. It is difficult sometimes when we are here in Cardiff, because we have our constituency interests. However, sometimes, as politicians, we must put Welsh interests, and what we want for Wales and our image in the world, at the centre of our deliberations, rather than what we say in the local newspapers in our constituencies.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First, on behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I thank the Minister for her statement today, and for taking a firm lead on this issue. We have been concerned in recent months that the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language has not taken a lead, that the Wales Millennium Centre lacked firm leadership, and that the Government's input has been slack. By virtue of your taking a lead, our confidence has increased, particularly given the way you have dealt with this important matter openly. We are pleased that the report contains such—in many respects—brutal statistics. The risks are brutal, as you outlined. I am grateful that you have been open and transparent in your approach.

We welcome Sir David Rowe-Beddoe's appointment as chairman of the Wales

Gorffennaf.

O ran y wasg, nid wyf yn gyffredinol yn sôn am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn y wasg. Yn amlwg, bydd dyfalu bob amser. Mae fy natganiad yn nodi safbwyt y Llywodraeth yn glir.

Rhaid imi ddweud nad oes diddordeb gennyst yn eich amodau, Val. Weithiau, rhaid inni gydnabod nad yw'r prosiectau hyn o fewn ein rheolaeth. Dechreuodd prosiect Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru ymhell cyn i'r Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu. Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru sydd yn gyfrifol am y prosiect hwnnw a chafodd ddigon o gymhelliant i ddechrau'r prosiect a denu arian o Gomisiwn y Mileniwm. Peidiwch â chael eich twyllo yn y Siambr hon: os nad aiff y prosiect hwn yn ei flaen, nid aiff yr arian hwnnw gan y Comisiwn y Mileniwm tuag at ganolfan newydd yn Abertawe neu ogledd Cymru. Golygai natur y prosiect y byddai yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n anodd weithiau pan fyddwn ni yma yng Nghaerdydd, gan fod gennym ein buddiannau yn ein hetholaethau. Fodd bynnag, weithiau, fel gwleidyddion, rhaid inni roi ein buddiannau Cymreig, a'r hyn yr ydym am ei gael i Gymru a'n delweddu yn y byd, ynghanol ein penderfyniadau, yn hytrach na'r hyn a ddywedwn yn y papurau newydd lleol yn ein hetholaethau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn gyntaf, ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad heddiw, ac am roi arweiniad cadarn ar y mater hwn. Buom yn gofio dros y misoedd diwethaf nad oedd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg wedi cymryd yr awenau, bod diffyg arweinyddiaeth gadarn mewn perthynas â Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, a bod mewnbwn y Llywodraeth wedi bod yn llac. Gan eich bod wedi cymryd yr awenau, mae ein hyder wedi cynyddu, yn arbennig o gofio'r ffordd yr ymdriniasoch â'r mater pwysig hwn mewn ffordd mor agored. Yr ydym yn falch bod yr adroddiad yn cynnwys—mewn sawl ystyr—ystadegau mor llym. Mae'r risgiau'n llym, fel y crybwyllasoch. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am fod mor agored a chlir yn eich ymagwedd.

Croesawn benodiad Syr David Rowe-Beddoe fel cadeirydd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru.

Millennium Centre. We believe that his appointment will ensure further confidence in the project. We know of Sir David's background and the wealth of experience that he will bring to the project. Are you in a position to set specific targets for raising private sector investment? We are concerned that this funding gap should not be wholly plugged from the public purse, but also from private sector investment opportunities. We do not believe that a project of such profound cultural and economic importance to Cardiff and Wales cannot gain more private sector investment. We are confident and sure that Sir David will be able to pursue that vigorously.

We would also like to see further changes in the Wales Millennium Centre board. We need people on the board with backgrounds in managing large-scale projects such as this. We hope for further changes over the next few months.

On the issue of fixed costs, we have been concerned about the size of the building. Last year the building probably could have been built for £85 million, at about 420,000 square foot. It will now be about 320,000 square foot, but will cost £92 million. Therefore, we are pleased that the Government has recognised the need to fix the costs and for the Wales Millennium Centre to go out to tender, to establish whether a construction company will build it for £92 million. Without fixed costs, there is no confidence, and no agreement to proceed. This is an important part of our agreement to proceed. It would do a great deal to raise confidence, not only in the Assembly, but also across Wales and among the taxpayers who are being asked to foot the bill for this important project.

We have been concerned about the Wales Millennium Centre's revenue figures. Leading members of the arts community were surprised at the over-inflated projected attendance figures of some 450,000 people per year and at the percentage capacity that the Wales Millennium Centre expects to achieve. We are pleased that the Culture Committee will analyse those figures and scrutinise them further. We must be sure that this project will run effectively once the building is constructed.

Credwn y bydd ei benodiad yn ennynt hyder pellach yn y prosiect. Gwyddom am gefndir Syr David a'r cyfoeth o brofiad a ddaw i'r prosiect. A ydych mewn sefyllfa i bennu targedau penodol ar gyfer codi buddsoddiad y sector preifat? Gofidiwn na ddylid llenwi'r bwlc hriannu hwn yn llwyr o bwrs y wlad, ond y dylai gael ei lenwi hefyd o ganlyniad i gyfleoedd buddsoddi yn y sector preifat. Ni chredwn y gall prosiect o bwysigrwydd diwylliannol ac economaidd mor sylweddol i Gaerdydd a Chymru ennill rhagor o fuddsoddiad yn y sector preifat. Yr ydym yn hyderus ac yn sicr y gall Syr David fwrrw ymlaen â hynny yn egniol.

Hoffwn hefyd weld newidiadau pellach i fwrrd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Mae angen pobl ar y bwrdd sydd â phrofiad o reoli prosiectau ar raddfa fawr fel hwn. Gobeithiwn am newidiadau pellach dros yr ychydig fisoeedd nesaf.

O ran costau sefydlog, buom yn gofidio am faint yr adeilad. Y llynedd, gellid bod wedi adeiladu'r adeilad siŵr o fod am £85 miliwn, sef tua 420,000 o droedfeddi sgwâr. Erbyn hyn bydd tua 320,000 o droedfeddi sgwâr, ond bydd yn costio £92 miliwn. Felly, yr ydym yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi cydnabod yr angen i wneud y costau yn sefydlog ac i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru roi gwaith ar dendr, er mwyn sefydlu a all cwmni adeiladu ei adeiladu am £92 miliwn. Heb gostau sefydlog, nid oes unrhyw hyder, nac unrhyw gytundeb i fynd ymlaen. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o'n cytundeb i fynd ymlaen. Byddai'n gwneud llawer iawn i ennyn hyder, nid yn unig yn y Cynulliad, ond ledled Cymru ac ymhli y trethdalwyr y gofynnir iddynt dalu'r bil am y prosiect pwysig hwn.

Buom yn gofidio am ffigurau refeniw Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Yr oedd aelodau blaenllaw o'r gymuned gelfyddydol yn synnu at y ffigurau presenoldeb mawr a ragamcanwyd o tua 450,000 o bobl y flwyddyn ac yn synnu at y capaciti canrannol y mae Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn disgwyl ei gyflawni. Yr ydym yn falch y bydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn dadansoddi'r ffigurau hyn ac yn eu harchwilio ymhellach. Rhaid inni fod yn siŵr y bydd y prosiect hwn yn rhedeg yn effeithiol unwaith yr adeiledir

yr adeilad.

11:15 a.m.

Consultation is needed with people from the wider arts community, who have the expertise and knowledge to inform us how such a building can be filled with the necessary number of people to make the project worthwhile. Such people know and understand how to run theatres and other comparable buildings across the United Kingdom. We must ensure them that any public subsidy that the Assembly might have to consider will not divert crucial funds away from Wales's culture budget. People in north Wales and throughout the country, who see this development taking place in Cardiff, must have confidence that the Government and the Assembly will ensure public funding for the arts across Wales, in addition to any money that will be made available for this project.

In closing, Wales has nurtured many world-class artists and we have a world-class opera company. We have the privilege every year of seeing our world-class artists perform around the world, doing their nation proud. We must ensure that they have a world-class venue in Wales, in which to perform. That is a considerable challenge for the Assembly.

**Edwina Hart:** The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language has already been heavily involved in consultation with the arts community and several discussions have taken place. Therefore, that puts your unfair first comment about the Minister into context. I was asked to undertake this work by the Minister for Culture because of my financial brief. We are taking a two-pronged approach at this stage.

I share your concerns about revenue, which were also expressed clearly by the Culture Committee. There is probably not a public building or arts venue in the UK that does not receive some element of revenue funding from Government. We must get on top of this issue. It is better to have honesty at this stage, rather than have to tackle a crisis in a few years, when the building has been constructed. That is important. Fixed costs

Mae angen ymgynghori â phobl o'r gymuned gelfyddydol ehangach, sydd â'r arbenigedd a'r wybodaeth i ddweud wrthym sut y gellir llenwi adeilad o'r fath gyda'r nifer angenrheidiol o bobl i wneud y prosiect yn un gwerth chweil. Mae pobl o'r fath yn gwybod ac yn deall sut i gynnal theatrau ac adeiladau cyffelyb eraill ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Rhaid inni eu sicrhau na fydd unrhyw nawdd cyhoeddus y bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad ei ystyried efallai yn dargyfeirio arian holl bwysig i ffwrdd o gyllideb ddiwylliannol Cymru. Rhaid i bobl yng ngogledd Cymru a ledled y wlad, sydd yn gweld y datblygiad hwn yn digwydd yng Nghaerdydd, fod yn hyderus y bydd y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad yn sicrhau arian cyhoeddus i'r celfyddydau ledled Cymru, yn ogystal ag unrhyw arian a fydd ar gael ar gyfer y prosiect hwn.

Wrth gau, mae Cymru wedi meithrin llawer o artistiaid o'r radd flaenaf, ac mae gennym gwmni opera o'r radd flaenaf. Cawn y faint bob blwyddyn o weld ein hartisiaid gwych yn perfformio ym mhedwar ban byd, ac mae eu cenedl yn ymfalchïo ynddynt. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ganddynt leoliad o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru i berfformio ynddo. Mae hynny'n dipyn oherwydd y Cynulliad.

**Edwina Hart:** Eisoes bu'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg yn ymgynghori llawer â'r gymuned gelfyddydol a chynhaliwyd sawl trafodaeth. Felly, mae hynny'n rhoi eich sylw cyntaf annheg ynglŷn â'r Gweinidog yn ei gyd-destun. Gofynnodd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant imi ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn oherwydd fy mriff ariannol. Yr ydym yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd ddeublyg ar yr adeg hon.

Rhannaf eich pryderon ynglŷn â refeniw, a fynegwyd yn glir hefyd gan y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Nid oes un adeilad cyhoeddus na lleoliad celfyddydol yn y DU siŵr o fod na chaiff rywfaint o arian refeniw gan y Llywodraeth. Rhaid inni roi trefn ar y mater hwn. Mae'n well bod yn onest ar yr adeg hon, yn hytrach na gorfod mynd i'r afael ag argyfwng mewn rhai blynnyddoedd, pan fydd yr adeilad wedi ei godi. Mae hynny'n

are essential. We have all learnt that, if you cannot secure the figures for building projects, you have had it.

I also welcome Sir David Rowe-Beddoe's appointment. His background will be useful in seeking greater private sector investment. He will have the private sector's confidence and has many contacts worldwide. Hopefully, he will also make a tremendous difference in raising revenue from such sources. In his leadership role, I think that he will want to consider the board. It is a hard-working and industrious board, but I accept your point about the importance of project management. I know that Jenny is also concerned about that. We need somebody who is hands-on, managing the project daily, to ensure that we keep within the budget.

Your final point was well made. The Welsh National Opera is well-known worldwide. It is the image of Wales and it markets our country wonderfully. However, we must recognise that it has no suitable home in Wales. It could just as easily be the Bristol hippodrome opera company or a company working from Birmingham. That would be a great tragedy for our nation.

**Mick Bates:** This project presents an immense challenge, which we must meet. I am sure that you will join me in congratulating the First Minister for announcing a review of the project some months ago. I also record our thanks to Jenny Randerson for her work in that review. I also welcome Sir David Rowe-Beddoe as chair of the Wales Millennium Centre. I am sure that his expertise will ensure that this project is a success.

The project is a critical step forward for Wales's arts, culture and language, as it demonstrates our vision and confidence in our country's future at what is such a dark time in many areas. It will also have a significant impact on employment and economic benefit for Wales and, in particular,

bwysig. Mae costau sefydlog yn holl bwysig. Yr ydym oll wedi dysgu os na allwch sicrhau'r ffigurau ar gyfer prosiectau adeiladu, mae wedi canu arnoch.

Croesawaf benodiad Syr David Rowe-Beddoe hefyd. Bydd ei gefndir yn ddefnyddiol wrth geisio sicrhau mwy o fuddsoddiad yn y sector preifat. Bydd hyder y sector preifat ganddo hefyd ac mae ganddo lawer o gysylltiadau ar draws y byd. Gobeithio hefyd y gwnaiff wahaniaeth enfawr wrth godi refeniu o ffynonellau o'r fath. Yn ei rôl fel arweinydd, credaf y bydd am ystyried y bwrdd. Mae'n fwrrd sydd yn gweithio'n galed a diwyd, ond derbyniaf eich pwynt ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd rheoli prosiectau. Gwn fod Jenny yn gofiddio ynglŷn â hynny hefyd. Mae angen rhywun arnom sydd yn gweithio mewn ffordd ymarferol, gan reoli'r prosiect o ddydd i ddydd, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cadw o fewn y gyllideb.

Yr oedd eich pwynt olaf yn un da. Mae Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gyfarwydd i bobl ledled y byd. Dyma ddelwedd Cymru ac mae'n marchnata ein gwlad mewn ffordd ragorol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod nad oes ganddi unrhyw gartref addas yng Nghymru. Gallai yr un mor hawdd fod yn gwmni opera hippodrome Bryste neu'n gwmni sydd yn gweithio yn Birmingham. Byddai hynny'n drasiedi fawr i'n gwlad.

**Mick Bates:** Mae'r prosiect hwn yn cynnig her aruthrol, y mae'n rhaid inni ei derbyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y Prif Weinidog am gyhoeddi adolygiad o'r prosiect rai misoedd yn ôl. Cofnodaf hefyd ein diolchiadau i Jenny Randerson am ei gwaith yn yr adolygiad hwnnw. Croesawaf innau hefyd Syr David Rowe-Beddoe fel cadeirydd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ei arbenigedd yn sicrhau llwyddiant y prosiect hwn.

Mae'r prosiect yn gam holl bwysig ymlaen i gelfyddyddau, diwylliant ac iaith Cymru, gan ei fod yn dangos ein gweledigaeth a'n hyder yn nyfodol ein gwlad ar adeg mor dywyll mewn llawer o ardaloedd. Caiff effaith bwysig hefyd ar gyflogaeth a budd economaidd Gymru ac, yn arbennig, ar

on Wales's image in the world.

We welcome the fixed price contract approach and the realistic attitude to this project. I am confident that these conditions will be met as long as you, Minister, retain your current position. That was meant as a compliment.

**Nick Bourne:** Be wary of giving compliments.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am all in favour of compliments to the Minister for Finance and I pay them to her myself, privately, but will you get on with it?

**Mick Bates:** I was pleased to hear your response to Jonathan Morgan because I agree that there must be wide consultation with arts societies to ensure that this project is a success. We have heard many times how poor consultation leads to failure.

Finally, since we announced that this project would continue and since a wonderful chair has been appointed, is there a possibility that the private financial support for this project may increase from £4 million to £8 million or even more? If the project exceeded £92 million, will that extra private funding meet that extra cost?

**Edwina Hart:** On Jonathan Morgan's point, I would be delighted if we could get more private money so that there would not be as much public money involved. However, I am determined about the cost envelope of the overall figure and I do not think that I can move from it. People have asked me 'what if the costs exceeded £100 million?' My answer is that they cannot. We must have stability in this project. We have not had it before and it is essential that we stick to the figures. Jenny has taken a lead on taking this through and has asked me to calculate these figures.

**The Presiding Officer:** We are out of time but I will call the Chair of the Culture Committee.

ddelwedd Cymru yn y byd.

Croesawn yr ymagwedd contract pris sefydlog a'r agwedd realistig tuag at y prosiect hwn. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bodlonir yr amodau hyn cyhyd ag y gallwch chi, Weinidog, gadw eich swydd bresennol. Golygyd hynny fel canmoliaeth.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwyliwch rhag canmol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf o blaid canmol y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a thalaf deyrnged iddi fy hun, yn breifat, ond a fyddch cystal â pharhau?

**Mick Bates:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed eich ymateb i Jonathan Morgan oherwydd cytunaf fod yn rhaid ymgynghori'n eang â chymdeithasau celfyddydol er mwyn sicrhau bod y prosiect hwn yn llwyddo. Clywsom droeon sut y mae ymgynghori gwael yn arwain at fethiant.

Yn olaf, ers inni gyhoeddi y byddai'r prosiect hwn yn parhau a chan fod cadeirydd gwych wedi ei benodi, a oes posiblwyd y gall y gefnogaeth ariannol breifat ar gyfer y prosiect hwn gynyddu o £4 miliwn i £8 miliwn neu hyd yn oed yn fwy? Pe bai'r prosiect yn mynd y tu hwnt i £92 miliwn, a fydd yr arian preifat ychwanegol hwnnw yn talu'r gost ychwanegol honno?

**Edwina Hart:** Ar bwynt Jonathan Morgan, byddwn wrth fy modd pe baem yn gallu cael mwy o arian preifat fel na fyddai'n golygu gwario cymaint o arian cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn benderfynol ynglŷn â therfyn cost y ffigur cyffredinol ac ni chredaf y gallaf wyro oddi wrtho. Mae pobl wedi gofyn imi 'beth os aiff y costau y tu hwnt i £100 miliwn?' Fy ateb yw na allant. Rhaid inni gael sefydlogrwydd yn y prosiect hwn. Ni chawsom ef o'r blaen ac mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cadw at y ffigurau. Mae Jenny wedi cymryd yr awenau ar ganlyn hyn i'w derfyn ac mae wedi gofyn imi gyfrifo'r ffigurau hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Daeth ein hamser i ben ond galwaf ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I welcome the Minister's statement and commend her on her astute management of the financial aspects of this sensitive issue and the inclusive way in which she has tried to move this project forward. Does she agree that the chairmanship and membership of the board of the Wales Millennium Centre is a matter for the board? Will she agree that Sir Alan Cox, the former chair, made an important contribution to getting this project off the ground and ensuring enthusiasm for it? I welcome the new chair, Sir David Rowe-Beddoe.

I welcome the role that the Minister has asked the Committee to undertake and that she has recognised that we do not have the expertise to give cast iron guarantees about the revenue position of this project, but that we are happy to review the figures and, hopefully, be reassured by the board that they are under control. Will she also reassure us more firmly—she has partly done so—that expenditure on the Wales Millennium Centre will not affect the expenditure on the arts generally in Wales or the budget of the Arts Council of Wales? Does she accept that if we want the Millennium Centre to reflect the culture of Wales, there may be a need for the Assembly to contribute financially year-on-year to the revenue funding of the centre to ensure that it has an outreach programme to the whole of Wales?

Croesawn y ffordd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi delio â'r sefyllfa hon a'r ffordd y mae'r prosiect yn symud yn ei flaen. Byddwn yn edrych yn fanwl ar y ffigurau cyfalaf a refeniw ond hyderaf y gallwn symud ymlaen â'r prosiect hwn sydd mor bwysig i ddiwylliant yng Nghymru.

**Edwina Hart:** It is essential that we recognise the implications of the Wales Millennium Centre on the arts in Wales. We cannot be seen to be taking money from one area of Wales to ensure that we have the Wales Millennium Centre. It is appropriate that the Committee will be discussing the centre in the run up to the budget process. It is an ideal opportunity for it to look at the nature of the arts in Wales and the outreach activities that could emanate from the Wales Millennium Centre in the context of its

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog ac fe'i canmolaf ar ei rheolaeth graff dros agweddau ariannol y mater sensitif hwn a'r ffordd gynhwysol y ceisiodd ddatblygu'r prosiect hwn. A gytuna mai mater i'r bwrdd yw cadeiryddiaeth ac aelodaeth bwrdd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru? A gytuna y gwnaeth Syr Alan Cox, y cyn gadeirydd, gyfraniad pwysig tuag at ddechrau'r gwaith ar y prosiect hwn a sicrhau brwdfrydedd amdano? Croesawaf y cadeirydd newydd Syr David Rowe-Beddoe.

Croesawaf y rôl y mae'r Gweinidog wedi gofyn i'r Pwyllgor ymgymryd â hi a'i bod wedi cydnabod nad yw'r arbenigedd gennym i roi sicrwydd cadarn ynglŷn â sefyllfa refeniw y prosiect hwn, ond ein bod yn fodlon adolygu'r ffigurau a, gobeithio, cael ein sicrhau gan y bwrdd eu bod o dan reolaeth. A wnaiff hi ein sicrhau hefyd yn fwy cadarn—mae wedi gwneud hynny i ryw raddau—na fydd gwariant ar Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn effeithio ar y gwariant ar y celfyddydau yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru nac ar gyllideb Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru? A yw'n derbyn y bydd angen i'r Cynulliad gyfrannu'n ariannol flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn tuag at arian refeniw y ganolfan er mwyn sicrhau bod ganddi raglen allgyrch i Gymru gyfan, er mwyn adlewyrchu diwylliant Cymru?

We welcome the way in which the Minister has dealt with this situation and the way in which the project is proceeding. We will look at the capital figures and revenue figures in detail, but I trust that we can proceed with this project, which is so important to culture in Wales.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cydnabod goblygiadau Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru i'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru. Ni ddylwn roi'r argraff ein bod yn cymryd arian o un ardal yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau y cawn Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Mae'n briodol y bydd y Pwyllgor yn trafod y ganolfan yn arwain at y broses gyllidebu. Mae'n gyfle delfrydol iddo edrych ar natur y celfyddydau yng Nghymru a'r gweithgareddau allgyrch a allai ddeillio o Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru yng nghyd-

request for Jenny Randerson to bring forward proposals relating to arts budgets in Wales. There has to be recognition that if we want Wales to shine in terms of its artists and to deliver we must examine the resources that are available. I give that assurance in that context, providing that there are no more national crises or emergencies.

I value the role that the Committee has undertaken and the further role that it has agreed to undertake. The Committee members are not experts in this field but they had a feel for it and they knew what the issues were during the interviews with the representatives of the Wales Millennium Centre in the Culture Committee. The Committee can play an important and vigorous part in getting to the heart of the issue of whether we need any revenue to be allocated. If that is the issue and that is what we must do, we will do it. Let us be clear at the start of the process that it might require funds from us.

I agree, Rhodri, that the appointment of the chair of the board is a matter for the Wales Millennium Centre. We value the work and the vibrancy of Alan Cox's approach. He wanted the project to shine and go ahead. We have to recognise that. We also have to recognise that the decision of the board is a matter of 'horses for courses'. You would not appoint an artistic director to manage the building of an arts centre; you would appoint an expert in building. We have to recognise the various skills involved.

I thank the Chair of the Culture Committee for his assistance over the last few weeks and also the party spokespeople who have been helpful in enabling me to deliver this statement.

11:25 a.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before we move on, I have received electronic representations that I am in danger of not allowing a balanced view to be put forward. Therefore, I will call Peter Law to speak.

**Peter Law:** I am grateful to you for this

destun ei gais i Jenny Randerson gyflwyno cynigion yn ymwneud â chyllidebau'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru. Rhaid cydnabod, os ydym am i Gymru lewyrchu o ran ei hartistiaid ac er mwyn iddi gyflawni, bod yn rhaid inni archwilio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael. Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, ar yr amod na fydd rhagor o argyfyngau cenedlaethol.

Gwerthfawrogaf y rôl yr ymgymeroedd y Pwyllgor â hi a'r rôl bellach y cytunodd i ymgymryd â hi. Nid yw aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn arbenigwyr yn y maes hwn ond yr oedd ganddynt ymdeimlad ohono a gwyddent beth oedd y materion yn ystod y cyfweliadau â chynrychiolwyr Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Gall y Pwyllgor chwarae rhan bwysig a grymus wrth fynd at wraidd y mater i weld a oedd angen inni ddyrannu unrhyw refeniu. Os mai dyna yw'r mater dan sylw, a dyna beth mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud, yna gwnawn hyunny. Gadewch inni fod yn glir o ddechrau'r broses y gallai olygu bod yn rhaid inni ddarparu'r arian.

Cytunaf Rhodri, mai mater i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru yw penodi cadeirydd i'r bwrdd. Gwerthfawrogwn waith ac egni ymagwedd Alan Cox. Yr oedd am i'r prosiect lewyrchu a datblygu. Rhaid inni gydnabod hyunny. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd bod penderfyniad y bwrdd yn golygu penodi'r person cymwys yn y maes priodol. Ni fyddch yn penodi cyfarwyddwr artistig i reoli'r gwaith o adeiladu canolfan celfyddydau; byddech yn penodi arbenigwr adeiladu. Rhaid inni gydnabod y sgiliau amrywiol sydd yn gysylltiedig â hyn.

Diolchaf i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant am ei gymorth dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf ac i lefarwyr y pleidiau hefyd am eu cymorth i'm galluogi i gyflwyno'r datganiad hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn inni symud ymlaen, derbyniais sylwadau electronig yn datgan fy mod mewn perygl o beidio â gadael i farm gytbwys gael ei chyflwyno. Felly, galwaf ar Peter Law i siarad.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am y

opportunity to speak as I represent another opinion, as some will know. It is important because many people in Wales, the poor people, see this centre as a cultural albatross around their necks. It was originally costed at £75 million and now we are talking about £92 million and possibly £100 million and a blank cheque with a copper bottom guarantee. The Minister for Culture said recently that this project must not be allowed to siphon money from the rest of Wales. That is exactly what it will do. The £25 million or so that was going into this will siphon money from the rest of Wales.

I appreciate that at least two Secretaries of State in the Westminster Government made a commitment to support this and that £2 million was given by the First Minister for the Millennium Centre to assess the situation. Surely, having been given the £2 million, it should have stuck to the £75 million cost envelope and not come back here requiring another £17 million, while people are suffering from social deprivation and inequality in Wales. That is the point. What does this mean for the people of Ceredigion, Rhondda, Denbigh, Caernarfon, those who sleep rough on the streets and my constituents in Blaenau Gwent? Thousands of people will never see it let alone sit in it. I understand that there is £27 million available from the Lottery Commission and that is important for Wales. However, there must be reality. Until now we have been living in a virtual reality—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are in danger of making a speech and you are not the lead speaker in your party group. The lead speaker expressed a similar view to yours. I ask you to draw to a conclusion.

**Peter Law:** I have a minority view and I appreciate your letting me speak. I will wind up now because I will speak to the press outside later. The people of Wales deserve equality and a fair deal. We should at least cap this scheme—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have allowed you to make your point. This is not a debate. These contributions should be questions on the statement. I have allowed

cyfle hwn i siarad gan fy mod yn cynrychioli barn arall, fel y gŵyr rhai ohonoch. Mae'n bwysig oherwydd gwêl llawer o bobl yng Nghymru, y bobl dlawd, y ganolfan hon fel albatros diwylliannol o amgylch eu gyddfau. Cost wreiddiol y ganolfan oedd £75 miliwn ond erbyn hyn mae'n £92 miliwn ac o bosibl yn £100 miliwn gyda siec wag â gwarant ddibynadwy. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant yn ddiweddar na ddylid caniatáu i'r prosiect hwn sugno arian o weddill Cymru. Dyna'n union beth a wna. Bydd y £25 miliwn neu oddeutu hynny a oedd ar gael ar gyfer hyn yn sugno arian o weddill Cymru.

Gwerthfawrogaf fod o leiaf dau Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi ymrwymo i gefnogi hyn a bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi rhoi £2 filiwn ar gyfer Canolfan y Mileniwm i asesu'r sefyllfa. Does bosib, ar ôl cael y £2 filiwn, y dylai fod wedi glynu at y £75 miliwn a oedd ar gael yn hytrach na dod yn ôl yma i ofyn am £17 miliwn arall, tra bod pobl yn dioddef o amddifadedd cymdeithasol ac anghyfartaledd yng Nghymru. Dyna'r pwynt. Beth mae hyn yn ei olygu i bobl Ceredigion, Rhondda, Dinbych, Caernarfon, y rheini sydd yn cysgu ar y strydoedd a'm hetholwyr ym Mlaenau Gwent? Ni fydd miloedd o bobl byth yn ei gweld heb sôn am eistedd ynddi. Deallaf fod £27 miliwn ar gael gan Gomisiwn y Loteri ac mae hynny'n bwysig i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cael realiti. Hyd yn hyn buom yn byw mewn rhithwir—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych mewn perygl o wneud arraith ac nid chi yw prif siaradwr grŵp eich plaid. Mynegodd y prif siaradwr farn debyg i'ch un chi. Gofynnaf ichi ddod i ben.

**Peter Law:** Mae gennyl farn leiafrifol a gwerthfawrogaf eich bod yn gadael imi siarad. Gwnaf ddirwyn i ben yn awr oherwydd siaradaf â'r wasg y tu allan yn ddiweddarach. Mae pobl Cymru yn haeddu cydraddoldeb a chwarae teg. Dylem o leiaf geisio capio'r cynllun hwn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Caniateais ichi wneud eich pwynt. Nid dadl yw hon. Dylai'r cyfraniadau hyn fod yn gwestiynau ar y datganiad. Caniateais gwestiynau estynedig

extended questions by one speaker from your group whose position was not inconsistent with yours.

**Peter Law:** I ask that the Wales Millennium Centre committee cap this scheme at £75 million.

**Edwina Hart:** If you ask it to cap it, you will say goodbye to the scheme, to £27 million, to the public money that has been invested. There is not a blank cheque for this scheme. I find that comment quite insulting. I have set out in words of one syllable the financial arrangements and tests that I envisage. There is not a blank cheque. This is a realisation of the current situation. It is not ideal that we are only at this stage. It would have been nice if this project had been done and dusted 12 months ago, but it was not. That is life. Now that we have decided to get a real grip on this, we know where we are going.

When I was a trade union official I was privileged to be involved with many people from many companies across the world. I used to think that they looked at Wales in terms of cheap labour costs and so on and that that was why they came to Wales. There were elements of that but it was also because they knew where Wales was. They knew because of the Welsh National Opera company. When they were sitting in some American town or city listening to the WNO, they could tell that it was a prestigious company. That is how they knew about Wales and were persuaded to visit sites in Wales.

We must recognise that companies such as the WNO, and the arts and culture of Wales, are key to our economic development. That is what will bring prosperity to areas such as Ceredigion and the Valleys. We cannot be narrow-minded and think that if it does not happen in Cardiff, it will happen somewhere else and that only that area will benefit. That will not happen. This statement is about being realistic. The centre will not go ahead if it goes beyond the cost envelope.

gan un siaradwr o'ch grŵp nad oedd ei farm yn anghyson â'ch un chi.

**Peter Law:** Gofynnaf i bwyllgor Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru gapio'r cynllun hwn ar £75 miliwn.

**Edwina Hart:** Os gofynnwch iddo ei gapio, gallwch ffarwelio â'r cynllun, â £27 miliwn, â'r arian cyhoeddus a fuddsoddwyd. Nid oes siec wag ar gyfer y cynllun hwn. Teimlaf fod y sylw hwnnw yn eithaf sarhaus. Nodais mewn geiriau unsill y trefniadau ariannol a'r profion/amodau a ragwelaf. Nid oes siec wag. Dyma realiti'r sefyllfa bresennol. Nid yw'n ddelfrydol mai dim ond ar y cam hwn yr ydym. Byddai wedi bod yn braf pe bai'r prosiect hwn wedi ei orffen 12 mis yn ôl, ond nid oedd. Fel yna y mae pethau. Gan ein bod wedi penderfynu cael gafael bendant ar bethau erbyn hyn, gwyddom i ble yr ydym yn mynd.

Pan oeddwn yn swyddog undeb llafur cefais y fraint o ymwneud â llawer o bobl o lawer o gwmniâu ledled y byd. Arferwn feddwl eu bod yn ystyried Cymru yn nhermau costau llafur rhad ac yn y blaen ac mai dyna pam y daethant i Gymru. Yr oedd hynny'n wir i raddau ond yr oedd hefyd am eu bod yn gwybod ble yr oedd Cymru. Gwyddent oherwydd Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru. Pan oeddent yn eistedd mewn rhyw dref neu ddinas yn America yn gwrando ar Gwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, yr oeddent yn ymwybodol ei fod yn gwmni blaenllaw. Dyna sut y gwyddent am Gymru a sut y cawsant eu darbwyllo i ymweld â safleoedd yng Nghymru.

Rhaid inni gydnabod bod cwmniâu fel Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, a chelfyddydau a diwylliant Cymru, yn allweddol i'n datblygiad economaidd. Dyna beth ddaw â ffyniant i ardaloedd fel Ceredigion a'r Cymoedd. Ni allwn fod â meddwl cul a chredu os na fydd hyn yn digwydd yng Nghaerdydd, y bydd yn digwydd yn rhywle arall ac mai dim ond yr ardal honno fydd yn elwa ar hynny. Ni fydd hynny'n digwydd. Mae'r datganiad hwn yn sôn am fod yn realistig. Nid aiff y ganolfan yn ei blaen os aiff y tu hwnt i drothwy'r gost.

## Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Jonathan Morgan:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 9.10, relating to the business of Subject Committees. As you will be aware, Presiding Officer, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee is undertaking a review of higher education. During early June, we are due to attend meetings in Scotland and Northern Ireland, in order to augment that review. Those are important meetings and will have an important contribution to make to the review. However, yesterday, Government Ministers tried to persuade the Committee to postpone these meetings, so disrupting its business, because of the pending Westminster general election. I seek your ruling on this matter, because I feel strongly that the Assembly's business, and that of the Subject Committees, needs to continue without being hindered by the pending general election at Westminster.

**Alun Pugh:** Further to that, that was an absurd point of order because the dates for the visits have not yet been fixed. All we asked for yesterday was that some common sense be applied in determining the dates.

**Gareth Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan. Mae llawer o wastraffu amser yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd wrth sôn am etholiad cyffredinol—cyfeiriasoch at hynny y bore yma, Lywydd. Mae hynny bellach yn digwydd mewn Pwyllgor sydd â phethau holl bwysig i'w trafod. Gallaf felly ond gefnogi'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan Morgan, gan fod yn rhaid i'r Pwyllgor fwrw ymlaen â'r rhaglen y mae yn ei hystyried, heb edrych dros Glawdd Offa at rywbeth a allai ddigwydd neu beidio.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Further to that point of order, I am sorry that the Chair of the Committee is not in the Chamber to respond to the concerns expressed. As Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, what I said in Committee yesterday was that we must ask our colleagues in Scotland and Northern

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 9.10, sydd yn ymwneud â busnes y Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Fel y gwyddoch, Lywydd, mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn cynnal adolygiad o addysg uwch. Ar ddechrau Mehefin, byddwn yn mynchu cyfarfodydd yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, er mwyn ategu'r adolygiad hwnnw. Maent yn gyfarfodydd pwysig a bydd ganddynt gyfraniad pwysig i'w wneud i'r adolygiad. Fodd bynnag, ddoe, ceisiodd Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth ddarbwyllo'r Pwyllgor i ohirio'r cyfarfodydd hynny, gan amharu ar ei fusnes, oherwydd etholiad cyffredinol arfaethedig San Steffan. Ceisiaf eich dyfarniad ar y mater hwn, oherwydd teimlaf yn gryf fod angen i fusnes y Cynulliad, a busnes y Pwyllgorau Pwnc, barhau heb gael ei rwystro gan yr etholiad cyffredinol arfaethedig yn San Steffan.

**Alun Pugh:** Ymhellach i hynny, yr oedd hwnnw'n bwynt o drefn hurt oherwydd ni phenderfynwyd ar y dyddiadau ar gyfer yr ymweliadau eto. Y cyfan y gofynasom amdano ddoe oedd i rywfaint o synnwyr cyffredin gael ei arddel wrth benderfynu ar y dyddiadau.

**Gareth Jones:** Further to that point of order, I agree with what Jonathan said. Much time is wasted at present in talking about a general election—you referred to that this morning, Presiding Officer. That is now happening in a Committee that has very important issues to discuss. Therefore, I can only support what Jonathan Morgan said, because the Committee must proceed with the programme that it is considering, without looking over Offa's Dyke to something that may or may not happen.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, mae'n ddrwg gennyl nad yw Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn y Siambra i ymateb i'r pryderon a fynegwyd. Fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yr hyn a ddywedais yn y Pwyllgor ddoe oedd bod yn rhaid inni ofyn i'n cyd-Aelodau yn yr Alban

Ireland whether or not the dates we had originally chosen for the meetings are still appropriate in light of any considerations raised by other Members. The Committee then agreed that the clerk would consider, with colleagues in Scotland and Northern Ireland, whether or not the visits should go ahead on the initial putative dates or whether they should be postponed for a few weeks. The Chair then asked the Committee clerk to consider dates, and the whole Committee confirmed that it wants to ensure that the meetings go ahead in the timetable for the review. I reject the suggestion that I, as Minister, said that the timetable should be put back.

**Huw Lewis:** Further to that point of order, Jonathan is wasting Plenary time. We are discussing dates of meetings with colleagues from Scotland and Northern Ireland that the Committee has not yet fixed, in relation to the date of a general election that has not been fixed either. This is somewhat of a riddle within an enigma. The Committee made a sensible decision, with which it was content and this, therefore, does not need to be discussed in Plenary.

**The Presiding Officer:** The point of order was raised out of a general concern about the position of the Assembly in relation to a Westminster election. A Subject Committee's timetable is not a matter for me, it is a matter for the Chair, in consultation with the Minister and its members. I am sure that the Committee Chair—who is now in the Chamber—is fully able to discuss this matter with the Minister and the clerk.

**Cynog Dafis:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, hoffwn nodi ein bod wedi cynnal trafodaeth ar y mater a chafwyd awgrymiadau na ddylem ymweld â Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban ar y dyddiadau a fwriadwyd yn wreiddiol, ond nad oedd wedi eu pennu'n derfynol. Penderfynodd y Pwyllgor y dylai'r ymweliadau ddigwydd ar adeg gyfleus i bawb, yng Nghymru, Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o ymweld mewn da bryd fel y gellir defnyddio'r wybodaeth a gasglwn yn yr adolygiad.

a Gogledd Iwerddon a yw'r dyddiadau a ddewisasom yn wreiddiol ar gyfer y cyfarfodydd yn briodol o hyd yng ngoleuni unrhyw ystyriaethau a godwyd gan yr Aelodau eraill. Yna cytunodd y Pwyllgor y byddai'r cleric yn ystyried, gyda chyd-Aelodau yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, a ddylai'r ymweliadau fynd yn eu blaen ar y dyddiadau tybiedig cychwynnol ai peidio neu a ddylid eu gohirio am rai wythnosau. Yna gofynnodd y Cadeirydd i glerc y Pwyllgor ystyried dyddiadau, a chadarhaodd y Pwyllgor cyfan ei fod am sierhau bod y cyfarfodydd yn mynd yn eu blaen o fewn yr amserlen ar gyfer yr adolygiad. Gwrthodaf yr awgrym fy mod, fel Gweinidog, wedi dweud y dylid gohirio'r amserlen.

**Huw Lewis:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, mae Jonathan yn gwastraffu amser y Cyfarfod Llawn. Yr ydym yn trafod dyddiadau cyfarfodydd â chyd-Aelodau o'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon nad yw'r Pwyllgor wedi eu pennu eto, mewn perthynas â dyddiad etholiad cyffredinol nas pennwyd ychwaith. Mae hyn yn rhywfaint o bos o fewn enigma. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor benderfyniad synhwyrol ac mae'n fodlon arno ac felly, nid oes angen trafod hyn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Codwyd y pwynt o drefn o bryder cyffredinol ynglŷn â sefyllfa'r Cynulliad mewn perthynas ag etholiad yn San Steffan. Nid mater i mi yw amserlen Pwyllgor Pwnc. Mae'n fater i'r Cadeirydd drwy ymgynghori â'r Gweinidog a'i aelodau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gall Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor—sydd yn y Siambro erbyn hyn—drafod y mater hwn yn llawn gyda'r Gweinidog a'r cleric.

**Cynog Dafis:** Further to that point of order, I would like to note that we discussed this matter and it was suggested that we should not visit Northern Ireland and Scotland on the dates originally intended, but which had not been ultimately determined. The Committee decided that the visits should take place at a convenient time for all concerned, in Wales, Northern Ireland and Scotland. We are determined to visit in good time so that the information that we gather can be used in the review.

11:35 a.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor am ei sylwadau. Nid oes etholiad ar gyfer y Siambwr hon, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, ac yr wyf yn awyddus i'r Cynulliad barhau â'i waith fel arfer.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.30 ar gwestiynau llafar. Codais y pwynt hwn fwy nag unwaith. Ar ôl cwestiwn pump i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, nid oedd cyfle ar gyfer cwestiwn atodol gan Aelodau, er bod gennyf fater etholaethol i'w godi. Nid wyf yn beirniadu'r Llywydd. Gwn ei bod yn eithriadol o anodd i reoli trafodion y Siambwr, ond dylid sicrhau bod cwestiynau atodol i bob cwestiwn a bod modd i'r Llywydd reoli amleiredd Gweinidogion.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i Rhodri Glyn Thomas am ei sicrwydd nad yw'n beirniadu'r Llywydd. Derbyniaf hynny yn yr ysbryd y'i cyflwynwyd. Tynnais sylw at y mater hwn ddydd Iau diwethaf pan oedd atebion gan Weinidogion yn golygu nad oedd modd i Aelod, heblaw'r Aelod a gyflwynodd y cwestiwn i'w godi'n llafar, i ofyn cwestiwn atodol.

Gofynnaf i Weinidogion, ac ni allaf wneud mwy na hynny, i ystyried a yw'n briodol i wneud datganiadau polisi sylweddol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn neu a ydynt yn fwy addas i'w gwneud mewn Pwyllgor. Os ydynt i'w gwneud mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, dylent fod ar ffurf datganiad yn hytrach nag mewn atebion i gwestiynau. Mae hynny'n hwyluso pethau o safbwyt yr ymateb gan Aelodau, sydd o'r pwys mwyaf i mi. Mae'r sesiwn gwestiynau yn bennaf ar gyfer Aelodau o bob plaid i ofyn cwestiynau. Mae cydbwysedd rhwng y pleidiau o ran gofyn cwestiynau yn fater o ddiddordeb i'r sawl sydd yn y Gadair.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This relates to guidelines that I think have been issued by the Assembly and not yet published, relating to the conduct of Assembly business before the general election. I appreciate that we do not know the date of the general election, but

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the Chair of the Committee for his comments. There is no election for this Chamber, as I said earlier, and I am eager for the Assembly to proceed with its work as usual.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.30 on oral questions. I have raised this point more than once. Following question five to the Minister for Environment, there was no opportunity for Members to ask a supplementary question, although I had a constituency matter to raise. I am not criticising the Presiding Officer. I know that it is extremely difficult to control Chamber proceedings, but it should be ensured that there are supplementary questions to every question and that the Presiding Officer can control the verbosity of Ministers.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank Rhodri Glyn Thomas for his assurance that he is not criticising the Presiding Officer. I accept that in the spirit in which it was presented. I drew attention to this matter last Thursday when replies from Ministers meant that it was not possible for a Member, apart from the Member who had tabled the oral question, to raise a supplementary question.

I ask Ministers, and I can do no more than that, to consider whether it is appropriate to make substantial policy statements in Plenary or whether it would be more appropriate to do so in Committee. If they do so in Plenary, it should be in the form of a statement rather than in answers to questions. That facilitates matters with regard to the response from Members, which concerns me most. The main purpose of the question and answer session is for Members from every party to ask questions. The balance between the parties in terms of asking questions is of concern to the person in the Chair.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chanllawiau a gyflwynwyd, fe gredaf, gan y Cynulliad, ond nas cyhoeddwyd eto, sydd yn ymwneud â'r ffordd y cynhelir busnes y Cynulliad cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol. Gwerthfawrogaf na wyddom

it will be while the Assembly is sitting. Sir Richard Wilson has indicated that Westminster has guidelines as to what Government announcements can be made in the period before a general election. We are in new territory, but it would be helpful, First Minister, if these guidelines could be issued to all Members so that we are aware of what can and what cannot happen in that period.

ddyddiad yr etholiad cyffredinol, ond bydd yn ystod eisteddiad y Cynulliad. Nododd Syr Richard Wilson fod gan San Steffan ganllawiau o ran pa gyhoeddiadau'r Llywodraeth y gellir eu gwneud yn y cyfnod cyn etholiad cyffredinol. Mae hwn yn faes newydd inni, ond byddai'n ddefnyddiol, Brif Weinidog, pe gellid cyflwyno'r canllawiau hyn i bob Aelod fel ein bod yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a all ddigwydd a'r hyn na all ddigwydd yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will consider this matter. I understand that guidelines have been prepared about the use of the Assembly Chamber, for example, and there are also guidelines to Assembly officials. That could also affect the position of support staff.

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Further to that point of order, I believe that those guidelines will be made available, but not before the election is called, because to issue them would be to presume the date of the general election. The rules for both Assembly Ministers and officials are being prepared for what is, as Nick has accepted, a difficult situation because it is the first ever post-devolution general election. As soon as the general election is called, those rules will become public knowledge.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have been advised by the Clerk that guidelines have been issued generally, and made available to Members, about the use of Assembly property. That applies not only to Westminster elections but even more so to our election which will be on a fixed date in 2003.

**Nick Bourne:** Further to that point of order, my point was not about Assembly property, though that is also important. It is in relation to Government announcements in the period before a general election. I understand, though I stand to be corrected, that these guidelines are prepared. They are not in draft form. We received an indication from Westminster that they are prepared. Therefore I cannot see why they cannot be issued to Members. You are right, First Minister, that we are in virgin territory but it is important that all Members are aware of the rules and goalposts. If the rules are ready

**Y Llywydd:** Byddwn yn ystyried y mater hwn. Deallaf y paratowyd canllawiau ynglŷn â defnyddio Siambwr y Cynulliad, er enghrafft, ac mae canllawiau hefyd ar gael ar gyfer swyddogion y Cynulliad. Gallai hynny effeithio ar sefyllfa'r staff cymorth hefyd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, credaf y bydd y canllawiau hynny ar gael, ond nid cyn y gelwir etholiad, oherwydd byddai eu cyflwyno yn golygu rhagdybio dyddiad yr etholiad cyffredinol. Caiff y rheolau ar gyfer Gweinidogion y Cynulliad a'r swyddogion eu paratoi ar gyfer yr hyn sydd, fel y derbyniodd Nick, yn sefyllfa anodd gan mai dyma'r etholiad cyffredinol cyntaf ers datganoli. Cyn gynted ag y gelwir yr etholiad cyffredinol, daw'r rheolau hynny yn hysbys i bawb.

**Y Llywydd:** Fe'm cyngorwyd gan y Clerc bod canllawiau ynglŷn â defnyddio eiddo'r Cynulliad wedi eu cyflwyno'n gyffredinol, a'u bod ar gael i'r Aelodau. Mae hynny'n berthnasol nid yn unig i etholiadau San Steffan ond hyd yn oed yn fwy felly i'n hetholiad ni a fydd ar ddyddiad penodedig yn 2003.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, nid oedd fy mhwynt yn ymwneud ag eiddo'r Cynulliad, er bod hynny'n bwysig hefyd. Mae mewn perthynas â chyhoeddiadau'r Llywodraeth yn y cyfnod cyn etholiad cyffredinol. Deallaf, er y syrthiaf ar fy mai os wylf yn anghywir, fod y canllawiau hyn wedi eu paratoi. Nid ydynt ar ffurf ddrafft. Derbyniwasom awgrym gan San Steffan eu bod wedi eu paratoi. Felly, ni allaf weld pam na ellir eu rhoi i'r Aelodau. Yr ydych yn iawn, Brif Weinidog, ein bod yn torri tir newydd ond mae'n bwysig fod pob Aelod yn ymwybodol o'r rheolau a'r

for issuing to Members I cannot see any reason why that cannot be done.

**The Presiding Officer:** I believe that the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives may be referring to guidance to the Executive. I have no responsibility for anything that emanates from Westminster, except for any speeches that I may make in the second Chamber.

amodau. Os yw'r rheolau yn barod i'w rhoi i'r Aelodau, ni allaf weld unrhyw reswm dros beidio â gwneud hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf fod Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cyfeirio efallai at ganllawiau i'r Weithrediaeth. Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am unrhyw beth sydd yn deillio o San Steffan, ar wahân i unrhyw areithiau a wnaf yn yr ail Siambr efallai.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Presiding Officer:** In the absence of the Minister for Assembly Business, I call Jane Davidson to propose the motion.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the no-named day motion tabled on 3 April 2001 on approving the three-month timetable of Assembly business.*

Andrew Davies referred to the fact that this procedural motion would be proposed today in his business statement on Tuesday.

**Y Llywydd:** Yn absenoldeb y Trefnydd, galwaf ar Jane Davidson i gynnig y cynnig.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn gerbron y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod a gyflwynwyd ar 3 Ebrill 2001 ar gymeradwyo'r amserlen tri mis ar gyfer busnes y Cynulliad.*

Cyfeiriodd Andrew Davies at y ffaith y cai'r cynnig trefniadol hwn ei gynnig heddiw yn ei ddatganiad busnes ddydd Mawrth.

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbynwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Cymeradwyo'r Amserlen Tri Mis ar gyfer Busnes y Cynulliad**  
**Approval of the Three-month Timetable of Assembly Business**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly notes the proposed three-month timetable of Assembly business laid in the Table Office on 3 April 2001, under Standing Order No. 5.1.*

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi'r amserlen tri mis arfaethedig ar gyfer busnes y Cynulliad a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ebrill 2001, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.1.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val

German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir y cynnig hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ac felly ni chynhelir dadl arno.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25,*

*approves the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) and (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment) (No.2) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) and (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment) (No.2) (Wales)*

**The Presiding Officer:** This motion is proposed under Standing Order No. 22.25, and therefore it is not subject to debate.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25,*

*yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2001;*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2)*

*Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 March 2001;* (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mawrth 2001;

*approves the Valuation Tribunals (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 6 March 2001;* yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mawrth 2001;

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Valuation Tribunals (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 March 2001;* yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mawrth 2001;

*approves the Coffee Extracts and Chicory Extracts (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 21 March 2001;* yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Echdynion Coffi ac Echdynion Sicori (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Mawrth 2001;

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Coffee Extracts and Chicory Extracts (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 27 March 2001 and the Memorandum of Corrections laid in Table Office on 28 March 2001;* yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Echdynion Coffi ac Echdynion Sicori (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mawrth 2001 a'r Memorandwm Cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mawrth 2001.

*approves the Ancient Monuments (Applications for Scheduled Monument Consent) (Welsh Forms and Particulars) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2001; and:* yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Henebion (Ceisiadau am Gydsyniad Heneb Gofrestredig) (Ffurflen i a Manylion Cymraeg) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2001; ac

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Ancient Monuments (Applications for Scheduled Monument Consent) (Welsh Forms and Particulars) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 March 2001.* yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Henebion (Ceisiadau am Gydsyniad Heneb Gofrestredig) (Ffurflen i a Manylion Cymraeg) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mawrth 2001.

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane

Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000  
(Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001**  
**The Approval of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000  
(Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2001**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham to the first motion.

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*considers the principle of the Countryside and Right of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2001.*

I propose that

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham i'r cynnig cyntaf.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2001.*

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified under Standing Order No. 11.5 any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Countryside and Right of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 March 2001; and*

*approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2001.*

The purpose of these motions is to seek your agreement to making the Countryside and Right of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2001 in order to bring into effect certain provisions embodied in the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000.

I will not support William Graham's amendment 1, because it seeks to reopen the debate about a voluntary approach to the provision of countryside access. The Assembly debated that issue prior to the Act's Royal Assent. The provision of a statutory right of access now underpins the legislation and there is no merit in re-examining the principle. In addition, the Act provides for landowners who wish to voluntarily dedicate land as access 1 and to do so.

The Order relates to a limited range of powers under the Act to come into effect from 1 May 2001. The Order will bring into effect all the provisions of Part IV, which relate to areas of outstanding natural beauty. These include procedures for designating areas of outstanding natural beauty, power for the Assembly to establish conservation boards for such areas and a duty for local authorities to prepare areas of outstanding natural beauty management plans within three years.

The Order also commences provisions for the Countryside Council for Wales to make recommendations to access authorities in the use of their powers and to make by-laws over accessed land where appropriate. It also

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n peri pryder dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 yn y gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mawrth 2001; ac*

*yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2001.*

Diben y cynigion hyn yw ceisio eich cytundeb i gyflwyno Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001 er mwyn rhoi darpariaethau penodol ar waith sydd yn rhan o Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000.

Ni chefnogaf welliant 1 William Graham, gan ei fod yn ceisio ailagor y ddadl am ymagwedd wirfoddol tuag at ddarparu mynediad i gefn gwlaid. Cynhaliodd y Cynulliad ddadl ar y mater hwnnw cyn Cydsyniad Brenhinol y Ddeddf. Mae darpariaeth hawl mynediad statudol yn sail i'r ddeddfwriaeth bellach ac nid oes rhinwedd i ailarchwilio'r egwyddor. Hefyd, darpara'r Ddeddf ar gyfer tirfeddianwyr sydd yn dymuno neilltuo tir yn wirfoddol fel mynediad 1 a gwneud hynny.

Mae'r Gorchymyn yn ymwneud ag amrywiaeth cyfyngedig o bwerau o dan y Ddeddf sydd i'w gweithredu o 1 Mai 2001. Bydd y Gorchymyn yn rhoi holl ddarpariaethau Rhan IV, sydd yn ymwneud ag ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol, ar waith. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys gweithdrefnau ar gyfer dynodi ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol, pŵer i'r Cynulliad sefydlu byrddau cadwraeth ar gyfer ardaloedd o'r fath a dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i baratoi cynlluniau rheoli ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol o fewn tair blynedd.

Cychwynna'r Gorchymyn hefyd ddarpariaethau i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru wneud argymhellion i gael mynediad i awdurdodau o ran gwneud defnydd o'u pwerau a chreu is-ddeddfau dros dir y cafwyd

allows it to make grants and loans to any person for any of the purposes of the Act. Thirdly, it states that CCW must include a report on the discharges of its functions under the Act in its annual report. These are important provisions.

The Order will commence provisions relating to private vehicular access across common land to premises. It also introduces amendments to the Highways Act 1980, which provide for simplified procedures for closing or diverting footpaths or bridal ways when justified on grounds such as the safety of school children and staff, crime prevention and where there is unreasonable interference with agriculture.

The main control mechanisms on the right of access will be introduced through regulations that have yet to be presented to the Assembly. They will first be the subject of detailed consultation, but there will be an opportunity for a full debate on these provisions in due course.

In themselves, the provisions in this Order will not provide greater access to the countryside. The public will have not have a general right of access to the countryside until access land has been mapped and other preparatory work completed. It is important to state that. The provisions of this commencement Order will not hinder the fight against the spread of the foot and mouth disease in any way. It represents the next step in implementing the provisions of this important Act and making the most of the opportunities it provides for this country. I commend the motions to Members.

11:45 a.m.

**David Davies:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of William Graham. Add at the end of the first motion:

*notes the additional financial and bureaucratic burdens placed upon landowners and local authorities as a result of this legislation and recognises that voluntary access agreements represent a*

mynediad iddo lle y bo'n briodol. Caniatâ iddo hefyd roi grantiau a benthyciadau i unrhyw berson at unrhyw un o ddibenion y Ddeddf. Yn drydydd, noda fod yn rhaid i'r Cyngor gynnwys adroddiad ar gyflawni ei swyddogaethau o dan y Ddeddf yn ei adroddiad blynnyddol. Mae'r rhain yn ddarpariaethau pwysig.

Bydd y Gorchymyn yn cychwyn darpariaethau mewn perthynas â mynediad preifat i gerbydau ar draws tir cyffredin i eiddo. Cyflwyna hefyd welliannau i Ddeddf Prifyrdd 1980, sydd yn darparu ar gyfer gweithdrefnau wedi'u symleiddio ar gyfer cau neu ddargyfeirio llwybrau troed neu ffyrdd ceffylau pan fo cyflawnhad dros hynny am resymau fel diogelu plant ysgol a staff, atal troseddau a lle yr ymyrrir ag amaethyddiaeth mewn ffordd afresymol.

Cyflwynir y prif ddulliau rheoli ar yr hawl mynediad drwy reoliadau sydd eto i'w dwyn gerbron y Cynulliad. Ymgynghorir arnynt yn fanwl yn gyntaf, ond bydd cyfle am ddadlawn ar y darpariaethau hyn maes o law.

Ynddynt eu hunain, ni fydd y darpariaethau yn y Gorchymyn hwn yn rhoi mwy o fynediad i gefn gwlad. Ni fydd gan y cyhoedd hawl mynediad cyffredinol i gefn gwlad hyd nes y caiff tir mynediad ei fapio ac y cwblheir gwaith rhagbaratoawl arall. Mae'n bwysig nodi hynny. Ni fydd darpariaethau'r Gorchymyn cychwyn hwn yn rhwystr i'r frwydr yn erbyn lledaeniad clwy'r traed a'r genau mewn unrhyw ffordd. Y cam nesaf ydyw yn y broses o weithredu darpariaethau'r Ddeddf bwysig hon a gwneud y gorau o'r cyfleoedd y mae'n eu darparu ar gyfer y wlad hon. Cymeradwyaf y cynigion i'r Aelodau.

**David Davies:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw William Graham. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi'r beichiau ariannol a biwrocrataidd ychwanegol a roddir ar dirfeddianwyr ac awdurdodau lleol o ganlyniad i'r ddeddfwriaeth hon ac yn cydnabod bod cytundebau mynediad gwirfoddol yn ffordd*

*more cost efficient and participatory way forward.*

The Conservative group has deep concerns about the current right-to-roam legislation. We support the general provision for greater access to the countryside. However, creating access by imposing compulsory burdens on farmers is not the answer. The foot and mouth disease crisis has already increased costs and pressure on farmers to an intolerable degree. The additional burdens of enacting this legislation could push some beyond breaking point. Foot and mouth disease has shown how fragile our countryside is. The Government would not consider allowing unfettered access to factories or industrial complexes. At least, I do not think it is considering that at present. However, it does not seem to realise that allowing walkers to roam around the nation's food-producing areas could have serious consequences. Voluntary access would at least allow farmers some control over which areas are made available to the public, and at which times of the year. This legislation will impose increased costs on local authorities and farmers. The Government has failed to take account of that, and our amendment, which I hope that Members will support, is an attempt to put that right. The Government may argue that there will not be an increase in costs. In that case, I urge it to support our amendment because it will not cost it anything but will provide reassurance in rural areas.

What we find most insidious about this scheme is that it represents an attack on one of the most basic human rights: the right to own property. New Labour members may have thrown away their donkey jackets and shaved off their beards and may even have adopted a few Conservative economic policies such as privatisation—and we congratulate them for that—but, sadly, socialist instincts still lurk and rise to the surface every now and then. This Act is an unpleasant manifestation of those socialist instincts and of putting the interests of the state before the interests and rights of the individual. Even at this late stage, I urge Members to join the Conservative group in

*ymlaen sy'n fwy cost-effeithlon a chyfranogol.*

Mae gan grŵp y Ceidwadwyr bryderon mawr am y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol ynglŷn â'r hawl i grwydro. Cefnogwn y ddarpariaeth gyffredinol ar gyfer mynediad mwy i gefn gwlad. Fodd bynnag, nid creu mynediad drwy orfodi beichiau ar ffermwyr yw'r ateb. Mae argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau eisoes wedi cynyddu'r costau a'r pwysau ar ffermwyr i lefel annioddefol. Gallai'r beichiau ychwanegol o weithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon wthio rhai i ben eu tennyn. Mae clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi dangos mor fregus yw ein cefn gwlad. Ni fyddai'r Llywodraeth yn ystyried caniatâu mynediad dirwystr i ffatrioedd neu gyfadeiladau diwydiannol. O leiaf, ni chredaf ei bod yn ystyried hynny ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, nid ymddengys ei bod yn sylweddoli y gallai caniatâu i gerddwyr grwydro o gwmpas ardaloedd cynhyrchu bwyd y wlad arwain at ganlyniadau difrifol. O leiaf byddai mynediad gwirfoddol yn caniatâu rhywfaint o reolaeth i ffermwyr o ran pa ardaloedd sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd, ac ar ba adegau o'r flwyddyn. Bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn gorfodi costau uwch ar awdurdodau lleol a ffermwyr. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi methu ag ystyried hynny, ac mae ein gwelliant, y gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn ei gefnogi, yn ymgais i unioni hynny. Gallai'r Llywodraeth ddadlau na fydd cynnydd mewn costau. Os felly, fe'i hanogaf i gefnogi ein gwelliant gan na fydd yn costio unrhyw beth iddi ond y bydd yn tawelu meddwl pobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Yr hyn a gawn yn fwyaf lladradaidd am y cynllun hwn yw ei fod yn ymosodiad ar un o'r hawliau dynol mwyaf sylfaenol: yr hawl i feddu ar eiddo. Efallai fod aelodau Llafur newydd wedi taflu eu cotiau gwaith ac eillio eu barfau ac efallai wedi mabwysiadu ychydig o bolisiau economaidd Ceidwadol hyd yn oed fel preifateiddio—ac fe'u llongyfarchwn am hynny—ond, yn anffodus, llecha greddf sosialaidd o hyd gan godi i'r wyneb bob hyn a hyn. Mae'r Ddeddf hon yn amlygiad annymunol o'r reddf sosialaidd honno ac o roi buddiannau'r wlad cyn buddiannau a hawliau'r unigolyn. Hyd yn oed ar yr adeg hwyr hon, anogaf yr Aelodau i ymuno â grŵp y Ceidwadwyr a gwrthod y

rejecting these motions.

**Alun Pugh:** I will be voting to support the Order. One of the few positive aspects of the foot and mouth disease outbreak is the realisation that access to the open countryside underpins the rural economy. I regret that the Welsh Conservatives are still wedded to their slogan ‘get off my land’, even though the principle of open access to our mountains is now enshrined in law. I urge the Conservatives to look at the ghost towns of north Wales, where walkers have been kept away by foot and mouth disease controls, and acquire a vision of a thriving rural economy underpinned by green tourism. Mountains can be places of great danger but, David, if you are equating the Carneddau with a steelworks or an engineering factory, then you need to get out more. [*Laughter.*]

cynigion hyn.

**Alun Pugh:** Byddaf yn pleidleisio i gefnogi'r Gorchymyn. Un o'r ychydig agweddau cadarnhaol ar glwy'r traed a'r genau yw bod pobl wedi sylweddoli bod mynediad i gefn gwlad agored yn sail i'r economi wledig. Mae'n edifar gennyf fod Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn glynu wrth eu slogan, sef 'gadewch fy nhir', er bod egwyddor mynediad agored i'n mynyddoedd bellach wedi ei diogelu'n gyfreithiol. Anogaf y Ceidwadwyr i edrych ar drefi anghyfannedd gogledd Cymru, lle y cadwyd cerddwyr i ffwrdd gan reolaethau clwy'r traed a'r genau, a meithrin gweledigaeth o economi wledig lewyrchus yn seiliedig ar dwristiaeth werdd. Gall mynyddoedd fod yn lleoedd o berygl mawr ond, David, os rhoddwch y Carneddau yn yr un categori â gwaith dur neu ffatri beirianyddiaeth, yna mae angen ichi fynd allan fwy. [*Chwerthin.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** I apologise for laughing. I had an interest in that last remark.

**Y Llywydd:** Ymddiheuraf am chwerthin. Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb yn y sylw diwethaf yna.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I have come to the front of the Chamber to speak because I want to address some of my remarks to David Davies and it is difficult to do so from behind a pillar. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will support this motion and the Order. We will abstain on the amendment since we share some of the concerns expressed, particularly about the cost. However, I say to the Conservative spokesperson: David, on this issue you and your group are taking the King Canute line. Yours is the group that least wants the National Assembly to have the additional powers needed to take a distinctive approach on the countryside and access issues. It wants those powers to remain at Westminster. I do not think that this Assembly would necessarily have wished to take a different approach. However, if it were left up to the Conservatives, its beloved Westminster Parliament would be the only democratic forum in which Wales would be represented. There would be not be a National Assembly, and you would not want us represented in the European Parliament. It is your beloved Westminster Parliament that has passed this Act. David Davies would have us out of the European Union tomorrow

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf wedi dod i flaen y Siambri i siarad gan fy mod am gyfeirio rhai o'm sylwadau at David Davies ac mae'n anodd gwneud hynny o'r tu ôl i biler. Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn a'r Gorchymyn. Ymataliwn ar y gwelliant gan ein bod yn rhannu rhai o'r pryderon a fynegwyd, yn arbennig am y gost. Fodd bynnag, dywedaf wrth lefarydd y Ceidwadwyr: David, ar y mater hwn yr ydych chi a'ch grŵp yn cymryd safbwyt y Brenin Canute. Eich grŵp chi yw'r grŵp sydd yn dymuno leiaf oll i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael y pwerau ychwanegol sydd eu hangen er mwyn cymryd ymagwedd wahaniaethol ar gefn gwlad a materion mynediad. Mae am i'r pwerau hynny aros yn San Steffan. Ni chredaf y byddai'r Cynulliad hwn o reidrwydd wedi dymuno cymryd ymagwedd wahanol. Fodd bynnag, pe cai'r mater ei adael i'r Ceidwadwyr, eu hannwyl Senedd yn San Steffan fyddai'r unig fforwm democrataidd lle y cai Cymru ei chynrychioli. Ni fyddai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac ni fyddch am inni gael ein cynrychioli yn Senedd Ewrop. Eich annwyl Senedd yn San Steffan sydd wedi pasio'r Ddeddf hon. Byddai David

if he thought he could get away with it. As for Alun Cairns, we know where he stands on that. This is the only democratic forum—

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Will you give way to Alun Cairns?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Absolutely not. We have heard quite enough from him and his sort. [Interruption.]

**The Presiding Order:** Order. It would be courteous, since you named Alun Cairns, for you to give way.

**Helen Mary Jones:** If you wish me to do so, Presiding Officer, I would be happy to do so.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is not my wish, it is entirely a matter for you. I am only trying to ensure courtesy.

**Helen Mary Jones:** As you know, that is a high priority for me, so I will certainly allow Alun Cairns to intervene.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for your support, Presiding Officer. I am intrigued by Helen Mary Jones's interpretation of my views. Will she clarify that, so that we all know what they are?

**Helen Mary Jones:** My understanding—and I have heard you say this privately—is that you think that the United Kingdom might be better off in a closer relationship with the United States of America than in one with the European Union. If I have misinterpreted those views, perhaps you should be more careful about what you say.

**Alun Cairns:** My view about a closer union, or closer relationship—

**Helen Mary Jones:** A union with the United States? That is an interesting idea.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know that we are approaching a recess, but I do not

Davies yn ein tynnu allan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yfory pe credai y gallai wneud hynny. Ac o ran Alun Cairns, gwyddom ei safbwyt ef ar hynny. Dyma'r unig fforwm democrataidd—

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** A ildiwr i Alun Cairns?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ddim o gwbl. Clywsom hen ddigon ganddo ef a'i fath. [Torri ar draws.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai'n gwrtais, gan ichi enwi Alun Cairns, ichi ildio.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Os dymunwch imi wneud hynny, Lywydd, byddwn yn barod i wneud hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni ddymunaf i hynny, mater i chi ydyw yn llwyr. Dim ond ceisio sicrhau cwrteisi yr wyf i.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae hynny'n flaenorïaeth uchel i mi, felly caniatâf yn sicr i Alun Cairns ymyrryd.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cefnogaeth, Lywydd. Mae gennyl ddiddordeb yn nehongiad Helen Mary Jones o'm safbwytiau. A wnaiff egluro hynny, er mwyn inni i gyd wybod beth ydynt?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf i—ac yr wyf wedi eich clywed yn dweud hyn yn breifat—credwch y gallai fod yn well i'r Deyrnas Unedig fod mewn perthynas agosach ag Unol Daleithiau America nag mewn perthynas gyda'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Os camddehonglais y safbwytiau hynny, efallai y dylech fod yn fwy gofalus am yr hyn a ddywedwch.

**Alun Cairns:** Nid yw fy safbwyt am undeb agosach, neu berthynas agosach—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Undeb gyda'r Unol Daleithiau? Mae hynny'n syniad diddorol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwn ein bod yn dynesu at doriad, ond nid wyf am i'r ddadl hon

want this debate to degenerate. One speaker at a time please, and I would appreciate it if we could then get on with the debate.

**Alun Cairns:** My view about a closer relationship with the United States of America does not preclude a policy of being in Europe, but I do not want to be run by Europe.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am sure that we all find that enormously reassuring. However, my main point is that this is an Act passed by the Westminster Parliament, which is where the Conservative group wants primary legislative power to reside. That is not what I want, but what it wants. In the light of that, as much as we enjoy your dramatic performances, David, on this issue as on so many others, it is high time that you stopped trying to turn the clock back and started to attempt to work co-operatively to ensure that this legislation is implemented as swiftly and as fairly as possible.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales has concerns about some aspects of this legislation. The Minister is well aware of those concerns, which are about resourcing, information and detailed issues such as the control of dogs. However, now that the legislation exists, the sensible and, dare I say it, grown-up thing to do is to co-operate to ensure that the legislation is implemented as well as it possibly can be. I am confident that we can continue to do that through the Committee.

**Karen Sinclair:** I do not intend to say a great deal; I would like to make an observation and ask a question of David Davies. His is a hypocritical stand, because we all remember the views of the Tories—the Welsh Conservatives, forgive me—on the Burns report on hunting with dogs. Farmers often do not want hunts to ride across their land. Therefore, according to the Welsh Conservatives the right to rampage was acceptable, but the right to roam for the many seems to be totally unacceptable. Those are conflicting views.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I remind Members that this debate is not about

ddirywio. Un siaradwr ar y tro os gwelwch yn dda, a byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi gallu bwrw ymlaen â'r ddadl wedi hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Nid yw fy safbwyt am berthynas agosach ag Unol Daleithiau America yn nacáu polisi o fod yn Ewrop, ond nid wyf am inni gael ein rheoli gan Ewrop.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n gysur mawr inni i gyd. Fodd bynnag, fy mhrif bwynt yw bod hon yn Ddeddf a basiwyd gan Senedd San Steffan, sef lle yr hoffai grŵp y Ceidwadwyr i bŵer deddfwriaethol sylfaenol aros. Nid dyna fynymuniad i, ond eu dysmuniad hwy. Yng ngoleuni hynny, pa faint bynnag y mwynhawn eich perfformiadau dramatig, David, ar y mater hwn fel ar gymaint o faterion eraill, mae'n hen bryd ichi roi'r gorau i geisio troi'r cloc yn ôl a dechrau ceisio cydweithio i sicrhau y rhoddir y ddeddfwriaeth hon ar waith mewn ffordd mor gyflym a theg â phosibl.

Mae gan Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales bryderon am rai agweddau ar y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r pryderon hynny, sydd yn ymneud ag adnoddau, gwybodaeth a materion manwl fel rheoli cŵn. Fodd bynnag, yn awr bod y ddeddfwriaeth yn bodoli, y peth synhwyrol ac, a feiddiaf ei ddweud, y peth aeddfed yw cydweithredu i sicrhau y gweithredir y ddeddfwriaeth gystal ag sydd yn bosibl. Yr wyf yn hyderus y gallwn barhau i wneud hynny drwy'r Pwyllgor.

**Karen Sinclair:** Ni fwriadaf ddweud llawer; hoffwn wneud sylw a gofyn cwestiwn i David Davies. Mae ei safbwyt ef yn rhagrithiol, gan ein bod i gyd yn cofio safbwytiau'r Toraid—Ceidwadwyr Cymru, maddeuwch imi—ar adroddiad Burns ar hela â chŵn. Yn aml nid yw ffermwyr am gael helwyr yn marchogaeth ar draws eu tir. Felly, yn ôl Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yr oedd yr hawl i redeg yn wylt yn dderbynol, ond ymddengys fod hawl gyffredinol i grwydro yn gwbl annerbynol. Mae'r safbwytiau'n groes i'w gilydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau nad dadl am hela yw hon.

hunting.

**David Davies:** I suspect that the Member may be slightly confused about what are separate issues. We support much of what was said in the Burns report about the fact that abolishing hunting with hounds would have a detrimental impact on the welfare of foxes. That does not mean to say that we support allowing people to irresponsibly—*[Interruption.]*

I am sorry that other Members have not taken the opportunity, as I have done, to read the Burns report. It makes it clear that getting rid of hunting with dogs would be detrimental to the fox because it would lead to hunters using snares and so on.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This debate is not about hunting.

**David Davies:** I agree, but I am merely answering the question. As regards the right to roam, allowing people unfettered access across open farmland is not a sensible option. I do not see a contradiction in holding those views.

**Karen Sinclair:** I had not realised how strongly David Davies felt about the welfare of foxes. As someone who gave evidence to the Burns inquiry, I can say categorically that many farmers do not want hunts to go across their land. I am only making an observation—*[CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘It is voluntary.’]* When farmers tried to stop hunts from going across their land, they failed.

**Mick Bates:** I have heard a few sensible words this morning, and I would like to add my contribution to that genre of speaking. We must be rational and responsible when considering these issues because the hardline in hypocrisy expressed by the proposer of the amendment is evident. I am afraid that this principle is in place. I too understand and sympathise with the cause of many farmers and the need for greater consultation on and discussion of issues relating to mapping areas. We have already established fine principles on how we can move towards a greater integrated rural economy, and there is a growing acceptance that visitors’ rights to

**David Davies:** Tybiaf fod yr Aelod wedi drysu ychydig efallai rhwng materion cwbl wahanol. Cefnogwn lawer o'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn adroddiad Burns ynglŷn â'r ffaith y byddai diddymu hela â chŵn yn cael effaith niweidiol ar les llwynogod. Ni olyga hynny ein bod yn cefnogi caniatáu i bobl fod yn anghyfrifol—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y mae'n drueni na chymerodd yr Aelodau eraill y cyfle, fel y gwneuthum i, i ddarllen adroddiad Burns. Eglura y byddai cael gwared ar hela â chŵn yn niweidiol i'r llwynog gan y byddai'n golygu y byddai helwyr yn defnyddio maglau ac ati.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid dadl am hela yw hon.

**David Davies:** Cytunaf, ond y cwbl yr wyf yn ei wneud yw ateb y cwestiwn. O ran yr hawl i grwydro, nid yw caniatáu i bobl gael mynediad dirwystr ar draws ffermdir agored yn opsiwn synhwyrol. Ni welaf bod y safbwytiau hynny'n groes i'w gilydd.

**Karen Sinclair:** Nid oeddwn wedi sylweddoli pa mor gryf oedd teimladau David Davies am les llwynogod. Fel rhywun a roddodd dystiolaeth i ymchwiliad Burns, gallaf ddweud yn bendant nad yw llawer o ffermwyr am i helwyr groesi eu tir. Dim ond gwneud sylw a wnaf—*[AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: ‘Mae'n wirfoddol.’]* Methodd ffermwyr wrth geisio stopio helwyr rhag croesi eu tir.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf wedi clywed ychydig eiriau synhwyrol y bore yma, a hoffwn ychwanegu fy nghyfraniad i'r genre hwnnw o siarad. Rhaid inni fod yn rhesymegol a chyfrifol wrth ystyried y materion hyn gan fod y rhagrith digyfaddawd a fynegwyd gan gynigydd y gwelliant yn amlwg. Mae arnaf ofn bod yr egwyddor hon yn ei lle. Yr wyf innau hefyd yn deall ac yn cydymdeimlo ag achos llawer o ffermwyr a'r angen i ymgynghori'n ehangach a thrafod materion sydd yn ymwneud â mapio ardaloedd. Yr ydym eisoes wedi sefydlu egwyddorion da o ran sut y gallwn symud tuag at economi wledig integredig fwy, a derbynir yn

walk on public footpaths is an essential part of bringing greater prosperity to the rural economy.

11:55 a.m.

When the debate on this amendment began, I was minded to be sympathetic towards the part that refers to the burden on local authorities. They will undoubtedly have to carry an extra burden in terms of the necessary provision of wardens and signposts. I have expressed these views many times in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee and I know that the Minister is aware of our concerns. However, we must address that concern, and I hope that the Minister in her summing up will reassure us that no farmer nor local authority will suffer from any financial burden that might threaten their business. There is a need for recognition from both sides that we are dealing with private property.

I declare an interest as a farmer; I am sympathetic to the landowner's cause, because there are public footpaths on my land, but I welcome open access to my farm. We must present the best face of the farming industry to the world. Shrouding the facts with views on hunting and the welfare of foxes is not the way forward on this—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Will you give way to Alun Cairns?

**Mick Bates:** No. I have almost finished. I announce that the Liberal Democrats, as is our custom, will have a free vote on this.

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I had hoped that we might be able to scamper through this quickly, in view of the limited time, and you will have noticed, Presiding Officer, that I kept that in mind during my opening speech. However, I should have known that any motion on the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 would prompt hoary old chestnuts, one of which was offered by David Davies, true to form. David, you need to consider your position on this because you are out of touch with some of the organisations—

gynyddol bod hawliau ymwelwyr i gerdded ar lwybrau troed cyhoeddus yn rhan hanfodol o sicrhau economi wledig fwy llewyrchus.

Pan ddechreuodd y ddadl ar y gwelliant hwn, fy mwriad oedd dangos cydymdeimlad tuag at y rhan sydd yn cyfeirio at y baich ar awdurdodau lleol. Yn ddi-os bydd yn rhaid iddynt gario baich ychwanegol yn nhermau darpariaeth angenreheidiol wardeniaid ac arwyddbyst. Yr wyf wedi mynegi'r safbwytiau hyn lawer gwaith ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth a gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'n pryderon. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ymdrin â'r pryder hwnnw, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog wrth grynhoi yn ein sicrhau na fydd unrhyw ffermwyr nag awdurdod lleol yn dioddef o unrhyw faich ariannol a allai fygwth eu busnes. Mae angen cydnabyddiaeth o'r naill ochr ein bod yn delio ag eiddo preifat.

Datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwyr; mae gennych gydymdeimlad ag achos y tirfeddiannwr, gan fod llwybrau troed cyhoeddus ar fy nhir i, ond croesawaf fynediad agored i'm fferm. Rhaid inni gyflwyno wyneb gorau'r diwydiant ffermio i'r byd. Nid cuddio'r ffeithiau â safbwytiau ar hela a lles llwynogod yw'r ffordd ymlaen ar hyn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A ildiwrch i Alun Cairns?

**Mick Bates:** Na wnaf. Yr wyf bron â gorffen. Cyhoeddaf y caiff y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn ôl ein harfer, bleidlais rydd ar hyn.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y gallem efallai wibio drwy hyn yn gyflym, o gofio'r amser cyfyngedig, a byddwch wedi sylwi, Lywydd, imi gadw hynny mewn cof yn fy arraith agoriadol. Fodd bynnag, dylwn fod wedi gwybod y byddai unrhyw gynnig ar Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 yn codi hen grachod cyfarwydd, a chynigiwyd un ohonynt gan David Davies, yn ôl y disgwyl. David, mae angen ichi ystyried eich safbwyt ar hyn gan eich bod wedi colli cysylltiad â rhai o'r sefydliadau—

[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. For some reason, Members are restless this morning, which only serves to delay our proceedings. Please allow the Minister to be heard in silence, and I address the Conservative benches, in particular.

**Sue Essex:** I discussed this Bill with many of the organisations that have historically opposed it, but are now facing the reality that it will be implemented. So, let us implement it in the best ‘partnership’ way that we can. It is up to you how you approach it, David, but you are becoming increasingly out of touch with the prevailing thought in Wales.

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Sue Essex:** No. I want to finish quickly. On the sensible points that were raised, I am pleased that Helen Mary supports the Act and that Plaid Cymru intends to be grown up about this.

**David Davies:** What about the Liberal Democrats?

**Sue Essex:** Mick was using language that I did not understand with his reference to ‘genre’ and so on, I will have a word with him afterwards. The sensible and important point raised by Helen Mary was that the Committee will have an important role to play. The details of this will be out for public consultation. We will work together in consultation with other key agencies, including the landowners representation, and the ramblers’ association to make it work.

For goodness sake, let us have some vision. Alun Pugh commented on what is happening to the tourism industry and to many other people, such as farmers, and my friends in north Wales. We can help the agricultural industry by encouraging walkers to visit and stay in bed and breakfasts. This is a difficult time for them. Let us recognise what access can do for Wales’s economy.

Mick made a point about finance. Let us

[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Am ryw reswm, mae'r Aelodau yn aflonydd y bore yma, sydd yn ychwanegu at hyd ein cyfarfod. A fyddch crystal â gwrandio ar y Gweinidog mewn tawelwch, a chyfeiriaf at feinciau'r Ceidwadwyr, yn arbennig.

**Sue Essex:** Trafodais y Mesur hwn gyda llawer o'r sefydliadau a'i gwirthwynebodd yn hanesyddol, ond sydd bellach yn wynebu'r realiti y caiff ei roi ar waith. Felly, gadewch inni ei roi ar waith yn y ffordd ‘bartneriaeth’ orau bosibl. Mae'n fater i chi sut yr ymdriniwch ag ef, David, ond yr ydych yn colli cysylltiad yn gynyddol â'r meddylfryd cyffredinol yng Nghymru.

**David Davies:** A ildiwrch?

**Sue Essex:** Na wnaf. Yr wyf am orffen yn gyflym. O ran y pwyntiau synhwyrol a godwyd, yr wyf yn falch fod Helen Mary yn cefnogi'r Ddeddf ac y bwriad a Plaid Cymru ymddwyn yn aeddfed yn hyn o beth.

**David Davies:** Beth am y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oedd Mick yn defnyddio iaith nad oeddwn yn ei deall gyda'i gyfeiriad at ‘genre’ ac ati, caf air gydag ef wedyn. Y pwynt synhwyrol a phwysig a godwyd gan Helen Mary oedd y bydd gan y Pwyllgor rôl bwysig i'w chwarae. Cyhoeddir y manylion perthnasol ar gyfer ymgynghori cyhoeddus. Cydweithiwn ninnau mewn ymgynghoriad ag asiantaethau allweddol eraill, gan gynnwys cynrychiolwyr tirfeddianwyr, a chymdeithas y cerddwyr er mwyn gwneud iddo weithio.

Er mwyn popeth, gadewch inni gael rhywfaint o weledigaeth. Gwnaeth Alun Pugh sylw ar yr hyn sydd yn digwydd i'r diwydiant twristiaeth ac i lawer o bobl eraill, fel ffermwyr, a'm ffrindiau yng ngogledd Cymru. Gallwn helpu'r diwydiant amaethyddol drwy annog cerddwyr i ymweld ac aros mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Mae hwn yn gyfnod anodd iddynt. Gadewch inni gydnabod yr hyn y gall mynediad ei wneud dros economi Cymru.

Gwnaeth Mick bwynt am arian. Gadewch

ensure that access is truly embedded in the rural regeneration policies that we implement. Let us do that in partnership with all agencies. People will discover that this legislation is important in achieving that. In the future, they will look back with a degree of pride, if we do this properly in Wales, in a sensitive, fair and imaginative way looking at the rural economy. I hope that Members support this.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar y gwelliant i'r cynnig cyntaf.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 13, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

inni sicrhau bod mynediad wedi'i wreiddio'n wirioneddol yn y polisiau adfywio gwledig a roddwn ar waith. Gadewch inni wneud hynny mewn partneriaeth â phob asiantaeth. Bydd pobl yn darganfod bod y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn bwysig wrth gyflawni hynny. Yn y dyfodol, byddant yn edrych yn ôl â rhywfaint o falchder, os gwnawn hyn yn iawn yng Nghymru, mewn ffordd sensitif, deg a chreadigol gan edrych ar yr economi wledig. Gobeithiaf y cefnoga'r Aelodau hyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on the amendment to the first motion.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on the principle of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.  
Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on the motion to approve the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.  
Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Swyddogaethau Disgyblu) 2001**  
**Approval of the General Teaching Councils for Wales (Disciplinary Functions) Regulations 2001**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*considers the principle of the General Teaching Council For Wales (Disciplinary Functions) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2001.*

I propose that

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysg Cyffredinol Cymru (Swyddogaethau Disgyblu) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2001.*

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified under Standing Order No. 11.5 any matters for concern in the draft Order, the General Teaching Council For Wales (Disciplinary Functions) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 March 2001; and*

*approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2001 and the Memorandum Of Corrections laid in the Table Office on 27 March 2001.*

The General Teaching Council for Wales was formally established by the Assembly on 1 September last year to provide an independent and authoritative voice to the teaching profession, working with the National Assembly and others to raise standards. Its principal statutory functions are to provide advice to the Assembly and others on a wide range of professional issues to establish and maintain a register and records of teachers. It is also responsible, in accordance with regulations for disciplinary action against teachers, for unacceptable professional conduct, convictions of relevant offences and serious professional incompetence.

The Assembly has already agreed regulations and an Order, which came into force on September 2000, covering the registration of teachers and the maintenance of records. The regulations now before us are, therefore, the final piece of the jigsaw designed to enable the council to fulfil its disciplinary responsibility.

The regulations provide a framework for the council as it considers cases of teachers who have failed to uphold the high standards expected of them, which are delivered by the vast majority of members of the teaching profession. They allow the council to consider the teacher's place in the profession.

It is important to note, however, that the council's role is not to usurp that of the employer. It is not to usurp that of the LEA or governors who will continue to take

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysg Cyffredinol Cymru (Swyddogaethau Disgyblu) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mawrth 2001; ac*

*yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2001 a'r Memorandwm Cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mawrth 2001.*

Sefydlwyd Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru yn ffurfiol gan y Cynulliad ar 1 Medi y llynedd er mwyn darparu llais annibynnol ac awdurdodol i'r proffesiwn addysgu, gan weithio gyda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac eraill i godi safonau. Ei brif swyddogaethau statudol yw rhoi cyngor i'r Cynulliad ac eraill ar amrywiaeth eang o faterion proffesiynol i sefydlu a chadw cofrestr a chofnodion o athrawon. Mae hefyd yn gyfrifol, yn unol â rheoliadau ar gyfer camau disgyblu yn erbyn athrawon, am ymddygiad proffesiynol annerbyniol, dedfrydau troseddau perthnasol ac anallu proffesiynol difrifol.

Mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi cytuno ar reoliadau a Gorchymyn, a ddaeth i rym ym Medi 2000, sydd yn cwmpasu cofrestru athrawon a chadw cofnodion. Y rheoliadau sydd yn awr ger ein bron, felly, yw darn olaf y jig-so a gynlluniwyd i alluogi'r cyngor i gyflawni ei gyfrifoldeb disgyblu.

Darpara'r rheoliadau fframwaith ar gyfer y cyngor wrth iddo ystyried achosion athrawon a fethodd â chynnal y safonau uchel a ddisgwylir ganddynt, ac a gyflawnir gan fwyafrif helaeth aelodau'r proffesiwn addysgu. Caniatânt i'r cyngor ystyried sefyllfa'r athro yn y proffesiwn.

Mae'n bwysig nodi, foddy bynnag, nad rôl y cyngor yw trawsfeddiannu rôl y cyflogwr. Ni ddylai drawsfeddiannu rôl yr AALL neu'r llywodraethwyr a fydd yn parhau i wneud

decisions on the conduct and competence of their employees. It is only after that step that the council, acting on the employer's findings, will consider whether any further action should be taken in relation to any teacher on its register.

12:05 p.m.

The regulations enable the council to establish investigating committees to consider allegations of unacceptable professional misconduct, convictions of relevant offences or serious professional incompetence. Where the committee considers that there is a case to answer, the regulations provide for a conduct or competence committee to hear the case and to consider whether a disciplinary order should be made in relation to the teacher involved. These committees, in turn, will have the power to apply a range of sanctions, from a reprimand to a prohibition order, which will remove a teacher from the council's register of teachers, with the consequence of preventing that teacher from continuing to teach in the maintained sector.

The regulations are largely permissive in that they enable the General Teaching Council for Wales to decide for itself the best way to handle what are largely procedural matters related to membership and proceedings of the disciplinary committees. Only where the enabling legislation, the Human Rights Act 1998 or natural justice requires are the regulations prescriptive. In practice, that means that the regulations will, for example, prescribe that teachers should have the opportunity to appear before, and be represented at, a hearing. There is a right of appeal against any disciplinary order.

The regulations have been the subject of consultation, on policy and detail, with a wide range of bodies with an interest in the teaching profession and the wider education field, including the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. All comments were considered in drawing up the final draft. I therefore hope that you will support the motion.

penderfyniadau ar ymddygiad a chymhwysedd eu cyflogeion. Dim ond ar ôl y cam hwnnw y bydd y cyngor, gan weithredu ar ganfyddiadau'r cyflogwr, yn ystyried a ddylid cymryd unrhyw gamau pellach mewn perthynas ag unrhyw athro ar ei gofrestr neu beidio.

Mae'r rheoliadau yn galluogi'r cyngor i sefydlu pwylgorau ymchwilio i ystyried cyhuddiadau o gamymddygiad proffesiynol annerbyniol, dedfrydau troseddau perthnasol neu anallu proffesiynol difrifol. Lle yr ystyria'r pwylgor bod achos i'w ateb, darpara'r rheoliadau ar gyfer pwylgor ymddygiad neu gymhwysedd i wrando'r achos ac ystyried a ddylid cyflwyno gorchymyn disgynblu neu beidio mewn perthynas â'r athro dan sylw. Bydd gan y pwylgorau hyn, yn eu tro, y pŵer i gymhwysyo amrywiaeth o sancsiynau, o gerydd i orchymyn gwahardd, a fydd yn diddymu athro o gofrestr athrawon y cyngor, gyda'r canlyniad o atal yr athro hwnnw rhag parhau i addysgu yn y sector a gynhelir.

I raddau helaeth mae'r rheoliadau yn oddefol gan eu bod yn galluogi Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru i benderfynu drosto'i hun ar y ffordd orau i ymdrin â'r hyn sydd, i raddau helaeth, yn faterion gweithdrefn sydd yn gysylltiedig ag aelodaeth ac achosion y pwylgorau disgynblu. Dim ond lle y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth alluogi, Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 neu gyflawnder naturiol yn galw am hynny y mae'r rheoliadau yn gyfarwyddol. Yn ymarferol, golyga hynny y bydd y rheoliadau, er enghraifft, yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd y dylai athrawon gael cyfle i ymddangos gerbron gwrandawiad, a chael eu cynrychioli. Mae hawl apelio yn erbyn unrhyw orchymyn disgynblu.

Ymgynghorwyd ar y rheoliadau, o ran polisi a manylder, gydag amrywiaeth eang o gyrrif sydd yn ymddiddori yn y proffesiwn addysgu a'r maes addysg ehangach, gan gynnwys y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Ystyriwyd pob sylw wrth lunio'r drafst terfynol. Gobeithiaf felly y cefnogwch y cynnig.

**Gareth Jones:** Datganaf fuddiant fel athro sydd heb gofrestru eto gyda Chyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru.

O ddarllen y rheoliadau, mae'n amlwg y bydd y cyngor yn ymarfer pwerau disgynblu mewn perthynas â chyhuddiadau o gamymddygiad proffesiynol difrifol neu anallu yn erbyn athrawon. Â'r rheoliadau ymlaen i sefydlu pwylgorau a fydd yn rheoli swyddogaethau disgynblu'r cyngor, sef pwylgor ymchwilio, pwylgor ymddygiad proffesiynol a phwylgor gallu proffesiynol. O wrando ar y Gweinidog yn dehongli'r rheoliadau hyn, ymddengys fod iddynt elfennau negyddol a bygythiol, ond yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod yn angenrheidiol.

Serch hynny, nid oes cyfeiriad yng nghynllun corfforaethol y cyngor addysgu at gyfrifoldebau neu ddyletswyddau i warchod buddiannau athrawon sydd wedi dioddef cam yn eu gyrfa proffesiynol gan reolwyr, llywodraethwyr ysgolion, neu awdurdodau addysg lleol. Gwelsom achos o gam-dystiolaeth yn erbyn aelod o'r proffesiwn ac achos arall o ddiswyddo annheg yn ddiweddar.

Er bod y cyrff proffesiynol, sef undebau'r athrawon, yn gweithredu ar ran athrawon, oni ddylai'r cyngor addysgu ystyried ei rôl a sut y dylai ymwneud ag agweddau mwy positif i gynnal morâl, enw da a buddiannau proffesiynol athrawon, yn ogystal â'u disgynblu? Oni ddylai fod llawer mwy o gydbwysedd yn y rheoliadau hyn ynghylch rôl y cyngor addysgu?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Datganaf fuddiant fel athrawes.

Croesawn y rheoliadau hyn, sydd yn gyfraniad at gynnal safonau dysgu a phroffesiynoldeb athrawon. Y gobaith yw na fydd angen defnyddio'r pwerau disgynblu hyn yn aml. Mae'n briodol i brifathrawon a llywodraethwyr ymdrin â'r rhan fwyaf o broblemau disgynblu sydd yn codi mewn ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg y bydd angen cyfeirio ychydig o achosion at Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru.

**Gareth Jones:** I declare an interest as a teacher who has not yet registered with the General Teaching Council for Wales.

From reading the regulations, it is obvious that the council will exercise disciplinary powers in relation to allegations of serious professional misconduct or incompetency against teachers. The regulations go on to establish committees that will control the council's disciplinary functions, namely an investigating committee, a professional conduct committee and a professional competence committee. From listening to the Minister interpreting these regulations, they appear to contain negative and threatening elements, but I am sure that they are necessary.

However, there is no reference in the teaching council's corporate plan to responsibilities or duties to safeguard the interests of teachers who have suffered inequity in their professional career from school managers, governors, or local education authorities. We saw a case of false allegations against a member of the profession and another case of unfair dismissal recently.

Although the professional organisations, namely the teachers' unions, act on behalf of teachers, should not the teaching council consider its role and how it should deal with more positive aspects to sustain the morale, good reputation and professional interests of teachers, in addition to disciplining them? Should not there be a much greater balance in these regulations as regards the teaching council's role?

**Eleanor Burnham:** I declare an interest as a teacher.

We welcome these regulations, which are a contribution towards maintaining teachers' teaching standards and professionalism. It is hoped that these disciplining powers will not need to be used often. It is appropriate for headteachers and governors to deal with the majority of disciplinary problems that arise in schools. However, it is likely that some cases will need to be referred to the General Teaching Council for Wales.

**Jonathan Morgan:** When a teacher is accused of misconduct, there is a point at which that teacher's name is made public. At what point during these proceedings would a teacher's name be made public? Would that happen when the investigating committee considers allegations, when the professional conduct or professional competence committees consider allegations, or at a disciplinary stage? As the Minister knows, the Welsh Conservative Party is concerned about the number of allegations made against teachers, which has increased during recent years. Many of these teachers' names are printed in newspapers and broadcast on the media. Even when teachers are found not to have committed the offences of which they were accused, the accusations still have damaging effects on their careers. Will the Minister explain when this information becomes public, at the beginning or end of proceedings? We would be concerned if teachers' names were made public when the investigations committee were only making preliminary enquiries.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** It is important to say, in terms of these regulations—because that is what is under discussion today, the regulations rather than the wider debate raised by Gareth—that the council will only consider cases passed to it by the employer, where a teacher has been dismissed on the grounds of incompetence, or in cases where the employer would have considered dismissal, but the teacher resigned instead. Therefore the council examines specific areas of professional competence.

Regarding the publishing of information, one of the safeguards in the system is the appeals process. It would clearly be against the principles of natural justice if there were a situation where anyone was identified prior to an appeals process being properly conducted. The regulations do not require the council to publish information at all. Whether to publish, and the manner of publication will be for the council to decide. It must do so in accordance with the Human Rights Act 1998 and natural justice.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pan gyhuddir athro o gamymddygiad, daw amser pan gyhoeddir enw'r athro hwnnw. Ar ba bwynt yn ystod yr achos y cāi enw athro ei gyhoeddi? A ddigwyddai hynny wrth i'r pwylgor ymchwilio ystyried cyhuddiadau, wrth i'r pwylgorau ymddygiad proffesiynol neu gymhwysedd proffesiynol ystyried cyhuddiadau, neu yn ystod cyfnod disgyblu? Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn pryderu am nifer y cyhuddiadau a wneir yn erbyn athrawon, sydd wedi cynyddu yn ystod y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Argreffir enwau llawer o'r athrawon hyn mewn papurau newydd ac fe'u darlledir yn y cyfryngau. Hyd yn oed pan ganfyddir nad yw athrawon wedi cyflawni'r troseddau y'u cyhuddwyd ohonynt, caiff y cyhuddiadau effeithiau niweidiol ar eu gyrfaedd serch hynny. A esbonia'r Gweinidog pryd y cyhoeddir yr wybodaeth hon, ar ddechrau neu ar ddiwedd yr achos? Byddem yn pryderu pe cāi enwau'r athrawon eu cyhoeddi pan nad oedd y pwylgor ymchwiliadau ond yn gwneud ymholiadau rhagarweiniol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae'n bwysig dweud, yn nhermau'r rheoliadau hyn—gan mai dyna a drafodir heddiw, y rheoliadau yn hytrach na'r ddadl ehangach a godwyd gan Gareth—mai dim ond achosion a drosglwyddwyd iddo gan y cyflogwr y bydd y cyngor yn eu hystyried, lle y diswyddwyd athro ar sail anallu, neu achosion lle y byddai'r cyflogwr wedi ystyried diswyddo, ond i'r athro ymddiswyddo yn lle hynny. Felly archwilia'r cyngor feisydd penodol o allu proffesiynol.

O ran cyhoeddi gwybodaeth, un o amddiffynfeydd y system yw'r broses apêl. Mae'n amlwg y byddai enwi person cyn cynnal proses apêl gywir yn groes i egwyddorion cyflawnwr naturiol. Nid yw'r rheoliadau yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r cyngor gyhoeddi gwybodaeth o gwbl. Mater i'r cyngor fydd penderfynu a ddylid ei chyhoeddi neu beidio, a'r ffordd o'i chyhoeddi. Rhaid iddo wneud hynny yn unol â Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 a chyflawnwr naturiol.

I ask you to support these regulations.

**Several Assembly Members rose—**

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Registered teachers do not need to declare an interest. Guidance on declaring an interest in this matter is on the Chamberweb.

Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn.

**Sawl Aelod o'r Cynulliad a gododd—**

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes angen i athrawon cofrestredig ddatgan buddiant. Mae canllawiau ar ddatgan buddiant yn y mater hwn ar we'r Siambrau.

I call for a vote on the principle of the Order.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion adopted.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar y cynnig  
i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on  
the motion to approve the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion adopted.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 12.08 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 12.08 p.m.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before we continue with today's business, I ask that speeches be as succinct as possible, given that we are under pressures of time, and the importance of the matters before us.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn inni barhau â busnes heddiw, gofynnaf i'r areithiau fod mor gryno â phosibl, o gofio ein bod o dan bwysau amser, a phwysigrwydd y materion ger ein bron.

**Dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog Cymru Holl Swyddogaethau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol  
Cymru a geir yn neu o dan Reoliadau a wneir o dan Adran 2(2) o Ddeddf  
Cymunedau Ewrop 1972**

**Delegation to the First Minister all the Functions of the National Assembly for  
Wales Contained in or under Regulations made under Section 2(2) of the  
European Communities Act 1972**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under sections 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all the functions of the National Assembly contained in or under regulations made by*

*(a) the National Assembly (whether made by the National Assembly alone or together with a UK Minister, UK Government Department or the Scottish or Northern Irish Executives) under section 2(2) of the European Communities Act 1972 pursuant to the functions conferred on the Assembly by:*

*i. the European Communities (Designation) (No. 3) Order 1999, (SI 1999/2788) (available on the HMSO website at <http://www.hmso.gov.uk/si/si1999/19992788.htm>; and*

*ii. the European Communities (Designation) (No. 3) Order 2000, (SI 2000/2812) (available on the HMSO website at <http://www.hmso.gov.uk/si/si2000/20002812.htm>; or*

*b. a UK Minister under his concurrent powers, under the said section 2(2) for the same purposes*

*to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of*

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a geir yn neu o dan y rheoliadau a wneir gan*

*(a) y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (boed y rheoliadau'n cael eu gwneud gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ei ben ei hun neu ar y cyd â Gweinidog y DU, Adran o Lywodraeth y DU neu Weithrediaethau'r Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon) o dan adran 2(2) o Ddeddf Cymunedau Ewrop 1972 yn unol â'r swyddogaethau a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad gan:*

*i. Gorchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodiad) (Rhif 3) 1999 (SI 1999/2788) (ar gael ar wefan yr HMSO yn <http://www.hmso.gov.uk/si/si1999/19992788.htm>; a*

*ii. Gorchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodiad) (Rhif 3) 2000, (SI 2000/2812) (ar gael ar wefan yr HMSO yn <http://www.hmso.gov.uk/si/si2000/20002812.htm>; neu*

*(b) Weinidog y DU o dan ei bwerau cyd-gyfredol, o dan yr adran 2(2) dyweddedig at yr un dibenion*

*i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad, ac eithrio'r rheini na ellir drwy ddeddf eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.*

*Ni fydd dim yn y cynnig hwn yn lleihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn, nac yn lleihau swyddogaeth Pwyllgorau'r*

*the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions.*

The purpose of this motion is to seek the Assembly's agreement for functions created in the regulations made in areas of European Union policy, for which the Assembly has been designated. These are the European Communities (Designation) (No. 3) Order 1999 and the European Communities (Designation) (No. 3) Order 2000, which will be delegated to the First Minister as provided for in section 62 of the Government of Wales Act 1998. This would be done in the knowledge that, in accordance with usual practice, the First Minister would then make appropriate delegations in turn to his Cabinet colleagues and then, where appropriate, would delegate some functions to staff.

These Orders were made by Her Majesty by Order in Council under section 2 (2) of the European Communities Act 1972. They empower the National Assembly to make regulations, also under section 2 (2) of that Act, for the purposes of implementing various European Union obligations in relation to Wales. The precise purposes in respect of which the National Assembly can make these regulations are set out in the schedules to the Orders and are set out in detail on the intranet.

I commend this motion to Members.

12:15 p.m.

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian

*Cynulliad wrth arfer y swyddogaethau uchod.*

Diben y cynnig hwn yw ceisio cytundeb y Cynulliad ar gyfer swyddogaethau a grëwyd yn y rheoliadau a wnaethwyd mewn rhannau o bolisi yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, y dynodwyd y Cynulliad ar eu cyfer, sef Gorchymyn Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodiad) (Rhif 3) 1999 a Gorchymyn Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodiad) (Rhif 3) 2000, a ddirprwyir i Brif Weinidog Cymru fel y darparwyd ar ei gyfer yn adran 62 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Gwneir hyn gan wybod y byddai Prif Weinidog Cymru, yn unol ag arfer cyffredin, wedyn yn dirprwyo'n briodol yn ei dro i gyd-Aelodau ei Gabinet ac yna, lle y bo'n briodol, byddai'n dirprwyo rhai swyddogaethau i'r staff.

Gwnaethpwyd y Gorchmynion hyn gan Ei Mawrhydi drwy Orchymyn mewn Cyngor o dan adran 2 (2) Deddf Cymunedau Ewropeaidd 1972. Rhoddant bŵer i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud rheoliadau, hefyd o dan adran 2 (2) y Ddeddf honno, at ddibenion gweithredu rhwymedigaethau amrywiol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd mewn perthynas â Chymru. Nodir yr union ddibenion y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud y rheoliadau hyn yn eu cylch yn atodlenni'r Gorchmynion ac fe'u nodir yn fanwl ar y mewnrwyd.

Cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn i'r Aelodau.

Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted*

**Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23, Adran 3 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34**

**Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 23, Section 3 and Standing Order No. 34**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 34:*

*(i) considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 28 March 2001; and*

*(ii) approves the following revisions of Standing Orders:*

**Standing Order No. 34**

*1. After paragraph 34.3 insert,*

*34.3A. The Assembly may provide that any standing order or any revision thereto shall be temporary and where a standing order or a revision thereto is temporary, its precise duration shall be expressed in a distinct paragraph of the standing order or the*

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:*

*(i) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mawrth 2001; a*

*(ii) yn cymeradwyo'r gwelliannau canlynol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog:*

**Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34**

*1. Ar ôl paragraff 34.3 ychwanegu,*

*34.3A. Caiff y Cynulliad ddarparu y bydd unrhyw reol sefydlog neu unrhyw welliant iddi yn un dros dro a phan fydd rheol sefydlog neu welliant iddi yn un dros dro, dywedir pa mor hir yn union y bydd yn para mewn paragraff ar wahân o'r rheol sefydlog*

revision.

**Standing Order No. 23, section 3**

1. After the heading insert:

*Section 3 of Standing Order No. 23 applies to Assembly subordinate legislation, not being Assembly general subordinate legislation, which is made by the Assembly, whether jointly or not, together with a UK Minister or UK Government Department, the Scottish Executive or Northern Ireland Executive.*

2. At the start of paragraph 23.9 insert,

*Subject to paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E,*

3. After paragraph 23.11 insert,

*23.11A. Subject to paragraph 23.11E, the Assembly Cabinet may determine that, in the particular circumstances, it is not reasonably practicable for a draft to be laid before the Assembly under paragraph 23.9 and in that case paragraphs 23.11B to 23.11D shall apply.*

*23.11B. The draft shall be signed on behalf of the Assembly in accordance with paragraph 22.26(iii).*

*23.11C. The relevant Assembly Minister shall as soon as reasonably practicable after the draft has been signed under paragraph 23.11B lay before the Assembly a memorandum notifying the Assembly that the subordinate legislation has been signed on behalf of the Assembly and explaining its intended effect and likely financial implications.*

*23.11D. Whenever a memorandum is laid before the Assembly under paragraph 23.11C, a Member may, within the period of 40 working days beginning with the date on which the memorandum is laid, table a motion instructing the relevant Assembly Minister:*

*(a) to consider the possibility of the subordinate legislation being revoked in*

*neu'r gwelliant.*

**Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23, adran 3**

1. Ar ôl y pennawd ychwanegu:

*Mae adran 3 Rheol sefydlog Rhif 23 yn gymwys i is-ddeddfwriaeth y Cynulliad, nad yw'n is-ddeddfwriaeth gyffredinol y Cynulliad, ac sy'n cael ei gwneud gan y Cynulliad, p'un ai ar y cyd neu beidio, ag un o Weinidogion y DU neu un o Adrannau Llywodraeth y DU, Gweithrediaeth yr Alban neu Weithrediaeth Gogledd Iwerddon.*

2. Ar ddechrau paragraff 23.9 ychwanegu,

*Yn amodol ar baragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E,*

3. Ar ôl paragraff 23.11 ychwanegu,

*23.11A. Yn amodol ar baragraff 23.11E, caiff Cabinet y Cynulliad benderfynu, o dan yr amgylchiadau penodol, nad yw'n rhesymol ymarferol i ddrafft gael ei osod gerbron y Cynulliad o dan baragraff 23.9 ac yn yr achos hwnnw bydd paragraffau 23.11B i 23.11D yn gymwys.*

*23.11B. Bydd y drafft yn cael ei lofnodi ar ran y Cynulliad yn unol â pharagraff 22.26(iii).*

*23.11C. Cyn gynted ag y bo'n rhesymol ymarferol ar ôl i'r drafft gael ei lofnodi o dan baragraff 23.11B bydd y Gweinidog Cynulliad perthnasol yn gosod memorandwm gerbron y Cynulliad yn hysbysu'r Cynulliad fod yr is-ddeddfwriaeth wedi'i llofnodi ar ran y Cynulliad ac yn esbonio ei heffaith arfaethedig a'r goblygiadau ariannol tebygol.*

*23.11D. Pryd bynnag y bydd memorandwm yn cael ei osod gerbron y Cynulliad o dan baragraff 23.11C, caiff Aelod, o fewn y cyfnod o 40 diwrnod gwaith gan ddechrau ar y dyddiad y gosodir y memorandwm gerbron y Cynulliad, gyflwyno cynnig yn cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog Cynulliad perthnasol:*

*(a) i ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddiddymu'r is-ddeddfwriaeth mewn perthynas â Chymru; a*

*relation to Wales; and*

*(b) to lay before the Assembly as soon as possible a report stating what action the Assembly Minister has taken or proposes to take in that respect.*

*23.11E. Paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E and, in paragraph 23.9, the words ‘Subject to paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E,’ shall cease to have effect on 9 May 2001.*

*4. For paragraph 23.12 substitute:*

*23.12. Where subordinate legislation to which this section applies would, if the legislation were made by the Assembly alone, fall within section 1 or section 2 of this standing order, the provisions of that section or those sections shall also apply to it except that:*

*(a) the reference in paragraphs 23.1 and 23.5 to the provisions of paragraphs 22.2 to 22.30 shall be replaced by references to paragraphs 23.9 to 23.11E; and*

*(b) in a case to which paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E apply, paragraph 23.2 shall have effect as if for ‘after the Assembly has been notified’ there were substituted ‘after that Assembly Minister has been notified’.*

*Provided that, on and after 9 May 2001, for sub-paragraphs(a) and (b) of paragraph 23.12, substitute:*

*the reference in paragraphs 23.1 and 23.5 to the provisions of paragraphs 22.2 to 22.30 shall be replaced by reference to paragraphs 23.9 to 23.11.*

*5. After paragraph 23.13 insert:*

*23.14. Nothing in this standing order shall, in relation to the subordinate legislation which is Assembly General subordinate legislation, be construed as overriding the application of Standing Order No. 22 to such legislation.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that this motion needs a two-thirds majority to be adopted.

*(b) i osod gerbron y Cynulliad cyn gynted â phosibl adroddiad yn datgan pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog Cynulliad wedi eu cymryd neu yn bwriadu eu cymryd yn y cyswllt hwnnw.*

*23.11E. Bydd effaith paragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E ac, ym mharagraff 23.9, effaith y geiriau ‘Yn amodol ar baragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E,’ yn peidio ar 9 Mai 2001.*

*4. Yn lle paragraff 23.12 rhodder:*

*23.12. Pan fyddai is-ddeddfwriaeth y mae'r adran hon yn gymwys iddi, os cai'r ddeddfwriaeth ei gwneud gan y Cynulliad yn unig, yn dod o fewn adran 1 neu adran 2 o'r rheol sefydlog hon, bydd darpariaethau'r adran honno neu'r adrannau hynny yn gymwys iddi hefyd ac eithrio:*

*(a) y bydd y cyfeiriad ym mharagraffau 23.1 a 23.5 at ddarpariaethau paragraffau 22.2 i 22.30 yn cael eu disodli gan gyfeiriadau at baragraffau 23.9 i 23.11E; a*

*(b) mewn achos y mae paragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E yn gymwys iddo, bydd paragraff 23.2 yn cael effaith fel pe bai ‘ar ôl i'r Cynulliad gael ei hysbysu’ yn cael ei amnewid gan ‘ar ôl i'r Gweinidog Cynulliad gael ei hysbysu’.*

*Ar yr amod, ar neu ar ôl 9 Mai 2001, yn lle is-baragraffau (a) a (b) o baragraff 23.12, yr amnewidier:*

*y bydd y cyfeiriad ym mharagraffau 23.1 a 23.5 at ddarpariaethau paragraffau 22.2 i 22.30 yn cael eu disodli gan gyfeiriad at baragraffau 23.9 i 23.11.*

*5. Ar ôl paragraff 23.13 ychwanegu,*

*23.14. Rhaid peidio â dehongli dim yn y Rheol Sefydlog hon, mewn perthynas ag is-ddeddfwriaeth sy'n is-ddeddfwriaeth gyffredinol y Cynulliad, fel ei fod yn drech na chymhwysiad Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22 i ddeddfwriaeth o'r fath.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Atgoffaf yr Aelodau bod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i'r cynnig hwn gael ei dderbyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the motion on approving the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 7) (Wales) 2001, which differs from the agreed business*

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn ymlaen y cynnig ar gymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 7) (Cymru) Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2001, sydd yn wahanol i'r gwaith y*

*shown in the forward look of 27 March.*

*cytunwyd arno yn y rhagolwg ar 27 Mawrth.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion adopted.*

**Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 7) (Cymru)  
Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2001  
Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report  
(No. 7) (Wales) 2001**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly, under Section 88B of y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Adran 88B*

*the Local Government Finance Act, 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No.7) (Wales) 2001 which was laid in the Table Office on 29 March 2001 and e-mailed to Members on 29 March 2001.*

Thank you for proposing that, Jane, although I thought that I was old enough to propose my own procedural motions. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.]

I said in my statement last week that I would bring forward details on how the additional £12 million that I am making available to local authorities in 2001-02 will be allocated to individual authorities. The special grant report sets out the purpose, conditions, and the amounts of grants payable to local authorities. It also includes some guidelines on how local authorities may operate a scheme. The main focus of the report is Annex A, which sets out the individual allocations for the 22 local authorities in Wales.

This figure of £12 million reflects our best estimate for the number and size of properties that are most likely to be affected, based on the data provided by the Valuation Office Agency. We are keen to help those involved in agriculture and its ancillary services, such as blacksmiths, saddlers, food processors, and retailers. We have also recognised that tourism in Wales needs support at this time. We are all aware of the devastating effect that the foot and mouth disease outbreak is having on hotels, guesthouses, pubs, restaurants, activity centres and all other leisure facilities.

We must act quickly to get this money to where it is needed most. As you can imagine, it is impossible for us to gauge precisely which businesses will be hardest hit. I cannot overemphasise the importance that local knowledge will have in deciding how the money can be used most effectively. We must work in partnership with local authorities to deal with this problem and I have written to the leaders of all county and

*Deddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988 ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 19.8, yn cymeradwy Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 7) (Cymru) Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Mawrth 2001 a'i e-bostio at yr Aelodau ar 29 Mawrth 2001.*

Diolch am gynnig hynny, Jane, er imi gredu fy mod yn ddigon hen i gynnig fy nghynigion trefniadol fy hun. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.]

Dywedais yn fy natganiad yr wythnos diwethaf y byddwn yn cyflwyno manylion ar sut y caiff y £12 miliwn ychwanegol a roddaf i awdurdodau lleol yn 2001-02 ei ddyrannu i awdurdodau unigol. Noda'r adroddiad grant arbennig ddiben, amodau, a symiau'r grantiau sydd i'w talu i awdurdodau lleol. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys rhai canllawiau ar sut y gall awdurdodau lleol weithredu cynllun. Atodiad A yw prif ffocws yr adroddiad, sydd yn nodi'r dyraniadau unigol ar gyfer 22 awdurdod lleol Cymru.

Adlewyrcha'r ffigur hwn o £12 miliwn ein hamcangyfrif gorau o ran nifer a maint yr eiddo sydd yn fwyaf tebygol o gael ei effeithio, yn seiliedig ar y data a ddarparwyd gan Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio. Yr ydym yn awyddus i helpu'r rheini sydd yn ymwneud ag amaethyddiaeth a'i gwasanaethau ategol, megis gofaint, cyfrwywyr, proseswyr bwyd, a manwerthwyr. Yr ydym wedi cydnabod hefyd bod angen cymorth ar dwristiaeth yng Nghymru yn ystod y cyfnod hwn. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol o'r effaith ofnadwy y caiff clwy'r traed a'r genau ar westai, tafarndai, tai bwyta, canolfannau gweithgaredd a phob cyfleuster hamdden arall.

Rhaid inni gymryd camau cyflym i sicrhau yr â'r arian hwn lle y mae ei angen fwyaf. Fel y gallwch ddychmygu, mae'n amhosibl inni ragweld yn union pa fusnesau yr effeithir arnynt fwyaf. Ni allaf orbwysleisio pwysigrwydd gwybodaeth leol wrth benderfynu ym mha ffordd y gellir defnyddio'r arian yn fwyaf effeithiol. Rhaid inni weithio mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol i ddelio â'r broblem hon ac

county borough councils in Wales asking for them to adopt maximum flexibility when considering requests for support from businesses suffering hardship.

Local authorities have already started to devise and implement bespoke schemes to react quickly to the needs of businesses affected in their local economies. In order to provide local authorities with the flexibility and legal certainty needed to better respond to the foot and mouth disease crisis, we intend to commence section 2.1 and related provisions of the Local Government Act 2000 to provide local authorities in Wales with a new discretionary power to do anything that they believe would promote the economic, social, and environmental wellbeing of their areas. That power will enable local authorities to undertake a wider range of initiatives for the benefit of their areas and the businesses located there than would otherwise be the case. The new power will come into effect on Monday, 9 April 2001. I welcome the speed with which the councils have responded to my announcement. We must now act quickly to give them the resources that they need. I therefore ask Members to support this motion. I also announced on Tuesday that I have decided to activate a scheme of emergency financial systems, known as the Bellwin scheme, on an all-Wales basis to help local authorities deal with the immediate effect of the foot and mouth outbreak and to meet any additional costs that they may incur in handling the emergency.

**Janet Ryder:** I believe that we all welcome today's Order, and the freedom that it will give local authorities to help the economies in their areas. I also welcome your announcement on bringing in their powers on wellbeing earlier than was previously thought. That will give them a great deal of discretion. I also welcome the announcement of the Bellwin scheme.

There is much freedom for local authorities to support their local businesses in this Order. However, I would like to consider how the allocated money—the £12 million—has been distributed. Only £700,000 of this money will go to Anglesey. The North Wales Tourist

ysgrifennais at arweinwyr pob cyngor sir a phob cyngor bwrdeistref sirol yn gofyn iddynt fod mor hyblyg â phosibl wrth ystyried ceisiadau am gymorth gan fusnesau sydd yn profi caledi.

Mae awdurdodau lleol eisoes wedi dechrau llunio a gweithredu cynlluniau penodol i ymateb yn gyflym i anghenion busnesau yr effeithir arnynt yn eu heconomiau lleol. Er mwyn rhoi i awdurdodau lleol yr hyblygrwydd a'r sicrwydd cyfreithiol sydd eu hangen arnynt i ymateb yn well i argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, bwriadwn ddechrau adran 2.1 a darpariaethau cysylltiedig Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 i roi pŵer diamod newydd i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i wneud unrhyw beth y credant y byddai'n hyrwyddo lles economaidd, cymdeithasol, ac amgylcheddol eu hardaloedd. Bydd y pŵer hwnnw yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i ymgymryd ag amrywiaeth ehangach o fentrau er lles eu hardaloedd a'r busnesau a leolir yno nag a fyddai'n bosibl fel arall. Daw'r pŵer newydd i rym ddydd Llun, 9 Ebrill 2001. Croesawaf pa mor gyflym y mae'r cynghorau wedi ymateb i'm cyhoeddiad. Rhaid inni weithredu'n gyflym yn awr er mwyn rhoi iddynt yr adnoddau sydd eu hangen arnynt. Felly gofynnaf i'r Aelodau gefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Cyhoeddais ddydd Mawrth hefyd fy mod wedi penderfynu gweithredu cynllun o systemau ariannol brys, o'r enw cynllun Bellwin, ledled Cymru gyfan, i helpu awdurdodau lleol i ddelfio ag effaith bresennol clwy'r traed a'r genau ac i gwrdd ag unrhyw gostau ychwanegol wrth drin yr argyfwng.

**Janet Ryder:** Credaf fod pob un ohonom yn croesawu'r Gorchymyn hwn heddiw, a'r rhyddid a rydd i awdurdodau lleol helpu economiau eu hardaloedd. Croesawaf hefyd eich cyhoeddiad ynglŷn â chyflwyno eu pwerau ar les yn gynharach nag y bwriadwyd. Rhydd hynny lawer o ddisgresiwn iddynt. Croesawaf hefyd y cyhoeddiad am gynllun Bellwin.

Mae llawer mwy o ryddid i awdurdodau lleol gefnogi eu busnesau lleol yn y Gorchymyn hwn. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ystyried sut y cafodd yr arian a ddyrannwyd—y £12 miliwn—ei ddosbarthu. Dim ond £700,000 o'r arian hwn a aiff i Ynys Môn. Mae Bwrdd

Board has prepared an estimate of the effects of the foot and mouth disease on businesses. It estimates that there will be a potential loss to business in Anglesey and Snowdonia of up to 80 per cent of turnover during this year, with a consequential estimated loss of income of over £136 million in Anglesey alone. That £700,000 of support will not meet that need. I know that this is only one of the measures that can be introduced to meet the need, but I ask that you bring a paper to the Local Government and Housing Committee to show how this money has been distributed. You could also perhaps consider other mechanisms that could be used to distribute the money more fairly so that it goes to areas that will really suffer as a consequence of the foot and mouth disease.

This Order is also strictly time limited. As the probable consequences of this crisis will extend beyond the end of June, the Assembly must be prepared to come back with further Orders to provide support beyond that time. I ask you, therefore, to give a firm commitment today to that, and to give further consideration to future schemes in ample time so that there is not a time lag between this Order finishing and any new Orders that may need to be brought in taking effect. I also ask that you give a firm commitment today to bringing in an Order to raise the maximum rateable value for discretionary rural rate relief from £10,000 to £50,000 for the financial year beginning on 1 April.

**Nick Bourne:** We support the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, and the special partnership that she enjoys with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning in bringing this forward together. We realised that it was a partnership government, but we did not realise that there were two partnerships in the Government.

On the substance of the Order, we recognise that it is important that we facilitate this money going to local authorities to provide the assistance needed. Edwina will know that we have previously given full support to these issues. I am anxious, however, to

Croeso Gogledd Cymru wedi paratoi amcangyfrif o effeithiau clwy'r traed a'r genau ar fusnesau. Mae'n amcangyfrif bod posibilrwydd y bydd busnesau Ynys Môn ac Eryri yn colli hyd at 80 y cant o'u trosiant eleni, gydag amcangyfrif o dros £136 miliwn o golled ganlyniadol ar Ynys Môn ei hun. Ni fydd y cymorth hwn o £700,000 yn diwallu'r angen hwnnw. Gwn mai dim ond un o'r mesurau y gellir eu cyflwyno i ddiwallu'r angen yw hwn, ond gofynnaf ichi ddod â phapur i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai i ddangos sut y dosbarthwyd yr arian hwn. Efallai y gallech ystyried hefyd ddulliau eraill y gellid eu defnyddio i ddosbarthu'r arian yn decach fel ei fod yn mynd i'r ardaloedd a fydd yn dioddef yn wirioneddol o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau.

Mae cyfyngiadau amser llym ar y Gorchymyn hwn hefyd. Oherwydd y bydd canlyniadau tebygol yr argyfwng hwn yn ymestyn y tu hwnt i ddiweddu Mehefin, rhaid i'r Cynulliad baratoi i ddod yn ôl â Gorchymynion pellach i roi cymorth ar ôl hynny. Gofynnaf ichi, felly, roi ymrwymiad cryf heddiw i hynny, ac i ystyried ymhellach gynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol mewn da bryd fel na fydd bwllch amser rhwng diweddu y Gorchymyn hwn a dechrau gweithredu unrhyw Orchymynion newydd y bydd angen eu cyflwyno. Gofynnaf ichi hefyd roi ymrwymiad cadarn heddiw i gyflwyno Gorchymyn i godi uchafswm y gwerth trethiannol ar gyfer rhyddhad trethi gwledig dewisol o £10,000 i £50,000 ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol sydd yn dechrau ar 1 Ebrill.

**Nick Bourne:** Cefnogwn y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, a'r bartneriaeth arbennig sydd ganddi â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wrth gyflwyno hyn ar y cyd. Sylweddolasom mai llywodraeth bartneriaeth ydyw, ond ni sylweddolasom fod dwy bartneriaeth yn y Llywodraeth.

Ynglŷn â sylwedd y Gorchymyn hwn, cydnabyddwn ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau yr aiff yr arian hwn i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn rhoi iddynt y cymorth sydd ei angen. Gŵyr Edwina ein bod wedi cefnogi'r materion hyn yn llwyr yn y gorffennol. Yr

underline that this is a continuum and that we will need additional money within the three-month period, never mind beyond that. I also reiterate the point that I made to the First Minister. He was going to have discussions with the Treasury about the possibility of tax relief and of this year's losses for businesses being rolled forward. I wonder if we could perhaps, at an early opportunity, have a fresh statement on all the financial assistance that is being made available across the board to tourism and related businesses throughout Wales, because this is of great concern to all Assembly Members at this difficult time.

**Peter Black:** I also welcome the open and transparent way in which this is being dealt with. Issuing the guidelines so early, particularly to councils, but also to Assembly Members so that we know to what businesses are entitled, was helpful and is welcome. I have a few points. First, I have been contacted by some businesses that have already tried to make inquiries about this particular hardship relief and have found that some confusion exists in councils, even though those councils have received guidelines. It would be helpful if we could find a way of getting information out to businesses about to what they are entitled and how they should apply for it. I wonder whether it is possible to use the Valuation Office Agency, or some other method—maybe encouraging local councils—to do that. That information is important if all this money is to be claimed and businesses are to get the compensation and the help to which they are entitled. Secondly, I support Janet Ryder's concerns about the way that the money is being allocated. I know that we are doing our best in difficult circumstances with the information that the Valuation Office has made available to us. However, is there any flexibility in the way that this money is being allocated? If Powys County Council, the Isle of Anglesey County Council or some other council found that the money was being oversubscribed, could further allocations be proposed? If a council found that the money was being undersubscribed, could it be reallocated? That flexibility would be useful and we could consider how we would monitor that expenditure to achieve that flexibility. That would also be helpful.

wyf yn awyddus, foddy bynnag, i danlinellu mai proses barhaus yw hon ac y bydd angen arian ychwanegol arnom o fewn y cyfnod tri mis, heb sôn am y tu hwnt i hynny. Ailadroddaf hefyd y pwyt a wneuthum i Brif Weinidog Cymru. Bwriadai gynnal trafodaethau â'r Trysorlys am y posibilrwydd o symud y rhuddhad trethi a cholledion eleni ar gyfer busnesau yn eu blaen. Tybed a allem, efallai, cyn bo hir, gael datganiad newydd ar yr holl gymorth ariannol a roddir yn gyffredinol i dwristiaeth a busnesau cysylltiedig ledled Cymru, gan fod hyn yn peri pryer mawr i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf innau hefyd y ffordd agored ac eglur yr ymdrinnir â hyn. Yr oedd yn ddefnyddiol cyhoeddi canllawiau mor gynnar, yn enwedig i gynghorau, ond hefyd i Aelodau'r Cynulliad fel ein bod yn gwybod beth y mae gan fusnesau yr hawl i'w gael, ac fe'i croesewir. Mae gennyf ychydig o bwyntiau. Yn gyntaf, cysylltodd rhai busnesau â mi sydd eisoes wedi ceisio gwneud ymholaadau am y cymorth caledi penodol hwn ac maent wedi darganfod bod rhywfaint o ddrysych yn bodoli o fewn cynghorau, er bod y cynghorau hynny wedi derbyn canllawiau. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gallem ddod o hyd i ffordd o drosglwyddo'r wybodaeth i fusnesau am yr hyn y mae ganddynt hawl iddo a sut y dylent wneud cais amdano. Tybed a yw'n bosibl defnyddio Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio, neu ryw ddull arall—efallai drwy annog cynghorau lleol—i wneud hynny. Mae'r wybodaeth honno yn bwysig os ydym am i'r holl arian hwn gael ei hawlio ac os bydd busnesau am gael yr iawndal a'r cymorth y mae ganddynt hawl iddynt. Yn ail, cefnogaф bryderon Janet Ryder am y ffordd y caiff yr arian ei ddyrannu. Gwn ei bod yn gwneud ein gorau mewn amgylchiadau anodd gyda'r wybodaeth y mae'r Swyddfa Brisio wedi'i rhoi inni. Fodd bynnag, a oes unrhyw hyblygrwydd yn y ffordd y caiff yr arian hwn ei ddyrannu? Pe byddai Cyngor Sir Powys, Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn neu ryw gyngor arall yn gweld bod gormod o geisiadau am yr arian, a ellid cynnig dyraniadau pellach? Pe byddai cyngor yn gweld nad oedd digon o geisiadau am yr arian, a ellid ei ailddyrannu? Byddai'r hyblygrwydd hwnnw yn ddefnyddiol a gallem ystyried sut y byddem yn monitro'r

gwariant hwnnw er mwyn cyflawni'r hyblygrwydd hwnnw. Byddai hynny'n ddefnyddiol hefyd.

12:25 p.m.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** Thank you for those comments, Peter. Getting the information out to businesses is crucial. I will consider that and discuss it with the Welsh Local Government Association. If any Members are aware of any problems that businesses are having in accessing information through local authorities, I would be grateful if they would e-mail me so that I can deal with them straightforwardly. As we have made this money available, we want to ensure that it is accessible. I say to Janet and to the opposition parties that I appreciate the position that you have taken on the wellbeing power. I wrote to the party spokespeople indicating that we wanted to bring that forward to give those extra powers and discretion to local government. It is important that we assess our current position and I would be more than happy to report to the Committee—as Janet suggested—when we return from the recess. The time issues that were raised by Janet and Nick will also be important as the crisis continues. If we have to give additional relief, we want to ensure that there are not gaps in provision and that all the points are covered to deal with it effectively. I would also be pleased, if the Assembly wishes, to give an update after the recess on the finance that has been made available and allocated, if that would be helpful to Members.

Finally, I say to Nick, do not try to cause mischief between Jane and myself. You only want to cause mischief because you are not good at playing politics.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Diolch am y sylwadau hynny, Peter. Mae'n hanfodol trosglwyddo'r wybodaeth i fusnesau. Ystyriaf hynny ac fe'i trafodaf â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Os bydd unrhyw Aelodau yn ymwybodol o unrhyw broblemau a gaiff busnesau i gael gwybodaeth drwy awdurdodau lleol, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddech yn anfon e-bost ataf fel y gallaf ddelio â hwy ar unwaith. Gan ein bod wedi sicrhau bod yr arian hwn ar gael, yr ydym am sicrhau y gellir cael gafael arno. Dywedaf wrth Janet ac wrth y gwrthbleidiau fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi eich safbwyt ar y pŵer lles. Ysgrifennais at lefarwyr y pleidiau yn nodi ein bod am gyflwyno hynny i roi'r pwerau a'r disgrifiwn ychwanegol hynny i lywodraeth leol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn asesu ein safbwyt presennol a byddwn yn fwy na bodlon rhoi adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor—fel yr awgrymodd Janet—pan ddychwelwn ar ôl y toriad. Bydd y materion amser a godwyd gan Janet a Nick hefyd yn bwysig wrth i'r argyfwng barhau. Os bydd yn rhaid inni roi cymorth ychwanegol, yr ydym am sicrhau nad oes bylchau yn y ddarpariaeth ac y caiff pob un o'r pwyntiau eu cwmpasu er mwyn delio ag ef yn effeithiol. Byddwn yn fodlon hefyd, os bydd y Cynulliad am imi wneud hynny, rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar ôl y toriad am yr arian a fu ar gael ac a gafodd ei ddyrannu, os byddai hynny'n ddefnyddiol i'r Aelodau.

Yn olaf, dywedaf wrth Nick, peidiwch â chreu helynt rhwng Jane a minnau. Yr unig reswm yr ydych am greu helynt yw oherwydd nad ydych yn chwarae gêm wleidyddol dda.

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbynwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have accepted a procedural motion from Jocelyn Davies.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*the Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.10, defers the minority party debate scheduled for today to a later date.*

This is due to the time difficulties that we

*y Cynulliad, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, yn gohirio'r ddadl plaid leiafrifol y bwriadwyd ei chynnal heddiw.*

Y rheswm dros hyn yw'r anawsterau o ran

have experienced today following the Cabinet statements this morning. amser a brofwyd gennym heddiw ar ôl datganiadau'r Cabinet y bore yma.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Do 10 Members object to that? They do not. I will therefore put this procedural motion immediately to the vote as required by Standing Orders.

**William Graham:** May I comment on the procedural motion?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** No. Under Standing Order No. 6.10, we must proceed immediately to a vote. We will now vote on the procedural motion

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod yn gwrthwynebu hynny? Nac oes. Felly rhoddaf y cynnig trefniadol hwn i bleidlais ar unwaith fel sydd yn ofynnol yn ôl y Rheolau Sefydlog.

**William Graham:** A allaf ddweud rhywbeth am y cynnig trefniadol?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Na allwch. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, rhaid inni gael pleidlais ar unwaith. Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig trefniadol.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Cairns, Alun

Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion adopted.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have been corrected to the effect that the motion could not have been adopted if 10 Members had voted against it. However, only one Member voted against it, so I therefore declare the procedural motion adopted.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Fe'm cywirwyd. Ni ellid bod wedi derbyn y cynnig pe byddai 10 Aelod wedi pleidleisio yn ei erbyn. Fodd bynnag, dim ond un Aelod a bleidleisiodd yn ei erbyn, felly datganaf fod y cynnig trefniadol wedi'i dderbyn.

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **Stres—Ei Effeithiau ar Blant Stress—the Effects on the Child**

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. David Melding and Kirsty Williams have stated that they want to contribute to the debate.

The word ‘stress’ is used loosely in language today. As a short-term response to an external situation, it can aid mental or physical performance, for example in meeting tight deadlines. However, as a long-term condition, it has an extremely negative physical and mental effect on the individual. Stress can be caused by a variety of factors—long-term, short-term or cumulative—such as job loss, bereavement, relationship breakdown, financial worries and so on. It can lead to physical illness or further mental problems such as depression. Because of the social stigma attached to any mental condition, individuals rarely seek help and most may have little idea what services they need or whether help is available.

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae David Melding a Kirsty Williams wedi nodi eu bod am gyfrannu at y ddadl.

Defnyddir y gair ‘stres’ yn eang mewn iaith heddiw. Fel ymateb tymor byr i sefyllfa allanol, gall gynorthwyo perfformiad meddyliol neu gorfforol, er enghraifft i gwrdd â therfynau amser caeth. Fodd bynnag, fel anhwylder tymor hir, caiff effaith gorfforol a meddyliol negyddol dros ben ar yr unigolyn. Gall amrywiaeth o ffactorau achosi stres—ffactorau tymor hir, ffactorau tymor byr neu ffactorau cynyddol—megis colli swydd, profedigaeth, perthynas yn chwalu, pryderon ariannol ac ati. Gall arwain at salwch corfforol neu broblemau iechyd meddwl eraill megis iselder. Oherwydd y stigma cymdeithasol sydd ynghlwm wrth unrhyw salwch meddwl, anaml y mae unigolion yn gofyn am gymorth ac mae'n bosibl nad oes fawr o syniad gan y rhan fwyaf ohonynt o'r gwasanaethau sydd eu hangen arnynt neu a oes cymorth ar gael.

The seeds of this debate were sown in my mind during February and March, when the catastrophic events of late winter and early spring turned their dark gaze on Wales. I am thinking of Corus's announcement on job losses. Our immediate concern goes out to

Dechreuais feddwl am y ddadl hon yn ystod Chwefror a Mawrth, pan ddigwyddodd trychinebau diwedd y gaeaf a dechrau'r gwanwyn yng Nghymru. Golygaf gyhoeddiad Corus am golli swyddi. Pryderwn ar unwaith am y bobl a fydd o

the people who may lose their livelihoods. However, what about the effect of this twist of events on the child or children of the household? Perhaps they feel the responsibility of this shift in the family's fortunes. Perhaps they shoulder the guilt, anxiety, frustration, depression and other negative mental and emotional responses of their parents or guardians.

Children typically know about the everyday affairs of their parents. As a parent, you know that anything that affects you will, sooner or later, affect your children as they base their emotional security on you. Even young children can sense when their parents are upset, and these youngsters become tense themselves. Living from day to day with stress can be emotionally exhausting. Most people can endure difficulties of known duration, but living through a protracted crisis can be much more stressful. How does this make children feel? Children are fragile. Who knows how domestic tension can lay the foundations of insecurities in later life?

I was further prompted to hold a short debate on this issue while watching, with my grandchildren, news coverage of sheep and cattle carcasses being burned as a result of the foot and mouth disease epidemic. As adults, we can absorb this horror, or some of it at least, through our hard-earned and hard-learned sense of self-preservation. Our compassion becomes overlaid with an understanding of the world and human nature. Children have no such defences. The sight of cattle and sheep being burned and slaughtered is a profoundly disturbing image for any child to grasp and understand.

However, my theme today is wider than those two specific issues. It involves children and stress in the wider context. As my theme, I will take a close look at the predicament of children in Wales and what Assembly Members can do about it. The scale of the Corus announcement and the rural crisis, preceded by a series of job losses in the electronics industry, has brought the effects of domestic stress and pressure on families

bosibl yn colli eu bywoliaeth. Fodd bynnag, beth am effaith y digwyddiadau hyn ar blentyn neu blant y teulu? Efallai eu bod yn teimlo'n gyfrifol am y newid hwn yn sefyllfa'r teulu. Efallai eu bod yn ysgwyddo euogrwydd, gofid, rhwystredigaeth, iselder ac ymatebion meddyliol neu emosiynol negyddol eraill eu rhieni neu eu gwarcheidwaid.

Mae plant yn ymwybodol o faterion bob dydd eu rhieni ar y cyfan. Fel rhiant, gwyddoch y bydd unrhyw beth sydd yn effeithio arnoch chi, yn hwyr neu'n hwyrach, yn effeithio ar eich plant gan eu bod yn seilio eu diogelwch emosiynol arnoch. Gall plant ifanc hyd yn oed synhwyro pan fydd eu rhieni yn ofidus, ac mae'r plant ifanc hyn eu hunain ar bigau'r drain. Gall byw gyda stres o ddydd i ddydd eich blino yn emosiynol. Gall y rhan fwyaf o bobl ddioddef anawsterau sydd yn parhau am gyfnod penodol, ond gall byw drwy argyfwng hir achosi llawer mwy o stres. Sut mae'r plant yn teimlo o ganlyniad i hyn? Mae plant yn fregus. Pwy a wyr ym mha ffodd y gall tensiwn yn y cartref osod sylfeini ansicrwydd yn nes ymlaen yn eu bywydau?

Fe'm hysgogwyd ymhellach i gynnal dadl fer ar y mater hwn tra'n gwylio adroddiadau ar y newyddion o garcasau defaid a gwartheg yn cael eu llosgi o ganlyniad i epidemig clwy'r traed a'r genau, gyda'm hwyrion a'm hwyrresau. Fel oedolion, gallwn dderbyn yr arswyd hwn, neu rywfaint ohono o leiaf, oherwydd ein hymdeimlad o hunangadwraeth a feithriniwyd ac a ddysgwyd gennym. Gorchuddir ein tosturi â dealltwriaeth o'r byd ac o natur ddynol. Nid oes amddiffynfeydd o'r fath gan blant. Mae gweld gwartheg a defaid yn cael eu llosgi a'u lladd yn anodd dros ben i unrhyw blentyn ei amgyffred a'i ddeall.

Fodd bynnag, mae fy thema heddiw yn ehangach na'r ddau fater penodol hwnnw. Mae'n ymwneud â phlant a stres yn y cyddestun ehangach. Fel thema, edrychaf yn fanwl ar drybini plant yng Nghymru a'r hyn y gall y Cynulliad ei wneud. Mae graddfa cyhoeddiad Corus a'r argyfwng gwledig, a ddilynodd gyfres o ddiswyddiadau yn y diwydiant electronig, wedi amlygu effeithiau stres a phwysau yn y cartref ar deuluoedd â

with children into sharp focus.

People experience stress in different ways. Some people react to stressful situations physically. Others have emotional responses. Some respond with changes in behaviour in relationships. Stress can show itself in physical symptoms, such as headaches or stomach problems, or in emotional symptoms, such as angry outbursts or depression. Behavioural changes, such as increased smoking or drinking, can also be a reaction to stress. In most people, stress affects their relationship with others, such as having difficulty getting along with people because of irritability or feelings of sadness. Stress that goes unrecognised and is not dealt with leads to poor decisions. Relationships between partners and between parents and children also suffer during stressful times, as can health.

Everyday, children live with the effects of stress. Many families feel under stress due to family breakdown and social disadvantage. Some parents also suffer stress because they have demanding jobs. Under these circumstances, some parents have difficulty forming or maintaining normal positive relationships with their children. It is our duty to ensure that advice and support is available to support not only the children, but also the parents. We are all aware that being a parent can be hard as well as rewarding work, always mindful that today's children will shape our future.

12:35 p.m.

What is the predicament of children in Wales? According to 'Wales' Children, Our Future', the manifesto produced by the consortium of Barnardo's, the Child Poverty Action Group, the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children, Save the Children, Children in Wales and the Children's Society, young people are at greater risk than others in our society in Wales. They are frequently without voice and unable to get their concerns heard. New legislation, changes in policy and better co-ordination of existing policies are necessary to enable young people to grow into secure,

phlant yn glir.

Mae pobl yn profi stres mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Mae rhai pobl yn ymateb i sefyllfaoedd llawn stres yn gorfforol. Mae pobl eraill yn ymateb yn emosiynol. Mae rhai yn ymateb drwy newid eu hymddygiad mewn perthynas. Gall stres achosi symptomau corfforol, megis pennau tost neu broblemau'r stumog, neu symptomau emosiynol, megis dicter neu iselder. Gall stres achosi newidiadau o ran ymddygiad hefyd, fel ysmyu mwy neu yfed mwy. Ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o bobl, mae stres yn effeithio ar eu perthynas ag eraill, megis cael anhawster i gyd-dynnu â phobl oherwydd eu bod yn bigog neu'n drist. Arweinia stres na chaiff ei gydnabod ac nad ymdrinnir ag ef at benderfyniadau gwael. Mae'r gydberthynas rhwng partneriaid a rhwng rhieni a phlant, ynghyd ag iechyd, hefyd yn dioddef yn ystod cyfnodau llawn stres.

Mae plant yn byw gydag effeithiau stres bob dydd. Mae llawer o deuluoedd yn teimlo o dan bwysau oherwydd chwalfa yn y teulu ac anfantais gymdeithasol. Mae rhai rhieni yn profi stres oherwydd swyddi anodd. O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, mae rhai rhieni yn profi anawsterau wrth ffurfio neu gadw perthynas gadarnhaol gyffredin â'u plant. Ein dyletswydd ni yw sicrhau bod cyngor a chymorth ar gael nid yn unig i gynorthwyo'r plant, ond y rhieni hefyd. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol y gall bod yn rhiant fod yn waith anodd ynghyd â bod yn waith gwerthfawr, gan gofio'r ffaith mai plant heddiw fydd yn llunio ein dyfodol.

Beth yw trybini plant yng Nghymru? Yn ôl 'Plant Cymru, Ein Dyfodol', y maniffesto a luniwyd gan gonsortiw Barnado's, Grŵp Gweithredu Tlodi Plant, Y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant, Cronfa Achub y Plant, Plant yng Nghymru a Chymdeithas y Plant, mae pobl ifanc mewn mwy o berygl nag eraill yn ein cymdeithas yng Nghymru. Maent yn aml yn ddi-lais ac ni allant sicrhau y caiff eu pryderon eu clywed. Mae angen deddfwriaeth newydd, newidiadau o ran polisiau a chydlynau polisiau presennol yn well er mwyn galluogi pobl ifanc i dyfu yn ddinas syddion sicr, hyderus a

confident and resourceful citizens.

What is the solution? We require an integrated approach that will focus on key areas in which to create equality of opportunity for children. Children's issues must be at the heart of government. Policy on non-devolved issues, such as social security and youth justice, and primary legislation on devolved issues, such as education, still significantly affect the lives of children in Wales. An overarching strategy for children in Wales must be developed within an appropriate strategic framework to ensure that children are a high political priority and central to the Government of Wales's agenda.

We need increased financial support through child benefit, income support and the integrated children's tax credit. We also need more well-funded services to support children, particularly the most disadvantaged children, to ensure that they have the best possible start in life and to help them throughout childhood. We must eliminate child poverty by supporting local initiatives within a national framework. In light of her recent budget statement, I call on the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to consider the allocation of some of the underspend and unallocated funds to set up a children's fund to redress the deplorable situation as regards children in Wales.

The statement made last week by the Minister for Rural Affairs, on his offer to match pound for pound any monies publicly donated to assist those farmers and families affected by the present foot and mouth disease epidemic to ease the current hardship, was a gesture far short of a lifeline. It is shameful that the Assembly had to be prompted or shamed to match the pace of spontaneous public donations. The National Assembly should take the lead and should be the public conscience in times of crisis. I hope that the offer was intended to be complementary to, not instead of, direct family support funding.

medrus.

Beth yw'r ateb? Mae angen ymagwedd integredig arnom a fydd yn canolbwytio ar y meysydd allweddol lle y gellir creu cyfle cyfartal ar gyfer plant. Rhaid i faterion plant fod wrth wraidd llywodraeth. Mae polisiau ar faterion nas datganolwyd, megis nawdd cymdeithasol a chyflawnder pobl ifanc, a deddfwriaeth sylfaenol ar faterion datganoledig, megis addysg, yn parhau i gael effaith sylwedol ar fywydau plant yng Nghymru. Rhaid datblygu strategaeth drosfwaol i blant yng Nghymru o fewn fframwaith strategol priodol er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir blaenoriaeth wleidyddol uchel i blant a'u bod yn rhan ganolog o agenda Llywodraeth Cymru.

Mae angen mwy o gymorth ariannol arnom drwy fudd-dâl plant, cymhorthdal incwm a chredyd treth plant integredig. Mae angen mwy o wasanaethau wedi eu hariannu'n dda arnom hefyd i roi cymorth i blant, yn enwedig y plant o dan yr anfantais fwyaf, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael y cychwyn gorau posibl mewn bywyd ac er mwyn eu helpu drwy gydol eu plentynnod. Rhaid inni ddiddymu tlodi ymhliith plant drwy gefnogi mentrau lleol o fewn fframwaith cenedlaethol. Yn sgîl ei datganiad diweddar ar y gyllideb, galwaf ar y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau i ystyried dyrannu rhywfaint o'r tanwariant a'r arian nas dyrannwyd i sefydlu cronfa plant i unioni'r sefyllfa alaethus o ran plant yng Nghymru.

Yr oedd y datganiad a wnaethwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, ar ei gynnig i roi punt am bunt i gyfateb ag unrhyw arian a roddir gan y cyhoedd i gynorthwyo'r ffermwyr a'r teuluoedd hynny yr effeithir arnynt gan epidemig clwy'r traed a'r genau presennol i leddfu'r caledi presennol, yn symbolaidd yn hytrach na bod o gymorth sylwedol. Mae'n warthus bod yn rhaid ysgogi'r Cynulliad neu godi cywilydd arno i roi arian sydd yn cyfateb â chyflymder rhoddion y cyhoedd. Dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol achub y blaen gan weithredu fel cydwybod y cyhoedd yn ystod argyfngau. Gobeithiaf y bwriadwyd i'r cynnig fod yn ategol i'r arian uniongyrchol i gefnogi teuluoedd, ac nid yn

ei le.

No one could fail to be touched by the image of the young Cumbrian family that is a victim of the foot and mouth disease crisis. The family faces ruin due to mounting bills, no cash coming in and having no money to buy food for their young children. I have no doubt that there are Welsh families in similar situations. The Assembly's administration should give more consideration to setting up a proper fund to address children's issues, particularly in times of crisis.

I welcome the appointment of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. However, I remain concerned that his powers are restricted to services devolved to the Assembly. Children in Wales need a truly independent champion who can monitor, review and report freely on any devolved or non-devolved issue that affects their rights and welfare. It remains for us to continue to lobby our Westminster colleagues to ensure that the recently announced amendment to the Children's Commissioner for Wales Bill is accepted.

As the gap between rich and poor continues to widen, children and young people in Wales are increasingly bearing the brunt of poverty, inequality and social exclusion. Children born in poverty in Wales are likely to be unhealthy and to have a poor education and limited employment prospects. They are also more likely to become homeless, be exposed to crime, alcohol and drug misuse and to experience abusive relationships.

The Waterhouse report, 'Lost in Care', appalled us all. However, home is where the hurt is. Most physical abuse occurs within the family. No one could fail to be appalled by a recent newspaper headline that read 'Rolling Pin Fury'. The article described a case in which a mother thrashed her six-year-old daughter with a rolling pin, having first slapped her and her eight-year-old brother in the face. The mother's defence was that she was under extreme stress having to bring up two boisterous children. The courts have dealt with the matter and the mother is now

Ni allai neb beidio â chael ei effeithio gan lun y teulu ifanc o Gymbria sydd yn dioddef yn sgil argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae'r teulu yn wynebu dinistr llwyr oherwydd biliau cynyddol, dim arian yn dod i mewn a dim arian i brynu bwyd i'w plant ifanc. Mae'n siŵr bod teuluoedd yng Nghymru mewn sefyllfaoedd tebyg. Dylai gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad ystyried ymhellach sefydlu cronfa briodol i ymdrin â materion yn ymwneud â phlant, yn enwedig yn ystod argyfyngau.

Croesawaf benodiad Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Fodd bynnag, parhaf i bryderu bod ei bwerau'n gyfyngedig i wasanaethau a ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad. Mae angen amddiffynnydd gwirioneddol annibynnol ar blant yng Nghymru a all fonitro, adolygu a rhoi adroddiadau heb gyfyngiadau ar unrhyw fater a ddatganolwyd neu nas datganolwyd sydd yn effeithio ar eu hawliau neu eu lles. Rhaid inni barhau i lobio ein cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan i sicrhau y derbynir y gwelliant a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar i Fesur Comisiynydd Plant Cymru.

Wrth i'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd barhau i ehangu, mae plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn dwyn baich tlodi, anghydraddoldeb ac allgáu cymdeithasol yn gynyddol. Mae plant a gaiff eu geni mewn tlodi yng Nghymru yn debygol o beidio â bod yn iach ac o gael addysg wael a rhagolygon cyfyngedig o ran cyflogaeth. Maent hefyd yn fwy tebygol o ddod yn ddigartref, o gael eu cyflwyno i droseddau, camddefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau a phrofi cydberthnasau difriol.

Codwyd arswyd ar bob un ohonom gan adroddiad Waterhouse, 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal'. Fodd bynnag, yn y cartref y caiff pobl eu brifo. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o gam-drin corfforol yn digwydd o fewn y teulu. Ni allai neb beidio â chael eu dychnyn gan bennawd diweddar mewn papur newydd, 'Rolling Pin Fury'. Disgrifiodd yr erthygl achos lle y curodd mam ei merch chwe mlwydd oed gyda rholbren, ar ôl ei tharo hi a'i brawd wyth mlwydd oed yn eu hwyneb yn gyntaf. Amddiffyniad y fam oedd ei bod o dan bwysau eithriadol oherwydd bod yn rhaid

serving a 12-month probation order. The children have been placed on the child protection register. What was particularly worrying in this case was that the eight-year-old boy, who had been slapped harshly for misbehaving, handed his mother the rolling pin, inviting her to hit his six-year-old sister with it. What provoked this lad to do such a thing? Was he trying to divert the pain and suffering away from himself? We can only wonder why and hope that the 12 month probationary period will assist in ensuring that this family, with much support, can rebuild the love and respect for each other that is obviously lacking at the moment.

All children have the right to be protected from exploitation and abuse and to be kept safe in their homes, at school and in the wider community. Urban and Valley areas in Wales have seen their communities spiral into deprivation through unemployment, poverty and lack of investment. Rural communities are in crisis. That applies not only to farmers but also people working in other rural industries. Fears of violence, bullying, assaults and drugs all impact with great force on vulnerable, impressionable and precious children. Children from black and ethnic minority backgrounds experience the additional burden of discrimination and racial harassment.

Much work remains to be done in creating a safer environment for our children and identifying and resolving children's stress. Symptoms of stress in children that parents may notice include school grades going down and teenagers increasing alcohol abuse and sadness. Children often become withdrawn and bitter but some children's grades in school go up, because they use achievement in school as a way to cope with their stressful feelings.

Steps that parents can take to help children to cope include reducing demands made on them until they can feel in control, helping them to think positively and to turn problems

iddi fagu dau blentyn afreolus. Mae'r llysoedd wedi delio â'r mater ac mae'r fam bellach o dan orchymyn prawf 12 mis. Rhoddyd y plant ar y gofrestr diogelu plant. Yr hyn a barodd bryder arbennig yn yr achos hwn oedd bod y bachgen wyth mlwydd oed, a gafodd ei guro'n galed oherwydd ei fod yn camymddwyn, wedi rhoi'r rholbren i'w fam, gan ei hannog i fwrw ei chwaer chwe mlwydd oed. Beth achosodd i'r bachgen hwn wneud y fath beth? A oedd yn ceisio gwyo'r poen a'r dioddefaint oddi ef ei hun? Ni allwn ond tybio pam y gwnaeth hyn a gobeithio y bydd y cyfnod prawf 12 mis yn helpu i sicrhau y gall y teulu hwn, gyda llawer o gymorth, ailennyn y cariad a'r parch tuag at ei gilydd sydd yn amlwg ar goll ar hyn o bryd.

Mae gan bob plentyn yr hawl i gael ei ddiogelu rhag cael ei gamddefnyddio a'i gam-drin ac i fod yn ddiogel yn eu cartrefi, yn yr ysgol a'r gymuned ehangach. Gwelodd ardaloedd trefol ac ardaloedd y Cymoedd yng Nghymru eu cymunedau yn llithro i amddifadedd oherwydd diweithdra, tlodi a diffyg buddsoddiad. Mae argyfwng mewn cymunedau gwledig. Mae hynny'n berthnasol nid yn unig i ffermwyr ond hefyd i bobl sydd yn gweithio mewn diwydiannau gwledig eraill. Mae ofn traïs, bwlio, ymosodiadau a chyffuriau yn effeithio'n sylweddol ar blant diamdiffyn, annwyl y mae'n hawdd dylanwadu arnynt. Mae plant o gefndiroedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn profi baich ychwanegol gwahaniaethu ac aflonyddwch hiliol.

Erys llawer o waith i'w wneud i greu amgylchedd mwy diogel i'n plant ac i nodi a datrys stres ymhliith plant. Ymhliith symptomau stres ymysg plant y gall rhieni sylwi arnynt mae graddau yn yr ysgol yn gostwng a chamddefnyddio alcohol a thristwch cynyddol ymysg pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau. Aiff plant yn dawel ac yn chwerw yn aml ond mae graddau ysgol rhai plant yn codi, gan eu bod yn defnyddio eu cyflawniad yn yr ysgol fel ffordd o ymdopi â'u teimladau llawn stres.

Ymhliith y camau y gall rhieni eu cymryd i helpu plant i ymdopi mae lleihau'r hyn a ofynnir ohonynt hyd nes iddynt allu teimlo dan reolaeth, eu helpu i feddwl mewn ffordd

into challenges, and aiding them in finding the right amount of stress because in some instances it can be a valued friend. They could also encourage children to have strong friendships and take part in activities helping them to see how their contributions are useful to the family.

Parenting is the most challenging job that families face. Child rearing needs to be given a higher status in society and must be valued and supported regardless of family composition, culture and background.

I applaud Rhondda Cynon Taff Community Arts' teenage mothers project, which aims to provide vulnerable young girls aged 16 years and under, who are young mothers or pregnant, who are unlikely to stay in education and who are at risk of social exclusion, with the opportunity to participate in innovative, creative experiences that will raise their feelings of self-worth and self-esteem. The project will explore issues relevant to young women such as pregnancy, parenting, healthcare and society, producing an annual magazine for teenage mothers based on these issues.

The health and education of children are vital factors in ensuring the future prosperity of Wales. Tennyson once wrote

'Household happiness, gracious children, debtless competence, golden mean'.

Children need this 'golden mean' in which to thrive. I will give you examples of excellent work in my local authority area, Rhondda Cynon Taff, which is breaking new ground in rejuvenating opportunities for children and young people.

First, Valleys Kids in Penygraig in Rhondda, which turns the negative into positive through youth and community work, helps children to succeed through play work, makes the impossible possible through computer training, offers support between a rock and a hard place with its Bridges community support scheme and gives kids a chance through the Artworks programme.

gadarnhaol ac i droi problemau yn heriau, a'u cynorthwyo i ddod o hyd i'r lefel gywir o stres oherwydd gall fod yn ddefnyddiol mewn rhai amgylchiadau. Gallent hefyd annog plant i feithrin cyfeillgarwch cryf ac i gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau sydd yn eu helpu i weld ym mha ffyrdd y mae eu cyfraniadau yn ddefnyddiol i'r teulu.

Magu plant yw'r gwaith mwyaf heriol a wynebir gan deuluoedd. Mae angen rhoi statws uwch yn y gymdeithas i'r gwaith o fagu plant a rhaid ei werthfawrogi a'i gefnogi waeth beth fo cyfansoddiad, diwylliant a chefndir y teulu.

Cymeradwyaf brosiect Celfyddyau Cymunedol Rhondda Cynon Taf i famau yn eu harddegau, sydd â'r nod o roi i ferched ifanc diamddiffyn 16 mlwydd oed ac o dan 16 mlwydd oed, sydd yn debygol o aros mewn addysg neu sydd mewn perygl o allgáu cymdeithasol, y cyfle i gymryd rhan mewn profiadau arloesol, creadigol a fydd yn codi eu teimladau o hunan-werth a hunan-barch. Bydd y prosiect yn archwilio'r materion sydd yn berthnasol i ferched ifanc megis beicio grwydd, magu plant, gofal iechyd a chymdeithas, gan gyhoeddi cylchgrawn blynnyddol i famau yn eu harddegau yn seiliedig ar y materion hyn.

Mae iechyd ac addysg plant yn ffactorau hanfodol wrth sicrhau ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol. Ysgrifennodd Tennyson

'Household happiness, gracious children, debtless competence, golden mean'.

Mae angen y 'golden mean' hwn ar blant er mwyn iddynt ffynnau. Rhoddaf enghreifftiau ichi o waith ardderchog yn ardal fy awdurdod lleol, Rhondda Cynon Taf, sydd yn torri tir newydd wrth adnewyddu cyfleoedd i blant a phobl ifanc.

Yn gyntaf, mae Plant y Cymoedd ym Mhenygraig yn y Rhondda, sydd yn troi sefyllfa negyddol yn sefyllfa gadarnhaol drwy waith ieuengtiaid a chymunedol, yn helpu plant i lwyddo drwy chwarae, yn gwneud yr amhosibl yn bosibl drwy hyfforddiant ar gyfrifiaduron, yn cynnig cymorth mewn sefyllfa amhosibl gyda'i gynllun cymorth cymunedol 'Bridges' ac yn rhoi cyfle i blant drwy'r rhaglen 'Artworks'.

There is another project that will concentrate on developing childcare places for the students of higher and further education institutions in an area of disadvantage, to meet the increasing demand of the workforce and the prospective workforce in Rhondda Cynon Taff. Unfortunately, despite the fact that this comprehensive bid was submitted to the Welsh European Funding Office in September 2000 for consideration under the Objective 1 programme, we are still awaiting an announcement on whether it has been approved.

I hope that this debate has proven that stress and its effect on the child has a dramatic influence on the whole social fabric of Wales. One policy idea that I would like the Assembly to adopt is the setting up of a family and children anxiety network with a website or a newsletter. It could be provided locally or nationally and contain professional, voluntary and statutory agency contact points so that young people would understand where to go and the options available.

Our children are our legacy and investment in the future. It is our duty to protect them from stress and to give their needs the priority they deserve. What better time to start than now?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Pauline has taken up all the allocated time, and I should not allow David Melding or Kirsty Williams to speak. However, if they want 30 seconds, I am sure that we could make an exception.

12:45 p.m.

**David Melding:** I congratulate Pauline for bringing this important matter to our attention and for using a short debate so productively.

I think that bereavement services are often inadequate for children and are not targeted well at them. Other professionals, such as teachers, often have a reduced ability to follow-up and provide the necessary counselling in an environment in which the child feels safe and comfortable. It can also be difficult for the remaining parent or

Mae prosiect arall a fydd yn canolbwyntio ar ddatblygu lleoedd gofal plant ar gyfer myfyrwyr sefydliadau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach mewn ardal sydd o dan anfantais, i fodloni galw cynyddol y gweithlu a'r darpar weithlu yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Yn anffodus, er gwaethaf y ffaith y cyflwynwyd y cynnig cynhwysfawr hwn i Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ym Medi 2000 i'w ystyried o dan raglen Amcan 1, parhawn i aros am gyhoeddiad i gadarnhau a'i cymeradwywyd ai peidio.

Gobeithio i'r ddadl hon brofi y caiff stres a'i effeithiau ar blant ddylanwad sylweddol ar gymdeithas gyfan Cymru. Un syniad polisi yr hoffwn i'r Cynulliad ei fabwysiadu yw sefydlu rhwydwaith pryder i deuluoedd a phlant gyda gwefan neu gylchlythyr. Gellid ei ddarparu'n lleol neu'n rhyngwladol a gallai gynnwys cysylltiadau asiantaethau proffesiynol, gwirfoddol a statudol er mwyn i blant ifanc ddeall ble i fynd a'r opsiynau sydd ar gael.

Ein hetifeddiaeth a'n buddsoddiad yn y dyfodol yw ein plant. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i'w diogelu rhag stres ac i roi'r flaenoriaeth haeddiannol i'w hanghenion. A fu gwell amser i ddechrau nag yn awr?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cymerodd Pauline yr holl amser a ddyrrannwyd i'r ddadl, ac ni ddylwn ganiatáu i David Melding na Kirsty Williams siarad. Fodd bynnag, os hoffent 30 eiliad, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem wneud eithriad.

**David Melding:** Llongyfarchaf Pauline am ddod â'r mater pwysig hwn i'n sylw ac am ddefnyddio dadl fer mewn ffordd mor gynhyrchiol.

Credaf fod y gwasanaethau profedigaeth yn aml yn annigonol ar gyfer plant ac na chânt eu targedu atynt yn dda. Mae gan weithwyr proffesiynol eraill, megis athrawon, yn aml, lai o allu i wneud gwaith ategol ac i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth cynggori angenrheidiol mewn amgylchedd lle y teimla'r plentyn yn ddiogel ac yn gyfforddus.

guardian to give that kind of support. People often say that children get over things quickly or that they seem to be in fairly good shape, without realising that when children reach adolescence, early bereavement could have a serious effect on them. We must remember that.

**Kirsty Williams:** Children and young people have reported bullying as a major source of stress. One in three pupils in schools in England and Wales have been the subject of bullying, one in four have been threatened with violence and one in eight have been physically assaulted. This results in one in 10 pupils skipping school lessons to avoid potential violence. In events organised by the NSPCC and similar organisations in the run-up to the establishment of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, children's workshops always noted bullying as one of the highest priorities that children hoped the National Assembly and the Children's Commissioner would address. I trust, now that we have a Commissioner, we can work with him to establish successful strategies to combat what is, as children have reported, one of the major sources of stress in their lives.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I also thank Pauline for using the short debate to discuss an important issue and I welcome what has been said. This debate is appropriate as we had a good debate about mental health earlier this week, when the child and adolescent mental health strategy was discussed. That strategy reveals a strong link between excessive stress and the mental health of children and young people in Wales. As Pauline has said, the causes of stress are varied. She drew to our attention the impact of crises such as the threat of a plant closure, as is being experienced in communities where Corus has announced job losses. We know of the impact that the uncertainty of such a situation has on children and families. There is also stress in rural communities due to the current foot and mouth disease outbreak. However, we often only hear about the experiences of adults, not children. It is important that that is recognised and, therefore, I endorse what has been said.

Gall fod yn anodd hefyd i'r rhiant arall neu'r gwarcheidwad roi cymorth o'r math hwnnw. Dywedir yn aml fod plant yn dygymod â phethau'n gyflym neu yr ymddengys eu bod yn ymdopi'n dda, heb sylweddoli y gallai profedigaeth gynnar gael effaith ddifrifol ar blant pan fyddant yn eu harddegau. Rhaid inni gofio hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae plant a phobl ifanc wedi dweud mai bwlio yw un o brif achosion stres. Mae un disgybl o bob tri mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr wedi cael ei fwlio, un disgybl o bob pedwar wedi'i fygwth â thrais ac ymosodwyd ar un disgybl o bob wyth yn gorfforol. O ganlyniad, mae un disgybl o bob deg yn colli gwersi ysgol i osgoi trais possibl. Mewn digwyddiadau a drefnwyd gan y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant a sefydliadau tebyg cyn sefydlu Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, nododd gweithdai plant bob amser mai bwlio yw un o'r prif flaenoriaethau y gobeithiai plant y byddai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r Comisiynydd Plant yn ymdrin â hwy. Hyderaf, gan fod Comisiynydd gennym bellach, y gallwn gydweithio ag ef i sefydlu strategaethau llwyddiannus i wrthsefyll yr hyn sydd, ym marn y plant, yn un o brif achosion stres yn eu bywydau.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolchaf innau hefyd i Pauline am ddefnyddio'r ddadl fer i draffod mater pwysig a chroesawaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd. Mae'r ddadl hon yn un briodol oherwydd inni gael dadl dda ar iechyd meddwl yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, pan drafodwyd strategaeth iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc. Dengys y strategaeth honno gysylltiad cryf rhwng gormod o stres ac iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd Pauline, mae sefyllfaoedd amrywiol yn achosi stres. Tynnodd ein sylw at effaith argyfyngau megis bygythiad gweithfeydd yn cau, fel sydd yn digwydd yn y cymunedau lle y cyhoeddodd Corus ddiswyddiadau. Gwyddom am yr effaith y caiff ansierwydd sefyllfa o'r fath ar blant a theuluoedd. Mae stres mewn cymunedau gwledig hefyd oherwydd yr achosion presennol o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Fodd bynnag, yn aml, dim ond am brofiadau oedolion y byddwn yn clywed, nid profiadau plant. Mae'n bwysig y

caiff hynny ei gydnabod ac, felly, cymeradwyaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd.

Kirsty mentioned bullying as a significant source of stress and pressure, along with the Assembly's role, in partnership with local government and the voluntary sector, in ensuring that we promote environments where we can deal with the consequences of children's stress and prevent it from occurring. I am pleased that we have a network of healthy school schemes in Wales throughout the 22 local authorities. Schools are now developing a culture where they can consider their own priorities, in terms of the school ethos, preventing bullying and ensuring that there are parent training programmes in place. These are important, as Pauline said, in enabling parents and teachers to work together to help children with behavioural problems. That is all part of the school environment. Throughout Wales, partnerships are fostering new projects, which are breaking new ground with children and young people. I am aware of the work done by the pioneering project, Valleys Kids, and on Wednesday, I will visit the Sure Start initiatives in Rhondda. As we discussed a few weeks ago, Sure Start can help younger children and their families to reduce stress and improve mental health. Parenting, reducing stress and dealing with its impact and causes, such as poverty, poor housing or lack of opportunity, are all important, and Pauline described good initiatives in her area that aim to do that.

Today's children will shape our future. We must work together. It is important that the Assembly tries to bring strands together, such as the children and young people framework for partnership, which is important for local government in ensuring that our policy responsibilities are brought together. We are much more co-ordinated at service planning level, at local level with all the agencies involved and also at Assembly level. We are also looking at all the grant schemes and how we can improve the support and funding for children's services. We are reviewing the children and family services grant scheme and substantially increasing the money going directly into children's services as a result of our budgetary considerations.

Crybwylodd Kirsty fwlio fel un o'r achosion mwyaf arwyddocaol o stres a phwysau, ynghyd â'r rôl y Cynulliad, mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol a'r sector gwirfoddol, wrth sicrhau ein bod yn hyrwyddo amgylcheddau lle y gallwn ddelio â chanlyniadau stres plant a'i atal rhag digwydd. Yr wyf yn falch bod gennym rwydwaith o gynlluniau ysgolion iach yng Nghymru ledled y 22 awdurdod lleol. Mae ysgolion bellach yn datblygu diwylliant lle y gallant ystyried eu blaenoriaethau eu hunain, o ran ethos yr ysgol, atal bwlio a sicrhau y gweithredir rhagleni hyfforddiant i rieni. Mae'r rhain yn bwysig, fel y dywedodd Pauline, wrth alluogi rhieni ac athrawon i gydweithio i helpu plant â phroblemau ymddygiad. Mae hynny oll yn rhan o amgylchedd yr ysgol. Ledled Cymru, mae partneriaethau yn meithrin prosiectau newydd, sydd yn torri tir newydd gyda phlant a phobl ifanc. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith a wneir gan y prosiect arloesol, Plant y Cymoedd, a ddydd Mercher, byddaf yn ymweld â mentrau Cychwyn Cadarn yn y Rhondda. Fel y trafodasom ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, gall Cychwyn Cadarn helpu plant iau a'u teuluoedd i leihau stres ac i wella iechyd meddwl. Mae magu plant, lleihau stres a delio â'i effaith a'i achosion, megis tlodi, tai gwael neu ddifyg cyfle, oll yn bwysig, a disgrifiodd Pauline fentrau da yn ei hardal sydd â'r nod o wneud hynny.

Bydd plant heddiw yn llunio ein dyfodol. Rhaid inni gydweithio. Mae'n bwysig y ceisia'r Cynulliad ddod â'r llinynnau ynghyd, megis fframwaith partneriaeth plant a phobl ifanc, sydd yn bwysig ar gyfer llywodraeth leol wrth sicrhau y deuir â chyfrifoldebau o ran polisiau at ei gilydd. Mae ein gwaith yn llawer mwy cydlynus o ran cynllunio gwasanaethau, yn lleol gyda phob un o'r asiantaethau perthnasol a hefyd yn y Cynulliad. Ymchwiliwn hefyd i bob un o'r cynlluniau grant ac i weld ym mha ffordd y gallwn wella'r cymorth a'r arian a roddir i wasanaethau plant. Adolygwn y cynllun grant gwasanaethau plant a theuluoedd a chynyddwn yn sylweddol yr arian a aiff yn uniongyrchol i wasanaethau plant o ganlyniad i'n hystyriaethau cyllidol.

If we look at the children who are most at risk, we have to look at key Assembly documents, such as 'Working Together to Safeguard Children' and the 'Framework for the Assessment of Children in Need and their Families'. 'Working Together' was published in September 2000 and it gives guidance to all agencies with child protection responsibilities on how they should work together to help families and, especially, children before abuse and neglect takes place. You are right to refer back to the Waterhouse report. We have to ensure that we all implement the Waterhouse recommendations and that we review the report to ensure that 'Working Together' is implemented at local level.

The new assessment framework document, which will be issued shortly, is important as it covers the full range of children in need, not just those at risk of abuse. It focuses on child development needs and how families can respond to them in the long and short term. I hope that we will discuss that in the Assembly. The document demonstrates the impact that various adult problems and needs, including domestic violence, have on many children in Wales and how adult concerns and what happens to children's parents impacts on children's development. The assessment framework recognises the link between domestic violence and child abuse.

You describe the appalling things that happen to children in families and how we must ensure that we have the means and procedures to enable support for children but also try to have a preventative approach to address important issues. We know that stress experienced by children has an impact on their lives, their opportunities, their ability to learn, their leisure and that it prevents them from growing up as we would want our children to grow up in Wales. We must encourage agencies and services to work together. Pauline is right to say that that goes back to how we integrate our policies in Wales. Integration is vital. I was impressed with the children's manifesto, published recently by all the voluntary sector agencies.

Os ystyriwn y plant sydd yn wynebu'r perygl mwyaf, rhaid inni edrych ar ddogfennau allweddol y Cynulliad, megis 'Gweithio ar y Cyd i Ddiogelu Plant' a'r 'Fframwaith ar gyfer Asesu Plant mewn Angen a'u Teuluoedd'. Cyhoeddwyd 'Gweithio ar y Cyd' ym Medi 2000 a rhydd ganllaw i bob asiantaeth sydd â chyfrifoldebau diogelu plant ar y ffordd y dylent gydweithio i helpu teuluoedd ac, yn enwedig, plant cyn iddynt gael eu cam-drin a'u hesgeuluso. Mae'n briodol eich bod yn cyfeirio yn ôl at adroddiad Waterhouse. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod pob un o honom yn gweithredu argymhellion Waterhouse a'n bod yn adolygu'r adroddiad i sicrhau y caiff argymhellion 'Gweithio ar y Cyd' eu gweithredu'n lleol.

Mae'r ddogfen fframwaith asesu newydd, a gaiff ei chyhoeddi cyn bo hir, yn bwysig gan ei bod yn cwmpasu amrywiaeth llawn plant mewn angen, nid yn unig y rheini sydd mewn perygl o gael eu cam-drin. Canolbwytia ar anghenion o ran datblygiad plant a sut y gall teuluoedd ymateb iddynt yn y tymor hir a'r tymor byr. Gobeithiaf y trafodwn hynny yn y Cynulliad. Dengys y ddogfen yr effaith a gaiff amrywiaeth o broblemau ac anghenion oedolion, gan gynnwys traís yn y cartref, ar lawer o blant yng Nghymru a'r effaith a gaiff pryderon oedolion a'r hyn sydd yn digwydd i rieni'r plant ar ddatblygiad y plant. Mae'r fframwaith asesu yn cydnabod y cysylltiad rhwng traís yn y cartref a cham-drin plant.

Disgrifiwch y pethau ofnadwy sydd yn digwydd i blant yn eu teuluoedd a sut y dylem sicrhau bod gennym y dulliau a'r gweithdrefnau i sicrhau cymorth i blant ond bod yn rhaid inni hefyd geisio mabwysiadu ymagwedd ataliol i ymdrin â materion pwysig. Gwyddom y caiff y stres a brofwyd gan blant effaith ar eu bywydau, eu cyfleoedd, eu gallu i ddysgu, eu hamser hamdden a'i fod yn eu rhwystro rhag tyfu yn y ffordd y byddem am i'n plant dyfu yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni annog asiantaethau a gwasanaethau i gydweithio. Mae Pauline yn gywir wrth ddweud bod hynny'n ymwneud yn y bôn â'r ffordd o integreiddio ein polisiau yng Nghymru. Mae integreiddio yn hanfodol. Gwnaeth y maniffesto plant, a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan bob un o asiantaethau'r

sector gwirfoddol, argraff arnaf.

On rural stress and what is happening at present, I met last week with the rural stress information service, Cytûn: Churches Together in Wales and the health and agriculture departments to consider the health and social care issues arising from the crisis in the countryside. I have asked the Chief Medical Officer and our officials in the social policy division to work on how to respond to the health and social care needs in our rural communities. In terms of rural stress information services, we have launched a helpline through the voluntary sector provider in Wrexham for the whole of Wales.

Ynglŷn â stres gwledig a'r hyn sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd, cefais gyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf â gwasanaeth gwybodaeth stres gwledig, Cytûn: Eglwysi Ynghyd yng Nghymru a'r adrannau iechyd ac amaethyddiaeth i ystyried y materion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol sydd yn deillio o'r argyfwng yng nghefn gwlad. Gofynnais i'r Prif Swyddog Meddygol a'n swyddogion yn yr is-adran polisi cymdeithasol ystyried sut i ymateb i anghenion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ein cymunedau gwledig. O ran y gwasanaethau gwybodaeth stres gwledig, lansiwyd llinell gymorth gennym drwy ddarparwr y sector gwirfoddol yn Wrecsam ar gyfer Cymru gyfan.

We will talk to the Children's Commissioner, who is closely in touch with children and young people, particularly about children's needs. If the Assembly is going to make a difference, it has to be in the lives of children of Wales. We have made a great start with the Children's Commissioner but I am pleased to announce today—we have only just agreed this—that the Cabinet has agreed to form a children's committee as a Cabinet committee. As Minister with responsibility for children and young people, I feel that I must have an inter-ministerial approach to ensure that we are integrating policies. It will be the first cross-cutting Cabinet committee in which all Ministers will have an interest. The First Minister will be a member of the committee and I will chair it. It will meet for the first time next week. I foresee that this will ensure that children's interests will be central to Assembly policy development. This will also help Assembly Committees and Members to monitor and identify how we are integrating, joining-up and realising the vision that we need for integrated services and meeting children's needs. It will respond to many of those challenges.

Siaradwn â'r Comisiynydd Plant, sydd mewn cysylltiad agos â phlant a phobl ifanc, yn arbennig anghenion plant. Os yw'r Cynulliad am wneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid i hyn ddigwydd ym mywydau plant Cymru. Dechreusom yn dda drwy benodi Comisiynydd Plant ond mae'n bleser gennyl gyhoeddi heddiw—yr ydym newydd gytuno ar hyn—fod y Cabinet wedi cytuno i ffurfio pwylgor plant fel pwylgor y Cabinet. Fel y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am blant a phobl ifanc, credaf fod yn rhaid imi gael ymagwedd ryngweinidogol i sierhau ein bod yn integreiddio polisiau. Y pwylgor hwn fydd y pwylgor trawsbynciol Cabinet cyntaf y bydd gan bob Gweinidog ddiddordeb ynnddo. Bydd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn aelod o'r pwylgor a minnau'n ei gadeirio. Bydd yn cyfarfod am y tro cyntaf yr wythnos nesaf. Rhagwelaf y bydd hyn yn sierhau bod buddiannau plant yn ganolog i waith datblygu polisiau'r Cynulliad. Bydd hyn hefyd yn helpu Pwyllgorau ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad i fonitro ac i nodi ym mha ffordd yr ydym yn integreiddio, cydlyn a chyflawni'r weledigaeth sydd ei hangen arnom ar gyfer gwasanaethau integredig ac er mwyn bodloni anghenion plant. Bydd yn ymateb i lawer o'r heriau hynny.

Thank you, Pauline. This is an important debate. I hope that you will see that it has influenced how I, as Minister with responsibility for children and young people, will take this forward.

Diolch, Pauline. Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig. Gobeithiaf y gwelwch ei bod wedi dylanwadu ar y ffordd y byddaf fi, fel y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am blant a phobl ifanc, yn datblygu hyn.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.51 p.m.  
The session ended at 12.51 p.m.*