



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Pwyllgor y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Dysgu a  
Sgiliau (Cymru)  
The Proposed Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure  
Committee**

**Cyfnod 1  
Stage 1**

**Dydd Iau, 9 Hydref 2008  
Thursday, 9 October 2008**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Ethol Cadeirydd Dros Dro  
Election of Temporary Chair
- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions
- 4 Y Mesur Arfaethedig Ynghylch Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2008—Cyfnod 1, Sesiwn  
Dystiolaeth 4  
Proposed Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2008—Stage 1, Evidence Session 4

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg. Mae hon yn fersiwn ddrafft o'r cofnod. Cyhoeddir fersiwn derfynol ymhen pum diwrnod gwaith.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included. This is a draft version of the record. The final version will be published within five working days.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Alun Davies	Llafur (yn dirprwyo ar ran Jeff Cuthbert) Labour (substitute for Jeff Cuthbert)
Andrew R.T. Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Janet Ryder	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Alun Charles	Swyddog Datblygu, Uned y Blynyddoedd Cynnar ac Ysgolion, Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg Development Officer, Early Years and Schools Unit, Welsh Language Board
David Rosser	Cyfarwyddwr, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yng Nghymru Director, Confederation of British Industry, Wales
Jeni Smallwood	Swyddog Datblygu, Uned Pobl Ifanc a Sgiliau, Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg Development Officer, Young People and Skills Unit, Welsh Language Board

**Swyddogion Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn bresennol**  
**Assembly Parliamentary Service officials in attendance**

Claire Griffiths	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Gwyn Griffiths	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser
Anne Thomas	Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau Members' Research Service
Sian Wilkins	Clerc Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 12.37 p.m.*  
*The meeting began at 12.37 p.m.*

**Ethol Cadeirydd Dros Dro**  
**Election of Temporary Chair**

[1] **Ms Wilkins:** Good afternoon. Welcome to this meeting of the Proposed Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure Committee. Unfortunately, Jeff Cuthbert, the committee Chair, is unable to be here today. Therefore, under Standing Order No. 10.19, I call for nominations for a temporary chair. Are there any nominations?

[2] **Janet Ryder:** I nominate Alun Davies.

[3] **Ms Wilkins:** Are there any other nominations? I see that there are not, and so I declare that Alun Davies has been elected temporary chair.

*Penodwyd Alun Davies yn gadeirydd dros dro.  
Alun Davies was appointed temporary chair.*

12.38 p.m.

### **Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions**

[4] **Alun Davies:** Cyn inni ddechrau trafod busnes, hoffwn atgoffa pawb fod y Cynulliad yn gweithredu yn ddwyieithog a bod gwasanaeth cyfieithu ar gael i'r rheiny sydd ei angen. Os bydd unrhyw larwm yn seinio, bydd gofyn inni ymadael. Hoffwn sicrhau hefyd nad oes unrhyw ffonau symudol neu declynnau BlackBerry yn cael eu defnyddio yn y cyfarfod hwn. Gwn pa mor anodd yw hi i ddiffodd eich BlackBerry, ond mae botwm i'w gael a byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi pe gallech ddefnyddio'r botwm hwnnw ar gyfer y cyfarfod hwn. Mae'r meicroffonau yn gweithio'n awtomatig.

**Alun Davies:** Before we begin discussing this afternoon's business, I would like to remind everyone that the Assembly operates bilingually and that interpretation is available for those who require it. If any alarm should sound, we will need to exit the room. I also want to ensure that no mobile telephones or BlackBerry devices are used during this meeting. I know how difficult it is to switch off your BlackBerry, but there is such a button and I would appreciate it if you would use that button for the duration of this meeting. The microphones work automatically.

[5] Hoffwn nodi hefyd fod ymddiheuriadau wedi dod i law oddi wrth Christine Chapman, Kirsty Williams a Jeff Cuthbert. Yr wyf i'n cymryd lle Jeff Cuthbert ar gyfer y cyfarfod hwn.

I would also like to note that apologies for absence have been received from Christine Chapman, Kirsty Williams and Jeff Cuthbert. I am substituting for Jeff Cuthbert for this meeting.

12.39 p.m.

### **Y Mesur Arfaethedig Ynghylch Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2008—Cyfnod 1, Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 4**

#### **Proposed Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2008—Stage 1, Evidence Session 4**

[6] **Alun Davies:** Dyma'r bedwaredd sesiwn dystiolaeth ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Fel y gwyddom, bydd y sesiwn dystiolaeth hon yn ffurfio rhan o ystyriaeth y pwyllgor o egwyddorion y Mesur arfaethedig, o dan Gyfnod 1 y broses ddeddfu.

**Alun Davies:** This is the fourth evidence session on this proposed Measure. As we know, this evidence session will form a part of the committee's consideration of the principles of the proposed Measure, under Stage 1 of the legislative process.

12.40 p.m.

[7] Hoffwn groesawu ein tystion y prynhawn yma, a gofynnaf iddynt gyflwyno'u hunain ar gyfer y Cofnod. Wedyn, byddwn, yn Aelodau, yn dechrau'r broses o ofyn cwestiynau.

I welcome our witnesses here this afternoon, and ask them to introduce themselves for the Record. Then, we, as Members, will begin the process of asking questions.

[8] **Ms Smallwood:** Jeni Smallwood

**Ms Smallwood:** I am Jeni Smallwood, a

ydwyf i, swyddog datblygu yn uned pobl ifanc a sgiliau Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg.

[9] **Mr Charles:** Alun Charles ydwyf i, swyddog datblygu yn uned blynyddoedd cynnar ac ysgolion Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg.

[10] **Alun Davies:** Diolch yn fawr. Bu i'r bwrdd gyflwyno ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, ac, yn eich tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig, yr ydych yn datgan bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn ceisio creu cwricwlwm a system addysg sy'n diwallu anghenion pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Deallaf, felly, eich bod yn croesawu'r Mesur arfaethedig. A fedrwch esbonio pam yr ydych yn ei groesawu, a sut yr ydych yn ei weld yn cryfhau ac yn gwella'r system bresennol?

[11] **Ms Smallwood:** Yr ydym yn croesawu'r Mesur arfaethedig ac yn gweld yr angen am fframwaith deddfwriaethol sy'n ymateb i'r agenda newydd sydd o'n blaenau. Yr ydym yn sicr yn croesawu'r egwyddor o ehangu'r opsiynau sydd ar gael i ddisgyblion, ac o gynllunio'r ddarpariaeth ar sail anghenion unigol y dysgwyr. Yn amlwg, yr ydym yn croesawu'r egwyddor o gydweithio, a hefyd o roi hawl i ddysgwyr unigol ddewis eu llwybrau dysgu unigol. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym bryderon am ymarferoldeb gweithredu egwyddorion y Mesur arfaethedig.

[12] **Mr Charles:** Bydd yn her gweithredu'r Mesur arfaethedig o ran addysg Gymraeg ac addysg ddwyieithog, ac, er ein bod yn ei groesawu o ran ei ddyheadau, yr ydym hefyd yn gofidio a fydd addysg Gymraeg ac addysg ddwyieithog yn cael eu lle haeddiannol yn y broses.

[13] **Alun Davies:** A minnau'n cynrychioli'r Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, mae gennyf dipyn o amheuan am y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Gymraeg. Cymeraf eich bod yn rhannu'r amheuan hynny.

[14] **Mr Charles:** Mae dyheadau'r Mesur arfaethedig yn iawn, ond beth yw statws addysg Gymraeg ac addysg ddwyieithog? Yr ydym yn cychwyn ar drothwy isel, felly sut mae adeiladu ar hynny?

[15] **Alun Davies:** Sut?

development officer in the young people and skills unit of the Welsh Language Board.

**Mr Charles:** I am Alun Charles, development officer in the early years and schools unit of the Welsh Language Board.

**Alun Davies:** Thank you very much. The board did submit a response to the consultation on this proposed Measure, and, in your written evidence, you state that the proposed Measure seeks to create a curriculum and education system that meets the needs of young people in Wales. I understand, therefore, that you welcome the proposed Measure. Can you explain why you welcome it, and how you see it strengthening and improving the current system?

**Ms Smallwood:** We do welcome the proposed Measure and we see the need for a legislative framework that responds to the new agenda that is before us. We certainly welcome the principle of expanding the options open to pupils, and of planning provision based on the individual needs of the learner. Obviously, we welcome the principle of collaboration, as well as that of giving individual learners the entitlement to choose their individual learning pathway. However, we do have concerns about the practicality of implementing the principles of the proposed Measure.

**Mr Charles:** Welsh-medium and bilingual education will present a challenge in implementing the proposed Measure and, although we welcome it for its aspirations, we are also concerned about whether Welsh-medium and bilingual education will get the place that they are due in that process.

**Alun Davies:** As a Member who represents Mid and West Wales, I have quite a few doubts about Welsh-medium provision. I take it that you share those same doubts.

**Mr Charles:** The aspirations of the proposed Measure are fine, but what status will Welsh-medium and bilingual education have? We are starting from a very low threshold, so how can we build on that?

**Alun Davies:** How?

[16] **Mr Charles:** Mae angen amser ar bobl. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn y Mesur arfaethedig, hyd y gwelaf i, sy'n cyfeirio at addysg Gymraeg ac addysg ddwyieithog.

**Mr Charles:** People need to be given time. There is nothing in the proposed Measure, as far as I can see, that refers to Welsh-medium and bilingual education.

[17] **Ms Smallwood:** Un arall o'n pryderon yw'r diffyg ystyriaeth a roddir yn y Mesur arfaethedig ar hyn o bryd i'r addewid i adeiladu Cymru ddwyieithog—a gwirioneddol ddwyieithog. Efallai bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn colli'r cyfle i sicrhau y caiff y nod hwnnw ei wireddu.

**Ms Smallwood:** Another of our concerns is the lack of consideration given in the proposed Measure as it stands to the pledge to build a bilingual Wales—and a truly bilingual Wales at that. Perhaps that is a lost opportunity in the proposed Measure to ensure that that objective be realised.

[18] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** In your evidence, you state that the key to delivering a bilingual Wales in the context of this proposed Measure is the learning coach, particularly ones who can cater to people in both languages. What sort of number are you talking about? How many do you think would be required to deliver a comprehensive service that would meet the requirements of users, namely the 14 to 19-year-old students, in receiving that service?

[19] **Ms Smallwood:** Mae'n anodd rhoi nifer penodol i chi ar hyn o bryd, ond rhaid ystyried nifer y disgyblion sydd mewn addysg Gymraeg ar hyn o byd. Bydd yn dibynnu ar nifer yr anogwyr dysgu yr ydych yn ei rhag-weld fesul disgybl. Faint o ddisgyblion a fydd o dan ofal un anogwr dysgu? Efallai'r ystod oedran fydd yr ystyriaeth, a nifer y myfyrwyr sydd yn y system addysg Gymraeg yn y cyfnod oedran hwnnw ar hyn o bryd.

**Ms Smallwood:** It is difficult to give you a definite number at present, but consideration needs to be given to the number of pupils in Welsh-medium education at present. It will depend on how many learning coaches you envisage for each pupil. How many pupils would be under the guidance of each coach? Perhaps the age range will be the chief consideration, and the number of students in the Welsh-medium education system in that age group at present.

[20] **Mr Charles:** Hefyd, mae angen anogwyr dysgu ym mhob rhan o Gymru ac nid yn unig yn yr ardaloedd lle siaredir Cymraeg bob dydd. Mae'n effeithio ar bob rhan o Gymru oherwydd, fel y gwyddom, mae addysg Gymraeg yn ffynnu yn y de-ddwyrain.

**Mr Charles:** Furthermore, learning coaches are needed in all parts of Wales, not just in the areas where Welsh is spoken daily. It affects all parts of Wales because, as we know, Welsh education is flourishing in the south-east.

[21] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** I agree with that, and that is why I am trying to get a handle on this because the documents have talked about learning coaches, which is a wonderful term—I would call them tutors, as that is how I used to know them when I was in school—but I am trying to get a feel for the feasibility of this. I do not want a specific figure. We know how many students are coming through the system via the census and, in an ideal world, you know roughly what ratio you would like to see in order to deliver a functioning service, so there must be a feel for how many we would need roughly to provide that fully fledged bilingual service that would deliver the aspiration for a bilingual Wales. That is a key part of being able to deliver what is outlined in the Measure because you are offering that guidance to the student to access the course.

[22] **Mr Charles:** Nid wyf yn gallu rhoi'r ystadegau, ond yn sicr mae angen nifer fawr ohonynt ledled Cymru ac y mae amheuan o

**Mr Charles:** I cannot give you the statistics, but certainly we need a vast number of them throughout Wales and there are doubts about

ran a yw'r niferoedd hynny ar gael ar hyn o bryd.

whether that number is currently available.

[23] **Ms Smallwood:** Mae hefyd yn codi cwestiwn nid yn unig o ran gallu'r anogwr dysgu i drafod gyda'r myfyriwr yn eu dewis iaith ond hefyd i fod â'r cefndir perthnasol fel anogwyr dysgu i drafod materion yn ymwneud â dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, pwysigrwydd dilyniant ieithyddol ac, o bosibl, manteision y Gymraeg. Felly, nid yw ond yn fater o allu trafod yn newis iaith y myfyriwr, ond bod yn ymwybodol o'r ystyriaethau sydd ynghlwm â hynny.

**Ms Smallwood:** It also raises a question not only about the ability of the learning coach to discuss matters with students in their chosen language but also about them having the relevant background as learning coaches to discuss matters relating to Welsh-medium education, the importance of linguistic continuity, and, possibly, the advantages of Welsh. Therefore, it is not only a matter of being able to converse in the student's chosen language, but being aware of the associated considerations.

[24] **Mr Charles:** Mae'n swydd gwbl allweddol o ran datblygiad y Mesur ac yn y blaen gan fod y myfyrwyr yn troi at yr anogwr am gyngor ynghylch dyfodol addysg a pherthnasedd dwyieithrwydd yn y byd cyfoes.

**Mr Charles:** It is a crucial post in terms of the development of the Measure and so on because students turn to the learning coach for advice on the future of education and the relevance of bilingualism in the modern world.

[25] **Alun Davies:** Nid wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn cytuno â chi, Mr Charles, pan ddywedwch fod rhaid cael system ar draws Cymru. Credaf ei bod hi'n bwysicach mewn rhai rhannau o'r wlad—yr wyf yn meddwl yn arbennig am Sir Gaerfyrddin, Ceredigion a Gwynedd, ac ardaloedd megis y rhai yr wyf yn eu cynrychioli, sy'n gwbl wahanol eu natur i Flaenau Gwent, lle cefais fy magu. Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn. Cytunaf â'r hyn y mae Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg yn ei ddweud am sefyllfa'r Gymraeg mewn addysg yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, er enghraifft, , lle nad oes darpariaeth ddigonol ar gyfer pobl ar ôl iddynt adael ysgol. Byddem yn hoffi gweld buddsoddiad mwy mewn ardaloedd o'r fath i sicrhau bod gennym system ar gyfer yr ardal sydd yn adlewyrchu'r gymdeithas yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

**Alun Davies:** I am not sure that I agree with you, Mr Charles, when you say that a pan-Wales system is needed. I think that it is more important in certain parts of the country—I am thinking specifically of Carmarthenshire, Ceredigion and Gwynedd, and areas such as those that I represent, which are completely different in nature to Blaenau Gwent, where I was brought up. I am very concerned. I agree with what the Welsh Language Society says about the situation of the Welsh language in education in, for example, Carmarthenshire, where there is insufficient provision for those who have left school. I would like to see more investment in such areas to ensure that we have a tailor-made system for the area that reflects the society in those areas.

[26] **Mr Charles:** Nid anghytunaf â'r angen yn y siroedd bu i chi sôn amdanynt, ond byddai'n gamgymeriad i anwybyddu siroedd eraill lle mae addysg Gymraeg ar gynnydd.

**Mr Charles:** I do not disagree with the need in the counties that you mentioned, but it would be a mistake to ignore other counties where Welsh-medium education is on the increase.

[27] **Janet Ryder:** Do you think that that should be written into the Measure?

[28] **Ms Smallwood:** Credaf yn gryf fod angen rhywbeth yn y Mesur i sicrhau bod gan y myfyrwyr hynny sy'n dewis astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yr un hawliau â'r

**Ms Smallwood:** I believe strongly that there is a need for something to be included in the Measure to ensure that the students who choose to study through the medium of

myfyrwyr sy'n dewis astudio drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. Welsh have the same rights as those students who choose English-medium education.

[29] **Janet Ryder:** Do you think that that should be written into the provisions within the local area curricula or written in as an individual right?

[30] **Ms Smallwood:** Y ddau, o bosibl. Yn sicr, wrth gynllunio'r cwricwla lleol mae angen sicrhau bod prosesau cadarn mewn lle er mwyn gallu sicrhau bod cwricwla lleol cyfrwng Cymraeg hefyd ar gael i fyfyrwyr. Fodd bynnag, yn yr un modd, mae'n rhaid sicrhau ar lefel bersonol bod y myfyriwr hwnnw'n gallu mynd ar drywydd llwybr dysgu cyfrwng Cymraeg os mai hynny y mae'n dymuno ei wneud. **Ms Smallwood:** Possibly both. Certainly, in planning the local curricula, we must ensure that there are robust processes in place in order to ensure that Welsh-medium local curricula are also available to students. However, in the same way, we must ensure that on a personal level that student can follow the Welsh-medium learning route if that is what he or she wants.

[31] **Mr Charles:** Mae'r cwricwla lleol yn hanfodol yn y broses. **Mr Charles:** The local curricula are vital to the process.

[32] **Janet Ryder:** I do not want to put words in your mouth, but—[Inaudible.]—in effect, the learning domains and in the number of units studied. It needs to be written into each of those three areas.

12.50 p.m.

[33] **Mr Charles:** Dylid rhoi sylw manwl i'r posibilrwydd, o ystyried lefel y ddarpariaeth ar hyn o bryd. **Mr Charles:** Detailed consideration should be given to that possibility, given the level of provision at present.

[34] **Janet Ryder:** Are you satisfied that the provision exists in further education colleges at present and, if not, what would need to happen?

[35] **Ms Smallwood:** Ar hyn o bryd, nac ydym. Yn ôl yr ystadegau, mae rhyw 2 y cant o ddarpariaeth addysg bellach drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Nid yw hynny'n ddigonol i ymateb i'r galw nac ychwaith i'r hyn y mae'r Mesur hwn yn ei gynnig. Yn amlwg, mae'r bwrdd, fel y corff statudol sydd yn gyfrifol am gynlluniau iaith colegau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch, yn gweld y cynllun iaith fel offeryn pwysig o ran cynllunio darpariaeth mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach, ond o weithio gydag ysgolion, yr ydym wedi ffeindio bod cwestiwn wedi codi o ran arbenigedd a phrofiad athrawon a darlithwyr i gynnig yr ystod eang hwn o opsiynau, a byddem yn dweud efallai bod angen ystyriaeth bellach ym maes hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon cyn ein bod yn gallu cyrraedd y pwynt lle mae'r opsiynau yn hollol gyfartal. **Ms Smallwood:** At present, no, we are not. According to the statistics, about 2 per cent of further education provision is through the medium of Welsh. That is not sufficient to meet demand or to meet what the Measure proposes. Clearly, the board, as the statutory body responsible for the language schemes of further education and higher education colleges, sees the language scheme as an important instrument in planning provision in further education institutions but, from working with schools, we have found that a question has arisen around the expertise and experience of the teachers and lecturers to offer this wide range of options, and we would say that further consideration is needed in the field of initial training before we can reach the point where the options are totally equal.

[36] **Mr Charles:** Mae bylchau amlwg yn **Mr Charles:** There are obvious gaps in the



y maes galwedigaethol, ac mae prinder aruthrol o gyrsiau Cymraeg yn y byd hwnnw. Mae adroddiadau Estyn yn dangos yr anghydbwysedd sydd yn bodoli.

vocational areas, and there is a great lack of Welsh-medium courses in that area. Estyn reports show the imbalance that exists.

[37] Ar ben hynny—i ddod yn ôl at bwyt Alun Davies—mae anwastadrwydd hyd yn oed yn y siroedd Cymraeg eu hiaith.

On top of that—coming back to Alun Davies's point—there is an imbalance even in the Welsh-speaking counties.

[38] **Janet Ryder:** Have you given any consideration to how this would work if it came forward before the Welsh language strategy that the Government is developing, or does the Welsh language strategy have to accompany it?

[39] **Ms Smallwood:** Dyna un o'r pwyntiau yr oedd gennym i'w codi. Nid yw'n glir o'r ddogfennaeth yr ydym wedi'i derbyn beth yw'r berthynas ac, o bosibl, gallai peidio â sicrhau bod y Mesur hwn yn rhoi'r un ystyriaeth i'r sector cyfrwng Cymraeg danseilio'r holl waith sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd o ran datblygu strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn y sector cyn 14. Yn bendant, byddai angen i'r ddau beth gydweithio. Ar hyn o bryd, fel yr ydych yn gwybod, mae'r ddarpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg ar draws yr ystodau oedran wedi datblygu mewn dull cymharol ad hoc ac wrth ymateb i'r galw. Pwrpas strategaeth yw ceisio gosod a datblygu'r ddarpariaeth yn strategol. Mae angen sicrhau bod yr un math o beth yn digwydd yn y sector ôl-14, ac mae cyfle, efallai, drwy'r Mesur hwn, i sicrhau hynny.

**Ms Smallwood:** That was one of the points that we wanted to raise. It is not clear from the documentation that we have received what the relationship is, and not ensuring that this Measure gives the same consideration to the Welsh-medium sector could undermine all the work that is being done at present in developing a Welsh-medium education strategy in the pre-14 sector. The two things would certainly have to dovetail. At present, as you know, Welsh-medium provision across all age ranges has developed in a comparatively ad hoc manner and in response to need. The purpose of a strategy is to try to set and develop the provision strategically. The same sort of thing needs to happen in the post-14 sector, and there is an opportunity, perhaps, through this Measure, to ensure that that happens.

[40] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** We have gone into quite a lot of detail there, and we have quite a few questions to go through. The Measure proposes to create the right for learners aged 14 to 19 in Wales to elect to study through a local area curriculum. Does the Measure as it is proposed achieve that key objective?

[41] **Ms Smallwood:** Ydyw, i raddau. Os ydych yn dewis astudio drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg, mae'n debyg bod y Mesur yn gwneud hynny. Ein pryder ni yw y disgyblion hynny sydd yn dewis astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac i ba raddau y byddai'n ateb eu hanghenion hwy. Nid yw hynny'n glir yn y Mesur ar hyn o bryd.

**Ms Smallwood:** Yes, to a degree. If you choose to study through the medium of English, it seems that the Measure does that. Our concern is those pupils who choose to study through the medium of Welsh and the extent to which it would answer their needs. That is not clear in the Measure at present.

[42] Soniasoch am gwricwla lleol ac, o ddarllen y Mesur, mae'n ymddangos bod y cwricwla lleol yn benodol i awdurdod addysg lleol ar hyn o bryd, felly mae'n lleol yn ddaearyddol. Ystyriaeth arall efallai yw—

You mentioned local curricula and, from reading the Measure, it seems that the local curricula are specific to local education authorities at present, so it is geographically local. Another consideration perhaps—

[43] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** There will be two curricula in certain local education

authorities; it will not be a case of a specific LEA only having one curriculum in its area.

[44] **Ms Smallwood:** Gwelais yn y Mesur y gallai fod mwy nag un ganddynt, ond nid oes rheidrwydd iddynt sicrhau bod cwricwla lleol cyfrwng Cymraeg. A oes unrhyw hyblygrwydd i'w galluogi i gynllunio ar sail ieithyddol? Ar hyn o bryd, er enghraifft, drwy'r rhwydweithiau 14-19, mae awdurdodau addysg lleol yn cydweithio ag awdurdodau addysg lleol cyfagos, yn sicr yn yr awdurdodau hynny lle mai un ysgol uwchradd cyfrwng Cymraeg sydd yno ar hyn o bryd; maent hwy wedi gorfod gwneud hynny. Felly, a oes hyblygrwydd i greu cwricwla ar draws ffiniau awdurdodau addysg lleol hefyd?

**Ms Smallwood:** I saw in the Measure that they can have more than one, but there is no obligation on them to ensure that there are Welsh-medium local curricula. Is there any flexibility to enable them to plan on a linguistic basis? At present, for example, through the 14-19 networks, LEAs are collaborating with neighbouring LEAs, certainly in the authorities where there is just one Welsh-medium secondary school; they have had to do that. Therefore, is there any flexibility to create curricula across LEA boundaries?

[45] **Mr Charles:** Byddai hefyd angen monitro yn ofalus waith y cyd-bwyllgorau lleol er mwyn sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth Gymraeg a dwyieithog yn cael sylw. Fel y gwyddom—ac mae hwn yn dod yn ôl, bron, at eich cwestiwn cyntaf—mae diffyg arbenigedd yn aml iawn yn lleol yn y meysydd hyn o ran y Gymraeg a dwyieithrwydd.

**Mr Charles:** There would also be a need to monitor the work of the local joint committees carefully to ensure that the Welsh medium and bilingual provision is considered. As we know—and this almost comes back to your first question—there is a local lack of expertise in these areas with regard to Welsh and bilingualism.

[46] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** I will move on to the next question. The Assembly Government proposes to implement the changes to 14-19 provision from year 10 in September next year, and the rest will roll out over four years. Do you think that this is achievable? We have touched on the Welsh language, and Janet mentioned the Welsh-language strategy that the Welsh Assembly Government will bring forward as a key precursor to the Measure being able to work fully. However, what other obstacles do you see to achieving the rather ambitious start date of September 2009?

[47] **Ms Smallwood:** Efallai mai un o'r pethau sy'n taro rhywun yw'r diffyg cyfleoedd achredu sydd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Os oes rhywun yn rhedeg y cynllun hwn o Fedi 2009, mae cryn waith i'w wneud o ran sicrhau bod cyfleoedd achredu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

**Ms Smallwood:** One of the things that strikes you is the lack of accreditation opportunities that exist through the medium of Welsh. If this is implemented from September 2009, then there is a lot of work to be done to ensure that there are accreditation opportunities through the medium of Welsh.

[48] **Mr Charles:** Os ydym yn sôn am ffurfioli'r hyn sydd ar gael, mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn cwbl wahanol i sicrhau lle teilwng i addysg Gymraeg ac addysg ddwyieithog yn y broses. Fel yr esboniais eisoes, yr ydym yn dechrau ar lefel isel, felly mae rhywun yn gweld anhawster yn yr amserlen.

**Mr Charles:** If we are talking about formalising what is available, that is a completely different question to ensuring the due place for the Welsh language and bilingual education in the process. As I have explained already, we are starting from a low threshold, so we see difficulty in the timetable.

[49] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** You see difficulty in the timetable, and you have touched on problems relating to accreditation if we were to start in September 2009. Two questions arise

from that. Do you think that September 2009 is far too ambitious a date to begin this programme, as other witnesses have told us, and that maybe 2010 would be a better start date—bearing in mind what the Welsh Assembly Government proposes to do with regard to the Welsh language strategy? Secondly, do you believe that, were it to go ahead in 2009, there would be sufficient capacity for people to access Welsh-medium training as it stands?

[50] **Ms Smallwood:** Ar hyn o bryd, byddai 2009 yn uchelgeisiol iawn. Os mai'r bwriad yw sicrhau cyfartaledd yn y ddarpariaeth a sicrhau'r un hawl i fyfyrwyr cyfrwng-Cymraeg a chyfrwng-Saesneg—

**Ms Smallwood:** At the moment, 2009 is extremely ambitious. If the intention is to ensure equality in the provision and ensure the same rights for Welsh-medium and English-medium students—

[51] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Do you think that it is ambitious, or unattainable?

[52] **Ms Smallwood:** Anghyraeddadwy, ar hyn o bryd. Byddai'n rhoi cyfle, o bosibl, i sicrhau—gan eich bod wedi sôn am y strategaeth addysg gyfrwng Cymraeg—bod y ddau beth yn cydreddeg. Hynny yw, bydd y strategaeth yn dod cyn hwn, ond bydd un peth yn arwain at y llall. Mae'n sicrhau'r llwybr dilyniant priodol i fyfyrwyr hefyd.

**Ms Smallwood:** Unattainable, at the moment. It would possibly give an opportunity to ensure—you mentioned the Welsh-medium education strategy—that both could run in parallel. That is, the strategy will be implemented prior to this, but one would lead into the other. It would ensure an appropriate continuity path for students.

[53] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you very much. The Measure prescribes that Welsh Ministers should be responsible for planning the provision for 16 to 19-year-olds, and that local education authorities should plan for 14 to 16-year-olds. Do you agree with that divide in responsibility in this Measure?

[54] **Ms Smallwood:** Credaf ei bod yn rhaniad eithaf hanesyddol o ran torri yn 16 oed. Credaf, ar hyn o bryd, bod y ffynonellau cyllid yn digwydd yn y modd hwnnw hefyd, ac mae'n bosibl mai dyna'r rheswm dros gynllunio'r Mesur yn y ffordd honno. Os ydym yn symud tuag at gael cwricwla lleol 14 i 19 oed, efallai bod modd dadlau ei bod yn gwneud mwy o synnwyr i un corff rheoli'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer 14 i 16 ac ôl 16, er, yn hanesyddol, ac yn ôl y Mesur, mae'r ddau beth yn wahanol.

**Ms Smallwood:** I believe that the split at 16 is a fairly historic one. At the moment, I think that the funding sources are split in the same way, and that may be the reason for planning the Measure in that way. If we move towards local curricula for 14 to 19-year-olds, perhaps it could be argued that it makes more sense for one body to manage the provision for 14 to 16-year-olds and post-16 provision, even though, historically, and in the Measure, the two things are different.

[55] **Mr Charles:** Mae'n rhaid cael cydweithrediad i sicrhau dilyniant. Os oes rhywbeth yn rhwystro dilyniant, mae'n effeithio nid yn unig ar addysg drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg, ond ar addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a hyfforddiant.

**Mr Charles:** There is a need for collaboration to ensure progress. If something hinders progress, it affects not only the education available through the medium of English, but education through the medium of Welsh, and training.

[56] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** What organisations, other than those already named in the Measure, do you think should have a role in providing local curricula? I am thinking of local employers, and so on.

1.00 p.m.

[57] **Ms Smallwood:** Yr wyf yn credu

**Ms Smallwood:** I believe that input is

bod angen mewnbwn gan y gweithlu ac, o bosibl, gan y cynghorau sgiliau sector, sydd yn adnabod y sgiliau mae eu hangen ar y gweithlu. Efallai mai dyna yw'r bont rhwng darparwyr hyfforddiant a symud allan i fod yn rhan o'r gweithlu. Byddem yn sicr yn awgrymu bod angen cynrychiolaeth o'r fan honno, fel rhan o gynllunio'r ddarpariaeth.

[58] **Mr Charles:** Mae traddodiad o ysgolion yn cydweithio â'i gilydd, ac mae hefyd datblygiadau o ysgolion yn cydweithio â cholegau addysg bellach, ond mae lle i welliant sylweddol yn y maes hwnnw, ac i ddod â'r gweithlu i mewn hefyd. Mae angen amser yn sicr i ddatblygu'r bartneriaeth, fel y bo'n gadarn wrth symud ymlaen. Efallai bod hynny'n ffactor hefyd o ran yr amserlen yr ydym eisoes wedi sôn amdani.

[59] Yr ydym yn croesawu cydweithio, ond, yn sicr yng nghyd-destun addysg Gymraeg, mae llawer iawn o waith i'w wneud i feithrin y cydweithio'n effeithiol.

[60] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** I touched on local employers coming in on this. We have touched on learning coaches and the aspiration to access Welsh-medium provision. Can you give us a taste of the opportunity to have local employers and businesses coming in on this, through the medium of Welsh? What would your understanding be of that provision as it currently stands? Is there the ability to go into that sector, or is the ability to provide that training opportunity for students via the medium of Welsh very limited?

[61] **Ms Smallwood:** Mae'n deg i ddweud ei fod yn faes sy'n datblygu a byddai cael mynediad i'r sector hwnnw'n haws mewn rhai ardaloedd penodol o Gymru nac mewn ardaloedd eraill. Yn sicr, os yw rhywun yn edrych ar yr ardaloedd mwyaf Cymreig, mae cyflogwyr lleol sy'n cyfrif y Gymraeg fel sgil hynod o bwysig, os nad yn hanfodol, ar gyfer gweithio yn yr ardaloedd penodol hynny. Byddai'n beryglus i awgrymu mai dim ond yn yr ardaloedd cyfrwng Gymraeg, neu Cymreiciaf, y mae rhywun yn cael mewnbwn o'r sector hwnnw. Byddem yn dweud ei fod yn hollbwysig i bob cwricwla lleol gael y mewnbwn hwnnw hefyd.

[62] **Mr Charles:** Gorau po fwyaf o gynrychiolwyr byd busnes sy'n ymwneud â'r Mesur a'r cynllun, yn enwedig o ran y Gymraeg. Fel yr awgrymodd Jeni, mae lleoedd amlwg yng Nghymru lle mae dwyieithrwydd yn bwysig, ond mae'n

needed from the workforce and, possibly, from the sector skills councils, which can identify the skills required by the workforce. Perhaps that should be the bridge between the training providers and moving out to be part of the workforce. I would certainly suggest that there is a need for representation from that area, as part of planning the provision.

**Mr Charles:** There is a tradition of schools collaborating, and also there are developments of schools collaborating with further education colleges, but there is scope for substantial improvement in that field, and also to bring in the workforce. Time is needed to develop this partnership, so that it is robust in moving forward. Perhaps that is another factor in terms of the timetable that we have already mentioned.

We welcome collaboration, but, certainly in the context of Welsh-medium education, there is much work to be done to nurture effective collaboration.

**Ms Smallwood:** It would be fair to say that this is a developing area and that accessing that sector is easier in some areas of Wales than in others. Certainly, if one looks at the most Welsh areas, there are local employers who regard the Welsh language as an important, if not essential, skill to work in those areas. I would say that it would be dangerous to suggest that only in the Welsh-medium, or most Welsh, areas should there be input from that sector. I would say that it is crucial for all local curricula to also have that input.

**Mr Charles:** The more representatives from business who are involved in the Measure and the scheme, the better, particularly with regard to the Welsh language. As Jeni suggested, there are obvious areas in Wales where bilingualism is important, but it is

ymledu hefyd i bob rhan o Gymru erbyn hyn. spreading throughout the whole of Wales by now.

[63] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** My last two questions are on co-operation. 'Co-operation' is a wonderful word that is used time and again, but, in practice, it often falls flat on its face. This Measure has the potential, as we have heard from other witnesses, to do such a thing just on the basis of funding. Although the Measure mentions co-operation, can you see any obstacles other than the obvious? You may like to comment on the funding streams that create these barriers to creating better co-operation, but how do you believe that this co-operation could become a reality?

[64] **Ms Smallwood:** Nid yw'r arfer o gydweithio, fel yr ydym eisoes wedi sôn, yn rhywbeth hollol newydd o safbwynt sefydliadau addysg bellach ac ysgolion, hynny yw, mae'n dechrau digwydd ar hyn o bryd drwy rwydweithiau 14-19, ac yn sicr o ganlyniad i rai o fentrau'r Llywodraeth yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, mae gwahaniaethau sylweddol o ran natur y sefydliadau a natur ieithyddol y sefydliadau, hynny yw, byddant yn eithaf gwahanol o ran eu traddodiad o ddarparu addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg, a byddant hefyd yn wahanol o ran eu gweledigaeth ieithyddol fel sefydliadau. Mae gan ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg weledigaeth eithaf cadarn am y Gymraeg, ac efallai nad yw'r sefydliad agos, neu'r sefydliad y byddant yn cydweithio â hwy, yn rhannu'r un weledigaeth ieithyddol. Felly, gallai hynny fod yn rwystr.

**Ms Smallwood:** The practice of co-operation, as we have already said, is not a brand-new concept as regards further education institutions and schools, that is, it is beginning to happen now in 14-19 networks, and certainly as a result of some of the Government's initiatives. However, there are quite fundamental differences as regards the nature of the institutions and the linguistic nature of the institutions, that is, they will be quite different as regards their tradition of providing Welsh-medium education, and they will also differ in their linguistic vision as institutions. Welsh-medium schools have quite a robust vision for the Welsh language, and a neighbouring institution, or the institution that they are going to collaborate with, might not share the same linguistic vision. Therefore, I could imagine that that could become an obstacle.

[65] Yn hynny o beth, ar hyn o bryd, bydd yn anochel mai un darparwr, o safbwynt cyfrwng Cymraeg, mewn ardal benodol a fydd yn arwain ar y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg, fel y mae ein tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig yn ei awgrymu, oherwydd diffyg arbenigedd a diffyg profiad, fel y dywedodd Alun yn gynharach, yn enwedig o safbwynt cyrsiau galwedigaethol. Cytunaf fod systemau cyllido ar hyn o bryd yn annog cystadleuaeth rhwng sefydliadau o fewn yr un ardal. Awgrymaf hefyd—

In that context, at present, it will be inevitable that it would be just one provider, from the point of view of the Welsh language, in a particular area that will be leading on the Welsh-medium provision, as our written evidence suggests, because of a lack of expertise and a lack of experience, as Alun said earlier, particularly in terms of vocational courses. I agree that current funding systems encourage competition between organisations in the same area. I also suggest—

[66] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Do you have a view on funding? Everyone has told us about the problem, but no-one has come up with an answer. This institution is great—everyone comes here with their problems, but not with many answers.

[67] **Ms Smallwood:** Mae'r Llywodraeth, drwy'r system rhwydwaith 14-19, wedi awgrymu dyraniad o ryw 10 y cant o gyllid i'w wario ar ddarpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg. Ni wn pa raddau y gellid bwydo'r cyllid drwy'r cydbwyllgorau cwricwla lleol. Nid

**Ms Smallwood:** The Government, through the 14-19 networks system, has suggested an allocation of around 10 per cent of funding to spend on Welsh-medium provision. I do not know how we could feed that through the local curricula joint committees. I am not

wyf yn siŵr i ba raddau y byddai hynny'n bosibl. Hefyd, o ran y cyllid, o safbwynt y ddarpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg o leiaf, y mae'r ddarpariaeth yn dechrau a byddai angen cydnabyddiaeth gyllidol o safbwynt cynnig darpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg a monitro eithaf gofalus ar y cydbwyllgorau hyn sy'n cael eu ffurfio yng nghyd-destun y ddarpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd yr argraff, mewnbyn a'r wybodaeth a gawn ni o'n partneriaid yw bod y systemau cyllidol yn annog cystadleuaeth.

[68] **Mr Charles:** I ddychwelyd at yr ardaloedd y soniodd Alun Davies amdanynt yn gynharach, yng nghyd-destun cydweithio, yr ydym yn sôn yn aml iawn am ardaloedd gwledig ac y mae problemau arbennig yn yr ardaloedd hynny yn enwedig mewn sefyllfaoedd lle mae niferoedd disgyblion a myfyrwyr yn gostwng. Mae hwnnw'n creu tensiwn o ran cydweithio. Mae her arbennig yng nghefn gwlad Cymru ac y mae lle i wneud mwy o ddefnydd o bosibl o athrawon teithiol, ond yn sicr o dechnoleg fodern i geisio hwyluso'r cyd-gysylltu hwn. Drwy gyd-gysylltu yn unig, hyd y gwelaf, y mae modd ymledu'r cwricwlwm mewn ardaloedd o'r fath a sawl ardal arall yng Nghymru.

[69] **Janet Ryder:** We have talked about the need to increase the provision of Welsh-medium education, but many people have expressed particular worries about how the Measure will affect the current Welsh-medium schools. Do you think that the Measure will have an impact on the existing provision of Welsh-medium education?

[70] **Mr Charles:** Ym mha ffordd?

**Mr Charles:** In what way?

[71] **Janet Ryder:** It has been suggested that in some areas, there might be a restriction in the provision of Welsh-medium education as we move to area curricula—that perhaps the current provision may disappear and that only English-language provision will be made available.

[72] **Mr Charles:** Credaf y byddai hynny'n ddatblygiad anffodus iawn.

**Mr Charles:** I think that that would be an extremely unfortunate development.

[73] **Ms Smallwood:** Heb gynnwys rhywbeth yn y Mesur yn benodol i ddiogelu'r ddarpariaeth gyfredol ac i ysgogi cynnydd yn y ddarpariaeth er mwyn sicrhau y bydd modd gwireddu'r bwriad o greu Cymru ddwyieithog, mae cryn bryder y gallai danseilio'r ddarpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd.

**Ms Smallwood:** Without specific inclusion in the Measure of something to safeguard the current provision and to encourage an increase in the provision in order to ensure that the aspiration of creating a bilingual Wales can be realised, then there is great concern that that could undermine current Welsh-medium provision.

[74] **Alun Davies:** Yr wyf wedi bod yn dyst i hyn. Pan fod ad-drefnu o'r system addysg leol ac y mae ysgolion yn colli'r chweched dosbarth er enghraifft, mae'r bobl a mynychodd ysgolion Cymraeg yn colli'r cyfle o astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar ôl cyrraedd 16 oed. Gwn am rai ardaloedd yn ne-orllewin Cymru lle mae hynny wedi digwydd.

**Alun Davies:** I have witnessed this myself. When there is a reorganisation of the local education system and a school loses its sixth form, for example, those who attended Welsh-medium schools lose the opportunity to study through the medium of Welsh post 16. I know of areas in south-east Wales where that has happened.

[75] **Mr Charles:** Mae hynny'n galw am reoliadau cadarn—[*Anghlyw.*]—myfyrwyr. Hefyd mae gan swyddfeydd gyrfaedd gyfrifoldeb mawr yn y cyfeiriad hwn yn enwedig pan fo disgyblion yn cyrraedd yr oedran neilltuol hwnnw fel bod darpar myfyrwyr yn gwbl glir am y cyfleoedd o ran cyflogaeth a'r cyfleoedd cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn sgîl ennill dwyieithrwydd. Mae lle yn y fan honno nid yn unig i reoliadau, ond i gynghori pobl ifanc sy'n newid o un sefydliad i sefydliad arall.

**Mr Charles:** That calls for robust regulations—[*Inaudible.*]—students. Furthermore, careers departments have a huge responsibility in this regard particularly when pupils reach that age so that prospective students are clear about the employment and social opportunities in Wales that are associated with being bilingual. There is a place there not only for regulations, but to advise young people who are moving from one institution to another.

1.10 p.m.

[76] **Ms Smallwood:** Ac o bosibl hefyd o ran rôl yr anogwr dysgu, fel yr ydym wedi trafod eisoes, beth yw rôl yr anogwr dysgu a pha sgiliau sydd eu hangen ar yr anogwr dysgu yn benodol er mwyn gallu arwain a chynghori'r myfyriwr yn nhermau iaith a manteision ieithyddol?

**Ms Smallwood:** Also, possibly, in terms of the role of the learning coach, as we have already discussed, what is the role of the learning coach and what specific skills will that learning coach need in order to be able to guide and advise the student on language and linguistic benefits?

[77] **Mr Charles:** Yn aml, mae'r bobl ifanc yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt eisiau aros yn y sefydliadau beth bynnag. Mae'n bosibilrwydd mawr bod yr ethos Gymraeg a chyfleoedd dwyieithog yn ffactor yn hynny o beth.

**Mr Charles:** Very often, the young people that you are talking about want to remain within the institutions anyway. It is quite a big possibility that the Welsh ethos and the bilingual opportunities are a factor in that.

[78] **Janet Ryder:** We have talked a little bit—[*Inaudible.*]—the anecdotal lack of provision in further education colleges. Do you have any evidence of demand for Welsh-medium further education courses not being met at present?

[79] **Ms Smallwood:** Yr unig dystiolaeth y byddem yn ei derbyn fyddai tystiolaeth y cynlluniau iaith ac adroddiadau colegau ar eu cynlluniau iaith. Ar hyn o bryd, yr argraff yw bod y galw'n cael ei ddiwallu, ond efallai ei fod yn bwysig nodi nad ydym bob tro yn cael gwybod os nad ydyw'n cael ei ddiwallu. Hynny yw, os yw disgybl sy'n dymuno dilyn llwybr dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn canfod nad yw'r ddarpariaeth honno ar gael, yn aml iawn bydd y disgybl jyst yn derbyn

**Ms Smallwood:** The only evidence that we would receive would be the evidence of the Welsh-language schemes and the colleges' reports on their Welsh-language schemes. At the moment, the impression is that demand is being met, but it is perhaps important to note that we are not always told if it is not being met. That is, if a pupil who wishes to follow a learning pathway through the medium of Welsh learns that that provision is not available, very often that pupil will just

bod yn rhaid iddo astudio drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. Felly, buaswn yn ofalus iawn o ddweud bod y galw'n cael ei ddiwallu ar hyn o bryd oherwydd mae'n bosibl nad ydym yn clywed pan nad yw'n cael ei ddiwallu.

accept that he will have to study through the medium of English. So, I would be very wary of saying that demand is being met at the moment because it is possible that we do not hear about it when it is not met.

[80] **Mr Charles:** Mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos bod yr ystod o gyrsiau'n gul beth bynnag.

**Mr Charles:** The evidence shows that the range of courses is limited anyway.

[81] **Janet Ryder:** So, you would consider—[*Inaudible.*—]that the provision had to be made through the media of Welsh and English, that that would guarantee provision.

[82] **Mr Charles:** It would help.

[83] **Janet Ryder:** I will move on to think about another issue that we have touched on, which is the learning domains—I know that you raised these in your paper. Are you happy with the way in which the learning domains are formed? Do you think that they are specific enough? Do you think that it is sufficient to just put them as learning domains and expect them to be provided, in some areas, through the media of Welsh and English or do we need to look again at that whole area?

[84] **Ms Smallwood:** O safbwynt yr ardaloedd dysgu eu hunain, buaswn i'n dweud eu bod yn cyfateb i amcanion allweddol y Mesur. Buaswn efallai'n ofalus o ran dweud bod disgwyl iddynt fod ar gael yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg ar draws yr ardaloedd. Buaswn o bosibl yn dweud bod angen bod tipyn yn gadarnach na hynny; mae angen prosesau a rheoliadau mewn lle er mwyn sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

**Ms Smallwood:** On the learning domains themselves, I would say that they correspond to the Measure's key objectives. I would perhaps be cautious in terms of saying that there is just an expectation that they will be available in Welsh and English across the domains. I would possibly say that there is a need to be much more robust than that; processes and regulations need to be in place to ensure that it happens.

[85] **Mr Charles:** Buaswn i'n cytuno â hynny. Afraid yw disgwyl; mae'n rhaid cael rhyw fath o ganllawiau a rheoliadau i ddwyn y maen i'r wal.

**Mr Charles:** I would agree with that. Expectation is pointless; there must be some sort of guidelines and regulations to ensure delivery.

[86] **Janet Ryder:** The regulations prescribe the minimum number of courses that are to be included within the local area curriculum, as well as a maximum number of courses that a pupil might have the right to elect to follow. Is setting a minimum number of courses through regulations the correct approach and will it actually help to guarantee breadth of choice for individual learners?

[87] **Ms Smallwood:** Byddai, o ran yr egwyddor o gynnig lleiafswm ac uchafswm o bynciau. Credaf mai 24 yw'r isafswm ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer blwyddyn 10 a'r hyn sydd efallai yn aneglur yw a ydyw hynny'n isafswm o gyrsiau y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei gynnig drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg neu a oes rhaid iddynt gael 24 o bob un. A oes rhaid iddynt ddarparu'n union yr un cyrsiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a thrwy gyfrwng y Saesneg? Pa ganran o'r isafswm

**Ms Smallwood:** It would, in terms of the principle of offering a minimum and maximum number of subjects. I think that 24 is the current minimum for year 10 and what is perhaps not clear is whether that is a minimum number of courses that they have to offer through the media of Welsh and English or whether they have to have 24 of each. Do they have to provide exactly the same courses through the media of Welsh and English? What percentage of that



hwinnw y dylid ei gynnig drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac i ba raddau y bydd hynny'n effeithio ar ddewisiadau'r unigolyn? minimum should be offered through the medium of Welsh and to what extent would that affect the choices of individual learners?

[88] **Janet Ryder:** So, you would like to see it—[*Inaudible.*] What would your approach be towards students who might want to choose a mixture of Welsh and English? They may not be secure enough to do it all through the medium of Welsh, but they may want a mixture of Welsh and English. Does that need to be taken into consideration at this stage?

[89] **Ms Smallwood:** Yn bendant. Bydd rhai disgyblion yn dymuno amrywio nifer y cyrsiau cyfrwng Cymraeg y maent yn eu dilyn ac, yn yr un modd, i'r disgyblion hynny sydd o bosibl yn astudio'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith ac sy'n dymuno dechrau cyrsiau cyfrwng Cymraeg, gallai fod yn fanteisiol iawn cynnig y dewis hwinnw. Felly, mae'n bwysig cadw'r drws hwinnw ar agor iddynt, sef bod y dewis hwinnw ar gael. Dyna lle yr wyf yn rhag-weld rôl bwysig i'r anogwr dysgu: cynnig cyngor o safbwynt datblygiad a dilyniant ieithyddol y disgybl unigol.

**Ms Smallwood:** Certainly. Some pupils will want to vary the number of Welsh-medium courses that they take, and, in the same vein, it could be advantageous to offer that choice to those pupils who may be studying Welsh as a second language and who wish to take Welsh-medium courses. So, it is important to keep that door open to them, namely that that option be available to them. That is where I envisage an important role for the learning coach to play: offering advice on the linguistic continuity and development of an individual pupil.

[90] **Mr Charles:** Yn y byd cyfoes sydd ohoni, mae llythrennedd deuol yn sgil allweddol i'w meithrin ymhlith pobl ifanc, sef y gallu i drosglwyddo o'r Gymraeg i'r Saesneg ac yn ôl.

**Mr Charles:** In the modern world that we live in, dual literacy is a key skill to nurture in young people, namely the ability to transfer from Welsh to English and back again.

[91] **Janet Ryder:** There has also been some debate on the difference between level 1 and level 2 courses. It has been suggested that level 1 courses may not count towards the minimum learner entitlement. Level 1 is the equivalent of a GCSE grade D to E, so if you are on the second-level English course, or whatever, you are in that lower level. It has been suggested that only level 2 courses are eligible. Do you have a view on whether the minimum number of courses should include level 1 and level 2 courses?

[92] **Ms Smallwood:** Yn sicr. O ystyried mai un o fwriadau'r cynllun arloesol hwn yw mynd i'r afael â'r disgyblion hynny sy'n debygol o ddadurithio, gellid dadlau mai'r disgyblion hynny fydd yn mynd am y cyrsiau lefel 1, oherwydd y cyrsiau hynny sy'n fwyaf addas ar gyfer nifer fawr ohonynt. Felly, byddwn yn dweud bod angen ystyried cyrsiau lefel 1 a lefel 2.

**Ms Smallwood:** Certainly. Given that one aim of this innovative scheme is to get to grips with those pupils who are likely to become disillusioned, it could be argued that those pupils are likely to opt for the level 1 courses, because they are more appropriate for a large number of those pupils. So, we would say that level 1 and level 2 courses do need to be considered.

[93] **Mr Charles:** Byddwn yn ategu hynny.

**Mr Charles:** I would support that.

[94] **Janet Ryder:** Finally, undertaking courses at different educational sites will result in an increase in travel for learners. Can you foresee any practical transport-related issues that need to be addressed as a result of that? It is not necessarily something that the Welsh Language Board would consider, but have you given it any thought?

[95] **Ms Smallwood:** A dweud y gwir,

**Ms Smallwood:** In all honesty, that is quite

mae hynny'n eithaf pwysig, yn enwedig o ystyried y ddarpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg a'r pellter y bydd angen i ddisgyblion mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru ei deithio er mwyn dilyn cwrs cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn sefydliad arall, hyd yn oed os ydyw o fewn ardal yr un awdurdod lleol. Mae hefyd yn bwysig ystyried canllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer trafndiaeth i ysgolion a thrafnidiaeth ôl-16. Mae'n bosibl bod angen i'r berthynas rhwng y cynllun hwn a'r canllawiau hynny fod yn gryfach. Soniodd Alun yn gynharach am y syniad o gael athrawon teithiol. Mae'n bosibl bod ffyrdd o ddod dros hynny, ond mae trafndiaeth yn elfen bwysig a chreiddiol o safbwynt y ddarpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg.

important, especially considering the Welsh-medium provision and the potential distances that pupils in some parts of Wales will have to travel to follow a Welsh-medium course in another institution, even if it is within the same local authority area. It is also important that consideration be given to the guidelines provided by the Assembly Government on transport to school and post-16 transport. It could be that the relationship between this scheme and those guidelines needs to be strengthened. Alun mentioned earlier the possibility of having peripatetic teachers. It is possible that there are ways of overcoming that, but transport is an important and core element of Welsh-medium provision.

[96] **Janet Ryder:** Do you think that it is possible to create equality of access for students in rural and urban areas, or will there be an inequality for some students, perhaps those in more rural areas, in accessing a full curriculum?

[97] **Mr Charles:** Mae'n bosibl, ond bydd yn golygu llawer o gydweithio a rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny. Bydd angen cael sefydliadau gwahanol i gydweithio â'i gilydd. Gallaf enwi ysgol uwchradd sy'n cyrraedd y gofynion o ran nifer y lefelau ym mlwyddyn 10 yn awr, a honno mewn ardal wledig. Felly, nid yw'n amhosibl ei gyflawni, ond mae angen cydweithio manwl. Rhaid gwneud defnydd o ddulliau megis athrawon teithiol, fel yr awgrymodd Jeni, a chanolfannau neu dechnoleg.

**Mr Charles:** It is possible, but it will require a great deal of joint working and that needs to be addressed. It will require different institutions to collaborate. I could give you the name of a secondary school that already fulfils the requirements on the number of levels offered in year 10 now, and it is in a rural area. So, it is not impossible to achieve, but it will require detailed collaboration. We will have to use methods such as peripatetic teachers, which Jeni suggested, and centres, or technology.

[98] **Ms Smallwood:** Mae honno'n elfen bwysig o ystyried y rôl a fydd gan y cydbwyllgorau hyn wrth fonitro'r cwriciwla lleol, a dylent ystyried hynny wrth gynllunio'r ddarpariaeth yn lleol. Ni ddylid cael diffyg yn ansawdd y ddarpariaeth ar draws ardaloedd, boed yn rhai gwledig neu'n wledig ac yn drefol. Mae'n bwysig eu bod yn cael cyfarwyddyd clir bod disgwyl iddynt ystyried hynny er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'n digwydd.

**Ms Smallwood:** That is an important element given the role that these joint committees will play in monitoring the local curricula, and they should consider that as they plan local provision. There should not be any deficiencies in quality across areas, whether they are rural or rural and urban areas. It is important that they be given clear guidance that they are expected to consider that, to ensure that it does not happen.

1.20 p.m.

[99] **Mr Charles:** I ddwyn y maen i'r wal, mae llawer o gydweithio rhwng ysgolion unigol ar hyn o bryd. Mae hwnnw'n ffactor pwysig, yn enwedig yn ardaloedd y de-ddwyrain.

**Mr Charles:** In order to succeed, there is a great deal of collaboration between individual schools at present. That is an important factor, particularly in the areas of the south-east.

[100] **Alun Davies:** Diolch yn fawr am

**Alun Davies:** Thank you very much for that

hynny ac am eich presenoldeb. Yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r amser yr ydych wedi'i dreulio gyda ni. Nid oes gennym fwy o gwestiynau heddiw a gwelaf nad oes unrhyw beth gennych i'w ychwanegu. Bydd trawsgrifiad o'r sesiwn hon ar gael i chi edrych arno cyn i'r fersiwn derfynol gael ei chyhoeddi. Os bydd unrhyw bwyntiau ychwanegol yn eich taro, mae croeso i chi ysgrifennu atom. Gyda hynny, diolchaf i chi eto am eich amser heddiw.

and for your attendance. We appreciate the time that you have taken to be here with us. We have no further questions today and I see that you have nothing further to add. A transcript of this session will be sent to you to take a look at before the final version is published. Should any additional points occur to you, you would be most welcome to write to us. With that, I thank you again for your time today.

[101] I now welcome Mr David Rosser from the Confederation of British Industry to the meeting. I assume that you have a season ticket for this committee's meetings by now. *[Laughter.]* Thank you for your written evidence, which we have all had an opportunity to read. Can you give us your name and post for the Record, and then we will carry straight on with questions?

[102] **Mr Rosser:** I am David Rosser, director of CBI Wales. I must offer apologies for my colleague, Leighton Jenkins, our head of policy. He was due to be with me today, but is unwell.

[103] **Alun Davies:** Thank you for that, Mr Rosser. The evidence that you gave us was an excellent explanation and description of some of the challenges facing Wales, including the Government, the industry and others. In paragraph 47 of your evidence, you state,

[104] 'We support placing a duty on Local Education Authorities (LEAs) to produce an options menu',

[105] and that,

[106] 'the government should try to maximise the number of incentives within the new system to aid more rapid and voluntary collaboration'.

[107] Are you saying that you support an element of duty in the public sector, for the LEAs, but would prefer a more voluntary approach elsewhere?

[108] **Mr Rosser:** First, I want to say that we strongly support the objective of the proposed Measure, which is to ensure that learners of all abilities have access to a wide range of vocational and academic courses. Whether a statute is required to make it happen is probably a question for the provider sector and for Government. We assume that the fact that the Government has decided to bring forward this proposed Measure means that it is not confident that the provider community will collaborate fully across Wales to the necessary extent. If that is the case, we support placing this on a statutory basis, because the end objective is particularly important. I would always prefer to believe that this could be done through strong collaboration by the different elements of the provider community, but I am unsighted on that and would defer to the Government's view that a Measure is needed.

[109] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you for coming in, David. My first question to you is about the Welsh Assembly Government's aspiration for 95 per cent of young people, by the age of 25, to be ready for high-skill employment by 2015. In paragraph 44 of your evidence, you highlight how, at present, only 45 per cent of young people are hitting that target. How do you consider the proposed Measure will help to reach that goal of 95 per cent?

[110] **Mr Rosser:** It is entirely down to how it is implemented, and I do not think that we

will know whether it will help to achieve that target until we see it working. We strongly support the target, and we have also given evidence on the proportion of jobs in the future that is likely to require level 3 skills or higher. So, equipping a greater proportion of our younger people with lower-level skills does not seem to be the right thing to be striving for. However, we do not minimise the challenges that we face in doing that. We think it important that we offer as many good-quality opportunities as possible to a wider range of our young people, particularly on the vocational side. Vocational qualifications should not just be open to those who are perceived not to be good enough to do academic qualifications. If the proposed Measure contributes to achieving that, as we think it ought, we strongly support it. However, whether it will achieve that we can judge only when we see it working in practice.

[111] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** You are saying that we have to run with it, basically.

[112] **Mr Rosser:** I think so.

[113] **Janet Ryder:** May I come in on this? There has been some debate as to what ‘vocational’ means. Technically, you could class chemistry and biology A-levels as vocational, for a pupil who wants to study medicine.

[114] **Mr Rosser:** Yes, you could.

[115] **Janet Ryder:** How would you define ‘vocational’, therefore?

[116] **Mr Rosser:** I accept the point that someone has made to you, which you just repeated. When most people talk about vocational courses, they probably mean something that starts with a BTEC rather than a GCSE, although that distinction is being blurred. My daughter is studying a GCSE in catering. I am pleased that the distinctions are being blurred, because that is the point that we need to get to. The current received wisdom is that ‘vocational’ is something that you do with your hands and ‘academic’ is something that you do with your brain; we desperately need to get away from that, and we hope that this proposed Measure, when it is put into practice, will help to achieve that.

[117] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** The Assembly Government is proposing to commence the Measure in September 2009, and the full roll-out across Wales will take place over four years. What impact, if any, is this timetable likely to have on the business sector, given that the starting point is now so close?

[118] **Mr Rosser:** I am not sure is the honest answer. The timetable is probably a bigger issue for the provider community than for the user community, if I may use that phrase. The business sector, as the recipient of the young people coming out of the system, is probably pretty unsighted as to the fact that you plan to make these changes anyway. The extent to which we are asked to participate actively in delivering some of this is, I guess, an issue—and perhaps we will touch on that later—and time to plan is always welcome. However, this is largely a question for other people in the provider community who have been giving evidence to you. I am not sure that I can make a strong contribution.

[119] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Perhaps the only thing that you could say is that the sooner this starts, the sooner you will have better students coming into the workplace, hopefully.

[120] **Mr Rosser:** Indeed. However, when you are making some fundamental changes—as you appear to be—to whatever area of public service delivery, it is important that the system is set up and equipped to deliver it, ideally from day 1, and to deliver to quality standards from day 1. If the system is equipped to do that, and is funded, then, yes, press the button and roll it out as soon as possible. However, if the quality of delivery looks set to be patchy, it might be better to defer this by a year—although I have no reason to think that the quality will

be patchy.

[121] **Alun Davies:** In my introductory remarks, I mentioned that your paper was a comprehensive analysis and description of the issues facing the business community regarding skills and all the rest of it. What I took from your paper was a tremendous sense of urgency to address these issues.

[122] **Mr Rosser:** There is an urgency to deliver higher standards of educational outcomes in Wales. Yes, I would agree with that. However, the system has to be well equipped if it is to start to deal with those. We agree, and that is why we highlighted some of the differences in aspirations and targets between Wales and England—not necessarily because we should always be target-driven, but the world is moving on and the need for higher skilled people in the workplace is growing rapidly. We need to keep pace with that. We are perhaps just about keeping pace at present, but we do not want to fall behind.

1.30 p.m.

[123] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** My next question again refers to the provision. You might not have a view on this, but the proposed Measure basically leaves responsibility for provision for 14 to 16-year-olds with the local education authorities and responsibility for the provision for 16 to 19-year-olds with Ministers. Do you believe, for continuity, that it would be better to pass the whole package over to the local education authorities, to have one overarching authority to deliver the project so that you have a provision for 14 to 19-year-olds, or do you believe that this split in the middle, at 16 years old, is sensible to allow continuity of provision?

[124] **Mr Rosser:** I am not sure whether I have sufficient knowledge of how this would be delivered to make a meaningful comment. The notion of one body having sole responsibility and providing continuity has a certain appeal to it. However, I guess that one could equally argue that there is a certain appeal to having consistent standards across Wales and that that might be better delivered by Assembly Ministers. I am sorry; I am not sure whether I have the evidence that you need.

[125] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** That is all right. We have received some evidence to suggest that the proposed Measure does not provide for sufficient input from the business sector and those providing work-based learning in the planning of local curricula. Also, other evidence suggests that the legislation places too much focus on vocational study and that it will shift the focus of learning for 14 to 16-year-olds to further education institutions. Do you agree with that prognosis?

[126] **Mr Rosser:** I do not think that I would agree that there is too much emphasis on vocational education. Our current impression is that vocational education is too often seen as the cinderella service to school sixth forms and the academic strands. We would like to see more involvement by the business community—by the employer community, in general, as it is not just business—in the planning of curricula and the subjects offered. That can be a challenge for the providers in getting that input and for the business community in giving it. However, we would like to see more of that.

[127] **Alun Davies:** I think that it is fair to say that my predecessors' policy in terms of ELWa and that process was that there was not sufficient employer input to it, and that, in some ways, employers had been locked out of the process. Of course, the Assembly has had the Leitch report and the whole process that followed from that, which all demanded far more employer-led training and employer-led skills. Are you confident at present, and will business be confident, that the proposed Measure, as currently drafted, provides the opportunity for your members and for business in general to be able to have an input to the sort of skills

agenda that we are considering to ensure that the skills that we deliver through this are the skills required and are in tune with the demands of the economy as we move forward?

[128] **Mr Rosser:** I have read pretty much all of the proposed Measure. I do not actually recall seeing business or employers written on the face of it. Please correct me if I am wrong. Therefore, in answer to whether the proposed Measure provides for that opportunity, it is hard to see that it specifically does so. One hopes that the clear Government policy towards getting more input from employers coupled with, as you mentioned, two or three recent reports, such as the Webb and Leitch reports—all of which emphasise the need to get more employer input into the design of the curriculum and delivery of education and training—will be taken on board by the provider community, local education authorities or Welsh Ministers as they take this forward. However, it does not appear to me to be on the face of the proposed Measure.

[129] **Janet Ryder:** Would you be satisfied with business and training interests therefore being represented by the sector skills councils?

[130] **Mr Rosser:** Sector skills councils should have a strong role to play in this. There must be some mechanism for aggregating and portraying business demand for key skill areas. It is not the role of the Confederation of British Industry to do it; we can do it at a very general level, as we have tried to do in this paper, but it is not the role of an organisation such as the CBI to do that for specific sectors or skills. If the SSCs did not exist, you would probably need to invent them. Whether they are they well equipped to do that job in Wales is another question. A few of them—probably a small number—seem to be doing quite a good job at that, generally where they are building on a pre-existing base of another organisation.

[131] SSCs ought to be well positioned to help to shape qualifications, because the skills needs of an engineering company in Bridgend will probably be similar to those of an engineering company in Bideford or Barnstable. It seems to us that identifying the demand for those skills in Wales requires some resource on the ground, which is probably lacking in too many of the SSCs at present.

[132] **Janet Ryder:** If you have local curricula that reflect the demands of local employers, you could possibly end up with a situation where, for example in north-east Wales, Airbus sets the main trend and the skills are geared into what big businesses such as it demand, and you would get a totally different curriculum in the mid Wales area, say, in Aberystwyth. What does that say for equality of access to employment prospects, and should we allow that to happen or should we aim more for generic transferable skills?

[133] **Mr Rosser:** Sadly, I think that the answer is ‘a bit of both’. You desperately need some of the generic skills and a lot of what the CBI and employers talk about is the fact that those generic skills, certainly at basic skills levels, are not there in too many of the working-age population and the youngsters coming out of education into the working-age population. So, getting those generic employability skills sorted must be a key priority for this.

[134] You then go into higher level skills, which we also need. There is probably more of a role for those being tailored to individual industry sectors, and, in some cases, individual companies. Airbus is massive in north-east Wales, and it is probably legitimate to put on aircraft building courses in north Wales, because there is a real demand and jobs there for people to go into. So, it would be silly to provide aircraft building courses in mid or west Wales because the jobs are not there. Airbus will take on apprentices from across the UK to go to work in Broughton, so if someone really wants to be an aircraft builder, they might have to relocate in order to be able to do that, but that is quite sensible, I think.

[135] **Alun Davies:** Following on from Janet’s point, you gave some robust evidence to our colleagues in Westminster earlier in the week.

[136] **Mr Rosser:** I did not think that anyone watched that. [*Laughter.*]

[137] **Alun Davies:** We are a bit closer than people might realise.

[138] Do you have any comments to make on some of the cross-border issues that Janet referred to, in terms of the impact that this curriculum and this way of working would have on some border areas?

[139] **Mr Rosser:** There is an issue for some companies that work cross-border with regard to the skills or training that they can offer to their individual employees on either side. Take as an example a company such as Wales and West Utilities based in Newport, which maintains and renews the gas pipelines in south Wales and the west of England. It has to operate within two different systems. As it happens, I think that it found the system in Wales for apprenticeships a little less bureaucratic to operate—once it got into it.

1.40 p.m.

[140] It found the system in England much easier to access: a learning skills council is a very visible point of entry; the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills is a less visible point of entry. Once it found a good quality provider, which happened to be a private training provider, to take it through the system and get it in the door, the company found the Welsh system very favourable in comparison. Companies have to invest in understanding between the two systems, and the extent to which one can do something different to another is an issue for them in providing their employees with equality of opportunity.

[141] Another example is the Shotton Paper Company in Deeside, which, again, is a border company. It has very strong links with some of the local providers in Wales to provide apprenticeships at certain levels for certain skills there. It wants to do more to provide more specialist qualifications in paper making. To do that, it needs to partner with other paper-making companies in the area, some of which are in north-east Wales, some of which are in north-west England. You then get into issues about getting the funding for these courses, the fact that there are the different procedures and that there may also be different funding streams. So, there are issues that should be understood.

[142] **Alun Davies:** I will ask you, if I may, Mr Rosser, to drop us a note on some of those issues so that we can ensure that the committee is familiar with them before it comes to do its report. Andrew, I think that you were asking questions when we interrupted you.

[143] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** No problem at all. On the learning domains, it has been said that greater clarity is needed. Would you agree with that, or do you think that they are fit for purpose as they have been constructed? Do you think that the learning domains are broad enough, and do they encompass both the academic and vocational courses that would be required?

[144] **Mr Rosser:** I guess that this is a question of the number that you want to have. I would imagine that one could fit most of the key employability skills and key courses into one or other of those domains. If that is how they are intended to work, it seems to me that there are probably sufficient.

[145] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** From an employer's perspective, they would seem to fit the purpose—

[146] **Mr Rosser:** I would think so. I think that employers would be much more interested

in the exact courses that will be offered within those domains, but most of those that I can think of that employers would need would seem to fit within those domains.

[147] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Do you think that the balance between academic and vocational courses would be accounted for under those domains?

[148] **Mr Rosser:** That is not clear to me. You could imagine vocational courses and academic courses under pretty much each of the domains.

[149] **Janet Ryder:** Given what you said earlier about the need to increase attainment levels, we have taken evidence that says that level 1 courses may not count towards the minimum learner entitlement and that only level 2 courses may be eligible. A level 1 course is a GCSE course in which a grade D to E has been achieved, an NVQ level 1, and a BTEC introductory certificate, whereas a level 2 course is a GCSE course in which grade A to C has been achieved, an NVQ level 2, a BTEC first diploma, and Open Door and English for speakers of other languages courses. Do you have a view on whether the minimum number of courses should include both level 1 and 2 courses or are you content that the aim is to include the higher level courses?

[150] **Mr Rosser:** I am not sure that I fully understand what the minimum level of learner entitlement is.

[151] **Janet Ryder:** This came about from evidence that we took last week from the Association of Directors of Education in Wales. We were told:

[152] ‘A condition was introduced into the policy towards the end of the summer term that I do not think appears in the original draft legislation; it was certainly not part of the consultation exercises that we went through. The condition relates to the courses that are counted towards the minimum learner entitlement and states that only level 2 courses are eligible.’

[153] So, when you are counting the minimum number of units that the student has to do, it is only the level 2 courses, those higher level courses, that will be counted. Given what you have said about the desire to raise the overall level, are you happy that we will discount those lower-level courses?

[154] **Mr Rosser:** If there are young people, learners, who are only likely to succeed at level 1 courses, trying to squeeze them into taking, and probably failing, level 2 courses does not seem terribly productive. The bigger question is why we would still be producing so many people who are not capable of doing level 2 courses—of getting a grade C in maths or English, to be specific. Most employers probably think of a grade D in maths or English as a fail. As a parent, I am always bemused that we put people on courses where the best that they can do is fail. As a realist, I understand that some children will not get a C, and it is better that they get something. The danger—although I am not in the provider community—is that, if one has to offer a minimum of 20 courses, and six or seven of them are at level 1, does that mean that you are offering fewer level 2 or higher courses? That would not seem to me to be a good idea, if we are trying to raise standards. I do not think that I am giving you a straight answer to your question, I am afraid—possibly because I do not know the answer. However, there are issues here, and the real issue is why 50 per cent of our young people leave education without passing English and maths, as it were—I am not sure whether you are allowed to use the term ‘passing’ any more. That is surely the bigger question.

[155] **Janet Ryder:** As this only emerged in evidence last week, it is something that the committee itself would like to explore further.



[156] **Mr Rosser:** I would not want my children to be in a position where their choice of 20 options—my children are reasonably academic—has suddenly shrunk to what I, as a pushy parent, would regard as 12 acceptable courses, and eight that I would not want them to do.

[157] **Janet Ryder:** I have a couple of questions about the learner support services. I do not know how much thought you have given to this, but the Measure makes provision for learner support services that may be identified as ‘solely provision for learning coaches’. What is your view on the level of support needed for learners, and is there a role for business in supporting learners?

[158] **Mr Rosser:** The question on the level of support for learners is better answered by those in the business of education and training provision. Is there a role for employers? I would like to think so. I would like to think that a certain number of employers would want to and be able to get involved in providing support for learners, mentoring, encouragement, experience of the workplace, and understanding of what the world of work is like. There are probably some barriers around that, although some employers already do it, sending out employees to work in schools. At some levels, it is reading support; at others, it is help towards passing exams, or study aids. Some employers do that. It is fairly resource-intensive, so it will be fairly challenging for smaller companies to do that. At the moment, because it is all done on a voluntary basis, no-one has sat down and decided under statute what a learner support or learning coach should offer. So you do as much as you can, and agree that with the individual school. If learning support, or the activities of the learning coach, become very prescribed, that might make it more difficult for some employers to fully participate. However, there should be a role for employers to get involved. I would like to think that the system is flexible enough to allow them to do so.

[159] **Janet Ryder:** Have you given any thought to the employment of the learning coach? Who should take responsibility for learning coaches? Should it rest with the school, or with the FE institution?

1.50 p.m.

[160] **Mr Rosser:** No, we do not have any views on that.

[161] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Is there capacity in the private sector to provide these learning coaches? In an earlier evidence session, I tried to get a feel for the sort of numbers of learning coaches—‘tutors’ I would call them—that we would require. Most people would see normal, everyday teachers as being able to fill that role, as a different role in their teaching environment. However, it is a specific role. Mentoring and taking the learner though is important, because if the learner is not guided and helped, all of these learning domains and everything else is pretty much meaningless. The same is true of engagement with employers to find out whether we are turning out the right students. Is there that capacity to provide these learning coaches from the private sector, should the opportunity present itself?

[162] **Mr Rosser:** I guess that the obvious question is the one that you have already asked, which is how many do you need.

[163] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yes, and no-one seems to have an answer. The document talks of learning coaches—

[164] **Mr Rosser:** It is very hard to tell you whether there is capacity then, I am afraid.

[165] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Exactly. I am just amazed that there is such talk of learning coaches but no-one understands how many we need and whether the capacity is there to meet the demand. We are due to start this in September 2009.

[166] **Mr Rosser:** Sometimes you hear talk about employers being funded to do this, but I am not sure that that is the issue for many of them; it is about releasing staff. When would they have to release staff, at what time during the day? I imagine that this would all happen during school time, which is pretty tough for employers. Evening coaching and mentoring would be easier, because you would have individuals volunteering to do it in their own time, which would mean less disruption to the workplace. So, there are real issues here around goodwill, and employers and employees will have to offset the practical issues. However, I will have no idea about capacity until I know the numbers that you are talking about. I imagine that it will be thousands rather than hundreds, or it feels like it ought to be.

[167] **Janet Ryder:** Talking about the co-operation that is going to be needed between institutions, the Measure places a duty on those delivering the local curricula to consider co-operation in delivering maximum availability of courses and, if they conclude that joint working is appropriate, they must seek to enter into arrangements. Do you think that that provision is strong enough to ensure effective co-operation?

[168] **Mr Rosser:** I understand the point that you are making about the duty to consider. To draw a parallel with the world of employment, there is a duty on employers to consider requests for flexible working, which I am sure many would say is nowhere near strong enough, but statistics show that about 90 per cent of such requests for flexible working from employees are granted. So, I would not dismiss a duty to consider as being completely ineffective, but it is probably one for the provider community to decide on.

[169] **Janet Ryder:** We have taken evidence that suggests that the current funding structure will continue to promote competition rather than co-operation. What is your view on the effect of retaining the current funding methodologies in relation to co-operation and joint working?

[170] **Mr Rosser:** It is about bums on seats. Anybody in FE will tell you that schools will do whatever it takes to keep kids in sixth form rather than send them out to FE to do courses. I am sure that the schools will tell you that they will do whatever is in the best interests of the pupil. Funding is probably an even more powerful tool than passing a Measure in this institution.

[171] **Janet Ryder:** The present funding module not only sets schools against colleges, but colleges against colleges in the same area that are now being asked to co-operate.

[172] **Mr Rosser:** Yes, there are some big issues around it. Funding in most walks of life is the most powerful tool. So, that is one for the Assembly Government to consider.

[173] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** Do you have a suggestion for an ideal funding model that would take an element of the competition away, because, ultimately, all funding must relate to the numbers that you are teaching?

[174] **Mr Rosser:** It is not the simplest thing to do, but the obvious thing is to passport it to the learner. One hesitates to use the term 'vouchers' any more, because that is not popular either, but passporting it to the learner, coupled with top-quality careers advice and options advice is one way of doing that. Setting up the bureaucracy and the systems to manage it could be a challenge and could sap a lot of resource out of the system, but it is about giving purchasing power to the learner. In other areas, for example, work-based learning if you really want to make it employer and demand-led, give vouchers to the employer to spend with a college, school or private provider, because if you spend your own resource you tend to spend it on what you want and what is valuable to you. However, I am sure that you would not underestimate the system challenges of doing that.

[175] **Alun Davies:** Thank you very much, Mr Rosser, for the time that you have taken this afternoon in giving evidence and also for providing written evidence to us. If there are any issues, you will receive a transcript, as you are aware, hopefully before it is published, and you will have an opportunity to comment on that. Please feel free to comment further through the process if you have any additional issues that you wish to raise.

[176] **Mr Rosser:** Thank you. I have noted your request for additional information.

[177] **Alun Davies:** Yr wyf am gau'r cyfarfod drwy ddweud fod papur i'w nodi, sef cofnodion cyfarfod 2 Hydref. Bydd y sesiwn nesaf i gymryd tystiolaeth ar y Mesur hwn dydd Llun nesaf 13 Hydref, ac ar y diwrnod canlynol, sef dydd Mawrth 14 Hydref pan fydd y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau ger bron y pwyllgor.

**Alun Davies:** I will close the meeting by stating that there is a paper to note, namely the minutes of the meeting held on 2 October. The next evidence-gathering session on this Measure will be held next Monday 13 October, and on the following day, Tuesday 14 October when the Deputy Minister for Skills will appear before the committee.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 1.57 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 1.57 p.m.*