PDC(2) 2004-2 Decision Letter

Niall Phillips

Messrs Niall Phillips Architects

35 King Street

BRISTOL BS1 4DZ

Eich cyf. Your ref:

Ein cyf. Our ref: A-PP 171-98-012, 013, 014 and 015

5 February 2004

Dear Sir

Ancient Monuments And Archaeological Areas Act 1979: S2 & Schedule 1

Town and Country Planning Act 1990: s77

Applications by Cardiff County Council – proposed visitor centre and restaurant/shop at Cardiff Castle

- 1. Consideration has been given to the report of the Inspector, P J McDonald MSc ARIBA MRTPI, who held a public local inquiry into your clients' applications:
 - (a) for planning permission and scheduled monument consent for the erection of a new visitor centre; and
 - (b) for planning permission and scheduled monument consent for the erection of a restaurant/shop at Cardiff Castle.
- 2. The applications for scheduled monument consent were made direct to the National Assembly for

Wales as required by the 1979 Act. On 8 November 2002, the National Assembly for Wales directed, under Section 77 of the 1990 Act, that the planning applications be referred to it rather than being determined by the local planning authority. On 27 January 2004, the Assembly resolved that a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee (2) 2004/2 be established, in accordance with Standing Order 35, to discharge the functions of the Assembly under Section 2 and Schedule 1 of the 1979 Act and Section 70 of the 1990 Act, in respect of the applications made on behalf of Cardiff County Council as described above. Accordingly, the Planning Decision Committee has considered the applications and has resolved, under Standing Order 35, to adopt this letter.

- 3. The Inspector's conclusions are set out in paragraphs 110 to 144 of his report, a copy of which is enclosed, and those conclusions are reproduced as an Annex to this letter. The Inspector recommended that all four applications be refused.
- 4. The Planning Decision Committee recognise that there is a need for new visitor facilities at Cardiff Castle and accept that the loss of archaeological deposits should not be seen as preventing the construction of new buildings always provided that such deposits are properly recorded before their destruction save that those affected by the new restaurant/café represent a scarce resource which should only be removed where it can be demonstrated that there is an overriding need for the new facility. Whilst noting that the Inspector has concluded that the high walls surrounding the castle will screen the development from the surrounding and thus preserve the appearance of the Conservation Area within which the castle is situated, the Planning Decision Committee were cognisant that the interior of the castle can be overlooked from high rise buildings though the extent to which that is possible, given tree cover within the monument, is something that might need to be assessed were the issues more finely balanced.
- 5. Of overriding importance is the effect that the new buildings would have on the setting of the listed buildings and the character and appearance of the Castle Green. Committee Members agreed with the Inspector that, despite the fact that the visitor centre would be partially buried within an existing and extended bank it would extend too far into Castle Green and its partially curved shape would conflict with the rectangular lines of the castle walls. As regards the restaurant, it is accepted that there may have been buildings at this location in the past but the area has remained open, save for car parking, since they were removed early last century and the introduction of a modern building is unacceptable.

Formal Decision

- 6. For the reasons given by the Inspector, the Planning Decision Committee hereby refuse to grant planning permission and scheduled monument consent for the construction of a new visitor centre and restaurant/shop at Cardiff Castle.
- 7. A copy of this letter has been sent to the Council's Development Manager.

Yours faithfully

Carwyn Jones AM

Chair, Planning Decision Committee (2) 2004/2

Encs Leaflets "H" ,"HC" and "HC (SMC)"