



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig  
The Rural Development Sub-committee**

**Dydd Iau, 13 Mawrth 2008  
Thursday, 13 March 2008**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions
  
- 6 Themâu sy'n Codi o Ymchwiliad yr Is-bwyllgor i Dlodi ac Amddifadedd yng Nghymru  
Wledig  
Emerging Themes from the Sub-committee's Inquiry into Poverty and Deprivation in  
Rural Wales

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal,  
cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.  
In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Mick Bates	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Alun Davies	Llafur (Cadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor) Labour (Sub-committee Chair)
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Darren Millar	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig (yn dirprwyo ar ran Brynle Williams) Welsh Conservatives (substitute for Brynle Williams)

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Lorraine Barrett	Llafur Labour
------------------	------------------

**Swyddogion Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn bresennol**  
**Assembly Parliamentary Service officials in attendance**

Joanne Clinton	Clerc Clerk
Dr Virginia Hawkins	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 10.16 a.m.*  
*The meeting began at 10.16 a.m.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon**  
**Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Alun Davies:** Galwaf y cyfarfod i drefn. Ystyriwch fod y rheolau arferol ar waith. **Alun Davies:** I call the meeting to order. The usual housekeeping rules apply.

[2] Mae gennym ddau fater penodol i'w trafod y bore yma, sef y ddeiseb gan ysgolion cymunedol Powys a gyfeiriwyd atom gan y Pwyllgor Deisebau, a'n hymchwiliad i dlodi yng Nghymru wledig. We have two specific matters to discuss this morning: the petition by Powys community schools that has been referred to us by the Petitions Committee, and our inquiry into poverty in rural Wales.

[3] Mae Brynle Williams wedi ymddiheuro ac mae Darren Millar yn dirprwyo ar ei ran. Mae Mick Bates wedi datgan buddiant ym mater ysgolion cymunedol Powys. Felly, ni fydd yn cymryd rhan yn y drafodaeth honno. Brynle Williams has sent his apologies and Darren Millar is substituting for him. Mick Bates has declared an interest in the matter of Powys community schools, so he will not be participating in that discussion.

[4] **Mick Bates:** I think that I should put on record that I cannot take part because my wife is the head of one of the schools that this group is trying to keep open. Therefore, I have a direct interest.

[5] **Alun Davies:** Diolch am yr eglurhad hwnnw, Mick; gwerthfawrogwn hynny. **Alun Davies:** Thank you for that explanation, Mick; we appreciate that.

[6] Wrth drafod ysgolion cymunedol ym Mhowys, hoffwn i chi ystyried y llythyr a dderbyniasom gan y Pwyllgor Deisebau sydd wedi gofyn i'r pwyllgor hwn a'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ystyried goblygiadau'r ddeiseb, yn enwedig o safbwynt y syniad o ddatblygu polisi addysg i Gymru wledig.

In discussing community schools in Powys, I would like you to consider the letter that we have received from the Petitions Committee requesting that this committee and the Enterprise and Learning Committee consider the implications of this petition, particularly the idea of developing an education policy for rural Wales.

[7] Yr ydym wedi derbyn llythyr gan Gareth Jones, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, yn gofyn i ni, fel is-bwyllgor, drafod y pwnc gan fod y pwyllgor hwnnw'n meddwl y byddai'n well i ni ei drafod.

We have received a letter from Gareth Jones, as Chair of the Enterprise and Learning Committee, asking us, as a sub-committee, to discuss this because that committee thinks that it would be better for us to consider it.

[8] Yr ydym hefyd wedi derbyn llythyr gan y Gweinidog yn esbonio polisi'r Llywodraeth ar ad-drefnu ysgolion. A oes gan Aelodau unrhyw sylwadau ar hwn?

We have also received a letter from the Minister, setting out the Government's policy on the reorganisation of schools. Do Members have any comments on this?

[9] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'n amlwg bod y ddeiseb hon yn cyfeirio'n benodol at Bowys a bod trafodaeth ehangach yn digwydd ar hyd a lled Cymru, felly—

**Alun Ffred Jones:** It is clear that this petition refers specifically to Powys and that there is a broader discussion throughout Wales, therefore—

[10] **Alun Davies:** Efallai y dylwn fod wedi egluro ar y dechrau fod yn rhaid i ni drafod hwn yng nghyd-destun Cymru yn hytrach na Phowys yn unig, oherwydd mater i Bowys yw ad-drefnu ysgolion Powys, felly nid yw'n fater i ni.

**Alun Davies:** Perhaps I should have explained at the beginning that we must discuss this in a Welsh rather than a Powys context, because the reorganisation of Powys schools is a matter for Powys only, so it is not a matter for us.

[11] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Fel y dywedais, mae'r mater hwn yn effeithio ar bob rhan o Gymru mewn gwahanol ffyrdd, felly byddai'n briodol i ni wneud darn o waith ar bolisi presennol y Llywodraeth er mwyn gweld a oes unrhyw argymhellion y gallwn eu gwneud wrth ymateb i'r sylwadau hyn. Wrth wneud hynny, rhaid i ni fod yn ofalus nad yw'r drafodaeth yn mynd i bob man, oherwydd mae haeriadau'n cael eu gwneud ar y pwnc hwn sy'n anodd eu profi neu eu gwrthbrofi.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** As I was saying, this matter impacts on every part of Wales in various ways, therefore it would be appropriate for us to carry out a piece of work on the Government's current policy to see if there are any recommendations that we could make in response to the comments received. In doing so, we must be careful that the discussion does not go all over the place because allegations are being made about this subject that are difficult to prove or to deny.

10.20 a.m.

[12] Byddwn yn gofyn i'r pwyllgor, wrth gynllunio'r gwaith, edrych ar enghreifftiau penodol lle mae ad-drefnu wedi digwydd mewn cyd-destun gwledig—gall fod yn brofiad cadarnhaol neu fel arall. Byddwn hefyd eisiau holi'r Llywodraeth am y mater.

I ask that, in planning this work, the committee looks at specific examples of where reorganisation has occurred in a rural context—that could be a positive experience or otherwise. I also want to question the Government on the matter. In addition, I

Byddwn yn ogystal am wahodd y deisebwyr, er, yr oedd eich sylw'n un teg iawn—nid ein busnes ni yw gwneud sylwadau ynglŷn â threfniadau mewnol yr un sir.

would want to invite the petitioners to committee, although your remark was a fair one—it is not our business to pass comment on any individual county's internal arrangements.

[13] Gyda llaw, gallai hwn fwydo i mewn i'n hymchwiliad ehangach i amddifadedd yng nghefn gwlad. Dylem, er hynny, aros i weld casgliad yr ymchwiliad hwnnw cyn penderfynu a yw'n ffitio'r darn hwnnw o waith ynteu'n sefyll ar ei ben ei hun.

By the way, this could feed into our wider inquiry into rural deprivation. Having said that, we ought to wait for that inquiry's conclusions before deciding whether it fits with this piece of work or whether it stands alone.

[14] **Darren Millar:** I agree with Alun Ffred. These petitioners are voicing very real concerns in their petition and submission. We need to consider them carefully. However, this is not just an issue in Powys; it is an issue across Wales, with falling school rolls. We need to consider it in the wider context of the impact of small school closures on communities. There is significant merit in conducting a piece of work in committee. Major reorganisations have taken place in Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire, and it would be good to get some evidence about the impact on those counties and to bring it back to this committee.

[15] I, too, would hesitate to introduce it into the other review being conducted. We need to start a piece of work that is totally separate from that in the first instance, and then perhaps feed back into a joint session, perhaps with the Enterprise and Learning Committee. Yes, let us look at the educational impacts, but it is the wider impacts that we need to consider. They are the ones on which we need to be making recommendations to the Minister in terms of policy on schools closures.

[16] **Alun Davies:** Diolch, Darren. A oes sylwadau pellach? Gwelaf nad oes, ac felly fe dderbyniaf y cynnig a gofyn i'r clerwr sicrhau bod gennym bapur i gwmpasu natur y drafodaeth a'r ymchwiliad a gawn ni. Trafodaf gyda'r clerwr sut y gallwn gynnwys hynny yn amserlen waith y pwyllgor. Sicrhawn fod nodyn yn cael ei e-bostio atoch yn ystod y toriad, a gofynnwn ichi gytuno cwmpas ac amserlen yr ymchwiliad drwy'r e-bost yn ystod y toriad fel y gallwn symud ymlaen gyda'r mater hwn mor fuan â phosibl. A yw'r pwyllgor yn cytuno â hynny? Gwelaf eich bod yn cydsynio.

**Alun Davies:** Thank you, Darren. Are there any other comments? I see that there are none, so I will accept the proposal and ask the clerk to ensure that we have a paper to scope the nature of our discussion and inquiry. I will discuss with the clerk how we can fit that into the committee's work schedule. We will ensure that a note is e-mailed to you during the recess, and we would ask you to agree the scope and timetable for the inquiry by e-mail during the recess so that we can move forward with this matter as swiftly as possible. Is the committee in agreement? I see that you consent.

[17] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Hoffwn godi un pwynt. Mae hwn yn is-bwyllgor cymharol fach. Datganodd Mick fuddiant, felly ni fydd yn cymryd rhan yn y drafodaeth y bore yma. A yw hynny'n golygu na fydd yn cymryd rhan yn yr ymchwiliad ychwaith? Byddai hynny'n drueni, ond, os nad yw, bydd rhaid wrth rywun yn ei le, oni fydd?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I would like to raise one point. This is a relatively small sub-committee. Mick has declared an interest, and he will therefore play no part in this morning's discussion. Does that mean that he will play no part in the inquiry either? That would be a shame, but if he does not play a part, someone will have to take his place, will they not?

[18] **Alun Davies:** Mae hynny'n fater—

**Alun Davies:** That is a matter—

[19] **Mick Bates:** I will wait for a legal ruling from the Chair. [*Laughter.*]

[20] **Alun Davies:** Cawn drafodaeth am **Alun Davies:** We will discuss the matter hynny y tu allan i'r pwyllgor. outside committee.

10.24 a.m.

**Themâu sy'n Codi o Ymchwiliad yr Is-bwyllgor i Dlodi ac Amddifadedd yng Nghymru Wledig**  
**Emerging Themes from the Sub-committee's Inquiry into Poverty and Deprivation in Rural Wales**

[21] **Alun Davies:** Yn ystod ein cyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf, cytunodd y pwyllgor drafod rhai o'r materion sy'n codi o'n hymchwiliad presennol. Mae pob un ohonom wedi cael copi o'r papur gan y gwasanaeth ymchwil, ac ynddo fe danlinellir rhywfaint o'r materion gwahanol sy'n codi o'r dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a gawsom, yn ogystal â rhai o'r sesiynau tystiolaeth lafar. Mae'r papur ymchwil hwn yn trafod y cefndir ac mae'n dangos y wybodaeth a gasglwyd gennym. A oes gan unrhyw Aelod sylwadau ar y papur fel y mae ar hyn o bryd?

**Alun Davies:** During our meeting last week, the committee agreed to discuss some of the issues arising from our current inquiry. Everyone has received a copy of the research service's paper, in which some of the various issues are outlined that arise from the written evidence that we have received, as well as some from the oral evidence sessions. This research paper discusses the background and it highlights the information that we have gathered. Does any Member have any comments to make on the paper as it stands?

[22] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae hwn yn grynhoed o'r sylwadau a'r dystiolaeth yr ydym wedi'u derbyn ac mae'n ddefnyddiol iawn. Fy mhryder i yw bod llawer o'r sylwadau sydd yma yn eithaf cyffredinol. Mae un o'r themâu yn ymwneud â'r ffaith nad yw'r mynegai amddifadedd lluosog fel y mae'n sefyll yn pigo dim byd i fyny mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'r ardaloedd hynny, felly, yn cael eu hamddifadu o unrhyw weithredu i ymateb i'r amddifadedd hwnnw gan nad yw'r broblem yn ymddangos yn yr ystadegau. Felly, dim ond fel problem gyffredinol y'i gwelir.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** This is a summary of the comments and evidence that we have received and it is very handy. My concern is that many of the comments here are quite general. One of the themes is to do with the fact that the index of multiple deprivation as it stands does not pick up anything in rural areas. Therefore, those areas are being deprived of any action taken to respond to that deprivation because the problem does not show up statistically. Therefore, it is seen just as a general problem.

[23] Hoffwn ofyn i'r staff edrych ar un neu ddau o bethau. Hoffwn gael gwybodaeth o rywle ynghylch unrhyw wahaniaeth rhwng patrwm yr amddifadedd yng nghefn gwlad a'r patrwm yn y trefi. Ai'r un bobl sydd yn dioddef o amddifadedd yng nghefn gwlad ag sy'n dioddef yn ardaloedd Cymunedau'n Gyntaf? Mae rhywbeth yma yn dweud, er enghraifft, mai'r bobl sydd yn dioddef waethaf yng nghefn gwlad yw pobl dros 55 oed sydd ar bensiwn. A yw hynny'n wir yn y trefi hefyd neu a oes ffactorau eraill yn

I would like to ask the staff to look at one or two things. I would like to have information from somewhere on whether there is a difference between the pattern of deprivation in rural areas and that in towns. Is it the same people who suffer deprivation in rural areas as suffer in Communities First areas? It says here, for example, that the people who suffer the most in rural areas are people over the age of 55 who receive a pension. Is that true in the towns too or are there other relevant factors?

berthnasol?

[24] Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad bum neu chwe mlynedd yn ôl o'r enw 'Cymunedau â Chydbwysedd Oedran'. Nid wyf yn siŵr pwy oedd awdur yr adroddiad—[*Torri ar draws.*] A report was published some five or six years ago called 'Age Balanced Communities'. I am not sure who the author of the report was—[*Interruption.*]

[25] Who was it?

[26] **Mick Bates:** It was the Development Board for Rural Wales.

[27] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pwy bynnag oedd yr awdur, aeth yr adroddiad i Carwyn Jones fel y Gweinidog perthnasol ar y pryd. Collwyd yr adroddiad yn llwyr, ond credaf fod tystiolaeth fanwl ynddo ynglŷn â chymunedau arbennig a fyddai'n berthnasol i'r gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Whoever the author was, the report went to Carwyn Jones as the relevant Minister at the time. The report was completely lost, but I believe that it contained detailed evidence about specific communities that would be relevant to the work that we are doing.

[28] Pwy arall yr ydym am ofyn iddynt gyflwyno tystiolaeth? Efallai y dylem fod yn edrych yn fanwl ar gymuned wledig benodol. Mae'n iawn i bobl roi tystiolaeth gyffredinol i chi am bwnc—ac yr wyf yn gwybod bod pobl ifanc wedi dod i mewn i sôn am eu profiadau—ond efallai fod gwerth mewn edrych ar ryw ardal benodol. A oes gwaith neu ymchwil wedi'i wneud ar bentref neu dref wledig a allai roi teimlad mwy penodol inni o'r hyn yr ydym yn sôn amdano wrth gyfeirio at amddifadedd a chefn gwlad? Cwestiynau yw'r rheini yn hytrach na sylwadau. Who else are we going to ask to present evidence? Perhaps we should look in detail at a particular rural community. It is fine for people to give you general evidence about a subject—and I know that young people have come in to talk about their experiences—but perhaps there is value in looking at a particular area. Has any work or research been undertaken on a village or rural town that could give us a more specific feeling for what we mean when we talk about rural deprivation? Those are questions rather than comments.

[29] **Alun Davies:** Yr oedd sawl awgrym cryf iawn yno yr hoffwn eu derbyn ar ddechrau'r sgwrs. Gofynnaf i'r clerc ddod o hyd i'r dogfennau yr ydych wedi sôn amdanynt ac i'w cylchredeg i'r pwyllgor. Bydd yn ddefnyddiol inni gael cyfle i'w darllen yn ystod y toriad. Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau am y themâu sydd wedi codi o'r ymchwiliad, ac yr wyf hefyd yn hoffi eich awgrym ein bod yn edrych yn fanwl ar effaith rhai o'r themâu hyn ar gymunedau. Efallai y gallwn ystyried hynny ymhellach yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. I ateb un o'ch cwestiynau, Alun, mae sesiynau tystiolaeth wedi'u hamserlennu gyda phobl sydd yn cynrychioli'r rhai sydd yn economaidd weithgar a'r rhai sydd yn economaidd anweithgar, yn ogystal â phobl hŷn yn y gymuned. Byddwn hefyd yn cynnal sesiwn dystiolaeth gyda llywodraeth leol. Felly, mae tair sesiwn wedi'u trefnu eisoes. **Alun Davies:** There were several strong suggestions there that I would like to accept at the outset. I will ask the clerk to find the documents that you have mentioned and to circulate them to the committee. It will be useful for us to have an opportunity to read them during recess. I agree with your comments on the themes that have come out of the inquiry, and I also like your suggestion that we look in detail at the impact of some of those themes on communities. Perhaps we can consider that further over the coming weeks. To answer one of your questions, Alun, evidence sessions have been scheduled with people who represent those who are economically active and those who are economically inactive, in addition to older people in the community. We will also have an evidence session with local government. Therefore, three sessions have already been arranged.

[30] **Mick Bates:** On the index of multiple deprivation, I have not seen evidence yet that can help us to identify and analyse the sparsity issues that we talk about in another way, because it is all spatial. So, if it is more concentrated, you get a Communities First programme. Therefore, that is a difficult bit.

10.30 a.m.

[31] That leads me on to the Government's policies. In our investigation, we are scrutinising the Government's actions, and there have been references to Government policies where the word 'rural' is mentioned. I wonder whether we should look at all current Government policies in which the word 'rural' is mentioned. I believe that access is a key issue; therefore, in terms of health, reference was made last week, in some evidence, to Townsend, which suggested that we had a better formula for costing access to rural health. That never happened here—it happened in Scotland. Therefore, could we have all the references, so that we could scrutinise that policy?

[32] We are looking into a massive piece of work, which, at the end of it, may not find any new conclusions that will help us to identify and scrutinise Government policies to recommend where we may send more resources, because that is what it will come down to at the end of the day. Last week, for example, participation was identified as a key issue—that was the way to overcome most of the deprivation and poverty issues. However, without scrutinising Government policies, we will miss the opportunity of what we are doing with this deprivation and poverty study. Therefore, I would like to see an analysis of Government policies and the expenditure that it is putting in, so that, when we come to make recommendations, we can say, 'This is not working, according to our evidence', or whatever.

[33] **Alun Davies:** Mae gennym lythyr oddi wrth Elin Jones, a phecyn o wybodaeth gan bob adran Llywodraeth. Mae'r llythyr wedi ei ddyddio 3 Mawrth, ac mae'n nodi gweithrediadau pob adran Llywodraeth sy'n ymwneud â Chymru wledig. Mae hyn yn rhan o'r pecyn gwybodaeth sydd gennym o'n blaenau.

**Alun Davies:** We have a letter from Elin Jones, and a package of information from each Government department. The letter is dated 3 March, and it notes the actions of each Government department that is involved with rural Wales. This is part of the package of information that we have before us.

[34] Mae hwn yn becyn swmpus, â llawer o wybodaeth, ac mae angen i ni ystyried ei oblygiadau. Yr hyn sydd gennym yma yw datganiad o weithrediadau a pholisïau'r Llywodraeth. Credaf fod angen i ni fynd gam ymhellach na hynny, ac ystyried effaith y polisïau hyn ar bobl dlawd yng nghefn gwlad—sut y maent yn gweithio yw'r peth pwysig i ni.

This is a substantial package, which contains a lot of information, and we need to consider its implications. What we have here is a statement of the Government's actions and policies. I believe that we need to take it a step further than that, and consider the impact of these policies on poor people in rural areas—how these are working is the important point for us.

[35] Felly, hoffwn ofyn i'r clerc a oes modd i ni ddechrau dadansoddi rhywfaint o'r wybodaeth hon. Mae'ch syniad yn un da, Mick; pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn gwneud datganiad polisi, fel yr un ar Cymunedau Nesaf, er enghraifft, efallai y dylem, fel rheol, wahodd y Gweinidog perthnasol i'r pwyllgor, i'w holi sut y byddai hynny'n gweithio yn y Gymru wledig. Gallem ofyn

Therefore, I would like to ask the clerk whether we can start to analyse some of this information. Yours is a good idea, Mick; when the Government makes a policy statement, such as the one on Communities Next, we should, perhaps, as a matter of course, invite the relevant Minister to the committee, to ask how that would work in rural Wales. We could ask how they have



sut y mae wedi sicrhau bod y Gymru wledig yn rhan o'r cynlluniau hynny, a sut y mae wedi ystyried y gwahanol faterion sy'n effeithio ar bobl yng nghefn gwlad. Efallai y gallwn wneud sylw arbennig ar hyn yn yr adroddiad, a hefyd newid y ffordd yr ydym ni fel pwyllgor yn gweithredu yn y dyfodol.

ensured that rural Wales is a part of those plans, and how they have considered the different issues that affect people in rural Wales. Perhaps we could give special attention to this in this report, and also to change the way that we work as a committee in the future.

[36] **Darren Millar:** I wish to endorse what Mick said. As a sub-committee, we are going to have to come up with recommendations to Government on improving the lives of people who are living in poverty and deprivation in rural areas. I have a specific question. I notice that one of the future evidence sessions will be on older people. So far, there has been no written evidence from any organisations regarding specifics on older people. Who will be present at that session?

[37] **Alun Davies:** Mae gennym rywun o Age Concern Cymru a Help the Aged, y Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn, a chynrychiolwyr o Fforwm Pensiynwyr Cymru. Bydd hynny ar 24 Ebrill.

**Alun Davies:** We have someone from Age Concern Cymru and Help the Aged, the Commissioner for Older People, and representatives from the Welsh Pensioners' Forum. That will be on 24 April.

[38] **Darren Millar:** Will they present written submissions prior to the meeting?

[39] **Alun Davies:** Deallaf y byddant.

**Alun Davies:** I understand that they will.

[40] **Darren Millar:** Fine, thank you.

[41] **Lorraine Barrett:** The paper that we have from the clerk is very good—it is factual, and covers the evidence that we have taken. As you said, Chair, we have received the information from all of the departments, which is very useful, but there is much information there and it is almost a case of matching up what the Ministers are saying with how it is being delivered. For example, every local authority is required to provide a comprehensive and efficient library service, but it would be useful to know how that service is delivered to remote villages, and whether mobile library services are provided, and so on.

[42] Something that we have discussed many times in the Chamber is summer holiday activities and access to free swimming. How easy or difficult is it to gain access? How many children in rural areas are able to access what is—I am not arguing with that—a great free service? We need to try drill down in this regard—we have the policies and the commitment of the services from the Government side and the statements from the people giving evidence, and it is a case of matching them up to see how they impact on these areas. You suggested that the clerk will do some research on it, but it is a case of matching up the information. We need to find the gaps, to see whether those services are reaching the parts that they are meant to reach.

[43] **Alun Davies:** You are right, Lorraine; it is the sub-committee's work to scrutinise the actions of Government rather than accept the declarations of Government. The paper that we have received from the Minister is a good starting point. In it, the Government outlines the policies that it believes are having the greatest impact on poverty and deprivation in rural Wales. It is up to us to analyse and scrutinise that in more detail. That is a considerable piece of work and I will discuss it with the clerk during recess, and come back to the sub-committee at its first meeting in the new term or, more likely, by e-mail during recess.

[44] Are there any more comments on this paper?

[45] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Under service poverty, reference is made to limited transport and low car ownership. I had always assumed that there were higher car ownership levels in rural Wales than in urban areas. I do not require an explanation about it today.

[46] **Alun Davies:** Yr wyf wedi nodi yr un peth. Mae sawl peth wedi deillio o'r papur, a byddaf yn ysgrifennu ymateb i hynny yn seiliedig ar ein trafodaeth y bore yma, ynghyd â rhai pethau yr wyf wedi eu hystyried fy hun. Byddaf yn cylchredeg hynny i aelodau'r pwyllgor yn ystod y toriad, er mwyn i chi gael cyfle i roi sylw arno, a symudwn ymlaen o hynny cyn y cyfarfod nesaf. A ydych yn hapus â hynny? Gwelaf eich bod.

**Alun Davies:** I have noted the same issue. Many issues have emerged from the paper, and I will write a response to that based on our discussion this morning, as well as some matters that I have considered myself. I will circulate that to committee members during recess, so that you have the opportunity to comment on it, and we will go forward from there before the next meeting. Are you content with that? I see that you are.

[47] Nid oes mater arall i'w drafod. Bydd ein cyfarfod nesaf ddydd Iau, 17 Ebrill, ac edrychwn ymlaen at hynny. Diolch am eich presenoldeb y bore yma.

There are no other issues to discuss. Our next meeting will be on Thursday, 17 April, to which we look forward. Thank you for your attendance this morning.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 10.38 a.m.  
The meeting ended at 10.38 a.m.*