



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig
The Rural Development Sub-committee**

**Dydd Mercher, 16 Gorffennaf 2008
Wednesday, 16 July 2008**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions
- 3 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 4 Cytuno ar y Flaenraglen Waith
Consideration of Forward Work Programme
- 6 Ymchwiliad i Dlodi ac Amddifadedd yn y Gymru Wledig: Cytuno ar yr Adroddiad
Terfynol
Inquiry into Poverty and Deprivation in Rural Wales: Agree Final Report

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal,
cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Alun Davies	Llafur (Cadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor) Labour (Sub-committee Chair)
Michael German	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (yn diprwyo ar ran Mick Bates) Welsh Liberal Democrats (substitute for Mick Bates)
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Brynle Williams	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives

Swyddogion Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn bresennol
Assembly Parliamentary Service officials in attendance

Claire Morris	Clerc Clerk
Annette Stafford	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 9.03 a.m.
The meeting began at 9.03 a.m.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Alun Davies:** Galwaf y cyfarfod i drefn. Yr ydym wedi derbyn ymddiheuriadau gan Mick Bates ac mae Mike German yn parhau i ddirprwyo ar ei ran. Y bore yma, byddwn yn trafod ein hadroddiad ar dlodi yng Nghymru wledig a hefyd ein hadroddiad blynyddol. Mae gennym hefyd raglen waith i'w thrafod ac i'w hystyried.

Alun Davies: I call the committee to order. We have received apologies from Mick Bates and Mike German continues to substitute on his behalf. This morning, we are going to discuss our report on poverty in rural Wales and our annual report. We also have the forward work programme to discuss and consider.

[2] Os ydych chi, fel pwyllgor, yn gytûn, bydd y drafodaeth ar yr adroddiad blynyddol, sef eitem 3, yn cael ei chynnal yn breifat. Cawn y drafodaeth honno pan fydd yn gyfleus gwneud hynny. A ydych yn hapus â hynny a chyda'r agenda? Yr ydym yn mynd i symud mewn ac allan o sesiynau cyhoeddus a phreifat y bore yma.

If you, as a committee, are in agreement, the discussion on the annual report, namely item 3, will be held in private. We will have that discussion when it will be convenient to do so. Are you happy with that and with the agenda? We are going to be moving in and out of public and private sessions this morning.

9.05 a.m.

Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion

[3] **Alun Davies:** Cynigiaf fod **Alun Davies:** I propose that

y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r drafodaeth ar eitem 3 yn unol â the committee resolves to exclude the public from the discussion on item 3 in accordance

Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.37(vi).

with Standing Order No. 10.37(vi).

[4] Gwelaf fod y pwyllgor yn gytûn.

[5] I see that the committee is in agreement.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 9.05 a.m.
The public part of the meeting ended at 9.05 a.m.*

*Ailymgynullodd y pwyllgor yn gyhoeddus am 9.29 p.m.
The committee reconvened in public at 9.29 p.m.*

Cytuno ar y Flaenraglen Waith Consideration of Forward Work Programme

[6] **Alun Davies:** [*Anhyglyw.*]—A oes gan unrhyw un arall sylwadau ar hyn? Cytunaf â chi, Alun; y flaenoriaeth o heddiw tan y Nadolig yw craffu ar y Gweinidog a'r gyllideb—mae'n rhaid gwneud hynny—wedyn y cynllun datblygu gwledig, a'r sector bwyd. Trafodasom hynny'n fras yn gynharach yn y flwyddyn, a hoffwn ddychwelyd at hynny rywbryd yn yr hydref. Felly, dyna le mae fy mlaenoriaethau i ar hyn o bryd.

Alun Davies: [*Inaudible.*]—Does anyone else have any comments on this? I agree with you, Alun; the priority from now until Christmas is the scrutiny of the Minister and the budget—that has to be done—and then the rural development plan, and the food sector. We discussed that in general terms earlier this year, and I would like to return to that at some point in the autumn. Therefore, those would be my priorities at present.

9.30 a.m.

[7] **Brynle Williams:** Yn sicr. Hwyrach y gallwn ddod â'r sector bwyd i mewn i'r cynllun datblygu gwledig.

Brynle Williams: Certainly. Perhaps we can bring the food sector under the RDP.

[8] The other thing that I would raise, and I am conscious of the time constraints, is bio-energy in Wales. Overall, I suppose that that would be encompassed by the RDP, would it not? However, the bio-energy aspect is worth exploring, with what we have seen, if only in forestry, in terms of its use and trying to promote it in Wales.

[9] **Michael German:** I just have two points, as, obviously, this will not be for me. The Committee on European and External Affairs has done a brief analysis of the work on the common agricultural policy health check and CAP reform. There is an ongoing need to check progress on this matter, because it is very important. It may well be that the Committee on European and External Affairs could deal with that issue, but it needs to be followed through strongly, because modulation is a major issue for Welsh farmers, as well as the follow through, along with match funding. My only suggestion comes from Mick, and that is that use should be made of the opportunity at the Royal Welsh Show to ask people and the various parts of the Wales Rural Forum whether they have any priorities that they would like to see brought out into the open for scrutiny, in order to get engagement. That was all that I wanted to say.

[10] **Alun Davies:** O ran blaenoriaethau, yr ydym wedi trafod y sector bwyd, y cynllun datblygu gwledig, bio-ynni a'r polisi

In terms of priorities, we have discussed the food sector, the RDP, bio-energy and the common agricultural policy. To take this

amaethyddol cyffredin. Er mwyn mynd â hyn yn ei blaen, siaradaf gyda Sandy Mewies, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol, am yr hyn mae'n ei wneud o ran PAC, ac adrodd yn ôl. Efallai y gallew neu wneud gwaith ar y cyd gyda'r pwyllgor hwnnw yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf.

forward, I will speak to Sandy Mewies, the Chair of the Committee on European and External Affairs about what it is doing about CAP, and report back to you. We could perhaps do some joint working with that committee over the next year.

[11] **Brynle Williams:** With the CAP health check, there are serious implications to the statements that Sarkozy is making and that are being made in Brussels and we will have to look at that. The energy crisis has turned food production on its head within months, and Sarkozy has been thinking about direct subsidies for food production, which would have implications for Wales.

[12] **Michael German:** That was precisely the matter that the Committee on European and External Affairs was exploring: what the dynamic was between the various parts of Europe. There is a lot of pressure to get all of those issues covered, so you may want to leave that issue to it, but, as Brynle said, it is a crucial issue for Welsh agriculture.

[13] **Alun Davies:** Caf y drafodaeth honno gyda Sandy Mewies ac adroddaf yn ôl ar hynny yn ystod yr haf. A oes gennych unrhyw deimlad am beth ddylai fod yn flaenoriaeth o ran ystyried y cynllun datblygu gwledig a'r sector bwyd?

Alun Davies: I will have that discussion with Sandy Mewies, and I will report back on that during the summer. Do you have any sense of what should be a priority in terms of considering the rural development plan and the food sector?

[14] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dylem edrych ar y cynllun datblygu gwledig yn weddol gynnar neu ni fydd pwynt i ni ei wneud. Bydd yn rhaid i chi, fel Cadeirydd, ddod â rhaglen i ni ar ddechrau'r tymor nesaf yn dangos yr hyn sydd yn rhaid i ni ei wneud a beth yw'r amserlen, er enghraifft, ar gyfer y gyllideb, fel ein bod yn gweld faint o le sydd gennym. Wedyn gellir penderfynu beth allwn ei wneud a beth na allwn ei wneud. Nid oes pwynt dechrau ymchwiliad sylweddol os nad oes amser i wneud hynny, ac efallai byddai'n well ei ohirio tan y flwyddyn wedyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: We should look at the rural development plan fairly early on, or there will be no point in doing so. As Chair, you will have to bring a programme before us at the start of next term identifying what we must do and what the timetable is, for example, for the budget, so that we can see how much scope we have. Then the decision can be taken on what we are able and what we are not able to do. There is no point starting a substantial inquiry if there is no time available for it, and it may be better to defer that until the following year.

[15] **Alun Davies:** Cytunaf. Pan ddychwelwn o egwyl yr haf, bydd yn rhaid i ni ddod â'r gwaith ar ysgolion i ben. Yr wyf yn mawr obeithio y gallwn ddod â'r gwaith hwnnw i ben yn ystod mis Medi yn ein cyfarfod cyntaf neu'r ail gyfarfod. Yr ydym wedi gorffen cymryd tystiolaeth, oni bai bod Aelodau yn teimlo bod angen mwy o dystiolaeth ar y pwnc. Os nad ydych yn meddwl hynny, bydd y clerc a minnau'n drafftio'r adroddiad a byddwch yn ei weld cyn diwedd toriad yr haf.

Alun Davies: I agree. When we return from the summer recess, we will have to complete our work on schools. I very much hope that we can complete that during September in either our first or second meeting. We have completed the evidence taking, unless Members feel that more evidence is required on that issue. If you do not think that, the clerk and I will draft the report and you will have sight of that before the end of summer recess.

[16] **Alun Ffred Jones:** O ran yr ymchwiliad ar ysgolion gwledig, nid wyf yn

Alun Ffred Jones: On the inquiry on rural schools, I am not sure that we have taken

siŵr ein bod wedi derbyn digon o dystiolaeth am safleoedd lle mae ad-drefnu wedi digwydd ers peth amser. Aethom i sir Benfro, ac yno yr oeddem yn sôn am ad-drefnu sydd wedi digwydd yn gymharol ddiweddar, ac, yn achos Ceredigion, ad-drefnu sy'n mynd i ddiwydd. Efallai dylem ofyn am dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig o ardaloedd lle mae ad-drefnu wedi digwydd 10 neu 20 mlynedd yn ôl, a gweld beth oedd yr amgylchiadau ac os oes unrhyw wersi i'w dysgu. Gallaf gynnig dau neu dri o enghreifftiau i chi.

sufficient evidence about sites where reorganisation took place some time ago. We went to Pembrokeshire, and there we were talking about reorganisation that took place relatively recently, and, in the case of Ceredigion, reorganisation that has yet to take place. Perhaps we should ask for written evidence from areas where reorganisations took place 10 or 20 years ago, and see what the circumstances were and whether there are any lessons that could be learned. I can offer you two or three examples.

[17] **Alun Davies:** Oes modd gyrru e-bost ynghylch hynny?

Alun Davies: Can you send an e-mail on that?

[18] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwnaf.

Alun Ffred Jones: I will.

[19] **Alun Davies:** Cawn sgwrs gyda gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau a thrafod hynny dros yr haf, os yw hynny'n iawn. Gwelaf ei bod. Diolch am hynny, Alun.

Alun Davies: We will have a discussion with the Members' research service and discuss it over the summer, if that is okay. I see that it is. Thank you for that, Alun.

[20] **Michael German:** There are examples in Wales where rural schools have been amalgamated, at least 10 years ago or within the last 10 years, and new schools created, and it would be interesting to note what the community structure is in those areas. I am thinking particularly of northern Monmouthshire, where six village schools were amalgamated into a brand new school, and it would be interesting to look at communities—although perhaps not that particular example—that have now had five years of being on their own, as it were.

[21] **Alun Davies:** Please e-mail me that information. What I will do is to look at both of those e-mails and make a decision on getting further written evidence and try to sort that out before the end of the summer recess.

[22] A ydych yn hapus â hynny? Gwelaf eich bod. Felly, erbyn diwedd mis Medi, byddwn wedi dod â'r gwaith ar ysgolion bach i ben. Ym mis Tachwedd, bydd yn rhaid inni graffu ar y gyllideb, a chredaf ei bod yn gwneud synnwyr inni weld y Gweinidog rywbyrd ym mis Tachwedd, a, gobeithio, gallwn ddechrau ar y gwaith ar y cynllun datblygu gwledig ddechrau fis Hydref. Gwelaf fod gennym gytundeb ar hynny, felly symudwn ymlaen. Diolch am y drafodaeth ar y mater hwnnw.

Are you content with that? I see that you are. So, by the end of September, we will have completed our work on small schools. In November, we will have to scrutinise the budget, and I believe that it would make sense to see the Minister at some point in November, and, hopefully, we can start work on the rural development plan at the start of October. I see that we have agreement on that, so we will move on. Thank you for the discussion on that issue.

9.38 a.m.

Ymchwiliad i Dlodi ac Amddifadedd yn y Gymru Wledig: Cytuno ar yr Adroddiad Terfynol
Inquiry into Poverty and Deprivation in Rural Wales: Agree Final Report

[23] **Alun Davies:** Yr ydym wedi cael **Alun Davies:** We have had a number of

sawl trafodaeth ar yr adroddiad, ac mae'r adroddiad drafft wedi'i gylchredeg. A ydych yn cytuno'r adroddiad neu a oes unrhyw welliannau yr hoffech eu cynnig cyn gwneud hynny? A oes unrhyw sylwadau? Yr ydym wedi trafod y pwnc ar sawl achlysur.

discussions on the report, and the draft report has been circulated. Do you agree the report, or are there any amendments that you wish to make before doing so? Are there any comments? We have discussed this on several occasions.

[24] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr unig sylw y hoffem ei wneud yw'r un arferol o ddiolch i'r staff, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch hefyd yn ei wneud fel Cadeirydd, am ddod ag ymchwiliad eang a chymhleth at ei gilydd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn iddynt ac yn eu longyfarch ar eu gwaith.

Alun Ffred Jones: The only comment that I would like to make is the usual one of thanking the staff, as I am sure that you will also do as Chair, for bringing this wide-ranging and complex inquiry together. I am grateful to them and congratulate them on their work.

[25] **Brynle Williams:** Cytunaf.

Brynle Williams: I agree.

[26] **Alun Davies:** Os ydych yn hapus, cymeraf fod yr adroddiad wedi'i gytuno, felly. Bydd yr adroddiad yn mynd i'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, sy'n cyfarfod am 10 a.m., a bydd yr adroddiad yn cael ei lansio yn Sioe Frenhinol Gymru yr wythnos nesaf. Mae manylion y lansiad wedi'u cylchredeg.

Alun Davies: If you are content, I will take it that the report is agreed. It will now be passed on to the Sustainability Committee, which will meet at 10 a.m., and the report will be launched at the Royal Welsh Show next week. The details of the launch have been circulated.

[27] Dyna ddiwedd y cyfarfod ffurfiol, sef ein cyfarfod olaf am eleni. Hoffwn ychwanegu at eiriau Alun Ffred a diolch i'r staff, pob un ohonoch, sydd wedi gweithio gyda ni yn ystod y flwyddyn. Yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi'ch gwaith i gefnogi'r pwyllgor.

That brings the formal session to an end this morning, which is our final session for this year. I would like to endorse Alun Ffred's comments and thank the staff, each and every one of you, who have worked with us this year. We appreciate your work in support of the committee.

[28] Hoffwn ddiolch yn arbennig i Joanne, sy'n dychwelyd i Gaeredin. Dyma ei chyfarfod olaf gyda ni, felly diolch yn fawr iawn, Joanne, am y gwaith yr ydych wedi'i wneud dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr ydym yn mawr obeithio eich bod wedi mwynhau'r profiad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn eich gweld yn ystod ein hymweliad nesaf â Senedd yr Alban. Diolch yn fawr am eich gwaith a diolch hefyd i'r Aelodau am eu gwaith hwythau.

I thank in particular Joanne, who will be returning to Edinburgh. This is her final meeting with us, so thank you very much, Joanne, for the work that you have done over the past year. We very much hope that you have enjoyed the experience. I am sure that we will see you the next time that we visit the Scottish Parliament. Thank you very much for your work and I also thank Members for their work.

[29] Bydd ein cyfarfod nesaf ym mis Medi. Diolch yn fawr.

Our next meeting will be in September. Thank you very much.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 9.40 a.m.
The meeting ended at 9.40 a.m.*