



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd
The Sustainability Committee**

**Dydd Iau, 29 Tachwedd 2007
Thursday, 29 November 2007**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions
- 4 Ymchwiliad i Leihau Gollyngiadau Carbon yng Nghymru
Inquiry into Carbon Reduction in Wales

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Lorraine Barrett	Llafur Labour
Mick Bates	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Welsh Liberal Democrats (Committee Chair)
Alun Davies	Llafur Labour
Andrew R.T Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig (yn dirprwyo ar ran Brynle Williams) Welsh Conservatives (substitute for Brynle Williams)
Lesley Griffiths	Llafur Labour
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Karen Sinclair	Llafur Labour
Leanne Wood	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

David Blainey	Cynrychiolydd Cymdeithas Swyddogion Cydgysylltu Trafnidiaeth Gogledd Cymru Association of Transport Co-ordinating Officers North Wales Representative
Roderic Jenkins	Cadeirydd, Cymdeithas Swyddogion Cydgysylltu Trafnidiaeth Cymru Chair, Association of Transport Co-ordinating Officers Wales
Rhodri Jones	Is-gadeirydd, Cymdeithas Syrfewyr Sirol Cymru Vice-chair, County Surveyors Society (Wales)
Brian Kemp	Cadeirydd, Cymdeithas Syrfewyr Sirol Cymru Chair, County Surveyors Society (Wales)

Swyddogion Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn bresennol
Assembly Parliamentary Service officials in attendance

Joanne Clinton	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Dr Virginia Hawkins	Clerc Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 9.32 a.m.
The meeting began at 9.32 a.m.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Mick Bates:** Thank you for your attendance this morning. I have some housekeeping announcements to make. In the event of a fire alarm, you should leave the room by the fire exits. Follow the instructions from the ushers and staff. There is no fire alarm test planned for today. Please ensure that all mobile phones, pagers and BlackBerrys are switched off as they interfere with the broadcasting equipment. The National Assembly for Wales operates

through the media of Welsh and English. Headsets are provided, through which the simultaneous translation may be heard. For those who are hard of hearing, the headsets can also be used to amplify the sound. Translation can be heard on channel 1 and channel 0 is for amplification. Please do not touch the buttons on the microphones, as that can disable the system, and please ensure that the red light is on before you start to speak.

[2] As Members are aware, we have undertaken our first piece of scrutiny into carbon reduction, having completed our evidence sessions on carbon reduction from residential properties. At this point, I would like to say a word of praise for the *Western Mail*, which has, as I am sure many of you know, undertaken an environment week—

[3] **Alun Ffred Jones:** And it printed an article by you today.

[4] **Mick Bates:** Well done, Alun. It certainly has. Raising awareness is really important. The *South Wales Echo* did this a couple of weeks ago too. This is part of the process of us, as Members, and the Assembly as a whole raising awareness. As we have seen already, changing behaviour to reduce carbon emissions is an important factor. I love the picture from the paper on Tuesday about how we need to green our homes. There is an excellent article on that too. If anyone has not seen it, I suggest that you put together the whole package, because it is really useful.

[5] We have received apologies from Darren Millar this morning, who is representing the Assembly at the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association conference in Westminster, which is on climate change. Darren will make a report to the committee because he will prepare a report for the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association, and we will also lay that report as a committee.

[6] There are no other apologies this morning. Andrew R.T. Davies, who is held up in traffic at the moment is substituting for Brynle Williams.

9.35 a.m.

Ymchwiliad i Leihau Gollyngiadau Carbon yng Nghymru Inquiry into Carbon Reduction in Wales

[7] **Mick Bates:** This is in relation to carbon reduction in transport. It gives me great pleasure to welcome Brian Kemp and Rhodri Jones from County Surveyors Society Wales and, later, we will take evidence from the Association of Transport Co-ordinating Officers Wales. We have received your paper, which directs us to the four regional transport plans. Members have been given the priorities from those four transport plans. I invite you to give an introduction of up to three minutes on how you feel carbon reduction can be undertaken with regard to transport in Wales and then the Members will have a series of questions for you.

[8] **Mr Kemp:** Thank you for inviting us here. I will use my three minutes to explain who we are in the County Surveyors Society, why you do not have a paper from us as an organisation and why we are leaning on the regional consortia. The County Surveyors Society is a UK-wide organisation that was founded in 1885 following a meeting with the then county surveyor of Norfolk, when it was agreed that it was desirable for a county surveyor society to be formed in England and Wales for the purpose of watching over matters affecting the office of county surveyor. While we have generally lost the title of county surveyor across the UK, the purpose of the society has remained and we aspire to be one of the main advisers to Government on matters relating to transport and highway activities within the local authority area.

[9] Members of the society are the chief officers for highways and transportation in the local authorities and hence we provide the input to the regional transportation consortia in Wales, which is why I say that, in answering, we will be leaning heavily on the papers to which we have contributed. Rhodri and I are advisers to the Welsh Local Government Association; hence we have had some input into its paper. The danger that we in the society face is that, if we start to do things individually, we end up doing the same thing three times with three different names on it, so we tend to concentrate our individual efforts on areas where we think that there is an all-Wales perspective that is not covered in our other activities.

[10] I have probably had my three minutes. I commend you in particular to the South East Wales Transport Alliance presentation, which is a very comprehensive view of where we are going in the local authority world in terms of carbon reduction, and I invite questions on that subject.

[11] **Mick Bates:** Thank you. It was very useful to hear where your roots are. We appreciate your evidence, because it avoids duplication, as it appears that you are speaking on behalf of a great many people. I look forward to hearing your answers.

[12] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gredwch fod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad bwerau digonol dros faterion trafniadaeth i gyflawni system drafniadaeth gynaliadwy yng Nghymru? Os nad ydych yn credu hynny, pa bwerau ychwanegol sydd eu hangen arni?

Alun Ffred Jones: Do you believe that the Assembly Government has sufficient powers over transport matters to achieve a sustainable transport system in Wales? If not, what additional powers are required?

[13] **Mr Jones:** Yn ddiweddar iawn, yr ydym wedi dod ar draws papur gan Gyfeillion y Ddaear sy'n sôn am bartneriaeth rhwng y defnyddiwr, Llywodraeth a busnes. Yn ddefnyddiol iawn, mae'n gosod rôl llywodraeth leol yn y bartneriaeth honno.

Mr Jones: We have recently come across a paper by Friends of the Earth that talks about partnership between the user, Government and business. It usefully sets out the role of local government in that partnership.

9.40 a.m.

[14] O ran yr awgrym am rôl llywodraeth lleol, dylai fod o fewn y gymuned. Felly, os ydym yn edrych ar y cwlwm hwnnw o ran o ba gyfeiriad y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ddod, mae'r papur a gyflwynwyd gan Sewta yn sôn am ddiffygion amlwg yn yr hyn y gall y Cynulliad ei wneud i hwyluso'r gwaith a hwyluso'r broses o symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen. Mae sôn am y manau hynny lle mae deddfwriaeth benodol o du'r Cynulliad yn gallu bod o ddefnydd, ond mae gagedor hefyd mewn rhai manau, ac yr ydym yn sôn yn benodol am y diffygion hynny o ran newid y gyfundrefn dreth, er enghraifft.

In terms of the suggestion about local government's role, it should be a lead role within the community. So, if we look at those ties in terms of from which direction the Assembly Government should come, the paper presented by Sewta mentions obvious deficiencies in what the Assembly can do to facilitate the work and facilitate the process of moving this agenda forward. There is mention of those areas where specific legislation from the Assembly could be useful, but there are gaps in some areas, and we specifically mention those deficiencies in terms of changing the taxation system, for example.

[15] Mae hynny yn fan cychwyn amlwg, o ran y gallu i amrywio costau a'r hyn sy'n deillio o gost tanwydd, er enghraifft.

That is an obvious starting point, in terms of the ability to vary costs and what arises from the costs of fuel, for example. We are aware

Gwyddom am y newid diweddar yng nghost olew, ac yr ydym wedi clywed bod costau nwy a thrydan yn debygol o gynyddu'n ddychrynlyd eto yn ystod y flwyddyn sydd i ddod—yr ydym wedi clywed ffigurau o 24 a 36 y cant yn cael eu hawgrymu am y cynnydd hwnnw. Yr ydym hefyd yn ymwybodol am y sôn ynglŷn â chynnydd o 40 y cant mewn prisiau tocynnau trên. Felly, mae'r elfen dreth yn fan hynod bwysig i ddechrau'r drafodaeth hon. Bydd gallu neu anallu'r Cynulliad i bwysu a newid y gyfundrefn honno yn hanfodol i'r dyfodol a chreu'r hyn yr ydych yn dymuno ei weld.

of the recent change in oil prices, and we have heard that the cost of gas and electricity is likely to rise alarmingly in the year to come—we have heard figures of 24 and 36 per cent being suggested for that increase. We are also aware that train fares are likely to rise by 40 per cent. Therefore, the taxation element is a very important place to start this discussion. The Assembly's ability or inability to influence and change that system will be essential to the future and to realise your aspiration.

[16] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os wyf wedi deall eich ateb yn iawn, yr ydych yn awgrymu, heb bwerau yn y maes trafniadaeth, fod gallu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddylanwadu yn gyfyngedig. A yw hynny'n iawn?

Alun Ffred Jones: If I have understood your answer correctly, you are suggesting that, without powers over transport, the Assembly Government's ability to influence is limited? Is that right?

[17] **Mr Jones:** Byddwn yn cytuno gyda 'cyfyngedig'.

Mr Jones: I would agree with 'limited'.

[18] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn.

Alun Ffred Jones: Okay.

[19] What are your views on the proposals in the Local Transport Bill relating to road pricing and bus services, and the contribution that they can make to reducing carbon emissions?

[20] **Mr Kemp:** First of all, it is essential to understand the level at which transport contributes to emissions. In south-east Wales, which covers nearly half of the population of Wales, we make a contribution of 0.01 per cent to world carbon emissions. So, whatever we do will, globally, be a fairly small contribution, but that is not to say that we should not be doing something. There are very good reasons why we should do it, apart from the moral reasons. We cannot build our way out of our traffic and transportation problems; in putting schemes in place to deal with that, we will be contributing automatically to carbon reduction. We must also recognise that oil prices will inevitably continue to rise, which again points us towards dealing with transportation issues to reduce the use of oil, and hence carbon emissions. We must recognise that continuing to develop more private transport is not helping towards social inclusion, which we should be determined to tackle. While we will not make a massive contribution globally, it is an important way forward.

[21] The Welsh Assembly Government is doing much better than Her Majesty's Government across the UK in encouraging us to do that, but it is only a start and we need to develop these areas much more. In Wales, we have seen initiatives that have led to free travel for the elderly and the disabled, which is a massive start. Our colleagues in England said that that could never be done, but we have done it in Wales, and that is a major feather in our cap. However, as I said, that is only a start. We need to use the powers of the Government to encourage more sustainable transport, but we need also to recognise that sustainable transport is not a cheap option. It is not that we can say that because we are not going to build massive road schemes—I would argue that there are still road schemes that need to be built to fill some black holes—or that we cannot say, 'We will build no more road schemes; everyone will travel on public transport and we will save a lot of money as well as reducing carbon

emissions', as that is just not the way of the world. It is, initially, an expensive option to get people to change their mode of travel. We need to make public transport more effective, more efficient, more comfortable and more secure so that people are encouraged to use it. It has to be a mixture of carrot and stick; we cannot just pull the plug on private transport and say, 'Well, get on with it', because, at the moment, the public transport network is not there to enable people to use it—it needs to be developed.

[22] **Mick Bates:** You mentioned road building. Last week, we took evidence from Sustrans, whose representatives told us that it costs £30 million to build 1 mile of motorway. That is a lot of money. Their argument was that we could do many better things to reduce carbon emissions with that £30 million. Do you accept that figure and the logic behind that reasoning?

[23] **Mr Kemp:** It is of the right order. Each scheme will be different, depending on topography where you are trying to build a road, but it is probably that sort of figure. However, we have to recognise that there are certain black holes, which I referred to, and, coming from Newport, you would expect me to look at the new M4 as being one of those areas. Without certain road improvements, we are building congestion into our towns and cities, which in itself is detrimental to reducing carbon emissions.

[24] **Mick Bates:** But, generally, do you accept the figure of £30 million a mile?

[25] **Mr Kemp:** Generally, I accept that, yes.

[26] **Mick Bates:** Thank you, because Members will later be taking up the issue of Sustrans's view on this.

[27] **Karen Sinclair:** When will the final regional transport plans be published? Why has it taken longer than originally envisaged to produce these plans?

[28] **Mr Kemp:** There are several reasons for it. The initial reason was the delay in the production of the Wales transport strategy and the spatial plan, which are essential guidance documents for the regional transport plan. That is combined with the delay in producing the guidance on what the Welsh Assembly Government expected from the regional transport plans, which also delayed us initially. The latest delay, which leads us to believe that the draft plans will not be ready until the end of 2008, with the final plans ready in early 2009, is caused by a reduction in funding previously promised from the Welsh Assembly Government to allow the production of these plans.

[29] **Karen Sinclair:** Did you expect a significant difference in the spatial plan from last time? That is, in the update of the spatial plan.

[30] **Mr Kemp:** We did not expect a significant difference, but is important that we are working with up-to-date documents rather than ones that are some years old.

[31] **Karen Sinclair:** How should the Assembly Government fund local authorities' expenditure on transport once the regional transport plans are in place?

[32] **Mr Kemp:** I attended a working party about a fortnight ago with the Welsh Local Government Association and Transport Wales to specifically look at this subject—we have an ongoing working party looking at funding. At the moment, there is quite a variety of different funding streams coming from the Welsh Assembly Government towards local authorities, some of which are rate support grant, and some as specific grants for specific activities—there is the general transport grant, which we bid for in terms of specific schemes. It is felt that there is a much more efficient way of dealing with that by trying to put all the funding

streams together to allow a little more flexibility, both in terms of the Welsh Assembly Government as the provider, and the local authority as the recipient, in how it uses that money.

9.50 a.m.

[33] We are addressing the fundamental question of the regional consortia's role in this. At the moment, it is a voluntary collaboration between local authorities to try to deliver on strategic and regional transportation issues, so it is right that the consortia have a role in deciding where and how the money is spent. However, at the moment, they are not employer organisations—they do not have their own technical staff to work up schemes and deliver on the ground, so it then falls to the local authorities to deliver the schemes. Certainly, in Sewta, we have had a great deal of success in getting the local authorities to sit down and draw up pragmatic priority lists, which has inevitably meant that some local authorities have missed out on expenditure in certain years, with the majority of the money going to others. However, I have been impressed with the way that our local politicians and officers have been able to get together, look at the bigger picture, and determine what needs to be done. So, I think that there are better ways of funding for the future, at least partly through the regional consortia, and the Welsh Assembly Government can then have confidence that that money will be spent wisely.

[34] **Karen Sinclair:** You were talking about a pooling of the general transport grant with other grants, so that it comes down to each local authority as a bigger sum of money, and they can use it to set priorities. However, there is surely a danger that if each local authority prioritised differently, you would find it difficult to take a regional, joined-up look at things. Do you not envisage that being a problem? You spoke about chief officers not wanting to talk to one another, but there are a lot more issues at play than just that one.

[35] **Mr Kemp:** Yes, there are. Again, leaning on my Sewta experience, we have a two-tier system. There is the directorate of Sewta, which is made up of the chief officers, and sitting above them is the Sewta board, on which each of the 10 authorities has two executive members. It is that board that makes the final decision on the priority lists. If we are to move to pooling resources in a more holistic way, then I am sure that the Welsh Assembly Government would want to have some input into how those priorities are determined. At the moment there is a system known as WelTAG—the Welsh transport planning and appraisal guidance—which allows you to look at schemes and compare them against certain criteria that have been laid down by the Assembly Government, and you check the priorities that have been given to schemes by that method. We have some issues with the WelTAG system, not least that carbon reduction is fairly low down on its list of priorities, so I think that it does need looking at in the longer term, but at least it is there as an initial safeguard that can be developed.

[36] **Lorraine Barrett:** The former Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks launched a new best-practice document entitled 'Smarter Choices: Wales' earlier this year. Can you say something about the emphasis that is being put on that in the regional transport plans, and what funding is available to implement those techniques?

[37] **Mr Kemp:** I think that I partly answered that question in my last reply—we are looking at having a more robust method of comparing schemes to ensure that when we do decide to spend money, it is fully justified in a way that will be comparable across the whole of Wales, and not just within the consortium. Also, we have partly addressed that in the area of highway maintenance, because in developing the asset management plans on an all-Wales basis, we are now in a position, in conjunction with Transport Wales within the Welsh Assembly Government, to look at all the proposed maintenance schemes and see which should receive the priority. So, in terms of 'Smarter Choices: Wales' and ensuring that we are

spending the money where it is most needed, we are taking giant strides in Wales and, in this area, we are ahead of our neighbours in England in pressing it forward. There is certainly a different view there regarding regional transport plans and the way that the highway maintenance backlog should be dealt with.

[38] **Mr Jones:** In the context of the way that the regional transport plans are seeking to address the Wales transport Act issues in terms of the three headings of social, economic and environmental outcomes. On a regional basis, that is the way the regional transport plans are presented but we are imposing that sort of regime in each local authority and are trying to look holistically at creating those opportunities that come via working with health, for instance, in terms of accessing care, services and leisure facilities. Implicit in the way that we currently work is our trying to integrate those opportunities. In relation to the question that Karen Sinclair asked about funding aspects, we are, through those funding regimes, capable of developing walking and cycling strategies, which will make it somewhat more beneficial to access those sorts of facilities in certain of our town centres. By also seeking to create pedestrianised areas in our town centres, we are addressing needs in those areas, as we are making it a much more pleasant environment for people to walk in. We are exchanging vehicle space for pedestrian space and that is part and parcel of the model that is implicit in the smarter choices aspect.

[39] **Lorraine Barrett:** On the papers that you have provided from the various bodies detailing their draft regional transport plans, do you feel that the emphasis on environmental improvements and climate change, that sort of heading, is not as upfront as it should be? Sewta's paper is pretty good; it talks a lot about walking, healthier lifestyles, public transport and so on, which will obviously benefit the environment and cut down on emissions, but perhaps there should be an overarching heading for all of them to say that the main objective of the plans is to reduce carbon emissions, to improve the environmental situation. Is that a fair criticism?

[40] **Mr Kemp:** At this point in time, it would be difficult to say that that was the main objective of the regional transport plans. It is certainly a very important objective, but we are looking towards economic development in Wales, and south-east Wales in particular, and there is a relationship, albeit not a direct one, between economic development and traffic growth, unfortunately. So, yes, we ought to be moving more and more towards raising the importance of the environment but, at this stage, in dealing with this round of regional transport plans, we are not in a position to say that that is the most important thing and that everything should look towards that; we have to be looking towards other issues too.

[41] **Lorraine Barrett:** Do you not think that this is the last-chance saloon, though? If we do not get it in this round, this time, in 10 years' time it will be almost too late.

[42] **Mr Kemp:** If you are talking about a 10-year period, then perhaps you will be beginning to get to the stage where it is too late, but these are living documents that are going to be developing all the time and, as I said earlier, the environment is going to be a growing aspect, whereas other aspects in the regional transport plans, such as road building and economic development, generating more private traffic, will gradually reduce in importance. However, we are never going to get away from the need to maintain our highway system because, at the end of the day, buses run on roads and we have to keep those available.

10.00 a.m.

[43] **Mr Jones:** Some of the tensions come from this issue of balancing the economy with the environment. The comment made earlier about the second M4 has a bearing in terms of its impact on the economy of south Wales as opposed to its impact on the environment of south Wales. I know that there has been some concern about the Sewta support for the second M4.

The current M4 needs to be maintained, some major maintenance work is required—I know that it is not a local-authority concern; the Assembly itself is the highway authority in that context—and we are aware of the impact that such major maintenance work would have. It is from that perspective—the impact that future maintenance would have on the economy of south Wales—that the Sewta support has been forthcoming.

[44] **Lorraine Barrett:** What are the local authorities doing to achieve the necessary changes in behaviour in relation to smarter choices?

[45] **Mr Jones:** I have mentioned the balance of all aspects. Brian has also referred to some of the things, such as concessionary fares, that we are administering on behalf of the Assembly Government. We are doing our utmost to put in place adequate cycle tracks and to prepare and present a better walking environment and so on. That is purely the transport aspect, but we are doing far more than that.

[46] To mention highway maintenance again, we know that there is a tremendous backlog of highway maintenance across the whole of Wales, and what we are doing is recycling a tremendous amount of waste from highway planning and so on. In Bridgend, the other day, we won an award from Sustainable Wales for the amount of recycling that we have done in that domain. We are reusing somewhere between 93 per cent and 97 per cent of all highway arisings. So, there is a contribution from that perspective.

[47] There is also a contribution from the street-lighting aspect. We are moving into a different domain in terms of using low-energy light bulbs and so on. Although these things may be considered to be small contributors in themselves, when you put them all together in one basket, you can see that we are certainly trying our utmost to make a difference to this agenda. We are aware of our responsibilities. We all have responsibilities as individuals and we certainly try to practise in our homes. As an authority, we try to be an exemplar and show others what the introduction of green travel plans can do in terms of county council staff and then seek to impose such things, as much as possible, as part of planning consents for major developments. They are all small elements in themselves, but I am sure that when you look at the canvas, we are doing a reasonable amount to address this agenda.

[48] **Mr Kemp:** I think that because of the differences that local authorities experience across Wales, each of them will be addressing this in different ways. For example, 70 per cent of all rail travel in Wales occurs in south-east Wales, so that presents an opportunity for Sewta to attack rail problems, whereas the other three regions may not feel that it is something that they could usefully do.

[49] **Mick Bates:** If I may draw a line under that for the moment, I think that we got the point about changing behaviour. Only this week, the Confederation of British Industry published its report on climate change, which is very encouraging, because it called it ‘Climate Change: Everyone’s Business’. I was pleased to hear that.

[50] I will now move on to Lesley, who has a question about the predict-and-provide approach.

[51] **Lesley Griffiths:** As the Chair mentioned, we took evidence from Sustrans last week, and one view expressed was that transport planning in Wales is still far too reliant on the predict-and-provide approach. What are your views on that?

[52] **Mr Kemp:** We abandoned the predict-and-provide approach four or five years ago, but, inevitably, major transportation and highway schemes are a long time in their generation and fulfilment. So, you are still seeing schemes coming through that had their beginnings in the predict-and-provide system, and I think that that will continue to be the case for a few

years yet. However, they will be coming through less and less and our major initiatives now do not bear any relation to that system in road building terms, but that is not the case in measuring the need for travel and trying to find a sustainable way of dealing with it. I think that that is most laudable on behalf of the local authorities. However, for some time now, we have not tried to look at building our way out of traffic congestion, which is usually what is meant by predict and provide.

[53] **Mr Jones:** It is true to say that the predict-and-provide model that we currently seek to move towards is in order to make better use of the current networks. So, that is our challenge. We know that the funding for new build, as Brian said, is no longer there, but it is about making better use of the network that we have. However, it is important for us to be able to maintain that network, which brings me back to funding for highway maintenance. We are facing a tremendous backlog and this also has to be part and parcel of the solution.

[54] **Lesley Griffiths:** How do you feel the Assembly Government's transport appraisal system—the Welsh transport appraisal guidelines—takes account of the carbon impact of transport schemes? I think that I know how you will answer that, Brian, because you just said that you thought that it was fairly low down on the list of priorities.

[55] **Mr Kemp:** Yes, it is. The Welsh transport planning and appraisal guidance provides a framework for assessing schemes, but carbon reduction is too far down the list. As your colleague said, we are moving towards the stage where it will be too late, and we now need to start to consider that. The schemes running through WelTAG in the next 12 to 18 months will be schemes that come to fruition in four to five years' time, so now is the time to raise the profile of carbon reduction in that sort of assessment procedure.

[56] **Lesley Griffiths:** You do not think that that is happening.

[57] **Mr Kemp:** It is not happening at the moment. WelTAG is what it is. It is laid down and I believe that carbon reduction is too low down on the priority list in that assessment technique.

[58] **Karen Sinclair:** I just wanted to explore that point. I accept what you say in that it is low on the Welsh Assembly Government's priority list and you are waiting for it to be reprioritised, but how proactive are you in pushing for that and saying that it has to be included? It is one thing to be the recipient of wisdom, but how much are you feeding into the process of creating wisdom?

[59] **Mr Kemp:** We have expressed strong reservations at our meetings with the civil servants in Transport Wales about the efficacy of WelTAG as an assessment tool. We think that it could be developed a lot more. At the moment, it is their tool and they want to promote it as being the all-Wales prioritisation tool. We are largely in their hands, but we will continue to press for a better tool or at least for that to be changed to better suit the needs of local authorities and the people of Wales.

[60] **Alun Davies:** I want to explore the relationship between your work and the spatial planning that takes place. Could you describe how transport planning and land-use planning is co-ordinated at local authority and at regional level?

[61] **Mr Kemp:** Yes. At a local authority level, our land-use planning would largely be led by the planning and economic regeneration departments, but, as technical highway departments, we have a strong feed into that. At the lowest level, it is through placing comments on planning applications, but we also have a strong input into council policies that are developing in planning guidance and so on. I am afraid that I am old enough to remember those halcyon days when highway engineers used to be able to direct planners on planning

applications, but that does not happen anymore.

[62] At a regional level, the boundaries of the regional transport consortia coincide with those of the planning fora. There is a close relationship and there are regular liaison meetings between the two fora to ensure that we work together.

10.10 a.m.

[63] **Mr Jones:** To add to that, Chair, in the context of developing a strategic highway network for the region, in our previous local plans, as individual local authorities, we have identified strategic highways, but, as part of the regional transport plan domain, we are now moving towards that being translated into the local development plans that we are also developing and also the links into the spatial plan. We must recognise that some areas are not the same, such as the spatial plan and regional transport plan areas; nevertheless, they are a means of placing a different emphasis—or perhaps a re-emphasis, where necessary—on where the strategic transport network and corridors are.

[64] I am conscious of the fact that we have not really mentioned the rail or the bus industry, but they are an integral part of Sewta, from their attendance at meetings to their involvement in producing rail strategies and so on. So, they are very much an integral part of Sewta. There is an holistic approach taken to the interchanges needed between different forms of transport. That is strategic decision-making in land use, in the development of the spatial plan, employment sites, waste sites—and waste is a big problem for us in Wales, as you are aware—and links to the main tourism areas, and so on. So, it is an integral part.

[65] **Alun Davies:** Are you confident that these structures are effective, and that they work?

[66] **Mr Jones:** I think that it is still early days in this context. We are talking about new concepts. In south-east Wales, there are 10 local authorities working together, and they have been since 1996. That is where we are with that. Going back to an earlier answer, the capacity and willingness to prioritise is an indication of movement and progress.

[67] **Alun Davies:** As someone from the south west and mid Wales, I might take a different perspective, but we will not follow that road now. Do you believe that the work of the Wales spatial plan area groups feeds effectively into regional transport planning?

[68] **Mr Kemp:** I think that it is beginning to. In answer to the earlier question about why there are delays, I mentioned that I did not think that the spatial plan was available to us when we were setting up the regional consortia. At that stage, we were working a little blindly in relation to the spatial plan. As it has been developed, it has become more of a tool that we use to establish our strategies and priorities.

[69] **Mr Jones:** The link between regional transport consortia is important, because transport does not stop at Sewta's border, to the west of Bridgend, or at SWITCH's border, at the eastern extremity of Neath Port Talbot. There is a mechanism to ensure integration both within and outside a region, at its boundaries.

[70] **Alun Davies:** Those boundaries are quite important from my perspective, because some significant communities may be located at the extremities of a region. I have a feeling that some of these communities are not always well served, as they may be within the travel-to-work or social areas of a different region. I am concerned about the relationship and interplay between the different regional consortia.

[71] **Mr Kemp:** We recognise that as an issue, and we hold regular liaison sessions with

the consortia, particularly SWITCH and Sewta, but, as TraCC develops more, it will also be of interest to us in south-east Wales. There are communities towards the southern edge of TraCC's boundary—and Brecon is an obvious example—which rely largely on the transport infrastructure provided by the south-east and south-west Wales consortia for their services.

[72] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Following on from Alun's point, and this may be slightly more provocative, can you give me one example of where the Wales spatial plan has influenced a decision on transport? I am thinking about this relationship between where people live and where they work, and the problems associated with that. The A470 is gridlocked morning and evening coming in and out of Cardiff, so what do we do about that? Stuart Cole was here last week, and he mentioned a huge housing development to the north west of Cardiff, around Llantrisant, where there is no rail link, no work, no shops, and yet 5,000 houses are being built there. So, where is the planning?

[73] **Mr Kemp:** I will tackle the last question first, because it is an important one. Developers are looking towards developing their houses, as there is a tremendous uplift in the value of land once you get planning permission for its residential development. However, as a highway engineer, I would say that you cannot plan residential developments—or any sort of development—without taking account of transportation at the beginning and making it an integral part of the development.

[74] **Alun Ffred Jones:** But it is happening.

[75] **Mr Kemp:** It is happening. One particular example is the redevelopment of the Llanwern steel works in my local authority, where we have taken on board the transportation issues. As part of that development, we will be providing an additional link from junction 23 of the M4 through to the Newport southern distributor road, thereby relieving congestion at junction 24, which is one of our particular hotspots. We will also be providing a bus and rail-based park-and-ride facility on the site, a new link over the railway to link two communities that have to date been severed by the railway, as well as residential and commercial development in close proximity to reduce people's need to travel, should they wish to take advantage of it. Therefore, in spatial planning terms, we are putting all those things together.

[76] The difficulty that we have, and Rhodri has mentioned it on two or three occasions in his answers, is finance. The finance to do these things will come from the developers, under section 106 agreements, to a large extent, and it then becomes a matter of negotiation as to how much can be squeezed out of the developers' profits to put back into the community.

[77] **Mick Bates:** The question asked for a direct example of how the spatial planning process figured in your work as county surveyors in regional planning.

[78] **Mr Kemp:** The Llanwern steel works site is a specific example.

[79] **Mr Jones:** While the spatial plan is still very much in its infancy, in that we do not have the final plans in place, it is nevertheless impacting on our thought process. I am a civil engineer, and I was brought up in the 1970s and have worked on motorway building—I worked on the M4 between Miskin and Pencoed. I am certainly aware of the change in philosophy, if you like, of the design concepts, and certainly the environmental issues and impacts associated with highway design and highway build since that time. Therefore, it is an evolutionary approach, and the concepts and the notions of trying to ensure that employment sites are located where people can travel there by public transport, as well as near housing sites, are important.

[80] Therefore, that sort of thought process is very much at the forefront of where local authorities are at present. I am afraid that I cannot think of a particular example near Pen-y-

groes, or near Tan-yr-allt, to quote to Alun, but if I think of one in the intervening period I will let him know.

[81] **Mick Bates:** I am sure that we could continue this for a long time looking for examples. However, I will finish this session now, because we have other witnesses waiting. I thank you both very much for your evidence. I am sure that the whole committee would encourage you to use your influence to ensure that WelTAG places a bigger emphasis on including carbon reduction in any appraisal.

[82] Welcome, Andrew. We are waiting for the new witnesses to arrive.

10.20 a.m.

[83] **Karen Sinclair:** Can I just say—[*Inaudible.*].

[84] **Mick Bates:** Thank you, Karen. You have made a valuable point. Remember that planning and industry are part of the carbon reduction inquiry. Therefore, when we take evidence from witnesses about planning, we can make that point.

[85] We move now to evidence from the Association of Transport Co-ordinating Officers, which represents local authorities, dealing with the promotion and procurement of public transport, the co-ordination of all modes of travel, including school transport, social services and health transport, and the development of sustainable forms of travel. I am certain, as I welcome you to the committee, that you will be aware that we are undertaking an inquiry into carbon reduction in Wales. The inquiry is split into six sections, and we are currently taking evidence on how the Assembly Government can best reduce carbon emissions from transport, hence your invitation to come here this morning. I welcome David Blainey and Roderic Jenkins to the committee. Please give a brief introduction of about three minutes, after which there will be questions from Members.

[86] **Mr Jenkins:** I am Roderic Jenkins. I am the chairman of ATCO Wales, and I have brought along a colleague from north Wales, David Blainey, who helped to prepare the evidence for this committee. ATCO Cymru represents those in local government in Wales responsible for the provision, promotion and co-ordination of passenger transport services. We are one of the constituent geographical parts of ATCO UK. Our membership comprises and is limited to a small number of key officers in each authority. We have been around since 1974; our creation coincided with local government reorganisation then, and we have worked closely with the National Assembly for Wales since its inception. We also work closely with the Welsh Local Government Association, the Confederation of Passenger Transport and the County Surveyors' Society.

[87] We are very grateful and pleased to be given the opportunity to help with this inquiry. As transport professionals, we see ourselves as having the expertise to provide the necessary proposals to help you achieve significant carbon reductions. My colleague David will now briefly describe the detail of our proposals, as referenced in the submission that you received. Much of that detail will provide answers and ideas for further thought with regard to the consultation questions that you put to us.

[88] **Mick Bates:** Thank you very much. We have received the excellent paper, and I am sure that, as we read it, we all tried to identify what type of car driver we were. As it is an excellent paper, please take only about a minute on the detail, as we have many questions.

[89] **Mr Blainey:** I do not think that I need to say anything. You have the paper; ATCO recognises the need to address seriously the issue of carbon reduction, on which we have done some work ourselves. We are happy to answer questions.

[90] **Mick Bates:** The paper was excellent, particularly in directing us to carbon emissions savings.

[91] **Alun Davies:** I enjoyed reading your paper. I wish to start with a few basic principles and discuss whether you believe that the Welsh Assembly Government currently has sufficient powers over transport matters to enable it to achieve a sustainable transport system in Wales.

[92] **Mr Jenkins:** I believe that the existing powers are present. One point that ATCO made in its response to the Local Transport Bill consultation is that, as the Department for Transport is currently reviewing the bus service operators' grant, local authorities would be in a stronger position to administer that grant. That grant is currently paid to operators on a mileage basis only. It is not linked to anything environmental, but it could be linked to carbon reduction, increased patronage and a whole variety of measures that could be contained in the regional transport plan. That funding stream is already present, and we are arguing that the local authorities are best placed to administer it. That would mean that they would have that funding stream in addition to the local transport services grant from the Welsh Assembly Government and the funding that comes through the supplementary spending assessment.

[93] I have mentioned in the paper that ATCO is well aware that the standard spending assessment funding is unhypothecated—it is not ring fenced—and that each authority's allocation is not necessarily spent on public transport; it is generally taken by other big-spending departments, such as education and social services. I appreciate the fact that authorities like to have the flexibility to manage their finances, but I think that if it were handled sensitively, some focus could be put on that. There is funding that is allocated for passenger transport that is not utilised for that currently. Those are the two funding streams that we feel would help to achieve many of the proposals that we have listed in our paper.

[94] **Mr Blainey:** Just to add to that, I think that many powers are already available; we just need to look at ways in which they can be used. The Local Transport Bill can give further powers and, within our submission, we include ATCO's response to the Bill, which explains how what is contained in the Bill can be developed within Wales to enable the sort of things that we have said need to be done to take place. We are also moving towards having a new funding regime with the Wales transport strategy and the regional transport plans, and there needs to be an emphasis in those on using the powers that are available to support what we call smarter choices.

[95] **Alun Davies:** Do you think that the Assembly Government requires additional powers in order to deliver on its stated objective of creating a sustainable transport system across Wales?

[96] **Mr Jenkins:** I believe that the powers that it already has can be utilised towards that objective, largely.

[97] **Alun Davies:** You do not believe that they are being fully utilised at the moment.

[98] **Mr Jenkins:** I certainly do not.

[99] **Alun Davies:** Can you give us an example of where they are not being utilised?

[100] **Mr Jenkins:** The glaringly obvious example, which I have already alluded to, is the funding allocated for passenger transport use within the standard spending assessment.

[101] **Alun Davies:** Could you give us an example other than that on funding streams?

[102] **Mr Blainey:** The powers are available to help support better bus services, the introduction of walking and cycling routes, and so on—those powers are in place. Perhaps the Assembly needs more powers to integrate and co-ordinate bus services. There is obviously a debate about regulation and so on, but, currently, it can be difficult for services to be co-ordinated so that passengers have the best services possible because operators can cherry pick routes. The Assembly does not have the powers to ensure that links between buses and trains are as good as they could be.

[103] **Alun Davies:** Do you think that those additional powers are important to sustainable transport?

[104] **Mr Blainey:** Yes.

10.30 a.m.

[105] **Mr Jenkins:** Just to add that briefly, ATCO is arguing in its detailed response to the Local Transport Bill that we should have a much closer working relationship with the traffic commissioner for south Wales. We should be able to liaise with regard to registrations for local bus services and we are arguing that the commissioner should have the power to refuse local bus registrations that undermine a local bus partnership. So we feel that that link with the licensing authority is important as an area that could be improved.

[106] **Alun Davies:** In terms of the Local Transport Bill, do you believe that it gives sufficient powers to local authorities to ensure that bus services—you may be able to answer part of this question—can make a greater contribution to reducing carbon emissions than is presently achievable?

[107] **Mr Blainey:** Yes, I think that if the powers in the Local Transport Bill in relation to quality partnerships and quality contracts are used effectively, that can make a difference. We have made the case for what we call tender network zones in areas outside the major cities, and we feel that local authorities should be able to co-ordinate the whole network in partnership with commercial operators. We believe that the Local Transport Bill would give us the powers to do that.

[108] **Mick Bates:** Karen, do you want to pursue this issue of bus operators?

[109] **Karen Sinclair:** I think that the witnesses have more or less covered that. The only question that I have around that is that each local authority may be operating its own grant. Therefore, how would you envisage, or would you envisage, it always being the case that local authorities work harmoniously side by side in order to join it up?

[110] **Mr Blainey:** There is always a risk that we might fall out, but the experience to date is that we do work together. We have the regional consortia but even outside that cross-boundary services are jointly supported and we have always agreed together on how those are funded and how that should work.

[111] **Lesley Griffiths:** Last month, the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport announced that, over this Assembly, £350 million will be spent on improving the trunk road system. What are your views on that programme?

[112] **Mr Jenkins:** That is a good question. The Association of Transport Co-ordinating Officers is supportive of that and endorses the view, if you like, that you can make significant passenger transport improvements, increase patronage, influence modal transfer and so on, and do everything that will ultimately reduce carbon, without significant investment and we

have tried to illustrate that in our evidence, and in our support for the smarter choices agenda, which illustrates that you can influence people's travel behaviour without huge capital schemes. You can influence behaviour by marketing, by changing bus frequencies and routes and with fairly small-scale schemes in terms of investment, such as cycle ways, so we do not subscribe to the view that road improvements of the scale supported by, dare I say it, the CSS are necessarily the way forward.

[113] **Mr Blainey:** How funding is allocated is a major challenge. We would say that big benefits can be gained from much smaller levels of funding. For example, we have just had a study completed into creating a cycle way on the old railway line from Mold to Chester, which would create 12 miles of off-road cycle and walking way, linking into major employment sites, for about £8 million. The challenge is establishing the best way of using what are scarce resources.

[114] **Karen Sinclair:** Do you envisage that people will walk 12 miles from Mold to Chester in the morning?

[115] **Mr Blainey:** No, but people will cycle 2 miles to work at county hall in Mold, and they will cycle 2 miles to work at Airbus. It is a long link, but it can be used in small sections.

[116] **Lesley Griffiths:** How do you feel that the Welsh transport appraisal guidance takes account of the carbon impact of transport schemes?

[117] **Mr Blainey:** It is something that we are only just beginning to use in Taith, but, having gone through stage 1 of it, it does take account of it.

[118] **Lesley Griffiths:** Do you think that it is high enough on the list of priorities?

[119] **Mr Blainey:** Yes.

[120] **Mick Bates:** On that point, we have previously heard that the WelTAG does not place enough emphasis on looking at how we can reduce carbon, but you are saying that it is perfectly adequate.

[121] **Mr Jenkins:** Are we talking about the targets being proportionate to the impact that transport has?

[122] **Mick Bates:** Yes.

[123] **Mr Jenkins:** I think that the answer to that is that the targets have to be proportionate to the damage or effect that transport has; I am not in a position to say whether that should be 3 or 5 per cent per year.

[124] **Mick Bates:** I take your point on that, but, given that there is a commitment by the UK Government through the Climate Change Bill and by the Assembly Government to make a 3 per cent reduction, one could argue about how that is apportioned to various sections, but the fundamental point is that you are satisfied. However, in terms of carbon appraisal, is the WelTAG guidance satisfactory?

[125] **Mr Blainey:** I did qualify my answer by saying that it is something that I am only starting to be involved in, but that is my impression at the moment.

[126] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** I have a supplementary to Lesley's question. What are your views on the forward trunk road programme of £350 million? I take it from your answer that you are not very impressed by it, and that you see it as a poor spend.

[127] **Mr Jenkins:** I am concerned about the balance of spending in terms of public transport in contrast to road building. ATCO has frequently made the point that the balance in Scotland, for example, is more appropriate. The priority there, in terms of the funding allocated, is for public transport, and we would like to see a similar ratio adopted by the National Assembly.

[128] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Can you give me a feel for that ratio?

[129] **Mr Jenkins:** Correct me if I am wrong, but is it 70:30, or 70 per cent for public transport, in the Scottish Parliament? It is the direct opposite for the National Assembly.

[130] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** So, it is a complete about face from what it is in Scotland?

[131] **Mr Jenkins:** Yes, that is my understanding.

[132] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** That clears that up; thank you. When the road transport plans are presented, the wish list will have a cost implication, and local authorities will be looking to be funded on that cost implication. What is the best way for the Welsh Assembly Government to help to facilitate that funding?

[133] **Mr Jenkins:** That is a good question.

[134] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** It is about where the Welsh Assembly Government will help local authorities to fund the wish list that is contained in the regional transport plans.

[135] **Mr Blainey:** We will continue to require capital funding in the way that the transport grant has previously funded transport schemes. So, we will still be looking for capital money. We need to make as much use as possible of European funding. We need to look at how revenue funding streams, such as the bus service operators' grant and the local transport services grant, are targeted. We also need to be inventive in how we use developer funding. In north-east Wales, there are massive developments going on, and we need to ensure that the developers pay to deal with the problems that arise from people trying to access those developments.

10.40 a.m.

[136] **Mick Bates:** If you wish to add to the evidence that you have given today, you can write to us.

[137] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** What about the opportunity in the Local Transport Bill to transfer powers for trunk-road charging? Do you see potential in that to provide a greater income stream?

[138] **Mr Blainey:** Yes. ATCO does support road-user charging, with the proceeds going to smarter choices, such as cycling, walking and public transport.

[139] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Do you support it in the context of isolation for Wales, rather than it happening over the border in England? The proposal is not that it should happen in England.

[140] **Mr Blainey:** We would support—

[141] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** You are quite happy for Wales to go it alone, are you?

[142] **Mr Jenkins:** ATCO has always supported road pricing as one of several measures. The important point, as David mentioned, is that proceeds would be ring-fenced for passenger transport improvements, as opposed to spending it elsewhere.

[143] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** As I understand it, they are not ring-fenced—but that is by the by.

[144] With the sustainable travel towns initiative coming to the four regions, how do you see that being best used to pilot sustainable transport? We have the evidence from England, as it has happened there, but how extensively, do you think, should that pilot scheme be used in Wales before we actually get going on it?

[145] **Mr Blainey:** We say in our evidence that we support the creation of four pilot schemes. There is a concern—we have the evidence from England, and if we then take two or three years in waiting to see the results of the pilot schemes, that is two or three years when we could have been spreading it over a wider area. So, we support it as something that needs to be done, but we are concerned that it may delay funding beyond those four pilot schemes.

[146] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Would I be right in thinking that you will not find fundamental differences between the pilot scheme towns in Wales and the pilot scheme towns in England? The evidence is already there really, is it not?

[147] **Mr Blainey:** The only difference may be that the towns in Wales will be smaller. Darlington, Worcester and Peterborough are fairly large places. There are not many towns of a similar size in Wales, so you could say that it might be different in a small town, but I think that the results would be similar.

[148] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** The principle is the same, is it?

[149] **Mr Blainey:** Yes.

[150] **Lorraine Barrett:** As others have said, this is a very useful paper. I will take it to the commission, as I am the commissioner for the sustainable Assembly. There are many things in this paper that we can use in looking at our modes of transport and how staff and Members get to work. I am somewhere between the malcontent motorist and the diehard driver—I enjoy the convenience of driving a car, but I do feel guilty and, although I would like to change, I cannot quite do that just yet. However, when the barrage road is open, I shall walk to work.

[151] The Commission for Integrated Transport has suggested that significant carbon reduction could be achieved in Wales were the Welsh Assembly Government to promote eco-driving. Do you have any views on that?

[152] **Mr Jenkins:** It is funny; I was reading a report by the RAC yesterday in which it referred, among its conclusions, to its support for eco-driving. That was the first time that I came across the expression. I can only imagine that it is suggesting that we drive in an environmentally friendly way in terms of speed, braking and so forth. Naturally, ATCO would always support such a measure, particularly as it means that one would not be breaking the law.

[153] **Lorraine Barrett:** That is fine.

[154] **Mr Blainey:** A lot of this comes down to education. Certainly, I had not heard the name before. Many people want to do something, and that may be something that they feel able to do, so we would support it.

[155] **Mick Bates:** We are going to hear more evidence about it. It is already implemented in Holland, for example, and possibly in other countries. You mention Lynn Sloman in your paper; she brought it to our attention last week.

[156] **Leanne Wood:** In the paper, you list a number of measures that would be smarter choices. What would be the most cost-effective of those measures?

[157] **Mr Jones:** David might want to add something, or possibly contradict me, but I would suggest that marketing is probably the most cost-effective in the kind of results that you obtain. Research has shown that one of the largest obstacles is ignorance about what is available, or the assumption that there is not anything available. So, marketing is certainly an area that can be improved. What tends to happen is that local authorities receive their funding, and the political decision is always to put that into services; you spend less on publicity and marketing than you would like, because the pressure is to provide a service in Abertillery after 6 p.m. from Monday to Friday. You can spend £10,000 to £20,000 on marketing and publicity per authority, but there is always that conflict.

[158] **Leanne Wood:** Sustrans came to present evidence to us last week, and argued that there was no financial reward at present for local authorities to build dedicated paths and cycle ways. Do you support that argument?

[159] **Mr Jenkins:** Is Sustrans saying that there is no financial reward?

[160] **Leanne Wood:** Yes.

[161] **Mr Jenkins:** I am not aware that there is a reward or an incentive—

[162] **Leanne Wood:** Sustrans said that there was not, but would you say that there should be?

[163] **Mr Jenkins:** Sorry—I thought you were asking whether I agreed with the statement. I think that there should be, though it is easy for me to say that there should be an incentive for authorities to take these options as opposed to the orthodox, conventional approach to road building. So, yes, I would agree that there should be incentives.

[164] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Just briefly, this is the second time in your evidence that you have touched upon marketing, and I concur entirely that information is crucial in making that change. I understand that Transport for London spends £30 million per year on its information and marketing campaign. Have we got a figure for what is spent in Wales by local authorities? Is there a meaningful campaign in Wales, or is it ad hoc, with no figure out there?

[165] **Mr Blainey:** It is something that we could find out from our ATCO network. We could quite easily find out what each authority is spending, and then let you have that information. However, the money spent on marketing and information tends to be anything that is left over, rather than a core spend—we tend to assume that everybody knows how to use the bus, and what buses are available. Yesterday, I told someone where to catch a bus, and I assumed that they would know on which side of the road to wait, but they ended up going the wrong way, because they had not used that bus before. We assume that it is something that people know how to do.

[166] **Mick Bates:** Thank you for raising that point, Andrew. I have to draw a line under this, but I look forward to seeing the total cost of marketing, because it seems relevant, in view of the fact that you have highlighted marketing as your most cost-effective spend.

[167] On behalf of the committee, I thank you for your evidence. A copy of the Record will be sent to you for examination. If there are issues that have been raised today on which you would like to give us further evidence, please do so—as with the marketing information. I wish you all the best in your activities, and I look forward to more carbon reduction as a result.

[168] I remind the committee that our next meeting is on Thursday 6 December at 9.30 a.m., when we will be taking evidence from a panel of witnesses comprising the Confederation of Passenger Transport Wales and the Association of Train Operating Companies. Thank you for your attendance.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 10.48 a.m.
The meeting ended at 10.48 a.m.